

---

THURSDAY, 31 AUGUST 2017

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p**

The SPEAKER: Please be seated.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let us welcome Fritz here. †Fritz, ons verwelkom jou hoor. [Fritz, we welcome you, you hear.]

An HON MEMBER: Hello Fritz! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Good afternoon hon members. Welcome to our guests in the gallery. I would like to take this opportunity to welcoming you to the sitting of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. Please be guided by the rules of the gallery that you are not allowed to participate in the proceedings in the

form of hand-clapping or interjection. We trust that you will enjoy the sitting with us.

Before I call on the first speaker to address the House, I would like to provide the following guidance, as a reminder to all members on the applicable rules, conventions and practices governing debate and engagement in this House. This is important because from the recent debates, as presiding officers we have had to deal with conduct that leaves much to be desired and is threatening the reputation of this House as a place of decorum where robust, yet orderly debates are conducted.

As far as the Rules of debate and conduct in the House are concerned, I wish to remind members of the following: interjections are allowed but senseless interjections and running commentary do not add any value to the debate and will be reprimanded and, if the behaviour continues, sanctioned accordingly in terms of the Rules.

When speaking, members must please stand in their places and address the Chair. Drowning out of a member speaking will not be allowed. The member speaking can rely on the protection of the Chair who will intervene if and when deemed necessary. Allegations around parliamentary language will be dealt with on their merits, taking into account the context in which the alleged offensive words were used. Statements and words reflecting negatively on the integrity and honour of another member will not be allowed.

In other words a member may not use words imputing improper or unworthy motives, dishonesty, hypocrisy or want of sincerity to fellow members or refer to them in a contemptuous or derogatory way. Racist remarks either in speeches or by way of interjections are out of order and will not be tolerated. Unruly behaviour of whatever nature compromising the dignity and decorum of this House will be checked.

I wish to reiterate what we have said in the House on many occasions previously. The Presiding Officers do not intend stifling robust debate and unduly interfere in the workings of Parliament or from the Chair in any way, but we do expect members to conduct themselves with dignity and decorum and within the parameters of the rules.

I thank you.

The PREMIER: Hear-hear!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So you have a plan somewhere there, it seems.

An HON MEMBER: Ja. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I recognise the Chief Whip. [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daar is 'n plan daar.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: There is a plan there.]

(Notice of motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 198, precedence be given to the subject for discussion please.

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are no objections. Agreed to.

The next item on the Order Paper is the Subject for Discussion in the name of the hon member K E Magaxa as printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon member Magaxa.

**(SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION)**

Violation of people's socio-economic rights in the Western Cape

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you Madam Speaker. Let me take this opportunity to welcome the people in the gallery, of which many have their socio-economic rights violated under the watch of this DA-led Government.

The equality clause in the Bill of Rights states that: "Equality includes the full and equal enjoyment of all rights and freedoms." However, these rights are at times not protected and / or promoted in the working environment.

The women and people with disabilities are often at the receiving end of employment opportunities or positions of power and influence, especially in the Western Cape.

In the past I argued that racism is institutionalised in the Western Cape. The continued failure of the DA-led administration to reform apartheid spatial planning is an obstacle to employment and economic development and work opportunities for the poor.

It is by no mistake that many poor communities are home to socio-economic challenges like drugs, serious crime, hopelessness associated with substance abuse, gang violence, unemployment, abject poverty and inequality. For as long as the DA-led Government is pasting-over these social ills and pay lip service to communities, there is no hope for the poor in this province. How can there be hope when the head of the Provincial Government, honourable Premier Helen Zille, has been stripped of most of her powers by her own political party, but has an audacity to cling onto her position as the Premier for the sake of money. [Interjection.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Speak for yourself.

Mr K E MAGAXA: In fact the DA-led Government is guilty of violating people's socio-economic rights; the evidence... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members. Hon member Magaxa, kindly take

your seat. Premier, are you rising on a point of order?

The PREMIER: Yes, I am. I am rising on Rule 57, which says: “No-one may use unbecoming language”, and you have just spelt out... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: What is unbecoming now?

The SPEAKER: Order please, members, there is a speaker on the floor.

The PREMIER: You have just spelt out what unbecoming language is...

Ms P MAKELENI: Why do you not... [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: ...and it is my submission that the hon member Magaxa has made himself guilty thereof. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You must answer... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you Madam Premier.

An HON MEMBER: You have heard the statement. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: To the members, order please, we have another speaker on the floor. Hon member Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you Madam Speaker, it is very clearly referring to offensive language. There was no offensive language from the side of hon member Magaxa.

The SPEAKER: Colleagues, I have noted both the Premier and the Chief Whip's input. I will refer to Hansard and I will revert to the House in need, thank you. You may proceed, hon member Magaxa.

An HON MEMBER: Thank you Madam Speaker.

Mr K E MAGAXA: In fact, Madam Speaker, the DA-led Government is guilty of violating people's socio-economic rights and the evidence of this is in the open for everyone to see. Although Zille's Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry report and recommendation in 2014 ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Hon member Magaxa, if you are - may I address you; it is the hon Premier. You referred to Zille. We are all hon members in the House please, and let us refrain from "he's and she's", let's remain honourable and manage ourselves with dignity. Thank you. You may proceed.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Madam Speaker, I was referring to the name actually of the Commission. It was called like that way. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No, no, no.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Magaxa, kindly take your seat.

Mr K E MAGAXA: But it is fine, I understand.

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat. Chief Whip Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: There was no commission called the Zille Commission of Inquiry.

An HON MEMBER: Ja, exactly. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Magaxa, I think there is a point of clarity. There was no Zille Commission. May we now proceed without any reference to that going forward? Thank you.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you Madam Speaker. Although the Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry Report and Recommendations in 2014 promised to reduce crime, nothing has been achieved.

An HON MEMBER: Why does your Minister not sign the MOU?

Mr K E MAGAXA: The report issued in August 2017 only concentrated on the work of the detectives, but was silent of other crucial interventions such as installation of CCTV cameras that are not working in communities such as Khayelitsha and Philippi and many of the poor communities their quantity



and whether they are operational or not; in Khayelitsha, nothing. They are always non-operational. In fact death happened next to the camera and it cannot give us who killed that particular individual. It is these failures by the DA to deal with crime that ensures Cape Town is among the most unsafe cities... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Sorry hon member Magaxa, there is a point of order. [Interjections.]

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you Madam Speaker, I would like to know if the hon member will take a question.

An HON MEMBER: Sit down! [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Really, do not waste our time.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Magaxa, there was a request, will you take a question?

Mr K E MAGAXA: After I have finished.

The SPEAKER: Okay the member is not prepared to take a question.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I welcome that.

The SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes. I know it is painful a bit. It is these failures by the DA to deal with crime that ensures Cape Town is among the most unsafe cities in the world, the murder and gang capital of South Africa.

Mr D JOSEPH: The ANC.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The housing crises in many informal settlements like Imizamo Yethu, Masiphumelele and Vrygrond near affluent areas all points to the DA-led administration's failure to build integrated and affordable human settlement with social housing.

The DA often finds reasons to throw people out of the periphery of the town, away from job opportunities, economic activities and development. That is what apartheid social engineering was all about. The DA happily still perpetuates this unjust spatial regime - the DA's classic "influx control of a special type".

According to Stats South Africa's mid-year population estimates of 2017 the Western Cape is home to about 6.5 million people, which constitute 11.5% of the national population. This province reportedly has the highest life expectancy at birth over time.

It was reported in 2015 that there is no longer a guarantee to find

employment in the Western Cape. The unemployment rate was actually higher in that year than the rest of the other poorer provinces. Here in the Western Cape under the DA-led Government the workforce is racially dominated by White males in top - despite the Government led by a woman - and senior management levels of employment. This is laid bare by the Commission for Employment Equity Report for the last few years. It clearly shows that the racial supremacy of the White male dominated labour market system is still intact and the status quo does not seem to change...

The PREMIER: The private sector.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...with a manager at the top of this whole thing, who is hon Helen Zille. This report for 2016/17 reveals that according to Stats South Africa, the Economically Active Population, Coloureds are about 49%, followed by Africans at 36% and then Whites at almost 15%, whereas the top management level is dominated by the White group at almost 77%. The rich get richer... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon member Magaxa, kindly take your seat.

An HON MEMBER: No.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: They just want the black votes. You just want the black votes.

The SPEAKER: Premier, are you raising on a point of order?

Ms M N GILLION: They do not care.

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Julle gee nie om nie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: You do not care.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. There is a speaker on the floor.

The PREMIER: May I ask for your ruling please under Rule 57.

[Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Laat ons gou luister, laat ons hoor!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let us listen quickly, let us hear!]

The PREMIER: Is it unbecoming to mislead this House because the hon member Magaxa has referred to a report that is predominantly measuring the private sector and I have no management control over the private sector. So I believe it is unbecoming to mislead this House. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The PREMIER: ...under Rule 57. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you Premier. [Interjections.] Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, this is a political debate.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes.

Mr P UYS: I am sure members can make their input... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Yes.

Mr P UYS: ...and of course there will be opportunity to respond to that.  
[Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Yes. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Uys. [Interjections.] Members, I provided the House with guidance at the beginning. I do not want to stifle debate in the interest of robust debate. There are political points which are debating points and points of clarity and then there are points of order. Unfortunately Madam Premier, I cannot talk to the content of the report whether it related to the private sector or to Government and I think when the next speaker comes up if I could give you guidance, that might be the way to deal with it. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Yes. She is wasting time here.

The SPEAKER: So that is a debating point. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: She is wasting time.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, let us just respect each other and play nicely like we did last week and we will get through this. [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: She was not here.

The SPEAKER: You may proceed, hon member Magaxa. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you Madam Speaker. By the way the Provincial Government is worse than that.

The PREMIER: It is not.

Mr K E MAGAXA: This province still tops the chart when it comes to the professionally qualified level White group at over 47%. In contrast Coloured and African groups are at almost 30% and 23% respectively. At the skilled technical level the Coloured group at almost 40% is followed by Africans at 30%, and the White group at 25%.

The poor get poorer. The workforce at unskilled level, the African group is at over 60%, followed by the Coloured group at over 36%, whereas their White counterparts are at a mere 1%. In George Orwell's terms, "some

animals are more equal than others...” especially those white animals.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The most vulnerable groups of focus... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...women and people with disabilities...

The SPEAKER: Order please hon member Magaxa. Hon member Magaxa, kindly take your seat. Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Meyer, if you could take your seat. The Chief Whip was on the floor. Chief Whip Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Was the hon member referring to any members of this House?

Ms M N GILLION: Read the Rules.

Mr S G TYATYAM: No! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you Chief Whip.

An HON MEMBER: Sit down!

The SPEAKER: I will - hon member Magaxa, a question has been posed. Were you referring to members in this House? [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: †Haibo! [No way!] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: But I am going to go back to my guidance notes where I have said racist remarks either in speeches... [Interjections.]

Hold on! Allow me to speak please, hon members. Racist remarks either in speeches or by way of interjections are out of order. Let us try and not reduce this to less than what it should be. It is an important topic. [Interjections.]

The Deputy Chief Whip.

Ms M N GILLION: What is the Rule number? [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: No thank you, thank you for the opportunity, Madam Speaker. It is ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, there is a speaker on the floor.

Mr D JOSEPH: It is unacceptable to call White people animals. It is



unacceptable in this democracy. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No! No! Sit down, please! [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: It is unacceptable.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa. Will you clarify, and you may proceed. Were you referring to animals or to members or to individuals?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Madam Speaker, the last time the book written by George Orwell does not talk about humans. It is animals that are there. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Unless because of the Christian education they failed to read that book.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, you have a script there, you are doing well. Please stick to your script. [Interjections.] Is it *Animal Farm*?

Mr K E MAGAXA: The most vulnerable groups of focus, women, people with disabilities remain under-represented across almost all levels in this province. Even though this province is led by a woman, almost all provincial departments have no instruments to ensure that women emancipation in the

economy and work-world – not to even speak of the public employment environment. These are the structural deficiencies of our local economy that can be traced from these abnormalities, amongst others. The bigger challenge is unemployment of the youth in this particular province. Take into consideration that this Provincial Government refuses to work with the National Youth Council and they are refusing to empower young people and that is how they deprive our youth of that empowerment and in transformation of their socio-economic situation. Thank you Chairperson. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Lennit Max is in the House. [Interjections.]

†Me S W DAVIDS: Hene, nè! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Ms S W DAVIDS: Oh, my word, hey! [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members! Let us cooperate. I undertook that I would protect any speaker on the floor, in my guidance, let us manage that. I now see the honourable the Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Speaker, thank you very much. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Order please. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Premier, Cabinet colleagues; members of the House, ladies and gentlemen. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja, members of the conduct committee.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I would like to thank the Leader of the Opposition very much for giving us an opportunity to show how well the Western Cape is doing compared to National Government and other ANC-controlled provinces. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Speaker, I am not only pleased but equally puzzled as to why... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Please stay in your province.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...why would this member ask for a debate on a topic that his party and his Government is so vulnerable on. [Interjections.] Why on earth would you choose to address when you live in a glass house? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Speaker, just over a week ago the Statistician-General Pali Lehohla released a damning report showing glaring failures of the ANC Government. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: The conduct committee.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now according to this report and I quote, which is the poverty trends in South Africa... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: The One and Only.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: According to new data released by Stats SA, poverty is on the rise in South Africa.

An HON MEMBER: You are running away from... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The latest Poverty Trends in South Africa Report shows that despite the general decline in poverty between 2006 and 2011... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Where is the relevance?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...poverty levels in South Africa rose in 2015. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, Minister Madikizela, kindly take your seat. Hon member Davids that question - if you were to get a response would put you in a very difficult situation. [Laughter.] So I am asking you to cooperate please. I am sorry. Thank you. Now I am asking you to cooperate. Thank you. [Interjections.] Please, please kindly allow the Minister to speak, thank you. You may proceed, hon Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon member Davids, please first pay R81 000 that you owe this Parliament. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Please talk to the Speaker.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now more than half of South Africans were poor in 2015... [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: The One and Only. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...with poverty head-count increasing... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...with poverty head-count increasing to 55.5% from a serious low of 52.3% in 2011. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: And the tender... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, Minister Madikizela...

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The figures are calculated...  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela, kindly take your seat. Chief Whip, hon member Mnqasela was on his feet, if I could...

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, there is just a constant running commentary from hon member Davids and others on the other side here.  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Are you done now? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mnqasela.

Ms M N GILLION: Give the Rule number.

The SPEAKER: Hold on. Take your seat, kindly, Minister Madikizela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, just the courtesy, Rule 39, it does not

matter how much you love or hate a person, but let us just be honourable in this House. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: It is your leader *mos*.

An HON MEMBER: Ja, you are done.

Ms M N GILLION: That is *mos* your leader. [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: No, it does not matter, we are hon members and Madam Speaker, I am only appealing for your guidance. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mngqasela. Hon members, may I address you all, Rule 39 says a member may not interrupt another member who is speaking except to call attention to a point of order or a question of privilege. Now all the commentary that I have heard is actually drowning out the speaker. From Rule 39 I go to Rule 41, which says: "Order must be maintained." If order is not maintained, hon members, I am going to go to Rule 44, which is going to order a member to withdraw if you don't cooperate with the guidance that was provided. There is interjection and then there is something completely unrelated that is not even relevant to the topic at hand and I would appeal to you for your cooperation please. Thank you. You may proceed hon Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you Madam Speaker.

These figures are calculated using the upper-band poverty line of 992 per person per month in 2015 prices. This translates, Madam Speaker, into a whopping over 30.4 million South Africans who are now living under poverty under the ANC Government. [Interjections.]

Now there is a saying... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: There is a saying that says...

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...if you tell a lie repeatedly you end up repeating, you end up believing your own lies.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now let me come to...  
[Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: They are talking from experience.



Ms S W DAVIDS: ...Talk of experience.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now let me come to the real figures in terms of employment stats in the Western Cape. 95% of the Western Cape employees are from designated groups as defined by the Employment Equity Act - not what we have heard on that side. This is compared to 91.8% of economically active population being from designated group. Now let us look at gender again. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Top management...

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: We heard untruths from that side. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Minister Madikizela, kindly take your seat. Hon member Dijana, that is completely inappropriate, launching an attack and I do not know who has provoked you. I could not see that but members, I am going to go to Rule 44 and I am going to ask you to withdraw from the Chamber for failing to cooperate. Dignity and decorum is one thing. Being completely disruptive at the cost of just drowning out the speaker to make interjections and points that are completely irrelevant is completely inappropriate, so can I please request your cooperation. You may proceed, hon Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you Madam Speaker.

Now let us look at the gender. 67.3% of the Western Cape employees are female, Madam Speaker, compared to 45.7% of the economically active population. Now if you look at, if we exclude... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Can you sound like a leader, because [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: If we exclude White women, Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...from this equation as opposed to use the legal definition of designated groups, 83.4% of the Western Cape staff are black, while 85.1% of the economically active population are black as well. Now these are real figures in terms of the Western Cape employment, not what we have heard from that side. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Top management.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now Madam Speaker, since the DA took over this Government we have made education our number one priority. Now let us compare the stats here. The ANC in its eight year tenure since 2001 and 2009 built only 34 schools - 34 schools. Now let us compare those stats. Now the DA on the other hand built a whopping 118

schools... [Interjections.] [Applause.] ...including replacement schools...

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...in its eight year tenure in Government... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...between 2009 and 2017.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Sorry Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Madikizela, kindly take your seat please.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Is it parliamentary for the hon Premier to say to me I must shut-up. Is it parliamentary, Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: I have not heard that. Hon member Davids if you could take your seat I would request that. Madam Premier, may I address you. A statement has been made, did you indeed ask the hon member Davids...

The PREMIER: I vocalised nothing. I vocalised nothing. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay, the Premier said she has not vocalised. I have to

accept the Premier's word. May we now proceed. I was looking to the member, I could not say, I never heard and I have asked the Premier, in this House we act in good faith. I have asked the Premier: "Did you indeed say that" and the Premier said she did not vocalise that. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: I vocalised nothing. I moved my lips but I did not vocalise. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: So I have to accept that the Premier said she has moved her lips and she did not say anything. Excuse me, hon member Dugmore.

Mr M G E WILEY: Could you explain why you are not... [Inaudible.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Chairperson, Madam Speaker, could I just address you on this matter?

The SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Would it be possible to ask that we get video footage of exactly the mouth movements, which clearly indicated that she told the hon member to shut up, because she might not have vocalised it, but she clearly, so could we get camera footage and could we have an investigation.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, your request is noted, but we report, everything is referred in Hansard and if I were to bring some of the video

footage of what actually happens in this House we would have a little bit more than mouthing-off. So the record, the official record is Hansard. I will however, go to the visual and I will reflect on it and I will come back to this House if required. Hon member Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Madam Speaker, may I address you?

The SPEAKER: Yes of course, you may.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Madam Speaker, I lost respect for this hon Premier and I do not think that is the way for a first lady of the province to behave. She is rude. She is a rude person. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Davids, sorry. [Interjections.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: She is a rude person.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Davids that is not... Madam Premier, kindly take your seat. Hon member Davids, that is not a point of order. You are expressing yourself and it is an opinion and I do not think it is appropriate if everyone stood up and told each other what they thought about each other we would never make progress in this House, unfortunately. Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker, may I address you on the subject?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: She is the only one acting like that.

The SPEAKER: Order please!

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker, in flagrant breach of your statement at the beginning of these proceedings, this hon member has been running a running commentary reflecting on the integrity of the hon Minister Madikizela.

Mr K E MAGAXA: So?

The PREMIER: This is an hon member who has a *prima facie* charge against her of fraud against this House, and she cannot reflect on anybody's...  
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Why must you be allowed to [Inaudible.] in this House?  
She always does this, everything!

The SPEAKER: Order.

Ms M N GILLION: Every time she is doing this.

An HON MEMBER: Your mic is off, Madam. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please Madam Premier, kindly take your seat. Chief Whip.

Mr P UYS: Honourable, a point of order Madam Speaker, the Premier will have to withdraw that. That is a direct attack on a member and the integrity of a member. It is wrong to say that.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: It is not wrong.

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you Madam Speaker. I would like to request that whoever is using the manual for the microphone, that when somebody is addressing the Chair they do not turn the microphone off that has happened now. ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: †Hayi [No.], sit down! [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: When the Premier was addressing you the microphone was turned off. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: I have been watching that for a long time. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: That is a contravention.

An HON MEMBER: No man!

The SPEAKER: Okay. I will ensure that the microphones are checked.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker...

The SPEAKER: I sit a point of order?

Ms M N GILLION: Can I address you?

The SPEAKER: Yes, hon member Gillion, you may.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, please, give a rule in the House. You allowed the Chief Whip of the ruling party to tell you what to do and your staff. It is wrong.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, if I... [Interjections.] If I understood what the Chief Whip said it is a point of procedure. He was saying my mic had been muted, so he has not given me an instruction. He has alerted me to the fact that the mic has been muted, but what we have had in the House now is a situation where two members have gone beyond what is the scope. Hon member Davids expressed herself in a manner which was inappropriate. It should not have been done in the way it was done. If you have an issue we



need to bring substantive motions to the House. I understand people can respect or disrespect each other but we cannot verbalise that. Similarly, Premier, we cannot start talking to issues of what is transpired that is not part of our programme and agenda here today. I understand that you said the hon member Davids did a running commentary, and I am going to from here on ask the next person who interjects without stopping, I am going to ask that member to withdraw, but I would want to believe that we treat each other in a manner that is not disrespectful, and that displays dignity towards each other. So we have a situation where we have two women, who have both had a go at each other and I am now going to - Premier, I think in your statement, around the fraud, I think it was inappropriate and I am going to ask you to withdraw that statement please. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Please.

An HON MEMBER: She must withdraw. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: There we go, there we go again! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Now will you allow the Premier to speak, it is a point of order.

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker, what I said is common cause.

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is not common.

The PREMIER: In this House it has become customary to allow...  
[Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Uh-uh, Madam Speaker, on a point of order...

The PREMIER: ...to allow people... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: There is another member on a point of order.

The PREMIER: ...to breach Rule 57 all the time... [Interjections]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: ...as the hon member Davids was doing... [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker...

The PREMIER: ...but when people point out that those people who have  
major question marks on their ... [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, Madam Speaker!

An HON MEMBER: On a point of order!

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, on a point of order.

An HON MEMBER: On a point of order! [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: On a point of order, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

Ms T M DIJANA: A point of order, she must sit down. There is a point of order. [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, Speaker!

The SPEAKER: Order please! There Premier is talking to Rule 57.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker!

An HON MEMBER: She must sit down, there is a point of order. She must sit down. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: No-no, member [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Olivier, kindly take your seat.

Ms T M DIJANA: She must sit down. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Kindly take your seat please.

Mr R T OLIVIER: On a point of order, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I am asking you to take your seat.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, on a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, kindly take your seat. I am listening to the Premier and the Premier is addressing me in terms of Rule 57. Yes Madam Premier, you may continue. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: You see, they are again breaching Rule 57.

The SPEAKER: Absolutely!

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: She must just withdraw from the Chamber.

The SPEAKER: Order please members! [Interjections.]

Mr B D JOSEPH: Withdraw!

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker, I have asked to address you on this subject and you have said yes, I may. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

An HON MEMBER: Withdraw! Withdraw!

An HON MEMBER: You must go.

An HON MEMBER: Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: They are howling because they do not want it to come out in this House what we all know is true.

The SPEAKER: Okay.

The PREMIER: That a member who has a major question mark over her integrity for very good reasons is here able to reflect on the integrity of other members... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Speaker... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: ...and I will not sit by in a House with double standards, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I have taken, Madam Premier, may I address you.

I have taken cognisance...

Mr B D JOSEPH: She must withdraw! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. I have taken cognisance of your response to Rule 57, but I have asked you to withdraw... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes.

The SPEAKER: So I would expect that you withdraw and then I will get to the hon member Davids and I will have to ask the hon member Davids to withdraw her disrespectful statement too.

Ms S W DAVIDS: I withdraw, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Davids. You have withdrawn. Madam Premier, I have requested that you withdraw please.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Too high.

The PREMIER: Madam Speaker, I cannot withdraw a truth. [Interjections.] I cannot withdraw a truth when mendacious statements are allowed in this House.

The SPEAKER: Premier, unfortunately, kindly take your seat please.

[Interjections.]

The PREMIER: I cannot withdraw the truth when mendacious statements are allowed in this House. [Interjections.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: That is true.

The SPEAKER: Order members, order please. Premier, I would have to address you. You may take your seat. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Can you call Mmusi Maimane. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members! [Interjections.] You have all requested an outcome and a ruling, yet you continue howling. Now I have asked the Premier to withdraw and Premier has decided she is not going to withdraw, so Madam Premier, I would have to ask you to kindly leave the Chamber for the rest of the day. Thank you. [Applause.]

Hon members, that is nothing to celebrate. There is nothing dignified... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: You are correct there, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: There is nothing dignified... [Interjections.] Let me speak to you. My role as a Presiding Officer and that of the Deputy Chair is to ensure

that we are fair and that procedurally we follow the Rules. You cannot conflate the debate on the table with other matters and issues and I am especially - you might hold opinions on people who are speaking, you cannot howl at that person. Now I heard members howling at Minister Madikizela about the One and Only, completely irrelevant to the topic at hand. So I have asked the Premier to withdraw and she has indicated that she will and I will take this practice to whomever next steps out of line, because we simply cannot manage ourselves in this way. I thank you.

The PREMIER: It is for me a pleasure to withdraw from a House where lies are allowed and the truth is not. [Interjections.]

*[Premier Helen Zille withdraws from the Chamber.]*

The SPEAKER: Hon members, please maintain your composure. Let us just breathe for two or three minutes, seconds. Hon member Dyantyi. The idea of having a sitting is not to cast aspersions on each other. The idea is not to howl and make personal attacks on each other's being or person. So let us now treat each other with respect. We have guests in the gallery and guess what, the rest of the country is watching this behaviour. We are the leaders of this province. Let us start leading and act in a manner that is appropriate with leadership of the province. May we now proceed.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is going to be better now that she is out. [Interjections.]



The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, that is a comment. It is your point of view. You do not have to air it in the House. You can share it outside after the sitting. I am not entertaining any comment that is irrelevant to the matter at hand. The next speaker, is it still you Minister Madikizela?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: How much time do I have left?

The SPEAKER: The Table will alert me. You have three minutes left, and members, I am the Speaker here. I have the Table staff to guide me. Please do not try and do my job because it is difficult as it is. Thank you. You may proceed hon Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Speaker, I ended up by just showing the performance of the Government of that side when they were in power and our performance in terms of the schools that we built. 34 versus 118. [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dis hopeloos! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is hopeless! [Interjections.]]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: But not only that, Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: [Onhoorbaar.] ... julle lieg!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] ... you are lying!]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, order! Did I hear you say, “Jy lieg”?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Ja.

The SPEAKER: No-no-no-no, hon member Dyantyi!

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ek het gesê “julle.”

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: I said “julle.”]

The SPEAKER: Okay, I will revert to Hansard because I am almost certain I heard you say “jy lieg.”

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ek het Afrikaans gepraat. Ek het gesê “julle.”

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: I spoke Afrikaans. I said “julle.”]

†Me M N GILLION: Julle.

[Ms M N GILLION: Julle.]

The SPEAKER: I will come back to the House on that one, thank you.

[Interjections.] Table staff, will you note that. We need to come back to the House. Thank you. You may proceed hon Minister Madikizela.

[Interjections.] Yes Chief Whip. Minister Madikizela, kindly take your seat.

Mr M G E WILEY: In generalising “julle”, was he including members of the House?

An HON MEMBER: No, a term for the DA.

The SPEAKER: A debating point. Let us proceed. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is not a debating point.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Speaker, this House is really turning into a circus because of these members.

Ms M N GILLION: Who is turning it into a circus? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now, but more importantly, Madam Speaker, the DA Government reduced the number of underperforming schools. Now these are schools in poor areas that had a pass rate that is below 60%. We reduced the number of these schools. There were 78 when we took over this Government from the ANC and we have now reduced them to 19. Now that is a clear indication of a clear performance between that government and this Government. [Interjections.]

The Western Cape Government has always maintained that indicators of

poverty go well beyond the overall pass rate... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. Minister Schäfer and hon member Olivier, I would recommend that the two of you discuss your education issues outside the door. You are becoming disruptive and you are drowning out the Speaker. You may proceed Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Speaker, I will also focus on quality of passes and retention of as many learners as possible in the school system so that we can ensure the best possible opportunities for our young people in the Western Cape. Now let me come to the issue of inner-city development and human settlements because when we speak here we don't make sweeping statements, Madam Speaker. We base these things on the reports... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela kindly...

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...and these reports are not done by us... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Kindly take your seat. There is a member on the floor. Hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, is it allowed that the DA have caucuses that side. They are running up and down?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, I hear your point. It says members are allowed to converse as long as it does not interfere with the speaker in the House. If it is, Chief Whip Wiley, there is a request to the caucus you are conducting which seems to be interfering with the proceedings of the House. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: May I address you?

The SPEAKER: Yes of course you may.

Mr M G E WILEY: I am the Chief Whip of the majority party.

The SPEAKER: Correct.

Mr M G E WILEY: I will speak to any member of this House at any time and liaise and consort with them as much as I see fit.

The SPEAKER: Correct.

Mr M G E WILEY: That is my job. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He was not interfering with... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: By raising that objection now they have done it so in defiance of the ruling that you made about a frivolous point of order earlier.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Correct. Chief Whip, except... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: [Inaudible.] But they have obstructed our committee meeting.

The SPEAKER: Order please members. Hon member Beerwinkel take your seat. I understand that you have the right to talk to your members but you were on your feet and I did not know, you were actually standing, so I did not know if you are standing on a point of order while the debate was ongoing. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Sit down.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, Chief Whip. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: With due respect, you just made a ruling that you'd ask that this debate continue peacefully. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Correct.

Mr M G E WILEY: I went down to that end of the House... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M G E WILEY: I went down to that end of the House to ask the members let us get through this debate, to support yourself. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you Chief Whip. Thank you. Hon member Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Chairperson I am going to say upfront...

The SPEAKER: Speaker.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I am sorry.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Speaker, upfront, I cannot address you on the Rule number which I always ask for, because there is no such rule, and I hope that you will allow me to speak as does the Chief Whip of this House repeatedly without referring to a rule. Madam Speaker, you are about to amend the Rules of this House.

The SPEAKER: Correct.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Now unless and until you include provocation in these Rules you will have this kind of disruption all the time. We cannot be continuously provoked from the other side. What is the purpose...  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay. Hon member Beerwinkel, I hear your comment, the Rules do not make provision for provocation.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Exactly!

The SPEAKER: But one would expect that as members of Parliament it is a political terrain. We are expected to display a certain amount of emotional intelligence and constraint and composure, that we understand the debate does get robust and we need to deal with it. If someone is calling you out by poking a finger at you or something that becomes very different so I have asked for cooperation. I hear your point and when we do get to the Rules review I think it would be useful for you to bring that point to the table as well. Both parties are provoked. It is about the level of decorum in terms of how people manage the information. I cannot control what is told to, a question is posed. You might get a difficult response that you do not like and then all of a sudden there is uproar so we have to understand this is politics. It is robust and I cannot rule on the veracity of a statement that is made. I am here to ensure procedural fairness. Your point is noted, hon member Beerwinkel.



Ms C F BEERWINKEL: May I complete what I was saying, Speaker?

The SPEAKER: You may.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: At no stage was I debating the veracity of what people are going to say or not going to say. I am speaking about the provocation that we cannot sit quietly about from the other side of the House. In the same way that they do not want us to shout things at them. What is the purpose Madam Speaker, if I may continue, what is the purpose of having a debate that refers to the Western Cape and we continuously have to listen to South Africa? Stay on the topic. That is part of provocation. [Interjections.]

That is part of provocation. I understand that we are not an island. [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: We have the stats. [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I can hear. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I can hear MEC Winde chuckling sarcastically. I am not a fool, Speaker, I understand... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Take your seat Chief Whip, there is someone on the floor.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I understand that the Western Cape, yes.

An HON MEMBER: Talk to the Western Cape.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I understand that the Western Cape is proud of South Africa. I know that. We all know that. There is not anybody who does not know that. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: But while you put a topic about the Western Cape [Interjection.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: You did.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...and then you discuss South Africa.

The SPEAKER: Okay. Hon member Beerwinkel... [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: We want to discuss the Western Cape [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Beerwinkel, I have displayed latitude. Hon member Dugmore, take your seat. I have displayed latitude. I have allowed

you an opportunity to express yourself on provocation which is not in terms of the Rules a point of order but I have allowed that. I now see the Chief Whip and my understanding though, this is a political debate and the topic is not actually about the Western Cape as I understand it. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The Western Cape is in South Africa.

The SPEAKER: Does it say Western Cape?

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members!

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, may I? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, there does - hold on, hold on. The topic is a political one. I can - you see members... [Interjections.] Order please.

An HON MEMBER: A stupid question.

The SPEAKER: We cannot simply be selective to say today we want the Western Cape and tomorrow we want South Africa so let us put that to bed and understand it is politics.

An HON MEMBER: Talk to the Western Cape, the Western Cape...

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip may I take your point of order.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you Madam Speaker, may I just remind the House... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members, stop howling. You want an answer, you are getting it. Please maintain your composure, hon member Tyatyam.

Mr M G E WILEY: May I remind the House that the subject for discussion is an ANC subject, and it is “violation of people’s socio-economic rights in the Western Cape.”

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you, sit down. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Now how on earth do we have a debate without referring to the Western Cape?

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, can I address you on this particular point of order. The hon member Wiley has been acting like a bully in terms of disrupting our Standing Committee. I have laid a formal complaint to the Registrar on the Code of Conduct and that particular conduct continues. I, as a member of this House, have still not received any response to my complaint and the behaviour which has been demonstrated in the House today is the

same behaviour... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore...

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...so if you fail to bring someone to order they will continue acting like a bully, which is exactly what Mr Wiley is doing.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, I thank you for your input but it mirrors exactly what happened between the Premier and member Davids in terms of something that is conflated. It is not relevant to this debate. Your issue needs to be followed up. If you have not had a response, do send another written piece of work to try and get it, but it certainly does not sit in this space today. Hon member Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Madam Speaker, appeal to the House that we get on with the business of the day. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. May we now proceed. The next person to be out of line is going to walk in terms of Rule 44. It is not a threat. I am making a statement of fact. Thank you. You may proceed, Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Speaker, I am really shocked at what I heard. This debate is about the Western Cape where we are in Government as the DA and we have to compare how we are governing with where the ANC is governing.

An HON MEMBER: No-no.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The Western Cape is in South Africa, for God's sake. [Interjections.] Now let me then do exactly that Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order please, Minister Madikizela, kindly take your seat. Hon member Gillion was up on a point of order.

Ms M N GILLION: Yes Madam Speaker, I want you to rule if "for God's sake" is parliamentary. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is not parliamentary.

The SPEAKER: Members, this one has got me flummoxed because it is a difficult terrain. Some people believe in God. Some people believe in a higher power. If a statement is made in a blasphemous way then I might want to say, Minister Madikizela, I think in the interest of getting on with the proceedings, would you want to withdraw the statement "for God's sake" please?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Speaker, with all due respect, I did not say that statement in a blasphemous way. "For God's sake" is not unparliamentary and therefore really I am not going to withdraw. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay. Hon member Gillion, can I - before you speak to me, can I just address you. Earlier on in the debate and “for God’s sake” could be blasphemous. The Minister has said he did not mean it in a blasphemous way. It could be a figure of speech, the same as “all animals are equal” earlier on by the hon member Magaxa. It was a “figure of speech”. [Interjections.] It was a euphemism. So can I ask that we proceed. Thank you.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, I agree that we must proceed.

The SPEAKER: Yes.

Ms M N GILLION: I agree, you asked me to sit down.

The SPEAKER: I did.

Ms M N GILLION: I want to remind you, Madam Speaker, that you made a ruling on the MEC to withdraw, please.

The SPEAKER: I did, hon member Gillion, I did say if it was meant in a blasphemous way I would ask him to withdraw. The Minister indicated that it was not meant in a blasphemous way so I would need to allow him the benefit of the doubt to proceed with his presentation. Hon member Uys.

Mr P UYS: Hon Madam Speaker, I do not think even that this is the right debate or interaction. Just appeal to the House please, not to use words like

that, because I mean it is hurting somebody.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Tell us what words to use.

Mr P UYS: Whether people like it or not, let us just ask him to refrain from that please.

The SPEAKER: Members, I have taken your cognisance of your comment, hon member Uys, but you know what we started off with “animals not being equal” and “white animals” and “black animals”, and now we are busy with God. So in the bigger picture it is all nasty. Let us grow up and start acting like leaders here now and display some leadership and let us take this province forward. You may proceed Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. Now hon member Magaxa spoke about the failures of this Government in the inner-city development. Quite frankly he has got no moral high ground on that matter. This is a government that never did a single inner-city development in its tenure, a single inner-city development, but let me then show the glaring differences between where we are governing and where the ANC is governing. Now in terms of the ... [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Joburg is far ahead of you. Joburg is far ahead.

The SPEAKER: Order members!



The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: All provinces, Madam Speaker... [Interjections.] All provinces are required to report. Now I did say here that when we debate we refer to documents. We do not make sweeping statements. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Documents.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The topic is not “compare”.

The SPEAKER: Order please members! This is a political debate.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now all provinces are required to report in terms of their performance to the National Government. There is a Presidency report that is out. If you look at Human Settlements, now if you look at this report, it is red where the ANC is governing and you see the touches of blue there and there. [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: But you've got your own...

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now if you look at the upgrading of informal settlements programme, we are blue as the Western Cape. If you go to another programme, if you look at Social Housing - CRU, we are blue as the Western Cape... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela...

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...in the sea of red. If you look at the title deed restoration we are blue as the Western Cape in a sea of red...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela, finish up please. Your time is up.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: So these numbers, quite frankly cannot tell us about the violation of people's right in the Western Cape, where all the reports are indicating... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Madikizela, your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...that we are doing far better than any other province where they are in government. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Applause.] [Interjections.] Can we get some order please. I now see the following speaker, the hon member Christians.

†Mnr R T OLIVIER: Ek hou van jou das! Jy het 'n mooi das aan.  
[Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr R T OLIVIER: I like your tie. You are wearing a very nice tie.  
[Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, do not cast aspersions. Your tie might not be pink like hon Christians' tie, thank you. You may proceed, Sir.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, I want to agree that much needed to be done for our people in the Western Cape and also South Africa when it comes to the socio-economic conditions. Madam Speaker, everybody have the right to basic education, healthcare, water and a safe environment, but every programme needs money and we the Western Cape can only do what we receive from National Government. So who is responsible - in Afrikaans - †dat ons 'n rommelstatus is? Niemand wil die land aanraak nie want die ANC laat ons sink. [- in Afrikaans - that we are junk status. No-one wants to touch the country because the ANC is causing us to sink.]

So Madam Speaker, we are still recovering from the Wage Bill. What the people of the Western Cape must understand is that the ridiculous things that the ANC Government nationally does, affects the poor man on the street, so the foolish insane decisions. When you have a competent Finance Minister like Pravin Gordhan and you get him, and replace him with a †‘ja-broer’. [yes-man.]

An HON MEMBER: With a what?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: You replace him with a †“ja-broer”. [yes-man.] Somebody that will say yes to everything. So Madam Speaker, the important thing is our people in the Western Cape are suffering because of an incompetent national ANC. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Christians, take your seat please. There is a

member on the floor.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Madam Speaker, when we started this debate you gave us a long paragraph of what we can and cannot do. This is clearly aspersions on a person who is not even in this House, besides the fact - I think - that the member must speak a little louder. We cannot hear him!

The SPEAKER: Okay. So now we are getting into frivolous and all sorts of other stuff.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Ja.

The SPEAKER: We are actually not dealing with the real issues. Hon member Christians, if you could tone down just a little bit and then you may proceed with your presentation. Thank you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, the important thing is when we talk about the violation of people's rights is when politicians steal from the poor, and that is what the ANC Government is doing, stealing from the poor and then they want to come with the subject that also hurts me when I see people suffer. But we must be fair and we must be constant. So when National Government makes stupid decisions it affects the people on the ground, and Madam Speaker, in conclusion I want to say, we lost billions of rand by a reckless President Jacob Zuma, and they must be ashamed of themselves. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Who are you calling ... [Inaudible.] You must be ashamed for yourself.

The SPEAKER: Order please! [Interjections.] Hon member Dijana. [Interjections.] Members, you cannot go launching into each other, finger, fists and everything. It is inappropriate and it is unparliamentary. Hon member Christians, please cooperate with me.

Mr D JOSEPH: It is only one person who... [Inaudible.] It is only one.

The SPEAKER: Just please cooperate with me. I have said and I go back to my guidance, where I said statements and words reflecting negatively on the integrity and honour of other members will not be allowed. So please members, let us not go there. I do not know what it is, if there is something in the drinking water, but you are all behaving badly today. So can we please get on with the business. I now see the hon, the Minister, the Minister of Finance.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Madam Speaker... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: What is in that water?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... and thank you for this opportunity to take

part in this debate, but when this topic of this debate landed on my desk, I was immediately, as with Minister Madikizela, intrigued.

The immediate question was: Why would the Hon Leader of the Opposition choose this particular topic? After all, this is the Western Cape. We have the highest life expectancy rate. We have the highest human development index rating in the country. We have not had a Marikana, which resulted in the death of the striking of mine workers like in North West. We have not had a 94 [Interjection.] mental health patients die as in Gauteng after they were transferred from Life Esidimeni Centre. We are not experiencing the levels of inefficiency that has led to the total collapse of the KZN Health Department, not only the Oncology Department. [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: [Inaudible.] Malmesbury.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, I recently attended a budget council in Pretoria at the National Treasury. The Minister of Health was present at that meeting and he said to us at that meeting the ANC KZN Department of Health will collapse in the next few weeks. [Interjections.] This is a shocking state of affairs happening under the ANC watch.

An HON MEMBER: So we... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: In fact in the Western Cape... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... the Health Department has outperformed its provincial counterparts by being the first to obtain an unqualified audit opinion and more recently a clean financial audit, the first Health Department since 1994 in South Africa. We are not an ANC province, where there are reportedly over 2 000 dysfunctional schools... [Interjection.] yet education in that province, they gave back to the National Treasury... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Talk to the... [Inaudible.] about this province.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: You have 2 000 dysfunctional schools and you give back to the National Treasury R530 million, redistributed to other provinces. This is a shame on how the ANC manages it.

We are not in Mpumalanga where the Department of Health has received zero percent compliance on the financial disclosure framework. Furthermore, this same Department has a backlog of 12 581 unpaid invoices. In other words, accruals within the 30 days deadline, to the total value of R1,4 billion. That is the money that you could have used to transform the socio-economic landscape where you are governing in the ANC province. This is the real debate, Madam Speaker, but this is the Western Cape.

The annual budget of the Western Cape medium-term policy is one of the key mechanisms through which this Government gives effect to the socio-

economic rights. All of the members in this House have received this document. The Medium-term Budget Policy Statement. In the very first chapter is a detailed account of how we have achieved the socio-economic rights. This document was approved by all of you in this House. So it is not correct to say that these rights are being violated, because we have given effect to these rights and this document is a legal document adopted in this House.

So this is the Western Cape Province, we fulfil our service delivery role, we promote good governance and uphold the socio-economic rights.

Madam Speaker... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Is jy nou moeg? Is jy nou moeg?

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Are you now tired? Are you now tired?]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... the Western Cape has done much to create sustainable human settlements and improve quality of households, as the hon member, my colleague, the Leader of Government Business, has indicated. In the Western Cape we have the highest percentage of households who have access to flush toilets connected to a sewerage system. In the Western Cape we have the highest percentage of households with access to piped water inside the dwelling. In the Western Cape we have got the highest percentage of households that have refuse removed by a local authority, private company [Interjection.] at least one a week.



Madam Speaker, let me move on.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Tyatyam, your interjections are now...  
[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I think what we have done under the leadership of the hon Minister of Local Government, we have commissioned a study called the Growth... [Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Maar waar gaan... [Tussenwerpsel.]  
[Mr Q R DYANTYI: But where are ... [Interjection.]]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... Potential of Towns and Regions.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Waar gaan jy daar?  
[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Where are you going there?]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Specifically [Interjection.] to have an asymmetrical... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... approach to economic development and through that study we have seen where the socio-economic needs are the

highest and this budget, Madam Speaker, was specifically targeted at what we call the spatial alignment of the budget to where the needs are the biggest.

So, this budget and this Government have budget priorities which include allocations to health, education, the elderly, women, children, youth and the disabled, and elevating the status of the previously disadvantaged areas. In this Government, under this leadership of this Cabinet, we have now made available R300 million specifically also for people with disabilities under the leadership of the Minister, Social Development, Minister Albert Fritz.

Innovative Western Cape initiatives creating public value towards the delivery of socio-economic rights include the Regional Socio-economic Programme, the Violence Protection through Urban Upgrading, neighbourhood investments, the Broadband digital strategy over the next three years. Members in this House will know that we have allocated a budget and approved the budget in this House, for R1,7 billion...  
[Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: It is supposed to be for women.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... over the next three years. Not only for the City, but specifically for the rural areas so that we can bridge the digital divide and bring out the socio-economic inequalities that exist. We are making progress also through the strengthening of the NGO sector, transfer models thereby improving the assurance for reporting.

Madam Speaker, in the 2017/18 budget, in other words, in this current financial year, we have made a budget available specifically to address the socio-economic needs of R59,3 billion. The biggest slice of that budget is R21 billion. That goes entirely to the Health Department, specifically transforming the health infrastructure, particularly in the rural areas.

The second biggest budget goes to Education, specifically [Interjection.] to transform education in this Western Cape. We are making progress... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry...

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: If you want to become... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: If I may, Minister Meyer... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... a Member of Parliament, stand for election. We beat you right there.

The SPEAKER: Minister Meyer, kindly take your seat. Will the [Interjection.] – thank you. If you would leave the House, thank you.

Guests in the gallery, I have cautioned you up front. You are welcome to attend. You cannot clap, you cannot comment, you cannot agitate. So please understand the Rules. If you do not cooperate you will be asked to leave the

House. You may proceed, hon Minister Meyer. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, we have specifically allocated this budget where the highest needs are, because unlike the ANC, when they have R100.00 and 10 towns, they give each town R10.00, irrespective of the economic potential of the various towns.

Ms P MAKELENI: [Inaudible.] at least they give to towns.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We are giving specifically to strengthen the economic regions, so that people have, in that specific geographical space, a better dividend on that so that you can also benefit all the other poorer regions. But, Madam Speaker, the single biggest threat – hon member Joseph...

The SPEAKER: Christians.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Christians said [Interjections.] – my friend over there, what he mentioned is what we should talk about, because he indicated that the biggest threat to socio-economic investment is corruption. R100 billion was stolen by Zuma and the Guptas and the son of Mr Zuma. R100 billion is two year's financial year budget. You can radically wipe out poverty and socio-economic rights. The hon Leader of the Official Opposition can help us to get back that R100 billion from Dubai and we can change the landscape in this province.

So help us, please, we need that money that was stolen and it is now in Dubai. [Interjections.] Madam Speaker, the Western Cape Government... [Interjection.] has over the past 10 years... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... systematically and progressively enhanced all Government's levels.

The SPEAKER: Order. Minister Meyer, kindly... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is a small amount.

The SPEAKER: ... take your seat.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The One and Only small amount... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, the One and Only is not the topic – I am referring to you. [Interjection.] No-no, no, hon member Magaxa, I am asking that if you would like to pose a question to the Minister, you address it through the Chair to the Minister, not engage in a debate. If the Minister has said something that offended you, you should rise on a point of order and alert me to that, but you may address me.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Madam Speaker, I was listening to the Minister.

The SPEAKER: Yes?

Mr K E MAGAXA: But he mentioned my name. In your presence.

An HON MEMBER: He mentioned my name in your presence, that I must help him to bring the money from Dubai and then I am saying he must bring the nearest One and Only Hotel. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is here. I can bring that money... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Alright.

An HON MEMBER: It was not yours.

The SPEAKER: So, hon member Magaxa, it is... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Dubai is very far. He can take a taxi to that place.

The SPEAKER: Alright. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: One and Only is just here in Cape Town.

The SPEAKER: So that is not a point of order. That is a debating point.

[Interjections.] Order, please members. Hon Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Madam Speaker, I think we must just apply the Rules perhaps... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Yes.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... equally to everyone. Earlier the Premier made a comment and she was told to withdraw and she refused, because it is again referring to what is before the Ethics Committee.

Ms M N GILLION: Do not give the Premier... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Now there is a similar thing about the One and Only and it is not concluded [Interjection.], it is not concluded yet... [Interjection.] and you are not... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... applying the Rules. Surely should you ask the hon member to withdraw.

†Me T M DIJANA: Ag man, sit down... [Onhoorbaar.] van Nyanga nie.

[[Tussenwerpsels.]

[Ms T M DIJANA: Oh, man, sit down... [Inaudible.] not from Nyanga.

[Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Fritz and Dijana, hon member Magaxa, the request was part of the Minister's presentation. Your reference to collecting money at the One and Only is completely irrelevant to the conversation...

[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The same as Dubai.

The SPEAKER: ... and I am going to rule on relevance. So I am going to ask you to withdraw your statement, please.

Mr K E MAGAXA: No, Madam Speaker, I will never. Instead, he must first withdraw saying I must go and fetch money in Dubai.

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Did I take the money of this country to Dubai?

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: It... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: How can he... [Interjection.]



The SPEAKER: It was... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: How can he ask me to do that thing?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Magaxa, my role is not to reflect on the veracity of the statement. The issue of the One and Only is what I have asked you to withdraw on... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Exactly.

The SPEAKER: ... and I am asking you again to kindly withdraw that statement. Thank you. [Interjection.] No. Hon member Uys, before we proceed... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: Mine is just a point of clarity.

The SPEAKER: I am – no, I am not entertaining a point of clarity. I am asking the hon member Magaxa to withdraw the comment about the One and Only. It was irrelevant and it was unnecessary. What the Minister has put in his speech I cannot rule on and it certainly cannot be tit for tat. So I am asking you, hon member Magaxa, would you kindly withdraw that statement?

Mr K E MAGAXA: I will withdraw, but there is unfairness.

The SPEAKER: Have you drawn or will you withdraw?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Withdraw.

The SPEAKER: You have withdrawn. Thank you, hon member Magaxa. You may proceed. Hon member Uys?

Mr P UYS: I want to address you.

The SPEAKER: Yes. [Interjections.] Sorry.

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, just help me, please. What is, what must be relevant or not relevant when there is an interjection? Because the relevance section in the Rules is relevant to when a person will make a speech. Then you must keep relevance to the topic itself, but to make an interjection, I do not understand that ruling, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Minister – I am calling you a Minister. Hon member Uys, you know the Rules better than all of us in this House, because you have been here for a long time. We simply cannot degenerate into a tit for tat now and as with the statement against hon member Davids, I requested the Premier to withdraw. We have now got a very similar situation and I believe I did the right thing in ruling that the hon member Magaxa withdraw. I have ruled on that, I am not entertaining any more discussion on that. You may proceed, Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. In the words of

the Auditor-General, Mr Kimi Makwetu... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Meyer, kindly take your seat. Hon member Makeleni?

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, can you also on the same note ask the hon Minister to withdraw for saying to hon member Magaxa he must go and fetch money in Dubai. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister Meyer, you had presented a statement. The hon member Magaxa is offended at the fact that you had asked him to go to Dubai. He might not get there, but are you – hold on, hold on. Guys, you are making this, hon members, you are making this extremely difficult for me. The Minister has a speech which he is reading. This is a political debate. You cannot operate on tit for tat, because this one says that I must do that.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, I withdraw... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... and I would be very happy to facilitate a smooth transition in this House but ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Meyer. I appreciate your cooperation.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Yes. I withdraw that statement, but I will personally go to Dubai to fetch the money.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Meyer, you may proceed.  
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The Western Cape... [Interjections.] I will go, I will go to Dubai... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, can there be order, please?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... and I will take Minister Winde and Minister Fritz with [Interjections.] and I will take my lawyer, the Minister of Education with, because if you enter Dubai, you will need some legal representation in Dubai. So thank you, Debbie, but I will also need a big suitcase from Mr Albert Fritz to bring that money because... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please, members.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... there will be lots of money that we will have to bring back. But, Madam Speaker, let us proceed.

The SPEAKER: Yes, please do.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I am excited. Madam Speaker, Mr Kimi

Makwetu, on this particular debate that we are having, the Western Cape, he said the Western Cape continued to set the pace by increasing their clean audits from 73% to 80% of all their particular municipalities. Madam Speaker, this Government is able to embrace the task of further improving the socio-economic conditions of our citizens, because we have the basics in place. We practice good financial governance, we put stringent measures in place to ensure financial sustainability, we focus on creating jobs, we focus on creating public value, we believe in the rule of law.

Madam Speaker, it is well documented that the socio-economic rights of citizens in South Africa are the best realised in the Western Cape. Every single report confirms this fact and we want to thank the voters for voting the ANC out, because the ANC has violated the socio-economic rights of citizens here in the Western Cape. These rights are also qualified by phrases such as progressive realisation, as well as within available resources.

Now, the court, for example, in the Grootboom case stated that the housing programme fell short of reasonable resources for people who have no access to land and who were living in intolerable conditions.

The SPEAKER: Minister Meyer, kindly finish up.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you. Sit down.

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired, thank you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, let me conclude by thanking the hon member of the Opposition, because he gave us a platform to showcase how best the Western Cape Government is realising the socio-economic [Interjection.] rights in the Western Cape. [Interjection.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Makeleni, if you make one more comment, I am going to ask you to walk. Thank you. I see the hon member Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Let me also begin by thanking the Opposition for posing the debate, as it does give us an ideal opportunity to highlight the success and the restoration of the socio-economic dignity to the people of South Africa under a DA led Government.

Socio-economic rights are those rights which give people access to certain basic needs necessary to lead a dignified life. The ANC has brought this debate to the province that leads South Africa in clean, effective service delivery, in sharing that socio-economic wellbeing of some 5,8 million people who call the Western Cape home. Even with an additional 150 000 people having moved into our province since 2011, our Government still manages to lead, govern in this country.

Why then is the Western Cape attracting hundreds of thousands of South African citizens if the ANC questions the province's commitment to ensuring

the socio-economic rights of our people? Indeed it is where the ANC fails in its provinces that the DA leads in the Western Cape.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Madam Speaker, in 2004 in defence of his involvement in a R6,6 million stake in a Telkom tender, ANC national spokesperson, Smuts Ngonyama, stated and I quote:

“I did not join the struggle to be poor.”

This statement characterises the ANC’s continued stance on state looting and corruption for years to come, where their so-called revolutionary organisation has proven to be nothing more than a syphon of state funds into the pockets of the political elite.

Why do people come to the Western Cape? Because the Government has received a 100% clean audit for four years running and spends 99% of its budget allocation. In 2015 a report by the Institute of Internal Auditors estimated that South Africa has lost R700 billion to corruption in the last 20 years.

Why do people come to the Western Cape? Because we have the lowest percentage of fruitless and wasteful expenditure as a proportion of the national total, sitting at 0,4%. In the latest poverty trends in the South

African Report released by Stats SA, as my colleagues have indicated, it was revealed that 30,4 million South Africans live now in abject poverty. The highest figure in 10 years, comprising 3 million more of our citizens since 2011.

South Africa's rising poverty rates are indicators of a deteriorating human rights situation and of an outright failure by the ANC to grow the economy and create jobs. In ANC provinces such as Gauteng, the expanded unemployment rate sits at 32,9%, in KwaZulu Natal at a whopping 40,4%. Why do people come to the Western Cape? Because this province has the lowest expanded unemployment rate in the country, sitting at 24,6% and the highest labour absorption rate in South Africa.

Madam Speaker, the World Economic Forum's Global Information Technology Report of 2015 has revealed that South Africa ranks as the lowest performing country out of 143, studied on the quality of education systems. Furthermore, South Africa came last in the quality of its Maths and Science education in the same group of countries. Why do people come to the Western Cape? Because we have the highest national senior certificate pass rate, the highest Bachelor's pass rate and the highest Mathematics pass rate in South Africa.

In addition to this, in the Southern and Eastern African Consortium for Monitoring Educational Quality Report released this year, the Western Cape came out as the leader in Reading and Maths in Southern and Eastern Africa.



The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Madam Speaker, the provision of basic services such as water and sanitation underpin human rights in our country, but the ANC's National Ministry of Water and Sanitation is paralysed and bankrupt, owing some R5 billion to the Reserve Bank and R3,5 billion to the water boards across the country.

Water and sanitation is at the heart of restoring socio-economic dignity to our people, yet the ANC's National Department has run it into the ground. Why do the people come to the Western Cape? Because 99% of our households have piped water and the City of Cape Town's economy is still the fastest growing in South Africa, even in the midst of a drought.

The ANC's State Land Lease and Disposal Policy states that the small-scale subsistence farmers must remain tenants of the State and only medium to large scale farmers have the option to buy farms, but only after having leased the land for 30 to 50 years. This policy failure by the ANC is ensuring a continued cycle of socio-economic ruin by denying our people access to land and further denying them land ownership. 92% of land reform projects fail under the ANC. Why do people come to the Western Cape? Because in this province we support land reform farmers and have a 62% land reform success rate. The highest in the country.

Having done nothing but erode the socio-economic dignity of South Africans

through looting, state capture, crippling corruption and government incompetence, the ANC has made a cheap attempt to brand the DA led Western Cape as a province that does not care for the dignity of our people. [Interjection.] In reality we are the national leaders in governance, uplifting people out of poverty and into a life they can value.

The topic of this debate is entirely baseless as the cornerstones of socio-economic rights are the most revered and the best ensured in this province. Where the ANC fails, we lead. Where their policies plunge our people into despair, ours catapult them into a dignified life. The question posed by the Opposition holds no value in this House and the DA led Western Cape is happy to continue showing up an ANC Government at the mercy of its own leader's corruption.

Mr Deputy Speaker, if anything, this debate has revealed that it is in fact the ANC that has and continues to violate the socio-economic rights of each and every South African.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear! [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Davids. [Interjections.]

†Me S W DAVIDS: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Ek wil net wil vir Beverley Schäfer sê dat dit as gevolg van die apartheidstelsel is dat die mense na die Wes-Kaap en na Johannesburg toe hardloop, oor die hulpbronne

wat in daardie provinsies is. Die hulpbronne. [Tussenwerpsels.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I just want to say to Beverley Schäfer that it is because of the apartheid system that people are running to the Western Cape and Johannesburg, because of the resources in those provinces. The resources. [Interjections.]]

Mr Deputy Speaker, I rise here today on this topic. I just want to say victory to the people of Philippi.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Where the Court said that if the people are united they shall never be defeated. The Western Cape High Court ordered the City of Cape Town to buy land for 60 000 people in the Marikana informal settlement. [Applause.] Is that caring, Beverley? Are you caring? No.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Never.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Let us come to the DA, Mr Deputy Speaker. In this province people are humiliated. It is when their rights and dignity are compromised. It is the same with evictions. Women, elderly people, people living with disabilities and children, are the most negatively affected. People

were thrown out onto the streets with no shelter, no access to water, Beverley, no access to water, toilet facilities or basic services. Not even bread. Evictions are up in the Western Cape under the DA watch. The DA Government is evicting our people and no real action is taken by this uncaring and aloof Government to aid the poor.

In May 2017, education MEC, hon Minister Debbie Schäfer, did not oppose the eviction application of Grootkraal Primary School near Oudtshoorn. [Interjection.] Judge Baartman was in pain to point out to the Department that it treated farm learners badly.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Take it on appeal.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Hon Minister Schäfer was accused of enabling anti-transformation and cruel actions of private profit driven actors at the expense of rural poor learners. To make things worse, Premier Helen Zille is busy on a world tour, going this way, that way. Not coming to her responsibilities to serve the people of the Western Cape.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Where is Minister Mokonyane?

Ms S W DAVIDS: The people of the Western Cape's socio-dignity and socio-economic rights are violated. Human Rights Commissioner, Chris Nissen's office said he is dealing with evictions, whether legally or illegally on farms in the Ceres, Somerset West, Drakenstein and Worcester areas. He described

them as a horrible and that the illegal evictions are done in the most brutal manner. People's roofs are taken off their houses, people's doors are broken off their houses. Old people are thrown onto the street in rainy nights, not during the day where they can go and look for shelter for themselves.

†Schalk Burger, julle famous rugby speler, julle DA voor hardloper in die Drakenstein [Schalk Burger, your famous rugby player, your DA frontrunner in the Drakenstein] - a farm in Wellington - a farmworker of his, Anneline Arendse is a living example of daily experiencing – yôh, I cannot even say what Anneline is going through. Anneline has cancer, but currently farmer Schalk Burger is treating her like a dog. [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: She is quoted as saying:

“I am really scared, because he is threatening me. He threatened before. I have children to think about.” [Interjection.]

Those intimidation tactics that they are using.

Mr S G TYATYAM: They do not care.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Has this Cabinet ever bothered to visit these farms... [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Never.

Ms S W DAVIDS: ... and convene public hearings and hear directly from the farmworkers? No, they put up farmworker committees with blue T-shirts, so that they can speak on behalf of the farmer and not the farm owner, because if they speak on behalf of the farm owner, they will be treated like Anneline. This answer is a big no. The DA is an uncaring party and has no feelings and lacks humanity for the vulnerable. [Interjection.]

In 2015, 60-year old Lodewyk with 32 year's service at St Kilda Kwekery had his belongings loaded on a truck and dropped off at the backyard of a DA PR councillor. Surprisingly the DA councillor, Sfiso Malgas, protected the company who illegally evicted Lodewyk. What a shame on the DA.

Then I want to bring in another DA councillor of Ceres, Ward 5, who has his own farm, Eselfontein, where people are evicted and living without water. †Hy het die boorgate toegedraai en nou moet die mense uit die rivier vuil water drink. [He closed off the boreholes and now the people have to drink dirty water from the river.]

An HON MEMBER: Yôh, yôh, yôh.

Ms S W DAVIDS: A DA councillor in Ceres, Witzenberg, †daar sit die mense, hulle drink vuil water, Beverley. [there the people are sitting, they drink dirty water, Beverley.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: They do not care.

Ms S W DAVIDS: And then I want to come to July 2017... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms S W DAVIDS: The Gowa sisters have... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member, just one second. Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, two things. First of all, can the hon member speak through the Chair? And secondly, can the hon member refer to other members as hon as well?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, point is taken. Hon member, you must just... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Sorry, Chief Whip... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... from time-to-time turn your shoulder to the Chair as well.

Ms S W DAVIDS: ... hon member Beverley Schäfer, because she was speaking around the water. I just want to say to the hon member Beverley Schäfer that the people there are drinking dirty water. [Interjections.]

50-year old Sanna Morris who stayed at Karata Farm near Knysna for over 30 years, has been fighting an eviction since 2011, after the death of her husband. Her matter was referred to the Speaker of the National Assembly Office and the councillor for the DA did nothing for Sanna, because the councillor of the DA said to Sanna that, “You do not have a right on that farm, because you were only a farmworker.”

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member, your time... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Even the emerging... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms S W DAVIDS: ... black farmers... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Davids, your time has expired unfortunately.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Can I conclude, Mr Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just your last sentence... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes. These actual evictions of the Steenberg people and the people of Woodstock, are a disgrace in this Western Cape. [Interjection.]



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: ... the DA only cares for the rich. [Time expired.]  
[Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Your time has expired. Hon member Mngqasela?

†UMnu M MNQASELA: Enkosi Somlomo. Somlomo ngo 2009 sangena apha sakhupha iANC kurhulumente. Kwakungekho nomnye umasipala onophicotho olungenaziphene, thina ke sangena safaka idiphu, amakhalane aziwela. Emva kweminyaka esibhozo sinoomasipala abangama 23 abanophicotho olungenaziphene, into leyo ethetha ukuthi idiphu le yethu iysasebenza apha eNtshona Koloni. Asinantanga.

*[Translation of is Xhosa paragraph follows.]*

[Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Speaker, in 2009 we came here and removed the ANC from government. There was not a single municipality that had a clean audit, then we came and administered an insecticide, and the ticks fell off by themselves. Eight years down the line we have 23 municipalities with clean audits, which means our insecticide works well here in the western Cape. We are unequalled.]

†The quality of governance is amongst the highest in the world in this province. We have restored hope. We have restored dignity. We have ensured that people live looking forward to the next day in this province, because lives are improving every day. [Interjections.]

During apartheid, Mr Deputy Speaker, you had three provinces administered in this Chamber and that was the Cape Province; the Eastern Cape, the Western Cape and the Northern Cape. They were all administered as the Cape Colony.

Now why is it that only this province performs very well compared to these other provinces? [Interjections.] What happened to these other two provinces? The fact that we can improve to where we are now, yet we are administered by the same administration. [Interjections.] That shows you the rot in the ANC.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is without doubt... [Interjection.] that this province, under the DA led Government, is a province that has improved the lives of the people as opposed to what the statement by the ANC says.

Now I would be very embarrassed if I was the ANC saying what you are saying. †Ngoba ngesiXhosa, kuthiwa ngesiXhosa iqaqa aliziva kunuka. I-

ANC iyanuka hure, ngoba ubuqhophololo ... [Because in isiXhosa they say, one cannot smell themselves. The ANC smells very bad, because of corruption ...] †in this province. We have been able to set up Whistle Blower Policies throughout the municipalities in this province. This Provincial Government has been able to establish Whistle Blower Policies in order to ensure that corruption is something of the past where we are in government and where we find it, we deal with it decisively.

When you look at the public transport in this province, we boast the best public transport through MyCiti and the GoGeorge as clear examples of good governance, and that is one of the indicators [Interjection.] of the quality of governance and for that you are grateful. People did not make a mistake by putting the DA in government.

Mr Deputy Speaker, maybe the ANC is right when they are saying we are failing. We are failing... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Let us confirm it.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... because for them if you do not steal money, you are failing, because their factions are fuelled by fighting for control of state resources [Interjections.] to enrich themselves. [Interjections.] The latest General Household Survey ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... survey released by Statistics South Africa, on 31 May 2017, shows that almost 95% of residents in this province have access to clean water, but over and above that, 93,4% have access to full flush toilets and that is very clear determinant of good governance. [Interjection.]

In fact, 14 out of 20 best performing municipalities, with the highest household access to improved sanitation are in this province. 14 out of the 20 best performing municipalities. [Interjections.] It is not a joke. This is serious business. [Interjection.]

The report goes on to say that 99% of people have access to refuse collection and that we remove refuse regularly. 92.7% have access to electricity and that is the reality in this province. †Abantu bayalayita kweli phondo, umbane ukhona. [People are lighting in this province, there is electricity.] [Interjections.]

But let me also say, Mr Deputy Speaker, it will be remiss of me not to mention this. [Interjection.] Let us put comparisons here. Which province that follows us in terms of good financial and sound financial management? That is KZN at 17, 18%, and here we have 80% of very sound... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M MNQASELA: ... and clear financial management systems...

[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member...

Mr M MNQASELA: ... and quality governance.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... your time has expired. I will allow you to...

[Interjection.]

Mr M MNQASELA: And let me finish, Mr Deputy Speaker, that we are busy fixing the government in Nelson Mandela Bay, in Tshwane, in Johannesburg because of the mess caused by these people. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Order.

Mr M MNQASELA: We are coming to fix... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA:: ... South Africa in 2019. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Before I see the next speaker, can I – hon member Mngqasela. Can I just check with the hon member. You used the term the ANC were enriching “themselves”. Can I just check for sure. Are you referring to members of the House or not? [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I was referring to the inherently corrupt organisation, the ANC.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Not the members of this House?

Mr M MNQASELA: Not members.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Okay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker, and can I say to the hon member Magaxa, the Leader of the Opposition... [Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: [Inaudible.]... question. Can I ask him a question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: What is the point? Is there an interruption? Hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: No... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No? Minister Winde, you may continue.

[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, if I can start again. [Interjections.] I would like to thank...

Mr R T OLIVIER: He is just acting, he is just acting. Just continue.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I would like to thank the Leader of the Opposition for putting this motion on the Order Paper today and in thinking about this Order Paper and how we are going to react to the question stated, I thought about what it is like in the caucus of the ANC... [Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: It is very nice.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... when it becomes their turn... [Interjection.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: You can join us... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... to put a motion on the Order Paper. [Interjection.] And of course, as an Opposition ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is a running commentary that I cannot pinpoint... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It is here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... where it comes from, but I suspect it is hon member Olivier. If it is not so then I apologise. If it is hon member Olivier, please refrain from doing that. You are interfering with the Minister's attempt to start his speech. Hon Minister, you may... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much. I will start again, Mr Deputy Speaker [Interjection.].

Mr R T OLIVIER: He is also acting.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I will start again.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Start.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Mr Winde, your time is running out unfortunately. [Interjection.] Hon member Olivier... [Interjection.] Hon member Olivier! Give the Minister a chance.



The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I ask you to please watch the hon member. [Interjections.] So can you imagine what it is like in this caucus when you have to, as an opposition, stand up and say we are going to raise an issue. I think it probably brings nightmares to these members, because one would think that in a caucus like this they would need to want to deal with some of the cruxes and the big issues that our people... [Interjection.] in our province and our country deal with every day. [Interjections.]

So they probably say, what we are going to do is we are going to bring a motion of no confidence on dealing with the high crime levels in our – maybe we will not do that. Maybe we should talk about Metro – ah, maybe we will not talk about Metrorail. Let us deal with poverty. Let us talk about jobs. Let us talk about the State owned enterprises. Maybe we should have a debate on corruption. What about evictions? Let us talk about evictions.

Every single topic that they bring up in that caucus they cannot debate, because they know they are going to come into this House and they are going to get a hiding, like they have [Interjections.] every single time we have a debate in this House. [Interjections.]

But, Mr Deputy Speaker, they have to put something on the Order Paper and this is what is on the Order Paper, and speaker after speaker on this side of the House has shown, whether it is measuring, as the hon member Beerwinkel says, in other provinces or how the performance in this province is taken

forward and is leading in every single aspect and every single...

[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order! Order, hon member Davids.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And every single space across this province, Mr Deputy Speaker.

So without repeating too much of what has been said, perhaps and maybe talking about the hon Leader of the Opposition, who stands up and says, “We will bring the evidence.” That is what he said when he opened his speech, “We will bring the evidence.” He went on to crime. Well, where is the evidence of your party and either the existing Minister of Police or the previous two Ministers, signing the MOU post the Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry? Where is the evidence of that? Where is the real stuff that makes a difference in people’s lives when we deal with crime? Or if you think about the debate in this House, where people’s lives are affected around crime and in actual fact you cannot bring a debate here because it is because of an ANC failure that we have got this problem.

Stats SA and the report have been spoken about in this House, Mr Deputy Speaker, the figures are blunt. 30,4 million South Africans, 30,4 million South Africans of the 55 million citizens live in poverty in this country. A number that is worse than it was when President Zuma started his term of office. [Interjections.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: A number that gets totally or that is continually getting worse every single year that the ANC is in government in this country. Every single year this number gets worse and people get poorer. This issue which we are talking about today [Interjection.] talks about poor people in this country [Interjection.] and under ANC rule, people get poorer. If you read the report, now this is the report of the Statistician-General of the ANC Government. He says:

“Yet Government has maintained its policy course, regularly blaming global economic crisis and the country’s economic woes, repeatedly calling on others to try and fix it.”

They hold a policy conference which should deal with where the policy failures 24 years into... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Winde, just one second. Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Speaker ruled earlier that any person who continually interjected was going to be dealt with. Now hon member Olivier has been repeatedly spoken to from the Chair... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: Sit down.

Mr M G E WILEY: Now he has a constant running commentary. He leans behind the good hon member Gopie and then just runs a commentary continuously. [Interjections.] He distracts the speakers.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: We cannot continue like this.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Chief Whip, I will have a look specifically at him and also the hon member Davids, who is reaching the point of being a nuisance in the House now, continuous commentary across the floor. That is not allowed. Hon Minister Winde, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So the ruling party in this country holds a policy conference in order to examine where policy failure is not helping the poorest of the poor in our country. They have nothing to do with changing policies or even questioning themselves. It becomes a faction fight and what happens? The poorest of the poor of this country get poorer. [Interjection.]

The political party who is supposed to be making this difference, who says they are for constantly championing for the poor, continually fails the poor in this country.

So let us have a look at some of the other evidence. As the hon member Magaxa says, “We will bring the evidence.” The evidence in this space and the measurement, are things like jobs numbers or things like the Gini coefficient, if you want to talk about the difference between rich and poor. [Interjections.] So the Gini coefficient in East London, 0,75. The Gini coefficient in Bloemfontein and in Pietermaritzburg, 0,73. The Gini coefficient in Durban, 0,72. Not one ANC run space is below 7. It is all above 7. Cape Town, 0,67.

†’n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The best Gini coefficient in South Africa. Again, the key measurement and they failed dismally and that is what they try and bring for discussion.

These measurements are out of 109 countries in the world and this country under this rule of the ANC, is the worst in the world, scratching the barrel.

[Interjection.] Let us talk about jobs. Let us talk about jobs. In the last...

[Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Let us talk about... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: In the last year-on-year jobs, and a job brings dignity to someone. A job makes a difference in someone's life. The only province with jobs growth is the Western Cape with 6%, when this ANC cannot even get 1% growth in South Africa. [Interjection.] And in the rural areas of this province where the poorest of the poor live, it is 9,2%. [Interjections.]

Let us actually have it, the actual indicators. The unemployment rate quarter 2, 2016, 22%. This last quarter now, quarter 2, which came out last month, 20,7%. It dropped from 22,2. [Interjection.] Number of employed 649 000, of unemployed, dropped to 628 000. The number of employed, 2,26 million went up to 2,4 million.

Labour absorption rates in a space when the country is going into a recession, went from 51,9% to 53,9%, and labour participation rate went from 66,7% to 68%. Every single indicator shows positive, that makes a difference in the lives of the poorest of the poor. [Interjection.]

When we speak about the broad unemployment rate, there is not one province in South Africa, not one province, that has under 30% and of course there is only one province, two provinces that have 30% to 40% broad unemployment. All the rest of the ANC provinces are sitting over 40% and this province, broad, is sitting at 24%.

Now I ask you, Mr Deputy Speaker, this is how you make differences in people's lives. You cannot bring a debate here and ask about poverty and not

expect to get measured against other provinces and show where ANC policy differs from DA policy. That shows you where the difference is made in people's lives.

The hon member Schäfer spoke about this report that was done, an independent report on land reform, where we really make a difference in someone's life, where we actually have the apartheid era, that the hon member on that side spoke about now, which was the cause and we want to know what the difference is that the ANC is bringing to that 24 years later? [Interjections.] This report shows exactly where the problem is.

Ms S W DAVIDS: [Inaudible.]... 300 years.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It shows exactly where the problem is. No land transform, policy of no land ownership. Do you know that the ANC says you cannot own land?

You cannot own land and then it talks about elite capture and no leases. I have spoken about that a number of times in this House, but let me also answer the question about evictions and again, I will ask the hon member, as I have said in the past, give me the detail [Interjections.], give me the detail and I will work it out. ... [Interjection.]

Now she has quoted ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: She quoted a case from 2015. She raised that in 2015. She still has not given me that case since 2015. [Interjections.] She quoted her... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... second case in 2016. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order hon Minister Winde. Hon member Davids, that is not invite to a dialogue with the Minister. He is asking things, but you can do it afterwards in writing to him. Do not comment on all his remarks. Minister Winde, you may continue.

Mr D JOSEPH: 2015.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Winde, you may continue.

Ms T M DIJANA: Since 2015 he knows about it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry, Chief Whip?



Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, all the points that the hon member raised the Minister is responding to. So why is she outraged? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Why are you shouting?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, you may continue. You may finish off. [Interjections.] Order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So, Mr Deputy Speaker, in the words of the Leader of the Opposition, “We will bring the evidence.” So please bring me the evidence, because in this province, the only province with a Farmworker Support Unit, the only province that has now completed a farm worker household survey across the whole province and when we presented this to Minister Zokwana in a meeting on 9 August, he said to his officials, “This is amazing work, why do we not do this in any other province?”

But I say to you again, please bring me the evidence. Our unit will spring into action, because I do not [Interjection.] deny, I do not deny... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: That these things do not happen. I do not deny, and if they are

here in this House, I ask them to bring me the detail and the Farmworker Support Unit will jump on this case immediately.

An HON MEMBER: †Haibo. [No way!]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The Speaker of this House brought me an issue about two weeks ago, three weeks ago, in Grabouw. This issue was on a farm that was neglected. No one was living on the farm. The original owner of the farm had moved to a retirement village. Our unit went in and people were living on a farm, in a house, without a roof.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Winde, just finish off. Your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: They were not working on that farm. The owner of that farm, since our intervention, has now built houses for those people. He did not have to do that. He had - because we intervened ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... and found solutions and I tell you, bring me the evidence and we will react to it... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... which is different to other provinces. [Time expired.]  
[Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please come to order before I see the last speaker.  
Hon member Gillion.

†Me M N GILLION: Mnr Adjunkspeaker, kan ons terugkom Wes-Kaap toe?  
[Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, can we come back to the Western Cape?]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Ms M N GILLION: Today we heard what a good province the Western Cape is. How it is managed and what progress is made to address inequalities and how much is given to provide services to the poor. Moreover, we were told what this administration did to supposedly change the plight of the poor and mechanisms they had put in place to advance the socio-economic rights of the people of the Western Cape.

Sadly, Mr Deputy Speaker, this is grandstanding, simply part of airport advertising and disguise. [Interjections.] What we were shown here today is part of the DA's alternative Western Cape they wish to present to investors

and voters, but let us lift the veil.

It is in this real Western Cape where 25 children have been killed by men known to them, since the start of this year. I dare to ask what has the DA done to protect the rights of these young children who died the most horrific and violent deaths?

†Dit is in die regte Wes-Kaap wat die reg op lewe en die reg om groot te word in veiligheid en sekuriteit, nie die hoogste prioriteit van hierdie Regering is nie. [Tussenwerpsel.] [It is the real Western Cape where the right to life and the right to grow up in safety and security is not the highest priority of this Government.] †It is in this real Western Cape, Mr Deputy Speaker, where Maruwaan Thompson from Poeksebos, an informal settlement in Rylands, was burnt to death on Tuesday, and that left another 127 people homeless.

†Dit is in die regte Wes-Kaap waar mense huisloos gebore word en lewe om in daardie swak omstandighede te sterf. [It is in the real Western Cape where people are born without a home and live to die in those poor conditions.] It is in this real Western Cape where communities had to take the Western Cape Education Department to the Human Rights Commission and the Public Protector in their quest for adequate, decent and equal education.

It is also in this real Western Cape where people prefer even illegal schools than the lies of this Department. †In hierdie regte Wes-Kaap het mense nie

meer vryheid van beweging nie, want dan word hulle doodgeskiet omdat hulle in die baas se pad is, soos in Klawer. Dit is in die regte Wes-Kaap waar duisende leerders steeds sonder skool is, selfs na die eerste kwartaal van die skooljaar tot 'n einde gekom het, en die Wes-Kaap se Onderwysdepartement nie omgee vir daardie leerders nie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[In this real Western Cape the people have no more freedom of movement, because then they are shot dead because they are in the boss's way, as in Klawer. This is the real Western Cape where thousands of learners are still without school, even after the first quarter of the school year had come to an end, and the Western Cape Education Department did not care for those learners.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid, net een oomblik.

[THE DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, just a moment.] Hon member Schäfer?

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, this hon member is misleading the House when she cast aspersions about the incidents that happened in Klawer. It is basically... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ... untrue. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: It is untrue, for the record. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order! [Interjections.] Hon member Schäfer, you have made your point, but it is not a point of order. Hon member Gillion, you may continue.

Ms M N GILLION: I just hope my time was not messed with, Mr Deputy Speaker. †Mnr Adjunkspeaker, dis ook in dieselfde Wes-Kaap [Mr Deputy Speaker, it is also in the same Western Cape] where hospitals get closed and demolished, and alternatives are not provided in the same communities, but inconvenience them. Now they have to take two taxis and maybe a train to the nearest hospital.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You cannot build one hospital!

Ms M N GILLION: But is also where the plans for the very same hospital are not yet known and promises remain unfulfilled.

†In hierdie Wes-Kaap, waar die lyke op die Kaapse Vlakte daaglikse lê [Tussenwerpsel.], maar hierdie Regering wil gaan boer in ander provinsies...

[Tussenwerpsel.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[In this Western Cape, where the corpses on the Cape Flats lie daily  
[Interjection.], but this Government wants to go farming in other  
provinces...[Interjection.]]

†Mnr D JOSEPH: Nasionale... [Onhoorbaar.]

[Mr D JOSEPH: National...[Inaudible.]]

†Me M N GILLION: ... in ander provinsies wil hulle gaan boer.

[Ms M N GILLION: ... in other provinces they want to go farming.] †They  
want to go and say that in this province and that province and even in  
National Government this did not happen, to justify that they cannot deliver  
to the poorest of the poor in this province.

†n AGB LID: Sê jou Minister... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[An HON MEMBER: Tell your Minister...[Interjection.]]

†Me M N GILLION: Ek wil vandag sê die Wes-Kaap word deur die DA  
regeer. Regeer hier en hou op om te dink julle is uit hierdie Parlement uit  
die Opposisie vir Nasionaal. Julle het julle members daar wat Opposisie is.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Ms M N GILLION: I want to say today, the Western Cape is governed by the DA. Govern here and stop thinking that you are out of this Parliament and out of the Opposition for National. You have your members there who are Opposition.]

†Now, Mr Deputy Speaker, I just need to say to this House, as a member of this Legislature, it is my duty to keep this Western Cape Government accountable. Hiding the real Western Cape because of what is happening in another province, has lost its value. The people of this Western Cape, the real and the alternative, deserve better. We shall not be shouted down, intimidated or harassed to silence as the Opposition here, because you are running away from your responsibilities in governing this province. Running to the National Assembly and running into other provinces. I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

†n AGB LID: Mooi-mooi.

[An HON MEMBER: Good-good.]

†n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That concludes the debate on the subject. We move on to Interpellations on the Question Paper.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Where is the MEC?



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The first interpellation, hon member Dugmore to MEC Madikizela. I see Minister Madikizela.

## INTERPELLATIONS

### *Steenberg evictions*

#### **1. Mr C M Dugmore asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

What is the current situation at Steenberg where there have been repeated attempts to evict residents who stay in a property which is leased by his Department to a social housing company who in turn leases it to tenants?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I do want to say that the way this interpellation is asked, is very disturbing, because the way social housing works, is Steenberg is managed by a social housing company. It was not leased by the Department, but the way social housing works, which the hon member should be aware of, is that you have a contribution from National Department, through SHRA, and you have a contribution from the province, through the Human Settlements Development Grant, and then you have a contribution from the City of Cape Town that makes land available and then you have a 10% contribution from the Social Housing Institution, which in this case is SHRA. So I just wanted to correct the way the question is put by hon member... [Interjection.]

†UNksz P Z LEKKER: Yehaake titshala!

[Ms P Z LEKEKR: Oh yes, teacher!]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... Dugmore.

Now in 2016, Mr Deputy Speaker, a small group of tenants, about five of them, in support of about 20 people, started encouraging tenants in development to stop paying their rent. Deliberate confusion with respect to obligations to pay rent and options to own units in the development was created by this group. These events were also linked to some degree, to a political campaign in the ward in advance of a voter registration drive.

During this period a particular political party bussed in supporters from a settlement across the city, to the area between Steenberg Station and the housing development, where they staged a meeting, pretending to be unhappy tenants for the benefit of invited media representatives and they were not from there. They were bussed from other areas and they pretended to be the unhappy tenants.

Now [Interjection.] in April 2016, the Ward Councillor, Ms Marita Peterson, attended a meeting and initiated an arrangement for a larger public meeting, which was subsequently called off. A meeting was held between the organisers and myself in my office, and a schedule of complaints were laid which, on investigation, were found to be largely fabricated.

Now the Western Cape Provincial Department of Human Settlements subsequently organised a public meeting for interested tenants from the development, held at Coniston Hall on 5 May 2016. The meeting was addressed by me and the City of Cape Town Portfolio Committee Chair, together with SOHCO representatives. The meeting was successful in confirming the nature of the development as a social housing complex, which... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela, unfortunately your time has expired for this slot. You have another opportunity later.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you. ][Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I find it very, very worrying that the MEC appears to want to distance the province from this particular problem. In one breath he wants to distance, in the other breath he then concedes that the province, through the grant that he referred to, is directly involved.

What disturbs me further is the fact that the MEC knows that the manner in which this particular eviction, the first one I, through you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I called you about, MEC, and I appreciate the fact that you responded to the call, but what I and more importantly, the community, do

not appreciate, is that when you make a commitment to phone those affected, whose children were potentially being evicted before school started on that particular morning and when a commitment is made to me by an MEC of this Government, to call those people back and that commitment is not honoured, that is when the red lights begin to flicker.

So the MEC, with due respect, did respond to my call, but the promise that he made to call the community leaders on the day the first evictions were happening last month, he did not honour that commitment.

The reality is that the Freedom Charter says that there shall be housing, security and comfort. Yes, this is social housing, but what we want to know from the MEC is that when Government is involved we expect caring, governance and sustainable management.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You expect that from the DA?

Mr C M DUGMORE: And we know, and I want the MEC to please confirm this, that this social housing company pays R150 a year to the City. The MEC needs to tell us, what are the rentals? What are the profits and how was a Durban-based company... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yôh!

Mr C M DUGMORE: How was a Durban-based company given this particular

contract and what was the process and due diligence followed? Yes, MEC, that was in 2009. We hope that you will be able to give a – it is very clear here that what the community is asking for, which is a very progressive proposal that honours the clauses of the Freedom Charter and also the need for economic participation and ownership, is:

1. Cancel the SOHCO contract. What has the performance evaluation been every year since 2009?
2. Make an interim arrangement for the City to manage this project in the meantime.

And we would like to ask you, are you as bold as to agree that these tenants organising themselves into a cooperative, their own social housing company, should be given the opportunity to then run, own and administer this particular site? Can we do that? Can we put our confidence in the vast majority of people to actually make a genuine, empowered social housing initiative possible?

That is what the community have asked and, MEC, we would like you to rise to the challenge and agree to take the hands of the community, because if we have... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... partnership, if we have control... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, finish off.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... we will have cooperation and success. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired. The hon member Maseko.

Mr D JOSEPH: The ANC will not do that.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is quite a difficult interpellation to really debate, because we are already speaking about Durban and we have the interpellation that we have to talk about.

As a Standing Committee [Interjections.] Chairperson, we always say that it is vital for all stakeholders that are involved in the delivery of houses. We have said we need the buy-in from every sector to make housing a possibility in the Western Cape. We have different options that include the rental stock and this option is quite ideal for a family who might not be able to qualify for a home loan from the bank, because they earn too much to qualify for a free house or they – I do not even want to debate this topic, because it is – we do have members of the ANC in the Standing Committee, that always promote the issue of the rental stock, that we need to have rental stock to be able to give houses to those people that do not qualify for social housing, for those people who do not qualify for free housing, hon member Dugmore.

[Interjection.]

Now when it comes to rental stock, private partnerships play a vital role. If I look at the interpellation, the problem is why do we involve a private partnership? But we have to take the burden of managing and maintaining the Government units. That is not our core business. The private partner also keeps a record so that the Government is aware of the families' social situations and should an intervention be needed, it can be addressed.

Furthermore, the rental units generate revenue so that we can be able to increase the housing budget as [Interjection.] we know that a lot of money is being wasted by the ANC ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms L M MASEKO: ... run Government, that we should buy houses ...  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member, your time has expired. Just finish off.

Ms L M MASEKO: Okay. Before I sit down and stop being howled at, Mr Deputy Speaker, again, [Interjections.] I am saying that we really have to have partnerships... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time has expired.

Ms L M MASEKO: ... in the Government. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you. I think this approach by the last speaker indicates exactly the political bankruptcy... [Interjection.]

Ms S W DAVIDS: Yes.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... of the DA and essentially an anti-poor attitude. Since 2009 residents of Steen Villa have themselves been paying, the vast majority, R4 000 a month. The hon member is now talking ... [Interjection.] about generating profit from Steen Villa. The reality is if people have been paying over many, many years and the proposal of the community themselves, those tenants that are there, to run a cooperative, to manage this facility, to maintain it, why should it just be that these tenants who have been paying all these years, should also not benefit?

So what we hear from hon member Maseko, who clearly was completely unprepared for this debate, it was actually quite embarrassing ... [Interjection.] that the community, and this is what we are putting directly to the MEC - explain to us what percentage of the residents have been paying, how much and for how long? And would there not be an argument that this community of people who are there, who have lives in the Steenberg area, who operate, whose children go to school, why can we not think beyond? Do



you agree with hon member Maseko that the objective here is to generate profits? Because that is what she actually said. [Interjection.] That is what you said and I hope you will distance yourself from that, MEC, through the Deputy Speaker.

So we here have an opportunity to give houses, security and comfort to a community in Steenberg. Surely we can rise to this challenge and begin to go further to identify the municipal land, the provincial property, the national property and really begin to densify and integrate the City. MEC, we know that your Department wanted the Tafelberg site to be used for social housing but you were clearly overruled by the Premier, because there was clearly an attempt to sell that privately.

Let us realise that housing is a right in our Constitution and that we should protect... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr C M DUGMORE: ... the security of tenure of our tenants. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, your time has expired. Hon member Simmers?

Mr T A SIMMERS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Listening to the input of hon member Dugmore and the MEC, it is quite notable that the emphasis of

hon member Dugmore's message falls in caring and he mentioned an example of possibly creating a cooperative with the tenants. Now as caring leaders, irrespective from which party we come, why can we not then come together at one table... [Interjection.]

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

Mr T A SIMMERS: ... and discuss it? That will be the obvious thing to debate. Not to over politicise things at all times, because we are all leaders that care for the people that have elected us here. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Dugmore again.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think that what we have just heard from hon member Simmers is a breath of fresh air in this House.

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

Mr C M DUGMORE: It is a significant improvement on the unprepared input that the hon Chairperson of the Committee actually made, because that is exactly the point. The MEC himself has said, "National is involved here, the province, the City and obviously the tenants, and in this case the social housing company." That is exactly how we are supposed to act as members of the three spheres of government, but we have a situation where the DA

blames and complains. Where the DA, even if the crayfish walk out of the sea in Lamberts Bay, the DA wants to blame the ANC for that. [Laughter.] †Dis onaanvaarbaar. [It is unacceptable.]

We have to get to a position to solve this problem in the interests of those tenants whose children are affected by evictions, where armed people come there, with guns, with stun grenades and so on. Surely we can hold hands together and deal with this through our colleagues here, comrade Davids, comrade Dyantyi and others who are dealing with the housing and local government issues? If that is an offer, hon member Simmers, let us hope the MEC is going to respond to that proposal and that we set up a committee to actually go and deal with this, and speak to the community and listen to them.

We do not need evictions, we need a solution to this problem and we really need to take hands, and I hope that what hon member Simmers has said has, I do not know which faction he belongs to in the DA, but I think the proposal that he made [Interjections.] is a very reasonable one.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Order. Minister Madikizela?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the populous comments from Dugmore reveal ... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Hon member Dugmore.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... a deep lack of understanding of how social... [Interjection.]

Ms T M DIJANA: Honourable.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... housing works.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. The hon member Dugmore.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon member Dugmore.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now his populous comments are revealing a really deep lack of understanding of how social housing works. Sir, we have 16 programmes within our housing codes and those programmes cater for different income categories. So social housing is not for what you are proposing we should do. It is not for ownership.

Now if people [Interjection.] – no-no, no, can I finish? Can I finish? Now let me then speak to some of the allegations that you are making about how this Durban company got to be appointed. When we call for proposals we do not limit them to the one province, hon member Dugmore. We work with five social housing institutions across the country and by the way, SOHCO, like all the social housing institutions, is an accredited social housing institution

[Interjection.], which is a partnership – I did not disturb when you were talking.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Did the Durban company pay for your birthday...  
[Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... which has an agreement with... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Minister Madikizela, just one second.  
Hon Deputy Chief Whip.

Mr D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think the member must give the Minister a chance to answer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I agree. I will ensure the Minister has ample opportunity to finish his speech. Minister Madikizela, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now this company, like all other companies, has a partnership with the Department and the City of Cape Town. This development was made available to SOHCO by the City of Cape Town on a lease basis and social housing institutions are not Government entities, just to make it clear, but they are regulated by SHRA and established in terms of Social Housing Act. That is the first thing.

The second thing, hon member Dugmore, is that please do not mislead this House. Bring the proof here that someone is paying R4 000 here, because in terms of this Act, tenants are required to pay between 25% and 30% of their income.

Now social [Interjection.] – can I finish? Social housing caters for people previously, who used to earn R1 500 to R7 500, and we have since amended that. Now it caters for people who are earning between R3 500 and R15 000. So no one is paying R4 000. So please, if there is someone who is paying R4 000 please bring that information to the fore.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela, order, your... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Unless that person... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... time has expired.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... is in arrears. So... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela, order. Your time unfortunately has... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... this is how social housing

works. Not what hon member Dugmore is saying. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... has long expired. We move on to the second interpellation.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo to Minister Winde. I see Minister Winde.

*Employment Equity Report 2017: improvements thereon*

**2. Ms N D Nkondlo asked the Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development and Tourism:**

Whether he has any plans to improve the employment equity report for 2017, specifically at Top Management and Professional Qualified levels at EOTA and Wesgro?

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker, and thank you very much to the hon member for the question. I am a little bit confused with the question, because if you read it, it says:

“Whether he has any plans to improve the employment equity report of

2017.”

and I just presume that that is this report. But then the question goes on to say:

“Specifically at Top Management and Professional Qualified levels of the EOTA.”

which I presume is Economic Opportunities, Tourism and Agriculture. So the two are quite different. If the question is this, then the answer is yes, quite detailed in the annual report, or in our performance plan going forward.

If the question is more about my Department and I presume so, because if I look at the question that the hon member asked to the Premier last week ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is for both.

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: .... it said and I quote... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is for both. Answer now.

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Well:



“What is she doing about the disproportionately high white representation in management on the Professionally Qualified staff levels in the province?”

and so I presume you are saying the very high white component of my Department? I presume that is what you are asking me on? The very high white component.

So if that is the question, then I need to ask the hon member, as a member of this House, to ask me or to please advise me on the plan, because if I look at, so if I go straight out and I say okay, what should the plan be at Wesgro... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He has got no answer...[Inaudible.].

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... where it is four white top management to five black, or in Agri where, let us divide it into male and female. So at top management level in male I have got seven white, seven black, or at female I have got six black and two white, or if I look at the whole Department, from a male point of view, I have got 353 employees in the Department of Agriculture that are black and 140 that are white, or, and those are male, or female which is 342 black and 87 that are white, or 227 white to 695 black.

Okay, so I do not know how the disproportionately white high comes in there

and then of course my Department of Economic Development, which is in top management, in male I have 10 top managers of which nine are black and one is white.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Ja.

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: That is male, and in female I have 11 top managers of which 10 are black and one is white. Now I do not know what the plan is that the hon member is asking me about.

Is the plan to get to a quota system? And if that is true, then what I would like to ask the hon member, is when we appear before the House at the annual report stage, which is coming up very soon, that she please helps me to tell me which black employees in my Department I need to give marching orders to so that I can fill it with white, if we are going to a quota system, because in actual fact my Department is totally skewed in favour of black and not in favour of white.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo.

Mr M G E WILEY: Try and get around that one. [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, and thank you Minister for your response.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Or non response.

Ms N D NKONDLO: It is my understanding, hon Minister, that when we are talking or referring to employment equity, race is just one of those elements and the fact that you decide to choose to only deal with the issue of race, which is the white males, in your response is puzzling, because one of the things I raised in my question was top management level. Indeed there is skewed or over-representation, first, of males and a seriously under-representation of females.

Again the issue of disability which I would be interested in, if the Minister has got that. That is why the question is asking if there are any plans and some of those plans, hon Minister, if indeed you are looking for advice, some of those plans, if you look at the Board, in particular, of Wesgro, is when you look at succession planning of institutions, Wesgro being a State-owned entity, I am sure when you open up for Board recruitment, these are some of the ways that you are able to if you are interested.

So I am not sure what is it that you do not understand if you look at employment equity, because employment equity does not only focus on race, it looks at equitable representation and also practices to try and promote workplace transformation.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Beverley Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I think the Minister has answered the question. I also get a little bit confused that this becomes a debate when... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So both of you are now confused.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ... it is a straight question, but - maybe you should listen hon member... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, both of you are...[Inaudible.].

Ms B A SCHÄFER: But I looked at the workforce profile for the Western Cape by race and gender, and obviously as my colleague across the House said, it does not always talk about race... [Interjection.] but she has a point on the issue generally and I cannot talk about the Minister's Department, but generally in the Western Cape, obviously there is a disparity with women coming through at top level management. We have recognised that. We sat in the International Women's Conference and we talked about that need, that women across South Africa are not given opportunities as they should be.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is that your... [Inaudible.].

Ms B A SCHÄFER: But we have also noticed that - if I look from top management all the way down to unskilled, there certainly is a process.

So my point really is that without the expansion of opportunities, inclusion, meaning general inclusion, is relegated to a zero sum game at the cost of some and the cost of others. We believe that in an inclusive society, Government has to focus its policy interventions on expanding those economic opportunities and creating jobs through growth, which we do and we have to look at this across South Africa, and I am not talking specifically as any criticism to this province, because we certainly do.

Our policies require that we have policy certainty and we need to ask that at National Government level. We need policy certainty, we need clean government, we need excellent education, we need appropriate skills training and we need effective healthcare and reliable, efficient delivery of basic services.

This all leads to employment equity in the long run. It means that governments have to play a central role in creating the conditions to achieve rapid sustained economic growth and laying down that groundwork for redress, and I think that is what the important point is here; that we are certainly on track to achieving those goals. We need to look at the whole of South Africa though, because we are failing dismally at a South African level. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Something that we

always have to deal with here in the House is the challenge that when you are asking a question, hon members on the other side have got this tendency of trying to create a decoy and you go all over the world, instead of just trying to respond on the one issue that is on the table.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hulle is uitgevang. [Onhoorbaar.]

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: They have been caught out. [Inaudible.]]

Ms N D NKONDLO: And that is why I asked if there is a plan. One would be interested to know how the current HR policies in the Department look at promoting disability, so that people who are living with disabilities are able to see the Department of Economic Opportunities and Agriculture, Wesgro as an employer of choice.

Again, if you look at women, the disparity that hon member Schäfer also acknowledges - and I take note that in one of the departments, I think the Economic Department, there is currently an active Chief-Director position which I am sure is going to be filled at a certain point - I am asking what are some of the initiatives in the Department in terms of your HR, your recruitment policies, your selection policies? How do they ensure they create the necessary environment to attract this particular grouping and that is the question. Are there plans in regard to that?

I hear what hon member Schäfer is raising, which I am sure if we were in a conference debating generally about issues of ensuring workplaces are

equitable, those comments would be welcomed. Thanks.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Schäfer?

Mr B A SCHÄFER: Thanks, Mr Deputy Speaker. I just want to say and I am obviously going to be political here, because we do have a plan.

An HON MEMBER: †Haibo! [No way!]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] supposed to be political.

Mr B A SCHÄFER: We have the DA policy on Economic Inclusion. [Interjections.] And that is the point. We do have a plan. [Interjections.] Our Ministers carry out this plan and this policy that sits in the Democratic Alliance, and I just want to say and I am going to say, the DA's approach to economic inclusion and empowerment is as such, firstly expanding opportunity, which we do. Empowering South Africans for participation through education, skills and access to services... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Are you calling that oversight?

Mr B A SCHÄFER: ... which we do. Redress in the plan for growth and jobs, which we know that we are doing, and incentivising business to contribute to redress. This is the plan that we have got. We are managing this plan and we are implementing it in this province. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Again the hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think the explanation from hon member Schäfer is bringing emotions to this point, which I am sure are somewhat unnecessary, because I think the question, given the high-level plan of the DA that she is mentioning, is really how that plan gets to be operationalised and how are we seeing the results. Because what we are talking about here is what you are saying at a high-level where you plan and you think this is the kind of Western Cape that you want to see, where indeed people across calibre, across gender, are seeing this province as a world of opportunity. [Interjection.]

How does it translate to real policies in the Department and here in question is the HR policy, to ensure the result, because the result is in your employment profile in this Department. That is what we are debating. I am not arguing about the DA policy – we are asking for that particular DA policy to get to a point where it is realised, because it cannot be a dream, remember? It cannot be a dream.

So all I am asking, hon Minister, once again, I have asked if there is a plan? That high-level plan is not translating into a result at this particular point of showing in the current staffing compaction insofar as gender, in particular, and disability. So what one is raising is how your HR policies are able to ensure that that disproportionate reality is actually changed? Thank you.



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister Winde to respond.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Yes, there is a plan. The plan is very successful and has been implemented already. I mean, there are some areas where I agree with you.

I think with disability, there is definitely some work to be done, but quite frankly you spoke about we are filling a position in the Department of Economic Development at the moment. If I have to put the filling of that post according to the plan, I have to employ a white male. [Interjection.]

If I have to go according to the plan. I am beyond that plan. I am way beyond that plan. Now what we do and it does not matter if the person coming to apply for that job is black and female, and they are the best person, they will get the job over and above the white male, because I will not go according to the plan in that space. I will go according to the best person, because I have finished with that plan and I will give you those numbers again, and you said to me, after I gave you the answer, you said do not give it to me in black and white, what about male and female and disability?

Well, let us go to male and female, which I gave you in that first answer. So at the moment in that Department I have 84 males, 84. How many females do I have in the Department? 124.

Ms S W DAVIDS: And in senior management?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: In top management I have 10 males and 11 females. More than 50% is female in that Department. That is better than what the ANC policy asks for.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Better than what the ANC policy asks for. I do not know what more you want me to do. I have a plan, the plan has delivered, it has delivered outstanding requirements according to your policy. [Interjections.] I do not know what more you want me to do. Quite frankly I just do not get it. [Interjections.]

But I do agree with you if you start to talk to this plan. Now that is a different plan, because my Department is sorted. We do not have to worry about that. We do not have to worry about that. We can be very proud, whether you are Opposition or Government in this House, of what that representation looks like.

Mr D JOSEPH: Well done.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: You can all be proud of that, but in this space we have got lots of work to do, because you have a look at how many young females are coming through in the ICT sector. Not sufficient. To fill the demands of the fourth industrial revolution, we need to make sure more young females are taking maths.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: We need to make sure more young people... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... are choosing the ICT sector for their future careers and we all have a role to play in doing that. [Time expired.]

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Winde, your time has expired unfortunately. That brings us to the end of Interpellations. We move on to Questions for Oral Reply. The first one is Question 9 standing over from Thursday. Hon member Gillion to Minister Fritz. I see Minister Fritz.

**QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

*Question standing over from Thursday, 17 August 2017, as agreed to by the House:*

*Murders of children in the province*

**9. Ms M N Gillion asked the Minister of Social Development:**

With reference to the 25 children in the province who have reportedly been brutally murdered by 31 July 2017:

What is his Department doing to have this matter investigated and to ensure the appointment of a Children's Commission in the province?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Before I answer this question I just want to say to the House and to all members on both sides, I want to say thank for allowing the question, hon member Gillion, to stand over and thanks for understanding the context in which it is standing over. I also want to say to every member from both sides of the House thank you for the support that you rendered through a very difficult time. I see the hon member Tyatyam, with a very interesting suit, who actually personally came to the police station on that particular day.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.]... answer the question now.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: Blue!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And – it is a blue suit incidentally, ja.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It is very nice.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: So thanks for the...  
[Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Answer the question now.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Can I - Mr Deputy Speaker can I answer the question, because... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I will protect... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... there is another speaker in the House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... you from the hon member Dyantyi. Yes, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Before I swear at him again

and then I get [Laughter.], and I am very, I am very religious now. So I am – you know.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please stay calm, Minister Fritz, and proceed.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I do not swear anymore here. [Laughing.] Thanks. [Interjections.] Thank you. The hon Premier of the Western Cape, hon Helen Zille, and myself [Interjection.] as the Minister of Social Development, have decided to convene a meeting of non-governmental organisations specialising, and I want to emphasise, specialising in child protection to discuss the way forward regarding the recent spate of child murders in the province.

In the *Daily Maverick* column of 14 August 2017, the Premier wrote and she rightly pointed out that:

“Research has shown that at least 900 children were murdered in South Africa in 2016/17. Although the number was slightly higher in the Western Cape than other provinces, the problem remains a countrywide problem.”

In the light of this, I trust and hope, the hon ANC member - I think we need to also just sensitise all our colleagues throughout South Africa around the issue of child and women murders. The Department of Social Development has noted a pattern emerging from incidents in the Western Cape whereby in

almost all cases, as the hon member earlier pointed out, the perpetrators are known and usually trusted by the victim and their families.

Police investigations have shown this. Perpetrators range from neighbours, landlords, lodgers, ex-boyfriends and even the fathers of some of the victims. Many perpetrators were under the influence of alcohol or drugs when they committed their crimes and so some acted out of revenge against their partner, and it just goes on and on and on.

My Department will support the Premier in her plans to convene a meeting of stakeholders who are actively involved in child protection issues, and I want to make this point. A number of other organisations also emerged who are not working in this space. It is important that the child protection people come out and our NGO's come out. I expect greater insights to be gained from this exercise, especially as she will also seek their response to her proposal for an in-depth expert study into the six child murders, murder cases that happened in the province.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Minister Fritz answered only the one part of the question. The second part of the question is what is his Department doing to appoint the Children's Commission in this province. I am not satisfied that you answered that question.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you for asking that, because the study where we talk about missing children will help us to determine whether a formal Commission of Inquiry must be called for and whether it is appropriate, and I think we want to find the kind of evidential kind of burden or evidence to call that Commission of Inquiry or whether there are other more effective steps the Provincial Government can take within its constitutional mandate to help prevent child murders.

The study will document what is known about each case, analyse the details and use comparable international studies to recommend solutions. Meanwhile the Western Cape Government continues to facilitate extensive programmes aimed at child protection and welfare services in the province.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion, a second chance and then I will come back to hon member Wenger.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is known in this House that the process was followed through. †Nee, *no man*, ek verwys nou daar na die [No, no man, I am now referring to the] Public Participation Process and that report came to this House. The people of the Western Cape said no, we are not going to change the Constitution of the Western Cape, we will keep this section within the Constitution of the Western Cape and this Western Cape must appoint the Children's Commission.

Now my question to the hon MEC is, when that report came in, my Chairperson over there can assist me, and I am very clear Mr Deputy



Speaker, when I talk about these issues, I do not play politics with it; it is a constitutional mandate for this Government and I am asking the MEC for the last time, what is he doing in his Department? I am not talking about an inquiry, I am not talking about that because the Premier answered that and it is now a contradicting answer because there are two answers from the Premier already. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you ...[Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: My question to the MEC is what is he and his Department doing to make sure that the constitutional obligation is being fulfilled?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister Fritz?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I must remind the hon member of the question, I will read the question for you and see whether you can make sense of it. The question reads: "What is the Department doing to have this matter investigated and to ensure the appointment of a Children's Commission in this province". A Children's Commission. Now I thought you were referring to a commission of inquiry because a commission and a commissioner are two different things.

Ms M N GILLION: Children's Commissioner.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: But that is a different

question.

Ms M N GILLION: It is not a different question.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: No, a commission of inquiry like a number of NGOs are asking us to do. I am answering on the basis of what NGOs are asking us around ... [Interjections.]. Can I just answer the question quickly?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order.

Mr P UYS: It is a follow-up.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: What they are asking? I am saying what you read now, it says a commission and it sounds like a commission of inquiry which is one thing but now that the hon member talks about a commissioner, I can help her and answer [Inaudible.].

Ms M N GILLION: We are talking about the Western Cape Commissioner.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: No, let me just try and answer your question, excuse me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Allow the Minister to now answer these questions properly.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Because it went out and they know that the Children's Commissioner went out and they know that the public and public hearings said that they want the Commissioner and in fact our Cabinet the other day, on Wednesday, approved the final Green Paper to go out for public comment because there is now a draft that is going out for public comment calling for a Commissioner. Some of the hon members in the Premier's Committee will remember there were four models that were used and they decided on one model so that is now going out for public comment and that is the final. That is a draft that is going out for public comment and then when that comes back, of course - but that is the Premier's Department which we support of course, completely.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon member Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. In keeping with the question on constitutional mandates I would like to ask the Minister whether the Family Violence Child Protection and Sexual Offences Police Unit is investigating these 25 infanticides and if so, whether the under-resourcing of this unit is perhaps impacting on the police's ability to investigate ...  
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms M M WENGER: ... these child murders? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Minister I am allowing you to respond if you want to, it sounds like a different question but you may.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I want to. I think it is an important follow-up question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Minister just one second, just one second. Hon member Wenger?

Ms M M WENGER: Mr Deputy Speaker, if you read the question it says " ...with reference to the 25 children in the province who have reportedly been brutally murdered, what is the Department doing to have the matter investigated ..."

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I have already ruled.

Ms M M WENGER: ... so that is clearly in line with the question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That it is okay. The Minister may proceed.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: So the Department works very closely with the South African Police Service and the NPA, I want to emphasise. We have just seen a case fall through the cracks. There was just a case now where two people, two men walked free after the child was killed. Yes, we work very closely and yes, that is exactly the reason why the men

walked free because of a lack of police resources and policemen to properly investigate cases, so that they can get a proper case, they can get a conviction in a court of law and they can send people to prison for life. Thanks for the question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move on to the next question which is Question 7, also standing over from Hon Botha to minister Fritz. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you hon Botha for the question. Just to say that we have supported every single family. You know in every case when a child is murdered and even in a case where once, a social worker went out and she came back and said, "Oh, the people do not want trauma counselling." I said we will personally go back and advise them properly to provide services such as trauma counselling and we have done that in all cases and in certain cases we also supported them with funerals. In fact, in most cases, we supported them with the funeral costs because many of the people honestly do not expect their children to die so early.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up? Can we move on? Hon member Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Mr Deputy Speaker I just want to ask the hon Minister in terms of trauma counselling for these families, is it done by the Department or is it done by NGOs or MPOs that are stakeholders within the Department?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you. It is a mixture of the two where an NGO operates within a particular geographical area, they will do it but in many of these cases our own social workers did the counselling and trauma counselling and we also develop relationships with people, where I personally got to know some of the people very well.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Botha, your second opportunity?

Ms L J BOTHA: Hon Minister can you tell this House in terms of the counselling, especially by stakeholders, for these families, are there any costs incurred by the families to undergo the counselling and is it once-off or is it sessions that families attend on a regular basis and how many sessions would that be that the family would undergo?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes, of course, on a case by case basis. There is no generic approach to it and †foeitog die arme mense, [shame, the poor people,] as I said they do not even have money for a funeral so it would be criminal to charge them anything for service, for some kind of trauma counselling. The trauma counselling is completely free and the length of it will depend on a personal individual assessment of the matter, of that particular person. Some people need more, like me, I need far more counselling from hon Tyatyam, than when that is one person or one case.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Makaleni first.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister I would like to know if you have been to all these families to show moral support?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes, I have been to most. On Friday evenings when all of you are having your little parties I am still in areas where [Inaudible.] but I have been to most. I cannot say all, but I have been to most cases.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The last opportunity to hon member Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to say to the MEC but the Strand family did not get any of it, not counselling, not support, nothing. When they were seeking support the organisations were charging them money, up until now, they did not get anything.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gopie I take it your statement is in the form of a question to the Minister? Yes, thank you hon Minister. You may respond.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I must say I will really investigate that. Are you are talking about the Strand case?

Ms D GOPIE: The Strand.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I will really investigate that because that is completely unacceptable.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to the next question, new questions. First new question, hon Dugmore to Minister Schäfer, Minister Schäfer?

*New Questions:*

*Grove Primary School: allegations against principal and treasurer*

**1. Mr C M Dugmore asked the Minister of Education:**

Whether there has been an investigation into the allegations made against the principal and the treasurer of the School Governing Board of the Grove Primary School; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, through you. Yes, there was an investigation as you know hon member, because I have responded to this question before in this House. There were some issues that were found to be problematic in respect of the budget process last year, but nothing that justified invalidating it. The Department is working with the school to ensure that no such issues occur this year.

Subsequent to that investigation the same parent has made some further allegations, a number of these are issues that relate to the management and



governance of the school and are simply issues that he does not agree with. There are a few matters that are being looked into still by my Department and on which I expect a report by the end of October.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Can I ask a follow-up question? Could the MEC confirm that an investigation was completed and that she has received a copy of that investigation from her officials?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: As I say we did an investigation and I have received two different reports from two different sections of my Department.

The DEPUTY MINISTER: Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Would the MEC make those two reports available to myself?

The DEPUTY MINISTER: Hon Minister and then I will see the hon member Kivedo afterwards. First the Minister to respond.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I will have to take legal advice on that matter, if they agree I will happily do so, if not then no.

The DEPUTY MINISTER: Hon member Kivedo first and then I will give the hon member Dugmore an opportunity.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Minister Schäfer do you have any powers as the MEC to act against a member of the school governing body?

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much, hon member Kivedo. The governing body is supposed to take action against any of their own members if they are guilty of any misconduct, so I do not have any such power. My Head of Department can suspend or remove a member of the governing body but only after a due process has been followed in terms of the Code of Conduct by the governing body.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Can the MEC confirm whether a letter from the National Department of Basic Education about this matter has been sent either to her or to her Head of Department and if so, what is the content and recommendation of that particular letter?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I very recently received a letter from the National Deputy Minister who is asking for information in relation to the same matter which I will respond to but have not yet had an opportunity to do so.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to the second question, we have used all four opportunities on this one. Second question, hon member Dugmore again to minister Schäfer. Minister Schäfer?

*High schools: school halls*

**2. Mr C M Dugmore asked the Minister of Education:**

(a) What are the names of the high schools in the province that do not have school halls and (b) which schools have been earmarked to be assisted to build school halls in the (i) 2017/18 and (ii) 2018/19 financial years?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The answer to section (a) of the question is that the WCED has 46 high schools without a school hall. I have the names. Would the hon member be happy if I table those names? Thank you very much. The second part (b) 1 is that the WCED plans to assist the following schools in 2017/18:

- Ashton Secondary School
- Bonteheuwel Secondary School
- Kairos Secondary School

- Portlands Senior Secondary, that has just been completed
- Parkhurst Primary
- Ferndale Primary
- Ridgeview Primary
- Northpine Primary
- Kerria Primary
- Sir Lowry's Pass Primary and
- Pelican Park Secondary School

And the second part of that question is that the priority list for halls for 2018/19 is still being finalised.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Could I ask the MEC to explain to the House briefly what the policy is, given the fact that for instance the only high school in the Hessequa constituency which did not have a hall was Kairos and we obviously are very happy that Kairos is one of those schools who will have a hall and construction has in fact started. I would like to ask in regard to primary schools in particular, given that Melkhoutfontein Primary in the Hessequa Municipality does not have a school hall, is there a difference in terms of the priorities for high schools and primary schools, in terms of making a decision about which school should get a hall or not?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I think that is a new question. I can get the answer to that from our Department. I do not have the policy with me at the moment, they use various criteria depending on the circumstances of each matter.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, your second opportunity and then I will come back to hon member Mitchell.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you for that response, Mr Deputy Speaker and also the commitment of the MEC to provide that information. I would like to then further ask in regard to each one of these schools, what is the contribution (a) of the school itself, (b) of the Department and (c) Garden Cities, who are the partners in this initiative, which was actually started by the ANC in this province?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you for that question. School halls, they vary, there are some that are built by the Archway Foundation Programme and there are others that are not. We have built new schools with halls from 2009 till today, we built 95 of those at the Department's cost as opposed to the ANC's 32 when they were in power. School halls built by the Archway Foundation with the Mod Centre Programme has been 22 by the ANC and we have built 74 with another 11 in planning and construction for 2017/18. So a lot of them are Archway Foundation but certainly a lot of them

are done by the Department.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mitchell?

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Can the hon Minister please advise us how many schools were built during the ANC administration compared to the current DA administration? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much for that question. It is important to notice that when schools are replaced, very often those schools do not have halls as part of their schools, so we do build, replacement schools do include halls. We, as I said, have built 95 halls since 2009/10 which include new and replacement schools, most of which would not have had halls. Sixty-nine (69) of those were replacement schools and 26 were new schools which add up to the 95. So as I say compared to the ANC's new schools with halls we have built three times as many. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we move on to hon member Dugmore, the last opportunity.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you. Could I ask the MEC: given that the Melkhoutfontein Primary School near Stilbaai has in fact managed to raise

close to R250 000 from a donor, would the Minister give this House the commitment, that given both myself and member Joseph and the Mayor and the ANC councillors in the area support this initiative, is she prepared to give a commitment that in terms of the 2018/2019 year that Melkhoutfontein Primary will be prioritised?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you for that. I cannot give that ...  
[Interjections.] May I answer?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. I cannot hear the Minister's reply.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I cannot give a commitment that it will definitely be done because I do not know what plans my Department has, but I can give the undertaking that I will certainly discuss it with them and see if it is possible.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move onto the next question. Hon member Botha to hon Minister Mbombo. Minister Mbombo?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you for the question. The Western Cape does not capture statistics of how many teenagers fall pregnant. However we use the proxy when we collate information related to the number of deliveries of women younger than 18 years of age and also for the termination of pregnancy for women younger than 18 years and then we add it up.

Now for 2014/15 there were 5,894 teenagers out of 93,923 deliveries which is about 6.2%. In the 2015/16 year there were 6,899 under 18's that were pregnant out of 91,153 which is about 5.7%. In the 2016/17 budget year there were 6,964 out of 88,121 deliveries which is about 5.9%.

Now the second question on programmes. We have various programmes. For example, we have got 13 adolescent and youth-friendly service points in addition to the other services of which 8 are in the Metro. Five (5) are in the rural areas where they are specifically teenage friendly and also through PSG.

We have to look in terms of empowering the girl child so that we do not wait until the girl child is pregnant or when the girl child is pregnant. I mentioned here that we have got a young women and girls project that we are piloting in the Metro and then we are funded by the Global Fund.

In addition to that we also have other services for example, the mini-pill which is part of the contraceptives we do offer, especially for those who are breast-feeding. We also have oral contraceptives, the normal ones and injectables. We initiated the intrauterine device which is a long acting reversible contraceptive, which takes up to 5 years in terms of its effectiveness and we also introduced implants that offer three years' protection and can be removed should the patient wish to start a family. We also have expanded medical termination services in most of our primary health care facilities. Thank you.



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Gillion?

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you to the MEC for that update. It is very alarming that every year it is going up. Now the question is, your advocacy programmes and research that is done by the Department, because your answer is saying to us that every year, for the last three years, the pregnancy teenage rate has grown ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT. It is coming down. It is coming down?

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, can I be protected from the MEC?  
[Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I did not hear anything which is threatening.

Mr P UYS: Carry on sleeping.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may continue.

Ms M N GILLION: Yes thank you. Now, Minister do you have a plan that you work with the Department of Education in the Western Cape and an advocacy project to assist us in these figures?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you. Just a caution, the figures are in

proportion to the population so I did not provide the population of women who are in their reproductive age which is from around 15 to 49. You have to look at the denominator which is the total deliveries, taking into consideration that the population in the Western Cape from 2014 to 2016 has changed. So therefore it is difficult to make a judgement and conclusion whether they have increased or not.

However you will get certain areas where you will have an increase that is above the normal average of the province. For example in areas like Mitchells Plain, Nyanga, Gugulethu, Manenburg, Heideveld, Cross Roads, Hanover Park and Athlone is where we have seen such an increase. Hence, I introduced the Young Women and Girls Project and it has got 8 sub-projects where it focuses on all age groups; the Soul Buddies, from primary school. We work with the Department of Education and do it during school hours.

With the high school group, Rise Up which is also with the Department of Education. In addition to that for post-schooling because they are not necessarily at universities but staying at home but they have completed formal schooling - 19 to 24 year olds, the Women of Worth which we started this year.

The focus is on grass roots, not only the uptake of reproductive services, but also empowerment so that they are able to make informed decisions in order to reverse their decisions if there are 'at risk' decisions.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to the next question, is there a follow-up? Just stand up so that I can see who. Hon member Makaleni, you may proceed.

Ms P MAKALENI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I thought you could see me. Hon Minister, does the Department know how many of them are involved in using drugs and if there are any programmes to ensure that this does not affect the babies?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The whole package of Sexual and Reproductive Health Services is inclusive and not only about unprotected sex or sexual issues but it encompasses gender based violence as well as all other at risk behaviours, inclusive of alcohol and the drugs. As you know, when you are under the influence your decisions in terms of having unprotected sex are far greater than others. So it is part of the package around that.

But in terms of the number, again, when a teenager is asking for, or coming for help, you journey with that person, so you do not say let me test whether you are using or not. So any young person, whether we know they are using or not, we take a high risk so it is part of the whole package that we are providing. And also with those that are already pregnant. Those already pregnant also attend a teenage parenting programme where they come with their mothers, parents as well in terms of the parent, teenage relationship because in most instances, you will find that some of these young mothers, they are grandmothers themselves, they are very young so it is a whole

package.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No further follow-up questions? The hon Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Can I just ask the hon Minister: the programmes you are referring to, how long have they been taking place and have they reached the stage of evaluation to check whether those programmes are yielding any results?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The others, except Men of Worth started in 2016. They are funded by the Global Fund because the previous funding reached completion so with the new funding we started in early 2016. Then the Women of Worth, which we just started now, is part of the R81 million and they are funded until 2019. What we do is we engage with the municipalities also so that they can uptake some of these within their programmes in case we end up not having much funding, for example in Drakenstein.

So, that is why I was saying it is a pilot because we want to see the effectiveness of the interventions and then we work with the academics at UCT in order to collect the data and also to keep an audit trail to see whether the interventions will be fruitful because it is supposed to end in March 2019 in terms of the funding period.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, we now move to the next question

which is Question 4, hon member Maseko to Minister Plato. Minister Plato?

*Gangsters in Valhalla Park: hampering building of houses*

**4. Ms L M Maseko asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

Whether his Department asked the South African Police Service to arrest gangsters in Valhalla Park who are hampering the building of houses in the area by demanding protection money from the contractor and security guards; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you and also to the hon member for the question. No, the City of Cape Town laid charges with SAPS. SAPS is the responsible entity for investigation of crimes and possible arrests of perpetrators and also to investigate the matter in depth.

The Department condemns all criminal activity and incidences of this nature which hampers the service delivery mandate of Government and affects the well-being of citizens and we are working closely with the police on this matter and hope the problem will be resolved soon as the houses are dearly needed by those affected in Valhalla Park. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Maseko?

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, I just want to find out, to your knowledge, how many arrests have been made if you did follow-up with this case and what is the status of the case if that has happened?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Currently no arrests as yet but SAPS are still continuing with the investigation.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Second question, hon member Maseko?

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much. Hon Minister are there any contingency plans to make sure that this criminality does not tamper with the official projects of human settlements?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Maybe the entities involved could have dealt with this matter, maybe somehow better. It is shocking that gangsters and drug lords take control of projects, asking for ransoms and monies and that sort of thing and that they have the ability to stop a project, a governmental project. I just hope that the municipalities concerned in future will make sure that things like do not happen again.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move onto the next question. Question 5, hon member Uys to Minister Bredell.

**\*5. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

Regarding the book *Land use planning law reform in the Western Cape*, who (a) compiled, (b) printed and (c) paid for the book, (d) what was the total cost and (e) to whom was the book distributed?

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dankie, agb Adjunkspeaker, en baie dankie vir die agb lid vir die vraag. Dis 'n redelike lang antwoord. Ek gaan probeer en dan sal ek vra of ek vir u die name en die verspreidingslyste kan inhandig. Om dit te staan en lees dink ek sal ons nie by 'n punt kry nie.

Die vraag, die (a) gedeelte: Die boek is intern geïnisieer en saamgestel deur die Hoofdirekoraat: Ontwikkelingsbeplanning, Wes-Kaapse Regering, die Departement van Omgewingsake en Ontwikkelingsbeplanning. Die doel van die boek was om 'n gedenkpublikasie daar te stel om die 10-jaar proses van Grondgebruikswetgewing-hervorming te herdenk en ook om as 'n toekomstige verwysingsbron te dien.

Die tegniese versorging van die boek is gedoen deur Anthony Barnes, die Hoofdirekteur: Ontwikkelingsbeplanning; Helena Jacobs, Direkteur: Ontwikkelingsbeplanning, Intelligensiebestuur en Navorsing; en Riëtte Fourie, Hoof Stads- en Streeksbeplanner in die Subdirekoraat

Ontwikkelingsbeplanning en Inligtingsbestuur. Riëtte Fourie het ook gedien as die departementele skakelpersoon en publikasiekoördineerder. Die boek se uitleg- en taalversorging is gedoen deur die Departement se kommunikasiespan wat bestaan uit Rudolf van Jaarsveldt en Shereen Pearsons, in samewerking met die Korporatiewe Dienste-kommunikasiespan van die Departement van die Premier, verteenwoordig deur Jennifer Skordis en Leah Moodaley.

Die boek bestaan uit 'n verskeidenheid van geskrewe bydraes van skrywers en verskillende organisasies. So ek gaan vra dat ek daardie lys name vir u indien en as die agb lid daarop aandrings dan ek dit staan en lees, maar dis regtig, dis 'n klomp name.

Die (b) gedeelte: Shumani Mills, Kommunikasie was as die diensverskaffer aangestel om die publikasie te druk.

Die (c) gedeelte: Die Wes-Kaap Departement van Omgewingsake en Ontwikkelingsbeplanning het betaal vir die druk van die publikasie.

Die (d) gedeelte: Die drukwerk het bestaan uit twee drukoplae, elkeen met 1000 kopieë, met 300 oordruk-kopieë, wat die drukker teen 'n kosprys van die papier aan die Departement beskikbaar gestel het, eerder as om die oordruk te vernietig.

Dan die (e) gedeelte, of die totale koste, as u net – dis R281 000. Dis nou vir



alles. Ek kan dit ook vir u gee, ek sal die uitleg daarvan vir u gee.

En die (e) gedeelte, Adjunkspeaker: Sien die volledige verspreidingslys aangeheg, en dit sal hier aangeheg wees. Hierdie lys sluit in, maar is nie beperk tot: die artikels van die skrywers, die Nasionale Biblioteke, Universiteitsbiblioteke, Boekbekendstellingsgeleentheid, die Departement van Omgewingsake en Ontwikkelingsbeplanning se Senior Bestuurslede.

500 kopieë word gehou vir die Suid-Afrikaanse Beplanningsinstituut se “Planning Africa 2018 Internal Planning Conference” wat in Oktober 2018 in Kaapstad aangebied word. Driehonderd-en-tagtig (380) kopieë word tans aan die Munisipale Biblioteke in die provinsie versprei.

So as u my toelaat sal ek daarmee eers volstaan en die res van die antwoord dan indien, as dit so reg is met die vraesteller. Dankie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you to the hon member for the question. It is a reasonably long reply. I am going to try and then I will ask if I can submit the names and distribution lists for your convenience. To stand here and read it I think is not going to get us to a point.]

The question, the (a) part: The book has been initiated internally and compiled by the Chief Directorate: Development Planning, Western Cape Government, the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning. The purpose of the book was to create a commemorative publication to celebrate the 10 year process of Land Use legislation reform and at the same time serve as a future source of reference.

The technical finishing of the book was done by Anthony Barnes, the Chief Director: Development Planning; and Helena Jacobs, Director: Development Planning, Information Management and Research; and Riëtte Fourie, Chief Town and Regional Planner in the sub-directorate Development Planning and Information Management. Riëtte Fourie also served as departmental liaison officer and publication co-ordinator. The layout and language aspect were done by the communications team of the Department consisting of Rudolf van Jaarsveldt and Shereen Pearsons, in conjunction with the Corporate Services communications team of the Department of the Premier, represented by Jennifer Skordis and Leah Moodaley.

The book consists of a variety of written contributions of authors and various organisations. So I am going to ask that I submit that list of names and if the hon member insists then I can stand and read it, but really, it is a lot of names.

The (b) part: Shumani Mills Communications was appointed as the service provider to print the publication.

The (c) part: The Western Cape Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning paid for the printing of the publication.

The (d) part: The printing consisted of two print runs, each with 1000 copies, with 300 over-run copies, which the printer made available to the Department at a cost price of the paper, rather than having to pulp the over-run.

Then the (e) part, or the total cost, if you just – it is R281 000. That is now for everything. I can also give that to you, I will give you a breakdown of that.

And the (e) part, Deputy Speaker: See the attached complete distribution list, and it will be attached hereto. This list includes, but is not limited to, the articles of the authors, the National Libraries, University Libraries, Book Launch Event, the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning's Senior Management Members.

500 copies are retained for the South African Planning Institute's "Planning Africa 2018 Internal Planning Conference" to be held in Cape Town in October 2018. Three-hundred-and-eighty (380) copies are currently being distributed to Municipal Libraries in the province.

So if you will allow me, I will settle for that for now and submit the rest of

the reply, if it is in order with the hon member who asked the question.

Thank you.]

*[Distribution list as tabled by hon Minister Bredell.]*

LAND USE PLANNING LAW REFORM IN THE WESTERN CAPE: THE ROAD TO TRANSFORMATION: DISTRIBUTION LIST					
Name and Surname	Organization	Copies	Received	Date	Purpose
<b>DEA&amp;DP STAFF</b>					
Anthea Gelendehuis	DEA&DP	50	YES	02.05.2017	Planning Advisory Board Meeting
Anwaar Gaffoor	DEA&DP	1	Yes	25.07.2017	Hand delivered. Signed by Monique Small
Ayub Mohamed	DEA&DP	1	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Charmaine Maré	DEA&DP	1	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Dr Eshaam Palmer	DEA&DP	1	yes	25.07.2017	Hand delivered. Signed by Shiehaam Pheko
Eddie Hanekom	DEA&DP	1	YES		Was sent via Registry
Elizabeth Barclay	DEA&DP	1	YES	25.07.2017	Hand delivered. Signed by Anthea Geldenhuys
Garron Campbell	DEA&DP	1	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Goosain Isaacs	DEA&DP	1	YES	25.07.2017	Hand delivered. Signed by Frances van der Merwe
Gottlieb Arendse	DEA&DP	1	YES		Was sent via Registry
Henri Fortuin	DEA&DP	1	Yes	25.07.2017	Hand delivered. Signed by Charlene Kistensamy
Jeremy Benjamin	DEA&DP	1	Yes	25.07.2017	Hand delivered. Signed by Charlene Kistensamy
Johannes Fritz	DEA&DP	1	yes		Gave to Lana
Joy Leaner	DEA&DP	1	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Karen Shippey	DEA&DP	1	YES	25.07.2017	Hand delivered. Signed by Jameelah Kasper
Marlene Laros	DEA&DP	1	YES	25.07.2017	Hand delivered. Signed by Frances van der Merwe
Paul Hardcastle	DEA&DP	1	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Riette Fourie	DEA&DP	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Ronald Mukanya	DEA&DP	1	YES	25.07.2017	Hand delivered. Signed by Jameelah Kasper
Shereen Pearson	DEA&DP	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Theo Gildenhuys	DEA&DP	1	YES	25.07.2017	Hand delivered. Signed by Kim Hendricks
Varuschka Peters	DEA&DP	4	YES	22.03.2017	SPLUMA Discussion
Willem Smith	DEA&DP	1	NO		
Wilna Kloppers	DEA&DP	1	yes		Was sent via Registry
Zaahir Toefy	DEA&DP	1	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch

AUTHORS					
Allan Rhodes	DEA&DP	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Adv Gary Birch	DEA&DP	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Anneke Muller	School of Public Leadership: University of Stellenbosch	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Anthony Barnes	DEA&DP	4	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Bongumusa Ndwandwe	Mossel Bay Mun	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Chrizzelle Kriel	DEA&DP	2	YES	31.07.2017	Signed by Riette
Claus Rabe	Private	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Danie du Plessis	University of Stellenbosch	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Deon van Zyl	Private	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Dr Cecil Madell	CPUT	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Dr Laurine Platzky	DOTP	2	YES	31.07.2017	Signed by Riette
Eloise Rousseau	COCT	2	YES	31.03.2017	
Erna van Zyl	DRDLR	2	YES	31.07.2017	Signed by Riette
Fiona Ogle	City of Cape Town	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Francois Wüst	DEA&DP	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Gavin Benjamin	DEA&DP	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Gerhard Gerber	DEA&DP	2	YES	25.07.2017	Hand delivered. Signed by Lynette Speller(Gave 1)
Helena Jacobs	DEA&DP	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Julien Rumbelow	DEA&DP	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Kobus Munro	DEA&DP	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Laurel Robertson	DEA&DP	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Marx Mupariwa	COCT	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Minister Bredell	DEA&DP	2	YES	31.07.2017	Signed by Riette
Pieter van Zyl	DEA&DP	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Prof Ivan Turok	HSRC	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Riaan van Eeden	COCT	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Stiaan Carstens	DEA&DP	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Theo Rebel	DEA&DP	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Wadzanci Madangombe	DEA&DP	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
BOOK LAUNCH GUESTS					
Anita Vosloo	DoTP Legal Services	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Anthony Hazell	Dept of Human Settlements	1	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Catherine Stone	Independent	1	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Chris Rabie	Private	1	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Frank Cummings	COCT	1	NO		
Gideon Brand	COCT	1	NO		
Laetitia Theunissen	Private	1	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch

Leah Moodley	DOTP	2	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Lucas Buter	DOTP	1	NO		
Marek Kedzieja	DEA&DP	1	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Margie Murcott	COCT	1	NO		
Nancy Odendaal	UCT	1	NO		
Prof Jaap de Visser	University of the Western Cape	1	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
Tommie Bolton	WCDRLR	1	NO		
Tricia Brink-Jones	Private	1	YES	31.03.2017	Book Launch
<b>LIBRARIES</b>					
Dr S Neerpath	University of the Western Cape	1	Yes		
Ms Gwenda Thomas	University of Cape Town	1	Yes		
Dianne Steele	UCT Libraries Built Environment Library	1	Yes		
Laureen Rushby	UCT Libraries Government Publication Department	1	Yes		
Renate Meyer	UCT Libraries Manuscripts and Archives Department	1	Yes		
Sadiq Keeran	UCT Libraries Brand van Zyl Library	1	Yes		
Prof Jaya Raju	UCT Libraries Library and Information Studies Centre	1	Yes		
Sulaiman Majal	CPUT Libraries Cape Town Campus	1	Yes		
Regina Sikhosana	CPUT Libraries Bellville Campus	1	Yes		
Sipho Hlongwane	CPUT Libraries Athlone Library	1	Yes		
Tirzah Arendse	CPUT Libraries George Library	1	Yes		
Edene du Toit	CPUT Libraries Granger Bay Library	1	Yes		
Cavall Barends	CPUT Libraries Media City Library	1	Yes		
Sharon Panayiotou	CPUT Libraries Mowbray Library	1	Yes		
Michelle Snyders	CPUT Libraries Tygerberg Library	1	Yes		
Joanne Arendse	CPUT Libraries Wellington Library	1	Yes		
Nontobeko Xwayi	CPUT Libraries Worcester Library	1	Yes		
Mrs Henriëtte Swart	Stellenbosch University USBI Bellville Park Campus Information Centre	1	Yes		

Ms Yvette Diedericks	Stellenbosch University JS Gericke Library (Central)	1	Yes		
Auriah Mabelane	National Library of S.A. Pretoria Campus (NLSA-Pta)	1	Yes		
David Slamet	National Library of South Africa – Cape Town Campus (NLSA-CT)	1	Yes		
Doret du Toit	Legal Deposit Library Section, Mangaung Library Services (MLS)	1	Yes		
Eshara Singh	Msunduzi Municipal Library Services (MLS)	1	Yes		
Sarah Jones	Legal Deposit Section, Library of Parliament	1	Yes		
Joseph Dlamini	National Film, Video & Sound Archives (NFA)	1	Yes		
Sheryl Luthuli	The Constitutional Court of South Africa	1	Yes		
Rebecca Makume	R J R Masiea Public Library	1	Yes		
Granny Ross	Northern West Provincial Library and Information Services	1	Yes		
Solani Ngobeni	Mpumalanga Provincial Library and Information Services	1	Yes		
<b>GENERAL DISTRIBUTION</b>					
Annelize De Villiers	Office of the HOD	20	YES		
Anthony Barnes	Audit Committee	4	Yes		
Varuschka Peters	Planning Advisory Board Meeting	4	Yes		
<b>TOTAL</b>		<b>236</b>			

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Uys.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys.]

†Mnr P UYS: Baie dankie, Adjunkspeaker. Dankie vir die antwoord, LUR.

Ja, dis in orde so, dan kan ons dit bestudeer. Kan ons net vir u vra, in die tyd nou dat kostes so bietjie druk is en orals moet beskermingsmaatreëls getref

word, wat het u laat besluit om voort te gaan met hierdie boek, of die boek te laat doen net onder R300 000.00, en ek aanvaar dit sluit nie al die koste van al die werk in wat ingesit is in die boek nie?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr P UYS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you for the reply, MEC. Can we just ask you, now in the time that costs are pressing and everywhere protection measures have to be instituted, what made you decide to proceed with this book, or to publish the book just less than R300 000.00, and I assume that does not include all the cost of all the work put into this book?]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Agb Adjunkspeaker, ja. Ek persoonlik dink dit was 'n ongelooflike inisiatief, en u kon gesien het deur al die skrywers, en as ek dit vir u indien, dis alles intern gedoen. Die enigste eksterne uitgawe was die drukwerk.

So dit is 'n baie, baie goeie inisiatief deur ons eie mense. Ons moet ons beplanningsfoute en -suksesse bymekaartrek, ons moet dit saamvat en ons het dit vervat in 'n skrywe. Ek dink in die toekoms in die universiteit en...

[Onhoorbaar.] ongelooflik geïnteresseerd in ons leerskool en ons lesse. Ons almal besef waar ons vandaan kom, ons geskiedenis, en ons almal besef die moeilike taak op ons om geïntegreerde ontwikkeling te bevorder en daar te kom, en ek dink hierdie boek sal die volgende generasies 'n beter begrip gee



oor waar ons vandaan kom, waarnatoe ons op pad is en wat die struikelblokke was, om ons vinniger daar te kry.

So persoonlik dink ek dit was 'n ongelooflike inisiatief, en ek dink dit sal elke sent werd wees.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, yes. Personally I think it has been an unbelievable initiative, and you could have seen through all the authors, and if I submit it to you, it has all been done internally. The only external expense was the printing.

So it is a very, very good initiative by our own people. We have to compile our planning mistakes and successes, we have to summarise it in a document. I think in future in the university and ... [Inaudible.] unbelievably interested in our learning school and our lessons. We all realise where we come from, our history, and we all realise the difficult task upon us to promote integrated development and to get there, and I think this book will provide the next generations a better understanding of where we come from, where we are going to and what have been the obstacles, to get us there sooner.

So personally I think it has been an unbelievable initiative, and I think it will be worth every cent.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Beerwinkel?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Beerwinkel?]

†'n AGB LID: AWB.

[An HON MEMBER: AWB.]

†Me C F BEERWINKEL: Baie dankie, Adjunkspeaker. As ek luister na wat die MEC nou verduidelik het, dan wil dit voorkom asof hierdie boek waarna verwys word 'n wonderlike inisiatief is om te praat van die werk wat daar ingegaan het om hierdie gebruike te verduidelik, ook die tekortkominge.

My vraag aan die MEC is: As dit dan so 'n goeie werk is, waarom het u nie daaraan gedink om 'n eksemplaar aan elke lid van die Komitee ook uit te gee dat ons ook kan sien wat dit is wat julle doen nie?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. If I listen to what the MEC has just explained, then it appears that this book he refers to is a wonderful initiative to speak of the work that has gone into explaining these methods, also the shortcomings.

My question to the MEC is: If it is such a good work, why have not thought of also providing each member of the Committee with a copy so that we can see what it is that you are doing?]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ek sal die agb lid opneem daaroor en ek vra om verskoning vir die oorsig. Ons is besig met die verspreiding van die boek en ek sal ook net vra dat elkeen van ons dalk sal moet teken, want ek moet ook vir die ouditeur-generaal verduidelik waar elke sent was, maar ons sal enige tyd vir elke lid van die Komitee so 'n boek voorsien.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I will take the member up on that and I apologise for the oversight. We are busy with the distribution of the book and I will also just request that perhaps each one of us will have to sign it, because I also have to explain to the Auditor-General where every cent has gone into, but we will gladly provide every member of the Committee with such a book.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie. Kan ons voortgaan?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Can we continue?] †The last question hon member Uys to Minister Meyer. †Agb Minister? As hy sy asem teruggekry het. [Hon Minister? When he has recovered his breath.]

*Drakenstein Municipality: external loan*

**\*6. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Finance:**

Whether he and his Department spoke out against the Drakenstein Municipality earlier this year for taking up an external loan; if so, (a) what was the amount of the loan, (b) for which projects was the money used and (c) what was the (i) reaction and (ii) action of the municipality?

†Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Baie dankie, Adjunkspeaker. My asem is terug. Dankie agb lid Beerwinkel, u praat uit die Huis uit, maar ons neem met waardering kennis dat u ook uit die Huis uit kan praat.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. My breath is back. Thank you, hon member Beerwinkel, you are speaking from within the House, but we notice with appreciation that you can also speak from within the House.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you for this opportunity and the question from hon member Uys.

In terms of Section 46 of the Local Government: Municipal Finance Management Act, the Provincial Treasury provided written comments on 11 April 2017 on the long-term borrowing proposal submitted by the Drakenstein Municipality.

The borrowing proposal amounted to R506,92 million. The raising of the external loan was to finance capital projects such as: the upgrading of the sewerage, the water infrastructure, streets, storm water and electricity infrastructure within the municipal boundaries; the upgrading of sport facilities and sportsgrounds; upgrading of community centres and municipal offices; investment in various infrastructure ward projects; and also infrastructure for the promotion of local economic development and tourism; and other equipment.

The comments provided by Provincial Treasury, as well as the comments from stakeholders, including the comments from the National Treasury were tabled in the Drakenstein Council, with the external loan item on 26 April this year, as required in terms of Section 46 of the Municipal Finance Management Act.

The loan was taken up by the Municipality with the successful bidder. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Uys?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?]

†Mnr P UYS: Baie dankie, Adjunkspeaker. Kan ek vir die LUR vra, dankie vir die antwoord, wat was die kommentaar van die Provinsiale Tesourie aan die munisipaliteit vir die opneem van hierdie eksterne lening?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr P UYS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. May I ask the MEC, thank you for the reply, what was the comment from the Provincial Treasury to the municipality for taking up this external loan?]

†Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Dankie, Adjunkspeaker, en agb lid Uys. [The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Deputy Speaker, and hon member Uys.] †The comments central to our comments are the affordability of the long-term borrowing. Remember, this is a separate sphere of government. So we can submit these comments and then they have independently to decide how they want to take forward these comments.

The comments were also to acknowledge that a full public participation process was followed as part of the IDP in the budget process. Funds to be sourced from financial institutions accredited in terms of the Banks' Act. This was also, Mr Deputy Speaker, the comments that we also submitted, that this was not a refinancing application. In other words, this was not a refinancing, it was a new loan, and therefore it had to come to the Provincial Treasury.

The Provincial Treasury also made some comments about the affordability assessment. The Treasury also looked at the 2015/16 annual financial statements. The Treasury also looked at the IYM, or the so-called In-year Monitoring and Operating of Capital Expenditure Reports. It also looked at

the cash flows actuals. It also looked at the IDP for 2012 to 2017. We also made comments about the service delivery backdrops. We also indicated that it must be for improving the quality of life of all citizens. We also commented about the loan and the bank that they selected, about the Standard Bank. We also commented about the interest rate in line with current market rates. We have also commented that they have provided business plans and repayment schedules in this particular regard.

We have also indicated in our comments that the borrowing should be utilised for revenue generating assets, in particular for community centres and the municipal offices. We also commented about the financial ratios that need to be taken into account, set by the National Treasury. We also commented about the instalments, about the R84.75 million that will put pressure on the liquidity of the municipality if not managed well. We have also commented on the capital rollovers, and we made some specific recommendations.

We also made some comments about the cash position to remain at adequate levels. We made recommendations that they must guard against underperformance in revenue collections. We have also made recommendations that we must caution against excessive reliance on borrowing for capital budgets.

So these were the comments that we have made, and these comments were also tabled in the Council where they considered the budget.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys.

†Mnr P UYS: Baie dankie, Adjunkspeaker. Bekostigbaarheid is deur die LUR beklemtoon. Die LUR het ook daarna verwys dat die kapitaal- en rentedelging per jaar R84 miljoen kan wees. Het die munisipaliteit die Provinsiale Tesourie tevrede gestel dat hulle wel die addisionele R84 miljoen in hulle bedryfsbegroting sal kan finansier en bekostig?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr P UYS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Affordability was emphasised by the MEC. The MEC also referred to it that the capital and interest payment per year can be R84 million. Did the municipality satisfy the Provincial Treasury that can indeed finance and afford the additional R84 million in their operational budget?]

†Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Adjunkspeaker, ek het ook spesifiek gekyk na die rentedelgings. Wat hulle ook gedoen het is dat hulle het hierdie lening oor verskillende tydperke gestruktureer sodat daardie delging vir hulle ook baie meer gemaklik is, byvoorbeeld vir die eerste drie jaar vir die terugbetaling van daardie termyn het hulle is dit geskeduleer dat hulle so R4.157 miljoen teen 'n rentekoers van 9.3% betaal. Dan die vyfjaar-termyn, want dis so 10-jaar lening, teen 4.5 miljoen teen 'n 9.68%, en dan die 10-jaar is die grootste gedeelte van hierdie lening, dis ongeveer so 498 miljoen, en dis teen 'n bietjie hoër koers van sowat 10.12%. Die Raad het dit ook



goedgekeur.

Die kontantposisie van die munisipaliteit op 30 April verlede jaar was so R261 miljoen. Ek kan wel aan die Huis rapporteer en agb lid Uys, dat ons het ook kennis geneem van die toename in die *liquidity*. Ons het ook kennis geneem, die Nasionale Tesourie het ook kennis geneem van die provinsiale kommentaar. Die Nasionale Tesourie het ook kennis geneem dat die *debt service cost is decreasing*, maar hulle het wel ook die opmerking gemaak dat *it will diminish the cash reserves*. Dis 'n kommentaar van die Nasionale Tesourie.

So breedweg het ons ons kommentaar gelewer. Hierdie Kabinet en hierdie Regering respekteer die beginsel van *separation of powers*, en ons het ons kommentaar daar gelewer. Ons het ook interaksie gehad met die munisipaliteit en aan die einde van die dag neem die munisipaliteit daardie besluit, want hulle is ook in staat, ingevolge Artikel 160 van die Grondwet, om ook aansoek te doen vir lenings, maar wanneer hulle vir daardie lenings aansoek doen en die geld aanwend, is dit primêr vir kapitale uitgawes, en hulle moet die kommentaar van die Provinsie en die kommentaar van die Nasionale Tesourie in ag neem en binne die konteks van rekenpligtigheid en deursigtigheid moet hulle dit ook in die Raadsbesluit so notuleer.

Ek dank u, Adjunkspeaker.

***[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]***

[The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Deputy Speaker, I have also looked at the interest payments. What they have also done is that they have structured this loan over various periods so that that payment is a lot more comfortable for them, for instance for the first three years for paying back for that term, they have scheduled it so that they pay around R4,157 million at an interest rate of 9.3%. Then the five year term, because it is a more or less ten year loan, R4,5 million at 9,68%, and then the 10 year is the largest part of this loan, about 498 million, and this is at a slightly higher rate of about 10,12%. the Council has also approved it.

The cash position of the municipality on 30 April last year was about R261 million. I can report to the House and hon member Uys, that we have taken note of the increase in liquidity. We also took note, the National treasury also took note of the provincial commentary. The National Treasury also took note that the debt service cost is decreasing, but they did make the comment that it will diminish the cash reserves. It is a comment from the National Treasury.

So broadly speaking we have commented. This Cabinet and this Government respect the principle of separation of powers, and we have commented there. We also inter-acted with the municipality and at the end of the day the municipality takes that decision, because they are also able, in term of Section 160 of the Constitution, to apply for loans, but when they apply for those loans and spend the money, it is primarily for capital expenses, and

they have to consider the comment of the Province and the comment of the National Treasury and within the context of accountability and transparency they also have to minute that in the Council's decision. I thank you, Deputy Speaker.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Uys?

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Uys?]

†Mnr P UYS: Adjunkspeaker, baie dankie. Dankie, agb LUR. U het verwys na die oorrol van 2015/2016, 'n bedrag van R83 miljoen wat hulle nie kon spandeer nie, en dit was ook een van u groot bekommernisse. Hoe dink u as hulle R83 miljoen nie kan spandeer nie, gaan hulle die R506 miljoen wat addisioneel nou voor begroot is kan spandeer?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr P UYS: Deputy Speaker, thank you. Thank you, MEC. You have referred to the roll over of 2015/2016, an amount of R83 million that they could not spend, and it was one of your big concerns. How do you think, if they could not spend R83 million, how are they going to spend the R506 million that has been budgeted for additionally?]

†Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Adjunkspeaker, ek dink dit is 'n geldige opmerking wat agb lid Uys maak. As jy aansoek doen vir 'n lening, 'n groot bedrag, soos in hierdie geval R509 miljoen, en het jy nog vorige finansiële

jaar so 'n groot bedrag nie gespandeer nie, is dit wel 'n potensiële risiko, en daardie risiko is ook onder die aandag gebring van Drakenstein Munisipaliteit deur die Provinsiale Tesourie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Deputy Speaker, I think it is a valid remark by the hon member Uys. When you apply for a loan, a large amount, as in this case R509 million, and you have not spent such a large amount in your previous financial year, it may well be a financial risk, and that risk has been also been brought to the attention of Drakenstein Municipality by the Provincial Treasury.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Laaste geleentheid, agb lid Uys.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Last opportunity, hon member Uys.]

†Mnr P UYS: Baie dankie, Adjunkspeaker. Dan net laastens, onder al die waarskuwings, as ek dit so kan sê, want as ek die LUR reg verstaan is daar verskeie waarskuwings gerig aan die Munisipaliteit van Drakenstein, beide van Provinsiale en Nasionale Tesourie, kan u ons inlig, het hulle desondanks nog voortgegaan daarmee?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr P UYS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Then just finally, amidst all the

warnings, if I may say so, because if I understand the MEC correctly there were several warnings to the Municipality of Drakenstein, both from the Provincial and National Treasury, can you inform us, did they proceed with that notwithstanding?]

†Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Adjunkspeaker, ter voorbereiding van hierdie vraag het ek ook bietjie gekyk waarvoor spesifiek is hierdie kapitaalbegroting gevra, en ek het opgemerk, ek het 'n hele skedule getrek van die verskillende tipe projekte wat Drakenstein wil finansier. Die opgradering van Mbekweni Sportfasiliteit, die opgradering van huureenhede, 'n gemeenskapsaal en fasiliteite in Saron, die vervanging van – wat is 'n *valve* in Engels? Afrikaans?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Deputy Speaker, in preparation for this question I also looked specifically what this capital budget was requested for, and I noticed, I drew up a whole schedule of the various types of projects that Drakenstein wants to finance. The upgrading of Mbekweni Sport facility, the upgrading of rental units, a community hall and facilities in Saron, the replacement of – what is a *valve* in English? Afrikaans?

†'n AGB LID: Wat is 'n...?

[An HON MEMBER: What is a...?]

†Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: 'n Valve. 'n Valve?

[The MINISTER OF FINANCE: A valve. A valve?]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dis 'n klep.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is a *klep*.]

†'n AGB LID: 'n Valve?

[An HON MEMBER: A valve?]

†'n AGB LID: Klep.

[An HON MEMBER: *Klep*.]

†'n AGB LID: Klep.

[An HON MEMBER: *Klep*.]

†Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Klep. Okay. Kleppe was vervang daar by die Wemmershoek standplaas, die rehabilitasie van ook werke by Saron, Minister Madikizela ...

***[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]***

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Klep. Okay. Valves were replaced there at Wemmershoek site, also the rehabilitation of works at Saron, Minister Madikizela †would be very happy that some of this money is also for the minimum basic services to informal settlements. There was also upgrading of

a gravel road in Saron, reconstruction of Drommedaris Street, fencing at Daljosafat, street lighting in Hermon, where hon member, our colleague over here would be very happy that there is also street lighting in Gouda. She is very happy with the progress that is made there.

So given the wide and extensive application for this, this loan was now approved by the Drakenstein Municipality. It is now also our function and our responsibility as we monitor the IYM, the In-year Monitoring. We will also look very closely during the quarterly financial performance assessments and report that we bring to the Cabinet, to make sure that this loan that was now taken up legally through the right processes of the Drakenstein Municipality, that they keep to the payment schedule and that we do not see further radical increases on levies and taxes on the citizens of Drakenstein.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That brings us to the end of Questions. We move on to Statements by Members. I see the DA first. Hon member Mitchell.

**STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS:**

Mr D G MITCHELL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The National Assembly Guide to Procedure 2004 states that the underlying principle for conduct and decorum in the House is that members show respect to the House and to other members.

We are expected to refer to each other as honourable members because there

is a long standing parliamentary tradition that assumes that members will always act honourably and therefore that a member's word is accepted.

*[The Speaker takes the Chair.]*

Unfortunately, Madam Speaker, that tradition is being abused by the Opposition. The guide to procedures states, and I quote:

“making unsubstantiated allegations against the integrity of any member [Interjections.] is unparliamentary, nor may improper or unworthy motives be imputed to them.”

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Mr D G MITCHELL: But, every week, Madam Speaker, the Opposition abuses this tradition and as a result some members have sacrificed their honour. [Interjections.] Even if we allow for political contestation, the abuse of freedom of speech ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Mr D G MITCHELL: ... in this House goes on unchecked. The reason we are not allowed to call parliamentarians liars is based on the assumption that we will not lie. When this assumption no longer holds it makes the title of “honourable member” unfitting and, with it, the respect that this title confers.



ANC members refer to Western Cape schools as shebeens, for example, Madam Speaker [Interjections.] and continue to discredit the legitimacy of this Government by besmirching the Ministries with falsified and made up statements.

Madam Speaker, this disregard for rules and tradition is destroying the creditability, integrity and decorum of this House and must no longer be tolerated. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I now see the ANC. Order, please members. We are almost there. You may proceed hon member Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, violence and tensions in and around Western Cape schools under the DA spread like wild fire. It is the reason therefore when you bring alcohol into schools making them shebeens is one of the results of those ... [Interjections.]. More and more learners ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Mr R T OLIVIER: ... teachers, support staff and even parents or members of the public are regularly entangled in scuffles.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Olivier, kindly take your seat. Hon member

Schäfer?.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Madam Speaker, this is just the case in point. This is a misleading statement [Interjections.]. Section ...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Schäfer ...

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ....57 of the Rules states that you cannot mislead this House.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Hon member Schäfer the Rules do not allow for objections or anything to the contrary in terms of statements. Hon members, you have two minutes to conclude your statement, we cannot enter into deliberations on statements, so let us proceed [Interjections.]. Let us just remain calm, thank you. You may proceed hon member Olivier. [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: The most worrying aspect is the fact that the DA-led Government just does not seem to get a grip on the escalating killing of children in and around our schools.

Even the Walking Bus Initiative of the DA is not the solution because people fear for their lives as regular killings of our children continue.

Mr M G E WILEY: What is your solution?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Schools should be safe for children to learn, however in this Western Cape, having schools as safe places is only a dream. Bullying is at a tipping point. Just last week three matrices of the posh Paarl Boys High were suspended. Yet learners are still abused by seniors in hostels of this specific school.

The violence is also directed at teachers and the Union SADTU recently lamented the growing tendency. In the first three months of this year almost 40 teachers were attacked by learners. Community members and parents are also making themselves guilty of assaulting teachers. The ANC calls on the Western Cape Education Department and the South African Police Service to put better plans in place to rid violence from our schools.

We further call on communities to assist law enforcement agencies in this regard. We call on the MEC to withdraw the Bill of bringing alcohol into school premises and creating those shebeens. I so move. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Olivier. I trust that you do have a written statement to submit hon member Olivier? Thank you. And now we see the DA.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Madam Speaker, may I raise a point of order. The hon member persists in misleading this House about shebeens in schools. [Interjections.]. There is no intention to put any shebeen in a school, That is unacceptable.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Schäfer, I have - hon members kindly take your seats please. After the hon member Mitchell spoke, I said this is Statements. It is two minutes per statement, there is no recourse to deliberate until we amend the Rules likewise. So please, let us just co-operate. [Interjections.]

Hon member Olivier, thank you if you do not mind, I am speaking. However, I think it is incumbent on every member in terms of representing matters factually and not misrepresenting the onus is not on me to decide who is telling the truth or not telling the truth. That will need to be tested and there are mechanisms I imagine that could be put in to place to ensure the veracity of statements made in this House. So I now the see DA.

Ms B A SCHÄFER (DA): Thank you, Madam Speaker. We know of and have witnessed the damaging effects of climate change over the past years from devastating storms to the absence of seasonal rain which supplies us with water for the coming year. The Western Cape is indeed in the grips of a changing climate as a direct result of increasing global temperatures but we need to be aware of the knock-on effect of the shifting climate on our agricultural sector.

The current outbreak of Avian flu in South Africa is exasperated by an unusually warm and dry winter, prolonging the life-span of the virus which normally dies off in colder months. When Avian flu has an extended life-span the threat of infection still lingers when farmers assume that their livestock

is safe.

We need to be mindful of the shift when transporting live poultry in South Africa in the face of dry winters. As the H5N1 virus survives into winter so the threat of further infection becomes imminent. As long as our climate changes so must our agricultural practices to ensure the health of our industry and our livestock. I urge all livestock farmers in the Western Cape to be extremely vigilant in the face of Avian influenza as the cost of an outbreak on our agricultural sector is already tabled at around R50 million with 10,000 chicks culled in the Western Cape so far.

Farmers and workers in agriculture must be aware not only of changes in our climate but the effects of these changes on the workings of agriculture and the jobs and food that this sector creates. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. The EFF has tendered an apology so in the absence of the EFF, I see the DA. Hon member Nkondlo, statements run in sequence and I follow the sequence. So, the EFF is not here and I will see the DA.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. The challenge of providing adequate housing requires an effort at every level which includes Government and the private sector and individuals. We are fully aware of the Western Cape's housing backlog that has grown to 575 000.

Further challenges are that people are moving to the province in search of better opportunities, then there is the estimated growth in the population which could reach 12 million by 2050. You add to this the fact that not all land is habitable, even though you might find people living there.

Madam Speaker, agricultural land is also so vital to us and we cannot, in fact we dare not use this land to build houses because you might have a house to live in, you still need food to eat which must be produced from the land. Along with this we are also faced with budgetary constraints. The current R2,5 billion only allows us to offer 18,000 opportunities. This is why we need to ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms L M MASEKO: ... maximise the habitable land parcel that we have in the province and densification is the solution. An online article that was published earlier this year on [smartergrowth.ca](http://smartergrowth.ca) says: “When urban densification is done right, it brings economic advantages and lifestyle benefits.”

Madam Speaker, it bring lifestyle benefits because densification gives us an opportunity to diversify our communities. It also encourages economic advantages because the integrated development means that employment opportunities are established in these areas.

I envision communities with towering apartment blocks, attached houses and other structures. The benefit of it all is that we build inclusive communities and we use our space effectively. Madam Speaker, densification is the solution to utilise the limited land parcels we have and that is the solution for human settlements. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ANC.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The ANC welcomes the more than R74 million relief grant announced by National COGTA Minister, Des van Rooyen, which partly is transferred to municipalities of Cape Town, Bitou and Theewaterskloof with the remaining portion to the Provincial Department of Agriculture as well another almost R29 million from disaster management.

We appreciate the leadership provided by the ANC led National Government to fires and the drought. This is what differentiates strong and mature leadership by our ANC Government from the toddler mentality and blame game the DA persistently subjects us to.

Instead of following similar constitutional co-operative governance and service delivery, the DA whines and complains. We call on Minister van Rooyen to make public the agreed funding obligations for good governance and transparency to hold this Provincial Government accountable.

We further call on all various stakeholders to ensure this money realises its intended benefits by working through Ward Committees and other public participation fora. They must actively share in all interventions to not exclude local voices and indigenous knowledge from their communities.

The ANC will join the citizens in our oversight of the Legislature and councils. A joint effort of all social partners is critical in the new way to manage the climate and disaster effects felt by all. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA.

Mr T A SIMMERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, Section 24 of the Constitution highlights that everyone has the right to an environment that is not harmful to their health or well-being and to have the environment protected for the benefit of present and future generations.

It is increasingly imperative that environmental management must place people and their needs at the forefront of its concern and serve their physical, psychological, developmental, cultural and social interests equitably. On this note, Madam Speaker, more recently we have seen a dramatic increase in environmental crime, particularly in the case of illegal dumping in the Western Cape.

Operations undertaken by our Government face several challenges to dealing with the culprits of illegal dumping. Some of these challenges include



insufficient budget, insufficient capacity, insufficient specialist services and a small pool of highly skilled EMIs. Although our Government continues to do its best to provide law enforcement support service and advice to conservation services related to biodiversity crime enforcement, if we are to be more successful in our future endeavours to prevent illegal dumping, in particular, further assistance from National Government and society itself is imperative to our success.

Not only does illegal dumping pose a threat to our future generations being able to experience the diverse biodiversity we witness today, but illegal dumping poses a massive contamination threat to the scarcely available water sources in our province. If not contained we will also witness a rise in health related issues where illegal dumping takes place. In conclusion, Madam Speaker, I would like to call on all sectors of society to help fight against all forms of environmental crimes. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ACDP, the hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Madam Speaker, on Tuesday 29 August 2017, the Standing Committee of Education did an oversight visit to the Siphamandla Secondary School in Khayelitsha. The school is located in a very poor community. We were informed by the principal that gangsterism, drugs and crime are rife. but, Madam Speaker, after the formal introduction and presentation by the principal, who has a school of 34 educators and 1170 learners, the school excels year after year.

In 2014 in their National Senior Certificate results they had a 92,4% pass rate. In 2015, they had a 95,6% pass rate and in 2016 a 96,4% pass rate. And we asked the principal why do they do so well? And it is because in this day and age we get committed ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...educators and a dedicated school governing body.  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: So, as the ACDP we just want to compliment the principal, the school governing body ... [Interjection.]

Ms P MAKELENI: And the teachers ... [Interjection.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Do you not know “educators” are teachers?  
[Interjections.] The principal, educators and the school governing body for the excellent work done under difficult circumstances. I thank you.  
[Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians. I now see the ANC.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Baie dankie, agb Speaker. Onder die DA-regering is

die hele Wes-Kaap weereens aan die brand en hierdie tyd is die brande nie in Knysna nie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Under the DA Government the whole of the Western Cape is burning again and this time the fires are not in Knysna.] †There are various protest hotspots.

Dissatisfaction seems to grow along with other social ills. This past week we saw the outburst in the Overstrand Municipality when people of Kleinmond took to the streets that saw the destruction of property.

It is reported, unhappiness with a questionable municipal tender led to this uprising. The DA just does not want to openly deal with the matters by involving public participation processes and ward committees. The DA high-handedly goes about like a despotic ruler that costs the taxpayer and public dearly. [Interjection.] Leave Kleinmond. [Interjection.]

In Klawer on the West Coast a farmer allegedly shot two black people, killing one. The suspect then fled. Two houses of the accused were burnt down in mob action before he was arrested elsewhere and brought to court. This incident led to serious racial tensions. The DA has yet to condemn it.

Mr D JOSEPH: We have done it.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We do not condone the destruction of property.

[Interjection.] We, as the ANC, want to call on all our people ...

[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...not take matters into their own hands and to address ...

[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... problems in a mature way. We are very conscious that the DA is failing them everywhere in the province. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA. [Interjections.]

†UNksz T M DIJANA: Hayi suka!

[Ms T M DIJANA: You go!]

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon members. Hon Dijana, “hayi suka” is inappropriate across the House. Please members. Minister Fritz ... [Interjections.] Minister Fritz, may I address you? You cannot engage in a debate ... [Interjection.] Ja, but Minister Fritz, please address the Chair. You

cannot make a statement across the floor. I must caution you on refraining from doing that, please. Thank you. The next speaker is the DA, I recognise the hon Chief Whip. Hon members, we are almost there. Just remain calm please.

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, this week the ANC played fast and loose with the truth once again. They are so desperate to paint a particular picture about the DA that they, hon member Uys in particular, have developed collective amnesia. [Interjections.] They would have the public believe that the matter of dealing ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M G E WILEY: ...with the appointment of an independent Registrar is something they knew nothing about. The truth is a little bit more direct and plain for all to see. In March of this year the acting Registrar told the Conduct Committee that it was the Speaker's intention to create an externally based Registrar. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, hon members.

Mr M G E WILEY: March of this year. The Speaker herself addressed the matter in her Budget Speech on 31 March 2017. I quote:

“As many complaints and investigations take a political flavour, it is not

desirable that employees of the WCPP should be involved in it.

“To enhance public confidence, breaches of the Code of Conduct by members will be appropriately investigated and dealt with. An external Registrar of Members’ Interest will be proposed for consideration by the House.” That was in March.

Equally, Mr Uys would have heard this information from the Deputy Speaker at the Internal Arrangements Committee last year and in the event that he still had not got the message it would have been mentioned during one of the Parliamentary Oversight Committees.

The ANC utterances at yesterday’s press conference are deplorable and libellous and further indicate their passing acquaintance with the facts. It is precisely because of Mr Uys’ political grandstanding that WCPP has had to take these measures of procuring an independent Registrar. So much for honourable intent. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: That is the end ... [Interjections.] Members! Members, respect begets respect. When a statement was made, the Opposition or one side of the House was told, you cannot comment, it is simply a statement. So, let us understand, you might choose to object, but you cannot get involved in an objection point like that. So, that now is the ... [Interjection.]

Hon member Gillion, what is good for the goose must be good for the gander.

†So werk dit. [That is how it works.] That is ... [Interjection.] That is the end

– people, let us not object anymore now. Let us get on with it. That is the end of Members Statements. We now move to Motions. Are there any motions where notice is given? I see the hon member Kivedo, I see hon member Olivier. I need help. I am doing three at a time and then I see hon member Hinana. Then I will take the next round. Thank you. I need the Table to help me please.

### **MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

Mr B D KIVEDO: Madam Speaker, thank you. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the implementation and execution of more stringent, pro-active and progressive measures to combat gang violence in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. The hon member Olivier?

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the danger teachers in the Western Cape schools

are exposed to. I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the reintroduction of school inspectors in the Western Cape schools. I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Lekker, I see hon member Wenger, I see hon member Christians. That is the next three. Work with me please. Thank you.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the 40% increase in Western Cape murders on the DA watch.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Wenger.



Ms M M WENGER: Thank you. Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the Western Cape Policing Needs and Priorities Report of 2016/7.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the negligence and incompetence of medical practitioners in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice taken. The next round is hon member Beerwinkel, hon member Hinana and hon member Joseph. Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the reluctance of the DA MEC's Bredell and Madikizela and the Standing Committee Chairpersons to deal with

community and housing issues of Suurbraak after months of reminders and alerts.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Hinana. No objections, †asseblief. [please.] I see the hon member Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the service delivery achievements of the Western Cape Administration under the DA.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the possible use of Government Employment Pension Fund to bail out State entities.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of the National land reform crisis on the Western Cape.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Any further? I see hon member Mnqasela. I see hon member Joseph. [Interjections.] Order please. No conversations. There is a speaker on the floor.

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the horrendous electricity tariffs imposed by NERSA and its impact on the households and the poor.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. I see the hon member Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the failure of National Government to implement information technology systems in all Legislatures, under the project called “Integrated Financial Management Systems”. [Interjections.]

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Are there any further notices of motion? That concludes Notices of Motion. We now move to Motions without Notice. I see the hon member Wenger. I see the hon member Gillion. I see the hon member Kivedo. I am going to do three. The Table staff will help me. Thank you. Hon member Wenger, you may proceed.

#### **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House implores all South Africans to promote inclusion, reconciliation, redress and non-racialism. Symbols of oppression serve to promote the opposite. We therefore condemn the display of the old South African flag in Brian’s Bar in Sea Point and call on each and every citizen to work together to build a country we can be proud of.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without

notice? There are no objections. I see the hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates our own home-boy, Benni McCarthy, on his appointment as Cape Town City's Head coach of the soccer team, as well as his 2-0 victory record since his appointment.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? There are no objections. Sorry, I thought I heard the hon member Max talk to that, but I see hon member Kivedo. No, it is your turn, hon member Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Madam Speaker. †Ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis opregte medelye uitspreek teenoor ons mede-agbare kollega, Tertius Simmers en sy geliefdes. Agb lid Simmers se skoonmoeder, mev Sarah Cornelia Erasmus is Dinsdagoggend in George oorlede na 46 jaar getroue diens vir die Wes-Kaapse Departement van Gesondheid. Mag haar siel in vrede rus.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die SPEAKER: Is daar enige beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing?

Nee, daar is geen beswaar. Goedgekeur.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[I move without notice:

That the House conveys its sincere condolences to our hon colleague, Tertius Simmers and his loved ones. Hon member Simmers's mother-in-law, Ms Sarah Cornelia Erasmus, died on Tuesday morning after 46 years of faithful service to the Western Cape Department of Health. May her soul rest in peace.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Is there any objection to the motion without notice? No, there is no objection. Agreed to.] †Next person I see, let me go with hon member Botha, hon member Dorothea Gopie, the hon member Max and I will do the next round after that. Thank you. Just hold on.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House mourns the loss of and send condolences to the husband and family of Porterville resident, Florina Daniels, who passed away after a long battle with breast cancer.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are no objections. I see the hon member Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: Thank you. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates athlete Luvo Manyonga on a successful season, going unbeaten in all competitions and winning gold medals in both the World Championships and Diamond League, and calls on the DA Government to facilitate honouring him by naming the Bellville Velodrome and Durban Road after him. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are no objections. I see the hon member Max.

Mr L H MAX: Thank you. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its sympathy and extends its deepest condolences to the Chief Executive Officer of Artscape, Ms Marlene le Roux, and the Chief Director of Community Safety, Mr Simeon George, for the tragic loss of their 15-year-old son Adam, who passed away last

week. Our hearts and minds are with the family during this difficult time. May his soul rest in peace. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? There is no objection. I now do the next round. I see the hon member Simmers, hon member Nkondlo and there was one other hand. Hon member Magaxa.

Mr T A SIMMERS: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates Laerskool Blanco for celebrating their 170<sup>th</sup> year of existence, making them the second oldest primary school in the Western Cape. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? There are no objections. The next person in that sequence. Hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N NKONDLO: Thank you. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the help by the National Government for drought relief in the DA-run Western Cape, as the Department of Water and Sanitation is continuously monitoring dam levels, followed by the



National Disaster Management Centre committing almost R21 million to Cape Town and Minister Des van Rooyen giving more than R74 million, and commends the ANC National Government for prioritising the crisis.

I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are no objections. I now see the hon member Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that it is time for the holy Muslim festival of Eid Al-Adha tomorrow and wishes all believers a blessed day with their families and friends. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are no objections. I now do the next round. I see the hon member Simmers, hon member Schäfer and hon member Gillion. Hon member Beerwinkel, hon member Dyantyi and the rest will follow soon. Thank you.  
Hon Simmers?

Mr T A SIMMERS: Thank you. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates Progress RFC for being crowned the 2017 SWD Eagles Premier League Champions and their promotion to play in the Gold Cup. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the ... [Interjection.] Hon member Dugmore, you could do that outside. Are there any objections to the motion? There are no objections. Hon member Dugmore, hon member Gillion is on the floor. Thank you.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Rape Crisis as it commemorated its 40<sup>th</sup> year of existence yesterday and had during this period placed rape and assistance to victims of rape, firmly on the national agenda and that the House also commends the work done and contributions made by its founder, Anne Mayne.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? There are no objections. I see the hon member Schäfer and then I will start the next round of three.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends and congratulates Riaan Cedras, a former Cape Flats grass cutter for the South African Navy, who just received his PhD in Marine Biology from the University of the Western Cape. This is a phenomenal achievement for a man who managed to rise above his poverty-stricken community and make a success of the opportunities afforded to him. I here so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There are no objections. Agreed to. The next round. I see the hon member Kivedo. I see hon member Beerwinkel, I did say and let me take hon member Simmers in this round. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You did mention it.

The SPEAKER: My apologies. You had the first round. Table staff will you guide me, please? Thank you.

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Baie dankie, agb Speaker. Ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy opregte gelukwense uitspreek teenoor ons parlementêre mediabeampte en -kollega, Matthys Johannes Odendaal, wie op

29 Augustus 2017 sy doktorsgraad in Linguistiek aan die Universiteit van die Wes-Kaap verwerf het.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die SPEAKER: Is daar enige beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates our parliamentary media official and colleague, Matthys Johannes Odendaal, who on 29 August 2017 obtained his doctorate in Linguistics at the University of the Western Cape.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Is there any objection to the motion without notice? †There is no objection. Agreed to. The next hon member, I think it is hon member Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commiserates with the family of the long-standing Apostolic faith mission pastor, Mervin Williams, who passed on this

morning after suffering a stroke a while ago. He leaves behind his wife Patricia, three sons Devon, Shane and Ethan and also a few months-old granddaughter.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There are no objections. Agreed to. I see the hon member Simmers, after which I will go to hon member Dyantyi and then start the next round. You may proceed.

Mr T A SIMMERS: Thank you. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates the firefighting team from Eden District Municipality, for winning the grinder challenge in a new national record time of 3 minutes 28 seconds, in a competition hosted by the Ethekwini Fire and Emergency Services over the weekend. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to. I see the hon member Dyantyi.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Baie dankie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you.] †Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the anger that exploded this weekend at the West Coast town of Klawer, after a white man shot and killed Hartvicht Manneljies Ockhuis and wounded his friend Howard Andrews; and further notes the suspect was arrested and appeared at the Klawer Magistrates Court on charges of murder and attempted murder; condemns the racist attack and welcomes the arrest of the perpetrator.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is an objection. It will be recorded. It [Interjections.] Order, please members. Order. There is an objection. It will be recorded on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Kivedo, I see hon member Gillion, I see hon member Wenger [Interjection.] I will work with you in the next round. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: One of the – members, may I ... hon member Kivedo, kindly take your seat. Hon members, there is a parliamentary right to agree, to disagree, to object. Let us respect that fact as part of our Rules and not get into a spat while someone else is on the floor. I recognize the hon member

Kivedo. You may proceed.

†Mnr B D KIVEDO: Baie dankie, agb Speaker. Ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis opregte medelye uitspreek teenoor die gesin en geliefdes van Vallentino Williams (17), 'n Graad 10-leerder aan die Sekondêre Skool Proteus in Atlantis, wie Sondagaand koelbloedig vermoor is. Mag sy siel in vrede rus. Ons wens die personeel, leerders en ouergemeenskap van hierdie skool sterkte toe.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die SPEAKER: Is daar enige beswaar teen die voorstel?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House conveys its sincere condolences to the family and loved ones of Vallentino Williams (17), a Grade 10 learner at the Secondary School Proteus in Atlantis, who was murdered in cold blood on Sunday evening. May his soul rest in peace. We wish the staff, learners and parent community of this school lots of strength.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Is there any objection to the motion?] †There is no objection. Agreed to. The next hon member, hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House calls for an urgent solution into the financial situation at the Child Welfare Society in Albertinia, an NGO funded by the Provincial Government; as it turns out they do not have a proper telephone or vehicle for the work of social workers in Albertinia.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] Hon member Fritz, I asked if there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

†Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Ja, ek het klaar ge-object.

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes, I have already objected.]

The SPEAKER: Okay. You have objected. It will be recorded on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] The next hon member, table staff? Who is it? The hon



member Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House calls on the National Police Department to increase the reservist recruitment rate and reinstate reservist levels to what they were before the recruitment moratorium.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? There is an objection. It will be recorded on the ... [Interjections.] Order, hon members. We are talking about democracy and the right to object or not. So, let us not get stuck there. Who is the next round of three members? Hon member Mnqasela, hon member Dijana and hon member Lekker. Are you on your feet, hon Lekker? No? Hon member Mnqasela?

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the barbaric acts of violence and criminality that ensued in Kleinmond on Monday 28 August 2017; further notes that vandalism of public and private property and looting cannot be tolerated and calls on law enforcement agencies to unleash the full might of the law and bring to book the perpetrators of these crimes. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? There are no objections. I see the hon member Dijana.

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the Beaufort West residents of Ward 7 have been getting dirty drinking water delivered in an old rusted truck for the past four weeks, as the newly elected DA councillor Japie van der Linde does not care for them and further notes his farm pigs get better quality water than the community of Ward 7. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There are objections. The motion will be recorded on the Order Paper. Can I see the next round? It is the hon member Mngqasela, hon member Olivier and I might have missed someone on this side. Hon member Lekker, you may proceed. Hon member Mngqasela, would you mind taking your seat please? I omitted hon member Lekker. You may proceed, hon member Lekker.

UNksz P Z LEKKER: Enkosi, Somlomo. Somlomo, ndiphakamisa ngaphandle kwesaziso:

Ukuba le Ndlu iqhwabele izandla abakwantsasana ngomsebenzi

oncomekayo xa bathe bakhangela usana oluminyaka mithathu uAseza Sauls waseWallacedene xa ebethe walahleka ngethuba ebeye evenkileni nodadewabo. UAseza lo ke uthe wafunyanwa ehleli nomntu abangamaziyo ePhilippi.

*[Isiphakamiso njengoko siphakanyiswe liLungu.]*

*[Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follow.]*

[Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House applauds the police for a job well done when they searched for a three year child, Aseza Sauls, from Wallacedene who had gone missing while going to the shop with her sister. Aseza was subsequently found with an unknown person in Philippi.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? There are no objections. Hon member Dijana, it was about a child lost in Wallacedene, if I might add. The next round. Hon Mnqasela, you were on your feet. It is now your turn to speak.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its sympathy and deepest condolences to the family, the Democratic Alliance and Blompark community on the passing of a DA activist, a community worker, a democrat, Ms Felicia Dunston from Blompark in Gansbaai; further notes that Ms Dunston was loved by her people; she has served her community with distinction and her zest for community service has left an indelible mark in her community. Our hearts and minds are with her, her family and Blompark community during this difficult time.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

An HON MEMBER: Statement.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, may her soul rest in peace.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved? There are no objections. The next round ... [Interjection.] Hon members, please allow the Chair to determine a statement or a motion. The idea is that a statement is 2 minutes. A motion is normally shorter than that. I see the hon member Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: †Somlomo [Madam Speaker], I move without notice:

That the House notes that hon Education MEC, Debbie Schäfer, was again proven wrong about her predictions that the National Government will not in the near future give money for the drought and fire crisis in the Western Cape, as the National Government, in her own words “does not understand disaster”. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Members, any further motions without notice? I see the hon member Lekker, I see hon member Tyatyam. I see hon member Davids. So, we have ... [Interjections.]

Work with me, it is hon member Lekker, hon member Tyatyam and hon member Davids. Hon member Olivier, please do not get too animated there with Minister Winde. You may proceed, hon member Lekker.

UNksz P Z LEKKER: Somlomo, ndiphakamisa ngaphandle kwesaziso:

Ukuba le Ndlu iqwalasele ukuba abakwantsasana nangona bengenazo ngokwaneleyo izixhobo zokusebenza, besilwa neziyobisi nemigewu kweli phondo. Ndicela ukuba siqhwabele izandla abakwantsasana eNyanga ngokuba bedebabamba imigewu engamakhulu amane aneshumi

elinesine abathe benza izinto ezithile ezahlukahlukeneyo ezingalunganga. Kubo kuquka nabo babanjwe nemipu kunye neziyobisi kule veki iphelileyo.

*[Isiphakamiso njengoko siphakanyiswe liLungu.]*

*[Translation of isiXhosa paragraphs follow.]*

[Ms P Z LEKKER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that although the police are not well resourced to do their work, fighting drugs and gangsters in this province. I ask that we applaud the police in Nyanga for arresting four hundred and fourteen criminals who have committed various crimes. Among them are those who were caught with guns and drugs last week.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

†The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? There are no objections. I see the hon member Tyatyam, looking very spiffy.

Mr S G TYATAM: Please, please.

The SPEAKER: You may proceed, hon member Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the hon Premier and the DA forced the Conduct Committee Chairperson, hon Lennit Max, and the Registrar of Members Interests, to resign in order to protect the one and only salary bragger [Interjection.] Human Settlements MEC Bonginkosi Madikizela, who failed to declare gifts and hospitality he enjoyed on his birthday; further notes that this law he broke was in fact promulgated by the same DA whom he leads today. You must protect your laws that you make.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There are objections. The motion will be recorded on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] Hon members, please. Hon member Davids wishes to proceed. Hon member Tyatyam.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that another life has been lost due to informal settlement fires in the province, following a fire that broke out at Poeksebos in Rylands this week, displacing 127 people and claimed the life of Maruwaan Thompson (29); conveys its deepest condolences to his family and friends and calls for concerted efforts to eliminate informal settlements and its risks.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are no objections. Agreed to. Any further motions without notice? Was someone in the queue? I see the hon member Tyatyam, I see hon member Davids. You may proceed.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you very much. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that UWC produced 100 PhD's and nearly 5000 graduates this year, following the graduation of more than 620 students this week and congratulates the university for its work. Well done.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections? There are no objections. I see the hon member Davids.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the provincial Human Settlement's inconsiderate and uncaring attitude, following an order to Ms Sylvia Beukes (77) from Parkwood to demolish a wendy house she erected at her house to accommodate her divorced daughter, who is very sick and



in need of her care; notes further that before she erected the structure, she asked for the Department's approval and was told there was a shortage of inspectors, her case will be attended to next year; and calls for an urgent intervention from the Provincial Government.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? [Interjections.] Are there any objections? Yes, there are. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further motions without notice? I see the hon member Davids again and I see hon member Dijana.

Ms S W DAVIDS: Thank you. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that Ms Sanna Morris (50), a widow who stayed ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members ... [Interjection.]

Ms M N GILLION: It is the Ministers!

The SPEAKER: Please, there is a speaker on the floor.

Ms S W DAVIDS:

That the House notes with concern that Ms Sanna Morris (50), a widow who stayed for over 30 years at the Katara farming community on the outskirts of the Greater Knysna Municipality has been evicted; notes further that the eviction has caused her so much stress that she is now getting medical treatment as this process started shortly after her husband died, and calls for the National Government to intervene.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? There are no objections. I see, I think hon member Olivier. No, sorry, hon member Dijana first and then hon member Olivier.

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you. Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the recent cases of racism in the province; the first was a Saldanha Bay farmer, Pieter Bester, who swore at municipal workers and called them by K and H words, which led to *crimen injuria* charges laid against him and the recent murder of a black man by a white man in the West Coast, and calls on SAPS not to leave any stone unturned in its investigations. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? There

are no objections. I see the hon member Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its support to the calls made by the National Teachers' Union for an urgent summit of all stakeholders to address the challenges of attacks on teachers and other forms of violence in schools, which they say has reached a crisis point, with very minimal intervention from this Provincial Government. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? There is an objection. The motion will be recorded on the Order Paper. Hon members, that concludes Motions without Notice. †Dit sluit Voorstelle sonder Kennisgewing af. [That concludes Motions without Notice.] †Let us move to the Orders of the Day. The Secretary will read the first Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of principle of the *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation (Emergency Funds) Bill* [B 5 – 2017].

The SPEAKER: I now see the hon, the Minister Ivan Meyer.

*(The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair.)*

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. On 13 August 2017 I tabled the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation, in other words the Emergency Funds Bill 2017, the Adjusted Estimates of Provincial Expenditure 2017 and the Provincial Extraordinary Government Gazette for discussion in this House.

At the time I highlighted the scope and the scale of the disasters that struck the Western Cape. The persistent drought was worsened by a massive winter storm that struck Cape Town and surrounding areas over the period 6 to 8 June 2017.

Secondly, during the same period a huge fire raged in the Eden District, specifically the Knysna and Plettenberg Bay area between Thursday 8 June 2017 and Sunday 11 June 2017.

In addition, Mr Deputy Speaker, this Government had to respond to the partial destruction of the Swartland Hospital and related equipment, caused by a fire on 18 March 2017 and I want to thank the Minister of Health who was immediately on the site in Malmesbury, as well as the Minister of Local Government and Environmental Affairs, Minister Bredell.

Sadly a large section of Imizamo Yethu, Hout Bay, Cape Town, was also struck by devastating fires. Mr Deputy Speaker, the core values of the Western Cape Government includes amongst others:

- Caring, and we cared for those who we serve and work with;
- Responsiveness, we served the needs of the citizens;
- Integrity, to be honest and do the right thing; and
- Accountability, we took responsibility.

The Western Cape Government's actions during this drought and these disasters were informed by our core values. Mr Deputy Speaker, the response to these disasters clearly highlighted the character of the people of the Western Cape and South Africa. The outpouring of compassion during the Knysna fires, which has been described by the Knysna Fire Chief, Mr Clinton Manual, as the biggest disaster in South African recent history, highlighted that South Africans have the ability to respond in a most caring manner when others experience adversity.

Mr Deputy Speaker, R75 million was made available by the Western Cape Government during a meeting that we had in Knysna. Business plans have been finalised and approved and Memorandums of Understanding have been put in place.

The Western Cape Provincial Treasury will now closely monitor the implementation and financial performance against budget to ensure that the allocated funding indeed brings a positive change in the lives of the individuals and the communities who were affected by the drought.

This Government will ensure that we do not experience the same level of incompetence that resulted in, as alleged by AgriSA, the wrong feed being delivered to farmers, some of which was found dumped in the Free State. Several boreholes were also drilled in the same area. Feed prices being inflated to benefit service providers and departmental officials taking some of the feed for themselves, in another province. Despite R265 million spent by the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform on the Relief Programs, farmers have told devastating stories of how all they received was only feed enough to feed their livestock for a day.

Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, was allocated R212 million of which only R146 million was spent, despite the country being in the grips of the worst drought in decades.

The Western Cape Government will not make the same mistake. The allocated funds will reach all the identified beneficiaries and I am thankful to my team from Provincial Treasury, who sit in the box, because they will see to it that every single cent of that R75 million is allocated for the purpose it was intended.

We will hold every single department, together with the Standing Committee and the Budget Committee, accountable for the money. Mr Deputy Speaker, I would once again like to express my sincere thanks to all the businesses, the NGO's, the financial institutions, the various municipalities, the National

Government and disaster management agencies for excellent support during this most difficult period.

The Adjustment Appropriation shows that the Western Cape Government is indeed a responsive government, who will stand by our communities in a period of distress.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dis wat jy dink. Wag 'n bietjie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: That's what you think. Wait a minute.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE:: Mr Deputy Speaker, despite all our difficulties, the people of the Western Cape demonstrated the power of a united resolve to assist those affected by the drought and the broader disasters. I am further heartened by the announcement earlier this week that an additional amount of R74,5 million has been made available to the Western Cape by the National Disaster Fund.

I want to thank all our colleagues, particularly from the Provincial Disaster Fund, Provincial Disaster Centre, as well as the Provincial Treasury and the various departments, for cooperation in terms of the applications to the National Disaster Management Centre.

These funds will be dispersed as follows:

- Department of Agriculture: R40 million for transportation of livestock feed to affected farming communities;
- The City of Cape Town: R20,8 million for drought relief projects; and
- Bitou Local Municipality: R10,9 million for further drought relief projects;
- Theewaterskloof Municipality: Mr Deputy Speaker, your area, your responsibility as a constituency, will now receive R3,1 million for further drought relief projects. [Interjection.]

This is a response ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Stick to your speech!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: This is a response to our submission ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Why does he start looking around before ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...that we dated May 2017. While we are extremely grateful to the National Disaster Fund ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Stick to what is written ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. Chief Whip?



Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, can we stop this ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I will. [Interjections.] Order, order! Hon member Dyantyi, I have been listening carefully. You are on the verge of interfering with the Minister. Order! Hon Minister, you may continue.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Stay sharp now.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I will start all over. Mr Deputy Speaker, despite all these difficulties, the people of the Western Cape demonstrated the power of a united resolve to assist those affected by this crisis. I am further heartened by the announcement earlier this week that an additional R74,5 million has been made available to the Western Cape by the National Disaster Fund.

I want to thank all our colleagues that assisted, both the Department of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and the Provincial Treasury for assisting partly with the technical assessments and the submission to the National Treasury, in cooperation with the National Department of COGTA, these monies have now been made available.

These funds will be distributed as follows:

- Department of Agriculture, Minister Winde: R40 million for transportation of livestock feed for affected farming communities;

- The City of Cape Town: R20,8 million for drought relief projects; and
- Bitou Local Municipality: R10,9 million for further drought relief projects;
- Theewaterskloof Municipality: R3,1 million for further drought relief projects.

This is also a direct response to our submission dated May 2017. While we are extremely grateful to the National Disaster Fund, we trust that urgent consideration will also be given to further requests for further national support, following the recent June 2017 disasters. I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just before I see the first speaker, can I just remind members that the scope of this debate will be limited to the various votes in the Bill. So it is not a wide ranging debate covering all votes, only the votes mentioned in the Bill. I see the hon Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The storm that hit the Western Cape on Wednesday 7 June 2017, was catastrophic and damaged a total of 172 of our schools.

The extent of damage at each school has varied, but has included roof damage at 102 schools; damage to fences at 27 schools; structural damage at 14 schools and damage to mobile classrooms of 4 schools. Schools also reported

other damages which include fire damage, fallen trees and damage to electrical components.

Four schools were very badly damaged in the storm and the costs to repair these schools are significant. Four serious cases were one in the Southern Cape. A school hostel was severely damaged by the fire and the expected costs to repair and replace what was damaged is estimated at between R15 million and R20 million.

At a school in Metro South, the school's roof blew off, which has come in at a cost of R3,5 million to repair and replace. In Metro North a school suffered damages owing to a collapsed walkway and damage to the school roof where roof sheets were dislodged and gutters were blown off. The estimated costs to repair and replace what was damaged comes in at around R2,8 million.

At a school in Metro Central a school's administration block and classrooms were severely damaged. The entire roof was blown off and school furniture destroyed. Estimated costs to repair and replace what was damaged are around R1,5 million.

A combined estimated cost to repair and/or replacement at all 172 schools is R72,9 million. The WCED was allocated an additional amount of R15 million by the Provincial Treasury and I must thank them for that, as well as my Cabinet colleagues.

The amount was used immediately as a first response, to deal with the serious cases and to make buildings safe for use. A total of 55 schools that were visited for inspection were immediately repaired, which means that learning and teaching could resume almost immediately. Mr Deputy Speaker, this leaves a remaining sum of almost R60 million for the WCED to cover the full cost of the repairs.

I am informed that Provincial Disaster Management has already submitted a request to National Disaster Management for R35,1 million to assist with 21 school projects and I am very pleased to hear that we have been granted additional funding.

The challenge is that this money will only become available as far as I understand, by next year whilst the WCED is faced with the situation where schools continually phone in to find out when repair work will start.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I have continuously highlighted the ongoing financial constraints and pressures that the WCED is facing. To find an extra R22,8 million or more if we do not receive what we are hoping for from National Government, it will mean that other projects will have to be delayed.

Our CFO and finance officers are currently considering our budget to see where additional funding can be found by readjusting current projects and/or programs to cover the costs of the remaining reparation works.

We received indications from several sources outside Government, that they may assist us, but so far only one seems likely to materialise. Any assistance is greatly appreciated to ease the pressure on the WCED.

I must take this opportunity to commend all officials from my Department and from the Department of Transport and Public Works, for initiating the repair process so quickly. I must also thank all my officials, school principals and teachers and in some cases even parents, for their support and willingness to work with our officials in meeting these challenges positively and quickly.

There is no doubt that we face tough financial pressures at the moment, compounded by the drought and the impact of the destructive storm that hit the Cape in June this year. As mentioned on previous occasions, my Department has cut our budget to the bone and we are having to do the impossible with less.

I would like to thank the Department for making every effort to effect savings and efficiencies which have enabled us to do extraordinary things with limited resources.

I have already thanked Provincial Treasury, but thank you then once again to Provincial Treasury, who have had an unenviable task in trying to accommodate and provide relief to the various Government departments that

were affected by the storm and the fire and again to my Cabinet colleagues, who have persisted in their stated intention of assisting our frontline services to maintain the best possible service delivery under the circumstances.

To conclude, we received the additional R15 million to our provincial equitable share from the Provincial Revenue Fund and the results of the fire and the adverse weather conditions, which will increase our main appropriation from R20,629 billion to R20,644 billion.

I request this House to approve the Adjustment Budget for the current financial year. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. One wants to acknowledge any initiatives, given the challenging economic environment we live in today, of any resources that may be found to respond to the negative impacts that have been felt by communities, including the economy in general. With that said, in the allocation of such resources, the principles of governance remain a standard that should never be compromised.

As I said this, it was so unfortunate that the experience one found in the debate on the Standing Committee in Agriculture to appropriate these emergency funds, the Chairperson took it upon herself to then disregard these

basic principles towards expediency and partisan approach in the debate to arrive at the support of this budget. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So true. Just like her.

Ms N D NKONDLO: This I say, hon members, that our oversight role ...  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Our oversight role as this Legislature... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo, just one second.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, again this is under Rule 57. This is misleading the House ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...and putting out false aspersions to me as a Chair.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, order. Hon member Schäfer, your point has been made, but it is not a point of order. Hon member Nkondlo, you may proceed. You may proceed.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Our oversight role  
[Interjection.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi kole! Gooi kole!

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Throw coals! Throw coals!]

Ms N D NKONDLO: ...as the Legislature cannot be treated casually, driven by partisan or more sweetheart engagements. I once again welcome the advice that was given here in this House by a Treasury to all of us when they were presenting their budget. They even further directed all of us through our Standing Committees, with the rider that said, “any detail must be presented by the departments to the Standing Committee”, so that we do not bog down the presentation to ask for detail that relates to how this money will be allocated or spent by the various departments.

It is so unfortunate when I myself, was asking some of the questions in that particular committee and acknowledging that the HOD at some point, whispered to the Minister about some of the information, which they would have presented to the Treasury, which unfortunately at that time was not presented in the committee ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member, your time ... [Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: ...which I felt was very important.



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired. You can just finish your sentence. Your time has expired.

Ms N D NKONDLO: In that regard, we do not support this vote. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon Minister Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, Members of Parliament, member of the media, they are still there. Thank you very much, Minister Meyer, for giving us the amount of R19,460 million for disaster emergencies. Despite having the bigger slice of the budget, supply still does not meet the demand.

The Department is faced with a growing population and a complex disease profile where people have quadruple disease, which lead to service pressures in all facilities.

Mr Deputy Speaker, as if the service pressures are not enough, this year we witnessed fire related disasters and storms, affecting our facilities, more so in both Malmesbury and Knysna.

In March 2017, the Swartland Hospital caught fire and some parts of the hospital were burnt down. The impact of that fire has had far reaching effects not only on the hospital itself, but also on the other facilities in the region,

which have had to absorb some of the services previously delivered by the hospital.

Those facilities are Stellenbosch Hospital, Paarl Hospital, Wesfleur Hospital, Lapa Munnik, Radie Kotze and Vredenburg Hospitals. The Malmesbury Community Day Centre as City's CDC, was used as a temporary emergency centre for all local medical emergencies.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the situation is unsustainable and needs to be rectified as soon as possible. That is why the majority of the funds, which is the R18 260 000, have been allocated to rebuild some parts of the wards that were affected.

This will include the design and construction of the two prefab buildings, with the capacity of 24 beds each; conversion of the nurses home into the outpatient department; X-ray and administration block on the first floor; conversion of a current admin into a minor theatre in CSSD; re-establishment of the EC via the construction of a prefab in the place of the existing buildings destroyed by the fire; demolition of the fire damaged area.

Although we have these short terms goals to ensure that we continue to provide uninterrupted services to our clients, based on our health care, already, Swartland Hospital is earmarked for replacement because it is 102 years old.

We will increase the beds from a current 85 to 130, and we have already put together a business case that will be submitted to the National Department of Health, applying for funds for the new hospital.

Now the rest of the money, which is the R1,2 million, will be spent on the facilities that were affected by the storm damage across the province. As we all know, the Knysna Hospital in Eden was greatly affected by the fires that occurred in that district, that left many residents without homes. Even though it did not catch fire, it was severely affected by smoke, which is why we have allocated R731 000 to clear the smoke and soot. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] your voice is going down, please.  
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Metro and some parts of the province experienced the greatest storms in June and that also affected some of our facilities and these are the facilities that have been affected. This is where the R1,2 million will be spent:

- Eden District: R806 000 for 2 facilities, including Knysna;
- Cape Winelands District: R10 000 for 1 facility;
- Metro: R344 000 allocated for 9 facilities; and lastly
- Overberg: R40 000 is allocated for 1 facility.

I would really like to thank the Provincial Treasury for the funds and as you can see, it will be put to good use for the service of our clients. I would also like to thank the staff for their hard work in ensuring that services are delivered, regardless of the disasters.

I hereby table the R19,46 million to be added to the current budget. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ACDP supports the Bill. We were briefed by Provincial Treasury and then being a member of the Standing Committee on Education and also Community Safety, both committees supported the Bill, Mr Deputy Speaker. That is why we support the Bill. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Dyantyi.

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Baie dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.] †We want to thank the Department of Local Government for, in the Standing Committee, taking us through and telling us about their future plans.

†Al die boorgate en al die munisipaliteite waarvan julle ons vertel het, en so aan, [All the boreholes and all the municipalities you told us about, and so

on,] †and a lot of the kind of plans that they have. But, whereas they have done that and given us that important information, and we will watch that space and use it as we play that oversight role, there are key areas of concern.

Look, this is a department, in terms of their aim which is to monitor, coordinate and support municipalities to be effective in fulfilling their developmental mandate and facilitate service delivery and disaster resilience through engagement with government spheres and social partners.

In going through that, there are a few things that we picked up which, from the meeting with Provincial Treasury we said we are interested in those. Firstly, it became clear that the first task of quantifying the extent of the damage, by the time they were meeting with us, they still – †dit was nog ‘n hele duimsuig [it has been a whole thumbsuck.]

They were telling us about plus minus R4 billion. They did not know the exact figure. They could not even give us a breakdown, when we met with them. In terms of the provincial disasters declared, interacting with Agriculture, it became clear that for example, in areas like Central Karoo, West Coast and Cape Winelands, they are mentioned as districts that are declared as disaster, but in terms of the Act you needed those local municipalities to take responsibility and the Department of Agriculture could not move quickly, because those municipalities were not ready and hon Winde, as an MEC, would know better that they will delay the bid by the

lacklustre performance of that department under the - †die LUR Bredell [the MEC Bredell.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Do you really believe yourself?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Secondly – you just have to listen, if you want to. Secondly, we then dealt with the issue of the reprioritisation of their plans, because in terms of Section 56 of the Disaster Management Act, the Premier had not made a declaration, is supposed to have started the reprioritisation of the capital and operating budget. Meeting with that department which was supposed to champion that, they could not even indicate; it became clear they have not started that process.

†Nou, die feit is, daar is te veel dinge wat ons nie antwoorde op het nie. Nè? En min wat gedoen is. [Now, the fact is, there are too many things we do not have answers to. Hey? And little has been done.] So, such a vote and an adjustment - because why would we support an adjustment that is not even telling us, this is what we are reprioritising across these departments and local government and the Premier should be responsible for that. For that reason, Mr Deputy Speaker, we are very clear that this adjustment is not supported. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I am actually disappointed in the previous speaker.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You must be because [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: First of all, we did give them a thorough briefing and thorough breakdown and obviously, as we stated then, we do have a detailed list. The total cost of that ideal plan will be R4,8 billion. The current needs are around R259 million. [Interjection.] We have also explained to him - you had your chance.

We have also explained to him that that was a moving target. As you move closer to day zero, obviously costs will increase and so forth. But I would like to start by thanking the Western Cape Government officials, the municipal officials, including the Disaster Management Teams in all our regions in the Western Cape, who are helping to manage the worst drought in 100 years in this province.

There are many people who are working tirelessly on a daily basis, to alleviate the impact of this disaster on the Western Cape and I want to thank them all for their ongoing efforts.

Mr Deputy Speaker, this Bill is about emergency funding of R75 million, that the Province has allocated to the various departments in tackling the ongoing drought as well as recent storms and fire disasters that struck the Western Cape.

†Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, hierdie geld is bewillig om opkomende boere en kommersiële boere te help, wie se vee sou vrek van die honger as ons hulle nie van voer voorsien het nie. Die Departement van Landbou in die Wes-Kaap het die afgelope 5 maande reeds elke maand sowat R11 miljoen bestee aan veevoer wat voorsien is aan die nagenoeg 1300 kommersiële- en opkomende boere regoor hierdie provinsie. Die geld is ook aangewend om te help betaal vir die skoonmaak van die kanale in ons belangrikste damme en riviere.

Die skoonmaak is 'n nasionale regeringsfunksie wat nie uitgevoer word nie. Die geld is ook gebruik om Knysna te help na die onlangse verwoestende brande. Die geld is gebruik om boorgate te sink in gebiede soos Beaufort-Wes, Ladismith en Kannaland Distrik.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr Deputy Speaker, this money was allocated to assist emerging and commercial farmers whose livestock would have died from hunger if we had not supplied it with feed. The Department of Agriculture in the Western



Cape has for the past 5 months each month spent about R11 million on feed that was supplied to the almost 1300 commercial and emerging farmers throughout this province. The money was also used to help to pay for the clearing of the canals in our most important dams and rivers.

The clearing is a National Government function and is not executed. The money was also used to assist Knysna following the recent devastating fires. The money was used to sink boreholes in areas like Beaufort West, Ladismith and Kannaland District.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, this drought is not going away. In fact, we are nearing the end of our winter rainfall period and the truth is that our dam levels in the Western Cape are on average only 32% to 34% full. We will be entering a summer with high water demand, with dams only about a third full.

This is a cause of great concern and one we are most worried about. There can be no doubt the Province will require much more assistance from National Government. This week we were pleased by the announcement of the National Minister of COGTA, Des Van Rooyen, stating that R75 million has been allocated to the Western Cape. R40 million was towards agriculture and the rest is intended for the four worst affected municipalities in the province. These are at this stage the City of Cape Town, Bitou, Knysna and Theewaterskloof.

†Agbare mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek het enkele maande gelede, nog voor die

winter in hierdie Huis gesê ons hoop om die damme teen Oktober teen 75% vol te hê. Die kans daarvoor is besig om te verdwyn soos mis voor die son en daar is geen twyfel dat ons mag in wees vir 'n baie moeilike somer nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

***[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]***

[Mr Deputy Speaker, a few months ago, before the winter I said in this House we are hoping to have the dams about 75% full by October. The chance for that is disappearing like mist before the sun and there is no doubt that we may be in for a very difficult summer. [Interjections.]]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Want julle doen niks nie.

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: Because you are doing nothing.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dit is dus al meer noodsaaklik dat ons al meer moet doen om water te spaar. [Tussenwerpsels.] Ons moet eenvoudig gehoor gee aan die versoeke deur ons munisipaliteite soos die Stad Kaapstad wat vra dat die totale verbruik onder 500 miljoen per dag moet wees. Ons is tans op 600 miljoen so ons sal moet 'n ekstra 100 miljoen liter per dag spaar. Die Stad het 'n uitstekende plan opgestel en ek wil hulle gelukwens daarmee, wat kyk na grondwater sowel as ontsouting. Ek wil die Stad weereens gelukwens en my dank uitspreek dat hulle bereid is dat ons ook - die kleiner munisipaliteite - kan gebruik maak van hul kundigheid. Die Provinsie het ook vandag 'n perskonferensie aangebied waartydens die provinsiale planne

vir die droogte aangekondig is. Dit bly ons prioriteit om te kyk na die medium- en langtermyn om watersekerheid vir die Wes-Kaap aan te spreek.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: It is therefore all the more necessary that we do more to save water. [Interjections.] We simply have to heed the requests by our municipalities like the City of Cape Town that is asking for the total consumption to drop below 500 million per day. We are currently on 600 million and thus we will have to save an extra 100 million litres per day. The City has drawn up an excellent plan and I want to congratulate them on that, one that is looking at ground water as well as desalination. I want to again congratulate the City and express my thanks that they are prepared that we – the smaller municipalities – can make use of their expertise. The Province today also hosted a press conference where the provincial plans for the drought have been announced. It remains our priority to look at the medium and long term to address water security for the Western Cape.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, moving forward it will require the combined efforts of us all from the three spheres of government, the public and the media to get through this drought. We must work together. I want to urge the public to continue to use water wisely. No matter if it rains outside your house, every drop we can save is precious. The DA therefore supports this Bill. I thank you.

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agbare Minister Meyer.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Meyer.]

†Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, baie dankie vir die geleentheid en dankie vir almal wat 'n bydrae gelewer het tot hierdie debat.

[The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you for the opportunity and thank you to all who have made a contribution to this debate.]

I would also like to thank the colleagues for supporting the Emergency Funds Bill. Thank you also to all the public representatives in this House, all the Mayors, all the councillors of all political parties, all the NGOs and all our senior managers in this Government and also in other spheres of government both in the municipal space and our senior managers in the National Government for all departments for working long hours in visiting these areas, putting the complex application to the National Treasury, to COGTA and to the National Disaster Management Centre. We had to respond quickly in invoking Section 25 of the Public Finance Management Act. I want to thank my colleagues in the Cabinet because they immediately supported our approach to make emergency money available.

I have also, together with my colleague, the Minister of Agriculture, visited the Leeuw River, together with my senior officials of the Provincial Treasury that is seated here and our colleagues, the senior managers of the Agriculture

Department, visited the Leeuw River to inspect the canals, feeding water into the Voëlvlei Dam and the Leeuw River is about 28 kilometres away from Voëlvlei Dam and, as you know, Mr Deputy Speaker, that is the second-biggest supplier of water, Voëlvlei Dam, to the residents in the City of Cape Town – 4,2 million citizens.

We have inspected the canals at Voëlvlei Dam, we have noticed that the National Department have failed to do basic maintenance at the canal and we had to make an additional R3 million available to clear the sand...  
[Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: So daai is die probleem?

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: So that is the problem?]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...so that the water could be transported...  
[Interjections.]

†Me M N GILLION: Daai is die probleem met water.

[Ms M N GILLION: That is the problem with water.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...from the Leeuw River into the Voëlvlei Dam, but the whole process - there is a detailed process to determine the quantum of this disaster. We are still busy with the Minister of Local Government and his team together with the Provincial Disaster Management Centre as well as the National Disaster Management Centre and the various

departments because the quantum of this disaster as we will still see in the years to come, not only now... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We do not even know. You do not even tell us...

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: So the first 75% is firstly an emergency response.

Ms M N GILLION: We do not believe you... [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We will see in the years to come. [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Even the National Treasury and the National Disaster Management Centre ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, order Minister, just one second.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...they are following the same process.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dyantyi, the time for your speech has expired long time ago. Please allow the Minister the time to speak.

An HON MEMBER: Your talk started a long time ago. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS

AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: [Inaudible.] ...by the ANC.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: So departments have also requested to reprioritise and did so for example the transport and public works, the roads, education, infrastructure, health and maintenance, the cost of the disaster exceeds the current emergency of R75 million and hon Mr Deputy Speaker...

[Interjections.]

†Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hoe weet jy daai?

[Mr Q R DYANTYI: How do you know that?]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Omdat hy slim is.

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Because he is clever.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, what we have here is we will certainly need more support. There will be definitely a need to give further support and it will be considered later this year in the adjustment budget. We have also agreed that we will have to amend future capital budgets. We are now preparing in the Government as we go forward to the MTEFs in the next budget cycle for the 2018/19 financial year. I have already communicated to my Cabinet colleagues that we will have to reveal the R28,3 billion infrastructure budget over the next three years to also support this particular matter.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We are watching that space. You say these things and we will come back to you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, we have already through the Premier, her PCF, the Provincial Premier Coordinating Forum, the Premier has already alerted the Mayors and the municipal managers of all 30 municipalities... [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: The Premier has left the House.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...that there will be a request that they also in their adjustment budget as we go forward, amend the capital budget to also support our efforts to deal with the drought. The hon Minister of Local Government has done an extensive study, drought, water, infrastructure, a survey [Interjections.] That survey will certainly influence us both in the municipal space as we go forward in terms of this. So I am particularly happy that the colleagues have contributed significantly, I want to thank my Cabinet colleagues because this was a huge, massive effort, but we must not underestimate the lots of amounts of work that was done by our Treasury officials. In particular, I want to pay my deep respect for the long hours and also the site visits because we have also visited together with my Treasury officials, the water infrastructure in Kannaland. We went to see. We have given them many years ago money...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No, we have not been there; †ten spyte van die



[Onhoorbaar.] [in spite of the [Inaudible.]]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...money for the ten - we have given money for ten balls. We have inspected the balls to see whether the balls are functioning.

An HON MEMBER: From the tap to the toilet!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I am pleased to report that those ten balls in Kannaland for example are functioning, that water is pumped to the reservoir. We visited the reservoir. We have concerns about the dam. The dam is currently leaking, but I think what we are now doing is onsite monitoring where the money is being allocated in this particular government and I want to thank our Director Infrastructure Mr Klaas Langenhoven, who is also doing outstanding work to assist us in monitoring the expenditure on infrastructure.

I want to thank everybody for this outstanding debate and your contributions in these discussions. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. That concludes the debate on the Consideration of the Principle of the Bill. Are there any objections to the approval of the Principle of the Bill? There is an objection. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: It is with regard to Vote 11 and 14.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We are getting to the separate votes now. This is...

Mr P UYS: Sorry?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We are getting to the separate votes.

Mr P UYS: No, I know.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja, is the principle then agreed to? Agreed to. The Secretary will read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation (Emergency Funds) Bill* [B 5 – 2017] .

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We will now deal with the separate votes for going forward. The Secretary will read the second Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Votes and Schedule – *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation (Emergency Funds) Bill* [B 5 – 2017].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will put the votes separately and if parties wish to make a declaration of vote for three minutes they must just indicate so otherwise we go very quickly through it.

I put Vote 4 - Community Safety - *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation*

*(Emergency Funds) Bill* [B 5 – 2017]. No objection? Agreed to.

I put Vote 5 - Education - *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation (Emergency Funds) Bill* [B 5 – 2017]. Any objections? No objection? Agreed to.

I put Vote 6 - Health - *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation (Emergency Funds) Bill* [B 5 – 2017]. Any objections? What is vote 6, Vote 6 is Health. Any objections? Agreed to.

I put Vote 7 - Social Development - *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation (Emergency Funds) Bill* [B 5 – 2017]. No objections? Agreed to.

I put Vote 8 - Human Settlements - *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation (Emergency Funds) Bill* [B 5 – 2017]. No objections? Agreed to.

I put Vote 9 - Environmental Affairs and Development Planning - *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation (Emergency Funds) Bill* [B 5 – 2017]. No objections? Agreed to.

I put Vote 10 - Transport and Public Works - *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation (Emergency Funds) Bill* [B 5 – 2017]. No objections? Agreed to.

I have a copy, thank you. I put Vote 11 - Agriculture - *Western Cape*

*Adjustments Appropriation (Emergency Funds) Bill* [B 5 – 2017]. There is an objection of the ANC. The objection will be recorded. [ANC dissenting.] [Interjections.]

I put Vote 14 - Local Government - *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation (Emergency Funds) Bill* [B 5 – 2017]. There is an objection of the ANC. The objection will be recorded. [ANC dissenting.] [Interjections.]

Order! Order! Order! Please attend. That concludes the decision on the vote. I now put the Schedule to the Bill. Any objections? [Interjections.] Agreed to.

I put Clauses 1 to 4 of the Bill. No objections? [Interjections.] Agreed to.

I put the short title. No objections? [Interjections.] Agreed to.

The Secretary will read the third Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Finalisation of the *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation (Emergency Funds) Bill* [B 5 – 2017].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I came to this House on 17 August to table the 2017 Western Cape Adjustment

Appropriation Emergency Funds Bill, the Estimates of Provincial Revenue and Expenditure and the Western Cape Gazette of Allocations to Municipalities.

The relevant budget votes were extensively discussed in the relevant Standing Committees and also in the Budget Committee on 18 August, and I wish to thank all the hon members for taking part in the debates on the respective budget votes as well as the officials of the various Western Cape Government Departments and also the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, because this was an extraordinary rescheduling in the programme and I want to thank the Whippers and the Parliament for fitting this into our very tight legislative programme. Thank you very much, hon Chief Whip of both parties.

Then special thanks also to the budget office in the Provincial Treasury lead by Mr Zakariya Hoosain and Harry Malila for finalising the supporting documentation to give effect to our response to the disasters.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I now move that the 2017 Western Cape Adjustment Appropriation Emergency Bill 2017 be finalised and submitted to the Premier to be assented to. I so move.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I do not have a speakers list, so I put the question. Any objections to the Bill being finalised? No objections, agreed to.

The Secretary will read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation (Emergency Funds) Bill* [B 5 – 2017] .

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Bill will be sent to the Premier for assent. The Secretary will read the fourth Order.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report on the Social Cluster visit week from 8 to 12 May 2017.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Again, we do not have a speaker's list. If any parties wish to make a declaration of vote they can do so, otherwise I simply put the report. Any objections to the report? No objections? Agreed to.

That then concludes the fourth Order of the Day, but before we adjourn there is one piece of business that is still outstanding and I need to ask the attention of the hon member Magaxa. During questions to the Premier on 24 August the hon Premier replied about her visit to Ghana.

The hon member Magaxa by way of repeated interjections questioned and imputed that the hon Premier had used the opportunity, whilst she visited Ghana at Government's expense, to sell her book.

I have studied the Hansard of the exchange and it is clear that the hon

member has exceeded the limits of freedom of speech enjoyed in the House and thus in so doing reflected on the integrity of the hon Premier.

Let me in this connection refer to the guide to procedure of the National Assembly, which also informs our proceedings here, and I quote from that:

“Making unsubstantiated allegations against the integrity of any member is unparliamentary, nor may improper or unworthy motives be imputed to them.”

And also, I quote:

“Members should not be allowed to impute improper motives to other members or cast personal reflections on the integrity of members.”

The Chair has also ruled along similar lines in this House on numerous occasions before. I therefore ask the hon member to withdraw the imputation and the comments he made.

Mr K E MAGAXA: That she was selling her book everywhere?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: My ruling is quite clear. Just withdraw it.

Mr K E MAGAXA: No, I just wanted to hear that, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am waiting for you...

Mr K E MAGAXA: I think I do have a right to hear you properly so that I know why I am doing that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, that is exactly what it is.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Oh okay. No, I will withdraw... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Thank you very much and that concludes the business of the House. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 18.57.