

---

THURSDAY, 29 AUGUST 2013

---

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p

The SPEAKER: Order! I recognise the Chief Whip.

(Motion)

Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That notwithstanding Rule 198, precedence be given to the draft resolution  
and the Orders of the Day. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections?

Mr P UYS: Yes, Mr Speaker. We as the ANC object to that.

The SPEAKER: The ANC objected. If there is an objection I will then put a  
question. Those in favour of the motion being agreed to will say “aye”.

HON MEMBERS: Aye!

The SPEAKER: And those against will say “no”.

HON MEMBERS: No.

Me A ROSSOUW: Nice try!

The SPEAKER: It seems that the ayes have it and so the motion will serve. Thank you hon members. We will now deal with the draft resolution. The next item on the Order Paper is the draft resolution by the hon member Ms Labuschagne. I recognise the hon Chief Whip.

Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Speaker, I informed all the political parties that the hon member Ms Labuschagne is sick and that hon member Mr Wiley will stand in for her.

## **ONGOING ACHIEVEMENT OF DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION**

(Draft resolution in terms of rule 144)

The SPEAKER: I recognise the hon member Mr Wiley .

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Speaker, I move the draft resolution, as follows:

That the House notes the on-going achievement, since 2009, of the Department of Education of the Western Cape in respect of –

- Lit num results with regard to literacy and numeracy;
- retention levels in grade 10 to grade 12; and
- underachieving schools;

and therefore congratulates the Premier, the Minister of Education and the Department of Education and wishes them all the best for the challenges that the future holds for education in the Western Cape.

Mr Speaker, I thank you for allowing this critical debate. Today we address the successes of education in this province. We are reminded that improving learner outcomes is a process. Getting education to the levels that are required is no easy task for any government. However, we are also reminded that these challenges, no matter how tough they can be for the future of South Africa, must be overcome. If we as legislators and government leaders do not endure, how can we expect our learners to do so?

The essential ingredient of endurance is the will to succeed. Here it is political will that is needed to endure and it is political will that turns plans into policies and later into results. If a government intends to better the lives of its citizens it needs this political will to act. That is why, in addressing the shortcomings in education, one requires a well governed, effective and willing government.

Mr Speaker, what we want to achieve more than anything in education, it is to see all our Grade R's matriculate one day in one form or the other; academically or with a skills based qualification. Through this administration's interventions in

language and mathematics based subjects, and learner retention in underperforming schools, our learners are doing better today than ever before. Which is why I am confident in presenting to this House today a breakdown of these interventions and the improvements that have been made in this province since 2009, which is the start of this government's term.

As far as the LitNum strategy is concerned, Mr Speaker, let us not err when we say that our youth need to be literate and numerate. These are two critical skills that learners will need to develop early on in their formal education years. Yet learners across the board have historically continued to underachieve in literacy and numeracy in this country.

In 2009, having identified the need for intervention, this provincial government made a firm commitment to develop a strategy to tackle the underperformance in literacy and numeracy. The LitNum strategy became the tip of the spear in this commitment effort. The strategy outlines a form of systemic testing of literacy and numeracy competencies in Grades 3, 6 and 9, the analysis of these results and the provision for teacher training, and the support to improve teaching of these skills. The primary objective of this strategy is to produce fully literate and numerate learners so that they can someday navigate the demands of an ever changing knowledge economy. Between 2002 and 2009 WCED conducted *ad hoc* testing of language, numeracy and mathematics in Grades 3 and 6. Later the testing was extended to Grade 9.

In the first two years of this administration annual testing became more

sophisticated, taking on a revised, improved and expanded form which culminated in the WCED developing tests that were more in line with international standards.

The political will to improve outcomes spurred this government's resolve in improving learner outcomes in difficult areas. They say numbers do not lie, which is why we can say that if you are in doubt what this strategy is doing to improve the literacy and numeracy, look at the results of the last few years. They have shown measurable and dramatic improvements year-on-year. The LitNum strategy works because the annual assessment of learner's aptitudes gives teachers a better idea of how their students are performing. In turn this gives the department a better understanding of what is happening in the classroom of our schools.

Another development in the tests over the years is the use of independent service providers to administer and assess these LitNum tests. This further strengthens the tests as it ensures that the results are of a credible and impartial nature. In respect of teacher training the strategy includes programmes that are offered by the Cape Teacher and Leadership Institute in Kuilsrivier which aim to improve the educators' abilities in languages and mathematics. Improving educator outcomes and learner outcomes simultaneously ensures that the learning cycle improves over time.

Mr Speaker, this government is firmly of the conviction that systemic testing does not just benefit individual learners or grades but the system as a whole. The WCED has set new goals for this year's LitNum tests. In Grade 3 mathematics a 8.5% improvement has been set and in Grade 9 mathematics a 6.1% improvement. These

targets are bold and will require some effort but this is not to say that these targets will not be met. On the contrary, perhaps having bold targets is what is needed. This government does not aspire to mediocrity.

In their retention policies, creating a new education system that will see our Grade R's progress to Grade 12 and matriculate lies in retaining these students. No child must be left behind.

In a study cited in a Department of Basic Education brief, dropout rates are not entirely due to the learner's performance in school but often attributed to one of several socio-economic problems. This demonstrates that tackling the challenges of education requires robust government intervention.

The dropout rate in the two years leading to matric is often noticeably higher in the lower grades and as such requires particular attention. Mr Speaker, the process of dropping out is not a sudden event, it occurs over a period of time.

The Western Cape has over the last four years greatly improved its ratio of Grade 10 enrolments to matric passes. If we are to continue getting our learners to get the key pass, we have to make sure that those in Grade 10 are at an academic level that will see them through to matric. Identifying and ensuring that we stop learners that are at risk of dropping out is the key to improving retention.

As far as underperforming schools are concerned, tackling underperforming schools is one of the core focuses of the WCED as outlined in its vision. To clarify, an underperforming school is one which achieves 60% or less in the

National Senior Certificate.

Between 2006 and 2009, in the three years preceding this administration, the number of underperforming schools had more than doubled, from 36 in 2006 to 85 in 2009, all under ANC rule. However, in 2010 the number of underperforming schools began to decline. In that year there were 76 underperforming schools. In 2011 it further declined to 30 schools and this last year past it was 26 schools.

These numbers speak for themselves. The number of underperforming schools has declined year-on-year and is a tribute to the department and its officials and the political will of this administration. This was achieved by a concerted effort to ensure matric candidates are provided with materials for their six core subjects, the supplying of past examination papers for preparation for exams and the WCED official visits to bolster curriculum support and monitoring.

The “one size fits all” is not an option in education, which is why earlier this year the department announced that each district would develop its own performance plan. This would provide a more tailored fit for schools in that district.

We also await the launch of the department’s new matric support resource system in September which will make use of digital resources like You Tube to enhance the studying of such subjects as physical science and mathematics.

We have made progress in the last few years, that much is obvious, but there is also a lot more to do. With the right targets and priorities I am confident that we

will only improve on these improvements. We are moving forward and any progress in something like education, no matter how big or small, should be acknowledged and celebrated by us all. I thank you.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you. Mr Speaker, I move the following amendment to the draft resolution under discussion:

That the House notes the ongoing failure since 2009 of the Department of Education in the Western Cape in respect of LitNum results; retention levels in Grades 10 to 12 and underachieving schools and therefore condemns the Premier, the Minister of Education and the Department for failing to address the challenge of bringing equal education opportunities to the whole of the Western Cape.

The SPEAKER: Can somebody forward a copy of that amendment please?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Speaker, again today we are expected to take part in a boasting exercise with the DA. We have to do this against the background of the reality of school closures that are still imminent and the continued court battle that will further marginalise poor learners and take from them, as one of the principals wrote ... [Interjections.]

Mr H P GEYER: You have the wrong speech.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...their last vestige of strength which is education.



An HON MEMBER: We do not believe that.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: This stubborn clinging to a notion that a court ruling here will affect the rest of the country when in reality the cold flawed procedure was judged.

The PREMIER: While the rest of the country closes schools without any procedure.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: In the rest of the country if you feel that way ...  
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: There is no public participation.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Then find a champion to drive the process there...  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon members. Order! Order.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Find a champion in the rest of the country to drive your process because that is what we did here. [Interjections.] Here you govern. There you are in opposition.

An HON MEMBER: We drove it downwards ... [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Those schools can never perform at speed. Those schools that are waiting for this challenge can never perform at peak ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...with this uncertainty hanging over their heads. [Interjections.] The DA continues to raise issues of poor education in other provinces.

An HON MEMBER: They always have.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: So why then would you care about school closures there if that is exactly your agenda for closing it here, or was the agenda to keep poor schools closed so that the results at the end would look better?

Fight your own battles here where you govern because for every percentage that you boast about, that you have done well, it means there is a percentage that you have not done well and we can mention those to you. If you for instance say that 96% of schools have whatever facilities they have, that means 4% does not, but if we relate that 4% into numbers and we plot where those numbers are or where we find those schools ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order honourable members, order.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... you will find that it is in areas where the poor live.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member, take your seat please.

Me A ROSSOUW: Mnr die Speaker, die debat is baie spesifiek waarom gepraat moet word en die agb lid me Beerwinkel moet bly by die onderwerp van die debat asseblief.

The SPEAKER: I will deal with ... [Interjections.] Order! Order! I will ... [Interjections.] Order! Hon members, order! You may continue, hon member Ms Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Speaker, I would prefer that the DA members do not rule on the content of my speech, because what is in this content has an end effect on the result that you get.

An HON MEMBER: Because there is no content.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: This debate, Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.] This debate is not about equalising the opportunities for education in this province. It is about the grandstanding exercise. We do not hear real measures for safety and security and proper transport and that the whole cabinet should be doing more about and better planning because the problems are transversal. We talk about retention of learners. What did the President say in his SONA last year? He specifically raised the issue in the Western Cape that you have a problem with learner dropouts in the rural areas. So let us go there then. Let us look at what the National Assembly

discovered when a department of theirs went on an oversight tour, and I will read what the report said.

Mr H P GEYER: Is this Limpopo?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: No, actually it is the Western Cape. The principals alluded to the fact that numbers of learners were dropping out of school shortly after Grade 6 because for one their schools are not catering for higher than Grade 6. There are no other schools, and transport was another worrying issue. Some learners had to walk long distances before they could catch a bus to school. Now I would like to know which of these cabinet members would allow their children to walk those distances to school.

Mr M G E WILEY: Who said that? Carol, who said that?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: No, you will not ... talk about the poor ... [Interjections.]

Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.] the LitNum tests and what the study shows from the ANA document, it is this document, in case you have not seen it yet. It speaks about the results of literacy, numeracy and mathematics across the country for each province and it is actually shocking because it tells you that while literacy is good, mathematics is absolutely hopeless across this province as well ... [Interjections.]

Mr H P GEYER: Especially in the ANC provinces.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: So what is the bottom line? Somehow learning and

learning to read is not important but also the ability to reason is not given the attention that it should have. I want to just use a practical example of how when we spurt numbers, the reality the people feel and know is not what these theories say. As an example, because I want to be here on time and on task, I leave home at six o'clock in the morning while my meeting only starts at nine. Then at Esplanade there is a bridge that crosses from the station. Hundreds of people cross there, mothers and fathers. Now if at half past six those mothers and fathers are crossing the bridge what time did they leave home? Who is looking after their children? What time do they get home? Learning does not only happen in a classroom. It happens at home as well so when you measure these LitNum successes that you are saying ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... and what results are you using? I am going to give you some pictures ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Order! Order!

An HON MEMBER: We are not the province.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yes, this is the province. This is the picture.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Beerwinkel, your time has expired. Thank you very much.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: These kids need to be at school as well. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Hartnick, over to you. [Interjections.] Order!  
Hon Minister Madikizela, is it a point of order?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Is it parliamentary for a member of this House to drag the judiciary into politics by referring to the ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: To the cases you lost. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... by aligning the members of the judiciary to a political party. Is that parliamentary?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Please clarify that, Mr Speaker. I would like ...  
[Inaudible] ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member, order! Take your seat.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Let me clarify.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I will clarify it.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order! Hon Minister Madikizela, I am not in a position now to make a ruling on that matter because I do not have all the facts in front of me, but what I will do, I will refer the matter to Hansard so that I can get the information there. [Interjections.] Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I can help you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order! Okay, Order! Hon members.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes, I just want to ...  
[Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The Speaker ruled.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: To assist you, Mr Speaker, I just want to ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: No, hon Minister Madikizela, that is fine. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I just want to say what hon member Mr Ozinsky said ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: That is what I will check. That is what I will get from Hansard, hon Minister Madikizela. Thank you very much. [Interjections.] I recognise the hon member Ms Hartnick.

Ms J L HARTNICK: Mr Speaker, considering the goals of the Western Cape Education Department's 2013/2014 budget which include improving learner performance in literacy and numeracy in primary schools, improving the number and quality of passes in the National Senior Certificate examinations and reducing the number of underperforming schools, it is clear that the WCED is progressing in attaining these goals.

Before I get to the evidence in statistics I also considered the non-personnel expenditure commitments of the department for 2013/2014. Some of these include literacy and numeracy programmes; ensuring a test rich environment in classrooms; infrastructure; teacher development; inclusive education and the strengthening of special schools.

The DA commends the Western Cape Education Department on these commitments as not much proactive effort was put into it before 2009. [Interjections.] This said, I vote in favour of the resolution under debate as the Western Cape Education Department redressed the implementation of the ANAs, but shared the objective of improving literacy and numeracy performance in this province because we agree that literacy and numeracy are significant foundation blocks of education. What sets the Western Cape Government apart from other provinces who blindly follow the national government as a result of party affiliation, is that our systemic tests are independently administered, tested and marked by outside service providers, once again proving that the Western Cape is the leader in all departments as the statistics obviously show. This enhances the credibility of the tests and delivers on the DA's transparency objective.



The systemic testing makes the Western Cape Education Department aware of where assistance needs to be directed and therefore the budget can be appropriated accordingly to where it is needed most. It is also clear that there was an improvement in both language and numeracy if one considers the LitNum results.

In October 2012 over 250 000 Grade 3, 6 and 9 learners from 1421 public ordinary and independent schools took part in the tests. The tested learners comprised 83 030 Grade 3 learners, 79 301 Grade 6 learners and 89 674 Grade 9 learners. The results are as follows for language:

Grade 3 language pass rate: 2011: 30.4%, 2012: 38.9% - difference 8.5%

Grade 6 language pass rate: 2011: 31.5%, 2012: 36.9% - difference 5.4%

Grade 9 language pass rate: 2011: 44.2%, 2012: 48.2% - difference 4.0%

The mathematics results:

Grade 3 mathematics: 2011: 47.6%, 2012: 51.5% - difference 3.9%

Grade 6 mathematics: 2011: 23.4%, 2012: 26.4% - difference 3.0%

Grade 9 mathematics: 2011: 10.9%, 2012: 13.9% - difference 3.0%

Mr Speaker, these results suggest that strategies in our foundation phase such as the provision of additional readers and the introduction of mathematics textbooks in the foundation phase have yielded positive results. For this reason I congratulate the Premier, the Minister of Education and his department and wish them all the best for the challenges the future holds for education in this province. I thank you.

’n AGB LID: Mooi! Mooi! Mooi!

Me J A VAN ZYL: Dankie, mnr die Speaker. Om reg te laat geskied aan hierdie uiters belangrike debat moet daar gekyk word na die omstandighede van leerders oor die hele provinsie wat onderwerp was aan die toetse. Kan ’n leerder wat uit ’n huishouding kom waar albei ouers werk en kan voorsien aan die daaglikse behoeftes soos ’n geboude huis met lopende water en elektrisiteit, ’n warm bed, drie daaglikse etes, ’n kosblik in die skooltas, warm skoolklere en voor die skool hek afgelaai word in ’n relatief veilige skoolomgewing enigsins vergelyk word met die omstandighede waar ’n leerder se ouers werkloos is, in ’n informele woonbuurt bly, daar nie voldoende skuiling is in buitengewone weersomstandighede nie, nie genoeg kos is vir drie daaglikse etes nie, nie die luukse van elektrisiteit of lopende water het nie, nie kos vir ’n kosblik in die skooltas het nie, nie genoeg warm skoolklere het nie en van openbare vervoer gebruik moet maak, blootgestel is aan skole waar sommige skole onlangs moes gesluit geword het as gevolg van bendegeweld, ander skole die teikens van dwelm transaksies en ander kriminele elemente is?

Verder meer, mnr die Speaker, leerders in landelike gebiede word soms gedwing om net minder as vyf kilometer na die naaste skool te stap omdat daar nie gesubsidieerde leerdervervoer beskikbaar is nie. Alle leerders in hierdie provinsie skryf dieselfde toetse ongeag die ongelykhede en sosiale agterstande.

Persentasies oor die algemeen lyk baie goed op papier, maar die vraag bly, in

watter gemeenskappe was daar 'n beter uitkoms vergeleke met jaar op jaar prestasies?

'n AGB LID: Dis voor-die-hand-liggend.

Ms J A VAN ZYL: Despite an increase in the number of learners writing the National Senior Certificate, the Western Cape Education Department has managed to retain the 2011 pass rate. WCED also monitored the Grade 3, 6 and 9 learner performance in language and mathematics in 2012. Learners achieved an average pass rate of 48.9% and 43.7% in mathematics and language respectively.

Mnr die Speaker, die Minister moet vandag sê watter spesiale maatreëls hy gaan aankondig om daardie persentasies tot ten minste 60% op te stoot. Dan sal dit regtig juistheid aan hierdie debat gee.

There is an urgent need to retain more learners in Grade 12 and cut the human cost of the large numbers who leave without formal school leaving certificates, particularly males. The retention rate for the Western Cape is poor according to the ANAs of 2012. The 2012 annual national assessment or ANAs for Grade 4 reflects a 37% national average for mathematics and 43% for home language. This poor performance lays the basis for a large dropout rate six to seven years later and the low levels at which people are passing matric. Improving quality in the foundation phase will improve retention and improve the quality of passes at the NSC.

To solve our education crisis we need a holistic view that aims at improving

success from primary school, reducing the dropout rate in Grades 9 to 12, increasing the proportion of people who are passing at higher levels and not enter into endless court cases to close underperforming schools. Thank you.

Me J WITBOOI: Mnr die Speaker, baie dankie. Dit is inderdaad 'n voorreg om te volg na die agb lid me Van Zyl. U weet, die agb lid me Labuschagne, slinks soos sy ook al te werk gegaan het om hierdie debat op die Ordelys te kry, moet net 'n bietjie terugstaan, stil word en na 'n paar naakte feite kyk en haarself dan die vraag afvra of sy met 'n rein gewete die Minister en die Premier langs hierdie weg wil pryssang en dan nog hoop dat ons almal dit moet doen. Ek is baie jammer, maar die African National Congress kan dit nie doen nie.

'n AGB LID: Siestog! ... [Tussenwerpsels]

Me J WITBOOI: Mnr die Speaker, ek het by 'n vorige geleentheid ook in 'n onderwysdebat 'n hele paar knelpunte aangeraak rakende Ebenaeser Primêre Skool. Ek wil vandag dit in hierdie Huis noem dat in die weke wat daarop gevolg het dit 'n miernes van bedrywigheid en belangstelling by die skool ontketen het en aspekte wat reeds lank terug by die departement aanhangig gemaak is, is toe afgestof as gevolg van die debat hier. Mnr die Speaker, die arm skole in die provinsie kry baie swaar. Hulle pleidooie val op dowe ore. Die aspek van leerdervervoer, 'n aspek wat al holrug gery is in hierdie huis ... [Tussenwerpsels]

'n AGB LID: Deur wie is dit holrug gery?

Me J WITBOOI: Dit impakteer op elke faset van 'n leerder se opvoeding regdeur die provinsie. Veral op die platteland het ons steeds te make met leerders wat as gevolg van leerdervervoerprobleme nie betyds by hulle skole opdaag nie en in sekere gevalle vir dae aaneen nie by die skole opdaag nie. Die geval van leerders van Chatsworth, Riebeeck-Wes, in my bedieningsgebied is sprekende voorbeelde hiervan. Vir seker sal dit negatief impakteer op die LitNum-uitslae met betrekking tot gelettertyd en syfervaardigheid. Natuurlik sal dit 'n invloed hê op die retensievlakke in Grade 10 tot 12 en beslis sal dit 'n bydraende faktor wees wat tot onderprestering lei. Kan die Minister vir my met alle eerlikheid sê dat hy die gelukwense wat vandag so mildelik op hom uitgestrooi is deur die agb lid mnr Walters en die agb lid Me Hartnick, sonder enige gewetenswroeging aanvaar? ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mnr die Speaker, om met hierdie onderwerp saam te stem, sal beteken dat ek saamstem dat die agb LUR Donald Grant as die redder van die “kinderdom” in die provinsie beskou te kan word, maar as hy vandag 'n vrou was, het ek vir hom gesê sy onderrok ver uithang. Ek sal nou maar net sê dat sy frokkie ver uitsteek en dis 'n frokkie van bevoorregting van sekere skole.

Laat ek verduidelik: Skoonspruit Sekondêr in Malmesbury en Hoërskool Swartland in dieselfde dorp: Skoonspruit, 'n leerlingtal van 1584; Hoërskool Swartland Hoër 733; opvoederstal Skoonspruit 52, Swartland 32; leerlingtal per klas: Skoonspruit, 50; Swartland 23 tot 38. 'n Spesiale toekenning wat ek nie weet waarvandaan dit kom nie en waaroor die Minister moontlik in sy repliek vir ons kan inlig is aan die skole gegee: Skoonspruit R5 miljoen; hy is in die vooraf benadeelde gebied,

Swartland: R10 miljoen ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

’n AGB LID: Jo! Hoor net daar!

Me J WITBOOI: ...vir ekstra tien klasse en ook vir ’n hoërskool. Mnr die Speaker, dis die frokkie van bevoorregting. Ek kan nie saamstem met wat hier gepryssang is vandag nie. Ek sal dit nooit kan doen nie en sê die pryssang rondom daardie Minister moet nou ’n slag end kry in die Huis, want hy is ’n ‘disgrace’ vir die “kinderdom” in die provinsie.

’n AGB LID: Dit is ’n tien uit tien, tien uit tien.

An HON MEMBER: Well done, hear!

’n AGB LID: Hoor, hoor!

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon members, order! Hon member Mr Haskin, over to you.

Mr G C R HASKIN: Thank you, Mr Speaker. The ACDP acknowledges and notes that progress has indeed been made since 2009 to improve performance in terms of literacy and numeracy levels, retention levels from Grade 10 to 12 in terms of underperforming schools and for that we congratulate the Minister and the Department.

However, we also acknowledge that much more of course still needs to be done,

including ensuring that all our schools and all our learners are safe, particularly in the 109 high risk schools, but more especially in those that are continually ravaged by violence in communities and in schools; evidenced by the recent closure in fourteen in Manenberg alone. Successes in reducing overall absentee or truancy levels down to 5%, recently announced, are negated by recent dramatic increases in absenteeism sometimes to well over 50% including up to 67% in some schools on the Cape Flats, particularly that which is related to ongoing violence as a result of gang warfare.

Over and above the safe schools programme in the 109 high risk schools the department confirms that 50 additional schools received core security infrastructure last year, at great cost, these including all of the fourteen schools that closed recently. But then we have to ask how this core security infrastructure helped in terms of those schools that remained vulnerable to attack by the gangs. By not supporting the need for minimum norms and standards for school infrastructure primarily because of cost, we are concerned as the ACDP that the massive disparities between schools will continue and in fact worsen in years to come. The ACDP is all too mindful that until the immense and ongoing challenges facing the most vulnerable schools and their learners are sustainably addressed, including through partnerships with all role-players and including the communities and families themselves, education outcomes will continue to remain unequal with the most vulnerable still not getting a quality education that translates into viable economic opportunities that reverse their reality for future generations. There cannot be a too high a cost to achieve this goal. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, I am actually amazed that the hon member Ms Labuschagne would propose such a motion. Maybe she is too embarrassed to come and stand here today to defend it.

’n AGB LID: Nonsens.

Mr M OZINSKY: Let me say why, because this motion says a lot about the views of the hon member Ms Labuschagne and her DA colleagues on oversight. The Constitution says that this parliament must have oversight over the executive authority of the province, but instead of doing that oversight these members there are using the committee simply to try and praise their government. In fact this has got to the point where suddenly a member of the executive, the hon Zille, becomes a member of a standing committee, which is not possible, so that she can misuse this House’s committees to interrogate the national commissioner.

Mr M G E WILEY: Read the rules. Read your rules.

Mr M OZINSKY: There cannot be any MEC or any Premier who can be a member of a standing committee.

Mr M G E WILEY: Which rule?

Mr M OZINSKY: By definition it cannot be because the committee has oversight over the government and the committee cannot have oversight over the government when the government is part of the committee. It is obvious.



The PREMIER: We have oversight over the police!

Mr M OZINSKY: It is the basis of democracy, but the hon Premier misuses her position.

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Hon member Mr Ozinsky, order!

The PREMIER: We have oversight over the police.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order! Take your seat, hon member Mr Ozinsky.  
[Interjections.] Hon members is it a point of order?

Mr M G E WILEY: It relates to relevance to the topic at hand. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What is the relevance?

The SPEAKER: Relevance, okay. Proceed. [Interjections.] Order! Order hon members, order!

Mr M OZINSKY: The motion that gets submitted to the House today which instead of engaging in oversight is what it is doing a word which I cannot say in this House but you know what I am talking about, your relationship to your government ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M OZINSKY: And secondly, Hon member Mr Wiley also ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon member, take your seat please. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Speaker, may I have a ruling on my point of related relevance please.

The SPEAKER: I am still listening to what hon member Mr Ozinsky is saying, but please can you then stick to the subject of discussion.

Mr M OZINSKY: I am on the subject. The subject is the oversight of the committee of this department and whether we should praise the department and that is what I am dealing with. I do not think we can praise the department for the reason I am raising and the reasons I am going to raise in my speech. [Interjections.] Secondly, the hon member Mr Wiley ... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Speaker, with respect, the word “oversight” does not appear anywhere on this Order Paper ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: No, but thanks hon member Mr Wiley ... [Interjections.] Order! Let us give the hon member Mr Ozinsky a chance.

Mr M OZINSKY: Thank you. Oversight is in the Constitution. Maybe you do not

stand for the Constitution.

The PREMIER: We have oversight powers over the police. Wake up.  
[Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: The hon member Mr Wiley ... [Interjections.] ... this department is a department that operates in secrecy ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Oh, come on!

Mr M OZINSKY: So there is nothing that we can trust about this department. There were learners in this province that died in a bus accident in Rheenendal. [Interjections.] Fourteen learners got on a bus provided by that MEC to go to school and they died.

The SPEAKER: Hon mem Mr Ozinsky, that is totally not relevant to the subject.

Mr M OZINSKY: It is relevant. [Interjections.] It is about this department you want us to congratulate!

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Ozinsky, order! Can you stick to the subject of discussion.

Mr M OZINSKY: ...congratulations to the Premier and the Minister of Education ... [Interjections.] ... and I have explained to you why I refuse to congratulate them.

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Ozinsky, order! Take your seat please.

Ms A ROSSOUW: Die agb lid mnr Ozinsky toon disrespek teenoor u as Speaker van heirdie Huis. Hy moet tot orde geroep word. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: I will make that ruling ...[Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, quite simply ... let me read the resolution, the last part of it:

“and therefore congratulates the Premier, the Minister of Education and the Department and wishes them all the best for the challenges that the future holds for education in the Western Cape.”

That is what I am talking about.

An HON MEMBER: You are not talking about ...[Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: It is precisely about that. Now, let me tell you about the future of education ...[Interjections.] ... because this government knew that the department was not looking after the buses. They knew it. They had a report for six months before that accident ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky, what is the relevance of this ...

[Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: It is relevant ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon mem Mr Ozinsky. Hon members order! Hon Chief Whip?

Ms A ROSSOUW: Mnr die Speaker, die busongeluk het niks te doen met hierdie debat en hy kan nie verder daarmee voort gaan nie [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: I think ... hon members, order! Hon members, order! I think I have repeated myself twice to you already, hon member Mr Ozinsky ...[Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: I am dealing with the challenges that the future holds ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky, you may proceed.

Mr M OZINSKY: and the challenge the future holds ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky, take your seat please.

†UMnu M NCEDANA: Hayi. Somlomo bendicela ukhe usicacisele ukuba yeyiphi ke into efanelekileyo xa le ithetwa nguMnu Ozinsky ingafanelekanga .

\*Mr M NCEDANA: No. Mr Speaker, I would like you to explain what exactly is relevant if what the hon member Mr Ozinsky is stating now is not relevant.

†UMnu SOMLOMO: Hayi ndicinga ukuba besendiyicacisile uza kuyiqonda, kodwa ungaqhuba ngokuthetha.

\*The SPEAKER: No, I think I have explained. I am sure he will understand. You may proceed, hon mem Mr Ozinsky.

Mr M OZINSKY: One of the challenges the department has to face is, what will the inquest say about the responsibility of this government and the department in that bus accident, because the audit report says that the buses were not being checked. In fact, it says that the bus checking inspectorate was effectively closed down by that hon Minister before the accident took place. The second thing the report says was the department did not know which buses were being used because the department did not know the registration numbers of the buses on particular routes. They did not know which bus was being used, so therefore they did not check those buses. Thirdly, the report says the department did not know the number of learners on each bus and whether the number of learners travelling on the bus was in line with regulations for that bus ...[Interjections.]

Fourthly, the report also raises the fact that people raised complaints about transport and the department never even recorded those complaints let alone responded to those complaints. So when the accident took place, knowing all the things that the department had done wrong with regard to transport, the hon

Minister Carlisle, who is absent – maybe he is ashamed today, I do not know – the hon Minister Carlisle immediately blamed a bus licensing facility for the accident and closed it down illegally instead of coming clean with the public and saying, these are the things we knew about the buses. They knew about it because they had the report six months before the accident.

Now, we come to the hon members Mr Wiley and Ms Labuschagne. Hon member Mr Wiley and hon member Ms Labuschagne are leading the process to ensure that that report be kept secret. They do it every day in Scopa. The hon member Mr Wiley proposed yesterday in Scopa that we discuss the implementation of the report without being able to quote from the report. Hon member Mr Wiley in his standing committee refuses to allow the police commissioner to talk about staffing of police at stations which is a confidential matter and I think, everyone would accept ...[Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Why is it confidential?

Mr M OZINSKY: ... a matter of the safety of the police. He refuses that very serious issue to be allowed to be discussed in camera in his committee and then goes to Scopa and says ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr M OZINSKY: ... we cannot have the report on learner transport.

The SPEAKER: Order! Honourable ...[Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: The problem is the future of education in the hands of these members because ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Mr Ozinsky, your time is expired. Thank you, very much.

Mr M OZINSKY: Thank you. [Time expired.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I would like to start off by thanking the hon members who took part in this debate. I would also say that I am now not surprised to know why the ANC sent a media alert to be here this afternoon to see this Oscar awarding performance, which is completely off the topic. I just want to, Mr Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I would like to deal with his issue about the secrecy first. One of the reasons, hon member Mr Ozinsky, there is secrecy is that your hon member who should be part of the standing committee, is hardly ever there. I have only seen her there once in the last nine months. So, if you want to know what is going on, come to the standing committee ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.] public [Inaudible.]



The SPEAKER: Order! Minister. Order! Order! Take your seat please. Hon members no, we cannot allow this. We cannot even hear the Minister. Can we give the Minister a chance please? Hon member Mr Ozinsky, you had your chance, please. Order! Take your seat, hon member Mr Ozinsky. Take your seat.

Mr M OZINSKY: On a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Do you want to raise a point of order? What is the point of order?

Mr M OZINSKY: I want to know why you protect that hon member and you do not protect me when I speak?

The SPEAKER: Take your seat. That is not a point of order honourable ...[Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Speaker, I hope your timekeepers are taking time off for these interruptions?

The SPEAKER: Of course, yes.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I was not going to use my full 15 minutes, but now I am going to. I would like to thank the hon mem Ms Labuschagne, albeit in her absence, for this debate. It is a refreshing reminder of the progress we have made in the last few years and the many challenges we yet have to face.

In 2009 the government of the Western Cape inherited an education system that had come into terminal decline from 2002 after Premier Zille's departure. The matric rate was decreasing year on year, hitting an all time low of 75.7%. The number of under-performing schools were increasing to a record 85 at the end of 2009 and learner retention had stagnated. Education in this province, as in the other provinces, needed stability and a sustainable long-term plan. It needed systematic, clear and sometimes bold change, not short-term projects, interventions or ill-conceived cash injections. This government sought immediately to review and change these failing strategies and in November 2009 released its strategic plan for education from 2010 to 2019. The 10 year plan encompasses a sustained, focused and systemic approach to improving education in this province. The overarching objectives for this plan to improve learner performance are:

- An improvement of language and mathematics;
- An increase in the quality of passes;
- Numbers writing and passing the national senior certificate; and
- A decrease in under-performing schools.

Nearly four years later we can confidently report to this House that all the important indicators demonstrate the fact that our learners' lives are better off

today and that the state of education in this province is improving. Results in the 2012 national senior certificate show that the system is qualitatively getting better and that our strategic interventions are proving time and again to be successful in increasing the performance levels of our under-performing schools.

Last year we broke a number of records which include achieving the highest number of passes in this province since the inception of the national senior certificate, breaking our record of the number of learners qualifying for bachelor's degree study and achieving the highest percentage pass rates in both mathematics and physical science. We have also successfully reduced the number of under-performing schools to ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Which area?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... to 26 from 85. Success at the top end of our system, however, is not just subject to a few privileged schools. While this government has always prioritised the education needs of all of our learners, we have particularly focused on our schools serving our poorer communities. If we analyse the national senior certificate results since 2009, it is overwhelmingly evident that the quality of education in our schools serving our poorer communities in quintiles one to three, is improving under this government. Mr Speaker, this directly refutes the allegations made by the hon member Ms Beerwinkel and hon member Mr Ozinsky and others on the south side of the House.

An HON MEMBER: The down side.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: There has been a 25.6% increase in the number of candidates passing the NSC in quintiles one to three since 2009 with 9 797 candidates passing compared to 7 798 in 2009. The average pass rate also increased from 56.9% in 2009 to 70.9% in 2012. The number of bachelors passes also increased in quintiles one to three from a low of 1 432 in 2009 to 2 531 in 2012. This is an increase of approximately 76% between 2009 and 2012. The average percentage pass rate for mathematics in quintiles one to three has increased by 12.2% ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky, order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... and the average pass rate for physical science by 26.64%. Mr Speaker, I will just ignore him, do not worry about him.

The number of under-performing schools in quintiles one to three has been reduced from 50 in 2009 to 18 in 2012. This is a 74% reduction in three years in the schools where the ANC, amongst others in this House on the south side, say we do not give any attention to. I am afraid the facts are somewhat different.

In the lower grades of the system, the Western Cape government has also seen improvements. Integral to this is the testing of learners in grades three, six and nine in language and mathematics. Clearly, the ANC also does know the difference between the ANAS and the Western Cape systemic tests. In fact, the first national report of Needu, the national evaluation and development unit

entitled “The State of Literacy Teaching and Learning in the Foundation Phase”, makes recommendations to the National Department of Basic Education that recognises the importance of systemic testing of learners. It supports systemic testing as it determines where the strengths and weaknesses of our learners and educators lie, as well as holding schools accountable for their performance. It also notes that such testing is having a positive impact on both teachers, understanding of teaching literacy and numeracy and on their classroom practice. And that, hon member ms Beerwinkel, is what gives our children the ability to reason.

The Needu report also recommends that an external agency should be commissioned to undertake such tasks. We also believe in the value in providing diagnostic assessment of the provincial education system so that we can improve the management of education and learner performance. If one looks at the representations by Dr Nick Taylor and Professor [Inaudible.] van der Bergh in terms of the systemic testing, it is obvious to us who do attend national symposiums on education, that the national minister is fully in support of these initiatives.

As noted by the hon member Ms Hartnick, we are pleased to see that in our latest results for grades 3, 6, 9 language and mathematics, we have shown improvement in every grade tested in both language and mathematics throughout all eight districts of the Western Cape.

HON MEMBERS: Hear, hear.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: As stated time and again, there is no quick fix when it comes to improving the quality of education. We were aware in 2009 that our strategy to improve LitNum would take time. In fact, it stated that it would take 10 years before we would be satisfied with the outcomes in these areas. We will, however, continue to expand and implement strategies that will improve performance in this regard. Strategies like those that were implemented at Nakazimlo Primary School in Khayelitsha. This school improved its language results by 59.8% and its mathematics results by 29.5%.

While much of this improvement had to do with leadership and the commitment of the school's principal and educators, the school worked closely with the department to formulate a strategy which included targeted support and training.

Many of our interventions whether at the top end of the system or in the foundation phase, will never yield positive results if we do not keep learners within the system. Improving the retention rate and reducing absenteeism are some of our key objectives. The hon member Ms Beerwinkel alluded to statements made by the president in his State of the Nation address. All the statistics which go to the Department of Basic Education were analysed for retention rates by Dr Stephen Taylor of the Department of Economics at Stellenbosch University, published on 30 June 2013. The title of the paper was "*The Real Matric Pass Rate*" and I would suggest that the hon member Ms Beerwinkel goes and reads that report and compares and contrasts the performance of the Western Cape to the rest of the country.

Since 2008 we have increased the retention rate of learners that have entered the system in grade 1 and have completed their education in Grade 12 by 9%. This is a remarkable increase in just five years. I am also pleased to announce that we have managed to reduce the absenteeism levels of learners at schools. In 2009 the absentee rate in this province was 7.7%. This figure has consistently declined over the three years that followed to 6.9% in 2010, 5.9% in 2011 and 5.7 in 2012. In 2013, the absenteeism rate in the first two quarters has decreased even further at an average of 5%. Another negative trend that we have turned around. Another target we can proudly tick off.

While we have made some significant strides in improving education in this province, we are also aware that we face some tough challenges such as in language and particularly, and in mathematics as I described earlier. Not all our challenges stem directly from education delivery or the curriculum. Drug abuse, gangsterism, violence and poverty continue to affect our learners' lives, which ultimately has a negative effect on their education. That is why we are working transversally to improve socio-economic conditions in our communities. But we need all role players to be on board. This includes our parents, our educators, our government officials, our law enforcement agencies and especially our learners. We can further improve the state of education in this province if we work better together. With that, Mr Speaker, I propose that we support the resolution.

The SPEAKER: Order! Order hon members. That concludes the debate on this motion. The question before the House is the motion printed in the name of the hon member Ms Labuschagne on the Order Paper, upon which amendment has been

moved by the hon member Ms Beerwinkel. [Interjections.] I now put the amendment as proposed by the hon member Ms Beerwinkel. Those in favour of the amendment will say “aye”.

HON MEMBERS: Aye!

The SPEAKER: And those against will say “no”.

HON MEMBERS: No!

The SPEAKER: The “no’s” have it. The amendment is therefore rejected. I now put the motion as printed on the Order Paper:

That the House notes the ongoing achievement, since 2009, of the Department of Education of the Western Cape in respect of:

- (a) LitNum results with regard to literacy and numeracy;
- (b) Retention levels in Grade 10 to Grade 12;
- (c) Underachieving schools,

And therefore congratulates the Premier, the Minister of Education and the Department of Education and wishes them all the best for the challenges that the future holds for education in the Western Cape.

Are there any objections to the motion being adopted?



HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Is it a yes?

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The SPEAKER: If there is a yes, I put a question. Those in favour of the motion as printed will say “aye”.

HON MEMBERS: Aye!

The SPEAKER: And those against will say “No”.

HON MEMBERS: No!

The SPEAKER: Yes. Definitely the “ayes” have it.

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, we will now proceed to the next item, but before that I want to recognise two special guests in the central gallery, that is the hon Tony Kristicevic, a member of the Liberal Party in the legislative assembly of Western Australia, and Mr Peter Matthew, the Clerk of the Legislative Assembly. You are welcome to the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. [Applause.]

We now proceed to the first Order of the Day. The Secretary will read the first Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Finalisation of the *Western Cape District Health Councils Amendment Bill* [B – 2013]

The SPEAKER: There is no speakers list. Are there any objections to the finalisation of the Bill?

HON MEMBERS: No.

The SPEAKER: No objections? Agreed to.

Bill agreed to.

The SPEAKER: The secretary will read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: The *Western Cape District Health Councils Amendment Bill*.

The SPEAKER: The Bill will be sent to the Premier for assent. The Secretary will read the second Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Introduction and First Reading – *Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill* [B 7 – 2013]

The SPEAKER: I recognise the hon Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:  
 Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. I introduce to this House the *Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill*. I ask that this House approve the expenditure of the unauthorised expenditure of R53 741 946.90, this sum being money that was spent by the Department of Health ...

The SPEAKER: Hon Members, order! [Interjection.] Hon members, order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:  
 ... that was not part of the original budget. This bill has already proceeded through the Standing Committee on Public Accounts, Scopa. The money was used for overtime payments, for service charges like sewerage and utility charges through the Department of Transport and Public Works to the City of Cape Town for deliveries from service providers for that financial year to ensure a balanced budget. The BAS system report had to be withdrawn and so I ask that I table this in the House for deliberation. Thank you very much.

Ms L BROWN: Shocking! Shocking. Why is the budget ... [Inaudible.] Shocking.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister. Order. [Interjections.]. The Secretary will read the Bill for the first time

The SECRETARY: The *Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill*.

The SPEAKER: In accordance with Rule 184, the introductory speech, the Bill and the papers laid upon the Table will be referred to the relevant committee for consideration and report. We now proceed to interpellations. I recognised hon Minister Botha, the first interpellation.

## **INTERPELLATIONS:**

### *Khayelitsha district hospital: bed shortage*

#### **1. Mr M Ncedana asked the Minister of Health:**

Whether the fact that the Khayelitsha District Hospital does not have enough beds to accommodate all the people who are admitted has been brought to his attention?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you and to the hon member Mr Ncedana for putting forward this question about the Khayelitsha district hospital.

Yes, I am aware of the overflow situation at Khayelitsha hospital. The average bed occupancy for the first quarter of that hospital this year was 139%, and one of the future plans is to create a separate facility for the mental health clients, because this is now part of the general beds in the medical ward. This will be done in the 2014/15 financial year. The overflow of patients at Khayelitsha hospital is a demonstration of the dire need that there was for this hospital but also for the increasing numbers of people in our province. The profile of the burden of disease in this area has also impacted significantly on the hospital's patient load. It is for

this reason that the provincial government is shifting the focus towards the increase of wellness whilst addressing illness. The creation of a healthier society is essential and that is why the government is looking into healthier life-style programmes, for example the 'walk for health'. The hospital management is addressing the issue of the bed shortage by doing the following.

The new Khayelitsha hospital is a 230 bed institution and serves a population of roughly one million residents. We know that they are poor and unemployed and living predominately in informal dwellings. These are major contributors to the current burden of disease including HIV and TB and chronic diseases of life-style and obviously violence and injuries as well. When the hospital emergency unit is unable to accommodate patients brought in by ambulance these patients are then transferred either to Groote Schuur or Victoria hospital. When the new Mitchells Plain hospital opens later this year, it will also take some of the burden of the beds that we are experiencing there. I do remind this House that the mortality rate in that emergency centre which has become overnight the busiest centre in the province is below 1%. Thank you.

Mr M NCEDANA: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker, and thank you to the Minister. I am happy to note that the department is aware of the problem. The Minister says the department is addressing the issue of the shortage of beds, but he did not specify what is that being done in this regard. I note that he says people will be transferred to Groote Schuur and Mitchells Plain, but it is a fact Minister that people remain waiting there for a day or so. I am interested to know whether the department is doing something. If you are sick you cannot be expected to sit on

a bench or be brought blankets from your home while you are waiting to be transferred somewhere. As I was engaging with the hospital I was also told that Groote Schuur and Tygerberg are facing the same challenge. Obviously something must be done in the meanwhile for the patients in order to address these undesirable consequences for those who are sick. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, through you, thank you to the hon member Mr Ncedana. We share the same concerns. I think its fair to say that it exceeded all our expectations that the occupancy rate would be so high in that hospital, at 139%. A hospital is actually full when it reaches 85% occupancy. I can assure the House that the patients are not waiting and there is no delay when the hospital is full and there is an emergency. Using our GPS systems and other communications, emergency vehicles are directed to other facilities so there is no unnecessary waiting time and risk involved.

There is a plan to address the shortages of beds. The infrastructure for the mental health clients is a priority, as I mentioned, for 2014/15 and the business case is already complete for a new ward, at present an incomplete ward, which was constructed but not fitted out in the initial construction. This will add another 50 beds to this institution which is very significant and we hope to be able to commission that in the next financial year. As regards the patient flow, the hospital forms part of the departmental emergency flow collaborative to improve the quality of emergency care, and patient flow and departmental strategies and lead methodologies are leading this process to improve the outcomes in that regard. A comprehensive strategy is being developed to do that. Then in terms of quality

care, the department has invested in a Change and Organisational Design Manager who is already appointed to facilitate the development of an organisational culture of client centredness approach, which will definitely deal with the attitude problems that we have which are also one of the complaints we have to deal with. We also appointed a Complaints Manager. [Time expired.]

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Met die aangekondigde besoek van die Staande Komitee aan die hospitaal verlede week is wel gevind dat van die pasiënte in die ongevalle wag vir toelating tot beddens. Maar ten spyte van hierdie situasie is die behandelings steeds van hoogstaande gehalte en word geeneen van hierdie pasiënte verwaarloos nie.

In teendeel, die konsultant en van die verpleegpersoneel werk rondom die klok as ek nou so kan vertaal om hierdie pasiënte te hanteer. Geestesgesondheidspasiënte is van dié wat in die trauma-eenheid wag op beddens en beddens beset in die chirurgiesaal. Dit is verblydend om te hoor dat daar fasiliteite beplan word vir hierdie pasiënte. Hierdie pasiënte het ook 'n voltydse sekuriteitspersoon by hulle omdat as gevolg van sommige van hulle se diagnose hulle 'n gevaar inhou vir ander pasiënte.

Agb Minister, sou die skep van 'n "step down" fasiliteit kan help met die hantering van bedbesetting? Wat wel 'n las op dienslewering plaas en die gevolg van die oorbesetting is, is die siektelas, of die "burden of disease". Daarom bly voorkomende programme die intervensies ten opsigte van MIV Vigs en die handhawing van infrastrukture ten opsigte van sanitasie, skoon water en

verwydering van afval noodsaaklik. Hierdie aspekte is ons elkeen se verantwoordelikheid om by te dra tot goeie gesondheid vir almal. Dankie.

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is indeed shocking that the Khayelitsha hospital has a massive bed shortage. This problem cannot be divorced from the human resource challenges which are impacting negatively on patients. 11 doctors have been dismissed owing to budgetary constraints. The hospital is functioning with only 50% of the required number of doctors. The shortage of beds and lack of human resources has had a negative effect on the staff. Whilst they are very motivated to do their work the inequality they see between Khayelitsha hospital and those in the leafy suburbs has resulted in staff members wanting to leave the hospital.

The Public Service Commission told this legislature that most of its grievances received out of all government departments across the country and across all spheres of government are from staff in the Western Cape Department of Health. Khayelitsha has a large patient population with the highest burden of disease in the province. There must be appropriate resource allocation. Sadly this is not happening. This is shocking as health has the largest slice of the provincial budget. Clearly, there is a lack of political will on the part of the MEC to do the right thing. A political decision can be taken regarding allocation of more resources to Khayelitsha hospital. Instead we see unauthorised expenditure from MEC Botha's department. This lack of political will to rescue the Khayelitsha hospital is clearly a result of the DA's neglect of poor communities. I thank you.



†UMnu M NCEDANA: Somlomo enkosi, kumnandi ukuva ngezicwangciso ezikhoyo, kodwa kungaba mnandi ngakumbi ukuva zonke ezi ntetho zenziwa liLungu eliBekekileyo lisithi ziza kwenzeka umzekelo, ukuba kukho inxalenye eyakhiwayo neza kuba neebhedi ezingashumi amabini enesihlanu (25) kuza kwenzeka nini oko? Ee... Mhlawumbi xa ujonga imeko eKhayelitsha, ayibonakalisi ukuba inani labahlali eKhayelitsha liza kuhla, ibonakalisa ukuba liyanda endaweni yokuhla, loo nto ithetha ukuthi xa urhulumente esenza ezi zigqibo kufuneka athathele ingqalelo ukuba ngenene abantu baza kwanda. Apha amalungiselelo enziwe ngendlela eelungiselela ukwanda kwabantu abalulekile. Bendicinga ukuba iLungu eliBekekileyo liza kuxoxa ngokuba indlela yokuhlangabezana nalo mngeni kukuba abantu, ngokukodwa abahala ematyotyombeni eKhayelitsha, bathathe amanyathelo othintelo xa besakha izindlu kwiindawo ezikufutshane nesibhedlele iGrooteshuur, kwaye kufutshane nangakumbi kwizibhedlele ezikhulu, ukuthintela le mingeni yezibhedlele ezibekelwe amanani athile ukuthintela abantu ukuba banyangwe. Kudala ndiyithetha le nto ngoku yokuba xa umntu esiya esibhedlele sekube kungokuba efuna ukunyangwa. Ndinenkolo yokuba enye yezinto ezinceda umntu ukuba aphile kukuba akufika kwindawo yoncedo ancedwe ngokukhawuleza kangangoko, anikwe indawo entofontofo ukuze ingqondo inga bi nakuxhlaba, alaliswe nakumgangatho wesamente.

\*Mr M NCEDANA: Mr Speaker, thank you. It is nice to hear about the plans in place, but it would be even greater to hear statements made by the hon Minister stating that it will take place, for example, that there is a section being built that will accommodate twenty five beds. When will this take place? When you look at

the situation in Khayelitsha it does not show the number of residents in Khayelitsha decreasing. It shows that they are increasing instead of decreasing. That simply means that when government makes these decisions, it must take into account the fact that people will indeed increase. Here the way in which preparations are made matters. I thought the hon Minister would be discussing how to meet the people halfway, especially in the informal settlements in Khayelitsha. We should take precautionary measures in building houses in other areas closer to the Groottesuur, and much closer to the larger hospitals, in preventing these challenges of maximised hospitals preventing people from being treated. I have been saying this for quite some time now that when a person visits a hospital it is because they need help in being healed. I believe that some of the things that speed up a person's healing are that when they get to a place of help they are assisted as soon as possible, and they must be afforded a comfortable place that will allow their mind to relax, and not be made to sleep on a cement floor.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much for those contributions. Let me say that I find it very difficult to understand why the ANC specifically is really making a huge effort to discredit this institution which was really a bold step and an act of redressing the imbalances of the past in this country. It is something which a million people waited for which was delivered, and one would have thought if they were patriotic that they would have shared in the excitement of this institution. The fact of the matter is we still receive more compliments than complaints from Khayelitsha hospital. We received in writing 43 complaints of which we already solved 42, and the other one is in the process of being solved.

I am concerned about what I want to refer to as selective information which the hon member Ms Magwaza mentioned here with 11 doctors that were, as she put it, fired. The fact of the matter is that hospital had a huge component of agency staff, which were replaced by permanent staff. She refers to those from the agency who were withdrawn. So, it is selective information and I do not think it is fair to this institution to do that. Hon member Mr Ncedana, let me remind you and the hon member Ms Magwaza that this institution, or our department, gets the most compliments. The fact of the matter is, this institution was awarded by the national government as the best public facility – any public facility – in the whole of South Africa, by your government. So, you know, maybe you should speak to your caucus across the road to find out what the real facts are.

I agree that we have got to invest and we have got to change our strategy. We have got to invest more. What you referred to now as step-down facilities, hon member ms Marais, we refer to as intermediate care and palliative care. This is one of the plans that we have to free up medical beds by providing those services, and we have a number of NGO's who are assisting us in that regard. The 50 beds, I have mentioned ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... will be completed in the next financial year.  
Thank you very much.

Mr M NCEDANA: May I ask a question, through you Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: On this interpellation?

Mr M NCEDANA: The question is, the Minister says he is reminding me but I did not get what he was ...[Interjections.]

Debate concluded.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Unfortunately, that interpellation has now expired. We will continue with interpellation number two. Mr von Brandis to Minister Winde. I see Minister Winde.

*Saldanha Industrial Development Zone: Economic growth in Western Cape*

**2. Mr E J von Brandis asked the Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism:**

How will the designation of Saldanha as an industrial development zone (IDZ) contribute to economic growth in the Western Cape?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:  
Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker, and thank you to the hon member Mr von Brandis for the question.

Saldanha Bay has long been acknowledged as an important resource for the sustainable growth and development of the West Coast region and indeed, the

whole of the Western Cape and South Africa.

Our vision is to establish the Western Cape as an oil and gas hub for Africa and the Saldanha IDZ is crucial in achieving this objective. It is projected that within 10 years the project will create 15 000 jobs and generate R10 billion for the gross domestic product of the region.

All indicators show that the industrial development zone in Saldhana would be to the benefit of the Western Cape, South Africa and the African continent as a whole, in creating a functional self-sustaining industry that contributes to economic development and sustainable employment.

An economic impact study has been conducted to estimate the potential job creation, economic activity and benefit cost ratio as per national treasury prescripts. Assuming a scenario where appropriate port and back of port infrastructure is provided and skills challenges are addressed, Saldanha could attract a 27.5% share of the addressable rig repair market and a 9.21% share of the accessible supply fabrication market within five years of operation of a well-functioning IDZ.

Considering the total cost and benefit to society, the overall BCR was calculated at 9.5%. A sensitivity analysis indicated that even with the least favourable assumptions regarding capital costs of potential new businesses, the BCR remains positive at 3.8%. This comes from the economic analysis of the proposed Saldanha IDZ as produced by EIS in April 2012.

South Africa is a significant industrial economy in the sub-Saharan African region and is logistically well connected to the region. It is therefore a natural location for providing repair and maintenance services, warehousing and logistics and professional and technical services where proximity to end location is an advantage.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, from our understanding the industrial development zone is a purpose-built industrial estate linked to an airport or sea port that leverages both domestic and foreign direct investment in value-added and export-orientated manufacturing industries and services.

It is thus understood that the core of the Saldanha IDZ will be maritime and related industries. Part of the IDZ program as outlined by the national government policy and legislation states certain outcomes which includes skills transfer, further job growth, increased exports, regional development and technological advancement. Jobs are always key when looking at such developments. We know that if we are to better the lives of our citizens, develop our economy and fight inequality, we need to grow jobs. From an initial feasibility study and additional experts inputs and studies, the Saldanha IDZ is projected to create upwards of 6 000 direct and indirect jobs in its first year. But the question is how will the IDZ contribute to economic development at large, in the province? The industrial prospects of Saldanha are sound, the job projections are positive. If the province is to harness the potential of the IDZ, the Western Cape government will need to ensure that expected outcomes of the IDZ do not remain insulated and that whenever possible, they contribute to economic development in the province at large.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:

Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I think, picking up from the hon member Mr von Brandis, perhaps first to note that we do actually have to prepare for this. That is where I am going to bring in this latest program that we have just launched, the Artisan Program, which is linked to not only the IDZ but the national development plan where the national development plan sees the shortfall of about 30 000 artisans in South Africa per year if you look at their projected economic growth over the next while. That is why we have just launched this program. The average age of an artisan in our province is 55 years old, so we have to really address that matter so that we can start producing the right work and skilled work force for the IDZ. But then also following on from hon member Mr von Brandis, it is also about how the port of Cape Town interacts with the port of Saldanha and how we balance those two ports, because obviously that kind of skilled ship repair and oil rig repair already exists in this port. But then even more so than that, how do we link it to the other South African ports or sub-Saharan African ports so that together those ports create a great offering for this specific industry around the whole coast of Africa.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Saldanha Bay IDZ is a project of national strategic interest and its success will benefit the future generations of the West Coast and the country as a whole. This is the first time that we, as the African National Congress, here in the legislation have the opportunity to commend the Minister of Trade and Industry, Dr Rob Davis, for his leadership in ensuring that an IDZ that will benefit the West Coast communities

was designated at Saldanha.

The Industrial Development Zone Program was approved by cabinet in 2000 in terms of the *Manufacturing Development Act*, No 187 of 1993, to promote foreign direct investments in export-orientated industries. The feasibility study further revealed that even in the low scenario over a 25 year period, the project has the potential to make a contribution of a huge percentage to the gross geographic product and create thousands of jobs, direct and indirect, and attract foreign investment worth billions.

To ensure that the benefits of the IDZ are spread equitably, the DTI is also developing a program for skills and supplier development strategies. This will ensure that the West Coast communities benefit as both employees and businesses, small, medium and large, will benefit from the IDZ. The application for the designation of the Saldanha Bay IDZ and operator permit, together with a feasibility study, was submitted to the DTI to comply with the regulations. After evaluation and their satisfaction and after carefully considering the application, it was approved on 7 August 2013. That was the process to date. We trust and we hope that the MEC and his department will keep the community of that area informed – and I just heard MEC Winde refer to it – that the principles of the NDP will be entrenched in the growth opportunities in that area.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please finish off, your time has expired.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Okay.



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Last sentence please.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: That all of the opportunities that will come out of – all of the knock-on opportunities – that will come out this development will be afforded to that area first of all, the rest of the province, but also the rest of the country.

[Time expired.]

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The reason why the question of the potential economic growth of the IDZ is so important, is because of the history of IDZ's or special economic zones in South Africa. Last year the *Financial Mail* wrote that industrial development zones were haunted by the past. As with any project of this nature, they are prone to empty promises. South African IDZ's, especially to investors, made many empty promises. Simply put, IDZ's suffered from not being competitive enough. There were many reasons for this. Inter-governmental co-ordination and planning and a lack of incentives by the government in tax, trade or labour regulations resulted in IDZ's merely becoming industrial parks.

Trade and Industry Minister, Rob Davis, in the same piece admitted that while IDZ's had not delivered to their full potential, they were not completely unsuccessful. Now there is an upside to these criticisms and shortfalls. Knowing full well what has happened in other IDZ's, the Western Cape government, national departments and stakeholders can ensure that past mistakes are not repeated if the designation is granted. Saldanha's economic growth potential lies in delivering on

the proposed benefits it will bring to the region and the province. In order for this to happen, it needs to not go the way of other IDZ's. I thank you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:  
Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The hon member Mr von Brandis talked about the limited success of IDZ's, and I agree with him. That was one of the first concerns I had when I came into office around the IDZ, but I must say that Saldanha Bay has got so many plus factors that even without a designation of an IDZ, it can still offer what is necessary in respect of oil and gas supply and oil and gas servicing without having the added advantage of an IDZ. So , having the IDZ proclaimed and signed-off by our national cabinet, is only just an added advantage and will make it all the more workable.

I must assume following on the hon member Ms Beerwinkel saying that it was passed on 7 August, that it is now in a public space. I have been waiting for the national Minister to actually announce that it is approved because obviously it is in his competency to make that announcement. We have been waiting for him to make that announcement, so I presume that now that you have announced that it has been passed, we can actually utilise 7 August as the date that the IDZ was passed through the cabinet. That is exactly what we want to know so that we can actually now go ahead with the process of getting this IDZ up and running. It is critical, because it is a catalyst, a part of so many more bigger projects and such a big driver of the economy. Just for example ... [Inaudible.] another national government intervention, which is the upgrading of a R120 billion railway line, Sishen to Saldanha, linked to the IDZ. We have just had a three day ports

conference right here in Cape Town, which looked at ports in sub-Saharan Africa mainly, and had discussions in that conference with political and business leaders from around sub-Saharan Africa, all looking at what the IDZ can do for this region. I must therefore thank those that have taken part in today's interpellation and thank the hon member Mr von Brandis for putting it on the Order Paper.

Debate concluded.

*Stikland Hospital: Eviction of nurses at nurses' home*

**3. Mr M Skwatsha asked the Minister of Health:**

What are the conditions and circumstances that led to the notice to evict nurses at the nurses' home at the Stikland Hospital?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. In the absence of hon member Mr Skwatsha who put the question, I reply as follows. Stikland Hospital has a hostel where employees of Stikland Hospital have been residing, some for many years. The hostel was never used as a primary residence for nursing students in training.

As part of the Western Cape Nursing Education Plan, the Western Cape College of Nursing will expand its operations and has commissioned a fully fledged Metro East campus for the training of psychiatric nursing students on Stikland Hospital premises. The implication of this plan is that infrastructure changes will be done, and are already in process, and that hostel and teaching staff accommodation is

needed. This in fact means that the current staff staying in the hostel must vacate the hostel.

The action that was taken: The consultation process with Labour and residents commenced in December 2011 and continued throughout 2012. The first due date for residents to vacate the hospital was set for 30 June 2012, but residents refused to vacate. The second re-negotiated date for residents to vacate the hospital, in consultation with Labour, was extended to 31 December 2012. Management then further extended assistance to members by making available information and/or options on how to find alternative accommodation during this period. Some residents vacated the hospital, but 13 residents refused.

At a meeting on 8 February 2013, hospital management and Labour Relations Directorate informed Labour that the formal eviction process via the legal route would commence. The legal eviction process was subsequently followed by the Labour Relations Directorate. In the meantime, lease agreements had not been renewed and disciplinary action was also implemented against those or some of the residents for disorderly and misconduct-related concerns via the disciplinary process. Recently the notice to vacate was served via the office of the State Attorney. In addition, nursing students of the Western Cape College of Nursing were also residing in the hospital and a large section of the hospital and training facility has already been handed over to the College of Nursing.

The 13 residents are still in the hospital. The current occupants have access to housing subsidies as an alternative. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Ms J WITBOOI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Sadly, tomorrow some of the nurses of Stikland Hospital will be without accommodation as they were presented with eviction notices. Whilst it is very important for the department to accommodate students, this must not be at the expense of staff. The hospital management claimed that the nurses are being evicted so that the homes can accommodate 16 students. This is not plausible. The nurse's home has three blocks, each block can accommodate 35 people and two blocks are not occupied. There are enough rooms to accommodate both the staff and students and they will still be left with two empty blocks. The hospital management refuses to explain to the nurses their plan regarding the other two blocks and when nurses ask questions, they are intimidated. The management has also made no effort to provide them with alternative accommodation.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I have made the point very clearly how the consultation took place, how long it took place, what alternatives were offered, how periods were extended, how Labour was involved and consented, only to dishonour the agreement afterwards and, how those nurses, the majority of them have vacated the premises, how we need those premises for the College of Nursing.

The fact of the matter is that on evaluation and on analysis, this process was extremely fair, it was very thorough, they were consulted, they were given opportunities, they were given alternatives and a decision was taken to use this facility for the purpose that we now need it.

I am concerned that these members might have been victims of political influence and that they eventually are the ones who are going to be inconvenienced and not those who incited political action there.

No students were evicted. That is also wrong. There was a certain point in the allegation that it is only staff members, but the fact of the matter is also that the rental agreements lapsed and they were not renewed. Thank you.

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Dankie, agb mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Wat duidelik is uit die antwoord van Minister Botha is dat daar met oorleg te werk gegaan is en dat 'n proses gevolg is. Gesondheidswerkers is spesiaal en onontbeerlik vir dienslewering in hospitale en in ons klinieke. Die empatie waarmee die aangeleentheid hanteer is onderskryf die departement en die Minister se respek en erkenning aan ons personeel. Dankie.

Ms J WITBOOI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is very clear that there is a lack of communication and maybe the Minister must intervene immediately especially on the part of communication. If he does not intervene he will further confirm the indictment by the Public Service Commission of his department. The Public Service Commission told this legislature on Tuesday that most of its grievances received out of all government departments across the country and across all spheres of government are from staff in the Western Cape Department of Health. Minister, I am begging of you, help with this communication because I think there is something to do here.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am going to repeat it again. The negotiations started in 2011. There were twice agreements on this, Labour agreed twice. The arrangement was not honoured. No-one has been evicted yet. The lease agreements lapsed. It was a due process. Alternatives were offered. There was really ample conversation or communication and that is the last thing we can say. We have done everything possible to accommodate these people over a more than two years period and really we have to draw the line somewhere, because we have to also ensure that our other obligations towards the nursing college are adhered to and therefore we have got to proceed the way we have.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That brings us to the end of the interpellations. We continue with questions. The first group is questions standing over from Thursday 22 August, hon member Mr Von Brandis to Minister Winde.

## **QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

*Question standing over from Thursday, 22 August 20013, as agreed to by the House:*

*Western Cape: Year-round destination*

### **2. E J von Brandis asked the Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism:**

What can the Western Cape do to counter seasonality in our tourism industry and to ensure that our province becomes a year-round destination for tourists and visitors?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:

Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. The reply is as follows:

2. Seasonality and tourism is not unique to the Western Cape but there are actions that can be taken to try and counter the issue. Year on year trends show a decline in international tourist numbers during the April to September period. The argument is often around the cold and wet weather conditions of our province during winter. We need to take the cold weather issue out of the equation and showcase our range of amazing indoor experiences and other products that tourists can enjoy in the Western Cape over this period.

According to South African Tourism countries such as China, Hong Kong, India, Japan, Brazil and the United States have shown year-on-year positive growth over their winter periods. Wesgro is spending time in these markets to truly understand what types of experiences and products they offer that might appeal to these countries' outbound operators, consumer base and the emerging frequent independent traveller especially over our winter season. Strategies and linkages can be used from this and therefore develop new routes and packages tailored for specific markets, which the regions are already working on. We are also leveraging off winter events to attract tourists into the smallest towns of our region.

Due to our wide range of unique experiences and products we have a wonderful opportunity to profile and position the Western Cape, not only as



an amazing outdoor destination but also a region that offers unique experiences, rich in culture, heritage, luxury and best enjoyed over our winter season. Another opportunity will be to drive big indoor events that will appeal to the international market over the winter period in the Western Cape, also another focus area for Wesgro. It will be the incentive travel business as well as business travel as they offer greater opportunities for drive travel into the Western Cape and over the quieter time and the quieter periods of our year.

In summary, the opportunity for the Western Cape to counter seasonality and to become a year-round destination is to drive awareness within the international markets, especially those showing growth over the winter period. Our domestic market is truly unique and the Western Cape experience is rich in culture, heritage and luxury best enjoyed during our winter.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Minister Winde, will the announcement by Virgin Airlines about the direct flight from Cape Town to London assist in this matter?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Yes, definitely it will. Obviously airlines like Virgin come back into our market because of season time, but this specific announcement that has been made - they have put bigger aircraft onto the London/Cape Town route, which means straight away an extra 5000 seats coming into our market, number one, and of course then it is up to us and the businesses of this region to offer better value for money and better marketing attraction so that we actually start to stretch that season so that

these airlines, while bringing more and more people, also then offer to stay longer and longer in the market.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Minister Winde, CTRU used to have a programme for marketing the Western Cape as a winter destination. What has happened to that programme and is it still continuing?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: That programme still continues and obviously they refine it each and every year. That is specifically the work they do with the regions because obviously their job is to coordinate all the five regions of our province, and they work specifically with the regions trying to get them to deliver better on their market promise and then take it to market, so it definitely still exists.

*New questions:*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the Deputy Chief Whip.

Mr H P GEYER: Mr Deputy Speaker, if I can address you in the absence of Minister Carlisle, and request that this matter stand over. The hon member Mr von Brandis has been advised of that.

*Questions 1, 3 and 5 standing over.*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Would the same apply to question 3 and question 5?

Thank you. We then proceed to question 2, Hon member Ms Brown to Minister Plato. Minister Plato.

*Gangs in the Western Cape*

**2. Ms L Brown asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

- (1) Whether, in his capacity as Minister of Community Safety, he has had any meetings with or has met any members or representatives of gangs in the Western Cape; if so, (a) how often, (b) why did such meetings take place and (c) what are the further relevant details in this regard;
- (2) whether such engagements have had any discernible outcome or result; if so, what are the relevant details in this regard?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you and also to the hon member Ms Brown for the question. The reply is as follows:

2. (1) Yes, at just about every public meeting in gangster affected communities there are more than likely gangsters present. Many of the youth who attend the meetings or the sessions claim to have been gangsters.
  - (a) I attend various public meetings in different communities on a monthly basis.
  - (b) The meetings took place to address concerns raised by members of

the public to share information about the services provided by the Department of Community Safety and also to gather information for the policing needs and priorities report.

(c) Part of the question I have answered in (b) above, but many of those attending were once gang members, are turning their backs on crime and choosing education instead.

(2) The meetings have had many positive outcomes with hundreds of youth, many of whom were once gangsters and involved in a life of crime, but are now enrolled in FET Colleges and studying towards a qualification, which will give them the necessary skills and qualification to find employment and become an active and positive member of society. This whole initiative, Mr Deputy Speaker, is proving to be a major success, looking at the amount of youngsters that is enrolling. Mr Deputy Speaker, with your indulgence, let me show you one or two of the positive reports in the press. May I do so, just to show you?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Well if it's part of your reply you may do so yes.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Very positive, last week in the papers about the initiative with the youth speaking from Hanover Park to Khayelitsha and also to Manenberg and various areas where they tell their stories.

An HON MEMBER: Manenberg; only Manenberg?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I have said various communities. You must listen, hon member, and then another one in Nyanga, “MEC urges the youth to change their lives”, very positive I must say, and then also this one: “Gangs gaan opnuut leer: los bendelewe”. Wherever I go in various communities there is always press present and that is the primary reason why the reports in the press are so positive. Thank you.

Ms L BROWN: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. The question would be why would you want the army in if you were so good at dealing with the gangs? I want to ask have you met any of the leaders like Donkie Booysen or Ernie Lastig?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I said it at the very beginning when I started with this initiative and I reported that in the press. Yes, I had a meeting with Donkie Booysen. I was his ward councillor for almost twenty years. Donkie Booysen owned more than half of Belhar. You move around in Belhar yourself and you know that. Let me say to you Donkie Booysen ... [Interjections.] ...is also the current president of the Belhar Rugby Football Club, and has been for the last couple of years, and that the rugby football club does not belong to him ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: In other words he owns it!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: It belongs to the City of Cape Town

and currently all politicians ... [Interjections.] ... operating in Belhar have to deal with him in his capacity as the president of that rugby football club. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Ms L BROWN: So in essence the hon Minister Plato sings the praises of one of our big gang leaders in the province. [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: Yes! Yes!

Ms L BROWN: What I want to ask, Mr Deputy Speaker, I am very interested to know why the hon Minister Plato defends, as he does now very adequately in the House, somebody like Donkie Booysen? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am very pleased with that question and I like the question and let me answer the question.

Ms L BROWN: I know, that is why I am asking you, because you ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: You know! You know the answer! The answer is there are many of what you call “top gangsters” walking around in our society ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: In the ANC!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... supposed to be in jail and not walking around on the streets. You must talk to your police to go and have them arrested. That is what you need to do ... [Interjections.] and let me further say, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.] let me say that all the ANC members living in Belhar, and I had such a meeting, a public forum in Belhar a couple of weeks ago where they posed that question to me. Their kids are receiving their rugby training under Donkie Booysen [Interjections.] You. Your ANC members.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order Minister Plato! Order! Is that a question?

Mr M OZINSKY: Whoa, you can defend him.

Mr M NCEDANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, is it parliamentary for the Minister to refer to police as “your police” while he is in charge of the police? ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, that is [Interjections.] Okay, Order! Order! Order! Please continue.

Ms L BROWN: Have you in your oversight responsibility as MEC for Community Safety, reported the criminal activity of any one of those who you call in this House today gangsters doing good work in the community?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Plato, to reply?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I have never once said the gangsters are doing good work. [Interjections.] I have never said that. [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker, the hon member Ms Brown is putting words in my mouth. [Interjections.] That is what she is doing. She is very clever with her questioning, but let me say, Mr Deputy Speaker, the hon member Ms Brown needs to ask me what happened when the hon member Mr Ozinsky visited me one Friday morning in my office. He was very quick to tell this House what I showed him. He must tell the people of the Western Cape what he told me in my office. [Interjections.] That is the untold story ... [Interjections.]... that needs to be told. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Ms L BROWN: My last question, thank you Mr Deputy Speaker. The hon MEC Mr Plato really confuses me. He just said in the House now and I am asking a question, that Donkie Booysen - I almost called him the hon Donkie Booysen - Donkie Booysen ... [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Well that ... [Inaudible.]

Ms L BROWN: Oh, please keep quiet Premier. [Interjections.] Donkie Booysen has ... [Interjections.]

’n AGB LID: Sy sê agbare vir die ANC! ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Please allow the Leader of the Opposition an opportunity to ask the question.



Ms L BROWN: I just want to check with the hon Minister Plato whether Donkie Booysen as he said here today in the House is an active, honest member who runs a soccer ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He didn't say that.

Ms L BROWN: ...who runs a soccer club and people have to abide by whether he thinks that the hon Donkie Booysen has done nothing wrong ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I also like that question and I like to the manner in which the hon member Ms Brown is playing with words. I have never said that, what you imply. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: You said you are his ward councillor.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I have never said that and I am not going to repeat what I have said. What I want to say, there are many of those people operating in our communities and it is the work of the intelligence service and the South African Police Services to have those people arrested. Why is that not happening? Thank you.

Mr M OZINSKY: You are the prosecuting authority. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Order! No. We have had the

maximum amount of questions, four already. We proceed to the next question. Number 3 stands over.

*Luhlaza Secondary School, Khayelitsha: Compensation*

**4. Mr M Skwatsha asked the Minister of Education:**

What kind of compensation is his department prepared to consider for the whistle-blower in the dog called Warrior case, who was fired at the Luhlaza Secondary School in Khayelitsha?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The reply is as follows:

4. The department did not employ the person concerned and has no evidence to suggest that she was dismissed. If she believes she was dismissed unfairly she has every right to lodge a complaint with the CCMA. In these circumstances the department has no plans to pay her an *ex gratia* payment.

Mr M OZINSKY: Thank you hon Minister Grant, are you not aware that this worker who is referred to here was dismissed, and that it was reported in the same case where it was reported about the dog?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I see that the hon member Mr Ozinsky is now the proxy for the hon member Mr Skwatsha. Let me tell you what my information is, because I think your information is wrong. [Interjections.]

The worker concerned was according to my information on a short-term contract with an independent service provider providing nutrition to that school. That short-term contract had come to an end.

Mr M OZINSKY: Did the department take any other action against the principal?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I do not know what is wrong with the hon member Mr Ozinsky [Interjections.] I said that she was not in our employ. How do we take action against someone who is not in our employ ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: On a point of order. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: It is such a stupid question.

Mr M OZINSKY: You misunderstood the question. The question was ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is a new question!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr M OZINSKY: The question was not about the action against the employee; it was about the principal.

An HON MEMBER: That is a new question!

Mr M OZINSKY: I asked did the department take any action against the principal.

An HON MEMBER: That is a new question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay that is the second question, please continue.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, the department, even if it wished to, could not take action about this matter. We were not the employer.  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Your third question.

Mr M OZINSKY: The last one.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your third question, yes. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: I am asking you, are you saying that the principal of Luhlaza Secondary School is not in the employ of the education department?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: That is not! Mr Deputy Speaker, that is not

what I am saying. I am saying that this worker had a short-term contract with the service provider which had nothing to do with the principal.

Mr M OZINSKY: You see the hon Minister should stop throwing insults and listen carefully. This is recorded in Hansard. The question was: did you take any action against the principal for what happened to the dog?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The answer is no, because we did not employ the person concerned and therefore the principal had no jurisdiction in the matter.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That disposes of that question.  
[Interjections.] Order! Order! Question number 5 stands over.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: You do not understand the issue.

Mr M OZINSKY: I do understand the issue!

*Cederberg Municipality: Salaries and legal costs*

**\*6. Mr H P Geyer asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

As at the latest specified date for which information is available, what amount had been spent on salaries and legal costs in respect of a number of senior officials in the Cederberg Municipality who won their cases against the municipality and received salaries after their suspensions or dismissals?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Die antwoord is soos volg:

6. Die burgemeester het as volg geantwoord: SALGA verteenwoordig die munisipaliteit met arbeidsgeskille en geen werknemer het na ontslag 'n salaris ontvang nie aangesien dit onwettig, vrugtelos of verkwistend sou wees. Die munisipaliteit het geen rekord van werknemers wat hul sake gewen het nie. In een geval is 'n werknemer na die onvoorsiene dood van 'n sleutelgetuie voor die saak vir arbitrasie in die Suid-Afrikaanse Bedingingsraad vir Plaaslike Regering aangehoor is, op dieselfde en soortgelyke wyse weer aangestel.

Mr M OZINSKY: Sorry, on a point of order, is this the answer to question 5?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No we are dealing with question 6 now.

Mr M OZINSKY: But was question 5 answered?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Question 5 stood over. Questions 1, 3 and 5 stood over.

We agreed that initially. We are now at question 6. Is there a follow-up?

Mr H P GEYER: There a follow-up, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, deur u aan die Minister, ek het drie van daardie mense

gekontak en daar is minstens vyf mense, senior amptenare, geskors of afgedank en hulle het nou hulle saak teen die munisipaliteit gewen. Hoe gaan hulle nou geakkommodeer word met inagneming daarvan dat die voormalige waarnemende Direkteur: Korporatiewe Dienste nou al byna twee jaar by die huis sit teen volle betaling?

’n AGB LID: Vra dit vir die munisipaliteit.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek is in die hande van die munisipaliteit met sekere antwoorde soos hierdie. Kom ek gee dan nou maar vir u die sin wat ek nie wou gegee het nie oor hoe die burgemeester my geantwoord het. Sy sê dat “We, that is the municipality, place on record that this is the last time that we will respond to issues raised by the hon member that is based on misinformation or misinterpretation of the functional situation of the relevant legal prescribes.” So ek sit met ’n munisipaliteit wat vir my sê dat hulle nie met die agb lid saamstem nie, en dit is die antwoord wat hulle vir my gegee het. As die agb lid enige feite het dan moet ons dit maar ondersoek. Dankie.

Mnr H P GEYER: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. As dit die geval is met die inligting wat ek het en die organogram wat nie voorsiening maak nie is my vraag dan ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mnr H P GEYER: ... is my vraag dan, moet die Huis nie hierdie saak na Skoor verwys sodat ons dit kan ondersoek nie ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

'n AGB LID: Ag nee, daar is niks nie! Daar is niks ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mnr H P GEYER: Want dit rym beslis nie. ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek kan seker nie namens die Huis antwoord nie, maar dit staan seker die Huis vry om enige munisipaliteit voor Skoor te dagvaar en dan die feite te verifieer.

Mr M OZINSKY: Hon Minister Bredell, are you aware that Scopa, because of the actions of your party, no longer has any oversight over local government?

An HON MEMBER: They never had, they never had.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: No, I am not aware.

Mnr H P GEYER: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, dan stel ek die vraag dat ons dit deur Skoor laat ondersoek.

'n AGB LID: Jy kan nie dit hier stel nie.



Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid Mnr Geyer, jy kan nie vir die Stoel 'n vraag vra nie ... [Tussenwerpsels.] Ek sal u 'n kans gee om 'n vraag te vra vir die Minister of ons kan net verbygaan. Sal ons verbygaan?

Mnr H P GEYER: Ja.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dan gaan ons oor na die volgende vraag, vraag 7. [Tussenwerpsels.] Question number 7, hon member Mr Wiley to ask Minister Plato. Minister Plato.

*SAPS Mitchells Plain: Conduct of major-general*

**7. Mr M G E Wiley asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

- (1) With reference to an earlier correspondence regarding the conduct of a major-general of the South African Police Service based in Mitchells Plain, whose name has been furnished to the Minister's department for the purpose of his reply, what specific actions were taken in this case;
- (2) Whether the officer concerned was charged; if not, why not; if so, what were the findings in the case?

The MINISTER OF SAFETY AND COMMUNITY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you for the question. The reply is as follows:

7. I have asked the South African Police Service to provide me with more detailed information on this matter and on receiving of such information I

will hand it over to the hon member Mr Wiley. Thank you.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Does the Minister feel that a police officer who is ostensibly promoting illegal drugs, makes racist comments and political comments is worthy of an investigation?

’n AGB LID: Nee man!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, that is the information I have asked SAPS to supply me with. Thank you.

Mr M OZINSKY: Hon Minister Plato, will you make this correspondence public by providing it to the House?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: If the information appears in the House and you know the answer, then it is public. Thank you.

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, can the Minister confirm ...  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon, Order! The minister is not attending.

Mr M G E WILEY: Can the Minister confirm that the original response by the Police Commissioner was: “the concerns raised by yourself were evaluated and dealt with in terms of our South African Police Service employment policies”,

whether that is an adequate response to a parliamentary question? [Interjections.]

Die MINISTER VAN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, dit is juis om daardie rede dat ek vir meer inligting gevra het ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

'n AGB LID: Waar het jy die brief gekry?

Die MINISTER VAN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID: ...omdat ek nie gevrede was met hulle oorspronklike antwoord aan my nie.

'n AGB LID: Waar het jy die brief gekry?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. There is one opportunity left and I will give it to the other side. Hon member Mr Wiley. Hon member Mr Ozinsky?

Mr M OZINSKY: Minister, if you will not make the correspondence available to the House, will you give me a copy of it?

Ms L BROWN: Only on Friday morning!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon Minister Plato, are you replying to that?

An HON MEMBER: Only in his office. ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I would love to

give a different answer, but I have to be polite in the House.

Dit is 'n tipiese strikvraag.

Mr P UYS: Dit is nie 'n strikvraag nie.

Die MINISTER VAN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID: Ek het dit reeds beantwoord.

'n AGBLID: Ja nee wat!

Die MINISTER VAN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID: Die lid maak van homself 'n kleintjie deur so 'n dom vraag aan my te stel.

Mr P UYS: Jy kan nie sê dis 'n dom vraag nie.

Die MINISTER VAN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID: Baie dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Wiley, is that a point of order?

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, can the hon Minister Plato please confirm to this House ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Wiley no, we have already exceeded the four supplementary questions ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: We had four already.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... so unfortunately.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to question number 8. Hon member Mr Von Brandis to ask Minister Winde, Minister Winde.

*Work and skills programme: Bypassing criteria*

**8. Mr E J von Brandis asked the Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism:**

(a) What are the reasons for his department's bypassing the criteria in respect of the work and skills programme for 88 interns and (b) what measures have been taken to ensure that the placing of interns will be done according to set criteria in the future?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:

Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. The reply is as follows:

8. Both the interns who were outside of the stipulated criteria were women who were breadwinners in their respective households. In addition, most interns who did not meet the age criteria were from peri-urban and rural areas of the

Western Cape. While exceptions are made in rare circumstances the majority of the participants are selected according to a set of criteria for the work and skills programme. This follows a pre-selection process in which all applicants will be assessed according to the maturity assessment tool.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No follow-up there? We continue with question number 9, hon member Ms Labuschagne to Hon Minister Grant. Hon Minister Grant.

*Underperforming schools in the Western Cape: Decreasing*

**9. Ms C Labuschagne asked the Minister of Education:**

Whether there is any possibility of decreasing the number of underperforming schools in the Western Cape based on the results of June 2013; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The reply is as follows:

9. Yes, if we take into account the 2013 June results the department is confident that we can reduce the number of underperforming schools even further. Districts reported that the June results overall were promising. We have in the last four years been successful in reducing the number of underperforming schools from 85 to 26. The department is supporting our underperforming schools through various interventions to improve not only

the overall performance but also the quality of the results at the end of this year.

Interventions include additional tutoring by expert teachers; telematics programmes; curriculum support; holiday schools and camps; mentoring of educators and learners and the provision of additional study materials.

Mr H P GEYER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would just like to know did the supplementary examination have any influence on the results?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, yes. The last year's results improved from 82.9% to just under 86% for the supplementary examinations.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you? No further? We continue with question number 10, Hon member Ms Labuschagne to Hon Minister Grant again?

*Manenberg: Continuation of school education*

**10. Ms C Labuschagne asked the Minister of Education:**

Whether his department has any plans in place to ensure that education continues in schools in Manenberg if gang violence in those areas continues; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The reply is as follows:

10. On 15 August the Department together with Community Safety, Social Development, SAPS and the City of Cape Town met with a representative group of educators from Manenberg to discuss their safety concerns. The Western Cape Government and the City of Cape Town put forward a proposal that focused on safe access in and out of Manenberg and the protection of our schools. The plan was approved and finalised the next day for implementation on Monday 19 August. The City of Cape Town offered to deploy additional manpower, between 60 and 80 metro law enforcement staff in Manenberg. The City of Cape Town and SAPS have deployed additional law enforcement staff in Manenberg which was divided between schools during school hours and along the access routes both before and after school, ensuring a safety corridor. Our objective was to ensure the safety of our educators and learners before, during and after school so that teaching and learning could continue. We are pleased the teaching and learning have now continued and that attendance levels have stabilised.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No follow-ups there? We continue to question number 11. Hon member Mr Uys to ask Minister Van Rensburg. Minister?

*Philippi agricultural land: Studies or research*

**\*11. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Agriculture:**

- (1) Whether any talks or consultations were held with him on the inclusion of the agricultural land in Philippi within the urban edge of the City of



Cape Town; if so, what are the relevant details;

(2) whether his department conducted any studies or research in this regard;

if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;

(3) whether he will make a statement on the matter?

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, dankie aan die agb lid

Mnr Uys vir die vraag. Die antwoord is soos volg:

11. Die hele Philippi-area is geleë binne die stedelike gebied van die Stad Kaapstad met 'n sonering van tuinboukundig, en dus is hulle nie onderhewig aan die bepalings van die Wet op die Onderverdeling van Landbougrond, Wet 70 van 1970, nie. In terme van deelnemende bestuur word my departement egter in terme van die Ordonnansie op Grondgebruiksbeplanning deur die Stad Kaapstad gevra om kommentaar te lewer op enige aansoeke om verandering van grondgebruik in die Philippi-gebied.

Gedurende die afgelope paar jaar is daar op 'n aantal aansoeke kommentaar gelewer en die kommentaar het deurgaans daarna gestrewe om die tuinboukundige gebruik te behou. Daar is ook kommentaar gelewer op die moontlike verandering van die grense van Philippi weens die talle grondgebruiksaktiwiteite wat teenstrydig is met tuinboukundige gebruik. Aangesien dit feitlik onmoontlik sou wees om die grondgebruik van sekere gedeeltes om te keer na tuinboukundig is aanbeveel dat gedeeltes uitgesluit word van die tuinboukundige area. Geen studies of navorsing is uitgevoer ten opsigte van die Philippi-gebied nie aangesien die gebied nie landbougrond is

wat onderhewig is aan Wet 70 van 1970 nie. Om dieselfde rede kan ek nie 'n verklaring daaroor uitreik nie.

Mnr P UYS: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Dankie vir die agb LUR. Kan ek net vir u vra wat die persentasie groente is wat daar geproduseer word in verhouding tot die hele Wes-Kaap?

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Agb lid mnr Uys, as u aan my die vraag vra sal ek dit vir u voorberei. Ek kan dit regtig nie uit my kop uit vir u gee nie.

'n AGB LID: Hoeveel hare het jy op jou kop?

Mnr P UYS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, het u in gesprek getree met die burgemeester hieroor en wat was die resultate van hierdie gesprek? Dit is mos waar dit bespreek moet word, nie waar nie?

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Agb lid mnr Uys, ek het met die burgemeester sowel as met die boere van Philippi daaroor gesels, maar dit was bloot net ter inligting en ek het geen resultate van die gesprek verwag nie.

Mnr P UYS: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Kan ek dan vra wat is u finale besluit hieroor as u 'n inset lewer na die burgemeester toe? Sê u ja, sê u nee? Waarvoor sê u ja, waarvoor sê u nee?

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Ek het baie duidelik vir u probeer sê dat ek nie

beheer het oor hierdie goed nie. Dit is binne die grense van die Stad van Kaapstad. Ons maak bloot 'n aanbeveling wanneer hulle vir ons vra, so daar kan nie 'n finale besluit van my kant wees nie.

Mnr P UYS: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Waarom sê die LUR hy kan nie 'n besluit neem nie wanneer landbou sy jurisdiksie is ... [Tussenwerpsels]

'n AGB LID: Ag, kom nou man!

Mnr P UYS: ... en hy die kosvoorsiening in die Wes-Kaap moet beskerm en hy hardloop weg daarvan?

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek hardloop beslis nie weg nie. Ek doen net wat my werk is. Hierdie het ek gesê is uitgesluit onder Wet 70 van 1970.

Mnr P UYS: Dit maak nie saak nie!

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: En dit sê dat ek nie 'n jurisdiksie daaroor het nie en daarom kan ek nie 'n besluit neem nie.

Mnr P UYS: Daarom wil jy niks sê nie ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We continue to question number 12.

Agb lid mnr Uys aan Minister Madikizela.

Mr M G E WILEY: Sorry, how many court cases have you lost recently Pierie?

Mr P Uys: None!

*Boys Town housing project: continuation or expansion*

**\*12. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

Whether the Boys Town housing project is to be continued and/or expanded; if not, why not; if so, (a) when and (b) what are the further relevant details with regard to such continuation and/or expansion?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.  
The answer to ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: None! ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms L BROWN: How many court cases has the DA won?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela, you may start now.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The reply is as follows:

12. Yes, that is the intention. As you know, the first phase of just over 500 units has been completed and the construction of phase 2 needs to commence, but currently there is a temporary hold in the construction activities because of the fact that some members of the community raised a concern about the allocation process with the Premier. This resulted in a decision to appoint a forensic investigation unit to conduct an investigation. The investigation has been completed and once the announcement in terms of funding has been made, we will then start to track the way forward in terms of the commencement of phase 2 and phase 3.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Did the hon Premier stop the development of the project because the community raised the issue with the Premier?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The hon member Mr Uys would know that we had a number of challenges when it came to the project. It is not the Premier who actually stopped the project.

Mr P UYS: You said the Premier stopped it.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Let me answer you, through you Mr Deputy Speaker. It is not the Premier who stopped the project. If the hon member Mr Uys understood the problem that we have been facing in Boys Town, he will know that that project has been stopped by the community members on a number of occasions. We had to make a number of interventions as department to

make sure that the project continues unhindered, but the fact that there were allegations that were raised by community members further fuelled the reasons for them to stop the project, which is why the FIU was then appointed to deal with the allegations and concerns that were raised so that we can continue with the project.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. May I ask the MEC, do you have money allocated for that project and what is the amount please?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes, we do have money allocated to the project. I cannot think of it now off the top of my head but I can provide that answer to you, but yes, we have money allocated to the particular project.

Mr P UYS: I would just like to know the number of units that will be developed in phase 2? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: As I said the next phase we will be developing 400 houses. The total number of houses that will be built there is 1392. As I said, about 501 houses have been completed, and about 890 or 892 will be developed in terms of phase 2 and phase 3.

Mr P UYS: MEC, who will take responsibility for the development, your department or that of the City of Cape Town?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: N2 Gateway is part of the N2 Gateway Project which means we are the developers, the Provincial Department of

Human Settlements, so I take responsibility for what happens at that particular project.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That brings us to the end of questions. We now proceed with questions to the Premier without notice and the first one is the hon member Mr Ncedana. I see the hon member.

*Questions to the Premier without notice:*

Mr M NCEDANA: Madam Premier, did you and the DA Government make it clear to the media that you believe the “poo protestors” is a politically motivated protest? Does that mean you disregard the genuine complaints of the people who have to live with the stinking portable toilets, the so-called “portable flush toilets” in their houses?

The PREMIER: The answers to those two questions are yes and no. The first one is yes, the second one is no.

Mr M NCEDANA: Madam Premier, do I understand that you agree with the statements made by yourself that the flushable toilets, the so called “flushable toilets”, are in suit so they contain no risks to the health of people?

The PREMIER: That is a completely different question. The truth is if properly used the portable flush toilets are not a risk to health. It is only when political activists are throwing around their contents that they are a risk to health.

n AGB LID: Mooi!

Mr M NCEDANA: Madam Premier, do you know whether those flushable toilets are provided with the necessary chemicals that they are supposed to be provided with to curb the stench and health hazards?

The PREMIER: I have obviously seen, assembled and flushed a portable flush toilet before, and my clear experience from when I have used them before in caravans and other places, is that a sealed container has no smell. It is only when you break the seal and start throwing the contents around that you have a smell, as was done recently at the Provincial Parliament.

Me J WITBOOI: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Aan die Premier deur u, kan die agb Premier bevestig dat die R6 miljoen wat aan die Stad Kaapstad geskenk is uit die begroting van die Departement van Onderwys kom nadat veertien skole in Manenberg deur dieselfde departement gesluit is?

The PREMIER: Part of that budget will come from the Department of Education. The rest will come from elsewhere.

Me J WITBOOI: Kan die Premier vir ons sê onder watter program die skenking gemaak is?

The PREMIER: You know it is very interesting, Mr Deputy Speaker, how we come



under interrogation because we are solving a problem that the police should be solving. Because the police refuse to increase their forces there, because they refuse to bring back the anti-drug and gang units, because they refuse to bring in a peacekeeping force from the defence force as a force multiplier, and we have to get kids back to school in safe circumstances ... [Interjections.] ... so because the national government and the ANC is refusing to do their job we are having to do their job ... [Interjections.] ... by taking away from our programmes and that is where the scandal is, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

Me J WITBOOI: Ek gaan my laaste vraag vra, maar ek het kennis geneem dat die Premier nie my vraag antwoord nie.

'n AGB LID: Die Premier het vir jou baie mooi geantwoord.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde! Agb lid me Witbooi, jy kan die vraag vra.

'n AGB LID: Nee, sy het nie ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

Me J WITBOOI: Die derde vraag is waarom hierdie DA-geleide regering die Stad Kaapstad as begunstigde van die groot bedrag gekies het?

The PREMIER: The answer is the twelve schools were closed in Manenberg and we had to get the schools open and the children back into schools.

Me A ROSSOUW: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, Premier, op gister se *Cape Argus* se

buiteblad is daar 'n foto van 'n persoon wat sê hy is 'n regsstudent. Het ons regering reeds daardie persoon geïdentifiseer want hy beweer hy staan sentraal in hierdie hele ontlastingstrooiery?

Die PREMIER: Ja, ons weet presies waar hy is. Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ons weet presies wie hy is. Hy is een van die leiers van 'n sogenaamde 'self-proclaimed' taakspan wat almal geïdentifiseer is. Sy naam, sy spesifieke naam wat nou so weggesteek word van die kameras is Sibusiso Zonke. Hy is 'n student aan die Universiteit van Wes-Kaap en hy bly daar in die koshuis op belastingbetalers se geld, maar ons sal môre in 'n perskonferensie die name van die ander taakmaglede bekendmaak en dan sal mense mooi sien wat hulle agenda is en wat die plan is.

'n AGB LID: Aha, aha.

Me A ROSSOUW: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Agb Premier, is hierdie persoon se naam reeds al aan die polisie deurgegee om op te volg of gaan dit môre by die perskonferensie gebeur?

Die PREMIER: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, nie net Sibusiso Zonke se naam nie, maar talle ander name en bewyse is bymekaargekry en aan die polisie en die intelligensiedienste oorhandig.

Me E PRINS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, deur u aan die Premier. Agb Premier, is al die mense van die Wes-Kaap se veiligheid vir u baie belangrik?

Die PREMIER: Ja, mnr die Adjunkspeaker.

Me E PRINS: Dankie. Die rede hoekom ek vra is waarom sonder u Manenberg uit wel wetende dat Nyanga ook 'n misdaadnes is, en u nie van plan is om in te gaan in Nyanga en om daaraan aandag te gee nie? Is dit miskien deel van die DA se 'divide and rule game'?

'n AGB LID: Glad nie!

The PREMIER: The answer is, Mr Deputy Speaker, no. It is not part of any strategy at all. In fact we are spending enormous amounts of money on safety in Nyanga. We have put together an integrated community team there with a whole range of departments across the City and the province. We have major funding to back that up. We have major new pilot projects at every level from education to health to after-school programmes. All of those issues in Nyanga focus very specifically on increasing safety for the community. Of course the biggest reason, acknowledged by General Lamoer himself for the high murder rate in Nyanga, is the amount of alcohol consumed from illegal shebeens, and again it is the police's job to close illegal shebeens.

Mr M OZINSKY: That is not. It is Winde's job.

The PREMIER: No, it is not. It is the police's job to close illegal shebeens. [Interjections.] That is illegal. [Interjections.] That is illegal.

Ms L BROWN: What about here in Cape Town? [Inaudible.]

Mr M OZINSKY: The municipal police! ... [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: They have to ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: They have to license legal shebeens but not illegal shebeens. They have to be closed down by the forces of law and order ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: By the municipal police!

The PREMIER: General Lamoer said that alcohol from illegal shebeens is the major cause of the crisis in Nyanga. That is the reason and the police will not close down those shebeens, Mr Deputy Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: No!

The PREMIER: That is the core problem that we face. [Interjections.] If it was not ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The Metro police.

The PREMIER: If it was not for the City police this city would be anarchic.

Mr M OZINSKY: It is anarchic.

The PREMIER: In fact there is nothing in the by-law which enables the City police to intervene in illegal shebeens. They can only act on the legal shebeens if they are not keeping by the terms of their licences. It is the police that have to close down the illegal shebeens and until they do and until they bring back the anti-gang and drug units ... [Interjections.] ... we are going to have to continue taking money away from other budgets to ensure the people are safe in both Nyanga and Manenberg. Thank you. [Interjections.]

Me E PRINS: Dankie Premier vir die antwoord ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Wag net so 'n bietjie. Orde! Orde! Laat die Leier van die Opposisie probeer net eers stil raak, dan kan u die vraag vra.

Me E PRINS: Kan die agb Premier miskien vir my aandui hoeveel geld in waarde hulle gekry het; ek wil weet watter bedrag. U het verwys na projekte en ander 'intervention' in Nyanga. Die feit van die saak is dat u R6 miljoen in Manenbergbestee het. Hoe kan ons dit vergelyk met ander geteisterde gebiede, misdaad geteisterde gebiede ... [Tussenwerpsels.] ... en sal u dieselfde doen in ander gebiede; die bedrag van R6 miljoen?

The PREMIER: What we will do to increase safety in this province, Mr Deputy Speaker, is increase our oversight to the very maximum that it can be extended to.

That is what we need to do ... [Interjections.] ... and the key thing is that we are waiting for the judgment of the Constitutional Court around our proposed commission of enquiry in Khayelitsha. We are proceeding with our Community Safety Bill and we have got many more oversight mechanisms in hand including calling the Commissioner of Police to answer questions in this House so that this executive can undertake oversight to which the police will not succumb through any other legal mechanism.

Mr A M FIGLAN: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Madam Premier, what are the findings of the pilot phase of the disability project that is being run in Vredenburg and Mfuleni by an NGO called Uhambo, by the Premier and by Social Development?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much indeed, Mr Deputy Speaker. This is an issue that has really hit me very forcibly because I have known for a while and through my own experience that there are many disabled children in very poor communities who are not getting any access to services and are often neglected and hidden away. It is a very, very serious problem, but I never knew the extent of the problem. Uhambo was a consortium of various organisations who were trained and then did this pilot for us. They had a very clear definition of what we meant by disability. It was quite a narrow definition. They went door-to-door and the findings are much worse than I ever anticipated. There are far more young people with disabilities living without any support. Especially in a place called Diasville up the West Coast where many people have intellectual disabilities which we can only at this stage put down to foetal alcohol syndrome.

Now we are going to have to do something dramatic as an intervention. I want to run some pilot projects in Mfuleni, in Vredenburg and in Diasville, but we have to test if they are sustainable and replicable across this province, because the resource implications are absolutely massive. They are absolutely massive and this again underscores ... [Interjections.] ... that we have to stop. We have to stop diseases that are preventable before people get them so that we can deal with the tragedy of children born with conditions that they were not in a position to prevent, whether it is alcohol addiction, whether it is unsafe sex, whether it is unhealthy eating habits. All of those things are absolutely critical like for example lack of exercise. We have to prevent the preventable diseases so that we have resources to spend on the unpreventable diseases.

Mr A M FIGLAN: Mr Deputy Speaker, what are the implications for the province of the funding of the pilot project?

The PREMIER: Well, we still have to work out the implications because we have to fund some pilot projects and see what they take. This is where some NGOs have been very helpful to us. The acute cases that we have discovered in this process have immediately been taken up into programmes, but it has implications for everything and we are going to look at the cost implications and see whether it is sustainable and is replicable and where the kind of resources can come from that we need.

Mr A M FIGLAN: Thank you, Madam Premier. Will the Premier recommend that

all provinces undertake such a disability project?

’n AGB LID: Sy kan mos nie ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

’n AGB LID: By watter forum?

The PREMIER: You know I think it is absolutely critical. If people with disabilities were as well organised and vocal as other lobby groups we would have focused on their needs and interests a long time ago. I do not like this principle that “the squeaky wheel gets the oil”, because often the wheels that squeak most are not the wheels most in need. I think that this government has got to focus on people who are not in a position to change their circumstances, who are certainly not in a position to have prevented their conditions, and that we should do everything we possibly can to support and help the hidden people, often hidden by their families out of fear and shame and ignorance, who live terrible lives without any opportunities at all. If we are talking about the open opportunity society for all, then these people particularly deserve our care and support as a government.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That brings us to the end of questions to the Premier without notice. We move on to statements by members, party statements, and I see the DA first. Hon member Ms Marais.

## **STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS**

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS (DA): Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Ons is almal



bewus van die verhoging in bendegegeweld wat jong kinders en polisielede se lewens eis. *Die Burger* het berig dat oor die laaste drie maande 100 moorde in Nyanga gepleeg is. In vergelyking met die 233 moorde wat die vorige finansiële jaar gekenmerk het, is die huidige moordtendens onrusbarend.

Die statistieke word deur die media en gemeenskappe as 'n noodroep om hulp onderskryf. Interessant word in die artikel genoem deur Johan Burger, 'n senior navorser by die Instituut vir Sekerheidstudies, dat bendes nie so 'n groot rol speel in Nyanga en Khayelitsha nie, maar wel drank. Luitenant Generaal Arno Lamoer stem saam met Johan Burger. Alkohol is 'n prominente faktor wat bydra tot die moorde, en veral oor naweke. Inwoners in Nyanga besoek sjebeens vir ontspanning. Volgens Luitenant Generaal Lamoer is van hierdie sjebeens onwettig. Die satelliet polisiekantoor in Nyanga is in aanbou en rondgaande eenhede moet help om die ewel hok te slaan. Volgens Luitenant Generaal Lamoer sal die polisie nie alleen die probleem die hoof kan bied nie. Hy sê voorts: “Die gemeenskap moet begin kyk na die maatskaplike ewels en hulle samewerking aan die polisie gee.” Dit is goed en wel, maar in Nyanga is die ratio ten opsigte van polisielede teenoor die aantal gemeenskapslede ver onder die ideaal. Dié feit en situasie moet dringend juis deur Generaal Lamoer en sy span aangespreek en opgelos word.

Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, die Departement van Maatskaplike Ontwikkeling het verskeie programme wat die sosiale ewels aanspreek. Een hiervan is 'n ouerleidingsprogram. Verantwoordelike ouerleiding is die kern van gesonde gemeenskappe. Deur middel van hierdie programme in samewerking met die gemeenskappe kan standhoudende verandering teweeggebring word, waardeur

gemeenskappe hulle eie probleme identifiseer en hulle eie oplossings vind. Dit is dan ook die verantwoordelikheid van die Departement van Maatskaplike Ontwikkeling om te monitor of daar werklike gedragsveranderinge plaasvind in gemeenskappe. Slegs deur middel van samewerking met verskillende rolspelers kan verandering teweeggebring word. Ek dank u. [Tyd verstreke.]

Ms L BROWN (ANC): Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. Two mothers, Ellen Pakkies and Venita Augul, mothers who have fought very hard against drugs and gangsterism on their own on the Cape Flats, represent thousands of mothers on the Cape Flats. The ANC notes with great concern that the DA leader Helen Zille once more snubbed the drug and gang-riddled Mitchells Plain on Tuesday by not attending an anti-crime drive lead by Police Minister, Nathi Mthethwa, as part of a renewed plan to fight and curb drug and gang violence on the Cape Flats.

Instead she sent footmen to the area and opted to stay indoors and fight the very police who have to walk the streets and bite the bullet while Premier Zille actively divides and puts people against the SAPS. Instead of backing our protectors in blue, she has instituted the Western Zille Commission to hunt and haunt the police. Instead of reigning in her community, the Community Safety MEC who fraternises with gangsters, she turns a blind eye.

The ANC thanks the national commissioner of Police, General Riah Phiyega, for coming to the Western Cape because she is serious about fighting gang wars and crime within this province. She does not account to us directly. She actually

accounts to national Parliament, but her commitment to every province is really commendable. The ANC says shame on you DA ... [Interjections.]

Mr H P GEYER: Ag, shame on the ANC!

Ms L BROWN: ...and its leader for reducing the crime drive to a media circus.

We need strong political leadership in the process, not cheap political points at the expense of Ellen Pakkies and Venita Augul and the mothers of this province. [Time expired.]

Me A ROSSOUW (DA): Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, kindermolestering is 'n skandvlek op die naam van ons gemeenskappe. Seksuele vergrype teen kinders is wêreldwyd besig om epidemiese afmetings aan te neem, ondanks daarvan dat dit ten sterkste deur die meeste gemeenskappe afgekeur word. Onlangs is 'n kinderpornografie-ring deur Kanada oopgeplek wat sy tentakels diep in ons land het. 'n Skoolhoof, opvoeders, 'n dokter en 'n regsman is gearresteer, almal in gerespekteerde beroepe. Na bewering gaan nog 50 arrestasies volg. Suid-Afrika het die grootste kindermishandelingsyfer ter wêreld. Verlede jaar is meer as 28 000 seksuele misdrywe teen kinders aangemeld en net 30% van hierdie slagoffers was jonger as 10 jaar. Wat die meeste ontstel is dat tussen 80 en 90% van die jong slagoffers die oortreders persoonlik ken, dus familie en vriende. Molestering vind op alle vlakke van die samelewing plaas en nie een gemeenskap se kinders ontglip hierdie walglike oortreding nie.

Die gebrek aan daadwerklike optrede en die feit dat slegs 5% tot 7% van alle

seksoortreders skuldig bevind word deur die hof, is die grootste enkele oorsaak daarvan dat 'n skamele 15% van die oortredings aangemeld word.

Die Nasionale Register vir Seksoortreders is reeds in 2007 in die lewe geroep, maar dit is na 7 jaar steeds nie gebruikersvriendelik nie. Dit is beslis nie in ons kinders se belang nie want organisasies wat met kinders werk soos skole, nasorgsentrums en hospitale het nie gereëlde toegang toe hierdie register nie. Die inligting word ook so daarin vervat dat dit die identiteit van die oortreder beskerm. Die onus rus op die seksoortreders om sy voornemende of huidige werkgewers of nuwe werkers van die skuldigbevinding in kennis te stel. Die Demokratiese Alliansie in die Wes-Kaap keur kinderpornografie ten sterkste af. Ouers moet daarop bedag wees dat seksoortreders wag dat hulle waaksaamheid vir 'n oomblik verslap. Ons kinders is ons grootste skatte. Hou seksoortreders weg van hulle af. Dankie.

Ms T N BEVU (COPE): Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. As much as we are agreeing that there is a need to urgently utilise available land for the rapidly growing housing needs of the city, especially around the Philippi horticultural area, we do not see why this should be done at the expense or threat to our food security. There is plenty of land around Cape Town that can be used for human settlement. Indeed, informal settlements in the Philippi horticultural area are growing. The largest of these, "Egoli" and "Jim se Bos" are about 20 years old. Cape Town's 2011 figures estimate that "Egoli" and "Jim se Bos" hold about 350 and 300 homes respectively. Both are on private land and the settlement keeps growing; encroaching on the farmland.

After due deliberation and studying carefully the research surveys done by the development organisation about the area, as Cope we strongly feel that rezoning is not the solution for this piece of agricultural land. Egoli's people are part of a significant portion of Cape Town residents who face food insecurity. Rezoning that land for housing will just compound their problems.

A 2012 study by Rooftops Canada, Agri International and the African Food Security Network that examined the horticultural area's significance in sustaining food security within the Cape Town municipality, found that without it the city would be placed at extreme risk of food insecurity, with low income households suffering the most.

A 2009 report commissioned by the city had similar findings. About 3,7-million people lived in Cape Town in 2010, which constituted 66% of the Western Cape's population, and the city's population has grown by 3% a year. A growing population will not only increase the demand for food, but also the need for housing and commercial development. We would urge the MEC for Local Government and Environmental Affairs to strongly consider the research warning about the Philippi horticultural area as a crucial part to the city's food security and particularly that of its poorest. About half of the carrots, cauliflower and lettuce supplied to the city come from Philippi.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Just finish off, your time has expired. The last sentence.

Ms T N BEVU: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The area also produces over 40 crops including coriander as well as cabbages and leeks. Philippi's proximity to Cape Town means the fresh produce can be delivered at a lower cost. [Time expired].

Ms V HANI (ANC): †Enkosi Somlomo. \*Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. †As we commemorate this important National Women's Month and the historic march by women against apartheid oppression and for their liberation on 9 August 1956 to the Union Buildings, the ANC has noted that the DA has no plan or programme to raise awareness about our women's plight and their quest for equality. This DA Government led by Premier Helen Zille ignores women issues and as a woman and a mother she runs away from her obligation to also give other women a chance to develop. Instead of leading the way to advance the cause of our women in the Western Cape, it is like we are going back to the bad old days of Cape slavery, bondage and exploitation. [Interjections.] This premier claims to come from a progressive background ... [Interjections.] ... but she seems oblivious to the struggle of our women and many attempts to raise this with her showed she is in denial and hiding behind meritocratic arguments of "fit for purpose". As we are also commemorating the fiftieth anniversary of American human rights activist Dr Martin Luther King delivering his famous "I have a dream" speech, the women in the Western Cape also say they have a dream of a free, fair and equal society, not the empty DA dream where poor people get inferior services, the "take it or leave it" of the DA. Women say to this DA and its leaders: "Stop the war on the poor and liberate the Cape!" [Interjections.] Like in 1956, the women of South

Africa tomorrow come to this Premier's office to bring demands ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Your time has expired. Just finish off, thank you.

Ms V HANI: Yes, to bring demands to her, if she does not once again, as usual, go into hiding. [Time expired.]

Mr J J VISSER (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is my privilege today to speak about the Public Service Commissioner. Since the appointment of the PSC in 2009 the relationship with the Western Cape Public Service Commissioner was a very rocky road and therefore engagement with the Commissioner was non-existent. Since the PSC's broad legal mandate is to promote basic values and principles of governing public administration in South Africa, to promote measures to ensure efficiency and effectiveness, to investigate, monitor, evaluate, give direction and advice around regarding personnel policies and practices, employee grievances and the organisation, administration and applicable procedures in the public service, it is important for the Western Cape Parliament to engage with them on a regular basis. Parliament then needs to establish a mechanism through which such engagement could happen.

The role and function of the Public Service Commissioner must be seen as part of the oversight structure and mechanisms of Parliament and should be utilised through a relevant standing committee.

The latest report of the Public Service Commission indicated good cooperation with all the departments of the Western Cape and that the Western Cape Public Service Commissioner's work is of the highest standard in South Africa.

En dan wil ek die agb lid me Witbooi net raad gee, sy moenie op hoorsê getuienis praat nie, Dit wat sy genoem het oor die Departement van Gesondheid is nie waar nie. Dit is bloot dat die Departement van Gesondheid 'n hoë verwysing het van griewe, maar nog steeds van die bestes in die land is.

'n AGB LID: Die hoogste.

Mr J J VISSER: But we still need to know what the standards of performance of the different departments are within the sphere of the Western Cape Province to be able to render oversight. The hon Speaker can maybe direct this function to the Standing Committee on Governance. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I do not see an ID representative in the House, so it is the DA next. Agb lid mnr Von Brandis.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker, many have voiced their objections to the province's liquor laws citing them as harsh. The economic impacts of more rigid trading hours have been labelled as detrimental to businesses coming in the form of losses in revenue or jobs. Another criticism is the belief that there is little correlation between sales times of alcohol and incidents of alcohol



and related harm and criminality.

Despite their criticisms of reducing liquor trading hours, an article by medical researchers in the *Cape Times* last week does in fact correlate the period of liquor sales and increased alcohol related incidents. One study, for instance, in a city in Brazil noted that new laws kerbing sales times resulted in a reduction in the City's murder rate by 106 per year.

In another, the removal of a ban on Sunday alcohol sales in New Mexico resulted in a 42% increase in alcohol related motor accidents. 130 people die every day in South Africa because of alcohol related causes. It is therefore only responsible to regulate the sale of alcohol and prevent abuse.

The Western Cape has also committed to reducing alcohol abuse by drivers. Roads are now safer thanks to the "safely home campaign", the name and shaming of drunk drivers and the anti-drunk driving war room in Athlone. Since inception the centre has processed over 17 000 suspected drunk drivers. Some hundred go through the centre every weekend.

Recently one of these 100 was Tony Yengeni! The Western Cape government should be commended for their efforts in combating the affects of abuse on and off the roads.

Mr M OZINSKY (ANC): Yesterday Scopa agreed to discuss the "the actions taken by the Western Cape Education Department to implement the recommendations

made in the Learner Transport Report”.

Mr M G E WILEY: And you walked out.

Mr M OZINSKY: Whilst this crucial audit report remains confidential and could not be quoted in the meeting, the ACDP chairperson of Scopa and the DA members including hon member Mr Wiley, agreed to this bizarre “Alice in Wonderland” situation, effectively giving the department the right to determine what Scopa can and cannot discuss, in the face of two legal opinions advising Scopa that the report should be made public.

Mr M G E WILEY: That is not true!

Mr M OZINSKY: The report is of extreme public interest ... [Interjections.] ... given that the department was in possession of it 6 months before a tragic school bus accident claimed the lives of 14 learners near Rheenendal. The report shows that the department was not checking the buses that were used to transport learners, in contravention of the agreements it had signed with service providers and that the department had effectively closed down the operations of the Bus Inspection Team since the DA took over the government. They did not even know which buses were being used on which routes.

At the time the DA government and MEC Carlisle publicly blamed, and illegally closed, a licensing testing station for the accident, without ever admitting that it was remiss in its own, that is the government’s own management of the learner

transport contracts. In a classic piece of media disinformation learnt from the comops of the apartheid regime, the DA government created a diversion to deflect attention away from its own responsibility in this accident.

Ironically the DA position in Scopa contradicts their position in the National Assembly where they argue that information in the public interest should be made public. This hypocrisy is a hallmark of the DA and its members. Yesterday in Scopa it was the hon member Mr Wiley who argued that the report should not be made public. However, two weeks ago the same hon member Mr Wiley, as chair of the Community Safety Committee, argued that the provincial Police commissioner should not be able to present a highly sensitive report on the staffing of police stations to the committee in camera. This is a report that could result in attacks on police, but he wants it discussed in public. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, just finish off please. Your time has expired.

Mr M OZINSKY: It is the last sentence.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, the last sentence, a short one.

Mr M OZINSKY: However, the hon member Mr Wiley argues that the report which would shed light on the deaths of 14 learners in the care of the Western Cape Education Department should remain secret. This is the hypocrisy which is a hallmark of the DA in the Western Cape. [Time expired.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Now you are just telling an untruth.

Mr G C R HASKIN (ACDP): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. On Tuesday the Standing Committee on Community Safety engaged the National Commissioner of SAPS and some of her top brass. The ACDP applauds this step taken by the standing committee and thanks General Phiyega for her thought-provoking participation.

Whilst there are several positives that came out of the engagement, the ACDP's ongoing concerns include that the SAPS, the Minister of Police and the Presidency refuses to call in the SANDF to assist SAPS as a peace-restoring force multiplier in the Manenberg community and in other gang hotspots as they will flare up in the future. Whilst they correctly explain that the long term solution lies in social and economic cluster interventions and civil society partnerships, they conveniently forget that gangsterism is generations old and that their inability or unwillingness to address gangsterism since 1994 has allowed it to worsen to the detriment of the communities the gangs have been allowed to flourish in. SAPS' pride that they do not need the army's help is endangering our people.

The ACDP is disappointed that SAPS after more than a year have still not analysed the census statistics and finalised obvious and urgent staff establishment increases for SAPS in the Western Cape. [Interjections.] Their lack of concern or urgency in this regard is telling, as under-rag-staffed at SAPS stations across the Province will continue to under-deliver indefinitely while SAPS drags their feet, again to the detriment of our people.

The South Africa Reserve Police Service policy places an unfortunate limitation that unemployed citizens cannot become reservists, even when they meet all the other criteria. It is evident that this limitation is based on a dangerous blanket assumption that because some very few reservists were previously found guilty of theft out of SAPS stations and collusion, all unemployed reservists will do the same.

What about unemployed, job-seeking graduates who want to become reservists? What about those who had previously been employed and who have become recently unemployed and that has got nothing to do with moral compass problems or work ethic challenges?

What about the millions of youth who have never been able to find employment but who are honest, trustworthy and reliable and who meet all the other requirements of being a reservist? Crucially it is a dangerous, defamatory and inaccurate to assume that all unemployed South Africans cannot be trusted to be SAPS reservists. [Time expired.]

Mr A M FIGLAN (DA): Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. South Africa is sitting on a double-edged sword. Should a concerted effort be made to address the urgent housing needs of the overall population, but at the risk of needing constant repairs or should the focus be turned towards the supply of quality housing?

Informal settlements are mushrooming around our cities and towns. Nationally the population stands at 53 million people. Our province has grown to 5.8 million people. Housing programmes have not been able to address the demands due to urbanisation and population growth as well as legislative red tape, and the current housing backlog has grown by 40%.

In an attempt to meet the housing demand 3.3 million low-cost houses have been built since 1994. However, 80% of these houses are already in need of repairs at an estimated cost of R 59-billion. This repair tag is just too big, especially when one considers that the Western Cape alone needs R 22,5 billion to address the yearly housing increment.

Problems arising from low-cost housing include cracked walls, loose bricks and leaking roofs. Communities have shown their growing dissent over perceived poor levels in service delivery in housing due to the use of emerging contractors, various degrees of corruption, poor planning and monitoring. Critics accuse the housing strategy of lack and inadequate defined roles and responsibilities of all role players in the housing sector.

The Western Cape Department of Human Settlements will provide 12 341 quality homes to its citizens during this financial year. Its professional teams are ready to assist the housing projects across the province with advice and expertise.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Figlan, your time has expired. Please finish off.

Mr A M FIGLAN: A golden midway should be found between sustainable and long-term housing developments that focus on quality homes for the people of the Western Cape. Thank you. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That brings us to the end of statements by members. We move on to motions.

### **MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek gee kennis dat ek sal voorstel:

Dat die Huis die welstand en werksomstandighede van gesondheidswerkers in die Wes-Kaap Provinsie bespreek.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie, kennis word geneem. Agb lid Me Prins.

Ms E PRINS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses Premier Helen Zille's lack of political will to act decisively on the misconduct of the Swellendam DA Mayoral Committee member who allegedly viewed child pornography in council time and on council equipment, thereby flouting the code of conduct for councillors.

*[Notice of motion as given by member.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Kennis word geneem. Is daar verdere? Geen verder nie?  
Geen verder? Nobody? Hon member Mr Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the evictions of the poor residents from their homes  
in Bishop Lavis by the City of Cape Town.

*[Notice of motion as given by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Ms Marais.

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek gee kennis dat ek sal  
voorstel:

Dat die Huis die gereedheid van die provinsie ten opsigte van rampbestuur  
bespreek.

*[Kennisgewing van voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Kennis geneem. Any further? Hon member Ms Gopie?

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the failure of the Western Cape Provincial  
Government in implementing a solution to the gang violence on the Cape Flats.

*[Notice of motion as given by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Any further? Agb lid Me Witbooi.

Ms J WITBOOI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:



That the House discusses MEC Donald Grant's wastage of taxpayer's money as he applied for leave to appeal against the judgment that seventeen poor black schools remain open.

*[Notice of motion as given by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, notice taken. Any further? Hon member Ms Magwaza?

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the inferior services at the Helderberg Hospital in Somerset West where mothers are forced to sit on the floor with their premature babies as they wait in long queues.

*[Notice of motion as given by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice has been taken of that. Any further?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the failure and refusal on the part of the DA to render proper services to the poor and the working class of the Western Cape.

*[Notice of motion as given by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken. [Interjections.] Order! Are there any further? If not then we proceed. Hon member Mr Ozinsky.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses and condemns the actions of the DA and ACDP members in Scopa as undermining the mandate of Scopa in the legislature as set out in Sections 114 and 115 of the Constitution which states:

- (2) (a) To ensure that all provincial executive organs of state in the province are accountable to it; and
- (b) To maintain oversight of –
  - the exercise of the provincial executive authority in the province, including the implementation of legislation; and
  - any provincial organ of state;

by allowing the Western Cape Education Department to report on the actions it has taken to implement the recommendations made in the learner transport audit report without the report being made public.

*[Notice of motion as given by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice is taken of that. Any further, hon member Mr Haskin?

Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates SAPS responsiveness to community challenges in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of motion as given by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice is taken. Hon member Ms Magwaza.

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the poor working conditions and lack of medical staff in the Western Cape Department of Health.

*[Notice of motion as given by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that. Any further? The last time? Nothing? Then we continue. Are there any motions without notice? Hon member Mr Wiley?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice is taken. Hon member Ms Magwaza.

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the poor working conditions and lack of medical staff in the Western Cape Department of Health.

*[Notice of motion as given by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken of that. Any further? The last time? Nothing? Then we continue. Are there any motions without notice? Hon member Mr Wiley?

## **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

**LATE JEREMY HOOP AND MONIQUE PORTLAND**

(Motion of condolence)

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its deepest sympathy to the families of Sergeant Jeremy Hoop and Constable Monique Portland, both of the Kuilsriver Police Station, who were tragically killed in a vehicle accident while on duty over the weekend.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Mbalo.

### **LATE CHRISTIAN MORRIS**

(Motion of condolence)

Ms B G MBALO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family of the eight month old baby, Christian Morris of Philippi, who was thrown into a fire by a relative and killed.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I take it there is no objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

### **HULP AAN STORMGETEISTERDE MENSE**

(Kennisgewing van voorstel)

Mnr J J VISSER: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die relevante owerhede en amptenary sterkte toewens met hul taak om in hierdie ekstreme weerstoestande hul werk te doen om mense wat aan nat en koue blootgestel is te help.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennis nie? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie?

Goedgekeur.

### **LATE VERONICA ABRAHAMS AND RIEDEWAAN SLINGERS**

(Motion of condolence)

Ms V HANI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family and friends of a mother, Veronica Abrahams and her four-year old child, Riedewaan Slingers, who died in a shack fire in Parkwood.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion without notice?  
No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

**WYLE PEARL VAN ZYL**

(Roubeklagvoorstel)

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis empatie betoon teenoor die gesin en familie van 'n voormalige raadslid van die Stad Kaapstad, Pearl Van Zyl, wat gisteraand oorlede is.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie, geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing nie? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie? Geen beswaar nie?

Goedgekeur.

**LATE IAN BLECHER**

(Motion of condolence)

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family, friends and colleagues of the University of Cape Town student, Ian Blecher, who died as he fell from the mountain in Cape Town.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion without notice?  
No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

**WYLE LINDA TITUS**

**(Roubeklagvoorstel)**

Me A ROSSOUW: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy medelye betoon met Mnr Danny Titus, Uitvoerende Direkteur van die ATKV, sy gesin en familie en vriende met die heengaan van sy eggenoot Linda Titus op Woensdag 28 Augustus na 'n lang stryd teen limfoomkanker. Linda was van Genadendal in die Overberg en het in Crawford grootgeword.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennis nie? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie?

Goedgekeur.

**LENTEGEUR POLICE STATION**

**(Motion)**

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the National Minister of Police, Nathi Mthethwa, for opening the Lenteguur Police Station in Mitchells Plain.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

**WYLE NEIL JOUBERT**

(Roubeklagvoorstel)

Mnr M C WALTERS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy meegevoel betuig met die gesin, familie en vriende van die oud wynmaker, Neil Joubert, wat Maandagoggend 27 Augustus 2013 in die ouderdom van 79 op sy plaas Klein Simonsvlei op Simondium naby die Paarl oorlede is. Hy sal onthou word as 'n gemeenskapsmens en 'n puik wynmaker.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie agb lid. Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennis nie? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie?

Goedgekeur.

## **DISTRICT SIX HOUSING ALLOCATIONS**

(Motion of congratulations)

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the 70 residents of District Six who received the keys to their homes from the National Minister of Rural Development and Land Reform, Gugile Nkwinti, after having been forcefully removed by apartheid's Group Areas Act.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.



## **AGRI MEGA GROEP BLOMME-UITSTALLING**

(Voorstel van gelukwense)

Mnr M C WALTERS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die Agri Mega Groep voorspoed toewens met die eerste Kaapse Blommeryk-uitstalling wat vandag by Mega Park op Bredasdorp geopen is. Daar sal waardevolle biodiversiteitsverwante inligting aan blomkykers, botanici en belangstellendes oorgedra word.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennis nie? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie?

Goedgekeur.

## **HORIZON PLACE OF SAFETY: ESCAPE FROM**

(Motion)

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that a thirteen year old young offender broke out of juvenile centre Horizon Place of Safety in Mfuleni.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie. Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennis nie? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie?

Goedgekeur.

**ROSALIE NYMAN, DIANE DAVIS, NOLWAZI BONGWANA**

**AND KATE SAVAGE**

(Motion of congratulations)

Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the four women who have been short-listed by the Judicial Service Commission as candidates for the judicial vacancy at the Western Cape High Court. They are advocates Rosalie Nyman and Diane Davis of the Cape Bar and attorneys Nolwazi Bongwana and Kate Savage.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

**LACK OF COMPUTERS AT LAVIS RAND PRIMARY SCHOOL**

(Motion)

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that the teachers of Lavis Rand Primary School in Bishop Lavis are forced to use computers at neighbouring schools after theirs were stolen.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

An HON MEMBER: They find it funny.

An HON MEMBER: It is terrible that they were stolen.

An HON MEMBER: It is a joke!

An HON MEMBER: It is terrible that they were stolen!

Mr J J VISSER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Please continue.

Mr J J VISSER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the master whisky distiller, Andy Watts, who produced the Bains Cape Mountain Whisky at the James Sedgwick's Distillery at Wellington, which won the award for the world's best grain whisky at the 2013 World Whisky Awards held in London. This whisky pays tribute to Andrew Geddes Bain who built the Bains Kloof Pass near Wellington in 1853.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

## **LILIZELA TOURISM AWARDS**

(Motion of congratulations)

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its congratulations to the Western Cape's 15 nominees who will compete in the first ever Department of Tourism's Lilizela Tourism Awards on 12 September 2013. We wish them all the best of luck.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

## PREGNANCIES AT ALBERTINIA HIGH SCHOOL

(Motion)

Ms B G MBALO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that during this year 13 learners have fallen pregnant at the Albertinia High School in Albertinia, seven of whom have been intimidated and prematurely forced to leave the school as a result.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

•

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

## WYLE ANNIE NHLAMBINI

(Roubeklagvoorstel)

Me E PRINS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy medelye oordra aan die Nhlambini gesin wie onlangs hulle moeder raadslid, Annie Nhlambini, 'n dienende ANC raadslid in die Langeberg-munisipaliteit na 'n kort siekbed verloor het.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennis nie? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie?

Goedgekeur.

**ANDREW CHIN, RAM BARKAI, RYAN STAMROOD AND TOKS VIVIERS**

(Motion of congratulations)

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulate four Capetonians, Andrew Chin, Ram Barkai, Ryan Stamrood and Toks Viviers who with other swimmers successfully swam across the Baring Strait, the sea that separates Russia from the United States. This is the first time that humans have managed to cross this icy and rough sea that is 82 kilometres across from point to point.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion without notice?

No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

**ROSH HASHANAH CELEBRATIONS**

(Motion)

Mr H P GEYER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House wishes a blessed Rosh Hashanah to the Jewish Community in the Western Cape. Rosh Hashanah commences on the evening of 4 September and concludes on the evening of 6 September. May this New Year be one of health, peace and happiness for you and your families. Ketiva Ve-chatima tova. May you be written and sealed for a good year!

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion without notice? No objection

to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

**KAROOLS PAULSE**

(Voorstel van gelukwense)

Mnr H P GEYER: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis mnr Karools Paulse van Mouton-boerdery in Citrusdal gelukwens wat as die plaaswerker van die jaar vir die Olifantstreek aangewys is.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennis nie? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie?

Goedgekeur.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Is daar enige verder? Any further? For the last time? Then we've come to the end of the business for the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:25.