
THURSDAY, 27 AUGUST 2020

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members! Hon members, welcome today. As you can see, we have a hybrid system that is actually happening for the sitting of the House today. I trust that everybody is connected and is participating with ease to the sitting of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. Just a reminder that all your privileges and immunities as are in the House are imparted by law, and please may I ask that if you are not speaking that all your microphones have been muted?

We now move over to the first item on the Order Paper, and that is the motion in the name of hon member Mitchell. I recognise the Deputy Chief Whip.

(Notice of Motion)

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the existing contract of the Registrar of Members' Interests, Adv P Burgers, be extended on the same terms and conditions for a period of no longer than three months with effect from 1 September, 2020.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion? No, no objections? Agreed to.

Thank you very much. We then move, I recognise now the Chief Whip.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 20(1), precedence be

given to the Subject for Discussion as printed on the Order Paper in the name of hon member Mackenzie.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon Chief Whip. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to.

We will now deal with the Subject for Discussion in the name of hon member Mackenzie, as printed on the Order Paper. I recognise hon member Mackenzie.

SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION

(The impact of the draconian measures by the National Government on the economy, which costs South Africans their jobs, and is exacerbated by the reoccurrence of load shedding, which will result in many more job losses.)

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, hon members inside the House and on the virtual sitting. Hon members, it is widely speculated that unemployment could escalate to a peak of 50% by the end of this year. Furthermore, it is estimated that 160 000 people have lost their jobs in the Western Cape and the number of jobs lost in the country could be as high as three million. Over 55% of those who have lost their jobs are in the lowest 10% of our economy. Many represent women of colour, further demonstrating that the unduly extended lockdown and draconian measures by

National Government magnified and worsened the systemic inequalities of our economic landscape.

Hon Speaker, these draconian measures have cost South Africans dearly in jobs; taking bread off the table for far too many families. An example is the labour-intensive wine industry which has suffered a R7,5 billion loss of revenue in only 14 weeks equating to a potential 25 000 job losses. In the space of less than four weeks, Central Government went from declaring the industry non-essential to then permitting harvesting and then banning transport even for export purposes. It is this kind of inconsistency derived from vested political interest to enrich ANC cadres that ultimately results in a lack of business confidence in South Africa. That in turn leads to the loss of revenue and finally an inability of employers to pay workers. Poor and inconsistent policy ruins a breadbasket, Deputy Speaker.

We have to debate how these measures were worsened by the recurrence of the notorious load-shedding, as surprise Level 3, but most importantly this debate has to offer hope and restore dignity to the people in the Western Cape.

Initially as a country we supported the hard lockdown but what the ANC Government did under the undue extension of the hardest lockdown in a power drunk state served only to decimate far too many businesses and plunder their employment rate.

Hon Speaker, I have to quote the Commissioner for Human Rights, Michelle Bachelet, and I quote:

“Respect for people’s rights including economic, social and cultural rights, were fundamental to the success of the public health response and recovery from the pandemic.”

Deputy Speaker, the ANC failed miserably at the above and sadly while all the above was happening, job losses, massive unemployment, business closures, not one hon member of the ANC in this Parliament deplored this or condemned these blatant acts and decimation of jobs. In fact, many of them went out their way and asked for interventions for the Western Cape by National Ministers, who we all know are only interested in tenders for friends than in sorting out the high unemployment in this country.

Deputy Speaker, load-shedding is not a natural phenomenon and whilst South Africans were battling under the unreliable inconsistent and unrealistic measures the ANC brought back the self made crisis and made the desperate situation far worse, but here in the Western Cape we used the lockdown for what it was meant to be and have already realigned our vision to speak to the needs of restoring livelihoods and supporting small businesses.

Deputy Speaker, just as the Western Cape fought COVID-19 alone, we are still waiting for the billions from the President so we will do the same against the second pandemic of unemployment and poverty and we will do

this with dignity and hope with our partners, which is civil society, the private sector and public sector, communities and individuals alike.

Today I hope this debate will inspire the reprioritisation of plans to save business ventures, jobs and the economy and restore the dignity of people in the Western Cape. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise hon member Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, the devastating impact of COVID-19 on health and economy is known to all. It has exposed the fundamental structural challenges facing our country, particularly the distinct economic realities – a poor one of black majority and the rich one for whites.

The COVID-19 infection rate followed this pattern. The hotspots were all in the poor communities, while the affluent areas with best healthcare facilities were spared. It is therefore correct that the outbreak highlighted the very high levels of inequality as well as the deeply engraved dimension of poverty. Income assets and access to basic services, all of which are defined in terms of race, gender, age and geographic location. This is addressed in the National Government's Three Stages of Response to the COVID-19 pandemic. The first stage was mainly about containing the spread of the virus through various measures including the nationwide lockdown and

rigorous testing and tracking, which the Western Cape failed to do for several months.

The second stage focused on relief and support to households and businesses in distress. In this stage the Government announced a R500 billion Social and Economic Support Package for household and businesses which included a special R20 billion COVID 19 Health Budget; R50 billion for expanded social grants, distribution of food parcels, additional funds to municipalities to improve service delivery as well as a Government-backed loan guarantee scheme for businesses in distress. This also included the temporary employee relief scheme payouts. This has been halted temporarily due to the Auditor-General's preliminary audit of payments to companies. While additional funds were made available to improve service delivery, it is said that the Provincial Government failed to de-densify the densely populated informal settlements, which was highlighted as a major risk to accelerate community transmission.

The third stage focuses on the development and implementation of an Economic Reconstruction, Growth and Transformation Plan. The objectives of this plan are well captured in President Cyril Ramaphosa's words, when he said:

“Our economic strategy going forward will require a new social compact, among all role-players – business, labour, community and Government, to restructure the economy and achieve inclusive growth.”

Deputy Speaker, it is important to note that the DA has always supported the National Government's three stages to save lives and to protect livelihoods. It is on record in April welcoming the President's announcement of a lifting of lockdown restrictions. The DA is only angry because it wanted to follow an unscientific approach of ending the lockdown when the country was approaching its peak. It is the same thing they did in the Western Cape which resulted in the province being the epicentre. I hope it becomes clear that the National Government's efforts to prevent the spread of infection were not draconian. What is draconian, however, are nepotism and cronyism that are deeply entrenched in the DA-led Provincial Government. While thousands have lost jobs in the province, the son of MEC Meyer, Ivan Meyer Junior, was employed as an assistant-director in the Department of Local Government during the lockdown period. We call on the Premier to investigate this appointment immediately and make its findings public.

I thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise Minister Fernandez.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Premier, hon members, before I begin my input, I must though comment on the nepotism, cronyism and talk to the fact how National Government is plundering, using PPEs and we really have a case of the pot calling the kettle black, so hon Deputy Speaker, the draconian measures implemented by the

ANC National Government are indeed placing immense pressure, not only on our economy but directly affecting lives and livelihoods.

It is no secret that South Africa was in a dire economic state before the COVID-19 pandemic. This has been exacerbated by the blatant corruption we see that is taking place on a grand scale daily.

Hon Deputy Speaker, many citizens have lost faith in the ANC Government, as they have not only enabled plundering of the public purse but have also robbed millions of South Africans of their jobs and livelihoods in the process. Job losses as a result of the hard and protracted lockdown saw increases daily. National departments are in disarray and citizens are frustrated by the irrational flip-flopping. Confusion range as gazetted directions contradicts the Premier's addresses to the nation.

According to the findings from the *National Income Dynamics Coronavirus Rapid Mobile Survey* released in mid-July, it is estimated that R3 million South Africans have lost their jobs during the nationwide lockdown with an additional 1,5 million workers who have lost their income as a result of this lockdown.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the social sector has also felt the impact of these draconian irrational measures. Our ECD Sector is bleeding. Thousands of jobs have been lost and sadly it is mostly women who are affected. Instead of providing much needed funding to ECD Centres and programmes that are

in financial turmoil, the ANC National Government announced on 30 July this year that R1,3 billion from the Economic Stimulus Package would be used to employ 36 000 youth compliance monitors for ECD programmes, this whilst thousands of ECDs across the country are struggling to keep their doors open. What is the point of employing compliance officers when there would not be any ECD programmes to monitor as ECDs are struggling to recuperate funds from parents who are struggling financially or parents who have lost their income as a consequence of the pandemic? I would urge the National Minister to reconsider this decision and rather use the funds to support ECDs with operational costs and other measures.

Deputy Speaker, I fear the job losses that we are experiencing across many sectors will increase the demand for social services, especially psychosocial support. Lives and livelihoods are threatened further by the inability of entities such as SASSA, who continually fail to meet their mandate. They have failed in providing social relief of distress grants, and the disability grant to millions of vulnerable citizens throughout this period. The pool of vulnerable citizens is growing at an alarming rate and we face an even worse humanitarian pandemic, that of poverty and unemployment, and to add insult to injury, Deputy Speaker, the impact of rolling blackouts has dire consequences for our economy and the social sector.

Although the failures of the ANC National Government have amplified the many challenges facing our society, all hope is not lost. As a government and as a department we have remained steadfast in restoring hope and dignity

to the people of our province during this testing time, albeit that our ability to provide social services is being pushed to the limit we continue to support the most vulnerable where we can. Where the ANC National Government has failed to provide financial support to many of our sectors, we have stepped up, this despite the many promises of this Province receiving funding, which we have yet to receive. We have made a series of Budget reallocations to mitigate against the draconian measures implemented by our National Government. Where SASSA has failed to provide social relief, we stepped in and we went above and beyond our mandate and provided food parcels where National DSD failed to assist our ECD Sector, we stepped in and reallocated funding to ensure that registered ECDs could reopen whilst abiding by the COVID-19 Health and Safety Protocols. We have continued to provide psychosocial support to those who are being psychologically impacted by the pandemic. We have continued to provide funding and assistance to old age homes. Although it is in the lockdown period, we have remained committed to ensuring our NPO partners continue to receive support from DSD. We have recorded a 98% payment rate to our NPOs, which far outstrips any other province.

In conclusion, hon Deputy Speaker, we would not be able to deliver the service that we do to the many vulnerable people of this province without the support of our NPO partners who are on the ground providing services to the most vulnerable. There are also many NGOs, private sector donors, religious organisations and CBOs which have come forward to assist communities independently of Government. It is in this regard that we also wish to thank

all those organisations, donors and volunteers for their compassion and kindness during the challenging time for our province and our country. Whilst the Coronavirus pandemic has wreaked havoc globally and plunged our country into a national emergency of epic proportions, we can and will overcome, thanks to the many frontline essential service workers and our citizens for heeding the call to flatten the curve. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. I recognise the hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, saving livelihoods is intimately connected with saving lives and this is not a choice. Our Government had to act decisively to contain the spread of the virus especially in poor communities who live in overcrowded and underserved conditions. They did so by introducing laws and regulations specifically designed to contain and control the virus. The DA calls these “draconian” because for the DA some lives matter less than the creation of wealth. They are not willing to put the greater good above private wealth. They were not even willing to give up surfing in order to limit the movement of people. They could not accept well-established wine farms publicly expressing their solidarity with Government’s actions. These were labelled sell-outs.

There is no denying that the lockdown has had a devastating impact on the economy and many people’s incomes have been reduced or their jobs lost

entirely. What does need to be denied is that the alternative herd immunity approach advocated by some DA leaders was ever a realistic alternative. This Swedish- or Trump-style open economy approach to handling a global health crisis was only ever intended to benefit the rich, those with private healthcare or who could easily work from home, and now the entire world can see where this denial is and where it led us. COVID deaths in Sweden are ten times higher than in the neighbouring countries Norway and Finland, which, like South Africa, endured a prolonged lockdown and despite aiming to save their economy, Sweden's GDP has dropped by 60% more than its neighbours who did lockdown. Sweden proves that calls for herd immunity were irresponsible and deadly.

These mistakes were done and the lives of the first wave of COVID infections have been lost but let us not lose the lessons. We now need to rebuild the economy and absolutely load-shedding will not help us achieve this at a fast rate. We need to look to avoid energy intensive investments and look to invest instead in labour intensive industries and sectors. One way is to stipulate the construction sector by releasing well-located Government land for the development of affordable housing.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Herron. I now

recognise hon Mitchell.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. It has been over 150 days since the first COVID-19 patient was diagnosed in the Western Cape. I would like to take a moment and remember all those who have sadly lost their fight against this terrible pandemic. Our thoughts and prayers are with their families during this very difficult time.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I rise today to take part in this debate and I can go on and on about the various draconian rules imposed by the National Government which cost jobs and livelihoods and which would no doubt have a lasting and devastating effect on many South Africans, but it would be remiss of me not to highlight one or two of those rules that directly affect the dignity of our citizens.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I am reminded of a call I received from a constituent in Beaufort West, a business owner who was prevented from selling a grilled chicken to a long-distance truck driver who arrived in Beaufort West to stop and have something to eat. This truck driver had been on the road for many hours without a decent meal because a certain National Minister deemed it not essential enough for a person to have a cooked meal, but, hon Deputy Speaker, as long as it does not affect me, I do not give a damn!

Then I am reminded of a curfew being imposed that has affected livelihoods, as well as business as they only have a limited time to operate, especially

those companies that only work through deliveries. The curfew has also seen workers such as restaurant staff and delivery drivers receiving fines because the curfew has not enabled them to get home in the given time. But, yet again, hon Deputy Speaker, a certain National Minister deemed it not essential enough because as long as it does not affect me, I do not care about the bread on the table of that particular family tonight because mine is looked after with the public funds from these very people. But rather than going back and reminding this House of the obvious and highlighting the failures of the National Government, let me rather use this time to demonstrate how this DA-led Western Cape Government implemented effective evidence-based programmes and, together with the citizens of this province, came together to flatten the curve.

In doing so we ensured that the dignity of patients and citizens were at all times at the centre of this Government's planning.

Let me now turn to what was done, hon Deputy Speaker, not what should have been done. When the national lockdown in March was announced by the President, the DA-led Western Cape Government immediately put measures in place to be ready for what was the dreaded peak of this pandemic. First up was the identification of field hospitals and isolation facilities. Why, hon Deputy Speaker, because the safety and dignity of residents was our primary concern. The identification and opening of the Hospital of Hope with the over 800-bed facility, was a key part of this response. It opened at a cost of R50 million and saw over 1500 patients. This provided a dignified space for

patients who would need to be in isolation, but the beacon of hope to the 1500 patients that went through the hospital were without a doubt the 900 staff members who worked tirelessly to ensure that the first patient on 8 June was received with the dignity that he deserved.

Hon Deputy Speaker, because this DA-led Government cares and provides hope together, the infection curve has successfully flattened to the point where the CTICC Hospital has now been decommissioned. Hon Deputy Speaker, because this DA-led Government cares and values the frontline workers, a special dedicated taxi service was initiated for healthcare workers. This initiative ensured that over 12 000 workers were safely taken to work and home again with approximately 450 staff transported to over 25 healthcare facilities in the Cape Metro every day. Considering how important these people are and the incredible stress that they work under, doing all we could to ensure that they arrived to and from work, would be the last burden that they would care about. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): This initiative also undertook over 8600... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, your time is up.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): In conclusion, hon Deputy Speaker, if I

may, I am reminded of the thank-you video I saw on social media of a patient who was treated at Brackengate Hospital, named Beryl, and I would like to quote an echo of Beryl's words. I quote... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, finish off.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): "To the Premier, Mr Alan Winde and your frontline workers, I am so grateful. You are doing a great job."

Thank you, Premier, to you and your Government for ensuring dignity and hope to the citizens of this province... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Your time is up.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The poor men and women are the hardest hit by this lockdown. The food distribution nationally and provincially, the UIF payouts, amongst others, failed those who needed it the most, but Deputy Speaker, maybe the question and the real question that should be asked is who is the real President of this country? Is it President Cyril Ramaphosa or Minister Dlamini-Zuma? By the President making one announcement, and his Minister comes in, contradicting him, makes us

wonder.

Hon Deputy Speaker, and then just out of the lockdown, and our economy is about to recover, we see load-shedding is back and every South African knows the meaning of load-shedding and when they see the word “load-shedding”, it just demoralises all of our people and especially our small businesses, because it is our small businesses that do not have alternative power. They do not have generators, meaning that when we have load-shedding, they lose the most. When we are at home we still have candles, we have heaters, but the true problem is that if we are going to recover, Eskom must get its act together because otherwise more and more people will die of starvation and the question is, what is the Western Cape Government going to do to assist and I heard what Minister Maynier said, we are doing all our best, but I want to ask this Government and tell this Government our people, our men and women in the street in our poorest communities, are hit the hardest. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Christians. I now recognise hon Minister Marais.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Hon Deputy Speaker, I thank you for the opportunity to participate in this very significant debate today as it is no secret that the National Government’s inadequacies, maladministration and incompetence have further impoverished an already under-resourced sector, which we all look to, to inspire hope and motivate for

social inclusivity.

The second wave of relief funding announced by the National Minister of Sports, Arts and Culture, sounds proactive and perhaps even plausible, but essentially exposes an inactive Department and I would even go as far as to say one marred by nonchalance maladministration and delays to afford corruption and plundering of public funds for a select few.

What the second wave of relief funding means for the millions in need in the Sport, Arts and Culture sector, is that of the R150 million announced by the National Minister on 25 March 2020, only R65,7 million was allocated and only catered for Sport and Recreation applicants while the second wave caters to the Arts, Culture and Heritage sector. This adds further injury to an already open wound as five months later our esteemed artists, the developing creatives and emerging stars have not received any form of relief, if not from us, provincially.

To place it in perspective, our Provincial Arts, Culture and Heritage Relief Fund of R4,7 million was set aside primarily to offer relief to creatives and not to compensate for losses incurred, as we simply could not, due to budgetary pressures. The fund adjudicated 948 applicants and following the required administrative processes to approve the 691 successful applicants, the combined revenue losses – the applicants – come to a total of R58,6 million, a clear indication of the devastating impact on the sector. Yet for five months National Arts Culture and Heritage practitioners have no

source of income to provide for their basic needs to sustain not only their own livelihoods but also those dependent on them.

In his latest address on 18 August, the National Minister listed all the challenges experienced during the first wave of relief. The bulk of which is due to mismanagement, lack of strategic vision, lack of readiness by the Department's IT system, amongst many other self-implicated issues which are not new and may even account for the lack of structure and support to the sector pre-COVID-19, plunging the industry into further disrepair. As we fast-forward to the present day, with some restrictions now relaxed, the hon member Mackenzie calls it draconian. I would add irrational and even absurd, almost wanting to kill our economy and livelihoods as the National Regulations around gyms, theatres, museums and even libraries prescribe no more than 50 people regardless of space available.

The content is two-fold. One, some spaces are bigger than others, which could safely accommodate more people by strictly adhering to the mandatory health protocols. These spaces should be allowed to reopen in accordance with their total area available to increase revenue, to attract and retrieve increased membership, patrons and ticket sales to save the industry, and secondly, no work means no pay. Not only are our artists now starving and some homeless but so are the millions of employees to those entities.

In the dire fiscal environment in which we find ourselves, the possible deterioration of the socio-economic wellbeing of citizens will further impact

the tax base, increase dependence on governmental services, further augmenting the number of indigent households which require additional support across the three spheres of government. This will compound existing development challenges and extend fiscal demands from Government as unemployment will rise due to the lockdown. Based on experiences of countries further along the trajectory of the pandemic, this crisis is likely to last for months and require an immediate planning and budgetary response whilst considering a post-COVID-19 strategic approach as only the Western Cape Government has done. The proactive efforts of the Western Cape Government's whole of society and whole of government approaches indeed assisted us to pick up national slack with the very little we had, still have and will continue to struggle with as so much of our available funds were surrendered while conditional grants continued to be cut from National.

Hon Deputy Speaker, perhaps the funds cut from and surrendered to National can be considered the third wave, one which waves goodbye to constructive opportunities for those we serve in the Western Cape and the greater South Africa. Our track record of good governance and maximum citizen impact service delivery has been confirmed by various independent stakeholders including the Auditor-General's report for the past five years, yet other provinces are awarded exorbitant budgets, facilities and resources with little or no deliverables to show in real terms.

The case in point, last year was the fourth consecutive year in which the National Department of Sport and Recreation South Africa instructed each

provincial department to contribute R10 million of our annual budget towards the establishment of the National Training and Olympic Preparatory Centre in Bloemfontein, the hometown of the former Minister Fikile Mbalula. Four years on only dust is proof of this investment as the National Department only officiated the sod-turning on the site on 10 November 2018. To date R40 million has been re-appropriated from each provincial department budget, amounting to a total of R360 million which is at the National Government's disposal with no plan communicated, no concrete facility, no accountability nor urgency or evidence-based research into the needs of our sports people, further reducing the relief, development, opportunities and transformation in the Western Cape and forcing us to be innovative with the little budget received, based on rife maladministration and pie-in-the-sky strategies. Because of this, wasteful expense could help with the abundance of requests we receive in the Western Cape. Assistance is needed in this humanitarian crisis for the empowerment of our under-resourced sports people of facilities, to bridge the gap between developmental participation and high levels of competition and quite simply to afford to serve all the human dignity they deserve.

As Zig Zigar reminds: "The lack of direction, not time, is the problem."

The National ANC problem, that I urge all in this House to seriously consider the repercussions national practices have on the Western Cape, and we note with grave concern that key political grandstanding is killing the positive aspirations in the country ... [Inaudible – audio distorted.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister, your time is up.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: ...and further crippling progress in the Western Cape. With the crumbs left from the ANC's left-wing rhetoric... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, Minister.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: ...the battle between the captured and the capturers is holding our youth potential hostage and diminishes the human dignity of all those we serve. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. If we could make sure that the microphones are off in the House. I now call on hon member Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. The COVID-19 pandemic has impacted negatively on the economic [Inaudible.] in South Africa, the entire South African continent and the world. Africa's three largest economies, Angola, Nigeria and South Africa, have all been heavily impacted. The World Bank projection indicated that growth in Sub-Saharan Africa will decline from 2,4% in 2019 to between negative 2,1% and negative 5,1% in 2020. This resulted in rising unemployment numbers in many businesses closing down or downsizing their workforce. Public finances are also being overstretched as Government were forced to strike a balance

between saving lives and livelihoods. The nationwide lockdown was one of the tough decisions the National Government had to take to curb the spread of the virus. Unfortunately, this resulted in heavy restriction in economic activities including supply chain disruption and labour supply deductions.

The IMF considered that the impact of COVID-19 on the global economy is much worse than the 2008 and 2009 financial crisis. Edmund Conway, the Economics Editor of Sky News was correct when he said: “Economics is something people usually take notice of only when things go wrong or when an economy is facing a crisis.”

Only those who have a rudimentary knowledge of economics will want to blame the economic impact of COVID-19 wholly on the containment measures of National Government.

Hon Deputy Speaker, given the scale of the COVID-19 damage to the economy I expected a serious level of debate, not the resuscitation of the same DA script of blame-and-complain game. I appeal to members not to be reactionary and not to waste the precious opportunity that we have, to reflect on our real economic challenges and to share new ideas on how to rebuild the economy post-COVID-19 pandemic in the Western Cape. The subject matter needs us to go beyond vitriolic attacks on National Government. The DA must put its ideas on the table on how to rebuild the economy of the Western Cape. We must also be told what the DA’s post-COVID economic recovery plan is and how will it address the Western Cape legacy of

under-development, poverty and unemployment, as well as the racial and gender inequality that has been exposed by the outbreak. Here we are not talking about mere budget reprioritisation but an economic recovery plan that will talk to the transformation and restructuring of the economic underpinned by inclusive growth and supporting the informal sector and SMMEs which the Premier has recently referred to as the lifeblood of the economy.

The Economic Transformation Committee of the ANC developed a framework for reconstruction, growth and transformation with the objective of building a new and inclusive economy post-COVID-19. We still have to see what the DA is going to do, what it is also planning to do. The first pillar of the policy framework is centred on infrastructure-led recovery, with new investments in energy, water and sanitation, roads and bridges, human settlements, health and education, digital infrastructure and public transport. Further to this the policy framework has placed more emphasis on localisation including maximising the use of South African materials in construction companies, a labour-intensive network, in order to achieve significant job creation. In addition to this, the use of the district development model will be strengthened and deepened to improve service delivery and infrastructure expansion in both rural and urban areas. Through the policy framework the aim is for South Africa to forge new spatial forms in its settlement and transport system to bring people closer to areas of social and economic opportunities.

The Western Cape is the worst performing province when it comes to both

MyCiTi and Go George Operations. The Go George Operations are in shambles, while suitable pockets of land closer to places of opportunity continue to be disposed of, to be developed for private interest.

In closing, the second pillar of the policy framework is promoting investment in key productive sectors, such as agriculture, manufacturing, money and tourism. The Western Cape Recovery Plan should aim to observe the province as the textile manufacturing hub.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Speaker, the same legal system which ruled regulations as irrational, illegal and unconstitutional, now ruled against the City for removing illegal structures of land invaders. We have become like a dog chasing and biting its own tail. There are too many uncertainties at a time when our President seems unable to act decisively against corruptors and corruptees in his own party. His crown is lying uneasy on his head, forcing him to change his statements at regular intervals, to please Minister Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma.

Premier Winde, we need to see your promised Recovery Plan. It should not be an upgraded soup kitchen. The Cape Flats is tired of soup kitchens and food parcels. We should not get bigger food parcels but bigger responsibilities, more jobs, encouraging of hard work, productivity and urban renewal, Mr Premier. We need to see that plan.

We need to see the municipalities drawn in, they must change their rules at provincial level to make provision for how to handle rapid urban renewal. Where is the urban renewal plan so that we are not every time running to court with Chris Nissen, running in front not having work; something else to do. We need to get the courts to back us and not to fight us and therefore common law must come into operation. In the absence of common law we will always lose our case in the Constitutional Court because we have not done our planning properly.

Hon Premier, let us see your recovery plan. We need it. Corruption is a runaway train. The ANC cannot stop corruption because corruption is ANC policy.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: You have got to come with your plan. I am waiting for it, Premier, and if need be... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr P J MARAIS: ... I am prepared to make certain recommendations regarding what should be in that plan including urban renewal.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marais. Your time is up. Thank you very much. Hon member Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: [No audible reply.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Brinkhuis, are you online?

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Hon Speaker, the Western Cape Government must stop blaming, blame-shifting its own shortcomings and corruption and rather accept responsibility for failing to deliver the most basic services to the poor areas where most needed. Studies worldwide have revealed that the virus has taken its heaviest toll amongst the poorest communities and the Western Cape is one of the examples of such a phenomenon; not forgetting this province was the epicentre of the virus. Al Jama-ah fully supports the total lockdown by National Government as saving lives are more important than business under abnormal circumstances.

The province's infections were spiralled by tourists and travellers, the same

industry the DA called the premature reopening. The virus spreads from tourists to our poor and densely populated areas such as in Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain. The vulnerable people were more susceptible to the virus and it seems the Province has very little regard for black lives. The Province, the Western Cape Government, should focus more on the equal distribution of food amongst all the needy communities.

Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Brinkhuis. I now recognise hon Minister Maynier.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Faced with the prospect of a health pandemic that we have never seen or experienced before, we took immediate action to save lives in the Western Cape. During the lockdown we built hospitals and isolation and quarantine facilities. We provided emergency food relief and school-feeding schemes and we provided the personal protective equipment, tools and resources for our essential services, schools and businesses to operate safely. [Inaudible – speaking simultaneously.]

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Hon Deputy Speaker, the quality of the sound is very poor. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: My apologies, I got stuck, I missed the last part

because I went offline. You are finished? Hon Minister Maynier, did you carry on?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Can I continue, hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, you may, sorry, I just disappeared for a second there. You may continue.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you. We also knew that the lockdown would have a severe impact on the economy in the Western Cape and on individual lives and so we made a commitment to work hard and use the lockdown period to prepare our healthcare system so that we could fight the COVID-19 pandemic in the Western Cape.

Unfortunately, of course, the legitimacy of the lockdown itself was undermined by the often arbitrary nonsensical and contradictory nature of the restrictions that emerged under lockdown. You can buy chips or cooldrinks, but only if bought with other essential goods. You can buy crock-bottom pants, but not a T-shirt or open-toe shoes. You can sell frozen food but not cooked chicken or hot food and you definitely cannot buy anything online, which of course was one of the safest retail options, and then of course there was the flip-flopping on restrictions that impacted most on economic activity especially in the tourism and hospitality sectors.

The result of course was a widespread spike in the illegal trade of alcohol and cigarettes and I think a breakdown of public trust particularly in National Government in South Africa, and so I think we all breathed a sigh of relief when President Cyril Ramaphosa finally announced that South Africa would move to Alert Level 2. We were ready to open safely. We were ready to start doing business again and we were ready to start rebuilding our economy in the Western Cape. The tourism and hospitality industry has been particularly hard hit during the COVID-19 pandemic and so our immediate focus on economic recovery is to support these businesses that are a major contributor to jobs in the Western Cape. Earlier today I announced the launch of our domestic tourism campaign, *We Are Open*, which will be run by Wesgro and which will stimulate economic recovery by encouraging consumer spending, especially in the tourism and hospitality sectors in the Western Cape.

Next month, which of course is tourism month, I will also be visiting businesses across the province to engage with them, to listen to them and to work with them on rebuilding our economy. Since the start of the lockdown we have worked hard to support businesses and the employees to survive and to adapt to the current challenges while also keeping an eye on the future. Not only did we want to ensure the survival of businesses through this crisis but we also wanted to identify opportunity to do things better, to pivot and adapt to do business in a more innovative way that will ensure that we are ready to compete globally when the time comes.

We have seen many examples of businesses who have done just that, businesses like Granadilla Eats, which is an incredible success story of an e-commerce company that pivoted during the crisis. Prior to the hard lockdown this company only sold swimwear, but now they deliver fresh produce from local farmers and other food items from small local businesses right to your doorstep.

It is these businesses that we remain committed to supporting as we start to rebuild our economy in the Western Cape, but Deputy Speaker, despite all of this, the biggest hand-brake – and this has to be said – on economic recovery in the Western Cape and South Africa is National Government. The fact is that National Government is a snakepit of competing interests that cannot agree on the what, let alone the how of economic policy, and where economic policy is no longer a means to an end but an end in itself, which of course will ultimately compromise economic recovery in provinces across South Africa. For 13 years the country's economic potential has been hamstrung by recurring load-shedding, and the tragedy is that this could have been avoided.

At the State of the Nation Address this year President Cyril Ramaphosa promised to take measures to rapidly and significantly increase generation capacity outside of Eskom. He promised to implement the integrated resource plan, 2019 – not done! He promised to procure emergency energy power for projects that can deliver electricity into the grid within 12 months – not done! He promised to open Bid Window 5 of the Renewable Energy Independent Power Producers Programme – not done, and he promised to put

in place measures to enable municipalities in good financial standing to procure their own power from IPPs – not done!

When the Eskom CEO André de Ruyter was recently asked to comment on the risk of load shedding he said: “The one thing I have learnt about the Eskom generation system is that it keeps you humble and that like forecasts made by economists you need to hedge your bets and be very careful...” – which hardly inspires confidence. Frustratingly with just the stroke of a pen National Government could drastically change the current energy crisis. With the stroke of a pen the Minister of Energy could lift the one-megawatt cap of self-generation to immediately bring online significant amounts of renewable energy and with the stroke of the pen immediately open Bid Window 5.

However, when National Government continues to drag its feet, we are doing everything possible to enable resources and prepare municipal procurement of energy in the Western Cape. Direct business engagements by the Green Economy Team to inform and support increased implementation of solar PV has resulted in 167 megawatts of small-scale renewable energy being installed in the Western Cape to date.

Hon Deputy Speaker, times have been tough for businesses and people in our province who faced many challenges during lockdown. We have all pulled together and we have worked together to stop the spread of COVID-19 in the Western Cape. The fight is not over, because we now face a daunting

unemployment pandemic.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: And to overcome this second pandemic we will have to continue pulling together and working together so that we can save jobs and save the economy in the Western Cape. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister Maynier. I now call on hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. This is a much important and welcome debate by the African National Congress as it presents an opportunity to educate members of the Democratic Alliance and the House at large about the necessity of the response by the Government on the Coronavirus pandemic and how the world has responded to this pandemic, with also how we should position our economies as we recover from this period. Perhaps let us all start and consider what the hon Minister Fernandez called “the pot calling the kettle black.”

It is also interesting to note that the DA pot here in this province refused PPEs which were stored in pricy storages for EMS workers of Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain and others until they had to protest just to get protection during the Coronavirus. FEDUSA yesterday reminded us in their

presentation as a stakeholder of the Government response, when they indicated that the Western Cape Government is not effective in its role in communities and they are calling for greater and inclusive collaboration with social partners, so we still have to hear which are their social partners in private and civil society that hon Fernandez and hon member Mackenzie are speaking about. What has this Government done to expose employers who have delayed, and some have not paid, UIF monies to distressed workers; let alone claims of those who were paid out, the same as the noise that they were able to make of inefficiencies of the Department of Labour.

Again, this DA pot must tell us how they have made the astute choice of rather leasing from established, and also including small and emerging accommodation, for quarantine facilities, so that they are able to save jobs. The CTICC Hospital of Hope, we will be hearing today how much was spent on this facility and the cost benefit of such expenditure. Again, here in the City of Cape Town we had six weeks spending of about R53 million in an internment camp by the City of Cape Town for the homeless. Again, a cost of the loss of income to the informal economy when the municipalities under the watch of this DA Government placed their own draconian barriers for informal businesses to get trading permits until these issues and the association had to go to court for that – again a blatant refusal of this Provincial Government to innovate procurement to benefit small and medium-sized businesses for emergency procurement.

Let me further share with you, hon Deputy Speaker, that today the black wine

businesses are marching in protest of lack of transformation in the wine industry, whom amongst them is a significant group of black women-owned wine brands. Leading this protest is Vivian Kleynhans of African Roots Wines, who says “enough is enough” and points at unequal distribution of wealth and opportunities in this industry, stating that “the larger wine brands have reserves, but black-owned wine businesses do not have that luxury. We are first-time rounders and we do not have generational wealth.”

Should we then follow and lay a charge to the Premier and his Cabinet for these? Perhaps hon member Mackenzie can advise – is this Government quantifying these losses to the economy and these households or maybe they do not fit the profile of their audience or donors so they do not fall in the DA debates. We may choose the immediate sensation as a sponsor of this debate did, of opting to parade his matriculant DA leader, who understandably must ensure relevance in the wake of the upcoming Leadership Conference politics in their party – a party with an identity crisis that can only survive in weaknesses of its opponents than its own existence so to score political relevance and hopefully vote until the voter gets exposed to the realities of white master and spanner boy. Let us remind this House that we are still three days to go in wrapping up the Women’s Month as a constant reminder that our past is interwoven in our present and our present is an indicator of our future.

Let me further share with the House that today, hon Speaker, we will rethink this matter of issues of women, as this Parliament which has committed to the

plight of women in the province and also in the Parliament. We all know that the novel Coronavirus is a global pandemic that has stretched our thinking beyond the usual ideological sentimentalism either to the extreme left or right for short-phrasing and holding on to ideological rhetoric in order to remain relevant to their constituencies and sponsors. The reality is that the COVID-19 pandemic has destroyed lives and livelihoods globally. It has weakened economic growth and investment and reduced commodity prices. It has changed the way we do things and needs a rethink on how we conduct business moving forward.

As we say this, Speaker, the debate is not on whether South Africa should have applied the measures as it did or to a lesser extent to protect livelihoods, at this point where most of us have been affected by this virus we are asking whether we could have even done more to protect our citizens by controlling the spread in the initial phases.

With hindsight now we all can speculate of what could have constituted a proper response to the pandemic. The COVID-19 pandemic exposed and further widened the inequalities in society and economy, a persistent feature since the apartheid colonialism era. What is draconian, is the DA's attempt to maintain the status quo, whilst opportunities continue to favour a certain race and gender, whilst our colour-conscience poverty and unemployment continues to hit black majority and Africans in particular, whilst others are happy to play into the gallery regarding this matter.

I want to laud the ANC Government efforts to build a post-COVID-19 South African economy based on the principles of inclusive, resilient, and sustainable growth. We still call on the Premier [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: What ANC Government?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Yes, hon Deputy Speaker? We still call on the Premier and the MEC of Finance to account to this House on the hotspot strategy, and the extent to which this strategy has actually changed the situation in those declared communities. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and I want to thank every speaker for their contribution. Albeit misconstrued facts, fake news, and misinformation, we cannot leave any stone unturned when it comes to providing hope and restoring dignity at the same time.

Hon member Nkondlo, let me first correct you, it is not an ANC debate, it is a DA debate. I literally put the debate – it is literally on the Order Paper; it is my name, so it is not the ANC debate, and you keep talking about the economy and us, the ANC, a post-COVID economy, respond COVID plan,

and your other member, hon member Mvimbi, also talked about the Economic Transformation Committee of the ANC. That must be the most useless committee in the country, because the only thing they come up with is how to bail out State-owned enterprises.

There is nothing coherent the ANC transformation has come up with before COVID-19 and currently COVID-19. So I do not know what you are going to get from them in a few months' time, because the only thing I think they can come up with is another policy on corruption, and hon member Marais, you hit it right on the head.

If the hon members did not listen last week, the last few days SARS announced a R70 billion reduction in tax income.

So hon member Nkondlo and hon member Mvimbi talks about rebuilding an economy; what are they talking about? The economy is in tatters. There is no economy to be rebuilt without rethinking things, and the ANC is incapable of doing it. That is the reality. I do not know which planet they are living on. Three million people estimated who have lost their jobs, and hon member Nkondlo is quoting FEDUSA.

Slide number 2, hon member Nkondlo, slide number 2 of FEDUSA's presentation yesterday, slide number 2, and I am going to quote:

“On top of already...”

Well, that is my adding, sorry.

“...show the job losses forecasted as per National Treasury,
7 million.”

Seven million jobs going to be lost, forecasted by National Treasury, under the ANC that introduced draconian legislation during a lockdown. The pandemic did not kill us, it is the ANC. The pandemic did not introduce legislation that said, “Today you can buy an open-toe shoe; tomorrow you can buy cooked chicken.” It is the ANC. The pandemic did not say, “Shut down, open the wine industry, but close the transporting of alcohol.” It is the ANC.

So it is not the pandemic that we are blaming, we are blaming the ANC, because it is the ANC that introduced draconian legislation that made 3 million people unemployed, and I hope one day you will understand it, because at this point it seems the few members who contributed to this debate still do not get it. We are in a crisis. †Ons is in diep. [We are in deep.] I do not know if you get it. We are in deep “ish”.

R70 billion lost taxes. There is no way to recover that in the next three months. So that Economic Transformation Committee that you are hoping on, you should rather believe in the tooth fairy, you stand a better chance of getting something out of that.

And hon member Christians, you are absolutely right. Who is the President? No one knows who the President is. No decision is coming. Today it is him; tomorrow the Prime Minister *de facto* come up with something else. We have no idea who is running [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is only you.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...the Union Buildings. Hon members, the [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Yes?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you could just wait one minute. Hon member Sayed, have you got a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, hon Deputy Speaker, I have got a point order. Hon member Mackenzie, can he please be advised to speak through you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Sayed. Hon member Mackenzie, if you can please speak through me.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: [Laughs.] Thank you, hon members. Hon members,

small businesses are the livelihood of the Western Cape and we have to applaud Mr David Maynier and the Premier, earlier on they launched the revived tourism and hospitality industry, and we should all support the We Are Open economy. It feeds into many businesses and many opportunities.

We also call along as the DA, as the Minister says, we need a cheaper Energy Bill right now. The members asked what the DA put on the table, the DA is the only one that actually understands the regulations are killing the economy, are killing jobs, because that Corruption Committee called the Economic Transformation Committee, is going to come up with another policy on how to steal more.

Hon members, under the DA we want to bring you freedom of darkness; we want to bring down the cost of electricity, because that will reduce economic hardship, and we also want to introduce new renewable sources of energy. We need to grab every opportunity to provide the relief for small businesses during this difficult time.

I trust that the Western Cape Government continues to remove red tape to make it easier for businesses to operate, along with support; every sector to reopen safely.

Over the last 10 years the Western Cape has been synonymous with innovation. We need to be innovative and work with the private sector, the [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up, hon member.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...the citizenry, to stem the job pandemic.

I just want to tell all hon members, let us get to work, let us save jobs, let us save lives, and let us save our economy by working together. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...hon member. That concludes the debate on this subject. Hon members [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...we now proceed to Interpellations [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: This is [Inaudible.] the blue [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...as printed on the Question Paper. I now recognise hon Minister Schäfer.

INTERPELLATIONS

Schools: infrastructure challenges

1. The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC) asked the Minister of Education:

Whether the infrastructure challenges faced by many schools with prefabricated structures have been brought to her attention; if so, (a) what are the relevant details and (b) how does she plan to address them?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and to hon member Sayed for the interpellation. Yes, I am aware of the infrastructure challenges of many of our schools with prefabricated structures.

In 2009 when the DA took over the Western Cape Government, it was soon apparent that there had not been sufficient investment by the previous ANC administration in the upgrading and maintenance of the schools. [Interjections.]

We had inherited a backlog of hundreds of schools that were still built with inappropriate materials; [Interjections.] dating back to the apartheid era, that evidently needed a maintenance upgrade or replacement entirely with a new structure.

The track record of the previous ANC administration in tackling the three issues of maintenance, replacement, and new schools, had been poor, to say the least. It then became the responsibility of the DA Government to tackle these backlogs; a challenge we took head-on. We began to prioritise spending on all three areas and the difference between the two administrations is staggering.

The ANC administration had done little to address this issue in the five years that the ANC was running education in this province, only three of these schools were replaced. In stark contrast, since 2009 the DA administration has replaced 61 schools.

We fully realise that a lot more needs to be done in this province to improve school infrastructure in the Western Cape. However, I shudder to think what the situation would have looked like now had the ANC remained in government in this province. One need only look to the Eastern Cape and their education facilities for an indication of what we could have become.

The Western Cape Education Department currently has a list of 141 schools that have various categories of prefabricated facilities. We have been systematically addressing the replacement of schools built with inappropriate materials, but budget remains a huge challenge and is getting worse every year. Thirteen of these schools are currently under construction; therefore 128 schools still need to be addressed.

Some schools are entirely built with prefabricated materials, whilst others have a few sections with prefabricated facilities. The enrolment figure at these schools varies. The challenges faced by many of these schools can be attributed to various factors; one of which is the age of the infrastructure, as most of these facilities are between 30 and 40 years old. The general condition of the infrastructure is poor, despite continuous maintenance over the years, and the type of material used in the construction of these schools, for example wood or asbestos, could present health and safety risks to staff and learners.

The strategy to address these schools incorporates the following:

- First of all, schools are divided into three different categories:
 1. The first category is schools that present a high health and safety risk to learners and teachers. These are schools that are in a very bad condition and may have materials that are harmful to the school community.
 2. The second is schools with a medium risk, which have components that contain asbestos and other harmful materials.
 3. And the third is schools with a low health and safety risk.

We have various options available to us:

- Either replacement of the entire school;

- Refurbishment of inappropriate structures;
- Replacement of inappropriate structures;
- Replacement or refurbishments in phases to allow for uninterrupted schooling;
- Placement of learners at alternative schools; or
- To consider possible merges or closure of non-viable schools.

The strategy will take into consideration the following factors:

1. The enrolment at the school;
2. The general condition of the school;
3. The availability of alternative education opportunities in the area; and
4. Opportunities to address the intervention in phases.

Thank hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I see the MEC speaking about Budget cuts – but this is the same Department that for a long period of time has not been spending all its money. It sends money back to the Provincial Reserves; we have seen that.

A careful observation, hon Deputy Speaker, of the infrastructure development

in the Western Cape, especially where building of new schools is concerned, will show a deliberate move, as has been confirmed now by the MEC, by the Provincial Government, to erect prefab structures as opposed to construction of brick and mortar schools.

The same can be said about the renovation of schools that are falling apart. The WCED either lets infrastructure fall apart and closes down the school, like we saw, for example, with Uitzicht High; or they erect prefab structures, or replace the parts of the schools that are not safe to use.

In areas where communities demanded new schools, such as Lwandle, for example, the Department responded by giving them prefab schools. As the ANC [Interjections.] in this Legislature, we have taken up the matter with the MEC on a number of occasions, and she consistently defends her Department and herself by saying that prefabs were not less of schools, they are expensive to erect and are safe for learners, and all of this. What we have noticed is that they are not safe. The recent storms in the Western Cape have proved the WCED shortcuts are not sustainable, and that they are costly and they are unsafe for learners and teachers. The storms that hit the province on 12 July have shown that, for example, in Nomzamo.

The MEC should tell us what is the extent of damage caused to the school in Nomzamo, and how much will it cost for that to be fixed?

Furthermore, the asbestos prefab buildings we have noticed, like in the

Southern Suburbs; many schools there that we visited, those prefab buildings pose major health risks to learners and to teachers, including cancer risks. In some instances, I must add, we even find that in terms of prefab schools, certain Model C schools, or let me say former Model C schools, are advantaged, because those prefab classrooms have got air-conditioners.

Our demands as the ANC are clear. The WCED must stop these shortcuts and build actual schools. Stop making excuses; renovate schools and stop glossing over problems through prefabs.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed, are you still there? Hon member Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, I am done.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Oh, you are done? Okay.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry, I did not get, I did not get the end there, my apologies. Hon member Botha, you are up next.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. God forbid if any learner got hurt at Uitzicht; the ANC would have sung another tune.

During the last Standing Committee meeting on Education, the SG mentioned that although schools can apply for a lower Quintile score, it comes at the cost of another school. Minister, this implies that funds are truly stretched in the Western Cape. Along with this, according to the DG of the Department of Basic Education, certain provinces are challenged with underspending regarding the accelerated infrastructure delivery initiative.

Are these remarks relevant to the Western Cape? If necessary, what are the proactive measures taken by the Provincial Education Department in this regard? Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Botha. I now recognise hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, just the question to the Minister, that the Minister said we had 141 schools, prefab schools, and that they have three categories: high, medium, and low.

Can the Minister tell us if those 13 schools under construction, are they in the high category, meaning they are a health and safety risk?

Another question is, schools that were demolished, were there prefabricated schools built in that place and why? Why was it done that way? We know that budget is a problem, but I think we need to move away from prefab and get

00brick buildings for our children.

In closing, just another question, are those schools that are a safety or a health risk, are there still learners occupying those schools? And the Minister must be very careful, because when she closes schools, she has got to get it from various political parties. So that is the last thing to do. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians. Hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, following – firstly let me also state, because we heard also the reply of the Minister. Let me state that, and let me remind the MEC, that the replacement of schools was funded by National Government, not from the Provincial Budget.

Following the Nomzamo High incident, a group of high school learners from Nomzamo and from various other schools, picketed outside WCED's Metro East District's offices in Kuils River, to actually demand that temporary structures and prefabricated classrooms must be replaced with brick classrooms.

The severe storms overturned and destroyed most of the classrooms and the toilets at these schools. The damage caused learners to miss out on the valuable learning and teaching hours, as the school remained closed as

repairs were taking place. Learners, hon Deputy Speaker, were forced to use social media to complete schoolwork while they waited for repairs to be effected.

The WCED's shortcuts, which I stated before, are failing our poor learners from the Western Cape. Instead of listening to calls to end these shortcuts, the MEC and her Department moved to replace the damaged structures with new ones.

The WCED is on record, stating that it cannot build a brick and mortar school as the school is on leased land. This cannot be the fault of learners. The WCED must accelerate the process to build a proper school for both primary and high school learners in Nomzamo as well as Mfuleni.

The norms and standards for South African schools infrastructure had clear deadlines on when schools built with improper material such as zinc and containers, should be eradicated. As far as I am aware, prefab structures fall into this category. We cannot have a department that continues to use improper material when the country needs to move towards eradicating schools built with improper infrastructure.

We therefore need the Department to give us an actual date, in fact we must hear from the MEC, an actual date as to when prefab schools in this province will be replaced with proper infrastructure. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Sayed. I recognise hon Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, and to the hon members. Firstly, I will address hon member Botha.

You are quite right, if somebody had been injured at Uitzicht, we would have heard all about it from a different angle, but on the issue of our Budget being stretched. You are completely right, it is extremely stretched. We have been saying so for quite some time.

But on the [Inaudible.] projects; when it was launched in 2011, Western Cape did not actually initially receive any allocation for addressing the school backlogs from this national project, despite all the inherited prefabricated schools from the previous administration that we had inherited, and we eventually did manage to get some schools on, from that project, after we had made some appeals to National Government, and we duly completed these 25 schools with [Inaudible.] funding by 2016, but we only received that once-off allocation, and since then we have not receive any more [Inaudible.] funding from the National Government, and it is extremely disappointing to hear that the DBE is now complaining that the funds are not being spent by the other provinces, which we certainly could use effectively here, and perhaps my colleagues from the ANC on the other side of the House might be able to assist us in that, but I will also still continue to engage the National Minister. I did in fact raise it at [Inaudible.] last week.

So, it is an extreme concern, and we could certainly use the money.

Hon member Christians, I have to assume that the 13 schools in construction – I do not have the details with me now, but that they will be in high risk categories, because that is the criteria that we use to decide which schools we are going to replace.

Schools that are demolished; we only usually demolish schools if they are in extremely bad condition, and it depends on which school it is and what the situation is; whether they are replaced by brick schools, but often what we do is, when we are building a new school, we put a mobile school up first while we are busy replacing an existing school; demolish the old school, and then they move in from the mobiles into the new school.

Health risks, I sincerely hope not. I mean there is a bit of myth regarding asbestos; that asbestos *per se* is a health risk. It is only a health risk, according to my information, if it is damaged, and if so, then we normally, as far as my understanding goes, cordon that section off until it is fixed, and then we put specific measures in place to ensure that risks are mitigated; that of damage to people.

Hon member Sayed, we send money back to Provincial Treasury because there is a limitation in place that does not allow us to spend more on our cost of employment, and as a result of that, as I have explained on previous occasions many times, we cannot always get an exact, on-the-dot expenditure

when we have a salary bill of over R1 billion a month, but the House can change that decision if they wish.

Then prefab structures we have also dealt with before, especially the Nomzamo issue. Hon member Sayed complains about the learners having to miss out on valuable teaching and learning time.

As I explained on a previous question, I think last week, it took us exactly one week to fix that mobile school, and that is an unprecedented achievement in conjunction with the Department of Public Works. It was certainly also not the only school to suffer storm damage. There were a number of brick and mortar schools that were also damaged during that same storm, as it was an extremely significant storm.

So mobile schools and classrooms obviously are an excellent option for creating additional space for learners, as the ANC well knows, because they employed exactly the same option when they were in government, and I do want to quote a few quotes on that issue.

One of them is as follows:

“We face a massive infrastructure challenge in the province in regard to the building of new schools, as well as maintaining our existing facilities. It is hoped that the bid to National Treasury, arising out of the National Audit of School Needs, will result in

increased funding to meet some of these challenges.”

And that was Mr Cameron Dugmore in June 2007.

“In addition, to address the mismatch between the supply and demand for classrooms, the Department will use such measures as merging schools, proper use of bus transport, building additional classrooms, and using mobile classrooms.”

Cameron Dugmore in November 2004. And then another is:

“We are looking at all possible ways of addressing the need for new classrooms from expanding existing schools and building new schools, to erecting prefabricated classrooms and using mobile classrooms.”

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...Andrè Gaum, 2003. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. That concludes the first interpellation. We now move over to Interpellation 2.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear, Minister.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I recognise the hon Minister Bredell.

Municipalities: deliveries of food parcels

2. Ms N Makamba-Botya asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

(a) What intervention has his Department implemented to make sure that municipalities deliver food parcels effectively and speedily to people in need and (b) what mechanisms are in place to make sure that councillors do not abuse such relief efforts?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you the hon member for the interpellation.

To support the municipalities in humanitarian relief, my Department implemented various monetary, practical, and institutional interventions to ensure food parcels are delivered effectively to citizens.

On the financial interventions; my Department transferred a grant of R16,2 million to the municipalities for immediate emergency humanitarian relief initiatives, as provided by the Western Cape Cabinet.

The conceptualisation of this grant took into consideration that my Department's support would seek to speedily reach citizens that traditionally would not meet the means test, the criteria utilised by the Department of Social Development, as well as South Africa Social Security Agency food provisions programmes.

On Government interventions; my Department, with the support of the Centre for e-Innovation, developed a real-time digital, electronic capturing application. Each local municipality was given access to capture food parcels and meal distribution done through the grants at ward and town level. This application thus serves as real-time digital reporting mechanisms to be utilised by municipalities to report on the food provision activities undertaken with three sources of funding, namely the grant funding, the municipal funding, and donor funding.

On the humanitarian resources; my Department in cooperation with the Department of Social Development dedicated a team of senior officials to manage and to support municipalities to speed up the process of applications, verifications, and delivery of the food.

On institutional interventions; my Department facilitated the participation of local and district municipal officials at all provincial structures and workstreams dealing with food security, either through the joint district approach representatives, or the District Disaster Management Centre.

My position on corruption and political meddling in administration processes is well-known to this House. As indicated above, my Department, with the support of the Centre of e-Innovation, developed a real-time electronic capturing application, which allowed each local municipality access to capture food parcels and meals that is being done through the grant at ward and town level, to support the district and specifically the district coordinating forum in monitoring and coordinating the efforts. Access has been created for each district municipality to view their own district's dashboard.

In my various engagements with all our Executive Mayors, I emphasised the fact that abuse or meddling in food relief efforts would not be tolerated. When rumours about possible interference surfaced, I formally wrote to all Executive Mayors, reminding them of the potential consequences of such actions. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Bredell. I recognise hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you to the Minister.

During the COVID-19 Ad Hoc Oversight Committee early this year, on 13 May 2020, your Head of Department, Graham Paulse, confirmed in that meeting that councillors in the Western Cape municipalities are not allowed

to distribute food parcels. He further reiterated that this [Inaudible.] and stance was [Inaudible.] to the Speakers of different municipalities in the province.

Now according to the latest Adjusted Estimate of Provincial Revenue and Expenditure, your Department allocated R16,2 million as assistance and support to municipalities with their humanitarian relief initiative.

Now taking into account this Budget allocation to municipalities and your office's stance that no councillor will distribute food parcels, one would expect your office to be true to its oversight role and monitor how municipalities assist society with regards to humanitarian relief, such as food parcels, and more importantly, monitor how such efforts are executed so that this aid reaches the poorest of the poor people.

Moreover, in cases where there is a slightest complaint on the misuse of this humanitarian relief aid, it is expected of your office to take initiative and address the matter by taking appropriate action in the circumstances.

Food relief is a constitutional right covered in Section 27 of our Constitution, for the benefit of our poor people; more especially during the pandemic where many lost their jobs and sources of income. The Constitution then makes it your duty to take reasonable legislative and other measures to achieve the progressive realisation of this right.

Hon Minister, I would like to place in it on record that no matter how much money you budget for this humanitarian effort, if the food relief aid does not reach it's intended target, then your Government is not only in breach of the South African Constitution, but it is a failed government.

Now how is it that after promising this House that no councillor will distribute food parcels in the province, then around 11 August, we still had residents of Kuyasa in Khayelitsha, Ward 99, protesting and complaining of a ward councillor seen to be distributing food parcels to his friends, whereas residents were starving? I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise hon member America.

Mr D AMERICA: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you there, hon member America?

Mr D AMERICA: [No audible response.]

Mr P J MARAIS: On his way to the States.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am going to move on to hon member Smith. Can we just check that hon member America is connected, please? Over to you, hon member Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, it is not the first time that this subject matter comes up for discussion in the House.

The Local Government was at the coalface of Government response to the COVID-19 pandemic; billions were transferred to municipalities to coordinate a response, be it to accelerate service delivery of basic services, procurement of PPE's, or distribution of food parcels to vulnerable households.

There are a lot of challenges that were raised in municipalities in the Western Cape, be it of allegations of corruption or councillors that have been seen going against directives of distributing food parcels.

A few examples are DA councillors that were seen distributing food parcels in party regalia on Mandela Day, and Mayor Dan Plato who was seen distributing food parcels in other municipalities. Yet there is no action whatsoever taken to investigate these cases. That clearly showed an abuse of the process.

What is clear is that there is no mechanism to prevent these malpractices. The only thing the MEC is good at is targeting municipalities that are not controlled by the DA, and turn a blind eye on those who are actually controlled by the DA.

This discussion must be taken to the Standing Committee, where it will

receive maximum attention. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Smith. Is hon member America online?

Mr D AMERICA: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Last call, hon member America?

Mr D AMERICA: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, I have got to move [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): In the chat it says he is connected, and he seems to have a problem with his microphone.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, I will then move over to the EFF, hon Chief Whip, and see if he takes the second last slot. If somebody could dial him in that would help.

So, while hon member Makamba-Botya speaks, if we could just dial hon

member America in. Over to you, hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Minister, following the very same stance by your office, that councillors are not allowed to distribute food parcels, around 19 May there were complaints in the City of Cape Town made against Mayor Dan Plato for violating your Provincial Government's directive, prohibiting the distribution of food aid by the councillors. This was after the Mayor was alleged to have been pictured in Strand outside a home, with a group of people and food parcels, to which the Mayor defended himself by saying that the City's humanitarian efforts are compliant with the spirit of national and provincial guidelines. I am not sure which spirit he was referring to, by the way, but he makes no mention of your directive.

Now firstly, was the complaint regarding the conduct of the Mayor in this regard ever brought, been brought to your attention? If so, what steps did you take thereafter?

And secondly, what steps would your Department ordinarily take against councillors and mayors who defy directives from your Department? Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Makamba-Botha. Hon member America? Let me just see if they have dialled him in.

Mr D AMERICA: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip, is he connecting?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): He is on the line, and it says that his microphone is on, but for whatever reason we cannot hear him.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. I am going to give it a few more seconds. Hon member America, are you on?

Mr D AMERICA: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think I am going to have to move on, my apologies, hon member America.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip. Over to you, hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you very much, and thank you again to the hon Makamba-Botya for putting this interpellation on the table.

The guideline is we must just distinguish between the money, Government money, and then obviously private money and private donations.

So, all the complaints had been received. We must also remember, hon member, that the Code of Conduct for councillors, the custodian of that are the Speakers, and it must go through that process.

So, there are various investigations. If I had known that it is specifically about the Mayor, I would have asked the Speaker's office to tell me exactly where they are within that investigation and that process. Our guideline that we send out, we send it out specifically to do with our R16,2 million; it is taxpayers' money, and we [Inaudible.] that it is very important that we do have the interaction with our councillors on not being involved with the distribution of the money.

The hon member Smith, I really want hon member Smith to become party to anti-corruption within this province. I am, and I was always more strict with any DA councillor than an ANC-run councillor. It is not about politicking, it is about clean, good governance, and when there are whistle-blowers and people that are coming to the front, we need to and we must investigate, and we must protect them.

The councillors he had referred to are not even my investigation, it is the President's investigation.

So the SIU has walked into the Council and they will find out what is going on within that Council, and we all need to back the SIU, because I think they need to be impartial and I think they need to do their job, because it is the only way we are going to get rid of corruption within.

I will always talk to our councils and ask them not to be involved in any kind of relief, and politicise any kind of relief to our people. It is to help and to assist the poorest of the poor, and I think it sends out a completely wrong message if we try to politicise any kind of relief to our poor people, and therefore I have also even asked our politicians not even to take photos of people who are receiving a food parcel or anything, because it is already undignifying being poor, and now we just contribute towards that.

So, I am being sensitive towards this topic, but thank you very much, and we will follow up with our councillors and the Speakers' offices on the disciplinary actions within. Thank you very much.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: When you [Inaudible.] you must declare.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...hon Minister.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] ANC.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. That brings us to the end of Interpellations. We will now in terms of Rule 202 move over to Questions for Oral Reply, and if I can just remind the hon members that there are four opportunities for follow-ups, and that the first question will be reserved for the opportunity of the hon member who posed the question.

I now recognise the hon the Premier.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Provincially-owned land: human settlements

1. Mr C M Dugmore asked the Premier:

Whether the Province has developed a plan to utilise all provincially-owned land and buildings for human settlements; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you very much to the hon Leader of the Opposition for the question, and obviously this question was probably put in at the same time as the one for last week, because there is a fair amount of similarity between the two questions.

But first of all, if I read the question it says:

“Whether the Province has developed a plan to utilise all provincially-owned land and buildings for human settlements.”

Now the straight answer is “no”, and if we go back to last week’s question where you asked the question about what is the current policy of the Provincial Government towards the management of the Provincial Property Portfolio, and of course there it was, the second part of the question was around what does the Department of Public Works and Transport do, and I pointed out that of course there are two separate custodians: the main custodian being the Department of Public Works and Transport, but of course they do make allocations to the Human Settlements Department, who then focuses on what the hon member is asking.

But also I want to point out that all provincially-owned land and buildings for human settlements, the reason I say “no”, is because of course all provincially-owned land and buildings include hospitals, it includes schools, it includes this very building that we are in right now, it includes your own office as an hon member.

So of course it goes far wider than just being available for human settlements, and before I get to the answer, because obviously I need to consult with the Department of Human Settlements as that is the key part of the question, it reminded me, when I looked at the other utilisation of

properties, like this very one that we are in right now, I cast my mind back to just over a year, and a debate in this House where, as hon member, you spoke about the utilisation of school properties, and you were going to bring to me the governing body go-ahead to do a housing development partnership between our Government and probably private sector and that school governing body, for an ability to find homes on a school piece of property for teachers specifically, but also probably for people in that vicinity, and in doing so also creating a safety buffer around a school, because many of our schools that have extra land are also subjected to all sorts of criminal activity on those open pieces of land, specifically putting our learners at risk, and of course I would welcome that, as I said, and still looking forward to that plan from you.

But the answer that I must give you, is yes, the Department of Human Settlements has developed plans to utilise all provincially-owned land in its custodianship, and, for example, to date the Department, and obviously in the last year of this term, has pockets of land measuring 344,6 hectares in extent for human settlements, as part of catalytic programmes, and these programmes are endorsed by national, provincial, and local governments.

This 344,6 hectares has a yield of about 15,300 opportunities, or housing opportunities, and of course as you know, these housing opportunities can be in the form of BNG housing, people who earn less than R3,500 a month; FLISP housing, R3,501 to R22,000 a month; and of course even linking to other social activities that could be linked through on these properties, and to

date there are about 2,000 in this time that have already been made available and transferred.

And so there my answer. Thanks to the hon member.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Premier. Hon member Dugmore, would like you a follow-up question?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, arising from the response of the Premier it is very clear that this Province does not actually have a comprehensive, consolidated plan to utilise provincial buildings that are vacant, and land for human settlements.

I would like to ask the Premier, is he prepared to make public the exact pieces of land owned by the Province, and of those pieces of land that will be specifically made available for housing. We have been asking for 10 years in this Provincial Legislature for such a plan, and once again the Premier has failed to do that, and I would like to ask whether that is not contributing to the frustration which people in our province have in regard to having access to land for human settlements, and to reverse apartheid spatial planning.

So, I would like to ask the Premier, will he make a clear publication of all these properties available, and identify those that will be used for human settlements.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Dugmore. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, and thank you very much to the hon member for that challenge, and my answer is going to be yes, but I will do so once your National Government does exactly the same thing on national public land and buildings in this region.

The second thing is I really would value your help in two buildings specifically, which we really would like to get going for human settlement. The one being the Woodstock Hospital and the other one being the Helen Bowden property. There are many, many people who are waiting for specifically inner-city development and opportunity, and of course we need help to actually get these properties available to the development of and creation of those opportunities.

So, if you help and guarantee you can help with that, then of course I will help you with making that list available.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Premier. Are there any follow-up questions? I do not see any hands raised. There, hon member Marais, over to you.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I am very concerned by that question which is asked by my good friend hon member Cameron Dugmore. Why does he want to know the properties? Will he give the list to

future land invaders, based on the Court's decision against the City of Cape Town? I am very concerned that land invasion is becoming part of EFF and ANC policy.

Now they want to know which land is State land so that tomorrow we can wake up and find out, hon Premier, are you serious about making that land, that properties available, the list, to land invaders?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marais. Hon Premier?

An HON MEMBER: Is that a question to the Premier?

Mr P J MARAIS: That is a question to the Premier.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marais.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. It sounded more like a question to the hon Leader of the Opposition, but exactly, that is the point. The point is – and that is why I reversed the challenge to say well let us see what National Public Works does and telling us which buildings are available across this province, because exactly that is the risk right now in the system, and we need to make sure that the hon member Dugmore is not using this opportunity for specifically that purpose; to invade these pieces of property where we actually are trying to find opportunities for people and citizens in this province.

And it is really, really upsetting that we have to spend so much money in this province trying to protect these properties from the illegal occupations, and of course even these properties that have got fully fledged plans for creating opportunities specifically in inner-city or inner-town developments, like the two that I have just mentioned, and it is really sad that we cannot get this going quickly and get this going in the interest of the citizens of our province.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon member Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. What I would like to know from the Premier is that noting his response in terms of the question from hon member Dugmore, whether the Province is prepared to shy away from its stance of selling private land to private individuals, and then rather use them for development for affordable housing purposes in the province?

Let us not concentrate on what hon member Marais is saying. I do not think it is going to take us anywhere, because our people need land.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, and to the hon member, I am going to say no, because we have to analyse every single piece of property. Not every piece of property is going to only be used for human settlements. Some need to be used for schools; some need to be used for healthcare; some need to be

used for any of the departmental needs, and of course some can be used for human settlements.

And so we have to apply our minds to all of those pieces of property, and then once we have done that, some pieces of property could be sold to fund twice as many opportunities as would be given on that specific property.

So, we also have to apply our minds and apply economics at the same time, because we also know that our budgets are being slashed at the moment, because of bad policy and ANC government at a national level. Our income is going to really be deteriorating over the next few years. We have got to try and get as much opportunity for the citizens as possible, and of course we also see the demand climbing. The demand is also climbing because people are leaving failed ANC provinces to come here to look for opportunity.

So we need to be able to apply our minds, and in some cases we will apply our minds where a piece of property might not be needed for a school or a hospital, or some other Government use, and we might sell that property and take those funds, and provide two and three and four times the opportunity when it comes to human settlements.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, and the final cherry goes to hon member Lili. Hon member Marais, if you can just lower your hand, please.

Mr A LILI: No, no, no, I – thanks, hon Deputy Speaker.

No, hon Deputy Speaker, my question to the hon Premier is that why are we not the members of the Provincial Legislature? Why as and when he has to account on matters he, and he would refer us to national, as if we are a National Parliament? Why he is failing to account on matters pertaining to the issues of the Western Cape, instead of referring us to National Government, which we are not part of.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC WORKS AND TRANSPORT: That is a new question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier, you may answer.

The PREMIER: I have been listening to that question. I mean, it is one of those questions that are very difficult to answer, because I have got no idea which specific department, what it is for, but what I can tell you is that there is massive failure from every department at a national level [Interjection.], and that is probably why many times we have to refer to these departments, because they hinder any kind of growth opportunity in our country. They hinder opportunities for our citizens.

If we just take the last 10 years. Our citizens are poorer because of national departments, national policy, ANC policy, and absolute ANC failure, and that has put so such pressure [Interjections.] on us as an effective government,

that is able to deliver on behalf of its citizens, but jeepers, we have a hard time from national, and of course we have got to refer to this failure at national level often, because it is massive, and that is why we refer to it, hon member Lili, and thank you very much for bringing it up.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Sorry, hon member Herron, we have exhausted all floor opportunities; if you could just lower your hand, and please can I ask that you mute your microphones, there is some feedback in the back.

We now move over to Question 2. I recognise hon Minister Madikizela.

CTICC Hospital of Hope

2. Ms N D Nkondlo asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

(1) How much is the Provincial Government paying for the rental of the CTICC for the Hospital of Hope;

(2) whether such cost is justifiable; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you to hon member Nkondlo for the question. The Western Cape Government did not pay for rental of the CTICC. It was a 100% discount of the rental of the CTICC.

However, there was a charge for the operating cost of the facility. These costs are deemed to be justifiable as they were calculated more on a cost recovery as opposed to a profit basis.

The charge for the operating cost was R36,2 million, and included the following:

- Staff cost of CTICC for running the facility while being used as a hospital;
- Waste management;
- Cleaning consumables;
- Electricity consumption;
- Water consumption;
- Lift and escalator maintenance;
- Generator maintenance;
- Pest control;
- Plumbing maintenance;
- Safety cost relating to fire services;
- CCTV cameras, etcetera;
- Hire of parking bays at a 50% discounted rate;
- Laundry costs;
- Decontamination cost post occupation;
- Build up cost and break down cost;
- Catering for patients.

It must also be noted that this amount does not include the cost incurred by the Department of Health for oxygen installation, beds, IT, etcetera, as they were all separate contracts; work done through Department of Health contracts already in place. That is the answer to your question. Through you, hon Deputy Speaker, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Madikizela. Hon member Nkondlo, do you want a follow-up question?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Okay. Hon Deputy Speaker, the R32,6 million that the Minister is referring to as operational costs, if the Minister can just indicate, because I understand, and he can confirm, that the facility has now been closed, so this is the R32,6 million that has been paid from the start, which is around July, when the facility was up and running, to now, which is almost a month of this facility. Is that the case?

And further than that, how many – because my question around whether it is justifiable, is trying to understand the cost benefit, that the cost that we had to incur, which is the R32,6 million at this point - how many patients to date were serviced in this particular hospital? Just to understand that particular cost benefit.

So, I am just trying to understand now two things. One is, at this point this facility is closed, so this R32,6 million is the cost of the period since it was opened, which is somewhere in July to now in August, and also how many patients did it service during this period?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister Madikizela?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you. On your first part of the question, hon member Nkondlo. The Cabinet took a decision that the hospital must be decommissioned as of 17 September.

So that is what is going to happen. I mean the updated figure in terms of the number of people that were assisted, I do not have it with me, hon Deputy Speaker, to hon member Nkondlo, but I can always furnish that information, because it is in the report that we are getting on regular basis from the Department of Health.

So, I can always give that information to the hon member, to clearly indicate how many patients went in and out from the first day when the CTICC was used, or the Hospital of Hope was used, up to the time when we planned to decommission it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Madikizela. I recognise hon member Wenger.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. On the issue of cost benefit for field hospitals, whether the Minister is aware that the NASREC Field Hospital in Gauteng is estimated at a running cost of R350 million, which is 10 times the cost of the CTICC Hospital of Hope, and whether there is any explanation for such vast discrepancies in the amounts and costs of field hospitals between provinces?

An HON MEMBER: Go Province.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Well, thank you, Chief Whip. Look, just give me an opportunity to respond to the question, because indeed, if you look at the R36,2 million, just to correct hon member Nkondlo, because I think there were discrepancies in terms of the figure; it is not R32,6, it is R36,2 million.

If you look at what the money was spent on, hon member Nkondlo, I can assure you that this is money well spent, and to hon member Wenger – well, I find the figure quite staggering, but maybe the Department of Public Works and Health in the Province of Gauteng can actually say in that particular province, give the breakdown as we did; what is that money for, but it sounds like a very high figure.

But in terms of the money that was spent by the Western Cape Government, I

can assure hon member Wenger that this is money well spent, if you look at what the money was spent on.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Madikizela. Hon member Sayed, I saw your hand go briefly up. Was that a question that you were waiting to ask?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, it was up by mistake, sorry.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No problem. Are there any other follow-up questions to this particular question? Hon member Nkondlo, over to you.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you for the response from the Minister and the correction of R36,2 million, and I would appreciate the information that he would follow with, regarding the patients serviced there.

Now what I want, I just wanted to check, considering that this happened during this emergency procurement or environment of decisions around sourcing such activities. Can I just understand from the Minister whether this was done through a deviation, or were there any other options that were considered when this particular project of the Hospital of Hope was considered, from a cost point of view, that led to the Cabinet rather opting for the option of the CTICC? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister Madikizela?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon member Nkondlo, if you remember when we were hit by this pandemic and we got the directive, by the way from the National Treasury, on the route that we need to follow to procure the services of the service provider; I can assure you that those directives are in line with the National Treasury provision.

And in instances, because we are dealing with emergency here, where services had to be procured, following of course the regulations when there is emergency, the Department did exactly that, but on everything that was done in terms of procurement, it was above board, and for your information again, hon member Nkondlo, this is one of the three field hospitals that the Auditor-General decided to focus on when she decided to audit specific areas during the COVID-19.

In our case, as a Department, this is one of the areas that the AG focused on, and she did find that everything was above board in terms of how the services were procured. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Madikizela. Any last opportunity for a question? If not – hon member Nkondlo, if you can just lower your hand – we will move then over to Question 3.

Hon member Marais, is that a question regard Question 2?

Mr P J MARAIS: Yes [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may ask, you may ask. Go ahead.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you. Hon Premier, in view of our experience we have now gained with the advent of COVID-19, are you considering making this – Minister, sorry – a special feature of future plans, Minister of Health, to be in a better state of preparedness should any new pandemic strike us? Or are we going back to where we were in our readiness programme, prior to the COVID-19? Do you have plans now, have you learned anything, and what have you learned during this COVID pandemic that you want to make provision for in your future plans?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you member Marais for the question. In fact, this is one of the issues that we discussed at the Cabinet meeting, as to whether the manner in which we moved with speed to procure the services during this pandemic should not be a norm. And the reality is that it cannot be the norm because when you are faced with a pandemic you follow a completely different route to procure services.

Under normal circumstances you cannot. I think what we can do, which is

what we are looking at, is to see whether some of the facilities that we used cannot be retained so that we can use them in addition to our infrastructure capacity.

One of those for example is the Brackengate facility and that is a discussion that we are having: to what extent we can keep some of the facilities that we used for this emergency, so that we can add them in, in our infrastructure portfolio. But of course, it would be unrealistic hon Deputy Speaker, to suddenly think that what was achieved during the emergency, when we were using the Disaster Management Act, can be achieved under normal circumstances.

Obviously, certain lessons have been learned. Just to give an example if you look at our road infrastructure and the congestion on our roads before Covid, and now, we have learned that some of the people really can be productive working from home and there is no need for all of us to be on the roads and going to offices. People who must go to offices are those people who are not able do their work from home. So these are some of the lessons, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. We move over to Question 3. I recognise hon Minister Fritz.

SAPS: Department assisting the efforts of

3. Mr M Kama asked the Minister of Community Safety:

(a) How has his Department assisted the work of the SAPS in fighting crime, especially at the stations in the top 30 murder precincts and (b) what are the plans to assist the efforts of the SAPS to decrease further the contact crimes, as reported in the 2019/20 crime statistics, in the province?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker and thank you to the hon Kama for asking this question. There are nine police precincts in the Western Cape in the list of the top 30 murder stations in the country but the province has identified 11 stations as its priority stations: Bishop Lavis; Delft; Gugulethu; Harare; Khayelitsha; Kraaifontein; Mfuleni; Mitchells Plain; Nyanga; Philippi East and in Hanover Park, part of Philippi.

These stations have historically contributed to the most murder cases in the province. The Department is in partnership with City of Cape Town and we fund the deployment of 500 learner law enforcement officers in line with the Provincial Safety Plan. These Leap officers are meant to be deployed in the priority areas identified by the City Plan to support SAPS and to support the Metro Police etc. Additionally, the Department accredits and trains Neighbourhood Watch structures in these areas and as part of the monitoring and oversight role of the Department we conduct annual inspections of police

stations in these areas and provide feedback to police management.

The Department implemented the Court Watching Brief Programme on murder cases coming from these areas. The Department is also collecting data and conducting research to track and monitor the violence in some of these areas and to provide feedback so that we can be part of an evidence-based approach.

The (b) part of the question, hon Deputy Speaker, the Department will continue to support the 500 Leap officials during the 2020/2021 year, and they will be deployed in the priority areas, as I mentioned above. Area-based teams will be established in partnership with the Province, which will work together with stakeholders across national, provincial and local government and will also involve civil society and I want to say there is some amazing work going on around the civil society part, there is just great, great work around violence prevention programmes.

The Department coordinates a Data Committee consisting of representatives from the Department of the Premier, the Department of Transport and Public Works, and the Department of Social Development in order to analyse data pertaining to these stations. The Department and the Province are working towards the data-led deployment of the Leap officials and SAPS in these areas.

The Department is also continuing with its current initiatives which include

working with religious organisations to provide holiday programmes to youth, also entering into agreements with the Neighbourhood Watches, specifically in the Covid hotspot areas, and there we have seen some amazing work emerging from that.

We also will, with monthly support, based on adherence to a set compliance, start innovative programmes with the Neighbourhood Watches in areas to assist us with regard to violence prevention programmes, facilitating the deployment of Chrysalis graduates in these areas, on the Extended Public Works Programme. I just want to say we have been getting requests from schools asking us to also see whether we cannot assist them with matriculants who are about to prepare for the final exam, just in terms of the safety aspects.

The Department determines the policing needs and priorities for the province on an annual basis, and a final report is submitted to the National SAPS to influence resource allocation to the Western Cape. And you know we are having a huge fight with National policing around the resource allocation on a constant basis. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Hon Kama, do you want a follow-up question?

Mr M KAMA: Yes, thank you and let me thank the MEC for the response. Hon Deputy Speaker, I expected to hear about all the Department collecting

data, the Department analysing this data, the Department submitting reports, the Department doing all these things, but what I want to know, hon Deputy Speaker, is like the recent crime statistics have shown in areas like Nyanga, that now Nyanga is no longer the number one murder capital, because of the efforts that we have seen, the stabilisation interventions that have been conducted by SAPS in Nyanga, the work that has been done by CPF in Nyanga.

Now what we want to understand is: what was the role of the Department in that operation, how has the Department assisted, for example, the CPF in the area, what are the interventions the Department has put in the areas, so that we can say what we are doing as a department to fight or to make this province safe, contributing to the fight?

I do not want to talk about the law enforcement officers because every time we are not told what are they doing but we see them in evictions in Khayelitsha, we see them in all these other illegal acts, we see them being paraded by Angus Mckenzie. So we want to know what is the Department doing in fighting crime as the police currently do it alone with the communities? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. That is an excellent question from the hon member because I think

the ANC and some of our members must get into their heads that we all work in a collaborative way, that we work not as this unit or that unit.

Most of our law enforcement agencies work under the command of the South African Police. They have an early morning operational strategic planning programme where they, before they go out, decide where and they look at the data. As member Kama pointed out, Nyanga is no longer the crime capital, it is now Khayelitsha. It just shifts somewhere else.

But the point I think we need to make, what we need to emphasise, is that all partners, all components of this machine must be in place and the CPFs must be in place and most of them are in place and contributing. The Neighbourhood Watches must be in place and they must contribute, and they must be accredited. All police formations must be in place.

It is only the political level where we have these little differences that we do not even understand it ourselves. We are always fighting about law enforcement viz-a-viz South African Police, viz-a-viz Metro Police. I want to emphasise that on the ground all those police officers work and defend each other. That is part of why Nyanga is no longer the murder capital.

We are trying to bring the same kind of approach, the same kind of emphasis on collaborative work, on working with everyone, on our relationships also at a provincial and national level and I want to say, I think we are really getting it done well in that regard.

It is also an all of government approach. It is not just DOCS, it is every other department, from the Premier's Department right through as I emphasised. And I think it is important to acknowledge and to realise that is an all of government and all of society approach and until we appreciate and work with the City, work with National, work with the Province, we are not going to get this crime down and I think that is an important point for the hon Kama to remember. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. I recognise hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. If the Minister can just tell us: we know that the Province has an oversight role. They do not have operational powers. How did his encounters, these meetings that he had with the Provincial Commissioner, how did that influence the deployment of SAPS, seeing that the Department has the data and they do the data analysis? How did that strengthen the movement of his Department with the role of SAPS and the same with the Leap officers, seeing that it is a partnership with the City, what communication does he have with the City in order to influence the analysis that they have? Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians, hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I think another good question, hon Christians. Thank you for that question because it is precisely because of

the approach and our discussions with the National Provincial Commissioner, General Matakata.

When we approached the hotspot strategy for Covid, it was necessary for us to also look at how policing is going to be influenced in an operational way in all the hotspot areas and I can tell you it was at a level with our discussions with the Provincial Commissioner Matakata, that that was given effect too because of our relationship and because she could understand the need for that, and in that command our Leap officers fell in, our other law enforcement officers, everyone fell into place.

Sometimes I get the impression that the hon – and I am saying it with respect, I am not attacking you hon Kama – sometimes thinks that in the City there are only 500 leap officers that we fund. They forget that before they even came onto the scene there were other law enforcement officers and there were other law enforcement agencies and other law enforcement contingents that always operated within the province and within our inner city specifically.

So I must emphasise, it was that continuous collaboration, even though we do not have operational command and control, which many of our members think we have, but we do not.

It was that cooperation with our Provincial Commissioner and it speaks to the great relationship that we have because we respect the hon General in charge, but it is that relationship that effected that all our people worked,

everywhere, in every hotspot area, as was requested from us, followed by the data because we had to get some of the stuff done. So, I thank you for the question. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Allen?

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you so much, hon Deputy Speaker. To the Minister: the quarterly crimes stats released recently pointed to a significant decrease in the number of crime categories and as you alluded that during this period the first 500 law enforcement officers were deployed in our hotspot areas, and I have no doubt that it contributed to these decreases, but what I would like to know from the Minister, according to the crime stats, how has crime decreased or changed in our priority areas? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, hon Allen for that question. The lockdown has contributed in a real way and it has played a significant role in the decrease of the murders and crime all round. So too, has the deployment of the additional 500 law enforcement officers through the Western Cape Government, funded by the Western Cape Government, who play an important role through our Western Cape Safety Plan and specifically in our 11 priority areas.

We have seen a decrease in almost all priority areas, and I wish to really

commend our Leap officers under the overall command of SAPS on the sterling contribution that they have made to getting those down. There was a lot of synergy, hon members, between the crime hotspots and the hotspot areas of Covid and when we were asked to look at, to redirect some of the resources to some of the Covid hotspots, it was not difficult because in most cases they overlapped.

I also need to commend the coordination and the integration efforts by SAPS, by the SANDF and the City as I said, but it is important to remember, it was a collaborative role, it was all the law enforcement agencies including the Metro Police working together during this time to collectively decrease crime through their visibility. You remember the roadblocks we had everywhere. You were supposed to be in by eight o'clock, you had to be inside. There were roadblocks in very strategic places.

A lot of the stats may be kind of artificial because of the lockdown, because it was a kind of unreal situation, but that was visible policing that made the difference and that is the reality of the situation. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Xego, that is the final opportunity. Apologies hon Marais, but there are no further opportunities for you. Hon Xego?

Mr M XEGO: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. We welcome the

response by the Minister but judging by the fact that crime hotspots have been diverted towards the taxi violence that is also taking place, of which the hon Madikizela has his hands full, as far as the loss of lives that is happening in that particular area; what I want to understand is what is the Department's role in ensuring the protection of lives in the ongoing taxi wars around the City of Cape Town, and in particular, the areas of Bellville and Paarl; the role of ensuring that there is a cap on this kind of loss of lives? Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you to the hon Xego. I just want to say we, my colleague, hon Minister Bonginkosi Madikizela and I, speak to each other all the time. We collaborate. Yesterday the hon member will remember that SAPS, in collaboration with the Department of Transport and Public Works, closed down the Bellville Taxi Rank. So that happens all the time and we were all informed.

I want to emphasise this: it is always a collaborative approach and it will continue to be that approach. So where it is needed, at the moment, where the hon Madikizela requests assistance, that will happen, that deployment will immediately happen. But it is always an all of us approach and an all agencies approach. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. That brings us to the end

of Question 3. Hon Allen if you could just lower your hand. We now move over to Question 4. I recognise hon Bredell.

Matzikama Municipality: election of new Speaker

4. Mr D America asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

(1) Whether it has been brought to his attention that a new Speaker was elected at the Matzikama Municipality; if so, what process was followed with the election?

(2) whether the process was legal; if not, what steps will he follow to force the Municipality to comply with the prescripts of the law?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: To the hon America, thank you very much for the question.

The reply to question (1): Yes, according to the information received the Speaker, councillor Eddie Nel, adjourned the Council meeting held on 28 July 2020 in the interests of the health and safety of councillors following a report of a suspected Covid-19 contact case at the municipality.

Upon the adjournment the departure of the Speaker and councillors

comprising of the Democratic Alliance and the Economic Freedom Fighters, the remaining councillors of the African National Congress and the United Democrats continued the meeting and also elected a new Speaker.

For the sake of maintaining impartiality and to source the basis and grounds relied upon by the ANC and UD coalition in justifying the continuation of the meeting and the finality of the proceedings which followed the adjournment of the meeting by the Speaker, councillor Eddie Nel, including the purported election of the new Speaker, I addressed correspondence to the Executive Mayor seeking more information and the grounds, if any, relied upon by the ANC, UD coalition justifying the continuation of the meeting.

I have subsequently received correspondence from the Executive Mayor of the Matzikama Municipality which asserts the legality of the said Council meeting, but without any elaboration of the process followed, save to say that it was conducted in accordance with the Rules of Order of the relevant legislation. In the absence of the additional information, I am not in a position to comment on the process that was followed in the purported election of this new Speaker.

Point (2): In the absence of full details pertaining to the purported election of the new Speaker, I am unable to make a pronouncement on the legality thereof. It is furthermore necessary to state that, based on legal advice received, the matter is of a political nature and according to case law, so I am advised it would be more appropriate for the political party or parties whose

interests have been directly prejudiced by the actions of the ANC and UD coalition to seek appropriate relief including from a court of law in the event that it wishes to contest the legality of the purported election of the new Speaker on 28 July 2020. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Hon America do you want a follow-up question?

Mr D AMERICA: Yes, hon Deputy Speaker I would like to pose a question to the Minister.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you for the answer to the question, hon Minister. Based on what you were saying in terms of the answer, a chronology of events that took place at a time on the 28 July, a Council Speaker was elected. On the 30 July, hon Minister, the Hawks raided Matzikama Municipality in connection with alleged fraudulent PPE contracts. On 31 July, the Speaker that was elected on 28 July convened a special Council meeting where he instructed that all councillors should hand in their laptops.

Would it be fair to infer that either incriminating evidence or evidence was to be eliminated from councillors' laptops that is related to the raid of the previous day, or could evidence possibly be planted on certain councillors' laptops or both? Could you just respond to that please, hon Minister?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: This is very difficult for me because I am being asked to speculate. I would prefer the hon member to work with the facts. Nevertheless, the Hawks did raid it. I am very cautious and we need to understand that the councillors do have a right to also say no. If I was in that position, I would hand my laptop to the Hawks but not to a council that is being raided by the Hawks, that is my personal opinion, but yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I recognise hon Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The majority of councillors submitted a Section 29 Vote Notice to the then Speaker, to convene a meeting on 24 July. Also, in terms of Rule 11 of the Council Rules, a motion in terms of Section 39 and 40 was included, also a Rule 38 Motion to Minmec. The Speaker acknowledged the request but refused to honour it. The meeting did not take place per request.

A second request in the same process above was sent to the Speaker for the meeting of 28 July. At a normal Council meeting on 30 July, the amendment into Rule 38 included the motion on the Council agenda per the Council Rules. The Speaker refused to acknowledge the inclusion of a motion on the agenda whilst the majority in the Council supported the inclusion. The

Speaker refused to entertain the request to proceed with the meeting and despite majority position, closed the meeting without taking any motion to voting. He and the Opposition then walked out and the remaining councillors selected an interim Speaker and continued with the meeting and handled the agenda and ... [Interjection.]

Mr M XEGO: Point of order, Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. Who am I speaking to, who is the point of order from?

Mr M XEGO: It is Xego, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, what is your point of order?

Mr M XEGO: There is one of our guests, Nomawethu Sbukwana whose mic is on and is making a very bad [Inaudible.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I actually thought I was hearing that clicking noise again. Can I please make sure that all guests, their microphones are off. If I can ask ICT just to check. Thank you very much. You may proceed, hon Smith. Hon Smith, have you finished your question?

Mr D SMITH: Yes, hon Speaker. I am done, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is over to you, hon Minister, my apologies.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, to be honest hon Smith did not ask a question, he started to answer the original question. If the Mayor could just send us the facts. We will work with the facts. It is obviously an internal fight in the ANC. All that I can request, as the MEC in the Province, is that we stick to the rule of law.

I mean there is no such thing as an interim Speaker to be quite honest with you. There is a process. The majority and hon Smith knows me, I have always said it because I have done it where DA control has become a minority and I said to them, call your Council meeting. That is democracy and we need to respect democracy.

This seems like there is a lot of toing and froing. If the Mayor sends us the facts, we can deal with the facts, but I do not have locus standi. If you go to the Oudtshoorn judgments of the Speaker, this is that the parties that are involved can decide to take it to court if they wish but that is where we stand.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Hon America?

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, at this same Council meeting on 31 July 2020, the appointment of the Chief Financial

Officer was discussed. Do you have any knowledge as to what the outcome of that discussion was? Has a Chief Financial Officer been appointed? Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon member, in Article 56 and 57 a point is after the Council has gone through their process, they need to get my concurrence so they will send me the facts and I will definitely look into this.

Remember, I need to follow the legal process so if the person is qualified, if it was a legal Council meeting then it is not for us to decide who they must appoint, they must just stay within the legal framework. So in other words their advertisement puts conditions in there, the law puts conditions in there and if they adhere to the qualifications and the experience, then it is their prerogative who to appoint, but I will definitely see to it that it is within the legal framework.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I see there are no further follow-up questions. Hon America, if you can just lower your hand and we will then ... [Interjections.]

Mr D AMERICA: Hon Deputy Speaker, I have another follow-up question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may, you have the last opportunity.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, it appears to me that there is a relative instability within the Municipality with regard to the appointment of certain employees to fulfil certain tasks. Would you say that that inter-party conflict and rivalry had an effect on service delivery ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: There is no conflict.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Continue please, hon America.

Mr D AMERICA: Yes, I am done, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to the Minister.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, there is no doubt that with any council where there is instability within the political domain, there is a direct link to the non-delivery of services. So, it is always very worrying when there are internal battles within a municipality or an instable political environment. There is more than enough evidence that will show us that that leads to the administration falling apart, that has got a direct link to the non-delivery of services. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. That concludes Question 4. We move over to Question 5. I recognise the hon Minister Fernandez.

Ihata Shelter for abused women in Heideveld

5. Mr G Brinkhuis asked the Minister of Social Development:

(1) Whether her Department will consider scrapping the rent charges to the Ihata Shelter for abused women in Heideveld; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

(2) whether her Department provides any assistance to this shelter; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I wish to thank the hon member Brinkhuis for his question. The question has two parts, the first part whether the Department will consider scrapping the rent charges? I unfortunately have to inform the hon member that the Department cannot consider scrapping the rent, since the property is not owned by the Department of Social Development. The shelter needs to approach the landlord or landowner of the property to negotiate either a reduction or a scrapping of the rent.

In terms of question (2), whether we have provided any assistance, I can confirm that the shelter is not funded by the Department as they did not apply

for funding during the previous call for proposals. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Hon Brinkhuis, you want a follow-up question?

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker, no follow-up questions. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Noted. Hon Bosman, I see you.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Through you, if I can perhaps ask Minister Fernandez if she could outline broadly what assistance her Department provides for victims of gender-based violence in shelters across, and maybe perhaps outline what that call for proposal for funding entails as well?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Gillion for the question. There could be a lengthy response, or I could just talk to it at a higher level. The support that we provide through our Victim Empowerment Programmes aims to support victims and survivors of crime and violence including gender-based violence and also to the families of those impacted by trauma that they might have experienced. So firstly, one needs to understand

what is a victim? It is a person who has suffered physical, mental or emotional harm including economic loss or substantial impairment of their fundamental rights through crime or violence.

Our Social Development Department, supported by service providers in the Western Cape, offers support to victims. There is a range of support services, but I think what is important to say is that a shelter is a place where victims of crime and violence are able to live for anything from a day to approximately three to four months, depending on the needs of the victim or survivor and the shelters assist us.

I had a meeting with 20 of them on Monday morning, they assist us with meeting basic needs such as providing a safe place to live, protection, food and clothing; they provide emotional support such as trauma debriefing and therapeutic counselling. They also provide information and many of them have skills development programmes; they do programmes on victim's rights and capacity building and they also assist victims and survivors with preparation for court procedures.

So, a shelter for a victim of crime and violence does not provide statutory services to children, therefore our shelters cannot accommodate children without their parents, legal guardians. We have economic independence of women who need to leave abusive partners, and we also have court diversion programmes for perpetrators. So, the focus is not only on the victim, but also on the perpetrator.

In terms of funding, the proposal for funding is advertised and I would encourage people to go to the Government website, the link is there, and all the detail is provided. Some of our call proposal dates have closed but it would be useful to go and check the different proposals that are out on the website. Thank you, hon Gillion.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Are there any other follow-up questions for the Minister? No follow-up questions? Right, thank you hon members, this is the end of Questions for Oral Reply. Outstanding replies will be printed in the Hansard. Thank you very much. We now move on to Statements by Members in terms of Rule 145. There will now be an opportunity for you to speak for two minutes. I recognise the DA.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS:

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. We have witnessed exceptionally disturbing attacks on our transport system this week. Most recently, six Golden Arrow buses were stoned, and innocent passengers injured requiring hospitalisation for further care.

These attacks come at a time when there is an increasing amount of taxi violence occurring over whom controls which routes as well as infighting amongst operators. Hon Deputy Speaker, a Golden Arrow spokesperson confirmed that the attacks on the buses were linked to taxi operators in the area, as they have been intimidated repeatedly, and openly told that they

should not operate in the area. The assault on our transport system is of grave concern as it not only affects the lives of our residents but their livelihoods as well.

This untenable situation cannot continue. We cannot be held hostage by thuggery, violence and destruction which threatens to risk the progress of individuals as well as the province as a whole. Hon Deputy Speaker, I welcome the continual engagement of the Provincial Transport Department, led by Minister Madikizela, to provide solutions and mediate in order to achieve conflict resolution.

In conclusion, hon Deputy Speaker, I urge all stakeholders including the South African Police Services and law enforcement to take every possible legal measure to ensure that these solutions are indeed achieved and remain long lasting for the benefit of all our residents. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I recognise the ANC.

Ms G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. As Women's Month draws to a close, we are saddened by the rising numbers of GBV and femicide. To win the battle against GBV and femicide, we need to take heed to Alexandra Kollontai's message when she said that specific economic factors were behind the subordination of women.

Natural equalities have been a secondary factor in this process. Only with the

complete disappearance of these factors, only the evolution of those forces which at some point in the past gave rise to the subjection of women, is able in a fundamental way to influence and change their social position. Women can become truly free and equal only in a world organised along new social and productive lines. We can only win this war when we start pursuing individual women's rights and advance towards a common goal for women emancipation.

The Provincial Government should play a central role in this. The point of departure should be a pro-women Budget and more resources towards the fight against GBV as well as opening up more opportunities for women in senior management. These are non-existent in the Western Cape. This is important to leverage women in their quest for full emancipation.

We also understand GBV to involve power dynamics between males and females. In closing, hon Deputy Speaker, I call on women to support one another as we fight to end GBV and the attainment of a goal of full emancipation of women. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I recognise the EFF.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The EFF welcomes yet another Western Cape High Court judgment against the inhuman and treacherous acts of the DA-led City of Cape Town for carrying out illegal evictions against the community of Mfuleni. This is the latest

spate of a series of judgments ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, if you could just wait one minute. Can I please ask the members to put their microphones off?

An HON MEMBER: Okay, okay ... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, I think that it you. I can hear you. If you can just put your microphone on mute. You may continue.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): My microphone is on mute, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry, my apologies. I am just trying to find out who it is. Over to you, hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. This is the latest spate of a series of judgments produced by the Western Cape High Court which includes Hangberg, Ocean View and Khayelitsha eviction matters, where the Court attempted on numerous occasions to school the City of Cape Town that no evictions can be carried out under lockdown and that only a court of law can order evictions.

However, it is not surprising that the DA-led City of Cape Town continues to defy court judgements. This is in line with their belief that the Western Cape

is a country in itself and that they are a law unto themselves. This is captured in the Court judgment where both judges likened the brutal eviction of Kulani as remnants of the apartheid era brutal forced removals. The Court further ordered the South African Police Services to sit and watch but to constantly take action against those carrying out the illegal evictions and violating South African laws in the process.

The EFF's legal intervention on the matter also resulted in the Court ordering the City of Cape Town to return all confiscated building material from the homeowners, who in addition, must be compensated to the value of R2 000 each. The Court has set a correct precedent in this standard approach against all those who continue to undermine the land rights of black people. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I recognise the DA.

Mr R D MACKENZIE? (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. A report by the United Nations Development Programme shows that a third of the South African middle class has been wiped out as a result of the socio-economic conditions under the COVID-19 pandemic. Hon Deputy Speaker, the report shows that over half of households in the country are now on temporary employment contracts. Effectively, the fight against the eradication of poverty and inequality was placed on hold. Up until last week residents were still largely suffering under the narrow-minded regulations in the name of Disaster Risk Management.

Hon Deputy Speaker, this report showcased the disaster created by the ANC and the self-made second epidemic which we must now face as a nation. Reports, facts and data now clearly tell us that the unduly extended lockdown in South Africa is not viable, it is destructive. It is clear that the severity of this crisis has not been realised by the ANC and National Government and earlier as we heard in the debate by the ANC members in this Parliament.

If [Inaudible.] then they would direct every effort to tackle the second pandemic. With this I make one statement clear today: the decline of our economy could and should have been avoided. The ANC Government does not have the political will to build a capable, caring state. It needs a DA government that is serious about economic rehabilitation and creates opportunities to better the life of every resident; a party that does not seek to serve the interest of political allies like the ANC does; that does not fight corruption through years of commissions of inquiries but the one that puts the needs of the people first. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Hon members I now hand over to the Speaker, thank you very much.

[The Speaker takes the Chair.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Hon members, thank you very much and now we are going to the GOOD Party, I recognise hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Thank you, hon Speaker. Yesterday the office of Cape Town Mayoral Committee member, Zahid Badroodien, said that they are appealing to all communities to stop feeding homeless people on the streets, to stop giving clothes and to stop giving money. They said by enabling a homeless person to remain on the street, we lock them out of opportunities that are available and shelters.

This approach that starves people on the streets so that they are forced to go to shelters assumes of course that there are enough shelters for the homeless. Last year, Mayco member J P Smith was quoted by the *Sunday Times* saying that there are enough shelter spaces for all the homeless people in the City of Cape Town.

However, the Western Cape's Minister for Social Development confirmed to this House that last year there was a shortage of thousands of shelter spaces within the City of Cape Town. The Minister indicated that just 1 499 shelter spaces were available last year for the estimated 7000 or more homeless people. Had the DA given R43 million to shelters instead of renting tents for a few weeks, the Annual Budget to shelters would have tripled. R43 million for six weeks rent when you can buy a whole marque tent for just R85 000.

Waste and corruption, and now the DA is asking all communities to let people starve on the streets. Neither our City nor Provincial Government provides enough shelters to protect and care for the homeless but now the DA is asking the communities to stop feeding starving people too. The DA's

treatment of homeless and hungry people is mad; fining them and now telling them to stop feeding the hungry even when you know there are not enough shelters.

I do hope that the caring communities who are feeding homeless people ignore your calls. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Herron. Hon members, I now recognise the ACDP, hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. The ACDP in the Western Cape believes that the solution to South Africa's current problems is to strengthen provincial powers in our federal system by allowing each province to govern over its own affairs such as police, education and a health system, while we remain a province of South Africa.

Although the Cape Independence Advocacy Group is gaining momentum in calling for an independent Western Cape, this call is unrealistic and will never happen. They think by calling for a referendum, independence will happen. Our Constitution only allows for the Premier of a province and the President of the country to call for one.

Secondly, even if a referendum does take place, and even if the people in the Western Cape voted for the Western Cape to be independent, neither is legally binding on anyone. The only way for the Western Cape to be

independent is for Parliament to amend the Constitution by a two-thirds majority. Hon Speaker, this will never happen.

In addition to this, it is almost impossible to try to comprehend the budget implications we would face, should we become independent. Border control and law enforcement are only two aspects that will add severe economic pressure. The ACDP in the Western Cape is appalled at the racist agenda being driven and promoted by this movement. Supporting racial division and disruption will only set us back as a nation. It is extremely disheartening to see the Cape Independence Advocacy Group misleading the people of the Western Cape by luring them into empty promises that can never be fulfilled. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. Hon members I now recognise the ANC.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, the African National Congress notes the continued lack of political leadership in education in the Western Cape. When political leaders across the globe were displaying caution in the reopening of schools or ensuring that they strenuously work with all stakeholders to ensure the safety of learners and their families, our Provincial Department of Education continued to display an attitude of arrogance and it was led politically. I am not blaming the officials here.

Repeatedly the ANC questioned in this House whether the schools in our

province, especially those in poor areas, were ready for reopening and as reality now shows some were far from prepared and this is due to lack of political leadership. Our educators, who are already under pressure under normal circumstances, have now the added responsibilities of guaranteeing that the safety and health measures regulated by law are adhered to.

Given that classes were half in size and assistant educators were to be appointed to double up the supervision and educate the numbers, the hon MEC of Education provided little leadership. Now only, when matriculants are on the way to their final examinations, the Department started advertising as there is a critical shortage of matric educators. Yet there is still something that can be done to salvage the academic year, if the political leadership of the Department works with all stakeholders; unions, parents; educators and learners.

We need all hands-on deck, hon Speaker. The ANC will support such an initiative in ensuring all co-operate to save our children's futures. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed. Hon members I now recognise the DA.

Ms L J BOTHA (DA): Hon Speaker, we have reached a point where there is effectively less than 16 weeks left of the 2020 academic year. After the four-week closure of schools, the Department of Basic Education revealed that of

the 13 million children who are expected to be back at school, only 10 million returned.

Hon Speaker, I am afraid that the ANC still fails to realise the impact of their inconsistent measures and particularly the constant change of reopening dates during the lockdown on the learners in our country. They are still not doing enough to revive the remainder of the academic year.

In the debate today, we saw that these measures serve political interests of the ruling national party without real consideration of the future of our children. Hon Speaker, the country has an alarmingly high dropout rate, along with even higher numbers of illiteracy. We are seriously running out of time to make things right.

Today I want to address, once again, the lack of political will behind prioritising education. Fortunately, in the Western Cape we have long started to focus on the retention rate with the same level of attention given to the pass rate. The WCED has issued extensive guidelines for teachers and learners, how to use online resources optimally but also put up its best fight for those who have to really depend on in-classroom activity.

Hon Speaker, at this stage we are missing three million learners, three million futures and possibly the well-being of three million households and we have less than 16 weeks to get them back. I call on the DBE to act decisively on the future of our learners now. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Botha. Hon members, I now recognise the FF PLUS.

Mr P J MARAIS (FF PLUS): Thank you, hon Speaker. The Freedom Front Plus supports a post-COVID-19 recovery plan that will include structural reform measures, that will rid society of the idea that chronic poverty is a solely black condition. Poverty affects all races and cultures. Land invasions, if not halted, will therefore become a legal right to be exercised by all citizens, coloureds and whites included, in the Western Cape. Then race should be taken out of the picture, if land invasions are a right.

This will lead to chaos and anarchy. The action by illegal people, foreigners invading land, should be declared criminal. And they should be repatriated to where they came from. The indigenous people's right to land in the Western Cape should be restored and not that of Zimbabweans who have no legal right here or any other country north of South Africa.

The recovery plan should include amending certain municipal by-laws with regard to land invasions, rental housing and urban renewal plans. Agri South Africa should be assisted to ensure the preservation of food security in the Western Cape and safety on farms. We need new town planning measures relating to its design, to make the Cape Flats safe for women and children, irrespective of race.

We appeal to the Premier therefore that the recovery plan ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Marais, thank you, your time is up.

Mr P J MARAIS: ... should be a bipartisan effort to preserve the Cape ...
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: ... lifestyle and revive our culture.

The SPEAKER: Your time is up. †Baie dankie meneer, baie dankie. Agbare, baie dankie. [Thank you, sir, thank you. Hon, thank you.] Hon members I now recognise Al Jama-ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Speaker. Al Jama-ah wants to reiterate the urgent need for personal protective equipment, PPE, for all burial undertakers as all burial undertakers are also frontline workers. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. Thank you, hon Brinkhuis. I now recognise the DA.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Through a parliamentary question we have learned that the South African Police Services do not record specific statistics under the gender-based violence category of crimes. Instead GBV is noted by SAPS as a so-called generic term to encompass

amongst others, rape, assault and grievous bodily harm.

Hon Speaker, in as much as President Ramaphosa rightly pronounced GBV a national pandemic, the time to proactively treat it as one, has long passed. During the nationwide lockdown, women were severely limited in receiving support for gender-based violence. The National GBV command call centre recorded over 3 000 cases for the lockdown Alert Levels 5, 4 and 3. With the stretching of policing resources and limited functioning of courts, too often cases have gone without prioritisation and a lack of access to the protection orders that women so desperately need.

Hon Speaker, this tells us two critical things, firstly we need to adopt a smart, data-led approach to fight the GBV pandemic. Just as the intelligent use of data informs decision-making and beating COVID-19, a similar model with the same vigour is required to defeat the scourge of gender-based violence.

Secondly, Pretoria needs to muster concerted efforts across departments in this fight. It should follow the Western Cape's lead in the provision of a Court Watching Brief Unit, with the necessary teeth, on a nationwide scale, to support the criminal justice system and improve accessibility to legal services for victims of gender-based violence.

Hon Speaker, the nationwide lockdown highlighted and exacerbated gender-based violence and it has deteriorated the economic standing of

women and of women of colour, in particular. I call on our leaders, starting with the President, to address this systemic, institutionalised crisis with the political will and fervour desperately needed to eradicate this tragic pandemic. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bosman. Hon members, that concludes Members' Statements. I now wish to give an opportunity to a member of the Executive, that a Minister should, if they so wish to, respond to the Members' Statements for no more than five minutes, in terms of Rule 145 Subsection 6.

Is there any member of the Executive that wishes to respond? Going, 1, 2, 3. None, thank you. Hon members, that concludes the Members' Statements and now we begin with the Motions and Notices of Motion will go first. I now recognise hon member Christians.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the ongoing alcohol-related offences in the Western Cape. I so move. I thank you.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians and hon members. I now recognise hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the failure of the Western Cape Provincial Government to deal with institutionalised racism in sports. I thank you, hon Speaker.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Makamba-Botya. Hon members I now recognise hon Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of the Quintile System on the performance of schools in the Western Cape. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Botha, hon members I now recognise hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House, noting the refusal by the Chairperson of the Western Cape Legislature Portfolio Committee on Local Government, hon Derrick America, to convene a meeting to consider the evidence of complaints against the hon MEC Bredell and senior officials of the Provincial Government, therefore calls on the Speaker to investigate this matter, given that this decision undermines the Legislature's responsibility to maintain robust oversight over the Provincial Executive and further calls on the National Council of Provinces ... [Interjection.]

THE SPEAKER: Hon the Leader of the Opposition?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes.

The SPEAKER: This is now Notices of Motion.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes.

The SPEAKER: And this is not, what you are delivering is not.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No-no, Speaker. I have one more sentence to go. I am giving notice, if I can conclude,

That the House further calls on the NCOP Portfolio Committee to investigate the allegations contained in the dossier of evidence. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Alright. I will come back to this. This motion is inadmissible. I will come back to that.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: But Chairperson, could you clarify in what sense that is a motion with notice? To what extent is it inadmissible?

The SPEAKER: The structure and the convention of motions with notice, in terms of the Rules. That is not the nature of a motion with notice.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I would appreciate you providing a backup for that statement, because it is clear that I am moving with notice. I am giving notice to this House of a matter that needs to be debated, but I look forward to your reasoning, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: I will come back to that, hon Dugmore. I promise. Hon members, I now move to the hon Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you. Speaker, I give notice that I shall move on behalf

of the EFF:

That the House debates the Western Cape Housing crisis and backlog. I so move. Thank you very much, Speaker.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Xego. Hon members, I now recognise [Interjections.] Order hon members. I now recognise hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you. Speaker, I give notice that I shall move on behalf of the African National Congress:

That the House at its next sitting debates the destabilising role the Western Cape DA Government-backed vigilante system of rogue Neighbourhood Watches has on relations and society as a whole. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama. Hon members, I now recognise hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you. Speaker, I give notice that I shall move on behalf of the Economic Freedom Fighters:

That the House debates the funding of shelters for abused women and children. Thank you, Speaker.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Makamba-Botya. Hon members, I now recognise hon Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you. Speaker, I give notice that I shall move on behalf of the EFF:

That the House debates the Western Cape Government's support for black farmers. Thank you very much, Speaker.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Xego. Hon members, I now recognise hon Brinkhuis. Hon members, is hon Brinkhuis in the House? Okay. Hon Brinkhuis is there. Hon Brinkhuis? Hon members, I move now, and I recognise hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you. Speaker, I give notice that I shall move on behalf of the Economic Freedom Fighters:

That the House debates the impact of the Western Cape Safety Plan in light of the increasing violence against women and children, gang violence and taxi wars. I thank you, Speaker.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Makamba-Botya. Hon members, I now recognise hon Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you. Speaker, I give notice that I shall move on behalf of the EFF:

That the House debates the constant defiance of the Western Cape Government in terms of land evictions. I so move, Speaker.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Xego. Hon members, that concludes the Notices of Motion. Thank you, hon members. We now move to the Motions without Notice. I now recognise hon America.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the Democratic Alliance:

That the House extends its deepest condolences to the family and friends of Mr Piet Meyer, former Deputy Speaker of this House, who passed away on 22 August 2020 at the age of 80. Mr Meyer was born on 12 August 1940 and grew up in the small village of Noupoort in the Northern Cape. He held many positions in public office and served the people of South Africa with dignity, humility and honesty over a period of four decades. He held the following positions during his time: 1) As a member of the management committee of Vredenburg/Saldanha Bay Municipalities in the seventies. 2) He was a member of the House of Representatives in 1984. 3) Deputy Minister of Agriculture in 1987. Furthermore he was a member of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport: Western Cape Government, Minister of Transport and Public Works: Western Cape Government; Minister of Health: Western Cape Government; Chief Whip in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament; Deputy Speaker of the Provincial Parliament; Head of the Mission South Africa's Liaison Office: Taipei, Taiwan; Mr Meyer will fondly be remembered by colleagues and friends across the political divide; our hearts go out to Dr Ivan Meyer, Min of Agriculture in the Western Cape Government and son of Mr Meyer, and trust that the family will find solace in the legacy left behind by a true son of South Africa. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon America. Hon members, are there any

objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. I would like to request the House that all members rise in their places in order to observe a moment of silence. May his soul rest in peace. You may all be seated. Thank you, hon members. Hon members, the next motion is by hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you. Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the African Christian Democratic Party:

That the House acknowledges the 11-year-old Braedon Powell who saved two men from drowning at Fish Hoek. Speaker, we are referring to the recent article which highlighted how Braedon, who is part of the Fish Hoek Surf Lifesaving Nippers, a junior programme that teaches children from ages 8 to 14 years old life skills and knowledge of the marine environment, was playing with his friends near the beach when he caught sight of the men in trouble and without thinking rushed with his red board and saved the lives of these two men that were 150 metres away from shore; Speaker, Braedon should be an inspiration to others. I so move. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. Hon members, I now recognise hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you. Hon Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the EFF:

That the House notes that 24 August 2020 marked one year after the rape and murder of 19-year-old UCT student, Uyinene Mrewetyana. Round about the same time there was also an escalation with regards to cases of gender-based violence and femicide in the country; despite widespread protest against this scourge and calls to the President and law enforcement houses to toughen the laws against perpetrators of these actions, nothing has been done yet as women and children remain at the mercy of these marauding criminals. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Makamba-Botya. Hon members, I now recognise hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Speaker, thank you. Good afternoon to everyone. I move without notice on behalf of the African National Congress:

That the House notes a big suspected Neighbourhood Watch member, now suspended, over the weekend pinned down the young Bradley de Bruin of Wolseley, severely assaulted him, left him unconscious and the young man is now in hospital with head injuries; further notes the vigilante member then fled the town to a neighbouring province; further

notes this member of the rogue unit's actions were recorded on a phone camera where De Bruin was seen pinned down like the killed American George Floyd by the burly member and severely beaten up while other members of the Wolseley Neighbourhood Watch even encouraged him while this big vigilante man also threatened and abused De Bruin; lastly the suspect had to hand over himself to Wolseley Police this morning amidst a public outcry and race tension. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marran. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. I now recognise hon Philander.

Ms W PHILANDER: Thank you. Hon Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the Democratic Alliance:

That the House expresses our sincere condolences to the family, friends and colleagues of the late councillor Henrietta Sylvester Mangenenene; councillor Mangenenene served as a PR councillor at the Langeberg Municipality and was a dedicated and committed member of the Democratic Alliance; she served the DA Women's Network as a representative with passion in the Langeberg constituency in the West Region; that this House notes that councillor Henrietta was a mother to many children who were placed in her care over several years, which she

raised as her very own; that this House further notes that her compassion for cancer patients in her community and dedication to uplift rural women are truly commendable; Speaker, may the dear soul of councillor Henrietta rest in eternal peace. She will be sorely missed. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Philander. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. Hon members, I now recognise hon Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you. Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the EFF welcomes the move by the City of Cape Town for coming to its senses for a change, and withdrawing the advert intending to renew a 10-year lease on a 49-hectare King Mowbray Golf Club; further notes that the City did not withdraw the advert out of its own wisdom, of those who run it, but due to the mounting pressure from activists in favour of integrated spatial planning and the building of affordable houses. As the EFF we hope that further sanity will prevail in the heads of those who are running the City, to realize the impact of shortages of affordable housing, especially on the land closer to economic opportunities. I so move, Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Xego. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. I now recognise hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that a 50-year-old Plettenberg Bay restaurant worker appeared on a charge of attempted murder in the local court after shooting at a colleague last Thursday. No injuries were sustained. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mvimbi. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. Hon members, I recognise hon Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its heartfelt condolences to the family and friends of the respected and much loved 79-year-old Jane Dowie Dunn, a resident of Stanford who unexpectedly passed away on 22 June 2020; she will be sorely missed by her family, friends, her Food 4 Thought family and the Stanford community and it is our prayer that they find solace and strength through these trying times of bereavement. I so

move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Van der Westhuizen. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections.

Motion agreed to. Hon members, I now recognise hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you. Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the Economic Freedom Fighters:

That the House welcomes the recent conviction of Reagan Zietsman for the kidnapping, rape and murder of 6-year-old Delvina Europa on 24 March 2019. This follows a shocking revelation that the very same man walked away with a slap on the wrist back in January 2017 after he was granted a suspended sentence after he was convicted of raping a 12-year-old girl. The time has come now for South Africa to assess our judges and magistrates and put them under a rigorous training to assess whether they are still fit and proper to remain on the bench; the EFF hopes that the Court will impose a very heavy and harsh sentence this time against Zietsman for his treacherous evil deeds. I so move. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Makamba-Botya. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. Hon members, I now recognise hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Thank you, Speaker. Hon Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the African National Congress:

That the House notes the attack last Friday near Stellenbosch on owners of Hillcrest Berry Farm; the 77-year-old Raymond and 74-year-old Betty O'Grady, who escaped after being abducted and are recovering from sustained injuries; and commends SAPS investigators who speedily arrested three suspects. I so move. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marran. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. I now recognise hon Allen.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Speaker, my hand was up Speaker.

Mr R I ALLEN: Speaker [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... with an objection to something.

The SPEAKER: What is your objection, hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Not an objection, Speaker. Sorry. More just a point of clarity. Something that I have noticed, Speaker. Having looked at the list of your motions with notice Speaker, we have submitted a motion with notice for the hon Nkondlo and it was part of the list that went through with all the others and I do not see that particular motion on the list. I wanted to know whether she can do it now or would you prefer that it is done in the next sitting? Thank you. Because it was [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Yes, thank you, hon Sayed. Order, hon members. The specific motion must be, if it was submitted it should be with the Table staff, if it is not on the list of motions here, but I will enquire before the end of the sitting. I will come back to that.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed. You are most welcome. Hon members, I now recognise hon Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the Democratic Alliance:

That the House sends its sincere condolences, in a devastating loss to the justice fraternity, as the human rights champion, Adv Hishaam

Mohamed, recently sadly passed away; we know that he leaves his wife, Ragmat, behind as well as his two sons and daughter; he was known as a man for the people and our sincere condolences is extended to his family, his friends and colleagues. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Allen. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No objections.

The SPEAKER: No objections. Motion agreed to. Thank you, hon members. Hon members, I now recognise hon Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, Speaker. I move without notice on behalf of the EFF:

That the House notes the recurring protests by former matric learner from the South African College High School, calling for the disbandment of the current School Governing Body; this follows the SGB's reluctance to update the school's Code of Conduct to be in line with the Provincial and National Department's discrimination policies. It is alleged that the school has an entrenched discrimination culture targeting pupils of colour, lesbians, gays, bi-sexuals, transgender people

and as well as the Muslim community. The EFF calls for the disbandment of this SGB at the school with immediate effect, which must be replaced by a multi-cultural, and multi-racial group representing diverse interests of different stakeholders. I so move, Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. Hon Xego, there is an objection. Your motion will be printed in the Order Paper. Hon members [Interjection.]

Mr M XEGO: You like the racists!

The SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Order. Order, hon members. I now recognise hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you. Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House notes an 8-year-old boy was killed and a girl of 12 injured by stray bullets on Monday in an Elsie's River shooting involving officers of the Cape Metro. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Objection, Mr Speaker. The case must be investigated. It was other people who shot [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon Minister.

An HON MEMBER: It is hon Fritz. It is hon Fritz again.

The SPEAKER: Objection has been noted. Hon members, and the motion will be printed in the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Philander.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you. Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the Democratic Alliance:

That the House strongly condemns the ongoing and increasing attacks on Emergency Medical Staff; that this House further notes that from 1 January to 23 August a total of 43 cases has been recorded, compared in comparison to 30 cases in 2019; that these senseless attacks leave EMS frontline staff severely traumatised in their jobs whilst having to save lives and fearing for their own; that when EMS staff are held up at gunpoint it results in double trauma on the staff member and the possibility of a family member of anyone of us; that the House further

urges members of the public to report these attacks to their nearest police station without hesitation. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Philander. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. Hon members, I now recognise hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you. Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the Economic Freedom Fighters:

That the House notes that on 31 August 2020 the Western Cape High Court will be delivering its reserved judgment on the Tafelberg case. The case relates to the unjust manner in which the Western Cape Provincial Government attempted to sell the well-located land in Sea Point to a private buyer. This was done in the face of the worst housing affordability crisis in well-located areas within the City. A judgement against the Provincial Government in this case will be a victory for the people of the Western Cape, especially those who have been side-lined to the outskirts and denied access to the well-located land. It will also be a victory for South Africa and a chance for the DA Provincial Government to develop an integrated spatial planning policy. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: Object.

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon members. Hon Makamba-Botya, noting there is an objection, the motion will be printed in the Order Paper. Hon members, I now recognise hon Smith.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker. A point of order.

The SPEAKER: I see a hand. What is your point of order, hon Mitchell?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Speaker, I would like to ask your ruling on whether it is parliamentary for Parliament or the House to take a decision on a judgment that is yet to be delivered. So, pre-empting an outcome of a court judgment.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Also a point of order, Mr Speaker, if I may.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Mitchell. Your point of order, Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): I would just like to point out Rule 63, which states that no member may suggest what conclusions a court should come to.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip, and the hon Deputy Chief Whip

of the Democratic Alliance. I will come back to this. I need to consult with the Table staff. Whilst I am coming back to that, I just want to move and recognise hon Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Thank you, Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes a Sunday charity drive ended in a tragedy when five people were killed when a bakkie and five motorcyclists crashed near Saldanha Bay. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Smith. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. Hon members, I now recognise hon Wenger.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the Democratic Alliance:

That the House commends 11-year-old Braedon Powell for his bravery in saving two men from drowning; further that the House notes that this under-12 Nipper at the Fish Hoek Lifesaving Club saw two men blown out to sea on an inflatable mattress, grabbed a knee-board and paddled over 150 metres to help them; neither of the men were able to swim, so Master Powell calmed them down, had them lie in a stable position on

the mattress and pushed them safely back to shore; further that the House congratulates young Master Powell for his exemplary actions. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Wenger. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. Hon members, I now recognise hon Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the EFF:

That the House notes with sadness the death of a 2-year-old girl from Gugulethu who died inside a shack that caught fire; this is after two of her siblings, the 9-year-old and 12-year-old managed to escape the fire, leaving the 2-year-old behind inside the burning shack. The EFF calls on the law enforcement officials to investigate what led to the parents not being able to look after the children during this unintended incident and the required punishment to be imposed if there is any form of neglect during this incident. I so move, Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Xego. [Interjections.] Order, hon members.

Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. Hon members, I now recognise hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much. Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House condemns the incident that took place in Wolseley last weekend where a Neighbourhood Watch member assaulted a man who is currently fighting for his life in hospital with a serious head injury and that the DA and its Department of Community Safety should take full responsibility as the ANC has warned against such vigilante people, disguised as community crime fighting structures [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Object.

Mr M KAMA:

...conducting policing with no mandate. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: Object.

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Order, hon members. Objection has been noted. Hon Kama, your motion will be recorded in the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you. Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the Democratic Alliance:

That the House congratulates Warrant Officer Gawie du Toit on his long-term service award; that this House recognises his 38 years of service within the South African Police, serving the community of Porterville in the Vredenburg Cluster. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Both. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. Hon members, I now recognise hon Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, hon Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the EFF:

That the House notes that on 31 July 2020 the Public Service Commission produced a report in which it found that the DA-led Western Cape Provincial Government had acted unlawfully in extending a contract of a 65-year-old man who is now 68 years old, as the Head of

the Western Cape Education Department [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Object!

Mr M XEGO:

It is an irregular contract extension in violation with the [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection in advance [Interjection.]

Mr M XEGO:

...Public Service Act, which makes it clear that [Interjections.] the approval of the Provincial Parliament cannot be bypassed in an extension [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Point of order, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. I have got [Interjections.] hon members, I have got the hon Kama's hand up. What is your point of order hon Kama?

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, Speaker. I think in your rulings made before and the directives which were also repeated by the Deputy Speaker when we started this sitting, you warned against members interjecting when a

member is on the podium. There is a time that is provided for members to indicate whether they object or not, but the continuous disruption of the members from the DA when a member is speaking, we cannot even hear the motion of other members, but because they assume what the motion is, they are already interjecting, "Objection, objection" and we cannot hear. Can you please protect the member, Speaker, and also protect us as members of this House.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama. I fully support the view and it is what I have repeatedly said, and it is indeed regrettable that hon members continue to undermine the very Rules that we agree upon and I will definitely deal with that. I just need to say to the hon members here, please with your indulgence, support the Presiding Officers and make sure that we help to run this House in accordance with the Rules and the agreed principles of hosting the virtual meetings. And the directives are clear and if we collapse this meeting, that will mean that you have collapsed your own sitting.

So, I will make sure that we deal with this continuously. Thank you, hon Kama. Hon members, there was a motion by hon Xego. I could not hear what hon Xego was saying but I heard there was an objection. The motion will be recorded in the Order Paper. The objection has been noted. Now [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Sorry. On a point of order. On a point of order, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon, the Leader of the Opposition.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I think just following up from member Kama's point of order, we support your ruling, but the problem is that we could not actually hear the motion of hon Xego. So before you put it could we please request that we hear the motion and that we can then apply our minds as to whether we object or not, because there has been a lot of disturbance and I would like to hear the motion that was moved by the hon member. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Hon members, order. I would like to request – I will grant that opportunity to hon Xego, hon Dugmore. It is the right of all members to be heard and for all members to hear what is being said, and therefore I request hon Xego to indulge the House and address us on the same motion again.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, for your flexibility there and your ruling. I move without notice on behalf of the EFF:

That the House notes that on 31 July 2020 the Public Service Commission produced a report in which it found that the DA-led Provincial Government had acted unlawfully in extending a contract of a 65-year-old, who is currently 68, to head the Western Cape Education Department. This irregular contract extension violated provisions of the Public Service Act, which makes it clear that the approval of the

Provincial Parliament cannot be bypassed if an extension of that nature is to be made. However, this is not surprising coming from the Democratic Alliance Government, who think that they are a law unto themselves because even when the Premier was alerted of this incompetent conduct by this Government, he turned a blind eye. The EFF joins the calls by the Public Service Commission that the DA Premier approaches the court to nullify an irregular contract extension of their friend. I so move, Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

An HON MEMBER: A very strong objection.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon members. [Interjections.] Order, order, hon members. Thank you. Hon Xego, noting the objection to your motion, the motion will be recorded in the Order Paper. Hon members, I now recognise hon Bans.

Ms A P BANS: Thank you. Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the African National Congress:

That the House commends Cape Arts CEO Marlene le Roux on being appointed as Afrikaans language and culture society ATKV's new

Chairperson of its Board of Directors. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bans. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: No objections. No objections.

The SPEAKER: No objections. Thank you, hon Fritz. Hon members, there is no objection. Motion agreed to. I now move to hon America.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the judgement handed down by the Western Cape High Court in which it dismissed the application by Opposition parties in George, which rallied to overturn the election of the new Executive Mayor of George, Councillor Leon van Wyk; Speaker, additionally that the High Court noted that the election of the Mayor was valid, transparent and just, dismissing all allegations of procedural bias and malicious intent; Speaker, that this House further notes that the Opposition parties have now resorted to breaking quorums for council meetings and refusal to work, and that this is evidence that the Opposition parties have no regard for the potential negative impact their actions are having on service delivery to the residents of George. I so

move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: Object.

An HON MEMBER: Object.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Objection.

†'n AGB LID: Natuurlik [Tussenwerpsel.]

[An HON MEMBER: Of course [Interjection.]]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja, object.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Alright. Thank you. Thank you, hon members. Hon America, there is an objection to your motion. Your motion will be recorded in the Order Paper. I now proceed. I recognise hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, Speaker. Hon Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House calls on the South African Police Services in Ceres to

desist from being used by the DA Municipality or its hired security as a shield between them and the communities of Ceres, instead of the Municipality addressing the genuine struggles pursued by the people of Nduli. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Object!

An HON MEMBER: Object. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. Hon Kama, an objection has been noted and therefore your motion will be recorded in the Order Paper. Hon members, I recognise hon Mitchell.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Mr Speaker. Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the Democratic Alliance:

That the House extends its thanks to Mr Ntombana, who heads the Nursing Unit at Beaufort West Hospital and who has gone above and beyond when duty called on him during the current worldwide COVID-19 pandemic; Speaker, Mr Ntombana is a shining example of the type of individual who have made our health system stronger internally through this pandemic; we note that this has not been an easy period but his leadership has played a pivotal role in easing the fears of staff; Speaker,

I move that this House further notes the dedication and perseverance shown by Mr Ntombana who has served as a committed healthcare official during the COVID-19 pandemic. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mitchell. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No.

The SPEAKER: No objections. Motion agreed to. Hon members, I now recognise hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you. Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House notes the Cape's and probably the world's oldest man, 116-year-old Freddie Blom from Delft died over the weekend in the Tygerberg Hospital. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Windvogel. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No.

The SPEAKER: No objections. Motion agreed to. Hon members, I now recognise hon Philander.

Ms W PHILANDER: Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the Democratic Alliance:

That the House notes the multi-party Standing Committee on Health on 26 August 2020, in their proceedings, resolved that a formal notice of congratulations be extended to the Western Cape Department of Health on their diligent management, hard and dedicated service during the COVID-19 pandemic to the residents of the Western Cape; and that this House further notes that the Committee expressed their congratulations gesture to all healthcare workers at every level across all facilities in the Western Cape. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

An HON MEMBER: Object.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Philander.

An HON MEMBER: What?

Ms W F PHILANDER: How can you object if you congratulated them?

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you [Interjections.] Order. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: U-turn. ANC U-turn. ANC U-turn. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members.

Ms W F PHILANDER: You congratulated them.

The SPEAKER: Hon Philander, noting that there is an objection the motion will be recorded in the Order Paper. I now [Interjections.] recognise [Interjections.] hon members, order. I now recognise hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, can I start, hon Speaker? There is noise.

The SPEAKER: Alright. Thank you hon members. Let me just check where the noise is coming from. We need to ensure that there is no noise here. Let me check with the IT quickly. Thank you, hon members. The feedback from the technical team is that one of the hon members had their microphone on. Now it has since been muted. You may proceed. I now recognise hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the ongoing unsavoury abuse of municipal so-called nuisance by-laws by the City of Cape Town in Bo-Kaap to suppress and silence worshippers from the practice of their faith and culture in this historic Muslim area of Cape Town; also notes the complaints against the call to prayer is laid against the mosque Nuru El-Houda, one of the oldest in South Africa; notes one of the Bo-Kaap religious leaders Shaik Dawood Terblanche says that it hurts that people are trying for years now to silence their heritage and also notes that many residents believe it is not a normal complaint, but part of a concerted effort of intolerance linked to gentrification to squeeze them out of this historic area. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No.

An HON MEMBER: Object.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No objection.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. The motion will be recorded in the Order Paper. I note the hand of the hon Mitchell. Hon Mitchell, what is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, I just want to clarify. It is not an objection. It is an objection to it being moved without notice, not an objection to the motion itself.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mitchell. Your clarity has been recorded. Hon Sayed, I see your hand. Is there a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes. Could the Deputy Chief Whip elaborate as to what is the basis for his objection to this being tabled as a motion without notice? Because there was no call for a discussion here. It was noting [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: I see the two [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Rules. Rules. Rules, Rules, Rules.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. For the information of the House, these are the two Deputy Chief Whips from either side of the House. So I think you can take it offline. Let me proceed. Now I am going to recognise hon Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes Cape Town Mayor Dan Plato's intent to use taxpayers' money to appeal against a High Court order against breaking down the homes or eviction of informal residents during the lockdown period. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

An HON MEMBER: Object! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members.

An HON MEMBER: But it is a fact!

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. I note the objection. The motion will be recorded in the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, Speaker. I move without notice on behalf of the African National Congress:

That the House notes the unwillingness of the DA-run Cape Town Metro policing services to account to the National Assembly's police portfolio committee and refusal to appear when invited after one Khayelitsha

resident, Mr Bulelani Qolani, was undignifiedly dragged around naked and assaulted on video by law enforcement officers when they evicted him and broke his informal structure down; and denounces the letter to refuse to account and commends the National Parliament for starting the process to summons the City of Cape Town to the Metro to account for the way in which the widely criticised situation was handled. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Object!

An HON MEMBER: Object.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Get all the facts first!

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you, hon members. [Interjections.] The objection has been noted, hon Kama. Your motion will be recorded in the Order Paper. Hon members, I now recognise hon Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the hon DA leader, Ivan Meyer's son, Ivan Meyer Junior has been appointed in a senior position as Assistant Director in the Department of Environmental Affairs and Integrated Development Planning of the Western Cape Provincial Government under MEC

Meyer's colleague, the hon MEC Anton Bredell; notes that Meyer Junior was appointed during the strictest COVID-19 lockdown period and that this appointment is viewed by some as nepotism. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Object!

An HON MEMBER: Object.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Stop [Inaudible.] Ministers.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. Objection has been noted. The motion will be printed in the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you. Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House notes a case of attempted murder is investigated after a sergeant on regular patrol was shot in Wallacedene on Saturday. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama. Hon members, are there any

objections to the motion being read without notice?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. The motion is carried. I now recognise hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you. Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House commiserates with the family, the friends and the comrades of the 55-year-old human rights activist ANC Member of Parliament and judicial reformer, Adv Hishaam Mohamed, who died suddenly on Monday due to a heart attack; and further that this House acknowledges that Adv Mohamed assisted greatly in our country's transformation from starting as a prosecutor to heading the Provincial Department of Justice and Constitutional Reform for almost three decades and played a big role to have mobile courts in certain areas and established in Khayelitsha, Philippi and Nyanga, to give fair access to all vulnerable communities and notes that this servant leader was a Whip for the Justice Committee in the National Assembly and the Constituency Head for the ANC in the Southern Suburbs at the time of his passing. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon the Leader of the Official Opposition. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: No objections. It is a pity the ANC comes so late with it.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon members. No objections. Motion agreed to. Hon members, I now recognise hon Smith. Hon members, I recognise hon Smith. Alright. Let us move to hon the Leader of the Official Opposition.

Mr D SMITH: Speaker. Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Yes, hon Smith?

Mr D SMITH: Can I [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Are you back? You are welcome. Please take the podium, hon Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Apologies, Speaker. I just got disconnected for a period there. I move without notice:

That the House notes the resounding legal victory of one Bulelani Qolani of Khayelitsha supported amongst others by the South African

Human Rights Commission in the High Court against the Cape Metro Council and its anti-land invasion unit, as well as the police to not evict, break down or confiscate occupying residents' property during the COVID-19 lockdown, unless by a valid court order and in which case people must be treated with dignity in accordance with the Constitution; and notes this follows after Bulelani was dragged naked from his shelter and repeatedly assaulted by Metro law enforcement officers; the interdict prescribes minimum force only, the return of Bulelani's building material and a minimum compensation of R2 000 per affected person and lastly, Cape Town must pay the cost of the case. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Object!

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. Hon Smith, there is an objection. The motion will be printed in the Order Paper. I now recognise hon the Leader of the Official Opposition.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, Speaker. I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House commiserates once more with the family, the friends of

the retired provincial politician Mr Piet Meyer who died on Saturday due to pneumonia after two days at the Durbanville Hospital; and further notes the 80-year-old Meyer was a Deputy Speaker of this Legislature, MEC of Health and also Transport and head of South Africa's diplomatic mission to Taipei; that prior to joining the Legislature he served in the Government of National Unity as the Deputy Minister for Agriculture. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon the Leader of the Official Opposition. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: No objection.

The SPEAKER: No – is that an objection?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: No, no. No objection.

The SPEAKER: Oh. Thank you, hon members. No objections. Motion agreed to. I now recognise hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you. Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House notes police are still investigating a Valhalla Park accident on Wednesday when a car ploughed into people killing a 5-year-old boy and injuring another of ten years. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. I now recognise hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you. I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House notes that earlier this month National Treasury released technical guidelines that must be followed by Government departments and public institutions as they prepare the mid-term Budget estimates for the 2021 Budget Process; this is in line with National Finance Minister Tito Mboweni's earlier instruction regarding a zero-based budgeting approach to ensure the effective use of shrinking state resources and requests that the hon MEC of Finance, David Maynier, declares what form will the zero-based budgeting approach take in the province and which areas of spending will be affected and if any consideration will be made to protect the vulnerable and poor during this tight fiscal environment. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection. We will deal that in the second Budget anyway.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon members. Hon Nkondlo, noting the objection the motion will be recorded in the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you. Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House notes a 30-year-old man was killed on Sunday and one of 25 injured when attackers shot at a taxi in Vrygrond. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. Hon members, I now recognise hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you. Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House supports the protest march by black wine businesses

calling for transformation of their industry; reiterates the snail pace of this R49 billion GDP contributor and second biggest exporter of agri-product in our economy to transform, as the reality of 2% black land ownership and 0% black owned cellars continues to hamper any meaningful participation of black wine producers, let alone processing activities in the value chain, and calls on the Competition Commission to undertake a market inquiry to investigate the uncompetitive practice and models in this industry, including if the current business model of black brands realises true meaning of transformation or is just established as historically white owned wine brands bottled with a black name or label. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Object.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Nkondlo. Objection is noted, hon members.

The motion will be printed in the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the most unusual step by the hon Education MEC Debbie Schäfer to issue a circular letter to all and sundry to defend the irregular extension of her Head of Department Brian Schroeder's appointment beyond retirement age and without working through the

Legislature as the constitutional watchdog institute the Public Service Commission, found, and that this is unnecessarily dragging the name of a competent and hard working head of department through the mud. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Objection.

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you hon members. Hon Sayed, there is an objection to your motion, and it will thus be recorded in the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you. Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House applauds efforts in Khayelitsha Sub-district against COVID-19 as already on Level 2 the recorded cases have gone down in this sub-district, thus moving to Level 2 from Alert Level 5, and now sitting at number six of the eight sub-districts of the Metro; further calls on the Ad Hoc Committee on COVID-19 to receive reports and discuss the lessons learnt in this area and to share this with other sub-districts; further notes the situation at the Tygerberg Sub-district that has remained number one since the end of Alert Level 5 to date, with

Eastern and Southern moving up to number 2 and 3 respectively in their reported cases to date and calls for cause for concern and urgent report from both political and administrative champions of these sub-districts as per the Hotspots Strategy in the province and city. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: Speaker, I object [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: ...that it is moved without notice [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: I do not object the [Inaudible.] [Interjections.] thank you, hon members. Alright, thank you [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: How can you object [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you [Interjections.] hon the Minister of Health. Thank you. Hon members, there is an objection. The motion, hon Nkondlo, will be recorded in the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Speaker, can

you hear me? I think I lost connection.

The SPEAKER: Yes. You are connected, hon Sayed. Please proceed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the fact that subsequent to the ANC raising the problems with failed payments over months to a small Boland company for security services at schools in the Cape Winelands, the issue was addressed by the hon MEC Schäfer with remedial action to follow; that the ANC thanks the Minister in the Province and her team and that we encourage further critical yet constructive oversight relations going forward. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. I now recognise hon Nkondlo. Must [Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Yes. Speaker, I think my fourth motion is the one that is still to be decided upon because it was a motion with notice.

The SPEAKER: I will come back to that as we conclude.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Nkondlo. Hon members I recognise hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you. Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the ANC:

That the House notes at least five families of eight victims killed two years ago in an explosion reminiscent of the explosion disaster in Lebanon, have asked the Public Protector to investigate the Macassar events for maladministration, negligence and improper conduct since the killer explosion at that Rheinmetall Denel Munitions plant. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to.

Now, hon members, I wish to announce that Motion number 15 by hon Makamba-Botya – I am going to come back to this one and provide a ruling in the next sitting. There were two motions, one by hon Nkondlo where hon Nkondlo's motion was somewhat mixed up in the motions without notices, whereas it is a motion with notice, or a notice of a motion. I wish to grant

hon Nkondlo the opportunity to deliver the motion with notice. Hon Nkondlo, I recognise you.

Mr N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, I move with notice:

That the House mandates the hon MEC David Maynier to present a full report of the results of the Provincial Government Economic Recovery achieved in all the declared COVID-19 hotspots areas since Alert Level 5 to date. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Nkondlo. Hon members, there was a motion by hon the Leader of the Official Opposition. Having consulted with the Table staff I now rule that the motion is admissible and therefore sustains. The motion is in order and consistent with the Rules of Order.

Now that, hon members, is the last on the motions and that then concludes the business of the day and the House is now adjourned. Thank you very much. Thank you. Thank you, hon Premier and hon members.

The House adjourned at 18:21.