

---

MONDAY, 27 MARCH 2023

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid Sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 10:00.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The SPEAKER: Please be seated. Order, members! Before we proceed I would like to remind members about some of the logistical arrangements. As has been our practice to date, hon members will participate in the Sitting of the House, both from here in the Chamber with the Presiding Officer and Table staff, and via Microsoft Teams. Our Standing Rules have accordingly been amended to accommodate such hybrid Sittings of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament.

Hon members experiencing challenges in connecting to the Sitting are requested to contact the WCPP ICT colleagues who will assist to resolve their connectivity challenges.

The quorum requirements for the Sitting of the House are provided for in the Constitution and the Standing Rules. Unless there is an indication of unanimous concurrence, voting will be confined to members present in the House and on the hybrid system, who are entitled to cast their votes as per the ATC issued on 11 August 2020.

Members present in the Chamber and via Microsoft Teams have all the privileges and immunities imparted by law. Members who are considered out of order by the Presiding Officer will have their microphones muted and called to order.

The Serjeant-at-arms has recorded members' attendance.

Hon members, in instances where these Directives do not cover a particular eventuality, the Standing Rules will apply. In instances where the Rules cannot be applied, the ruling by the Presiding Officer is final.

Members, all microphones have been muted. However, for those members participating in the Sitting of the House via Microsoft Teams, you are requested to use the raise-hand functionality of the system when you desire to raise a point of order, and I will recognise you. When an hon member in the Chamber wishes to raise a point of order, such an hon member may address the Presiding Officer, as expected, but must mute their microphones when they have completed speaking.

Hon members are requested to please ensure that the microphones are unmuted when the Presiding Officer recognises them, and when they are done speaking to please mute their microphones.

Hon members participating in the Sitting of the House via Microsoft Teams are requested not to sign into Microsoft Teams on more than one device, unless the second device is utilised with earphones for Language Translation Services.

The Media have also been granted access to this Sitting as guests of the WCPP. However, members of the media and members of the public may not use the chat room or speak or activate their cameras while the Sitting is in progress.

For this Sitting, hon members, Language Translation Services are available in the Chamber, as usual, and on the Microsoft Teams via the respective channels. Hon members participating in the Sitting of the House must please access the Language Translation Services via a second device, for example your cell phone, and if you have earphones available, please use them for Language Translation Services.

Hon members, please be reminded that no interjections are permitted during these hybrid sessions, and, to this end, I draw the attention of hon members to Rule 40 of the Standing Rules. Hon members, I now recognise the Chief Whip for the motion in your name.

**BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker, I move:

That notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 18, that the hours of the Sittings of today, Monday, 27 March 2023; Tuesday, 28 March 2023 and Wednesday, 29 March 2023 shall be 10 o'clock until adjournment.

I so move, Speaker. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Chief Whip. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved? No objections? Agreed to.

Hon members, before I allow the Secretary to read the First Order of the Day, I would like to make a ruling of the Sitting of 9 March, if you allow me to do so and herewith my ruling.

(Ruling)

During the Sitting of 9 March 2023 the hon Marais, in a member's statement, made utterances which led to several interjections by members across the floor.

A point of order was raised by the Chief Whip of the Official Opposition as follows and I quote:

"I really do not take kind in whatever the altercation was, to refer to black people in particular as foreigners is an insult of the highest order and I want you to rule on this matter."

Since I could not clearly hear the interjections, the context in which they were made, and who were making them, I informed the House that I will come back with a ruling on the matter once I have consulted Hansard. Because the audio recording had not been transcribed at that stage, I listened to the audio recording, but could still not with any certainty establish who uttered those alleged offensive words. I was then duty bound to inform the House that since serious allegations were made against the hon Marais, I would consult the transcribed audio, when available, and make a final ruling on the matter.

Hon members, I do not make an apology for doing so and I will not be strong-armed from either side of this House to take action and to be forced to rule on any matter before I have satisfied myself of the prevailing facts and circumstances. I would also like to inform the House that I have a responsibility as the Speaker and Chief Presiding Officer of this House to ensure that the business of the House is transacted, as the Constitution requires from us, a responsibility I take very seriously and I have committed to adhere to in my Acceptance Speech on my election as Speaker.

I have now had the opportunity to peruse the transcribed extracts of the proceedings of 9 March 2023 and I wish to rule as follows:

In his prepared member statement, the hon Marais articulated and contextualised, from his perspective and that of the party that he belongs to, I presume, what is happening in the province as far as certain challenges facing minorities are concerned. As Speaker and as the custodian of free speech and the right of free expression in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament I find no fault with that in the context of giving the member the right of free speech.

However, when the hon Marais in an interjection declares that "you are foreigners", when responding to hon members of the Provincial Parliament, representing the African National Congress, and albeit what could be argued to be under provocation, repeats the statement, it becomes problematic and cannot be tolerated.

I regard the reference to South Africans of a particular ethnic group as "foreigners" in the own country as highly offensive, unparliamentary and in bad taste. This kind of stereotyping of people will not be tolerated under my watch, and exceeds the boundaries of free speech in no small measure.

I therefore call on the hon Marais to withdraw the words "you are foreigners", and apologise to the House for making those utterances. I so

rule.

Hon Marais, I recognise you.

Mr P J MARAIS: Speaker, in the interest of free speech, I ask to address you on this matter to give better perspective. Everything that is flung at me, you were not privy to... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Marais, hon Marais, I have ruled. If you have an issue with my ruling there are other mechanisms to do so. I have ruled. I am not going to allow any engagement on the ruling.

Hon Marais, I asked you to withdraw those statements. [Interjections.]

Hon Sayed, please! I am addressing the hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: I am not withdrawing. I am stating a historic fact. I can prove it by various historians that say that Ndebele, the Zulus, the Xhosas are not indigene to the Cape.

The SPEAKER: Hon Marais, hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Yes.

The SPEAKER: I have ruled. You leave me with no other option but to ask you to leave the Chamber.

Mr P J MARAIS: I will leave it with joy because ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

Mr P J MARAIS: ...because you will never be respected while you bend to them.

The SPEAKER: Hon member, hon member, I have asked you to withdraw from the Chamber.

Mr P J MARAIS: I will walk with my head up high.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, members. [Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: I will walk with my head up high. [Interjections.] I am indigene. I am... [Interjections.] ...the First Nation, the Griqua. They are foreigners. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: And he says having [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, hon Marais, can you please exit.

Mr P J MARAIS: I am leaving the Chamber. [Interjections.]



An HON MEMBER: Ja, you must leave!

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: You must leave.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Do not come back.

[Hon Peter Marais exits Chamber.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, is that a point of order, is it on the ruling, because I am not going to entertain anything on the ruling? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, I am asking for a ruling, it is based on his behaviour...

The SPEAKER: Okay, I am not going to entertain that. I will deal with that in a different platform because I think it is clear what just happened, so I do not need any guidance from the House on further action. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): In terms of Rule 46.

The SPEAKER: Can you please stand when you address me?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Can I address you, Chair, thank you very much firstly for the ruling. I think it is most welcome. We cannot have the House descending into chaos because of utter racism, but Chair, just to address you on the ruling. I think the ruling is fine, and he has now withdrawn from the House, but given the resistance I also wish to therefore move and it is serious, the matter is of a serious nature, that member Marais be asked to withdraw from the parliamentary precinct for the day. That is what I want to ask in terms of Rule 46.2. I so move, yes, which also means that in terms of salary also for the day that it be suspended. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Deputy Chief Whip of the Opposition. I think the procedure to do that is not correct and for that reason the hon member has already left the Chamber and therefore I will not grant that request.

Hon members, can we now move on to the First Order of the Day. I see the Secretary.

## **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

1. Consideration of principle of the Western Cape Appropriation Bill  
[B 2–2023]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now see the hon, the hon Minister, Minister Wenger.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Hoor-hoor!

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hear-hear!]

The PREMIER: Hear, hear!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Good morning, Mr Speaker, hon Premier, Cabinet Ministers, hon Leader of the Opposition, hon members of the Provincial Parliament and people of the Western Cape.

On 16 February of this year in his State of the Province Address, Premier Alan Winde set out a bold vision to deliver a better future for the people of the Western Cape, and on 14 March of this year I set out how we will fund this plan of action over the next three years in pursuit of realising a future full of hope in the province, and while we do face strong headwinds, we remain determined to take the required action to continue on our path from recovery to growth.

This determination springs from the many reasons we have to have hope in the Western Cape. From the fantastic recovery of the tourism sector, which in many cases has now surpassed pre-pandemic levels to the exceptional performance of employment levels in the fourth quarter of 2022, in which the

Western Cape created nearly 99% of the net employment gains in South Africa, and to the approving nearly one third of all building plans in the entire country.

We have seen the rewards of our evidence-based approach to strategic decisions and the grit and courage of the people of this province and we will continue to push on and push forward because we have more work to do to lift people out of poverty, to increase opportunities for our residents and to deliver a better future.

Mr Speaker, to achieve our goal we will allocate a total of R242,31 billion over the three-year Medium Term Expenditure Framework in the Western Cape, of which R1,1 billion has been set aside to ramp up our energy security and decrease our reliance on Eskom.

R39,82 billion has been allocated to boost economic growth and create opportunities for our citizens. R4,76 billion has been allocated to make sure citizens are safe in their communities and R170,91 billion has been allocated for our citizens' wellbeing, including on key services such as Education and Healthcare.

While there has been a slight reprieve of late, the single biggest threat we face right now which compromises our collective future, is the missing-in-action, stable supply of electricity upon which all else rests, and so to take action and ramp up the Western keeps energy security and decrease our reliance on Eskom an additional R1,1 billion has been set aside over the

MTEF. This includes R598,47 million to reduce the impact of loadshedding, to boost the green economy, to set up a strong pipeline of green energy projects, to scale up support to municipalities to help them get more power into the grid, and to identify critical transmission infrastructure upgrades.

A further R501,52 million is earmarked for Energy Projects in the pipeline and it is a critical element of the Province's ability to respond in an agile and flexible way. We have a four-pronged approach to increasing our energy resilience, as contained in the Western Cape Energy Resilience Programme, highlights of which include the Western Cape Integrated Resource Plan, the Demand Side Management Plan, the New Energy Generation Programme and the Network Development Plan.

As part of our whole-of-government approach to tackling this challenge, our Energy Funding includes over the MTEF, R95,9 million for the Department of the Premier, which will be leading, coordinating and driving strategic components of the Energy Resilience Programme; R148,7 million...

Sorry, Speaker. May I continue?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES:  
R148,7 million for the New Department of Infrastructure to drive Municipal Independent Power Producer Procurement, which also includes the Project

Preparation Facility, grid infrastructure development work and exploring gas power. R60 million for Wesgro and Freeport Saldanha to enable green hydrogen development in the Western Cape, R55,5 million for the Department of Economic Development and Tourism to support SMMEs to implement alternative energy supply systems and R57,5 million for the Department of Local Government to help municipalities pilot renewable energy solutions, which will include the provision of specialists to find the best fit renewable energy options, as well as the creation of Municipal Energy Master Plans, and we will do so with transparency and accountability during the State of Disaster by publishing our Best Practice Procurement Disclosure Report on energy procurement, just like we did during the COVID-19 Pandemic.

Speaker, we have a clear vision for the future as contained in our new economic growth strategy, Growth for Jobs, which is near finalisation. This strategy envisages a jobs rich, inclusive, sustainable and resilient provincial economy that is growing at between 4% and 6% per year in real terms by 2035. Underpinning this growth is the understanding that it is the private sector that creates jobs, and that Government's role is to enable its success.

Over the next three years, this Budget of Action will spend R39,82 billion to boost economic growth and to create opportunities for citizens, including an additional R709 million for the growth-for-jobs priority over the MTEF.

In addition, the Western Cape Government will spend R32,57 billion on

infrastructure over the 2023 MTEF, which includes funding to deliver and maintain transport infrastructure, to provide housing opportunities, as well as boost education and health infrastructure.

This will be the first time that our expenditure on infrastructure crosses over into R10 billion per financial year. The new Department of Mobility will spend R9,11 billion over the next three years to support access to affordable transport, to continue efforts to keep roads safe and develop and implement an integrated, enhanced and efficient Transport Hub System, which will include the delivery of crime fighting technology and systems to support the Highway Patrol.

As South Africans, every man, woman and child shares a common fear of becoming a victim of crime. For too many, this fear may have already been realised. Too many lives have been cut short and far too many deal daily with the scars caused by crime and violence.

Let me say this again, it should not be this way and so to tackle crime holistically over the next three years, this Budget of Action will spend R4,76 billion to make sure citizens are safe in their communities, including an additional R396 million, which has been added to this important priority over the MTEF.

This includes R2,26 billion to make sure our provincial policing functions have the funding they need to be effective to work with and build up

community based safety partnerships, and to continue critical oversight of the SAPS. Of this amount R1,05 billion is allocated to continue the Law Enforcement Advancement Plan or LEAP, keeping more than 1200 boots on the ground in hotspot areas, so we can continue to make progress in reducing crime.

To address the root causes of crime, this budget will spend over the MTEF R987,38 million on crime prevention and support within the Department of Social Development, specifically to support children at risk and to help set them on a better path and R49,32 million on supporting the work of the new data-led Violence Prevention Unit in the Department of Health and Wellness.

Speaker, to build a strong and resilient society where citizens have the skills that they need to succeed, access to holistic healthcare, including mental health support and where every woman, man and child can meet their basic nutritional needs to live full and healthy lives, the Western Cape prioritises the wellbeing of our citizens as the foundation upon which our success relies.

Over the next three years, the budget of action will spend R170,91 billion including an extra R966,85 million over the MTEF on citizens wellbeing, including on key services such as Education and Healthcare. This includes spending an additional R61 million in 2023/24, R63,89 million 2024/25 and R67,25 million in 2025/26 on a School-Feeding Programme to provide a balanced and nutritionally rich meal to 485 000 learners daily. Building on the highly successful Rapid School Build, by adding R350 million in the



2023/24 financial year, to increase school spaces; R238,36 million over the MTEF to fund Victim Support Programmes, which includes an additional R91,92 million to expand GBV services, such as Victim Empowerment Programmes, shelters for victims of gender-based violence and psychosocial support services; R193,5 million over the MTEF to maintain food relief efforts so that we can continue to assist those who need it; an additional R239,4 million to strengthen Mental Health Services, including the provision of a coordinated and targeted approach to ensure support to the most vulnerable and those at risk, and an additional R92,35 million over the MTEF to support and improve the outcomes of the TB Response Plan ensuring detection, proper care, support to continue treatment as well as prevention interventions.

Speaker, with this Budget of Action, we choose to push on, to roll up our sleeves and to work for a future that we want for our children. I look forward to robust and constructive debate in this House and to hearing the contributions from my colleagues as well as the Opposition on the actions we have taken and are taking to build a better future, because it is only through action, through the fierce urgency of now that we can deliver change and a future full of hope. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I now see hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Mr Speaker, hon Premier and members of the House, during his address on Human Rights Day last week, President

Ramaphosa said the following:

"One of the defining features of the Bill of Rights contained in our Constitution is the inclusion of socio-economic rights. Our Constitution also says that everyone has the right to housing, healthcare, food, water, social security and education and further that the State must take reasonable measures within its available resources to achieve the progressive realisation of each of those rights."

It was interesting, Speaker, that this Province held no Human Rights Day event and also that the Province never focuses on these socio-economic rights which are central to any budget.

We are debating then today available resources which the President alluded to. Today we discuss, once again, whether this DA-led Provincial Administration is making the correct choices from the limited available resources at their disposal, and it is about choices. For instance, in Barrydale, the DA made a choice to back the Mayor in his battle against three black DA councillors. Helen Zille took the side of the Mayor and actually did not listen to the views of others and the choice that the DA made contributed to the rejection... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, please take your seat. Hon Murray, is that a

point of order?

Ms C MURRAY: Yes, thank you, Speaker. That is a point of order.

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order?

Ms C MURRAY: The member is incorrect in his statement and I can confirm that in my Western Cape Provincial Government, Western Cape Provincial Parliament capacity last week on Human Rights Day... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order, hon Murray, what is your point of order?

Ms C MURRAY: An event was held.

The SPEAKER: Hon Murray, what is your point of order?

Ms C MURRAY: He is misleading the House.

The SPEAKER: Hon Murray, that is not a point of order. Hon Dugmore, please continue.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you. So the choice that the DA made there might have seemed a simple political choice but it was also about the choice, which the African and Coloured councillors of the DA in

Swellendam were making about how resources should be utilised, whereas the white DA Mayor had a particular perspective similar to this MEC about where to direct and spend resources and not deal with the real issues on the ground and that is why the DA is a sinking ship. It is divided.

I want to add today that budgets are also about human rights. We can either choose to allocate resources to those members from our society who continue to suffer and deny them the human rights because of the legacy of apartheid, or we can continue to provide for those who have had the privilege passed, like the Swellendam Mayor.

The ANC's view on this issue is that this Provincial Government has not been making the correct choices and have not done so for some time in how they spend the little resources that they have at their disposal for the benefit of those human rights just mentioned.

One example, Speaker, of poor choices is the Tafelberg High School matter. There is only one reason why the DA opposes the Tafelberg site being transformed into a Social Housing Project, despite the fact that the Department of this Provincial Government proposed that Tafelberg gets used for social housing and that reason clearly is to preserve apartheid spatial planning and the beneficiaries of apartheid. They actually want to deny domestic workers who have been saving up for years in Sea Point to have access to that particular site.

MECs in this Government complained about too little funding and shrinking budgets, yet it is scandalous that this Provincial Government spent nearly R5,5 million on legal fees for Tafelberg, which was completely unnecessary. Once again, Helen Zille and the hon Premier are at the centre of refusing to accept the advice of their own Department and use that and took us on a R5 million wasted journey. What could that R5 million have been used for? Actually housing as a human right! That R5,5 million could have been better used to fight crime, to improve school buildings, to fund the Khayelitsha District Hospital, which our members have been raising, because being safe, especially safe in a school building, and having access to healthcare, are human rights. If the R5,5 million spent on Tafelberg is not enough, what about the frivolous and directed, politically directed WCED cases against certain principals in our province, including Mr Newman and many others, that they specifically want to target and then waste all this money. So, a total expenditure on legal and other fees to deny human rights of over R8 million, that is over R8 million, and still counting, not available to Community Police Fora, and this Government should hang its head in shame that contracts for housing in this province and in the City are being handed to the relatives of known gangsters, who are killing people on site because they do not...

Reagen Allen, he seems to be missing in action this year. Premier, you have said nothing about this. You know what is going on besides the corruption in the City of Housing Maintenance Department, you know that gangs have actually taken over and yet you are quiet about this. It is shocking.

Budgets are about choices, but they also about meeting people's human rights. Evidently the Government fails... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, can I please ask you to conclude your last sentence. Your time has expired.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: I will conclude by saying that Coloured, African and Indian people are landless in this province. They lack housing. Some of them go to bed hungry, and that is why this Provincial Government must start making the correct choices. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore. Please take your seat. I now see the hon Fry.

Mr T FRY: Hon Speaker, Premier, Cabinet members and hon members of this House. Beacons are wonderful things. In ancient times and in the not so distant past, they were essential to life. Beacons provide light in the darkness, direction when there is none, and most of all beacons provide a hope for a better future.

In our province, this Government is a beacon of hope, hope that is desperately needed, but there are questions that we need to ask ourselves. Firstly, why is this hope needed?

Speaker, the answer to that is simple. Our nation is fast becoming a failed

state. The President has created yet another ministry, that of Electricity, when there are two other ministries namely Mineral Resources and Energy and Public Enterprises, under which the current crisis of loading blackout should have been resolved 15 years ago, when they first arose.

Our unemployment rate is spiralling out of control, which is a concrete case of a failing National Government. An increasing number of our citizens are living in despair, striving to obtain employment and thus experiencing the indignity of living below the poverty line.

Furthermore, crime is increasing at a frightening rate as up to 75 people are murdered in our nation every day. Our nation desperately needs hope.

What then is this beacon of hope? Hon Speaker, this hope lies in the Provincial Strategic Implementation Plan of the Western Cape. Unlike the plans of the National Government, this Implementation Plan has specific outcomes supported by a clearly defined budget and actual targets governed by realistic timeframes.

This plan will support a number of initiatives across the Provincial Government, which culminates in addressing the key focus areas of energy safety, jobs and wellbeing. The response to the energy crisis is clear. The Energy Resilience Plan is a whole-of-government approach that will see R1,1 billion over three years spread across departments to mitigate the effects of the rolling blackouts in both households as well as the economy at

large. One of the most notable line items is the R85 million that the Department of the Premier will spend in its financial year to reduce the impact of blackouts, support project preparation, grid generation and finance in planning, and the capacity to implement the plan.

R500 million is reserved for the increasingly realistic scenario of a total grid collapse. A final part of what this beacon of hope is, is the plan to increase access to the internet for our citizens.

New Cape Access Centres are planned, including an e-Mobile e-Centre, more money has been allocated to the Broadband initiative and an increase in funding to the Centre for e-Innovation. The Standing Committee on the Premier and Constitutional Matters has welcomed this with delight.

Hon Speaker, so how will this beacon of hope be lit?

To answer this question, let us first turn to the Provincial Strategic Implementation Plan. R95 million has been allocated to the Energy Resilience Plan and of that R60 million is allocated to Emergency Blackout Packs. These packs will provide energy to the poorest of the poor, so that essentials of heating, lighting and charging can still be maintained while the power has been cut.

Other highlights of the Energy Resilience Plan within the Department would be the R9,7 million for Demand Site Management, R3,3 million for municipal



pool buying and R7,5 million for estimating the energy demand in the Western Cape, and thus developing an Integrated Resource Plan.

Hon Speaker, when looking at e-Innovation, R1,378 billion has been allocated to this vital programme, which is an increase of about 12% on the current financial year. Of this R555 million is allocated to the Broadband Project, and there is also an increase in funding to expand the Cape Access Centres, both in the Cape Metro as well as the rural areas, including the establishment of a Mobile Access Centre to service these communities.

As a last point of e-Innovation, the Department will be building a new Digital Experience Platform, as well as strengthening cyber security across the Western Cape Government.

Hon Speaker, beacons are wonderful things. They provide light in darkness, direction where there is none, and most of all, beacons provide hope for a better future.

As I have already stated, the Western Cape Government is doing everything in its power to give that beacon of hope for all of its residents in the light of this budget.

Now is the time to light that beacon and make it shine. The DA supports this budget. I thank you, Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Fry. Thank you members. I now see hon Cassim.

Ms A CASSIM: I thank you, Speaker. Speaker, the EFF cannot support the Appropriation Bill and this Budget as it does not speak to the needs of the people in this province.

Speaker, at some stage we must ask ourselves the question as to whether the money that we spend in this province, does it serve and how does it serve the needs of the people, and more so, the budget, how has the ordinary man in the street ever benefited from it?

It is evident that over and over again, under this DA-led Government, when it comes to budgets, it does not include or rather never prioritises the most critical challenges and the needs of the people in this province, like that of housing, jobs, more schools in poor communities, and even proper intervention programmes for areas affected by crime. [Interjections.]

There are really lots of unnecessary items on this Budget that can be diverted to address the real challenges faced by our people in the Western Cape, but when we look at the state of this province, nothing seems to change when it comes to those in need and the only changes that we will find are that of the pockets of our colonisers, hence always finding corruption especially when it comes to housing projects. We will even find things in this budget like unnecessary subscription fees being paid to our colonisers via the

Commonwealth Parliamentary Association just to sit around the same table as them.

Subscription fees paid here is fruitless and wasteful budgeting and should be diverted to take care of the needs of our people, once again, housing, jobs, among others, and to put on the record the EFF is not in support of SA being a member of the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association because we cannot sit around the same table with our colonisers who subjected us to all forms of oppression without so much of an apology, let alone reparation for all the damage they have done to this country as well as the suffering we endured. [Interjections.] We are really disgusted... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Ms A CASSIM: ...and opposed to this continuous foolishness by the foolish DA-led Government in the Western Cape, who feels the need to spend money on it. Money being spent here is misappropriation of funds and it can only be this pretentious European style DA-led Government that is totally out of touch with the needs of the people in the province... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Ms A CASSIM: If this DA aspire to be European, then they should move there, but leave the rest of us out of it so that we can deal with the real issues of this province. There is nothing to celebrate when it comes to crime...

[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms A CASSIM: ...crime in the province. Crime is increasing in our communities but there are always excuses as to why there are no resources or proper intervention programmes for our communities affected by crime. It cannot be that we have daily shortage of police or law enforcement services in such areas where drug and gangsterism are a norm and it cannot be that there is not much allocated in his budget for proper intervention programmes as well as deployment of more police and law enforcement to tackle such issues in such communities. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Ms A CASSIM: Yet we see the province as usual going all out with the needed deployment of thousands of police... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Ms A CASSIM: Like on Monday, the 20<sup>th</sup>, when poor black people took to the streets to peacefully protest for basic human rights that this Province failed to address, and more so, instead of utilising its police and to arrest drug lords and gansters, this DA-led City and Province were celebrating the arrest of thousands of tyres leading up to 20 March, because they were hoping for a

violent protest instead of focusing and utilising that same intervention effort daily within gang-infested communities where our people are held hostage. But the solution to crime is not only bringing proper intervention programmes and the deployment of more police, among others, but also by eradicating inequality. The Government makes the same mistake that the National Government makes by thinking that policing can solve crime.

The SPEAKER: Hon Cassim, can I please ask you to conclude.

Ms A CASSIM: The way to reduce crime is to eradicate inequality. The EFF is not in support of the budget. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Please take your seat. [Applause.]

Thank you very much, hon members. Members, can I please ask that while I understand that this is a political debate, that you please respect the speaker on the floor and allow everyone an opportunity to address the House. I now see hon Sileku.

Mr I M SILEKU: Good morning, *Somlomo. Goeiemore. Somlomo.*

What I have learnt in my short life experience is that there is one thing or these are two people that are very difficult to deal with. It is a jealous girlfriend and a jealous boyfriend... [Interjections.] [Laughs.]

An HON MEMBER: Sure.

Mr I M SILEKU: Especially if they are exes. So, you cannot expect anything good that would come from your ex because they are so, so jealous. They thought you are not going to progress in life and you are progressing. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

So I hope when the exes speak today that you are not going to take it to heart and that you are going to focus on the Business of the Day. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sileku, can I please ask... [Interjections.] Hon Sileku, hon Sayed, is that a point of order? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Why is his mind...

The SPEAKER: Hon members, there is a member on the floor.

The PREMIER: Chair, on a point of order, I think that is quite sexist, the member is generalising about the way in which exes of particular genders interact... [Laughter.] [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: [Inaudible.] ...about those things.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, please. Can I please ask you to calm down? That is not a point of order. Hon Sileku, can I please remind you of the topic of the debate and while I understand that this is a political debate, can you

please stick to the topic at hand? [Interjections.]

Hon members! [Interjections.] Order, members! Order, members!

†Mnr I M SILEKU: Die waarheid maak seer, agbare Speaker.

[Mr I M SILEKU: The truth hurts, hon Speaker.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sileku, please address me.

†Mnr I M SILEKU: Agbare Speaker, Premier, Kabinetslede,

[Mr I M SILEKU: Hon Speaker, Premier, Cabinet members,] and hon members of the House. Over a week ago Minister Wenger delivered the Provincial Government's Budget, a budget aimed at restoring hope for the Western Cape communities, entrenching the urgency of this Government's commitments to its residents, and showing the Provincial Government's care for our most disadvantaged communities through the prioritisation of infrastructure development across the Western Cape.

Hon Speaker, I rise confidently in support of Vote 10, Infrastructure. The Western Cape Department of Infrastructure has been allocated R9,8 billion of the Provincial Budget for the upcoming financial year 2023/24. This allocation demonstrates that the Western Cape Government has not only spoken about the need for urgent service delivery, but is also putting it into action in every way possible.

Hon members, I commend the Western Cape Government for establishing the new Infrastructure Department. This new Department will not only create employment for the Western Cape, but it will also allow the Government to prioritise infrastructure related projects.

It will assist the Provincial Government to plan infrastructure projects through Government and private sector contribution more effectively.

Hon Speaker, before we look at the future, we must acknowledge the achievements of the Department of Human Settlements throughout the current financial year. To address the country's rising unemployment rate, particularly among the youth, the Department was on track towards training young people in the construction industry, equipping them with essential skills for future employment in the field. Many locals in various communities of the Western Cape can attest to the job opportunities they were given as a result of Human Settlements housing projects; noted that even though some housing projects were facing extortion, the Department proactively contributed safety precautions within its Human Settlements Projects.

In the current financial year the Informal Settlements Upgrading Partnership Grant ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr I SILEKU: ... was implemented .....[Interjections.]



The SPEAKER: Hon member Sileku, please take you seat. Hon Chief Whip, is that a point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP [DA]: Yes, thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, in terms of the Rules it is very clear in terms of conversing aloud. Can you kindly rule because hon members Nkondlo and Marran just keeps on addressing the member across the floor. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Chief Whip.

I am listening very carefully, hon members, listening very carefully. Can I please caution all members that when there is a member on the floor to please allow that member, but, hon Chief Whip, I am not going to rule on that point of order. [Interjections.]

Hon member Sileku, can you please continue. [Interjections.]

Hon members, please. There a member on the floor. [Interjections.] Please respect the member on the floor.

Hon member Sileku, please continue. [Interjections.]

Mr I SILEKU: While this has been a success, the Department has faced

numerous challenges, including land invasions, complex community dynamics and incidence of extortion.

The new Department of Infrastructure continues to implement a Help Me Buy A Home programme, which gives individuals earning between R3 501 to R22 000, more flexibility on their route to home ownership.

Many residents, especially young professionals, can speak to how this programme has impacted their lives, particularly in the context of our country's economy where property ownership is becoming increasingly expensive and difficult to achieve. The Department will also continue its deferred ownership pilot project in which beneficiaries can rent units for up to three years before having the chance to purchase the units.

Hon Speaker, Transport Infrastructure Programme III has received 46% of the total infrastructure budget. This highlights the Western Cape Government's continued efforts to guarantee that roads in our province are maintained while jobs are created and young people are trained and upskilled.

The budget furthermore reveals that accredited learnership training opportunities will be provided to 170 unemployed youth from across the Western Cape. 18 boiler-making apprentices will be supported, 25 electrical and 25 plumbing learners will be placed on a two year apprenticeship programme. This fall under the Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP), which is aimed at ensuring the achievement of the EPWP work opportunities

target of 67 882. The Standing Committee on Infrastructure will work hard to perform oversight on the implementation of this project.

Hon Speaker, despite the Department's tireless efforts to ensure that Western Cape housing beneficiaries receive their homes on time and in good condition, the Department has encountered significant challenges as a result of gangs ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr I SILEKU: ... that intimidate and extort contractors by demanding so-called protection money. Dozens of housing, schools and other infrastructure development projects in the province have been halted as a result of extortionist gangs. Extortionists have had a detrimental impact on the dignity of ten of thousands of housing beneficiaries and school children.

I am delighted to have witnessed some of the Department's safety strategies for mitigating this matter. While the Department is working tirelessly on keeping contractors protected, the absence of arrest by the South African Police Services ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Sileku ...[Interjections.]

Mr I SILEKU: ... is concerning.

The SPEAKER: ... please conclude, your time has expired. [Interjections.]

Mr I SILEKU: Hon Speaker, the DA supports this budget. Thank you.  
[Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Sileku. [Interjections.]

Hon members ...[Interjections.]

†'n AGB LID: Jy is *jealous*, man! [Gelag.]

[An HON MEMBER: You are jealous, man! ][Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.]

Hon members, please allow the next speaker. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

Hon member August, I see you.

Mr S AUGUST: Hon Speaker, I do not know if I am speaking as the ex-boyfriend here. [Laughter.]

Hon Speaker ...[Interjections.]

†'n AGB LID: Jy is aan die veilige kant. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: You are on the safe side. ][Interjections.]

Mr S AUGUST: ... the Western Cape Provincial Budget ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, there is a member on the floor.

Mr S AUGUST: Hon Speaker, the Western Cape Provincial Budget as tabled by the MEC Wenger, has been since 2019 a theoretical document with little to no real impact. [Interjections.]

Under MEC Maynier we have had a budget focusing on consolidation for maximum impact, a budget for you, a budget for hope, as well as a budget to push forward. [Interjections.]

Under MEC Wenger the budget of action, a future full of hope was tabled. [Interjections.] What do they all have in common you might ask. Let me answer. [Interjections.]

They string together words and phrases to get the people into thinking that this Government works for them. [Interjections.] Well, it really is not. The DA-led Western Cape Government has done everything in its power since Helen's reign to stop and oppose inner city spatial transformation. We also see this as the main objective of Premier Winde.

In addition, this Government has been actively contributing towards the

creation of informal settlements with its lack of urgency in building decent homes for the poor and the needy.

DA-led municipalities across the Western Cape share the tale of two towns or cities, where one part enjoys uninterrupted services, green parks, working streetlights and lush greens, and on the other side you will find war zones, sewage spills, inconsistent water supplies and inhumane living conditions. [Interjections.]

This administration is so obsessed with the National Government, its main objective deviates from prioritising the needs and the challenge of its people and this budget reconfirms and heralds that obsession. [Interjections.]

Instead of finding tangible solutions to ailing problems it will in turn use taxpayers' money to fund each better than the ANC campaign. [Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, this administration funnelled hundreds of millions into safety and security in the City, but the CBD is now considered the robbery capital of South Africa. How does this make sense?

Cape Town Central and Mitchells Plain Police Stations won first and second respectively on the top 30 police stations for 17 community contact crimes. Take note, these areas enjoy a great deal of law enforcement presence. How functional is your Safety Plan considering that they are planning on spending R4,76 billion over the next three years on Community Safety?

Please justify the provincial spend of R39,82 billion for economic growth, but you overlook the informal trade sector that has the potential to absorb unemployment, youth, women and persons with disability.

This Government claims to follow the data which is quite difficult to believe seeing that the Deputy Speaker is going one way by hosting anti-vaxxers, and the Premier and the Department of Health run in the total opposite direction. Therefore, I cannot support this budget.

An HON MEMBER: Is that so?

An HON MEMBER: Wow! [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member August.

I now see the hon America. [Interjections.]

†Mnr D AMERICA: Baie dankie, agb Speaker.

Agb Speaker, lede van die Huis en mede-burgers van die Wes-Kaap. Ons moet onthou dat vervoer nie net oor die beweging vanaf punt A na punt B gaan nie. [Tussenwerpsels.] Dit gaan oor die verbindings tussen mense, die skepping van geleenthede en die vorming ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, hon Speaker.]

Hon Speaker, members of the House and fellow citizens of the Western Cape. We must remember that transport is not just about the movement from point A to point B. [Interjections.] It's about the connections between people, the creation of opportunities and the formation ...] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

†Mnr D AMERICA: ... van die toekoms van ons provinsie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Daar is drie noodsaaklike pilare van vervoer wat ons visie vir die Vir Beter Môre sal rig: veiligheid, ekonomiese ontwikkeling en hoop. Veiligheid is nie onderhandelbaar nie, agb lid Marran. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Ons vervoerstelsel moet veilig wees vir al ons burgers.

[Mr D AMERICA: ... of the future of our province. [Interjections.]

There are three essential pillars of transport that will direct our vision for the For a Better Tomorrow: safety, economic development and hope. Safety is not negotiable, hon member Marran. [Interjections.]

Our transport system must be safe for all our citizens.]

†n AGB LID: Ja!

[An HON MEMBER: Yes!]



†Mnr D AMERICA: Deur die jare het ons tragiese ongelukke, onverdraagsaamheid, sinnelose geweld en 'n ongereguleerde taxi-bedryf gesien wat die lewens van ons mense in gevaar stel. Tragiese ongelukke met die vervoer van plaaswerkers blyk ook 'n groot bekommernis te wees. Dit is dus ons verantwoordelikheid om hierdie probleme aan te spreek, pad- en verkeersregulasies te eerbiedig, te handhaaf en veilige en betroubare vervoeropsies vir die inwoners van die Wes-Kaap te bied. Ons moet verseker dat ons paaie, spoorweë en hawens veilig en toeganklik is vir almal, veral die mees kwesbares.

Alhoewel dit 'n uitdaging vir die meeste in ons land is, word daar sigbare pogings in die Wes-Kaap aangewend om die kwessies aan te spreek.

Agb Speaker, ekonomiese ontwikkeling is die ruggraat van ons provinsie se vooruitgang. Ons kan dit nie bekostig om die rol van vervoer in die dryf van ekonomiese groei en werkskepping te ignoreer of te onderskat nie.

Ons vervoerstelsel moet doeltreffend wees, bekostigbaar en goed gekoppel wees om die volle potensiaal van ons ekonomie te ontsluit. So ook moet ons vervoerinfrastruktuur die vermoë hê om die groeiende behoeftes van 'n groeiende bevolking en die ekonomie te ondersteun.

Werkskepping bly 'n tergende uitdaging. Ons onvermoë om 'n vaartbelynde netwerk van vervoer-infrastruktuur te vestig en die investering daarvan bly 'n

prioriteit vir ons Regering. Hierdie begroting is inderdaad tekenend daarvan.

Daarom is die integrasie van verskeie vervoermodi soos busse, treine en taxi's in hierdie verband krities. Dit sal nie net verkeersopeenhopings verminder nie, maar ook nuwe besigheidseleenthede skep en die mobiliteit van ons burgers verbeter.

Agb Speaker, hoop is wat ons voortdryf selfs in die aangesig van ons uitdagings. Vervoer gaan nie net oor die fisieke beweging van mense en goedere nie. Dit gaan oor die hoop op 'n beter lewe, 'n beter toekoms en 'n beter wêreld. Vervoer verbind mense, kulture en idees, en hoop is ons gesamentlike verbintenis.

Ons moet hierdie krag van vervoer omhels om hoop te inspireer en 'n helderder toekoms vir al ons burgers te bou. Ek is verheug om hierdie Huis mee te deel dat die Kaapstadse Sentrale Treinlyn gedeeltelik onlangs geopen het. Ons volgehoue druk op die Nasionale Regering het verseker dat hierdie ekonomiese slagaar wat 'n belangrike mylpaal is in ons reis na 'n beter vervoerstelsel, uiteindelik die lig gesien het.

Hierdie lyn is nie net 'n treinspoor nie, dit is 'n lewenslyn vir baie burgers wat daarop staat maak om na hul werk, studie, ontspanning en geliefdes te pendel. Ek is derhalwe jammer dat die Minister op Dinsdag, môre, 'n reis op hierdie trein sou onderneem het om die potensiaal eerstehands te ervaar. Ongelukkig moet dit afgestel word. Ek hoop dit sal spoedig gebeur.

[Mr D AMERICA: through the years we have seen tragic accidents, intolerance, senseless violence and an unregulated taxi industry that endanger the lives of our people. Tragic accidents with the transport of farm workers also seem to be a big concern. It is therefore our responsibility to address these problems, adhere to and maintain road and traffic regulations, and offer safe and reliable transport options to the citizens of the Western Cape. We must ensure that our roads, railways and harbours are safe and accessible to all, especially the most vulnerable.

Although it is a challenge to most of us in our country, there are tangible efforts in the Western Cape to address these issues.

Hon Speaker, economic development is the backbone of our province's progress. We cannot afford to ignore or underestimate the role of transport in the drive for economic development and job creation.

Our transport system must be effective, affordable and well connected to unlock the full potential of our economy. Our transport infrastructure must also have the capacity to support the increasing needs of a growing population and the economy.

Job creation remains a serious challenge. Our inability to establish a streamlined network of transport infrastructure and the investment thereof remain a priority for our Government. This budget is in fact indicative of that.

Therefore the integration of various transport modes such as buses, trains and taxis in this regard is critical. It will not only reduce traffic congestion, but also create new business opportunities and improve the mobility of our citizens.

Hon Speaker, hope is what drives us even in the face of our challenges. Transport is not only about the physical movement of people and goods. It's about the hope of a better life, a better future and a better world. Transport connects people, cultures and ideas, and hope is what joins us together.

We have to embrace this power of transport to inspire hope and build a clearer future for all our citizens. I am pleased to tell this House that the Cape Town Central Train Line has recently opened partially. Our continued pressure on the National Government ensured that this economic artery, that is an important milestone on our journey to a better transport system, finally saw the light.

This line is not merely a railway line, it is a lifeline for many citizens who depend on it to travel to their work, study, recreation and loved ones. I am therefore sorry that the Minister would have travelled on this train tomorrow, Tuesday, to experience the potential firsthand; unfortunately it had to be cancelled. I hope it will happen soon.]

Hon Speaker, hon members of the House and fellow citizens, let us continue

to work together to make our transport system safer, more efficient and more hopeful. Let us embrace the power of transport to drive economic development, create new opportunities and shape a better future for our province.

As we move forward, let us remember the wisdom of Tata Nelson Mandela, which says:

"It always seems impossible until it is done."

Let us do the impossible, let us make a difference, let us devolve the power to manage and operate our rail transport to the City of Cape Town and let us inspire hope. Thank you, hon Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member America.

I now see the hon member Christians.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, the ACDP welcomes the Provincial Budget tabled by Minister Wenger on 14 March 2023. [Interjections.]

As we heard, hon Speaker, the medium-term expenditure framework, R1,1 billion will be set aside for the energy security and the decrease on the

reliance on Eskom, but, hon Speaker, we must also note that according to the Chief Executive Officer, the former Chief Executive Officer, André de Ruyter, R1 billion is stolen a month from Eskom. R1 billion. It is alleged that the ANC is involved in stealing this money.

So that is, hon Speaker, concerning and nothing is said about that.

[Interjections.]

Secondly, hon Speaker, over the next three years [Interjections.]

R39,82 billion has been allocated ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: ... to boost economic growth, to create opportunities for the citizens.

Now, hon Speaker, the question that I want to ask Minister Wenger is the following: what does it cost the Province when we have a national shutdown, a have failed national shutdown that happened on Monday? The Biznews said the shutdown fails to impress, leaves the party, like the EFF, weak and isolated. [Interjections.] What does it cost this province? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Hon Speaker, another question ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: ... and the Minister spoke about economic growth, but there is uncertainty, there is uncertainty when it comes to the economic growth because the uncertainty hanging over this country and this province is a coalition between ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: ... the ANC and the EFF for next year.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Christians, please take your seat.  
[Interjections.]

Hon members, we have allowed other hon members an opportunity without severe interruption and disruption. Please allow the same for hon member Christians. [Interjections.]

Hon members, please. Hon member Christians, you may continue.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Speaker.

We have now seen what is happening in Tshwane. We saw what is happening in Joburg. So the EFF is a declining party and has no relevance and they, as

the ANC ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Christians, my apologies, please take your seat.

Hon member Sayed, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: No, Chair, is hon member Christians willing to take a question?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Christians, are you prepared to take a question?  
[Interjections.]

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: He remembers my previous reply, so it stays the same.  
[Interjections.] The previous reply I had, it is the same as what I said.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Christians is not prepared to take a question,  
for the record.

Hon member Christians, you may continue. [Interjections.]

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Hon Speaker, you see people can say whatever they want, the EFF and the ANC are a threat to this economy, it is a threat to job growth, [Interjections.] it is a threat to South Africa and the voter will say that in 2024, [Interjections.] they will not get votes.



Now let me tell you further what Biznews said about the EFF. Let me further tell you what it says. [Interjections.] It says that ...[Interjections.]

Ms A CASSIEM: Hon Speaker?

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: ... the EFF has taken a ...[Interjections.]

Ms A CASSIEM: Sorry, hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Christians, [Interjections.] please take your seat.

Can I please the Table staff to just ...[Interjections.]

Ms A CASSIEM: Sorry, can the hon member please stick to the topic and not be obsessed about the EFF?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Cassiem, I did not recognise you. Hon member Cassiem, [Interjections.] hon member Cassiem. Hon member Cassiem, I am addressing you. You had a point of order, what is your point of order? [Interjections.] Alright, that is not a point of order.

Hon members, can I please ask that you allow hon Christians – you might not like what the presentation is [Interjections.], but that is his right to present his presentation. Can I please ask that members respect one another.

Hon Christians, you may continue. [Interjections.]

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Speaker.

The importance of this is that, as I said previously, the EFF and the ANC, I do not think they love this country. I do not think they love the people. [Interjections.] Because you do not do actions of stealing, you do not do actions of shutdown.

Now this shutdown, this shutdown that they had, they say it is a huge success, [Interjections.] but we know it is a huge failure ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Christians, your time has expired. Please conclude. [Interjections.]

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

Hon members, hon members, please calm down. [Interjections.] Please settle down, hon members. [Interjections.] Hon members, before I recognise the next speaker can you please settle down.

I now see hon member Marais, Minister Marais. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Hon Speaker, the Department of Culture Affairs and Sport recognises the need to put preventative programmes in place to ensure that we can stem the rising tide of youth disillusionment and address the issue of youth unemployment.

We want to ensure that we are a province that prioritises the well-being of all who live here and especially our youth, as the youth is the hope of our future.

We have seen that our youth are feeling a sense of hopelessness due to unemployment and challenging social circumstances. We must take an approach of addressing the root of the problem rather than trying to deal with the effects later down the line. We believe in taking a proactive approach which will enable us to reach out to our youth and offer them renewed hope before they lose their way due to the various temptations of fast money and status.

To this end the Western Cape Government is working together on a number of youth projects which aim to bring hope of a sense of urgency to our youth. The Western Cape Government, through Provincial Treasury and the Youth Forum, has negotiated a partnership with YES to provide a second year of funding for stipends for youth on Western Cape Government youth programmes. Year Beyond, Chrysalis, PAY, and Work & Skills, for those youth who are not able to move into the economy within a six to 12 month programmes offered by the Western Cape Government.

This would mean that rather than short *ad hoc* programmes, the Western Cape Government will develop a pipeline to offer unemployment youth with meaningful work experience, including monitoring and development of soft skills for at least six months to two years. This will offer them the opportunity to build their CVs, gain important knowledge and skills and assist them to become economically active adults.

Our Year Beyond programme is constantly growing and over the past year we have offered work experience opportunities to approximately 3 000 unemployment youth.

We have partnered with other Government departments, NGOs and private partners to offer a whole of society approach, and we aim to increase the number of youth who receive work experience opportunities to 4 000 in the new financial year.

In 2022 the Year Beyond programme worked with 53 partners of 354 sites across the province. The Year Beyond programme is also unique in that it gives back to communities. The youth on a programme are placed within communities where they are then able to bring help to learners, educators and Government institutions such as libraries and museums.

This ensures a two-way flow where youth are given work experience opportunities and they can plough their experience and their skills back into

the community.

Hon Speaker, funding to the amount of R2 million was received for the new financial year to unlock learners' creativity. This programme is part of the Mzansi Golden Economy Strategy, which aims to create sustainable jobs and develop the arts, culture and heritage sector.

25 artists will be appointed to work with classroom teachers to teach art and culture in three districts: Cape Winelands, Central Karoo and West Coast. We believe that hope and imagination go hand-in-hand and when we empower youth to dream big we will see that they will reap success.

Our Department offers youth who are interested in the arts and culture spheres the opportunity to gain more experience in the fields of script writing and producing pieces for the stage. We want to ensure that we can give our young people exposure to world class stages and that they will be inspired to follow their dreams and pursue careers in the arts.

We continue to offer work experience opportunities to youth through the EPWP programme, with the majority of EPWP interns placed at our museums and libraries to ensure that they can get a holistic working experience. These interns gain valuable work experience that can serve as a stepping stone to a next career opportunity.

We have seen the impact of both sport and arts and culture in fostering well-

being. Our MOD and after school structures offer children a first opportunity to participate in sport and to hone their talents. In 2022, Team Western Cape reached historic first place finishes in both the Winter and Summer Games. This shows the level of talent we have in the province, as well as the hunger of our youth to be involved in sporting activities.

Our after school activities offer our young people the chance to take part in dancing, creative arts, music and other arts and culture activities. Our youth, who have come through this programme, continue to perform on world platforms.

Our aim is to ensure that every young person can find the activity that they are passionate about and have the opportunity to grow their talents in that chosen path. There is a clear link between living active, healthy lifestyles and maintaining mental well-being.

2023 has been a year of hosting major sporting and cultural events in the Western Cape. These major events bring an economic boost through overseas investment and touring spectators, athletes and other participants. They bring job creating opportunities, especially for our youth. These events offer opportunities for connections for people to engage positively and to encourage healthy and active lifestyles.

The successful hosting of the T20 Women's Cricket World Cup served as a wonderful opportunity to inspire our young aspiring female athletes to pursue

their athletic dreams.

Hon Speaker, it is clear that we must prioritise the well-being of our youth especially as we look at addressing social ills and unemployment. We must look at the source of the problem and put preventative measures in place to ensure that we do not get overwhelmed with trying to control the problem.

With our approach to youth in the province we believe that we are taking important steps to address the pertinent issues and to help our youth rediscover their hope and joy. The [Inaudible.] Henri J M Nouwen said, and I quote:

"Joy does not simply happen to us, we have to choose joy and keep choosing it every day."

Therefore when we foster an enabling environment of holistic well-being and hope for all, we can help every person to reach their full potential and to choose joy every day. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Marais.

Budgets are about choices, but they are also about human rights. The ANC wishes to decline support for this Appropriation Bill today because budgets are about human rights and we do not believe that this budget presented by this DA administration keeps in mind the human rights of the poor, people

who remain predominantly Coloured, Africans and Indians in this province, when they were drafted.

This budget simply repeats what it did last year and the year before that. The figures may have changed, but the facts have not. If we accept that budgets represent what a government chooses to do or not choose. There is no urgency in this budget to address the chronic challenges faced by our people, challenges which undermine their human rights.

It is this DA Government that often wants to claim the Khayelitsha District Hospital and the Mitchells Plain Hospital as their achievements, even though these were conceptualised under the ANC governance in this province.

Yet this budget makes no provision to address the 130% occupancy rate at Khayelitsha District, or the R150 million that they so desperately need to function, and this is the choice of this DA Government. [Interjections.] Mitchell's Plain Hospital is at 120% capacity.

At the same time this Provincial Government under the DA has been consistently failing to build enough houses. In the last decade, 2012 to 2022, under the DA rule there has been a 52,7% drop in the number of houses built and a 40% decrease in the number of sites serviced. The DA is building half the houses today than they were building 10 years ago.

This is the budget of the DA and the choice that the DA is making. According



to this Provincial Government's own PERO, the number of houses built in 2021/22 met only 1% of the registered housing demand. Yet if the DA is not upholding and ensuring our people's human rights through the correct appropriations, then they are also rubbing salt into the wounds of non-service delivery by returning vast sums to the Provincial Revenue Fund.

Our estimates are that in the last financial year alone:

- Over R77,5 million was returned to the Provincial Revenue Fund.
- The Children's Commissioners had to lose out on nearly R5 million.
- R40 million surrendered to PRF from Department of the Premier because of a service provider not being ready to upgrade the Broadband.
- R14 million surrendered back to the PRF because of capital funding reallocation.
- Over R3 million surrendered back to the PRF because the Department of Local Government could not make the necessary contract appointments.

The reality is that the DA and especially where they govern here in the Western Cape, has no plan for jobs and no plan to grow the economy. As we heard in the budget speech the so-called growth for jobs plan is still to be finalised as the DA is exiting this administration, 14 years into DA rule and four years into this administration's term of office.

Consistently the ANC has said in this House look at the township economy, learn from Gauteng and allow those stakeholders in the township economy to tell you as the Provincial Government what they need. Do not be patronising when dealing with the township economy. Do not think you can prescribe to the township economy what they must do.

That is exactly what happened to your Pick n Pay Spaza Shop project. It went bust because this Government thought they knew the answers to the township economy and could tell people how to run them.

Let us start with the most obvious industry in the township economy, the taxis. Taxis provide 84% of public transport in this province. This budget completely ignores the industry. Instead we are told that the province will continue to work with Golden Arrow, which provides transport services to 220 000 passengers per day. According to the former MEC for Transport in this province, 220 000 is only 13% of passengers using public transport.

The Premier, and it was repeated by the MEC in her budget speech, insists that this Provincial Government is data driven, yet it is prepared to work with and subsidise a service provider that only provides 13% of the public transport needs of this province, and if this was not madness on its own, it then insist on ignoring that taxi industry which supplies 84% of public transport to commuters on a daily basis.

Another important cog in the wheel of the township economy is infrastructure in our townships. Business hubs in our townships have not been maintained or invested in. Instead we are told of containers as the solution to infrastructure for intrapreneurs in townships.

As early as 2001 Former President Thabo Mbeki launched the Urban Renewal

Plan, [Interjections.] the programme sought to address infrastructure deficiencies and declining economies characterised by poverty and neglect. [Interjections.] We remember then that Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha were two of the sites of the roll out of this project.

Sadly, when the DA came into power in the City in 2006, in the province in 2009, resources were then redirected to wealthier areas. We still await, yet not a single item raised under infrastructure by the MEC in her budget, spoke to improving infrastructure for the sake of doing business. She allocated funds for infrastructure in transport, assuming for the Golden Arrow and MyCiTi and Go George buddies.

She allocated funds for infrastructure in housing, which will probably not be spent given the consistent decline in delivery of houses over the last decade and also the hands of the likes of their own DA deploy, MMC Booi, whose hand is in the cookie jar.

Funds for infrastructure in Education, which is mainly being supported by funds from the National Government. R3,86 billion for infrastructure of clinics, hospitals and challenges, and an allocation of infrastructure for basic services, but nothing for infrastructure in townships to stimulate and promote the local economy, nothing for local economic development. Yet this is the business model of the DA.

Our people must keep going to the malls, must keep going to the

conglomerates such as Pick n Pay and Shoprite, who continue to put thousands of SMMEs out of businesses. A base for the DA is Mitchells Plain. The DA must tell the people of Mitchells Plain, and especially the SMMEs, how much it has invested in the town centre in the last 10 years.

Today the town centre is the shell of its former hub of economic activity. Today buildings are abandoned in the town centre. What has the DA done to revitalise the economy of Mitchells Plain? Other than the show that this Premier did to go and put the SONA in Mitchells Plain, what exactly are the significant changes that have been done in Mitchells Plain?

While the funds for alternative energy supplies to SMMEs must be welcomed, that is where the support seems to stop.

Hon Speaker, this DA Provincial Government, especially the Premier and the MEC for Finance, must stop with sloganeering smokes and screens, stop the spin and provide substance. We cannot support a budget which is simply not radical, we cannot be comfortable with the status quo and this budget simply reaffirms, reinforces the status quo of a white elite and also black majority that must remain poor and therefore as the ANC we do not support this budget. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you, hon member Nkondlo.

I now see hon Minister Mbombo. Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Just give me one second, the Table staff can make sure that we get your time right. Okay, you can go.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, hon Speaker.

In the early 16<sup>th</sup> century, the AB Church of St Peter in Westminster was absorbed into the Diocese of London when the Diocese of Westminster was dissolved. A few years later many of the assets once belonging to the Diocese of Westminster were later expropriated in order to fund the repairs needing to take place at St Paul's Cathedral.

While this event may seem irrelevant and from a distant era, it is claimed to have given rise to a common and well-known proverb which we still use to this day:

"To rob Peter to pay Paul."

This saying could not be more relevant to represent what is happening to healthcare funding in the Western Cape. However, this robbing is not due to our Provincial Government, Mama Nkondlo. No, this lies solely on the doorsteps of the National Government.

The ANC Government, [Interjections.] the ANC Government and throughout National and Provincial, we have seen the chowing of taxpayers' money, the stealing of the money, for which people have worked long hours for. This is an obvious fact that has happened for years [Interjections.] and one which intensified during the national disaster as a result of pandemic.

The PPE money that was stolen, [Interjections.] where you find that [Interjections.] that ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: ... healthcare workers ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: ... ended up being exposed to ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: ... infection.

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: And now the ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: ... feasting has caught up.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat.

Hon members, can I please ask that you allow the Minister to do her presentation? I am [Interjections.] – hon Chief Whip, I am mindful that this is a political debate [Interjections.], but please allow the – hon Chief, I am on the floor.

Can I please ask that you allow the members on the floor who are speaking an opportunity to make their presentations. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: And now the feasting has caught up. A combination of a shrinking economy, increased sovereign debt and widespread unemployment has led to the National Government, which is under the ANC, to rob Peter – which is us – in order to pay Paul in terms of what is happening across [Interjections.], and Health is getting to short end of the stick.

Hon Speaker, for the first time [Interjections.], the first time the Western

Cape now will have, will receive a decreased allocation in his Equitable Share and Conditional Grants. [Interjections.] First time.

When considering the impact of this on cost of employment, goods and services and transfers, the Department of Health and Wellness faces a budget shortfall of R1,5 billion. [Interjections.] One year, R1,5 billion in this budget year that we are not getting.

While this amount is only around 5% of the Defence budget for the next financial year, it is a lot of money. Probably, hon Speaker, let me put this shortfall into perspective so that one can understand.

The 1 694 posts, it is about R916 million for the COA. With a R1,5 billion it means that we have to let go of 1 694 posts. With a cut of a R1,5 billion, hon Speaker, it means that – which Mama Nkondlo has already referred to these hospitals – it is a combined budget of one year of Mitchells Plain Hospital, of the Karl Bremer Hospital, of the Khayelitsha Hospital, meaning that R1,5 billion, those three hospitals need to be closed if you look at that.

Hon Speaker, hon Speaker [Interjections.], it means ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: ... the [Interjections.] termination ...[Interjections.]



The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: ... it will mean the ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Is my time ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, there is a hon member on the floor.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: It will mean, hon Speaker, that termination of the conversion of the Brackengate and Sonstraal Hospitals to Transitional Care Hospitals, which is also part of the service redesign, to shift from the in-patient care to more ambulatory and transitional care, it will mean that we have to let go.

Although there are five grants, with the two grants – National Tertiary Service Grant and Human Resource Grant – that have been decreased, it will mean that the training components will have a significant impact on the service delivery, especially to the specialist services and the registered training that is happening at Groote Schuur and also in Tygerberg Central Hospital.

The less money we are allocated from the National Government, which is the taxpayers' money, it is not even their money, the less we are able to realise the principles of the university [Inaudible.] ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is also not your money.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: ... where the country has to go to. Even though our Province has had to dip into its reserves to partially pay for this deficit by allocating again R1,5 billion shortage that we are getting, guess what? The Province has to rob Peter from other departments and get the reserve to pay us [Interjections.] R1 billion. [Interjections.]

So the Province has given us R1 billion, which is more than 400%, [Interjections.] it is four times of the amount that they normally give us. If you look in terms of the previous year's amount it was.

So the province has tried to save us from that billion, I mean from the one point billion shortages, it means that at least we could be able to do other things. We will continue to push forward with our community-based primary health focus, whilst also ensuring that our current services and infrastructure are able to meet the demand of our communities, given the socio-economic climate.

We have a population, hon Speaker, of about 7,2 million. I think we are the third populous province, where we have got 75% that are uninsured When

they talk about the region, even those who are rich, if you go outside the Metro, in the Matzikama area or Beaufort West, you do not get private hospitals, even then they have to use also our facilities.

In fulfilling its constitutional mandate to progressively realise the right to healthcare, this Department, hon Speaker, is going to have to do more with much less so that our 571 service points, which is the 448 primary healthcare service points, 52 hospitals, 49 EMS stations, are able to serve the other residents and it is non-negotiable.

No matter how the incompetence of the National Government and the stealing of the monies that are happening there, [Interjections.] and the effects of this Government have on our country, we dare not to fail.

The Western Cape is the only hope for South Africa and must go above and beyond to succeed so that our country succeeds, no matter how much Peter is robbed for Paul, but we have to do **dala** whatever we must. Thank you, hon Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Mbombo.

I now see hon member Allen, Minister Allen.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
Thank you so much, hon Speaker. [Interjections.] Hon Premier, hon Cabinet

members, hon members of this House, the Leader of the Opposition.

Less than 14 days ago the hon Minister of Finance, Mireille Wenger, clearly stated that the Western Cape's budget is one of action and hope, and I do want to thank the ACDP for their support in that particular regard. [Interjections.] This is not, as we have continuously demonstrated, we are not paying lip service, but actually delivering and this is seen in our action. [Interjections.]

I have noted that the Leader of the Opposition quoted the President and we have seen consistently that particular narrative is merely lip service. We are wanting to ensure that it leads to action.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] lip service. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: It is lip service from the ANC's ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... side for a number of years ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please speak ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...  
and that is quite frankly ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, hon Minister Allen ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: The  
Western Cape Government remains the only province ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Allen, please speak to the Chair and not to the  
members across the floor. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
Thank you. The Leader of the Opposition did say that I have been missing in  
action, hon Speaker, so I just wanted him to make sure that he sees me or  
maybe he is referring to a different Reagen Allen, but I am in the House.  
[Interjections.]

I take your comments seriously [Interjections.], via you ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...  
hon Speaker. [Interjections.] Via you, hon Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... to the Leader of the Opposition, I take his comments seriously and I have noted further comments from his speech.

The National Government's inability to protect our residents is well-documented and there are various examples. Let me start, there is no desire to support the dedicated men and women in blue in this particular province.

The majority of our officers in this province are eager to do their best, yet around every corner you have hats and bats making it merely impossible for them to be effective.

Through you, hon Speaker, I also want to thank the EFF. They have provided a subtle support for our call for devolution because the EFF clearly stated in this House that our budget did not allocate additional police officers. So, I do interpret that the same as the ANC's comments previously, that the call for devolution for policing powers to be closer to the people, is resonating not only on this side of the aisle, but amongst hon members of this particular House. So, hon Speaker, if there had been any appetite to effectively support the officers, they, too, would have been able to diligently do their work at a station level and that is exactly what we have been advocating for.

I do not need to rehash this but let me state again. We have a police-to-population ratio of 1 officer for every 1 016 residents in the area of the whole of Cloetesville. That particular station in Stellenbosch has over 1 242 residents and only one particular officer servicing that amount. The Makhaza Station in Khayelitsha would by now have been constructed and operational, should this particular Western Cape Government have had operational powers over the South African Police Service. Judges would not have findings of gangsters colluding with both senior and junior SAPS members. The Equality Court would not have an adverse finding against SAPS management that is discriminating against poor and black people. So, we could go on making numerous examples.

Thinking about this actually makes me quite sick because it is a complete disgrace, and this ANC-led National Government has blood of all the innocent victims on their hands. I can just imagine if the foreign currency that was found in a couch of a particular person whose words were echoed in this House and quoted in this House. If that particular quote on Human Rights Day led to action, we would have actually seen a focus ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes! Yes.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
...a focus from the ANC [Interjections.] that would outwardly lead to more boots on the ground. [Interjections.] So, we would want the ANC to focus.

So, through you, thank you to hon member Marran, hon Speaker, for his call to the ANC to focus. But this means that over the MTEF, R105-billion is allocated to continue the Law Enforcement Advancement Programme. We will further, like the hon Minister has indicated, allocate R2,26-billion over the MTEF to ensure that our provincial policing functions have the funding they need to be effective, hon Speaker, to work with and to build up community-based safety partnerships and to continue our critical oversight over the South African Police Service.

Hon Speaker, I have said it in this House that our Department does not want a free pass. Even in the current legal framework, we would want our oversight to lead to better service delivery because oversight has to lead to better service delivery, and this is part of the reason why we will continue to hold SAPS accountable. Our Neighbourhood Watches, our CPFs play a critical role in fighting crime.

We have even seen the EFF speaker's remarks with regards to the shutdown. I want to thank the EFF's members, all 600 of them, that marched peacefully as well. [Laughter.] So, I want to thank them for their nature because we would never want to stifle democracy and the freedom of any person to protest and to walk our streets, but like we have said, as long as they stick to the law. So, I want to thank the 600 EFF members.

We will also continue to support our districts because we have seen the value



that districts offer and R36,5-million of our funding has gone in that regard. So, as I conclude. I would like our residents to know that we have their best interests at heart and unlike the ANC and some of their partners, and everyone else that has forsaken them, we will not do so. We will continue to hold SAPS accountable, strengthen their hand. The only province – the only province that has a dedicated Law Enforcement component via a payment transfer agreement because we have stepped up. We have stepped up seeing the need. We are 20-years behind in terms of our resources: two SAPS stations. We ultimately need 90 000 members at a station level for the South African Police Service and we are fighting for them.

Through you, hon Speaker, you have not stopped me yet so I will continue so that the hon Leader of the Opposition can also see that I am present, that through you to ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has now expired, hon Minister. Please conclude.  
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: It has not expired. Thank you. I also appreciate the comments made by the hon August. Thank you so much for ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

...as well.

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired. Thank you very much.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

We will continue. Thank you for the focus, hon member Marran.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, please settle down. We are nearly getting the end of this debate, so can I please ask for your cooperation for the last three speakers on the Speakers List. Hon Kama, I now see you.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, please settle down. We are nearly nearing the end of this debate, so can I please ask for your cooperation for the last three speakers on the Speakers List. Hon Kama, I now see you.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. When hon member Fry has spoken about 'hope', I thought it is very relevant and important that I greet you this morning with the new-found renewed hope from the people of Barrydale, who have made their voices heard in the past week and rejected the DA. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Exactly! [Applause.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Hon Speaker, I want to thank the ANC members who

have participated in this debate. I also want to thank the GOOD and the EFF. [Interjections.] Because time is a luxury that we do not have, allow me not to waste time on hon member Christians.

Hon Speaker, Nelson Mandela is often abused in this House by the DA. [Interjections.] It is the very same Nelson Mandela who said, and I quote, that:

“Never and never again shall it be that this beautiful land will again experience the oppression of one by another.” [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr M KAMA (ANC): And it is a reality hon Speaker, in the Western Cape that we continue to observe and experience systematic oppression of the poor, while lip service is exactly as good as saying it is paid to this integrated approach, evidence-based approach, the poor and all of that, but in reality, this budget continues to remind us that the people who are poor in this province will continue to be oppressed systematically by the DA. [Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, there should be little doubt and we concur with what hon member Nkondlo was saying, that budgets are about choices, but they are also about human rights. Hon Speaker, there should be little doubt that high levels of inequality lead to high levels of crime. This budget does nothing to

address the high levels of inequality: inequality in service delivery; inequality in education; inequality in healthcare; inequality in income. The manner in which the hon MEC Wenger will secure the future of her child is by presenting a budget that will secure the future of Thandi.

Thandi lives in a shack with six others. No, it is not because her mother could not control herself, but Thandi, her two sisters and the mother herself, are actually living with their grandparents. Thandi's father, like so many other fathers on the Cape Flats, is missing. When Thandi walks out of her shack, she walks into the doorway of a shebeen which neighbours her grandparents' shack. Thandi's mother is unemployed. Their only income is the pension of her grandparents and the child grant, and Thandi's mother uses that little money to supplement the tuckshop she runs in order to make a bit more money.

At night, Thandi has to walk 500 metres in the dark to a communal toilet to relieve herself. She and her sisters are often confronted by the drunkards emerging from the shebeen next door, which keep them awake all night. The neighbour runs a shebeen as a form of income. The patrons drink themselves because they are scared; people who have never had a social worker speak to them when they were at school. Thandi, too, will be scared one day if she is not scared already.

Hon Speaker, the problem with this budget is that the hon MEC is not thinking about Thandi when she drafts and presents it. The hon MEC is

thinking about her son and that is the problem because the lived reality of the hon MEC's son, who is a white boy, and the lived reality of Thandi are vast.

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes, that is it. [Interjections.] That is it.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): If only the hon MEC had Thandi in mind ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Hon members, order. [Interjections.] Hon Kama, please take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon members, there is a member on the floor. Please allow the hon member – hon Minister, is that a point of order?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Yes, it is a point of order.

The SPEAKER: What is the point of order?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, when all hon members of this House stood here and undertook the Oath of Office, they have committed themselves to the principle of non-racialism. [Interjections.] The colour of the child ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: The colour of the child ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Then he must come ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ...of the hon Minister should not be a matter of subject of discussion in this House. I find it offensive. [Interjections.] I find it racist, and I will protect that child as it is my duty ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Why are you making that advance ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ...to protect such a [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: ...racist? Why?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: And I want him to withdraw the colour of the child.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: [Inaudible.]...

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: The child cannot be misused in this House. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members!

Ms R WINDVOGEL: You were quiet, now you ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: I object to the racism because we took our Oath of Office.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible]... *jy kan praat!* You can talk!

The SPEAKER: Honourable, hon members. [Interjections.] Hon members! [Interjections.] Hon Minister, that is not a point of order, but I am going to look at Hansard and the context of how that speech was delivered. Hon Marran, there is an hon member on the floor. [Interjections.] Hon Chief Whip. Hon Nkondlo and hon Marran, the hon Chief Whip is on the floor. Hon Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker, may I address you? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may. Hon Marran, the Chief Whip of the Opposition is on the floor.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, I find it difficult to understand why you would allow the hon MEC to make a frivolous point of order at this point in juncture. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip. Hon members, I have ruled and so I am not going to allow further discussion on that point of order. I am now going to allow the hon Kama to continue. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Speaker. We are a country, hon Speaker, that has a very painful past of people that were discriminated against according to their race and it then affected their status in the economy. And that is the reality ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hmm, black people.

Mr M KAMA: And we make this point again, hon Speaker that the problem with this budget is that the hon MEC is not thinking about Thandi when she drafted and presented it. The hon MEC is thinking about her son, and she said that and that is the problem ...[Interjections.] because the lived reality of the hon MEC's son, a white boy, and the lived reality of Thandi are vast. If only the hon MEC had Thandi in mind when she drafts her budget and her budget speeches. If only the hon MEC realised that her son's future is only secured when Thandi's or Leyla's future, as well as the future of those drunkards ...[Interjection.]



The SPEAKER: Please honourable, honourable ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA: ...emerging from the shebeen are secure.

The SPEAKER: Hon member, please take your seat. Hon Minister Wenger, is that a point of order?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Yes. I would kindly ask that the hon member refrains from these grotesque and reprehensible remarks. He is making aspersions on my character by saying that I do not understand the lived reality of children in this province, and I take great offence to that. And the fact that I used a metaphor for my child, and he does not understand what a metaphor is, I will not stand that he ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: ...use my son in this debate.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: It is unacceptable.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: That is a speech, this.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

An HON MEMBER: That is a speech, that.

The SPEAKER: Hon Kama, can I please ask that you please note and respect the decorum and integrity of all hon members of the House in the remainder of your speech. Hon Sayed, is that a new point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, this is unacceptable. Hon Kama did not cast any aspersions on anybody's character, hon Speaker, and I do not think an inference must be made in that regard. He is speaking and I have not heard him insulting anybody.

The SPEAKER: Alright. Hon Sayed, I have – I have addressed that, so I am just cautioning all hon members going forward: please note that we are all hon members in this House. Can you please respect one another accordingly and can I please ask that you address the topic at hand and that it does not become personal.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible]... become president.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. The topic at hand is the budget and I am speaking to it, and the reality is that he (*sic*) is prioritising a certain sector of society, and that is the thinking of the hon MEC.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): If only the hon MEC realised that her son's future is only secured when Thandi's or Leyla's future, as well as the future of those drunkards emerging from the shebeens, are secured. We do not wish to weaponise Thandi's lived experience. We do not wish to weaponise the lives of those men coming from the shebeens. Even though the hon MEC weaponised her son in her speech, we do firmly believe that our Province and City must do more ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Point of order!

Mr M KAMA: This budget fails to address ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Kama, please take your seat.

Mr M KAMA: ...of Thandi.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Wenger, is that a point of order?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: It is. The hon member just said that I weaponised my son. That is unparliamentary. It is casting aspersions on my character. [Interjections.] I certainly did not and that must be withdrawn.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister for that. Hon Deputy Chief Whip, please take your seat. Hon Kama, can I please refer you to Rule 59. Can I please ask that you do not continuously impute improper, whatever your view is, on the hon member of this House. And the reality is that we must please [Interjections.] Hon colleagues! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What do you want to ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Can I please ...[Interjections.] Can I please ask that you continue with your speech without ...[Interjection.] We are all hon members here. Can I ...[Interjections.] Hon Kama, I am addressing you. Please do not get into a dialogue. Please continue. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): This budget fails to address the needs of Thandi. What about Thandi's human rights? When the hon MEC bragged, and it is in the

speech, I am not going to run away. She should have not included it in the speech. When the hon MEC bragged about her son's future, well known and respected journalist Shakirah, published a story headlined and I quote:

“5-year-old Manenberg boy recovering well after gunshot in the head.

Devonte was shot and critically wounded in the head across from the school at Seine Road and Thames Avenue, where he had been playing on February 5 at around 10am.”

These are people's lived realities. The ANC wishes Devonte a speedy recovery and our thoughts and prayers are with his family, especially the parents.

But we have to ask, hon Speaker through you, and say where is the Walking Bus that was introduced by then hon Mayor Plato? [Interjections.] People from Elsie's River are making calls even now, even the CPF, that we want the Walking Bus back because there is violence at schools in the morning. This programme was working, but it was just stopped because the thinking of the Government of this province and the hon MEC is not about the lived realities of the poor [Interjections.], it is not about Thandi. [Applause.]

One wise man once said, and I quote:

“In a time of universal deceit, telling the truth is a revolutionary act.”

Earlier, we have heard the hon MEC misleading this House and the province about her Government's investment in crime. The people of Manenberg, Hanover Park, Kraaifontein, Delft and other gang-infested communities must know that this Government has reduced even what they brag about every day, which is LEAP. They have reduced the budget from R400-million to R350-million for this financial year. This is a fact. In a time when crime, especially violent crimes, are on the rise [Interjections.]. The DA Government has responded by reducing the budget. [Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, I heard, through you, hon member Sileku lamenting on extortion syndicates in the province. We may forgive him because he is new. We who have been here since the start of this Administration, know that the extortion syndicate in the province was started, supported, and sustained by the DA Government. [Interjections.] It is this DA that is giving lucrative contracts to gangsters and the hon MEC comes here in this House and says no, but they applied. They went through the process and all that, but the reality is that the society knows that these people are gangsters, and we are giving them deals, and what are you promoting or communicating to the society? That is a lived reality.

Hon member Fry was bragging, through you, hon Speaker, about the sterling work done by the Provincial Government through the Centre for Innovation. Where we acknowledge the importance of this, we must get the basics right. The people of Nyanga, Khayelitsha, Gugulethu and Mitchells Plain do not have access to Wi-Fi hotspots. In order to access it they have to stand in

front of schools with their gadgets and thereby, exposing themselves to the risk of getting attacked by local criminals. It should also be known that many libraries in the rural areas do not have access to internet and when will this be addressed, we have to ask?

Hon Speaker, hon member Fry [Interjections.] also mentioned the investment [Interjections.] towards combatting GBV ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...and femicide. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): This Government is not serious about addressing the scourge ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...and femicide. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M KAMA(ANC): A serious government cannot invest only R60- million in the budget [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Kama, please note your time has expired. Can you please conclude. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): As I conclude, hon Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Marran, hon Kama is trying to conclude.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): As I ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): As I conclude, hon Speaker, what is the challenge that we are dealing with here? We are dealing with a Premier that never left the position of being a Premier candidate since 2019. All he does is to campaign.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Kama ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA: When President Ramaphosa has to mention a crime ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: ...your time has now expired. Thank you, hon Kama, please take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon Kama, please take your seat! [Applause.] Hon members! Hon members, when I address you ...[Interjection.] I mean, this is complete disregard. You might not respect me, but can you please



respect the Chair? Can I please ask that you settle down and that you allow the hon members an opportunity, like each one of you that was on the Speakers List, was allowed an opportunity. We are all honourable members. Can we please act honourably as the citizens of this province watch us. I now see the Deputy Chief Whip of the Majority Party, hon Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I want to start by saying that sometimes, you must learn to love what is good for you. Sometimes, we do not always like eating our vegetables, but you need to eat them because they are healthy for you. And similarly, like hon members of the Democratic Alliance said today, sometimes you must leave that boyfriend, or you must leave that girlfriend that you are in a toxic relationship with.

To the Western Cape residents, the South African Reserve Bank estimated that rolling blackouts of about 6 to 12 hours per day ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...or Stage 3 [Interjections.] and Stage 6 ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon Deputy Chief Whip, please continue.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): The South African Reserve Bank has estimated that the rolling blackouts of about 6 to 12 hours per day, or Stage 3 and Stage 6 outages, will trim between R204-million and R899-million from the national economy daily in 2023. Price Waterhouse Coopers also estimated that the rolling blackouts eliminated five percentage points of South Africa's GDP in 2022, and it was revealed in the latest Quarterly Labour Force Survey that 333 000 jobs were created in the Western Cape in the past year, with 167 000 new jobs in the last Quarter alone.

Further, it was also revealed that the Western Cape still has the lowest expanded unemployment rate in the country at 26,8%, which is a 2,2-percentage point decrease and a margin of 12,6 percentage points better than Gauteng, the next best-placed province. We were told that we should learn from Gauteng, but hon Speaker, I think Gauteng should learn from us.

In page 6 of the Overview of the book of the budget today, the Gini coefficient is there in the book. The South African Gini coefficient is 0,68. The province after that is KZN at 0,67. The province after that is Gauteng at 0,63. The Gini coefficient in the Western Cape is better than the Gauteng one and the KZN one at 0,6.

Hon Speaker, during these dire times, the Western Cape Provincial Government must provide hope to its people and that is exactly what this budget aims to do. And hon Speaker, I just want to speak on human rights because there are actually sections in the National Constitution dealing with

human rights and the first one stems from Section 1(b) of the Constitution dealing with non-racialism and non-sexism, a Constitution which binds this House as well as the Western Cape Constitution.

Further, in Section 28 of the Constitution which is also binding on this Provincial Parliament, in Section 1(d) it says:

“Every child – every child has a right to be protected from maltreatment, neglect or abuse or degradation.”

Section 28(2) says: [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA):

“A child’s best interest is of paramount importance in every matter concerning the child.”

And this Constitution is binding on this Parliament as well, hon Speaker, whether they like it or not.

Hon Speaker, when we deal with human rights, we must ask ourselves about the implementation of Section 27 of the Constitution dealing with healthcare, food, water and social security because you cannot have proper healthcare if

you do not have electricity supply. You cannot have potable water if you do not have generators making sure that the water and waste treatment continues pumping. What are people going to drink? How are we going to have emergency medical treatment in terms of Section 27(3) of the Constitution if your patients are not able to stay alive on the surgery table because of loadshedding?

This is why in the Western Cape, we have the Premier's Energy Council which was established to identify and action solutions to the energy crisis, including directing and overseeing the implementation of the Western Cape Government's urgent action to relieve both the immediate impacts of loadshedding and its medium to long term energy strategy. These outcomes inform the respective digicons which ensure that we have consistent, consultative, most up-to-date information about energy effectively and regularly communicated to the citizens, communities and businesses within the Western Cape. And the hon Minister of Finance announced the R1,1-billion to be set aside over the MTEF to give effect to our energy response in the province of the short, the medium and the long term.

Hon Speaker, leaders are readers. If you have not read the Overview Book on page 110 dealing with all three financial years of the MTEF and every single programme within the energy respective plan, then that is your problem, not our problem. Do not make your problem our problem because we will be spending R126,6-million on loadshedding impact reduction. We will be spending R25,9-million on Green Economy Ecosystem Support; R246-million

on project preparation; R27-million on grid generation and financing planning; R58-million on capacity to implement; R114-million on operational matters. R501-billion on ensuring the establishment of the energy reserve because when we speak about human rights, you must speak about how you are going to implement those human rights for the people on the ground.

The loadshedding impact reduction will focus on Demand Side Management Programmes, alternative energy support for SMMEs and emergency loadshedding packs. The Green Economy Ecosystem will support the green economy ecosystem support ...[inaudible.]. The project preparation will focus on municipal pool buying, municipal IPP procurement, project preparation facilities, pilot renewable energy solutions in municipalities, specialist service providers exploring gas power and green hydrogen development.

At the Saldanha Bay IDZ, hon Speaker, specifically regarding the green hydrogen development, there is already a strong market interest in developing green hydrogen in the area and this project sees an MOU between the Northern Cape and the Western Cape Governments collaborating on developing the West South African development community green hydrogen corridor. Further, a major World Bank study regarding the green bunker fuels in Saldanha has been initiated by the National Climate Commission and the IDZ also hosted its re-industrialising Saldanha Bay as part of the South African Green Hydrogen Summit, which was opened by both our hon Premier and the President of the Republic of South Africa.

Hon Speaker, further, Sasol ArcelorMittal South Africa signed a joint development agreement to develop carbon capture technology to produce sustainable fuels and chemicals, as well as revitalising the ArcelorMittal and operative steel plant in Saldanha Bay to produce and export green steel because you must implement these sections in the Constitution in terms of human rights.

Hon Speaker, up to five Western Cape towns are set to come off grid due to the Province's plan to end loadshedding and diversify its energy supply and this will be done through mobile, containerised PV battery units which can tap between 1 megawatt and 400 megawatts into the power system and can be connected to municipal power generation networks. The City of Cape Town is busy procuring 200 megawatts of embedded renewable energy via IPPs. The City of Cape Town is also set to announce a tender of 500 megawatts of dispatchable power that will be available immediately for energy resilience.

Hon Speaker, in terms of solar PV, for example, there is already a collaborative project between Stellenbosch University, the Western Cape Education Department and energy efficient start-up GreenX at the Cloetesville Primary School where a solar PV system was installed, and it is saving them up to R20 000 per year. It is a 7,5-kilowatt system. It reduces carbon emissions by almost 13 tons annually and this is why in Education, we are identifying up to 100 schools in the province, especially with lower quintile and poorer schools, so that we can become more energy resilient.

You have to have grid generation and financing planning because if you cannot upgrade the grid, where is the energy going to go to? You need a municipal electricity master plan; you need an integrated development plan for the province. You need the capacity for a core energy team because you cannot do it if you do not have the technical skills. In terms of these projects, it will amount in total to R509-million, with an additional R500-million set aside for energy reserves.

And further, hon Speaker, the City of Cape Town is also working on policy shifts to allow households to be net generators of energy, not just businesses, households as well and to sell this energy back to the City. They are working furiously in order to reduce even the special meter so that households are able to afford putting energy back into the grid.

In terms of the Department of Economic Development and Tourism also, the uptake of rooftop solar PV in the province has already provided more than 20 municipalities with support and advice around SSEG wheeling or utility scale energy matters. And in terms of this particular work, previously rooftop PV system installations increased substantially by 147 megawatts of registered rooftops in the Western Cape in the first two quarters of 2022/2023. This is what it means when you implement the Sections of the Constitution. This represents R2,4-billion worth of investment and around 368 jobs. Further, also supporting businesses on advising them on how to reduce their water and energy in their respective businesses.

Due to the impact of the energy crisis ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Baartman, that is the end of your time. Please conclude.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): This Budget, hon Speaker, represents the next step in bringing services to our people, bridging the gap between the haves and have not and building a brighter future ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, please take your seat.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...in our province. Support the budget. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Baartman. I now see hon Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you very much, hon Speaker and thanks to the hon members for the debate and the contributions. Starting with a response to hon Dugmore. He unfortunately did not say much about the 2023/2024 Budget, so there is not too much for me to respond to there. He did, however, in his final words



mention hunger.

I would like to assure the hon member that we are acutely aware of the nutritional needs in particularly poor communities, which is why we are allocating over R190-million for school nutrition to over 405 000 learners. We are doing this to ensure that learners across the province can have a nutritious and calorific meal and despite the very steep rise in food inflation, those meals will be able to maintain their nutritional value. In addition, we are allocating R193,5-million to Social Development to provide food relief for those that need it the most in poor communities.

In response to hon Cassiem, she mentioned just in passing that the budget does not need to meet the needs of housing, jobs and schools. I find this a little bit of a confusing comment because the budget provides for exactly those needs. R7,7-billion is allocated for housing opportunities, R7,4-billion allocated for school infrastructure and classrooms, as well as infrastructure for children with special educational needs.

For the rest, I thought I was perhaps sitting through the Vote to debate. But hon Speaker, that hon member also referred to her party's failed shutdown and I thought it was quite ironic that she spoke about people's rights when her party sought to deny the rights of others to practice and trade their profession freely. And of course, as hon Christians mentioned, the cost to the economy and the cost to struggling small businesses. And what was the EFF going to do with those tyres anyway? Perhaps the hon member would like to

come clean with that.

Hon August spoke about tangible solutions, and this is exactly the point, tangible solutions and that is why we have developed a Budget of Action. The national police are not keeping us safe and that is why we have taken action because safety is just too important. We are acting. What is the National Government doing? Hon Christians, I would like to thank you for supporting the budget and I hope that the House takes note of those damning figures that you have quoted on Eskom losses.

In response to hon Nkondlo, the rights of the poor are exactly what we have in mind with this Budget and worked very hard to fund and this is what we choose to do. We choose to fund education, health, social services, safety and energy. These are the things that this budget funds, and then some. In particular on health, perhaps the hon member can talk to her national colleagues who have cut our Provincial Budget by R1,9-billion and at the same time, underfunding healthcare grants which are not keeping pace with inflation and we are having to subsidise the difference.

As hon Minister Mbombo noted, these cuts have severe pressures on budgets across the province and I thank her for her giving the House more insight into what these budget cuts actually mean. On infrastructure, hon Nkondlo will be pleased to know that we have a spatial lens on infrastructure, and I have already placed information in detail before this House recently, on market infrastructure in townships. I would also like to note that we are allocating

R9-billion to Mobility over the MTEF, and it shows the importance that this Government places on transport and commuters.

Then finally, in response to hon Kama I would just like to quote Socrates who said:

“When the debate is lost, slander becomes the tool of the loser.”

Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Applause.] Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, that concludes the debate ...[Interjections.] That concludes the debate on the Principle of the Bill. Are there any objections to the approval of the Principle of the Bill?

Hon MEMBERS: No!

The SPEAKER: No objections?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Is there an objection?

An HON MEMBER: Yes, we object ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Okay. Can I now put the question: those in favour of the question being adopted, please say 'yes'.

Hon MEMBERS: Yes!

The SPEAKER: Those not in favour of the question being approved, please say 'no'.

Hon MEMBERS: No!

The SPEAKER: I think the 'ayes' have it. Question approved. The Secretary will read the Bill. [Interjections.]

The SECRETARY: Western Cape Appropriation Bill.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon members. The House will deal with the separate Votes on the 28<sup>th</sup> and 29<sup>th</sup> of March 2023. The Secretary will read the Second Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Principles of the Western Cape Additional Adjustment Appropriation Bill (2022/2023 Financial Year) [B 1–2023].

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I have been informed by the Chief Whip that the Programming Authority resolved that there would be no list of

speakers and that parties who wish to do so, will now be afforded an opportunity to make a Declaration of the Vote for a maximum of three minutes. I will now afford the political parties to make a declaration if they so wish. I recognise the ANC. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible]...

The SPEAKER: Okay, I am going to agree to that. I now see the EFF.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Thank you, hon Speaker. The Economic Freedom Fighters are not convinced with the Western Cape's Additional Adjustment Appropriation Bill. An additional adjustment into the Education budget is not enough to enable a functioning learning environment for learners in the Western Cape, specifically in the schools. There are not enough classrooms to accommodate learners in the province, which often results in an increase in volume of unplaced learners. More money must be channelled into the province's education system in order to have more classrooms and to eradicate makeshift temporary classrooms.

It is also shocking that the majority of the makeshift temporary classrooms are mostly found in township schools, whilst the same cannot be said to the case when it comes to most former Model C schools based in the leafy suburbs. The EFF calls for more and better budget allocations to the Education Department, in order to make sure that there are more classrooms built with bricks and to enable a functioning learning environment.

In terms of the Local Government, when it comes to Local Government, the Provincial Department of Local Government fails to exercise proper oversight over municipalities under its watch. So, we cannot allow more money to be channelled into dysfunctional municipalities which cannot even account for the misappropriation of funds.

On 25 January 2022, the President of this country made public the final SIU report which investigated the irregular expenditure of R53-million on the Strandfontein site which housed homeless people during COVID-19 in 2020. The report found that supply chain management processes followed by the City in sourcing various resources and services required were irregular and should be set aside. To this day, there is no urgency or concern from the current City Mayor in an effort to reclaim the funds concerned. There is also no appetite from the hon MEC from Local Government exercising oversight ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Hon Speaker, can you please protect me.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. There is an hon member on the floor.  
Hon Kama!

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): There is also no appetite from the hon MEC of Local

Government exercising oversight over this municipality to get to the bottom of this matter. It is clear that under this DA-led Government, thieves will act with impunity and there will be no action taken against them. The EFF does not support these additional adjustments. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Cassiem. Please, honourable – is the ANC ready now? I see the ANC. Hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): *Enkosi somlomo*. The African National Congress in the province does not support the Additional Adjustment Appropriation Bill. The ANC welcomes the [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): ...the R115,462-million Education Infrastructure Grant allocated towards providing maintenance of existing infrastructure and the building of new infrastructure for schools in the Western Cape Province.

Although these funds are a reallocation from two provinces where we feel the grant was very imperative, the Eastern Cape and Mpumalanga, this grant will provide great assistance in providing additional classrooms and attend to overcrowding of current available classrooms in the province. We hope that this grant will be a step in the right direction, a direction that leads to more children in schools instead of meandering the streets, rather than unlocking their full potential due to placement failures. We look forward to seeing the

path that the Western Cape Government will take with this grant, whether they will build more brick-and-mortar classrooms or they will build shack classrooms.

Hon Speaker, the ANC also acknowledged the R88,815-million allocated towards Local Government for the purchase and installation of backup energy supplies for municipalities in the province. We anticipate seeing the impact of this allocation towards the effects of loadshedding. Loadshedding has had a severe impact towards the economy and wellbeing of the country, and the province in particular. Hopefully, the money set aside to mitigate this issue in the province will go towards exactly that.

This Province has been appropriating money for energy supply through the MER project and has not delivered, and yet are quick to blame the ANC when it comes to energy supply. Talk about people who live in a glass house, but yet throw stones. We hope that among the identified municipalities, black communities will benefit from the stabilisation of water supply, wastewater treatment and sewerage infrastructure. These communities were already facing inadequate water supply and sewerage infrastructure without loadshedding playing any role.

We want to applaud the National Government, but also acknowledge that it is important that service delivery for black, coloured and Indian communities must be prioritised in this province. Hon Speaker, the ANC at this point would like to thank you. [Applause.]



The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Nkondlo. I see GOOD, hon August. [Interjections.] No declaration. Hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: The ACDP, just for the record.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, when you get additional money and you say I do not want it, I have got a problem with that. The money for Education is for infrastructure and if you do not support this Bill it means that you do not want the money. Now, there are other provinces that are not functioning and [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): ...because they do not spend their money, we are getting additional money. We need more money, yes, but in other provinces where there are ANC governments, they do not spend their money. So, we welcome the Appropriation Budget and the ACDP supports the budget. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians. I now see the Democratic Alliance. [Interjections.] Order, hon members.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Hon Nkondlo. [Interjections.] Hon Baartman, you may continue.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, the Western Cape Additional Adjustment Appropriation Bill appropriates R204-million from the current financial year for Education and for the Local Government departments. And I do think there is a little bit of confusion as to the two separate Bills because this particular Bill deals with extra money we are getting, whereas the Main Budget in terms of Education infrastructure has R3-billion allocated for Education infrastructure. [Interjections.]

In this particular one, R115-million has been allocated for infrastructure development and the Western Cape Government received this funding due to the under-expenditure on infrastructure development funds in other provinces, which was the Eastern Cape and Mpumalanga. They did not spend their money. [Interjections.] In order to ensure that national money ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...for Education is spent ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]... to spend.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. There is an hon member on the floor! [Interjections.] Hon Nkondlo and hon Premier, there is an hon member on the floor. Can I please ask that you allow the hon member to continue.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, in order to spend the National Education money, these funds were directed to provinces such as the Western Cape and such as Gauteng, in order to actually spend the money of the people of South Africa on Education infrastructure. We have always believed that capable governments should be rewarded with incentives for their good governance, instead of being punished for governing well. It is uncertain still why the Western Cape has the fifth biggest and the fifth lowest Equitable Share still in this country.

Hon Speaker, in this particular instance we are being rewarded for building schools and spending our money well for building schools, and it is noteworthy that the ANC is voting against a National Government department giving the Western Cape money to build schools. [Interjections.]

The second allocation appropriated from this particular budget is from our own Provincial Revenue Fund for the Local Government Department of R89-million, which is appropriated for the purchase and installation of backup energy supplies within municipalities and it aims to reduce the impact on loadshedding. The implementation: I would like to implore the Minister of Finance and Local Government on all municipalities in the Western Cape

...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Maynier. Please take your seat. Hon Minister Maynier and hon Nkondlo, you are drowning out the speaker. There is an hon speaker on the floor. [Interjection.] Can I please ask that you take your conversation outside and allow the hon member on the floor to continue.

The PREMIER: That is fine. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: No, can you ...[Interjections.] [Laughter.] Hon members, please! Hon Baartman ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, regarding ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: You can continue.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you. Hon Speaker, regarding the implementation of this money, I would like to ask the hon Minister of Finance and of Local Government in the Province, not every municipality in the Western Cape is able to brag with clean audits. So, when we transfer these monies to the municipalities for the generators in order to keep the water running, in order to keep the waste water running, please ask them to take a photo of their generators and send it to you with the description and the specifications alongside it, with their respective payment invoices. † Hulle moet vir julle die *receipts* kan wys. [They must be able to show you the

receipts. ]

Let us ensure that the municipalities use every cent of the people's money in the best manner on the people of our province. Electricity provision is the responsibility of National Government and Eskom, and their failure to do their job as men, the Western Cape has no option but to take matters into our own hands and make provision for their failure through our own provincial funds. ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): The DA supports this Bill. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Baartman. [Applause.] Hon members ...[Interjections.] Hon members, that concludes the declarations on the Consideration of the Principle of the Bill. Are there any objections to the approval of the Principle of the Bill?

Hon MEMBERS: No!

The SPEAKER: No objections, agreed to. The Secretary will read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: Western Cape Additional Adjustment Appropriation Bill (2022/2023 Financial Year).

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. The Secretary will now read the Third Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Votes and Schedule – Western Cape Additional Adjustment Appropriation Bill (2022/2023 Financial Year) [B 1–2023.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. As we consider the Votes, parties are entitled to make declarations for no longer than three minutes per Vote. I now put Vote 5 Education. The ANC. The EFF. GOOD. ACDP. The DA. Okay. Are there any objections to Vote 5?

Hon MEMBERS: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to Vote 5?

An HON MEMBER: None.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: No.

The SPEAKER: Okay, there are objections. I now put the question: those in favour of the question or the Vote being adopted, please say ‘yes’.

Hon MEMBERS: Yes!

The SPEAKER: Those not in favour of the question being adopted or approved, please say 'no'.

An HON MEMBER: No, no!

An HON MEMBER: No, no.

The SPEAKER: I think the 'ayes' have it. The objections will be recorded. That concludes the decision on the Vote. Hon members, I now put Vote 14 Local Government. The ANC. The EFF. GOOD. The ACDP. The DA. Thank you very much. Are there any objections to Vote 14?

An HON MEMBER: No!

An HON MEMBER: There are objections.

An HON MEMBER: There is.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. I now put the question ...[Interjections.] I put the Question to the House. Those in favour of the question or the Vote being adopted, please say 'yes'.

Hon MEMBERS: Yes!

The SPEAKER: Those not in favour of the question being approved, please say 'no'.

Hon MEMBERS: No!

The SPEAKER: For the record, I think the 'ayes' have it and the objections will be recorded. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon members. That concludes the decision on the Vote. I now put the Schedule of the Bill. Are there any objections to the Schedule of the Bill?

Hon MEMBERS: No!

An HON MEMBER: No, no objections.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection to the Schedule of the Bill. I now put the question: those in favour of the Schedule of the Bill being adopted, please say 'yes'.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Hon MEMBERS: Yes!

The SPEAKER: Those not in favour of the Schedule of the Bill being adopted, please say 'no'.



An HON MEMBER: No!

The SPEAKER: I think the 'ayes' have it. The objections will be recorded. [Interjections.] I now put – thank you, hon members. I now put Clauses 1 to 3 of the Bill. Are there any objections to the Clauses 1 to 3 of the Bill being adopted?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): No.

An HON MEMBER: No!

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection to Clauses 1 to 3 of the Bill. I now put the question to the House. Those in favour of Clauses 1 to 3 of the Bill being adopted, please say 'yes'.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Hon MEMBERS: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Those not in favour of Clauses 1 to 3 of the Bill, please say 'no'.

An HON MEMBER: No!

The SPEAKER: I think the 'ayes' have it and the ...[Interjections.] and the objections will be recorded. I now put the Short Title. Are there any objections to the Short Title being approved?

Hon MEMBERS: No!

An HON MEMBER: I object to them ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: There is an objection to the Short Title of the Bill being approved. [Interjections.] I now put – I now put. Hon members, please work with me. I now need to put the question. Those in favour of the Short Title of the Bill being approved by this House, please say 'yes'.

Hon MEMBERS: Yes!

The SPEAKER: Those not in favour of the Short Title of the Bill being approved, please say 'no'.

Hon MEMBERS: No!

The SPEAKER: I think the 'ayes' have it and the objections will be recorded as such. ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I object to these  
[Interjections.] [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members ...[Interjections.] Hon members, the Secretary will now read the Fourth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Finalisation of the Western Cape Additional Adjustment Appropriation Bill (2022/2023 Financial Year) [B 1–2023].

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Secretary. I now recognise the hon Minister of Finance, hon Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Speaker. I believe that the Western Cape Additional Adjustment Appropriation Bill B 1-2023 including the Clauses and Short Title be finalised.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I see there is no list of speakers and therefore, I am going to put the question. Are there any objections to the Bill being finalised?

Hon MEMBERS: No!

Hon MEMBERS: Yes.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. I will now put the question to the House. Those in favour of the Bill being finalised, please say 'yes'.

Hon MEMBERS: Yes!

The SPEAKER: Those not in favour of the Bill being finalised, please say 'no'.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No.

Ms N D NKONDLO: No!

The SPEAKER: I think the 'ayes' have it and the objections will be recorded as such. Hon members, the hon Secretary will read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: Appropriation Bill (2022/2023 Financial Year).

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Secretary. The Bill will be sent to the hon Premier for ascent. Hon members, that concludes the business for the day. The House is adjourned. The Secretary will now end the meeting and all members will be exited from the Sitting. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 12:20.