
THURSDAY, 26 MAY 2022

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The SPEAKER: You may all be seated. Order, hon members! Your Excellency, the Premier of the Western Cape Province, the leaders of political parties, distinguished guests, ladies and gentlemen. We are in a hybrid session. As you all know with the hybrid sessions, we are now experts as this Parliament, because since the beginning of COVID-19 in 2020 we have on record succeeded in posting our sessions, so I want to request the hon members to remain circumspect of the instruments that guide these hybrid sessions. The hon members who are connected virtually, and those hon members who are here with me in the Chamber, if you are here in the Chamber, please do not connect to the sitting, to the session

virtually.

Leave your electronic device because you are already here in the meeting but for the hon members who are connected virtually, please if you have any point that you want to raise, you want to participate in one form or the other, kindly indicate by a show of hand using your device, failing which you must indicate in the chat room. You will be recognised by the Presiding Officer.

I also need to implore those who join us like the members of the media, you are welcome to be here with us, but kindly observe the Rules of this House, that if you are a guest you do not participate in the proceedings, therefore do not activate your microphone. Do not activate your microphone and do not activate your camera. You are here as a guest and we really appreciate having guests in this Parliament, but you do not participate.

I also need to indicate to the hon members translation services are available on all four official languages in this province. You know, the sign language is also there, and it has been there all the time, but equally all other three languages are there.

I am going to request at this point that the hon members in terms of the Order Paper, I will ask the Chief Whip to rise. I recognise the Chief Whip.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Mr Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 20(1), precedence be given to the Questions to the Premier without Notice; and then secondly also in regard to the question posed to Minister Maynier, that that question stands over to the next sitting. The member who has posed the question has been informed that the Minister is not in the House due to ill health. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Madam Chief Whip. That was your debut address to the House as the Chief Whip. Hon members, please join me congratulating hon Lorraine Botha as the Chief Whip of the Democratic Alliance. Congratulations, Madam.

Hon members, in terms of the list before me, I have the following members. Let me just request the members, are there any objections to the motion raised by the Chief Whip? No objection? Agreed to.

I have hon Brinkhuis, hon Kama, hon Mackenzie, hon August, hon Christians, hon Plato, hon Marais in that order. You will know that you have two follow-ups, hon members, and I would like to request that the follow-ups be linked to the original question or to the response by the hon

Premier. In that way we will be consistent with the Rules.

I recognise the hon member Brinkhuis.

QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr G BRINKHUIS: †As-salāmu ‘alaykum wa-raḥmatu -llāhi wa-barakātuh Bismillah-ir-Rahman-ir-Rahim. [May the peace, mercy and blessings of Allah be with you.]

Hon Speaker, hon Premier, of course you are aware of the increasing crime rate in the province, and I am specifically referring to the recent abductions of women, young girls and children on the Cape Flats. The increasing abuse of women and children and other criminal activities such as gangsterism, drug abuse [Inaudible – audio distorted.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Brinkhuis, it is not... [Inaudible.] There is a problem. Let us see what the problems there are. Are you sorting that? Let us try again, hon Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you very much, Speaker. Hon Premier, we are aware of other toll-free crime stop numbers and help lines for gender-based violence, but these are not very effective. What we need is a hotline. What we need is a hotline where a woman can phone for help in case of abuse and this hotline must be backed up with an immediate armed

response. Hon Premier, will you establish such a much-needed hotline, with strong armed response to the women's call for help? An armed response, Premier, an armed response is better than our army.

No other Premier has done this before. It will leave you a great legacy, hon Premier, and I will make a special *du'ā'*. I will make a special *du'ā'* for you if you do this. Thank you very much, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Brinkhuis. I recognise the Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Speaker, and to the hon Brinkhuis. I want to thank him. I suppose it was a question and I think on the face of it, I think being responsive is one of the values of our Government. I think that sounds like a good suggestion. Obviously then my brain goes to how would we implement it across the length and breadth of this province, but it also brings me to the launch of our Safety Dashboard today. Perhaps what we need to do is align it to that dashboard so at least in the hotspots we create some kind of reaction.

I must say that gender-based violence, especially for me, is in a new kind of area in my thinking because of what I have had to deal with personally in the last while, so I think it is a good suggestion and I will definitely take that suggestion, engage with the Minister, Minister Reagen Allen, and say what is it that we can do because I think we really need to look at how we innovate, how we show the citizens of this province that we care,

especially, you spoke about general crime, you spoke about abduction. Quite frankly, I think the Pink Ladies System, I must give them credit, how their system is really innovative and works so well, but we need to learn, we need to innovate, we need to be reactive and I take that on board, absolutely, and we will engage with him. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Premier. Any follow-ups, hon Brinkhuis?

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you, Speaker. No follow-ups. Thank you very much, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Brinkhuis. I am going to ask some help here of my Temporary Chairperson, are you able to help here, please? Hon members, I now recognise hon Kama.

[The Temporary Chairperson takes the Chair.]

Mr M KAMA: Thank you. Thank you very much, hon Speaker. To the hon Premier through you, hon Speaker. I think in November 2020, the South African Police and the Ethekewini Municipality launched the Integrated Safer Cities Concept, which was a new crime-fighting initiative to strengthen efforts to fight crime in cities. The Safer City Model is also a form of cooperation across all spheres of government, business, the NGO sector, and community-based structures in the fight against crime and that was meant to be piloted around ten municipalities in the country. I

therefore want to ask the Premier, hon Chair, that in line with the commitment you would have made on a number of occasions in this House and the assurances that his Government would explore any viable strategies in its integrated approach to fight crime and given the picture, which I think member Brinkhuis would have partly covered, and in particular now in violent crimes in the City of Cape Town, I want to understand from the Premier what will be the benefits of a successful implementation of this integrated approach of the Safer City Model across spheres in the province. Thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, on a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I rise on a point of order, hon Chair of the session and my greetings to you. I am apologising for interrupting the response that the Premier would be giving to the good question posed by hon Kama, but I just noticed, it is very early in the setting, normally when the Chair of the session leaves the Chamber, it is after an hour or half an hour. Here just after one question the Speaker has left, and you are chairing the session. It is a bit unusual. Even members of the public will find it unusual. I would like to know is there a reason perhaps as to why the Speaker has left and will the Speaker be returning? Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Sayed. That is not a point of order. Premier, please proceed.

The PREMIER: Thank you. Thank you very much, Chair, and to the hon Kama.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, hon Sayed, I have ruled on that matter.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, but surely we must at least be given some rationale as to what is behind this.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: It is not a point of order. You are only allowed to raise points of order, hon Sayed, but you are welcome to use other means, you can follow the Speaker if you want to engage with him. Thank you, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: I would imagine that one could have an urgent body break, but thank you very much. [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: On a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Is it hon Brinkhuis, oh sorry, online?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It is member Dugmore, Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Is that a point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please raise your point of order.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, Chairperson. Chairperson, I know that the matter of the Premier's absence in the House after he has finished his questions has been raised in this House, but what I want to ask you is, if you could please have my objection noted, all of us know that we have sessions of the Legislature, and even though the Legislature and the matter has been discussed at the Programming Committee, I think it is unacceptable. [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I believe it is unacceptable for the Premier not to be present in the House, and this is contributing to the fact that there is chaos, both in his Government as well as in this Legislature. So could you please... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I just want my concern registered and minuted in this meeting.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Hon Dugmore, please,

there is also the Rule of Anticipation. The Premier is still here so please, that is not a point of order. Premier, please proceed.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Order, Chair!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Is that a point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, I raised, I switched on my mic and my point of order is based on what Khalid Sayed then asked about it, and in your response, Chairperson, and following I would like to understand whether what you have just said to hon Sayed, was it parliamentary and are you perhaps chasing him out?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No, the answer is no. Please Premier, proceed. No-no, please take your seat. Thank you, thank you Premier. Sorry, the Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, House Chair. I am just reminding my colleagues on the opposite end of Rule 66(D) if they can go and read it. You have ruled. Thanks.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, thank you, sustained. Premier. [Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: So, the Speaker has been chased out?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I did not hear that. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, just to indicate and I want to add on from the hon Lekker. There is no precedent for a member to be taken out of the House to go and follow the Speaker, just to put that [Inaudible.] I have no intention to go and follow the Speaker. What I want to know because we have seen what was out there in the media, the Speaker had his own press conference. [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Questioned... [Inaudible, speaking simultaneously.]. So really, the public needs to know.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed, you are only allowed to raise points of order, but you have not done.

Mr P MARRAN: Speaker?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

Mr P MARRAN: Chair, there is a strange noise coming out from the Chambers, we cannot hear clearly.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Marran, we will ask

ICT to attend to that. Thank you, Premier. You know you are not allowed to rise on repetitive points of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, I am raising an order based on what the Chief Whip of the DA has just said.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): The Chief Whip has raised Rule 66(B), saying you may not get considered if the Presiding Officer made a ruling on the matter in the same sitting. Now you did not rule on the fact that you were chasing hon Sayed on that aspect. Now I would want you to rule on the order that I have raised to you and not what the Chief Whip of the DA has just alluded to, because it has no grounds on what I have raised, hon Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Thank you, hon Lekker. Please do not read things which are not there, and I have sustained the Chief Whip's point of order. Thank you. Premier, please rise.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Are you sustaining me, Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: On grounds of the Rules.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): But you have not ruled on my point of order on you, so what Rule are you sustaining on that one?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Chief Whip of the Opposition, I did rule, and I ruled you out of order. Please take your seat.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please, we are not... [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): But you clearly do not understand the Rules Book.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): And I would advise you to go and familiarise yourself with the Rules Book.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. You are welcome to refer this matter to the Speaker. Thank you, afterwards. Premier, thank you. Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you, thank you very much and thank you to the hon Kama and the question that he raised is a very, very serious issue. It is about safety in our province, safety in our country. It is something that we take really seriously. That is why we have the Safety Plan and what he is talking about is safer cities and of course, even when I was the MEC in that position, that was when the first discussions were around safer cities,

we took part in those discussions. Obviously right now I am not in those discussions any further, but I know that the City is still involved in those discussions and of course, as far as the Safety Plan goes and as far as every comment you hear from Minister Allen, it is how we can, number one, work with the South African Police Services to make sure we build a safer society. We are absolutely committed to that, but we are also committed to making sure that we hold SAPS to account, and I would like to familiarise the hon Kama with a meeting that we had not so long ago, where we said “Please, we actually need even the Opposition parties’ help here. We need to make sure we get resources allocated specifically to those areas that are the hardest hit, where crime is the highest, where the murder rate is the highest and I think of late, unbelievable as to what is happening and what our citizens have to go through right now. I mean, it is just beyond comprehension how people have to live with crime the way that it is in our society.

Speaker, you know that if I think about what citizens live with right now, these are the kinds of messages I get in the middle of the night. If you listen to the gunfire, it is not even just gunfire, this is automatic gunfire that is in our communities.

[Cell phone audio clip played in background – gunfire]

This is how bad crime is and I promise you, I had a public meeting – this is at a school.

[Cell phone audio clip played in background – teacher speaking]

“... interval and then they flew into the classes, any child goes into any class now, because our gangster friends on the border of our school are busy shooting blindly.”

These are the kind of messages that we get from teachers who are trying to protect our schoolchildren who are running into the classrooms, they are shooting down in the street outside the school. This is unacceptable. We cannot live in a society like that. So what hon Kama is raising is absolutely critical.

How do we get more resources allocated to areas where the crime is out of control? Imagine what that is doing to the minds of those young learners in our province. What is being entrenched in their psyche? Are we setting them up for failure into the future? I say we are. It is unacceptable, that these are the levels of crime of violence. Six people shot in Manenberg just the other day; three people in Mitchells Plain; five people in Khayelitsha. This happens day after day after day and absolutely we got to find solutions.

I still believe that it should be devolution of power. I agree that the Minister should be fired. Minister Bheki Cele has done nothing for fighting crime in the last years for this province. It is unacceptable. We should be able to find ways that make it safe. Now that is why we put the

Safety Plan in place.

Today, we launched an amazing dashboard, a dashboard that shows how we are going to use evidence in deployment. Those of you have not seen it, please go and have a look at the YouTube or the Facebook Social video of that technology that our Health Department is putting together with our Community Safety Department and how we are bringing that data together to manage. Now imagine, instead of having a crime statistics history lesson that the Minister of Police is going to give us next time in Parliament, or next time he releases the historical crime statistics that we could get real time data like our dashboard is building. Then we can start to deploy before and that is why Minister Reagen Allen can say that in Kraaifontein, 40,5% decrease in criminal activity. That is why the Minister can say that Nyanga is no longer the murder capital of South Africa, because we are deploying on an evidence base using our data cleverly and of course, now we have to get in with the violence prevention programmes and really start to take that so that those young boys are actually got before they end up going into the gangs. They need to stay in school so that they become the risk taker in the economy, the entrepreneurs of the future. Thank you, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Kama. Before you get an opportunity for your first follow-up, I see there is a hand raised by hon Makamba-Botya. Is that on a point of order because the first follow-up question belongs to the original questioner?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: [No audible reply.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Makamba-Botya, you seem to be muted. Can we proceed to the first follow-up question? Over to you, hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: No, thank you very much, hon House Chair. The frustration now that one has is that if the Premier had not planned to showcase, maybe we would have received a response that speaks to the question that we asked rather than the grandstanding about what we know, because we live in those communities. But what I want to check because the Premier says, hon Chair, that he is aware, because since he has been an MEC, the talks about the Safe Safer City model were there and that is where the City is continuing to engage, and now what we are trying to get is a response to the crime that is happening. We understand all what is happening, the gunshots that are there, and now there is this issue of the Safer City Model which seeks to bring all these spheres of government and the particular sectors that we have been talking about. Now I want to understand because we are aware that in the City of Cape Town there has been a delay from since the project was launched in terms of implementation in the City of Cape Town and only now when there has been a change of administration in 2021, we see progress.

There has been about a 15-months delay in the implementation of the pilot in the City of Cape Town in terms of the Safer City Model, and we want to

understand what would have caused that particular delay in the implementation, and we believe that the Premier should know in line with the commitment that the Premier is making that he is a Premier that wants to ensure that Government works with everyone, to ensure that we deliver or at least we assure the safety of the people of the Western Cape. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. As far as the delay is concerned, I presume that the ANC and the Leader of the Opposition in the City would also be asking that question to get clarity. Of course, I do not want to give that answer from a thumb-suck point of view and absolutely, we need to find ways to bring down the crime rate. We believe we need extra deployment. I would also believe that we need control. That should be a better model and of course, the one thing that the ANC does not do, is they do not apply data and science and then say: “Hang on a second; we are probably doing the wrong thing here. Let us try something else.”

I would hope that the hon member would come to this House to say, “but what we have employed is the Safer City Concept in Gauteng, in Ethekewini, and what has happened is the crime rate has plummeted.”

Now of course when it comes to murder, we know that our per capita murder rate is high in the Western Cape, but the numbers of people

murdered in other provinces and number-wise is actually even more than in the Western Cape. So quite frankly, I am looking forward to seeing results from some of those programmes and, of course, if they show results we will work absolutely together to push for more coordination. We need to make sure that coordination works. I also would like the hon Kama to support us in calling for extra resources.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Premier.

Hon Sayed, just note that in terms of the Rules for hybrid sessions no interjections are allowed. Please respect the Rules. Hon Kama, you have an opportunity for a second follow-up.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, hon Marais, is that on a point of order?

Mr P J MARAIS: No.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No? It is Questions to the Premier and it is only the original. Thank you.

Mr M KAMA: No, thank you very much, House Chair, and hopefully the Premier would make one understand as to how now all of a sudden the

ANC did enter in this very important question that the Premier said it is, but I want to check now because the Premier is aware of the Safer City Model and leaves what the ANC somewhere else must do, where we are not involved but I want to understand with regard to the progress that has been made in the City of Cape Town in the piloting of the project, and I think even at Stellenbosch Municipality, Mossel Bay Municipality and Swartland, I think some of them had even volunteered to be part of that Safer City Model.

Now I want to understand through the Safety Plan of the Province what contribution are we making towards this successful implementation of this initiative and let us live the ANC and speak to what is important.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Kama and over to you, Premier.

The PREMIER: Just for clarity, I was talking about the Leader of the Opposition in the City, which happens to be an ANC member, and get them to ask for absolute clarity there, because that is where their questions should be asked. I welcome any success in this way because absolutely, we have to make sure that we find ways to make our country safer and of course, I am interested in making our province safer and I look forward to it. Our teams work together already. We sit in those joint operations and perhaps at a last point I want to say, through you Chair, to the PC, to the Provincial Commissioner, thank you very much for the way in which he

and his team work with us. We really do value that because we have to work together to build this safer region. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Premier. The next question belongs to hon R D Mackenzie. Hon Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon House Chairperson. My question to the Premier is actually around the current Census that is taking place and I just wanted to find out from the Premier, with regards to the Census being extended again to the 31st of May, what would the effect be on specifically crucial services such as health, education and social services if the Western Cape is undercounted?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Premier?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much to the hon member for that question. I want to say that, and I think I am on record to say that the Census is a critical tool for any government to make sure that we are planning correctly, make sure that we have the correct numbers to get our fair allocation of budget and that is why, as a government, we have engaged with Stats SA. If you remember a few weeks ago, in actual fact our count in this province was sitting in the 40%. I am very happy to announce that as of today, we are sitting at 77%. We have engaged. We actually have the Stats SA team in our extended Cabinet every second week now and we have a team in the Province that meets with Stats SA, because of the point

that I think the hon Mackenzie raises, what are the implications for us as a province. We already know that we have been fighting for years to say we want our fair share of the budget, how the division of revenue is done and quite frankly, that fair share is derived through a number and that number is how the citizens of this province of this country are apportioned by province, and so it gives us that tool, and quite frankly we know that our education system is under tremendous pressure from the number of learners versus the number of schools we are building; the number of – the same thing with health, the number of hospital spaces. It is a critical, critical question.

Of course, that is why we are so keen to work with Stats SA. That is why we call on the citizens of this province, please play your part in getting the numbers right, because then we have a proper set of data to put on the table when the division of revenue proportions are applied in South Africa.

I want to say that if we just look at our current numbers; our current number says that our population is to grow about 1,4 million people in the next eight years between now and 2030. 1,4 million people, in the City of Cape Town alone it is like Bloemfontein coming to Cape Town in eight years. We are building six schools a year at the moment, maybe seven. There are 186 schools I think in Bloemfontein. We are going to be building close to 50 schools between now and 2030, but if Bloemfontein is moving here we need to build 186 schools, or we have to innovate, find different ways of doing it. That is why this Census is so critical and that is on

education. What about healthcare? What about social development?

We have just spoken about the effects of crime on our citizens. What about just the social impact the mental wellbeing of our citizens that are affected by crime in this province every single day, how we need to correct allocation that we can actually put the correct measures in place to make sure that our citizens get the best opportunities they can. That is why Census 2022 is so critical and again, through this House and the members of this House, let us please try and make sure that every citizen gets counted.

Go online, welcome that counter into your home. Give them the detail that is needed. It is critical we get it right. Thank you Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon Mackenzie and members, unfortunately the 20 minutes allocated for Questions to the Premier have expired. Thank you very much, Premier, for responding to those questions. My apologies, time is not always on our side, hon Mackenzie.

Hon members, we will now deal with questions as printed on the Question Paper. Sorry, you are rising?

The PREMIER: Mr Chair, I rise on an answer to a point of order. I am not sure if I am able to.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You are not...

The PREMIER: The question was that I was going to leave directly after Questions. Is that correct, because I have a long-standing appointment but I promise you I will be online on route to that appointment, so I am not leaving the sitting of this House. Thank you, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Thank you, Premier and while you are out of order in what you have just said, you are very quick to take a gap.

Members, we will now deal with Questions as printed on the Question Paper. I wish to advise hon members that once the hon Minister has started to reply to the oral question as printed on the Question Paper, hon members must use the chat facility for this Sitting of the House to indicate that they want to ask a follow-up question. There are four opportunities for follow-up questions but the hon member who has posed the initial oral question, as printed on the Question Paper, will have the first opportunity for a follow-up question. Thereafter other hon members may then use the remaining opportunities to ask a follow-up question. I recognise the hon, the Minister Mbombo.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

[Question 1 stands over]

Health facilities: security

2. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Health and Wellness:

Whether her Department has plans to improve the security at health facilities to make staff, who work at health facilities and patients who attend health facilities, feel safer; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, House Chair. I am sorry I am unable to put on my camera. Thank you for the question, hon Christians.

The Department does have an approved security strategy because the question is about the safety. We have liaised with the Western Cape Department of Police Oversight and Community Safety for its standard operating procedures to guide hospital CEOs with the oversight and management of arms, South African Police officials who access our healthcare facilities, including the armed SAPS officials who are guarding patients requiring in-patient care.

We have already done the coordination with this same Department for the implementation of a provincial Memorandum of Agreement between SAPS, the Western Cape Provincial Commander and then also us. The MOA is to commit local resources for visibility and support of SAPS within our

health facilities. The implementation of complementary security measures such as the implementation of security technology to bolster the security of such deployment has also been part of this strategy going forward and we also have to keep on reviewing, which we are doing with the current CCTV installations at health facilities and reiteration of the procurement of CCTV systems on the approved tender, which has actually been happening – this one – since July 2021.

I must also indicate, House Chair, that the incident that happened in the new Somerset Hospital, the unfortunate incident, indeed, is just something that is not usual, because, as I indicated, I think there was a time though, about this question some time ago that it was only the policeman who had a gun and it was not a patient. So it has been an unfortunate incident, but we have to take lessons in regard to how people, who have guns, which are specifically the police officers who are on duty, how they are supposed to deal with these, how we are supposed to respond to these issues. Thank you, House Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, I recognise the hon member Christians who posed the question. You have a follow-up question, sir. Please proceed.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Chairperson, and thank you, Minister, for the answer. I think we all concerned about the safety of our nurses and also our patients visiting the hospital facilities. Just, Minister, I saw the

spokesperson of the Western Cape Health Department, Mark van der Heever, said that from April 2020 to March 2021 there were 996 incidents, and another concerning thing is the parking areas, nurses are sometimes – their cars are taken away according to this report and we know that cars have been damaged so I am glad that the Minister mentioned CCTV cameras, but a concerted effort, I think we are all worried about patients and nurses and just for nine months in the following year 857 cases were reported. So it is worrying and I am glad something is being done about it, but it is a major concern. Thank you, Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Minister. Before you respond, I recognise the next three follow-ups, hon Windvogel, hon Makamba-Botya and hon Philander, just so that they can prepare themselves. We listen to you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Yes, thank you, House Chair. Yes, indeed, member Christians, it is concerning for the people who are there to provide support and render health services to the communities and it is the communities themselves that are actually assaulting, because we are just talking about one incident. It is true indeed, staff, they will know that over the weekend, especially towards the end of the month, in some of the health facilities where there is a high level of alcohol and substance abuse, it is about where the patients come in or the escorts of the patients, they will not only be swearing at the staff; some of them even will end up taking their phones and so forth.

Similarly with the EMS, because it affects everyone; it affects everyone in noting that the health service platform becomes a microcosm of what is happening surrounding those societies. So it is about when there is a high level of crime, in that particular area, it means that it will have an impact on any other sectors.

If you get a situation where it is not about the schools, learners threatening the teachers or even bullying each other, it is also where you will find that even in the police stations in those areas, where in some stations you even have police stations that have got security that are being threatened. If it is not about the taxi violence, if it is not about the high level of gender-based violence, but now we are just coming from the Safety Plan Dashboard, showcasing dashboard, where we even show that there has been a high-level of assaults toward pregnant women, specifically in their second trimester, without even them reporting those cases to the police.

We have seen how children as young as below the age of two have been affected with violence, so we are living in a violent society and therefore people who are mostly vulnerable, such as the healthcare workers, because they are not armed, are coming face to face, head-to-head and toe-to-toe with some of these alleged perpetrators. So that is the kind of situation. We try as much as we can, but it becomes quite sad that we have to take money that is meant for rendering a service that is supposed to be adding more, to appoint more staff, but we have to put up high walls.

If you go to Wesbank Clinic, which is under the City, they even installed a two-metre wall that is bullet-proof. When you go into the gates, it is a whole thing about the zigzag with the backline and everything that is there. So it is really concerning. Thank you very much, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you Hon Minister. Hon Windvogel, I see you.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, House Chairperson. House Chairperson, my understanding of the question relates to staff safety concerns and which would lead to traumatic experience. It is for this reason that I want to ask the MEC about the number of reported safety and security incidents, which led to staff being traumatised, and how many cases, and what was the response of the Department? Thank you so much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: I do not have the figures with me in terms of how many staff have attended trauma counselling as part of the wellness within the departments or within their units and also those that will go to the Dot P.

I do not have that figure, but it is supposed to be somewhere there, but it was not part of this, but indeed, member Windvogel, the mere fact is that there is a high level of crime in those areas, as I have shown in examples.

It does impact on the staff. So that is why it is not only about staff going to the Metropolitan Wellness, but we have got localised occupational health and wellness within each and every area, some especially in the big facilities so that people can just go there. But surprisingly, in as much as there is a high-risk level of uncertainties, you cannot operate, it is difficult to operate in a surrounding where you do not know whether this patient will rob you of your phone.

Remember, there was a case in Hanover Park where we ended up having to close the other side of the EC because we only have the MOU there, an alternate of the City unit, where actually it was the patients themselves who were allowed, although there is a beep-beep when you enter the security area in case you are carrying any weapons, but they went there as patients, and then once they are inside, it was the people from outside on the other side of the wall, where they throw the weapons inside; they are supposed to be patients but they still rob the staff. It is that kind of a situation where you will find that they are exposed to the high-level pressures of having to render a service, but now they have to keep on looking on the other side just in case someone wants to assault and swear at all of them. But in terms of the information, I think I did respond to that information. There was a written reply. I am not sure if it was coming from you about the specifics, in regard to how many went for counselling and what type of counselling. Thank you, House Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, and the next person

recognised is that of hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: [No audible reply.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Makamba-Botya, I believe your microphone might be off. Can we proceed to the hon Philander and then come back to you, hon Makamba-Botya. Hon Philander.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Thank you very much, House Chair. House Chair, through you, Minister, you made mention of the review of the current CCTV installation at health facilities. Minister, if you can kindly, through you House Chair, just please give us an indication by when is this review expected to be completed and is it expected or anticipated that the Department will be procuring more CCTV systems in health facilities? Thank you, House Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, member Wendy. Yes, it is already happening because you review a CCTV, and then you have to upgrade accordingly, because we have already started this process as far as 2021 because you might have what you call the “red zone areas” based on our EMS response, and that they have to be accompanied. It also impacts on their stationed facilities that are in those areas, so therefore you will find that there are other area sub-facilities where you

have to install this CCTV. So we keep on upgrading each and every time that the level of crime is escalating in those areas, so it is happening. It started as far back as 2021 and if you look at the security budget, actually the previous financial year, we will spend almost about R373 million and we are not talking about other means of actually ensuring that there is staff safety, because I want to actually even acknowledge the Neighbourhood Watches, which costs I know are not embedded in this. Like for example, I am coming from Lotus River CDC, where the Clinic Committee consists mostly of the members of the Neighbourhood Watch, where, if there has been an unrest or protest or there has been some level of crime, like gunshots in the area, they will make sure maybe a night before or in the early hours of the morning, that there is a safe WhatsApp group with the staff where they will text and indicate to their facility manager that “ Ah, the coast is not clear yet, just wait a second until it is clear.” So there are many other multi-pronged approaches. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja, I am feeling it now.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Sorry, sorry, there is a noise, Chair, House Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Order please! Can we ask that the members that have unmuted themselves just mute themselves again? Minister Mbombo, would you like to finish?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Yes, yes, just to end, the MOA in regard to the point, the visibility of the police officers is still under discussion, because remember even the police are under pressure. So just like when you have to be there in the hotspot or red zone area that the ambulance has to go to via the police station to be escorted by the police, meaning you are taking your police to some of the work that they have to do. Just imagine now that we still have to expect some commitment, the visibility of the police in some of our areas. We can imagine that it will be a daunting task, but we have to see to it that we do as much whatever we could in order to protect the staff, but again, House Chair, through you, the whole of this happens, it starts outside the health system, outside the health services. When you have a situation where the shebeens do not close, there is a high level of gangsterism; there is a high level of the other forms of violence, whether it is in school and so forth, that it goes to all other sectors, and then it ends up even landing in our shores, which threatened the staff. So it is not that the violence started to happen at the health facilities, it is something that has been happening outside, which is supposed to be prevented, to have such a violent society, so that you protect these kind of areas because it is supposed to be a calm environment, it is supposed to be harmonious. It is supposed to be a healing space. I mean, the platform of the Health Services...but unfortunately, we are not operating in our own planet. We are operating in the same planet that we all share. So hence we absorb, and it becomes visible and then it becomes a whole public sympathy when it happens in a supposedly safer space like ours, like the health facilities. Thank you,

Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Makamba-Botya. Please try again. Let us see if you are audible.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: [No audible reply.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Apologies. We do not seem to be able to hear you. The next question is then from the hon McKenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon House Chair. When the Minister responded she talks about obviously the EMS areas and the red zoning.

My question would be to the Minister, given that security incidents not only take place at our health facilities, it takes place on the EMS, ambulances get robbed. We have seen an increase in those incidents. What would the Minister reckon the role of our community members should be, because we have seen in the Neighbourhood Watches as well, 90% of the people in the Neighbourhood Watches are women, in our Walking Bus members in most of our safety structures, so what would the Minister think our role of our community, particularly our men in our communities that do not participate in these structures, should be? We do not only protect the health facility, but our EMS services as well. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: As we keep on saying that health is everybody's business, I welcome the input from member Mackenzie, it is not necessarily that the response should only be coming from me. I will also welcome even the members of the House to make such an input. [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: I think what is crucial – it is about, as I indicated, when we enter those hospitals or those clinics as healthcare workers, we do not carry guns; we do not carry knives. The only weapon we have is our hands and also our knowledge, and also, of course, our hearts. So when now that kind of tools – those are the only tools that we have – ended up being disturbed where, like in the case of the New Somerset Hospital where Sister Seale – being an operations manager, night duty – now has to deal with a person who has got a gun.

Whilst we are skilled and trained with our psychiatry and all the other skills in negotiating with a difficult patient or with a mentally ill person or with misbehaviour, never in any of our curricula have we ever been told how to negotiate with a person with a gun. So some of these things just happen and then you have to make sure that you respond appropriately.

So that is why we are saying that that is why actually Health has got a Violence Prevention Unit because we say we cannot just be sitting when

you talk about the social ills and then we are the ones who receive the data because some people do not immediately go to the police station and report that, "I have just been stabbed," and all, because they do not even go. The first thing a person will do is go to the hospital and then get the wound dressed and the gauze applied and everything, and then do not bother to report.

So that is why we say that we are the ones who are filling all these pages and all of those. So therefore, let us make sure that we assist in generating the data so that we can share it with the relevant sector, the law enforcement officers, the police and everyone. Then secondly, the issue of the social [Inaudible.] as we know that with the issue of violence, especially in the different areas, some of it you will find that it goes, that is why in the presentation today by Dr Moodley from us, it is about looking at it from the life course approach. Do not only look at when Joanie, Gatiep or whomever at age 18 now has joined the gang and then wants to commit crime or being violent at the hospital but take it from that unborn child.

Then we have that pregnant woman who is carrying that unborn child in an environment that has a high level of violence, already those first two years of a child's life from conception to the first 1 000 days is when 80% of the brain development happens. Now that child, unborn child, up to the age of two grows up and is growing up that kind of environment. We are talking about the person now. Already the whole of his or her upbringing will have

a huge impact. That is why we focus also on those.

Therefore, that is why we are saying let us look at all of this holistically, do not wait until he is a teenager; do not wait until he is school-going. Start with, as you indicated, before these children are being born, at the time of the society where it is, so that when they are born the environment is protected.

So you might have probably noticed that I am the loudest who always talks about jobs and employment because we do know that it becomes a buffer in the cases of poverty. Like now there have been reports, also at national level, in regard to the malnutrition and the starvation and also the standing among the children, which we know that the malnutrition does have a huge impact on in terms of how one behaves in regard to matters related to the cognitive abilities, to be able to see what is wrong and right, to differentiate. Which is the same thing with alcohol, when we talk about foetal alcohol syndrome.

So for us as Health we do provide all this information because it is not only about the shootings, it is about how we communicate among each other and then lastly, House Chair, there was a report that also came some time ago through the Department of Safety, it is a national report where actually they said that you will find that the origins or the contributing factors when people ended up like fighting, which is mostly, if it is not a Friday evening, now it even goes to the Monday morning, but at that time

it was mostly these early Saturday mornings.

You will find that the origin is about argument. The argument and that argument normally happens with the people who are closer. So it means if you are arguing and then you stab each other 2 a.m., that you were closer together, whether as friends or as family.

So what is it that we can be able to assist Government, civil society and everyone in creating this social cohesion, people to have that cultural warmth. Up to that you do not argue, but that then you even have an appetite to take a knife and stab each other, and I made an example that now we see pregnant women, 50%, 49 point something percent in the current stats. What we have from our Trauma, where pregnant women have been assaulted and it means they were assaulted with the assailant knowing that that person is pregnant. The mere fact is that they come after four months because it is during that second trimester. It does show that something is very wrong and unfortunately it cannot only be fixed by Health. We absorb all of these social ills, but they are perpetrated elsewhere.

So we appeal to everyone; faith-based organizations, other departments, other spheres of government and us here in this House, Chair, to protect our healthcare workers by making sure that we stop the tap from running because what we do, we are just mopping the floor.

So let us stop this running tap everywhere so that we end up not having these health workers who have to be exposed to this kind of violent society unnecessarily. Thank you, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Thank you, hon Minister. That is the end of Questions for Oral Reply, which brings us to the next item on the Order Paper, Statements by Members. There will now be an opportunity for Members' Statements and may I remind you ...[Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon House Chair? Hon House Chair?

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Hon member Makamba-Botya?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon House Chairperson, I just wanted to know if I am now audible because I have been disadvantaged since the start of this sitting. So I want to know if I am audible. Then if it is, then I am fine. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Yes, your problems have been sorted and I am really grateful to be able to hear your voice now. You will probably be third on the list of statements. Thank you.

So hon members, may I remind you that statements are scheduled for two minutes each and I first recognise the hon member Plato from the DA.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Mr D PLATO (DA): Hon Chairperson, thank you for the opportunity. As many of you are aware I and several members of the social cluster of this House recently visited Sao Paulo in Brazil to interface with our counterparts there and to share insights into our policy, which could benefit citizens in both countries.

The trip took place over a number of days and we were fortunate enough to be able to engage with many stakeholders during our time there. What we saw was at once inspirational and shocking. Brazil is a nation that has its own share of problems, but one which, until recently, stood on an equal footing with our own.

Hon Speaker, and this is the issue, this is no longer the case. The very most important issue about our visit was to understand that their unemployment rate is standing at 12%, when ours is approaching 50% and looking at their population of over 250 million people, there is definitely, hon Chair, some big lessons to be learned.

They have a strong education system and their currency is stronger than ours. The simple and painful truth is that Brazil is pushing forward along with the rest of the BRICS Alliance and we are getting left behind and I would urge this House today to consider some of the things which Brazil has done well.

The country is administered under a federal system, one in which individual states are vastly better equipped to deal with their own unique problems and are not forced to be reliant on a national government.

They educate their youth in financial matters from an early age and ensure that the education system is focused on delivering skills needed for the job market.

They have emphasised public transport and have used initiatives, such as urban farming, to reduce food insecurity and to create jobs.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Time.

Mr D PLATO: Brazil may not be perfect, but their national government has its priorities in order. Hon Chairperson, thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Thank you. Thank you. Next up ANC. Hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon House Chairperson, the African National Congress notes and condemns the internal divisions of the Democratic Alliance in the Western Cape, impacting on democratic governance and service delivery in our province.

The absence of the Premier for most of today in this House, physical

absence, adds to a long list of ways in which he has consistently undermined this Legislature. The undermining of the Legislature started with the suspension of former MEC Bonginkosi Madikizela, when details of that move was denied to this House.

The refusal of the Premier to release the Williams Report into allegations against former MEC Fritz to hon members of this House was another example of how he has undermined the Legislature, the body constitutionally bound to hold him and his Executive accountable.

We are therefore not surprised to hear reports that Premier Winde, in whom the executive authority of this Province rests, demanded that the Speaker resigned from his post. The DA will do well to educate its Premier on the democratic rule of law and separation of powers. This attitude of dismissal of this House and its constitutional duties by the Premier, permeates throughout his Cabinet.

More than half of the Provincial Cabinet is not even present here today. This attitude has a direct impact on the democratic governance in the province and service delivery. The work of this House is hampered because the Premier and his Executive refuses to account here. We call on the Leader of Government Business, the hon Dr Ivan Meyer, to provide leadership because clearly the Premier, as leader of the DA caucus in this House, cannot do so.

We cannot be led in this House by a Speaker and a Deputy Speaker who both have clouds over their heads and who openly and clearly cannot work together.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Hon member Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): For now both the Speaker and Deputy ought to step aside ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Time.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... for the time being. Again the ANC notes and is not surprised that it is a black person who is dealt with by the DA ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Hon ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... while whites are protected.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Hon member Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Madikizela is punished; JP Smith is protected.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Hon member Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Fritz is punished; Bredell is protected, and in closing I say this ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: No, hon member Sayed, please ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Inaudible.] to protect any black leader of the DA from being held accountable. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Hon member Sayed, please, you have got two minutes and you exceeded your time by a considerable margin. Also, you were very close to the offside line, if not completely offside in terms of Rule 59(1)(b) reflecting on the integrity of members of this House.

The next person is hon member Makamba-Botya. Hon member Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): So, House Chair ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Just a moment, hon member Makamba-Botya.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon House Chair, perhaps then for future reference, that we do not move away from that particular Rule, could you possibly explain how exactly I was close to contravening that Rule of reflecting on the integrity of a member of this House? Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Thank you. I will do so afterwards. Thank you

very much, hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Hon House Chair, thank you very much. The Economic Freedom Fighters would like to take this opportunity to condemn members of Democratic Alliance within the Western Cape Executive Committee and Legislature for bringing the Western Cape Provincial Parliament into disrepute.

This follows, hon House Chair, the attempts to employ black [Inaudible.] sinister tactics to force the Speaker of the Provincial Legislature to resign. The matter has its roots within the DA factional battles which are now playing themselves out in the public and negatively affecting the two arms of government.

Hon House Chairperson, the DA finds it unacceptable for an African man to refer a white woman to the Conduct Committee for possible sanctions. It is now public knowledge that Beverly Schäfer abused state resources by using a state vehicle that she was not supposed to use ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Hon member Makamba-Botya? Point of order. I believe you are reflecting on the dignity of a member. Please bring a substantive motion, if you so wish. Thank you. Hon member Kama?

Mr M KAMA: No, thank you, hon House Chair, I also now am very much confused, maybe you will have to assist us because I am getting a feeling

that you are really suppressing the members because you do not even see what is that ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Hon member Kama?

Mr M KAMA: ... they are saying which reflects because talking about what is there it is not reflecting, it is just talking about [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: That is not a point of order. Thank you, hon member Kama, and if you question any ruling by the Chair, you are welcome to write to the Speaker in this regard. The next person is from the DA, hon member America.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: What is really happening here?

Mr D AMERICA: Hon Chairperson, I do not know if hon Makamba ...[Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon House Chairperson, on a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: [No audible response]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: On a point of order. Can I be guided by the House in terms of what Rule I have not followed in this manner? Because this is how we have been doing the statements all along.

Now that this matter is speaking directly to the DA, now it is having an issue in this House. [Interjections.] Can you please enlighten me on the Rule that you are referring to on this matter?

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: I did quote the Rule, 59(1)(b). Please go and read that Rule. You are welcome. Thank you, the next speaker ...[Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon House Chairperson, does the Rule apply on certain statements or on all the statements? Because this is not the first type of statement that has been read in this House and that Rule was never mentioned.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: You are welcome to seek clarity ...[Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Thank you.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Whose hand is raised? Is that hon member Mvimbi?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Yes, hon Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Yes, hon member Mvimbi?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Yes. Hon Chairperson, just maybe it might also assist us because we are actually in a session of the House and then the sessions of the House are actually being run in terms of the Rules and then now some of the Rules, even if you may mention them, it might assist to actually explain them because Rule Section 59 says that no member may:

- “(a) Impugn improper motives on
- (b) Reflect on the integrity or dignity of, or verbally abuse another member.”

And then 2 goes on to say:

“A member who wishes to bring any improper or unethical conduct on the part of another member to the attention of the House, may do so only by way of substantive motion, comprising of a clearly formulated and properly substantiated allegation.”

So maybe, hon Chairperson, it might assist that if you can just say maybe for the benefit of some of us in the House, virtually and also physically, how has this Rule been actually broken? Otherwise, you might also yourself actually be guilty of abusing the very same Rules that you are

supposed to be guiding us and leading us on.

So, if you can just explain as to how hon member Makamba-Botya has actually transgressed this Rule as I have just read it.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Thank you. Hon member Mvimbi, the Rules do not allow for the House Chair to explain his or her decisions. The decisions are final and if you want to question any of those decisions, as you have read you can also write to the Speaker, the Rules also provide for that, and I encourage you to do that in order for you to be able to get clarity on your question. Thank you so much. I also see hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon House Chairperson, I have not finished reading my statement.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Correct.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: So I want you to give me time to finish my statement.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Hon member Makamba-Botya, I ruled that the contents of your statement does not comply with the Rules of this House and that there are other – you cannot – can I just, please, you are very close to a yellow card, hon member.

You know the Rules. No interjections in terms of hybrid sessions. [Interjections.] You are – thank you. Hon member Sayed, no interjections, thank you. You are not recognised. Hon member Kama, you are recognised.

Mr M KAMA: No, thank you very much, hon Chair. You see now we are confused, all of us because I think as the Chair you were supposed to say, “You are not supposed to do this,” so that she refrains from doing that and be able to, because she has two minutes to finish her speech.

Now you just say, “You cannot continue ...” ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Correct.

Mr M KAMA: ... because of the contents.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Correct.

Mr M KAMA: What is that? Because now you are going against the decisions that would have been made at programming, that the member has two minutes.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Yes.

Mr M KAMA: And only if the member would have, after you had made a ruling and not wanted to abide by your ruling, then you can be able to say,

“You cannot continue to speak,” but you just say, “You cannot speak ...”
...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Thank you.

Mr M KAMA: ... and she does not even know what part of the statement is actually in contravention of these Rules that you are talking about. We think that is a bit of abuse of power, hon Chair, and really you must assist us in that regard.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Yes. No, thank you very much. Unfortunately, hon members, if you are outside of the Rules, you are not allowed to continue and that is my ruling and you are welcome, as I have said, the Rules do provide for you to get the necessary clarity and I have ruled on this matter.

Also, the Rules say no repetitive motions of the order, so please not. I recognise ...[Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: I recognise the Whip. She has indicated that she would like to speak.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Hon member Lekker?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... hon House Chairperson. I think, hon House Chairperson, with respect to the position that one is holding, particularly that one of yourself, it would be proper because clearly when we are sitting here we can see there seems to be a lack of understanding of the Rules and I would appeal to you to ask the Table staff to assist you because the member still has a few seconds to go through.

Now if anything from what she is going to say from the remaining seconds is out of line, you would then rule her instead of shutting her down and say she may not continue. There is no such a Rule. I would like you to point out what Rule are you referring to. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Thank you. Hon member Lekker, I have referred to Rule 59(1)(b) repeatedly. So, please, I refer you to that Rule and the next speaker for a statement is hon member America. Thank you.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Chairperson, sorry to interject. The ruling that you are referring to ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon Chair?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: ... does not mention that I cannot continue with my statement. If you read it thoroughly with understanding it does not

say that I cannot continue with my statement. Can you please read the Rule again ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Honourable...

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: ... and please make your interpretation.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Thank you, hon member Makamba-Botya. I have ruled on it, thank you, and as I have said ...[Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: But, hon House Chairperson, this is out of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: You [Inaudible.]...

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: You cannot suppress us like this in this House. We all have the right to speak in this House.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Thank you.

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Chair, my hand is also up.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Yes, hon member Marran?

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Chair, my hand is also up on a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Whose is that? Marran? Hon member Marran, thank you.

Mr P MARRAN: Yes, hon Chair, on a point of order, hon Chair, because I am sitting with the Rules in front of me and I have read 59 right through; 59(1) and (2), and you have just said, hon Chair, if a person is out of ...

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Order, yes.

Mr P MARRAN: Yes, then the person cannot continue. Nowhere in 59, either (1) or (2), does it say that the person cannot continue. So I also would like to understand which Rule are you quoting, that the person cannot continue.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Thank you, hon member Marran. As I have said, please direct that question to the Office of the Speaker. Thank you. Hon [Inaudible.]

Mr P MARRAN: Are you not the Speaker today?

The CHIEF WHIP [DA]: Point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: I am the House Chairperson ...[Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: This is so wrong.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: ... I am chairing this meeting according to the Rules, thank you.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: No, there is no rule [Inaudible.]

The CHIEF WHIP [DA]: On a point of order!

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: [Inaudible.]

The CHIEF WHIP [DA]: Hon House Chair!

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: ... I may not speak on the statement. There is not a rule of such nature.

The CHIEF WHIP [DA]: Point of order ...

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Thank you, hon members. Please I would like hon member America to raise his, or to do his statement. Hon member America, please unmute yourself.

Mr D AMERICA: Sorry, hon House Chair. Hon House Chair, I went to the George Municipality with the Standing Committee on Transport last week. I witnessed first-hand how the Municipality and the Province prioritise and invest in public transportation. The Municipality is currently in the final stages of implementation of Phase 4 of the GoGeorge bus service. 11 buses

have been allocated to serve the community of Thembalethu. This would allow more people to access different locations in George quicker, safer and cheaper. When the bus stops are constructed in Thembalethu it is anticipated that not to be more than 500 metres away from the majority of the community's residences to access the service.

These are significant developments to those who rely on public transportation because residents will no longer have to walk long distances to reach the bus stop.

Thembalethu CCTV system had also been upgraded by the Municipality. This will keep the community safe, but also ensure that anyone attempting to vandalise the GoGeorge service infrastructure will be apprehended and face the consequences of breaking the law.

The DA-led George Municipality and the City of Cape Town Municipality have repeatedly demonstrated the benefits of municipal control public transportation. The DA in this province and in this Provincial Parliament applauds these efforts and the continued support from the National and the Western Cape Government in ensuring that the public has access to reliable modes of transportation.

The George Municipality has committed itself to roll out the service to Thembalethu before the end of the year. The progress with this suggests that this will be achieved. Thank you, hon House Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Thank you. Hon member August, do you have a statement?

Mr S N AUGUST: Hon Chair, with the commencement of the war in Ukraine, the world reacted to defend the human rights violations, which are essentially trampled on in the event of war and any illegal occupation of a country's territory.

The Global World of Nations rightfully rose to defend this gross injustice and called continuously to this day for the war to end. We have seen horrible imagery, news castings and were moved by the pleas of Ukraine's refugees asking for support and assistance. We applauded how swiftly aid was made available to the destitute and the world continues to condemn the actions of aggressor.

Hon Chair, this House was lit up with yellow and blue to show its support to Ukraine and the reasons provided was that as signatory to the United Nations Charter on Human Rights, South Africa has a moral obligation to defend the sovereignty and peace of all member states, including Ukraine.

We have seen this Government bend over backwards to take its own position on foreign policy and simultaneously set in motion its own mandate on Foreign Affairs against the Constitution which empowers the President and the Minister with the keys to develop South Africa's position on foreign relations.

A war has existed since 1948 and that has claimed 14 000 lives between 1987 and 2021. It is not enough for this Government to condemn Israel's actions in slaughtering Palestine.

This Government should not execute its mandate by practicing hypocrisy, but should apply its position on human rights equally. I am hereby calling on this House to light up in the colours of Palestine to show its support in defending the human rights violations of Palestinians and that it condemns the actions of Israel. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Thank you. Hon ACDP?

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon House Chair. The ACDP once again points out the tragic events that happened at New Somerset Hospital on 7 May 2022. This was extremely traumatising for staff and patients, especially since it caused the death of constable Donay Phillips and two in-patients. This, hon Chair, is a really, really sad story and according to the ACDP this could have been prevented.

Now, hon Chair, an interesting story is that Constable Phillips was there not even to safeguard the person that killed him. He was there for somebody else, but he was alone on duty safeguarding Ayanda Mpinda. He was there to safeguard that person and a Mr Malgas killed him.

So the questions out in the public domain is the following: Why was

officer Phillips alone on duty and why was Mr Malgas released by the policemen that brought him to New Somerset Hospital?

He assaulted a policeman in Vredendal; he was transported and the two policemen that brought him to the hospital, released him. So the question is why was this person not charged and why was he released? Is it because the police did not know how to hand over an accused? Why was the accused released? Why was he not charged if he assaulted the policeman out in Vredendal?

So the question is, again, is it because we do not have enough resources in the Western Cape? Is it because we have a shortage of policemen and police women and that is why a constable was killed, and I think the police must take responsibility for the loss of this constable. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Thank you, hon member Christians. ANC?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon House Chairperson. The ANC Government remains committed towards the vision of the creation of a non-racial, non-sexist, democratic and prosperous society. Our country's Constitution is a social contract, binding citizens to create an inclusive South Africa. It is disheartening that in the Western Cape there are still enclaves of racism as exposed by the recent Stellenbosch University's racism incident, where a white first-year student urinated on the laptop and books of a fellow black student. The conduct of Theuns du Toit should not

be looked at in isolation from other racism incidents in schools and society. It is definitely part of the land culture inherent in racism enclaves like Stellenbosch. We condemn this barbaric act in the strongest possible terms.

Equally we must view the DA and the Provincial Government's silence on the matter in a very serious light. The DA's policies, actions and inactions against racism create a conducive environment for racism.

As early as 2012 DA councillor Catherine Booysette resigned from the DA after her complaint of racism against a fellow councillor, who called the DA councillor by the K-word, was not adequately addressed. Recently DA councillor and former MP, Tandeka Gqada, suffered a similar fate and her case too was swept under the carpet.

In light of the above we must commend the activism of SASCO, the ANC Youth League, various youth formations and students at the Good Hope Seminary High School for confronting racism head-on. In line with our commitment in the last sitting all members must commit to play a role to destroy the demon of racism wherever it rears its ugly head. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Thank you, hon member Lekker. DA? Hon member Bosman.

MR G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon House Chairperson.

Hon Chairperson, the international world and international companies are ready to invest in the Western Cape. Tourists want to come here and airlines and cruise ships want to bring them here. Our tourism recovery is a key pillar in getting us back on track and in the Western Cape we are keen to see the negative effects of COVID subside, but the deliberate mismanagement of the South African economy by the ANC is hampering this.

We know that things are going to get a little bit more difficult, especially with the ANC plundering; Eskom unable to keep the lights on; businesses having to close due to not being able to deal with unpredictable load shedding and, hon House Chairperson, although the ANC tries very hard to stall growth in the Western Cape, we found ways to succeed.

Through our continued investment in the Air Access Programme we have seen this week that Virgin Atlantic Airways will bring back their direct flights to Cape Town from London. This means we have got another direct and dedicated 80 000 seats from November 2022, just in time for our peak tourist season. We know that these direct flights bring more than R6 billion to the local economy.

Hon House Chairperson, we are determined to bring tourists, whether by air or sea. That is why I am very excited by the work done by Wesgro to ensure that 104 cruise ship visits will be calling at the Port of Cape Town.

This is an exciting time for the tourism sector as a number of indicators show that there is pent-up demand that we could benefit from.

Hon House Chairperson, although all the players in our province are making sure that we create a conducive environment, we are still being let down by National Government. During a meeting with the South African High Commissioner in London last week it was revealed that many British tourists simply cannot choose South Africa as a holiday destination due to our continued requirement that they need a negative PCR test despite being vaccinated. These tests cost up to £80 per person, so if a family of four has a choice of a holiday in South Africa, with a £320 PCR test bill versus a holiday in Portugal with no barriers to entry, they choose the cheaper option.

Hon House Chairperson, I encourage all members of all parties to work with us to grow the economy in the Western Cape and to speak to the counterparts at the ANC-run National Government to open up South Africa for international tourists, to open up for investment. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Thank you. Freedom Front Plus?

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Hon Chair, the Freedom Front Plus has noted the high escalation of serious aggravated rape and murders committed in the Western Cape. We noted the huge backlog in finalising cases relating to gender-based violence due to a huge DNA backlog and the dire shortage of well-trained detectives to solve crime.

We call on the Premier to fight unrelenting for the devolution of powers relating to police matters to this province to bring stability in the Western Cape. The time has come from a multiparty position on the principle of subsidiarity. We need a conference of leaders who can deliberate on the future of this province, instead of each one trying to build our own empire for himself.

We need a rainbow coalition straddling all other selfish ambitions if we are to solve problems relating to adequate housing, economic growth, protecting our environment, rail and road transport, job creation and education. Good governance is what we need. It is in the interest of all the people living in this province if we are to survive the current geo-political events that are overtaking us and to this extent the Freedom Front Plus leads the campaign countrywide to achieve this rainbow coalition to solve this country's problems.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Thank you, hon member. †Die volgende is Al Jama-ah. Agb lid Brinkhuis. [The next is Al Jama-ah. Hon member Brinkhuis.]

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon House Chairperson. In October 2021 the Western Cape Education Department fired a highly respected principal, Mr Wesley Newman, from his post at the Heathfield High School on charges of misconduct. This after the

principal took a decision not to reopen the school during the peak of COVID-19 pandemic. Mr Newman's decision was based on the National Disaster Management Regulations and fully supported by the school governing body.

The dismissal of school principals responsible for academic excellence turnarounds largely occurs in the Western Cape to stop advancements of black learners. This underhand tactic by the DA-run Western Cape Education Department is a matter of national importance as National Parliament gave its undertaking during the peak of the COVID-19 that parents have a choice whether to send their children to school.

The tension at the school is evident as learners and neighbouring communities have embarked on daily protest actions in support of Mr Newman. We are a month away from June 16, National Youth Day, and today's learners are looking up to the historic and tragic events in the education of the youth of 1976.

The former MEC for Education, Beverley Schäfer, has since resigned amid a storm brewing about her capacity to be in this important position. She and the head of WECD have refused to meet with Heathfield High's SGB to discuss the issue of COVID-19. Students, parents and teachers are now prepared to take to the streets to defend Mr Newman. The angry learners, parents and wider school community are expecting the Premier to intervene and return their beloved principal ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Time.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: ... to his rightful position at the school. Mr Newman took a principled decision not to accept the Department's offer to demote him ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Time.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: ... and a post at another school. Hon Premier, this action of the Western Cape Education Department ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Hon member Brinkhuis, time is up. Thank you.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Please take your seat, thank you. The last statement from the DA, hon member Mackenzie, I see you.

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Thank you, hon House Chair. Hon House Chair, I am glad to see that President Ramaphosa has reached the decision to cancel the National Government's plan to spend R22 million on the proposed ornamental flagpole, but despite this project's cancellation the fact that it was ever proposed and approved in the first place by the Cabinet, indicates a disturbing and dangerous trend with National Government [Inaudible.] Ministers spent lavish amounts of public funds on

spurious and unnecessary vanity projects that have no benefit to the country's citizens.

Even now, despite the failure of this flagpole, Nathi Mthethwa is fighting to rename and modify the Afrikaans Taalmonument in Paarl at substantial expense to the taxpayer. Hon House Chair, Minister Mthethwa's proposed flagpole has already cost this country R1,7 million in feasibility study and would have cost the taxpayers R22 million to build. A basic calculation tells us that R22 million could provide R62,857 SRD grant, with about R50 left over. How many will suffer, hon House Chair, from this latest project? How much will be sacrificed for the ego of those in Pretoria?

To be fair, hon House Chair, Nathi Mthethwa is the Minister of Sports, Arts and Culture – sorry, Arts and Culture, and has defended his flagpole proposal that it is falling under his mandate. So let us examine what can be done with his mandate.

- Artists crippled by the lockdowns could receive the funding they need to survive and continue their work.
- Museums could have benefited from the finalisation of the National Museum Policy which has stayed in draft form for decades, whereas this Province has had his own museum policy for almost 10 years because we focus on results, not on vanity projects.

This trend of unnecessary and irrelevant spending demonstrates what we

have known in this country for many years, that the President, the members of his Cabinet and the ANC have totally become detached from the realities of the average South African.

I congratulate those colleagues in the National Parliament and the NCOP who have been vigilant to hold Government to account, which would otherwise have been a waste of money. I fear their work is not over yet. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Thank you very much. Thank you, that brings us to the end of Statements.

In terms of Rule 145(6) I now give one or more members of the Executive present, an opportunity to respond to Members' Statements for not more than five minutes collectively. Can I please get an indication whether there are any members of the Executive that would like to respond? I see hon Minister Bredell is unmuted.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: If there is nobody in the House that will respond, I will respond.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Please proceed, hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL

AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon House Chair.

Hon House Chair, to the statement of hon member Sayed. I do understand that the hon member Sayed tries to save a sinking ANC ship and therefore comes with these kind of nonsensical statements. I can just for the record state that there are no divisions in the DA and they must stop focusing on us and rather try to see what can be done to save the sinking ship that pulls the whole of South Africa down under water.

The Premier has acted within his powers, within the rule of law, within what anybody can expect from a Premier. It is never easy to act against your own colleagues and I am very proud to be part of this team because what the DA has promised to the people is that we will discipline our members where necessary. We will be strict within the party and every DA member recognises that and knows that we will be acted against if we overstep a certain line.

I do not know why the ANC is so obsessed to get the report of MEC Fritz, but it can only speak to a very negative outcome and that is to get the names of the people who have blown the whistle on a member that is now no more a member of Parliament. So, hon Speaker, the Premier acted within the rule of law on all the matters that were put in front of him and I, and I think all my colleagues, respect that.

On the Speaker's case currently, you are innocent until proven guilty
...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL
AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... and the Premier had
...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL
AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... an opinion and the
opinion was ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Minister Bredell, Minister Bredell, I have two
hands. The one is that of hon member Kama, and then hon member
Dugmore. Please just hold your breath for a moment. Hon member Kama?

Mr M KAMA: No, thank you very much, hon Chair. I think my point of
order is guided by the ruling that you would have made because one really
struggles to understand the ruling, but you made it when hon member
Makamba-Botya was making reflections on a member of this House.

Now when I am listening to the Minister's reply and how the Premier even

now continues to – and what hon member Sayed would have mentioned
...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Sorry, your point of order? What rule?

Mr M KAMA: 59(d). That's why I am saying it is with that
...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: No, but – thank you. My ruling is that hon
Minister Bredell is not contravening Rule 59. Please take your seat, thank
you. Hon member Dugmore, your point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much,
hon Chair. My point of order relates to the hon member misleading the
House. The hon member has just said the most unbelievable thing, in the
sense that he said there are no divisions within the DA. This coming from
someone ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Sorry, hon member Dugmore, that is one of the
...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... who himself has twice
been convicted by the Public Protector ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Hon member Dugmore?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... for breaching the code of ethics. So I would ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: That is not a point of order. Please proceed, hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Ja, the ANC does not ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is what you can expect from you.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: But the ANC .. [Inaudible.] hon House Chair.

An HON MEMBER: Sometimes [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon House Chair, and on the statement that half of the MECs are not in the House. I am online, my colleagues are online ...[Interjections.] ... So we must then decide if you are online, are you in the House or not, and my understanding is that we are in the House currently. So I just want to rectify that and rather the hon member Dugmore ...

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Hon Minister Bredell? I have got a point of order here in the House.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Chair, on a point of order and this point of order is on you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: What rule?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No. Hon member Kama was still busy speaking and expanding on his objection and you immediately ruled on that. You are supposed to hear the member out.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Please, when you raise a point of order, hon member Sayed, and I think you know it quite well, you must just refer to the Rule that you want the Chair to be ruling on. Thank you very much.

Back to you, hon Minister Bredell. You still have almost three minutes. Members of the MEC.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: [No audible response]

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Hon Minister Bredell, would you like to proceed? Please unmute. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: *Ja.* House Chair, thank you. Hon House Chair, the DA does not have a step aside rule where you keep on paying people a full salary and full benefits, and have never acted against them like the ANC.

If we look at the outcome of the Zondo Commission, can the hon Dugmore show us anybody that was fired by the ANC or, you cannot? So, I am very proud to be part of this DA team. We will keep on building this province and the country, and in 2024 we will be the saviours, we will run the country after the election. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Any other hon members of the MEC that would like to respond? You still have two and a half minutes left. None? Thank you very much. That is the end of Members' Statements, which brings us to the next item on the Order Paper: Notices of Motion.

In terms of the new Rule 151, all Notices of Motions by the hon members are required to be delivered to the Secretary for placing it on the Order Paper. These motions have been duly submitted and published on the Order Paper below the line.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Mr G BOSMAN: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the tourism recovery strategy in the Western Cape and the impact on the Western Cape of the failure of National Government to open up South Africa fully to international tourists.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr M KAMA: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the risks associated with the launch of Operation Dudula in the province and the mitigation strategies for it.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates how schools in the Western Cape are breeding environments for a racist society following reports of several racism incidents in schools in the province.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of DA infighting and factionalism on service delivery in the province.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the risks of monkeypox outbreak in the Western Cape and the public healthcare system's preparedness for it.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: In terms of Motions without Notice, I would like to inform you that in terms of this new Standing Rule pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolence and congratulatory motions were submitted to the Programming Authority prior to this plenary on 23 May 2022. Hon members are also reminded that Motions without Notice pertaining to congratulatory and condolences, will not be allowed in this sitting that have not been processed by the Programming Authority.

I have been informed that in the Programming Authority meeting of 23 May 2022, political parties did submit the names of hon members in the desired order of speaking and those who had wished to move a Motion without Notice in this sitting of the House. I will therefore, just for noting and for the purpose of the Minutes, call out the hon members' names who

have accordingly been submitted and approved.

The following hon members' motions have been approved by the Programming Authority, as follows: hon Brinkhuis of Al Jama-ah, hon L J Botha DA, hon Christians ACDP, hon Mackenzie DA, hon Marran ANC, hon Van der Westhuizen DA, hon Lekker ANC, hon Mackenzie, again, DA, hon Marran, again, ANC, and then, hon Sayed ANC and another motion proposed by hon Sayed ANC. I now put the motions duly submitted and approved by the Programming Authority to the House.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr G BRINKHUIS: I move without notice:

That the House recognises Jason Oktober, a 21-year-old from Strand, who won a gold medal at the National Universities Championships in the 110 metre hurdles sprint held at University of Western Cape earlier this month (May 2022); recognises that Jason, who is from the Strand, was awarded the 2022 SA University Champion title in sprint hurdles; notes that, as the only child of his parents, Mr Thomas Oktober and Ms Alfharita, he has been practicing sprint hurdles since he was 8 years old; further notes that, as a young promising athlete who completed matric at the Paul Roos Gymnasium, he faced many challenges in accessing athletic facilities in the Strand and his struggling parents made many sacrifices to provide professional

coaching for him in Stellenbosch; acknowledges that he was also the Boland U17 Western Cape champion in athletics at the SA Schools National Championships and also won second place in the SA National Junior Championships when he was 19 years old in the 110 m hurdles; notes that earlier this month (May 2022) he competed for the first time in the SA National Senior Championship and took fifth place in the final; recognises that he is a final-year student studying BA Humanities and intends to pursue further studies in Sports Science; further recognises his aims to become a professional athlete and to represent South Africa at the Olympic Games; and extends good wishes to Jason for making his hometown, Paarl, and South Africa proud.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the newly appointed members of the Provincial Executive, Ms Mireille Wenger and Mr Reagen Allen, on their promotion to Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities, and Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety respectively; and recognises their service to the public during their time as members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament and Chairpersons of their respective committees; and wishes them well in their new roles.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I move without notice:

That the House notes that there are many organisations who work tirelessly, often without recognition for the work they do; notes therefore, it comes as a pleasant surprise to learn that the Cape of Good Hope SPCA and the Animal Welfare Society Stellenbosch (AWSS) received the award for Best Animal Welfare NPO in South Africa and the Most Compassionate Animal Welfare Organisation in South Africa respectively (*Weekend Argus*, 26 April 2022, Keagan Mitchell); notes that the awards were received at the Pet Products and Service Awards 2022; notes that Senior Strategist of the Cape of Good Hope SPCA, Shane Everts, said the organisation was ‘surprised and humbled to receive such a prestigious award and international recognition’; notes that these organisations care for animals that cannot speak or fend for themselves; notes that in the performance of their duties, the staff are at times subjected to difficult and challenging circumstances and conditions, and inspectors are often intimidated and threatened when responding to calls where animals are at risk or in distress; notes that, despite this, they respond time after time to the needs of our four-legged friends; and commends and congratulates the SPCA and AWSS, its sponsors, staff and volunteers for the service they provide to the community.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family and loved ones of Deborah Fraser, the legendary gospel singer, who passed away on Sunday 15 May; notes that Fraser had an unquenchable passion for music and devoted herself to a range of humanitarian activities; and notes that her loss will be greatly felt by all in the province and the nation.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr P MARRAN: I move without notice:

That the House conveys sincerest condolences to the families of Marshall September and Philip Makaleni from De Doorns, who both passed away last Saturday; and prays that the good Lord guides them through this difficult period.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the residents of Cape Town and the City

on achieving second place out of 450 cities worldwide in the City Nature Challenge competition; notes that Cape Town took second place in the challenge for recording the second-highest number of observations and species; and notes that with this achievement they showed their appreciation, recognition and love for our unique fauna and flora kingdom.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House conveys deepest condolences to the family of veteran gospel musician, Dr Deborah Fraser, who passed away on Sunday after battling with a short illness; notes that Fraser began her music career in 1985 and that she has been a household name ever since; and notes that she composed some of her music for the ANC and for performances at its gatherings.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the organisers of two successful running races held in the City of Cape Town recently, namely the ABSA Run Your City 10 kilometres on 15 May and the Langa Run for Freedom

race on 27 April; notes that these events not only benefit the province economically, but also help to promote fitness and community wellbeing; and congratulates all of those who worked to make these events a success.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr P MARRAN: I move without notice:

That the House extends heartfelt condolences to the family, friends, comrades and the greater community of former ANC councillor of Ward 11 in Tulbagh, Witzenberg, Aunty Lizzy Jooste, who passed away the morning of 18 May 2022.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with profound sadness the passing away of former Johannesburg Mayor, Mpho Moerane, who succumbed to injuries he had sustained from a car crash last week; notes that Moerane passed away on Wednesday, 18 May 2022, at the Milpark Hospital in Johannesburg; notes that he will be remembered for his dedication and service to the ANC and the City of Johannesburg; may his family and friends find comfort during this dark time.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with profound sadness the passing away of Aunty Agnes Lukas, a longstanding and dedicated community worker who was loved by all residents of Ward 31 in Bonteheuwel, regardless of party affiliation; notes that Aunty Agnes passed away last week; and conveys deepest condolences to her family, friends and comrades.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Are there any objections? No objections, agreed to. These motions will appear in the Minutes of proceedings and in Hansard in each individual hon member's name as if that member had read them aloud.

I will not afford the opportunity to hon members to move Motions without Notice as per Standing Rule 152.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Sorry, hon Chairperson, I am trying to raise my hand as a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Apologies for not recognising that while I am reading. Hon Dugmore, please proceed.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Chair. Hon Chairperson, you made a statement now, just a short while ago, in which you said that any hon member who stands up and wants to address the Presiding Officer on a point of order, must state the Rule in terms of which they are doing that.

Now, I would like you, because this is critical for how this meeting proceeds, because that is not what the Rule says. The Rule does not require of any hon member, and I would like to refer you to Rule 66, hon Chairperson; because if you look at the Rule that actually deals with points of order, there is absolutely no reference in the Rules to the fact that a member rising on a point of order, has to say in terms of which Rule he or she is actually raising the matter.

Now, if I can refer you specifically to that clause, hon Chairperson, you will notice that the procedure for dealing with that is very clearly outlined in terms of that particular Rule where it simply says that:

“A point of order...”

And this is under 66(3):

“...must relate to a procedure, practice or operation of the House or a complaint of unparliamentary conduct or behaviour on the part of the member which may be et cetera, et cetera.”

Now, could you tell us: in terms of what? What were you referring to when you said that you have to cite the Rule in terms of which you are raising a point of order because the only Rule on a point of order is Rule 66. So, possibly, you want to concede that you made a mistake or maybe there, you would like to explain yourself, but I do not think we can let that become a ruling which is sustained in this House. I would like you to reflect on your ruling either now or come back to this House later or possibly, if you could just help us by referring to which Rule you were referring to?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you, hon Chair – oh, sorry.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Chair? No, no, no, I am not the hon Chair, I am the Leader of the Opposition.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Hon Leader of the Opposition, my apologies. Hon Leader of the Opposition, a point of order must obviously relate to the Rules and the points of order recognised by the Rules of Order. It is not befitting to do that via a speech, but people or hon members are supposed to rise and then, point out where they believe that the Rules of Order have been transgressed. That is all. You do not need to cite the number of the Rule in terms of our Rules.

In terms of the National Assembly, you do need to cite the number of the Rule, but here, Rules of Order must be pertinent, and they must not be

speeches. That is my ruling, thank you very much. Thank you. Hon members, as I have said ...[Interjection.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Chair? Hon Chair? Hon House Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: There is a hand from hon Makamba-Botya?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon House Chairperson, from what the last hon member has spoken about, I still want to understand. When you stopped me on my statement, on what Rule did you refer that to because gathering from the events of today's sitting, hon House Chairperson, you rather create your own DA Parliament where you will not have issues of applying House Rules as you please.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member ...[Interjection.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: If some statements are distasteful to the DA, then the Rules are forcefully and incorrectly applied on Opposition parties. That is supressing us deliberately so and abusing the powers of being the Speaker.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you ...[Interjection.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: So, I want you to still take me to the issue of Rule 55 because Rule 55 has got nothing to do with that what limits you on the content of the statement. It only limits you on the time of the statement and has nothing to do with what is the content of the statement.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Hon, I did cite the Rule and the number of the Rule. Secondly, please: once a ruling has been made, the ruling has been made and if you want to address that afterwards, you must please also, in terms of the Rules, follow the Rule which says that you must write to the hon Speaker. Thank you very much and I am not going to debate that because that would be deviating from the Order Paper. Thank you very much ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, there is a hand in the House. Hon Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Chairperson. Hon Chairperson, Rule 66 (5) because I see there are hon members aggrieved in the House, and 66 (5) is very clear:

“A member who is aggrieved, may not challenge the ruling in the House. That member should follow the process of writing to the Speaker who must then convene a Rules Committee within a

reasonable time, to address the principle of the ruling. This should only apply to substantive matters.” ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Audio distorted.]...the Rule that does not exist.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Thank you, hon members. As I have said, there is no debate regarding the rulings, so can we please proceed. As I have said, the motions will appear in the minutes of proceedings and in Hansard, in each individual hon member’s name as if that hon member had read them aloud.

I will now afford the opportunity to hon members to move Motions without Notice as per Standing Rule 152(d). This could also include Motions without Notice that were not approved in the Programming Authority meeting. Hon members are reminded that the 30 minutes as per Standing Rule 152(d) will start now. I recognise hon Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you very much, hon House Chair. I move without notice:

That this House notes the appeals from the Muslim community to the City of Cape Town to remove the Adhan or Calls to Prayers from its bylaws on ‘noise pollution’. The City of Cape Town is misleading communities giving the undertaking that the bylaws pertaining to the Adhan in the ringing of church bells will be amended and removed.

However, the City of Cape Town reneged on its undertaking and instead, changed the amendment agreed to, to remove the bylaw. The Al Jama-ah calls on the hon Premier to intervene in this matter and heed the communities' calls for the exclusion of the Adhan and church bells from the bylaws pertaining to noise pollution. I so move. Thank you, hon Chair.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Brinkhuis. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Mr G BOSMAN: Object!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): I object that it is being moved without notice.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: There is an objection, thank you. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. The next is a motion in the name of hon Xego. Hon Xego? We move on. The next is a motion in the name of hon Kama.

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, hon Kama, proceed?

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, hon Chair. I move without notice:

That the House notes that the Western Cape Government, through its Case for Sport Report, acknowledged that sports have proven to be an effective antidote for crime when it stated that ‘Sport and Recreation provide idle people with a healthy alternative to crime, violence, and anti-social behaviour’; notes further that despite this acknowledgment by the Provincial Government, Sport and Recreation are given the smallest share of the budget, thereby disempowering the Department from achieving its mandate; and calls on the Provincial Government to provide the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport with an adequate budget which allows it to play a meaningful role in addressing the scourge of drugs and gangsterism in the poor working-class communities. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Kama. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No, there is no objection. Agreed to. The next one is a motion – sorry, can I just recognise? There was a hand raised by hon Mvimbi that has been lowered. Can we proceed? Thank you, we proceed. The next one, again, a motion in the name of hon Xego. Not present. Hon Bosman, you are recognised.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon House Chairperson. I move without

notice:

That the House notes the outstanding work of renowned South African economist Mike Schüssler in analysing the South African economy in extremely volatile conditions; notes further that Mr Schüssler always aimed to make his analysis accessible to the average citizen, helping many people to understand complicated economic developments; and that the House acknowledges that the passing of Mr Schüssler represents a big loss to innovative economic analysis in South Africa. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is no objection, agreed to. The next motion is a motion in the name again of hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, House Chair. I move without notice:

That the House notes with a great sense of pride and celebrates the achievements of the Cape Town All Stars which finished third in log standings of South Africa's National First Division, thereby qualifying for the playoffs for a spot in the DStv Premiership next season; notes further that this means the Western Cape stands a chance of having another team representing the province in the Premier Division, which

is great news for the economy and the people in the Cape Flats, as the team played its home games at the Athlone Stadium; and calls on the Provincial Government, the City of Cape Town and the people of this province, in general, to rally behind the team and wish them well, ahead of their playoffs commencing on Sunday, 29 May 2022, against Pretoria University. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...moved without notice?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: There is no objection, agreed to. The next motion, it is a motion in the name of hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you very much, hon House Chairperson.

I move without notice:

That the House condemns the continued femicide and abuse against

women and children. This follows the recent continued killings of women and children for greedy ends. We are now tired of hearing that a woman or a child was killed and found with missing body parts. We are also tired of hearing accounts of women being shot 9 times and the police still failing to arrest the perpetrators. It is now clear that our criminal justice system and its laws are far from being a deterrent for criminals who have made it a hobby to brutally beat and kill innocent people, coupled by the look of things, such matters of GBV in this province will never end while we are having a DA-led Parliament in our midst. Thank you very much.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Ms L M MASEKO: Objection!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Chair, on a point of order?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Hon House Chairperson. Can she just repeat that last line? I did not hear it properly.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Makamba-Botya, there is a request that ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Chair?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...perhaps, just read the last line again?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: The last line says:

By the look of things the matters of GBV in this province will never end while we are having a DA Parliament in our midst. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Are there any objections to the motion? ...[Interjection.]

HON MEMBERS: [Audio distorted.]...

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Chairperson, on a point of order?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Indeed. There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. The next is hon Mvimbi, who is online.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Chairperson. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that the Premier's commitment to

building security fences at 30 schools each year for the next five years, has not yielded any positive results for the schools in poor working-class communities where a majority of schools have broken fences and weak fences that are falling off, including those that have not been fixed for decades; notes further that during an oversight visit to schools in my constituency, I identified several schools where fences were broken or missing in large sections of the school, and calls on the MEC to prioritize building fences at Bongoletu Primary and Fezekile Secondary school in the Eden and Central Karoo District, where lives of teachers and learners are at risk as the school fence is broken and missing in large sections of the school. I so move, hon Chairperson.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, the motion has been put. Are there ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Objection!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: There is an objection ...[Interjection.]

Ms L M MASEKO: Objection.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Good.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Objection.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Then, the motion will be printed ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: †Hayibo! [No way!] [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...on the Order Paper as there is an objection. The next motion is that again, of hon Makamba-Botya. Please, hon Makamba-Botya, be reminded that the motions that you have submitted are also the ones that you are to propose now. Please proceed?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon House Chairperson. I move without notice:

That the House condemns the Western Cape Department of Health and the University of Cape Town, for failing to suspend a professor who is alleged to have sexually violated a student at the university. In January this year, there was an incident of Usasazo High School in Khayelitsha, Site B, where the principal of the school was refusing to give post-matric students their statements report because...

I beg your pardon, sorry.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Makamba-Botya, will you please

return to the motion as submitted?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: My apologies, hon House Chairperson. I move without notice:

That the House condemns the Western Cape Department of Health and the University of Cape Town, for failing to suspend a professor who is alleged to have sexually violated a student at the university. The professor in question is a joint employee of both the University and the Department, and he is based in the Medical Department of the University at the Groote Schuur Hospital. During these dangerous times where women are subjected to all forms of abuse and rape, it is shocking that the institution and the Department failed to suspend the professor in question pending the investigation. Hon House Chairperson, in so doing they have subjected the victim in a double punishment of being harassed and continuing to face the perpetrator on daily basis. The EFF finds this shocking and is asking for those who are entrusted with public power to do what is right. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. The motion has been put. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No? The motion is therefore, accepted. The motion has been accepted, thank you. The next one is, again, a motion in the name of the hon Kama. Hon

Kama, please proceed.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, hon House Chair. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the ongoing murders and spate of violent crime in the Western Cape, which included yet another mass murder in Khayelitsha; a shooting incident that left five people injured in Duinefontein Road, Manenberg, and the murders of 12 people in Manenberg and Hanover Park in just 24 hours; conveys sincere condolences to the Titus family who lost 3 family members in the shooting; wishes a speedy recovery to all the wounded in the Manenberg shooting and calls for an integrated approach to creating community safety in the province, including the need to address the causative factors of crime and increasing the number of deployed LEAP officers to the gang-infested communities. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: The motion has been put. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No? The motion is agreed to. The next one is a motion in the name of the hon Lekker. Hon Lekker, are you online?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, hon House Chairperson, I am online, but I

will let it pass.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. The next one is in the name of hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon House Chairperson. I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep concern the disparities in the treatment of victims and perpetrators of alleged sexual misconduct in the Provincial Government; notes further that a UCT professor, also an employee of the Western Cape Government, that is facing rape allegations against a post-grad student in Medicine and remains in his job while the victim has been suspended by the Department; notes further that the case of the UCT professor has followed the similar pattern to the case of Farrell Payne, who remains in his job despite facing serious charges of sexual misconduct against a junior colleague, while the victim is at home; and is similar to the case of a teacher at Thandokhulu High in Mowbray who remains in his job despite facing charges of sexually assaulting a learner at the school; condemns the institutionalisation of GBV culture within the Provincial Government and calls for the immediate suspension of the professor. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: The motion has been put. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Mr L L MVIMBI: No objections.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No? Agreed to. The next one is a motion in the name of, I believe, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon House Chairperson. I move without notice:

That the House notes that despite the Education Department wasting over half a million rand on the Wesley Neumann witch-hunt, the WCED has since offered principal Neumann a demotion after he appealed the decision of the kangaroo court to dismiss him; notes further that following his appeal to the former MEC of Education, she gave principal Neumann an ultimatum, either to accept a demotion to head of the department at another school or the sanction of dismissal would stand; further notes that principal Neumann was persecuted for protecting his learners from being exposed to COVID-19 as the WCED forced schools to reopen at the height of the COVID-19 peak, an instruction which the progressive principal failed to adhere to after he consulted with the parents and SGB of the school; rejects the former MEC's ultimatum and calls on the new MEC Maynier, to do the right thing and drop all the frivolous charges against principal Wesley

Neumann. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Mr G BOSMAN: Object!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Objections.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, we object.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Object that it is moved without notice.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: There are objections, the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Mvimbi?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Chairperson. I move without notice:

That the House notes with a great sense of sadness the bus crash that claimed the life of a 2-year-old toddler and left scores of others injured outside George on Saturday; notes further that the bus carrying 35 people, including a rugby team, staff, supporters and

family members was traveling back to Wittedrift close to Plettenberg Bay after playing rugby at NMMU Saasveld near George, where it crashed down an embankment in the Wilderness area. It is believed that they had apparently taken this road through the back of the Wilderness to connect to the N2 at the Saasveld road, also known as Madiba Drive, which has been closed due to flood damage that occurred in November 2021, thereby placing the blame on provincial and municipal authorities for the fatal crash; wishes all the injured persons a speedy and full recovery; and conveys sincerest condolences to the parents and family of the deceased 2-year-old toddler. I so move, hon Chairperson.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: The motion has been put. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Mr G BOSMAN: Object!

Mr L L MVIMBI: †Hayibo! [No way!]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): I object to this being moved without notice.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Object!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: I have to ask, I just got ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, but there ...[Audio distorted.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: I mean, we do not want to object to the motion, but that he squeezed in a line there. That is just totally wrong.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Mvimbi. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Chair, I do not think you need to give reasons why you object. You must just say 'object' or ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Correct ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...move with things ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, thank you ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We do not give reasons here, hon Chair ...[Interjection.]

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Chair ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): And you should not do it ...[Audio distorted.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Point of order. Thank you! ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We do not many ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Take your seat, hon Sayed. Thank you for ...[Interjection.]

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Sit down!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Chair?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. There are objections then, yes. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Thank you. The next motion is that in the name of hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Thanks very much, hon Speaker and good afternoon to everyone. I move without notice:

The House notes that Africa Day was celebrated on 25 May 2022, under the theme that focuses on the importance of addressing malnutrition and food insecurity across the continent of Africa; it

further notes that Africa Day was founded on 25 May 1963 by the Organisation of African Unity, to celebrate and acknowledge the successes of the organisation in the fight against colonialism and apartheid; also notes the month of May is recognized as a month to promote and uplift African unity and to recommit Africa to a common destiny; in line with this year's theme, especially given the rapid increase in the cost of living globally, recommits this House and the Provincial Government to put all efforts in place to cushion the poor from all walks of life from the devastating effects of the rising cost of living and poverty; and calls on the House to join efforts to curb the spread of Operation Dudula in the Western Cape and enhance the spirit of African unity. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. The motion has been put. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No? There are no objections, therefore, agreed to. The last motion is again in the name of the hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon House Chairperson. I move without notice:

That the House notes and commends the newly established Oliver Tambo and Yusuf Dadoo Trust on Palestine and the projects it has

launched to create solidarity links with families of Palestinian political prisoners; notes further that the Tambo-Dadoo Palestine Legal Fund has identified the main project of family-to-family contact between families in South Africa (and, later, elsewhere) and families of Palestinian political prisoners; calls on the members of this House and the members of the public in the Western Cape to reach out to the Trust to participate in this revolutionary act of solidarity; and to condemn the continued atrocities of the apartheid Israeli regime, which include the incarceration of approximately 5,000 male prisoners, about one hundred female, and even teenage boys. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. The motion has been put. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Objection.

Mr G BOSMAN: Objections.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, there is an objection. No interjections, please, hon Sayed. The Motion will be printed on the Order Paper. That concludes Motions without Notice and brings us to the last item. The Secretary will read the Order of the Day and before the

Secretary starts ...[Interjection.]

Ms L M MASEKO: There is a hand raised, hon Chair. There is a hand, hon Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes? Whose hand is that?

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Chairperson, it is my hand. I would like to know if I can rise on a motion without notice?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, did I miss that one, hon Bosman?

Mr G BOSMAN: I think so, hon Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, please proceed then.

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: It is not on the Order Paper.

Mr G BOSMAN: I move without notice:

That the House notes that the ANC member of the Legislature, Andile Lili, has been convicted of incitement to murder and common assault,

in the Bellville Magistrate's Court; and I would like the House to further note that member Lili will be sentenced in August 2022 ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Bosman. The same Rule that I have quoted earlier today, I believe, applies. So please, I rule you out of order. That concludes then Motions without Notice and I call upon the Secretary to read the Order of the Day. Thank you very much. I will now be vacating the seat. I want to say thank you very much, hon members, for your cooperation. I really enjoyed it and I hope you will also have a fruitful remainder of the meeting. Thank you so much.

ORDER OF THE DAY

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill [B 6–2022] (NCOP), dated 6 May 2022 (see Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, No 48, dated 6 May 2022, p 201) (Ratification of Final Mandate.)

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr Secretary. Hon members, there will be an opportunity for parties for a three-minute declaration, should the parties so wish. I now afford the opportunity to the ANC.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Chairperson. On behalf – can you hear me, hon Speaker, sorry?

The SPEAKER: You are audible, hon Mvimbi, you may proceed.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. On behalf of the African National Congress, I rise to support this Bill. The ANC acknowledges and accepts the increased allocation for the Provincial Government of the Western Cape. The increased Provincial Equitable Share will benefit the people of the Western Cape to alleviate the socio-economic issues that the province currently faces. With more provision made in the education sector, this will aid in alleviating unemployment, as well as the challenge it has currently faced by the Western Cape, of people having to sit out on an academic year due to no placement.

With an increase of 3,6% from 2021 to the 2022 fiscal year, the Provincial Equitable Share accounts to 77,45% of the Provincial Total Receipts, while the Provincial's Own Receipts have a 3,57% decrease, amounting to R90,72 million. Local Government Conditional Grants allocation have increased with a focus in infrastructure, which will contribute to employment creation, economic growth and productivity in the province. The Provincial Government should stop protesting about budget cuts, especially on Education and acknowledge the increase if they want to alleviate these challenges.

The equitable share formula is a work-in-progress, and we hope that the Provincial Government can cooperate with the National Government in supplying constructive proposals in the development of the formula. The

African National Congress supports this Bill. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mvimbi. Hon members, I now recognise the EFF.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): †Enkosi Somlomo. [Thank you Speaker.] On behalf of the Economic Freedom Fighters, we reject the Division of Revenue Bill and we further do not have any declaration. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Makamba-Botya. I see the hand of the Deputy Chief Whip of the DA. Do you have a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): You can see my hand is up ...[Audio distorted.] slot comes up, so that you just know which person is doing the declaration.

The SPEAKER: Oh, so you will be speaking on behalf of the DA?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes. Hence, my hand is raised for when the slot comes up. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. You may lower your hand. I will recognise that at the right time. Hon members, I now recognise the GOOD party. Before then ...[Interjection.]

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Hon Speaker, no declaration, thank you.

The SPEAKER: No declaration? Thank you, hon August. I see the hand of the hon Deputy Chief Whip of the ANC.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, I rise on a point of order where I was going to rise at the commencement of this sitting, but then, as the hon Speaker, you had left the seat and asked the hon Van der Westhuizen to chair.

I would just like to raise a concern when we have seen that the DA has issued a statement around the hon Speaker and the investigation. The hon Speaker has then gone to the media. I mean, is it? I would just like to – my point of order is, would it not then be proper at least for hon Van der Westhuizen to continue chairing till the end of this sitting, given the current controversy that is surrounding things. Just for the sake of the smoothness of the House, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you. Thank you, hon ...[Interjection.]

Ms L M MASEKO: That is not relevant.

The SPEAKER: I was just trying to understand what is the point of order, and having listened, I did not find any reason to write ...[Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: It is those ...[Audio distorted.]

The SPEAKER: Because that is not ...[Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: ...a matter that really resonates with the Standing Rules as we see them. So, the point of order is thereby discarded. May I then request? I see there are also some other hands online. Hon Marran?

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Speaker, *ja*, mine was also a point of order, hon Speaker. I just wanted to say: those who are saying it is not relevant will tomorrow vote against you ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. ...[Interjections.] Thank you, hon Marran. I have no comment [Laugh]. That is not a point of order. May I – I see the hand of the Minister of Social Development. Is that a point of order, Madam?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Sorry, hon Chairperson. Hon Speaker, on a point of order, that is almost casting aspersions on hon members. So, you are right. It must be disallowed. Thank you. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You are a former Speaker ...[Audio distorted.]

An HON MEMBER: Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. I thought you missed me. [Laughs]
May I just, as a matter of course, proceed with the business of the House?
I do not see what we are dealing with here now. I do not want any further
deliberations on this matter. There is no agenda called. So, can I then
proceed, please? We are in the middle of serious business of the House,
and can I allow the other parties to also, please, have the opportunity to
express themselves? ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order, hon Deputy Chief of the
ANC?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, the hon MEC of Social
Development is out of order. There is no 'almost casting aspersions'. You
either cast aspersions or ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...or you do not cast aspersions.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Deputy Chief Whip.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): This Chamber has raised, and my points of order must be noted.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: The hon Speaker has ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): There is a public discourse out there that is having an impact ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you!

Mr G BOSMAN: You are not a teacher, hon Sayed. Please sit down! ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please, take your seat.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...of this House and the DA wants to run away from those things ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Deputy Chief Whip ...[Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Sit down! You are not a teacher.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): And we will sit on those

...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat, hon Sayed. I think ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You are not the hon Speaker.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): On a point of order?

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. I have made a ruling on this matter, and I thought you are rising on a different matter, and the hon members have spoken, and they have been talking on the same matter which is not before us. I have expressed a decision on that matter as the Presiding Officer. Let us respect the Presiding Officer. The decorum of this House can only be maintained by us respecting our Rules. The Chief Whip of the DA: is it on the same matter, Madam?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, yes, thank you. You have ruled. Can we continue ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Yes, yes.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...with the serious business of the House?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, madam Chief ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker, mine is on another matter. It has got nothing to do with you chairing or not chairing.

Ms L M MASEKO: There is nothing with ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order hon ...[Interjection.]

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): ...to do with the Order of the Day.

The SPEAKER: Can I have one member speaking at the time? Hon Dugmore, what is your point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, you may – I am not sure whether you were following the procedures earlier, but you may have noticed that the hon House Chairperson made a ruling that before any member can raise a point of order, they need to cite in terms of which Rule that point of order is being raised. I then pointed him, I indicated to him the provisions of Rule 66 and he then did respond in a manner that was not clear.

I wonder if you, in your capacity as Speaker, could just clarify that because nowhere in Rule 66 does it actually say you have to cite a Rule. You just have to be compliant with 66 itself, obviously, and there are references there, as you know, hon Speaker, to issues of procedures, practice, operation of the House, a complaint of unparliamentary conduct,

et cetera.

So, could you just clarify whether you share the understanding that it is not necessary for a member of this House to quote a specific Rule, in terms of which they are raising a point of order? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon Leader of the Opposition. I was not presiding when this specific matter was dealt with you as you have related. I will, however, engage with the Table staff and I will be advised of the deliberations and, of course, consult Hansard. The Standing Rules will be applied consistent with the Standing Rules itself. May I then ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Speaker, thank you.

The SPEAKER: ...attend to it on that basis, so the next session will advise on those matters. May I please proceed, hon members, with the ACDP. Hon Christians?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. The ACDP considered the Division of Revenue Bill. We cannot support this Bill. Although there is an increase in the conditional grants and other additional funding, we have certain concerns.

Certain concerns are: Eskom returning the infrastructure grant, the using of old data, old census data, the data gaps experienced by Treasury and also, we are not sure if the Presidential Employment Initiative will go beyond two years and that is why we cannot support the Bill. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. Hon members, I now recognise the Freedom Front Plus. Hon Marais?

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Hon Speaker, for the first time, I must agree with the previous hon speaker. I cannot see myself supporting this Bill. The Census was a disaster, complete disaster and I do not think that this Province has done justice to itself, to determine exactly how many people are in this province so that we can get our equitable share, which will then accrue to this Province. I do not want to make a long speech. There will be enough time in future sessions to air my views on this, but this is a horrific negligent behaviour of both National and Provincial, not to make sure that there is an efficient census count having been taken. So, I cannot support this.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais. I now recognise Al Jama-ah. Hon Brinkhuis?

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, Al Jama-ah fully supports this Bill. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Brinkhuis. Hon members, I now recognise the DA. Hon Deputy Chief Whip of the DA?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. The Budget Committee has examined this Bill from all angles. While we do welcome the increase of the Provincial Equitable Share allocated to the Western Cape, it is simply not enough to erase years of budget cuts. Whichever way you look at it, the Western Cape is still being short-changed by National Government. The increase in funding to the Western Cape should be seen in the context of cost-of-living increases.

Hon Speaker, hon member Mvimbi is correct that the increase is 3,6%, but that is less than inflation reaching 5,9% year on year in March this year, at the time the Bill was received. The increase in funding suddenly seems much less notable and it is now estimated that inflation might even become 8%. So, let us not play with numbers.

Hon Speaker, we must also mention that the Provincial Equitable Share is based on outdated Census data from back in 2011 and with the state of the current Census, the next decade will be based on inaccurate data again. Furthermore, the PES formula is not comprehensive enough with issues, such of huge importance in our society, such as Gender-Based Violence and special needs education, receiving no allocation in the PES formula.

Hon Speaker, regarding Provincial Grants: all, but one of the Provincial

Conditional Grant Allocations will either be decreasing in percentage terms or increasing less than inflation over the MTEF period, creating a risk for service delivery in key departments. The process through which these grants are allocated is also lacking in transparency, creating yet another opportunity for corruption and Government inefficiency. The lack of innovation from National Treasury regarding grants is unacceptable, but unexpected from a National Government that has shown little innovation across their departments.

We have the same grants being moved around and redistributed, but no new grants have been created for the new challenges we are facing regarding energy, technology, jobs. Even the outstanding quality of government in the Western Cape is not enough to paper over the cracks left by the lack of funding from National Treasury, meaning it is once again the citizens of the Western Cape who are being let down by National Government.

Hon Speaker, for these reasons the Democratic Alliance does not support this Bill and we request the House to support the ratification of this report. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Deputy Chief Whip of the DA. Hon members, I have to, at this point, indicate that that is the end of the declarations. In terms of the attendance in the House, we have about 30 members: 17 DA, 8 ANC, 1 EFF, 1 GOOD, 1 ACDP, 1 FF Plus, and 1 Al Jama-ah. That then constitutes the quorum for the purposes of adopting

this particular Bill.

May I indicate to the hon members that the question that is put before us is for the House to adopt the Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill, conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the National Council of Provinces, not to support this Bill; that this report be ratified and adopted. Are there any objections to the request of the Committee?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes!

Mr G BOSMAN: No.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Not.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Yes.

The SPEAKER: Okay.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): No objection.

The SPEAKER: I think I can – I just want to put the question. Those in favour of the report being adopted, please say ‘aye’?

Mr G BOSMAN: Aye.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Aye!

HON MEMBERS: Aye! Aye!

The SPEAKER: [Audio distorted.]... Those, thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Too late.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Those not in favour of the report, please say 'no'?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No!

An HON MEMBER: No.

The SPEAKER: I think the 'aye' ...[Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: No!

The SPEAKER: I think the 'aye's' have it. The report has thus been ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Ah, hon Speaker ...[Audio distorted.]

The SPEAKER: ...adopted as per the request not to support this Bill. I am

going to indicate to the hon members that the vote 'no', will be recorded as such and it has been noted. The report, therefore, of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill has been adopted.

Hon members, it has been a great day, it has been a beautiful session and unfortunately, †nezindab'ezimnandi zihamba zihambe ziphele. [good news spreads and spreads and comes to an end]

So, we have reached the end of the session and that concludes the business of the day, and the House is thereby adjourned. Thank you very much.

The House adjourned at 16:48.