
THURSDAY, 25 MAY 2023

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid Sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The SPEAKER: Please be seated. Order members! I have to announce that due to the termination of membership of Mr S N August of the GOOD party, a vacancy occurred in the representation of the GOOD Party in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. This vacancy has since been filled by the nomination of Mr P T De Villiers with effect from 23 May 2023. Mr P T De Villiers was sworn in, in my office, on 23 May 2023. Please allow me, members, to take this opportunity to welcome hon De Villiers to the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. [Applause.]

Members, before we proceed I would like to remind members about some of the logistical arrangements. As has been our practice to date hon members will participate in the Sitting of the House both from the Chamber, with the Presiding Officer and the Table staff, and via Microsoft Teams. Our Standing Rules have accordingly been amended to accommodate for this hybrid Sitting of the House.

The hon members experiencing challenges in connecting to the Sitting are requested to contact the WCPP ICT colleagues who will assist to resolve their connectivity challenges.

The quorum requirements, members, for the Sittings, are provided for in the Constitution and the Standing Rules. Unless there is an indication of unanimous concurrence, voting will be confined to members present in the House and on the hybrid system, who are entitled to cast their votes as per the ATC issued on 11 August 2020. Members present in the Chamber and via Microsoft Teams have all the privileges and immunities imparted by law. Members who are considered out of order by the Presiding Officer will have their microphones muted and called to order. The Serjeant-at-Arms will record members' attendance.

In instances where these Directives do not cover a particular eventuality, the Standing Rules must apply and in instances where the Standing Rules cannot be applied the Ruling by the Presiding Officer is final.

Members, all microphones have been muted. However, for those hon members participating in the Sitting of the House via Microsoft Teams, you are requested to use the raise-hand functionality of the system when you desire to raise a point of order, and I will recognise you. When an hon member in the Chamber wishes to raise a point of order, such an hon member may address the Presiding Officer, as expected, but must mute their microphones when they have completed speaking.

Hon members participating in the Sitting of the House via Microsoft Teams are requested not to sign into Microsoft Teams on more than one device, unless the second device is used with earphones for Language Translation Services.

Hon members of the Media have also been granted access to the MS Teams meeting as guests of the WCPP. However, members of the press may not use the Chat Room or Speak or activate their cameras while the Sitting is in progress. If an individual member who is not a member of the House activates their microphone and video camera such an individual will be exited from this Sitting immediately.

I also would like to take this opportunity to request that those who are here today, who are not members of the House, to please observe the decorum of the House. For the Sitting, hon members, Language Translation Services are available in the Chamber, as usual, and on Microsoft Teams via the respective channels.

Hon members participating in the Sitting of the House must please access the Language Translation Services via a second device and if you have ear-phones available please use them for the Language Translation Services.

Hon members, I would like to remind you that no interjections are permitted during these hybrid Sittings and to this end I draw your attention to Rule 40 of the Standing Rules. With that being said, hon members, I now recognise the Chief Whip.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 20(1), that deals with the sequence of proceedings, that precedence be given to the Subject for Discussion.

Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Chief Whip. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved by the Chief Whip?

No objections? Agreed to.

We will now deal with the Subject for Discussion in the name of hon C Murray as printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Murray.

SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION

The National Government's lack of urgency in securing South Africa's status in terms of the African Growth and Opportunity Act (AGOA) and the subsequent implications for trade and economic growth in the Western Cape.

Ms C MURRAY: Hon Speaker, hon Premier of the Western Cape, hon members of the Provincial Legislature, to our province's farmers and farm workers, to our business people and entrepreneurs, and, most importantly, to the residents of the Western Cape. This Africa Day, I rise to open a debate on a matter of serious concern for the people of this continent, this country and this province. The African Growth and Opportunity Act (AGOA) is a lifeline that provides African countries with preferential access to the massive US market. This US Act will expire soon and is set for reauthorisation in 2025. South Africa's inclusion in any renewal or even expansion of the useful provisions within this Act are being jeopardised by the ANC-led National Government. It is being drawn into question by their questionable actions. To put into perspective how important AGOA is for international trade, the industries that benefit most include automotive industry, metals and jewellery and agriculture. Of the top 10 exports from South Africa to the US, five come from the Western Cape alone, which means that it will be this province that will be hardest hit if we are excluded from

AGOA. What is more, the amount of money that South Africa earns from exporting goods to the United States increased from R417 million in 2001 to R1,9 billion 2021. That is a massive increase. There can be no doubt that AGOA is actively growing our province's economy and creating jobs.

Hon Speaker, this Africa Day, I want to emphasise to the people of this continent, of this country and of this province, that we must ensure South Africa's inclusion in future versions of AGOA. We cannot allow the reckless actions of the ANC to demonstrate loyalty to Russia at the expense of our relationship with our biggest trading partner. We cannot stand by idly while the ANC turns a blind eye to the atrocities committed by Russia in Ukraine. It is time we call a spade a spade. The ANC is indebted to and even scared of Russia and that is why they are doing their bidding.

Speaker, that is why the ANC is condoning colonisation of Ukraine. Putin began his colonising exercise by annexing Crimea in 2014... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms C MURRAY: ...and has now colonised the Donbas region. This is being done at the expense of countless Ukrainians as well as Russians. This is the very same thing that the ANC fought against, and they should be hanging their head in shame for failing to condemn these actions. There has been a marked lack of urgency in representing South African interests in the US by the ANC National Government, when they have attempted to engage with the

US on AGOA, attempts have been sorely lacking with the recent delegation to Washington scheduling their visit while Congress was on recess. This meant that they failed to meet with any influential figures involved with the renewal of the Act, and so my question, Speaker is, what exactly did they do in the US? Did they have a nice holiday?

This Africa Day there can be no doubt, the ANC does not care about African interests instead. Instead they are ambassadors for Russian colonialism. The ANC claims that they are unaligned when it comes to Russia's invasion of Ukraine, but they are placing South Africa on the side of the aggressor. We saw this with the murky dealings with Lady R in Simon's Town, and we saw it in the National Government's participation in war games with the Chinese and Russian militaries in Durban earlier this year. The ANC Secretary-General himself has said that the National Government will welcome Putin here tomorrow if they could, despite the ICC warrant requiring us to request and arrest him for his war crimes. This will undoubtedly push us closer to the exclusion of the very important and much needed AGOA Act. Instead of addressing these issues with the necessary urgency, the ANC is advocating for Russian colonialism at the expense of empowering our African brothers and sisters. By now it should be abundantly clear that it would be disastrous for South Africa to lose out on AGOA. Not even the staunchest most loyal ANC member across the aisle could deny this. Unlike the ANC, the DA-led Western Cape Government takes South African's inclusion in AGOA seriously. We, the DA, represent African interests.

I was part of a delegation that recently visited California, where we raised this risk with our state counterparts and reiterated our Province's friendship with the US and commitment to strengthening our bilateral ties. The Premier himself will also be going to Washington to lobby on behalf of the Western Cape and South Africa. We all need to work together to ensure our inclusion in AGOA. If there is one thing that makes that makes our markets uncertain and unclear of investing in a country, it is uncertainty itself.

I have further invited the Department of International Relations and Cooperation, as well as the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition, to appear before my Standing Committee. We need clarity, clear blue water, on their plans to lobby for the inclusion within AGOA, as well as their efforts to expand sections of the Act which could provide much needed boosts to our economy.

The fact of the matter is that if we are excluded from AGOA we are going to bleed jobs and harm the province's economy. The preferential access to the US market means that our exports are much more competitive than those of countries that are not included in AGOA. Should this access lapse, American importers will simply look for cheaper alternatives from our competitors outside of the country and outside of the continent. This will leave our local businesses and farmers with a huge shortfall, but Speaker, Putin, who is fixated on colonising further corners of Eastern Europe, will surely not help our economy fill this shortfall. The result will be the scaling down or even closing our businesses, meaning that all residents will end up suffering in the

end.

Just think of the farmers and the farmworkers who need to provide for their children. The ANC is putting their lives and their livelihoods at risk.

Agriculture is one of the most significant industries when we talk about AGOA and it accounts for 251,000 jobs within this province alone. How many of these jobs will be left alone if we are excluded. How many will we lose? The fact of the matter is that even if we lose one job, it is one job too many in this climate. Speaker, this Africa Day I reiterate that the ANC is not representing African interests, but that the DA is. Under the ANC, inflation has spiralled out of control, with the repo rate set to increase again. Our economic outlook remains bleak and is already buckling under the pressures of endless load shedding but under the DA, we see mass job creation and tangible strategies to turn around this failing state. Speaker, I thank you.
[Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Murray. I now recognise hon Sayed. Order, members, there is a member on the floor.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. As the hon Murray indicated, we are celebrating Africa Day today. It is very...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members! Please take your seat. Hon members, there is a member on the floor. Can I please ask that both on my left and on my right, that you allow the member on the floor to deliver his input into the debate? Thank you, hon Sayed, you can continue.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. It is very ironic that the party that defends the interests of colonialism in this particular country defends the ill-gotten gains of apartheid, defends the atrocities perpetrated by the Zionist State of Israel, is silent on Sudan, is silent on Western Sahara, can so glibly speak about colonialism today; can undermine what President Nelson Mandela told the Americans when he said that they must not expect their enemies to be our enemies.

Nevertheless, Speaker, in the past the ANC has welcomed debates in this House sponsored by the DA, despite some serious matters being used to score cheap political points.

However, the ANC has never thought that the DA and its member, the hon Murray, would stoop to such low levels as to conjure up issues and sponsor fake news as discussion items. One feels compelled to ask... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, please take your seat. Hon Murray, is that a point of order?

Ms C MURRAY: Yes, Speaker. Speaker, will the hon member take a question? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat, hon Murray. Hon Sayed, are you prepared to take a question?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No.

The SPEAKER: The hon Sayed, before you continue... [Interjections.] Hon members, before you continue hon Sayed, let me address the hon Murray. Hon Murray, hon Sayed is not prepared to take a question. You may continue hon Sayed. [Interjections.]

Hon Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Mr Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members, there is a member on the floor.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Mr Speaker, I am sure we have started on a good note, and I would really urge you to take note of frivolous points of order because member Murray – Murray-whatever. [Interjections.] English is not my language.

The SPEAKER: No-no.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): If I were to pronounce *gubule* I would have done it very good.

The SPEAKER: Honourable, order members!

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Unlike the Premier here who cannot even pronounce *gubule*. By the way, the hon stood up... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...and said she wants to raise a point of order, but then she asked whether member Khalid can take a question and you did not entertain that. I find it really wrong because you could have or should have immediately pointed out what she did was wrong and not honourable. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Alright, members! Members, as per the Standing Rules and I am not going to entertain this. When you rise, then you indicate if you have a point of order and whichever manner in which you want to raise that point of order. The hon Murray wanted to ask or pose a question from the hon Sayed, as per the Rules, I posed the question to hon Sayed, if he was prepared to take that question. He was not and that was the end of the point of order.

Members, can I please ask that you allow the member to continue and that you please work with me today so that we can get through this very long Order Paper. Hon Sayed, you may continue.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): One feels compelled to ask, where was the hon Murray in the last few weeks when President Ramaphosa sent his A-team led by his National Security Adviser to the United States to secure our relations with the United States? Where was the hon Murray in the last two weeks when the US Ambassador to South Africa himself reaffirmed through a Tweet that his country and ours under the ANC-led National Government enjoy a strong partnership. Maybe the hon Murray must tell us whether AGOA and South Africa's disqualification from the Programme was raised by her with any American official during her visit to the USA, because for the rest of the delegation of which the hon Marran was a member, the issue of AGOA and South Africa's participation being in jeopardy was not discussed by the Americans themselves. In fact, the hon Marran informs me that DA members of the delegation kept stoking the AGOA-issue in their recent visit to the United States, but US officials, in their wisdom, dismissed them trying to raise the issue. In fact, even the US Consul-General cautioned about raising the issue. No, the hon Murray cannot tell us that it was a concern for US officials, because it is simply fake news to suggest that South Africa's participation in AGOA is at stake. The hon Murray may be part of a right-wing conspiracy that wants to promote fear based on ignorance.

We have seen how right-wing Republicans in the US, a fringe group whose sentiments did not resonate with the rest of the Republican caucus in the US Congress, wish to promote a tough stance against South Africa. These right-wing Republicans have attempted to put pressure on the administration of President Biden to alienate South Africa. These are the same Republicans who defended apartheid against economic sanctions and whom the hon Murray wishes to align herself with today.

Luckily, the ANC's relationship with the Democratic Party in the US has been able to weather many storms and we will count on this historic relationship to further the interests of our respective nations. The relationship between the ANC-led administration in Tshwane with the Democratic Party-led administration in Washington, remains resolute and firm. The relationship between the governments of South Africa and the US are strong.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, please take your seat. Hon Deputy Chief Whip, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes, Chair, it is a point of order in terms of Rule 51. As member Sayed often reminds us in this House, one must speak through the Chair of the House or the Speaker of the House to the member, and not directly to the member.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you very much. Please take your seat, hon Deputy Chief Whip. [Interjections.] Thank you very much. Hon Sayed!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Inaudible.] I did speak through the Speaker; I did not address the member.

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, I am on the floor. I am on the floor. Members! Hon Sayed, can I just caution you or remind you to speak through the Chair when you address a member?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, I am doing that. The relationship... between... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Of course, a caution does not mean... Hon Sayed, please take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon, no it is not. A caution is not a transgression. It is before a transgression occurs. Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. The relationship between the governments of South Africa and the United States is strong. American interests in our country are secure. South Africa's position in AGOA is secure, and there is no reason whatsoever to believe that the ANC-led National Government has not reiterated its belief in the bonds with the United States, yet, while the DA, through the hon Murray, wishes to spread fake news and create scarecrows, the DA continues to use misinformation campaigns to spread fear, like with the Employment Equity

Campaign, as they are doing this with this debate.

Let us look at the facts of the relationship between our country and the United States. Today, the US remains the Western Cape's top foreign direct investor. The US directly contributes in excess of 100 FDI projects totalling more than \$2,3 billion US dollars... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members! Order, members! [Interjections.]

Members, members on both my right and left hand, there is a member on the floor. Please allow the hon Sayed to make his contribution. It is my responsibility to protect the member on the floor, so hon Sayed, I will do so. Can I please ask members that you work with me? Hon Sayed, you may continue.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): The ANC acknowledges this, and we will work for more US investment in the Western Cape. The US is the third largest export market after Namibia and the UK to which goods from the Western Cape are exported. The ANC remains committed to expanding the province's export market. AGOA allows for 18 of our province's 25 exports to the US to be exported duty-free, hon Speaker. Our ANC-led National Government is conscious of the immense benefits of AGOA, and we do not take these benefits for granted. While we must appreciate and welcome the exporting of citrus, leather and seafood, we must also promote the export of more wine, jewellery engine parts, and boats. The latter products are manufactured goods, and these are much more labour intensive industries than the primary goods, which the DA continues to promote. Labour intensive

industries simply create more jobs, hon Speaker.

Speaker, 224 years ago, the US President, John Adams, sent his country's first diplomatic representatives to the then Cape of Good Hope. One of the most admired quotes by President Adams, and I hope the hon Murray, who sponsored this debate, is listening, said, and I quote:

"I fear that in every elected official, members will obtain an influence by noise, not sense; by meanness, not greatness; by ignorance, not learning; by contracted hearts, not large souls. There must be decency and respect."

Speaker, today, for the sake of decency and respect, let us not spread fake news for political points. Today, for the sake of our farmers and our manufacturers, let us not promote cheap fake news of suggesting that our National Government does not wish to secure South Africa's position in AGOA. Nothing can be further from the truth. As elected members, as President Adams said, DA members must resist the temptation to be influenced by noise and rather choose sense. They must not look at election sponsorship for 2024. The DA must choose learning over ignorance.

The ANC in this House, hon Speaker, will continue to strengthen the relations between our country and the US by engaging with local US diplomats and business people. Notwithstanding our critiques and our foreign policy positions, the ANC in this House will continue to reassure the US of our country's matured relationship with its foreign partners, where it

may well express certain concerns, especially in regard to international order and the questions of Palestine, Cuba and Iran... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, your time has expired. Please conclude the sentence.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...as it did with the ANC conference discussion. I am concluding. The motion of this debate, therefore, cannot be further from the truth. It is simply fake news. South Africa's position on AGOA remains... [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed. Please take your seat. Thank you, hon Sayed. Hon members, I now recognise the hon Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM: Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, the individual member of the DA who sponsored the debate seems to know much about what is happening in National Government regarding international trade agreements involving nations and states, more than pertinent issues affecting our province. The core of the question at issue is more interested on the losses of what white farmers might incur if the current agreement with the United States of America under the African Growth and Opportunity Act is not renewed when it eventually lapses in 2025. Speaker, we live in a province with a huge gap of inequality, where the majority of black and coloured people remain unemployed and are deliberately denied access to opportunities to own land and farm.

Whilst it is true that the AGOA benefits the agricultural sector in the province and in South Africa, by extension, with duty-free access to agricultural products, and whilst it is true that such benefits add to the GDP of the country, with this agricultural products eligible to receive duty-free accesses under the AGOA, are 661, but South Africa is currently only using 44 of those.

The truth of the matter is that this agreement benefits white farmers in this province, who continue to be rich at the expense of black and coloured farm workers, who are exploited and abused daily on those farms across the province. The DA is simply trying to protect the wellbeing and economic interest of whites at the expense of black and coloured people of this province. That is why there has never been a Subject for Discussion from the party speaking about equality and transformation either in South Africa or this province.

The USA continues to use trade agreements, such as those under the AGOA, to try and influence African countries' foreign policy. Today they are insinuating that the AGOA agreement with SA might not be renewed if our country does not make changes on its foreign policy, especially when dealing with countries such as Russia and China. This makes it pertinent that colonialism continues to remain in place in a form of trade, but the more we find alternative ways and better opportunities for trade elsewhere as a country, the better it will be. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Cassiem.

Hon members, the next speaker will be hon De Villiers. I am just reminding members both on the virtual and in the House, this will be the member's maiden speech.

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor, hoor! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear! [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon De Villiers, you may continue. Order members! [Interjections.] Order, members! It is the member's maiden speech.

Mr P T DE VILLIERS: Hon Speaker, to prepare for today I scanned the internet to get up to speed with all the news headlines about our beloved Western Cape. What I found was a province that seems unhappy with just being a province, a province that wants to play in the World Cup of global politics, arrest Russian President Putin and directly negotiate deals with the US; a province more invested in its anti-ANC position than improving the lives of the masses.

Hon members, this raises the question. The question is not about whether we support Putin's invasion in Ukraine – we do not – or whether we do not believe in the benefits of securing South Africa's status in terms of the US African Growth and Opportunity Act – we do! The question is on what should we focus? Take AGOA, it is a country-to-country incentive that the US offers to certain African nations and is of massive significance to our

fruit and wine export industries in the region.

The Western Cape does not have the power to sign its own deal with the US, but it does have the power to positively change conditions for struggling workers in the agricultural sector.

It has the power to demand that the portion of AGOA's benefits actually benefit those who produce the fruit. Our region is considered among the most unequal in the world, yet our regional Government is more focused on being seen as a global player, who then is watching out for our people?

Hon Speaker, it is simple in rugby: we have national and local competitions. The Stormers cannot play in the World Cup. Understanding... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Members!

Mr P T DE VILLIERS: Understanding in which league the Western Cape sees itself playing will better equip me to account to my constituency...

The SPEAKER: Hon De Villiers, can I please ask that you conclude? Your time has expired.

Mr P T DE VILLIERS: ...and contribute constructively to the next debate in this House. I thank you, Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon De Villiers. I now see the Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities, hon Wenger. [Interjections.] Order members, there is a member on the floor.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thanks to the hon Murray, through you, for sponsoring this debate. There is no denying the fact that we as a nation and as a province face significant challenges. There is also no denying that we as a nation and especially here in the Western Cape, have immense potential to realise the kind of breakout economic growth that we need to create jobs that will pull people out of poverty and create the kind of future that we hope to see our children inherit, and each and every one of us in this House has a responsibility to do everything in our power to make sure that we work day and night to ensure our collective future, our collective tomorrow, is better than today. Part of this responsibility entails working with other countries, specifically our key trading partners, to secure, promote and expand access to markets for our goods.

AGOA, a preferential trade programme, which was launched in 2000, was initially set to expire in 2008. It has since been extended and amended several times, providing an economic lifeline to many African countries, not least South Africa – Africa's most advanced economy. The programme allows a range of products from eligible African countries to duty free access to the US, one of the largest consumer markets in the world. It has helped bolster South Africa's economic development in recent years

and facilitated job creation, foreign direct investment and the expansion of local industries.

It is in this context that the ANC-led National Government's inexplicable stance on the Russia/Ukraine conflict raises concerns about its level of responsibility and care. The National Government's stance on this contentious and polarising issue could potentially sour trade relations with our key trading partners and provide a knockout blow to an economy that is already on the ropes, amid rolling blackouts and inflation woes, which threaten to worsen inequality, poverty and unemployment.

It is economic suicide. Not only has AGOA put proudly South African and Western Cape products on shelves in the world's largest consumer market, the United States, but it has had immense benefits for the people of our country. Our nation stands at a critical juncture where strong leadership and decisive actions are needed to safeguard our trade relations with the US, including our benefits under AGOA. It is imperative that the National Government urgently reconsiders its position for the greater good of the nation and its economy.

In the Western Cape, we are on a mission to enable the kind of economic growth we need to create jobs so that we can lift people out of poverty and create a prosperous future.

It is with this in mind that we recently finalised and adopted the New Economic Growth Strategy for the Province Growth for Jobs. Our vision, as contained in this ambitious strategy, envisages a trillion-rand jobs rich,

inclusive, sustainable and resilient provincial economy that is growing between 4 and 6% per year in real terms by 2035. At the heart of this plan is the understanding that it is the private sector that creates jobs and that Government's role is to enable its success.

The key to unlocking this potential lies in the actions we take to enable and support a business friendly environment that facilitates trade, exports and investments, which lead to job creation. These are also key provincial competencies that are given to provinces by the Constitution. Expanding export of products and services, including international tourism and enabling access to global markets, are key to break-out economic growth for the Western Cape economy. Exports create opportunities for our domestic producers to expand and to diversify their customer bases and products and grow their businesses, which is why our growth for job strategy sets out to triple the value of exports, including tourism, and this, of course, entails not only continuing and sustaining current trade deals, but seeking to enable further growth through renewing critical and undeniably beneficial trade agreements like AGOA. So let us put it in context.

South Africa and the Western Cape have traditionally benefited from a good relationship with the United States of America. Since the launch of AGOA, South Africa's exports to the US grew from 4,4 billion in 2001 to \$15,5 billion in 2021, and, according to data compiled by Wesgro, which is the official Tourism, Trade and Investment Promotion Agency for the Western Cape, 70% of South Africa's agricultural exports to the United States

relied on AGOA in 2021, 70%.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: 70%, hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Five of the top 10 AGOA qualifying products exported from South Africa to the US came from this very province... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: ...with a share greater than 89% in 2021. At the same time Western Cape exports to the US grew from R2 billion in 2001 to R16 billion in 2022.

A recent survey by Wesgro in which 44 exporters participated, over 60% of those that export to the United States, indicated that they use AGOA. Two thirds of respondents from SMMEs and large-size businesses indicated that AGOA had a significant impact on the growth of their businesses.

Looking at investments over the last 20 years, the US was South Africa's top source market for inward foreign direct investment projects and the second largest based on capital investment. This accounted for 20% of FDI Projects and 14% of Capex. For the Western Cape foreign direct investment is intrinsically linked with the exposure we get from AGOA. Over the same period in our province, the US has also been the top source market for inward

FDI in terms of Capex and the second largest based on the number of projects.

In the last 10 years, the US has been the number one source market for FDI in the Western Cape, investing R30,6 billion into 68 projects, which represent 29% of all Capex investments in our province. These facts clearly indicate that AGOA provides significant job creation, trade and investment benefits for the Western Cape.

We also benefit significantly from US tourism, and in 2022, the US was our second largest source market for tourism, supporting many jobs and injecting a significant amount of spending into the provincial economy. So based on these facts, it simply beggars belief that the National Government would jeopardise such a beneficial relationship, especially considering the significant headwinds that we face.

At the end of the day, the benefits we, as a country and a province, get from AGOA, are clear. The stats do not lie and clearly show that it is in our best interest to work with the US in good faith to renew this preferential trade agreement. Ultimately, it is not only billions of rands, millions of tonnes of goods, citrus fruits, wine, flat-rolled steel and yachts that are at stake, what is at stake are the livelihoods of hundreds of thousands of jobs and the ability of people across this country to put food on the table.

Speaker, it is our responsibility to do everything we can to ensure that AGOA is renewed, because it is our responsibility to fight for the people of the

Western Cape. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I now recognise the hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, taking into account the benefits that AGOA brings to our economy, we must do everything in our power and that is why this debate is so important that we do not lose this agreement with AGOA. We must fight because it affects the people of the Western Cape. We know what AGOA does to this province and to this country, but now the question in the media is the relationship between the US and South Africa is on shaky ground and lawmakers in the US is calling for AGOA to be revoked and not to be renewed in 2025 so the question is, Speaker, why is this relationship on shaky grounds and the question must be posed, is the ANC putting their coffers for 2024 ahead of the people of this country, because that is what they are doing. They are warming up to run because they are filling up their coffers for the election for next year. That is what is happening here. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

That is what is happening here, and the important thing, Mr Speaker, is... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: When you vote for the ANC, you are going to vote for

unemployment. When you vote for the ANC, you are going to vote for load shedding. When you vote for the ANC, you are voting for doom and gloom, and that is what is happening today, so it is time that the ANC puts the voters first and not their pockets first, because you see, Mr Speaker, we are representing the people of this country, we are not representing political parties. We are elected by the people to speak on behalf of the people, and we are saddened by the fact that the President is quiet. They were asking where is the South African Ambassador in the US? They confined him, so I do not know what hon Sayed is talking about. They confined; he is silent. He rather responds through Twitter. You do not do that. This is serious matters, and this matter must be addressed urgently, so I welcome the debate. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Christians, your time has expired. Can you please...

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians. Hon members, the next speaker is on the hybrid system, so hon Brinkhuis. [Interjections.] Order, members! Can I please ask that the members in the Chamber please allow hon Brinkhuis. He is on the hybrid system.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you, very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, a five-year research on curbing illicit financial flows and tax injustice in Africa, estimates that Africa, which includes South Africa, ku Azania, has

lost in excess of \$1 trillion US dollars in illicit financial flows in the last 50 years. These illicit financial flows affect the continent in several ways, such as weakening the prospects of realising the sustainable development goals which aims to put an end to poverty. The illicit financial flows have a negative impact on the domestic revenue of our country and that of developing countries. How can one expect growth that is challenged by illicit financial flows? The negative impact of IFF is of great concern and should be tackled. The African Growth and Opportunity Act AGOA should raise IFF as a critical stalling factor continentally as well as the external influences and internal developments.

To say that the National Government lacks the urgency in securing African growth and opportunities, which impact negatively on the economic growth in the Western Cape, is an unfair statement. The whole country is negatively impacted by the weak structural growth and the pandemic further increased the socio-economic challenges. The Government needs the cooperation from all three spheres and business sectors to help curb the illicit financial flows. South Africa cannot afford these huge losses, which attributes to unemployment, poverty and loadshedding. If the country can stop IFF and channel the monies into housing, employment opportunities and other sectors, these will make a huge difference in our communities and not put the sustainability of public finance at risk. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Brinkhuis. Hon members, the next member is hon Sileku.

Mr I M SILEKU: To my friend and colleague, hon Klaas, happy African Day!

Hon Speaker, Nelson Mandela once said:

"The African Growth and Opportunity Act is a historic opportunity for Africa to trading its way to prosperity. AGOA has already helped to create millions of jobs in Africa, and it has the potential to create even more. I urge all African countries to take advantage of AGOA and to use it to build a better future for their people."

Hon Speaker, South Africa is a major African hub and not only has AGOA helped to promote regional integration with the international markets, but it has also helped to connect South Africa with other African countries, and it has helped to promote the growth of regional trade.

Hon Speaker, there is a tale of two narratives that shaped the destiny of South Africa's economy. It is a story that compares the remarkable benefits of AGOA with the unsettling implications of the ANC's cosy relationship with Russia. Let us begin with AGOA, the African Growth and Opportunity Act, a trade agreement that has become one of South Africa's greatest blessings, AGOA has served as a bridge connecting South Africa to the United States, fostering a trade relationship that has seen our exports soar by almost R400 billion. Through AGOA, hon Speaker, local businesses have flourished, creating thousands of jobs and injecting vital... [Audio

disconnects due to technicality.]

Business of the House suspended at 15:00.

Business of the House resumed at 15:11.

The SPEAKER: Please be seated. Thank you very much, hon members, and my apologies for that technical glitch or technical gremlin that we had to deal with.

Hon Sileku, you may continue, I just want to indicate to you, you have four minutes and 21 seconds remaining.

Mr I M SILEKU: Hon Speaker, due to widespread corruption and maladministration, South Africa last experienced economic growth in 2014, when the country's GDP grew by 1.5%. Losing AGOA status would further exacerbate the economic struggles of South Africa, already plagued by downturns and would make it more difficult for South African businesses to compete with businesses from other countries that have AGOA status. This could lead to an even greater decline in investment in South Africa as businesses will be less likely to invest in a country that does not have preferential trade access to the US markets.

Hon Speaker, we have seen allegations of corruption and the so-called "Lady Russia Gate," which cast a shadow over the integrity of our Government and

its commitment to transparent and accountable governance. This scandal has put South Africa at severe risk of losing its AGOA status. It is indeed disheartening to witness political aspiration taking precedence over the needs of our people. The ANC's alignment with Russia, allegedly fuelled by billionaire oligarchs' financial support, has led to dire consequences. The Lady R vessel, supposedly laden with weapons destined for the Russian shores, has become a symbol of this ill-fated affair. Innocent lives in Ukraine hang in the balance, casualties of a political dance disregard human welfare.

It is crucial to address these issues head-on and ensure that our economic interests are not compromised. As the Democratic Alliance, we will continue to hold the ANC accountable for their actions and demand transparency in all dealings related to AGOA. We believe that the economic prosperity of our province and our country should not be subjected to hidden agendas or political alliances that prioritise personal gain over the welfare of our citizens.

However, within the shadows, a ray of hope emerges from the DA-run Western Cape. We have consistently advocated for the extension of AGOA beyond 2025, recognising its paramount importance as the most vital trade agreement.

Hon Speaker, while the ANC in the Western Cape is trying for the fourth time to arrange their Provincial Conference that should have already happened in 2019, our Premier, the Premier of the people, the Premier that

has been acknowledged by the former President of the Republic when he was in the NCOP, DD Mabuza, is preparing to meet with various stakeholders of the United States Congress and Senate. His mission is clear, Speaker, and there is only one thing on his mind, to encourage and to convey the immense potential and undeniable benefits that AGOA bestows upon both our nations.

My fellow South Africans, in this critical juncture, it is essential to avoid getting tangled in the ANC-perceived alignment with Russia as we risk overlooking the profound influence and potential benefits that the United States holds for our nation.

As responsible citizens, we must transcend the swab of political games and set our sight on securing the long-term prosperity that AGOA can offer South Africa. South Africans are not worried about aligning to anti-Western ideology. They are worried about jobs and about the future of South Africa.

AGOA not only grants us preferential access to the largest consumer market in the world, but also fosters trade relationships that can stimulate our economy, create employment opportunities and bolster our global standing. By remaining steadfast in our commitment to AGOA we navigate intricate international relations while advancing the economic well-being of our citizens and securing a brighter future for South Africans.

I thank you. Baie dankie. Enkosi kakhulu. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Sileku. Hon Marais. The one is hon Marais and the other one I would introduce as the Minister for Cultural Affairs and Sport, the Minister Marais. So now I am saying, hon Marais, you may continue.

Mr P J MARAIS: I am honoured. I am honoured. Speaker, the AGOA since 2000 has allowed South Africa to export on a preferential basis goods worth billions of rand to the USA. At the time the world labelled the African continent as "inherently corrupt", and they said, "no handouts any longer," and they were correct.

The USA's foreign policy became one of trade, but never aid. 2021, 53%, South Africa's total exports went to the USA and European Union countries. Platinum exports to the USA alone amounted to \$71,1 billion. Converted, it is R1,208 billion. That is platinum.

Other substantial exports are wines from the Western Cape, and South Africa's auto industry. It is absolute political madness therefore, to risk losing these USA and possible EU markets, simply to repay Russia for their power-struggle support given to the ANC. It is to be hoped that the President could have succeeded in placating the USA with reassurance that BRICS will not force them into the Communist camp. It boggles the mind that the supposedly "liberation movement" should support and side with a Communist dictator who goes on committing criminal acts on civilians in the Ukraine.

It is also incomprehensible that our President, co-drafter of South Africa's supposed liberal constitution... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It is the racist himself now, speaking there.

Mr P J MARAIS: ...has fallen politically in love with one of the world's most oppressive dictators in geopolitical terms, but it is also exasperating that our President, who sleeps on mattresses filled with millions of US dollars, allows black children to die in squalor ... [Interjection, speaking simultaneously.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Racist, listen to the racist.

Mr P J MARAIS: ... from cholera and dirt-infested water in Hammanskraal. The question can be asked, is he fit to be a President? Why has he not been removed yet? Unlike leaders, ANC leaders like Walter Sisulu, Nelson Mandela and Albert Luthuli... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Marais, please note... [Inaudible, speaking simultaneously]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Hon Marais is speaking about our leaders; focus on the topic. Focus on the topic. [Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: The ANC has no more leaders of integrity and wisdom, whose names are revered and shouted out on campuses... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais, your time is up... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You do not speak about any... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You racist, your time is up.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, please note that the next speaker is also on the hybrid system. Hon Windvogel, I recognise you.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Speaker. Am I audible?

The SPEAKER: You are indeed audible.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you. Speaker, allow me to agree with the hon Sayed and state that this debate is a mere scarecrow in our relations, especially for trade and economic growth with the United States. There is no need for our National ANC-led Government to give urgency to secure our country's AGOA status, because it is firmly secure. The hon Sayed is also correct that what the hon Murray attempts to do through this debate is align herself to white right-winged elements within the Republican Party in the US. Yet this debate must also make us reflect maturely on our relations with the US, and in particular, AGOA. We must be able to ask ourselves as Africans and South Africans, whether we will remain dependent on AGOA or whether we will be able to develop a self-sustaining relationship with the United

States, the reality is that AGOA has also had negative effects. For example, it has had a devastating impact on our chicken industry.

If the hon Meyer wants to be honest, and I believe he is, then you would reflect honestly on how, because AGOA American chicken was dumped onto our market in recent years. We have yet to come across a South African chicken farmer that supports AGOA. South Africa is said to be Africa's top chicken consumer and number 4 in the world. There should be no reason why our chicken producers are struggling as they do. More than 65 000 tonnes of US chicken are dumped onto the South African market annually.

Speaker, according to our own provincial Department of Agriculture the West Coast is said to hold the most potential in expanding the poultry-producing sector and we can only imagine how many jobs will be created if the sector was able to do without chicken dumping from the US. In fact, we are told that 3% or 4% of job losses in the poultry sector are due to US chicken-dumping.

"For every town 10 000 tonnes of imported chicken, we lost 1000 jobs," said the South African Poultry Association's Kevin Lowell. Speaker, while we acknowledge the many benefits we receive from AGOA, it is simply not a partnership. It is a one way policy between the US and Africa, from which individual African countries benefit. As Africans, we had no say in how the US formulates this policy and we can well understand that this is how the DA does things, what the *baas* says, must go. Well, a modern democracy wants a partnership, not patronage.

We must also be able to convey to the United States the outcome of our analysis of their recent trade policy trajectory. We are all aware that in the last decade we have seen an upsurge in US protectionism and an American industrial policy, which has had China in mind, but which has negatively affected all other developing countries. In fact what one analyst have suggested was that the war in Ukraine has simply exacerbated the fragmentation of the global economy because of US economic policy rather than seeing its integration.

While we can agree that the war in Ukraine has increased the rise in cost-of-living crisis globally, we cannot divorce from this rise in inflation from the trajectory of US trade policy and the protectionism that this has perpetuated even before the Trump administration. At the same time, we simply do not have the fiscal capacity to subsidise our farmers and producers to compete against their European and American counterparts, while the Biden administration's trading with Sub-Saharan Africa seems to favour the imports of raw materials, such as palladium... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Windvogel, please note that there is a point of order in the Chamber, so the time – we have stopped the time. So hon Deputy Chief Whip, what is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): It is not a point of order. I wanted to find out whether member Windvogel is willing to take a question?

The SPEAKER: Alright, hon Windvogel, the Deputy Chief Whip is asking if you are prepared to take a question?

Ms R WINDVOGEL: No, Speaker, no.

The SPEAKER: Hon Deputy Chief Whip, the member is not prepared to take a question. Hon members, please note that there is a member on the floor. Please allow the member to continue. Member Windvogel, you may continue.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, Speaker. In all of this, it will therefore be foolish to think that we are simply beneficiaries of AGOA. AGOA comes at a cost. Yes, according to our own poultry industry, the benefits of AGOA outweigh the disadvantages, but we must be able to have a frank and honest conversation with our US counterparts and as the ANC we can assure this House, our National Government is leading such discussions.

As a result, we must, as a continent, a country and a province, diversify our target market for export. We cannot be dependent on one export market and if the truth be told, the DA has jitters today. This debate takes place today simply because while the rest of our country has been diversifying their markets for export, this Province has simply over-relied on the US market. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Windvogel. We move on to the Minister of Agriculture, Minister Meyer.

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor, hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker. Firstly, let me welcome the past matriculants from Lentegour and Portlands in this House. [Applause.]

We are very happy that you are here in this House and thank you to hon member, the Minister of Mobility, that they have invited you. We are pleased to have you in this House today.

I would also like to welcome the hon Mr De Villiers. In my previous capacity as the Minister of Sport. I worked very closely with you, admired you and still admire you, but our politics in this House is going to be robust. [Laughs.]

I would also like to inform you, hon member De Villiers, when you do not have a National Government, you do not sit here and wait for things to happen. Like in the energy crisis, you rise to the challenge. This Government in South Africa is missing in action. We have no precedent and so we are into the geopolitical landscape internationally because the Government and our Ambassador in Washington, Nomaindiya Mfeketo, was absolutely missing in this very critical, important debate. So it is your job, it is my job to fill the space.

In politics, the first law of politics, †moenie dat mag rondlê nie, die ANC laat die mag rondlê [don't let power lie around, the ANC leaves power lying around].

You grab the power. That is politics.

Also I want to thank hon member Ferlon Christians, a fantastic brilliant speech. That is why I understand our friendship over 20 years. Thank you for a brilliant speech. We can see the fruits of investment that was made by your mentors. One of them is in the House.

I want to also thank an excellent speech by Isaac Sileku. Thank you for understanding that context. Hon member Peter Marais, thank you for supporting the correct side of history, because I will now juxtapose people who are on the wrong side of history. You are on the correct side, sir. So thank you very much for that. So, hon Speaker... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, there is a hand up on the virtual platform. Please take your seat. Hon Kama, is that a point of order?

Mr M KAMA: Yes, hon Speaker. I want to check, hon Speaker, whether is it parliamentary for the Leader of Government Business to say in the House that we do not have a government nationally, as that might lead to anarchy in the country and he would have taken an oath of office to protect the Constitution,

and accordingly... [Inaudible, speaking simultaneously].

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama, that is not a point of order. This is a political debate, and one cannot have more political or freedom of speech outside of the House, so I am not going to curb freedom of speech in this House. Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker. I rise to take part in the debate on South Africa Government's reaction and to the implications of AGOA.

Hon Speaker, there are moments in history when nations have to be decisive and take a decision and decide whether you will walk the road of darkness or whether you will choose opportunity and prosperity.

Hon Speaker, there are moments in nations, in their history, where leaders must choose the right side of history. Hon Speaker, when your nation is at a crossroads, and South Africa is now at a crossroads, your decisions must add up to be on the right side of history.

Hon members, the governing party in South Africa made decisions and defined their sides in the history of our nation. Hon members of this House and my friend, hon member Klaas, will know that the governing party is on the wrong side of history in respect of Nkandla, Marikana, Phala Phala, Eskom, SAA, SABC and state capture. On the wrong side of history.

Hon Speaker, the governing party in South Africa is now continuing to be on the wrong side of history. Instead of supporting global efforts towards peace, human rights and democracy, the South African Government is choosing the wrong side of history, supporting Russia, a terrorist state, recently being declared by the European Parliament as a terrorist state. When you attack and invade a sovereign nation you are violating international law. The South African Government chose to support Russia and its killing machines in Ukraine.

The question that comes to mind in the international community, did South African Government supply weapons via Lady R in Simon's Town. We do not know the full truth, but what we do know is that South Africa was on the wrong side of history in respect of [Inaudible.] AGOA trade agreement now and grey-listing.

I met the US Ambassador two weeks ago in his office in Pretoria at the Embassy and he spoke to us about what happened in Simon's Town, and for this House – he is a naval officer by trade, by career, by profession [Interjections.]. He knows what happens at naval bases around the world. He is a career naval officer.

An HON MEMBER: He is a submarine [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: And so – he is not only naval, he is a

marine officer, and he, and I quote, this is what he said to me, he said:

"Weapons were provided ..." ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE:

"... to Russia on Lady R."

And he said:

"And I bet my life on it."

Diplomats never speak like this unless they put their life on it, and in this case he has put his life on it and so we know who is on the right side of history.

Hon Speaker, Ambassador Reuben Brigety, he was angry because †Suid-Afrika se totale uitvoere na die VSA is R275 miljard. Ons invoere uit die VSA is R123 miljard. Dit laat ons met 'n positiewe handelsbalans van R152 miljard. AGOA, soos in hierdie debat uitgekome, bied verskillende Afrikalande, geselekteerde lande, marktoegang vir ongeveer 1 800 produkte. [South Africa's total exports to the USA are R275 billion. Our imports from the USA are R123 billion. That leaves us with a positive trade balance of

152 billion. AGOA, as emerged from this debate, offers various African countries, select countries, market access to about 1 800 products.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat.

Hon member Sayed, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Chair, I think the hon member Meyer must tell us – it is a point of order – whether the hon US Ambassador lied when he apologised about the assignments ...[Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: He is misleading – he is actually ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... casting aspersions on the US Ambassador. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He is misleading the House.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon member Sayed, that is not a point of order. When you rise on a point of order you request or you point

out the point of order, you do not go ahead and pose the question or make your comment.

Hon Members, let that be ...

[Audio disconnects due to technicality.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... US dollar in 2020. Ford had announced an investment of R1 billion, creating jobs, creating opportunities for the youth.

There are two responses in the context of AGOA. You can support AGOA and create jobs, or you can reject AGOA and kill jobs. We know who is on the wrong side of history. Nkandla, Phala Phala, Marikana, Al-Bashir, the evidence is all documented, and so, Hon Speaker, the Premier of the Western Cape, Mr Alan Winde, will soon visit the United States to campaign for the renewal of AGOA, and hon member of the EFF, wonderful, great, but AGOA is not a trade agreement, it is an Act of the Congress.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: So it is completely different from a trade agreement. It is an Act, and our Premier will go to the US, meeting with our colleagues in the Congress ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... in Washington.

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat.

Hon Deputy Chief Whip of the Opposition, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Hon Speaker, yes, point of order.

The hon Minister is addressing the hon member Cassiem directly. He should be speaking through you. I did not address anyone directly, for the record. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Alright.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you very much for that useless input ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you – hon Minister, please take your seat.

Hon member Sayed, I note your point of order. Hon Minister, please can I remind you to please speak through the Chair if you want to address a member of the House. You may continue.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, through you. Hon member Cassiem, thank you for your input.

Also, Hon Speaker, AGOA is now up for review. When? In 2025. Am I worried? Obviously am I worried because we must create opportunities for the youth. They must get jobs, but I am worried, but there is hope in the end of the tunnel. In 2025 when that Act comes under review in the United States, there will be a new government, Mr De Villiers, in South Africa. [Applause.]

So we are worried, but to be honest I do not worry anymore because there will be a new government in the Union Buildings, and we will renew the AGOA Act in Washington. The Premier is leaving next month to make that road for us clear [Interjections.]. You do not sit and wait for the Government, there is no government.

An HON MEMBER: Yes! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: You step into this space [Interjections.]. That is what the Premier is going to do. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: We cannot stop [Interjections.] – we can stop the economic bloodshed that will follow if AGOA is scrapped. Next

year's election gives us a golden opportunity to vote the ANC out ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... and choose to be on the right side of history.

An HON MEMBER: Yes! Yes! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: The right side of history, not on the wrong of history [Interjections.]. Voters will have that opportunity [Interjections.]. We can and still and must save South Africa. Saving AGOA will help us in rebuilding South Africa because we know that top agricultural products, seven of the top 10, hon member Klaas, through the Speaker, top 10 of those products that are exported, seven of the 10 have an agricultural footprint.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time has concluded. Please conclude.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, this is a sad moment for me, but I must conclude.

Our citizens are ready to vote out the corrupt ANC, immoral ANC, spineless ANC.

An HON MEMBER: Ja!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Watch out, as Bishop Tutu said ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... watch out, it is coming.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister, please take your seat. [Applause.]

Hon members, thank you very much. That concludes the debate.

We will now move on to the next Order of the Day, or the next Order on the Order Paper, and that is Interpellations as per Rule 197. I recognise the hon member Allen, hon Minister Allen.

INTERPELLATIONS

1. Mr F C Christians to ask Mr R I Allen, Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety:

What has the resultant impact been on the community of the closure of

the satellite police station in Brown's Farm?

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much, Hon Speaker. Please allow me to also at the onset to say welcome, through you, Hon Speaker, to hon member De Villiers, a man who has broken ceilings in terms of what he has achieved in terms of your career as a rugby coach. †Ek is geëerd om vir u te kan sien vandag. [I'm honoured to be able to see you today.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I am also wanting to indicate, Hon Speaker, [Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
The young ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Hon Minister, please speak to me. [Interjections.]

Hon member Marran, there is a member on the floor [Interjections.].

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

Let me say, Hon Speaker, also to the young people from Mitchells Plain, although I did not attend the high schools that the young people attended in Mitchells Plain, and I was just down the road in Glendale, we do know that from Mitchells Plain, from Drakenstein, regardless of where you are, young people are rising up and they are playing a significant role.

Hon Speaker, I want to also on this particular interpellation say thank you to hon member Ferlon Christians. Hon member Ferlon Christians also played a vital role since August 2021 when this particular matter was in the media.

As a way of background, we have seen, via a visit to the satellite office in Brown's Farm, when information was received, that that particular station was closing down at 5 p.m. on a daily basis. That then led, and to echo the sentiments made by the LOGB to hon members De Villiers, is that I then at the time wrote to the previous National Minister of Public Works, who have failed to act, seeing that that particular satellite office and that building was owned by the National Department of Public Works, and it was then rented by PRASA, all national competencies, and they have failed in their particular way of service delivery there.

So to answer the question specifically, and I want to read it for the record, Hon Speaker.

"What has the result and impact been on the community of the closure of the satellite police station in Brown's Farm?"

The community of Brown's Farm and surrounding areas have been severely negatively impacted and affected by the closure of the satellite police station in Brown's Farm.

The satellite station serviced a large area, namely Section 3 and 4 of the Nyanga policing precinct, which at the time, Hon Speaker, was also the murder capital of our country.

Even though the station was a satellite it played a huge role in terms of combatting crime within the sector. Schools in the surrounding area have been affected by drugs and gangsterism, which can be attributed to the lack of SAPS visibility in the area. The health sector also, Hon Speaker, was negatively affected as doctors and other clinic staff, as well as patients, have experienced numerous robberies. Businesses and trade in the area have also been severely affected as delivery vehicles, big and small, have become a target of hi-jacking, and, Hon Speaker, this is a serious matter for this particular area and we have consistently, even by the Standing Committee, raised this particular matter.

From any administrative policing business, for example, we have seen where for affidavits, community members must then commute to Nyanga Police Station which, via a taxi, is a one way taxi ride, which could cost between R10 and R15, which for many people in that particular area is unaffordable.

The physical building that used to house the satellite station has been

vandalised and it is feared that this may become a nest for criminal activities in this particular area.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister.

I now recognise the hon member Christians.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Minister, for that answer.

Hon Minister, the biggest problem is when police are not even safe in their own building, no running water, no electricity, and inadequate fencing, and then we also know that a policeman was killed just 600 metres away from the satellite station.

So what happens now? Nobody is safe ...[connectivity problem.] and a failing National Government, but my question to you this afternoon is, at your MINMEC meetings, because it is not just one specific police station in the Western Cape that is under-resourced, it is quite a few of police stations that we visited in the Western Cape that we see holes in the floor.

So my question is, I know it is under Public Works, but surely the police must take responsibility for the safekeeping of their own members. Their own members are not safe. What about the community? How can we ask them for service delivery if they themselves are not safe?

So this is a big concern, it is a big concern and I am pleading that you do something. Your Department has got oversight, you are now called Police Oversight and Community Safety, to please look at the situation. People are being robbed, people are being mugged. You know all of that. I am giving you the facts, but this is what we have, that people are not safe. Even the refuse removal services said, "We cannot go into the area."

So what do residents do now? They burn the rubble, they burn the garbage and think of the health issues with the closing of that police station. So it is shocking to see that nothing has been done so far.

So in your role, in your oversight role you will have to drive this hard so that we can at least make sure that our police are safe, but also that to communities there are services. I thank you, Hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Christians.

I now see hon member Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you very much, Hon Speaker, and many thanks to Minister Allen for that comprehensive response.

I find it very interesting that we did not get more information from the South African Police Service through the Minister's response, especially since we know that SAPS has maintained the line, that this police station and the

community are inadequately serviced without that satellite police station.

What worries me about this, particularly the line taken by SAPS, Hon Speaker, as you would know recently there was a high profile assassination right at that facility, at that satellite police station that is no longer open. The activists, Loyiso Nkohla, was shot and killed in broad daylight at this facility in question.

So through you, Hon Speaker, I would like to ask the Minister if any investigators from the main station at SAPS has assured us it is perfectly equipped to serve ...[connectivity problem.] has made any progress in bringing Mr Nkohla's killers to justice, and whether the Minister has found that adequate policing is taking place in that Brown's Farm area. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Bosman.

I now see hon member Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Thanks, Hon Speaker. Good afternoon, hon Premier, and hon members present.

The hon member Christians must remember, he must know that people are getting robbed in streets where there are no streetlights. He must remember that the garbage that he is talking about is garbage that is not being removed by the City of Cape Town. He must remember the poor access roads into the

squatter camps are not the responsibility of the police, but the responsibility of Government, and those are the things the MEC should focus on and make sure that those services are rendered to that community.

Hon Speaker, MEC Allen on 3 March 2020, in his response to Mr Christian's written question on the same matter, clarified that community safety is not compromised by the closure of the satellite station. The MEC also explained that in the intended reopening of the new satellite station in the area, it will further enhance policing efforts and the community policing the area has been strengthened for the implementation of the Safer City concept, and that there is a functional CPF in Nyanga, with the [Inaudible.] residing in Brown's Farm and representing Sector 3 and 4 of the CPF SAP forums.

We must assist hon member Christians to understand that safety in Brown's Farm will not be improved by the re-opening of the police station alone. It needs this Provincial Government to install streetlights, CCTV cameras and improve accessibility in informal settlements. It must enable communities to play a vital role in the fight against crime.

These are the kinds of issues MEC Allen should respond to. We welcome the progress made to implement the Safer City concept after nearly three years' delay. For this strategy we can combat crime and violence and half the murder rate in the province by 2029. The MEC must tell us when the Safer City concept will be fully implemented in the province.

We are saddened by the murder of Comrade Loyiso which took place in close vicinity of the police station. We urge the hon member to desist from politicising the heinous and barbaric act. We reiterate our calls to SAPS to leave no stone unturned in investigating the murder and bringing the perpetrators to justice. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marran.

I now see hon member Christians again.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Hon Speaker.

You know, I do not even want to respond to hon member Marran because the issue is not about refuse removal. The issues are people are scared of their lives. That is why they cannot move into the area.

Now the ACDP is on record saying this all the time. It is time that we devolve the police powers to the provinces and municipalities because the ANC [Applause.] – because the ANC ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: ... is incapable to keep our people safe and they will excuse and make excuses and make excuses, but I want to say this, the people have opportunity to vote ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: ... the ANC out in 2024 and they must do it because their lives are at stake. We have one lifeline in 2024 and that is to get rid of the corrupt ANC that does not care for our people. I thank you.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: We want [Inaudible.] Chairperson.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, on both my left and right ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] Chairperson.

The SPEAKER: I – hon members. [Interjections.] Hon members, when there is a member on the floor, I mean can you please respect that that member has an opportunity to make his or her contribution? This constant commentary on both the right and the left is hindering the member on the floor to have an opportunity to do so.

Can I please ask that you allow and respect the fact that there is a member on the floor and when it is your turn, we will ensure that you get the same rights.

Thank you, hon member Christians. I now see the Minister, hon Minister Allen.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

Thank you so much, Hon Speaker.

Hon member Christians, I can give you my assurances that this matter has already been tabled at MINMEC. Guideline 35 in terms of our oversight responsibility over the South African Police Service also indicates that the MEC, and in this case the Provincial Minister in this role that I am occupying, sign off on the priority needs in terms of infrastructure.

I have made that abundantly clear in terms of that particular station at Brown's Farm.

I would want to correct hon member Marran, through you, Hon Speaker. He read a parliamentary reply which he attributed to myself, which he said community safety has not been compromised by the closure of the satellite station. I do want to correct the hon member in that in my capacity as oversight there is a number of queries that we will directly refer to the South African Police Service, and the parliamentary reply, Hon Speaker, will actually indicate for the record ...[connectivity problem.] service. I will repeat again, the reply of the South African Police Service.

So we have given the South African Police Service the opportunity to provide

that feedback. However, hon member Marran attributed that particular wording to myself, which is not the case, and for the record once again I can confirm that we have seen that that particular area has been affected by the closure of the station.

Hon member Bosman, thank you so much for your input as well. I am fully aware, Hon Speaker, that certain information I am unable to put into the public domain in this regard, but I can confirm at this point that the case that hon member Bosman referred to, has been ...[connectivity problem.] officially known as the Directorate of Priority Crime Investigations and from the feedback that I have got, and I triple-checked again actually earlier this morning, Hon Speaker, on this particular case, that there have been developments in that regard, but I am unable to make any further information public at this particular stage, but the investigation is at an advanced stage, and we would ideally want to see those perpetrators behind bars as soon as possible.

Then in closing I would want to again echo the sentiments expressed by hon member Ferlon Christians, that it is high time that policing powers be devolved. I am also able to confirm via a letter that I have received, which I have also shared with the Cabinet, in which other provinces are reaching out, and one particular province, called the beautiful KwaZulu Natal, actually wrote to me two weeks ago wanting to visit, where they are wanting to undertake an exchange, and they are wanting to learn from our best practices, from our experiences and what we have been calling in terms of a new

policing model.

So it is definitely so that the call made by the hon Premier is resonating stronger and stronger, and that particular call is rising across our beautiful country and not only here in the Western Cape. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister.

Hon members, that brings that brings us to the end of Interpellation 1. We now move on to Interpellation 2.

I see the hon Minister, Minister Mackenzie.

2. Mr L L Mvimbi to ask Mr R D Mackenzie, Minister of Mobility:

With regard to the resumption of train services on parts of the Central Line: (a) What is the contribution of his Department to the process to date and (b) how will his Department support the National Government's efforts to fast-track the process?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, Chairperson. Thank you, Hon Speaker of the House, and I also want to welcome our youth for Mitchells Plain. I appreciate it that they took the time to spend with us this afternoon in the House, particularly on such an important topic, the Central Line.

So the first question is, hon member, how did they get here? I want to

appreciate Parliamentary Services for bringing the youth here, but they got here by taxi, they did not get here by train. Why not? Because the Central Line is not working.

So I wanted to demonstrate the visuality of what happens when state institutions fail. I travelled by train yesterday myself, the ticket was R8. A ticket from Mitchells Plain to Cape Town is R8; taxi fare R25. Three times the cost.

So this is a very important question by hon member Mvimbi and I am certainly honoured to participate in this interpellation. Hon member Mvimbi, the Central Line has not been operational since 2019 due to safety concerns and infrastructure caused by vandalism and theft ...[connectivity problem.] significant impact on commuters who relied on the Central Line as a primary mode of transport, as I just earlier demonstrated. The situation has been exacerbated by the onset of COVID-19 and the lockdown regulations, and the condition of the Central Line has been deteriorating significantly over that period, recognising the critical importance of the Central Line to commuters of the Metro and the Mitchells Plain community, particularly where these youth are from, because they cannot use the train because the station is dysfunctional.

The Western Cape Mobility Department entered into a memorandum of understanding with PRASA to cooperate towards restoring the Central Line as well as exploring interim solutions. The MOU was signed in May 2020. A

number of interim solutions were explored and the WCMD proposed to PRASA a form of rail replacement service along key stations. Unfortunately this proposal was never further developed due to the instability caused by continuous organisational changes within PRASA.

At the beginning of 2020, PRASA approached the WCMD and sought assistance with the control and the eradication of vegetation within the rail services. The rail services, the yards and the infrastructure sub-stations were overgrown due to the non-award of vegetation contracts with PRASA. Vegetation close to and on railway lines and infrastructure poses a significant fire hazard, especially during the dry season. As our colleague, hon Minister Bredell, will tell you, we have thousands of fires, so the Western Cape Mobility Department (Transport at the time) knew the risk and therefore appointed and mobilised their own EPWP workers to rapidly respond to PRASA's needs. Since then PRASA has not requested any further assistance despite us continually offering to assist them.

Another key element in which the Department has played an important role is facilitating the identification of suitable land on which to relocate the illegal settlements on the Central Line. This is a critical activity which, without the Central Line, cannot be restored. The Department has reviewed available Public Works property as well as facilitating early discussions with the then Department of Human Settlements, and it remains to this day.

The Department is also part of the Steering Committee for the [Inaudible.]

priorities set up for this crucial project. More recently the Department has had a number of engagements with executive leaders of PRASA as well as the PRASA Board Chair, which meetings were held with myself in Cape Town and Johannesburg, which we facilitate in helping to restore the Central Line, and I have said it before and I will say it again, meetings were also arranged by myself, the Premier of the Western Cape, Executive Mayor of Cape Town, of which PRASA Chair cancelled at short notice and I want to thank the Premier Alan Winde and the Mayor for making themselves available. So we consistently do whatever we can to do that.

So there are solutions that need to ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time has expired for your first input.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Okay, thank you.

The SPEAKER: So you have another opportunity at the end.

I now see the hon member Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Good afternoon, Hon Speaker and hon members. Hon Speaker, can you hear me?

The SPEAKER: You are indeed audible, hon member Mvimbi, you may continue.

MR L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, Hon Speaker, and thank you very much to hon Minister Mackenzie for the input and the response. Although it did not really address some of the issues in a practical way, except to say that there was just a memorandum of understanding.

Hon Speaker, the Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa has been struggling for years to relocate the families now living on the Central Line. PRASA has to work with the Provincial Government of the Western Cape to assist these families to move. Not so long ago I did stand here on the same issue on how the Western Cape Government, the City of Cape Town, are dragging their feet when it comes to the restoration of the Central Line and its full operation and that solution is supposed to be a practical solution, not in the form of a memorandum.

The issue of relocating the families that are on the Central Line needs a practical solution, but I can assure you, Hon Speaker, in spite of all this I would not be surprised that once again there will be more blame game that is going to come from the Provincial Government and also from hon Minister Mackenzie. I am expecting that he is going to give a very constructive response and stop putting blame every time they must actually act practically on issues of provincial government.

This of course – I would not be surprised if that blame game comes, because every time the Provincial Government is unable to perform its duties they

will always blame the National Government.

Last week the National Minister of Transport, Sindisiwe Chikunga, in her budget speech, indicated that the full recovery of the Central Line remained the National Government's top priority. [Connectivity problem.]... the National Department of Human Settlements has also provided the City with R111 million to address the railway relocation. That is now a practical solution to a practical problem. National Government will of course need the cooperation of the Province in order to restore the Central Line for its full operation.

Of course it also brings us to the question as to what has the Department of Mobility done to support and assist PRASA in the restoration of the Central Line? I understand the issue of the memorandum of understanding. The memorandum of understanding is just paper that is written in agreement, but there must be practical realisation of that, but up to this stage I hear the Provincial Minister says that it has only gone as far as signing a memorandum of understanding, but to me that is not a practical solution to the problem.

As a province that wants the devolution of power ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mvimbi ...[Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... this Provincial Government ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... your time has expired.

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... has done ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mvimbi, your time has expired. Thank you very much.

I now see the hon member Sileku.

Mr I M SILEKU: Thank you, Hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, I think what our hon member Mvimbi should be doing is actually to thank and congratulate Minister Mackenzie, since his appointment to trying to bring the Central Line into action, because you cannot miss him, he is everywhere. He is on Twitter, he is on Facebook, he is on WhatsApp. He is running [Interjections.]. He really wants the Central Line to be back [Interjections.]

You know, it is in the taxi – and what is funny is that the question about fast-tracking is coming from a cadre of Thambo, like hon member Mvimbi called themselves [Interjections.], knowing that since 2019 deadline after deadline has been pushed and pushed. It is truly a stunning display of consistent incompetence as it seems their commitment to delays and broken promises knows no bounds.

Just last week through a parliamentary question it was revealed that the new

Minister's deadline once again has been pushed back. It appears that the National Department's promises are as reliable as a chocolate tea pot.

Hon Minister, has your Department identified any potential bottlenecks or areas of improvement in the current process? If so, what steps would be taken to address them and accelerate progress? †Want ons mis die Trans-Karoo. Baie dankie. [Because we miss the Trans-Karoo. Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

Hon members, I now see the hon member Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, Hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, as a province the Western Cape is one of the provinces that wants the devolution of power in rail, and unfortunately this Provincial Government has done nothing to show that it is worth that devolution of power.

The funds allocated by the National Department of Human Settlements have not been used by the City, with the excuse that they are nearing the end of the financial year. The DA-led Provincial Government stated that they had no funds available, no funds available to assist towards the relocation of the informal settlement on the Central Line, but when they were given the funds to do so they come up with more excuses and even more blaming games.

I hope that in response the hon Minister is actually going to give us this practical solution because up to this stage we believe that the Provincial Government has done nothing, whereas PRASA and the National Government are on record on practical solutions that they can actually bring to this, and of course we know that we are also not going to shy away from the fact that the DA is the sole reason for the slow pace of this Central Line relocation process.

Might I remind you, Hon Speaker, that it was the very hon Mackenzie of Mobility that was berating PRASA before his current appointment as the Mobility Department, for dumping people in Mitchells Plain, and I can see again he is continuing on the same ground of keep on blaming PRASA and not bringing a practical solution, and unfortunately I acknowledge the fact that even hon member Sileku says that the Minister is all over, taking joyride and taking selfies and taking pictures, but he is not actually attending to the actual problem of the Central Line.

The Central Line is not only showing the incompetence of the Provincial Government when it comes to the issue of rail powers - and if ever these powers can actually be devolved into the Provincial Government - it begins to prove what the Provincial Government can actually show us.

All they ever do is to make noise on data and evidence. Well, we have heard the data and evidence that the DA-led Government is not intending or keen

on assisting the National Government to find proper land and relocate these residents.

When the land is available there are excuses that are being brought by the Provincial Government, including the City of Cape Town, and interestingly hon Minister Mackenzie is also on the forefront in making sure that this process of relocating these people to suitable land is actually being frustrated.

In fact the DA only uses devolution to score cheap political points. This is their priority, not the citizens of the Western Cape. The ANC ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Mvimbi ...[Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... will not wait on Provincial Government ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... your time has expired.

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... that is incapable.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much ...[Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: If I may conclude, Hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mvimbi ...[Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: The ANC will not ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mvimbi, your time has expired ...[Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... wait on Provincial Government that is incapable ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... [Inaudible.] muted ...[Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... of governing. Thank you very much, Hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mvimbi. Hon member Mvimbi, I have called you to indicate that your time has expired on three occasions.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Apologies [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, if your time has expired, there is a reason why it has been – because it is part of the Rules. Can I please ask that you adhere to the Rules.

So we will, hon member Mvimbi, just for the record, for the House, we will

check the Hansard and when your time expired and the Hansard will reflect up until that point.

I now see the hon Minister, Minister Mackenzie.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, Hon Speaker, and thank you my colleague, Mr Sileku. †Ons soek die Trans-Karoo. [We want the Trans-Karoo].

You know it is interesting that the hon member Mvimbi does not seem to know who is in charge of the current trains, because it is not the Western Cape Government that is currently in charge of the trains. The purpose of this exercise of what we are doing is to take over the train so we can run it better.

The R111 million – and I remember distinctly – was transferred on 30 March. Now frankly it is criminal, and the National Minister should go to jail, for transferring money on 30 March while the new financial year starts on the 1st. It is fiscal dumping to its highest order and that is exactly the reason why the country's finances are in a mess. They do not know how to deal with money, how to plan money, how to process money and how to plan for it. Yes ...[intervenes]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Return [Inaudible.] return it to National Government then.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... they do know how to steal it. [Inaudible.] transfer money to another person without – imagine somebody transfer R100 million into my bank account without telling me what it is for, without telling me what is the process, without telling me what to do.

In fact Mayor Geordin Hill-Lewis is a very generous person. I would have taken that money and appointed more LEAP officers, but he still had the decency to write to them and say, "Here is the money that you have transferred, please take it back." I would have taken that money and appointed Anti-Gang Units, or appointed more law enforcement units. He is far more gentlemanly than I am. I would have taken that money and appointed a 100 rail enforcement officers on the trains [Interjections.], I would have taken that money and bought 50 vehicles for combat policemen and crime for Minister Reagen Allen. That Minister Kubayi, she should go to jail for dumping money and that, hon member Mvimbi, you should write to her and say, "Colleague, do not abuse taxpayers' money," because that is exactly what she did and that is nothing to praise for it.

It is unacceptable, it is not okay [Interjections.] and in fact they should lay criminal charges against her for dumping money on 30 March, probably at 11:59 before 1 April.

The second matter, hon member Mvimbi, you did not hear what I said. It was me, Premier Winde, Mayor Hill-Lewis, who led the process, who wrote to the Chairperson of PRASA, who wrote to the CEO of PRASA, to come to a

meeting. It was them on the Wednesday, in fact the Thursday morning, via a WhatsApp. The disregard for millions of people in Mitchells Plain, Khayelitsha, Bonteheuwel, Nyanga, Langa and many communities who use the Central Line. To send a WhatsApp, "Cancel the meeting."

That is the blatant disregard the ANC has for the people of the Western Cape [Interjections.]. It is unacceptable, it is not okay and we will not tolerate that behaviour in the Western Cape.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat.

Hon member Sayed, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Yes, Chair, I have a point of order.

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: The hon Minister Mackenzie has misled the House regarding Minister Kubayi. Minister Kubayi clarified ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... on Cape Talk [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... hon member ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... the process followed ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... hon member Sayed ...[intervenes]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... with the transfer to the City ...[intervenes]

The SPEAKER: ... hon member Sayed, that ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... she clarified the process. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: He must not mislead the House [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed, when you rise on a point of order, you do not justify the point of order.

Hon Minister Mackenzie, please continue.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, Chairperson.

So the leadership of PRASA must take responsibility for what they did to the Central Line [Interjections.]. It was them that destroyed the Central Line and we are going all out to get the Central Line up and running. So much, hon member Mvimbi, when I was in Joburg to meet with PRASA, I am so desperate because you hear on the phone lines every morning people phoning to the radio, this signal is not working. I went to meet with Alstom, the supplier of trains, just to get an understanding what the hell is going on?

I asked them what is the price of the signals because I am going to go back to the Premier in Cape Town and ask him for signals. To my shock, hon member Mvimbi, and you will be shocked to hear that as well, the price of the signals – in my mind it was R11 000, and it was R400 million. That is the desperation we have in this province to get the Central Line going.

Further to the point I wrote to our colleagues in Gauteng because they are in the same situation that we are. The Metro Rail is Metro Fail in Gauteng. It is dysfunctional. Your colleagues came here ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time has expired. Please conclude.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you. They are in the same situation. We are working with our peers ...[Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: No, this guy has not responded to this ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... to get the Central Line going.

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... question [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: We are desperate, and we are doing far more ...[intervenes]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time has expired. Please take your seat.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... than Prasa to get it going. Thank you, Hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon members, that concludes Interpellation 2.

Mr L L MVIMBI: No, the Minister did not respond.

The SPEAKER: Hon – I will recognise you now. Hon members, that concludes Interpellation 2.

Hon member Sayed, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Hon Speaker, I rise on a point of order in the context of consistency.

Hon member Mvimbi's mic or sound was turned off when we went over the time, but the same was not done for hon member Mackenzie.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I am not going to justify my rulings on this platform. However, just for the record, hon member Mvimbi's microphone was turned off after the third request to end his speech.

Hon members, we now move on to Interpellation 3 and I recognise the hon Minister Allen.

3. Mr T M Klaas to ask Mr R I Allen, Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety:

Whether Delft is considered a murder or crime hot spot for the purposes of the deployment of officers of the Law Enforcement Advancement Plan?

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

Thank you so much, Hon Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

[Connectivity problem.] I also wish to express my sincere thanks to hon member Klaas for this particular interpellation, which is whether Delft is

considered a murder or crime hotspot for the purposes of the deployment of our LEAP officers.

Hon Speaker, the short answer is yes. It is yes because LEAP deployment is based on data and evidence and where the need is the greatest. For all the law enforcement perspective, LEAP is the Western Cape's Safety Plan in action, and we have consistently spoken about the Western Cape Safety Plan in this particular House.

Delft has also been a priority station since LEAP commenced in 2020. In the last financial year between October and December, Hon Speaker, we saw that Delft has become the second ranked station in terms of murders, but also the first station in terms of gender-based violence.

So yes, it is definitely in terms of the Western Cape Safety Plan and for the purposes of your question, but, Hon Speaker, what we have also done is that we have added 30% in terms of actual numbers to the officers that are in the South African Police Service. I am going to repeat that. In terms of the deployment of SAPS members to the Delft area, we have come along, in terms of the Western Cape Safety Plan, and added 97 LEAP officers in that particular area, bodies on the ground and that amounts to 30% of the full complement that the South African Police Service has in that particular area.

It is a step up outside of our mandate, it is a step in outside of our mandate, and further to that we have also helped and assisted 27 of our accredited

Neighbourhood Watches in the area; 25 of the accredited Neighbourhood Watches in the area consisting of 355 active members. We are also helping to assist a functional CPF in that particular area, and I am also delighted to note, Hon Speaker, that in the last financial year 17 of the Chrysalis graduates are from the Delft area, and they contribute towards safety measures in that particular area, and we have placed all 17 in a work opportunity for a period of 12 months.

So we have seen Delft is a priority area. We have actually made certain that our priority areas are taken care of, and we have stepped in and stepped up in that regard, but the short answer is yes.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister Allen.

I now recognise hon member Klaas. [Interjections.]

Mr M T KLAAS: †Molweni. Ninjani? [Hello. How are you?]

No, the Minister surprises me, I am supposed to read, now he answers [Interjections.]. So when the real truth is that we want this thing to be implemented. We – no, he can say that. I was in Delft recently. They were just fighting with the spade. Ja, spade, and we were worried what is happening.

So that is why I am saying that I will not read there [Interjections.] but –

huh? They were fighting.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Hon member Klaas, please speak to me and not directly to the members. Hon members, please ...[intervenes]

Mr M T KLAAS: So for me it is just to put this thing on record, I will read quickly, in order to be in the record of the Parliament. Let us read.

Hon Speaker, the Safety Plan introduced by the Western Cape Premier after he assumed office, remains a futile exercise [Interjections.] and they amount to nothing but fruitless and wasteful expenditure.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr M T KLAAS: Millions of taxpayers' money has been wasted since 2019 in the sham called Safety Plan, which has yielded no results in the inception. That is why he said he is implementing now. Over the years this DA Provincial Government has been telling us that they will target crime, murder spot areas, and deploy law enforcement as a proactive measure to counter crime and murder increase in the province.

However, in the 2023 financial year Delft has been going up in ranking in the whole country when it comes to a high murder rate, despite the so-called Safety Plan being in place.

According to the first quarter crime statistics for the financial year at the issue, Delft was ranked number 5 in the country. When it comes to the high rate in the second quarter it went up at number 7 and according to the latest stats of the third quarter, this township was now at number 3. This piece of information does not show the whole of society approach and every Western Cape department assisting in fighting crime and murder in the province. It is in fact an opposite.

The Premier's term will be coming to an end in less than a year now. Perhaps he must take residents of his province into his confidence and tell them where he spends their tax money, because it is now clear that certainly the money allocated for the purpose of the Safety Plan was not issued to fight crime and murder. † Ngoba basafa eDelf [People are still dying in Delft]

Just two weeks ago two people were shot dead in Delft in separate incidents in the same location ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Klaas, your time has expired.

Mr M T KLAAS: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Klaas, please conclude.

Mr M T KLAAS: Yes. What is the proposal of the Safety Plan and how are

that people continue to ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Klaas.

Mr M T KLAAS: ... in the area?

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, I see the hon member Bosman.
[Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you very much, Hon Speaker, and once again thank you to Minister Allen for another comprehensive response.

Hon Speaker, while Delft remains a challenging area, it is heartening to hear the excellent work that the Minister's Department is doing and I salute those Chrysalis Academy students who are helping to contribute to solve the problems, especially when our national Minister of Police, the [Inaudible.] hat, Bheki Cele, does not actually want to get involved.

With this in mind, Hon Speaker, I would like to ask the Minister if he knows whether hon member Klaas has actually read the Safety Plan. It does not seem like it, and I also want to ask if the Minister can perhaps tell us how many EFF members the LEAP officers have assisted in arresting during the Clicks debacle. I know the predecessors of hon member Klaas were some of those arrestees that were apprehended by LEAP officers and, Minister, with that can you also perhaps tell us whether you are providing any additional

support to those 25 Neighbourhood Watches as well? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Bosman.

I now see the hon member Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Speaker, thanks very much.

Hon member Klaas, through the Hon Speaker to you. You must remember that the LEAP officers do not belong to the Premier, it belongs to J P Smith.

An HON MEMBER: Ja! [Interjections.]

Mr P MARRAN: Because the Premier does not have [Interjections.] – so the Premier does not have any say, they take their command from J P Smith. They take their command from the Metro, not from the Province. [Interjections.]

It is just something that the Premier have promised the people of the Western Cape in his manifesto, that he will start his own police force. The police force, the LEAP officers, belong to J P Smith.

Also, MEC Reagen Allen, through you, Hon Speaker, you must check your responses, your answers to questions.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] speak through the Hon Speaker.

Mr P MARRAN: Ja, I have said so.

You must check – you must check, Hon Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr P MARRAN: The MEC must check his responses to questions because he got sent to all members and it is on record, and I can read you your response to a question asked by the hon member Christians in terms of an issue that we have discussed previously. I got it also. Check when you send it out.

Hon Speaker, today marks exactly 1 344 days to the day Mr Winde, hon Premier, launched the Western Cape Safety Plan, promising to spend R1 billion to halve the murder by 2029. [Interjections.]

What we have witnessed during this period is monumental failures, crime levels and murder rate continue to shower. Premier Winde is the face of this failure as his Safety Plan has proved to be a big expense failure.

In 2021/22 third quarter crime stats between October and December 2022, Delft and Mfuleni were in the top three of the 30 murder stations in the country. In total there were eight stations from the province and the top 30

murder stations. This is despite concerted efforts by the DA to drive a narrative of decreasing murders in areas where LEAP officers are deployed. This is [Inaudible.] knows this.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Marran, please note your time has expired.
[Interjections.]

Mr P MARRAN: Ja, exactly – ja.

The SPEAKER: I know, I recognise ...[Interjections.]

Mr P MARRAN: If we are serious about fighting crime in the province ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Marran, please take your seat, your ...[Interjections.]

Mr P MARRAN: ... the Gauteng [Inaudible.] is the way to go.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Christians.

An HON MEMBER: We need ...

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, thank you, Hon Speaker. Just ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: I note your bias...

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: ... again a few questions. We see murders happening every month. I want to know from the Minister is there a drop in the murder rate seeing that you want to drop the murder rate in half?

It is sad what is happening in Delft and despite the 97 LEAP officers and it is despite the Neighbourhood Watches. I want to know the Neighbourhood Watches, are they fully equipped? Because the Neighbourhood Watches can help us, that is always what I say, can help us because they are members of community and they know what is happening in the community, but killings continue to make the headlines, robberies continue to make the headlines.

I will never forget where the community set five men alight because they have no trust in the police and this is a major problem, when people take the law into their own hands because they do not have any faith.

So I want to know was there a reduction in the crime? Are our – even the Neighbourhood Watches – fully resourced to help? Because here is a major problem and it seems that there is no difference. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians. Hon member Klaas.

Mr M T KLAAS: Thank you, Hon Speaker.

Since Delft has moved from number 5 to number 3 in the country when it comes to a high number of murder rates across all the 2022/2023 crime statistic reports combined, what has this Department been doing in line with the Safety Plan? What were we doing? I am not saying we do not know there is no Safety Plan † Ibisenzani? [What was it doing to curb or to eradicate the crime † Iyisusa njani? [How do they eradicate it] that is the most important thing that you have to answer. This to curb or to eradicate crime.

As per the Minister, if LEAP is for the purpose of protection of the Western Cape, why is it being abused by the Premier to deal with the Russian prostituting, who is not a threat to the Western Cape?

An HON MEMBER: But the Premier is not in charge of the LEAP officers.

Mr M T KLAAS: But he said so.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Klaas, speak to me. [Laughter]

Order, hon members! Order, hon members! Thank you very much.

Mr M T KLAAS: That is why we want him now to be clear and everyone knows he is not in charge.

The SPEAKER: Okay. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon members.

[Interjections.]

I now see the hon Minister, Minister Allen.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

Thank you so much, Hon Speaker.

I am also grateful for the input. Sadly some is extremely misplaced. Let me just state for the record, Hon Speaker, we have seen, and if I am going to request humbly if some of the hon members are able to listen, that we have seen violent crime and crime like murder across our country, Hon Speaker, across our country increase by 26,1%. Murder increasing across our country on average by 26,1%. Here in the Western Cape in eight of the 13 stations where LEAP officers are, we are seeing reductions. We are seeing reductions in the murder rate [Interjections.]. We are seeing reductions in the crime stats, and I would be more than happy, and we have been encouraging, Hon Speaker, for members of this House to read. To go through the documents so that they can actually see the information. [Interjections.]

So we have seen when it comes to Delft, I am so glad that hon member Klaas recently visited Delft. Delft is the area – †en in Voorspoedstraat waar ek my vrou gekry het [and in Voorspoed Street where I found my wife]. So I have seen that we have still concerns [Interjections.] – †ja, sy het in Voorspoedstraat gewoon [yes, she lived in Voorspoed Street.]

So we have seen, Hon Speaker, that Delft in the last quarter had an increase of 12%. An increase of 12%. It remains a concern for us. The Premier and myself have been very open in this regard. We have said we are stepping up and we have added these LEAP officers to work with the South African Police Service, work with all our safety stakeholders, to see reductions and for the record, our Department plays a critical role in where and how our LEAP officers are operating.

We have seen how we are being very clear, how we are very clear and I think this is also a misconception why LEAP is often attacked in this House. Maybe because they have arrested some members, but also another point is that many people in this House, Hon Speaker, sadly do not read. The Western Cape Safety Plan and the LEAP officers, 75% of the funding is derived from the budget here in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

Those officers ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
Those officers belong to the residents. [Interjections.] They belong to the residents where they are serving, and they are working tirelessly in that regard.

I am also wanting to state we are consistently working with our

Neighbourhood Watches, we train, capacitate and fund them and we are requesting members of this House to always encourage other members of the community to also join the Neighbourhood Watch ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... and that is what we will continue to do. We will not shy away from our responsibility in providing oversight.

We have also spoken to the South African Police Service because I am deeply concerned that the police to population ratio in the Delft area is way above the average in the province, where 711 members of our community are actually attributed to one SAPS officer, but the provincial average is 525, but for Delft it is 711, and those skewed allocations we are wanting the South African Police Service to address actually.

So we are stepping up. I have said in this House, if SAPS is not going to improve, I am going to see that as a failure on my part because we are wanting to see our oversight leading to better service delivery. That is why we are working with SAPS, wanting to influence them, wanting to take over SAPS so that we can even better manage the South African Police Service.

We are always stepping up and the Premier is the only Premier ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...
in the entire country ...[intervenes]

The SPEAKER: ... thank you, hon Minister ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...
that have put ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: That brings us to the end of this interpellation. Please take
your seat. [Interjections.]

Hon members ...[intervenes]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
Thank you so much.

The SPEAKER: ... that is the end of Interpellation 3. Hon Minister, is that
a point of order?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: It is a point of order.

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order, Minister?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: It is a point of order.

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order, Minister?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: I want to know if the Minister is available for the National Minister of Police. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister, that is not a point of order.

Hon members, that brings us to the end of Interpellation 3 and the end of Interpellations on the Order Paper. Before we move on to Questions, on behalf of all the members, hon Minister, I would like to wish you a happy birthday ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... and blessings for the year ahead. [Applause.]

Hon members, I deliberately waited until the Minister concluded his participation in the House today, so that there is no bias. So the Minister is not on the rest of the Order Paper for today.

Hon members, we now move on to Questions as per Rule 202. Hon Chief Whip, I recognise you.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

The CHIEF WHIP [DA]: Thank you very much, Hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, as per the oral Question Paper, Questions 2 and 5 will stand over, and affected members have been consulted. Thank you, Hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon members, and thank you very much, Chief Whip.

Hon members, we will now deal with Questions as printed on the Question Paper. I would like to advise hon members that once the hon Premier in - the first question or the Minister has started the reply to the oral question as printed on the Question Paper, hon members must use the chat facility for the Sitting of the House to indicate that they want to ask a follow-up question or indicate in the Chamber.

There are four opportunities for follow-up questions, but the hon member who has posed the initial oral question as printed on the Question Paper, will have the first opportunity for a follow-up question. Thereafter hon members may then use the remaining opportunities to ask follow-up questions if they so wish.

So with that being said, hon Premier.

1. Ms A Cassiem to ask Mr A R Winde, Premier:

With regard to his statement on 27 April 2023 that, if the Russian President, Vladimir Putin, set foot in the Western Cape, he will make sure he is arrested:

(1) (a) Where would LEAP officers detain the Russian President and

(b) where will he be taken afterwards;

(2) whether LEAP officers report to the City of Cape Town or to the Western Cape Government?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Hon Speaker, and to the hon member Cassiem, thank you very much for posing the question.

A perfect question, I think, and so to put in context the question we must understand that South Africa as a country is a signatory to the Rome Statute, and also a founding member and the original member in Africa to the International Criminal Court. In actual fact it was during Nelson Mandela's rule as President and his Minister, Dullah Omar, who led the charge on behalf of South Africa to make sure that we were part of an international criminal court to deal with atrocities that happen in our world, based specifically on the lessons that we have had as a country during the apartheid years.
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Oh, you are back? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The PREMIER: So again I thank the hon member for this question
...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: What powers does [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: So 1(a) ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, please take a seat. Hon member Dugmore, can I please – if you want to ask a follow-up question there is – hon member Dugmore, there is a process if you would like to ask the Premier a follow-up question. Please indicate so and I will recognise you, but you cannot ask your question while the Premier is responding, and that is not interjections.

Hon member Dugmore?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker, thank you very much.

Hon Speaker, I was definitely not asking a question. That is in parliamentary parlance called an interjection.

An HON MEMBER: Yes. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Well, that was not an interjection, that is directly communicating with the member, so that is not interjections, that is running commentary, and it is affecting the member from delivering the answer.

So if you would like to ask a question, please indicate so and I will provide you an opportunity.

Hon Premier, you may continue.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much.

So 1(a), should Vladimir Putin be arrested in the Western Cape he will be handed over to the South African Police Service, as South Africa remains a signatory to the Rome Statute and a member of the International Criminal Court.

SAPS and the National Government would be expected to fulfil their obligation. I am going to say it again, fulfil their obligation as a warrant has been issued for Mr Putin.

(b) Vladimir Putin will be held at a South African police station or a place of safety, pending his extradition through Interpol. The Western Cape Government would not have the mandate nor the jurisdiction to determine where Mr Putin would be held. The South African Police Service would be mandated to secure Mr Putin after his arrest.

(2) The law enforcement and advancement officers are LEAP officers in partnership with and in collaboration with the City of Cape Town and the Western Cape Government. The Western Cape Government is a co-funder of the LEAP programme together with ...[intervenes]

An HON MEMBER: Hey, this man wants to play for the national team.

An HON MEMBER: Huh? She was just in the House.

The PREMIER: The Western Cape Government has an agreement with the City of Cape Town and as a partner we are able to ensure LEAP is deployed to priority areas within the City of Cape Town. Thank you.

†Die LEIER VAN DIE OPPOSISIE: Die Boere [Onhoorbaar.]

[The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: The Boere [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. [Interjections.]

I will provide hon member Cassiem the first opportunity and then hon member Kama and then hon member Fry and then hon member Mvimbi. In that order. [Interjections.]

Hon member Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM: Thank you, Hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, we know that Russia is not a member of the ICC and any arrest warrant for a Russian national would need to be endorsed by the United Nations Security Council. However, Hon Speaker, Russia, being a permanent member of the Security Council, has the power to veto any such endorsement, rendering the arrest warrant ineffective, and before I get to my question, Hon Speaker, and just to add. According to the Rome Statute, which established the ICC by the way, the ICC can issue arrest warrants for individuals charged with war crimes, genocide and in other international crimes.

However, if the individual being charged is from a country that is not party to the Rome Statute, the ICC must then seek approval from the UN Security Council before issuing an arrest warrant.

So with this being said, Hon Speaker, my question, is it not misleading for the Speaker to say and to give the impression to the public and to the House, that he has the powers to arrest Putin when he clearly cannot?

Please focus on arresting gangsters instead of people who are not on your level. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Cassiem.

Hon Minister Meyer, is that a point of order? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: It is a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, there is a member on the floor.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: It is a ...

No sound on audio 1:07:42.9

The SPEAKER: That is the hon member, an hon member. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: No, the Hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: No-no, when you address the member it is not she and he, it is "the hon member".

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Oh, sorry, the Hon Speaker to the hon member. The hon member has referred to the Speaker who has this powers. It was factually incorrect. She, I think, means the Premier. Can I just establish whether – she did mention the Speaker, whether she meant the Premier? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Klaas, please take your seat.

Hon member Minister, thank you for that. Hon member Cassiem, did you in

fact refer to the Speaker or the Premier?

Ms A CASSIEM: I am referring to the Premier who does not have the power to do that.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. That addresses that point.

Hon member Klaas, is that a point of order or can we continue?

Mr T M KLAAS: Yes, it is correct, Chair, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, and I would ask the hon Cassiem to probably consult their legal advisors because what she has just said now is incorrect.

Number 1, the ICC has issued a warrant of arrest for Vladimir Putin and the Children's Commissioner of Russia. Both of them have been issued. We also know, fact, that if he arrives in South Africa, that our country is under obligation to arrest him and that was proven in our own Constitutional Court when we failed to arrest Al-Bashir when he visited our country. It was taken to court and proven that we failed as a country, we were obliged to arrest him.

So the fact is that this country is obliged to make sure that he is arrested. Obviously our President is flip-flopping, he does not know whether he should or he should not, and we saw that play out. So I wanted to make sure that there was absolute clarity to the world that in this province we would make sure that that happened.

Now from a process point of view, no United Nations has to be consulted. What would happen in this country is that our courts would have to be approached for that warrant of arrest to be converted to a South African warrant of arrest. That is the process that has to happen. Our courts have already shown how it has to happen and that will happen should Vladimir Putin come to this country, because I will make sure that we go through the process of forcing that application to our courts to turn the International Court warrant into an active South African court warrant to arrest Vladimir Putin should he step foot in this province.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Can you hear me, Hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Yes, now we can hear you.

Mr M KAMA: Yes. No, sorry. Thank you very much, Hon Speaker.

I think Hon Speaker, while I think now we can establish that the Premier is not giving us any law that perhaps mandates him to instruct any law enforcement officer to make an arrest, as he has explained now even the process of going to the court and we know the court will then direct SAPS to make the arrest because SAPS are the ones, if necessary, that have to make any arrest.

I want to check with the Premier therefore, Hon Speaker, is that is he not worried that these utterances that he is making against the National Government's actively non-aligned stance in the war of Russia and Ukraine, and trying to find solutions around that particular matter, is the Premier not aware that he might be working against the National Government, and is this perhaps one of his styles of just making pronouncements, knowing that he is not empowered to do anything like that, like how he would have promised the people of the Western Cape that by 2029 the LEAP officers would have reduced the murder rate by 50%. Thank you, Hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Kama.

Hon Premier, there was more than one follow-up question in that question. So I am not going to adjudicate how you answer that, but just for the record, there was more than one question as a follow-up.

Before you go, hon Premier, hon member Klaas, is that a point of order?

Mr T M KLAAS: No, I request to add my question.

The SPEAKER: Unfortunately the four opportunities have already been allocated. So there is not another opportunity.

Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much.

First of all the hon member Kama must understand that his point about the National Government being not aligned or neutral on the Russia/Ukraine issue is definitely shown to be incorrect and in actual fact that was the core basis of a debate in this House today on how, number one, it put AGOA under threat. Number two, it is linked to the cost of living rising in this country and across the world. There are so many areas that the actions and the non-neutral stance of our National Government in this case is so evident that it is hurting the poorest of the poor in South Africa. So absolutely I disagree with the hon member Kama.

The second thing is of course where the National Government fails I will definitely step up. I swore an allegiance to our Constitution, an amazing document, and that allegiance to the Constitution means that I will step up

when they fail specifically and then the last point is the hon member Kama must please go and read the regulations around peace officers and see what powers they have. That would be a very interesting read I am sure. Thank you, Hon Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier.

The next person is hon member Fry and then the last one is hon member Mvimbi.

Hon member Fry.

Mr C FRY: Thank you, hon Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Marran and hon Premier, there is a member on the floor.

Mr C FRY: Thank you, hon Speaker.

My question to the Premier, Hon Speaker, is should South Africa fail to fulfil the obligation once again as we have seen in the Al-Bashir case and failure to arrest Putin on his arrival in this province, how would it affect the country's standing internally, and what impact would it have on trade and foreign direct investment, especially in the Western Cape? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. I think what is already playing out is the effect on our international brand. South Africa is being questioned at every angle. Yesterday the Cabinet had a presentation from the Ambassador representing the European Union. It is a major issue for another big trading block of this region, the EU.

I do not have to go further than to show the snubbing of President Ramaphosa and South Africa by Japan based on our position.

So even before it gets to a point where we actually would be forced, because we are obliged and it has been proven, so we would be forced to arrest Vladimir Putin should he step foot in South Africa, it is really interesting as to how the ANC are backtracking and still flip-flopping all over the place. The original position of the President flip-flopping all around. Then a bit of clarity from us here in the province. Then he suddenly changed his tune and in actual fact when I saw him on Friday, what did he do? He spent his time convincing me that what is going to happen now, he is flying to Ukraine, and he is flying to Russia, because he is now going to broker the peace. I really wonder if that is going to happen and then the last point [Interjections.] – and then the last point, hon Speaker [Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: So the President is now supposedly going to broker this peace deal between Russia and the Ukraine [Interjections.], but at the end of the day the damage that is being done because of our non-neutral stance, ships in the night, aircraft landing in military airports, all sorts of clandestine operations, with zero clarity behind it.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: It sounds like [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: Six months later we still do not know, and you know what the President is? He is the commander-in-chief in our country. One would have imagined that he would have known what was happening on the previous day before the ship entered the port, but if he did not know, one would have imagined the telephone call the next day would have said, "Minister of Defence, I am really upset as to what is going on. You have got two hours, I need everything, every bit of detail."

Six months he is now appointing a judge for an independent investigation. It is damaging the brand of South Africa and that is the core problem that we have here, and of course what happens? The interest rates go up; the Rand/Dollar exchange rate gets worse. South Africa's brand as a country, which we were at, if I think about where we were as a rainbow nation in '94, 29 years later we are the laughing stock of the world, and it is because we cannot take stands on positions like this. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier, and the last opportunity

is hon member Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: I withdraw, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Okay, you have withdrawn, withdrawn. So I am now going to provide hon member Klaas that opportunity. [Interjections.]

Mr T M KLAAS: Thank you, Hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, I am seriously concerned about this matter. This matter looks like not a serious matter, but at end of the day you will see this is the fight of countries, and when the countries fight it is a huge different fight. There is no need for us as South Africa to be one-sided. We must be reconciling, because if you choose, you know that the law will take its course when something is done.

Let me read here, let me ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members, order hon members. I am listening; I am listening.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Statute 4 of the South African Constitution makes it clear that when it comes to policing, Chapter 11 of the Constitution applies. So, under Chapter 11 Section 205, it makes it clear that the national police must function in all levels of government, including national, provincial, and

local government. So, since Chapter 11 in Section 206 makes it clear that provinces can only exercise oversight of the police.

Please, tell this House which province or South African law gives your province the power of arrest, especially acting on warrants of arrest issued by international criminal courts against which this arrest is issued by an international criminal court. So, which is supposed to be base with the national and then the national ...[Interjections.]. Let me continue and finish ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Alright ...[Interjection.]

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): ...my question.

The SPEAKER: Hon Klaas, I thought that the previous sentence was the question because you can only pose one follow-up question. So, I am going to listen carefully. Please conclude.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Okay. Through you, hon Speaker, I would like to take this opportunity to ask the hon Premier Alan Winde to apologise to the people of this province ...[Laughter.] and the country, for misleading them that he can arrest people on his own. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Premier, again, like the previous one, there was more than one follow-up question. I will do a ruling on

follow-up questions in general at the next Sitting, but I am going to hand over to you to answer the question as you see fit.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. To the hon Klaas, thank you very much for that multi-faceted question. The first point on apology: no! The second point is I like that the hon Klaas refers to the Constitution and specifically, Schedule 4 and I think we should start there to say a province, where we take Schedule 4, part A of the South African Constitution, shares a concurrent power with the National Government over trade, as well as regional planning and development. So, that is why this issue is so important to us and that is why the whole AGOA debate was really important to us, and it is about our economy, it is about jobs, it is about economic freedom.

Someone who should be fighting for economic freedom should be on this side, not that side. He says he is from the Economic Freedom Fighters, but they are destroying jobs with their policies and ideas that will never work.

But when it comes to the position of arrest, I would ask because the hon member says – and readers are leaders as we know, and he quotes the Constitution – I would suggest that the hon member goes and has a look at the powers of peace officers ...[Interjections.] and you will see that peace officers can exercise all of the arrests that police officers can exercise, even up to international foreign people in our country they are able to arrest.

As you heard from the hon Minister a bit earlier that in actual fact, our peace officers have arrested in excess of 15 000 or exercised in excess of 15 000 arrests already, through that peace officer regulation and please, go and read it. You will see exactly what gives the LEAP officers their full power to exercise arrests. But also, as I said to the hon Cassiem who asked the question originally that the correct procedure is you have to empower those peace officers in this case with a warrant. And our courts have already determined that South Africa is obliged to arrest someone who is wanted.

And then lastly, I want to say the most horrendous part of the ruling of the ICC is that it is against Vladimir Putin and the Children's Commissioner of Russia not because of general war crimes, it is because of the abduction and removal of nearly 20 000 Ukrainian children ...[Interjections.]. Nearly just short of 20 000 children have been abducted and removed from the Ukraine and put in with families in Russia. If ever there was a heinous crime, that is it. Absolutely, we cannot condone the abduction of children. How would you feel if you were stuck in the middle of the war and your children were being abducted as a lever? ...[Interjections.] You must definitely ...[Interjection.]

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): What will you do about Palestine?

The PREMIER: ...stand and I absolutely ...[Interjections.] No, I will tell you. I will absolutely do exactly the same ...[Interjections]

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: Get an ICC court ruling in Palestine, and I will do exactly ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon Premier ...[Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, is that the end of your ...[Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: ...your answer. Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, it is fine. He speaking directly ...[Interjection.]

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Through you!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It is fine ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, that brings us to the end of Question 1. Hon members, can I just remind you that when you pose a follow-up question, that you do not need to introduce the follow-up question. You can go straight to the question. So, with that being said, we now move on to Question 2 and

Number 3 as printed on the Question Paper. Hon Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities, hon Minister Wenger.

3. Ms N D Nkondlo to ask Ms M M Wenger, Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities:

- (a) How does her Department support the township economy in the province; and
- (b)(i) what is the impact of extortion on the economy, particularly the township economy; and
- (ii) what is her Department doing about the negative economic effect of extortion?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Speaker and thank you to the hon member for the question. The Western Cape Government acknowledges the immense importance and potential of the township economy in the Western Cape and in South Africa generally. The Department of Economic Development and Tourism has finalised the Growth for Jobs strategy, which is explicit in its approach that the informal and township economies are part of this all of Government strategy, and the document takes cognisance of the rural and urban dimensions in its approach, with a clear spatial lens. More specifically, the strategy makes clear that inclusion requires growth that is jobs-rich and includes a spatial dimension to growth which will require growth in the formal, informal and township sectors.

As I have informed the House recently, I am advised that since 2019 the SMME Booster Fund included a category to support municipal infrastructure development, and which resulted in the establishment or support of informal and township trading places. To date, the following municipalities have been supported resulting in the following markets developed or expanded to the benefit of the township sector.

In Hessequa, the KwaNokuthula Business Hub allows the municipality to expand on a small-scale project to construct four business units in the Hub to support light industrial types of businesses. In Bongolethu in Oudtshoorn, the Oudtshoorn Business Hive and Trading Area will house five traders in containerised units. In Langeberg, the Bonnievale informal trading site and the Montagu site will serve 22 existing and new traders. In Mossel Bay, the Hayixhale Business Hub and Wolwedans Market site includes the establishment of 17 refurbished containers which will house 23 local businesses.

In Swellendam, SMME trading zones in the township of Smitsville in Barrydale, house containerised LED units and support six businesses. In Laingsburg the New Business Park is a trading facility that consists of four units to accommodate businesses in the retail sector. In Cape Agulhas, the Ou Meule Street Trading area or Lesedi Square, has six trading containers and hosts six businesses employing eight people. In Witzenberg, the Skoonvlei SMME Business Hub in Ceres provides an industrial and business

space for traders through ten customised containers. In Mossel Bay, the KwaNonqaba Youth and Business Park has 19 trader units that actively trade. In Mossel Bay, the D'Almeida Trader Hub ensures that 15 local businesses and 3-day traders have attractive and affordable spaces to do business.

The Department along with the municipalities implemented these municipal booster initiatives, along with SEDA, the Small Enterprise Development Agency, to provide business development support and training. Further, the partners engage in co-op departments like the Department of Agriculture, the Department of Land Reform and Rural Development, an agency such as SEFA, which is the Small Enterprise Finance Agency, to provide additional support to beneficiary businesses.

I am further advised that the Business Development and Support Programme is a collaborative initiative between the Department and the Drakenstein Municipality. The initiative supports entrepreneurs trading within the Drakenstein townships and provides small and micro businesses, both formal and informal, with nonfinancial support which includes equipment and machinery, marketing collateral and so on, to support the sustainability and growth of the businesses. The programme intends to formalise at least three of the businesses that operate informally. This is to enable businesses to create opportunities for growth offered through structured markets like public procurement and private sector business opportunities.

To build on this, and as I said in my Budget Speech approved by this House, I

tabled a R1,6-billion budget for Vote 12 for the 2023 MTEF. This includes a R55,5-million allocation over the 2023 MTEF for alternative energy support for small, medium and micro enterprises in the province. To support them in mitigating the devastating effects of loadshedding, this support will be critical to helping businesses in township and informal economies to continue and trade. I also announced that the SMME Booster Fund will be continuing in the 2023/2024 financial year with an R8,18-million allocation. R4,61-million has also been allocated for the continuation of the 2022/2023 Booster Fund Projects for the year ahead.

I am quite excited to confirm here that we will soon, in the next few weeks, be launching the 2023 iteration of the SMME Booster Fund. The fund is a demand-led partnership driven and collaborative model of enhancing the SMME ecosystem and delivering impactful interventions to selected and targeted categories of SMMEs and entrepreneurs, including businesses that are youth owned, women owned and owned by people living with disabilities and specifically, to support township-based businesses.

As I mentioned upfront, the Growth for Jobs strategy understands that the private sector includes the township and informal economies. And so, we need to ensure that our projects and programmes are geared towards unlocking and enabling these sectors to succeed.

This leads me to part (b) of the question which deals with a very worrying barrier to growth for township economies and that is safety. As I indicated to

the hon member via a written reply, I have requested my Department to undertake research to better understand its impact on the provincial economy and I look forward to updating the hon member once the report is finalised.

I am, however, informed that there is a September 2022 report by the Global Initiative against Transnational Organised Crime entitled *Strategic Organised Crime Risk Assessment South Africa*, which details some of the reported incidents of extortion and demands facing local businesses, especially in the townships. The reports intention was to analyse the risk posed by organised crime to South Africa. The report notes that there are 15 main illicit markets currently active in South Africa today. An evaluation of these markets provides several insights into the key traits of organised crime in the country and the context of South African organised crime at the local, state and international levels.

The report furthermore evaluates the state's response to organised crime and offers suggestions as to how to prioritise a response. The Western Cape Government takes safety seriously, even though policing is mandated in the national and local spheres. That is precisely why it is one of our North Star priorities and why the hon Premier has led with the provincial Safety Plan, which has seen over 1 000 officers deployed to crime hotspots to address violent crime.

I announced in my main Budget Speech that R1,05-billion is allocated to the Law Enforcement Advancement Programme or LEAP, for this purpose over

the 2023 MTEF. Overall, I also mentioned that we had made R2,26-billion available to make sure that our provincial policing functions have the funding they need to be effective, to work with and build up community-based partnerships and to continue our critical oversight over the South African Police Service, so that they can do their jobs to combat crime such as extortion.

I am also advised as per written reply by my colleague, hon Minister Allen, that the Department of Police Oversight and Community Safety as the lead Department responsible for safety, partners with the SAPS with respect to its mandate to address extortion, by serving on its bi-weekly Extortion Priority Committee. It also co-chairs the Anti-gang Provincial Joint Committee. The Department also chairs a bi-weekly LEAP operational Steer-Com meeting with the City of Cape Town. I am also advised via this reply that the Department's Court Watching Brief Unit monitors, amongst other, extortion matters which have been struck off the roll.

I am also informed that complaints received via the Department are shared with the SAPS to be addressed and that the Department promoted the new extortion tollfree number, which is 0800 31 44 44. I also support hon Minister Allen when he indicated that the Western Cape Government remains committed to fighting all forms of crime by working with safety stakeholders, particularly Neighbourhood Watches and Community Policing Forums to assist and support the SAPS as the lead agency in addressing this major challenge. The Growth for Jobs strategy understands that safety is a key

enabler for growth in the Western Cape and an all of Government transversal approach will be needed to ensure that this horrific barrier is removed. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister Wenger. Hon Nkondlo, I am going to provide you with the first opportunity if you so wish. If not, are there any hon members that would like to ask a follow-up question? It does not look like it, so we are going to move on. That brings us to the end of Question 3. We will now move on to Question 6 as printed on the Question Paper. Hon Minister, over to you. Hon Minister Wenger, for the record.

6. Ms N D Nkondlo to ask Ms M M Wenger, Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities:

In respect of the high youth unemployment rate and NEET in the province:

- (a) What is the number of unemployed young people and those not in employment, education and training;
- (b) What is the breakdown for each population group in the province; and
- (c) What is the Provincial Government doing to address black and coloured unemployment?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Speaker. The statistics the hon member has asked for are recorded

and published by Statistics South Africa. For the latest jobs numbers, namely Quarter 1 of 2023, the specific breakdowns for your unemployment by province. Those not in employment, education and training by province and the respective racial breakdowns have not yet been made available. I will endeavour to engage with STATS SA as we have done in the past, to request this specific information the hon member seeks. I would like to invite the hon member to submit a written question in a few weeks' time.

What the latest statistical release by STATS SA did reveal in latest Quarterly Labour Force Survey on 16 May 2023, is that between Quarter 1 of 2022 and Quarter 1 of 2023, there were 360 000 more jobs in the Western Cape. This is an increase of 15,7% year on year and is the highest percentage increase in employment in South Africa. According to the same publication, the unemployment rate in the province also decreased, both on the official and expanded definitions. The official unemployment rate in the Western Cape decreased from 25,2% in Quarter 1 of 2022 to 21,6% in Quarter 1 of 2023. The expanded unemployment rate in the Western Cape also decreased from 29% in Quarter 1 of 2022 to 25,9% in Quarter 1 of 2023. Overall, the expanded unemployment rate in the Western Cape at 25,9% is almost half the national unemployment rate which is 42,4%.

To answer the hon member's final part of the question, unemployment and specifically youth unemployment in South Africa is unacceptably high. Unemployment in this province continues to buck national trends because we take seriously our responsibility to create opportunities for employment. The

link between quality education, skills development, and the prospects of being employed are undeniable which is why our Department has allocated R99,19-million towards our skills priority in the 2023/2024 financial year, with a strong focus on experiential learning initiatives.

As an example, through our Artisan Development Programme we are looking to create access to opportunities which is particularly important for the stimulation of the township economy. Earlier this month, as part of the Western Cape's drive to create opportunities for youth employment, DEDAT together with 12 employers in the Business Process Outsourcing sector posted a recruitment drive at the Athlone Stadium, specifically to bring employment opportunities closer to where young job seekers live.

Unemployed youth between the ages of 18 and 34 with a Grade 12 or equivalent qualification were interviewed by BPO operators, which then offered 1 000 of those interviewed in the BPO sector. The event is the first of five to be held in the 2023/2024 financial year bringing the number of opportunities offered to 5 000 young unemployed people over the year. Successful candidates will receive a 12-month on-the-job learnership within a BPO company including a monthly stipend. After completing the programme, each beneficiary will receive an accredited qualification equivalent to an NQF level 3.

What is truly impressive is the track record of 80% of those who complete the programme are transitioned into a formal job, giving them the opportunity

to live a life they value to support themselves and their families which is why we will continue to partner with key stakeholders in the private sector so that we can help create many more opportunities for young people in this province. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, are there any follow-up questions? There are no follow-up questions on the virtual platform, no follow-up questions in the Chamber. Thank you very much, hon Minister. That is end of Question 6 on the Order Paper. We move onto Question 7. I recognise the hon Minister of Health and Wellness, hon Dr Minister Mbombo.

Ms R Windvogel to ask Dr N Mbombo, Minister of Health and Wellness:

- (a) What is her Department doing to address service pressures at district hospitals; and
- (b) What formula is used to determine the funding allocation for, and staff complement of these hospitals?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, hon Speaker. Thank you for the question, hon member Windvogel, in relation to how to address the service pressures. I think before I go there, I just want to quickly paint the picture of what is the current status quo around the pressures.

Actually, these hospitals across the country were not built in the context of

what we see right now in terms of the diseases that we see. Yes, the quadruple burden of disease which is HIV Aids, maternal and child health related, the mental health, interpersonal violence, and all of those, they might have been there, but the way they are now, is due to the whole contribution from the social determinants of health. This is the issue of crime which previously we did not see as much compared to what we see now.

For example, the issue related to loadshedding and previously the boreholes that we had to install during the time when we were going towards Day Zero due to the lack of water, and then there was a pandemic and all of those things. Therefore, the previous health system which was focusing on disease where everything is to be cured at the hospital, is completely different. Therefore, it meant that we have to firstly de-hospitalise, which is we have to change our focus. We should not be focusing on having a hospice-centric model, but to look at other ways on how we strengthen the health system.

So, a district hospital is just part of three other levels of hospital, but the bulk of the health services is happening outside of the hospital, which is at the wellness hub, at the primary healthcare clinics as we always say that health is everybody's business, so that one can understand in regard to that.

So, when it comes to the service pressure which now has increased because of the pandemic and also with mental health that has also been encumbered by the pandemic and all other challenges like quality, poverty and unemployment, we have had to add an additional R71,5-million to the district

hospitals in the Metro and R55,5-million to the district hospitals outside the Metro, in addition to strengthening all other facilities that are referring to these district hospitals.

The other part is to strengthen the other services. We used to call them intermediate care models. At the time it used to be called a stepdown or step-up facility. For example, some of the patients used to be cared for longer at a hospital like for palliative care, but now they do not have to do that. They are able to go back to the intermediate care as now, for instance, with Brackengate where we have introduced it so that they could be cared for outside of a hospital.

Previously, we were using community health services where they would be cared for by NPOs that used to do caring. For example, like when someone had cancer, we used to refer them to hospice or other NPOs. Now, we have to take care of those patients ourselves as mentioned with the issue of Brackengate. So yes, indeed, we have to do as much service redesign as possible under the circumstances of the available resources.

And then lastly, you might have heard that for the District Health Services Grant, there has been a decrease and the district hospitals form part of that grant. Therefore, it puts a whole lot of pressure also on the clinics or primary healthcare services that are referring people there. And also, some of the hospitals like Khayelitsha, although it is a district hospital it also runs in between like the original way and plus a district hospital. What does this

mean? It means that you end up having specialised staff that are mostly at a level 2, instead of being at level 1.

And then lastly, the other question is about how we fund, what formula. There is not much of a formula, but we have got what we call the approved post lists where annually you will be able to determine what you need for a level 1 in this kind of an area because hospitals are different. For example, Victoria Hospital is a district hospital at level 1, but it does not necessarily cater for only one suburb. Wesfleur Hospital, like Khayelitsha Hospital, caters for more or less the same as the ...[Audio distorted.]

So, you have to determine what type of package is available there. Wesfleur Hospital is a district hospital but does not provide the same package as Khayelitsha Hospital. The packages that we are offering there and as I mentioned, every package is determined by which healthcare professionals are available based on categories, whether they are a level 12 or they are a level 10, and what specialisation is there.

For example, if it so happened that Khayelitsha has got the APL approved post list of say four medical officers, three specialists or 20 professional nurses and so forth, and it so happened that there are many four nurses who will probably resign. They do not have to wait in terms of being vetted at a higher level because it is part of their APL. They are able to fill those four posts themselves or they can change it. They can say, for example, that's okay, we have lost one cardiology specialist. Do we still need a cardiologist?

They are able to say that anyway, we are motivating that instead of appointing a cardiologist, we can actually appoint about eight generalist nurses instead of that. So, it is already there.

Noting also, the delegations. Central hospitals, for example, do not even have to do a motivation. They can appoint staff up to a level 11, similarly with the budgets that they are able to run so that the issue of the subsidisation is taken care of. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon Windvogel, do you have a follow-up question? I will provide you with the first opportunity. Hon members, can you please give me an indication if there are any other hon members. Hon Windvogel, over to you.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Speaker. Through you, hon Speaker, to the hon Minister: with regard to the intermediate care facilities in the province, a strategy that we have welcomed, we want to know when we can expect such a facility to cater for hospitals like Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain District Hospitals and why were they not included in the current ones being rolled out. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you. In an intermediate care facility, patients do not go directly there. It is about decanting and reducing

pressures on the existing hospitals as in the one at Brackengate which was a 330-bed hospital during COVID-19, which is now an intermediate care facility and is going to have 128 beds. But for now, we are still doing, I think, about 60 beds that are currently there as they are being phased in. So, they do not admit patients directly to the hospital. You do not go straight there. They must be patients who would have been assessed. Actually, currently it is catering for most of the Metro East.

This happens in Mitchells Plain Hospital, Khayelitsha Hospital, Eerste River Hospital, and in Helderberg Hospital. Patients need to be assessed by the clinicians there they are now ready, or they qualify, and they meet the requirements to go to intermediate care. The intermediate care includes units for palliative care, which are mostly the cancer patients, where the clinicians or specialists might see that this patient does not need specialist or an acute level of care. They need inter-disciplinary care.

Even for those that need rehabilitative care that have been involved in an accident, who still need to learn to walk, but are not ready to go home and need physiotherapy, occupational therapy and all of that, they then are part of that group. And then, also for the chronic patients. There are people who have got diabetes, where you will find that it includes complications or any other chronic matter, that they still need to be taken care of with regard to their diets and everything. So, they will have been seen in these district hospitals and then there they are being referred to intermediate care. So, there is no direct entry.

So, Brackengate services mostly the Metro East area. Similarly, with Sonstraal Hospital. It is also a part of the ones that need to be converted to become part of the intermediate care, not only for the Winelands, but also for the lower part of the West Coast. Also, the Harry Comay Hospital in George.

Noting, however, that there are also some of the NPOs who are attached to the hospitals as in Knysna. There is a house there at the top of 9 which is in The Yard, which also offers intermediate care, but specifically for the ...[Audio distorted.] patients. So, patients do not go there directly to the intermediate care. They are being referred to a stepdown facility for the continuation of care, as with the ambulatory patients, for them to recuperate and also, for all the other stuff that is done there.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Pretorius and then I see hon Windvogel. Was that an indication for another follow-up?

Mr G PRETORIUS (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I recently spoke in the NCOP to discuss National Treasury's budget for healthcare in South Africa, which will see – is this mine or ...[Audio distorted.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Pretorius, just put it off. Please put it on again. Please, if you may, can you please use the microphone next to you. [Interjections.]

Mr G PRETORIUS (DA): Through you, hon Speaker, thank you, hon member

Marais. [Laughter.] Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I recently spoke in the NCOP to discuss National Treasury's budget for healthcare in South Africa, which will see the hon Minister's Department suffer several cuts to several key conditional grants. How will the decrease in funds allocated by National Treasury affect her Department's ability to render services to the people of the Western Cape? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you for the question. At the beginning of the year, when I delivered the Budget Speech, I did mention the R1,5-billion shortage because of the decrease in equitable shares and also a decrease in conditional grants. So, a R1,5-billion cut which actually does not even consider inflation where the price of medicine and everything have been affected. As we know, with the wars that people are talking about, it does have a huge impact on the supply chain and procurement and so forth. Luckily, the Provincial Treasury tried to save us by giving us R1,485-billion. Still, there is a shortage because the Conditional Grants were also not taken care of.

So, that means that we need to focus and implement this service redesign which is what I have just alluded to about not having patients staying longer unnecessarily at the acute hospitals. For those that need to go for rehabilitation or intermediate care, they need to be referred and to also have the wellness hub. We are the Department of Health and Wellness.

Also, to take services everywhere. If it is about creating awareness or providing screening and testing at the taxi rank or at churches, that also needs to continue. Also, to ensure that in the communities where it takes even longer for the ambulances to get to, to train more EFAR which are the Emergency First Aid Responders. So, it impacts on us.

Now, in addition to that, because we had a COVID-19 related budget until 31 March, it meant that for those staff that were appointed using that money, their contracts ended. We were not able to extend some of their contracts. There are about 6 000-plus of the contract staff. We managed to retain some, but there are about 600-plus that we were not able to retain.

Whilst we were waiting for that, now boom: the issue of the Wage Bill where the Department of Public Service Administration made an agreement with the unions for the 7,5% increase. We are not arguing that public servants do not deserve an increase, but the argument is about at this stage, there is no money that has come from Treasury. And when we calculate that money that is now based on this 7,5% increase, it equates to about R1,2-billion.

R1,2-billion means that it equates to about 2 362 posts that we may end up having to freeze if we do not get the money. So, that is why we as a sector, because it does not only affect us in the Western Cape – a sector is a province – we are saying to National Treasury if you do not follow up and bring the money, follow up with the promises that the DPSA has made, it means that

we will not be able to continue to appoint anyone.

Lastly, hon Speaker, through you. The issue of loadshedding. There is no new money that is coming in from anywhere. It means that we have to take the money that is meant for the services to buy generators because not all our hospitals have been exempted from loadshedding. There are only about five hospitals in the Metro, which now we have added others to, and then one in George. So, the whole issue impacts on Health.

So, for the first time, hon Speaker, we used to speak about the fiscal cliff that is coming. We are actually on the fiscal cliff. I do not know how the health sector is going to survive if we do not get that money from Treasury with regards to the Wage Bill. So, in essence, we are talking of about R2,5-billion or even about R3-billion that there is a shortage of when we have to add the Wage Bill and where we now have to pay for our staff salaries. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Taking into account what the hon Minister has just explained, what measures have been put in place in the current financial year to increase the number of staff and beds at those hospitals which are mostly affected. Patients are sleeping on floors and on benches for days before they receive help. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you. I think I have already answered this question that there is no new money. The budget has been decreased. But [Inaudible.] we have to do whatever we must do because we operate seven days a week, 24 hours a day, 365 days a year. We are the space where people come to, irrespective that we may be full or we are full, but it is about them needing us at their lowest moment. We are the only sector that does not have a policy that says: †geen ingang nie, [no admission] we are full. We cannot. Even if they are on top of each other, you have to take them no matter what.

So, you will always have a situation, especially in EC where there is a policy on mental health. If a person that is not old is misbehaving and you suspect there might be some mental illness, you just take them to the police station. It is no longer the case. These people must also go to the EC and that EC is where you go you find that there are patients on top of each other and so forth. It is because there are those who have been there for a 72-hour assessment for a mental illness. So, when they become violent or they will be brought in being violent, you will sedate them. When you sedate a person, you cannot sedate a person and then you leave that person in bed, especially in the EC because in the EC, there are those coming in by ambulance, rape patients coming in, others having a fit, children who are burnt and everyone.

Therefore, in some instance, when you see the patients on the floor, it is not because there are no beds or about poor care. It is for the sake of the patient because some of those patients you cannot even tie them down, it is not like

that. You cannot. So, in some instances it is about that. It is preferable to be right, to be put there temporarily whilst the person is heavily sedated.

And then the other thing. When I was mentioning about the intermediate care, it also actually helps us reduce some of the pressures because as I mentioned before with the Metro East, at Khayelitsha Hospital, Mitchells Plain Hospital, Helderberg Hospital, Eerste River Hospital. Now that we have got the 128-bed intermediate care facility, it means that now those people, especially the chronic ones who would have been staying there not necessarily because they need acute care or everyday specialist care, but they need the holistic approach, physio and everything and also being taken care of. Now, they will be able to be discharged to the intermediate care to continue with that care and then that bed will now at least be available for the others.

And then lastly, we urge people to start at the primary healthcare level, instead of firstly jumping to the district hospitals, but we do understand especially in the non-Metro areas, some of the facilities are closed. They do not have 24-hour access, except the hospitals. So, you can understand the issue where we find that people end up going to the hospitals. But generally, there are other hubs, as I mentioned, where because you say and wellness.

So, you must not only assess a health system based only on hospitals. Hospitals are where people are sick, but for us, we are the Department of Health and Wellness. We want people to be healthy. There are many things

that are happening elsewhere. School health is happening at the schools. As I mentioned with the taxis where we bring the services to the taxi ranks. Wellness hubs, some of the Thursdays for their chronic medication. We do distribute them instead of them queueing there in all of those kinds of areas. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, are there any further question? Last opportunity for follow-ups. I see the hon Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I just want to find out, hon Minister. You were talking about the budget cuts that you have been facing from the Department of Health and we need to applaud you for really doing what you must in trying to make sure that our communities there receive the services.

Is there a policy that really empowers you to make sure because as we interact with our constituencies, we have heard how we get some provinces' chronic patients that are coming to the province to get their medication. Do we have a policy which can empower you to make sure that you claim the funds for this because the allocations are in different provinces? For those ...[Interjections.] for those patients that are coming to get their chronic medication as their provinces failed dismally to give those chronic patients their medication. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Maseko. Hon members! Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: *Ja*, thank you. Actually, it is a good question because the Health system is complex and we are one Health system with provinces and also, with national. To give an example.

Mpumalanga does not have a central hospital. Limpopo does not have a central hospital. I am thinking of those that are being referred to Gauteng. Therefore, their patients go to Gauteng, but they are getting an allocation of the Central Hospital Grant. A central hospital is a Tygerberg and a Groote Schuur Hospital which are a level 3. They do not have level 3 hospitals, but they are referred to Gauteng and they are getting the grant and the money follows. They get invoiced. It is there, it is part of their policy. Gauteng invoices them and they pay Gauteng. Similarly with the Free State. The Free State is supposed to or used to have it. I do not know what happened with Pelonomi Hospital and all of those ones.

In the Western Cape there is no such thing, irrespectively. There is a difference when someone just comes in, like myself coming to the Western Cape and then going to hospital because I moved. You can move anywhere; we are South Africans. But I am talking about doctors who even go to Cecilia Makiwane Hospital and see patients, going to Mqanduli seeing patients and even sending a helicopter for these patients to come here, whether to Red Cross or wherever. There is no money that follows. No money that follows.

And then, when you argue about it, it is about the Western Cape being privileged or something like that. Noting that whilst the Western Cape has been privileged, yet we now have the difference in the budget and noting that the disease profile in the Western Cape has got high interpersonal violence. Hence our ECs are full because of gangsterism and so forth and, also, we are the third most populous. Yet you will find that when it comes to the budgeting, we do not get extra. So, when they add one to the population, one person for the Western Cape, they will give us R200 per person for the additional population. Remember for us, that person is not coming for a cough in Groote Schuur, they are coming for 50 gunshot wounds which costs us more.

So, there is no money that follows, but we still render the services. We have got doctors who go to other areas, fully fledged paediatric cardiologists or oncologists. Luckily, I am from the Eastern Cape and most of the time I see them when I am there. When they are here, I see them and when they are there, I go there. These doctors go there and follow the patients because they are worried that in cases the care that is supposed to have been continued does not happen. Therefore, they go, but there is no money that follows and we have been asking for this throughout. Remember also, in Gauteng, for example, they even charge foreign nationals through their embassies, but for us, we are not able to do that. We have to service everyone. That is the reality.

The SPEAKER: Sjo! Thank you. Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, that brings us to the end of Questions for Oral Reply. We now come to Questions to the Premier without Notice.

QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE

[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Good afternoon, everybody and welcome to the hon de Villiers. Just for those people who I have forgotten. Remember that there are two follow-up questions by the hon member posing the question which relates to the original question or reply. I recognise the hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): The Employment Equity Act was enacted in 1998 as a form of prime to balance the previous imbalances that were created by apartheid South Africa. Now, just in terms of trying to imply with that Act, hon Premier, I would like to ask what percentage of top management positions he was thinking is held by coloured people?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier, over to you.

The PREMIER: I would recommend that the hon Mvimbi goes and look at our Annual Reports because that have exactly those details. I do not want to just thumb-suck a number here. But referring to the Act and the implications of the Act, the Act itself and what it is aiming to do, I think 29 years into our democracy, 29 years into ANC rule, the one big failure of, I think, majority ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): On a point of order, hon Premier ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Yes?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): I asked ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi. Hon Mvimbi, one minute. Can I just finish. You have to allow the hon Premier to answer and then you have an opportunity again for a follow-up. So, please just listen ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...to what he says ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): No, I ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Let him finish and then I will give you second opportunity.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): I hear you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You cannot say he does not answer the question ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): I want a point of order. I am rising on a point of order because the hon Premier is out of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, what is your point of order?

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): I have asked the hon Premier ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon Premier is out of order?

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): ...about the percentage. I can see that. I can hear.

I can hear that, clearly, he is refusing to deal with the percentage. That is the question I have asked.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): I know about the Employment Equity Act. That is why I quoted it, but I ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): So, it is clear on that that he is not going to answer because he does not know. So, I would like to move on to the next question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi! Hon Mvimbi, that is not a point of order. The hon Premier has a right to respond in the way he chooses, so I am going to allow him to finish the response and then, you may proceed after that. You may rise.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much and I really want to thank the hon Mvimbi for this question. I think it is an outstanding question to ask and I have told him exactly where to get the percentage. But in line with the question that he has asked, I am not answering something, anything different, I am answering the question on employment equity. And I want to say that I think probably, I mean the ANC has got some massive failures in South Africa.

I mean, we are living with loadshedding. We have had a whole debate on how they are messing up our export industries and our brand in the world and how we are seen by the world. I mean listen, let us not even get to talking about eight out of every ten learners in South African cannot even read with meaning. 29 years into this beautiful democracy led by the ANC, it is a total disastrous failure. They have messed everything up.

But I do want to say on employment equity, I think this is a real one that meets the cherry on the top because quite frankly, after years and years and years of trying to re-engineer and fix the atrocities of apartheid and in the past, they have dismally, dismally failed. They have failed in such a way that they have left the majority of our citizens in dire straits. [Interjections.] The highest youth unemployment rate in the world, [Interjections.] the highest unemployment rate in the world ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: So, they have totally failed ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ...when it comes to employment equity. And then what they do is they want to re-engineer, racially put quotas in place. [Interjections.] That does not work.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: They want to take people's opportunities away. They want to give you racial bean-counting numbers and that has shown that it does not work. And quite frankly, the latest amendment now and the latest regulations that are out for comment, the consequences are going to be that more and more businesses are not going to want to grow. [Interjections.] They are choosing and they are putting in a Group Areas Act in a piece of legislation. They have not learnt from the pain of apartheid, and they are doing exactly the same thing to the citizens of this country.

It is totally unacceptable, it has totally failed and this piece of regulation, all that it does is it makes politicians in the ANC wealthier and the few chosen friends and family, it turns them into big oligarchs and then everyone else is left in poverty and unemployment. It does not work, Mr Mvimbi.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Mvimbi, would you like a follow-up question?

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): It is definitely, hon Deputy Speaker, and I hope that the hon Premier is not going to be angrier ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi. Hon Mvimbi, just one minute. Can I just ask your colleagues on my left side just to allow me to hear hon

Mvimbi's question. You may proceed.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Okay. Now, hon Deputy Speaker, as I have said that because the hon Premier refused, just for his information, that coloured people only hold about 14,9% of top management posts in the Western Cape. And then also, the whites hold 73% of top management posts in the Western Cape. Now, I just want to find out whether does the hon Premier find anything wrong with this situation? If he does, what is his solution to the problem?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, hon Premier.

An HON MEMBER: There, he gave you the figures.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. Once again, I want to say to the hon Mvimbi that bean-counting does not work. [Interjections.] It has made sure that we have ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ...the highest youth unemployment rate in the world. The policies of the ANC do not work. [Interjections.] We need to recognise people for their worth and what they add to the system. That is what we need to be. We need to be based on merit and nothing else.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.]... your own credentials.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, that is your last follow-up [Interjections.] Okay, hon Mvimbi ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Can you hear me, honourable ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I can hear you now.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, since 2009, up till 2009, the top management in the Western Cape Provincial Government consisted of almost 70% people from the designated group. Since the Democratic Alliance has taken over, since then, that situation has been redressed to almost less than 50% of the representation of coloured people in the Western Cape. Does the hon Premier still not find anything wrong with that? What is he going to do to rescue the situation?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. I promise you I make sure that we appoint people on merit, number one. Number two, that we recognise that we have to have redress and go and have a look at since I have become the Premier. Who was the DG when I was the Premier and who is the new DG? Who was the head of Health and who is the new head of Health? Who was the head of Education and who is the new head of Education?

So, I am sorry, hon Mr Mvimbi, I really am sorry. [Interjections.] We need to make sure that in this country we move forward, and we actually focus on people who are unemployed instead of bean-counting and shifting around people who have got jobs. And quite frankly, the latest piece of regulation that the ANC has brought for comment in South Africa is going to be so destructive in so many provinces in this country. And in actual fact, it is talking about a certain race component within our province. It is going to destroy so many jobs.

He cannot see that it is totally counterproductive, and we need to make sure that we change the policies in South Africa that start to radically create jobs and not radically destroy jobs, the brand of our country and reduce us to a country that is the laughing stock of the world. A country where in actual fact, people cannot get jobs because of failed ANC policy. Their policy does one thing and one thing alone, is it makes ANC politicians super wealthy and ANC connected friends and family super wealthy and does nothing for the rest of society in South Africa. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. I now call on hon Plato.

Mr D PLATO (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. Hon Premier, in your opinion, what factors have contributed to the rapid rise in the cost of living in the Western Cape and South Africa?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Plato, for that question. I think one of those we debated quite long and hard today in this very Parliament. The consequences of National Government, once again, their behaviour in the global context of policy. I mean, in front of me here – I did not get to use it in one of those questions – but is the Resolution of the 118th Congress first session. It is Resolution 145 of the House of Representatives in the USA representing three members from New Jersey and three members from California. And, I mean, it is long. Basically, it talks about AGOA, but it goes further on to say that in actual fact, they are asking the President not only to investigate AGOA and whether America should still be honouring AGOA where South Africa is concerned because it focuses directly on South Africa.

The second thing is it even talks about including gas to power initiatives to counter the widespread national blackouts and that they should rethink that opportunity. It looks at proceeds linking to wildlife trafficking. It really is a horrendous resolution passed in a House that really raises a lot of questions

about us as a country. I think that is one place that definitely has an impact on our inflation rate, on the poorest of the poor.

Quite frankly, while we have been sitting here in Parliament, we have just had another 50-basis point change in our interest rate. We were having a discussion with Treasury yesterday, on the implications and if one of these members happened to have been a homeowner, building some wealth, getting some asset behind their name and they had taken out a bond and that bond two years ago, they had taken out a bond of R2-million to buy themselves a home and build some wealth. And quite frankly today, what would have been their bond payment would have increased by R6 200 ...[Interjections.] R6 200 [Inaudible.] and then he says we need a state bank which would exactly take us even further in the opposite direction. And it has been for 29 years ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon ...[Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: ...he has had an opportunity to put a state bank in place and he just failed with that as well. ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Eh, the hon Premier is very angry today. *Joh!*

The PREMIER: But hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ...the question was around the cost of living. You know, the Minister of Agriculture was talking and luckily, I got a piece of paper from him ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: ...talking about the prices that are affecting our citizens at the moment and inflation rates. So, I spoke about the impact on a bond, but let us look at the basic food prices and what is really impacting citizens in this country because of really shocking policy positions of the ANC.

So, maize prices now in the April 2022 to April 2023 have risen by 34,6%. 34,6% a staple diet. Samp 29,8%, flour 29,9%, meat 9,5%, onions 52,8%, carrots 29 point. I mean, these are all not just double digits, but over 25% increases. Cheese 14%, milk 19% and so it goes on. Washing powder 25%, fuel 24,8%, electricity 18,7% when it is there. Mostly not there. All of these things have massive, massive consequences to the poverty line and to every single citizen in this country. And guess what, 99% of it is brought to you courtesy of the ANC.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Plato, any follow-ups?

Mr D PLATO (DA): One follow-up in line with the hon Premier's current answer. What initiatives then, hon Premier, does the Western Cape

Government have in place to improve the food security of specifically, the poorest of the poor. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Okay, so I think first of all, I spoke a little bit earlier about the eight in ten learners that cannot read for meaning. And I think short term, obviously I think one of the biggest impacts is two meals a day in our education system. I think that fundamentally makes a massive difference for our learners going into the future and it costs many millions, but I think it is critical to those learners: 500 000. It is actually just over 500 000 learners in this province, as one intervention.

I know that at the Cabinet *bosberaad*, we again spoke about another gap and we have got to look at now how we fill that gap between the 1 000 days because if you look at the work that hon Minister Mbombo does in the first 1 000 days of a child's life and the impact that that has on the basic poverty line, it really has positioned this province in a way better position than any other province. Of course, the big gap is between that 1 000-day ending and school.

And I think we have got to do a bit more work there in making sure that we are playing catchup in the poverty gap because obviously, all of those prices that I have just mentioned now and the implications of interest rate hikes and our inflation rate hikes that are just creeping above any possible increase on

the salary component of our society, but more so on those citizens who are unemployed and unable to find work. And of course, we might be better off in this province with the lowest unemployment rate in South Africa, but still, there is that 21% or the 25,6% broad unemployment rate. Those citizens do not have a mechanism to feed their families and these prices are really pushing it further and further, people further and further into poverty. So, we are going to have a look at those gaps.

I think the thousands and thousands of food gardens that our Government has rolled out through the Department of Agriculture, starting off at the COVID-19 time because of this disaster and still following through, they still keep on doing it. It is those kinds of spaces that we climb in. But I do want to say that I think there is still a big, big problem facing us because of the sharp rising prices and I think one of those areas - you know, we support 2 000 NGOs, but I can see it more and more and through you, hon Madam Deputy Speaker, more and more NGOs are finding it very difficult to raise the money that they need to raise in the economic environment that we find ourselves.

So, those businesses that were having money to spend on CSI and on funding NGOs and putting money into alleviating mass poverty and unemployment, they are now spending that money on trying to rectify and save their businesses because of the energy crisis. So, they are spending it on diesel instead of spending it on NGOs and CSI spends.

So, I think we are in a very, very difficult position as a country. We might

feel we could be a bit better off in this province, but it really does worry me, and I think it is a very good question from the hon Plato because I think it is something that faces every single citizen, this mental wellbeing of being able to feed your family and to see a future. And so ja, it is very, very tough and we have got to continue looking at mechanisms that are going to help specifically the poorest of the poor, the unemployed.

We have got to find ways and we have got to get Growth for Jobs going because it is through Growth for Jobs that we find opportunities. We have got to expand our markets to the world. We have got to grow our opportunity of a track in more and more foreign direct investment. We have got to grow the economy at all costs because there are so many people that are so desperate and really need us to do that. But again, I think that this sorry state, again brought to you courtesy of the ANC. They have a year; they are on notice. Next year the election comes around and I am pretty certain that citizens are going to make a different choice.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. I am going to – no, there is a minute left. That is it. I am going to call it an end to the Questions to the Premier. That concludes – apologies – that concludes the Questions. We now move over, hon members, to Statements in terms of Rule 145. I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, the need for land in South Africa is rooted in historical inequalities characterised by land dispossessions and concentrated ownership. Addressing land ownership and redistribution is of paramount importance for achieving social justice, stimulating economy growth and reducing poverty. By ensuring equitable access to land, South Africa can foster inclusive development, redress past injustices and promote social cohesion.

However, it is disheartening to know that despite having had 30 years, the ANC has not addressed the issue of land at all. Rather than relying on an unconstitutional Expropriation Bill that will achieve nothing, what we truly need is a competent government that can plan and budget effectively. The DA wholeheartedly supports land reform, but it should be pursued with fair compensation. We firmly believe that there is no necessity to amend Section 25 of the Constitution as it already provides a framework for land reform and restitution. The slow pace of the reform can be attributed to the ANC Government's incompetence, corruption, and insufficient budget allocation. [Interjections.]

Remarkably, the ANC National Government currently owns as much as 25-million hectares of land. That is bigger than 90 other countries, yet they insist that expropriation without compensation is the only solution to the land issue. They have set a target of redistributing 30% of land to black people by 2030, while currently, only 4% of land is owned by black individuals. The ANC will not fulfil its land redistribution targets. Instead, they are more

focused on political games, indulging in luxuries with the comrades and deceiving the electorate. The DA fully supports land reform, but we strongly oppose the unconstitutional Expropriation Bill. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now recognise the ANC.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry, one minute, hon Dugmore. Hon Klaas, is it a point of order? Okay, you will get your chance under the list. Thank you. Over to you, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you. [Laughter.] Hon Deputy Speaker, the DA Mayor of Hessequa, Councillor Grant Riddles, while speaking to housing beneficiaries in their own House in Melkhoutfontein near Stilbaai, said the following. This transcript is taken from the SAPS complaint that has been laid against him. Line 19:

† “Jy moet in die verklaring lieg.” [“You must lie in the statement.”]

Line 85:

† “Dan moet jy lieg op die verklaring.” [“Then you must lie in the statement.”]

An HON MEMBER: *Haai* no.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Ja. A complaint has been laid with SAPS MAS35/4/2023 and the HAWKS are investigating.

At the Council meeting yesterday, it was unanimously resolved to refer the Mayor to a disciplinary committee within 30 days. It has emerged that even Council workers who do not qualify for housing subsidies were allegedly urged by Mayor Riddles to lie about their income. This is on tape. It is recorded. Yes, hon Deputy Speaker, the DA Mayor of Hessequa did this. The audio recording proves this beyond doubt. MEC Simmers is also the DA Leader in this House. †Hy is nie hier vandag nie, hy het weggehardloop. [He’s not here today, he ran away]. Why has the DA leader not suspended Grant Riddles? In Swellendam the DA expelled Deputy Mayor Pokwas who had never committed any corrupt act.

Hon Deputy Speaker, this, as serious as it seems, is just the tip of the iceberg in Hessequa. It is alleged that the contractor, Asla, rented a site from the Mayor himself to store equipment in Stilbaai. So, they paid the Mayor. It is further alleged that other municipal officials who do not qualify for subsidies

were unlawfully given subsidies. It is not just the blatantly corrupt conduct of the Mayor of Hessequa, it is the devastating impact on the beneficiaries. Asla has abandoned the site. †Daar is geen bouwerk wat nou daar aangaan nie. [There is no construction work going on there now]. Construction has stopped, and this is how the corruption of the DA ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...is affecting people on the ground.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Shall I conclude? And that is why we are going to the Public Protector, COGTA and we call on MEC Simmers ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...to expel this Mayor without further hesitation.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Klaas, now is your opportunity. [Interjections.]

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Ja, The EFF statement, corruption, maladministration taking place under Collaboration School Pilot Programme. The EFF would like to take the opportunity to condemn the Western Cape Education Department regarding corruption, maladministration, enslaving of teachers ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Enslaving?

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): ...and infringement of learner's rights to the education using the so-called Collaboration School Pilot Programme. [Interjections.] Under this Collaboration School Programme, public schools are [Inaudible.] with corrupt non-profit organisations which continue [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]... communication of [Interjections.]

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Speak to me, hon Klaas, I am listening.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Under this Collaboration School Programme, public schools are [Inaudible.] with corrupt non-profit organisations which continue to siphon public money through the Education Department for their own enrichment and potential kickbacks to members of the Department.

...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Huh? [Inaudible.]

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Zwelethemba High School is one of the schools in the province placed on the corrupt pilot project. Complaints coming from the school are that teachers are not adequately paid as they do not receive their salaries from the Department, but from the school in collaboration with this corrupt non-profit organisation. Most teachers at Zwelethemba High School do not last for long due to the non-payment and as a result, there is a constant shortage of teachers resulting in the learners not receiving proper education. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): As we speak, the school ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, finish off. Last sentence.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Last sentence, okay. Let us. The EFF calls on the Western Cape Education Department to scrap this pilot project in [Inaudible.] to PERSAL system and make sure that schools that are currently under this pilot project ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): ...receive an adequate number of teachers ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): ...and resources.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Klaas. I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. The recent Employment Equity Act Regulation gazetted by the ANC National Government last week is an affront to the South African Constitution and [Inaudible.] against the values of non-racialism [Interjections.] which the ANC themselves purport to expose. These regulations seek to introduce numerical racial targets across all industries and regions in South Africa, and smacks of yet another sinister attempt by the ANC National Government to expand its control over the South African economy and private sector.

These regulations do not seek to foster any real transformation or representation as it is evident in the incoherent and clumsy nature of its formulation. Hon Deputy Speaker, instead, the regulations will effectively ban the employment of certain groups of South Africans in certain provinces and sectors of the economy, drive an estimated 600 000 South Africans into

potential unemployment, lead to mass brain-drain and trigger further disinvestment in a country already ravaged by a 42,6% expanded unemployment rate.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the ANC National Government has failed so dismally in promoting economic growth and job creation. That is how they now stooped to reinforcing racial categories of the past as an electoral ploy and completely disregarding the far-reaching implications of these regulations. Hon Deputy Speaker, the Democratic Alliance believes in creating an open and thriving economy in order to create true transformation, upliftment and opportunities for all South Africans. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Philander. I now recognise the hon De Villiers. You are giving it a miss? That is fine. I recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, yesterday I received an email from a parent of a learner from the Fishhoek High School and she called it yesterday at the school, her words:

“There was a homosexual and lesbian march on the premises orchestrated.”

According to her and incited by teachers. Three teachers and seven to ten schoolchildren marched with a multi-coloured flag of this movement and was

waved in the procession. She says:

“I simply am contacting the ACDP to take this matter up with the Western Cape Education Department. My daughter is a learner at the school, and I am obviously very, very concerned that she will be victimised. My daughter begged me, no emails. I will not by any chance give the name – I am giving my name, but please do not mention my daughter’s name as I am scared, she will be victimised.”

The question is: did the educators have permission to participate in this march? And I am asking the hon Minister to please investigate – a letter is on its way to his office – to investigate what happened yesterday. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the ANC.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks, hon Deputy Speaker. The ANC welcomes the announced plans by the Human Settlements Minister, Mmamoloko Kubayi, to give the Housing Development Agency the responsibility to provide basic services to communities in the Cape Town informal settlements. This is a move that will bring back dignity for the poor as they will no longer relieve themselves in plastic bags or be forced to share single ablution facilities with 15 other families. It is when it becomes clear to the Minister that the DA and MEC Simmers had no interest addressing these challenges

that she made a decision for the HOD to take over the responsibility. Minister Kubayi was disappointed by the lack of progress in the provision of services, such as water and sanitation in 16 informal settlements in Khayelitsha.

For years, our people in the province were forced to live undignified lives with no basic services such as water and sanitation. It is for this reason that we think the responsibility should be for the entire province. We concur with the Minister's remarks. Indeed, there is no time for excuses whilst our people are suffering. We are happy that Minister Kubayi was able to dispel the myth of fiscal dumping that was being spread by the dishonest alliance why its failure to spend R111-million allocated to provide basic services for 16 informal settlements and to address the PRASA railway line relocations. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

Mr D PLATO (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. On Tuesday, I chaired a meeting of the Standing Committee on Social Development. We saw representatives of SASSA's Western Cape operation brief us on their progress in rectifying longstanding issues surrounding grant distributions. This included their plan for dealing with the eminent liquidation of the South African Post Office which many of our older residents still use to access their grants.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I am pleased to report that some progress has been made in this regard and it was clear that the staff of the Western Cape of SASSA have worked hard to find these solutions. But what was also clear, was the fact that these people, many of whom seem to truly care about improving the experiences of our people, are constantly hamstrung by a total lack of leadership from their organisation at a national level.

From January to March this year, more than R1,7-billion Social Relief of Distress Grants have gone unpaid in South Africa and the Western Cape. [Interjections.] This is unsurprising when both nationally and in the Western Cape, SASSA suffers from a catastrophically high vacancy rate and operates under the management of senior staff who are expected to fill temporary positions for months and years on end. We understand procedures have been drafted to resolve this situation, but Minister Lindiwe Zulu has failed to implement them.

As always under the ANC, those on the ground have been left high and dry by those who are supposed to be leading them. Under these circumstances, it is little surprise that long queues of unpaid grants and other service delivery challenges persist in the Western Cape. Minister Zulu must address the problem and must rise to the occasion and fix this vital part of our social security net before it is too late. The National Department of Social Development declared a R9,1-billion savings in the 2022/2023 financial year. This amount of money meant for the poorest of the poor has been shifted by

National Treasury to other departments. The Department of Social Development failed to spend the budget. ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr D PLATO (DA): Thank you so much. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise the Freedom Front ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi! I recognise the Freedom Front Plus. Are you online? [Interjections.] No. I am going to move over to Al Jama-Ah. [Interjections.]

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Am I audible, hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are, you may proceed.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Ah, thank you very much. Hon Deputy

Speaker, crime in the Western Cape remains a matter of serious concern. It is not decreasing but getting worse. The need for immediate intervention is superficial and ineffective. There is no consideration for alternatives and to implement the best methods to eradicate crime. This DA-led Province with the City of Cape Town lack the political will to deal with crime, gangsterism and drug peddling. The 2022 Third Quarter police data shows that Mitchells Plain is leading in terms of illegal possession of firearms and ammunition, followed by Delft. Driving under the influence of alcohol and drugs increased to 83,6%. Communities are suffering and have lost trust in the police.

The community of Tafelsig called on the People Against Gangsterism And Drugs [PAGAD] for help to root out gangsters and drug dealers from areas. When the PAGAD motorcade arrived in Tafelsig on Tuesday, 23 May 2023, they were confronted by 20 police [Laughter.] 20 police and law enforcement vehicles, a Nyala and water cannon to prevent them from embarking on an anti-crime motorcade.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the point I want to raise is that the police know who the gangsters and drug peddlers are and where they live but fail to act. One of several grievances the community has is the police absence when the gangsters are shooting and threatening the lives of innocent people. There are several police law enforcement and police vehicles not only become visible when PAGAD arrived to help the communities, but also at events organised by the Jewish communities. Is this province protecting gangsters

and drug dealers, criminals and people intent on establishing a Zionist laager in the Western Cape? I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

Ms C MURRAY (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I welcome the commitment made by the Department of Home Affairs that the legislation and public participation needed for the implementation of remote working visas will be completed by June. While this has taken much longer than necessary, it seems that we will finally see this visa brought to life.

This visa will be a game-changer for the Western Cape, which already has a significant entertainment and tourism industry in place. This is because remote workers will spend their earnings here, rather than in the country where they are employed. Remote workers will contribute to our economy and create jobs by spending their foreign earnings in our shops, in our businesses and accommodation, bolstering the local economy and again, creating jobs.

Our beautiful province is already an international tourist hotspot and it is well past time that we open up to the 35-million digital nomads worldwide. We are in a prime position to take advantage of this new trend in remote working because who would not want to live and work in Cape Town, Plettenberg Bay or any of the other picturesque seaside towns dotted along

our coastline.

The DA will keep a close eye on the implementation of legislation over the next month and will hold the Department of Home Affairs accountable should they fail to deliver. Once the legislation is implemented, we will push for clarity on the application process and the efforts to be taken to promote awareness of this visa among the global community. We need to grow our economy and this visa will contribute immensely to that. Let us get it over the line.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. That brings us to the end of Statements. In terms of Rule 145(6), I now give one or more members of the Executive an opportunity to respond for not more than five minutes collectively. Are there any hon Ministers who would like to respond. Hon Minister Maynier, over to you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Set the clock.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The hon member is quite wrong about collaboration schools. Corrupt collaboration schools like Apex High School in fact, provide a model which provides excellent education, particularly for poor communities in the Western Cape. And so, it is unsurprising, hon Deputy Speaker, that the hon member joins a coalition of Equal Education,

Equal Education Law Centre and SADTU to oppose collaboration schools which provide excellent education for children in poor communities in our province.

I can assure him that I have absolutely, absolutely no intention of scrapping the model. In fact, I have every intention of expanding the model because the difference between that hon member and myself is my mission is to provide better education for poor communities, rather than to oppose better education, like this member, better education for poor communities here in the Western Cape. I would advise the hon member to decide where he stands. Is he for better education in poor communities in which case he should support collaboration schools, or does he oppose collaboration schools that provide excellent education for poor children in our province. [Interjections.] Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Are there any further hon Ministers who would like to respond? [Interjections.] No? The hon Minister may continue.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hon Deputy Speaker, my hand was up.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You have still got 3 minutes 35. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute. One minute, hon Minister Maynier. I see the hon Minister Mackenzie would just like to respond. Hon Minister Mackenzie, over to you. My apologies.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker and thank you for giving me the opportunity. Hon Deputy Speaker, I think it is worth mentioning: any National Government Minister that dumps R111-million on 31 March, probably at 11 o'clock, should be criminally charged and deserves to be in jail for wasting taxpayers' money. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Over to you, hon Minister Maynier.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Let me also say that I look forward to receiving the hon member's letter. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Interjections.] No, the hon Klaas cannot respond. [Laughter.] No. It is the prerogative under Rule 145(6) for the Ministers only. You may respond afterwards to the hon Minister directly. [Interjections.] Thank you very much, hon Klaas. That brings us to the end of Members' Statements.

MOTIONS

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We now move over to Notices of Motion in terms

of Rule 151. All Notices of Motion by members are required to be delivered to the Secretary for placing it on the Order Paper and these motions have been duly submitted and published on the Order Paper below the line.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the inefficiencies within the South African Police Service (SAPS) and how it has affected and hamstrung the current state of safety and policing in the Western Cape.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the delay in getting the railway lines and resultant infrastructure in the Western Cape in working condition to benefit the community.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Motions without Notice in terms of Rule 150. I would like to inform you that in terms of the Standing Rule 150 pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolence and congratulatory were submitted to the

Programming Authority prior to this plenary on 23 May 2023. Hon members are also reminded that Motions without Notice pertaining to congratulatory and condolence, will not be allowed in this Sitting, that have not been processed by the Programming Authority.

I have been informed that in the Programming Authority meeting of 23 May 2023, political parties did submit the names of the hon members in the desired order of speaking and those who had wished to move a motion without notice in this sitting of the House. I will therefore, just for noting and for purposes of the Minutes, call out the hon members whose names have accordingly been submitted and approved.

The following member motions have been approved by the Programming Authority: hon Christians, hon Bosman, hon Van der Westhuizen, hon Dugmore, hon Windvogel, hon Bakubaku-Vos, hon Nkondlo, hon Sayed, hon Kama and hon Mvimbi.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): I move without notice:

That the House joins the family and friends of the late Janine Daniels as they mourn her tragic passing; notes that Byron Lukas reports in the *Daily Voice* of 17 May 2023 that she died in the fire that destroyed her informal dwelling; notes that her family and friends are devastated by

her untimely death; notes that they agree that the deceased was someone they could depend upon; notes that Kay Daames, mother of the deceased, was too devastated to speak of her daughter; extends condolences to the family and friends of the late Janine; and it is our prayer that the presence of God will strengthen them during the time of their bereavement.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Tygerberg Children's Choir on their incredible success at the Hull International Choir Competition, which was held in the United Kingdom from 27 April to 1 May.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Deli-Co Farmstyle Butchery in Riebeeck Kasteel on 30 years of success; notes that their modern agri-processing and food processing plant has been developed to the highest standard over the past 30 years; further notes that this successful agri-business provides jobs and dignity to 560 people in the Western Cape; and wishes the business well for another 30 years of top-class meat production.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I move without notice:

That the House notes with profound sadness the passing away of Dr Dennis George, a former union leader, activist and Ayo Technology Board member; notes that as a former General-Secretary of the Federation of Unions of South Africa (FEDUSA), he fought passionately for the rights of workers championing fair wages, safe working conditions, and equitable opportunities; notes that George's life journey was one of relentless pursuit for a better world, particularly for the majority of South Africans who continue to face socio-economic challenges; and extends condolences and messages of strength to his family and friends.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with pride and congratulates Dr Ronald Kroukamp, originally from Grabouw and now working at Mitchells Plain CHC, who won the gold award for the best frontline service delivery employees; notes that Dr Kroukamp not only made Grabouw and the Overberg proud, but he continues to shine the spotlight on the great work that our

dedicated healthcare heroes continue to do for the people; and calls on the Provincial Government to treat them with the respect they deserve.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep shock and sadness the passing away of Olwethu Mkrola (25) and his 4 children: Awonke Sgidi, who was in Grade 6 at the Isalathiso Primary School, and Hlobisile Mkrola (4), Kamogelo Mkrola (5), and Avuzwa Mkrola (3), who attended the Masincedisane Educare Centre; notes that the five family members were involved in a tragic accident on the N2 near Mossel Bay; and extends its heartfelt condolences to their family and friends.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates Mr Ndithini Leon Thyido on his recent election as the Chairperson of the Khayelitsha Development Forum (KDF) at its 10th elective conference held earlier this month; notes that the KDF is a strategic centre to coordinate the development of one of the country's biggest townships; and wishes him and his collective well for their term to show to the world that Khayelitsha is

indeed, not a jungle.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with profound sadness the passing away of anti-apartheid activist, a member of uMkhonto we Sizwe, and a stalwart of our liberation movement, comrade Mzowandile McDonald Masala, who passed away on 2 May 2023 in hospital following a short illness; notes that comrade Masala, a veteran of our movement, was one of the MK members awarded military medals as members of the Luthuli Detachment, the first generation of MK combatants in the 1960s; notes that he also served as a Member of Parliament for the ANC and as South African Ambassador to Zambia between 2004 and 2007; and conveys heartfelt condolences to his family and comrades.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with profound sadness the passing away of comrade Mogolodi Corra Dikgacwi, a selfless hero of our liberation struggle, a dedicated servant of the people, comrade Corra was a provincial organiser for the ANC in the province, and also served as

Member of Parliament; and conveys condolences to his family, comrades and loved ones, as well to the community of Oudtshoorn and the Southern Cape at large.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep regret the passing away of South Africa's serving Ambassador to the People's Democratic Republic of Algeria, Mr Billy Masetlha; notes that while a consummate diplomat, Mr Masetlha also served as head of the National Intelligence Agency and as a former member of uMkhonto we Sizwe; notes that, during his time in exile, in Botswana and Zambia, he served in various capacities in the youth and student movements; and notes that, a Pan-Africanist at heart, South Africa is the poorer for losing one of its sons of this calibre and nature.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now put the motions duly submitted and approved by the Programming Authority to the House. Are there any objections? No objections, agreed to. The motions will appear in the Minutes of the proceedings and in Hansard, in the individual member's names as if that member had read them out aloud. I will now afford the opportunity to hon

members to move Motions without Notice as per the Standing Rule of 152(d) and this can also include Motions without Notice that were not approved of in the Programming Authority meeting. Hon members are reminded that 30 minutes as per the Standing Rule will begin now. I will now recognise hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House notes with deep sadness the death of LEAP officer Siphelo Magwa, who was murdered along with his brother and one other person in Crossroads on 18 May. It is utterly heartrending to note that Mr Magwa who had dedicated himself to the safety and security of his fellow citizens, passed on in such sudden and brutal circumstances and at such a horrifically young age. The House should mourn his loss, as well as that of the other two victims of this murder and should further join calls for SAPS to urgently apprehend the perpetrators of this egregious crime and punish them to the fullest extent of the law. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon Pretorius.

Mr G PRETORIUS (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the death of academic and former politician Dr Denis Worrall, who served as Ambassador to Australia and the United Kingdom in the 1980s. Suffering a crisis of confidence amid his growing consciousness of the political system he had served, Worrall resigned his ambassadorship in 1986 in order to return to South Africa and oppose apartheid. After 1994, he embarked on a glittering business and academic career which included such achievements as acting as the Vice Chairperson of the International Bank of Southern Africa. The House should recognize that his loss will be felt by innumerable students, colleagues, and admirers of Dr Worrall. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House notes that Boelhouer Farm in Matjiesfontein town in

Laingsburg Municipality currently produces between 10 and 25 truckloads of bottled water per week (season dependent), under the name 'Matjiesfontein Water', they employ 19 people and have plans to extend their business with another plant, bringing the total number of water plants to three; further notes that this 'Matjiesfontein Water' is currently being distributed for sale at all Engen garages across the Western Cape province; recognises that in order for Boelhouer Farm to grow, despite them having faced many challenges and given a spike in demand, that they require the installation of an additional Eskom electricity connection; further recognises, that in anticipation and preparation of the Eskom installation of additional electricity connection, they have already spent approximately R170 000 to purchase cables for this purpose. Given that they are now waiting for months for this installation and in the spirit of stimulating economic growth and opportunities, that the House calls upon Eskom to urgently expedite the process of installation of the additional electricity connection for Boelhouer Farm; and this House welcomes Boelhouer Farm's commitment to economic opportunities in the Karoo. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objection, agreed to. Hon Kaiser-Philander.

Ms W F KAISER-PHILANDER (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House sends well wishes to Ms Magdie de Kock following her re-election as President of the Associated Country Women of the World in Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia on 23 May 2023. The Associated Country Women of the World was founded in 1929 to bring together rural women and their organisations across the globe in order to collaborate and find solutions to the unique challenges they faced as a result of the isolation of their communities, discrimination against women, and their limited access to political processes. Rural women in the world experience hardships from poverty, under-development, gender-based violence, discrimination in the workplaces, political under-representation, multiple health issues, food insecurity, and general neglect. We are proud of the work the Association of Country Women is doing world-wide in creating a better world. †Ons is opreg trots op die herverkose President van die Wêreldbond van Plattelandse Vroue, Magdie de Kock van Suid-Afrika. [We are genuinely proud of the re-elected President of the Associated Country Women of the World, Magdie de Kock of South Africa] The organisation has members within 82 countries and has passed more than 180 policy resolutions focussing on the empowerment of rural women in all their diversity; that the House offers its support to Ms De Kock as she leads the organisation in its empowerment of rural women and communities. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. The hon Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House notes the achievements of Ms Cindy Anthonie from Matjiesfontein, who having worked at the front desk of the famous Lord Milner Hotel in Matjiesfontein for 17 years was recently promoted to the role of Hotel Manager; recognises that this promotion represents Ms Anthonie's friendliness, warmth and utmost professionalism; acknowledges that her story represents what is possible when the people of the Western Cape are allowed to grow and flourish in a healthy economy; and further recognises that Ms Anthonie's story is emblematic of the potential of our people. May you be successful in every endeavour you tackle within your career! I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon Baartman, you seem to be in demand.

†Die ADJUNK-HOOFSWEEP (DA): Agb Adjunkspeaker, namens die Demokratiese Alliansie lê ek ter tafel 'n mosie sonder kennisgewing:

Dat hierdie Huis kennis neem van die ontydige afsterwe van Mnr Stoffel Botes van Klaarstroom; hulde bring aan mnr Botes se getroue diens aan sy gemeenskap deur sy werk as 'n raadslid in Prins Albert Munisipaliteit, en onlangs as onderburgemeester van dieselfde munisipaliteit; kennis neem dat dit 'n groot verlies is wanneer ons 'n toegewyde plaaslike aktivis verloor; ons innige simpatie uitspreek aan sy familie en vriende en hulle sterkte toewens deur hierdie moeilike tyd. Adjunkspeaker, ek lê hiedie mosie ter tafel.

[The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, on behalf of the Democratic Alliance I'm tabling a motion without notice:

That this House notes the untimely death of Mr Stoffel Botes of Klaarstroom; honours Mr Botes's faithful service to his community through his work as Council member in Prince Albert Municipality, and recently as Deputy-Mayor of the same municipality; notes that it is a great loss when we lose a dedicated local activist; expresses its sincere sympathy to his family and friends and wishes them strength during this difficult time. Deputy Speaker, I so move.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Baie dankie. [The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.] Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon Mvimbi. Not here. Hon Sayed.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): No, hon Deputy Speaker. I am here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: My apologies. Are you online?

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Yes, I am on.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, you may proceed. I would have given you your chance. There you go.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Oh, okay. No, thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and commends the South African President, HE Cyril Matamela Ramaphosa accompanied by members of the Executive from the national, provincial, and local spheres of government on the sixth Presidential Imbizo that was held with a focus on the District Development Model and with the theme ‘Leave no one Behind’, as many appreciated the opportunity to engage with the President and to raise their issues. The President honed into the challenges raised around crime, gender-based violence and gangsterism in the province and

assured community members that these issues will be addressed in a meaningful manner. The DA Chief Whip, Wendy Kaizer-Philander, called the Presidential Imbizo an ‘electioneering ploy by the ANC’ when her own Premier, hon Alan Winde and hon MEC Anton Bredell were part of the delegation accompanying the President. This is a clear picture of how DA’s internal conflict will hurt the citizens of the Western Cape. It is the same Philander’s Cabinet that had a week-long outreach programme that yielded no positive outcome, except for useless and wasteful expenditure, but wants to come and make baseless accusations about the Imbizo. If she wants to look into the wasteful expenditure, she must first start with the DA. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much honourable ...[Interjections.] hon Mvimbi. [Interjections.] For the record, there are objections. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.] There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise the hon Sayed. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice: [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Order, hon members. Okay, you may proceed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with shock the numerous challenges faced by the recently built Witsand Primary school. The Western Cape Education Department only provides food for 120 of the 700 learners, all of whom come from impoverished communities in the area. There are no security personnel at the school while the school has been broken into on three occasions with no responses from Safe Schools to date. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise the hon Sayed. Order, hon members.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, on this particular motion I am going to withdraw ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...because subsequently after submission, the hon Minister's office has responded, and they are working on the matter.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...for letting me know. Thank you. [Interjections.]

Hon members, that concludes Motions without Notice. That also concludes the business for the House and the House is now adjourned. Thank you very much.

The House adjourned at 18:54.