

---

THURSDAY, 6 JUNE 2013

---

**PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT**

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p

**INTERPELLATIONS**

*Medical male circumcision*

**1. Ms A J du Toit Marais asked the Minister of Health:**

What is the strategy in respect of medical male circumcision in the Western Cape?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you very much Mr Speaker and to hon mem Ms Marais for raising this question. The approach of the Department of Health is that the Department plays a secondary role in that it is geared to perform medical male circumcisions, but that the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport is the primary role player, as initiation constitutes an important cultural practice amongst a significant section of the population of the Western Cape. This is a new approach that we have implemented in our Government.

The objective is to promote the cultural practice without compromising our health objectives. That is the real objective with this programme. The departments have in collaboration with all relevant stakeholders embarked on a process that will culminate in the formulation of a joint strategy for the Western Cape. In 2011 the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport developed an initiation framework and protocol. The recommendations of the Department of Health's circumcision strategy are included in this framework. The two departments have jointly established a steering committee driven by DECAS. The committee drives closer collaboration and co-ordination between DECAS and the Department of Health with regard to medical male circumcision, and the initiations are all traditional circumcision programmes. The DECAS mandate is to protect, promote and preserve the cultural heritage. There is agreement, however, amongst all the relevant role players that initiation is a cultural practice with health implications. The department has, therefore, in partnership with the relevant initiation forums, municipalities and provincial departments such as Health and Cape Nature, worked towards protecting the custom of initiation as well as safeguarding the medical wellbeing of all initiates.

The recent initiation workshop which was held on 30 May 2013 was attended by traditional leaders, traditional surgeons and representatives from local and provincial government, who certainly acknowledged the need for consideration to be given to all options that promote the wellbeing of initiates while at the same time creating and enabling an environment for this very important custom to be practised. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Baie dankie mnr die Speaker. Navorsingsstudies het aangedui dat die veilige sirkumsisie of dan besnydenis van MIV negatiewe mans sekere beskerming bied teen MIV-infeksie. Die departement het 'n mobiliseringsstrategie vir MMS wat

ontwikkel word en gerig is op die segment van die gemeenskap wat nie deur die tradisionele sirkumsisie geraak word nie. Helen Epstein verduidelik soos volg “Sirkumsisie verwyder die slymvlies wat selle bevat wat spesiale reseptore vir MIV bevat”. Hierdie prosedure verminder die risiko om met MIV besmet te raak met tot 60%. Tydens die navorsing was die resultate so beduidend dat die studie voortydig gestaak is omdat dit as oneties beskou is om nie die kontrolegroep aan die prosedure te onderwerp nie. Hierdie prosedure is net vir mans en ek herhaal net vir mans and nie vir vrouens nie. Vroulike sirkumsisie bied geen beskerming teen MIV nie en is dus uiters gevaarlik vir vroue. Hierdie prosedure bied tans meer effektiewe beskerming teen MIV as enige ander eksperimentele vaksines. Dit is goedkoper, het minder newe-effekte and indien veilige prosedures gevolg word, veral minder newe-effekte. Baie dankie, mnr die Speaker.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you Mr Speaker and thank you to hon mem Ms Marais for that contribution. The Department of Health currently provides medical assistance and advice to traditional healers and surgeons in the form of providing first aid training and kits for traditional healers and surgeons and providing bibs for nurses who assist during these ceremonies. Districts providing the services have a doctor on call for circumcision groups or camps, encouraging local authorities to have clean running water points at their circumcision camps and engaging traditional healers and surgeons through their local forums. The Western Cape Government wishes to protect and promote the cultural practices of our people. We have great regard for the inputs of the initiation forums in the process of developing an initiation protocol that will intergrate the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport and Health. The Department of Health and DECAS officials are working towards the finalisation of these integrated protocols which will be signed off by my colleague, the hon member Mr Meyer and myself in the near future, hopefully by September. Thank you.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Thank you, Somlomo ee... ndimadolwanzima, e... This interpellation presents me with difficulties in my culture... [Uphazamisa.]... ndili zizi ihlubi mna. Intwenjengalena andiyi xoxi esidlangalaleni, and even when I look at the people participating here, none of these people have undergone this particular practice. I can be in big trouble [interjection.] ... ndiyindoda mna

MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PULBIC WORKS: Have you done personal inspections?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Probably. I can be in big trouble if I can entertain... lentwilumezayo ndiyivayo ezindlebeni ithetwa ngula mama. This does not only present me with a problem, it also presents African women with a problem. They are not familiar with ... They are not used to such discussions. This is a discussion for men who have gone through this practice and I can in fact ... I do not even know because the question here speaks about circumcision, which is something very different to initiation. When you started the discussion it became apparent that you were discussing initiation. The question should probably have been phrased differently. All I know is that if we speak about initiations we should avoid unnecessary deaths by embarking on illegal initiations schools. In this day and age in our country those that are going to go through this ritual are by law supposed to be very fit in all respects. I can engage in any other discussion but a discussion on this matter I will not be able to engage in. Ndiyindada.

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Speaker, I just want to tell the hon member that I am sensitive to his culture, but that this is about medical male circumcision. I repeat, medical

male circumcision. Tydens die Staande Kommittee se besoek verlede week, is in die voorlegging by Melkhoutfontein ... (Tussenwerpsels.)

The SPEAKER: Order hon members!

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: ... aangedui dat MMS se teiken, soos deur Department gestel, oortref is. Dit is verblydend, veral omdat hierdie mans verantwoordelikheid neem ten opsigte van hulle eie en ander se gesondheid. Selfs met hierdie prosedure is dit noodsaaklik om nie ombeskermd seks te hê nie. Daar moet ook nog steeds voorligting ten opsigte van seks en MIV gedoen word. MMS vorm deel van 'n onvattende pakket wat deur die Departement van Gesondheid aangebied word om manlike gesondheid daar te stel. Baie dankie.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, I am really extremely disappointed in my good friend and colleague the hon member Mr Skwatsha for not taking the opportunity to address the serious medical problem that we have. 27 young boys died in Mpumalanga due to malpractices and inefficiency. I am a member of the South African National Aids Council under the leadership of the Deputy President of South Africa, Deputy President Motlanthe, and I am part of the men's sector of that South African National Aids Council. The men's sector said the reported deaths of 27 initiatives ...

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Ms Magwaza can you please stop that running commentary. Proceed hon Minister.

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Huh?

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Bobbejaan sê “huh”...(Interjections.)

The SPEAKER: You may proceed hon Minister.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Dis waar. Nadat ek ‘n ... (Tussenwerpsels.) The reported deaths of 27 initiates at Government registration ...

The SPEAKER: Order! Take your seat hon Minister.

Mr M SKWATSHA: On a point of order. Is the hon member allowed to refer to other people as ‘bobbejaans’?

The SPEAKER: Which member is that? [Interjections.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: The hon Theuns Botha.

Mr SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Hon member Ms Tingwe. Order!

Ms L BROWN: ...[Interjections.] I am very shocked ... bobbejane.

Mr SPEAKER: Over to you hon Minister. Can you address it?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, if I may just reply to that through you. I said “‘n bobbejaan maak ‘huh’”. I did not say she is a baboon. I would never say so. I love her. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order hon members. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order hon members.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Vir 'n outjie wat 'n hofsaak verloor het, lyk jy nogal goed, nê.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha, order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, let me ...[Interjections]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, Take your seat please ...[Interjections.].

Mr P UYS: I am not going to make a case.

The SPEAKER: Minister, take your seat please.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, is it parliamentary to make such a reference?

Ms M TINGWE: Yes.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Would I be wrong if I say it has racist connotations?

'n AGB LID: Ja.

The SPEAKER: Order. Hon member! Order!

THE MINISTER OF HEALTH: Racism?

THE MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS : What is racist about a baboon?

Mr M OZINSKY: ... calling a black person a baboon is racist.

The SPEAKER: Order hon members! Hon member Mr Ozinsky! Order! (Interjections.)  
Order hon members! Hon member Mr Carlisle.

THE MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: A baboon does not have a race.

An HON MEMBER: Baboon.

Ms L BROWN: And a Giraffe?

THE MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Kangaroo.

THE MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Baboon.

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Skwatsha. I will make a ruling later on that matter.



I have to check exactly what the Minister said and ... (Interjections.)

THE MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: There is nothing wrong with a baboon.

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Minister. Hon ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: On a point of order. Is it parliamentary for the hon Minister Carlisle to continually interject when you are giving a ruling?

The SPEAKER: That is why I am saying order both sides because both sides ... [Interjections.] ... you apologised, but please members, can we allow the Minister now to finish his speech.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Just on a last point of order, Mr Speaker. I want to accept your ruling, but I think the Minister said "bobbejaan'huh'".

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr M SKWATSHA: You do not have to ... [Interjections.] He needs the votes of the bobbejaane.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mr Skwatsha. [Interjections.] Order hon members! Minister, over to you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I want to, with your permission, Mr Speaker, just read one paragraph from our statement from the men's sector of SANAC:

“The men's sector joins many other voices that have condemned these events in Mpumalanga, and welcomes the condemnation of the presidency. Although the men's sector welcomes the opening of 26 murder cases related to the deaths of the initiates by the South African Police Service, the sector's primary interest is not in the punitive measures against those who have committed the crime, but rather in the prevention of the senseless loss of the lives of young boys. The men's sector therefore condemns this, and in the Western Cape we will do whatever is necessary to respect the culture and ensure medical precision”.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

*Taxi permits : policy*

**2. Mr Z C Stali asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

Whether there is any policy in place in respect of the issuing of taxi permits in the Western Cape; if not, why not; if so, what criteria are applied in respect of the issuing of such permits?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and thank you also to the hon member Mr Stali for this question with regard to whether there is a policy in place for the issuing of tax permits in the Western Cape. I presume that he refers to operating trading permits and the answer is as follows:

The issuing of operating taxi permits is governed by statute, notably the National Land Transport Act, by the conditions laid down in the integrated transport plan of the appropriate planning authority, which would be the municipality in each case, and the policy of the provincial regulatory entity, the PRE. So, the short answer is yes, there is.

In terms of section 57 of the NLTA, the PRE, in disposing of an operating licence application, must act according to, and may not issue an operating licence contrary to, the directions of the planning authority – as I said, the municipality – and the integrated transport plan for the municipal area.

Section 38 of the Act further stipulates that all state departments are bound by the provisions of the integrated transport plan. A municipality may also proceed with certain actions even if the integrated transport plan has not been prepared, updated or approved provided such actions are based on sound transport planning principles.

It goes on, hon member Mr Stali, in some considerable detail which I am happy to examine with you but let me just give you some idea of what we base this on. As part of the production of the plan, surveys are undertaken of service capacity and passenger utilisation on all mini bus taxi routes. This would include rank surveys where passenger numbers are recorded, roadside monitoring surveys to quantify boarding and alighting taking place along the route. The numerating team also conducts onboard bus surveys. The survey information is used to do a comprehensive demand analysis to calculate the number of vehicles required on each route.

Now, a little more detail, but let me say this - and I think the hon member knows this – traditionally the routes in the Cape Town area were up to 70% over-traded as a result of the deregulation of the public transport system where operating licences were issued in an uncontrolled manner. This resulted in fierce competition for passengers and concomitant violent confrontations. Over the last few years, very few new operating licences have been issued and over-trading and its associated violent competition, have largely abated.

The purpose of the National Land Transport Act is to move from a supply driven public transport system to a demand driven public transport system based on plans, and the need for services must, at all times, be demonstrated.

Mr Z C STALI: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Having noted the Minister's response, can the Minister tell us why over 50% of taxi owners are not able to use or uplift their permits? Surely the criteria to be met within 60 days, that they need the clearance from SARS and that the vehicles are roadworthy, is unreasonable especially for taxi owners from poor and working class communities. It takes more than 60 days for SARS to clear someone. Most taxi owners do not have roadworthy vehicles. The province does not have a proper training program in place for the taxi owners as to how to fulfil the criteria to obtain their permits. With regards to monitoring - the role of the City - it seems as if the MEC is absent. The MEC has not addressed the challenge posed to taxi owners when the City drags its feet in informing people about dormant permits. The City is also not swift in facilitating the granting of licences when there is a demand for taxis. Taxi associations have also found that many a time the City claims that there is no demand for taxis on certain routes whilst there is indeed demand for the taxis on those routes. I thank you.

Mr E VON BRANDIS: Mr Speaker, the taxi industry is crucial for the local economy. It is relied on by hundreds of thousands of commuters on a daily basis, but it is also unfortunately an industry with intense competition, and over-subscription has led to a cycle of feuding and violence. The National Land Transport Act of 2009 states that the provincial sphere of government is responsible for the formulation of provincial transport policy and strategy. Therefore, as the authority in this regard, the Department of Transport and Public Works is mandated with regulating all classes of road users along laws set nationally and provincially. This includes regulating the mini bus taxi industry. Any policy and regulation that exists is done with the aim of ensuring that our roads are safer and that commuters, whether in public or private transport, are part of a system that has the necessary regulatory oversight and enforcement.

We have seen the violence and recklessness that the taxi industry is capable of and we have also seen how effective enforcement of that and strategies by the department has curtailed this over the years.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Thank you to the hon member Mr von Brandis and also to hon member Mr Stali who is not addressing this particular interpellation. He has now created a second interpellation which I am happy to deal with.

I do not think he is addressing this province though, I think he is addressing some other province, but anyway.

An HON MEMBER: All that alcohol ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Speaker, it is not correct that 50% of taxi permits have not been uplifted. A tiny proportion may not be uplifted at any given time. SARS has a representative at the PRE. We especially arranged that. At the end of the day if SARS do hold up people, we cannot help that. We do not control SARS. It is the ANC government that controls SARS, not us.

As far as the roadworthy is concerned, I cannot believe the hon member Mr Stali would want us to issue an operating licence to an unroadworthy vehicle.

As far as training programmes are concerned, let me say to the hon member Mr Stali that I was at the electoral conference of SANTACO on Tuesday and they do not seem to be troubled by the things that the hon member Mr Stali is troubled by. The very people on whose behalf he is trying to act, seem very happy with what is happening. In fact, I have to tell you that they did a 'viva' and then an 'amandla' for me, as the Minister. So, they do not seem to ... [Interjections.] I will not tell you what else they did because that would really make the hon member Mr Stali very sad indeed.

As far as dormant permits are concerned, throughout the time the ANC was in control, they did nothing about dormant permits. We are the ones who are doing something about dormant permits.

As far as demand is concerned, the hon member Mr Stali knows as well as I do, it is always a

difficult matter. You make the best judgement you can in the circumstances and you know if you get it wrong, that human life could depend on it.

Mr Z C STALI: Hon Minister, unfortunately, the Registrar of Taxis, Mark Striker, who reports directly to you, is all too powerful in the issuing of permits. Taxi owners must be registered with the Registrar. Through the Registrar, Minister Carlilse punishes taxi owners who do not toe his line. Mr Junaid Pieterse of Mitchells Plain – I am surprised if you are now saying they do not see anything wrong .. [Interjections.] – he is one of the many victims of this. Once the hon Minister revokes and denies taxi permits, he refuses to engage with the owners and drivers. We saw how this led to conflicts in Hout Bay. It is also pragmatic that non-taxi owners are receiving permits as well as people who do not stay in the areas in which they apply to operate in. These are the issues that bother the taxi people. If they do not raise them when they are with you, then it must be something else. If they are calling ‘Amandlas’ and ‘vivas’ for you, well then you must celebrate that because it is only they that can do that for you. If you go outside of that, they will not be doing that for you. These are some of the problems that are raised. You get a number of areas in the Western Cape where there is not even a single person who stays in that area who has a taxi permit and is operating taxis. What is your thinking in respect of awarding those drivers who have been operating in the industry for more than 30 years, and even the guards within that industry for more than 30 years, because those are the people that are being victimised in this regard. Those are the people who are collecting all the tickets but there is nothing that goes to them as a reward. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Yes, it was them. You are right. It was Misello and Mandla and Dibela. Right. [Interjections.]

And it would have been Capuko if he was not in bed, okay. [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Members order!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Now, first of all, let me say that the interesting thing about the hon member Mr Stali is that he has, for the first time ... [Interjections.] Often he speaks for 20 minutes or so, and gets only one thing right. All the other things are wrong.

An HON MEMBER: Aah, no.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: This time he has set an absolute record. He got nothing right. Every single thing was wrong. [Interjections.] Mr Striker does not report to me. Mr Striker does not make the decisions about whether taxis can operate in an area or not. That is done by the City of Cape Town. I explained that to the hon member Mr Stali, by what is called the planning authority. Junaid Pieterse has a permit. I happen to know that personally, but he has not uplifted it and do you know why he has not uplifted it?

An HON MEMBER: Why?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Because he cannot pay what he owes to SARS. That is why he has not uplifted it. I cannot help him with that problem. If



you want to go and lend him some money so he can uplift the permit, that is fine, but until he pays SARS, he cannot uplift the permit.

You say that a person applies for a permit in one area and is given a permit in another area. It is not so. I have never heard of such a thing. We would be mad to do such things. I want to say to the hon member Mr Stali, I want to say to his Chairman, please take him to the PRE. Please show him what goes on there so that he will come back here and say, as the others did, 'amandla' MEC. 'Viva' MEC. [Laughter].

*Toll Plaza building :Chapman's Peak route*

**3. Ms T N Bevu asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

How much money had been paid by the Provincial Government of the Western Cape for the construction of the Toll Plaza building on Chapman's Peak route as at the latest specified date for which figures are available?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Speaker and thank you also the hon member Ms Bevu who asked how much money has been paid by the provincial government for the construction of the toll plaza building on Chapman's Peak as at the latest specified date.

The Western Cape Government entered into a 30 year concession agreement with Entilini Concession in 2002, and the hon member Ms Bevu remembers who was in power in 2002, for the reconstruction of Chapman's Peak Drive and the operation thereof as a toll road. This agreement constituted a public/private partnership involving National Treasury. Due to environmental constraints, the construction of a permanent toll plaza was delayed, and the

road was opened in December 2003 with temporary toll plaza on the Hout Bay side of the concession, which is still there to this day. Environmental authorisation for the construction of the Hout Bay toll plaza was subsequently obtained. The agreement hon member Ms Bevu refers to in 2002 was extremely prejudicial to the province resulting in some R60 million being paid by the province to the concessionnaire either as a shortfall on the original estimated revenues, and increasingly as compensation when the pass was closed. In as much as the concessionnaire was entitled to close the pass at will, it was clear that the agreement placed the province and the taxpayers in a very intolerable position. When I assumed office, I immediately called for the agreement to be reviewed and for those clauses which were prejudicial to the province to be removed or mitigated. Negotiations between the province and National Treasury and the concessionnaire commenced in 2009, and the outcome was the signing of the third addendum of the concession agreement between the government of the Western Cape and Entilini Concession, signed on 18 March 2011.

This amended agreement removed those clauses that were prejudicial to the province and provided for a profit-sharing arrangement in which all of the costs that we had paid over the years, will be recovered. Section 531 of that agreement states:

“The province shall make a capital contribution of R25 million inclusive of VAT towards the construction of the Hout Bay toll plaza”.

That R25 million is one half of the total cost of that construction and it has already been paid to the concessionnaire, in answer to your question, after submission of certified work certificates. This amount will also be recovered from the concessionnaire over time and at the end of the 30 year contract, the toll plaza comes back as the property of the province. So, not only do we get back the money we put into it, we get the whole construction back as ours,

as our property at the end of the period.

Ms T N BEVU: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Thank you very much to the Minister. I was putting the question to you as the person who is now in control of this department. So, do not tell me about 2002. The province stated in court during the 2012 urgent interdict ...  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order. You may proceed hon member Ms Bevu.

Ms T N BEVU: The province stated in court during the 2012 urgent interdict that it would cost R141 million to back out of the Chapman's Peak toll road contract. Would you say this would have been cheaper than continuing to pay Entilini for 30 years and why did your government not run a public tender for the building of the Chapman's Peak toll plaza instead of allowing ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Prins, hon member Ms Bevu is on the floor. Please.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: On a point of order. Hon member Ms Bevu is making important points and I cannot hear them because of the row over there.

The SPEAKER: That is what I am doing hon Minister, because I also cannot hear the hon member Ms Bevu

Ms T N BEVU: Would you say this would have been cheaper than continuing to pay Entilini

for 30 years? Why did your government not run a public tender for the building of the Chapman's Peak toll plaza instead of allowing Entilini to be the only contractor on site to build 800 square metres, quoted at R54 million? Why has there been no independent quantity surveyor to assess the toll plaza now and give province and estimation of the cost of this building as built? It is public knowledge that tender traffic volumes have never been met on the Chapman's Peak toll road, that the volume of traffic using this road is below 20% of what Entilini tendered for at that time. The question is whether the provincial government will continue paying for these bogus expected traffic volumes forever, and if so, how much will it cost the taxpayer over the contracted period with Entilini? Is it true that your government has given Entilini 20 years to repay the R59 million paid in wrongful compensation claims by the province? So, if we add all this up, due to bad Western Cape provincial management, taxpayers have now spent ...

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms T N BEVU: I will come again.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Speaker, after several years of wrangling, the Chapman's Peak toll plaza opened in 2013. When the DA came into government in 2009, six years of planning the construction of the operation centre and toll plaza was already done. Minister Carlisle had the task of fixing what was then called the Chapman's Peak mess. This mess was inherited, a legacy of the previous ANC led provincial government. It was under the ANC's watch that the tolls were implemented and it was under their watch that this entire mess unfolded. It was also under their watch that the concessionaire was allowed to play gatekeeper, deciding if and when the pass would be opened. Let us be ever mindful that it

was Minister Carlisle that managed to disallow this from continuing. To say that we are in a better place than previous years, would not do enough justice to what the DA led government has accomplished over the last few years.

On the matter of the costs incurred, the department in 2012 stated that the total cost of the plaza that was not financed by the province, will be paid off through toll fees. Mr Speaker, it is with certainty that I say, that had the ANC been left to the task, Chapman's Peak would have entered into another rudderless decade. I thank you.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Speaker and thank you to the hon member Mr von Brandis. I think he answered most of the hon member Ms Bevu's questions. Now, the interesting thing about the hon member Ms Bevu is that she said you must not think about 2002, speak about now, and then she promptly speaks about 2002. So, I have to go back to 2002 and remind her that this was a very bad contract that was entered into by the ANC, of which you were then a member. Our job in 2009 was to take a very bad contract and make it a good contract, and that was not easy. But we have done it and all the money that was lost because of the ANC, the DA will get back. It does not matter if it takes us 15 years. If we had not done that, the taxpayer and the state would never have got that money back.

I am not quite sure what you mean by public tender. The toll plaza was part of the contract. We could not change everything in the contract and in fact, we did not want to change everything in the contract. There are certain things I did want to change. There was an independent quantity surveyor estimate. In fact, there were three and let me say this, that once it became evident after the rock falls of 2000 – if I had been the Minister then hon

member Ms Bevu, I would not have reopened Chapman's Peak. It would have been closed forever. There is no justification for the amount of taxpayers money that has been spent on that pass before we came to power, under the ANC, for five and a half kilometres. But once that money had been spent, I had to get the best possible deal I could for this parliament and for this administration and that is exactly what we got.

Mr Z C STALI: Mr Speaker, with the Chapman's Peak toll plaza the taxpayer is funding the agent with a base income. The DA has turned their opposition to Sanral and to tolls into an electioneering ploy. None of Sanral's projects entail this kind of taxpayers funding for agent based income. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: What about the tolls in Gauteng.

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Z C STALI: The discussions around Chapman's Peak ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr Z C STALI: ... underlying the DA's double talk around e-tolls. Here in the Western Cape ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Wiley, order!

Mr Z C STALI: The DA fought people who opposed the Chapman's Peak toll plaza, but the DA wants the same people to join them in opposing the Cape Winelands toll roads. They claim that the ANC supported Cape tolls when it governed the Western Cape. The ANC did not support the toll project. [Interjections.]

Then MEC Fransman wrote a letter objecting to the project. In their transport policy document the DA proposes toll roads as a means to fund road infrastructure development and says it will pass toll legislation. They did it in 1999 when they governed the Western Cape. Now close to the elections they oppose toll roads vehemently. DA policy says that the user pay principle is appropriate and believes that profits must be made, but the DA now claims that the user pay principle is unwarranted, double taxation.

Ms T N BEVU: Mr Speaker, If I add up the taxpayers' money spent at the moment, it is a R150 million tender to Entilini to repair the slopes, R54 million for the building of an unnecessary toll plaza building of which R11 million was used from funds not spent from the audit, another R150 million during the repair phase. R100 000 per month for 8 years for Entilini office accommodation expenses prior to the company ...

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member .

Ms T N BEVU: ... being housed in their own tall building, when the cost of Entilini renting office space in Hout Bay was a recorded R10,000 per month. In a nutshell, Entilini has been given an interest free loan for 20 years to repay the R59 million paid in wrongful compensation claims. We must be concerned about that. The DA Western Cape Provincial Government does not approve of the Sanral e-tolling system as it will cause a battle for the

poor. Why did they fight the taxpayers in the very same Cape High Court last year when they were informed the Chapman's Peak tolling system had a dramatic cost effect on the people of the South Peninsula by cutting off the poor communities of Hout Bay from their relatives in Ocean View; cutting off South Peninsula commuters from a direct route into the city; the volume of traffic using Ou Kaapse Weg and creating massive bottle-necks of traffic entering and leaving the South Peninsula; on top of the City Managers digging up the M4 Main Roads from Muizenberg to Fish Hoek and allowing the contractor to overrun a two-year contract to five years, at a cost of a mere R150 million? Thank you.

The MINISTER FOR TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Speaker, what I am trying to establish from the hon member Mr Stali is: Are you in favour of the Sanral toll road or are you not? That is what we keep asking you. It is a simple question, you know. You can answer me. Just tell me. Are you in favour or are you not? He giggles with embarrassment. The fact is that you are opposed to it but you are too scared to say so in case you get a posting to Syria. That is what you are scared of. We do not want that toll road. We do not want to see that kind of spending then extracted from the citizens of the Western Cape.

Mr M OZINSKY: Which toll road do you want?

The MINISTER FOR TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I do not want any toll roads.

Mr M OZINSKY: But your policy says ...

The SPEAKER : Order, hon member Mr Ozinsky.



The MINISTER FOR TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: No. My policy says we believe in user pays. We do not want any toll road, but it's not a question of what we want. We said what we want. When are you going to say what you want? When is COPE going to say what COPE wants? That is what we want to know. [Interjections.] Let me conclude Mr Speaker, by saying I agree with COPE.

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Ms Magwaza, order.

The MINISTER FOR TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: It is appalling what was spent there. Shocking, and you should bitterly criticize the ANC because they were the ones who spent it.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. That is the end of the interpellations. We will now deal with questions as printed on the Question Paper. We'll start with questions standing over from Thursday, 16 May and the first question is to the Premier.

*Public Service Commissioner : appointment*

**\*1. Mr P Uys asked the Premier:**

Whether someone has been appointed as Public Service Commissioner in the Western Cape; if not, why not; if so, (a)(i) who and (ii) for what period and (b) what procedure was followed in respect of the appointment?

THE PREMIER: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. Yes.

(a) (i) Dr G Woods. (a)(ii) For five years with effect from the date of assumption of duties as

per President's Minute No. 223 of 11 August 2011. The date of assumption of his duties was dependent on the President granting Dr Woods permission to fulfil remunerative work at the University of Stellenbosch on a part-time basis. Dr Woods wrote to the President requesting permission on 19 September 2011. President Zuma granted that permission as per Minute No. 371 of 6 December 2012. Therefore Dr Woods is appointed for five years from 1 January 2013 which is when he assumed his duties.

- (b) The procedure followed in his appointment was that a committee of the Western Cape Parliament recommended that Doctor Woods be nominated for the position, and the legislature then approved that recommendation. I wrote to the President nominating Dr Woods on 8 June 2010 and the Minister of Public Service Administration, Mr M R Baloyi, wrote to me to inform me that the President had appointed Dr Woods with effect from 12 July 2010.

When informed of his nomination and before being formally appointed, Dr Woods wrote to the President in June 2010 seeking permission to perform remunerative work at the University of Stellenbosch as provided for in the Public Service Act, in addition to his duties as the Public Service Commissioner. The President appointed Dr Woods, but made no mention of his request for permission to do other work. Four months later Dr Woods received a letter informing him that the President would not grant him that permission. In light of the fact that Dr Woods had made commitments to the University he reluctantly tendered his resignation in November 2010. In January 2011, I informed the Western Cape Cabinet of this development and I was requested by cabinet to raise this matter with the President.

While at a meeting at the Union Buildings in March 2011, I discussed Dr Woods' case with the President. I then confirmed our discussion in a letter dated 30 March 2011 wherein I asked him to reconsider his refusal to give Dr Woods the required consent.

On 12 August 2011, Minister Baloyi wrote to me to tell me that the President had indeed appointed Dr Woods as Commissioner of the Public Service Commission for the Western Cape and that his appointment would take effect "from the first day that he reports to the Chairperson of the Public Service Commission for duty and is for a term of five years." A similar letter was written to Dr Woods.

In September 2011, Dr Woods wrote to the President seeking clarity on whether the President had now given him permission to fulfil his teaching obligations at the University of Stellenbosch.

He indicated that he was unable to take up his duties at the Commission until he had formal permission from the President to carry on the other remunerated work. On 21 December 2012 - that is over a year later – the current Minister of Public Service Administration, Lindiwe Sisulu, wrote to me to confirm that the President had indeed agreed to Dr Woods performing remunerative work at the University of Stellenbosch.

Thank you.

Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, is it not then correct that Dr Woods resigned? You said he was not happy but he resigned. How could you then appoint him again after he resigned from that specific position seeing that there is this clear process ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order please!

Mr P UYS: ... in terms of Section 196 of the Constitution. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, I did not appoint him at any point. In terms of the Constitution and the Law he is appointed by the President and the President appointed him. If the hon member Mr Uys has got any problems with the President's method of appointment then he must please direct the question to the hon President.

An HON MEMBER: Can you ask the ANC whether they fired him? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Order hon members. Hon member Mr Uys over to you.

Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker thank you. Did the Premier inform the President that Dr Woods resigned from that position? [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Well first of all Dr Woods had been in a lot of correspondence with the Presidency so I assume the President knew, but I had a long conversation with the President in March 2011 in which we discussed the entire issue and he said in the light of my information he would appoint Dr Woods; which he then did.

Mr P UYS: Is Dr Woods then carrying on with his functions at the University of Stellenbosch?

The PREMIER: Yes. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order! Hon members order. Can we then proceed to the new questions and the first question is to the Premier.

*New questions:*

*Report on alleged police inefficiency : Khayelitsha*

**\*1. Mr P Uys asked the Premier:**

Whether the period relating to the submission of the report of the commission in Khayelitsha on alleged police inefficiency and a breakdown in relations between the community and the police has been extended; if so, (a) why, (b) to what date and (c) at what cost?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much Mr Speaker. Yes.

(a) The Commission has postponed its public hearings until the Constitutional Court has handed down its judgement regarding the application by the Minister of Police for leave to appeal and direct access with respect to the lawfulness of the establishment and operation of the Commission.

(b) 24 April 2014.

(c) The budget has not been extended. Budgetary requests are considered by the

Department of Community Safety.

Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, the question was very clear. What is the implication for the budget seeing that the Premier extended the time of that Commission?

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, if the Minister of Police was not interfering and obfuscating and putting obstacles in our way there would have been no need to extend the time of the Commission. It is because the Minister of Police wants to prevent us from doing our oversight duties, for reasons that only he knows, that the Commission has sought fit to wait until a Constitutional Court gives its judgement. It was therefore essential to extend the timeframe and that is entirely due to the Minister of Police. It is quite unbelievable that President Zuma just recently agreed to extend the date of the Marikana Commission of Enquiry. He agreed to extend the date of the Marikana Commission of Enquiry and they have not been facing obstacles by the Minister of Police. What is very interesting in this connection is that more people have died from necklacings in Khayelitsha at the hand of people taking the law into their own hands and vigilantes, than died at Marikana.

Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, the Premier did not answer the question around the cost involved in this, and the question is why are they not fulfilling their proclamation? It is either they do the work that they must do or you recall the proclamation [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Uys, can you ask a question.

Mr P UYS: I did ...

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, I can easily answer the question that he tried to ask. I know what he was trying to ask. First of all the Commission is very keen to fulfil the terms of the proclamation, but they are being blocked by the National Minister of Police.

An HON MEMBER: They are not blocked!

The PREMIER: They are blocked and they have decided that they want to know what the Constitutional Court has to say about the constitutionality of the work before they continue, because they obviously do not want their investigation to be tainted by politics. While the National Minister is trying to block them they are saying, and this is a position that I completely understand, let the Constitutional Court give a judgement on this matter and then the field will be clear to move from that point one way or the other. I have extended the terms of the time span of the Commission for obvious reasons, as I've explained now twice, but I have not yet extended the budget because we do not know for how long exactly that extension is going to be required given the court case, and we do not know what the budgetary implications are. When we consider the budgetary implications the decision will be made by the Department of Community Safety. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, seeing that the Premier does not want to answer the question, I must be direct. Do they still cost this Government R 51 000 per day as Commission?

The PREMIER: We have not extended the budget at this stage.

Mr P UYS: You do not want to answer.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: The truth is if he wants to talk about budgets he can ask the Department of Community Safety, because they are managing the budget, but there would be no need for any extensions of time and no need at some future point to consider any extensions of the budget if the ANC lets us get on with our work and exercise oversight as foreseen by the Constitution.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

*Advertisement in Daily Voice : 25 April 2013*

**2. Ms L Brown asked the Premier:**

What was the (a) reason for the advertisement in the *Daily Voice* on 25 April 2013 and (b) cost of the advert?

The PREMIER: In the hon member's absence; this is in answer to the hon member Ms Brown's question.

- (a) In April the *Daily Voice* published a series of articles that falsely and repeatedly stated that 66% of top posts in the Western Cape Government are held by whites. This followed a written reply to a Parliamentary question from COPE MPL, Mr Mbulelo Ncedana.

An HON MEMBER: Honourable.



The PREMIER: Hon member Mr Mbulelo Ncedana. But the exact opposite is true from what the *Voice* was reporting, Mr Speaker. 65% of top officials in the Western Cape Government Senior Management are black, which according to employment equity legislation includes Black, Coloured and Indian people. The article failed to take into account the complete figures for the full senior management service in the Provincial Government, leaving readers with erroneous information and a completely false impression.

Despite contacting the *Daily Voice* on a number of occasions and providing them with the facts, the newspaper failed to publish the correct figures and instead repeatedly published the wrong ones. This was why the Department of the Premier had no option but to put an advertisement in the newspaper in order to set the record straight. Our Government's policy is to appoint the best person for the job and this has enabled us to reach our equity targets with excellent staff. Citizens have a fundamental right to be properly informed and we believe that this advert was the only way in which this could be given effect to at that stage, after a number of articles had been published containing serious inaccuracies and distortions. We also submitted a complaint to the Press Ombudsman regarding the *Daily Voice*'s misleading and inaccurate coverage. The newspaper has subsequently agreed to publish a retraction and an apology.

(b) R 28 589.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Ms Tingwe is it a follow up?

UNKSZ TINGWE: Enkosi...

The SPEAKER: It is a technical problem.

UNKSZ TINGWE: Kutheni i tv zingadlali namhlanje?

The SPEAKER: There is a technical problem. They are fixing it. That is why it is ...singadlali namhlanje. Okay. [Interjections.] Can we then proceed to the next question? That is to question number 3 to Minister Grant.

*Teachers not performing duties : steps to be taken*

**3. Mr M Skwatsha asked the Minister of Education:**

Whether any steps will be taken against teachers in the Western Cape who are not performing their duties; if not, why not; if so, (a) what steps and (b) when will the steps be taken?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and to the hon member Mr Skwatsha for the question.

The Department and my office have on more than one occasion requested clarity concerning this question. Finally yesterday my Ministry was told that the hon member Mr Skwatsha feels that the question is straight-forward and no further information is required from him to be able for me to answer. In the absence of clarity I will have to give both a general and a specific answer.

Generally educators who are not performing their duties are dealt with in terms of Section 18 of the Employment of Educators Act, 1998. Cases of poor work performance are investigated

by departmental labour relations officials who make an appropriate submission to the Head of Education at the conclusion of the investigation. It is the experience that educators who do not perform their duties may be premised by the dereliction of duty or negligence in the workplace. In this instance the employee is charged with negligence in the workplace or poor work performance for reasons other than incapacity, and if the matter is proven on a balance of probability, an appropriate sanction is imposed and implemented. In the case of repetitive offenders for this particular transgression, dismissal as a sanction may be imposed.

The second criterion is poor work performance as a result of incapacity for ill health or incapacity to perform. These cases are dealt with in terms of the incapacity procedure as per the relevant Schedule 1 of the Employment of Educators Act, Act 76 of 1998. However, in the absence of detail from the hon member Mr Skwatsha, I am therefore presuming that the non-performance of duties refers to the recent protest action. In relation to the recent protest action, yes, steps will be taken.

(a) The application of the no-work-no-pay rule will apply.

(b) Once off deductions will be made in confirmed cases starting from June 2013.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Hon Minister, in relation to the reported claims of teachers not willing to teach because of a principal being cleared by the Department, is there any action that is contemplated?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Speaker yes, action is in the pipeline. Those teachers have received a written warning.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. We now proceed. Hon Chief Whip I don't see Hon Minister Plato in the House. Can you address me please?

Me A ROSSOUW: Mr Speaker, Minister Plato has contacted the hon member Mr Skwatsha and the questions will stand over. They have sent an email and I received that email. Minister Winde is not here either and hon member Ms Bevu requested that both questions that she had to the Ministers stand over. Hon member Ms Beerwinkel requested that the question to hon Minister Winde be answered by hon Minister Van Rensburg.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Van Rensburg will answer?

Me A ROSSOUW: Hon Minister van Rensburg will answer the question of hon Ms Beerwinkel to hon Minister Winde.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Hon Chief Whip. The question to Minister Dan Plato will then stand over. Mr Grant, question number 5, over to you.

Questions 4, 12, 14 and 15 stand over.

*Qhayiya High School : school yard*

**5. Mr Z C Stali asked the Minister of Education:**

What action is being taken by him and his department about the school yard of the Qhayiya High School that has been occupied by informal settlements?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you Mr Speaker and thank you to the hon member

Mr Stali for the question relating to Qhayiya High School.

The land concerned belongs to the Overstrand Municipality. Our District Office is in discussion with the Municipality about the rectification of the situation.

The SPEAKER: Any follow up hon Mr Stali?

Mr Z C STALI: I would like to know whether hon Minister Grant is able to tell us for how long that land has been occupied at that school by those people?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Speaker, no. I am not aware of how long it has been occupied, but I can certainly find out for the hon member Mr Stali and let him know.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Any follow up hon member Mr Stali?

Mr Z C STALI: Yes. Are you also aware hon Minister Grant that the school is being vandalised and there is no proper security that can be practised because the people from the community are actually sitting right in the school?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes, Mr Speaker. I am aware of that and that is why our officials have been in touch with the Municipality to rectify it from their side because we cannot take the action necessary in order to deal with those people who are there illegally.

*City of Cape Town director : investigation into appointment*

**\*6. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and**

**Development Planning:**

Whether he is investigating the appointment of a certain person, whose name has been furnished to the Minister's department for the purpose of his reply and who is in the employ of the City of Cape Town as a director; if not, why not; if so, what (a) are the criteria and (b) is the (i) approach, (ii) procedure and (iii) legislation that he is using in the investigation?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dankie, mnr die Speaker. Dankie agb lid mnr Uys vir die vraag. Daar is tans geen ondersoek ten opsigte van enige aanstellings by die Stad Kaapstad nie aangesien daar geen rede vir so 'n ondersoek is nie. Dankie.

Mnr P UYS: Baie dankie, mnr die Speaker. Kan ek vir die LUR vra of daar tot op hede enige klagtes by hom ingedien is met betrekking tot die aanstelling van hierdie persoon?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: By my persoonlik nie waarvan ek weet nie. As dit direk na die Departement toe is, het dit nog nie by my uitgekom nie, maar nie waarvan ek bewus is nie.

*Qualified maths teachers : challenges identified*

**7. Ms C Labuschagne asked the Minister of Education:**

- (1) Whether there are enough qualified mathematics teachers for primary schools in the Western Cape, if so, what is the reason for the challenges that have been identified in respect of grades 3, 6 and 9; if not,

- 2) whether his department has any plans in place to improve the situation; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Speaker and thank you to the hon member Ms Labuschagne for the question.

- (1) Primary School teachers train as generalists and therefore include mathematics in their training as a matter of course. However, our language and mathematics tests reveal that these skills need further development.
- (2) Teacher training therefore forms a key component of our language and mathematics strategy, especially in the foundation phase. The strategy includes a training programme designed to reach all primary schools needing this support over an eight year period and we are currently in year five of that eight year period. Our Cape Teaching and Leadership Institute also provides in-service training for educators in mathematics. Needu has identified this training as an example of best practice. Our tests have shown an improvement in mathematics results albeit from a low base; thanks to these and other interventions which are in line with our strategy. In the most recent testing in 2012 Grade 3 mathematics results increased by 4.3%, Grade 6 by 3% and Grade 9 by 3.5%.

*Stipulations of Regulation No 1114 : Implications of enforcement*

**8. Ms C Labuschagne asked the Minister of Education:**

- (a) What are the stipulations of Regulation No 1114 to the *National Curriculum*

*Statement Grades R to 12* and (b) what will the implications be if this regulation is enforced?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Speaker and again to the hon member Ms Labuschagne for the question.

- (a) The stipulation of Regulation 1114 refers to the following with reference to the *National Curriculum Statement Grades R to 12* and provides a framework for implementation at schools.
  - (1) The scope of the application applies to all public schools and those independent schools offering the *National Curriculum Statement Grades R to 12*.
  - (2) Entrance requirements.
  - (3) Minimum duration per phase.
  - (4) Programme requirements for Grades R to 12.
  - (5) Promotion requirements for Grades R to 12.
  - (6) School based assessment.
  - (7) Compilation of school based assessment and practical assessment task marks.
  - (8) The conduct of the end of year examinations.
  - (9) Absentees during the end of year examination.
  - (10) Management of school assessment records and school learner profiles.
  - (11) Irregularities during the end of year examinations.
  - (12) Recording and reporting of learner performance.
  - (13) Registration of additional subjects in the FET Phase.
  - (15) Recognition of subjects not listed in the *National Curriculum Statement Grades R*



to 12.

- (16) The status of subjects offered by other assessment bodies.
  - (17) Changing subjects in Grades 10, 11 and 12.
  - (18) Concessions.
  - (19) A National Senior Certificate with endorsement for learners who experience barriers to learning.
  - (20) Certification.
  - (21) Time allocation.
  - (22) Transitional arrangements.
  - (23) Short title and commencement.
- (b) The Department is currently enforcing these regulations in terms of the extract below which I will read shortly. The implication would be that schools would have greater clarity on the implementation of the National Curriculum at school level. The timeframe stipulated would give structure to the rollout and provide adequate opportunities for teacher training. It could also lead to an alignment across provinces and districts as the document gives clear guidance about implementation and regulations. This would result in enhanced quality of teaching and learning and a system that is reliable and fair.

The short title and commencement: The regulations may be cited as the regulations pertaining to the *National Curriculum Statement Grades R to 12* and will commence on the day of the promulgation thereof and becomes effective in 2012 for Grades R to 3, for Grade 10 in 2013, as well as for Grades 4 to 6 and Grade 11, and finally in 2014 for Grades 7 to 9 and Grade 12. Thank you.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Thank you Mr Speaker. I would like to know what would be the implications of the promotions for the further education and training phase for Grades 10 and 12.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Speaker, in terms of that regulation which if my memory serves me correct was promulgated on 28 December 2012? Is that correct?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: It has made it difficult in terms of its late notice for 2013. At the last Council of Education Ministers' meeting we asked the Director General to relook the regulation so that better notice can be given to Provincial Education Departments to deal more effectively with that policy.

*Grootfontein Agricultural College : training*

**\*9. Mr J J Visser asked the Minister of Agriculture:**

- (1) Whether the fact that the Grootfontein Agricultural College is providing training to the Thusong Centre in Oudtshoorn has been brought to his attention; if so, (a) what is the scope of the training or the extent to which it is provided and (b) why does Elsenburg Agricultural College not provide this training; if not,
- (2) Whether he will inquire into the matter and report to the House; if not, why not; if so, when?

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Baie dankie, mnr die Speaker en dankie aan die agb lid mnr Visser vir die vraag.

Die Grootfontein Landbou-kollege bied kursusse aan wat ons nie aanbied nie en dit gaan veral oor ekstensiewe kleinveeproduksie wat skape en Angorabokke insluit.

Die tweede gedeelte van agb lid mnr Visser se vraag oor of ek ondersoek sal instel, ek het ondersoek ingestel en Grootfontein Landbou-kollege het van 23 tot 25 Julie 2012 'n boog-sweis-kursus in Bongoletu, Oudtshoorn aangebied vir 16 kursusgangers, wat hoofsaaklik werklose mense en munisipale werkers was.

Hoekom het ons dit nie aangebied nie? Elsenburg Landbou-kollege het nie daarvan geweet nie en het ook nie so 'n versoek ontvang nie. Grootfontein Landbou-kollege was gekontak deur mnr Franklin Booysen van die Oudtshoorn Thusong-sentrum wat hulle gevra het om die kursus te kom aanbied.

Mnr J J VISSER: Dankie, mnr die Speaker. Agb Minister is dit so dat die beplanning is vir Elsenburg om satellietkampusse dwarsoor die Wes-Kaap te vestig wat dan ook die proefplaas op Oudtshoorn sal insluit?

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Dit is heeltemal korrek. Ons het satellietkampusse by Oudtshoorn, by Outeniqua, by Bredasdorp en ook by Clanwilliam.

Mnr J J VISSER: Agb Minister, sou dit dan wees dat hierdie satellietkampusse hulle dienste aan munisipaliteite in die omgewing sou aanbied en dan nou ook hierdie tipe kursusse vir die

Thusong-sentrum sou kon aanbied?

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Mnr die Speaker, as regering behoort ons nooit in isolasie te werk nie en as ons 'n kursus kan aanbied wat vir munisipale werkers van waarde kan wees dan sal ons dit met graagte doen.

*Infant mortality : Save the Children South Africa*

**10. Ms J A van Zyl asked the Minister of Health:**

How does the Western Cape far with reference to the report recently released by *Save the Children South Africa* that indicates that 21 babies die in South Africa every day soon after birth due to preventable causes and a lack of health care?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you Mr Speaker and thank you to hon member Ms Van Zyl for the question.

According to the report South Africa ranks 77 out of 176 countries on the global index. Of the 21 babies that die countrywide every day soon after birth, the prenatal problem identification programme indicates that in the Western Cape the number is much lower than the average in South Africa. This data reflects good neonatal care and outcome in the Western Cape. The leading cause of neonatal death remains immaturity related. The *Save the Children South Africa* report states that the majority of newborn and maternal deaths in South Africa can be prevented by ensuring equal and fair access to skilled medical assistance. Part of this solution is ensuring access to equipped healthcare workers during childbirth especially in rural areas. This means that newborn and maternal deaths can be prevented through universal healthcare for all, which is the Western Cape policy.

Equal access to health services can only be acquired through the strengthening of the health system and strict financial management and disciplined project oversight such as we have in our Province.

*Anti-Land Invasion Unit : contribution*

**11. Mr M Ncedana asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

How much money did his department contribute to the Anti-Land Invasion Unit during the latest specified period of 12 months for which figures are available?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much Mr Speaker and thank you to hon member Mr Ncedana for the question.

My Department contributed just under R 8.2 million to the City of Cape Town for the law enforcement component towards the provision of services rendered on departmental projects. The Department had entered into an agreement with the City of Cape Town in terms of which the City of Cape Town had recruited and trained 30 persons for a full-time law enforcement support service for one year in respect of departmental projects. The service comprised a law enforcement presence as well as an Anti-Land Invasion Support Service. Some of the projects that benefited from the agreement are Boys Town, Joe Slovo, Mama's, Pelican Park and Our Pride. The service includes the availability of support at short notice in cases where there is a threat of occupation of provincial property. I thank you Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Follow up Hon Mr Ncedana?

UMNU NCEDANA: Ingabe uphathiswa imali engapha kwe 8million ingakha izindlu ezengaphi, ubangaba mhlawumbi besisebenzise lomali ekwakheleni abantu izindlu enzeluba singa.. si avoide intoyo kubana ba inveide umhlaba?

UMNU MADIKIZELA: Mhlawumbi ezipha ko 80.

UMMNU NCEDANI: eliny'isoloty lombuzo wam into yokubana uqinisekisa into yo kubana si avoida intokubana abantu ba inveide umhlaba, mhlawumbi ke xandizama ukucacisa lombuzo ingaba umphathiswa uyavumelana ke nomsenbenzi wale...wale anti Land Invasion ngakumbi kulomsebenzi wenze phaya e Phillipi apho khona kuthwe kwa invidwa khona infact kuthe kwa evictwa khona abantu abayi 125 ngaphandle kokulandelwa kwe miqathango efaneluba ilandelwe phambi kokuba ku evictwe abantu?

An HON MEMBER: Is that a question?

An HON MEMBER: That is a question.

The SPEAKER: That is a question.

UMNU MADIKIZELA: I think mhlekazi if uyive kakhuhle impendulo yam yintoba i anti land invasion note inceda kakhulu ingakumbi kwimeko apho e..abantu bazithathela umhlabangenkani okanye bangenezindlini ngo ngekho mthethweni, and I think iluncedo kakhulu because if unokhumbula ndingenza imizekelo emininzi.. e... if i land invasion unit e... ibikhona isebenza kakuhle xa ujonge indowo ebesinayo eDelft ne bangele into yokuba

kubekhona u iblekisdorp, ngesingenayo iblekisdorp namhlanje, because ndicinga into yokuba uya vumelanala nam indaba nagona sinomcelingeni kweli cala lezindlu, noko asinoyivumela intoba abantu bathathe umthetho ezandleni okanye bophule umthetho ngokungena ezindlini ngoku ngekho mthethweni ezakhelwe abanye abantu and I think i luncedo eku qinisekiseni into yokuba e.izindlu ezokhiweyo zakhelwe abantu ekudala belindile e.. azithathwa nge kani ngongekho mthethweni.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Mr Ncedana, a follow-up?

Mr M NCEDANA: The question is does the Minister agree with the action taken by the Anti-Land Invasion Unit where they evicted 125 people in Philippi without following due law processes?

The PREMIER: The processes were followed.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Speaker, this is a new question, but let me answer it in this way. I have no information about the specific case that the hon member Mr Ncedana is referring to and I think I will be able to answer that question once I get all information about that particular eviction and the processes that were followed when those people were evicted. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: The next question, question number 12, will stand over.

*Labour brokers : Hiring of workers by farmers*

**13. Ms J A van Zyl asked the Minister of Agriculture:**

Whether his department is encouraging farmers to hire workers through labour brokers to avoid dealing with the Food and Allied Workers Union (FAWU) members; if so, why?

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Dankie mnr die Speaker en dankie aan agb me Van Zyl vir die vraag. Die antwoord is nee, my departement moedig nie boere aan om werkers deur arbeidsmakelaars te huur nie.

The SPEAKER: Questions number 14 and 15 stand over. Then question number 16. Minister Meyer. Where are you, Minister?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Speaker, Minister Meyer has left to catch a plane to Durban. He has already left.

An HON MEMBER: Ai-ho. Gee! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: If I can address you? He has given an apology to the Chief Whip. He did it previously.

The SPEAKER: Mr Carlisle, question number 17 [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you Mr Speaker and thank you to hon member Mr Stali ...[Interjection.]

Mr M OZINSKY: On a point of order. Mr Speaker, what is happening to that question now?



The SPEAKER: Because ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I can answer the question.

The SPEAKER: Are you going to answer the question? [Interjections.] Order! Hon Minister, are you going to answer the question? Yes. You can answer it.

*MOD Centres : facilitator application requirements*

**16. Ms J L Hartnick asked the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:**

What are the qualifications required to apply for a position as a facilitator at MOD (Mass, Opportunity and Development) centres?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Most of the facilitators who are prepared for the MOD Centres are people who are graduates from the Chrysalis programme, so in most instances they have the requirement of matric, but it is not necessary.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, the Minister is not answering the question. The question the hon member Ms Hartnick is asking is what qualifications must someone have. Now tell us what are the qualifications? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Speaker, I wonder what matric is. What is matric? Are you asking what criteria? [Interjections.] [Laughing.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: No, what is matric?

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The minimum qualification you need is a matric and I have answered that, hon member Mr Ozinsky. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Take your seat hon ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: What else is your qualification?

An HON MEMBER: That's right.

The SPEAKER: Is it a follow-up?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: What is matric?

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M OZINSKY: This is what happens when the member makes a joke of the House.  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member Mr Ozinsky. Order!

Mr M OZINSKY: And when that hon Minister stands up here and answers questions ...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Ozinsky.

Mr M OZINSKY: ... when he doesn't have the authority of the Minister either.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky, I will ...

Mr M OZINSKY: The question I am asking ...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky. Order. What is the question?

Mr M OZINSKY: Yes, I am coming to the question. I am asking the question.

The SPEAKER: What is your question?

Mr M OZINSKY: You are stopping me from asking the question.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky. I will ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: The question is then whether any people have been admitted to Chrysalis without the minimum qualification? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: That is the ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Take your seat hon member Mr Ozinsky.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: No. Can I just make the point? I mean that is exactly where the hon member Mr Ozinsky is missing the point. [Interjections.] It is not an admission to Chrysalis. Chrysalis is one source and we have said that. We are working with a transversal committee on MOD Centres. All of us work on it. I know exactly what is happening in MOD Centres. We are saying we are developing good sport programmes, and one part of it is Chrysalis. The other parts are from our youth programmes throughout the province. On the extended public works programme the hon Minister Carlisle provides ample assistance - you know the good money that he gives - we talk specifically about training people to be facilitators at MOD Centres [Interjections.] I can tell you. I work on the committee. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order!

Mr M OZINSKY: Hon Minister, you have not answered the question again. The question I want to ask ...

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon! Hon member Mr Ozinsky, take your seat please.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Pose a question to the Minister. You do not have to make a statement, hon member Mr Ozinsky, only ask questions. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ask the question.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, I have asked the question. The hon Minister did not answer it and I am asking it again.

The SPEAKER: What is the question?

Mr M OZINSKY: Has anyone been admitted to any of these centres without the minimum requirement you say they need?

An HON MEMBER: It is a new question.

An HON MEMBER: It is simple.

Mr M OZINSKY: It is not a new question. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon members. Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT I am convinced ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky, order.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It is in fact a new question and I do not think I am going to answer.

An HON MEMBER: No, it's not. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It is a new question.

The SPEAKER: That is your last chance, hon member Mr Skwatsha, the last chance. That is the last chance to anyone. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Let me ask the question. I am asking the last question now.

The SPEAKER: That is the last chance, hon member Mr Ozinsky. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: What action is taken against people who are admitted to these centres without the minimum matric as you said? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Minister Carlisle, Hon Minister. Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I want ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible] ... prepare the answer ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: No. We work on it. [Interjections.] I work on the programme. [Interjections.] But the question ... [Interjections.] The question ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Ozinsky. Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: In fact there is a very strict regime in terms of any ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: You need to answer. You need to answer.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: No. Why must we give answers? Can you not think? I told you we work on ... we write the stuff. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members. Order! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It is not a joke! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon member Mr Ozinsky. You are starting to act disorderly in this House and ...[Interjections] Order - if you continue doing this I will really ...[Interjections.] You will leave this House. Definitely. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Let me see your notes. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I do not want to address that. [Interjections.] That is my ruling. Thank you.

Hon member Mr Ozinsky, I warn you. [Interjections.]

Mr SKWATSHA: Point of order!

The SPEAKER: Order! What is the point of order hon member Mr Skwatsha?

Mr SKWATSHA: A member in the House in terms of the rules has the right to address you.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Take your seat, hon member Mr Skwatsha.

Mr SKWATSHA: Can you uphold that? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Take your seat, hon member Mr Skwatsha. I have made my point that the hon member Mr Ozinsky ... I warn you. We now proceed to the next ..

Mr M SKWATSHA: And the hon Minister Carlisle?

The SPEAKER: What about the hon Minister Carlisle?

Mr M SKWATSHA: What happens to him? He has given running commentary here.  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! The next question. [Interjections.]



Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, I want to address you on a different point.

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr M OZINSKY: I would like to know whether it is practice in this House that when an MEC is not here and he has not assigned another MEC to answer the question, whether any MEC can just stand up and answer the question. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Geyer there is - Order! Order! Order! Order!

An HON MEMBER: That is unheard of!

An HON MEMBER: That is out of the question.

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Geyer .... There is an arrangement between Minister Meyer and Minister Fritz. [Interjections.] Hon members, order! [Interjections.] Take your seat hon member Mr Skwatsha. Hon Mr Geyer. Hon Geyer over to you. Order!

Mr H GEYER: That is correct. There is an arrangement [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky, Order! [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Ozinsky, order. [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Geyer.

Mr H GEYER: Mr Speaker, there is an arrangement that the Minister would stand in for him

for that question.

HON MEMBERS: Oh. Ah yes [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, can I address you on that?

The SPEAKER: On the same matter?

Mr M OZINSKY: On the same matter.

The SPEAKER: No, I have closed this. Hon member Mr Ozinsky. Order! [Interjections] No, no. Hon member Mr Ozinsky.

Mr M OZINSKY: If there was an arrangement [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky, take your seat. Take your seat. Hon member Mr Ozinsky. Take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon Minister Botha, is it a point of order?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Yes, Mr Speaker. I want to know whether it is parliamentary to say “jy lieg”? That honourable member over there and she knows about it.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Prins, can you address me on this please. [Interjections.]

Hon member Ms Prins, address me please. [Interjections.] Order!

Ms E PRINS: I withdraw.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon members, I am closing now on this matter.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: May I address you, Mr Speaker?

The SPEAKER: On the same matter?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Yes, please.

The SPEAKER: No, I am not allowing that. [Interjections.] Hon members, I have made my decision. I am not allowing anyone. I think the hon member Mr Geyer has made it very clear that there is an arrangement ... [Interjections]

HON MEMBERS: No, no. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... between the two Ministers and I am not going to allow the same ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, I want to address you on this.

The SPEAKER: I am not going to allow anyone. [Interjections.] I am not going to allow anyone. Hon member Mr Uys. I am not going to allow you. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: I want to address you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys, take your seat!

Mr P UYS: He was not at the programme meeting.

The SPEAKER: I was not there also.

Mr P UYS: He was not there. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Then you can discuss it. [Interjections.] Order! Order! You can discuss it at your next programme meeting. Order! [Interjections.] Hon members, take your seats. Take your seats.

Mr P UYS: Ask the Chief Whip.

The SPEAKER: Take your seats [Interjections.] Take your seats. [Interjections.] Hon members, I want to make it very clear to you, very clear, that I am not going to allow you to discuss the same matter. Hon member, Mr Ncedana, order. I did not allow you to speak. I did not allow you.

Mr M NCEDANA: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member, take your seat. No, sit down. Hon member, take your seat. [Interjections.] Is it in the same, do you want to address me on the same matter? Masiqale

ngowokuqala umbuzo, hon Ncedani...On the same?

UMNU NCEDANI: ndifuna ubuza umbuzo othi kuwe, Somlomo...e...uba ngabe irulling ibiyenziwe apha kwixesha elidlulileyo nguwe, ethi uba uminister akekho apha umbuzo uye u stende over enzeluba uphendulwe kwi ntlanganiso ezayo, ingaba ke ngoku kukho enye i rule entsha ethi kunelungelo umphathiswa ongekhooyo aphendulelwe ngomnye umphathiswa? okokugqibela ingabe ...[ uphazamiso] ngoba kaloku ingabe sifanele sithini thina bantu bebeyi nxalenye yentlanganiso xa ngabe kukho ilingu ebilise ntlanganisweni elithetha into engakhange ithetwe entlanganisweni lonto itsho into beyi rulling yokho, kodwa elilungu liya missleader this house.

The SPEAKER: Ewe sithi xa uMphathiswa engekho endlini, umbuzo u stenda over but xa umphathiswa ecele omnye uphathiswa ukuthi amphendulele, ithetha ukuthilombuzo kumele into yokuba uphendulwe endlini....Hon member Mr Ncedana. Eye yentokuba benivene njani i programming andiyo nxalenye ye programming, now buyela back kenina ningo chief wheep, no wheep niyoyixoxa kwi programming, into endithetha ngayo mna ndithetha ngento yo kuba ndixelelwe njengob ndehleli kwe sisitulo ukuthi kuvenwe phakathi kwaba phathiswa ababini okuthi uphathiswa lowa uwuphendule lombuzo, nantso information endinayo mna enye into yokubana bekuxoxwe kwavanwa ngantoni kwi programming e .. bendingekho. Take your seat. I am not going to allow any member to talk on this issue. Can we then proceed, hon members?

Mr M SKWATSHA: On a point of order.

The SPEAKER: No. What is the point of order? [Interjections.] What is it?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Is the Speaker allowed not to apply the rules in the House?

The SPEAKER: Take your seat, hon member Mr Skwatsha. Please, please. [Interjections.]

No. Hon Minister [Interjections.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Because the hon member Mr Ozinsky is exactly saying that hon ...  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha.

Mr M SKWATSHA: May I request to address you, Mr Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha.

Mr M SKWATSHA: May I request to address you, Mr Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha, take your seat.

Mr M SKWATSHA: May I request to address you?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha, take your seat. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are not the Speaker. You are not the Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are not the Speaker, you ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha, take your seat. [Interjections.] I am not going to allow you to address me now.

Mr M SKWATSHA: I am asking you a question.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha. We will throw you out.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Are you allowed not to apply the rules? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha [Interjections.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Are you above the rules? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon Minister Carlisle over to you. Hon Minister Carlisle over to you.

An HON MEMBER: Order, Mr Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Carlisle over to you.

An HON MEMBER: Order, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Is it the same matter?

An HON MEMBER: Mr Speaker, I just want to ask ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: No, take your seat hon Minister.

An HON MEMBER: I just want to ask, Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Take your seat. Hon Minister ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Mr Speaker, I just want to ask from you ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Carlisle over to you. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Is it parliamentary to be treated differently? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What is the matter, why are you closing this? Why are you closing that?  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Yes. That is not a point of order.

An HON MEMBER: Is it, I am just asking. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member, that is not a point of order.



An HON MEMBER: I am asking is it parliamentary for you as the Speaker to treat us differently? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member, that is not a point of order. [Interjections.] I do not know whether ... Do you provoke me? Do you want me to throw you out of this House? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Mr Speaker I am asking ...

The SPEAKER: Hon member, take your seat. Hon Chief Whip?

Mr P UYS: You must apologise to the whole House. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, may I address you on something?

An HON MEMBER: No!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I want to address you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order!

An HON MEMBER: No, that is unfair. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I want to address you on something.

The SPEAKER: Is it the same?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: No. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I am not going to allow any ... [Interjections.] Hon members, order! [Interjections.] Order, hon members. Hon Tingwe, order! [Interjections.] Minister, is it the same?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: No. It is not, so all that shouting was in vain. [Interjections.] Mr Speaker, I want to address you on something and that is that it is very obvious to me that there is a concerted effort to undermine your rulings in this House today.

HON MEMBERS: No! No! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: And I want to ask you, I want to ask you, Mr Speaker, to investigate the footage of this meeting so that we act disciplinary against these members ... [Interjections.] It is unacceptable what is going on here today.

An HON MEMBER: You know that these things are not working ... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Order! [Interjections.] Order!

An HON MEMBER: We are not here for ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Minister Carlisle over to you. Question number 17.

*Cata and Codeta Taxi Associations : peace rally contribution*

**17. Mr Z C Stali asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

Whether his department has contributed any money to the Peace Rally which was held between Nyanga and Philippi by the Cata and Codeta Taxi Associations; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: No, I will make up my mind. [Interjections.] I will make ... I will make up my mind on that one. [Interjections.] I will make up my mind. [Interjections.] Hon Minister Carlisle, over to you.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: After that distinguished period, Sir, let me answer the hon member Mr Stali by saying that I am not aware of a peace rally that was held between Nyanga and Philippi. I am aware of a peace rally that was held at the Nyanga rank by Cata and Codeta, the 15 plus 15, which I attended and which was a moving and important event, but we did not contribute to that.

The SPEAKER: Any follow-up question?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Is the hon Minister sure that he did not contribute at all?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I did not contribute other than to make a speech and have a dance with Mr Mandamata. We did not pay. What we did do, what we had discussed but had not finalised, is the possibility of a plaque at the rank to just remember that particular day, which my Department would then pay for, but we have not finally agreed what shape that would be, so there is no cost at this stage.

*Ekwezi Hostel Langa : Transnet negotiations*

**18. Mr A M Figlan asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

Whether his department has entered into negotiations with Transnet regarding the Ekwezi Hostel in Langa; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you, Mr Speaker and to the hon member Mr Figlan. Yes, my department has after negotiation with the relevant parties, that is Transnet, the resident and City of Cape Town, appointed a service provider to prepare a project plan for the redevelopment. It has been agreed that the project would be driven by the City. The City is currently negotiating with Transnet and the Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa or PRASA to secure the land on which the hostel is situated as well as the decanting of the beneficiaries who cannot be accommodated on site. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Any follow-up question, Hon Mr Figlan?

UMNU: A M FIGLAN: Enkosi kakhulu mphathiswa: Bendizo cela uqonda ke mphathiswa kwaba bantu sebehlala phaya ingaba bakhona kuluhlu lo lindelo lwezindlu na abesebahlakwila intersight?

UMPHATHISWA MADIKIZELA: ee... le plan Mhlekezi emm esidibengayo kunye nesixeko sase kapa izojongana nalonto, into ba xa si renovate landawo e... basuswa njani and babekwaphi okwethutyana...  
and so the plan entails all that.

*Black City : houses vandalised*

**19. Mr A M Figlan asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

Whether it has been brought to the attention of his department that houses are being vandalised in Black City; if not, why not; if so, what is being done about this problem?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you again to the hon member Mr Figlan and to you Mr Speaker. The current status is that the funds for the repair of the vandalised units were transferred to the Accounts Administrator. This will enable the service provider to repair the vandalised units in the project before August 2013. For the houses on the vacant sites for 23 beneficiaries, the supplier prepared a construction schedule and aims to have the houses completed by October 2013. The vacant sites will thus be built on after the rectification of the vandalised units. The City of Cape Town Electricity Department and the community are aware of the construction commencement date. It should be noted that this will be the fourth attempt by the service provider to commence with the construction of the units on the vacant site as all previous attempts have been thwarted by community unrest and

vandalism of the construction site.

uMNU A M FIGLAN: Kakhulu Mphathiswa, ingaba ababantu bezindlu zi vandaliziweyo bayazazi uba zizindlu zabona?

UMPHATHISWA MADIKIZELA: [Uphazamiso]....that is why sesi ba identifayile noba bangaphi na e...njengoba ndichaza intoba ezibeneficiaries ziyi 23.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Questions 20 and 21 will stand over.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Mnr die Speaker, ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die SPEAKER: Orde.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Die agb lid me Beerwinkel het gevra dat ons wel die vrae antwoord en ek neem waar in die plek van Minister Winde, so ek sal antwoord.

The SPEAKER: Which question is it?

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Vraag 20.

*Wesgro : staff complement*

**20. Ms C F Beerwinkel asked the Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism:**

- (a) What was the staff complement at Wesgro as at the latest specified date for which information is available and (b) how many departments does the entity consist of?

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Mnr die Speaker, by Wesgro is daar 70 goedgekeurde poste. 62 van die poste is in hierdie stadium gevul en dit bestaan uit elf departemente of programme.

*Tour guides : operating illegally*

**21. Ms C F Beerwinkel asked the Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism:**

- (1) (a) What method is used to control the (i) registration and (ii) number of tour guides in the Western Cape and (b) why are at least 187 tour guides operating illegally in the province;
- (2) Whether his department has enough staff members to monitor the tourism industry in the Western Cape; if so, what are the relevant details; if not, why not?
- (3) Whether any steps are being taken to address this situation; if so, what are the relevant details?

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Mnr die Speaker, toergidse word geregistreer in ooreenstemming met die Tweede Nasionale Wysigingswet op Toerisme, Wet nommer 70 van 2000, wat bepaal dat voornemende toergidse 'n reeks dokumente moet indien wat aansoekvorms en 'n kopie van 'n gedragskode insluit. Ek som net op want dis 'n bietjie lank. Ons sal die hele antwoord vir die agb lid me Beerwinkel laat kry.

Watter metodes is daar om toergidse te beheer? Enige persoon wat aan sekere vereistes

voldoen, kan as 'n toergids registreer. Daar is tans 3,192 geregistreerde toergidse in die Wes-Kaap.

Waarom is daar ten minste 170 toergidse wat onwettig sake doen? Die 187 persone wat as onwettige gidse geïdentifiseer is, is geïdentifiseer deur middel van die Departement se Onwettige Gidse Inspeksieprogram. Hulle oortreding kan toegeskryf word aan die volgende redes: minagting van die Wet; taxi pendeldrywers wat ook as gidse optree en nie net toeriste vervoer nie; gastehuse en hotelle wat hulle personeel gebruik om toeriste na toeriste-aantreklikhede te neem en dan gidse wat in SADTU se dae opgelei is en nie oorgeskakel is nie en dus nie kan registreer nie.

Is daar genoeg personeellede in sy Departement om die toerismebedryf in die Wes-Kaap Regering te monitor? Die Departement gebruik tans buite- instansies om die inspeksie van toergidse te doen. Die diensverskaffer is deur die Departement se aanskaffingsproses aangestel. Die diensverskaffer sluit ook 'n kontrak met die Departement om 'n duisend toergidse te ondersoek. Soms sal personeellede van die Departement gesamentlike inspeksies met personeel van die Verkeersdienste van die stad uitvoer. Die Provinsiale Registrateur hou ook 'n Register van Toergidse in die provinsie aan en publiseer en versprei inligting oor geregistreerde toergidse en verenigings van toergidse en ander relevante inligting. Hulle hanteer ook klagtes wat teen toergidse aangemeld word en hulle oefen ook dissiplinêre magte uit.

An HON MEMBER: Has he answered both?

The SPEAKER: Follow-up hon member Ms Beerwinkel?



Ms C F BEERWINKEL: No, it would be unfair to ask the hon Minister. I will follow up in a written form to the hon Minister Winde.

*Cederberg Municipality : investigation of allegations*

**\*22. Mr H P Geyer asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

Whether the mayor of the Cederberg Municipality has been requested to investigate an allegation against a senior official in accordance with the Local government: Municipal Systems Act, 2000 (Act No 32 of 2000), and the Local Government: Disciplinary Regulations for Senior Managers, 2000; if not, what steps have been taken in this regard; if so, what was the outcome of the investigation?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Speaker, dankie en dankie aan agb lid mnr Geyer vir die vraag.

Volgens die Munisipaliteit Cederberg is daar geen versoek vir 'n ondersoek teen 'n senior beampte ingevolge die Wet op Plaaslike Regering: Munisipale Stelsels, 2000, (Wet No 32 van 2000), en die Plaaslike Regering: Dissiplinêre Regulasies vir Senior Bestuurders, 2000 nie. Dankie.

The SPEAKER: No follow-up?

Mr H P GEYER: No, I do not want to waste the time of the House because this mayor has

just been expelled.

*Cederberg Municipality : mobile clinics on farms*

**\*23. Ms A J du Toit Marais asked the Minister of Health:**

What planning is being done in respect of mobile clinics on farms in the Cederberg municipality?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and thank you to the hon Ms Du Toit Marais for the question.

Within the Cederberg Municipality there are 23 routes in total which includes Graafwater, 7 routes into farms, and in Clanwilliam 16 routes. Citrusdal has 26 routes, Wuperthal has 8 routes. The other routes are covered and visited on a six weekly basis to enhance the service of the mobiles and make it more accessible. Three health posts were established. There are four mobile vehicles in the sub-district. There are three farm health posts, Seekoeivlei which is fully operational, as well as Zandberg. Middeltuyn is currently busy with bigger infrastructure renovations and remains work in progress. Whilst the infrastructure work is being done at the health posts the clients still receive a service from the mobile clinic.

*Citrusdal Clinic*

**\*24. Ms A J du Toit asked the Minister of Health:**

What are the relevant circumstances with regard to the Citrusdal clinic?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: There are sessional doctors at the Citrusdal Clinic ... [Interjections.]

Mr H P GEYER: Point of order. Point of Order. Can you please just protect the speaker against the running commentary going on there please, Mr Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon members order! I note it hon member Mr Geyer. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: There are sessional doctors at the Citrusdal Clinic, Dr Burger and Dr Jacobs, to provide a service on a daily basis. There are currently no vacant doctor posts at that facility. It is also very challenging to recruit a Xhosa speaking doctor to the Citrusdal area as applications are not received when posts are advertised. Mr Vusi Maseko, the previous operational manager, accepted a transfer to one of the Cape Town Metropole health facilities.

*BAWSI and Women on Farms*

**25. Mr M C Walters asked the Minister of Agriculture:**

- (1) Whether any monetary and / or other forms of contribution have been made by his department to (a) BAWSI and (b) Women on Farms during the latest specified period of 12 months for which information is available; if so, (i) what are the relevant details, and (ii) what was the motivation for making such contributions, in each case;
- (2) Whether his department requires these organisations to submit annual reports or any other form of reporting on a regular basis; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Dankie mnr die Speaker, en dankie aan agb lid mnr

Walters vir die vraag of my Departement geld aan BAWSI gegee het die afgelope jaar, en die antwoord is nee.

Die tweede gedeelte is of ons finansiële of jaarverslae vereis. Ons befonds nie 'n persoon nie, ons befonds 'n projek en as ons 'n projek befonds, vereis ons geouditeerde finansiële state.

The SPEAKER: Any follow-up? Hon member Mr Walters?

Mnr M C WALTERS: Agb Minister baie dankie vir die antwoord. Waarom het Minister Tina Joemat-Petterson dan ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

An HON MEMBER: You must ask the Minister. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mnr M C WALTERS: Jammer. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mnr M C WALTERS: Baie dankie Minister. Waarom het Minister Tina Joemat-Petterson dan in die pers gesê dat die DA ook geld aan BAWSI gegee het? [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: She did not say that.

The SPEAKER: Order! Let the Minister reply first.

Mr M SKWATSHA: It is a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Is it a point of order, okay.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Hon Minister, Tina Joemat is not here in the House. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: No, that is not a point of order.

Mr M SKWATSHA: She is not here to defend herself.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha, that is not a point of order. Please take your seat.  
[Interjections.]

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Baie dankie, mnr die Speaker. In 'n antwoord in die Parlement het Minister Tina Joemat-Petterson gesê dat sy R 4.1 miljoen vir Nosy Pieterse die middel Oktober verlede jaar gegee het. [Tussenwerpsels.] Waarom sy daarna in die pers gesê het dat die DA ook vir hom geld gegee het, weet ek nie. Dit lyk so asof sy skuldig voel en 'n maatjie soek wat by haar agter die deur wil staan. [Tussenwerpsels.] Dit is nie waar nie. Ons het nie vir hom geld gegee nie. Die laaste geld wat Nosy Pieterse van die Departement van Landbou gekry het, was in Maart 2009. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Is it a follow-up?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr K E MAGAXA: : I just want to ask the hon Minister how he reconciles his presidency, the presidency of Agri Western Cape, and his work as a Provincial MEC?

An HON MEMBER: What has that got to do with the question? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Dis 'n totale nuwe vraag, mnr die Speaker.

The SPEAKER: It is a new question.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: This is the Western Cape Parliament.

The SPEAKER: Hon members. Order! That is the end of question time. [Interjections.] Hon members Order! Outstanding replies will be printed in Hansard.

## **STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS**

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Speaker, the DA policy document called upon an open opportunity ...  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Ms Prins, order!

Ms M TINGWE: ... society for all as part of its key programme to enhance transparency, separation of powers and general tolerance of differences, things that we do not see in this House.

The DA clearly forgot that this is a multi-party legislature. It is not a DA institution. During the past oversight visit we noted with concern with other parties that we were excluded from and sidelined from thanking the presenters and that it was only a DA family show. Was this only cheap electioneering?

With issues to discuss the Rules Committee have not met since September 2012. That was the last meeting of the Rules Committee by this so-called transparent DA. Less must be said about the Petitions Committee, which did not sit in nine months and did so for the first time only this year on 17 May. So this is the fit for purpose DA that closes lines of engagement!

At other vital meetings members of the public were prevented from speaking. While the DA claims to be transparent, why is it so afraid to engage with the public? Is it part of this open society to shut up people?

Note, Mr Speaker, in this youth month the very same afraid DA of public engagement resolved not to host the youth parliament because youth groups may voice their frustrations of the government failures under the DA. Why does the DA run away from this vibrant youth voice? The DA hides behind the excuse that it does not want to politicise issues, as if the DA

is not a political party!

We demand that the DA stop running this province through the courts of law, but with open communication and engagement in the legislature that used to be very vibrant when the ANC was in power. People of the Western Cape miss that vibrant voice!

Ms J L HARTNICK: Mr Speaker, Tuesday, 4 June 2013 commemorated International Day of Innocent Children Victims of Aggression. The DA commemorates this significant day by bringing forth the plight of disabled children, which is often a silent one. Mr Speaker, children's rights should be safeguarded at all costs without any exceptions. One of these rights is the right to be protected. I think it is appropriate to commemorate International Day of Innocent Children Victims of Aggression by reminding each one present here today of their moral duty to ensure this right is not infringed upon.

A week before International Day of Innocent Children Victims of Aggression, 28 May 2013, we were confronted with a media report in which a teacher at St Joseph's School in Montana hit a mentally disabled seven year old boy with a rubber pipe. The school is dedicated to catering to children with special needs. I can understand the job comes with great challenges, but I am also sure the teacher knew this when committing to the job. Much like our health professionals such as nurses and doctors, teachers especially educators with expertise in educating children with special needs are an essential necessity. They play an invaluable role in nurturing the development of children.

Ek wil Minister Gerhard Van Rensburg bedank vir die drie Percheron perde wat hy aan die Organisasie "Sixty-One Three" geskenk het en wat as terapeutiese hulpmiddel vir



mishandelde kinders gebruik sal word en 'n groter impak op hul lewens sal maak.

The DA encourages these essential necessities and the structures they are accountable to, to re-evaluate their contributions and attitudes in their professions. They are valued and have and influential impact on the lives of children which should not be taken lightly.

Ms T N BEVU: Mr Speaker, it is good that for whatever reasons the issue of sanitation is back in our headlines. Sanitation is something most of us take for granted. If we had our priorities right no Government will think of investing in anything before it invests in the health of the people. Sanitation is at the centre of the health of the people.

We travel every day through the N2 looking at people doing what is called “open defecation”. We look at it with disgust. We say they are behaving like animals. We never think about what choices they have. We are looking at them from the perspective of our “flushed and plumbed” world.

Diarrhoea is the second largest killer of children worldwide. It kills more children than HIV, TB and measles combined. It is a weapon of mass destruction. 98% cases of diarrhoea come from poor people who stay in informal houses.

At the last sitting we cautioned the Mayor of Cape Town against looking down at people with her dangerous statement of saying “people prefer to use the bucket system.” We showed how she misrepresented people’s rejection of the portable toilets which they say are just a glorified version of the bucket system. We suggested that the city build some kind of enclosure for these toilets outside their homes. The toilet’s stink is intolerable after two days.

Today when we entered this building we were greeted by stink. The Mayor and the Premier cannot go anywhere without shit being thrown at them. Again they play down the significance of these incidents by branding them only criminal actions. They do not see the silent approval of many who are tired of being ignored.

The chances are this “shit revolution” will spread to other provinces also, especially ...  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Your time has expired. [Interjections.]

Ms T N BEVU: Especially the Free State and Eastern Cape where there is still the bucket system in use. [Time expired.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: At least six people died in the cold perennial Cape winter floods and 30 000 are affected!

Every year we hear DA promises and nothing tangible is done to improve the lot of poor people trapped in this recurring predicament. The heartless DA in this terrible weather evicts people, break down shelters and puts mothers with babies out on the street and in the open as we have seen in Marikana.

This is part of the DA’s war on the poor. The poor are punished by the DA as we hear services are deliberately not rendered in certain areas. The DA covers up its failures to deliver services behind all sorts of lame excuses.

The DA does not give shelter to the homeless and the poor! Yes, the DA cannot reach its housing targets and only want to continue with slum conditions and mostly offer temporary measures.

Yesterday, the arrogant Cape Town Mayor De Lille admitted that more than 120 000 residents do not have access to sanitation. City figures reveal that 40% of households in informal settlements are not serviced at all with sanitation! Thousands do not have electricity, water or refuse collection as per Stats South Africa figures! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon members!

Mr K MAGAXA: We understand the frustration of people with poor service delivery. It is not right to treat people bad and allow them to live under worse conditions than the public entities in leafy areas. The DA says: “Take the hateful and stinky porta potties or you get nothing!” Shame on you DA! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is a shame, yes.

Mr M NCEDANA: The hon member Von Brandis ... I parliamentary intokubana athi abantu abamyama kutheni bangahlali e eastern cape?

The SPEAKER: [Inaudible.] Do you follow what the Hon member Ncedana said?

An HON MEMBER: Is it Parliamentary for him to say why don't black people stay in the

Eastern Cape?

An HON MEMBER: He did not say that [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Speaker, I did not say that, they are mistaken. I said 12% came here to the Western Cape. Why does 12% of the Eastern Cape come here if it is such a bad place? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! If that is what you said hon member Mr Von Brandis there is nothing wrong in saying that such a large percentage are coming from other provinces. [Interjections.] There is nothing wrong. [Interjections.]

Mr M C WALTERS: Mr Speaker, ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha. You will go out of this House. [Interjections.]

Mr M C WALTERS: Mr Speaker, once again reason triumphs over the unwarranted and suspect decisions taken by the ANC while in power in the Western Cape before the voters entrusted the DA with the restoration of good governance in the province. The controversial application by Clairison CC to develop 173 retirement units on the Farm Gansevallei, north-east of Plettenberg Bay, was hastily approved by the then ANC Minister Pierre Uys, two days, two days before the 2009 general election which ousted the ANC.

Mr Uys took this decision in spite of the considered advice of the officials of the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning that the application be refused as the proposed development was not in line with the administration's policy and that large new residential developments north of Plettenberg Bay should not be allowed.

Further authorisation in terms of environmental legislation was withheld by the Department. An appeal by the developer to the newly appointed DA Minister Anton Bredell against the Department's decision was turned down in November 2009. The developer then challenged Minister Bredell's decision in the Western Cape High Court where the Minister's decision was overturned. Minister Bredell, ever the crusader against inappropriate development, took the matter to the Appeal Court in Bloemfontein which last week ruled in Minister Bredell's favour with costs to the developer.

The Appeal Judge said a Government functionary is perfectly entitled to refuse application because it conflicts with predetermined policy. This ruling has been welcomed as vindicating the position taken by Minister Bredell and his Department and questioning the motives for the decision by the then ANC Minister, Pierre Uys, on the eve of his removal from power by the voters of the Western Cape.

We all remember the hon Uys's similar involvement in a very controversial decision to transfer provincial land to National Government on the eve of the election defeat of the ANC.

I thank you. [Interjections.]

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Mr Speaker, the Human Science Research Council and Independent Research Agency recently concluded that the Annual National Assessment Tests, the ANAs,

while a worthy effort to address alarming incompetency in math and literacy skills, fell short of its potential as it was set out in the Action Plan of 2014.

The Policy brief states that the plan of combining large-scale assessment with formative assessment would only succeed when all stakeholders in education especially teachers accept this proposition and continuously use data analysis to inform teaching and learning improvement strategies.

Mr Speaker, the problem is that the Action Plan 2014 does not indicate how schools and other education stakeholders could develop the mechanisms to use the ANAs data to improve teaching and learning. This is not an indictment of the ANAs, but rather confirmation that the Western Cape LitNum Tests have already addressed these very recommendations. The Western Cape's LitNum is done in much the way that the Human Science Research Council has recommended as an assessment that has mechanisms to use the data to modify teaching and learning.

I stated in an earlier debate that the Western Cape's model can serve as an example to other provinces. Perhaps it could now serve as a model for national testing too. I thank you.

Ms V HANI: The DA does not care about poor people. [Interjections.]

'n AGB LID: Jy praat nonsens.

Ms V HANI: Yes. It does not at all. It is like that. The youth are scandalously neglected by this DA run Western Cape Provincial Government, especially the most vulnerable that have

nowhere to go!

As we celebrate youth month throughout South Africa the youth in this province are desperate and despondent. [Interjections.] It is our youth that bite the bullet in the intensifying drug and gang war devastating our people! [Interjections.]

We have seen horrific abuse, torture, rape and murder of too many young girls. I think of Anene Booysen and Annemarie Beukes here. This legislature watered down its regular youth parliament and the Department of the Premier ignore the plight of the youth. [Interjections.] Why does the DA avoid the youth so much and only use them as voting fodder? [Interjections.]

We commemorate the sacrifices by our youth and the Soweto and Langa uprisings. In two months of 1976 in the Cape alone 92 students died for our freedom.

This year the theme is Working Together for Youth Development and a drug free South Africa. Unfortunately the Western Cape has the most worrying rate of youth drug abuse, but this legislature does not support that drive. This province is also not serious about opportunities for youth as it only set its target on 2,500 youth jobs. This Premier also ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: I don't believe that. Do you believe that?

Ms V HANI: Very much so. This Premier also refuses to engage with all youth on issues affecting them. Shame on you DA!

Mr A M FIGLAN: Mandibulele somlomo. Every year billions of Rands are spent by authorities in South Africa, not just in the Western Cape, on legal fees for the eviction of illegal, informal housing dwellers. In the process valuable time and money is being wasted by the illegal occupators to legitimise their claims, and for the land owners or relevant Government Department to state their case.

Recently in Joe Slovo Phase 3 Project 96 families agreed to voluntarily relocate to an allocated area nearby. However, the five families who refused to move in time effectively deprived 2051 families of decent homes and service delivery. They forced them to spend yet another cold, wet winter in informal circumstances which make them vulnerable and susceptible to illness and disease and deprive the community of service delivery.

Mr Speaker, the illegal occupation has also deprived hundreds of families of a well-earned livelihood and stopped the transfer of the much needed skills development necessary for the sustainable economic development of the community.

Since June 2009 the Department of Human Settlements has been in constant consultation with the community to ensure that the R480 million formal site development would be to the advantage of everyone living there. Mayor Patricia De Lille has enforced a positive stand and said that she will not tolerate resistance to development, neither will she be deterred by a minority of unruly elements when engaging with any community in the City.

The need for housing is pressing and those who stand in the way of development must be taken to task. [Time expired]



## MOTIONS WITH NOTICE:

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We now come to the motions. Are there any motions where notice is given? I see the hon member Ms Hani.

### SHORTAGE OF PUBLIC SCHOOLS

(Notice of motion)

Ms V HANI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the shortage of public schools in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of motion as given by member]*

Ms V HANI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the shortage of public schools in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of motion as printed on the Order Paper]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.

### INCREASING RACIAL DIVISIONS

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the increasing racial divisions in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of motion as given by member]*

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the increase in divisions between races in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of motion as printed on the Order Paper]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.

#### DISCUSSION ON GANG WAR

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the escalating [Inaudible.] in 10/30 gang war on the Cape Flats.

*[Notice of motion as given by member]*

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the escalation in the low-intensity gan war in the Cape Flats.

*[Notice of motion as printed on the Order Paper]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.

#### RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN DA AND

#### BIG BUSINESS

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That this House discusses the relationship between the DA and big business in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of motion as given by member]*

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the relationship between the Democratic Alliance and big business in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of motion as printed on the Order Paper]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.

### INCREASE IN HOUSING AND SERVICE DELIVERY PROTESTS

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discuss the increase in housing and service delivery protest across the Western Cape as people are left homeless with substandard houses and are denied access to basic services.

*[Notice of motion as given by member]*

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the increase in housing and service delivery protests across the Western Cape as people are left homeless, are living in substandard houses and are denied access to basic services.

*[Notice of motion as printed on the Order Paper]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.

### SAFETY AT SCHOOLS

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the safety at schools in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of motion as given by member]*

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the safety at schools in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of motion as printed on the Order Paper]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken.

## **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE:**

### **TRAFFIC INSPECTOR KILLED IN THE LINE OF DUTY**

(Motion of condolence)

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its deepest sympathy to the family of traffic inspector, Phumzile Banisi who died tragically while performing his duties on the N1 Highway near Worcester on Tuesday evening. Inspector Banisi was rendering assistance and directing traffic when he was run over by a vehicle. Inspector Banisi was 42 years old and the father of five children.

*[Motion as moved by member]*

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) expresses its deepest sympathy to the family of traffic inspector Phumzile Banisi, who died tragically while performing his duties on the N1 highway near Worcester on Tuesday evening, 4 June 2013; and
- (2) notes that –
  - (a) Inspector Banisi was rendering assistance and directing traffic when he was run over by a vehicle; and
  - (b) He was 42 years old and the father of five children.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes]*

Agreed to.

## VICTIMS OF DISASTER

(Motion of condolence)

Mr K MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House express its deep-felt sympathy with those who have lost homes in the storms that have hit the City of Cape Town over the past days and expresses condolences to the families and friends of those who have lost their lives.

*[Motion as moved by member]*

Mr K MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) expresses its heartfelt sympathy with those who lost their homes in the storm that hit the City of Cape Town over the past weekend; and
- (2) its condolences with the families and friends of those who have lost their lives.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes]*

Agreed to.

#### KIRSTENBOSCH BOTANICAL GARDENS CENTENNIAL

Mr M C WALTERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Kirstenbosch Botanical Gardens which celebrates its 100<sup>th</sup> birthday this year for making the City of Cape Town, the Western Cape and South Africa and all its citizens proud by taking its 33<sup>rd</sup> gold award at this year's Royal Horticultural Society's Chelsea Flower Show in London.

*[Motion as moved by member]*

Mr M C WALTERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Kirstenbosch Botanical Gardens, which celebrates its 100<sup>th</sup> birthday this year, on making the City of Cape Town, the Western Cape and South Africa and all its citizens proud by taking its 33<sup>rd</sup> gold award at this year's Royal Horticultural Society's Chelsea Flower Show in London.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes]*

Agreed to.

## LATE LUTANDO NAMAZI

(Motion of condolence)

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family and friends of Luthando Namzi, aged 31, who died in a car accident. He was a talented parliamentary official in the National Assembly who once worked as a media liaison officer for the hon Zodwa Magwaza when she was MEC for Social Development.

*[Motion as moved by member]*

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) extends its condolences to the family and friends of the 31-year-old Luthando Namzi, who died in a motor accident on 23 May 2013; and
- (2) notes that he was a talented parliamentary official working in the National Assembly and that he once served as the media liaison officer for Ms Zodwa Magwaza when she was Minister of Social Development in the Western Cape.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes]*

Agreed to.

## APPOINTMENT OF CEO TO CAPE TOWN TOURISM

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House extends its congratulations and best wishes to Enver Duminy, who was announced today as the new CEO of Cape Town Tourism after an extensive recruitment process.

*[Motion as moved by member]*

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its congratulations and best wishes to Enver Duminy, who was announced today as the new CEO of Cape Town Tourism after an extensive recruitment process.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes]*

Agreed to.

## COMMEMORATION OF FIFTY YEARS UNITY IN AFRICA

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House celebrates fifty years of unity in Africa as we commemorate the 50<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Organisation of African Unity, the predecessor to the African Union.

*[Motion as moved by member]*

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House celebrates 50 years of unity in Africa as we commemorate the 50<sup>th</sup>



anniversary of the Organisation of African Unity, the predecessor of the African Union.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes]*

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Which unity do you have in mind? [Interjections.]

Agreed to.

#### PROCESSES FOLLOWED BY TRANSPORT DIRECTORATE

Mr Z C STALI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes growing concerns by opposition parties in the City of Cape Town about the manner in which decisions are made by the City Transport directorate where due process is believed not to be followed.

*[Motion as moved by member]*

Mr Z C STALI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) notes growing concerns by opposition parties in the City of Cape Town about the manner in which decisions are taken by the transport directorate of the City; and
- (2) that there is a belief that due process is not being followed.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes]*

Agreed to.

#### NATIONAL DETECTIVE CONVENTION AWARD

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the three Western Cape Detectives, Vatiswa Tshanga-Tshanga, Thando Mchithwa and Paul Moss for getting the award of top investigating team at the National Detectives Convention.

*[Motion as moved by member]*

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the three Western Cape detectives, Vatiswa Tshanga-Tshanga, Thando Mchithwa and Paul Moss, on receiving the award of Top Investigating Team at the National Detectives Convention.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes]*

Agreed to.

#### ANNUAL TRAVEL AND LEISURE SMITTIE AWARD

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Cape Town Tourism for winning this year's Annual Travel & Leisure SMITTY Awards in the category of "Best Overall Use of Social Media."

*[Motion as moved by member]*

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) congratulates Cape Town Tourism on winning the 2013 Annual Travel & Leisure

SMITTY Awards (Social Media in Travel & Tourism Awards) in the category of Best Overall Use of Social Media; and

- (2) notes that these prestigious global awards, announced in New York on 4 June 2013, recognise innovative use of social media in the travel industry.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes]*

Agreed to.

#### TV SCREENS IN THE HOUSE

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the TV screens in this House on which hundreds of thousands of Rands were spent, are not working.

*[Motion as moved by member]*

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the TV screens in the House on which hundreds of thousands of Rands were spent are not working.

*[Motion as printed on the Order Paper]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper.

#### DISCOVERY FOUNDATION AWARD

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates young Groote Schuur Hospital doctor, Neliswa Gogela, for receiving the Discovery Foundation Award worth R 1.2 million to conduct cutting edge clinical research in liver transplants and disease in the United States of America.

*[Motion as moved by member]*

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Dr Neliswa Gogela, a young doctor from the Groote Schuur Hospital, on receiving the Discovery Foundation Award worth R 1.2 million to study, acquire experience and conduct cutting edge clinical research in liver transplants and disease in Boston in the United States of America.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes]*

Agreed to.

#### FORBES TOP AFRICAN YOUTH ENTREPRENEURS

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates Sizwe Nzima of Khayelitsha for earning a spot on Forbes Top African Youth Entrepreneurs under 30's list for his business, Iyeza Express, which delivers chronic medication to clients.

*[Motion as moved by member]*

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates the 21-year-old Sizwe Nzima from Khayelitsha on earning a spot on Forbes Magazine's list of best young African entrepreneurs under 30 for his

business, Iyeza Express, which uses bicycles to deliver chronic medication to clients.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes]*

Agreed to.

#### GYM AND SPORTS EQUIPMENT HANDED OVER

Ms J WITBOOI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the national Minister of Sport and Recreation, Fikile Mbalula, for handing over sports equipment to learners at a secondary school in Khayelitsha and opening an outdoor gymnasium in Rocklands, Mitchells Plain last month.

*[Motion as moved by member]*

Ms J WITBOOI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends Minister Fikile Mbalula, the national Minister of Sport and Recreation, for handing over sports equipment to learners at Iqhaya Secondary School in Khayelitsha and opening an outdoor gym in Rocklands, Mitchells Plain last month.

*[Motion as printed on the Order Paper]*

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper.

#### NEW IT CENTRE ESTABLISHED AT HEIDEVELD MOSQUE

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the Deputy Minister of Communications, Stella Ndabeni, for establishing an IT Centre and handing over computers at the Heideveld Mosque last month.

*[Motion as moved by member]*

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends Ms Stella Ndabeni, the Deputy Minister of Communications, for establishing an IT Centre and handing over computers at the Heideveld Mosque last month.

*[Motion as printed on the Order Paper]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper.

#### TRAVEL & LEISURE: WORLD'S 30 BEST HOTELS

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates three Cape Town Hotels for making Travel and Leisure World's 30 Best Hotels List for 2013. The Hotels are the One & Only, 14<sup>th</sup> on the list; the Twelve Apostles Hotel & Spa, 41<sup>st</sup> on the list and the Cape Grace, 44<sup>th</sup> on the list.

*[Motion as moved by member]*

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House –

- (1) congratulates three Cape Town Hotels on making Travel & Leisure's list of the 50 Best Hotels in the World for 2013; and

- (2) notes with pride that the local hotels that are on this prestigious list are the One & Only Hotel (14<sup>th</sup>), the Twelve Apostles Hotel & Spa (41<sup>st</sup>) and the Cape Grace Hotel (44<sup>th</sup>).

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes]*

Agreed to.

#### BRIBERY AT LICENCE TESTING CENTRES

Mr Z C STALI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses concerns at the increase in the cases of bribery at drivers' licence testing centres in the Western Cape.

*[Motion as moved by member]*

Mr Z C STALI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses concerns at the increase in the cases of bribery at testing centres for driving licences in the Western Cape.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes]*

Agreed to.

#### CAPE TOWN TOP DESTINATION IN AFRICA

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its congratulations to Cape Town for ranking 16<sup>th</sup> out of the 25

top destinations of the world including top destination in Africa by Trip Advisors Travellers Choice 2013.

*[Motion as moved by member]*

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its congratulations to Cape Town on being nominated as the top destination in Africa in the Trip Advisors Travellers' Choice awards for 2013 and on ranking 16<sup>th</sup> in the world on the list of the 25 top destinations in the world of Trip Advisor, the world's largest travel site.

*[Motion as printed on the Order Paper]*

An HON MEMBER: That is fact.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there an objection?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper.

[Interjections.] Order! Order! Anything further? Are we done? Okay, before we come to the next order I need to give a ruling which is standing over from the previous sitting.

### **RULING ON ISSUE THAT STOOD OVER FROM 16.05.2013**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: During the debate on 9 of May the hon Premier raised a point of



order to enquire whether a certain utterance by the hon member Mr Ozinsky was parliamentary or not. The utterance in question was “she wanted to kill us...” referring to Helen Suzman, a former member of National Parliament.

What is at issue here is whether the hon member Mr Ozinsky has abused his parliamentary privilege of freedom of speech. The privilege of freedom of speech allows a member to raise any matter in the House without fear of legal consequences. However, that freedom of speech is not absolute and is curtailed by Parliament’s own rules, resolutions, precedents or rulings from the Chair.

The hon member Mr Ozinsky in addressing the Chair on the matter at the time correctly referred to a previous ruling from the Chair, namely that it was not unparliamentary to reflect on a member of National Parliament. His assertion however that it was ruled parliamentary to “insult” members in another place is his own interpretation and is wrong.

The ruling in question as well as subsequent clarification from the Chair set certain limitations. Let me quote briefly from that ruling:

“Members have freedom of speech in the House and in committees of the House but that freedom of speech is not unlimited. As an institution we determine the parameters within which we operate and in determining those parameters we are guided by our own rules, previous rulings and convention, our constitution, our powers and privileges legislation, our code of conduct and developments and precedents in other Westminster Parliaments including our own National Parliament. Above all, the Chair has a duty to ensure that acceptable standards of parliamentary propriety shall be maintained.”

Therefore although it is parliamentary to reflect on a colleague in the National Parliament, the way that is done, in other words the words used, must be considered. If an utterance of conduct crosses that line of propriety, it will be unacceptable and unparliamentary. Examples would be to make grossly derogatory or insulting statements or indeed to accuse such a colleague of murder or killing or of wanting to kill people.

As current members of National Parliament do not have protection in this House, it then follows that former members of National Parliament also do not have protection in this House. It is therefore not unparliamentary *per se* to reflect within the meaning of the term “reflect” on former members of National Parliament. The same would apply to former members of this House. This is also in line with Australian practice.

Let me briefly quote from the Australian House of Representatives Practice:

“Although former members are not protected by the standing orders the Chair has required a statement relating to a former member be withdrawn and on another occasion has regarded it as most unfair to import into debate certain actions of the member then deceased.”

But let me come to the specific utterance by the hon member Mr Ozinsky. The question I have to consider is whether the utterance can pass within the ordinary meaning of “reflect” and the Afrikaans term for that is “refleksie werp.” Where it goes beyond it can be regarded as an insult or is in bad taste or is likely to create disorder and is therefore an abuse of parliamentary freedom of speech. For a member to accuse someone outside of the House of having killed or wanting to kill people is a very serious accusation; perhaps more so as it

refers to a former member in the National Parliament. The Chair's duty is to maintain order in the House and to preserve its dignity and decorum, and utterances which continually test the boundaries of freedom of speech make it very difficult for the Chair.

Ruling on this is not an exact science, but ultimately the Chair must decide based on rules and precedent but also on the specific merits whether that line of propriety has been crossed or not.

In this specific instance the Chair would fail in its duty if it were to allow this type of accusation to go unchecked. This is not an accusation that specific policies or actions of the then Government had led to people being killed or were meant to be killed or meant to kill people; a statement which could very well be parliamentary, but is in fact a very specific and deliberate accusation that a specific person, namely Helen Suzman, personally wanted to do the killing. Not only is it unsubstantiated and in bad taste, but if allowed it could open the door for recriminations and tit-for-tat involving other former members that would exacerbate matters and undermine the good order and decorum of the House.

I therefore rule that the specific utterance goes beyond the scope of acceptable freedom of speech. It is therefore not parliamentary and needs to be withdrawn.

I ask the hon member Mr Ozinsky to withdraw the remark.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, may I address you on this matter?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, you have had your opportunity.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, then I am not prepared to withdraw this for the reason that you have not consulted with me on this matter and quite clearly this is a borderline issue and ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky, order!

Mr M OZINSKY: And you say it was unsubstantiated [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member Mr Ozinsky.

Mr M OZINSKY: It was substantiated. My colleague said that she supported the sale of arms to South Africa [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Please take your seat! Hon member Mr Ozinsky, please take your seat. I am giving you the opportunity to withdraw and if you are not withdrawing you know what the next step is. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: As I was saying, because the statement was substantiated I am not prepared to withdraw it. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky, order! Order!

An HON MEMBER: Just a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! I am busy with this specific ...[Interjections.]  
Order! Please take your seat. Hon member Mr Ozinsky I am giving you the last opportunity to withdraw the remark, otherwise you know what the next step is.

Ms M TINGWE: Yo! Why do you always threaten?

Mr M OZINSKY: With full knowledge of what you have said and what the consequences are, I believe your ruling is wrong and I will not withdraw the remark.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky then the next step is that I am going to ask you to leave the Chamber. If you still feel aggrieved by the ruling then you know the avenue. Through your Chief Whip please communicate that in writing to the Speaker's office. The subject of this ruling can then be discussed at the Rules Committee. Will you please then leave the Chamber.

(Whereupon hon member Mr Ozinsky left the Chamber.)

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We now proceed to the subject for discussion on the Order paper. The topic for the subject is the growing inequalities in the Western Cape and I see the first speaker Hon member Mr Ncedana.

## **SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION**

*The growing inequalities in the Western Cape.*

Mr M NCEDANA: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Constitution of the Western Cape recognises that this province shall strive to heal the injustices of the past. This province recognises the need for peace, reconciliation and justice. This province endeavours to promote the Western Cape for a better quality and better life for all. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! On a point of order?

Mr M G E WILEY: On a point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker. With all due respect, the hon member Mr Ozinsky left without showing the due respect to the Chair which I think [Interjections] needs to be taken into account in the Rules Committee [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I did not recognise that but I will keep it in my consideration. Thank you. Please continue.

Mr M NCEDANA: The Western Cape strives for better quality of life for all its people through just and fair effective governance. However, Mr Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape inequalities have increased in all categories of life. It does not matter which direction you take, the results are the same. The unfortunate thing of it is that the black people in general are the victims of this. You would look at the economical scales of the Western Cape. The opportunities that are created are created for more affluent communities than to benefit the poor community of the Western Cape. DA Helen Zille closed the ... [Interjections.] The hon Helen Zille, Premier, leader of the Democratic Alliance in this Province, has closed all the skill development centres in poor communities. The Zenzele Training Centre in Khayelitsha, Ulundu Community Centre in Gugulethu and others elsewhere. Those centres were training people in sewing, bricklaying, plumbing, plastering and other skills. All those skills centres

are closed down. The question should be answered by the DA as to why.

However, it is also important to note that since the DA took over in 2009 where you look at the jobs created you would see that where black people had occupied senior positions, HOD's, they have been decreasing in number. For example, if you take the Heads of Department, people of colour, the so-called coloured people, were at 50%. Today they are at 16.6%. White people were at 16% and today are sitting at 25%. If you look from 2009 the white people today are sitting at 62%, coloured people have dropped from that percentage to about 30%. Black people were sitting at 23%, today they are sitting at 7%. There is no doubt that the Democratic Alliance is ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Doing well.

Mr M NCEDANA: Is doing everything well for the white minority in this country. The Democratic Alliance correctly in terms of development is doing very well for the white minority. The coloured and black communities are suffering the most in this province. If you go to Cederberg, where you come from, all the HOD's [Interjections] where in municipalities that are led by the Democratic Alliance it is in the same vein. Either black people are incompetent or they do not have the necessary education, as Premier Helen Zille has alluded, saying coloured people, African people and Indian people do not have the necessary skills that are required. Clearly only white people have the skills in this province. Surely, Mr Deputy Speaker, you would have no doubt that people in this province will never see the light of day where their lives shall be improved for the better as long as the Democratic Alliance is leading this province. [Interjections.]

The only thing that you know about the black and coloured people is to use them as your voting cows. Mr Deputy Speaker, if you go to an old age home in Gugulethu; if you go to the Thembalihle Old Age Home, compare that with the Goodwood Old Age Home. You would see the difference. Those old age homes in Gugulethu and Thembalihle do not have clinics or a nurse visiting them. Those old age homes ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon Minister Botha.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, will the member take a question?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I only want to ask why we ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

Mr M NCEDANA: Ndawu thatha umbuzo xandiqgibileyo). Mr Speaker, if you compare those old age homes with the old age home in Goodwood; the Goodwood old age home has got a doctor visiting it. That old age home has got a nurse visiting it. That old age home has got a social worker visiting it. The conditions as you walk into these other old age homes are so different, if you look at the people that are residing there, the manner in which they are denigrated and looked down upon by the department of the hon Minister Fritz.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Thank you hon member Mr Ncedana.



Mr M NCEDANA: Shame on you Democratic Alliance! [Time expired.]

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGBEPLANNING: Baie dankie mnr die Adjunkspeaker vir die voorreg om deel te neem aan hierdie baie belangrike debat. Ek wil graag aan die Huis ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde! Orde! Orde!

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGBEPLANNING: ... daarop attent maak dat die syfers en die statistieke wat ek vandag gaan deurgee, gemeet moet word aan die feit dat die Wes-Kaap van 1996 tot 2001 met 47, 2% gegroei het. Nieteenstaande die feit dat ons 47,2% gegroei het, het ons nie net bygebly met dienslewering nie, maar het ons ook dienslewering verbeter. Dit is 'n skitterende verhaal en ook iets waarop ons as Demokratiese Alliansie baie trots kan wees.

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, die agb lid mnr Ncedana wat die debat aangevra het, het sy feite deurmekaar. Hy het definitief probeer om dit 'n totale rassedeбат te maak en om nie te kyk na die feite nie. Ons as Provinsiale Regering het as ons mandaat om dienste aan die 6 miljoen mense in hierdie Wes-Kaap te lewer en meer spesifiek die 2 miljoen arm mense, en ons het die feite om dit te staaf. Die DA beheerde Wes-Kaap Regering spandeer 76% van sy 2013 / 14-begroting om armoede aan te spreek, beter en meer as enige ANC-provinsie. Die stad Kaapstad spandeer 56,8% van sy 2013 / 14-begroting, 'n totale bedrag van 11,17 miljard, aan arm mense in die stad. Die ANC-lede in die Stad Kaapstad het teen hierdie begroting gestem en daardeur het hulle hulle werklike kleure gewys. 'n Kleur dat hulle teen armoede is, want

hulle het nie 'n alternatief op die tafel gesit nie. Hulle het dus teen al hierdie voordele vir die armes gestem. As die DA Provinsiale Regering is ons egter terdeë bewus van die ongelykhede in Suid-Afrika, ongelykhede wat aangespreek moet word. Dit is 'n geweldige uitdaging en daarom het 'n mens 'n uiters bekwame span nodig om hierdie uitdaging van armoede die hoof te bied.

What is also very important is the service delivery between Governments? The legislation sets it out clearly. The Intergovernmental Relations Act describes what the relations between the different spheres of Government should be. The Municipal Systems Act promotes developmental local Government, and an integrated approach to such development requires co-operation.

Voorgenoemde wetgewing kan nie tot sy reg kom nie weens die afwesigheid van 'n ANC-Nasionale Regering en weens die afwesigheid van die ANC vandag in die Huis. Hulle hardloop weg as die debatte warm raak en hulle wil dan gaan verkondig dat deur weg te hardloop kan jy 'n probleem oplos. Hulle is lafhartig en hardloop van enige moeilike situasie af weg.

Ons munisipaliteite moet verseker dat daar reaktiewe, verantwoordelike, effektiewe en doeltreffende plaaslike regering daargestel word, sodat ons die armes kan dien. In dié opsig sal die deel van dienste tussen munisipaliteite 'n massiewe bydrae lewer, en dit is die konsep van “shared services”. Ek kan vir hierdie Huis vandag sê dat die Wes-Kaap weer eens baanbrekerwerk sal doen en ons sal die enigste provinsie wees wat “shared services” sal maak werk.

National Government in its own recent survey on performance has put this DA run Western Cape Province at the top of the list with 82%. That is the ANC Government who evaluated all the provinces and put us at the top of the list hon member Mr Ncedana. The six ANC run provinces have failed this test. The criteria by which the provinces were judged were also very interesting, and in terms of ethics - you must listen up Mr Deputy Speaker, the House must listen to this - the DA run Western Cape Government achieved 90% in terms of ethics. In terms of fairness the DA run Western Cape Government achieved 100%, and more importantly, in terms of representivity in the workplace, hon member Mr Ncedana, of race groups and gender equality, the DA run Western Cape was on the top of the list of the provinces with 80%. It is not we that say this, it is the National Government in their research saying this. Access to schools, 97.3% in the DA run Western Cape, the highest in the country.

Die provinsie troon ook uit bo die ander agt provinsies wanneer dit kom by basiese dienste. Basic services gives dignity to people and in respect of basic services let us look at the facts. I am not making a political debate.

Op riool, “sanitation”, die DA-beheerde Wes-Kaap 89.6%. Die ANC-beheerde Oos-Kaap, 21%.

’n AGB LID: Jislaaik!

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Water, die DA-beheerde Wes-Kaap , 99,1%.

’n AGB LID: Hoor, hoor!

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Die ANC-beheerde Oos-Kaap, 77%. Elektrisiteit, die DA-beheerde Wes-Kaap 93,4%. Die ANC-beheerde Oos-Kaap 75%. Op vullisverwydering, die DA-beheerde Wes-Kaap 91%, die ANC-beheerde Oos-Kaap 21%. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Daar is geen twyfel nie dat die Wes-Kaap die nommer 1 Provinsie is op die voorsiening van basiese dienste.

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, verder gaan ons Provinsiale Regering ook 228 miljoen aanwend om nuwe boere te ondersteun. Die bedrag sluit R 10 miljoen in vir die vestiging van 1 036 huistuine en 85 gemeenskapstuine. Werkloosheid en armoede moet aangespreek word. Die werkloosheidsyfer in Suid-Afrika is 25%, in die Wes-Kaap 23%. Ons is dus ook beter op daardie gemiddeld. Hierdie provinsie is egter nie net 'n voorloper in die verskaffing van basiese dienste nie, maar ons is ook die nommer 1 Provinsie met die verskaffing van gratis basiese dienste.

'n AGB LID: Hoor daar!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Free basic services speaks to the dignity of people, Mr Deputy Speaker, and that is why it is so important to provide free basic services to our communities.

But if the hon member Mr Ncedana does not believe me he can go and read this document. It is out of the Presidency. It is out of the President's Office. There is the logo of the President.

They have done an assessment.

Die Presidensie het 'n bestuursprestasië-assesseringsinstrument waarmee hulle prestasie meet.

Die assessering is gebaseer op 31 bestuurstandaarde en 17 bestuursareas. Die DA-beheerde Wes-Kaap het weer eens homself onderskei van die ander provinsies.

On strategic management, the DA controlled Western Cape scored 95%, the ANC controlled Eastern Cape 49%. The ANC controlled Northern Cape 55%.

Die DA is die nommer 1 provinsie in die land.

'n AGB LID: Hoor daar! Mooi!

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Beheer en rekenpligtigheid, “control and accountability”, die DA-beheerde Wes-Kaap 70%, die ANC-beheerde Oos-Kaap 16%, die ANC-beheerde Gauteng 25%. Die nommer 1 provinsie is die Wes-Kaap, mnr die Adjunkspeaker [Tussenwerpsels.]

'n AGB LID: Hoor daar! Hoor daar!

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: En dit kom uit die President se kantoor uit.

Hulle het verder gegaan: Menslike hulpbronne, “human resources”, die DA-beheerde Wes-Kaap 55%, die ANC-beheerde Gauteng 14%, die ANC-beheerde Limpopo 23%. Die Wes-Kaap is die nommer 1 provinsie.

'n AGB LID: Hoor daar! Mooi!

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Finansiële bestuur, “financial management”: die DA-beheerde Wes-Kaap 81%, die ANC-beheerde Noord-Wes 10%. [Tussenwerpsels.] die ANC-beheerde Gauteng 29%. Die Wes-Kaap weer nommer 1.

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, dit is nie ek wat so sê nie. Die agb lid mnr Ncedana moet net die dokument gaan lees en hy sal sien dat die Wes-Kaap is eintlik die enigste provinsie in hierdie land wat armoede aanspreek en wat omgee vir die armes. [Tussenwerpsels.]

We also need to ask ourselves if we are really giving our people value for money. We must realise that when we brag about our performance the Western Cape is the only province who is at the stage where we can debate and look at how we can put a toilet in each household, a tap in each household, because we are at a certain level now where we can move towards the next step. In other provinces it is not near that, so we are the only province that adhere to and speak to the dignity of our people, the dignity of the poor people. It is of the utmost importance that our municipalities are able to remain performing their functions as on-going concerns. Only when they are in this space can they render on-going quality of services to their communities. In this vein a number of critical actions can be taken.

Firstly, a relook at municipal organisational structures needs to occur. We need to look at that and we need to get our municipalities cost effective. Mr Deputy Speaker, let me conclude. Corruption has a massive impact on dealing with poverty and poverty alleviation, as well as service delivery and this country is now at a crossroad in this regard. National government must now face up to the serious situation this country is in. The ANC's disregard for good

governance, the rule of law, and cadre deployment in general have certainly contributed substantially to the predicament we are facing.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde!

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGBEPLANNING: Die DA-beheerde Wes-Kaap regering besef die uitdagings en ons sal alles in ons vermoë doen om die arm mense te dien. [Tyd verstreke.]

'n AGB LID: Mooi, mooi! (Applous.)

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to thank the hon member Mr Ncedana for raising the topic.

I want to start off by saying that when you go throughout South Africa, as my colleague just indicated, inequality is everywhere. Let us not make a joke about that. What I think is interesting and what I think is very informative are the two issues you raised. One is the issue you raised about the Western Cape constitution. There is one operative word in issue you raised, namely that the constitution of the Western Cape states that it shall strive, and I want to emphasise the word strive, hon member Mr Ncedana, for a better quality of life for all through just and fair governance. In doing that and in looking at that I also want to take the hon member Mr Ncedana to Section 27 of the big constitution, the National Constitution, which speaks to the rights of food, water and social assistance, and also take the hon member to the Grootboom matter and ruling in that case in the Constitutional Court that speaks to the progressive realisation of those rights. The reason why I am creating that context is because

hon member Mr Ncedana raised certain matters. Sometimes we create these wild perspectives or perceptions around inequality and we create these incredibly wild issues without really substantiating them or looking at the facts. I am so grateful to the hon Minister Bredell for just raising firstly what the President and the ANC government itself say about it. I think we can go a bit further and can actually look at what the United Nations say and what their research say about cities and equality in cities. I think you actually did research some of that, and when we look at those issues specifically, of all cities in South Africa, the poorest performing province at the moment is Kwa-Zulu Natal at 0,64%. The higher the number - I want to just indicate - the bigger the inequality. The second of course is again Mpumalanga and Gauteng, and then the Western Cape coming in at 0.55%. We are not there yet but we are moving there.

The hon member Mr Ncedana should look at the number specific profiles and specific portfolios of all our different members here. One of the issues I find very interesting is in respect of service delivery since 2009 to where we are standing now, specifically at the end of March of this financial year. In housing alone this government, this new government who took over in April 2009, up to 31 March 2013, delivered 94 228 sites and houses. I just want to make that first point. Since April 2009, R 166.3 million was spend on individual subsidies creating 2 385 new housing opportunities. But the most interesting one here for me in what the Minister of Human Settlements has done in the province was the R 121 million that was spent on the Extended Enhanced Discount Benefit Scheme for people who eventually got their own housing title deeds.

I am not going to go through all of these because it may bore the House and I think most of us sitting here are aware of these kinds of successes. However, sometimes we just need to be



reminded about them.

I am looking at Education. Since 2009, the Department has built more than 47 schools, and there are 28 additional schools at a cost R 1.3 billion in the pipeline for this current year. I want to ask this question and it is a question that no-one wants to ask. There is a broken tap somewhere and we do not fix the tap there. We wipe the water up here but the tap stays broken there, and how are you ever going to keep up with the service delivery needs? I remember going with the hon Minister Grant to some of the township schools in the beginning of the year. In regard to late registrations alone, we almost needed 21 more schools to be built just for late registrations because delivery elsewhere is so poor. It is bad. It is pathetic and I am not trying to be emotional about it.

The hon member Mr Ncedana made a very interesting point about old age homes. You know the old age homes and you know the government system. We as a government do not own one single old age home in this province but what we do, we subsidise old age homes, we fund them. They have their own governance structure and we fund them. What we find in Gugulethu - it is not the one I think you referred to in NY1 - there was almost a gang war between the different committees about who owns what, until we stepped in and said out with all of you, we will now put this thing under an administration fund, and get a service provider from outside to see to the basic human rights of those old people there.

At Goodwood they have structures where they run the home themselves. We give the same amount of funding, and I just want to make that point. This is the issue about perceptions. I just want to make that point.

The other point is around skills. You are going to be very excited when I take you on a tour of one of our great new programmes that we are looking to roll out in respect of skills development, namely carpentry, plumbing, and upholstery. I also went to five schools. I went to one in Mitchells Plain of the Minister of Education, “The School of Skills”, where I see young people building the most beautiful couches that we pay R 5 000 in the shops for that you can get for R 2 000. I would suggest you actually go and look at that one because you can get a good bargain there. These are the skills that this government is trying to impart to our young boys and girls in those kinds of schemes.

In healthcare I think of the immunisation programme around polio alone to the very poorest of the poor. Not in Bishops Court. Not anywhere else. We do a means test in the province. If you earn - if you are not rich - just slightly more than R3 500 you do not qualify for some of the services. I want to make this point very seriously because this government is serious around delivery to the poor and so that we can look at effecting that delivery to the poor.

A lot was said today about youth development. I listened and I honestly thought these people are not living in the province. They do not have a clue of what is happening in this province. I want to say part of our programmes for youth development is going to culminate on 16 June in a huge event at the Velodrome in Bellville. From all over the province young people are going to descend on that place and they are going to celebrate the achievements of the year. This government does not believe in hit and run. I just want to make that point. They do not believe in one day events. They believe that the work that they have done for the year must be celebrated and that all of us can together celebrate this great youth day and the historical significance of that day. I want to extend an invitation to you to come and see our young people, to come see them in action. We will have about 2 300 from all over the province

coming there. We are going to have fantastic young people performing part of their programmes; performing to us, singing and dancing. So I want to say the celebration of our young people throughout their programmes will be there, including the job creation and the extended Public Works programmes that we have most of our young people on.

Hon members I want to say that we want to see a 25 year old, a young person in this province; to be economically self-sufficient, more or less with a job. He should be independent and healthy with a family, a personal and social relationship with good people and active in the community. That is what we strive for in this province for our young people and I am very excited. I am incredibly optimistic. I had the opportunity yesterday to speak to Doctor Danny Titus from the ATKV, or TAKV. He sat there in awe listening to what this government is doing specifically around these needs, for example the need for employment, for educational training. Those youngsters would normally go become a gangster. He was amazed at the plans we are making with one of our big sites that we are going to repurpose to bring those young people in and to skill them. They may not be interested in carpentry. They may be interested in dance, in hip hop dance. They may be interested in hip hop song. That place is going to give them the opportunity. We also have our social development programmes, which will run parallel at that site, where you can pop in and can get whatever your specific needs are. We do not want to make the place a pathological place. The Minister of Health has his wellness centre rolled out there, a fantastic gym, with early health findings, so that they do not discover when you are 50 that you have sugar diabetes or heart problems or liver problems. We are able to identify that at an early age. Lastly, there is a central programme, which will be a nutritional programme. Every boy, girl, young person, young man who will come through those doors, will have access to food that is heavily subsidised by us because we have a food programme. I think all of us are incredibly excited around most

of that. We must also then finally say we will continue to extend opportunities to people that will enable them, hon members and Mr Deputy Speaker, to lead a better life and to enjoy better living conditions, things we must strive for. We must progressively strive for that. So instead of accusing the DA and the Western Cape government of not doing enough for the poor ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... the ANC should be striving to improve equality in other provinces so that the people do not all come here. [Time expired.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker and thank you to the hon member Mr Ncedana for bringing this discussion to the House.

I think it is an important discussion. He started off by using the words peace, reconciliation and justice and I suppose that has to be the rational end of all rational people in South Africa. If you are not looking for peace, reconciliation and justice one wonders what you are doing here. So we share that with him. You know, if ever there was a woman who fought under difficult circumstances for peace, reconciliation and justice it was the late Helen Suzman. It was a grave shock to me when the hon member Mr Ozinsky refused to acknowledge that. We often say things on the spur of the moment and in heat and so on and, but when he refused to withdraw that in the cool light of the Deputy Speaker's ruling, that was a troublesome moment for me. It indicates which way the ANC are likely to go.

Of course, hon member Mr Ncedana, I as a white person, felt he touched on areas that I do

not feel easy about. They are not things that can be simply dismissed out of hand. They are complex. For instance, when I took over this job I had a black guy - I prefer not to think in these terms because I spent most of my life and I grew up in a home where these terms were not acceptable, where our values were that people were individuals and they were not blacks or whites or Catholics or Jews or whatever. They were individuals and they were either good as individuals or not so good as individuals. Be that as it may, I inherited an HOD who perhaps the hon member Mr Ncedana would say was black, and in quite short order he and I parted ways at my insistence. It is always easier not to do that, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is always easier not to do that kind of thing. The fact of the matter is that the key infrastructural department or the key infrastructural force/thrust in this province has simply delivered nothing over five years, but somewhere between R 700 thousand and R 1.1 million had wandered out of the department into other people's pockets. I want to assure the hon member Mr Ncedana it was not the poor people's pockets.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Carlisle can I just point out that we are talking about inequalities and you must just ...

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Yes, I will come to that in a moment, but one of the things that the hon member Mr Ncedana spoke about was how there was an increasing inequality in that the DA was removing black and coloured people from positions of authority. It is that that I am talking about. So that particular decision was one that I had to make if I was in any way going to achieve my mandate and use the resources of my department and the budgets of my department to assist the poorest people in the community, because they were the least assisted by my department until then. One is always faced with those things.

I think it is also important to understand how things have changed over the last twenty years and take that into account. For instance, the number of households, formal households, has increased from 5.8 million in 1996 to 11.3 million in 2011. That is an astonishing increase. That is an unbelievable increase. That has not occurred anywhere in the world as far as I know. Most of the beneficiaries were obviously black people. The living standards measures, which is the best way to measure people's prosperity or lack of prosperity, and which go from 1 which is the very poor end, to ten, have shown the most astonishing change in South Africa. In 2001 10.5% - well let me group them together - 40% of all South Africans were in living standards 1, 2 and 3. So right down at the bottom were 40% of the total, and most of those, hon member Mr Ncedana, were black. In 2011 that 40% had fallen to 12% and the middle ranges, LSM 4, 5 and 6 had doubled. What that meant was that one of the most remarkable, and I think probably the greatest, transfer of wealth had occurred without violence. There is not a precedent in history for that transferring of wealth occurring, So in the broad scheme of things, there has been a huge change. As long as we go on seeing things only in racial qualities or in racial terms it is going to be very difficult to deal with genuine inequality in South Africa because we are always going to confuse inequality with race. When I go to a MINMEC meeting I am very often the only white person at that meeting. I go to two MINMEC meetings, and my colleagues will confirm that happening to them as well. I will tell the hon member Mr Ncedana that at that level there is no respect for employment equity, none at all. There is no attempt at that level in National Government to ensure that the races are represented as they should be represented in terms of demographics. However, I want to look at something that I think is very important. I visit quite regularly a place called Amasi Tandani, which is a kind of orphanage in Nyanga, the best orphanage in the Western Cape. There is nothing to touch it. Let me give one measure of it and that is that every three

children there have their own computer. There is one computer for every three children. It is spotlessly clean. There is the most wonderful loving supervision and it simply cannot be criticised. The interesting thing for me, and here I touch on something my colleague hon Minister A Fritz said, is that this is the product of a young man called Michael Tladi. Michael Tladi has worked very hard to make it like that, has inspired his friends, has created networks that now stretch across the globe, to Australia, to the United States, and to Nigeria to make it like that. It is good because Michael Tladi has made it good, and has made the effort to make it good.

There are many ways that one can actually dispute the notion that there are growing inequalities in the Western Cape, but there is no way I can do it more effectively than to talk about infrastructure in education, because we believe as a government, hon member Mr Ncedana, that if we cannot offer children a decent education we have no reason for existence as a government. We are wasting our time and their time and everyone else's time. There can be no question that the supreme imperative of this administration is to improve education, because without that how can we offer the opportunities which we claim to stand for as a party. Obviously the hon Minister Grant could show you the slow but steady increases in the standards of children in the various grades that they measure, but let me talk about the schools because that is where I am involved.

The ANC in the last four years they were here - you are talking about growing inequality, I want to show growth the other way - spent on average R157 million per annum during that time. By the time we finish the current MTF we would have spent R 700 million per year. R 157 million per year buys you, hon Minister Grant, about five or six schools?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Five schools.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: R 700 million buys you I think 28 schools, something like that. So to go from five schools per year - I think I am under correction in saying that these new schools are almost exclusively for Blacks, to 28 new schools for Blacks per year, is quite something. Let me say it is not just a question of schools. Many of these are replacement schools and if you see what was there and what it is replaced with and if you see the consideration that is given to create something of value, not just what is taught there but that the architecture itself should be something of value, you can appreciate what is being done in this regard. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon Minister Carlisle, you must finish off.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I will. This shows without any doubt or conditions that there are not growing inequalities in the Western Cape. There is greater and greater equality in the Western Cape, but not ... [Interjections.] [Time expired.]

Mr M NCEDANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, can I get the time that the Minister spent talking. He was allocated 10 minutes. Now according to my watch he spoke about ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: 5.

Mr M NCEDANA: No. The time was seventeen minutes past when you stopped him.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: A little bit ... [Interjections.]



Mr M NCEDANA: I just want to register this. If it occurred that he spoke in excess of four minutes, the time allocated to him, the transcript will help me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am pretty sure that your watch is wrong. I have been led by the Table, but I am prepared, hon member Mr Ncedana, that if you want to wrap up the debate with a short reply, to give you three minutes for that. Otherwise we have come to the end of the debate. The Minister spoke for ten minutes on the instructions from the Table. I am giving you the opportunity if you want to reply quickly. You are welcome, otherwise we close the debate.

Mr M NCEDANA: Thanks for the three minutes, Mr Deputy Speaker. The issue is that we miss the point. We miss the point in focussing on comparisons with the failures of other provinces instead of focussing on what more we need to do for this province. Let me use just one example, the old age homes. As you walk into those old age homes the environment is horrible. The inside of the old age home, the environment is terrible. It may be that the DA is doing well if you compare yourself with the ANC where it is running government in the provinces, but it does not necessarily translate to the fact that the DA is effective in this province. I think that is where we miss the point. I appreciate the contributions, but I think that if Ministers were to look at what is happening and who gets what, they would do more, as opposed to what the ANC is doing wrong elsewhere.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mr Ncedana. That then concludes the debate.

Debate concluded.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That also brings us to the end of business today. This House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:20.