
THURSDAY, 25 APRIL 2013

The House met at 14:15

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS -

see p

INTERPELLATIONS, QUESTIONS AND REPLIES – see p

INTERPELLATIONS

MOD Centre Programme: effective operation

1. Ms J Witbooi asked the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:

Whether the operation of the MOD Centre Programme is effective where it has been rolled out?

Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Dankie, mnr die Speaker, die bedryfsdoeltreffendheid van die 181 MOD - sentrums wat die Provinsie bedryf en tot stand gebring het, kan as bevredigend beskou word soos gekwalifiseer teen hierdie antwoord. Operasioneel het elke MOD-

sentrum 'n gestruktureerde program van aktiwiteite en doel – spesifieke afrigters daarvoor. Met 'n afrigter-tot-leerder-verhouding van een tot 35 het die MOD-sentrums nie oral dieselfde sukses nie, want nie alle MOD-sentrums word voldoende deur leerders bygewoon nie. Hoewel die program ten opsigte van infrastruktuur 'n goeie onderbou het, is daar vele aspekte wat wel 'n negatiewe impak het op die naskoolse program, soos byvoorbeeld die weer, godsdienstige verpligtinge, en misdaad in die omgewing.

Sedert die inwerkingstelling van die MOD-sentrums in 2010 is die volgende tendense wel waargeneem. Oor die algemeen word laerskoolgebaseerde MOD-sentrums beter bygewoon as hoërskoolgebaseerde MOD-sentrums. Waar daar 'n voedingssteunprogramme bestaan wat deur die Departement van Maatskaplike Ontwikkeling aangebied word, is die bywoning van leerders beter as waar daar nie sulke programme bestaan nie. 'n Fundamentele invloed met betrekking tot die bywoning deur die leerders is dat dit nie verpligtend is nie maar vrywillig.

'n Bykommende element wat 'n negatiewe inpak op bywoning het, is wanneer die skool se leierskap nie betrokke raak by die bevordering van MOD-sentrums nie. In dié verband het ons reeds goeie samewerking gefasiliteer met die Onderwysdepartement en met die betrokke leierskap by die skole. Daar waar die betrokke leierskap wel die MOD-sentrums

bevorder, was die daaglikse bywoning van die leerders buitengewoon goed. Om die bywoningskoers en deelname te verhoog, sal die Departement vanjaar fokus om by 32 van die 181 MOD- sentrums die gehalte en produk-aanbieding te verbeter.

Die doel van hierdie oefening is om lesse uit die proses te neem en dit aan te wend deur opgradering van ander MOD-sentrums. Daar sal vanjaar ook 'n elektroniese moniteringsstelsel in werking gestel word om hierdie proses te ondersteun. Dit sal die jongste inligting en die data gereedlik beskikbaar maak. MOD-sentrums word in die algemeen in die armste gemeenskappe opgerig sodat die kinders van hierdie gemeenskappe toegang verkry tot positiewe geleenthede en nie in negatiewe en afwykende gedrag verval nie. Vir talle leerders is die MOD-sentrums die enigste volhoubare alternatief om die gapings in hulle lewens te vul. Dankie, mnr die Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Witbooi over to you.

Me J WITBOOI: Baie dankie, mnr die Speaker. Ek het die vraag op die Ordelys geplaas omdat die sukses van die program baie belangrik is. Nie net het dit ten doel om die jeug te help ontwikkel in verantwoordelike jong mense wat op verantwoordbare wyse tot hulle eie bemagtiging kan bydra nie, maar dit het ook die potensiaal om rolmodelle daar te stel. Dit is dus vir die ANC belangrik dat die sukses van die program gewaarborg is en

dat enige negatiewe beïnvloeding tot die program summier aangespreek en reggestel moet word. Daar sal in diepte gekyk moet word hoe die maksimum deelname aan die program deur leerders verkry kan word. Die grootste uitdaging, en daar is talle ander, tot die sukses van die program, is leerlingdeelname en die Minister het so pas dit genoem.

Dit is 'n aspek waarmee die Departement nog lank sal mee worstel as daar nie 'n deeglike bewusmakingstrategie in plek gestel word nie. Hierdie bewusmakingstrategie sal die leerders, ouers, gemeenskapslede, en gemeenskapsorganisasies moet insluit. Dit is gemeenskappe wat al die genoemde komponente insluit wat 'n program van dié aard kan maak of breek. Die MOD-program is al by verskeie geleenthede in die Huis bespreek, en onder andere het die LUR al genoem dat hy die munisipaliteite besoek het om te hoor in watter mate hulle hul rol kan speel tot die sukses van die program.

'n Bewusmakingstrategie soos bogenoemde sal dus noodwendig ook die plaaslike owerhede moet insluit. Skole wat nie oor sportfasiliteite beskik nie sal van munisipale geriewe gebruik moet maak. Sommige van die geriewe is onversorg, die gras is nie gesny nie en dies meer, en ons kan 'n lang lys sulke goed opnoem. Ander is weer onveilig, en is nie behoorlik omkamp en omhein nie. [Tyd verstreke.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired, thank you very much. Hon member Mr Wiley over to you.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I think this is a very apt topic for the hon member Ms Witbooi to raise, but I think she posed the wrong question. The question she should have asked was why it is necessary for this Province, the Western Cape Province, to take this initiative to keep the children occupied and off the streets and to develop their motor skills, physical motor skills, and intellectual motor skills as far as arts and so on is concerned and is affording them the opportunity to study further.

And the answer is quite simple. If it wasn't for the fact that the National Government, the ANC Government, had taken physical education out of schools and taken sport away from the Department of Education and given it to the Department of Sport, without proper planning and capacitation we would not be sitting with this problem. That is the problem. We had compulsory structured physical education twice a week previously under the previous governments. We are now in a situation where no motor skills are being developed in the schools. It is an optional extra as part of life orientation. Those children are not able to develop physically the way they are meant to do in their growth years, and on top of it instead of incorporating the educators, who know the scholars better than most, as far as sport is concerned, we have now given the educators the opportunity, with extra time on their hands, to strike on the streets of Cape Town.

That is what we really must be concentrating on, and the real tragedy of it is, that it is not the middle and upper class children, the more economically enabled children that are being affected by this. The ones being affected the most are the ones that can least afford extra curriculum activities. That is why this Province in pursuit of an open opportunity society has taken this initiative to try and occupy the children and give them a better chance in life. That is the question that must be asked. It is not so much whether this project is succeeding. It will succeed because this Government is determined to make this project succeed, and yes, it is trial and error because it is completely new, and yes it will take a bit of time, and yes it will take a bit of adaption, but the fact of the matter is at least they are doing something.

The SPEAKER: Order. Thank you hon member Mr Wiley.

Mr M G E Wiley: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, Mr Speaker and thank you for some of these inputs. Mr Speaker, recently I paid a visit to three MOD Centres; Voorwaarts Primary School in Riversdale, Tandora Primary School in Thembaletu in George, and also to Swartburg Primary School in Caledon. My visit confirmed that where leadership is given and actively seen to be driving the MOD Centre programme, the successes are as follows: the Deputy Principal of

Voorwaarts Primary School, Mr Stephanus shows leadership by assisting with the coaching of rugby at the MOD Centre; the principal of Tandora Primary School in Thembaletu in George, Mr Ntentele, actively supports his MOD Centre and has a teacher dedicated to support the MOD Centre. So too does Mr Hendrick, principal at Swartburg Primary School in Caledon. His Deputy Principal, Ms Booysen, teaches chess at the school. I am happy to say that the hon member Eugene von Brandis was present when I visited these MOD Centres, as well as the hon member Jennifer Hartnick .

These MOD Centres also work successfully with parent involvement, because it is critical in the success of the MOD Centre. The presence of the Chairperson of the Governing Body confirmed that the parents of Swartburg Primary School were kept informed and that they actively encouraged their children to attend the program. The large number of learners at the MOD Centre illustrated the power of communicating with parents, and I agree with the hon member Ms Witbooi that we have to continue improving our communication with the parents. That's a point well taken. SPartnerships ignificantly enhance the quality of the MOD Centre programme. The involvement of Mrs [Inaudible.], the coordinator of the Chess Organisation, Moves for Life in the Hessequa region, adds much value to the work of the MOD Centre. Local municipalities also have a critical role to play. The support given to Swartkop Primary School by Theewaterskloof Municipality is a case in point. In Theewaterskloof

they partnered with the MOD Centre in the space of specifically in sports facilities and also in the development of chess. I have handed over a chess set to the school and the game is now going to be played at a particular library in Caledon.

[Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister. Your time has expired. Thank you very much. Hon member Ms Witbooi over to you.

Me J WITBOOI: Baie dankie, mnr die Speaker. Volgens die departementele program sal die Departement van Kultuursake en Sport die staande komitee toelig oor die huidige stand van die sake rakende die hoofprogram. Ek dink die Minister het nou al 'n paar keer hierdie goed vir ons gesê, maar ek wil vir die agb lid mnr Wiley sê dis nodeloos om my te kom staan en uitkryt. Ek gaan my rol speel, totdat ons oortuig is dat jongmense baat vind by die program. Ons sal die Departement aanmoedig soos wat ek nog altyd gedoen het as ek opstaan, om 'n ernstige poging aan te wend om die MOD-program so bekend te stel dat dit op almal se lippe is. Die waarheid is dat baie jongmense wat die program behoort by te woon, weet nog nie almal van die program nie, en ek verstaan ook die dinamiek daaragter. Baie verstaan nie die konsep nie en vir baie fasiliteerders is dit 'n groot bron van frustrasie as daar sommige dae net 'n handjievol leerders opdaag. Alhoewel die program nog nie tot sy volle

potensiaal ontwikkel is nie, is dit darem ook nie asof daar nie werk gedoen word nie. Gedurende hierdie Meimaand gaan die Departement van Maatskaplike Ontwikkeling hulle staande komitee inlig en toelig oor die toedrag van sake. By sommige skole daag die kinders net nie op as daar nie voeding vir hulle gegee word na skool nie. Hierdie inligting is belangrik vir die suksesvolle uitrol van die program. Baie dankie.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister over to you.

Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Dankie, mnr die Speaker.

The success of the MOD Centres as we know now also depends on our ability to foster partnerships in this regard. We have fostered partnerships with the private sector particularly with Virgin Active, with NGO's like the JAGFoundation in Hout Bay and also with my colleague Minister AlbertFritz in terms of the nutritional programme. One certainly does not want to see children being in school without a meal from eight o'clock to four o'clock in the afternoon. Since Minister Fritz started to contribute in the after school programme we have seen an increase in the numbers that are attending the MOD Centres.

We also have now improved our relationship and our institutional relationship with the Western Cape Education Department in terms of the

EMDC's as well as the principals but also importantly the parents buy-in. We are also very happy that Minister Botha is now also part of this in terms of the Wellness programme at schools. Mr Speaker, on Monday I met with the Mayco member of Sport in the City of Cape Town to discuss exactly the point the hon member Ms Witbooi raised about the lack of facilities at schools. The Mayco member of sport, Ms Belinda Walker, has now offered that we can also use the sports facilities in the surrounding areas where there are no sport facilities at particular schools. I intend to raise this question with other municipalities around the province.

1

We have also arranged partnerships with cultural organisations because it is a fact that not everybody wants to do physical education. Some people may want to dance and sing and when we include these particular aspects in the programmes we see an increase in the numbers of the scholars attending. But the key point here is that when we see the leadership, and this is also confirmed by my recent observation, of the school principal, the government body, then we really see the success of this particular programme. Mr Speaker, allow me to take this opportunity to announce in this House that we are now also busy increasing the quality of the coaches and they are conducting a coaching course at Chrysalis this week. Minister Albert Fritz paid a visit to Chrysalis and was told that they are conducting an international coaching certificate course there and we are now using those in the MOD Centres from Chrysalis. I thank you Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Order hon members! That is the end of interpellation number one. We now proceed to the second interpellation.

Hon Minister Carlisle over to you.

Bellville Taxi-rank: suspension of licences

2. Mr M Skwatsha asked the Minister of Transport and Public

Works:

What are the reasons that led to his suspending the new and renewed licences of the three associations at the Bellville taxi rank?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you Mr Speaker. I am interested that the hon member Mr Skwatsha, having called for my head, continues to ask me questions. He says I am a useless transport minister and that the Premier should fire me but he still asks me questions. So I will give him an answer. In fact I have not suspended the new and renewed licences of the three associations in Bellville. I have done something quite different.

I have for the second time stopped all transactions in respect of the three associations. The reason for that is that during August violence developed and people were killed. They belonged to one of the three associations; Bellville Taxi Association, Durbanville Taxi Association and Bloekombos Wallacedene. This was because of a power struggle within those three associations which have a very close relationship with one another. We

had ongoing negotiations, meetings, internal dispute reconciliation and everything you can imagine, employing very capable people to do so, as the hon member Mr Skwatsha well knows. We were not able to bring about some kind of reconciliation to end this particular situation.

For the first time I then suspended all transactions. As the hon member Mr Skwatsha will know the most painful part of that of course is that it closes them off from long distance taxi permits.

They then came to heel as it were. They promised not to fight with each other and kill each other anymore and that they would do everything we wanted them to do. Let me tell the hon member Mr Skwatsha that they were completely non-compliant. They had not held supervised annual general meetings as they were supposed to.

I then lifted the suspension but I am afraid the situation got worse. About eight weeks ago certain members within BELTA, including members of the executive or certain members of the executive, began removing minibuses. Any member of theirs who had more than six minibuses was not allowed to rank more than that number and they violently removed such minibuses. They caused a commotion and in the end a man was murdered at the rank. They assaulted a member of my staff very seriously when he went to investigate these matters. I personally went to the rank while this was happening and we immediately re-suspended.

But we went further. I have now Gazetted that if the situation is not resolved, if proper annual general meetings are not held, if we do not get written undertakings that there will be no further removals from the rank then we will actually close their 81 routes entirely. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha over to you.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Thank you Mr Speaker. Thanks to the hon Minister as well. In your general notice H23 you indicated that in the light of the extraordinary measures that you would take you would then allow other operators, who need not be the holders of operating licences for the affected routes, to come in and provide the services. The bullet reads:

“As to allow other operators who need not be the holders of operating licences for the affected areas to come in and provide the services in the interim period until the situation returns to normal”.

Has that been effected at the present moment?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: No.

Mr M SKWATSHA: I would strongly suggest that that would be

disastrous and I think the hon Minister knows that very well because this would lead to bloodshed.

Now if the Minister then says he has suspended, lifted and re-suspended, is there a timeframe to this re-suspension and what are the conditions and what are the commuters doing at the present moment?

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr von Brandis over to you.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Speaker, the closure of taxi ranks, suspension of pending licences, cancelling of routes and impoundings are all actions that can be taken against the taxi industry where necessary to stem violence and illegality. Last year, four taxi operators were killed when disputes between the taxi factions based in Bellville turned violent. It was necessary for Minister Carlisle to take certain measures against those associations in response to the then unending fighting between these rival groups. The absence of violence within the taxi industry is usually short-lived and it is only a matter of time before it returns.

The hon member Mr Skwatsha will remember in 2005, when as MEC of Transport and Public Works, he used similar tactics to restore order when violence erupted over disputed taxi ranks in Bellville, Brackenfell and Durbanville, amongst others.

It must be noted that the informal transport is highly competitive and prone to infighting and violence as operators in those situations battle amongst themselves for key routes. The internal mechanics of associations, alongside competition and factionalism, as in these latest incidents, disrupts what is often a very fragile level of stability in the industry.

Such violent infighting casts a negative light on a very crucial industry for the Western Cape, with violence affecting both the commuters and other road users.

Mr Speaker, constant engagement with and monitoring of taxi associations and operators is essential to prevent possible disagreements and disputes amongst operators. It should be made clear to taxi associations that the government will use whatever means necessary to ensure that routes and ranks remain safe.

As long as the threat of violence exists within the taxi industry so too will the measures that can be used to prevent or end it. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister over to you.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Let me just deal quickly with the hon member Mr Skwatsha. I have a wide range of powers. I can close just the BELTA ranks or I can close the whole

Bellville rank. I can invite other people to come in or not invite them to come in. In fact I have no option at this stage other than to suspend their transactions at the PRE. No, I would not invite anybody else to come in, as you know. What is the timeframe? Let me come back to that question and what the conditions are. The hon member Mr Skwatsha knows that it has its roots in the struggle between what is now Wallacedene in Bloemkombos and the old SMKTA which was operating at the time when he was the Transport Minister. It has carried on from there. There are elements within BELTA who are opposed to Thusumeli and his group within BELTA.

Let me say this. They are in fact challenging the 15 plus 15. That is what it amounts to. They first tried to split the 15 plus 15 and tried to get CODETA on that side. When that failed - they are in fact challenging and they are now linked with another area of problems which is Delft. The BELTA problems and the DUTA problems are intimately related, the one is sparking the other.

This is a challenge to the existing order which has served us very well in the taxi industry for the last four years. Let me say to the hon member Mr Skwatsha because I am deeply disturbed about this. I have these rogue elements in BELTA and nine people are now dead. They are challenging the existing order. They provoke violence on the ranks and what do I find, Sir? I find letters of support for them from Councillor Makalene, from

Councillor Toko, from Councillor Giempies Mr M SKWATSHA:
Supporting what?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Supporting the formation of a new mother body called DUTA in opposition to CATA and CODETA.

The SPEAKER: Conclude please, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Including Councillor Giempies. Now as far as I know those are all ANC councillors. I want to urge the hon member Mr Skwatsha to please to keep party politics out of this.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Please keep party politics out of this.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha over to you.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, I want to agree with the Minister that party politics should not play a role in all these issues. I am not sure whether party politics are in fact playing a role. The mere letter of support,

which I have not even seen, to the formation of an organisation does not imply party politics.

We are dealing with something that has been rooted in violence for a long time – as the hon Minister would know – it has a long history of violence. All that I would like to say on this issue is that I am not sure how far the negotiation process is at the present moment. I think at some stage it has to be a carrot or stick situation.

I would also like to say to the hon Minister that it would not help to consider some of the sections that are listed in the notice. I think that the hon Minister should not put something forward or even have intentions of passing something that would lead to bloodshed because that is not your intention. The last thing that I would like to say is the hon member Mr von Brandis is very right that in 2005, which started in 2004, we were faced with a similar situation. I would be very impressed if the DA appreciated that situation because the hon Minister from this side of the House does not see it that way at the present moment. The hon Minister was the one who was threatening to side with the taxi associations and wanting to take us to court to open the taxi ranks when the situation was so fragile and volatile.

At that time the hon Minister was playing party politics on this issue over the death of many people in this regard.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister over to you.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: We can go back in history but I am dealing with the question that you asked me now. Let me say this, you did open the ranks and the killing did go on and you remember it well. [Interjection.] The killing did go on. Let me say here that negotiations have been extensive but to little purpose. But let me say this, and I think the hon member Mr Skwatsha knows it, but let me say this for everybody in the House. The warfare between CATA and CODETA and their predecessor bodies has been the main cause of taxi deaths in the province. CATA and CODETA with some external help, I think a little help from us in the province, have gone to great lengths to bring about a process to keep the peace between them. That process eventuated in the 15 by 15. It has worked extremely well. There has been no CATA versus CODETA or CODETA versus CATA violence for a number of years. They work very well together and now that is beginning to produce a host of benefits.

Now we have a rogue organisation or rogue group coming out of BELTA linking with other rogue groups in Delft seeking to bring in the 14 coloured associations of the northern region to try and bring about some kind of unholy racial war. That is not going to happen. We have the support of CATA and CODETA in what we are doing here and we have

the support of Mr Billeton Santaka. I want to say this, what we do not want is for politicians of any party to start issuing letters like this saying “please register this new mother body”. We have got something which works in the Western Cape, it may not be perfect but it works in the Western Cape and we certainly do not need that.

Perhaps hon member Mr Skwatsha – I will give him copies of these letters – might just breathe a little easier. Maybe they issued these letters because they do not understand the dynamics of the taxi industry and they do not understand the dynamics of long distance travel. I look forward to the hon member’s support in this matter.

Debate concluded

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. We now move to the third interpellation. I recognise the hon Minister Fritz.

Social Work Veterans Forum: improvement of service delivery

3. Ms A J du Toit Marais asked the Minister of Social

Development:

To what extent will the Social Work Veterans Forum contribute to the improvement of service delivery?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Speaker, the Social Work Veterans Forum, which is a national initiative or initiative by the national department, was launched in the Western Cape Province in December 2012. Since their launch a meeting has been held between the Veterans Forum and the Head of the Department of Social Development to assess how the Veterans Forum can assist in improving service delivery. The Veterans Forum has been advised by us to register as an appropriate legal vehicle with which the department can engage such as an NPO. A discussion on the improvement of service delivery will occur once the Veterans Forum is a registered legal entity.

The SPEAKER: Hon Marais over to you?

Ms A J du Toit MARAIS: Mr Speaker, the incorporation of experienced social workers will definitely address the chronic shortage of social workers in the Western Cape. It will assist in reducing the demands of service delivery in the province as social ills are on a perpetual increase. This will afford a significant number of new social workers who require supervision with mentoring and coaching in joining the profession.

With all of this said, can the hon Minister Fritz tell us whether an organisational design was done to incorporate the Social Veterans Forum into the department?

The SPEAKER: Minister, over to you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Mr Speaker. We have just appointed 93 graduate social workers who received bursaries over the last three years. I make that the first point.

The second point is [Interjection]. Yes. It is a very important question about the organisational design. Mr Speaker, in the Department of Social Development nationally I sometimes get the impression that at some point someone wakes up one morning and decides we must go and get all the retired social workers and put them in without any organisational design, without going through the process determined by the Public Service Act. I was so amazed when I went to a Minmec meeting and I heard they have already started and they have no budget for it. They actually started the forum. I think it is a wonderful idea to have the Veterans Social Worker Forum involved, but it must be done in the proper way.

Suffice to say the Western Cape's proposal of having the veterans as a registered entity and specifically as an NPO so that we can do business with them was accepted by all the national MECs. No one ever thought that you are supposed to do an organisational design before you start anything. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Magwaza over to you.

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Thank you. Mr Speaker, this province is losing social workers on a daily basis. Social workers are going to the NGOs because they pay better than the Government. We know that this is a scarce skill. Our communities are much more in need of social workers who go down to the communities and assist the communities.

Social workers presently are basically doing a lot of administration rather than being in contact with the people. I want to say that the presence of social workers in our communities is very crucial and the success of social development in terms of caring for the vulnerable, the poor and people with disabilities, depends on a huge component of social workers being available.

This Province has set itself the objective of being the best run Regional Government in the world with a trans-versal system of governance and a dashboard in the Office of the Premier that is supposed to be hands-on in monitoring the service delivery of departments. The reality is that all these systems do not really deal with the challenges of service delivery where it matters most.

Can the Minister or the Premier inform us today of the cases of social workers and the cooperation of other departments to assist social workers in the execution of their work; the administrative backlog regarding cases

and the programmes that are in place to assist social workers in their personal psychological challenges that they have to deal with. In this province there is a clear lack of understanding of the challenges that social workers face on a daily basis. The assistance of seasoned social workers who are willing to assist younger people who deal with challenges at the coalface have become a necessity.

In this regard the role and contribution of the Social Work Veterans Forum will serve to alleviate the work load of these younger people.

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Nothing can replace experience.

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Ms Magwaza, thank you. Hon member Ms Marais over to you.

Ms A J du Toit MARAIS: Thank you Mr Speaker. According to the terms of reference the objectives of the Social Work Veterans Forum are:

“To define useful roles for Social Work Veterans in supporting the State’s purpose of providing effective and efficient services in the Social Welfare sector; and to collaborate with the national Department of Social Development in addressing

skills shortages and enhancing professional social services;
provide support, mentoring and coaching of social service
professionals, especially newly qualified social workers; and
play an advocacy role in the Social Welfare Service sector”.

I commend this initiative to develop a structure that will serve as a platform to enhance professional growth and development. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Minister, over to you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Let me just state for the record that we absolutely always welcome the value of any seasoned social worker. I just want to make that clear. The question I always ask is, do we need another structure within the department for that or can we have an agreement with people on the job? We need to have agreement. If you need them to do specific mentoring work with our graduate social workers we will call those people in.

Mr Speaker, I am always very interested and sometimes excited when I sit in this House. People make absolutely unsubstantiated statements about social workers who are resigning to go to the NGOs. NGO social workers are running to us because we pay far more than NGOs. That is the first point.

The second point I want to make is that the collaboration with the national department and our own department in the Western Cape is always an important point. I want to remind the hon members on the other side of the House that when we arrived in Government - and I say it respectfully and I am not pointing fingers - when we arrived in the Office the head office was filled with social workers sitting and doing so called policy design. It is absurd nonsense brought by the previous government who is sitting opposite me now and they are now pointing at me. I am trying to get them back to the local areas and then they all run to my favourite union NEHAWU.

They all run there and I say you are a social worker you were trained as a person to work with the people.

I then discovered that there is this notion, the notion that when you come and work at the head office as a simple policy designer – I have not seen one policy that has been designed – you also get the OSD, extra pay for doing that. I would want to come to the Standing Committee and do a presentation on – do not talk about case load because that is the biggest challenge.

Debate concluded.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, thank you very much. That is the end of

the interpellations. We will now deal with questions as printed on the Question Paper. Please note that question number 6 has been withdrawn. The first question is to the Premier.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Forensic Investigation into Hip Hop Media

1. Mr M Skwatsha asked the Premier:

(a) How much was spent on the forensic investigation into Hip Hop Media, (b) in respect of what period is the information furnished, (c) who were the forensic experts involved in this investigation and (d) how were they employed?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much Mr Speaker. (a) The provincial investigation into the Hip Hop Media matter, which was limited to the internal investigation into tender irregularities and contract administration irregularities, was performed in the time when the FIU staff was augmented by seconding staff from various professional service firms to the FIU to conduct the majority of its investigations. Not only into Hip Hop. The cost cannot be accurately determined as the investigators assigned to the Hip Hop investigation worked on various matters during this period: (b) the period being July 2010 to February 2011, during which period the majority of the fieldwork was conducted. (c) Senior forensic consultants suitably qualified in law and finance from Deloitte were assigned to this investigation. (d) Staff were seconded from various

professional services' firms to augment the capacity of the FIU, a procurement process and a delegation 5G was followed at that time.

Thank you Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Any follow up questions, hon member Mr Skwatsha?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Thank you hon Premier. Are you saying you cannot exactly say what the figure is?

The PREMIER: I am saying that as the same investigators from Deloitte investigated many, many matters during that period it is not possible to disaggregate the exact amount on the investigation that he did into Hip Hop.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Skwatsha?

Mr M SKWATSHA: So, I am right then that you cannot say exactly how much it was. Are you able to say how much was recovered?

The PREMIER: The issue is now with the South African Police Service and I wish that it would make as speedy progress there as it made in the internal investigation in this province. When it makes that speedy progress we will be able to take the necessary action.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Ozinsky?

Mr M OZINSKY: I do not think the Premier has answered the question but I want to ask the question directly then. Of the R22 million and cents, how much has the department recovered as a result of the investigation done by the FIU?

The PREMIER: That is a completely different question Mr Speaker. A completely different question ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The PREMIER: I will get that information and the hon member who has just tried to pose a different question can pose it to me and I will answer him then.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. We now deal with ... [Interjections.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Can I still ...

The SPEAKER: That is your last chance hon member Mr Skwatsha.

Mr M SKWATSHA: That is exactly the question I am asking. How much

has been recovered? It is not a different question.

Mr M OZINSKY: It is the same question.

The PREMIER: With respect Mr Speaker, it is a totally different question because the question on the Order Paper says how much was spent not howmuch was recovered Mr Speaker. Those are two totally different questions. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order!

An HON MEMBER : I would still like to know.

The PREMIER: You see the point is the hon member Mr Ozinsky wanted the hon member Mr Skwatsha to ask another question and now he is trying to fix the hon member Mr Skwatsha's question in this house [Interjections.]. The hon member Mr Ozinsky must ask his own questions ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon Member Mr Ozinsky, order! Order! [Interjections.] Hon members order! Hon member Ms Brown, hon member Mr Botha, order! The second question, over to you Hon Premier.

Gender based violence: combating of

2. Ms V Hani asked the Premier:

Whether her department is working with any outside organisations to combat gender-based violence, if not why not; if so, (a) with what organisations and (b) what are the details and is the extent of cooperation with such organisations?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. The Western Cape Government strives to work in a transversal manner as we have just heard from the hon member Mr Magwaza, where services are mainstreamed and delivered in a way which makes use of expertise and systems of all departments which are able to impact on the problem in question.

This is a deliberate effort to move out of the silo-thinking and management of the past which sealed off crucial issues and policy initiatives from general application. The focus now is to work together to address issues in the most efficient and cost-effective manner. I certainly have in my department a rapid response capacity because I get many, many letters, much information on social networks and various other things and I have the capacity to investigate very quickly and then pass out the problems to the various transversal management systems that are able to cope with them.

The mandate for women and children and people with disabilities is allocated to the Department of the Premier with that kind of inter-

connectivity. However, an issue such as gender-based violence impacts on the mandates of almost every department, particularly Community Safety, Social Development, Education and Health. It also speaks to the mandates of some national Government departments such as Police, Justice and the national Department of Social Development. The role of my department is to try to analyse the problem and then draw together the skills of the provincial departments which can impact on the issue, and if it is a national department to take it up at that level as well, or if it is a local issue, to deal with it at that level.

It must be borne in mind Speaker that there are also key non-governmental factors which have a major impact on the prevalence and combating of gender-based violence, for example parenting, peer groups and community dynamics. Within the Western Cape Government the Department of the Premier works with the Department of Health, Social Development and Community Safety to provide programmes to reduce violence in society and support the victims of violence.

These include first of all the Department of Health's Intimate Partner Violence pilot project in the Northern Tygerberg and Cape Winelands health districts, which is facilitated by the University of Stellenbosch. The project aims to provide an integrated service for women who experience violence from their intimate partners. These women either self-refer or are referred by the SAPS to these health facilities where there are trained

health workers and social workers for easy referral.

The Department of Health also has the Women's Health programme which trains healthcare workers on sexual assault examinations, collection of forensic specimens, counselling and the provision of post exposure prophylaxis. There is also a partnership with the Department of Justice and the SAPS at the Thuthuzela Centres. The Red Cross Hospital also has a forensic unit for this purpose.

Further, to try and ensure the implementation of gender-based interventions that meet the needs of women by addressing the problems that men face, there are men's health clinics in Khayelitsha, Salt River and Woodstock. There is a partnership with funded NGOs, such as Lifeline, at these clinics who also offer counselling services on various issues.

Fourthly, the Department of Health also funds various organisations, amongst other, HIV interventions which also focus on gender violence. They fund the Sonke Gender Justice network for two projects working with prisoners as part of the Correctional Service's social project, to prepare prisoners for integration back into the community, bearing in mind that the majority are there for violence-related crimes. Secondly, the project with men in their communities on the One Man Can campaign. We also fund Sweat and Triangle to work with sex workers and sensitise them on gender issues and how to deal with these in their work. They also

sensitise the general public on these issues. They are funding partners in Sexual Health to work on gender issues in Beaufort West where there is a problem with truckers and sex workers.

The Western Cape also participates in the Gender Justice Forum which includes national and provincial Government departments so that we can continue to work transversally on this scourge. The Nyanga Safety Summit, for example, by the Department of Community Safety, included a particular focus on gender-based violence. The Department of Community Safety works with the civilian secretariat for Police Services in evaluating the readiness of police stations at a local level to monitor compliance with the Domestic Violence Act.

The department has also established a Compliance Forum with the provincial SAPS where domestic violence issues and related complaints are discussed and action determined. The Chrysalis Youth Programme and Youth Safety Ambassador Programme offer parental programmes which also focus on gender-based violence.

The Western Cape Government also provides funding to various organisations which provide shelter and care for victims of violence including; the Mitchell's Plain Crisis Line, Carehaven Centre, Mosaic, Mitchell's Plain Care Centre, Place of Hope Lansdowne, Saartjie Baartman Centre for Women and Children, Sisters Incorporated, Famsa

Western Cape, St Anne's Shelter for Women, Khuleleka Multi-Cultural Counselling Service, Saphila Ekuhlaleni Community Organisation, United Sanctuary Against Abuse, Nonceba Shelter, Samila Gender Counselling, Creating Effective Families, Famsa Outeniqua in George, Phambili Refuge, Athlone House of Strength, Worcester House of Hope, L'Abri de Dieu Safe House, Trauma Centre in Woodstock.

The partnership in this regard includes information and awareness on issues of abuse and gender violence, screening, assessment and referral for victims of violence, the provision of safe accommodation, therapeutic and practical support for abused women and children, assisted transition back into the community and non-residential counselling and support. Thank you Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Any follow up questions? Hon member Ms Hani.

[Interjections.]

Ms V HANI: No.

The PREMIER: She's got the follow up written on a piece of paper.

An HON MEMBER: Who gave her the piece of paper?

[Interjections]

Ms V HANI: It is what she is doing.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER Order! Order! Hon members, hon[Interjections.] over to you, hon member Ms Hani. Hon members, Order! Hon member Ms Brown, Order!

Ms V HANI: Mr Speaker, can you protect me so that I can put a follow-up question to this long and transversal answer. Hon Premier, are there any intentions or plans from you to coordinate the training of the staff of other departments regarding gender-based violence? It is also important

The SPEAKER: Order. Order.

Ms V HANI: with all this information outside the organisation, that the staff in the departments

The SPEAKER: Order. Take your seat please. Hon member Ms Hani, I think the question is clear and that you do not have to motivate it.

Ms V HANI: Alright.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, over to you.

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, I think my entire answer was to show how we work transversally and develop expertise within the departments, all the departments, to assist victims of violence, to deal with gender-based violence and to support NGOs. So the answer is yes, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Is there any supplementary or follow-up question? None, we then are going to deal with the third question.

Outreach programmes to children

3. Ms V HANI asked the Premier:

(a) In how many outreach programmes to children was her department involved during the past financial year and (b) what was the extent of and are the further relevant details in respect of these programmes?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. As indicated in my reply to the last question, the Western Cape Government strives to work in a transversal manner where services are delivered in a way which makes use of the expertise and systems of all departments which are able to impact on a problem.

In the case of Programmes for Children, the Departments of Education, Cultural Affairs and Sport, Social Development, Community Safety and

Health also provide services and programmes which benefit children. Most certainly our programme dealing with children with disabilities is absolutely crucial and we have major pilot programmes driven by the Department of the Premier to deal with the big challenge of children with disabilities who are not getting the services they deserve.

Let us start with the School Feeding Scheme as one of the most important programmes we have. Over 427 000 learners currently receive a nutritious lunch every day. Most of these learners also receive a breakfast meal as well on three days of the week. This will be expanded to five days a week for all learners in the 2013/2014 financial year and that is really extraordinary as a service delivery item to children. The breakfast meal encourages learners to arrive at school early for the school day which assists in reducing late-coming.

Spending on this programme has increased from R112 million in 2009/2010, which is when we came to power, to R260 million in the current financial year Mr Speaker. An integrated school health program has been launched in the Eden district and includes health assessments for Grades R and 1 as well as health education. This programme includes three mobile clinics.

We also run, as everyone knows, an anti-diarrhoea campaign from January to May each year and we target the parents of children under five years

old. Immunisation campaigns covering measles, Vitamin A, H1N1, polio and de-worming are also conducted. Outreach includes visits to crèches and ECD centres. Childcare and protection programmes reach over 80 000 children each year through ECD and day care centres. At risk children are also assisted at child and youth care centres and foster care safety for parents.

A pilot project has been launched with the aim of documenting children with disabilities in disadvantaged communities. The aim of the project is to identify youth with disabilities, to build the capacity of parents and primary caregivers, to provide access to support programmes and to refer people to services. This programme is managed by the Uhambo Foundation but also includes Epilepsy South Africa, Iris House, Peter Pan Downs Syndrome Centre, Coma Care, Heads Up and Western Cape APD, that is the Association for People with Disabilities, as well as other Provincial Government departments.

In the past three weeks over 3 000 people with disabilities have been identified and assisted at Mfuleni and Vredenburg. This is a huge problem that we are now working to define and support to help people deal with it.

A Youth Safety Initiative ran during the December and April school holidays in partnership with various religious organisations and that assisted existing youth programmes in crime hotspots to keep children out

of harm's way. A reported 11 770 children have benefited from this programme at a total cost of R1.3 million. Areas where these programmes are located include Bonteheuwel, Delft, Kensington, Manenberg, Heideveld, Hanover Park, Elsies River, Franschhoek, Gugulethu, Nyanga, Lotus River, Malmesbury, Mitchell's Plain, Khayelitsha, Ravensmead, Scottsdene, Lavender Hill, Eerste River, Bellville, Hout Bay, Simonstown, Grassy Park, Ottery, Strand, Scottsville, Steenberg, Wallacedene, Zonnebloem, Oudtshoorn, Leeu Gamka, Philippi and Samora Machel.

The MOD centres are very important as a childcare initiative run by the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport. You have heard about the MOD centres today so I do not have to repeat anything about them.

In addition, I have a Human Rights champion in my Office who responds to all complaints and requests directed to the Office of the Premier regarding reports of abuse or mistreatment of children. She investigates as quickly as possible, assesses the situation and brings in the relevant support services from other provincial and national departments to address the needs of the children. She is not a specific case manager but a rapid response person to cut through red tape and ensure quick action where there is a crisis.

In one instance just recently we found a severely disabled child locked in a shack while the mother was at a shebeen. We can intervene in these sorts

of situations. This is just one of many, many examples of the kind of rapid response to children in difficult situations. Thank you Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Any follow up? We then move to the next question and it is the last one to the Premier, that is question number 4.

Extension of TBWA/Hunt/Lascaris contract

4. Mr P Uys asked the Premier:

(a) Whether the contract of TBWA/Hunt/Lascaris has been extended after its expiry on 31 December 2012; if so why, (b) by whom, (c) for what period and (d) at what cost was the contract extended?

The PREMIER: Thank you Mr Speaker. (a) The extension of the current service which is provided for in terms of the existing contract has been done to ensure that the new tender process for the communications contract adheres to all regulations, policies and prescripts, including a comprehensive demand management process. This careful attention to detail means that the process has taken longer to complete than originally planned. (b) The contract extension was signed off by the Director-General in consultation with provincial top management. (c) for six months and (d) there is no pre-determined cost for extending the contract as TBWA are paid as their services are utilised. There is no fixed monthly fee.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys?

Mr P UYS: Thank you Mr Speaker. Thank you to the Premier. Hon Premier, in your implementation plan to the Public Protector that you had to submit you committed yourself that well before the contract expires you will ensure that you put it in place. Why did you not ensure well in time, referring to May already, that the contract was not in place by the 31st December?

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, the demand side of the management process and assessment process has taken a long time because this is a transversal tender. It is very, very complex and it is the difficulties of managing the demand side of a transversal tender across all 12 departments that takes a long time.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys, over to you.

Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, the Premier said that the extension was negotiated. Can the Premier explain what was negotiated and what was the cost because she also said that there is no fixed cost per month. So we need to understand if this is an open-ended expenditure?

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, the cost of this particular contract has been far, far lower than even we anticipated. In fact, TBWA has made R6 million during the entire period of the contract, while other service providers for printing, broadcasting and production have earned R24.3 million. Compare that with the communication initiatives by the ANC and its service providers at the time and you will see what a basement bargain this is ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Ms Brown?

Ms L BROWN: Thank you very much Speaker. The Premier says that the transversal nature of this tender has taken a very, very long time. When did the Premier then conclude the transversal nature of the tender because surely that must have been done ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Ozinsky, hon member Ms Brown has on the floor.

Ms L BROWN: ... before she put out the tender. The first part, not the six month extension.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, If the hon leader of the opposition is referring to what we have been doing to ensure proper transversal demand side management, which is what I was referring to ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Member Mr Ozinsky, Order!

The PREMIER: we followed a rigorous process where all HODs and HOCs were interviewed to understand their departmental communication needs and to understand ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Member Mr Ozinsky, Order!

The PREMIER: whether it would make sense to have a common service provider in those areas where we need flexibility. Based on the feedback, as well as our brand and our provincial strategic objectives, 12 objectives, we compiled a business plan that was presented to provincial top management for their approval. It was agreed at PTM that a detailed communication plan needs to be submitted to understand what skills we have inside the organisation, how much of the work we can do ourselves, what type of work will come to corporate communications to complete, what needs to go to Trade World and for what work we do not have the skills inside that needs to go to an external service provider. That is very complex to do across all 12 departments.

These plans were further interrogated to make sure that they are focused and link back to our strategic objectives. Based on the final communication plan as well as the input of the HODs, we refined the business plan for final presentation to the Provincial Top Management.

This process did not happen in respect of the previous tender, which is why we did it this time and why it has been so complicated.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. The last time hon member Ms Brown.

MS L BROWN: Mr Speaker, I want to know why then did they extend it for six more months if it took a whole year to do what the Premier has just told us terms of the demand side?

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Because we did half of it before the contract ran out and we needed six more months Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Question number 5 to hon Minister Carlisle. Over to you

Roof of Zwelihle Primary School

5. Mr Z C Stali asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

Whether it has been brought to his attention that the roof of the Zwelihle Primary School in Kwa-Nokuthula in Hermanus is falling apart; if so, what steps has his department taken to address this problem; if not, what does he intend doing about this situation?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you Mr Speaker and thank you to Mr Stali. It has been brought to my department's attention that the roof of the Zwelele Primary School in Qwanakutu has been – well we do not believe it is falling apart - is not in good condition. I am sorry to inform the hon member Mr Stali that there is another problem in that we had appointed contractors, the contractors failed on us and we are have to appoint a second set of contractors. That will be completed in the next week and then the work will be undertaken.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Stali follow-up?

Mr Z C STALI: **isiXhosa:** Ingaba umphatiswa unolwazi ukuba le roof iya yachaphazela ...

The SPEAKER: umlinde kancinci.. Hon..can you ...U qale i question yakho please.

Mr Z C STALI: Bendifuna ukwazi ukuba ingaba unalo na ulwazi lokuthi le roof ingasebenzi iminyaka emithathu iye yachaphazela isikolo

seComputer singakwazi ukusebenza?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Speaker, the question is whether I am aware that it has been in that state for three years. No I am not. That information would come through Education to us. We carry out a routine inspection but that does not follow that we will pick up a problem as soon as it occurs.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Stali?

Mr Z C STALI: **isiXhosa:** Ingaba unolwazi ukubana le roof ineminyaka emithathathu yanakala?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: That is exactly the same as the previous question and my answer has to be exactly the same. No I was not aware of that, if it is indeed the case.

Question 6 withdrawn.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister Grant, question number 7.

Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Speaker, I apologise on behalf of Minister Grant. He is at a Minmec meeting.

The SPEAKER: Thanks. As questions 7 and 8 are addressed to Minister Grant, we will just withdraw them. Minister Winde, question number 9?

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, if I may address you on that last ruling? Once things are on the question paper they are the property of the House. The MEC is expected to come and answer the question.

The SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip?

Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Speaker, I informed the programming authority meeting that Minister Grant will be at a Minmec meeting and he has contacted the Members

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, if I can address you on that? What is the arrangement that has been made so the House can have the answers to those questions?

Ms A ROSSOUW: The arrangement is that it will be dealt with at the next sitting.

The SPEAKER: Order! I think there is an arrangement, a decision that has been taken in this House that if a Minister is not in the House due to other business purposes or meetings the question will stand over to the next sitting.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, if I can address you on that? There is a difference between it standing over and what you said which is to withdraw the question.

The SPEAKER: The questions will stand over, thank you very much. We now proceed to question number 9.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Does that apply to all his questions?

The SPEAKER: Not to all the questions hon member Mr Skwatsha.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Of Minister Grant.

The SPEAKER: Yes to all

Mr M SKWATSHA: Is your ruling that you withdraw them?

Ms A ROSSOUW: No

The SPEAKER: Can you take your seat hon member Mr Skwatsha. I have said the questions to the Minister will stand over. Hon Minister Winde, over to you.

Questions 7 and 8 standing over.

Design Indaba and Cape Town World Design Capital 2014: support to

9. Mr E J von Brandis asked the Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism:

Whether any financial and/or other support is provided to the (a) Design Indaba and (b) Cape Town World Design Capital 2014; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. In response to the hon member Mr von Brandis' question: (a) Over the next three years the Western Cape Government has allocated R750 000, R800 000 and R750 000 respectively to the Design Indaba through its various departments and public entities. We support this event as it contributes revenue and jobs to our economy. (b) My department, the Department of Economic Development and Tourism, does not fund the Cape Town World Design Capital as it is a City of Cape Town initiative.

However, the department is involved in a strategic initiatives directive providing strategic support to the World Design Capital 2014 and we did so in the bidding process. In addition, it is financially supporting the Cape Craft and Design Institute in the development of the Western Cape Design Strategy and projects flowing from this strategy will be submitted to the

World Design Capital 2014 as possible projects to be showcased during 2014.

Furthermore, the Department of Economic Development and Tourism through, its public entity Wesgro, provided non-financial support to the Cape Town World Design Capital, this included PR and support at tourism platforms like ITB in Berlin. We have also put together a transversal team on which the Western Cape Government departments are represented. This body is in the process of identifying appropriate projects and processes to contribute towards the World Design Capital 2014.

THE SPEAKER: Thank you. next question. Minister Carlisle question number 10 over to you.

Road Traffic Management Corporation

10. Mr E J von Brandis asked Minister of Transport and Public

Works:

- (a) What is the current situation with regard to the Road Traffic Management Corporation (b) what impact does this situation have on the Western Cape?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. The hon member Mr von Brandis asked what the current situation with regard to the Road Traffic Management Corporation is. My

reply is as follows:

- (a) At a meeting of shareholders of the RTMC held in Cape Town on the 15th February 2013 a paper was put to shareholders reviewing the history of the RTMC since its inception.

Inter alia, this paper noted that the significant corruption that had occurred in the Corporation, the fact that it was no longer a going concern and was incurring new debt at the rate of 200 million a year, that no CEO had been appointed for the previous three years and that there was no board of directors. In addition, the requirement that shareholders meet quarterly had never been met and the few meetings that had been held were seldom *quorate*.

Shareholders were presented hon member Mr van Brandis with three options on the way forward and the shareholders unanimously chose the option to dissolve the RTMC and passed a resolution to that effect. I made mention to him that that is an objective to which I had been working for four years.

A process for the formal dissolution of the RTMC has been drawn up and will include national Cabinet approval and significant amendments to a number of Acts of Parliament. The process is envisaged to take 18 to 24 months.

(b) The impact on the Western Cape will be minimal. The RTMC has been largely dysfunctional and has played almost no role in road traffic management and road safety in the province. However, important powers were transferred from the provinces to the RTMC some years ago and in the interests of road safety it is essential and urgent that these be returned, and I have approached the national Minister of Transport in that regard.

The SPEAKER: Any follow up? Next question. Minister Fritz, question number 11 over to you.

Chrysalis Academy : youth development

11. Ms N P Magwaza asked the Minister of Social Development:

What recourses were provided to the Chrysalis Academy in terms of youth development during the period 2011 to 2012?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and I want to thank the hon member Ms Magwaza for the question. The Department of Social Development spent the following amounts on the following youth programmes during 2011/2012 financial year. For the Chrysalis Academy, and as you heard from the Premier, the Chrysalis Academy is an incredibly important academy for the Western Cape. In respect of the type of programmes and youth skills development we do and

the provision of reputed services, and this at a salary level for a social worker, the amount for the year was R155 467. This lady provided therapy for 350 youths at the Academy. I can tell you that this woman is doing phenomenal work.

In respect of the second type, 10 youth leadership development camps and the upgrade of part of Wolwekloof, the amount came to R804 894 for the 10 leadership camps for youth in that area.

The SPEAKER: No follow-up? Next question Minister Fritz, question number 12.

Life Link

12. Ms N P Magwaza asked the Minister of Social Development:

Whether Life Link is in operation; if not, what other alternative measures are in place; if so, what are the relevant details in this regard?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I once again want to thank the hon member Ms Magwaza for the question. The Department of Social Development is using Live Link for enterprise content management - the ECM.

The Live Link product was introduced in about 2005 to replace the

previous electronic document management system. In 2009 the organisation Blue Print which was approved by the provincial Cabinet confirmed Live Link as the preferred ECM product for the province.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Magwaza?

Ms N P MAGWAZA: I just want to check hon Minister. Is this programme in progress? Is it in operation or do you have an alternative programme in action?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The system is operational and it currently has 1 132 registered users. It is currently used for information management, including the sharing and safeguarding of documents. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Minister van Rensburg, question number 13, over to you.

Malting Barley

13. Mr M C Walters asked the Minister of Agriculture:

(a) What is the annual consumption of malting barley, expressed in tonnage, by the beer industry in South Africa, (b) what portion of this quantity comes from (i) the Western Cape and (ii) other provinces, (c)(i) what portion is imported from abroad and (ii) from what country or countries does the imported malting barley come,

and (d) what is the potential for the expansion of the production of malting barley in the Western Cape in the light of production targets set by beer breweries?

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Baie dankie, mnr die Speaker. Die tienjaarlikse gemiddelde gebruik van moutgars is plus minus 275 000 ton. Die deel van die nasionale kommersiële verbruik wat van die Wes-Kaap afkomstig is, is tussen 160 000 en 190 000 ton, afhangende van die kwaliteit. Dit verteenwoordig 65% van die nasionale kommersiële verbruik van moutgars. Die nasionale kommersiële verbruik afkomstig van die res van Suid-Afrika is gemiddeld 15%, hoofsaaklik vanaf die Noord-Kaap, Vrystaat en die Noord-Wes Provinsie. Tussen 50 en 70 000 ton word jaarliks ingevoer, hoofsaaklik van Kanada, Australië, en mees onlangs ook van Argentinië. Vroer het ons heelwat van die Verenigde Koninkryk en Frankryk ingevoer, maar dit is deesdae baie minder belangrik. As ons kyk of ons kan uitbrei in die Wes-Kaap, lyk dit vir ons of die moontlikheid beperk is, maar daar is wel uitbreidings moontlikhede in die besproeiingsgebiede.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Any follow-up? We then move to the next question.

Taxi violence: deaths

14. Mr M Skwatsha asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

How many people were killed as a result of taxi violence in the Western Cape from the beginning of 2013 up to the latest specified date for which information is available?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. This question in a sense is almost a carry on from the interpellation that we had earlier. Let me say that the figure has changed since the answer was prepared. In February Mr Mkaliso from Bloekombos and Mr Pawule from BELTA were murdered. We are not sure what the reasons were but certainly it was around this conflict within those three associations. Mr Mdedela from Iona CATA was murdered on the 11th April. Jokanzi I am sure you know from Delft Unity was murdered on the 12th April. It is believed that his killers may have been Mr Nglelu and Mr Moytjana who were both shot to death in Delft the following day on the 13th April. Mr Menzi who had been with those two men during the day in which they were shot, was himself shot at their funeral on Saturday the 20th April.

We have a difficult situation here hon member Mr Skwatsha and I hope this list will not grow.

The SPEAKER: Any follow up? Hon member Mr Skwatsha?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Thank you, Mr Speaker. We really have a difficult situation. Have there been any arrests in this regard?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I am very pleased and I hope the hon Minister of Community Safety will take note of this. There have been no arrests. I am sorry I should have mentioned that there have been no arrests whatsoever in this matter. In some of the murders last year which relate to this, even when the taxi industry were able to point out the murderers who were then taken into custody, two alleged murderers have apparently been released and the case against them does not appear to be going forward. I will, once we have all of this together, be forwarding it to the Department of Community Safety. But that is a very worrying aspect.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes. Councillor Giempies by the way is a DA councillor.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Yes, I have just discovered that.

The SPEAKER: Order! We now proceed to the next question. That is question number 15. Order! Order hon members! Minister Meyer, over to you.

Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport : visits to municipalities

15. Ms J Witbooi asked the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:

(a) How many visits were undertaken by his department to municipalities in the Western Cape in the past financial year and (b) what (i) was the purpose and (ii) were the total costs to his department of these visits?

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, Mr Speaker. One of the things the Premier has implemented is evidence-based practice and she has asked me not only to transfer money to municipalities but to see what happened to these monies once it has been transferred to the various municipalities.

Mr Speaker, six out of the 12 functions listed in Schedule 2, the exclusive provincial legislative competence has applicability to the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport.

That is the context of this answer. The purpose of the visits to these

municipalities are:

Firstly, in Program 1; to do asset verification, to implement a comprehensive rule or development program, to do provincial transversal strategic projects and also to implement a provincial gang prevention strategy through sport and culture in liaison with the Minister of Community Safety and the Minister of Social Development.

There are visits and various meetings to municipalities relating to the minstrels, various meetings regarding the Jandri development, various meetings of officials regarding the Cape Winelands Performing Arts Initiative, meetings with officials and municipalities regarding the Eden Drama Festival, various meetings regarding the initiation project and visits to the initiation forums across the Western Cape.

There was also the Arts Week Festival taken out to the rural areas together with Artscape, various meetings relating to the Heritage Resource Management in terms of workshops on the delegation of powers to Heritage Resource Agencies, issuing of permits, and the declaration of provincial heritage sites.

Mr Speaker, there are meetings and visits to municipalities by my department in terms of the delivery of library material, monitoring of expenditure of allocated funds by B3 municipalities on the issue of the

unfunded mandates. We transfer the money and look at what happens to the money in terms of these particular oversight visits. Quarterly visits are undertaken by my unit in terms of library services to the various libraries.

There are also inspections and advice on the expenditure of funds, ensuring that the record systems, policies, procedures and processes are properly implemented in governmental bodies. In respect of library services infrastructure, when we build a library we go and visit these libraries to see that they are well maintained and well stocked.

In addition, we also take part, as all the other departments here in this Western Cape Government, in the various meetings in terms of municipalities as part of the IDP processes. We also take part in the initiative of Minister Bredell and Minister Winde in terms of the Local Government MTEC meetings. We also visit these institutions and municipalities, in particular when we signed the memorandum of agreement in terms of the transfer payments, especially in terms of projects but also in terms of library services.

We have a Youth Development Against Violence through sport programmes together with the two other Ministries I have already mentioned. Also, Mr Speaker, in terms of the transfer of funding to municipalities in terms of the MIC funding, we are now also conducting regular visits to make sure that the MIC funding allocated for sport

infrastructure is indeed spent on sport infrastructure as determined by a national circular.

Mr Speaker, we also have spent some money in terms of the upgrade of facilities in Saldanha and in Oudtshoorn. Regular visits are also undertaken to these particular areas. In addition, the Western Cape is the only provincial government that transfers money to the various sport federations within one month after the start of the financial year and I completed that yesterday in Stellenbosch.

We are also transferring money to the Federation for Sport Festivals and to major sport events. We pay visits to these particular events to make sure that the money is indeed spent on these various activities for which we have signed memorandums of agreements. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Ms Witbooi, follow-up?

Me J WITBOOI: Mnr die Speaker, baie dankie. Die LUR het net die middelste gedeelte van die vraag wat gevra is, beantwoord. Hy het nie vir my gesê hoeveel besoeke hy gedoen het nie, en hy het ook nie vir my gesê wat dit die departement gekos het nie, ek vra dus daardie twee vrae weer.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Mr Speaker, there were more than 2000 visits in this financial year in terms of the

question that was put to me. 1046 visits were undertaken in respect of the library component especially in terms of the delivery of library material to public libraries in 25 municipalities and to establish whether there is a need for better stock control, professional guidance and delivery. Forty-four of these visits were monitoring visits, especially in terms of the M&E reports for vulnerable libraries. 75 of these visits were undertaken in terms of the conditional grants in terms of the M&E reports.

About 20 inspections were done by the Western Cape Records and Archives teams. I have specifically requested to be informed about the main expenditure because that was a key question. The following can be regarded as the main cost-drivers for determining the cost of visits to the municipalities, which is normally the salaries of staff, the overtime, the accommodation, the catering, the daily allowance and the GG transport.

Given the total number of visits it was not possible for my department to determine the exact cost of all visits to municipalities as the department does not possess a system to determine the cost, as it is not a requirement to report on it separately in the system.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Next question is number 16.

Cape Institute for Agricultural Training: financial aid to students

16. Ms E Prins asked the Minister of Agriculture:

(a) How many previously disadvantaged students that are currently studying at the Cape Institute for Agricultural Training get financial aid from (i) the state and (ii) private institutions and (b) in respect of what date is this information furnished?

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Baie dankie, mnr die Speaker. 56 studente word deur die staat gehelp, en 30 privaat. Die syfers is ten opsigte van die 2012/2013 finansiële jaar.

The SPEAKER: Any Follow-up? None. Agb lid Me Prins?

Me E PRINS: Dankie vir die agb Minister vir die antwoord. Mnr die Speaker, ek wil graag weet of die studente ten volle gesubsidieer word wat die subsidies ontvang en die rede hoekom ek vra, en daar word in die report genoem

The SPEAKER: Order! You do not have to give a reason for that; you just ask the question hon member Ms Prins. Minister van Rensburg?

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: mnr die Speaker, dit is 'n ander vraag en ek het nie die ...

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon members.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Ek het nie die inligting by my nie maar, as die agb lid Me Prins dit weer op die Ordelys plaas, sal ek sorg dat ek dit by my het.

The SPEAKER: Any follow-up? None. Question number 17. Hhon Minister Bredell over to you.

Goedverwacht, Wittewater and Wupperthal : provision of services

17. Ms A Rossouw asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

Whether his department is providing any services to the communities of Goedverwacht, Wittewater, Wupperthal; if not, what role does his department play to ensure that sustainable services are in fact provided to these communities; if so, what services are provided to these communities by his department?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING. OMGEWINGSACE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Speaker, dankie vir die vraag. My departement verskaf geen dienste aan die gemeenskap van Goedverwacht, Wittewater of Wupperthal nie. Ek is bewus daarvan dat die gebrek aan basiese dienste veral water, vullisverwydering en by tye elektrisiteit, 'n uitdaging is wat baie van hierdie gemeenskappe nadelig tref. In hierdie geval is dit egter baie moeilik vir Bergrivier Munisipaliteit en Cederberg Munisipaliteit om dienste op 'n volhoubare basis te lewer vir die

volgende redes.

Die grond is in besit van die Morawiese Kerk en beide die kerk sowel as die munisipaliteit het 'n gedeelde verantwoordelikheid om die behoeftes van die gemeenskap op 'n volhoubare wyse aan te spreek.

Tweedens, die munisipaliteit moet 'n kontrak vir dienste met die Morawiese kerk sluit, wat op sy beurt die koste van die diens van die gemeenskap moet verhaal. Daar is dus 'n gedeelde verantwoordelikheid op die kerk en die munisipaliteit om te verseker dat diegene wat dit kan bekostig, betaal vir die munisipale dienste wat gelewer word. Die Morawiese Kerk en die departement van landelike ontwikkeling en grondsake het historiese ooreenkomste wat die transformasieproses reguleer, maar dit word nie geïmplementeer nie. Oor die afgelope jaar en 'n half het my departement regstegniese advies ten opsigte van die diensleweringuitdagings hierbo ingewin.

Ons het ook regsadvies aan die munisipaliteit en die gemeenskap verskaf. Onlangs, op 6 Maart 2013, het my departement in 'n poging om onmiddellike watertekorte op Wittewater aan te spreek, maar ook om vir 'n volhoubare langtermynoplossing te beplan, met die munisipale bestuurder van die Bergrivier Munisipaliteit vergader. Hierdie vergadering is opgevolg met 'n sessie tussen verteenwoordigers van die Morawiese Kerk, die Bergrivier- munisipaliteit wat deur die Uitvoerende Burgemeester en

die wyksraad verteenwoordig was, en deur my departement gefasiliteer is. Die partye is daartoe verbind om hierdie uitdaging saam aan te spreek. Dankie.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Question number 19. Minister Fritz, over to you.

Problems at St Michaels Home

18. Ms A J du Toit Marais asked the Minister of Social

Development:

What are the relevant circumstances surrounding the problems currently experienced at the St Michaels Home for abused teenage girls in Plumstead?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Mr Speaker and thanks to the hon member Ms Marais for asking the question. St Michaels Home is a registered child and youth care facility which accommodates 25 girls between the ages of 12 and 18 who have been found in need of care and protection in terms of the Childrens Act.

Allegations of alleged sexual abuse were brought to our attention on the 22nd February 2013. I want to say one of the perpetrators was another child, one of the children in the centre. An investigation was immediately put in place the very same day. The recommendations and findings of that

report were discussed with the organisation and the girl was immediately moved to a higher care security facility.

The SPEAKER: Any follow-up questions? None. Next question. Minister Fritz, over to you.

Mitchells Plain pilot project

19. Ms A J du Toit Marais asked the Minister of Social Development:

What is the expected outcome of the Mitchells Plain pilot project?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Speaker, thank you and once again to the hon member Ms Marais. In light of the recent Medical Research Council's research around drug and alcohol use among learners in Grades 8 to 10, I am launching a pilot project with immediate effect with social workers who have been trained in substance abuse treatment. We can now offer initial screening intervention and even treatment at six local offices in the metro south region which includes Mitchell's Plain, Nyanga, Gugulethu, Spes Bona – Mr Stali, Spes Bona is included - Athlone office – and Wynberg.

We will also include the Hout Bay Treatment Centre and the Steenberg project that we are busy with. I also have an agreement with Minister Botha to extend that very service immediately as a pilot project to Atlantis,

as I think the people in that area are experiencing tremendous trauma at the moment.

This will alleviate the burden on some of our NGOs and service providers offering substance abuse treatment. Sometimes it is not necessary hon members for someone to be admitted to a residential facility. The treatment can be done on an outpatient basis at a local office. If needs be the client can be referred to a treatment facility for further assistance and in this way services can be brought even closer to the people who need it most hon members.

The SPEAKER: Minister Plato, question number 20 over to you.

Necklacing in Khayelitsha

20. Mr M Ncedana asked the Minister of Community Safety:

- (1) (a) What steps are being taken by his department about the continuing incidents of necklacing taking place in Khayelitsha and (b) what prior interventions have been undertaken by his department to curb this phenomenon?
- (2) Whether these prior interventions have made any difference to the incidents of necklacing; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Speaker, thank you very much. I visit the Khayelitsha area on a regular basis and I have had meetings and conversations with most of the local organisations and community leaders about the incidents of necklacing and other vigilante killings in the area.

During the visits I asked the residents and the communities to refrain from incidents of vigilantism and to become more actively involved in community policing structures such as neighbourhood watches. Mr Speaker, the local CPF are engaging the civil structures and street committees in a campaign to prevent vigilante incidents.

Mr Speaker, it is furthermore common cause that the Commission of Enquiry into allegations of police inefficiency in Khayelitsha and of the breakdown in the relations between the community and the police in Khayelitsha was established on 24 August 2012 by the Premier in terms of the provisions of section 206(5) of the Constitution.

Mr Speaker, it is widely believed that the vigilante killings are as a result of a breakdown of trust and relations between the police and Khayelitsha residents who have criticised the police for a failure to investigate criminal cases thoroughly. The Social Justice Coalition formally requested the Premier to institute a Commission of Enquiry into the matter. The SJC holds that this breakdown in trust is the reason for increasing violent

vigilante action against suspected criminals taking place in the township. It is believed that residents of Khayelitsha have taken the law into their own hands to exact mob justice because they have no faith in the ability of the police to undertake thorough investigations, make arrests or render the requisite assistance to secure convictions in reported criminal cases.

The task team report stated that the three stations in Khayelitsha collectively recorded 78 incidents between April 2011 and June last year relating to what it called “bundu courts”.

Numerous written complaints were submitted by the SJC to the Western Cape Government pertaining to alleged police inefficiency in Khayelitsha and a breakdown in relations. Hence the department, through the Office of the Premier, facilitated the establishment of the Commission of Enquiry into allegations of police inefficiency and a breakdown in relations.

In addition, a safety summit was held in Khayelitsha in November 2011 involving many stakeholders to discuss the issue of crime and vigilantism. A stakeholder forum was established as an outcome of this summit and which continues to operate with its last meeting held on 20 March of this year.

As the Minister of Community Safety I will continue to engage with the community and I will continue with my 24/7 involvement in addressing

the gang and crime issue in the Western Cape. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Wiley over to you. Follow up?

Mr G M E WILEY: Thank you to the Hon Minister for that response. I wonder could he tell me whether in his working in the community, has there been any indication that if this Commission of Enquiry had gone ahead that it would have made any impression on his level of information in this matter?

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Speaker, thank you very much. The work of the Commission of Enquiry, as you all are aware, has been delayed due to court challenges initiated by the national Minister of Police. Although the first High Court application of the national Minister against the establishment of the Khayelitsha Commission of Enquiry was rejected with costs by the Western Cape High Court, the national Minister has now lodged an appeal against that decision with the Constitutional Court.

In order to reduce costs the Commission of Enquiry has, after consultation with various role players, decided to postpone public hearings until after

the matter is decided by the Constitutional Court later this year.

Mr Speaker, I wish to remind hon member Mr Wiley that the national Minister of Police is the biggest obstacle in addressing vigilantism by his legal challenge to the Khayelitsha Commission of Enquiry. This challenge means it has now had to postpone its public hearings until the Constitutional Court hearing later this year.

The Commission of Enquiry is the strongest action that the province could take within our constitutional oversight mandate to help arrive at a solution to this issue. The legal challenge and the SAPS' uncooperative attitude are delaying progress towards curbing these type of incidents. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Stali, over to you.

Mr C STALI: Somlomo ingaba umphathiswa uzama ukuthi unobangela wobana kubulawe abantu nge necklace eKhayelitsha kungenxa yekhomission engakhange ithathe inxaxheba?

The SPEAKER: Do you follow that question?

Mr C STALI: khawu- khawu phinde mhlekazi khange awubambe kakuhle.

MR C STALI: Ndifuna ukuqonda into yo kubana ingaba uzama ukusixelela apha endlini, intwe'bangele intobana abantu babulawe nge necklace eKhayelitsha?

Ingaba uzama ukusixelela intobana owona nobangela intobana abantu bade basebenzise iNecklace, okanye kusweleke abantu ngeNecklace as umbuzo esitsho apha kungenxa yekhomision engakhange ithathe inxaxheba na?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Speaker, we want to get to the root cause of the problem. One of the ways of getting to the root cause is to engage with the community and with all the structures in Khayelitsha. We have done that but the problem is as yet not resolved. Now we want to lift that to the next level and the next level is the Commission so that the community can speak out and give us their reasons why not. The police, with the national Minister of Police, are not happy with that and that is why they are taking us to court

The SPEAKER: This is your last chance hon member Mr Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you. Hon Minister, I wonder if you could confirm, if the reason why the Commission was called was because the community, both individuals and CBOs, came to you saying that they had lost confidence in the police and therefore the community was taking the law into their own hands?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Speaker, I was in Khayelitsha for the whole of Saturday morning with the Makhaza community. I think if I am not mistaken ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon members. Order!

[Interjections]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The latest vigilante killing took place in Makhaza. I addressed the residents of Makhaza ...

The SPEAKER: Order hon members!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: It was a message that they have no faith in SAPS, they have no faith in the justice system and that we need to address that problem. This is exactly what we are trying to do through the establishment of the Commission.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Question number 21. [Interjections.] – No.

That was the last chance for this question. Question number 21. Hon Minister Botha, over to you.

Gugulethu Day Hospital : sewerage drain

20. Mr A M Figlan asked the Minister of Health:

- (1) Whether it has been brought to his attention that there is a sewerage drain in the middle of the waiting room at the Gugulethu Day Hospital and that this drain really smells bad, especially when it is hot; if so, (1) what are the relevant details in this regard and (b) what steps have been taken to address this problem; if not,
- (2) Whether he will investigate the matter and report back to the House about his findings; if not; why not; if so, when;
- (3) Whether there are any plans for further development at this day hospital; if so, (a) what are the time frames in respect of this development and (b) what are the further relevant details in this regard?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, yes the department is aware of the sewerage drain under the waiting room at the Gugulethu Day Hospital. The preparation work has been completed, the sewerage pipeline at the emergency entrance is exposed indicating the hole in the pipeline at the Y junction.

I have arranged for the repairs to be done within the next seven days. The matter was investigated and it was found that the main sewerage line requires an extra manhole on the outside of the building to ensure better flow. There are plans in the pipeline – that is the planning pipeline and not the sewerage pipeline – to relocate the existing clinic. We are currently

investigating a possible site which has been identified by Public Works. The plan is to replace the current building in the next five years.

I want to thank the member for asking this question Mr Speaker. I was not aware of this problem. If it was not for the question I would not have known of it. It is unacceptable and it will be completed within the next seven days.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, the hon Minister says he was not aware of this problem. Does that mean in spite of the Madontsela report, the Minister has not taken time to monitor the situation at the Gugulethu Day Hospital?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: There is a difference, Mr Speaker, in what I was aware of or not. I was aware of the drain which went through the building but I was not aware that the pipes on the outside had a hole which is an unacceptable condition. The pipeline underneath the facility is sealed off.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Just in terms of health standards, is it proper to build

a drain in the middle of waiting room?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, the drain is not in the waiting room. It is piping that goes underneath the building, and it is properly sealed. There is no problem with that in terms of building standards, conditions and plans. The problem is however, and I agree with the hon member Mr Skwatsha that it is unacceptable, is a broken pipe on the outside at the Y junction causing an unpleasant odour and an unhealthy condition.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha?

Mr M SKWATSHA: When do you think that this matter will be sorted out?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Within seven days as I have mentioned Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Last chance hon member Skwatsha?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Seven days from when?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I became aware of this problem today when the reply to this question was given to me about the broken sewerage

pipe. I became aware of the broken sewerage pipe today. I arranged, which is not part of the reply here, that it will be fixed within seven days. I have also arranged for someone to visit the site to ensure and report back to me that it is fixed after the seven day period.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Botha. That is the end of the question time. The outstanding replies will be printed in Hansard. Questions to the Premier without notice. Hon member Ms Brown over to you.

QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE:

Ms L BROWN: Mr Speaker, the Premier responded to me in a written reply that there were certain people in excess in her department. I would like the hon Premier to tell this House what the reasons are that of the 13 people who are in excess in her department 12 are black and one is white and why those people cannot be placed?

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, I am not doing the matching and placing. That is being done by the Corporate Services Centre and it is crucially important that they find the right places to match individuals.

The reason is that we are mainstreaming many of the projects that existed in separate entities, very much as I explained around women and children and people with disabilities and human rights. All important entities and desks that used to be in the Premier's department are now being mainstreamed and people are being matched and placed according to the skills that are required. That is the reason why people were in excess in the Premier's department.

Mr SPEAKER: Any follow up hon member Ms Brown?

Ms L BROWN: Mr Speaker, of these 12 black staff, graduates I assume, I would like to know what the Premier's plan is for them. Before the modernisation process the hon Premier said that she was not going to fire anybody in the modernisation process. What is the hon Premier going to do with 12 graduates who are also black?

The PREMIER: No one has been fired have they, Mr Speaker? They are there and the point is that when you decide to mainstream a function in routine work such as women and children, human rights and people with disabilities, those functions get incorporated into what a department is already doing.

I personally do not fill posts unless those posts are linked to my term of office. So I do not personally fill posts. I do not personally declare

individuals in excess, ever, and I do not personally transfer people to other posts. That is why we have an independent professional human resources department. That is their job and I trust they are doing it and the people involved have not been put out of their jobs. That is the important point.

The national Minister of Social Development wants us to now start an older person's desk as well and I argued very strongly to the President that it was the wrong way to go. The care for older persons has to be mainstreamed and every single department from Education to Health and everything else needs to take the needs of older persons very seriously indeed. They should not be put in a separate little ghetto. We are trying to un-ghettowise all of these services and mainstream them and that has been some of the reasons for the restructuring.

The SPEAKER: This is your last chance hon member Ms Brown.

Ms L BROWN: The hon Premier is politically responsible for these departments. I would really like to ask if there is a problem in that of the 13 people who are in excess, 12 of them are black, meaning African, coloured and Indian? Is there a process that you will be able to deal with the 12 people who are in excess?

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, it is very interesting that the hon Leader of the Opposition points to there only being 12 in excess. There are 80 000

staff members in the Western Cape and indeed no one has lost their jobs through the modernisation programme.

Modernisation obviously is going to involve making sure that all issues are addressed in the line functions wherever possible with the coordinating role of the human resources department. That is what is currently happening and I am sure that all of the people will be placed appropriately without my interference.

I do not believe that, except in posts which are linked to my term of office, I should have any role in right sizing, in moving, in transferring, in declaring people in excess or by putting them in other posts. I do not do that because I believe there should be a firewall between the professional filling of posts and political roles of the Premier and other Ministers.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Wiley, over to you.
Question to the Premier without notice. Over to you.

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Speaker, does the hon Premier agree that the Cosatu supported SADTU strike yesterday which saw hundreds of teachers out in the street during school time was an injustice to all those poor schoolchildren who legally are trying to get a quality education?

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, that protest was a disgrace. Even though a

very small fraction of school teachers in the province participated, at only about 3% of schools as I understand it, most of those schools are in the most disadvantaged areas of our province. It was those teachers who often do not work after 2 o'clock in the afternoon [Interjections.] I said many of whom do not work after 2pm in the afternoon decided to go on the streets to protest against the national Minister and the national Director-General, depriving children of education for the interests of that small percentage of teachers.

Mr Speaker, the irony was beyond description because those teachers toying during school time not only took some of their pupils with them but they were encouraged to do that by the ANC leader in the City of Cape Town caucus, Tony Ehrenreich, and indeed, those teachers were wearing t-shirts that said "every child deserves a teacher".

Now can you imagine wearing a t-shirt like that on strike ...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mr Ozinsky.

The PREMIER: The children there were mobilised for party political purposes

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mr Ozinsky.

The PREMIER: by a trade union that was very happy to undermine the very profession

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Premier. Order.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky, I have warned you several times and I am not going to that- I will really [Interjections.] Hon Premier, you may continue.

The PREMIER: It was a total disgrace, Mr Speaker, but I want to commend the vast majority of teachers and schools and pupils and parents that continued with the teaching and learning process uninterrupted yesterday. I express my heartfelt condolences for those most disadvantaged pupils who were disadvantaged even further by the ANC and Cosatu yesterday.

Mr M G E WILEY: Hon Premier, thank you for that response. Would you, given your reply, consider taking SADTU and Cosatu to the Human Rights Commission on the grounds of the injustice?

[Interjections.]

The PREMIER: I think that is a very good idea in fact. Mr Speaker, I think that is a very good idea and thank you to the hon member Mr Wiley for giving me that idea. The truth is that the rights of those children to a decent education have been profoundly undermined. While the hon member Mr Wiley has put that idea into my head, the Constitution guarantees the right to basic education and I wonder whether the amount of effort and time which many SADTU teachers put in to their teaching and learning time with school pupils actually meets the basic rights of the Constitution.

We saw Equal Education with a prominent panel of people visiting schools in the Eastern Cape and I have read some of the reports. Mr Speaker, those schools do not come anywhere near the basic rights guaranteed in the Constitution and I think they all need to be taken to the Human Rights Commission.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Stali. Questions to the Premier.

Mr C STALI: Primier kweli phondo lwakho, ulikhokheleyo unenqubo ethi, izothe ebeyi ntathonxaxheba ku wonke wonke, kodwa kungekudala nje sibone abantu abamnyamama ebebe shishina ePhillipi bedudulwa begxotwa abangapha.

Kwekhulu, ebebeshishina phayana ngaphezu kwe minyaka emishumi amathathu. Ingaba le policy niyisebenzisayo ethi kuzokuxhamla wonke umntu ibakhethe kanjani ababantu baphelelwe yindawo yokusebenzela?

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, I think this question refers to the municipal business hive in Philippi. Mr Speaker, that business hive I know has been subject to an interaction for a very, very long time. There are a significant number of businessmen there, and women, who allegedly have not paid rentals for a very long time. There is a lot of demand for space in that business hive by people who would like to pay rentals.

All the people involved, those who do not pay rentals, those who do pay rentals and those who would like to pay rentals, are all black South Africans. To make the business hives run viably and to enable them to really generate business and opportunities for jobs in that area, people have to stick by the rules and have to stick by the contracts that they signed when they were able to move in to those spaces.

I also have enquired from the City about that and that is the answer that I got but I think primarily this question needs to be posed in the Council of Cape Town.

Mr C STALI: Ndimamele kakuhle, eyona ngxaki enoba abantu ibachapazele babe kanti ngoku batyiwa yindlala kungenxa yokuba usithi

baye basalelala ukuhlawula inkonzo.

The SPEAKER : Uthini umbuzo wakho?

Mr C STALI: Ingaba unolwazi ukubana eyona organisation ebeyikhokhelwe lelinye lungu lalombutho ukhokheleyo apha yeyona eye yaba ngunobangela ukube kanti inkonzo azikhange zihlawulwe ebizwa ngokuba Yi PEDI?

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, I am not sure that I quite grasped that but let me try and if I have got the question wrong then the hon member Mr Stali can help me. The hon member Mr Stali's question as I understood it said that people do not pay rent in the business hive because they are poor and was I aware of the fact that people do not pay rent because that organisation was led by somebody in the DA. Is that correct? Is that what you asked me because that is what I understood?

The SPEAKER: No, that is not. Please take your seat hon Premier. Can the hon member Mr Stali then repeat his question to the hon Premier please?

Mr C STALI: What the hon Premier said to me is that those people had to be evicted because some of them have defaulted in terms of paying the rent. I am asking whether she is aware that an organisation called PEDI,

which was in charge of collecting the rent is the one who did not pay the rent to the municipality, is led by one of the leaders in your party?

The PREMIER: Pedi is the Philippi Economic Development Initiative and it is not a DA organisation at all. It is a structure of the City of Cape Town. We apply the distinction between party and state very, very clearly.

The Philippi Economic Development Initiative is the institution in charge of the Philippi business hive as I understand it and it is that institution that has acted against defaulters for not paying their rent. That is the information that I have at my disposal because obviously when I read in the newspaper that this was happening I phoned people at the City and asked them to explain to me what was going on.

This is a City of Cape Town initiative and ... [Interjections.] ... no I was asking them what was happening because I get asked questions here all the time and I am not interfering ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, I ask for information because it is relevant. I ask for information because I do not always rely on what I read in the newspapers and I like to know what the answers are to many of these questions. I do not check on every one of them and I got this answer. I

obviously did not give any instructions to the City of Cape Town. I never do. I just like to know what is going on. Thank you.

The SPEAKER : Last chance hon member Mr Stali.

Mr C STALI: Thank you. Mr Speaker, is the hon Premier aware that more than 100 of these people are sitting at home without anything to eat and the business places that they used to own are now going to be controlled by someone who is not from Philippi? [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, I am not aware of who is going to control that business hive and the stalls of that business hive. All I am aware of from the information that I received from the City is that there have been literally years of negotiations to try and get the stall holders to pay a very modest rental that they were contracted to pay and that they refused to do.

This process went through a very, very long mediation and interaction. What they plan to do with the future of the business hive I am not sure, Mr Speaker, and I am very sorry that there are going to be people without their businesses now. That is precisely why, because I was so worried to read about that, that I phoned up to find out what the background of this issue was and that is where I learnt about this background which I am relaying here today.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ncedana, chance not taken. Hon mem
Ms Marais?

Ms A J du Toit MARAIS: Madam Premier, with reference to the Mfuleni
Disability Project pilot launch, what are the relevant details surrounding
the progress of the project launch?

The PREMIER: Mr Speaker, I have been worried for a very long time
about the number of times in my working in communities that I come
across children with disabilities whose parents are often at their wit's end
about what to do. They do not know where the services are, they often
have no clear diagnosis of what the problem is, they do not know what the
prognosis is and they have not been given the skills to understand the
problem and deal with it.

This has led to some very tragic consequences; of children sometimes
being locked in shacks, children not being referred to the services that are
available for them and various other things. We had an example of a child
with cerebral palsy having terrible burns when he was locked in a shack.
There was another child who was blind and cerebral palsied who was
locked in a shack and his mother was at a shebeen.

I do not sit here and blindly condemn the mother because what must a
single mother do with a child who is that severely disabled with no support

and no access to services. I therefore wanted to try and see if we could identify every person living with that circumstance, either parent or child.

We decided on two pilot areas, Mfuleni and Vredenburg. We put out a call for proposals and the winning tender as I said earlier in answer to a question came from an organisation called uHambo which was started by a woman who, herself, has a very severely disabled child and who has worked for a long time on helping parents and families care for disabled children. She has a huge amount of experience, as does uHambo.

They are working with a range of problems as I mentioned previously like epilepsy and Down's Syndrome. Iris House and many organisations are all working together in this consortium to help us with this severe crisis. We launched in Mfuleni and we are still going to launch in Vredenburg but the projects are already underway Mr Speaker.

A report that I got back today shocked me because in the few weeks that they have been working there they have already identified 3000 people, about 1600 in Mfuleni and 1400 in Vredenburg, children with disabilities and people with disabilities. This shows what an extraordinary challenge this is.

I am not sure, because I would like to see the breakdown and have proper feedback, that these people may already be receiving services and they

may already be referred to the right place. I want to ensure that because there is nothing more challenging for a family, especially a family living in poverty, than to deal with a challenge of serious disability without adequate support and that is the issue that I am trying to address Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Any follow up hon member Ms Marais?

Ms A J du Toit MARAIS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Thank you, Madam Premier for the answer. I just want to know if the projects in Vredenburg and Mfuleni will be rolled out in a sustainable manner in other areas of the Western Cape?

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: That is part of what we are going to have to see through this pilot project because it is taking a lot of resources and a lot of person power to do this. I got a fright when I saw how many people have been identified. As I say I want to seek out as many of them as possible. They may already be in services, they may already be referred to the right places, they may already be supported.

I want to look at these two pilots to see what the implications of this are but certainly I do not think it is in any way viable for poor people to be left

without support. There was one family we found with six children, three of whom are seriously disabled. Very serious and it is a horrific thing and I do not know why the hon member Ms Hani is laughing at that ...

Mr M MAGAXA: It is because your budget does not talk to that.

The SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The PREMIER: Our budget does talk to that.

[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa, order!

[Interjection.]

The PREMIER: There are other wonderful projects that we are doing, for example, we learnt that in many contexts where deaf children wear hearing aids they often cannot use their hearing aids because they cannot afford the batteries. They will hear for a short time everyday and then switch the battery off to conserve it.

We, in partnership with an international company, have started a job creation project for deaf people from the National Institute of the Deaf to build solar powered battery chargers, which will change people's lives. So

there are these different projects that arise out of this kind of initiative. People with disabilities are a key priority of mine and I want to work on that more and more.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Order! Hon members last question. Order! Order! [Interjections.] Hon members. Hon Magaxa, Order! That was the last question to the Premier without notice. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We now go over to party statements. I see the DA?

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, in the past month the Western Cape has seen more than 20 000 regional and international visitors arrive for events being hosted in and around the province. Events such as the Cape Epic and Design Indaba are two that draw local and international visitors to the province annually.

Conferences and events remain important to the tourism strategy of the province. Cape Town will be the design capital of the world in 2014, another opportunity for the province to show off its business and leisure potential.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in the first half of 2012 the Western Cape welcomed almost 700 000 tourists, an increase of 0.5% from 2011. The number of visitors to the country has seen a steady increase and it ranks 64th out of 140 in the 2013 World Economic Forum's travel and competitiveness index. The province is one of the three most visited regions of South Africa and tourism accounts for 10% of our GDP.

South Africa's recent hosting of the Brics Summit highlights our connection to the potential of these nations' growing number of visitors. It must be noted that tourist arrival growth from these nations is now beginning to outnumber our traditional visiting countries. While the province attracts a healthy number of local visitors, it must focus on attracting and investing in new tourist markets to further grow the industry.

Mr Deputy Speaker, it is crucial that we take advantage of growing international tourism, especially from our Brics partners and expanding the hosting of events and conferences. Growth in both these areas will have a measurable effect on job creation and our local economies. The DA commends Wesgro for taking the necessary steps to better capture these emerging tourist markets. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The ANC, hon member Ms Brown?

Ms L BROWN: Mr Deputy Speaker, the heart of the DA is laid bare by

the Commission of Employment Equity's latest report. This is not surprising because it is the learnt experience of African and coloured staff employed by the DA Provincial Government.

In fact, Mr Deputy Speaker, the excess after the modernisation process probably best exposes the fact that if you are African or coloured or female you will not be viewed as fit for purpose. Of the 13 staff members not placed there are eight African people and three coloureds, six females and five males. Compare this with just one white male not placed. [Interjection.]

This is the DA's real heart. They appointed a white male Cabinet. All the black HODs who leave are replaced by white males or one female. The gaffe of calling citizens of this country, because they are black and they move between provinces, refugees or closing 27 schools in African and coloured areas and so I can go on. [Interjections.]

Is it not a wonder that the DA is trying to delete its apartheid roots and fabricate a new history and a new tradition, one it never had. As you airbrush out Tony Leon you also airbrush out the number of members in this House who during apartheid were deputy generals of the SADF, paratroopers, those who served in the apartheid army who massacred our people, tortured and detained them without a trial. They sit in this House today in your party. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms L BROWN: Do not try and rewrite history.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, the hon member Mr Wiley!

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, is the hon member Ms Brown accusing any member of this House of murder?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That same thought crossed my mind. Order! Order! [Interjections.] A point of order was raised. Will the hon member Mr Wiley repeat his point of order please?

Mr M G E WILEY: Did the hon member Ms Brown in saying that members massacred South Africans, accuse any member of murder?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Brown, did you refer to any specific member in this House as being a party to murder?

Ms L BROWN: Not at all. Not at all.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms L BROWN: I spoke in the generic about it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That disposes of that point of order. [Interjection.] Order! Hon members, if I am busy giving a ruling then the House is quite. Hon member Mr Ozinsky, I am looking at you specifically now. When I am giving a ruling I expect the House to be quiet, and you hon Minister Carlisle.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, to address you on that because I noticed that when the hon member Ms Brown was giving her statement that that side of the house was allowed to make as much noise as they like but if people on this side raise one issue then you ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky please. You know the rules. I am trying to be fair. I was talking about giving a ruling from the Chair that is quite different from an ordinary debate. I see the DA?

Mnr J J VISSER: Mnr die Andjunkspeaker, die Wes-Kaap is steeds van die uitsonderings wanneer dit kom by die vestiging van the Municipal Public Accounts Committee (MPAC). Daar is verskeie redes daarvoor wat ek nou nie vandag wil bespreek nie. Wat wel belangrik is dat iets daaromtrent gedoen moet word.

Die agb ministers van Plaaslike Regering en van Finansies is ten gunste

van die skepping van MPAC en ook so die verskeie politieke partye in hierdie Huis, maar ten spyte hiervan, is daar slegs 15 MPACs sover by die 30 Munisipaliteite in die Wes-Kaap gevestig.

Die Ouditeur-Generaal sê aanmekeer vir ons die stand van 'n audit verslag begin by leierskap. Dit bepaal hoe goed of hoe swak hierdie audit verslag is. Dit is dus belangrik dat politieke partye, wat in elk geval die vorming van MPAC voorstaan, dringend met hul strukture oor dié aangeleentheid moet gesels.

SCOLGO neem nou die leiding met 'n vergadering met alle munisipaliteite op 21 Mei 2013 om hierdie saak vir eens en vir altyd uit te sorteer. SCOLGO gaan in die proses beide Ministers van Finansies en van Plaaslike Regering tesame met hul departemente, die O.G. en SALGA betrek by hierdie geleentheid.

Die geleentheid sal benut word om vas te stel hoekom munisipaliteite nie MPAC wil stig nie, hoe hierdie probleem oorbrug kan word en om munisipaliteite te motiveer om wel MPAC te skep en daarmee te werk.

SCOLGO verstaan, saam met die ander rolspelers hierbo genoem, dat dit iets nuut is, dat mense dalk aan die huidige norm wil vashou of dat daar dalk vrees vir die onbekende is. Hierdie aspekte moet deur deurdagte opleiding en sensitisering breedvoerig aangespreek word.

Opleiding wat in die vooruitsig gestel word sou daar opleiding wees vir die besluitnemers oor die proses, sowel as diegene wat op die MPAC's fisies sal dien en die taak van oorsig moet volvoer.

21 Mei 2013 kan dus 'n baie belangrike dag word in die geskiedenis van die Wes-Kaap wanneer dit kom by die oorsigfunksie van Plaaslike Regering, wat kan lei tot skoon oudits in 2014. Die doel is dus om teen die einde van die jaar 'n 100% funksionerende MPAC te hê in elke munisipaliteit in die Wes-Kaap. Ek dank u.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. COPE?

Ms T N BEVU: Mr Deputy Speaker, there have been recent media reports about the Cape Town International Jazz Festival considering its options such as moving to another city due to financial matters. This would be a monumental disaster for the economy and the tourist industry in Cape Town if it were to happen. The Festival attracts about 40 000 visitors to the city of Cape Town. According to the Tshwane University of Technology these people contributed about R475 million to the income of the Western Cape in 2010, and the GDP of the whole country gets spin-offs of about R685 million.

The Festival operates with a budget of about R37 million. Only

R3 million of that comes from the City of Cape Town. The profit margins of the Festival are reported to be around 5% to 7% of the budget. EspAfrika, who are the organisers, say these margins are not acceptable to their shareholders which is why they are considering more viable options.

Our concern as COPE is should this momentous event leave Cape Town it will be a tremendous loss to the city and the province at large, especially our domestic tourist industry. Cape Town Jazz Festival, more especially among black people of our country, has become a means for a gateway to tour the Mother City. As COPE we feel the Western Cape Provincial Government should become one of the sponsors of this event before it is too late and we lose it.

Should the Cape Town Jazz International Festival leave the city most people would say it is because it is something mostly supported by black people thus enforcing the notorious opinion that the DA Government cares only for lily white projects. It would be very difficult to justify the tremendous support given to festivals like Seidenberg and Franschhoek who attract only a fraction of the number that the Cape Town International Jazz Festival attracts. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The ANC?

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Speaker, I am pleased that Minister Grant is not here

today. Why does the Premier Helen Zille not cut her losses on her government's perceived dismal education albatross and fire MEC Donald Grant? Is it because she cannot acknowledge MEC Grant's failures? Or is it because she, as a former education MEC, in fact sits behind all the terrible miseries our children suffer in this Western Cape province and protect MEC Grant?

This Premier's interference in education was demonstrated when she attempted to sway the Western Cape High Court as a desperate last ditch attempt during the interdict hearing against the shameful closure of poor black schools. She suffered a severe and humiliating reprimand from the honourable judges.

Grant then continued on the illogical course to try and pre-empt the judicial review process and in contempt of the independent judiciary processes tried to smuggle an appeal, wasting taxpayers money, to the Constitutional Court through the back door.

For this he suffered another bleeding nose as he lost the gamble and his application was refused. He had to be reminded that due process before the courts first has to proceed.

This is another example of how the DA abuses taxpayers' money in its continued war on the poor blacks, coloured and Africans alike labelled in

this province as refugees. Shame on the DA. The Western Cape deserves better.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The DA, hon member Mr Walters?

Mr M C WALTERS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The ANC is devious. It is dishonest. It utilises state resources for its own political ends and it hides behind other ostensibly independent organisations. The so-called farm workers' crisis was manipulated with the use of many outside demonstrators to create a huge impression of community dissatisfaction.

Why do I say that? The ANC was the unprincipled sinister plotter behind this.

The conspirators met in Robertson in mid-November last year to plan the so-called crisis before it erupted in late November. The surrogates used by the ANC were BAWSI led by Nosey Pieterse, an organisation with minimal support among farm workers, and COSATU with its shallow but vocal Western Cape leader, Tony Ehrenreich.

Who was the ANC leader who channelled government funds to these surrogate organisations? The controversial Minister of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, Tina Joemat-Pettersen, who has excelled in

abnormal public expenditure on her own travels and ANC support. She seems to have little grasp of the fact that public funds are sacrosanct and cannot be utilised for political purposes.

Her transfer of R4.1 million of departmental funds to Nosey Pieterse's organisation in mid-October prior to the demonstrations funded BAWSI's involvement, provided T-shirts, the bussing in of demonstrators and so-called administrative purposes.

The Minister's provision of R10 million for food parcels for demonstrators was also in conflict with budgetary principles and she needs to explain what was done with the considerable residue which must have resulted. These transfers contributed to the loss of life and destruction of infrastructure which occurred.

The ANC remains a party which cannot be trusted by the South African voter and does not only tolerate corruption but also does not hesitate to divert state funds away from legitimate service delivery to further their own absolutely unprincipled political agenda. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Can I ask the hon member Mr Walters - did I hear the hon member say that the hon Minister on that side is corrupt? If that is so, it is a little bit too far I would be more comfortable if the hon member Mr Walters refers to it as alleged

corruption.

Mr M C WALTERS: I will follow the example of the hon member Ms Brown. It was a generic term I used.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, I'm afraid. [Interjections.] I am afraid hon member -please take your seats.

Ms L BROWN: You cannot be dishonest about this.

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] You referred to a very specific Minister and I am not sure that there was a court case to find her corrupt. It is a political expression that you used but I will be more comfortable if you would tone it down a little bit. If you were to say alleged corruption I would accept that or something along those lines. I am trying to help you.

Mr M C WALTERS: Can I say who was the unprincipled ANC leader?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am not sure what the hon member Mr Walters is saying now? I am referring specifically to the hon member's reference to the hon Minister of Agriculture.

Ms L BROWN: Just say alleged.

The SPEAKER : I am helping the hon member.

Mr M C WALTERS: I will withdraw that particular term.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, that assists us. I see the ID. Hon member Mr Lentit?

Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Deputy Speaker, genuine refugees from neighbouring African countries flee to South Africa for the chance of a better life ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr R B LENTIT: It is an inspiration to have met a humble Rwandan man whose success story is a sad yet ongoing determination to reach his goal of becoming a South African citizen after living here for 16 years.

Mr Deputy Speaker, Mr Albert Mpazayabo is a guest here today. He is sitting there on the balcony. Sixteen years ago, desperately looking for work, he got a job as a car guard just to earn an honest living to put bread on the table. He and his family now live an honest life from humble beginnings in an opportunity city and an opportunity province.

This opportunity has now enabled him to manage a team of car guards,

mostly South African unemployed men and women, at a shopping centre in the northern suburbs of Cape Town. Determination and a positive attitude landed this man a degree in psychology from the University of the Western Cape. He is currently a Master's student in HIV/Aids Management at the Stellenbosch University from whom he received a full bursary. Albert has big dreams of finishing his Master's degree next year.

Many people blame their circumstances and the State for their inability to rise from the ashes. Here is a man deserving of the finest life whose will to succeed brought him what many of our people refuse to envision.

I have no doubt that the Western Cape Province will benefit from his wisdom while waiting for his opportunity to return to Rwanda as an ambassador of hope. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The DA?

Mr A M FIGLAN: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a recent visit with the NCOP to the Oudtshoorn Municipality it was shocking to hear of another illegal occupation of housing, especially in the light of legal occupants having already been identified.

Housing lists and the illegal occupation of housing units are some of the most prevalent problems to be addressed by municipalities. The problem

in Oudtshoorn seems to have been escalated by an official of the municipality who fraudulently handed out erf numbers, as well as the contractor who handed over keys to houses to some of the illegal occupants.

The problem now is that illegal occupations seem to happen to force the municipality into giving in to the demands of the illegal occupants. Those who have been on the waiting list for years mistrust the waiting list system as it is portrayed that illegal occupation will immediately give you access to a house.

What needs to be addressed by all municipalities is to check that beneficiaries are first time homeowners. Too often the situation arises where an already established homeowner gains access to another house at the expense of a person who has been on the waiting list for a long time.

Mr Deputy Speaker, occupants who are not on the waiting list need to understand the issues regarding the provision of housing in the province and the country. Municipalities should do everything in their power to rid the housing units of gangsters that use them for illegal activities.

There is an understanding of not wanting to remove people from housing units and accommodate them in shacks, or to provide alternative accommodation for them. Some of the illegal occupants have extended

and finished the building of some unfinished units.

The issue is that illegal occupants seem to dictate and hold municipalities to ransom in order to jump the waiting list. This action must be condemned. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The ANC?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC welcomes the positive initiative of the national government to invest R10 million in the future of Bredasdorp youth with skills training to make them more employable.

It is even more praiseworthy since the project by the national Higher Education Minister Blade Nzimande is in the name and memory of the late, brutally tortured, gang raped and murdered victim Anene Booysen. She lost her most precious possession, her life, earlier in February this year.

Further to this good news, after the tragedy is that an important agreement for youth jobs was recently signed here in the Western Cape by the national government as well. National government under the ANC is serious about investing in our youth on a large scale.

The ANC also notes the dozens of boats worth millions of Rands that are donated to poor fisher folk along our coast by the Department of Trade and Industry to support these communities. This is more positive news from our national government.

The ANC also applauds the national government for availing a single composite daily dose ARV tablet to ease life for the poor people living with HIV and Aids.

The ANC congratulates our national government for the many positive interventions to make life easier for the many poor people of the Western Cape and for showing that it really cares about the poor and ordinary people in a very tangible way. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The ACDP?

Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ACDP wishes to express its condolences to the family of Jordan Lewis, three years old, who died on Sunday at the N2 Gateway in Delft, through poisoning. This death, which was unnecessary and painful, could have and should have been avoided.

The ACDP is concerned about two aspects of the City. The first is the City's role in this. The dumper is liable and the dumper must be found and prosecuted to the fullest extent of the law but the City knows where 985

illegal dump sites are. They have mapped these dump sites. They have allocated budgets to eradicate the dumping from these dump sites. Law enforcement officers are on record as saying that they have not come across dumped waste that is health hazardous which means that they do not know what a health hazardous product is.

It means that when they see it they do not report it but yet it is these same law enforcement officers in terms of the City's reaction to this death who have been appointed by the City to investigate across all 985 dump sites which substances are hazardous, which are not and which should be removed. But they do not know what a hazardous substance is.

The ACDP is also concerned that this is not the first time that such poisoning or incident such as this has occurred, again not causing death thankfully, but instances such as this have occurred before. One wonders why it has taken so long for the City to react. Why does it take a death in a community for the City to react in such a way?

We approve of the fact that the City is going to seek to increase fines attached to this but this quite frankly should have been done a long time ago. We welcome the fact that the City is announcing that it will investigate contraventions of NEMA and the Waste Act. We also support the fact that the matter be investigated, but surely not by the specialist law enforcement units who do not know what hazardous waste is.

Lastly Mr Deputy Speaker, the ACDP believes that the City is hiding behind what they call the fact that this investigation is *sub judice* and therefore they cannot express themselves any further on it.

We know that *sub judice* means that it is before a court and it is being subjected to assessment and judgment. That is not the case in this instance. The City must not hide behind that clause in order to not express to the public of South Africa, to Cape Town and certainly to the family itself, what the progress is with this investigation and what action is going to be taken in reaction to what the investigation highlights.

Speaker, the ACDP wants this investigation to be transparent, public and all information that is derived from this investigation must be divulged to the public to the fullest extent possible. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The DA?

Me A ROSSOUW: Gedurende die 2010/2011 boekjaar het die Provinsiale Regering en die Verenigde Nasies navorsing aangevra oor die misbruik van dwelms en alkohol in die Wes-Kaap. Hierdie taak is onderneem deur die Suid-Afrikaanse Mediese Navorsingsraad. Die bevindings van hierdie verslag is onlangs vrygestel, en alhoewel die uitslae skokkend is, gaan hierdie verslag 'n definitiewe bydrae maak tot die voorkoming en

behandeling van drank-en-dwelm misbruik onder veral tieners.

Hierdie verslag het gekyk na die alkohol-, tabak- en dwelmgebruik onder graad 8 tot 10 leerders in die Wes-Kaap. Daar is ook gekyk na die geestelike welsyn van hierdie leerders en hoë risiko gedrag met betrekking tot geweld en seksuele gedrag.

Die navorsing het gewys dat daar wel 'n hoë voorval van risiko gedrag tussen tieners is. Hierdie risiko gedrag spreek spesifiek tot seksuele gedrag en alkohol misbruik. Hierdie verslag moet gebruik word vir die bemagtiging van ouers, leerkragte en die regering. Dit moet gebruik word om ons kinders te help om gevare te identifiseer en te voorkom.

Die verslag maak voorsiening vir voorstelle wat die Provinsiale Regering kan implementeer. Dit stel ook die provinsiale Departement van Maatskaplike Ontwikkeling in staat om hulle strategiese doelwitte te verfyn om seker te maak dat hulpbronne geplaas word waar dit nodig is.

Dit is ook 'n bewys dat nie al ons kinders mishandel of verslaaf is nie. Daar is hoop vir ons jeug. Die verantwoordelik berus nou by elke ouer, om hul kind te help as dit nodig is, en ook te onderrig oor die gevare wat elke dag oor sy pad gaan kom. Die *onus* rus ook by ons as regering om seker te maak dat die hulpbronne en geleenthede daar is vir kinders om nie deel te word van 'n dodelike siklus nie, maar deel te word van 'n oplossing

vir die hele Suid-Afrika. Ek dank u.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Dankie agb lid. That brings us to the end of statements. We now go over to motions. Are there any motions where notice is given? Ek sien u agbare von Brandis.

MOTIONS

Mnr E J VON BRANDIS: Mnr die Andjunkspeaker, ek stel voor:

Dat die Huis debat voer oor die rol van die groen ekonomie as 'n ekonomiese sektor van die provinsie.

[Kennisgewing van voorstel soos deur lid gestel.]

Ms V HANI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move:

That the House discusses the failure of the DA led Western Cape Provincial Government to address the challenges facing the province.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER : Thank you. Notice is taken.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move:

That the House debates the continuous failure of the DA to provide

adequate water and sanitation to all the poor in the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER : Thank you. Notice is taken.

Ms L BROWN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move:

That the House debates the Commission of Employment Equity report on the Western Cape and the fact that it remains resistant to change.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, notice is taken. Hon member Mr Stali? Hon member Mr Magaxa?

MR K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move:

That the House discusses the ongoing housing crisis in the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER : Thank you. Notice is taken.

Mr C STALI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move:

That the House discusses the taxi crisis in the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER : Thank you. Notice is taken.

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move:

That the House discusses the increased gang warfare in the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER : Thank you. Notice is taken.

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move:

That the House discusses the cancellation of the Golden Games in the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER : Thank you. Notice is taken.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move:

That the House discusses the interference by the Premier and her

department in the mandate of Cape Nature to develop a policy for the management of creditors.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER : Thank you. Notice is taken.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move:

That the House discusses the delay in the opening of the Mitchell's Plain hospital.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER : Thank you. Notice is taken.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move:

That the House discusses the problems associated with the Western Cape Government's economic development partnership and the composition of the board.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

THE DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, notice is taken. No more? Then we continue with motions without notice. Are there any motions without notice? Agbare Visser was eerste op die been.

Mr J J VISSER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys it's most heartfelt sympathy to the City of Boston Massachusetts USA and its people for the loss of life and injury suffered following the devastating and senseless twin bomb blast at the Boston Marathon finishing line on Monday, April 15, 2013.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Ms L BROWN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House invites all South Africans to celebrate our national Freedom Day, our democracy, our Constitution, our national symbols and especially congratulate all those who will receive national Orders from President Jacob Zuma on the 27th April.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved

without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Me A ROSSOUW: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Kan die huis kennis neem van die heengaan die afgelope van mnr Attie de Villiers, 'n voormalige sekretaris van die Nasionale Parlement en eggenote van die bekende Afrikaanse skrywer Audrey Blignaut, en ons ons medelye aan al sy naasbestaandes oordra.

[Voorstel sonder kennisgewing soos deur lid gestel.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Is daar geen beswaar dat dit sonder kennis gedoen word? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel nie? Goedgekeur

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House invites all South Africans to celebrate national Workers' Day on the 1st May 2013 and to all people that keep the cog of our economy turning through their hard work.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House expresses its deepest sympathy to the family of Jordan Lewis who died after consuming hazardous substances on Sunday, 21 April, 2013.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the University of Cape Town which has trumped all academic institutions in the country by scoring 33 A-rated researchers. Thirty three is the highest number of National Research Foundation A-rated researchers. Professor Danie Visser, the university's Deputy Vice Chancellor responsible for the university's research said the results were important to them as they focus on quality rather than quantity.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its sincere sympathy to the wife and family members of Deon Lott who, as Oudtshoorn's acting municipal manager and chief financial officer, died after suffering a stroke on Tuesday, April 16, 2013.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extend its condolences to the family and friends of 59 year old local businessman Allie Parker who was murdered at his home in a robbery on the 18th April, 2013.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Ms J L HARTNICK: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulate the Democratic Alliance with winning

the by-election in Ward 7, Hessequa, on 24th April, 2013.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion without notice? Is there an objection? It will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Ms Witbooi.

Ms J WITBOOI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family and friends of 23 year old Monroe Rhoda who was brutally murdered in Retreat on the 11th February, 2013.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House salute the extraordinary courage and determination of paralympian Ernst van Dyk of Stellenbosch, who, after witnessing the bomb blast across the street following his second place in the Boston marathon, then flew to the UK where he placed third in the London marathon the following weekend.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Mr H P GEYER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulate Mr Colin Eglin, the former leader of the Democratic Party, on receiving the Order of the Baobab from President Zuma this Saturday. Mr Eglin has dedicated his life to fighting apartheid and building South Africa's democracy.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

[Interjections.] Order. Hon Minister Carlisle, please that is enough. Hon Member Ms Brown, that is enough. Please proceed.

Ms M P MAGWAZA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House sympathises with the 164 people who were left homeless following the shack fires in Langa, Wesbank, Gugulethu and Philippi over the Easter weekend.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

[Interjections].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon von Brandis first. Order! Order! Hon Minister Carlisle, order! Hon Minister Carlisle, hon member Mr Ozinsky, I have given you some latitude because it is an important point that you are raising there but it is finished now please. Hon member Mr von Brandis?

Mr M SKWATSHA: On a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes raise it. Raise your point of order.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Is it parliamentary for the hon Minister Carlisle to say to the hon member “bloody”?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I did not hear that. Hon Minister Carlisle, did you use that word? If so, please withdraw.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Yes I did but I withdraw “bloody”. It was still rubbish.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Please continue hon member Mr von Brandis.

Mnr E J VON BRANDIS: Mnr die Andjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die Stad Kaapstad ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon Minister Carlisle, order! I have got to address three members. Order! Before you continue ... [Interjections.] Order! Order! Hon Minister Carlisle can I please address you? Order! I am addressing the hon Minister Carlisle now. Please, when I ask for order - I know it is a very hot and topical issue this - but when I ask for order please abide by the Chair's ruling. The same applies to hon member Mr Ozinsky and the hon member Ms Brown who are instigating him and exciting him. I will see the hon member Mr von Brandis now for the second time.

Mnr E J VON BRANDIS: Mnr die Andjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die huis die Stad Kaapstad gelukwens met sy benoeming deur Moody's International vir gesonde finansiële bestuur en ontvang daarvoor die hoogste moontlike munisipale Aa3 kredietgradering. In die huidige swak nasionale en internasionale ekonomiese klimaat sorg hierdie internasionale erkenning daarvoor dat beleggers in die gemeenskap met

vertroue in die Stad Kaapstad en sy toekoms kan belê.

[Kennisgewing van voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie. Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing, teen die voorstel self? Goedgekeur. Anybody on the other side? Hon member Mr Skwatsha, do you want to raise something? No. Then I see the hon member Ms Hartnick. Please, I saw her first. You were too late. Please hon member Ms Hartnick, continue.

Ms J L HARTNICK: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates Ndumie Funda from Mandalay who won a medal and was awarded a certificate

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! There is too much noise. Hon member Ms Brown, I cannot hear the hon member Ms Hartnick. Please continue hon member Ms Hartnick.

Ms J L HARTNICK: That this House congratulate Ndumie Funda from Mandalay who won a medal and was awarded a certificate of recognition for her work to fight gay issues in Mzansi from the Federation of Gay Games in Toronto last week.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House extend its condolences to the family and friends of traffic officer Wesley Woodman who was brutally murdered in Lavender Hill earlier this month whilst executing his duties.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Mnr E J VON BRANDIS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die huis die volgende lede gelukwens met die jaarlikse maritieme toekennings wat deur die Suid Afrikaanse Maritieme Veiligheidsowerheid aangebied was op 20 April 2013, naamlik Kaptein Okke Grapow - Maritieme Maestro toekenning, Hanlie Gouws - Maritieme Media Toekenning en Knowledge Bengu - Seevaarder van die Jaar.

[Kennisgewing van voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Is daar geen beswaar dat dit sonder kennis gedoen word? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel nie? Goedgekeur

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the national Department of Health has expressed its confidence that the training of South African medical students in Cuba will continue and will help with the roll out of the NHI.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the hon Premier left the hon Minister Carlisle off the very short list of DA members who fought apartheid and that the House recognises his contribution to the struggle against apartheid ... [Interjections.]

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order. No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Ms J L HARTNICK: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House convey our sincere condolences to the family and loved ones of the eight disabled pupils killed in Tuesday night's horrific bus accident in KwaZulu-Natal.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Me A ROSSOUW: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die drie Suid-Afrikaanse skrywers gelukwens met hul prestasie om op die kortlys geplaas te word vir die Statebondsboekprys van 2013. Jamala Safari is benoem vir die roman *The Great Agony and Pure Laughter of the Gods*, Sally-Ann Partridge vir die kortverhaal *Take me Home United Road*, en Julian Jackson se kortverhaal *The New Customers*, as die beste kortverhaal wat nog nie gepubliseer is nie
[Onhoorbaar.]

[Kennisgewing vanvoorstel soos deur lid voorgestel]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Is daar geen beswaar dat dit sonder kennis

gedoen word? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel nie? Goedgekeur

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the families and friends of a two-year-old child Haylee Anne Moos, Loretta Moos, 32, and Shaun Buys, 33, who were killed in shack fires in Wesbank over the Easter weekend.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Mr H P GEYER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulate hon members Figlan, Hartnick, Majola, Marais, Visser and von Brandis of the Democratic Alliance who completed the Palama Graduate Certificate in governance and leadership. Member von Brandis also achieved the highest score in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion without notice?

Order! Is there an objection?

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I really think it is divisive to make a motion of a non-political thing for the Legislature in such a way. I would only support it if it congratulates all members of the House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I take your point. There is an objection unless the member is prepared to change it.

Mr H P GEYER: I am prepared to include all of them. We were not given their names because the names were given to the different parties but I am absolutely prepared to do that ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! I take it the hon member Mr Geyer grants the point that we will include all the names in that motion. Agreed to. I see the hon Ms M Tingwe.

Ms M TINGWE: Enkosi kakhulu sekela somlomo, awundiboni tu namhlanje: That this House congratulates the young boy from the dusty streets of Langa Vezokuhle “VeziMntungwa for having represented his country South Africa, his province and his school in the cricket in India and was elected player of the series and the best batsman.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that there are currently 985 illegal dumping sites in the City of Cape Town.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the uncertainty surrounding the future of G F Jooste Hospital with the provincial Department of Health saying that they are waiting for the Department of Public Works before they can provide answers on whether the hospital will be demolished and rebuilt as planned.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the ANC in yesterday's by-election in Hessequa, Ward 7 has increased its votes by more than 50% and narrowly lost to the DA, who has shed support.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Me A J du Toit MARAIS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die huis kennis neem dat Bill Gates na sy onlangse besoek aan Professor Househam, die Wes-Kaapse Departement van Gesondheid geloof het as een van die bestes in die wêreld, met ander woorde "The best of the best".

[Kennisgewing van voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Is daar geen beswaar dat dit sonder kennis gedoen word? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel nie? Goedgekeur

Ms M TINGWE: Enkosi kakhulu sekela somlomo, awundiboni tu namhlanje:

That the house congratulates the 16 students of Mitchell's Plain who

each received a bursary of R10 000 for the year, handed over by Minister Trevor Manuel of the community's Mitchells Plain Bursary and Role Model Trust.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the SAPS for conducting a successful raid on drug houses in Bishop Lavis on the 2nd April 2013.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the national Minister of Police Nathi Mthethwa for listening to community concerns around crime at an imbizo organised by the Surrey Estate Provincial Constituency Office in Manenberg last night.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there an – Order! Order! Is there an objection to the motion? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any more? Please continue.

MR K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the national Minister of Human Settlement Tokyo Sexwale for launching the new solar water heating project at the N2 Gateway project in Joe Slovo.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House joins numerous public health workers and patients in welcoming the national Minister of Health Dr Aaron Motsoaledi's introduction of a new single anti-retroviral pill with 400 000 doses having been distributed to provinces for the first phase of the roll out.

[Notice of motion as given by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes Public Protector Thuli Madonsela's decision to investigate allegations of the DA's double standards around dealing with the code of conduct for councillors in the City of Cape Town.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objection against the motion without notice? Is there an objection? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Any further motions? Hon member Beerwinkel?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House joins the community of Bredasdorp on commending the national Minister for Higher Education and Training Dr Blade Nzimande for launching a R10 million skills development project in memory of Anene Booysen.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to.

Are there any further motions without notice? The next topic is the subject for discussion in the name of the hon member Mr von Brandis.

SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION

*The Desirability and Impact/ Implications of toll roads in the
Western Cape*

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA will not support Sanral's decision to use tolling in the Western Cape as a means of generating revenue when other options exist. Fuel levies, if spent correctly, could alleviate the strains on outstanding or future costs. In this year's national budget the fuel levy increased by 23 cents, deepening the revenue pool. Fuel levies are an efficient and broadly accepted form of collection. Fuel levies do not require policing to be enforced and are simply part of government's set fuel prices.

Instead of utilising existing structures to acquire revenue, such as levies and motor licensing, Sanral seeks to spend billions to create new toll plazas and collection systems with little public input.

Mr Deputy Speaker, in 2011 Sanral announced that the preferred bidder for the project is Protea Parkway Consortium. The consortium comprises a variety of private investors and partners to the South African Government.

Sanral has yet to clarify all the individual parties in this Consortium, let alone toll costs or any other key information. The round number of R10 billion is now outdated by two years. This number is likely to further

inflate over time. If ever there was an example of poor public oversight, it is Sanral.

To say that South Africa has had tolling since 1983 is a poor excuse by Sanral and the ANC-led government to justify this form of revenue collection. We also had apartheid in 1983.

Mr Speaker, the economic implications of tolling in the Western Cape are great. Limited economic growth and weak wage increases alongside increased commuting costs will further choke personal income growth. Commuters will be getting the same, or less, for more.

The Provincial Government and its departments will also have to amend budgets to cater for the tolling of its vehicles. It is not surprising that tolling has united opposition parties and businesses. Only a project of such broad disapproval could motivate such an opposition.

Mr Deputy Speaker, South Africa is a road economy. 89% of this country's inland freight is transported by road. Without sufficient public and rail freight transport, the country's road infrastructure and its users will remain under enormous strain. It is also unlikely that tolling will reduce the strain or congestion found on such crucial roads as the N1 and N2. If the N1 and N2 Winelands project succeeds, there will be no stopping Sanral from steamrolling its tabled toll road projects across the

country. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr von Brandis.
Your time has expired. Hon member Mr Stali.

Mr Z C STALI: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC here is on the record that it does not support this Wineland N1/N2 toll plaza project [Interjections.] where it impacts negatively on the poor and working class. This was again stressed by our ANC Western Cape leadership. It must be further unpacked as the Sanral proposal must still go back to national Cabinet and public participation process followed.

It is a pity that the DA does not use this route to raise its concerns, but pre-empt matters for political point-scoring. In contrast, the ANC will first calmly consider all facts, continue to consult and look at all finance models before it takes a final position on the matter, as the ANC is in principle not entirely against the construction and maintenance of toll roads or the possible benefits to our economy. [Interjections.]

But it is blatant and deliberate DA lie to claim that the ANC supports this specific toll project. The turncoat DA will do anything to score cheap party political points. It is the DA's change of heart on this matter that leaves it bare for all to see. It is once again unmasked as a party that cannot be trusted with transport.

It stoops to any level in electioneering. In fact, the DA has a talent for bad publicity and to often set its foot in the only puddle.

This has happened with the desperate attempt to frame the ANC as the NP incarnate while the DA actively fought for and won the lion's share of conservative Nat supporters. Again the DA was exposed for its silly attempt to delete its own apartheid history and paint it over with a polished version falsely portraying it as a leading force in our liberation struggle.

My colleagues after me will deal more with the DA's politics of chronic deception. But the DA's lies spin, smoke and mirrors cannot cover up its fabrications on the tolls. Instead now it is totally against its nature.

Generally the DA lies through its teeth if it says it opposes tolls. In fact, from the Premier to every MEC and backbencher, each fully supports and asks for more toll roads as it is the DA's officially approved transport policy.

The DA can also not run away from its party philosophy of entrepreneurial privatisation and outsourcing. It has no moral leg to stand on to oppose tolls.

When citizens opposed the Chapman's Peak toll plaza, the DA fought

them in court with taxpayers' money. Now the DA wants the same citizens to oppose this toll project. Which DA is speaking here?

The DA now calls for resistance only to reap easy votes and pretends as if it opposes all roads.

Just to refresh some of the memories on the DA's side. Under those old Nats on the DA's side the provincial ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon Minister Carlisle, there is too much discussion going on there. It interferes with the speaker. Please continue.

Mr Z C STALI: Under those old Nats on the DA's side, the provincial Toll Act was promulgated in 1999. In contrast, since the ANC came into power in the Western Cape it questioned this toll project. The ANC in government has initiated campaigns to listen to concerns and objections as far back as 2003 under MEC Tasneem Essop, 10 years ago.

The evidence is there that the ANC leaders have passed these on to national level and raised the matter directly with Sanral and even the national Transport Minister in the time of MEC Mcebisi Skwatsha and Marius Fransman.

No measure of spin and lies can take away the ANC's concerns about the impact of such a system, especially on transport for the poor like the many taxis and on basic food produce. It is the ANC that met with farmers and all other stakeholders to hear their fears.

I say this because the DA is allergic to public participation. It only meets with its buddies. Has the DA done constructive groundwork? It just wants to run an election campaign to blame national government instead of putting in place public transport for the poor from overcrowded areas. The DA allows empty MyCiti buses to serve the rich areas like Blaauwberg.

The DA cannot be trusted with public transport and should learn from Gauteng how to operate such a system. This DA does not care for the poor at all.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Ms Bevu.

Ms T N BEVU: Mr Deputy Speaker, when you look at the way the DA government at Chapman's Peak and Sanral implement e-tolling you discover a very low level of public engagement and planning. Most disturbing you discover that though said parties profess to be against the system of e-tolling, their government implements them in any case. This begs the question who is actually driving e-tolling to their obvious benefit?

Why are our governments being made into cash cows for companies who have connections in high places? Why are our political parties not respecting the voice of the majority and where is accountability to the voters? As Cope we realise that sometimes there is a need to pay for freeway improvements but we expect this to be done in an efficient way that does not bring unnecessary extra burdens on taxpayers.

E-tolling requires far more complex planning to avoid costly inefficiencies. The DA on a provincial level has dismally failed to do so with Chapman's Peak. The hon Minister Carlisle knows how quickly these unplanned costs escalate. If I am not mistaken I think they were up to R200 million in their payments to Entilini. Now the ANC on a national level seem to be falling into the same mistakes, ignoring far simpler and cheaper methods to collect revenue for these projects.

We shall not harp on Chapman's Peak. We said enough about that last year and we were blatantly ignored. Still, it surprises us to see MEC Carlisle now at the forefront of opposing Sanral e-tolling. [Interjection.]

The lie the DA likes to pen is that Chapman's Peak is just a tourist road. Tell that to a person who lives at Noordhoek, Fish Hoek and so forth who work in the city and have to pay e-tolling on top of their escalating fuel costs. Tell that to the owner of a bakery who, after a delivery in Hout Bay, has to pay e-tolling fines everyday that can be as high as R3 000 a month.

The same applies to other businesses that have to be on the road on a daily basis such as delivery vans. The same will apply to the tolls at N1 and N2. We reckon people from places like Grabouw and Somerset will suffer most with escalating travel expenses.

There is no need for politicising these issues. It is simple mathematics. Look at Gauteng. Since we do not have exact figures for the Western Cape tolls, it is estimated that the electronic tolling process planned by Sanral will cost R1.7 billion *per annum* based on the tender awarded by Sanral to ETC for this work at R84 billion for the first five year period plus set-up costs. This amount is just to operate and administer while the road construction capital cost of R17 billion is paid over 20 years, with interest, amounts to approximately R1.62 billion *per annum*.

E-tolling in Gauteng is said to raise over R100 billion which is 216% of the required amount which will be a burden to the road user. There is no doubt that the entire country benefits from a good road infrastructure. Even if one does not use the roads as such so the national Treasury needs to be the major contributor to the planning of roads. Indeed, road users should also contribute towards our roads more so than a non-road user. The fuel levy was introduced in the mid-60s exactly because of this. Today the average fuel in the fuel tank of a car contributes around 135 towards the levy which helps maintain and build our roads in reality.

This R35 billion *per annum* simply goes into the national Treasury pot and it is directed to roads. Government has never successfully convinced us that these funds, after being efficiently utilised for this, were not enough. There is no question that when constructing new rural and inter-city roads in the past, to by-pass the longer and more dangerous single lane roads, a tolling process is justified as it offers clear benefits to road users, who also have the option of using a shorter and less congested alternative road for free. This is how the Huguenot Tunnel came to be.

To date Sanral earns billions from such toll roads and these funds subsidise the General Road Funding Board. What we do not know is whether these funds are used efficiently because there is an open process of accountability about them.

Revenue generated by the sale car licenses at a local level is supposed to be utilised to fund road maintenance and infrastructure development between the municipal and metro areas ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Please continue and finish off.

Ms T N BEVU: These fees are the highest in the Western Cape and are said to increase significantly in June but the benefits to the local road users are not at the level expected from the local authorities.

[Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Ms Bevu. Your time has expired. Hon member Mr Meyer.

The MINISTER FOR CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA in the Western Cape will oppose the tollgates unlike hon member Mr Stali and I hope the media have picked it up, as today he has spoken in two tongues. He said he is for tollgates and he is against tollgates. I hoped the media have picked it up because he used the words “not entirely against” and that is an indication of double speak.

[Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, that is also indicative of the leader of the ANC in the Western Cape. Here in the Western Cape he says he is against tollgates but in the national Cabinet where he sits, he is in favour of tollgates. So it is double speak and it is now confirmed and hon Minister Carlisle will pick that up further in his debate.

That is what we are witnessing here today in this debate. The Democratic Alliance is opposing the tollgates because no proper consultation was done, because tollgates will hurt the poor and the cost of this project is now clear as the Ministers will indicate later in their speeches.

Mr Deputy Speaker, why does the ANC like mega projects? Here is the answer MrSpeaker. Here is the answer why the ANC likes mega projects and I quote hon President Zuma:

“I always said that the wise businessman will support the ANC because supporting the ANC means you are investing very well in your business”.

And this is the business of tollgates we are talking about.

Mr Deputy Speaker, your business will flourish if you join the ANC. It will flourish if you build the tollgate and that is what this is about. In the spirit of hon Minister Carlisle I have five questions to the ANC on tollgates.

1. Why do you target the poor people of Mitchell’s Plain and Khayelitsha?
2. Why do you want to destroy the agricultural sector, the food basket of South Africa?
3. Who in the ANC will again benefit from tollgates through tenders and contracts?
4. Did Marius Fransman oppose tollgates in President Zuma’s Cabinet?
If yes, could you tell us the date of the Cabinet meeting?
5. Why are the ANC provinces not spending their provincial road maintenance grant because in Gauteng in the previous financial year

they have only spent 24% of the provincial road maintenance grant?

That is the problem Mr Deputy Speaker, they want tenders because Mr Zuma gave the answer of why they like mega projects.

Mr Deputy Speaker, why does the ANC want to punish the taxi drivers and the buses? Why does the ANC want them to pay an extra tax on the tollgates? Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC cannot answer these questions because in the ANC if you are honest you are on your way out.

Mr Deputy Speaker, it is painful to think that a party with a 100 year history of liberation that does not want to give road users the liberty of saying no to toll roads.

Toll roads are bad for poor people. It is bad for the people of Khayelitsha. It will be bad for the people of Mitchell's Plain. It will be bad for our agriculture, export, local economic development. It is bad for our local taxi industry. It is bad for the rural people. It is bad for job creation. It is bad for the transport industry in general. It is bad for the working class the ANC says it represents. It is only good for ANC tenderpreneurs but in the Western Cape we will fight this tooth and nail.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA in the Western Cape will oppose tolling in the Western Cape. We will mobilise communities against the toll project on

the N1 and N2 and we will drive an extensive media campaign against tolling. We will have mass mobilisation on the streets of the Western Cape. We will also protect the poor and road users against ANC abuse.

Mr Deputy Speaker, people may be poor but they are not stupid and the ANC will learn the hard lesson of this as they did yesterday in the by-election.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Agb Beerwinkel? Order!
[Interjections.] Order.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I do not believe that you have told us you are deaf so I am not going to shout at you and neither do I believe that the press are deaf so I will not shout at them either.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA once again wants to mislead the citizens of the Western Cape. Firstly, it pretends that it is against toll roads and secondly it wants to portray the ANC in a skewed way and falsely define it.

In the Western Cape, Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC will continue to oppose the Winelands toll road where it hurts the poor, as we originally did when we governed here. MEC Carlisle is misleading the public when he says that the ANC did not object to the toll road when it governed, as

you heard. The records show that since December 2004, MEC Skwatsha submitted objections from the community. In 2008 MEC Fransman added his objection to the proposed toll roads. Check the records MEC Carlisle.

The ANC is continually engaging constructively with national Government and Sanral around the economic sensitivities of the toll roads as we seek workable solutions. We believe that business should not be forced to curtail their activities and in the process shed jobs as a result of increased transport costs. For the same reason, Mr Deputy Speaker, we do not believe that tourism should be affected because travel has become too expensive.

We do not believe that the poor should be burdened with extra transport costs. They already have to pay an additional 5,3% for increased vehicle licence fees imposed by MEC Carlisle. Through no fault of their own the poor must travel very far to get to work as businesses have not yet woken up to the idea of creating work where people live.

As the ANC, we are interested in building a public transport system that prioritises the interests of the poor people. Hence we are not interested in building beautiful bridges and highways for the rich while people from Mitchell's Plain, Khayelitsha, Mannenberg and Kraaifontein are raped and killed in our trains on a daily basis. We want our people to have access to public transport that is affordable, accessible and safe.

We will continue to engage Sanral and other stakeholders in transport to assist us. That, MEC Carlisle, is your responsibility. Not these cheap electioneering stunts. Mr Speaker, let me remind MEC Carlisle of what he said. I would also like to remind him not to grandstand on issues that are not his competency. Concentrate on public transport, Golden Arrow buses and trains because as I speak today many people are not at work due to the strike of this subsidised company. Your words, and I quote MEC Carlisle:

“We, the people of the Western Cape, must treat the election as a referendum on the toll road. Every vote for the ANC in the April 2014 election will be a vote for the toll road. Every vote against the ANC, regardless for which party, will be a vote against the toll road. I call on the voters of the Western Cape to show the ANC the real teeth of a functioning democracy”.

MEC Carlisle and the DA’s election campaign against the toll road is not believable. For example, privileged people living on the hills with the views of the sea south of the N1’s proposed toll will hardly ever pay toll fees unless they go up north for their luxurious holidays. This is mostly DA constituency right around the corner from Ou Bokkie. Highways will become the open road for the rich because the very few poor who happen to own a vehicle will not be able to use these roads as frequently as they

would like to.

Another reason why your electioneering campaign DA against the toll road is not believable is right here in your transport policy and I quote, here it is your transport policy. It says on page 9:

“The DA will invest an additional R15 billion a year for six years making use of the existing fuel levy and in addition toll income and other traffic related income sources which together currently contribute R26 billion to the fiscus each year”.

Then 2.2.3 of your policy says ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL:

“The DA will pass toll road legislation to ensure consistency and the Road Maintenance Fund will be used to hold proceeds of the toll roads for upkeep of roads and a certain percentage ...”

Now Mr Deputy Speaker, if that is not double speak then I do not know what is.

It is strange then that when the ANC under the then leadership of MEC Fransman proposed a fuel levy you opposed it.

Yet your member and shadow member of Parliament of Transport Ian Ollis supports the fuel levy now and I read what he says:

“A dedicated road maintenance fund sourced mainly from the fuel levy would ensure a regular supply of funds to gradually eliminate South Africa’s roads ...” ...
[Interjections.]

You were against it when MEC Fransman proposed it. This province has amongst the most expensive vehicle licence fees, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Why does MEC Carlisle pretend to care about the poor when they are paying these exorbitant vehicle licence fees when the very people who he expects to support are having to pay those toll fees. This again is double speak.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I repeat the DA does want toll roads. They oppose privatisation of toll roads for electioneering yet their open opportunity society policy advocates privatisation as a means of creating – my last sentence.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It must be a short one.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: It will be. Speaker, what I have read in here is the proof that in spite of all their electioneering-based objections, Premier Zille, MEC Carlisle, MEC Winde and MEC Meyer are all proponents of the toll road system. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER. Thank you. Your time has expired. Hon member Mr Lentit.

Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Deputy Speaker, the N1 and the N2 are vital arteries into many central business districts in our province. The largest fractions of our communities make use of these national roads to get to work, schools and specialised healthcare facilities. The implementation of toll roads, especially the N1/N2 Winelands toll highway project will subject our poor communities to additional and unavoidable spending.

The planned toll roads will affect Mitchell's Plain and Khayelitsha the most. These are only two examples of communities in Cape Town with the lowest income levels and the highest unemployment rate in the city at 45.1%. This means based on the current tariff at the Huguenot Tunnel a vehicle travelling from Khayelitsha or Mitchell's Plain to Cape Town will have to pay a toll fee of R58 per day for a round trip.

In many cases this is half of what an average domestic worker gets paid

per day. A large portion of our lower income workers are lucky to work three days out of a five day working week. Mr Deputy Speaker, it is already a financial strain to travel from these areas as it is. I can only imagine the burden that tolling will place on the pockets of poor mothers who commute in the early hours of the morning to put bread on the table.

The increasing cost of living and the implications that tolling will have on our agricultural industry is a concern. Farmers and inevitably farm workers will be right back to square one at the infamous farm workers' strike. A domino effect of depriving the poor and pushing up costs for goods and services and service delivery will be inescapable. This will ultimately cripple not only the Western Cape economy but also be a major blow to the South African economy.

I commend the mayors of DA led municipalities in the province, especially the City of Cape Town for obtaining a court date to interdict the construction of the N1 and N2 Winelands highway toll project. We have a responsibility as members of this House and that is a mandate to protect our people's interest and the wellbeing of our province. Tolling is not just a way to get people commuting. It will ultimately cause financial, emotional and social breakdown of already impoverished communities. I thank you.

Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ACDP joins those political parties that are unwavering in their opposition to toll roads. Not those that flip-flop.

Mr Speaker, the ACDP also agrees and accepts that there are numerous already listed negative effects of toll roads on communities and the economy, I am not going to list them now. I only have two minutes.

Mr Speaker, we are deeply concerned about the role that Sanral is playing instead of addressing and helping to alleviate poverty, unemployment and inequality in South Africa and in the Western Cape, Sanral are now playing a role to make matters worse for the people of the Western Cape.

What is worse for the people of the Western Cape and that Sanral clearly do not understand is that the build, operate and transfer type tolling, which is what they are pursuing in the Western Cape, has already been tried in China and has failed in China.

Allow me to read from a report on China's experience with the build, operate and transfer tolling scheme:

“BOT schemes are by nature too complex and fragile and too highly prone to politicisation to enable governments in developing countries such as ours, to achieve the quick, efficient and privately financed supply of infrastructure as

intended by this method of privatisation.

Across Asia the number of unqualified BOT successes have been few. A great number of attempted projects have been characterised by lengthy delays, chronic disputes and frequently, failure to get underway. Even in the case of those which do proceed, the state often fails to attain its principal goals”.

The principal goal in this instance can only possibly be for Sanral to undermine government’s intentions to address poverty, inequality and unemployment. While its government-stated intention is to enhance growth, employment and equity, the ANC Government itself and this government is being undermined by Sanral in their actions with toll roads in the Western Cape. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Haskin your time has expired. Hon Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: Mr Deputy Speaker, I first of all would like to thank the hon member Mr von Brandis as this subject for discussion is printed in his name. If you look at the subject for discussion it asks about the desirability, impacts and implications of toll roads in this province. I think first of all when it comes to desirability it is very simple. No. This, seems

to be the general consensus, although with a little bit of confusion in the ANC ranks at the moment.

Let us talk about the impacts and implications first so that we get to understand why we need to say no. The impacts; there have been a number of studies into this toll road and helping make decisions for Sanral in the process, first of all starting as far back as 2001, then an update in 2008 and then of course a study that we have asked for when we came into power.

If you have a look at all of these studies and perhaps just to highlight one or two areas, when we look at the costs of these tolls out of the study:

“overall the economic costs of tolling using toll plazas are R5.94 billion and if using open road tolling R1.56 billion”.

Just remember those two large numbers in the billions and of course construction costs. This is looking back to the 2001 study and then also bringing in the 2008 study that UCT conducted.

According to Sanral civil constructions costs have increased 89% between 2001 and 2007. Bear that in mind as well. Talking about costs - if you look at the estimated construction costs these are inflated by 12.3% to update the number to 2010, as if we were going to be constructing it in 2010.

These numbers however differ from the estimate provided by Sanral during a meeting in which they estimated the anticipated construction costs to have doubled since 2007. I do not need to go any further because we know what is happening at the moment with regard to these costs and it is going to be immensely more than what we think is the number mentioned around R10 billion.

My point is that all of these were done prior to 2009 and the global recession.

Prior to the global recession we had all this discussion around toll roads and the implications and the impacts of what it would have on the economy and the people of this region.

Let me move to the next point. I always support user pays, I think user pays is a great philosophy and policy to stand behind. But if that is the case the user is already paying. They are already paying in this case. Let us just look at the fuel price. In 2008 when the UCT study was done, at the end of 2008 the fuel price was R7,11 a litre. It is now just under R13 a litre. The user is paying and paying a lot more.

There is then talk, you heard about fuel levies, or let us go back to 2007/2008 when we used to bring in R26 billion a year in South Africa from fuel levies. That has now gone up to R42 billion a year. Then of

course there is vehicle licensing which in this province brings in about R1.3 billion a year. At the moment the user is paying already and I do not think that it would be wise to add another cost to what the user is paying already.

The implications, and that is what is asked in this debate, the implications of a toll road would push – and we have heard it from Minister Meyer and many of the other participants in this debate - the poorer people on the Cape Flats specifically, in the towns surrounding the city, in agriculture getting their products through to market, jobs in general and every single sector in this region would have a huge implication if we added another cost. They are already paying. If we add to it again it would have devastating effects on our economy in this region.

In South Africa for far too long we have had unacceptable unemployment rates and it is not fair to add extra costs and the end implication would not help us with those unemployment rates either.

Let us talk about the R10 billion in infrastructure investment because we look at this as infrastructure investment but it is not real infrastructure investment that creates an environment for economic growth. I think our two roads coming into the city, both the N1 and the N2, (I am not talking about the N7 now) - I think they are great roads. I think the quality of those roads is unbelievable at the moment.

If we had R10 billion right now to invest, why put it into a gateway that creates an extra cost? Let us invest it into other areas that would create a better platform to reduce our unemployment rate and increase our competitiveness as a region in the global economy.

I think it is quite simple Mr Speaker, listening to most of the people in this debate, I think when it comes to the question of toll roads the desirability is no. I think that when it comes to the implications and impacts it is plain to see it is a no-brainer. It means that the answer must be no. The costs are far too high.

But I do have a problem that we are discussing today a subject for discussion and I am sorry that it is not a motion that we could actually call for a decision of this House, so that the decision of this House could be taken to national Government to say all parties of this House would not like toll roads.

I am going to ask the hon member Mr von Brandis to perhaps think about putting this again to the House in the form of a motion that we need to take a decision as this House to send a very strong message from all the political parties of this House to the ANC at a national level that we do not want these toll roads in our province at this very time. We cannot afford it. The unemployed people of this province cannot afford it. The

businesses of this province cannot afford it.

But there seems to be a problem, Mr Speaker, because the ANC are divided. The ANC at national level want it. The ANC at provincial level are half-half. They do not know whether they want it or not. We need to ask them that at the same time we are preparing a motion they need to make up their minds as to whether, in this province, they are going to go for it or against it.

We see that Tony Ehrenreich is also in two minds. When it is the City and there is a court case to go against the toll roads he votes against the City making that decision but then he steps outside (that is the ANC leader in the House). He steps outside of the City and he is under Cosatu rules and now he says no, he does not support it. At the same time we need the ANC in this province to get their act together to decide whether they do or do not support toll roads and when this motion comes to the House I would expect every political party in this province to stand together to send a very clear message to the national Government we do not want toll roads in this province. Thank you Mr Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Ozinsky.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA yet again today shows that they cannot be trusted with the truth. The DA says for instance, I

heard this yesterday in Hessaqua, that Mandela is saam met die DA. The biggest lot of nonsense. Not true. The DA refused to participate in Mandela's government. So much for values. You refused to participate in the government of Mandela when he asked you to. The DA goes and lies to the people of Hessaqua.

The hon Premier Zille said the ANC did not lead the struggle against apartheid but Nelson Mandela says that!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr M OZINSKY : Your new member says that!

Interjections.]

Me A ROSSOUW: Die relevansie van wat die agb lid mnr Ozinsky nou gese het, het niks te doen met hierdie debaat nie.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order please! I am listening very carefully. I will regard that as a short introduction to his speech about toll roads. Hon member Mr Ozinsky, please get to the point.

Mr M OZINSKY: Just like the DA lies about the toll roads. The DA lies about their position on learners being in class . The DA objects to SADTU

taking learners out of class but MEC Grant brings learners to this House when they were meant to be in classrooms.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky.

Mr M OZINSKY: I am on how the DA lies and it is about the toll roads.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Get to the road quickly. You are on a detour now.

Mr M OZINSKY: The DA says it fought apartheid but they produce a list which does not even fill up one page. If the ANC was to produce a list of people who fought apartheid it would be longer than all the books in the library. Of course, the hon Premier forgets important members of her party who fought apartheid ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member Mr Ozinsky, I have given you some latitude and that latitude has now reached the end. Please get back to the main road which is the toll road.

Mr M OZINSKY: Just like the DA lies on those issues, the DA lies on the issues of the toll roads. As the hon member Ms Beerwinkel and the hon member Mr Stali have pointed out, your policy is in favour of toll roads but you do not say that to the public. You do not say why even to the

public who support toll roads. [Interjections.]

Let us tell the public why the DA supports toll roads and not only supports toll roads but also supports the Build Operating Transport system that the ACDP was talking about. The DA will encourage private sector investment in road construction through direct ownership and through partnerships with national - Direct ownership is the BOT system and the toll roads.

The user pay principle is important but a system should be introduced whereby toll road concession fees are rationalised so that motorists pay comparable amounts for roads of comparable cost. In other words, what you are saying about how to fund these toll roads is not contained in your policy. Nowhere in your policy does it say that there should not be toll roads and that is why you are not being honest with the people.

The DA is further dishonest with the people because all the scientific studies, including the studies that the hon member Mr Winde has quoted, show the tremendous benefits of these toll roads. [Interjections.] For instance, the study from UCT which the hon Winde quotes, says that “the financial MPV of doing nothing is R17 billion more than upgrading and tolling using traditional toll plazas”. We wonder if you are saying the election will be fought about toll roads, which DA should the people believe? The real DA which says they support toll roads in their policy or

the DA that stands up here and pretends they do not support toll roads.

When we look at the severe problems we have in transport in this province then we realise why the DA wants to make this the centre of their election strategy because of their failure with public transport. Instead of solving the public transport system by taking the IRT to Gugulethu, Philippi, Athlone and Khayelitsha they took it to the West Coast. That has made the problem worse. The DA has a serious problem in telling us about what capital investment is needed in the province. When you go to Sir Lowry's Pass, when you go to Du Toit's Kloof, most times there is serious congestion. The hon Minister Carlisle is so busy on his bicycle he cannot get to Sir Lowry's Pass to see what is happening there.

The question the DA needs to answer is what is the infrastructure we need in the province and how are we going to pay for it? If you reject the system your policy says must be used to pay for it, tell us how really it is to be paid for. What the people of the province must know is that this party lying today about this issue in a year or two's time after the election they will bring the toll roads in knowing that this was just simply a cynical election ploy by these members.

Before this House takes any motion on this matter what needs to be presented here is the real cost benefit analysis. That needs to be based on the research that the Department of Transport has done and you will know

that consistently, since the year 2000, the department has supported toll roads. So if the department were to come here and tell the House that it no longer believes the toll roads are viable, then the department would have to tell us why, and the only reason they could tell us why would be because the MEC has instructed them not to go against what more than 13 years of research in the department has shown.

That is why the MEC and his department is not prepared to make that information available. Our researchers have asked the department to give us those documents on its internal calculations and they have refused to make it available because the MEC has instructed them not to make it available because it goes against his own public position.

Remember people of the Western Cape: this is a party whose policy is totally in favour of toll roads who only puts forward a funding model based on toll roads but goes public and says that it is opposed to the toll roads.

Remember people of the Western Cape what they did with the IRT.

[Interjection].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Is that a question or a point of order?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Could I ask the hon member Mr Ozinsky a question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky, are you prepared to take a question?

Mr M OZINSKY: You can join me afterwards in the corridor. I have a lot to say.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The answer is no, not now. Please continue.

Mr M OZINSKY: Remember people of the Western Cape the IRT was meant to go to Athlone, Gugulethu and Khayelitsha. The Mayor of Cape Town, the hon Zille took it to the West Coast and she took it away from the black people and poor of this country to pay back white people for voting for the DA.

Again with the toll roads just like they said at the time they were in favour of the IRT but it will never go to Athlone, just the same with the toll roads. Suddenly they will take out their real policy which they have never rescinded and impose it on the people of the province. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, what we are witnessing here is a party at war with itself. But let us just deal with a few things quickly before we enjoy the agony of the ANC in the Western Cape.

Let me just say yes the hon member Ms Beerwinkel is correct. That is our national policy on transport. Quite right. We believe the users should pay.

There are a variety of ways in which that can be done, which includes toll roads. Let me give you an example of a toll road in this province and I think it is a very good one. It is the toll road that runs along the railway line on the West Coast. It belongs to Transnet but what they say is we will upkeep this road and we will allow people to use it but they must pay us a small toll. That makes a lot of sense. No problems with that. We have no problems with that toll road.

Let us have a look at a few things. The hon ANC says the tolling of Chappies was done by the ANC. Who do we have to thank? The ANC. They spoke of the building of the luxury roads for the rich. Who built Koeberg intersection? Who widened the M5? Who widened Table Bay Boulevard? It was this government here, Mr Speaker, at a cost of R1billion. I have always been on record that I would not have done that. I would have used that R1 billion to knock out our backlog on road maintenance.

They built these luxury roads. The ANC built them. Someone spoke of high licence fees. In what period did the licence fees rocket up? In the very period that the ANC was in power. In the first four years that I was here I never increased the licence fees by one cent and now they are reasonable. You pushed the licence fees up to the highest – this government, the ANC government. Very short memory.

Who built the Gauteng freeways? The ANC built the Gauteng freeways. But then why is the ANC so excited about the toll fees? Who built the luxury Gautrain for the rich people? The ANC built the luxury Gautrain. I am saying these things specifically because I am coming to a point in a moment.

Privatisation of the roads. Who has privatised roads in Mpumalanga, in Gauteng and Limpopo? The ANC has privatised the roads that hon member Mr Ozinsky objects to so severely.

If I can just say, I agree absolutely with my colleague hon Minister Winde that the N1 and the N2 serve their purpose pretty well. Yes, when those people with holiday homes go to enjoy them on a long weekend, yes, you do get some congestion. But should we spend Sir, R10 billion so that those people holiday homes in Hermanus can get home a little bit faster? That is the ANC's policy. [Interjections.]

It is a very conflicted party and it has a very short memory. All of the woes that I sit with and that the commuter sits with and that the average motorist sits with are the woes that were inflicted by an ANC spending on all sorts of things they should not have spent on.

Indeed, the question of public transport has been raised here. I think back to my years as the transport spokesman for the DA in opposition and I try to remember what it is that the ANC did for public transport in the years I sat in the corner there. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT & PUBLIC WORKS: The IRT which goes to the suburbs of the enormously rich like Atlantis and De Noon [Interjections.] was a DA project not an ANC project. When I arrived here there were 77 [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY : It doesn't go to Atlantis.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Ozinsky.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT & PUBLIC WORKS: There were 77 train sets in the Western Cape and I never knew any of the transport people

to do a single thing, any of the transport ministers, about that. In fact they did not even know there were only 77 and steadily working with an agency over which I have no control we built that up to 98. So we have done something, even though we do not control it we have done something.

Mr M OZINSKY: It was the ANC.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT & PUBLIC WORKS: No. It was the ANC who smashed it into the ground, did not care about it because why Sir, because it is for the poor and the poor vote the way they are told to vote and that is it.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER : Order. Order.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT & PUBLIC WORKS: Let us talk some realities here because the realities are being missed. The reality is that the Winelands toll ways are going to introduce three absurd and very expensive luxuries. That is a by-pass around Somerset West, which incidentally will take a high speed road straight through the middle of Lwandle.

Secondly, to commission the second tunnel at Huguenot. Thirdly, to

build a tunnel up Sir Lowry's. Three luxuries were going to cost R10 billion. I do not know what they are going to cost now. Nobody has asked for those but we are told by the ANC national Government you will have them and we will parcel them out to our private sector friends and you will pay for them. That is the reality of the Winelands toll way. That is the reality.

A party who claims itself to be semi-socialist should go away and expire. How can they support such a thing? How can this hon spokesman for transport say what "I am semi in favour" – or ... I don't know what he said. How can the hon member Mr Ozinsky actually defend it here? [Interjections.] You build luxuries, you privatise them and then you toll the people of the Western Cape for it. What kind of obscenity is that, Sir? What kind of obscenity is that. [Interjections.]

Now let me read some letters. One is from the hon Mcebisi Skwatsha, Minister of Transport. This is in 2004. He said he does not like this toll road too much and he expresses some concerns. He goes on to say in the spirit of the ANC at the end "but please note these are my personal views and not necessarily the views of the Premier or the Province". That is what the Minister of Transport says. [Interjections.]

Here is a better one ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT & PUBLIC WORKS: This is the next one that comes along. This comes from Transport Minister Fransman who asked some very good questions [Interjections.] It is in there. That is the complete record. It is in there and you can have this if you want to. Yes. You probably do not know what that is but some people know what it is. He asked a number of very good questions and then he goes on to say ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! There is too much noise here. Please hon Minister Carlisle?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: He goes on to say “my department has received no response to the abovementioned issues. Accordingly my objection to your proposal as outlined...”

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: But you see the Tolling Act says what does the provincial Premier say and that is the one we cannot find. That is the one we cannot find ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon Minister Mr Carlisle, you

have reached the end of your road. Please finish off.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT & PUBLIC WORKS: I make my last speech.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No. Your last sentence.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT & PUBLIC WORKS: My last sentence.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Please Order!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT & PUBLIC WORKS: When a party cannot take a stance on a key issue because it knows if it says we are opposed that President Zuma is going to sharpen his little axe,

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please finish off

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT & PUBLIC WORKS: and if it says yes it is gone. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister Carlisle. Your time

has now really expired.

Debate concluded.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the first order of the day.

ORDER OF THE DAY

Consideration of Report of Budget Committee on the *Division of Revenue Bill* [B2-2013] (NCOP).

THE DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

“The Legislature received the report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Bill conferring authority on the Western Cape Delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill without amendments”.

This mandate has been sent to the NCOP. Are there any objections to the ratification of the conferring of authority on the Western Cape Delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill? No objection.

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Will we break for a while? The bells will be rung before we get together again for the discussion of the NCOP report of last week. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 18:10.