

---

THURSDAY, 28 SEPTEMBER 2023

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid Sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

**BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

The SPEAKER: Please be seated.

Before we proceed, hon members I would like to remind you of some of the logistical arrangements. As has been our practice to date, hon members will participate in the Sitting of the House both from here in the Chamber with the Presiding Officer and Table staff and via Microsoft Teams. Our Standing Rules have accordingly been amended to accommodate such hybrid Sittings of the House.

Hon members experiencing challenges in connecting to the Sitting are requested to contact the WCPP ICT Colleagues who will assist to resolve their connectivity challenges.

The quorum requirements for the Sittings are provided for in the Constitution and the Standing Rules. Hon members, unless there is an indication of unanimous concurrence, voting will be confined to members present in the House and on the hybrid system, who are entitled to cast their votes as per the ATC issued on the 11 August 2020.

Members present in the Chamber and via Microsoft Teams have all the privileges and immunities imparted by law. The Serjeant-at-Arms will record members' attendance and in instances, hon members, where directives do not cover a particular eventuality the Standing Rules must apply, and in instances where these Rules cannot be applied the ruling by the Presiding Officer is final.

Members, all microphones have been muted. However, for those hon members participating in the Sitting of the House via Microsoft Teams, you are requested to use the raise-hand functionality of the system when you desire to raise a point of order and I will recognise you.

When a hon member in the Chamber wishes to raise a point of order such a hon member may address the Presiding Officer as expected, but must mute their microphones when they have completed speaking.

Hon members are requested to please ensure that their microphones are unmuted when the Presiding Officer recognises them and, when they are done speaking, to please mute their microphones.

Hon members participating in this Sitting of the House via Microsoft Teams are requested not to sign into Microsoft Teams on more than one device. Hon members, the media have also been granted access to this Microsoft Teams meeting as guests of the WCPP. However, members of the press may not use the chatroom or speak or activate their cameras while the Sitting is in progress. If an individual, who is not a member of this House, activates their microphone and video camera, such an individual member will be exited from the Sitting immediately.

Hon members, I also wish that those who are here today who are not members of the House to please observe the decorum of the House.

Hon members, for this Sitting, Language Translation Services are available in the Chamber as usual and on Microsoft Teams via the respective channels. And lastly, hon members, I wish to remind you that no interjections are permitted during these hybrid Sittings and to this end I wish to draw your attention to Rule 40 of our Standing Rules.

Hon members, with that being said, I recognise the Chief Whip.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP: Thank you, hon Speaker, I move:

That notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 20(1), that precedence be given to the Subject for Discussion. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Chief Whip. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved? No objections? Agreed to.

We will now deal with the Subject for Discussion in the name of the hon D Plato as printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Plato.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

## **SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION**

*The impact of SASSA's inability to process payments  
efficiently on social security in the Western Cape*

Mr D PLATO: Thank you, hon Speaker, for the opportunity to once again talk about this SASSA problem that just does not want to go away. Non-payment of social grants is a serious issue and because, Speaker, this SASSA problem causes so many families, hundreds of thousands of families to suffer at the hand of this SASSA problem, and the ANC Government does not know how

to address this problem. They rather see that this problem persists that our poor and vulnerable people continue to suffer rather than to find sustainable solutions.

Speaker, organisations such as Black Sash and Open Secrets warned there was a crisis brewing in the administration and payment of social grants. They questioned why SASSA and the Post Office had made Post Bank, which already had the reputation for technical difficulties, the preferred partner to take over the administration of social grant payments.

Earlier this month, well over 600 000 vulnerable people, already at the mercy of poverty, could not receive their social grants as a result of what SASSA called "a system glitch" – an absolute disaster for someone who only has that money to rely on every month.

Speaker, what we experienced is a Government unshaken by the plight of those forced to find a way to feed themselves and pay for electricity until the glitch was resolved. The so-called glitch is a glitch far too many. How disgusting!

What happened was a clear sign of a Government's complete incompetence. For many, it means a three-week waiting period for the glitch to be rectified. Many people, including columnist Ebrahim Harvey argues that there is no Government Department whose glaring inefficiencies, incompetence and mismanagement have hurt and harmed poor and vulnerable people – the

overwhelming majority of recipients to receive these grants – more than the Department of Social Development.

SASSA's system quite often failed the public. If this is how the National Department of Social Development often treats the public, and in this case the poor and, Speaker, let me say they treat them with utter disgust, and listen to this, hon Speaker, and on top of it all, sending back to National Treasury millions, billions of rands, it is said about R15 billion. Then there is a figure of about R5 to R6 billion, but it does not matter. The figure, hon Speaker, is immaterial; the fact of the matter is that billions of rands were sent back to National Treasury. It is a clear sign of not knowing what to do with the budget, what to do with the money, no plan in place for the poorest of the poor.

I want to take it further to say no plan in place for the Minister of Social Development's own poor people of this country. Let them suffer. Let them wait for their money. That is actually what the Minister and her department are saying, and because of no plan in place, just send the money back. The best way of defeating the poorest of the poor and hope the problem will go away. Proper leadership, proper management is at the root cause of this problem. No leadership from the Minister and her chief directors. The Minister and the Department of Social Development, are supposed to use every cent of the budget to uplift the poorest of the poor. No vision, no plan on how to address poverty and disadvantage issues in South Africa. Because of no plan in place we just send back the billions of rands and do not use it

where we need to use the monies most. How can you do that to the poorest of the poor and then we want the poorest of the poor to come and vote for us.

[Interjections.]

AGBARE LEDE: Skande! Skande!

HON MEMBERS: Disgrace! Disgrace!

Mr D PLATO: And, hon Speaker, I want to say this very softly...

[Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: The poorest are still...

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr D PLATO: I want to say it very softly, hon Speaker, to hell with the poorest in need of the money. [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Ja, there you are saying that.

Mr D PLATO: Elderly and poor people for days without food. Can we allow this to continue in this new South Africa? The Minister and her top management showed their incompetence to lead the Department of Social Development effectively and efficiently. Our elderly and disabled and disadvantaged recipients deserve much, much better from this National Government... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr D PLATO: And to lie to the public that all recipients have been paid while hundreds of thousands of recipients visit the banks and Post Bank just to return empty handed, no money available for them.

Hon Speaker, the National Minister of Social Development is a shame for the disadvantaged public out there. She is a shame for the country as a whole. Speaker, I therefore call on President Cyril Ramaphosa to remove Minister Zulu from that position. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members. Order!

'n AGBARE LID: Skande!

An HON MEMBER: Digrace!

Mr D PLATO: I ask for the removal of the National Minister of Social Development immediately. She does not deserve that position because she does not know how to look after the poorest of the poor. [Interjections.]

The Democratic Alliance lodged a complaint with the South African Human Rights Commission to investigate the issues around social grant payments as a matter of urgency, I thank you, Speaker. [Applause.]



The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Applause.] Order members. Order!  
Thank you very much, hon Plato. I recognise hon Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you very much, Speaker. Am I audible?

The SPEAKER: You are indeed audible, hon member.

†Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you very much. Somlomo. Namhlanje ndima phambi kwale ndlu ibekileyo ndinentliziyo ebuhlungu ngenxa yembandazelo abantu bakuthi abazifumene bekuyo ngenxa yokungaphumeleli kwentlawulo yesibonelelo sikarhulumente kwinyanga kaSeptemba. Abantu abakuthi ngabona abahluphekileyo nabaxhomekeke kwisibonelelo sikarhulumente ukuze bagxothwe ikati eziko. Bazifumene ubomi babo buyinkxwaleko emveni kongukawzi ukufumana le ntlawulo ekuqaleni kwale nyanga.

Ndima ngokuzithoba phambi kwabo futhi ndixolisa kakhulu ngemeko abazifumene bekuyo. Ndiyaqonda kananjalo ukuba ithemba labo kumbutho kwezolonke liye levavanywa ngokugqithiseleyo ngenxa yesihlelo. Imali yesibonelelo urhulumente ebezibathale ngethuba kodwa kuye kwakhna iingxaki zobuxhakaxhaka bale mihla kwaPost Bank nento leyo ethi yachaphazela ukubhatalwa kwezi mali. Urhulumente weANC uyathembisa ukuba uzokuzama ngandlela zonke ukuba ingaze iphinde yehle le ngxaki.

[Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you very much, Speaker. Today I stand before this honourable house with all humility and shame for the suffering

our people have undergone when they did not receive their government monthly payment in the month of September on time. Black people are the ones who are affected the most by poverty and they are reliant on the government monthly payment in order to get a basic meal. They really suffered when they did not get their monies at the end of this month. I stand before them with all humility and I apologise sincerely for the struggle they have had to endure. I also realise that the faith they have put in the ruling party has been tested beyond their belief because of this event. The monthly pensions were paid on time, but there were issues with the technology and network at Post Bank. That caused a problem in the timeous payout. The ANC government promises that it will try by all means that this problem never occurs again.]

Hon Speaker, the September payment failure which led to the difficulties faced by around 600 000 of grant beneficiaries was a result of a technical glitch in the Post Bank payment system; a system upon which the livelihoods of 6.3 million people depends, in August. The Post Bank underwent a migration to a new payment system designed to connect with the Bank Safe Africa Platform and processed transactions through the Integrated Grant Payment System. No-one could anticipate the havoc this migration would cause on the lives of fellow citizens.

Speaker, while noting that the Subject for Discussion for this debate is incorrectly framed as SASSA's inability to process payment efficiently on Social Security in the province, it is our responsibility to correct the

misconception and convey the correct information to our people.

On SASSA's side all social grantwork disbursed on time into beneficiary's bank accounts as has always been the case. Unfortunately, one of the 21 banks used by SASSA to disburse social grants, which serves around 35% of SASSA's clients, encountered difficulties on Monday and Tuesday, September 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup>. Funds were deducted from Post Bank accounts but were not automatically reversed when withdrawals failed, leaving many clients unable to access their money, forcing them to take loans just to put food on their tables.

To rectify this situation a manual process was implemented to reverse these transactions. I am pleased to report that the majority of these accounts have now been corrected, with failed withdrawals credited back to their accounts. However, due to the manual processes involved, there may still be a few beneficiaries indeed in need of assistance. Many beneficiaries were faced and added with the burden of taking loans to travel to local offices for assistance and Post Bank and SASSA Call Centres were overwhelmed by the influx of calls, complaints and balance inquiries, which led to longer waiting times for assistance. In response, SASSA and the Post Bank increased resources and capacity to handle the increased workload, including extended office hours in high demand areas and off-site handling through outreach programmes.

The South African Reserve Bank also intervened by appointing an

administrator along with a team of technical experts to assist this difficult situation. The Post Bank has since given assurances that it is better prepared and such situation is unlikely to occur again. I implore all hon members to convey the message to their constituencies that beneficiaries still facing families should contact the Post Bank Call Centre at 0800535455, send a WhatsApp message 0738061631 or email... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: [PPBbalancingSaswitch@Postbank.co.za](mailto:PPBbalancingSaswitch@Postbank.co.za) with their identity documents and card number. Furthermore, I call for community mobilisation led by the Provincial Government, working with stakeholders and civil society to enhance the province's disaster preparedness.

If the DA-led Government really cared for the poor it could have stepped into the database of all affected social grant beneficiaries in the province and provided for them in the form of food parcels or vouchers they could use at any of the retail stores.

I urge Premier Winde and MEC Fernandez to ask Provincial Social Development officials to gather this database to ensure that our province will never again be caught unprepared in the face of such disaster. We must unite across all party affiliation and rally behind our fellow citizens during the times of difficulties.

Hon Speaker, it is not the first time that this agreement between the Post Bank and its service providers led to technical glitches that inconvenienced the poor people. It is with a heavy heart that I recall a similar incident in February 2021 that affected over 120 000 beneficiaries nationally.

I therefore call upon the National Government to expedite efforts to address the longstanding disagreement between the Post Bank and service providers for access to the integrated grant payment system. A dispute that dates back to 2018, we cannot allow the suffering of our people to persist because of bureaucratic disputes. The Post Bank must also accelerate its effort to create its own system, ensuring stability and security of our social grant payments.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bakubaku-Vos, your time has expired. Can you please conclude.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Social security is the bedrock upon which the dignity and wellbeing of our people rest. The ANC National Government remains committed to this ideal as led by President Nelson Mandela when he said ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon Klaas.

Mr T KLAAS: Thank you, Speaker.

In view of the impact of SASSA's inability to process payments especially on Social Security in the Western Cape, the Economic Freedom Fighters would like to take this opportunity to condemn the National Department of Communication and Digital Technology and the Department of Social Development together with their agencies, Post Bank and the South African Social Security Agency, SASSA, for the hardship and the pain they caused the South African senior citizens and the persons with a disability, which solely depend on social grants for their daily livelihoods.

This was followed by disaster, which took place earlier this month, which resulted in thousands of social grant beneficiaries being left stranded, as they could not access their current payments from ATMs and retail outlets as a result of some glitch from the Post Bank Payment System. This latest disaster comes as no surprise, as well, and note that the Post Office and Post Bank are going through a state of dysfunctionality and collapse at the hands of the politicians and administrators who have no clue as to what they are doing and what their job description are. A government system that fails an elder and those living with disability, equates to a failed and hopeless Government which does not respect the rights of dignity of our people.

If a Government cannot take care of the vulnerable, then all of us are in trouble and we are a time-ticking bomb that can explode at any given time, or

is imminent. It is not enough for the Department and their entities to just offer an apology when we all know that it was bound to happen due to the collapse of the Post Office and the Post Bank. There is nothing more sad than seeing elderly people and those living with disabilities stranded at ATMs and they out of confusion tell that they do not know how they will afford transport money to return back to their homes or where their next meal will come from. The pain and the suffering bestowed upon these vulnerable people of our society, it is painful and there is also suffering.

The majority of our adult pensioners already carried the burden as they catered for sharing these monies with the rest of their families and dependents, as we stay in a country with high unemployment. These social grants, little as they are, I used to buy groceries, clothing and pay rates of household. So the delayed payments, even by a little day, can have an untold catastrophic consequence for their family.

As the EFF we call upon the Department of Social Development and all those involved to make sure that a disaster of this magnitude never occurs again. Thank you.

Mnr P J MARAIS: Hoor, hoor!

Mr P J MARAIS: Hear, hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Klaas. Thank you very much. I now recognise the hon Kaizer-Philander. Order members!

The CHIEF WHIP: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Speaker, on 8 September 2023 the Democratic Alliance in the Western Cape lodged a formal complaint with the South African Human Rights Commissioner against the National Minister of Social Development.

This complaint was lodged on behalf of the people of the Western Cape and pertains to the gross negligence on the part of the National Minister, Lindiwe Zulu, to safeguard the socio-economic rights of SASSA grant beneficiaries in the Western Cape, specifically in regard to the provision of social security benefits.

Hon Speaker, last week we saw the ANC in this House objecting to a motion delivered in this instance, which is appalling and shocking to say the least. Hon Speaker, this complaint is grounded in the constitutional framework of South Africa, notably Section 27 of the Constitution, which explicitly affirms the entitlement of every African citizen to essential socio-economic rights, including, but not limited to, the access to healthcare, sufficient clean water and food and social security.

It is clear that the ANC in the Western Cape and nationally, regrettably, do not recognise or want to acknowledge that Minister Zulu has demonstrated a consistent pattern of inadequacy and delay in delivering the requisite social security assistance.



Hon Speaker, it is worth noting that the delayed disbursements of SASSA grants have become an enduring issue that has adversely impacted our grant beneficiaries for a prolonged period. Minister Zulu's and the ANC's persistent failure to effectively address and rectify these recurring problems has exacerbated the hardships faced by the beneficiaries month after month and year after year. Speaker, it is also very noticeable that the ANC in this House and nationally do not care.

In some communities, receiving SASSA may be seen as a diminishing term and level in society. It seems from the ANC's approach to this matter they beg not to differ and that says a lot of what they think about our people, otherwise they would have ensured that this matter receives the urgent and important attention it deserves. In the light of this protracted and unacceptable state of affairs, the Democratic Alliance in the Western Cape has taken the proactive step of bringing this matter to the attention of the SAHRC and the purpose of this step is not political sensationalism. It is an action to demand accountability from Minister Zulu for her and the ANC's dereliction of duty in relation to grant beneficiaries in the Western Cape. It is however, believed that her actions or rather the lack thereof have caused significant harm and distress to those vulnerable citizens and their families who rely on social security benefits for their wellbeing and this warrants an investigation and remediation by the SAHRC.

Hon Speaker, if the ANC in this House or the man that is supposed to lead this country, President Cyril Ramaphosa, had any regard for the vulnerable

people of the Western Cape and elsewhere, Lindiwe Zulu would have been fired by now.

Well, I believe that the people that are suffering because of this, they will fire the ANC in 2024, because this can simply not continue. It is unnecessary that our parents and grandparents, whom by their hard work and commitment built this country, must now be dependent on loan sharks on a monthly basis to keep them from starvation.

Speaker, we learn from our elders. You pay your food.

†Jy betaal jou begrafnisboekie, jou *rent*, jou ligte. [You pay your funeral booklet, your rent, your lights.]

And you buy food. The ANC Government makes it impossible for its citizens to even afford the most basic necessities. They were afforded the opportunity to govern this country. They proved that they are unable and they have to vacate.

†Want so swaar kan ons mense nie kry nie! [Because our people cannot suffer like that!]

†Die ADJUNKHOOFSWEEP: Sê vir hulle!

[The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP: Tell them!]

The CHIEF WHIP: Speaker, it is important for the citizens of the Western Cape to know that a key focus of the DA Social Development policy is to provide higher levels of support to those in need and not doing away with the grants as the ANC propagates in their campaign gimmicks, but also to ensure that the pool of grant recipients is continuously shrinking.

En Speaker, hoe sal dit gebeur? And Speaker, how will this happen?

How will this happen? By ensuring that people are put in a position to stand on their own two feet instead of being stuck in a cycle of dependence on the State.

Speaker, this is how the DA will build a resilient society in 2024 by emphasising rights and reciprocal responsibilities, the obligation of one dependent upon the obligation of the other, providing for a socio-economic floor, by ensuring that basic social security guarantees are met and that they are secured, by promoting the general welfare and wellbeing of the population, in particular the vulnerable individuals and group.

†Agbare Speaker, die rede hoekom Suid-Afrika in so 'n groot gemors is, is omdat die ANC uit voeling is met die werklikheid in ons gemeenskappe. As dit was dat hulle sien 'n bejaarde staan drieuur in die oggend op om SASSA-kantore toe te gaan en dan terug te keer sonder 'n oplossing sou hulle beter gedoen het, agbare Speaker. [Hon Speaker, the reason why South Africa is in such a great mess, is because the ANC is out of touch with the reality of our

communities. If it was that they saw an aged person getting up at three o'clock in the morning to go to the SASSA offices, and then return without a solution, they would have done better, hon Speaker.]

While the member of the ANC in this House, hon Bakubaku-Vos, refers our residents to a WhatsApp number and to an email address, where must the people get the data money from while they do not even have money for bread? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The CHIEF WHIP: Hon Speaker, the Democratic Alliance in 2024 is on a mission, on a mission of building a resilient society. I thank you, Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Kaizer-Philander. I now recognise the hon De Villiers.

Mr P T DE VILLIERS: Thank you, Speaker. I am hoping that this will be one of the debates that we can all agree on. The devastation and trauma caused to our grant recipients this past month when the payments were not received on time, is shocking, unacceptable, and must not be repeated. The Post Bank, the National Minister and the Department must take the blame. The National Minister has consistently been warned of the pending disaster if the glitches identified in the past were not addressed. What makes this worse is that

these are our most vulnerable citizens. Most of them are 100% dependent on pittance on the amount to survive and for them to have to wait for an extra day past the payment date, is too much.

What happened this month is inexcusable and criminal. Most of the recipients depend on this money to live on from day-to-day. When this is not adhered to, it can turn their world upside down. Some had no choice but to approach banks and loan sharks with a 60% or more interest rate. We cannot allow for this situation to repeat itself. Systems must be put in place to prevent this from ever happening again. GOOD is calling for assistance to be given to beneficiaries to have their payments changed to the conventional bankers, as it would seem as if the Post Bank was unable and incapable of handling the disbursement of these funds, I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Villiers. I now recognise the hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, SASSA's inability to process payments efficiently on social grants in the Western Cape is inexcusable, indefensible and simply outrageous.

Speaker, we can debate this, but the blame must surely go to the National Minister, Minister Zulu and the ANC. We must ask ourselves the question, and the question is, is it because of the incompetent ANC, or was it a deliberate manoeuvre from the ANC playing games with the livelihood of the

most vulnerable? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Speaker, the ANC is so conniving that they threaten the defenceless, the most insecure to say to them, "If you do not vote for us in 2024 your grant will be removed." [Interjections.]

That is what they say. Well, Speaker, let me say, the ANC made their biggest mistake because the voters will punish them in 2024. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Let me say this, the ANC will receive a single digit figure in 2024 in the Western Cape and that is less than 10%. [Interjections.]  
Let me say further, speaking to the people on the streets, on the road... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...asking them the hardship that they endure and they are pointing fingers at Cyril Ramaphosa, the President of this country that is failing the most vulnerable, the most insecure and people that need the bit of grants that they receive. Speaker, in conclusion, I want to say, the previous speakers mentioned this. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Do you know, people that go for money day after day with no communication, hoping that there is money, there was no money.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Your pension must... and not getting anything.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: And now they must pay loan sharks because they had to provide to the families. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Christians, your time has expired. Thank you very much, hon Christians. I now recognise the hon Marais. [Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, it is obvious listening to all the discussions here that the ANC's rule is the glitch in our country, not SASSA. ANC is the glitch and the people who voted ANC are all worse off today, and they should wake up. The majority of Black people in this country have allowed themselves to be led by intellectually bankrupt and chronically corrupt leaders. They are expected to live off food parcels like beggars. Democracy allows people the freedom to elect their own leaders and this we did, but I asked the question of this House: why must those people, SASSA grantees who refuse to vote ANC in five elections, why must they also be ruled by the ANC? Why must they suffer under ANC misrule, since 1994, why must minorities be forced to submit to the will of poor governance of the

majority? It is time to break the change of rule by the majority.

[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: The same DA that wants only R1 800.

The SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr P J MARAIS: It is time for minorities to stand up and claim their right of self-determination. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr P J MARAIS: Dr Walter Terblanche, Virginia Peterson and Mr De Grass were my Department when I was Minister of Social Services and the Western Cape ran our own SASSA grants in the Western Cape. We did the payouts. Why was that stopped? We did a good job! We let the money be paid directly into our bank account and we arranged payments of it. It can happen again.

The ANC is death to the suffering of the poor, whether you are White, Coloured or Indian or Black and the electorate should kick them out in 2024.

Tatta ANC, tatta SASSA. *Phuma* ANC!

That is what they should say.



The SPEAKER: Hon Marais, your time has expired, please conclude.

[Interjections.] Order!

Mr P J MARAIS: Those who continue to vote and see in 2024 will be the architect of their own misery and chronic poverty. We will stop pitying them.

Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marais, your time has expired.

I now recognise the hon Minister of Social Development, Minister Fernandez.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Speaker...

The SPEAKER: Order members!

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Sy gee net geld vir DA NGOs. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: She only gives money to DA NGOs. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Speaker, I welcome this much needed debate on the impact of SASSA's inability to process payments efficiently on social security in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Sy gee net geld vir die DA NGOs. Skande! Jy sê niks daaromtrent nie.

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: She only gives money to the DA NGOs. Disgrace! You say nothing about that.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: As my colleague vividly sketched, the disgraceful and inhumane lengths people have had to go to in order to access grants and the battle to merely survive, I wholeheartedly echo their sentiments.

After a press briefing by two National Ministers, Zulu and Gungubele on 14 September, declaring that the glitch was resolved and receiving feedback to the contrary, I paid a visit to a few SASSA offices and Post Offices. I was deeply saddened at the sight of the elderly, frail and disabled in the cold and treacherous Cape Town weather, who queued in hope of drawing their much needed grant money for food, paraffin, taxi fare and electricity amongst others. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order, members. Hon Minister, my apologies. Please take your seat. Hon Chief Whip, is that a point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP: Yes, Speaker, I rise on Rules 39 and 40, Speaker. It is

becoming a disturbance to hear the Minister on the floor. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon members, because this is a political debate, I do not want to stifle free speech, but please be mindful when a member is on the floor, please do not drown out the speaker and please do not affect the decorum of the House. Hon Leader of the Opposition, is that a point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes, thank you, Speaker. †Ek wil net vra is die LUK vir Sosiale Ontwikkeling bereid om 'n vraag te kry van my? Ek wil eintlik die waarheid vra. [I just want to ask is the MEC for Social Development prepared to take a question from me? I actually want to ask the truth.]

The SPEAKER: Alright, I will ask the Minister if she is prepared to do that. Hon Minister, are you prepared to take a question?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Speaker, I am not going to engage on petty issues and... [Inaudible, speaking simultaneously]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please just... Are you not prepared? Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon Leader of the Opposition, the Minister is not prepared to take a question.

Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Many beneficiaries talked about taking loans on a daily basis just to get to SASSA and Post Offices. I sat in Gatesville Post Office where grant beneficiaries were told on the Friday to come back the following week and that hopefully there will be some money in their bank accounts on Tuesday or Wednesday.

Clearly, the technical glitch referred to during the press conference had not been resolved. I since ascertained that Post Offices were instructed to request cash holdings from Post Bank nationally, which impacted their ability to pay grants timeously since some of them had run out of cash. Gatesville, hon Speaker, is the only functioning Post Office in the Athlone Cluster, hence beneficiaries converging from a wide catchment area due to Post Offices having closed due to non-payment of their rent. These are serious red flags.

This week marks more than three weeks since the most vulnerable citizens of this country have been struggling to access their social assistance grants. Sadly, my office is still receiving complaints and desperate pleas from beneficiaries. I have subsequently written to both Minister Zulu and the Deputy Minister Bogopane-Zulu to request an urgent MINMEC before the next SASSA grant payouts are due on 4 October, for all MECs to receive a progress update. Based on the public display of discord between the Office of the Minister and the Deputy Minister, I felt it prudent to include the Deputy Minister in this meeting-request to ensure seamless and uniform communication to the public and not a Twitter war.

Speaker, allow me to detail some of the instances where the most vulnerable of society were marginalised even further and stripped of their dignity long before the shenanigans between Post Bank and SASSA surfaced.

What the National Minister has failed to tell the nation was that Post Bank was served notice on 31 July that the switching service provider would not deliver services due to non-payment to the tune of nearly R4 million. Post Bank then went to court to ensure that the services were provided.

However, the switching company said to them: "We are not prepared to provide the service. We will withdraw..." and they have since secured a new service provider. However, we must question the tender that was given to Post Bank because there are seemingly irregularities around it and then we also read in the newspaper that the Board members had resigned only then to be told that they were fired so this begs the question, Speaker, what is really going on at Post Bank?

SASSA has been in existence since 2005, and it is disheartening to see that after 18 years they still have a long way to go in providing a dignified, caring and humane way of delivering social assistance to the most vulnerable.

Hon Speaker, in February 2012, Net1's subsidiary, Cash Paymaster Services, won the tender to pay SASSA grants, but a rival bidder, Alpay, questioned the terms of the tender and in 2014 the Constitutional Court declared the

contract invalid and ordered SASSA to start a new process.

However, the court decided to allow CPS to continue to distribute the grants, in the meantime, so as not to disrupt the payment of existing grants. Here is a thread emerging.

Hon Speaker, in 2015 the Minister of Social Development, Bathabile Dlamini herself admitted that the rate of deductions from grant beneficiaries had increased significantly since the appointment of CPS and that there had been contraventions of legislation which lays down that social grants cannot be used as collateral and they can only be used for one deduction to a maximum of 10%, and that is for funeral insurance.

Well, we all remember the R10-deduction saga, which the Black Sash bestowed on behalf of the most vulnerable.

In July 2018, we saw another headline, "SASSA dealing with technical issues and payment glitches." In May 2020, approximately 435 000 people in the Western Cape reportedly received duplicate payments while 450 000 old age grant recipients in Kwazulu Natal never received a payment at all.

Earlier this year, beneficiaries were negatively impacted by the Post Bank Gold Card saga, and so we can continue.

Hon Speaker, CPS was a technical glitch. Net1 was a technical glitch and

now Post Bank is the technical glitch. The question remains, though, who and what is the common denominator?

Earlier this year, we welcomed the judgment handed down that former Social Development Minister Bathabile Dlamini and others pay back almost R3,5 million for personal protection services. This judgment provided hope. We were hopeful that this judgment would put an end to SASSA's long history of prioritising top management, fraud and corruption over the vulnerable grant beneficiaries. Hope, however, quickly turned to despair when allegations surfaced of SASSA staff taking out funeral plans on the lives of the elderly without their knowledge. This, if true, is scandalous and must be dealt with emphatically.

Hon Speaker, in spite of the dysfunction at SASSA the Provincial Department of Social Development remains committed to serve the most vulnerable of society and to help wherever possible.

However, SASSA needs to make urgent fundamental policy changes that are required to ensure that the most vulnerable receive the necessary social relief of distress in the quickest most efficient way possible.

Minister Zulu needs to focus all her attention on SASSA and ensure that due diligence and oversight is exercised over third-party service providers on an ongoing basis, and not deflect and abdicate her responsibility as the custodian of the most vulnerable in South Africa.

In closing, I can confirm receiving a WhatsApp message from Minister Zulu earlier today where she expressed her concern regarding the flood disaster. I quote, she said:

"We are so sorry to see the disaster happening in the province. Thank you for stepping up in support of the affected communities. I got the first report from SASSA today."

I welcome Minister Zulu's acknowledgement of our letter. However, there are lots of courageous conversations to be had if we wish to resolve this issue.

My fellow South Africans, I remain hopeful that we will see the much needed changes at SASSA sooner rather than later... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Minister, please conclude.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: However, we need transparency, political will and greater collaboration to ensure that the rights of the vulnerable are not compromised.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Your time is up.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I thank you.

The SPEAKER: I now recognise the hon Brinkhuis.



Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you very much, Speaker, and good afternoon. Good afternoon to everybody.

*Bismillah-ir-Rahman-ir-Rahim.*

Firstly, Al Jama-ah sends its condolences to the families of the four young boys tragically electrocuted while playing in water at the Klipfontein Mission Station in Philippi, and to the families of the three passengers who died in the fatal bus crash on Jakes Gerwel Road on Monday morning. Al Jama-ah further acknowledges the tremendous inconvenience and hardships caused to thousands of people who are unable to withdraw their SASSA payments this month. We are calling on Government to assess the state of Post Bank and to work towards preventing any such incidents from taking place in the future.

The fact that thousands of people were left without money, food and other basic necessities further exposed the poverty levels in the Western Cape of the most vulnerable sectors within our communities and worse for those living in the rural areas where there are high levels of poverty.

We are aware that the City of Cape Town has one of the highest rates of poverty in the country. For people not receiving their SASSA grants on time is indeed an injustice so too should there be equal outcries for injustice when families – I am referring to farm workers that are being unjustly evicted from their homes. It is a shame that these families who have lived for generations

on farms must be threatened with eviction. We call on the Western Cape Government to lodge a complaint with the South African Human Rights Commission to investigate the thousands of unfair evictions from farms taking place in the Western Cape. I thank you very much, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Brinkhuis. I now recognise the hon Bans.

Ms A BANS: Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, I must say that it is indeed a privilege to stand here and debate on this matter today. The National Government, which is the ANC, the government of the day, has always been confident and knew that actually the imbalances of the past need to be addressed through social grants and it is not a policy for all parties. The ANC is always criticized for having this country as a free-for-all, everything must be for free but today we hear from the counterparts from the left, speaking a lot about the free-for-all and having views on that. I must say, Speaker, it is indeed an eye-opener for everyone to see that the imbalances of the past, they need to be addressed, and there is no way you can say it is not important. It is shown by what happened this week through SASSA.

†Agbare Speaker, agbare lede van die Wetgewer en geagte burgers van die Wes-Kaap, ek staan vandag hier met 'n swaar hart, bewus van die swaarkry wat die mense van die Wes-Kaap onlangs ervaar het as gevolg van die onvermoë van SASSA om betalings doeltreffend te verwerk. Ek bied opregte verskoning aan die begunstigdes wat hierdeur geraak is. Ek is ook op roep,

ek herhaal die beroep wat die lid Bakubaku-Vos voorheen gemaak het vir die Nasionale Regering om die begunstigdes te vergoed vir ekstra uitgawes wat hulle moes maak.

Hierdie betalingsfout het ontstaan deur tegniese foute in die Posbank en die betalingstelsel. Daar is berigte in die media dat hierdie fout voortspruit uit die oorgang na 'n nuwe betalingstelsel as gevolg van 'n verskil van die vorige diensverskaffer. Ek wil die begunstigdes verseker dat so 'n voorval nie weer sal gebeur nie. In hierdie verband het die ANC provinsiale leierskap reeds begin met gesprekke met hul nasionale mense om 'n blywende oplossing vir hierdie aangeleentheid te vind, veral in die Wes-Kaap.

[Hon Speaker, hon members of the Legislature and hon citizens of the Western Cape, I'm standing here today with a heavy heart, aware of the suffering that the people of the Western Cape have recently experienced because of the failure of SASSA to process payments efficiently. I'm offering genuine apology to the beneficiaries who were affected by this. I'm also on call, I repeat the call that the member Bakubaku-Vos previously made for the National Government to compensate the beneficiaies for the extra expenses they had to make.

This payment fault originates through technical faults in the Post Bank and the payment system. There are reports in the media that this fault originated from the transition to a new payment system as a result of dispute with the previous service provider. I want to assure the beneficiaries that such a incident will not happen again. In this regard, the ANC provincial leadership

has already started talks with their national people to find a lasting solution for this issue, especially in the Western Cape.]

Hon Speaker, this month's social grant payment failure affecting thousands of recipients resulted from a system glitch with Post Bank, not SASSA at fault.

Media reports revealed that Electronic Connect, the software supplier, threatened to suspend services due to unpaid invoices by Post Bank forcing a rushed migration with inadequate testing. While service providers deserve payment, it is disheartening to see one deliberately inconveniencing vulnerable citizens for profit.

Regarding ongoing governance issues at Post Bank, we appreciate the Minister's intervention, but these issues have deep-rooted origins. Board resignations and dissolution are not the sole reasons for the recent failure. The call is to our counterparts in National Government to accelerate in solving the issue.

Our duty as legislators is to support Government's efforts to lasting solutions, prioritising citizens over the interest and not to be the source of division and sowing confusion, as some have done during the challenge. Together, we must address these challenges head-on.

It is regrettable to note that the DA is sponsoring this debate. It has shown a lack of genuine concern for the affected grant beneficiaries. It is not enough

to raise the issue for political expediency. Action must follow. The DA's failure to gather information on the matter of affected individuals and their lack of efforts to provide assistance maybe through food parcels or vouchers, it speaks volumes, Speaker. The MEC and all other DA members that are participating in the debate have failed to display how Provincial Government contributed in assisting these grant beneficiaries.

As expected, they are not supporting in any way the grant system.

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member, you can continue. Hon Bans, your microphone. Order, members! [Interjections.] Order, members!

Ms A BANS: Upon receiving this grant, Speaker, beneficiaries unfortunately still have to pay those monies to high electricity bills that are highly in this City of Cape Town rated, abnormally so. The DA is not taking responsibility. The DA refuses to take responsibility; they rather take the matter to the Human Rights. What are they doing as a province to interact and intervene? Let us not forget that the social grant payment is not only a Social Development emergency that has transpired in our country and province this month. The recent storms that hit the province in the past week have left many displaced and desperate in need of assistance.

Additionally, a total of eight fatalities caused by electrocution, were confirmed during recent storms. Four people died in the COVID-19 informal settlement in Driftsands as well as four children in the Klipfontein area,

Speaker, we just visited the families now, with a few of my colleagues.

I must say inequalities must be addressed, there is no way water can be on that level, and we only see at certain times there are challenges within this House, when it goes to the National Government. Our backyards here in this province, we are drowning in water. That is why the children are dying.

The DA-led Western Cape Provincial Government's lax response to this crisis is concerning. Who shall we blame to this death on? The tragic loss of eight people due to inadequate housing conditions requires the Government's immediate intervention. Additionally, the flooding, extensive damage to properties, public infrastructure and agriculture cannot be ignored. We plead with the Provincial Government to also prioritise the poor farm workers when it responds to the impact of flooding.

Speaker, in 2019, the DA in its manifesto committed to building one South Africa for all by creating a caring social assistance system, a fundamental step to achieving it. This system should be able to deal with challenges posed by the increasing levels of economic inequality and income poverty. The DA's commitment of building one South Africa for all stands in stark contrast to their recent lost Jobs-for-Growth Strategy, which seeks to widen economic inequality and income poverty.

It is essential, Speaker, to recognise that under the DA governance in the Western Cape, the majority of Black individuals, particularly Coloured and

African communities bear the brunt of poverty, incomelessness, homelessness and hunger. The living conditions in poor class communities in the Western Cape are a testament of the DA's persistence in maintaining inequalities. The recent mass murders in KTC serve as a chilling reminder that violence continues to plague these communities, echoing the legacy of apartheid and colonialism. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms A BANS: Speaker, for the nearly three decades the ANC has invested significantly in rectifying the injustices of apartheid, through social policy and transformation. The DA has consistently opposed these transformative efforts. Their manifesto is called for a labour-market flexibility exemption clause aimed at making the process to hire and fire employees simpler and allowing potential employees to opt out of relevant sectoral minimum wage, which we would have a new minimum of no less than the old age grant. The purpose of this is to further entrap the poor in poverty, Speaker.

Lastly, it is imperative for the DA to understand the technical glitches are not exclusive to any institution... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Bans, please conclude, your time has expired.

Ms A BANS: Even one of their biggest funders, Le Roux's Bank Capitec experienced the technical glitches this week.

An HON MEMBER: Your funders!

†Me A BANS: Ek wil ook melding maak dat hierdie werkgewer het ook dieselfde deur gekom... [onduidelik, praat gelyktydig]

[Ms A BANS: I also want to mention that this employer also came through the same ... [inaudible, speaking simultaneously.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bans.

†Me A BANS: Hierdie werkgewer het ook dit gehad. [Tyd verstreke.]

[Ms A BANS: This employer also had it. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order, members! There is a member on the floor.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and good afternoon. Hon Speaker, through you, I would like to ask member Bans, hon Bans, that instead of spending so much time supporting the National Government and the National Executive, as she sees her role is to support the Executive, she should really open her eyes and look at the mammoth amount of social distress ... [Interjection.]



Ms A BANS: Where were you? Where were you?

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms A BANS: The ANC was here, where were you?

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Bosman, please take your seat. Hon members, there is a member on the floor. Can I please ask that the members on my left not directly engage the member on the floor, but also, hon Bosman, can you please speak to me. [Interjections.] Order, members!

Ms A BANS: He lies with a straight face.

The SPEAKER: Order members!

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Speaker, through you, †die waarheid maak altyd seer [the tuth always hurts.]

Ms A BANS: He lies with a straight face.

Mr G BOSMAN: The ANC did not see the amount of support that was provided by this Government to members evicted by floods in this province over the last weekend because they were too busy with their heads in the sand and too busy writing apologies for Minister Zulu and the African National

Congress Government. [Interjections.]

Speaker, concerns have been expressed that a glitch in the Post Bank system that prevented thousands of beneficiaries from accessing their social grants has not been fixed. Despite assertions by Post Bank that all overdue South African Social Security Agency grant payments to recipients have been made, we know they have not been paid.

While this is tragic, this is ultimately what we have come to expect from a chronically flawed system. It has become apparent that the crisis at the National Department of Social Development and the South African Social Security Agency runs so deep that we have no choice but to completely overhaul the Social Security system in this country. We need to ensure that those most vulnerable in society are taken care of because we know, according to research, each senior citizen who receives a grant of only R2 080 is very often responsible for the care of more than four family members on average. The failure of Post Bank and SASSA to pay these grants have been felt far and wide. We saw the hurt. We saw the pain and we saw the betrayal on the faces of our beloved grandparents as they had to stand in undignified queues day after day. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN: Tragically, Speaker, we know of at least one case where an elderly senior citizen has died while standing in a queue and we send our

condolences. Hon Speaker, hon Bakubaku-Vos said that she apologises on behalf of the ANC and just like her, my heart is also very sore that she has to come and stand there and apologise for Minister Zulu because we know the dysfunction in the National Department of Social Development is so apparent... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr G BOSMAN: ...that the Deputy National Minister of Social Development, our dear friend, Deputy Minister Bogopane-Zulu has gone to Twitter to ask what have the elderly done to deserve this treatment from the ANC?

†Mnr D AMERICA: Skande!

[Mr D AMERICA: Disgrace!]

Mr G BOSMAN: We must say, Speaker, this is not a technical glitch, it is a failure on the Department of Social Development to meet its most basic obligations, relief of distress.

Ms A BANS: Do you understand that it is an obligation for you to...

Mr G BOSMAN: We have to ask ourselves what possible reason could there be for this routine task of grants that have to be paid for being so abruptly stopped. Perhaps what we see now at SASSA is a recurrence of the infamous Cash Paymaster Saga or the many other scandals where our ANC comrades

are busy preparing to steal ahead of the elections.

Whatever the specific cause for this glitch is this time, the essential factor behind SASSA's dysfunction is all too easy to guess. The ANC has ruined our economy and that it has made millions of people reliant on the State to survive, but at the same time they have ensured that the State has become so dysfunctional and corrupt that it cannot even function. Even former President Thabo Mbeki this weekend reminded us that the State has failed and they fail miserably all the time. [Interjections.]

To live in South Africa in 2023 is to exist in a constant state of crisis. A government that steals from its people with such ease is a crisis. A government that does not seem to care about the failure to pay senior citizen grants is a crisis.

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: [onduidelik] SASSA loop.

[Tussenwerpsels.]

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.] SASSA walks.

[Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN: Almost everything the ANC touches becomes a crisis.

Ms A BANS: So you are supporting social grants.

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN: We have known for years that this Government is in crisis and every week we are reminded of the deep rot, but we never thought the ANC would stoop so low as to withhold the only means of income for the elderly in our society.

Ms A BANS: So you are supporting social grants.

Mr G BOSMAN: We know, Speaker, that some of our elderly residents have been forced to take out private loans... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Bosman, please take your seat. Hon Bans, since hon Bosman has started his speech you have been running commentary throughout the speech. I understand that interjections are allowed, but can I please ask that you allow the hon member to make his presentation? You had an opportunity to do yours. It is a political debate, so I do not want to stifle freedom of speech and interjections as per the Rules, but please running commentary is not allowed.

Hon Bosman, please continue and again, hon Bosman, can you please speak to me?

Mr G BOSMAN: Yes, Speaker, through you, I see the hon member is even trying to steal my time now. Speaker, this latest crisis does not seem to be a surprise, since we know that since Post Bank has taken over the management

of grants from SAPO in October 2022 there have been at least three nationwide technical problems with the payment of social subsidies. During November 2022, a technical error occurred; a cyber attack in December stopped grant disbursements and there was yet another issue in January 2023. SASSA has claimed on numerous occasions that these problems have been fixed. Clearly they were wrong. Our social grant system remains in crisis just like the ANC remains in crisis.

We desperately need a Government in the Union Buildings that understands the need for urgent economic growth to enable citizens to thrive. Our current Social Security system is severely overburdened and the inability to pay senior citizens their grants is just one more example of where Minister Zulu has failed. Another example of a system in crisis is that Minister in crisis. At what point do we say enough? At what point do we as South Africans get tired of this broken party presiding over a broken government? At what point do we demand that this constant state of crisis is ended?

What we need is to go back to basics and we need to allow competent Provincial Government to bring power to the people. This means we need to devolve policing and rail infrastructure to a provincial level. It means we need to be given the power to fix our ports. It means that we need to fund provincial departments of Social Development to adequately manage the administration of grants and to pay out those grants. Surely they can do a better job than SASSA. Surely they can do a better job than Post Bank, who has outsourced this responsibility.

Hon Speaker, I support member Bakubaku-Vos' call for community mobilisation. In fact, she should not worry. The Democratic Alliance is busy mobilising voters by registering them to vote so that we can get rid of this government in crisis. Speaker, through you, I want to remind hon De Villiers that he should really use the immense influence that he has through his party's position in the National Cabinet, to give some advice to Minister Lindiwe Zulu and to President Cyril Ramaphosa on how to pay grants because an ANC Government supported by the GOOD party is failing the people of the Western Cape. We must not forget that this ANC / GOOD alliance is part of the problem.

Speaker, I really want to encourage member Bans to go and listen to the words of former President Thabo Mbeki where he says: "The Government of the ANC has outsourced its responsibility," and I want to urge, through you, Speaker, that members of the Opposition join us and that we outsource the ANC to the rubbish-bin. I want to remind hon members and through you, hon Bans, that the Post Bank is not an outsourced private agency. Post Bank, through you, hon Speaker, is an entity of the ANC National Government in crisis.

Speaker, we live in a world that is becoming more and more expensive and we cannot allow those already so vulnerable to suffer under this uncaring ANC Government. It is time for this crisis to end. It is time for change and through you, hon Speaker, to member Bans, it is time for the DA.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bosman, thank you very, very much hon members. That concludes the debate on the subject.

We will now move onto Interpellations in terms of Rule 197. [Interjections.]

Hon members, are you done? Can we continue? Hon members, we have a long Sitting today. I am more than happy to let you continue with your interjections but I am not going to compete with you today. So if you want to continue, you can continue. Otherwise, we will move in terms of Rule 197 and I recognise the hon Minister, Minister Mackenzie.

## **INTERPELLATION**

1. Mr L L Mvimbi asked the Minister of Mobility:

In respect of the handover of the first 31 BMW vehicles to Traffic Services:

- (a) At what stages are the remaining 100 vehicles and
- (b) What will he do to ensure that all the vehicles are on the road as soon as reasonably possible?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, in respect of the handover of the 31 BMW vehicles to Traffic Services, to clarify to hon Mvimbi, a total of 136 replacement vehicles were ordered, and



122 were delivered to Government Motor Transport (GMT). Of these 122 vehicles, 31 have already been handed over to Provincial Traffic Law Enforcement. Fourteen (14) vehicles are still outstanding on the order of 136 and are being followed up with BMW South Africa regularly. BMW South Africa's delivery of these vehicles is anticipated towards the end of this month or early November.

As to the stages as requested by the hon member, GMT's replacement vehicle onboarding and conversion process for the provincial traffic fleet entails the following stages. The stages are, and it was done for the remaining vehicles already delivered but not yet handed over, as follows:

- The registering of each vehicle on the GMT's asset register;
- The registration of the vehicle in NaTIS;
- The fitment of number plates;
- The fitment of branding and reflective markings;
- The fitment of emergency lights and sirens;
- The installation of tracking devices;
- The installation of driver recognition devices. This is linked to the orange driver tags issued to all drivers of Government vehicles;
- The installation of in-vehicle technology such as automatic number plate recognition (ANPR) camera solutions.

The final steps being implemented are:

- The fitment of tablets or the screens and the brackets for the NaTIS

queries and other traffic law enforcement purposes; and

- The loading of a digital push-to-talk app on vehicle tablets/screens;
- The rollout of the push-to-talk app on the traffic officers' handheld devices also runs in parallel with the preparation of the replacement vehicles, to ensure the officer's hand-held devices work with the vehicles handed over.

The (b)-part to the hon member's question, what will we do to ensure that vehicles are on the road as soon as reasonably possible. We are doing everything possible within the prescripts of the law to ensure the safety of officers but more importantly, the people of the Western Cape.

The first batch of the 31 vehicles was handed over the Metro on 12 September. The second batch of 36 replacement vehicles for Beaufort West, Laingsburg and Worcester is planned for next week, Thursday, 5 October 2023.

The final two batches of vehicles are expected to be handed over towards the latter part of October, with a completed rollout of 122 replacement vehicles by 31 October this year. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise the hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and thank you very much to the provincial Minister for the response that he has given on this

matter albeit we are not very impressed around the manner in which this issue has been dealt with because if it was not for the proactive involvement on the media on this matter, maybe we would not even have known about this BMW that is actually standing idle there.

Hon Speaker, the ANC caucus, stands before this esteemed Legislature today to address the recent handover of 31 BMW vehicles to the Provincial Traffic Department by the Democratic Alliance-led Provincial Government. However, we are deeply concerned about the inexplicable delay in releasing the remaining 100 vehicles, which have been sitting idle and gathering dust at the Government Garage. This issue of delayed deployment not only constitute wasteful and fruitless expenditure, but also undermines the Government's ability to enhance road safety, particularly as our country marks the Transport Month in October.

We cannot ignore the stark contrast between fanfare surrounding the release of these initial 31 vehicles and the 100 others that languish idling in the Government Garages. It is imperative that we scrutinize how the manner in which the provincial Minister have dealt with this manner, who, in our view, has proven that to be very ineffective in dealing with this manner, and actually in delivering his sole responsibility on this issue. There is no reason why we should be still having ongoing discussion of this matter. This is a matter that we believe that should have been finished a long time ago and also we are still actually busy, as we warned the Premier in the beginning around the responsibility of the current MEC on this job. The people of the

Western Cape are still puzzled why it has taken the Government nearly 20 months to get vehicles on the road. The timing of the procurement of these vehicles, which appear suspiciously close to the end of the financial year, is raising concern of fiscal dumping. The delay in handing over the remaining vehicles is a matter of grave concern. It raises questions about the Government's commitment to road safety, especially as we approach the festive season and school holidays. Our communities cannot afford such delays when it comes to ensuring the safety of our roads. We particularly would like to raise the issue of fiscal dumping because the Minister himself is on the record having accused a certain National Government of fiscal dumping, and he was even suggesting in this House what action he was going to take in those, so we would like to actually call on the Minister to act on this issue. Revealingly an additional 100 vehicle remaining dormant in Government Garages despite having been procured a year ago... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Mvimbi. Your time has expired for your first opportunity. You will have another opportunity. That is the first opportunity has expired. I now recognise the hon America.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, Speaker. Thank you, hon Mvimbi. Thank you, Minister, or your response. It is worth noting that if hon Mvimbi had read your press statements, he would have found the answer to his question nearly three weeks ago. Hon Speaker, the Democratic Alliance eagerly anticipates the rollout of the remaining traffic service vehicles, having modern and

up-to-date traffic service vehicles is crucial for ensuring public safety on our roads, serving as the frontline defenders of law and order in traffic management. Equipped with advanced technology these vehicles not only facilitate efficient law enforcement, but also plays a pivotal role in accident prevention and rapid response to emergencies. They are better equipped to address the evolving challenges of our roads today, including managing traffic congestion, monitoring speed limits and enforcing safety regulations.

Impressively, the Western Cape remains the only province with a 24/7 traffic service presence actively protecting our roads and reducing road accidents and road fatalities.

Hon Speaker, through you, hon Minister, what are the benefits of the technology in these vehicles, example, how is the Mobility Department using technology to make our roads more safe? I thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon America, I recognise the hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, I just want to ask the Minister, is the reports true in *Eyewitness News* to say the Western Government confirms that 110 BMW vehicles purchased in 2022 were never used so I want to know from the Minister, one, were the vehicles idle and was there time wasted; how long did it take for work to be done, and lastly, was it efficient and was it effective, so I have heard your answer about all the

stages it must go through, but according to this report, the vehicles were gathering dust and nothing was done to the vehicles. I want to know from you is this statement true because that is what is out in the media. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians. Hon Mvimbi, that's your next opportunity.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and also thank you very much to hon Christian in assisting me in holding the Provincial Minister to account. Unfortunately, I am a bit disappointed with my friend over there that I had hoped he was also going to assist us in holding the Executive to account and not ask sweetheart questions.

Let me reiterate, hon Speaker, the ANC's stance on this matter is that there is nothing to celebrate on the release of the first 31 vehicles, we do not celebrate mediocrity, the Provincial Minister has failed the people of the province dismally, with those vehicles still idling there. The continued idleness of these vehicles represents a missed opportunity and a failure on the part of the Provincial Government to efficiently utilize valuable resources. These vehicles were purchased without a well thought out plan, we believe, leading to fiscal dumping. This situation not only resulted in wasteful and fruitless expenditure by the Provincial Government but also casts doubt on the DA's commitment to improving road safety in our province.

In light of this concern, we demand immediate attention and scrutiny from the Legislature. We must seek answers and hold the Government accountable for the delay in the handover of these vehicles and the reason behind the 20-month dormancy of the remaining 100 BMW vehicles. It is our duty as public representatives of the people to ensure Government resources are deployed effectively and in an organised manner to serve the best interests of our constituents and ensure the safety of our citizens on our roads. The safety of our community is paramount and we must act accordingly. We call upon the Provincial Government that is led by the DA to take immediate and decisive action to address these pressing issues. We cannot allow valuable resources to gather dust in Government storages while the safety of our citizens is at risk. As the ANC we demand transparency and accountability in the procurement process and the efficient utilisation of these vehicles.

We also request the Premier to take decisive action against the Minister. If the MEC Minister was not there, MEC Mackenzie could have been the weakest link. Hon Speaker, Provincial Minister Mackenzie has opted for the service of a foreign company for the processing of these vehicles. The apparent preference for a Swiss company in the technology procurement process is also concerning as it neglects our local businesses and job opportunities within our province. We know our friends on that side always prefer to have friends in foreign places and actually neglect their own people locally. We should prioritise the growth and support of our local industries while making decisions that truly benefit our province. The MEC must tell us why he preferred a foreign company and what are the total costs associated

therewith [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, your time has expired. Please conclude.

Mr L L MVIMBI: I have concluded, thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Mvimbi. I recognise the hon Minister, Minister Mackenzie.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Speaker, and let me respond to the hon member Mvimbi on some of the comments that he made. The rest I am not going to respond to but it is worth quoting the hon Mvimbi. He said: "We do not celebrate mediocrity." Indeed, we do not celebrate it, not on this side of the House, because if you cannot even deliver pension funds to your ailing seniors in this country you don't even deserve to use the word mediocrity. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: It is really pathetic and sad on a day that we debate pensioners waiting since three o'clock in the morning, unable to afford R20, I got Please-call-me's from people to ask me for R5 to buy a loaf of bread, and that a member of this House has the audacity to use the word mediocrity. He should not even own that word.



The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: He should not even own that word.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon Mvimbi, is that a point of order?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Yes, certainly... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Mediocrity is not my language, so it is definitely not going to be my word but, hon Speaker, on a point of relevance to the topic we are talking about the BMWs and non-use thereof.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: So we would like the Minister to concentrate on that and also the issue of SASSA is a National Government competence... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Okay, you wanted, hon Mvimbi... [Interjections.] Hon Mvimbi, hon Mvimbi... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: He must really focus on the topic.

The SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, you rose on a point of order, I allowed you that opportunity. You do not need to justify your point... [Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: But the Minister is not answering the question. That is why he... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: ...but also, also, members, I am on the floor.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Oh sorry.

The SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, you rose on a point of order. I allowed you an opportunity. You do not need to justify your point of order. The hon Minister has got four minutes in which he can respond. I cannot dictate from the chair how the Minister should respond. Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, Chairperson. I was going to do that, I am just trying to give context as to why the hon Mvimbi and his party should be the last people to give me advice. In fact, the day he likes me, that means something wrong. The more they hate me, the more that means I am doing something right, because the poor standards, nonexistent standards from a government that can't deliver pension funds I will gladly accept criticisms for that. So, thank you very much for that.

Hon members, I am going to – the last two and a half months we have given extensive written answers and verbal answers on this topic, and it starts by reading and thank you, hon America, because you've read that statement with the facts.

Clearly other members did not and that is where the word mediocrity is applicable.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Exactly, the other [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you for not being mediocre and reading those statements. The others did not bother. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hon Speaker, GMT produces vehicles in batches based on needs as original equipment manufacturers who supply vehicles via the national transversal contract signal available to the market. As a result of global supply chain challenges, which we had said here before, stemming from the impact of COVID-19 that continues to plague the automotive industry, GMT and mostly fleet vehicle owners, anyone that buys a thing called a car, struggled with keeping up with the planned cycle of vehicle replacement. This in turn resulted in challenges with vehicle storage space as manufacturers starting, producing and delivering vehicles once

again, it should be noted that the market has not yet fully recovered and then certain makes and models of vehicles are still not available during 2023. It is not a Cape Town thing, it is not a Western Cape thing. It is a global thing. If you live on this planet, you would have known it.

Once vehicles are delivered to BMW by vehicle manufacturers the preparation process was initiated by GMT to be ready to deliver the vehicles for its intended process. The Vehicle Manufacture Procurement and Conversion Project suffered a setback as a result of a fire that gutted Renesas, a Japanese Technology Company, in a place called Japan, and one of the car industries biggest computer chip suppliers. The fire had a massive impact on its ability to fulfil orders to companies such as Motorola, which supplies digital radios for clients including the Western Cape, part of this planet. We are not that unique, so the benefits, hon America, it is high performance vehicles that are not just ordinary sedans, they are specialised vehicles that have been converted and optimised with the rigours of Traffic Law Enforcement on our provincial and national roads. They are equipped with cutting edge in-vehicle technology, including automatic number plate recognition cameras, which interface directly with the National Information Traffic Systems, providing officers with critical information within seconds.

In fact, on the day of that fanfare launch, for which the member was not present, as the vehicle was standing there, they automatically picked up a vehicle that erred. That is the quality of technology that we use and a member in this province, living in this province would have known that

indeed, we had 30% reduction in road traffic fatalities over the last year-on-year. If you lived in this province, you would have known we are the only province in the country with a 24/7 traffic service.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister, your time has expired. Please conclude.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: We indeed take it seriously. The people in this province, the House, should know it. Thank you.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister. Please take your seat. Thank you very much, hon members. That brings us to the end of Interpellations in terms of the Rules. We now move on to Questions as printed on the Question Paper in terms of Rule 202. Hon members, I wish to remind you that once the hon Minister has started to reply to the oral question as printed on the Question Paper, hon members must use the chat facility for the Sitting of the House to indicate that they wish to ask a follow-up question, if you are online, hon members, if you are in the Chamber please indicate to the Table staff in order for us to recognise you. The first opportunity will be afforded to the member who posed the initial question and the remaining three opportunities will then be to those members indicating that they so wish to do so.

Hon members, before I recognise the hon Minister Allen, just for the record, we will now first deal with the Questions that stood over from the Sitting of Thursday, 14 September 2023, as agreed by the House.

So the hon Minister, Minister Allen, that is Question Number 5 on the Question Paper.

### **QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

*Questions standing over from Thursday, 14 September 2023, as agreed to by the House:*

5. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety:

Whether his Department has implemented measures to enable women to report cases of gender-based violence in a manner that minimises the trauma of the report; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
Speaker, thank you so much for this particular opportunity and for also clarifying that a number of questions stood over. I can confirm a key component during that particular MINMEC discussions, hence I was not able to be in the House, and where we again were able to as a province raise a key aspect that speaks directly to this particular question. That the hon Christians

have asked, but Speaker, I think it is very vital to address this question in detail, and I wish to confirm that the DA-led Provincial Government has implemented a host of interventions to combat GBV which is a key priority. GBV remains one of the most dire and pressing issues across our entire country, as barely a week, Speaker, goes by, whereby we do not hear of a woman or a child that has been brutally assaulted or murdered or a young woman being raped. In recognition of the increased levels of GBV the Premier of the Western Cape, charged the Western Cape Minister of Social Development, Sharna Fernandez, with being the lead in the Province for gender based violence. Her Department is tasked with coordinating the development of the Western Cape Gender-based Violence Implementation Plan, which I can confirm was adopted by the Provincial Cabinet. The Provincial Implementation Plan details each provincial department's interventions and measures. I think it's vital because this particular question speaks to that intervention plan and the role that each and every department has to play and to touch, first and foremost, if I venture along the line, I see our Minister for Education.

Education has established the Safe Schools toll-free number which is 0800454647 where all teachers and learners can report any form [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members, order! Hon Minister, you can continue.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: The

Provincial Department's interventions cut across the entire Government. If I look at the Minister for Education, which has established... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: The Provincial Minister, which Minister, the Provincial Minister?

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: The Provincial Minister... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat.

An HON MEMBER: The National Minister?

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, would you like to pose a question for the Minister? Can I get an indication? You cannot do it now. I will recognise you when you have an opportunity.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Speaker, it is a point of order, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order, sir?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Speaker, my point of order



is the continuing failure of the Office of the Speaker to uphold the Provincial Constitution.

An HON MEMBER: That is not a point of order.

The SPEAKER: That is not a point of order.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It is a point of order, because when an MEC refers to a Minister then he is misleading the House because the Constitution, which has been certified by the Constitutional Court, says a Provincial Minister. It is confusing when he says Minister. We do not know who this is. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon members, hon Deputy Chief Whip, please take your seat. Hon member, that is not a point of order. Hon Minister, please continue. I will allow hon Dugmore to pose a question to you, if he so wishes, but that is not a point of order.

Hon Deputy Chief Whip, is that a new point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP: Speaker, I rise on Rule 62, even within the point

of order, when member Dugmore rose, he reflected upon you as your office and the reflection upon holders of an office of this House that is a penant on this House is not allowed.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Chief Whip. That is indeed the case, so hon Dugmore, if I am not upholding the decorum or the Rules of this House, there are Rules for you to put in, to move a substantive motion for my removal but until such time I will recognise, I do need your warnings until such time. I will recognise the Minister, Minister Allen.  
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
Speaker, thank you so much. I would not... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Andricus...

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Ms L M MASEKO: It is member Dugmore.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I would not want to have any confusion in the House, so please allow me to again restate. The Premier has tasked the Provincial Minister of the Western Cape responsible for Social Development with the lead responsibility in the fight against gender-based violence. The Western Cape Provincial Minister's

Department is responsible for coordinating the development of the Implementation Plan and it has been adopted by the Provincial Cabinet led under Alan Winde. This Provincial Implementation Plan details each and every Provincial Department's responsibility, and each and every Provincial Minister has a key role in this regard. If I look to my left, I see the Provincial Minister of Education and Education has established a Safe School's toll-free number which is 0800454647 where all teachers and all learners can report any form of abuse and receive advice and support with regards to gender-based violence.

Furthermore, the curriculum from Grades 4 to 12 equips and helps our young learners on the dangers that is associated to committing gender-based violence. If I further look at the Department of Police Oversight and Community Safety, I can confirm that our interventions were extremely well received at our MINMEC just last week. Part of that intervention is that the Western Cape Government has requested in writing in MINMEC to ensure that every gender-based violence desk that is situated at a South African Police Service must have certain specifications. I can confirm as of today and up until the implementation of the gender-based violence desk at every SAPS station, the Western Cape has a desk at each and every station, but we have not been able to get signoff from National with regards to the specifications and the specifications of that particular desk will ensure that a victim or a survivor would be able to ensure that if he or she goes to a SAPS station to get the necessary help and support when they do report such matters.

We also have interventions with regards to our Court Watching Brief and our work in terms of compliance with the implementation of the Domestic Violence Act, which sits within our Directorate, the monitoring and evaluation which compiled an awareness campaign around that which is entitled "Protect yourself and act with courage to contribute towards attempts aiming at any gender-based violence."

Also, that particular pamphlet details the steps to follow when applying for a protection order with a Gender-Based Violence Command Centre which is a toll free number at 0800428428. That pamphlet has also been distributed to all our Neighbourhood Watch members, 17 500 across our ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: What about Community Policing Forums (CPFs), what about the CPFs?

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: You can check my notes, it says boldly "and CPFs", but you interject... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please do not directly address a member. Please speak to me.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Speaker. I trust that the confusion has been eradicated, and myself and member Dugmore appears to be on the same page, because just

before member Dugmore interjected, I would have said "and CPFs." We work closely with our CPFs in the Western Cape, together with Gauteng, have made sure that the funding that was allocated from National was a direct motivation from Western Cape and from Gauteng and that particular R70 million, R12,7 million that landed in the Western Cape, was towards making sure that gender-based violence is also tackled and that speaks directly to the reporting of gender-based violence cases.

I can also confirm that this Government, in partnership with the Department of Health and the Department of Social Development, partners with the NPA in terms of the establishment of Thutuzela Centres and we have eight here in our province. That particular centre does amazing work in terms of advocating but also makes sure that victims do have access to information on where to report any form of gender-based violence or femicide.

As the Western Cape Government, as the Provincial Minister and all call on my colleagues, we will continue to play our role in terms of tackling gender-based violence by making sure that a victim or survivor would have the courage, the support and the assistance to ultimately ensure that that particular case is not only handled properly, but that justice is served.

We remain open to any further input and interventions that we will gladly take under consideration because I firmly believe that everyone in this House clearly wants to eradicate gender-based violence. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister, I recognise the hon Christians. I've got hon Christians, hon Sayed and hon Bosman and hon Bans. Those are the four [Inaudible.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you. Thank you, Speaker, and thank you to the Minister for the question. Minister, the question is, what is your Department doing? Right, you said about what the National Department is doing, what other departments are doing, because it is a serious problem. We saw, I do not know if you saw the statistics, because of police mistakes, 77 cases were withdrawn of gender-based violence. So it is a major problem. I see there are measures and the desk you are talking about going forward so I hope that will help, but of course your Department's role is now definite oversight to make sure that when our victims have the courage to go to a police station, that they are treated with dignity and respect and that we do not have 77 cases of gender-based violence ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Christians, I would just like to remind you, you must ask a follow-up question. You do not get to make a speech. Please get to your question.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Ja. Thank you, Speaker, scrapped off the roll because of mistakes of police so that is why the question to you, Minister. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

Thank you so much, Speaker. I wish to say thank you to the hon Christians for this particular question. I can confirm that the Court Watching Brief, which I mentioned, I am delighted that I am able to share further information in that regard.

I think it is very important for this House to note that the Court Watching Brief Unit, an initiative of the Western Cape Government, has now been adopted across our entire country as a result of the work that we are doing, as a result of the reports, but also the post-monitoring reports, because those post-monitoring reports detail exactly what needs to be done on what particular case and what action should be taken against SAPS members that have failed in their duty. So in terms of the Court Watching Brief we monitor a number of cases that range from gender-based violence to murder, attempted murder, or when someone is caught with an illegal firearm. We then compile a report and we list a number of inefficiencies. There is a number of categories and the categories are that where the docket is not at court another category is where the witnesses have not been interviewed or summoned to be in court. Another matter is that there is not enough evidence that were collected, even though the statements refer to evidence that were collected, but also, if the docket is just purely missing. What we then do in that particular case, we engage also with the NPA to ensure that those matters are re-enrolled onto the court roll so that justice can be served and I think it speaks directly to the question that member Christians have asked, because if

a female or any person loses hope in the criminal justice system, that person will be less likely to report any matter of gender-based violence so our Court Watching Brief Unit and the post monitoring go a very long way towards ensuring that those victims and survivors have the courage and we hold SAPS accountable. I also get the briefing with regards to steps taken against SAPS members.

Just two weeks ago, I visited the one station that featured predominantly in that particular report because it was 12 particular cases at that one station. In my engagement with the head of detectives it became again increasingly clear that the case-to-detective ratio was over 200 and those detectives are struggling and then we took that particular matter again to National and to the Provincial Commissioner to ensure those matters are addressed, so we will always be active in our Court Watching Brief Unit and I can confirm, two days ago, I was very blunt with our Police Commissioner when we addressed our post monitoring report with him, two days ago, and I said, and I asked, "Is this of value to the South African Police Service; are these reports helping?" And unequivocally, the Police Commissioner, together with two Generals instantly said "yes." They echoed, it keeps SAPS on their toes, but it also helps to ensure that any SAPS officer that is not doing his or her job, will be held accountable, and I think it goes a long way through the intervention of making sure that cases are reported, but also wanting to dig a little deeper into the whole of government because this particular question stretches not only across what we are doing in our oversight, and I sincerely want to be held accountable for the oversight role that must lead to better



service delivery. Otherwise I will also then be at fault, but I would always want to ensure that the role that each and every Department also plays, because it does take that whole-of-government, it takes everyone in this particular House, Speaker, to play a role to ensure that if we become aware of any particular matter that we escalate that matter via the proper channels, and I would not want to read a message from this morning. In one particular district and a discussion with Brigadier Harri, who is our FCS head in the province and via the request from our office, an investigator at FCS went to a victim's home and took that particular victim to court to obtain a protection order, but also further assistance in terms of psychosocial assistance and support is being provided to that particular victim after we have received information with regards to gender-based violence. So we are always wanting to work with all stakeholders. We are not wanting a free pass, but we are also encouraging residents in the Western Cape, members of Parliament, councillors to ensure that if they become aware of any matter to follow the proper channels, the hotline that I have indicated, help and assistance are available at the Thutuzela Centres, because the more our females and men that are abused, if they seek the help they will ultimately, to a large extent, become emboldened and help others break the cycle. So thank you so much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise the hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, thank you very much and thank you to the Minister, to the Provincial Minister for the response.

[Laughs] Thank you to the Provincial Minister, my friend hon Allen, for the response.

Now let – can I just get a sense from the hon Minister, what role does his Department play in working with Safe Schools? Because he spoke about Safe Schools. In working with the Safe Schools Unit in order to ensure that they are more responsive and if he is aware then of that case, and because I give an example, Hillside Primary School.

Safe Schools has not been responsive. They call, they send all the information. To date nothing has happened not even a ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed, the question?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Is he aware of this? Thank you very much, and what are they doing? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I want to remind members, you must please ask a follow-up question. You are allowed one follow-up question in terms of the Rule.

Hon Minister, there was more than one question. I am not going to dictate how you answer that, but just for the record I have noted that.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

Thank you so much, hon Speaker. I wish to appreciate this particular question and, hon Speaker, if I can be as transparent and as honest and as clear as possible.

The Integrated Crime and Violence Prevention Strategy, which speaks directly to the Western Cape's Safety Plan, our Safety Plan which was adopted in 2019. The National Integrated Crime and Violence Prevention Strategy was adopted in 2020. Those two plans ultimately speak to one another, and I firmly believe that we are on the right path with that plan.

That plan speaks to a whole-of-government approach. I have the privilege of serving in this particular position and I am also tasked with being the lead in terms of the safety priority. Education sits on that particular priority committee and we have constant engagements in that regard.

Just yesterday, I trust that members this side will be delighted to hear the following. There is one particular school that I know that he is familiar with in Elsies River. Just yesterday, the engagement between business, the engagement between the local councillor, but also Education, to ensure that certain interventions and certain measures are implemented at that particular school where we have seen videos circulate on social media, we have seen and heard of rumours of behaviour of learners, and it speaks to that whole-of-government approach. The same with the nationally adopted plan, which speaks to a broader scope of the role that parents need to play.

So in our role, to directly answer, we work closely with the Department of Education. If we become aware of any matters that has not been taken up with the seriousness that it deserves, we will be more than happy to make sure that those matters are addressed, because we would never want in this province or in any other province, to have an education system that is not functional or an education system where our learners are not adhering to a code of conduct.

We would want to ensure that we step in immediately and I would be more than happy to take that up and to raise it directly with the Provincial Minister for Education, and via that particular priority committee.

I think it is very important, the work that Health is doing to ensure that if a young person is born, help and assistance need to be provided to that young person the first 1 000 days. It paves the way so that that person can ultimately go into the mainstream education where that person and parents can get parenting programmes where we can then ultimately ensure the role that Social Development plays, because all those departments are key towards creating safer spaces, safer schools.

I thank the hon member for the question and my communication lines remain open to ensure that we can address any pertinent and direct matters with any particular school. I can also confirm I have the full commitment from the Provincial Minister of Education that if any matter like that does come up, we will instantly in our attempts make sure that it is adequately addressed.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise the hon member Bosman for a follow-up.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, through you.

Hon Minister, are you able to perhaps expand a bit more on the role that the victim support rooms play in the reporting of gender-based violence at police stations, and maybe outline some of the deficiencies in that system in the Western Cape?

The SPEAKER: Again, hon Minister, hon members, you are allowed one follow-up questions. Hon Minister, I am not going to dictate how you answer that. There was more than one question. Hon Minister, over to you.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
Thank you so much. I appreciate this question.

Hon Speaker, it was two weeks into my appointment, I visited a certain South African Police Service Station and upon requesting to visit the victim empowerment room, I was informed that the key was missing. I then indicated that I will wait up until that particular key is found. 38 minutes later the key was found and when we entered the victim empowerment room there was a bloody, stained hoody, and I can vividly see the hoody still in

front of me, that was in the victim empowerment room, stained with blood and that left a smell that almost knocked us off our feet.

I requested the information on why that particular victim empowerment room was locked, but also why there was a bloody, stained hoody in that particular victim empowerment room. I was informed that 10 months ago a known gang member was stabbed and he was then taken into the victim empowerment room where there was a chair, a bed and a couch.

His hoody was then removed and when the ambulance came, he was escorted to the ambulance. I would assume after that that particular victim empowerment room was locked.

The register confirmed that it was actually 11 months ago, prior to my visit, when there was a last entry into the victim empowerment room. I have since then, hon member Bosman, through you, hon Speaker, made it my mission that each and every announced, each and every unannounced visit I conduct at a SAPS station, I will visit the victim empowerment room.

We will check whether all the specifications have been met in that regard, but we will also ensure that the referral pathway is maintained at that particular victim empowerment room. To put it in plain terms, a person will approach the South African Police Service, a victim of gender-based violence. It is a female, potentially 40 years old. That particular person will then be escorted to our victim empowerment room that sits at the South African Police Service

and will be offered assistance. They could potentially also be offered any water or something to eat, depending on the circumstances.

So I triple check, hon Speaker, the rosters, I triple check whether we have sufficient volunteers at every victim empowerment room because it speaks directly to assistance that is needed to be provided.

We go further by making sure that should there be any gaps in the training of those volunteers that are working in our victim empowerment rooms, that they get the necessary help and assistance to be trained in a VEP. The VEP is also a key component towards making sure that the relevant SAPS officer has a high enough rank.

Hon Speaker, it is very clear that when we look at the Domestic Violence Act, the implementation thereof, our reports found that the coordinators of those particular programmes are usually, prior to my appointment, at the lowest level, at a constable level.

When a constable in real terms needs to get information from a higher ranking officer, we have often seen that rank and file kick in and the assistance is not provided.

Our reports, our intervention and making sure that we have oversight, ensures that a sufficiently ranked SAPS officer is actually the coordinator of that particular intervention or programme, be it a victim empowerment room or

the programme, but the programme also stretches beyond the work of just a physical building or a physical room. It also stretches, through you to hon member Bosman, it also stretches towards the programmes that victim empowerment programmes will undertake.

Funding that we provide to CPFs; funding that CPFs also get from National Government support via the Police Commissioner's Office with regards to crime prevention also speaks directly to the work that the victim empowerment coordinator at a local SAPS station must undertake. Those include your public imbizos, it includes the school visits that are undertaken by crime prevention, but also the engagements that CPFs have with a number of entities and role-players. To make it very clear, it could be in a local ward in Mitchells Plain. That particular Ward Committee will have a number of responsibilities, be it in sport, education, food supply or to look at the assistance that we need to provide in terms of education. It will always be towards making sure that the victim empowerment room and the Victim Empowerment Programme are fully utilised and used to the best of that particular station's benefit.

I can also confirm and I would encourage members of this House to visit the Bothasig Police Station. The Bothasig Police Station has a state of the art victim empowerment room and at that particular station we have a number of volunteers that are also actively playing their role, but at that particular victim empowerment room there is a number of toys, educational toys that will help and assist a victim.



There is also a number of soft equipment to help someone that goes through trauma, that will help someone to speak out or speak to someone, but also how the registers have been maintained, and any person on the committee that is conducting these oversights at SAPS stations, or visiting a VEP, I would encourage you to continue checking the register, continue to check the amount of volunteers and should there not be enough volunteers at that particular SAPS station to help in terms of the victim empowerment programme, to make sure that the station commander is addressed in that regard so that any victim, any survivor that enters a victim empowerment room, will not only feel safer, but will feel that he or she is going to get the help and assistance that they need. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise the hon member Bans for the final opportunity.

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, it is the duty of a station commander to ensure that all stations have victim friendly rooms.

In the past when the ANC governed, we ensured that all victim rooms have staff. In fact they have key personnel staff.

I want to ask from the MEC why is he not making use of the Safety Plan to provide the recruitment of professional counsellors and deploy them to police stations in the province, just like the ANC did in the past? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Bans. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
Thank you so much for that particular question. I would encourage hon member Bans, through you, hon Speaker, to once again support the Western Cape Government and my colleagues on this side's view in terms of the Equitable Share.

Should any further budget be derived or land within our Department, the department that I am leading, I would be more than happy to take such a matter into consideration, but as a government we have been proactive. We have been proactive by making sure that the referral pathway and the role that Social Development plays in that regard is maintained.

How it works, hon Speaker, is that someone is brutally raped, someone is assaulted and it is 11 o'clock at night. Every SAPS station will have a standby social worker on duty. A standby social worker that can be contacted. Should that particular station commander not do that, I want to know, because I would want to then hold that particular station commander accountable as well, and that is a professional service and it speaks directly to the referral pathway, because we believe that Social Development has a key role to play and that is why Social Development is the lead in the fight against gender-based violence.

Hon member Bans is quite correct, hon Speaker, that our victim empowerment rooms often get insufficient help, insufficient assistance. Hence I always say this, once we enter into a particular precinct, into a particular station, we often see the leadership of the station commander, we often see the leadership of the sector commanders, and when we have proper, credible leaders at a local precinct, we actually see all components at that particular SAPS station can function, especially the VEP coordinator and that particular programme and the interventions that they are rolling out.

So we will always stick to making sure of referral pathways, which is a professional service to our residents via Social Development, but we are always encouraging also NPOs that are doing amazing work alongside Government.

A number of NGOs and NPOs receive funding from this DA-led Government, and many of those are within the gender-based violence, by providing help and assistance, and those NGOs also play a vital role and they also deliver a professional service to any person that may not have had any help before, considering that gender-based violence is rife and I want to echo the following sentence: even the work that the Thuthuzela Centres are doing, they have set the benchmark in terms of how professional services must be rendered, what must be done, but also making sure that there is a prosecutor available to speak to any victim or survivor.

Those centres, like I have indicated earlier, is in partnership with the

Department of Social Development and the Department of Health, by making sure that those centres are fully functional and that a service can be rendered.

So we are always looking towards making sure that any service here in the Western Cape should be done in a professional way, with dedicated officers, with officers and support staff that are there to ultimately ensure that young people, victims, seniors, any person that is a victim of crime in this particular province, gets the help and assistance that they require.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, that brings us to the end of Question 5.

We will now move on to Question 6 as printed on the Question Paper. I recognise the Minister, Minister Allen.

**6. Mr F C Christians to ask Mr R I Allen, Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety:**

Whether his Department has any programmes to educate women on how to report incidences of gender-based violence; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
Thank you so much, hon Speaker. Yes, the Department does have programmes in place to educate women on how to report incidents of gender-

based violence.

The Department of Police Oversight and Community Safety supports the Department of Social Development as far as our budget allows. During the 2022/2023 financial year the Department embarked on a Gender-Based Violence First Respondent two day training programme in the Delft area, where 25 members of our Neighbourhood Watches were accredited with training in first responders.

The training attendees included female participants. Part of the training was also on how to report incidents of gender-based violence. This was in partnership with the Department of Social Development and various NGOs, the Trauma Centre, Triangle Project and Rape Crisis.

During the current financial year the Department facilitated a five day Gender-Based Violence Programme to the Mitchells Plain Community Police Forum. Participants from various community organisations, including Neighbourhood Watches. There were 30 participants in that particular case. The training of attendees included female participants and the training included how to report incidents of gender-based violence. This training was done in partnership with NGOs in the Mitchells Plain area as well with regards to dealing with the reporting of gender-based violence. Both programmes were well-received by all participants.

As a department we further give input into CPFs and the programmes that the

CPFs undertake. I provide the CPFs at a provincial level with our key priorities and our key priorities, like I have indicated in the very beginning, gender-based violence and combatting gender-based violence are key priorities.

So even in our engagements with CPFs to ensure that programmes around the reporting of any particular crime, including gender-based violence, it is also communicated effectively via all our stakeholders, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise the hon member Christians.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you for the Minister for that answer.

Hon Minister, you mentioned Mitchells Plain and Delft, it is two areas in the Metro. I know in the rural areas it is hard for females to report.

So did you do any interventions out in the rural areas and not just in the Metro? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Christians. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

Thank you so much. I have participated in interventions outside of the City of Cape Town, not one particular programme that was directly led by our Department.

I can confirm in the Bergrivier area, in the West Coast, matters with regards to gender-based violence and interventions, but it is in partnership with the municipality. I have not added in the numerous engagements, the numerous public meetings where gender-based violence often comes up, because otherwise I would have been reading an entire book.

Last week I was again in the West Coast and I was in an area called Hopefield and gender-based violence again featured prominently. We were together with the South African Police Service, which included our District Commissioner and our station commander.

So in a number of initiatives, even though the Department will not be the lead in terms of arranging and organising, but we would give input and we would actually be present. I have made a number of colleagues in this Department extremely upset. I have made them so upset because we have demanded and that we have instructed to ensure that this Department plays its role at any safety-related matter. So at CPF meetings our officials and our field workers are working extremely hard.

So even though a particular event engagement is not directly arranged by the Department, we partake and we partake all over the entire province.

Two days ago, three days ago I was in Beaufort West, and in Beaufort West we handed over a number of resource equipment to the relevant Neighbourhood Watch and I can again confirm that hearing from Mayor Botha. I was delighted to hear from Mayor Botha, who is the Central Karoo District Mayor, literally echoing the same sentiments that we have been echoing about the Western Cape Safety Plan, and I was extremely delighted that even in that district a key component on that agenda remains the implementation of our District Safety Plans with a key emphasis on key strategic points and gender-based violence is one of them.

I can confirm at that particular district summit we had Laingsburg. No, we had Laingsburg, yes. [Interjections.] We had Prince Albert. We were in Beaufort and we did not have Beaufort. [Interjections.] The Minister was with me. Minister Mackenzie was with me. We were in Beaufort and we did not have Beaufort, but we had the district, but we had Laingsburg and we received updates with regards to the District Safety Plans, and I can confirm that that particular district has a Safety Plan. A key component of the Safety Plan is programmes, interventions to eradicate gender-based violence, and I was delighted when Mayor Botha echoed how delighted she is with the Safety Plan, and how the Safety Plan in the Central Karoo is working, and how we need to work together towards making sure that we are fostering not only working relationships, but also holding each other accountable, and she was there for the entire day.



I do see across our country, across our province, the role that this Western Cape Government is playing towards making sure that other provinces can also take a leaf out of our book. I was delighted when the KZN Premier visited less than a month ago, and part of that engagements also was very clear about the role that departments are needing to take in the fight against gender-based violence, and not to merely say it is one entity that is responsible.

We would want to make sure that SAPS does the investigation, that investigations are not dropped, that that particular investigator has all the help and assistance. The work we do with our prosecutors and in engaging our DPP here in our province, to ensure that we are able to help and assist.

I can also further inform this House that at my most recent engagement with Correctional Services one particular matter that I placed squarely in front of Commissioner Klaas, was the matter of our parolees and parolees being released into a community. Often parolees that have committed heinous gender-based violence against community members, against females.

One of the key things that we continue to raise in that space is the role that Correctional Services needs to play in the rehabilitation of those offenders and making sure that certain offenders and category crime offenders must ultimately make sure that they are part of those rehabilitation programmes even in prison, because if someone comes out and reoffend, it is ultimately never welcomed and it should be condemned, because we want to create a

society where every key stakeholder plays a role.

I can also confirm the work that Minister Bredell is doing alongside Minister Ivan Meyer, which is key, and Minister Anroux Marais, which is key in terms of the faith-based organisations.

When we engage those organisations we are so aware that the influence that those particular entities, organisations have, be it in the Christian faith or in the Muslim faith or any other faith, we want to make sure that their influence stretches into their congregations, into their meeting rooms and the message must always be clear: that gender-based violence will never be condoned. It should be condemned, and that every person must ultimately make sure that they play a role towards making sure that there is no hint of gender-based violence whatsoever. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise the hon member Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, to the Minister through you.

Hon Minister, can you tell us whether the 2017 policy by SAPS on reducing barriers to the reporting of sexual offences and domestic violence, has been successful in the Western Cape and if the police stations in the Western Cape are adhering to that six point plan?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Bosman. Again, hon Minister, there is more than one question. I am not going to dictate how you answer them.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I would not want to miss the question. If I can just request that the hon member repeats.

The SPEAKER: Sure. Hon member, please repeat. Can the Table staff just stop the clock.

Mr G BOSMAN: I would like to know whether the Minister can tell us whether the 2017 SAPS policy on reducing barriers to the reporting of sexual offences and domestic violence, is it working in the Western Cape?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much for this particular question.

I would not want to get it wrong because our Implementation Plan, Cabinet in the year 2019 at a national level adopted a Gender-Based Violence Implementation Plan, which each and every province then also had to implement.

Like I have indicated earlier on, hon Speaker, to hon member Bosman, the Western Cape Government has adopted our provincial Implementation Plan to fight gender-based violence. When we look at our oversight role I can confirm that we are making headway, we are making great progress in that regard, because we want to ensure that our SAPS members are trained, that they are equipped and that where there are any inefficiencies in any particular process, be it lodging a matter, a detective not being able to take a proper statement, or if there is any hint that that particular person has not received the necessary help and care from a South African Police Service member.

So we are closely monitoring those interventions from our side and I would be more than happy should hon member Bosman request that particular question in writing, to submit it via a parliamentary reply so that we can extensively respond in that regard, by making sure that this House is then also fully aware of those interventions.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise the hon member Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, can I ask whether these programmes are only directed to women in communities, or also to men who must be educated about the dangers and social-ills associated with gender-based violence? Whether they are offenders or not, what programmes

are there for men specifically in these communities?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Cassiem. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
Thank you so much, hon member Cassiem, for that particular question.

It is one key aspect that you are mentioning and I want to say thank you for raising it, because we have seen when we have men's dialogue and from the South African Police Service side I have participated in a number of men's dialogues where we discuss these particular matters, and it ranges on a two-pronged approach.

On the one hand that predominantly men are the perpetrators and we need to address men in a way where we can ultimately foster a change in behaviour. The second prong in that regard is that we know that at times men are also victims and to eliminate any stigma, to eliminate any fears of being stigmatised, but also wanting to avoid embarrassment. Many men do not report any matter with regards to gender-based violence.

I can confirm that during the last release of the crime stats it again became very evident that when we look at the breakdown between sexual offences, gender-based violence, there is an increase in terms of attacks on men and gender-based violence specifically against men as well, but we will continue from our side to make sure that we participate as a department with the South

African Police Service.

I think it is very important to highlight the following: I know that we as a department, hon Speaker, have done so much in our oversight role, we have done so much by making sure that we are stepping in, we are stepping up, the LEAP programme which in part has been adopted by the Provincial Government in Gauteng in their own skewed way, but, hon Speaker, this Department, that I have the privilege of leading, have stepped up.

We have done so much and I am delighted when I hear questions are phrased in a certain way: What is your Department doing? Because at times it might not be directly my Department, but it must be where the safety leads, which I have the honour of having at the moment, engage other departments around the programmes that they are doing.

I have done a number of events and engagements with Social Development, where we are there, we are present, our officials are there. With Education, with National Government and whenever we have a men's dialogue and the last men's dialogue that I actively participated in, was in Khayelitsha. At that particular event we had over 1 200 men, but also the budget that was derived from the South African Police Service for that particular men's dialogue, was also key towards where we needed it to happen, because at that particular quarter Khayelitsha was the top ranking station in terms of gender-based violence.

Then also even if we participate in our bilateral discussions with the City of Cape Town, we ensure that certain priorities that this province have undertaken are covered, and I want to re-emphasise those priorities again, it is safety. Safety remains a priority and in safety there is a number of key priorities, like gender-based violence, that we will continue to advocate for, but secondly also it's jobs, and thirdly, when we look at where our country is in terms of electricity.

Electricity and the lack of electricity has contributed to such a lot of social-ills increasing, gender-based violence increasing and SAPS on record by saying that at certain precincts we have seen that during loadshedding crime increases, which includes gender-based violence.

So that are priorities that this Government has undertaken. Each and every Provincial Minister that is sitting here is attached to a particular priority. We serve on a number of priorities as well and we work closely together, because the one thing that irks us, the one thing that upsets us is that when there is a silo approach to the work that we are needing to achieve.

We know that safety is everyone's responsibility. Each and every department has a role to play to ensure that a young person, from growing up to the day that person passes away, should be where that person has opportunities, has everything in their way of life to be a constructive citizen in our country.

So we will definitely from our side, directly to hon member Cassiem, any

other stakeholder we engage, but we also engage in a very constructive way, but also depending on budgets and where certain interventions are happening so that we can engage in those men's dialogue as well, and to any man that is currently listening to me, or that might be listening to this particular reply, I would want to say to that man should he feels that there is stigma attached if he is being abused, if he is a victim, I will encourage him to reach out to the South African Police Service, to reach out to a Thuthuzela Centre, so that he can get the help and assistance that he requires.

Minister Fernandez took us into confidence by explaining the trauma associated to being a survivor, and we would never want any child, any woman, or any man be a victim of gender-based violence in this province or in any other province here in our country. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, are there any further follow-ups? No further follow-ups. That brings us to the end of Question 6.

We now move on to Question 7. I recognise the hon Minister, Minister Allen.

**7. Ms A P Bans to ask Mr R I Allen, Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety:**

With regard to the arrests of taxi drivers in their homes at night with



alleged warrants of arrests for various traffic and road offences in the City of Cape Town:

- (1) Whether his Department has played any role in it; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) whether any LEAP officers were involved; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

Thank you so much, hon Speaker. If I can just, with permission, have a little water and be in unity with hon member Bans as she is also drinking water.

The SPEAKER: Can I please ask that the Table staff stop the clock. Thank you very much, you may continue, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

The Head of Department, Advocate Pillay, our Chief Director and Director: Security Risk Management, attends daily provincial [Inaudible.] meetings and provided regular updates on, amongst other, incidents, developments and arrest.

I have also been kept updated and in accordance to my role in this particular Cabinet, kept the Premier and the Cabinet members abreast of the situation.

There were daily Cabinet meetings chaired by the Premier, wherein the Department of Police Oversight and Community Safety, Mobility and Local

Government, briefed the Premier and and Provincial Ministers on the status of the strike action and integrated response of all agencies to address the situation.

Point (2), LEAP officers were deployed to areas experiencing flareups within the priority area, to support the South African Police Service. LEAP officers continue to work hand-in-hand with the South African Police Service, strengthening their hand in efforts to combat all forms of lawlessness, regardless of who the offender might be.

Our LEAP officers will continue to be deployed to areas based on the data and evidence, and where the need is the greatest. Our LEAP officers are working tirelessly to ensure greater safety across our province.

This particular strike action that we saw during the taxi unrest ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... is one that we would never want to see again, where six members, including an international foreigner, was murdered.

So we were very clear from a Cabinet point of view by briefing the Cabinet, the Premier chairing that particular meeting, but also getting the South

African Police Service into the room so that, not only be kept abreast, but that we can ultimately make sure that should there be any resources, or a lack of resources, that if a municipality or our Department needs to step in, we can do it on a quick basis.

The question is also filled with some offences. The specific question in terms of homes at night, and if the hon member has any information to back up, in my view, a perceived allegation, I would make it my mission to make sure that those matters are investigated, so that any person that did not do his or her work, will be held accountable so that we can get to the bottom of it, because I would not want in all that I do, have reputational damage on the SAPS, or reputational damage on LEAP, or CPFs, or Neighbourhood Watch members.

When we address certain matters it is actually to strengthen their hand, to make sure that the service is professional.

So I am looking forward to hearing inputs from the relevant hon member with regards to the specific question, so that we can tackle matters in a way where we see safer communities all across Cape Town and the Western Cape. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Bans.

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I must say I

appreciate the effort of the MEC saying that I can come with information if I have at hand. I will definitely do it so.

My question, Chair, will be in the light of the fact that the LEAP officers have been used in the past in persecution of poor informal settlements, are there any actions, steps that are being taken by the MEC to prevent the use of LEAP officers by J P Smith for things that are outside of their mandate?

Can the MEC clarify the checks and balances that are in place to prevent the abuse of power and ensure that the deployment of LEAP officers is consistent with the scope of the Safety Plan? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Hon Minister, again that is more than one question. I am not going to dictate to you how you need to answer that question.

Please bear in mind there are 20 seconds left for questions. So over to you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much for this particular question. I am going to try to keep a straight face in answering it.

This Parliament, hon Speaker, and the committee directly ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, I am really sorry to do this, but I am going to draw your attention to that the time has expired, so please conclude.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: If I receive any information with regards to a politician that is dictating where LEAP must be, I would need that information so that it can be verified. Our Department, in terms of the payment transfer agreement ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister, please take your seat. Your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... this Government. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister.

Hon members, that is the end of Questions for Oral Reply. Outstanding replies will be printed in Hansard.

We now move on to Statements by Members in terms of Rule 145 and I recognise the DA.

Mr I M SILEKU: Hon Speaker, this past weekend saw flooding devastating our City and rural towns all across the province. Various roads have been washed away, up to 12 000 people have been affected and an unknown

number of individuals have unfortunately passed away.

The Western Cape Government activated the Provincial Disaster Management Centre on Sunday after the South African Weather Services confirmed that the approaching storm would be more severe than what was initially anticipated.

The DA in the Western Cape warmly welcomes and appreciates the proactive approach that has been so far taken by the Department of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning in ensuring that communities receive aid and that our citizens' lives are protected.

We would like to further acknowledge and thank all other stakeholders who are providing assistance, cooking meals and delivering groceries. These actions warm our hearts and a whole-of-society approach is exactly the approach we need to be taking during the floods.

Hon Speaker, while commendable progress has so far been made with various roads being reopened and mop-up operation underway, these events highlight the need for this province to continue investing in early warning infrastructure and ensure new infrastructure is designed with adjusted climate change parameters in mind.

While it is still too early to calculate the cost of the storm, if you would in the context of the June floods and the recent coastal damage due to storm

surges, this is becoming a very expensive winter for the Western Cape.

The disaster response of the Western Cape Government to the severe weather has since shifted from saving lives to recovery and humanitarian aid coordination. The DA, alongside the Western Cape Government, will continue assisting various communities across the province.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, please conclude.

Mr I M SILEKU: I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the ANC. Hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Speaker. As the ANC we welcome the setting up of the Legislature Ad Hoc Committee on the energy crisis. The energy crisis facing our country is very serious and what is needed is a cooperative approach to seek solutions.

What is clear, however, is that the Ad Hoc Committee is choosing to make cheap politics and not operate as a non-partisan committee of the House.

Ultimately we do need a just transition to an energy mix which has more renewables and less fossil fuels. However, the DA in this committee is hiding the fact that the DA City of Cape Town has imposed a surcharge above

what NERSA has said, not only for this year, but also for last year. In 2023 NERSA determined an increase of 15,1% for Eskom supplied electricity to municipalities. The DA set an increase of 17,6%. This is 2,5% more.

Then also in 2022 NERSA determined an increase of 7,47%. The City increased the price by 9,6%. 2% more than NERSA. The DA City has thus charged 4,5% more than the NERSA rate over the last two years.

Now the problem is that despite the ANC having proposed that both NERSA and the Mayor of the City of Cape Town are called to the Ad Hoc Committee, this has not happened.

While the DA chooses to attack the Minister of Electricity, they are penalising the poor by imposing surcharges on electricity. This is unlawful. The National Treasury have confirmed that the DA's doing what they are doing has no basis in legislation. The courts themselves have dismissed with costs the City's urgent application to set aside the NERSA tariff.

The DA in the province are scared of the DA in the City. They are not prepared to call out this unlawful and anti-poor behaviour by the City, and we also know that the committee itself refuses to condemn the practise by the DA in the City to deduct money from those buying prepaid electricity ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time has expired.



The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: ... if they are in arrears for other accounts.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, your time has ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: So what [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, your time has expired. I recognise the EFF.

Ms A CASSIEM: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, on 2 October the EFF, together with the Western Cape Taxi Industry, will engage in a provincial shutdown and a march to Ndebele Municipal Complex to demand the immediate release of all taxis that have been frivolously and unjustly impounded by the racist and draconian City of Cape Town under Geordin Hill-Lewis, with the recurring theme that the struggle of the taxi industry is the struggle of the poor and the working class.

The shutdown will be comprehensive and will also bring to light society's concerns stemming from taxi passenger harassment at the hands of law enforcement officials; the ever increasing gangsterism in the province; social-ills associated with drugs and alcohol abuse; collapse of service delivery in the province, especially towards the poor; high unemployment rates; unlawful evictions; racism; high crime rates; electricity tariff

increases, among others.

We further call upon community members of this province to join this progressive march which is intended against a racist Government which does not care about the needs of the poor Black, Coloured and Indian population in this province.

It is in times like these where the community of this province must stand together and face a common enemy made in the form of this racist DA Government, which only serves the interests of Whites and the rich.

Proper service delivery, meaningful jobs and proper security are only reserved for the Whites in this province, who are made privileged at the expense of other racial groups. The State funds, which should be for everyone, are channelled to services which only assist Whites in this province.

We cannot remain idle anymore and tolerate orchestrated injustices from a White Government which is trying by all means to uphold the legacy of colonialism and apartheid.

We are also aware that the pretentious City of Cape Town is now planning to house an Urban Mobility Summit, exactly following march, 3 and 4 October, where they will be featuring the taxi industry as part of the agenda to formalise it.

The reality is that this DA-led City of Cape Town is doing everything in its power to destroy the taxi industry and promote its bus service, MyCiti, and the White-owned Golden Arrow Bus Services.

In conclusion, hon Speaker, the EFF remains the vanguard of the poor and the working class and it will do everything in its power to protect the interest ...[Interjections.]

*[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time is up. Thank you very much. I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, over the weekend we celebrated Heritage Day, a day that brings all of us together to appreciate the incredible mix of cultures and heritages we have right here in South Africa. These differences, like threads in a woven fabric, make our country stronger when we embrace them.

Sadly, while we were celebrating the richness of our culture and diversity, the Western Cape was hit by some of the worst flooding it has seen in a long time. This flood has caused significant damage to important infrastructure, left people stranded and tragically led to the loss of lives.

Now as the residents of the Western Cape we need to come together just like we did on Heritage Day. We must lend a helping hand and work together to rebuild our cities using a united approach that involves everyone in our society.

We must acknowledge the diverse group of individuals and organisations that have contributed to emergency and relief services across our province so far. These efforts encompass not only the generosity of ordinary citizens who have prepared meals, provided financial support, donated groceries and offered invaluable assistance such as accommodation and transport, but also the dedicated efforts to our first responders who risk their lives daily to save our lives. They are heroes and we are truly grateful for all they do for us.

By working hand-in-hand we can rebuild and restore dignity to the people of the Western Cape who have lost so much due to this flooding. Let us stand together and make a difference in their lives. A whole-of-society approach is what we need. Ubuntu is what we need and is what we need during this crisis. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise GOOD.

Mr P DE VILLIERS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Most DA members discount what I say in this House as coming from the new kid on the block and my hope is never to lose sight of that part of me. I think most of the members in this House have forgotten how they got here and why.

We stand and speak in this House on behalf of those we are again trying hard to convince return us here next year.

If civilian replacements who voted for us, communicate and act towards one another, given the opportunity, would DA supporters object to every ANC motion proposed just because it comes from the ANC, and *vice versa*? Because that is what we do, often to the detriment of those who we represent.

Politicians can learn a great deal from our Springbok rugby team. They have already triumphed in my eyes. They have set an example for all of us and shown us the power of inclusivity and common cause. A pair of White Afrikaner coaches, a Xhosa-speaking captain and a mix masala of players and a sprinkling of gold dust provided by the Boland Boys, similar to the composition of this House, but when they line up to sing the national anthem, they are all one colour.

The Springboks are teaching us that which we as politicians would do well to understand. If I had to arrange for the top brass of the DA to play a rugby match against ANC ...[intervenes]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P DE VILLIERS: ... or EFF against the Freedom Front Plus, with the exception of an odd quota player, the two matches will still be Black versus White.

Only when we as politicians start acting in a manner that our rugby players act, bringing all our people in as equals, we will service the mandate we have been given to bring about the stability and contentment that [Inaudible.] brings, and with it real hope for a better, more inclusive and successful future. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise the ACDP.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, the Western Education Department is still failing our learners, to place learners close to their homes.

The problem is that engaging with people in communities it is difficult to see how students are placed outside of the area where they live. Let me give an example. I have been in Mitchells Plain for this week. A pupil staying in Rocklands, Mitchells Plain, gets placed in Tafelsig. The mother said to me, "I can barely afford food on my table, but it is R230 per week to get my child to school," and this is unacceptable.

The Western Cape Education Department talks about the retention rate, but this is how we are going to lose our learners. I do not think they understand the difference between Rocklands and Tafelsig, and I can go on and on. The other lady I engaged with was a lady that said she moved from Primrose Park in July of this year to Mitchells Plain, and the children, three children, she went to the school, they could not be placed, a whole year wasted.

So I really – and I want the Minister to look at this because we are losing pupils because they cannot get to school and this week the mother's got R230, next week she does not have R230. What does she do? The child stays at home.

So it is a problem and I am asking the Minister, I have mentioned it before, that we give preference to learners in the area that is closest to them and not outside of the area. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I recognise the ANC.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

I rise today, hon Deputy Speaker, to acknowledge the presence of the young Palestinian academic and activist, Mr Alaga, Ehab Alaga, who joins us in the gallery today. Mr Alaga's presence here today marks an important development in the deep relations between South Africans and Palestinians.

Recently the African National Congress-led National Government announced that Palestinian passport holders will no longer require a visa to visit South Africa.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Under the new regime Palestinian citizens will be granted entry visas at the airports, ports and border crossings into South Africa for a period of 90 days.

Commenting on this decision by the South African Government, the Palestinian Minister of Foreign Affairs, Riyadh al-Maliki, welcomed the move on behalf of the people of Palestine and acknowledged the message of solidarity by South Africa for Palestinians this move sent.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the decision, however, is long overdue. Today, 75 years after the Nakba, over 6 million Palestinians still live in exile or as refugees. Today, 75 years later, the call of the United Nations General Assembly 194, which affirms the rights of all Palestinians to return to their homelands, must continue to echo throughout the power making chambers of this world.

Today, after 67 years of illegal apartheid occupation, we must continue to insist on a peaceful, just and prosperous settlement in the Middle East which



has as its aims the return of all Palestinians to their homeland and the establishment of an independent free state of Palestine, with East Jerusalem as its capital. I thank.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

An HON MEMBER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

SASSA has once again been in deep crisis with the disbursement of social grant payments. It follows three weeks of strife for pensioners and people with disabilities who could not access their grant payments via SASSA's Postbank payment system. The shortcoming of the Postbank system error prevented the poor and vulnerable of our country from accessing their only source of income. This left families unable to buy necessities such as food and electricity. However, this is nothing new and has been an ongoing issue since last year.

There is an urgent need for an effective social grant payment system, one that protects the dignity of grant recipients and are free from corruption and poor management. Last week I invited SASSA Western Cape to the Standing Committee on Social Development for an urgent briefing to explain the current issues with the payment of social grounds, in particular in the Western Cape. The province's pay points and the role of the Post Office in all of this.

This request for a briefing follows the revelation that despite a chorus of apologies by Minister Zulu for Postbank payment issues, the Department of Social Development apparently returned over R15 billion of social relief distress grants to the National Treasury in the past financial year. This comes as thousands who applied for the R350 grant have not received it. The Department said it could not locate SRD grant applicants through their phones. However, no other alternative options were used to reach these applicants.

While the DA in the Western Cape are tirelessly trying to improve and better the social and economic conditions of our residents, our efforts continue to be hindered by these kind of challenges caused by the National Government failures. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the Freedom Front Plus.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, the Freedom Front Plus believes that what South Africa is currently witnessing is an ANC who has failed to govern effectively as a political party within a democratic state and a capitalist economy. They remain a revolutionary socialist movement, still clinging to Marxism.

We believe the ANC's ultimate objective is the total destruction of South

Africa's capitalist system by imposing the most heavy taxes on the middle and upper middle classes and exempting the rest. They want a classless society. That is the ANC's ultimate objective, and the total dependence of the masses on the Government grants to keep them State dependent and loyal voters forever and ever.

SOEs are bankrupt, but commercialisation or privatisation is not considered by the ANC, even at the expense of job losses and rocketing unemployment. Then we have land expropriation, the new Health Bill and cadre deployment are all part of this bromance between Russia's President Putin and Xi Jinping of China, to establish South Africa as a communist satellite of Russia.

The Freedom Front Plus believe that only self-determination for the Western Cape can save this province. We need to rid this land of the ANC. The ANC acts like a Grade 6 child attempting to write a university paper on economics. I thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise Al Jama-Ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the first chapter of the Holy Koran continues

“Know but indeed man transgresses.”

“Because he sees himself self-sufficient.”

“Indeed to your Lord is the return.”

“Have you seen the one who forbids?”

“A servant when he prays.”

“Have you seen if he is upon guidance?”

“Or enjoins righteousness?”

“Have you seen if he denies and turns away?”

“Does he not know that Allah *subhanahu wa ta'ala* sees?”

I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very [Interjections.], thank you very much. I recognise the Democratic Alliance.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, last week the Western Cape Provincial Economic Review and Outlook for 2023 was revealed, and this revealed that the Human Development Index for the

Western Cape have improved over the last decade, indicating progress and well-being, education, healthcare and living standards. It was further revealed that this is occurring despite the unprecedented immigration.

The HDI is a measurement of a country's or region's human development in health, education and income per capita. It has three basic dimensions of human development; long health and life, and healthy life; knowledge and a decent standard of living.

A further four indicators are used to calculate the index: life expectancy at birth; mean years of schooling; expected years of schooling and gross income per capita. Currently while South Africa stands at 0,64 as at 2021, the Western Cape has a higher and thus more positive outlook at 0,74.

Further, the PERO reveals that the learner retention rate in primary schools in the Western Cape have increased 10 percentage points, from 83% in 2018 to 93% in 2022, and that learner retention in high schools have increased 6 percentage points, from 66% in 2018 to 72% in 2022.

Despite the economic challenges we face, such as unemployment, loadshedding and crime, the Western Cape Province continues to work towards creating an environment for every person in our province to flourish and we will not stop there. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. That brings us to the end

of Statements.

In terms of Rule 145(6) I now give one or more members of the Executive an opportunity to respond to the members statements. I recognise the hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, what the hon member Dugmore did not say is that NERSA increased the electricity tariffs by 18,65% and by 12,2%. The only disgrace here is the ANC Government that fails this country. They bankrupt Eskom ...[intervenes]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: What about the City putting more ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... and they are busy bankrupting ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... that is – and they are busy

bankrupting our country.

NERSA increased 18,65% to Eskom and then they expect the City to increase by 15%. That is the disgrace, nothing else. [Interjections.]

Hon Chairperson and to the City of Cape Town's and the taxi dispute. The City of Cape Town only tries one thing and that is to ensure safe public transport to the communities, [Interjections.] and therefore the City of Cape Town and Minister Mackenzie are busy negotiating with the taxi industry to ensure a safe public transport. That is the only dispute. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: That is no response. That is not even a response.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any further – there are. I recognise you, Minister Maynier.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I would like to thank the hon member Deidre Baartman for her very positive comments on learner retention in our province.

The hon member Ferlon Christians will be aware, given the fact that he is a veteran of the Education Committee, that the education system is under massive admissions pressure and for that reason of course it is not always

possible for us to accommodate learners at either their school of choice or indeed the school which is closest to them, but certainly as I have said to the hon member before, I would really appreciate it if he would furnish me with the details or the relevant details of the learners in question so that we can look at finding a solution together. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Any further comments or statements by the Ministers? No? I take it not. That brings us to the end of Members Statements.

We now move over to Notices of Motion. In terms of Rule 151 all Notices of Motion by members are required to be delivered to the Secretary for placing it on the Order Paper. These Motions have been duly submitted and published on the Order Paper below the line.

### **MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

Mr G BRINKUIS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes that on 9 September 2023 the world observed International Alcohol Spectrum Disorder (FASD) and calls for substantial preventable measures to be implemented to drastically eliminate the contributing factors of FASD.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*



The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the Provincial Government's plan to recover from the storm in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

Ms A P BANS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the rise in young teenage girls "vanishing" in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

Ms A P BANS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the Western Cape Government's failure to deal with the increase in gang violence.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the failures of the Safe Schools Unit of the

Western Cape Education Department.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We now move to Motions without Notice. I would like to inform you that in terms of Standing Rule 150 pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolence and congratulatory were submitted to the Programming Authority prior to this plenary on 15 August 2023.

Members are also reminded that the Motions without Notice pertaining to congratulatory and condolence will not be allowed in this Sitting that have not been processed by the Programming Authority.

I have been informed that in the Programming Authority meeting on 15 August 2023 political parties did submit the names of hon members in the desired order of speaking, and who had wished to move a Motion without Notice in the sitting of this House.

I will therefore, just for noting and for the purpose of the minutes, call out the hon members whose names have accordingly been submitted and approved. The following member motions have been approved by the Programming Authority as follows – but before I list the names, can I just confirm with the Table staff that 15 August 2023 is not correct? Can I have the date if that is – okay. For the correction and for the order of Hansard, this is accordingly that the Programming Authority was on 26 September

2023. Apologies for that error.

So according to 26 September, the following have been approved: hon Bosman, hon Maseko, hon Brinkhuis, hon Kama, hon Sayed, hon Sayed, hon Nkondlo and hon Kama.

I now put the Motions duly submitted and approved by the Programming Authority to the House. Are there any objection? No objections? Agreed to. The Motions will appear in the minutes of the proceedings and in Hansard in each individual member's names as if that member had read them out aloud.

I now afford the opportunity to members to move Motions without Notice as per Standing Rule of 152(d). This could also include Motions without Notice that were not approved of in the Programming Authority meeting and please be reminded that the 30 minutes as per the Standing Rules applied.

I now recognise the hon member Bosman.

### **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House takes note of the Cultural Affairs Awards that took place on 26 September 2023. The awards honoured individuals and

organisations who have made exceptional contributions in the areas of arts, culture, heritage, language, libraries, archives, museums, heritage and geographical names, and that this House further notes that the winners shine as a beacon of hope for communities throughout the province. They have done tremendous work in their respective fields. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to.

I recognise the hon member Murray.

Ms C T MURRAY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the lack of transparency on the steps taken to protect the over 136 000 jobs in the Western Cape directly affected by the renewal of the African Growth and Opportunity Act from the Minister of Trade, Industry and Competition himself, Ebrahim Patel, during a briefing to the NCP this week. That the House further notes that this was a crucial meeting and it was cut short without an opportunity for members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament to fully get clarity on their many needs and concerns regarding AGOA. I

so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

I recognise you again, hon member Murray.

Ms C T MURRAY: Thank you. I move without notice:

That the House notes with disappointment that the Department of Home Affairs has still not implemented a remote working visa and is unable to provide any indication of when this will be done. That the House notes further that the remote working visa is a guaranteed gateway of job creation and it was announced almost two years ago by the President

himself. That the House further notes that the lack of urgency in finalising this visa is typical of an ANC National Government's lacklustre approach to job creation. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections.

An HON MEMBER: Object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

I recognise the hon member Christians.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes between October 2022 and March 2023 that 283 criminal cases were dropped from the court roll due to police mistakes, includes this total of 77 cases of GBV reported by women. Notes that

these are administrative errors that could have been avoided. That these errors are a glaring indictment of SAPS in the Western Cape. It points out the level of inefficiency eminent at police stations. SAPS stands accused of having failed the women in GBV cases. 68 cases, files out of 283 were not presented in court. It is shocking to note that 104 cases out of 283 were dropped because of incomplete investigations. Further notes that Knysna, Vredendal, George Police Stations were top of the list where important documents were missing. Lutzville, Kraaifontein, Kuils River are police stations where incomplete investigations hampered the work of the courts. Calls for justice to prevail for the women mentioned in the GBV cases. That these cases be re-examined and readmitted to the court roll. The perpetrators in the police mistakes be identified and suffer the disgrace of dismissal from SAPS. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to.

Thank you very much, hon member Sileku.

Mr I M SILEKU: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House takes note of the recent flooding that devastated our City and rural towns all across the province. Various roads have been washed away. Up to 12 000 people have been affected and an unknown number of individuals have unfortunately passed. This House notes that proactive steps have been taken by the Western Cape Department and the Provincial Disaster Management Centre was activated on Sunday after the South African Weather Service has confirmed that the storm would be more severe than what it was initially anticipated. The disaster response of the Western Cape Government to the severe weather has since shifted from saving life to recovery and humanitarian aid coordination. This House further notes that mop-up operations have since started and various roads have since been reopened. While rebuilding commences, the Western Cape Government is also considering asking for the deployment of the South African National Defence Force engineers to assist with rebuilding critical infrastructure in the Western Cape. †Dat hierdie Huis prys verleen aan die uiteenlopende groep individue en organisasies wat bygedra het tot hulp en nooddienste reg oor ons provinsie. Dit sluit nie net die toegewyde pogings van eerste reageerders nie, maar ook die gulheid van gewone burgers wat etes voorberei het, finansiële ondersteuning gebied het, kruideniersware geskenk het en onskatbare bystand verleen het. That this House gives praise to the diverse group of individuals and organisations that contributed to aid and emergency services all across our province. It does not only include the committed efforts of first responders, but also the generosity of common citizens who prepared



meals, offered financial support, donated groceries and provided invaluable assistance. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Just a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: What is your point of order, hon member?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: The point of order, hon Deputy Speaker, is just I did not quite hear the beginning. We would like to support the motion like that, but is it correct that the hon member started off by referring to Gauteng in his statement? [Interjections.] No, I just want – we did not hear.

Mr I M SILEKU: No, there was no Gauteng.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, no, there was no Gauteng mentioned, and I can confirm.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: No, then we cannot ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. So are there any objections to the motion being moved?

An HON MEMBER: No.

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections, thank you. The motion will be accepted. Thank you very much.

I now recognise the hon member Kaizer-Philander.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. On behalf of the Democratic Alliance:

That this House notes, with approval, the nomination of Chris Pappas as the DA Premier's candidate for KwaZulu Natal in the 2024 elections. Pappas received international recognition when *Time* magazine honoured him as one of 24 young leaders in the leadership category on the Time100 Next list earlier this month. *Time* commended his transformative impact on the uMngeni Municipality since taking office in November 2021. His achievements include restoring the municipality's fiscal balance, a feat not seen in more than a decade, and facilitating the integration of 175 new homes into the electricity grid. Hon Deputy Speaker, this House further notes that under Pappa's

leadership uMngeni was declared debt free in less than a year into governance. This House send its best wishes to Premier candidate Chris Pappas in his mission to save KwaZulu Natal, who is one of the country's biggest economic contributors. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion be moved without notice? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: This is actually a waste of our time.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections?

An HON MEMBER: We object.

An HON MEMBER: Object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections.

An HON MEMBER: We object. We object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

I now recognise the hon member Van der Westhuizen. [Interjections.] Hon member, order please. Hon member Van der Westhuizen, you may proceed.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjections.]

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Waar is die grond?

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Where is the land?]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ... I move without notice ...[Interjections.]

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Julle moet die grond teruggee.

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You must give back the land.]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ...

That the House notes with approval the Western Cape Department of Agriculture's launch of a Provincial Veterinary Week, notes that animal health is an important part of the successful agriculture sector, especially as it relates to the exportation of meat products. Notes further that the support offered by the Department in this regard is to the benefit of our farmers and enables them to grow their agri-businesses, creating much needed employment in the Western Cape, and just for the

hon member Dugmore, it is the Western Cape Department of Agriculture, not Gauteng. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Interjections.] Are there any objections to the motion being moved? Hon member Dugmore? [Interjections.] Hon member Dugmore, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections, agreed to. Thank you very much.

Hon member Dugmore, now is your chance.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House extends its deepest regret at the passing of Lieutenant Commander Gillian Elizabeth Hector, Master Warrant Officer William Masela Mathipa, the coxswain, and Warrant Officer Class 1 Mmokwapa Lucas Mojela, coxswain in training, while performing a naval exercise off the Simon's Town coast. Conveys its deepest condolences to the family and the friends of these navy marines, while calling upon the

House to observe a moment of silence at the beginning of the next Sitting, as well as requesting that the Premier declares a provincial day of mourning for these men and women who served our country and were based in our City and province. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to.

I now recognise hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Once again I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House commends the countless men and women who continue to mop-up and clean up after the devastating rains and floods that besieged our province this past weekend. Acknowledges the tremendous work done by Disaster Management staff, emergency personnel, non-governmental organisations, churches, mosques and community organisations, as they stood together to lighten the burden of the poor, especially those in the rural areas and in our historical township communities, who were most affected by these floods. Condemns municipalities in this province who fail to invest in infrastructure, proper maintenance on sewerage, as well as making land available in

their municipalities.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved?

An HON MEMBER: Yes. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. [Interjections.] The motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

I now recognise hon member Sayed. [Interjections.]

Order, hon members. Order, hon members.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates Herzlia High School for winning the Western Cape Metro under 14 Kay Motsepe School Championship, but notes with deep concern that these champions could not represent the region at the Western Cape Provincial Finals in Saldanha Bay this past weekend because the match was scheduled to be played on the Jewish Sabbath. Whilst acknowledging the great work done to develop sport by

some non-governmental organisations, we call upon all sporting bodies or organisations to respect the holy days of all believers. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being printed on the Order Paper? No objections, agreed to.

I recognise you again, hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House urgently calls upon the Provincial Government to address the critical safety concerns plaguing Hillside Primary in Mitchells Plain. This perilous situation marked by drug-trafficking on the nearby hill and recurring break-ins, demand for immediate attention and for collective efforts. As the ANC we seek substantial investments in the infrastructure and personnel to fortify security measures and ensure the safety and well-being of learners and staff. Moreover, we implore the Education Department's Safe Schools Unit to amplify its responsiveness and support in addressing these distressing issues. Forging a secure environment which is conducive to learning and growth. Time is of essence. We beseech prompt action to protect our educational sanctum. I so move.



*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to.

I recognise hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the AGOA Forum to be hosted in South Africa in November 2023 in Johannesburg, to discuss the future of the agreement and its possible extension in 2025. The strategic move signifies a promising step in the right direction, opening doors to amplify trade opportunities and economic growth. In reimagining AGOA during this third review, the alignment of AGOA to Africa's industrialisation programme, wherein lies opportunities of US companies and investors to access mutually reinforcing economic benefits in the manufacturing sector, e.g. car components, green technology and agri-processing, given the much developed agri-sector in the country. The South African common position on AGOA lays a strong basis for the extension of AGOA as African countries had already been unanimous on advocating for the extension of AGOA, and South Africa nominated to put forward the African case to be discussed in the

AGOA Forum in the meeting of November. These are positive developments that we must all support and continue to embrace towards an extension and enhance AGOA in 2025. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to.

I now recognise the hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. On behalf of the ANC I move a motion without notice:

That the House notes the anniversary of the death in detention of Imam Abdullah Haron yesterday, a revered anti-apartheid activist and founder of the Claremont Muslim Youth Association. We solemnly remember his unwavering commitment to justice and equality. Held captive for 123 agonising days, enduring unspeakable torture by the apartheid security branch. His sacrifice remains etched in our collective memory as we approach the anticipated judgement on 9 October 2023, we anticipate a just resolution providing the much needed closure for his grieving family and a testament to the pursuit of truth and justice. May his legacy inspire generations to stand against oppression and prejudice. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to.

Hon members, Motion 14 has been withdrawn, so that concludes Motions without Notice.

The Secretary will now read the first Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Standing Committee on Social Development on the Fundraising Amendment Bill B29-B2016 NCOP.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Secretary.

The House received the Report of the Standing Committee on Social Development on the Fundraising Amendment Bill, confirming authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill. This mandate has been sent to the NCOP.

I will now afford members and parties an opportunity to make a declaration if they so wish. I recognise the ANC.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Am

I audible?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, you may proceed.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you very ... thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Bakubaku-Vos, I can hear you clearly.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, I rise today on behalf of the ANC for wholeheartedly express our resolute support for the Fundraising Amendment Bill B329B-2020 NCOP.

This legislation represents a pivotal stride in our continuous endeavour of to fortify the regulatory frame that overseas fundraising activities in our nation.

This Bill have [Inaudible.] unwavering backing from members of the Provincial Legislature across all political affiliations. This resounding endorsement underscores our shared commitment to enhancing transparency, accountability and efficiency in fund raising endeavours.

Regardless of political affiliation, such widespread endorsement underscores the profound recognition of the Bill's significance in safeguarding the interests of our communities.

The primary purpose of this Bill is to amend the Fundraising Act of 1978. It seeks to refine certain divisions, certain definitions [Inaudible.] amendments for greater clarity. Discontinue certain funds, dissolve board responsibility for those funds and establish the disaster relief of the National Social Development Fund, and to transfer any amount remaining in the [Inaudible.] funds to the disaster relief and National Social Development Fund additional. It empowers the Minister to make regulations regarding the financiality of a fund and addresses other related matters.

The ANC particularly welcomes the insertion of Section 25A into Act 107 of 1978. This section establishes procedure for the discontinuation and transfer of specific funds. It stipulates that certain funds such as Refugee Relief Fund, the State President's Fund and Social Relief Fund ...[intervenes]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you ...[Interjections.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: ... or Social Relief Fund shall ...[Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time is up.

Please can I ask the members who are online to speak ...[Interjections.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Ah, hon Deputy Speaker, so quick?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Bakubaku-Vos, thank you, your time is up. To speak loudly please and clearly because for the Hansard we cannot record the sound that is going high and low all the time. Thank you.

Hon member Bakubaku-Vos, your time was up. I recognise the EFF.

No? No? I recognise GOOD. No?

Mr P DE VILLIERS: No declaration.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, you may proceed. Okay, thank you very much, I hear you.

Mr P DE VILLIERS: I said no ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I recognise the ACDP.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: No declaration, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise Freedom Front Plus. No I am assuming.

I recognise Al Jama-Ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. No declaration, hon Deputy Speaker, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, noted, thank you very much.

I recognise the Democratic Alliance.

An HON MEMBER: Hon Deputy Speaker, very short from my side.

After the Committee conducted public hearings across the province, the committee unanimously resolved to support the Bill. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I am just trying to confirm how many members we have. 32, thank you very much. I have to announce that there are currently 32 hon members present and entitled to vote, and the House is therefore quorate.

The question put before the House that the Standing Committee on Social Development on the fundraising Amendment Bill conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill, be ratified and adopted. No objections? No objections, agreed to.

An HON MEMBER: No objections.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

An HON MEMBER: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now will ask the Secretary to read the second Order of the day.

†Die SEKRETARIS: Oorweging van verslag van die Ad Hoc Komitee oor die aanstelling van die Staatsdiens Kommissaris vir die Wes-Kaap, gedateer 21 September 2023.

[The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on the appointment of the Public Service Commissioner for the Western Cape, dated 21 September 2023.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Baie dankie, Sekretaris. [The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Secretary.] I have been informed by the Chief Whip that the Programming Authority resolved that there will be no list of speakers and that parties who wish to do so, will now be afforded an opportunity to make a declaration on the report for a maximum of three minutes.

I recognise the ANC. No? Thank you very much. I will move over to the EFF. No. GOOD.

Mr P DE VILLIERS: No declaration.



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. ACDP.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: No declaration.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Noted, thank you. Freedom Front Plus. I am assuming no. Al Jama-Ah?

Mr G BRINKHUIS: No declaration, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the Democratic Alliance.

An HON MEMBER: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Public Service Commissioner has a crucial role to perform in our society in keeping a watchful eye over Government, ensuring that the public service remains committed above all to the people of this province.

Among the responsibilities of this office are to promote constitutional values and sound principles, public administration in the Government and to keep Government free from corruption and maladministration.

Hon Deputy Speaker, an Ad Hoc Committee to administrate the appointment of a new Public Service Commissioner was formed and a rigorous process

was followed to ensure the best candidate was found. The post was widely advertised and four candidates were shortlisted to be interviewed by the committee. All the candidates went through a security vetting process as the integrity of this person to hold this position must be above reproach. A comprehensive interview with the Ad Hoc Committee followed and a leading candidate emerged.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Committee thus recommends Mr Ashley Seale to the House for approval as the Premier's nominee for appointment as the Public Service Commissioner for the Western Cape. We believe Mr Seale has the necessary skills and depth of character to perform this role to the highest standard and that he will uphold the important values that his new office demand, hon Deputy Speaker. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Just there was a problem with connectivity, so I am just going to give a moment for the ANC to give their declaration.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Am I audible, Chair?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are. Just give me one second, hon member Lekker. Hon Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. May I address you?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, at the beginning of the Sitting it is quite clear that members are responsible, those that are online, to make sure that their connectivity is in order. If not they should contact the IT Department of the WCPP. We cannot create the precedence of members not adhering to that and wanting an opportunity after their opportunity has passed.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Can you please make a decision and rule on that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is noted. I am going to proceed. In the interest of collegiality today I am going to proceed, because this is a declaration and so I am going to allow the ANC to continue in this moment.

Thank you very much. You may proceed. Hon member Lekker, over to you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I must sincerely apologise. I am having difficulties with my phone today, but let me get into the declaration.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the ANC does not support this report. What this report

should have stated was that in terms of Section 4(4) of the Public Service Commission Amendment Act this House was considering the renewal of the term of the new outgoing Commissioner, despite the fact that the law allows for the renewal of the term of a Commissioner, particular DA members of the Committee insisted on advertising the vacancy and recruit someone else.

The only requirement for the renewal of the term of office for the Commissioner was that he or she should have, and I quote:

“Maintained a satisfactory level of performance in relation to his or her duties.”

This House today must commend Mr Leonardo Goosen for doing a sterling job at being the Public Service Commissioner in the Western Cape for the last five years. So sterling was his performance that the DA sought to see him go.

Mr Goosen pursued his duties without fear or favour and this often landed him in trouble with the first office of this province and members of the Executive. As even DA members of the Committee agreed, Mr Goosen displayed the utmost determination of putting the people of the Western Cape first.

Mr Goosen put the learners of the Western Cape first when he exposed malfeasance at a number of former model C schools. He exposed the poor

handling of clients at healthcare facilities in poorer communities, such as Eersterivier, and lifted the lid on the maintenance crisis at Red Cross Children's Hospital. Mr Goosen was at the forefront of investigation into the alleged rape of a minor by a fellow patient at a mental care facility in Stellenbosch.

All of this exposes the DA's failure and no matter how good he was at doing his job, he had to go and today we see him go. The profile of the Western Cape is poorer no longer having Mr Goosen protecting them. Instead the Provincial Government of the Western Cape insider has been appointed to replace him.

The ANC therefore rejects this report. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Hon member Cassiem and hon members, you know, the Chief Whip is correct. We should be self-responsible, but I have now in the interest of collegiality and at the end of the day to allow the ANC.

So, hon member Cassiem, I hear you also have connectivity problems. Do you want to make a declaration?

Ms A CASSIEM: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am going to assume that that is a no. Thank you.

I can confirm and announce there are currently 32 hon members present and entitled to vote, and the House is therefore quorate. The question put before the House is that the report on the Ad Hoc Committee be adopted. Are there any objections to the report being adopted?

An HON MEMBER: No! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. Those objections will be noted. So I am going to take it that those in favour of the report have unanimously said yes as a majority, thank you very much. I do think that the ayes have it. Question is approved.

Hon members, before we adjourn, I would like to inform the members that the CPA general meeting will commence straight after this. The WCPP CWP will commence straight after the adjournment of the CPA, and that concludes the business for the day.

The Secretary will now end the meeting. The House is adjourned.

*[The House adjourns at 17:38.]*