
THURSDAY, 24 NOVEMBER 2022

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 10:00.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

Business of the House was temporarily suspended due to IT problems.

Business of the House resumed.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order! We are now back in the House, and I just want to establish if we are all sorted? Hon Deputy Chief Whip?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Speaker, I have given, and I have

received an indication from one of the people that raised the issue that it has been sorted, yes, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed. Welcome again, hon members. We are now set to proceed. Apologies once more, hon Minister Wenger. May I now call upon you, hon Minister, to address the House, and thank you very much. Over to you.

MUNICIPAL ECONOMIC REVIEW AND OUTLOOK

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, Speaker, hon Speaker, hon Premier, Cabinet Ministers, hon Leader of the Opposition, hon members of the Provincial Parliament, special guests and people of the Western Cape. In September I had the privilege of tabling the Provincial Economic Review and Outlook here in this Parliament, which detailed the impact of national and international developments on our provincial economy and important data on various trends in the province, with the specific focus on our key priorities of Growth for Jobs, Safety and Wellbeing.

Today, I have the honour of tabling its sister publication, the Municipal Economic Review and Outlook, which is an equally impressive and even deeper-dive research report comprising of six documents such as these, covering over a thousand pages. The MERO is a veritable treasure trove of invaluable insights, providing new data and analyses for each of our five

district municipalities, 24 local municipalities, and the City of Cape Town. Making this information easily accessible has been an overarching goal in its compilation and design, because it is the intention of this rich data to inform municipal planning and budgeting through municipal integrated development plans, local economic development strategies, and the budget processes of municipalities. This will enable evidence-based decision making as well as the implementation of the Joint District and Metro Approach to socio-economic development across the province. Equally, this information is freely available to businesses, local communities, NGOs, and anyone else who will benefit from its invaluable insights.

Together the MERO and PERO form the foundation on which we base critical decisions, strategies as well as the next steps of our budget process, which I will speak to when I table the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement (MTBPS) before you later today.

Speaker, the MERO provides our citizens with a wealth of information for a better understanding of the various dynamics in the province. The data contained in the MERO also supports private sector development by providing succinct analysis on the investment potential, comparative advantage and economic specialisation of each region. The MERO continuously sources new data to expand the socio-economic intelligence available to its users. Innovations in this year's MERO include an analysis of COVID-19 vaccinations, the number and average income of taxpayers, local mobile location data for tourism profiles, new investment data, and

housing market studies within the Garden Route and Cape Winelands Districts as well as public expenditure trends.

This data guides us in our quest to build a better future for residents, providing a spatial lens to strategic decisions and shining a light on new opportunities and challenges in each municipality. It empowers us to identify what plans are working and where, so we can replicate them to spread success across the province. It also allows us to measure the impact of the challenges that we face and furnishes us with the evidence we need to formulate responses. Ultimately, the MERO empowers us with the information that we and our municipalities need to govern for growth in the Western Cape.

It shares with us, for example, that between 2011 and 2021 the Western Cape was one of only three provinces that increased its contribution to the National Gross Domestic Product (GDP). Additionally, between 2012 and 2021, the average estimated economic expansion of the Western Cape of 1,2% was marginally higher than South Africa's growth rate over this time at 1%. The Cape Town Metro with the largest population and economy, valued at R502 billion made the largest economic contribution and was the most service-oriented regional economy in the Western Cape in 2021. The West Coast District is expected to have had the largest GDP expansion at 6,2% in 2021, largely owing to significant growth in the agriculture and manufacturing sectors. In the same year, the Cape Winelands district had the third highest GDP growth rate in the province at 5,3% and accounted for the second largest share of Provincial GDP in 2021, with a contribution of

11,1%. In 2021 the Overberg's GDP is estimated to have grown by 5,5%, with contributions from trade, finance and manufacturing sectors, all at 1,2 percentage points. In the same year, the Garden Route's economy is expected to be the third largest contributor to the Western Cape GDP, given the strength of the financial sector.

In 2020, the trade sector had the greatest share of employment in the Western Cape, contributing 22,7%, closely followed by the finance and community services sectors, which contributed 20% respectively. However, we know that we must do much more to shrug off low levels of economic growth, which currently characterises our national economy by enabling breakout economic growth that creates jobs and improves the lives of residents in all districts in the province, and I will elaborate a bit more on this in my next address.

Speaker, as I am sure Minister Ivan Meyer will celebrate, this MERO also sets out how the agriculture, forestry and fishing sector in the Western Cape expanded, with this sector in the Cape Metro increasing by 8,9%, followed by the West Coast at 8,6% and, overall, the expected growth in the sector was 8,3% in 2021. I was particularly impressed with the fascinating information included on overall trade for each of the district municipalities, especially that four out of the five district municipalities, namely the Cape Winelands, Central Karoo, Overberg, and West Coast are net exporters, with the Central Karoo exporting goods to the value of R114 billion, almost three times as much as their import.

Going forward, Governing for Growth will mean that we need to build on this

success and further enhance trade opportunities with international partners, so we can share more proudly Western Cape goods and services with the world.

It will also require that the Western Cape ports, especially the Port of Cape Town, have sufficient capacity with high levels of investment and infrastructure. This is why the Western Cape Government is working closely with stakeholders across the ports logistics chain, all levels of government and the private sector in order to unlock the port's full potential. This remains a top strategic priority and we will continue to govern for growth by advocating strongly for private sector participation at the Port of Cape Town, as is currently the case for the Port of Durban and Ngqura.

Speaker, one port of entry where we are certainly making progress in increasing connections, is Cape Town International Airport, as a result of our successful Cape Town Air Access Initiative. On Thursday evening last week, Premier Winde welcomed the United Airlines direct route from Washington DC to Cape Town, which will not only bring in visitors but also goods in the belly of the aircraft, with a potential of 648 metric tons of cargo between November and March of next year. This is very welcome news given how hard the tourism and hospitality sector was hit during the COVID-19 pandemic and with the new addition of detailed tourism data for each district, using mobile data to provide key insight into tourism trends in the province, the MERO shows us that the green shoots of recovery were evident in the Western Cape in 2021. What I found particularly heartening is the strong

rebound in our domestic visitors, which is reflected by growth in bed nights.

In 2021 the Central Karoo, Cape Winelands and the Garden Route in City of Cape Town experienced an increase of approximately 12% compared to the previous year, and the West Coast 13,5%. To ensure that we govern for growth by boosting these numbers further, we must remove the barriers that stand in the way of our tourism and hospitality sector, which is why we will continue to lobby for a remote working visa, ensure that national visa backlogs are addressed, and that the e-Visa system is running efficiently.

Speaker, as was the case with this year's PERO, the MERO also provides data insights into our priorities of wellbeing and safety. For example, it provides valuable information on access to formal housing, basic services, water, sanitation, and solid waste removal across all districts. Within the Western Cape in 2021, the MERO tells us that 96,6% of residents had access to electricity; 99,4% had access to basic levels of water; 95,2% to basic levels of sanitation and 87% to refuse removal at least once a week. Overall, the Western Cape had the highest Human Development Index (HDI) score in the country at 0,71 out of a possible 1,0, which is also above the global average. This, as we forecast population growth to increase in 2022, as it has over the last decade. With that said, we do also take note of concerning trends identified in the MERO. The first I want to share with you today is the increase in teenage pregnancies. These increased across all districts except for the Overberg district.

The second, which is an ongoing focus of this Government, is the year-on-year increase in multiple categories of crime, following the lifting of the COVID-19 restrictions during 2020 and 2021. These demonstrate the importance of our safety and wellbeing budget priorities in the Western Cape Government and we will be leveraging this data to respond with targeted strategies in our communities.

Speaker, we are also concerned about the impact that deteriorating economic conditions and the budget crunch nationally will have on municipal budgets, especially capital budgets. This is only worsened by the impact of loadshedding, which further erodes revenue streams for municipalities. Municipalities will need to strengthen their own revenue-generating capacity to proactively seek alternative funding for infrastructure developments that will stimulate growth and improve service delivery at a local level.

I can give them mine and Minister Bredell's continued assurance that they will have the support of our Provincial Treasury and our Department of Local Government. We will support vulnerable municipalities to stabilise and we will focus on assisting our Local Government to leverage their services to enable growth in our province.

Speaker, with over a thousand pages of information, it is difficult to do these documents justice in such a short period of time. I certainly encourage members of this House to engage with the content so that we can come up together with innovative solutions to the challenges faced in our

communities.

For our part, the Western Cape Government will be taking this information to every district through the District Coordination Forums. I am also pleased to announce that I will be establishing a Provincial Budget and Governance Forum with all Finance Mayco members across the province, with the first meeting taking place next month. The MERO will be unpacked in this forum, so that we can land responses to municipal budget processes.

Speaker, in my travels across the province... [Interjection.] [inaudible, speaking simultaneously causing audio distortion.] ...wonderful, strong, resilient and innovative people. I feel so lucky not only to call this province home, but also to have the honour of serving its citizens. It is indeed a privilege to work with the Legislature and my Western Cape Government colleagues to ensure that this beautiful and unique place reaches its full potential. At the end of the day, the MERO empowers us with the data and evidence we need to do just this so that we govern for growth, and so that we enable opportunity, and so that we deliver the safety and wellbeing that our communities need to thrive.

It is therefore my pleasure to table the 2020/2023 Municipal Economic Review and outlook for consideration and deliberation in this Parliament. I would like to thank the Local Government Budget Office within the Provincial Treasury for their immense effort in putting together this remarkable research report and especially their commitment to making the

information easily accessible through creative design layout and especially the superb infographics will be shared with all of you shortly.

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to the entire Team Finance under the leadership of the Head Official, David Savage, and the immeasurable contribution made to supporting municipalities with both the PERO and the MERO so that they can govern for growth, and, of course, to all our Mayors, Deputy Mayors and Mayco members as well as Municipal Officials who are on the frontline of service delivery in the Western Cape, thank you for all that you do for the people of this province. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Do not take that away yet. Thank you, sir. We want to make sure the Minister gives us more money! [Laughter] Thank you, hon Minister.

The Municipal Economic Review and Outlook, which is MERO, will now be referred to the relevant Standing Committee for consideration. The Secretary will now read the first Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Introduction and First Reading, Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation [*Bill, B – 2022*] and Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement (MTBPS).

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr Secretary. Hon members, I now recognise the hon Minister of Finance. Minister, over to you.

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor, hoor!

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Speaker. When I tabled the Provincial Economic Review and Outlook in this House in September, I made it clear that we had challenging times ahead of us. The headwinds that confront us are indeed powerful. Our country is experiencing sluggish economic growth, high levels of unemployment and poverty, significant debt-service costs, a rising cost of living and a debilitating energy crisis.

In that speech, however, I also made it clear that there are promising opportunities that present themselves with a clear pathway ahead for us, from recovery to growth. This is a pathway that will deliver hope and confidence for our citizens. As the renowned author Helen Keller so aptly said:

“Optimism is the faith that leads to achievement. Nothing can be done without hope, and confidence.”

This “sober hope”, as I call it, is also evident in the Municipal Economic Review and Outlook, which I have just tabled, as we look to identify new opportunities to leverage in every corner of our province so that no person is

left behind.

Armed with the rich data and analyses from these two reviews, and fully aware of the powerful headwinds that we face, it is now for us to navigate this journey from recovery to growth so that we reach our destination, and as with any difficult journey, we will need to adjust in the face of challenges so that we stay on course and keep our eyes firmly on the horizon and the future we hope to realize.

The Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement which I table before you today, is our opportunity to determine that course as we set sail to deliver a better tomorrow. The adjustment budget, which I also table before you today, is our opportunity to adjust the sails, resolute in remaining on that course and towards our shared goal, and what is that goal? To realise a better, more prosperous future for our citizens; a future with economic growth that leads to opportunity and job creation; a future which is safe and nurturing, no matter where you live; a future where your life journey is filled with care.

As Premier Alan Winde said to this Parliament, these priorities of Growth for Jobs, Safety and Wellbeing are the North Stars of this Government. Together they are the ingredients for real change. They are our reason for hope.

Speaker, as we pursue this difficult journey, we must do so in the context of an ongoing budget crunch in South Africa that continues to affect provincial budgets in particular. Slow to no growth, high levels of Government debt,

bail-outs to failed State-owned Enterprises and state capture have meant that South Africa has less money to spend, precisely at the time when the demand is the greatest.

Over the 2023 Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) as a result of changes to how the equitable share formula is calculated, the Western Cape's percentage of the provincial pie is reduced. This equates to R1,9 billion less over the period for the horizontal division, and may be reduced even further as these changes are phased in.

Fortunately, over this period, additional allocations for service delivery pressures as well as conditional grants allocated to provinces will off-set this decline marginally, allowing for a narrow 2,2% increase in funding for the Province over the MTEF. However, when considering our growing population and the high rate of inflation, which is not being factored into the allocation, it is obvious that we will have to do more with less. This trend is very worrying, and we need to have a frank conversation about this in this House. The consequences of not doing so, especially for poor residents across the country, will be severe.

Through our Fiscal Futures Project in the Provincial Treasury, we are now able to forecast our budget into the future using modelling. According to this modelling and after adjusting for inflation, by expressing the Budget in 2021/22 rands, we estimate that the Provincial Equitable Share for the Western Cape will effectively decline from R54,6 billion in 2021/22 to

R49,6 billion in 2030/2031. Over the same period it is estimated that the City of Cape Town will grow by 882 000 people, equivalent to the population of Mangaung, while the Western Cape will grow by 1,25 million people or the equivalent of the population of the Nelson Mandela Bay Metro. To put it simply, we will likely be receiving less money to respond to what will be significant pressures on frontline services. The consequences of this gap could be catastrophic. The hard truth is that the National Government is trying to clean up the mess created by years of state capture, corruption and mismanagement, by squeezing provinces on the front line. It is a dangerous exercise, and so, it makes me very angry to hear that the National Government's Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, that some R30 billion will be provided to stabilise State-owned Enterprises. If that amount had instead been distributed to provinces to deliver frontline services using the Provincial Equitable Share the Western Cape would have received R3 billion more this year – almost equal to our Health Department's infrastructure budget for the next three years. It is, quite frankly, unjustifiable.

Speaker, another area of concern regarding our Provincial Equitable Share has been the decline in our share of funds distributed by the health component of the formula. Instead of acknowledging and incentivising the innovation which our Department of Health has championed, such as through tele-medicine and home medicine deliveries, we are effectively being penalised for it because the data is excluded in the calculation. Our citizen-centric approach means that we are working hard to prevent the sick from having to wait in long all-day queues at clinics, and instead, where

possible, take healthcare to them, but this aspect of the formula only counts visits at clinics and therefore incentivises the wrong outcomes in our view.

If you, for example, include our additional data, it is clear that the demand on the health platform is at least equal to what it was in 2019 and our budget should reflect that. The reality is that healthcare does not just take place in brick-and-mortar buildings, and this is going to be the reality into the future as new technology emerges.

The PEAR's analysis of health services pressures is therefore outdated and must change, and we will certainly be making this point wherever we can.

Speaker, while we will be putting more pressure on National Government than ever before to change this trajectory, we must ensure that we face up to this challenge. We must as George Washington said, "consult our means rather than our wishes." Making these tough choices and difficult trade-offs will require us to be guided by sound budget principles, so that we can remain on course from recovery to growth.

These principles, in effect, are the compass that we will use to navigate the stormy seas that await us. We will do so firstly by acting to protect our core mandates so that we deliver life-saving and life-changing services such as healthcare, basic education and social services.

Secondly, this Government will focus on programmes that maximise impact

in our priorities of jobs for growth, safety and wellbeing. Within the Western Cape Government this also includes a focus on innovation, organisational culture and effective governance.

Thirdly, we will act to enhance our Government's productivity by relentlessly focusing on doing more with less, delivering value for money projects. We will also continue to review and propose measures to streamline functions and activities across departments, and with municipalities through improved coordination and functional reassignment and, lastly, this Government will act to protect the long-term fiscal sustainability of the Province by ensuring that we rebuild reserves over the medium term, so that we remain resilient to shocks and by continuing with our cost of employment strategy to manage to manage headcount in our administration.

Steered by these principles and guided by our North Star priorities, we have a framework for hope, a plan to prepare for the future that we want to realise, so that every person can live a life that they truly value. To give effect to this framework for hope, the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement adds a total of R1,28 billion to spending over the next three years, bringing the total estimated expenditure for the Western Cape over the 2023 MTEF to R230,82 billion.

Firstly, to deliver on our priority of growth for jobs, we will add R466,5 million to the new Infrastructure and Mobility Departments over the MTEF, while R257,3 million will be added to our Education and Health

Departments to expand critical infrastructure.

Over the 2023 MTEF, we are planning to spend R31,17 billion on infrastructure in the Western Cape. With low levels of economic growth in South Africa, worsened now by loadshedding, it is critical that we help unlock much higher levels of economic growth in the Western Cape, so that we can create opportunity. It is for this reason that we are currently formulating a new Growth for Jobs Strategy for the Province that will be finalised before the end of the financial year. At its core will be the understanding that governments do not create jobs, but rather create the enabling environment for entrepreneurs, business people and citizens to succeed. Through the strategy we want to achieve breakout economic growth and realise a provincial economy that is jobs rich and inclusive, so that citizens across the province, no matter where they live, can benefit, and we want to do this through enablement by providing the foundations for growth, by investing in infrastructure, energy and water, transitioning to carbon zero, unlocking housing opportunities, and building reliable safe roadways, as well as delivering skills for the economy, all the while making it easier for businesses, big and small, to trade in the Western Cape. As we shift to this new strategy over the MTEF, we will look to adjust our sails so that we can achieve this objective and I look forward to making further announcements in the main budget in March next year.

Speaker, I was informed this morning that according to Eskom se Push App, which I am sure you all follow as closely as I do, that South Africa has now

experienced 2 932 hours of load shedding or the equivalent of 122 days of interrupted power supply. Let me repeat that.

We have been deprived, we have deprived our country's economy of the energy it needs to grow for 1/3 of this year, and the year is not over yet. As we entered Stage-5 loadshedding this week it is clearer than ever before that we face a national emergency on the same level as the COVID-19 pandemic and, like the COVID-19 emergency, it requires urgent response. We therefore welcome Premier Alan Winde's establishment of a Cabinet Level Energy Council to coordinate immediate action over the next year as the energy crisis worsens. This Council brings together Government, citizens, businesses and civil society, leveraging the lessons that we learnt during the pandemic.

This coordination with interventions over the short term will be key, while we continue to put the foundations in place over the medium term for an energy resilient future, through the Municipal Energy Resilience (MER) Initiative. This programme is making important strides in unlocking energy opportunities by enabling municipalities, businesses and households to generate, procure and sell power. I would like to use the opportunity to share some of the updates with you this morning.

The key component of the MER Initiative is to enable and unlock municipal independent power producer procurement in candidate municipalities. Following a pre-feasibility analysis, Stellenbosch Municipality, as one of those candidates, will soon be supported with transaction advisory services to

take the work from pre-feasibility through to feasibility procurement and contract finalisation.

In parallel to this process, a business case for a pooled buying mechanism is being developed, aimed at providing a lower risk and lower cost for municipal IPP procurement to multiple Western Cape municipalities. This was a key finding that emerged from our energy workshop, which I hosted shortly after being appointed in this position. To enable the private sector, work is also underway to map out large private sector energy users' current energy use and demand growth projections, as well as the alternative energy supply interventions and plans.

During 2023, the intention is to map this information against municipal grid capacity to enable and fast-track private sector implementation of small-scale embedded generation and electricity-wheeling solutions, where possible, and to support municipal readiness. In the last year, the Western Cape Government has provided funding to 10 municipalities for 16 foundational energy studies, including the development and updating of electricity master plans, and cost of supply studies. We are now also in the process of having standardised legal agreements drafted for the use of municipal grids in wheeling transactions.

Day-by-day these efforts by our MER team are helping to ensure that we have systems in place to generate an additional 500 megawatts of power for the Western Cape by 2025 and we will constantly be looking at ways to focus,

innovate and scale up so that this moves quicker.

Speaker, secondly to deliver on our safety priority, we will allocate an additional R200 million over the MTEF to continue the Law Enforcement Advancement Programme, ensuring that boots on the ground in crime hotspots continue to save lives. This brings the full allocation for LEAP over the 2023 MTEF to R900 million. This is because areas where LEAP officers were deployed showed an overall 3% reduction in the murder rate for the first half of this year, when compared with 2019. In the context of chronic police under-resourcing and high levels of policing and efficiencies, this data-led intervention remains a strategic priority for this Province. We however, know that law enforcement is only one side of the equation, and that we need to address both the causes and the consequences of crime. That is why we will also focus on the violence-prevention pillar of us of our safety response by strengthening relationships between caregivers, better support for youth at risk, reducing alcohol-related harms and preventing gender-based violence. We will do this by using our rich health data so that we can develop targeted responses that work in communities. I am also pleased to note that another critical element of our safety response, which is to leverage our constitutionally mandated police oversight role, is being ramped up with an organisational redesign underway in the Department of Police Oversight and Community Safety to enable this new emphasis, because we know that if the SAPS have the resources they need to do their job properly, many more lives will be saved in the Western Cape.

Speaker, lastly, to give effect to this framework of hope we will add R246,54 million to the wellbeing priority over the MTEF to support a comprehensive response to the very real social distress being experienced in our communities. This includes funding for an additional 170 social workers in the Western Cape. Overall, Health and Education will receive the lion's share of the Western Cape's Budget with a combined allocation of R168,9 billion or 73% of the total budget over the period. Our approach to this priority is to ensure the wellbeing of every citizen throughout their life journey so that they have dignity, so that they are cared for when they are ill or in distress, and so that they have the opportunity to pursue a better future. We will do this by ensuring strong foundations, building social cohesion, meeting basic needs and protecting human rights. We will also improve access to ECD facilities, respond to learning losses in our education system, while protecting and nurturing psychosocial wellbeing in our communities.

A key focus area will also be to re-establish comprehensive healthcare in the context of the normalisation of our COVID-19 response with a new emphasis on non-communicable diseases such as mental health.

I am particularly excited to note the progress made in the preparation of a new tertiary hospital on the Tygerberg Hospital site, with the first National Treasury approval granted in terms of the Private Public Partnership Regulations under the Public Finance Management Act (PFMA). To prepare for this multi-billion-rand partnership we have ring-fenced R995 million in the asset finance reserve over the MTEF so that we are prepared to deliver on

our financial commitments.

Speaker, as we set course, to realise this better future and face the powerful headwinds ahead of us, we also need to ensure that our vessel, our vehicle for delivery can rise above the swells and sail through the storms. This is precisely why Premier Winde has put a strong emphasis on a fourth guiding priority for the Western Cape Government, and that is to ensure innovation, a thriving organisational culture and effective governance in our public service. By leveraging technology through encouraging a citizen-centric approach to our work, and by finding new and better ways to solve problems, we want to empower our employees in the Provincial Government to make an even bigger difference, and, in doing so, we want to ensure that our systems and processes help and not hinder the growth we have set out to achieve. With an exemplary clean audit record in this Province again demonstrated in the audit results of the last financial year, we now also need to step up a gear by ensuring that we move with speed and scale in improving the quality-of-service delivery in the Western Cape. The Province's procurement planning toolkits and in-house developed e-procurement solution will play a critical role in achieving this objective and is a demonstration of how we are embracing technology to improve supply-chain management.

Speaker, as the damning Zondo Commission reports on state capture proved, corruption is the enemy of progress. Corruption, as Pope Francis so powerfully put it, is paid by the poor. While the Western Cape's clean governance record is excellent, we know that we must continually find ways

to strengthen our governance platform, ensuring strong oversight mechanisms and transparency.

Corruption must never be allowed to rear its ugly head in this Government and, to this end, we have and will continue to consider the Zondo Commission recommendations emanating from these reports, finding new ways to implement them where they are applicable, so that we strengthen our institutional processes, remain ahead of the curve and continue to be the best-run government in South Africa.

Speaker, as I mentioned in the start of my address, staying on our course from recovery to growth will require that we adjust our sails in the face of challenges. In the budget process, this is enabled through the tabling of the Western Cape Adjustment Budget, which is before you today. This is a budget that cares, making provision for a net addition of R490,6 million in expenditure for the 2022/23 financial year. In the face of high levels of unemployment brought on by the pandemic, there are many citizens who are battling across our province. They do not know where their next meal will come from. They are unable to find work and to provide for their children.

As a mother, the thought that a malnutrition-induced death of a child is now a real risk in our country, absolutely horrifies me, and it must motivate all of us to act. To ensure that we respond to these pressures and provide the care our citizens deserve, R43,92 million will be allocated to fund additional social workers and alleviate pressure on case loads. A further R25 million

has been allocated in the short term to fund food relief initiatives.

Another key focus area covered by this Adjustment Budget, is our Infrastructure and Mobility Priorities, which are critical for job creation. R96 million is allocated to the Department of Transport and Public Works to, amongst others, improve transport safety, and to cover the operational costs of GoGeorge. A further R128 million will be included for infrastructure programmes, including for the upgrading of road infrastructure.

Overall, in 2022/23, to keep us on our course from recovery to growth, we will have allocated R54,75 billion to our wellbeing priority, R15,87 billion to our growth for jobs priority, and R2,65 billion to our safety priority.

Speaker, embarking on this difficult journey will also require that we prepare to respond to the storms that we had not foreseen emerging, and by making sure that our vessel is robust and can weather any challenge. After experiencing a once-in-a-century drought, and then a once-in-a-century global pandemic we know too well that being prepared is essential. It is for this reason that we will recharge our Provincial Reserves with R1,46 billion being allocated for unforeseen and unavoidable expenses, which includes a contingency for unforeseen disasters, enabling a rapid and decisive response, should they occur.

One of the risks that we will need to manage is the uncertainty created by the ongoing wage negotiations with public sector unions led by the National

Government. While we welcome the commitment by the National Government to cover the cost of any wage agreement reached and to not pass the cost on to provinces, the current allocation for the wage increase is only for the 2022/23 financial year. This means in effect that we have been forced into one year budgeting, unable to plan for spending over the MTEF. This creates high levels of uncertainty for our departments. We are closely monitoring developments and will continue through the Budget Council to engage with the National Government to ensure more certainty can be provided into the future.

For our part, we are also ensuring that we manage our cost of employment spending, which is our largest spending item. If left unchecked, it will result in less money going towards programmes that will make a difference in the lives of our citizens. So far prudent COE management has resulted in the Western Cape Government having the lowest number of employees per capita in comparison with other provinces yet offering undoubtedly the best service packages. We will continue to implement our COE Strategy with care, by taking a differential approach across departments so that they can manage their own headcounts and effectively deliver on our key service delivery priorities.

Speaker, I have today shared how this Government will set out on a pathway from recovery to growth so that we realise a better future for our citizens. There is no doubt that the course ahead of us will have many challenges, and that the headwinds will be strong, but there is every reason to have hope and

confidence.

We have to guide us, our North Star priorities of delivering opportunity, safety and wellbeing for our citizens. We have to steer us, our budget principles, so that we stay on course during challenging times ahead. We have a vessel that is being strengthened to do more with less, so that we provide the quality services our citizens deserve. We can adjust our sails, as we have done now, so that we respond to the needs of our communities and we are ensuring that we can withstand storms that have yet to come so that we will, in the end, reach our goals. This is our framework for hope, a plan to realise a better, more prosperous future for our citizens.

In closing, I would like to recite one of my favourite poems by Emily Dickinson to inspire us on the journey ahead:

“Hope is the thing with feathers that perches in the soul
and sings the tune without words and never stops at all.”

Speaker, it is my immense pleasure to table before the Provincial Parliament today, the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill 2022, the Western Cape Adjustments Estimates of Provincial Revenue and Expenditure, the Western Cape 2022 Draft Notice Additional and Amended Allocations to Municipalities, the Overview of Adjusted and Municipal Infrastructure Investment 2022, and the 2022 Western Cape Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, all of these for discussion and deliberation in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament and its Committees.

I would like to thank our captain, Premier Alan Winde, for his wisdom and leadership and to extend my heartfelt gratitude to my fellow Cabinet colleagues for their support during this budget process. I would especially like to extend a big thank you to our world-class Treasury team who have burned the midnight oil to ensure that we present such excellent documents for your consideration. We applaud their efforts today.

I would also like to thank the Ministry, the A-Team under the leadership of Mr Russel Brueton for the tremendous work they have done in support of these important milestones, and finally, I would like to thank and acknowledge the wonderful support that I received from my family, who are indeed my inspiration. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, the Secretary will now read the Bill a first time.

†Die SEKRETARIS: Wes-Kaapse Aansuiweringsbegrotingswetsontwerp
[W – 2022]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The SECRETARY: Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B – 2022]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr Secretary. The Bill, together with the papers

tabled, will be referred to the relevant Standing Committee for consideration and report.

Hon members, we now move to the Question Paper. Thank you, hon Minister, once more. I know we overworked you this morning but, you know, it comes with the purse. [Laughter.] Thank you.

I see the hand of the hon Deputy-Chief Whip of the ANC.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Speaker... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, a quick one, can I just get a sense, because we have not received this yet in terms of our emails. I just wanted to get a sense whether we will be receiving these documents also online as well as soft copies, and when will that happen?

The SPEAKER: Okay. Alright, thank you, hon the Deputy Chief Whip. Yes, it will be shared with the hon members, if it has not been done so just yet, but it will be shared immediately. Is that all, hon member? Thank you. Oh, the hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, do you want to address the Presiding Officer?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Yes, thank you very much, hon Speaker. I am rising in terms of Rule 66, which is a point of order, but also in terms of Rule 201 but also, hon Speaker, I take it that now we are going to go to Questions for Oral Reply?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mvimbi. Rule 66 and Rule – ja, I like it now that we quote the Rules because at times I have to say, “What rule?” And the member scratches the head. Now I hear that the hon members are quoting the Rules, it is encouraging. So what is the point of order, hon Mvimbi, because we are getting to the questions, that is the next order here before us, hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Okay, let me wait then, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Oh, you are happy now that we go to the Questions?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Yes, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Okay. Hon Minister Meyer, you may address the Presiding Officer.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, I have the Rule Book in front of me. I think we can proceed.

The SPEAKER: [Laughs.] Order, hon Minister, thank you very much, hon

members. May I draw the attention of the hon members that the Question Paper before us, there are questions from 1 to 4, we will not be dealing with those questions. The hon Premier asked to be excused. He has got other commitments.

[Questions 1 to 4 for Oral Reply by the Premier, as printed on the Oral Question Paper of 10 November 2022, to stand over.]

The SPEAKER: From Question Number 8, which is the Questions that stood over from the Sitting of 8 September 2022, as agreed to by the House, is where we will begin, and the first question as it reflects on the Question Paper is by hon Christians. I see hon member, is that a point [Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: On a point of order, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member. Let the Speaker finish and then you will be given the opportunity. The question is by the hon Christians to the hon Minister Allen, who is the Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety. Before I recognise the hon Minister, there is a point of order that is raised by hon member Mvimbi. What is your point of order, hon member Mvimbi?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. As we are dealing with Questions for Oral Reply and as you have indicated that it was a continuation of the meeting that was abruptly aborted in the previous Sitting

of 10 November, firstly, as we are actually going to continue, we will actually have expected maybe there was going to be a report as to the outcomes of the reasons for the abortion of that previous session, but also, hon Speaker, noting further that there were the Questions for Oral Reply, there were questions that were going to be raised to the hon Premier, and the hon Premier has chosen not to be present at the meeting for the reason that you have actually expected, but also, hon Speaker, this is a show of disrespect for this august House for the Premier not to be present, and you know also, hon Premier, that there is a practice – although it is not written – that if an hon member, especially the member of the Executive, is not going to be present, he or she sometimes makes a courtesy call or a report or requests the particular members that have asked those questions, if those questions can actually be referred to. So, then I would like, hon Speaker, to put it on record that I... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member. Yes, you may proceed, to conclude?

Mr L L MVIMBI: I said that myself as one of the people who are on the list in terms of asking questions, there has been no communication that has been sent to me, either formally or informally, either in writing, because normally some of these are done in a courteous manner. I have asked Questions for Oral Reply in the past to quite a number of Executive members. Those Executive members will either make a courtesy call to me and say that “please, can we refer this”, and in most instances I have always actually complied with their request that they said, because I think it was just in the

manner in which you all want to be cooperative. But then, hon Speaker, it is very disappointing that the Number 1 of the Province, when he is supposed to actually answer in this House, he chooses first to be absent... [Interjection.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): On a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: ...and he also makes no contact with the people that have asked questions.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mvimbi. Order, hon Chief Whip, will you please take your seat, I will recognise you now. Firstly the hon member is correct, to say that ordinarily a member that will not be present will give the questions if that is so, if he or so deems fit, to a member of the Executive to deal with them, but there was a message by the hon Premier to that he will not be able to join us here this morning, which I then noted as a request made to me formally, but also if I could just say I was not the Presiding Officer on the Sitting of 10 November. That then places the responsibility on the Presiding Officer of that day to deal with whatever else that might be necessary emanating from that Sitting. I have, however, as the Chief Presiding Officer and as the Speaker of this House, and this Parliament, convened a meeting with the respective Whips, the Chief Whips of the political parties and the leaders of minority parties, where we deliberated on how this House should conduct its business, and that is in

keeping with the statutes, but of course our Standing Rules that are here should guide this session, and I think that engagement brought some light into how this House should not allow itself to degenerate into what may have been the unfortunate situation of the 10th.

Now we did not deal with the specificity of what transpired on the 10th because that was not a tribunal, nor some kind of an inquiry, but I have a responsibility as the Speaker, and of course when I preside, it is the responsibility like any other Presiding Officer to ensure that there is a spirit of collegiality, the spirit of this Parliament, being a democratic Parliament, a multi-party Parliament of all of us as the respective members coming from all the different seven parties here. I would not want to be drawn into why the Premier cannot answer here. The Acting Chief Whip is now going to address the Speaker.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Chair. My point of order was on Rule 66(3) since member Mvimbi was perhaps still reading the whole of Rule 66 in the book, and it relates to a matter that relates to Procedure, Practice and Operations of this House and other matters and three Ministers did indicate to this House that they are asking for the Oral Questions to stand over. That was because the questions on the Order Paper for today, are from a previous Order Paper. As is the general practice in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, should a Minister not be able to be in the House, they ask for the respective questions to be stood over. Therefore, the previous point of order is actually not a point of order. Interpellations as well as the

Questions to the Premier and two other Ministers are standing over for today and the sequence of proceedings was earlier today adopted in this House, and no-one objected to that. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Acting Chief Whip. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. I see all the hands virtually and here. There was a hand by the hon, the Leader of the Opposition and then there is another hand from the hon, the Deputy Chief Whip of the Opposition. I recognise the hon, the Leader of the Opposition.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Speaker, thank you, and greetings to members. Speaker, thank you, and greetings to members. Speaker, just to address you on this point, I would like to thank you for explaining your attempts to convene a meeting so that we maintain order in the House. I think all of us have an interest in making sure that what happened at the last session is not repeated and that we establish order and decorum, but that we also look at the issues which lead to these situations, but I think your efforts are appreciated in terms of that particular intervention responding to the letter, which we wrote to you.

The second point is that as hon Mvimbi has indicated, there is a precedent in the House, which I think is covered by Rule 66(3) in the sense that there is communication from the member of the Executive, including the Premier, to the member concerned. In this particular instance – and I speak here for myself as well – there was no communication from the Premier to myself

making that request. We all know that the President never misses questions in the House, and I think that we need to raise our concern that the Premier is accountable to this House. He was elected by this House and needs to follow the convention which has been set in this House. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon, the Leader of the Opposition. Just to address that point, hon, the Acting Chief Whip, ordinarily Ministers would talk to the members asking questions. I also want to ask now, as the Speaker, the Leader of Government Business to address this House.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker and thank you to the members who asked these particular questions. There is a convention in this Cabinet but also in this House, that whenever a member of the Executive is not available, that that member makes contact through the office of the various members. That convention still stands. That convention is the practice, and it is a practice of good governance. There are some specific circumstances that has led to this situation of the Premier having another commitment, and that commitment he has made towards meeting people, but if the situation was under control in the previous session, it would not have been happening what is currently happening, so we have to collectively, and as the Leader of Government Business, I take collective responsibility for what has happened and the Presiding Officer for what has happened, and all members in this House were jointly responsible for what has happened in this House, and so that situation has led to the current situation where the Premier is not here today. But unlike what is happening in some other parts of the

country, this is the only Premier that receives Questions to the Premier Without Notice and he is committed, as per the values of this Government, to accountability. He will come back to this House. He is not avoiding accountability. The principle of this Cabinet is accountability and integrity, and the Premier will come back to the House at an appropriate stage. If there was any misunderstanding in some communication as Leader of the Government Business, I apologise, and I ask us to proceed.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon, the Leader of Government Business. There is an apology, hon, the Leader of the Opposition, and the rest of the hon members in the House.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Apology accepted, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, that is leadership, and I really appreciate the collective wisdom that the leaders of this House are able to showcase so that we are able to have a Parliament those functions, without us being seen as one of the worst examples we have seen elsewhere in the world. May I now at this point proceed. Thank you.

Question standing over from Thursday, 8 September 2022, as agreed to by the House:

The SPEAKER: Then the first question by hon Christians to the hon, the Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety, the hon Minister Allen.

Are you able to address us, hon Minister Allen?

8. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety:

Why were law enforcement officers called out to the Heathfield High School on 16 August 2022?

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:
Speaker, I trust that I am audible.

†Die SPEAKER: Reg so.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The SPEAKER: [Right so.] You may proceed, hon member.

†Die MINISTER VAN POLISIEOORSIG EN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID:
Baie, baie dankie, Speaker.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:
Thank you, thank you Speaker.]

Speaker, through you, I wish to thank member Christians for this particular question with regard to why law enforcement officers were called out to Heathfield High School on 16 August.

There is a memorandum of agreement between the Western Cape Education Department and the City of Cape Town Law Enforcement Department where law enforcement is deployed via the school resource officers at schools identified by the Department. The Western Cape Education Department and the management of Heathfield School met with law enforcement management and requested law enforcement to assist with challenges where learners enter the school with dangerous weapons and drugs. What we have further noted in that there has been communication via the Minister of Education in the Western Cape and where he indicated that on 17 August, the following day after that particular happening, that parents were informed that they should keep their children at home for that particular day...

[Audio stops abruptly – problems with connectivity.] [01:02:06]

The SPEAKER: Are you load-shedding, sir?

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:
I think, am I audible now, Speaker? So sorry.

The SPEAKER: May I request, for the purposes of Hansard, and also the member that has asked the question that you try and find a stable network. If you are unable to proceed, we will not be able to hear what is being shared,

which creates a challenge also for the hon Christians and other members.

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:
Speaker...

The SPEAKER: Just test whether you can continue smoothly. You can try again, hon Minister.

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:
Speaker, I trust that you can hear me now, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Yes, clearly sir, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: We sadly have a scenario where Eskom is putting many, many residents at risk due to a disruption in our electricity but let me continue.

Speaker, with regard to what has happened, I have indicated initially that there is a memorandum of agreement in place, but also that the management of the school, together with law enforcement management, requested law enforcement to assist with challenges where learners enter the school with dangerous weapons and drugs. The MEC, the Minister for Education, is also on record with regard to his appeal to parents to play a key role towards ensuring that their children take their education and safety extremely serious and that learners do not engage in such unlawful actions again, and

obviously, Speaker, we must say that those that continue to disrupt the school environment should be facing disciplinary or further legal consequences in such matters. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. I know that the first member to ask a question will be the member who raised the question in the first place. It is okay. You are safe here, and then afterwards I will recognise the next Speaker will be hon Sayed and I do not see other hands. So in that order, hon Christians?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Speaker, and thank you to the Minister for that answer. Minister, the problem is when we look at the Heathfield High School, you know, members in this House play politics with the lives of our children and because there was a lot in the media. My question just to the Minister is, access control, you know, the school should have access control because I believe a lot of these criminal events involved people, they were residents and not students. So, the question is, if we look at the safety aspect, access control is so important. The last thing is that most probably - I hope that it is peaceful now - learners can write in peace, their Matric exams, and all the other examinations. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:
Thank you so much for that particular follow-up question. I totally hear

member Christians in this regard and it is for that very reason that action was taken quickly with the request for law enforcement to assist with the challenges where learners enter the school with dangerous weapons and drugs and I think the context is further, that due to the ongoing gang-related issues within that particular community, which has filtered onto the school premises, the school management team, together with law enforcement agencies and the Department implemented various safety control measures at the school in order to protect teachers and learners. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, thank you to member Christians for the question. It is deeply disappointing though, that he makes an inference about members in the House playing politics on the issue, as opposed to going to the root causes of the problem, but that is fine.

Chair, just in response to the response from the Minister, we do understand that law enforcement officers can be deployed to schools as part of the school resource officers, but, however, this particular situation does not seem normal, to see such a high deployment at one particular school. Can we get a sense from the Minister, can we expect these officers to be deployed in various other schools in the Western Cape where gangsterism and drugs are a major concern? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed. Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:
Thank you so much for that additional question. I think based on the comments that were made by member Sayed now, we note that concerns over school safety and gang-related incidents at this particular school are sadly not new. It is a long-standing issue causing great concern for the community. The previous school management further also struggled with this particular challenge.

In this regard further, Speaker, a search and seizure operation which was conducted by the South African Police Service and a variety of items were confiscated from learners, which we have again seen that when those elements are infiltrating a particular school and carrying dangerous weapons, it can never be tolerated, and the steps that have been taken by school management are in line with the Department's policies and processes and were requested and welcomed by parents, teachers and learners.

The Department supports the steps taken to ensure that learners and teachers are safe. We do regular assessments with regard to ongoing violence and gangsterism within various communities and, where it affects a school, appropriate action will be taken to first and foremost make sure that we safeguard our learners and our teachers and our communities towards ensuring that education continues. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I have the following hon members expressing interest to speak, and that is hon Bosman, followed by hon Marais, in that order.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon Speaker, and good afternoon.

Hon Speaker, through you I would like to ask the Minister whether the Department is able to assist and develop a joint programme with the Department of Education in the Western Cape to perhaps look at working with the Learner Representative Council at different schools across the province, but focusing on this school to look at how students can also address some of the safety issues that affect their peers, and instead of law enforcement coming in, to assist the school in managing the contraband that is brought into the school. Is there a way of including the leadership at the school also to avoid some of our members getting involved in schools as well?

Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Bosman. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:
Thank you so much, hon member Bosman, for that particular question.

Yes, indeed if we consider the whole of government approach where each and

every department has a key role towards safety, that input is definitely welcomed and it will be taken on because the influence of gangsterism and substance abuse and what that is having on truant behaviour, absenteeism and fear in schools, we want to make sure that the steps are taken to support all those towards creating peaceful, productive and a stable school environment.

So, thank you so much for that particular input and question. It is definitely in line with us prioritising safety across our province, including in our schools. Thank you.

†The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Agbare Marais. [Hon Marais.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, this thing has been coming on a long way now about problematic schools. We need a much bigger holistic approach to this. You know if we identify schools as problematic, there must be separate solutions and not a generalised solution to crime and drugs and gangsters at certain schools. We can conclude, after identifying these schools we can conclude a contract [Inaudible.] – oh, sorry, what is happening?

†The SPEAKER: It is on your side, agbare [hon.]

Mr P J MARAIS: A rapid response unit that we can contractually employ for rapid response to these high-risk schools. We cannot have a one shoe, one

size fits all approach to law and order in this country. There are hotspots, like there were COVID hotspots there are also crime hotspots. We need a different approach. I want to suggest to the Minister to have his Department look at budgetary constraints with employing a rapid response agency that can within minutes respond to such actions at schools which they have identified. Our people, Minister, are flocking, I have seen – sorry?

†Die SPEAKER: Agbare, waar is die vraag?

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The SPEAKER: Honourable, where is the question?]

Mr P J MARAIS: That is the †vraag [question.] Will you consider it, Minister, to have a rapid response unit, instead of just SAPS, that can quickly respond to such happenings with gangsterism involved at our schools?

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie, agb lid Marais. Minister?

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marais. Minister?]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:
Thank you so much for that particular question, hon member Marais.

Yes, indeed we have seen that the events that took place at Heathfield High confirmed the need to ensure that access control and the increase of monitoring at schools should always be prioritised and the Department will continue to prioritise the safety of learners and teachers and will be continuing to liaise with law enforcement and the SAPS regarding further safety measures at school.

I do know that the one particular input that hon member Marais made now with regard to a rapid response, I am delighted to actually provide feedback that when we considered the LEAP units that were deployed in our hotspot areas, we have already established two reaction units that are available to assist when such matters arise, which could speak to the very fact that it is rapid indeed, to hon member Marais, through you, hon Speaker. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister and to the hon members.

Now we move to Question number 5. That is a new question by hon member Brinkhuis to the Hon Minister of Mobility.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Sorry, hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, let me finish, if I may, and then I will recognise you. Thank you very much, hon the Leader of the Opposition.

Now this is a question by hon member Brinkhuis to the hon Minister of Mobility, Minister Mitchell. Before I recognise the hon Minister, let me hear from the hon the Leader of the Opposition. Is that a point of order, sir?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, yes, it is one in regard to Rule 66. Hon Speaker, one notices that when you as the Presiding Officer address members of the Executive Council, the word "Minister" is used. I think as we are all aware the Provincial Constitution, which has been certified by the Constitutional Court, refers to MECs as "Provincial Ministers".

My concern is that when the terminology of "Minister" is used, there is potential for confusion because in South Africa we have National Ministers, we have MECs and we have Provincial Ministers as per the Western Cape Constitution.

So, I would just like to request that you consider this issue, not necessarily respond to it now, but to actually come back to the House in regard to the terminology used, as I think we should be consistent with the Provincial Constitution. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon the Leader of the Opposition. If I may just deal with this, but I think now. The same Constitution, the Provincial Constitution, which I do read quite often, I cannot quote the particular

section, it then says that therefore the members of the Executive Council in the Western Cape shall then be referred to as "Ministers".

So, I do not see the conflict in terms of the Constitution of the Western Cape as it stands, with the remarks and the reference thereof to the Cabinet members in this province.

So if there is any contest I think that could be something that could be petitioned with the Constitutional Court, quite frankly, but if there is any conflict that this House could deal with it will now be up to the members of the House collectively, whether they want to amend their own Constitution to deal with those matters, but as I sit here as the Presiding Officer I may not assume the authority that I do not have. I now want to also request... the Leader of Government Business is raising his hand.

†Die LEIER VAN REGERINGSAKE: Agb Speaker, ek sit hier met die Provinsiale Grondwet van die Wes-Kaap, spesifiek Hoofstuk 4 van die Wes-Kaapse Provinsiale Grondwet en soos die agb lid van die amptelike Opposisie aandui, hy is korrek, hierdie Grondwet is gesertifiseer deur die Grondwetlike Hof, wat die hoogste hof is in Suid-Afrika, en die bepalings van die Provinsiale Grondwet waaronder hierdie Raad funksioneer in samewerking met die Grondwet van die Republiek van Suid-Afrika, en toe hierdie Grondwet gesertifiseer was deur die Grondwetlike Hof, was die bepalings van die Nasionale Grondwet die primêre oorweging om seker te maak dat daar geen konflik is tussen die Nasionale Grondwet en die Provinsiale Grondwet

nie.

Die sertifisering wat gedoen was deur die Grondwetlike Hof het bepaal dat in terme van die Wes-Kaapse Regering die Uitvoerende Gesag sal bestaan uit, en ek lees Artikel 35(1) en (2):

"Die uitvoerende gesag van die Wes-Kaap berus by die Premier."

(2): "Die Premier oefen die uitvoerende gesag gesamentlik met ander Provinsiale Ministers uit deur – “

onder andere die volgende funksies.

Maar ons is nie getroud met titels nie, maar ons is getroud met die bepalings van die Grondwet en ons eerbiedig die grondwetlike bestel in Suid-Afrika.

Daarom, vanuit 'n pragmatiese oogpunt, wanneer ons vergader – agb lid Sayed, wanneer ons vergader met ons nasionale kollegas, die Nasionale Ministers,

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: Hon Speaker, I'm sitting here with the Provincial Constitution of the Western Cape, specifically Chapter 4 of the Western Cape Provincial Constitution and as the hon

member of the official Opposition indicates, he is correct, this Constitution had been certified by the Constitutional Court, that is the highest court in South Africa, and the provisions of the Provincial Constitution under which this Council functions in cooperation with the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, and when this Constitution was certified by the Constitutional Court, the provisions of the National Constitution were the primary consideration to ensure that there is no conflict between the National Constitution and the Provincial Constitution.

The certification that was done by the Constitutional Court determined that in terms of the Western Cape the Executive Authority will consist of, and I'm reading Section 35 (1) and (2):

"The executive authority of the Western Cape is vested in the Premier."

(2): "The Premier exercises the executive authority together with the other Provincial Ministers by – “

amongst others the following functions.

But we are not married to titles, but we are married to the provisions of the Constitution and we honour the constitutional system in South Africa.

Therefore, from a pragmatic viewpoint, when we assemble – hon member

Sayed, when we assemble with our national colleagues, the National Ministers,] when I write a letter to Minister Thoko Didisa, I will write "MEC" to create no confusion. We have no problem to recognise if they were legitimately elected. In terms of constitutional democracy, I am happy to do that.

When we write letters to anybody outside in the national domain, we are not married to titles, but we are married to two things, we have two wives, two husbands. One is constitutional democracy [Interjections.], that is the first wife, and that wife is the senior wife.

†'n AGB LID: [Lag.] Sê vir hulle.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[An HON MEMBER: [Laughs.] Tell them.]

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: The second wife is also a senior in the household of democracy [Interjections.] and that is service delivery to the people.

An HON MEMBER: Yes! [Laughs]

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: The wife that does not matter is the title [Interjections.]. So, this is what this Government is committed to

and hon member Dugmore was a Minister in this House, he never objected during that time, but I will respectfully respect him as a former Provincial Minister in this constitutional dispensation.

So let us clear this forever. We are not married to titles, we are married to the Constitution and to service delivery. You can even call us many other names, we will proceed in respecting the Constitution, but what is paramount is that we serve the people and not walk around with our titles. I thank you, Chair.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I just want to request – hon the Leader of the Opposition, if you could log out from one of your other devices and maintain one for the purposes of the sitting because that is why there is a bit of an echo whilst you connect. Thank you, sir, and I would like to request that.

Before I give any other hon member an opportunity, I just want to thank the Leader of Government Business. I think the reason why I have allowed you, sir, is because it responded to a question raised with the Speaker and I thought, having raised that question, hon the Leader of the Opposition, it necessitated a response and I guess that response, in fact I do not guess, I think that response suffices as a substantive response to the question that was raised.

May I then, if there is no further point of order ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Is that another [Inaudible.] – alright, your device
...[Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: I see your hand, hon member Bosman, but I am still dealing with hon the Leader of the Opposition and then I will come to you immediately. Hon the Leader of the Opposition?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, just to inform you that I am only on one device. It might be another member who has two devices. I have actually switched off my phone completely, so I am just on the laptop.

Hon Speaker, thank you, I really do not want to be labouring the point
...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, there is one by yourself, the one that you are speaking with, and then there is one that says "C Dugmore guest".
[Inaudible.] you to exit that one.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Okay. Chair, as I said I joined initially

on my phone, and I have now exited that ...[Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: We will help you then remove the other one.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITIONS: Ja, please do. Thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, yes, not to belabour the point, but I think it is important that we just clarify this. I think the Leader of Government Business stopped short of actually quoting Section 42(1) of the Provincial Constitution, which refers to the Provincial Cabinet and that section says:

"The Provincial Cabinet consists of the Premier as head and no fewer than five and no more than 10 Provincial Ministers."

And then it further goes on to say, 42(2):

"The Premier appoints the Provincial Ministers."

So I think it is important that the Leader of Government Business is familiar with the provisions, but as I said, Chair, I do not want to belabour the point, I am just, and I appreciate what the Leader of Government Business has said in regard to when they are in meetings with National and how they address

correspondence, but I can assure you that I have received correspondence in in which the Provincial Ministers referred to themselves as "Ministers".

So, I am just raising it, possibly we can deal with this issue at a later date, but we are part of a united South Africa which is governed by a Constitution. This Constitution has been certified ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: ... by the Province and that refers to "Provincial Ministers". Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, sir. Thank you, hon the Leader of the Opposition, may I say this? It does appear that there might be an appetite from your side, hon the Leader of the Opposition, to be involved in the Rules review as we currently are dealing with a number of areas in the Rules because as the Chairperson of the Rules Committee, it is the first time that it is now raised substantively that it is actually an issue, the manner in which you have raised, but I am so happy as well that the hon the Leader of the Opposition, the Leader of Government Business, indicated that they do not mind whichever way that we want to refer to the members of the Executive, but I think in terms of the Standing Rules, hon the Acting Chief Whip and the Chief Whip of the Opposition, let us rethink about this whole matter whether is it something that we want to deal with in terms of the Standing Rules and write "Provincial" and then write "Minister".

So that if the Order Paper serves it then says, "the Provincial Minister" instead of just "Minister", but that will be something that the Rules Committee has to decide in terms of what this House might be seeking to address.

Hon member Bosman and then we proceed thereafter.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon Speaker.

I did also want to raise, it is very difficult to hear and follow the proceedings because it sounds like the hon Leader of the Opposition is in his own echo chamber this morning.

Hon Speaker, I also rise on Rule 66, 3.A. I think we need to ask whether the point of order is pertinent to the proceedings taking place today, as the hon member Sayed reminded us earlier and hon member Mvimbi, we do observe precedents in this House and I think this matter is something that has come up before and there was a ruling made, and we need to ask that the hon Leader of the Opposition allows for the proceedings to continue, especially with the beautiful explanation given by the Leader of Government Business. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Bosman.

I think that undertaking was made by the hon the Leader of the Opposition, that he is happy to proceed. The responses by the hon the Leader of Government Business is sufficient. Notwithstanding that, the matter will have to be further deliberated at a different stage, which we will do as Parliament, which is the standing matter that could be entertained by the Rules Committee, which is empowered to do so. Thank you very much for that.

I now know that we have really spent quite some time on a matter which does not form part of what the order of business is about, but I had to make that determination and obviously collectively we dealt with that matter.

The next question, as I indicated earlier, is by the hon member Brinkhuis to hon the Minister of Mobility. I now recognise Hon Minister Mitchell.

5. Mr K Brinkhuis to ask Mr D G Mitchell, Minister of Mobility:

(1) Whether the Province has implemented safety interventions to stop robberies on Golden Arrow busses; if so, what are the relevant details.

(2) whether he received any feedback from Golden Arrow on the effectiveness of surveillance cameras installed on busses; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Am I audible?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you are, hon Minister, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

Firstly, thank you to hon member Brinkhuis for the question. Part (1) of the question. The increase in criminal acts on GABS buses cannot be tolerated and requires a coordinated response from all spheres of government, SAPS, other law enforcement agencies and Golden Arrow Bus Services itself.

The Department has taken action by installing CCTV cameras on the GABS fleet and to date 844 vehicles have been fitted with CCTV, a fleet of 1 900 buses. Gabs have taken steps to install drop safes and driver panic buttons on their fleet, which complements the CCTV camera systems.

Part (2) of the question, hon Speaker. The CCTV cameras are intended to identify suspects, provide crucial evidence for prosecution and provide law enforcement authorities with new insights into the methods used by criminals.

Records indicate that the first conviction assisted by CCTV footage was handed down on 23 June 2022. The sentence was 10 years with five years suspended and, hon Speaker, there are a further two sentences pending, and 11 suspects have been arrested using the CCTV footage to identify them. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Mitchell. Hon member Brinkhuis?

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Good morning to you and good morning to all the members.

Yes, thank you very much to the Minister of Mobility for that answer and for that response. Yes, we have seen in the last days that there has been considerable reduction in crime on the buses, especially the Golden Arrow buses in the mornings. So, the cameras that have been installed on these buses seems to be quite effective and we want to say thank you very much to the Department for the rapid response and, yes, I have got no follow-ups, hon Speaker. Thank you very much.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Brinkhuis.

I have the following hands: the hand of hon member Mackenzie and then I hear hon member Mvimbi. You might, if you wish, then follow after hon member Mackenzie, in that order.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thanks, hon [Inaudible.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: [Inaudible.] funding for this project or are we getting funding from National Government for this project? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Was that a question, hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Yes [inaudible.] hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: We could not hear a word, sir. Let me just check again with the Hansard team. I do not think they heard anything. Ja, nothing. May I request that you find a better spot? We will proceed with hon member Mvimbi and then once you have comfortably found a comfortable, a better spot, then we will give you an opportunity.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I also was struggling to hear hon member Mackenzie and I hope he is also not going to raise the question I am going to raise, which is fine.

I was listening to the Minister's response where he was saying that they have actually installed these cameras. I just want to check from the hon Minister, was this at the account of the R1.2 billion that is being given to Golden Arrow, or was it over and above that amount? Thank you [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mvimbi. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and thank you very much, hon Mvimbi.

The R1.2 billion allocated to Golden Arrow gets transferred rand for rand for that subsidised commuter fares to Golden Arrow. If the hon member Mvimbi recalls last year when I tabled the budget and in the previous years, the Department has always made significant contributions to the safety of public infrastructure and in this case busses to ensure that commuters are kept safe, but the amounts I will supply to the House. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

Hon Mackenzie, are you now in a better position?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Covered, Chairperson.

The SPEAKER: You are covered?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Speaker, covered, ja.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mackenzie.

The SPEAKER: [Inaudible.] we are on the same page. Alright, that is fine.

Now I wish to recognise hon member Marais, †agbare [honourable.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you very, hon Speaker.

My question is really not, I never pose catch you out questions. My question is meant to stabilise and to come with fresh ideas.

Now I wanted to ask the Minister, when we look at the whole issue of taxis, which is also transport regulations; do you think that passengers should have a bill of passenger rights? And do you think your Department can come with legislation to this House? They pass a Bill on what are the rights of a passenger getting into a taxi. Which will force taxis to conform because there is now a legal sanction? Overcrowding, smoking in taxis, rude behaviour, loud music in the taxis people do not like.

There are a lot of things that had caused discomfort to people in these taxis. Did you ever consider having a bill of rights for passengers and then that bill of rights will be pasted in each taxi, with phone numbers for any transgression where the drivers can be reported? Thank you.

†Die SPEAKER: Dankie, agbare.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The SPEAKER: Thank you, honourable.] Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and thank you very much to hon member Marais for that question and for the suggestion and comments.

I wholeheartedly agree with hon member Marais and I think that is something that as a department we can definitely look at because ultimately as a government and as the Western Cape Government, we need to ensure that we have safe, reliable public transport, and that could be one of the key contributors to that, to achieve that.

I just want to touch on the current legislation and perhaps that is also, hon member Marais, perhaps for another question or a follow-up question in the future, but I know that the legislation provides for me as the Provincial Minister, hon member Dugmore, to impose certain conditions before operating licences are issued to operators, minibuss taxi operators.

So perhaps the legislation already covers for introduction of that very, very significant, and which I think is a very good proposal, but if not that is definitely something I would be willing to look at. So, thank you very much, hon member Marais. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

I wish to establish whether there are any other hon members that wish to ask a question? We are done. Thank you?

Thank you, hon members, that concludes Question 5. Thank you, hon Minister.

I now recognise hon Minister Simmers, the Minister of Infrastructure, to a question that is asked by hon member Bakubaku-Vos. Hon the Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP [DA]: Thank you, hon Speaker.

Earlier I indicated it was three Ministers. Minister Simmers is one of those three Ministers. I do know that Minister Simmers did communicate with the respective member. Whether the respective member has had an opportunity to look at her emails or not I am not sure, but I do know about Minister Simmers's indication that he will not be in the House today and request that that question is held over. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Yes. Thank you, Madam Acting Chief Whip. That is noted and of course it was shared with the House. Duly noted.

The next question is the question by... that is Question 7. Can we just again refresh the memory of all members. The questions that have been requested to stand over vis-à-vis the questions that will proceed. We also do not have much time now, we are almost at the tail end of the question.

Table staff, please.

Madam Chief Whip, you can sit down, sir, the Chief Whip is ready to give us that list, thank you?

The CHIEF WHIP [DA]: Thank you, hon Speaker. The three was the Premier.

The SPEAKER: Yes.

The CHIEF WHIP [DA]: It was Minister Simmers and I do also have knowledge of Minister Mbombo, who is with the Premier, with the Deputy President at the moment in the respective meeting. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Madam Acting Chief Whip. I can imagine how far can you go to tell us where they are and what they are doing. [Laughs.] But thank you very much for that detail.

So, we now know that every other Minister is expected to respond to questions if we still have the time to accommodate that.

Now the next question is Question 7 by hon members Bans to the hon Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety. I now recognise you, hon Minister Allen again.

7. MS A P Bans to ask Mr R I Allen, Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety

(a) What steps have been taken to address the high number of child murders and abductions, (b) how does the Safety Plan prioritise the safety for children and (c) what are the details of the (i) programmes and (ii) budget

associated with it?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:
Thank you so much, hon Speaker. I wish to express my appreciation to hon member Bans for asking this particular question.

I have engaged the South African Police Service and the first part will be a direct response from the South African Police Service. Proper prosecutorial led investigations are being done on a number of cases. Continuous awareness campaigns are conducted to alert children and their parents of the dangers and preventative measures to be taken. Specific focus will also be placed on the safety of our children during the 16 days of activism, as well as the festive season operations.

Having stated that, hon Speaker, we further note that in our role in terms of our oversight mandate and where we are working with various stakeholders, we are very specific in highlighting the role and the preventative measures that should be taken, but this is part further to the question that I would appreciate if it can be directed further to the Ministers of Social Development as well as Cultural Affairs and Sport, but I want to state that the Safety Plan seeks to ensure that all residents regardless of age, gender, creed, language, culture, background and/or sexual orientation, live in a safe environment and in a dignified manner.

Hon Speaker, this plan has two components. One is the violence prevention

and the other is the law enforcement. This is intended to ensure a whole of government approach is employed and the Department of Social Development, Cultural Affairs and Sport, Health, through their various programmes, play a significant role in the protection, support and nurturing of children.

Hon Speaker, just earlier on we further heard from the Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities, hon Minister Mireille Wenger, with regard to the tabling of the midterm budget policy statement in which she stated that it is a budget that cares and I want to re-emphasize that the amounts that are being budgeted for R54,75 billion on our well-being priority, R15,87 billion on our growth for jobs priority and R2,65 billion on our safety priority, and as indicated various departments all have a role to play in creating safer communities so that our children are able to live and play in safe environments and grow up to ultimately be the best that they possibly can be. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

I now recognise the hon member Bans. Hon Bans, are you ready?

Mr A P BANS: [No audible response.]

The SPEAKER: Alright. Are there other hon members who wish to participate in the question? Alright, none.

Thank you, hon Minister. We now conclude with Question 7.

We move to Question 9 by hon member Christians, who is here with us in the House, to the hon Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety. I now recognise the hon Minister.

QUESTION 9

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:
Thank you so much for the question.

The question that was posed by hon member Christians was with regard to whether LEAP officers are a preventative or a reactive measure to combat crime in the hotspots in the City of Cape Town [Inaudible.] state categorically once again that the Western Cape Safety Plan objective is to reduce murders by 50% in 2029. The law Enforcement Advancement Plan was established as one of the Safety Plan's key interventions to combat crime.

This intervention allows for proactive deployment of LEAP officers to the predetermined crime hotspots. So, it is definitely to be taken in a proactive and not a reactionary point of view to combat crime. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

I now recognise hon member Christians.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Speaker, and hon Minister, thank you for that answer.

I know that the LEAP officers do make a difference, but please explain to me the increase in crime, especially contact crimes in the Western Cape. Are the LEAP officers playing a role there because we know that the Government is talking about reducing the murder rate by 50%, but now it seems to me that other crime is out of hand. 21.5% of crime increase when it comes to contact crimes. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:
Thank you ...

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians.

Sorry, hon Minister, will you please hold back. Hon the Deputy Chief Whip of the ANC?

The CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Hon Speaker, just a point of order and I think maybe the Table staff may have missed it, but the hon member Mvimbi has had his hand up for quite some time. I do not think he has been recognised. Thank you.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Apologies. It is a previous hand. My sincere apologies, hon Speaker and hon member Sayed.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mvimbi for that.

I thought it was [Inaudible.] hand because it was static, but thank you for that and thanks to the hon the Deputy Chief Whip.

The hon member Bosman, you want to come in, sir?

Mr G BOSMAN: No, sir, I thought we are moving on to the next person to ask a question to the Minister after he has responded.

The SPEAKER: Okay. Alright, now, hon Minister. Thank you, hon member Bosman.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:
Thank you so much, hon Speaker.

I appreciate that follow-up. It is a follow-up that actually speaks directly to what we have seen yesterday.

Hon Speaker, based on the latest crime stats we have noted on the one hand an encouraging amount of precincts where LEAP officers are deployed where we have seen a reduction in contact crime, even in murders.

So that is welcome on the one hand. Two particular stations, and the Premier has tasked me to have further engagements in the Nyanga and in the Philippi East area because it remains a concern on that end, but if I look at that approaches to address certain crime categories, it is in terms of the LEAP deployment in their vehicle checkpoints, their visible policing, their patrols in hotspot areas, but also in their engagement with communities when certain information is then shared via community structures, via Neighbourhood Watches, all contributing towards making sure that there is a flow of information.

That flow of information leads to intelligence that can be used by the South African Police Service, by law enforcement agencies, in order to eradicate various levels of contact crimes in our area.

So from the vehicle checkpoints to visible patrolling to making sure that there are targeted interventions and operations between the SAPS, Metro Police and law enforcement, it is to make sure that contact crime is continuously being reduced and yes, I do note that we should be at a point, hon Speaker, where we are being very deliberate in our approach to make sure that the various stakeholders are jointly working together towards ensuring that we see the crime being reduced in our province. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

Just to remind the hon members that if you are on a virtual platform it is better to guide the Presiding Officers by, one, using one device to connect and number two, just like now the hon the Deputy Chief Whip had to intervene. If there is a hand that is up, once you are done, once you are recognised and you have actually had the opportunity to address the House, kindly just withdraw the hand so that we do not assume that you still want to talk.

I have recognised now the hand of hon member Bosman. If you could withdraw the hand once you have done speaking, sir.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, through you. I would like to know from the Minister how LEAP officers are going to also assist with the festive season preparedness and also making sure that they complement the work being done by the South African Police Service, to ensure a safer festive season, especially in the light of the massive increase in crime at the Cape Town Police Station and also police stations around spaces where members of our communities gather. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:
Thank you so much, hon member Bosman, for that particular question.

We have engaged previously with regard to the Standing Committee interactions. I want to place on record once again that the LEAP officers are being strategically placed and deployed where crime is in our priority areas.

I am delighted to at this stage further indicate that there are interventions that are going to be announced in the coming days with regard to the Safer Festive Season campaign and the launch of an initiative to ensure that we are creating those extra visibility measures during the festive season that we are currently in.

So I am looking forward to sharing that information with the Standing Committee as well in that we have had engagements across various departments with regard to all the interventions that are taking place, but LEAP is very strategic in our hotspot areas where it has been indicated, based on the data and the evidence, where those LEAP offices are needed the most. They will remain in those particular priority areas together with the two reaction units, that should there be a flare-up anywhere in our province, that particular reaction unit will be able to step in and help and assist, but on the other hand various other interventions are in place together with the South African Police Service and the City of Cape Town with a joint Safer Festive Season approach. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Hon Minister.

I do not see any further hands ...[Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Speaker? Hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mvimbi, you must raise your hand or say something in the chatroom there, but you may proceed. Is that an interest to speak, sir?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Yes, thank you very much, hon Speaker.

I note originally the plan, hon Minister, was developed or started about two or three years ago, with a budget of R1 billion over a period of three years, over a period of five years. I think up to now we spent about R350 million of that, and I believe that it is supposed to be for the whole province, but so far there seem to be a clear concentration and prioritisation of the Metro and I just want to check then that because I believe that the province has got six district areas, including the Metro, and there has been nothing that has been done outside of the Metro.

I just heard you mention that there are also priority areas, we deployed these people in these priority areas. Now how do you identify these priority areas? Are the areas outside of the Metro not your priority areas?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mvimbi. I recognise the Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:

Thank you so much for that particular question.

We have been very clear, hon Speaker, through you, with regard to the Western Cape Safety Plan.

The priority areas have been identified based on the data. That data has been visible and public across various platforms. It is in line with regard to the crime stats that are released by the South African Police Service.

So, the priority areas that have been identified as the murder hotspot areas are located in the City of Cape Town and that is where the LEAP officers are deployed in order to see a reduction in the murder rate in those particular priority areas.

We will never, hon Speaker, forget about our rural areas. We have activated K9-units because we have seen, hon Speaker, a reduction of K9-units in the South African Police Service since 2018, by 27%. We have then stepped up in order to ensure that we are able to launch K9-units outside of the City of Cape Town.

We have launched reaction units outside of the City of Cape Town. We have provided funding to various districts and each and every district, there are five districts outside of the City of Cape Town. They are receiving funding

from the department based on the District Safety Plan.

The District Safety Plan will be specific to a particular district, for example, when we are in the West Coast area, in their District Safety Plan funding is allocated so that plans are implemented in that particular area.

In the Overstrand and in the Overberg area there is also a K9-unit together with the reaction unit that we have launched and most definitely it is never so that nothing has been done. We have done amazing work and I am proud of the work that various municipalities are doing together with district municipalities in partnership with the Department of Community Safety towards making sure that the districts are never forgotten.

I have just over the last three months concluded four of the rural safety summits and the very last one will be early next year, which will happen in the Central Karoo area, and that is all towards making sure that we are working with our districts, that we are working with our B municipalities, with all municipalities outside of the City of Cape Town as well.

So we will never forget about our rural areas, we will never forget about the Swellendams, about the Bitous, because we are wanting to make sure that when we see that there is a increase in crime outside of the City of Cape Town, we would want to nip that in the bud as soon as possible and for crime not to have a foothold in our rural areas.

In the Cape Winelands, from the West Coast to the Garden Route we are playing an active role in the safety space by not only making funding available, but also making sure that we are fostering those working relationships towards reducing the murder rate together with a number of contact categories.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

Hon members, are there any further questions by the hon members? If none, that concludes Question 9.

We now move to Question 10 by hon member Van der Westhuizen to the Hon Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning. I recognise the Hon Minister Bredell.

QUESTION 10

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you to the hon member for posing the question.

The Province has not identified nature reserves for acquisition from SANParks nor has nature reserves to be relinquished under the Provincial Government to the care of the National Government or SANParks in a possible land swap, been identified.

Part (2) and (3) of the question. The National Department of Forestry, Fisheries and Environment (DEFF), has established a task team that is representative of all the provinces to investigate the rationalisation of the protected areas estate management. Despite the task team being formed more than two years ago, there has been little to no progress in this regard. I thank you.

(The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair)

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister Bredell. Hon member Christians, any follow-up?

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry, are we on Question 9? Oh, Van der Westhuizen, my apologies. Over to you.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Agbare Adjunkspeaker, deur u aan Minister Bredell.

Minister, die moontlike ruil van natuurreserve, sover my kennis strek, is die eerste keer geopper deur die Nasionale Minister van Omgewingsake, Minister Barbara Creecy, tydens 'n debat in die Nasionale Raad vir Provinsies.

Kan u dalk sê wat sy in gedagte gehad het toe sy hierdie moontlikheid geopper het? Wat dink u sou haar doel hiermee gewees het en wat was haar of haar amptenare se reaksie sedertdien? Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, through you to Minister Bredell.

Minister, the possible exchange of nature reserves, to my knowledge, was first mentioned by the National Minister of Environmental Affairs, Minister Barbara Creecy, during a debate in the National Council of Provinces.

Can you perhaps say what she had in mind when she mentioned this possibility? What do you think would have been her aim with this and what has her and her officials' reaction been since? Thank you.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Chair, it is very difficult to debate or to discuss what other people think.

I think that the possibility is that obviously we manage a lot of land on their

behalf, and we will rather have that land within our asset register, or the register of CapeNature, but the investigation is ongoing.

I also think that from a national perspective they wanted to look at the land that is available for especially the tourism market, but obviously it is a lengthy discussion, it is a difficult discussion because we have managed in this province to increase our tourism revenue by over 30%.

So, we want to continue on that, but for that you need to have the assets to invest in. It is an ongoing debate with National Government. There is also the pressure between Forestry, Fisheries and Environment, and then the Department of Public Works, who is the custodian of the land at the end of the day, and to dismantle all of these pieces of land it is important to understand that if there is no contract between Fisheries, Forestry and Environment, then the land owner is Public Works and we must then negotiate with Minister De Lille on a couple of pieces of land.

We have presented all the vacant land, pieces of land, to Minister De Lille to try and fast-track and to try and put pressure on the task team to do their work so that we can take this forward. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise hon member Van der Westhuizen.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Agb Adjunkspeaker, weer deur u aan

Minister Bredell.

Minister, die Suid-Afrikaans Grondwet laat provinsiale regerings toe om sekere verantwoordelikhede af te wentel na munisipaliteite. Gestel die verantwoordelikheid vir die Tafelberg Nasionale Park sou aan die Provinsie oorgedra word, sou u Departement dit dalk oorweeg om daardie verantwoordelikheid verder weer oor te dra aan die Stad Kaapstad, en indien wel waarom sou u dit dalk wou doen? Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, again through you to Minister Bredell.

Minister, the South African Constitution allows provincial governments to cede certain responsibilities to municipalities. Suppose the responsibility for the Table Mountain National Park was ceded to the Province, would your Department possibly consider ceding that responsibility further to the City of Cape Town, and if so, why would you possibly do it? Thank you.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Well, at the end of the day, hon Deputy Speaker, hon member, that I think our responsibility is to our residents, at the

end of the day the value for money, where will we get the most value for it?

You must remember there is also an MOU between National and City of Cape Town. My gut tells me if there is a possibility they will directly transfer to the city, we will be a role-player, but it is not that we want to claim anything. The honest question is where will we get maximum bucks for our money? What can we do with the asset so that people can benefit? And obviously the city has got a huge interest in that and I would not have any objections if we move it to the city. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister.

Are there any further follow-up questions? None?

That concludes Question 10 and that concludes the Questions for Oral Reply. Outstanding replies will be printed in the Hansard.

Sorry, hon member Van der Westhuizen, do you have a third follow-up?

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Ja, dankie, agb Adjunkspeaker.

Minister Bredell, een van die kwessies wat die publiek werklik bekommer is die hele kwessie rondom veiligheid op Tafelberg en in die Tafelberg Nasionale Park.

Tot watter mate kan u Departement alreeds ondersteuning bied aan SANParke en tot watter mate het ons al sukses behaal om van Tafelberg 'n veiliger toerisme-bestemming te maak? Is u Departement betrokke en tot watter mate is daar samewerking in die verband?

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Yes, thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Minister Bredell, one of the issues that really concerns the public is the whole matter around safety on Table Mountain and in the Table Mountain National Park.

To what extent can your Department already offer support to SANParks and to what extent have we already achieved success to make Table Mountain a safer tourist destination? Is your Department involved and to what extent is there cooperation in this regard?]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie. Agb Minister.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS

AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Chair, thank you.

The safety on the mountains [Inaudible.] the City of Cape Town working with SANParks. They have got a specific programme to see to how they can safeguard the tourists on Table Mountain but making it safer for fire hazards and then the Department and Disaster Management are involved.

So, we have got very close relationships working with the teams within the Table Mountain range and we will keep on building on that relationship. I think it is an important relationship, but at the end of the day again I think that we can utilise that asset better.

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie, agb Minister.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.] Hon member Van der Westhuizen, your final question if you would like to do any further follow-ups.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, I will step down.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I see no further hands.

That does conclude then the Questions for Oral Reply. Any outstanding

replies will be printed in Hansard.

Hon members, we will now move over to Statements by Members in terms of Rule 145 and just to remind our members, for two minutes as an opportunity for you.

I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape has experienced an average growth rate of 17 901 learners entering our education system over the past five years. This means as of this year there were 1 117 080 being taught in our schools.

With more learners seeking quality education, the demand for capacity naturally increases. Owing to this demand the Western Cape Education Department has announced that it would be constructing an additional 842 classrooms in the current financial year, which far exceeds the construction of 212 classrooms last year. In doing so it will provide at least 26 000 places for learners.

It also means that the Western Cape's ground-breaking initiative will be

almost 70% larger than the 499 classrooms which Gauteng announced it will construct at the beginning of the year.

Thanks to the R830 million increase in the WCED's infrastructure budget this year, it means that 164 classrooms have already been built. A further 510 classrooms are planned for completion by January 2023, with the remaining 168 by March 2023.

Coupled to the extra 1 143 teachers being appointed to start in the new academic year, the construction of these classrooms is crucial to sustaining our learning efforts.

The DA in the Western Cape welcomes and congratulates the hard work which the Department does on a daily basis, and we look forward to this infrastructure allowing the province to continue to provide quality education to all learners. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Hon Member

I now recognise the African National Congress.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... hon member Nkondlo is now on the floor.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. You may proceed, hon member.

The CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The ANC wishes once again to note the qualified audit report received by Wesgro for the 2021/2022 financial year. The ANC is not surprised with the slow demise of this engine room of economic growth opportunities and tourism in our province.

The slow demise of Wesgro started with the appointment of Tim Harris as CEO of the agency, an appointment with all the characteristics and covered in DA cadre deployment. When this DA political appointee wanted an exorbitant salary contrary to the realities of COVID-19 when millions were losing their jobs, the DA was more comfortable with seeing board members resign than resist DA indulgence in a state entity.

When the ANC was governing the Western Cape, one of our focus areas for Wesgro was that we used the entity to promote trade, tourism and to access the West Coast of Africa region in particular. [Inaudible.] remains one of the most strategic economic regions in our continent. Only recently has Wesgro redirected their attention to the African market.

While we continue to welcome visitors from North America and Europe, we must note the myopic view that this Provincial Government has had in only focusing on these markets. Since the ANC-governing days we have urged that we start focusing on the African, Middle East and Asian markets.

The qualified audit report follows this long list of unfortunate mishaps and failure in governance at Wesgro. Even more so Wesgro has come to concentrate on strengthening, empowering old money in our province rather than ensuring the benefit and empowerment of black SMMEs.

We urge the Western Cape Provincial Government to ensure good governance in Wesgro and refrain from everything what really amounts to a racist approach to tourism. In fact, maybe it is time that Wesgro and its board in particular receive a session in diversity training. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member.

I now recognise the EFF.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The Economic Freedom Fighters condemns the Western Cape-led Democratic Alliance Government's useless Safety Plan that continues to waste taxpayers' money whilst crime in the province continues to be on the rise.

In the financial year alone, this Government availed more than R400 million for purposes of the Law Enforcement Advancement Plan, which is LEAP, which was intended to fight crime in the province. The purpose of this plan was to utilise Law Enforcement as a machinery to combat crime. However, reality shows that this plan is nothing but a pipedream which unluckily achieves the opposite.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the second quarter crime statistics for the 2022/2023 financial year placed the Western Cape in the second position when it comes to 17 community-reported serious crimes trends over the three months period, July to September 2022 however, with the Cape Town Central Police Station leading the pack in the number one spot. The Western Cape continues to experience a high number of contact crimes in the country, with Nyanga leading the rest as the number one spot, followed by Mfuleni in third place and Harare, wrapping up to the top ten of townships in the country with a high level on contact crime.

Another concerning issue is the rise of sexual crime incidents in the province, which include sexual offences, sexual assault, and rape. There is a shocking increase in these crimes when one compares this to the previous financial year in the same period of July to September, with sexual offences increasing from more than 1,400 incidents to more than 1,800 incidents. Similarly, hon Deputy Speaker, cases of rape also increased with most incidents experienced in townships such as Delft and Harare, whilst Mitchells Plain and Manenberg lead the whole country when it comes to sexual assault

cases. This is evident, hon Deputy Speaker, that Law Enforcement remains useless and instead of tackling and combatting crime, they are busy focusing on evictions of poor people in informal settlements and terrorising homeless people within the city. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the DA.

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon members, the two-day taxi minibus shutdown at the beginning of this week, came as the Western Cape Department of Mobility had to make the difficult decision to suspend the Blue Dot taxi programme. Although the Department would prefer to continue with the programme, it is unfortunate that this must come to an end, as the hon Minister Daylin Mitchell has stated, due to the lack of funding. Hon Deputy Speaker, the DA supports Santaco's right to protest, but we strongly condemn the kind of strike action that is violent and that is an impediment to economic activity. The Western Cape taxi bus service suffers the daily loss of R9 million due to the shutdown, but the local economy and the direct impact on the commuters of this province is far worse and immeasurable.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the people of this province cannot be held to ransom by criminal elements within the taxi industry. These elements continue to commit all these horrendous crimes and as yet, we have seen few prosecutions. These criminal actions are designed solely to sabotage the

economy and intimidate the people of this province and may no longer be tolerated. ...[Interjection.]

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker? Hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): ...and SAPS must make sure that those involved must be found and must be apprehended. ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): But here, this House ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): ...has now called on the National Prosecuting Authority and the Minister of Justice, Ronald Lamola, to take into consideration the establishment of a specialised prosecuting unit that will be responsible for prosecuting acts of violence and destruction of public infrastructure. The Standing Committee of Transport of all political parties were also united in the condemnation of these violent crimes committed by individuals in the taxi industry. To ensure those are accountable for lawlessness, they must be brought to justice, and we will work together to achieve this. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Mackenzie, but I am sure you are going to be devastated to see that we actually did not see you because your phone was in front of your face. So, we heard you clearly, but unfortunately on record, you were behind a telephone. But no problem, I know that hon Maseko wanted to alert you in time, but it is on record. So, not a problem. Thank you very much. We now recognise GOOD.

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just one second, one minute, hon member. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Well, hon Deputy Speaker, can the technical team just assist hon member Bakubaku-Vos. I know she has been having troubles to log in. Can the team please just assist her? Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. If the IT can assist, thank you. Over to you, to the GOOD party.

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Hon Deputy Speaker, the funding for the Western Cape Government made available to combat the increase of crime in rural communities, is a complete joke. While the City of Cape Town enjoys a R1.3 billion cash injection delivered over a five-year period to fund the Law

Enforcement Advancement Plan (LEAP), district municipalities in the rural Western Cape got a mere R730 000 towards anti-crime initiatives. We need to ask ourselves how is this possible?

Practically, the Provincial Department of Community Safety and Police Oversight held safety summits as the all-in-all to strengthen rural security. But considering that they are planning on having their third summit so far and we are almost in the final stretch of this political term, it can well be established that this Department and the Provincial Government do not care about the protection of our rural communities.

The hon MEC confirmed in this House that there has been a constant shift in crime operations moving to rural communities and they have noted a 28% escalation to this effect. We ask ourselves what this Government is doing to counter the opportunistic escalations? The answer: a menial budget of R730 000 to save lives and livelihoods. In comparison to the City of Cape Town where the DA's glorified sheriff gets shiny new toys when he barks loudly enough, the answer to rural safety is a talk shop.

Hon Deputy Speaker, if one should read the hon MEC's response to yesterday's crime stats, it is revolting. The focus again is solely placed on the city, whereas murder increased in the province by 3,9% in comparison to last year. No solutions for our rural counterparts, no plan, no resources. Instead, we use taxpayers' money to fund crime reduction in the crown jewel of the DA, the City. This, at the expense of people who are suffering just as

much from murder, rape, robberies, brutality, and community unrest. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Before we proceed to the ACDP, I would just like to interject, it is my right as Presiding Officer, to welcome the new hon member, hon Isaac Mbulelo. Hon member Mbulelo ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Sileku.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sileku, my apologies there. I wrote it wrong. Hon Sileku, a very warm welcome to this House and I wish you all the best in your job and your mandate as an hon member of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. Wishing you all the best. [Applause.] I will now call on the hon ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, as the ACDP, we are opposed and I stress again, we did it before and we are doing it again, against the draft guidelines on gender identity and sexual orientation. Today, in front of this Legislature, almost 200 members of the ACDP came to protest against these unisex toilets that they want to introduce and now, the Department of Basic Education has also now jumped on the bandwagon with the same policy.

The other problem at our schools, and I am so grateful for hon Minister

David Maynier, with these ungodly blasphemous workshops, diversity workshops that happened at Fish Hoek and it would have been rolled out to Rondebosch. These things are unacceptable. You know, what is happening in our schools, our learners are already confused and then they get indoctrinated with wrong things. I mean, if we look: already the crimes are up of by 18,5%, contact crime in the Western Cape is up by 21%, and then we want to have ungodly diversity workshops and we want to have unisex toilets at our schools.

We believe with these workshops are confusing our learners and remember, 800 learners were affected at the Fish Hoek High School, they have to go for trauma counselling after that. And I have said it before, and I have written to the hon Minister. The hon Minister said these workshops are terminated. These diversity workshops are terminated, but our children must go through this. There were 800 children in those workshops and no teachers were allowed in those workshops. I cannot understand because the hon Minister was forewarned on 4 July and again in July, not to continue and this person came in and produced those workshops.

So, the ACDP are against the introduction of these ungodly laws, these blasphemous laws. I mean, it hurts me as a Christian at the poem that was read in this workshop. It hurts me, it irks me. My blood boils. So, that is why we protested today and say no, no, to unisex toilets and no, no, to blasphemous diversity workshops. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the ANC. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Bakubaku-Vos does not seem to be in the House. Can I ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, can I just check if hon Bakubaku-Vos is able to hear us? Can I just ask, while I move on, that the IT please make contact with her. We will move on to the Democratic Alliance, thank you.

Ms C MURRAY (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. As is often the case with technological advancements, governments are usually slow to keep up with and adopt new developments. As more South African citizens and businesses explore the possibilities of Web3 Integration and Innovations, the Government will have to become increasingly adaptive. It is not a choice. Of course, the Western Cape Government is already paving its way in this front. In July, Wesgro launched a game on the popular online gaming platform, Roblox metaverse, allowing users to experience Table Mountain virtually. The game has already been a massive success with 88,000 views, 30,000 clicks, an 84% approval rating and an average game time of ten minutes, which is ten times that of the Roblox average.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the pioneer of change, particularly in the tech industry, is of the private sector as it should be and our role in Government should always be to support and enable this. Testament to this is that Pick n Pay

recently announced that it would be adopting Bitcoin Lightning payments at 29 of its stores. This is historic. This further took place during the same week that Cape Town hosted the two-day Africa Fintech Summit for the very first time, which was touted as being the most successful summit that the Fintech Summit has had to date.

I further want to note that I am very glad that some of our Standing Committee members from Finance and Economic Opportunities joined us as we attended this summit, helping to ensure that we do keep apace with innovation.

Web3 Integration is making inroads in our province, and we must enable our province, in the hon Premier's words, to create a crypto Cape. That is why national and subnational governments, as well as their entities, must move quickly to support this and be adaptive. There is immense potential in this sector for Government business. Blockchain, for example, has the potential to disrupt and improve SCM processes, recording title deeds through its decentralised and transparent processes.

The fact of the matter is that we are already in the fourth wave, the Fourth Industrial Revolution, and we cannot ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member.

Ms C MURRAY (DA): ...be seen to be left behind. It is no longer a

buzzword. That is why I am extremely encouraged by the work already underway by the Western Cape Government, as well as this province's private sector. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Bakubaku-Vos, are you on yet? I am still going to give her a bit of time. I will then move over to the Freedom Front Plus. Hon Marais, are you doing a Statement today?

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Yes, certainly, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you very much for the opportunity.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may continue.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): The Freedom Front Plus wishes to announce with great elation, the result of a by-election yesterday in Groot Drakenstein Ward 17. Our candidate, Pierre Du Toit, polled 41% of the votes against the DA's 49%, remembering that the DA had taken the seat with an overwhelming majority in 2021. This shows tremendous growth for the Freedom Front Plus from 13% in 2021 of the votes to 41% yesterday.

This follows closely on our great victory in Limpopo a few weeks ago, where the Freedom Front Plus won Bela-Bela's seat, which was considered a safe DA seat, by polling 58,3% of the votes against the DA's mere 35%. This is extraordinary if you keep in mind that the DA won this seat with 85% of the votes in 2021. It could only get 35% now.

We therefore wish to thank the voters for their continued support for the Freedom Front Plus and look with great expectations to 2024 when a new co-government scenario might present itself and emerge because the era of majority rule is fading rapidly. Thank you, voters, for your confidence in the Freedom Front Plus ...[Interjection.]

Mr D PLATO: Ah, shame!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, thank you very much. Hon member, what is your point of order?

Mr D PLATO: I just want to ...[Interjection.]

†The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Die DA gaan huil. Die DA gaan huil.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: The DA is going to cry. The DA is going to cry].

Mr D PLATO: ...hon Marais. The Democratic Alliance: he does not mention all the other wards across the country won by the Democratic Alliance. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Plato, that is not a point of order.

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Die DA huil nou, hulle huil.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: The DA is crying now, they are crying.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon ...[Interjection.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Die ANC kan nie eers 'n konferensie hou nie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The ANC is not even able to hold a conference.]

†Me N D NKONDLO: Jy moet ...[Tussenwerpsel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Ms N D NKONDLO: You must ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms N D NKONDLO: Congratulations, hon member Marais.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Bakubaku-Vos, are you online? I do not know if you ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, who am I referring to?

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): It is hon Lulama Mvimbi.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, yes.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Yes, I will be reading the Statement by the African National Congress.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, one minute, hon Mvimbi. I will allow it, but in terms of Rule 145(3), usually we do not, but as a Presiding Officer, I will give you that permission to read it on behalf of hon Bakubaku-Vos. You

may proceed.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, for your discretion. Hon Deputy Speaker, the month of November marks the beginning of the 16 Days of Activism against Gender-Based Violence under the theme of ‘UNITE! Activism to end violence against women and girls.’

†Xa singena kule nyanga, ndifuna sithatha eli thuba sukhumbule onke amaxhoba akhe adlwenuglwa abulawa ngamadoda, kuquka uBam Tshirayi Madzimo, Dimpho Skelenge, Nomaphelo Sifuba, Oyinene Mkrwetyana, nabanye abaninzi. Iinkcukaca manani ebezikhutshwe ngamapolisa zibonisa ukuba amaxhoba athe adlungulwa phakathi kukaAprili noJuni 2022 ame ku1115 babantu. Loo ngumcelimngeni odinga ubambiswano kurhulumente kazwelonke namaphondo kwakunye noomaspala basebenzisane noluntu. Ukusukela ngo2019, oko bendisenza isimemo kulo rhulumente wepondo ukuba makunyuswe amanani we-trauma centres kwakunye ne-safe houses for women and children. Endaweni yoko, loo rhulumente weNtshona Koloni, ubonisa ukungakhathali ngokuba usuke wavala amaziko afana neKhayamnandi Women and Children’s Safehouse awayekuthembisile ngaphambili ukuba bancedisa ukuze bafumane inkxaso kaRhulumente.

[Translation of isi-Xhosa paragraphs follow.]

[As we start this month, I would like us to take the opportunity to remember all rape victims who have been raped and killed by men. These victims

include uBam Tshirayi Madzimo, Dimpho Skelenge, Nomaphelo Sifuba, and Oyinene Mkrwetyana. Reports provided by the police show a figure of 1,115 cases between April to June 2022. The national government and all the provincial governments need to work together to fight this problem. Since 2019, an invitation has been sent to this province to increase the number of trauma and safe houses for women and children. Instead of doing that, this Western Cape government showed disregard by closing houses like the Khayamnandi Women and Children's Safehouse, after the safehouse had been assured that it would receive help and support from the government.]

I wish to take this opportunity to commend President Cyril Ramaphosa and his Government for successfully hosting the Second Presidential Summit on Gender-Based Violence and Femicide. National Government has made steady progress in the fight against GBV since the last summit, including the upgrading of 83 courts into sexual offence courts, establishing GBV shelters in 45 out of 52 districts across the country, mainstreaming gender issues to be included in the budget.

In January, three key pieces of legislation were signed into law, namely the Criminal Law (Sexual Offences and Related Matters) Amendment Act, the Criminal and Related Matters Amendment Bill ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): ...and The Domestic Violence Amendment Bill.

†URhulumente wethu kudingeka enza kakhulu...lukhulu ukulwa naloo

celimngeni we GBV ukuquka ukumamela zonke izikhalazo beziveliswe kule ndibano yokugqibela ibibizwe nguMongameli.

[Translation of isi-Xhosa paragraphs follow.]

[Our government needs to work hard in fighting with GBV problem, this means they have to listen to all complaints that have been raised in the last assembly that was called by the President.]

Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Mvimbi. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I rise not on a point of order, but to thank you for your indulgence, hon Deputy Speaker, for letting hon member Mvimbi do the Statement. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Much appreciated. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now ...[Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now recognise Al Jama-ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Deputy

Speaker. The crime rate in the Western Cape is not decreasing, it is not decreasing as the DA-led Province wants the people to believe. The latest quarterly crime stats are no different to that of August 2022, as reported in the stats report on the crime in the province. This Province must stop fooling the people that it is managing crime effectively. The Western Cape is the second province with the highest number of recorded murders. Delft and Nyanga are amongst the top four stations with the highest reported rape and murder cases.

Earlier this week, a kidnapping of a teenage girl took place from her father's tuckshop. We have hardly recovered from the eight-year-old Abirah's kidnapping. Thank God for her safe return. We need this Provincial Government to be focused on the crisis in our communities and how to solve it, and not waste resources on measures to have the Province's policing powers devolved. These calls are nothing more than a political tool by the DA or is this DA-run Province playing with the lives of people in the Cape Flats and in the townships?

The areas previously identified as hotspots remain the same – Nyanga, Delft, Kraaifontein, Philippi East, Harare, Khayelitsha, Mfuleni, Gugulethu, Samora Machel – where the high crime rates remain unchanged. These are places where one is most likely to get murdered. I am not even including some areas as Mitchells Plain, Hanover Park, Manenberg and others, which are riddled with gangsterism and crime. Interpersonal arguments and gang violence have been identified as the major contributors to murders.

Shebeens, which are so notoriously prominent in our townships and on the Cape Flats, are springboards for murders and criminal activities.

Where are the LEAP officers? Where are the LEAP officers at these hotspots for crime? The Department boasts that crime has dropped ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): ...in areas where LEAP officers have been deployed. If that is the case, surely the deployment of ...[intervenes]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): ...LEAP officers should be in the areas ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thanks, hon member.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): ...identified as high risks? The police and LEAP officers know who...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): ...the gangsters ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Apologies, your time is up.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

Mr C Fry (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, on Tuesday, 8 November, the South African National Space Agency and the United States' National Aeronautics and Space Administration signed a ground-breaking agreement to commence the building of a Deep Space ground station right here in the heart of the Western Cape in the town of Matjiesfontein. This agreement means that our province of the Western Cape will play a significant role in once again, putting man and the first women on the moon. The Matjiesfontein site will be one of three lunar exploration ground sites around the world. This project's 18 to 24 metre communication antennae will ensure near continuous connectivity between astronauts on NASA's Artemis spacecraft and those who will walk around the lunar surface.

The DA in the Western Cape is over the moon with this agreement and the investment into the province's space technology economy. This venture will not only make massive leaps in expanding space science in the province but will also foster interest in this field within the local Central Karoo region. In

addition to this, the programme is expected to be a valuable boost into the Matjiesfontein and Central Karoo economy by attracting new visitors and contributing to job creation efforts. Hon Premier Alan Winde said that the project has the potential to launch the Western Cape Government's skills development drive beyond the limits of earth.

The location of the lunar exploration ground-site in the province is therefore, further proof that our Province is open for business not just locally, not just internationally, but to infinity and beyond. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Applause.] Thank you very much, hon members. In accordance with Rule 145(6), I now allow one or more hon members of the Executive to respond to the Member Statements for not more than five minutes collectively. I recognise hon Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER FOR FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I would like to respond to the Member Statement by hon Nkondlo. I think she will be absolutely delighted to learn that Wesgro has so far this year participated in the ICCA chapter and knowledge exchange focused on business development in Africa.

The Wesgro Convention Bureau attended the Spotlight to Africa roadshow in Kenya, focusing on B2B markets, followed by the Business Event Workshop and Lead Development in Kenya for business events. Wesgro exhibited at Magical Kenya. Wesgro participated in the fifth African Tourism Leadership

Forum in Botswana. It led the SA Chef Campaign which targeted food and wine audience aimed at the African market.

Wesgro participated at the On Show Africa Showcase and the Wesgro lead in Air Access. As a result of the good work done by the Air Access team, we now have new flights from Air Mauritius into Cape Town and a direct flight into Maputo. Air Rwanda has doubled its flights at the start of this month and TAAG Angola have doubled their frequency for the summer season as well. And one of the strategic priorities for Air Access is working very hard to make sure that we can increase connectivity to West Africa, and Nigeria and Ghana in particular. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise hon Minister Allen.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
Thank you so much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker
...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: On a point of order, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, hon Minister. Please stop the clocks.
Hon member, do you have a point of order, hon Mvimbi?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Yes, I have a point of order. Hon Deputy Speaker, I think

in terms of the Rules that you quoted where you allow hon Executive members to respond, there is only one hon Executive member that is allowed, and I think hon Wenger has already responded.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, so I will read the Rule to you. In accordance with Rule 145(6) I now allow:

“...one or more members of the Executive.”

So, we are in line with the Rules. I trust that is okay. We can proceed. Over to hon Minister Allen.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, if I can be as clear as possible. Hon Deputy Speaker, in our country during the last quarter, we have seen that murders increased by 13,6% across our country. We will never want to mince the stats because we have seen that yes, there was an increase in murders here in the Western Cape of 3,9%. However, where LEAP officers are deployed, we have seen a reduction across our priority areas. We would want to ensure that we continue doing everything in our power to make sure that our communities are safer.

Hon Deputy Speaker, if we consider where would our Province have been if it was not for LEAP and that is the question that I would want residents together with members of this House, to realise that where would we have

been in terms of our crime categories if it was not for LEAP. We have now over 151 SAPS stations. In 2018, we had a figure, a granted establishment. We are now in 70% of those stations, less members. Our stations have 70% less members than what they had five years ago, hon Deputy Speaker. Where would we have been if it was not for LEAP officers contributing towards reducing crime?

The AGU that plays a huge role towards combatting gangsterism, has a 38% vacancy rate in their granted establishment. Where would we have been, hon Deputy Speaker, if it was not for the extra boots on the ground? We have seen the K9 Units in the South African Police Service being reduced by 27%. If it was not for LEAP officers, where would we have been? The murder rate would have been so much worse here in our Province because even though there are increases in eight of the provinces, the Western Cape had the lowest increase.

But that is nothing to boast about. We will never boast about a figure like that. We would want to be as real with residents, hence we are asking for stakeholders, CPFs, Neighbourhood Watch to continue to work with us as we want to reduce crime. But we are seeing crimes being made. So, when crime is used as a political tool, it upsets me, it upsets residents and it upsets many people in this House, hon Deputy Speaker, because we know we can never want to play politics with the lives of our young people, with our women, with our men that are dying as a result of gangsterism and of crime activities.

So, we want to be real, but we are saying: where would we have been, hon Deputy Speaker, if those extra deployments, LEAP officers, were not on the ground? Would we have been on the level of the Eastern Cape that had a 31,3% increase in the murder rate? Would we have been on the level of the Northern Cape that had a 27,2% increase in the murder rate. Would we have been on the Gauteng level of seeing a 19,6% increase in the murder rate? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Unfortunately, hon Minister Maynier ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Deputy Speaker, on a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...the time has come to an end for five minutes. Unfortunately ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: On a point of order, hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon Mvimbi, a point of order?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Deputy Speaker, I do not know which Rule 145 you were reading because if we go to Rule 145(6), it says:

“At the conclusion of Statements by members, one Minister present may be given an opportunity to respond for not more

than five minutes, to any Statement or Statements.”

So, that is why I just did not want it to look as if I am going to be disruptive to the process, but I thought that I needed to allow the hon Minister to finish so that I can alert you to this Rule.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I will respond, but I see the hon Acting Chief Whip. Over to you.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, I also have my Rule Book in front of me and perhaps, hon member Mvimbi has a previous Rule Book in front of him before the Rules were amended. But in terms of the latest amendment, Rule 145 subsection 6 clearly it is written:

“At the conclusion of Statements by Members, one or more members of the Executive may be given an opportunity to respond for more than five minutes to any Statement or Statements.”

Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Mvimbi and you might just want to check and throw those old Rule Books away because they can easily get mixed up with the one of March 2021, which is the latest Rule Book. I trust that is in order with you, hon Mvimbi. That brings us to the

end of Member Statements ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi?

Mr L L MVIMBI: No, I am saying thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are most welcome. I would just like to quickly consult with the Whips of both, of all the parties. Would you like to suspend the House for a lunch break, or would you like to push through to Motions? I am happy to take direction from the ANC or the other members. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I think we can push through. That is my suggestion because we have only got Motions and the Declaration. So, I think we can push through. I am sure we are not that hungry and starving.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Hon Baartman ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Deputy Speaker?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Since

none of us here in this House are fat cat politicians, my suggestion from the Majority Party is that we get through the Order Paper.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am happy to proceed. We will continue. Thank you very much, hon members. That is the end of Member Statements. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Deputy Speaker?

MOTIONS

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move over to Notices of Motion. In terms of Rule 151, all Notices of Motions by hon members must be delivered to the Secretary for placement on the Order Paper. Accordingly, these Motions have been submitted and published on the Order Paper below the line.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the incident where a pregnant learner was prevented from writing the English FAL P1 examination paper in the National Senior Certificate 2022.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the progress the Western Cape has made in delivering inclusive education for learners, with emphasis on implementing the objectives of Education White Paper 6.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr G BRINKHUIS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the changing of by-laws from permits to registration for informal traders to remove the unnecessary red tape required for permits and thereby opening the informal trading sector to more indigent people who are struggling to survive.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr S N AUGUST: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates a Provincial Government assessment on the barriers of entry that keep persons with disabilities unemployed in Western Cape government departments; that the Western Cape Government considers employing a greater percentage of persons with disabilities in the various departments and provincial state-owned

enterprises; and that measures of accessibility be adopted to ensure disabled people can access public transport, public buildings and public services.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the disruption that affects some Grade 12 learners and prohibits them from writing examinations, including the pregnant learner who was denied writing her final examination and another learner who could not write the first paper because of outstanding school fees.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates yet another delay to the R84 million construction project of the Manenberg School of Skills.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms A P BANS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the ongoing taxi violence between gang members and taxi drivers in Vrygrond, Retreat, that is now affecting commuters.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the qualified audit opinion for Wesgro.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr M KAMA: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the prevalence of crime and substance abuse in the province.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We now move to Motions without Notice. Hon members, please note that in terms of the Standing Rule 150 pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolence and congratulatory were submitted to the Programming Authority prior to this plenary on 8 November 2022. Hon members would further remember that the Motions without Notice on

congratulatory and condolence matters will not be allowed in this sitting if the Programming Authority has not processed them.

In this regard, the Tabling Staff informs me that in the Programming Authority meeting of 8 November 2022, political parties submitted the names of the hon members in the desired order of speaking and indicated their respective members with the desire to move a Motion without Notice in this sitting of the House.

I will therefore, just for noting and for the Minutes, call out the hon members whose names have accordingly been submitted and approved. The Programming Authority approved the following members' motions as follows: hon Murray, hon Van der Westhuizen, hon America, hon Kaizer-Philander, hon Bosman, hon Bosman, hon Bosman, hon Lekker, hon Kama, hon Dugmore, hon Kama, and hon Brinkhuis.

Ms C MURRAY: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Pick n Pay for adopting bitcoin payments at its retail stores; notes that this follows a recent trial that occurred at 29 of its stores in the Western Cape; notes that, not only is this an innovative step towards ensuring financial inclusion, but it is also an important development in achieving a cashless society; and we look forward to them pioneering in this regard.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: I move without notice:

That the House commends the efforts by the agricultural sector and related role players in the Western Cape for maintaining peace and calm on farms across the province, despite the worrying attempts by certain individuals to incite discord on Wednesday, 2 November 2022 in commemoration of the tenth anniversary of the farm worker strikes of November 2012.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr D AMERICA: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates firefighters from the City of Cape Town, the Cape Winelands District Municipality and CapeNature for extinguishing two potentially disastrous veld fires in the Du Toitskloof Pass and on Table Mountain over the last month; notes that their rapid and efficient responses demonstrate that the Western Cape is prepared for the summer fire season; and they should be commended.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Groote Schuur Hospital for prioritising the mental health of its staff; notes that on 1 November, Minister Mbombo officially opened their Wellness Centre which houses several facilities such as a gym, a yoga class and a meditation room; notes that all-in-all, this centre will be accessible to more than 4 000 staff members; and notes that by taking care of our healthcare workers, we take care of our patients.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr G BOSMAN: I move without notice:

That the House sends its condolences to the family of the retired Cape Town Netball Federation President. Marsha Wagenaar, who passed away after a short illness on 29 October; notes that, with dedication and professionalism, Wagenaar worked to promote netball in the Western Cape for many years and inspired countless young athletes to excel in their disciplines; and acknowledges her loss and will hold her memory in mind as Cape Town hosts netball's premier event next year.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr G BOSMAN: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Mr Ernest Mnyaka, a petrol attendant and poet from Malmesbury, who recently published his first volume of Xhosa poetry, Waphela Umda kaLoval (The end of the road for a thug); notes that Mnyaka's poetry reflects on his experiences in prison and his previous life of crime, and acts as a commitment to build a new life; notes that Mnyaka acts as a true example of the restorative power of the written word; and wishes him great success in his future endeavours.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr G BOSMAN: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the winners of the recent Western Cape Cultural Affairs Awards and Western Cape Sports Awards, which were held in October this year; notes that the winners of these awards are living examples of the incredible dedication and talent present in the Western Cape's cultural and sporting sectors; notes the sectors' heartening progress in recovering from COVID-19; and commends all the winners.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep sadness the untimely passing away of

comrade Mustapha Isaacs from Ward 116 in Mitchells Plain; notes that the comrade passed away peacefully in his sleep; notes that he will be remembered for his selfless service and dedication to the ANC and to the community; may his soul rest in peace and may his friends find comfort.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr M KAMA: I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep sadness the passing away of legendary netball veteran, Marsha Wagenaar, who died recently after suffering a severe stroke; and notes that ‘Tannie’ Marsha was a retired Cape Town Netball Federation President and a former Acting Principal at the Cavalleria Primary School in Kraaifontein.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Brazil’s newly elected President, Luiz Inácio Lula da Silva; notes that Da Silva won Brazil’s election with 50,9% of the vote; and South Africa is looking forward to working with the Government of Brazil under his leadership.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr M KAMA: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates King Misuzulu kaZwelithini on his coronation; and notes that he was officially made King of the AmaZulu after a long battle for the throne.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr G BRINKHUIS: I move without notice:

That the House notes that the University of Stellenbosch will award the degree Doctor of Philosophy (DPhil) *honoris causa* to Ms Zubeida Jaffer; further notes that this award-winning journalist is from Wynberg; recognises that she is one of five distinguished individuals to receive this highest accolade from the Stellenbosch University at the 2022 graduation ceremony; further recognises that she started her career at the *Cape Times* daily newspaper in 1980; acknowledges her role as a black journalist, often arrested and tortured for writing about the brutality of the apartheid system; further acknowledges that, despite the security risks, she assisted in developing local community newspapers, such as *Grassroots*, during the anti-apartheid struggle; recognises that she was also the founding editor of Independent Newspapers' *Parliamentary Bureau*, serving 14 newspapers across South Africa;

further recognises that she was the first woman in Africa to have won the coveted Foreign Journalist Award from the National Association of Black Journalists in the United States; acknowledges that her work has earned her several local and international awards, including the Achiever Award from a leading Cape Town community newspaper, *Muslim Views*; further acknowledges that she is also an author of several books and her own memoirs; and congratulates Ms Zubeida Jaffer.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now put the Motions duly submitted and approved by the Programming Authority to the House. Are there any objections? No objections, agreed to. The Motions will appear in the Minutes of the proceedings and in Hansard, in the hon members' names as if that hon member had read them out aloud.

I will now allow hon members move Motions without Notice as per the Standing Rule of 152(d). This also will include Motions without Notice that were not approved in the Programming Authority Meeting. Hon members are reminded that 30 minutes, as per the Standing Rule of 152(d) will start now. According to my list, I now recognise hon Xego.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Sorry, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, hon Xego. Hon Dugmore, do you have

a point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, no. Hon Deputy Speaker, I was just trying to get your attention. It is just a small point. I think Rule 66 would cover it. I noticed when the issue of the Rules was raised that the Acting Chief Whip for the DA, stood up with a copy of the Rules that was kind of in a ring binder. Now, I think many of us have actually been trying to get printed copies. Obviously, there is an electronic version, but there is a serious problem, hon Deputy Speaker, in that when we have requested printed copies of the Rule Book as amended, they simply do not seem to be available in the Legislature.

So, I just wanted to use this opportunity to raise that because we should not have a situation where the Acting Chief Whip is standing up without a proper Rule Book and I think all of us would like that. So, if you would not mind, hon Deputy Speaker, for just raising this matter in your discussions as the Speaker and so on, so that we could actually have a hard copy set of Rules. That would really be appreciated. Thanks.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore. Over to you, hon Baartman.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, in terms of Rule 66 that is not a point of order. These Rule Books we got via email. I printed my own with my own paper and I bound it. If hon member Dugmore does not

have a book and if he does not want to print his own or bind his own, that is his problem, but that is not a point of order in terms of Rule 66.
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is not a point of order. Hon Maseko, did you?

Ms L M MASEKO: Hon Deputy Speaker, I think Acting Chief Whip covered me. I just wanted to inform the hon member to check in his emails. The one that he did not read is the one of this. [Laugh.] Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Well, hon Dugmore, what I am happy to do is make you a copy if that will alleviate some of the stress or I will check with the Administration if it is possible to get you printed copies so that everyone has a copy ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: What is the score energy of the Acting Chief Whip of the DA?

Ms R WINDVOGEL: The hearing, the hearing.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, I see your hand is up.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: *Ja*, no, thanks. Hon Deputy Speaker, it was just simply that we had got used to it. I did receive the emails, they are available on email, but we had got used to it and it is useful

to have it properly printed. I do not think it is up to one hon member just to say they had printed it out or not. I think people ask for copies of the Rule Book when they come to this Legislature, and I think it is just important to have a printed copy. It costs less if you do it in bulk, et cetera. I know there is a reference to amending the Rules again, but all I am asking for and it is not just for me, is a limited print by the Legislature of new copies of the Rule Book because there are none available. Thanks.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore. I now recognise hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I do want to warn hon members of both sides of the House, but especially the ruling party. If we had to find each other in a gentlemanly manner, we must not nit-pick little things to deny access to information. Now, you do not know the circumstances of all hon members here and I support Cameron Dugmore, the hon Cameron Dugmore. If we ask for a printed copy, then let me get a printed copy. We waste millions on each department's copies of reports by Ministers, but now we do not want to give one copy of a set of Rules. I object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marais, thank you very much. Hon Sayed?
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, no, thank you. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Can I suggest that we continue with the Sitting. I do not

think this is an issue that we really want to fight about at this point. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. What I will commit to is at the beginning of the new year in February, that we have printed copies for you. That will make it easier. We will not print them now. I am sure they will get lost over the recess period. I would like to now move over to hon Xego to continue with his Motion without Notice.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Deputy Speaker, sorry to interject. Hon member has put in an apology. So, he is not part and parcel of this Sitting. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, thank you very much. I am going to move over to hon Makamba-Botya. Over to you.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House calls on the Western Cape Department of Social Development to extend its Sanitary Dignity Programme project beyond only school learners. The Department can achieve this through sponsoring and working with non-governmental organisations that are already involved in such projects. The current programme for learners by the Department should be applauded, but it can be expanded so as to

reach even more needy women out there, especially in townships, informal settlements and rural areas. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to. I recognise hon Makamba-Botya, you, again.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. I move without notice:

That the House calls on the Western Cape Department of Local Government to make conditional grants and transfers available to municipalities so that they can provide free water, electricity and sanitation to indigent households which rely only on social grants. Whilst we are aware that the City of Cape Town provides rebates to indigent households headed by pensioners from the age of 60 years and above, we call for more funds to be made available so that all these rates become free of charge and to also include child-headed households who survive on social grants. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to

the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

Mr D AMERICA: Yes.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No, no.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Makamba-Botya, you are again on the list.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House calls on the Western Cape Provincial Legislature to embark on a mission of reviewing and removal of all provincial statutes that are representative of apartheid and remain offensive to the majority our people. The review must make a deep analysis in searching for all these statutes or provisions that might be offensive and fall foul of the principle of constitutional validity when tested against the South African supreme Constitution. Hon Deputy Speaker, our people cannot continue remain living in fear just because they are scared to infringe certain apartheid provisions in statutes which might end up leaving them with fines or potential imprisonment upon their infringement. Hon Deputy Speaker, we must strive to be a proactive and responsive Legislature that

eradicates everything bad before they deeply manifest themselves in society. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] There are objections ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjection.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Oh, oh my God!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the exceptional achievements of two of the Western Cape's finest actors, who have exemplified the highest standards of our province's cultural sector and demonstrated their talent

on the world stage. 11-year-old Caleb Payne was recently honoured with a Youth Artist Academy Award in the category of Feature Film Leading Youth Artist for his role in the 2021 film *Good Life*. This is the first time any South African has won this award, and places Caleb in the auspicious company of previous winners such as Julia Roberts, Leonardo DiCaprio, and Zendaya. At the same time, renowned actress Kim Engelbrecht has been nominated for an international Emmy award for her work on the locally produced series *Reyka*, for which she has already won a SAFTA award. We commend these artists from our province on their achievements and their representation of our country on the world stage and wish them well on their future endeavours. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. I now recognise hon Baartman.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House welcomes the Western Cape Education Department's outstanding achievement of spending 100% of its infrastructure budget during the 2021/22 financial year. In total, this equated to more than

R1,7 billion. Every year, the Western Cape is a top destination for emigration as South Africans seek a better life of dignity, wellbeing, and safety. We know that this proves that our learners are in safe hands and that it further contributes towards their quality education taught in our province. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the Vredendal Regional Court fining three Saudi nationals R2 million for illegally harvesting a large quantity of flora without documentation. The trio, who were also found guilty of money laundering and ordered to leave South Africa, admitted in court that they had travelled to the country with the sole purpose of acquiring the flora and exporting it to their home country and recognises that this recent incident highlights the fact that plant poaching is not simply a petty crime, but forms part of an intricate international web of syndicates dedicated to the theft of our natural heritage. I also move that Minister Barbara Creecy and the National Department of

Environment, Forestry and Fisheries provide support in the form of funding and to engage with her counterparts in Law Enforcement to provide urgent support to stamp out this criminality.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon Van der Westhuizen, over to you again.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: I move without notice:

That the House notes the category winners of the annual Prestige Agri-Worker Awards that were announced at a gala ceremony at Grand West on Saturday, 5 November 2022, and particularly Mr Nigel Klaasen who was announced as the overall winner of 2022; and that the House commends the Western Cape Department of Agriculture for being the only provincial department in the country where the contributions of the agri-workforce to the agriculture economy are celebrated and recognised. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise hon Baartman.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Deputy Speaker, can I just get the name ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ...of the person that objected?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, can you just repeat?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: I heard there was an objection. I would like the name of the person that objected.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The person that objected: I would have to check on my Hansard.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Dugmore.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Maybe the Table staff can help. Over to you, hon Sayed.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Deputy Speaker? Hon Deputy Speaker, is that a point of order? [Interjection.] I do not think that is a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute. Hon Dugmore, I am just ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: In terms of which Rule?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...hon Sayed on the floor. One minute. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, could you maybe probably suggest to the hon Minister to wait until the Hansard comes out. Then, he can look at it. We all get the Hansard in our emails, and he can look at it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: In terms of Rule 60, it is not a point of order, hon Minister, but you are welcome to consult the Hansard. I did not see who that was, unfortunately.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: If a person objects, that person must have the conviction of his heart to state his name because I want ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Which Rule, which Rule?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ...to engage with him afterwards.
...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Which Rule asks that?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, is that you?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: *Ja.* Hon Deputy Speaker, on a point of order. You see, I think this is one of the examples, with the greatest of respect, that I want to raise in regard to bias because it is clear that the Leader of Government Business, that was not a point of order, but he was entertained twice where it is clearly not a point of order at all.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Like the printing of Rules.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...when you entertain that, hon Deputy Speaker, it creates ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...the wrong impression. I appeal to you, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, anybody that rises can raise a point of order. If it is not a point of order, the hon Minister has been told, it is not a point of order. Alright, we will move on. We now move over to hon Baartman.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker and hon Deputy Speaker, I just want to say welcome to the new leader of the Opposition in the House as well. She is looking quite beautiful today. I hereby move without notice:

That the House welcomes the great impact and progress made by the Harmony Project with their work in the Plettenberg Bay community. The Harmony Project is a UK-based organisation that attempts to make teaching practices more practical so that learners are already connected

with nature. Already, Grade 3 learners at the Bahia Formosa Primary School have had significant increases in their Maths and Language results. We look forward to even more developments in this regard. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. I ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there? There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the passing of Graham Power who was the founder and chairperson of the Power Group. Throughout his life, Mr Power made great strides as a formidable business leader in the fields of civil engineering and construction. He has also won many awards and had received various honours from the City of Cape Town in his efforts to help transform our society. His family and loved ones will remain in our thoughts. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mackenzie. Just before I ask the question, your audio was not good. Probably, people would not have been able to know that unless they were reading the words, but are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon Mackenzie, over to your next one. I hope that we can hear you clearly.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Can you hear me clearly now?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is not great at all. Hansard might find it difficult, but you can try.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Can you hear me better now?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Perfect, perfect! Continue.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. My Wi-Fi. Unfortunately, loadshedding is messing with all of us. I hereby move without notice:

That the House commends the Western Cape Government and City of

Cape Town in the jointly developed Human Settlements project in Woodlands, Mitchells Plain. That the House recognises the Western Cape Government's ongoing commitment to accelerate housing delivery in Mitchells Plain, while fostering social inclusion by creating integrated and sustainable human settlements in an open-opportunity society. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon Baartman.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, I hereby move without notice:

That the House notes two weeks ago the Beaufort West district library burned down, which contained the historical archives of many families within the municipality. Many children in the area relied on these books not only for their academic ambitions or to remember their history, but to escape into different worlds and adventures, to meet new people and explore places we only ever see on the big cinematic screen. It is still unclear what the cause of the fire was, and we call upon the local municipality and relevant law enforcement agencies to investigate this matter speedily. Our deepest sympathies are with the people of Beaufort

West and despite this set-back, we must rebuild Beaufort West. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon Baartman, over to your next one.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the Western Cape Minister of Health and Wellness for opening the new Bergsig Mental Health Ward at Nelspoort Hospital, in Beaufort West, on Monday, 7 November. Nelspoort is located approximately 50 kilometres north-east of Beaufort West. The Nelspoort Hospital is classified as an Intermediate Care Facility and has both TB and psychiatric beds. The total project cost was estimated at R18,6 million. This allowed for the renovation of existing wards, Bergsig, Omega, and Lusthof, and to improve the environment of care for current mental health care operational requirements. The total area renovated is +/- 3,740 square metres. The Bergsig ward has been completed and the estimated date of completion for Omega and Lusthof wards is January 2023. We thank the Department of Health for investing in infrastructure for the people in our rural constituencies and for caring

deeply for Nelspoort. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House welcomes the signing of a Memorandum of Intention between the Western Cape Provincial Parliament and the Bavaria State Parliament. This document will allow for greater exchange on parliamentary best practices so that we both can enhance our roles as legislators and oversight work. By building partnerships with different stakeholders, this move builds on our efforts to further whole-of-society approaches going forward. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon Sayed. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with grave concern the Provincial Government's poor handling of the racial tensions ...[Interjection.]

†Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Khange kutshiwe ekugqibeleni...[indistinct]

[Translation of isi-Xhosa paragraphs follow.]

[Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Wasn't that said in the end...[indistinct]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC):

...at Fish Hoek High School which started in May 2022 when a teacher allegedly used racial slurs during a lesson, a matter which we as the ANC raised sharply in this House; notes further that a ...[Interjection.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: [Indistinct]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC):

...diversity workshop at the school was abruptly halted by the Education MEC David Maynier after demands from the white right-wing who argued that the diversity workshop intervention by the Western Cape

Education Department (WCED) traumatized the learners; and that we acknowledge that the reaction by the right-wing elements proves that some of our schools remain racist enclaves – why else would young children be traumatized by antiracism interventions? And the House condemns in the strongest possible terms the DA’s MEC Maynier for cowering to white right-wing demands at the expense of driving non-racialism and protecting black learners who are continuously targeted and discriminated against in many former Model C schools; and calls on the MEC to provide this House with all details as to why the intervention was suspended, to desist from caving in to race denialists for the sake of building a right-wing coalition in the Western Cape, and to instead roll out more of these diversity workshops to tackle racism at a fundamental level in our schools. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Interjections.] There are ...[Interjections.] There are objections. The motion will ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No objection. No objection.

Mr G BOSMAN: Vehement objections.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

...[Interjection.]

Mr G BOSMAN: Vehement objections.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now recognise hon Bans. Hon Bans? No? Hon Sayed, over to you again and you can always come back to hon Bans.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Over to me again?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and condemns the bullying of learners at Cascade Primary School in Mitchells Plain, after an eight-year-old pupil was peed on, spat on, and even threatened with sexual violence, which resulted in the child fearing to go back to school anymore, as the bullying is not only from other learners but teachers as well, allegedly; notes further that the mother of the child laid complaints to the Western Cape Education Department, as well as the Mitchells Plain SAPS, but the police told her that the child needs to have visible injuries in order for them to open a case; notes that the House strongly condemns these horrific acts and calls on the WCED to accelerate its interventions for inclusive education and to eradicate all forms of discrimination and

abuse in our schools. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No objections.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: No objections.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...on the Order Paper. I now recognise ...[Interjection.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Haibo. What objections?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Who is objecting ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now recognise, hon members, hon Bakubaku-Vos. [Interjection.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Ai, people are sick.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Over to you, hon Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates ANC MPL Rachel Windvogel for her sterling work and dedication to solving a labour crisis, where about 100 workers became violent against each other after the employer agreed to only take some of them to work; she and her PCO administrators worked as a team with the Human Rights Commission Office, Police, Law Enforcement, Councilor Libazi and the Municipality to restore calm and order in the community; and that the labour issues will be dealt with at the headquarters of the employer and the Chief Director of Inspectors of the Department of Labour in the province and the Human Rights team with the MPL; and the team will continue to work together to resolve the issues. I so move, thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Mr D AMERICA: Yes.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No objection.

Mr L L MVIMBI: No objection.

Mr G BOSMAN: Object!

An HON MEMBER: We object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise hon Mvimbi. [Interjection.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Some people ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Can you hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I can hear you; you may proceed.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the ongoing attempts by the DA Mayor at the Oudtshoorn Municipality to evict a local museum from a Council-owned building despite a lease agreement which is for an indefinite period; notes further that it is clear that the DA-led administration is unhappy with the transformation that has taken place at

the museum and also, given proximity of the building to the Mall, want to give access to white business interests. I would like to make a call to the Premier and MEC Marais to urgently intervene to halt the planned eviction. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections?

An HON MEMBER: I object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections.

Mr G BOSMAN: Yes, objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the Department of Social Development's plan to close off certain MPOs assisting women and children and providing help to Gender-Based Violence victims. We have been sent letters alerting them to a possible discontinuation of funding in the 2023 financial year; and warns the Provincial Government against this, as it will have adverse effects on the vulnerable people in the province. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I move without notice:

An HON MEMBER: I object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections in the House. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Mvimbi, you may proceed to your next motion.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and condemns in the strongest possible terms the termination of the Department of Transport and Public Works' Blue Dot taxi pilot programme at the end of this month and is disappointed at the Department for wanting to cut this programme; notes further that the

Blue Dot programme, which was run in collaboration with the minibus taxi ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, one minute. That is not the – that is not your motion. Can you just check that you are reading the right one? I need to have that removed off Hansard. It is the one regarding the DA Mayor.

Mr L L MVIMBI: I finished that one. I am done with that one. That was the previous one.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Have you got it right?

Mr L L MVIMBI: I have done that one. That was the previous one I did before with hon ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, okay, one minute. I have two from you. I have regarding the one that has just been rejected, which was the Blue Dot taxi pilot programme ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: And I have this one, with regards to the Mayor at Oudtshoorn Municipality. I cannot, unfortunately, allow any ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Can I explain, hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Deputy Speaker, the first one I read was about the DA Mayor of Oudtshoorn, which I have finished. That was the one that was objected to. Thereafter, hon Windvogel read one. Then, this is now the second one of the Blue Dot I have not as yet read.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Deputy Chief Whip?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, I know that when we started off with citing Rule 66, but not knowing the respective subsection, I am going to ask that we allow hon member Mvimbi to do his second motion, since it was number 22 and 24. The fact that he swapped it around, perhaps it just has been a long day. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, no, thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I have been covered by the Acting Chief Whip on that. I think it is just a swap around. That tends to happen.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is fine.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, you may proceed, hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much for all your indulgence, hon members
...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thanks.

Mr L L MVIMBI: ...and the hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and condemns in the strongest possible terms the termination of the Department of Transport and Public Works' Blue Dot taxi pilot programme at the end of this month and is disappointed at the Department for wanting to cut this programme; notes further that the Blue Dot programme, which was run in collaboration with the minibus taxi industry, was aimed at improving taxi services and to improve passenger service quality and safety, as well as to empower and transform the industry and to address illegal operations and violent conflict; accepts that the Government's decision once more proves the disregard and undermining of the taxi industry by the uncaring DA-led Provincial Government which now say they do not have funding, which in turn forced them to cease the operation. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you for your indulgence, hon Mvimbi. [Interjections.] There are objections in House. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Dugmore. I see your hand is up.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Sorry, hon Deputy Speaker. No, the hon Deputy Chief Whip covered me. I am just still waiting for my opportunity to move a motion.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your opportunity, hon Dugmore, your opportunity is now. You may proceed. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House welcomes the report of Judge Kamphephe into allegations of racism at the Stellenbosch University as well as the current institutional culture and calls for engagements on its recommendations; and noting that the DA MP, Schreiber, has called on University funders to withdraw their support given the comments in the report about language and its potential to limit access to non-Afrikaans speakers; therefore resolves to condemn the DA for once again resisting transformation at Stellenbosch University and advocating language

policies which limit, rather than broaden access to the institution. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Are there any objections? [Interjections.] There are objections, the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Sayed, I do not think hon Bans is online? No. We will proceed. That brings us to the end of Motions without Notice. The Secretary will now read the Second Order of the Day.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

The SECRETARY: Consideration of report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on the Sectional Titles Amendment Bill [B 31B–2020] (NCOP).

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Secretary. Order! The House received the report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on the Sectional Titles Amendment Bill conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill. This mandate has been sent to the National Council of Provinces. I will now afford parties an opportunity to make a declaration if they so wish, for three minutes each. I recognise the ANC.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I am actually standing in for hon member Marran, who has taken ill, unfortunately, and is physically not able to be part of this. But I think it is a rare occasion that we have a situation where the Legislature discusses a Bill which has impact on the Province and then, actually mandates the Province to support the Bill. I think this is a reflection of the participation of hon members, the manner in which hon member Van der Westhuizen has chaired the session which discussed this particular Bill.

We do think it is important for our Province and for the country, and from the side of the ANC, we believe this will bring greater certainty to this sector in terms of the property industry. With those few words, hon Deputy Speaker, we welcome, we support the mandate, and we trust that this spirit of actually looking at the merits of legislation and not at times, and this applies to everyone, adopting narrow party-political positions, but taking decisions which actually take our country forward; that there would be more of this in the Legislature. So, it is a privilege and pleasure to talk in support of the Bill and the mandate that has been given. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you ...[Interjection.] thank you very much, hon Dugmore. It is within Rule 182.1 for a recommendation to be made, but I understand your point about mandate. I suppose that is a matter of interpretation. We will now move over to the EFF. Hon Makamba-Botya, are you online?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Hon Deputy Speaker, my apologies. The EFF is not making any declaration. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Noted, thank you. I will move over to GOOD. Hon August? No? I then move over to the ACDP. Hon Christians? No. I will then move over to the Freedom Front Plus. Hon Marais?

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): No. I do not have a comment on this.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Noted, thank you. I then move over to Al Jama-ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Al Jama-ah supports this Bill. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now call on the Democratic Alliance. Hon Van der Westhuizen, over to you.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. In 1971, the Sectional Titles Act ushered in a new era in homeownership in South Africa. The Act provided for the division of buildings into sections and common property, and for the acquisition of separate ownership in sections, coupled with joint ownership in common property. That also provided for the establishment of bodies corporate to control common property and for that purpose, to apply rules unique to the property.

This Act was later replaced by the 1986 Sectional Titles Act that *inter alia*, provided for a Sectional Titles Regulations Board. Ownership of units in well-run sectional title schemes have often seen excellent capital growth. This points to the desirability of living in such schemes. It also allowed and supported the identification of particularly, residential areas, allowing more people to stay closer to places of work such as inner cities.

In 2011, the Sectional Title Schemes Management Act, Act 8 of 2011, was added. This Act gave recognition to the important role that body corporates play in effectively organising and managing the common property. Yet, despite sectional title developments being popular and despite the Act having been amended more than once, certain important needs were not provided for in the existing legislation. The Sectional Titles Regulations Board therefore proposed a number of amendments to the existing Sectional Titles Act. These range from improvements in the definitions of certain terminology, such as exclusive use areas to situations where a body corporate has not yet been established and where the developer intends to consolidate or subdivide certain sections.

The amendments include provisions to change the size of the original scheme. An example of such an amendment is found in the new clause 26, that provides for the purchase of additional land to extend the common property. While it is generally accepted that the amendments are non-controversial, it did come as a surprise to me that the Standing Committee did not receive one single input in response to our public participation initiatives. Not a

response from developers, not from any of the many body corporates in the Western Cape. Neither from estate agents nor anyone else.

I am raising it here as I am concerned that our current public participation model may not have been kept up with the times. As members will see in the report, the Standing Committee recommended that the Sectional Titles Amendment Bill be supported, despite our initial small amendments not being accepted by the NCOP. We have since learned that none of the proposed amendments by provinces were supported and that the Amendment Bill was adopted as is. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to this motion? No objections, agreed to. I have to announce that there are currently 29 hon members present and entitled to vote and the House is, therefore, quorate. The question put before the House is that the report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on the Sectional Titles Amendment Bill conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill, be ratified and adopted. No objections? Agreed to.

No objections, agreed to. The question is therefore approved. The report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning on the Sectional Titles Amendment Bill has therefore been adopted. I here so move.

The Secretary will now read the Third Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Standing Committee on the Premier and Constitutional Matters on its oversight visit to Wi-Fi sites at the Centre for E-Innovation (CE-1) office (4 Dorp Street) and Groote Schuur Hospital on 27 July 2022.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr Secretary. I have been informed by the Chief Whip that the Programming Authority resolved that there will be no list of speakers and that parties who wish to do so, will now be afforded that opportunity to make a declaration of the Vote, for a maximum of three minutes. I now recognise the ANC. The ANC, no?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Can you hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, over to you, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, yes, I think one would – hon members would notice from the report that a number of hon members, including myself, were not able to physically participate in this visit, but from the side of the ANC, we have no objection to the report as tabled being supported. I just want to make two points.

I think all of us are very keen that the original commitments in regard to

access to Wi-Fi are actually delivered on and I think one of the critical issues is that there had been a commitment by this Provincial Government, to make sure that there would be a Wi-Fi hotspot in every single ward. Now, the reality is that as we speak, that particular objective has not yet been met. We also, secondly, note the fact, and you will often see it when you drive around in our communities, young people standing close to a school, standing close to a library, linking up to the Wi-Fi. One of the limitations of that is that in many cases, it does not have a 24-hour access to that Wi-Fi.

So, the visit, as I have indicated, we have no objection to the report, but we want the House and in particular, the Constituency MPs from the different areas, to really take a clear look as to where in the particular wards spread out, the 406 wards across our province, with the focus on those which cover historically disadvantaged communities, actually have 24-hour access to a dedicated Wi-Fi hotspot, not necessarily having to rely on access to the Wi-Fi at a school or a library or a clinic.

But in regard to the report itself, we have no objection and support that report. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Hon Dugmore. I now recognise the EFF. Hon Makamba-Botya?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Hon Deputy Speaker, we have no declaration from the EFF. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I am just checking if GOOD is in the House.

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Yes, hon Deputy Speaker. No declarations from GOOD, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the ACDP.
[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: That is good, that is good.
[Laugh.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I reckon no ACDP. The Freedom Front Plus, hon Marais? [Interjection.]

†Ms N D NKONDLO: Batyi, kunjani? Ndiyaphila akho nto.

[Translation of isi-Xhosa paragraphs follow.]

[Ms N D NKONDLO: Batyi, how are you? I'm fine thank you.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, thank you very much. [Interjection.]

†Ms N D NKONDLO: Heyi ndiyithumelelwa nguCameron.

[Translation of isi-Xhosa paragraphs follow.]

[Ms N D NKONDLO: Cameron sent this to me.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Interjection.]

†Ms N D NKONDLO: because ebeyibuza kum ukuba if it is true...

[Translation of isi-Xhosa paragraphs follow.]

[Ms N D NKONDLO: because he was asking me if it is true...]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we just mute it? ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: And is said there's nothing that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we just mute the hon member ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Sorry.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...who is speaking at the moment? I just want to go back to Al Jama-ah. No?

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, thank you, hon Deputy

Speaker. Yes, hon Deputy Speaker, I was actually on that oversight with the Committee and yes, from the Al Jama-ah, we support that report on the initiatives there of the Western Cape installing the Wi-Fi hotspots all over the Western Cape. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Brinkhuis. I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

Mr C Fry (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I intend to make sure that my speech is lively enough, so hon member Bakubaku-Vos does not feel the need to stretch again. [Laugh.]

On 27 July this year, the Standing Committee on the Premier and Constitutional Matters visited the Wi-Fi sites at the Centre for E-Innovations in Groote Schuur here in Observatory. The objective of these oversight visits was to access the facilities and gain a general sense of how well services were being delivered, including any issues with the Wi-Fi at 4 Dorp Street and Groote Schuur Hospital.

Hon Premier Alan Winde joined the Committee during the oversight visit to the E-Centres. Together with the hon Premier, the Committee gained first-hand experience on how the systems operated from a health, education and environmental viewpoint as well as the capabilities made possible for citizens through public Wi-Fi access.

As has been the case over the years, the Western Cape Government's efforts to guarantee that residents have sufficient access to the internet, were once again demonstrated. During the visit, it was also communicated that the State Information Technology Agency is implementing a 10-year broadband programme on behalf of the Western Cape Government, along with its partner, Liquid Intelligent Technologies. I applaud these transformative partnerships that will improve access to the Western Cape residents.

In the previous financial period alone, the Western Cape Government had spent over R1 billion on centres for E-Innovation. The Department of the Premier has played an important role in digitally empowering residents by ensuring the availability of digital services, providing facilities through which these services can be accessed. The Department provides residents with free internet access at 1,286 Wi-Fi hotspots and 75 Cape Access E-Centres located around the province. The Committee will make further visits throughout the Western Cape in upcoming year. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I have to announce that there are currently 30 hon members present and entitled to vote and the House is therefore quorate. The question put before the House is the Report of the Standing Committee on the Premier and Constitutional Matters be adopted. Are there any objections to the report being adopted? No objections.

Mr D AMERICA: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Agreed to. The report now of the Standing Committee on the Premier and Constitutional Matters has therefore been adopted. Hon members, we have come to the end of our programme. Before we adjourn, hon Sayed, over to you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker and I think the Sitting went off quite well. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Just one more thing. I have raised it at the beginning, earlier in the morning when the hon Speaker was in the chair. To date, hon members have yet to receive the soft copies of the Budget Speech and of the MERO. I just wanted that to be made known to the Table staff. We were told that it would be sent earlier on, but it still has not come through to the emails. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I will certainly follow that up with the Secretary and the Table staff here, and make sure that you get those copies. And thank you to all the hon members for cooperation today, to get through a busy programme. We do understand you are under a tremendous amount of stress.

So, I would just like to remind hon members that the Budget Committee meeting will commence after the adjournment of this Sitting and that concludes the business of the day. The Secretary will now end – oh, is it tomorrow? Hon Deputy Chief Whip, over to you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Because we went through lunch, the Procedural Officer for the Budget Committee has sent out the amended link for the meeting, that we are starting at half past 3. [Interjections.] Those who are here in person, we are hybrid here in the Chamber and those who are online can join on the online link. [Interjections.] But half past 3, we will commence so the hon members have time for lunch. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I had almost forgotten that there was still food for our hon members. So, hon members, the Secretary will now end the meeting and all hon members will be exited. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 14:05.