

---

THURSDAY, 28 AUGUST 2014

---

The House met at

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p

The SPEAKER: Order, order members. We now proceed to interpellations as printed on the Question Paper. I recognise the hon Minister Meyer.

**INTERPELLATIONS:**

*Municipalities: irregular and unauthorised expenditure*

**1. Mr M Mnqasela asked the Minister of Finance:**

What plans are in place to support Western Cape municipalities to address and limit findings from the Auditor-General related to (a) irregular and (b) unauthorised expenditure?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, during September 2013 the provincial top management team met with the senior officials of municipalities as part of the MGRO process. That is the Municipal Governance and Review Outlook Process. The aim was to identify governance challenges and forging single-minded action plans and processes to address

these challenges. Subsequent to the September engagements municipalities provided their Provincial Treasury and the Department of Local Government with their completed governance action plans.

The Provincial Treasury and the Department of Local Government engaged with each municipality during 17 February 2014 until the 11<sup>th</sup> of March this year, on the following:

In terms of progress achieved by each municipality with the implementation of the municipal governance action plans as at 31 January 2014, there was also an engagement with each municipality on the 2012/13 audit outcomes to address the challenges in the audit and management report.

Hon Madam Speaker emanating from the abovementioned engagements support plans have been adopted to address the findings in respect of unauthorised irregular fruitless or wasteful expenditure from the Auditor-General. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: I see hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you Madam Speaker. If you look at the Auditor-General's report on fruitless and wasteful expenditure and the irregular payments and the whole financial control, it points out the fact that 96% of the R15.2 million in fruitless and wasteful expenditure was disclosed in the respective audits, that means therefore that within the municipalities

concerned there were signals and warnings but politicians do not want to listen. Now we need to ensure that we instil that discipline and good leadership and over and above that ensure that politicians understand that if they do not listen there will be consequences, and in this case this is one of the areas where serious emphasis has to be made; both the Auditor-General and the Financial and Fiscal Commission are making this point that leadership in municipalities, both in the administration and politically, should come to the fore and take control in this particular area. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And what about the MECs? Our MEC, who does things there?

Mr M MNQASELA: The other example here is the Central Karoo. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Staff meetings.

An HON MEMBER: With your presence.

Mr M MNQASELA: Central Karoo Municipal District, the ANC is in charge there, what they are doing there [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There is one ANC in this province. There is one ANC.

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: When they take the money that should be used to pay pensions for the employees who are working hard. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is the MEC aware? What is the MEC doing?

Mr M MNQASELA: They use that to run the affairs of the municipalities.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi. Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: How do you explain such [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ...an abomination - it is a serious abomination.

The SPEAKER: Are you rising on a point of order hon member Mr Dyantyi?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Can the member take a question? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Oh come on! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, will you take a question? [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you Madam Speaker, there was no point of order.  
[Interjections.] Madam Speaker [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: In Central Karoo 100% of the issues that were raised before had recurred in the 2012/2013 financial year [Interjection.] ...because there is no will in that municipality in political leadership and administration. They are bluntly corrupt [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M MNQASELA: ...to the core. We need to fix that. Thank you, Minister Meyer. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Owen Rogers out there [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: He is your mayor.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Hinana.

An HON MEMBER: Why him? Why him? [Interjections.] He must go.

Mr N E HINANA: Thanks Madam Speaker. The Auditor-General  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr N E HINANA: ... has a constitutional mandate and as the supreme audit institution of South Africa exists therefore to strengthen our democracy by enabling the oversight, accountability and governance in the public sector through auditing by building public confidence.

It is evident in the Auditor-General's report that there is serious cause for concern about the maladministration of the municipalities that are governed by the ANC. [Interjections.]

The people of Kannaland and Oudtshoorn Municipality deserve better service delivery. [Interjections.] They should therefore not bear the brunt of greedy politicians who selfishly cater for themselves instead of the community's true effective service delivery. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr N E HINANA: Therefore the fact that the Auditor-General found the irregular and unauthorised expenditure in these municipalities is indicative of the reality facing the communities under the ANC administration. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja, ja.

Mr N E HINANA: I urge the hon Minister Meyer through his department's corrective steps to hold the underperforming municipalities accountable. [Interjections.] As elected representatives we will surely take our mandate responsibly and seriously and prioritise the well-being of the citizens of the Western Cape and not misappropriate the ratepayers' money. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you Madam Speaker. I would like the MEC when he stands up to respond to these serious issues that are coming out of the pages of the report that we are talking about. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Do not worry about him. He will...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You know as we stand and speak here that only three out of the 11 clean audits do not have supply chain findings on them. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The second indictment that I wanted to talk about, is to stop talking about MGRO. That is the future. That still is to come. We were hearing yesterday that municipal officials lacked competencies to even prepare a financial statement and that they had to rely on consultants and pay

a lot of money for that. What are you doing about that? [Interjection.] That is what you need to come and speak to us about here [Interjection.] through the Speaker, yes, I am looking at him. [Interjections.] I am speaking through the Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: The ANC doesn't have a policy [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Secondly, you have vacancies; there are CFO positions that have not been filled [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: This Minister must tell us what is he doing about that, because the red flags do not go up with what that other two members were talking about; as we sit here the Auditor-General's report is clear that heads of supply chain management do not have the competencies. That is your heads of supply chain management. What is he doing about that? Stop going around [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Just employ...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Come to the point and run a proper government in this province. Please stand up and respond. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! I see the hon member Mr Max.



Mr L H MAX: Madam Speaker, it is very clear from this debate that hon member Mr Dyantyi does not live in the Western Cape [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr L H MAX: ...or have a clue what is going on in the Western Cape politics. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He is here every day. How can he not know?

Mr L H MAX: The Auditor General's report [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Oor my dooie liggaam.

Mr L H MAX: The Auditor General's report [Interjections.] ...speaks volumes. [Interjection.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Vat hom Fluffie.

Mnr L H MAX: If that is what is happening in the Western Cape municipalities as he indicated, then I do not know; where did he find it? This Western Cape is the best run with regard to municipalities. [Interjections.]

[Applause.]

Where things go wrong [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is a dream, you are dreaming.

Mr L H MAX: ...is where the ANC governs. [Interjections.] It is where bad politics exist [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is a blue dream.

Mr L H MAX: And that is Kannaland and Oudtshoorn. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Honourable [Interjections.]

Mr L H MAX: And then on top of this [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Max, order please. Hon member Mr Dyantyi, if you will refrain from running commentary; the odd interjection is okay, but you are actually providing a running commentary. Thank you. [Interjections.]

Mr L H MAX: May I proceed?

The SPEAKER: You may continue. Thank you.

Mr L H MAX: Thank you Madam Speaker. Local Government, as I stated earlier on in the previous debate is the best in the Western Cape ever since 1994... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Your time is up hon member Mr Max.

Mr L H MAX: ...and you know what [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired.

Mr L H MAX: That is a pity, Madam Speaker. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: A sweetheart question.

Mr M MNQASELA: ...it concerns me [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That the MECs [Inaudible.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ...that we stand here [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Short and sweet.

Mr M MNQASELA: ...to listen to the rowdy unbecoming behaviour [Interjections.] ...of some members here who have failed to win through the elections, because the ANC stood in an election that we won convincingly. [Interjections.]

If you have anything to say, accept that you are now in opposition and act as a responsible and a constructive Opposition. [Interjections.] What we see in municipalities is the lack of leadership in the areas where I have mentioned, and I was talking about Central Karoo District as an example and other municipalities where we have highlighted this as a problem. We have to get to a point where municipalities not just get unqualified audit opinions, but also help them to get clean audits without findings.

An HON MEMBER: That is the DA.

Mr M MNQASELA: It will mean therefore we need to have the kind of cooperation [Interjections.] ... that we expect to get from the ANC that is very destructive, that has pronounced that they will make this Western Cape ungovernable. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Who said that?

Mr M MNQASELA: We promise [Interjections.] ... the voters and people in Kannaland and other places [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Who said that?

An HON MEMBER: Your ANC Government [Interjection.]

Mr M MNQASELA: ...that we are coming [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ...come 2016 we are going to clean this mess. Thank you.  
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, if I may, please refrain from pointing your finger into anybody's eye. Thank you. [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: I do not have such long arms.

The SPEAKER: Well, the rate at which you are going there you might just get across the aisle. [Interjections.] I see the hon Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you Madam Speaker. The hon member Mr Dyantyi asked me to be direct. I will be direct in my response. The hon member Mr Dyantyi knows that those issues that he is raising, the lack of

internal controls, the lack of budget constraints, the lack of political leadership happen in Oudtshoorn - your municipality, in Kannaland, where you are in charge [Interjections.] ... in Matzikama, where you are in charge and in Cederberg where you are in charge. [Interjections.]

Let me read to him [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] It is not the ANC.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: He asked me to be direct. I will be direct. This is the report of the Auditor-General and it says [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: We know about the report.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Yes, but you have not read it. That is why I will be reading it to you. It says there: "A special intervention is required at Oudtshoorn Municipality." You are not reading the report. That is why I am reading it to you. [Interjections.]

We are the only Provincial Government in South Africa that has a... [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Order! Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Is it on a point of order?

Mr R T OLIVIER: It is a point of order, Madam Speaker. Is it correct for the Minister to point a finger at us?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I withdraw my finger but not my argument. [Laughter.] [Interjections.] Madam Speaker [Interjections.] I withdraw my finger, but not my argument. The reality is that the Western Cape Province is the only provincial government in South Africa that has a tool called the MGRO; the only institution in South Africa that has a MGAP (Municipal Governance and Action Plan). We are assisting municipalities by putting governance action plans together with self-assessment with municipalities. We do the validation. We assist with the reporting and the action plans in the monitoring and evaluation and that is the result of the good audit outcomes the Auditor-General is talking about [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We are looking for answers, not talk. Talk is cheap.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...so what hon member Mr Dyantyi is talking about does not exist. [Interjections.] This is why hon member Mr Max is right, he lives in another province. He does not know what he is talking about. He is not staying in the Western Cape. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am not a refugee, you know.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: He is talking about something else [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...something from another planet, but not from the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: That brings us to the end of Interpellation 1.

Debate concluded.

The SPEAKER: We now move to Interpellation 2. I recognise the hon Minister Fritz.

*National Lottery: Social Development Sector, funding*

**2. Ms M M Wenger asked the Minister of Social Development:**

What is the impact of the National Lottery reducing funding to Non-governmental and Non-profit Organisations in the Social Development sector in the province?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you Madam Speaker and thank you to the hon member Ms Wenger for the interpellation. Let me start by saying the very, very short part of the answer is it has had a huge impact [Interjections.]



Mr M N PAULSEN: Short and sweet.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... and allow me to just expand on that [Interjection.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Short and sweet.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Allow me also to contextualise the importance of our NGO partners [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Make it short and sweet.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...And the first point [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, I am going to have to call you to order, if you continue to interject.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It is so serious that I think the people in the gallery would really want to listen to the answer.

The NGO sector plays an important role in helping to build a self-reliant society in the Western Cape and through their dedication, hard work and commitment to service many NGOs are doing absolutely good work and really embodies the department's mission statement in which we say "to

ensure the provision of a comprehensive network of social development services that enables and empowers the poor, the vulnerable and those with special needs.”

Hon members, NGOs like this are part of our mission. However, as the Department of Social Development we have received pleas from some of the NGOs we fund, which indicate that they are finding it increasingly difficult to operate owing to the drying up of funding from the National Lottery Fund.

In the last financial year in particular we received many complaints from the NGO sector including NGOs we work with and help with funding, which indicate the difficulty they found themselves in due to the National Lottery withdrawing their support to them. Their problems are compounded by the drop in support and funding from private sector through the CSI, the Corporate Social Investment funding. This could perhaps be attributed to the difficult economic times and climate that we are going through and especially in the wake of the recent recession. These combined factors have seen some NGOs relying more and more on the department becoming their major funder and in some cases their only source of income. Many NGOs that had applied for funding that had in many cases previously received it on a yearly basis, suddenly found they receive rejection letters from the Lotto owing to insufficient funds, hon member Ms Wenger.

We know that the Lotto had received more funding applications from the NGO sector than what they have funds available for. However, one of the

greatest issues we often hear of is that it can take their administration as much as two years to inform NGOs whether they have been successful or not and that is very, very unacceptable.

This is a very serious matter. Various NGOs have closed their doors and some of the stronger NGOs have had to reduce staff or close down some projects. The Department of Social Development has however tried to step in, in many instances to assist by providing funding to the NGOs that may have been in the process of closing.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Ms Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you Madam Speaker. Last year the National Lotteries Board received 850 applications from charities in the Western Cape amounting to about R1.2 billion. This would indicate that there is significant need in our communities from NGOs and NPOs for support. The reality is that we are living in hard times. It is in these hard times when funding that comes from donations dries up and makes it very difficult for these organisations to function without funding. Of the R1.2 billion requested only R165 million was allocated.

The most widely-known role of the National Lotteries Board is its assistance of the NGO sector to promote social development and as we have heard from the Minister, vast sums of money have been channelled to various programmes and projects. However, despite the positive contributions many

problems have been experienced. For many organisations the Lotto is their main or sole source of funding and they find themselves on tenterhooks waiting to hear whether they will continue to survive or whether they have to close their operations and stop service because of the lack of funding or because of a delay or reduction in contribution from the NLB. [Interjections.] If organisations are lucky enough to get funding it is only for 12 months which also makes sustainability... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members!

Ms M M WENGER: If organisations are lucky enough to get funding it is only for 12 months which makes sustainability difficult. The problems with applications and processing have been widely documented over a period of many years and the NLB has undertaken to address these and there is literature available on remedial measures, but yet these problems persist and these administrative problems have a very real impact on the daily lives of many people. Lotto funding is important for NGOs and NPOs.

I can give you some examples; for example Mr Koopman from a small community in Bitou who cooks a nutritious meal for 100 people each and every day of the work week. He does this with Lotto funding and he would not be able to provide this service without the funding. He and those 100 people are very grateful for the help and Mr Koopman does this work voluntarily for the community. Surely the administrative hurdles should be knocked down so that funding can get to where it should. Thank you.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] I see the hon member Ms Du Toit Marais.

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Thank you Madam Speaker. The Department of Social Development ensures that a comprehensive network of social development services is provided to enable and empower the poor, vulnerable and those with special needs. The National Lottery is intended to provide a sustainable source of funding for non-profit organisations. This funding, it is hoped, will help secure a better life for all citizens.

It seems that barely half of the money available for distribution has actually been distributed. This represents a complete disregard for the necessary institutional and social factors needed to make legislation work and is sadly indicative of the increasing inability of the South African National Government to match its social commitments with actual delivery.

I commend the Western Cape Department of Social Development and the NGOs who under difficult circumstances never cease to deliver comprehensive services to our vulnerable communities. I thank you.

'n AGBARE LID: Mooi! [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Ms Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, this is just another sop-DA question. They deflect and justify the fact that this MEC's department is the main culprit to cut funding to numerous NPOs in this province and community organisations that deliver vital services to very poor people [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi kole!

Me M N GILLION: ...including nutritional meals; advice offices, etcetera. The real question this MEC should answer is what is his department doing to assist, develop and guide all those organisations this Western Cape Provincial Department of Social Development has bumped off the funding list, for all sorts of petty reasons, while assisting the poorest of the poor in this province? Even if there were concerns, what did this department do to regularise all those organisations that inherently had trouble with administrative and bookkeeping skills? Many organisations deliver good services. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M N GILLION: Unfortunately too many had to close as they were failed by this department. Lotto funding on the other hand is not a provincial competency and merely a windfall awarded in an *ad hoc* way and not a sustainable means of providing money to any beneficiary organisation. However, this department's assistance is dependent upon this aid, yet it is not

developmentally minded in any way to keep up this aid to the poor. How is this MEC going to change that?

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Ms Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Speaker, many of our existing community organisations have been established through the needs of hunger within these said communities. Groups of people came together and out of their households and their personal money bought extra grocery ingredients to be able to feed an extra hungry tummy on the street. The National Lottery has been created as a catalyst for social upliftment.

The mandate and the mission of the National Lotteries Board is the deployment of state institutions for greater good. This is the context which informs the National Lotteries Board investment since its inception in 2000.

As said by the Chairperson of the National Lotteries Board and I quote: “We are now more capacitated from an executive point of view to discharge our socio-economic development mandate and to help government proactively respond to the Greek philosopher Aristotle’s warning that “poverty is the parent of revolution and crime”, yet we see complaint after complaint of less support to community organisations from the same Lotteries Board. The Lotteries Board has a responsibility to deliver on the mandate it proclaims it stands for [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Botha, finish your sentence.

Ms L J BOTHA: It is Mahatma Ghandi who said: "There are people in the world so hungry that God cannot appear to them except in the form of bread."

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Ms Wenger. May I just before you speak, hon member Mr Paulsen, I need to ask you to please be compliant. An interjection is okay but when you continue a running commentary it is destructive and it does not afford the person speaking the opportunity, so if you do not mind, an interjection is allowed but you cannot have a running commentary. Thank you, you may proceed.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you Madam Speaker. We hear about so many organisations that make a real and meaningful impact to social development and yet which are struggling to get their funding from the NLB. In 2013 R893 million was allocated nationally to charities and R716 million was disbursed. This begs the question what happened to the R177 million that was allocated and not disbursed?

We hear about so many organisations that make a real and meaningful impact to social development and yet are struggling to get their funding from the NLB, yet the NLB allocated R40 million to the NYDA for a kissing festival. Surely this was a poor prioritisation of funds. [Interjections.]

The NLB really must get this right. Funds must get to our charities where



they are most needed and funds must get to where they are most needed on time. People's well-being depends on it and we must encourage the NLB to ensure the provision of lotto funding to a network of social development services that truly enables and empowers the poor and the vulnerable. Thank you.

'n AGBARE LID: Mooi!

The SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you Madam Speaker. I need to firstly say that the hon member Ms Gillion made the point - and you people really make this point very loosely - that we do not have a comprehensive funding policy. I think it is a very serious matter, because I have the facts here in front of me that is actually audited by the Auditor-General, and allow me to just mention a couple of facts.

When we came into power we introduced a comprehensive NGO funding policy that enabled us to ensure that the funding applications and allocations are managed through a consistent and transparent process, not through who I think should get funding. She mentioned the advice office, it is very interesting [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: He is pointing his fingers.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The issue is, handle the application and forget about people's political affiliation. Throw that into the sea for a change and focus on the service that people deliver. I think that is an important point of departure that we must really, really respect.

I want to also say along with that, that we introduced a very comprehensive departmental system for monitoring the use of these funds, and to see that NGOs ensure that the money gets to the vulnerable people; not into my pocket, but to the people on the ground who are poor [Interjections.] ... but we all talk, because we know about the extent of poverty. This is the problem. It will be hard to romanticise it. Instead of saying: "Stop stealing the money of the people and get the money to where people must get service delivery..." [Interjections.] And this is the issue that you must address, and of course hon member Ms Wenger spoke about the Kissing Festival, R40 million spent on a Kissing Festival [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Fritz [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...those are the kind of priorities. This is not an attack on the Lotteries Board. We are asking them just to please prioritise the plight of our people and be a part of that system [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Fritz, your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...of all of society.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That brings us to the end of Interpellation 2.

Debate concluded.

The SPEAKER: We will now move to Interpellation 3. I see the hon Minister Meyer.

*Cango Caves: annual contribution to economic growth*

**3. Mr Q R Dyantyi asked the Minister of Finance:**

What is the annual contribution of the Cango Caves to the (a) Oudtshoorn Municipality and (b) economic growth in the Eden District?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you very much hon member Mr Dyantyi. The 2014/15 budgeted operating income of the Cango Caves amounts to R13.858 million and budgeted operating expenditure amounts to R15.564 million resulting in an operating deficit of R1.7 million. The operating deficit is mainly due to a depreciation that forms part of the operating expenditure.

During 2014/15 Oudtshoorn Municipality budgeted an income for building and lease of R1.391 million and administration recoveries of R1.496 million

from the Cango Caves.

The Eden District accounts for 7.3% of the Western Cape Gross Domestic Product per region, and Oudtshoorn constitutes 12.1% of the Eden District GDP.

Oudtshoorn and the Eden District sectoral composition in other words is what constitutes the various sectors of the economy in that particular region for the last ten years from 2000 to 2011, the highest percentage of the sectors of the economy in that region. Firstly let us analyse the Oudtshoorn composition and then that in relation to Eden. Firstly, the strongest sector in the economy in Oudtshoorn is the central government sectors at 24.2%, the finance insurance, real estate and business services sector constitute 19.1% in Oudtshoorn, followed by the manufacturing sector of 16% and then followed by wholesale, retail, catering and accommodation, and this is also the sector that is covered by tourism and the Cango Caves is part of that 13.9%.

The question also relates; what does that translate into percentages, in terms of the Eden District. We also know that in the broader context of the economy it is 6% for agriculture in the Eden District. Mining and quarrying is 0.2%, manufacturing in Eden is 18%, electricity, gas and water are 1.8%. Construction constitutes 18.1% and transport, storage and accommodation constitute 7.9% and wholesale, retail trade, catering and accommodation in the Eden District, 17.7%. Transport, storage and communication - I have already alluded to that - constitute 7.9% and community, social and personal

services 5%. Finance, insurance and real estate are a bigger sector of the economy and in Eden region constitute 23.4%, and in that whole region of Eden general government services constitute 11.5%.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I was hoping that you were going to help me, Madam Speaker, because I asked a very specific question. What is the contribution of the Cango Caves? [Interjections.]

'n AGBARE LID: Waar is jou Mayor? Go and look.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Hy is orals, soos altyd.

'n AGBARE LID: Jy is nêrens, soos altyd.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So I am not surprised. [Interjections.] But I am going to help him to bring him back and even everybody else will speak on his behalf to come back to the issue: Cango Caves [Interjections.]

'n AGBARE LID: En Gordon April?

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ek het nie oor Eden gevra en al die goed waarvan die LUR nou praat nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

An HON MEMBER: The point is you have no interest, so. [Laughter.] There are plenty of him.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: On a point of order.

The SPEAKER: A point of order?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The question is specifically on the economic growth in the Eden District, so Eden is relevant in this context.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Sit. Dankie. [Interjections.] It is very clear even though the MEC has not responded specifically in terms of what I asked. We know as we stand here, that the Cango Caves are an important asset in this country and Oudtshoorn Municipality. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: So help us.

The SPEAKER: Order, gentlemen!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He's evaded coming to that but we know. That is what it is. Knowing what the Cango Caves are contributing; I stand here very concerned about the very same MEC who is responsible for and helping economic growth and running proper finances in the municipalities. He will go out of his way instead of helping the municipality that is struggling with a particular asset. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: They do not want to be helped. It is Oudtshoorn, remember.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And applying two rules in the way he is leading the province. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Do not worry. We will help them.

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: One rule is to smear and discredit any institution or any municipality where the DA is not in control.

An HON MEMBER: But I think you should not be in control.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The second rule, where the DA is in control, to protect, shield, anything to justify as long as it is in-house. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Go and visit the Caves. Then you will see [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oudtshoorn is the point in case here, at least has been until yesterday. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

An HON MEMBER: There is corruption at Oudtshoorn. You must go there.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Oudtshoorn was a point in case at least until yesterday. I am hoping that as from today we are going to get a different message towards Oudtshoorn [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You must go there. You must go there.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You must go there.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...but I want to go further. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The MEC has shared with this House, even though he is all over the place, the important economic tourism contribution that the Cango Caves bring to the Oudtshoorn Municipality. The Caves are an important asset. Yet the MEC in his utterances, in his behaviour, in his showmanship has completely damaged the image of the Cango Caves and with that goes the tourism growth [Interjections.] ...of that area. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: What are you trying to do and what is your point?



Mr Q R DYANTYI: One MEC tries to promote tourism, MEC Winde. The other MEC within the same House negates that. Die DA is deurmekaar. Hulle is deurmekaar. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Your time is up hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: My time might be up. I am not done yet. [Time expired.] [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Well you may finish your sentence. [Interjections.] I see the hon member Mr Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you Madam Speaker. The Mayor of Oudtshoorn issued a statement on the 21<sup>st</sup> of July where the Mayor attempted to set the record straight on a media statement made by the MEC of Finance, Dr Ivan Meyer.

The statement was about the management of the Congo Caves. The Mayor said the municipalities owned [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Congo Caves.

Mr D JOSEPH: Congo Caves. The Mayor said that the municipality owns the Caves and my worry is that the Congo Caves will disappear while it is under the management of the ANC. The R16 million mentioned in the budget for upgrading is not explained.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Says who?

Mr D JOSEPH: In response to the [Interjections.] statement I think we must set the record straight that the DA has won the by-election and the ANC who so believes in democracy refuses to hand over the power. [Interjections.]

The ANC who has a liberation struggle history, which we are not going to deny, does not understand democracy anymore. [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The Cango Caves.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr D JOSEPH: The ANC is illegal and therefore all the decisions you make are illegal. [Interjections.] It is illegal if you are illegally in charge. We have to say that to you. [Interjections.].

The Cango Caves are an international heritage site. The ANC does not even know that. The purpose of that site is drawing people to the country and to the Western Cape for job creation, which is a big part of the income from tourists to this heritage site. I do not think that the Mayor himself or the municipality itself knows what the contribution is because they do not know how to manage finance in that municipality.

I think I will welcome the request by the MEC for further investigation as the

report has indicated a meeting with the AG and the MEC of Finance to conduct further in-depth investigations into that municipality so that we can actually find out what the income is and what the ANC knows about the income. They do not know. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: It is not the ANC [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: For his scenes the hon AWB makes the following point, to just demonstrate the 'deurmekaar ding in die DA.' He says [Interjections.]

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Wie is AWB?

Die SPEAKER: Wie is AWB? [Tussenwerpsels.] [Gelag.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Any obscurity about the money matters and management of the Congo Caves can be ironed out with the Oudtshoorn Municipality [Interjections.] ...but that is the MEC for Local Government who says that. Again the other MEC says something else.

'n AGBARE LID: AWB, Anton Bredell.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hy is AWB wat al [Tussenwerpsels.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Madam Speaker on a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Can the hon member call one of our members AWB; is it parliamentary? [Interjections.] [Laughter.] Is it parliamentary?

The SPEAKER: Sorry, thank you, will you respond?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, I can, I can call him that. Hy is Anton Wilhelm Bredell. [Gelag.] [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Please, members, order.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The MEC for Finance should have asked that MEC for Local Government before he made this announcement, because that is the way to go to engage with the municipality, sit down with them and find solutions to that.

'n AGBARE LID: Die AWB was reg.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: If there is anything untoward financially in a municipality [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: On a point of order. Hon member Mr Dyantyi.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Madam Speaker is it parliamentary to come to parliament with dirty shoes? [Laughter.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: You may proceed please. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please. Order hon members! [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I will take the hon member for some good shopping. I do not think he is good at that, but let me leave that. [Interjections.] If there is anything untoward financially in a municipality the accepted thing to do is to engage with those municipalities. The MEC for Finance could not do that. Is it that he is using the Cango Caves as a political football? He is using the so-called disappearance of R16 million because the DA until yesterday was not in control of Oudtshoorn. That is the reason why he made the noises without even speaking to the municipality.

Mr M G E WILEY: Read the Auditor-General's report.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, we read and very carefully so that the Cango Caves have not submitted financial reports to the Minister and almost R16 million or more [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Let him speak for himself.

Mr M MNQASELA: I want to understand, please †mhlekazi sukundifundisa ukuthetha. \*Don't teach me how to speak. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: I want to understand what the Minister is going to do in turning this situation around. It is embarrassing in our tourism sector, and remember the Cango Caves site is one of the very instrumental mechanisms to raise funds and profit that community which is the heartland of our tourism sector among others. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hear, hear.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you Madam Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: What about Robben Island?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let us remind this House that the DA Government destabilised the day they board the five councillors [Interjections.]

Secondly, we know for a fact that the court ruled that the meeting you had was illegal. You know it as you sit there. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: What does that have to do with the Congo Caves?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thirdly, now that you are in control of the municipality will you help change your attitude towards Oudtshoorn? Maybe ask one of the members here and you can make a statement and claim the victory of yesterday and help that municipality, and I am hoping to hear that [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Try to stick to your own interpellation about the Congo Caves. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I would like to hear the MEC to tell us whether before he made that statement he spoke with the Mayor of Oudtshoorn [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: There is no Mayor.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There is a Mayor. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And after that why would he have instituted an investigation after he went to the media and played to the gallery, if he was a responsible MEC for Finance, nogal! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon Minister Meyer. [Interjections.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hy skryf nou, moenie worry. Hy sal...

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, this member who comes to this House with dirty shoes must know that I have been to the Congo Caves on Monday. There is a surprise waiting for you. What I have seen on Monday in the Congo Caves is shocking. There is no conservation management plan as required by law.

An HON MEMBER: Fix that. Do not make noise around it.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The Cave's site is an asset for the region. The ANC is destroying that asset in that region and the ANC wanted to give a tender to one of its friends at the Caves, and yesterday we were again victorious in a court case by Judge Hlophe that stopped this situation of the ANC cadre who wanted a contract at the Congo Caves. [Interjections.]

Judge Hlophe stopped this ANC right in its footsteps here in the High Court. These are your friends.



Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Sies!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: This is what the ANC wants to do with the Cango Caves but Judge Hlophe stopped this in the court case yesterday and this therefore is a victory for the people of the Western Cape. We will not allow the Caves to become the ANC's Western Cape Nkandla. [Interjections.]

Let us remind this House, the ANC wants to milk the Cango Caves and we have put a stop to this milking of the Cango Caves.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That brings us to the end of interpellations.

Debate concluded.

The SPEAKER: We will now deal with questions as printed on the Question Paper.

### **QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

The SPEAKER: The hon member Mr Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you Madam Speaker, the Premier is not here at present. She will be here shortly. I understand that she has corresponded with hon member Mr Fransman that she will answer the question when she arrives,

alternatively I do understand that hon member Mr Fransman has indicated the question must stand over. If that is the case, then so be it.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mr Fransman. Would you want it for later or to stand over?

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Madam Speaker, we obviously want to register our discomfort at the fact that the Premier is not here to reply, but bearing in mind that we would prefer her to reply herself and not necessarily to delegate it to any other MEC, we therefore suggest that it stands over.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, may I just reply to that please?

The SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr M G E WILEY: I could fully understand the hon member Mr Fransman's discomfort. The Premier was at the Supreme Court of Appeal upholding the Constitution whereby the National Prosecuting Authority [Interjections.] which has been in breach of High Court Orders has been ordered to come to rights within seven days. [Interjections.] I can understand your discomfort.

The SPEAKER: Noted.

*[Question by the Leader of the Opposition Mr Fransman to the hon Premier to stand over.]*

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Madam Speaker, bearing in mind the argument by the Chief Whip; can the Chief Whip also impose the same practice when it comes to the DA that actually opposed the Human Rights Commission report around the sanitation issues in the City of Cape Town? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I think we need to move on. We were dealing with the issue of Question 1 and the fact that it would stand over. So can we move to the next question please, which is the question standing over. It is Question 5. I recognise Minister Madikizela.

*Question standing over from Thursday, 7 August 2014, as agreed to by the House:*

*Capacity to deliver housing*

**5. Mr M N Paulsen asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

Whether his department is considering the development of capacity to deliver housing; if not, why not; if so what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much Madam Speaker. My department is working together with municipalities and using municipalities as implementing agents. We have worked very closely with municipalities to assist them to deal with some of the capacity constraints

like planning, where we have appointed the professional resource teams, which are working now with municipalities to make sure that there is a pipeline of projects created so that when funding is made available it is used immediately.

We have also worked with municipalities to ensure that there is alignment in terms of the housing demand database through the establishment of the housing demand database improvement programme, to ensure the selection of beneficiaries is done fairly so we deal with the perception of corruption at that level. So these are some of the things amongst others that we have done to strengthen the implementation of projects at a municipal level. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Paulsen.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Thank you Madam Speaker, and welcome back, hon Minister Madikizela, I have not seen you for a while. I was wondering if you were one of those who has been replaced.

The SPEAKER: Your question.

Mr M N PAULSEN: You know Minister Madikizela, the shortage of houses in the Western Cape is 500 000. This province boasts that it is going to build 10 000 [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Where is your question?

Mr M N PAULSEN: Listen! As jy kan luister dan moet jy jou mond hou.

'n AGBARE LID: Nee, Uh-uh, no.

The SPEAKER: Honourable, on a point of order hon member Mr Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, he cannot make up the rules as he goes along. Can he put the question please?

The SPEAKER: Sorry, you are entitled to a follow-up question hon member Mr Paulsen.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I did not [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Please desist from making statements. Ask your question.

Mr M N PAULSEN: I did not hear, I asked whether you were going to build capacity to deliver houses. I am not speaking about managing the delivery. Are you actually going to develop the capacity to physically build houses instead of outsourcing it?

The SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Speaker, I think the

member should have been properly inducted to understand the municipal  
[Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: A point of order Madam Speaker [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I am responding to a question.  
There is no point of order.

Mr M N PAULSEN: No, you are making a statement. You must answer.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: This is the answer that I am  
giving you.

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjection.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: No you are making a statement. I want an answer.  
[Interjections.] Short and sweet like you.

The SPEAKER: Proceed Minister Madikizela, continue.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In terms of what the member  
is saying, let me answer his question as to the reality of the situation.

An HON MEMBER: Good!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The problem of housing shortage is not only a problem that is unique in the Western Cape. There are a number of factors which I am going to get to now.

Mr M N PAULSEN: No, do not give me that. What are you doing?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Nationally we have a backlog of 2.3 million households. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is one [Inaudible.] You govern here.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I want to put this into context so that you can understand. [Interjections.] The Western Cape is not an island. It is part of South Africa. Now you must understand that this problem is bigger than the Western Cape. Nationally we have a backlog of 2.3 million households. In this province we have a backlog of about 500 000 families and there are a number of reasons why we have this backlog and part of the problem is because of population growth through various reasons. You might have seen hon member, that in just ten years between 2001 and 2011 the population of the Western Cape has grown by 1.3 million people [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That we know.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...and that contributed to the

backlog that we see. It has nothing to do with lack of capacity because the allocation that comes to this province is spent every year. In the last five years we have not sent back a cent to the national Treasury. All the money was spent, but the reason why there is so much backlog is because of the factors that I have just mentioned, which has nothing to do with lack of capacity. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Madam Speaker, I am not hon member Mr Paulsen, but I think the Minister did not do justice in answering his question. I think I must repeat this question for my own purposes [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Well do that. You must ask the question.

Mr K E MAGAXA: That to what extent is the department willing to improve its capacity so that we do not have a department that is reducing the target every year. Every year we reduce the target, instead of building 15 houses we promised, we reduce it to 13, the next year to ten.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You are not here to make a speech. You must ask a question.

Mr K E MAGAXA: This year we are going to be delivering 10 as building target, and we have been reducing the target ever since I have been sitting



here. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: But all the ANC can do is just repeat what the EFF says.

The SPEAKER: Excuse me, on a point of order hon member Mr Wiley?

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, the Standing Rules are very clear on this matter. A question must be posed. If it is prefixed with a short sentence to lead up to the question that is fine, but they give a long sentence, they give a question and then they make the statement afterwards. It cannot go on like this. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Noted. Hon Minister Madikizela. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Let me again answer this question directly by stating one of the reasons which is also not unique in the Western Cape, just to remind the members. One of the reasons why the number of houses that are built is decreasing is because if you look at the subsidy quantum, it has increased drastically; three years ago for example we were spending about R70 000 to build a house. Today we are spending almost double that amount, more than R130 000 to build one house and if you look at the increase in terms of the allocation to all the provinces we have not kept up with the subsidy increase, which then results in the number of houses that we build decreasing. That is why nationally we spoke about this that the cost

escalations in terms of building material are not keeping up with the available resources in terms of funding that the properties are receiving, so that is just one of the reasons why you see this decline in terms of the number of houses that we are building.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, I see you.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Thank you Madam Speaker, hon Minister Madikizela, should we then not look at how we as government could actually build the capacity, recruit people that will build instead of outsourcing, because do you not you think that that is one of the problems? We are outsourcing the capacity that we should be having in this government, outsourcing to contractors out there.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Speaker, the government's developers, municipalities, have different roles and responsibilities in the provision of housing. We are not outsourcing here, but what we are doing as the province is to carry out our mandate and responsibility and municipalities are doing the same because the responsibility of planning in terms of the Constitution is a responsibility of municipalities. So we are not outsourcing anything, and also the responsibility of building is the responsibility of developers and service providers. So we are doing what we are supposed to do as provincial government in partnership with all other stakeholders that I just spoke about, so that is what needs to be understood by hon member Mr Paulsen.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That concludes Question 5. The hon member Mr Fransman.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Madam Speaker, can the MEC confirm the fact that there was no money sent back to Treasury was actually the result of fiscal dumping?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Well, I cannot confirm that because it is not true. Let me perhaps clarify because this term “fiscal dumping” is normally used incorrectly. Fiscal dumping implies that you give or transfer money to an entity of the municipality with no plans so that you can then have no money left in your coffers, but when you transfer money to municipalities or to any entity which is attached to a project, a programme that must be delivered in that financial year, that is not fiscal dumping. Otherwise if that was an issue it should have been raised by the AG but it was never an issue, because any money transferred that is attached to a programme that is ready to spend that money is not fiscal dumping. So I then do not agree with the hon member Mr Fransman in this instance.  
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon member Mr Fransman needs a workshop.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. There have been four follow-ups. Let us move to question number 12 again for the Minister of Human Settlements, the hon

Minister Madikizela.

*Question standing over from Thursday, 14 August 2014, as agreed to by the House:*

*Houses built on land vulnerable to flooding*

**12. Mr K E Magaxa asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

Whether there are any urgent plans to address the life threatening challenge of people whose houses are built on dangerous land which is not conducive for human settlement of which some are currently staying in community halls due to flooding; if not, why not; if so, when will this crisis be resolved?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much Madam Speaker. This department is currently focusing on informal settlements upgrading in order to improve living conditions through an incremental approach. One of the things that we are doing is to ensure that all informal settlements have access to basic services, but also some of the challenges that we are facing resulted in the situation that has been described here by the member where a number of people are living on unsuitable land. It must also be said that we have instances though that in a number of areas there are people who have been relocated more than once and then they were taken to formal houses, but we are faced with the situation where those areas are not protected and you find that when you relocate some of these people, new people come and settle there and therefore you have a situation then where

some of these people are still living in wetlands. It must also be noted that a number of people who built their houses in areas that are not habitable are people who are new on the waiting list, and therefore in terms of how to prioritise the allocation of houses you start with the people who have been waiting the longest, and that is why you find a situation where some of the people are still living there because of the fact that they do not meet the criteria for them to be prioritised in terms of housing allocation. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you Madam Speaker. I really appreciate your answer MEC, but I was informed by the City of Cape Town that actually the low land is much smaller. It is about 10% or 25% of the land that is worked in, insofar as Thabo Mbeki area is concerned. Now my question is what is the plan to deal with the other area that is not necessarily within the Thabo Mbeki area, which perhaps can help us resolve the consistent flooding in the area?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. What the hon member must remember is that in 2010 we started a programme together with the City of Cape Town where we identified some of the areas where people are living under these conditions. We identified five sites which were ready with services for us to be able to relocate these people to those sites, but one of the problems that we have as the member would know, is the problem of “Nimby”, which we often come across, “not in my

backyard”, because where you identify a site in order to relocate people who are living in these conditions to a dry area, you find that there is contestation from neighbouring communities who feel entitled to that piece of land. As a result of that we were successful to do that in only one site, that is the Bosasa site next to Mfuleni, because in a number of those sites the communities next to those areas refuse for us to use those sites so that we can relocate those people. But now in terms of the bigger plan there is an understanding that we cannot allow those people to live in those areas for a very long time. That is why we are saying let us now focus on the upgrading of informal settlements by and large and make sure that while some of these people are waiting for their houses they are at least waiting under much better conditions. That is a bigger plan that we are busy with which we will be sharing with the Standing Committee very soon because plans are at the very advanced stage.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I just want to ask you one last question. Who is responsible to prevent the reoccupation of the land, of the wetland or the land that is not conducive to living? Who is really responsible to prevent that not to happen and who is responsible to also protect poor communities from Nimby, that is “not in my backyard”, kind of syndrome? Who is responsible for all of the two?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much. I think

that is a very, very important question. I think it must be understood that any development is a partnership between government and communities. You will agree with me hon member that in areas where there are strong leadership we have successfully managed, one, to prevent land invasion, because the leadership in those communities take responsibility and make sure that those pieces of land are protected because they know that the development that is going to be done there, is going to benefit them. I must be honest that one of the challenges that we are faced with is that we have allowed, as communities and leaders, our communities to be taken over by anarchists like Siskol where you find a situation where these people are going around causing havoc and leadership in these communities are nowhere to be seen. It must be understood that the police alone cannot be able to deal with the community issues if there is no strong partnership between leadership and those communities and government, because government officials will not always be there to ensure that lawlessness is prevented. Now we are faced with the situation where all well located pieces of land that were earmarked for development are targeted for invasion and that really jeopardises people who have been on the waiting list for a very long time, because they now have to take a back seat because of the weak leadership structures in our communities.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: May I ask the MEC a follow-up question; when you refer to the fact that you would shortly be bringing to the Standing

Committee a new housing plan, is that the housing plan that the Premier referred to in her State of the Province Address, the integrated new housing plan to deal with the problems; is it that plan you are referring to? When specifically will you bring it to the Standing Committee and when will we have sight of that plan?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much. Just yesterday we had a meeting with a number of stakeholders who are involved in this particular housing plan, where we discussed the rolling out of communication because we also have to take into cognisance a number of the issues that I have mentioned, but the housing plan that we are talking about is going to take a multi-prong approach, hon member Mr Dugmore, because there are three things that we are now going to focus on. The first thing is that we want to accelerate delivery of housing in the affordable market space, because for most of the people who are earning just above R3 500 and R9 000, the current housing policy does not address the needs of those people.

The second thing that we are going to be doing is to embark on a massive upgrading of informal settlements, which is part of that plan, and thirdly and lastly is to streamline the housing demand databases of municipalities and ensure that the allocation is done fairly to the most deserving individuals. And as I said, we have concluded with the plan and now we will be presenting it to the Standing Committee. I am just not in a position to give the date as I am standing here.



The SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Mr Max.

Mr L H MAX: Thank you Madam Speaker, I just want to know from Minister Madikizela, whilst people have been moved from this wetlands or [Inaudible.] areas to better areas, is there anything being done to prevent other people also to occupy that same area with intention to get preference / preferential treatment in future? Thanks.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Well, to a certain extent, yes, there are certain areas for example where we have fenced. If you look at a specific area in Site C, CL-Section, we have managed to fence that area and we are planning to do the same in Dromedaris where we are moving people away from the railway and next to the railway line, but it is Dromedaris, because it is what people named it. I know that you are very uncomfortable with that [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Charmaine Manuel [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...but it is not us who named it. It is the people themselves. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Charmaine Manuel [Inaudible.] on the Dromedaris.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...but as I said, in some

instances where we fence these areas, people break it down and move in there and that is why we are saying we really need to have a very strong partnership, with strong leadership from communities in order for us to deal with this problem.

The SPEAKER: That concludes question 12. Again a question to the Minister of Human Settlements, I see Minister Madikizela.

*New questions:*

*Low-cost housing*

**2. Mr N E Hinana asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

- (1) Whether the provision of low-cost housing has a cut-off date; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) whether there is a system in place to prevent the abuse by beneficiaries of the provision of low-cost housing, if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much Madam Speaker. Whether the provision of low-cost housing has a cut-off date, the answer is no. The department continues to provide low-cost housing. In fact we are no longer calling it low-cost housing because it costs a lot of money. As I said we spend more than R130 000 now to build a house, so it is no longer low-cost housing, so through various housing subsidy instruments

stipulated in the National Housing Code the department aims to progressively shift towards other forms of housing assistance such as rental and incremental housing support as per the recommendation of the National Development Plan.

The provision of low-cost housing is a policy of the national department of which all provinces must abide by and therefore the policy on the provision of low-cost housing continues in line with that particular policy. Whether there is a system in place to prevent the abuse by beneficiaries of the provision of low-cost housing, the answer is there are various interventions designed to ensure a fair and transparent housing allocation process and mitigate abuse of the system by beneficiaries. For example each and every municipality in the province is required to draft an approved beneficiary selection policy clearly indicating how potential beneficiaries are selected. The department has developed a provincial framework to guide municipalities in developing selection policies that result in fair allocation of housing opportunities.

Secondly, the departments also developed a database platform to be used by all nine metro municipalities. This database platform is called Western Cape Housing Demand Database Improvement Programme, which went live in April 2012 and contains a set of controls and measures to minimise data tampering, and there are a number of other measures that we have put in place to ensure that we prevent the corruption in the provision of low cost housing.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: MEC, thank you very much. Would it also not be developmental as a strategy for house provision that a land is identified, the infrastructure is installed, so that people who can have access to a plot or to land that has got the infrastructure, so that people can build the houses themselves, because I do not believe that the people cannot build the houses. They have the capacity to build their houses, but they do not have the capacity to have the infrastructure, in terms of development [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Hinana your question please; your question?

Mr N E HINANA: Would you consider that land is provided; then the infrastructure installed so that people can be provided with that to build for themselves?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Actually this is part of our multi-prong approach. It is one of the programmes within our Housing Code because the Housing Code has about 16 programmes and we have been doing that, but that is why I said before that we must now try to do it at a scale so that at least the living conditions of people are improved while they are waiting for the top structures. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: That concludes question 2. Sorry, hon member Mr Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, I just want to ask the Minister, do you cross-reference the Western Cape Database with the National Database and how reliable is the National Database?

Mr K E MAGAXA: That is a not a question. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is a question. [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: It is not a valid question. Can you answer that?

An HON MEMBER: No. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Speaker, we still have some challenges with the housing subsidy system of the National Housing Subsidy System. We have been dealing with this challenge for some time because it is indeed one of the challenges that we are grappling with, because while we have our own work data in the province where you are able to cross-reference and check if a person from municipality A has benefited so that that person is prevented from benefiting again, we are yet to ensure that that is happening nationally, but I think plans are at a very advanced stage to also make sure that we have a nationwide database and the national department is busy dealing with that.

The SPEAKER: That then concludes Question 2. Can we now move to

Question 3? I see the hon Minister Bredell.

*Municipalities: environmental management plans*

**3. Mr R B Lentit asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

Whether all municipalities in the province have environmental management plans in place; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dankie agb Speaker en dankie aan die lid vir die vraag. Ja, alle munisipaliteite in die provinsie het omgewingsbestuursplanne in gereedheid. Munisipaliteite moet as deel van hulle geïntegreerde ontwikkelings ruimtelike beplanningsraamwerk ontwikkel wat onder andere ontwikkelingsbeginsels, norme en standarde moet bevat wat die ruimtelike beplanning, grondgebruikbestuur en grondontwikkeling moet rig en volhoubaarheid moet aanspreek. Ook as deel van die munisipaliteit se geïntegreerde ontwikkelingsplan moet munisipaliteite onder andere geïntegreerde afvalbestuursplanne, luggehalte bestuursplanne en kusmunisipaliteite ook kusbestuurprogramme ontwikkel. My Departement Omgewingsake en Ontwikkelingsbeplanning werk nou saam met alle munisipaliteite om hierdie planne in gereedheid te kry. Dankie.

The SPEAKER: I see hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I knew it was a sweetheart, but let me [Interjections.] Madam Speaker, taking from what the MEC is saying, what does the MEC think is the problem given the fact that you are saying all municipalities have these environmental plans; why are we still having communities being settled in wetlands when all municipalities have environmental plans because in terms of their mandate that is supposed to have been looked at and addressed? What do you think is the reason why we have that?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, because municipalities work with a given. They do not put people in a wetland. They move there and their municipalities need to deal with it. We have also got a history and now for the first time we have got spatial development frameworks for the whole of the province to address the divide within our communities. Never before has any other government come up with these plans. We have got it now. The municipalities work according to that. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Are these environmental plans, MEC Bredell, enforced by the municipalities or is it just environmental plans that are in the IDP and nothing happens about it, because if they are enforced we should not be having this. Are they enforced? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Do not answer the question... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No I am not. Ek sal vir hom help as hy die hulp soek.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Yes, they are all new questions and nothing related to this question, but I can answer it. Again it is in place but it will take 20 to 30 years to get it right. Municipalities cannot do this overnight. It is long-term plans and they will work and budget accordingly. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: So it is 2030, alright. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: 20 to 30 years! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Let's move to question 9. I see the hon Minister Winde.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Ons het nou oorgeslaan.  
[Tussenwerpsels.]

'n AGBARE LID: Ja, waar is dit nou?

The SPEAKER: Sorry, where am I, 4?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Question 4. [Interjections.]



The SPEAKER: Question 4, sorry. [Interjections.] Here I am, sorry, it is number 4. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: I looked at the question. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: The hon Minister Bredell.

*Municipalities: drinking water, quality of*

**4. Mr R B Lentit asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

Whether his Department or Ministry have supporting plans to ensure the quality of drinking water in municipalities; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dankie agb Speaker, weereens dankie aan die agb lid mnr Lentit vir die vraag. Ek gaan met die toestemming van die lid net 'n kort opsomming gee want anders gaan ek al die vrae-tyd opneem, as ek die antwoord lees, 'n baie lang antwoord. Dit gaan oor waterbestuur en waterdienste.

Ingevolge die Wet op Waterdienste, Wet 108 van 1997 het alle munisipaliteite as waterdiensowerhede mandate om drinkwater van goeie

gehalte aan die gebruikers binne die munisipale gebied te voorsien en dan het ons al die reëls waarbinne die munisipaliteite moet opereer. Hulle moet beskikbare hulpbronne daar hê. Dit moet teen 'n billike tarief voorsien word. Dit moet tot voordeel van die gemeenskap strek. Hulle moet hulpbronne uitbou om dit te bestuur; daar is die aard en topografie sonering en ligging van die munisipaliteite. Dan sê ons verder dat alle munisipaliteite moet 'n vyfjaar waterdienste-bestuursplan hê en ons is ook die enigste provinsie, dink ek, wat 'n waterbestuursplan het as 'n provinsie. Alle munisipaliteite moet een keer per jaar 'n wateroudit uitvoer en die gehalte van drinkwater moet op 'n gereelde grondslag by verskillende punte getoets word en daarom kan ons ook op 'n webblad gaan kyk na die Bloudruppelverslag van munisipaliteite. Die Departement van Omgewingsake ondersteun die munisipaliteite in hierdie mandaat en voorsien hulle van hulp so ek is meer as bereid om die hele vraag te lees, maar as dit die lid se goedkeuring wegdra sal ek dit enige tyd inhandig. Dankie.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Beerwinkel.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Jy is stadig man, jy is stadig.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Jou skoene [Onhoorbaar.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Madam Speaker, thank you. [Interjections.] MEC Bredell [Interjection.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ons werk vir jou.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...you have told us now what the municipalities are supposed to do. When last have you seen the plans of these municipalities and are they being enforced?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: U sou ook verlede week opgelet het dat ons heeldyd besig is om nuwe omgewingsinspekteurs aan te stel om ons te help om die omgewing in die Wes-Kaap te beskerm, so ons het ook 13 lede bygevoeg tot die reeds bestaande 15, so ons het nou so 28 mense in die veld en ja, ons is besig met 'n program. Ons is nie 100% daar nie. Ons het nog ver om te gaan met die Bloudruppel en die Groendruppel. Ons munisipaliteite is bewus daarvan, maar ons het die nommer een plek in die land opgeneem in beide. Dit sê nie ons is al waar ons wil wees nie. Daar is nog ruimte vir verbetering en ons het die volle samewerking van al ons munisipaliteite om ons te help. Daar is op verskillende vlakke verskillende uitdagings. Jy het jou armer munisipaliteite wat langer gaan neem om daar te kom. Jy het jou munisipaliteite wat kapitaal daar agter kan sit en die infrastruktuur daarstel. Jy het die MIG-infrastruktuurfondse wat ons bestuur. Ons gee darem jaar op jaar omtrent 100% daarvan uit. So dis 'n langtermynproses. Daar is nie vir hierdie items wat ons noem vinnige oplossings nie, maar ek is heel gemaklik dat ons munisipaliteite baie nou saamwerk met ons. Hulle besef ook dat ons as 'n departement enige tyd bereid is om 'n direkteif uit te reik teen 'n munisipaliteit, met ander woorde om op te tree teen die munisipaliteit.

Ons het al geskik op die trappies van die Hooggeregshof, want dit gaan ook nie net om 'n boete te dien nie. Dit gaan om reg te maak en skoon water en skoon riool daar te kry. Dankie.

Mnr R B LENTIT: Agb Speaker ek is bewus dat die Minister gesê het dat dit is 'n opsomming, maar ek sal graag wil weet is die Minister bewus daarvan dat Kannaland Munisipaliteit 'n probleem gehad het met die kwaliteit van hulle water [Tussenwerpsels.] en is daar enige iets gedoen deur die munisipaliteit om hulle water te suiwer, want dit was weer onder ons aandag gebring by die laaste NRVP. Dankie.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Jy praat van Kannaland.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ja, agb Speaker, ek is bewus daarvan. Ons is besig om met Kannaland te werk. Ons het sessies wat ons opgestel het. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Ry af na Kannaland toe [Onhoorbaar.] [Tussenwerpsel.]

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ons is besig met die munisipaliteit om 'n finansiële volhoubare plan vir hulle te help uitwerk. Daar is 'n dam waarna

ons kyk of 'n mens dit kan aankoop om hulle waterbron te versterk, so dit is in proses. Weereens, dit is een van ons finansiële lae-kategorie munisipaliteite, so provinsie en nasionaal sal moet intree en help en solank die munisipaliteit bereid is om saam met ons te werk sal ons daardie probleem ook oplos.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Nog 'n ANC-nagmerrie.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi kole, gooi kole! [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Beerwinkel.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi kole. Die Huis is koud. [Gelag.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you Madam Speaker. MEC Bredell, are you aware of a group of 40 families in the Swellendam District Municipality who have been left on a farm and who get water that is being pumped from the river, unpurified, close to a place where you are allegedly supposed to have bought property recently? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Madam Speaker, yes, there are a lot of new questions. [Interjections.] Obviously, ek is nie bewus nie. Ek is nie bewus van almal wat nie water het nie; maar dit verbaas my dat ons dit vandag nog vind, want hierdie probleem is onaanvaarbaar dat mense nie

skoon drinkwater het nie. Dit spreek tot higiëne, dit spreek tot menseregte, maar ons moet [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ek hoop rêrig ons gaan dit regkry met ons NRVP-besoeke, ensovoorts. Ons moet hierdie items buite die politiek probeer bestuur. Dit spreek tot gesondheid, tot higiëne, dit spreek tot menseregte en mense is geregtig op skoon water, maar dat water uit 'n rivier kom en water uit 'n boorgat kom beteken nie die water is vuil nie. Ek het grootgeword met water uit 'n boorgat. Brakwater is nie altyd ongesond nie. Ons moet die water laat toets, maar dat elke inwoner geregtig is op skoon water is 'n feit. Dis 'n grondwetlike reg, en daarom wil ek nie hiervan verneem hier wanneer dit vrae-sessie is nie, maar gee dit vir my. Ek stuur van die Groen Skerpioene daarheen en ons kom met 'n oplossing en ons vat hande en ons kry vir hulle skoon water as hulle dit nie het nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

'n AGBARE LID: Ja, ja. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Max and then hon member Ms Beerwinkel.

Mnr L H MAX: Dankie Agb Speaker. Ek wil net vir die agbare Minister Bredell vra of hier in die Wes-Kaap enigsins 'n voorval onder sy aandag

gekom het dat mense siekte opgedoen as gevolg van vuil water wat voorsien is soos wat in die ander provinsies plaasvind? Dankie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Nee, dit het nie onder my aandag gekom nie.

An HON MEMBER: Do not answer that question.

The SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Nee, dit het nie onder my aandag gekom nie en ek hoop regtig nie dit gaan ooit onder my aandag kom nie. Dankie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

'n AGBARE LID: Wel ek hoop nie die Groen Skerpioene gaan vir President Zuma vang nie [Onhoorbaar.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry. Hon member Ms Beerwinkel in terms of follow-ups that was the four that were required for the question in terms of the rules.

An HON MEMBER: No!

The SPEAKER: I am sorry, hon member Mr Wiley, I see you.

Mr M G E WILEY: Yes, thank you Madam Speaker. The Premier has arrived and by discussion or by gesture with hon member Mr Fransman he has agreed that he will allow the Premier to take the question now, if that is alright with the House.

The SPEAKER: Can we then revert to the very first question, for the Premier to take the hon member Mr Fransman's question. Hon Premier.

*New question to the Premier:*

*Farm workers: abuse by employers*

**1. Mr M L Fransman asked the Premier:**

- (1) (a) what is the reason why a significant number of farm workers in the province continue to live and work in very bad and inhumane situations and (b) what programmes do her government have in place to stop the abuse of farm workers;
- (2) whether these programmes ensure the elimination of abuse of farm workers by their employers; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much Madam Speaker and I would like to take the opportunity of thanking the House for its indulgence for accommodating the pressures today and to thank the hon Leader of the



Opposition for that as well.

Alright, in this question I have a very similar response to Minister Bredell, because indeed if any farm worker or any person in this province at all is being abused I would like to hear about it immediately, because it is a criminal act and we have said repeatedly and regularly and often, and I do so again in this House, that if any farm worker comes to us with an allegation of abuse or violence or ill treatment I will help that person lay a charge with the police and I will continually follow up that charge, because we will not tolerate abuse in this province and anybody guilty of abuse [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Come to the point. Come to the point now.  
[Interjections.]

The PREMIER: It is a very, very important point.

An HON MEMBER: That is the point.

The PREMIER: That is the point.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Answer now.

The PREMIER: Because you see one cannot wait until you try and unearth these questions, come and ask us, try to ambush us in parliament; when in fact we could have solved the problem long ago so is someone [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: This is not ambush. This is an important question. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi.

The PREMIER: It is an oral question without any indication of who is being abused. It is an obvious point to me when I read this question; that the hon Leader of the Opposition wants to come to a specific case. So if he is sitting there with a specific case and he waits for me to come and answer the question in Parliament, and if indeed someone may have been abused all this time in the run-up to the session, this person then allegedly continues to be abused, so that the hon Leader of the Opposition can score a point here.

An HON MEMBER: No, no.

The PREMIER: My interest is much more in trying to deal with these issues of abuse [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Answer the question [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: I am answering the question. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] you must answer it.

The PREMIER: I am answering the question. I have a very great interest in ensuring that no-one is abused, so I will begin answering this question by responding to section (b) before I get to section (a). The member makes very serious allegations when stating that a considerable number of farm workers are being abused.

The Oxford Dictionary briefly states the definition of abuse as follows: “It is to treat with cruelty or violence...” [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: We know that, please, we know what abuse is.

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: “...especially regularly or repeatedly...” [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: She’s heard the question. The Premier must answer. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: If the member is aware of any farm workers who are being abused, and this applies to any member in this House [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Ja, we know what abuse is. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members, sorry hon Premier. The Premier is responding to the question, if you will afford her the opportunity to provide

the response. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: If the member is aware of any farm workers who are being abused it is his duty and responsibility to report such cases to the South African Police Service [Interjections.]

'n AGBARE LID: Dis hy, moedswillig, moedswillig!

The PREMIER: And I hope that he has done so. [Interjections.]

'n AGBARE LID: Jy ken Afrikaans, en Engels.

The PREMIER: These types of accusations are very serious indeed and cannot be taken lightly, just as are allegations of people not having water. Cases where such abuse is happening should be reported immediately and we would be keen to assist in investigating such allegations if provided with the facts.

Allow me to now respond to section (a) of the question posed by the member. The Western Cape Department of Agriculture has since 2004 been in a responsible manner involved in the upliftment of farm workers in the Western Cape. The Western Cape Department of Agriculture is after all these years still the only department in the country that has a dedicated sub-programme for farm worker development.

Over the last ten years this programme succeeded in addressing a lot of the important backlogs among farm workers in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] They are still beating farm workers.

The PREMIER: We identified a number of crucial social issues like alcohol abuse, drug abuse, and reasons for farm worker evictions and could address some of these and also refer them to the relevant departments.

We trained and supported the upliftment of thousands of farm workers in different spheres of life through funding projects implemented by various partner organisations. [Interjections.]

The sub-programme receives no grants from the national Department of Agriculture Forestry and Fisheries. We take that from our own budget. Partnerships with private companies are important to sustain some initiatives with farm workers. For example, the Farm Worker of the Year Competition which demonstrates just how much progress promotion of farm workers makes in the management and ownership structures of farms.

Geographically the Western Cape is a very large province and we have to provide a service for an estimated 142 000 farm workers and their families.

In April 2014 the Western Cape Cabinet approved the Farm Worker Response Plan which consists of various initiatives and I'd like to highlight a few:

- The future of agriculture in the rural economy process, which is known as FARE.
- The provincial farm worker survey; the department initiated the farm worker household survey to establish a database of farm workers in the province and to identify their needs in order to appropriately align and coordinate service delivery and resources.
- Then the farm worker and farmer case studies, and we have a publication on this precise engagement that we had and researched in that area.
- Rural youth empowerment, placement of farm worker children and rural youth, student interns and graduate interns on an appropriate internship by placing farm worker's children with an external host, an employer or mentor to expand their experience of life and to enable them to experience working on a farm in a farming community within the agricultural industry.
- We have nurtured skills of farm worker children through special programmes such as bridging courses, to assist them in improving their mathematics and mathematical literacy as well as natural and physical science marks, to allow them to meet the criteria for further study.

- Then we have the Ethical Trade Initiative where the farmers complying with good practices and ethical trade initiatives of the fruit and wine industries are supported;
- Then we have a lot of training initiatives for farm workers to enable them to progress up the ranks.

Number two, many of the initiatives within the Farm Worker Response Plan are aimed at improving communication and relationships with farm workers and producers, so yes, this is a process in which the Department of Agriculture has been involved for many years. We have achieved successes and we will continue to do so.

The second part of the question therefore is not applicable and I would like to respond to the final part of the question by highlighting the producer and farmworker dialogue sessions of the department, which are aimed at improving communication relations between farmers and farm workers.

Furthermore the department is publishing a case study of 16 success stories of farmers and farm workers who could also in future be utilised as a manual to replicate initiatives and ways of improving communication and relationships on farms. The English version will be launched at the end of August while the Afrikaans and IsiXhosa will follow shortly thereafter. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Fransman.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Madam Speaker, it is a pity. I think it would have been best that the Premier would have let it stand over because she just literally read it out. She misunderstood that question. It was not about abuse. The question is simply the following and she did not answer that:

What are the reasons why a significant number of farm workers in the province continue to live and work in very bad and inhumane situations? She did not give us the actual reasons. She tried to posture by saying that I am going to come up with a name of the farm worker that is possibly evicted. In fact that was grandstanding on the part of the Premier that was really not acceptable. That is the question. Can the Premier actually answer the question? [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: You know, I went to look at the statistics of the national government. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ...and they produced... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: We are talking about the Western Cape, not national. [Interjections.]



The SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, there was a question to the Premier and the Premier would like to answer the question. We cannot answer the question in these conditions. [Laughter.] [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Speak through Andile. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The Premier, Deputy Premier. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: The statistics of the national government are very pertinent to the Western Cape, because I presume that conditions in people's lives are materially affected by what they earn, and if you look at the comparative farm labour wages across provinces in South Africa the Western Cape since 2000 when the survey started, has been consistently the very highest.

Of course at the bottom has been the North West province and Limpopo and various others, maybe joined by Thandi Modise who obviously abused her workers so badly that to keep his family alive he had to run away from the farm; not to mention Minister Senzeni Zokwana's herder who had to live in an aluminium shack for R26.00 a day, and among all of these unbelievable stories another farm has been unearthed here [Interjections.]

Mnr R B LENTIT: Skande, skande! [Tussenwerpsels.]

The PREMIER: ...and it was quite horrific the way in which other people have been treating not only their animals but their workers as well, so of all the farms owned by the ANC's bigwigs, that is where we can say that there has been serious abuse of workers and there has been a no more gross case than Thandi Modise's farm in the North West. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear.

The SPEAKER: Sorry. I see the hon member Mr Max.

An HON MEMBER: And Nkandla.

Mnr L H MAX: Dankie agb Speaker. Agb Premier, het die Leier van die Opposisie of enige van die Opposisie of lede van hierdie Huis gedurende u termyn as Premier enige voorval aan u kom rapporteer waar plaaswerkers in, soos ons sê, baie swak en onmenslike omstandighede woon [Tussenwerpsels.]

An HON MEMBER: That is a complete new question.

Mnr L H MAX: ...waarin u nie opgetree het nie?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is so sweet, it is all sweetheart questions.

The PREMIER: No it is a very valid question, because if there is  
[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: No, it is so sweet. Ja.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I give up.

An HON MEMBER: Give up.

The PREMIER: Well I simply do not give up.

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: That is a very valid question in fact, because if there was all of this abuse you would think that I would get an example of just one case. The hon member Ms Davids, who isn't here today, raised a question the last time about a family that she said had been evicted from a farm unlawfully. I was worried to hear about that case so I went into it in some great detail and the story is quite different from what was set out here.

A judge called Judge Canca lawfully evicted that worker from the farm because of several incidents of extreme bad faith by that worker against the

farmer. The one that I also read included that the worker alleged that the farmer had stolen his pig, where his pig had died and so there were various cases of that nature. That led to a complete breakdown in trust between them and eventually the court upheld a lawful eviction.

Now before the ANC comes and makes allegations in this House, they must please get their facts right, because it is very serious to allege that people are being abused and evicted outside the ambits of the law. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You must give questions [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: But now let's take a look at this.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You do not want to answer the questions [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: I definitely do want to answer questions because I actually even went to the police and asked them and I said: "This is such a serious allegation, that farm workers are being abused and mistreated. Can you please give me a breakdown of the cases that have been before the police?"

An HON MEMBER: They reported everything in the media.

The PREMIER: Now let me give you this. There were eight cases that were made in the course of 2013 and 2014. The first one was withdrawn. The second one was withdrawn. The third one the farmer was acquitted and found

not guilty. The fourth one was withdrawn. The fifth one is under investigation. It is in Oudtshoorn so nothing surprises me from Oudtshoorn. [Laughter.]

An HON MEMBER: It is one of your municipalities, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: No it is one where you refuse to get out of power. It is one where you refuse to get out of power even though you lost an election [Interjections.] and you are wasting public money there again. [Interjections.]

In Villiersdorp, withdrawn; in Uniondale, withdrawn; in Groot Brak, under investigation. So of eight cases in the last two years there are only two that are still under investigation. For the rest, people have either been found not guilty and acquitted or the case has been withdrawn. [Interjections.] Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Mr Fransman. [Interjections.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Madam Speaker, in fact it is sad, unless I am hearing wrong, that the Premier is saying that the withdrawal signifies that there is no abuse, because that shows the shame on you, Premier, when it comes to the abuse of farm workers. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: No question.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Does the Premier know [Interjections.] ... does the Premier know about her own government's Department of Agriculture's position that farm workers are horribly being abused in the Western Cape? Does she know that there was a report two years ago and did she in fact action the report after the former MEC for Agriculture and the former MEC for Economic Development in August two years ago went public and say they will implement those recommendations? [Interjections.] Are those recommendations actually implemented? It is a shame that the Premier did not know about this report. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: I know very much about the Human Rights Watch Report and I know that they never, ever identified any of the farms, nor did they identify any of the cases and we have said to them and the Minister Gerrit van Rensburg who was the Minister at the time, to please give us the examples, where are people being abused, on what farms so that we can come and assist and help. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: No-one laid a charge.

The PREMIER: ...and that never happened. No-one laid a charge. No-one

took up any case and we were absolutely committed. We said we will protect the workers. We will make absolutely sure that they can take a charge and lay it before the courts, so it is very easy to get up and make a blanket allegation. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

The PREMIER: The methodology of that report was found to be highly suspect as well.

'n AGBARE LID: Ja. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The PREMIER: It is very easy to stand up and make a blanket allegation with no facts to back it up and when we asked to go to the court they ran away. Thank you. [Interjections.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: On a point of order [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Your point of order hon member Mr Fransman.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Madam Speaker I did not speak about the Human Rights Report. I have spoken about the Department of Agriculture and Economic Development in the Western Cape's report [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: That is not a point of order. You cannot speak to the

[Interjection.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: ...not the Human Rights Commission Report.

An HON MEMBER: You cannot do that [Interjection.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Please clarify, did you know about that?

The PREMIER: I cannot immediately recall that report as I sit here now  
[Interjections.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Daar is hy man. Yes, so you do not know.

The PREMIER: ...and I have absolutely no doubt that the hon Minister Winde knows all about that report, but Madam Speaker, may I say [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND  
TOURISM: You have to ask that question to me.

The PREMIER: That is the critical point. When this question came to my office I said this is a question [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ...the focus is on agriculture and it must be put to the



Minister of Economic Opportunities and Agriculture. I said that is where it must go, because it makes no sense to put detailed questions to me on agriculture, and in fact I just replied because I like to answer questions unlike a leader of another political party [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: All questions [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Unlike the leader of another political party [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You do not know, you are running away [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: I like to answer questions and I did my best to get all the information. If he wants details around reports that were drawn up in the Department of Agriculture three years ago, could he please ask the relevant Minister [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Ask the question then. [Interjection.] You should ask me the question.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That concludes that question. We now move to question 5. I see the Minister Bredell.

*Kannaland Municipality: Caravan Park, sale of*

**1. Mr L H Max asked the Minister of Local Government,**

**Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

- (1) Whether it has been brought to his attention that Kannaland Municipality sold its caravan park site; if so;
- (2) whether the proper procedure was followed and if the selling price was in line with the market value of the property; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie aan die lid vir die vraag. Dit het onder my aandag gekom dat die Kannaland Munisipaliteit in die proses is om die karavaanpark perseel te verkoop. Die vraag is aan die munisipale bestuurder deurgegee wie verantwoordelik is dat regmatige prosesse gevolg word in die oorweging van 'n bestaande aanbod in ooreenstemming met heersende pryse en marktoestande.

Verder het die munisipaliteit steeds volle eienaarskap van die karavaanpark in Ladismith. Sekere aspekte van hierdie aangeleentheid is intussen met die munisipale bestuurder opgeneem. Dankie.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No follow-up questions? [Interjections.] We move on to question number 6, hon member Mr Max to Minister Grant.

*Department of Transport and Public Works*

*Underspending due to valuation disputes*

**6. Mr L H Max asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

With reference to his department underspending by R84, 115 million in the fourth quarter due to the devolution of property rates allocation relating to objections stemming from the valuation process in respect of property rates:

- (a) Who are the beneficiaries with whom objections have been lodged,
- (b) when were the disputes lodged and (c) what is in place to resolve the disputes speedily, to enable his Department to spend its budget?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker, and thank you to hon member Mr Max for the question. In response to part:

- (a) Rate objections were lodged with the Breede River Valley Municipality and the City of Cape Town. These have been finalised.
- (b) Disputes on the inclusion of provincial roads were lodged with the City of Cape Town on the 25<sup>th</sup> of March 2014. The value of the disputes is R66.006 million.
- (c) The department has monthly engagements with the City of Cape Town and Provincial Treasury. In the last meeting held on the 19<sup>th</sup> of August 2014 it was resolved that my department will meet with the City of Cape Town Revenue Unit, Valuation Unit and Provincial Treasury with a view

to resolving the province's liability for the payment of rates on provincial roads.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No follow-up questions? We can then move on. Question number 7 was withdrawn in fact. Question number 8, hon Mr Mnqasela to ask Minister Bredell. Minister Bredell.

*Municipalities: Corruption, curbing of*

**8. Mr M Mnqasela asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

(a) What measures are imposed by his Department to curb corruption in municipalities, (b) to what extent are these measures successful and (c) what further measures are developed to improve the action against corruption?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie vir die vraag. Die departement het 29 munisipaliteite ondersteun met die instelling en funksionering van antikorrupsie komitees in die provinsie. Spesifieke klem was op die totstandkoming van antikorrupsie planne in die munisipaliteite geplaas. Die departement het ook antikorrupsie bewusmakingveldtogte in 29 munisipaliteite geloods deur die opleiding van amptenare en raadslede in etiekbestuur.

Verder het die departement antikorrupsie plakkate ontwikkel en versprei in drie landstale as deel van die Wet op Beskermende Bekendmaking, gewoonlik bekend as 'fluitjie-blaas'.

Verder het die departement ook munisipaliteite ondersteun met die instelling van munisipale rekeningkomitees om beter toesig oor wetgewing en die uitvoeringsfunksies in die munisipaliteite te verseker. Tot op hede het 26 munisipaliteite alreeds munisipale rekeningkomitees ingestel terwyl vier munisipaliteite nog oorsigkomitees gebruik. Sake van bedrog en korrupsie word aan die Departement van Nasionale Antikorrupsie se direkte lyn gerapporteer en die Openbare Dienskommissie se direkte lyn.

Sover as dit die maatreël van korrupsiebeheer betref, dit is nog nie op die vlak waar op ons enige noemenswaardige suksesse kan aanspraak maak nie. Ek hoop dat gereelde bewusmaking ons sal help om hierdie euwel uit die weg te ruim.

Verder word die munisipaliteite wat sukkel om hierdie inisiatiewe te implementeer deur die departement ondersteun met die implementering om sodoende te verseker dat die maatreëls meer funksioneel en operasioneel is. Ons sal voortgaan om ons munisipale rekeningkomitees behulpsaam te wees om te verseker dat hul oorsigrol verbeter. Die Departement van Plaaslike Regering beoog om 'n aanlyn antikorrupsie bewusmakingveldtog te loods wat meer amptenare en raadslede sal bereik. Dankie.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Is there a follow-up question? Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thanks hon Minister Bredell for a very eloquent and very clear response to my question. I would wonder though given the fact that the Auditor-General has highlighted the fact that more than 60% of the issues raised as fruitless and wasteful expenditure which links to the corruption in many cases, how are you going to protect the whistle-blowers who may at times be those members who sit in these audit committees or the general public who want to come out and say this is wrong?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Answer that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Minister to reply.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Daar is wetgewing wat die ‘fluitjieblasers’ beskerm, maar korrupsie strek baie verder as net ‘fluitjieblaas’. Ons moet ’n ‘hands-on approach’ hê. If we are in the municipalities day by day, and that is where I am very much for that, we need to build capacity especially with our internal audit units. I think they understand what to look for and I think it is very important that the municipal managers as well as the mayors understand that they, as accountable officers, need to actually support the internal audit units. I think if we build huge

capacity within the internal audit units it will speak directly to corruption within our municipalities and furthermore we will deal with it through our court system and on a day-to-day basis. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Is there a further follow-up, hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: MEC Bredell, just with the measures that you've referred to, at what level are people responsible taking this as an example; are your mayors, the municipal managers taking responsibility for these measures at a level that you have outlined as champions for this, or have you introduced measures that are more lost in an internal audit somewhere under some director and so on?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Well I think the mayors and the municipal managers understand the powers within the internal audit units within the municipalities, those are mostly those who receive clean audits at the end of the day. You will never have an ideal situation. After 2016 we will again start to build capacity and to enforce that, but it is important that we always through all our forums, Salga, my own forums, have also got a CFO Forum and it is actually a pity that we do not always utilise the Article 79 Committees to build extra capacity within our financial units. We will come up with a system to look at that as well, but it is an ongoing process.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The time allocated to questions has expired already so the remaining replies will be printed in Hansard.

*Time expired. Remaining replies to questions 9 to 22 to be printed in Hansard.*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to statements by members. I first see the DA. Hon member Mr Lentit.

### **STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS**

Mr R B LENTIT Mr Deputy Speaker, allow me to quote from the verdict on the Oudtshoorn year-long battle by Judge Owen Rogers of the Western Cape High Court and he said:

“If they, the councillors, cause a municipality to raise meritless claims or put up meritless defences and if as a result their municipality is ordered to pay costs to the other litigant, they may, in terms of Section 32 of the Local Government Municipal Finance Management Act, become personally liable for deliberately or negligently making or authorising fruitless and wasteful expenditure...”

Furthermore the judge mentioned that the political factions in the municipality have allowed their unseemly jockeying for power to distract them from the mandate laid down in the Constitution. They, the councillors,



exist for the community, not the other way around, and this is what the judge said.

The mayor, the former mayor, the former speaker and the former Mayoral Committee members of the Oudtshoorn Municipality have wrongfully, unlawfully and illegally held the economical heartbeat of the Klein-Karoo captive and manipulated the power structures of this town for the better part of the year. [Interjections.]

'n AGBARE LID: Ja, ja.

Mnr R B LENTIT: Ek doen 'n beroep op die agbare Minister Anton Bredell, Minister van Plaaslike Regering, om te verseker dat die hofonkoste asook die onwettige salaristrekings deur die betrokke ANC-raadslede terugbetaal moet word [Tussenwerpsels.]

'n AGBARE LID: Dat dit terugbetaal word, ja. [Tussenwerpsels.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mnr R B LENTIT: ...en dat die onkoste nie aan die belastingbetalers oorgedra sal word nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

'n AGBARE LID: Nooit!

Mr R B LENTIT Pay back the money. Mnr die Adjunkspeaker [Tussenwerpsels.] ek sien uit na daardie dag [Tussenwerpsels.]

Ek sien uit daarna dat die bestuur van Oudtshoorn herstel sal word en in die hande geplaas word van die regte mense wat deur die kiesers aangewys is as hul regmatige verkose uitvoerende gesag.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde!

Mr R B LENTIT In conclusion I am sure that after the reconstruction of the new executive structure that Oudtshoorn will be placed on a journey to good governance. I thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde, die agb lid mnr Lentit se tyd is verstreke. Die ANC. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid me Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Post-94 South Africa is one where we have the democratic space for robust debate in the interest of oversight. To a large extent that has been my experience in this House during the Fourth Parliament. In retrospect, I have to mention how in the Fourth Parliament Chairpersons followed meeting procedure, acknowledged and respected our

experience and guidance as committee members. They allowed for debate, engagement and intellectual discourse, always striving to find solutions or compromise for a positive outcome. Most of the time we looked forward to our next meeting together.

Inasmuch as we are mandated by our respective caucuses to come to Standing Committees with caucused positions, Standing Committee should be the place where oversight debates happen in a qualitative, substantive, informative and robust manner.

However in this short space of time since the inception of the Fifth Parliament it has been my and other colleague's horror experience in certain committees where members and Chairpersons bulldoze through caucus positions [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The Rocky Horror Show.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...and prematurely move motions or calls for votes on issues. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Votes - it sounds more like the ANC.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: This is counterproductive to the very reason why we are here. [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: The same like the ANC.

An HON MEMBER: Carol, we do not believe a word of what you are saying; do you? [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: This is how a democratic space is fast eroding and closing down. Some new Chairpersons are very accommodating and they know who they are, mine for one, and I commend them for that. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Sadly my experience of the Fourth [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Sadly my experience of the Fourth Parliament had to make way for a new breed in the Fifth. With new MPLs we would expect new ideas, new initiatives, new perspectives, but what we now have is a smothering of the democratic space by rushing to put motions, to get a vote to hide inexperience out of fear for debate and get the item off the agenda or get the meeting done.

An HON MEMBER: Well done!

'n AGBARE LID: Dis reg [Tussenwerpsels.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Voting is not a solution, it is a way out, it is a mechanism to shut out others, which is not my mandate from a constituency I am supposed to represent here. This however is the shocking way most meetings are run by this DA-led committee members.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, your time has expired. The last sentence, finish if you want to finish off quickly.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I sadly see a long and combative road ahead because the essence of democratic debate has not yet sunk in [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: One for the ANC.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...for some of the members of the ruling party. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Ms Beerwinkel. Your time has expired. I see the DA, hon member Mr Max.

Mr L H MAX: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. In 2011 the Oudtshoorn community elected a local government, but some of their public representatives realised that an Oudtshoorn local government under the ANC

was heading for disaster as the ANC councillors had chosen their own interests over the people who elected them.

Subsequently, five councillors resigned from the ANC and joined the DA [Interjections.] realising that the DA is the only political party which could deliver to the needs and expectations of the people of Oudtshoorn.

On the 7<sup>th</sup> of August 2013, the people of Oudtshoorn changed course and during a by-election mandated the DA to serve and to take over the government.

'n AGBARE LID: Hoor, hoor.

Mr L H MAX: However the power-hungry and self-interested ANC refused to accept and to respect [Interjections.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dis julle gemors. Oudtshoorn is julle gemors man.

Mr L H MAX: ...the will of the people of the Oudtshoorn [Interjections.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dis julle gemors. [Tussenwerpsels.]

'n AGBARE LID: Nou word daar 'n vraag [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mr L H MAX: ...and the Constitution by refusing to vacate the offices and to

hand over power. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is the ANC.

Mr L H MAX: Yesterday Mr Deputy Speaker [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Mr Deputy Speaker why do they [Interjections.]

Mr L H MAX: The 27<sup>th</sup> of August 2014, a year later, the Western Cape High Court concluded in its judgment that the action of the ANC to prevent the DA from assuming power is unlawful, frivolous and baseless.

'n AGBARE LID: Hoor, hoor.

Mr L H MAX: ...and ordered them to surrender to the DA. [Interjections.] President Zuma and his cabinet ministers of the Security cluster without delay jumped into action to invoke urgent measures to, as they call it, “to protect the dignity of Parliament and to restore democracy”, after their stand-off last week with the EFF.

Now this DA is waiting to see whether the same ANC is going to walk their talk in Oudtshoorn, by imploring the highest party structures to ensure that yesterday’s court judgment and the Constitution is respected [Interjections.] and complied with, and that the dignity of Oudtshoorn Municipality is restored [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Finish off, please.

Mr L H MAX: ...so that democracy can prevail. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Max's time has expired.

'n AGBARE LID: Mooi! [Applous.] [Tussenwerpsels.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I see the EFF. [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Yesterday while responding to a question at the launch of the roll-out of free WiFi in Atlantis, the leader of the DA exclaimed how the Western Cape Parliament is a demand-driven government.

At first, when one pictures the living conditions of the majority of the people in the province and how their desperate pleas and other attempts have fallen on deaf ears, the statement is beyond ironic, but she may be confessing for once. She should then tell us whose demands this government is driving for they are clearly not those who are subjected to the unending suffering. What is further ironic is [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The Western Cape Government [Interjection.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: ...what is further ironic is how there is an informal



settlement called Zillerain Heights named after the leader of the DA herself as she promised to build those community homes. The people of Zillerain along with the rest of our poor remain trapped in the concentration camps called informal settlements, thus catalysing the indefinite cycle of poverty and are expected to raise fully functional families in shipping containers and “hokkies”.

We have a Premier that has made a complete volte-face from her election campaign echoes where she promised at every opportunity that her government will build houses and we also heard that Filcon is one of the scapegoats for the poor housing delivery in the Western Cape. We have over 200 informal settlements still staring us in the face.

The City of Cape Town has now turned into a City that works against its people and for a select few; a City plagued by inhumane evictions. We have all seen what transpired in Khayelitsha, Zwezwe and in Philippi. Marikana at the hands of the same government that promised we will never see another Lwandle again. How many have we witnessed and still will?

Another sickening issue not in the spotlight, but needs every responsible citizen’s immediate attention is that of Simondium in the Drakenstein area where there is a systematic gentrification with dozens of families being evicted by the DA Government this Sunday, the 31<sup>st</sup> of August.  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M N PAULSEN: The government has as per tradition invested enormously in infrastructure and failed in everything else. People are still sandwiched in MyCiti buses as they were in MetroRail and we are now [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, conclude please. Your time has expired.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Thank you very much. The main reason why all these things happen and continue is because foreigners own our land, our resources, our banks, our culture and the ANC/DA tag team has signed a lifelong pact [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Thank you. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: I now see the DA. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] whatever you say.

The SPEAKER: I now see the DA.

Mr M N PAULSEN: What did you say? [Interjections.]

Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Speaker, as we come to the end of August so we come to the end of the commemorative month of Women in South Africa. In this month we acknowledged the plight of the vulnerable women in our communities but we have also celebrated the successful women in their different fields, industries and callings.

The DA is outraged that in the heart of Women's Month the Western Cape was confronted with an attack on a woman in Khayelitsha, whose eyes were gouged out for her material belongings such as her cellular phone and earrings. The media reports that the 23-year-old woman was left for dead just a few metres from her home.

This is unacceptable and the DA will not tolerate these gruesome crimes, especially against our women. According to gender rights activists, there has been a notable rise in violent attacks against women in the province this year.

We call on all the Ministers of all departments of the Western Cape Government to redress issues that disregard women and demean women in the province. I urge the Western Cape Government to continue to empower women through their various dedicated programmes so that women can live lives that they can value. I also call on the public to protect, respect and honour their sisters, mothers, gogos, nieces, daughters and partners not only in the month of August, but for all 12 months and for all 365 days.

I conclude with the words of the late great Maya Angelou and I quote: “Each time a woman stands up for herself, without knowing it, possibly, without claiming it, she stands up for all women.” I thank you.

'n AGBARE LID: Mooi, mooi! [Tussenwerpsels.]

'n AGBARE LID: Ja mooi. [Applous.]

The SPEAKER: I see the ANC. [Interjections.]

Ms T M DIJANA: Thank you Madam Speaker. The DA [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members.

Ms T M DIJANA: The DA preaches in the National Assembly the independence of Parliament, but it practices a different morality here in this Western Cape legislature under DA control. We see how DA members apply double standards and play dubious roles.

In Mossel Bay we saw protest after the DA disconnected electricity shortly before the recent by-election and after an interest group on TV claimed responsibility for it [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms T M DIJANA: Piet Pretorius erroneously issued a statement blaming the ANC. The uprising was not even in the ward where the election took place and the rioting continues.

The Nelspoort Hospital did not order enough food supplies for patients. Sharna Fernandez is quoted in the Courier claiming she visited the hospital twice, knows of the emergency and established that patients' portions had to be rationed and supplies be brought in, but she then denied there is a problem of any sort. Instead, she blames the TV, ANC and community leaders for exaggerating the situation.

It is not wrong that DA members head constituency offices in those areas or are concerned about local issues. It is when presiding officers engage politics in those areas, but expect a different regime in this House. Outside they even pose as spokespeople of the government when they should speak for the legislature. They then step into the petty party political fray and even engage in propaganda or untruth spreading.

The DA should practice what it preaches or face ridicule. The ANC calls on the DA to lead by example. Thank you.

'n AGBARE LID: Mooi, mooi! [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: I see the DA.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you Madam Speaker. The Commission of Inquiry into policing in Khayelitsha released its comprehensive report this week. [Interjection.]

'n AGBARE LID: Nog 'n pak slae.

Ms M M WENGER: It is a historic moment for policy oversight in our young democracy and has breathed life into Section 206 of our Constitution. Until this Commission these provisions had not been tested in law nor properly in practice.

The Commissioners, evidence leaders, the commission secretary and the administrator must be commended for the manner in which they conducted the Commission. Having attended many hours of the hearings and listening to the very difficult testimonies of the real experiences and fears of those living in Khayelitsha, the Commission was always conducted in a manner that was dignified and in a manner which sought to find the real answers to the problems that exist.

The South African Police Service must be commended for having publicly embraced the recommendations of the Commission [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I will take it to [Interjections.]

Ms M M WENGER: ...as soon as the report was released and for undertaking

to implement the recommendations made. Similarly the Department of Community Safety has embraced its task of setting up a multi-sectoral task team to address youth gangs. [Interjections.] It is in this collaborative spirit that we can progress as a nation. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M M WENGER: The focus is now on fixing things for the future so that the residents of Khayelitsha can receive better policing. This Commission is an outstanding example of what oversight can achieve and how it can act as a facilitator for improved safety.

The Commission has made some recommendations that concern this institution, the Provincial Parliament. The Democratic Alliance resolves to treat this responsibility with the utmost respect and will provide the necessary importance to fulfil these obligations. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I now see the ACDP. [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, the ACDP is shocked by the anarchy that ensued in the Mossel Bay area, which left severe damage on property. We as the ACDP reiterate that we do not condone the violence service delivery protests that occurred. However, should there be any protests, it should be done in a peaceful manner.

The question must be posed in regard to what the underlying causes are, resulting in the community endangering their own lives.

After perusing some reports, blame cannot solely be placed on the community of Asla and surrounding areas. It must be said that the municipality has a history of not consulting communities. One underlying reason is a lopsided budget of the Mossel Bay Municipality, not addressing the needs of the most vulnerable, the most destitute and the most poor.

An example would be that over the past three years a total of R8 million has been spent on electricity. R7.5 million has been spent on infrastructure on electricity from a R902 million budget. Reports now surfaced that R20 million will be spent on beautifying The Point. Surely the needs of the people come before spending a massive budget on beautifying The Point. I believe that 820 objections were received from the community which excludes the Khoisan, who has a rich history in this area. This is believed to be one of the major drivers for the violent protest. The Mayor failed to meet the residents to address their concerns, but thank goodness to Minister Plato who consulted the Mayor and afterwards she addressed the community. The cluster commander said that the safety is not under threat. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order! You may continue.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: It is believed communities do not come to IDPs because the IDPs are a smokescreen that does not address their needs. Now to



inflammé la question encore plus, la municipalité a remis un avis à la  
 des branchements illégaux d'électricité avant une élection partielle et puis on a dit que  
 c'était du chaos politique après ça.

Nous, au ACDP, nous ne condamnons pas les branchements illégaux d'électricité mais nous demandons que  
 cela soit fait de la bonne manière. Je vous remercie. [Interjections.]

'n AGBARE LID: 'n Dominee sê altyd iets reg.

The SPEAKER: I now see the ANC.

Ms P Z LEKKER: †Enkosi Somlomo. \*Thank you Madam Speaker. What an  
 utter waste of money the Zille Commission into Khayelitsha Policing is.  
 [Interjections.] We still have to uncover what the hidden costs internally  
 [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable, on a point of order, sorry, there is a point of  
 order.

An HON MEMBER: What a statement!

Mr M G E WILEY: The Premier is an honourable member of this House and  
 she must be addressed as such.

An HON MEMBER: This is a statement!

Mr P UYS: No Madam Speaker, this is a Commission. She is not addressing the Premier.

An HON MEMBER: She is not addressing.

Mr P UYS: This is the Zille Commission.

An HON MEMBER: It is a statement.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: It is not her commission.

An HON MEMBER: You must listen first. [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: We are still [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Proceed. [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you Madam Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: Can you relax now [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: We still have to uncover what the hidden costs internally and otherwise were. We will have to see whether there is money in the various budget votes or a will to really implement all the so-called

recommendations.

An HON MEMBER: For the national Minister.

Ms P Z LEKKER: All that money would have been better spent on CCTV cameras, lights, proper roads and other infrastructure that would have improved everyone's lives and directly reduced crime.

The Commission's report was disappointing and stating the obvious.

An HON MEMBER: Did you read it?

Ms P Z LEKKER: The outcomes are not new. The so-called recommendations are also mostly run-of-the-mill-stuff that should actually be normal day operations. [Interjections.]

One good thing that came to the fore is the DA's ulterior motives in bringing this inquest only to three stations in Khayelitsha. What about Manenberg, Bonteheuwel or the worst murder capital of South Africa, which is Nyanga?

At least there is cognisance of the dire condition people live in and under which SAPS has been forced to do its work.

The ANC notes that the report states the breakdown in relations or trust between the community and the police is not - as per statement - irretrievable

and irreparable. It further conceded that there are many committed and diligent members of SAPS posted in Khayelitsha. They perform efficiently and strive to provide a professional policing service, as well as that they provide many of the residents with a professional service, respect and efficient service. We call on all police officers and agencies to strive to do better. Now we will wait for the DA to investigate the rogue Metro Police!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Lekker, thank you.

Ms P Z LEKKER: I thank you. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Jissie! That is your statement! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: I let the matter ride, but I actually want a ruling on this. It is not the Zille Commission of Inquiry. It was a Commission of Inquiry of the Khayelitsha Police into as far as the governance of the [Interjections.] There is no such thing as the Zille Commission of Inquiry and so to use that common terminology as the media have done is an insult to the Premier.

An HON MEMBER: Ja [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: She commissioned it but it cannot be termed by a member as the Zille Commission of Inquiry. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is so called. It is the Zille Commission of Inquiry [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Wiley, your comments are noted. I will go back to the record to Hansard and come back with a ruling. Thank you. I now see the DA.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, as the great Ahmed Kathrada once said:

“While we will not forget the brutality of apartheid, we will not want Robben Island to be a monument of hardship and suffering. We would want Robben Island to be a monument reflecting the triumph of the human spirit against the forces of evil.”

Robbeneiland is beslis die Suid-Afrikaanse erfenisinstelling wat mense regoor die wêreld na Suid-Afrika toe bring om daar van ons land se geskiedenis te leer en erkenning daaraan te gee. Dit is 'n tasbare ruimte waarin 'n mens eerbied betuig aan diegene wat vir ons vryheid geveg het.

Few places in the world symbolise the struggle for freedom against oppression of basic human rights as Robben Island does. Visiting Robben

Island is an experience of immense power, reflection, understanding and empathy.

For these reasons I am disheartened by the adversities with which Robben Island is now faced under the management of the National ANC Government. I am disheartened that so many visitors were not afforded the opportunity to explore our history and heritage through the Robben Island tour due to mismanagement. Issues of mismanagement and poor visit experiences have plagued the island for years. Many tourists as well as locals were unable to visit the island in December in commemoration of the late Tata Madiba who passed on in that time, due to management failing to secure enough charter boats.

This is appalling, yet not surprising as management of the Island and the museum rests with the National ANC Government. In support of the Western Cape Government the DA calls on the national government to relinquish some of the management rights and responsibilities to the provincial government for better and effective running of the island and the museum. [Interjections.]

The legacy of Robben Island, the museum and all it stands for can no longer be diminished as the National ANC Government has continuously allowed it to do. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Mackenzie. That brings us to the end of statements by members. We now move over to motions and

we start off with motions where notice is given. Are there any motions, hon member Ms Du Toit Marais?

### **MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek gee kennis dat ek sal voorstel:

Dat die Huis die voorkoms van bendes en die strategie ter voorkoming en bekamping daarvan deur die Wes-Kaap Regering debatteer.

*[Kennisgewing van voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken. Are there any more? I see the hon member Ms Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That this House debates the role of the Western Cape Government in creating opportunities for growth and development in rural areas.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken. Any further, hon member Ms Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the recently released Commission of Inquiry report into Policing in Khayelitsha.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Ms Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the cost and implications of the Commission into Khayelitsha Policing. Thank you.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Mr Paulsen.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates Neotel's contribution to the Province's Broadband project given the company's limited infrastructure.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Mr Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the insufficient number of police detectives at Nyanga police station where there are 56 detectives who are responsible for 9 000 cases, as it appears in Cape Times, dated Thursday, 28 August 2014.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Ms Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That this House debates the Western Cape Government's efforts to cut red tape and create a competitive provincial economy.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Are there any further on this side?  
Hon member Ms Du Toit Marais, if you want to move?

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek gee kennis dat ek sal voorstel:

Dat die Huis die primêre gesondheidsorg dienslewering in die Wes-Kaap debatteer.

*[Kennisgewing van voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice is taken. Hon member Ms Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the effectiveness of visible policing.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Mr Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House congratulates Lucky Tywaku of Crossroads for being elected to play in the International Rugby Tournament in Australia.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Are there any further? Any further notices? Then we move on to motions without notice. I see the hon member Ms Gillion.

## MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the new Western Cape hero Gezelle Magerman of Darling who won South Africa's first 2014 Youth Olympics Gold Medal in China with a memorable win in the Women's 400 metres hurdles event.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is Gezelle, not Gazelle.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Mackenzie now.

Mnr R D MACKENZIE: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die Springbokke gelukwens daarmee dat hulle die Argentynse gety kon omdraai en van die veld afstap met 'n 33-31 sege oor die Pumas rugbyspan in die Rugbykampioenskap op Saterdag 23 Augustus in Salta, Argentinië.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennis? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self?

Goedgekeur.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid mnr Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House remembers the tragic deaths when a school bus from Rheenendal ran into a stream three years ago on 24 August 2011 in which 15 people lost their lives. They were the siblings Felicity Fiegeland (10); Andre Fiegeland (12) and Maurishia Fiegeland (15); the siblings Antonio Mello (6); Lugan Mello (8) and Lisa Mello (9); the siblings Marco Kiewiets (11) and Jorina Kiewiets (7); Cheswin Freiburg (15); Ashwell Davidson (17); Marushaan Meyer (13); Michael Sass (9); Rayleen Wessels (11); Octavia Williams (14) and the bus driver Colin

Pyle (65). We think of their families as the inquest into this incident draws to a close with possible judgment tomorrow. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House pays homage to the late Anglican theologian Father David Russell, who passed away last week; that we salute him for his courageous and relentless pursuit for righteousness, fairness, equality and liberty; that his immense contribution to our democracy is his greatest legacy; and may his soul rest in peace. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Mnqasela first.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House recognises the Western Cape High Court ruling regarding the Oudtshoorn Municipality. South Africa is a constitutional state. We, as members of this House, need to defend the Constitution; the freedom and rights of our people [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: There is no freedom.

Mr M MNQASELA: ...and every public representative and every municipality across South Africa must respect and observe the Rule of Law. Thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can I just say before we carry on that I have been

picking up that people are starting to motivate motions again. A motion is a succinct short motion or it can have subsections but it must be in the form of a motion; not in the form of a debating point. I see the hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys condolences to the family, friends and comrades of the former Umkhonto weSizwe operative and freedom fighter, Trevor Ngengemana who last week died at the age of 40. He was a soldier of a special type, also known to his peers as Toivo ya Toivo of Nyanga.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Dijana.

Ms T M DIJANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commiserates with the family, friends and comrades of a militant resister, gallant hero and prominent Karoo activist Mbulelo

Grootboom, who was buried in his hometown Oudtshoorn. Thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Lentit first.

Mr R B LENTIT Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its congratulations to the City of Cape Town for taking public transport to the next level with the launch of its first green transport facility at the Wallacedene taxi rank and to notice that this taxi rank is the first public transport facility in the country that uses a rooftop solar panel system for its electricity generation and the roof area will be utilised for the harvesting of rainwater to be used in the washing bays.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?



Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I first see the hon member Ms Maseko in the corner; then I will come back this side.

Ms L M MASEKO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House extends its heartiest congratulations to the DA Soccer Team in Citrusdal for recently winning the Mayor's Cup in the ANC-run Municipality of Cederberg.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection [Interjections.] Order! No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Ms Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that September is the National Heritage, Tourism and Public Service month and that we ask all communities to join hands

to heal the division of the past and establish a society based on democracy values, social justice and fundamental human rights.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mackenzie first.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates the South African cricket team for their seven wicket win over the Aussies in the second match of the Triangular Series in Zimbabwe.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Max.

Mr L H MAX: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates Stellenbosch Municipality for winning the National Arbor City Awards competition in South Africa.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House commends the Western Cape Government's roll-out of R1.3 billion Broadband Plan to connect the citizens of the Western Cape to accessible and affordable internet.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without

notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Du Toit Marais.

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis Minister Botha en die Departement van Gesondheid gelukwens met hul inisiatief om mobiele klinieke vir Graad R- en Graad 1 leerders beskikbaar te stel.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennis? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self?

Goedgekeur.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House conveys its deepest sympathy with the family, friends

and political home, the Democratic Alliance, of Ms Umama Nomboniso Thiyiwe, who died on the morning of August 21, 2014. Ms Thiyiwe was a founding member and instrumental in the formation of the Democratic Alliance in Khayelitsha. She suffered immensely when she lost three children in a shack fire, allegedly orchestrated by her former party, during the establishment of the DA structures in the area; may her soul rest in peace.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House notes the start of the Cape Floral Kingdom season with all its beautiful spring flowers waiting in the Western Cape, Southern Cape and the Eastern Cape. Many festivals will draw local visitors and international visitors to the beautiful scene of flora and fauna and rich cultural history. I want to say that all South Africans and our members must enjoy the beautiful landscape of the spring season. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Joseph, I also allowed some leniency there. That is a typical one of motivation but for the moment it can go through. No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates Tristan Galant, a 12-year old from Belhar who was awarded a full scholarship at the Bishops' Gate Golf Academy in Florida. The young golfer was scouted at the World Junior Championships in North Carolina, after achieving ninth place out of 150 other players.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Du Toit Marais.

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis erkenning gee aan die Suid-Afrikaanse dokters wat hul kennis en vaardighede beskikbaar stel vir die voorkoming en behandeling van die Ebola pandemie.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennis? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self?

Goedgekeur.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid mnr Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Mama Gladys Mokoena of Masiqame Trading Centre who won the Best Woman Contractor award in the country.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Maseko first.

Ms L M MASEKO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the University of Cape Town for maintaining its position as the Top University in Africa, according to the 2014 Shanghai Jiao Tong Academic Ranking of World Universities, which was released earlier this month.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Schäfer first.



Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the following women: Claudie Daniels, Nomonde Kweza, Eleanore Swart, Ilse Ruthford, Jeanne Groenewald and Samantha Smiles, for receiving top honours in their respective categories at the Western Cape Department of Agriculture's 15th Annual Female Entrepreneur award.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Ms Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House wishes 10-year old Chelsea Lamprecht well, who will represent South Africa as part of the Kickboxing President's Team at the upcoming Cadet and Junior World Championship in Italy from the 5<sup>th</sup> to the 15<sup>th</sup> of September. We know she will do South Africa proud.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mackenzie first.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates the Western Cape under 19 Women's Football Team who won National Champions by beating Gauteng 3-1 and that their coach was named as Coach of the Tournament.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon member Ms Schäfer first.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates Ilse Ruthford, from Stellenbosch, who was awarded top honours in the Agri-Processing Category at the national Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fishery Awards to honour women in agriculture at a gala dinner in Mahikeng last Friday.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Hinana first.

Mr N E HINANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Western Cape Government for having the best UISP Upgrade of Informal Settlement Programme in the country.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved? Is there an objection? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper.

I see the hon member Mr Lentit.

Mr R B LENTIT Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its best wishes to the False Bay Yacht Club for hosting the 61st Lipton Challenge Cup in which 14 clubs are competing.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates Ajax Cape Town for the 3-1 win against Wits on Tuesday night at Athlone Stadium.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to that motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House extends its congratulations to Jyoti Mistry's debut film, Impunity, that will have its world premiere at the 39th Toronto International Film Festival in September which showcases 300 films from over 60 countries.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to that motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates Capetonian Mamela Nyamza, for being named as one of Glamour Magazine's Women of the Year, at an event

held in Rosebank, Johannesburg this week.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the South African chess team who participated in the 41st World Chess Olympiad in Norway, of which nine players were from the Western Cape. The team won silver in their category.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any further? Hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House wishes the senior citizens participating in the Provincial Golden Games scheduled for the 28<sup>th</sup> and 29<sup>th</sup> at the Blue Downs Sport Complex, all the best for the tournament. All districts are to be represented and the Golden Games are for the seniors, 60 years and older.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates the twelve councillors of Oudtshoorn Town Council who have been reinstated by the Western Cape High Court. We reiterate the words of Mr Anton Bredell, Minister of Local Government, that the judgment would be applied without wasting any more taxpayers' money on litigation.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there an objection to the motion? There is an objection. That motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? Hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House wishes the Western Province team good luck for their match against the Blue Bulls on Saturday at Loftus Versveld.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to that motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any further? We are then done with motions. We move [Interjections.] Order! Order! We move on to the Order Paper to the subject for discussion. [Interjections.] Order! Order! The subject for discussion in the name of hon member Mr Mnqasela entitled "Support for the destitute and poor in the programme called Social Relief of Distress."

I first see the hon member Mr Mnqasela.



**SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION:**

*The support for the destitute and poor in the programme called  
Social Relief of Distress.*

†UMnu M MNQASELA: Mandibulele, Sekela Somlomo, \*Let me thank you,  
Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mr Deputy Speaker, hon members, guests, ladies and gentlemen; social relief of distress is a temporary provision of assistance intended for persons in such dire material need that they are unable to meet their most basic needs and those of their families.

The social services are continuously reviewed in order to meet the changing developmental needs of our citizens especially the vulnerable groups including children, youth, older persons and people living with disabilities. We need to recognise the need to build partnerships with all sectors of our society specifically the disadvantaged, the advancement and the development of all communities: black, white or any other creed or colour.

Serious concerns have been raised regarding the social relief of distress as a grant in various communities and many organisations are very active in this space. These grants intended to relieve the dire circumstances of our people are just not reaching those that it is really intended for.

In recent firsthand research conducted by Unicef these issues were highlighted. The research confirmed that the child support grants are not reaching those who are in the outskirts of the province, especially in urban, in peri-urban areas in the far-flung areas and informal settlements. One could say that social workers and pastors have not reached these areas as they may be newly established or not within accessible reach.

More than a third of our children, about 36%, should be receiving these grants. Somehow they are excluded. There are more and more child-headed households that we see in poor communities.

This is not just a grant. These grants should intervene in these situations. Quite often the children are abused by neighbours and people they know, being an uncle, being a neighbour and it happens because poverty is rife. The truth remains that there are not enough social workers and other workers to assess these areas and ascertain the true extent of the problem. Hon Minister, through you Madam Speaker, it is not a normal situation. It is not a normal situation for children to start being adults when they themselves are children and need to be taken care of at such a very young age, and the reality is that you will find these communities having more and more children being parents even when they themselves should be taken care of.

Now we need to ensure that the children who need relief grants are reached through schools, clinics, hospitals, churches, NGOs and any other entities

that works on behalf of children. These entities should have the necessary distress relief forms so that they are able to assist children when they get to the centres, without having to refer them left, right and centre.

Another area of serious concern is that young children who are themselves still in need to be cared for, have lacked the kind of guidance and role models that they need from the communities and we need to bring that parental guidance and support through churches, through parents who care.

†Sibuyise lanto yakudala ethi \*Let us return to the past where we used to say  
 †“umntwana wakho ngowam” \*“Your child is my child”, that is very, very important in bringing this message. We never had street kids in an African society. It is new to have street kids and people still feel that they must walk past a child who is hungry. Another area that is seriously concerning is that you find political parties during the elections using this very important kind of a programme to buy votes in poor communities in villages, in informal settlements, and the ANC is notoriously good at doing this and we need to condemn this.

The ANC councillors in their wards where they are in charge do not differentiate between a service and party politics [Interjections.] and this is a programme that does not need political bias but strictly the support of the most vulnerable, the poor and downtrodden. The Bill of Rights in Chapter 2 of the Constitution Section 9(3) states that:

“The State may not unfairly discriminate directly or indirectly against anyone on one or more grounds, including race, gender, sex, pregnancy, marital status, ethnic, or social origin, colour, sexual orientation, age, disability, religion, conscience, belief, culture, language and birth, including political affiliation.”

The Mikondzo Project or Footprint Project was initiated by the national Department of Social Development to step into the divide where the various service delivery entities have failed. It has to ensure that all citizens especially children are able to access these services.

Mikondzo was launched to focus on service delivery improvement interventions in five priority areas on early childhood development, child youth development, substance abuse, gender, gender based violence and strengthening the role of the non-profit organisation sector. Mikondzo's prime objective was to identify challenges and other service delivery challenges which would have given social development the opportunity to strengthen and improve the impact of its policies and programmes. The project should have engaged provincial, municipalities, councillors, ward committees, social workers and community development workers, to provide firsthand information about the situation on the ground in various areas [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member Mr Fransman - just one second; is that a point of order?

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Yes please, Mr Deputy Speaker. I just want to know, is this the hon member whom Premier Zille referred to as “Verwoerdian” in a case?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Fransman that is a totally irrelevant statement at this stage of the debate. It is not related to the topic. Please continue. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He is going to the councillors [Interjections.]

†UMnu M MNQASELA: Masincedisaneni ke. \*Let us work together. Mr Deputy Speaker, despite the fact that there were good intentions around the establishment and appointment of Mikondzo, this never took off. It has become just another tool by the ANC and its supporters through proper unbiased non-politicised outreach programmes; the many developmental programmes and communities would and in fact could contribute to the triple challenges, poverty, unemployment, and inequality that should be addressed by everybody and we need to stress this [Interjection.] These are issues, hon member Mr Fransman [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: ...that affects everybody. It doesn't matter where the child comes from, where [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member order, your time has expired. Please finish off. Your time has expired.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you. It doesn't matter whether you are pink, yellow, brown or black, poverty affects everybody. We need to treat this programme as such. Thank you. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon Ms Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC in approaching this debate this afternoon is concerned about the possible reasons why this issue is before us.

The hon member who sponsored this debate could have attended the Standing Committee on Community Development, held hardly a month ago, where a detailed presentation by Sassa was given on the Social Relief of Distress (SRD) programme. Therefore the real question is: does he want to address the plight of our people or is this to score cheap political points?

The Standing Committee meeting heard of the particulars of this programme driven by the national Department of Social Development. Instead, it would seem true to form that the member wishes only to kowtow his party's line and simply criticise for the sake of criticising, but let us help the member a little. Given our history and understanding communities such as Khayelitsha,

Bonteheuwel, 8ste Laan, Grabouw, Hawston and others, we must never forget that the inequality and poverty continue to plague our province.

The conditions and problems faced by our people are all results of apartheid, but the party whose line the member follows to the tee, wants to protect past privileges... So, obviously he will criticise national government's attempt [Interjections.]

Mr R B LENTIT Skande, skandelik!

Ms M N GILLION: ...to reduce poverty, as the SRD programme does. Through such initiatives we have seen economic development and the strengthening of the social security net; as proven by research done by the Benchmarks Foundation. Whilst the DA might not believe in the importance of social security, the caring ANC National Government sees it fit as an effective tool in alleviating poverty.

The NDP is clear: social security is important for development in this country. The DA supports the NDP, they say, but do they support social security and if so, why question programmes such as the SRD? [Interjections.]

The SRD is one of national government's programmes to assist individuals and families who are in temporary or immediate need of assistance or in distress situations. This includes disasters such as fires or floods, those in

dire need due to the death of a breadwinner or other temporary devastating situations. This may include providing blankets as well as school uniforms to people who lost everything. The concern in this province is, is it coincidence that food parcels are distributed in blue packs?

This is all in keeping with Section 12 of Social Assistance Act, as amended, which states and I quote:

“The minister may provide social relief or distress to a person who qualifies for such relief as may be prescribed.”

[Interjections.] For this financial year, this province received an amount of more than R37 million, allocated for the SRD programme, but the question arises, is our provincial government, and specifically this Department of Social Development, willing to work with the national department and give credit where credit is due? Will this provincial government acknowledge the support and programmes given to our people from our national department?

Sassa cooperates, on a daily basis, with a number of stakeholders in respect of the SRD programme, amongst others, local government, health, education, social development, NGO's and the National Development Agency. Sassa does this in order to support local social and economic investments in communities as a catalyst for development.

More importantly, instead of trying to throw mud or score cheap political



points, we should ask some pointed questions to this provincial government, for example with this budget of more than R37 million for this year, is there a political will to assist our struggling communities, specifically those in distress?

Unicef research, for example, confirms that 36% of eligible, poor Western Cape children do not get the child support grant! What are our provincial plans to combat this?

Rains are falling, fires flare up and our people are left destitute. Our children are not being provided with grants, that which they are entitled to. The SRD seeks to address these devastations.

Surely it is better to ask such questions, starting with those children not in the security net, than to ask questions that have already been addressed. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Die agb lid me Marais.

'n AGBARE LID: Mooi, mooi, mooi!

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. As previously said the Western Cape Department of Social Development's mission is to ensure the provision of a comprehensive network of social development services that enables and empowers the poor, the vulnerable and those with

special needs. For this reason I am concerned about the practicality of the Social Relief of Distress Programme.

It is the South African Social Security Agency - well known as Sassa - initiative and within social development in the Western Cape we have many an experience with Sassa. More often than not, negative experiences, which result in the vulnerable bearing the brunt of a dysfunctional national agency. In July in a presentation to the Standing Committee on Social Development Sassa officials explained the legislative framework, categories and developmental approach of the Social Relief of Distress Programme. The presentation made clear that:

“An application for Social Relief of Distress must be made in a relevant form and be completed by the applicant or his or her procurator at the offices of the agency or at a designated place in the presence of an designated officer or with the assistance of the designated officer for an area in which the applicant resides and signed, certified or confirmed in the presence of the designated officer by the applicant or his or her procurator. The designated officer must approve or reject the application for Social Relief of Distress immediately.”

This becomes a serious cause for concern based on our negative experiences with Sassa in both the past and presently. The practicality of the Social Relief of Distress based on these negative experiences warrants the questions, how accessible is the application process, how successful is the

application process as well as the issuing of the relief? These questions surfaced in the light of the public comment on Sassa's services.

I quote one of these published in the Sunday Times in June this year entitled: "Chaos at Sassa offices makes seeking a grant a trying ordeal." Wanting to remain anonymous the individual said:

"There have been reports in the Sunday Times and the Times about elite corrupt practices among the hierarchy in the Sassa. This is bad enough, but if you visit any Sassa office where members of the public are expected to apply for grants, you would find it a revelation. The hall was always crowded to capacity and confusion reigns. No-one is told what is going on or where to go. The queues of seated applications are disorganised, and such announcements as are made are rendered inaudible by the noise generated by the people waiting for assistance. If you put a question to anyone who appears to be a marshal it is treated as an affront. Usually persons asking for information or help are simply ignored. It took me two whole days to lodge my application starting at 6:30 a.m. every day, it fills me with despair."

Another public outcry as published in the Cape Argus, and I quote:

"It is absolute chaos. I arrived at the pay-point on Friday morning and was told at 15:00 to return on Monday. She did so but was told to return on Tuesday. I came here at 07:00 am and they only let us in at 08:30 but

then nothing moved until 09:30. She said she had initially been told there was no money.”

This is the quality of services from Sassa. Adding injury to the wound is that the Constitutional Court found that Sassa awarded constitutionally invalid tenders. Sassa CEO Virginia Petersen has been implicated in a cronyism allegation in which she secured jobs for family members of her friends. [Interjections.]

It is alleged that Sassa had been unlawfully deducting money from pensioners nationwide and there was a growing spate of administrative disasters within the agency resulting in many people leaving without money to even buy bread.

This is the quality of service and calibre of a national agency tasked to support the destitute and poor with Social Relief of Distress; although essential, Sassa is not fit to provide the necessity. [Interjections.] This is indicative of how the national ANC Government in its agencies are rendering lip service to the vulnerable, not only in the Western Cape, but South Africa as a whole.

We will not tolerate the national government’s “let them eat cake” demeanour and will engage with all stakeholders including Sassa to redress this infringement of human rights whereby numbers are more important than impact. I thank you.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Mooi!

An HON MEMBER: Thank you. The hon member Ms Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I am dumbfounded by the reasoning of the sponsor of this motion, who has only opted for one social service initiative out of the total of nine currently implemented by the national government through the social services department.

Nonetheless, the national Department of Social Development is mandated to radically alleviate poverty through provision of access to social security. This implementation is undertaken through the South African Social Security Agency Act which makes provision for effective management, administration and payment of social assistance and services; through establishment of the Sassa, which reports directly to the Department of Social Development. To this end, the national Department of Social Services seeks to ensure achievement of the stated objectives through origination of the following initiatives:

Social grants for adults 18 years and older:

- Old person grant;
- Disability grant;
- War veterans and grant-in-aid.

To children below the age of 18 there are:

- Child support grant;
- Foster care grant;
- Social distress award
- Care dependency grant.

Some of the notable achievements of the national government as supported by the Unicef report initiatives can be surmised in terms of the child social security grants. For example, a wide range of cognitive insufficiencies have been widely reported in malnourished children, which culminate in inattentive behaviour and poor academic performance. According to the most recent study commissioned by the national Department of Social Development and undertaken by Unicef in five South African provinces released in May 2012, the child support grant and by extension provision of nutrition was found to promote knowledge, social and personality attributes, including creativity and cognitive abilities. This report further qualifies the assertion that the national Department of Social Development through its programme is effectively curtailing the scourge of poverty.

With regard to immediate or short-term relief disasters in the Western Cape, however, there seems to exist blurred lines between the metro and provincial government on deliverables, with each claiming programmes implemented in the other, as their own, in order to claim easy victories; thus obfuscating their mandates. Henceforth we need clarity of functional deliverables forthwith, and these to be reflected in the budget spend of each sphere of government.

We have also noted the limited roles afforded to ward councillors in the delivery of this programme in the Western Cape. Ward councillors need to be incorporated into the delivery mechanism as they serve as buffers between communities and the metro and/ or provincial government, instead of delivery being centralised in these spheres and creating protracted delivery timeframes when disasters occur in underprivileged communities. This would also bring the delivery of this service in close proximity to the affected communities.

We are the first to admit that there still exist some challenges. However, there is no justification for the 36% of entitled children that still do not have access to social grants in the Western Cape, in this beautiful province of ours. As alluded to by the UNICEF research report, public information programmes aimed at creating awareness should be undertaken forthwith to ensure that all those who do meet the set criteria are granted access to what is due to them through legislation. The Western Cape Government would do well to piggy-back on the national Department of Social Development Service Delivery Improvement Initiative Project, Mikondzo, as it is more predisposed to do so. Aimed at expanding and leaving a positive service delivery footprint by bringing all its services to the people, this project is initially targeted at 1 300 wards in 23 district municipalities which face a lot of challenges as well as other service delivery challenges.

We would further do well to heed the call of ubuntu which the existence of

this department is premised on, and desist from politicising delivery of this important service which seeks to alleviate poverty for all our people. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the topic under discussion today is an important topic and as for the ACDP we want to say that a multi-party relief response programme must be well structured. No one department, national, provincial or local can do it alone.

The main or most effective qualities of a programme should be a multi-faceted format. We highlight this in particular because there is a practical demonstration of how three sectors can work together for one common goal and that is to address the needs of the most vulnerable and poor. Those support functions we believe should be the Department of Social Development, Sassa and the municipalities Disaster Risk Management Centres should work together hand in hand to alleviate these problems.

The City of Cape Town, in the disaster support programmes they have, and the department have programmes when flooding and shack fires occur but we know political parties hijack and particularly ward councillors abuse these programmes and go in their T-shirts and advance their political agendas.  
[Interjections.]



In terms of the programme it is easily accessible, because when a disaster occurs the City of Cape Town sends a SMS to the other role-players and we believe that together they can do it better to alleviate the problems of the poor. [Interjections.]

When you visit these sites of disaster when there are floods and fires you see these people with their blankets, with their T-shirts, distributing government resources under political umbrellas, and that is done. [Interjections.]

We can do much more. We can do much more if three spheres of government work together because our people are still hungry; our people are still suffering [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...and something needs to be done. We cannot play cheap political games in order to advance political parties and not the need of our people [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Member your time has expired.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I thank you. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon Minister of Education, Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The grants for Social Relief of Distress were created in order to provide for people who found themselves in desperate financial circumstances. These are a short-term measure designed to help people out of a crisis situation for a period of three months with a possible extension of an additional three months. This programme has the noble goal of assisting the most desperate so we would expect all political parties to support it [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It is a fairytale.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...and use it for the purpose for which it was intended, namely helping the poor. Yesterday the hon Leader of the Opposition, who has disappeared again in this House, spent some time in the NCOP, berating the DA for not caring about the poor and trying yet again to convince the nation that the ANC does care, but as we all know, actions speak louder than words.

When we look at the implementation of this Relief of Distress Programme it is abundantly clear that it has, like so much else, been perverted by the ANC who has transformed it into the programme for the relief of the distress of losing elections. All social grants are paid out of government money derived from *inter alia* the taxes we pay and it is not the ANC's money, nor that of any other political party. It is there for the government of the day to meet its obligations to, amongst others, the poor, yet the ANC while constantly

speaking about how much it cares for the poor acts in ways which creates the impression that they are the ones who control how and to whom these grants are paid.

In addition, hon member Mr Mnqasela has referred to how political allegiance is used to allocate and exclude people from receiving these grants. The public needs to understand one thing. They are entitled to grants from the government if they qualify on the basis of relevant criteria, none of which is the political party they support. As just one example, in the Western Cape Department of Education in the DA-led government we have excellent support for the poor.

There is a lot more that is needed to alleviate poverty, but we provide for our enhanced schooling nutrition programme, learner transport, extension of no-fee schools and increased funding for the fee-paying schools which cater for people unable to pay. Just today we have in partnership with the Department of Health and the private sector officially launched the Health Mobile Unit which provides free eye tests, glasses where necessary, basic inoculations and dental treatment. All this is done by the department for which these issues are not the primary mandate, and you really expect people to believe the DA does not care for the poor?

An HON MEMBER: At how many schools?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yet the very department whose primary

mandate it is, namely Social Development, is using the poverty of people to try and manipulate them into supporting the ANC and punishing them if they do not. It is a sad reality that we are becoming all too used to the ANC abusing state resources for their own purposes, both personal and political. The *modus operandi* is well known; deploy loyal cadres to high level positions and ensure that they do whatever it takes to use or abuse state resources for the ANC's benefit. [Interjections.]

In the case of Social Development one of the loyal cadres in question is Virginia Petersen.

'n AGBARE LID: O, daar's hy.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: As a result of actions during her tenure in the province under the premiership of Ebrahim Rasool, she was the subject of a report into the controversial Erasmus Commission, which report called for the investigation of Petersen and others for alleged serious irregularities in connection with the Commission [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Ai, Virginia.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...which was declared by the High Court for all intents and purposes as a political witch-hunt. [Interjections.] Before

she could be charged she resigned. Of course the ANC cried “racism” as usual. How could the DA dare to constructively dismiss a woman and a woman of colour at that? True to form the only thing that mattered was that issues of race and gender beat counselling as well of course the fact that one more deployed cadre would not be able to carry out her mandate on behalf of the ANC.

Sure enough Ms Petersen was redeployed into the national Department of Social Development in 2011 as Director-General [Interjections.] thereby enabling her to continue further in the ANC agenda unencumbered by a party that insists on following the rule of law and due process. There she has presided over one scandal after another. She has been investigated by the Public Protector for cronyism and corruption after employing a family friend as an intern at Sassa, doubling her salary and promoting her without due process. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Recycled in another department.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: She reportedly personally instructed that certain contracts for a multi-million rand security tender in KwaZulu Natal be funded from her own office, and that the tender process be bypassed. The R10 billion tender awarded to Cash Paymaster Services as referred to by my colleague hon member Ms Du Toit Marais has been declared invalid by the Constitutional Court after a lengthy court process. Interestingly the President’s lawyer Michael Hulley was also linked to this tender. In the court

judgment it was said that Ms Petersen and the adjudication committee failed to ensure due diligence during the tender award process.

Next time we hear whinging from the ANC about so-called “prejudice of staff”, bear all these things in mind and it will be abundantly clear why Ms Petersen did not feel comfortable in a DA government.

Then we have the blatant abuse of this grant for election purposes. [Interjections.] On the 16<sup>th</sup> of April 2014 the Leader of the official Opposition in this House attended a function in Atlantis in his capacity as Deputy Minister, now ex-Deputy Minister of International Relations. Evidence from officials in the Western Cape Government was that hon Fransman, who was making an ANC election speech, after which food parcels were handed out to approximately 2 000 people, despite Petersen’s contention that only eight people were given the Social Relief of Distress grants. It was claimed that the food parcels were distributed in the context of poverty alleviation. The timing of handing these out a month before the general election is telling. In addition the poor recipients had to endure listening to a speech from hon member Mr Fransman before they could even receive their food parcels. [Interjections.] Another coincidentally timed act of concern for the poor was in Tlokwe. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! There are too many interjections from the front bench here now. I am looking at hon member Mr Dyantyi, please.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes, they do not like what they are hearing. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Uh-uh.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Not now, but hon member Mr Dugmore next to you as well and hon member Mr Paulsen, please contain yourselves.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes, hon member Mr Paulsen's baby-grow is getting uncomfortable.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: [Laughter.] Another coincidentally tired act of concern for the poor was in Tlokwe. Minister Dlamini reportedly planned a televised launch of a plan to pump 3 000 to 5 000 food parcels into Ward 9, just five days before a crucial by-election; this after she had used Sassa to employ 180 ANC Youth League activists to canvass for the ANC under the guise of profiling poverty in the ward. [Interjections.]

Before the previous by-election in the same ward the Minister had pumped over 300 food parcels from the food bank and 100 blankets into the ward. In addition she also held a televised launch of a previous social relief effort prior to the August by-election in which the Minister appeared at an ANC

office with the Mayor and the ANC ward candidate.

To corroborate the view that the ANC is only concerned about the poor just before elections, in September 2009 i.e. just after the general election earlier that year, a report in “The Sowetan” appeared saying that while the poor are starving tons of food parcels are gathering dust and going rotten in the Sassa warehouse in Batlokwa north of Polokwane. Perhaps they should have arranged for a by-election for them to actually receive the parcels.  
[Laughter.]

In addition the budget for Social Relief of Distress grants in 2012/13 according to an IOL report was R187.9 million. For the 2013/14 election year it increased by R51 million.

An HON MEMBER: Jo!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: An increase of 27.3%. The response from the department was that they were catering for the increased need. It is a great pity that the increased need only seems to be catered for when elections are looming. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja, and the R8 million for Nosey Petersen.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The situation has even been the subject of a study by the University of Johannesburg’s Centre for Social Development



in Africa which recommended that the distribution of food parcels should be banned during political campaigns.

This is a shocking indictment of the abuse of these grants and this is from the so-called caring ANC. It is time the ANC stopped abusing the poor of this country; stop discriminating against people based on their political allegiance; appoint people to run crucial institutions based on their ability to do so, not on their political allegiance and concentrate on growing our economy so that grants can be a temporary solution for the poor so they are able to find jobs and develop the dignity to which they are entitled. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Schäfer. The hon member Mr Paulsen.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Can I have the remainder of her time Mr Deputy Speaker? We as the Economic Freedom Fighters are not going to continue with this legacy of an apartheid styled welfare state that only seeks to perpetuate poverty and keep us dependent on the state.

An HON MEMBER: The ANC, blame the ANC.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Social Relief of Distress is a temporary provision of assistance, it is a fairytale of course. It is almost non-existent. The ANC government left the social welfare grant structure created by the apartheid

government intact. Only by 2003 all discriminatory provisions were gone from pensions.

The security of many in the least secured groups has improved but it could have done so much more if the security of all members of poor households have been taken into account. Anti-poverty policy in South Africa, I propose, cannot succeed in a politically acceptable period of time. Only with one shiny exception; policy makers in South Africa by virtue of their fixation with growth on the one hand and wealth independency on the other hand, impose unnecessarily constraints on government's ability to tackle mass poverty, mass unemployment and gross inequality,

We as the EFF intend going BIG. By BIG we mean "Basic Income Grant." BIG will be accessible to all South Africans, by 2019 we would have determined the level of BIG. BIG will have one overarching condition, able-bodied people, those who cannot access the State Social Grant system will have enrolled in training or education prior to entering EFF government's massive protected industrial development, which would have created millions of sustainable jobs including the introduction of minimum wages in order to close the wage gap between the rich and the poor.

There are indications of extreme confusion in government about what it is that has to be done to eradicate poverty, until an EFF government with its radical policies is elected and rescue South Africa [Interjection.]

'n AGBARE LID: Kan ek iets vra aan die agb lid?

Mr M N PAULSEN: Ablebodied poor are to be sustained instead by a massive extended Public Works Programme and a number of smaller initiatives.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M N PAULSEN: So as you may wish to flog that stillborn programme called Social Relief of Distress, by 2016 we will already wet the appetite of our people when we start to put the building blocks in place for a development state in municipalities where we will be governing.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen your time has now expired.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Thank you very much. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Tyatyam.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Decades of apartheid clearly were not going to be able to redress justice since 1994 when you took over political power. Clearly the majority of South Africa particularly in the Western Cape continues to live under depressing social ills. The ANC has

since been on course to redress the plight left by colonialism.

An HON MEMBER: And building Nkandla.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Twenty years into the new democracy it is still stuck in spatial development of apartheid. The poor still face unemployment, lack of skills, and education, infrastructural backlogs and sustainable living conditions. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: And that is a good story to tell.

Mr S G TYATYAM: This is particular visible in the Western Cape under the DA where democracy is seen by the poor only on the voting day and thereafter the DA pull all stops and tricks to continue to subjugate our people in squalid conditions, designed and implemented by apartheid and endorsed by the DA government in this process in this province. It is clear that some of the social protests over service delivery are also a reflection of poor people looking over the wall at what to do [Interjections.] living in a way that is more exhibitionist.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The one that is sponsored by you.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yet continue to find their state of living unbearable and hardly no change in their conditions. The ANC is guided and committed by

the ideals of the Freedom Charter, as we work towards building a national democratic society. In this regard we are committed to adhere to the Freedom Charter that says South Africa belongs to all who live in it, black and white, and that only in a democratic state, based on the will of the people, can we secure all their rights without distinction of colour, race and sex and belief. [Interjections.]

The task of social transformation is about advancing the goal of our people, hence the strategy and tactics of 2007 which states that “our strategies for social transformation must seek to empower people to lift them out of poverty while creating adequate social nets to protect the most vulnerable in our society.”

In order to realise our goals we must continue to ensure that we implement a comprehensive programme that focuses on the war on poverty, inequality, and underdevelopment, and that is based on advancing and defending human rights as articulated in Chapter 2 of the Constitution. [Interjections.]

Further in the 2012 Mangaung Conference we resolved that we must ensure social cohesion and nation building that underpins all national, provincial and local government in strategic priorities. I am raising this because you do not find anything; there is no policy of the DA that deals with social transformation. You can go and check anywhere. It is hidden somewhere. [Interjections.] We do not have it. [Interjection.] The ANC have it. What we raise is in our policies. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Talk about social ills.

Mr S G TYATYAM: It is for this reason that Minister Bathabile Dlamini under the guidance of the ANC decided to make or not to make a political game of the plight of our destitute people.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes.

Mr S G TYATYAM: ...that she launched the social relief of distress to provide [Interjections.] for our people.

An HON MEMBER: We know it.

Mr S G TYATYAM: ...who are under undue hardship. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: We know it. We were there.

Mr S G TYATYAM: In that the national department is working with the NDA, National Development Agencies [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The national department is not working.

Mr S G TYATYAM: ...Sassa, it works with province and municipalities and you can prove that with the work that we have done in other areas in the West

Coast and Matzikama, Malmesbury [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Did you say Nkandla [Inaudible.] [Laughter.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: And I want to raise also [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Nkandla, raise Nkandla [Inaudible.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: I will raise the Mikondzo Project.

An HON MEMBER: What, Nkandla?

Mr S G TYATYAM: What we have done in Atlantis where now we see the DA decided [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: To build Nkandla.

Mr S G TYATYAM: ...to take the people that are employed by the department to be their spies; that the DA decided to take our people who are employed by our taxpayers to go and work for the DA as their spies. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes, they are spies.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It is your people.

Mr S G TYATYAM: I am talking about your Tarryn-Lee Bell as one of them, which the case [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Who? Who?

Mr S G TYATYAM: ...which case, it was said in High Court, was thrown out. [Interjection.] It was thrown out of court. In fact the DA could not produce any evidence [Interjection.]

'n AGBARE LID: Iemand van Bellville. Somebody from Bellville.

Mr S G TYATYAM: ...that the ANC have induced or rewarded people to vote for the ANC. There is still [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You have lost so many court cases.

Mr S G TYATYAM: There is still nothing that the DA can produce till today. Also [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order hon member Mr Tyatyam, Order! Hon member Mr Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: There is a clause in the Standing Orders about relevance that I am waiting for. He has talked about social transformation, but nothing about Social Relief of Distress [Interjections.]



Mr S G TYATYAM: No, no, no. [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Nothing!

Mr S G TYATYAM: Sit, sit, sit. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr S G TYATYAM: Sit, sit. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Tyatyam, yes, carry on, but [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Carry on please. [Interjections.] Link it to the topic as far as you can. I am watching it.

Mr S G TYATYAM: All that I am raising is linked to the topic. If the member cannot hear or hon member Mr Wiley cannot hear, he must ask other people who can educate him around these issues. [Interjections.]

'n AGBARE LID: Wiks hom, wiks hom!

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes for instance [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order!

Mr S G TYATYAM: In fact some of the issues which are raised by James, your Chairperson ... that's why honourable Marius, if he was not due to speak, his name appeared on the agenda to speak [Interjections.] Do you know why?

An HON MEMBER: Uh-uh. Why?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Maybe we must remind hon James that there is a new technology. [Laughter.] There is a new technology, that you can do things quicker than before. That is why, you know [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Then you summarise. [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: You know there is a new technology [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr S G TYATYAM: So we are no longer using old machines, maybe that is what he was doing before [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Time. Order! Order!

Mr S G TYATYAM: Let us also [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order please.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: A point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Minister Botha. [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: A point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is almost [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes, yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order please. Your time has expired [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: I can see that [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired. If you want to say a last sentence I will allow you that. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Take the opportunity [Interjection.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Order! A point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mr S G TYATYAM: I can see that [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please rise if you want to raise a point of order.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: A point of order Chair, the member is in the wrong parliament. There is no James here. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is not a point of order. Please finish off your speech or take your seat.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes. I can see that people have a running stomach when we talk about these things [Interjections.] [Laughter.] Mr Deputy Speaker [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon member Mr Tyatyam. I have given you one sentence and that was a sentence, so please conclude with your speech.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Okay, just one.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, a point of order, that member is in distress. Please help him. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have allowed you one sentence and I am listening

to that one sentence, then we finish off. [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: In a caring government for the vulnerable I still want to know why is the DA, when we have by-elections, if they care about our people [Interjections.] Why do they make sure that they give our people alcohol?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, Order!

Mr S G TYATYAM: To drink themselves to death?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Tyatyam. Your time [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: This is what we are seeing in Knysna [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr S G TYATYAM: This is what we are seeing in Bitou [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Tyatyam your time [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: I know this is what that they all do again [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr S G TYATYAM: It started in Stellenbosch [Interjections.] [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Laughter.] Order! Order! When the Chair asks for order hon member Mr Tyatyam, then you take your seat, your time has expired long time back now. I have given you too much leniency there. The hon Minister Fritz to respond?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] I want to firstly just talk about the legislative framework because there are very specific legislative frameworks and the one specifically deals [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: That framework [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...with the particular Act and let me just say that we are guided by this specific Social Assistance Act. Now hon member Ms Gillion, we believe in social security, where there are undue hardships. Let me put it very, very categorically, I think Minister Botha in the past used to say that, that we believe in social security [Interjections.] where that is happening, hon member Mr Tyatyam, we believe in that. [Interjections.] But there are very clear criteria and I think no-one spoke about this, and I think the essence of this debate is exactly that the Act spells out clear criteria with which individuals must comply in order to be

considered for that particular grant.

It is important to note that the Social Relief Programme also makes provision for those who have been affected by disasters, and hon Minister Bredell will tell us also about that, disasters as defined by the Disaster Management Act, so I want to point out that nowhere in the Act does it require those in need to display any party political loyalties or card or membership; that if you are in need, you are in need, and unfortunately hon members and honourable [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: I do not think disasters are racist [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...much of these grants are currently coordinated by Sassa, as you indicated. Now let us just start very quickly. Sassa started with a tender of the CPS that was declared unlawful and irregular. It started off with that and it is almost like, soos die ou mense gesê het: “you know, it starts on bad luck almost”, and I think it is important to just note that.

The second point I want to make here is that regarding that particular grant, our responsibility as Department of Social Development in the Western Cape, through our social workers, when someone is identified as being in distress, we then assess the person, hon member Ms Makeleni. [Interjections.]

We go and assess the person and then make the referral to Sassa. That is the

way we work, we have always been working, and Sassa this year for the first time decided not to divide the 37 million by two, they just took the whole 37 million; our only conclusion we can come to for this year is that we are moving towards the 2016 Municipal Election. That is the frightening part about this debate, that it seems as if [Interjections.] ... Social Relief of Distress is used, as hon Minister Debbie Schäfer pointed out, just before elections or by-elections or during the elections, and hon member Mr Tyatyam, the Atlantis experience was interesting, as you called “a spy” or whatever, “the spy who came at night”. A very interesting point about that was that it was open evidence, although the court found it differently because the court wasn’t in Atlantis. Very clearly our social distress food parcels were distributed by people in ANC T-shirts [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: And it looked like that.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: So the ANC logo, ANC T-shirts people [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What about the court case [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: So local ANC people distributed that [Interjections.] and in fact, let me inform this House of a very personal experience. Last Thursday and Friday we had a Minmec, and I want to come to some issues raised by our honourable members in the ANC. I sat as normal; we arrive at quarter-to-eight if it starts at eight o'clock. You



know the national meeting starts an hour-and-a-half late and so while I was waiting in the holding room [Interjections.] the room filled up with local ANC ward councillors and they did not know who I was. I do not know, ons is mos nie famous nie [Interjection.] [Laughter.] So they discussed in that room, hon member Mr Dyantyi [Interjections.] Just hang on, they discussed the target set by Sassa for them to collect names of recipients and beneficiaries and it is... [03:28:45] ...completely criminal, you cannot believe it. They were discussing those lists [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order Minister Fritz, is that a question? [Interjections.] Order please. Do you want to ask a question?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes. I just want to know [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, before you ask the question, Minister, are you prepared to take a question?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: No, no, no, I am not. No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Not prepared to take a question.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Sorry hon member Mr Tyatyam, I cannot. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Ja, sorry, and what was interesting about that was that they were comparing the list and they said: “Ooh, we are not...” and many people who landed on the list got kicked out when they punched in the names because they work at ABSA or they are teaching or they... [Interjections.] and so I am saying this is the unfortunate thing.

An HON MEMBER: They are working at ABSA.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Let me just make this point, hon member Ms Makeleni. [Interjections.] You see we must not, and I really call on this House, make a joke of the poor. Where people are in need, let us serve the people wherever they are, whatever party. [Interjections.] And let us get the systems [Interjections.] ...let us get [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: They are making a joke of it.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes, let us get the systems in place and you and I think hon member Ms Gillion also asked, “will we work together?” We have always worked together. We will work together, we will make sure that the assessments are done properly; and that we move from a social security system and migrate people into a developmental way to become independent and to calculate [Interjections.] to eventually get human capital so that for instance in terms of the school system that the hon

Minister Debbie Schäfer was talking about, that if you access this grant that your children are at school, and that we ensure that there are conditions the Minister always talks about, as practiced in Brazil. I think it is important when we talk about the Mikondzo Project that we are acknowledged in the project. They have completely and deliberately left the out province.

Someone mentioned the 1 300 wards in which the national department wants to put a social worker. Now for your information the Western Cape is completely excluded, and I think [Interjections.]

No, we were completely - do you know what is interesting about that, it contradicts. [Interjections.] What is interesting about why we are excluded from 1 300, it contradicts whatever was said in this House about “Oh, the poverty is so great, this province is so terrible, the household this and the child-headed households...” [Interjections.] It completely contradicts that and they acknowledged that but I do not think we want to score political points of what are very serious [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: They have already done that [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... issues around a lot of the issues. The other point I want to make, and it is interesting hon member Ms Gillion, is that when all these agencies come to our Parliament to the Standing Committee, the little presentations all of them make are sometimes ‘hemel en aarde van mekaar geskei’ when we go and look on the ground. I

really think as government and as oversight I want to ask [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: There is six million people [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... to go and probe those issues, to go see whether it is really so. When they say it is like this, go and check that out and really hold us and everyone accountable.

The other point I want to just make - and hon member Mr Christians I think you amplified the point – is about the issue of using political party T-shirts, to make out as if “O, jy gaan nie ’n toekenning kry as jy nie ’n ANC-lid is nie. Jy moet ANC wees om iets te kry...” [Tussenwerpsels.] ...and so the T-shirt and hijacking all these projects I think are very, very important issues, but I think hon member Ms Du Toit Marais made a very interesting point when she said [Interjections.]

When hon member Ms Du Toit Marais was talking about the issue of Sassa being so excellent in distributing food parcels before an election, but ladies and gentlemen you will be shocked [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No point [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Just hear me out, you will be shocked when you see what happens to our poor, those elderly, those youth who are sent from pillar to post because there is no affidavit, they must then

queue again at four o'clock in the morning. These are the people we are talking about. [Interjections.] Now what is interesting [Interjections.]

No! What? No hon member, what is very interesting about the point that hon member Ms Du Toit Marais makes, 'luister gou net juffrou', is that at the Minmec five other provinces complained about the way our customers are treated, our poor, our elderly and our children. Five other MECs complained. So I thought it was only us. It is a systemic problem with the way Sassa manages and it is no reflection on the GD, I just wanted to make that point. [Interjections.] I have no fight. I think the GD is a wonderful person; no reflection. I think it is the way of managing the issue of Sassa distribution of grants [Interjections.] Thanks hon Du Toit Marais for making that point very pertinently, because, ons is goed om pakkies uit te deel maar ons kan nie ons basiese mandaat uitvoer nie, and that is the main problem that we have here.

Hon member Ms Makeleni, I also want to say we have no issue with working with national. I will work with anyone who will let us get the best for our... but it becomes frightening when councillors start becoming conduits of Sassa; ANC councillors, not others, just ANC councillors. It becomes very, very, very frightening. [Interjections.]

I also want to just make the point hon member Mr Paulsen, I noted that your nice red overall is so nicely ironed; jou boots is mooi, jy lyk soos 'n voorman. You do not look like a worker. [Laughter.] Jy lyk asof jy in die trend is. [Gelag.]

So please there is no [Inaudible] [Interjection.] Ja, exactly, but your point, you know [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And the point that the hon member Mr Paulsen makes, he rejects Social Relief of Distress out of hand, but there are people who are in need and there are people in distress and I think one must acknowledge that, but then work from that point forward in a developmental way to incorporate and get people empowered. Moenie weer slakke-projekte hê nie, do not create projects for snails, like we did in the previous government and that we had inherited, and I want to just talk about that, because that is linked to the kind of Social Relief of Distress.

There are five projects where we cannot find the money, we cannot find where the tools and the equipment are and those are worrying. The reason why I think it has happened in the so-called Sustainable Livelihood Programme is because we as social workers want to run economics. We want to run economic programmes. That is best served by the Department of Economic Development and so what we can do is identify people for possible skills, provide them with skills and refer them next door. These are the people who are the experts in economic development. [Laughter.]

We should focus on the social pathologies and on the preventative work and

all of that kind of work, but sometimes I really get this impression that  
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order Minister.

Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Alles wat ons wil  
doen wil ons net romanties doen vir die armes. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Please sir, I beg you  
honourable [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, Minister your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you honourable.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You can finish, if you want a last sentence to finish  
off.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes, I want to urge this  
House that we sharpen our oversight work, that we do it for everyone, for the  
department, and really hold us accountable, and that is what I want to ask as  
a last plea. Thank you.

Hon member Ms Makeleni I am waiting for you in Oudtshoorn.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear.

*Debate concluded.*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you [Interjections.] Order! Order! That concludes the debate on this subject for discussion, but before we adjourn there is one issue that still needs our attention. I need to give a ruling on something which happened on the 14<sup>th</sup> of August.

During that debate on the 14<sup>th</sup> of August 2014 and on the draft resolution a point of order was raised by the hon Premier enquiring whether it was parliamentary for the hon member Ms Gillion to say and I quote:

“...and so the Khoisan people are baboons...”

I enquired from the hon member Ms Gillion whether she had indeed used those words and she replied that her words were:

“...so they say the Khoisan people are baboons...”

Having now had the benefit of consulting Hansard I rule as follows: Hansard does not confirm the hon member Ms Gillion’s version of what she indicated or believes she had said. It is clear from the transcript that the hon member



Ms Gillion said:

“...and so the Khoisan are baboons...”

'n AGBARE LID: Jo, skande! [Tussenwerpsels.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! [Interjections.] But even if she had meant that the government or anybody in the House had done or said something that had led her to equate the Khoisan to baboons that is immaterial. Either way the comment is an insulting comment. It is a serious reflection and it is unparliamentary. I therefore ask the hon member Ms Gillion to withdraw the remark unconditionally. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: There is your chance to explain.

Ms M N GILLION: I am an honourable member and I am also a Khoisan and I withdraw, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Ms Gillion. That then disposes of this issue. [Interjections.]

'n AGBARE LID: 'n Goeie Khoisan!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: This brings us to the end of the proceedings of the House. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:51.