
THURSDAY, 7 DECEMBER 2023

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid Sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 10:00.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Good morning, hon members. Before we proceed I would like to remind members about some of the logistical arrangements. As has been our practice to date, hon members will participate in this Sitting of the House both from here in the Chamber with the Presiding Officer and Table staff and via Microsoft Teams. Our Standing Rules have accordingly been amended to accommodate such hybrid Sittings of the House. Hon members experiencing challenges in connecting to the Sitting are requested to contact the WCPP ICT Colleagues who will assist to resolve their connectivity challenges.

Hon members, the quorum requirements for this Sitting of the House are as provided for in the Constitution and the Standing Rules and unless there is an indication of unanimous concurrence voting will be confined to members present in the House and on the hybrid system who are entitled to cast their votes as per the ATC issued on 11 August 2020.

Members present in the Chamber and via Microsoft Teams have all the privileges and immunities imparted by law. Members who are considered out of order by the Presiding Officer will have their microphones muted and called to order. Hon members, in instances where these directives do not cover a particular eventuality the Standing Rules must be applied and in instances where the Rules cannot be applied the Ruling by the Presiding Officer is final.

Members, all microphones have been muted and when an hon member in the Chamber wishes to raise a point of order, such hon member may address the Presiding Officer as expected, but members must mute their microphones when they have completed speaking.

Hon members participating in the Sitting of the House via Microsoft Teams, you are requested to use the raise-hand functionality of the system when you desire to raise a point of order and I will recognise you.

The media have been granted access to this Microsoft Teams meeting as guests of the WCPP. However I wish to remind members of the press that they may not use the Chat Room or speak or activate their cameras while this Sitting is in progress.

Hon members, Language Translation Services are available in the Chamber as usual and on Microsoft Teams via the respective channels. Hon members participating in this Sitting of the House must please access the Language Translation Services via a second device and if you have earphones available please use them for Language Translations.

Hon members, I wish to remind you that no interjections are permitted during these hybrid Sittings and to this end I wish to draw your attention to Rule 40 of our Standing Rules.

Hon members, good morning, and to the guests online and in the gallery, welcome to the Western Cape Provincial Parliament.

Hon members, the Secretary will now read the First Order of the Day.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

†Die SEKRETARIS: Debat oor Begrotingspos 1 – Premier – Wes-Kaapse Aansuiweringsbegrotingswetsontwerp [W7–2023].

[The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 1 – Premier – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7–2023].]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise the hon Premier, Premier Winde.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, hon Cabinet colleagues, Leader of the Opposition, members of this Provincial Parliament, the DG and staff of this Provincial Government, special guests and, most importantly, the citizens, the residents of this great province, the Western Cape.
[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Who are the special guests? I do not see anyone.

The PREMIER: Despite catastrophic national failures, the Western Cape, Mr Speaker, has now become the hope, the only hope for South Africa.
[Interjections.]

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Hoor-hoor!

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hear-hear!]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: For the Whites.

The PREMIER: Speaker, as we near the end of 2023 we reflect on the highs

and lows of the past year. Our province and country have been made to endure another challenging year as a result of continued massive failures by the National Government. On Tuesday it was announced that the contraction of the economy in the third quarter marked fears of a looming technical recession. Stats SA announced that the economic activity declined by 0,2% in the three months through to September. That is a decline on almost zero percent growth. That is catastrophic, Mr Speaker. We have chronic energy crises and a logistics nightmare that is taking its toll on our economy.

If I think about how much it is costing us every single day, the logistics failure in our system exacerbated by these power cuts and, of course, in 2023 we saw the worst power cuts ever and they have been hampering our growth as of today while our citizens have to fumble in the dark, 322 days of loadshedding this year so far, 322 days of loadshedding this year and, you know, it almost makes me feel like a Monty Python Show, when every single time the ANC stands up and makes an announcement that says "This year we will end loadshedding," ten wraggies waar, [and so and behold], this year becomes worst than last year, and of course that is why we are seeing this catastrophic implication for our citizens because of total failure at a national level.

Speaker, on the rare occasion when the lights are on businesses, investors and companies are left counting the costs of this ongoing calamity, the cost is counted in the hundreds and thousands of jobs lost due to loadshedding, nearly a billion rand goes down the drain each and every day because of these

rolling power cuts. This disaster, sadly now synonymous with South Africa, is exacerbated by ever increasing electricity prices so we cannot keep the lights on and what little power we do give is just costing more and more and that has a knock-on effect to the cost of living. Who suffers the most? The poorest of the poor!

Speaker, caught in the midst of these challenges are our residents, many of who feel abandoned. They look to us in this Province for hope, and rightfully so. It is this Government's singular obsession to keep delivering for you, the citizens or our residents.

When faced with natural disasters like the September floods or the deadly minibus taxi strike, we act with purpose and urgency, with the need of our residents always front of mind. We lead by delivering the best possible essential services. We are building a fertile jobs ecosystem driven by our Growth for Jobs Plan.

We are enabling and empowering local governments to help us resolve the energy crisis through our Energy Resilience Programme, which is already delivering encouraging results. We all know that in this Municipality, Cape Town and where this Parliament sits, we already mitigate more than two levels of loadshedding now. If I look at what is happening in Saldanha Bay, and I am not talking about yesterday's by-election, I am talking about the announcement of 100 megawatts for their own resilience with a potential 1 500 megawatts.

†Ons kan krag gee vir die hele Weskus uit Saldanhabaai.

[We can provide power to the whole West Coast from Saldanha Bay.]

I think about what is happening in George. I think about what is happening in Mossel Bay, what is due to happen very soon in Stellenbosch, that Energy Resilience Programme is the hope that this Province is giving to South Africa.

Our growing provincial economy is the product of a government that cares and responds to the needs of our residents, no matter what.

The Western Cape, Speaker, is doing much more with a lot less. Yet even in the face of the perennial issues – the catastrophic energy crisis, alarmingly high unemployment and crime levels, the adversities which have been long in the making are now rearing their ugly heads, this calamitous fiscal crisis forced on us by the failed National Government – we still manage to build hope for the future. This hope is embodied in every job we helped to create and the most recent Quarterly Labour Force Survey has confirmed not only did we create more jobs between quarter three of 2022 and quarter three of this year than any other province in South Africa, with more than 305 000 new jobs. We have also the lowest unemployment rate. If you listened to the Adjustments Budget, if you listened to the budget yesterday and the speech by the Minister of Finance, you know it is the lowest unemployment rate, both narrow and broad, the highest absorption rate, the highest business

confidence rate. All of those indicators in this province are those indicators that give citizens hope.

We are moving into what I want to say is the next stage of hope, which is this coming season. If I think of the 215 direct flights that are coming into the City of Cape Town or the Cape Town International Airport every single week now in this tourism season, 33 000 international visitors every single day on average, that excludes the thousands and thousands of South Africans who will come to this province for their holidays and of course the thousands and thousands of jobs that are created over this next season because of tourism, but of course I look at agriculture and the potential of around 20% growth because of really good rains. Sometimes maybe in some parts of our province the rains were too good because we had severe floods, but the good rains, we expect a 20% growth in potential exports of our agricultural products. As long as we can get another failed ANC mandate, our ports to operate properly, we will be able to reap the rewards in jobs at the end of the day, once again this Province giving South Africa hope.

We have maintained and improved our already impeccable track record for good governance. This is confirmed by all of our departments and entities, Speaker, receiving unqualified audits in the 2022/23 financial year. Speaker, the best audit results ever in this province, and thank you very much to the Cabinet colleagues and to your departments and your entities, the best audit outcomes in South Africa ever. That again shows you that this Province is the hope for the future and the hope for our country. [Interjection.]

HON MEMBERS: Hear, hear!

The PREMIER: Speaker, as we reflect on the hard work this Government puts into making a difference in the lives of our residents, we must also be candid. We have a long road ahead of us. Unemployment and crime remain a deadly reality for too many of our vulnerable residents, let alone those in the rest of South Africa. Levels of unemployment and crime are still intolerably high.

Speaker, just this last week I joined the Minister for Police Oversight and Community Safety and we joined Neighbourhood Watches in Mitchells Plain. The Neighbourhood Watch in Mitchells Plain that we walked with pointed out cable thefts. They had taken away street lamps. That exacerbates crime levels. We walked with volunteers that give of their time, one of 17 500 volunteers in this province, people who spend their time in their communities, making sure that we are building a safer province and I want to say thank you very much to them, but what we also did was we spent some time, Minister of Health, Minister Mbombo, in your hospital in Mitchells Plain, on a Saturday night, 10 o'clock at night in the trauma unit, seeing the impact on our citizens of gangsterism, of crime, and how perhaps your mom, your daughter, your brother who is sick and going to one of our hospitals and who has to get pushed to the back of the queue because of gangsterism and crime. While we were there, three stab-victims came in almost one after the other in that three quarters of an hour and all the doctors have to be rushed in

surgeries, you name it, to save that life of a stab victim and my message...

[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: We talked about the Adjustment Budget.

The PREMIER: And my message – this is the impact of budgets, Speaker, the impact of budgets, and my message to our citizens this season...

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Kom by! Kom by!

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Come round! Come round!]

The PREMIER: ...is, the Festive Season is a time for celebration; it is a time for rest and recuperation. It is also a time for jobs. It is a time for the economy but it is also a time that we need every single citizen to take responsibility this festive season. Be safe on our roads; be safe in our communities, look after our communities, take responsibility for your own self and for others. Let us make sure that this is a safer season, the safest season yet, and we want to play our part in building that partnership going forward. That is why safety is such a critical issue for me and for this Government.

Speaker, I also want to talk about the implications of the budget cuts, the in-year budget cuts, and that is why we are saying to our National

Government, give us our R1,1 billion or we will see you in court.

[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

The PREMIER: We have declared this intergovernmental dispute because we have a contract, a contract that is an approved budget...

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The PREMIER: An approved budget that is a contract for this year, signed, debated and agreed to, becomes a contract, and in-year they have broken that contract and they expect R1,1 billion to be found in-year and they expect us to take that away from the very services that our citizens deserve.

We are not going to cut those services to our citizens. We are going to hold the National Government accountable to that very contract and that is why we have declared this dispute. Unfortunately, the first meeting in this process was not able to be had. That was on Monday this week, the Minister of Finance was called away urgently to some other business. I presume it was to go and defend territory against the sheriff at Luthuli House, but that is the ecosystem and the environment we live in. The ANC is busy defending their wickets while the sheriff takes away their furniture, computers and a water-cooler, but that is synonymous with exactly what is happening in our country. We will go and fight for that R1,1 billion because our citizens deserve those

services in our hospitals, in our schools. Our social workers need to be empowered to do the work that they do. We need to carry on growing for jobs in our province and we will fight for that money because that money is the money that the citizens deserve.

Speaker, those cuts, the implication of those cuts, Infrastructure in our Province is being cut by R372 million; Health services by R136 million; Education by R248 million; Roads and Road Maintenance by R52 million; Human Settlements by R214 million; Agriculture by another R20 million. These cuts are unacceptable because we have a contract. We have a contract and we need to deliver on that contract and we will not tolerate having that contract broken. We will fight for our citizens.

Speaker, we cannot afford to divert funding away from critical services due to an irresponsible and incapable and failed National Government. Speaker, we stand here today because we are at that stage in our contractual agreement where we have an opportunity to legally adjust the budget, where we have taken responsibility as a Government and you will see in our documents we are putting those cuts in the system but we are taking this to the very end. We will get the courts to decide, but in the interim we obviously must approve because we believe in the rule of law. We must approve the processes and that is why we are here today with this 2023/24 Budget Adjustment.

In aggregate the Department of the Premier has a reduced budget of R16,392 million and this amount represents the net results of several

additions and reductions applied to the Department's Main Budget baseline of R2,047 billion.

The budget realignment, first of all, on Energy and the blueprint for the Western Cape's drive to maintain the province's energy security through our Energy Resilience Programme, the rollout of Energy Projects, and we have experienced some delays and hence the need to realign our current budget for this critical area of massive failure of the ANC and as a result of specifically tender processes, again where we need to bring about changes, but in the interim tender processes that did not deliver the required outcomes, we have had to delay beyond our March allocation and move over into April of next year and so we have reallocated R57 million of the budget.

The Department also had to surrender R7,5 million on the Integrated Resource Plan. This is actually a positive because it will be resulting in a saving because we are looking at outside funding to come and help us with building that resource plan which gives clarity to the industry on what our plan is within the Province, not a national plan. It was a failure at that level. We will have a Resource Plan here at the provincial level. We have also had to delay R9 million in budget because we are battling to get the Demand Side Management Programme finalised due to delays in getting national outline.

I must say that the Minister has attended a few of our Energy Committees but of late in the last two we have not managed to get that finality and we cannot take that risk, so we will defer that R9 million over to next year.

We are also shifting budgets, money between votes R36,094 million in budgetary shifts. This is in the IT support for Police Oversight and Community Safety of R1,3 million. Microsoft Azure Cloud Computing Services and Technical Support for Health and Wellness of R28,81 million; the Programme and Project Management Resources for Transversal Enterprise Content Management, ECM of R7,440 million and R2,7 million is shifted to the Department of Infrastructure, and this is for organisational development or for the units moved to an alternative and more cost effective accommodation.

Hon Speaker, as we prepare to enter a new year and faced with a host of challenges which I outlined in the beginning and more, I ask of this Government and appeal to the citizens to maintain hope. We are a resilient province blessed with diversity and a can-do spirit, which I believe is unmatched in this country. We will not abandon you, the citizen or the resident. You are the core of this Government's work and we will continue to service you with dignity and humility. Your resilience and support helped made us a better Government and we thank you for allowing us to serve you. We remain citizen-obsessed. We remain a Government for you, the citizen, and armed and equipped with data and evidence and backed by the Western Cape's strong, stable and sound track record of good governance we can better prepare ourselves today for the need of the future. To our partners we have come a long way and still have some distance to travel in realising this province's full potential.

Speaker, I would like to thank the DG and our colleagues both in the Department of the Premier for the work that has gone into not only our work with national and some of our fights and some of our successes, but also just the work of realigning this budget. Thank you to our colleagues in Treasury, but of course to all of our colleagues across each and every department, all of the public servants in our province who go beyond or above and beyond every single day.

I also want to specifically thank the team in my office for the long hours and the hard work that they put in, also in service of the citizens of this province and so, Speaker, I table these Adjustments here today in this debate and look forward to the discussion. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. I now recognise the hon Leader of the Opposition, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, Speaker, and also to the Premier. I think all of us know that we are discussing these adjustments in the context of serious fiscal challenges and a number of other challenges, some of which the Premier has referred to. The Premier argued that this particular Government is bringing hope. I am talking about the DA Government. He argues that they are bringing hope to the people of the Western Cape.

Now what I want to say in the context of the post-COVID period, the need to rebuild, the constraints that we face, often there is a debate about whether the response to this is to actually understand that more people are unemployed. More people are vulnerable and the need to actually focus on the security net. Obviously, all of us want a growing economy that is inclusive, but in a situation like this, I would argue that what gives hope to South Africans, including the people of the Western Cape, is the fact that our National Government launched a Temporary Employment Relief Scheme, the TERS Scheme, with 5,7 million workers benefiting from that in terms of the wage... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I would also argue that what gives people hope are not the words of the Premier, but the fact that the Social Relief of Distress Grant amounting to R350 per month, which has benefited nearly 10 million people, that gives hope to people. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order members!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I would argue that the fact that 2,2 million young people between the ages of 15 and 24 are in the post-school, education and training sector and I would also say that the investment of R32 billion in the Presidential Employment Stimulus Initiative which started in 2020 has actually benefited 1,2 million young people.

I would also argue that the more than 550 000 workers who are now actually part owners of companies through Broad-based Economic Empowerment and Share Equity Schemes are not only getting a salary, but are also actually getting a dividend at the end of the year. Those are the real things that give people hope, but when, for instance, the DA across the road votes against the National Health Insurance System, a system to actually cater for the whole population for health at the point of service and this Democratic Alliance votes against a system of National Health Insurance, they say, and they show that they are against the poor. [Interjection.]

When they vote against, as they have done, the Expropriation Bill, which replaces the 1967 Act and actually provides and will assist land redistribution – not as the DA wants to imply with willy-nilly expropriation without compensation; in certain cases, there will be nil compensation. That is what is needed, but the DNA voting against it does not provide hope and that is why despite, and I will be the first to admit it, despite the pathologies that we as a movement – the African National Congress – have and are dealing with, that still gives people hope in the African National Congress, not in the Democratic Alliance. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So what does not give hope to people is the fact that here in the Western Cape, as I indicated in the

speech earlier on this week, that when it comes to ownership, †kaart en transport [title-deed], ownership of urban land, 70% of urban land is owned by White South Africans in the Western Cape. [Interjections.] Coloured people, who constitute 48% of the people of this province, own only 10% of urban land and African people, who constitute 32% only own 3,5%. That is simply not sustainable, but since the DA took power, there has been no political will to give hope in regard to land restitution.

Ms A CASSIEM: District Six.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: The DA talks about a whole-of-government approach and it talks about crime and gangsterism. The reality is that gangsterism in this province has got worse under the DA because there has not been an integrated focus, you can talk about Neighbourhood Watches moving around and we support that. We are, as you know, concerned that the CPFs are still not getting the support that they need, but that is not the only solution. You have to get communities involved. You have to get young people involved and give them hope. The reality is when you go to Mitchells Plain and you see the number of young people of college age who are on a street corner... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Because of the ANC!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...that is the crisis of gangsterism and drugs, which your Government, Premier, has actually

neglected. You want to say and there is ample evidence that in terms of this adjustment, in terms of this adjustment... [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: You failed, ja, the applications, you failed.

The SPEAKER: Order members!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...there is no penalisation of the Western Cape. When it comes to police ratios and I will give the figures to the MEC because we wanted to contest that, there is no penalisation of the Western Cape when it comes to the allocation of these resources. So yes, when we look at the budget we note a decrease of R16 million and as the ANC we definitely cannot, will not and we will vote against this adjustment. Suddenly R81 million is found from strategic management, you know, to be adjusted, so clearly that was in the first place, just cushioning the resource but suddenly it is no longer needed.

The exchange rate, obviously that has affected our ability to obtain Microsoft licenses, but why is the DA so silent when clear evidence has emerged that the banks have specifically manipulated and weakened the rand, and that is what is actually making us pay more, yes. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You must read about the

Competition Commission, you must read the Competition Commission, why did Standard Bank Charter pay an admission of guilt... [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: They are always quiet when it comes to this.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP: We deal with it... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: And the DA wants to protect the banks to stand against the opening of the State Bank because they are not prepared to actually take on. So that is a real issue... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: R39 million...

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Dugmore, please take your seat. Order members! Hon Kama, is that a point of order? Hon Meyer, I will recognise you afterwards. Hon Kama?

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. We are now really struggling to hear member Dugmore.

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M KAMA: The leader has much more time to contribute to the debate. I think they must just wait for their turn.

The SPEAKER: Absolutely! Hon members, can I just caution you. Please do not drown out the Speaker on the floor. [Interjection.] Interjections are allowed but the minute that it drowns out the Speaker it becomes a problem. [Interjection.]

Hon Windvogel, I am also speaking to you. Hon Minister Meyer, is that a point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: He always has bogus points of order.

The SPEAKER: Order members! Hon Minister Meyer?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: That is not a point of order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, I would very much like to know if the hon member will give you permission to pay his salary into a State bank.

An HON MEMBER: What is the point of order? What is the point of order?

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Meyer, that is not a point of order. Hon Leader of the Opposition you may continue.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you. As I said the comedian never comes with a proper point of order. Now R39 million in terms of improvement of conditions of service. Now what we have here is a DA Government who does not want to respect national bargaining for all public service work. It is happening, yes, in a very difficult environment, but in the Legislature, Speaker, as you would well know, there is discretion as to what our staff in this Legislature get paid and why is it that members of staff in the Western Cape Legislature get paid less than other provinces and you know why that is? It is because the DA ideologically does not even support a minimum wage. The minimum wage is now between R4 000 and R4 500. They have in their policy documents... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, your time has expired. Please conclude.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...that the minimum wage should be R1 800 so they do not give hope and that is why the ANC will always give hope to the majority who has despite ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Dugmore, your time has expired. Thank you, hon Dugmore, please take your seat. [Applause.] Order members. Thank you very much, hon Dugmore. I now recognise hon Fry.

Mr T FRY: Hon Speaker, it is my privilege to deliberate on the Western Cape Adjustment Appropriation Bill, Vote 1, the Department of the Premier in this debate. However, as with the other Votes in this Bill the picture is not rosy at all. We are now seeing the effects of poor management of parastatals, a shrinking economy and its effect on the currency, constricting procurement procedures and a wage settlement that is simply unaffordable. These factors have led to drastic budget cuts across the board, and this Vote has unfortunately not been spared. By way of introduction, let me state that the Adjustment Appropriation for this Vote has decreased by nearly R16,4 million to R2,030 billion, as the Premier outlined. This might not seem like much but a deep dive into the figures will show that for the most part we are telling Peter that you must contain costs so that Paul can be paid what was agreed with him. What is ironic though is that in effect Peter and Paul are twins, and when you do the sums, they both lose out, because there is less money for both in real terms, so let us look at this Vote in greater detail.

As stated in the Budget Book, the aim of the Department of the Premier is to enable and lead a capable Western Cape Government by institutionalising a culture of innovation and collaboration for improved services for the people of the Western Cape. Given the current fiscal constraints that are ravaging the public service I would say that this Department is doing its level best to execute that aim under very, very trying circumstances.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP: Yes.

Mr T FRY: We must remember that this Department, through its six programmes, provides the bedrock for the rest of the Administration to execute their various mandates.

Hon Speaker, there are a few major points that are vital to note in this budget. The first is that there is an unavoidable expenditure of R17 million within the Centre for E-Innovation owing to the weakening of the rand/dollar exchange rate which has affected the procurement of Microsoft Software Licenses. The stipulated exchange rate in the contract was R17,00 to the dollar. However, it ballooned to R18,4 to the dollar, thus necessitating the R17 million expenditure. While this is perhaps a minor detail in the grand scheme of things it represents the hand this Department and this Government have been dealt. Our failing currency is a direct result of ANC's failed economy and, once again, we are seeing a hard-working Department hamstrung by the decision made at national level.

However, in Programme 4, it is not all doom and gloom. R3,5 million has been allocated via a virement from Programme 5.5 which is Corporate Communication, to Programme 4.2 which is Strategic ICT Services for the new Western Cape Government Digital Experience Platform, which demonstrates that, even in these difficult times, this Department is still serious about achieving its aim of improved services for the people of the Western Cape.

As alluded to in my introduction, one of the biggest virements is from Programme 4.4, Connected Government and Infrastructure Services. R12 million could not be spent owing to SETA procurement delays but thankfully that money was used to fund the shortfall on the Microsoft Licenses owing to the weakening rand and general price increases.

As far as shifting of funds between Votes is concerned, the biggest amount would be the R37,5 million allocated to the Centre for E-Innovation of which R28,8 million was shifted from Vote 6, Health and Wellness, to Microsoft Azure Cloud Computing and Technical Support Services, again as outlined by the Premier.

Hon Speaker, when we look at the expenditure trends of the Department across the six programmes, the overwhelming factor is that the effect of the increased 2023 Wage Agreement, it is clear that this negotiated settlement is just not financially viable. Now the National Government wants to pass the buck literally to the provinces, forcing us into a corner where we have had to fend for ourselves. Is it any wonder why the intergovernmental dispute has been declared? I think not.

Couple that with the effect of the weakened rand and costing procurement processes, we have a recipe for disaster. We now see this Government fighting to maintain its high standard of service delivery in the face of overwhelming odds. The stakes could not be higher. The people of the

Western Cape will remember who delivered a better life to them and who failed to do so. However, hon Speaker, there is a question that must be asked, and that question is, what if?

What if we had a National Government that actually acts in the best interest of its citizens at all times?

What if we had a President who was decisive in dealing with corruption and acting on the findings on the Zondo Report, held his Cabinet to account, ensuring that service delivery occurs as close to the people as possible?

What if we had a National Government who were good stewards of the people's money, strengthened parastatals through public private partnerships ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr T FRY: ...and jettisoned those who are no longer viable in their current form? What if the National Government was actually serious about growing the economy so that every citizen has an equitable chance of creating a better life for themselves and their families, with the poor being more and more involved in the economy and reducing the Gini coefficient?

Speaker, what if this Provincial Government could govern nationally given the effects of this Government over the term and previously, we can make a

pretty good guess as to what would happen. There would be more money available in the economy, a greater emphasis on service delivery, a crackdown on crime, more jobs created and a better life would not just be a pipe dream. That better life would be underpinned by the values of freedom, fairness, opportunity and diversity and when that government works, then the National Government would collaborate with capable provincial and local governments... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You are not delivering.

Mr T FRY: ...to bring necessary targeted and required services as close to the people as possible. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr T FRY: But, hon Speaker, hon Dugmore speaks about the ANC and them bringing hope. I want to quote from a letter from the now former Comrade Mavuso Msimang, who [Inaudible.] and he said:

"For several years now the ANC has been wrecked by endemic corruption with devastating consequences on the governance of the country and the lives of poor people when they continue to be so many..." [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Do not quote them! [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: He is not poor.

Mr T FRY: I want to quote.

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr T FRY: I want to paraphrase the Star Wars trilogy where Princess Leia said: "Help us Obi-Wan. You're our only hope." On the ground people are telling the DA, "Help us, you are our only hope." [Interjections.] So therefore, hon Speaker, let me close. [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: That is not in the council in Rondebosch.

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr T FRY: Let me close by adding two points. In order for our nation to rise from the ashes of riding the fiscal... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr T FRY: ...we need regime change and that will come in 2024, and number two, capable governments, provincial and local, must be given the necessary powers to deliver commensurate services to the people, thus the Western Cape Powers Bill must be supported and ratified.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: But it is unconstitutional.

Mr T FRY: At this point, hon Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr T FRY: I would like to thank the administration of the Standing Committee on the Premier and Constitutional Matters, especially our procedural officer, Ms Waseemah Kamish-Achmat for the sterling work through this year and especially through this Appropriation Budget. [Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, not only do we support the Vote as the Democratic Alliance, we support the intergovernmental dispute. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Thank you, hon Fry. [Interjections.]
Order, members, order! I now recognise the Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Speaker, and thank you very much to the Leader of the Opposition and the Chair of the Committee for your inputs. I will start first with the hon Fry.

First of all, thank you very much as a Committee Chair for the processes you lead and how you lead the Committee. We really do appreciate it. In your

input, you ask, "what if" and that is a really good question and I enjoyed what you had to say, because of course, I think that is what the citizens of our country are asking, what if and what of? What of the last 30 years and how has it changed the lives of our citizens?

I again referred myself to Monty Python earlier on and of course I think it is exactly like a Monty Python Show if you think about what is happening in the national leadership of the ANC. So what if the ANC get voted out next year in May and I think that is the real question. [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: What if... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: When the ANC get voted out next year in May we will start to see a better life for all and that is the irony.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: What if... [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Hon Speaker, the Chair referred also to this resignation letter, and I want to just quote one part of it that says the ANC is on the verge of losing power. That is the real "what if". The ANC is on the verge of losing power in this country and of course if last night's by-election is anything to go by... [Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: We are not even contesting...

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: If last night's by-election is anything to go by, Speaker...

An HON MEMBER: Where were you? Where were you?

The PREMIER: Those last two seats in the back corner of this House, Speaker, are the two seats that the ANC should be getting their measuring tapes for. I am sure all of these members are brushing up on their on their retirement policies because, quite frankly, there is going to be a different Opposition in this House next year and it is not going to be the ANC.
[Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Where were you? Where were you?

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: I am always willing to take a wager.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, please take your seat. Hon members on both sides of the House, both sides are drowning out the speaker. I am struggling to hear the Premier. Can I please ask you to please allow the Premier to respond, you have all had an opportunity, those on the Speaker's List, to

make their inputs. It is now the Premier's opportunity to respond and it is only correct that the Premier has an opportunity to respond to the inputs made by the speaker.

Hon Premier, you may continue.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I think MEC Meyer is disturbing the...

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Speaker, and if I could respond lastly to that last interjection and the wager which the hon Leader of the Opposition spoke about. I am always happy to take a wager on next year and I have this measuring tape here, and it reminds me of a while ago when I was actually sitting where the hon member sits and I had a meeting with the then Minister of Finance. His name was Garth Strachan in this Province. I remember going to his office with a tape measure and measuring up that office and of course, remember that time, that was as the ANC were losing power here in this province. It is the same feeling for what the ANC are doing at a national level and they are going to lose power in the same way but to help the ANC here at the moment, when I look at this tape measure, kind of the ANC takes about that much space and then I go there, it is going to probably take about that much space after the election, so I think that they should go and have a look at their – they should, Speaker, go and have a look at their retirement plans and of course their pension, their pension funds and I sincerely...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order members!

The PREMIER: I sincerely think that they should actually be worried about their pension funds because - and now I must get to the Leader of the Opposition and his inputs. Even the pension funds of the ANC members who are not going to be returning are under pressure. Why? Because of the ANC themselves and their shocking government or their failure in South Africa even puts their own pension funds at risk and they are not seeing the growth in their pension funds because of their failure.

The hon Leader of the Opposition, hon Dugmore, and he started off in a discussion around hope and talking about this province and the hope that we bring to South Africa versus the ANC, and he used the word he was talking about another programme in the ANC. He said, and the "ANC launched a programme." They are damn good at launching programmes.

You know, there was a time a few months ago where I was asked and in actual fact Minister Bredell went along to again the launch of the Clanwilliam Dam. You know, the Clan William Dam has been launched I think five times now, because in 2007, when they officially launched the expansion of the Clanwilliam Dam and every election after that, they still have further launches. I said I refused to go. I am not going for a big eat, meet and greet; a massive tent, invite everybody, cut a ribbon and launch the Dam. We have done that too many times already. That is the epitome of the

ANC. They launch things. In the DA we do not do that. The DA works so we get things done. We do not launch, we get things done. [Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: What, where?

The PREMIER: The ANC talks about grants and they are all excited about the grants. We talk about jobs and of course you need to have safety nets and grants in an ecosystem.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Oh, of course.

The PREMIER: You need to have them, but it is a transition to a job. They focus on... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: They focus on saying let us get the whole of the economy on grants, no-one in jobs...

The SPEAKER: Order members!

The PREMIER: When are they going to launch a plan that ends youth unemployment? That is what they should do, not a grant system. Jobs, focus on jobs, Mr Speaker... [Interjection.]

In actual fact, what he spoke about in launch and TERS, I saw it last year, the TERS Programme, yesterday, at least one of the people who stole the TERS money, was convicted yesterday with 135, but the money they launched gets stolen by their very own comrades.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: But at least there was a conviction.

The PREMIER: Every time they launch something it is a plan for their own people in their own system to steal the money. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: Speaker, that does not help the citizens one iota and that is exactly why the ANC is failing...

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...it is not millions.

The PREMIER: Then of course the hon Leader of the Opposition spoke about the NHI. [Interjection.] You know, when you read the policy document at the very beginning, it tells you that you have to have a minimum of 3% GDP growth to even think about it, and they then still go ahead like everything that they do, they go ahead despite every single input into this NHI that says it is going to fail like everything else has failed in this country; they keep on doing the same thing over and over again and it continues to fail. This will

fail. Well, of course it is actually not even going to get started, because it will be challenged in court. In actual fact this Government, we will also challenge this... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You are losing taxpayers' money.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: You lose taxpayers' money.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: We will send the President our documentation today to say it must not sign this thing into law, we must challenge it because it is going to fail. It is going to fail the citizens and it would be really good if they decided to use some of the comments... [Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Failing who?

The PREMIER: And put a universal healthcare system...

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Failing who?

The PREMIER: ...which we put forward on the table and that is why we are the province of hope because we show the alternate, we get things done. This province works and it changes people's lives.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: The public hearings in the Western Cape slaughtered the NHI.

The PREMIER: And it is interesting how even within the ANC you start to see ANC people saying: "Oh but hang on a second, why do we not come and try this?" So although Lesufi has not used the correct legislative framework, and that is why Bheki Cele will not give his new project any firearm licences and that is why the Premier of Gauteng says "Bheki Cele, your days are numbered," in a public meeting, because they are having this big fight, but his problem was he was not using the right legislation, but again he is saying: "But hang on a second, let us come and try something different." Now that is the first time I have started to see some change. We need to see more of that, but the ANC has failed. They have lost it.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Stop running away.

The PREMIER: We still hear a State Bank. I think the first thing would be the real test, the real test would be the ANC setting up a State Bank and taking their pension money and putting it into that bank.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: We will do that, do not worry.

The PREMIER: That would be the perfect test because I promise you their pension money would be stolen within days. Within days it would fail. I have

no doubt just like the NHI is going to fail, just like everything the ANC touches fails.

Energy, how many times have they said energy and electricity and loadshedding will end this year. For 15 years they have been saying it every single year, totally failed. In this province, we get things done, we create hope. We got an energy plan that is making a difference and you can feel it in the measurement. We are making a difference. Transnet – oh my goodness!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: City Power is more expensive than Eskom.

The PREMIER: Transnet, unbelievable how it is failing South Africa, every single SOE in this country is failing South Africa. SASSA, the most vulnerable of our citizens, and they cannot get that right. In the NCOP I actually made a suggestion. I think it would be the perfect thing to try, just like putting your pension fund or your pension money into a State-owned bank in this country, it would be stolen within seconds, I think that they should pass a law that says the Minister in charge of SASSA and the administration in charge of SASSA only get their salaries once all the beneficiaries have been paid that amount. How would that work? [Applause.] You would suddenly start seeing people getting paid.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: All of them are paid.

The PREMIER: Jobs, jobs they have failed dismally... [Interjections.] Because we have the highest youth unemployment rate in the world. They cannot get their programmes to work and they cannot turn the economy around. The ANC has failed dismally. Safety, I mean, I listened to the hon Nkondlo and she talks about extortion in her interjection, and I listen to the hon Leader of the Opposition when he talks about Mitchells Plain and he talks about safety and I could see while he was talking about safety in the back of his mind, he has been talking about safety and he was going like, Oh, but the constitutional mandate actually rests with the Minister of Police, the Criminal Justice System and both of those sit at a national level and not at a provincial level, but now he is like trying to drink the Kool-Aid. [Interjection.]

They have failed totally and in policing we have the 20-year high on murder, 27 000 murders last year and Bheki Cele just carries on as if it is not an issue. 27 000 people in this country, he should have fallen on his sword a long time ago, He should have been fired a long time ago.

The deployment of police officers to this province, when I became the Premier there was just under 20 000 officers. We should be 25 000 officers and perhaps even more because of the population growth in this province, but we are sitting at 16 500 officers deployed to this province. Why? Because the ANC does not care. They have failed. They have lost it a long time ago. Health, education, and then they talk about the exchange rate. The exchange rate is a direct reflection of the ability of the National Government to manage

our financial affairs in this country. One of the worst... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I think that we are fixing...

The PREMIER: ...one of the worst debt ratios around, and what happens? It just gets worse. Now instead of making tough choices around the budget, what do they do, they keep driving massive cars. They keep on having lavish events. I went to a police awards event the other evening and the top performing police officers, which have to be recognised. They do an amazing job despite massive pressure, so they get their certificate of recognition. "Thank you so much," a proper reward, but what else do they get? TV sets and microwaves, and what on earth? It is unbelievable. It is like there is no budget problem. There is no tomorrow. It is just... I cannot believe it! It is just like the ANC; they are on the Titanic, *†en dit moer al die pad ondertoe*, [and it plunges all the way to the bottom], and they just do not stop. [Interjections.]

They just keep on doing the same thing and expecting a different outcome. It is not sustainable whatsoever, not sustainable, and of course, the real litmus test was last night where they totally lost an ANC ward to the EFF. [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Where were you? You were absent!

The PREMIER: They totally lost it to the EFF.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Where were you? [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: The EFF are on track to become the official opposition in this province. [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: You cannot speak about something that you were not party to.

The PREMIER: The ANC is going to be relegated to the back door...

The SPEAKER: Order, order members!

Ms R WINDVOGEL: You were not there!

The PREMIER: ...because of one thing.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Do not speak about something that you were not party to.

The PREMIER: They are a total failure, a total failure, everything they touch fails, it does not matter what it is... [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: You were not even contesting. Jirre!

The PREMIER: ...and of course the right thing to do in this country is to vote them out. That is the right thing to do...

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Where were you, Premier? Where were you?

The PREMIER: So what if?

Ms R WINDVOGEL: You were not even contesting!

The PREMIER: What if we vote out the ANC in South Africa, then the Western Cape hope can become the South African hope. I thank you, Speaker.
[Applause.]

Hon members, that concludes the debate on this Vote. I am going to allow a couple of minutes if there are officials from the Department that would like to join.

[Debate concluded.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Where are all the guests that were referred to?

†n AGB LID: Daar sit hulle. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: There they sit.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, the House is not suspended. [Interjections.]
Can I please ask that you maintain the decorum of the House.

An HON MEMBER: You were not part of the process. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Order.

’n AGB LID: Hulle het nie eers probeer *contest* nie. Hulle weet hulle verloor soos hulle inkom. [Onhoorbaar.] [Tussenwerpsels.]

An HON MEMBER: They did not even try to contest. They know they lose as they come in. [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, please, the House is not suspended and I please ask your indulgence for the decorum of the House. Right. Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

Minister, are you ready? Thank you very much, hon members. The Secretary will read the Second Order of the Day.

Die SEKRETARESSE: Debat oor Begrotingspos 11 – Landbou – Wes-Kaapse Aansuiweringsbegrotingswetsontwerp [B7–2023].

The SECRETARY: Debate on the Vote 11 – Agriculture – Western Cape Adjustment Appropriation Bill [B7-2023].

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the Hon Minister, Minister Meyer.

†'n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

†'n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor! [Applous.] [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, hon members, members of the Cabinet, hon leaders of various political parties, [Interjections.] hon members of the Legislature. Hon Speaker, I rise today to table the Western Cape Department of Agriculture's Adjustment Budget for 2023, Vote 11.

Hon Speaker, when I tabled the Main Budget of R960 165 000 on 28 March earlier this year, I highlighted that the agricultural sector inspires hope.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: This was confirmed this week, or rather last week when Stats SA announced the findings of the Agricultural Survey for 2022.

The survey – so this is not hope in abstract terms, this is not hope in hypothetical terms. This is hope in real evidence-based terms and the survey confirms that the Western Cape is responsible for 26% of South Africa and the related industries and employs about - employment contributes 19% of the income generated through sales and goods of services in agriculture.

Why is this significant, Mr Kama, is because South Africa, the Western Cape is 10% of the geographical size, 10% of the population and we box in 26% of that landscape, double the size.

The total income generated from South Africa's agriculture-related services in the country – thank you for all the other provinces – grew by 11% in 2022, having increased from R408 billion to R450 billion in 2022. The Western Cape contribution to that in terms of the service industry is 20%, Mr Kama – hon member Kama, through you, 10% of the size of South Africa, 10% of the population, but we generate agriculture 20% of that.

In 2022 the Western Cape accounted for 26% of the national employment in agriculture and the related services industry, through the hon Speaker, hon member Kama, the Western Cape is 10% of the economy of South Africa, 10% of the population, but when it comes to the employment we generate 26%, double the size of what is expected from us.

Thank you to all the farmers, the agri-workers, the producers, because agri

job numbers grew by 12,4%. The next best province is the Free State.

Today I return to this House, hon Speaker, to place before you an Adjusted Budget and to confirm that agriculture is creating hope. Through the hon Speaker to hon member Kama, hope means “ithemba”, it means higher opportunities for people to excel. We are excelling in this province as the Premier just confirmed. [Interjections.]

I also want to provide you with details, hon Leader of the Official Opposition, [Interjections.] to the adjustments to the Estimates of the Provincial Expenditure of the Western Cape Department of Agriculture.

Hon Speaker, I now table the rollovers from 2022/23. It is about R11,572 million and are allocated as follows:

- R3,744 million towards equipment for the wine cellar. Hon members, hon Speaker, through you to hon member Kama, you will know that 90% of all the wine cellars in South Africa are based in the Western Cape. [Interjections.] Hon member Kama, when you at Christmas celebrate the fruits of the wine and the glass that you raise, please remember that those winemakers studied at Elsenburg, the oldest Agricultural Training College on the African continent. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Do it responsibly.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Do it responsibly [Interjections.], and please support this Budget, the Adjustment Budget, because R3,7 million will go to the wine cellar at Elsenburg so that you can enjoy the fruits of our labour.

- Hon Chair, R943 000 – very important, on a more serious note, Mr Kama, [Interjections.] R943 000 will go towards river protection and hiring of labour for alien clearing, very important. [Interjections.]
- R3,6 million towards the implementation in the update of the agricultural commodity production.
- R1,53 million towards diagnostic tests. Very important to also do an analysis and a testing of the wool and the wool quality and the procurement of office and computer equipment.
- Also for R278 000 towards the procurement of farm equipment and computer equipment. You will know that we have seven research farms, they need some of these equipment.
- R423 000 towards commitments relating to agricultural operating services and the procurement of office and computer equipment.
- R970 000, hon Speaker, towards the procurement and services to conduct training at the college and to purchase some laptops.

- Hon Speaker, revenue retention for 2022/2023 total R6,940 million. It is allocated as follows, and thank you hon – my accounting officer and Mr Floris Huysamer, for the work that you have done because R2 million for the relocation of the refurbishment of the new export office in Roeland Street.

Through you, hon Speaker, to Mr Kama. Mr Kama, you like *inyama*? Now this office is the office for the certification of exports. When you eat that *inyama*, we test it, we certify it that you are healthy, because the Minister of Health and myself make sure it is [Inaudible.], so when you eat *inyama* you must not worry about the safety. This is the Western Cape, a province of hope.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: The *inyama* will be safe, but this Budget you must report. This is the reason because we will now give R2 million for the move and the current office, Export Certification Office, is in Milnerton. We bring it closer to your place of work. It will now be in Roeland Street. I am going to invite Mr Pat Marran so that he can also see that the *inyama* that you eat are safe. That office will be here in Roeland Street.

Mr Pat Marran must support this office and must support this Budget because this office will do meat safety. If he rejects this Budget then I have got a

problem with Mr Kama having his *inyama* for Christmas.

- R3,4 million to provide for student meals and to facilitate the education and training. I think we all support training in this House. Thank you for that.

But, hon Speaker, there are unfortunately unforeseeable and unavoidable expenditure and therefore in this Adjustment Budget R5 million is allocated towards flood damage support.

Hon Speaker, sadly conditional grants will be cut as the Premier has indicated. The National Government has reduced the conditional grants to the Department by R11,065 million. The Chairperson of the Standing Committee, Mr Andricus van der Westhuizen, will speak to that because R9 million will impact directly on the Comprehensive Agricultural Support Grant, targeting Black farmers.

Hon member Pat Marran, every year for five years was asking me about that. There he has got an answer. His Government is cutting the grant for Black farmers.

Reprioritisation, the in-year reduction of budgets meant that the Department had no other option but to reprioritise R47,806 million in its current budget. R15 million had to be aligned to meet current priorities. A further R29,306 million had to be reprioritised towards the improvement of the

condition services, following the unfunded salary increase the National Government has burdened the province with, and her name, hon Speaker, is – I will come to it now. Because she was the Minister of DPSA. Faith Muthambi. She was in charge of this crisis. I am not going to speak about her first name, but I have no faith in this Government led by the ANC.

She caused this crisis, approved salary increases and then not budget for it, not consulting with the National Treasury. The National Treasury was against this. I was in the meeting. They said, "What the hell are you talking about?" and they agreed it cannot happen. There was even a Mandate Committee. The minutes were wrong, but this is the result of people not exercising excellence in Government and now as a result of this we have to reprioritise.

Reprioritisation simply means, in financial terms, take money away from where it is needed the most and reprioritise it, and this is a crisis caused by the National Government, but as hon member Chris Fry said, what if there is a new government in South Africa? All of this is going to stop in the Union Buildings. Where is that measurement? [Interjections.] I need to measure my curtains in the office in the Union Buildings. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, can I remind you to speak to me.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Oh, sorry. Sorry, Chief Whip. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You always play, you are not serious.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order, hon members.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: The Premier has asked me which office I want. Room 303 in the Union Buildings.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Chair, hon member Bakubaku-Vos, [Interjections.] I will conclude because I think you got irritated by the fact that we are the new Government in waiting.

So I conclude, hon Speaker. Despite the budget cuts I have full confidence in the Department of Agriculture, led by an able, competent, excellent Head of my Department, Dr Mogale Sebopetsa ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... excellent senior managers ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... excellent CFO ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... to continue to deliver high quality service to the agricultural sector of the Western Cape. The quality of those services was demonstrated by the recent report on the quality of the post-settlement support and land reform received by the Western Cape Department of Agriculture and we have on record Thoko Didiza, the National Minister, the hon Minister confirmed that in terms of land reform projected by the ANC Government has a 90% failure.

Independent evaluation done by this Department has now confirmed on record, independent, 83% success rate of land reform. Mr Peter De Villiers, 80 – Mr Peter de Villiers, for your attention – okay. You write a letter to Patricia de Lille, but 83% success rate for land reform. 90% failure rate of the ANC. That speaks to itself. Our farmers, our producers and our agri-workers are resilient.

So let me conclude in the words of Bruce Whitfield. He said:

"Thank God for farmers."

I want to add thank God to agri-workers. I want to add thank you to producers and I want to add thank you to rural communities.

Hon Speaker, I now table the Department of Agriculture's 2023 Adjusted Budget of R954 125 million for consideration and debate in this House. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise the hon member Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Thanks, hon Speaker, and good morning to the Premier, good mornings to the MECs.

So when the MEC spoke about Phuhlisani Solutions in the independent report that they made available and the 83% of success rate, you did not speak about the number of farms where the research have been done. You have not spoken about that, and also you did not say or tell us that on all those farms that you have done the research, it is [Inaudible.] farms, a national programme.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly.

Mr P MARRAN: You did not tell us that. [Interjections.]

You did not tell us about the more than 200 farmers that were not part of that research, that would have contributed to the failure of success, and the support that you are giving is PSS, post-settlement support. You are absent

when it comes to pre-settlement support. You are not there. You choose not to be there.

You spoke about the budget for the future. Whose future? I came to you, MEC – hon Speaker, through you – in this House and informed you about Voëlvlei. A farmer that have cut the electricity of farmworkers, even cut their water, and up until today you were not there. You were not there.

In 2019, for instance, when a Smit farmer in Stellenbosch were killed, and today we know that his wife has been charged, no other person, his wife and an investigator, police officer, have been charged. [Interjections.] You set up a committee that have to deal with that particular issues.

A young boy were killed in Matzikama not so long ago. We have not heard you spoke about that. We have not seen you go to court and oppose bail ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Exactly.

Mr P MARRAN: ... for a farmer that have killed a young boy, and you spoke about a future. A future for who? [Interjections.]

You spoke about and you have compared government, the percentages national, but when we ask you about how many land in the hands of Black farmers in this province, you tell us in this House you do not know.

When we ask you, when you spoke about the percentages of exports through this province, out of this province, we ask you how many Black farmers have contributed to that? You tell us you do not know. [Interjections.]

The hon ...[intervenes]

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Jy gee nie om nie.
[Tussenwerpsels.]

[The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: You do not care.] [Interjections.]

Mr P MARRAN: ... member Baartman has spoken about title deeds and the ANC taking away title deeds of these farmers. When Casidra bought implements for farmers it got registered in the name of Casidra, not in those farms, of those farmers, and you should tell us why.

When people of Amalienstein and Waaikraal ask for the title deeds of those particular farms that you are managing, you tell us you are not ready to hand over those title deeds to those people.

So you tell us then, [Interjections.] so when we spoke about the future, whose future? [Interjections.] But all the monies made by the agricultural sector in this province, billions of rands, as a senior leader of the ANC, in your manifesto and in your economic policy, you tell us they are only worth R1 800 a month for more than 200 hours of work.

So whose future are we talking about when you speak about the future? I really do not know. [Interjections.]

The City of Cape Town and eight officials are appearing in court because of R1 billion that have disappeared, hon Premier.

An HON MEMBER: When?

Mr P MARRAN: Whose future has been taken away? No, this is Human Settlements. [Interjections.] Whose future has been taken away? The DA Government and the City of Cape Town cannot account for a billion rand that has disappeared.

You spoke about the hon member Van der Westhuizen will come and speak afterwards.

An HON MEMBER: Province of hope.

Mr P MARRAN: The hon member Van der Westhuizen has been called a land thief by the Stellenbosch Municipality. [Interjections.] So he does not have the standing and comes here and speaks on behalf of the people of the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly.

Mr P MARRAN: So when we speak about a future, [Interjections.] whose future? [Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, I rise today on behalf of the African National Congress to decline support for the proposed Budget Adjustments for the Western Cape for the Department of Agriculture.

Hon Speaker, the MEC during the Medium-Term Budget spoke about a budget for the future and indeed the results of this budget speak about the future of the rich versus those who are poor. In debating the Adjustment Budget, the ANC contends that the disconcerting trend has emerged where funds allocated for compensation of employees' welfare are being diverted to other programmes.

This redirections not only raise concerns about the equitable distribution of resources, but also undermines the agreed upon commitment to prioritise the well-being of workers. This far the Department has shifted funds to approximately R11,6 million in compensation of employees.

The objection, I think, intensifies as those responsible for relocation, these [Inaudible.] has paradoxically opposed a Workers Wage Agreement, claiming that they are on the back foot with R1,1 billion. A billion that has been stolen by the City of Cape Town where eight officials are appearing in court. That is the billion that we are talking about.

The resource to an inter-governmental dispute with the National Government further exacerbates the situation, creating an unsettling precedent of disregarding the very workforce that propels the nation's progress. The Department went on to further reduce the EPWP programme to R235 000. A programme that was very instrumental in bringing or cushioning the unemployment, unemployed.

This reduction comes after the Annual Budget where it was held that the short to medium period, 1 000 green jobs will be created for EPWP. These steps by the DA-led Government display an unwarranted attack on the working class while there is always a demand from the DA-led Government to National to give them more money [Interjections.] and more money and more money, which is why they pride themselves that they just want more money and not utilise that for the benefit of the people or even seeing the results on the ground, not paperwork.

The National Grant Funding has been reduced by R9,6 million meant to relieve the poverty and support people of out of poverty and support infrastructure development. The ANC is deeply troubled by the widening scope of funds reallocation with the Adjustment Budget beyond the initial concern for employee welfare.

It has come to the light that funds earmarked for educational bursaries are also being redirected. This redirection raises alarming questions about the

Government's commitment to investing in the future of its citizens. The Department has shifted funds to the value of R2,8 million without impunity for those meant to benefit from this. Not investing in them will bring challenges as the Department's [Inaudible.] and I quote:

"Capacity remains [Inaudible.] sustainable resource use and management as engineering professionals remain in demand."

Instead of supporting the education and advancement of students for bursaries, these funds are now allocated for the repayment of TV licences, maintenance and equipment, and the purchase of laptops and software upgrades.

During the Annual Budget the MEC spoke about 569 resident students in the 2023 academic year and was only able to distribute 109 bursaries while at the same time they are cutting.

Hon Speaker, the ANC urges that such decisions ...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Marran, your time has expired. Please conclude.

Mr P MARRAN: ... pillars, an inclusive and equitable society diverting crucial resources away from education, a cornerstone of the national development. Hon Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Speaker, ...[Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired. Please take your seat.

Mr P MARRAN: ... by saying we cannot support...

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat, hon member Marran. Your time ...[Interjections.] Thank you very much, hon member Marran, your time has expired. [Applause.] [Interjections.] Thank you very much, hon member Marran.

Hon members, the next hon member is on the hybrid system and I please ask for your indulgence. I recognise the hon member Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the aim of this Department is said to enhance the economic, ecological and social wealth of all in the Western Cape.

However, the reality is that whilst the Constitution of this country does not empower Provincial Governments with land redistribution powers as they are obviously exclusively reserved for National Government, there is absolutely nothing stopping this Provincial Government from leasing its own

agricultural land to emerging African and Coloured farmers to achieve its aim of enhancing social wealth for all the people in the Western Cape, irrespective of race, hon Speaker, and needless to say, that for this to happen it must be spearheaded by the Provincial Minister of Agriculture in the Western Cape.

It is shocking that the Department's budget was cut by more than R6 million, which is money that could have been directed to people in different communities who are engaged in food gardens, for both subsistence and commercial gain. This would have gone a long way, hon Speaker, in alleviating the effects of poverty, unemployment and food security and could have been used to upskill people involved in food gardens, so that later when this DA Provincial Government comes to its senses then they can lease agricultural land to upskilled individuals in the agricultural sector, who will hit the ground running in producing agricultural goods, while also creating job opportunities in the process.

Hon Speaker, it is a sad reality that the majority of poor communities clean up dumping sites and then convert them into food gardens, but they still do not receive assistance from this Provincial Department of Agriculture, which is only concerned about White and rich farm owners, especially in the winery industry, but let me conclude, hon Speaker, but reminding the Minister that the Provincial Government's 2021 study found that food insecurity in this province affected up to 53% of African and 41% of Coloured households, and most of those households were led by women. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Cassiem.

Hon members, the next speaker is also on the hybrid system. I recognise the hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, we must stop moaning and start encouraging each other. The moans will not grow the economy, futuristic thinking will, and I think we must stop looking at Europe and look to Africa for some solutions.

First of all I support this Budget, I will vote for it. We must look at the Ivory Coast, we must look at the Gulf of Guinea and see what they have done. How do they feed their people and how do they empower small farmers. Most of the forests in these countries have been destroyed to the detriment of snails because it was deforestation that caused the snails to disappear, and what have they done? They did not sit in one corner and cry. 1 500 small new snail farmers have emerged in the Ivory Coast ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Marais, your time has expired. Please conclude. [Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: I want the Minister to look at how small snail farmers can benefit in terms of producing more jobs and empowering them and also

feeding them.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Marais, your time has expired.

Mr P J MARAIS: Wow.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise the hon member Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Speaker, colleagues and a warm welcome to the senior officials from the Department of Agriculture.

By this time it will come as no surprise to this House to hear that the Budget of the Department of Agriculture had to be cut. We all know that the ANC Government and particularly Government-owned Entities, such as Transnet, have failed us miserably.

South Africa is a country that is richly endowed with minerals, with a large percentage of our population of working age, with a good financial system, everything that is needed for a thriving economy. What is more, the world wants to do business with South Africa, but China can only buy our iron and ore if Transnet can bring this to the harbours. Europe and America can only buy our fresh produce if we can export it through our container terminals, and Africa can only buy our processed foods and manufactured items if we

allow it to move smoothly through our border posts, but we unfortunately just need to look at the economic statistics of the third quarter of this year that were released earlier, to see what an unreliable electricity supply does to the ability to produce goods, including agricultural goods, and especially processed agricultural products and manufactured items.

What a shame on this ANC Government that have managed our economy into negative growth figures, but may I remind the House, and Premier referred to it earlier, that this lack of electricity has been ongoing for more than 15 years. That we are sitting with an ANC Government that has, in the words of former President Mbeki, failed to plan, implement and invest in adequate electricity generation capacity.

May I remind this House that if it was not for loadshedding, for poor policing, for the failed investment and related policies of the ANC, that this country would have thrived economically and that ironically the demand for electricity in such a case would have been much, much higher than what we are seeing now, and still the Central Government is sitting on its hands. It could and it should have done a lot more to encourage South Africans to invest, particularly in renewable energy.

South Africa once boasted a strong and resilient economy, but while I was preparing for this debate, our President was complaining and begging for money at COP 28. What a shame.

So the ANC ruined our infrastructure, [Interjections.] the ANC then ruined the economy. [Interjections.] They even deliberately ruined SARS because the Revenue Service expected some of the ANC's corrupt buddies and politicians with dubious sources of income to start paying taxes on that income, and now we are sitting on the edge of a fiscal cliff. Now we are in a situation where budgets have to be cut, where posts have to be left unfunded and unfilled. [Interjections.]

Where the ANC is in charge they just ignore budgets and they stop payments to providers such as Eskom and Rand Water and others, [Interjections.] and they cut back on maintenance. I invite you, hon members, just travel to other provinces and go and look for yourself at the condition of particularly the secondary roads, and we all know that agricultural products need good roads to get to the markets.

Just go and speak to fellow South Africans whose taps run dry often for weeks on end. Where households hope that their refuse will be removed, not weekly, but where they are happy if it gets removed at least once a month ...[intervenes]

An HON MEMBER: Like in Matzikama.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ... and I am not referring to the rural areas or small rural municipalities. I am speaking from the personal experience of close family members staying in Mangaung.

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: [Onhoorbaar.] die Voortrekkers [Onhoorbaar.]

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.] the Voortrekkers] [Inaudible.]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Mr Speaker, let me interrupt myself. [Interjections.] This once beautiful city, Mangaung, was once known as † “die Rosestad” [the City of Roses]. Its official name was Bloemfontein, which, if translated from the old Dutch [Interjections.] into English, Flower Fountain. Well, the ANC knew that under their rule the flowers would soon all be gone. [Interjections.] Indeed one could ask where have all the flowers gone? In an ironic twist the ANC changed the name from Bloemfontein into Mangaung ...[intervenes]

An HON MEMBER: So?

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ... which is a Sesotho word for "predators", for the cheetahs.

So ...[intervenes]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: The cheetah.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ... under the ANC [Interjections.] this

Metro has indeed become the feeding ground of ANC predators. [Interjections.] What an apt name change, especially if we think of the charges against previous ANC leaders, such as Ace Magashule and his cronies, the Guptas. Now with such predators as leaders ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Van der Westhuizen ...[Interjections.]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ... how can you grow the economy?

The SPEAKER: ... please take your seat. Hon member Dugmore, is that a point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Yes. My point of order is, hon Speaker, whether the hon member Van der Westhuizen is prepared to accept a question?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, I will ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: About the Voortrekker ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, that is – you cannot pose your question. Hon member Van der Westhuizen, are you prepared to take a question? [Interjections.]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: No, hon Chair. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, hon member Van der Westhuizen is not prepared to take a question. Hon member Van der Westhuizen, please take your seat.

An HON MEMBER: He would not. Definitely he would not.

Mr M KAMA: No, thank you ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Van der Westhuizen, please take your seat. Hon member Kama, I have not yet recognised you. I will now recognise you. What is your point of order?

Mr M KAMA: No, thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, I just wanted to ascertain whether hon member is not contravention of Rule 50? Because I think he is addressing us from hon member Bosman's seat, when the Rules are saying he should be addressing us from his seat ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon member Bosman is sitting in his seat.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Kama, that [Interjections.] – hon member

Kama, thank you very much. Hon members, that is in fact the Rule, but the hon member is in fact addressing the Chair from his bench. [Interjections.] So that is not a point of order.

Hon member Dugmore – hon member Van der Westhuizen, you may continue. [Interjections.]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, hon Chair. It clearly is getting under the skin of the Opposition.

Now with such predators as leaders, how can we hope to grow the economy of this country? How can we create jobs? And how, in the sense of agriculture, can you farm productively? Go and speak to farmers that have to irrigate with sewerage in their water. Go and speak to farmers that want to protect their animals against diseases, such as foot-and-mouth disease, and that are unable to access animal vaccines. Go and speak to farmers that now need to appoint their own security companies because the South African Police Service, a national competency, has lost its ability to apprehend stock thieves, copper thieves and worse, murderers.

An HON MEMBER: And land thieves.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: The list is long.

It is against this background that the Western Cape Department of

Agriculture must assist our farmers to produce more food for a growing nation, and how well are the Western Cape farmers not doing.

†Agb Speaker, die Nasionale Regering gebruik dikwels Provinsiale Regerings om hulle planne te implementeer, en ons gee nie om om daardie dienste namens die Nasionale Regering te hanteer nie, solank daar aan sekere vereistes voldoen word. Solank ons weet dat daar 'n gereelde oordrag van fondse gaan wees. Solank ons weet dat daar genoeg tyd gaan wees om die implementeringsplanne gereed te kry en om die geld sinvol te kan spandeer, en ons doen dit graag omdat ons weet dat sekere planne net eenvoudig beter op plaaslike vlak geïmplementeer word as wat dit uit Pretoria uit gepoog word om daardie planne te realiseer.

In hierdie verband verwys ek na die Regering se plig om byvoorbeeld grondhervorming te befonds en te bestuur, en die bestaande skemas, en die agb sprekers voor my het daarna verwys, staan in bekend in die omgang as CASP en Ilima/Letsema.

Nou hierdie programme is daar om die eienaarskap in ons land, en in ons provinsie spesifiek ook, te verbeter, en die Leier van die Opposisie het vroeër in die week ook daarna verwys, dat ons steeds sit met 'n skewe eienaarskap van grond in Suid-Afrika.

Toe die Grondwet van Suid-Afrika 30 jaar gelede onderhandel was, is dit as 'n groot probleem uitgewys en daar was op die Nasionale Regering die

verpligting geplaas om grondhervormingsplanne in te stel, maar wat het gebeur? Die CASP en Ilima/Letsema begrotings van opkomende boere krimp elke jaar. Ook in hierdie begrotingsjaar.

Die begroting om grond aan te koop vir grondhervorming raak al hoe kleiner. Waarskynlik omdat – en die Minister het daarna verwys – hierdie skemas in ander provinsies 'n volslae flop is, maar boerdery, weet ons, is 'n uiters riskante aktiwiteit. Daarom dat ons regtig trots is op die hoë sukseskoers van opkomende boere in die Wes-Kaap, en landbougrond in die Wes-Kaap, weet ons, is van die duurste landbougrond wat daar in hierdie land beskikbaar is.

[Hon Speaker, the National Government often uses Provincial Governments to implement their plans, and we do not mind handling those services on behalf of the National Government, as long as certain requirements are adhered to. As long as we know there is going to be a regular transfer of funds. As long as we know that there will be enough time to get the implementation plans ready and to spend the money sensibly, and we gladly do it because we know that certain plans are simply implemented better at local level than when it is attempted from Pretoria to realise those plans.

In this regard I refer to the Government's obligation to for example fund and manage land reform, and the existing schemes, and the hon speakers before me referred to that, are generally known as CASP and Ilima/Letsema.

Now these programmes are there to improve the ownership in our country and in our province, specifically too, and the Leader of the Opposition earlier

also referred to that, that we are still sitting with a skew ownership of land in South Africa.

When the Constitution of South Africa was negotiated 30 years ago, it was pointed out as a major problem and an obligation was placed upon the National Government to introduce land reform plans, but what happened? The CASP and Ilima/Letsema budgets of emerging farmers are shrinking every year. Also in this budget year.

The budget to buy land for land reform is becoming less and less. Probably because – and the Minister referred to that – these schemes are a total flop in other provinces, but farming, we know, is an extremely risky activity. Therefore we are genuinely proud of the high success rate of emerging farmers in the Western Cape, and agricultural land in the Western Cape, we know, is some of the most expensive agricultural land that is available in this country.]

An HON MEMBER: Inflated.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Mens sou dus redelikerwys kon verwag dat die Sentrale Regering se begroting vir grondhervorming vir die Wes-Kaap veel groter sou wees as dié vir ander provinsies, maar nee, in plaas daarvan dat die Wes-Kaap se begroting vir sulke inisiatiewe verhoog word, krimp dit, en dan het die Leier van die Opposisie nog die vermetelheid om ons as Provinsiale Regering te wil kritiseer vir iets waarvoor die Nasionale Regering

verantwoordelik is. Dit is hulle wat verantwoordelik is vir die trae pas van grondhervorming.

Pleks daarvan dat hy sy eie partygenote hieroor aanspreek. Pleks daarvan dat hy dit by die konferensies van die ANC opper en hulle op hulle skandes wys, en vir ons help om meer geld na die Wes-Kaap te kanaliseer vir spesifiek grondhervorming.

Die agb lid Marran verwys na die plase Waaikraal en Amalienstein, en ek wens hy wil teruggaan en gaan kyk wat was die geskiedenis van hoe dat daardie plase in die besit van die Provinsiale Regering gekom het. Hierdie plase is beide geleë in gebiede wat aan ernstige droogtes onderhewig is. Wat ernstige hulp nodig het net om aan die klompie plaaswerkers wat daar alreeds is, aan hulle 'n voltydse werk en 'n volhoubare werk te kan voorsien, [Tussenwerpsels.] maar wat wil hierdie ANC lid doen? Agb Speaker, hy wil 'n verliesmakende plaas aan 'n arm gemeenskap gaan oorhandig en dit dan hulle mislukking uiteindelik maak. Die DA in die Wes-Kaap werk nie so nie. Ons gee die bal vir hulle net [Tussenwerpsels.] as hulle 'n sukses daarvan kan maak.

Nou die agb lid Marran is goed bekend met rugby. In rugby is daar die term van 'n *hospital pass*. Hy wil aan Waaikraal en aan Amalienstein se mense 'n *hospital pass* gee, en hy skaam hom nie om dit hier in hierdie Parlement voor te stel nie.

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: One would therefore reasonably expect

that the Central Government's budget for land reform in the Western Cape would be much higher than that for the other provinces, but no, instead of increasing the Western Cape's budget for such initiatives, it shrinks, and then the Leader of the Opposition had the audacity to criticise us as Provincial Government for something the National Government is responsible. It is they who are responsible for the slow pace of land reform.

Instead of admonishing his own party colleagues about this. Instead of raising it at the conferences of the ANC and pointing out their scandals, and help us to channel more money to the Western Cape for specifically land reform.

The hon member Marran refers to the farms Waaikraal and Amalienstein, and I wish he would go back and see what the history was of how those farms came into the possession of the Provincial Government. These farms are both situated in areas subject to serious droughts. That requires serious support to just provide a fulltime job and sustainable work to the few farmworkers who are already there, [Interjections.] but what does this ANC member want to do? Hon Speaker, he wants to hand over a farm, making a loss, to a poor community and then eventually make it their failure. The DA in the Western Cape does not work like that. We pass the ball only [Interjections.] if they can be successful.

Now the hon member Marran is very familiar with rugby. In rugby there is a term of a "hospital pass". He wants to give the people of Waaikraal and

Amalienstein a "hospital pass", and he is not even ashamed to propose that in this Parliament.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: But for how many years has this been going on?

An HON MEMBER: Exactly.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Oor die afgelope aantal jare het ons talle voorbeelde gesien waar die Provinsiale Regering moes ingryp waar nasionale departemente gefaal het. Ek verwys byvoorbeeld na die sprinkaanplae wat al die jare, en ingevolge wetgewing is hierdie natuurrampe die verantwoordelikheid van die Nasionale Regering, maar wat het ons gesien? Die Nasionale Regering het nie die toerusting nie, hulle het nie die nodige chemikalieë nie en uiteindelik was dit die Wes-Kaap wat moes inspring om ons boere te beskerm teen hierdie sprinkaanplae.

Agb Speaker, in die Wes-Kaap doen ons dinge anders, en al gaan dit hoe moeilik met ons finansies, belê ons steeds in die opleiding van ons jongmense. Die Minister het verwys na Elsenburg en die belangrike werk wat daar gedoen word, veral in terme van wingerdbou, wynmaak en hierdie goed wat spesifiek in die Wes-Kaap vir ons belangrik is, maar voordat ek voortgaan om te sê hoedat ons 'n krimpemde begroting anders benader, kom ons kyk net hoe gaan dit by ander provinsies se landboukolleges.

Tot ons skaamte moes ons sien hoedat by 'n landboukollege in Noord-Wes Provinsie die diere, wat veronderstel is modelboerdery-diere te wees, van die honger en die dors vrek. Dit is nou 'n plek waar jy juis op goeie boerderypraktyke 'n voorbeeld wil stel. Hoe kan jy jongmense oplei om vir diere te sorg wanneer daai diere besig is om van honger en dors om te kom?

Dit is nie net die ANC Provinsiale Regering wat nie hulle verskaffers kan betaal nie, dit is ook die ANC as party wat nie hulle verskaffers kan betaal nie, maar om terug te kom na Begrotingspos 11.

Van my kant wil ek sê te midde van hierdie beperkende ekonomiese omstandighede, baie dankie aan die Provinsiale Tesourie. Baie dankie aan Minister Wenger wat daarin geslaag het om maar 'n baie klein snit op die Landboubegroting toe te pas. Die Wes-Kaap is die provinsie van hoop. Hoop vir die toekoms, hoop vir ons jongmense.

Hier word nie korttermyn gedink nie. Hier word geld gespandeer met die langtermyn-toekoms in gedagte, en daarom glo ons daarin om in die jeug en in die toekoms te belê. Ten spyte van die gedwonge inkrimping van begrotings stel hierdie Aansuiweringsbegroting voor dat die Wes-Kaap se bydrae tot die opleiding van jongmense met 16% verhoog word. Wys vir my 'n ander provinsiale regering wat so langtermyn dink en beplan. Wys vir my nog 'n politieke party wat met raad en daad illustreer dat dit die waarde van kennis en kennisoordrag besef. Wat besef dat ons in die jeug, ons toekoms, moet belê.

In die Komitee se verslag sal u sien dat die ANC sy teenstem teen hierdie ekstra fondse vir die jeug laat notuleer het. U sal ook sien dat die ANC en ander Opposisiepartye stil is oor hoe hulle reken hierdie Begroting enigsins beter saamgestel moes word. Daar was geen alternatiewe begroting aan ons voorgelê deur die Opposisie nie.

Agb Voorsitter, daarom kan ek hierdie Huis met trots meedeel dat die Staande Komitee op Landbou, Omgewingsake en Ontwikkelingsbeplanning met 'n meerderheid van stemme by hierdie Huis heelhartig aanbeveel om die Begroting soos voorgelê, goed te keur. Ek dank u.

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Over the past few years we have seen several examples where the Provincial Government had to intervene where national departments had failed. I am referring for example to the locust plagues occurring for years, and in terms of legislation these natural disasters are the responsibility of the National Government, but what have we seen? The National Government does not have the equipment, they do not have the necessary chemicals and in the end it was the Western Cape that had to intervene to protect our farmers against these locust plagues.

Hon Speaker, but in the Western Cape we do things differently, and even if our finances are very difficult, we still invest in the training of our youth. The Minister referred to Elsenburg and the important work that is being done there, especially in terms of viticulture, winemaking and these things that are important to us specifically in the Western Cape, but before I continue to say

how we approach a shrinking budget differently, let us just have a look at how things are going at other provinces' agricultural colleges.

To our shame we had to see how at an agricultural college in North West Province the animals, that are supposed to be model farming animals, die of hunger and thirst. This is now a place where you actually want to set an example of good agricultural practices. How can you train the youth to care for animals when those animals are dying of hunger and thirst?

It is not only the ANC Provincial Government that cannot pay their suppliers, it is also the ANC as party that cannot pay its suppliers, but to get back to Vote 11.

From my side I want to say that in the midst of these limiting economic circumstances, thank you to the Provincial Treasury. Thank you to Minister Wenger who has succeeded in applying only a small cut on the Agriculture budget. The Western Cape is the province of hope. And hope for the future, hope for our youth.

Here we are not thinking in the short term. Here money is spent with the long-term future in mind, and therefore we believe to invest in the youth and in the future. In spite of the necessary shrinking of budgets, this Adjustment Budget proposes that the Western Cape's contribution to the training of the youth be increased by 16%. Show me another Provincial Government that is thinking and planning in such long-term. Show me another political party

that illustrates with word and deed that it realises the value of knowledge and transfer of knowledge. That realises that we have to invest in the youth, our future.

In the Committee's Report you will see that the ANC's recorded its vote against these extra funds. You will also see that the ANC and other Opposition parties are quiet about how they believe this Budget could have been drawn up in any way. There was no alternative budget put forward to us by the Opposition.

Hon Chairman, therefore I can inform this House with pride that the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning wholeheartedly proposes with a majority of votes to the House to approve the Budget as tabled. I thank you.]

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie, agb lid Van der Westhuizen.
[Tussenwerpsels.]

[The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Van der Westhuizen.]
[Interjections.] I recognise the hon Minister, Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker.

To hon member Marran, land reform study confirms 63% has been successful you know that rate in the National Government; the population size was 137, the sample was 84, which is a 61% success rate in terms of that population

size. You also know that land reform, these are farmers on Ellerad and plus farms. We do not buy land. This is the mandate of the National Government. We are only going to do ...[Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Because you failed.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: We are only going to do things that are legal. We are the only province with a strategy for farmer support and commodity approach, hon Speaker, and the EPWP that they refer to, is a grant from National and we do not affect these particular cuts.

Hon member Cassiem, land acquisition. We have legal counsel, we investigated this opportunity that you raised, but our legal counsel has indicated that we cannot go there. PALS is a great platform. The partnership in agriculture land solutions. In terms of food gardens that you mentioned, [Interjections.] we have delivered more than 3 000 food gardens through our One Home One Garden Project. The evidence indicated, hon member Cassiem, through the independent evaluation, the research that was done, we assessed it and that assessment has indicated, the evaluation, that 75% of our food gardens are productive and contribute to food security. So there is an independent evaluation which we believe in terms of data-led in evidence-based governance.

Hon member Marais, thank you for supporting the Budget. You seems to be the only person on that side of the House that understands the importance of

food security and the important role that agriculture plays.

Hon member Van der Westhuizen, thank you for an excellent speech. I always listen attentively and in depth to your debate [Interjections.] because your research is not only from the book, but also from practical work that you have seen as part of your oversight visit, and hon member Van der Westhuizen indicated that his focus is on long-term focus and investment in the future of the youth.

So I want to thank the hon member for that, but, hon members, I listened to the Premier speaking here and I listened to the hon members in this House, and during the course of this week members of this side of the House were in support of the NHI, the National Health Insurance. It pains me deeply because we know what is happening at Baragwanath Hospital, but, hon Speaker, hon members on this side of the House they are all members of Parmed, but it seems now that they have abandoned Parmed. Hon member Kama you are now abandoning Parmed for NHI. This is your new ANC medical aid card ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: I was waiting for [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... and so this is your card. You must now write to the Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: I was waiting for this theatrics.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: You must now write to the Speaker and say, "I hand over my Parmed medical aid card. I am no longer a member of Parmed because I want NHI." There are 14 cards here, 14 members, but there is one, because I do not know where Al Jama-ah is standing. I also included their card. They must write at the end of today in this House, [Interjections.] they must now write to you, hon Speaker, [Interjections.] because you are the employer and Parmed is a condition of service, and they must now indicate to you that they [Interjections.] – at the end of today I am going to phone your office, hon Speaker, because if you no longer want to join and be part of Parmed, you made your choice, you want NHI, which means your Parmed card is now no longer valid, and because it is no longer valid we are now, [Interjections.] hon Chair, putting the Parmed medical aid of these [Interjections.] members in the bin, because they have chosen NHI, which is a death warrant, and I am sad. I do not want my colleagues to die, but they made that choice. Kama, you are going to end up in Baragwanath Hospital because you ...[Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... reject the choice that you have, [Interjections.] universal healthcare by an excellent Minister of Health in this province.

An HON MEMBER: This is becoming [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: You chose a different route, but you can still make a choice. You can make a declaration today in the House. [Interjections.] A new declaration can say, "I reject NHI. I accept universal healthcare," and this Minister can save your life. [Interjections.] That is the choice. † Knip op jou kaart, [Cut up your card] [Interjections.] and if you want proper healthcare, you made a choice, but we love you, Mr Kama.

An HON MEMBER: NHI is the way [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: NHI is your ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... is your death insurance.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon member Marran, is that a point of order?

Mr P MARRAN: It was supposed to be a point of order, hon Speaker, because the MEC have switched on all the lights, [Interjections.] but it has been switched off now. So ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I do not – I just want to correct that.

That is not the MEC that switched it on. I think that that was done from the Table.

Can I please remind the Minister, Minister, you can only make your contribution from your bench.

An HON MEMBER: Yes. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, I accept your ruling, I apologise, [Interjections.] but any member of the staff in the Legislature working here, please raise your voice against NHI because we love you, we do not want to see you die in Baragwanath Hospital where patients today are lying in blood because NHI is failure, but, hon members, the Deputy Chief Whip gave me something very powerful.

She gave me a measurement because hon member Christopher Fry asked what if. If we had a new Government I think the first thing we need to do, because they have stolen the curtains ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... in the Union Buildings [Interjections.] and I am on my way to the Union Buildings ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE; ... but I have already measured the size of the windows ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... and the curtains, [Interjections.] but this is not curtains that we are going to buy. Some of the members in this side of the House, like hon member Dan Plato, he has some extra curtains. I will amend it and not buy curtains because there is no money left in the budget.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: So we will now reuse the old curtains of hon member Dan Plato, but we need – what if, Mr Kama, is now becoming a reality and I can see hon member Peter Marais, former Premier of this province, he understands the importance ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... of measuring correctly ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... because the trains that your Government ordered were measured incorrectly. [Interjections.] They did not know whether the trains can go. This side of the House we measure. This is why the Deputy Chief Whip ...[intervenes]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Measure twice.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... measure twice ...[intervenes]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Cut once.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... cut once. It is said in the schools.

On a serious note, hon Speaker, I want to thank the hon members who support this Budget because this is a budget that you will feel this afternoon when you have lunch. This, you will see, Mr Kama, the size of the *inyama* will become smaller. There will be Karoo lamb, but it will be smaller as a result of the Budget cut. Do not ask your family, "Why is my meal so small." It is the effect of the Budget cuts. It is real. [Interjections.]

If you look at the hair of my HOD, if you look at the hair of hon member Pat Marran, and if you look at my own hair, it is a testimony of things to come.

The Budget cuts are deep.

Hon Speaker, I conclude by thanking my new CFO, outstanding, brilliant, exceptional, meet the requirements of excellence, but I want to thank her former Minister, Minister Reagen Allen, that released her. Ms Govender, Linde Govender, I would like her to please stand.

Thank you for joining an exceptional department. We are looking forward to work closely with you. You are now inheriting a budget that has been cut deeply. We rely on your exceptional budgetary skills to assist us because I have developed a governance framework that says a budget has three dimensions.

Firstly it has a normative dimension. That is the guidance from the Premier and the guidance we get from the Minister of Finance. Secondly it is a technical dimension and we rely on your technical skills to assist the HOD and myself moving through difficult times, but also a budget, very important, is a political dimension and the politics of this Government is for an open opportunity society based on the values of freedom, fairness and opportunity and fundamental is the issue of redress that has been raised here. We wish you a very happy and a successful term. The air in Elsenburg is much more fresh, so you will be much more healthy, and we wish you very happiness in a very excellent department.

This Cabinet, under the leadership of the Premier, approved your appointment

and we want to thank you for stepping in the shoes of also a great CFO, Mr Floris Huysamer. I thank the House. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister.

Hon members, that concludes the debate on this Vote. The Secretary will read the Third Order of the Day, but before the Secretary does that, I am going to allow the officials to leave, and if there are – the officials from Infrastructure, if they are joining. Minister, can you just give me an indication?

Alright. Hon members, I ask for your indulgence.

The SPEAKER: Hon Marran, is that a point of order? Hon Marran, is that a point of order? [Interjections.] You may rise your point. Hon members, please. [Interjections.] Hon members, order. [Interjections.] Thank you very much, hon members. The Secretary will read the Third Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 10 – Infrastructure – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, I recognise the hon Minister of Infrastructure, hon Minister Simmers.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Premier, members of the Cabinet, hon members of this House, also guests in the gallery and also, who are logged in virtually. Hon Speaker:

“Where ignorance is our master, there is no possibility of real peace.”

Close quote. That is the Dalai Lama.

Earlier this year I tabled my Department’s inaugural Budget Vote, and it was themed “Building the New Hope”. Our record of delivery will indicate that we have indeed kept true to this theme.

However, as indicated in the quote from the Dalai Lama, today’s Adjustment Budget Vote, or should I rather say budget cuts, is mainly driven by sheer ignorance of the highest order by the ANC National Government. Due to years of carrying deadwood, exorbitant bailouts of State-Owned Entities, with negative returns year on year, the chickens are now coming home to roost. Further, we have been stifled by the continued daily loadshedding experiences, despite the large amounts of funds that have gone into Eskom since 2008, in response to a worsening financial position.

Hon Speaker, in economics we are told of the circular flow of income in an economy which is the flow of production, and this is where manufacturers produce goods and for that, they employ citizens or people. This ultimately leads to income which through this production, those employees and

households earn an income. Something which is much needed in our country for so many who are unemployed. This then also leads to expenditure or the possibility of being able to spend your income. This is where households spend that income on goods produced by those manufacturers which enables them to continue production in this cycle.

However, due to the electricity crisis and inefficiencies of the State-Owned Entities, this seemingly simple economic flow is buckling and coming undone. Our country is arguably in its worst financial position in the post-apartheid era *†en dit kan net slegter gaan soos die data wys op die oomblik* [and it can only get worse as the data shows at the moment.] This is all thanks to a party which governs through ignorance and governs while it is stuck in the past, and that party's name is the African National Congress.

Amidst all of this, to add insult to an already very injured population, earlier this week we had to learn that yet again, the National Treasury afforded the R47-billion bailout to Transnet. Again, another failing SOE proudly brought to you by the zombie state called the African National Congress.

Hon Speaker, in terms of Programme 1, Administration, when I tabled the budget for the year, earlier, it was on the eve of the newly formed department called the Department of Infrastructure and at the time we had a management arrangement in place to allow for the transition and transfer of staff between the two newly formed departments, mainly being Mobility and the Department of Infrastructure.

But hon Speaker, †alle goeie dinge moet tot 'n einde kom [all good things must come to an end] and that arrangement has now been concluded and dissolved at the end of October 2023 with the compliment of 126 staff members being transferred over to Mobility. And at this stage, I would really like to thank and show my appreciation to all staff members who worked during this difficult transition period. I would also like to thank the hon Premier and the DG's office who played an impeccable role in ensuring that this transition is, one, to be successful, but above all that its core services continued happening through our Department.

But hon Speaker, I am here today to essentially address you on how we plan to navigate the adjustments made to the reality of my Department's Budget for the remainder of this financial year, which is the elephant in the room somebody has addressed before me today. The appropriation of my Department's Budget for the rest of the financial year is set to decrease by 2,6%. This will be felt across all the branches in the Department of Infrastructure. Instead of pointing out every item with a budget reduction, I will seek to highlight the delivery that will be impacted and the progress that will now have to be drawn backwards.

The implications of these negative adjustments will have a knock-on effect sadly, for years to come given the nature of infrastructure itself. And this can be likened to stopping a plane on the runway, thereby affecting all traffic incoming, but also outbound from that airport. However, in the case of our

country and the citizens, that traffic will be our citizens who are undeserving of such shortsightedness. Again, by an ANC National Government that is stuck in the past.

But hon Speaker, as much as there is hopelessness in eight other provinces, this province and each and every department, including my own, remain a beacon of hope for those citizens as we continue to build a New Hope on the journey to where this country is heading come elections 2024.

I now move to Programme 2 which is Public Works and Infrastructure because as a Department and as a Cabinet, we are cognisant of the critical enabling role that Infrastructure plays in society in general, but also in the economic growth prospects of this province and ultimately, in the country.

But noting the risks associated with any further deterioration in the ability of Infrastructure to perform at the prescribed standards, we have set the protection of the asset portfolio foundation as our key objective, by focusing on maintenance as well as the prioritisation of assets that have the most profound service delivery impact and face the greatest risk of failure, be it at our provincial level and yes, at municipal level.

But, while we are focusing on this, hon Speaker, and the hon Premier earlier spoke about Eskom and loadshedding, it is said that:

“In times of crisis, people reach for meaning. Meaning is strength.

Our survival may well depend on our seeking and finding that meaning.”

Which is why while the rest of the country is faced with Stage 6 loadshedding and without any hope of a national solution, as the Western Cape Government, we are busy implementing much-needed innovation.

In October together with DEDAT we successfully launched the municipal wheeling toolkit. It is without a doubt that this toolkit will be adopted and used country-wide, given the enquiries from municipalities from beyond our borders, hon Premier, already enquiring about our toolkit. †Ons is werklikwaar ‘n baken van hoop vir dié wat hopeloos is buite ons provinsiale grense. [We are really a beacon of hope for those that are without hope outside our provincial borders.] But this once again proves that as a province under the leadership of our Premier, we lead while the rest try to follow, never mind catching up because some of them are very, very far behind our province because we need to ensure that we provide hope to millions of South Africans and it is not lost due to poor or stagnant national leadership, hon Speaker.

To ensure that this wheeling toolkit is a success at local government level, over the next couple of months we will continue with more training events within our municipalities so it can get wider adoption as we want to ensure that the Western Cape is lit up into the future so that our residents do not worry at local government level about loadshedding. Because hon Speaker

and hon members of the House, that is what a caring government is actually supposed to do and what this DA-led Government in this province is doing.

Hon Speaker, in February I visited the Middelpoort Primary School in Saldanha Bay, and the team during my site visit reassured that that that project would be finished before the end of winter. Indeed, I can confirm to the House this afternoon that by the end of July, construction was completed in record time. An R88-million school which will accommodate 1 860 learners from Grade R to Grade 7 is complete. [Applause] It will be one of the biggest schools on the West Coast. This will not only change the lives of the children and educators, but also the surrounding community. And the irony is: we built this school in an ANC ward where the ANC council is shown seeing hope through a DA-led Provincial Government. †Ons moet die feite gee anders gaan niemand ooit daarvan praat nie. [We have to give the facts otherwise no one is going to talk about it.]

Further to this, hon Speaker, over the next eight months we plan to complete another three brand new schools across our province because as the Department of Infrastructure, we intend to enable infrastructure-led growth and investment in the Western Cape that we believe must benefit all of the communities we serve, in brick and mortar.

Hon Speaker, the road infrastructure in the Western Cape is crucial for our province's economic growth, our tourism, but above all, connecting various communities. It facilitates trade and transportation of goods. It enhances

access to remote areas of our non-M0etro areas, and also supports the overall development of our region as a whole. Additionally, well-maintained roads contribute to improved safety, reduced travel times, and increased accessibility for both residents and visitors to our beautiful shores.

It is therefore in this programme that we will receive a rollover of R7,5-million. But as we have seen in the recent floods in June and September in our p0rovince, we are so many times reminded of the critical role this programme plays from an economic perspective, but also in terms of the socio-economic value of our roads' infrastructure.

Many of these communities at times were cut off from the rest of our province, but also essential services. In June, the community of Citrusdal were worried about missing their scheduled medical procedures due to their main road being cut off after it was washed away by a flood. However, this Provincial Government through this specific branch in my Department in record time, 10 days, we reconnected an entire community to the rest of this province. We did that with might in partnership not only through years of investment at district level, but also working with the surrounding farmers and the local municipality. †Saam, kon ons baie vinnig dinge gedoen kry. [Together, we could get things done very quickly.]

However, hon Speaker, on 25 September our province was again hit by a severe storm. Some say the worst in over 40 years. But this time, the height of the devastation in terms of our roads network, increased dramatically. At

one stage, we had over 150 provincial and local roads being closed. That is a lot to deal with. Many people were left destitute, but yet again, the commitment of our officials, our roads teams even to the lowest level, ensured that our investment over many, many years in developing in-house capacity, saw them rolling up their sleeves and they did what this Western Cape Government does best: getting things done! Hitting the ground running. So, road infrastructure once again, in this instance, ...[Interjections.] we could rebuild a bridge in 21 days. †Maar agb Speaker, die Leier van die Opposisie wat daarvan hou om geraas te maak, gaan kyk 'n bietjie in julle ander provinsies waar julle regeer, twee jaar later, is sommige paaie nog nie ...[Tussenwerpsels.] [But hon Speaker, the Leader of the Opposition who likes to make a noise, go and have a look in your other provinces where you govern, two years] later, some are not yet ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

†Die MINISTER VAN INFRASTRUKTUUR: ...eers reggemaak nie.

[The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: ...not even repaired yet.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

†Die MINISTER VAN INFRASTRUKTUUR: Hou op om bekommerd te wees oor nonsens. Kyk wat jou eie party se mislukkings is, dan praat ons weer.

[Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Stop being worried about nonsense. Look at what your own party's failures are, then we'll talk again.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Speaker, in less than 30 days of a disaster, we had managed to ensure that only 36 roads still remained closed. No other province can say that. No other province can do that: commitment of our people. We reconnected an entire community of McGregor to the municipality. A miraculous job, if you ask me! Again, can the Opposition Leader in this House say anything else about what his party is doing in other provinces? †Ek dink hulle kan nie ... [Tussenwerpsels.] want hulle is oppad by die deur uit. [I think they cannot ... [Interjections.] because they are on their way out the door.]

Hon Speaker, with the festive season upon us and many road travellers being concerned about which roads are closed, being well aware of our roadworks in our province, I can make a certain announcement this morning even that we are now into the peak inflow of people and tourists to our province:

Clarence Drive, Franschhoek Pass, and the Hemel-en-Aarde Road will be open for one-way traffic with effect from Friday next week. [Applause.] That is the commitment by the teams of our provincial branch in terms of roads. But I do want to caution our road users, even the Opposition members in this

House. †Kyk nou na die borde, asseblief. Volg die reëls; kom dit na. [Look at the road signs, please. Follow the rules; adhere to it.] Add some additional time to your travelling because at the end of the day, what we are doing is repairing the roads for you, being well aware that many have booked campsites. Some are going to get married. So please, simmer down your concerns. The roads will be open ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Who must simmer down?

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: ...for one-way traffic.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You must simmer down.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: ...this is one example where one needs to thank the Department, our departments at local government. Agriculture has played a role. Our district teams have played a role because we have shown excellence in the public sector, it is a reality if we all work together, if you put your citizen first and the business sector is kept abreast. But above all, we have shown that we can also restore the economy in record time when we are confronted with emergencies. [Interjections.]

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Maar jy is die leier
...[Tussenwerpsel.]

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: But you are the leader
...[Interjection.]]

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: But sadly, as Minister Wenger
stated, we will not receive any funding from the National Disaster Fund.
...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

†So, as die Leier van die Oposisie, hon Speaker, ophou geraas maak,
miskien moet hy gaan vra hoekom kry ons nie die geld nie want weet jy
hoekom, hy kan net geraas maak in die Huis. Dit is al waarvoor hy goed is.
Dit is maar nes 'n kongres [Onhoorbaar.] van sy eie party in die Wes-Kaap
hier. [Tussenwerpsels.] [Gelag.]

[The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: So, as the Leader of the
Opposition, hon Speaker, stops making a noise, perhaps he should go and ask
why don't we get the money because you know why, he can only make a noise
in the House. That is all he's good for. It's just like a congress [Inaudible.] of
his own party here in the Western Cape. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Speaker, ...[Interjections.]

over the coming months, despite the budget cuts, we will initiate and continue with new initiatives and projects in terms of transport infrastructure, as we are fully aware that the economy needs to be kept alive. And this will be done through the following projects.

The N7 to Freeway Standards which is at Van Schoorsdrift. It is a R530-million infrastructure project. Periodic maintenance between Ceres to Touws River: R120-million roads project. The Malmesbury Bypass, hon Minister Bredell, a R530-million investment into a single municipality. The upgrade of the road between Stanford to Gansbaai, an almost R390-million investment. The rehabilitation of the road between Waboomskraal and Holgaten: R175-million investment in terms of roads. And also, the reconstruction of the MR191 between Paarl and Franschhoek: a R610-million road infrastructure investment. ...[Interjection.]

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: En julle sê ‘no details’.

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: And you say ‘no details’.]

†Die MINISTER VAN INFRASTRUKTUUR: En tussen almal dié, agb Voorsitter, hon Speaker, gaan ons nog voort om die vloedskade te herstel. Ons kry dinge gedoen. Ons is nie aan die slaap soos in die ander provinsies waar die ANC al met vakansie gaan nie, met alle respek gesê hulle is al vir vyf jaar amper.

[The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: And in between all of these, hon Chairman, hon Speaker, we continue to repair the flood damage. We get

things done. We are not asleep as in the other provinces where the ANC is going on holiday already, with all respect, they have been for almost five years.]

Which leads me to the branch of Human Settlements ...[Interjections.] and much has been said about title deeds. First, there is a rollover of R3,961-million in terms of Title Deeds Restoration, but as this House is well aware, hon Speaker, since the start of my term, I have always spoken on the importance of ensuring that our citizens are provided with security of tenure which so many of them deserve because this document holds immense significance, especially in uncertain economic times such as we are currently in as a nation. And amid economic fluctuations, a title deed ensures stability, facilitates property transactions, and serves as a crucial asset for individuals and the economy alike.

For this purpose and for this year's update, hon Speaker, that we have already emancipated 1 799 beneficiaries within this province with a title deed. And in some instances, we have enabled to ensure that as we conclude a housing project, the same day that we hand over the housing key, we hand over the title deed. Now, that is a party and a government at work for their citizens.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hear, hear!

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: And now, hon Speaker, just to take it a bit further: in fact, on Monday, I will be visiting Bredasdorp. Again, to

hand over more than 140 title deeds. Two weeks ago, I visited the community of Elands Bay where the 84-year-old Mr and Mrs Ovies received their title deed. They waited 40 years for their title deed. A chapter in their painful lives closed.

But partnership is the key to moving forward because alone, we can do so little and together, we can do so much. And in recognising the shortfalls within our partners at municipal level, we have refined and bulked up our internal resources to ensure that the seven municipalities with the biggest title deed backlog can be fully assisted. And they are: Saldanha Bay, Theewaterskloof, Drakenstein, Bitou, George, Knysna, and Stellenbosch. ...[Interjection.]

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Wat van die Kaap?

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: What about the Cape?]

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Speaker, the Western Cape Government is consistently looking at how we can create more affordable housing opportunities for the citizens and those qualifying beneficiaries. Which is why in the first quarter of this fiscal year, we completed the Regent Villas Social housing in Mitchells Plain: hon Mackenzie. We then continued in record time to hand over the Maitland Mews social housing project which is another example.

Over this weekend, actually on Saturday, the hon Premier and I will be

accompanying the National Minister of Human Settlements, as we hand over the first 331 units of the Goodwood Station Social Housing project which upon its completion creates 1 055 housing opportunities.

And this is much to the dismay, hon Speaker, to the Opposition in this House who consistently tries to portray this DA-led Government and this Department as one who does not care, who does not prioritise affordable housing. †Wel skrik wakker. [Well, wake up.] There are a lot of facts that you are not looking at. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: But the results, not the rhetoric.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Speaker ...[Interjection.]

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Ons het meer huise gebou ...[Tussenwepse.]

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Ons het meer huise gebou ...[Interjection.]]

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: ...but much has also been said this morning about ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: ...about extortion, and it is a pity that hon member Nkondlo is not in the House. ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Minister.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: We have seen the scourge of crime ...[Interjections.] and extortion, and it has now found its way into the Western Cape. †In haar drome gaan sy ‘n Minister wees in die volgende 100 jaar... [In her dreams she is going to be a Minister in the next 100 years...]

So much, that it has now become a daily nightmare with billions of rands being lost every day across all our provinces. But more recently, we learnt, hon Speaker, that approximately 77% of SAPS precincts in the Western Cape have staff shortages and many of you will ask: now how does this tie in with extortion and my Department?

Hon Speaker, in the absence of adequate policing in precincts across our province, [Interjections.] we, through our branch, Human Settlements – and this is just between April of this year until October 2023 – have spent R75-million on security because of a failing national SAPS. [Interjections.] This is at a loss of 277 housing units or 1 100 people losing out on a full housing opportunity. [Interjections.] The areas being affected, hon Speaker, are the areas where many of the Opposition members in this House, service constituencies. †Maar hulle is absoluut morsdood, stil. Hulle maak net geraas as hulle in hierdie Huis sit. [Tussenwerpsels.] [But they are

absolutely dead, still. They only make a noise when they sit in this House.]

In our Public Works Infrastructure branch, as recently as last month in Gugulethu at the Litha Primary School for which there is a contract in place for preventative maintenance of R7,7-million, hon Speaker. [Interjections.] The contractor walked off site. He says they do not feel safe anymore. †En wat sê die Opposisie van hierdie Wetgewer? Absoluut niks, want leë blikke maak altyd die meeste geraas soos hulle al weereens vandag besig is om te doen. [And what does the Opposition of this Legislature say? Absolutely nothing, because empty vessels always make the most noise as they are again busy doing today.]

In terms of Delft in February at the Sunray Primary School, again, Business Forums or so-called community leaders again tried to stop and extort funding at this project. Again, all of this has an impact on my portfolio.

Hon Speaker, I can make many more examples, but once again, this: seemingly SAPS in our province are under resourced and they cannot manage what they actually have at their disposal. What is saddening, hon Speaker, is the reality that SAPS actually has a national budget of R20-billion. †R20-miljard, kan jy dit glo, maar ons moet nou behuisingsgeld vat om hulle probleme aan te spreek. [Tussenwerpsels.] [R20 billion, can you believe it, but we now have to take housing money to address their problems. [Interjections.]]

But Hon Speaker, when Eskom cut off the power and continued to terrorise our citizens, the people that suffer are the most vulnerable. I stood here in March and committed that through my portfolio, we will seek to find a way to mitigate the scourge of loadshedding, more so for our indigent households because I am committed to the hon Premier's Energy Plan for our province. I announced that we would seek to deliver 976 indigent households through our housing projects across our province ...[Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): When are you doing ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: ...with solar geysers, an expense of R24-million. ...[Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): We are almost [Interjections.] houses, when are you doing that?

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Speaker, I am happy to convey to the House today that as of 4 December, ...[Interjections.] 128 beneficiaries have already received their solar geysers and the balance will be installed in the new year. [Interjections.] And to ensure that it is done properly ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Deliver!

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: ... I actually visited some of these

sites. [Interjections.] I have witnessed the joy and the difference that this intervention of this Provincial Government ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: ...has made. Which is why as part of our Adjustment we will be ensuring that an additional 60 solar geysers are going to be installed, bringing the total cost of this intervention to R27,5-million. [Interjections.]

In terms of Programme 5, hon Speaker, it is said that:

“The more we can do to create a better society that benefits more people, the better chance we have that our society will continue to grow and prosper.”

That is from Mr Sanford Weill. In this specific programme, there is a roll-over of R1,46-million which has been allocated for local content tenders. But, hon Speaker, to ensure that the money we spend in true empowerment, not the ANC version of empowerment, is effective ...[Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): When?

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: ...we have what is called the Empowerment Impact Assessment Tool which we use as Department to

measure the potential empowerment of local communities in capital infrastructure projects that meet the financial threshold of R10-million or more. And in addition, this includes the maintenance infrastructure projects with a minimum planned construction duration of 12 consecutive calendar months, because we do realise the importance of this programme.

The key objectives of this programme are to firstly drive transformation and procurement reform; to align departmental procurement policy with Broad-Based Economic Empowerment objectives; to increase employment locally; to stimulate economic growth; and to reduce the imbalances in access to economic opportunities.

But do not take my word for it and if any hon member of the Opposition ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): We cannot take your word on ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: ...really are worth their salt, they can visit the Ashton High School ...[Interjections.] they can visit the Ceres Hospital Rehabilitation Project, they can visit the Helderberg Hospital Project; they can visit the Mvula Primary School in Nyanga; they can visit the Nolungile Community Daycare Centre in Site C, Khayelitsha. [Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, we are also ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: ...in the period of 16 Days of Activism against Gender-Based Violence. And therefore, the Child and Youth Care Centres will receive a roll-over of R7,6-million because we do realise these centres play a crucial role in the destitute communities by providing a safe, supportive, and nurturing environment for children and young people facing various challenges.

As I conclude, hon Speaker, I began with a quote from the Dalai Lama, and I will conclude with a quote by his Holiness. He says:

“Tragedy should be utilised as a source of strength. No matter what sort of difficulties, how painful the experience is, if we lose our hope, that is our real disaster.”

Hon Speaker, as the Western Cape Government, we will not be stopped to ensure that we provide hope to our citizens in the Western Cape, even when we are confronted by unjustifiable financial constraints brought upon us by the ANC National Government. In this Province and in this Department, we soldier on. †Ons kap dit nat, ons loop reguit vorentoe. [We are moving, we move straight ahead.] We get things done, which is why the citizens of the Western Cape should not lose hope because they can believe that they have a government [Interjections.] that actually is there for them. We work for you.

An HON MEMBER: Minister of ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: And at this stage, I would like to thank the Acting HOD, my senior team present here with her, as well as my Ministry under the leadership of the HOM, for ensuring that even under difficult times, ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You must let ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: ...the message of Hope is focused upon, that we deliver on that which is our mandate. But above all, to all the members of the Standing Committee who exercise their oversight effectively and diligently, the period that our country is embarking upon is going to be difficult. It asks for real leadership, leadership that provides hope and that hope is through a government that cares for you.

And I want to wish all of our citizens a very blessed festive season and always remember, this DA-led Provincial Government with this hon Premier's Government for you. [Interjections.] And come 2024, we will continue giving you that hope as we soldier on and move forward. I thank you. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon members, before I recognise the next speaker, can I please ask for your indulgence. When there is an hon

member on the floor, please do not drown out the speaker. This running commentary throughout the hon Minister's speech, I am cautioning you. We have a long day ahead of us. Can I please ask that you work with me. I now recognise the hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks, hon Speaker. The hon MEC did not mention once the construction mafia and eight officials that appeared in court when R1-million just disappeared. And we are not sure whether that R1-million ended up in the coffers of the DA to fight an elections campaign next year. [Interjections.] So, one of the councillors in the City of Cape Town who is responsible for Human Settlements was firstly fired and afterwards, resigned because of allegedly making deals with gangsters.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Secondly, hon Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: In the City.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): ...the MEC did not mention once the name of a lady with a disabled child called Cynthia Bless. Her subsidy had been approved I think three years ago and by the time it was approved, it was said that all houses had been handed out when her application had been approved. Three years later, she still has no house. And we hope, hon MEC, your commitment to make sure with this Adjustment Budget, that Witzenberg, that particular

municipality, will build a house for Cynthia Bless and her disabled child.

He did not once mention TransHex where you promised that in the first phase, you will build 2 000 houses and almost four years later, you have only built 170. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Ai!

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): And when you handed over 170 houses at the beginning of this year – I think it was in March – when winter came, some of those walls collapsed. Roofs were blown off. This is what you gave to the poorest of the poor.

So, you mentioned the issue of roll-overs. Why roll-overs? Because all these municipalities that have received clean audits within the Western Cape, or most of them, could not spend their allocations. And you told us in a meeting that ...[Interjections.] National Treasury, whilst you were applying for roll-overs, National Treasury warned us that we will not roll over time and time, over and over again. And when the hon Sileku spoke in that meeting, he blames the issue of capacity that those municipalities have no capacity. And the question that came up is, what is this Department doing to assist those municipalities to be capable, to implement and to spend the grants that they are receiving from National Government. And I agree with you when you say those municipalities, and most of them governed by the DA, do not have capacity and they do not know how to spend budgets.

...[Interjection.]

Mr I SILEKU (DA): I will respond.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Hon Speaker, [Laugh.] and I am going to speak about Silver Town and the postponement to upgrade that particular settlement, human settlement. I am going to speak to that within. I mean, when we have dealt with the annual performance of the Department, and we received that report. And you stood up in this House when I quoted from that Fourth Quarter Report and you said that I have misled this House in terms of the figures that we gave, BNG: 6 213 opportunities of which you have only built 3 673. Almost half of the houses that we have not built in that particular programme.

Hon Speaker, this Budget has allocated R8,9-million to the MEC's office and hon Minister Simmers is currently on the news for allegedly flouting rules of the Ministerial Handbook for claiming housing benefits while he owns property in the City of Cape Town. Serious allegations.

While this Department faces significant challenges that inhibits it from rendering quality service delivery such as invasion of land, community unrest and the prevalence of extortion and violent attacks on Government officials on sites by the construction mafia, this budget has not made any allocation towards addressing these pressing challenges. Of course, it has been proven with any reasonable doubt that the DA started, sustained, and continues to

fund the extortionists and construction mafia in the province, which may explain why no provision has been made in the budget to tackle the problem hands on.

In a previous Sitting, the hon Christians stood up and he told us, he said ‘We know who these extortionists are, we know, but we refuse to act against them.’ And every time when he comes here, he wants to complain and say ‘police, police, police’, whilst we are making deals with those extortionists. Ja.

The over R73-million reallocated to try and source the hon MEC Simmer’s mess in the Department could have been spent wisely to fund community orientated initiatives to fight extortion and other crimes associated with the construction mafia. This R73-million is made up of R10-million reallocated to provide for staffing costs previously under Human Settlements and R63,9-million received from the Department of Mobility for budget alignment and so-called refresh of management arrangement. This clearly shows that the merger of the components of Public Works in Human Settlements to create this Department, is not yet completed.

And officials in this Department of Infrastructure are not happy. They are not happy about these particular mergers. When the new Department was created, there was a lot of unhappiness as senior managers were demoted and others rendered redundant. We are now reliably informed that many skilled workers, especially those in middle management, do not have any jobs to do

or do not know what their job descriptions are.

I mean, a Head of Department, Jacky Gooch, has now been found incapable of being an HOD when she was an HOD for a number of years in Public Works. Two departments. When the new department was created, for instance those workers who were attached to the PHP project have been rendered useless and spend their time at work streaming music or watching movies.

This issue demands serious consideration as a close examination reveals a systematic attempt to turn this Department into a lucrative venture for White construction companies while sidelining Black emerging contractors who previously thrived on projects like the PHP. The Department's substantial R9,6-billion budget appears poised to exclusively benefit White companies who in turn will contribute to the funding of the DA's elections campaign, clearly.

Disturbingly, instances of this then are already evident in ongoing projects such a construction at Sir Lowry's Pass High where the expulsion of RC Civils, a well-established and experienced Black construction company, from the project occurred under questionable circumstances. In Mossel Bay, a company that built houses for the Department, apartheid government, has been awarded a lucrative contract against the wishes of community members and stakeholders. And when we as a committee visit Mossel Bay, we could not give answers to those people in that particular meeting. And

...[Interjection.]

†Die SPEAKER: Agb Marran ...[Tussenwerpsel.]

[The SPEAKER: Hon Marran ...[Interjection.]]

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): ...the Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

†Die SPEAKER: Jou tyd is verstreke. Sluit asseblief af.

[The SPEAKER: Your time has expired. Please conclude.]

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): And the Chairperson deliberately stopped that meeting from continuing.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Hon Speaker, the ANC therefore ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat. Thank you very much, your time has expired. I recognise the next person on the hybrid platform, [Applause.] I recognise the hon Klaas.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Thank you, hon Speaker, for the recognition. It is sad to see a provincial department trusted with the provision of Housing and Public Works cutting its budget by more than R259,6-million while the majority of our people in the province remain in a corner condition,

congested SAPS and others remaining homeless. And it is also shocking for the Human Settlement Budget to be cut by R212,1-million for the [Inaudible.] reasons such as procurement delays, unable to fix beneficiaries for the subsidised and outstanding [Inaudible.] claims. All this shows that the Department does not have the capacity to execute its delivery mandate and to ensure that the housing backlog is reduced.

In the 2022/2023 financial year, this Department bragged about creating a mere 8 000 houses in the province, which also included the ...[Audio distorted.] housing projects where applications are only partly subsidised from the block of close to a half a million people who are still on the housing waiting list. That is nothing, but a drop of the ocean.

Just on Monday, families were displaced in Nyanga where about 30 shacks caught fire at the same time due to their congested nature, and this Government failed those people in the .past and it continues to fail them to this day. We are yet to hear about people of Kosovo and Dunoon who were promised in the height of COVID-19 that their congested informal settlements would be ...[Audio distorted.] but to this, not much has been done. This cut budget could have assisted to make sure that our people residing in the ...[Audio distorted.] line are found alternative accommodation as a matter of urgency so that they can stay in decent environments and also, to make sure that the trains can continue to operate on that line in order to ...[Audio distorted.] ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Klaas. Your time has expired. Please conclude.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Of our poor people in Khayelitsha and surrounding areas. For this reason, the EFF will not support this Vote. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Klaas. I now recognise the hon Sileku.

Mr I SILEKU (DA): Mandibulele, Somolo.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): When are they sitting now?

The SPEAKER: Hon Sileku, my apologies. Can I please ask the Table staff to mute all microphones on the hybrid system. Thank you very much. Hon Sileku.

†Mr I SILEKU (DA): Ndibulele, Somlomo, ngethuba undinika lona. Okokuqala, Somlomo, ukusuka kwam endlini namhlanje bendisemini emnandi [Thank you, Honourable Speaker, for the opportunity you have given. Firstly, when I left home today, I was in a good mood.]

† Ek was in 'n goeie gees want dit is ons Kersseisoen. Ek het nie gedink ek gaan gedwing word om op sekere goed te reageer nie, maar dit het nou 'n nagmerrie geword. *You know*, toe *hon member* Marran gepraat het

...[Tussenwerpsels.] was ek onder die indruk dat hy nou goeie goed gaan praat oor die spesifieke baba van die Departement van Infrastruktuur. Maar ongelukkig, al die goeie dinge en al die goeie goed ...[Tussenwerpsels.] wat die Departement gedoen het ...[Tussenwerpsel.] [I was in a good spirit because it is our Christmas season. I did not think I would be forced to react to certain things but it has now become a nightmare. You know when hon member Marran spoke ...[Interjection.] I was under the impression that he was now going to say good things about the specific baby of the Department of Infrastructure. But unfortunately, all the good things and all the good stuff ...[Interjections.] that the Department has done ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

†Mnr I SILEKU (DA): ...alhoewel hierdie Departement 'n baba is, is daar baie goeie ...[Tussenwerpsels.] dinge wat die baba al bewys het, dat hierdie baba 'n goeie, goeie kind gaan wees. En die tekens is daar. Ons kyk in terme van die vloede hoe hierdie baba die vloede hanteer het.

You know, ek dink dit sal goed gewees het van agb lid Marran om 'n goeie buurman te wees en die nodige ondersteuning te gee aan die baba, nie 'n jaloerse ...[Tussenwerpsels.] buurman te wees nie omdat hy nie 'n baba het nie. *You know*, ja ...[Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr I SILEKU (DA): ...although this Department is a baby, there are many good ...[Interjections.] things that the baby has already proven, that this baby is going to be a good, good child. And the signs are there. We look in terms

of the floods how this baby dealt with the floods.

You know, I think it would have been good of hon member Marran to be a good neighbour and give the necessary support to the baby, not be a jealous ...[Interjections.] neighbour because he does not have a baby. You know, ja ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon Sileku, please address me.

Mr I SILEKU (DA): Okay. Hon Speaker, ...[Interjections.] and I would also want to say to the House that I am very glad to see that hon member Marran and hon member Kama, through you, were in the Boland. And I hope and pray that when they were in the Boland sitting with some of the office bearers in some of our municipalities that are not capacitated in terms of assisting this particular Department in the delivery of its targets, that they were able to address some of the issues that I am going to mention.

In one of the municipalities, you will find that within the first three months of their budget, they were only able to spend 5,5% ...[Interjections.] of their capital expenditure, as compared to the 25% envisaged in their budget. Secondly, what is of concern in that particular municipality is that in terms of contractual services and security, their expenditure within a period of three months, stood at 44,6%. Now, you must look at the comparison. Infrastructure: 5,5%; contractual services and security: 44,6% within a period of three months. And also, you know, what is interesting in terms of

what has been spent, 84% of that goes to the staff.

Hon Speaker, also what is important is that hon Marran speaks about the issue of capacity, and I want to correct him. When I raised this particular issue of capacity, I was actually trying to encourage him in his deliberations with his colleagues and friends that have been appointing temporary workers specifically in the Human Settlements Department, that they actually appoint people that are fit for purpose so that we are able to spend these roll-overs in terms of title deeds. ...[Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Who are those municipalities?

Mr I SILEKU (DA): But hon member Marran, through you, hon Speaker, knows which those municipalities are.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): No ...[Interjection.] where is the list?

Mr I SILEKU (DA): And what is also disappointing, hon Speaker, is the fact that as much one would appreciate the EPWP programme, we are very disturbed that some of these EPWP employees appointed by some of the colleagues who are aligned to hon member Marran and hon member Kama, who I believe were in the by-election in Saldanha. I hope they got off days. [Interjections.] You know, they actually lost because I am telling you now, ...[Interjections.] that even today, they are not at work. They are even not at work today ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr I SILEKU (DA): So, because when they appointed them, they were not appointing them because they want to contribute to the performance of this particular Department, but they appointed them for only one reason and one reason only: to use them as food canvasses because they do not have money, they are bankrupt.

So, hon Speaker, let me go to the speech. [Interjections.] Hon Speaker, today I stand before you with a heavy heart compelled to address the daunting R259-million budget cut that comes as a result of the ill-fated Public Wage Bill, signed into law by the National ANC Government. This policy the ANC has implemented has caused massive budget shortfalls in our province, casting a shadow over everything we do. However, in the face of difficulty, the Western Cape Government under the leadership of the Democratic Alliance, has risen to the occasion to mitigate the impact of these disastrous policies. This budget is not merely a financial statement, it fosters infrastructure-led growth and investment paving the way for a brighter future for the residents of the Western Cape.

Public Works Infrastructure has been allocated R2,2-billion, R4,4-billion has been allocated to Transport Infrastructure, R2,5-billion has been allocated to Human Settlements and R71-million has been allocated to community-based programmes. This budget has strategically reallocated resources to maximise

the impact of every rand we have. The allocation of R4,5-million for solar installation on various buildings is a move towards sustainable energy solutions. Moreover, R21,8-million has been dedicated to title deed restoration by municipalities, securing property rights and empowering our citizens. R25,9-million has been earmarked for the electrification of various housing projects, providing basic amenities to those who need it most.

In acknowledging the need for service deliver and energy performance, R55,7-million has been allocated and an additional R42,4-million has been strategically allocated from the Provincial Equitable Share Reserve to acquire property that will be used for Health and Education purposes.

The National Disaster Fund has seemingly deemed not to allocate the funds to the Province. I suppose, we are being punished, being the only province that delivers services. No good deeds go unpunished. ...[Interjection.]

† 'n AGBARE LID: Jy weet mos jy lieg nou.

[An HON MEMBER: You know you are lying now.]

†Mnr I SILEKU (DA): Ons is nog steeds kort. Ons is nog steeds kort ...[Lag.] R800-miljoen ...[Tussenwerpsel.]

[Mr I SILEKU (DA): We are still short. We are still short ...[Laughs.] R800-million ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sileku, please take your seat. Hon Deputy Chief Whip

of the Majority Party, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes, hon Speaker. I rise in line [Inaudible.] across the benches, hon member Windvogel heckled, † ‘dat jy weet mos jy lieg’ [‘you know that you are lying’] to hon member Sileku ...[Interjections.] while was speaking, and I would like you to rule on the matter.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Chief Whip. Hon Windvogel. Hon Windvogel?

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): What did he do?

The SPEAKER: Did ...[Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Hon members! [Interjections.] Hon Windvogel? [Interjections.] Hon Windvogel, did you refer to any hon member in this House ...[Interjections.] the honourable ...[Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): No, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Windvogel did not refer to anyone in this House and for that reason, I will ...[Interjections.] Hon members! [Interjections.] I will refer to Hansard and I will come back, but the hon member has said that she had not referred to anyone in the House. Hon Kama, is that a point of order?

Mr M KAMA (ANC): No, no, I am sorted. I am sorted.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Sileku, you may continue.

Mr I SILEKU (DA): Let me repeat. The National Disaster Fund has seemingly deemed it fit not to allocate the funds to the Province. I suppose we are being punished for being the only province that delivers services. No good deed goes unpunished. [Interjections.] We still need R800-million to restore the roads network following floods. This budget makes the best of a disastrous situation. [Interjections.] The Democratic Alliance supports this budget and I implore the Opposition parties to also support this budget ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No, we will not.

Mr I SILEKU (DA): ...like they supported our recommendation to not support the Expropriation Bill. †Baie dankie, [thank you,] thank you very much.

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie, agb Sileku. [Applous.]

[The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sileku.] [Applause.] I recognise the hon Minister.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Sixteen minutes.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Het jy niks om te sê nie?

[Tussenwerpsels.]

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Do you have nothing to say?] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Simmers, for the record. Order, hon members.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker and I think first let me thank all the comments or speeches based on our Adjustment Budget that we have tabled and in terms of the hon member Marran who hammered on the Cape Town matter. Last time I checked, you were a member of the Legislature, you were not a member of the City of Cape Town Council. [Interjections.]

In terms of Cynthia Bless ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: ...again, hon Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon members.

[Interjections.] Hon members on my left-hand side, there was an input made to the hon Minister. The hon Minister is now responding. Can I please ask that you do not drown out the speaker on the floor and allow the hon Minister to give his response to the inputs made during this debate. Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Speaker, again in terms of Ms Cynthia in Witzenberg again. Yes, Cynthia Bless who will be blessed very soon. [Inaudible.] was Eskom in its capacity, number one. Number two, he used an incorrect form. [Laughs.] That will be addressed. The hon member keeps on hammering on TransHex. That has been addressed, but just a correction: it is 190 units, not 170. [Interjections.] †Lees jou boeke reg. [Read your books correctly.] In terms of roll-overs. Again, I need to clarify, hon Speaker, I was referring to title deed funds which was an issue of roll-over. Again, the hon member needs to provide context.

Extortion allegations: the last time I checked I am the Department of Infrastructure. I am not SAPS, which is failing. What we are doing is trying to address a matter. It is not my mandate and extortion is a criminal offence, it is a criminal matter. [Interjections.]

Then, hon Speaker, I do want to thank hon member Sileku for his inputs, but I just wanted to in closing just give two quotes. [Interjections.] And this one, hon Speaker, through you is to those who still portray themselves as the liberators of our country, and this is more relevant today than ever. And

Johnny Clegg says in his song, and I am quoting:

“The revolution will eat its children.”

And I need to rephrase that: the liberators of this country who still think they are the liberators, are eating their own children and these budget cuts are a clear sign of that. [Interjections.] But there is also hope, hon Speaker, in terms of a poem by C Louis Leipoldt: *In die digte nag is die einde.*

And I will read a pertinent component of that poem:

“Moed, mense, hou moed:

Die kwaad sal verander in goed.

Die môrelik kom uit die duisternis!”

And hon Speaker, I just want to thank you for this opportunity. †Ons inwoners van die Wes-Kaap moet moed hou. Maar een ding is seker, as die ANC dink gisteraand was hulle wakker geklap, wag vir 2024. Julle gaan aan die slaap geklap word. Baie dankie. [Applous.] [Our inhabitants of the Western Cape must have faith. But one thing is certain, if the ANC thinks they had been slapped awake, wait for 2024. You are going to be slapped to sleep. Thank you.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Thank you very much, hon members. That concludes the debate on this Vote. [Interjections.]

Before the Secretary reads the next Order of the Day, I will allow the officials to just swap around, if they need to. Hon members, just for your indulgence. Both parties have agreed, or hon members have agreed that we will continue with the next Vote before we break for lunch.

Can I just get an indication, Minister, if we are expecting the officials from the Department? Minister Bredell, are we expecting the officials or can we continue?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We can continue. They are fine, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I will now ask the Secretary to read the Fourth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7–2023].

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon Minister, Minister Bredell.

†Die LEIER VAN DIE OPPOSISIE: Waar is die Omgewingskommissaris?

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Where is the

Environmental Commissioner?]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Speaker. The Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning sees its original Budget of R606 million for the 2023/24 financial year adjusted downwards to R588 million.

This Adjustment Budget comes at a time when the South African Government's finances are at an all time low. The reason for the sad situation is because the ANC National Government cannot work with money. It comes as no surprise that the ANC – the once global veteran struggle organisation is now also bankrupt and cannot even pay election posters of 2019.

Hon Speaker, life goes on and in the Western Cape the Provincial Government will continue to provide the best possible services to our citizens with the money available to us. I want to repeat what I have said many times before, we need a new financial system for government in South Africa. The current system where our National Government provides for itself before distributing what is left to the provinces and Local Government cannot continue.

Hon Speaker, there is currently no incentive for our National Government to introduce austerity measures on itself. That is why an increased Wage Bill can be negotiated nationally and then the cost increases are simply passed

onto provinces without making money available to implement it.

Speaker, in essence, the Western Cape, which has for more than a decade now been fanatical in managing public funds as efficiently as possible, is now being punished the hardest as there is no fat to cut.

Speaker, this is also the case of the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning as well as our Conservation Agency CapeNature. This Department has over the last number of years absorbed reduced budgets to the point where it is now at risk of not being able to deliver on its core mandate on service delivery areas. Several of our programmes will see a budget reduction, for example, our Waste Management Directorate sees a reduction of R2,4 million. Our Housing Market Study Project is cut by R946 000. Topographical surveys at selected municipal landfill sites had seen a reduction of R255 000. Speaker, all these projects and programmes are essential and of critical importance if we are to manage and balance environmental protection with economic development in our province.

However, it is during difficult times such as these that the value of competent, qualified and motivated staff becomes clear. Thank you to the officials who will now go back to the drawing board and figure out how to keep on delivering with the reduced budgets.

Hon Speaker, despite the financial challenges, the Department continues to deliver. The Department leads and coordinates and is mainstreaming the

climate change throughout the Provincial Government.

The Department welcomes the shifting of the Green Economy Ecosystem Support Project from the Department of Economic Development and Tourism. This comes with a R4 million allocation.

CapeNature sees its original 2023/24 Provincial Infrastructure payments revised from R42 million to R32 million. This reduction comes at a bad time for CapeNature as it was hit by the flooding the province experienced this winter. CapeNature had to close several of its reserves because of the floods. This resulted in closure of facilities and cancellations of bookings across CapeNature facilities.

In response to addressing flood damage, CapeNature reallocated financial resources from the current financial year for floods and stormwater damage mitigation. Several projects were deferred to the 2024/25 financial year to provide budget for selected nature reserves to ensure the income generated facilities are open for the coming holiday season.

CapeNature will once again play a leading role in the Wildfire Management and Support System this summer as the custodian of R1 million hectare Conservation Estate which includes many of our water catchment areas. Their work is extremely important and deserves our support.

Hon Speaker, allow me to thank the management team of both the Department

of CapeNature and the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning, who are executing on their mandate despite severe budget pressures. Running an organisation when there are ample funds can be very easy, doing it with shoestring budgets show character and dedication and for that I honour you and I thank you.

Thank you, Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise the hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Thanks again very much, Speaker. The MEC said that the ANC at the National Government cannot work with money.

The PREMIER: What happened with Saldanha?

Mr P MARRAN: What the MEC actually wanted to say is that Black people cannot work with money. [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: No, no!

Mr P MARRAN: Yes, the DA...

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P MARRAN: The ANC that the MEC is referring to, the DA leader, John Steenhuisen, said he would love to be in a Cabinet of Cyril Ramaphosa who is leading the ANC...

Ms R WINDVOGEL: He is pleading.

Mr P MARRAN: ...the President of the ANC. The same DA and the ANC that the DA is speaking bad about, is speaking at this moment with the ANC to be part of a Coalition Government, if the ANC falls below 50%. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order members! Members, order!

Mr P MARRAN: And it is clearly, listening to the response from that side. They do not agree with the national leaders, Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Marran, please take your seat. Hon members, there is a member on the floor. Hon Premier, is that a point of order?

The PREMIER: No, Speaker, I am wondering whether the hon member ...

The SPEAKER: Why are you rising, Premier?

The PREMIER: I am asking whether the hon member would take a question?

The SPEAKER: Hon Marran, the Premier is asking if you are prepared to

take a question?

Mr P MARRAN: Speaker, I do not have time to waste.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier... [Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: Speaker... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Marran, before you proceed – for the record, Premier, the hon member is not prepared to take a question. [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Because he has nothing, nothing. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Marran, you may continue.

Mr P MARRAN: The Premier can put his question in writing. Speaker, ja, when the ANC partook in the debate on the Main Appropriation in March, we reminded this House that the ANC took climate change so seriously that it identified the District Development Model as one of the mechanisms in which Government at various spheres uses to address the challenges of climate change. We found it unfortunate then, as we find it unfortunate now, that the DA always tries to package National Government's initiatives by another name. So instead of implementing DDM the DA-led Western Cape Government came up with its own name. It is also a pity, therefore, that the Western Cape Government chooses to declare an intergovernmental dispute

instead of working with the National Government during this time of fiscal crises.

We raise this because the question of the cost of employment in the Budget Vote remains a deep concern, despite the Public Sector Wage Agreement. Posts are simply not being filled and these particular departments that we are now engaging on initially budgeted for 288 posts. They reduced it to 80. They are only going to fill 11 by their own admission. Annually posts are not filled in the Department, even before the budget cuts, and they said the Premier's Department are not capable to filling or dealing with the issue of filling posts, and it is still the case. Since when we came in to this term up till now, the Premier's Department has been failing to deal with the issue of vacancies. Over R3 million is now to be prioritised simply because these posts were not filled before the announcement of the freezing of posts. The ANC remains concerned that a whopping R49 000 is spent on advertising for the Sandveld Environmental Management with such State budget and with cuts to funding. It is unbelievable that nearly R50 000 is spent on advertising. The ANC also rejects budgeting R270 000 for litigation costs. Again, we reiterate that if an Environmental Commissioner exists, the cost of litigation will be considerably cut. It clearly shows you that the DA only...
[Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Who wrote your speech?

Mr P MARRAN: The DA does not respect their own Constitution, yet the

people of the Western Cape are left waiting for the DA to acknowledge its embarrassment in the face of the rejection of the amendment to the Provincial Constitution.

The ANC continues to advocate because the Premier followed the public participation process and there was a resounding yes, that we want the Environmental Commissioner. The Premier on his own decided, "I am not going to listen to the people."

†Me R WINDVOGEL: *Yes, daar's hy.*

[Ms R WINDVOGEL: *Yes, there you go .]*

Mr P MARRAN: In the last week data from the City of Cape Town's website showed that the water qualified and the same thing will happen with the Provincial Powers Bill. It will explode in your face. In the last week data from the City of Cape Town's website showed that the water quality of the number of cities' most popular beaches is no better than that of Durban's water quality. The Provincial Government always brags that it is better than the rest of South Africa. Well, the data from the City of Cape Town on the water quality of the City says "Its beaches stink; it stinks."

As we approach the summer season, thousands if not millions of local and international tourists will be visiting our beaches and tidal pools, Fish Hoek, Strandfontein, Hout Bay and Camps Bay tidal pools have been found to have low water quality. High bacteria is found in Central False Bay, Lagoon Beach

in Milnerton, Macassar, to Gordon's Bay as well as Three Anchor Bay on the Atlantic Seaboard, but we cannot help to notice the difference for example, between the water quality in the Camps Bay Tidal Pool, which is terrible and which is used mainly by poor people coming from Camps Bay areas, whereas Camps Bay Beach itself, despite its short distance from the pool, is classified as a Blue Flag stated beach by the Wildlife and Environment Society of South Africa.

However, all these environmental disasters are not caused by climate change, nor is it a national disaster. This environmental disaster is manmade and caused by the DA-led City of Cape Town and the continuous refusal to take the problem seriously. There are the residents of Milnerton; ask the residents of Stellenbosch. Ask the residents of Milnerton. Ask the residents of Stellenbosch. They have been victims of municipalities which are hell-bent ignoring raw sewerage. Amongst others, the ANC rejects the Main Appropriation for this Budget, the Vote in March previously precisely because even before these budget cuts came from National Government, the DA-led Provincial Government cut the budget of Coastline Management in this Department by 7%.

Speaker, according to the Adjustment Appropriation for this Budget Vote, half a million rands will be realigned simply because the project scope for 2023/24 of the Green Economy waste entrepreneurs was not finalised, the failure of the MEC himself. This is completely unacceptable and therefore, Speaker, the ANC rejects to support this Budget Vote.

I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marran. I recognise hon Van der Westhuizen.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Agbare Speaker, teen hierdie tyd weet al die lede deeglik dat daar van provinsies en munisipaliteite verwag word om die gordel stywer te trek en dit lyk onwaarskynlik dat hierdie provinsie se begroting in die afsienbare toekoms weer sal toeneem teen dieselfde tempo as wat mense na die Wes-Kaap stroom of dat daardie begroting in lyn met die inflasiekoers aangepas sal word. Ek glo al die lede van hierdie Huis dra ons provinsie en sy inwoners se beste belange op die hart. Dit is immers wat in die aanhef van die Wes-Kaapse Grondwet beoog word met die woorde en ek haal aan:

"Ons strewe om die ontwikkeling van die Wes-Kaap en 'n beter lewensgehalte vir al sy inwoners deur regverdige en doeltreffende regering te bevorder."

Dit word van ons almal – en daarmee bedoel ek die lede aan beide kante van die Huis – verwag om in die beste belang van die Wes-Kaap op te tree.

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Speaker, by this time all the members know well that provinces and municipalities are expected to tighten their belts and it looks unlikely that this province's budget will increase in the foreseeable future at the same rate that people are flocking to the Western

Cape or that that budget will be adjusted in line with the inflation rate. I believe all the members of this House have our province's and its citizens' interests at heart. It is after all what the preamble to the Western Cape Constitution envisages with the words and I quote:

"Endeavouring to promote the development of the Western Cape and a better quality of life for all its people through just and effective government;."

It is expected of all – and with that I mean the members of both sides of the House – to act in the best interest of the Western Cape.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hear, hear!

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: En dit is omdat hierdie Provinsiale Regering die beste belang van ons inwoners op die hart dra dat ons tans in 'n inter-regeringsdispuut met die Nasionale Vergadering, met die Nasionale Regering gewikkel is. Daarom hoop ek dat diegene in hierdie Huis wat tot dusver teen die versoeke van die Wes-Kaap vir 'n groter begroting gekant was, hulle standpunt gou sal heroorweeg en dat hulle voortaan in lyn met die Provinsiale Grondwet se vereistes sal optree.

Die gedagte van 'n Provinsiale Grondwet is natuurlik vir die ANC 'n vreemde konsep. Daar is nog nie een van die ander agt provinsies wat hulle hand gewaag het aan so 'n dokument nie. Ons het amper vyf jaar gelede in hierdie lokaal trou gesweer en gesweer, en ek haal uit die eed aan:

"Ek belowe plegtig om my funksie as 'n lid van die Provinsiale Parlement na my beste vermoë te verrig."

Na my oordeel beteken dit onder andere dat lede van die Parlement hulle huiswerk sal doen en dat hulle nie valse inligting wat die Provinsiale Regering ondergrawe daar buite sal versprei nie, maar dit geld kennelik nie vir die ANC-koukus hier oorkant my nie.

Speaker, nie net het die ANC as politieke party geldelike probleme weens wanbestuur nie, nie net word provinsies insluitende die vinnig-groeiende Wes-Kaap nou nadelig geaffekteer weens die ANC se wanbestuur nie, uiteindelik is dit mense, broodwinners en daarom gesinne wat weens hierdie wanbestuur ly en soos wat ek later sal aandui is dit veral die armstes in die provinsie wat die swaarste deur hierdie besparings getref word. In die proses verwag ek dat ons almal groot erns sal maak met die slegte situasie waarin ons ons bevind maar ons het verlede week gesien, die ANC is nie net geldelik bankrot nie. Hulle is moreel bankrot en wat doen mense wat in 'n hoek is, hulle begin lieg en ek wil graag hê die ANC-lede moet 'n slag opkyk van hulle selfone en net bietjie kyk na hulle eie grafika wat hulle verlede week versprei het.

Verlede week is hierdie grafika onder die naam van die ANC koukus, met ander woorde die naam van hulle wat hier oorkant my sit, versprei.

[Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: And it is because this Provincial

Government has the best interests of our citizens at heart that we are currently involved in an intergovernmental dispute with the National Assembly, with the National Government. Therefore I hope that those in this House who had up to now been against the requests of the Western Cape for a larger budget, will soon reconsider their viewpoint and that they will act in line with the requirements of the Provincial Constitution.

The idea of a Provincial Constitution is of course a strange concept to the ANC. There is not one of the other eight provinces that tried their hand at such a document. Almost five years ago we swore an oath in this Chamber, and I quote from the oath:

I solemnly promise to perform my function as a member of the Provincial Parliament to the best of my ability.

In my view it means amongst other things that members of the Parliament will do their homework and that they will not spread false information out there that undermines the Provincial Government, but it obviously does not apply to the ANC caucus across from me.

Speaker, not only does the ANC as political party has financial problems because of maladministration, not only are provinces including the rapidly growing Western Cape detrimentally affected as a result of the ANC's maladministration, in the end it is people, breadwinners and therefore families who suffer because of this maladministration, and as I will later

indicate it is especially the poorest in the province that are affected the worst by these cuts. In the process I expect that we will all take the bad situation in which we find ourselves seriously but we saw last week, the ANC is not only financially bankrupt. They are morally bankrupt and do what people do that are in a corner, they start to lie and I would like the ANC members to look up from the cellphones for a change and look at their own graphics that they spread last week.

Last week these graphics was spread under the name of the ANC caucus, in other words the name of those who are sitting here across from me.]
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is a lengthy document...

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Die grafika sê, en ek haal aan:

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: The graphics say, and I quote:]

“Did you know, DA-led Western Cape Government’s alarming failure.
Out of 280 funded” ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr P MARRAN: It was called lies!

The SPEAKER: Order, members! [Interjections.]

Mr P MARRAN: ...you call it lies. We saw land in Stellenbosch. All are lies.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members ...[Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: Lies!

The SPEAKER: Hon van der Westhuizen, please take your seat. Hon members, you cannot. If you want to bring any improper behaviour of any hon member of this House to the attention of the House, there are parliamentary rules and mechanisms to do so. Until such a point, it is unparliamentary to refer to any hon member... [Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: It is not just the [Inaudible.] it is in the Department.

The SPEAKER: ...to any member, so then use the mechanisms at your disposal, otherwise I will rule that out of order. Hon van der Westhuizen, you may continue. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is stated in a letter, Chair, by the Stellenbosch Municipality.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, hon Speaker. Clearly, they are embarrassed by these lies. They thought they could just get by.

“Did you know DA-led Western Cape Government’s alarming failure. Out of 280 funded posts in the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning, the DA-led Western Cape Government will only fill 11 posts for this year.” [Interjections.]

†Agb Voorsitter, hulle lieg.

[Hon Chairman, they lie.]

Ms A BANS: The land belongs to the municipality.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Agb Voorsitter, dit is ’n leuen. Uit 280 onbefondsde poste sal hier 11 poste gevul word. Kritieke poste. Dit is ’n leuen en hierdie leuen sou deur die eenvoudige bietjie huiswerk, ’n eenvoudige oproep na die kantoor van die Hoof van die Departement uitgewys kon word. Dit beteken die organogram erken al vir jare dat daar nie genoeg geld is vir hierdie Departement om al die poste waaroor hierdie Departement behoort te beskik, te befonds nie.

Maar die DA-regering is verantwoordelik. Ons stel slegs mense aan in poste as ons weet dat daar geld vir daardie poste is, en ons weet dat hierdie leuens van die ANC gaan net erger word hoe nader ons na volgende jaar se verkiesing toe kom. Ek wil aan my ANC-kollegas sê, skaam julle om tot op daardie vlak te daal. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Chair, it is a lie. Out of 280

unfunded posts 11 posts will be filled here. Critical posts. It is a lie and this lie could have been pointed out by simple homework, a simple call to the office of the Head of Department. It means the organogram has for years recognised that there is not enough money for this Department to fund all the posts which this Department should actually have.

But the DA Government is responsible. We only appoint people in posts if we know that there is money for those posts, and we know that these lies of the ANC are going to become worse as we approach next year's election. I want to say to my ANC colleagues, you should be ashamed to sink to that level.
[Interjections.]

†Me R WINDVOGEL: Jy is 'n dief!

[Ms R WINDVOGEL: You are a thief!]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Speaker, after the disastrous flooding the province has seen this year on two separate occasions, there can be no doubt that the effects of ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Van der Westhuizen, please take your seat. Hon Chief Whip ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Is that a point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes, hon Speaker. It cannot be that a member of this House calls another member †"n dief" [a thief] and that is hon member Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: That is public knowledge. That is public knowledge.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Chief Whip. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What a †"dief" [thief].

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Ja, it is public knowledge. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Windvogel, can I please address you? Can you please stand while I address you? Hon Windvogel, did you refer to any hon member of this House as †"n dief" [a thief] [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: That is my understanding, Chair. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. There is a member on the floor.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Hon Speaker, it was public knowledge. It was in the newspaper.

The SPEAKER: Hon Windvogel, I am not asking you to justify it yet, I am asking did you refer to any hon member of this House as †"n dief" [a thief?]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: No, Chair.

An HON MEMBER: Did she?

†AGBARE LEDE: Ja, ja.

[Hon MEMBERS: Yes, yes.]

The SPEAKER: The hon Windvogel... [Interjections.] Order, members!

Ms A BANS: Even with it... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon members, the hon Windvogel... [Interjections.] Order members! The hon Windvogel was given an opportunity. The hon Windvogel said no. I will refer to Hansard and I will come back to the House. [Interjections.]

Hon Van der Westhuizen, you may continue. [Interjection.] Hon Van der Westhuizen, please take your seat. Hon Kama, what? Is that a point of order?

Mr M KAMA: Yes, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order?

Mr M KAMA: I am getting there. The hon member, when he was addressing the House through you, he even went to a point of saying: "Shame on you my colleagues in the ANC, that you had to stoop so low and lie." I believe that is out of order if he is referring to us who are here in this House. So, I would like you, Speaker, to check if he was referring to any specific member in this House that we are liars. [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Ja, he was saying to us.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I will certainly do so. I will consult Hansard. But just for the record, political parties you can refer to broadly. It has always been the custom and always been the Rules in this House. What I am going to do is, I will check Hansard and see if there was a direct referral to any hon member in this House, hon... [Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA: Can I?

The SPEAKER: Hon Kama?

Mr M KAMA: I am not challenging your ruling, hon Speaker, but if you can just clarify, because the approach you are taking on hon member Van der

Westhuizen is different to that you took, because he is here and you could simply ask him if he referred to any hon member of this House because I heard him talking about his "colleagues", not "the party", but his "colleagues from the ANC", and he is using the ANC to distinguish from the colleagues that are here that "not those ones, but these particular ones." So, I thought that you are going to really check with him if he is referring to any of us here in the House. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Kama. Can I just also, just for the record, hon members. There is no need to justify your points of orders or clarify your points of order and the ruling has already been made. The outcomes of the two rulings are exactly the same. I am going to refer to Hansard and then come back, but your point is noted. Hon Van der Westhuizen, please continue.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, hon Speaker. Just on a point of order, I think there is a longstanding convention that no hon member crosses the line between the hon Speaker and somebody that is on the floor, and I think it would be good for the hon member to take note of that. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Van der Westhuizen, you may continue.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Good, thank you. Thank you, Chair. Just

to clarify... [Interjection.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor. [An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!] I thought you must rule!

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Just to clarify, I will repeat.

†Maar dan, die ANC sukkel so om iets te kry waarmee hulle die DA-geleide Regering kan kritiseer dat hulle hul tot leuens wend en ons weet uit ondervinding dat dit net erger sal word soos wat ons nader na die volgende verkiesing kom. Skaam julle!

[But then, the ANC struggles so to get something with which they can criticise the DA-led Government that they turn to lies and we know from experience that it will only become worse as we get closer to the next election. You should be ashamed!]

Speaker, after the disastrous flooding the province has seen this year on two separate occasions, there can be no doubt that the effects of climate change are intensifying. We must expect more regular disasters and we must take action to ensure we protect our environment and our natural heritage. That is why this Vote is of utmost importance and why the Department of Environmental Affairs must be properly capacitated. They do the work that is often unseen but that does not make it any less important. Environmental

impact assessments, air quality management and nature conservation are not often headline-grabbing activities but they are crucial nonetheless. If we do not stand up and take responsibility for the protection of our environment on a collective scale, there will be nothing left for our children and the next generation, and they will face even greater hardship in the diminishing availability of natural resources.

In the Western Cape we are blessed with picturesque natural heritage and CapeNature does outstanding work in safeguarding and conserving this through their reserves. Their rangers are actively in work with other law enforcement agencies to ensure that poachers who seek to use our shared natural resources for their own gain are brought to justice. This is crucial work, and it must be continued and supported. The importance of this Department should now be clear to all. I do not think any member of this House on either side of the aisle will dispute that we are all dependent on our environment and natural resources for survival and that we should take the utmost care in protecting it.

This Vote has however been another victim of the budget cuts imposed by the ANC National Government. The Budget for this Department has seen an in-year cut of almost R19 million. Contained within that is a R13 million cut to the Budget of CapeNature. Ironically, it is the national allocation for Expanded Public Works project workers that has been cut. Again, it shows that the ANC does not feel an inch for the poor. The hon Dugmore goes on about the civil servants that require a liveable wage and about minimum

wages, yet he is quiet about the job losses. He is quiet about the poor unemployed in our deep rural areas, for whom the training and stipends from the EPWP Work Programmes are so important. The direct result of the Public Wage Agreement that the ANC centrally agreed to, have cost these people, mostly young people who were hoping for an opportunity to learn and to show what they are capable of their dreams.

The Western Cape Government has had to make difficult choices and has taken the necessary step of shielding Education, Health and Social Development from the bulk of cuts by cutting costs elsewhere, including in this Department.

On the note of the two disasters that have caused considerable damage to infrastructure in this province as well as in our CapeNature Reserves, it is worth mentioning that the Western Cape applied to have the flooding declared a provincial disaster. This application was successful and yet we will not be receiving any disaster recovery funding because that money has been squandered by the ANC and their reckless policies, and this is where the real impact of the ANC's recklessness is really apparent.

In an election year, when the pressure from unions was on and tough decisions had to be made the ANC showed a remarkable failure of leadership. The ANC is more concerned about the 55 000 civil servants and this excludes the thousands working for State entities that earned more than R1 million per annum, than about the poor and the unemployed. They agreed to a Wage Bill

they cannot afford, and now the price will be paid through cuts to critical programmes. They have no foresight. They have no leadership. They have no skill and as the lies have shown, they have no conscience.

It is time that South Africans stand up for themselves and their families for the poor and marginalised, for the environment, for their own well-being, and vote the ANC out come 2024. I support this Budget because while the tough decisions had to be made, they were made by this Government with an eye towards the future. We cannot mortgage the future to serve our own interest. This is not real leadership.

The Western Cape will continue to make every cent work for the people of this province and we have the record of clean governance that proves this. I shudder to think of what will happen in provinces that do not.

I am therefore grateful to inform this House that the Standing Committee, having deliberated on the Adjustments, recommend to the House to support the Budget and its report. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Van der Westhuizen. I recognise hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Speaker and thank you to the hon members. Ja, hon Speaker, to be honest with you, the only reason

we talk about budget cuts, it is because of an incompetent and corrupt ANC National Government. That is the only reason and instead of owning up, they now want to play a race card because that is the only card they have got left but, you know, South Africans are intelligent human beings and we can just look what has happened yesterday in Saldanha Bay where they could not get the vote, so South Africans know this... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: And at the end of the day South Africans will vote them out. Hon Speaker, it is a pity that ... [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Actually the racial policies...

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...as soon as people leave the ANC they start to talk the truth, you can just read the newspapers and News 24, where a veteran ANC member who left now said that "it was because the ANC was wrecked by corruption", and that is the honest truth. The DDM Model is just another model to corrupt the cadres even more and therefore we will not go with that. If you understand spheres of government you will understand that no other sphere of government can rule over another sphere of government.
[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It is collaboration!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: There is a lot, and that is our model, hon Speaker, through you to the hon Dugmore, our model is built on collaboration, joint planning and joint budgeting and that you can get through a competent team working through the IDP process. You do not need to create new structures, new systems because there is nowhere in this country and we talked to the National Government where the DDM Model works, but hon Chair, to the hon Andricus Van der Westhuizen, thank you very much, hon Chairperson, for supporting the Budget. Thank you for working with us during the year, keeping an eye on us. There is one thing that I do differ...

†En dit is waar wat u sê agbare Voorsitter, dat al die lede in hierdie Huis dra die Wes-Kaapse inwoners op hulle hart. Ek dink dit is net hierdie kant en die ander partye, maar dit is definitief nie die ANC wat die inwoners op die hart dra nie. Die ANC inherent glo om mense in armoede te hou, dan hou hulle hul afhanklik en dan dink hulle sal die mense vir hulle stem. Die mense is slim, agbare Speaker, en die mense sal in 2024, soos gister in Saldanha, met die ANC handel. Baie dankie, agbare Speaker. [Tussenwerpsels.] [Applous.]

[And it is true what you say, hon Chair, that all the members in this House have the Western Cape citizens at heart. I think it is only this side and the other parties, but it is definitely not the ANC who has the citizens at heart. The ANC inherently believes to keep people poor, then they keep them dependent and then they think the people will vote for them. The people are

wise, hon Speaker, and the people will in 2024, as yesterday in Saldanha, deal with the ANC. Thank you, hon Speaker. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, that concludes the debate on this Vote. The proceedings will now be suspended. Hon Dugmore, is that a point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Chair, I just wanted to ask whether you would consider us doing the next Vote. We can just hold our hunger pangs for a moment. Can we not do the next Vote as well?

The SPEAKER: Hon Leader of the Opposition, unfortunately not. The proceedings will now be suspended and we will resume at two o'clock, as anticipated. The House is therefore suspended.

Business of the House is suspended at 13:22.

Business of the House resumed at 14:02.

The SPEAKER: Please be seated. Thank you very much, hon members. Order! Hon Minister, can I just get an indication if we are waiting for the Department, if we can continue?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: [No audible reply.]

The SPEAKER: We will continue. The Secretary will read the Fifth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 14 – Local Government – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7–2023].

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon Minister, Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Speaker, the wheels are coming off in South Africa. Crime is out of control. Eskom is broken. Our trains are not running. Our harbours are in chaos. Towns are running out of safe drinking water and municipalities throughout the country cannot even perform the most basic services such as refuse collection and road maintenance.

Hon Speaker, the National Government has also broken our Government financial systems and the last nail in the coffin was the nationally negotiated wage increase for civil servants for which there is no money – for which there is no money.

Speaker, just to remind the hon members in the House, the Western Cape Province is a corner in South Africa where the Provincial Government led by the Democratic Alliance is still trying to do what is right for its citizens.

Speaker, to shelter and to protect our people from the chaos that is the reality in the rest of the country, this Government is focusing on resilience, energy resilience, water resilience, government resilience.

Speaker, this is the context for this Adjustment Budget for the Western Cape Department of Local Government. The Department's Budget for 2023/24 is adjusted from R370 million to R414 million. The Department will receive an allocation of R64 million to pilot renewable energy solutions for municipalities. This is our response to the unreliability of power supply from Eskom. We know that towns and regions with reliable energy supply will attract investment and support job creation in the private sector.

Water resilience, Speaker, we are on the eve of our summer holiday season and our tourism sector depends on thousands of locals and international visitors to come to our coastal towns. Knysna on the Garden Route used to be one of these proud tourism towns. Currently under the leadership of the ANC and the PA there is no drinking water and the refuse is piling up in the centre of town. Speaker, the decline of this town is a disgrace and a tragedy. We at the Provincial Government together with neighbouring municipalities are supporting the town with water and refuse emergency services, but the local leaders of Knysna are missing in action.

Hon Speaker, we have identified water resilience as a major risk for this province and as such we are implementing a 15-year Integrated Water Resource Management Plan for all municipalities. The plan also looked at

current water infrastructure and water sources and helps municipalities to plan and to budget for the future. This is also available for Knysna. Please come to the table.

Governance resilience: Speaker, in the Western Cape, Local Government gets clean audits because we realise that financial management and discipline are the foundation of good service delivery. We are maintaining this proud track record except for a handful of municipalities such as Beaufort West, Kannaland and Cederberg. Hon Speaker, we continue to work with them to improve.

During the last audit 21 municipalities received unqualified audits with no findings. Six municipalities received unqualified audits with findings. It is concerning that the Department of Local Government sees an adjustment of R6 million in employee compensation. This is a risk to the sustainability of the Department as it can impact negatively on critical appointments going forward.

Hon Speaker, also of concern is the reallocation of R6 million over the 2024 Medium Term Expenditure Framework of the funding of project management support to the roll-out of Sustainable Infrastructure Development and Financial Facilities Programme, SIDAFF.

The SIDAFF is a powerful tool to support local municipalities in planning and presenting mega infrastructure projects for international funding entities.

Speaker, as our National Government continues its decline under the ANC, we will in future become more and more dependent on alternative sources of finance for large infrastructure projects, and we must be ready for this future.

Speaker, I want to thank the Department for their commitment and dedication under the leadership of the HOD Graham Paulse and I want to thank my Ministry for their support. I thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister Bredell. I recognise the hon Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much, Speaker. Thanks to MEC Bredell for his input. As the African National Congress we do not support this Adjustment Budget Vote for the Department of Local Government. It is clear that DA "cadre deployment" continues to happen in DA-run municipalities and that also DA political interference in our municipalities continues unabated, and I would like to share with this House an affidavit which directly implicates MEC Simmers who is also the Leader of the Democratic Alliance in this province, and I quote from the affidavit which says:

“Councillor Steenkamp clearly stated...”

This is now a DA councillor from Kannaland:

"...that she was under tremendous pressure from MEC Simmers to follow the instructions pertaining to the appointment of Keith Jordaan as acting

MM."

Now this is not the MEC for Local Government, this MEC Bredell is the MEC for Local Government, but here is this MEC directly intervening. I continue:

"I got the sense that MEC Simmers wanted to have Jordaan appointed at all costs and he was leaving no stone unturned in getting Jordaan appointed as the acting MM of Kannaland. There was a determined effort from Simmers in pursuit of this endeavour to have Jordaan appointed as acting MM. During the meeting, and after the meeting also, Councillor Steenkamp..."

A DA councillor for that matter, colleagues:

"...emphasised that she is under tremendous pressure from MEC Simmers to get Jordaan appointed. Steenkamp literally begged us in this regard."

Now here you have an MEC who is trying to do his job but, hon Speaker...

[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, please take your seat. Hon Chief Whip of the Majority Party, is that a point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE MAJORITY PARTY: Yes it is a point of order

Speaker. Speaker, I rise on Rule 59, it cannot be that the Leader of the Opposition quotes from an affidavit that none of us has seen and he must bring a substantive motion, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much hon Deputy Chief Whip. Hon members, the Chief Whip rose on Rule 59. I am listening very carefully. I think that the Leader of the Opposition has stated that he is reading from an affidavit so he is not making those allegations. I will consult Hansard and revert back.

Hon Leader of the Opposition, I am just again cautioning you that if you want to bring the attention of the House to any improper behaviour or motives to any member, to please do so through a substantive motion, but I will allow you to continue.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you and just to share with the House and hon ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, please take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon Dugmore, please take your seat. Hon Mvimbi, is that a point of order?

Mr LL MVIMBI: Yes, on the possibility of the House being misled because Rule 59 says:

“No member may impute improper motives on;

(b) reflect on the integrity or dignity of, or verbally abuse another

member;

- (2) A member who wishes to bring any improper unethical conduct on the part of another member to the attention of the House may do so only by way of substantive motion comprising a clearly formulated and properly substantial ...”

So hon Dugmore has done none of those.

The SPEAKER: Hon, thank you very much hon Mvimbi for... [Interjections.]

Order! Order members! [Interjections.]

Order members! Members, order members! Hon Mvimbi, I have ruled exactly as you read the Rules. Thank you very much for reinforcing the ruling. Hon Dugmore, please continue.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much, and the affidavit goes on to say:

"...that Jordaan was eventually appointed as the acting MM on 21 October 2022, but shortly thereafter his appointment blew up in the media for the blatant illegality attached thereto. Jordaan was ineligible to be appointed to senior management in Local Government because he was found guilty of financial misconduct at his previous employer, the George Municipality..."

And it goes on to say Simmers was previously a councillor of George

Municipality and he knew that Jordaan was subject to an internal disciplinary hearing and subsequently found guilty of financial administration. This is clearly a case where the opinion of a politician, Simmers, was allowed to subvert the basic procedures of public administration.

So this is what we have because when, for instance, through you Chair, MEC Bredell talked a bit about energy, this very same Leader of the Democratic Alliance who is here as an MEC, had a situation where another friend of his, and I am saying this directly, that the Mayor of Hessequa, Mr Grant Riddles was recorded, and those recordings are with the Democratic Alliance, and in those recordings the Mayor of Hessequa, Mr Riddles, is heard telling a housing beneficiary of the very portfolio of the MEC: "No-no-no, not worry if your income is not right, †jy moet net daar skryf dat jy het nie inkomste nie." [you must just write there that you don't have an income.]

Now that is a situation where this MEC that I am referring to, the colleague of MEC Bredell, is the MEC for Housing and his own Mayor is recorded as telling people to commit fraud. What has the Democratic Alliance ever done about that and there is a case, MAS nommer 5306/2023 ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, hon members, hon Dugmore. [Interjections.] Order members! Hon Dugmore, I wish to just draw your attention to the relevance of the Budget, so I am listening for that, we are nearly four minutes into your speech. Can you just get back to the Budget? Order members!

Mr C M DUGMORE: There is much in the Budget about allocations to electricity, but yet the other day with the same Mayor, and this is about Local Government, it is about the Budget and in fact in the Adjustment the Premier of this Province was standing with the Mayor of Hessequa, someone who is openly accused and has a case against him for fraud announcing the new energy project.

Now the concern through you to MEC Bredell with all of the energy so-called resilience efforts, I don't believe that our Department and the MEC are paying enough attention as to what happens to the revenue stream from a municipality that is selling electricity once you have alternative power producers without proper thought as to what the cost of that electricity is actually going to be, and that is affecting the budgets and it will affect the budgets because we know and this is a stat that we quoted yesterday, because people are actually paying less for Eskom power than they are for City of Cape Town power, because there is evidence and we have the proof of that, that for every R100, when you buy electricity for R100 from Eskom, we all know that you will get 42 units. When I am from Eskom, say you live in Kraaifontein but Eskom is providing, you are getting 42 units, but now you are living in say Bellville and you are buying your electricity from the DA-run City of Cape Town, for that same R100 you are only getting 23 units which is literally half. Now we have energy resilience and we are paying tens of millions to consultants and not a single consultant including on the Hessequa Project can tell us how much is that electricity actually going to

cost, and how much less of a revenue will the Municipality - and I think this is a critical issue because in the adjustment, Speaker, we are spending money on these issues and we don't know the consequences. So I also want to say that while we refer to cadre deployment and the issue of interference, there is an MM in the Garden Route District Municipality, also a close associate of MEC Simmers. His name is Monde Stratu, and it is clear that this particular official has received R5 million more than he was actually entitled to as the MM, but because he is a DA deployee there is no consequences, and even one of our councillors that had to go to Court because of the intimidation, in the Garden Route District Municipality has had to go to Court because they have been intimidating her for her work in MPAC. This particular councillor of ours is doing work on MPAC. She is asking questions, but the very DA leadership in that council are intimidating her because the truth is starting to come out. So what you have ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, your time has expired. Please conclude.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...so this is why there is no hope. This is why there is no hope, †want hulle is skurke, die DA is skurke [because they are thugs, the DA are thugs.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you very much, hon Dugmore. I now recognise... Hon members, please, the next member will participate through the virtual platform, hon Klaas.

Mr T KLAAS: Thank you, Speaker. Thank you, Speaker. I am now opening my file, I will be quickly talking to you about this, and it is clear that... [Incomplete.] Okay.

The 2021/22 Audit-General Report of the Western Cape's six municipalities showed the [Inaudible.] in the audit accounts. These are the municipalities which received unqualified audits with findings. The highlights concerned include adequate performance indicators, deficiencies in ...[Inaudible.] delivery, irregular expenditures and incomplete reporting, among other things. All this happened before the Provincial Government department which is trusted and mandated to monitor, coordinate and support municipalities in the province in the fulfilment of their service delivery mandate and disaster management.

So, if all goes wrong, it means that this municipality department was caught sleeping and is useless. It is not enough, certainly, not once, for this municipality to brag about the municipality which obtained clean audit outcomes whereas other municipalities are neglected. It is not the mandate of this Department to selectively accede certain municipalities of which the majority is the DA Government.

The majority of the DA-run municipalities do not make provision for emergency houses. However, they are quick to run to Court to demand eviction orders of our people in the municipality. The dilemma after that comes when the Court orders eviction and directing this municipality to offer

alternative accommodation as close as possible to where the people currently reside. In the most cases, the municipality caught in this conduct ...
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Klaas, your time has expired. Please conclude.

Mr T KLAAS: ...then the painful part about all of this is that it comes to the cost of taxpayers' money being wasted. For this reason the EFF does not support this Vote.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Klaas. Your time has expired. Thank you very much.

Mr T KLAAS: Thank you. [Inaudible, audio distortion.]

The SPEAKER: I recognise the hon Sileku. Hon Sileku, I have recognised you and your time is running.

Mr I M SILEKU: Thank you very much, Somlomo. Good afternoon, †goeiemiddag en middag aan u, [good afternoon and good afternoon to you] hon members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament.

Firstly Speaker, let me start on a sad note and convey my sincere condolences to one of the councillors in KwaZulu-Natal who was a Chief Whip of uMngeni Municipality, councillor Ndlovu, who has unfortunately succumbed

to death within this week, and also convey my sincere condolences to the African National Congress on their loss yesterday and also I would like to congratulate the previous speaker for sinking the Titanic ship and being an iceberg yesterday in Saldanha. Hon Klaas, congratulations on beating this organisation that is failing.

†Ons wag net vir die reuk want ons weet hulle is al klaar dood.

[We are just waiting for the smell because we know they are dead already.]

Speaker, what is important also, I would like to also add a few or two minutes of my time on the lecture that was sponsored by hon Dugmore and member Nkondlo on the issue of gender-based violence, and you know why I want to be one of the appointed speakers in this particular subject is because they only talk and no action, and I want to, because hon Dugmore, through you Speaker, has been the chief negotiator for a coalition government in Theewaterskloof.

Ja, he was a chief negotiator, I was there when I first had my meeting, I left and then he entered with Greyton and they then negotiated, and they then contributed to the state of affairs that is currently taking place in Theewaterskloof.

Let us deal with the issue of gender-based violence. It is very disappointing when I wrote a media statement, you know about one of their leaders and member of the Provincial Executive Committee of the African National

Congress, who has been alleged and attended Court twice for hitting an employee in Theewaterskloof. To my surprise none of the members of the PEC has actually come out and has actually gone and rebuked ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order members! Order!

Mr I M SILEKU: They were there ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sileku, please take your seat. Hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much Speaker. Speaker, I would like you to call the member to be relevant to the debate that we are having which is the Budget Vote of Local Government. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much hon Kama. Thank you very much for trying to assist me. I do not need assistance from the floor. I am listening very carefully and I am going and as part of being consistent I will allow the same latitude as I did for the Leader of the Opposition. Hon Sileku, please continue.

Mr I M SILEKU: No, Speaker, thank you very much, we are dealing with Local Government here and it is important, because we take the tune from the Leader of the Official Opposition. He is leading and we are following, and also Speaker, what is important is that I just want to show what the ANC,

they always just talk but no action, because one of the issues – let me tell you, Speaker, through you, the ANC knows very well that there has been something that has been trending about gender based violence in the municipality that is governed by them with our coalition partners, where employees have been suspended left right and centre, where females have been victimised with their support and they are keeping quiet and now they come to come to this House, Speaker, and they want to ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sileku, hon members, Hon Sileku I was going to ask you to start turning to the Budget now. You may continue.

†Mnr I M SILEKU: Soos hulle sê die waarheid maak seer want hulle kan dit voel.

[Mr I M SILEKU: As they say, the truth hurts because they can feel it.]

From the inception of these debates we have consistently heard phrases such as, and I quote: "Absorbing of the wage bill and budget cut" echoing through this, through our discussions. In the face of the substantial budget cuts, thanks to the usual suspects and the near liquidated ANC, we remain undeterred. Our commitment to accountability and effective governance has driven this DA-led Government to reprioritise fines leading to a substantial increase in the Development and Planning Programme spending. In stark contrast to DA governance, provinces governed by the ANC and their allies have been employing cadres and unqualified individuals in key municipal positions, jeopardising proper service delivery for residents.

To give you just one example how they manipulate systems in terms of appointing cadre deployment officials, what they are currently doing, Speaker, in our municipalities, they are actually suspending competent people so that they do not get an opportunity to apply, and what they do they would actually appoint their own members and then force unions in agreeing with them so that they can actually short-list people who do not have qualifications, and that is what is happening in terms of cadre deployment. They are also doing this, Speaker, in terms of cadre deployment exploiting the need and the plight of the young people in our municipalities via EPWP. They appoint them and then on weekends they must go and do and sign up memberships. That is what they do in their municipalities. What a shame!

†Wat 'n skande!

[What a disgrace!]

We must put an end to this practice to ensure the people of the Western Cape receive the quality services they deserve.

Speaker, it is not surprising that when the Department fulfils its constitutional obligation in ensuring good and accountable governance, the ANC spreads their propaganda †en verdraai die waarheid. Dit is tipies ANC-taal en tekens van 'n sterwende party wat enigiets sal doen om aan die lewe te bly. Sies! [and distorts the truth. That is typical ANC language and signs of a dying party that will do anything to stay alive. Siss!]

I am proud to share that the Western Cape has earned the most clean audit opinions from the Auditor-General, receiving more clean audits than the rest of the country combined.

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr I M SILEKU: The dedication to transparency and effective management sets us apart. Where the ANC-led provinces and municipalities face collapse, the DA Province continues to be the shining example of good governance. *Somlomo.*

Despite facing a reduction of R2,88 million from the Equitable Share allocation, this Government has diligently managed the aftermath of the disastrous Public Wage Bill that caused these cuts. It is therefore critical that we get back our money from the National Government and the Western Cape Government has rightfully initiated an intergovernmental dispute against the National Government. We further understand the importance of fiscal responsibility and we are committed to navigating through challenges to safeguard the province's well-being.

Hon Speaker, I further welcome the allocation of R64 million towards the pilot on renewable energy solutions for municipalities. This is indeed, investment is a continuation of this Government's commitment towards addressing the energy crisis caused by a visionless, focusless ANC-led

Government.

As we approach 2024, I want to emphasise that this is our absolute last chance to save South Africa from disaster. The residents of the Western Cape hold the power to make a difference by voting for a government that works like the Democratic Alliance in the Western Cape. We stand united in our commitment to clean governance, accountability, and the well-being of our people. The Democratic Alliance will forge with determination in fighting for you, the residents of the Western Cape. The DA supports this Budget.

†Baie dankie. [Thank you.] *Enkosi kakhulu.*

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much honourable hon Sileku. I now recognise the hon Minister, Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Speaker, thank you very much. I want to start off with the hon Klaas, I struggled to hear you, hon Klaas, but I do accept that you had a very exciting and long evening, so I think that you are on the wrong budget of 2021/22, if I heard you correctly, as well as the wrong Budget Vote. This is Local Government and not Housing. But, to get to the hon Dugmore, hon Speaker, it is very sad that the hon Leader of the Opposition is actually misusing freedom of speech to get to another colleague in this House where he knows that the Public Protector is investigating, and let us then wait and see the outcome, and my colleague will be found

innocent, and I can tell this House that never ever had my colleague expected me as the Minister of Local Government or requested anything from me to do outside the realm of the law and the rule of law, because we are strict on the rule of law. We want all municipalities to work and we will do our utmost best to get them to work, because that is to the benefit of the people. That is why we want Knysna to work, although we are not in control, because it is about the people of Knysna, and I understand that the MEC will come down this weekend and meet with the structures of the ANC to discuss their by-election but they must ask them to postpone that investigation and the hon Leader of the Opposition must get in his car and go to Knysna because where we must try and make 30 municipalities work, they have got one to focus on. Come and help us to get Knysna's water back on standard. Come and help us to get the sewerage up and running. Come and help us to clean up the town, so that we can show the people we care, and then hon Speaker, they can claim the victory because we understand that the people are not blind. But they will not come to Knysna. They will not come to Knysna and if they come to Knysna they will not find their own people there, because they run away, they do not know how to fix the problems.

Hon Chairperson, and then if we look at the cost and the cost of electricity, the cost is actually much more than just electricity. We are very worried about the whole Municipal Bill at the end of the day, and the hon member of the Opposition must really go and look at the municipalities where they are in control, Beaufort West, Kannaland, how they ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...their levies and their tax, it is a concern for all of us, but to the electricity I can tell the hon member that at least in the City of Cape Town we do have electricity, so yes, maybe it is more expensive but at least there is energy Eskom does not have. But what the hon member, what the hon member of the Opposition also hides away like he is very selective with the truth, if you go to the Census, the province that has the best basic services, as well as the most free basic services on all basic services, electricity, sanitation, refuse removal, is the Western Cape.

Now if we have dealt with the poor and we give them a dignified life, services for a dignified life, the rest must pay, hon Speaker. That is discipline. The rest must pay. ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order members!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: There is no such thing as free basic services, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS

AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Speaker, and maybe we must be clear on this. No, what I am saying is there is nothing ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order Minister, speak to me. Order members!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Chair, there is no such thing as free basic services. Somebody pays, okay, so our free basic services to the people, who cannot afford services, is to secure the dignified life to them. Those who can pay must pay, that is discipline... ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order Minister, please take your seat.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...and we will put the systems in place ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Minister, please take your seat. Minister, please take your seat. Hon members! [Interjections.] Hon Minister, please take your seat. Members! Hon members, on both sides of the House, you are drowning out the Minister on the floor. [Interjection.] Hon Nkondlo! [Interjections.]

Order! Hon Marran, hon Marran, hon Marran! Colleagues, the Minister is on the floor. You have all had an opportunity to contribute to this debate. It is now the Minister's opportunity to respond. My apologies Minister, you may

continue.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Agbare Speaker, die waarheid maak baie seer. Ons droom vir ons mense is eintlik om baie - om die pakket van gratis basiese dienste... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Speaker, the truth hurts a lot. Our dream for our people is actually to have many – to the package of free basic services... [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon members, we are nearing the end of this Vote, if you do not agree with the content or the input by the Minister, there are other mechanisms available to you to challenge that, but for now the Minister is on the floor, and the Minister is the one that has an opportunity to respond. Hon Minister, you may continue.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Agb Speaker, ja, ek het gelukkig baie tyd. *Hon* Speaker, ons droom vir ons mense is om basiese dienste, gratis basiese dienste te vergroot, want ons het studies gedoen. Om vandag 'n menswaardige lewe te hê moet jy eintlik 150 eenhede krag hê. Jy moet eintlik 10 kiloliter water hê. Die rede hoekom ons nie daar kom nie is omdat die ANC die land faal. Die ANC faal die ekonomie. Die ANC het ons land so korrup gemaak dat ons nie die ekonomie kan bou nie. Dit is soos wanneer -

die agbare Dugmore was vreeslik vandag op *basic income* en hoe die DA nou mense se lone nie wil betaal nie. Hy praat nie oor die 34% mense wat nie werk het nie, wat geen lone het nie, danksy die ANC. Danksy hierdie mislukte regering van ons.

Agb Speaker, ek sluit af deur my agb Voorsitter te bedank vir sy oorsigrol, vir die rol wat hy speel om ons op ons tone te hou, en ten laaste aan die agb Voorsitter ook, dat wat die agb Opposisie nooit sal erken nie is die ondersoeke wat gelei het tot aksies in DA-beheerde rade, want ons het ook stout kinders, soos in Mosselbaai in *Garden Route* en ondersoeke in George was geïnisieer deur my, deur ons wat die Hawks ingestuur het en hulle tot orde geroep het deur ondersoeke, en as iemand moet tronk toe gaan sal hulle tronk toe gaan want ons gaan nie korrupsie verdedig nie. Dankie, Speaker.

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Speaker, yes, I fortunately have a lot of time. Hon Speaker, our dream for our people is to expand basic services, free basic services, because we have done studies. To have a dignified human life today you must actually have 150 units of power. You must actually have 10 kilolitres of water. The reason why we don't get there is because the ANC is failing the country. The ANC is failing the economy. The ANC has made our country so corrupt that we cannot build the economy. It's like when – the hon Dugmore has today been a lot onto basic income and how the DA does not want to pay people's wages. He does not speak about the 34% of people who do not work, who have no wages, thanks to the ANC. Thanks to this failed Government of ours.

Hon Speaker, I conclude by thanking my Chairman for his oversight role, for the role he plays to keep us on our toes, and finally to the hon Chairman as well, what the hon Opposition will never admit are the investigations that led to actions in DA-controlled councils, because we also have naughty children, as in Mossel Bay in the Garden Route and investigations in George were initiated by me, by us who sent in the Hawks and called them to order through investigations, and if someone has to go to jail they will go to jail, because we are not going to defend corruption. Thank you, Speaker.]

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie agb Minister.

[The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.]Hon members! [Interjections.]

Hon Marran, that is the end of the debate. Hon members, that brings us to the end of the debate for this Vote.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Can I just get – Minister, is there anyone else that you are waiting for, can we go? The Secretary will now read the Sixth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 8 – Mobility – Western Cape
Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B7–2023].

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Can I get some order before I

recognise the Minister. We are now on a new Vote, hon colleagues. I recognise the hon Minister of Mobility, Minister Mackenzie.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Speaker, hon Premier and fellow Cabinet members, hon Leader of the Opposition, hon members of the Western Cape Parliament, our head of department, Ms Marissa Moore, and her team, thank you for being here this afternoon, people of the Western Cape, the Ministry staff joining us today and my chief of staff from home, thank you for being here this afternoon in our first Adjustment Budget Vote.

We have a devastating backdrop to the 2023 Adjustment Appropriation Bill with National Government crippling the Western Cape's Budget and ability to provide services to the people of this province. Our residents have every right to the same services as the rest of the country and we are fighting for what is owed to them. It is unfathomable that the ANC National Government has cut our budget in a way that takes away healthcare services from those with no other options. Takes away education from children hoping for a better future and takes away refuge for those in desperate need of social services.

Hon Speaker, as in the ANC Western Cape are day visitors in this province from Cloud Cuckoo Land, it is that they do not live amongst us and feel the impact of national ANC policies on us every day, and yet they enjoy the lifestyle delivered by a competent and clean DA-led Government. It is for them to decide, are they on the side of the people of the Western Cape or are

they on the side of the National ANC? Because they cannot have both and they cannot continue their dual citizenship bouncing between this province and Cloud Cuckoo Land.

I want you to close your eyes for a minute, hon colleagues. I want you to consider someone just coming and shutting down your local clinic, closing your child's school, dismantling the construction project providing jobs for your community. This is what the ANC National Government has done.

Hon Speaker, the only logical conclusion is the ANC Western Cape does not wish to serve the people of this province. The ANC Western Cape supports cuts to school buildings, the ANC Western Cape supports cuts to infrastructure, the ANC Western Cape supports cuts to NGOs, the ANC Western Cape supports cuts to hospitals and clinics, the ANC Western Cape supports the punishment of people of the Western Cape, the ANC Western Cape hates the people of the Western Cape. What else can we conclude?

When it comes to mobility, hon members, we must remember that the current ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... fiscal situation compounds the existing crisis for transportation in South Africa. Our rail system has collapsed due to the plundering of PRASA and Transnet, amongst other entities, meant to

provide crucial services for citizens. Shameless plundering by ANC cadres as confirmed by the former member of the ANC yesterday in his resignation letter. A member that has been an ANC member in good standing for more than 60 years.

According to Stats South Africa over one decade between 2013 and 2023, there has been a 90% decrease in the number of passenger trips taken on South Africa's rail network ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... going from 422 million passenger trips between Jan and September 2013, to just 29 million passenger trips during the same period in 2023.

It is no coincidence that during these 10 years the Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa has been run to the ground by the ANC corruption, poor policies and mismanagement. That is how transportation or mobility has collapsed under the ANC watch in the last 10 years. Hundreds of thousands of Western Cape commuters have been forced to seek alternative, less affordable transport options. Petrol and transport costs eat into people's livelihoods across the boards.

The decline of freight network and logistics operations onto the road network, overburdening of the infrastructure and exasperating road safety

challenges, while communities in rural towns bear the brunt of increased volumes of trucks. Producers are battling to move goods to markets because of dysfunctional port operations, threatening our economy and businesses. We need to create jobs and opportunity.

Promises to formalise and subsidise the minibus taxi industries have been made by the ANC National Government over the last decades. From the 1995 National Taxi Task Team to the 2020 National Taxi Lekgotla, addressed by none other than the President of the country, plans to formalise and actively regulate the industry have not been materialised.

I could go on and on and on how the failure of the ANC National Government in national transport, or Mobility as we know it, has led to the crippling of the mobility in South Africa.

Hon members, we are also mindful of the very latest Stats SA report on population growth and migration. We are now the province with the third largest population in the country. Having surpassed the Eastern Cape, we have 16% of all international migrants in the country and over 1 million people who have migrated to our province from the Eastern Cape. We know there is an estimated population the size of Bloemfontein who will migrate to the Western Cape in the next 10 years. These migration dynamics alone translate into increased pressures to various facets of mobility, such as transport regulation, transport operations and of course traffic law enforcement.

Hon Speaker, if you consider the scale and complexity of transport and logistics in South Africa, and on top of the catastrophic fiscal situation, both which can be solely attributed to the ANC's mismanagement of this country, the task to improve mobility is colossal.

In the face of these challenges, as the DA Western Cape Government, we consistently punch above our weight, maximising resources to deliver services and hope for our people. Our mobility team especially has a track record for delivering innovative solutions despite serious obstacles and constraints.

We believe that the progressive and world class mobility ecosystem is essential to grow our economy and enable access and opportunities to every resident in the Western Cape. This is what a responsible and empowering government delivers. A functional, safe, reliable, competitive and affordable mobility ecosystem lies at economic growth, social and spatial transformation, job creation, well-being and safety of our province. It is a fundamental part of dignity for the citizens of the Western Cape.

The creation of Manoeuvrability Department as the first year, 1 April this year, demonstrates the Western Cape Government taking action to realise our vision for enabling mobility ecosystem. We cannot sit †handjies gevou[hands folded] waiting on the ANC National Government to fulfil the empty promises to fix rail and make progress with the formalisation of the minibus

taxi industry.

We will continue to push for these promises to be fulfilled and supporting where we can, but in the meantime we are at work on developing solutions with our partners. There are exciting private sector initiatives in the Mobility space and we need to enable these innovators to help transform these sectors. Harnessing technology is critical to resilience and being able to thrive in a changing world.

Our Department has demonstrated innovation and excellence in developing its information and technology systems. This includes the integrated transport hub which has developed beyond an internal system to be shared with municipalities and other role-players to enhance safety in the province holistically.

Our freight demand management system, which sheds light on the opportunities to tackle challenges for logistics and freight movement, is a tool helping to navigate the Transnet mess at our ports and ailing freight rail. The DA Western Cape Government stands in the gap and delivers where the ANC Government has failed in many other aspects.

For the 2023/2024 financial year I am proud of how our new Mobility Department has managed its budget pressures and have contributed to the Western Cape overall budget pressures and overall shortfall caused by in-year budget cuts. Budget cuts which had been orchestrated by the ANC

National Government.

It was so aptly put this morning by the Premier that there was a contract signed between the National Government and all our nine provinces. When you pass and approve the Budget, which this Western Cape Parliament has also done, that is a contract that you signed for the year. And in-year willy-nilly without notice you decided to cut that budget. That is a budget that you cut into the services to people of this province and many other provinces. You have broken a contract that was approved by Parliament and our colleagues on that side of the House do not seem to get it.

Our Department has prioritised the impact of the National Transport Operation Grants with an additional allocation to R2,109 million so that this subsidy, which has not been sufficiently increased by the National Government, can be maximised for providing safe, affordable and reliable public transport for communities via our Golden Arrow Bus Services, which provided great service to people of the Western Cape.

An additional R60 million has been allocated to bolster the George integrated public transport network, our best in-class public transport system which is the partnership between us, the Local Government and our National Government. It is also the first transformation project done in collaboration with the minibus taxi industry in South Africa.

The GoGeorge bus services is an excellent indicator of the tenacity and

commitment of the Western Cape Government to deliver services to the communities. Our transport operations team led ably by Ms Deidre Ribbonaar, has spearheaded this project for 10 years, developing a world class bus service covering 150 kilometres over 34 routes, employing almost 400 staff members, operating 4 million trips annually, that can cover 70% of households in George, and we have to thank those teams, they deliver an incredible service. Newly launched for the people of Thembalethu.

The most recent passenger satisfaction survey indicates overwhelmingly that passengers save money, they feel safe and they can rely on getting where they need to be on time. That is how mobility works and that is how you build an economy.

This year the team has succeeded with their service. The rollout was years in the making, but we have not given up or have not backed down for delivering this service to the community of Thembalethu so they can access opportunities, education, social and Government service. The DA-led Government sticks to its promises and delivers.

Our dedicated and well-equipped Provincial Traffic Services constantly go above and beyond the call of duty. They are using data and predictive modelling for more effective planning of operations. Our teams actively safeguard residents and visitors across the road network. I am proud to announce that in 2024 our renowned Gene Louw Traffic College will welcome a new cohort of 120 traffic officers, building safety and well-being

in the future of this province, with an expanded Provincial Traffic Services. That is what a capable and competent Government do.

These positions are in high demand with more than 15 000 people submitting applications in response to the opportunity to be trained in a top quality facility in the country.

Our DA-led Western Cape Government creates opportunities and thrive. The impact and results of our Provincial Traffic Law Enforcement are remarkable. The investments – I must learn from Gauteng. Hon member, the Gauteng Provincial Government does not have a Traffic Services. The Western Cape Government is the only 24-hour Provincial Traffic Services.

A simple Google will show you, hon member, and you have got access to the internet provided freely by this capable Western Cape Government ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... [Inaudible.]...

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... will show you in the last six months ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... their law enforcement officers have crashed 22 brand new BMWs. They did not get the enabling legislation by National ANC Minister Bheki Cele, who was gallivanting around the World Cup using taxpayers' money [Inaudible.]...

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... for his executive assistant, while we were working to get the job done in the Western Cape. So there is absolutely nothing to learn from the Gauteng Government.

The impact and the results of our Provincial Traffic Law Enforcement is remarkable. The investment that we made in technology is equipping our officers and they are bearing fruit. In the past year we have seen significant reductions in our crash and fatality statistics over critical holiday periods. These officers will be focused on traffic enforcement and road safety, but the impact multiplies for the overall safety in communities in the Western Cape.

Hon member, our Western Cape Government is relentlessly pursuing economic growth to create jobs and opportunities for better life for residents in the Western Cape. The Mobility Department in partnership with the Department of Economic Development and Tourism has developed an

innovative pilot project to address the barriers of transport costs to finding employment.

We will provide free public transport to job seekers by leveraging our existing subsidy to Golden Arrow Bus Services, which primarily services low income areas and is already running off-peak buses with underutilised capacity.

So next year if members of that side of the House do not make it, this Job Seeker Free Transport Vouchers will be available for them as well to look for jobs. The Job Seeker Transport Voucher Pilot Project has been allocated R7,5 million ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... in the 2023/2024 financial year. This is our commitment to improve access to job opportunities for everyone, including former members of this House.

Hon members as we develop an integrated transport system in the Western Cape, we are clear that our mandate to provide sound regulation and enforcement to ensure the safety of all commuters. Unlike the ANC Government who has allowed the chaos in a poorly regulated and under supported minibus taxi industry to devastate the public transport sector. In the Eastern Cape we see the detrimental consequences of Government not

standing firm on the rule of law.

The ANC has failed commuters and communities by handing over power to elements of the taxi industry to create chaos. The DA-led Government is resolute in our commitment to address the complex challenges in the industry. Whilst we have a firm stance on regulation and enforcement, we also believe that the transformation and empowerment of the minibus taxi industry is a critical priority. Our Minibus Taxi Task Team was created this year to expedite progress on formalising the minibus taxi industry, which is a vital part of our mobility ecosystem in the Western Cape.

The minibus taxi industry is not going away and as the Western Cape Government we firmly believe in working with them to formalise and supporting them.

Following minibus taxi stay-away in August 2023, which cost the Province billions of rands and much loss of life, the minibus taxi [Inaudible.] working intensely to address key issues to bring stability to the industry and find ways to improve existing service to our commuters. These include:

- The review of the operating licence conditions;
- To provide increased clarity for transport operators and enforcement officials on the roadside.

We are working closely with the City of Cape Town on an alternative operating model for ranking facilities to address key infrastructure constraints.

The DA-led Government is hard at work on solutions taking responsibility for what is in our control. We are funding over R1 million towards the Road Safety Implementation Programme, enabling under-capacitated municipalities to improve mobility and protect vulnerable road users. This include R500 000 for non-motorised transport infrastructure in the Swartland and R570 000 towards integrated transport planning in the Garden Route District Municipality.

Our provincial Sustainability Programme is a progressive programme to show leadership in taking our mobility system into the future. One of the simplest ways of changing a person's life is about empowering them with a bicycle. This tool opens up opportunities by enabling you to travel further with many minimal costs, just bicycle maintenance. There is a myriad of proven benefits, like physical health, mental health, safety and social connections.

In this financial year our Bicycle Distribution Programmes continue to make a difference in communities across the Western Cape, distributing hundreds of bicycles to improve mobility and access to opportunities. The programme works with partners organisations to ensure there is adequate support for recipients. I myself have taken up cycling recently and experience all the benefits on being on two wheels powered by my own steam. It is incredible

to see – thank you, hon Premier – and I am encouraging my fellow colleagues on the other side to please join us as well.

It is incredible to see the City is transforming around us. More and more food deliveries are being done on E-bikes. Courier and delivery companies using futuristic looking electrical vehicles. More and more charging stations are being established. I have the utmost respect for the tenacious first movers who have been fighting an uphill battle against the dominant car culture in our country. This green mobility champions might have seen out of place in a hopeless minority a while ago, but just wait, one day soon we will wake up in the future and realise the world has changed.

Hon members, our Government Motor Transport entity is a hub of innovation having created the first Electrical Vehicle Strategy in the country and making strides in greening our fleet of vehicles. The same team is also playing a leading role in developing a Western Cape drone strategy for drone usage, a mobility opportunity service or access service for our Western Cape Government.

This week Dr Nomafrench Mbombo and I celebrated the latest milestone in our ongoing commitment to the safety and wellbeing of our communities through replacing and enhancing our emergency medical fleet services in our provinces. A trench of 114 new and replacement vehicles collaboratively customised by GMT and our EMS teams, has recently gone into service at EMS stations across the province ahead of a critical festive seasons.

In a normal society I would have said we do not want to use the service, but it is the festive season period and unfortunately there are going to be irresponsible users on our roads that will have to use this great service provided by the Western Cape.

I want to take the opportunity and thank our new Head of Department, Ms Marissa Moore, and our senior management team for the work to develop this Adjustment Appropriation under trying circumstances. I want to thank our CFO, Mr Francois de Wet, Ms Reniel Davis and her team who have put in many hours to support the Head of Department in crafting our Adjustment Budget in this new Mobility Department.

Hon Speaker, the DA-led Western Cape Government is about progress, responsibility and getting things done. We are working hard with other departments to make sure that the economy and jobs are protected through connecting people and getting goods to opportunities.

Mobility is rebuilding and developing innovative solutions for the future, focusing on moving forward no matter the challenges. We are doing this for the children and family who rely on us to enable their education, well-being, jobs, growth and ultimately hope in the thriving province, and for the businesses, entrepreneurs and informal traders who need certainty for their goods and dreams to make a success of their lives.

Hon members and colleagues, I firmly believe in hope and future in our beautiful country. For all the deeply distressing problems we face. They are beacons of hopes of light where good people are working hard to turn our prospects around.

A week ago there was a flurry of excitement on social media as PRASA announced the resumption of the Shosholoza Meyl long distance trains between Johannesburg and Cape Town, as well as Durban's. These trains are the backbone of an affordable travel connecting families across the country. I welcome these signs of progress towards a functioning rail system with trains running smoothly and I will continue to support my colleagues in National and Local Government to do what is in the best interest of our citizens.

Today I call an hon members across the aisle to do the right thing and advocate to their national colleagues to take our transport crisis seriously. We need the National Minister to show leadership and take action to formalise the minibus taxi industry, unlock the challenges in our port and get both freight and passenger freight properly back on track. Instead of sitting here criticising the highly effective DA-led Government in the Western Cape, how about the hon members get busy working on solutions to fix the problems the ANC has created.

Hon Speaker, to conclude, I want to illustrate the excellence and effectiveness of our Mobility Department to our most direct service offering

for the people of the Western Cape. This festive season we have over 583 provincial traffic officers deployed across the Western Cape. These men and women will not have a Christmas holiday with their families. No braai, no visit to the beach, no opening of gifts with their kids. They will be patrolling vehicles, keeping the N1, N2, R300 and any other routes safe for all of us.

The influx of traffic in and out of the Western Cape will surge dramatically over the next few weeks. Our officers will be working hard to ensure that everyone reaches their destination and their loved ones safely. Our focus this festive season is highly visible enforcement on all roads, targeting alcohol, fatigue, public transport and speed. As far as possible we aim to maximise enforcement coverage across our road network rather than being limited to static operations in certain locations.

The festive season plan includes mandatory operation and specific intervention that are part of our alignment to our United Nations decade of action on road safety with a goal to reduce road fatalities by 50% in the year 2030.

Our operational priorities are also informed by advanced analytics and predictive modelling for each specific area. Our daily operations across the district in the province include high visibility across all areas, monitoring moving violation offenses, speed enforcement, including average speed over distance monitoring, and roadblock to detain drunk driving, driver fatigue and passenger overloading, as well as enforcing seatbelt usage and checking

documentation, driver fitness and vehicle operations.

On top of these daily operations we have a comprehensive programme of interprovincial corridor operations in collaboration with our neighbouring provinces in the Northern Cape and the Eastern Cape. We also have driver awareness interventions focusing on alcohol for public transport operators and integrated fatigue operations on key routes.

I want to emphasise that while our teams have enhanced programmes and operations during these critical periods, they tackle these issues 365 days a year. These interventions are conducted on an ongoing basis. We strive for safer mobility through structured traffic law enforcement interventions with effective road safety education, communication and awareness programmes to positively influence all road users towards improved behaviour on our road network in the Western Cape.

The core function of our Traffic Management Chief Directorate is to reduce road fatalities on crashes on provincial routes by ensuring that all road users comply with the rules of the road. We do this through intensive enforcement. Hon member, I want to urge all road users to spare a thought for our dedicated officers in blue this festive season. They will be working intensively and tirelessly to ensure everyone arrives safely to their loved ones.

We are just one week into the official festive season and I am dismayed by

the reckless behaviour we have seen on some parts of our roads. Behaviour such as trucks operating on prohibited routes and creating dangerous obstructions when they get stuck. Cyclists ignoring construction roads on closed roads and public transport operators putting the lives of passengers at risk. We have seen incidents of a taxi driver running away from the scene, including a bus driver.

Our weekly provincial traffic stats tell the story of the real costs of this behaviour. Last week 18 pedestrians were killed out of a total of 34 traffic fatalities. 80 people were arrested for driving under the influence of alcohol, including the driver of a minibus taxi carrying 12 people. That is irresponsible and reckless behaviour. One of these passengers did not survive the fatal crash the minibus was involved in, and further charges have been laid against the driver for reckless or negligent driving, amongst other. Those who take risks on our road must know that there are consequences.

At the launch of our Festive Season Road Safety Plan on Friday I made it clear that our Provincial Traffic teams are prepared for the holiday season with close to 600 Provincial Traffic officers deployed on our roads, but no matter how effective, dedicated and well-equipped these teams are, we need all road users to do their part in preventing traffic crashes. I would like to challenge my colleagues, hon members, to go into this festive season as road safety champions. My message to you is to go out and spread this message. See for yourself, check the vehicles are roadworthy, buckle up, do not drink and drive, do not speed and take rest breaks every 200 kilometres.

These simple actions will keep everyone safe and alive this festive season.
Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon member Dugmore, is that a point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker, yes, I have a point of order.

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: The point of order, hon Chairperson, is a very serious one. I think it is a matter of public record in this House that we have always maintained that when you have a situation where someone is charged with serious charges, that that person should have the benefit of the doubt to defend themselves and prove their innocence.

You are very much aware of the fact that in our midst today the Chief Director of Traffic stands charged criminally in the Cape Town Court. It is not nonsense, it is the truth.

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, what is your point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: And it is embarrassing that the very

person ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: ... so I want – my point of order
...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: My point of order is that – my point
of order is this ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: I have got a question.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: My point of order is this, my point of
order is this, that Mr Payne has every right to defend himself and prove his
innocence ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You cannot attack people [Inaudible.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: ... but you ...

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: You cannot have an official sitting in

this House, who is facing three criminal charges. It is just not fair to the official, it is not fair to this House, it is not a reflection on this Government, to the MEC, and I find it shocking that they are exposing an official to a situation like this. We cannot have an official of this ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: ... [Inaudible.] who is charged ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: He has every right to prove his innocence. We have never said anything other than that, but you cannot have someone in this House who is facing criminal charges. I am sorry.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: I want to object to that.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Dugmore. That is not a point of order, and whoever is in the gallery or in this House, it is – hon member Dugmore, the point is it is not a point of order and I have ruled on that, and whoever is in this House is here because they are entitled to be here.

I will now move on and I recognise the hon member Mvimbi. Hon member Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

After such a long speech you will have – actually the Provincial Minister's speech was even longer than the Premier himself.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Speaker, the ANC rejects this Adjustment Appropriation of the Department of Mobility with the contempt it deserves.

Hon Speaker, the MEC last week tabled the Medium-Term Budget titled:

"A budget to build your future."

No, hon Speaker, he probably meant a budget to build our future, referring to all of them in the Cabinet. They are just building their own future as Cabinet members.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr L L MVIMBI: hon Speaker, it has been a disastrous year for the

Department of Mobility, which was very weak and to a point of leaderless in solving the pressing matters facing our people in the province. Within a matter of four years that Department has actually has had four Ministers. So how is that for stability? Four years, four Ministers.

The Department revealed a deep-rooted historical divide that exists in the Western Cape where the rich are on one side and the poor on the other. This exacerbated, entrenched and exposed our outstanding fight to ever have an inclusive Western Cape under the DA-led Government. A Western Cape where its people live in harmony amongst one another with equal treatment, not the one they currently face under the DA-led Government.

Hon Speaker, in the Adjustment Budget for Vote 8 the Department has shifted funds of R13,5 million from the compensation of employees for savings realised due to cost containment measures. This again is not farfetched from their initial position towards the working class in the province, where they have the nerve to fight a Bill that seeks to uplift the lives of our people through better wage payments.

The Department has been aware of employees who participated in strike during the year in question, where this participation was due to failed wage negotiations.

Hon Speaker, this shift of funds came at the expense of vacant positions which the Department has been reluctant to fill. What is also important to

note is what was brought up during the Committee by one of their own members regarding paid vacant positions.

Hon Speaker, during the current financial year the Department made headlines for 124 traffic vehicles that have been purchased the previous year and has spent months in Government garages without being utilised for their intended purpose. This comes at the expense of our people having lost lives in road fatalities with an exacerbated increase of 22% in fatalities.

Hon Speaker, one must note that the DA-led Government always does things on a competitive basis with the National Government. We expect you to cooperate with the National Government, not to criticise it and actually not to compete with the National Government because we are not the National Government. You must accept that we are Provincial Government and at the same time they take resources meant for other programmes to create a programme ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... to compete with an existing one. They started a programme called Safely Home Programme, similar to Arrive Alive, and pump resources into it, yet these funds do not yield the required results of decreased road fatalities. Instead of running Arrive Alive campaign they have a Safely Home that started more than 10 years ago. Every time I ask what is this Safely Home Programme nobody can give definite answers on it.

So please cooperate with National Government, do not compete with National Government because you are not National Government. The vehicles purchased last year [Inaudible.]...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mvimbi ...[Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... distributed to different traffic departments across the province, but a delay was caused by defeating of cutting edge technology, which includes licence plate recognition cameras. The Department tends to want to use money which it failed to utilise in the current financial year.

This could be seen in the shifting of funds meant for goods and services to the transport equipment to the value of R604 000. Maybe we can expect another fleet of vehicles with this Adjustment.

Hon Speaker, during the Annual Budget period the Department presented a programme contribution that looks at improved public transport services, focusing on buses, passenger trains and minibus taxis. This programme is implemented through the Provincial Sustainable Transport Programme, which focuses on increased and improved bus services and in its wording it says that they managed to help the bus services, but if you ask them what have they done for the taxi industry they are quick to point you to National Government.

The Golden Arrow Bus Service contract for scheduled passenger bus services is administered by the Department of Transport and Public Works, which is now Mobility. Golden Arrow Bus Services operate more than 1 000 peak hour buses, transporting some 220 000 passengers daily. The Department and GABS work together and are subsidised to the value of R1,1 billion, and further added CCTV cameras on 80% of all the GABS.

The Provincial Minister during the Standing Committee when I asked about a taxi industry possible subsidy, the answer was obvious, National Government. They were very quick to provide R1 billion for the Safety Plan, but for the taxi industry they are not prepared to fund it. It signals and it illustrates a Government, the Safety Plan illustrates nothing else other than a government that is paranoid of its people. You are afraid of your own people that voted you into power and therefore you are making ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... a Safety Plan. That shows that you are paranoid ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mvimbi, hon ...[Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... that shows that you ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member ...[Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... are paranoid [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mvimbi, please take your seat. Hon Chief Whip, us that a point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, can I please ask that the hon member Mvimbi please speaks through you and not point this way, hon Speaker? †Baie dankie. [Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon member Mvimbi, hon member Mvimbi, you may continue. Please can I caution you and please speak to me.

Mr L L MVIMBI: It was quick for the Provincial Government to provide R1 billion for the Safety Plan because it is a Provincial Government that is paranoid of its own voters. They are protecting themselves against their own voters, but when we said fund an industry that transports two-thirds of the people, there is no money for that. They go to National Government, but for their own safety, for their own personal safety they are quick to take R1,1 billion, but for energy alternative because it is going to fund their own business friends, they are quick to take R1 billion. For the taxi industry no money.

The MEC during the ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr L L MVIMBI: So when I ask he says that they will not be able to subsidise the taxi industry. This will be possible only if the National Government funds it.

So it shows that we have got a Provincial Government that is not prepared to deliver to its own respective people. Taxis are responsible for about 75% of public transport in the province and transport about 1 million passengers daily. They are also responsible for serving areas that are not often covered by other public transport or licensed as an operating route.

About 22% of commuters use minibus taxi services and 9% of commuters use Golden Arrow Bus Services. MyCiti and Sibanya are also part of that 9%. 58% of commuters use private transport, while 10% walk.

Hon Speaker, the Department launched a Red and Blue Dot pilot programme meant to [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mvimbi, your time has expired. Please conclude.

Mr L L MVIMBI: So the ANC does not support this Budget. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Mvimbi. I now recognise – hon members, hon member Klaas is online. I am asking for your indulgence.

Hon member Klaas, I recognise you.

Mr M T KLAAS: Thank you, hon Speaker.

I am left wondering why is the Mobility Transport Budget to be increased by more than R23 million only for those funds to be transferred to the Department of Infrastructure and the Premier. What is more puzzling is that the Department of Infrastructure cut its own budget by more than R259,6 million in the same financial year.

It does not make sense why on 30 November 2022 this Department terminated the Blue Dot Taxi Programme which provided incentives and rewards improved driving and a good passenger services within the taxi industry. This was a good incentive for the taxi industry and certain good passenger safety and the reduction of accidents and fatalities on the roads as taxi drivers will not drive recklessly whilst desperate to meet certain profit targets.

Not only did this Department cut the R215 million investment to the taxi industry under the Blue Dot initiative, afterwards it works in collusion with the City of Cape Town under the [Inaudible.] of P J Smith, to create chaos

and instability within the taxi industry, by beginning to impound taxis without valid reasons and outside the bounds and scope of the ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M T KLAAS: ... [Inaudible.] legislation.

Whilst financial taps have turned dry for the taxi industry in the province, Golden Arrow Bus Services continue to rake billions of taxpayers' money under the Public Transport Operations Grant, which flows from the National Department of Transport and the Provincial Department and straight to the private company. In the 2023 financial year alone Golden Arrow received a whopping ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M T KLAAS: ... R1,1 million in [Inaudible.] under this grant.

Clearly the Golden Arrow Bus Service gets preferential treatment over the Western Cape taxi industry as a whole. That is why, or that is the reason ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon ...[Interjections.]

Mr M T KLAAS: ... the EFF ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... member Klaas, your time has expired. Please conclude.

Mr M T KLAAS: ... does not support this Vote. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon member America.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Mvimbi, if I were you I would have bowed my head in shame trying to criticise this Department and this Government for appropriating money towards creating a safer environment for our people, because the Department of Transport and Infrastructure in the Eastern Cape, they did not only obtain a disclaimer audit opinion. They have incurred over R3 billion in irregular expenditure and on top of that they have incurred over R4 billion in fruitless and wasteful expenditure.

Now that is something that I would suggest you take up with your counterparts in the Eastern Cape and ask them to clean up their House.

So therefore, hon Speaker, despite ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr D AMERICA: ... massive cuts to the Budget brought about by an incompetent National ANC Government, the Western Cape Government, under the leadership of the DA, still found a way to shift money towards operational continuities and efficiencies, thus ensuring transport operations continue in the face of limited funding, so that we can build an interconnected transport system that gets people to and from work safely and cheaply, and amongst those shifts are, as the Minister has stated, R15 million towards the Provincial Sustainable Transport Programme, R2,109 billion towards project management for public transport operations, inclusive ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, thank you, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr D AMERICA: Inclusive of that ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members!

Mr D AMERICA: ... additional funding – come now. Thank you.

Inclusive additional funding of R56 686 000 towards the GoGeorge integrated transport network for the implementation of Phase 4A, and that is the

transport route towards Thembalethu, and R1 million towards the Road Safety Implementation Programme to make our roads safer for all. As the Western Cape continues to do more, the National ANC Government continues to do less and less.

So, hon Speaker, PRASA gave themselves a December deadline to fully reopen the Central Line in Cape Town, but again, like previous deadlines, this deadline had once again been missed. Since 2019 this line has been closed and little progress has been made to fully reopen this line. Let this sink in.

In the whole of President Cyril Ramaphosa's presidency and in his various Ministers of Transport, they were not able to open the most crucial railway line in the whole of Cape Town. It could see people getting to work for less than R8 in some cases. The National Government does not want to fix the Central Line because they are scared of creating competition for the taxi mafia bosses, who threaten a stayaway whenever they do not get what they want, but this Government will continue fighting for the full reopening of the Central Line, because we want to get people to work cheaply. A transport system where people can use buses, trains, taxis and bicycles to commute.

Hon Speaker, the cost of living crisis is becoming unattainable for people who cannot continue to spend the majority of their salaries just to get to work. Fixing the Central Line would save our most vulnerable citizens almost R1 400. As the cost of living just keep getting more unattainable, the

National ANC Government seems to have no solution. In fact they simply do not care to assist our commuters in the face of ever-increasing cost.

One of the simplest solutions to combat the cost of living has been right under our noses this entire time. Unfortunately it has become obscured by lack of capable leadership and a lack of empathy for our poorest citizens. Since the Central Line in Cape Town closed down in 2019, commuters are paying up to four times more for alternative means of transport. Using the taxi could be as high as R1 500 a month. A Golden Arrow bus ticket could cost about R900 a month, whereas a monthly train ticket costs a mere R175.

That means that if the ANC Government seriously is committed to reopening the Central Line and stops playing politics and shifting blame, they could save our most vulnerable communities R1 325 per month. That means not having to choose between commuting to work or putting a plate of food on the table.

Hon Speaker, the ANC has failed the people of the Western Cape and should without delay allow capable governments, i.e. the City of Cape Town, to take over passenger railways so that the people can start getting back to work while not having to spend the majority of their salary on transport costs.

The DA in the Western Cape welcomes the commitment by the Director General to work on allowing capable Metros to run passenger rail. The DG knows that devolution of passenger rail is the only logical solution, but also

the right thing to do. It is time for the ANC to embrace this opportunity. The resistance from the ANC-led National Government to devolve rail services is deeply rooted in outdated Stalinist ideology of centralisation, but the real fear is that the DA will run passenger rail services far better than they ever could.

Hon Speaker, the total collapse of passenger rail services looms large and it is real. The current state of affairs is dire, leaving people yearning for solutions as the need for reliable and cheap transportation becomes increasingly urgent. It is high time we embrace the only logical approach, the devolution of passenger rail services.

Communities like Khayelitsha, Langa, Nyanga, Heideveld, Netreg, Bonteheuwel and Mitchells Plain, have been left in the lurch, desperately seeking a lifeline to connect them to the heart of the Mother City. Passenger rail not only holds the key to unlocking the potential of millions of people, but also offers the most affordable public transport options available. The DA in the Western Cape welcomes the commitment by the DG of National Transport Department and his commitment to working towards allowing capable Metros to run passenger rail and we are ready.

So, hon Speaker, acknowledging this pressing need, the DA-led Western Cape Government is not simply sitting back waiting for the National Government, but has taken up the mantle of creating an integrated transportation system. Our colleagues in the City of Cape Town have allocated a substantial

R5,2 billion investment to expand the MyCiti Bus Services. Soon areas like Khayelitsha, Mitchells Plain, Nyanga, Hanover Park and many more will have the MyCiti buses going up and down their communities and will no longer have to rely on expensive taxi trips.

Moreover, the investment in MyCiti is projected to create over 10 000 job opportunities in the Metro South East communities. This is playing out against the backdrop of the National Minister of Transport, who is more interested in playing politics with her ANC cadre comrades to DG that recognises that the devolution of rail has ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr D AMERICA: ... tremendous potential. So, hon member Nkondlo, the DA delivers.

Hon Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr D AMERICA: ... taking inspiration from success stories like the GoGeorge bus services in George, the DA-run Western Cape is poised to revolutionise public transportation. GoGeorge's remarkable growth showcases the transformative power of well-executed transportation transport systems.

Unlike PRASA, GoGeorge has continued its upward trajectory, experience a remarkable 20% increase in passengers within a single year. While operating 23% more routes. Another R256 686 000 will be spent on GoGeorge this year to further improve the service. Under the leadership of the DA Government, GoGeorge remains the most affordable transportation option in the region.

It is time for the ANC to embrace this opportunity. Devolution of rail services to the Western Cape represents an opportunity to realise long overdue promises and provide much needed relief to communities so desperately in need.

†So, agb Speaker, dit is uitstekende werk wat gedoen word deur ons provinsiale verkeerswetbeamptes om misdaad aan te pak, en ons wil hulle bedank vir die risiko's wat hulle elke dag loop om ons gemeenskappe veilig te hou en te beskerm. Hulle pogings het gelei tot die konfiskering van bykans R20 miljoen se onwettige goedere, soos dwelms, perlemoen en gesteelde elektriese kables.

Die DA-beheerde Wes-Kaap sal voortgaan om meer te doen om ons gemeenskappe te beskerm terwyl die Suid-Afrikaanse Polisie diens aanhou om die mense van die Wes-Kaap teleur te stel en te faal.

Die afgelope finansiële jaar was 93 motoriste in hegtenis geneem vir pogings

om ons wetstoepassers om te koop. 27 ongedokumenteerde buitelanders was in hegtenis geneem op ons provinsiale en nasionale paaie. Daarenteen was 494 inhegtenisnames gemaak vir ander ernstige kriminele oortredings. Die boodskap is duidelik, ons wetstoepassers doen hul werk en is nie omkoopbaar nie.

My pleidooi is aan alle padgebruikers om die verkeersreëls te gehoorsaam en bedagsaam te wees teenoor alle padgebruikers. Moenie dronk bestuur nie, wees eerlik met jouself en met ander oor hierdie Kersgety. Reis veilig waarheen jy mag gaan en onthou veiligheid op ons paaie is ons almal se verantwoordelikheid.

Die Demokratiese Alliansie, agb Speaker, ondersteun die Begroting. Baie dankie.

[So, hon Speaker, it is outstanding work that is being done by our provincial traffic law officials to tackle crime, and we want to thank them for the risks they run every day to keep our communities safe and to protect them. Their efforts led to the confiscation of almost R20 million worth of unlawful goods, such as drugs, abalone and stolen electrical cables.

The DA-controlled Western Cape will continue to do more to protect our communities while the South African Police Service continues to disappoint and fail the people of the Western Cape.

The past financial year, 93 motorists were arrested for efforts to bribe our

law enforcement officers, 27 undocumented foreigners were arrested on our provincial and national roads. There were also 494 arrests made for other serious criminal offences. The message is clear, our law enforcement officers do their work and cannot be bribed.

My plea to all road users is to obey the traffic rules and be courteous towards all road users. Don't drink and drive, be honest with yourself and towards others during this Christmas season. Travel safely where you may go and remember safety on our roads is everybody responsibility.

The Democratic Alliance, hon Speaker, supports the Budget. Thank you.]

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie, agb lid America.

[The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member America.] I recognise the hon Minister, Minister Mackenzie.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Speaker. I am going to start on the point made by hon member Mvimbi, and which was also made by hon member Klaas online.

First of all let me just say congratulations, hon Klaas, for – we are eating that elephant one bite at a time, called the ANC. So well done on winning the ANC ward yesterday. They are dying a slow death and next year some of them will have to apply for provincial traffic officers jobs. So thank you very much for that.

Hon member Mvimbi and hon member Klaas, you both ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: You both mentioned the subsidisation matter, and I think it is important that we touch with it, and I want to repeat the numbers that I think hon member Mvimbi made, and yourself, but as said by Minister General Bheki Cele, you are crying at the wrong funeral.

The facts – and I will repeat what my colleague said, the hon member Mvimbi, and I paraphrase hon member Klaas, he had talked about – but I am going to use my figures because it is better to research as far as I know. Golden Arrow gets R1 billion, 220 000 passengers. The Gautrain gets ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... a R2 billion guaranteed at 30 000 passengers per day. That is the ANC. Rail currently transporting 90 000 passengers per day, which were the billions of subsidy they get. The taxi industry, as hon member Mvimbi rightfully says, nearly a million passengers a day at zero subsidy per day.

The only province, the only one out of the nine that bothered to woke up one

morning and said, "How can we subsidise the minibus taxi industry?" was this Western Cape Government. Whilst the National ANC was sleeping, †die ander agt provinsies sit handjies gevou heeldag ...[Tussenwerpsels.] [the other eight provinces are sitting hands folded all day ...Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

†Die MINISTER VAN MOBILITEIT: ...hulle kry *disclaimers* ...[Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... they get disclaimers ...[Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Order!

†Die MINISTER VAN MOBILITEIT: ... [Onhoorbaar.] hulle provinsies,

[The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ...[Inaudible.] their provinces,] this DA-led ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... Western Cape Government, led by this Government and their officials, came up with an innovative solution and try and fix the problem created by the ANC.

So, hon member Mvimbi ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... the best place to continue this debate, the best place to raise this issue like we do constantly, is with the ANC National Government.

That R2 billion that goes to transporting 30 000 passengers in Gautrain should be going to the minibus taxi industry. I ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... am coming to the Safety Plan because you do not ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... seem to understand why we had to implement a Safety Plan. Because your ANC has failed. Your Minister Bheki Cele has failed. Your Minister Bheki Cele, who cancelled the Gang Unit when he was General Bheki Cele, was the cause of us trying to implement a Safety Plan, but I am going to respond to that on page 3. Let me deal with this one first.

The reason, hon member Mvimbi, we are sitting with this problem is because the ANC National Government has skewed priorities. The ANC National

Government has allocated billions of rands ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... to the failed South African ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat.

Hon member Mvimbi, you had an opportunity to make your contribution to this debate. I have allowed you to make your contribution and the members accepted your contribution. The Minister has now an opportunity to respond. You cannot be in dialogue with the Minister.

Hon Minister, you may continue and please speak to me.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Speaker, I will speak to you.

Can I just say two of the members retorted the argument is tired. That is the problem in this country. Facts do not change because the day you change it. If the hon members used this opportunity two years ago, three years ago, four years ago, five years ago to heed our advice when we were sitting, I was a backbencher there, and said to them, "Please speak to your National colleagues, do not give R20 billion to SAA", †hulle het hulle mond stil gehou

[they kept their mouths shut.] That R20 billion that had gone to SAA could have gone to the minibus taxi industry, could have gone to fix public transport in the country. When we warned them, "PRASA is a dead patient. The patient cannot be revived," they refused to listen. They went to conferences where the National Minister Fikile Mbalula, the National Minister Radebe, they refused to tell their colleagues, "Please do not waste this money," †en hulle luister alweer nie vandag nie [and they are again not listening today..]

So, hon colleagues, please when you leave this House tonight, pick up your phone, phone National Minister Chikunga and ask her, "Give the billions of rands you are wasting on PRASA, give it to competent agencies. Devolve that power to competent governments like ourselves and the City of Cape Town." That is how you help save South Africa. †Hulle het dit nie gekry 10 jaar terug nie, hulle kry dit nog altyd nie vandag nie. [They did not get it 10 years ago, they still do not get it today.]

So the message is not going to get tired because facts do not change on the day you say. †Hulle moet luister en implementeer met hulle nasionale kollegas. [They must listen and implement with your national colleagues.] That is the problem. They do not like facts and they do not listen to facts.

So I am going to repeat the message. Next week, in a month from now, because the facts are not going to change. So hon member Mvimbi and hon member Klaas online, who is a defeater of the ANC in Saldanha, please, hon

colleagues, speak to your national colleagues, phone Minister Chikunga after this meeting and ask them to devolve the powers to competent governments like ourselves who actually can do the work.

Hon members – now, you see, that is the problem. The hon member says I must keep on dreaming. While ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... she wants to keep on dreaming, hundreds of thousands of people cannot get to work. The Central Line is standing still. People in Philippi, Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain cannot get to work. That is the reality ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... of the matters the hon members on my right do not seem to get.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon Minister, please take your seat.

Hon members – hon members! Hon members, you – hon members Mvimbi. Hon members, you are drowning out the speaker on the floor. I am going to address that now.

Hon Minister, you cannot respond to interjections and then expect not a response. I have asked you to speak to the Chair. Can you please do so.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hon Speaker, I am speaking via you, but let me be very – let me repeat that message. Let me repeat that message.

Hon Speaker, we on this House are not dreaming. We understand the collapse of rail, the collapse of Transnet, the collapse of the port, the collapse of the South African Police Services, the collapse of Crime Intelligence, the collapse of State Security, the collapse of South African Airways, were solely and purely the responsibility of the ANC, and if the members on that House would have taken the opportunity and made phone calls to their colleagues at National Parliament, rail possibly could have changed, Transnet at the ports could have changed, our rail system in Khayelitsha, Mitchells Plain and Philippi could have changed. Those are the facts. They do not like to hear the facts. That is not my problem because the facts do not change because they do not like them.

I am coming back to hon member Mvimbi's point on the Safety Plan. The hon member Mvimbi said we implemented the Safety Plan – let me quote his words. I do not want to misquote him:

"Because we are afraid of our people."

That is what the hon member Mvimbi said. Now that is a callous statement to

make. We implemented the Safety Plan because the hon member Mvimbi and his members, the ANC, have failed the people in this country. The hon member Mvimbi and his members, the ANC, have collapsed the South African Police Service. The hon member Mvimbi and his ANC have collapsed State Security, Crime Intelligence, I can go on and on. That is the reason we have implemented the Safety Plan.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon member Mvimbi, please take your seat. Hon Chief Whip, is that a point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes, hon Speaker, I do rise on Rule 39. It is really becoming increasingly difficult to hear the Minister because you do not know who you should listen to, because member Mvimbi wants to shout louder and the Minister has to raise his voice. Can you kindly rule on that, hon Speaker? Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order, hon member Mvimbi?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. [Interjections.]

I think as long as the Provincial Minister keep repeating lies here we are going to correct him on his lies, but you have actually warned him, hon Speaker, not to speak to us and he continues actually in his reference always referring to "hon member Mvimbi".

So I am going to respond to him. As long as he keep on mentioning my name I am going to respond because that means he is indirectly talking to me via you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members – hon members on both sides of the House, because it is not just on the one side. You are drowning out the Minister on the floor and you are hindering the progress of Parliament to do its work, and I do not want to get to a point where I need to take a decision in order for Parliament to be able to do their work, or do its work.

Can I ask, hon Minister, once again that you speak through me and, hon members, you cannot be in conversation with the Minister. You can have a cup of tea after the Sitting had adjourned if you disagree with the Minister, but for now the Minister is on the floor. There is no time allocated to the Minister as per the Rules, so I am going to allow the Minister to continue until the Minister has concluded.

Hon member Kama, is that a new point of order because you cannot rise on a point of order that I have ruled upon.

Mr M T KLAAS: Yes, do not suspect me, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Okay. What is your new point of order?

Mr M KAMA: Hon Speaker, through you. I want to check if [Interjections.],

if the [Interjections.] ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order, hon members! You are protected, speak, speak, speak, hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: No, thank you. Through you I want to check if the Minister is prepared to take a question on this phenomenon of [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Okay. Hon Minister, are you prepared to take a question?

The Minister is not prepared to take a question, please take your seat.

Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hon Speaker, I am going – the hon members made comments and I am speaking straight at you and via you. It is common cause in this Parliament that I address an hon member, whether it is Mvimbi, whether it is America, by name. It is common cause in the – so I am not speaking directly to you, I am doing it via you and I am going to respond. I am now on page 105, because that is their input, I am responding to it. So I am going to respond.

Hon Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... hon Speaker, the hon member made a comment, we are afraid of our own voters. I am quoting the hon member, I am not making this up. I am quoting the own words of hon member Mvimbi, a member of this House who said it. That is what he said. So I am responding to him.

We are afraid of all people in the Western Cape. We are afraid of their safety, we are afraid of gangsterism, we are afraid of them being murdered, we are afraid of them being raped. So yes, we are afraid and it is sad that an elected member of this House is not afraid of that. It is heartbreaking to hear an elected member of this House thought it acceptable that we ought to do nothing. We did not do nothing. This DA-led Western Cape Government chose to do something. We chose to allocate a billion rand to the Safety Plan while the members of that House and their party at the National Parliament failed to do their job.

So this is nothing to be ashamed of to say we were – in his own words – afraid of our own people or our own voters. We were afraid of 7 million people. We were afraid of youngsters being killed on a Friday or Saturday night randomly in our neighbourhoods. We were afraid of guns being distributed by ANC cadres in this province. We were afraid of a police officer distributing thousands of guns enabled by an ANC policy. Yes, we were afraid. It is a shame that that member was not afraid. I am proud that I was afraid of people dying in this province and we will continue to stand up for people dying in this province.

The hon member then continued, then he continued and I am responding to his own statements. I did not make this up. I am a responsive man, I am responding to his comments.

Then he said we were not prepared to deliver to our own people. He is actually contradicting himself. His first words were we are afraid of the safety of our own people. Then he said we were not prepared to deliver to – we were prepared to deliver. That is why we started the Western Cape Safety Plan because they did not bother. That is the difference between us and them, because we bother.

The hon member then went further. The hon member and hon Mvimbi also said we keep on competing with National Government. Hon members, we cannot compete with National Government. We cannot compete. We do 100 metres under 10 seconds, they do 100 metres in two hours. There is no competition. There is zero competition between the two of us, so we cannot compete against us. We deliver services, they do not bother. We have a Safety Plan, they have nothing. We have functional hospitals, they are collapsing in the hospitals where they govern. There is no competition between the two of us. We are in a league of our own. We are in the Olympics, they are on a †plakkie sokker [*plakkie* soccer] during the time. We win the World Cup, †hulle speel Graad 3 rugby. Daar is nie kompetisie nie [they play Grade 3 rugby. There is no competition.] You cannot compete between the two of us.

So what we are ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... doing, hon members ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Minister, please take your seat. Minister Meyer?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, the Hon Minister said they play †"plakkie sokker" [*plakkie* soccer.] What is that? Because I would like to see hon member Kama play †"plakkie sokker" [*plakkie* soccer.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Meyer, that is not the point of order.

Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Speaker. So we are definitely not competing against the National Government. We are in a league on our own.

To give you practical examples to give you practical examples. Over the last four months [Interjections.], over the last four months, hon Speaker, I have written, I personally have written to Minister Chikunga, Minister Gordhan

and recently Minister Creecy. The only person who have bothered to acknowledge receipt of my letter, with respect to her, was Minister Creecy last week.

That is the difference between us and them. Minister Chikunga, interesting he gave me a call yesterday about a meeting for next week. We have asked them, hon members, to put on the agenda Transnet, the collapse of the port, the collapse of the harbour, the minibus taxi subsidisation, the user pay transport voucher, they did not even bother to have a MinMac for the last two or three months. That is why I am saying, we are in a league on our own. The country is busy collapsing, our ports are busy collapsing, our rail service is busy collapsing, they do not even have a meeting to discuss it, hon members.

So we are not competing against them. It is impossible to compete against somebody who is 10 kilometres behind you. We are not the same persons. We are not made of the same quality. We want this country to succeed, they are honestly working for this country to fail. That is the difference between us and them. So we are not competing.

Hon member America has talked about a disclaimer. Now to get a disclaimer ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... hon members ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... to get a disclaimer, a definition of a disclaimer ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your – hon Minister, please take your seat.

Hon member Mvimbi, I have asked you throughout this debate to allow the Minister to respond. This constant continued directing your comments to the Minister is completely out of order. This is the last time that I am going to call you to order. The Minister is competing with himself.

Hon member Mvimbi, I am not going to engage on that. I am asking you for the last time please allow the Minister to make his contribution. You had your opportunity. If there is something you do not agree with use other mechanisms or have a cup of tea after the Sitting is adjourned.

Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you. A definition of a disclaimer in plain, simple language. The information is so bad the Auditor-General did not even want to bother. He gives up. No invoices, no receipts, nothing. In

plain, simple terms.

So when we talk about them versus us, that is the difference between us and them. You cannot compete. They are not in a league on our own. So when your Government gets a disclaimer that is where he must legally resign actually. That is *maar* you just give up, go home and become a traffic officer. They can apply next year. That is the difference between us and them. That is a disclaimer, hon members.

Hon members, we are indeed, via you – I did not say that. We are indeed not the Eastern Cape. That is the difference between us and them. We are a functional government that operates, that cares for the rule of law, that bothers to wake up to do their job.

That Stats SA numbers – the Stats SA numbers delivered by the Statistician-General, appointed by the ANC National Government, should, in all honesty, break the members' hearts. It should break the members of that side of the House's hearts. That a million people have given up hope in the Eastern Cape. A million people over the last 10 years have packed their bags, wrapped themselves up and left. They have given up hope in this province. That is the difference between them and us.

So bad is the Eastern Cape, so bad is the Eastern Cape that the Premier of the Eastern Cape appointed the Head of Departments to his own office and a special team. He appointed acting persons to run that department. I mean

†daai man gee op. Daai man het hande opgegooi. [that man gives up. That man threw up his hands.] He has no faith in them. He appointed them all to his own office. †Dit is 'n skande, man, dit is 'n skande. [It is a disgrace, man, it is a disgrace.] That is the difference between them and us.

I am proud of our Mobility – I am not going to continue because there is so much I can say for another hour. I am proud of our Western Cape Mobility Team. I am proud that they have come so far in a new department, in trying to pick up failures of a dysfunctional rail system caused by the ANC Government. We are an A team in this province and I want to thank the team, I want to thank the HOD and my team who have worked extremely hard in building this new department. Building a new team is not easy, but they have done so against the backdrop of a dysfunctional transport system created by the ANC.

So well done team and thanks to my Ministry Team for being here. I really appreciate you. We are going to take this Mobility Department, as expected, to be the best in the country. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister.

Hon members, that concludes the debate on this Vote. Before I ask the Secretary to read the 7th Order of the day, I am going to allow for the officials to move in and out.

Order. Order. Order.

Order, hon members, the House is not suspended.

Order, hon members! Hon members, we are two Votes away to the end of the day. Can I please ask your indulgence and cooperation so we can get through the next two Votes.

I am going to ask the Secretary to read the 7th Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development. Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon Minister of Social Development, hon Minister Fernandez.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Speaker, hon Premier and hon Cabinet colleagues, hon members of the Provincial Legislature in the House and on the virtual platform; members of the media and public, citizens of the Western Cape. Good afternoon, goeie middag.

I rise to table the Adjustment Budget for Vote 7 in a time where the Department of Social Development and other service-driven departments are the hardest hit by the harsh reality of national budget pressures. As we are entering the festive season, a time that is known for joy, peace and rest, the

Department and the NGO sector that mostly financially depend on us, must continue our work as the problems and challenges of our clients we serve do not get a festive break. We must do so, knowing that help is not necessarily on its way. Due to financial constraints and the harsh reality that transfer budgets are likely to be impacted, which could affect the sustainability of the NGOs that we fund. This is the grim reality.

The fiscal outlook has deteriorated since the 2023 budget, driven largely by reduced revenue estimates, tightened monetary policy, higher borrowing costs, inflation, spending pressures, and the impact of the 2023 Wage Agreement. Hon Speaker, as a former banker, I can tell you that all the red flags are up, and we are seeing an exodus of global players from this country which makes this debate in this House seem miniscule compared to what is actually happening out there whilst we are dilly-dallying around who is to blame for the mess this country finds itself in.

However, we remain steadfast in our mission to serve the most vulnerable citizens of the Western Cape and fulfil our statutory obligations. As hon Minister Wenger stated during the tabling of the 2023/2024 Western Cape Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, and the Adjustment Budgets, I quote:

“In the face of the challenges and grave uncertainty that we face because of national failings, we do what we do in the Western Cape, and we do it best. We try and strive to protect. We strategise priorities. We boost, so that we can continue to build your future.”

Hon Speaker, an increase of R18,519-million has amounted to the Department's Adjustment Budget allocation being over R2,4,79-billion. This slight increase which is largely due to a shifting of funds from the Department for Infrastructure, requires DSD to absorb the costs of the wage increase within this amount. The Adjusted Budget did not include funding for the following: cost of living adjustments relating to the 2023 Wage Agreement, an additional funding to Childcare and Protection organisations. Revenue shortfalls, surging debt, servicing costs and the National Public Service Wage increases have left us with an equitable share cut of over R106-million. Fortunately, Provincial Treasury has buffered this with reserves to prevent the Department from running out of the funds we require to honour contractual obligations during the course of this financial year, such as staff salaries, NGO payments and service provider contracts.

Provincial Treasury, hon Speaker, has also unearmarked all the Department's earmarked allocations to help us move around to cover our compensation of employees, as well as to shift some additional funds to NGOs offering critical support services. The allocations for transfer funding in respect of these subprogrammes – persons with disabilities, child and youth care centres, substance abuse and victim empowerment – were reduced and reprioritised. This is likely to have a significant impact on the quality and reach of services provided to citizens.

These unprecedented in-year cuts, hon Speaker, are exactly what hon Premier

Winde has warned would happen, due to the National Wage Agreements. I support the steps the Western Cape Government is taking in declaring an intergovernmental dispute. I am deeply concerned that the situation will worsen which could lead to staff burnout and an overload in cases due to high vacancy rates, as we will not have enough funds to fill all our posts in the context of a rapidly growing population with increasing levels of poverty and inequality.

This House, hon Speaker, is the kind of on-the-ground impact National Government is turning a blind eye to. We have seen it happening time and time again. An example: the chaotic disbursements of SASSA grants through the ineffectual Postbank that impacts the most vulnerable residents and children; a dysfunctional Department of Home Affairs, which is in a complete mess; and we see it daily when the power goes off due to loadshedding, and our secure care centres and shelters are then placed at greater risk. This, hon Speaker, is a National Government completely out of touch with the realities of its citizens. However, all is not lost.

To provide additional funding to Child Protection Service, R20-million was reprioritised. This will ensure the sustainability of 115 designated child protection organisations that render statutory child protection services. Our NPO and NGO partners are crucial in ensuring the wellbeing, dignity and protection of vulnerable residents, like children, to ensure that they are safe. The additional funding will enable these organisations to cover their operational costs. More importantly, it will ensure the retention of social

workers as many of these organisations have been challenged with a high turnover of staff seeking better employment opportunities.

For the modification of specialised vehicles for the transport of children with intellectual disabilities, R1,2-million has rolled over. We have already handed over four vehicles to NGOs assisting children with disabilities and the Department has placed an order for another six vehicles to ensure we fulfil our legal obligation of making provision for children with severe to profound intellectual disabilities to be able to attend special schools. The Department also received an additional R723 000 for drop-in centre services for the rollout of the Delft Intervention Plan. This allocation will be reprioritised for emergency packs between childcare and protection NGOs within the regions.

We are certainly not forgetting those living on the streets and those living in poverty. We had initially planned to build a shelter for homeless adults in District Six due to the increasing numbers of people living on the streets in Cape Town's CBD, but this had to be reconsidered due to community objections and the severe budget cuts. That means, any delay to infrastructure work on this site may render the project unaffordable. Funds were instead transferred from the Department of Infrastructure for the expansion of bedspaces at existing shelters. Of these funds, R8,1-million was allocated to increase bedspaces at shelters across Cape Town and other parts of the province.

Since the COVID-19 disaster, hon Speaker, DSD has provided funding for social workers at all shelters to help with the reunification of homeless adults with their families and has increased access to shelter bedspaces funded by the Department from 1 500 to 2 398 beds. With this latest allocation, this figure will further increase to 2 584, which is over and above shelter spaces funded by the City of Cape Town and other municipalities across the province.

The unallocated funds of R8,8-million were reprioritised. The need for support of those living under the breadline, hon Speaker, is great. There was an economic classification shift from transfer payments to goods and services for the provision of food parcels to the amount of R935 000. These funds were used to assist with DSD's intervention and response efforts during the recent floods in disaster in the province.

The Department's role in response to the disaster is to coordinate psychosocial services and to facilitate access to humanitarian relief to affected communities. During the devastating floods, DSD worked with several partner NGOs and other governmental agencies to provide humanitarian relief to the worst affected communities. Besides providing trauma counselling and other psychosocial support, DSD social workers worked tirelessly with municipalities to assess the urgent needs of families whose homes were flooded, like providing emergency baby packs in Ashton.

Hon Speaker, National Government has placed us in one of the worst fiscal

positions we have ever been in in years. I fear this Adjusted Budget foreshadows even more severe cuts in the coming financial year. Now more than ever, we require the private sector to join hands with NGOs, NPOs and civil society to provide crucial services in the social service sector, whether it be GBV survivor support, child protection, elderly person care, substance use support services amongst others.

As this reading has proved, Provincial Government simply cannot do it on its own. The time of working in silos is long over, hence our transversal approach under the leadership of hon Premier Winde. The COVID-19 pandemic proved how much more effective we are when we work together. I still believe in what hon Minister Wenger said and I quote, that:

“We can build your future. That is the future of citizens, but we can only do so in collaboration with partners like corporates, NGOs and communities. We certainly cannot rely on the failing National Government that has plundered the public purse and has left this country on a fiscal cliff.”

Hon Speaker, I wish to thank my Cabinet colleagues at the Executive Council led by hon Premier Winde, for their continuous support and motivation. Thank you to the Standing Committee for the robust and transparent engagements we have enjoyed throughout the year. I am also grateful to the Department of Social Development, led by Dr Robert MacDonald and some of our Chief Directors in the box, for their tireless efforts and leadership in

making difficult decisions with the reprioritisation of a budget under serious fiscal constraints.

Colleagues, your efforts are appreciated. I know you have spent long nights and days deliberating on what must go and what must stay, but I want to say thank you for resolving what was a very difficult situation. I commend all the DSD staff who remain committed to serving the most vulnerable, despite the many challenges that we had. So, thank you to the entire Team DSD for going the extra mile.

And finally, I must thank the Ministry staff, capably led by our Head of Ministry, Ms Ananda Nel who is in the box there together with Ms Monique Mortlock, the A-Team as I call it, has been and continues to be the wind beneath my wings through what has been an extremely difficult period. I thank you.

[The Temporary Chairperson takes the chair.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Minister. I recognise the hon Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): I rise today on behalf of the ANC to decline support for the proposed Budget Adjustment for the Western Cape Department of Social Development. When the hon Finance MEC tabled her so-called budget to Build Your Future last week, she claimed it was a budget to prioritise the people of the province, by protecting the frontline services,

including the Department of Social Development. In the subsequent Budget Committee meeting, it was also stated that Gender-Based Violence, Child Protection and Psychosocial Support were policy priorities to be funded through the budget. And they always say the devil is in the detail.

A close examination of this Department's Budget reveals that the hon Finance MEC's claims were nothing but clear blue lies and empty promises. And really, we have witnessed substantial budget cuts for the following sub-programmes: Services to persons with disabilities by over R1,4-million, Child and Youth Care Centres, by R3,1-million; Poverty Alleviation and Sustainable Livelihoods, by over R1-million; Substance Abuse Prevention and Rehabilitation, by over R3,1-million; Victim Empowerment by a massive R3,5-million.

The budget cuts to the aforementioned programmes clearly demonstrate that the DA commitment to addressing social issues such as Gender-Based Violence and Femicide, substance use disorder and the involvement and youth in criminal activities are nothing but empty rhetoric and hollow noise.

This Province is failing to play its role in the prevention of these crimes. The mothers in the Cape Flats must know the DA has chosen to spend millions to buy computers instead of investing the money to get our youth out of drugs and crime. The victims of GBV must know the DA deems it important to use empowerment funds for travel and subsistence, instead of addressing the GBV scourge.

In the face of high poverty which predominantly affects the Black people, African and Coloureds in the Western Cape, along with the crisis of the rising costs of living, the DA has failed dismally to respond to these challenges by making essential budget reallocations towards addressing these challenges.

For instance, only R925 000 has been redistributed towards poverty alleviation and sustainable livelihoods for the provision of food parcels, while over R6-million from imported programmes have been distributed for computer equipment. This clearly exposes the DA's skewed priorities.

Hon Speaker, of course the ANC will be the first to acknowledge good decisions and give credit where it is due. Earlier this year, there was a huge outcry from Child Protection Services organisations in the province under the banner of the Western Cape Child Protection Alliance, who called out the DA Government for cutting its spending on child protection services, despite high levels of violence against children in the province. We note that in this proposed Adjustment Budget, there is an additional R26,6-million allocation for the children and families programme, inclusive of a R21,5-million increase for the Childcare and Protection subprogrammes. This is a step in the right direction, but unfortunately, it is not enough to address the challenges.

Furthermore, we do not think that R723 000 allocated to fund-drop incentives services is also sufficient to address the programme. Additionally, the bulk

of increase in the budget for the Children and Families Programme will not go towards NGOs in Child Protection Services to address increased operational costs but will instead be used for the provision of additional bedspace at shelters. The hon MEC and the Department have failed the NGOs in this regard.

The ANC strongly objects to the decision to allocate the R16,9-million shifted from the Department of Infrastructure towards additional bedspace at shelters, instead of the proposed development of homeless shelters in the CBD. This pattern of decisions raises a serious concern about the DA's commitment to address the root causes of homelessness and provide a sustainable solution for the vulnerable people, particularly those living in the City.

Lastly, hon Speaker, I really regret that this is not the first time where the DA has neglected the needs of homeless people in the province. Not long ago, the City imposed bylaws that criminalised homelessness and before that, it was an establishment of the inhumane Strandfontein concentration camp during the peak of the COVID-19 pandemic, which strategically led to the loss of lives among the homeless people. †Yiko loko okanye yilo nto singakwazi ukuyamkela oluhlaso-lubiwo mali. [That is why we cannot accept this budget.] Enkosi,[Thank you] hon Speaker.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Bakubaku-Vos. I now recognise the hon De Villiers.

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. The GOOD party cannot vote for a budget that has yes, promised, and not delivered on creating new bedspaces for those living on the streets in Cape Town. What was initially going to be a transitional shelter and developed centre for those living on the streets of Cape Town at the old Robbie Nurock building, was this year changed without proper consultation to a site in District Six which was successfully appealed by the public and those living on the streets.

The budget proposed ballooned to millions without providing these services. This Department has, without proper consultation, decided to invest these funds into upgrading the already over-funded temporary emergency shelters which those living on the streets refuse to go to for very good reasons. These shelters became havens for those on SASSA grants and those on the nationally funded programme like EPWP and BB programmes. The GOOD party cannot support this budget and votes against it. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon De Villiers. The next speaker is the hon Plato. You are recognised.

Mr D PLATO (DA): Ja. Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Thank you for the opportunity. We, in the Democratic Alliance, obviously we support the Vote, we support the Budget. There is no question about that.

And you leave me no choice other than to do so despite difficult budgetary constraints as identified by the hon Minister. And on top of it, let me congratulate the Minister, the HOD, all the senior staff and all the other staff on her beautiful audit finding. And I know the allocation of budget to many sectors are there, but also to projects and programmes.

The hon Minister of Finance's promises is part of the overall budget structure. It is worked into the overall budget. They are not promises, hon Temporary Chairperson, they are a reality. If budget cuts imposed by the African National Congress National Government, much more money would have been available for more services aimed at the poor. The budget cuts are hitting the poorest of the poor the most and we need to realise that. Most of the budget is aimed to support the poorest of the poor. This is a poor people's budget despite the budget cuts.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, let me use the further opportunity to say to the hon Minister, HOD and all her staff, thank you very much for a job well done under the trying circumstances. It is really a case of doing much more with a lesser budget. How do you cut? What are you taking away? It is exactly what the hon Minister has indicated.

The Department of Social Development is at the forefront of dealing with social related issues across the province. The Department focusses on many areas, such as Gender-Based Violence, Child Protection, Substance Use Disorders and Older Persons, and many, many more social related issues.

With many businesses still closed as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic, it means that many people are still without a job opportunity which aggravates the social issues around those concerned. The Department deals with all of these issues in a what we call Whole of Society Approach, and that approach will continue.

With the increase in poverty levels over a wide front, it is very, very difficult for the Department to reach out to all the people out there, but the Department is doing its utter best to do so. As we can see, quite a lot is happening around us with so few resources available to address them and budget cuts that will just aggravate the issues further.

The Department and the hon Minister are quite correct: the Department will never be able to do it alone. You are as good as those partners around you. Here, I want to take my hat off to many of our NGOs, our MPOs, our CBOs for the act of going and taking the extra mile to assist wherever they can and in particular, 90% of the assistance goes to the most vulnerable of people out there.

But we would love to see a much better budget allocation for our NGOs and CBOs and NPOs, but as the hon Minister has indicated, under these trying circumstances it is just not possible. But budget constraint issues prevent the Department from doing so.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, Social Development is speaking to all social

issues in our communities. All projects and programmes as the hon Minister has identified, are fully funded. That is what the public out there want to know. That is what the public want to see. They want assurances. Will projects and programmes continue? Will there be help, assistance for them during difficult circumstances? And as the hon Minister has indicated, yes, it will be available.

And let me just identify some of the issues the hon Minister might not have mentioned, and I would love to cover them. Nearly 39 000-plus children in foster care. That is an absolute highlight of the Department to reach out to such a lot of vulnerable people out there, in particular, children. Our hearts go out to children finding themselves in difficulty and under very difficult circumstances. A total of 220 new safety parents were trained as part of the departmental safety parental programme, programmes by the Department to provide the skills to preserve the family structure. Very, very important for the upbringing of our children. The value of the family unit, the value of the family structure cannot be underestimated.

But there is a devil in our communities that we need to address, and the hon Minister did address it very briefly. The high incidence of violence we experience, particularly against women and children, has continued to become a major, major issue and it has been a major issue for many years. But I am very pleased to say I am happy with the projects and programmes and the initiatives the hon Minister has put in place to address that sector. The Department has funded 26 GBV shelters for thousands of women and

children who were victims of crime and violence were able to access temporary shelter accommodation.

A highlight was the hosting of the GVB and Femicide Summit during October 2022, attended by over 1 500 delegates. But then, as my counter/Opposition member, hon Bakubaku-Vos has indicated as well and the hon Minister alluded to it, the assistance to insecure households and particularly food assistance.

The Department's Food Relief Interventions provided over 109 000-plus beneficiaries access to cooked meals. Some from 512 community kitchens across the province assisting with that and that, for me, is a major, major highlight because that is what the public want to know: what is it we are doing for those vulnerable people that cannot even put a plate of food on the table at night when they need to go and sleep. And that is why I put emphasis on this issue that that is what the Department is doing for those that are not in a job opportunity, that cannot fend for themselves and that is where the Department is stepping in to fill that space. Thousands of food parcels are distributed to families in food distress as well.

The Department continues to implement programmes aimed a youth at risk. Support for people with disabilities through programmes which promote their wellbeing and dignity. The Department's strength in community-based services through training and capacity building programmes. That is in the budget. All these issues I raise, they will continue to happen and then, the

Department will continue to support municipalities exactly an issue that was also raised earlier in particular the City of Cape Town and other municipalities with its massive homeless programmes.

But the cities are taking the lead, not the Department and I think that needs to be understood. The City provides assistance, input and that sort of thing, but the lead party in this to deal with the homeless issue is the local authorities. As a result of time constraints, I can say much, much more, hon Temporary Chairperson, it is a pleasure to be associated with a department such as the Department of Social Development and for the public out there to understand what it is that the Department is doing for them. I thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, honourable. I recognise the hon Minister of Social Development.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. I would like to thank the hon members for their contribution to the debate for Vote 7. I think it is important and it does not take rocket science. If we have a Wage Agreement that is negotiated at a national level, but the funding needs to come or originate at a provincial level and no provision has been made, something has to give. That is the harsh reality, and it is not only the Western Cape. All nine provinces have been affected by this move which in our Province, we have seen Health and Education get subsidised to a degree, but the other departments have to find the money in

their budgets. So, that is the harsh reality.

Now, you cannot do in-year cuts. It is unheard of and that is an example of a failing state. That is an example of the maladministration, the fact that there is no good governance and that we do not have people at a national level who actually understand what is happening, not only financially, but in terms of the reality, peoples' lived realities on the ground.

Hon Bakubaku-Vos, the Department can only deliver on statutory services because we do not, hon Temporary Chairperson, have the funds to do any of the nice-to-have stuff. If we do not focus on statutory work, we will face litigation and then, we need ...[Interjections.] and then we need to give effect to that litigation. We have, as you heard, tried to bolster child protection agencies, but there are no nice-to-haves.

Substance Use Disorder, Gender-Based Violence, those are all important programmes, but in terms of the bigger picture ...[Interjections.] hon Temporary Chairperson, in terms of the bigger picture, we can only work within the budgetary constraints that we are faced with. So, that, sadly, is the harsh reality.

Coming to the hon Marais. If I remember correctly, in one House Sitting the hon Marais objected to a shelter being built. So, it is simply a case of walking left and talking right. And simply, if you do the sums from 1 500 bedspaces to 2 500 and odd, that is an increase. We have a province that

caters for 30 municipalities. The Province does not only look after the City of Cape Town. There are 29 other municipalities that also require assistance.

Then, I want to highlight another point out, hon Temporary Chairperson. During COVID-19 level 4 and 5, we were asked to take all these people in. There was a R50-million Carenox deal that was very quickly absorbed [Interjections.] and then, what happened after that, the Minister Zulu was supposed to engage Minister Dlamini Zuma around legislation to affirm what needs to happen regarding those. That was another empty promise. We do not want to even touch SASSA.

We now heard that on 31 March, Gold Card stopped. What is going to happen to those 597 000 beneficiaries who we identified earlier in the year already. We cannot get abridged birth certificates; we cannot get our children into adoption because Home Affairs is completely dysfunctional. So, it is quite rich – it is quite rich of the Opposition to stand here and criticise us when we have a team of only 2 500 people who are working their butts off to service almost 7,4-million people, hon Temporary Chairperson.

So, it is 16 Days of No Violence Against Women and Children and it would be remiss of me to stand here and not address the hon members in this House. And here, I am talking ...[Interjections.] here I am talking to ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Thank you, hon members.

Just please take your seat.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Here I am talking ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon MEC, please take your seat. [Interjections.] Please, hon Leader of the Opposition, please. I do know your works are not in the House, but please. Thank you. Can we ...[Interjections.] And can we ask for ...[Interjections.] please? Please, Bearer. Thank you, hon Minister. You can continue.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: So, hon Temporary Chairperson, Gender-Based Violence is not just sexual assault. Gender-Based Violence takes the form of bullying, intimidation, harassment, and the point I wanted to make is that in this very House, the level of decorum, the amount of bullying: men bullying men, women bullying men, men bullying women is disgusting. Young children out there see this behaviour and we expect them to respond to GBV when in this very House, we have lost all respect for the dignity and decorum of Parliament to the point ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes, Temporary Chairperson. Can you please make a ruling in terms of Rule 39, hon Temporary Chairperson. It cannot be that the hon members on the other side drown out the hon Minister.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Correct.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Point taken. [Interjections.] Please, hon members. [Interjections.] Please, hon members. You cannot drown out the speaker. Please let us not be guilty of bullying here as well. Hon Minister, please proceed.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson, and that is exactly ...[Interjections.] that is exactly the point I want to make. I would like to appeal to every hon member in this House to reflect on ...[Interjections.] to reflect on their behaviour. We must be the example to our children, to the young girls in Mitchels Plain and to everyone else, but what do we do? We behave so appallingly in this House that I am actually quite disgusted on days when I see how hon members have a go at each other. That constitutes bullying and it is GBV, and it needs to be addressed.

So, you can ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members! Hon Minister, please ...[Interjections.] Hon Minister, please take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon members, please. I realise that you may be tiring. I know it was a long day,

but please ...[Interjections.] Please, and may I ask the Whip to also please play his role. Thank you, hon members. [Interjections.] Hon members, please.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: May I continue, hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Marran, please. [Interjections.] I would love you to continue, but can we please have order. Please continue.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Temporary Chairperson, not too long ago when I was the Speaker of Parliament sitting in that very chair, when a certain Marius Fransman went on a trip to Sun City and the very hon members across on the other side, defended him to the hilt. So, the sheer hypocrisy of the ANC is staggering and no case of Gender-Based Violence in any political party ...[Interjections.] must be condoned. ...[Interjections.] No case of ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...of political ...[Interjections.] no case of Gender-Based Violence must be ...[Interjections.] it must be acknowledged. It is wrong. [Interjections.] It is unacceptable. Whether it belongs in the DA, the EFF, the Patriotic Alliance, GBV is unacceptable. But what is happening in this House is

serious bullying and it has become unacceptable. [Interjections.] And I would love the Opposition to know what children out there think of their behaviour. They say it is appalling, they belong in the naughty corner, they are pathetic. We have no need to vote for them. So, that is that.

Then, hon Temporary Chairperson, another myth that I want all South Africans to listen to very carefully today, is that the ANC does not pay SASSA grants. SASSA grants are paid by taxpayer's money ...[Interjections.] and this idea that people are told 'If you do not vote for us, your grant will be taken away,' is complete rubbish. [Interjections.] And so, I am telling all South Africans today: wake up to the reality of what is coming. [Interjections.] The ANC is bankrupt. They are broke. They had the sheriff on their doorstep. They do not know how to manage their finances, †hulle moet nie eers praat nie [they must not even speak.]

Now, let me ...[Interjections.] let me just ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members! Hon members, please. [Interjections.] Hon members. [Interjections.] Hon members, you have had your opportunity to debate. There will be a further opportunity to debate, but you need to respect the speaker. Hon Marran ... Hon Marran! [Interjections.] Please, hon Bakubaku-Vos. [Interjections.] Hon Bakubaku-Vos, please! [Interjections.] Now, please.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Temporary

Chairperson, for protecting me. In terms of social relief of distress, it might be useful for the hon Marran ...[Interjections.] to go and read the Act, and he will find that in Chapter 3, SASSA is charged with social relief of distress. So, since SASSA has become dysfunctional, that has also become dysfunctional.

But, hon Temporary Chairperson, there has recently been a study of 18 to 35 year-olds by the Human Sciences Research Council which was commissioned in a runup to the 2024 national elections. Young people between 18 and 35 said they would not vote because of deep discontent – and this is out of the *Daily Maverick* – with Government performance, political parties and the functioning of the democratic system. Listen now; listen carefully.

“This is particularly prevalent in Gauteng and KwaZulu-Natal where more than 80% of young people distrust the National Government and more than 75% distrust political parties.”

And guess what the reasons are?

“They do not believe that voting will make a difference. There is a perceived lack of trust.”

“Corrupt politicians”

Is number two. Number three is:

“Poor socio-economic conditions”

Number four is:

“Empty promises”

And number five is:

“Feeling that politicians do not care.”

So, politicians ...[Interjections.] well, you should be worried about KwaZulu-Natal and Gauteng because they are not talking about the Western Cape. [Interjections.] Hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Interjections.] hon Temporary Chairperson, unfortunately, the truth cannot be altered because people have a different perception of the truth. The harsh reality is that facts matter, and we are sitting ...[Interjections.] we are sitting on a fiscal cliff because all it took was the once glorious movement 30 years to run this country into the ground. I was there and I left when I saw the rot starting. [Interjections.]

So, they need to acknowledge that they have failed. They have failed South Africa, they have failed their provinces, they have failed the most vulnerable. So, if I were them, I would reconsider and instead of sitting here, to make a difference, to get involved and help to save South Africa. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon members, that concludes the debate on Vote 7. We will just give the officials a minute to leave. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon members, can we calm down. Please, hon members. [Interjections.] Please, hon members, we want to start with the last Order of the Day. [Interjections.] Thank you. The Secretary will read the Eighth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I recognise the hon Mitchell.

Mr D G Mitchell (DA): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson, hon Premier, hon members of the Cabinet and hon members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. It is, indeed, a great privilege to present the Adjustment Appropriation for the Western Cape Provincial Parliament for 2023.

The WCPP Budget has increased by R863 000 from R240,242-million, including the direct charges, hon Temporary Chairperson, leaving the WCPP with an Adjusted Appropriation of R241,105-million. Hon Temporary Chairperson, an amount of R12,377-million in respect of the underspending on voted funds and an amount of R1,943-million in respect of over-collected

own revenue will be rolled over from the 2022/2023 financial year into MTEF.

In an attempt to reduce the total value of the additional funding requirements to Provincial Treasury, WCPP has revoted underspending from 2023/2024 to the 2024/2025 and 2025/2026 financial years to partially cover the additional funding need. WCPP has therefore made provision in the Adjustment Budget for R6,530-million, which is R2,2-million to the 2024/2025 year and R4,33-million to the 2025/2026 financial year from the current budget to mitigate the additional funding shortages.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the rollover of the 2022/2023 financial year was mainly allocated as follows. In Programme 1 under Governance, Leadership and Administration, the rollover was from the previous financial year to cover the committed projects which were not completed in the 2022/2023 and priority projects identified.

Under Programme 2 under Parliamentary Support Services, a total of R2,147-million was rolled over from the previous financial year to cover for projects which were committed in the 2022/2023 financial year and to cover for the additional projects such as archiving, shelving and wave readers, and to supplement the Standing Committee budget for law making activities.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, under Programme 3, Public Engagement an additional R323 000 was rolled over to cover for committed projects and to

cover for additional costs related to social media, advertising and the public education and outreach budget for law making activities.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, I now move over to Programme 4 under member support, an additional rollover of R697 000 which was for members' attendance of official WCPP events outside of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament precinct and to cover for an additional delegate to the CPA membership, and to supplement the constituency allowances to align to the National Parliament.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, I recommitted myself once again, to strengthening the core business of the Provincial Parliament to enable our members to fulfil their constitutional obligations with the necessary support, tools and administrative assistance. I also wish, hon Temporary Chairperson, to take this opportunity to thank all the hon members across the political divide, for their support and assistance, and look forward to completing the final stretch of this 6th Term of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, I therefore table the Adjustment for Vote 2 WCPP for consideration and debate.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Mitchell. I recognise the hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, the African

National Congress rejects this Adjustments Appropriation Vote 2 Budget. Before we proceed with the reasons as to why we reject this particular budget, allow me to share with the House our meeting this morning with an international delegation of parliamentarians for Jerusalem, hailing from Yemen, Turkey and Jordan. We were able to interact with them on our role as parliamentarians and operating within the public policy space in fighting for a just and peaceful settlement for a free Palestine.

Despite the DA's double standards, despite the DA not lighting up this particular building with the Palestinian flag colours like they did with Ukraine, and despite the hon DA Premier refusing to condemn apartheid Israel as he condemned Russia, we, each and every one of us can do our bit. The delegation was in South Africa as attendees for the Fifth Convention of Solidarity with Palestine and to honour President Nelson Mandela. The words of Madiba on our freedom and democracy, as practiced in this House, must ring through these hallowed halls of this Provincial Legislature. We will not be free until the Palestinians are free.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, public engagement remains a sore thumb for the ANC in this particular budget. Let us be clear: we do not blame or apportion responsibility to any staff member of the WCPP. In fact, if anything, and listening to complaints along the corridors of this building, the ANC can only sympathise with staff members of the WCPP. Budget cuts, but simply to bloat up non-essential programmes such as the offices of the political office bearers and the accounting officers.

When cuts are made, the first places and programmes political office bearers and accounting officers look at are programmes they do not believe in. So, cutting the public engagement budget comes as no surprise to us because it is precisely the programme that the DA has never taken seriously in this Legislature and in the municipalities where the DA governs. If it were not for our courts, the DA would have done away with public engagement and public education a long time ago.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the political head of this institution has again asked for suggestions from political parties to enhance public engagement. The ANC has given so many, but we are continuously ignored, even on the issue of the Rules because those suggestions do not serve the DA's agenda of disregard for public engagement. So, the WCPP staff in public engagement are actually fighting a losing battle under this administration.

Why does the Democratic Alliance not like public engagement? Well, because the public have so often disagreed with them. Childrens' Commissioner, Environmental Commissioner, National Health Insurance, among so many others. In fact, the DA was so desperate to please donors that they demanded more public hearings for the NHI when the Western Cape said 'yes' to the NHI. And after they got their extra public hearings from the NCOP because the ANC believes deeply in public engagement, the DA packed those hearings with anti-NHI people and the DA PR went into overdrive, hon Temporary Chairperson, to ignore all the hearings about the NHI before these

last ones.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the Administration claims to lament budget cuts, but the little money they do have, they have 72 – listen carefully – 72 litigation cases. When the Provincial Powers Bill ...[Interjections.] with the Provincial Powers Bill being dead in the water, legally, and opinion from the very competent legal team of the WCPP, one can understand why the DA leaders of this institution are budgeting in using taxpayer's money to context this Bill in court if need be.

Talking about the dead in the water Provincial Powers Bill. The DA wasted money on the public hearings and committee meetings for the amendment of the Provincial Constitution for the number of seats in this House to increase. Hon Dugmore will attest to taxpayers' money down the drain. In fact, we now have a price tag to those hearings which went wasted: R342 000. In fact, R342 000 later only for the DA to now be chickening out. Now again, public hearings are being called and taxpayers' money being spent, the little taxpayers' money that we already have on a dead in the water Provincial Powers Bill. Hon Bosman can laugh, but he knows that.

We call on the DA to abandon this Bill, like they abandoned both their Bills on the amendment to the Western Cape Provincial Constitution, both in respect of the Environmental Commissioner, as well as the number of seats in the WCPP before wasting more taxpayers' money. It is going to lead to abandonment because of the approach that they are taking right now in the

Committee.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, ours must have been the first Legislature in this country and since the dawn of democracy to be hacked. Yes, hacked. This is an indictment on our cyber security. Again, let us be clear. ICT must not take responsibility for this. As the political leaders, we must all take responsibility for this. But what adds insult to injury, the political leadership of this Legislature decides to cut the budget of ICT. This is a disgrace. In the wake of a hacking, one would expect a governing party to increase the budget, not to cut that particular budget. R830 000 is no small change, yet ICT will not have access to these desperately needed funds.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the ANC welcomes the cut in the Office of the Secretary, but the Office of the Speaker is immune to the cuts it would seem. No cuts for the Office of the Speaker, but a whopping R628 000 cut to the Secretarial allowance. What a disgrace. The Secretarial allowance is supposed to enhance oversight.

You will be forgiven for thinking that the hon Speaker leads by example. In fact, if you look at this particular adjustment, hon Temporary Chairperson, this Adjustment Appropriation Bill in general, everywhere else funds are cut, but not in the Office of the Premier, not in the Office of the Speaker, not in the Office of the MEC of Finance. The DA is truly a disgrace to the citizens of the Western Cape. We reject this particular Bill.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Sayed. Your time has expired, and you have managed your time quite well. The next, I recognise the hon De Villiers.

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): I did this morning withdraw.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon de Villiers. The next speaker on the list is then the Chief Whip, hon Kaizer-Philander.

†Die HOOFSWEEP (DA): Baie dankie, agb Voorsitter. Agb Voorsitter, die Wes-Kaap se Provinsiale Parlement se begroting is aanduidend van die fiskale krisis waarin die land in ons provinsie haar bevind. Alhoewel hierdie Begrotingspos deur die meeste nie as die mees kritieke van almal in die begrotingsproses beskou kan word nie, bly die werk van die Wetgewer van kardinale belang. So ook die fondse wat hierdie Huis benodig om dit te bereik.

Agb Voorsitter, hierdie Huis is verantwoordelik vir belangrike funksies insluitend die afvaardiging van belangrike lewensveranderende wetgewing, sowel as toesig oor die uitvoerende gesag. Regoor die land het Provinsiale Wetgewers sowel as die Nasionale Parlement hol, tandelose instellings geword wat niks anders doen as om die grille en wil van die ANC te kondoneer nie. Hierdie instellings het niks anders as nog 'n meganisme geword binne 'n proses om die ANC se Nasionale Regering se swak besluitneming, ramspoedige wetgewing en grootskaalse plundering van die

Staat te rubberstempel nie.

Agb Voorsitter, maar die Wes-Kaap se Provinsiale Parlement is 'n skitterende voorbeeld van 'n wetgewer met *guts* en een wat uitstaan bo die res. Daar is verskeie redes waarom die Wes-Kaap se Provinsiale Parlement op die voorgrond is as die beste wetgewer in die land. Sommige van die redes sluit in politieke leierskap wat die belange van inwoners bo die belange van politieke party-affiliasies stel en 'n toegewyde professionele en nie-partydige personeelaanvulling. 'n Provinsiale uitvoerende gesag wat verantwoordbaar en deursigtig is.

Agb Voorsitter, die rede waarom die Wes-Kaap volgens die meeste maatstawwe die provinsie is wat die beste bestuur word is omdat die Wes-Kaap se Provinsiale Parlement werk. Die Wes-Kaap se Provinsiale Parlement se toewyding tot sorgsame hulpbronbestuur dien as 'n baken van fiskale verantwoordelikheid waar dit wyse besluite neem om fondse na die essensiële werk van die Huis te prioritiseer eerder as om in weelderige reise en luukshede te verval soos in ander provinsies in Suid Afrika.

Agb Voorsitter, hierdie instelling omarm 'n kultuur van inklusiwiteit en is 'n voorstander van diversiteit, waardigheid, gelykheid, respek en regverdigheid. Deur die behoeftes en stemme van die mense eerste te sit, personifieer die Wes-Kaap se Provinsiale Parlement die ware betekenis van 'n Parlement wat toegewyd is aan die diens en verbetering van haar burgers.

Hierdie wetgewer, ten spyte van sommige van die Opposisie se standpunte tot die teendeel, werk sonder vrees of guns, respekteer nie-partydigheid en word goed bestuur, maar ons moet nie onder enige illusie verkeer nie, hierdie onlangse begrotingsbesnoeiings wat deur die Nasionale Tesourie veroorsaak is, sal 'n uitwerking hê op die Wetgewer en sy vermoë om sy werk te doen. Soos vandag tydens die verskillende begrotingsredes waargeneem is, is die Wes-Kaap onderworpe aan 'n yslike tekort van R1-miljard aan die algehele begroting.

Agb Voorsitter, hierdie is nie kleingeld nie. Hierdie is groot somme geld met groter implikasies vir die mense van die Wes-Kaap. Die inkortings vir die 2023/2024 boekjaar het beteken dat die Wes-Kaap verskeie kritieke dienste moes besnoei. Besnoeiings aan die Wes-Kaap se voorwaardelike toekennings sluit in 'n afname in toewysings aan kritieke infrastruktuurontwikkelingsprogramme, gesondheids- en welstandprogramme, onderwys, padinstandhouding, menslike nedersettings, opgradering van informele nedersettings en landbou.

Agb Voorsitter, hierdie begrotingsbesnoeiings klink dalk na groot woorde en groot getalle, maar dit het ook groot en werklike gevolge vir ons mense op die grond. Agb Voorsitter, inwoners se daaglikse lewens. Ek loof dus die pogings van Minister Wenger en die Provinsiale Tesourie wat onder geweldige druk werk om kritieke voorfront liniedienste en by uitbreiding die mense van ons provinsie te beskerm teen die begrotingsbloedbad wat deur die ANC se Nasionale Regering veroorsaak is. Ten spyte van die inperkings en

beperkings, het die Wes-Kaap inderdaad 'n begroting saamgestel om ons gemeenskappe te beskerm en ons toekoms te bou.

Agb Voorsitter, die Wes-Kaap se Provinsiale Parlement is ongelukkig nie deur die begrotingsbloedbad gespaar nie. Die Provinsiale Parlement het 'n verhoging van R836 000 in die Begrotingstoewysing van R187 678 000 in die 2022/23 finansiële tydperk gesien, wat neerkom op 'n toename van 0,45% vir hierdie finansiële jaar. Dit is egter die besnoeiings wat die Wes-Kaapse Wetgewer moes verduur om te verseker dat ander dienste wat deur die publiek in die gesig gestaar word, befonds word.

Agb Voorsitter, onder Program 1: Bestuur, Leierskap en Administrasie, R830 000 is aan die Provinsiale Inkomstefonds oorgegee ten opsigte van kuberveiligheidsgelde wat herverdeel sal word aan die 2025/26 Kuberveiligheidsbegroting. Program 3: Die Openbare Betrokkenheid, het 'n algehele afname van R1,877 miljoen gehad, wat verder soos volg opgedeel is:

- R1,7 miljoen is aan die PIF oorgegee ten opsigte van die Digitale Aanlynplatformbegroting, wat herverdeel sal word om die 2024/25 begroting aan te vul.
- Agb Voorsitter, R500 000 is aan die PIF oorgegee ten opsigte van die 2023/24 Digitale Aanlynplatformbegroting wat herverdeel sal word om die 2024/25 begroting aan te vul.
- R3,5 miljoen is aan die PIF oorgegee ten opsigte van die besparings wat in 2023/24 geïdentifiseer is teen vergoeding van werknemers wat

hertoegewys sal word om die 2025/26 begroting aan te vul.

Hierdie besnoeiings is 'n ongelukkige gevolg van die fiskale krisis waarin Suid-Afrika haar bevind, maar dit is nie die eerste keer dat die Provinsiale Parlement moeilike finansiële omstandighede moes oorbrug nie.

Agb Voorsitter, soos ons tydens COVID gesien het, is hierdie Wetgewer veerkragtig en ons sal hierdie fyn beperkings navigeer deur soos nog altyd te verseker dat ons die mense van die Wes-Kaap eerste stel.

Agb Voorsitter, ek wil afsluit deur my opregte dank oor te dra aan die leierskap, die Speaker, die Adjunkspeaker, alle personeel van die Wes-Kaap se Provinsiale Parlement. U toewyding en bydraes word opreg waardeer en dit is hoekom die Wes-Kaap se Provinsiale Parlement werk.

Namens die Demokratiese Alliansie ondersteun ek hierdie Begrotingspos 2 soos voorgelê in die Wes-Kaap se Provinsiale Parlement. Agb Voorsitter, ek dank u.

[The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Chair. Hon Chair, the Western Cape's Provincial Parliament's Budget is indicative of the fiscal crisis in which the country finds itself, in our province. Although this Budget Vote cannot be regarded by most as the most critical of all in the budget process, the work of the Legislature remains of cardinal importance. So also, the funds that this House needs to achieve that.

Hon Chair, this House is responsible for important functions including the delegation of important life changing legislation, as well as oversight over the Executive Authority. All over the country, Provincial Legislatures as well as the National Parliament have become hollow, toothless institutions that do nothing more than condone the whims and will of the ANC. These institutions have become no more than another mechanism within a process to rubberstamp the ANC's National Government's poor decision-making, disastrous legislation and large-scale plundering of the State.

Hon Chair, but the Western Cape's Provincial Parliament is a shining example of a legislature with guts and one standing out above the rest. There are several reasons why Western Cape's Provincial Parliament is on the foreground as the best legislature in the country. Some of the reasons include political leadership that puts the interests of the citizens above that of political party affiliations, and a dedicated, professional and non-party affiliated staff compliment. A provinsiale executive authority that is accountable and transparent.

Hon Chair, the reason why the Western Cape according to most standards is the province governed best is because the Western Cape's Provincial Parliament works. The Western Cape's Provincial Parliament's dedication to attentive resource management serves as a beacon of fiscal responsibility where it takes wise decisions to prioritise funds to the essential work of the House, rather than declining into the decadence of expensive trips and luxuries as in other provinces in South Africa.

Hon Chair, this institution embraces a culture of inclusivity and is a champion of diversity, dignity, equality, respect and fairness. By putting the need and voices of the people first, the Western Cape's Provincial Parliament personifies the true meaning of a Parliament that is dedicated to the service and improvement of her citizens.

This Legislature, in spite of some of the Opposition's standpoints to the contrary, works without fear or favour, respects non-partisanship and is governed well, but we should not be under any illusion, these recent budget cuts caused by the National Treasury will have an effect on the Legislature and its ability to do its work. As was noted today during the various Budget Votes, the Western Cape is subject a huge shortfall of R1-billion in the overall budget.

Hon Chair, this is no small change. These are large sums of money with greater implications for the people of the Western Cape. The cuts for the 2023/2024 financial year means that the Western Cape had to cut various critical services. Cuts to the Western Cape's provisional allocations include a decrease in allocations to critical infrastructure development programmes, health and wellness programmes, education, road maintenance, human settlements, upgrading of informal settlements and agriculture.

Hon Chair, these budget cuts may sound like big words and big amounts, but it also has big and real consequences for our people on the ground. Hon

Chair, citizens' daily lives. I therefore commend the efforts of Minister Wenger and the Provincial Treasury who work under tremendous pressure to protect critical frontline services and by extension, the people of our province against the budget bloodbath that was caused by the ANC's National Government. In spite of the restraints and restrictions, the Western Cape has indeed drawn up a budget to protect our communities and build our future

Hon Chair, the Western Cape's Provincial Parliament was unfortunately not spared by the budget bloodbath. The Provincial Parliament saw an increase of R836 000 in the Budget allocation of R187 678 000 in the 2022/23 financial period, which amounts to an increase of 0,45% for this financial year. It was the cuts that the Western Cape's Legislature had to endure, however, to ensure that other services faced by the public are funded.

Hon Chair, under Programme 1: Management, Leadership and Administration, R830 000 was given to the Provincial Revenue Fund with regard to cyber safety monies that will be redistributed to the 2025/26 Cyber Safety Budget. Programme 3: The Public Participation had a total decrease of R1,877 million, that was divided further as follows:

- R1,7 million was allocated to the PIF with regard to the Digital Online Platform Budget that will be redivided to supplement the 2024/25 Budget.
- Hon Chair, R500 000 was allocated to the PIF with regard to the 2023/24 Digital Online Platform Budget that will be redivided to supplement the 2024/25 Budget.

- R3,5 million was allocated to the PIF with regard to the savings identified in 2023/24 against remuneration of employees that will be reallocated to supplement the 2025/26 Budget.

The cuts are an unfortunate result of the fiscal crisis in which South Africa finds itself, but it is not the first time that the Provincial Parliament had to overcome difficult financial circumstances.

Hon Chair, as we have seen during COVID, this Legislature is resilient and we will navigate these fine restrictions by ensuring that we put the people of the Western Cape first, as always.

Hon Chair, I want to conclude by extending my sincere thanks to the leadership, the Speaker, the Deputy Speaker, all staff of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. Your dedication and contributions are sincerely appreciated and that is why the Western Cape Provincial Parliament is functioning.

On behalf of the Democratic Alliance I support this Budget Vote 2 as tabled in the Western Cape's Provincial Parliament. Hon Chair, I thank you.]

†Die TYDELIKE VOORSITTER: Baie dankie, agb Kaizer-Philander. [The TEMPORARY CHAIRMAN: Thank you, hon Kaizer-Philander.] I recognise the hon Daylin Mitchell.

Mr D G Mitchell (DA): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson and thank you to all the contributions in this debate. Hon Temporary Chairperson, I just want to make three general comments. I am not going to get into the political debate because it has got nothing to do with the Vote. So, I am going to stick to the Vote.

But there are three points that I would like to make. The first is that the Western Cape Provincial Parliament like parliaments, have got three constitutional mandates. And if you look at the budget and if the hon members looked at the budget, they will see that the constitutional mandates required from a parliament are being addressed. Those are: lawmaking, public participation and oversight of the Executive. And in all those constitutional – constitutional matters, money has been allocated in order to actually address the constitutional mandates.

If you look at the Committee's budget that over the last year with every adjustment, with every saving, has been increased. Public Education and Outreach: I mean, there is an hon member that says your Parliament is not taking public education outreach seriously. If you look at the Mogale Judgment which I would like to refer the hon member to, the Western Cape Provincial Parliament is the only Legislature, hon Temporary Chairperson, in this country where the courts ruled that it did adequate public participation.

But if we want to speak about public education or public participation, let us look at the DORA that was just passed with strict timelines. The people of

this province, the people of the Western Cape did not have an opportunity to make inputs into the DORA, but we come here, and we speak about public participation and public education that is not being addressed. If you look at the budget, hon Temporary Chairperson, the three constitutional mandates of this Parliament are being addressed. So, he cannot come here and make blanket statements without having the fact.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, then I want to address one other thing. Hon Temporary Chairperson, when we speak about Rules and that certain political parties are not being included. The Rules Committee met. There is a subcommittee that has been established which is a multi-party committee, hon Temporary Chairperson, that all political parties had inputs in. Not too long ago, two weeks ago, the Rules Committee met and a multi-party committee, a subcommittee agreed that there are still further amendments to the Rules. So, I do not know where the Rules of political parties are not being incorporated because the process is still ongoing.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, with regards to the lighting of the building. Again, if the hon member took the time, he would know that there have been directives that have been published with when and how the building will be lit up. So, he cannot come here and make political blanket statements and expect because it happens to be the Provincial Parliament Vote, I need to keep quiet about it, because it is not just. I mean, you can attack the political leadership of this institution, but do not reflect on the work that is going on behind the scenes from a very competent administration, that works

tirelessly.

They have probably the smallest component in this country, but with the least resources and the least resources ...[Interjections.] Yes, yes, probably the least ...[Interjections.] the worst paid in the country because this is a responsible Parliament that does not make commitments outside of a budget that has been appropriated because that is irresponsible and that is why this country is in the mess that it is in.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, with that being said, I would like to take this opportunity to thank every single staff member of this institution for the work that has gone in, for the amount of effort, for diligently serving the citizens of this province. Thank you very, very much for what you do and thank you very much for the amount of support that all hon members, all 42 hon members of this Parliament is receiving from the Western Cape Provincial Administration, thank you very, very much for the work that you do.

To the Secretary and the SMT: thank you. Thank you for giving effect to the strategic objectives. We have gone back to the basics. Thank you very much for embracing that. Thank you for understanding that we have got a constitutional mandate and that we do not move away from what we are mandated to do. †Daar is niks van *glitz and glamour* nie. [There is nothing of glitz and glamour.] There is absolutely no glitz and glamor in this Parliament. Go and look at the rest of this country. Not a single glitz and

glamor.

I mean, we speak about a cyberattack. We speak about a cyberattack. We can speak about National Government departments that get hacked regularly, that and nothing being done. Nothing being done. The ICT Department or the ICT unit of this institution acted immediately. They even act, hon Temporary Chairperson, when political parties try to bypass – bypass the WCPP infrastructure. Even then, they interact, or they get into it. So, thank you very, very much to Mr Skrikke and his team who work tirelessly and that I can comfortably say have addressed the issue of cybersecurity. Thank you for taking it seriously and for the amounts of hours and dedication that went into that. [Interjections.]

No, not at all. Hon Temporary Chairperson, I do not feel guilty. I do not feel guilty because in this Parliament we have proven that we are the best run in this province and mark my words, there is not a single Legislature that can come close to this. Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Thank you, hon Mitchell. [Interjections.] Thank you. Thank you, hon members. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon members. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon Nkondlo. [Interjections.] Thank you. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon Nkondlo. There are speaking times allocated in this House. Thank you.

Thank you, hon members. That deals with Vote 2. That concludes the debate

and the business for the day. The Secretary will now exit the meeting and all hon members will also be exited from this Sitting. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:15.