
THURSDAY, 28 NOVEMBER 2019

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The SPEAKER: You may be seated. Good afternoon, hon members, welcome!

Chief Whip, I recognise you.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you hon Speaker, I move the motion as printed on the Order Paper, in my name:

That, notwithstanding the provision of Rule 18, the hours of sitting on Tuesday, 3 December 2019, shall be from 10:00 to adjournment.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Chief Whip. Now the Secretary will read the Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of the Principle of the *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 6–2019]

The SPEAKER: I have the Speaker's List, and the hon Minister of Finance, Minister Maynier.

The PREMIER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you hon Speaker. The Medium Term Budget Policy Statement tabled earlier this week outlined how we will ensure the effective, efficient and sustainable management of our public finances, so that people are safe, so that people have jobs, and so that people have access to opportunities in the Western Cape.

I made the point that we are in deep economic trouble. What should be going up is going down and what should be going down is going up in South Africa. We have stagnant economic growth, collapsing revenue collection, ballooning expenditure, zombie State-owned Enterprises, staggering levels of national debt, eye-watering debt services costs and terrifying fiscal risks together with looming junk status... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You are quoting from your speech from Tuesday. The same thing. [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): He is giving a summary.

An HON MEMBER: The same, yes.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The fact is that if we do nothing, national debt measured as gross loan debt will be R3,6 trillion or 64,9% of GDP in 2020/21 or R4 trillion or 68,5% of GDP in 2021/22, and R4,4 trillion or 71,3% of GDP in 2022/23, and debt service costs will skyrocket to R232,8 billion in 2021, R264,6 billion in 2021/22 and a staggering R299,1 billion in 2022/23, which means that if we do not stabilise national debt we will be spending a staggering R299 billion on debt service costs alone in 2022/23... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You said that on Tuesday.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...which is R36,3 billion more than we will spend on education; R6,4 billion more than we will spend on healthcare; and R22 billion more than we will spend on social development this year, 2019/20, in South Africa, and we are in this situation, hon Speaker, because National Government has mismanaged our economy, mismanaged our public finances and mismanaged our State-owned enterprises in South Africa.

The fact is that the biggest threat to provincial economic growth is National Government in the Western Cape. We simply cannot be competitive when our ports, when our rail network, when our visa regime and when our electricity supply is mismanaged by National Government.

We all know that National Government can put provinces under administration, but the fact is that if provinces could put National

Government under administration we would have done it long ago, in South Africa. [Interjections.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Absoluut!

[An HON MEMBER: Absolutely!]

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon Speaker, I also make the point that the Minister responded to the full horror of this situation in his Medium Term Budget Policy Statement and pencilled in what he called “large reductions to provincial transfers” in South Africa.

An HON MEMBER: Which one?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The fact is the total provincial transfers in the form of provincial equitable share and conditional grants will be cut by a staggering R20,3 billion over the medium term between 2020/21 and 2022/23. I made the point that we should make no mistake that these budget cuts risk wiping out service delivery on the frontline on education, on health and on social development across provinces in South Africa, and what makes these budget cuts so hard to swallow is that Provincial Governments are expected to absorb the budget cuts so that National Government can bail out zombie State-owned Enterprises in South Africa. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Shocking.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I made the point that because of this there is significant and unprecedented uncertainty and because of all these known unknowns in the budget process we would continue to implement our Fiscal Strategy to focus on proper expenditure management, proper revenue management and to maintain a balanced budget. We would continue to apply the principles of allocative efficiency, fiscal sustainability, fiscal consolidation and fiscal discipline and we would continue to do so, so that we maintained stability, credibility and transparency when it comes to the budget in the Western Cape.

I made the point that we would assume a worst-case scenario and have planned a total downward adjustment to the provincial budget over the medium term of 5%, or R2,67 billion in 2020/21, 6% or R3,4 billion in 2021/22 and 7% or R4,19 billion in 2022/23; that we would commit to minimising the impact of the budget cuts on Education, on Health and Social Development and that we would commit to minimising the impact of the budget cuts on the maintenance and repair of existing infrastructure; all the while, while continuing to maintain a balanced budget in the Western Cape.

I also made the point that we are in the fortunate position of being able to minimise the impact of these budget cuts on Education, on Health and on Social Development, only because we have built up reserves for unforeseen

and unavoidable expenditure and for fiscal stabilisation in the Western Cape. But Hon Speaker, despite the budget cuts and despite the uncertainty and despite all the known unknowns, we have - despite that - developed a Western Cape Safety Plan... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Where is that?

Ms A P BANS: No, no! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...aimed at boosting law enforcement capacity, in the least safe neighbourhoods in the Western Cape, and we will over the next 12 months be partnering with the City of Cape Town to train and deploy one thousand law enforcement officers ... [Interjections.]

Mr D SMITH: That is why there is [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...providing us with boots on the ground to fight crime - especially violent crime - in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Bad ANC Government.

An HON MEMBER: Where is the money coming from?

An HON MEMBER: Bad ANC Government.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We have listened to the victims of crime and we have heard the victims of crime... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Where is the money coming from?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...and we have found R1,3 billion to fight crime - especially violent crime - in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members! Please proceed, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon Speaker, we are committed, even in this challenging time, where so many people have lost hope and when so many people have lost trust in Government to actually getting things done in the Western Cape.

Mr D SMITH: Human settlements [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: In the end the fact is that the politics, the high priests of economic madness who want land expropriation without compensation, who want to impose prescribed assets, who want to establish a State Bank... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Of course, poor people's money!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: And who want to nationalise the Reserve

Bank, are killing the economy in South Africa. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The fact is that if we continue like this...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister [Interjections.] Hon Minister...

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The high priests of economic madness...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, will you please take your seat. I recognise the
Deputy Chief Whip.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you Hon Speaker. Hon Speaker,
I am not able to hear the Minister delivering his speech. Can you please
protect the speaker?

The SPEAKER: Order! Order hon members! I think at this stage I need to
request the Chief Whips and the Deputy Chief Whips of various political
parties and because the reason why I am asking now, hon members, please
just bear with me. On both sides of the House I am getting this conversation
and it is very much loud and that is why we cannot hear what the Minister
says, hon Mitchell, so I am going to really ask that members, do cooperate

with the Presiding Officer.

Ms L M MASEKO: Hon Bakubaku-Vos.

The SPEAKER: I now recognise the Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, hon Speaker. In conclusion I was saying the fact is that if we continue like this the high priests of economic madness, who like to fight the struggle from the beaches and from the bars of Havana, all the while soaking up on their favourite authors, Marx, Lenin and Guevara, will get what they have always dreamed of - and turn this country into the equivalent of Venezuela. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon members. Thank you, hon Minister. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. I now recognise the hon Minister of Community Safety.

†n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

The SPEAKER: Hon Min Fritz.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Speaker, it is also Marx who said, no, no, it was John Lennon who said: "Know your Marx and your Lenin." [Interjection.] So it is very interesting from the Finance Minister to

talk about... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Who said that, John Lennon?

An HON MEMBER: John Lennon.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Ja, it was John Lennon who said: "Know your Marx and your Lenin."

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Checking.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Speaker, Premier, Cabinet colleagues, hon Leader of the Opposition, Cameron Dugmore, let me name him by name, otherwise, you know; other members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, citizens of the Western Cape.

Hon Speaker, as with all other departments across Government my Department has had to execute its mandate within an increasingly constrained economic environment. However, I wish to welcome this Adjustments Budget from the outset as it speaks to both recovery and hope for the Western Cape. On 26 November Minister Maynier tabled the Medium Term Budget Policy Statement and the 2019 Adjustment Estimates of Provincial Revenue and Expenditure in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament.

In support of building safer and cohesive communities in this province, an additional R130 million has been allocated in the 2019/20 period for the Law Enforcement Advancement Plan, also referred to as “Boots on the ground.” The project forms part of a larger transversal safety plan led by Premier Alan Winde... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: To which you allocated no money.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The Premier of this Provincial DA Government; not ANC, DA Government. [Interjection.] This was made possible by reducing my Department’s budget by R17,97 million, comprising of a transfer of R3 million made to the Department of the Premier for the development of the software systems for the safety project. It was further assisted in the surrendering of funds to the Provincial Treasury... [Interjections.] Can I just continue? Can I continue with my speech?

The SPEAKER: Please proceed, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Am I okay, can I go on?

Ms A P BANS: The Premier is disturbing us.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: It was further assisted in the surrendering of funds to the Provincial Treasury through the reprioritisation

of internal projects to contribute R14,97 million towards funds received, and by doing so, hon Speaker, we were allocated R130 million in the Adjustments Budget for the 2019/20 year and R417 million in the 2020/21, R350 million, listen carefully, R350 million in the 2021/22 year, and R400 million in the 2022/23 year. [Interjection.]

Let me repeat. Listen carefully! Ha-ha-ha-ha! [Laughter.]

Remember that! Now R1,3 billion, R1,3 billion towards the implementation of LEAP over the next four years, and we all know who is the famous man who did that - a notorious man! Hon Speaker, this budget will provide oxygen to the Premier's Safety Plan announced on the 19th of September 2019.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Oxygen. Where is this Safety Plan?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: As I am sure the House is aware, the Safety Plan aims to halve the murder rate over the next ten years. As part of the Safety Plan, each Minister has been allocated an apex priority which they will be personally accountable for and report on during the Safety Cabinet meeting that will be held every six weeks. We are still planning, making finalisation around that. My particular apex priorities include:

1. Overseeing the training and employment of additional law enforcement officers and 150 investigators to the places and times where and when violent crimes happen. I think that is a very important point.

2. Working to expand the Chrysalis Youth Academy Programmes.
3. Enhancing police oversight.
4. Working to change legislation to reduce alcohol-related harms, and
5. Implement the Boys-to-Men Programme also again with the partnership of Chrysalis.

As hon member Nkondlo has correctly noted, that we cannot address crime without firstly addressing the social factors which perpetuates it. I completely agree. That is why the Premier's Safety Plan will not only put additional boots on the ground, but will also be accompanied by various social interventions focusing on the ten gang stations...

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: How much money
[Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...and it will work to expand the highly successful Chrysalis Youth Academy within these communities.

†n AGBARE LID: Mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Good!]

An HON MEMBER: How much?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: As the Western Cape Government we have been hard at work implementing the contents of the

Safety Plan since its announcement. In fact each Monday we meet and make progress strides in implementing the plan. That is called work-in-progress, comrade. [Interjections.]

I am proud to announce that my Department is currently in the process of appointing its own high-level project manager who will ensure that the critical priorities that I have listed above, are implemented.

Mr D SMITH: So you employed Mmusi now?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Ja, we will have to give him a job. He needs a job. I wish to commend all actors who have played a significant role over the past few months, to bring peace and stability to our province. We have started to see murder figures, particularly within the Cape Flats, stabilise. The increased perception of safety in our province is happening. This did not happen overnight or incidentally. It comes from collective integrated approach to safety.

Hon Speaker, thank you to all media, civil society, safety agencies such as SAPS, law enforcement and Metro Police, the South African National Defence Force and good citizens who have played a part in making a safer Western Cape. These civil society organisations include Neighbourhood Watches and CPFs.

I wish to remind the House that whilst the Premier's Safety Plan will

particularly focus on reducing the murder rate within the identified hotspots, my Department will continue to implement and roll out its Safety Plans throughout the province. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Is the Boots Safety Plan [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: On 8 November 2019 I met with the executive mayors of each district municipality, hon member Marran, each district municipality.

An HON MEMBER: Safety plans [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: This gave municipalities an opportunity to give feedback on the progress made in implementing their Safety Plans. I am pleased to note that my Department aim to have all remaining District Safety Plans prepared by the end of December.

Mr P MARRAN: Will we receive those plans?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: It should be noted, hon members, with absolute attention, that the DA-led Western Cape Government has quite literally reprioritised itself to make the province safer and I think that is one of the reasons why the President and the Deputy President likes this Premier, because we do things. We do not talk about things, and for that, you know, we make it safer so that all of us can live safely in this province,

other than the ANC-led provinces who are continuing to ignore the crucial issues of crime. Make no mistake, hon members... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Where?

An HON MEMBER: In the Western Cape [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...crime is an issue which affects the whole of South Africa. [Interjections.] In fact, in many crime categories the Western Cape remains safer than many other provinces. [Interjections.] Shame on the ANC for continuing to subject those it governs to suffering and not prioritising their Safety Plans. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order hon members!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I thank you, hon Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Fritz. I now recognise hon member Mvimbi.

†UMnu L L MVIMBI: Somlomo, ndiyabulela ngelithuba ndilifumeneyo.

[Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Speaker, I would like to thank you for this opportunity.]

On 26 November, the day after the President launched the 16 Days of Activism against Abuse of Women and Children, the MEC of Finance tabled his Medium Term Budget Policy Statement under the theme, “We are getting things done in the Western Cape.” Anyone can see through these blue lies.

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Blue!

Mr L L MVIMBI: ...that there is nothing getting done here.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: [Inaudible.] the blue lights!

Mr L L MVIMBI: Except for maintaining the status quo, nothing is getting done except for maintaining the status quo, preserving white supremacy, preserving white power and preserving white privilege. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The writing is on the wall!

The PREMIER: The Justice Coalition said that the ANC is not employing [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: The writing is on the wall!

The PREMIER: ...in the poor areas. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members! Please proceed, hon member.

An HON MEMBER: The writing is on the wall! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): You must just read, you must just read what Jessie said.

An HON MEMBER: Where is Jessie?

The SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr L L MVIMBI: The MEC's habitual criticism of National Government and investment like the National Health Insurance must be condemned with the contempt it deserves. The MEC must know that he is responsible for the Province of the Western Cape. He must concentrate on the Province of the Western Cape and govern the Western Cape and leave the National Government alone. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): [Inaudible.] it applies to the Western Cape.

Mr L L MVIMBI: In addition his disinvestment in frontline services departments like Education, Health and Social Development must equally be

condemned.

An HON MEMBER: The failing department that [Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Those learners at Fairdale Primary School in Mfuleni, who are learning under inhuman conditions, must accept that their conditions will not change because the habitual critic, whose mind is preoccupied with zombies, is cutting the budget of Education.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The PREMIER: Oh no!

†UMnu L L MVIMBI: Indlela endikhulengayo keSomlomo yinto ngaba umntu osoloko ethetha ngezithunzela inokuba ngumntu uliGqhirha okanye uliqwirha ngokoke kufuneka akhethe umphathiswa ukuba uyeyiphi kwezozinto.

[Mr L L MVIMBI: The way I was brought up, hon Speaker, is when an individual always refers to a ghost it could be a traditional healer and witch craft, therefore it is wise that the honourable member chooses which it will be.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mvimbi, will you please take your seat?

†UMnu L L MVIMBI: Uligqirha.

Mr L L MVIMBI: A witch.

The SPEAKER: Will you please take your seat, hon member.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, I am rising to ask for your ruling. Is it parliamentary for a member to use his cell phone to record while there is a speaker on the floor?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Which Rule?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mitchell. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Who is that?

The SPEAKER: Will you guide the Speaker, who is that member?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): If my eyes are not misleading me it is hon Marran. [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Hey, you must also not [Inaudible.] Where is your Rule?

An HON MEMBER: Which Rule?

The SPEAKER: May I... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You have not been recognised!

The SPEAKER: Hon members, can there be one presiding officer at a time so that if we vote for you, you will sit here, but if it is me now, please, let us respect that.

Mr P MARRAN: You must provide proof.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Marran, you wanted to say something?

Mr P MARRAN: Are you acknowledging me, hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Regarding the recording?

Mr P MARRAN: I am just saying, hon Speaker, if he said I was recording he must submit you with proof.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Who is "he"?

An HON MEMBER: No, they can submit it [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: Who is "he"?

Mr P MARRAN: The Deputy Chief Whip... [Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: The one who stood up.

Mr P MARRAN: ...of the DA, the one who stood up.

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr P MARRAN: It is he who is making the accusation. Can he provide you with proof, hon Speaker?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): On a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip? Please take your seat, hon member Marran.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): The member is entering into an explanation, which I do not think is required. He is also pointing fingers at the member across the way, which I do not think is parliamentary. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Can he withdraw his finger?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip.

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Speaker, this is a pencil, not a finger. It is my pencil.
[Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: [Laughter.]

Mr P MARRAN: It is a pencil, not my finger! She must not make

accusations, hon Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marran. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You must be serious about this [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: We are dealing with a serious matter. I just want to know whether you were recording the member. Yes or no?

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Speaker, no. That is why I am saying...

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr P MARRAN: ...the person who is making the accusation must submit proof to you as the Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat, alright.

Mr P MARRAN: You cannot just speak and make wild accusations.

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat, hon member Marran. There are Rules in this House and one of them, hon members, one of the Rules - and I am addressing the House - is that when we talk to members we do not point at them, and the other Rule is that you address the Speaker at all times. So can we please respect that principle, hon Marran, now I am talking to you

specifically. The hon member said to the House that he did not record and that then puts the matter to bed. We are now going to proceed. Hon member Mvimbi?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Should I start where I... [Interjections.]

Those learners at Fairdale Primary School in Mfuleni who are learning under inhuman conditions, must accept that their conditions will not change because the habitual critic whose mind is obsessed and preoccupied with zombies is cutting the budget of Education. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No-no. [Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: From the onset I must state that R60 million rand is not enough to end the scourge of gender-based violence and femicide in the province. [Interjection.]

Thousands of women have been demanding action. They need more investment into this fight. The Government has not only failed to allocate additional funding to end gender-based violence but is also cutting its spending on important programmes like victim empowerment, substance abuse, prevention and rehabilitation, as well as child and youth-care centres responsible for assisting youth in conflict with the law. All this is happening while the National Government has allocated an additional R59 million for gender-based violence as well as the fact that the province is over

R659 million in reserves which it can use when it deems necessary. The same National Government you keep on criticising and attacking, but you are always quick to accept its funding.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: It is not their money.

Mr L L MVIMBI: This is simply unacceptable. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is not their money. [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: That is the problem. It is not their money.

Mr L L MVIMBI: The Provincial Government through its equitable share...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr L L MVIMBI: ...has the responsibility... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Youth - it is not their money.

The SPEAKER: Please proceed, hon member. Order hon members.

Mr L L MVIMBI: The Provincial Government, through its equitable share has the responsibility to allocate budget to different programmes according to its

priorities and in this instance the MEC has proved that the above are least of his priorities. But what are his priorities? A layman on the street may want to know. Of course, if you go to page 9 of the MEC's budget speech you will see in there that all other departments have had budget cuts, except Community Safety, Health, Human Settlements, Agriculture and Public Works.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mvimbi, you need to try and conclude.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Speaker, the MEC boldly stood here, dancing like a Pinocchio, the wooden puppet in children's stories, saying that "We are getting things done in the Western Cape."

I want to spend the last few minutes zooming into that. The Provincial Government has allocated an additional R130 million and gave the City of Cape Town to fund the DA's aspiration of a provincial police disguised as a Safety Plan. What is strange, it is masquerading as a provincial plan, but it is only concentrating in the City of Cape Town. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Aikona wena!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mvimbi... [Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Let me hasten to say that the additional resources towards combating violence, crime and gangsterism are welcome.

The SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, your time is up. Thank you.

The PREMIER: It is unbelievable!

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Fernandez, I see you raising your hand. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The point has been dealt with, thank you, Hon Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Oh, thank you. [Interjections.] Hon members, let us proceed. I now recognise hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Enkosi Somlomo. The Western Province continues to experience high levels of unemployment especially amongst the youth. In the long run these youth tend to give up hope in ever finding employment and some resort to criminal activities, abuse of alcohol and drugs, substance. This is sad because the Provincial Government is failing these youth. This issue of unemployment is further made worse by the Provincial Government's failure to stimulate the economic development of provinces to operate at an optimal level so as to attract major investments and create a free platform for small businesses to operate, especially in the urban areas.

Coupled with that then comes the issue of inequality. Early this month Statistics South Africa released a report showing that the Western Cape was leading the pack when it comes to inequality.

The report shows that only a handful had huge financial income, mostly white people, whereas the majority remain poor - that is the black and coloured population. The Province is not doing anything about this issue where whites earn two or three times more than their coloured and black counterparts in the same workplace in the same positions... [Interjections.]

†n AGBARE LID: Absoluut!

[An HON MEMBER: Absolutely!]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: ...it is true. It is further reported that the Western Cape had a larger population of chronically poor households. This is so because the Province does not care about the rural poor and creating economic opportunities for them, as the focus is on the few rich in the City. The same can be said about the Provincial Department in the Western Cape...

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hanover Park.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: ...which continues to overlook African and coloured employees when it comes to promotions to higher levels within the top executive management positions. [Interjections.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Ja-nee!

[An HON MEMBER: Indeed!]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hanover.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Moreover the Province continues to fail when it comes to dealing with the issue of traffic congestion especially within the City of Cape Town. The road infrastructure remains old and slightly developed. According to the recent report by the Transport Directorate, traffic congestion cost the City of Cape Town R2,8 billion per annum due to goods and services not reaching their destination on time. It also leads to lower job growth as the province becomes unattractive for investment.

Furthermore, those hit hard are the poor as public transport remains expensive and unreliable, costing low to medium-income households 45% which is spent on public transport. Connected to this is the issue of housing. The Western Cape Province is not doing enough in putting pressure on the City of Cape Town to develop an inclusionary housing policy that will see low and medium income households settling in their new developments, taking place in the City of Cape Town.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Makamba-Botya, you must please try and wrap up.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Again the province is failing to manage the issue of drought and job losses in the Karoo. The R50 million that was recently allocated there as a measure of drought relief is not enough to assist farmers to get farmers... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Your time is up, hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: †Siyabulela. [We thank you Ma.] Thank you, hon members, I now recognise - order, hon members, order, hon members. I now recognise hon Minister of Social Development, Minister Fernandez.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Speaker, hon Premier, Cabinet colleagues, Leader of the Opposition, hon members of the Western Cape Parliament, guests in the gallery, fellow South Africans.

Before I begin my presentation I do want to draw the House's attention to the fact that when the Minister of Finance delivered his speech the other day some hon members found it funny and it is quite sad that they do not realise the extent of the disaster, economic disaster that this country is facing. We have gone beyond a fiscal cliff. We are in fact at a tipping point.

Our Minister of Finance is to be congratulated on tabling a responsive, sustainable budget for the 2019 MTEF period. In the words of our very capable Minister, he said:

“The Medium Term Budget is about how we are getting things done in the Western Cape.”

Hon Speaker, let us not hide behind any smoke screens. Provincial services are indeed taking strain and are unable to meet the ever-increasing demand because of the rapid increasing population in the province. I have highlighted a few months ago that in the next five years research has proven, we will see the Western Cape population grow by a further R700 000 people. However, the only way to fill these gaps and get ahead of the population growth and development curb is if our equitable share allocation is significantly increased and National Government stops wasting money on failing SoEs like Eskom and SAA - I have just seen that Eskom is now looking for another R20 billion - above inflation wage increases, bad policy choices such as the NHI and land expropriation without compensation, as well as state capture.

Hon Speaker, where other provinces are struggling, we are still managing to show progress in the services we offer the people of our province, especially those who are most vulnerable and at risk across the province.

An HON MEMBER: Haibo! From where are you reading?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Our Government, led by our fit-for-purpose hon Premier Alan Winde, remains a shining example of the capable state while we continue to watch National Government imploding and shifting the goal posts set out in the National Development Plan.

Hon Speaker, yesterday a member of the ANC asked what we are doing in terms of increased support for victims, our Victim Empowerment Programmes with regard to GBV. To answer that question, hon members, I would like to bring some facts to the fore.

In the year 2009 when the DA first took over government in the Western Cape, the amount allocated for VP was a mere R7,6 million. Hon members, I have you know that the budget allocation for the same VP programme in 2019 is R45 million. That is six times more than what the previous ANC administration allocated in this province. [Interjections.] And let us be honest, the scourge of gender-based violence was a challenge then already.

As Minister Maynier highlighted in his mid-term budget policy speech, we must give credit to National Government for the few things that they do get right.

An HON MEMBER: Few!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: After the President though, announced at SONA, National Government has provided financial support

that has assisted... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Say so.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I have, I did say the good work - has assisted our Government in ensuring that, and listen very carefully, an additional R59,7 million be used to employ social workers in areas where there is a high prevalence of gender-based violence, substance abuse and issues affecting children in the Western Cape. This will include provision for capital requirements for the additional 30 social workers as at the 1st of October, the 1st of November 2019; an additional R17 million to continue to support efforts to deal with the drivers of HIV, TB and STIs and gender-based violence in the Western Cape; an additional R31,5 million to improve access to sanitary dignity for young women so they can stay in school and get the education they deserve in the Western Cape.

However, I would also like to use this opportunity to applaud our Provincial Treasury for working the numbers as well as they did. The Western Cape Government is one of three provinces that have allocated funding for the Sanitary Dignity Project for the 2019/20 financial year. I would also like to have you know that our average spend per child in an Early Childhood Development Centre is more than in any other province in this country. Another important point is that as a Government we are also providing higher subsidies than all but one other province for children to be placed in Child and Youth Care Centres.

Regarding the operation of Child and Youth Care Centres we should ask our ANC colleagues across the floor whether or not their counterparts in the other provinces have managed to deal with the BOSASA contracts that came to an end on the 31st October. [Interjections.] I can reliably say that our province have insourced 295 workers and as at 1 November our two centres in Clanwilliam and Horizon were up and running. [Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, one issue I need to bring to this House's attention - listen and then you can understand - [Laughter.] - is surrounding the Children's Amendment Bill, in particular the fact that the Department of Social Development nationally has not provided effective solutions to address the foster care backlog after almost ten years.

Our Department has been able to manage the foster-care placements but the Children's Courts are struggling to process orders due to capacity constraints especially in the Winelands area. Our social workers do not have a backlog but over 4 888 cases which we have submitted to the Courts across the province are still waiting to be processed of which 3 538 are in the Winelands area. We agree with the Centre for Child Law that it would help if Parliament amended the legislation so that extended family members caring for orphan children can access additional grant funding instead of having these children placed in the foster-care system.

Hon Speaker, I hope that over the MTEF there is clarity around the migration of Early Childhood Development Centres from the National Department. It is

unquestionable that the hard work of ensuring improved access to quality holistic ECD Services is much more complicated than a simple shift of location from DSD to DBE. As a DA-led Government we cannot agree or disagree with this possibility of the migration, because there is still great confusion and uncertainty at a national level as to when and how this will happen.

Hon Speaker, yesterday a guest in our Adjustment Budget Committee highlighted the need for us to expand our services to those individuals dealing with substance abuse in our poorest communities. Over the MTEF we will strive to expand our services in this regard.

At the end of the day we must not be under any illusions that one of the main contributors to the scourge of violence and gender-based violence being experienced across our province is fuelled by substance abuse. Despite our best efforts there remains room for improvement. In saying this, though, the DA-led Western Cape Government continues to be at the forefront of the fight against substance abuse, focusing on rendering early intervention...
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Fernandez, will you please try and wrap up.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...in-patient treatment and community-based treatment. Hon Speaker, in closing I would like to quote Corruption Watch who says:

“Corruption undermines the effectiveness of institutions. It diminishes public trust and it hinders the realisation of human rights.”

[Interjections.]

We need to work to stop with corruption. I thank you. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You are protecting your funders, protecting your funders.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: You were right on time, hon Minister. Now I recognise hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: I thank you Hon Speaker. The Minister for Finance, hon Maynier spoke about the *spekboom* and he brought a *spekboom* into Parliament. In English the *spekboom* is the “Elephant Bush”, so I think it is quite appropriate because I think there are a few elephants in this room that we need to speak about.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, die *spekboom*.

Mr B N HERRON: First is the Safety Plan. Where is it?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Why did you not come to the meeting this morning?

The PREMIER: Where were you this morning?

Mr B N HERRON: Hon Speaker, we all agree that we need to work together to support action to reduce crime and we have heard a lot about the Safety Plan but the Safety Plan does not actually exist. [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Where were you, why did you not come to the meeting?

Mr B N HERRON: This document is not a Safety Plan. It is not a plan. It is at best an executive summary or maybe a vision. It does not tell us what will happen. It just tells us - it tells us what they would like to see happen, but it does not tell us how it should happen, but yet this Parliament is asked to support the transfer of hundreds of millions of rands, without a plan, without any detail as to where this money will be spent or how it will be spent. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members.

Mr B N HERRON: The second problem, hon Speaker, is also the Safety Plan or, more importantly, where is the money? [Interjection.] Just a few months

ago the Premier promised R1 billion a year would be spent on this plan. On Tuesday Minister Maynier said: “We made a promise and we kept that promise”, but the budget he spoke about provides R1,16 billion over the promised next three years, so where is the remaining 60% of the money coming from? Are we expecting the municipalities to be coughing up R2,8 billion over the next three years?

Mr Speaker, the third problem is - and you have guessed it - the safety plan, because the Budget Adjustments contradict the Minister and the Premier’s commitments.

The SPEAKER: Will you please ...[Interjections.]

Mr B N HERRON: Nowhere in this document, Mr Speaker, does any Minister or any department refer to the safety plan, not one. They make no reference to any change in their plans, their programmes or their objectives.

The PREMIER: How long ...[Inaudible - speaking simultaneously.]

Mr B N HERRON: This document does not mention the safety plan. The only place it is mentioned is the ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Your time is up, hon member.

Mr B N HERRON: ... R130 million transferred by the Community

...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr B N HERRON: ... Safety Department.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes!

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you, hon member.

Now I recognise hon member Christians.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: He was not in the meeting.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, thank you, Mr Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: There is no [Inaudible.].

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I want to agree with the Minister when he said that the mismanagement of money of National Government is concerning and it places financial strain on provinces and on municipalities, but, Mr Speaker, where I do not agree is where he said the Premier Alan Winde made promises to the electorate and delivering.

He is not delivering, because he promised on his election trail that we will have a provincial police service.

An HON MEMBER: He lied!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Now he comes with a diluted law enforcement safety plan. This baby must be aborted. It is a still-born baby; it must be aborted. [Interjections.] It must be aborted. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

Let me further say, let me further say [Interjections.] he went on the election trail to say [Interjections.] a provincial railway service. He knew it is not his mandate and yet he promised the electorate and he did not deliver on his promises. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You support that!

Now, Mr Speaker, they want to come with a plan that they know it is not sustainable; it will die very-very soon [Interjections.], why do they not go to Jo'burg and learn from Jo'burg? [Interjections.]

The Metro Police in Jo'burg is doing a sterling job.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: You want to reinvent in the wheel, why do you not go

and learn from other provinces? [Interjections.]

Mr Speaker, and then when the Minister spoke about, he spoke about Cape Town, Cape Town, in parts of Cape Town. Is Cape Town the Western Cape?

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: It is not the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: Yes. [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: We are looking at Worcester, Paarl-East, Stellenbosch and Oudtshoorn where there are high numbers of crime.

So, Mr Speaker, this Metro is not the Western Cape ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... and I think the ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... Minister - I will close.

The SPEAKER: Your time ... [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The Ministers from [Inaudible.] do not understand, so we will assist him ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... that the Western Cape is bigger than just a metro. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time is up. I was struggling, hon member, to ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Sea Point, Sea Point!

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order. I think I need a separate mic to serve hon member Christians. Thank you, hon members. ... [Interjections.]

May I now recognise hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Enkosi Somlomo. [Thank you Speaker] On this afternoon allow me to first congratulate the women in the Department of Treasury, led by the acting DG, together with her team of women that have held this Department and demonstrated technical prowess in as far as taking up their work, and to say to them but the future is †Umandla. [Strength].

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes.

Ms N D NKONDLO: While the *spekboom* can survive frost, drought and fires, no amount of resilience will help it to survive the level of underdevelopment, poverty and unemployment that is endured by the poor working in the Western Cape.

Inequality trends in South Africa released by Stats SA earlier this month show that the white people earn three times more than black Africans on average.

An HON MEMBER: Indeed!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: And the ANC is stealing ... [Inaudible - speaking simultaneously.].

Ms N D NKONDLO: According to the PAMA ratio the highest inequality was observed in the Western Cape where the top 10% of the [Interjections.] in the province shared nine times more of total provincial expenditure than the bottom 40. That is a fact, hon member Mackenzie.

[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: This should tell that the resilience of the poor working class in South Africa, especially in the Western Cape, is far better than that of the *spekboom*.

Perhaps the black majority Africans and coloureds in particular, who are living in squalor on the Cape Flats and informal settlements are the *spekboom*, while the others that are benefitting from Government business and getting preference for senior Government jobs, are the fynbos or the Protea of the province. [Laughter.]

Are you really, Premier and the MEC, prepared and going to stand here and be proud to oversee an economy that takes us back to the apartheid era?

This notion of *spekboom* and fynbos is also vivid in the economy and fiscal policy decision contained in this budget. The MEC, when he tabled his mid-term budget policy statement, spent more time bragging that we are a leading tourist destination in the Western Cape; we have a growing economy in the Western Cape and actually we are told that others are taking strain and recently we are hearing from the last financial year annual reports to currently, that there are COO funds that have been shifted and others surrendered to the Premier's Safety Plan, so I am not sure who exactly is taking the strain.

Someone has to remind the MEC that economic growth in the province slowed down to 0,2% in 2018 and expected to grow by 0,7% in 2019. This is nothing to brag about, except if you are a fynbos.

An HON MEMBER: A fynbos!

Ms N D NKONDLO: Of concerning proportion is the average skills profile of the majority in the province, especially in the City of Cape Town planning districts with Khayelitsha, Mitchells Plain, hon member Mackenzie, reported to be sitting with about 18 skilled workforce and the rest semi-skilled and low-skilled.

In Saldanha where there is supposedly a huge capital investment to boost the local economy through the Saldanha IDZ, a similar profile with low-skilled being 40% and the other 41,6% is semi-skilled as they face closure of ArcelorMittal to compound the problem.

In the third quarter of 2019 the narrow unemployment rate stood at 21,5% whilst the expanded unemployment rate is at 24,5%. According to this there are 8,009 people, the majority of whom are black, that are unemployed in the province. How is the medium-term budget policy statement answering to this carnage?

This is damaging, Premier, for the functioning of our democracy, but I actually think also for the functioning of our economy. While the MEC mentioned an amount of R311 million of infrastructure development, how is this capital investment and budget going to change the picture above?

To date we sit with a precarious situation of inefficient procurement strategies, work that produce the same old patterns: while male ownership.

The Department of Public Works shared with us how some of these companies are running into liquidity risk and one submitted itself for business rescue causing delays in the construction timelines and service delivery.

The fiscal discipline chorus must surely change the beat as good procedures do not always assure good budget outcomes. Due process is indifferent to outcomes, and due process is neutral.

The OECD report on fiscal policy and inclusive growth cautions us that rich countries like to credit their good fortune on fiscal discipline, but the true explanation may lie in the economic plenitude, not in budget rules and procedures.

Incrementalism used to reward spending so future budgets are guaranteed, not fiscal outcomes, is one of the narratives we ought to change.

Worse, the function of allocation is left to one person and the sphere as the instrument to enable this Legislature's voice to be effected, does not exist and thus we are rendered toothless.

True to the tradition of the DA of speaking to left to attract votes and act right. The MEC reiterated the Premier's vision of people living free from want; free from hunger; free from deprivation and free from fear, whilst he has not, made any budget adjustment to address them.

Fiscal policy in this province ... [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Free from fear!

Ms N D NKONDLO: ... has become less redistributive and mutually exclusionary to a relationship of ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member.

Ms N D NKONDLO: ... productivity and inclusive growth.

Day Zero, like the Safety Plan, is something that we were looking for and we are required to see the Safety Plan so that we can see ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up, hon member.

Ms N D NKONDLO: ... how the results of the Safety Plan can reduce the challenges in the Cape Flats.

As I conclude, Madam Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

Ms N D NKONDLO: ... where taxes are dispersed and the tax base is shrinking, we ought to rethink beyond theatrics and start making true the

promise that, Premier, you made of a Madiba Province where people's circumstances and race shall not define their economic standing. I thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. [Applause.]

I see the hon member Daylin Mitchell.

Ms M M WENGER: Hear, hear!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, the International Monetary Fund has concluded its recent visit to South Africa, projecting that the country's economic growth will remain sluggish in 2020.

Of the many comments and recommendations made, the following rings true and I quote:

“Failure to implement the needed adjustment in government and SOE spending and efficiency, will worsen debt dynamics; erode financial stability and further raise the country risk premium.”

Hon Deputy Speaker, this quote speaks directly to the dire erosion of the public trust in the way in which National Government is managing the National Fiscus. [Interjections.]

In a country where the tiny minority of taxpayers are deciding to immigrate; where more people live on social grants today than they did 20 years ago and where trillions of Rands have been lost to severe corruption under the ANC, good governance and clean spending are crucial to economic recovery and sustainability, and yet year after year, president after president, the audit outcomes of our country under the ANC only seems to get worse.

An HON MEMBER: The Western Cape ... [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): The Public Finance Management Act of 1999 is arguably [Interjections.] ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Order!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... one of the most crucial pieces of legislation when it comes to governance and instilling a sense of trust in government and public servants [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): The Act provides for the sound management of the National Fiscus and the allocation and spending of provincial budgets, ensuring that the taxpayer receives the service for which their tax deductions pay.

The only way of proving that Provincial Governments are in fact adhering to this Act, is through an analysis of audit outcomes by the Auditor-General. With this in mind I would like to commend the Western Cape Government for the Western Cape's stellar performance as South Africa's best run province for the 10th year running. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Where the DA governs [Applause.] ... where the DA-run Western Cape Government has achieved 79% clean audits, the ANC's closest competitor, Gauteng, only received a dismal [Interjections.] 30%.

An HON MEMBER: Clean audit.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): I think it is safety to say, hon Deputy Speaker, that the ANC has failed outright to uphold the Public Finance Management Act where it governs, and has lost the trust of millions of

South Africans as a result. [Interjections.] Here in the Western Cape ...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... our outlook could not be more different.

It is clear that the DA has not only won over the trust of the residents of this province, [Interjections.] but managed to instil a [Interjections.] ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What are you talking about?

An HON MEMBER: Are you scared of it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.] You may continue.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): It is clear that the DA has not only won over the trust of the residents of this province, [Interjections.] but managed to instil a renewed sense of hope in millions of South Africans who remain unconvinced of what the ANC has become. [Interjections.] A party which steals from the poor and gives to the rich.

On the contrary here in the Western Cape taxpayers' money is consolidated and spent on what the people of this province both want and need: [Interjections.] Services, safety and opportunity.

Mr P MARRAN: What safety? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): This is the sense of hope that this Government has reignited in people across the country. The IMF has stated that South Africa's vulnerable outlook emphasises the urgency of rebuilding policy buffers and implementing reforms to put the economy on a sustainable and an inclusive growth path.

I stand here very proud to say that the DA has already been doing this for 10 years running, and it shows.

An HON MEMBER: Yôh!

Mr P MARRAN: Shows what?

An HON MEMBER: Where?

Mr P MARRAN: Where? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, I hope my time is being managed.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am managing.

An HON MEMBER: It is up!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): The Premier's Provincial Safety Plan, for example, hon Deputy Speaker, is the appropriation [Interjections.] of over R1 billion to fund a programme to keep our residents safe.

Many people may be asking where such a large budget for this Safety Plan comes from. Well, when public finances are managed so [Interjections.] prudently, a government can adapt its budgets to cater to the changing needs of its residents.

This is precisely, Madam Deputy Speaker, why sound management of public finances is so important, because it allows a government to be vigilant in the face of change and uncertainty. A government's ability to both plan ahead and plan for unforeseen challenges is rooted in the sound management of public money.

This also, this is also how the DA-led Western Cape Government has managed to bolster the province's farmers against the worst drought in a century.

An HON MEMBER: That is right.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): In terms of Section 25 of the Public Finance Management Act, the Provincial Treasury has allowed R50 million in emergency funding ... [Interjections.]

Mr P MARRAN: After they requested [Inaudible - speaking simultaneously.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... for fodder and support and drought-stricken farms across the province.

Again, the fact that the DA-led Western Cape Government has managed public money so well, has allowed us to be vigilant and provide even in times of an emergency.

The same, hon Deputy Speaker, cannot be said about the ANC at National Government. We are still waiting for the promised ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... R147 million from National Treasury for drought relief. An amount which is yet to be released to this province, hon Deputy Speaker [Interjections.].

†‘n AGBARE LID: Skande!

[An HON MEMBER: Disgrace!]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): But we know that the ANC has thrown the Public Finance Management Act out of the window. [Interjections.] What is sad, hon Deputy Speaker, is that this is not the ANC paying for decades of severe financial mismanagement, it is the taxpayer of this country who continues to foot the bill of billions of Rands lost to deeply entrenched corruption and cronyism [Interjections.]; severe financial mismanagement; a bloated public sector wage bill and at the mercy of ANC aligned unions.

This is why, hon Deputy Speaker, South Africa can no longer afford to service its debt. This is why South African State-owned Enterprises are all in financial turmoil. This is why the South African taxpayer has lost complete trust in our Government. [Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, this is ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... this is precisely why the Public Finance Management Act ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... and the audit outcomes are so important, and why the ANC will discredit these results at every turn, because the ANC cannot face the ugly truth ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... that it has run out, that it has run our public finances into the ground.

Hon Deputy Speaker, that is a fact. I thank you. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I see the hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon members, the Western Cape Safety Plan and legislative framework to combat crime rest on four important pillars; vision-inspired provision priorities, but like in the case of the biblical Samson I am afraid it may come crashing down on us.

I therefore have a simple suggestion to the hon Premier. [Interjections.] Make the leaders of the opposition parties in this Legislature part of the team which will draft and negotiate a protocol agreement between the three spheres of government. Invite us to assist your Cabinet and let the solution where ultimately we will arrive at, will be a bipartisan one. One which will ensure that all the existing cracks and omissions [Interjections.] in

these pillars are repaired before building commences.

Throwing money at this problem is not going to solve it, hon Deputy Speaker, because crime will simply waste taxpayers' money further.

The plan is built on pillar one. Pillar one says empower the people. Nobody told me how they are going to empower gangsters; nobody tells me whether they are going to be prepared to take part in whatever we decide we want to do for them. They have the right to say, "We do not want to be part of it."

The priority pillar two: economy and jobs. What happened to our economy? It is in a dustbin status.

An HON MEMBER: Mmm-hmm.

Mr P J MARAIS: Unemployment has reached record levels; even our SOEs are bankrupt.

Pillar three: public transport and mobility. Taxis act like road hogs and Uber drivers have raped women passengers. Is this the transport system? Buses and trains are being burned to ashes, and our highways have become, have made our suburbs mere dormitories. There are no economic activities in the suburbs to speak of.

Pillar four: innovation and culture. There is only one culture here and it is an anti-social racial culture ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member.

Mr P J MARAIS: ... that has developed in this country ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you can finish off.

Mr P J MARAIS: ... and a gang-culture.

So I want to say again, invite the Opposition. Let us come with a protocol agreement that this whole House will support. Let it not be a DA protocol with National Government, but the Western Cape protocol. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marais. I see the hon member Dugmore. [Applause.] Hon member Dugmore.

Mr P J MARAIS: Do you support the Western Cape?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Any decision about the allocation of resources is not easy. It is about choices, and that is why the choices that we make must be transparent in regard to the adjustments and additional allocations being made.

As the ANC we fully support the efforts to make our province safer for everyone, especially those communities most affected by violent crime, and thus, Deputy Speaker, we welcome the willingness of Premier Winde to move away from the blame-and-complain legacy of his predecessor; a legacy which actually made this province unsafer after 10 years of DA rule.

We also welcome the willingness of the Premier to adopt an integrated approach to the fight against crime.

However one would imagine that his budget person, the MEC, would actually embrace and understand what - let us be honest, it is not a plan, it is actually more of a working document, but it is clear that the MEC for Finance himself does not actually [Interjections.] embrace the essence of understand the essence of what is proposed, and that gives us concern.

When the Premier announced his Provincial Safety Plan, which I think we must be clear is a working document and not a plan at this stage [Interjections.], he said it would be informed by two key pillars [Interjections.] ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... one: it would amount to boots on the ground; and secondly, that the plan would focus on

reducing and preventing violence. In other words a commitment was made to focusing on the factors that actually contribute to crime such as unemployment, poverty, inequality, substance abuse, patriarchy and conflict within families, but, Deputy Speaker, yesterday was a day when we were disappointed, because the MEC for Finance, in terms of his delivery - and I want to quote - he said:

“We will over the next 12 months be partnering with the City to train and deploy 1,000 law enforcement officers providing us with more boots on the ground to fight crime.”

Not a word about the second pillar: reducing and preventing violence. Not a cent of new money allocated to the second pillar reducing and preventing violence, and in fact to quote him directly again, he then concludes by saying:

“We have found R1,3 billion to support the deployment of 1,000 law enforcement officers to fight crime, especially violent crime.”

Not a word about the second pillar.

So even the MEC of this Government does not understand the essence of what the Premier said this plan is all about.

There are 10 police precincts in the Western Cape which contribute close to 50% of all murders. These are: Nyanga and Samora Machel; Delft; Khayelitsha; Philippi East; Harare; Gugulethu; Mfuleni; Kraaifontein; Mitchells Plain and Bishop Lavis. Any serious plan would spell out clearly what are the projects, what are the investments, what are the programmes which will impact on poverty, inequality and unemployment in those 10 communities.

It can never be just about boots on the ground. We need infrastructure investment; investment into local economic development and support for entrepreneurs in these communities: Safer Schools; street lighting and security cameras.

That is why we as the Opposition cannot support a budget which actually confirms essentially a boots only approach, and provides no evidence of an integrated approach.

As we said budgets are about choices. If this Government was serious about changing the ownership patterns in agriculture in this province, it could have found resources from its reserve to support black and coloured farmers to actually own farms.

If this Government was serious about changing the ownership patterns of this provincial economy, it could have found the resources to set up an investment fund to support black business from our provincial reserves.

If this Government was serious it could have announced a dedicated fund to boost the quality of social and economic infrastructure in these 10 most affected areas [Interjections.], but a government which admits that there are no social housing projects which have been completed in the inner city and further says that it is not obliged to use Tafelberg site for social housing, has no political will to deal with the legacy of apartheid spatial planning.

We hope you will prove us wrong, Premier, but the DA that we know is not committed to an integrated approach which actually deals with the causes that lead to crime, and if we are going to only follow a boots on the ground approach, we are doomed to failure and we appeal to the Premier to be serious and to explain, to give a workshop to his MEC about what you are actually trying to achieve I submit, thank you.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: You missed the [Inaudible - speaking simultaneously.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you, hon member. I see the hon member Madikizela, Minister. [Interjections.]

†'n AGBARE LID: hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you very

much, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, I do want to, before I deliver my speech, [Inaudible.] by admitting that the Western Cape is by no means perfect, and the Opposition is correct in pointing out the challenges that we are facing, but I do want to go directly where the sources of the problems are, Madam Deputy Speaker, because, you know, I find it surprising that the Opposition wants us to treat the Western Cape as if it is an island.

The Western Cape is part of South Africa [Interjections.] and any challenges that we are facing [Interjections.] nationally, from the National Government, have a huge impact in this province.

Now presenting his Adjustments Budget on Tuesday, Minister Maynier painted a very disturbing picture about our economy, and he spoke about the unprecedented uncertainty in our economy. It is a reality that many people are grappling with.

This reminded me of the words by one of the economists, South African economists, Thabi Leoka, at the recent World Economic Forum hosted by South Africa. She describes South Africa as:

“A beautiful home with a dysfunctional family in which kids are fighting; parents are fighting; the house is dirty with dishes all over, but we want to invite guests.”

Now those words stuck with me because she was describing the situation that we are in in South Africa.

Deputy Speaker, it has now been almost two years since Cyril Ramaphosa was elected as the president of the ANC at Nasrec. Almost 22 months ago he delivered his inaugural speech as the President of the country with much fanfare, in which he promised us a new dawn.

He reignited the hope of many South Africans with the Thuma Mina slogan. Deputy Speaker, I must be honest with you and many of you know this. I have never had faith in President Ramaphosa, [Interjections.] but as a patriot I rallied behind the call to preach the message of hope for our country to redeem ourselves as a nation and attract much needed investment to grow the economy and create jobs that are so desperately needed by millions of South Africans who are unemployed. Unfortunately that hope has been dashed by President Ramaphosa and the ANC, Deputy Speaker.

My lack of faith in him has been proven right. Despite all the noises and investment summits, the country is getting worse under the ANC leadership.

An HON MEMBER: Yôh! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Now just

between 29 October [Interjections.] and now, this is what has happened in South Africa, hon Deputy Speaker.

On 29 October Stats SA released its quarterly Labour Survey, indicating that the unemployment rate has increased to the worst situation in 11 years under this current President.

After the National Minister of Finance's Medium Term Budget Policy Statement on 30 October, the Rand weakened.

On 1 November rating agency Moody's changed our investment status from stable to negative.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So you wanted us to have Mmusi as the President.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: No. [Laughter.] No, I heard the Opposition members [Interjections.] ... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You supported Mmusi.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ... making ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ... a joke
[Interjections.] ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ... I heard the
Opposition members making a joke about Moody's on Tuesday, but let me
be frank here, whatever you may think about Moody's ... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.] your
candidate. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Whatever you
may think about Moody's, but investment [Interjections.] ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Now investors
do listen to Moody's [Interjections.].

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: [Interjections.]
And they base their decision to invest in South Africa on the basis of what
Moody's say.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You wanted South Africans to vote for Mmusi.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: On 14 November again, Stats SA reported that inequality has worsened for black Africans under the ANC Government, and hon member Nkondlo confirmed that.

Ms N D NKONDLO: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: In South Africa [Interjections.], in South Africa [Interjections.] - now if you look at this ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ... this is not talking about the Western Cape. This report that was produced by Stats SA is talking about South Africa. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The Western Cape. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: This province [Inaudible.] problem.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Last week [Interjections.] - now again, last week's settlement between Government

and NUMSA after the industrial action by SA workers, will further deepen our crisis, which is exactly what we have seen in all our SOEs, especially Eskom.

Some may claim that the ANC under Ramaphosa must be given a chance. I would argue that this would be a chance to make things even worse, Deputy Speaker. We do not - truth be told, we do not have an economic crisis in South Africa, we have ANC crisis and leadership crisis under the ANC. [Interjections.]

While they are busy with ideological debate on how to solve our problems, the situation is getting worse under the ANC. We can no longer make excuses and blame global markets for failing to grow the economy, Deputy Speaker. The real issue here and the reason why the country is not growing, is because we have bad leadership and bad party that is managing the economy of South Africa.

An HON MEMBER: It is bad people. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The hardest hit industry which contributed to high unemployment rate, is the construction industry, Deputy Speaker.

Last year around this time this industry lost 163,000 jobs and again this time, this year this industry lost 24,000 jobs. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Within the 10 areas?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: When Minister Maynier announced budget adjustments on Tuesday, he struck a good balance between cushioning the social cluster and infrastructure investment in order to achieve this, and of course I will be sharing more specific details when I table the Adjustments Budget for my Department next week.

Deputy Speaker, this morning we have heard of a very tragic incident where 18 coaches and two trains were burned down in the central line in the City of Cape Town, and we know how important the rail transport is for our economy, and this has a negative impact particularly for a number of poor people who are using this mode of transport, but I must also say, Deputy Speaker, that the only way for Government, because we know that the operational control of PRASA and Rail is with National Government, and I made a commitment immediately after my appointment, that we need to work together to solve this problem, because the people who are getting affected when these things are happening are the people of the Western Cape, and therefore I find it really, really disturbing that there is this constant push-back from PRASA and the National Department of Transport, where we are needed most by the people of this province to put our heads together to solve this problem.

Today's events demonstrate that our rail system continues to be under

attack and is battling to retain its rightful place as the backbone of the public transport. The central line is core to this. The province, the City and PRASA partnership which resulted in the formation and deployment of the Rail Enforcement Unit over the last years, yielded positive results in many aspects.

We intend to continue to work with PRASA in this partnership to connect this to the use of technology to aid in security and central line deployment of REU.

We will continue to work through the Rail Management Task Team that is chaired by myself, to build on the partnership and identify our measures that can be implemented in order for us to solve this problem.

It is critical, Deputy Speaker, that PRASA makes good on its understanding, on its undertaking to fence off the rail reserve with concrete fences, but we must also make sure that we put in additional numbers of security. We must also make sure that we deal with the failing infrastructure and these are some of the commitments that were made by PRASA, and unfortunately this is happening at the time when more trains were supposed to be rolled out before the end of this year or early next year, and I really want to commit here that I will continue working with the National Minister and PRASA so that we can solve this problem.

And lastly, Deputy Speaker, I do want to really appeal to the members of

this House, that we have seen a number of incidents where the central line in particular has been affected by this, and I cannot understand, that after so many occurrences of this, that the intelligence cannot assist us to deal and apprehend people who are causing this; and ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you can finish ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ... again we have a war room that was established by Minister Mbalula and I am spending a lot of time on this, Deputy Speaker, because it is a very-very important issue for the poor commuters of this province.

There is a war room that was established by Minister Mbalula ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, Minister. If you can finish off.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The war room that was established by Minister Mbalula must really start to tell us exactly where the challenges are so that we can put measures in place to deal with this problem. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I see the hon Minister Maynier.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. The hon Leader of the Opposition, Cameron Dugmore, is of course right. I did repeat some of what I said earlier this week and I did so because I wanted to emphasise the fact that we are in deep economic trouble, and I thought that the hon member needed a refresher course so that he could properly appreciate just how serious our situation is in South Africa. [Interjections.]

Now, Deputy Speaker, do not listen to me, listen to the IMF who published a report to which the hon member referred to earlier, which says:

“The vulnerable outlook emphasises the urgency of rebuilding policy buffers and implementing reforms to put the economy on a sustainable and inclusive growth path. Failure to implement the needed adjustments in government and in SOE spending, and efficiency will worsen; debt dynamics will worsen and financial stability will be eroded; with delays in structural reforms, growth and social conditions will worsen in South Africa.”

I hope that the hon member understands [Interjections.] that unless we IMF ourselves, we will be IMF'd by the IMF.

Now the hon member Mvimbi says that we should leave National Government alone, and of course we will leave National Government alone

if National Government leaves us alone and properly runs our ports; properly runs our rail systems and provides security of energy supply so that we can [Applause.] so that we can be competitive in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Of course I agree with the hon member when he says that R59 million is not enough to deal with gender-based violence, but the hon member does not seem to realise that the R59 million to which I referred, is additional funding to combat gender-based violence ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: They cannot count. They cannot count.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... in the Western Cape.

Now the hon member Makamba-Botya talks about unemployment. I hope that she will appreciate that we have done more in this province, more than any other province, to create an enabling environment so that the private sector can create jobs and that is why we have the lowest expanded unemployment rate in the Western Cape, and why we are giving hope to people, especially young people who do not have jobs or have given up

looking ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... for jobs.

The hon member Brett Herron asks, “Where is the Safety Plan?” Well, I believe it is on www.westerncape.gov.za [Interjections.] and I have to be, I am surprised ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM ... that the hon member Herron [Interjections.] ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr B N HERRON: How do you put a billion rand behind this?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thanks. Order, hon members! Thank you, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, I was saying I am surprised that the hon member Brett Herron and the hon member Christians [Interjections.] oppose the Safety Plan.

Mr B N HERRON: We do not oppose it, just present one.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: We will stay the course and that is why we will keep our promises and that is why we have allocated an amount of R130 million ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! I cannot hear ...
...(intervention)

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM ... in the Adjustments Budget.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Herron. Order, hon members! [Interjections.] It is very difficult for me to hear hon Minister from, right at the back, so please if I can have some silence. Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Deputy Speaker, I was saying that I was surprised that the hon member Brett Herron is opposed to the Safety Plan.

Mr B N HERRON: I am not opposed to the Safety Plan ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: We ... [Interjections.]

Mr B N HERRON: ... I would like to see one.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... we will stay the course and we will keep our promises and that is why we have allocated an additional amount of R130 million in the Adjustments Budget so that we can fight crime, especially violent crime [Interjections.] in the Western Cape.

Which brings me to the hon member Nkondlo, and I associate myself with her comments and her compliments about Team Finance and especially the acting head of Provincial Treasury, Julinda Gantana, and the great job that they have done in preparing this budget at Provincial Treasury.

I think I should remind the hon member that this Government over the past four years, has spent about R10,6 billion on social development, supporting the poor in the Western Cape. I am surprised that the hon member is opposed to those allocations.

Mr B N HERRON: And R66 million [Inaudible - speaking simultaneously].

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: When it comes to the, which brings me to the hon member Peter Marais, whose suggestion in respect of the Safety Plan I am sure will be considered and responded to by the Premier.

Which brings me to the closing remarks made by the hon member Dugmore. He is of course right. The Safety Plan does have, as he puts it, two legs: violence reduction and violence prevention.

Of course, I think it is the Leader of the Opposition that needs a workshop, because he does not realise, or does not seem to realise that violence prevention is ongoing and is already being implemented ... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Where is the budget for [Inaudible - speaking simultaneously].

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... in the Western Cape.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Where is the budget? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Consider the Department of Health offering a comprehensive first thousand days programme by health practitioners, specifically to

mothers and caregivers at risk. Consider the work done by Social Development, supporting families at risk, to use alternatives to violence; reducing substance abuse and addressing gender-based violence through evidence-based parenting programmes and other interventions.

Which brings me to my closing remarks, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] I began the week by saying that in the Western Cape we are actually getting things done.

An HON MEMBER: Have you read it?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: We back business; we have world class infrastructure; we have an effective clean, Provincial Government; we have an award winning international airport; we are a leading tourism destination; we are a tech capital of the continent; we are home to four world class universities; we have a vibrant culture; amazing climate and beauty everywhere ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... in the Western Cape, which is why ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM ... we have a growing economy ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Barnes.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM ... and which is why we are giving hope to people especially young people who do not have jobs in the Western Cape. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. That brings us to the end of the speakers. [Interjections.] That completes - hon members from the Opposition benches, hon member Bans, I am watching you. Can I please have your attention? I am speaking. Thank you very much.

[Interjections.] That concludes - hon member Bans!

†‘n AGBARE LID: Nei, my ou.

[An HON MEMBER: No, my man.]

†‘n AGBARE LID: Wat van *MEC* ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: What about MEC ... [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, can I have your attention please? [Interjections.] Both of you, I am talking to you. [Interjections.] Hon member, I am talking to you. [Interjections.] Okay, thank you.

Alright, that concludes the debate on the Consideration of the Principle of the Bill. Are there any objections to the approval of the Principle of the Bill?

HON MEMBERS: No.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections.

An HON MEMBER: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, would you like to put it on, into the record?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Into the record ...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry, can you stand up?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... the African National Congress objects to the Principle of this Bill.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, that will be noted. The Secretary will now read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The House will now deal with the separate votes from now onwards. I now call an adjournment, but before we adjourn I would like to inform the members that the CPA general meeting will commence immediately after the adjournment of the House, and please note that on Monday, 2 December 2019, the proceedings will commence at 10 a.m. and this concludes the business of the day.

The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 15:42.