

---

THURSDAY, 26 AUGUST 2021

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The SPEAKER: You may all be seated. Hon members, let me appreciate the presence in the Chamber of the hon, the Premier of the Western Cape, our beautiful province, and of course the hon Ministers that are present here, Minister Simmers, Minister Marais, the hon, the Leader of the Opposition that is here with us in the Chamber. We appreciate your presence here because myself and the Deputy Speaker, we are here permanently in the Chamber, so it feels good to have you around. Let me appreciate and acknowledge the presence of the hon members who are connected virtually, and of course welcome you all here. Our guests, the members of the fourth estate, who are of course part of us, you are now members of the family.

I am just going to set some ground rules, the rules in terms of the sitting, the do's and don'ts in terms of our hybrid session, and just to request the members of the media not to activate the microphone, also not to activate the camera. You are in the Chamber, so, you are in the gallery rather, and that is where we expect you to be in terms of the Sitting. I also wish to request the hon members that we do not activate cameras just to keep stability of the platform except when you do indeed speak or recognise to do so and also keep camera, your microphone muted. If you so wish to speak you indicate by a show of hand or you indicate in the chatroom but do not speak unrecognised because it causes chaos in the system. I just want to at this stage also say to the people of the Western Cape and all of those who are watching this session, welcome, and thank you for your interest.

Hon members, our order in terms of the business today is as it appears in the Order Paper. I wish to recognise the Chief Whip.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, Mr Speaker, good afternoon.

I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 20, precedence be given to the Subject for Discussion.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip. Hon members, are there any

objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections? I think it is clear that the hon members are happy with you, Madam Chief Whip. Motion agreed to.

In terms of the Subject for Discussion it is led by the hon Bosman as printed in the Order Paper. I just wish to request the hon members, if I say that your time is up, that means you have concluded your speaking time. I am not going to warn you, forewarn you before you finish, because it disrupts the speaking for the hon members. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [inaudible] ... of your answer. We would like to share this... [microphone not muted]

The SPEAKER: †Noko kusekusasa ngalongxelo. [It is too soon for that discussion.] May I request that we mute everyone, IT, because members sometimes are connecting, forgetting that they are in the House. I now recognise the hon Bosman.

## **SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION**

The pressures of COVID-19 on the mental wellbeing and wellness of South Africans who are struggling to make ends meet and to care for their families; the importance of supporting the mental wellbeing and wellness of all residents in our province; and strengthening institutions that provide the care needed and that work towards a more prosperous future

Mr G BOSMAN: Good afternoon, hon Speaker, and colleagues in the House and online.

Speaker, at a time when our country faces its biggest challenge since apartheid, we see more and more people struggling to manage under the difficulties caused by poor management of our national economy. An alarming expanded unemployment rate and a hostile Government in Pretoria is to blame for this.

This has culminated in South Africa holding the highest unemployment rate with the ANC at the helm. The Opposition in green and yellow must not tell us today how much they care. Their very own staff at Luthuli House and across the country are striking right now for fair pay and working conditions.

†Die ANC gee nie om nie. Hulle eie huis is aan die brand maar hulle kan niks doen nie. [The ANC does not care. Their own house is burning but they cannot do anything.]

From the Union Buildings we see a government that does not view its role as helping citizens but it places them under the most illogical and hardest lockdowns we have seen globally.

During the COVID-19 pandemic we have seen a rapidly increasing number of our residents reaching out to the Western Cape Government to find assistance to support their wellbeing needs.

The mental and social wellbeing of our communities have suffered tremendously and the ability for all of our residents to thrive and succeed has been severely impacted by their inability to find work and provide for their families.

Speaker, people have the right to engage in meaningful work that enables them to provide for their families. This right was taken away when the ANC discriminated against broad sectors of society, choosing winners and losers to survive during their mismanagement of our economy. Meanwhile the Western Cape is the only province with a dedicated *ad hoc* Committee on COVID-19 and the only provincial Legislature to have reached out to residents to ask them about their experiences during this crushing pandemic. We have listened, we have felt, we have emphasised, but the ANC in Pretoria continues to destroy.

The residents have told us how difficult they have had it. They have shared with us the deteriorating mental health status and some respondents have indicated that they were so close to taking their own lives. The closure of the hospitality industry, the entertainment industry as well as the liquor industry has meant that many of our residents did not have the option to work. They were instead forced to rely on community feeding schemes, generous neighbours and the support that this DA administration provided them. Now more than ever, Speaker, residents need dignified opportunities that put them in charge of their own lives and their own wellbeing. The right to dignity is constantly being denied by our incompetent ANC National

Government. This constitutional right is being trampled on by a government hell-bent on making our people addicted to state funding through a meagre R350 grant, yet the ANC actually has told people that they can start a business with this grant – what an insult.

Speaker, dignity entails that people be allowed the opportunity to realise humanity to the fullest extent, that they have the freedom and the opportunity to support themselves in whatever meaningful work they choose to do. This is surely not the situation that the ANC Government has created. Over the last eight months I have been helping Ms Roman, a resident struggling to apply for her SASSA grant. She has spent many cold nights sleeping outside of the SASSA offices in Bellville in order to get assistance from this social assistance agency, but they have failed her. She is one of the many residents who have assisted whether it is engaging with the Unemployment Insurance Fund or trying to get SASSA to do its job.

Speaker, we need to do more to create opportunities to ensure that the citizens are content and that we are playing our part, but we really need our National Government to join us. I thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bosman. You are well within your time and I appreciate that. Hon members, I now recognise hon Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Sorry, Speaker, I am responding to the topic before us today. Allow me to quote Associate Professor Maylene Shung-King of UCT's School of Public Health, who said:

“Shocks such as climate change and COVID-19 also tend to intensify existing inequalities, for a privileged few the pandemic simply meant a change in lifestyle, but for the majority of South Africans, the pandemic has been catastrophic with families facing unemployment, hunger, violence and an uncertain future.”

The debate comes at a time when the country's unemployment rate rose to its highest rate ever at 34,4% in the second quarter from the 32,6% in the previous quarter. The expanded unemployment rose to 44,4%. The official unemployment rate increased by 2,1% to 25,8% in Quarter 2/2021 compared to Quarter 1/2021. This will result in a significant increase in anxiety and depression.

The global outbreak of COVID-19 leads to unbearable psychological impact on the mental health of the individuals, including through hunger and joblessness, the loss of identity likewise and wants [Inaudible.] because there is ample evidence to demonstrate the negative impact of COVID-19 on mental health, wellbeing and wellness of people, Speaker. Yet this Government did not deem it necessary to have targeted mental

health support programmes for the general public, particularly the survivors of the virus, those that have lost loved ones and those that have lost jobs. COVID-19 has left a lot of permanent emotional scars on the lives of patients who witnessed death in our hospitals. As a survivor of this virus who spent time in hospital, I have firsthand experience of this traumatic experience. I wish to commend the KwaZulu-Natal Provincial Government for its initiative to offer an entire Mental Health Toolkit to respond to psychological distress in the population.

We have reached that stage where in our neighbourhoods we know of families that lost loved ones to this virus, including child-headed households as a result of COVID-19. I am not sure if the Provincial Government has proof of conducting research on the number of child-headed households that have emerged as a result of COVID-19. If not, then the Premier should consider embarking on this research and set aside funds to support the child-headed households.

The Children's Institute at UCT, in collaboration with the Children's Hospital Trust and the Michael and Susan Dell Foundation, are calling for Government to put children at the heart of South Africa's COVID-19 Response and Recovery Plans.

According to their advocacy briefs, while children accounted for only 4% of cases in the province and 0,5% of the deaths, thousands more children have been affected by the illness and death of family members. Whilst the



Western Cape Recovery Plan recognises that the issue of food security is prominent in the wellbeing priority, this is not followed up with viable and sustainable interventions. The proposed food relief through resourcing of community kitchens, partnership with NGOs, spaza shops, food voucher schemes, and food parcel deliveries for families in remote areas is not sustainable and will not reach out to all those who are in need.

The ANC on record is calling on the Provincial Government to intensify the rollout of the community school and household food gardens, so that every community and every household could have a food garden.

The impact of violent crimes and the gender-based violence (GBV) pandemic continue to cause shock and psychological distress to the population. The Provincial Government has failed dismally in addressing these challenges. In working towards a prosperous future as member Bosman suggested in the subject for the debate, the Provincial Government should look at addressing the challenge... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: †Siyabulela. [We thank you.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: †Enkosi. [Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bakubaku-Vos. Hon members, I now recognise hon member Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, †Somlomo [Speaker.] The topic for the present debate coincides with the Unemployment Quarterly 4 statistics, which were released recently by Statistics South Africa (Stats SA). It is without a doubt that the issue of unemployment has been a recurring feature within South Africa for years, and now have reached high levels as a result of the COVID-19 Pandemic. The topic at issue in essence goes to the effect of asking a question on how residents in the province can be assisted to deal with the mental health issues caused by a disturbance in their ability to sustain themselves financially.

As the EFF it is our stance that our people do not need handouts from Government and short-term unemployment opportunities so that they can make their ends meet. Our people do not have to make ends meet in actual fact. What they need is to be economically empowered through legislation and correct policies so they can self-sustain without relying on any white employment. It has always been our position as the EFF that the equal redistribution of land and other public resources remain key in addressing the structural unemployment crisis which our country in this province faces. The only way real job opportunities can be created is when all share the wealth of this country meaningfully without greed and hate and racism.

It cannot be that all the wealth remains in the hands of the few white people and the majority of the people are being asked to beg for jobs from a few. That will never work and will always be unsustainable, so the

sooner the poor and the working class are empowered meaningfully by getting a stake in the resources and minerals of this country, talk of unemployment and making ends meet will be a thing of the past.

Thank you very much, †Somlomo [Speaker.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Xego. I see that you also finished within your time and thank you for that. Hon Minister Fernandez is now the next speaker. I recognise you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Good afternoon, hon Speaker, am I audible?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you are loud and clear, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Premier, hon members, we are convened today to debate the pressures of COVID-19 on the mental wellbeing and wellness of South Africans. A recent research survey published in February 2021 states that the COVID-19 pandemic and the resulting economic recession have negatively affected many people's mental health and created new barriers for people already suffering from mental illness and substance-use disorders.

The KFF Health Tracking Poll from July 2020 also found that many adults are reporting specific negative impacts on the mental health and wellbeing

such as difficulty sleeping or eating, increases in alcohol consumption or substance use and worsening chronic conditions due to worry and stress over the coronavirus. The mental and psychological distress experienced during the COVID pandemic has increased with many people dealing with the loss of a family member, colleague or close friend or community member. We meet at a time when poverty and unemployment have reached unprecedented levels which have been exacerbated by a protracted hard lockdown. Many citizens are experiencing grief, loss and trauma. Many citizens have lost not only jobs, informal sources of income, but their homes and assets in an effort to sustain lives and livelihoods.

According to a study by the Human Sciences Research Council conducted in 2020, 33% of South Africans were depressed while 45% were fearful and 29% were experiencing loneliness. Different lockdown levels often limited access to essential services including mental healthcare.

Hon Speaker, COVID-19 has indeed disrupted all spheres of society. However, the poor, the vulnerable and the marginalised living on the brink are the most effected by the socio-economic realities such as poverty, increasing unemployment, inequality, gender-based violence and homelessness amongst others. The emotional strain, anxiety and distress this pandemic has placed on educators and learners must not be under-estimated.

A recent UNICEF study in July 2021 states that school children lost about

54% of learning time and 400 000 to 500 000 learners have dropped out of school since March 2020. This is a dire situation that will not be resolved in the short term.

Hon Speaker, every hon member in this House today knows someone or of someone who is struggling emotionally during this pandemic. Some of us on this very platform have been affected adversely ourselves. Mental health and wellbeing affect us all. The COVID-19 pandemic has presented a unique set of psychological challenges for all citizens, ranging from anxiety, stress, grief, despair and a sense of hopelessness and as a government we have realised the need to address the issue of mental health and wellbeing.

Hon Speaker, more than 70 000 Western Cape residents accessed Psychosocial Support Services from DSD between April 2020 and January 2021. The support provided includes amongst others, debriefing, counselling, trauma informed care and psychotherapy. In order to mitigate the challenges of accessing services we had to redesign our way of work to ensure that psychosocial support is available telephonically to assist those who desperately need it. Hon Speaker, our ability to reach every corner of this province would not be possible without the support of many other stakeholders.

In this regard I wish to extend my gratitude for the support provided by our religious leaders, frontline workers, essential services, SAPS,

academia and civil society. More so I wish to thank every citizen in this province that stepped into the gap to help and support their fellow citizens.

Hon Speaker, the emotional and psychological wellbeing of employees is paramount. In many instances they too have to deal with losing loved ones, close associates and colleagues. The social sector and many social service professionals continue to deliver essential services to children, families and the communities that they serve and with whom they have built a close caring relationship. However, they too have a [Inaudible – audio distorted.] the sum of care is paramount. You cannot pour from an empty cup.

Hon Speaker, it would be remiss of me not to point out the National Government's role in fuelling the emotional turbulence of the already vulnerable South Africans over the past 518 days. SASSA and the National Department of Social Development's clients are at their wits end because of the delays, miscommunication and unresponsiveness in dealing with a fast-unfolding humanitarian crisis. The levels of anxiety and distress experienced by those applying for Social Relief of Distress Grants, have reached unprecedented levels. They wait in desperation to receive the financial relief promised to them. More than 5 million people applied and the system crashed, yet, we have not received any communication.

These are individuals, hon Speaker, who are already struggling, who have no idea where the next meal will be coming from and who will be

providing it. For the ECD workers who did not earn an income as a result of the Disaster Management Act Regulations forcing them to close ECDs for a protracted period, for them, hon Speaker, talk is cheap, as they await the Stimulus Relief Package which was announced in October last year. We are doing our best to assist with the payments of the Stimulus Relief Fund. However, many ECDs have not received any form of assistance because of the inefficient verification process designed by an inept and dysfunctional National Government.

Hon Speaker, the Western Cape Government is working transversally and collaborating with all spheres of Government and stakeholders to address the psychosocial impact of the pandemic on citizens of the province. We are taking action to alleviate the hardship of our residents, particularly the vulnerable during this difficult time. We have an established Wellbeing Work Group. We have a Provincial Faith-based Forum. We have the Food Forum, a Gender-based Violence Forum and a recently established Homelessness Street People's Forum which are making good progress.

Collaboration across spheres of Government is critical to ensuring an integrated holistic approach to the many challenges I alluded to. To this end, hon Speaker, I have scheduled fortnightly meetings with SASSA to address the ongoing challenges many citizens face on a daily basis, not only in this province, but across South Africa.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. You have exhausted your time.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Speaker, if I may just my last sentence, I am pleased to announce that the Minister Marais is leading a Mental Health Forum which will focus on the mental health and wellness of our citizens and staff. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I thought I must give you that, but my request to the hon members, for some you do not finish your time, but it is fine when you do not conclude your time, but if the hon members can time themselves so that I do not have to warn you before you finish off. I know it can be quite uncomfortable, but we are here to work together, so I just wish to request that we do so.

Now the next speaker, hon members, is hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, it is quite disappointing to hear the Minister for Social Development speak as if the subject matter of this debate is someone else's business when it is the Social Development Department that is mandated to ensure the provision of a comprehensive Social Development Service that enables and empowers the poor, the vulnerable and those with special needs. These services are important to protect and repair our social fabric and especially ensure that those residents who are vulnerable, excluded and most in need of social assistance are in fact assisted.

The failure of the Department of Social Development, the Western Cape



Department, to deliver facilities and services greatly contributes towards the increasing number of people in need of social support. Transitional housing for the homeless is one of the most important needs in this city and province right now. It is the start of the social support needed to assist the growing number of homeless people who live in appalling and dangerous conditions on our streets. In Cape Town alone there are estimated to be 14 000 people living on the streets. The factors contributing to this growing number are very well known. The provision of adequate facilities and appropriate programmes is essential to addressing their pathway off the street and it is this Minister's Department's responsibility. This Government has outsourced their responsibility. Last year the Minister allocated R12 million for homeless shelters – the majority of it going to The Haven.

Speaker, this Parliament can debate the impact of COVID-19 but this Government has the mandate, the duty and the funding to actually do something about it. The extent of starvation and hunger in our province is a disgrace. A month ago in KTC and Nyanga I met families in crises.

I met a young man who is so hungry that he is slaughtering cats and dogs to eat. These are the conditions that this Government must address. Instead of standing by while food monies are stolen by your colleagues in the City of Cape Town, do the right thing – intervene! Roll out a massive hunger alleviation programme and feed the hungry at the very least.

Speaker, they found R1,3 billion for a fake policing project. I urge this Government to focus on the basic mandate. Feed the hungry and house the homeless.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Herron. I appreciate your contribution. Now, hon members, we move to the next speaker, the hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Speaker, and thank you for the opportunity. Speaker, I believe this is a time where we as politicians and different political parties should unite and build and come together and say how can we assist and grow this province. This cannot be a blame game. We cannot blame one another. We need to take responsibility because we are sitting with depressing unemployment numbers, decreasing quality for life. The inability to serve, people cannot even service their debt and people are anxious and that even adds to people staying away from work, people not healthy, people really breaking down in this pandemic. When people hear that politicians come and play the blame game they get despondent. What we need to do is give practical solutions, how to get out of this pandemic and how to help our people so as a province we must unite. We must grow. We must build this beautiful province that we have. Many communities are already playing supportive roles when it comes to grief, when it comes to poverty, and we saw communities stepping out, stepping up, and helping their neighbours, helping their brothers and sisters, so that is the kind of message we must send.

Government cannot do it all, we need to engage our communities, engage one another and see how we can move forward. I want to salute the people of the Western Cape. I want to salute the people of this country that stepped forward to assist the most vulnerable.

Speaker, families are emotionally scarred for life through untimely deaths of their mothers, of their fathers, and brothers. People are going through a difficult time. Just today I heard when a family were preparing for a funeral, they lost another sister on the very same day. I thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you very much, hon Christians, for your contribution. I now recognise the hon member Philander.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Today COVID-19 infections led to the loss of over 17 700 lives in our province from over 470 000 confirmed positive cases, and deaths equate to 3,6% of the confirmed cases. Though COVID related deaths are considered the worst-case scenario, it does not end with our final goodbyes at the graves of our loved ones. It means that close to 500 000 residents, their families and friends could not continue with life as we know it, jobs, fulfilling basic needs, participating in recreational activities that support our lifestyles and wellbeing. Nothing is left unaffected. A new world was not only to be imagined but unravelled and lived rapidly and so we were deprived of many of our coping mechanisms.

Speaker, in the corridors of hospitals healthcare workers had to reduce the spread as a first point of call, develop short-term strategies and bear in mind long-term plans, provide care to this never-before-seen virus; delay the fears of patients and that of their own. Many were left without support of loved ones as isolation and quarantine became common practice. The conditions of a healthcare worker received heightened attention evident in their new named “the essential worker”.

Speaker, I salute every nurse, practice manager, doctor, porter and administrator. You have lost and learned but pushed through the unknown. You are deeply appreciated for your heroism.

Speaker, in contrast the lack of constructive criticism by an opposition, I commend the Provincial Government for the support provided to these essential workers. The employment of additional staff during each wave of this infection, we saw the launch of the Red Dot Taxi Service, which offers dedicated safe transportation services to workers and now they have offered over 5 000 passengers the opportunity to get to vaccination sites, made sure... [Interjection.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Ja, they spent fortunes in doing that, now they fight with one another and criticise.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Speaker...

The SPEAKER: I do not think – order, order hon members! My apologies hon Philander, if you could allow me. I just want to address the hon member who switched on the microphone. We do not do that. We do not do that. It is against the Standing Rules. It violates the very tenet that binds us here that we are hon members so we cannot allow that. I am requesting that we proceed, and hon member Philander, you have not lost your time. Please proceed.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you very much. Thank you so much, Speaker, and made sure that we repurposed hospitals and managed bed capacity innovatively through the Bed Bureau System and dedicated field hospitals to ease the system under which staff operate. Over and around above all I commend the Provincial Department of Health for embarking on an intentional healing process with one-on-one consultations for those who have suffered psychologically.

Speaker, these efforts have been made possible by tabling a Budget of Hope for 2021 – one to create jobs, safer communities and deliver wellbeing. As Minister Maynier said earlier this year, National Government gives with the one hand and takes with the other. While we supported every wave of COVID-19 by R1 billion, National Government effectively cut the Provincial Department of Health's budget by R1,85 billion, but during this time we were able to lean in, to help buffer reductions to basic programmes in Human Settlements, Education and Health, with over R9 billion over the medium term.

In this way we rebuild on ANC-sponsored ruins and we look to a better future. Speaker, I cannot stress enough the importance of supplementing support programmes of Frontline Service Departments, given the toll COVID-19 takes on those in need.

The impact of the pandemic is visible everywhere but what it has done to the mental health and residents wellbeing cannot be seen with the mere eye. It is therefore important that we continue to embark intentionally on these recovery plans. We do this with or without National Government and we do this in the interest of those who have passed, those who are suffering in silence and for those still with us.

I thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Philander. Hon members, I now recognise the hon member Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Good afternoon, Speaker, and hon members. Speaker, it has been over a year since COVID-19 visited our country and province. Since then, life as we know it changed drastically and will never be the same again. I want to commend President Ramaphosa and National Government for the efforts to save lives and to preserve livelihoods. We thank the President for extending the R350 grants to the unemployed young people. The impact of this is known to all.

†Cyril Gavin, 'n jong man van Swellendam sê: “Antie Rachel, as u die President sien, sê vir hom dankie vir die R350 want ek is 'n enkelouer met twee kinders sonder 'n inkomste, maar ek kan vandag 'n stukkie brood op hulle tafel sit.”

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Cyril Gavin, a young man from Swellendam says: “Auntie Rachel, when you see the President, say to him thank you for the R350 because I am a single parent with two children without an income, but today I can put a piece of bread on their table.”]

He ended off by saying, “Even though our country faces a lot of challenges currently I have a lot to be grateful for and I will pray for him and our Government to keep up with the good work.”

Speaker, the wrath of this virus has caused panic and psychological distress in the population as everyone is living in fear of contracting the virus or losing loved ones. As the Western Cape remains in the top two provinces with the highest COVID-19 infections, the situation remains volatile and the fear remains high in communities. The Government is not doing enough to protect the population and minimise the spread of the virus. While we may shift the blame to COVID-19 fatigue and many other excuses we have heard in the past, reality is that the Provincial Government has not done enough to prevent the rapid spread of the virus

in the province and we have failed to protect the healthcare workers who are the coalface of our response to the pandemic.

The psychological toll the pandemic has taken on frontline workers is not spoken about enough. The frontline workers put their lives in danger so we could live. They live in the shadows of death and have lost a lot of their colleagues in the past two years.

The physical and psychological harm of COVID-19 on healthcare workers is well established and easy to see. They put in long hours of work in often unsafe environments. They experience burnout and have witnessed colleagues contracting the virus and succumbing to it.

Speaker, Professor Garth Stevens, a clinical psychologist at Wits stated that “healthcare workers are first and foremost human beings and, directly due to Covid-19, they are like other humans struggling with mental health issues in this moment.

Speaker, we need to advocate for more assistance for the healthcare workers. The Provincial Government must employ additional healthcare workers to address the challenge of burnout and to allow workers time to isolate or to leave of absence when they cannot cope mentally and emotionally. Moreover, we need the Provincial Government to put in more resources towards the emotional and mental wellbeing of our frontline workers.



Speaker, the South African Depression and Anxiety Group conducted a survey last year which showed that stress levels had increased during COVID-19 as people experienced anxiety and panic and financial pressure. I do not want us to fall into a trap of believing that the Provincial Mental Health challenge only started with the emergence of COVID-19.

We have always had a serious mental health challenge in the province. To see the proof of this we need to look no further than service the pressure and shortages of beds in our psychiatric hospitals.

The unemployment rate particularly among youth and the need rate have pushed many young people to drug and substance abuse.

This in turn has contributed immensely to the challenges with mental health and increased numbers of patients in our psychiatric hospitals. The Western Cape Recovery Plan does not have specific programmes to deal with these pressing challenges.

The Department of Health has also failed to ensure that all our district hospitals have dedicated mental health e-units. Speaker, the psychological toll of COVID-19 on children is not receiving the necessary attention it deserves. The Government has not done enough to find best possible ways to communicate the impact of COVID-19 to children. For instance, what programmes are in place to support children when their caregivers are hospitalised, or they succumbed to COVID-19?

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: What methods are used to communicate outbreaks of COVID-19 in schools and when a teacher or learner has succumbed to death? This brings me to the point that we have been raising in the province as ANC, given the impact of COVID-19 on the emotional and mental wellbeing of the population, frontline workers and teachers and learners. Does the Province not see the need to employ more social workers and psychologists in schools? At the present moment there is only one per education district. One can imagine the emotional strain they are going through due to work pressure.

The Provincial Government, particularly the Departments of Health, Social Development and Education must find ways to ensure that we put resources in place to ensure that there are social workers or psychologists for every school in the province. I thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Windvogel. I said “thank you” a minute before you finished. I am glad you finished on time. Thank you. May I at this stage, hon members, request the hon Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sports, hon Marais to address the House?

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Speaker, this Western Cape Government understands that the COVID-19 pandemic had and continues to have an impact on the physical and mental wellbeing of

our citizens as well as officials across the province. It is for this reason that the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport has taken the lead to advise on programmes that could be rolled out to offer long-term healing and counselling support to the citizenry, both formal and informal.

We are living amidst a first global mass trauma event for several decades. It is arguably the first of its kind since World War II and likely the first of such severity in our lifetime. Billions of people have had to contend with loneliness, anxiety, boredom and grief during the triable crisis of a global pandemic, a brutal economic downturn and a profound social and cultural dislocation.

After the pandemic ends the effects of the mass trauma that it has inflicted will linger across societies for years. The challenge then is for overburdened psychiatric and special services to respond to this last COVID trauma.

The World Health Organisation reminds that mental health conditions are increasing worldwide. Mainly because of demographic changes there has been a 13% rise in mental health conditions and substance abuse disorders in the last decade. Around 20% of the world's children and adolescents have a mental health condition with suicide the second leading cause of death amongst 15- to 29-years old.

The World Health Organisation explains that two of the most common mental health conditions, depression and anxiety, cost the global economy

\$1 trillion US dollar each year.

The Organisation for Economic Cooperation and development reports that the uncertainties and broad impacts of COVID-19 have not affected all people to the same degree.

Young people were 30% to 80% more likely to report symptoms of depression or anxiety than adults in Belgium, France and the United States in March 2021. Higher levels of loneliness are also being reported by young people. To respond to this evidence, we should spend some time on the impact of recreation and sport on mental wellbeing. Studies suggest that sport achieves a number of impacts simultaneously, making it a highly cost-effective intervention. Many of the links between sport and different social impacts are common, including greater physical competence, better cognitive skills, better social skills, trust and connectedness and identification with social values. These help to counteract risk factors and stimulate favourable reaction to protective factors.

Hon Speaker, well-being is the manifestation of the catalytic role that sport plays in stimulating social impacts. Without a sense of well-being from participating, people would not sign up to sport. People would not play as frequently as they do and the Olympic and Paralympic Games null and void.

On a lighter note, Exhibit A would be our Premier. Without a sense of well-being from participating in sport, he would not be of the view that cycling

fixes many a problem. There is evidence of a positive relationship between sport participation and subjective well-being. While well-being is connected particularly to health, particularly mental health, but also anti-social behaviour in the Education and Social capital.

On the flipside of the same coin, we have also explored the impact of the arts and culture on mental well-being. The evidence of beneficial effects of the arts on mental health appears to be stronger than the evidence on physical health. Kilroy *et al* demonstrated that engagement with the arts creates a positive atmosphere, empowering individuals to make healthier choices through becoming more inspired; involved questioning and willing to take risks.

Results suggest that art-related participation contributes to the personal development and perception of well-being, which in turn builds inherent capacity and motivation for change.

The current Western Cape Government practices includes awareness raising, staff services, toolkit and training for community rollout, psychosocial and social work services, medical services and referral pathways.

The DCAS action plan to respond to these practices includes, which already is well on its way, consulting relevant government partners, civil society and business, through implementation strategies that include nudges and tweaks to build on successes we have had. Projects and events and interventions

were focused on collective approaches and not only individual self-care.

In keeping hope alive while creating a social movement for healing to safely move forward together, we have focused our energies on staff well-being, advocacy campaigns, creating new narratives and meaning, and training our teams in delivering our services, programmes and assistance on the ground to the citizens in our care.

Hon Speaker, the DCAS has a social infrastructure in place through our service delivery footprint and valued partners. The time is now to leverage on existing campaigns by icons, leaders and influencers, inclusive of our local artists, sporting personalities and all those who call the Western Cape home.

Creating new narratives and meaning through a whole of society and whole of Government approach, is key to addressing the lasting social dangers of mass trauma, as evidence shows a consist in forgetting.

Hon Speaker, when it goes unprocessed, undiscussed, perhaps actively repressed, a group's social tissues remain disturbed and unhealed. Individual trauma builds up unrecognised and festers under the cracks. We are tackling this head-on by stimulating public dialogue and creating positive narratives through new works of art, theatre, music, dance, the visual arts, storytelling, our network of faith-based organisations and NGOs, and activations that keep hope alive, while creating a social movement for healing to safely move forward together.

As we actively contribute to the Western Cape Government Recovery Plan, our well-being priority, based on a theory of change, is focused on firstly increasing well-being; physical, emotional and spiritual, nutrition, exercise ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: ... and [inaudible.] sport across all ages. Secondly ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister, your time is up.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: ... yet simultaneous – one ...

The SPEAKER: Your time is up, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: Okay, I am [inaudible.] thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. It is over six minutes. Your six minutes allocated. Thank you, hon Minister. I now recognise the hon member Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the

COVID-19 is not only posing threats to people's physical health, but also has a negative impact on our economy, social relationships, cultural activities, of which all impacted on the mental health of people.

We know that the pandemic is also harming the social and material well-being of the poor, especially children, the homeless and elderly. Closures of schools and social distancing have increased the risk of poor nutrition. Homelessness on its own increases poor mental health, and the delay in housing only exhibits existing mental health conditions. Poor mental health can make it harder to cope with being homeless, unemployed, living in abject poverty, high levels of crime and drug addictions.

As a Provincial Government we must ensure the implementation of measures for children to have access to good nutrition, that they are protected against child abuse and neglect, that the places of safety for abused women do not have to turn away those in need. Can we really account for the condition of the frail and elderly? Whether those in need of mental and physical health could access such services? The pandemic will be with us for a long time, and many more people will be losing their jobs or start earning less. By now we should have developed policies to support parental employment, which is a major factor in preventing poverty.

Provincial Legislature and municipalities are the frontline of the crisis management of COVID-19 at all levels, such as health, economic safety, social and fiscal.



In poor areas masks are not a priority. We have seen people being evicted from their homes without alternative ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Brinkhuis ...[Interjections.]

Mr G BRINKHUIS: ... accommodation.

The SPEAKER: ... your time is up.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I notice that sometimes the hon members they think that I am saying, “You must finish off.” I decided right from the onset to indicate to the hon members that I do not want to disrupt the speaking opportunity for the member by informing you during the speaking, because it is a hybrid session, so you might think someone is haggling, but I am saying you must finish off.

So I instead elected to rather inform you when your time is up. So my request really, my humble request, is to set your own timer for yourself so that you do not have a situation where there is a conflict at the end of the speaking time. [Interjections.]

So at this point – [Laughs] so the Premier says he is going to be a timer for the Leader of the Opposition, whether you trust that or not. I will leave it to

you. [Interjections.]

Hon members ... Oh, you have got your timer there, well done, well done, hon member Dugmore. [Interjections.]

Thank you. Hon members, I now recognise the hon the Leader of the Opposition.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I believe that it is important to echo the sentiments of hon member Windvogel that our province's mental health challenges did not start with the emergence of COVID-19. We have always had serious mental health challenges in the province, and to see the proof of this we need to look no further than service pressures and shortages of beds in our psychiatric hospitals.

However, the ANC wishes in particular during this debate, to pay tribute to the civil society and NGOs who attempted to fill the gap where this Provincial Government has not been able to cover all the bases.

We know that since 2009 there has been a systemic downscaling of the support given to civil society organisations, especially those that actually deal with mental health issues, and we, as the ANC, want to take this opportunity to pay tribute to organisations like Life Line and places such as the Counselling Hub. I am informed, hon Speaker, that one can access a

session at the Counselling Hub for as little as R50.

Hon Speaker, personally I think it was important for hon member Bosman to bring this matter for debate. It is just a pity that he could not resist playing party politics.

We must emphasise that mental health is as important as the MEC said as physical health and therefore, if we are to build our human capabilities and human capital in this province in order to meet the requisites of a developmental state, then issues such as mental health become imperative. It is not good enough to have a Wellness for All strategy that only focuses on staff members in this Provincial Government. The Wellness for All strategy needs to go into the community as whole. We have to encourage our older folk, young people and others, to speak to someone, even a friend, someone that you know, because we all know that we live in a deeply traumatic society.

So it is about finding support mechanisms. Who of us can forget the terrible photo of a little girl sitting in the street reading her book, while a body of someone who had been shot lay just a few feet away, and she continued reading?

Because of apartheid and because of poverty, inequality and gross unemployment, we live in this traumatised society, and we must be careful of making this into a political football, but I would be failing in my duty as

Leader of the Opposition if I were not to point out the devastating effects on mental health caused by alcohol abuse in this province.

We would be failing if we did not recognise the deep psychological pains which our fathers attempt to numb by drinking themselves into a stupor in many cases. We would be failing if we did not acknowledge that some of our mothers abuse alcohol because of being exploited, abused or even raped. That is the reality.

As leaders of society, we must encourage our people that abuse of alcohol is not the answer, and that is why, hon Speaker, we find it completely hypocritical that the MEC stands up here and talks about care for the homeless, when she was absolutely silent when the concentration camp in Strandfontein was set up. This Provincial Government, up to the Premier, to the MEC, did not want to take on the City, and homelessness, we know, often goes along with issues of mental health.

The other issue is that to deal with mental health, the physical and emotional, is also about keeping hope alive, but we have a continuous stream of negative, panic-creating politics from the DA, that actually tries to draw hope away and actually make people doubt, make people uncertain. Whereas if we are actually able to build hope based on the real conditions and how people can improve, that is one of the ways we begin to deal with mental health, and the same DA is the one that did not want a basic minimum wage. They wanted people to get R1,800 instead of R3,500, but they come to this House

...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... [inaudible.] thank you.

The SPEAKER: ... the Leader of the Opposition. Thank you for your contribution. Hon members, I now recognise [Interjections.] the hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and can I start off by saying I wish you had given the Leader of the Opposition a bit more time, because I needed to get an app downloaded, but I unfortunately will try to get the response from memory on that app.

Can I first of all say that I want to thank the hon member Gillion for bringing this debate to the House. I think that we face many issues in our province, we face many issues in our country, but this is the issue that is now starting to become the dominant issue that is facing citizens across this province, across this country and across the world at the moment. So I think it is really pertinent that this was brought here, it is a very, very important debate for us to be having.

I want to start off also by saying that I agree with the hon member Dugmore, which I do not often do, but I agree with him that this did not start with COVID-19. [Interjections.] In actual fact it started before COVID-19, but it

is a culmination of a perfect storm, of a whole lot of issues coming together and topped by COVID-19, which really starts to tip so many people over the edge.

It is a culmination of the COVID-19 loss, this immense of loss of life, of jobs, of the ability to look after your family, of the ability to find hope and security in yourself as an individual in our province, and to see a future, and of course it is this COVID-19 pandemic that kind of tipped so many people over the edge, and we see it from the suicide statistics, we see it from just engaging with citizens who tell you they cannot cope anymore, they cannot see that there is going to be better tomorrow.

Of course, it all started prior to this when we, as a country, were already sitting, and we heard many speakers today talk about our unemployment rate. Those people that have lost their jobs during this time, but before the pandemic started, we had one of the worst unemployment rates in the world. All that this pandemic did was took this country to the worst. The worst unemployment rate in the world, and by far the worst unemployment rate for young people, youth unemployment rate.

When I saw that graph yesterday of youth unemployment, it really hit me to the core. This is as a result of really bad policies from the ANC. Bad economic policies, bad policies that over the last 25 years have not made it better for citizens.

We already had that unemployment rate through these bad policies, but of course exacerbated by that was the immense corruption that our country has suffered.

Pravin Gordhan himself saying R250 billion; that is R2,500 million stolen from the people of this province. Imagine if that was put into job creation projects. Imagine if that was put in right now to help those citizens that cannot get the R350 a month, and of course it is also the shocking management that the ANC have put in place over this last while. Whether it is the management of SAPS, the management of our energy system, our rail system, the SOEs and right down to SASSA, and how SASSA is managed in the best interest of the most vulnerable population of our country or our province, and I say “SASSA managed”, I should say “SASSA mismanaged”, and that is why this Government has put a Recovery Plan, we already put it in place last November, a Recovery Plan, although COVID-19 is not over. It was to refocus what we were doing, and part of recovery is of course safety, jobs, but it is well-being. It is the well-being of our citizens.

So thank you, hon member Gillion, for bringing it here, because the well-being of our citizens and the mental well-being of our citizens is really under pressure at the moment.

The hon member Bakubaku-Vos, she also mentioned unemployment, but what she also spoke about was she said that this province has got no mental health programmes in place. Where has she been? Where has she been?

I have just spoken about the actual programme of the three focus areas of this Government. Then just go and have a look at the Department of Health itself and what it is doing for its own healthcare workers, the frontline workers, which she speaks about. The whole of society approach from the recovery plan. Please, she needs to look at these documents and then actually have a look at some of the other provinces.

But I must commend her on one thing. I have been in this House for 12 years and it is the first time I have heard an ANC member come up and say, "In KZN I have confirmed that we have put in place this project." Thank you very much, hon member Bakubaku-Vos, for the first time in 12 years I have heard someone from the ANC come up with, "This is what we are doing somewhere else," that is positive. Congratulations on that.

She did mention food gardens. I see that we are sitting at 37% of our schools have already got food gardens, and we passed the 6,000 mark of food gardens implemented by our Department of Agriculture. So that is an amazing feat and this is since March last year. Absolutely unbelievable.

The hon member Xego, I do not want to really spend too much time other than your policies, sir, in your party, these are the Venezuelan and Zimbabwean policies. I promise you go and do your research, they will just cause more misery.

Then I want to say to the hon members Fernandez, Marais, Mbombo and



Philander who spoke today, but the hon members Fernandez, Marais and Mbombo, I want to thank you for the leadership role that you are playing in our well-being focus of this Government.

The hon member Fernandez spoke about the faith-based organisations and how we link there. Food gardens and the food forums, the homeless, GBV, these issues that our citizens are facing and thank you for putting those programmes together and not just now, they have been part of this process from March last year, and then really reinforced in November.

The hon member Marais spoke about World War II, and basically the post traumatic stress syndrome that citizens faced after the Second World War, and that is exactly what is happening right now, and we are going to be stuck with this for years and we need to come up with methods and mechanisms to help our citizens. Whether it is in our psych wards in our hospitals, which I agree with the hon member Dugmore, under are severe stress.

In all the hospitals I visited, those psych wards are dealing with the most vulnerable psychological issues that our vulnerable citizens are facing. Of course, there are problems there too because they are exacerbated not only by alcohol, but also by drugs and of course they are also used a scapegoat by our policing system. SAPS find it much easier to drop off a drug addict at the psych ward rather than to deal with them, because they are a gang member and they have been arrested for the fourth and fifth and sixth time, and the criminal justice system has not dealt with them properly, we just clog the

psych system with people who should actually be arrested.

I want to say thank you for mentioning cycling as always, but also sport and sporting activities, exercise, we really have to get outside, we have got to exercise, we have got to clear our heads while we are fighting this pandemic, while we are getting to recovery back in place.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. [Laughs.]

†Die PREMIER: Dit kan nie wees nie.

[The PREMIER: It cannot be.]

The SPEAKER: I thought you have the timer there. [Laughs.]

The PREMIER: Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you. Thank you, hon Premier.  
[Interjections.] Hon members, that concludes the debate on the subject for discussion.

I now have the next on the Order Paper is the Interpellations. The interpellation that we have is only one, the one other one was withdrawn by the hon member who have moved it.

Now this one is by hon member Lili to hon member Simmers. I would like to

recognise the hon Minister of Human Settlements.

## **INTERPELLATIONS**

### *Preventative measures for tenants defaulting on payment of rent*

#### **1. Mr A Lili ask Mr T A Simmers, Minister of Human Settlements:**

What measures are in place to prevent tenants (a) from defaulting on payments and/or (b) from paying below the market-related value for his Department's rental stock?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, hon Premier, my colleague present and all colleagues virtually online logged into the sitting.

I want to thank the hon members for the question posed for this interpellation. The (a) part is that my Department has a debt management policy which contains how the process is managed, and I will ensure that the hon member gets a copy of this policy, but in a nutshell it focuses on ensuring the debtor statements are distributed monthly to all tenants, reminders are distributed as soon as a debtor defaults on payment.

Personal discussions are held with debtors, obviously noting the COVID regulations. If debtor's income has changed, the rental amount is amended

accordingly. Payment arrangements are discussed with debtors that default on payment, as well as arrears outstanding. Prescribed debt is referred to the delegated authority to be written off, and old cases are referred to the State Attorney to recover outstanding arrear amounts, and inform management on a monthly basis of the status of the debtor account.

On the (b) portion, hon Speaker, to the hon member. In March 2020 a strategic decision was taken to redefine the rental stock and shift the focus from primarily catering for low-income housing to also serve the affordable housing market for households earning up to R22,000 a month, while also reserving opportunities to those earning more than this.

The departmental rental units are now available to qualifying persons as determined by our new rental turnaround strategy, based on households with a combined income of between R7,500 and R22,000.

The monthly rental for the income group is determined on a sliding scale, I should add. Tenants whose income exceeds the upper income band of R22,000 per month will pay the full market-related rental.

Hon Speaker, with all our projects and assets we are seeking to ensure that integration occurs as our aim, where it is absent, is to establish and/or create integrated human settlements. Every person that qualifies and regardless of who they are, should be afforded an opportunity to rent, should this be the option they prefer.

We must also not lose sight of the fact that rentals are part of our broader affordable housing options. Not everyone is in the position to immediately acquire property, but this could be their first step towards becoming a fully-fledged homeowner. Our function, as the Provincial Government then, is to assist our citizenry by making these opportunities affordable. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, I now recognise the hon member Lili.

Mr A LILI: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, good afternoon. Hon Speaker, the Department of Human Settlements until 2016 had no rental policy. Instead, those who were privileged enough before 1994, continued to occupy Government properties, paying almost nothing.

This Department had been maintaining these rental properties and paying rates for these people, with no consequences for non-payment of rental. Credit to former MEC Madikizela, who was pushed to resign by the DA white cabal.

As from 2016 a rental policy that was meant to redress the imbalances of the past, affording even African deserving people an opportunity to have decent housing, occupying the rental units of the Department, was developed. The policy afforded public servants who could not afford to buy bonded houses, an opportunity to rent from the Department, which contributed immensely to

the revenue collection of the Department.

Hon Speaker, despite that [inaudible.] revenue, there is a drive from the Department of Human Settlements to [inaudible.] of Land and Asset Management Section to ensure that these Government officials are removed from these rental units. This drive is informed by the fact that black people have been afforded an opportunity to also occupy the units, which, according to this director, were meant for a particular group of people.

To this end a new document regarded as the rental policy, has been developed by this director and signed by the former HOD, Jacqueline Samson, which was fired for poor performance. This document was developed to target public servants, raising their rental beyond what is meant to be, to prove that this is a plan to target public servants despite their rental being paid, though deduction from Persal, they are still [inaudible.] that their leases will not be renewed.

The question is why? These are not social houses, but rental stock with the sole purpose of generating revenue. The MEC must therefore tell us why black public servants are targeted, while special conditions are created for white families to live in suburbs like De Waal Drive, Roxy Avenue in Worcester ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you ...[Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: ... Muller Street in Stellenbosch ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... hon member Lili.

Mr A LILI: ... and Plumstead, for as little as R100 monthly rental ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Lili.

Mr A LILI: ... [inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Your time is up. You will have a second bite later, so wait for the second opportunity, thank you. Hon members, I now recognise the hon member Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Speaker, while we need to maximise the income of the Western Cape Provincial Administration, we also know that not everybody can afford to pay market-related rentals, particularly in our well sought-after province.

Market-related prices are primarily the domain of the private sector and we are grateful for those entrepreneurs that do serve that portion of the housing market.

The management of rental stock is not a simple matter, particularly under the

COVID-19 regulations that limit the options to act against non-paying tenants. I am grateful for this interpellation in the name of hon member Lili, as I was getting concerned about his view of his oversight role and membership of this House.

Through you, Chair, to hon member Lili. Sir, we are missing you at our meetings. You have been absent from all meetings of the Standing Committee since 1 April 2021, and I feel sorry that you also missed the Standing Committee of Human Settlements oversight visit ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Van der Westhuizen ...[Interjections.]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ... [inaudible.] housing project.

The SPEAKER: Will you please take your seat? I have stopped the timer. Hon the Deputy Chief Whip of the Opposition.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, on a point of order, and I do not want to belabour the point. I have been raising it in previous sittings. Hon member Van der Westhuizen should not be saying, "You, hon member Lili." He must speak through you. Even though we know he did say, "Through you, hon Speaker," but still he then went and made the mistake by saying, "To you, Lili."

He must not speak directly to the hon member Lili, and also this, his remarks



are not related to the subject of the interpellation.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you, hon member Sayed. I think the point that you have made regarding how we should be addressing the hon member is taken. The other issues can be left to the member himself because it is, as much as it is a question, an interpellation, it is a political one in nature, so we cannot circumscribe the members' ability to be politicians in the House.

Hon member Van der Westhuizen, please do not refer to members directly. Just refer to them as "hon members". May you please proceed?

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Speaker, these projects, known as Glen Haven [inaudible.] and Bothasig Gardens, cater for families earning between R1,500 and R5,000.

The hon member Lili would have seen the beautiful buildings, the benefits of strict control to prevent overcrowding, the pride that tenants display and the demographics of the tenants. The properties were well kept, the grounds were clean and the tenants' safety a priority.

I wish that hon member Lili would have been there to satisfy himself of the amazing provision and the difference that social housing is making to those that cannot afford market-related prices.

While the needs always exceed the provision, this Province has more than

enough reason to be proud of its provision of social housing to the vulnerable. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Van der Westhuizen. Hon members, I now recognise hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, my question is pertaining to the market-related rentals being paid.

Is the Department, as we just heard and it is not my portfolio, but as we just heard the property is kept, it is neat and looked after, so these rentals that we receive, is it value for money when it comes to the Department of Human Settlements?

So it is your income and your expenditure to maintain the place, look after the place, that is one question. So how do the Department look at receiving the money that is not market-related, and how do they determine that when we give the money out, and we must maintain the place? So, is the Department looking at that when they also look at rentals paid of non-market-related prices?

The other question is just this; we know that everybody cannot apply for a bond, does not qualify and all of those things, but is there also assistance for people to get homes of their own and how does that process work? I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians. Hon members, I now recognise hon member Lili.

Mr A LILI: [No audible response.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lili, it is your second bite.

Mr A LILI: Okay, thank you very much again, hon Speaker. [Interjections.] The hon member is just angry that I am raising [Interjections.] issues that he knows that are correct.

Hon Speaker, a 76-year-old white female has been staying in a two bedroom house in Naruna Estate, Plumstead, for over 22 years, for just R100 a month. The market-related value for a three bedroom house in Plumstead is R9,500 per month, while for a two bedroom it is R6,000, and R4,500 for a one bedroom. This white privilege is costing this Government money.

Whilst public servants are persecuted by the Department, many who have been occupying these units since 1994 are still paying for less than what these public servants are paying, and yet thousands of public servants remain on the waiting list for rental stock.

The Department is still maintaining units occupied by people who owe the Department lots of money in terms of rental. MEC must tell us why. Is it because of their skin colour and because they belong to the DA constituency?

Is the DA using these rental units to appease them and buy their votes?

We actually need SCOPA to investigate how much the Government is losing through these deals of maintaining apartheid spatial legacy and white privilege.

Hon Speaker, we will bring this to the Legislature through a substantive motion. We need an investigation against MEC Simmers for concealing information in his replies to our questions. In all his replies to questions about the rental stock units he deliberately withheld information about Gatesville rental units. Tenants have been living in these units without paying any rental. The Department is maintaining the units while it does not receive anything in return.

The Department is busy finalising the process to hand over ownership of the units to the tenants for free. This has to be the biggest corruption scandal in the province since the dawn of democracy.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Lili ...[Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: We need SCOPA to investigate his matter.

The SPEAKER: ... your time is up. Thank you, you have exhausted your time.

I now recognise the hon Minister. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon Speaker, no, thank you very much and it is quite interesting to listen to the hon member Lili's second bite of the cherry so to speak, but seemingly the member does not read his written responses to the questions which he has requested through my Department, hon Speaker, and what you ask that is the response that you get.

We do not conceal any information, we give it to you, but it all depends on what you ask, but I think it is quite pertinent to actually focus the hon members' attention that we are trying to integrate different communities, but obviously individuals are occupying some of our rental stock, sometimes for more than 40 years, and they are actively paying and post 1994, more so in this province under this governing party, we seek to integrate various different people from different communities.

We do not see race, we see opportunity for these individuals, but sadly the hon member Lili is fixated on race. The narrative of everything he asked is race. His complete input today is based on race, but not only that, he is fixated on not identifying the responses which were given through to him, which would have assisted him so vastly in preparing for today's interpellation a lot better, through you, hon Speaker.

Firstly, in 2017 a rental policy was put in place. This is in terms and in line with the PFMA. In 2020 March we further updated this rental policy by also introducing a specific policy which deals with allocations.

We formulated the sliding scale formula as we now seek it to ensure that different salary bands pay different scales for rental of a unit, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, in 2016 when my predecessor opened up some of these units for those employees of the Provincial Government, we would not never, or he could have never projected the number of individuals who ultimately, even though they work for this Provincial Government, are seeking affordable housing closer to where they work, and currently we have on our demand list individuals who are still waiting, which are well over 1,116, but we need to understand we only have provincial stock of 538, something which was pointed out to the hon member when he asked me a written question, and I responded to that, hon Speaker.

But, hon Speaker, once again the hon member, through you, does not comprehend what affordable housing means, and affordable housing is not what I am saying, it is national policy which in the Western Cape we have altered to ensure that we speak to the realities of our people and, hon member, it is rental stock, which you clearly have an issue with, but you forget we are not the only provincial department that has rental stock. At least in our case our management is improving of our rental stock. Something which, if the hon member ultimately attends the Standing Committee, he would note we do report on the loss of income at our rental stock.

Then we have social housing, which seemingly the hon member is confusing with rental stock, but once again if the hon member actually attends the

Standing Committee he would know the difference.

And the third objective of affordable housing is FLISP, and just recently the Standing Committee had a meeting about the various options, but guess what, the hon member was not present, but ultimately, hon Speaker, we divulge every bit of information through our annual reports. If the hon member just looks at last year's annual report he would pick up that part of the reason for our turnaround strategy was because the amount of money we were spending in maintaining these stock, because what we were getting in did not make economic sense for us, and that was a question that was posed to us during that session.

Hon member Christians, thank you very much. Yes, we did introduce market-related payments for those earning above R22,000 because the reality is some of our provincial staff are living in stock, we entered into new agreements with them, but because we respect the rule of law, we had to wait for their rental agreement to cease so we can enter into a new agreement, and many of them welcome that approach as well.

Do we get value for money ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: We will see that in this financial year, thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you. Hon ...[Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: Chairperson?

The SPEAKER: ... members ...[Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: Hon Speaker? Hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lili?

Mr A LILI: Hon Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: [Inaudible.]

Mr A LILI: No, hon Speaker, I am just, I just want to correct something here.

The SPEAKER: No, we cannot do it like that.

Mr A LILI: No, I am saying, hon Speaker, because the MEC ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: [Inaudible.]

Mr A LILI: ... the Minister is misleading the House ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ...the Rule [Inaudible.]



Mr A LILI: ... saying that I was not attending the meeting.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member Lili. You are ...[Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: I am making an order, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: You cannot do it that way. Please take your seat and mute yourself there. There are opportunities in terms of the Rules, hon member Lili and hon members. If you need to clarify a statement or a misstatement by any member in the House during a debate, which is this is a mini debate as an interpellation, but you do not do it in the House at the moment without having sought an approval from the Speaker, which you can do for the next sitting should the Speaker give you that right.

So we follow the process and procedures, and my office will gladly advise how we can do that. So may I request that you do not repeat that conduct, hon member Lili.

May I then request that we move to the Questions? I thank you, hon members, who have participated in the interpellation.

Now the first Question for Oral Reply is the question by hon the Leader of the Opposition to the hon Premier. I now recognise the hon Premier.

#### **QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

*Alcohol Harms Reduction Strategy Implementation*

**1. Mr C M Dugmore asked the Premier:**

(a) On what date was the Alcohol Harms Reduction Strategy adopted by the Provincial Cabinet in 2017 and (b) what steps were taken to implement it?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and thank you very much to the hon Leader of the Opposition for the question.

The Western Cape Alcohol-related Harms Reduction Policy White Paper, which is underpinned by an Alcohol Harms Reduction Strategy, was adopted by the Western Cape Cabinet on 30 August 2017, and published in the *Government Gazette* on 4 September 2017, with implementation commencing thereafter.

In 2017, this is part (b) of the answer. In 2017 planning began on the development of a draft Liquor Bill and the necessary supporting evidence required for implementation of a rational, reasonable and proportional way as required by the Constitution.

In 2018 work was undertaken to obtain the appropriate approvals for the drafting of the Western Cape Liquor Bill, inclusive of the range of discussions and workshops with various working groups on the direction of

the draft Western Cape Liquor Bill.

In 2019 various research initiatives were undertaken during this period and included legal research initiatives and opinions around minimum unit pricing mechanisms, and the development of monitoring and evaluation toolkits.

An independent external service provider, the South African Medical Research Council ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, I just want to check with the hon member Allen, is that a point of order?

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Speaker, no, sir. I am raising my hand in anticipation for a follow-up question. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, thank you very much, hon member Allen. [Laughter.] At that point, hon Premier, I just want to indicate to the hon members, any member who wishes to raise their hand, please do so in terms of the Standing Rules.

I know that the hon member who asked the question will get the first opportunity. Thereon we will get the hon members who follow up, after which the hon member has spoken. I recognise the hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I recognised the hon

member's hand, prepared and ahead of the game, but thank you very much, I have still got a bit of a way to go with the answer.

So I will just go back to 2019. Various research initiatives were undertaken during this period and included legal research initiatives and opinions around minimum unit pricing mechanisms, and the development of a monitoring and evaluation toolkit.

An independent external service provider, the South African Medical Research Council, with a team specialising in alcohol-related harms reduction and monitoring and evaluation indicated development was taken by the Western Cape Government to develop an M&E toolkit.

The project reviewed and developed an M&E indicator list for the Western Cape Government, focusing on alcohol-related harms and related indicators. It also provided a critical assessment to the Western Cape Government internal evidence, data sources and relevant local and national data sources, the mechanisms for the Western Cape Government data provision collection.

The research on the WHO pricing mechanisms, that is the excise and tax and minimum pricing units, reducing alcohol-related harms through pricing mechanism, is one of the three WHO best-buys, which are mechanisms deemed highly cost-effective in reducing alcohol attributable death and disabilities at population level.

A report was delivered on 1 October 2018 which indicated that a minimum pricing unit had been or had the potential to significantly impact the consumption of heavy drinkers, and that it is an instrument that targets cheap alcohol to reduce riskier harm causing heavy drinking.

In 2020 the period provided for the continuation of research and exploring policy and legislative framework primarily around the availability mechanisms such as the density and trading times. It included research into alcohol outlet density and trading time interventions through utilising locally devised empirical data to guide the assessment and the development of a provincial policy position.

2021, initiatives in the current financial year include the continuation of further research particularly into pricing mechanisms and different trading time levels, but with a South African and Western Cape specific impact assessment across various social and economic variables in the province, such as consumption and reduced alcohol-related health and social harms, example HIV, IPV, road injury and others, and costs, individual spend, excise tax and VAT-related revenue, hospital and crime costs.

These research efforts culminated in a set of proposed amendments to the Western Cape Liquor Act. In principle approval was granted by the Cabinet on 9 June 2021, for the Amendment Bill to be drafted.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. I now recognise the hon the Leader of the Opposition.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much hon Speaker. Just as my first follow-up question, because no doubt I will follow the hand of hon member Reagan, I would like to then ask the Premier to confirm that after four years, what we have as of 9 June, is not a Bill, but actually simply permission to develop the principles of a Bill?

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: [No audible response.]

The SPEAKER: Your microphone.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. I will start again.

Thank you to the hon member for the question, and just to point out, this is not a new Bill, this is not policy formation, White Paper, Green Paper and a new piece of legislation.

Of course, the hon member should know that that took around 12 years for the ANC Government to deliver on. He was in the government at that time, I was in opposition, and of course this is an amendment to that existing Bill and of course this policy does not only need legislative amendment, it

also has actions taken as we move, so for example right now, if I think about the work that has come out of this process, if I think about the Trauma Report that we use in our Health System, that Trauma Report which started in six hospitals, now is going to 20 – we are at 19 already – 20 of our hospitals to actually measure. This comes from this kind of work, and in actual fact it is very interesting to see how it is even going further through the Violence Prevention Programmes.

So we have taken the work from the previous term and that is also linked into the Safety Plan, and of course part of the Safety Plan is in violence prevention, which the Health Department is leading, and I am sure the Standing Committee will be getting a presentation quite soon on the data-led processes in violence prevention, of which the Trauma Report is part of.

So it is not only about the Amendment Bill and changes to our legislation, it is also about other actions that get taken that do not necessarily need a legislative amendment, but you can actually implement immediately, and those are the kind of things that have been happening over time, and there are a number of them, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. I now recognise the hon member Allen, following hon member Allen would be hon member Dugmore.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Hon Speaker, a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Is that a point of order?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Sorry, just my hand was up after hon member Reagan Allen.

The SPEAKER: May I recognise – there is a point of order in the House, so let me just first take the one in the Chamber. I will come back to that issue, hon member Mackenzie, shortly. Hon member Dugmore?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Just my point of my order. I would like to ask where the Chairperson of the Committee on the Premier is? Because he would normally be asking questions.

So it is clear that hon member ...[Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: I am here, hon member Dugmore. That is not a point of order, hon member Dugmore. [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mackenzie, you are not the Presiding Officer.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Sorry, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: So you do not get to tell the hon members when they are raising a point of order or not. Hon member Dugmore, that is certainly not



a point of order. So let me just say that whether he participates or he does not participate it is the prerogative of the member, but fortunately he is here.

May I then take your point of order, hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Hon Speaker, I do not think you saw my hand as well. My hand was also up.

The SPEAKER: Yes. It is certainly up and I was just giving the order of speakers. I indicated that it will be hon member Allen, followed by hon member Dugmore and then hon member Mackenzie, in that order, and then the Premier would be the last as he responds.

Now let us proceed, hon members. I now recognise the hon member Allen.

Mr R D ALLEN: Hon Speaker, thank you so much. To the Premier, Premier, through you, hon Speaker, as part of the Alcohol Harms Reduction Game-changer strategy, whether the Premier can highlight some reasons with regard to why the custodianship of the Liquor Act was transferred from the Department of Economic Development to the Department of Community Safety? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Allen. I now recognise the hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and to the hon member, thank you.

I think maybe I am going to link it to the question from the hon Leader of the Opposition, where he speaks about the regulation change in the amendment, but of course there were other things that happened as a result of looking at alcohol harms, looking at what we need to do around reduction, and what are those things that we can do without legislative change, of course really looking at the data and measuring and monitoring, and that was the one and maybe I will come back to that.

The second one, or another one of those areas was to say at the moment the, or at the time the body that was responsible for licensing for the work that they do, whether it be carrying out the inspections, etcetera, sat with Economic Development, and if we were looking at harms reduction, surely we should link it with looking at safety and the policing thereof rather than the economic side of it, and it was felt then that that was a good strategic move to then position the Liquor Authority not in the Economic Department, position it in the Department of Community Safety.

And so that is where it is now, I think that was a part of that plan, to say this a focus of this project of saying this is what we want to do is effect change, and so I think that was another one of those moves and it is interesting to see now, because now when you see the report backs coming

in, in Cabinet for example, when we have a report back from the Safety Report from Minister Fritz, who then alongside him is the South African Police Services, you have the Provincial Police Commissioner, but also in that report you have the CEO of the Liquor Authority, and then they would report on at this time COVID-19, the regulations, what we are doing about making sure that we are minimising risk, how many inspections there has been, making sure that they are playing that role, not only licensing but also the oversight role, the policing role with the liquor inspectors you would have seen.

Another part of that programme was increasing the number of liquor inspectors that we have in place.

So sure, I understand the position that is being raised here is where is the amendment to the Bill, but it is also not only about an amendment to the Bill, it is also about what are the other actions that you are taking as a government, and that was definitely one of them, and how you moved it from DEDAT to DCOS.

And perhaps also then to talk about the data and what I said now in the last presentation on violence prevention, and what it will be really good to see. So now we are able to monitor and we are expanding our data system that is not only a trauma case that ends up, and it has obviously been highlighted now during COVID-19 because you measure your trauma cases in this pandemic, and of course we have seen the blunt instruments and the

effect on the alcohol industry of these blunt instruments, but you have also seen how we have measured it, and it is used in the rest of the country. The National Minister of Health uses our system in the province.

We have just met with the National Minister of Health last week, myself and Minister Mbombo, and we took him through all of the programmes and the projects and we spoke about differentiated approach and how we become more nimble, especially as we move into a fourth and potential fifth wave with vaccinations, and this is one of those other tools that we use, which is as a result of this work that has happened. The violence prevention data that is coming out now, which at the end of the last presentation I was really excited to see that we are now not only saying that there is now an increase of 23% or 58% of trauma cases at a payday weekend, and of those 83% are linked to alcohol abuse.

It is now we can start to expand that date. So we want to know where did that alcohol abuse take place? What was the cause of the abuse? So we can start GIS mapping; whether it was a sharp object, or if it was linked to a GBV incident? Where did it happen? So were the EMS called out to collect somebody? That gets GIS mapped, it comes back into the data system, and that is really about becoming much smarter as a government, understanding the negatives and understanding that these are what we need to put in place to actually manage the system.

So for me, I think we have still got quite a way to go, but it is really nice

to see how the work that was happening in the last term is now starting to culminate into the drafting of an amendment, but also in activities and changes that take place within the Safety Plan linked to a number of departments in violence prevention, but also at the end of the day led not by DOCS in this case, but that is led by the Department of Health.

*[The Deputy speaker takes the Chair.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon member Dugmore, follow-up?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. As a follow-up I would like to ask the Premier that in regard to the second component of the question, about what steps were taken to implement it. I think it is clear that those steps would have included consultation. I am sure, hon Deputy Speaker, the Premier is aware of another question from another member which outlined 26 meetings which have taken place between MEC Maynier and the representatives of the Liquor Industry.

I would like to ask a very particular question. Whether the Premier is aware, in regard to that question about steps taken to implement and consultation, whether the Premier knows the former DA MP, Mr Toby Chance, who describes himself as having left Parliament in 2019 and being involved in entrepreneurial ventures, as well as consulting on business,

Government relations and policies.

In regard to implementation, I would like to ask the Premier directly, has he met Mr Toby Chance? Has Mr Toby Chance, as a lobbyist for the liquor industry and a former DA MP, met MEC Maynier and has Mr Toby Chance been involved in any of the 26 meetings that either the Premier has been part of or MEC Maynier has been part of? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. First of all, I do know Mr Toby Chance. I knew him when he was a Member of Parliament. I would imagine the last time I met with him could have been three years ago, maybe four years ago and the answer is no, I have not met with him in any liquor industry related meeting, and I do not know if Minister Maynier has met with him.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Hon Premier, the Western Cape Liquor Board requires an advocate for Alcohol Harms Reduction to be a member of the Western Cape Liquor Board and I just want to check if any other provinces have similar kinds of initiatives?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Premier. If hon Mackenzie, can you

just mention that last sentence of yours again.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: If any other province has similar kinds of initiatives?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If any other province has similar kinds of ...

The PREMIER: Sorry, Madam Deputy Speaker, I just wanted to get the first part of the question, it was ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: I can start again. The Western Cape Liquor Board, our Liquor Board in the province, requires an advocate for the Alcohol Harms Reduction strategy to be a member of the Western Cape Liquor Board and do any other provinces have such initiatives?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much and sorry I did not get the first part of that question. Alcohol Harms Reduction and the workshop and that process, you know, said that on a board – I believe strongly that you need to get right balances on boards and so the first part of it, the answer is yes, we must at least have one person who is linked to, or a specialist in Alcohol Harms. I know that on our board we do not just have one, we have two. As far as I know it is not a requirement on any other provincial liquor board and I do not

know if any other provincial board actually even has that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Any further follow-up questions? Thank you very much, that is done. We now move over to Question 2. I now recognise hon Minister Mitchell.

*Taxi industry disruptions*

**2. Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

With reference to disruptions in the taxi industry:

(a) What actions and initiatives has he undertaken to mitigate the recent disruptions in the taxi industry, (b) in which ways did the national Minister of Transport support the Western Cape in these matters and (c) how will all governments support the safety of taxi and bus commuters moving forward?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker and thank you to the hon member for the question. Hon Deputy Speaker, as per subsection a) of the question: I invoked my powers in terms of Section 91 of National Land Transport Act; a notice was published in the *Provincial Gazette* whereby it closed the ranks in Mbekweni, the loading zones in the Bellville public transport interchange and the B97 route which was identified as being one of the burning issues at the centre of the conflict



and violence.

I, in person, had numerous engagements with the parties involved in order to understand the issues and ultimately get the parties to agree to a ceasefire while underlying issues such as the dispute over Route B97 are being resolved through an arbitration process.

With regards to subsection b) of the question, the National Minister of Transport supported me in the initiatives to broker the ceasefire agreement and then ultimately joined me to sign the ceasefire agreement. I must put on record, Deputy Speaker, that I am grateful to the National Minister and his officials for the collaborative effort in this regard and for not politicising the issue, unlike some other political parties that – †soos hulle in Afrikaans sê mosterd na die maal opgedaag het. [as they say in Afrikaans, mustard after the meal.]

Subsection c) of the question: since the conflict started SAPS and law enforcement agencies assisted with safety and compliance operations. SAPS and law enforcement personnel, as well as the South African National Defence Force, have been deployed to the Bellville Transport Interchange and taxi violence hotspots to protect commuters. The Minister and the Department of Community Safety played a role in coordinating efforts with the South African Police Service and their watching briefs over the cases through the courts and following recent arrests made by the dedicated team of detectives that have been assigned to investigate taxi related crimes.

In addition to this, Deputy Speaker, the role of traffic and law enforcement agencies: the City of Cape Town and Drakenstein Municipalities were integral players in developing a transport contingency plan following the closure of Route B97, at ranks in Mbekweni and specific lanes at the Bellville Interchange.

Government departments have drawn lessons from the recent conflict and have identified areas of weakness that need to be addressed. Some of these lessons were already presented to the Standing Committee but in the interests of the House, I am going to just highlight a few but the detailed answer will be submitted for distribution.

Under the rule of law, from the Department of Transport and Public Works, investigations, arrests and convictions in cases of taxi related murders and crimes must be prioritised. We will investigate conflicts of interest and criminal records of all applicants for new operating licences. We will strengthen the dedicated resources to enforce and investigate public transport non-compliance and crimes.

Under the strengthening of public transport plans, we will review the supply and demand on key routes, which includes the long-distance routes. We will unbundle the networking operating licences; we are busy reviewing the description that would include an A and B point definition; we will ensure that proactive planning by municipalities for the new developments, through a transport impact assessment, happens and then also an assessment of

municipal capacity for planning development.

What is also important to note, Deputy Speaker, is that we need to empower commuters and communities and find ways to strengthen the commuters say in their modal preferences. Commuters must be provided with tools and Apps to assess and report service standards that will directly be linked to the operating licence renewal process.

Then, as I have stated in this House before, the regulatory framework review that will strengthen national legislation to address the non-compliance mandatory tracking and vehicle marking on all, as part of the operating licence conditions, and then legal action against associations and operators directly linked to violence.

We are also busy reviewing, as part of this regulatory framework, the Registrar's powers and allowable sanctions. Then under management of the facilities, which includes the public transport interchanges or taxi ranks, we are embarking on declaring enforced ranks and interchanges as gun free zones. We are considering decentralising ranks which will allow for remote holding areas, which will include pick-up points for specific routes, and then ultimately, Deputy Speaker, which is very important to me, is that how do we empower the minibus taxi industry? How do we formalise regional and route-based taxi companies; how do we register taxi driver's employees for capacity building and how do we provide taxi owners and companies with tools to monitor and manage vehicle and operations? Thank you, Deputy

Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. I recognise hon Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Deputy Speaker and thank you Minister for the comprehensive response. Hon Minister, as you know during the taxi industry disruptions, one of the bigger problems was the fact that people could not get transport and part of the big problem were trains. What has the impact been on the train system not functioning during these taxi disruptions?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thanks, Minister.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker and thank you to the hon member for the follow-up question. Deputy Speaker, I think it is important to note that 1,6% of citizens use the rail system. Now if you look at how it decreased from six hundred thousand people using it to just under two hundred thousand currently, it is a clear indication of what the state of rail has become. Rail used to be, Deputy Speaker, and should still be, the backbone of public transport in the city and the broader Cape functional region because rail provides the most efficient mass transit solution for high commuter volumes.

But sadly, it has been a long time since rail has provided this crucial service. The collapse of rail operations has meant that there are a few, if any,

alternative forms of public transport that commuters and learners can use with most turning to the minibus taxi industry and bus services. During the minibus taxi disruptions many commuters and learners were left stranded and were unable to get to and from work and school. People stood in long queues for hours and the impact on their livelihoods and the broader economy was dramatic. This further demonstrates, Deputy Speaker, how crucial it is to restore the rail system so that there is a safe, reliable and affordable mass transit mode that passengers can rely on. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Mvimbi?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Can you hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I can hear you loud and clear.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much and thank you very much to the Minister for the comprehensive response. He mentioned that in the process he met with quite a number of parties that were involved in the conflict that we experienced. I just wanted to check with the Minister: the other parties have mostly been taxi operators, in the form of their associations, but we have also learned in the process that other people were more affected by this, the commuters.

And then, I know that there were quite a number of other associations that

came up in the form of commuter associations, community-based organisations as well as non-governmental organisations. These associations played quite a pivotal role in trying to make sure that a solution was reached. I just want to check with the Minister, has he met with any of these community-based organisations, NGOs and even commuter related associations in the process of resolving the conflict and also is the Minister planning to create or have any future relationship with these entities?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Minister?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker and thank you to the hon member for the question. Yes, I had an engagement with the Chairperson of the Khayelitsha Development Forum. It was actually planned to have been a broader, bigger meeting but due to logistical reasons I only had a meeting with the Chairperson of the Khayelitsha Development Forum. Then, also, through Minister Meyer who heads the religious leaders engagement, we briefed the religious leaders in this province. As I have stated, my office is always open, and I am always willing to engage. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. I recognise hon Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, during the taxi disruptions there were extreme and frankly terrible violence and murders leading up to that point, over the last few months. Have there been any

prosecutions of individuals implicated in these crimes and has there been any feedback from the National Prosecuting Authority or the SAPS in this matter?  
Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Thank you to the hon member for the question. Hon Deputy Speaker, there has been total of 23 arrests since the recent violence started, nine of which took place from 1 August 2021; unfortunately, no prosecutions have been finalised yet. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any further hands?  
There is one last one. Over to you, hon Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Deputy Speaker and thank you Minister for that response. It is obviously quite sad that there have been no prosecutions but Minister when you implemented some of these well-timed regulations and what the law also allows you to do, what was the response from the formalised or the legal taxi associations when you finally took that step?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Deputy

Speaker, thank you hon Mackenzie for that follow-up. Hon Deputy Speaker, the fact that both the leadership of CATA and CODETA as well as the provincial SANTACO signed that ceasefire agreement with me and the National Minister, was a clear indication that the parties were willing to agree firstly, and secondly that they wanted to get back to work and that they agreed that the violence or the killings should stop.

With that being said, Deputy Speaker, while there is no formal feedback from CATA and CODETA at this stage, SANTACO Western Cape welcomed the interventions. Together with SANTACO, the National Executive Committee convened a meeting with CATA and CODETA on 12 August where it was agreed between them that a constitutional conference will be called where the issue of mother bodies, which is actually the core issue that we are dealing with, and the role of violence will be ventilated. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. That brings us to end of Question 2, we move over to Question 3. I now recognise Minister Bredell.

*Taxi industry disruptions*

**3. Ms N Makamba-Botya asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

With regard the 13,5% electricity tariff increase announced and implemented by the City of Cape Town against residents and ratepayers



in July:

What interventions were initiated by his Department in making sure that the City of Cape Town broadens its scope and resources to assist more people who cannot afford the ever-increasing electricity tariffs?

The MINISTER FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker and thank you for the question. The Department of Local Government monitors municipalities to ensure that they follow and operate within the required legislative prescripts. The Department is pleased that the City of Cape Town has followed and adhered to the legislative prescripts that govern electricity tariff increases in South Africa.

The City of Cape Town is leading the charge to diversify energy supply and to promote competitive pricing for consumers including protecting city suppliers or customers from Eskom load shedding as far as possible by, amongst others, using the Steenbras Hydro pump station; getting the Atlantis power station up and running by 2023 with plans for renewable energy hub at the Athlone power station; planning to procure at least 300 megawatts of energy from independent producers, including ongoing consultations with National Government to speed this up; pursuing a range of renewable energy projects from 1 megawatts to 10 megawatts to be owned and operated on municipal land or for proposals issued on low cost finance solutions over a period of 20 years.

The City provided more protection than all other metros against Eskom's steep price increases for the 21/22 financial year. The City managed to come in at 32% below the national increase to municipalities, 13,48% versus 17,8%. This is despite the fact that the cost to the City of Cape Town is 3% more to buy electricity than cities situated closer to Eskom generating plants in the North.

The City was able to absorb some of Eskom's increases by running a cost-efficient electricity service even with tight margins with increasing input costs. The City has indicated that all income from electricity sales goes towards to provision of services. This includes load shedding protection to City supplied customers where possible, and 80% of electricity outages fixed within three and a half hours. The City continues to offer help to struggling households including: 27% of City supplied Cape Town households get free basic electricity on the lifeline tariff, among the highest proportion of households for any metro in the country. Gauteng averages at 15,9% versus City of Cape Town, 27%; lowest commercial and residential rates of metros in South Africa, with Cape Town 25% lower than Johannesburg, and over two times lower than Ethekewini, based on the Cent in the Rand, a statutory measure to calculate property rates; R3,35 billion in rates relief for the 20/21/22 financial year, including R1,99 billion for indigent relief and R1,35 billion in rates rebates; R4 billion debt write off and payment incentives are available to aid struggling residents and foster a culture of payment; pensioners, disabled and indigent rebates as well as rebates for public benefit organisations.

In cases of debt recovery, limited deductions on prepaid electricity purchase only occur if there is no payment arrangement in place despite warnings and notifications, or if the terms of an existing arrangement not being honoured. City of Cape Town tariffs are among the lowest of all metros. Cape Town residents generally get more units compared to Johannesburg with tariffs amongst the lowest of all metros especially when you use less.

Cape Town is still R300 cheaper than Johannesburg for 600 units, including all fixed monthly costs and VAT: R1,634 versus R1,928. The subsidised lifeline electricity tariff is available to households with prepaid electricity metres using an average of less than 450 units per month, and a property value less than R400,000 or registered indigent, R7,000 or less monthly household gross income or registered for a disability or pension rebate, including rental tenants who would otherwise benefit from this property rebate.

On the lifeline tariff, households receive 60 units free electricity if consumption is less than 250 units per month; 25 units free electricity if consumption is greater than 250 units but less than 450 units per month; no fixed charges, a subsidised tariff of R1,64 per unit, including VAT, after free units and up to 350 units use; from 350 to 400 units average usage for this tariff, a normal block tariff rate of R3,32 per unit including VAT applies.

In terms of electricity substructure, it costs less for the first 600 units bought in each calendar month on the home use domestic tariff and less for the first

350 units on the lifeline tariff, including free units. This ‘use less pay less’ system generally helps lower tariffs for the majority of households in Cape Town with average monthly consumption levels generally at around 600 units or less for households on a home use or domestic tariff.

The City offers residents access to a range of support with advice, including: if you are in arrears make payment arrangements; if you qualify for indigent or pension assistance, approach the City. Large bulk electricity purchases are not cheaper. When buying in bulk one runs the risk of moving into a higher tariff category. Always buy only what you need for a calendar month and try to keep the usage below 600 units per month. Save electricity by turning the geyser to 60 degrees, showering instead of bathing; 80% less water and five times less electricity and using energy saving lightbulbs like LEDs. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Hon Makamba-Botya, your first chance to respond?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker and thank you to the Minister. I just want to find out from the Minister: since the City introduced what is known as the indigent support or rates review for people earning R7,500 or less, where they can qualify for a discount on electricity amongst other things; what I want to know is what has the Department done to assist the City financially in making sure that those who qualify for such relief get a greater discount and that the people who are applying are all

assisted? Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Minister?

MINISTER FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, I hope I understand the question correctly. We do not subsidise the City of Cape Town or give them any grants to help. The City of Cape Town, all municipalities, have got the right to generate income and within that they cost subsidise and they help the poorest of the poor.

They do get equitable share. Through that they also help but it is not that the Province gets involved within; we monitor it, see to it that they stick within the legal framework and then obviously if they are cheaper and if they can save costs, we are very happy and very glad to be part of that. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon van der Westhuizen?

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, Deputy Speaker and if there is a possibility of a second follow-up, I would appreciate that. Speaker, through you to Minister Bredell, while Eskom applied for tariff increases of 15% per annum for the next three years, Eskom remains in the news for all the wrong reasons, particularly with allegations of its supply chain management system being used to bankroll some connected to the ANC at the expense of the poor. My question is, how do the criteria for residents in Cape Town, to qualify for

the basket of free services available to the indigent, differ from that as proposed by National Government and does it mean that more needy Capetonians qualify for support than in ANC run municipalities? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister.

MINISTER FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker and thank you to the hon member for the question. Yes, obviously we are very proud that the City of Cape Town is one of the cheapest cities to live in and where there are national criteria, we also understand that some municipalities cannot get to that. Where we normally used to have 50 units of free electricity, 6 kilolitres of water etcetera, etcetera, the City provides more than the national average and also if you look at the total costs and especially the market that uses under 600 kilowatts, they save up to R300 a month and that is good news to them.

We do worry about the management within Eskom but having said that, we must also realise that there are good personnel within Eskom that are keeping the lights on, on a daily basis. As a Province, we do research with the universities and at a certain stage we will share that research with the Standing Committee. We call it a dignified basket and the question is actually what do you need to have a dignified life and if we work through that, we will need to find ways to increase the free electricity to households, especially the poorest of the poor, because in today's life, with the

technology needed to support children that are in schools with laptops and computers and to get all our cell phones up and running etcetera, even the 60 units needs to be worked on.

We do have research that shows we need to actually start working towards a more lenient system where we can increase that to plus minus 100 units but what we need to understand is that all municipalities' finances are now under huge threat; nothing is for free and it all boils down to mismanagement on a national level.

You can go back to Medupi and Kusile and the corruption within that and the cadre deployment within that, the looting within that. And then after they started Medupi, something like seven to nine days afterwards, a blow-up that will cost over R2 billion now. When the ANC is finished with that, I think it could go up to R10 billion. No-one knows. But it is mismanagement that puts huge pressure on the tariffs. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. I recognise hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Is the MEC aware and his response on third-party resellers of electricity, which the City of Cape Town provides bulk connection points to, for flats and other sectional titles who then install their own third-party electricity metres to measure and bill the individual units. This is against one of the by-laws of the City that protects the end user from additional charges when electricity is provided for by a

third party. Is he aware of that and what is his response to that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister?

MINISTER FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Deputy Speaker, I am not aware, and the member must understand those kinds of complaints will be dealt with by the City with their Electricity Department and obviously they will take legal action and deal with that. That is part of the discipline that is within the City. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise hon Herron. Unfortunately, hon van der Westhuizen you do not have another opportunity. Hon Herron?

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, the Minister has provided a very detailed response to the question around the electricity tariffs in the City of Cape Town and I am wondering if he has the same kind of detail for the municipalities and the rest of the province? Because the City has decided not to answer our questions so how is this question being answered in such detail if the City has decided it will not answer questions from Members of Parliament or is this decided, and the Minister is endorsing that it is just my questions that will not be answered?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister?



MINISTER FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, to hon Herron, the City has a legal opinion on questions where we do not have oversight over the City. The City is an independent government sphere and I think it is their right to take that up. I think it was a learning curve for all of us dealing with questions and I was of the opinion that maybe they are taking it a bit far, so we sought a senior advocate's opinion.

At the end of the day, we agree that the City is an independent government sphere and where I do not have jurisdiction to monitor them or we cannot force an answer out of them, that should be put directly to the City. You do have councillors within the Council Chamber that can pose those questions. So it is not us nitpicking but how are we going to answer questions going forward with the new Popia Act? These are legislative prescripts that we will need to adhere to, and I think the Legislature will respect that; that there are new rules etcetera.

With respect to the first part of hon Herron's question, I think it is very important we do research on the tax base of municipalities to compare to see what is going on within the market and how they deal with their customers. If you look at the property rates, I think we still need to and we are discussing it currently with municipalities, that we need a lot of work on that because from where I am sitting, I do not think it is fair that a municipality like Beaufort West's tariffs are three times higher than City of Cape Town for instance.

We must also understand that all municipalities' tariffs cannot be the same but obviously I want to roll that out now to the Services Department to see what they charge people. Electricity tariffs, hon Herron, can get very complex. It is a very lengthy spreadsheet but obviously we need to look after and protect the consumers and especially the poorest of the poor and therefore we have done a lot of research on the dignity basket, that people really need to have a dignified life and at any time I will talk to the Chairperson, they can invite the Department and the University to come and present that research because I think there is much to learn from that. Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. That brings us to the end of Question 3. Hon members, we have eight minutes left I am going to start the next question; we might only get through to one response, so I hand over now to Minister Fritz.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Deputy Speaker, I had my hand up.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, unfortunately there are only four opportunities and the four opportunities have been fulfilled, thank you. Over to Minister Fritz.

*Department of Community Safety: Safety Plan*

**4. Mr M Xego asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

With regard to a *Cape Argus* article titled “Second hijacked city vehicle recovered in Philippi” in which the City is reported to have classified Philippi as a carjacking hot spot:

What role is played by his Department under the so-called Safety Plan to eradicate these crime hot spots in the province?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Enkosi, good afternoon, as-salamu alaikum. Thank you, hon member for this question. I think one of the big issues that we have found now, hon member and the House, through you Speaker, is that many of our government cars, not only the City of Cape Town cars, but also government cars, are being targeted in the townships and there are very specific types of cars that are being targeted. Those are Avanzas that are used as taxis in many of the townships and so the one very specific question that you asked around the hijacking of cars and the City declared this area or that area as hotspot areas, that is so.

Then your second part of the question, what are we going to do about it and this is why we have, as a government, and I think the Premier spoke quite extensively today around the Safety Plan and the rollout of the Safety Plan and some sceptics will always remain sceptics and some of them want to become mayors, they will never understand that, I do not think they have even read a safety plan, they will always have their problems and their negativity.

But the majority of people are celebrating and welcoming the efforts that we are making in many of these areas that have never seen police at this level. Someone said to me yesterday on a WhatsApp, Deputy Speaker, they saw all these cars coming into Mitchells Plain, all these police and law enforcement cars of the City, led by the police and they asked what was happening? An operation, a LEAP operation was taking place, people saw it; the visibility was clear. So to answer the hon Xego, the Department has put in place several measures under the auspices of the Western Cape Safety Plan to eradicate crime hotspots in the Western Cape. And those are those hotspots that he speaks of.

The objective of the Western Cape Safety Plan is to halve the murder rate in the province over the next ten years via integrated law enforcement, social cohesion and urban design interventions. It is important to look at all of that because my hon friends want to become mayors; they just see law enforcement; they forget there are urban design components, there are social cohesion components that are very, very important because until we get that right we will never get far.

These interventions are always based on data and evidence hon Deputy Speaker, and are designed at addressing the challenge of violence historically because in many of our areas we have historical issues with violence, we have historical issues with how we settle scores, how we resolve disputes and I think the point about what we are making here is to deal with it almost historically and then the ANC, my hon friends, will say in a very organic,

dialectical process, their Marxist analysis, it is very interesting. The criteria used to identify hotspots is based on data sourced from the Department of Health and SAPS data.

Some of the most amazing data we get from Health and you heard what Premier earlier said in some of his answers, how the Department of Health is playing a role in terms of safety, how we determined how many people were stabbed from a particular hotspot area, Deputy Speaker, so that we know next time how we should align the forces for operational purposes in those areas; how many gunshots were fired in a particular hotspot area and how do we then align our human resources for active policing into those areas? I find it absolutely amazing. Some of us here on this platform will unfortunately not understand, will not comprehend because they call the stuff fake because they have no clue of it.

That data led information assists us in deployment, assists us in also looking at what other interventions other departments can do, that is when it becomes very, very important. The focus for implementation is in priority areas, using a geographical approach. There are 16 areas of which 11 are hotspots in this metro, with the other five in the districts, right through the province so that people cannot say that we only work in the metro, but we also have district areas. Just to give you a practical example: someone asked me on a radio show last night in a very practical way, in Worcester in that district of the Cape Winelands, Avian Park is the hotspot. There is only a small place in Worcester that is a hotspot, not the whole area of Worcester, just Avian Park.

So one can focus on that area to get the violence down and effect social interventions. The Philippi policing precinct is one and this is where the hon member asked the question. It is one of the identified areas where the implementation will be led by area-based teams that bring together national, provincial and local government.

Deputy Speaker, we are busy with some work around policing powers, and we have looked again at the Constitution of South Africa because for many years all of us just said and I am part of it, I am guilty of it. I cannot believe that we have not read the Constitution properly and looked at the power functions of policing within the Constitution. There are far more extensive policing powers that have devolved to the Province within the Constitution, not something that we want to go and create. That is there and you must just read properly and interpret properly, and I tell you we are very excited to be taking that on specifically as many of those powers are vested within me as the MEC in this Province.

So I want to alert the House that you are going to have excitement, you are going to have real raucous debates around some of the stuff and I hope you will go and read your Constitution. I will give some lessons online and invite some of the members to join me so that we can prepare for online debates on constitutional law.

Hon Deputy Speaker, we also work with non-governmental organisations. Our Neighbourhood Watches are one of our best community-based safety

structures. They really work well. Our CPFs, specifically – I just want to remind people, that there are only four CPFs in this whole province who have not had their AGMs because of political issues, but we are always accused of not dealing with the CPFs. Most of the CPFs have their AGMs and we are very, very proud of that. Those are the community organisations that will assist, hon Xego, with solving problems in hot spot areas ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister.

MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY: Sorry, Madam Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The time is almost up, if you could just finish off your sentence and we will have to end the question.

MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY: I have got four paragraphs still to go. Okay I think hon Deputy Speaker, I will stop at that. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. That does bring us to the end of time for questions. Thank you to everyone and apologies we cannot do any follow-ups. We will now move over to Statements. I now recognise the DA.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Deputy Speaker, the latest Quarterly Labour Force Survey confirmed what we all know: the ANC is killing jobs and creating levels of unemployment never seen before in our country's

history. Meanwhile the Western Cape is the jobs province. We still hold the lowest unemployment rate, and our residents stand the best chance of meaningful work across the country. But our challenge is that we do not have a partner in creating jobs from National Government. In fact, we have an adversary which blocks and denies jobs.

The Standing Committee on Agriculture learned earlier this week that even primary agriculture, which until now has been a shining light in terms of job creation, shed tens of thousands of jobs over the past year. This despite bumper crops being implemented in many of our most labour-intensive agriculture sectors. Unfortunately, National Government is dead set on continuing its path of economic destruction with eventual debates such as expropriation without compensation.

During the briefing it was also revealed that many of the new small-scale farmers cannot adhere to the prescribed minimum wages. This is a direct result of these job creators being unable to raise funding due to the 30-year lease programmes that are not providing security when they apply for capital loans at banking institutions.

Instead of killing jobs and forcing more people to turn to SASSA lines, the ANC should follow the Western Cape Government's example. Over four years, the Department of Agriculture supported 20 reform projects which helped small scale farmers to grow deciduous fruit, amongst others. Speaker, today there are 514 permanent jobs created, providing dignity to our



communities. I plead with the Leader of the Official Opposition in this House, please join us in stopping your party from preventing South Africa's economic potential from being realised. This country ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ... is well endowed with wonderful people and huge mineral riches. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise the ANC. Before the ANC begins, if I can just ask hon Nkondlo; I think that is an old hand, if you could just lower your hand. Yes, it is, hon Nkondlo's hand has been up for a while. Hon Sayed, is that you? Yes, you may, thank you very much.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. The African National Congress is often inundated by members of the public coming to us with allegations of corruption at our schools in the Western Cape and the DA's refusal to address these allegations. Corruption and maladministration by those entrusted to lead our schools deprives our learners of a quality education and a meaningful future. This past Tuesday the Public Service Commission told this Legislature's Education Committee that at Mowbray's Rhodes High School, the bursar was found guilty of fraud and misappropriation of school funds, whilst their principal embezzled over half a million Rands from the school's trust fund which was never approved

by the governing body.

The report also found the principal guilty of nepotism by appointing his unqualified son for a position at the school. Despite this, the Education Department allowed the principal to retire without any fuss.

The Department was negligent in its supervisory and oversight duties and did not institute proper controls to detect any of the fraudulent activities at the school. Moreover, the Department failed in its duty to investigate complaints about financial irregularities. Sadly, Deputy Speaker, learners and parents to this day are suffering as a result of the financial loss caused by this looting. The school has since had to increase its fees.

The Department's atrocious control measures were actually highlighted by the Auditor-General's successive reports since the 2018/2019 Annual Report. In fact, the PCS told us on Tuesday, in no uncertain terms, that the Department's report on the allegation sought to mask the corruption, and administrative rot at Rhodes High School. If MEC Schäfer does not release the full forensic report into allegations of corruption at Golden Grove Primary School, which I raised in this House, not the ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... cover up that I was given. We will ask the PSC to review and to investigate the allegations at Golden Grove as they

have done with Rhodes ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We are not going to let these matters rest ... [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... and we call for a full forensic investigation ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... into the financial affairs at Rhodes High.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We demand the Department [Inaudible.] ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... your time is up.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... against the principal and that the

funds are recuperated. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, you were way over your time. I recognise the EFF. Please hon members, if you can just respect the time. Thank you. You may begin.

Mr M XEGO (EFF): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. The EFF is not shocked by the recently released crime statistics which continue to place the Western Cape as the epicentre of crime. In the latest statistics, contact crime in the province has increased by 50% and sexual related crime has by 74%. All this happened despite the province wasting millions of Rands on the so-called Safety Plan which has not yielded any results since its inception and will continue to do as such.

An increase in sexual related crimes also shows that the Province cannot protect the women of the province who remain at the mercy of the gender-based violence perpetrators. It is high time that the people of the Western Cape stand up and realise that there is no leadership in the province as marauding gangs and criminals rule this province with impunity.

In the Western Cape we are often told that the Safety Plan is an inter-departmental initiative in which all departments in the province play a part. So the increase in the crime means that each and every department is useless so far as their contribution is concerned and in actual fact, they do not know what they are doing. The recent taxi wars and incidents were the final nail in

the coffin exposing how the province cannot resolve disputes which ended up leading to fatalities and placing the rest of society in danger. The DA-led Government must just admit that it has failed and must immediately relinquish power. Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the DA.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Hon Deputy Speaker, I want to recognise and thank the many residents who have made use of their vaccine opportunities. They play an important role in helping us beat COVID-19, save lives, jobs and secure a free future. This past Saturday I received a message from my daughter: 'I got my vaccine; I want to live a full life.' – with all the emojis one could find.

One cannot be prouder for being an influence on even one person who chooses life when considering the massive implications of COVID-19 on the youth. Soon we will reach the 2 million mark on jabs administered in the Cape. The Provincial Government and municipalities are scaling up efforts at centres daily. Last week, the City's mobile site reached almost 2 000 residents and we are still the only province with a dedicated effort to vaccinate the homeless, the most vulnerable residents.

Deputy Speaker, yesterday during our unannounced Health Committee visit to the Breede Valley, we were privileged to be guided by a pregnant Sister

France at Worcester CDC, diligently attending to patients. The sister displayed the true sense of a passionate healthcare worker, executing her daily tasks with dignity, a woman who carrying a new life, not for a moment shies away from the care for those in need. Deputy Speaker, there is still life within COVID-19 and the uptake of vaccines are our lifelines.

The WHO describes vaccine hesitancy as a delay in acceptance or refusal of vaccines despite availability and so I commend the uptake thus far amongst young people and women in particular. My party's campaign to get vaxxed is testament to this and those who continue to share correct and reliable information and encourage others. Vaccine hesitancy requires us all to share the right information. Let us rather choose life; let us choose a better future and let us choose to get vaxxed. I thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Herron, party of GOOD, sorry. Well, it is hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: It is hon Herron, yes. I have no statement to make thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, apologies about that. The ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, tomorrow we will hear from the Constitutional Court if the 20/21 Local Government elections will be postponed or not. This extraordinary

circumstance, founded by the Moseneke Commission, to postpone Local Government elections is important seeing that we are in the third wave and that people's livelihoods and lives are at risk. That is why the ACDP is guided by the concern, the empathy and clarity of visionary leadership and political maturity, hence we add our voice that the elections must be postponed until next year.

But, Deputy Speaker, it is sheer arrogance from the DA and this Western Cape Government to oppose the recommendations of the Moseneke Commission that calls for the postponement of Local Government elections. The Moseneke Commission did the research; they say it must be postponed. Now you get the arrogance of the DA and this Government to oppose that. The ACDP wants to know – the Western Cape Government is now a respondent in the matter – what is the predicted cost that will be spent by this Government in taking the matter to court?

This Government always complains about National Government's wasteful expenditure and maladministration and rightly so. This Government always complains about there not being enough money to render service delivery, rightly so, but what business does this Government have to join with the DA in a court case? The question is who is funding this? Is the DA spending money on this court case or are this Provincial Government and MEC Anton Bredell paying towards this court case?

The public must know because this is taxpayer's money. This money can be

used for something else because this Government always looks for money and now they are throwing money away. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the ANC.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. The ANC takes this opportunity to commend our National ANC-led Government for their commitment to land restitution, land redistribution and security of tenure. We wish to note that President Ramaphosa has articulated how colonial and apartheid land dispossession is in fact the original sin in our country. Secondly, that the efforts to address this original sin and the process to complete both the Expropriation Bill and to amend Section 25 of the Constitution, so as to ensure better tools to expropriate land – and I must emphasise – if needs be without compensation for land reform, continues at a national level.

On the other hand, the DA in this province has made it clear that it does not want to support land reform and that it wants to protect the current domination by the white population of our province of practically all agricultural land. This is simply unsustainable. The DA is unashamedly the protector of privilege.

The Western Cape African Farmers Association has come out to question the Provincial Government's commitment to transforming the agricultural sector, noted by Ismail Motala, and he says we cannot have an Agricultural



Department that is purely a conduit for the distribution of the CASP Support Programme funding, which is in fact from National Government.

Mr Motala says that these funds made available by the ANC-led Government are simply all that the Provincial Department is doing and they are not interested in actually transforming this sector. The ANC commends our National Government for ensuring that the question of land is addressed. This programme, Deputy Speaker, will continue in this province. In spite of the DA, we will give leadership and engage communities and municipalities on a land identification and release programme and in this regard, we will meet organised agriculture, as the ANC, as well as farm workers and the organisations that represent them. I so move.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much for being on time. I now recognise the DA.

Mr R I ALLEN: Deputy Speaker, the National Police Minister has tried to explain away the double digit increase in crime as a result of budgetary constraints, and bizarrely, the crime holiday due to the hard lockdown. This is his response to the first quarterly crime stats from 1 April to the end of June 2021. It is extremely dangerous, Deputy Speaker, to attribute the fluctuation of statistics to criminals taking a break.

The ANC at the Union Buildings is effectively telling us that they have no control over crime unless criminals take a break, or the President places us

all under house arrest.

Deputy Speaker, it is unacceptable to blame budget cuts when our National Government last year bailed out SAA to the tune of R10,5 billion, a bail-out that was funded by cutting the budget to SAPS, the courts and prosecuting authorities. Deputy Speaker, although SAPS is a national competency, this week our Committee on Community Safety was briefed by the Department of Community Safety on the Western Cape's Recovery Safety Plan.

The EFF was indeed present in this Committee, Deputy Speaker, where it was revealed that interventions by the Safety Plan have improved the recovery rate of illegal firearms by 372%. This was achieved despite the nationally imposed budget constraints on the Province. But this data shows us, Deputy Speaker, that our safety efforts are working and that when we have collaboration with all policing agencies, including SAPS, we can achieve so much more to keep our community safe.

Deputy Speaker, in clamping down on illegal firearms we can prevent weapons from landing back in the hands of criminals. Stats have shown that 62% of homicides here in the province are related to shootings, so what next Deputy Speaker? We need the National Minister of Police to get his house in order to match the efforts of the Western Cape Government and to support overburdened officers and detectives here in the Western Cape and critically to fix the broken system so that the illegal guns can be destroyed. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, I now recognise the Freedom Front Plus. No? Okay, we will move over to Al Jama-Ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, agriculture is one of the most important industries as it is responsible for feeding the world and to be a step ahead, to meet the ever-growing demands for food.

In November 2020, the National Minister of Basic Education, Angie Motshekga, published a new curriculum policy document for public comment, which will introduce several new subjects at schools. The thirteen new subjects will be for grades 8 and 9 learners who will not necessarily complete grade 12 or enter university. The proposed subjects include agriculture, art, and other technology subjects.

In November last year, the WCED confirmed that the Department could not account for 114 588 learners and principals throughout the Province raised concerns over dropouts. The United Nations World Food Programme has also recognised the need to increase opportunities for students to enter the agricultural industries and for learners to make a success out of a career in the agricultural industry. They must be prepared at primary school level. The Department should encourage all schools to have food gardens, to offer basic training in management skills for the food gardens and create an awareness on the agricultural industry.

We call on the Department to liaise with National, to speed up the implementation of the new curriculum, also to liaise agricultural institutions like Elsenburg Agricultural Training Institute in Stellenbosch, to consider the intake of grade 8, 9, 10, 11 and school-leavers interested in pursuing a career in the agricultural industry. Not only will they learn farming, but also be skilled for sustainable employment or start their own farming businesses. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member, I now recognise the DA.

Ms L J BOTHA (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, three years ago a report by Corruption Watch indicated that maladministration and the misuse of funds at schools are becoming a growing concern. Of the 5 000 complaints received, 750 schools nationwide were accused of such acts. The National Department welcomed the release of this report and committed to elevate these issues. But we know all too well, hon Deputy Speaker, that South Africa is plagued with ANC-sponsored corruption in the public sector, of which basic services are the victim.

Hon Deputy Speaker, this week the Standing Committee met to discuss actions taken by the WCED to address such cases. I commend the WCED's food cooperation with the Public Service Commissioner and its recommendations, but more so it is undertaking additional measures to see no further cases in the Western Cape, this includes training, all new elected

SGBs on fraud and corruption awareness, identification and safe reporting mechanisms, and appropriate responses, financial management training and ensuring the SGBs declare personal interest in particular.

But hon Deputy Speaker, there is a tremendous concern. Why is it only the Western Cape that complies with the PSC? Where are provincial PSC officers when schools in the Eastern Cape still have pit latrines? Where are they when there are no roofs over the heads for learners and teachers elsewhere? It cannot be only the Western Cape that sets new benchmarks. We need all education departments on board. Learners all over South Africa deserve so much more.

Hon Deputy Speaker, we have had enough talk-shops on rooting out corruption. I commend the WCED for their efforts to make sure we recover and address concerns, but we are in need of deliberate and urgent intervention from National Government, to put an end to maladministration of the public purse. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. That brings us to the end of Statements. In terms of Rule 145(6), I need now give one of the Members of the Executive an opportunity to respond to Member Statements for not more than 5 minutes collectively. No? There, I do see a hand. I see Minister Schäfer. Over to you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thanks very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I

need to respond first of all to the statement by hon Sayed who once again is trying to grandstand, but doesn't seem to quite understand processes in government or in the criminal justice system.

First of all, the DA does not investigate. The DA is a political party and we are in government here so, we observe the separation of party and state. I know that is a difficult concept for the ANC to understand, but we do that. So, the DA does not investigate anything in government, we investigate things within our political party. But the DA government certainly does investigate and we did, as we told the Standing Committee on Tuesday, that we did, in fact, investigate Rhodes High and there was absolutely no attempt to whitewash anything.

I do understand also and thank you very much, hon Botha, for your statement. I have yet to the PSC engage in this kind of a robust engagement at Standing Committees of other provinces and I really would like to see that happen as well. But it is not correct that we did not do it, it is not correct we tried to whitewash. We did take actions. The Governing Body at the time, implemented recommendations that we had given them. Last year, we have already reported this action to the police. There is a case number from last year.

The other thing that hon Sayed does not seem to understand is we cannot tell people that they may not retire or resign. If they decide to resign or retire, then we cannot sit and put them in chains, and keep them at a school so that

we can take action against them. And if we are not the employer, we have not got the ability to take action against them in the Department. So, a criminal matter has been laid.

As far as the Golden Grove, well unfortunately Mr Gesante Bader from the so-called Independent Media, independent newspapers previously, has unfortunately chosen to collaborate with somebody who is not able to actually formulate a question properly for a prior application. [Interjections.] So, if you put your prior application in properly via this Deputy Speaker, then there will be a report that you actually want, but if you ask for a report from WCED and it was not a report of the WCED, then unfortunately, we have to comply with the law and give what you ask for. So, if you want a report of the Forensic Services, then please ask for it and you will get it. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, I recognise hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, to member Christians, I think, *ja*, I get your statement. Let me just respond. First of all, the Commission under the leadership of Judge Moseneke, the terms of reference were never to determine an election date, first of all. Secondly, we as government, need to protect the constitution at all cost and this is why we have decided to oppose because from where I am

sitting, the Constitutional Court serves also under the Constitution and they do not have the authority to change the Constitution.

Can you think in future, if a court can change the Constitution? If you want to shift and change the election date, it must go back to Parliament. That is our argument and we think it is the right thing to do to protect the public and the public interest.

To hon Van der Westhuizen, thank you very much to touch the subject of agriculture. Food security is very important in this country and to build the agriculture industry under the ...[audio distortion] every year more and more to support upcoming farmers, to support the agriculture industry when the ANC cadres want to throw out a farmer in Darling because of his skin colour, it was Dr Ivan Meyer who stepped in to protect that farmer.

I find it odd and ingenious that hon Dugmore is standing up here and tried to defend, and come up with new agriculture programmes. They must tell us where in this country have the ANC succeeded with any agriculture programmes, and you will not find it. Go to the Free State. It is one big bankrupt nest where they loot the State even more. If you look at Rural Development and Land Reform, it is full of ANC cadres. The only prize you can give them is they are the most useless of all the useless departments within this country. It is the only prize they can get, and they must go and start to look at all the land that they own currently, and they do not pay any taxes to municipalities. That is another thing that the ANC needs to look at,



but they will not because they want to defend looting by all costs.

So, it is very ingenious of the hon Dugmore to stand up here and to brag about nothing, actually. The hon Dr Ivan Meyer and the Department of Agriculture do their utmost best in very difficult circumstances to see that there is food security in the future and to help our upcoming farmers, and we cannot say the same from the ANC government. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Ministers. We now move over to Notices of Motion. In terms of Rule 151, all Notices of Motion by members are required to be delivered to the Secretary for placing it on the Order Paper. These motions have been duly submitted and published on the Order Paper below the line.

### **MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the recent United Nations (UN) Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) report entitled *Climate change 2021: The physical science basis*, and the efforts and actions the Western Cape can take immediately and in the medium term to prevent a bleak and uncertain future.

*[Notice of motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

Mr G BRINKHUIS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the matter of bullying at schools, and whether the disciplinary actions taken against learners involved in bullying are effective.

*[Notice of motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: In terms of Rule 150, in terms of Motions without Notice, I would like to inform you that in terms of the Standing Rule of 150 pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolence and congratulatory were submitted to the Programming Authority prior to this plenary on 24 August 2021. Members are reminded that the Motions without Notice pertaining to congratulatory and condolence will not be allowed in this sitting and have not been processed by the Programming Authority.

I have been informed in the meeting on 24 August that political parties did submit the names of hon members in the desired order of speaking and who had wished to move a Motion without Notice in the sitting of this House. I will, therefore, just for noting and for the purpose of the Minutes, call out the hon members whose names have accordingly been submitted and approved. The following members' motions have been approved by the Programming Authority as follows: hon Botha, hon Christians, hon Baartman, hon Bans, hon Baartman, and hon Kama. I now put the motions duly submitted and

approved by the Programming Authority to the House.

## **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

Ms N D NKONDLO: I move without notice:

That the House notes that the ANC is concerned that the Department of Economic Development is not doing enough to support the upcoming entrepreneurs in the townships, as shown by the challenges experienced by the store operators under the Pick n Pay Market project, particularly the Nozinga Store in Gugulethu which was the very first store to be opened under the project in November 2017 and ceased to operate in February 2021; further notes that the current situation with the Nozinga store, is a clear indication that there is no political will from Western Cape government towards redress; and such has been demonstrated in many other areas like to reject BBBEE, not prioritizing localization policy, in their public procurement and no clear targeted approach for those that are historically disadvantaged, including the historical pressures associated with their lack of development to be brought in the mainstream economy; and calls for a Township Economy legislation and related Policy regime, and ask MEC Maynier to get notes from Gauteng Economic Development department to learn from their Township Economy Bill currently out for public comment.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Mr M XEGO: I move without notice:

That the House:

- (1) Condemn the illegal actions by the City of Cape Town in abusing its own powers by using law enforcement to evict homeless people occupying private land next to the Green Point Tennis courts.
- (2) The occupiers having been living in this private land for more than a year and the City has no business or right whatsoever to evict them.
- (3) This latest move by the City entrenches the already known fact that those running the City hate the poor, and will always go out of the way to use the City's resources for illegal and racist ends.
- (4) The EFF condemns these actions in the strongest of terms and calls for the City to learn to distinguish between government property and private property, and also to familiarise themselves with the anti-illegal eviction legislation since we are living in a democratic country and not an apartheid state.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House investigates the failure by the Western Cape Education Department to provide the promised transport for poor learners without any other means from the previous Iris Qwela Primary School in Orchard, to the newly opened De Doorns Primary School. These learners stay more than 5km away from school and are still at home since the reopening of schools.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: I move without notice:

That the House notes that while the unemployment rate has increased to its highest level in the Western Cape, the DA run City of Cape Town has moved to increase the electricity tariff which has caused widespread outrage with residents bemoaning the increase amid the pandemic, rising hunger levels and joblessness; further notes that poor people are now forced to make a choice between buying electricity or food; and join millions of Capetonians in rejecting these senseless tariff hikes.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections, agreed to. The motions will appear in the Minutes of the proceedings and in the Hansard, in each individual members' names as if that member had read them out aloud. I will now afford the opportunity to members to move Motions without Notice as per Standing Rule of 152(d). This could also include Motions without Notice that were not approved in the Programming Authority meeting. Members are reminded that the 30 minutes as per the Standing Rule, will start now. I recognise the hon member Lekker. She is not here? *Ja*, it was not approved. Okay, I am going to move over to hon Sayed. You are number 2.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with grave concern the numerous additional so-called courses, various workshops and many fraternal get-togethers for teachers and learners that are forced down at an extra payment which is placing a financial burden on teachers and on parents, and which is financially exclusive by its very nature and thus, entrenches the class divide between schools in our province; further notes that this builds an exclusive elitist superiority system within the State environment at great cost to teachers who are told to 'pay their way' and that this exploitation must stop immediately, starting with the Creative Arts Conference hosted by Rustenburg Girls Junior School in partnership with the Western Cape Education Department (WCED) tomorrow and Saturday, which should either be called off or attendance must be at no cost to

teachers. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: No.

Mr B N HERRON: Object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Sayed again.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that in Grassy Park the Stephen Road Primary School is without electricity for three months now, have trouble with water for two years, and boys and girls are forced to share toilets for many months due to a number of problems which the Western Cape Education Department does not address despite numerous calls; further notes that this is only one of a number of poor, struggling schools that

are struggling with these type of challenges and resolves that these problems at vulnerable schools be addressed as soon as possible. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: Object. The cables are stolen all the time.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections.

An HON MEMBER: They don't deal with the crime.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Noted, thank you, hon members. I now move over to hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes:



- (1) That it is now almost two years since the brutal murder of Uyinene Mrwetyana, a first year UCT student who was raped and killed in an inhumane manner.
- (2) Her death and that of many others who perished under similar circumstances remains a constant reminder that Gender-based Violence is an evil pandemic which we should all strive to defeat.
- (3) As a broader society we have allowed this evil deed to entrench itself and form part of our everyday lives for so long, without any real action to stop it.
- (4) It is now time to unite and join hands in fighting for the freedom and safety of our women and daughters. We have put our faith in public institutions and the legal systems of this country for so long and watched as they failed us as women. More needs to be done and it should all start with changing behaviour from men. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to. I now move on to Hon Nkondlo. Okay, hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I think she is having a technical problem. She did, *ja*, she did send a message to indicate.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, I will give her a little bit of an opportunity later.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thanks.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will then move over to hon Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House:

- (1) Condemns the move by the Western Cape Provincial Human Settlement Minister for celebrating a so-called decline in the land occupation within the Province, rather than providing residents with land and housing opportunities.
- (2) The Minister has made it his strategy to cut his allocated housing budget, build fewer houses, and blame everything on land occupiers.
- (3) The residents of Dunoon, Kosovo and many other informal settlements remain in congested areas because of the Provincial

Minster who promised to move them by July 2021.

- (4) The Minister must do an honourable thing and resign from his post as he knows himself that he has failed. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections to the motion being moved without notice. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise hon Xego again. Hon Xego, you have got a few, so if you can just go onto the next one?

Mr M XEGO: Sure, sure. Thanks, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House note:

- (1) The quarterly labour force survey of the second quarter of 2021 released on 24 August 2021 by Statistics South Africa.
- (2) According to the statistics, the number of unemployed people and

discouraged work-seekers have increased to 7,8 million and 3,3 million respectively.

- (3) In percentage terms, the South African unemployment has reached 34,4%, which is the highest unemployment rate recorded since Stats SA started collecting quarterly labour force surveys in 2008.
  
- (4) This grim picture portrayed by these stats is a constant reminder of a structural crisis created by colonial and apartheid regimes. The majority of black people, especially women, continue to be discriminated from spheres of economic participation even to this day, whilst our youth remain greatly disempowered with little to no economic opportunities as land and primary resources continue to be held by the minority white population. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House:

- (1) Condemns the increase in criminality which is within the Western Cape public schools where members of School Governing bodies and staff continue to misappropriate and mismanage school funds.
- (2) These funds form part of the resources which should enable schools to run better and respond to the needs of pupils.
- (3) Stealing of school resources by adults amounts to robbing school children of their education and a better future.
- (4) The majority of learners in public schools come from poor backgrounds and rely on these resources to equip themselves so that they can progress to tertiary institutions and later, endeavour in various career streams.
- (5) The Western Cape Education Department requires a better leadership which will be proactive when it comes to tackling commercial crimes in our schools. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes.

Ms L J BOTHA: I object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections, there are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Lekker, I do recognise you, but I will start with you again when I am done with the list. I now recognise hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and as a matter of principle, support the calls of the ANC to have Mark Boucher removed as the Head Coach of the South African National Cricket Team by Cricket South Africa. South African democracy is built on the principles of non-racialism. Mark Boucher is on record to have admitted to the racial acts he has committed as a player and he does not deserve to be part of South Africa's Cricket team that will represent this rainbow nation with an ugly past, as the very same inquiry into racism in this sport is still ongoing with disturbing revelations of how other South Africans have had to endure racism in

this beautiful sport under the democratic dispensation. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House:

- (1) Pledges the EFF's support to the Public Service workers who protested outside the Western Cape Provincial Legislature on 25 August 2021, demanding salary increases and better employment.
- (2) Our support also goes to Community Health Care workers who have worked hard since the beginning of the COVID-19 pandemic and continue to do so, even when the Provincial Department of Health refuse to absorb and allocate them permanent positions.

- (3) Their plight is that of the proletariat workers who continued to be let down by the system which alienate themselves from themselves deliberately, so as they can produce for others in exchange for little to no pay.
- (4) We will continue to support these workers as the EFF, with the promise that victory is certain even in the face of oppression. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: Object, yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Sayed, are you done? You have got a few written here. Okay, then I recognise Hon Nkondlo. Hon Nkondlo, are you still stuck? I am then going to move over to hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. My apologies for



the problem I encountered earlier on. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates former Cabinet Minister, anti-apartheid stalwart and gender activist, Nosiviwe Mapisa-Nqakula, who is the newly elected seventh Speaker of our democratic National Assembly. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Object.

Ms L J BOTHA: Object.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Object, absolutely.

HON MEMBERS: Object! Object!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: This is great.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Sayed, can I just confirm: I have got three more here of yours. No more? Okay, those are done and then I recognise one more chance for hon

Nkondlo. Your chance is now or we shall close the session. No? Going, going, gone. That concludes Motions without Notice. Thank you, hon members, that concludes the business for the day. The Secretary will now end the meeting and all the members will be exited from this sitting. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17.30