

---

FRIDAY, 8 DECEMBER 2023

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid Sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 10:00.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

**BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

The SPEAKER: Please be seated. Good morning, hon members. Hon members, before we proceed, in order for us to have a record of the Sixth Parliament of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament I will now suspend the business and allow the Administration and the photographer to adjust the seating and bring the necessary equipment to ensure that we can take this photograph and then we will resume immediately thereafter. The House is now suspended.

Business of the House suspended at 10:02.

Business of the House resumed 10:07.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon members. Hon members, before we proceed I would like to remind members of some of the logistical arrangements. As has been our practice to date hon members will participate in this Sitting of the House both from here in the Chamber with the Presiding Officer and the Table staff and via Microsoft Teams. Our Standing Rules have accordingly been amended to accommodate such hybrid Sittings of the House.

Hon members who are experiencing challenges in connecting to the Sitting are requested to contact the WCPP ICT Colleagues who will assist to resolve their connectivity issues.

The quorum requirements for this Sitting of the House are as provided for in the Constitution and the Standing Rules. Hon members, unless there is an indication of unanimous concurrence voting will be confined to members present in the House and on the hybrid system who are entitled to cast their votes as per the ATC issued on 11 August 2020.

Members present in the Chamber and via Microsoft Teams have all the privileges and immunities imparted by law. Members who are considered out of order by the Presiding Officer will have their microphones muted and called to order. The Serjeant-at-Arms will record members' attendance.

In instances, hon members, where these directives do not cover a particular eventuality the Standing Rules must apply and in instances where the Rules cannot be applied the Ruling by the Presiding Officer is final.

Members, all microphones have been muted. However, for those hon members participating in the Sitting of the House via Microsoft Teams you are requested to use the raise-hand functionality of the system when you desire to raise a point of order and I will recognise you.

When a hon member in the Chamber wishes to raise a point of order, such a hon member may address the Presiding Officer as expected, but must mute their microphones when they have completed speaking.

Hon members participating in this Sitting of the House via Microsoft Teams are requested to not sign into Microsoft Teams with more than one device.

Hon members, the media have also been granted access to the Microsoft Teams meeting as guests of the WCPP. However I wish to remind hon members of the press that they may not use the Chat Room or speak or activate their cameras while this Sitting is in progress.

For this Sitting, hon members, Language Translation Services are available in the Chamber as usual and via Microsoft Teams via the respective channels.

Hon members, I wish to remind you that no interjections are permitted during

these hybrid Sittings and to this end I wish to draw your attention to Rule 40 of our Standing Rules.

Hon members, the Secretary will read the first Order of the Day.

### **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7–2023].

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport, Minister Marais.

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Agbare Speaker, dit is vir my 'n groot voorreg om vandag die Begroting van die Wes-Kaapse Departement van Kultuursake en Sport in die Wetgewer ter tafel te lê vir die goedkeuring van agbare lede.

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Hon Speaker, it is a great privilege for me to table the Budget of the Western Cape Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport in the Legislature for the approval of the hon members.]

I dedicated this Budget speech to the loving memory of Zanele Situ, a Paralympian athlete from our own Western Cape, who inspired many people and inspired me personally. She passed away earlier this year in Kokstad,

KwaZulu Natal. She died too young. I honour her memory and remember her fondly.

Hon Speaker, hon members, I table these Adjustments Estimates of Revenue and Expenditure for the Western Cape Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport at a time of enforced austerity and unprecedented curtailment of funding and services by the ANC-controlled National Government. This will impact the work of our Department to such an extent that I am fully in support of the intergovernmental dispute declared by our hon Premier.

†Dit is bepaald nie die skuld van die Wes-Kaapse Regering dat hierdie pynlike snitte gemaak moet word nie. Die Wes-Kaap is die provinsie van skoon oudits en skoon regering, iets waarmee die ANC-beheerde dele van ons land onbekend is. Dit is jare van wanbestuur, korrupsie en geldmors. Mnr die Speaker, dit is so klakkeloos en beginselloos nagepraat en aangestig deur agbare lede wat die ANC-banke in hierdie Huis vol sit, en wat ons in hierdie posisie plaas. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The Western Cape Government is definitely not to blame that these painful cuts have to be made. The Western Cape is the province of clean audits and clean government, something with which the ANC-controlled parts of our country are unfamiliar with. It is years of mismanagement, corruption and wasting of money. Mr Speaker, it has been echoed offhandedly and without principle and instigated by hon members sitting in the ANC benches in this House, and that put us in this position. [Interjections.]]

Speaker, when they have to tell their constituents whose fault it is that the services of the Department are cut, that children go hungry or are idle after school that the answers cannot create and the sport stars cannot be supported to the extent that was promised, will those ANC critics of this Provincial Government have the decency and the honesty to admit that it was the ANC National Government's in-year budget cuts which brought about the decreases they are sure to stand here and denounce today. Speaker, I believe it would require a standard of honesty and integrity the ANC is incapable of. Let us see.

†Mnr die Speaker, ek lê vandag 'n aangesuiwerde begroting van R888 290 000 ter tafel. Dit is 'n verkleining van R7,2 miljoen op die begroting wat ek vroeër vanjaar by hierdie Wetgewer ingedien het. Die eintlike verwagte snit se impak is in 'n mate versag deur R10 miljoen wat aan die provinsie beskikbaar geraak het. Dit bestaan uit R4,2 miljoen as gevolg van fondse wat oorgerol is vanaf die 2022/23 finansiële jaar, en R5,8 miljoen wat die Wes-Kaapse Onderwysdepartement oorgeplaas het na die Departement van Kultuursake en Sport vir spesifiek jeuggerigte programme.

[Mr Speaker, today I table an adjusted budget of R888 290 000. It is a decrease of R7,2 million on the budget that I tabled earlier this year in this Legislature. The actual expected cuts' impacts were mitigated to an extent by R10 million that had become available to the province. It consists of R4,2 million as a result of funds rolled over from the 2022/23 financial year, and R5,8 million that the Western Cape Department of Education transferred to the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport for specifically youth-centered

programmes.]

As an example R922 000 was rolled over for feasibility studies for potential public private partnerships in respect of the Congo Caves and the two culture facilities. These projects were started in 2022/23 financial year and will be concluded in the current financial year. The remaining funds of R3 million was rolled over for other goods and services committed in the 2022/23 financial year.

Funds shifted from the Department of Education comes to R3 001 000 (Three million one thousand rand) in respect of the @Home Learning Programme, which aims to promote a stronger culture of learning in homes and in the community in support of the Back-on-Track Intervention and R2 million for the Shukuma Moving Mindset Programme, which aims to equip learners with social and emotional skills to regulate their emotions and slow down their responses to violence and respond in healthy responsible ways.

†Uiteraard is daar baie druk op ons Departement om sommige van ons 375 biblioteke te sluit. Dit is op rekord dat ek opdrag gegee het dat geen biblioteek gesluit sal word nie. Ons sal meet en pas. Ons sal spoeg en plak. Ons sal plan maak en rug styfmaak maar elke liewe een van ons 375 biblioteke sal oop bly en funksioneer.

[Obviously there is a lot of pressure on our Department to close some of our 375 libraries. It is on record that I have instructed that no library will be

closed. We will measure and fit. We will spit and paste. We will make a plan and stiffen our backs but every single one of our 375 libraries will remain open and function.]

We have to stand firm on the preservation of our libraries. They are safe spaces where our children can study in peace. They are places where our people can read. They have been transformed into community centres of the best sort, staffed by people the Western Cape Government is very proud of. We will not desert them because they do a job we cannot do without.

Hon Speaker, I now want to turn to an issue I expect my opponent and friend hon Kama to raise. It is the issue of initiation. [Interjections.] For this passion on this issue, he has earned my admiration. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: [Inaudible.] What a shame.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: For his recent lack of factual accuracy and the rabble-rousing on this issue, which has made him nothing but a stranger to the truth, he has earned my frustration. I think we understand each other. I want to assure him, hon Speaker, that no cuts have been made to the budget for initiation because this Western Cape Government cares about the health and the lives of our province's young men.

†Speaker, groot snitte is gemaak aan die sportkant van ons Departement. Die voorwaardelike toewysing, dit is Afrikaans vir "conditional grants", agbare



Marais, die voorwaardelike toewysing vir Sport is drasties gesny deur die ANC-beheerde Nasionale Regering. Anders as met die biblioteek-begroting waar provinsiale prestasie in ag geneem is en die Wes-Kaap dus heelwat beter af is as die wanbestuurde ANC provinsies, is die sportbegroting sonder aansiens des persoons en sonder meriete gesny. Dit beteken, mnr die Speaker, dat die agbare lid Dugmore en die agbare Bakubaku-Vos vir sportklubs wat by hulle kom kla omdat die owerheidstoewysing vir klub-administrasie, klub-ontwikkeling, sport, skoolsport en ontspanning gesny word, aan hierdie mense sal moet beken dat dit die Nasionale ANC Regering in koalisie met die GOOD Party is wat daardie snitte dan gemaak het... [Tussenwerpsels.] ...want dit is 'n voorwaardelike toewysing en ek hoop die agbare De Villiers luister aandagtig, want op nasionale vlak is GOOD mos maar die ANC se handlanger vir die silwerstukke van 'n De Lille Kabinetspos. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Speaker, large cuts were made on the sport side of our Department. The *voorwaardelike toewysing*, that is Afrikaans for "conditional grants", hon Marais, the conditional grant for Sport he ANC-controlled National Government. Unlike the library budget where provincial performances is taken into account and the Western Cape is therefore better off than the mismanaged ANC provinces, the sport budget was cut without regard to persons and without merit. That means, Mr Speaker, that the hon member Dugmore and the hon Bakubaku-Vos will have to admit to Sport clubs who come and complain to them about the government allocation for club administration, club development, sport, school sport and recreation being cut, that it is the National ANC Government in coalition with the GOOD

Party that then made those cuts... [Interjections.] ...because it is a conditional grant and I hope the hon De Villiers is listening attentively, because at national level GOOD is actually only the ANC sidekick for the silver coins of a De Lille Cabinet post. [Interjections.]]

†ME R WINDVOGEL: Ons is nie jou kinders nie.

[Ms R WINDVOGEL: We are not your children.]

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: When the ANC comes to realise the effects of the 336 EPWP Social Sector and the R4 001 000 (four million thousand rand) Mass Participation and Sport Development Grant cut the ANC controlled National Government forced upon this Province by the in-year budget cuts, maybe even they will realise that the DA stands on the side of what is right and the ANC on the side of what is the wrong. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: I wish to thank every member of team DCAS for the long hours and dedication which they put into serving the public from our World Class Archival Service, while those in ANC-run provinces are mostly horror stories of neglect and decay to our 32 excellent museums, and we opened our newest museum in Elands Bay last month. Team DCAS performs wonderfully. I want to thank the staff in my Ministry. I want to thank our Head of Department, Mr Guy Redman for

his leadership. I want to thank our Chief Financial Officer, Ms Brenda Rutgers for her dedication and I want to thank our Chief Director, Sport, Dr Lyndon Bouah for his attention to detail and our Chief Director Culture, Ms Carol Van Wyk, for always walking the extra mile.

†Mnr die Speaker, van ons kunssentrums tot ons Year-Beyond Programme is die Departement waarvan ek die voorreg het om politieke hoof te wees 'n departement wat aan ons mense in die Wes-Kaapland hoop gee. Dit gee ons mense kans om te droom en daardie drome in werklikheid te omskep. Ek sê altyd as jou drome jou nie bang maak nie, dan droom jy nie groot genoeg nie.

Ek lê dan hiermee hierdie Aansuiweringsbegroting ter tafel in belang van almal in die Wes-Kaap.

[Mr Speaker, from our art centres to our Year-Beyond Programmes the Department is which I have the privilege to be the political head a department that gives hope to our people in the Western Cape. It gives our people the chance to dream and change those dreams into reality. I always say that if your dreams don't scare you, you are not dreaming big enough.

I then herewith table this Adjustment Budget in the interest of all in the Western Cape.]

Thank you. [Applause.]

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie, agbare Minister Marais. [Thank you, hon

Minister Marais.] I now recognise the hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and through you, I want to say to my caucus that they should forgive the MEC. They could not have expected anything more than the brief that you must blame the ANC for everything and perhaps the Premier should consider babysitting this Ministry to his office for there is little to none that comes from this office.

Hon Speaker, as I participate in this debate my thoughts are with the families of slain children who lost their lives during the course of the year due to the lack of recreational facilities in the poor working class communities. Due to the lack of investment towards youth, many young people find themselves in gangs and other criminal activities. The ANC long maintained that the budget for this Department is not enough to fulfil its mandate. All the officials in senior to top management of this Department agree with this view.

Allow me to quote the accounting authority of this Department who said his vision was to "close the tap on social ills rather than continuing with the mob."

This was an emphasis on his view that the Department's work is to advance youth development and is preventative in nature, seeking to address the casual linkages of social ills like youth participation in crime and gangs in drugs and in substance-abuse that are currently plaguing our society. Regrettably, this vision is not shared by the DA Government, which persists

in defunding the Department despite pleas for increased budgets. The DA Government is content with Sports Arts and Culture Development in White schools, where access for Black children are extremely controlled to maintain White dominance. The Adjusted Appropriation has been reduced by R7,2 million totalling just over R888 million with the Provincial Treasury originally aiming for an even greater cut of over R27 million. This decision reflects a disregard for the challenges faced by the Black youth particularly African and Coloured individuals who grapple with unemployment and various social issues. The ANC's clear demand is for the DA Government to protect the Department from unwarranted budget cuts. It is misleading to attribute the entire budget cut to reductions in National Conditional Grants as provincial realignments also resulted in an additional cut of over R11,3 million.

Moreover, Speaker, funds have been redirected from critical programmes to pay for TV licenses, air-conditioning and audiovisual equipment. Hon Speaker, we note and welcome that the budget for the Initiation Programme has not been cut. The summer initiation did not start on the right path with many disagreements between the Provincial Government, municipalities and the PICC on the one hand, and the traditional leaders and initiation forums on the other hand. There were disagreements about many issues, including the undermining of the custodians of this right of passage by the Provincial Government and municipalities. Our condolences go to the family of the inmate who passed away in Franschhoek where we long warned that the racist actions of the Stellenbosch Municipality would lead to such things if left

unattended to.

Allow me Speaker, to relay my most humble appreciation for the HOD's responsiveness in trying to resolve the ongoing issues, while discussions continue between the Department and stakeholders to address the differences, we welcome the Department's decision to reverse the closure of the four initiation schools following extensive engagements with initiation forums and the ANC. Hon Speaker, the Budget for Sport and Recreation is decreased by over R6,5 million. This will have a devastating effect on grassroots sports. Despite these senseless budget cuts I wish to commend the Boland Rugby Union for hosting a successful Boland Top 12 Tournament. Boland Rugby Union has over 18 000 registered players and with sufficient resources from this Department, it could produce more World-Cup winning Springboks like Canan Moody, Kurt-Lee Arendse and Grant Williams. We were earlier on even reminded by member Van der Westhuizen of how he was amazed that the Boland Rugby Union was able to fill a stadium while the international game of the Lions in Ellis Park was close to empty. This means there is work that is happening. The only thing that is absent there is this Department. This Government with its apartheid mentality is not found in grassroots sports development. It continues to condemn the Black youth to criminality. It is about separate development. Its apartheid-mentality guides it to invest more in getting them arrested and jailed.

Additionally, I want to congratulate Mhlahli Mpongwana from the dusty straights of Nyanga East – Nyanga East, Premier, is the one that has been

taken out of Google maps for its violent crimes – for his recent call up to the Proteas One Day International Team. Again, this shows that with more investment we can get more national team players from these communities known for violent crimes. Hon Speaker, the Department's vision is pursuing a socially inclusive, creative and active and connected Western Cape. As we strive for this vision, allow me to remind members of this august House of President Nelson Mandela's words when he said:

"But we know too well that our freedom is incomplete without the freedom of Palestinians."

The Gaza genocide has proved that the Western Cape will never be socially inclusive for as long as the DA and its Zionist funders and members support the Israeli war crimes and killing of innocent women and children in Palestine. In a letter written by Hamas to South Africans appreciating their solidarity support, they said:

"We know that South Africans and Palestinians are united by a common bond, the fight for justice, freedom against apartheid and our unwavering spirit of resilience."

The above is also how the majority of the Western Cape citizens relate to the people of Palestine.

In closing, Speaker, as we voiced the ANC's rejection of this budget, we must

remind the Pastor and his racist friend, who continuously calls Hamas terrorists, that the ANC was also referred to as terrorists when it waged the liberation struggle to end apartheid. All the sympathisers and beneficiaries of apartheid are now in support of Israel atrocities in Gaza. The people of the Western Cape see through the hypocrisy of the Moonshot-pact party and they will vote them out in 2024. We pray to God and we pray even harder...  
[Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Yes, yes.

Mr M KAMA: ...that he forgives the Pharisees we have in this House who claim to work for the Lord but support the Gaza genocide and therefore disrespecting the word in the book of Psalms Chapter 9, verse 9, as it says:

"The Lord is the stronghold for the oppressed, a stronghold in the times of trouble."

The ANC, Speaker, does not support this budget. Thank you very much.  
[Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Kama.

Hon members, the next hon member is on the hybrid system so I please ask that you work with me. I recognise the hon Marais.



†Mnr P J MARAIS: Goeiedag, Speaker, goeiedag lede. Dit is vir my 'n voorreg om iets te kan sê vandag. Minister, uit die staanspoor, ja, ek is nie tevrede met wat hulle die begroting so erg gesny het nie, ek is woedend daaroor maar omdat ek u as 'n ingeligte persoon aanvaar sal ek u begroting ondersteun want dit is al wat u kon doen. Ek wil net vir u 'n pleidooi lewer vir Afrikaans, my moedertaal en ek wil sê hy val ook in terme van wat is kultuur, u weet, en ek lees hier wat Pieter Snyders skryf. Hy het 'n gediggie geskryf:

*"Kind, as dji regte Afrikaans wil praat,  
doenit!  
Dis waarom mamma jou lat opleerit  
kritisaais skrywers wat skryf soes mamma praat,  
maa moenie ve'wag mamma moet nou change nie."*

[Mr P J MARAIS: Good day, Speaker, good day members. It is a privilege for me to say something today. Minister, from the beginning, yes, I'm not satisfied that they have cut the budget so severely, I'm furious about it but because I accept you as an informed person I will support your budget because that was all you could do. I just want to make a plea for Afrikaans, my mother language and I want to say it also falls within the terms of what is culture, you know, and I read here what Pieter Snyders writes. He wrote a small poem:

*"Kind, as dji regte Afrikaans wil praat,  
doenit!"*

*Dis waarom mamma jou lat opleerit  
kritisaais skrywers wat skryf soes mamma praat,  
maa moenie ve'wag mamma moet nou change nie." ]*

The SPEAKER: Hon Marais, your time has expired, please conclude.

†Mnr P J MARAIS: Ons kan nie *change* wie ons is nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die kultuur van die Khoi en die Bruin mense en die manier van praat moet uitgebeeld word.

[Mr P J MARAIS: We cannot change who we are. [Interjections.]

The culture of the Khoi and the Brown people and the way of speaking should be illustrated.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Tyd is op.

[An HON MEMBER: Time's up.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais.

†Mnr P J MARAIS: Baie dankie.

[Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais. I recognise the hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Good morning, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, before I rise in support of this budget, I want to wish the champion of Cultural Affairs and

Sports in this Province, our Minister Anroux Marais, a very happy birthday.

[Interjections.] Hon Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members!

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Speaker, we stand here today... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members! Order, members! Hon members! Hon Bosman, please take your seat. Hon members, while I recognise the well wishes... [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: [Singing birthday song, happy birthday to you.]

The SPEAKER: Order members! Members, while I recognise the well wishes... [Interjections.] Order, members! Members, while I recognise the well wishes to the hon Minister, can I please ask that you respect the decorum of the House. There is a member on the floor. Hon Bosman, you may continue.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I just got a little reminder of why the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sports is so important. Perhaps, Minister, a singing class would be a good idea for the African National Congress.

Hon Speaker, we stand here today debating the budget of the Department that

is perhaps the most important Government Department in this province. It is the Department that provides the glue that keeps the province together and despite member Kama's race-baiting remarks of division, this Department is dedicated to nurturing excellence, inspiring hope and forging a socially inclusive, creative, active and connected Western Cape. [Interjections.]

Speaker, since we are nearing the end of our term, it is important to remind the House of the strategic objectives of the Department of Cultural Affairs as they have set it out to themselves in their five year plan. I know that temporary spokesperson for Cultural Affairs and Sports from the African National Congress might not have been the spokesperson when we started in 2019 but when this Minister presented that strategic plan, she wanted to make the Western Cape safe, create supportive environments available across the province in all neighbourhoods, whether middle-class, whether working class, whether rural or whether urban and she wanted to do that through the Department's programmes and through the spaces that counteract the negative situations that the ANC has created in our communities. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: R400 million, yes.

Mr G BOSMAN: The provision of chances for social engagement via pursuits such as artistic endeavours, sports after-school programmes, cultural practices, teamwork and common goals is one of those strategic priorities. This Ministry has faith in the Provincial Youth Service Programme which it spearheads because it helps young people get the experience to become

members of the workforce, to develop their leadership skills and to open doors to educational and employment opportunities. This Department works to keep this Department's buildings in good repair. They perform routine maintenance so that their Department is able to offer cultural and recreational spaces across the Western Cape.

The Department also aims to establish a framework where individuals and communities can fully engage in society, supported by strong governance that enables better service delivery, and we see that through their Grants in Aid Programme, we see that through the successful funding that they give to sports federations in this province. In this Adjustment Budget, we see the majority of the budget going towards Programme 3, Library and Archives Services, a programme that aims to support community libraries and enables communities to gain access to knowledge and information that could improve the socio-economic situations because we have seen through our oversight work, libraries are safe spaces, but even when the Western Cape Government tries to provide a safe space for communities to read and learn, the National Government, led by the African National Congress, continues to cut Conditional Grants that enable libraries to be built and serviced in this province.

Hon Speaker, our National Department of Arts and Culture has wasted precious resources in the last year by investing money in an ill thought out National Orchestra, a National Flagpole Project and various other vanity projects that do very little to provide for the arts and cultural practitioners

in our country. In addition to wasting money on these vanity projects, they have cut the Provincial Cultural Affairs and Sports Budget by R4 million, reducing the Mass Participation of Sport Conditional Grant. This means that this province, a province that has done so well in producing a total of 19 players in the current Springbok squad, is getting less money to train more Springboks, and I am glad member Kama went to the Boland Park and saw the successful public/private partnership at Boland because we know that Boland is now a multiracial business partnership between Mr Motsepe and Mr Rupert.

Hon Speaker, we know that the African National Congress does not have a coherent policy framework to support artists and cultural practitioners. We know that they do not care about preserving the cultural heritage of this country. We know that they use the Portfolio Arts and Culture to send failing cadres to oversee their parties' political propaganda machinery and they use this portfolio, these Ministers, to send out congratulations messages for the successes that they had nothing to do with and they send out condolence messages for icons that they do not care for and they do not provide for.

Hon speaker, this Department has such a small budget and with a total cut of R7 million to their programmes they will suffer even further. These cuts are because the ANC negotiated a National Wage Agreement because they knew they needed the unions ahead of an election that they are on course to lose. Thus they have no issue in cutting the Social Sector Expanded Public Works Programme by R336 000 because, hon Speaker, we need to be honest. The

ANC does not care about the people of the Western Cape.

Hon Speaker, these cuts will hit deep and hard to programmes that are designed to have proven to improve the lives of the people of the Western Cape, programmes such as the Year Beyond Programme, a programme that provides over 400 volunteer opportunities each to youth along with extensive leadership, training and pathways into employment. It has shown such great success with 82% of the cohort of volunteers transitioning into formal employment or into studies.

Hon Speaker, it is going to cut our after-school programmes where the Department won a gold award for public service at the Premier's Service Excellence Award for this programme, a programme that integrates innovative thinking and provides pathways for employment, not a Presidential Stimulus Programme that offers temporary opportunities. These cuts are going to cut our recreation programme. It is going to cut the MOD Programme. It is also going to cut the School Sports Programme that member Kama professes to love so much. These programmes provide not only training opportunities, but also provides opportunities for young people to stay off the streets and to stay away from gangs.

The Neighbourhood Development Approach that was taken by this Department is an innovative approach where neighbourhood development is looking at utilising recreational facilities through mass participation, through school sports and club sports, creating an arts and culture vehicle for the

development of not just individuals, but entire neighbourhoods that contributes to belonging, identity, social inclusion and lifelong activity because this Department not only looks after young people but also older people.

Hon Speaker, I highlight these programmes because those opposite me have spent the last year criticising this Department. They have ridiculed our efforts in this province to build a better life for all when they failed since 1994. Though they bring no meaningful contribution to the multiple challenges our country faces, they sit here aiding and abetting the criminals at Luthuli House, this meanwhile the Western Cape Department of Cultural Affairs and Sports has celebrated 200 years of the isiXhosa language being a written language. This Department has received its 11th consecutive clean audit. The Department has supported 135 major events across all the six districts assisting in the province's economic recovery following the COVID-19 pandemic.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: He is asking for your favours.

Mr G BOSMAN: This Department has promoted sports, tourism and destination marketing. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Just answer my question.

Mr G BOSMAN: It has created 431 EPWP job opportunities in this year and



it supported 610 job opportunities through Arts, Culture and Heritage Programme in this financial year, an impressive 44 342 extra learners participated in district school sports tournaments in the Western Cape.

There are also 818 Mass Participation Opportunity and Access Development and Growth Centre Programmes that have taken place across the nine districts, programmes that provide after-school youth with access to various fun-filled play-based and modified activities in creation and sports, something that the ANC can never do. [Interjections.]

Additionally 3017 youth in-service opportunities were created with an additional 6 205 at-risk youth participating regularly and consistently in after-school programmes.

Therefore, hon Speaker, I want to also say that this Department not only does the hard work, but it also includes others... [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Where?

Mr M KAMA: Where, with R400 million?

Mr G BOSMAN: And I think if member Kama only attends some of the events that he is invited to, he will not say that his Department is missing in action. If member Kama only attends meetings, he will understand what the Department is doing.

The SPEAKER: Order members, order!

Ms N D NKONDLO: That is exactly it.

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Speaker, our thoughts are with the young man who lost his life at the initiation, but I also want to extend today, on behalf of the DA in the Western Cape, our condolences to the Province of the Eastern Cape...  
[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Do not shout!

Mr G BOSMAN: ...who has lost 12 initiates in the last few days...  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr G BOSMAN: The ANC in the Western Cape... [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Come back to the Western Cape!

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Speak about the Western Cape.

Mr G BOSMAN: And hon Speaker... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Bosman, please take your seat.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Come back to the Department.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: You are getting so lost!

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I have allowed a bit of latitude for interjections, but the minute you are... [Interjections.]

Hon Kama, I am on the floor. There is a member on the floor. You are drowning out the member. Interjections are allowed but please do not drown out the speaker and having constant dialogue with the member on the floor.

Mr M KAMA: You must talk about the Western Cape.

The SPEAKER: Hon Bosman, you may continue. [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Speak to the Western Cape.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker we know that this Province through this Department of Cultural Affairs has committed R1,4 billion for youth anti-gang activities in this province.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Where?

Mr G BOSMAN: We know that the Western Cape is the only province that can say that we have got a functioning Department of Arts and Culture that does not lend itself to being a post-office of congratulations and condolence messages. We know that we have an MEC who is visible for doing the hard work and who does not just come to Parliament and grandstands but she actually comes to Committee meetings to answer some of the questions.  
[Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, keeping young people out of gang activity not only safeguards their wellbeing and future prospects, but it also contributes to the overall safety, stability and development of communities. This Department goes a long way in fostering positive environments for growth through the various programmes that I have mentioned. This Ministry does a lot with very little... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Sit down! Sit down!

Mr G BOSMAN: ...and even though the cadres at Luthuli House have cut our budget further so that they can steal, I want to say that through the hard work done by this Department and through the hard work done by our Committee...  
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are not saying anything!

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr G BOSMAN: ...we have no other option as Democratic Alliance but to support this budget and, Speaker, I want to thank the Committee for their hard work in the last year... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr G BOSMAN: ...and I want to especially thank our procedural officer, Mr Waseem Matthews, for his hard work and I feel very sorry for the procedural officer because every committee meeting he has to write down the same information that has been requested since 2019, because our colleagues on the other side cannot decide who their spokespersons are and I hope that for the rest of our term they will determine who their spokesperson is and they will come to meetings prepared instead of coming to the House to grandstand.

Member Kama, you have done well, but this is not a relay, this is a marathon and we hope, hon Speaker, through you... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr G BOSMAN: ...that the acting spokesperson for Culture and Sport, hon Windvogel, will probably attend more meetings than hon Kama. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr G BOSMAN: With that said, Hon Speaker, the Democratic Alliance unanimously supports this vote. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bosman.

†Me R WINDVOGEL: Vertel ons van die 1 136... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Ms R WINDVOGEL: Tell us about the 1 136... [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, before you proceed.

†Me R WINDVOGEL: Vertel vir ons van hulle, 1 136 as 'n mens die ander...

[Tussenwerpsels.]

[Ms R WINDVOGEL: Tell us about them, 1 136 if the other ...

[Interjections.]]

†'n AGBARE LID: Jy het niks gesê nie.

[An HON MEMBER: You said nothing.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Hy het seker meer as jy gesê, hopelik. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Praat gelyktydig, meestal onduidelik.]

[An HON MEMBER: He probably said more than you, hopefully.

[Interjections.] [Simultaneous speaking, mostly indistinct.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon members are you done with your running commentary? Clearly not! I will... Hon Minister, I will wait until the House is able to afford you an opportunity to make your response. [Interjections.] Hon Minister, I now recognise you.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, Speaker. Thank you, †agbare Marais, vir u deelname, [hon Marais, for your participation], as well as for hon Kama.

It is heart sore that, hon Kama, that you still dwell on apartheid and the past and I want to just say the next, the only thing that I want to say to you is...

An HON MEMBER: We must forget about apartheid.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: ...the role and aim of the Western Cape Government is to do its utmost to ensure that our young men return from the initiation alive and healthy. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: So that they speak within.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: And thank you, hon Bosman, thank you for your dedicated oversight and leadership in this portfolio and for always speaking the truth. Thank you so much. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon Members, that concludes the debate on this Vote. Hon Minister, on behalf of all members present and online, I wish you a happy birthday and may you have a wonderful day and blessings for the year ahead.

*[Debate concluded.]*

The SPEAKER: The Secretary will now read the Second Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7–2023].

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, my apologies before I proceed, are there any officials that are joining or can we continue?

An HON MEMBER: It is fine.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. †Die volgende lid is die agbare Minister van Finansies en Ekonomiese Aangeleenthede in die Wes-Kaap. Minister Wenger. [The next member is the Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities in the Western Cape, Minister Wenger.]

†Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES EN EKONOMIESE GELEENTHEDE:  
Baie dankie, Speaker.

[The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank



you, Speaker.]

Good morning, hon members of the House, Speaker, Cabinet colleagues. It is said that there is no business like show business, but in our current fiscal crisis I am coming to know that there is no business like treasury business. The hard working and innovative people that make up our Provincial Treasury, were already leading us through a very difficult macro-economic period at the start of this financial year but the collapse of the national budget process has meant that every person who makes up Team Finance for this Province has had to dig even deeper to enable this Government to do even more with even less for the people of this province.

The PREMIER: Hear, hear!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: When I tabled the Adjustment Budget and the Medium Term Budget Policy Statement last week I shared the hard and honest truth of the situation in-year because National Government wants to foist the liability of an unfunded Wage Deal that was centrally concluded and negotiated onto provinces. In the Western Cape we are expected to magically find an extra R1,1 billion. The Premier and I have already announced that we are in an intergovernmental dispute with National Government about this R1,1 billion shortfall that crowds out funding that should be going to delivering schools, paying nurses, supporting social workers, building roads, and so much more for the people of our province and we have been clear in our message. Give us the R1,1 billion to do so or we will see you in Court, but it is not as simple as that and behind

the scenes there is a lot going on in this Vote.

Being able to present a strong, certain and fiscally responsible budget by doing more with even less for longer requires strong principles, clear leadership, good clean governance, and determined innovation to make sure that the prudent fiscal management of the responsibilities entrusted to us as Government deliver real results and improve people's wellbeing, enhance their safety and vitally grow jobs for hope and shared prosperity.

This year this Vote is that much more important because it is clear that good governance leads to even better results and that the people who form the backbone of that governance are essential and so I thank the officials of the Provincial Treasury, led by acting head official, Ms Julinda Gantana for their professionalism, dedication, expert direction and coordination of a seemingly impossible situation.

The Provincial Treasury has an important role to play in overseeing the financial governance of municipalities, including assisting them with financial capacity, building and training. A total of R5 million will be made available in this Adjustment Budget for the Western Cape Financial Recovery Services Grant which will be used to support vulnerable municipalities of Matzikama, Cederberg, Kannaland, Beaufort West and Laingsburg to enhance their revenue collection.

These municipalities will be asked to submit business plans for the use of the

funds and each municipality will be required to account to the Provincial Treasury on the impact of their project on revenue collection because doing more with less requires that every cent is used to its maximum benefit for the people of this province. A total of R4 million of the Western Cape Financial Management Capability Grant funds is allocated to the vote External Municipal Bursary Programme in order to fund studies in the field of finance.

This Vote is also returning funds as part of the whole-of-government commitments to shielding our children, the poor and most vulnerable from the impacts of the unfunded Wage Deal on service delivery. An amount of R1,07 million is returned from the Financial Management Capability Grant and R336 000 from Municipal Training Projects. Another R2,29 million to support infrastructure delivery is returned for immediate service delivery priorities, in-year and will be relooked at in the next financial year.

As part of this Vote's hard work behind the scenes for a better future for all our residents, work continues on the development of a Fiscal Futures Model. This is an analytical tool to enable the Province to be adaptive in its budgeting over a 10 year budget cycle or 10 year time horizon, particularly during challenging fiscal and economic times. The model will make projections on fiscal transfers, revenue and expenditure with the goal of improving medium and long term budgeting and planning. The model will make use of dashboards to better visualise revenue and expenditure allocations over time according to different scenarios and specified by policymakers. In this way risks and challenges can be identified in advance

so that corrective action can be taken and crises averted long before the curtain rises.

The Fiscal Futures Model is expected to be finalised in the 2024/25 financial year, when the Province will begin to incorporate scenario-based planning into the budget processes. This Vote's ability to respond to responsibly contribute to revenue enhancement and the efficient collection of revenue is clearly seen through the R5,6 million internal allocation in the Vote's budget in respect of gambling. Increased revenue collected by the Board meant that their grant was reduced, unlocking an allocation as follows. In the 2023/24 financial year, R2,16 million is for the economic and legal analysis of the potential of taxes and charges under the proposed new legislative scheme and in support of the development of a new Gambling Legislative Framework, additional resources in the amount of R3,5 million were made available over the 24 MTEF for the continued economic analysis, as well as additional capacity required for Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board oversight functions.

Provincial Treasury is nothing if not efficient in how it manages its people and processes and people and innovation remains a strategic focus to meet its mandate. It intends to build a culture of accountability, transparency and continuous improvement and connection to the lived experience of the residents of the Western Cape, but the implications of the Wage Agreement in the 2023/24 financial year and the carry-through over the MTEF meant that we needed to relook at our critical posts. Compensation of employees was

therefore reduced by R8,7 million and the remaining staff will be supported by management in doing more with less and thanks to the internal efficiencies identified in its Evergreen Legacy System Initiative and the Customer Relations Management Tool, a total of R2 million and R800 000 respectively will be returned to the Provincial Revenue Fund in this Adjustment Budget. There will also be further savings on printing, savings on the use of vehicles and savings on training.

Finally, in this Vote, support of prudent financial and non-financial management of our budget, the public entity review is in its final act and will shortly close. The review was undertaken as part of a continuous effort towards creating a leaner and cleaner Provincial Government and I am thankful for the extensive work done by the Provincial Treasury towards that end. Hon Speaker, as part of this Vote's commitment to professional and prudent fiscal management of a budget to build a future for every person in the Western Cape and especially the poorest of the poor, our children and the most vulnerable in society, we have released R24,2 million to the Provincial Revenue Fund, therefore bringing the total Adjusted Budget for the Provincial Treasury to R316,4 million for the 2023/24 financial year.

What this means in practical terms is that our Administration Programme now receives R57,6 million, our Sustainable Resource Management Programme now receives R126,3 million, our Asset Management Programme now receives R80,9 million and our Financial Governance Programme now receives R51,6 million.

Hon Speaker, I shared earlier my growing understanding that there is no business like treasury business. Today we have seen the diligent work that is behind Treasury's work in our provincial finances. Like any good stage production, the meticulous care that has gone into every decision, allocation adjustment, reduction and return is carefully planned, rehearsed and executed through the programmes and the projects that this Vote is fulfilling so that overall our Government can achieve its goals through decisive, clean and corruption-free governance. I think we can all agree that this Treasury team has one of the toughest tasks, but despite the collapsed National Budget Process, they are doing an excellent job in making sure that the finances of this Province are prudently and sustainably applied on the basis of good governance for the safety for the well-being and for job creation of every resident, especially our children, the poorest of the poor and our most vulnerable. Thank you.

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie, agbare Minister.

[The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.] I recognise the hon Nkondlo.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

Ms N D NKONDLO: *Enkosi Somlomo.*

Once again, happy birthday to MEC for Sport and Culture.

...amnesia about the history of apartheid in our country because we are still living that reality on a day-to-day. You may not. I rise today on behalf of the ANC to decline support for the proposed Budget Adjustment for the Western Cape for the Department of Treasury.

Speaker, the MEC in the Medium Term Budget tabled what she calls "a Budget to Build Your Future." I think she meant "one to build your future, future of their friends, future of the DA donors." The DA Provincial Treasury hollows out state capacity to friends and to their donors. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms N D NKONDLO: The ANC expresses its opposition to the Adjustment Budget of the DA-led Provincial Treasury. The Department has been hell-bent on delivering on the DA positions on a leaner government as the MEC has said and in talking about the leaner government, all you want to caution is that it is very important, MEC, that you and your DA do not sit and continue to be obsessed of your neo-liberal policies, which is get this Government and the people of this province into serious problems, as we see in the communities of Khayelitsha in majority Black people in Manenberg and others.

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms N D NKONDLO: It is very interesting to talk about leaner government in a growing population where every time in every budget you call about increase of the Provincial Equitable Share, but obviously you come here and you tell us about a leaner government. What does that mean? Are you going to be replacing employees with robots? Are you eroding worker rights and their dignity as you promote the unfettered market powers to hire and fire?

The MEC spoke eloquently here, saying:

"...that this Main Budget is what gives life and funding to every purpose of Government to deliver what is required to enable economic growth and job creation, while protecting the most vulnerable in society until they can be brought into the economy and empowered with the skills and opportunities they need to succeed."

It is baffling that the DA Government during this Medium Term Budget Adjustment spoke about funding economic growth and job creation and opportunities, and is now slashing numbers, reducing vacancies from 40 to 16 in a so-called reprioritisation move, which is just a euphemism for job cuts. This includes axing a four-year bursary programme down to two years, undermining the potential for internal growth and expertise.

Speaker, the excuse of difficulty in finding suitable candidates or process being low is weak as this is the excuse they have always been receiving from departments about staff vacancy, especially when staff attrition is soaring with 24 resignations in this Provincial Treasury and earlier retirements. It is



clear that the Provincial Treasury is neglecting its workforce leading to dismal morale and an erosion of institutional strength, as evident in the 2022/23 Annual Report discussions. The MEC, as said, spoke again eloquently here in this House, which I want to further quote.

"Each year the Western Cape Government starts its budget process in June and between June and September, which we call Phase 1, we prepare for the years to come based on the national fiscal status and various projections by applying a scenario-based risk aware and evidence-led approach."

Speaker, bear in mind that with all these words a handsome amount of the people's money is spent annually on consultants to do fiscal projections of the future of the Western Cape, which is something that the Premier sitting in front of us spoke about when he took a reign of talking about fiscal futures.

During the Annual Budget, the Department spent R1,1 million on future fiscal projections to the company DNA Economics. We are still asking where is the earth-shattering discovery from these fiscal futures on re-orientating public financing. Instead, what we hear here is Americanisation of our provincial economy, as we are told about a private-led economy with assumed perfection of the markets, whilst people are seeing in this particular province problems of the market as we saw them during the COVID-19 where people had to lay in hospitals and companies were refusing to take accountability about neglect of health and safety in their own operations to ensure that people are protected against COVID. Had they possessed these

analytical skills, they would not have missed the global phenomenon, also affecting the low and the lower middle countries as set out in studies done respectively by Oxfam International in policy dialogue about the impact of the global recession. This could be said to be deliberate as this Government thinks it is a State-Owned of its own, it is a state of its own outside of South Africa as they promote exceptionalism of the Western Cape. The MEC further went on and I quote:

"And each year the cycle repeats so at any time we should know what will be allocated where and for what purpose."

The people of the Western Cape must understand that the DA opposes these austerity measures when in fact they want a smaller government as they said, their priority in their analysis, they didn't have the people at heart, but that rather their friends and donors, hence they have cut the budget on the compensation of the employees and transferred it to a retention recruitment plan, which is led by the Premier's Office, as you would find in the DA Manifesto.

This is very interesting and alarming of the double standards of these members of the DA who sit here very comfortably and do not reject even in the main Parliament when there is increase to the salaries of Members of Parliament. We have not received any record of the DA rejecting that but here yesterday, as we have heard, that this is the one Parliament that does not pay its employees like all others, again it is cutting jobs so it is nice to have

cuts... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms N D NKONDLO: ...only for your own benefit and you leave all the other employees and actually erode their rights. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members!

Ms N D NKONDLO: That is not going to happen. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, please take a seat. Hon members on both sides of the House, there is constant commentary across the floor. Please allow the hon member to make a contribution. Hon Nkondlo, you may continue. My apologies.

Ms N D NKONDLO: *Ndiyabulela Somlomo.*

The Chihuahuas cannot be assisted, that is what they have to do. It is alarming to contemplate the future labour relations landscape under the DA LED Federal State on Independent Western Cape and therefore all those that are employees from this Western Cape Provincial Parliament to Government Departments, must use their democratic right as citizens of the country and this province to go into the polls and vote the DA out. This blatant manoeuvring of funds within the Provincial Treasury Budget amounting to

around R6 million is nothing short of a political sleight of hand. Shifting resources under the guise of a revised recruitment plan into various programmes, including Administration, Sustainable Resource Management, Asset Management, and Financial Governance, raises serious questions about transparency and accountability. The diversion of funds towards consultancy services, legal fees, leave gratuity and the impact of the 2023 Cost of Living Adjustments... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, your time has expired. Please conclude.

Ms N D NKONDLO: In conclusion, the ANC does not support this Budget because it is anti-workers and exposes the hypocrisy of the Democratic Alliance. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Nkondlo. Hon members, just for the record, on the Speaker's List is the hon Klaas, and I have received an apology so I am going to go straight over to hon Murray.

Ms C MURRAY: Hon Speaker, I would like to start with a reflection from a famous UK politician, she said:

"If they attack one personally, it means they have not a single political argument left."

An HON MEMBER: She is a great politician.

Ms C MURRAY: I think this is an important thing to keep in mind, particularly as we look at the austere measures that have been put in place to protect the people of this province and which the ANC seemingly does not believe are unnecessary.

Today, Speaker, we stand at the pivotal moment confronting a shadow that has loomed over our budget process coming for 30 years now. This shadow, dark and menacing, has grown stretching across our nation, threatening to eclipse the very light of progress and hope that we still have. It is a shadow cast by a pervasive and insidious corruption, a corruption that is seeped into the very fabric of the ANC, tainting every level from the top echelons to the grassroots and I think it is prudent to mention that this is exacerbated by the death-knell that is the Public Sector Wage Bill. This corruption is a corruption fed by criminality and today, Speaker, we face a stark reality. The coffers are empty and the time of reckoning has arrived.

Speaker, the resignation of Mavuso Msimang, a stalwart of the ANC since the 1960s, is a Clarion call. His words etched in history resonates with the profound truth and acknowledgement that the party he once served has veered off the path of integrity. His departure is not an isolated incident, but rather a symptom of a systemic disease that has plagued the ANC, a disease of self-service and rampant greed. We have witnessed this and particularly we have seen it in countless scandals, each one a stark reminder of the ANC's betrayal of the people's trust.

Consider the saga of Kusile and Medupi touted as power stations, yet failing to fulfil their basic purpose. Over 16 years, R300 billion, an equivalent to four years of the Western Cape's entire budget, was poured into these projects. Nobel laureate Amartya Sen once said:

"Poverty is not just a lack of money. It is not having the capability to realise one's full potential as a human being."

This staggering sum, I remind you, R300 billion, which could have improved countless lives and alleviating people from poverty by building much needed schools, hospitals and job creating infrastructure has instead lined the pockets of the corrupt, leaving our people impoverished not only in wealth but in capability and opportunity. This is not just the misallocation of funds. It is a crime against the potential of our people. Hon Speaker, let us consider the present state of our own budget. For the fiscal year of 2023/24, the Provincial Treasury has been handed an Adjusted Budget of R316 million marking a decrease of R23 million or 7,1% from the previous year's Main Budget. This reduction has translated into budget cuts across all critical programmes. We see this in the administration with a reduction of over 14%, while sustainable resource management and asset management which have been or which have seen Budget adjustments of approximately 9,2% and 9,7% respectively. This while the spectre of economic recession looms over us, threatening to compound the challenges that we already face.

Recent reports indicate that South Africa's economy has contracted by more than anticipated, shrinking by 0,2% in the third quarter of 2023. This contraction follows on the heels of an already tepid growth, signalling a troubling trend that may herald a recession.

A recession, Speaker, is traditionally defined by two successive quarters of economic decline, and key sectors foundational to our labour market and overall economic health, have seen a marked decrease in output, further exacerbating the situation. Coupled with power shortages, infrastructure challenges and high interest rates, these indicators present a clear risk of prolonged economic downturn.

Despite these constraints, hon Speaker, our Provincial Treasury stands resilient, having put strong systems and controls in place that will act as a buffer in these trying times. They are steadfast in their resolve to ensure that the Western Cape Government continues to deliver exemplary services to its citizens regardless of the financial woes plaguing our National Government.

The revelations of the Zondo Commission laid bare the depth of state capture, a looting spree that robbed billions of our citizens, yet the wheels of justice grind slowly and those implicated remain untouched, mocking our laws and the principles of justice. This too is a crime against the potential of our people. The very same party, the very same party parades as if they are in fact representatives of the workers, when they are far from it. Speaker, I address the ANC's moral bankruptcy today because it is the root of the

budgetary challenges we face across the Western Cape Government. The people are aware, yet they must be constantly reminded. This is not normal. This is not acceptable and we must not stand idly by. The Western Cape under DA governance stands as a beacon of hope, a testament to what can be achieved with integrity and fiscal responsibility. We do not claim to serve the people. Our unqualified audits are testament to our commitment to them. In the Western Cape, we have shown what is possible when governance is rooted in honesty and efficiency. Our province shines as the best run in the country with the best roads, schools, hospitals and thriving economy. This is the reality that we have created, a province that works and a province that serves the people and to that regard I must commend the Minister. I must commend the Acting HOD and the hard-working officials who put in time well past what they are rationally expected to do. We know that this has been an incredibly difficult period for all, and yet they are continuing to keep the wheels on the bus.

Hon Speaker, the ANC is deluded if they think that there is a viable alternative to this budget. When they vote against it, they are essentially voting against the potential of our people and they are voting for continued corruption and continued state failure. The budget cuts imposed on us are a direct result of ANC corruption and it is clear that more years under ANC rule will only deepen this crisis. It is time for change. It is time to choose a better path, a path of efficiency, honesty and hope.

Speaker, I support the Provincial Treasury Budget. It is more than a financial



plan. It is a commitment to keeping the Western Cape free from corruption that has plagued the rest of our nation. It is a commitment to our people, to a future of prosperity and integrity. Despite budget cuts to most of our programmes, we remain unwavering in our dedication to good governance, our sound financial management is the bastion against the fiscal mismanagement witnessed by the ANC at the national level, ensuring that the Western Cape remains a stronghold of service and prosperity for all, I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Murray. I recognise the Minister, Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Speaker. Thank you very much to the hon Chair for the work that she does in the Committee and to the members of the Standing Committee that conduct oversight over this Department. Thank you very much to those parties that support this budget. There was the word "hypocrisy" shared in this Chamber from hon Nkondlo, but how can it be that the ANC National Government is cutting our budget by R6 billion over the MTEF and in addition to that, not funding a Wage Deal that they negotiated and then asking, why are we freezing posts?

Ms C MURRAY: Hypocrites.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: You

know, why do we have a leaner government? Well, because we have no other choice. We cannot be ostriches and pretend that there is not a problem here. We cannot be like the KZN Provincial Government that is just going to overspend by R10 billion. That is not fiscally responsible. We are not pretending. We are putting the issues on the table and we are making this work. We are not a government that lives beyond our means. We are responsible with every rand of tax money. So how do we do this? What does leaner government mean? I was asked what does that mean?

First of all, it means we protect basic services. That is the first thing that we do. That is what, we prioritize basic service delivery.

Secondly, we unlock allocated efficiency. That means we stretch every single rand that we get, even though we proportionately get less than other provinces... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: So for example, Limpopo. Limpopo has one million less people than the Western Cape, but they get R6,5 billion more than we do and in that province they have just spent a multi-million rand tender to provide coal to 14 hospitals that do not even have the facilities to use coal as a fuel source. [Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Stupidity.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Alright, let us talk about hypocrisy. Thirdly, we enhance productive efficiency, which means we make every rand count... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: ...and we do more with every rand by making sure it is efficient and we crowd in resources through partnerships and other means, and finally, we ensure long run fiscal sustainability because we are also responsible with every single rand and cent, not only now, but also for future generations, and for that reason, Hon Speaker, I therefore ask that the House supports this Vote. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. [Interjections.] Order members, order. Hon members, that concludes the debate on this Vote.

*[Debate concluded.]*

The SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the Third Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7–2023].

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon members. Hon Minister, before I recognise you, is the Department ready, can we continue? I am going to allow the Minister a second.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you very much, Hon Speaker. The words "jobs, growth and budget cuts" are not typically heard or spoken together, but this year, more than ever before, we know that creating more jobs and making our provincial economy the choice destination for the private sector to invest, innovate, establish and grow is how we will together get through this seemingly impossible fiscal crisis, because as writer Robert Frost wisely said:

"The best way out is always through."

Our Growth for Jobs Strategy pioneered by this Vote and transversely managed across every Department for determined execution, is our map through this crisis. Growth for Jobs or G4J is our roadmap towards a trillion rand jobs rich, inclusive, resilient, thriving and diverse provincial economy that is growing at between 4% and 6% in real terms by 2035. We know that

the only way we will effectively address the challenges we face to breakthrough the dismal national constraints to growth, primarily including load shedding, SOE bailouts, the unaffordable Public Sector Wage Bill and the logistics crisis illustrated painfully by the barely functioning port of Cape Town is by enabling what we call "breakout economic growth that will create jobs."

We are focusing on achieving this goal because it has the potential to create over 600 000 jobs through meticulous planning and expert execution, because we know that with those jobs comes dignity, hope and the promise of a better future for every person in our province, most especially for the poor and the vulnerable and we are already seeing and that is not a laughing matter, Hon Speaker. This is a very serious topic. Job creation in our province is not a laughing matter. We are already seeing results. The latest quarterly Labour Force Survey, Quarter 3 of 2023, has shown that more jobs were created in the Western Cape between Quarter 3 of 2022 and Quarter 3 of this year, more so than any other province. We also have the lowest unemployment rate, the lowest expanded unemployment rate, the highest absorption rate and the highest labour force participation rate in South Africa. While the ANC might like to pretend that they are the defenders of the working class, they completely ignore the plight of thousands of unemployed people, especially young people who are desperate for a job and an opportunity for a better tomorrow but we have not forgotten them.

Hon Speaker, this is precisely why this Vote is so critical for our Government

and its objectives. We can only get out of the current crisis by going through the hard work and by making the tough decisions and trade-offs in a data-led all-of-government approach that enables the private sector. This Vote is key to that breakthrough.

Through our SMME Booster Fund, we seek to unlock economic growth by enabling small and micro enterprises to grow and succeed and employ more people. This fund distributes funding to selected organisations which deliver training programmes on business development support and access to markets and currently R8,18 million is allocated, which remains in this Adjusted Budget. One such example is the Bicycling Empowerment Network in Langa. This organisation aims to promote sustainable, social and economic empowerment in communities, where this empowerment is so vital.

Another is the collaboration between the Department and the Silulo Foundation, an organisation focused on empowering entrepreneurs and skills development in townships. We will continue to support organisations like these and many more through the Booster Fund. But, hon Speaker, we are all aware that one of the most devastating handbrakes on our economic growth are the rolling loadshedding blackouts that severely impact economic activity and therefore the ability to create jobs. SMME's often bear the brunt of the devastating blackouts because they are unable to afford alternative energy solutions.

Through our alternative energy support for SMMEs, we will assist businesses

with the acquisition of alternative energy solutions. The project recently reached a major milestone with bid evaluations being concluded for sites in Mossel Bay, Oudtshoorn, Laingsburg, Drakenstein, Stellenbosch, Theewaterskloof and Cape Agulhas. The implementation timeframe for all sites will commence in January 2024 and will be completed by the end of February 2024.

Given the overwhelming energy needs we are facing as a province, a portion of the alternative energy support for SMME's will be relinquished to the Energy Fund in the amount of R6,5 million and I look forward to sharing even more about how we as a government are helping the people and businesses of our province to get through these dark days.

Also on the energy front, a total of R9,2 million is shifted from this Vote to Vote 9 Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning for the Green Economy Ecosystem Support Project or GEES. The GEES Project aims to provide direct support to the economy through helpdesks and the provision of information on energy and water-related matters, provide industry briefs and information packs, strengthen the ecosystem through promotion and awareness campaigns and provide supplementary support to municipalities on energy matters. The shift will ensure a more focused alignment of functions, and we are satisfied that sufficient skills and mandates sit within Vote 9's Environmental Economy Team.

Another R9,1 million of unallocated energy funds will be returned to the

Provincial Treasury, where it has been reallocated as part of our all-of-government commitment to prioritising service delivery to our children, the poorest of the poor and the most vulnerable in society.

Hon Speaker, the Western Cape is a sought-after tourism destination and we want to keep growing the sector because of its immense ability to stimulate local economies and to create jobs. Our data show that in 2022, 214 000, almost 215 000 direct jobs were created by the Western Cape Tourism Sector. We are glad, happily expecting a 25% increase in international seats this summer and we are seeing strong signs of recovery to growth from our domestic and local tourists who are finding many reasons to visit our province, to stay longer and take their good experiences home to spread the word and in so doing create many more jobs that will take us through to breakout economic growth.

Of course, international tourists and locals alike should be able to enjoy the absolute beauty of our national parks and tourism spots with peace of mind and together with our partners in the city of Cape Town, we will be spending R3 million on tourism law enforcement officers over the Medium Term Expenditure Framework with an immediate injection of R2 million in this Adjustment Budget. The support and boosting of tourism businesses is key to a thriving tourism sector and through our G4J Tourism Challenge Fund we capacitate vital skills, jobs and growth.

In this year alone, a total of seven projects were approved for funding to the



value of R2,6 million. Funding projects from Mitchell's Plain to Mossel Bay to Van Rhynsdorp, enabling them to grow and create jobs across the province. This includes businesses like Our Labs that foster community-based housing opportunities and develop a diverse range of tourist experiences. It also extends to ocean-based sustainable tourism projects and promoting avitourism to position the Garden Route as a premier birding tourism destination in South Africa and the growth in visitors to our province and country whether it is tourists or skilled workers and contributors to economic growth for an efficient and effective visa regime remains an essential priority of mine. That I will continue to engage with my colleagues and Minister Motsoaledi towards substantive action and results.

As part of G4J, we are aiming to triple the value of Western Cape exports of goods and services by 2035. As much as tourism is considered an export, we are not turning a blind eye to the blight on our economic growth that is sitting in front of our eyes at the nationally run Port of Cape Town. We know that if the port works, our economy works and our research indicates that if we can increase exports by 10% we can generate an estimated additional R6 billion to the Western Cape Gross Domestic Product, which will create many more jobs.

The importance of trade to this Government is evidenced by the launch of the Export Competitiveness Enhancement Programme by DEDAT earlier this year, which aims to support businesses that are export-ready or working towards export readiness to meet international market requirements.

Currently supporting 12 exporters in industries including agri-processing, beverages, and boat building, the aim of the programme is to help Western Cape based SMMEs looking to increase their export activities in current and new markets. It provides support that ranges from product reformulation, certification, specialised shipping and labelling and with a R5 million allocation by the end of the financial year, the Programme will have resulted in the creation of 201 new jobs and more than R7,2 million will be leveraged through the Department's investment. We are planning to continue this fund in the next financial year, but we can only properly increase exports and grow even more jobs if we solve the logistics crisis, a massive impediment to our growth. It increasingly seems as if the National Government does not grasp the seriousness of this crisis and as a result the necessary urgency is severely lacking. It is unfathomable that our farmers cannot plant additional crops and employ additional people because there is no certainty that they will be able to get their product to market. The inefficiencies at the Port of Cape Town and in fact all ports managed by Transnet inhibits the growth of so many sectors right across South Africa. That is why we are continuing our dedicated ports and exports work to see an efficiently run Port of Cape Town with private sector participation to get our province's goods to export markets on time every time.

Hon Speaker, stimulating trade and growing investment is a crucial part of our G4J strategy and the entities that DEDAT funds and oversees are an important part of those outcomes.

Despite a reduction of R4,9 million in Wesgro's allocation due to the in-year cuts imposed by National Government, the entity continues to do sterling work to bolster trade and attract investment to the Western Cape.

We also see a R1,7 million reduction in the budget allocation of the Atlantis Special Economic Zone. DEDAT is undertaking a sustainability review of the Industrial Development Zones under its oversight to ensure that we continue to do more with less and R1 million is shifted from Programme 5 to Programme 1 to provide for this review.

To conclude, hon speaker, collectively, it means that the Department of Economic Development and Tourism's Budget for the 2023/24 financial year is adjusted to R482,9 million which is tabled before you for debate today.

I know we can all agree that jobs are what this province and country need for the hope and dignity that our people need and deserve, especially the poorest of the poor and the most vulnerable. Without the businesses, investors, innovators and tourists that make up these jobs that make these jobs possible, our way through is blocked.

I thank our passionate team within DEDAT astutely led by the Head of Department, Mr Welile Dube, for their dedication and determination to expertly develop and to grow our economy through these tough, tough times and into a better tomorrow for all. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise the Hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I rise again here on behalf of the ANC to decline our support for the proposed Budget Adjustment for the Western Cape, for the Department of Economic Development and Tourism; an adjustment that has been adjusted down by R29,8 million from the Main Budget of R512,7 million down to R482,9 million.

Whilst we consider what has been shifted and actually applaud, as we did for all these years when we participated in the Standing Committee to support the SMME Booster Fund, even the extension of the SMME Booster Fund welcomes the initiatives like the Tourism Challenge Programmes that the Department is implementing. Our concern which we are consistent in raising in the Department, is that these programmes are just too few and too dispersed to make any impact to the number of SMMEs of start-ups and many others were unemployed out there in this particular province where a quarter of a population from 7,4 million of its citizens lie unemployed.

We sit here, Minister, and ask that every time you think and you do your budget and also the budget adjustments that the lobbying that we have been doing even in the previous Administration to date about the informal sector is falling on deaf ears. It is falling on deaf ears whilst you came clear that we do not provide any proposals, knowing for fact that we have been saying

these issues when we stand here and debate, and also during the times when we had conversations with you through the Standing Committees, and we are not saying this out of any scientific evidence. Your continuous representation of the Provincial Economic Review and Outlook and also Municipal Economic Review and Outlook has been consistent in producing evidence to this effect that informal employment, informal sector continues to prove itself as one of the resilient sectors and therefore, as you are doing in this Government, to increase and put more effort to the likes of agriculture and other sectors important for this economy. We plead, as we have been doing to you, that you need to consider that programmes like the Integrated Economic Development that had to shift some funds and actually the biggest funds in this budget are supposed to be looking at the issue of using this particular evidence that comes from the MERO to actually provide you proper strategies in dealing with the issue of the informal sector.

We are asking you that the Trade and Sector Development Programme 3 is also another sector that is sleeping on duty if you consider what it is supposed to be doing, including business regulation, because every time we ask where is evidence of your red-tape reduction that indeed it is responding to the challenges and the harassment of informal traders in the municipalities of this particular province, you always tell us that you are unable to disaggregate and produce to us such evidence. So therefore, Minister, do not misrepresent us and the work that we do, because what we do here is not necessarily lobbying for some corporates as you would seem as the DA you are doing, as you said that the only interest that you seem to have is the Cape

Town Port because clearly, and it shall be revealed and exposed, that in your interest is actually to lobby for some in the private sector, and you leave all the other members of society and that is why we are here, to ensure that we remind you of the balance.

The Government of this particular province has auctioned its primary responsibility to the private sector and is working tirelessly to ensure that those who do not have the means nor the voice are bought out. A story of Mathea Eichel, a Black woman entrepreneur, the owner of the Galley Restaurant in Fish Walk, whose building of operation was just auctioned off from her through competition, not because she could not afford the bid, but due to those with more money. In her own words she holds that: "They made it very exclusive for me to keep up with the bid."

The competitive nature of the private sector will leave the poor and marginalised destitute. The benefits and resources of the State that the Government wants to divert to the private sector will only benefit the rich and all of this when you talk about Growth for Jobs, Minister, you must not forget that actually even here in this country of ours, and also studies are littered about jobless growth, so there is no guarantee as we have seen here when we implemented here in this country of ours that, yes, there were those authorities but the challenge that we saw is jobless growth. Actually the Premier Winde was an MEC of Economic Development in the previous Administration with a target of more than 500 000 jobs and they could not by the time he became the Premier, he could not even deliver on that 500 000

jobs. So he comes here and tells us about Growth for Jobs, which is just an illusion that they always create to just woo voters for the people.

In the Medium Term Budget, the MEC presented the economic cluster with R44,8 billion, which according to her will prioritise the Growth for Jobs Strategy. On the contrary, this money will rather benefit all those consulting companies and contractors that they are funding. What is here are targeted strategies as you, the last Administration under the same Premier who was an MEC of Economic Development, all he does is to create shows. He created a Township Revitalisation Strategy which delivered nothing but bring depression and problems to more of the SMMEs from the townships that he claimed were part of that. Now he has moved to the higher position of being a Premier with nothing that he can demonstrate as a delivery. [Interjections.]

He promised jobs for each household when he came in here, and none of those have been delivered. So we know these types of strategies, Premier, that you put up every time so that you can woo votes and you always make empty promises in this province.

I want to quote the words in the G4J:

"...that the primary focus of the G4J Strategy is the enablement of private-sector led economic growth through creating a business environment conducive to growth..."

And there is nothing wrong to doing that. All we are asking is that if you talk

about creating an enabling environment, please consider that any economy is run with the State, with the workers, with the communities, who must also be allowed the similar enabled environment by those that are participating to ensure that we grow the economy. It cannot be that all you do is to guarantee private sector whilst you do not guarantee workers when they are being abused in the farms, as we speak, by farmers and some have actually found themselves being illegally evicted by the same farmers, and you keep quiet in this Provincial Government, whilst you have a responsibility to enable an economy, and an economy includes those who labour and sweat their time so that there is productivity and competitiveness in these companies that you're talking about. So we shall not be silent about those issues, as you would sit here and you are comfortable because that private sector you are enabling, you know, behind the doors is the one that donates to you and your friends.

[Mr A P Van der Westhuizen takes the Chair.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: So the future that you are talking about is the future of yourselves with the comfort of the pay-packs also of what you get from this private sector.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Nkondlo. Your time has expired.



Ms N D NKONDLO: The ANC cannot support this budget because it is a misdiagnosis of the fiscal crisis that our global community is currently experiencing.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: The budget is anti-workers, is anti-township economy, it is anti the informal economy and therefore we decline support for this Bill. I thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Hon Deputy Chief Whip.  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP: Chair, just on Rule 66, based on Parliamentary Practice, when your time is up, you need to conclude your speech so if we are going to create a precedent that the ANC can continue and continue, then we are going to expect that that needs to be extended to everyone in this House.  
[Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: A frivolous point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: The point is the same, thank you. I recognise the hon Murray. Thank you. Hon Murray, just...

Ms C MURRAY: Hon House Chair...

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Just wait, hon Murray.

Ms C MURRAY: On the insightful words of Baroness Dambisa Moyo, African economies are facing the challenge of deindustrialisation, a trend that is undermining the economic potential. This poignant observation is a crucial backdrop to our discussion today as we look at the Western Cape's Budget Vote for Economic Development and Tourism within the larger context of what African deindustrialisation actually means.

Our people yearn for development. They yearn for employment and they yearn for opportunity, given opportunity. They are eager to work, contribute to society and build a prosperous life for themselves and their families.

In the Western Cape we are witnessing the fruits of our labour. We boast the lowest unemployment rate in the country at 20,2%, a figure nearly 12 percentage points lower than the national average.

From the Third Quarter of 2022 to the Third Quarter of 2023 we have successfully added 305 000 jobs, which is higher than any other province. This represents not just progress, but a beacon of hope in a continent grappling with economic stagnation.

The Department of Economic Development and Tourism plays a pivotal role in sustaining this momentum. Our Growth for Jobs Strategy is a testament to

our commitment to achieving job-rich economic growth. In contrast to the failed State policies of the National ANC-led Government, our strategy perceives the Government's role in the economy as an enabler and not a controller.

Our aim is to create a fertile ground for business to flourish, ensuring that regulation fosters innovation, infrastructure meets needs and the populace is equipped with industry demanded skills. However, our Province's efforts unfold against the backdrop of ANC national economic decay, which we have had to endure as a result of their mismanagement for years. This mismanagement is a microcosm of what we see in broader failing African nations which are also struggling with deindustrialisation. [Interjections.]

Where the DA seeks to support and enable businesses, the ANC gravitates towards control and overregulation. This ideological difference is starkly reflected in our contrasting economic outcomes. A recent and telling development is the withdrawal of French investments from our nation. A decision driven by issues around energy stability, logistics efficiency and anti-corruption measures. These are challenges the DA is poised to address, but are continually exacerbated under the ANC's policies and Government.

Additionally the ANC's inability to implement a straightforward policy like the Remote Working Visa, starkly illustrates their counterproductive governance approach. Such a visa is a direct route to economic growth, attracting digital nomads to our province, bolstering sectors like retail,

accommodation and entertainment. Yet it remains unrealised under the ANC's watch. It is to be seen if the President will make a third announcement launching this in SONA next year.

Tourism, a significant driver of job creation, is also hampered by the ANC's governance. [Interjections.] The Western Cape Government has had to step in launching a dedicated Tourism Safety Unit. This will support the work that Wesgro has done to ensure more than 1 million inbound international seats at Cape Town International Airport for the tourism season. Our proactive approach is in direct contrast with the ANC's indifference towards both safety and job creation. Hallmarks of those proponents of African deindustrialisation.

The detrimental impact of the ANC's governance is further highlighted in the Department's changed budget as a result of budget cuts. Owing to financial mismanagement, the Department has suffered a R30 million budget cut, impeding its job creation initiatives. This scenario echoes a broader trend of deindustrialisation seen across African nations such as Zimbabwe, Congo, Mozambique, where governmental mismanagement and external economic pressures have led to both economic decline and job losses.

My question, hon Speaker, is does the ANC understand what the consequences are of not having a functional port or not having functional infrastructure? Or do they profit from us not having a functional port and functional infrastructure? I ask this because they seem to dispute the fact

that not having a functional port is actually going to be detrimental to our economy.

Back home we do have complete inefficiency in the Port of Durban, Cape Town, Port Elizabeth, to name a few. We have also seen Eskom fail to deliver power to factories and the complete implosion of countless State-owned Enterprises. The very enterprises that should support economic development, but which are actually holding it back. These are the hallmarks of deindustrialisation.

Despite these adversities the Department of Economic Development and Tourism remains resolute in its mission. The Adjusted Budget of R482 million for 2023/24, though reduced by 5,8%, is a testament to our commitment to strategic allocation and maximisation of resources. This includes navigating budget cuts in critical areas like red tape reduction, balanced by increases in other sectors, to maintain a focus on reducing bureaucratic obstacles for other businesses.

However, in the wider context it reveals significant budget reductions, especially in supporting businesses through skills and SMME programmes attributed to a reduction in equitable share funding. Thankfully this Government has proactively put in place the Growth for Jobs plan which will ensure breakout economic growth so that we do not have to endure what other African nations have had to endure through deindustrialisation, but, hon Speaker, the ANC seems to misunderstand what G4J is at its most

fundamental level.

It does not pick winners like the ANC does. Instead it creates horizontal enablement. That means, and I think it is very important to understand this, it is very, very easy to misunderstand. [Interjections.] We are building the foundation. [Interjections.] The foundation, that is your roads, that is your schools, that is providing basic houses. All the things that Government are supposed to do. [Interjections.] They are not supposed to give jobs to people, that is not a Government job. [Interjections.] That is the job of a business. That businesses will not want to come to our country if we do not have roads, if we do not have electricity, if we cannot educate our young people and we leave them behind. [Interjections.] How can you invite business to come to our country if we have nothing to offer? [Interjections.]

*[The Speaker takes the Chair.]*

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Ms C A T MURRAY: Because while there is African deindustrialisation, there are many nations who are miles ahead of us on this continent and who are leaving us in the dust. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms C A T MURRAY: We cannot afford to be left behind in the race, in the

race to become an industrialised state [Interjections.] and to ensure that we truly, truly realise the potential of our residents.

An HON MEMBER: Speaking from a point of privilege.

Ms C A T MURRAY: In closing I reiterate Dambiso Moyo's warning about the perilous path of African deindustrialisation exemplified by the ANC-led National Government's policies. [Interjections.] This trend threatens not just South Africa, but the entire continent's economic future. We must learn from these challenges and implement strategies that foster real economic growth and job creation.

Hon Speaker, I support this Budget because I believe in its potential to make a real difference in the lives of our residents despite the challenges that it has to navigate. Imagine what could be achieved under a DA National Government. A future with low unemployment and the realisation of Africa's full potential. The time for change is now. It is time to prioritise Africa, South Africa, jobs and economic growth. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Murray.

I recognise the Minister, hon Minister Wenger. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Speaker. [Interjections.] Thank you again to the Standing

Committee for the oversight role that it plays in respect of the Department of Economic Development and Tourism. I also value the discussions, the suggestions and the debates that we have in committee and in this House.

Thank you to those parties that have supported the Budget of this Department, that, although it has a small budget, punches well above its weight. Just to respond to some of the comments made in respect of the Budget.

On the informal sector the impression has been created that we do nothing to support the informal sector, which is not correct. We do provide support to the informal sector. As part of G4J the informal sector is identified as part of the economy and therefore the horizontal enablement of the economy necessarily means enablement of the informal economy as well.

Through our Booster Fund we have supported informal trading spaces in no less than eight municipalities, with 11 trading spaces for informal businesses. Also through our Skills Development Programme we have several, but one I would like to highlight is the Artisan Development Programme, which helps to create entrepreneurs in the informal economy and in the township economies.

Then lastly I just want to respond to the utter nonsense on the Port of Cape Town, because one should ask the question: why is private sector participation okay for Durban and why is private sector participation okay for



Ngqura, but it is not okay for the Port of Cape Town? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: In fact when Cyril Ramaphosa visited Richards Bay recently, [Interjections.] he said ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: ... the private sector is going to play a critical role ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: ... through either concessions, through cooperations on this precinct where they will be able to, together with Transnet, run certain aspects of various operations that take place here in Richards Bay, but why not Cape Town? [Interjections.] Let us ask that question.

The Port of Cape Town ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: ... languishes at the very bottom of global indices on port performance. [Interjections.] Therefore the Port of Cape Town should be a prime candidate for private sector participation, [Interjections.] but it is not. Why not?

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: And it is very ungracious of hon member Nkondlo to peddle conspiracies when the facts speak for themselves. [Interjections.] If the port works, the economy works ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: ... and that is what we want, for the economy to work. Thank you, hon Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister Wenger. [Interjections.]

Hon members, that concludes the debate on this Vote. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. The debate is concluded. [Interjections.] Hon member Nkondlo, [Interjections.] hon member Nkondlo, the Vote has been concluded.

The Secretary will read the Fourth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 5 – Education – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7-2023].

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Minister, before I proceed, are you happy that we continue? Or are you waiting for the Administration? [Interjections.]

Thank you very much, hon Minister, I recognise you, [Interjections.] Minister of Education, Minister Maynier.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker. We tabled a massive R29,55 billion Main Budget to deliver quality education earlier this year, which was the largest departmental budget in the Provincial Government and the largest education budget to date in the Western Cape.

To deliver quality education I made it clear at the time that we need to reverse learning losses, we need to rapidly expand access to education and we need to improve support to learners with special needs. The COVID-19 pandemic had a catastrophic effect on learning outcomes in our country, which were already not at the level that they should have been. The fact is that learning losses is the critical problem that we must solve in our education system today. We simply cannot say that a child is receiving a quality education when too few learners in our country can read for meaning.

So to reverse learning losses in the Western Cape we allocated R399 million to a groundbreaking BackOnTrack programme. The largest learning recovery programme in our country. We aim to reach over 15 000 learners in Grade 4, Grade 7, Grade 8, Grade 10 and Grade 12, with extra classes on Saturdays and during the school holidays, and to provide extra training to over 5 000 teachers in those grades, and of course this was in addition to the 310 000 learners and 5 200 teachers in the foundation phase who are receiving extra support. I have had the pleasure of visiting a number of classes to see the work our tutors are doing with our learners and the enthusiasm and excitement about the programme at our schools has been inspiring.

So too has been the response of our teachers who have diligently showed up to training and have worked hard to implement their new skills in the classroom. And initial indication from learner results are showing the positive impact on learning outcomes.

Hon Speaker, the additional 19 000 learners enrolling in our schools each year have created tremendous demand for school placement in the Western Cape, and again we cannot say that a child is receiving quality education if there are too many learners in a class, if there are too few teachers in a school and if there are too few schools in our province, [Interjections.] and so to rapidly expand access to education we allocated R2,9 billion to build and maintain school infrastructure in the Western Cape. We plan to build 21 new schools and replacement schools, and an additional 289 classrooms at

existing schools.

The plan was built on the success of the Rapid School Build Programme implemented in 2022 and our delivery of 788 additional classrooms for the 2023 school year, which was a dramatic increase in the pace of delivery compared to previous years.

Once the Main Budget of course was announced, our infrastructure team worked hard to get a variety of projects shovel ready, with a pipeline of new schools and classrooms to be delivered over the next three years. It is often said, hon Speaker, that the measure of a society is how it treats its most vulnerable learners and so to improve support to learners with special needs, we allocated an additional R135 million to support learners with autism and learners with profound intellectual disabilities.

This included the supply of additional resources, as well as building two new schools for learners with special needs, and an additional 28 classrooms at existing schools or full service schools. The funding will also cover of course the additional teachers and classroom assistants and therapists needed to staff the extra classroom.

We were finally, hon Speaker, finally moving in the right direction, but in June we began to hear whispers in the corridors that something was seriously wrong, and that National Government was in trouble. We heard rumours that National Government could not afford the Wage Deal and that a full-blown

fiscal emergency was looming and once the National Minister of Finance announced the Mid-Term Budget on 1 November 2023, the sheer scale of the national fiscal emergency hit us.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The National Treasury [Interjections.] promised us 78% of the cost of the Wage Agreement for Education, but in fact only gave our department 64% of that cost, which means we were being shortchanged by National Government to the tune of R537 million and at the same time the Department of Basic Education cut our Conditional Grants by R179,4 million. The Education Infrastructure Grant has been cut by R156,9 million. The maintenance component of the Early Childhood Development Grant cut by R14 million. The Maths, Science and Technology Grant has been cut by R4,3 million. The HIV Grant has been cut by R3,1 million and the Expanded Public Works Programme Grant has been cut by R207 000. In other words, hon Speaker, National Government has dealt a massive R716,4 million blow to our ability to build and maintain schools and to pay teachers in this year alone. [Interjections.]

Now to fund the shortfall, to fund the shortfall created by this massive blow we have had to cut back, cut back on the BackOnTrack programme. We have had to cut back on our Rapid School Build plans and we have had to reduce spending on staffing in our Department. We will have to cut R143,5 million from the BackOnTrack budget this year, which unfortunately will put an end

to our plans to expand the number and resources for learners in Grade 8 and in Grade 10 and the parent programme.

The cuts we face to infrastructure of course are twofold. Firstly, National Government, as I have said, has slashed our conditional grants to infrastructure, which has had the obvious impact of reducing our infrastructure budget directly. Secondly, having been shortchanged by National Treasury in terms of the Wage Agreement negotiated without us, we will have to find R527 million somewhere else, including from our infrastructure budget. The net impact is a R248 million cut to our spending on school infrastructure, which very obviously will limit our ability to deliver new schools and to maintain existing schools and the cut to our Wage Agreement, funding requires of course cost containment measures in terms of staffing.

With the effect from 18 October 2023, National Treasury of course froze a variety of categories of vacant posts, including senior and middle management, but of course excluding frontline staff, but in addition, in addition, from 1 April 2024, which of course is the start of the next financial year, we will have to do the following in order to avoid cutting staff:

- We will have to stop the provision of substitute teachers, except to cover teachers on maternity leave.
- We will have to stop the provision of post 1 level contract teachers in

place of those acting in vacant school management team promotion posts, excluding, of course, vacancies for principal posts. [Interjections.]

- Any vacant posts level 1 post must be advertised in a vacancy bulletin and cannot be filled with a contractor appointment, and any vacant public service posts at schools must be advertised in a vacancy bulletin and cannot be filled with a contract appointment. [Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, the upshot, the upshot of this is that filling of posts is going to take longer and staff may need to take on extra work. [Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, aside from the sheer scale of the blow from National Treasury, the mid-term adjustment has had two unusual features. The entire budget period of course has been characterised by extreme uncertainty and for the first time ever, for the first time ever the cuts are an immediate in-year blow to our budget at the exact time, at the exact time when demand for placement is highest.

The warnings that National Treasury would leave us in the lurch on the Wage Agreement meant that we had no choice but to pull the handbrake on spending until further clarity could be provided. [Interjections.] We were essentially placed in a holding pattern by National Government for five months. The environment of extreme uncertainty had an immediate impact on our plans for infrastructure as we could not enter into contractor agreements without having certainty that we would have the funds to pay for them, and



with the National Treasury having effectively put the brakes on all spending, we essentially had two months to complete the work for the start of the school year.

Moreover, we have absolutely no indication of what the medium-term holds, which makes it extremely hard to plan for the next three years. There is no way, hon Speaker, to sugarcoat this. The National Budget process has completely collapsed and as my colleague has said, we no longer have a three year budget process. We do not even have a one year budget process. What we do have is a pay-as-you-go budget process.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: This, of course, is deeply damaging for the education sector because our service delivery calendar does not align to the financial year. Schools open in January not at the end of March. So we have a delivery deadline that is a mere two months after the announcement of the National Mid-Term Budget.

The Wage Agreement comes into effect automatically and we must fund it immediately. So we have absolutely no choice but to find the money somewhere and somehow. [Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, under these conditions it is difficult to find hope in the face of the mismanagement of the national economy. [Interjections.] It is difficult to

find optimism when we know how much tougher things will get financially and it is difficult to make plans when there is so much uncertainty over the budget for the next three years, but even when National Government has dealt such a severe blow to our province we will continue to fight to deliver quality education to the learners of the Western Cape.

We will continue to provide extra classes for learners and extra training for teachers through the BackOnTrack Programme. [Interjections.] We will build new schools and classrooms to accommodate the learners needing places for the 2024 school year. We will still, hon Speaker, we will still include two new special schools and an additional 28 classrooms and existing schools for learners with special needs in our infrastructure plan, and we will provide the additional support promised for learners with special needs, and we will not stop fighting, hon Speaker. We will not stop fighting to get the budget we need to deliver quality education for every learner in every classroom in every school in the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

An HON MEMBER: You are a fighter.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. [Interjections.]

I now recognise the – order, hon members! Before I recognise hon member Sayed, can I get your attention.

Hon member Sayed, you may continue.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, allow me to firstly acknowledge the presence of our guests in the gallery. Our guests in the gallery, Mandilakhe Ketwa, Bakisa Pepeta, Nuria Eli and Robert Hillian. These guests are active on the ground in trying to change society in the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Communities that the DA has neglected. They are on the ground, regularly assisting us and working with others to make a positive difference, including in the education sector.

I rise on behalf of the African National Congress to reject the proposed Budget Adjustment for the Western Cape Education Department.

Whilst we acknowledge the increased allocation from our National Government, a commendable R835,2 million earmarked primarily for the implementation of the 2023 Wage Agreement, despite this increase MEC

David Maynier's Department still claims that the Department is underfunded. He stands here making this claim and demands an additional R500 million from the National Government. Under normal circumstances that would have been a correct demand, but we understand, he needs to understand the deeper fiscal issues that we are facing, and as a former shadow Minister of Finance he should know these things.

While we appreciate the increased budget allocation from National Government, it is disheartening to witness the persistent failure of the DA-led Administration to ensure quality learning opportunities for every child in the Western Cape. The plight of the Black child, African, Coloured and Indian, continues unabated, facing overcrowded schools and insufficient placement spaces, teacher shortages and lack of essential amenities such as sports fields.

We witnessed this on Monday when we were in Salt River, visiting a school in Salt River. The crisis of unplaced learners is looming large as January 2024 fast approaches. [Interjections.] In December 2023 we are still inundated with many pleas for help from parents who applied timelessly and correctly and yet their children remain unplaced. We have a persistent crisis of unplaced learners in this province, a crisis the MEC and his Democratic Alliance deny because it is a crisis that faces the poorest of the poor. [Interjections.]

In the committee meeting dealing with this budget, I personally raised the sad

case of Ms Silvia Juries who applied very early and correctly to five schools in the Helderberg area for Grade 8. She was rejected by all the schools. She followed the process of appeals and yet her child remains unplaced.

I would also like to raise the sad case of Mr Johannes Hoorn. Mr Hoorn has been in communication with the Department since April 2023, seeking placement space in school for his child who has not been placed at school for 2023. Mr Hoorn continued to explain that his daughter has not been attending primary school since the year 2020. He has been applying at schools like [Inaudible.] Primary School, Forest Village Academic Primary and Forest Village Primary School, and none of the schools gave him feedback and there has been no oversight from the Department. As of today this child remains at home and still does not have a place in school for the 2024 academic year, and there are many more cases. [Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, the DA-led Western Cape Government has decided to engage in an inter-governmental dispute with National Treasury for the 2023 Wage Agreement. [Interjections.] This move is part of their agenda to balkanise the Western Cape from the rest of South Africa, while continuing to undermine workers in our province.

It aligns with the DA's persistent calls for devolution, aiming to erode the very foundation of our national unity and this MEC proudly praises Alan Winde for this. The DA's aggressive stance against increased wages for hardworking and dedicated public servants exposes their disdain for worker

rights. It is consistent with their past opposition to the minimum wage, revealing a deep-seated opposition to the fair remuneration of labour.

[Interjections.]

For years this Provincial Government has manipulated the budget for compensation of employees to grow provincial reserves and the Revenue Fund by not filling vacant funded posts.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): As they complain about the shortage of over R500 million to implement the 2023 Wage Agreement, it is only fair that they tap into the Revenue Fund and provincial reserves for these additional funds.

The consequence of compensation of employees' funds that have been surrendered back to the Provincial Treasury are felt, they are felt most profoundly in poor and working class communities where schools are grappling with the consequences of persistent teacher shortages, thereby compromising the quality of learning and teaching, hon Speaker.

On the matter of quality learning and teaching. I am deeply troubled by the recent *Mail & Guardian* opinion piece titled:

"How can we teach in a time of genocide when teachers are being

silenced?"

The writers have explained the following, and I quote, and I will not give the whole quote:

"The learners come to school with questions for their teachers. They bring their emotions, their concerns and their confusion, expecting the teachers to help them make sense of what is going on. Yet many teachers have been instructed not to talk or teach about the war in Gaza."

And this happens in the Western Cape. Our learners are being denied the opportunity to engage critically with global events. This is a textbook case of indoctrination of our youth. The suppression of discourse on the Gaza genocide and Gaza holocaust against Palestinians raises serious questions about the Department's commitment and MEC Maynier's commitment and the DA's commitment to fostering critical thinking amongst our students. [Interjections.]

The Department's hypocrisy and bias on this matter is unacceptable. It is the same WCED that openly defends Herzlia High School, which encourages its students to go and join the Israeli army that is currently committing holocaust against the people of Gaza.

The DA hypocrisy shines a spotlight on the transfer of millions of rands to

Wesgro under the guise of stimulating private sector investment in education. Are these attempts to commodify our public education like it was the case with the failing collaboration and donor funded schools? Or is Wesgro being roped in to get more pro-Israeli schools into the Western Cape?

The R500 million transferred to Wesgro ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... could have gone a long way ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... your time has expired. Please conclude.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... to support Western Cape schools to participate in national sports competitions and in conclusion, we want to wish those ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... learners well ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... hon member Sayed, your time has expired.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... competitions and have been failed by



the DA. We reject this [Inaudible.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Sayed.

Hon members, I now recognise hon member Cassiem on the virtual platform.

Ms A CASSIEM: Thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, I have said this before and I will repeat that the Western Cape has one of the most racist and dysfunctional education systems ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What nonsense!

Ms A CASSIEM: ... in this country as the learner school placement system in this province is still based on the colour of skin.

Just like during apartheid times Quantile 4 and 5 schools are predominantly reserved for White learners only, [Interjections.] whilst the majority of Coloured and African learners are mostly sent to Quantile 1 to 3 overcrowded schools, which are mostly in townships. [Interjections.]

The reasons furnished by Quantile 4 and 5 school under this Department for rejecting the majority of Black learners, are always that these schools of full and that these learners must go to overcrowded township schools. However,

when one takes a closer look, hon Speaker, at why Quantile 1 and 3 schools are always used as a dumping site, it is because even if those schools are full the Department will always extend the capacity by building temporary classroom structures in order to take more learners.

The question then arises, hon Speaker, why are we not seeing temporary classroom structures being erected in Quantile 4 and 5 schools in order to take more learners? The answer to this question, hon Speaker, posed is that because White people do not want this former Model C schools to be dominated by African and Coloured learners.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): There we go, and the DA promotes that.

Ms A CASSIEM: The rationale for this is plainly racist like that, hon Speaker.

It does not make sense why Black learners, whose parents can afford to pay school fees in this former Model C schools, are denied an opportunity to enrol there. This is purely racist once again and it must be seriously investigated as this Minister, hon Speaker, does not see an issue with this.

An HON MEMBER: What nonsense.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Cassiem.

I now recognise hon member De Villiers also on the virtual platform.

Mr P DE VILLIERS: Good afternoon and thank you, hon Speaker.

The GOOD Party cannot with good conscience support the Budget Vote for a department which is spending millions of rands on his budget to defend the indefensible.

The Education Department and the Premier have been taken to task in this House for the manner in which it has and is handling the firing of a principal in good standing with his community, his learners and the parents of the school, at a time when few knew what we are dealing with during COVID-19 pandemic and which has been criticised by the community at large.

This Department has not seen fit to do the right thing to support the poor people who find it very difficult to register their kids online, but is doing so to create a working class in a province where there is no job opportunities. Thank you Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member De Villiers.

I now recognise the hon member Christians also on the virtual platform.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, untruths and more untruths from the ANC are really disturbing. [Interjections.] They know how to look at the facts and just turn it, and I just want ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He is homophobic ...

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: ... to remind the ANC to leave Herzlia alone, with a brilliant academic track record.

An HON MEMBER: Homophobic.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Hon Minister, the R537 million Wage Bill shortfall ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible] homophobic.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: ... is going to hurt this province ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Homophobic.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: ... and I want to know from you, hon Minister, are our learners that are not placed in schools, are they going to be placed in the 2024 academic year? Because now you are cutting down on the Rapid School

Programme, on staffing, meaning bigger class sizes, and also the children that must catch up, your BackOnTrack Programme is also now going to be reduced.

So, hon Minister, the biggest concern from the ACDP's side is all our learners going to be placed in the 2024 academic year?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians ...[Interjections.]

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: I thank you.

The SPEAKER: ... your time has expired. [Interjections.] Thank you very much.

I recognise the hon member Marais also on the virtual platform. [Interjections.] I have just been informed by the Table staff that hon member Marais is not participating in this Vote.

I now recognise the hon member Baartman. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, fellow South Africans.

Today with the Education Budget Vote we are seeing a net increase of R835 million in the Adjusted Appropriation, taking it from R29,5 billion to a R30,3 billion budget.

For context, in 2022 this Department had 1,1 million learners in public ordinary schools, Grade 1 to 12, across 1 451 public ordinary schools. Similarly in 2022, 835 019 learners benefited from the Department's No Fee Policy. That is approximately 76% of all learners in the Western Cape. 510 956 learners benefited from the Nutrition Programme. 65 594 learners benefitted from the Transport Programme. 21 881 learners were subsidised in registered independent schools, and 94 099 learners benefited from the fee exemption. Now members of the Opposition might know this, but perhaps they have not read the Annual Report this year.

An HON MEMBER: *Ag, come on.*

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Further, hon Speaker, Opposition members claim that there is a crisis in the Western Cape, but at the last Education interpellation in this House the Minister revealed just last month that there was currently a 98% placement rate for next year, and that placement is ongoing and continuous in order to ensure that every learner gets placed.

Not only has that been done, but if you have read the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement on page 22, and this is substituted – *ag*, not substituted, but complemented by the Provincial Economic Review and Outlook, between 2018, just before our term, and 2022, the retention rate in primary and high schools in Western Cape, in primary school it went from 83% learner

retention to 93% learner retention in 2022 for primary schools. For high schools learner retention increased from 66% in 2018 to 72% in 2022. Clearly the Western Cape is doing something right.

Further in 2022 alone 17 512 learners arrived from other provinces and countries to the Western Cape schools and of this 13 424 – I am going to repeat that. Out of the 17 512 learners, 13 424 learners originated from the Eastern Cape.

So it is also the Department that acknowledges, yes, the Western Cape has quality education and every child deserves that, irrespective of where you come from, but National Treasury, please, fund the provinces with high migration patterns adequately. The money must follow the feet. Help us provide quality education to more learners and give us our fair share [Interjections.], but the ANC is not listening, hon Speaker. The ANC does not care. They are living the best champagne lifestyle on a beer budget. [Interjections.]

The ANC National Government centrally agreed to an above inflation public Wage Agreement for all provinces, not just the Western Cape. In KZN you will see that the KwaZulu budget will be unfunded. [Interjections.] They are going to run out of money. It does not matter what you want to say, at the end of the day you cannot go to Minister Maynier and say, "There is no money for pens." [Interjections.] You cannot go to Minister Nomafrench Mbombo and say, "We do not have money for needles." The money must

come from somewhere. [Interjections.]

The impact of the Western Cape specifically was R2,9 billion. [Interjections.] Not only has National Treasury – I am glad that the Opposition members are watching YouTube. Perhaps eventually they will start to listen as well. Not only has National Treasury turned around and indicated they will not be fully funding provinces for the full cost of the Public Wage Deal that they agreed to, but these costs have already been implemented in provinces mid-year. This means that provinces have already been impacted by the costs. [Interjections.]

The Western Cape is only receiving R1,7 billion from National Treasury and if you subtract that R1,7 billion from the R2,9 billion that you need, you will notice that you are missing between 1,1 and R1,2 billion, [Interjections.] but apparently mathematics is not popular in the ANC. [Interjections.] We are not against an increase in wages, hon Speaker we are against agreeing to something ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... you fully knew that you could not fund. [Interjections.] We are against National Treasury not paying for an agreement they made. [Interjections.] In terms of the Equitable Share, the Western Education Department received R943 million from the Equitable Share allocation for public wages. [Interjections.]



Now, hon Speaker, let us do another round of mathematics quickly. [Interjections.] If you need R1,48 billion and you subtract the R943 million that you have given to David Maynier, he is sitting with a budget shortfall of R537 million. [Interjections.] They are further receiving in this budget, the Provincial Treasury is giving the Western Cape Education Department R37,6 million from our own money for funding Energy Schools Solar Photovoltaics Programme, and R56,4 million for infrastructure service delivery, precious, particularly maintenance.

An HON MEMBER: Do not lie, we do not hear you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): This takes the Equitable Share portion in the particular Vote over R1 billion, and this is because this Department is serious about energy security and maintenance. [Interjections.]

In terms of roll-over funding, R18 million will be rolled over due to committed expenditure on the procurement of learner and teachers support material and eLearning programme expenditure such as LAN implementation, smart classrooms, coding and robotics. Given the changing environment that we are in of a digital economy, hon Speaker, to the provision of high speed internet to schools across the province, the WCED has now connected almost 850 000 learners and 25 200 teachers to vital eLearning resources. [Interjections.] This is evidence of the WCED's concerted push to provide the technology integrated education required for tomorrow.

Further it has provided Broadband internet to 1 296 schools in the Western Cape and established Wi-Fi networks at 902 of these. [Interjections.] Further the Department has constructed 9 981 Smart Classrooms across the province, across 806 schools and have trained 4 793 educators in these technologies in the last financial year alone.

Hon Speaker, the Department has further established 500 coding and robotic clubs, almost a third essentially of Western Cape schools. Thus fulfilling a pledge in committee last year to do so by 2024. These clubs form a vital part of the WCED's plan to equip learners with the necessary skills to drive our provincial economy forward into the future.

The Department's TMAC Science, Technology, Engineering, Arts, Mathematics, Agriculture and Coding classes have been specially formulated to get learners equipped with the most desirable skills for the provincial economy and digital skills to form a vital part of this.

Further, hon Speaker, we need to have a serious conversation about Conditional Grants. Despite everything this Department is doing, this is countered by the fact that National Government is cutting R179,3 million in Conditional Grants for the Education Department in the Western Cape, but it is not just the Western Cape. There are Education and particularly Education Infrastructure Grants across provinces, despite our Constitution dealing with education as an immediately realisable right, and I will read the Constitution

sub-section 29, since many members in the Opposition prefer not to read, [Interjections.] but here in the governing party benches leaders are readers. Sub-section 1: [Interjections.]

"Everyone has the right to a basic education, including adult basic education and to further education, which the State, through reasonable measures, must make progressively available and accessible."

So when we deal with the Conditional Grants we see a reduction of R4,2 million in Maths, Science and Technology Conditional Grant. We see reduction of R905 000 in the Social Sector Expanded Public Works Programme Incentive Grant for provinces. We see a reduction of R14 million in the Early Childhood Development Grant for the maintenance component. We see a reduction of R156 million reduction for Education Infrastructure Grant. This grant is specifically to build schools. Reduction of R207 000 in the Expanded Public Works Programme Integrated Grant for provinces and reduction of R3 million in the HIV and AIDS Life Skills Education Grants, and these grants, as contained in the Division of Revenue Bill 33 of 2023, the ANC supported. On record they supported the Division of Revenue Bill to cut these grants. This is the impact of a National ANC Government that does not care. They want provinces to go sell lemonade on the streets in order to find fund money to fund the particular budgets. [Interjections.] I am not sure if they expect Minister Maynard to go put his feet on Feet Finder in order to go find R537 million. [Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, it is an unprecedented boost for education infrastructure. Despite all of this the Western Cape Education Department delivered eight new schools and 602 new classrooms in the last financial year. This is a direct response to the growing number of learners seeking education in the Western Cape.

Further, these additional schools will serve learners in some of the Western Cape's most underprivileged areas, ensuring that all children, regardless of circumstances, have been given the opportunity to receive quality education.

Further, in terms of the Wesgro money. Hon Speaker, if you run out of money you need to go find it somewhere else and if National Government is not going to give it to you, you need to be able to build relationships within the private sector in order to build schools. Money does not come off David Maynier's back. So yes, we are unashamed to say that we are working with the private sector in this regard. [Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, I would like to conclude with saying thank you to the Committee members for their robust engagement throughout the year, particularly the permanent members. Further to our procedural officer, Ms Wasiema Hassan Moosa, for not only some of the best procedural advice that you can find, but ensuring that the Committee is always dotting their i's and crossing their t's, and to my researcher on my portfolio, Ryan Hand, you keep me on my toes and you provide quality research and I thank you for

that, and to the people of the Western Cape I want to say there is no sugar daddy coming to save us. None. We must save ourselves and we must vote the ANC out in 2024. [Interjections.]

If the ANC National Government [Interjections.] is unable and unwilling ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... to make difficult decisions required for financial stability in our country, we must vote in a capable DA Government that can. [Interjections.] The DA supports this Vote. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Baartman.

I now recognise the hon Minister, Minister Maynier.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker.

I would also like to take this opportunity to welcome the hon member Khalid Sayed's guests to this debate this afternoon. It is an excellent opportunity for his guests to hear firsthand how the failures of National Government and the ruling party, which he represents, had resulted in a R700 million blow to the Education Budget this year, and which will ultimately compromise teaching

and learning in the Western Cape.

Hon Speaker, I have to say that I am deeply concerned by what we have heard from some members of the Opposition this week, and certainly what we have heard from some members of the Opposition during this debate. They have brought us the same tired old toxic arguments that show they have absolutely no appreciation of just how serious the financial situation really is. [Interjections.] Untruth after untruth after untruth, as the hon member Ferlon Christians observes.

Other provinces get it and have been speaking out about the consequences of the budget cuts. NGOs, like Equal Education, get it and have slammed National Government's budget cuts. Even the National Minister of Finance himself has said that learning outcomes will suffer as a result of the budget cuts and yet astoundingly, astoundingly it seems to have gone over the Official Opposition's head.

The Official Opposition in this House appears to be unconstrained by reality and they simply do not get it. I was absolutely shocked to hear, hon Speaker, that the hon member, the hon member Khalid Sayed, said on a local radio station that the R716 million blow to the Education Budget was not an issue. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Did he say that? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: A R700 million cut to the budget in this year alone, according to that hon member, is not an issue. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: In closing, hon Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... I want to assure the ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Hon Speaker, in closing I want to assure the members of this House and indeed the people of the Western Cape, that despite the cuts made to our budget, despite the severe blow dealt to us by National Treasury and despite the disinterest of the Official Opposition, we will continue to provide extra classes for learners and extra training for teachers through our BackOnTrack programme. We will build new schools and we will build new classrooms, hon member Christians, to accommodate learners needing placements for the 2024 school year, and we will still build two new special needs schools, and an additional 289 classrooms for learners with special needs ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: What about their Maths?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... and we will provide additional support ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: The Maths and the Science ...

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... promised for learners with special needs and we will, hon Speaker, we will not stop fighting. Indeed we will never stop fighting ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: For who?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... to get the budget ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What are you fighting for?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... we need to deliver ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... quality education for ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... every learner in every classroom



[Interjections.] in every school here in the Western Cape. Thank you.

[Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister.

Hon members, that concludes the debate on this Vote and I am going to suspend the House and we will resume at 2 o'clock. The House is suspended.

*[The House is suspended until 14:00.]*

The SPEAKER: Please be seated.

Thank you hon members. The Secretary will read the Fifth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 6 – Health and Wellness – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7-2023].

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon Minister of Health and Wellness, hon Minister Mbombo. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Hon Speaker, hon Premier, my colleagues, members of the Legislature, the Leader of the Opposition, any guests in the gallery, the media, ladies and gentlemen.

Hon Speaker, I would like firstly to take the whole House on a journey of our

system in order to understand the context of the appropriation of this budget. Imagine you are in the Airbus. As you progress through the Airbus, the journey, it has made several stops. During each of these stops it has received extra seat capacity for passengers, the bigger engines more fuel, additional cabin crew, numerous alterations that has allowed it to be more accessible for people from across the country. These Airbuses, it is not only one Airbus, it is about eight Airbuses that accompany this Airbus, so it is seven plus one, eight, and in this squadron there is also a larger Airbus in front guiding us.

So, hon Speaker, the Airbuses that I am talking about is a nine provisional half and the other one, bigger one, is a national half. This is the current system where all provinces work with the National Department of Health to implement healthcare. What is the destination? It is a universal health coverage where there is a greater allocation of resources from both the public and the private sectors so that the health needs of the population can be equitably addressed and financial hardship is removed at the point of contact. This is in line, hon Speaker, with Section 27(2) of the Constitution, which goes on to say that, I quote:

"The State must take reasonable legislative and other measures within its available resources to achieve the progressive realisation of the right of access to healthcare services."

However, hon Speaker, we do note that these Airbuses in the current state are not perfect. While the economy class is the most accessible, it is

overcrowded and the passengers do not always experience efficient service delivery.

On the other hand, hon Speaker, the business and the first class services are deemed to be of quality, but come at an exorbitant cost. This, hon Speaker, represents our two-tier house systems of private and public healthcare. While our health system has progressed towards greater coverage since the dawn of democracy, many structural issues remain which necessitate the need for proper healthcare reform in South Africa. That is why we need to achieve universal health coverage, which means equitable, affordable, accessible, quality health care for all and it is not only a human rights issue, but it is a matter of justice. As leaders this is something which we all can undoubtedly agree to.

However, hon Speaker, we have now arrived at a critical juncture in our journey as the healthcare system. The introduction of NHI Bill is what the National Government believes to be the correct mechanism to achieve UHC and correct the current state of health in the country.

Hon Speaker, as I have said before, NHI will not achieve UHC and more importantly NHI is not UHC. In the Western Cape we have been committed to this goal of UHC using Healthcare 2030 Plan. We have moved away from the traditional hospital centered focus that pathologizes health, but also now we have transformed in order to accommodate the focus on the social determinants of health, with an emphasis on community-oriented primary

care. This has led us to our Whole-of-Government and Whole-of-Society approach, which has allowed us to bring all stakeholders on board to actively realise change.

We do this, hon Speaker, we know that it is unattainable for us to maintain the status quo. The Airbus cannot continue to buy expensive food and extensive leg room for the first and business class passengers at the expense of providing quality services for residents using the economy class. That is an analogy, hon Speaker. That is why we need UHC in order to be able to achieve this.

Noting, hon Speaker, the National Health Act, specifically Section 3(2) it does provide the National Health Minister with every tool to be able to implement the UHC without an NHI Bill.

Hon Speaker, as we battle this issue our Airbus faces another crisis. Its fuel tank is being drained mid-flight. As we deliberate the Department's adjusted allocation I would like to emphasise that the R29,7 billion allocation must be seen in a greater context. At the beginning of the financial year we arrived at the edge of the fiscal cliff when we had a baseline budget shortfall of almost R1,5 billion. While Provincial Treasury was able to fund the majority of this shortfall, we already started on a back foot with no real increases in our budget.

Then came the unfunded Wage Bill which added an additional pressure of

R1,08 billion. Hon Speaker, I need to state it categorically that in principle we wholly, wholly support salary increase for public servants. I have been a public servant, there is no way that you cannot support such. These are the individuals who have 24 hours, for example, in health, seven days a week, no matter the circumstances. However, this must be done on the basis of affordability. [Interjections.]

Equally so it is concerning that there are sufficient funds for the bailouts of the failing SOEs, like I saw now the Post Office that is to be bailed out at the expense of the dedicated public servants. We are grateful, hon Speaker, to have been allocated – I mean provided with 78% of this Wage Bill increase from the National Government, but this is something that should have been fully paid for as provinces are reliant on National Government for the funding.

However, there are other considerations in this budget that place further pressure. While this budget increased by R931 423 000, in nominal terms our real budget increase should have been R1,6 billion when accounting also for inflation. This confirms that we faced in-year real budget restrictions of R736 million, which, if you can even show in terms of where the cuts are, R317 million for the cost of employment. I am talking about the staffing. R317 million in terms of the shortage, the cuts. R104 million for goods and services. R155 million for all grants and R116 million in-year shift between our programmes.

To counter this our Department has already began curtailing our expenditure so that we stay within this new budget envelope. The Department is now ensuring that the hiring of personnel is done selectively and we have engaged most of our partners, like in academia, in regard to that. This specifically through the negotiations with our suppliers and improving operational efficiencies. Take into account the realities we face not only as a Department, but across the province, but if I could be able to present the Budget Appropriation.

- Programme 1 we have a decrease of 6,3%. It makes us we to have R997 million.
- Programme 2 an increase of 3,5%. Now it becomes a R12,1 billion.
- Programme 3 increased by 3,15%. Now it is R135.
- Programme 4 it is a 4,8.
- Programme 5 it is 8,1.
- Programme 6, Health Science and Training, to R419 million.
- Programme 7, Healthcare Support Service, increased by 2,9% to R641 million.
- Programme 8 a decrease which is the Health Facilities Management,

decreased by 10,45. Now it is R1,16 billion.

Hon Speaker, we already have the necessary mechanisms in place to make a difference.

So as we guide this Airbus through the storm and turbulence, we have to make sure, to make difficult choices in order to keep ourselves airborne, but it will mean that our passengers, including our crew, will experience even more discomfort than ever before.

As I table Vote 6 Adjustment Allocation to the House, I strongly urge that we work together to ensure that we save the South African Health System. Not only the Western Cape system, because it is still far better than all this. This Airbus Western Cape is still flying accordingly, but with the others they are not. [Interjections.] It means that it affects the whole health system. [Interjections.]

So as I table this Budget let us not leave anyone behind. Thank you, hon Speaker. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister.

I now recognise the hon member Windvogel. [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Speaker. I rise today with a heavy

heart to address the proposed Budget Adjustment for the Department of Health and Wellness in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

We stand at a critical juncture where the decisions made within these walls will have a profound impact on the lives of our people, especially in the realm of public healthcare.

Hon Speaker, allow me first to welcome the passing of the NHI Bill by a resounding majority of our people. [Interjections.] The people have spoken in the Western Cape and in the country. [Interjections.] Now is the time to prioritise the health and well-being of all citizens irrespective of their socio-economic status. [Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, I have told the House the NHI will be happening in my lifetime. For far too long the Western Cape has grappled with a healthcare system flawed ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms R WINDVOGEL: ... inequality and injustice. It is an indisputable fact that hospitals in affluent areas have enjoyed the privilege of quality healthcare while those in poor working class communities and rural regions have been shackled with underfunding, sub-standard services, staff shortages and a sad image of patients sleeping on the floors.



†Agb Speaker, laat ek vir u ook op 'n *journey* neem. [Tussenwerpsels.] Agb Speaker, die DA in die Wes-Kaap sê hulle het die beste dienste, gesondheidsstelsel in die land, maar, agb Speaker ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Hon Speaker, let me also take you on a journey. [Interjections.] Hon Speaker, the DA in the Western Cape says they have better services, health system in the country, but, hon Speaker ... [Interjections.]]

†'n AGB LID: Bewys ons verkeerd.

[An HON MEMBER: Prove us wrong.]

†Me R WINDVOGEL: ... daar is 'n vrou met die naam [Tussenwerpsels.] Eloise Adams, voormalig van Elsie-rivier. Sy het aan nierversaking gely en kon nie hulp kry by enige hospitaal nie, en sy moes glo by 'n mediese skema aansluit omdat sy nie voldoen aan vereistes nie. Ongelukkig kan sy dit nie bekostig het nie. Vandag huil die kinders, vandag huil die man nog steeds, want die DA *Government* het daardie familie, die Adams-familie, *ge-fail*.

Agb Speaker, dan vat ek vir u na 'n man met die naam Elric Daniels. Hy het bedseer opgedoen terwyl hy in 'n koma was. Sy bedseer was so erg dat hulle moes 'n operasie doen en niemand wou verantwoordelikheid vat nie. Soos ons dan nou die DA *Government* ken, *they always play the game, the blame-game*.

Agb Speaker, en ek kan nog van vele meer praat, die tipe dienste wat Bonteheuwel ontvang, [Tussenwerpsels.] en ons kan praat van Nkqubela in Robertson. 'n *Kitchen* van 1994, still the same conditions, en dit moet

daardie hele gemeenskap, daardie kliniek moet die hele gemeenskap diens. Dit is die goeie diens wat hierdie DA *Government* van praat.

[M R WINDVOGEL: ... there is a woman by the name of [Interjections] Eloise Adams, formerly from Elsie's River. She suffered from kidney failure and could not get help at any hospital, and she apparently had to join a medical aid scheme because she did not pass the requirements. Unfortunately she cannot afford it. Today the children are crying, today the husband is still crying, because the DA Government failed that family, the Adams family.]

Hon Speaker, than I take you to a man by the name of Elric Daniels. He got bedsores while he had been in a coma. His bedsores were so bad that they had to do an operation and no one wanted to take responsibility. As we now know the DA Government, they always play the game, the blame-game.

Hon Speaker, and can speak of many more, the type of services that Bonteheuwel receives [Interjections.] and we can speak of Nkqubela in Robertson. A kitchen of 1994, still the same conditions, and it has to service that whole community, that clinic has to service the whole community. That is the good service that this DA Government is talking about.]

Hon Speaker, who would forget the MEC's words, that the KDH is like a black sheep of the family and will not be giving any special treatment? KDH, who are they servicing? †Dit is die Swart *majority*. [It is the Black majority.]

In response to our call for an increased budget to address staff and bed shortages to alleviate service pressure, the blame for this stark disparity rests squarely on the shoulders of the DA Provincial Government. Instead of rectifying the systemic injustice over the years, we have witnessed a listless regard for the – a callous disregard for the well-being of those in need. Year after year we listen to different excuses when we demand the quality healthcare for our people. These range from supposed inequality share allocations, to complaints about budget allocations not keeping pace with inflation. The latest excuse presented is the 2023 wage increment. [Interjections.]

A Government who are against the working class. [Interjections.] You are against the working class.

An HON MEMBER: It is not true. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: The Premier ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms R WINDVOGEL: ... decision – the Premier's decision to lodge intergovernmental dispute with the National Treasury for the Wage

Agreement is not just a disagreement over budgeting, it is a blatant display of disregard for the working public servants, especially healthcare workers who keep our healthcare system running.

As the ANC we believe that our public servants, our healthcare heroes, who have tirelessly fought on the frontlines during the COVID-19 pandemic, deserve every cent of the proposed wage increase. [Interjections.] †Die DA *Government* is die *government* wie se salarisskaal die minste is in die hele land. 'n Skande, wat 'n skande. [The DA Government is the government whose salary scale is the lowest in the whole country. A disgrace, what a disgrace.]

Our example of the DA-led Western Cape Government's careless disregard for our healthcare heroes was the refusal of this Department to absorb all COVID-19 workers at the Brackengate Hospital. As a result over 30 workers remain unemployed and are victims of a system that value budgetary constraints over human life.

Hon Speaker, the ANC welcomes the R931,4 million additional allocation for the Department. The MEC argues that the additional allocation will not alleviate service pressure and that if we thought the situation of faces sleeping on floors is bad, then we must prepare for the worst. [Interjections.] This is very reckless ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Ms R WINDVOGEL: ... and unacceptable, especially coming from a Provincial Cabinet member. We cannot accept a future where the most vulnerable among us suffer due to a lack of political will and empathy. It is inexplicable that ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Ms R WINDVOGEL: It is inexplicable that while Health and Education are the only departments granted additional support from the 2022 Wage Agreement, the MEC stands here crying for more funding and predicting a further worsening of our healthcare services. [Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, this Department ...[Interjections.] in 2021/2022, and in 2022/2023 financial year, was R273 million and R180 million respectively. In addition R160 million was not spent and rolled over to this year. †Wat 'n *disgrace*. [ What a disgrace.]

I therefore fail to understand why a shortfall of about R600 million is claimed by the Department will now collapse the public healthcare in the province, when the Department underspending over the past two financial years was close to this amount. [Interjections.] The Provincial Treasury must come to the party and [Inaudible.] what happened to the millions that were earmarked ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms R WINDVOGEL: ... to the COVID-19 [Interjections.] pandemic ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms R WINDVOGEL: ... and [Inaudible.] procure the province's own vaccine which never materialised. Where are these? Why are these not ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms R WINDVOGEL: ... allocated to respond to the challenges?

Hon Speaker, we do not agree with the budget cuts for health facilities management, especially given the fact that only 40% of our healthcare facilities are in good, excellent condition, [Interjections.] with 52 in fair condition and the remaining eight between poor and very poor condition, and that is in our Black and Coloured areas.

We know this Department has been very poor when it comes to infrastructure development, [Interjections.] with many projects running far behind schedule. In this budget R100 million [Interjections.] has been reprioritised due to a determination of a number of infrastructure projects. This is a matter for

serious concern.

We are delighted to learn that the rebuilding [Interjections.] of the C F Jooste ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Windvogel, your time has expired. Please conclude.

An HON MEMBER: Your time is up. [Interjections.]

†Me R WINDVOGEL: Agb Speaker, ek moet sê [Tussenwerpsels.] die ANC [Ms R WINDVOGEL: I must say [Interjections.] the ANC] rejects this anti-poor proposed budget adjustment. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Windvogel.

Hon members, just for the record, as per your speakers' order, hon member Klaas and hon member Marais will not be participating in this Vote and therefore I recognise the hon member Pretorius.

Mr G PRETORIUS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, before I start just a last word from my side on the NHI. The ANC and the NHI are on autopilot to destruction and I hope they realise that. [Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, I rise ever so slightly conflicted. While I was afforded 16

minutes for this Vote, I was considering rising and saying just one word, "acquiescence". Some might call it "acquiescence" [different pronunciation.], same thing. It means a reluctance, acceptance and without protest.

As I said during our debate on Tuesday, this is a budget that no Government would have wanted to pass under ideal circumstances. However, as we know our circumstances are far from ideal. [Interjections.] How sad it must be for the brilliant men and women of National Treasury to now have to work with mere scraps of the people's money left for them by the National Government. I say scraps, hon Speaker, because that truly is all that are left. For decades now the people's money has been stolen, misappropriated or used for SOE bailout after SOE bailout. [Interjections.]

Let it not be forgotten that the Western Cape, as the third largest province ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G PRETORIUS: ... is entitled to much more. [Interjections.] That, hon Speaker, is the crux of the matter.

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G PRETORIUS: National Government seemingly has lost track of how to



count, of how to compare apples with apples. [Interjections.] When one considers what has been allocated to this province one feels as if Government is saying, "Wage increases for the bloated public service are more important than service delivery to the poor, the destitute, the elderly and the sick." [Interjections.] For many of our departments, including Health and Wellness, the funding shortfall does not just come from the grossly low Equitable Share and the unconscionable high public Wage Agreement, but also to the National Conditional Grants.

I spoke to this on Tuesday, but I feel it bears repeating. More than R57 billion has been cut from the Health Facility Revitalisation Grant. R674 000 has been lost to the Sectional Sector Expanded Public Works Programme Incentive Grant and a staggering R65,5 million has been cut from the HIV/AIDS component of the District Health Programmes Grant.

Hon Speaker, the last of these is perhaps the most important. Decreased funding for the fight against HIV/AIDS is unthinkable, especially when so many in our country and our province still suffer from this deadly disease. This cut made directly by National Government, has the potential to cost lives. However, hon Speaker, this Government will not let them get away with it. This Government will fight for what we are owed and it has taken the necessary measures ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Fight for who? For who?

Mr G PRETORIUS: ... to ensure that healthcare remained stable and reliable with what we currently have. [Interjections.] The spending cuts from National Government forces us to adapt ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Fight for who?

Mr G PRETORIUS: ... to be flexible and to respond effectively to the dynamic needs of our communities, especially in the face of unprecedented challenges.

The Adjustments Appropriation Bill we discuss today is not solely about numbers and financial allocations, it is about channelling resources where they are most needed. It is ensuring that every rand spent contributes to the enhancement of healthcare accessibility, quality and efficiency. Despite the cut, hon Speaker, our priorities remained clear, and that is to bolster healthcare services in underserved areas, enhancing preventative care initiatives and continuing to invest in the training and development of our healthcare workforce. These endeavours are not optional, but imperative to secure a healthier and more prosperous future for all our residents.

Through careful budgeting on the part of Provincial Treasury, the Department of Health and Wellness will receive a modest increase of 3,23%. What is important to note is that this money is being spent directly on our people, with every single one of the Department's public facing programmes receiving increased funding – district health services, emergency medical

services, provincial hospital services, central hospital services, health sciences and training, healthcare and support services. All of these programmes will receive slight funding increases of between 3 and 6%.

More than that, hon Speaker, this Department has ensured that its current staff, including doctors, nurses, paramedics and administrators, will still be funded, but all of this has come at a cost. The Department has taken steps to reduce its spend on administrative functions, but it has also been forced to drastically reduce its spend on infrastructure and facilities management.

Upon reading this budget one truly understands that this Department would sooner compromise its own internal functions than see a cent lost from the budgets which keep our people healthy. For that I commend them, but even so, hon Speaker, it is not enough. Despite the care and diligence with which these spending allocations have been made, there is nothing that can be done about National Government's aforementioned decision to cut into conditional grants for vital health care services, and due to the shortsighted and irrational public service Wage Agreement, this Department, through no fault of its own, still find itself 22% short of what it needs to fund that increase.  
[Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, approximately a decade ago a frequent slogan was heard in the National Assembly:

"Pay back the money."

Hon Speaker, [Interjections.] while we support this Bill, that remains our call to National Government because the failure to adequately fund the Western Cape is not some abstract decision made on paper, it is a decision that resonates through our schools, on our streets and of course in our hospitals.

Supporting this Bill reflects our commitment to innovation and progress in healthcare delivery. It is about leveraging technology, fostering partnerships and implementing evidence-based practices to ensure that our healthcare system remains robust and responsive to the needs of our diverse population.

However, as we deliberate on this Bill we must not lose sight of the human aspect of healthcare. Behind every statistic, behind every budget line, behind every policy change there are people, real people, individuals and families relying on us to safeguard their health and well-being. All stakeholders, legislatures, healthcare professionals, community leaders and citizens, are urged to work hand-in-hand. Let us collaborate closely to ensure that the resources allocated through this Bill, albeit less, serve their intended purpose effectively and equitably. Let the use of available funds be proof of our unwavering commitment to the health and wellness of our communities. Let it symbolise our determination to build a healthcare system that is not only responsive, but also compassionate and inclusive.

We acknowledge the tireless efforts of our brave healthcare professionals, our heroes who have gone above and beyond to provide care, comfort and

healing during these times. Their unwavering commitment to serve is truly commendable and we express our deepest gratitude to them, Dr Cloete and his team, but hon Speaker, I also have to thank the Minister, the pilot of the Airbus of Airbuses. [Interjections.] Hon Minister, you are in a peerless giant of health in this country. Thank you for everything you are doing for us. [Applause.]

In conclusion, hon Speaker, we also acknowledge that this Budget represents the best of a bad situation, an example of a triage in action and so, hon Speaker, while we support the Western Cape Health and Wellness Adjustments Appropriation Bill, the clarion call remains:

"Pay back the money."

Thank you, hon Speaker. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

An HON MEMBER: Pay back the money! Pay back the money!

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Pretorius. Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Order!

An HON MEMBER: You stole the money, pay back the money. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

I recognise the hon Minister, Minister Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, hon Speaker. [Interjections.] Thank you to my colleagues, hon member Windvogel and hon member Pretorius, for your input. [Interjections.]

I did indicate, hon Speaker, in closing, that it is time to save the South African health system. We cannot just sit down and then look and when we know that the solutions are there.

So I invite specifically hon member Windvogel, as the Premier and I wrote to the President to help in terms of the NHI Bill for which we did make a lot of submissions, even at the NCOP, and I was very disappointed to notice that he did not even take any of those considerations. So I want to invite hon member Windvogel to help us to be able to make sure that that NHI, if now it gets passed, that at least they consider the constitutional flaws and the practicality in order to achieve universal health coverage. It has to happen. There is no way that we can advise – I am talking about the Western Cape Government together with the top management that is sitting there – there is no way that you can advise them, the recommendations could be something that will make the health system for the whole country to fail. [Interjections.] We have worked quite well in the Western Cape building, this

health system we have done very well.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: So if it passes, will you support it?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: So it will never be that  
...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: If the NHI passes, will you support  
it?

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: ... 34 000, it cannot be  
34 000 of the staff members. I cannot be a pilot, who also is a health  
professional ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: The majority of your staff want it.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: ... could advise the  
Presidency or the colleagues about something that is not there.  
[Interjections.]

Now in response to the issues, part of it [Interjections.] because I  
...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Part of it – just not some of this. [Interjections.] When hon member Windvogel talks about a Khayelitsha and the social determinants of health. [Interjections.] The current NHI Bill actually ignores the social determinants and that is why we say you cannot focus only on building, on having, on dropping vertical programmes without looking at the social determinants of health. [Interjections.] It does not take into consideration.

Again, the NHI Bill, it talks about the centralisation of the services, cutting by 34% of the Provincial Equitable Share. So all are asking about what is going to happen to whatever, it is going to be worse. 34%.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Why is it going to be worse?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Three, third thing. [Interjections.] The third thing it is about, I spoke about nine Airbuses of the provinces. [Interjections.] The NHI Bill proposes 52 District Health Management Offices, because it is 52 districts, plus 180 of the contracting units that will be playing a role in terms of delivering the services. [Interjections.] Where are the profits going to be? So it is another layer. You cannot – a health system, you have to strengthen it across. You cannot have vertical programmes and drop these, these ones [Interjections.] are done. It needs to be, all need to be coordinated in terms of strengthening the



whole system.

This is what the NHI – because I am trying to now to [Interjections.] dissect it more further. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: The issue of the single payer, single purchaser, [Interjections.] which will be centralised, scholarly and also philosophically, you cannot. It is actually against ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: ... that is why people do not want ...

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: ... what the WHO is suggesting. [Interjections.] In order to implement universal health coverage the regional strategic purchasing is supposed to happen, you cannot centralise. It must go, subsidiarity must go back to the people. [Interjections.] You cannot ignore all of – and the NHI, this is what [Interjections.] is doing that. This is what is actually it is doing in terms ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: ... in regard to  
...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: ... all of, to all of ...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: And then lastly  
...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, my apologies. There is a point of order  
...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: And lastly  
...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... please take your seat.

Ms N D NKONDLO: At least you should have ...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member Nkondlo! [Interjections.] Hon Deputy  
Chief of the Majority Party, is that a point [Interjections.] of order? Order,  
hon members! [Interjections.] There is a member on the floor.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, I rise on Rule 39. Despite sitting almost next to the hon ...[Interjection.] Prof Dr Nomafrench Mbombo, ...[Interjections.] I can hardly hear ...[Interjections.] the information that she is trying to share with us. Please can you rule on it. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon members ...[Interjections.] Hon members, please can I caution you not to drown out the speaker. Hon Minister, you may continue. My apologies for interrupting you. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Lastly ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Lastly, going back to the ...[Interjections.] and lastly, hon Speaker, nine provinces and National Health, this is the current structure in terms of the Health governance. If now the other provinces – it is not even if – those other eight provinces have failed dismally in the Health system. [Interjections.] You cannot replace them ...[Interjections.] with a district health management office. So, in a province there are nine districts ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Do not do that.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: ...you cannot replace the whole provincial office with those district health management offices, plus also creating another layer. The system does not allow that. You cannot do that. Hence, if then your whole issue of the NHI Bill there would have been consultations with the academics, with the civil society where it was strong, ...[Interjections.] it could not have landed to be where things are. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: So, try ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon Nkondlo ...[Interjection.] you are directly commenting ...[Interjections.] or indirect conversation with the hon Minister. If you have any comments, hon Nkondlo, can you and the hon Minister take it outside of the Chamber at the end of this Vote. Hon Minister ...[Interjections.] hon Minister. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you. Thank you, hon Speaker, I am available to be asked that question because I have to talk about the NHI, but I am closing it off. [Interjections.] So, I am available to ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister ...[Interjections.] Hon Minister  
...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: But going forward  
...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: The Rules do not provide for you to voluntarily offer unless  
an hon member wants to pose a question. [Interjections.] I cannot provide  
that opportunity. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: So ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: You may continue.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: [Interjections.] So, and I am  
saying that in closing, I could be, but also secondly, I can also take one on  
one. And then thirdly, when the President comes and responds to us and asks  
us to go to the Union Buildings to discuss things, because I am available. I  
will guide the President ...[Interjections.] around that in regard to NHI Bill.  
[Interjections.]

But in closing, I want to thank you here in this House, all of my colleagues –  
the MP, the SC – for making us account and also, for my Cabinet colleagues  
for assisting, especially in the context of where we have done a whole lot of  
transversal because as we know that the health system, it also has to

strengthen and also we have to work transversally across other, especially in the social Cabinet office. So, thank you very much for that.

I want to thank in absentia other spheres of government. The National Government: they always make sure that they listen to us and then also even make an opportunity for us to make so many inputs. I am talking about the National Government office ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: That is how it should be.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: ...because we are strengthening the South African Health system. [Applause.] That acknowledgement ...[Interjections.] because you are colleagues, we are colleagues. [Interjections.] Everyone has got the public ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: And that from the Government officials, whatever happens, they do not politicise Health. So, we need to welcome that part of it. [Interjections.]

Even at the Local Government level ...[Interjections.] the Mayors in the Western Cape, with the Health it is not within the Local Government, except in the Metro where they have got the clinics, but the Mayors will go out of their way to ensure that they are able to give the support ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Not all the Mayors, no.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: The team: 34 000 staff members! Dr Cloete, Mr Kaye, Dr Kariem, and u-sisi Nonhlanhla, thank you very much. [Applause.] Please extend our appreciation to the team. We understand that things are difficult. And then all those there, the other stakeholders, but now the NPOs, the NGOs, the academia and everyone: thank you there. And then last, but not least, to the Ministry: thank you very much for when you keep on preparing the speeches and then I am rewriting all of them. So, thank you very much. Thank you. Dankie. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, that concludes the debate on this Vote. I am going to allow the officials to interchange in the box. If there is. Hon Minister Allen, if you can just give me an indication if you? Okay. Can I just ...[Interjections.] Hon members, the House is not suspended. Can I please ask for your indulgence. Can I just get an indication from the Table staff if there are officials. [Interjections.] Okay. Hon members, the Secretary will read the Sixth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 4 – Police Oversight and Community Safety – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon Minister, hon Minister Allen.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Speaker, hon Premier, Cabinet colleagues, hon members, hon Leader of the Official Opposition. It is quite fitting to pay homage to the men and women in blue, knowing that this has been an extremely difficult year and I sincerely trust that the men and women in blue across the South African Police Service, across Law Enforcement, will have our thoughts and our appreciation in this particular House for the role that they play. And I sincerely trust that the residents of this province will continue to support those in blue.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: But tell JP to stop attaching ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Please.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please speak to me.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You are following ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable [Interjections.] hon members. Hon Minister, you may continue. [Interjections.]



The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I would like to table ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Because he is useless.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...and initiate this particular debate and this discussion on Police Oversight and Community Safety, and the topic is resilience in continuing safety initiatives underpinned by the Western Cape Safety Plan. It will be remiss of me not to take us back to the National Development Plan, considering that we are in this particular Appropriation debate against a weak economy, against inappropriate policies, and also, hon Speaker, thanks to corruption, state capture, cadre deployment and anti-growth policies, South Africa is now far worse than it was 10 years ago. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is fine.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: This is the record that sadly, that the National Government will have to own up to and have been desperately trying to cover up and manage.

According to the NPC and that is the National Planning Commission, review report, the implementation of the NDP by the National Government has been a resounding failure on every economic metric. Instead of facing up to its own failures, the National Government has chosen rather to censor the NPC

and go into the 2024 elections on a platform that is based on lies and its record of government.

Currently, hon Speaker, with the expanded unemployment rate of 42,1% not only has the National Government failed to meet its 14% unemployment target by 2020 as set out in the NDP, it is also on course to miss the 6% unemployment target by 2030. Currently, GDP growth is 1,1% with GDP growth averaging at 1%, the National Government is also on course to miss the 5,4% target by 2030 enlisted in the NDP. More people, hon Speaker, are out of jobs. The NDP has set a target of 24 million employed persons by 2030, but only a fraction is currently in employment.

In concurrence, we have warned consistently, as the Democratic Alliance, over many years and this was confirmed by the NPC which in their scathing assessment, pointed out the following. The deterioration of the State and inappropriate policy management were behind the persistent problems of inequality, unrelenting poverty and rising unemployment.

So, against that backdrop, promises that were made and commitments that were made in terms of the National Development Plan, it is very clear it is not going to be materialised. Hence, we have had to table an Appropriation Budget in this particular House that can ultimately ensure that we remain resilient, but still add hope. And as I have indicated many times in this particular House, the hope is not devoid of the realities. I have just gone into great detail based on those realities, but we are stepping in and will continue

to step up.

I am delighted that we have the HOD together with senior management in the box. I am privileged to lead a Department which has over 50% female representation at SMT level, but also across our entire Department. So against that background, hon Speaker, I was sadly disgusted yesterday on how the debate ended and I would want to be very clear: we are open to criticism, we are open to hearing views, but I would appreciate if this particular debate can be in the tone of fostering a spirit of hope for everyone that is listening to us across this province, so that we as members of Parliament, hon members of Parliament, can ultimately take our oaths seriously.

An HON MEMBER: There is nothing to say ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: The ANC sadly, and its alliance and coalition partners and those who support, left a bitter taste after yesterday and quite frankly, it made me want to leave this particular House considering what was echoed in this House. But as a Provincial Department and we have said ...[Interjections.] in our budget debates that we have one of the smallest budgets, but we have had to step up and step in.

And now due to mismanagement, hon Speaker, due to mismanagement, ...[Interjections.] due to mismanagement, research shows that if you repeat a

certain phrase 12 times, people will remember it. So, I am more than happy to say it: due to mismanagement ...[Interjections.] – and as the talking continues – due to the mismanagement at a national level, we and the residents of this province now face the brunt.

In fact, over the last few days, we have heard that no department, hon Speaker, was spared. These are the types of downward adjustments that are unprecedented, and the big question is: who suffers? And the answer is quite simple, it is the people. It is the people who suffer. It is the over 1 000 people that are murdered in this province quarter by quarter, that ultimately suffer, coupled with communicates and everyone ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: What about the Mitchells Plain councillor ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: So, eradicating crime ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Answer it ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

...particularly violent crime, is not sadly an ANC priority. ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: With a pensioner.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
They are clearly and continue ...[Interjections.] to demonstrate this. An example is the persistent under-resourcing of our officers ...[Interjections.] and their equipment, together with the resources that they require. Investigators, hon Speaker, are sitting with between 200 and 250 dockets, and in some cases even 400 and 500 dockets. I have personally been to Philippi SAPS. I have personally been to Samora Machel where those detectives are sitting with 400 dockets per detective.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Ask Mackenzie about the GBV ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
SAPS is continually ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: With a pensioner.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
SAPS is constitutionally mandated to serve and protect all, but they are expected to do so without the relevant and required resources. I was sending a message earlier to the hon Advocate Deidre Baartman, and as I sent that

video, the hon Dugmore came up on an air transfer and I almost wanted to send it to him as well when I sent that, but I am noting the comments, and I will address it accordingly. ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: The one about the ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: So, the ANC, sadly, hon Speaker, is failing. The ANC is failing ...[Interjections.] and I am often at pains ...[Interjections.] I am often at pains because I have so much ...Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Talk about the Western Cape.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I have so much respect for many of our ANC colleagues ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: That is good.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...and I feel their pain, I can feel their shame at times when matters are needed to be defended, when the indefensible is being defended.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Do not marginalise us!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: So likely, I am telling the truth that it is ...[Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Do not marginalise us!

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...difficult, it is very difficult.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Do not talk ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: So, with LEAP and we will continue, hon Speaker, our Law Enforcement Advancement Plan LEAP officer programme which stems from our Safety Plan, has directly impacted the lives of many by making sure that we are able to showcase that over a five-year period, we have actually seen a reduction. KZN, Gauteng, together with the Eastern Cape over that particular five-year period, have all seen increases in their murder rates and two provinces double digit increases. Here, we are seeing decreases. So, we are definitely on course to meet our objectives of holding the murder rate.

Hon Speaker, for the current calendar year and through LEAP's operations, we saw significant decreases in the murder rate, which in the first six months combined a total of 198 fewer people who were murdered in our province. That is something that we know we need to build on and that we need to continue to work towards.

Last week, I took the opportunity to patrol with a unit in the Mitchells Plain area and in a very short space of time, we confiscated drugs where a number of search warrants were executed, arrests were made and also, profiles of known gangsters. Once again, an arrest leads ultimately to safer communities and we are consistently engaging, even outside of our core mandate, other safety partners like the DPP, like CPFs, like Neighbourhood Watches, knowing that we are needing to play our role, but also engage various others.

Between March 2021 and October 2023, there have been 3 211 arrests made with 57 firearms confiscated in that one particular area ...[Interjections.] of the Delft alone. In an area like Delft alone, 57 firearms were taken off our streets making our streets safer as a result of LEAP's impact: 57! On average one firearm leads to the death of potentially between 12 and 15 people. Here, 57 firearms were taken off an area like Delft. [Interjections.]

Yesterday, a question was posed: what if? What if? And I would also want to take it further by indicating the following. Imagine a society, imagine a Western Cape without a Democratic Alliance. Imagine a Western Cape where the policies we have been advocating for were not here. So, I am so thankful



for my colleagues. [Interjections.]

But make no mistake, the reduction is not ideal, but as a proactive Government we have put mechanisms in place that will ensure that LEAP services will not be interrupted. It is going to be extremely difficult, but our assurance goes to our residents that we have their best interests at heart. Our LEAP station allocation will also see a deduction of 50%, from R10-million to R5-million and once again, contingencies are in place to ensure that we are able to deliver in this regard. So yes, we talk about resilience and a budget that will ultimately pave the way where we can safeguard frontline services, but also continue to step up.

In terms of the Western Cape Liquor Authority, hon Speaker, which is an important entity in the regulation of liquor prices throughout our province, we also see a reduction of R1-million. This important role that they play with the liquor sector, particularly to reduce the harms associated with the abuse of liquor, cannot be highlighted enough. Year on year, this particular entity continues to be highly effective in the regulation of the retail of liquor throughout the province. Their inspectors are out on the beat visiting outlets to ensure that they are compliant and I have already undertaken a number of visits with them.

Just last week in Mitchells Plain again, and in Delft, we have undertaken such initiatives. At one outlet where they had all their relevant documentation, they did not have their trading licence on the premises. At

another one, that particular outlet wanted to trade outside of the trading hours and as a liquor authority, together with the South African Police Service, we could take quick action.

Enforcing laws, rules and regulations are important as incidents that occur at liquor entities and at places where liquor is sold, places a burden not only on communities, but also on hospital emergency rooms, cells at police stations, but also causes unnecessary trauma to families. Once again, an effective and essential regulatory and enforcement entity is affected by an incapable ANC-led Government due to their continued mismanagement.

Hon Speaker, at the Chrysalis Academy, we are also seeing a reduction of R2-million in that particular regard, but I am so delighted that just over the last week, over 1 558 young persons across our province applied for this particular programme. [Applause.] This is a world-renowned programme that has received a number of accolades and we are so delighted that the work of Chrysalis will continue.

Various other sectors are impacted by cuts, and this includes our Research by R500 000, Advertising and Travel by R474 000 and Conditional Grants by R289 000, and at Tourism Safety by R900 000.

And if I pause on the Tourism Safety. What has happened is when capable governments and different spheres of government ultimately work together. So, even though we are seeing a R900 000 in the Safety Tourism, we already

have 20 of our tourist champions that are working on the mountains, working in tourist destinations where locals and visitors will come. But also, the City of Cape Town, a DA-led government, has already stepped up and placed an additional 80 law enforcement officers to be proactive in their stance by making sure that those particular areas where tourists will be visiting will be safeguarded.

But also, hon Speaker, perhaps if the ANC Ministers can learn a lesson about cutting travel budgets like we have heard just last week, particularly when one considers the France trip of the National Minister of Police. It pains my heart that the Minister of Police undertakes a visit and pays almost R500 000 for one secretary to go with him to the World Cup. One person: R500 000! [Interjections.] That R500 000 ...[Interjections.] that R500 000 could have placed four constables in our streets in our communities, in our committees. [Interjections.]

Let me pause ...[Interjections.] ...because once again, as we are preparing like I have indicated, 20 of our tourism safety champions are deployed with officials from SANParks and we want to assure our locals and our residents. We have already engaged our consular corps as well that the safety of visitors and of locals will be prioritised.

As I reach a conclusion for this particular part of this debate, it is once again to highlight that we are failing in terms of the promises made as a government at national level in terms of meeting the objectives of the

National Development Plan, but it is not just a Development Plan that we are failing on. It is actually affecting the residents here in the Western Cape, in Elsies, all the way to Klapmuts and other areas, but as a Government, we will continue to step up.

And one thing, hon Speaker, that the voters will be very sure that we will have the opportunity in 2024 to actively participate by making sure that a government will be elected that will ultimately safeguard the men and women in blue in order to ultimately safeguard us. And I would urge our citizens of our province and our country to choose extremely wisely during the 2024 election.

So, during a difficult time, hon Speaker ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You have failed ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
...and it is quite fitting that Police Oversight and Community Safety is ending this particular budget debate cycle, considering that safety or the lack of safety deeply plays in how our people live, how our people work and play, but as a Government we will continue.

I have been inspired, hon Speaker, over these last two days. Inspired by hon Minister Mackenzie, I have been inspired by the hon Finance Minister, by all my colleagues because I know that when we work together, citizens of this

country will be able to see it. So, thank you so much to all my colleagues ...[Applause. ] under the leadership of the hon Premier, for his leadership, †baie, baie dankie. [thanks, thank you.] Thank you.

†Die SPEAKER: Baie, baie dankie agb Minister. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The SPEAKER: Thanks, thank you hon Minister. [Interjections.]] Thank you very much, hon members. The next ...[Interjections.] Hon members? Hon Minister, your time has expired. You said thank you, so can I please ask for your indulgence. I now recognise the hon Bans on the hybrid virtual platform.

Ms A P BANS (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, hon member Nkondlo raised peculiar challenges of crime in the Western Cape yesterday, which are extortion and GBV. Every hon member of the DA stood up just to counter what hon member Nkondlo has been saying. None of them took responsibility for the fact that they stood up in a row. It tells you, hon Speaker, that there are serious challenges regarding GBV and extortion, and the DA is not willing to take responsibility for that or even include it in their favourite Blue Book, which is called the Safety Plan that the hon Premier always raises.

The hon Dugmore also raised matters on corruption by the DA through affidavits. The hon Minister of Community Safety: today, he says nothing and speaks only of corruption that is done at a national level, where he gets defeated to speak of his own.

Hon Speaker, if there are any doubts regarding the failure of the so-called Safety Plan, the crime statistics for the second quarter of 2023/2024 should dispel them. The 17 community reported serious crimes increased by 2,4%, while murders rose by 10,9% and attempted murders by 19,2% in the Western Cape. The Provincial Government's own analysis presented in the Second Quarter Performance Report highlighted a 14,5% year-on-year increase in homicides from Quarter One of 2022/2023.

The 13 priority areas where LEAP officers are deployed recorded a 14,9% increase in homicides. This vindicates the ANC's stance as we have consistently maintained that the Safety Plan will not yield the desired outcomes unless it addresses the root causes of crime and contributes meaningfully to community-orientated crime fighting projects. The twin principles of peace and stability are important in the indispensable requisites for achieving the strategic objective of the national democratic revolution.

To the ANC, crime is not just a security issue, it is a social issue. That is why our crime prevention mechanisms always place communities at the centre. We believe in an integrated and holistic approach to crime prevention, poverty alleviation and achieving peace and stability in our communities. This is why during the ANC governance in the Western Cape, we implemented programmes like the Bambanani Programme which helped achieve the lowest crime rates this Province has ever seen. This province has always compared itself with other provinces, but when it comes to crime,

we get minimal comparisons with crime related issues.

Hon Speaker, in the face of escalating violent crimes characterised by mass murders due to gang infighting and rampant extortion of spaza shops, informal traders and emerging businesses in poor working-class communities, I once again call on hon MEC Allen to stop treating crime solely as a security matter, but as a social phenomenon. The budget for the LEAP programme should not only focus on boots on the ground. Violent crimes in the Western Cape are geographically and racially concentrated, mainly affecting 13 crime hotspots where African and Coloured people reside.

This may explain the DA Government's callous attitude in decreasing the Department's budget. While crime is on the rise, especially in high crime areas like Nyanga, Gugulethu, Mfuleni and Delft, which is the murder capital, between July and September 2023, 1 164 people were murdered, primarily African and Coloured individuals, and in response, the DA Government cut the budget by over R31-million. These cuts, including a reduction of R22-million to the LEAP programme, R1-million earmarked for the Western Cape Liquor Authority, R2-million for the Chrysalis Academy and R5-million for LEAP stations display a nonchalant attitude towards poor working-class communities.

The Western Cape has a serious drinking problem, and the Western Cape Liquor Authority plays a vital role in addressing these challenges. The recent incident of a law enforcement officer driving a State vehicle under the

influence of alcohol, shows the seriousness of this problem. We call for an urgent investigation to determine if the officer is associated with the LEAP programme.

Hon Speaker, allow me to advise hon MEC Allen that the funds spent on the so-called LEAP stations could have better supported community crime fighting initiatives and strengthened community policing forums. We note with concern, hon Speaker, that while CPFs remain underfunded, Neighbourhood Watches are over funded with over R1-million of its surplus funding reprioritised for computer equipment and additional funds for public and motor transport daily tariffs. Money earmarked for community crimefighting initiatives is now being diverted to such expenditures and this is highly unacceptable.

I also expressed concerns about the funding for the LEAP programme. Public resources are being misused by the DA as LEAP officers trained for deployment in priority areas are frequently poached by J P Smith for his personal militance in the City. This leaves the Department having to spend more funds on recruiting and training new officers who will be poached by J P Smith after a few months. This is why we have been calling for this Legislature to have more oversight powers over the LEAP programme. This will not only help to prevent LEAP officers from being used to serve the DA agenda, like being instructed to arrest President Putin or being deployed to Sea Point promenade to persecute and violate the rights of pro-Palestinian protesters. But this will go a long way to ensure that Safety Plan resources



are not only wasted on boots on the ground, but also fund programmes to address causative factors of crime.

Hon Speaker, while it is understandable that the Department funds the Tourism Safety project due to its critical role in economic development, the question arises about the absence of similar projects to the township economy and the informal sector, where entrepreneurs are targeted by gangs for protection fees on a daily basis.

In conclusion, hon Speaker, I have seen Minutes of the 18<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Council of Stellenbosch Municipality where the name of hon Andricus van der Westhuizen was discussed extensively. This involved his role in Franschoek Jeug Ontwikkelingstrust. The minutes read:

“During 2011, Mr Van der Westhuizen together with the other trustees, changed the trust provisions to remove the municipality as a beneficiary of the assets of the trust upon dissolution.”

What followed was a large scale of looting of trust resources as large pockets of land sold without knowledge of the Municipality. We need hon Van der Westhuizen to come clean with this House. It is clear that Stellenbosch Municipality, according to the minutes, are very unhappy with him saying that he is sitting on a trust, but not carrying the mandate of the Council. How does he explain the sale of land? Who benefitted from the over R28-million? This matter must be investigated, hon Speaker, and appropriate

action must be taken.

Hon Speaker, the ANC rejects this budget. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bans. Hon Bans. [Applause.]

Hon Bans. Order, hon members. [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

[Interjections.] Hon Deputy Chief Whip of the Opposition.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I am covered. I realised that the member ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Please, if you want to address me you can please stand up and switch on your microphone. Thank you very much. The next speaker is on the virtual platform. [Interjections.] I recognise the hon Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, in the beginning of the 6<sup>th</sup> Parliament the hon Premier of the Province stood before us during his State of the Province Address and introduced the Safety Plan. The purpose of the Safety Plan was to reduce crime in the province through the utilisation of LEAP officers. Billions of rands were invested over the years on the recruitment and training of LEAP officers and other resources which were supposed to be utilised by LEAP officers in order to fight crime, hon Speaker.

We were further told that crime hotspots will be identified and targeted,

using some form of state-of-the-art technology, hon Speaker, and two years later, leading to this day, crime in the province has reached its highest proportion to an extent that the hon Premier and his Executive have given up fighting. Not only did they give up on fighting crime, today they expect the House to vote in favour of cutting the Community Safety budget by more than R31-million.

All this takes place at the backdrop of the recently released Second Quarter Crime Statistics covering July to September 2023. The stats reveal that Nyanga township is number one in the whole country when it comes to contact crime. Delft is the capitol of murder in the whole country featuring 11 other townships from this province. When it comes to sexual offenses, Harare stands at number one in the whole country, hon Speaker.

All this is the state of crime in this province and its DA-led Provincial Government remains without a solution as our people perish at the hands of gangs and criminals, hon Speaker. Even the hon Minister up until today, who has been asked several times how many homes occupied by drug and gang activity have been shut down in the Western Cape, can still up until today not answer because he knows not much has been done to tackle that issue affecting our communities. And for these reasons, hon Speaker, the EFF will not support this Vote. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Cassiem. Hon members, the next hon member is also on the virtual platform, and I recognise the hon

Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, in the midst of South Africa facing a fiscal crisis, we read today in the *Argus* that a District Commissioner, a Major General, is staying in the Saldanha Bay Hotel for the amount of R50 000 to R57 000 per month. Now this, hon Speaker, to date an amount of R1-million was spent on accommodation for this Major General.

Hon Speaker, I cannot understand, the Department must cut something like R10-million and here, money is spent, R1-million, for a Major General that earns up to R1,8-million per year. It does not make sense. So, it seems to me the priorities of SAPS needs to be looked at and we as a Committee will have to do thorough oversight to see if this is really true, and call in the Commissioner and ask if this amount of money is spent, R50 000 to R57 000 ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Christians, your time has expired. Please conclude.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): ...thousand per month. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians. I now recognise the hon Bosman. [Applause.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Speaker, one of the most fundamental issues that

our province and country face is the safety of our citizens. Safety underpins all of the other priorities of this Government because without a safe province, we cannot have a prosperous Western Cape.

Hon Speaker, it pains me to inform this House today that the National Minister tasked with ensuring the safety of all of the people of this country, has finally admitted that he is not capable of keeping us safe. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): The custodian of policing policy in this country would rather act like a clown than ensure that our people are safe ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: That is where you go wrong.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...safe from gangsters ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...safe from extortion, safe from SAPS firearms that find their way back into the hands of criminals ...[Interjections.] and safe from a ruling party that has looted almost every available public cent.

The Department of Community Safety and Police Oversight faces a R32,2-

million cut to its Provincial Equitable Share, a gift from our incompetent and uncaring National Government. We know that the ANC National Government has an active programme to make the Western Cape ungovernable ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: [Laughs.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...and while their incompetence in this regard is not planned, they have continued to under-resource the Western Cape by cutting police officers available for crime fighting. They have failed to improve the detective services and to improve detection rates ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Why do you want to ...[Interjection.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...and they have failed to keep up with even the most basic maintenance and upgrades at police stations.

The ANC may attempt to claim otherwise, but the numbers do not lie. SAPS admits that there should be an absolute minimum of 20 000 SAPS members operational in the Western Cape, a number that will now rise as a result of the latest census data. But hon Speaker, we now have less than 16 000 police officers in this province. In some precincts, one SAPS member may be responsible for as many 800 to 1 200 of our residents.

Hon Speaker, it would not be a lie to say that Minister Cele has abandoned

Law Enforcement in the Western Cape, but instead of admitting that he has failed to keep the Western Cape safe, he has attempted to obstruct all of our efforts to take the safety of our people into our own hands. The African National Congress of criminals has abandoned the people of the Western Cape and they have left the Department of Community Safety to pick up the slack, which they have done for years.

Yesterday, hon members opposite me questioned the Western Cape's Safety Plan which many of them have not read, a Safety Plan that seeks to reduce the murder rate by 50% by 2029. Hon Speaker, what this shows us is that they have a profound ignorance to the actual state of crime, safety, and policing in this province. The simple truth is that the Department represents perhaps the last true bastion against the tidal wave of crime sponsored by the African National Criminals.

Hon Speaker, this Department has stepped up to the plate. Through the Law Enforcement Advancement Programme, they have provided more than 1 000 boots on the ground in the Western Cape's most violent and troubled areas. Using data and advanced intelligence gathering capabilities, these units find their way to where they are most needed. Not only has this Department done this, but this Department also works with other departments such as Health and Social Development to address the issues that lead to crime.

But these successful programmes are continually being threatened by the boogymen in Pretoria. These deep cuts to the Adjustments Budget mean that

R5-million will be cut from the LEAP budgets where we have hoped to build more LEAP stations. This is on top of the R22,3-million cut to the LEAP programme.

Hon Speaker, through you to hon member Mvimbi and to the real spokesperson for Community Safety, hon member Kama. Despite the attempts of the ANC to defund LEAP in the Western Cape, I am relieved ...[Interjections.] and exited to note that the LEAP will remain fully funded. This Department will continue to provide stability, making sacrifices to ensure our frontline programmes remain funded to protect the people of the Western Cape.

Hon Speaker, the wounded ANC in the Opposition benches of this House continually accuse us of not investing in the youth of this province, but they ignore, they continue to ignore that not only do we fund and support youth programmes in all departments in this province, unlike the ANC who only funds youth programmes through their ANC Youth Leagues employment office ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...the NYDA, but we do this through a transversal approach. With that said, we know the amazing and transformative work that is being done by the Chrysalis Academy and the ANC is forcing a cut to the Chrysalis budget by more than R2-million. This is an important youth



development academy ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): This shows, hon Speaker, the real cost of these budget cuts. Opportunities taken away from the youth by an uncaring government that has stolen and lost the money necessary to improve this country. [Interjections.]

The Western Cape Liquor Authority has seen a substantial cut, hon Speaker. The majority of murders in this province take place on weekends and it is not hard to imagine why. [Interjections.] The impact of unregulated alcohol sales ravages our communities and with a National Government having faced a cut to this budget as well, we are now sure to see more alcohol-driven violence on our streets. But let us not forget, hon Speaker ...[Interjections.] every single cut has been made out of necessity. Every effort has been made to keep our province safe ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...by prioritising the most impactful programmes. Every cut has been forced out of this Department by an incompetent, uncaring, disingenuous, incompetent, and ignorant National Government, a National Government limping nationally. [Interjections.]

We know that our national rulers will purposefully not give us the funding we need unless we force it out of them, and I look forward to the successful conclusion of the Western Cape Government's intergovernmental dispute. ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You are not going to ...[Interjection.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): In the meantime, I take solace in the fact that we have taken the necessary steps to keep the people of our province safe. ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...negotiate, do not dictate.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Speaker, I was listening to the hon Bans and I was dismayed by the inputs made. ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): She spoke about the national democratic revolution, but what she forgot to mention, hon Speaker, through you, is that the ANC believes in an integrated system ...[Interjections.] of maximum extraction of resources for the cadres, a system that continuously steals from the poor.

If only hon member Bans made herself available to visit the LEAP base in

Bishop Lavis when our Committee visited recently ...[Interjections.] she would have seen how data-led policing is healing this working-class community. But instead of attending Committee meetings, hon member Bans comes here to grandstand. [Interjections.] But I am glad, I am very glad that the LEAP officers in the Western Cape actually know how to drive ...[Interjections.] unlike the AmaPanyaza's in Gauteng who have crashed how many BMWs in the last few days. [Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, I hoped when I heard hon Bans saying that she read the minutes of a Stellenbosch Council meeting, that she would also have perhaps read the minutes of a Community Safety Committee meeting to which she is so often absent from. Instead of attacking an hon member of this House, hon Bans could have learnt about the work of this Department. She could have received answers to some of her questions from the capable staff sitting in the box. ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): But instead, hon Bans comes to the House and ensures that she rings through to the saying ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

†Mnr G BOSMAN (DA): ...dat leë blikke maak die meeste geraas.  
[Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...that empty vessels make the most noise.  
[Interjections.] ]

Hon Speaker, what the ANC is – I know they are hurtful about the by-election loss in Saldanha – [Interjections.] but what really hurts them today is that LEAP will remain funded. People will continually move to the Western Cape ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Bosman, please take your seat. Hon Chief Whip, is that a point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes, hon Speaker. I rise on Rule 39. Hon Speaker, the ANC had the opportunity ...[Interjections.] and they said absolutely nothing of significance. It is hon member Bosman's opportunity and I think he should be protected. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon members, hon Bosman ...[Interjections.] Order, hon members on both sides of the House. There is an hon member on the floor. Hon Bosman, can I also please remind you to please speak to me in order for me to protect you. Hon Bosman, you may continue.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. I am very grateful for your protection ...[Interjection.]

Ms A P BANS (ANC): Hon Speaker.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...as well as the protection of the LEAP officers in the Western Cape. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Speaker, we know that the ANC is trying to steal my time ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Bosman, please take your seat. Hon Bans, is that a point of order? My apologies for not noticing you earlier.

Ms A P BANS (ANC): Yes, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I cannot be quiet when the hon Bosman calls me directly an empty can that is making a hell of a noise. Can the hon Bosman please withdraw that, hon Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much ...[Interjection.]

Ms A P BANS (ANC): ...while he is busy deceiving the meeting ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable, hon Bans ...[Interjection.]

Ms A P BANS (ANC): ...on qualities that have never existed.

The SPEAKER: Hon Bans ...[Interjection.]

Ms A P BANS (ANC): We have never had a committee ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Bans, you do not have to justify it. I take your point of order ...[Interjection.]

Ms A P BANS (ANC): ...he attended on ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Bosman, did you refer to hon Bans or any member of the House as an empty tin?

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): No, hon Speaker. I did not mention any member's name ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank ...[Interjection.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...from the African National Congress.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very ...[Interjections.]. Honourable [Interjections.] Thank you. Hon members! [Interjections.] Hon Bans, hon Bosman did not refer to you as an empty tin, but I will consult Hansard and I will revert back to the House. Honourable ...[Interjection.] Hon Bosman,

please take your seat. Hon Leader of the Opposition, is that a point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Just to say that your ruling that you will go back and investigate whether hon – sorry, what is your name again? [Laugh.] ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Bosman.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...Bosman actually lied or did not lie. So, the fact that you are investigating it, it is fine. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Leader of the Opposition. Hon Bosman, you may continue.

†Mnr G BOSMAN (DA): Baie dankie, agb Speaker. Soos hulle sê: as die skoen pas. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon Speaker. As they say, if the shoe fits. [Interjections.]] Hon Speaker, I rest safely assured knowing that LEAP will be funded. I rest safely assured that knowing as we go into the festive season, the innovation from this Department to the Tourism Safety officers ...[Interjections.] will continue to keep the hardworking people of this province safe, as well as our many visitors visiting us from ANC provinces, to see good governance in action.

Hon Speaker ...[Interjections.] I want to end off by thanking the Committee

members and especially those dedicated members from the Opposition who show up to meetings. We have one star performer in the Community Safety Portfolio who is not even a member of that Committee, but that hon member, through you, hon Speaker, Hon Windvogel has shown up more than the permanent members. [Applause.]

Hon Speaker, I want to thank our capable ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...procedural officer, Mr Waseem Matthews and Ms Mary-Ann Burgess for their work, as well as our researcher, Mr Ryan Han for his work. A special thanks you to hon Minister Allen for coming and sometimes having to answer the same questions about the Safety Plan over and over, and to the Department and its capable officials led by the HOD, Adv Yashina Pillay. [Applause.]

Lastly, hon Speaker ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Sit down!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): I look forward to a future – a future of fiscal governance, devolved policing, and a competent National Government. This future we know will come next year. After the election, this future will be led by the Democratic Alliance. [Interjections.] We will take our Safety



Plan nationally and we will show the highflying comrades from the ANC, how governance is done.

Hon Speaker, we know that the ANC was instructed not to support this Vote, but deep down they are comforted by the safety provided in the Western Cape. [Interjections.] Hon Speaker, we know that when we go on oversight visits, they marvel at the successes of the Western Cape Government. Hon Speaker, we know that they lament the state of the South African Police Service but hon Speaker, we understand that the space for the Opposition will be limited next year, so the competition is rife.

With that said, hon Speaker, I support this Vote. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bosman. Hon Dugmore, is that a point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes, it is a point of order. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. There is an hon member on the floor. Hon Dugmore ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It is a point of order.

The SPEAKER: ...what is your point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: My point of order is that given that the hon members still has time left, will he be prepared to take a question. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member, the hon member has said 'thank you' and has sat down. So, according to me, there is no more time left, so unfortunately, I am not going to cede [Inaudible.] to that. [Interjections.] I recognise the hon Minister, hon Minister Allen.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you ...[Interjections.] Thank you so much. Can I say thank you to the Standing Committee Chairperson for the leadership, together with all of the members of the Standing Committee on Police Oversight and Community Safety. We firmly believe that accountability, but also inputs that we get from the Committee are so vital. So, thank you hon member Bans, thank you to all other permanent members, hon member Ferlon Christians, for their input as well.

If I can just briefly address some of the comments. We have said it. Now, I have checked my record. The Bambanani matter, we have said this repeatedly, the DA never stopped Bambanani. The Bambanani was stopped by the ANC. [Interjections.] It was stopped by the ANC. The Hansard will reflect ...[Interjections.] it was stopped by the ANC. So, we never stopped any Bambanani. [Interjections.]

We are also a firm believer, as a government, we are also a firm believer in  
[Interjections.] We are also a firm believer, hon Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
...in the Whole of Government approach and the DA does not see  
...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Whole of Society.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
...and the DA does not see to eradicate crime, it is only a policing matter.  
[Interjections.] We know it is not only a policing matter, hence we have the  
Western Cape Safety Plan. [Interjections.] And I want to again repeat, the  
Western Cape Safety Plan tabled in 2019 is a carbon copy of what we have  
seen in the National Integrated Crime and Violence Prevention Strategy of  
2020 ...[Interjections.] of 2020! So, we have seen a Safety Plan which has  
been adopted ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
...which has been adopted at a national level because those components speak

to the root causes of crime. ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: A couple of submissions ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: It speaks to urban design. It speaks to urban design, but it also speaks to law enforcement because there are various components in order to eradicate crime.

Also, very specifically. Just a month ago, under the leadership of the hon Premier and hon Minister Mbombo, we launched our VPU unit in the area of Delft and when crime stats are being ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: And launch, and launch, and launch.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: And when crime stats are being shared in this House, hon Speaker ...[Interjections.] when crime stats are being shared in this House, it is often in order to set a certain narrative. So, when I hear that Delft is the murder capital of our country, I want to qualify that with the following: it is for that particular quarter. When I hear that Nyanga is a top category for contact crime, as the EFF has indicated, it is for that particular quarter.

When they look at it over the entire year, Nyanga used to be the murder capital of our country and the murder contact crime category. Now, it is number seven in the entire country. Are we happy it is number seven? No, but are we positive that we can drop it further down? Yes! So, when we look at the stats, we have seen the reductions and as a government, we will continue.

Because, hon Speaker, I would want to end off because as a government, we will continue to work. [Interjections.] So, I will not want to speak as much, but let me say this ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Always complaining.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Let me say this. The DA and the hon Minister and the hon Premier did not cut the budget. Our budget, we did not cut it. It was forced because in-year there were cuts by National Government. [Interjections.] So, we did not cut the budget. Every item ...[Interjections.] every item, every programme that is seeing a cut is as a direct result and I firmly ...[Interjections.] I firmly know that the ANC sees it that way. There is no way you cannot see it that way! [Interjections.] There is literally no way that you can see it any other way. In-year, X-amount of budget was promised and was committed and then in-year you hear ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
...that there is a R1,1-billion shortfall. So, we did not cut any budget and the record will reflect that we have reprioritised, we have safeguarded frontline services, and we will continue to step up. [Interjections.] Once again, and I want to name and that Hansard will actually reflect the names of Adv Pillay, of CD, David Coetzee, of our CFO Moegamat Frizlar ...[Interjection.] but also our Acting CD Gillian Lutz ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
...because those are the men and women behind the scenes doing extraordinary work. [Interjections.] May also reflect that Calley Belooi who is in the gallery ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
...representing the Ministry: thank you so much. [Interjections.] We will continue, hon Speaker, and once again, the DA-led Government did not cut any budget. It was forced as the result of budget cuts at a national level. Thank you so much. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you very much, hon Minister Allen. Hon

members, that concludes the debate on this Vote. [Interjections.] I am going to allow the officials to leave before I – yes, you are more than welcome to stay if you so wish. I am going to ask the Secretary to read the Seventh Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Votes and Schedules – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, parties have an option of making a declaration now to cover all the Votes or to make a declaration on each Vote individually. So, when I call the political party to make their declaration, can you just indicate that you are going to do an individual Vote or individual declaration per Vote, or you are going to do one declaration for all the Votes. [Interjections.] So, I ...[Interjections.] Order, hon members! I recognise ...[Interjections.] I recognise the African National Congress. [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Honourable ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order, hon members. There is an hon member on the floor!

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Hon Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, please take your seat. In the interest of your time and for me to protect you, I am ...[Interjections.] You can take your

seat. Until the House is quiet, I am not going to recognise you. Hon Nkondlo, I trust that the colleagues will now allow you an opportunity to make your declaration. Hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, on behalf of the ANC, hon members of this House and our guests in the gallery, I stand before you today to shed light on the perceived immateriality of the Adjustments Budget Bill that currently occupies our legislative landscape these past weeks.

As stewards of public trust, it is our solemn duty to critically examine the efficacy and significance of every legislative instrument brought forth for our consideration. The Adjustments Budget Bill in its current form prompts us to question the tangible impact it bears on our fiscal framework and the lives of those it seeks to serve. In an era marked by unprecedented challenges and evolving economic landscapes, the need for adaptable financial measures is undeniable.

However, as we scrutinise the provisions of the Adjustments Budget Bill, it becomes imperative to discern whether proposed adjustments genuinely address the pressing issues at hand or merely contribute to bureaucratic rituals. The perceived immateriality then, prompts us to delve into a rigorous evaluation of the Bill's substance and its potential ramifications on the welfare of our constituents. These adjustment measures have cast a shadow over critical social programmes as witnessed by substantial budget cuts



across various subprogrammes, to think that budget cuts and even budgets are a choice a government makes.

The question that we place upon this House today, is actually when the DA-led Government makes choices to cut where it cuts and for whom. To think that the DA-led Government has cut R835-million off Education, they have cut R931-million on Health and Wellness, and further cut about R19-million on Social Development. This does not only stop here to look closer at these cuts there are also those that benefit the marginalised masses of our people. [Interjections.]

We understand their reluctance and backwardness regarding the NHI Bill. The services to persons with disabilities face a disheartening reduction of over R1,4-million, undermining the very support system meant to uplift the vulnerable. Child and Youth Care Centres, instrumental in providing a nurturing environment, grapple with a staggering R3,1-million cut from compromising their capacity to offer essential care.

Poverty alleviation and sustainable livelihoods are not spared, experiencing a reduction exceeding R1-million, hindering efforts to uplift those marginalised by economic disparities. Substance abuse, prevention and rehabilitation faces a substantial setback with a cut of over R3,1-million, jeopardising the wellbeing of individuals battling with addiction. Victim empowerment bears the brunt of a massive R3,5-million cut, posing a significant threat to the resources dedicated to supporting those who have suffered trauma. This

...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, please conclude. Your time has expired.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Hon Speaker, with all these cuts that our Government has undergone, we must remember that our legislative endeavours remain steadfastly focused on the tangible betterment of the lives we are duty-bound to serve ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): ...to ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): In closing the ANC does not adopt; does not support the adoption of this Bill. Thank you, hon Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Nkondlo. I recognise the EFF. I recognise GOOD.

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): No declaration, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the ACDP supports the Adjustments Budget Bill as was debated at length. The Province can only do so much when the National Government does not cover the entire Wage Bill and that is tremendous pressure on the Western Cape Government. But what is alarming are the budget cuts in Education that was forced by National Government.

I am very, as the ACDP, we are very concerned when it comes to the placement of learners and secondly, we are concerned now that the class sizes will also be bigger. Learners are already struggling to catch up what they lost in COVID-19 and now, you are going to sit with over-crowded classrooms and that is going to make it extremely difficult.

Also, when it comes to Community Safety. We heard in the Committee, due to the innovation of the Department by transferring the money early to the City, they will not terminate any LEAP officers' contracts and that is a compliment to the Department. But still, as I said earlier, when you cut it is difficult and the safety of our residents and the education of our children is so important to take this province forward. So, the ACDP supports the Adjustments Budget Bill. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the Freedom Front Plus. I recognise Al Jama-ah. I recognise Al Jama-ah. I will then move on. I will then move on to the Democratic Alliance.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, before I get into the reasons for the consideration from the DA on this Vote, I just want to fix some statistics and I am quoting from page 3 of the Schedule of the actual Bill, Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill.

“Education has a net increase of R835-million.”

This composes of an increase of R943-million of the Provincial Equitable Share for the public wages plus R94-million for energy and infrastructure programmes. Then, you minus the R179-million for Conditional Grants that we are getting cut. Then you plus the R18-million for the rollovers in the programme and then you minus the R15,7-million in the shifting of Votes, which is essentially bank account changes between departments which brings you to the R835-million net increase in the adjustments. ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Deputy Chief Whip, can I just remind you that you must make a declaration on the Votes as already debated.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes, hon Speaker. I am getting there. But I cannot allow that incorrect statistics are going ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: This is not the opportunity to correct the facts as submitted. Please do the declaration.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): I accept that. Thank you so much. In

total, the Western Cape is owed R2,9-billion from the National Treasury. We received R1,7-million. Therefore, we are still owed just over R1,1-billion. This is the equivalent of approximately 2 750 staff.

In addition to this, R642-million was cut in Conditional Grant funding from the National Treasury and the National Government. These include the Education Infrastructure Grant, ECD Grant, HIV and Aids Grant, Maths, Science and Technology Grant, District Health Programmes Grant, Health Facility Revitalisation Grant, Provincial Roads Grant, CAS Grant, Ilima/Letsema Grant, Land Care Grant, Human Settlements Grant, Informal Settlements Grant, EPWP Grant, Social Sector EPWP Grant, Maths Participation or Development Grant.

Our Provincial Reserves have been depleted in terms of the 2023 stabilisation reserve and this has been reduced; our total reserves have been reduced from R3,7-billion to R1,7-billion. [Interjections.] Despite this, the DA will continue fighting for the people of this province, which is why the Western Cape Government declared an intergovernmental dispute with the National Government, because they must pay back the money. [Interjections.] The DA in Western Cape will continue to build, plan and protect, and we support this Budget. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon members. Order, hon members! Before I put the question, can I just get an indication if there is any political party that wants to make individual declarations? There are no individual

declarations. I therefore have to announce that there currently 32 hon members present and entitled to vote, and the House is therefore quorate. Are there any objections to Votes 1 to 14 and Schedules of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriations Bill?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes.

Hon MEMBERS: No!

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, so I will now put the question to the House that those in favour of the Votes 1 to 14 and Schedules of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bills being adopted, please say 'Yes'.

Hon MEMBERS: Yes!

An HON MEMBER: No.

The SPEAKER: Those not in favour of Votes 1 to 14 and the Schedules of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill being adopted, please say 'No'.

Hon MEMBERS: No!

The SPEAKER: I think the ayes have it. Votes and Schedules of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill has therefore been adopted. Hon members, the Secretary will read the Eighth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Finalisation of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill including the clauses and short title.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon Minister of Finance, hon Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Speaker. The ANC National Government centrally imposed the Wage Bill ...[Interjections.] and then only partly funded it, leaving us with a R1,1-billion shortfall in-year, which is crowding out funding for service delivery. It is the ANC National Government that has slashed Conditional Grants in-year.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Yes.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: The Western Cape Government did not do this.

The PREMIER: Correct!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: The National Government did this.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Yes.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: We are therefore forced to make tough choices with what is left and strategically protect basic services, and through this budget provide stability and sustainability. And we are fighting for the Western Cape and for the residents of this province through an intergovernmental dispute.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hear, hear!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Hon Speaker, I therefore move that the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7-2023] the clauses and short title be finalised. [Applause.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hear, hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister Wenger. Hon members, there being no list of speakers, are there any objections to the Bill, clauses and short title being finalised?

Hon MEMBERS: No.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. So, the question that all those in favour of the Bill, the clauses and the short title being finalised, please say 'Yes'.



Hon MEMBERS: Yes!

The SPEAKER: All those not in favour of the Bill, clauses and the short title being finalised, please say 'No'.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No!

The SPEAKER: I think the ayes have it ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No!

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I just need to, just for the record, indicate that there were 31 hon members present and entitled to vote. Just for the record. The finalisation including the clauses and short title of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7-2023] is therefore approved.

Hon member, just for the record, the names of the individual hon members present and their support or otherwise for the question that was put before the House, will be recorded in the Minutes of the proceedings to ensure a full record of the voting on the Bill. I recognise the Secretary who will read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill.

The SPEAKER: The Bill will now be sent to the hon Premier for assent.

The PREMIER: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the Ninth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration and Finalisation of the Western Cape Nineteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Act Repeal Bill [B3-2023].

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon Minister, hon Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Speaker. On 20 May 2021, the Western Cape Nineteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Bill was adopted by this Provincial Parliament. It was assented to by the hon Premier of the Western Cape on 17 June 2021 and became the Western Cape Nineteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Act of 2021. The Amendment Act, however, was not brought into operation.

A pandemic of the scale of COVID-19 was not foreseen. This pandemic had far-reaching consequences for and exposed the practical realities and challenges faced by the Gambling and Racing industries and the Board. It has since become apparent that there is a need for a renewed consideration of the Gambling and Racing environment as a whole. This includes a renewed assessment of the economic landscape, taking into account lessons learnt from the COVID-19 pandemic and insights gained from stakeholders in the

gambling industry since the Amendment Bill was assented to.

Gambling and racing are indeed dynamic environments, and it is important that the provincial policy is updated in light of developments in these industries. If the Amendment Act were to be brought into operation it would be outdated and incompatible with the developments in the gambling and racing industries, the lessons learnt from the COVID-19 pandemic and the policy review process. In these circumstances, it is prudent to repeal the Amendment Act. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, as there is no list of speakers, I will now afford political parties an opportunity to speak for a maximum of three minutes each. I recognise the ANC.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Thank you, somlomo. Whilst the ANC remains in support of the financial sustainability of the Gambling Board, it also further recognises the revenue derived from gambling when undertaken responsibly with an appropriate regulated environment, always shouldering the risk of potential mishaps from this activity to the social fabric and vulnerable households.

The Legislation we are appealing went through a rigorous process of public participation when even legal opinion from our very competent Legal Services of WCPP and from the Department against what was litigation threats on the constitutionality of the aspects of that legislative process, in

particular on the right to equality versus the rationality of differentiation on the fee structure towards the totalisators, the LPMs and casinos and bookmakers.

It is interesting that this Bill had to be brought back for repeal within no time. As the hon Minister says that it was assented to the hon Premier in 2021, long after COVID-19. And when it was brought back for repeal under very dodgy circumstances and when we asked for the information about why and what is the basis of this repeal, we were told of structural problems which were already known with also the studies that were done around the gambling environment.

Clearly, this Provincial Government did not adhere to the legal opinions given by competent legal experts employed in this WCPP and after ignoring such, had to embroil and spend taxpayers' monies for legal fees to defend themselves in a litigation which they tried to hide as a basis of this repeal. Even the potential liability that it stays to accrue from this. We had to mine that information with questions to the Committee coordinator and the Committee itself to be told some of the information even at this point, we were told cannot be provided, it is confidential, from the senior counsel to understand the discussions that would have led to where we are.

This is actually not new as we were sitting here a few weeks ago where the Provincial Powers Bill was then imposed upon us with hon member Bosman actually making a statement that we must not always have faith in legal

opinions. So, it goes to show how this reckless Government act has constitutional delinquents who will go to lengths to try to get their way. And the ANC does not support this repeal. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Nkondlo. I recognise the EFF, for the record. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. I recognise GOOD.

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): No declaration, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): No declaration, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the Freedom Front Plus. [Interjections.] I recognise Al Jama-ah. [Interjections.] I recognise the Democratic Alliance.

Ms C MURRAY (DA): Hon Speaker, the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism has thoroughly considered the Western Cape Nineteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Act Repeal Bill. The Committee advertised a call for submissions on the Bill in the *Cape Argus*, *Die Burger*, and *Vukani*, as well as online on *News24* and *Netwerk24*, as well as the *Business Day*.

The call for comment was also released for radio advertising and was

advertised on social media for public knowledge. This included paid social media. Additional letters and invitation were sent to municipalities in the Western Cape, as well as Business Chambers. The PMG then advertised the Bill on its call for comment and the Western Cape Provincial Parliament's Public Education and Outreach Unit utilised its network of community development workers to request submissions and attendance on the public hearings.

The Committee held one public hearing in Cape Town and received one written submission from the National Gambling Board. No comments opposing the Bill were received throughout this extensive public participation process. [Interjections.] The Committee ...[Interjections.] the Committee had robust and open deliberations on the Bill and had considered the public inputs as well as inputs from Provincial Treasury and the gambling industry.

The Bill is necessary so that the impacts of COVID-19 and the changing environment of the gambling industry can be properly addressed. For this reason, the DA supports this Bill. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Murray. I recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move for the Consideration and Finalisation of the

Western Cape Nineteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Act Repeal Bill,  
Bill B3-2023.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, I have to announce that there are currently 31 hon members present and entitled to vote, and the House is therefore quorate. Are there any objections to the Approval of the principle and finalisation of the Bill?

Hon MEMBERS: No!

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: No objections? Is there an objection?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: The objection will be noted. Can I just for the record, just put the question that all those in favour, please say 'Yes'.

Hon MEMBERS: Yes!

The SPEAKER: All those against it, please say 'No'.

An HON MEMBER: No. [Laugh.]

The SPEAKER: I think the ayes have it. The Principle and the Finalisation of the Bill is therefore approved. [Interjections.] The Secretary will now read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: Western Cape Nineteenth Gambling and Racing Amendment Act Repeal Bill.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Secretary. The Bill will be sent to the hon Premier for assent.

The PREMIER: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: The Secretary will now read the Tenth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of report of the Rules Committee on the Presiding Officers' Manual.

The SPEAKER: I have been informed by the Chief Whip that the Programming Authority resolved that there would be no list of speakers and that the Rules Committee unanimously agreed to the report. The question there put before the House is that the Report of the Rules Committee be adopted. Are there any objections to the report being adopted?

Hon MEMBERS: No!



An HON MEMBER: No objections.

The SPEAKER: No objections, agreed to. The Amendments to the Presiding Officers' Manual is therefore adopted.

Hon members, as is our tradition, I will now afford representatives of political parties an opportunity to address the House on the occasion of the end of the year and the end of this session. The ANC.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker, as we wind down the year and prepare to take a break, I am reminded that the alphabet itself, the A to Z, provides a way of including most if not all of us.

A is for all of you, hon members, who battle in the House, sometimes making our hon Speaker rattle. B is for best, the support staff and administration who often work without rest. C stands for our caucus staff who go the extra mile to make their members smile. D is for the din we often make in this House while we interject, call points of order, heckle and how. E is for equality, a goal we should all pursue with vigour for without equality and justice, we will not have peace. F is for friendships which have developed over time. G is for the ground floor, the level we go to on our way down, but sometimes, get stuck all alone.

H is for hon members who try very hard. I for is for indifferent, something we should never be. J is for joyful, the way we feel when our work on the

ground changes lives. K is for kindness, something we should display more often. L is for laugh, what we do often at ourselves and each other. M is for the MTEF, an important process that we know well. N is for no, which we should say to frivolous points of order. [Laugh.] ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Where is the mirror?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Okay and then we come to O. O is for Our Province and our country, to which we remain loyal and true. P is for people whom we should always put first. Q stands for questions of which we ask many. R stands for rugby in 2023 when we celebrated a famous third World Cup victory. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Fourth!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: S is for silence that often illudes this noisy House. T is for time which governs our lives and U is for all of you, colleagues, and comrades that we are to each other and will always be. V is for vast, which is our province from Vanryhnsdorp to Bitou to Murraysberg and back. W is for words which we should carefully choice. X is what the voters will make in 2024. And Y is for yesterday which will never come back, meaning that we must make the most of today. Z is the last letter of the alphabet as we mark the last session of the year.

I thank you, hon members and hon speakers, and may God bless and protect

you and your families, and the people of our province over the festive season, and all those who visit us. †Dit is lekker. Moenie te veel suip nie. [It is lekker.] Don't drink too much. †Baie dankie. [Thank you.] Remember the A to Z. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Dugmore. I recognise the EFF. I recognise GOOD.

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): Thank you, hon Speaker. Ja, what a great year, learning curve and all the inputs from people. When I first came to this House, I was regarded as new and I struggled with the term 'new' because at 66, how new can you become? [Laughs.]

But I leave this place and I will come back more empowered because what I sense is that together, we can definitely build this world to be a better place, especially for all of us that need hope so much at this stage. And ja, I am coming a full circle, meeting brilliant people. I wish everybody that the 33 hours we spend to prepare, do not let anybody ever criticise the three minutes of output which we do get and sometimes, not adequately use.

May we all be blessed during this festive season. Go out there and be the best that you can be. Inspire people to be better than what they were yesterday. And whenever we leave this House this year, let us leave it in a better place than what we found it to be. I thank you so much and a Happy Christmas to all of you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon De Villiers. I recognise the Freedom Front – the ACDP, my apologies.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. hon Speaker, on behalf of the ACDP I would want to wish every hon member and support staff a blessed and festive season. I just want to read something to bless us all and that is out of Numbers 6 verses 24 to 26. It says and reads as follows:

“The Lord bless us and keep us; the Lord make His face shine upon us and be gracious towards us; the Lord turn His face towards us and give us peace.”

So, hon Speaker, my prayer is that we will enjoy the time off and that we will always remember Emmanuel. We worship Jesus Christ and Emmanuel means God is with us. So, wherever we travel, wherever we go visiting families, and on the road, remember that God is there with us to protect us and provide to us. Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

To everybody for, I think, a very productive year, a year of a lot of debates, but also, I believe a year that we can end off and say that as hon members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, we have achieved much, and we need this break. Coming back next year, it is the election year, so we will be up and fresh, and work hard to ensure that we do well for the people of the Western Cape. I thank you, hon Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians. I recognise the Freedom Front Plus. I recognise Al Jama-ah. [Interjections.] I recognise the Democratic Alliance.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker, hon Premier, hon Leaders of the various Opposition parties, but also all hon members of the House. As 2023 is slowly drawing to a close, we must reflect also on the year that was. A year, I believe, where the words of the icon of our country, Tata Madiba, rings out true. He said:

“May your choices reflect your hopes and not your fears.”

And I believe that as a Province, but also as a nation, as we prepare to go to our various families, some across various provinces, and share time with our friends, most of us will reflect on the highs and lows of the year. But I believe the highs truly symbolise this belief in hope that we must continue to have as a people and as a nation.

Among others, within our own provincial boundaries, we saw the successful hosting of the Netball World Cup, where the world showed faith not only in our country, but in this province to host such a World Cup. We saw above many peoples' belief, the Springboks mounting the insurmountable and taking up the World Cup title for the fourth time, the first nation to do so. All but, with one point. Earlier over the weekend we saw Gerda Steyn: endurance.

She broke the Two Oceans Marathon record. She broke the Comrade Marathon record, and she also broke the longstanding SA Marathon record, showing that if we endure and we focus, we can reach the insurmountable.

But we also saw it in our own province. Some of the worst storms in decades, yet the belief of the people in its Government, but also working with their Government. We saw communities being reconnected in record time. The power of belief. The power of working together. And indeed, within this august House, hon Speaker, we have debated many heated topics of debate, sharing opposing views, but we did so with respect, always remembering that all of us here, those that govern and those that oppose those that do govern in this province, we ultimately are the voices of all the people of the Western Cape which we must never forget.

And yes, on the political front within our own province, finally after many failed attempts, we saw the Official Opposition being able to have a congress which was surprising even to themselves. [Laugh] But we also saw that the governing party in this province, we also had a very successful congress recently. Again, the antithesis of a party that governs and a party that is busy dwindling in this province as we speak.

So, hon Speaker, indeed, 2023 has so many memories, good and bad for some of us and indeed, for all of us, but it has made all of us stronger as a people, stronger to commit to ensure that our country does not decline even further. And we are the beacons of hope as hon members of this Legislature. As we

are all now going to take a much-needed break, we must always remember that we are the beacons of hope wherever we go across this province and even beyond our province's shores.

And that is why my message to all of you as you go on a well-deserved rest, to carry into the new year again, the words of Tata Madiba:

“Remember that hope is a powerful weapon, even when all else is lost.”

I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister Simmers. Hon members, just from my side and the hon Deputy Speaker, thank you very much for your support the last year. It is literally a year in office for me in the next couple of days. So, thank you very, very much for your support across the political divide. I would not have been able to get through this year without your support.

I wish you all a blessed festive season and as I said earlier, if you are travelling, please be safe and it would also be remiss of me, hon members, if I do not acknowledge the wonderful support from the support staff. So, thank you very, very much to the Secretary and the team and also, to every single member of staff in the Administration.

Hon Dugmore, is that a point of order? [Laugh.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker, I think it might be in the A to Z I said no frivolous points of order, but ...[Laugh.] I think it is important that we should note, hon Speaker, that last year many of us were frustrated that we only received our 2023 diaries about a month into 2023. Now, I think we need to pay tribute to the Administration and to you, hon Speaker, [Laugh.] because we actually have our 2024 diaries in December. [Applause.] So, I know it is not a point of order, but I want to really say thank you. Viva 2024, viva.

The PREMIER: So that is not a privilege, thank you. [Laugh.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon members and for the last time for 2023, that concludes the business for the day. The Secretary will now end the meeting and all hon members will be exited from this sitting. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 16:08.