## PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid Sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

Hon Maseko took the Chair and read the prayer.

# **BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may be seated. Before we proceed, I would like to remind the members about some of the logistical arrangements. As has been our practice to date, hon members will participate in the Sitting of the House both from here in the Chamber with the Presiding Officer and the Table staff and the Microsoft Teams. Our Standing Rules have accordingly been amended to accommodate such hybrid Sittings of the House. Suppose a member of this Provincial Parliament elects to participate virtually and not from the Chamber, in that case such a member's responsibility is to ensure that he or she has good quality data connectivity, good quality audio and video, that there are no disturbances where they are. Members will know that the hybrid system has been functioning well. Poor audio and or video are not attributed to the systems, but rather the quality of the data connectivity.

Members, before we continue with the proceedings I would like to acknowledge our guests on the Women's Debate today. We do have the Western Cape Manager, Commission for Gender Equality, Ms Sixolile Ngcobo. We also have Ukukanja Projects from Kayamandi and Cloetesville. We do have Phenomenal Women of the District, women representatives of Kraaifontein, and the Western Cape On Wellness from Swartland. Thank you very much for joining us and I hope that you enjoy the Sitting today and carry the messaging that you will hear from the hon members today.

Members, the Media has also been granted access to this MS Teams meeting as guests of the WCPP. However, members of the press may not use the chat room or speak or activate their cameras while the Sitting is in progress. If any individual who is not a member of this House activates the mic and video camera such an individual will be exited from the Sitting immediately. I request those here today those who are not members of this House to please observe the decorum of the House. For this Sitting, Language Translation Services are available in the Chamber as usual and on Microsoft Teams via their respective channels. Hon Members participating in this Sitting of the House must be please access Language Translation Services via a second device, e.g. your cell phone and if you have earphones available, please use them for the language translation services. I recognise the Chief Whip.

#### (Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Good afternoon. Thank you very much, hon House Chair, all guests, and hon members. I move without notice:

That the Speakers' Debate receives precedence in terms of Rule 20.

Thank you, House Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Are there any objections? Okay. Thank you very much. I recognise Minister Sharna.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon House Chair, just on a matter of welcome, we have six ladies from Atlantis also in the gallery with us today. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, and they are also welcome. There is no objection. I agree to the motion.

I am now going to recognise the Deputy Speaker.

## SPEAKERS DEBATE

### Creating Hope and Equal Opportunities for Women.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Chairperson. To the hon Speaker, hon members of this House, ladies and gentlemen, special guests, thank you very much to the Speaker for this opportunity to participate on behalf of the office of the Speaker and for the support during this debate. But today, this august House recognises and pays tribute to the women of this province and ultimately of all women in this country, using Malala Yousafzai's words, saying:

"I raise up my voice, not so that I can shout, but so that those without a voice can be heard."

We cannot succeed when half of us are held back, Chairperson, and so I dedicate today's debate to specifically those women and young children caught up in human trafficking and ultimately the more than 50 million people caught up in human slavery across the world. Just recently I had the opportunity to be invited to the pre-screening of Sound of Silence (\*Film name: Sound of Freedom), a film financed through crowd-funding, rocking the world by storm as an outlier, it reached number one in the box office charts, much to the surprise of the large production houses.

It is the true story of Tim Ballard, who quit his US Department of Homeland Securities job to find Operation Underground Railroad, an NGO fighting to rescue the millions of children forced into sex trafficking. It encapsulates family, sacrifice and faith and touches the heart and soul of everyone who watches the film. This film is so important to raise awareness of the crisis we face that a worldwide paid forward campaign has been launched. South Africa has been fortunate to be the second region in the world to get the rights via Gravel Road Distribution Group. Thank you to Benjamin Cowley and your team for the courage to bring this film to South Africa and for gifting two tickets for each of our hon members here today in this House to go to any film theatre to witness the profound and truly heartfelt film of the decade.

If you decide not to take up the two tickets I ask that you pay the tickets forward to two persons who would really like to go and watch the film. South Africa's Pay it Forward Campaign allows for anyone who wants to watch the film to get transport and a free ticket and more than 20,000 people in South Africa today have requested for free tickets and transport, and it remains in the top two films currently on screen, so you should have your ticket delivered to you shortly and for those that are online, I will ensure that those tickets get delivered to your office. Thank you once again to Gravel Road. But, Chairperson, 80% of trafficked individuals are women and young girls across the world. South Africa in particular, is currently listed in Trafficking in Persons Report of 2023 under the Tier 2 Watch List. That largely means that countries such as these have governments that do not fully meet these global minimum standards. That includes a failure to provide the evidence of increasing efforts to combat severe forms of trafficking in persons from its previous year. A promise for a job is all it takes for a woman to place their trust in these perpetrators and for a dream of a better life or opportunity to lift themselves out of abject poverty. But Chair, if we look more broadly at the subject of debate, the United Nations women are actively leading the process since 2001 for Sustainable Development Goal 5 by supporting the United Nation Member States as they set global standards for achieving gender equality, by working with governments, civil society, and to design laws, policies and programmes and services needed to ensure that standards are effectively implemented and truly benefit women and girls worldwide.

SDG5 aims to empower all women and girls by ending all forms of discrimination, violence in all its forms and any harmful practises against women and girls in the public and private spheres. Despite the many strides that have been made to close the gap, we still have a long way to go.

Chairperson, the South African labour market remains gender-biased. According to Stats SA, the largest contributor to overall income equality, comes from the labour market at 74,2%. Female workers earn approximately 30% less on average than males. The report reveals that males are more likely to be employed and have relatively better paying jobs compared to females. Most recently, we heard the following remarks from President Ramaphosa. "You deserve equal pay for the equal work that you do," he said, addressing a reception for South Africa's Team Banyana Banyana in Tshwane. "I have been told," he continues to say, "that you get 10 times less than what men get when they play soccer and that has to come to an end."

It took their achievement, before anyone else recognised that it is unjust that Women in soccer, for example, earn a fraction of what their counterparts earn and says something really about paying lip service to creating a more equal society.

South Africa ranks 123<sup>rd</sup> out of 146 countries for wage equity in the Global Gender Gap Report of 2022. Even income during retirement is even more unequal, as males usually retire on 35% of their final or annual salary, compared to only 9% to 26% for women according to the Forbes Member Insights of 2021.

Chairperson, even at the highest level of corporate business only 19,9% of women sit on company boards. The gender pay gap remains a significant obstacle to achieving gender equality in South Africa, South Africa could benefit from strengthening legislative transparency mechanisms, especially regarding pay, reporting and audits. This, hon members, is where we can have some meaningful influence. We could, through legislation, compel employers to provide transparent fair and equal remuneration for similar work done. According to a Commonwealth Report, only 24,9% of members across parliaments across the world are women. According to the research conducted by Rubio in 2021, women parliamentarians are recognised as being the main drivers of change in terms of gender equality in parliaments and beyond. As policymakers, the research done has found that they have unique abilities to significantly influence and shape policy.

In our pursuit of a more equal society, Chairperson, we must remember the wisdom and philosopher Confucius who stated: "Real knowledge is to know the extent of one's ignorance."

It is not just about knowing where we stand today, but understanding where we need to go and how we need to grow to get there. Our fight is not just about rights, but also about recognition, respect and understanding. It is about breaking down stereotypes and acknowledging the rich tapestry of experiences that women of all backgrounds bring to our society. We must work hand in hand with governments, businesses, communities and families to ensure that our contributions are acknowledged, our potentials are nurtured and our rights are protected. I urge each one of our hon members here today to become advocates in your own circles; mentor younger women, support your peers; stand up for discrimination and never forget that we are all part of this incredible journey. It is the courage and strength of South African women that have held our nation together from the march on the Union Buildings to the challenges of today. Together, let's build a society that celebrates women, that values our insights, our wisdom and our unique perspectives; a society where our daughters can grow without limits, our mothers can age with dignity and where we as women can stand tall, proud of who we are and all that we can achieve. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. I now recognise hon member Philander.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, House Chair. Thank you, hon Speaker, for moving this debate.

This month commemorates the 67<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the women's march against the apartheid government's introduction of pass laws. 20 000 women of all races, colours and creeds descended upon the Union Buildings with such force that Prime Minister J G Strijdom, in a moment of historic cowardice, found reason to be elsewhere. By the time of the March in August 1956, women in South Africa had been allowed to vote for 20 years, but of course we all know this vital right to democratically determine the future of one's own country was only extended to white women. Women of every colour understood this, including the march's five leaders and as well as the forerunner of our own party, Helen Suzman. They took pains to ensure that the march was led by women from every one of the country's major racial groups in a powerful and evocative moment. Hon House Chair, but this was more than a moment of unity, more than an example of political spectacle. It was a declaration by those tens of thousands of women that not a single one of them could be free until all of them were free. It was recognition that political rights limited by race, gender, sexuality or class could not be tolerated.

Hon House Chair, their call remains as relevant and important now as it did 70 years ago. We have come a long way since 1956. The pass laws have been abolished and every woman in this country now has the right to vote, but yet still there is more ground to cover.

In many parts of our country and to some extent, even in our province, women remain deeply unequal in practise. It is not enough that our mothers, daughters and sisters have become equal before the law. We must ensure that our every policy we pursue, every measure we take, puts the interests of women first.

Hon House Chair, when I look at this Government, I see policy that puts equality first. I see the Department of Health and Wellness going above and beyond every single day to ensure that women are given access to pregnancy screening and antenatal care. I see our women receiving proactive screening for breast, vaginal and cervical cancers and given the best possible care for these stubborn illnesses that claim far too many. Last, but perhaps most importantly, I see our women given control over their own bodies with access to contraceptives and free health checks. It takes a healthy woman to raise a healthy nation and our Government is doing everything it can to achieve this goal, but we must do more than simply ensure that women are healthy and well. We must ensure that nothing holds them back from the professional opportunities and education that men take for granted, that start with ensuring that young girls receive quality education and the Western Cape Education Department has been relentless in its pursuit of this vision. The Collaboration Schools Model, for instance, has seen the Department bring the private and non-profit sectors together to create no-fee schools in areas that desperately need them.

In addition to this, millions have been spent on the Rapid Build Programme, which has built new classrooms, new science labs, and in some cases entire new schools from the ground up. This Government has even worked to expand the reach of the National School's Nutrition Programme, because, as all of us know, you cannot teach a hungry child. All of this helps to get our youth the education that they deserve and gives them the tools they need to reshape society. Education begets equality, and it shuts violence down before it even can begin. The more we educate, the more we give our girls the tools they need to empower themselves, and the more we put the building blocks in place to build a better, more equal society for all of us. So, hon House Chair, as we engage in this vital debate today, I encourage every member of this House to keep in mind its relevance, that the march that began in 1956, which strove for equality for every race, creed, colour and gender, has yet to reach its destination, and the spotless banner carried by its leaders has now been passed down to all of us. We cannot shrink this responsibility, nor can we bring the course of true equality to fruition by will alone.

In the Democratic Alliance we often speak of an open-opportunity society for all. We recognise that we cannot create equality from nothing. Instead we must put the building blocks in place to ensure that no one is denied the opportunity to succeed in our society, especially not as a result of factors such as gender.

Hon House Chair, and while our task remains a serious one and our goals remain ambitious, my heart swells when I see what is being accomplished every day in this province to bring about the equality and better future we in the DA so desire.

Hon House Chair, come 2024, we will bring this brighter future to the whole of our nation. As a wise woman once said: "In the future there will be no female leaders, there will just be leaders."

I thank your hon House Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Philander. I now recognise hon member Bans.

Ms A BANS (ANC): Thank you, House Chair. I will not be needing that table. I am not going to abuse a woman today.

House Chair, as we draw the curtains on Women's Month, the African National Congress extends its warm embrace to this pivotal discourse titled Creating Hope and Equal Opportunity for Women. This deliberation marks not only a culmination, but also a continuation of our unwavering commitment to gender equality and empowerment. Our province stands as a living testament to the indomitable strength and resilience exhibited by its own women. United under the banner of progress, we are resolute in our mission to dismantle obstacles, obstructing the path to gender parity and to be fervent advocates of women's rights. The African National Congress reaffirms its unswerving dedication to ideals of hope and equal opportunities for women. We recognise that the true realisation of progress can only be attained when the potential of each and every individual is unleashed to its fullest extent. Our commitment transcends a mere aspiration to bring hope and equal opportunities to women. Instead, it is a profound endeavour to reshape the very landscape of our province and our nation. Our vision encompasses the flourishing of women-led enterprises, the ascension of women leadership roles across all sectors, and the total eradication of the scourge of gender-based GBV. It is through these united endeavours that we can genuinely construct a society characterised by equity, justice and inclusivity. The ANC remains steadfast in its pledge to empower women to nurture hope and to create pathways for equal opportunities.

Our proactive policies, initiatives and unyielding resolve stand in stark contrast to the passive stance of the DA, particularly in the realms of economics and the fight against GBV. We acknowledge that the foundation of empowerment rests upon unimpeded access to economic opportunities. The ANC has been at the forefront of championing policies that foster economic inclusivity, recognising that a thriving economy is one in which women are integral contributors.

Our commitment to gender parity is deeply enshrined in initiatives such as affordable healthcare, quality education and comprehensive support for women entrepreneurs. We firmly believe that a diverse and empowered workforce not only fosters personal development, but also propels the prosperity of our province. It is with this sense of pride that we highlight substantial strides, and we have taken poverty, women's economic empowerment, initiatives like the Women Empowerment and Gender Equality Bill as well as Land Reform and Agriculture Programmes, stand as a beacon of dedication. These endeavours equip women with tools and resources required to establish and expand their entrepreneurial ventures. Through avenues such as microfinance and targeting training we have empowered countless women to drive their individual pathways to success, thus stimulating grass-root driven economic growth, recognising the vitality of representation. We have steadfastly worked to enhance the participation of women in decision-making roles across a multitude of sectors, guaranteeing that their voices resonate with the corridors where policies are forged.

However, in the realm of equality, of economic equity and gender-based violence, we must acknowledge that the divergent trajectory taken by the Democratic Alliance in the Western Cape, their strategies, especially within the economic and GBV domains, stand in stark contrast to the rhetoric they proclaim regarding women's rights. In terms of economic empowerment, the DA's policies have inadvertently exasperated the chasm between the privileged few and the marginalised masses. Their lack of comprehensive approaches to address economic disparities, disproportionately affects women, who often confront compounded challenges. The gap between social economic classes continue to widen, rendering access to resources, education and opportunities even more elusive for women hailing from disadvantaged backgrounds, in direct contrast where the ANC remains committed to fostering equitable economic policies that aim to counteract such disparities.

Furthermore, House Chair, the issues of gender-based violence remain an area of utmost concern. The ANC recognises that the violence perpetrated against women is not merely an affront in individual victims, but a collective threat to our shared humanity. We have consistently championed comprehensive measures to counteract GBV, acknowledging that this issue necessitates more than reactive solutions. Our multi-phased approach encompasses the establishment of safe spaces for women, active engagements to reshape establishment of safe spaces for women. Societal attitudes that perpetuate violence and discrimination, and holistic initiatives such as the National Policy Framework for women's empowerment and gender equality. Along with the GBV Command Centres, these endeavours encompass support networks, legal reforms and educational campaigns that target the very roots of this pressing problem.

In contrast, the DA's response to GBV in the Western Cape has been characterised by a lack of urgency and fragmented approach. Rather than holistically addressing the issue, the DA has faltered in allocating essential resources such as safety centres and emergency units for rape and abuse victims. The absence of comprehensive GBV policy further dilutes their response, undermining not only the safety of women but also the value society places in their lives. The ANC remains resolute in commitment to confront GBV heads-on, advocating for a society in which every woman can exist free from fear and violence. We reiterate our call for Provincial Government to take decisive action against Farrel Payne, who remains in his position despite facing serious charges of misconduct against a female colleague. As the ANC we firmly believe that empowerment of women is not solely a moral imperative, but also a requisite for economic and social progress. Our vision for the province and for the broader South African landscape is rooted in cultivation and celebration of every woman's potential. It entails dismantling barriers that obstruct progress and ensuring that opportunities are accessible to all, transcending mere slogans and necessitating resolute and comprehensive actions. Let us remember the words of Samora Machel. a beacon of wisdom:

"The emancipation of women is not an act of charity, the result of a humanitarian or compassionate attitude, the liberation of women is a fundamental necessity for the revolution, the guarantee of its continuity and the precondition of its victory." Amidst the shifting challenges today, women continue to play a pivotal role ... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member, you may conclude. Your time is up.

Ms A BANS (ANC): Amidst the shifting challenges of today, women concluded to continue a pivotal role, nurturing hope for unplaced learners. Vanessa le Roux, a remarkable woman at the helm of NGO stands as a testament to this spirit. Year after year, she provides unwavering support to learners who find themselves without place in our educational system. These women... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, thank you very much, member.

Ms A BANS (ANC): ... are deserving of all accolades. I thank you, House Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise member De Villiers.

Mr P T DE VILLIERS (GOOD): Hon House Chair, Statistics South Africa has for the past few days been hosting the Ninth United Nation Global Forum on Gender Statistics in Johannesburg. The statistics released for both our country and province clearly show that although we have made progress, we have a long way to go in providing hope and equity for women in this province. As we reflect on women's socio-economic challenges, there are some questions to ponder.

Are we ready for generational equality? Empowering women is necessary to bring gender equality, or can we say gender equality is very necessary to empower women. Are we grafting inclusive systems to foster women's empowerment and how conscious are we of the gender specific problems that limit women's expectations of socio-economic opportunities. As the Western Cape commits to accelerating women's empowerment, we must adopt a transformative mindset viewing women's empowerment as а shared responsibility and collective action. With the right supportive structures, women's access to economic opportunities will improve to better position them to take the bold actions needed to foster the attainment of socioeconomic goals. Now is the time to leave no-one behind. We need to live in a society where every woman's dreams and aspirations can be realised. Together let us pave the way towards a more equitable and prosperous Western Cape for all. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise Minister Fernandez.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon House Chair, hon Premier and Cabinet Colleagues, hon members of the Provincial Legislature, special guests and members of the public joining us today, here and on the virtual platform, citizens of the Western Cape, good afternoon. Creating hope in a time of widespread cynicism and despair may seem an impossible task, but hope is what continues to fuel the work of the Western Cape Government. During the month of August, we have celebrated and encouraged others to celebrate women but, as I say, every day and every year, we should not wait for commemorative days to raise awareness against gender based violence or in this instance, to celebrate the very backbone of our community, our women.

According to the BACHA Care Foundation, empowering a woman will ensure that the entire family receives better care and nutrition. One woman brings hope to her family. Many women bring hope to humanity. With this in mind, the Provincial Department of Social Development, our Atlantis office, initiated a women's empowerment project at the start of Women's Month. A group of unemployed single mothers has been identified to be at the core of this programme, which is aligned to the National Strategic Priorities of job creation and employment. It is also aligned with the Provincial Government's Growth for Jobs Strategy, which seeks to improve access to economic opportunities and employability of individuals, especially in non-metro communities. Job creation is a priority for the Provincial Government as it provides opportunities and dignities to all.

The United Nations General Assembly recently passed a resolution proclaiming 29 October as an International Day of Care and Support.

On this day we will acknowledge the disproportionate burden of unpaid care and domestic work on women and girls. There is a great deal of development required in this space in South Africa as structural barriers continue to hinder women's empowerment. With this project, DSD hopes to remove some of these barriers. Over the next 12 months, the Department will work with the women in partnership with the Department of Economic Development and Tourism to ensure all of them access a skills development or job opportunity. I have the great privilege of celebrating these individuals, who are sure to become change-makers in their communities, tomorrow in Atlantis at a Women's Month celebration. I am honoured that some of these women are here today in the public gallery. Welcome, ladies, and happy birthday to you, *Olwethu*.

Hon House Chair, I have seen time and time again how women are often the ones leading the charge in communities when the Department implements programmes for the upliftment or development of citizens. In July the Department launched the Victim Empowerment Programme (VEP) Forum, and a Gender-Based Violence Ambassadors' Model in Delft. Delft is an Area-Based Team in terms of our Safety Plan. Trained volunteers from the community provide information about Victim Support Programmes and services available for the intervention and prevention of GBV to residents in Delft. The only other programme like this in the province is in the Swartland Municipality, the first municipality to implement the GBV Ambassadors' Programme in their IDP in this province.

I have walked with the ambassadors through the streets of Delft and Lingelethu respectively. One thing that instantly stood out, many of the trained volunteers are women and when I asked them why they decided to become GBV Ambassadors, their answers carry the same thread: we want to be part of the solution in reducing violence against women and children. We want to be part of the change in our communities. And this, Hon House Chair, is exactly what we have been seeing. Thanks to collaboration between National, Provincial and Local Government, NGOs and communities, we are starting to see a difference. We are seeing the whole-of-government and the whole-of-society approach in action.

Then to something a little grim; the latest First Quarter Crime Stats for April to June 2023 revealed Delft experienced a drop in rape cases of 38,3%. In the West Coast District Swartland Municipality rape cases decreased by 37,8% between April and June 2023, compared to last year during the same period.

I believe these communities are proof that where there are effective partnerships, changes are happening and hope is created. The crime stats also revealed incidents of rape dropped by 10,1% across the province and the murder of women decreased by 33,6%. This is no easy feat in a country synonymous with consistently high crime rates and incidences of gender-based violence. In an ideal world, we wish to have no woman afflicted by violence, because every life lost is one too many, but sadly this is the brutal reality our social workers have to deal with on a daily basis. Hon House Chair, we have shelter services that are aimed at providing women with hope and dignity. We have 26 DSD-funded shelters across the province, providing therapeutic support to women and children who are victims of crime and violence. As the lead Minister for GBV in the Province, I believe change should start with me and every hon member in this august House.

Last week the Department partnered with NPOs, Gender Equity and Reconciliation International, Gender Works and the Chrysalis Academy to undergo a two-day workshop on gender equity and reconciliation. I was joined by other Provincial and Local Government officials and stakeholders, learning how to restore gender imbalances and peace and addressing sexual injustice. This transformative journey is one which inspires me to create hope and healing in the different spaces I occupy.

The Province is truly leading the charge in interventions to address GBV as part of the Western Cape Government's GBV Implementation Plan and the Western Cape Safety Plan. The small successes we are seeing across the province and in areas like the West Coast and Delft are thanks to community buy-in. Collaboration is key to creating hope and opportunities.

DSD also supports the Chrysalis Academy's successful Youth Development Programme, which serves as a platform for youth to unleash their potential and be empowered. Graduates receive a 12-month work placement opportunity at the Department of Police Oversight and Community Safety's various safety partners such as DSD. In fact, one student who graduated early this year, Fatima, now works at our front desk at head office. Through this work placement, some graduates also end up finding permanent employment, creating dignity and hope in the process.

Hon House Chair, this is just a snapshot of the many ways the Department is trying to create hope and equal opportunities for women. We still have much to do, but as I look up at the women from Atlantis and all the women in this gallery who are driven by purpose and determination to create better lives for themselves, their families and their communities, I am inspired. We must be intentional in our efforts to promote gender equality, to ensure women take up their rightful place in society. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. I now recognise member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, House Chair. House Chair, I also want to welcome the ladies from Macassar that are here today.

Teresa C Younger, President CEO of the Foundation for Women, said the following:

"My hope for the next generation is that they recognise the importance of their voice and power so that we do not go back to the levels of complacency that we have seen in the past." She further says:

"I hope they keep in mind that it is not the leader in front of you, but rather the leader in you that gives you the power to change a society."

House Chair, allow me today in this debate to pay tribute to my mother, late mother Lavonia Christians. I, being raised by a single mother who was never married, who never had a house that she could call home, but she was hopeful and resolute. Like my mother, who had to provide, work hard, make sure that the children have something to eat. We cannot believe it! In 2023, we still have women facing exactly the same challenges that my mother faced many, many years ago.

What can we do as leaders? And I am saying this to the leaders today. First start at your home, make sure that we treat our wives and our daughters with dignity and respect and we must extend the same dignity and respect to all women. Let me start also by telling our leaders, let us encourage our daughters to excel in everything they do. Let us teach them that they must overcome the boundaries set by men, and the important thing, the important thing is that we must tell them as we grew up, the sky is the limit. My mother was testament to this and I salute her. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, thank you very much. I now recognise hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS (FF PLUS): Speaker, we are the legislators. We stand in the

dock. We determine what constitutes crime and we must give people open opportunities and not criticise the status quo. But we all have failed to protect our women in a male-dominated society. What hope can women have if 71 500 were raped in 2008? What hope can women have if the Medical Research Council found that 45% of women aged between 14 years and 24 years has been raped or sexually assaulted? What hope is there for women if parole boards merrily go about giving early parole to rapists and those convicted of murdering women as though these criminals are earthly saints that need our protection, and what hope can we offer women when certain customary laws defines them as minors without any property rights?

When will well researched spatial planning make it safer for women to reach their home after work, take a stroll or make it safe for them to use public transport when they want to reach shopping malls?

Margaret Thatcher, British Prime Minister, said:

"Any woman who understands the problems of running a home will be nearer to understanding the problems of running a country."

Women simply need opportunities to prove their merit. They need no favours from men or equity quotas. They are intelligent and confident enough to stand on their own feet. Just give them equal opportunity to prove they are equal, if not better than men. I have seen it in this House, intelligent highly qualified women, of which I am proud. We all speak with high praise... [Interjection.] The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, conclude, your time is up. [Interjection, speaking simultaneously.]

Mr P J MARAIS (FF PLUS): We all speak with high praise of the brave women who marched to the Union Buildings for freedom, but today they are still in chains, put around their necks... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Marais, conclude, your time is up.

Mr P J MARAIS (FF PLUS): ...by the very men who are professing to be their liberators.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise Minister Marais.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: House Chair, we can say with pride that 2023 has been a year for women in sport. Through the power of sport we can continue to bring hope and create more opportunities and we can inspire young girls to pursue their dreams.

The Western Cape hosted the Netball Quad Series in January, which saw England, Australia, New Zealand and South Africa competing at the CTICC in Cape Town. In February we saw records being broken with a crowd of 12 782 people attending the finals. [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister, I am sorry to disturb you. There is an echo. I do not know where does it come from? Let us check because member Marais has dropped. Maybe it will be better now. My apologies for that, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you. In February we saw records being broken with a crowd of 12 782 people attending the final of the Women's T20 Cricket World Cup at Newlands. We saw our momentum Proteas play their hearts out in front of their home crowd in an action-packed final against Australia, which reignited a spark for many people in supporting our local teams. In July and August, we hosted the Netball World Cup for the first time on African soil, with all matches being played in Cape Town. We saw the whole country become netball obsessed as we followed the SPAR Proteas progress in the tournament and then we watched Banyana Banyana making history as they became the first South African national team to reach the last 16 in the FIFA Women's World Cup. With all of these events we have seen that women's sport is no longer nonprofitable or not getting air time. The whole country supported these teams as they represented us so fantastically on the world stage. The Western Cape also showed that we are more than ready and able to host large tournaments. These major sporting events also brought a huge economic injection to the

province, which created more jobs and promoted the province as a world class destination. As part of the Netball World Cup's dedication to promoting women in sport, SuperSport used an all female broadcasting crew in front of and behind the cameras for this tournament. We wish to thank and commend SuperSport for this important step, which serves to highlight all the female professionals in broadcasting.

Our female commentators in various sporting codes have been making impacts at international tournaments. It is crucial that we introduce our young girls to these pathways as potential career opportunities.

With the recent announcement of the professionalisation of women's cricket with the introduction of the Professional Domestic League we hope this will usher in a new era where our female athletes are paid equally to their male counterparts. We cannot continue to pay our women's teams less than the men's teams while they reach such excellent results at national tournaments. Equally we should be putting in bids for major tournaments like the 2027 FIFA Women's World Cup as we have seen that we are more than capable of successfully hosting these tournaments.

House Chair, as part of the legacy of these major events, the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport has assisted municipalities across the province with the upgrading of existing or building and new netball courts. We want to ensure that our young girls and women can continue competing in netball and that they can find connection with other women in safe spaces when they take part in sport. It is crucial that we harness the power of sport in our communities in creating safe spaces for women and girls. The benefits to competing in sports are plentiful. In addition to encouraging healthy lifestyles, it also provides a sense of identity and belonging and aids good mental health and well-being.

If we invest in the holistic development of our young girls by providing them with safe spaces, we can ensure that they will become the female leaders of the future. Our Department continues to promote, to implement the Women in Sport Policy which is aimed at growing and promoting women's sport in the country. An important topic in this policy is that of safeguarding. They must ensure that our sporting clubs and coaches are aware of the policies in place and that we protect our young and vulnerable athletes. Young girls must be able to participate in sport without fear of harassment or abuse. We will continue working closely with our stakeholders to ensure that the conversation around women is sport continues in such a way that we ensure safe and sustainable environments for our female athletes.

Our Department believes in the power of both sport and arts and culture in empowering women. We support our young aspiring scriptwriters, directors and actors through our various drama festivals across the province. In supporting our next generation of women in the performing arts, we can ensure that women will be front and centre in our theatres and then they can continue creating safe spaces for important narratives that need to be told. In partnering with major cultural events like the Cape Town Carnival, we are also supporting opportunities for employment for women in this industry. We must continue growing our culture events to ensure that we can create a sustainable environment for female professionals in this sphere to thrive.

As we wrap up Women's Month, we are now going into September, when we celebrate Heritage Day and Heritage Month. Our Department has done much in the museum space to produce exhibitions to celebrate the strong women who have left their legacy in our province. We must continue to celebrate women like Dulcie September who did so much in the struggle for freedom in our country. For both our travelling and permanent exhibitions we hope to inspire young girls across the province with the stories of the remarkable women who have made such an impact on our province.

House Chair, through all that we do for women, our aim is to bring hope and joy to the people of the Western Cape. We want our youth to experience the thrill and excitement of representing their sport teams on big platforms, and we want girls who aspire towards acting to be able to perform to audiences on various stages; we want that feeling of youthful exuberance to be captured in essence of participating in activities that allow girls to feel safe. When we equip our young girls with opportunities and spaces where they can safely grow and express themselves, we will give them the wings to fly to whichever heights they strive for. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister.

I now recognise hon member Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (ANC): Thank you very much, hon House Chair. Hon House Chair. Hon House Chair, firstly Al Jama-ah sends condolences to the EFF on the tragic loss of three of their fighters who were gunned down in Mfuleni because they were defending women against gender-based violence, gangsters and drug dealers; their deaths to be a reminder for this province that it fails to keep our community safe and to shut down shebeens and drug dens.

Al Jama-ah salutes the thousands of women who, despite, under very challenging circumstances, marched to the Union buildings in Pretoria against the permit or *dompas*, and the oppressive apartheid regime.

Unfortunately, the struggle against oppression, discrimination and exploitation continues for many women today, creating hope and equal opportunities for women remains an illusion for many. We have seen on social media, our women living in gang infested areas debunked the word "hope" when they were asked if they have any hope that the City's strategies to combat crime will lead to safer environments. The word "hope" has become a swear word for many women living in gang-infested areas. They are living in poverty and are unemployed. They are victims of gang and drug violence and victims of gender-based violence. All these are testimonies to the harsh realities of life in our townships, on the Cape Flats. They have no hope in this DA-run Western Cape Legislature and the City of Cape Town. At the 2022 Women's Month launch, the Western Cape Government expressed support for women who suffer all forms of violence, and it promoted its services and resources available in specific communities. We hope the specific communities include those living in gang-infested areas, so they too have equal opportunities to transform them.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, your time is up. Can you conclude please?

Mr G BRINKHUIS (ANC): Thank you, House Chair. Equal opportunities for job creation, education, and financial independence must reach the most... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (ANC): Oh, thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I now recognise hon member Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon House Chair. As Women's Month draws to an end the ANC welcomes today's debate on creating hope and equal opportunity for women sponsored by the hon Speaker. Today, as we gathered here, still celebrating Women's Month, we must acknowledge the remarkable strides that have been made in the battle for gender equality and women's empowerment. I understand that the Speakers Debate are always positive in nature. However, it is with a heavy heart that I stand before you to lament the glaring inadequacies in the Provincial Government's effort to uplift and support the women of the Western Cape. We must address the DA's lack of substantial support for women's empowerment; the insufficient investment in combating gender-based violence (GBV) and femicide and the appalling stance of the Provincial Government in protecting individuals like Farrel Payne, who face allegations of crimes against women. It is utterly unacceptable that a government body entrusted with the well-being and safety of its citizens would shield individuals facing such serious charges. By doing so, the DA Government sends a clear message that it is not fully committed to the support and dignity of women. The ANC condemns this behaviour and demands accountability. The Provincial Government's commitment to women's empowerment remains a hollow promise.

While we may have witnessed significant progress in gender equality and women's empowerment nationally, let us not be blinded by the illusion of achievement. When we analyse the Provincial Budget Allocation for Programmes aimed at empowering women economically, socially and politically, as the ANC, we cannot help but be dismayed. Without a genuine investment of resources and a comprehensive approach to women's issue, how can we expect hope and equal opportunities to flourish? One of the most pressing concerns of our time is the relentless epidemic of gender-based violence and femicide. It is an issue that plagues our society and the Western Cape is no exception. Sadly, the Provincial Government's effort to combat this heinous problem have fallen woefully short. The investment in shelters, counselling services and legal support for survivors is far from adequate. As the ANC we demand more than just lip service, we demand action. Lives are at stake and we cannot afford to turn a blind eye any longer. In this regard we commend the ANC National Government for releasing 12 state-owned properties, six which are in the province and the other six are in Gauteng, to be used as shelters for victims of GBV and femicide.

[Speaking in vernacular 01:02:47]

To create hope and equal opportunities for women in the Western Cape, it is imperative that the Provincial Government takes concrete steps. First and foremost an immediate increase in investment towards women's empowerment initiatives is non-negotiable. This includes funding for education and skills training, access to affordable healthcare, and support for women entrepreneurs. Without such investment we are merely paying lip service to a cause that deserves far more. We reiterate our calls for increased funding for the Victim Empowerment Programme.

I would also like to highlight the DA's lack of empowering women farm workers. The DA is not doing enough to support women on farms.

Furthermore, the under-representation of women insignia to top management roles in the Provincial Government and Western Cape municipalities is a reflection of deep-seated gender biases that persist. This smirks of patriarchal and misogynist tendencies that persist in the DA white-male dominated party, where women continue to be seen as second class citizens. The ANC calls for accelerated implementation of policies that actively support and promote the advancement of women on farms and in Government positions. The perspectives and voices of women are invaluable and must be heard at all levels of decision-making.

In the same breath, let us scrutinise the Provincial Government Growth for Jobs Strategy. While economic growth and job creation are vital we must not lose sight of the fact that the strategy should prioritise the empowerment of all citizens, especially black women, including African, Coloured and Indian women who are hard hit by the unemployment in the province. If this strategy fails to address gender disparities in employment and wage gaps, it perpetuates the very same inequalities. It should be dismantled. It is high time we hold Government accountable for such imbalances and demand a more inclusive approach to economic growth.

In conclusion, House Chair, as the Women's Month comes to a close and as we reflect on the progress made, let us also shine a light on the areas that require urgent attention. The Provincial Government's lack of support for women's empowerment, insufficient investment in combating gender-based violence and femicide, and questionable protection of individuals facing allegations of crime against women, are all deeply concerning. We have a moral duty to demand better for our sisters, our daughters, our mothers and friends who deserve a society that values and protects them. We must remember that hope is not passive. It is a force that drives change by advocating for equal opportunities, demanding accountability and challenging gender biases. We can pave the way for a brighter future.

It is time for the Western Cape to rise above the status quo and become a beacon of progress, equality and justice for all citizens, regardless of gender and race. Together we can transform hope into reality, and together we can make our province a place where women truly thrive.

I thank you, hon House Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon member Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon House Chair. House Chair, I firstly would like to take this opportunity to congratulate the hon Minister Dr Nomafrench Mbombo for winning the *Mail & Guardian* Woman of the Year Category in Governing and Politics.

Further, I would like us to pay tribute today to the anniversary of our late colleague, the Chief Whip, hon Lorraine Botha, a woman who promoted access, opportunity and espoused responsibility.

Hon House Chair, fellow South Africans, as we reflect on this particular

month, some questions I had to ask myself were what do I consider as success? What makes me successful and what makes a woman successful in a supportive society within the Western Cape context?

I could tell you, hon House Chair, about the Western Cape Department of Economic Development and Tourism that placed a total of 4 684 learners in the 2022/23 programme over the three years, in BPO, in the Artisan Programme, in Work and Skills.

I can tell you that in this particular programme there were 1 529 males, but there were 3 155 females, more than double the number of males in the particular programme.

The hon member Bans, hon Chairperson, indicated that our economic programmes disproportionally affects women negatively in this province, but the gender split combined for all of the DEDAT skills programmes is 70% female and 30% male. Is that success?

I could tell you, hon Chairperson, that DEDAT has an SMME Booster Fund that provides financial support to organisations that implements business development support, projects aimed at growing and developing SMME. Through this particular fund, 515 women-owned businesses have been supported out of the total of 860 businesses since 2019, and these 860 SMMEs have sustained 4 977 jobs and help created an additional 651 jobs. Is that success, hon House Chair? Hon Chair, I could ask you about the City of Cape Town's Economic Directorate and how you can go on to their website, search for small business finance options, apply for investment in centres or enrol for the myriad of free online courses with the Cape Town Entrepreneurship Academy, or the Smart Supplier Programme that encourages the private sector to increase procurement from small business.

I could tell you about the City of Cape Town's business hub that provides practical solutions to simplifying the starting up and developing of your business. How you can find business training workshops on their websites. How to do business with the City, costing and pricing, how to complete an RFQ or tender document, anti-corruption, construction training and business improvement. Is that success, hon Chairperson?

Hon Chairperson, I could ask you about how the City of Cape Town's Economic Growth Directorate is planning to invest R184 million in infrastructure initiatives for informal trading sites across the Metro over three years, or how the Khayelitsha Bandwidth Barn is South Africa's only township tech hub. Or even how the Mayoral Committee of Economic Growth member has proposed a zero percentage tariff increase on informal trade permits for the next financial year. Hon House Chair, is that success?

But today specifically I actually want to tell this House about one of my childhood neighbours, Uncle Forat and Auntie Wasira [1:08:09]. They ran a

spaza shop or a house shop, as we would call it in the neighbourhood, and every now and then I would help out Uncle Forat in this store, and Uncle Forat and Auntie Wasira taught me, growing up, about responsibility.

I would like to thus tell you about my very first business at the age of 8, in Grade 3, and that was a spaza shop.

Now in primary school what they had, they called it market days and this is essentially fancy English words for teaching kids how to run a spaza shop or a house shop.

So with the particular market day obviously as you would imagine parents are almost as stressed or more stressed than their child in order to make sure this market day stall is successful and my parents sat me down and asked me, "What are you going to sell? Chips? Sweeties? What flavours? Have you asked your grandmother yet whether she is going to bake *vetkoeke* and mince? What is going to happen?"

They made me put together a budget, I had to price the items, we had to go to the bank to get change, we had pre-market day meetings to discuss décor and equipment required and most importantly, hon House Chair, I had to, in writing, commit to pay my parents back for their expenses. Market day stall taught me the components of success are not just money. It is having an entrepreneurial mindset, having access, having opportunity, but also being responsible and that is what success means to me, hon Chairperson. It means access, opportunity, it means responsibility.

The Western Cape Government can help you with access to quality education, but you must do your homework. The Western Cape can ensure that there are 1 567 free Wi-Fi spots across the province and free [Inaudible.] access E-Centres, but you must make use of the resources available to you. Government has a responsibility, but so do we.

Hon House Chair, if we want to be successful in life, I want to ask you do you know your neighbour's name? If there is a mom in the neighbourhood who needs time to herself, but she has no one to look after her kids, do you offer to babysit? Do we celebrate the graduation? Do we celebrate the launch of the small business? Or do we only pitch up for the weddings and the baby showers? Do we help each other with submitting maintenance and protection orders? Do we phone the police when we hear the fighting, we know the husband has a history of violence? Or do we only pitch up for the gossip over the fence?

You know, every rape in this country is one too many, hon House Chairperson, but we are making strides in this regard. Recently the statistics have shown that between April to June 2022 and April to June 2023 rape in the Western Cape has decreased by 10,1% and eight police stations with high GBV rates have benefitted from LEAP deployments.

Hon House Chairperson, are we teaching our daughters how to do taxes?

How to balance income and expenses? Pursue Maths and Sciences? How to run a market day stall? Or is it one of those cases where we want them to do well, but not better than us?

Hon House Chairperson, we were told about how we must remind girlchildren they can be anything in life, but I actually want to say please stop telling girlchildren they can be anything in life because it would not occur to them otherwise if you did not tell them that you can be anything in life.

Do we ask people, do we speak to our children about antenuptial contracts? About drafting a will? About how to negotiate a salary? Success is helping one another break down barriers to access an opportunity, supporting one another. Success is knowing your neighbour's name and Uncle Forat and Auntie Wasira knew my name, hon House Chairperson.

In the Western Cape Government we consistently work towards breaking down barriers of access and opportunity, but if we do not even know each other's names then no amount of Government programmes will help us become a successful society and provide hope to the women in our province.

So I ask you today do you know your neighbour's name? I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now again recognise the Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon House Chairperson. Thank you to the hon members for participating in this debate today and to the hon Speaker that remains a staunch advocate for women and women in this Parliament. Really thank you, thank you for recognising us as an equal partner.

We certainly have come a long way, but as hon member Philander has stated, the march has yet to reach its destination.

Yes, hon member Christians, it begins at home where an environment of respect and dignity is created, but, hon members, I think really it is about us taking a completely different stance by making each day, each day of the year where we consciously, consciously with intent apply our leadership and mentorship in a way that can change the trajectory of even if it is only one woman who needs assistance.

It takes a village to raise a child, but equally it takes a village and a country to work together towards a destination that started way back in 1956. I thank you, hon Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. That concludes the Speaker's Debate. Hon members, with your indulgence, if we can pause just to allow the Speaker to take his seat.

Thank you very much, hon members. We are now going to proceed to the

Interpellations as printed on the Question Paper. My apologies, just ...[Incomplete.]

I now recognise Minister Simmers.

[The Speaker takes the Chair.]

# **INTERPELLATION**

## 1. Ms P Z Lekker to ask Mr T A Simmers, Minister of Infrastructure:

(a) What progress has been made with the Silverton Emergency HousingProject in Khayelitsha and (b) what has caused the delays in the project?

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon House Chair, and responding to this question contextual background is key for this specific particular project, hon member Lekker, through you, hon House Chair.

This project was initiated in October 2018 as a response to a fire disaster that occurred at the Silvertown informal settlement, wherein 342 informal structures were destroyed and as a result more than 1 300 people were displaced.

As a response to the disaster, the former Department of Human Settlements and the City of Cape Town identified Erf 56696, a City-owned property that is adjacent to the SST informal settlement, as a suitable area to erect 900 temporary housing units or TRUs as we call it, to accommodate the displaced families.

My Department obtained an informal and in principle agreement from the City of Cape Town as the landowners, for the erections of the TRUs. The progress to date is as follows, through you, hon House Chair, hon member:

Phase 1A of the project is at an advanced stage. This phase includes the installation of civil services, which include, but is not limited to, roads, water and sanitation, and to date my Department has spent R107 331 351 towards the project. Of this R31 331 251 has been toward the installation of these civil services and the remaining amount of R76 million was spent on alternative building technology or ABT materials for the top structure phase.

In addition, the Department facilitated the establishment of a Project Steering Committee, or PSC. The PSC is a platform whereby the Department provides periodic feedback and updates on this project.

Since the formation of this PSC there has been no less than 36 meetings where [Inaudible.] progress report was provided. The last meeting was on 19 July of this year.

Now what are the reasons for the delays, hon Speaker? Phase 1 of the installation of civil services is delayed as the land was illegally invaded

during 2020 and as you might appreciate all housing projects are subject to a number of statutory planning and land use processes. These include, but are not limited to:

- Environmental authorisations
- Land use approvals
- Site development plans
- Subdivision plans
- Building plan approvals
- Electrification approvals.

And this is just but to name a few.

The delay in receiving some of these approvals had a knock-on effect to the progress of the project and until recently the Department had not obtained the requisite development rights from the landowner to proceed with the other phases of the projects.

However, on 22 August of this year, which is last Tuesday, the Department obtained a Section 55(4)(b) approval that will enable the submission of building plans very soon.

With that said, hon member, through you, hon Speaker, I am under no illusion that in spite of all of our condemnable efforts, there are still challenges with this project. I am also cognisant that the community is understandably impatient with the delays in this project and I will be engaging this specific community and other Metro-based communities in the month of October to cement my commitment to these respective projects. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister, and good afternoon hon members. I recognise the hon member Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The Silvertown Emergency Housing Project was initiated to provide much needed housing for 1 542 beneficiaries, including the 342 households that were displaced in the devastating informal settlement fires in 2018.

After a series of delays sod turning for the project was finally conducted by the MEC in November 2021. However, the project has not yet commenced and the site is currently abandoned and costing taxpayers millions as a security company is paid every month to protect it.

I am deeply concerned about the delays in this project. I believe that they are a direct result of the divisions and internal fights between the Democratic Alliance Administration in the City and in the Province.

The City has stated that it has given Power of Attorney to the Provincial Government to enable it to submit a land use application to apply for the rezoning and sub-division of the area. The City also claims the rezoning and sub-division application, which included the approval of a site development, was approved in April 2020.

However, the MEC's Department has said that the project is delayed because the land availability agreement has not been signed and approved by the City. It is a clear case of buck passing. It is unacceptable that poor people's lives are being lost due to political gamesmanship of the DA.

The beneficiaries of this project continue to live in a squalid condition with no access to water and decent sanitation. They are also at risk of fire as evidenced by the lives of 12 of the beneficiaries of the projects that have been lost in informal settlement fires to date.

A simple signature from the City and the Provincial Government could have averted the senseless death of our people. This is yet another sign that Black lives do not matter to the DA.

I am therefore calling on the MEC to immediately intervene and ensure that the Silvertown Emergency Housing Project is completed without further delay. I also call on the City and the Provincial Government to put aside their differences and work together to deliver this essential project for the people of Khayelitsha.

How many more lives must be lost before the DA takes action? I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Lekker. I recognise the hon member Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, we welcome the progress that is made so far in this project, but the reality, hon Speaker, is that community dynamics sometimes plays the role in delaying the processes and if we can look at the 2023 financial years, one of the causes of the delays, that is so changing the communities, is the Department of Infrastructure did spend R161,7 million on security to mitigate stoppages or disruptions through extortions.

So the projects in Government all the time have to be implemented within the parameters of the rule of the law and policies for project implementations. It does not mean if the projects have to be implemented you just have to put a signature and that has to happen. There are the PFMA that has to be followed to make sure also that you operate within the rule of law.

It is really sad that a portion of this site, as we speak now, has been invaded and that means there are beneficiaries that have been shortchanged by this criminal behaviour.

If I can ask the question to Minister Simmers, with the progress that has been made so far, do you foresee any delays or anticipate any delays for this project? And if there are delays that you foresee, what will be those delays for these projects not now to be implemented to its finality? Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Maseko. I recognise the hon member Christians.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, just a few questions to the Minister.

The first question is now that there is a Project Steering Committee. You have the buy-in of the community. Will that assist to deliver these temporary housing sooner than later? Because I have read an article where you stated in 2018 in the *Mail & Guardian*, 26 October, it says, the lady said:

"MEC Western Cape Human Settlements did visit the scene of the fire on Saturday."

She says:

"Promises are being made and never realised."

So that was reported in the *Mail & Guardian*. So I am asking the Minister now, the Project Steering Committee, will that assist that the people will be sorted out sooner rather than later?

The other question, Minister, that I need to ask is these invasions of land, who is behind this? Because your Department is paying millions of rand to keep the property not invaded. Who is behind it? Do you know who is behind it so that that can be addressed? Because it is not just happening there, it is happening all over the province. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Christians. I recognise hon member Lekker. This your second opportunity.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. The Silvertown Emergency Housing Project is a National Government funded project with available land. However, it has been delayed due to a lack of signature and infighting within the DA.

Three different construction companies have been contracted to build top structures using alternative building technology (ABT). All of these companies are awarded advance payments to procure materials. Millions of rand have been already wasted as materials purchased for the project have been damaged or spoilt as a result of the delays.

One company has already withdrawn from the tender. The Premier must hold MEC Simmers accountable for this wasteful expenditure of public funds. MEC Simmers must also explain why his Department contracted three companies from Johannesburg to build top structures for the project when there are many local companies that can do the job. It is deeply concerning that millions of rands have been wasted and 12 lives have been lost, I must repeat this, and it is due to MEC Simmer's incompetent handling of this project. MEC Simmers and the DA should be held liable for these deaths. The ANC is considering taking this matter to the Public Protector for further investigation.

MEC Simmer's remarkable incompetence has also caused significant delays to the reopening of the Central Line. The DA has sabotaged, stalled the relocation of the families occupying the Central Line. This is not a coincidence. The DA is determined to ensure that the Black majority in the province lives in deplorable conditions.

Our people are forced to live in overcrowded, unsafe, informal settlements with little to no access to water and sanitation. We support Minister Kubayi-Ngubane's decision to appoint the Housing Development Agency as the implementing agent for upgrading all informal settlement in the City of Cape Town.

We urge the Minister to also consider appointing the HDA as the implementing agent for the Silvertown Emergency Housing Project. The DA has clearly shown no interest in getting this project completed as soon as possible.

The pain of the people is well-captured in the statement by Vicky Twani, a

local resident of Khayelitsha, who said, I quote:

"I get very sad when I think about how we have been taken for a ride by this Government who keep promising us that we will get sorted out with proper housing."

I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Lekker. Hon Minister, Minister Simmers.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you to all the members for their inputs.

Firstly to the hon member Lekker. I will once again outline that the immediate action that I have taken while waiting for the land availability agreement and all that entails. I have used Section 55(4)(b) on 22 August 2023 which ensures that with this approval in place I no longer need the land availability agreement from the City of Cape Town to move forward on our project.

So this is what I have done and my Department to ensure that there are no more longer delays in this project.

Hon member, you also referred to other projects. I do need to indicate all

projects do need to adhere to the rule of law and all processes, because all lives matter in our province, but also to ensure that we adhere to the rule of law. †Ons is nie 'n kangaroe-staat nie. Ons is 'n provinsiale regering wat glo in die gereg en die regsprosesse wat daaruit spruit. [We are not a kangaroo state. We are a provincial government that believes in the justice system and the legal processes stemming from that.]

Hon member Christians, indeed with a PSC in place, and we have had 36 meetings, we keep them informed and up to date, so they are well-aware where we are and what is about to commence. We have the buy-in and had it not been for some very strong PSC members, we would not have seen the prevention of a further invasion of the site.

Phase 1A, which is the one component where all services have been installed and the electrification is about to commence within this month, and we do project with bulk electrification that that will be complete by December of this year and all else will follow.

I think the pity here is that Phase 1B has totally been invaded allegedly by the encouragement of certain political parties within that sub-council, but I do commend the Project Steering Committee for preventing any further invasion on the already serviced site.

So sometimes what we as Government do with good intention, it is many a time within those same communities, scrupulous individuals going under the banner of so-called community leaders that actually try to prevent the Government from doing what they were meant to do.

Hon member Matlhodi, I do not foresee any delays that are within our control. We have now used Section 55(4)(b) to show that we do want to accelerate and move forward, but it is what the host community does that is very, very important and which is why I once again commend the Project Steering Committee because we believe in partnership, but all partners need to play their role, even members within this House and the councillor and councils in that sub-council. That is the only way we can get things going, but again we need to adhere to the rule of law and we have done that as a Provincial Department. Even HDA went through the same processes. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, that is the end of interpellation as printed on the Question Paper. We will now move on to Questions for Oral Reply in terms of Rule 202. I now recognise the Chief Whip.

### **QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. As indicated I wish to draw your attention to Question 2 that will stand over to the next Sitting and the relevant consensus has been reached between the member and the relevant Minister. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, so noted, hon Chief Whip. Hon members, before I recognise the first, or recognise the Premier for the first question, I wish to remind you that once the hon Premier or the Minister has started the reply to the oral question as printed on the Question Paper, hon members use the chat facility for the Sitting of the House to indicate that they wish to ask a question or a follow-up question, for those members who are joining us online, and those members in the Chamber to please indicate to the Table staff and we will recognise you. There are four opportunities for follow-up questions and the first follow-up will be afforded to the member who posed the initial question.

With that being said, I recognise the Premier.

## 1. Mr P T de Villiers to ask Mr A R Winde, Premier:

With regard to the report of the Public Service Commission (PSC) on the appointment and further extension of the contract of the Superintendent-General (Head of Education) of the Western Cape, Mr Brian Schreuder:

Whether he has acted on the recommendations of the PSC investigation report; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and thank you very much to hon member for posing this question, but before I get to answering the actual question itself, I would like to just point out to the hon member that of course this is something that was dealt with a fairly long time ago and I know that he is a new member in this Parliament.

I would also like to probably point out to him that he must try to be his own man and not to be manipulated or used by the hon member Herron. We know that perhaps a lot of what Herron was trying to do never reached any kind of fruition and we have seen that in some of the outcome of the public services.

An HON MEMBER: You are nasty, yes.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! If you – order! Hon Premier, please take your seat.

Hon members, if you want to pose a question, please indicate to me. Interjections are allowed, but please do not drown out the speaker and please allow the member on the floor to make their submission to the House.

I recognise you, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Just some advice, hon Speaker, but in the interests of the question coming when the member was not here earlier, so I will reply to the same question again.

The Western Cape Government has received advice from the Department of Public Service and Administration. That is quite clear, the Department of Public Service and Administration, which has reaffirmed that the extension of an Education HOD, Brian Schroeder's contract, was lawful and valid.

Mr Schroeder's contract was extended for two years in 2018, based on the original advice received from the DPSA in 2017. That HODs who are employed on contract are not permanent employees and that their contracts can therefore be extended beyond the retirement age of 65, which only applies to employees permanently appointed in the public service.

However, earlier this year the Public Service Commission finalised and released a report which indicated that the appointment was irregular, without having consulted the DPSA which is the custodian of the applicable legislation. In the wake of this report we requested that the DPSA provide clarity.

A legal opinion was provided to the DPSA by the office of the Chief State Law Advisor, in which the latter concluded that Section 16(7) of the Public Service Act does not apply to HODs appointed in the public service and that they are not regarded as permanent employees.

HODs' contracts can therefore be extended beyond the retirement age, which only applies to permanent employees. This in turn means that the Western Cape Government's acting in extending the contract was not irregular. Since receiving this legal advice and in the interests of maintaining good working relationships with the PSC, I have met the Western Cape Commissioner, Mr Goosen, to discuss the matter. I welcome the positive spirit in which we were able to engage and have also addressed a letter to him in writing, outlining our next steps.

Regrettably the PSC findings that Mr Schroeder's appointment was irregular was widely reported, which has a negative effect and impact on his reputation. Mr Schroeder is currently serving out the final months of his contract between his retirement next year. He has served this province with distinction and throughout his career. I am pleased that the matter can now finally be laid to rest and Mr Schroeder's reputation be restored.

The matter has also been used to score political points and to cast aspersions on the Education Minister, the then Minister Debbie Schäfer, despite the fact that the discussion or the decision to appoint an HOD to extend an HOD's contract is taken by the Premier and not by the MEC in question, and that is in terms of Section 12 of the Public Service Act.

My office will be writing to the Western Cape Provincial Parliament to share these latest developments. Once that step has been taken I will regard the matter as finalised.

So that was the answer then and of course the answer remains the same now, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. I recognise the hon

member De Villiers.

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): Thank you, hon Speaker. The findings of the PSC in that same document is that further extension of the contract of employment of Mr Schroeder for the period of 1 April 2019 until 31 March 2021 is irregular.

So ... [Interjections.]

†'n AGB LID: U het geluister.[An HON MEMBER: You have listened.]

An HON MEMBER: Workshop.

The SPEAKER: Order, members! Hon member De Villiers.

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): So what we would like to know, hon Speaker, is I do have some experience as a teacher that students sometimes do not answer questions because they do not know it. It is just they do not know the question, understand the question, you know, and we want to know that if the further extension of the contract with Mr Schroeder is irregular and, number 3, if finding says, and I quote:

"The Premier is dutybound to approach a court to set aside the irregular administrative act of appointing Mr Schroeder." We would like to know whether the Premier did indeed approach the courts and follow through on the Commission's recommendations. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member De Villiers. Hon Premier, I am going to allow you to answer that question because there was [Interjections.] ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Exactly. He does not understand ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... order, members! There was more than one follow-up question, so I am not going to dictate how you answer it, but I will leave it to you.

The PREMIER: Thank you very, hon Speaker. I do not want to read this answer again, but no, I did not approach a court ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Why not? [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: ... and the findings are that from the Department of ....[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You were just given that answer by the ....[Interjections.]

The PREMIER: ... Public Service and Administration is that it was not irregular. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. I recognise the hon member Fry. Hon members, if you want to ask a question, please put up your hand. Please, if you do not like the response or the answer then you can have another opportunity, but you cannot drown out the speaker.

I recognise the hon member Fry.

Mr C FRY (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Thank you to the Premier for his reply. I would just like to ask, hon Speaker, to the Premier what is the Premier's approach to dealing with reports from institutions like the Public Service Commission? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much and thank you very much to hon member Fry for that question. You know, obviously we take it very serious and in this case we took the report very seriously and then engaged on it and as I said, it was unfortunate that the report was brought into the public domain without having a final process through the state legal advisor and the National Department, who holds that legislation, but of course we take the report seriously.

We did not ignore the report, we dealt with the report. Then I personally engaged with Mr Goosen on the report itself and that was when it was cleared up that in actual fact this report came out before getting the final legal opinion, and of course it does not matter what report it is, whether it is a Public Service Commission, I am busy reading here, for example, the latest stats released from Stats SA. They write reports all the time. That is a really nice report to see for members of this House. It has only just come out now. This report released, embargoed until 31 August until 10 o'clock.

If you go and read that report that is quite interesting. You go and have a look at how basic services are delivered across South Africa. There the Western Cape outperformed other provinces. All other provinces on key service delivery matrix, 39,8% of citizens in the Western Cape are receiving water services and free basic water services. 27,9% of all citizens in the Western Cape, and this is the highest in South Africa, on the number of consumer units receiving electricity services and free basic electricity services. 45,8% of the Western Cape, highest number again, of consumers receiving sewage and sanitation services and free basic services in that space, and 44,8% of the Western Cape, as the highest number, of consumers receiving solid waste management services and free solid waste management services.

So there, that is a very serious report. Obviously these reports also come out

when it talks about youth unemployment and we take that very seriously as well.

We have got to make sure that we are tackling the issues that are raised through these reports, making sure, like the PSC, that it is a legal report and that that aligns with the legal custodian of that piece of legislation, as with the case with Mr Schroeder.

If it is the youth unemployment rate we will then say what are the programmes we are going to do to try and tackle that outcome to constantly push those boundaries. We will very soon have the audit outcomes. Again, a report that comes from an external body that tells us how we are doing. We will take it very, very seriously. We do take it very, very seriously all of these reports because they help us in determining what we should be doing, for example, the crime rate, and again some of these reports are really good for us. Seeing the murder rate reducing.

The debate that this House has just had seeing rape reduced by 10%, the murder rate by 5,5%. In the LEAP areas by 5,7%. Looking at 6,6% reduction in unemployment and the lowest unemployment rate in South Africa. These are serious reports. We take them very seriously. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Is that a – are you taking your seat for the point of order or you finished answering that

question? Thank you, hon member Nkondlo, I recognise you.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Point of order, hon Speaker, to you. Why do you allow the Premier to go all other way outside of the question that is on the Order Paper?

There is a question here. It has got nothing to do with what the Premier is responding to and this question is very specific. Why is he allowed that leeway in the House?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Nkondlo. That is not a point of order, but I want to make a general comment about that. So there was a follow-up question and the follow-up question, and I listened very carefully, related to reports in general and the Premier used examples of reports, but it is not for the Chair to determine what the content of a response is. We are not here to adjudicate the responses and the content to that. We are here to ensure that the Rules are being applied and fairly applied.

With that being said, I recognise hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker, and I thank the Premier for the response. I hear the Premier, if I hear clearly the Premier is saying that Mr Schroeder is serving his final months of his contract.

Now I also want to add we were amongst those, as the ANC, to raise this

issue, but we have got the utmost respect for Mr Schroeder. He served even in the ANC Administration and served well. We have not wanted to play games with Mr Schroeder, he is a good official. We did not do that at all. Even though we have been consistently accused of doing that.

We may have disagreed with him at times, but there was no intention to undermine him, but I want to say so the Premier has stated that Mr Schroeder is serving the final months of his contract, correct, but in the reply by the MEC, and I have got those replies here, in 2022 we were told that it was a one year contract.

So must we understand or we need to understand thus from the Premier what steps have been followed by the Department of Education in the Province and by the Premier himself to extend that particular contract to this year? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Sayed. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. Obviously the hon member Sayed did not listen to what I said. I said I was replying the same answer that I gave when the question was asked previously and at that stage, I mean this is dated on 18 December 2020 as to when this reply was given and at that stage he was serving the last few months of his contract. In 2020. This is 2023, hon member Sayed. So it is long past that date and that is why, and I said in the beginning I hear the question from the member, the member is brand new, I will answer the 2020 answer that I gave and I cannot, I do not know the aspects of what he is raising now.

What I do know is that Mr Schroeder's contract was extended for two years in 2018 based on the original advice received from the Department of Public Service and Administration in 2017, that HODs who are employed on contracts are not permanent employees and that their contracts can therefore be extended beyond the retirement age of 65. He then ended his contract. I remember the hon member Sayed even standing up in this House, thanking him for his services to the citizens of this province.

So he is definitely not still an employee of this province. He has moved on to other positions and other areas, but he is not employee of this province. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier, and the last opportunity is hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Chairperson, and I thank the Premier for the response.

Chair, but we also are led to believe as well that the same Mr Schroeder was appointed into another position as a special adviser, Chief Education Specialist, Governance and Examination, which only required three years education qualification.

Now this was interpreted at the time by many to mean that the post was specifically designed for Mr Schroeder. This was now post-retirement.

Now I therefore want to check with the Premier whether there are any other former employees from that particular department who are now in the Department of Education. Those who have retired and have now returned. If so, what are the relevant details? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much and as always, hon Premier, that is a ...[intervenes]

The PREMIER: A very new question.

The SPEAKER: A new question, but I am not going to dictate how you should or should not answer it. So it is over to you.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. As the hon member Sayed knows we have 87 000 people who work for this Government and I really like to answer all questions I get given, even if they are different in the follow-ups from the original question, but I am definitely not in a position to give an answer to the hon member Sayed on that specific point and if he really would like to know that, I think he should pose that question.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon members, that brings us to the end of Question 1. We will not be dealing with Question 2 as printed on the Question Paper as moved by the Chief Whip.

We will then move on to Question 3 and I recognise the hon Minister, Minister Allen.

# 3. Mr F C Christians to ask Mr R I Allen, Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety:

Whether the identities of the unidentified people who have died in the recent taxi violence have been established; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much, hon Speaker. I would like to reply as follow: the six victims who died in a recent taxi violence have now been identified. I can confirm it is Mr K H Teoh, it is Mr Zamikhaya Kwinana, Mr Bongabi Kebeni, Mr Sibulele Zweni, Mr Makhosandile Mkhele, and Mr Aphiwe Mzayiwa. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise hon member Christians.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you, Minister, for the reply. Minister, is that the final figure? Because in the media it was 5. You now pointed out six. Was that the final figure of the people that died in the taxi violence? I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Christians. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much for this particular follow-up. I omitted actually, through you, hon Speaker, to hon members Christians, that the initial figure was five. In the last seven days that figure rose to six after a person that had injuries then succumbed to his injuries, but as things stand the figure is six people may have died as a result of the recent tax violence. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, are there any further follow-up questions? I recognise hon member Christians.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. Just another question to the Minister. Those – I mean we read about what happened. Are there any arrests being made? Is the Minister aware of any arrest that has been made for, you know, for murder, for the killings of those people. Are there any people being brought to book?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians. Hon Minister Allen.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much. Yes, there have been arrests made in terms of the taxi violence that flared up in the City of Cape Town. It ranges from arson, it ranges for malicious damage to property. However, there has not been any arrests made for the murder victims.

I can also confirm that various leads are being followed up. I am getting a weekly update from the SAPS in that regard and as soon as an arrest is affected communication will then be distributed to various media publications because we want, hon Speaker, to send a strong message that taxi violence and what we saw in our province occur, should ultimately never, never occur again. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, are there any further follow-up questions? No further follow-up questions. That brings us to the end of Question 3 as printed on the Question Paper.

We now move on to Question 4. I recognise the hon Minister, Minister Simmers.

### 4. Ms L M Maseko to ask Mr T A Simmers, Minister of Infrastructure:

With regard to partner non-profit organisations (NPOs) of the Department of Infra-structure's Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP):

(a) (i) How many partner organisations are there and (ii) what role do they play and (b) how much money has been allocated by his Department to the EPWP in the next three financial years?

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker, and through you to the member and in responding to this question I need to provide the House with the contextual background to the Extended Public Works Programme so that we understand within that space my answer to the hon member Maseko.

The programme is an initiative geared towards creating work opportunities nationwide for unskilled, semi-skilled and unemployed persons. The programme provides skills development and empowerment initiatives to contribute to sustainable economic and employment growth in communities, to construction-related development and empowerment interventions.

The EPWP is a nationwide programme that covers all spheres of Government and SOEs. Therefore the implementation of EPWP is done by municipalities and state-owned enterprises and my Department acts as the provincial coordinator, hon Speaker, for provincial and municipal implemented projects across the various sectors in the built environment industry, and as the Provincial Department of Infrastructure our role is not only therefore to properly coordinate all these sectors, but also to ensure effective oversight, to see that the jobs or the job opportunities being created and reported on, are actually real jobs that are being created.

Our programme has a budget allocation of R68 646 million, hon member. It falls under the community-based programme or EWP component within our budget of which the EWP component, and I have two branches that deals directly with this; in terms of branch Human Settlements the national grant component they receive is R2 982 million. In terms of the Public Works component, once again the national grant component, is R3 687 million which gives you a national contribution of R6 669 million in terms of my Department, but our own contribution as a Provincial Department, hon member, is the balance of 90% of the amount of R68 million is actually what we are contributing from our own funding to ensure our contribution to this programme as a department.

In terms of the two outer years, once again, I can now only reflect on our own contributions because I do not know what the National Department may or may not give in the two outer years, but what we have indicatively budgeted in terms of our own contribution to the EPWP programme as a department, in terms of the budget year 2024/2025, our only revenue contribution will be R70 382 million and year 2025/2026 will be R70 184 million.

Once again I do need to emphasise, hon member, that is the two outers are our provincial contribution and as you can hear in the current year we are already giving 90% of our own of the total amount.

In terms of the NPOs which we are partnering with and because we play a coordinative role, hon member, I will need to provide you with a comprehensive list of all the NPOs registered on the Western Cape database in terms of EPWP, noting that we play a coordinative role and an oversight role, but we do ensure that, as I stated, those that do list beneficiaries that receive the monthly stipend, that actually the beneficiaries do exist, that we make sure of because we have seen in other provinces the ghost workers, as the own National Minister has alluded to as well, but also that the NPOs themselves actually do exist, and I must say, hon member, I have over the last few months been engaging the various sectors which form EPWP and they do the sterling job.

They contribute to our focus and jobs on safety, on dignity, but above all, all of these NPO organisations share our value system as Western Cape Government. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon member Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Minister, thanks for the response. I just want to find out as we go around doing our oversight role, one of the complaints that we hear is the EPWP grant being used by some of the public reps within the municipalities as a political tool in gunning for the support. Is there any communication that has come through maybe? Are you aware of that scenario? And as a coordinator what are the systems that you are going to, or the measures that you are going to put in place to make sure that that does not happen as we move towards 2024? That it might be a problem that happens from the implementation agents, which are the municipalities? Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Maseko. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker, and once again I take the role of oversight and coordination in terms of EPWP in the Western Cape very strongly, hon member, in that context what I have done is at the national MINMEC, because this is not just a Western Cape phenomenon, it is a national phenomenon, where these allegations are being made, sometimes against councillors, irrespective which party they belong to. I need to re-emphasize across the spectrum.

So what I have done, and I have written the National Minister a formal letter last week to indicate to him that I have now visited all five our districts in the Western Cape. Irrespective which municipalities I visited within those districts, there seems to be a consistent pattern of these allegations being labelled against specific parties' councillors. Some can be substantiated, some not, and I have asked him that as I am responsible for coordination within our province, that I will be zooming into all five districts. I will be looking at the database. Once again an acknowledgement which has been made by the National Department over the last few number of months.

As much as there is a database in theory, it is the accuracy of the information that feeds into the database that is the problem, hence these allegations of the abuse of the EPWP programme as a political tool sadly in certain municipalities, also in certain wards so that the National Minister has had to concede that the database is a big issue.

In the Western Cape, what we have done over the last few years and what we have seen is the way that the architecture of the programme has been implemented to ensure a credible data set that is at least delivered on what we report through to National, is that there are district forums which culminates all the data in the district and it feeds into the provincial system.

Now I will be zoning in, hon member, into that because the municipality is the implementing agent, not me, but I am the one that must be held accountable, together with the Legislature when there are these allegations, when we do note the funding being allocated through to the implementing agent.

So that is where I currently stand. I am awaiting a response from the National Minister, but I have started engaging my staff that deal with EPWP to ensure that once we start unpacking this it must not be seen in a negative way by our municipalities because as I have stated to you and to the Standing Committee when I appeared before you, the act of accountability is taken seriously in the Western Cape and more so when there are allegations that state resources are being used and abused for political gaining.

Once again I need to reiterate irrespective who that councillor is and who the party is that governs the municipality, if there are such examples that are tangible, †nie skinderstories nie, ek wil net benadruk, agb Speaker, [not gossip, and I just want to emphasise, hon Speaker,] then I will zone in on it. Thank you, hon member.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise the hon member Marran.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks very much, hon Speaker. Through you to the MEC and first I would like to thank him for writing to the Minister in terms of allegations that have been made, politicians, councillors using that, but there are more allegations, for instance, of companies, employers, that basically employ all their workers on an EPWP contract.

So – and I want to believe, MEC, that these allegations have, and if not it is fine, but I would like to know from your side whether you are prepared to investigate the allegations of companies employing all its workers through EPWP contracts? If not, why? And if you, in terms of maybe allegations that have been received, are already investigating these particular allegations, what are the relevant details? Thanks. The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marran. Hon Minister, before you respond. I just want to remind members you have one opportunity for one follow-up question based on the initial response.

So, Minister, I am not going to dictate how you respond, but I just thought it is important that all members are reminded of the Rules. Hon Minister, over to you.

<sup>†</sup>Die MINISTER VAN INFRASTRUKTUUR: Agb Speaker, hierdie kool is sy sous werd, so ek gaan die geheel prent beantwoord vir die agb lid, deur u. [The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Speaker, this game is worth the candle, so I am going to paint the whole picture for the hon member, through you.]

Hon Speaker, once again, just to reiterate, my role and that of my Department is to play a coordinative role and oversight role in terms of the provincial and municipal implemented projects. So through you, hon Speaker, if the member is referring to what has been done in the private sector, that is beyond my ambit, but what I will be zoning in on is exactly what is within my ambit of responsibility of oversight, which is at a provincial level where there are literally no allegations of that nature so far, but the crux of the complaints and allegations stem from a municipal level, which is at the coal face at the implementation level. So that is what I will be focusing on, because as stated prior, hon Speaker, at MINMEC the Western Cape is not the only province that has tabled this issue and in all nine provinces the issue of how EPWP is implemented at municipal level and the nature of the allegations and the scale of the allegations, that is where the real problem lies, because the intention of this programme is quite noble. Noting that if you look at the Act and the process of EPWP, there is actually, when you complete your cycle it is linked, it is supposed to be linked to the Department of Labour. You are supposed to get a CV that is generated for you to assist you.

So I will be looking at all of this because we are a Provincial Government known for taking oversight seriously, following due process, but ultimately also coming up with solutions and one of those is I possibly believe zoning in on the process of the reporting line and how we can effectively zoom in on that. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, are there any further follow-up questions? No further follow-up questions. That concludes Question 4.

We now move on to Question 5. I recognise the hon Minister, Minister Mackenzie.

## 5. Mr D America to ask Mr R D Mackenzie, Minister of Mobility:

With regard to the successful mediation of the recent taxi strike:

(a) What role did his Department play in the successful mediation effort between the Provincial Government, the City of Cape Town and SANTACO and (b) what steps have been proposed or taken to ensure that a future taxi strike will not again hold our City to ransom in the same way as they did a few weeks back?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Speaker. The question from Minister – ag, sorry, from hon member America, is with regard to the mediation of the recent taxi strike. What role did this Department play in the successful mediation between Provincial Government, the City of Cape Town and SANTACO, and what steps have been proposed to be taken to ensure that a future strike will not again hold our City to ransom in the same way as they did a few weeks back?

Can I just say thank you very much, hon member America, for this question.

The Department of Mobility engaged with the industry from the first day after the strike was initiated to the meeting with our National Minister of Transport, my colleagues, the MMC of Urban Mobility and officials.

The first engagement proposed concessions to the industry subject to a peaceful 48 hours. Unfortunately there was continued violence and the planned meeting on the Sunday was postponed. However, parties met again

on Sunday and made progress on clarifying matters. Again on Monday, under difficult conditions, the Mobility team met with the industry, the National Minister of Transport and our MMC for Urban Mobility.

On Women's Day the Mobility Department supported the engagement with faith-based organisations who were concerned about the impact that the strike was having.

Throughout this time the Traffic Management Services of the Mobility Department deployed 410 officers across the province under trying conditions, with one of our vehicles being burned and an officer attacked with a hammer.

The engagement with the industry continued on Thursday and led to an agreement between SANTACO, the City of Cape Town and the Western Cape Government. The implementation of the agreement has been initiated with the technical work by the Mobility Department on the operating licence condition, setting up its first task team meeting that happened on 22 August.

There has been a three day imbizo over the last three days, arranged by the Mobility Department with the City of Cape Town and the industry stakeholders, in which progress has been made to review the operating licence conditions and to find a way to support this industry.

During these engagements the Minister of Transport raised the issue

regarding the operating licence conditions in terms of which vehicles are impounded. We have sought legal opinion on this matter, which contends that conditions imposed on the operating licences are not *ultra vires* to the national Road Traffic Act and are valid and lawful.

In addition we have been advised that the conditions imposed on operating licences in reduced penalties are consistent with the National Land Transport Act and the National Road Traffic Act. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister Mackenzie. I recognise the hon member America.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Chairperson, and the second part of the question. Chair, there was a second part to the question.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, I am not sure ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Whether he is aware that any accusations that the ANC ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please – hon member America, please take your seat. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Chairperson, can you hear me?

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, we cannot hear you.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Can you hear me now, Minister? Sorry, hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Yes, we can hear you.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Okay, I am covered. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: You are covered? Hon member America, you may continue.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you, hon Minister, for the extensive answer you provided.

It goes without saying that the ultimate victims, hon Speaker, of the taxi strike were our commuters and the residents of Cape Town.

So, hon Minister, I would like to ask you whether you think that had we had a functional rail system within the Western Cape, and in Cape Town in particular, the impact of the strike would have been less disruptive to our commuters and to our residents in the Western Cape? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, I just want to remind you, you cannot pose a question and want the Minister to express an opinion or a view, but I am still going to allow the Minister, if you so wish, to respond in whichever way you deem fit, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Speaker. I am not going to express an opinion view. I am going to share the facts.

The fact is our train system has collapsed. Today I drove, yesterday I drove through from the Plettenberg Bay Area across [Inaudible.] to the West Coast and it is heartbreaking to see our rail services, our rail lines standing empty and the amount of trucks standing idly on our road, and I think it is an important point to make in the context of the taxi strike, because the collapse of the rail services speaks to why there is such a massive road usage for taxis, for buses, because the rail service under PRASA and the rail services for freight services have collapsed and that is why people use the taxis.

So if on that particular day, or if when the strike started there was alternative transport available, like the rail services, it would have had a much lesser impact because people would have had options and people would have had choices.

People did not have a choice. People were, as we all saw they had to walk home, they had to get lifts with families and friends, and that speaks to the fact that the rail service has completely collapsed, particularly our biggest line, which is the Central Line. So I cannot give an opinion or a view of the matter, the fact is the Central Line is still not running, so people have to use the taxis because there is no other means than the bus services of getting, for example, from Kapteinsklip and Khayelitsha through to Cape Town.

So the impact of the taxi strike and the taxi strike had brought to bear what has happened and I am so happy that the National Minister has become part of this process so ...

And I am so happy that the National Minister has become part of this process so we can deal with the genesis of this problem. The genesis of this problem, the origin of this problem is the failure of what has happened in 1995, including the Ntsebeza Commission of Inquiry Report, which I will also bring to the Standing Committee when I visit the Standing Committee in the next few weeks.

It is so important to find a solution for and avert another taxi strike coming in the future, that we have to deal with the genesis and the 1995 Task Team Report drafted and originated by the National Government. So, when the Standing Committee of Parliament asked me last week about the future and the way forward, the Portfolio Committee of Parliament, I really valued the opportunity that they had given us to put this matter on the national agenda. And I appreciate the role that the Standing Committee Chairperson played because she asked for solutions. I really hope that when I appear in front of our Portfolio Committee, our Standing Committee here in Parliament, they will have a similar attitude that ten members of Parliament of different political parties had at the National Parliament. And those four hours of tape that was in front of that Parliament is worth listening to. It is worth listening to because it shows that national members of Parliament, ANC members of Parliament, raised concerns about public transport. The one MP from Mpumalanga talked about taxis stopping people every day. It boils down to what has happened since 1995 and I am so proud that the Chairperson of that Standing Committee, the ANC Chairperson of that Standing Committee of Parliament, was asking for solutions.

One of the things that I did promise them that I will do because I was not around for the last three days, is send them our Blue Dot Programme because that is what should be on the national agenda. So, that Standing Committee of National Parliament has really opened up the door for the taxi industry to finally be fixed. And one of the recommendations, hon Speaker, that I made to that Standing Committee was very clear. And I said to them we have the opportunity. We have seven months to nine months, give or take excluding Christmas and weekends away, that we have left to finish this term. And that Parliament Portfolio Committee Chairperson, and I can say in this House, I will nominate them myself for the Nobel Peace Prize on a serious note, if they can get the Blue Dot running and the National Minister was in that Committee.

The National Minister Chikunga was in that committee, where I said to the

Parliament's National Committee, the four-hour meeting is worthwhile listening to for any member of Parliament who wants to take transport forward in this country. To say to them that we have an opportunity to change the face of public transport in this country. And out of every crisis comes an opportunity. This crisis should not have happened if our colleagues in 1995, our predecessors, dealt with the problem, but it is here ...[Audio distorted.], but now let us use this opportunity and fix the minibus taxi industry and the support that they need. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, just so that you know. I have recognised hon Christians, hon Bans and hon Mvimbi. So, those are the four opportunities. Hon Christians. [Interjections.] Order, hon members.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. Just a question to the hon Minister. When there was great uncertainty, there was fake news that went to many, many people saying, the strike is not over there is another strike and that goes out. I want to know from the hon Minister what is he and his Department doing to combat this fake news because people panic, and they do not go to work. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Speaker. Yes, unfortunately, hon Christians, there was a lot of fake news. There was a lot of fake news

and bad news spreads very fast. It is not a phenomenon that is new to us. As politicians, we know you can do so much good work, but nobody will notice. If you do one thing wrong, the whole world will notice.

But what we have tried to do ...[Audio distorted.] in the morning and in the evening as the Mobility Department, my colleagues in the City of Cape Town have done the same, where we shared information from Government. The hon Premier has done the same and many of my colleagues have done the same and I certainly hope other hon members of Parliament have also done the same, to inform their constituents what the right information is. And I think that is from the Mobility Department's perspective, that is what we have done, and we will continue to do so. After every Task Team meeting that was done the last three days, we have, with the City of Cape Town, with the leadership of SANTACO, we have shared the information that has come out of that Task Team to ensure that third parties or any individuals with malintent, do share that information on our behalf. And that has consistently worked very well, and we will continue to do so.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise the hon Bans.

Ms A P BANS (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the taxi violence started because of the toxic relationship between the industry and the DA, particularly J P Smith. In the past week we have witnessed the apartheid style of arrests where drivers are woken up in the middle of the

night and arrested for outstanding warrants. One cannot stop, but to fear as to when the next strike might happen again. Therefore, my question to the hon MEC would be we would like to know, hon Speaker, we would like to know, hon Speaker – sorry. We would like to know, hon Speaker, what role is the hon MEC playing to intervene? Has this matter been discussed in the Taxi Task Team? I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bans. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you very much, hon Speaker and thank you, hon member, for that question. It is really such an important question. And, you know, I am happy. Finally, when we did that presentation to our National Parliament, that we could give clarity on what has been massive miscommunication. One, is it has nothing to do with the bylaw or the City of Cape Town. As hon members of this Legislature and members of National Parliament, it is our role to draft legislation. So, if, for example and just as an example, if the Speaker of the House calls on the Serjeant-at-Arms in the House for the inherent behaviour of a member, or any of us in this Chamber, it is not the fault of the Serjeant-at-Arms. The Serjeant-at-Arms is implementing a Rule as approved or agreed to by hon members of this Legislature or the hon Speaker. That is how it works and there was a massive misunderstanding around it.

So, the bylaw in question and I am so happy it has finally come through, and the National Minister Chikunga in her own admission, in her own letter that she sent me, and I have just responded to her letter, that she has acknowledged it is not related to the National Land Transport Act and the National Road Traffic Act, and the conditions imposed on that letter. The City of Cape Town, like any law enforcement agent, has a duty to implement the laws as they are written. Should any of us in this Chamber or any member in the National Assembly or hon Minister Chikunga herself, not like a law for whatever reason – it is too harsh, it is too soft, it is not applicable anymore, it is applicable – then we must change the law.

The role of a traffic officer, a law enforcement officer, a police officer, is to enforce the law as it is written. So, when a traffic officer stops next to a road and there is a law that says Ricardo cannot wear a blue shirt, the traffic officer cannot allow Ricardo to wear a blue shirt because the law says Ricardo must wear a red shirt. So, you cannot blame the traffic officer for enforcing the blue shirt law. If Ricardo is unhappy with the blue shirt law, he must go to Parliament ...[Audio distorted.] blue shirt law. That is how the law works.

Unfortunately, there has been a misinterpretation by various parties around the bylaw and J P Smith's law and this and that. It has nothing to do with J P Smith or J P Smith's law. The law was written in the National Assembly. It is called the National Land Transportation Act. The National Road Safety Road Traffic Act. It is not called the City of Cape Town Land Act; it is not called the City of Cape Town Road Traffic Act and I am so happy that our colleagues in the National Assembly have finally understood it because it is their law. I am so happy hon Minister Chikunga understood it because it is her law.

People are aggrieved. They do not like the law. If they do not like the operating conditions as imposed by us as the provincial regulatory entity or the Western Cape Government, then we must change the law. It has got nothing to do with J P Smith. This is the message I have managed to make clear to the National Assembly ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... and I certainly hope all of us as well [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ...based in this province will understand that clearly. The second part to the hon member's question. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: The role of a law enforcement officer is called law enforcement. They enforce the law. It is not Ricardo enforcement or Ayanda Bans enforcement or Reagan Allen enforcement. So, let us leave the names of individuals out because ... [Interjections.]

## The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ...do not enforce the law ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: I am struggling to hear the hon Minister. Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon members, there is an hon member on the floor. Now, hybrid sittings are allowed and for that reason, the hon member has the same privileges as imparted by law on that particular hon member. I am struggling to hear the hon member on the virtual platform. Can I please ask, with your indulgence, that you allow the hon Minister to make his submission. If you do not like the submission, you have an opportunity to ask questions or pose follow-up questions. It is only right and fair to the hon member that posed the initial follow-up question, to hear the response by the hon Minister. Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Speaker. So, if we do not like the law – just to conclude on such a very important question because one of the National Assembly members also asked this question – then, we do not attach a name to a law. It has got nothing to do with J P Smith. He is not a traffic officer. It has nothing to do with that. It is law enforcement officers. So, the members of the law enforcement division, of which there are hundreds of traffic officers, including provincial traffic officers [Interjections.] Ms A P BANS (ANC): On a point of order, hon Speaker.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... their responsibility is to enforce the law.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): No questions, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, you had your hand up. Is that not a follow-up question?

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): No. No questions, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you very much. Hon members, are there any further follow-up questions? Hon Bans.

Ms A P BANS (ANC): Hon Speaker, my hand was raised earlier on a point of order to the hon Minister. The question I posed to the hon MEC was about the apartheid style of arrests perpetrated by the ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable ... [Interjection.]

Ms A P BANS (ANC): ...J P Smith.

The SPEAKER: Hon member ... [Interjection.]

Ms A P BANS (ANC): He goes to ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: That, hon member, that is not a point of order. You cannot repose your question and he is trying to ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Sorry, hon Speaker. I was struggling ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: ...to justify your question or the question that you posed. I am now giving you an opportunity to ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hon Speaker, I was going to answer that ... [Inaudible.].

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, I am on the floor.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister ... [Interjection.]

Ms A P BANS (ANC): Honourable ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Sorry, sorry.

The SPEAKER: ... I am on the floor.

Ms A P BANS (ANC): Hon Speaker, okay, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Can you please mute the hon Minister. Or hon Ministers ....[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hon Speaker, I was going to ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, hon Bans, the question that you posed, the hon Minister responded to. If you want any further follow-ups, I am now providing you with another opportunity because there is still an opportunity left. Your hand was up, and you said you did not have a follow-up question. Can I just determine did you have another ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hon Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ...follow-up question?

Ms A P BANS (ANC): Hon Speaker, my hand was up then on a point of order. The question I posed to the hon MEC is about the apartheid style of arrests perpetrated by J P Smith, where he goes to people's residences and arrests them ...[Interjection.] The SPEAKER: Honourable ... [Interjection.]

Ms A P BANS (ANC): ... for traffic offences.

The SPEAKER: Hon Bans, I already ruled ...[Interjection.]

Ms A P BANS (ANC): Is this not going to institute another violence. That was my question.

The SPEAKER: ...that that is not a point of order. How the hon Minister responds is not for the Chair to adjudicate, and the Rules do not provide for that. So, you have posed the question, the hon Minister responded. If you are not happy with the response, you can ask another follow-up question or use other mechanisms, but that is not a point of order. So, if you do not have another follow-up question, I am going to recognise the last opportunity to the hon America.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hon Speaker, if I may?

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Hon Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon America, please continue.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you. Thank you, hon Speaker. Clutching onto ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Honourable ... [Interjection.]

Mr D AMERICA (DA): ... what the hon Minister ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... Speaker, if I may?

Mr D AMERICA (DA): What engagements and what role did civil society play in assisting the Department in resolving this particular question that arose three weeks ago. Thank you. This taxi strike that it was ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon America. You have posed your question. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hon Speaker, I was still answering the earlier hand of hon member Bans and you asked me. That is why I was still answering that question, but you put me down.

The SPEAKER: No, no, hon Minister. We have been struggling with your connectivity and as per the Rules, it is your responsibility ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Oh!

The SPEAKER: ...to ensure that you are in an area where you have connectivity. We ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: No, fair enough, fair enough.

The SPEAKER: The Chamber went quiet for a few minutes, and I assumed you were done. We have moved on and you have missed that opportunity. There is now another question posed to you by the hon America for you to answer.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Speaker, I have got that question from hon America. I first of all want to thank hon America for that question and our hon colleague, the Leader of Government Business, hon Premier Alan Winde, who arranged the forum with the faith-based organisations. The role of faith-based organisations is critical in any conflict. We are very privileged in this country that we have an incredible amount of faith-based organisations, mosques, churches, synagogues and any individuals who belong to any institutions of religion or spiritual organisations that they deem fit.

We really had an incredible engagement, and I cannot remember the exact number of people, but there were roughly 60 or 70 individuals in that meeting, and I cannot name them all. Unfortunately, I do not have that attendance register with me. But where they gave input and they were concerned about the wellbeing, the mental wellbeing, the process and what can be done not only from a spiritual perspective, but from a humanitarian and basic human decency perspective.

We had a long engagement that Wednesday afternoon. The meeting was led by the hon Dr Ivan Meyer, Head of Government Business, the hon Premier Alan Winde and many other of our colleagues were present. Hon Minister ...[Audio distorted.] gave a presentation on violence. Some of the questions were talked about earlier on. Some of the hon members of this House asked parliamentary questions on this particular topic. And it was going to see our faith-based organisations really playing an active role in what they normally do.

Most of us go to church on a Sunday, some on a Friday, some on a Saturday. Some do it during the week, where we talked to our religious leaders about various matters that are affecting our hearts. †Sake van die hart, [Matters of the heart,] as they say in Afrikaans. So, many of us do participate in that and they really did play a role. And I want to thank them, our religious communities, for participating and working with us in getting these matters resolved. And I think that helped a lot. It always helps when there is calm. It always helps when somebody prays for you like we did in that service, and I really want to thank them for playing a part during this taxi strike and continuing to play a part as we move forward.

But I do think that it is an important point to make just as an addition, not to

divert that when there is a warrant of arrest out for hon MEC Mitchell, hon MEC Mitchell cannot decide that the warrant of arrest can only come on a Sunday at 2 o'clock. Hon MEC Mackenzie cannot decide that a warrant of arrest must come on a Thursday at 1 o'clock. Hon member Ayanda Bans cannot decide that a warrant of arrest must come on a Tuesday at 10 past 1. The law of the country is written by the National Assembly, written by the National Prosecution Authority. So, if there are hon members of this House or anywhere, so aggrieved then they have an absolute right to change the law.

It comes to the point that I am making. If you do not like any law, change it, but you cannot tell a police officer at a police station 'do not arrest Ricardo Mackenzie because it is his birthday today'. That is not how democracies work. Do not arrest Ricardo because he is attending a funeral. Imagine they run a country like that. So, that is what needs to happen. If hon members do not like the law, they do not like how warrants of arrest are executed, they do not like how the NPA work, you are more than welcome to write to the NPA, write to National Parliament, write to the National Minister of Police, National Minister of Justice and ask them to change the law. A police officer ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): A point of order.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ...sadly they are over ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Okay.

The SPEAKER: There is a point of order. Please, hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Hon Speaker, I thought this matter, you have already ruled on. When hon member Bans brought back the question to the hon Minister, you ruled on it. The question we are on now is of hon member America and I am not sure what the relevance is of the hon Minister going back to that question when you have already ruled on it and even referring to hon member Bans because that question has passed, and you have closed on it. So, please, rule on the hon Minister and he is out of order.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, the hon member is absolutely correct. There was a question posed to you by the hon America. You are busy responding to that question. Can I please remind you that you need to speak to the question being posed and if there is anything, hon Nkondlo, if there is a deviation from that answer to the question, I will revert to Hansard and I will come back to the House if there is such need. So, hon Minister, can you please conclude your response.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I will not speak to hon Bans. I will just say, hon America, when individuals, whether they are religious individuals or not, they also have a right if they are uncomfortable with laws in the country whether they are priests, pastors, during prayers sessions or not, to approach the relevant authorities to adjust the laws, but they do not have a right to decide how to implement those laws. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, that brings us to the end of Questions for Oral Reply. The remaining questions, outstanding replies will be printed in Hansard. We now move on to Statements by Members in terms of Rule 145. I recognise the DA.

## **STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS**

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, Wills Week will take place from 11 to 15 September this year when lawyers across the country offer to draft basic wills pro bono. You can log into the website of the Law Society of South Africa and find a lawyer within your respective province and hometown. The LSSA quite aptly states the importance of having a will, quote:

"By making a will, you ensure that your assets are disposed of in accordance with your wishes after your death. This privilege is called freedom of testation."

Approximately 70% of South Africans do not have a Last Will and Testament.

Hon Speaker, a will is an economic instrument. If you pass on without a will, you forfeit any opportunity to nominate preferred guardians for your children. Your assets could land in the wrong hands because of interstate law. The settlement of your estate could be delayed. You risk family feuds if you leave no clear wishes, and you risk your partner being left with nothing.

A valid will requires the testator or testatrix being over the age of 16. A will must be signed in ink, called a 'wet signature'. The will must be signed by the testator or testatrix on each page and at the end, and the will must be witnessed by two competent, independent witnesses, both present at the same time who sign on each page and at the end of the will as well. Our personal finances are our responsibility. Let us use this opportunity to protect the interests of our loved ones and avoid unnecessary delays in the settlement of our estates. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Baartman. I recognise the ANC.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks, hon Speaker. The ANC notes the legal opinion provided by the seasoned legal advisor to the Western Cape Provincial Legislature on the proposed Provincial Powers Bill a week ago, describing the Bill as one where, and I quote:

"Spurious generalisations are made without foundation, corroboration or research backing. †Nogal [Actually] under the preamble of a Bill."

Advocate Maasdorp explained that the Bill was premised, and I quote:

"On politically loaded statements, unsubstantiated, unfounded and unreferenced, unresearched as far as the verbatim of the Bill is concerned."

The advocate went on to note that the clauses of the Bill, and again I quote:

"Emanate and are birthed by spurious observations that are made."

And that he is at pains to find any grounds on which this devolution is grounded on, on which it is based on. Except for one Advocate Bishop, we are not sure about the full names of the rest of the legal team who assisted the hon Fry in drafting this Bill. Yet, the DA wants to ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Marran, please take your seat. Hon Minister Wenger, is that a point of order?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: I do want to raise a point of order, hon Speaker, on the rule of anticipation. This matter is and there is a reasonable probability that this will be anticipated and discussed in the House within a reasonable time.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you very much for that. Hon members, that is a valid point of order. I will allow the hon member to deliver this

statement and consult Hansard and apply my mind to that particular Rule and then come back to the House. And if need be, will then inform the House and then the Hansard and the record will reflect as such. Hon Marran, you may continue.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks, hon Speaker. Except for one Advocate Bishop, we are not sure about the full names of the rest of the legal team who assisted the hon Fry in drafting this Bill, yet the DA wants to second guess Advocate Maasdorp who has the courage to put a name and face to his comments.

The ANC calls on the hon Premier and this DA-led Administration to abandon the futile exercise of this Bill. They must abandon this Bill like they abandoned the Western Cape Constitution Amendment Bills, two of them now, which saw to do away with the Environmental Commissioner. The DA's attempt of the Constitutional Amendment Bill in 2015 to do away with the Environmental Commissioner in the Provincial Constitution, failed and they had to withdraw the Bill. The DA's attempt with another Constitutional Amendment Bill during the administration, again to do away with the Environmental Commissioner, seems also to be in the fast lane to nowhere, as we have not seen or heard of that amendment again. So, my advice, hon Speaker, withdraw the Bill. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, honourable ... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marran.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It was not your fault ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore? ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It was an interjection. [Laugh]

The SPEAKER: No, no, that is a dialogue. There is a difference between interjecting and dialoguing. Hon members, I now recognise the EFF. The EFF is not in attendance. I recognise the DA.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, today I wish to highlight to vital progress this Government continues to make in housing. Last Monday, the Western Cape Premier, hon Alan Winde, the Provincial Minister, hon Tertius Simmers and Executive Mayor, Dave Swart, officiated a bricklaying event at the Ebenhaeser Housing Project in Plettenberg Bay. This project will yield a total of 1 642 housing opportunities in New Horizons on completion. A first batch of homes can be expected to be handed over before Christmas and ahead of schedule. In addition to this, hon Speaker, the Bloukrans Road Project has also been completed. The R110-million projects began construction in July 2021 and officially cleared the site end of June 2023. During this period, 120 jobs, 60 local enterprises and emerging contractor opportunities were created. But while this progress is encouraging, we must remain aware of criminals who work to undo all our progress. House invasions have taken place in Eerste River where the criminal behaviour of a few individuals has impacted the delivery of 230 units at the Forest Village Project. Shockingly, some of these individuals are repeat offenders of perpetuating and inciting the invasion of Government projects.

The Department of Infrastructure's preliminary report estimates the cost of these recent property invasions to between R2- and R3-million, and to have affected 3 751 beneficiaries. Due to the selfish actions of a few, thousands will now face further delays. Strong consequences are needed for those who would undo all of the progress this Government has made. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Maseko. I recognise GOOD.

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): Thank you, hon Speaker. The Provincial Department of Social Development has the mandate to provide services to the homeless. To the best of my knowledge, all entities providing accommodation services to the homeless, need to be registered with the Department of Social Development. These entities are expected to adhere to the norms and standards contained in the Provincial White Paper on shelters. The City of Cape Town has opted to open safe spaces in Cape Town which provide accommodation services to almost 1 000 homeless people. But unlike other providers of accommodation to the homeless, the City's safe spaces are exempt from oversight.

GOOD calls on hon Minister Fernandez to address this issue as a matter of urgency, especially in the light of the many serious complaints that have been and continue to be levelled against these safe spaces. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon de Villiers. I recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, according to the most recent Quarterly Crime Statistics released by the Western Cape Police, it is concerning when it comes to school safety. Two infants and a mentally disabled woman were among the victims. Five out of eight rapes occurred in schools and the remainder in daycare and aftercare facilities. Even more shocking, hon Speaker, is that 11 rapes were reported to the police for the year up until the June month.

Rape victims are scared for life, hon Speaker. If a grown woman is traumatised, imagine a child. The youngest rape victim was a year-old baby raped in a daycare centre in Strand. An 18-month-old was also raped by a boy that removed the child under false pretences. And what is more shocking, hon Speaker, is that a 12-year-old boy was raped by five other boys. Hon Speaker, this is concerning, and we know that these cases were reported to SAPS, but I am asking the hon Minister today, to look at compliance and negligence. When our learners are at school, they should be safe and I want the hon Minister to please investigate these cases because this is concerning, as I said. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians. I recognise the ANC.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Thank you. Thank you, hon Speaker. The ANC wishes to acknowledge the progress made by the Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa, PRASA, in efforts to recover the Central Line, an initiative that is important to realise the provision of safe, reliable, integrated, and affordable public transport. The progress made in the restoration of this vital transportation network stands as a testament to PRASA's unwavering dedication to providing efficient and accessible rail services for the communities themselves. Since the recent achievement to open up the line to Nyanga Station and also with PRASA's intervention of a temporary solution through Operation Bhekela, it has allowed a limited service to operate from the CBD to Langa and Langa to Nyanga. One of the passengers alluded to Ms Nosiswe Macamo, the Board Chairperson of PRASA, that he saves R1 000 per month whilst using the train to work.

The recovery of PRASA comes amid an intergovernmental dispute threaten by the City of Cape Town which is tirelessly working to devolve this nation's mobility enterprise. It uses transport, a public good, as a bid to its political gymnastics and in turn, places the poor and working class in hardship. We recognise the work being done in the Western Cape in terms of recovering the rail services with five rail corridors designated for recovery and eight being recovered already. It is unfortunate that the Human Settlements element of the problem remains the delay for the full recovery of this line, as the City refuses and reversed the R50-million to purchase land by the Housing Development Agency to permanently resettle more than 1 000 households.

The recovery of PRASA comes – sorry, hon Speaker. In the National Assembly's SCOPA meeting yesterday, the Chairperson hon Hlengwa, conceded that the lack of political will places the public transport and citizens of Cape Town under undue strain. The ANC welcomes the intervention ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, can you please conclude.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): ...by the leadership of PRASA and the National Department of Transport to restore the Central Line. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Nkondlo. I recognise the DA.

Ms C MURRAY (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, today, unsurprisingly, I want to focus on AGOA. The Act provides South Africa, along with other African countries, preferential access to the US market. As trade is an area of concurrent legislative competence, I have been trying my very best to engage with the Minister of Trade, Industry and Competition, Ebrahim Patel, and we need clarity in terms of the AGOA negotiations.

It is my duty, hon Speaker, to represent the people of the Western Cape and with the thousands of jobs and investments on the line in this province, it is clearly an important issue. This is about people's livelihoods. This is about putting food on the table, and it is about ensuring that families do not go hungry. That is why I am frustrated that the ANC Minister does not see the need to brief the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism as they treat us as if we have no horse in this race.

The Minister is so determined to avoid appearing before the Committee that he has even threatened the Committee with a declaration of a formal intergovernmental dispute, and this is after being invited to the Committee since May. So, instead of attending our Committee on 5 September, he would rather put us through extended uses of the Department's resources and along an elongated dispute. But, hon Speaker, I would just like to harbour on this point because you cannot declare an intergovernmental dispute with someone who is in a Standing Committee. That is not how it works. So, perhaps, he does need to chat with his legal team.

Hon Speaker, it would be much more simple, more logical, and definitely more effective for the Minister to cut a few hours out of his day and simply attend the meeting. We need him to listen to the concerns of the Western Cape and demonstrate the much-needed transparency ...[Interjection.] The SPEAKER: Hon Murray, please conclude. Alright, thank you very much. I recognise the Freedom Front Plus. The Freedom Front Plus? I will then move on to Al Jama-ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, Chapter 103 of the holy Quran, sura – al-'Asr, [*Bismillah-ir-Rahman-ir-Rahim*, Wal'asr Allah .... takes an oath by time internally [inaudible] ..... verily, mankind is at a loss. Except those who believe and those who do righteous deeds and those who help each other in truth and those who help each other in patience. Verily, Allah has spoken the truth. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Brinkhuis. I recognise the DA.

<sup>†</sup>Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Agb Speaker, die Kersseisoen is vir alle Christene, ook dié van die Morawiese Kerk, 'n wonderlike feestyd. Maar sowat vyf jaar gelede op Sondag, 30 Desember 2018, het hierdie feesatmosfeer vir die inwoners van Wupperthal verander in paniek en desperaatheid. 'n Veldbrand het na die historiese dorpie met sy karaktervolle rietdakhuise versprei. Binne 'n oomblik het 53 huise afgebrand. Ook ander historiese geboue soos die Leipoldt-huis, die skoenfabriek, die gemeenskapsaal en die pastorie het in vlamme opgegaan. Sowat 200 mense waarvan baie hulpbehoewend is, het nie net die dak bo hulle koppe nie, maar ook hulle besittings verloor.

Ongelukkig was die eienaar, die Morawiese Kerk van Suid-Afrika, se versekeringsdekking totaal ontoereikend en het die kerk nie oor die bronne beskik om die huise te herbou nie. Wetgewing en spesifiek die Openbare Finansies Bestuurswet, oftewel PFMA, het gemaak dat die staat 'n beperkte hulp kon verleen. Hierdie Provinsiale Regering, insluitend sommige individue vandag hier, het gehelp waar hulle kon veral met noodleniging en tydelike huisvesting.

Volgende maand word die laaste vier van die pragtig gerestoureerde huise deur die bouers aan hul inwoners oorhandig. Die restourasiewerk was 'n grootse poging. Baie mense het hul tyd en kundigheid tot die dorp se beskikking gestel. Erfeniskennis, 'n liggaam soos Erfenis Wes-Kaap, argitekte, bourekenaars, ingenieurs, plaaslike en ingevoerde vakmanne- en vroue, en veral 'n konstruksiefirma soos Boland Bouers verdien ons lof. Dit was 'n hoog komplekse saak om die onderskeie verhoudinge te bestuur en niks hiervan sou moontlik gewees het sonder die uiters ruim geldelike steun van die Rupertstigting nie.

Ek glo dat ek namens die Parlement en die inwoners van Wupperthal praat as ek almal bedank wat gesorg het dat Wupperthal weer uit die as kon herrys. Ek dank u.

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Hon Speaker, the Christmas season is for all Christians, also those of the Moravian Church, a wonderful festive time. But about five years ago, on Sunday 30 December 2018, this festive atmosphere changed to panic and desperation for the inhabitants of Wupperthal. A veld fire spread to the historic town with its characterful thatched roofs. Within a moment 53 houses had burnt to the ground. Also other historic buildings such as the Leipoldt house, the shoe factory, the community hall and the parsonage went up in flames. About 200 people of whom many were indigent, not only lost the roofs over their heads, but also their possessions.

Unfortunately the insurance cover of the owner, the Moravian Church of South Africa, was totally inadequate and the Church did not have the resources to rebuild the houses. Legislation and specifically the Public Finances Management Act, or PFMA, resulted in the State only being able to render limited aid. This Provincial Government, including some individuals here today, have helped where they could especially with regard to emergency relief and temporary housing.

Next month the last four beautifully restored houses are to be handed over to their owners by the builders. The restoration work was a great effort. Many people made their time and expertise available to the town. Heritage expertise, a body such as Heritage Western Cape, architects, quantity surveyors, engineers, local and foreign male and female artisans, and especially a construction firm such as Boland Bouers, deserve our praise. It was a highly complex matter to manage the various relationships and none of this would have been possible without the generous financial support of the Rupert Foundation. I believe that I am speaking for Parliament and the inhabitants of Wupperthal when I thank everyone that saw to it that Wupperthal could rise from the ashes again. I thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Van der Westhuizen. Hon members, in terms of Rule 145(6), I now give one or more hon members of the Executive an opportunity to respond to any Members Statements for not more than five minutes if they so wish. I recognise the hon Minister, Minister Maynier.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker. I wish to thank the hon Ferlon Christians for raising the issue which he did in relation to safety at our schools. And of course, I share his concerns and will undertake to follow up with my colleague, hon Minister Reagan Allen, on those specific matters and I will do that. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister Maynier. Any other hon member of the Executive who wishes to use the remaining time? If not, that brings us to the end of Members Statements. I now recognise the hon Minister, Minister Simmers.

# MOTION

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Speaker, I move the following

Motion in my name which reads as follows:

That the House, noting that the hon Marran claimed during the Sitting of the House during question time on 17 August 2023 that he had not received responses to a written question addressed to the Hon Minister Simmers and that he had to submit an oral question to obtain the information; noting that the parliamentary service indeed received the replies to the question and distributed them to the hon Marran; noting that the assertion in the House by the hon Marran that he did not receive the replies when he in fact did receive them is a flagrant contravention of Rule 59; therefore, resolves that the hon Marran unreservedly apologises for deliberately misleading the House and in his comments that negatively reflected on the integrity and dignity of an hon member of the House. I so move.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, I will provide an opportunity if political parties wish to make a declaration before putting the question to the House. No declaration? Hon Chief Whip of the Opposition, just for the record, you may.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. I think there is an error of judgment in this matter. In the Programming Committee it was agreed that hon member Marran would be asked to withdraw and apologise. Now, I do not understand why you would begin with declarations instead of confirming whether he withdraws and apologises or what. The SPEAKER: Hon members, hon Chief Whip, Deputy Chief Whip please take your seat. I afforded opportunities for political parties, if they so wish, to make a declaration. If they do not wish to then I will put the question to the House and the question to the House will give effect to the request by the motion. So, hon Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, we do want to make a declaration, but this is supposed to be after you have posed a question to hon member Marran. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: No, no. You cannot do the declaration thereafter. So, if you want to make a declaration, I am going to give you an opportunity to do so now before putting the question to the House.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, the ANC cannot support this motion because it is mere politicking by the hon Simmers. A written Question 408 was asked by hon Marran. The written question had three parts (a), (b) and (c). The hon Marran asked in his question (a) and I quote:

(a) When was the Department made aware"

And the quote:

"... of the situation in Silver Town."

This question was not answered in the written reply. The hon MEC refused to answer the question of when his Department became aware of the situation in Silver Town. The hon Marran then asked in his question (c) and again, I quote:

"What intervention measures have been put in place to assist the families."

The only answer given to this question was that, and I quote:

"The City had identified potential land to relocate the 16 families."

Our emphasis: there were no details of intervention measures. Two of the three written questions asked were therefore not answered by hon MEC Simmers in his written reply and therefore, the ANC finds this motion completely unacceptable and completely untrue. However, we have tabled our own substantive motion against the hon MEC and will be filling in the complaint with the Public Protector. The ANC does not only reject this motion ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. There is an hon member on the floor. Order!

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Seriously. Hon member Simmers does not take

this debate seriously. The fact that he laughs out aloud clearly means he does not care about the people who died in Silver Town as a result of his negligence. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): The ANC does not only reject this motion, we condemn it in the strongest possible terms. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. GOOD, do you have a declaration? Can I just for the record, hon de Villiers.

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): No, we do not have.

The SPEAKER: The ACDP?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): No.

The SPEAKER: The Freedom Front Plus? [Interjections.] Al Jama-ah? Is Al Jama-ah still online? Hon Brinkhuis? Not online. And the Democratic Alliance? Can you just on the record say that you do not have a declaration.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. No declaration from the DA.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Chief Whip. Hon members, with that, are there any objections to the motion?

An HON MEMBER: None.

An HON MEMBER: No.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. So, we will now move over to me putting the question to the House. Those in favour of the question being adopted or the motion being adopted, please say 'yes'.

Hon MEMBERS: Yes!

The SPEAKER: Those not in favour of the motion being approved, please say 'no'.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No.

Hon MEMBERS: No.

The SPEAKER: I think the 'ayes' have it. Question approved. With that being said and the question being approved, I will now afford hon Marran an opportunity to unreservedly apologise for deliberately misleading the House, and his comments that negatively reflected on the integrity and dignity of the hon member of this House. Hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks, hon Speaker. I apologise.

The SPEAKER: Can you withdraw, just for the record?

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Hon Speaker, I withdraw.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marran. Hon members, now we move on to Notices of Motion in terms of Rule 151. In terms of Rule 151, all Notices of Motion by hon members are required to be delivered to the Secretary for placing on the Order Paper. These motions have been duly submitted and are published on the Order Paper below the line.

## **MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the continued lack of service delivery to the townships of the Western Cape, as it relates to refuse removal and blocked sewage drains.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): I give notice that I shall move:

That this House resolves to nominate Derek Watts for the National Order of Ikhamanga for his excellent work and lifelong commitment to the field of journalism.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the water crisis in Matzikama Municipality.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the plan of action of the new Covid variant, Eris, as the Western Cape has the for highest number of confirmed cases. Ms A P BANS (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates rising numbers of gangsterism in Cape Town and what the local government is doing about it.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the City of Cape Town's plans to sue the SA National Taxi Council (SANTACO) for damages during the eight-day stay away earlier this month.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The SPEAKER: We move on to Motions without Notice in terms of Rule 150. I would like to inform you that in terms of Standing Rule 150 pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolence and congratulatory were submitted to the Programming Authority prior to this plenary on 29 August 2023. Hon members are also reminded that the Motions without Notice pertaining to congratulatory and condolence, will not be allowed in this Sitting that have not been processed by the Programming Authority. I have been informed that in the Programming Authority meeting on 29 August 2023, political parties did submit the names of the hon members in the desired order of speaking and who had wished to move a Motion without Notice in this Sitting of the House. I will therefore, just for noting and for the purposes of the Minutes, call out the hon members whose names have accordingly been submitted and approved.

The following hon members' motions have been approved by the Programming Authority as follows: hon F C Christians, hon G Bosman, hon P Marran, hon M Kama, hon M C Dugmore, hon A P Bans.

# **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Wayde van Niekerk for qualifying for the 400 metre final at the World Athletics Championships currently being held in Budapest (*News24*, Simnikiwe Xabanisa 24 August 2023); notes that he set a world and Olympic record for the 400 metre men's race at the 2016 Olympics; notes that he sadly suffered a career-ending injury to his knee in 2017 while playing in a celebrity rugby match; notes that this was a serious injury and he faced delicate surgery to repair his knee; notes that his recovery from the injury has been slow but steady; notes that Van Niekerk has proven that he is tenacious in realising his vision and has been hard at work to regain his world-record form; notes

that he has had a steady build-up to the World Championship by competing in races where he has done well; notes that he is currently the fastest man in the 400 metres for 2023; and our prayers are with him to win the 400 metre final.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): I move without notice:

That the House sends its condolences to the friends and family of Theuns Stofberg; notes that Theuns represented the Free State, the then Northern Transvaal (now known as the Bulls) and the Western Province, as well as playing for the Springboks between 1976 and 1984; notes that he also occasionally captained the Springboks team; notes that, as a world-class flank, he was known for his speed and strength; further notes that he made a tremendous impact on rugby in our country and he will be greatly missed; and may he forever rest in peace.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates South Africa's three Pleistocene sites, the Diepkloof Rock Shelter in Piketberg, Western Cape, the Pinnacle Point Site Complex in Mossel Bay, Western Cape, and Sibhudu Cave in Durban, KwaZulu-Natal, for nomination for World Heritage status; and notes that the nomination of these sites presents an exceptional example of inter-provincial cooperation and collaboration and will showcase South Africa's unique and precious heritage on the global stage.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes the passing away of former Springbok captain, Marthinus Theunis Steyn 'Theuns' Stofberg; notes that Theuns was involved in a crash that happened on the R304 outside Stellenbosch at around 19:00 on Monday night; notes that he will always be remembered for his contribution to rugby in the province and at national level; and conveys heartfelt condolences to his family and friends.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I move without notice:

That the House notes with sadness the passing away of veteran journalist and legendary anchor, Derek Watts; notes that Derek passed away on Tuesday morning, 22 August 2023, after a battle against cancer; and extends condolences and sends a message of strength to his family and friends.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms A P BANS (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes the death of 21-year-old Jayden Adams whose lifeless body was discovered between a sports field and a primary school in Bonteheuwel on 23 August 2023; and extends condolences and sends a message of strength to her family and friends.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I now put the motions duly submitted and approved by the Programming Authority to the House. Are there any objections? There are no objections, agreed to. The motions will appear in the Minutes of the proceedings and in Hansard, in each individual hon member's name as if the hon member had read them out aloud.

I will now afford the opportunity to the hon members to move Motions without Notice as per Standing Rule of 150(2)(d). This could also be Motions without Notice which were not approved in the Programming Authority meeting. Hon members, I wish to remind you that 30 minutes as per Standing Rule 150(2)(d) will start now. I recognise the hon Chief Whip of the Majority Party. The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House today remembers the life and legacy of Lorraine Botha on the one-year anniversary of her death; on 31 August 2022, Lorraine passed in the line of duty. To this day, her passing has left an undeniable void, not only in the hearts of her colleagues on the 5<sup>th</sup> floor, but also in corridors and offices across this Legislature. Lorraine was a remarkable woman, leader, and public servant whose values of service, humility and cooperation continues to serve as an example to each of us in this House. Lorraine served as an hon member of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament for eight years and during her time, she served the people of the Western Cape and her constituents with distinction and integrity. Our dear Lorraine, you are still sorely missed and dearly loved by all of us who remain behind. †Rus in ewige vrede ons dierbare vriendin en kollega. [Rest in eternal peace, our dear friend and colleague]. I so move, hon Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Chief Whip. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is no objection, motion agreed to. I recognise the hon Kaizer-Philander. Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the announcement of hon Premier Alan Winde as DA's Western Cape Premier candidate for the 2024 elections. This nomination speaks volumes of hon Premier Winde's leadership ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER (DA):

...dedication and commitment to serving the people of the Western Cape. This nomination also highlights the DA's faith and confidence in him to guide the province for the upcoming five years. Despite challenges such as the COVID-19 pandemic ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER (DA):

...during the Premier's first few years in office, he led the province with integrity, innovation, and strong leadership. Through the implementation of the Western Cape Safety Plan in 2020, the province saw ...[Interjections.] The SPEAKER: Order!

## Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER (DA):

...the consistent and steady reduction of violent crime and we have also seen successes in job creation with 54 000 jobs being created in the last Quarter, economic progress, and the launch of the Growth for Jobs strategy. That the House further notes that despite regression in other parts of South Africa, the Western Cape continues to thrive as an example of law and order, economic progress, and good governance. Hon Speaker, I so move. [Applause]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Kaizer-Philander. Hon members, are there any objections ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Hon MEMBERS: No!

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections ... [Interjections.]

Hon MEMBERS: Yes!

Hon MEMBERS: No!

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes, object!

An HON MEMBER: No objection. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I did not even put the question yet. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Hon MEMBERS: Yes!

Hon MEMBERS: No!

The SPEAKER: There is an objection and motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, I hereby move without notice:

That the House notes Cape Town Mayor Geordin Hill-Lewis' announcement of his first Mayor's Science and Innovation Fair to be held on Saturday, 14 October 2023; notes the fair seeks scientific concepts and designs that address challenges our societies face on a daily basis; notes that this is one of the projects through which the City of Cape Town encourages creativity, science, innovation and forward thinking from young minds; and this House calls on all Capetonian learners in Grades 8 to 11 to enter this exciting initiative before the deadline of 2 October 2023. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Baartman. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: No objection.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, I object.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise the hon Fry.

Mr C FRY (DA): Hon Speaker, on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, I move without notice:

That this House cautiously welcomes national Minister of Electricity Kgoshientso Ramokgopa's agreement to brief the Ad-hoc Committee on energy crisis in September of this year on the impact of the energy crisis on the Western Cape as his office has so indicated. We should further note that this vital briefing has been postponed on numerous separate occasions and should express its profound hope that the Minister will honour his commitment in the interests of the people of the Western Cape. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Fry. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Hon MEMBERS: No! None!

The SPEAKER: There is no objection, and the motion ...[Laugh] ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No objection.

The SPEAKER: Was there an objection? My apologies, hon members, there is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Kaizer-Philander.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER (DA): Thank you ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes recent reports that President Cyril Ramaphosa allegedly snubbed Indian Prime Minister Narendra Modi upon his arrival to the BRICS Summit held in Johannesburg last week. Notes that President Ramaphosa's warm welcome of Chinese President Xi Jinping reportedly ruffled the feathers of the Indian Prime Minister ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER (DA):

...with the *Daily Maverick* report suggesting that Prime Minister Modi refused to leave his plane "because the South African Government had only sent a Cabinet Minister to officially welcome him". President Ramaphosa's reception of the President Xi, including conferring the Order of South Africa on him, highlights how South Africa is continuing its cozy relationship with the Chinese Government. Notes that while China may be South Africa's largest ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

#### Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER (DA):

...single-county trading partner ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

### Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER (DA):

...the relationship is not always based on benefaction as our trade deficit with China stood at over R170-billion last year. Further notes that India is South Africa's second largest BRICS trading partner and in 2022, India accounted for 4,5% of South Africa's exports. Notes that it is unfortunate that President Ramaphosa chose to elevate South Africa's relationship with China over an equally important trade relationship with India. I so move, hon Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Kaizer-Philander. [Interjections.] Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: Object.

### An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise the hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. The City of Cape Town also has a good relationship with the Chinese Government, by the way. [Interjections.] Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with grave concern the rising incidence of inappropriate conduct by teachers towards school children in our province. We call upon all members of this House, on both sides of the House, to join hands across party lines in condemning such behaviour unequivocally. We urge the provincial administration to take swift and decisive action by initiating an in-depth inquiry into these disturbing incidents. Let us unite by sending a clear message that such behaviour will not be tolerated I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Sayed. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Objection ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No!

An HON MEMBER: ...towards this motion.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Bans.

Ms A P BANS (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, on behalf of the ANC ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order, hon members. There is an hon member on the floor.

Ms A P BANS (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. On behalf of the ANC, I move without notice:

That the House notes the alarming rise of scammers within the Cape Town's business landscape masquerading as health officials. These fraudulent activities jeopardize public trust and safety. We earnestly request the Provincial Government to take immediate action by alerting citizens about these scams through public awareness campaigns and advocating for stricter penalties against such deceitful practices. I so move.

#### [Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bans. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Hon MEMBERS: No.

The SPEAKER: There is no objection and motion is agreed to. I recognise the hon Marran. Hon Marran?

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks, hon Speaker. On behalf of the Congress movement, the African National Congress, I move without notice:

That the House extends our heartfelt gratitude to the local contractors and artisans in Hanover Park who have joined hands with the non-profit organization Gift of the Givers. Their collaborative efforts in aiding residents affected by the recent storm's property damage are truly commendable. Their selflessness, dedication, and swift action are shining examples of community spirit and resilience. In times of need, they have demonstrated the power of unity and kindness, showing that compassion knows no boundaries. However, it is disheartening to observe the glaring contrast in responses to crises based on socioeconomic factors. The lack of prompt action by the DA in addressing the situation underscores systemic inequalities. The swiftness of their response often seems to be influenced by the demographics of the affected area. It is essential that political leaders rise above such biases and uphold their duty to serve all constituents equitably, irrespective of their background. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marran. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Hon MEMBERS: No!

Hon MEMBERS: Objection.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Mvimbi. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Just like the ANC.

An HON MEMBER: Ja, we have the ANC.

An HON MEMBER: You are always losing your way.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.] Hon Mvimbi? [Interjections.] I am going to, in the interest of time, continue because I cannot see hon Mvimbi. Hon Mvimbi is online, not responding, so I am going to move on to hon Sayed. I will come back to hon Mvimbi if there is time.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and calls on the Western Cape Education Department to urgently intervene in the following matters at the Delft North Primary School: the school's alleged unfair practices in awarding the uniform contract to a company that is not within the community, without giving local seamstresses a chance to compete. The school's discriminatory practices in singling out a child for wearing a uniform made by a local seamstress. The allegations that the school hired out a venue to a gang boss – yes, a gang boss – for a fundraiser without the necessary permits or safety measures in place. The school's alleged harassment of a parent for placing the school badge on her grandson's jersey. Further notes that the above matters, if true, constitute unfair practices and abuse of learners and laments the lack of decisive action taken by the WCED to address these concerns; and calls on the hon MEC and WCED to conduct an urgent investigation into these allegations and to take appropriate action if need be. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Sayed. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Hon MEMBERS: Object! Yes!

### An HON MEMBER: No!

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. On behalf of the ACDP, I move without notice:

That this House notes that some learners residing in Mitchells Plain have to travel outside of Mitchells Plain to attend schools. This concern is not to be confused with learners who attend schools out of Mitchells Plain out of their own free will and upon guidance from their parents. Notes that the concerns are for learners who have applied for admission in Mitchells Plain schools only to be placed by the WCED in schools outside of Mitchells Plain. In some instances, the schools are in walking distance of the homes of learners. This, while learners outside of Mitchells Plain are placed in Mitchells Plain schools. Further notes that there is an economical challenge to parents who have to pay for transport to schools. There is also the fear that learners who cannot be placed in Mitchells Plain schools become school dropouts. This situation is not unique to Mitchells Plain, but it is evident in other communities as well. Calls for the correction and rehabilitation of this prevailing condition at our schools. I so move. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Hon MEMBERS: Objection! Yes.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now go back to hon Mvimbi. Hon Mvimbi, can you hear me? Hon Mvimbi? Hon Mvimbi? Alright, hon Mvimbi is not online, and I cannot continue waiting any longer. Hon members, that concludes Motions without Notice, and that also concludes the business of the day. The Secretary will now end the meeting and all hon members will be exited from this Sitting. Hon members, the House is now adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:30.