

---

MONDAY, 25 MARCH 2023

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid Sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 10:00.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

**BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may be seated. Order! Good morning, everybody. A very warm welcome to all my members, guests, and those that are online.

I have to announce that due to the resignation of hon Kama a vacancy occurred in the representation of the ANC in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. This vacancy has since been filled by the nomination of Ms P Harris, with effect from 13 March 2024. Ms Harris was sworn in, in the Speaker's office on 13 March 2024. A very warm welcome to the hon Harris.

I trust she is probably online.

Thank you very much. Hon members, before we begin, I would like to just repeat some of the Rules of the House. I think there has been quite a gap since we last sat here. Just to remind everybody that our Standing Rules have accordingly been amended to accommodate hybrid Sittings and that a member of this Provincial Parliament who elects to participate virtually and not in the Chamber should ensure that he or she has very good quality in terms of data connectivity, good audio and video and that there are not any disturbances where they are. Members would note that the hybrid system has been functioning well and that poor audio or video is not attributed to the system, but rather the quality of data connectivity.

Members present in the Chamber and via Teams have all the privileges and immunities imparted by law.

The media have also been granted access to the MS Teams meeting as guests. However, the members of the press may not use the chat room or speak or activate their cameras while the Sitting is in progress.

Language Translation Services are available in the Chamber and if you are on hybrid, please access those language translation services via a second device. Hon members are reminded, no interjections are permitted during these hybrid Sittings, and to this end I draw the hon members' attention to Rule 40 of the Standing Rules. Thank you very much.

The Secretary will now read the first Order of the Day.

### **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

The SECRETARY: Consideration of the principle of the Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B 1–2024]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Secretary. I now recognise the hon, Minister Wenger.

The PREMIER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Good morning, hon Deputy Speaker, hon Premier and Cabinet Ministers, Chief Whip, Leader of the Opposition, members of the Western Capital Parliament and people of the Western Cape. My apologies for joining you virtually this morning. I am feeling a little under the weather, but I will endeavour to do my best to participate fully in the debate.

When I delivered the 2024 Main Budget in this House two weeks ago, I made three things clear. First, as a country and as a province, we face significant challenges which are brought about by pressing global concerns, weak national economic prospects and an increasingly constrained fiscal environment underpinned by unprecedented uncertainty and the collapse of

the National Budget process, which is forcing us to do far more with much less.

Second, we will face up to these challenges and we, as the Western Cape Government, remain utterly determined to check the poor and the most vulnerable now by stabilising essential services, relied on by many, such as excellent education, quality healthcare and social services needed to provide a pathway to a better tomorrow.

Third, we will continue the vital work to build a better future for all who call the Western Cape home, by prioritising and investing in those key ingredients of a flourishing and growing economy that creates many more jobs and opportunities for all.

While this will not be easy, nothing truly worth doing has ever been easy, and it is our responsibility as Government to work relentlessly day and night to make the tough choices that will be the difference between the current national trajectory of continued decline and accelerating the Western Cape's path to more economic growth that leads to a brighter future and a more prosperous future for all.

With the right choices, the right policies, we will continue on our upward trajectory of increasing employment and decreasing inequality with this budget to keep building a Western Cape that works for all.

Deputy Speaker, the facts speak plain and true. In the Western Cape we have the lowest unemployment rate in South Africa at 20,3%; the lowest expanded unemployment rate in South Africa at 25,6%; the highest employment-to-population rate in South Africa at 55% and the highest labour force participation rate in South Africa at 69%.

We also have the lowest inequality in the country as measured by the Gini coefficient, with an encouraging declining trend over the last five years. There is much more work to be done, but these self-evident truths show that this Government's approach to attract and incentivise investment to support and enable the private sector with expertly designed and implemented plans through determined action, we are making progress in cutting unemployment and lifting many more people out of poverty and into prosperity.

This year we must face up to and mitigate the impact of an unclear and ambiguous National Budget process. On all fronts, the Western Cape is facing funding cuts from National Government.

In-year we were dealt a body blow when the negotiated Public Sector Wage Deal was unilaterally imposed on provinces. In the Western Cape only our Departments of Health and Education received partial funding of the Wage Agreement of 70% and 64,5% respectively, of what they required. Every other department had no choice but to absorb the full cost of the Wage Agreement. Our intergovernmental dispute, therefore, is about settling the principles of intergovernmental relations and the consultation and agreement

required when a wage deal is made. This is to protect the integrity and the predictability of a budget. It is so important that we are never in this situation again.

Our proportion of the Provincial Equitable Share, the horizontal pie, if I could call it that, is projected to decline by R379,6 million over the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) and, due to fiscal consolidation, the Western Cape's Budget is significantly reduced by R6,36 billion over the 2024 MTEF.

Conditional grants allocated by National Government to provinces for specific programmes have also been slashed by a net reduction of R1,1 billion over the MTEF. This includes cutting the Human Settlements Development Grant by R621 million; cutting the Ilima Letsema Grant for emerging Black farmers by R19 million over the MTEF; cutting the comprehensive Agricultural Support Programme by R13,3 million over the MTEF; slashing the Informal Settlements Upgrading Partnership Grant by R841 million over the next three years; cutting the District Health Programmes Grant by R180 million over the MTEF and cutting the Health Facility Revitalisation Grant by R69,9 million over the MTEF.

These funding cuts implemented by National Government are cutting the very lifelines the poor and most vulnerable rely on, but Deputy Speaker, while National Government may be cutting grants earmarked to upgrade informal settlements, cutting grants to support emerging Black farmers and to improve

healthcare, we are moving forward and we are stepping in, in many cases supplementing Conditional Grants to make sure our children and most vulnerable are protected. We must work smarter, strategically plan and implement solutions because we must keep building a Western Cape that works for all which is why our approach to the 2024/2025 Budget focus first on protecting basic service delivery outcomes and supporting the partners to absorb the impact of baseline reductions.

Second, we are driving the implementation of programmes within the key provincial priorities of jobs, safety and wellbeing, while maintaining stability. A stable province is a working province and we will keep building a Western Cape that works.

Third, we have prioritised Infrastructure Maintenance and finally, because the Western Cape carefully plans to build a province that works for all, we are able to protect and prioritise where it matters most, for our children, our elderly, the sick and the vulnerable, because we are their safety nets, so that they too have an opportunity to hope and to succeed.

Deputy Speaker, overall, the Western Cape Government will allocate a total budget of R84 billion in 2024/25; R84,3 billion in 2025/26 and R86,9 billion in 2026/27.

Over the 2024 Medium Term Expenditure Framework to keep building the Western Cape that works for all, we will allocate R182,3 billion to wellbeing,

inclusive of Health and Wellness, Education and Social Services. We will allocate R45 billion to continue our work to grow the economy and to enable the creation of many more jobs across the province. We will allocate R21,8 billion to Innovation, Culture and Governance as a critical tool to enhance service delivery and to enable public servants to do more for our residents and we will allocate R5 billion to Safety to boost existing interventions, which includes an additional R190 million land over the 2024 MTEF so we can keep building a future where we all feel safe.

Of the total R255,3 billion Rand Provincial Budget over the MTEF at least two-thirds, 75,4% or R192,2 billion, is being spent to champion the needs of the poor and the most vulnerable in our province. This prioritisation of the needs of our poor includes allocations to primary healthcare, home and community-based care, mental health services, learner transport, the School Nutrition Programme, low-cost housing, food gardens in communities and schools, Child and Youth-care Centres and Poverty Alleviation Programmes, and to continue to build a better future, we will invest in and maintain vital infrastructures to support the growth of our businesses, our economy and our people. This is why we will invest in fixed assets, catalytic and agricultural infrastructure over the 2024 MTEF amounting to a total of R32,12 billion.

As part of our investment in the future and opportunities of prosperity for the people of the Western Cape, we are allocating funding to improve safety and access to affordable transport while supporting economic growth and spatial



transformation amidst climate change challenges. We are increasing energy resilience to ensure the availability of affordable, reliable electricity supply upon which the economy relies. We are supporting and growing SMMEs and township-based businesses through the SMME Booster Fund because our small businesses are the engines of our economy, providing jobs for thousands in this province.

We are investing in upskilling our young people to make sure they have the right skills, the right qualifications and the right experience for jobs available now and into the future and we are connecting young people with work opportunities through the innovative Job Seeker Partner, giving job seekers free transport to interviews and improved access to opportunities. We are hard at work on the foundations on which businesses and residents can build a life defined by opportunity in every region of our province.

Deputy Speaker, to conclude, the Western Cape Budget of 2024 sets a pathway to enable a growing economy and promote the safety and wellbeing of the residents of the Western Cape over the medium term to keep building a Western Cape that works for all. Within the context of a reduced fiscal envelope, we are single-minded in our determination to protect essential services and to continue our work to build a better tomorrow, especially for our vulnerable and poor residents, and we will continue to build on our strong foundations of good governance, of enabling the private sector and especially SMMEs, our young people and energy resilience so that we can trust in the future that we are striving to build every day.

I therefore ask this House for support of this Budget. Thank you.

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor, hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister. I now recognise the hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. It is funny that the MEC for Finance talks about the fact that at the moment the Western Cape has the lowest unemployment rate in the country. The truth is that there has never been an occasion when the Western Cape has not had the lowest unemployment because of many particular advantages that this province has. In fact, Deputy Speaker, when the ANC governed this province, the unemployment rate was 17% lower than it is now, so I think the MEC is misleading this House when she wants to make that particular claim and then also she talks about the intergovernmental dispute, but in essence what we have here is a Democratic Alliance that does not want to actually pay a living and a fair wage to all workers across the country, which is regulated through the Public Service Bargaining Council.  
[Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Inequalities of...

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So like they are talking about this notion of a separate Western Cape, they want to actually pay workers of this Administration lower than workers elsewhere, because why do we have a situation where the DA, in their own manifesto, does not support a minimum wage? The President and the Wages Council has determined the minimum wage according to sector... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...which amounts to between R4 200 and R4 600... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You must tell the workers, nè.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: But members of this House and the public and especially the voters need to understand that this Democratic Alliance wants a minimum wage to be R2 000. [Interjections.] So that is the reality. They do not want a public service that can regulate salaries for everyone that will be equitable and further than that a vote for the DA actually means that you are voting against.

†Asoze sivotele le DA, asoze! Asifuni le DA! Kufanele ukuba ihambe ngoku...sidiniwe yiDA ngoku maba hambe! [Interjections.]

[We will never vote for this DA! We don't want this DA! it should go now...

We are tired of the DA now. Let them go!] [Interjections]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...and then it is funny that the MEC, after the suicide of Mr Markus Jooste, it is also important to note that this Democratic Alliance sitting across, they received money from Markus Jooste... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Blood money!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: And where did Markus Jooste get his money from? He got money from the Public Investment Commission so they want to come here and talk about good governance but the reality is... [Interjections.]

†Bafumene imali...[Interjections.]

[They received the money...][Interjections]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Hulle het geld gekry van...

[Tussenwerpsels.]

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: They received money from... [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members. Hon Dugmore, just take your seat. Hon members, on the same side to which your Chief Whip is standing,

please! Hon Lekker, what is your point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: The point of order, Deputy Speaker, is with regards to the fact that you are not calling them to order. We have been quiet the whole time that the MEC was speaking... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Exactly! Exactly! [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: But you are keeping numb. Can you please be conscious and address the issue of the decorum of this House that is being disabused by those people on that other side?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am not necessarily going to take the views of the Chief Whip of the Opposition Party because I am still watching one of your members continue to talk despite, I have asked for an order. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Because hon Deputy Speaker, you are quiet, you do not even recognise... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So hon members on both sides, hon Lekker, I am not – I have not addressed you. [Interjections.] Please can we have some respect. [Interjection.]

Hon Lekker, please! Now remember you are allowed to have interjections, but not ongoing interjections. Please, can we ask from both sides of the House that we at least allow the hon Dugmore to complete his speech? You may proceed. You may proceed.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. The debate today follows our country's Celebration of Human Rights Day last week. Our people continue to enjoy Constitution enshrined rights to dignity and these are the issues that we actually celebrated last week, but once again the people of our province noticed that the DA Provincial Government did little, actually nothing to honour Human Rights Day. The Premier went to visit a hospital in the Overberg but there is no proactive culture to promote human rights in this province. Let us take the basic right... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: What basic right?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...the basic right to dignity, because in regard to the basic right to dignity... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Try to be silent here.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: There are incidences of racism and discrimination. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Do not just move it here!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you. It is clear, through the Deputy Speaker to hon Nkondlo and to Mr Van der Westhuizen that the Deputy Speaker is being protected from her disciplinary inquiry and in return for that she is making these rulings in favour of her own party because even though she was found guilty, it is clear that they are never going to deal with the issue whereas they dealt with hon Mngqasela. They dealt with all these other people, but she remains the Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, please take your seat. Thank you very much. Hon Deputy Chief Whip?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I rise in terms of Rule 62, dealing with reflections of holders of an office. The respective matter that the member is referring to is before the Appeals Committee. I do not wish any member to be telling or instructing or guiding the Appeals Committee on what should come out of that particular Committee. Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes, that you review all the time...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, can I also ask that you remain relevant to the speech?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I am in no way reflecting on any issue inside. I have signed an oath of a code of conduct. I know I do not talk about. The issue that I am raising, that Mr Van der Westhuizen, Deputy Speaker, should hang his head in shame that he has not concluded that particular process. That is what I am saying, but let us get back to human rights... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...and there are incidents of racism and discrimination in our province... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...where mostly the beneficiaries of apartheid colonialism are actually the perpetrators. Take for example the incidents of racism at the University of Stellenbosch. There is absolute silence from this Premier. There is no condemnation by the DA. Instead, the DA's Leon Schreiber tries to install fear about the progressive language policy which caters for Afrikaans amongst other languages,



claiming that Afrikaans is under threat. He is trying to be more Freedom Front than the Freedom Front.

Take, for example, the attack on a female Palestinian supporter who was displaying the flag of Palestine on her vehicle in Die Waterkant part of the City, she was abused by a Zionist thug called Adam Bulkin. Absolute silence from the DA. Bulkin appears in the Cape Town Magistrate's Court tomorrow. So, these rights that we are talking about here are first generation rights and the so-called liberals, the DA, is clearly not willing to condemn hate speech. The reality is that this hate speech emanates in our province, mainly from those who are ideologically tired and supportive of the DA and other right-wing parties.

It is no surprise, Deputy Speaker, that the DA in the National Assembly voted against the Prevention and Combating of Hate Crimes and Hate Speech Bill. In essence, the DA leadership are protecting the racists within their party, Penny Sparrow, just to mention one of them.

They are not only scared at the ongoing loss of political support to the Freedom Front Plus, but deeply engrained in the DNA of the majority of DA members is the view that apartheid and colonialism was not in fact a crime against humanity.

Speaker, the members may begin to ask what has this got to do with the budget but it is clear that budgets are intended to contribute to the wellbeing

of society, and I would argue that a recent debate that some may have followed amongst economists on what constitutes wellbeing are very instructive to our debate today.

It is interesting that a former Nobel Laureate Professor Angus Deaton in his latter years has begun to reflect on economic orthodoxy and what that has actually created and, for instance, he is asked on his views on unions these days. Like most of my age cohort, he says:

"I long regarded new unions as a nuisance that interfered with economic and often personal efficiency and welcome their slow demise, but today large corporations have too much power over working conditions, wages and decisions in Washington, where unions currently have little say, compared with corporate lobbyists."

And interestingly, he goes on to actually talk about how in the context of economic inequality we have situations where as more high income households have shifted into the private rental market, low income renters are struggling to compete and many are retreating into informal living arrangements and this is in the United States. So when we begin to look at the budget, we need to look at the wellbeing of society. So, the issues I was raising about human rights and dignity are absolutely critical to the wellbeing of a society and because of the DA's inherent racism that is something which is continually abused without any sanction. So, today we look at whether this Administration has effectively allocated scarce resources within its purview

and it is clear that the concerns that have been raised by many about this budget are not mere abstractions. They represent the lived experience of our fellow citizens.

As stewards of public trust, it is incumbent upon us to confront these challenges head-on with the commitment to equitable allocation of resources. Only through concerted efforts can we forge a path towards a brighter and more inclusive future for all of our residents.

Over the course of the last 15 years of DA rule, their tenure has been tainted with failures and the deterioration of key social determinants in this particular province. The strides that had been made by the ANC when we governed this province have slowly but surely been reversed. Their actions have prioritised the privileged few... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: And it is very clear, it is very clear that if we look at things like health, education and safety the DA has in fact progressed and failed the people of the Western Cape. The MEC wants to talk about agriculture. It is a common fact that in this province, less than 3% of agricultural land... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Based on what...

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...is owned by African, Coloured and Indian farmers. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: A common fact.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So, the real problem is that there is no political will that this Democratic Alliance, led by the Premier, those that benefit from the dispossession of land, the original sin, the DA is not prepared to change that. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: You never had any land given not on any farm...

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: They are prepared to keep those patterns of privilege like Markus Jooste and others to go on forever...

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...and in fact, to make matters worse, to take money from Markus Jooste, and up until today the DA is refusing to say how much did you get from Markus Jooste. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: How much did you get from...

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So, they maintain the inequality in regard to land. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: How much did you get from Umpa?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: When it comes to housing, it is very clear... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...that the amount of houses built by the ANC per year was much, much higher than what this Administration has been able to build every year. That is a fact. Go back and look at all the Annual Reports. You will see the number of houses built by the ANC exceeds by far the number of houses built by the DA. [Interjections.]

We have seen, through you, Deputy Speaker – this Premier... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...and the senior leader... must I start concluding?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: The senior leader of the

DA having refused to make Tafelberg available for domestic workers...

[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore...

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...because their friends want that land ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, if you can just take your seat.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Must I take my seat?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja, your Chief Whip is standing up.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It is totally unacceptable, we cannot hear a thing. The two MECs there, they continue making running commentary. We cannot hear a thing.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: The Deputy Speaker does nothing!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, please. Stop the accusations, hon Dugmore, you have 20 seconds left. I am trying to let you finish your speech. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Can I call an order on you, Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lekker, can you please speak to me with some respect?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I am getting tired, because right now you are sitting there, you are saying hon Dugmore must stop the accusations. Is that the way you conduct yourself as the Speaker of this House?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Ah, man, hai.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lekker, calm down please.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I cannot calm down when you are being biased, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Calm down! It is not necessary to suddenly get so

angry.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You cannot say the hon Dugmore is making accusations...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: He is making interjections...

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You are saying he is making accusations. What kind of a Speaker are you?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Interjections.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You said "accusations", that is what you said.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Nee wag!

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: No, wait!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, he did.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Are you not a speaker that is supposed to be sitting there... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lekker, please take your seat, please.  
[Interjections.]



The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: [Inaudible, simultaneous shouting.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore... You may sit now, I am no longer recognising. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: And compromised.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, hon Lekker, that is... [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You are compromised.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: This is the first time I am now naming you, please. Now that is unacceptable.

An HON MEMBER: You are not the speaker of the House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is fine. Hon Dugmore, hon Dugmore, you may rise.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You are protecting your people, including your boyfriend sitting there. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Oh, I have a boyfriend.

An HON MEMBER: Tell her like it is. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is why he is looking at him like this.  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Baartman, what is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP: Chair, not only in terms of Rule 66...  
[Interjections, speaking simultaneously.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP: Chair, not only in terms of Rule 66(5) you cannot challenge a ruling in the House, firstly.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Correct. [Interjections, 00:31:24 sitting Hansard.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP: In terms of Rule 62 you cannot reflect upon holders of an office without bringing a substantive motion. The ANC are aware of the Rules of this House. If they want to bring a substantive motion on someone they are welcome to do so.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Baartman. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Chair, with respect, the Chief Whip raised a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Correct.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: And I think that point of order ought to have been dealt with before giving over to the Deputy Chief Whip.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, that is fine, it has been sorted out. Thank you, hon Dugmore. You have 20 seconds left. Can you just finish off please? I have been trying to say that is 20 seconds.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I think it is going to be best that I print out copies of the speech...  
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Welcome back, hon.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...and share with all of the members, because clearly the atmosphere that is being created in this House through biased rulings has actually not allowed me to conclude my speech. I will circulate it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise the hon Murray.

Ms N D NKONDLO: There is an intimacy here, from there.

Ms C A MURRAY: Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, you may proceed.

Ms C A MURRAY: Thank you. As we turn our attention to the 2024/25 Main Budget for the Western Cape Government, it is my duty to highlight the strategic foresight embodied within it.

An HON MEMBER: It means nothing...

Ms C A MURRAY: An investment of R480 million has been carefully allocated to the Department of Economic Development and Tourism which is a 2,37% increase from the last fiscal period. This is despite the ANC-led National Government trying its level best to destroy our economy.

Deputy Speaker, this is not simply a budget, it is an actionable plan focused on tangible outcomes for our province's growth and well-being. Within the Department Sector Development Programme a R3,75 million allocation to green job creation is a clear message that we are prioritising the expansion of

green industries afield with both environmental as well as economic dividends. This is not a mere gesture. It is an investment in our children and in our future. Further the allocation for the Atlantis Special Economic Zone, R39,32 million, sends a strong signal to investors in the Western Cape. We are open for business and we need to compete on the global stage. Our economy will benefit from the new investments that these funds will attract and jobs will be created as a direct result of this and the Growth for Jobs Plan.

The support does not end there. We are bolstering 200 existing jobs and businesses rather and jumpstarting 100 start-ups with Business Development Services recognising that the growth of these enterprises is crucial for economic resilience.

Tourism, a pillar of our economy receives a substantial boost with an additional R52 million directed towards Wesgro. This will ensure that our natural beauty and rich cultural heritage continue to draw visitors from across the globe. The increased number of tourists moving through Cape Town International Airport is a testament to the effectiveness of our tourism promotion strategies.

The DA-led Western Cape Government is further allocating R86 million towards skills programmes and projects. This is not simply about funding, it is a lifeline to the 2 900 individuals who will be placed in employment, cutting into the unemployment issue that affects our communities. Training

100 tourist guides and safeguarding our tourism beneficiaries with improved safety services are not just line items in our budget. They are critical enhancements to our world class tourism experience.

To the voices of dissent, namely the ANC, I say look at the composition of the SMME Booster Fund beneficiaries. Look at the demographics of Skills Programme participants. They are overwhelmingly from historically marginalised communities. This is the DA's commitment to creating opportunities for all.

Further, the DA-led City of Cape Town's innovative energy initiatives, which complements this budget, further demonstrate our integrated approach to sustainable economic development. We are taking bold steps towards energy security and sustainability setting an example for others to follow. What is more, Freeport Saldanha's R20 billion targets are ambitious but achievable, set to make significant economic impact with thousands of jobs and sustainable contribution to our Province's GDP.

This budget is a blueprint for progress. It is structured to empower, uplift and transform. It addresses the immediate needs of our businesses and citizens while laying the groundwork for long term prosperity.

To the members of this House I stand with this budget. It mirrors our collective endorsement for a vision. It is a strategic allocation of resources, and it has potential to alleviate the Western Cape to new heights of success

and sustainability. That is why, Madam Deputy Speaker, I support this budget.

Let us all do the same for the sake of our province's future and for our province's children, I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the hon Christians.

Order, hon members. You may begin, hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, the ACDP supports this budget. Deputy Speaker, we are in a fiscal crisis not because of a lack of resources but due to the corruption, cadre deployment and incompetence of the ANC Government.

Deputy Speaker, on 29 May 2024 we will face the most critical election that this country has ever faced. The ACDP wants to assist to build this beautiful province and build this beautiful country that we live in. The ACDP's policies are allowing to help and address the needs of our people in this country and in this province and that is why in the Standing Committee I was very adamant that we, the people of the Western Cape, and when I say people of the Western Cape there was a survey done in the *Business Day* by First For Women on 14 March to say that women are not safe in the Western Cape. In the country the Western Cape is number one with females feeling unsafe and

that is why I said in our Standing Committee that we need to resource the Neighbourhood Watches more, and by attracting them is to give them a funeral cover. I will stand with that because I believe that the high turnover of Neighbourhood Watches can be curbed when somebody at least can die in dignity when they die.

We worked it out with the MEC, we worked it out. It will cost the Province R8,5 million for the year and that is just for about 15 000 Neighbourhood Watch members.

We will have to look at Safety. Just two weeks ago I was at Elswood High School. The school is completely vandalised. Our learners are not safe when it comes to many of our schools. So we need to look at how do we look at school resource officers and get them at our schools so that our learners can learn in a safe environment.

Deputy Speaker, it is a fact that the DA cannot compare, the Government of the Western Cape – you cannot compare them with the ANC. They need to compare them to international standards because if they compare it with the ANC we will go down the drain. We will go down the tubes. So I am saying to the DA Government, Western Cape, compare you to international standards so that we can take this the country forward.

Deputy Speaker, another important thing is that you know with the ANC, with policy uncertainty, we will have to get certainty from this Province to



say, invest, invest, invest, because our youngster who are out in the streets do not have much to do, but we need to get them back on track and the ACDP is calling on this Government to do more when it comes to skills development, to do more to get our youngsters off the streets, and that will help us, Deputy Speaker, when it comes to the employment of our youth. Deputy Speaker, it is important... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: It is important to make sure that we contribute to how to govern this problem better and from our side ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...we say safety. I am not even with the Education yet, but thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Hon Christians. I now recognise the hon Minister Mbombo.

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor, hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Hon Premier, Deputy Speaker and members of the Provincial Cabinet and the colleagues. Thank

you very much for the opportunity.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Minister Wenger's budget speech has provided a strong platform for the Second Reading Debate for today. While our budget for 2024/25 give us the means to build a Western Cape that works for all, the Minister correctly spoke to the effects of the collapse of the National Budget process, which has injured the entire country. We are reminded about the state of our economy and the fact that South Africa is servicing debt.

According to the Centre for Risk Analysis debt servicing costs from 2008 to 2023 moved from 8% to 16% of our National Budget. In the same period showcasing, what they are showcasing, the South African downward spiral Government expenditure as a total expenditure on health has never moved beyond 12%. Actually from 2008 to 2010 it has been 11%. It is only from 2012 to 2023 where we have seen 12%. These are against the signed agreements by African Union countries set to allocate 15% of the country budget each year to the Health Sector as part of the Abuja Declaration.

At the same time, the national expenditures, for example on other sectors like Education, went up, the same as servicing of the debts. Currently, Deputy Speaker, 30 million people in South Africa are drowning in poverty; eight million children go to bed every day hungry and noting all these are absorbed by the Health because Health is a safety net for all these abstract factors.

These impact on the health system.

In the 2023/24 the National Treasury abruptly introduced Revised Equitable Budgeting that saw the Western Cape Health Equitable Share reduced. That is why our Department has taken steps to create principles for our clinicians to navigate service reprioritisation to save money which is based on constitutionality, clinical and cost effectiveness, prevalence and severity and the context in which people are operating, noting Deputy Speaker, the National Government expenditure to Health remained the same, yet this is the time that our budget was decreased, and yet it was the time that we were actually coming from the COVID.

Provincial Treasury was able to save the situation to get us to baseline last year, but this year we are on our own as a result of the impact of the national cuts to our finances. My concern, Deputy Speaker, is now for our staff. Staff comes first to make patients come first. Health is not a cost, Deputy Speaker, it is an investment. A healthy population leads to healthy profits and that leads to the healthy economy.

We are now experiencing what we call moral injury. Moral injury is defined as an adverse psychological, behavioural, social and spatial effects on an individual as a result of actions, decisions or events that violate or go strongly against their moral principles and expectation.

Hon Deputy Speaker, for healthcare workers our ethics are compromised by a set of strong morals and rational thinking that arises from definite resources.

Our oaths, hon Deputy Speaker, are now being tested to its absolute limit in the face of the failing national economic policies which our country is experiencing. We have seen for the first time healthcare workers protesting, doctors being unemployed. Our staff, hon Deputy Speaker, are trying their very best to render healthcare services to communities when resources are drying up at an exponential rate and also they are being put in a conundrum.

For Health and Wellness our budget has increased by less than half of the country's inflation. Inflation in January 2024, according to Statistics South Africa, has been 5.3% and the medical sector inflation has been seen risen up to 6.5%. The impacts of the geo-political wars like in the Ukraine and Russia do impact on the cost of food and also of the medicine. This means that for every R100 000 of the Department's budget that was allocated last year, R105 250 will be needed to offer the same services when accounting for inflation in this year. Instead the Department essentially received about R102 000.

This means when considering the Department's R30,4 billion budget of this year, the Department of Health and Wellness will experience a shortfall of R807 million, hon Deputy Speaker.

Additionally, while we have managed to ensure we have enough money to maintain the 33 000 plus posts we currently have, the 1 958 funded and vacant posts have now become unfunded.

Hon Deputy Speaker, this is not something that is only being experienced by

the way only in the province, but it is a result of not investing in the health sector by the National Government. Every Health Department is facing fiscal crisis that threatens its health platform. Nobody can escape, but we have to do whatever we could be able to do.

While we are being pushed to the absolute limit we are still managing our monies responsibly and our facilities are not running out of food, unlike in some where we have seen in some of the social medias. I will mention – I do not even want to mention the names. We are ensuring that we can still pay our salaries and for our goods and services on time, despite being owed money even by the National Treasury, by the RAF, Road Accident Fund, and all those. Our medical legal claims they still remain lowest. Our CEO remains the lowest. That is what a morally responsible department has to aim for to ensure that you can do it.

Lastly, hon Deputy Speaker, we talk about ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Finish off, please.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: ...the universal health coverage. With a failing health system we will never be able to reach the universal health coverage. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise the hon member Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, Premier, esteemed colleagues. We gather today under the weight of a national reality, a South Africa plagued by an epidemic of crime. Yet in the face of darkness the Western Cape shines as a beacon of progress. Here under the leadership of the Democratic Alliance we are not simply lamenting the problem, we are actively building solutions.

Five years ago when this Parliament was constituted for the first time and this Government was formed, we, as the DA, knew that crime would stand as our single biggest challenge. Our greatest problem to solve. We all know that crime has plagued the entirety of our country for decades, but here in the Western Cape we have taken the initiative to fight back against what is undoubtedly our oldest epidemic.

Almost as soon as this term began, Premier Winde launched the Provincial Government Safety Plan. We asked ourselves how can we bring better law enforcement to our communities and more than this, how can we make all of our resources go the distance, not only to attack crime, but also to attack the causes of crime too.

Firstly, we have to get more boots on the ground and cops on our street. This Government has invested hundreds of millions into our highly trained, well-equipped and publicly trusted LEAP officers. This Government has increased visible patrols, especially in high crime areas, using data-led policing. This proactive policing deters criminals and builds trust in our communities.

Beyond this our Government has worked to create specialised units like the Rural Safety Unit and the K9 Units that tackle specific crime threats head-on. Their success stories are numerous. In fact more than 35 arrests have been made by these units for this month alone. Many of these arrests have been of drug traffickers and unlike is often the case with SAPS, we have gathered the evidence which will put criminals away for years and through all of this, hon Deputy Speaker, this Government has leveraged technology for maximum impact. CCTV cameras, computer aided dispatch systems, improved data analytics, gunshot detection technology and ballistic and fingerprint systems that all enhance our intelligence-driven approach. This allows us to respond and use our resources most effectively and to implement that against crime as soon as it happens.

The results, hon Deputy Speaker, speaks for themselves. Gang violence is being countered and drug trafficking disrupted. LEAP alone has made more than 27 000 arrests since its inception. We have confiscated hundreds of illegal firearms and weapons off our streets and if only the members opposite wish to argue, as they always do, that we only police the so-called leafy suburbs or the wealthy areas of our province, I ask them, through you, hon Deputy Speaker, to look at how we allocate our LEAP officers and provincial policing resources almost universally toward poorer areas where they are most needed. In many cases this is precisely the opposite direction of how the ANC's South African National Police Service allocates resources.

LEAP is complemented by this Government's effort to root out crime and to root out the causes of crime. This Government has focused on youth development programmes like the Chrysalis Academy, which offer at risk youth a pathway away from crime, fostering positive change and creating future leaders.

This Government has worked to improve social cohesion and actively promote community engagement through Neighbourhood Watches and building trust between residents and law enforcement, and knowing that illicit narcotics drive crime in our province like nothing else, this Government tackles drug dependency through dedicated support programmes. The results are undeniable, hon Deputy Speaker.

We see fewer young people drawn into the vicious cycle of crime, communities are taking ownership for their safety and a holistic approach that addresses the social ills [Interjections.] that breeds criminal activity is being tackled.

But let us contrast this with the national picture. The ANC-led National Government has failed us as we know. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN: Police stations are understaffed, resources are mismanaged [Interjections.] and a lack of political will allows crime to fester and grow.



[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN: Their empty promises ring hollow when juxtaposed with the daily struggles of South Africans living in fear. There is a reason, hon Deputy Speaker, while we hear reports of communities telling SAPS to *voertsek*, and they are proactively asking the Western Cape Government to send LEAP officers instead. This, hon Deputy Speaker, is the difference.

[Interjections.] The difference is focused and determined ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN: ...on this Government ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Indistinct] the DA to *voertsek*.

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, [Interjections.] the Democratic Alliance in the Western Cape is not just talking tough on crime, we are delivering tangible results. [Interjections.] We are building a safer province one success story at a time. [Interjections.] The Opposition can try to spin ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr G BOSMAN: ...as much as they want, but they cannot deny that the DA is the only party that has workable ideas to defeat crime. [Interjections.] Even the Amapanyazas in Gauteng appear to be nothing more than a poor imitation of our LEAP officers. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN: With this budget, hon Deputy Speaker, and what this budget does, [Interjections.] is allow the money to keep flowing so that our progress is not halted.

The disastrous economic policies of the African National Congress Government nationally mean that there will not be enough money to do all we want to do, but under this Provincial Government there is enough.

An HON MEMBER: Do not tell us about [Inaudible.]

Mr G BOSMAN: Through you, hon Deputy Speaker, to hon member Bakubaku-Vos. [Interjections.] There is enough ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN: ...to keep LEAP officers funded. [Interjections.] There is enough to keep K9 and Rural Safety Units ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon ...[Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN: ...operational, enough to keep our Neighbourhood Watches supported, enough to keep making progress.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, we should be getting more. [Interjections.] We should be getting a bigger budget to enable us to do more than just enough, yet the fight is far from over.

We urge the National Government to learn from our success, to invest in visible policing, capacitate law enforcement and prioritise community safety. South Africa deserves better. Let us together build a nation where all of our people can live free from fear [Interjections.] like we have done in the Western Cape. We have created an environment that is free from fear [Interjections.] and, hon Deputy Speaker, through you ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr G BOSMAN: ...we know that on 29 May the people of the Western Cape and the people of this country will rid themselves of the ANC by voting for the Democratic Alliance. I thank you. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): In your dreams, in your dreams.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise the hon member Marais. [Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member, please. Hon members, before hon Marais continues. [Interjections.] Hon member Bakubaku-Vos, can we please allow the hon Marais to do his speech. Thank you very much. You may proceed.

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Deputy Speaker, the Freedom Front rises in support of this Bill. Our current parliamentary system consists of committee-based legislative bodies. The most important of which is the budgetary process. It involves the total involvement of all political parties elected and represented in this House. That is why our Constitution in the Western Cape reads:

"We, the people of the Western Cape, through our own elected representatives."

It speaks of responsible and accountable government. It speaks of mutual cooperation and trust. Nowhere in our Constitution does it mention political point scoring or political dogma.

Ultimately our credibility will be measured not on points of orders raised or

disrespectful behaviour, but our efficacy and the quality of leadership we have shown over the past five years. Members of this House should always be mindful that all our decisions have been tempered and influenced by the external will of the Central Government and its various ministries. Our decisions in this House are all subject to limitations placed on us by the National Constitution. Let us therefore desist placing even further limitations on the quality and efficiency of her own Executive. What all the people of the Western Cape desire is the better life for all promised to them in 1994, not political grandstanding.

At the committee stages we have made use of the advice of experts in various fields, examined all best practises and debated robustly. Let us now close ranks and show a united front instead of playing to the public gallery. Let us admit to ourselves that our revenue resources are hopelessly inadequate and cannot satisfy all our wish lists. Let us pat ourselves rather on the back for having jointly, jointly performed admirably in spite of budget cuts and huge demographic changes over the past decade. Let us cooperate in reducing and not inflame public anger and public demand. Such actions will be unwise and could persist only in destroying the political order in South Africa.

Let us rebuild this province. That is our only responsibility. This province, let us fix the local economy, let us create jobs locally, let us ask for more for this province.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Finish off.

Mr P J MARAIS: Let us give our Western Cape people hope.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, sir.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Marais. I now recognise the hon Minister Meyer. Hon Minister, you have the floor.

[Interjections.] Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Deputy Speaker, I rise in support of the budget of the Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities. It is an outstanding budget based on the principles and the values of this Government.

Hon Deputy Speaker, on the morning of 21 March on the celebration of Human Rights Day, the *Farmers Weekly* greeted the agricultural sector in South Africa with the news that the National Government of Agriculture is under scrutiny for mismanagement of funds.

So my friend is absolutely correct. We must stop comparing us with the ANC because he said they take us downwards and we have to look to international standards because this ANC Government has now the department that is supposed to help us with land reform, this Government has now again stolen

the money.

So if you speak about land reform you must look at the budget for R20 million, they budget R20 million for land reform, then they steal R30 million. Here is the evidence.

The article further highlighted that this national department that must do land reform, they have now fruitless and wasteful expenditure. It has now, hon Deputy Speaker, because I know you have a passion for agriculture, it has now increased, hon member Marais, R33 000 last year, it is now R30 million in this fiscal year. This is why land reform cannot work because they chow the money.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it is the same department where a company formed by two sons of a farm worker, they were given land in Beaufort West to do proper land reform, they worked on it and there comes the ANC National Government and they stop the people that must get land reform. They wanted to move the people off the land to give it again to their own cronies. The people in the gallery must know what this ANC is doing, and so Joshua, his brother, and Herold Bezuidenhout and Jan Berg, they have built up a new veld farming empowerment enterprise for two decades. In January this year, two months ago, this ANC Government took two farms, the company had been building up since 2017, the officials they come to the farm, †hulle sluit die ding toe, hulle *lock* die mense se goeters op [they lock the thing, they lock up the people's things] because they wanted to remove the beneficiaries.

This people, criminals and crooks, they wanted to remove the people.

[Interjections.] †Hulle sluit die hekke toe. [Tussenwerpsels.] [They lock the gates.] [Interjections.]

I am giving you the farm now.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: I will give you the farm, [Interjections.] and so, hon – you are from Beaufort West, you know the farm. You know the detail. You should be standing up here for [Interjections.] the people of Beaufort West, but you must stand ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, hon member!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ...up for the people of Beaufort West. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: I am now asking you to stand up for the people [Interjections.] ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!



The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ...of Beaufort West. You are the Member of Parliament ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ...for Beaufort West [Interjections.], you should stand up. [Interjections.] You should stand up. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Meyer, can you take your seat, please?

Ms N D NKONDLO: This man! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, I recognise you, hon member Sayed. [Interjections.] Hon member Sayed has ...[Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: He has got the audacity!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed has got a point of order. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are biased!

Ms N D NKONDLO: I mean really this is not your House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo, please take your seat.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Chairperson, I am really, really disappointed. On a point of order. The hon Dr Meyer is abusing us now. He has been doing this for the entire term and he continues. [Interjections.] Hon – no, no, he must sit down. Sit down! [Interjections.] Do not stand up when we are speaking.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed, hon member Sayed, please ...[intervenes]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Sit down, please.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please, hon member Sayed, what is your point of order? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): What he does here, he abuses hon member Bans. This is what he thinks of women. He abuses a woman here telling her straight what she must do. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): He must speak through you, hon Deputy Chair. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Absolutely.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): He needs to speak through you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] He goes directly to the hon member Bans. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): That is unacceptable, and then he is also accusing us as members of the House of the ANC of being criminals. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members of the ANC ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): He must withdraw that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...your own Deputy Chief Whip is speaking and nobody is listening. So can I, first, I am going to take on, I understand the [Interjections.] Minister must speak through me, but any other accusations you are making of the Minister you need to bring a substantive motion. [Interjections.] Please, I would ask that we do not do that, [Interjections.] but, hon member Sayed,

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Can I continue, hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, if your members, if your members are going to be quiet, otherwise I cannot allow two people to speak at the same time.

[Interjections.]

So if hon member Sayed is going to speak I would like some order, thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): The second point is that he has accused members on this side of the House of being criminals. If you did not hear it clearly I would advise that you consult the Hansard and then come back maybe later or tomorrow ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...with a response.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Sayed. Hon Minister, please speak through me ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: I will.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...and you may continue and, please, I will consult the Hansard ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...I will consult the Hansard on the issue.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I have certainly scratched a nerve, but I want to carry on because what is now happening ...[Interjections.]

Ms A P BANS: Hon Deputy Speaker.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ...is that this National Government is ...[Interjections.]

Ms A P BANS: Hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon – wait, hon member, I will acknowledge you. Yes, what is your point of order?

Ms A P BANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, the hon member Meyer was speaking to me directly. You are saying nothing about it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I just said it.

Ms A P BANS: You say he must continue ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, I did not say that.

Ms A P BANS: No, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Maybe I should play back the Hansard for you. I specifically said that...[Interjections.]

Ms A P BANS: Perhaps you, perhaps you can say so that we can all hear it now.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take your seat. I have said specifically the hon Minister must speak through me. I have repeated that. You may proceed.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Hon Deputy Speaker.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Deputy Speaker, through you ...[Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Point of order, hon Deputy Speaker. Do not look the other way ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: ...I am raising a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo, if you address me you stand up. You do not shout. Alright, you may proceed.

Ms N D NKONDLO: So, hon Deputy Speaker, you need Hansard on something that the MEC was doing right in front of you? You need Hansard?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, I said ...[Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Because when he was raising his hand battering on hon member Bans, he was here for all of us to see. So you need Hansard for you to make a ruling on something that he was doing right here in the House?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo, can I answer you? So I said the Minister must address me, which is correct, according to hon member Sayed that is absolutely correct. On the second part is the accusation that he made of the hon member. That I will refer to from Hansard.

So he is absolutely correct on the two points that I have addressed.

Ms N D NKONDLO: And in his way of addressing the House?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have addressed that. I have addressed that. Thank you. Hon member, you may proceed. I will not take any further points of order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and, hon Deputy Speaker, through to you to the members in the gallery. When you see this type of behaviour you know you scratch the right point.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the same National Government ...[Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Point of order, hon Deputy Speaker.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ...they now have attempted ...[Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Point of order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ...it is in the record ...[Incomplete.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo, I am not taking any further points of order on orders. [Interjections.] That is according to the Rules ...[Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: What do you mean?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So once I have ruled on a point of order you



cannot raise the same point of order.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Order on what the MEC is saying now. It is a new order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: What is the new order? What is the point of order?

Ms N D NKONDLO: How do you allow an MEC to address the gallery about our behaviour? How do you allow that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: He is not addressing the gallery ...[Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: He is not?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...he is addressing me.

Ms N D NKONDLO: You are not listening. Is that the point? You are not listening?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo, if you are going to want to be in the seat then you must be elected here. [Interjections.] If you are not then please take your seat.

Ms N D NKONDLO: I am not interested to be in your seat, Madam.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am not acknowledging you. [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: I am very happy in this seat of mine.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take your seat. Right, I would now no longer take any points of order. [Interjections.] We will proceed with the ...[Interjections.]

Ms Y BANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is that a new point of order?

Ms Y BANS: Can I call order on you, hon Deputy Speaker? You cannot be saying when hon member Nkondlo is raising a point of order [Indistinct]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, I have not acknowledged you.

Ms Y BANS: No, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may actually sit down.

An HON MEMBER: But please be fair.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed, hon Minister. Thank you very

much.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Deputy Speaker, I will address the you and the House as per the Standing Rules.

This is the same National Government whose Deputy Minister, the hon Minister in the National Assembly, had to be interdicted from illegally settling, and further, vulnerable people in sub-human conditions on a farm, Mesco, in Stellenbosch.

By doing so this ANC Deputy Minister not only violated the human rights of the vulnerable families, but also the human rights of the emerging farmer and his workers, to whom the farm has been released. You may ask what does this have to do with finance? It has everything to do with finance, because the above system is what happens when a government mismanages its finance. [Interjections.]

It gives us insight into the impact of a failing budget and economic policies and the ecosystem the ANC creates cadres to act as a law unto themselves.

Over the last 30 years this ANC Government and the economy still grapple with prolonged instability and so we have been subjected in this province to Zumanomics and now to Ramanomics. The same result. Money disappear. More recent repercussions include the grey listing by the Financial Action Task Team, a declining GDP per capita, a worsening international standing

and the escalation of the cost of living.

Decades of financial mismanagement and failed economic policy has now come to fruition, and this is why this Minister has to do exceptional work to put this budget together.

Last year, hon Deputy Speaker, the National Treasury said, and people must know this around South Africa, the Government, meaning the National Government of South Africa, they have now run out of money and that it will now need to implement strict austerity measures.

Well, hon Deputy Speaker, we have now seen what this incapable Government in South Africa is doing, but we have an alternative budget for the National Assembly. That is now to establish sound foundations for economic growth, create jobs, revitalise the energy sector, to achieve fiscal stability through controlled Government expenditure and debt reduction. We are also releasing our DA Government's priorities for a fiscal sustainability, a competitive low regulation market that will empower individuals and not politicians.

So in the first year in government in the Union Building we will deliver an economic growth prospect by stabilising and consolidating the debt. We will also introduce a debt break law because the budget deficit as well as the fiscal deficit is simply unsustainable, but we will not punish the voters. We will not raise taxes because South Africans are already overtaxed and not

overtaxed, they steal the taxpayers' money and so we will also strengthen the Hawks, [Interjections.] SAPS, NPA and the crucial to combat corruption.

The DA Government in the Union Buildings will prioritise adequate funding, land reforms for these institutions and the DA Government in the Union Buildings will not only stabilise the finance, we will put Zuma and Ramaphosa in jail, and I think [Interjections.] hon member Marais must be happy because we are going to put Ramaphosa and current president, through you, in prison. That is the first order of business. [Interjections.]

So hon member Ferlon Christians is right, [Interjections.] you must not compare yourself with the ANC because that is a down way road, and so under the ANC you get poorer and now the ANC wants to target your pensions. Wake up civil servants, watching this on television. Wake up asset managers, wake up pension administrators, wake up Members of Parliament, wake up South Africans, because the ANC is now targeting your money.

Thanks to the ANC Government, they have now run out of money. Now they are going after your retirement funds. Stop it before it is too late. You can stop it on 29 May this year. Save your future, save your retirement funds and vote out the ANC because this is a criminal state, a Mafia state and the failed state, and so hon Deputy Speaker, I am here to protect your retirement money.

I am here to protect the retirement money of hon member Dugmore since he is retiring. I am here to protect his money. [Interjections.] Your money is not up for grabs. Please, I am fighting here for my friend Pat Marran. Your pension is going to be stolen, but I am standing up, I am rising for your pension money. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Bakubaku-Vos, I am here to protect it ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ...because you must get your money.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...can you address me. Last 10 seconds. Hon member Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Chair, no, hon Chair, I would have thought that as the outgoing MEC of so many years of experience, the hon member Meyer would be disciplined. You have cautioned him, he continues to speak directly to our members. This must end.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. Thank you very much. Hon Minister, please, you only have 8 seconds left. Please, for the last 8 seconds can you really

just focus on me? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Deputy Speaker, there is a lasting message, and I want to thank the Premier. He gave me a book:

"Rescue from a global crisis to a better world."

That is the task and the mandate of this House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Thank you, hon member Meyer. I now recognise the Premier, hon member Winde.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you very much.

Of course this Second Reading debate is a political debate and it is a debate on policy, it is a debate on risks and of course 64 days before an election it is going to be talking about current politics in our country, and let me start off by talking about the environment we find ourselves in.

So of course, and I have listened to the hon member Dugmore, but of course we find ourselves in an environment where we have got a failing economy. We have got a GDP growth rate of 0,1%, which is nothing. We by the skin of our teeth are hanging on, or not being in a recession. We have got grey

listing, every single thing is failing across our country and our current budget in this province is being cut by R7 billion, because we do not have the tax income because of the failing growth rate.

We also have, because we have shown over the years that this Government's policies make a difference and we can read it in the data and that is why 150 000 citizens every single year decide to come from other provinces that are run by the ANC, [Interjections.] to this province that is run by the Democratic Alliance, and of course the hon member Dugmore, when he talks about policy in his debate and he goes and ventures towards economic policy, he gets stuck in minimum wage discussion.

Now ANC policy across the board has totally failed South Africans [Interjections.] and has totally failed South Africa, and you can see I am still going on about minimum wage.

Let us talk about actual jobs, about real jobs, and in the last five years 64,9% of all jobs in the whole of South Africa came out of this province, one province, and surely that alone speaks volumes sufficiently to show the total failure of ANC policy has not enabled economic opportunities in other parts of our country, and of course let us talk about the highest youth unemployment rate in the world.

Just our unemployment rate, one of the highest in the world, a Gini coefficient which is a key measure in this province, the province that the



Gini coefficient gets better constantly every single year and under ANC rule in South Africa and in other provinces it does exactly the opposite. That is a key measurement of whether we are getting poorer or richer, and under the ANC rule we are getting poorer.

They cannot keep the lights on, they cannot make SASSA payments, our taxpayers are reducing and our grants beneficiary are increasing; 6 million taxpayers, 20 million grants recipients. That is not a key [Interjections.], a key measurement would be a reduction in grant recipients and an increase in youth employment, but that does not happen under ANC rule and so voters have a choice in 65 days, but of course it is also about our budget and what we can talk about.

I have heard quite extensively about the Safety Plan, so I will not talk about that today, and of course each budget will come in over the next two days on where we are spending money, etcetera, but I thought I just wanted to highlight that 74% of our budget goes to really the more disadvantaged or less advantaged citizens across this province and nothing highlights it more than when the budget was tabled and it showed where our Infrastructure Budget is being spent, and so you can see R6 103 million going to education infrastructure; Khayelitsha High School, Lwandle Technical High School.

I have just visited the Lwandle Primary School and amazing to see how we bring four and a half years' worth of construction down to two years' worth of construction. How we are innovating and getting quicker and faster. That is

not only just that school, those are big major schools, but you also think about the Rapid School Build; Blue Ridge High, Vuyiseka, Manenberg, and so it goes on. You can see at Kwanokuthula, at Fisherhaven, at Perseverance High School, in Delft, at Blueridge Primary School, and so it goes on.

Or you look at the health infrastructure spent; Swartland Hospital, Tygerberg Hospital and of course we are busy with the major revamping of Tyger Hospital, Belhar Tygerberg New Regional Hospital, Tygerberg New Central Hospital, Klipfontein New Regional Hospital, Gugulethu Community, Vredenburg Community, Stellenbosch Kayamandi Clinic, and so it goes on and on and on.

This Government investing into areas where we need to be able to create opportunities and those opportunities end up in people enabling themselves to build better lives. Why? Because those voters made a choice in this province and the policies of this party are being affected through the budget and they make the difference. They make the difference in citizens' lives and that is why so many people come here because they also want that difference. They could make a decision in May to say, if they still lived in one of those other provinces, they could change the power or remove the ANC.

I thought that I would also just talk briefly on the energy component of our budget and first of all we know that specifically indigent, who received the emergency packs, 100 000 emergency packs. The first few went – 4 000 actually went through DSD and to the most vulnerable in our elderly and

DSD managed that process. 96 000 of those packs going to learners in households that are in the low quantiles in our province. These are so that when, another ANC failure, we cannot keep the lights on in loadshedding, our learners are going to be able to study. Our learners will be able to keep with the Catch-Up Programme that we are busy with at the moment.

I also must say that at our schools, and it is not only at our schools, it is also at our houses, the Minister of Infrastructure and I were out on the road this weekend and of course having a look in Railton at a housing project. It is not only delivering housing, but we are making sure that solar PV is added when we deliver these products.

At schools, 19 schools were completed on LED lighting projects. Six schools are in a construction phase on solar PV. 19 schools are designed with the Framework Contract. 28 schools in design internally. A minimum of 44 schools installed this year with LED lighting.

If I look at the municipal pool buying, if I look at the hospitals, so far 195 of our hospitals have got generators, 47 have got inverters, 10 hospitals loadshedding free to stage 6, and so it just continues. All of these actions. The money does not get stolen, the money ends up going into projects that make the biggest difference it can to the citizens of this province.

I also wanted to talk about Local Government and you would have seen that we have put extra budget for legal services in Local Government, because it

is not only where province delivers services to its citizens, it delivers services through its citizens through our partners at Local Government level and I was just looking at a report on Local Governments and it is amazing how few local governments really stand out in this province, not for what I have just spoken about, our delivery of housing or delivery of energy solutions or delivery of real, tangible things that make a difference in citizens' lives, I am talking about the opposite end, and so there is a municipality, and I look at this report and it has very serious liquidity ratios, not able to keep payments going to keep under 30 days and it is unbelievable to see municipalities are not able to pay when it comes to 30 days, and you look at the province and we are sitting at 15 and 18. These are the kind of days we work about paying our customers that do business with us and these municipalities are really battling.

The same municipality in this report, I see there are a number of Special Investigation Unit investigations, whistleblowers have come forward. I see that the municipal manager, eventually his lawyers had to settle in court because of course again this municipality did not appoint him according to the rules. They still have a CFO that is currently vacant. Now I wonder why a CFO position is currently vacant? I think it is because they are using the system to milk it as the ANC usually do, and of course this municipality I am talking about is Theewaterskloof.

I am very concerned about it and I wonder, hon Deputy Speaker, as to which political party runs this municipality. It is a coalition. It is a coalition of

the ANC, the Good Party and the Patriotic Alliance, and what they are doing day and night is making sure that their citizens do not get services. They are making sure that their citizens suffer because they are busy looking after themselves within that system and not looking after the citizens in this province.

Another municipality, if I look at this report, experiencing cashflow challenges, the municipality's collection rate is way below where it should be. The Auditor-General and Eskom, both of those organisations, have not been paid in this municipality and guess what this municipality's name is? It is called Kannaland Municipality, and guess which political parties run this municipality? The ANC, [Interjections.] Icosa.

These municipalities are totally failing the citizens of this province. They are not paying even the Auditor-General. I think that is a massive mistake and of course they are not paying Eskom.

If I look at Knysna Municipality, and I have spoken about Knysna extensively over the last while, and we know that that rescue package that the province has put together, they have at least agreed to that. Of course if they do not they have also been given strict warnings on their major failures. They have been given pre-directives and now directives, and those officials can face up to a R10 million fine or jail time, and again the same thing, they are not able to get overdrafts sorted out through the banks, they are using overdraft money to pay salaries, they are not able to financially sustain

themselves. Ratepayers themselves are not paying yearly anymore, they are paying monthly, because they are so concerned about their own money being lost to corruption, and again, who runs this municipality I ask you, hon Deputy Speaker? Again this is the ANC, the PA and the EFF.

This is where there are bodies in the water system that are decomposing and these bodies are absolutely rotting this water system, but for 19 days the citizens have to drink that water.

These are those same municipalities where the fire truck gets to the fuel station to put fuel into the fire truck to go because they need to respond to their citizens, and the card bounces because it has all been cancelled because of their financial system which is not working.

I look at Laingsburg Municipality and I [Interjections.] look at ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Premier.

The PREMIER: ...and I look at Beaufort West Municipality. I say, hon Deputy Speaker, that it is these municipalities where services are not being delivered and they need to, the citizens of this province, make up their mind, if they want these kind of coalitions in this province, or they want the same that we have been delivering over the last years, much better government than any other province in South Africa.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The PREMIER: This is where it happens and they can make a decision on 29 May. [Interjections.] Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. I now recognise the hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Hon Deputy Speaker, members of the House, esteemed colleagues and citizens of the province.

Today we convene to scrutinise and debate the budget presented by the Minister of Finance and as the ANC we do not support this budget.

The Minister's budget presentation chose to coin this budget "a budget that works for all", and further she placed a serious claim of this being a pro-poor budget. Such a huge departure, Minister, do you not think even for yourself and your party as you exit the stage. We believe this is far from the truth and devoid of lived experiences of those defined as poor and vulnerable in the Western Cape under the DA rule.

Joseph Schumpeter points out that, I quote:

"The budget is the skeleton of the State stripped of all misleading ideologies

and that when the misleading ideologies are stripped away, what is left is the actual ideology of those who hold power."

Hon Deputy Speaker, let us delve into the reality behind the rhetoric and discern whether this budget truly serves the needs of all citizens, especially the poor and marginalised. Throughout the annals of DA politics the voices of the poor and marginalised in the Western Cape have been consistently silenced. This budget adorned with the rhetoric of inclusivity, is but a facade. A ploy to secure votes from the people it neglects.

Hon Deputy Speaker, since the dawn of the DA in the province, the DA has been playing this role of being better than the rest, even in instances that require a level of empathy and consideration of the factors that have put South Africa where we are.

One of those examples of DA logic is that it is in a better position than the rest when it comes to unemployment and reducing poverty, but also just recently demonstrated by both Minister Meyer and the Premier, a story of forgetting that in a DA-led coalition in Tshwane, the Auditor-General has recently flagged a R2,7 billion irregular expenditure and making Tshwane the worst-performing Metro in Gauteng.

Again *Sunday Times* were telling us here in this province, through you, that in the DA's red faces over Metro, over municipal tax on The Sun. This was because of the pushback of citizens who have made them to rethink the R623



monthly surcharge on residents who install solar power. This is the DA that said that in 2019 when the Premier took over the reins from Madam Zille, that he is going to ensure that the Western Cape is off the grid.

We are still waiting patiently and actually this is the same DA that has done the same here in the City of Cape Town, putting an additional tariff, more than what NERSA approved and increasing electricity cost in a province or in a city where people are struggling to survive.

Actually we ask the question which pro-poor is being referred to other than a list of individualised boutique projects we were referred to.

It is the cost of Cape Town households if one refers to a household affordability index, February 2024, which suggests that here in the City of Cape Town, as an example, that the household food basket has increased by R168.60 which is 3,4% from R4 942.45 in February 2023 to R5 111.05 in February 2024. Yet, the DA, including as it has been showing and saying it here in this House, in its manifesto, does not support a minimum wage and actually expects people to live close to a pension grant which is 50% of what the household food basket is. This is actually treacherous to even say that people must vote for you, come the 29<sup>th</sup>.

The cost of living here in this province and especially in the City, is well known to all and yet, the City of Cape Town's prepaid electricity prices deducts almost 70% of outstanding debt towards rates for both the poor and

the middle class. And the question is that is this the only feasible option that the City of Cape Town under the DA would have actually followed? Hon Minister Meyer is not here, and he boasts about progress in the agri space, and he leaves agri workers dying and others severely wounded in the open trucks where workers are actually finding themselves dying in this situation of unsafe transport.

Women are also killed in extortion related murders in the Cape Flats, and we ask the question about the DA choices of interventions which demonstrate exactly what they mean and where they stand. That they were able to ensure a rural safety intervention when there were challenges from farmers during COVID-19 and spent about R5-million.

Recently, the hon Minister, through the Department of Economic Development, was able to put aside R1-million for tourism safety when there were incidents on Table Mountain. But yet, in this particular province, the same City of Cape Town, the poor are actually finding themselves unsafe and living under terror on a day-to-day basis. You know, township businesses are unable to open up and are closing and there is no intervention by this DA Government. And yet, it tells us of presenting a pro-poor budget.

Further, in the list of projects that we have been told about, a situation of Mr Abraham Lintner from Atlantis who is 50 years old and is blind, has been directly affected by the termination of Dial-a-Ride services which are meant for people who are disabled. And without any consultation and considering

the implications of this to the disabled sector, the City of Cape Town has decided to close and terminate that service for people who are staying that far away.

And these are questions we place to the hon MEC on this bias of theirs of budget that is meant for the elite and the rich in this particular province under the disguise of the poor. You call for devolved powers and yet, hon MEC Mackenzie is mum when J P Smith's lunacy is actually standing to attack the taxi industry, including scholar transport that is not even protected here in this particular province of ours.

We find ourselves in a distorted reflection of a Robin Hood like society in the words of Professor Deaton, where resources are not flowing downwards as folklore suggests, but rather upwards from the impoverished to the affluent. This reflects the disregard for affirmative action, disregard for Black Economic Empowerment and redress of the past imbalances.

It was in Velddrif where the cries of women and ...[Audio distorted.] were echoed unheard as they languished without municipal support or assistance for their businesses, whilst billions are squandered annually in the name of Red Tape Reduction. The ANC has long advocated for reallocating these funds to empower the local economy, particularly in the townships, small towns, and informal sector settings plagued by crime and under-development. Yet, the DA persists in its misguided priorities allocating resources to ineffective Safety Plans whilst neglecting the very communities in dire need

of assistance.

It boasts of the City of Cape Town's international acclaim as a safe and clean haven, but conveniently omits the grim realities faced by its marginalised inheritance in Khayelitsha, suffocating under sewerage and waste; Delft and Manenberg besieged by crime. In the Boland region, embroiled in a cycle of farm evictions. These are forgotten corners of the DA's opulent City reserved solely for the privileged few.

Scrutinising the purportedly pro-poor budget, we find an increase of a mere R23-million from the previous fiscal year. When questioned on the rationale behind this allocation and pro-poor budget, the hon Minister deflected, pointing to a generic list of programmes buried within bureaucratic documents. This, they claim, is evidence of their commitment to the poor, a feeble attempt to mask their apartheid towards the marginalised.

The 2024 MTEF budget will allocate R45,3-billion to Growth for Jobs. We must look at this allocation with an understanding of trends in our province. Employment trends in the province show that the most vulnerable cohorts in the Western Cape to unemployment are the African population at 28%, those with lower than secondary education and African youth with less than secondary education are the most vulnerable cohorts in the province. In the Fourth Quarter of 2023, these cohorts made up of 300 at 8,7% of the labour force in the province. And the reality that we face here in this province is that only 26,3% in the education system are doing pure Maths, whilst almost

two thirds are subjected to Maths Literacy, and yet you expect them to participate in the economy and find meaningful jobs.

Hon Speaker, my question, and that of many in the above-mentioned vulnerable cohorts, is what targeted intervention is the Provincial Government making specifically for these African young people? What is Growth for Jobs doing to improve these realities? Where are the skills development programmes for these cohorts so that they can stand a chance to benefit from the net employment gains in sectors like finance, transport and agriculture which hold great significance in the province's economy, instead of them being subjected to modern day's level with meagre salaries.

Hon Speaker, the DA has been running a Youth Development Programme which was established or started in 2019. Since its inception, it has only 70 unemployed youth that have participated. What has happened to those young people? How many young people have been enrolled if for three years you have only spoken about 70 young people? It is evident that the history of the DA's politics in our province lacks genuine inclusivity.

For years, the ANC has called for pro-poor budgeting and declared an inequality agenda, only to fall on deaf ears. This is coupled with race denialism and refusal of this Government to disaggregate data that exposes the fallacy of racialised beneficiation of DA policies skewed to the privileged White individuals. The ANC has called for inclusive growth, addressing the rampant inequality and lack of decent employment opportunities which has

fallen on deaf ears within the DA camp. While we stress the importance of not just any job, but decent employment with fair wages, safe and protected working conditions ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member.

Ms N D NKONDLO: ...the DA remains aloof and indifferent to the struggles of the working class. It is clear that the budget presented by the hon Minister is nothing more than a political ploy designed to secure votes in the upcoming election. It is time ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms N D NKONDLO: ...for the DA to exit the stage. I thank you and the ANC does not support this budget.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Nkondlo. I now recognise the hon Baartman. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Good morning, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I first want to welcome some guests of mine. They are youth from the Ripples of Hope, Gregory Ricks fellowship, named after my late best friend, Dr Greg Ricks. And, you know, Greg and I, we always had a friendship where you would share and implement crazy ideas. And one of those crazy ideas was based on a City Year programme in America that in the

Western Cape is now called the YearBeyond project.

Hon Deputy Speaker, fellow South Africans and people of the Western Cape,  
...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It is not a crazy idea, it is  
...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): The Western Cape Government has tabled an R84-billion budget with the bulk of it being allocated to the Department of Health and Wellness, as well as the Department of Education. This budget is doing its utmost best to protect frontline services and to continue to build upon the work that this Government has achieved. These achievements include the Western Cape having the lowest unemployment rate in South Africa, the lowest expanded unemployment rate in South Africa, the highest employment to population rate in South Africa and the highest labour force participation rate in South Africa.

This means more people are employed in the Western Cape than any other province in South Africa. And hon Deputy Speaker, I just want to make it clear. We do not write our statistics ourselves. These statistics come from Statistics SA, an independent national entity that does statistics for all provinces. So, if it has been claimed that our statistics are wrong then maybe the statistics of other provinces might be wrong, too.

In terms, we have the lowest Gini coefficient in South Africa and we also have a higher human development index than the average of South Africa. So, the statistics show that yes, we might not be perfect, but life is better in the Western Cape. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yep!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): In 2023, we saw two significant shocks to the Provincial Budget. The first, the ANC National Government centrally agreed to an above inflation Public Wage Agreement for all provinces. The impact on the Western Cape was R2,9-billion. National Treasury committed to pay back all provinces because the effect of the Agreement was immediate and was implemented mid-year. That means on the payroll system you are already receiving your increase in the Province despite National Treasury not having yet paid back the money.

National Treasury then turned around and indicated they will not fully fund the provinces for the full cost of this deal which they agreed to. The Western Cape received approximately R1,7-billion from National Treasury, leaving little over R1,1-billion unpaid. The Western Cape then had to dig into its respective reserves and secondly, find ways to reprioritise funding across departments to make up the full amount.

No-one is saying, hon Deputy Speaker, that public servants do not deserve increases. But when your country decides to start selling off its gold to pay



for its debt, you know you are in deep, deep trouble. Right now, as a country, South Africa is essentially selling off the family jewels, metaphorically, so that the bank does not take our house. Hon Deputy Speaker, I want you to comprehend what I am saying. The ANC National Government wants a minimum of R17,7-billion for the BELA Bill, but as we are currently speaking, we are selling our gold to pay for our debt. If that is not moral bankruptcy, then I do not know what is. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It will not work. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): The second shock that we experienced was when the National Government cut Conditional Grants last year [Interjections.] midyear, amounting to over R640-million. To put this in perspective: the Western Cape Government depleted its full Stabilisation Reserve of R400-million last year in response to the fiscal consolidation and prolonged fiscal crisis. It was amidst these circumstances that the Western Cape Government then lodged an intergovernmental dispute, and rightly so because we are not getting our fair share from the Provincial Equitable Share formula and there are now real threats to budgets that have to be implemented in immediate realisable ways.

Deputy Speaker, you know, mention was made of the household food basket, but the household food basket across South Africa is based on inflation which is affected by national ANC economic policies.

So secondly, in terms of Safety and mention was made that why are we so unsafe. The hon speaker before me was speaking about it. But in terms of Section 205(3) of the Constitution, the South African Police Service is the mandate of the National Government. So, the hon members must please message or WhatsApp their respective national Ministers if they feel they are not doing a good job.

In terms of Energy, ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You must tell that to citizens.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...hon Deputy Speaker, the City spent 70% ...[Interjections.] of its tariff income to buy electricity from Eskom with its remaining 30% covering costs of the reliable electricity service and plans to end loadshedding. If the City asked any less, the City would essentially run into an estimated budget shortfall in excess of a R500-million, a shortfall that will make it impossible and unsustainable for the City to run a reliable electricity service and implement plans to end loadshedding.

Hon Deputy Speaker further, I want to indicate a third hit that the Provincial Budget had to take. The new Health Risk-Adjusted Index and data upgrades continue from National Treasury and have decreased our Equitable Share formula by 0,06%, resulting in a R192-million budget cut this year in the Provincial Budget.

Further, due to the fiscal consolidation and response from the Public Wages, we are seeing this year an almost R2,2-billion that is being reduced as an adjustment on our baseline. This means the money that was promised in 2023 of the MTEF by the ANC and the difference of the 2024 MTEF for this particular year, is R556-million. This is important because in government you plan for a three-year cycle, minimum, and that budget that you see over the three years must never be a shock.

In an ideal world, every year you will know what is happening over the next three years. But under the ANC National Government, we must hope, and we must pray every year that our budget will not be cut or at the very least, there will be some semblance of stability. It means what the ANC promised us in 2023 from provincial budgets is essentially null and void.

Further, what we have seen because of the adjustments from the Conditional Grants that we get from National Government, we see budget cuts in Infrastructure, we see budget cuts in Cultural Affairs and Sport, Health, Agriculture.

Hon Deputy Speaker, on average, the Conditional Grants of the Western Cape will be 0,8 percentage points lower than the average of the preceding four financial years. So, over the current MTEF, the Western Cape will experience a R1,135-billion budget cut on the Conditional Grants received by National.

Despite the ANC having now proven that it is financially and morally bankrupt, in the Western Cape we are committed to protecting our frontline services and building upon our good track record. This is why we are taking almost R2,3-billion from our own provincial reserves to essentially pay for this nationally imposed deficit it has brought upon our provincial budget. We will take R784-million from our Asset Finance Reserve and we will take almost R1,5-billion from our Provincial Revenue Fund to protect this Provincial Budget from ANC bankruptcy. This will leave just over R1-billion in our provincial reserves.

And hon Deputy Speaker, of these reserves, the Provincial Treasury has achieved something truly amazing. Through the Provincial Government Cash Management Policy which manages our money in such a way that we gain the most interest on our finances as possible, the Provincial Treasury has essentially recreated an additional R420-million to put back into the Stabilisation Reserve we had to deplete last year because of the ANC. This means with the Provincial Treasury we make your money work for you. Despite the ANC failures on provinces, the Western Cape will over the 2024 MTEF allocate R192-billion of this budget towards protecting social outcomes. That is 75,3% and allocate R32-billion towards Infrastructure investment.

And hon Deputy Speaker, I would like to thank the ANC for supporting the Infrastructure Budget of the Western Cape as per ATC 38-2024 on 20 March as published in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. We will spend R45-

billion to boost economic growth and set aside R759-million to increase energy resilience and R21,8-billion to entrench Innovation, Culture, and Governance as a pillar of how the Western Cape Government approaches challenges and solves them.

Where the ANC National Government squanders, pillages, and plunders, fuelled by their greed and their gluttony, the DA Western Cape Government will continue to build, to protect and to innovate. Because, hon Deputy Speaker, it is not the ANC's money. It is not Minister Godongwana's money or President Ramaphosa's money, it is the people's money and in the Western Cape, we will continue to ensure that the people's money is spent on the people. The DA supports this Budget. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Baartman. I now recognise the hon Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I would like to thank the hon colleagues for the debate and the inputs, and in particular those that have supported this Budget.

There are a couple of things I would like to respond to that came up in the debate. So, first of all, hon Dugmore noted that when the ANC governed, unemployment was 17% in the Western Cape. Well, it was actually 18,4% in 2008, but the important thing to consider here is what the national

unemployment rate was at the same time. So, in 2008, the South African unemployment rate was 22,9%. There was a 4,5% difference between the Western Cape's unemployment rate and the South African average unemployment rate.

However, in 2023, where we know times were vastly different and we were in a fiscal emergency, the unemployment rate in the Western Cape was 20,3%, but in South Africa it was 32,1%, which is a 12% difference. [Interjections.] So, the ANC benefitted from a lower ...[Interjections.] nation-wide unemployment rate and a growing economy whereas in 2023, we had a much worse national situation, and you can really see now where the Western Cape is bucking the trend. Despite a poorly performing economy, we still continue to buck the trend and have a much significantly lower unemployment rate than anywhere else in South Africa. As you know, it is much easier to have a lower unemployment rate when times are good.

Then, I would like to bring in some of the issues that were just general because this debate had a quite a wide range of issues that were thrown into the mix, not many relating to the budget. It would have been helpful for the Official Opposition to table an alternative budget, as is customary in countries all around the world. I have not seen any ...[Interjections.] alternative budget tabled by the ANC. In fact, we have only heard criticisms, but no constructive proposals on how this budget could be made better. I look forward to receiving those in the future, should the ANC be able to construct an alternative budget for this province. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: We do not have time to ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: I would like to thank the ACDP for their constructive policy and budget proposal, and I am sure the Department of Policing Oversight and Community Safety will look into this proposal that has been tabled.

Thanks very much to the Freedom Front Plus for supporting the Budget. I also noted that hon Dugmore lamented that we did not spend taxpayers' money on jamberries, which is something the ANC likes to do, and one does have to question how much of Government money goes towards jamberries that could rather be put towards service delivery.

But speaking of ANC spending, one has to wonder where the spending is coming from in the election campaign. Is the IEC not investigating ANC finances? So, one does have to question what the priorities are there.

Then, moving to hon Nkondlo. She said that she was unable to find the budget breakdown of the 74% of our spend on the poor and the vulnerable. It is in the [Inaudible.] book around page 74 or so, and ...[Audio distorted.] we have dedicated several pages to the budget breakdown. So, one can see very clearly how that budget calculation is made and what that funding is spent on, and the 74% is a conservative estimate.

She said that, hon Deputy Speaker, this is a departure for the DA, but this is absolutely not a departure. What it is, it is something that does not fit into the ANC's narrative because we do, in fact, put the 7,4-million residents at the heart of every decision that we make in this province. In fact, over the last five years, over this term, 78% of net jobs created across the whole of the country were right here in the Western Cape: 78% of all net jobs created in South Africa were in the Western Cape.

And if we look at the Geni coefficient, the Western Cape is the most equal province in South Africa with the lowest inequality. These are not things that can just happen overnight. These are things that are as a result of concerted effort and work towards achieving them, a growing economy, increasing employment and decreasing inequality. It is something the DA has always done and continues to do.

On the Public Sector Wages, I found the comments there quite difficult because what happened was, in-year, the budget that this House debated and approved and passed was then upended mid-year. So, what happened was undemocratic and wrong because it basically reversed a decision of this House in how the budget had to be spent. It made the law-making process meaningless and as a Legislature, we all should feel that what happened was a disgrace and we should prevent it from ever happening again in the future. This is an important principle and should not be politicised. We have to make sure that we protect the parliamentary process when it comes to money Bills.



And then finally, on the Dial-a-Ride. I mean, it has not been terminated. This is nonsense and while this is a City Government initiative and does not form part of this debate, I cannot really let these claims stand. The Atlantic Dial-a-Ride service has not been cancelled. This service is, however, a pre-booked arrangement and requires plans to advise in advance, and also in advance if there are any cancellations. But the service continues and furthermore, the Atlantis Station and others on that trunk route have universal access for differently abled persons, and it also has MyCiTi ambassadors at the stations who are able to assist passengers in need. So, we need to understand then why the incident that hon Nkondlo mentioned happened because the service still continues to run.

But what is clear, hon Deputy Speaker, is that while the national picture remains consistently in decline under the ANC, the Western Cape under the DA continues to show what is possible with the right policies followed by determined action. That is why so many thousands of South Africans are choosing to make the Western Cape their home.

It is possible to create many more jobs by enabling and working with the private sector, which is proven by the simple fact that this province created 78% of all net new jobs in South Africa, as I have mentioned. It is possible to build a school in 65 days. It is possible to provide calorific and nutritious meals to children who need it. It is possible to implement programmes that work alongside private employers, to help young jobseekers overcome the

hurdle of transport to interviews. And it is possible to make meaningful strides to decrease inequality, creating a far more just and equal society full of the opportunities our residents need to succeed and live a life that they value.

This and so much more are possible under a DA government. In as far as the country continues to decline, the Western Cape is set on a path of increasing employment, declining inequality, and increasing opportunity. This is the DA difference. Thank you. ...[Interjection.] [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. That concludes the debate on the Consideration of the Principle of the Bill. Are there any objections to the approval of the Principle of the Bill?

Hon MEMBERS: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections.

Hon MEMBERS: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The objections will be noted. The Secretary will now read the Bill. Sorry, Mr Stemele, I see you there.

The SECRETARY: Western Cape Appropriation Bill.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Stemele. The House will deal with the separate Votes on 26 and 27 March 2024. Mr Stemele, will you please read the Second Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on the recommendations for the appointment of candidates to the Western Cape Consumer Affairs Tribunal.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I have been informed by the Chief Whip that the Programming Authority resolved that there will be no list of speakers, and that parties who wished to do so will now be afforded an opportunity to make a declaration on the report for a maximum of three minutes if they so desire.

I will now afford parties and opportunity. I recognise the ANC. Any declarations? [Interjections.] No. [Interjections.] Okay, there are no declarations. I recognise. Are the EFF online? No. Thank you very much, I do not think GOOD is online and then, I recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: No declaration, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. The Freedom Front Plus?

Mr P J MARAIS: I do not want to argue with the rest. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I do not know if Al Jama-Ah is online? [Interjections.] No?

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Yes, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] Hon Deputy Speaker, Al Jama-Ah just wants to congratulate the Chairperson of the Tribunal, Lizanne Venter, for winning the chairpersonship and wishes her all the best going forward with the Tribunal. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I recognise the DA.

Ms C MURRAY: Thank you very much, hon Madam Deputy Speaker. A key part of a well-functioning economy is consumer protection. Consumers must have recourse should disputes arise with businesses, otherwise faith in the entire economy falters. That is why the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism went through a comprehensive process to identify the best possible candidates to constitute the Western Cape Consumer Affairs Tribunal. The Consumer Affairs Tribunal was initially operationalised in 2012 but ceased operations in 2016. It has now been reestablished to provide a free education service for resolving consumer disputes.

In an everchanging economic climate, safeguarding consumer rights is paramount. The re-established Consumer Affairs Tribunal, offering free dispute resolutions, ensures that citizens are shielded from financial uncertainties' harsh impacts. A call for public nominations for Tribunal membership was published in 16 local and regional newspapers in July 2023, including the *Provincial Gazette*. This resulted in a total of 22 nominations. Nominees underwent thorough probity checks to ensure their suitability for appointment. The eligibility criteria, this included being a citizen of South Africa and not being a civil servant, as well as not being unrehabilitated insolvent or having a criminal conviction due to dishonesty, as well as not having been removed from office of a trust due to misconduct.

After extensive interviews were conducted with top nominees, the Committee found the recommended suited candidates for appointment to the Tribunal by the hon Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the DA is confident that the process has been fair and transparent, and therefore supports the proposed appointments to the Consumer Affairs Tribunal.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I have to announce that there are currently 32 hon members present and entitled to vote, and the House is therefore quorate. The question put before the House is that the Report by the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism be adopted. Are there any objections to the report

being adopted?

Hon MEMBERS: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No. No objections, agreed to. Those who – no, it is fine. Agreed to. I think that we now have full approval.

The Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on the recommendations for the appointment of candidates to the Western Cape Consumer Affairs Tribunal has therefore been adopted. Mr Stemele, will you please read the Third Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Standing Committee on Infrastructure on the Expropriation Bill [B 23D–2020].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Order! The House has received the Report of the Standing Committee on the Standing Committee on Infrastructure on the Expropriation Bill conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP not to support this Bill. This mandate has been sent to the NCOP. I will now afford any parties an opportunity to make a declaration if they so wish. I recognise the ANC.

Mr P MARRAN: Thanks, hon Deputy Speaker. Good afternoon to everyone present. Hon Deputy Speaker, I rise on behalf of the African National Congress to voice our unwavering support for the passing of the

Expropriation Bill. This legislation has crucial steps towards advancing social justice, economic development, and equitable land for redistribution in our nation. It marks a pivotal moment in our journey towards rectifying historical injustice, particularly those who were forcefully displaced and dispossessed of their land and property.

Through this legislation we are building a more inclusive society. For too long, the legacy of apartheid and colonialism has cast a dark shadow over our nation. Countless individuals in communities were uprooted from their ancestral lands, their homes demolished, and their livelihoods destroyed. The wounds inflicted by forced removals and land seizures run deep and the effects continue to be felt daily.

The Expropriation Bill embodies the principles of justice, equality, and redress. It seeks to empower the Government to expropriate property for public purpose or in public interest by also ensuring fair and just compensation for affected parties. This Bill is not merely a legal document, it is a beacon of hope for those who have long suffered the consequences of land dispossession. By passing this Bill, we are taking a decisive step towards healing these wounds and building a more inclusive and equitable society. This legislation reaffirms our commitment to the principles of democracy and social justice. It is enshrined in the Constitution as the Republic of South Africa.

There will be no arbitrary dispossession of property, as the DA claims in its

*swart gevaar* tactics. Yes, the Bill acknowledges that there are instances where providing no compensation for expropriated property may be just and equitable, particularly when it serves the broader public interest. The provision ensures that land expropriation is not hindered by prohibitive compensation costs, enabling the Government to ensure transformative policies that benefit the nation as a whole.

We welcome the NCOP's adoption of this Bill with a vote of eight provinces in support and the DA delegation voted against: one province. The ANC fully supports this Bill in course, just like Herman Mashaba supported when he was a DA leader in the City of Johannesburg, supported expropriation. The ANC fully supports this Bill and calls on all members of the National Assembly to vote in favour of the Expropriation Bill when it is presented before the House. I thank you. ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hear, hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I note the apologies. I note ...[Interjections.] that we do not have GOOD. The ACDP? ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: They normally are.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] The ACDP does not support this Bill. With policy uncertainty and reckless



utterings from the ANC, we will see people not safe in this province. So, we cannot support this Bill. The ANC is thinking that with this, they will get more votes. They are not getting more votes. [Interjections.] They are going to be under 50% and they are going to be out on 29 May 2024. [Interjections.] I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Interjections.] I recognise ...[Interjections.] Order, hon members. [Interjections.] I recognise the Freedom Front Plus. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Nepotism!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Deputy Speaker, the ANC has proven itself unable and incompetent to manage this country and our hitherto excellent functioning State-Owned Enterprises. All of them are in a state of collapse. The Freedom Front ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marais, is your, sorry, apologies. Is your microphone on?

Mr P J MARAIS: Yes, Dear. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: He does not need a mic. [Laughter.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Thanks for the complement, honourable. [Laughter.] SAA, Eskom, Rand Water, Denel, all State-Owned Enterprises are in a state of collapse. Our national health system is in the process of failing, too and so is everything else. The Freedom Front therefore cannot support the Land Expropriation Bill because it will signal the final nail in the economic coffins and fortunes of South Africa as a whole. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Al Jama-Ah, do you have a declaration?

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you. Yes, thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, the Al Jama-Ah, we support this Bill of the ANC, and we will make sure that the ANC stays in power nationally, ...[Interjections.] [Laughter.] and we will also ensure that the ANC takes the Western Cape come 29 May. [Interjections.] [Laughter.] Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Applause.] I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, the DA supports land reform and restitution ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Ah, that is words!

Ms L M MASEKO: ...but we reject that the ANC smuggled in the Expropriation Bill, the Bill that will destroy our country. [Interjections.] This legislation will demoralise any investor that wants to help the Government in creating jobs for the benefit of our communities. This Bill aims to repeal the Expropriation Act of 1975 and provide for the expropriation of property for a public purpose or in the public interest.

Hon Deputy Speaker, Section 25 of the Constitution addresses social justice and redresses the past. It is necessary to address historical injustices, particularly in the context of land ownership in South Africa. The Bill in its current form undermines property rights and could have negative repercussions on investment and economic stability. [Interjections.] Expropriation sends a signal to investors that their property rights are not secure, which could deter investment and economic growth. [Interjections.] It undermines the rule of law and could lead to despotic seizure of property by the State. [Interjections.] The Bill lacks adequate safeguards to prevent abuse of power and lacks clarity on the criteria for expropriation with or without compensation.

The Expropriation Bill could erode market confidence and have a negative impact on the banking and financial sectors. It could lead to a decline in property values and disrupt the stability of the property market. This Expropriation Bill does not consider striking a balance between addressing historical injustices and protecting property rights and market stability. Any

expropriation process should be conducted in a transparent, fair, and equitable manner ...[Interjections.] with due regard for the impact on property owners and the broader economy.

For these reasons, hon Deputy Speaker, the DA does not support the Expropriation Bill. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I have to announce that there are currently 32 hon members present and entitled to vote, and the House is therefore quorate. The question put before the House that the Standing Committee on Infrastructure on the Expropriation Bill conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP, not to support this Bill be ratified and adopted. No objections?

An HON MEMBER: None.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Agreed to. Your objections will be noted in your declaration, hon Marran, but you normally would repeat it at the end. But I did listen very carefully that you had objected. That is correct? That is correct. Thank you. Okay, we are fine.

So, the Report of the Standing Committee on Infrastructure on the Expropriation Bill has therefore been adopted. Mr Stemele, please read the Fourth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Standing Committee on Infrastructure on the Housing Consumer Protection Bill [B10D–2021].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. The House received the Report of the Standing Committee on Infrastructure on the Housing Consumer Protection Bill conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP, to support this Bill. This mandate has been sent to the NCOP. I will now afford parties an opportunity to make a declaration if they so wish. I recognise the ANC.

Mr P MARRAN: Thanks, hon Deputy Speaker. It seems you want me to also say at the end that we support. I did say the previous Bill at the beginning, that the ANC did support. Again, hon Deputy Speaker, I rise on behalf of the African National Congress to voice our support for the passing of the Housing Consumer Protection Bill.

This legislation embodies our commitment to safeguarding the rights and interests of housing consumers across our province and country at large. The Housing Consumer Protection Bill is a pivotal piece of legislation designed to provide comprehensive protection to housing consumers. Its objectives are clear and noble to ensure the integrity of the housing market to safeguard consumers against unscrupulous practises and to promote transparency, accountability in the homebuilding industry.

One of the key positions of this Bill is the continuation of the National Home

Builders Legislation Council as the National Homebuilding Regulatory Council. This regulatory body will play a crucial role in overseeing the conduct of homebuilders, ensuring compliance with industry standards and providing recourse for aggrieved consumers. Furthermore, the Bill establishes mechanisms for the registration of homebuilders, the enrolment of houses in the Home Warranty Fund and the regulation of contractual matters related to home construction. These measures are essential for instilling confidence in consumers, fostering trust in the housing market and promoting responsible practices within the industry.

By passing the Housing Consumer Protection Bill, we are taking a proactive stance in addressing challenges faced by housing consumers. We are sending a clear message that we prioritise the wellbeing and interests of our citizens, particularly those who are embarking on a journey of home ownership. We are satisfied with the process followed and confident that ample time was given to the people to make submissions and to attend the public hearings.

I therefore call on the hon members of the House who stand united in support of the Housing Consumer Protection Bill to fight for the consumers' protection, promote sustainable development and uphold the values of fairness and justice as well as to demonstrate our unwavering commitment to building a brighter future for all. The ANC rises to support this Bill. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, the ACDP supports the Bill. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. The Freedom Front Plus.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): We have no declaration to make.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Noted. Thank you very much. Al Jama-Ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Al Jama-Ah supports the Bill. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. The Democratic Alliance.

An HON MEMBER: They support?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: They support.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, the Housing Consumers Protection Bill aims to address longstanding issues within the homebuilding industry by replacing the outdated Housing Consumers Protection Measures Act 1998, recognising the need to better safeguard the interests of homeowners. The proposed Bill seeks to enhance protection for housing consumers. Central to the Bill's

objectives is the reinforcement of existing protection measures. By imposing stringent standards and regulations, it aims to improve quality assurance within the industry and reduce the prevalence of substandard construction practises.

Additionally, the Bill emphasises the importance of effective regulatory frameworks to govern industry conduct. By prescribing clear guidelines and protocols, it aims to enhance transparency and accountability, while also introducing provisions for imposing sanctions against those who are found in breach of regulations.

Following careful consideration, the Standing Committee on Infrastructure recommended conferring authority upon the Western Cape's delegation in the NCOP, to support the Bill. The Democratic Alliance supports the Housing Consumer Protection Bill recognising the importance of an acting legislation to safeguard consumers and promote integrity within the homebuilding industry. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I have to announce that there are apparently 32 hon members present and entitled to vote, and the House is therefore quorate. The question put before the House that the Standing Committee on Infrastructure on the House Consumer Protection Bill conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill, be ratified and adopted. No objections?



Hon MEMBERS: No objections. None.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Agreed to. Thank you very much. Hon members, the Report of the Standing Committee on Infrastructure on the Housing Consumer Protection Bill has therefore been adopted.

This concludes the business of the day. Mr Stemele will now end the meeting and all the hon members will be exited from this Sitting. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 12:18.