
THURSDAY, 27 JULY 2023

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid Sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:30

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The SPEAKER: Please be seated. Good afternoon, hon members. Before I proceed, I would like to remind members about some of the logistical arrangements. As has been our practise to date, hon members will participate in the Sitting of the House, both from the Chamber with the Presiding Officer and Table staff and via Microsoft Teams. Our Standing Rules have accordingly been amended to accommodate such hybrid Sittings of the House. Hon members experiencing challenges in connecting to the Sitting are requested to contact the WCPP ICT colleagues who will assist to resolve their connectivity challenges.

The quorum requirements for the Sitting of the House are provided for in the Constitution and the Standing Rules. Unless there is an indication of unanimous concurrence, voting will be confined to members present in the House and on the hybrid system, who are entitled to cast their votes as per the ATC issued on 11 August 2020. Members present in the Chamber and via Microsoft Teams have all the privileges and immunities imparted by law. Members who are considered out of order by the Presiding Officers will have their microphones muted and called to order. Members' attendance has been registered.

In instances, hon members, where these directives do not cover a particular eventuality, the Standing Rules must apply, and in instances where the Rules cannot be applied, the ruling by the Presiding Officer is final.

Members, all microphones have been muted. However, I want to remind members participating in this Sitting of the House via Microsoft Teams, you are requested to use the raise-hand functionality when you desire to raise a point of order and I will recognise you. When an hon member in the House wishes to raise a point of order such hon member may address the Presiding Officer as expected, but must mute their microphones when they have completed speaking.

Hon members participating in the Sitting of the House via Microsoft Teams are also requested not to sign into Microsoft Teams on more than one device.

The media have also been granted access to this MS Teams meeting as guests of the WCPP. However, a member of the press may not use the chat room or speak or activate their cameras while the Sitting is in progress. If an individual, who is not a member of this House, activates his/her microphone and video camera, such an individual will be exited from this Sitting immediately.

For this Sitting Language Translation Services are available in the Chamber as usual and on Microsoft Teams via the respective channels.

Hon members, I remind you that no interjections are permitted during these hybrid Sittings, and to this end I wish to draw your attention to Rule 40 of our Standing Rules.

With that being said, we will now proceed to Interpellations as printed on the Question Paper. I recognised the hon Premier for Interpellation 2 on the Order Paper. Thank you.

INTERPELLATIONS

[Interpellation 1 withdrawn.]

2. Mr C M Dugmore asked Mr A R Winde, Premier:

In respect of the Western Cape Government's decision to change the "Face of Government":

- (a) What is the total cost of this and
- (b) What necessitated the change?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Speaker, and thank you very much to the hon Dugmore for the Question.

- (a) Towards improving the Face of Government, at Health, Education and Social Services delivery points in the 2023/24 Budget, the following budget allocations have been made:

Departments of Health and Wellness: R30 million;

Education: R40 million;

Social Development: R20 million.

- (b) As mentioned in my State of the Province Address on 16 February 2023, I have crisscrossed the province over the past year meeting with communities. I also made it a key objective to conduct unannounced service delivery site visits at some of our key institutions which serve the public. What I found was that while many of our clinics, schools, hospitals and social development sites are in good condition, some are in need of a facelift. It is in this financial year that funding has been set aside to aid these departments to make improvements at certain facilities to improve their condition and the overall user experience. This includes works such as painting or new signage, perhaps a window replacement, replacement of furnishings, and general cleanliness. This programme is aligned with the values of the Western Cape Government, which is to

show care to our residents by ensuring that we provide them with dignified service. Due to shrinking national budgets, we cannot unfortunately tackle all the institutions at once and we are therefore focusing this year's allocation to our hotspots and rural areas. We hope that the spend will serve as a catalyst for upliftment and a new sense of pride in these communities, which of course our residents deserve.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. I recognise the hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, Speaker. The ANC wishes to be very clear today. We condemn this exercise because it could well be described as wasteful and fruitless expenditure. Amidst the trying economic times when people are struggling to make ends meet and when more can be pumped into actually ensuring that frontline services operate effectively, this Provincial Government spends this amount of money, R40 million, R30 million, on a facelift. We will come to the real reasons why in a moment.

When we debated the budget earlier this year and in particular Budget Vote 1 of the Department of the Premier, we pointed out that the Premier allocates no money for fighting real battles but spends money on facelifts. We mentioned then and we will continue to state that while fighting GBV by this lead Department of the Premier does not get any funds, his communications machinery for this year certainly got massive funding.

We said then and we will repeat today, this Premier is the weakest Premier this Province has had since 1994 and he needed the more than R70 million this year to prop up his image. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members, order! Order, members! Order, there is a member on the floor. Order, members! Hon Dugmore, you may continue.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: He needed more than R5 million in particular to prop up his image in regard to the Comms Strategy. There was no money for fighting GBV, but R5 million was budgeted for the Premier's PR exercises and today we see where that R5 million budgeted for PR and Communications is going.

The hon Bredell must stop complaining about the little money they received from National Government because PR exercises are what this Provincial Government spends that money on. Cuts to essential services such as Health and Education are directly impacting... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members! Members, there is a member on the floor on the hybrid virtual platform. Please allow the member to make his contribution. Hon Dugmore, you may continue.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, Speaker.

†Dit is duidelik dat die waarheid maak seer. [It's clear that the truth hurts.]

Contracts of nurses are ended, the Blue Dot Programme is ended, but money is pumped into giving this weak Premier's Provincial Government a facelift, cuts to building more houses and delivering basic services to the communities that actually need them, but yet more money into spin and no substance. No money for fighting GBV in this Provincial Government; no money for social workers in our schools, but more money into giving business to companies such as Resolve. Well, the reality is this emperor of a Premier is naked and no amount of PR exercises will save him. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Dugmore. I now recognise the hon Fry.

Mr T FRY (DA): Hon Speaker, it is clear that this Government has cared more for its people ever since 1994. It is clear that this Government cares about the dignity of all its citizens, since 1994, and since 2009 even more so, more than what has ever been done in the 15 years prior to that.

Mr Speaker, the ANC fails to acknowledge that there is a whole-of-society as well as a whole-of-government approach in the name of a Family Strengthening Programme that is headed by the Department of the Premier and includes the Departments of Health and Wellness and Social Development. Mr Speaker, in the face of strong economic headwinds, both from a shrinking economy and constricting and constraining lessening of an Equitable Share, even in the face of these strong headwinds, this Government

has made it its clear objective to provide jobs, to provide safety and to provide dignity and wellbeing to this Government. This is the face of Government and if it means that we constantly evolve the Face of Government to show that we care, then so be it. This Government cares for its people.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Fry. Hon members, I now recognise the hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you. Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, I know the Premier spoke about dignity, and he spoke about "user friendly." I had to intervene not so long ago, where a mother was turned away with a sick child at Bishop Lavis Day Hospital. I got hold of the HOD, sent him a message and he intervened. But Premier, you still have these cases where the child is sick and they are turned back and they, the people panic and this lady said: †"Asseblief, die kind is rêrig siek. Is daar enige iets wat jy kan doen?" ["Please, the child is really sick. Is there anything that you can do?"]

So somebody sent it to me, so we still have these cases where people are turned back coming early hours of the morning, so I just want to know from your side, are you doing anything? We know that people wait for a long time, but when a child is critically ill according to the parent, I am not a doctor, so that is what the parent says, what do we do, so luckily I have the HD on WhatsApp and I could intervene, but there is a lot of people that cannot intervene that do not know what to do.

So what do you do as a government when people complain and say listen, we are turned back, our children are sick. I had the same problem with Karl Bremer where somebody went in and it was too full because if you come late, then you are not going to be assisted so we still have major problems and I know we talk about the budget and you must prioritise, but this is our people that are in dire need, and that is why I am just asking you what your Government is doing. Thank you very much, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians. I recognise hon Dugmore, your second opportunity.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Speaker, allow me now to point out the real reason why the so-called Face of Government had to change. We only need to look to Barrydale and George, where recent by-elections took place. In Barrydale, the ANC took the ward away from the DA. In George the PA won a ward where the DA was confident that they would win and so the DA has to engage in fear politics, fear tactics and move back into their laager thinking.

Finally, the ACDP and the Freedom Front Plus are no longer threats to the DA. They are simply the house poodles in the moon-shot pact but the DA is still losing support, so what do they do? Have a facelift!

†Ek moet, en ons moet verbaas wees dat die *facelift* wat die DA wil hê is die drie kleure van die apartheid Suid-Afrikaanse vlag. Ja, kyk na die kleure. [I

have to, and we must be surprised that the facelift that the DA wants, are the three colours of the apartheid South African flag. Yes, look at the colours.]

Talk about showing your true colours. This is the logo of the facelift, three apartheid, three apartheid flag colours, blue, orange and white. Speaker, the ANC is not surprised that this facelift, instead of going for better, the DA takes the people of the Western Cape backwards, backwards to a divided South Africa, backwards to federalism, backwards to past privileges, backwards to racism and not addressing the real injustices, back to fear tactics such as *swart gevaar*, backwards to the apartheid's flag colours... this Provincial Government. The rest of South Africa must know that the DA will take us back to apartheid. The rest of South Africa must know that the DA is okay with Mr Peter Marais' racism... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...and the only reason why he is not a member of the DA is because some object to the blatant racism of the FF Plus. Well, today both the DA and the FF Plus are in bed together. They are the racist right-wing moon-shot pact together and where they govern they are taking us back to apartheid. We do not need fancy facelifts. We need more teachers, more nurses, more people on the ground servicing the working class and rural communities. The DA with its facelift takes us back to apartheid.

The SPEAKER: Are you done, is that... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes, I have concluded.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore. Hon members, order! Hon Premier, it is now your opportunity.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Speaker, and again to the hon Dugmore for placing the question. I noted that the members across the House that clapped for him after his latest input, are the ones that did not vote for him and that is quite interesting. But, Mr Speaker...

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order, order!

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, what is absolutely clear...

The SPEAKER: Order, members! The Premier is on the floor. It is now the Premier's opportunity to respond.

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, what is absolute, and I have limited time. What is absolutely clear is that Dugmore has lost touch with the people. When last has he been on the ground? [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ...and I want to link this answer... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Monday, Tuesday and Wednesday.

The SPEAKER: Order, members! Hon Dugmore, please, that is out of order. Interjections on the hybrid session, as per Rule 40 is not allowed. Hon Kama, is that a point of order?

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Yes, hon Speaker. I think the Premier is aware that he is supposed to say "hon Dugmore" and not just "Dugmore".

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Kama.

Mr P J MARAIS (FF PLUS): Only if he is honourable.

The SPEAKER: You are quite correct. Hon Premier, all members of the House are hon members. So if you can please refer to the hon member as hon Dugmore.

The PREMIER: Thank you, Speaker. I absolutely apologise and withdraw. It slipped my mind. I thought he was voted out, but he was not out of the seat yet, but the hon Dugmore has lost touch with the citizens of this province. We are citizen-obsessed. We believe in making the biggest difference we can to the citizens of this province and if you go and have a look at our facilities

where we do need a tile replaced or a broken glass window replaced, we must do it because the one thing that the ANC has absolutely messed up with, they have forgotten about maintenance. They have forgotten about making sure that the infrastructure of our country remains in place and is maintained and looked after. They have lost it totally and that is why we have a port that does not work, railway lines that do not work. We have energy systems that do not work... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: The ANC has taken this country to absolute destruction. The hon Dugmore was talking about going forward and not going forward in a pact. The ANC has taken us forward to destruction, taken us forward to total failure and total meltdown and the real thing and the hon Dugmore used this opportunity to reflect on election outcomes. Well, the last test for election outcomes was in George and very interestingly, the election outcome in George in Ward 27, the Official Opposition in this province did not even put a candidate up. In Ward 16 they got a total – they got a total of 31 votes... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ...and of course, let us go and have a look in Ward 20, what did the ANC get? [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: A total of 82 votes. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: They could not even get a hundred votes in the whole of George in three wards!

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, please take your seat. Hon members in the House, can I please ask that you work with me? Hon Premier, I am on the floor. I am addressing the House. Can I please ask that you allow the Premier to make his input? I do not want to stifle debate and interjections, but you are drowning out the speaker.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: A point of order, a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, I will recognise you as soon as I am done. So, can I please ask members that you please allow the members on the floor to make their input. We still have a long way to go through this Sitting so I want to ask your cooperation in the beginning of the Sitting. Hon Dugmore, what is your point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much,

Speaker. Speaker, the point of order relates to the Premier misleading the House. He was reading out election results in the recent by-elections and he claimed that in Ward 20 the ANC got 80 votes. The ANC got 516.

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, what is your point of order, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: That is misleading the House. That is misleading the House.

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, when you raise a point of order, you do not need to justify the point of order. So your point of order was that you deem that the Premier is misleading the House, and that is – if you want to bring any conduct of the member to the attention of the House, please do so as per the Rules. That is not a point of order. Hon Premier, you may continue.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Speaker. So again, I want to reiterate that it is obvious that the hon Dugmore has lost touch with the citizens. We need to make sure that we are investing in Government spaces that offer services to our citizens and that is exactly what we are doing here. From the hon Christians, I absolutely get what he says because you have to get the balance right. You cannot not do maintenance. You cannot not look after your facility because once it goes past a point of no return, the whole place falls to pieces, as we have seen in every other province in South Africa, in anything that the ANC touches. So it is about getting that balance right so a fraction of the over R30 billion budget to the Department of Health goes to

making sure that we have to look after the facility too, because also a doctor must be able to get to work... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ...and feel like this is a place that I want to work and a patient, more importantly, must get to a place and say I am happy that I am getting a great service at this place. We have to make sure, and it is a balance. Of course it is a balance, but that is exactly what this is, and that is what came on the ground, sitting with citizens in waiting benches, in hospitals, or speaking to parents at schools or that is what happens and you have a look and you say we need to increase spend with maintenance and that is how this project came about.

Thank you.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon members, that brings us to the end of Interpellation 2 as printed... Hon Windvogel, do you have a point of order?

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): [No audible reply.]

The SPEAKER: Order members, that brings us to the end of Interpellation 2

as printed on the Question Paper.

I omitted to inform the House at the beginning that Interpellation 1 has been withdrawn so we now move on to Interpellation 3 as printed on the Question Paper. I now recognise the hon Minister, Minister Maynier.

3. Mr M K Sayed asked Mr D J Maynier, Minister of Education:

When will his Department be in a position to:

- (a) Provide information regarding the number of learners who were rejected by the schools they had applied to for the 2024 academic year and
- (b) share the plans it has to ensure that the placement of all learners takes place accordingly?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Speaker. We are making bold investments to improve learning outcomes and expand access to education for children in the Western Cape, which of course is why we will spend R1,2 billion over the next three years on our Back on Track Programme to reverse learning losses, improve learning outcomes and of course give our children a better future, which is why we are implementing our Rapid School Build Programme to deliver additional schools and classrooms across our province faster than ever before. We will spend R2,9 billion this year on expanding access to education, which is why we will spend an additional R68 million specifically to improve our support for learners with Autism Spectrum Disorder, which is why we are spending an additional

R67 million this year on improving the resources available to learners with profound intellectual disability and which is why we are working with the World Bank to support and improve learning outcomes with an Education Sector Analysis, so in the end, Speaker, we are able to deliver on our vision, which of course is to deliver quality education for every learner in every classroom, in every school in the Western Cape.

Now we understand that the admissions process is a stressful one for our parents and we will of course do everything we can to support them as we work to place their children. If there are any parents up in the gallery today or watching we have made provision and ensure that there are officials available downstairs who can chat to you, and so I urge any of you who are struggling to take that opportunity. Turning, of course, to the interpellation, I was a little bit surprised with the specific reference to the timelines given the fact that the hon member announced the answer to his own question earlier this week in a press conference based on information which has been publicly available for months. So I could simply refer the member to himself for the response and quote his own press statement, which is as follows:

"Between 19 July and 31 August 2023, schools review admissions lists and contact parents who applied on the system and still need a place."

But of course, for the benefit of the House, let me repeat our admissions timeline. On time applications closed on 14 April 2023 and parents started to receive offers from 29 May 2023. Schools are able to make offers to parents

until 31 August 2023, and they will then submit their placement lists to the Department. Once that data has been verified, we will then assist the parents who have not received an offer at a school. We of course are still therefore in the first phase of placement, where schools are still offering places to parents and they will continue to do so until 31 August 2023. We are months, months, Speaker, ahead of other provinces because we do want to find places for all the children seeking placement in the Western Cape and so, Speaker, it seems to me that the hon member seems to have jumped the gun. We do understand that the placement process can cause frustration for parents and we ask for their patience as schools continue to make offers. Surely, Speaker, as members, our goal should be to support our parents and to work together rather than trying to manufacture a crisis. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time has expired for your first opportunity. I now recognise the hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, I am firstly very pleased to know that the hon MEC reads my press statements very, very carefully. In fact, I am also even further pleased to know that the Democratic Alliance sent a contingent of, I think, three to four staff members to even attend my press conference so that is really, really – we are really pleased to know. Thank you, very much. [Interjections.] Since the closing... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members! Hon Sayed, please take your seat. Hon members, there is a member on the floor.

Hon Sayed, can you... [Interjections.] Hon members, hon Bakubaku-Vos, I am addressing the House. Can I please ask – members, there is a member on the floor. Hon Sayed, can you please speak to me in order for me to protect you, so, hon members, hon Sayed, over to you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Since the closing of the admissions applications for the 2024 Academic Year the African National Congress in the Western Cape has been inundated with cries for help from desperate parents. I know member Christians has also been inundated and member Cassiem, by desperate parents, who applied correctly and timeously, but the children were rejected by all schools that they applied to. This will surely contribute, hon Speaker, to the unplaced learner crisis, and I emphasise the word "crisis" in the province as thousands of learners will not have placement spaces in schools in the Western Cape, This is why both parents and the learners who have been rejected by all schools they apply to remain anxious and distressed as the school year fast approaches an end.

On numerous occasions, the ANC has sought to get details of how many learners have been placed in schools for the 2024 academic year, how many are yet to be placed from the MEC, and up until now, as we have seen from his first response, he has been ducking and diving, pulling every trick in the book to avoid giving us answers. MEC Maynier and his Department are withholding this information deliberately as they try to hide the depth of the crisis.

The decision by this DA-led Government to withhold the information is a shameful and callous act. Hon Speaker, it is deeply unfair to the parents and learners who are denied information that will help them make informed decisions about the future of their children. The MEC's decision is based on spurious claims which he makes that the process is still ongoing and that schools have until the end of August 2023 to review admission lists and contact parents who applied and still need a place. This argument by the hon MEC Maynier is nonsensical to say the least, as parents of successful applicants were informed of application outcomes, as he has said, from 29 May up until 19 June 2023 and from 20 June 2023 all the systems started to activate the first successful option where parents fail to decide on which school they accepted, and we are making this crystal clear [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): MEC Maynier is clearly able to ascertain... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, your time has expired.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...and as we feel the number of learners... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, your first option... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... that has not been successfully placed... [Microphone muted, time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, I called you three times to remind you that your time has expired. You will have a second opportunity. I now recognise the hon Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Speaker, I thank firstly the Minister for his particular response, but also for the problem for the exceptional work that they are currently doing. The Department is operating months ahead of the schedules established in other provinces. We know that under the WCED schools begin to send out acceptance letters in May. For example, schools in Gauteng will only begin this process on 4 September by which the WCED will already have begun the process of assisting those learners who have not yet received placements offers. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): This means the WCED is ahead of the curve by three months. Parents and learners are kept informed by means of a transparent and responsive system... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...and are able to clearly appeal any

rejections their children might receive, but, Speaker, with this in mind, I find the member's assertions quite ridiculous, from the Opposition. The member refuses to acknowledge the work that the Department has done and the fact that the Department is outstripping provinces where the ANC governs, but perhaps this is unsurprising, since the member and his party voted against the Department's unprecedented and much needed infrastructure in investment, including the R115 million in additional funding the Western Cape received from National Government because provinces such as the Eastern Cape failed to spend the infrastructure money. With this in mind, Speaker, I would like to ask the Minister how many extremely late applications... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...the Department has received for the 2024 school year and what impact these extremely late applications will have on the placement process. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Baartman. I recognise the hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, Speaker. Minister, I do agree that the placing of learners is in the first phase and that it concludes on 31 August 2023, but, Speaker, my biggest concern still is children in disadvantaged communities that want better education because of gangs, drugs and all these problems we have in those communities, when those parents apply to improve the education of their children in other suburbs, they are refused, and I still

have a problem, Minister, when you have Bonteheuwel for example, you have three high schools there, only one of the high schools offers pure Maths and that is the limit placed on that community.

I want to know, Minister, what is your Department doing and I mean, we engage with your Department on a regular basis, they assist where they can, but when somebody applies in Mitchells Plain and we are waiting, Mitchells Plain to five schools, and rejected at five schools, it is a problem. It is a problem, so there is specifically a problem when it comes to people that want to apply outside of the area because the subjects are not offered or they are scared for the safety of their children, so, Minister, please, it is not the first time I am asking that. I have asked it before, what is being done for the child that is looking for a better future being rejected at schools outside of their area? I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians, I recognise hon Cassiem. Hon Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM: Yes, Speaker, thank you. Since the beginning of the Sixth Parliament, the Western Cape Education System has been regressing with the Premier of the Province chopping and changing MECs for Education as a result of incompetence. Things are even getting worse under the current MEC who runs a dysfunctional Education Department. The Provincial Government uses 90% of its time to compare itself to other provinces, yet they cannot explain why they occupied fourth place when it comes to the 2022 Matric

results. Every time when things are not going well for this Education Department, then the blame is placed on the Eastern Cape along the lines of semigration. Speaker, the current DA Provincial Administration does not have a competent individual who can run this Department and this is frustrating to parents every year as they need to fight the Department when it comes to learner placement.

Speaker, the learner placement system also has elements of racism but this is normal under this DA-led Administration. The majority of former Model C Schools appear to operate with what seems to be racial quotas in making sure the majority of white people are placed in or other white learners are placed in these schools while Black and Coloured learners will be told that it is full and placement will be made available for them in township schools. This has especially been made clear when Black or Coloured learners are told that the school is full only for the same school to admit the number of White learners later.

Speaker, even our Black learners from leafy suburbs who want to be admitted into former Model C Schools are given placements in township schools but the same does not happen with White learners. The question then arises, why are White learners not placed in township schools? Having said that, Speaker, can this Department explain who makes the determination regarding the number of learners who should be in each class and where the learner-to-class ratio is the same between former Model C Schools and township schools. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Cassiem. Hon Sayed, your second opportunity.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much Hon Speaker, Hon Speaker, firstly, allow me to respond to member Baartman. I think it is quite disingenuous to now decide to shift the focus to late applications. We are dealing here with applications that were made on time. That is typical of the DA to shift the focus and run away from responsibilities. Also, other provinces that she may be referring to have fared better than our province in terms of the Matric results; that just on the side.

Whilst I thank the MEC for his response it is unfortunate that he still refuses to make this information public. The decision by the MEC and his Department is irresponsible as he prevents this House as an oversight body as well as parents and other education stakeholders from knowing about the depth of the unplaced learner crisis for the 2024 Academic Year. This information is crucial for the whole of society approach which the hon Premier often refers to, as together with the Department, parents and other stakeholders we can work to find meaningful solutions to the crisis and yes, hon Baartman, we do give the Department credit when credit is due and we actually assist them and they are grateful for that assistance. The ANC is simply calling on the MEC and his Department to be transparent about the number of unplaced learners, including the reasons for the crisis and to hold to account those responsible for the poor planning and the glitches around the

learner application process in the province. The DA thinks nothing of transparency and accountability. The ANC will continue to fight for a transformed and quality education system that benefits all in the province. The MEC must release the figures of learners who have been placed, learners who have been accepted in all schools as of today, as well as those who have not yet been accepted and have not even been responded to, no decency to even respond to them. In addition, he must make public his plans to ensure that all learners are placed in schools.

Finally, we commend the various education activists, civil society formations, our ANC branches, our alliance partners for taking up the fight to ensure that no child must be left behind. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Sayed. Hon Minister Maynier?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I would like to begin where I ended and again remind members that we are still in the first phase of placement where schools are offering places to parents and of course they will continue to do so until 31 August 2023.

We are months ahead of other provinces and what seems to me what is

clear... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...is that the hon member has jumped the gun and indeed his true intention appears to manufacture a crisis where none exists. I would like to thank the hon Baartman for her reference to late applications. Already in the 2024 admission cycle, we have received 30 000 late applications... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...which makes it very difficult to manage the admissions process. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Of course, what makes it very difficult is the extremely late applications which offering occur in the last three months of a year.

In the first three months of 2023, we received 4000 extremely late applications, many of those applications in fact occurring well after the school gates had opened, and that does cause a challenge for the Department. We are not sure how many extremely late applications we will receive.

We are unsure about what grades, languages and ages of the learners who will be applying, and we are not certain of the specialised subjects or indeed the special needs of the learners and this is a challenge in our planning and so I really would like to appeal to parents and guardians who may not have applied to please immediately apply for a place at a district office. Of course, the hon Sayed raises the question of transparency and says that I am ducking and diving. Of course, exactly the opposite is true. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: In 2023, I committed to being transparent on the admissions system and the hon member will recall that we submitted a detailed report to the Standing Committee on Education and we released at least seven detailed statements during the admissions, a period which provided very detailed information on both our admission system and our Rapid School Build, and I will certainly be doing something very similar for the 2024 admissions cycle.

The hon Ferlon Christians raises a very good question, but of course he will be aware that we do not have declared feeder zones in this province, unlike, of course, many other provinces in our country, which expands the opportunities and the schools to which learners can apply, so a learner in Mitchells Plain can of course apply to many of the good schools in Mitchells Plain, but is also able to apply to schools outside Mitchells Plain.

Now the hon Sayed opened saying that I paid very close attention to his press statements, which of course I do, because they are so often flawed and full of fiction.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time has expired, please conclude.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: He claimed in his press statement that one parent... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon Sayed, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): A point of order, Chair, you indicated that the hon Minister's time is up, so he should be done. He should not continue.

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, hon members! Hon Sayed, the same latitude to conclude that I gave and afforded to you I am affording to the Minister. Minister, please conclude.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much, Speaker. The hon member claimed that a learner had been rejected by multiple schools. The truth... [Inaudible.] statement carefully and do your research, what we actually find that the learner was in fact afforded a place... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: A point of Order.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...one and a half months ago.

[Time expired.] [Interjection.]

[Debate concluded.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: On a point of order, a point of order! Order! Order!

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister, please take your seat. Your time has expired.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: A point of order.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon members. That brings us to the end of Interpellations as per Rule 197. We will now move over to Questions for Oral Reply as per Rule 202, but before we begin, I would wish to advise hon members that once the hon Premier or a Minister has started the reply to the oral question as printed on the Question Paper, hon members must use the chat facilities online for the Sitting to indicate that they want to ask a follow-up question and hon members in the Chamber to please give an indication to the Table staff if you so wish to.

There are four opportunities to follow-up questions, but the hon member who has posed the initial Oral Question, as printed on the Question Paper, will have the first opportunity for the follow-up question. Thereafter other hon members may then use the remaining opportunities, if they so wish. On the first oral question, it is over to you, hon Premier.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

New question to the Premier:

1. Mr M Kama asked Mr A R Winde, Premier:

In the light of the world's celebration of Nelson Mandela Day on 18 July 2023:

- (a) What are the Provincial Government's programmes and efforts to rekindle the legacy of Nelson Mandela and to ensure that his legacy is not lost and
- (b) What is the Provincial Government doing to enhance his legacy of hope, reconciliation, social cohesion and unity?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Speaker, for the opportunity and thank you very much to the hon Kama for the question. The Western Cape Government promotes the founding provisions of the South African Constitution and its guiding values of human dignity, the achievement of equality and the promotion of human rights and freedoms.

Former President Nelson Mandela embodied this when he stated:

"I have cherished the ideals of a democratic and free society in which all persons live together in harmony and with equal opportunities."

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, continue.

The PREMIER: It seems as though the ANC does not believe that that is what he said.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): [Inaudible.] Why does the Premier always claim, why does he quote that?

The PREMIER: All departments have initiated various programmes to ensure that Nelson Mandela's values are embodied and embedded in the interest... [Inaudible, speaking simultaneously.] in all communities across the province.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, please take your seat. Hon members, there is a member on the virtual platform. Can I just ask the Table staff to please ensure that all microphones are muted, and then also members in the Chamber, again, I ask for your indulgence, when a members is on the floor. I do not want to stifle the interjections in the Chamber, but you must please work with me to allow the member on the floor to have an opportunity to make his or her submission. Hon Premier, over to you. My apologies for the interruption.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. In the hon Kama's question he specifically references words like "legacy of hope." If ever there was a province that is instilling hope in citizens of South Africa, it is this province. Reconciliation, social cohesion and unity and I will give a reply on those because he has asked it across our Government, but also if I think about just my own Department and my own very office and what we did together as a team recognising Tata Madiba on Mandela Day, going into this, going into service spaces in society where we engage with citizens, but where we arrived in our boots and our overalls and we got stuck into cleaning and we got stuck into helping to make sure that those service sites are better able to deliver services to our citizens.

So Part B is a comprehensive answer to their 24 pages of this, and I think I will start to read some of the items, but of course the hon member knows that that this full answer is handed out to the Parliament, but, for example, DCAS, and if I think about social cohesion, which falls under the social cohesion space and DCAS which is continuing to increase its footprint in the after-schools programme, 346 schools now up to 515 schools, and, depending on the on the year, up to 49 000 young people involved in these after-school programmes, which is about social cohesion, but it is also about caring, it is about understanding. We have to get young children opportunities to help them make sure that they can live in an opportunity-driven society.

Childcare and child protection, if we look at the DSD Department, 12 914 children placed in foster care, 1059 were reunited with their families, 10 517

parents and caregivers completed parent education and training programmes, again under the social cohesion, unity and reconciliation lead.

If we look at the work that the Chrysalis Academy does under DOCS again here, if you think about hope, absolutely. If I think about the thousands of young people who over the years have had opportunity through the Chrysalis Academy, these are young people coming out of our most vulnerable communities, given an opportunity not only at the Academy in training in various areas to help them into the future, but then of course helping them with a stipend and a position in Government, if ever there was anything that gives hope to a young person, this programme does exactly that. Madiba would be very proud. In DCAS, community based sports and culture programmes and of course that again, social cohesion, 35 702 youth participated in these opportunities this last year.

If we look at DOCS again, Community Safety partners supported this again, social cohesion, and you can go to your area-based teams across this province exactly reaching in to making this difference. It was in that ideal and so we have the Department of Mobility deploying additional traffic and highway patrol officers into areas where we really need to make the biggest difference, and, again using technology and innovation, but when you bring it all together, what does it do? It brings hope to citizens because we are dealing with a serious issue but at the same time, making a difference in society.

The Department of Agriculture, through the Rural Safety Plan, social cohesion, again, DSD and their programmes there, 70 504 families participated in family preservation and support services. DSD has supported DOTP and other departments in co-designing norms, standards and strengthening evidence, informed family strengthening programmes that would help families across our whole province, again, social cohesion. And, Mr Speaker, I could go on and on, from the first thousand days to expert teams focused on safe spaces, to national drug master plans in social cohesion and hope, to informal settlement programmes, mapping serious violent crime and so we go on 24 pages.

I am not going to go into each and every one of them, but across every single department, embedded in exactly those words that were raised in the question from the hon Kama, so hon Kama, thank you very much for that question and it is always good to see from a question like that exactly what is happening across this province. I am pretty certain that Madiba would be very proud of these actions. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. I now recognise the hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you very much, Speaker. I think let me appreciate the response of the Premier, and especially that he speaks about the founding provisions of the Constitution and in reality is that the structure of the economy in the Western Cape has not changed since 1994 and it is

untransformed. Social inequality and special segregation still persist and in recognising the legacy of Nelson Mandela, I can also say without doubt that Nelson Mandela would not be proud that he spent 67 years in prison for what the Premier was saying. But I want to understand what programmes has this Government put in place, including specific annual targets to address spatial segregation and social inequalities like income gap, gender inequality and disparities in the education and healthcare system. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Speaker, I am really tempted to read this whole document to the hon Kama, but I am not going to do that and it is interesting how obviously the hon Kama sits in this very House and if I think about a very similar question asked last time with details around the difference that has been made and sure, I too am saying 30 years into democracy in our country, we definitely have not done enough. We definitely have not changed sufficiently, but you know what disappoints me is that the province that has the lowest Gini coefficient is this province. The province with the most jobs are created is this province. The province with the lowest unemployment rate in South Africa is this province... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ...and the hon member says that Tata Madiba would not be proud! I promise you what Tata Madiba would not be proud of, is how the

ANC is failing every single citizen of this province and how the ANC are failing in the other provinces so badly... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ...and I really would like hon members from the ANC...

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

The PREMIER: ...when they stand up in this House, to tell us where we are failing and where they are succeeding and give us an example in one other province of where they are making a massive difference, where they are making big change. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: Give us one province, this province's track record is way better than any other ANC province and I do not discount that we have got a long way to go still. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: Many people have got to feel the real difference in this new South Africa, but that is why we do what we do. That is why we have a Safety Plan because the ANC has failed us in South Africa and the people of

this province. That is why our Jobs For Growth Plan ...[intervenes]

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, please take your seat. Hon members, the Premier is responding to a question that was posed to him. If you want to ask a follow-up question there is an opportunity as per the Standing Rules, but this constant interjections are drowning out the speaker and will not be tolerated.

My apologies, Premier, for the interruption, please continue.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, maybe I do not have to speak so loudly if it is a bit quieter in the room.

That is why our Jobs For Growth Plan, a bold, ambitious plan that is pushing the boundary further than ever before because we need to make sure that every single citizen in this province has an opportunity, as per the question.

So the question about creating opportunity and what Madiba said himself in a place where everyone has an opportunity. That is why we are busy with programmes that the Minister of Education has just spoken about, catch-up programmes. Not happening in one other province. That is why we do what we do and we push those boundaries harder and further than ever before in an environment where our budgets are put under such pressure. Why? Because the ANC cannot even keep the lights on in South Africa. We get downgraded and of course it is a very difficult environment in which to do this, but this

province is showing that it can be done despite the ANC. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon members! Hon members, hon members. Hon members on my left-hand side. I have been very patient and I have been trying to not stifle debate interjections. Hon members, I am now asking you for the last time to please observe the decorum of the House and apply the Rules or adhere to the Rules, and when a member is on the floor to allow that member to make their input. Whether you agree with it or not, the Rules provide for you to raise your hand and to pose a follow-up question if you do not agree with the response that you are getting.

Hon members, just for noting, the next person would be hon member Fry and then, hon member Kama, I noted you have a follow-up question. Are there any further follow-ups to this question? Hon member Fry.

Mr C FRY: Hon Speaker, thank you very much. Thank you to the Premier for the answer. I would like to know, given Tata Madiba's legacy and the values of this Government, where would the Premier see the congruency between the values of this Government and Tata Madiba on what he stood for? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Fry, we were struggling to hear you in the Chamber. May I please ask that you repose your question.

Mr C FRY: Is that better, hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Ja, much better, thank you.

Mr C FRY: Thank you. I would just like to know from the Premier, given the values of this Government and the values of Nelson Mandela, where would he see the congruency between the values of this Government and the values of Madiba. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Fry. Hon Premier, did you get that?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much and it is nice that the hon member Fry refers to values, because I think that is a big issue in South Africa. We, across our country, need to really think about all of our values and that is why in this Government we spend so much time focusing on values and that is the whole point around having a culture journey, because a value of caring, because we are citizen-obsessed, a value of responsiveness because we are citizen-obsessed. You know, we really take our values, embed them in what we do because at the end of the day we are a government and we are a government that has been elected to serve the people to the best of our abilities and when we do that, I think we do that exactly when I say these words that I quote from former President Mandela:

"I have cherished the ideal of a democratic and free society in

which all persons live together in harmony and with equal opportunities."

We need equal opportunities in our society, we need harmony, we need a democratic and free society, not a society held captive by crime and especially held captive by poverty and held captive by economics that really are not enabled because of really seriously failing ANC policy.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, although my first question was not responded to, but let me ask this question, hon Speaker, because it is the very same Tata Nelson Mandela that said the DA will remain a party of White bosses and Black stooges, and quite recently the latest Black victim of the DA, Speaker Mnqasela, said the DA does not believe there was apartheid.

Now I want to understand, because in terms of youth unemployment in the Western Cape, 96% of them are Black Africans and Coloureds. Now how is this Government - because you said that you believe in the founding provisions of the Constitution whose preamble says we adopt the Constitution to heal the divisions of the past - how are you in the Western Cape as a Government ensuring that you intervene and have programmes and which programmes are you having? Surely a EPWP programme, a first time opportunity, work opportunity, will not change the economy of this province.

Now what programmes are you having in place to ensure that these young Black Africans and Coloureds, who actually have hope in the Western Cape, that in the future they will not be a face of crime, a face of unemployment and a face of all the social ills that we find in our society? Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Kama. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. I am going to refer the hon member Kama to a document, it is 196 pages long. It is called "G4J" and it is on our website and that is exactly, exactly an opportunity document with bold, bold targets of a trillion rand economy, where everybody in this economy has an opportunity and specifically young people in our economy have an opportunity.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon members, this is the last opportunity. I recognise the hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: No, thank you very much, hon Speaker. Now what I want to understand, hon Speaker, is that the very same President Nelson Mandela is quote to have said that racism must be opposed by all means that humanity has at its disposal.

Now I want to understand because whether through the media or different

parts of the media, we continue to realise that apartheid and racism tendencies in the Western Cape are very high and now I want to understand from the Premier in terms of these Government programmes and the vision-inspired priorities, how has his Government sought to address the issue of racism? Are there any specific programmes that are happening in this province to tackle racism? Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I allowed you some latitude, there was more than just one follow-up. Hon Premier, I am not going to dictate how you answer that. Order, hon members. Hon Premier, over to you.

The PREMIER: Every single programme is about how do we get redress right, how do we fix the faults of the past. Fix apartheid which destroyed so many people's opportunities in this country and that is exactly what needs to be focused on, but I will say one thing to the hon member Kama, that the ANC 30 years [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members! The Premier is trying to respond to a question that was posed. Hon member Bans, you will have an opportunity in the second question. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. 30 years into our democracy nothing to show for it and at the end of the day they are going to be voted out next year, and talking about that and quoting Tata Madiba, I will tell you one quote that he did say:

"If the ANC Government treats you the same way that the apartheid Government treated you, vote them out of power."

That is what is happening next year.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon members, that brings us to the end of Question 1 on the Question Paper. We move on [no sound on audio.] we will now move on to Question 2 printed on the Question Paper for oral reply. Hon Premier, I recognise you.

2. Ms A P Bans to ask Mr A R Winde, Premier:

In the light of the recent celebration of the International Day of Criminal Justice, a day to promote the rights of crime victims and to highlight the importance of upholding justice: (a) What is the Provincial Government doing to support this important day and (b) how has his Government supported the oppressed people of Palestine in their quest for freedom, peace and justice?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much and thank you very much to the hon member Bans. No formal celebration was held in the Western Cape in recognition of International Day of Criminal Justice. However, the Western Cape Safety Plan aims to tackle crime and reduce the number of victims, i.e. the Violence Prevention Programme, and provide services to victims of crime

around the whole year and not just on one day.

The plan may be found on our website and please, I urge you to go and have a look at it and then (b), no, and we do not take formal positions on anything and everything around the world. We do take formal positions on issues around the world that really talk to safety of our citizens, jobs or losing of jobs of our citizens, or anything that has any impact on the dignity or well-being of our citizens. Then we will definitely take a position. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon member Bans.

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, it is clear that the Premier and his Provincial Government care less about the people of Palestine, they care more about the blue eyes and the blond hair of Ukraine and less about the Palestinians. Palestinian people have been living for more than 56 years under Israel occupation ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Ms A P BANS: ... more than 56 years Palestinians have been living under the occupation of Israel, but I know, hon Speaker, we know that the hon Premier will not condemn the apartheid state of Israel as he has been condemning the Russians.

So when will he meet the Palestinians and pledge solidarity with them? I just

wanted to check that. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Bans. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: I am not planning to meet them or pledge anything, but interesting that the hon member Bans talks about Israel and I wonder what her behind the scenes conversation is like with their coalition partners who are in Israel at the moment looking at coalition governments.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon members, are there any further follow-ups? I recognise the hon member Fry – hon members, there is an opportunity if you have one follow-up question. There is no need to ask questions by not raising your hand, but if you do not use that process as part of the Rules, you are out of order. So I now recognise hon member Fry.

Mr C FRY: Thank you, hon Speaker. Thank you for the hon Premier for his answer. I just wanted to know, given the plan that is outlined, has there been any collaboration between the Western Cape Government and the Department of Justice and Constitutional Development in advocating the plan? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Fry. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. Yes, that is one of the areas that I

think we still have a lot of work to do. I know that from the Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety's point of view in the platform, we really look at how to work together far more closely in the full criminal justice system. Of course this again is an area that is not a mandate of the Province, but of course crime and, you know, the criminal justice system is an area that is of great concern because we do not seem to be getting a handle on crime in South Africa. We need to have a different policing model, but we also need to make sure that in the criminal justice system specifically, that we are putting away criminals that need to be put away, that we actually tighten up that system because definitely your percentage chance of getting caught is so slim, and then once you are caught the percentage chance of getting a conviction is slim again and there are a lot of questions to be asked there and of course we need to make sure that we build that collaborative environment to raise these issues that are of huge concern to every single citizen in this province.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon members, are there any further follow-ups? Hon member Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Speaker. I just want to check with the hon Premier from his response if he does recognise that in Palestine there are families that are related to some of the citizens here in the Western Cape and does it bother him as he said that he will speak on any matters that affect citizens of the Western Cape?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Nkondlo. Hon members, I just want to remind you that oral questions are linked to an executive's role and constitutional responsibilities as per the office that they hold. Opinions and members' opinions cannot be posed. Hon Premier, I am not going to lead you into your answer. I am going to allow you to respond whichever way you deem necessary.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much and I am concerned for every single citizen in this province, I am absolutely obsessed about making sure that we give the best service possible to the citizens. So I look forward to the email from the hon member Nkondlo with the names of those citizens so I could interact with them.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier, and the last opportunity is hon member Bans.

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. I think in last year we had a celebration in this building of lighting candles for the Ukraine. It happened here, hon Speaker. I just wanted to check to which extent does your interest have to stretch for you to be acknowledged as a friend of this Provincial Government? Because Ukraine was celebrated here? What makes it different for Palestine? If I can get an answer to that. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Bans. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. I can assure the hon member and of course this House, it is the full House, the Parliament, we were not doing a celebration of Ukraine, we were actually standing up in solidarity with a country who was being illegally invaded in an illegal war, where right now we know that we are getting closer and closer to 30 000 children who have been abducted and of course I think we need to also understand the impact, because remember I said earlier that we will take a position if we know that impact is going to be hunger, the impact is going – because what is the impact on our citizens?

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: We know that our citizens are being impacted by this war. We know that food inflation is driven by this war. We know ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order, hon members! Hon Premier, please take your seat. Hon Premier, please take your seat.

Hon members, the hon Premier was posed a question, he is now responding. If you do not agree or do not like the content of the reply, that does not mean that the hon member cannot answer the question. I mean we are getting to a point now where the decorum of this House is being being compromised and I am not going to tolerate that. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. So obviously that is why this House must have taken this decision. It was not my decision, it was a decision of the House and that happened in this very House as the decision of the House. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon members. Hon members, that concludes Question 2. We will now move over to Question 3. Hon Premier.

3. Ms A Cassiem to ask Mr A R Winde, Premier:

(a) How far is the Province in rolling out the emergency load-shedding kits to poor households in the province, (b) how many households have benefitted so far from this project and (c) where should indigent households register to make sure that they also receive these kits?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much and thank you very much to the hon member Cassiem for the question.

The tender to appoint a service provider to supply and distribute rechargeable lighting units with USB charging capabilities to identified beneficiaries throughout the Western Cape, has been advertised. Upon closing, the various supply chain management processes will have to be followed. Upon conclusion the contract will be awarded to the successful bidder.

(b) An estimated 400 000 loadshedding packs will be distributed to five

beneficiary groups in the Western Cape. These are as follows: rechargeable lighting unit with USB charging. We are looking at supplying to 23 084, that is matric pupils, in Quintiles 1 to 3, schools of 1 to 3 Quintile, residents of the Western Cape Government, Department of Social Development (DSD) funded frail care centers and assisted independent living facilities. That is 10 229 persons with disabilities in DSD facilities, that is 1 647.

And then (c), the loadshedding packs will be provided to indigent residents who are currently registered on the municipal indigent registers in the 24 local municipalities and the City of Cape Town. Indigent registers are compiled annually through the municipal processes that are updated and only households registered on the indigent registers of the various municipalities will benefit.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon member Cassiem on the virtual platform.

Ms A CASSIEM: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Premier, so does this mean that your promise that indigent households will get electricity loadshedding kits by winter in 2023, was this an empty promise like you did when you told the country that Western Cape will procure its own COVID-19 vaccines, which never materialised? Seeing that you are saying that they still need to get those kits? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Cassiem. Hon member Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. Obviously I wish I could bypass supply chain and go directly, but of course we must follow proper processes and I am seriously hoping that in the next couple of weeks, this will be completed and handed to households during this winter.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. I recognise hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Could the hon Premier give a specific date? We have seen, for example, that BMWs are standing idle for over seven months now. So when the Premier says a few weeks, I would like to ask him could you please give an accurate date for when these packs, in fact the over 500 000 packs, will actually reach their destination? Could the Premier commit to a specific date of delivery and when all deliveries will be completed?

The SPEAKER: Hon members, hon Premier, before you respond, can I just once again remind members that you are allowed one follow-up question based on the Rules that we all agreed to.

So, hon Premier, once again I am not going to dictate how you answer that, but one follow-up question for all the other questions that are going to follow.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much the hon member Dugmore for the question. The answer is no, and the second part, he must listen, it is 400 000 and not 500 000.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon member Fry.

Mr C FRY: Thank you, hon Speaker. Thank you very much to the hon Premier for that answer. How will we ensure that the quality of these packs are of a standard that is acceptable to the citizens that need it so desperately? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Fry. Hon Premier, did you get that?

The PREMIER: Yes, I did, thank you very much, and obviously this is the difficulty in an open procurement process because you have got to put a bid together, you have first got to identify who has got to get it. Then you have got to put the bid together and of course we want to give as much as we can with the limited funding that we do have, but we only will really know this when the market responds to say yes, we can deliver X and, you know, it has got to be something that is going to last, it has got to be something that is going to manage at least a few hours of loadshedding.

Obviously at loadshedding level 8 or whatever, that might be something different, but the procurement is within the current framework of 4 to 6

loadshedding levels and will it be able to help a matriculant study for the upcoming exams, because we cannot allow the failure of the giving electricity to our citizens and that loadshedding really, to impact heavily on the outcomes of our matriculants, or the elderly or the disabled or the different categories that have been identified.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon members, are there any further follow-ups?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Yes, hon Speaker, I did indicate on the chat that I have another one.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, please pose your question.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Speaker. Could the hon Premier please indicate in terms of the specifications of the procurement, what is the average unit cost of these particular emergency kits?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Dugmore. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: The point of a procurement process is to ask the market what they can supply. I do not know that until the procurement is completed. I would have thought the hon member Dugmore would have known that by now. So I do not know yet. That is why we have gone out to market. When it comes back we then have to make a decision on, yes, it is within a range

and we can get it done, but we have got to wait for the tender to come back.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon members, that concludes Question 3 on the Question Paper. Just for the record, we now move on to Question 7 under Questions standings over from 20 July 2023, as agreed to by the House. I recognise the hon, hon Minister Mbombo.

Questions standing over from Thursday, 20 July 2023, as agreed to by the House

7. Ms R Windvogel to ask Dr N Mbombo, Minister of Health and Wellness:

- (1) (a) In which regions was the NHI piloted in the province and (b) what are the successes and challenges of each pilot project;
- (2) whether her Department has plans to conduct an independent impact assessment of the NHI pilot projects; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, hon member Windvogel, for the question about the NHI pilot, but I was not sure because the NHI has three phases.

Phase 1 was in 2012/2017. So that one evaluation was done by National, I

think probably you do have an access of that.

So Phase 2, which is now 2017/18 to 2022/23 is the one that I am responding to, which is the main focus for now, the pilot is about a contracting unit for primary health care, which is CUPS, of which each and every province has been provided in terms of where they will want to pilot it. For us in the Western Cape for the CUPS we are doing it in the Knysna, Bito sub-district.

The whole overall aim is to ensure that you get the demographics of a place correctly and then you also work together, because the whole issue of the whole of society work together with the public, the private, the civil society, non-profit organisations is crucial in that defined geographical area, it is part of the lessons learnt and it is exploratory in nature. That is why for each and every province the ideal is about the need to develop its own CUPS plan based on their own understanding.

What we have taken into consideration, because the framework was development December 2022, we have to consider about seven things, which are:

- The scoping of the existing services, which already we have worked out, although we started this year.
- Health information systems, because it means that every service provider in that particular area will end up using more or less the same system.

- The CUPS, which is the CUPS governance. At this stage we do not know exactly what does it mean.
- Accreditation, because some of them might not necessarily have been providing service, especially the civil society or the NPOs because they need to be accredited.
- Service delivery model, we do not know exactly when we are all combined under the same roof in that space, what does it entail and then how the communication will be.
- Workforce matters, especially in the context where in the other area the other service provider might have been accredited for something else, but only to find that actually they do not have the staffing that is required to deliver that service.
- Of course lastly the legal implications, because currently health, everyone is using the public services. If you want to sue or complain, the system says that it is the Executive who is responsible for that, but now if it is going to be provided, service is going to be provided by someone else, the NPO, they will be referred there, who is going to take the responsibility for that.

So I am responding on Phase 2, which is the CUPS. Thanks.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise hon member Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, we recently

visited the Southern Cape, the Garden Route, and we got a flowing feedback about the NHI pilot.

Now my question, hon Speaker, to the Western Cape Government, to our MEC, because she made it clear on numerous occasions that it does not support the NHI, it rather supports the objective of universal health coverage.

Now I want to understand from the MEC that given these success stories of the NHI in the Western Cape, has there been a change from her Government in terms of supporting the NHI? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Windvogel. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: I think the hon member is asking two different things. There is now NHI, which already is in the NCOP as part of the legislation.

Therefore whatever legislation that gets passed anywhere, which becomes South African legislation, in terms of the Constitution when we say that we swear to uphold the Acts and everything related to the South African Government, we do, we respect the rule of law. There is a difference around that.

Secondly, which is still, because it is a '76 Bill, so it is still going to be discussed. I think it is going to be presented here among the SC.

Now on the issue of a health reform, which is what as a party the ANC came up with as part of their resolution, which is where they say they want to implement. We made a contribution because it is a health reform, before even Phase 1 of the pilot, that is why the 10 areas where they used in the first pilot, which is the ward-based primary healthcare teams, school health, the GP contracting, the Ideal Clinic, district clinical specialist teams, centralised chronic medication dispensing, health patient records, stock visibility and availability, the infrastructure, the workload, it means that we had an opportunity to tweak whatever needs to be tweaked. For example, if they are saying in Eden, because it was Eden for Phase 1, the pilot; when they say in Eden we are going to build or extend Pacaltsdorp, we are going to extend Blanco – I am making an example because I have recently come from there.

So you are not going to say no, because it is part of your thing, it is because Blanco needs to be extended. So if they are going to say that we are giving you those buses for the school health programme, these are required, whether there is an NHI, whether there is no NHI.

So one of the changes, for example, of the GP contracting, we did it our own way, we did not do it their way, because we do need sessional doctors who will come to the clinic at certain times, but instead of centralising them where it is going to be managed in Pretoria at the time, we said, "Give us that money, we will do it ourselves so that they become part of the team." The district specialists team is actually what I was paid to be a consultant for at

the time for the National Department of Health, focusing on the maternal and child health, because that was my programme.

So when we came to the Western Cape at the time, it was not there for them to sell, they said we want another way around because we want those specialists to be part of a regional hospital, provincial hospital, so that, for example, if they are in Paarl they can do the outreach for the whole of the Winelands instead of where they are sitting somewhere, maybe here in Cape Town, and then they are being called in a specific area [Inaudible.] because they wanted them to be part of the team.

So my point is just because we are not necessarily supporting it, noting NHI is a money bill, it is about money; it does not say anything about universal health coverage.

What South Africa needs is a universal health coverage where nobody has to pay for service. It is an affordability, there is no point, I mean money exchanged at the point of service, where it reaches out to everybody. There is no one anywhere in the world who could say no to UHC. We are saying no to NHI because it focuses on the funding without necessarily looking at strengthening the whole health system.

So you need to understand that what is it that we are saying no to, but if it so happened that it ended up being passed, it will be South African legislation. It means we respect the rule of law, but we will do our own way where it has

to make sure that we strengthen the health system, it does not leave Auntie Sarah behind. Thanks.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, are there any further follow-up questions? Hon member Windvogel and then hon member Bans and hon member Maseko, and that is in that order.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I try to understand from the *Tannie Sarah's* point of view what the hon Minister have just said. We do not need a NHI, meaning that the Auntie Sarah will never be helped. Get the – no-no ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members ...[Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: ... the Auntie Sarah at the moment is turned away from facilities because it is too full, there is not enough space. That is what is happening at the moment with the Auntie Sarahs and the hon Minister is saying that is the way to go, because she is saying we are already doing that. We are already implementing the Universal Health Coverage, but nevertheless, hon Speaker, I want to check with the hon Minister the possibility because she mentioned that they are doing their way, the possibility of the Western Cape to use its own funds to extend the NHI pilot to other districts in the same as the KwaZulu Natal did when it used its own funds to expand the NHI to a third district. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Windvogel. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Okay. I think before I answer the question, I also need to respond to the remark. We did not say where things are that they are perfect. They are not. Like we have just not been even given R1,5 million, the shortage of our budget. It is not and there are more people who are the third populace. It is not. That is why we are saying that it is a UHC, not NHI.

NHI will not make Auntie Sarah to access the bed, it will not, it will not.

The SPEAKER: Hon members!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: I think the doctors, the [Inaudible.] they even indicated it will not. What needs to happen is we must ensure equity and all of those. So the South Africa ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon members, this constant conversating with the hon Minister while she is responding, is unparliamentary. Hon member Bans, you are asking the hon Minister while she is responding. You have been acknowledged, you will have an opportunity to do so.

Hon members, this is the last time I am asking to please cooperate and respect the member on the floor.

Yes, this is a warning for the whole House. Hon Minister, my apologies, please continue.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Let me use an example because we have been speaking about Auntie Sarah. Let me just probably, through you, hon Speaker, demonstrate how I present the UHC we want to take to the Auntie Sarahs as the health users.

I will say that currently we have got a situation where others will be like driving a Benz, others will be driving a Toyota, others riding on a bicycle, others are walking, in terms of the health system. I am just defining all the cars and whatever, it is about a health service that is happening. Where we stand is about it is not acceptable that there are people who are still going to be using donkey carts or will be walking, it is not acceptable.

Also it is not acceptable that the State will pump money for the other people to drive a Benz. What we are saying that UHC – wait, you ask a question, I am going to respond to you.

So it is about UHC being about everyone else, the State could at least do the minimum so everyone drives a Toyota, meaning you bring everyone – I am making an example, a Toyota. If it so happens that you want to drive a Benz, continue to, it is the same thing. Not for everyone you have to build RDP houses. I can have a mansion if I can afford it, but I must not expect the

State to be able to build myself a mansion.

That is what we are saying. It is about we need to create an enabling environment for such. NHI does not say that if you are walking, if you are whatever, you will end up being able to drive a Toyota. What it is saying is all of you who are driving the Benz now must come and end up all walking.

We all agree that you cannot use State's money to fund the others and then you leave behind the others. That is what Universal Health Coverage is all about. No one mentions a medical doctor, like the South African Medical Association, they say no to NHI and these are part of the people who are opposed to that. I am talking about that.

So the NHI is a money thing. It does not say anything that Auntie Sarah will be able to access. So we do not support NHI, we do not. We support the UHC. However, if now we end up legislated, we will customise and tweak it and still pilot the UHC. We are going to pilot.

Now your last question about KZN. You are asking about the first phase, you are asking about what happened in 2012 to 2017. That is Phase 1. During that time every province had a district where National was piloting, that was in every province. For us it was the Eden/Garden Route. The report, all of what was presented there, they did not even want to open it. It is because it was dismal. Dismal, dismal.

Even up to, they even have to take some of the money. When the President came and said that there is a – what is it – a stimulus for the HR, he was using that.

So it was a dismal failure. So that is why nobody talks about what happened in Phase 1. Mention now what is happening with the Ideal Clinic, mention to you what is happening with the ward-based primary healthcare. All those 10 areas.

So the question is about how will you be able to add, but that one ended in 2017. Now we are talking about CUPS, which is where each and every province takes one area where they could be able like add a recipe, and come up with what if now we ended up implementing the CUPS in those areas, what kind of a method are we going to use.

So that is where we are. So you cannot go back to Phase 1, that disappeared long ago. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise hon member Bans.

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, my [Interjections.] ... Hon Speaker? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat. Hon member Bans, you may

continue.

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, my question to the hon Minister, through you, would be where the hon Minister is saying that funding was received from NHI and they were able to make tweaks and turns and the money was used, and from a practical side one knows that NHI is operating specifically in the area of Kannaland – I just forgot the name of the town, I think it is Ladismith – where one could see the difference of what impact it could have in communities.

What I want to know from the hon Minister, leave UHC, NHI. We received money as this Department, this Government. Does NHI work, from your opinion, from what we have seen in Ladismith? What response would you give an account for what we got for Kannaland on the NHI? George and Kannaland? I just wanted to hear that from the hon Minister. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Bans. Hon members, just once again you cannot ask a member for their opinion. So I am just putting it for the record, but, hon Minister, you can answer however you so wish.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: They have an opinion, I am so opinionated about that. I think also, when you say money for NHI, in the Phase 1 pilot it was meant specifically for that.

So that it is why now we are reminding them, for example, infrastructure, we are reminding them, "You still owe us." Parkdene, Pacaltsdorp and all those, that was part of the NHI, which is the infrastructure we need.

So therefore when they have to go and give us that money, even with a NHI funded GPs, it is because it was money that was supposed to come, that was already committed at the National level to go to the provinces.

So whether it is for NHI – ja, no, wait-wait. It is not whether it was for NHI, for whatever, but the principle is it is not additional money, it is about when you are going to have this R20 million and then they give you R2 million. You cannot say no, and then the last part of it, noting once Phase 3 is done there is less money to the province, coming by the way. The mere fact that actually they have decreased it, because the Equitable Share and everything now is going to go to either the NPO, to the private, to whoever can provide the services.

In the NHI legislation it says we will be responsible for the EMS, for the forensic pathology and therefore the provincial hospital. The rest is this CUPS that are being tested.

So, through you, hon Speaker, in Beaufort West there might be Auntie Sarah, whoever, who will be running a service provision in terms of maybe immunisation and whatever, which has got nothing to do with us. Now when they complain they will have to complain straight to Pretoria because we will

not be running it.

So with that money that we already have now that has been decreased, it will be worse and luckily they will not be running to us. However, constitutionally we are supposed to be responsible for the total health of the population in the province.

So that is where things are. So my point is there is no health professional who will say that they are very happy where the South African health system is, and then lastly the issue of trying to create binaries between the public and private. Remember National up to now has not done anything related to the regulation of the private health sector. The private is the referee, is the player, is everything.

So it cannot be now that we have got a situation where now they want us to fight when they have not regulated because they do their own thing. No one knows the clinical outcomes, no one knows about death within private and all of those, because it is not being regulated.

So lastly, hon Speaker, I still say Universal Health Coverage in South Africa is the way to go. NHI is not a solution to the state of the health system where now actually the cracks have been more severe post-COVID. That is where things are. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Order, hon members.

Hon members, the time for questions will be running out. Can you please work with me because there are still questions on the oral Question Paper for reply. Hon member Maseko.

Alright, hon members, are there any further follow-ups on that question?

Alright, that brings us to the end of Question 7. I now recognise hon Minister Simmers for Question 4 under New Questions.

New Questions

4. Ms L M Maseko to ask Mr T A Simmers, Minister of Infrastructure:

As the elections are nearing, it is alleged that some political parties encourage and promote land grabs:

- (1) Whether his Department is aware of any criminal investigations into these allegations; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) whether his Department is collaborating with the South African Police Service (SAPS) to hold those implicated in encouraging land grabs accountable; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (3) whether there are any cases of land grabs currently being prosecuted that involve political figures or political organisations; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker, am I

audible?

The SPEAKER: You are indeed.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and thank you to the hon member for the question.

Hon member, it is unfortunate as there are anecdotal reports that some of these illegal land invasions are prompted by certain political parties and/or figures within such political parties. However, I do not want to be accused of misleading the House or casting aspersions. It appears the person or persons that lead these invasions are faceless and hence no arrests or prosecutions have occurred.

Therefore I will be focusing on the alarming and exponential rate of illegal invasions in our province, particularly in the Cape Metro. Our residents are being misled by certain so-called leaders to invade land as they will be assisted much quicker. This is the classic case of queue jumping being indoctrinated in these communities, sometimes by the very political leaders they entrust to empower them with legal advice and guidance. Sadly this is not how the housing allocation process works.

Furthermore our residents end up invading dangerous and uninhabitable land, like we have seen wetlands or placed where people live below the flood line, which ultimately put those very same communities in grave danger. It is for

this reason why I have set aside the month of August to crisscross the corners of the Cape Metro to engage residents living in informal settlements in specific sub-councils.

These engagements will be the opportune platform to educate those residents directly on the myriad of housing opportunities other than the traditional free and subsidised dwellings, or B&Gs, which they are encouraged to forcefully demand or to possibly jump the queue for.

As a parting comment, hon Speaker, through you to the member, I would like to appeal to our residents who are tuned in today, to not allow these unscrupulous so-called leaders to manipulate or to use you for their own cheap political gains toward the elections of 2024.

I also would like to challenge hon members of this House to bring forth any information that could assist in alleviating this problem to bring these unscrupulous events to an end, but also to refrain from commenting on WhatsApp groups, or sending around malicious SMSs or WhatsApps which seemingly encourage land invasions and the attempts of illegal land occupation. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, with 23 seconds remaining for Questions for Oral Reply, I am not going to allow any follow-up questions because we have come to the end of Questions, because the Minister will not be able to respond in the time allocated as per the

Rules. So all outstanding replies will therefore be printed in Hansard.

We then move on to Rule 204 for Question to the Premier without Notice. Hon members, I just want to remind you of two follow-ups by the hon member posing the question, which relates to the original question to the reply.

The first hon member is hon member Kama for Questions to the Premier without Notice.

Questions to the Premier without notice

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I think recently there was a video clip showing the poor conditions that the people of Voëlvleistasie live under, which is near Gouda in Ceres, where I think there is a farmer who switched off their electricity and water, and for some time they have not had such, and this farmer failed to evict them after he could not prove that he owns the property.

Now I want to ask to the hon Premier, through you, hon Speaker, that, given that your Government prides itself on being a government that cares and works for the people, does your Government care about the people of Voëlvleistasie? And if so, why has it allowed the people to be abused like that and when can we expect this Government to intervene and ensure that not only are the basic services like electricity, water and sanitation

reconnected, but that there are other Government programmes to improve the poor living conditions of the people in the area? Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. For the rest of the question to the Premier, please, hon members posing questions to the hon Premier, you must ask one question. You have two follow-up opportunities for follow-up questions.

Again, hon Premier, I am not going to dictate how you answer that question, but please note, for the record, one question with two opportunities for follow-up questions. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and to the hon member Kama for the question. Unfortunately I have not seen the video and I do not know the detail, but if the hon member gives it to me I can definitely go and investigate, because obviously I have said in this House we care for our citizens, we are citizen-obsessed, and we have got to make sure that we are fair and that we are offering the best services that we can.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very, hon Premier. Hon member Kama, your first follow-up.

Mr M KAMA: No, thank you very much, hon Speaker. At least I know the hon Premier is aware of the living conditions of the people, especially your farm workers in these farm areas, and that we know that agriculture is a key

pillar of Western Cape economy and that in 2020 the province exported R78 billion worth of agricultural products.

Now I therefore want to understand what are the specific Western Cape Government programmes that are catered to respond specifically to these economic conditions of the poor farmworkers who are living as modern day slaves in areas like Voëvleistasie, while the White farmers continue to rake in the billions?

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier. Thank you, hon member Kama. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. I did refer the hon member Kama earlier to the Growth for Jobs strategy. I think that speaks specifically to making the biggest difference that we can. Nothing stops a bullet like a job. Nothing gives you dignity like a job. Nothing ends poverty like a job. We are serious about making sure that we have the biggest impact possible in this country on creating employment and I think our track record has shown that.

Of course again, if it is a specific issue in a specific place, we are more than happy to go and engage. We have a specific unit that looks after the interests of issues that farmworkers face. There is even a membership group of farm workers who sit on a panel, that the Minister of Agriculture meets with regularly to discuss farmworker issues. We can feed it straight in there as well.

So absolutely, the hon member does not have to wait to try and ambush me here with a question, he can give me the detail and we will deal with it decisively. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon member Kama, your last opportunity.

Mr M KAMA: I am not ambushing anyone, hon Speaker. No, the last follow-up question that I have, hon Speaker, is because the Voëlvlei Station situation is not an isolated incident. Many other farmworkers suffer the same treatment from farmers who use basic services, like water and electricity, to coerce workers to do what farmers want. Many more farmworkers are without electricity as we speak, in a province that has made the loudest noise about loadshedding.

Now to the hon Premier, through you, hon Speaker, I want to understand what his Government is going to do differently, to protect the rights of farmworkers and guarantee them uninterrupted access to basic services like water and electricity. Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Kama. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: No, I mean first of all if you look at many of our interventions and policies, they will be directed specifically at farmworkers. Whether it is even the indigent loadshedding packs directed at farmworkers,

specific projects in human settlement delivery focused at farmworkers, economic development opportunities, agricultural opportunities, all focused at a specific sector, but I can tell you also, I refer back to Growth for Jobs, we have got to grow this economy.

We have a shrinking economy getting downgraded all the time, less and less money coming into the system and of course we need to turn that around, we need to grow and everything that is going to impact on someone who is a farmworker or someone who has less than anyone else, especially unemployed people, we have got to intervene in those areas. We have got to make sure that we bring about change in those citizens' lives.

Exactly referring to the previous question from the hon member on what is it that we need to do in that original vision of our Constitution to make the biggest difference we can 30 years into our democracy, but what happens is when we see something that is going to have a huge impact on farmworkers, probably the biggest impact on farmworkers immediately is AGOA, and his party, his party takes a stance that puts all of those farmworkers' incomes at risk. Absolutely at risk. Unbelievable!

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, please take your seat.

The PREMIER: And it is his party that is taking that stance.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, please take your seat. Hon members, in

particular hon Marran, firstly, you cannot interject from a bench that is not yours. That is unparliamentary. So, you are not in your bench, so can I please ask that you adhere to the Rules of this House and the decorum of the House. Hon Premier, please continue.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. I would encourage the Whips to give him a workshop. But you know, so it always amazes me. Those things that are going to make the biggest difference or have the biggest negative impact, get totally ignored by the ANC. You know that on AGOA itself, and I saw after I visited the US on AGOA which is about jobs, it is not about anything else. It is about jobs and the economy, and growing opportunity for our citizens. Nothing else. That is what it is about. A frantic visit, a frantic visit to the US by three Ministers. A frantic visit.

And then – and then, do you know what happens? The very same committees in their parliament who are having a look at this piece of legislation and the impact it has on South Africans, I make a submission to that Standing Committee in America and on Monday night, I make a submission verbally to the Standing Committee on Monday night, on protecting and saving jobs in South Africa. Farmworker jobs in the Western Cape, jobs in the automotive industry in the Eastern Cape and in KZN and in Gauteng. Guess what, hon Speaker? I am the only politician making a representation. There is nobody else on behalf of any other province there, and there is no one from South Africa's National Government. They are just missing in action.

And, you know, the most amazing thing. I get a call from COSATU afterwards to say how did it go. Because why? At least they are interested in jobs. Not the ANC ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: Not the ANC at all.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member!

The PREMIER: They do not care about jobs in our country, and they definitely do not care about the unemployed in our country. But I want to say to the hon member that if these conditions, the way he spells out here today: please give me the detail. I will engage with the Minister of Agriculture. We will go and have a look, and we will see how we can remedy the situation. But most importantly, we need to make sure that we expand the economy, jobs, and create opportunities for every single individual in this province that wants a job. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. That brings us to the end of Question 1 to the Premier without Notice. I now recognise the hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Can you hear me, hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Loud and clear, sir.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you so much, hon Speaker. I would like to ask the hon Premier what is the provincial economic growth outlook for 2023?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Mvimbi. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: The revised outlook, which is slightly up now, it is 0,4%.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon Mvimbi, your first opportunity for a follow-up.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I would have thought that given that the hon Premier is basing his Growth for Jobs on the growth outlook in the Western Cape, I would have thought that of course, although the hon Premier is not really correct, the actual figure is 0,3%. But however, my next question is: how does the DA envisage achieving a growth rate of 4% to 6% in 12 years' time, that is up to 2035, when it is only achieving 0,3% growth after 14 years of the DA rule.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Premier, did you get that?

The PREMIER: Yes, I did. Thank you very much to the hon Mvimbi. If I can

correct him. I know he said he wanted to correct me, I will correct him because I was being – I saw the presentation from the National Government and the National Treasury yesterday which downgraded South Africa down to 0,3% and the Western Cape up to 0,4%. And because the whole point of Growth for Jobs and breakout strategy is because ANC policies in South Africa have given us the worst economic environment ever, driven by absolutely failed ANC policies. We have got grey listings. We cannot even keep the lights on under their rule. Higher and higher and higher unemployment rates. Higher and higher murder rates and crime rates. The ANC is destroying South Africa and its economy. And if I am looking at the messages ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The PREMIER: If I am looking at the messages out of the Budget Policy Committee that is happening in Tshwane or Pretoria right now, I would, if I was the hon Mvimbi, also start to get a bit worried. But it is obvious that the ANC does not keep their members updated as to the actual crisis that we find ourselves in South Africa under ANC rule. There is no fiscal management, there is no management ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ...that enables us to get any kind of positive economic result.

But in this province we have shown, and we still have the lowest unemployment rate in South Africa. We have the fastest growth rate in South Africa. We are creating exponentially more jobs year-on-year now than ever before in this country, even though the ANC keeps on dragging everything down the drain every single day and has all of the really shocking decisions and the absolutely abysmal management that they have put in place in running this country. And the real test is going to come next year when the citizens are going to vote them out because they have had enough.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon Mvimbi – order, hon members in the House! Hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. While the hon Premier ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, please take your seat. Hon members in the House. There is an hon member on the virtual platform. We are struggling to hear that hon member. Please allow the hon member to pose his follow-up question. Can I please ask the Whips on both sides to please assist me. Hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. While the hon Premier really has failed to answer my questions directly, it is clear that the manner in which the hon Premier is answering, he is really trying to decouple the economy of the Western Cape from the rest of that of South Africa. The

difference is 14 years ago, the DA did not want an independent Western Cape. Today, unfortunately, they do. Is this decoupling of the Western Cape economy from the rest of the national economy, even though it does not make sense, part of the DA's programme to make the Western Cape independent?

The SPEAKER: Hon members. Before, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. Absolutely, we need to decouple the Western Cape economy from the ANC's policy and the ANC economy because the ANC economy is dragging South Africa down the drain, and we have to decouple. If you read the Jobs for Growth strategy, you will see it does not call it decouple, but it calls it breakout growth. So, while the ANC Titanic keeps on going down, we need to turn that around and take it up and that is exactly what this strategy is.

There are more than 137, I think, engagements that have happened. This strategy is not just a strategy that we have sucked out of our thumbs. We have spent many months devising it, sitting with all of our universities, with the economists in our universities, meeting with business, meeting with business that sits in other provinces as well; and saying what is it that we need to do to make sure that we are not pulled down the drain along with the ANC. Let us get that decoupling, let us get that breakout growth. How do we make sure?

There are seven priority areas in the nearly 200-page document; I would

actually encourage the hon Mvimbi to go and read it. But I would also like to challenge the hon Mvimbi to: when he comes to this House, to come to this House with alternate solutions and also, come to this House to tell us one area, just one – just one, where the ANC have actually got a success story and where we have got economic growth happening, and it is really making a bit difference to the citizens. Because at the moment, the indicators are showing exactly the opposite, whether it is job numbers, economic growth numbers, keeping the lights on numbers, hope or business confidence numbers. Every single one of them.

But I think the most important is how people in this country vote with their feet; how people vote with their feet. And that is why you can see from a planning point of view, we pass more plans than Gauteng. A 15% economy is now passing more plans than a 35% economy. Why? Because the ANC runs that economy and we run this economy. That is it. And how do we take that and move it to the next level? Exponential growth. Now, there is the plan. We have said that it is bold and ambitious, and we are going to drive this plan. He also referred to the economy of 1994 ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The PREMIER: He also referred to the economy of 1994 and this is also, I think, where the ANC absolutely fail. The world is in a very different environment. This province is in a very different environment. In 1994, we did not have the Smart phone. In 1994, we did not have the tech and

innovation capital, Silicon Cape. We have got that now. The economy is evolving, the economy is changing. But the one thing that is not changing in South Africa is ANC blind policy. Their blind policy of doing the same bean-counting, racially bean-counting people and not making a difference, only making one or two very wealthy ANC cadres. The systems of tendering cannot get fixed. They keep the same thing because that makes very few ANC connected people very wealthy and keeps the rest of South Africa poor, and the economy going down the drain.

We have to have breakout economic growth. We have to have that differential because we will not, in this province, be pulled down by the failure of the ANC. We will show you that DA policies work and make a difference, and we are focused on those citizens in our province. The 2,7 million in our province that have a job and the 700 000 that do not have a job, we need them to get a job and we need to grow the economy by doing so, not shrink the economy as the ANC does.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. We now move on to hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Through you to the hon Premier. As the Province and the City gear up to host the 2023 Netball World Cup Premier with the first game starting tomorrow, how do you envisage this World Cup positively influencing the province in terms of fostering new employment opportunities, boosting our local economy, and

promoting the development of sports at a grassroots level?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much to the hon Gillion. That, you know, this World Cup: I am super proud that we are hosting it here in Cape Town and in the Western Cape. I am super proud that we can showcase what South Africa can offer here in this province because of course, this is the first time that this cup has come to the African continent, even though South Africa was a founding partner of the World Cup for netball.

And so, I think it is an honour. I think it is a privilege. I think the showcasing again of how well we put on events. I just looked at the events last night. I was busy in a meeting looking at the next Formula E, which is another major global event that we hold here, while I saw some of you were enjoying some of the launches of this current event. But the visuals are amazing. It just shows the amazing place called Cape Town, called Western Cape, and called South Africa.

And of course, everything we do, we do for South Africa. That is why we get up in the morning and go to work, to show the difference between the other provinces. And I think it is an honour for us to be able to host this event. It is going to lead to economic growth, it is going to lead to further brand expansion. We get voted as the Best City in the World time and time again, and here is an event in the Best City in the World busy showcasing to the

world how amazing we are at putting on these events to welcome the world and show them what we have got here.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon members, that brings us to the end of Questions to the Premier without Notice as per Rule 204. Hon members, we will now move on to Statements by Members in terms of Rule 145. I recognise the DA.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the commencement of the Netball World Cup last night marks a pivotal moment for our province, presenting another golden opportunity for substantial economic growth. As the hon Premier reminded us, we are one of the only provinces creating economic growth.

This event is predicted to bring a boost of about R68-million to the local economy. Sporting events in our province have a history of drawing large numbers of spectators, as we saw last night when young people were dancing to the music of Nasty C and Kurt Darren. And it leads to increased spending in our local establishments such as restaurants, hotels, and retail stores. Looking back at the last year, we witnessed the impact of major events on our economy and in Cape Town alone, the seven previous major events generated an astounding R5-billion worth of economic activity. We wish Gauteng could do that.

The remarkable success story translated into numerous job opportunities and opened up trading prospects for small and medium sized enterprises. These figures paint a vivid picture of positive outcomes that sporting events can bring to our Province. Therefore, we are once again grateful to the R1,4-billion that the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport has put aside for young people in this province.

Hon Speaker, let us not forget that there is still a lot more that is happening in our province, with more than 100 other sporting events set to take place in the Western Cape and this will all contribute to the growth of our local economy. As the Democratic Alliance, we are committed to advocating for and for building our sporting sector within the province. We recognise the immense potential it holds to drive not just economic growth, but also to create employment opportunities and foster striving, socially cohesive communities. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bosman. I recognise the ANC.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker, can you hear me?

The SPEAKER: I can hear you, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you. Hon Speaker, the African National Congress celebrates an historic moment of inclusivity and recognition as sign language is officially designated as the 12th official language of South Africa. We commend the President of our country for his visionary leadership in championing this decision, marking a significant milestone in our nation's journey towards inclusivity.

The history of sign language in South Africa is deeply intertwined with the deaf community's experience and contributions. For years, this community faced challenges including limited access to education, public services, and employment opportunities due to communication barriers. Yet, they have shown remarkable resilience advocating for the recognition of sign language as a fundamental aspect of their cultural identity and their right to communicate.

Recognising sign language as an official language began with the South African Sign Language Charter in 2018, affirming the rights and dignity of deaf individuals. The Sign Language Bill further advances the process engaging with stakeholders to shape its recognition. Today, we welcome sign language as the 12th official language, a significant stride towards an inclusive society. It ensures the deaf community's full participation in public life and enriches our cultural heritage.

As the ANC, we commit to fostering an environment embracing diversity and upholding all South Africans' rights. We thank your sign language interpreters, including the person that we have doing sign language today – if she can thank herself as well for what she has been doing in this House – and providing sign language to our viewers and the people of the province. We celebrate this milestone with them and pledge to work harder in ensuring inclusivity. Inclusivity is the very foundation of a united and prosperous nation where every person's abilities and contributions are valued. Let us move forward, celebrating our linguistic diversity and empowering every person to participate fully irrespective of their abilities. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore. I now recognise the EFF. The EFF? I will then move on. I recognise the DA.

Mr D PLATO (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, homelessness continues to plague not only our province, but our country. While there is no record or survey to tell us exactly how many are homeless in South Africa, that number is estimated to be in excess of well over 200 000. The Western Cape Government is taking this very seriously and has nearly doubled the number of beds offered at homeless shelters since the pandemic. Even now, millions have been allocated to create a large brand-new shelter for homelessness here in this City of Cape Town.

But I have been troubled to see certain figures weaponizing this issue for

their own political gain. Criticism is a necessary part of democracy, and this Government welcomes the opportunity to be held to account by the hon members of this House, and members of civil society. This Government has made concrete steps to provide the necessary assistance to homeless people: to provide beds, to provide food, meals, and employment opportunities to lift people out of their homelessness for good, to reintegrate them with their families. Some refuse reintegration.

Many homeless people do not want to live under these conditions and accept assistance. Some just refuse any form of assistance Government and other NGOs provide to them. Many are making use of our shelters; some bluntly refuse because they do not want the disciplined rules imposed by shelter management. Hon Speaker, we continue to find ourselves between a rock and a hard place in dealing with this issue, but as a responsible Government and a responsible Department of Social Development, we will continue to do what is expected from us to assist homeless people. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Plato. I recognise GOOD.

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, we do not seem to be winning in reducing the number of people living on the streets of the Western Cape. The fact that we have a very active homeless industrial complex is beneficial for all, except the homeless. The latest advertorial on how we are addressing the homelessness seems to confirm this notion.

Figures provided cannot be confirmed as the City is not registered as a service provider with the Provincial Department of Social Development, to have oversight over safe spaces. Let us take the figures at face value: 51 000 engagements reported for July 2022 to June 2023. Nearly 3 500 of these individuals were seemingly assisted. This, too, is confusing because we only have 2 800 beds available and most of these are paid for and occupied by SASSA grant recipients. Let us not forget Safe Space evicts residents after three months, which means we are contributing to the increasing and not decreasing number of those living on the streets, which the City's new bylaws criminalise. The same goes for the work programmes offered to homeless who are used for cheap labour. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon de Villiers. I move on to the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the illegal guns in the hands of the indiscriminate are causing havoc. There is a dire need for everyone in the Western Cape who calls it home. They must take hands to confront the current scourge of gun violence by reporting illegal guns to law enforcement agencies.

Now, the fact is that the ANC nationally is not interested in saving or protecting the lives of the people in the Western Cape. This province is under-resourced when it comes to the police. The criminal justice system is failing us. Hon Speaker, it is reported that over a period of two years, there were 700 arrests which involved firearms with only six convictions. This

means a conviction rate of 0,98%. Hon Speaker, as the ACDP, we want to know from the hon Premier and the hon Minister of Community Safety and Police Oversight, what is the Western Cape Government going to do to stop the killing of innocent people?

It was reported today in an Afrikaans newspaper:

†“*Byna 40 kinders in Januarie tot Maart vanjaar in die Wes-Kaap vermoor.*” [“Almost 40 children murdered in January to March this year in the Western Cape.”]

We read of a 15-year-old boy who killed a 14-year-old girl in Eerste River. We read about a man cleaning his gun in Manenberg and killing a 9-year-old. Hon Speaker, this is sad. It is sad, sad, sad, and something must be done because hon Premier, the ANC is failing us. They are not protecting our people, and this is shocking. So, we are calling on behalf of the people of the Western Cape for the Western Cape Government to do something because the ANC is failing us. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians. I recognise the ANC.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. The ANC notes the release of the Western Cape Growth for Jobs Strategy 2035 yesterday, by the hon Premier. Whilst it is a known to welcome Government’s forward looking and planning for the future, the ANC in the province is however, deeply

concerned that the strategy will not lead to shared economic growth, but a concentrated and racially skewed economy, whilst the poor will be prepared to line up for cheap, unprotected below minimum wages jobs in the name of job opportunities.

The script of the DA of private sector investment with minimal or no Government role to intervene to ensure equitable redistribution of wealth created by this provincial economy is once again a demonstration of a party and pack of leaders with no ideas of dealing with modern day economic realities, as even the proponents of trickled down economics have long left that station. As evidence of financial meltdown, COVID-19 and impacts of climate change have long told the fact of the critical role of governments in economies and integration of social partners through compacts to mitigate known government failures, but also documented market failures registered through many studies of market economies. So, DA illiteracy and dogma is nauseating, to say the least.

The strategy which comes a few months too late as the mandate of this Government and crop of leaders is coming to the fold with elections of 2024, why should we believe these electioneering ploys where clearly the intention is to manipulate the voter, as the evidence of delivery is scant. And worse, that three administrations later, the DA refuses to develop a strategy to respond to informal and township economies. Instead, it remains in the pipeline as you see it in Pillar 7 as a strategy that will still be developed. As the ANC, we are not moved by not only the form of the provincial economy,

but its content which must be equitable, distributive and inclusive for all. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Nkondlo. I recognise the DA.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, yesterday, the Democratic Alliance took to the streets of Cape Town in our numbers. South Africans from diverse backgrounds came together to march for a united cause: fair access to jobs. ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): This march was about so much more than politics. Our unemployment levels have skyrocketed over the last decade in this country and now the ANC seeks to push legislation that will unjustly cost 600 000 people their jobs. If the Draft EEA Regulations are implemented, it would affect some private sector employers employing 50-odd people or more.

For example, if you employ 50 people you would not even be able to employ one Indian person out of the 50 because 1 out of 50 is 2%, which exceeds the target they have set of 0,1%. In the Northern Cape, for example, some companies would be in violation of the law and penalised if they employed too many Black women. For example, so if you are a 100% Black woman owned business, your turnover would literally be penalised.

By contrast, in the DA-led Western Cape we have increased employment by 15,7% in a year. We have created thousands of jobs and we boast the lowest unemployment rate in this country. And since the ANC loves to discuss issues in demographic terms, I do feel proud to tell them that we also boast in terms of the Quarterly Labour Force survey, the lowest Black African unemployment, and the lowest female unemployment in the country. We also have lower youth unemployment than our counterparts in Gauteng and KwaZulu-Natal.

What the ANC fails to acknowledge is this: real economic progress is the only way to address inequality. Our country, hon Speaker, remains deeply unequal and this inequality is rooted in our history. But the simple fact is that the DA addresses inequality by means of economic stimulation through fair access to jobs, recreation, and health. Unlike the ANC who wants to make the rich richer, the DA believes in equal opportunities for all. We are marching to the Union Buildings, and we call upon South Africans to stand with the Democratic Alliance, to send the ANC to the dustbin of history. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Baartman. I recognise the Freedom Front Plus, hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Hon Speaker, the Freedom Front Plus acknowledged the good governance in the Western Cape and maintains that only when

leaders of other parties have the honesty and the courage to publicly criticise their own shortcomings and mistakes in their own organisation, and in provinces they govern and the poor governance records, have they earned the right to criticise others. We hope that the ANC will heed this good advice when hon members of this House try to make COVID-19 a circus and the Freedom Front Plus calls for a tightening of the Rules of this House to create order and bring ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Oh!

The SPEAKER: Hon Marais, you may continue.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): The Freedom Front Plus calls for a tightening of the Rules of the House so that hon members who misbehave will have a place to pay for misbehaviour ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon Marais, please continue.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): I will stop at that, hon Speaker, to make your task

easier.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marais. I recognise Al Jama-ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the Western Cape Education Department under the DA ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! There is an hon member on the virtual platform. Hon Brinkhuis, please allow me one moment.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Okay.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, there is an hon member on the virtual platform. Hon Brinkhuis, you may continue.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the Western Cape Education Department under the DA-led Provincial Legislature is doing a grave injustice to Black children and Coloured and Indian children by denying them their right to basic education. Section 29 of the Constitution specifically outlines the child's right to basic education. Al Jama-ah notes with concern the education crisis in the province which has been persisting for many years. The WCED has no effective strategies to ensure that all children will be placed in schools before the 2024 academic year.

Over the years, thousands of children in the Western Cape province have been denied their right to basic education. Al Jama-ah calls on the DA-run Province to stop holding back on budgets for education, to deploy officials at schools in areas where ...[Audio distorted.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Brinkhuis, we have lost you. Order, hon members. Order, hon members. Hon Brinkhuis? Hon Deputy Chief Whip of the Majority Party and the Deputy Chief Whip of the Opposition, I actually need you to support and assist me and not be part of. Hon Brinkhuis? I will then move on to the DA.

Ms C MURRAY (DA): Hon Speaker, today I stand before the House with a heavy heart. I am burdened by the potential loss of countless jobs in our beloved province and country. It is also deeply frustrating that Minister Patel has persistently refused to address our Province's concern regarding the African Growth and Opportunity Act or AGOA. If we do not act swiftly, hon Speaker, 136 000 jobs in the province's agricultural sector alone will be at risk, leaving countless families devastated and struggling to make ends meet.

In my letter to Minister Patel yesterday, I emphasised the importance of AGOA for the province's economic growth and job creation. The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa further confers responsibility to us on matters which include AGOA. Regrettably, the Minister's response to me yesterday seemed to dispute the undeniable facts and statistics that

underpin the significance of AGOA for our people. The refusal to acknowledge the realities of our situation is troubling. As Walter Kerr once said:

“He had delusions of adequacy.”

These words perfectly describe the Minister’s response to AGOA. We will therefore pursue further legal action if the Minister fails to engage with hon Provincial members of Parliament on this critical matter because time is of the essence, hon Speaker. In the spirit of cooperative governance, we are willing to explore all avenues for resolution, but if the Minister continues to disregard our concerns, we will have no other choice but to issue summons and ensure that he provides information we need to safeguard the interests of our residents.

Hon Speaker, the DA’s relentless efforts have led to promising developments.
...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: hon Speaker!

Ms C MURRAY (DA): South Africa has been nominated to host the next AGOA conference and there is now active collaboration with the US administration to secure an extension of AGOA before its expiry in 2025. We, as the DA, stand united in the pursuit of economic growth and job creation. We will not rest until we have exhausted all avenues to secure our

AGOA status and protect the lives and livelihoods of our people. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon Murray. Thank you, hon members, that brings us to the end of Members' Statements. In terms of Rule 145(6), I now give one or more hon members of the Executive an opportunity to respond to Members' Statements for not more than five minutes collectively. I recognise the hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I wanted to just add to the statement by the hon Nkondlo around the Growth for Jobs strategy. I welcome the fact that she has read it. I think that is at least a positive step. But I also want her to understand the context in which she is speaking and that is the ANC economic context which has 18-million citizens and growing on a grant and not in a job. It has a further 9-million citizens on R350 a month. What can you do with that? And not growing jobs in the economy. Of our citizens, 44% are kept poor by the ANC and not given proper job opportunities. The ANC stands for zero ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ...opportunity, zero electricity, zero safety and zero future. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Order! Thank you very much, hon Premier. I recognise Hon

Maynier, hon Minister Maynier, hon Minister Allen, hon Minister Meyer, in that order. Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker. The hon Brinkhuis evidently listens ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The hon Brinkhuis evidently listens with his mouth, not his ears. He must have heard of the Rapid School Build Programme where we are building schools faster than ever before so that we can expand access to education, especially in poor communities. Far from holding back on the budget, we plan to spend R2,9-billion this year on infrastructure, which is roughly R1-billion more than we would normally spend on infrastructure. And for information: 55% of that budget is contributed not by National Government, but by the Western Cape Government. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister Maynier. I recognise hon Minister Allen on the virtual platform, hon members.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much, hon Speaker. I will take 40 seconds. Hon Speaker, I am grateful for the input from hon member Ferlon Christians. We will continue to hold SAPS accountable, knowing that our oversight is needing to lead to

better service delivery, but in the same vein we are calling for the devolution of policing powers to capable provinces, like the Western Cape.

The 39 children that were murdered and that were referred to: I am able to announce that when we compared that particular figure to the same period last year, it was 20 less. A reduction, but even that reduction will never make us happy because we would never want our children to be murdered. But I firmly believe that the Standing Committee, what we are doing as a Government, we are continuing to work together.

Taken off the streets over the last year were 163 firearms. We have seen operations; we have seen visibilities in our policing needs and priorities. Hon Speaker, we are seeing a 14,1% reduction in murders in the province. Where murder is increasing by 3,8% across our country, it is reducing here. But we will continue to hold the NPA accountable and to have those engagements, and also with Correctional Services and all other entities. Thank you so much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister Allen. I recognise hon Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, I rise on the matter of the dignity and wellbeing of farmworkers. Hon Speaker, dignity, and wellbeing is a strategic priority of this Government and I believe that agri workers deserve dignity as they play a very important role in the economy of the

Western Cape.

And any time when I hear about abuses, I would like to get that information and I want to, in the context of the hon Premier's response, to assure this House that I will take this matter up with my Head of the Department. I will send a delegation to this particular place where this abuses or alleged abuses have been taking place, and I am happy hon member Van der Westhuizen, to bring back to this House the various responses. If there is any abuse of farmworkers, I think we cannot tolerate it, but I need to have the facts and the information, and then we will certainly report back to the Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Affairs.

I think, hon members, the attitude of this Government is not to be defensive, but to follow up these issues and hon member Kama, you raised it. I will investigate it and I will come back to this House because to simply defend things that are indefensible is not in line with the spirit of this Government. So, dignity and wellbeing apply specifically also to the agri workers because they constitute 17% of the labour force of this province and they are also fundamentally responsible for the agricultural production ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, can you please conclude.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: The total agricultural value production in this province is R50-billion and I think they play a critical role ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ...dignity will be ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister, please. Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, that brings us to the end of Members' Statements. We will now move over to Notices of Motions in terms of Rule 151. In terms of Rule 151, all Notices of Motions by hon members are required to be delivered to the Secretary for placing on the Order Paper. These motions have been duly submitted and published on the Order Paper below the line.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the Western Cape growth for jobs strategy.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the wasteful R12-million spent in the past three months on 200 healthcare facilities that have not been exempted from

loadshedding in the Western Cape.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates Cape Town's housing crisis.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the financial breakdown of the Western Cape Government's budget to improve safety and security at schools, for the next five years.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We now move on to Motions without Notice in terms of Rule 150. I would like to inform that House that in terms of the new Standing Rule 150 pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolence and congratulatory were submitted to the Programming Authority prior to this plenary of 25 July 2023. Hon members are also reminded that the Motions without Notice pertaining to congratulatory and condolence, will not be allowed in this Sitting and that have not been processed by the Programming

Authority.

I have been informed that in the Programming Authority meeting, political parties did submit the names of the hon members in the desired order of speaking and who had wished to move a Motion without Notice in this Sitting of the House. I will therefore, just for noting and for purposes of the Minutes, call out the hon members whose names have accordingly been submitted and approved.

The following hon members' motions have been approved by the Programming Authority as follows: hon M Kama, hon C M Dugmore, hon N G Bakubaku-Vos, hon A P Bans, hon N G Bakubaku-Vos.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr M KAMA (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes and wishes good luck to women in sport; notes that the Western Cape has hosted the Netball Quad Series, the T20 Women's Cricket World Cup, and the Ice Hockey International Championships in Cape Town in the first half of this year; notes that, over the next few days, we will see the start of the Netball World Cup in Cape Town; notes that economically, women's sporting events are making an important contribution to our economy with the Netball World Cup event alone predicted to bring an estimated boost of R68 million to our local

economy; and notes that this translates to more jobs being created, more tourism and more potential investment interest in our province.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I move without notice:

That the House notes with grave sadness the tragic incident where five people, including two children, two men and one woman, lost their lives in a fire in Kleinvlei, Cape Town, early on Wednesday morning; notes that three more people were taken to hospital for treatment for smoke inhalation and burn wounds; and extends condolences and sends a message of strength to the family and friends of the deceased.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with sadness the passing away of three children, Athanathi Janda (6), Hlelo Mhlathsana (6) and Alunezo Janda (1) after eating a suspected poisonous substance; notes that it is suspected that the three children ate something from a dumping site near their house in the Taiwan Informal Settlement in Site C, Khayelitsha, where they were playing; and conveys condolences to their family and friends.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms A P BANS (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with profound sadness the passing away of a 14-year-old girl, Naeema Marshall, who was allegedly murdered by a 15-year-old boy who was reportedly obsessed with her; notes that Naeema left her Beacon Valley home to visit her aunt when she was killed on Monday afternoon in Budhi Crescent, New Forest Village, Eerste River; notes that Naeema was a Grade 9 learner at the Beacon Hill High School; and conveys condolences to her family and friends.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep sadness the passing away of 7-year-old Israel Adams from Delft who drowned on Monday afternoon while playing with his brother and friends at a construction site; and conveys condolences to his family and friends.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now put the motions duly submitted and approved by the Programming Authority to the House. Are there any objections? No

objections, agreed to. The motions will appear in the Minutes of the proceedings and in Hansard, in each individual member's name as if that member had read them out aloud.

I will now afford the opportunity to the hon members to move Motions without Notice as per Standing Rule of 150(2)(d). This could also be Motions without Notice that were not approved in the Programming Authority meeting. Hon members are reminded that in terms of the Rules, 30 minutes will be allowed for this section and the 30 minutes will start now. I recognise the hon Sileku.

Mr I M SILEKU (DA): Somlomo. I move on behalf of the Democratic Alliance without notice:

That this House notes the ruling of the IEC who found that GOOD lied about incorrect voter registration in George; that this House notes that they are so desperate for power, that they are willing to blatantly lie to media houses and spread misinformation; that they are the real fraudsters and should be held accountable for their reckless accusations; that this House notes that due to their actions, the GOOD party's Secretary-General, Brett Herron, is now being investigated for intimidation and breach of the Electoral Code of Conduct; that this House notes that even though the GOOD party went to these extreme lengths, they still lost three wards in one day. Karma really is a dish best-served cold ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr I M SILEKU (DA):

The GOOD party only has themselves to blame. They should accept their defeat, respect democracy, and move on. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon members. Hon members, are there any ...[Interjections.] Hon members, there is no need for debate. I am going to put the motion. If you have an objection, indicate so. There is no need for a debate ...[Interjection.]

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): Yes.

The SPEAKER: I have not put the ...[Interjection.]

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): Object!

The SPEAKER: ...to the House. Hon members, are there any objections ...[Interjection.]

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): Object!

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Object!

The SPEAKER: Hon members, have you concluded? I will now put the motion. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Object!

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): Object!

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Hon Speaker, on behalf of the people's movement which is time tested, the African National Congress, I move without notice:

That the House urgently calls for the DA-led City of Cape Town to address its neglect of Black lives in the wake of another tragic fire in SST, Town Two, Ward 93, resulting in two more fatalities. This incident occurred in an area previously devastated by a fire that destroyed over 300 shacks, leading to the proposal of the Silver Town Emergency Housing Project. However, this crucial project remains unrealized due to the City's refusal to sign a land availability agreement with the Western Cape Department of Human Settlements. We condemn this neglect and demand immediate action to save lives and prioritise the

safety and wellbeing of all citizens, regardless of race. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Kama. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you. Thank you, hon Mr Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House condemns the measures undertaken by the apartheid state of Israel in the reforms of their justice system; notes the concerns of justice loving Israelis and democrats across the world in how these measures will continue to solidify Israel as an apartheid state. Warns the Israeli Government that they are continuing the same path that the National Party in South Africa, and specifically Jimmy Kruger, did and calls on the international community, including the National Government of South Africa, to move for the international isolation of the apartheid state of Israel. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Lekker. Hon members, are there

any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Yes, I object!

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise the hon Bans.

Ms A P BANS (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, on behalf of the African National Congress, I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep concern the recent Court proceedings involving a security company boss accused of a R26,8-million tender fraud within the DA-led Saldanha Bay Municipality. These allegations jeopardize public funds and erode trust in Government institutions and service providers. As a political organisation committed to transparency and community wellbeing, we stress the importance of upholding the rule of law and respecting legal processes. We trust the judiciary to conduct a fair investigation, upholding justice. However, we cannot overlook the poor oversight by the DA-led Saldanha Bay Municipality and the DA's Provincial Community Safety and Police Oversight hon MEC, Reagan Allen. The lack of effective monitoring in tender management raises serious concerns. The ANC firmly condemns negligence in overseeing public resources, undermining citizens' trust in elected representatives. We commit to monitoring this matter closely and call on relevant representatives to address similar issues. I so move,

hon Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bans. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks, hon Speaker. On behalf of the Congress, I move without notice:

That House notes with solicitude the Breede Valley Municipality's failure to construct houses in outer towns like De Doorns, Touws River, and Rawsonville. It is disheartening that no houses have been built in these towns over the past five years, with no future projects in the pipeline. Housing is a fundamental human right, and the lack of progress in addressing this issue hampers the well-being and dignity of our citizens. The ANC urgently calls for a comprehensive plan to be put in place to expedite housing development in these neglected areas. We demand transparency in the allocation of resources and a commitment to prioritise housing projects in the outer towns. The ANC will closely monitor the implementing of these plans to ensure accountability and that the needs of our communities are met. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marran. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks, hon Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): You are giving me many chances today. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the Casidra's recent turnaround strategies for Amalienstein and Waaikraal farms in the Southern Cape, considering their previous failures in managing these farms effectively. We acknowledge the importance of successful farm management in promoting agricultural growth and rural development. In light of these past shortcomings, we call for increased accountability and scrutiny in Casidra's approach to revitalizing these farms. The ANC urges Casidra to provide transparent reports on their strategies, progress, and utilisation of resources. To ensure sustainable and successful farm management, we advocate for comprehensive oversight mechanisms and the inclusion of local stakeholders' input. This approach will bolster the

farms' potential for economic growth and social upliftment, benefiting the surrounding communities. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marran. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

Hon members, that brings us to the end of Motions without Notice. Before we adjourn, I would like to deliver two rulings, outstanding rulings. During the Sitting of 15 June, the hon Leader of the Opposition made certain allegations of corrupt practices by a DA Mayor and asserted that a DA Mayor, and I quote:

“Withheld correspondence from the National Minister of COGTA and the hon Minister Bredell.”

He further said, and I quote:

“When they put forward the issue of the MM, they withheld information.”

The Deputy Chief Whip of the DA rose on a point of order and enquired whether the mentioning of hon Minister Bredell's name was a reflection on

him, as contemplated in Rule 59 of the Standing Rules.

Hon members, having had the opportunity to study the Hansard transcript, I find no reflection on the hon Minister Bredell by the Leader of the Opposition and therefore, cannot sustain the point of order raised by the Deputy Chief Whip.

A further point of order was raised by the Deputy Chief Whip of the DA, enquiring, and accusing the hon Minister Simmers of corruption by the hon Leader of the Opposition constitutes a reflection on him in terms of Rule 59.

Hon members, having studied the Hansard and by the hon Leader of the Opposition's own admission, I ascertained that he did not say that the hon Simmers was corrupt, but that he in fact said, and I quote:

“He is covering up corruption.”

Accusing an hon member of covering up corruption is equally offensive and indeed, a reflection of the integrity of the hon Simmers and I therefore rule that the hon Leader of the Opposition withdraws the offending statement. I so rule. Hon Dugmore? Hon Dugmore? Yes, he is on, he is on the virtual platform. Hon Dugmore?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes, I am on. I am on the virtual platform, and I withdraw that statement. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Dugmore has withdrawn. I now move on to the next ruling. During the Debate on 1 June 2023 – hon members, I am delivering a ruling!

During the Debate on 1 June 2023, the hon Minister of Infrastructure made utterances in relation to the Official Opposition whereupon a point of order was raised by the Deputy Chief Whip of the Official Opposition, enquiring whether it was parliamentary to refer to an hon Leader of the Opposition as a zombie. I enquired from the hon Minister whether he referred to any hon member of the House in those terms, upon which he responded that he said the ANC in the House is a zombie. I undertook to consult Hansard and revert to the House once I have had an opportunity to study the transcript.

Hon members, having now had the opportunity to study the Hansard transcript as undertaken, I ascertained that the hon Minister said the following, and I quote:

“All their ideas are zombie orientated with a zombie Opposition Leader in the House who has no backbone.”

I find the reference to the Leader of the Opposition as a zombie Opposition Leader in the House both offensive and unbecoming and therefore, unparliamentary and hereby request the hon Minister of Infrastructure to withdraw the offending statement. I so rule. Hon Minister Simmers? Order,

hon members. Hon Simmers? [Interjections.] Hon Simmers, are you on the virtual platform? [Interjections.] Hon Simmers, are you on the virtual platform?

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Speaker, did you call my name? I have a very bad connection.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, the hon Minister is online, and he is struggling with connectivity. Can I please ask that you allow the hon Minister. Hon Minister? Hon Minister Simmers, are you online? Hon members, please allow the hon Minister a minute to reconnect. Can I just ask that the ICT please assist the hon Minister. Hon members, one last time. Hon Minister, are you online? Hon Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. The hon Minister did indicate that he will join virtually. He was online during the duration of the Sitting. We even heard him vaguely upon your conclusion of the ruling. So, perhaps it is just a connectivity issue, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Chief Whip. I have also heard the hon Minister, so I take it that the hon Minister heard my ruling. I am not going to hold the House further. I have already ruled, and the application of that rule will be done at the next sitting, but I have already ruled.

With that being said, that brings us to the end of the sitting of the House and

the House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:05.