
FRIDAY, 23 OCTOBER 2020

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 09:00.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Good morning to all the members, to the Executive, to our guests and to the press. A very warm welcome to you here today!

I trust that everyone has been connected to participate, in order to be able to participate in today's sitting in terms of Rule 1A of the Standing Rules with regard to those members that are in remote sitting. All the members who are present here today, both here in the Chamber as well as on Microsoft Teams, have all the privileges and immunities that are imparted by law.

Members who are considered to be out of order by the Presiding Officer will have their microphones muted and called to order.

As ruled by the Presiding Officer in a sitting of the House on 23 April 2020, no interjections will be permitted during the debate. In this regard I also wish to draw the attention of the hon members to Rule 40 of our Standing Rules.

We will now proceed with Orders of the Day. The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Debate on the Premier's Address.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Mr Secretary. I have received a copy of the Premier's address delivered in the House on Thursday, 22 October 2020. The address is printed in the Minutes of the proceedings, and I now place it before the House for debate.

I recognise the hon member Windvogel. [Pause.] Member Windvogel, can you hear us?

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Hon Speaker, can you hear me, Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I can hear you clearly, you may proceed.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Speaker. Good morning, Hon Speaker, Premier, hon members and Leader of the Official Opposition. Speaker, the province waited with bated breath to hear the Premier's vision for the Western Cape after the severe impact of COVID-19 on the economy and people's livelihoods. The Premier failed to rise to the occasion. There is nothing new he presented. Instead he spent a lot of time reporting back on his Government's lacklustre response to COVID-19. The theme of this, of his speech, was *Courage to get the job done*. In fact, he mentioned the word "courage" 39 times in the speech.

How I wish he had the courage to tell the people how his Government undermined the relentless efforts of the National Government to save people's lives while the Western Cape Government undermined the Hard Lockdown Regulations. This resulted in the province being the COVID-19 epicentre and it remained so until they introduced a new testing strategy that only focused on those who are over 55.

The Premier did not have the courage to reflect the observation made in the Parow that the sharp economic downturn resulting from the health response to COVID-19 is expected to have the greatest adverse effect on low income households. In this part of the Western Cape community the impact is expected to be experienced particularly [Inaudible.] eroding the progress made in reducing extreme poverty in the world since 1990, while documents

at his disposal show him that poverty, hunger and inequality are increasing in the Western Cape. He failed to demonstrate courage to address these pathologies. I was struck by the interesting line that the Premier used in his speech, he said: “While we cannot control what is decided at other levels of government, we can be brave here.”

Was this his way of admitting that the right-wing DA faction in the City of Cape Town is more powerful than he? Where was his bravery and courage to call out Dan Plato and JP Smith when they created a concentration camp for the homeless people at Strandfontein during the lockdown?

The report by Doctors without Borders on health conditions in the Strandfontein concentration camp for homeless people found that there were a number of violations of international humanitarian standards with significant risk for the health and safety of residents of the shelter. It found that homeless people were at risk of negative health outcomes including causative transmission of COVID-19, TB and other communicable diseases, yet there was no courage to call out this cruel treatment of the homeless people.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I want to urge the Premier to have the courage to share the real story of the Western Cape COVID-19 response. The objective of the National Government was to save lives and preserve livelihoods in the Western Cape. Focus was solely on saving the economy.

This is the reason why, during this peak of infection, the Premier made reckless calls for the National Government to lift the ban on the sale of alcohol and tobacco products, despite the obvious risk.

Only yesterday did the Premier realise that we were correct in our position that the ban on the sales of alcohol should not be lifted. Yesterday he cried that the bushfires are starting to emerge. These are due to super spread like Tin Roof Nightclub in Claremont where the Western Cape Government tracked 89 cases of COVID-19 infections from an event at the club. This includes 38 Grade 12 learners.

Health Minister Mkhize has said that in the last two weeks there has been a 42% increase in new infections in the Western Cape, while there is the resurgence of COVID-19 infections, both in the country and the Western Cape in particular, as well as in other countries globally. The Western Cape Government is at it again, making other reckless calls with the National Government to scrap the Red List of high-risk countries and allow international travellers into South Africa. The real story of COVID-19 infections was shared by Dr Jantjie Taljaard, head of the Division of Infectious Disease at the Stellenbosch University. He said that the current data suggests that the poor areas in South Africa have been hit the hardest by the COVID-19 infection. He said figures showed that the Coronavirus has infected twice as many South Africans living in poor areas compared to those residing in wealthier suburbs and that the living conditions in informal settlements make it very challenging to contain the virus due to difficult

socio-economic circumstances, such as overcrowding and the sharing of communal taps and toilets.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Premier must have the courage to admit that he's failed the poor in the province and that he does not have a plan to address the socio-economic circumstances that made the poor more vulnerable to the pandemic. Knowing him, we will not be surprised if the Premier fails to tell this House and the province that he failed. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon Minister Meyer. [Interjections.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Gooi! [Applous.]

[An HON MEMBER: Throw! [Applause.]]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon members of the Provincial Cabinet and my Cabinet colleague, Minister Fritz here in the House, hon Leader of the Official Opposition and leaders of the other official political parties in this Legislature, hon members of the Legislature, special guests, members of the public. I rise to take part in the debate of the best Premier in South Africa, Alan Winde. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Deputy Speaker, yesterday the

Premier shared our whole of government and whole of society journey and the courage to get the job done. Under his leadership this Government has the courage to effect change, in his own words, because every life must matter. The Premier is serious in his words and in his deeds when he said, and I quote: “When you invest and focus on a common goal anything is possible.”

Hon Deputy Speaker, in agriculture we have a common goal and we will continue to invest in agriculture because like the Premier of Agriculture believe everything is possible. *ʃ'n Boer maak 'n plan!* [A farmer makes a plan!]

During lockdown, agriculture was declared as an essential service and our farmers and our farmworkers and producers continue with production, distribution and sale of agriculture, and so during COVID-19 agriculture continued to feed the nation. We salute the farmers and the farmworkers of South Africa. The COVID-19 pandemic highlighted that Government must also create the appropriate environment for farming and for agriculture to flourish. The Western Cape agricultural sector did not emerge unscathed [audio distorted.] hon Deputy Speaker, from the COVID-19 pandemic. There were disruptions in value chains, loss of markets, increase of cost of compliance and even changing consumption patterns to a weakening exchange rate.

Hon Deputy Speaker, we believe that the agricultural sector will lead the economic recovery of the economy of the Western Cape and the job creation.

There are currently 6 937 commercial and 9 844 small farmers in this province and according to the 2020 First Quarter Labour Survey by Stats SA there are 254 000 agri-workers and another 230 000 agri-processing workers in the Western Cape.

Hon Deputy Speaker, these numbers represent 28% of all agricultural workers in South Africa and 17.2% of the Western Cape labour force. The total agricultural value production amounted to R43,8 billion in 2018.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the contribution to the Western Cape economy by the agricultural sector, its forward-and-backwards linkages are equal to 11% of the gross value add of the provincial economy.

Hon Deputy Speaker, in the period of 2008 and 2018 the real value of agricultural exports has grown by 6.4% per year with the result that the Western Cape now exports 50%, Mr Pieter Marais, 50% of all South Africa's agricultural export products from the province that we also represent in this Chamber; eight of the top ten export products from the province are either essential agricultural commodities or value-added products such as wine. It is therefore not strange that agriculture is the most competitive of all the sectors in each of the five districts in this province.

The second most crucial sector of the rural economy is tourism after making use of agricultural infrastructure. Agriculture is key to the

economic growth in this province as well as in the five districts, hence while the South African GDP contracted 51% during the second quarter of this year, the value of agricultural production in the first quarter, hon Deputy Speaker, increased by 28%, and 15% in the second quarter.

Agriculture, hon Deputy Speaker, is the ideal position to lead the post-COVID-19 recovery of the Western Cape economy. Agriculture is now positioned to create jobs and to contribute to the safety, the dignity and the wellbeing of the people in the Western Cape. The Department of Agriculture in the Western Cape will now be focusing on increased agricultural production in a sustainable manner. We will do so also by improving food security and safety, transform the agricultural inclusive sector and innovative and resilient rural economies.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape Department has also now identified certain projects ready for implementation during the 2021 and 2021/2022 financial years. These are the commodity approach, food security, rural safety interventions, agri-worker interventions, the establishment of lucerne at Ebenhaeser, the irrigation of the Brandvlei Dam, irrigation development at Buffeljags Dam, invasive alien clearing, support to our vulnerable industries, the erosion stabilisation and river protection, stock watering systems, upgrading and refurbishing of irrigation canals, firebreaks fencing for area-wide planning, and the further appointment of interns.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape Department of Agriculture's One Home One Garden Campaign plays a significant role in encouraging and assisting qualifying households to establish vegetable gardens. To date we have established 2 589 vegetable gardens across the Western Cape. Through this campaign I've been mostly inspired by people. One such person is Natasha Johannes from Mitchells Plain who established a vegetable garden from a dumping site. Natasha Johannes started a community garden five years ago after being diagnosed with colon cancer. She needed to eat fresh vegetables as the cancer caused her to feel weak and tired. She was unemployed at the time and could not afford to buy vegetables. She then identified a dumping site behind her house as a space to convert it into a vegetable garden. Supported by her husband, Jerome, they approached the City of Cape Town to gain access to the land and with the support of the Western Cape Department of Agriculture the dumping site has been replaced with a thriving community vegetable garden. I am pleased that Minister Fritz is aware of these developments. I was joined by the Premier recently in this place.

In Natasha's own words the vegetable garden is her passion and she now teaches communities as far afield as Bonteheuwel to grow these vegetables.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please finish off, Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Lastly, hon Deputy Speaker, this Government has now the courage to drive the economy and working through farmers and farmworkers to stimulate not only the economic growth but also safety, dignity and wellbeing. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I would just like to check before we move on, if hon Xego actually is online, if he has managed to get back in time. I know he was on a flight and I am going to then...

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is he here? No.

An HON MEMBER: No, he is not.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I recognise the hon Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, may I rise on a point of procedure, please?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, yes you may.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I got a message from the EFF after the debate had started to ask whether there could be a

change to the Speakers' List and replace hon Xego with hon member Makamba-Botya. However, given the late notice I have not been able to engage with all party leaders to check whether the change is acceptable and therefore I would like to ask now whether there are any objections if we can amend the Speakers' List.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, I am willing to take that up. Are there any objections to amending the Speakers' List as per the request of the Chief Whip?

HON MEMBERS: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There does not seem to be, Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much.

An HON MEMBER: No objection.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Then we will then amend the Speakers' List accordingly to replace hon member Xego with hon member Makamba-Botya as the third speaker in the debate. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Chief Whip. I recognise hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The speech delivered by the Western Cape Premier yesterday was not only uninspiring but a waste of time. It was the devoid of substance in all aspects and lacked any real solutions to the challenges we face as a province. Perhaps you should have consulted the Opposition for input in this regard.

The Premier's speech, like that delivered by his Provincial Finance Minister the day before, did not provide solutions to economic challenges affecting the province. Instead, what they did was to leave the Economic Recovery Plan in the hands of the invisible hand of the market with the hope that the unguided and unassisted private sector will steer the province out of this economic crisis. The very same Government is not doing enough to assist businesses recover from economic losses experienced during the period of Hard Lockdown. Instead, they are playing a blame game by pointing everything on National Government.

We are told that the province must anticipate some 150 000 jobs whilst only 20 000 new jobs will be created through the so-called rapid intervention, which the Premier has no clue what it is, even today.

He further mentioned that the Provincial Government will freeze non-critical posts while the children of your Cabinet Ministers are provided with jobs in Government through patronage and nepotism.

One thing that COVID-19 taught us was the future is uncertain and we must adopt innovative and viable options to draw income and keep the economy going; to respond to the issue of employment effectively in the era of the Fourth Industrial Revolution. The Provincial Government must create an enabling environment for youth to be able to utilise technology, innovative ways to generate economic income. This can only be championed through investing in proper research.

The Premier further mentioned that everyone in the province, despite their birth circumstances, can live a life of true value. I find this to be ironic under this Government that illegally evicts the poor and use excessive force to make sure that they remain homeless; the same Government which is currently appealing a positive judgment of the High Court seeking to guide and direct it on how to address the issues of spatial planning in the Tafelberg matter. The Housing Dedensification Project announced by your Government early this year to mitigate the effects of COVID-19 in a number of congested informal settlements became history before it even began, because your Government chose to cut the housing budget by more than R200 million. This is in line with your so-called Prioritisation Plan where outcomes are achieved through doing less by effectively prioritising the interests of the rich and white at the expense of the poor. Moreover, your speech fails to mention how your Government plans to tackle the ever-increasing crime in the province. This is so because you know very well that your so-called Safety Plan is nothing but a wasteful and a fruitless venture that will never produce any positive outcome.

The Western Cape townships are currently under siege from marauding gangs and crimes who are going around demanding protection fees from local business, whilst your Government remain idle.

It is also shocking that your speech failed to take note of the current resurgence of the COVID-19 infections taking place in the nightclubs and some public spaces... [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): A point of order.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Deputy Speaker, is there a point of order?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One moment, hon member, just one minute. I see there is a hand up by the Chief Whip. Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I would like to ask whether it is parliamentary for the hon member to refer to the Premier as “you”. Should this not go via the Chair?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon member Makamba-Botya, we have to refer and remember we are all hon members here, so can you please refer to the Premier either as Premier or as hon Premier. Thank you very much.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Noted, hon Deputy Speaker. I will take note of that. It is also shocking that the Premier failed to take note of the current resurgence of COVID-19 infections taking place in nightclubs and some public spaces in the province. This is so because the Premier does not care about human life but how your friends in business can generate more financial income through the opening of the national borders. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Makamba-Botya. I now recognise hon member Botha.

†n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

Ms L J BOTHA: Deputy Speaker, in a decision where residents have no voice, 150 000 jobs were sacrificed in our province. For six months we had no choice but to stay safe and stay home. Consequently, on 16 October we remembered World Food Day during a time when many more people in our country had less to eat than what they had just a year ago, and poverty levels have sadly deepened.

Fortunately, following the special address by the Premier I note that this DA-led Western Cape have championed the humanitarian workstream and provided over 15 million meals, delivered 800 000 medicine parcels to the vulnerable, along with building South Africa's first state-of-the-art field

hospital.

Deputy Speaker, I have no doubt in the confidence of the Economic Recovery Plan to further these groundbreaking achievements under their commitment to making brave decisions in its Economic Recovery Plan.

In addition, I am able to draw attention of the House to the following remarks by Professor Salim Karim, the country's leading epidemiologist when he said, "...that this country learnt from the Western Cape. It became the teacher and showcased decisive leadership in keeping infections low." Well done Premier and the Western Cape Government!

This week the High Court ruled that all provinces, except that of the Western Cape, have reversed on their obligation to provide Early Childhood Development Centres with their subsidies, prior, during and post-lockdown.

ECD Centres not only provide foundational educational resources but offer jobs for many and are a key factor in our socio-educational setting, a fact that only this DA-led Western Cape took to heart. In the Western Cape your education, development, health, your dignity matters and form a central part of the Provincial Economic Recovery Plan.

I wish to thank and pay sincere homage to every frontline worker and our residents who have sacrificed in helping us move forward from the disaster

effects of COVID-19.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the reality is South Africa has been in need of a recovery plan and hard decisions before the COVID-19 pandemic. The current battered economic climate can only be blamed on too many years of poor implementation of economic policy by the National Government.

Since infrastructure-led growth formed an essential part of the National Recovery Strategy, allow me to explain. Today the percentage of schools in South Africa that comply with the minimum physical infrastructure stands at a mere 59% after 20 years of prioritising education under the ANC-led Government. I make this example to showcase that we have had the opportunity for infrastructure-led growth to the benefit of more than just learners. Only now the National Government realised one could supplement schools with assistance and create jobs, something that the DA-led Government has embarked on during the pandemic to ensure the smooth functioning of classrooms within its existing budget and was able to pay over 1000 assistants a stipend.

Hon Deputy Speaker, however, the unions have insight on the new plan around teaching assistants from the National Government. This surely cannot be inclusive growth. This Government has already planned and understood its role in creating growth and development to the benefit of all our citizens. In fact, at the start of 2021 we will again experience an influx of learners to the Western Cape seeking better education

opportunities, yet the increasing budget we so desperately need to accommodate learners has been neglected year-on-year. We have been forced to make hard decisions in the Western Cape because the ANC has been poor at implementation of economic reconstruction plans for more than 20 years and that is sadly our reality. Here in the Western Cape we have moved beyond the implementation stage of our previous administrators. We were thus able to provide the best care despite the precarious conditions of COVID-19 and were thus able to table the first real Recovery Plan – a plan that seeks to restore dignity and one where residents and business alike are supported and where there are prepared healthcare systems for the vulnerable. We are not out to protect our position in Government. Our legacy will be one of innovation through tough times. Deputy Speaker, our plan places our province's people, their needs and wellbeing first, and, as the DA, we will hold the Premier and his Executive accountable to the transparent and courageous pursuit thereof.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Deputy Speaker, the COVID-19 pandemic has decimated economies across the globe. Economic growth has collapsed and unemployment queues are

growing everywhere. South Africa has not been spared this misery and neither has the Western Cape. I agree with the Premier that we need to be bold and courageous if we are to navigate our way from this unplanned and unforeseen crisis and its devastating impact, but we also need to be meticulous. We need to be meticulous about what we will do, when we will do it and what we expect to achieve.

Unfortunately, the Premier has not been meticulous. The Premier presented broad-sweeping, old promises that fail to meet the crisis. The Premier is literally putting lipstick on a pig. These are not bold and courageous plans. These are the same plans being presented to us for the third time, camouflaged with new labels.

On 18 July last year the Premier addressed this Parliament for the first time. He committed to creating jobs. He committed to ensuring a dignified life for each and every resident and he committed to safety. Likewise, at the State of the Province Address in Mitchells Plain on 20 February this year, we have been promised a job in every household. We were promised an environment conducive to growth and jobs. We were promised a support package for small businesses including an SME booster fund. We were promised red-tape reduction. We were promised a streamlined and smaller government. We were promised an energy-secure future. We have already been promised a game-changing minibus taxi project to incentivise improved public transport. We were promised integrated housing and affordable housing opportunities in proximity to

our economic centres. We were promised enhanced commuter rail. We were promised a Premier's Priority Committee on Safety and then it became a Safety Plan and a Safety Cabinet. Yesterday the Premier's special address to Parliament was just recycled ideas we have heard all before.

Now there is nothing wrong, hon Deputy Speaker, with choosing a strategy and staying the course, but why present the ideas of something new and as being in response to the biggest crisis of our time? Why not report to this Parliament what these old plans have achieved to date, how they will be strengthened to respond to the crisis? The one bold and courageous idea we should have heard a lot more about, was the funding of an infrastructure programme through borrowing. I agree that we need our own version of the New Deal, a massive infrastructure-led economic growth and employment programme, but because the Premier was not meticulous, this was presented as some vague pie in the sky idea rather than a well thought out plan with details as to what infrastructure would be built, where, for what value and for what cost benefit.

Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape Government is becoming a government of announcements. The people of this province deserve real plans and the meticulous details. Bold and courageous intervention can be staying the course with tried and tested plans, but we need to hear how these plans have been implemented, what they have achieved to date and how they can be improved. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Herron. I now recognise hon Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Deputy Speaker, all protocol observed. [Mic off]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Oh! [Mic on] Deputy Speaker, good morning, all protocol observed, because I have very little time, so I hope everyone forgives me for that.

I just want to start off by saying that in this province, and I want to emphasise, in this province the ANC and the EFF have become completely irrelevant. That is why they talk this absolute drivel because they must go to Hanover Park and to Mitchell Plain and ask the people the impact of the innovation of this Premier and of his speech and then they must come back here. The same with Brett Herron, hon Brett Herron must really come out of Sea Point and get into Hanover Park and hear how people feel safe for a change, that they have not felt for a long time.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I am in Hanover Park more than you!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: So they have become

completely irrelevant, and I do not think we must waste time with. Actually focus, we must just keep focus and go deliver to the people and stop listening to these irrelevant people. So of late I have drawn strength, hon Deputy Speaker, from Ralph Waldo Emerson. He is a famous philosopher from America and his famous words are, "What lies behind us and what lies ahead of us are tiny matters compared to what lies within us..." and I really want to today draw on that within-us spirit and within the spirit of the Premier, who has really taken the lead up front to take us and to take the team with him and not only our team, to actually take the Opposition with him, to take our own caucus with him in changing the way people live in giving dignity, jobs and safety to our communities.

So these words resonate deeply with me, as last week I reconnected with my home town, Hanover Park. I went there to participate in the redeployment of our LEAP officers following a spate of shootings the previous week that left two people dead and 11 people injured, and I tell you it was such a proud moment to see our LEAP officers that Brett Herron does not have a clue about, when you see them stand and line up on parade and young kids admire them. They are not admiring the 28-gangs; not the 26-gangs; they are admiring these law enforcement officers standing on parade.

I am proud to say that since the deployment of LEAP officers to Hanover Park supported by amazing Colonel Fredericks, a man of absolute wisdom,

the acting Station Commander of Philippi Police Station, and Alderman Van Reenen, Alderman J P Smith, there has been a significant decrease in shooting incidents and we have begun to see change in the attitude of residents in that area. There is an improved sense of safety returning to the community long terrorised by gangsters. Unfortunately – as we said, a significant decrease – this week we had the first incidence of two shooting incidents and immediately the police acted. Colonel Fredericks acted immediately.

Hon Deputy Speaker, when Premier launched the Western Cape Safety Plan, he made an unequivocal commitment to using every tool at his disposal to make our community safer and the successes in Hanover Park are a testament to this. You know what, the hon Brett Herron or the ANC and the EFF, they have no clue, because when they become MPs then it seems they move out of the areas. The deployment of LEAP in Hanover Park is no flash in the pan either. Their deployment will last for as long as needed to put a stop to the violence and to restore the legitimacy of the State, because remember the trust deficit has increased, and we tried to rebuild that trust deficit, Deputy Speaker. These deployments will not be done on a whim. They will be informed by up to date crime pattern analyses from SAPS and will rely on the local data to ensure that we target crime, so we cannot have officials in the area; we have to monitor it all the time, stabilise the area and really take note of the data of that area. We have to speak about the strong partnerships we have built; we have built SAPS and the City, hon Deputy Speaker. Let it be on record that there is

no competition between LEAP officers and SAPS. SAPS must take the lead in fighting gangs and crime. They take the lead. It is under their command. In turn we will continue building partnerships. It is in fact juvenile and misleading for the ANC, the EFF and GOOD to argue otherwise.

As Premier Winde outlined in his recovery plan, safety is a crucial component in the face of this COVID pandemic. We cannot revive the economy if our people are too scared to go to work, to use public transport, to go to the shop. You know, we cannot employ the many individuals who lost their jobs due to the lockdown, if industries are held hostage by criminals and thugs.

Madam Deputy Speaker, we will ensure that the safety initiatives highlighted by Premier Winde, such as the deployment of an additional 500 LEAP officers covering all 10 offices, hon Deputy Speaker, my friend hon Christians, all 10 gang-infected hotspot areas. The amendments to the Western Cape Liquor Authority will get special impetus as we are in fact looking to employ a specialist advocate or attorney to just focus and drive the liquor amendments and look at innovative ways to open the economy as my colleague here next to me will say, and to make sure that we do not have the consultants in between who block the system.

We need to get quicker ways of getting licences, but responsible ways of dealing with alcohol harms.

The deployment of 1000 safety ambassadors, these are different. Some of the ambassadors are young people in schools and in many of our municipalities, so I think a very, very important point, 120 peace officers will be deployed to about five municipalities, hon Deputy Speaker.

The Safety Plan itself is composed of the Law Enforcement arm and Violence Prevention arm. We will not achieve our aim of halving the murder rate over the next ten years and reduce violence in the province through additional law enforcement alone. The entire purpose of the Safety Plan is to reduce crime by addressing the roots of crime and I want to quickly tell you a story that is not in the speech.

There are two young boys in Laingsburg that were caught, were found by an active councillor called Lindie Potgieter in that town and before they were locked up, she begged me when I was as MEC with one of our great social workers there for Social Development; she said: "Please save these kids", and she is passionate. She took them into her home. I just want to report back. Yesterday she phoned me, and she said to me, hon Deputy Speaker, crying, the one boy got 100% for two subjects, two! The others are all 80% - now you know an 80% is an A, 80% - he just got 80% s, but 100% for two subjects.

This is what our Violence Prevention Programme is. This is the programme. [Applause.] In this regard and in that example, our area-based teams, it is that model that will bring together schools, social workers,

psychologists, doctors, because safety is a health issue, man, a public health issue, faith-based organisations, Local Government, to ensure that we permanently stop the violence plaguing our communities, but it starts with changing around the institutional violence within all of us, and I spoke, drawing on the strength of me, now on every child we have amazing strength and that is what we are drawing too.

Going forward, hon Deputy Speaker, my Department will be engaging with district and local municipalities, on the establishment of area-based teams also for the rural areas. Hon Tertuis will remind us to not forget about the rural areas. So we are not just in the city and I want to also just...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... in conclusion say, we hope that everyone will come on board, the ANC, the EFF, GOOD, my dear friend of the ACDP.

An HON MEMBER: ACDP.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: My other dear, dear friend will come on board in saving and changing around the way violence has been perpetrated in this province. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister. I recognise hon member Christians.

†n AGBARE LID: Gooi! Gooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Throw! Throw!]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it was very concerning yesterday, and rightfully so, when the Premier said that the country's economy is shrinking and that unemployment is growing, but the problem is when our provincial budgets are cut and as the Premier mentioned yesterday that the people on the ground are suffering, and it is so unfortunate that we know that money at National Government are still wasted and also missing and this is the heartsore story. But hon Deputy Speaker, let me say I share the sentiments of our Premier by thanking everybody in the province for playing their role. If you go to malls and we go to places you see people playing their role, and they said the significant thing is because everybody is complying with the regulations – not all over, but in most of the places that we have gone through, but, especially we also as the ACDP want to thank our frontline workers, people that are committed to fight this pandemic.

This morning in the *Cape Times* - Premier must explain why the headline says: "Winde, Mkhize differ on Western Cape COVID stats", headlines of the paper, and what is National Government's interpretation, where do they

get their figures from and where does the Premier get his figures from? But Premier, I also heard you saying yesterday, that you want a seat at the table of the wage bargaining table, and I think rightfully so, but as a legislature we also need a table when it comes to spending our money on LEAP officers; as a Community Safety Standing Committee has alleged that we have no oversight, and yet we give money to that.

We need to get reports to say what is done, where it is done, we need to have a say when money is spent on LEAP officers, and we need, like I said, a seat at the table when it comes to that because I will agree with Minister Fritz; the other day I have been in Manenberg and you can see the law enforcement officers around, because we need to get our people to work, but they need to feel safe when they go to work, but we cannot just hear about it in the newspapers. We need to get actively involved as Legislature and as Standing Committee.

Premier, I also want to bring to your attention and to the attention of the Minister of Agriculture, Dr Ivan Meyer, that yesterday while you were making your speech, I believe, and I do not want to play politics with this, yet again farmworkers were evicted from farms in Drakenstein.

Others were receiving eviction notices and the problem is colleagues phoned me to tell me that these people gave their prime of their lives on those farms, 40 years, 30 years, and now they are evicted. I don't know the details and I said I will bring it to the attention of Minister Meyer and

maybe if I get more details we can discuss it, but we are talking about dignity. We are talking about respect, and if it is lawful or not, and I think as a government we must really look at that, because I just need some research. There was a lot done there and there is a lot of politics being played but I am talking about serious issues of children being evicted, families being evicted.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I will finish off with the following – I want to say as an Education Committee we went to all the schools. PPEs were all in order. The one concern was the shoddy work done by contractors not even in the Western Cape and the principals trying to get those people to fix the schools properly. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians. I now recognise hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Premier unfortunately yesterday once again became the bearer of bad news, no fault of his own, of course. National Government decided to cut our budget allocation once more, to feed the ever-increasing homicidal impulses of corrupt SoEs.

Without money, your promises, Premier, will remain what it says, promises. Efficiency, spending cuts and a new delivery model are fine. It is okay, but you missed one vital fifth element of your plan and that I want to tell you, and the Minister sitting over there, Minister Meyer mentioned it, subsidiarity, he said that is your policy. I hope you would have mentioned it yesterday, subsidiarity is the same as our policy in the Freedom Front, it calls for greater autonomy, greater credible autonomy so you can run your own affairs. We are now at the calling of National Government. We have a three-headed monster there. We have the ANC, we have COSATU, we have the SACP and now they have got a kindergarten called the EFF that sort of direct things in their favour. [Laughter.]

Premier, we are under the influence of a red brigade and the ANC dances to their tune at the moment. Let us break the chains of domination and submission that Central Government has over us. Let us free ourselves politically, economically. You have the ideas. We have competent Ministers here. We have competent members of all parties, but we are sitting, we are chained to an incompetent clan hell-bent on enriching themselves at national level.

Premier, safety, I know you promised a Safety Plan. Thank you, Minister Fritz, for what you have attempted to do, but let us face it – your plans are still subject to confirmation by the National Minister of Police. I mean if they do not give you money then you do not have money.

An HON MEMBER: It is our own money.

Mr P J MARAIS: And if you have your own money I want to wait and see what Minister Maynier is going to promise us. Thank you for that. I will remind him. [Laughter.] You said so.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Tell them that. [Laughter.]

Mr P J MARAIS: I want to ask you, Minister, Premier Fritz. [Laughter.] You spoke of that. Maybe I am futuristic! [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr P J MARAIS: Premier, I want to ask you, I hope your spatial plan is not a copy of Patricia de Lille's spatial plan. She is withholding the land. She is not giving us the land. Wingfield, Kensington – all this open land is in her control. I want to know if you want densification. Do you want to bring unemployed people to where the work is supposed to be or are you prepared to take the work to where the people are? So I want to also say what do you do about... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member.

Mr P J MARAIS: I want you to consider establishing an unemployment

agency where people can go and register if they are unemployed so that there is a bridge between available jobs and jobseekers. Everybody does not have internet to look for jobs. We need an agency. I want you to consider that, but I also want you to consider freeing ourselves from Central Government domination. Thank you. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais. I now recognise hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The COVID-19 was a hard lesson to all. The unresolved inequities of the past came back to haunt us. COVID-19 exposed the disparities between the haves and the have-nots. COVID-19 hotspots were all in communities where poor people reside. This should be blamed on refusal of the DA to dedensify the densely populated communities and the deliberate decision to force people from these communities to self-isolate in the same houses they share with three or more family members. This was clearly part of the bigger strategy to drive herd immunity which led to the Western Cape becoming the epicentre.

In moving forward the Premier told us about his ingredients for hope, which he says are recipes for real changes. These are to create jobs, build safer communities and to ensure dignity and wellbeing of people. It is not clear how this will be achieved as there is no coherent plan that has been presented. Moreover, unemployment, poverty, hunger and inequality are

on the rise in the province. In order to achieve this, the Premier needs courage to address the imbalances of the past, apartheid spatial legacy and economic disparities that are persistent in the province. It is really disappointing that he did not demonstrate any courage to address the real pathologies of the Western Cape inequality, poverty and unemployment.

During his address yesterday the Premier said something which struck me. He admitted that the Western Cape Government is broke; there is no funding to invest in its recipe for real change, including plans for infrastructure projects. For the first time in the history of the province, Government is considering taking loans from financial institutions. Premier, does this mean the Western Cape does not have funds in its reserves?

Deputy Speaker, in the Premier's address of moonshots and courage, he identified the failing transport system as a stumbling block to the economy. He however did not dwell much on plans to help save the failing MyCiTi and Go George Buses. I was also disappointed that he did not tell us how he would support the taxi industry as per the resolutions of the provincial lekgotla.

Another impediment was safety. He correctly noted that many lives have been lost to violent crimes in the province. There are ongoing turf wars in the Cape Flats. There is also an emergence of a new threat of extortion especially in Khayelitsha, where emerging businesses have to pay

protection fees. The Premier did not reflect on this yesterday. Perhaps he knew that we would ask – where is the R1 billion Safety Plan when gangs run amuck in our communities?

Funnily enough, Minister Fritz says people of Mitchells Plain are feeling comfortable. There is no such thing. People of Mitchells Plain are living in fear as they get robbed, as their houses get burgled by the same gangsters. Where is the Safety Plan? Where is this thing that he talks about that people of Mitchells Plain feel safe? We must not be engineers? [00:55:55] here. We must tell things as they are, that the DA Government has failed. There is no Safety Plan. It is just an empty strategy that is not even implemented properly. We must also ask where are the 1500 boots on the ground which were later revised to 1000 with no explanation? To date only 438 officers are deployed with some trained officers languishing at home with no salaries as they are not deployed.

We welcome the initiative taken by the Khayelitsha Development Forum to mobilise society for a prayer session and to discuss safety challenges in Khayelitsha.

The people have accepted that this Government does not care about their plight. They are now organising themselves. This is a vote of no confidence by the people of Khayelitsha on this useless DA regime.

How useless can a government be if after spending hundreds of millions on

a response to medical emergency, its public healthcare facilities remain poor in the state they were in before the crisis? The Western Cape spent most of the funds on temporary solutions like building field hospitals, employing agency personnel and renting bed space in private hospitals. No investment was made to finding a lasting solution to our public healthcare challenges. While the Premier brags about building the Hospital of Hope in six weeks, he omits to tell us that the hospital was in operation between June and August despite millions having been spent.

In closing, hon Deputy Speaker, if the province is to recover from this major setback, the Premier must have the courage to address inequalities, racism and white privilege. He must be brave to take drastic decisions to reverse apartheid spatial planning. The Tafelberg ruling presented him with an opportunity to [Inaudible.] this. He can also choose to object to the plans to extend the lease of the Rondebosch Golf Club and use this land for low-cost housing.

As he claims victory for the School Nutrition Programme, he must acknowledge that the ANC was the first party to call for the programme to continue during school closure.

We are yet to hear the explanation on why the Western Cape refused to adopt a cooperative approach that included Opposition parties in the same way that the President of the country did at national Level. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Lekker. I now recognise hon Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. The Province's consideration of an introduction of per-unit for alcohol is not going to solve the drinking problem. The Province must look at the accessibility to alcohol in our residential areas. Shebeens, legal or illegal, along with drug dens are on every street corner, many near institutions of education, religious centres and health facilities. The increase in price of the cheapest alcohol will not be effective. It is the accessibility to it. Stop the municipalities, stop the local municipalities; stop the DA-led City of Cape Town from giving permission to schools to sell liquor at school events. We have more shebeens than recreational facilities in our province. The Province must address the real issues as it is on the ground. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Brinkhuis. I now recognise hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

†Die MINISTER VAN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID: Gooi kole!

[The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Throw coals!]

†n AGB LID: Gooi kole!

[An HON MEMBER: Throw coals!]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, hon members, the Premier and [Interjections.] residents of the Western Cape.

The problem with Zoom is that you do not know where people are Zooming from. Because I think people are Zooming from other provinces, because they do not know what is happening in the Western Cape.

Without [Inaudible.] the COVID-19 pandemic immediately led us to the fork in the road. A juncture of which the likes we have not experience and one where every government was compelled to [Interjections.] choose [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...to respond in one or two ways.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Either remain in the comfort zone of the old routine or continue with the familiar. Or innovate and meet the greatest challenge of our lifetime head-on with bravery and courage.

Hon Deputy Speaker, in the Western Cape we chose the latter. We have chosen to be brave, we have asked residents to partner with us in choosing to be courageous. And with this choice in mind, it is incumbent upon Government to be honest, open and transparent at such a juncture. This is what we have done here in the Western Cape. Unlike other provinces, Premier Winde continues to take residents into confidence, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon member Makamba-Botya, we are the only province to provide a regularly updated dashboard of COVID-19 data, that drills right down to the details of our province's towns and suburbs. We have actually used technology. That is why I am asking again, where are people Zooming from?

We therefore have been frank, hon Deputy Speaker, with the people of the Western Cape. We have prepared for the worst and communicated as such. We also told the truth about the economic hardships on the way. And although we have always hoped for the best, we are agile to make the changes to mitigate risk.

Whilst we built Africa's largest field hospital, hon member Lekker, a world-class facility, your ANC-led Gauteng still stands with a dismissed MEC of Health during a pandemic, and also with 28 senior management [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...positions that are vacant. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute. Could you just take your seat. I recognise you, hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I would like to rise on a point of order. Can the hon member Mackenzie not speak directly? We know it is via MS Teams and not Zoom, but if he can speak through yourself as the Deputy Speaker.

We know that his mind is on the weekend's congress [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: [Laughs] No.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...and we wish him all of the best, but if he can rather speak through you, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Noted. Thank you, hon [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Hon Deputy Speaker, I will certainly [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please speak through me.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...speak via you. I am glad hon Khalid gets the point.

And also, with 28 senior management vacancies in Gauteng during a pandemic, while the Western Cape positions are filled.

Hon Deputy Speaker, whereas we are the first to provide relief to the Arts and Culture sector now paid to deserving beneficiaries, not a cent has been paid by the ANC's Gauteng Department of Cultural Affairs – it is called Arts and Culture – during a pandemic. So I do not again know where the members are MS Teaming from.

When this DA-led Province was the first to provide regular PPE procurements available to the public, only thereafter did Minister Mboweni instruct other provinces to do so. In the absence of procurement in the Western Cape, the President's own spokesperson, a member of the ANC's PEC, benefitted from PPE tender to the tune of R125 million. That is the difference between the DA and the ANC.

So, hon member Lekker, when there is no money, you know you are a member of good standing in the ANC. †Vra vir hulle om op te hou steel.
[Ask them to stop stealing.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Hon Deputy Speaker, we recognise the key aspects of the turnaround strategy in the Western Cape are underpinned by economic

recovery, without which we cannot realise our job opportunities, dignity, wellbeing and safety.

Yet instead of supporting provinces in the crucial attainment of these goals, National Government remains hellbent on bailing out State-owned Entities and once again SAA to the tune of R10 billion.

And on that point, hon member Lekker, via hon Deputy Speaker, just yesterday the ANC Government appointed former MP, failed MEC, failed National Party Member of Parliament, Leonard Ramatlakane, to manage Prasa. Our trains are in disarray, yet the ANC, of which hon member Lekker is a member of good standing, appointed a failed ANC cadre to manage an entity with a R15 billion loss, to sort out our trains.

Those are the issues that this Government continue to rise up against and deliver services for our people.

So let us consider this, hon members. The R10 billion to bail out SAA. That R10 billion is an opportunity cost lost. For that R10 billion the National Government could have built 50 brand new schools, 80 clinics, 20,000 new homes, five desalination plants to secure water, a precious commodity of which many provinces, including the Eastern Cape, currently suffer. Their ANC, of which hon member Lekker is a member in good standing.

That R10 billion could have provided COVID emergency relief grants for six

months to cover 2 million people as a critical safety net, and hon member Lekker, via you, hon Deputy Speaker, a member of that ANC she is a member of, said absolutely nothing, zero, †niks [nothing.]

The National Cabinet, hon Deputy Speaker, is a patronage-built Cabinet of networks, and like I said yesterday, member Ramatlakane - none of the ANC members – I can guarantee you, hon Deputy Speaker, if I go to Facebook now they probably congratulated the failed MEC to manage the trains, and that these hon members are going to come in this House and say, “But the trains are not running.” The trains are not running because their failed MEC, failed Member of Parliament, who went party to party, is now running an entity that has got a R15 billion loss, and that actually is the real story of members of this House.

Hon Deputy Speaker, Premier Alan Winde is not one to shy away from tough calls and innovation in this Government, and given the lack of leadership from the National Government, from the President himself, we are still waiting for the billions.

So, hon member Lekker, the reason we have to go and borrow money, †want hulle het die geld gesteel in Pretoria. [because they have stolen the money in Pretoria.] That is the real reason, and you know the facts, because you serve on the Committees as this Parliament.

Hon members, as Legislature we must commit to rigorously oversee decisions

of expenditure in this House.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I mentioned earlier the Western Cape has taken a clear decision to do different things, and we met these challenges of the day. We have clear timelines, we have goals, we set milestones, we have actionable steps. In short, hon Deputy Speaker, we have a bold, brave, new plan. But Pretoria office has nothing. They just fail to deliver continuously.

Hon Deputy Speaker, hon member Windvogel again, where are hon members Zooming, MS Teaming from? She said the Western Cape was lacklustre. Now if we were lacklustre I do not know what the word is for the ANC Government, because by all accounts we were the best, not only in the country, but in the continent, and probably in the world for responding to the COVID-19 pandemic.

In closing, hon Deputy Speaker, allow me to quote from hon member Windvogel, Prof Jonny Myers for UCT's Department of Public Health. He said:

“At provincial level...” [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE:

“...only the Western Cape combines highly functional public

healthcare services...” [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, can I address you?

Mr R D MACKENZIE:

“...with action in public health and accurate statistics about the pandemic.”

Indeed, hon Deputy Speaker, he wished – and I paraphrase now – what is true for the Western Cape should be true for the Western Cape. I thank you and well done, Premier Winde. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you very much, hon member Mackenzie. I now recognise hon member Nkondlo.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo – I recognise you, hon member Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I wish to bring to your attention that there was a point of order raised by hon member Sayed, where hon member Mackenzie continued to address members directly.

You did address that, but just two minutes before he finalised, he did it more than three times already and you were quiet. I think, hon Deputy Speaker, I need to bring to your attention that you really need to listen to members attentively so that they do not deviate from the Rules. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Lekker. No need, hon member Mackenzie. I am moving over to hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and greetings to the Premier and to all the colleagues in the House, and those that are joining this particular debate.

We have to, I think, as we go along, hon Deputy Speaker, try and really teach ourselves as members of this House that this grandeur in the manner in which we debate and actually personal attacks, really demonstrate childish and foolish behaviour amongst ourselves as hon members, because I think if we are asked to debate I am sure what is expected is for people to engage the content that is presented to us, rather than trying to point individuals in their effort of trying to look good perhaps to the Premier at this point.

Let me once again appreciate the opportunity to engage in this debate where the Premier actually spoke to us yesterday about courage. Let me quote one of the implicit theories of courage which defines courage as:

“A wilful, intentional act executed after mindful deliberation

involving objective, substantial risks to the actor, primarily motivated to bring about a noble good or worthy end, despite perhaps the presence of the emotion of fear.”

And I am stating this, hon Deputy Speaker, because indeed listening attentively to the Premier yesterday, one was looking for all these elements in trying to understand the concept of courage that he decided to choose to frame his speech yesterday.

And I must say in the 25 page-speech there was a lack of courage, let alone little in outlining what becomes an economic recovery plan, but more self-applause of the Premier and his Cabinet, and perhaps we must be reminded here by what hon member Sayed will always remind us, of wanting to sort of praise the fish for swimming.

We have observed a trend. Every time that the President Ramaphosa addresses the joint sitting of Parliament, Premier Winde rushes to either make announcement on big projects or ask to address the Legislature.

Last year when the President addressed Parliament of plans to [Inaudible.] the femicide, the Premier, unprovoked, wanted to outshine the President by announcing the so-called Safety Plan, which is now falling apart.

This year he asked to address the Legislature a week after the President tabled the country’s economic reconstruction and recovery plan, and the

announcement of the Safety Plan early this year. This economic recovery plan lacks the very essence of being a plan, but contain more blue lies that citizens of this province have been forced to accept as their Government.

The Premier brags of the hotspot strategy that to date little is reported of how the very challenges that those areas were exposed to due to their socio-economic circumstances before COVID, such strategy has resolved.

To date we request his MEC of Finance to report on how the economic recovery of the hotspot strategy has yielded any results to protect the local businesses of the Cape Flats. How did it happen that the very period of the hotspot strategy Khayelitsha and other informal areas within the hotspot definition, were faced with flooded drains, potholes in most of these areas, making a difficulty for delivery of goods and services to enable the local economy?

Where is the basic infrastructure, particularly enabling connectivity of these local enterprises that are supposed to take up opportunity of e-commerce and E-trading promised by the Government?

The special address by the Premier as it comes, comes after the Parliament of South Africa received the economic reconstruction and recovery plan. That plan sets a clear path for investment and economic recovery and growth for all provinces. It aims to build a new economy through transforming the economic and inclusive growth.

A central pillar of this work is the transformation of our economy, creating space for new black women entrants and takes deliberate steps to change ownership in production patterns.

We must welcome the work of the Competition Commission in signing an agreement with Pick n Pay retailers to eliminate exclusive leases in shopping malls. That is courage motivated to bring a worthy end that is the maximum participation in the economy.

The plan will be focusing in particular on the development of Small, Medium and Micro Enterprises through the promotion of localisation and industrialisation. This work will take place along the development of rural and township economy.

Moreover, the plan aims to improve the inclusion and active participation of women in the economy. Amongst other measures, Government will work with women-empowered companies to progressively reach its target of directing at least 40% of procurement spent to such enterprises.

Something that transpired in the last week in the Standing Committee of Human Settlements, this Provincial Government had to even downgrade its target to 10% for women and 4% for youth, because they have confirmed failing to reach the target of ensuring the participation of women in the Human Settlements programmes.

Gauteng Human Settlements, as an example, has recently, through its Elijah Barayi project, been able to deliver success in this regard. [Inaudible.] Province has got the opportunities to still go and learn from the Department in Gauteng around this.

Like the announcement of a Safety Plan earlier this year, this economic recovery really lacks the essence of what a plan is all about. The Premier has claimed his Emergency Economic Relief Programme will create nearly 20,000 new jobs, a target for private sector, he tells us. The same private sector that is highly racially configured and perpetuating the old racialised and male-dominated corporate environment as evidenced by employment equity reports. So what result of jobs is the Premier predicting in that regard?

Also, he is much aware and happy of such a reality that chooses these particular groupings than others. Maybe we will be told of jobs from the EPWP work opportunities as what will be the result of this Government.

This again is despite the decision to outsource Government services to mainly private sector players. It is important once again that as this Government we need to consider the plan of the President that has been placed before us, that ensures that the infrastructure-led growth once again [Inaudible.] of local contractors, which is an area that to date we have been struggling to realise.

The PERO and the MERO have showed that the Western Cape economy is expected to grow at 1% over the next four years; employment rate is expected

to grow at an average of 0,6% per year between 2020 and 2025; less than the 1,5% recorded between 2015 and 2019.

Inequality is widening as shown by the increase in the Gini coefficient in the Cape Metro and the Western Cape. Something that is not new, because even in the PERO and the MERO of 2019 the reality of the inequality widening in our province and the City, has already been affirmed, and this is a challenge that the plan of the Premier is silent on, how it will address this particular reality of the Western Cape citizens.

Then we ask the question: when the Premier speaks about dignity, at whom is this dignity aimed at? Because majority of citizens, especially the poor and the working class in this province, continue to be trapped in a poverty environment of not their own making, and we seek to request the Premier to really speak about how his Government, post-COVID, will really deliberate in trying to deal with a situation or the reality of inequality in the province, in the manner in which the structure of the economy is actually perpetuating the status quo, in the manner in which local and township businesses continue to be in the side-lines, and SMME's, when you talk about private sector, will also be interested to hear what role is going to be played or opened for them also in the consultations that the Premier has spoken about.

One will be interested to encourage the Premier to ensure that there is a clear and meaningful representation and participation of the SMME's that are in the province, so that they can also contribute their own challenges and their

own inputs into how the economy of the Western Cape can actually be structured in a way that ensures inclusivity for everybody who is interested and has a role to play in the province.

The address of the Premier is that he confirmed one thing: that the DA is a party of analysts, who have nothing better to offer towards the development of the country. They are a divisive element who spread fear mongering. The case in point is the unsubstantiated claim that the Western Cape Government's Budget of the MTEF are likely to be cut by over R10 billion.

This is the same [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: ...theatrics that were used during the budget before COVID. We were told of how the budget is going to be cut for the Western Cape and only that could not be realised.

So we continue to ask the Premier to at least bring facts so that he can draw some conclusions and stop providing unnecessary panic amongst the people. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Nkondlo. I now recognise Premier Winde.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you very much for the members that took part in this debate.

I would like to start off by saying that I explicitly yesterday asked the members of this Provincial Parliament to come with suggestions, to come with solutions, to put issues on the table, to work together to help us get out of this crisis, and, hogwash comes to mind, but I must just say that of every single member from the Opposition parties, the only one member that put anything on the table, was the hon member Marais who spoke about an unemployment agency. I have noted it and I will have a look at seeing whether this is something we could look at.

But just to remind the hon members of this Legislature of what was said yesterday. I have also seen in the comments here today, but also in the comments made afterwards in the press, etcetera, that I saw things like, “Nothing new,” and, “Rehash and rehash.” For the first time ever we are investigating borrowing in our province, for infrastructure that give us capital infrastructure that is job-creating and boosting the economy. Here is something new not mentioned before, not a rehash.

We spoke about an infrastructure agency that can trade. The PFMA 3D entity. This is something brand new. The Transport Authority, get the legislation going, give it a timeframe. The Blue Dot Taxi partnership. I mean we have spoken about Red Dot before, because that was an innovation not pre-COVID-19. That came out of this Government while we were fighting

COVID-19. The Transport Department, the taxi industry formed a partnership and the Red Dot Transport System was born.

That has evolved now into a pilot project of the Blue Dot which is so innovative and for me going to change public transport in South Africa. Not in the Western Cape, in South Africa, and this should be celebrated. But no, people say, “Oh, there is nothing new.”

The continuation of the next 500 LEAP officers during a time when our budgets are being slashed. You wait until Tito Mboweni speaks in the National Assembly to see exactly what our financial system and situation looks like in South Africa, and the kind of slashing and cuts that we have to make.

To continue with the roll-out of this plan, which is not our mandate – I wish it was. I agree the federal side that we should have much more control of our police system, but despite this we are committing and making sure that we will continue to roll out, and what is more, it goes further than that. The Minister has just spoken today again about a further 1,000 safety officers rolled out across our province, on top of the LEAP officers.

ECD, yes, it is a big debate in South Africa at National Government level, but for the first time this province is going to step up and make sure we claim that space in a very different way. Something very new.

Inclusionary housing policy, putting a timeframe on it when it will be in place. We have not had the policy up until now. We have actually enabled it and made it happen in our existing spaces, but here is a commitment with a timeframe, and this is not for the Provincial Government, this is the whole province, helping our local governments as well, that we do this in unison.

The stance that we have taken now on Tuberculosis, on TB, really standing up and making a bold commitment while we are put under huge pressure from a budgetary point of view. Or even the point that Minister Meyer raised today. I said 2,000 food gardens. We are already sitting on 2,589. And this all happened now during this specific time.

But let me get to some of the members and some of their inputs. I again said, and I listened to the hon member Windvogel. She waited with bated breath and, “Nothing new.” Well, I have just mentioned a whole lot of new things. She did not recognise one of them.

And she then goes on to say that in this province we spend our time undermining lockdown regulations. Please, she needs to make sure that she bases what she says in this House on fact. She must base it on fact. Go and have a look at the data and the details that are put out, and the one thing in this province that we have already been recognised, not by Government, but outside, as an awarding winning dashboard that was put together. Go and have a look at the openness and the data that gets put out every single day. There are the facts.

And then she says that the announcement by Minister Mkhize and the way that we reacted was “reckless”. Well, quite frankly the Minister was reckless. We have worked damn hard during this COVID-19 not to play politics with COVID-19. The Minister goes straight out and puts a number of 42% increase in cases in the Western Cape. He says nothing about any other province.

In actual fact, the Western Cape is number 5 on the number of increases, the percentage. Free State, Gauteng, Eastern Cape and KZN were all higher than us, if you go and have a look at that graph across South Africa, but he determines that he is going to just decide, “Let us choose the Western Cape and come up with a 42%.” I do not know where he cooked that up from anyway, because 20% is the threshold and we are sitting at 13%.

But 13%, I just want to say again, is 13% too high. We still have to make sure that we work damn hard to flatten this curve and beware of a second wave. A second wave will make us poorer, a second wave will make us more hungry and a second wave will cost more jobs.

Minister Meyer, thank you very much. I have mentioned the food gardens. I want to say it again. He also mentioned Natasha Johannes as one example of the 2,589 food gardens. It was amazing to go and visit and see how a small intervention in a food garden not only becomes a sustainable business, it creates jobs, it creates healthy nutrition for society, and in this specific vegetable garden not only creating jobs, but it also creates a space where donations are given to people who cannot feed themselves.

So you find that this entrepreneur, which was born out of help to start a vegetable garden, creates a space of land which was a dumpsite. Unbelievable, and there are thousands of these opportunities, and we will continue with this learning and roll out thousands more.

The hon member Makamba-Botya, thank you very much for your input, but I wondered who wrote your speech. Because quite frankly – again I say, I asked you – you actually said, “You should have consulted the Opposition for input before your speech,” but then in this opportunity, which I said in the speech, “Please come with some solutions,” not one solution was put on the table.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, hon Premier. Hon member Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, on a point of order. Can the Premier also, like we have implored from the previous hon member Mackenzie, to also speak directly through you as the Deputy Speaker, and not directly to the member of the EFF. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: Thank you very much for that point, that very serious point as raised by the Opposition.

So, hon Deputy Speaker, through you for the rest of my speech, I would say

to the EFF nothing on the table, nothing at all. I was looking forward to some input.

You also said there was a failure to mention anything to do with crime. Did you even listen to the speech? Did you even listen to the extra focus. I mean, it is called jobs, safety and dignity. It is a like a core pillar, and then you go and say, “Nothing,” or, “Failure to mention anything on crime.” I am sorry, I am not going to give any further input on that.

The hon member Botha, thank you very much. Again, celebrating our frontline workers, absolutely, and I think it is something that we cannot do enough of. And especially our nurses and I know for you, our teachers.

You know, I look at every time people ask us as Government, “How many of your Government officials are back at work?” Well, most of the Government officials need a damn good holiday, because they have not stopped since day one. In actual fact, the officials in this Government have blown me away by the dedication and input, the extra hours, the seven days a week, 24 hours a day. It has been quite amazing.

And I can say that, because I send these emails around to officials and they answer me back at 10 o’clock at night, but it is not about me, it about when I interact with consul-generals who tell me about – and, hon Deputy Speaker, you know this so well. When we were helping foreign nationals get back home and Government officials, we would find them and they were amazing.

How they just stepped up and they made us proud, but they made South Africa look so great from those people, and those people are going to come back. Those people, because they were treated in the way they were treated. So, yes, absolutely, our Government officials.

The hon member Herron. Again, need I say it? He says, “Nothing new, rehashing.” I mean this Red Dot I think is – Red Dot to Blue Dot is going to be amazing. I have already said it, borrowing, ECD’s, vegetable gardens, so I am not sure where he gets the “nothing new”, but obviously as a good ANC member he needs to make some kind of negative comment. I was really looking forward to something constructive.

The hon member Fritz, thank you again, and again your responsibility on your shoulders around safety – and perhaps here I must also speak to all of the Opposition members. We all feel the same way about crime, but you know what I never hear in this House? Everybody talks about the Safety Plan, which is fine, that is exactly what they need to do, because it is oversight of our Safety Plan, but what about an Opposition member actually calling on the National Government to devolve SAPS power. Maybe the hon member Marais talks about devolution of power or federalism, but we need extra POPS in this province, Public Order Police.

We definitely, hon Deputy Speaker, need more police in our province. They are under such severe pressure. We must be calling on the National Government, every single person in this House, in unity, “Please, we need

more deployment and more resources to this province.” We can have another debate about where the power sits, because I know the ANC disagrees with that, but let us at least get the deployment because our people need to be made safer, absolutely.

And your points around specifically where the first 500 were deployed and the difference that it has made, and I really look forward to seeing the rest of the deployment and the difference that is going to make.

The hon member Christians, thank you very much. Obviously starting off by talking about our financial environment that we find ourselves in, in South Africa, and of course no one wants to invest in a country where the money gets stolen, the money gets wasted and quite frankly, linking also to the last speaker, the ANC, the Chief Whip of the Opposition.

The ANC is still like this Titanic that just keep on going downhill. They are almost at the bottom of the ocean. They do not change policies, they do not understand for 25 years they have been doing the wrong thing, because it has not changed. We have got the worst unemployment rates in the world, the worst youth unemployment rates in the world, climbing crime. Our borrowing is at absolute maximum. We cannot get any more. We are paying over R6,000 a second at the moment in return, and just paying for our borrowing before we can spend a cent on the poor or a cent on the people of this province.

I want to say that the issue around farm evictions, obviously Minister Meyer

made note of that, and we do have that farmworker support unit. We must make sure that they get that detail and move in as quickly as possible.

The hon member Marais, I just want to know, hon member Marais, when I listen to you speak I get confused whether you belong to the Freedom Front or you belong to the Cape Party, and I wonder whether you are speaking about “federalism” or “independence”. Because I do believe in federalism and I do believe that we have to have much more federal powers, especially when you can show that you can govern. You can show that you can get the clean audits, you can show that you are spending your money properly, and I mean that is actually in our Constitution, it is in there.

It should be devolved closer to the people, at provincial level and at Local Government level, but that does not happen in our environment in South Africa at the moment.

An HON MEMBER: I am Freedom Front. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: [Laughs.] Then, thank you very much, the hon member Mackenzie, and perhaps there I want to reiterate once again. You know, your point around cadre deployment.

We have got to fix our trains. You know, this Titanic that keeps on sinking, it is going to hit the bottom of the ocean sometime, this thing called the ANC, and they never ever learn.

So what do you do? You have got to rehash and recycle the cadres. Where they fail somewhere you remove them, which makes people happy, and then you just recycle them through the revolving door, and they come back into it, and what do we do? We all say, the President says it, we have got to fix the Central Line in the City of Cape Town; we really need to get our trains operational again, and then behind the scenes, “Do not worry, we will put an ANC cadre in there to fix it, who has not fixed anything else, but we will get him...” – I mean, absolutely, you are on the button.

And then SAA, and SAA is actually just a metaphor for so many of the other State-owned Enterprises. R57 billion already wasted, and now we want to add another R10 billion, and what is next year? Probably another R10 billion. Are we not going to ever learn? And the problem is, and it is what the hon member Christians said right up front, that it is our budgets in the provinces that they are cutting.

I said it in the speech. Our provinces’ budgets are being cut because of bad management at a national level, and we must all stand together and fight that this does not happen, that this does not change.

And then of course the hon member Nkondlo. Jô, I really do not know what to say there, because exactly the same thing, who wrote your speech? You started off incredibly well. You really did. And then you said we all need to have responsible debate in the House, and then you slipped right back into the space that everybody else fell into.

But of course, you then went onto the hotspot strategy and you asked a whole lot of questions around it. I promise you that this strategy is what was adopted, once we put it in place, at a national level. I do not know if it is still working at a national level. I can tell you it still works here at a provincial level. It still works incredibly well.

You spoke about jobs and how we are going to get back, and you did speak about the 20,000 jobs, and of course you must read the wording of who and what those 20,000 jobs are.

But overall 321,000 jobs in the province, of which now the estimate at the end of year if 150,000 should be lost, so already with the moving from Level 4 to Level 3 to Level 2 to Level 1, you have seen jobs coming back into the economy. We know at Level 4 104,000 jobs were lost in our hospitality sector, and now we are less than 80,000 jobs lost.

We have got to get back to naught jobs lost and one job gained. It is a path that we are going to have to walk and we all have to make sure it is shoulder to wheel to make sure that this happens.

But again, it is her own ANC policy that has just kept this country going downhill. Her own ANC National Cabinet that is confused around policy, that is divided around policy and that is actually what is causing our country to get poorer, our Gini coefficient to get worse and our youth unemployment to grow.

The hon member Lekker, exactly the same thing. Hotspots – I also wrote here who wrote your speech? No understanding of what we did in this province over the last eight months.

And quite frankly, she then goes on and speaks about, “Nothing was said about equality, poverty and unemployment.” Please go and read that speech again. The speech is about dignity, it is about jobs, it is about safety. Every one of those leads to changing equality, changing our poverty position and changing unemployment, and all three of them for the better.

She then goes on to say that there is nothing felt in Khayelitsha around crime. Where was her call – and she is speaking now specifically around the gangster-type crime – to say, “Minister Bheki Cele, where is that Committee? Where is that team?” after he met with the City and the Province here in Cape Town, all *†vuur en vlam* [on fire] and we are going to actually take this on. Where is the urgency, and that was weeks ago. We have not seen it, but no, she must blame the Province for this. She does not understand where the power sits.

I am happy if she wants to blame the Province, but she must join us in saying that SAPS must be managed here in the province. We need to devolve the power and the management to this province. We are able to do it, we are asking for it, she can blame us, but then she must actually be joining us in calling for that movement.

And I think with that, hon Deputy Speaker, I want to say again that I am a bit disappointed that people did not really come with a whole lot of new suggestions. [Interjections.] I want that as kind of how we work together going forward.

When we come up with something that sounds like a great idea or one of your constituents raise the idea, let us add it to the mix. Let us put it into the system. Because if we get that right, we will definitely start to change our position here, and we will recover from COVID-19.

We still have to keep our finger on the pulse, we still have to work hard, make sure that we continue with the rules: masks, social distancing, we know what to do. Please, let us all keep doing that, but at the same time let us all stand together to make sure that we do not continue seeing the Gini coefficient get worse. We do not continue seeing more and more people in this country and this province getting poorer. We need jobs. We need dignity. We need safety. That is what we need, and we all need to work together to get it. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: On a point of order, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That concludes the debate on the Premier's address.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: On a point of order, hon Deputy Speaker. It is member Brinkhuis speaking here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Brinkhuis, sorry, I can hear you now. [Interjections.] What is your point of order?

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Yes, hon Deputy Speaker, I would like [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, please.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: ...the hon Premier, Alan Winde, to respond to my engagement with regard to the liquor licences [Interjections.] issued.

An HON MEMBER: On what Rule? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja, hon member Brinkhuis, there is no Rule like that, unfortunately.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: [Inaudible.]

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. We will now move over to the second Order of the Day. The Secretary will read the second Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Standing Committee on Social Development on the Social Assistance Amendment Bill [B 8B–2018] (NCOP), dated 13 October, as ATC number 85 dated 16 October 2020, page 292, “Ratification of Final Mandate.”

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Secretary. Order. The House received the report of the Standing Committee on Social Development on the Social Assistance Amendment Bill, conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill. This mandate has been sent to the NCOP.

I will now afford parties an opportunity to make a declaration, if they so wish, of three minutes each. I recognise the ANC.

An HON MEMBER: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, the ANC supports the Social Assistance Amendment Bill on behalf of the people of South Africa.

The purpose of the Bill is to provide for payment of benefits to a child-headed household, to provide for additional payments linked to social grants and to provide for social relief of distress in the event of a disaster.

And also to provide for an independent tribunal to consider appeals against decisions of the agency. These are all important amendments that are needed to assist and provide a safety net for the poor citizens of our country.

I humbly appeal that we do not delay the passing of this Bill because certain parties want to have more powers than they had before. I call on all members to support the Bill and for our opposition to be recorded on the report. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise the EFF.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. As EFF we support the legislative intervention proposed by the Bill. We further hope that the Department of Social Development will strengthen its administrative capacity so that it can be able to reach the vast majority of all vulnerable and needy South African children who need social assistance.

Some of the positives about the Bill is that it is recognising that there are child-headed households. Often times these children remain vulnerable and experience administrative red tape hurdles when they attempt to access social assistance benefit.

The Bill seeks to resolve or to solve this problem by providing a platform for payment benefits for child-headed households.

Furthermore the Bill is alive to the realities of the modern era as it makes provision for social relief of distress in the event of a disaster, such as one of we find ourselves in at the moment, the COVID-19.

The provision making it mandatory for the Minister of Social Development to appoint an independent tribunal, should also be welcomed. The tribunal will help fast-track the decision-making process in a case of dispute between SASSA and the grant beneficiary, or the recipient.

This mechanism is intended to assist the vulnerable potential grant recipient who have been abused and denied of their rights for a long time at the hands of corrupt SASSA officials. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Makamba-Botya. I now recognise GOOD.

Mr B N HERRON: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Herron, are you making a declaration?

Mr B N HERRON: Hon Deputy Speaker, I'm not making a declaration, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, very much. I now recognise the ACDP.

The C F CHRISTIANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, we support the Bill, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise the Freedom Front Plus.

Mr P F MARAIS: I do not make any declaration.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise Al Jama-Ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now recognise Al Jama-ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Assuming he is not making a declaration, I now recognise the DA.

An HON MEMBER: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The Department of Social Development has the legislative mandate to protect the well-being of vulnerable citizens and with many of those being children who do not have the financial independence, and who do not have the caregivers who are financially independent to support them. The Government must step in to provide that assistance.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Social Assistance Amendment Bill is another tool in the arsenal of Government to help protect those most vulnerable in our society. The Bill creates a streamlined approach to dealing with social assistance and also frees up the Department's resources to focus on

preventative social work as far as it relates to foster children.

The Bill also gives additional payments to social grant beneficiaries and extends those beneficiaries to include child-headed households. It removes the internal reconsideration process currently housed within a dysfunctional SASSA and it gives that to an independent tribunal.

The biggest win, however, is the amendment which includes additional funding in order to allow for the speedier placement of vulnerable children within the foster care system. The ANC-led National Government cannot hide from the fact that the foster care system is a massive failure throughout the country. Given the dire statistics when it comes to foster care placement in South Africa, this amendment covers a range of issues that are in deep need of attention, and the DA looks forward to the improvements that will hopefully bring about positive change, particularly for the 1 million orphaned children in our country.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Democratic Alliance supports the report.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I would just like to check with the Table staff in terms of the amount of members on the sitting. Mr Secretary? If we can just give the Secretary one minute, please.

I have to announce that there are currently 33 hon members present, which are entitled to vote and the House is therefore a quorum.

The question put before the House that the report of the Standing Committee on Social Development on the Social Amendment Bill, conferring authority on the Western Cape Delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill, be ratified and adopted.

Are there any objections?

An HON MEMBER: No.

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections. Agreed to. Thank you very much, hon members. The report of the Standing Committee on Social Development on the Social Development Amendment Bill has therefore been adopted.

That brings us to the end of the Orders of the Day. We will now move over to Interpellations. I recognise the hon Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Schäfer, are you online?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I am online, can you hear me now?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can I ask that our IT staff to just check that

Minister Schäfer is online?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, she is online, but it is very soft.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We cannot hear her. I will just ask IT to assist us quickly. Minister Schäfer, if you can just wait for one minute, please, because we cannot hear you.

Minister Schäfer, please check if your volume can be switched on higher. We cannot hear you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Can you hear me now?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is very soft. I wonder if we can dial Minister Schäfer in through her cellphone?

I am going to make a decision and ask that we take a five-minute break just to sort out the IT problems for this interpellation to happen, and we will adjourn after five minutes. Thank you very much.

Apologies, I would like to [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Can you hear me now? Can you hear me now? Yes, can you hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you back, Minister Schäfer?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I am on my cellphone. Is this working?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is working. Could I then retract all of that and can we continue? Thank you very much. Over to you, Minister Schäfer.

INTERPELLATIONS

Palestinian-Israeli conflict: history in schools

1. Mr M K Sayed asked the Minister of Education:

What is her Department's approach to teaching the history of the Palestinian–Israeli conflict?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, and to hon member Sayed for the interpellation.

As the hon member should be aware, the WCED is guided by the CAPS curriculum, which is a policy document introduced by the Department of Basic Education.

The Palestinian-Israeli conflict is included in topic 4 of the Grade 11 History curriculum. The areas covered in the topic include eugenics, apartheid,

Afrikaner and African nationalism, and the conflict in the Middle East.

This topic investigates the two faces of nationalism, positive and negative, the CAPS document states:

“The concept of nationalism needs to be studied as a phenomenon that changed form during the second World War but has a long history. The origins of nationalism lie in Europe, including the unification of Italy and Germany, and the revolutions of 1830 and 1848. The focus should be on understanding where nationalism comes from in this topic.”

The CAPS document specifies the following topics to be covered in the Middle East conflict:

- Case study;
- Nationalisms;
- The origins of Arab nationalism and Jewish nationalism;
- The Balfour Declaration;
- The origins and establishment of the State of Israel after the Second World War and the 1948 War;
- Different interpretations of the 1948 War;
- The Palestinian and Israeli perspectives;
- Broader Arab nationalism in the region;
- Jordan, Egypt and Syria;

- The question of Palestine;
- The conflict of nationalist aspirations between Palestine and Israel;
- The Arab/Israeli conflict;
- The issue of refugees, military occupation of the West Bank;
- Responses of Israelis and Palestinians;
- Intifadas and peace processes between 1979 and 2000; and
- The roles of USA, Palestinian and Israeli leaders.

The pedagogical approach to the teaching of these topics in History is in line with the outcome of addressing social cohesion and nation building.

We are required to teach controversial topics in school and learners are required to be taught the skills on how to engage with these issues. Teachers are encouraged to create the opportunity for learners to be exposed to different opinions and perspectives.

The concept of differing respectfully should form the basis for all discussions. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister Schäfer. Hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you very much for the hon Minister for the response.

Hon Deputy Speaker, South Africa comes from a painful past. A past characterised by settler colonialism. A settler colonialism that continues to be at play in the Palestinian/Israeli conflict, perpetrated by the apartheid State of Israel, and unfortunately, even from the response of the MEC, one gets a sense that the conflict is taught as a conflict of two nationalisms, which it is not. It is not a conflict of two nationalisms, it is a conflict of a settler colonialism and a resistance to that particular settler colonialism, and various human rights crimes perpetrated by the State of Israel.

And unfortunately, hon Deputy Speaker, one also gets the sense, having looked at some of the textbooks, for example, you have got, for example, scholars and historians such as Benny Morris, who is making up one of the main historians, a famous Zionist historian, but, for example, there are scholars who have written on the topic, Avi Shlaim, for example, a progressive Israeli scholar, who is not being utilised.

So I would like to know is the MEC open – we understand that there is a CAPS curriculum – is the MEC open to including the writings of those who do not postulate the conflict as a conflict between nationalisms, but that unpack the issue of the settler colonialism? Is the MEC open to doing that?

As well also what we have noted is that last year, towards the end of last year, there was a delegation from the WCED that went to Israel and it was paid for by the Cape Town Holocaust and Genocide Centre in partnership

with the Yad Vashem School of Holocaust Studies in Jerusalem.

Now I do not see how that ties in with a balanced approach. That is a particular Zionist approach where the Holocaust, well, the Holocaust must be studied, but the Holocaust took place in Europe, not in the Middle East. It was a result of European racism.

If they wanted to teach learners and get a sense as to how to teach about the Holocaust, the MEC should have then insisted that they go to Europe instead.

On that note, would the MEC then be willing, if non-governmental organisations that have a different perspective on the teaching of the conflict in the Middle East and who got a firm stance, as is the stance of the South African Government and the African National Congress, on the oppression undertaken by the Israeli State, would the MEC then be willing to also allow those NGOs to sponsor trips for her Department delegation to go to Palestine, to go to the Gaza Strip, to see how Palestinians are living, to see how the State of Israel has actually abused the narrative of the Holocaust to continue with its apartheid settler colonialism? I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Sayed. I recognise hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Minister, we know that our priority in your Department should always be the learners, and

as you have said this topic is in the CAPS curriculum.

Some learners might find this material uncomfortable or difficult and some teachers might be concerned about teaching it as a result.

So, Minister, what ways is your Department looking at improving the way in which we teach these topics so that learners and teachers can be more comfortable with these kind of topics? Thanks.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister Schäfer?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Is it me again already?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: My apologies. Hon member Sayed. My apologies, hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and my thanks also to the Chairperson of the Committee for those questions as well.

On the website, it is a concern and I want to continue with the point that I made in terms of the imbalance, because coming from the past that we come from, South Africans always need to stand with those who are dispossessed.

If you have a look at the website of the Yad Vashem, one of the sponsors of this trip, they pride themselves as being the only school of its kind:

“To train educators to teach the Holocaust.”

But they speak about, they say:

“Develops pedagogic and didactic tools to be utilised by teachers and conducts educational workshops for youth and soldiers of the State of Israel.”

Those are amongst the biggest war criminals in the globe currently.

So it means that the Education Department is allowing our teachers, who are going to be teaching history, to be taught by the same people who are pushing the propaganda to the Israeli soldiers, who are giving the various propaganda tools to the Israeli soldiers to basically justify what they are doing.

It is no surprise though, hon Deputy Speaker, and I want to ask will there be trips organised to the State of Palestine? I will ask that question yet again: is the MEC also going to be open for workshops to take place here with educators, with local NGOs.

But I am not surprised also because the Democratic Alliance’s position on this particular issue has been one which has been biased in favour of the Zionist State of Israel.

We remember Mmusi Maimane not so long ago, when he was the leader of the

Democratic Alliance, going on some so-called mission around peace, but he met no Palestinians on that trip. He only met with Benjamin Netanyahu, a war criminal.

We also find that immediately after that, when the African National Congress-led Government spoke about and ensured that there was a downgrading in relations in line with the cultural boycott undertaken by various human rights organisations, a cultural boycott called by the Archbishop Desmond Tutu, we then find that the DA then issues a statement and calls Government to order.

What the WCED has done, guided by the DA ideological posture, which is in favour of apartheid Israel, is that it is not taking a balanced approach on the issue. It is actually entrenching apartheid settler colonialism and actually undermining the cultural and educational boycott that is currently underway of the apartheid State of Israel, and I would like the MEC to be open to actually taking a different approach on this particular matter. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Sayed. I now recognise hon Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon member Sayed, we certainly understand the sensitivities of this matter and it is quite clear from the comments you have made that there definitely is

more than one view on this matter, and we are always open to looking at various views to ensure that our people are given the critical skills to make up their own minds on issues.

Are we open to including text – the text are generally set by the DBE, so I suggest you speak to Minister Motshekga, your colleague, on that matter, but as far as other people coming to speak to us, we will certainly assess any such request on its own merits, but in principle we are open to hearing different perspectives on any issue.

Hon member Botha, the Cape Town – sorry, I am losing my place. We are aware that the National Ministerial Task Team is currently developing a revised and inclusive curriculum that aims to promote human rights, but the WCED has seen a need to offer content training in line with CAPS and coupled with pedagogic methods to support teaching controversial topics, as many educators are scared to approach such topics because of the sensitivities around them.

The WCED is therefore in discussion internally on designing a series of content training workshops to address various controversial topics, making use of the philosophy of facing history and ourselves.

An organisation from Boston, that the WCED has partnered with, is one of empathy and reflection as a point of departure to the South African context.

This approach includes holding a panel discussion to:

- Discuss the approach of the topics,
- Exposing participants and learners to debates,
- Taking note of the learners' reflection,
- The use of resource material as a basis for discussion to address different perspectives,
- Addressing different methodologies and application of those methodologies,
- The provision of resource materials to prepare lessons that will address the human rights violations in these topics,
- Exposing participants and learners to pre-tests and post-tests [Inaudible.] the values of the lessons learned, and
- Building in a note to teachers as well, that they must never assume their learners' sensitivity or non-sensitivity.

It also includes:

- Upskilling teachers with the necessary skills to create a comfortable environment conducive to productive dialogue.
- It offers a session to senior management teams at school as well so that they are aware of what learners are being taught and how their behaviour could be understood.
- And also offering debriefing to teachers and learners through district psychologists.

This envisaged roll-out will be in 2021 and the training material is being

develop in 2020, which will include:

- Developing resource booklet,
- Which would include informal assessments and formal assessments,
- Ongoing reflection sessions on the process with teachers and learners,
- And integrating the imbedded human rights-based values to promote social cohesion and nation building.

And then just on hon member Sayed's second bite. I am not going into the DA position. The questions relates to how my Department teaches the curriculum, and as I have said we are endeavouring to give all sides of the story, which is controversial and people do have very different views, and I think, as I have said earlier, also we certainly will be open to having different organisations discuss different perspectives on the matter. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Debate concluded.]

[Interpellations 2 and 3 withdrawn.]

[The Speaker takes the Chair.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Schäfer. Hon members, now we are

dealing with the Oral Questions. I recognise the hon Premier.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Prevention of crime through urban design and spatial integration

1. Mr M Kama asked the Premier:

Whether there has been any progress with the implementation of plans to prevent crime through urban design and spatial integration as highlighted in the Safety Plan; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

Question 1 from the hon member Kama. I gather that is the first one.

The SPEAKER: Yes, that is the one [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Thank you very much.

The Western Cape Safety Plan has tasked each department with safety priorities in order to create a whole of society approach to safety and violence prevention.

The Departments of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning and Human Settlements have been tasked to use urban design spatial integration and design elements in our new human settlements build to create safer spaces.

So the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning informs me as follows:

“The Western Cape Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning contributes to safe space in our towns through the continuation of the RSEP programme.”

And I know that Minister Bredell on Wednesday opened a new business hub and pedestrian bridge in Bredasdorp as part of the Province’s RSEP programme. The Ou Meul Pedestrian Bridge ensures a safer path for the community to travel across a canal, and this pedestrian walkway also leads to the Ou Meul Square, which is a business area that has been upgraded to include 12 trader units, a paved courtyard with wheelchair friendly timber desks and landscaping.

Earlier this month the Department also opened two similar business parks in Mossel Bay, creating attractive, safe and affordable spaces for a total of 34 businesses. One of these, the Kwa-Nonqaba Youth and Business Park, also includes an Astroturf, chill area, outdoor gym, raised dance stage and space for informal traders, art murals, a playground and a security guardhouse,

creating a dedicated and safe space for young people to visit.

The other, the D'Almeida Hub, also includes art murals, safe parking and critical elements that contribute to spatial integration and safety.

The recent examples of towns where successful projects have been related to safe spaces, have been implemented in Piketberg, Porterville, Vredenburg, Malmesbury, Ceres, Worcester, Touws River, Plettenberg Bay and Mossel Bay. Often these projects are integrated with local economic development and creation of opportunities too. Further projects are being planned in Velddrif, Saldanha, Darling and Stellenbosch.

The RSEP programme also seeks to assist to integrate towns. Projects are often located in specific zones called "integration zones", promoting the stitching together of towns, examples of Vredenburg, Piketberg, Prince Albert and Darling. Safe walkways and pedestrian corridors are being developed in these and other towns.

As mentioned earlier in my response, this also facilitates the transformation of hostile or no-man's land parcels, historic buffer areas, between communities to active safe spaces and movement corridors.

An initiative to develop a peer learning network in the Western Cape Government, where urban design best practice will be shared and documented by the Department in collaboration with other departments, is also underway.

A related aspect of the spatial integration that is linked to our mobility and spatial transformation VIP, addressing the larger scale of whole towns and marginalised neighbourhoods, which specifically looks at the structural relationship of these neighbourhoods to the rest of the town.

Our Government has also been a leader in piloting inclusive mixed-use developments on well-located land. Construction of the Conradie Better Living Model Project is in process or progress. The lessons learnt here and further application of this concept is being extended to Founders Garden Artscape Precinct in the Foreshore.

This work is a springboard for the next step. To scale up through the development of policy to assist municipalities to apply inclusionary housing in their work and provide a clear and consistent approach to the province, as I announced in my speech yesterday.

Then the Department of Human Settlements informed me the following:

“At a micro level each project application that the Department receives is accessed via the professional town and regional planners in the Department to check if the project aligns to spatial integration principles, as well as linkage to urban nodes and facilities for future growth. Within the project footprint, urban design principles are being brought in, where possible, to ensure that the safety aspects, including place-making, look and

feel of the development, safety and public spaces, inclusion of traffic considerations, all contribute to the safety facets of the development.”

Good examples of these are in catalytic projects such as Vlakkeland development in Paarl, the Trans Hex development in Worcester, where the top structure’s construction is underway at the moment, and in Bloemfontein in Knysna where the design focuses on safer living conditions. A similar design layout is also being done at Mountain View at Mossel Bay.

Examples of some of these design elements are being used in some of the developments, including traffic calming via circles and major intersections, as well as raised surfaces. The provision of sidewalks and pedestrian crossings along the major routes for the safe navigation of pedestrians, courtyards and boundary walls are used to define the individual space, but hopefully will aid the courtyards to create micro communities. We have begun to add stoeps to some of the designs.

The 19 declared priority human settlements and housing development areas have been identified to direct human settlements development to better achieve spatial integration. These areas form part of our commitment to continue to develop over the next five years.

The Department of Human Settlements works closely with the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning, Regional Social

Economic, or the RSEP Programme as I have mentioned, and then of course there is also the Violence Prevention Urban Upgrade and it is obviously a similar programme. One locally funded and the other one initiated and funded via foreign donor money.

There has also been a shift in the manner in which informal settlements are upgraded to involve communities through participating planning in an effort to influence the final design of their settlement. And of course, this talks to lighting, it talks again to access and egress.

The Department is also in the process of reviewing the sustainability criteria framework which intends to ensure the development of sustainable settlements in the Western Cape.

A further initiative to encourage housing developments that incorporate the following design features, namely:

- Clear property boundaries and collective ownership of public spaces,
- Safe and accessible movement routes in housing developments,
- Creating positive interfaces between buildings and public spaces,
- And ensuring the progressive improvement of neighbourhoods and increased perception of safety over time through the

upgrading of informal settlements.

Research is still being done in this regard and policy development will follow in due course.

Through this we will build safer and more resilient settlements that create conducive environments for our communities and especially for the youth. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. I now recognise hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and thanks to the Premier for the response.

Hon Speaker, I think now it is just over a year since the announcement of this plan, this R1 billion plan that seeks to halve the murder rate by 2029.

Now what I want to understand, hon Speaker, I hear the Premier is talking about these many other developments that are happening in different areas, but I want to understand projects that are in these areas of high crime, because even in the past debate we were talking about how densified are these areas.

Now I want to hear, and in line with the courage that has been defined by hon member Nkondlo in the debate earlier, I want to understand what deliberate

projects, or I mean infrastructure projects are in place and to what Rand value, and in which areas in these areas that are high crime zones? Thanks, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Kama. I will hear whether the Premier has specifics, given the fact that you are raising questions, but it could be challenging, because now that might be a new question.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Obviously I have just mentioned the Ou Meul in Bredasdorp which was opened this week. Last week or earlier this month in Kwa-Nonqaba and in D'Almeida in Mossel Bay. Then of course there are safe spaces now in Piketberg, Porterville, Vredenburg, Malmesbury, Ceres, Worcester, Touws River, Plettenberg Bay, Mossel Bay.

Further projects which are now planned, those are the ones that are done; the ones that are planned – because you have spoken about the last year - but there are some that are coming still, and of course we had COVID-19 in the middle of this, but still Velddrif, Saldanha, Darling and Stellenbosch, and I mean that is what I have just said, these exact areas, and then of course we have got ones in the City of Cape Town as well, applying them to our developments, but also looking at the existing ones, the learnings that we have taken from the initial VPUU, which then, as a provincial project, then became RSEP.

So, I think I have given those answers in this comprehensive answer which tells you exactly where, it tells you what kind of projects, and of course also projects that are to come.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Speaker. I want to check, hon Speaker, as a follow-up, if the Premier is saying we do not have any plans? Because when I talk this urban design and spatial integration, I am also talking about infrastructure that was cited even in the Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry, that is needed in areas that make it difficult for police to do their work.

Now is the Premier saying they are not planned? Because if the aim by 2029 is to reduce the murder rate by half and we understand that the high murder areas or violent areas, especially those that are also found in the City of Cape Town and outside the City, does the Premier say there are no plans that are aimed at being used to prevent crime through this urban design and spatial planning in areas like your Leonsdale, your Elsies, your Nyanga, your Delft, your Khayelitsha, and all these other areas that are of high violent crimes, and also their profile being that of these areas or these communities that were defined by many speakers in the previous debate? Thanks.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Kama. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Yes, there is a plan, and I have just explained the delivery of

that plan.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Speaker, thank you, Premier, for the comprehensive Safety Plan.

I just wanted to find out from the Premier, what are the biggest impediments to implementing this plan? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. I suppose when I hear that, immediately your mind automatically goes to budget, but then when you think about it a bit more, it actually probably goes to I would say devolution of the SAPS power, that probably would be the biggest impediment.

But it is a combination of a whole lot of things, you know, if it was a simple, easy, quick-fix we would be able to fix it. This is a massively complex issue, safety is something that most other provinces steer clear of. It is complex and the one thing that we have done is we have been bold. We have said, "Alright, let us actually take this on, even though it is not our constitutional mandate, let us try and get the Constitution changed. Even though it is not our mandate from SAPS, let us actually see how we can work better with SAPS, let us see how we can actually put our own funding in. Let us see what

we can do at Local Government levels.”

The question really talks about one small component of this much bigger plan, which is how you change developments, planning, planning tools, our own human settlements and the design of how to design human settlements. That was the question here. How it actually starts to move towards creating safety for people.

And sure, these are things that actually we are learning every single day in design. I used the example when we launched the plan around stoeps and the effect that that has with eyes on the community. In the modern world it is even more than that. It is about your connectivity to your local Neighbourhood Watch, it is about the apps that are available, it is about how they have access through what we have just mentioned in pathways in community, open spaces. It is about how the Human Settlements Department is now looking at the way lighting is done and those courtyards they spoke about, how the windows must look onto the courtyard, because you must be able to watch what is happening so your children are safe.

It is complex and this is one small part of it, but it is about saying yes, we are all part of it, every single Minister, every single committee, all focused on how are we going to get this to be improved, and how are we going to create a safer environment.

If you think about safety it is one of your first constitutional rights and in

actual fact we all should be focusing on it, and like so many other things in our country, it has got out of hand and that is why we are really putting so much energy into it in this province. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: [No audible response.]

The SPEAKER: Alright, we cannot get hold of hon member Nkondlo. We are going to give you one more opportunity, hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: No, sorry, hon Speaker, I did not unmute myself.

In the plan that the Premier speaks about, I just want to check two things. (1) I wanted to ask in that design that he is referring to, how has this urban design actually altered, especially if we talk about these areas in which the sort of apartheid infrastructure has not necessarily assisted safety of local businesses?

So I am trying to understand in the plan that he is implementing, how has that altered such, and how in the progress that he is mentioning, if there are any results experienced for local businesses, because that is one area that when you talk about just your household and individual citizens' safety, it is one thing that has been predominantly highlighted I think in the main when [Inaudible.] crime rather than the [Inaudible.] elements of distance.

†'n AGB LID: Kan ek en jy saam daar deurgaan?

[An HON MEMBER: Can you and I go through that together?]

†'n AGB LID: Maar nie nou nie. Ja, ons wil nie al die goed insit nie. Ons sit nie altyd so baie goed nie. Dié een kan ons hê. Sien jy?

[An HON MEMBER: But not now. Yes, we do not want to place all the things. We never place so many things. This one we can have. You see?]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo.

†'n AGB LID: 'n Mens kan miskien net ietsie bietjie...sien jy?

[Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: One may perhaps just somewhat...do you see?

[Interjections.]]

Ms N D NKONDLO: [Inaudible.] background.

The SPEAKER: There is an echo on the line there, hon member Nkondlo.

†'n AGB LID: Haai, my oë is nog baie beter, jong. [Gelag.]

[An HON MEMBER: Hey, my eyes are still much better, you. [Laughter.]]

The SPEAKER: There is somebody else here. Hon member Windvogel, ja.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Yes. No [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, hon member Nkondlo, I just need to apologise. You had some – one of the members unmuted her microphone, so you can proceed now.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Speaker. I am hoping that the Premier picked up my first one, on the design.

The second one was more on the progress and how such progress
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: It is one follow-up, hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Oh, apologies, apologies.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Premier picked up your question, so he is now going to respond. I recognise you, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and thank you very much to the hon member Nkondlo for the question.

I think the best way to explain, because you are speaking about the design and how that affects the safety specifically of businesses; a lot of what the RSEP concept comes from is the initial VPUU, Violence Prevention Urban Upgrade work that was done and the very first project which was that foreign donor funding, That happened before the Safety Plan. That happened in

Khayelitsha.

So if you remember Harare Station up to the Harare Square, that was a place that was full of crime. If you remember that area where there was all the alien infestation, police would actually probably go and look there first if there was a missing child. It was really an urban area that had high crime, and I mean that immediate urban upgrade was about how you bring lighting, design, dignity, and then of course it not only made it safer for the businesses that were there, suddenly it created an environment where more businesses wanted to come, and so suddenly you saw along that whole route, not only from the direct investment that came from the foreign donor, but also the City of Cape Town put a lot of money into that as well.

At the station itself, and then of course about halfway to Harare Square the investment that came in for the Neighbourhood Watch, for their own office space, or the playing fields and the sports facilities for the youth. It also made it a safe place where eyes and ears and people were together, the lighting. And then of course up at the Square itself where just safety and design, where people's retail downstairs became a living space upstairs, just because suddenly it became 24/7. That design element on its own adds safety for business, but adds safety for communities, I mean if I think about the sort of earlier concepts.

Now if you take that concept and you go and visit what I have just mentioned now in the answer to the question in the RSEP, because they obviously

remember VPUU is a specific programme and foreign donor funded; RSEP, out of that programme in this Government, where we took this Government's budget and started aligning the same principles and also taking our own learning.

If you go to any of those areas, go to Saldanha Bay and have a look at how you join communities by that investment, which specifically is for safe economic activity and promoting activity, and you will see more and more businesses opened up and businesses started to flourish, because it was lit, it was designed properly, it became a safe place to trade and it definitely made a difference for the economy in that specific space.

So that is how the design concept actually at the end of the day breaks down those barriers, joins up communities and creates safe spaces for citizens, but also safe spaces for the economy to flourish and operate. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon members, now we move to Question number 2 by hon member Dugmore to the hon Premier. I recognise the hon Premier.

Legal services: expenditure

2. Mr C M Dugmore asked the Premier:

(a) What is his Department's total expenditure for legal services since the beginning of the sixth administration and (b) how much of this has been spent on property-related litigation?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much and thank you to the hon member Dugmore for the question.

(a) For the period May 2019 to September 2020, the total expenditure for providing legal services. This is on a corporate level to the entire Western Cape Government, i.e. that is legal governance, litigation and legislative draft services, as provided for in Vote 1 sub-programme 5.5, and that amounts now to R66,243,000, and then to (b) the answer is nil.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. I recognise hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

Just arising from the response of the Premier. I would like to ask whether he has been advised about the anticipated cost for the Tafelberg judgement, which has been handed down, and the anticipated cost that there would be linked to the appeal against this judgement, which the Premier has announced recently? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Dugmore. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you, very much, hon Speaker. Thank you to the hon member Dugmore. No, not as yet.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Just as a [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: There are no other hands.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: A follow-up please [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon the Leader of the Opposition again.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Could I just, arising from that response, ask the Premier, do you not think it is irresponsible to not have determined or not have asked for projected cost in this instance? Given the implications of this judgement and the fact that other parties are involved here, and given the result of the initial outcome in this matter?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much Speaker, thank you to the hon Dugmore. No, not as yet.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Other hands ... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Follow-up please.

The SPEAKER: The Leader of the Opposition again.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Could I just, arising from that response, ask the Premier, do you not think it is irresponsible to not have determined, or not have asked for a projected cost projection in this instance, given the implications of this judgment and the fact that other parties are involved here [Inaudible.] and the result of the initial outcome in this matter?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore. Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much to the hon Dugmore. Thank you, hon Speaker. No, I do not because of course the reason is about the principle and about a court taking away powers of a provincial government. You cannot put a cost to that.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So, just as a final ...
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Alright. Hon Dugmore?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker, if I could have a last follow-up please? If there is no other?

The SPEAKER: You may proceed, hon Leader of the Opposition.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: If I could just understand the Premier correctly here. He is basically saying that whatever the cost, it is not a concern to him because the Tafelberg judgment in his words, raises a principled matter. So I want to understand the Premier correctly here, that in his view, costs are not an issue at all and should not be considered?

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much and I would like to ask the hon Dugmore not to put words in my mouth. But this is about a principled matter and of course, at the end of the day, this is taxpayers' money but it is the principle of this matter, he must look at my press release when the Cabinet made the decision and of course if he needs to know the answers to these questions, then he must ask also the specific questions.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon members, as there are no other follow-ups, I now recognise the hon Minister of Community Safety, it is a question by hon Bosman.

Rape kits at SAPS stations

3. Mr G Bosman asked the Minister of Community Safety:

(a) What is the status of the availability of rape kits at SAPS stations in the province, (b) which stations currently have a shortage and (c) how long has this been the case?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Speaker and thank you to hon Bosman for the question. I think this is a very important question and it speaks to the whole programme around gender-based violence. I think the point that the Premier has made in his previous answer and one of his first answers to hon Kama, is that it is an all-encompassing approach. Such expenses become very, very important for everyone and so in this very specific question, hon Bosman asked around rape kits.

So the (a) part of the answer is – and I am given this answer by the South African Police Services – we of course do, hon Bosman, check on that in our oversight visits. Rape kits are available at all stations in the province, that is in (a); (b) which stations have shortages, none and; (c) how long has this been the case, it is not applicable. So those are the three answers given by the South African Police Services. Thank you, hon Bosman.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Bosman.

MR G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon Speaker. Speaker, through you, if the Minister can perhaps tell us what steps his Department is taking to address gender-based violence, femicide and domestic violence?

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, hon Speaker. One of the first issues that we, as residents in the Western Cape must really start thinking about, hon Speaker, is beyond the idea of 16 days of activism. I am happy that last year, in this House, the Minister of Social Development launched the 365 days of No Violence Against Women and Children and that should really be our approach in general.

I think the Premier made that point also earlier in one of his answers, that there are too many gimmicks, you know when we all stand somewhere and take photos and it is just gimmicks. The substantive issues are far more important, and hon Bosman, through you Speaker, I just want to make that point.

We are also starting to look at gender-based violence that can also be one of the fronts where we fight the problem of safe spaces and I am so happy to say that as all of government, those spaces in Piketberg and all those areas are very, very important for everyone.

On a second point, we need to look at the empowering of women. When we

talk of empowering, it is not just giving people power, it is actually finding ways to empower them, like for young girls to finish school. For example, hon Deputy Speaker, my colleague at the back and my colleague here – I know in Kannaland he is doing it – this one is doing it in Laingsburg, where they literally get young people, at a huge cost to themselves, to get to university and to colleges here in Cape Town. But they must alert all of us so that all of us can contribute and make it possible for those young children, those young girls and those women, to empower them.

I always think of Tannie Poppie's roosterbrood. Just to advertise †Tannie Poppie's roosterbrood en koek [Aunt Poppie's toast and cake] on the Main Road, so that when all of us drive through we go and make a point of stopping there. That is empowering Tannie Poppie and that is part of the empowerment that we talk to generally because Tannie Poppie does not just create food for herself but for a whole big extended family.

I think I must speak a bit more because it seems as if the hon Kama did not get the point and it links to the question that hon Bosman is asking - what are we also doing further in terms of gender-based violence? But it is not gender-based violence alone. It is also violence prevention programmes and part of our violence prevention programmes speaks to male masculinity and that whole thing that men still think they are very great and macho. The point we are making about our area-based violence prevention teams going into schools, going into communities, sensitising young children about the power relations between women and men and to say to them, listen, women are just

as powerful as men, all of them are on an equal basis.

It is those kinds of programmes, hon Bosman, that we really need to take further and really look at the empowerment of that because we can so easily lose our young boys as was the case of the two boys in Laingsburg who are now in Oudtshoorn in a kind of home because they so easily can become the perpetrators, they can so easily become the rapists if we do not save those boys with great alternatives, knowing that they can have a great future and that education can be that foundation, family life can be that foundation.

Sometimes it is not their own family. Sometimes it is other persons, like in this case the counsellor, Lindy Potgieter, who became a mother to that boy, and he calls her †“my wit ma” [“my white mother”.] Other people will take offence to that, but to that boy it means such a lot that someone cares for him, someone loves him, someone took him in when he was lost on the streets and gave him a future and he is excelling in terms of those marks that he has.

In the Department we have also appointed a specifically targeted advocate to only focus on gender-based violence and to specifically look at Court Watching Briefs of cases that deal with gender-based violence. The hon Marais, Mr Speaker, always asks in this House why the woman must always leave, and the man then stays behind? The women must – †hulle moet vlug, in Afrikaans [flee (in Afrikaans).]

I also want to add that that whole issue around gender-based violence also

speaks to violence against LGBTIQ and I think it is an important point because we sometimes forget about the corrective rapes that are taking place.

Then I finally want to say, a very important aspect will be, and the Premier alluded to it in his speech yesterday, around the amendments to the Liquor Act. You know it is part of our competence. What can we do, how can we push the envelope further? We are working with some of the big companies to look at incentive programmes, to look at where we will take away a licence if you violate the basic rights of anyone. We will look at where women have to walk home late at night from wherever they are, maybe sitting in a tavern and then walk home. What we are looking at is how those tavern owners ensure that those women get home safely by being driven home; how do you get an agreement with the taxis to come and collect those people, get them safely home and then we can perhaps really reduce quite a lot of the murders that take place.

So there is a whole lot of innovative thinking, all of us as partners, everyone taking part in it, Mr Speaker, so that we can really solve not only the crime issue, but also the gender-based violence issue, that we get some kind of behaviour change, engineered through incentives to these taverns. But we must not reject them, we must go and talk to them, we must get them on board as partners so that we can effect that change and we can really deal with gender-based violence in an effective way. I think the time is now for us to seriously move beyond the boardrooms and really get to the ground and go and deal with gender-based violence. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members I now recognise hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, Speaker and let me thank the Minister for the responses. Hon Speaker, I wonder if we are going to hear about thinking, thinking, thinking with no courage to actually implement any of these plans that we are thinking about. But what I want to ask, hon Speaker, is whether the law enforcement officers that are on many occasions deployed to work in different areas outside the command of SAPS, receive any training in the fields of domestic violence and other sexual offence areas? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and thanks to the hon Kama for that question. I think I have addressed this in my speech and I sometimes wonder if people are really listening, but I want to emphasise the fact that law enforcement officers in our programme are under the command of the South African Police Services. Now again I want to emphasise that, Mr Speaker and we know, in fact we brought out the report on domestic violence and the way police stations dealt with domestic violence and we also took quite intensive training to all those people.

I want to make the point – these hon members constantly talk about we are thinking of – we are not thinking of anything, we are doing it, it has been

implemented. They do not implement the thinking and that is the problem. We are not the ANC, we go and do it and we want to invite them to come. I must say he is a very good member because if I invite him, the hon Kama comes along with me. So I invited him to a number of our events where he can see it on the ground; when we visit police stations where women are coming in at night, sometimes beaten by their husbands. I want to see the way all of us deal with them and I think specifically, the point he is making, we must continue with the ongoing training around the sensitisation of gender-based violence and it must be constant, not just a once-off, all the time. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Bosman and the last one will be hon Marais.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you. Mr Speaker, through you to the Minister, I want to ask if the Minister can tell us how members of the public can contact the Department about following Court Watching Briefs and how to follow up on court matters, and specifically, how the members of the public can follow Court Watching Briefs against the 139 members of the South African Police Services who have been accused of gender-based violence? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bosman. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you and again thank you to hon Bosman. We have a very interesting email address that members of the

public can write to, hon Bosman. It is police.oversite@westerncape.gov.za. I also just want to add that we constantly investigate not only on gender-based violence cases but all cases; we have just launched yesterday the issue around 92 cases being withdrawn from court, withdrawn for two reasons, hon Speaker. One, the docket does not arrive at the court and two, when they arrive at court the prosecutor says they are asking for another postponement because the investigation is still on-going and then at some point the magistrate withdraws or kicks the cases out of court. So we are also following every one of those cases, to get them back onto the court roll and the same with those specific cases regarding any kind of gender-based violence and related cases of police officers.

We also plan this week, or in the next two weeks, to look at a meeting with IPID to ask them where those investigations are that concern police members' conduct and so I think it is a very, very good point you are making. We cannot just report, because the days when this Department just reported to Parliament, are past. We want to know what happened to the cases, and the one hon member looking at me always asks that question, so thank you very much, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I now recognise hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Minister, this problem comes a long way. It is not a DA problem that suddenly because the DA runs the province now, there is this type of thing against women. So we must look

broader, instead of acting as if we are an extension of national. We, Parliament, are responsible. So what would you say that in order to be effective in combatting gender-based violence that we ask that this be considered as a serious crime which has far heavier sentences than the ordinary crime of just slapping somebody? This is serious.

And then mandatory referrals of such men for psychological counselling. I think this will wake up men to the idea that if I should violently attack my wife or my girlfriend or anybody, that I will have to undergo this process and I must know what is waiting for me. If we are not going to do this, then we are just playing †pophuisie [doll's house] here with gender-based violence. So I want to ask you what would your idea be about making such a proposal that gender-based violence has reached such proportions it should now be listed as a serious crime that justifies much stricter sentences and mandatory referral for a time period for psychological counselling, because many a time a man feels inferior to a woman, that is why he attacks her. She earns more than me, she is better educated than me, I am jealous of her because she is attractive, I do not look so attractive myself and so jealousy lends itself to violent actions. It is just a suggestion, I would like to hear you on it, sir.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you. That is what I like about hon Marais, he comes up sometimes with very innovative points, but I need to first point out there is no gender-based violence crime category. It is

rape and it is assault. What prosecutors are doing now is when an assault is registered, they will make an entry on the docket to say this was a GBV assault. They will say this assault relates to a woman that has been assaulted by her husband.

I think it is important and it is those kinds of constant interactions with the National Prosecuting Authority and they have very interesting meetings where they sit on what they call a case management meeting once a month on a Friday morning and they will really look at some of those kind of proposals that you make; how do we look at this, why is there a blockage of cases in this regard?

It is really a case flow but also we can make recommendations – you remember it must eventually go to Parliament, any kind of minimum sentence legislation must go to Parliament, the National Prosecuting Authority and all the stakeholders from prisons right through to police officers to social workers, to everyone. It is an amazing body. We can we look at making a recommendation to Parliament and to the Portfolio Committee on Justice to look at a minimum crime sentence because there are already minimum sentences for murder, for rape, for all of those. But should it not become an aggravating factor in the case when it is gender-based violence and I think those are the kind of issues that we must constantly deal with. We have very good relations. There is an advocate, Bonnie Curry, who is an excellent prosecutor here in Cape Town and she is the Deputy Director of Provincial Prosecutions. She is really driving the gender-based violence issue and I am

happy to say I actually taught her once in my life, she was in my class, so I teach very good people who are very great afterwards. So thank you very much, hon Marais.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, we now move to Question number 4 by hon Bosman to hon Fernandez. I recognise the hon Minister.

COVID-19: quality healthcare services

4. Mr G Bosman asked the Minister of Social Development:

(a) What is the role of her Department in the provision of psychosocial support to the victims of gender-based and domestic violence and (b) how has such support been altered during the nationwide lockdown?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Speaker. I would like to thank the hon Gillion for the question which has two parts. It refers to psychosocial support and I am pleased, or I can confirm that the Department manages psychosocial support on two platforms. One is done where the Department uses services through partnerships with service providers and we monitor the services rendered to ensure that they comply with service standards. Then secondly, the Department renders psychosocial service support at various service delivery service points in the province.

Psychosocial support also entails emotional containment for GBV and domestic violence, trauma debriefing, therapeutic support, court support, practical support and ensuring provision of statutory services to support the victim.

In terms of part (b) of the question, the impact of the lockdown, the implementation of the lockdown has been a measure used across the globe as a means to curb the spread of COVID-19 and mitigate its impact on public healthcare systems. The implementation of the various alert lockdown levels by the National Government has made access to support services for women experiencing gender-based violence and domestic violence more challenging. The Provincial DSD, with the support of its NPO partners and volunteers, utilised and still continues to utilise various awareness programmes that are integrated with psychosocial interventions. The Department also formed partnerships with various NPO partners to establish support groups in vulnerable communities for individuals and families in need of support.

I can confirm that through the Khayelitsha hotspot we started a support group, not only for COVID-19 survivors but also for COVID-19 survivors who experienced GBV and that is practical support provided through a WhatsApp medium to victims and family members of GBV. We continue to use telephonic counselling and social media platforms such as Zoom and Teams and PPE was also used in our interventions. The Department of Social Development ... [Inaudible – audio distorted].

The SPEAKER: Your line there, hon Minister, is a bit challenging.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Sorry, hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Your line is a bit challenging there, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Alright, hon members we will see if the hon Minister is able to get a stable network. In the meantime, we will try and accommodate, we will give another minute to see if you can connect properly.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Speaker, can you hear me now, Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you are better now.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Alright, I am sorry, I do not know what happened. I was in full flight as Minister Maynier would say. So the Department of Social Development ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you. The Department of Social Development recently completed online trauma support training for

house mothers across our VP shelters. The training covered the definition of trauma and violence, the basics of trauma support, trauma response interventions including protection orders, psychological first aid, support groups and also how to care as a trauma supporter. We have engaged an NPO who provides COVID as well as GBV trauma support.

Hon Speaker, we conduct monthly webinars in this sector and we have engaged the Western Cape Womens Shelter Group and this coming Monday on the 26th, we will then be engaging activists in an effort to get the trainer programme so that we can spread the support into communities.

Hon Gillion, the follow-up part of your question, the danger of secondary victimisation. It is as dangerous or even more dangerous as the initial trauma that is suffered and victimisation. How widespread is the phenomenon? Secondary victimisation has been defined as negative social or societal reaction in consequence of the primary victimisation and let us use the example of a woman who has been sexually assaulted who then goes to a police station and gets asked, †“Hoeveel het jy gedrink of hoekom dra jy sulke klere?” [“How much did you drink and why are you wearing such clothes?”] That is basically what secondary victimisation could look like. Unfavourable outcomes of secondary victimisation may violate several important expectations of crime victims, such as retaliation, security and recognition of their victim status.

Victims and survivors of gender-based violence generally lack support from

their communities and face potential secondary victimisation when reporting instances of gender-based violence. They face the additional risk of being accused of violating lockdown regulations and this was especially during Levels 4 and 5 when they came forward to complain. We heard of victims being turned away at SAPS saying that our shelters were closed.

Furthermore, stretched policing resources focused on policing the national lockdown meant that GBV cases were less likely to be prioritised and the hon Minister Fritz spoke to this and in many cases the limited functionality of courts inhibit womens' access to protection orders to guard themselves against further abuse.

There were numerous complaints regarding courthouses being closed during lockdown and this caused secondary victimisation. How can it be curbed? There has to be realistic interventions for decreasing or preventing secondary victimisation and this can include making adjustments as to how the interview and the medical forensic exam, also known as the MFE, is performed, helping survivors to feel believed. We all know about the Me Too movement where often the victim is not believed, but rather the perpetrator and how we communicate in these circumstances.

We are starting to see an outpouring of the Me Too movement whereby women, men, children who were abused many years ago are experiencing secondary trauma by seeing the perpetrator on TV, in their community, released on parole and they are now speaking out. So the fact that police

officers feel they must ask survivors what they were wearing at the time of the assault or that survivors feel a need to protect, to collect objective proof of the assault to provide to friends and family, indicates that a change is needed on a larger systemic level. While systemic level changes are indeed indicated, institutions along with individuals can make alterations to the protocol for treating sexual assault victims that have experienced secondary victimisation to experience positive benefits. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I see hon Botha but there is not going to be enough time, but I will give the opportunity to ask a question. Alright, thank you. We have reached the end of our time, I see hon Bosman, but let us pause it for the next time. Thank you very much. Now that concludes the opportunity for Oral Questions. Hon members, we now move to Members' Statements. I recognise the Democratic Alliance.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS:

Ms L J BOTHA (DA): Hon Speaker, the WCED has been a forerunner for education departments in South Africa. It has produced the best Maths and Science results for Grades 3, 6 and 9 and Grade 12's for the last ten years. In comparison with every other province and the Republic, its infrastructure standard is beyond reproach.

During the lockdown of 2020 it was the only education department who was able to provide meals to all its learners in need, due to reliable systems and

administration. It has the best retention rate and consistent matric pass rate above 80%. Recently it has been wrongly accused of political bias while it is the inverse that holds truth.

Ironically, it was the indecision and inconsistent regulations that left learners in limbo for weeks regarding the return to schools. While this Department was first to indicate the readiness to reopen safely, as mentioned in my Debate Speech today, this Department accommodates year-on-year budget cuts which really must be attributed to a suffering economy established through inadequate planning and the billions looted from State coffers. Yet this Department remains committed to its mission of providing quality education to every learner in every classroom.

I make this statement today to highlight to this House how political agendas divert our attention away from performance and that we cannot allow for these agendas to distort the mission and the education of generations. It seeks nothing but to undermine the performance of the Department and contributes little to the service it provides, but more importantly the wellbeing and potential of learners. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Botha. I recognise the ANC.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks, you hon Speaker. Good afternoon to all members present. Hon Speaker, the African National Congress supports the economic reconstruction and recovery plan that was tabled by the President

to the Joint Sitting of Parliament on 15 October 2020. In developing this plan, the President worked closely with our social partners at NEDLAC and got the full support and consensus of Government, business, labour and community organisations. The plan is to build a new economy, at the centre the pillars of transformation and inclusive growth, following the impact of COVID-19 on the economy and people's livelihoods.

The plan has four priority areas and they are: massive roll-out of infrastructure; expanding energy generation capacity with Government accelerating the implementation of the integrated resource plan; employment stimulus to create jobs and support livelihoods and lastly, a focus on industrial growth where Government will support growth in local production and make sure South African exports become more competitive.

The plan also focuses on the development of SMMEs through promotion, localisation and industrialisation. Further to this, there is also a dedicated focus on development of rural and township economies. The plan also aims to improve the inclusion of active participation of women and youth in the economy. When the Premier asked to address the Legislature and province, we expected to hear details of a Western Cape economic recovery plan. There is clearly none as we heard yesterday.

In that event we call on the Western Cape Government and members of this Legislature to fully support the implementation of the Reconstruction and Recovery Plan. This is our moment of opportunity as the President said on

15 October:

“Even the darkest clouds have a silver lining.” We need to see this moment as a rupture with a past and an opportunity to drive fundamental and lasting change. It is an opportunity, not only to recover the ground that we have lost over the course of the pandemic, but to place the economy on a new path to growth.”

I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, hon Marran. I now recognise hon, the EFF, I do not know who is going to speak.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Makamba-Botya, you may proceed.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Speaker. Following the withdrawal of fraud charges against Mr Glen Snyman, a teacher at Groenkraal Primary School in Oudtshoorn, the EFF calls on the Western Cape Education Minister, Debbie Schäfer, to subsequently take disciplinary action against those in her Department who are responsible for these treacherous acts.

It cannot be that in a post-apartheid South Africa we still allow apartheid practices of reinforcing racial classification on people against their will to go

unpunished. Such conduct from officials of the Education Department threatens the advancement we have made as democracy post 1994, as well as those sought to be achieved by our national living Constitution.

The Constitution recognises everyone as having an inherit right to have their dignity respected and protected. Section 12(e) of our South African Constitution makes it clear that Mr Snyman has a right not to be treated in an inhuman and degraded way. This is over and above being granted the freedom for self-association with whoever he wants to associate with, as stated in Section 18.

We cannot allow those who are mentally blocked and still stuck in colonial and apartheid ways of imagination and thinking to rob us of these constitutional achievements. In actual fact, we cannot even afford to allow these people to serve in our education departments anymore, as they have nothing left to offer. It is for these reasons and those not articulated here that we ask that they be relieved of their duties. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Makamba-Botya. Hon members, I recognise the DA.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Speaker. Speaker, South Africa's first Provincial Economic Recovery Plan was tabled at the Western Cape Provincial Parliament in this House yesterday. During the special address, in an unprecedented decision of the Premier, the House learned another first: for

the Province itself to borrow funds from financial institutions. In the current economic climate we anticipate budget cuts which will be evident in the current MTBS due to years of poor implementation of economic policy by the National Government.

My concern is, there is no true recovery plan from the National Government but willingness to implement what they promised before. Another commitment is to move for green energy while Eskom debt currently marches to the R500 billion mark. The announcement to move forward, to roll out Broadband, we have heard that before. Version 2 of the Accelerated Infrastructure led growth, along with the absent R500 billion debt parcel, National Government commits to another R10 billion to the failed SAA, as I have said before.

In the DA-led Western Cape Government, the Broadband Game Changer; we have been fortunate to see the exponential growth Broadband using during the lockdown, that it also enabled our health system to greater perform and as I have said earlier on the data. We are in fact in the process of using LNG to ensure energy security. This is the DA difference and the basis for real economic recovery as presented yesterday by Premier Winde.

South Africa, as a country, faces economic crisis. The commitment of old plans is not enough. It is rather a crucial time to be transparent and make hard decisions about meaningful economic growth for the people of this province and to be taken into the confidence of our National Government.

At the Provincial Legislature, we will however commit to oversight on the recovery plan as tabled by the Premier yesterday and will work with the Executive to ensure continued agility and our response to every challenge ahead. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mackenzie. Hon members, I recognise the GOOD party.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Thank you, hon Speaker. Yesterday we heard the Premier talking about the Economic War Room once again. The Economic War Room has been in each of the Premier's three addresses to this Parliament. The War Room was positioned as a unit that would unblock economic growth inhibitors and it was meant to focus on economic growth and sectors such as construction, property development, manufacturing and tech.

When you call something a War Room, Speaker, you communicate a sense of urgency, combined with leadership and control. But in response to my questions, the Premier described the purpose of the War Room as including a different approach to problems solving by Government officials, creating an environment for new processes and ideas and building teams of capable officials collaborating to solve problems. Hon Speaker, in reality this Economic War Room is a hoax. It has very nebulous terms of reference, straddles between the Premier's office and Wesgro and it is just a job

creation project for DA cadres.

The Economic War Room duplicates the work of Wesgro and the Red Tape Reduction Unit and creates a third wheel in the crucial work of securing economic growth that will create jobs in the right sectors at the right time. And then we discover that the so-called War Room is headed by Penny Tainton, a former DA staff member who joined the previous Premier's office to work on e-Learning and after-school programmes.

Tainton has no qualifications or experience in economic development or job creation. In fact, Tainton had to issue a tender to get others to do this work. The tender says the purpose of this RFQ is to identify a suitable, experienced service provider to undertake a programme of strategic consultation and facilitation to initiate the Premier's War Room teams, to ensure that priority projects as highlighted by the Premier of the Western Cape are implemented using the PDI methodology in line with specified requirements as and when required.

Hon Speaker, the War Room is a plain and simple abuse of public funds and a DA cadre deployment project. It is focused on process and not outcomes and is a waste of money. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Herron. Hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. It is reported that the quiet

area in Muizenberg, Marina da Gama, was rocked by an attack on an elderly couple. A 65-year-old woman, Francis Carter, was found dead on the arrival of ER24 Emergency Services and her 71-year-old husband, William Carter, is recovering from a gunshot wound in the stomach.

Hon Speaker, according to the Muizenberg Community Police Forum, this is a quiet area and that they rarely experience such crime in Marina da Gama. Chairperson, the ACDP is appalled by the senseless killing of this 65-year-old woman and also the attack on her husband. We are pleading with people to come forward so that the perpetrators can be brought to book and face the full might of the law. I thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hear, hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. Hon members, I recognise the ANC.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Yesterday the Premier made a revealing statement when he said, and I quote:

“While we cannot control what is decided at other levels of government, we can be brave here.”

It is revealing because it is in fact an admission that the Premier has no

control or influence over what happens in our municipalities, Cape Town in particular. It also implies that partnerships with the national sphere are not a priority for him. This is deeply worrying. We believe that this explains why there was a deafening silence from the Premier when the City herded the homeless into the concentration camps of Strandfrontein. Courage would have been to work with faith-based communities and NGOs to find local decentralised solutions for the homeless.

The silence was about appeasing the base voters of the DA who have been unwilling to [Inaudible – audio distorted.] the homeless. This explains the deafening silence when the City proceeded with evictions during lockdown, actions which were held to be unlawful in our court. While the majority of people in our province support the need to reverse apartheid spatial planning, our Premier, under the clear instruction of the DA, has decided to appeal the Tafelberg judgment.

Yesterday the Premier asked for support irrespective of party affiliation. This House needs to be reminded that it took 43 days before the DA allowed the Premier to meet leaders of Opposition parties. President Ramaphosa convened party leaders immediately when the lockdown began. It was the Premier who ignored his own Health Department's call to ban the sale of alcohol and succumb to pressure of industry to have the ban lifted. Once again the Premier, on instructions from the DA, refuses to support the District Development Model.

The real courage we need is for the Premier to unstraddle himself and this Provincial Cabinet from the DA. Do what is best for all of the people of the province, not just the DA and its funders. The Premier cannot shrug his shoulders and say that he has no ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon the Leader of the Opposition.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... control and influence on the other spheres.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, the Leader of the Opposition. Your time is up.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Real brave people call on the Premier to lead this province, to get the job done better and finally break from the Zille tradition of blame and complain.

The SPEAKER: Alright. I recognise the DA.

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Speaker, a key component towards building society's resilience to violence is by increasing participation in sport. It can positively influence behaviour of young people, particularly young people at risk. Sports further presents the world with a universal language and a sense of belonging. I thus welcome the resumption of sporting activities authorised by recognised bodies and subject to a range of conditions to promote safety.

Hon Speaker, however the National Conditional Grant was cut by R22,7 million which will negatively impact sport in the Western Cape as the provincial trials for the Winter Games, the Indigenous Games and leagues and festivals to support club development will not be taking place this year.

I note this in particular, hon Speaker, as we could have done so much more with the funds that have been cut. But also, hon Speaker, it is deeply concerning that in Gauteng, the Sports, Arts, Culture and Recreation Department is yet to provide any, and I mean any, COVID-19 financial relief to artists and athletes whereas here in the Western Cape, Minister Marais together with a capable Department led the way.

I am reminded of the sentiment echoed by the HOD, Mr Brent Walters, when he said:

“Let us understand that there are ways to win and there are ways to lose.”

Despite the limitations we face here in the Western Cape, the Department embarked on cheque handovers across the various districts in order to support sporting federations in their reopening efforts. The first of six handover events started in September, where a total of R610 000 was handed over to the West Coast and on 20 October, R700 000 was handed over to sports facilities in Laingsburg. I welcome this initiative. We must empower, develop and build capacity not only for the months to come but for the wellbeing of

young people here in the province.

Hon Speaker, I conclude. As a province with good governance, accountability and commitment to the sports sector, we will win. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Allen. Hon members I recognise the FF Plus, hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Hon Speaker, hon members, the Freedom Front Plus strongly condemns the recent call by an EFF Member of Parliament to start fires and making a call for the fire brigade to arrive. We view this as akin to an act of terrorism which has possibly led to the setting alight of a large farm in the Free State. Such irresponsible actions should form the basis for a full parliamentary inquiry as it reflects poorly on the conduct of the Members of Parliament which could lead to civil unrest and anarchy if such action is left unpunished.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais. Hon members, I recognise Al Jama-ah, hon Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Speaker. The MEC of Safety in the Western Cape should not fool the ordinary people living in high crime risk areas such as Delft, Hanover Park, Joe Slovo, Khayelitsha, Manenberg, Gugulethu, to name a few, that crime is under control. Whilst we commend efforts to curb crime, we call on the MEC to focus on eradicating

crime, plastering over the holes does not help the situation. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Brinkhuis. Hon members, I recognise the DA.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Speaker, this week the Gauteng High Court provided a ruling that is a victory for the Early Childhood Development sector and the wellbeing of the next generation. It ruled that the National Minister of Social Development, Minister Lindiwe Zulu and provincial MECs must ensure complete compliance in paying subsidies to ECD Centres and even to those who have not resumed operations at the current lockdown level. However, Mr Speaker, there is one notable omission from the judgment and that is the mention of the Western Cape. Hon Sharna Fernandez is the only MEC to whom this ruling does not apply, specifically because the Western Cape Government remains the sole province to provide ECD funding and support to 100% ECD centres at 100% of the funds provided on time and in an open and transparent manner.

According to Judge Van Nieuwenhuizen, and I quote:

“Since the dawn of the lockdown and save for the Western Cape Province, the payment of subsidies were either withheld or only partially paid by the remainder of the provinces. In the Western Cape, the provision of food was deemed as an essential service and ECD kitchens

were allowed to remain open. The full subsidies were paid in the Western Cape to ECDs and vulnerable children still received daily nutrition. Caregivers at ECDs received their stipends and could at least provide for their families.”

In fact, even before Minister Zulu was ordered by the very same court, in a separate judgment, to reopen ECD centres, the Western Cape had reprioritised over R10 million to assist ECDs in a safe, well-informed reopening in light of the COVID-19 protocols. Hon Speaker, it is this kind of legacy which the DA-led administration in this province provides, one that is at the forefront of mind in the restoration of dignity and hope and one that places the interests of the next generation ahead of the next election. Given this judgment and the previous one ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: ... Minister Zulu plans to spend over R1 billion on untrained ECD compliance monitors. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon members, that concludes Members' Statements, but in terms of Rule 145, Subsection 6, I would like to recognise a member of the Executive who wishes to provide responses from the Ministers. None? Thank you, hon members. The Executive has no statement to respond to. At this point we are now moving to Notices of Motion and the first motion is by hon Brinkhuis. Hon Brinkhuis, I recognise you, sir.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you, hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes that more than a month ago a young woman who was wearing a modest Islamic dress and a veil covering her face, was attacked in public in Paarl by a man whose identity is known to the police. This coward ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Brinkhuis, order. We are dealing with Notices of Motion. You need to give notice to this Parliament. Then next after this one, we will be dealing with the Motions without Notice, that one qualifies for the next round. I will still recognise you later. Let me move, if you do not have a Notice of Motion. I now recognise the African Christian Democratic Party, hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Speaker, I give notice that I shall move.

That the House debates the recent bus robberies in Mitchells Plain for three consecutive weeks on the Mandalay and Merrydale bus route. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Thank you, hon Christians, I now recognise

hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the continued rising level of crime in the Western Cape townships. I thank you, hon Speaker.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Thank you, hon Makamba-Botya. I recognise hon Marais.

Mr P MARAIS: Hon Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates strategies to manage an orderly urbanisation process in the Western Cape, providing legislative support to municipalities to manage a just and equitable legal process in the treatment of unlawful land occupiers, while simultaneously protecting the rights of private land owners.

I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Thank you, hon Marais. I now recognise hon

Xego. Alright, I now move to the next motion by hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of the Safety Plan introduced by the Premier measured against the escalating crime in the Western Cape province. Thank you.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Thank you, hon Makamba-Botya. Hon Xego, again so let me move to hon Dugmore. Hon Dugmore? Alright, you may proceed hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the recently completed Life Style audits in the province and in particular the fact that the hon Premier decided to use the services of a private company and not to utilise the services of institutions like the Auditor-General, Public Service Commission and the Public Protector, due to the fact that in the view of the Premier this would be a conflict of interest, given that he, the Premier, is in legal dispute with or has had legal disputes with these institutions. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Thank you, hon Dugmore. Hon members, I recognise hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates how the annual carnage of road users can be limited, especially the large number of pedestrians that are killed, maimed and disfigured on the narrow and dark roads of the province. I so move, hon Speaker.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Thank you, hon Mvimbi. I now recognise hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the clear inflammatory role of EFF darling Helen Zille in Senekal, where tensions ran high and she announced to go to support, which is also viewed as cheap and publicity-seeking by the DA National Chairperson. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Lekker. Hon members, I recognise hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the World Health Organisation's stand that proclaimed to follow a herd immunity approach – with a dangerous and little understood pandemic like COVID-19 – would be unethical. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Windvogel. Hon members, I recognise hon Windvogel again.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the present rising number of COVID-19 infections in notably the Western Cape. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Windvogel. Hon members, I recognise hon

Windvogel again.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates calls by the hon Premier Alan Winde to lift all COVID-19 lockdown measures – which in turn and on the heels of his calls – led to a flare-up of the pandemic in the Western Cape and caused a large number of matric learners to go to a Claremont drinking place where they contracted the dreaded disease that could cause them to only write their final exams next year. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Windvogel. Hon members, I now recognise hon Smith. Hon Smith? Alright. Hon members, that concludes Notices of Motion. Now let us move to Motions without Notice. I recognise ... [Interjection.] Are you there, hon Smith?

Mr D SMITH: Yes, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: You may proceed, hon Smith, if you are there.

Mr D SMITH: Thank you, hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the ongoing attacks, assault and robbery by criminals on emergency staff, serving the poor living in townships – like luring fire fighters into a trap in Wallacedene and injuring them, also attacking law enforcement officers. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Smith. Hon members, that concludes Notices of Motion. We now move to Motions without Notice. I recognise hon Brinkhuis.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that more than a month ago, a young woman wearing the Islamic modest dress and the niqab, a veil covering her face, was attacked in public in Paarl, by a man whose identity is known to the police. This cowardly act amounts to gender-based violence and slanderous comments against the Islamic faith. The woman, Ashika Benjamin, received an injury to her face and was left traumatised. The incident happened in broad daylight as she was on her way to assist her

brother at his workstation in Northern Paarl. He further threatened to stab her and also threatened her and her father with a firearm. He was arrested a month after the attack and subsequently appeared in the Paarl Magistrate's Court yesterday. Why is it so difficult for the Western Cape SAPS to not have arrested the culprit sooner? He was surely a danger to the public and specifically to the traumatised woman he attacked. We cannot condone such lack of will from our SAPS when ordinary citizens are being attacked and threatened. This culprit should have been arrested ... [Interjection.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Brinkhuis. Thank you. There is a point of order. What is the point of order, hon Marais?

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Speaker, can you rule whether this is a ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Your mic is not ... [Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS: It is on. Hon Speaker, this is not – this is a statement. It is not a motion at all. What we are now dealing with is Motions without Notice. What does the hon member move? This is a statement. It is not a motion.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais. Hon Brinkhuis, did you get that point of order?

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Yes, hon Speaker, I got that point of order. This is indeed a motion, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Are you done now, hon Brinkhuis?

Mr G BRINKHUIS: I am done, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you. [Interjections.] I now recognise hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Speaker.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Point of order, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Alright, hon members, hon Christians will you please take your seat. Hon Chief Whip, what is your point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): My apologies for interrupting, Mr Speaker. Usually a motion without notice needs to be carried by the House. You have not put the question to the House, but I am also not clear on what hon Brinkhuis is asking of the House?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip. Yes. I think what the Speaker can ask of the House is whether the hon members – are there any objections to the motion being read without notice and whether there are objections to the motion itself? [Interjection.] There is an objection to the motion itself from hon Marais. The motion will be printed in the Order Paper. I now move to the next, hon member Christians.

Mr F C Christians: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates The Justice Desk's Mbokodo Club, also known as TJD, on their two years of educating girl survivors of sexual abuse and gender-based violence in Nyanga. Hon Speaker, the TJD has been active in Nyanga for the past two years. They focus on self-defence and fitness, female empowerment and leadership and also access to mental health care, support for girls between the ages of 9 and 19. Jessica Dewhurst, CEO of TJD, stated that watching the incredible transformation of these girls is truly amazing; Dewhurst is of the opinion that the only way to dismantle the drivers of GBV is to challenge the patriarchal societal norms. One of the unnamed survivors said and I quote. "That she now knows that they as women and children should speak out if they are abused and that they do not have to shrink themselves to make others feel big around them or with them." Hon Speaker, the ACDP wants to congratulate TJD and we hope that other organisations will follow suit. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Christians. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice?

Mr P J MARAIS: Clarity Chairman. I just want a point of clarity otherwise I would follow in the same footsteps. I believe a motion is, "I move that this House blah-blah-blah". If I get up here and say, "Mr Chairman, yesterday somebody smacked me in the street and I was bleeding and I went home and my wife cried on my shoulder," that is not a motion. So I am now confused.

An HON MEMBER: But the Speaker should determine that.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais. Hon members, I am putting a question to the House. You can object or raise the objection in the manner in which the question is put to the House, hon Marais. Are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections? Are there any objections to the motion itself? No objections. Motion agreed to. Now, I move to the next motion. Hon Xego, I am assuming that you are still not present. Now we go to hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House extends our heartfelt congratulations to doctors Cherise Domingo and Riyad Dunn, two outstanding South Africans from Cape

Town, for their remarkable achievements in science and technology. Next week doctors Domingo and Dunn will be keynote speakers at the Form Lab's Global Summit, which celebrates innovators who are shaping the future of manufacturing from desktop printing to digital factories, Cherise and Riyad established Africa Makes 3D Printing for Development, and have pioneered 3D printing for the benefit of the health sector in Africa, working to overcome the challenges of affordable access to health care products under the motto "Made for Africa, made in Africa". Cherise and Riyad embrace 3D printing as the Fourth Industrial Revolution technology that will drive the future of emerging economies. Right here from Cape Town they are demonstrating the true meaning of 4IR innovation and how to harness technology to make a business and how to make a profound impact in the lives of people across the African continent. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Herron. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The SPEAKER: No objections. Are there any objections to the motion itself?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The SPEAKER: No objections. Motion agreed to. I now move to hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the Post Office in Matieland situated in the Neelsie Centre inside the University of Stellenbosch Campus is refusing residents to collect their R350 COVID-19 social assistance grants; instead the Post Office placed a notice on its door referring these poor residents to areas such as Paarl, Somerset West, Eerste River, and Kuils River without any valid explanation; this comes after it was reported that certain white people in the campus are uncomfortable with the presence of a number of black people queuing in that post office to collect their grants; this is the only post office in the Stellenbosch area, and the other alternative areas proposed are very far from these poor and vulnerable residents who cannot even afford travelling fares. The EFF condemns this racist behaviour in the strongest terms. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Makamba-Botya. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? Are there any objections to the motion itself? No objections? Motion agreed to. I now move to hon Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its sincere and heartfelt condolences to the family of the late Colonel Charl Kinnear, noting that his death is a loss to his family, to his friends, but also to the entire safety fraternity within our province; and calls for this case to be dealt with the level of seriousness that it deserves; and that our thoughts and prayers are with his family and friends as we continue to mourn his death. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Allen. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? Are there any objections to the motion itself? No objections? Motion agreed to. I now move to hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the robbery that took place at the Khayelitsha Art School & Rehabilitation Centre on Saturday 10 October 2020; six gunmen entered the theatre and held hostage 40 plus children and their director inside the premises; the gunmen subsequently robbed everyone in the building of their belongings and left them traumatised; one child with special needs had to be rushed off to hospital as a result of heart complications due to the traumatic experience of that incident; the

director of the theatre has since left the province and gone into hiding due to the ongoing threats from these criminals. The EFF calls on law enforcement authorities to intervene in the escalating crime in our townships. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Makamba-Botya. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Are there any objections to the motion itself? No objections? Motion agreed to. I now move to hon Maseko.

Ms L J BOTHA: Hon Speaker, may I address you on this? Member Maseko has got signal problems. So I am reading her motion.

The SPEAKER: I am advised that in terms of the Rules we may not allow that.

Ms L J BOTHA: Oh, okay.

The SPEAKER: Hon Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Your Rule. Thanks.

An HON MEMBER: Hon Speaker, may I address you?

Ms L J BOTHA: A precedent has been set already.

The SPEAKER: A precedent?

Ms L J BOTHA: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: What precedent? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: May I request the Table staff to advise the Speaker? I am sitting here guided by what they advised – that we cannot – I do not want to create confusion. I will just take one minute. I will come back to you on that, hon Botha. [Interjections.] You can have coffee, hon members.

[The House adjourned for the Speaker to obtain guidance and resumed.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, the House is governed by its Rules, but I do not get the precedent as per the advice from the Table staff and in terms of Rule 152 it says,

“A member may give notice of a motion on behalf of an absent member, provided that the member has been authorised to do so by the absent member.”

And in terms of this Rule I may allow a person, an hon member, to deliver a motion, but that has got to be done with the authority of the other member.

Now I want to, I do not know what other precedent has been – we are dealing with the Rules here and Rule 152 allows, provided that you have been duly authorised to do so. Hon Botha, do you have that authorisation?

Ms L J BOTHA: Hon Speaker, is this authorisation from the member whose motion it actually is? Yes.

The SPEAKER: From the member whose name is written on the motion.

Ms L J BOTHA: Yes, affirmative.

The SPEAKER: Well, you may proceed hon Botha.

An HON MEMBER: Where is the proof?

Ms L J BOTHA: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with sadness the passing of Dr Anwah Nagia;
Dr Nagia served as the Chairperson of the District Six ...
[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Mr Speaker, can I raise a point of order?

An HON MEMBER: Point of order, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Botha, will you please take your seat. Hon Marran and hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Mr Speaker. Indeed there was a precedent that was set before, there is a “but” there. There was an argument raised by the Chief Whip to say, if there is an authorisation from the other member, that must be communicated prior the motion being read, but now in this case have a member that has not even communicated to us that there is an apology of a particular nature. I am saying this Speaker, because it affected the ANC initially where I did not communicate with the Chief Whip what the circumstances were and as a result the ruling was that that particular motion will not be read. And on the next occasion I duly communicated that a specific member had problems connecting and in that instance I was then given the go-ahead that a particular member can therefore read on behalf of the other member.

So, I am not sure what exactly members are saying that there is a precedent when there are two different instances where this thing of reading a motion on behalf of another member took place, because there are two situations here. As the Chief Whip I communicate with the Chief Whip of the Ruling Party that this is the crisis and thereafter I will be given an authorisation that someone else can then read that motion. So I really need some clarity in relation to this inconsistent ruling. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip. The hon Marran and then I have got hon Makamba-Botya and I have got hon Kama. If it is on the same point,

I just read Rule 152, but I want to hear what the hon members say. I truly wish the hon members could help by ensuring that the Rules are applied, and Rule 152 does not ... [Interjections.] Let me just read Rule 152 again.

“A member may give notice of a motion on behalf of an absent member, provided that the member has been authorised to do so by the absent member.”

Now, that is in the event of a notice of a motion and motions without notice, that is a different case. The Rules are silent on Motions without Notice. Now it makes sense why there is a debate about this matter. Can I request that, instead of us having a debate on this matter, we do not entertain this debate, but you wait until the Rules are amended because currently there is nothing explicit before me that suggests that we can allow the members to read motions without notice from a member who is absent from the House. So, I withdraw my suggestion to hon Botha and therefore the motion will not be read. Can I get the note from the House that you have forgiven me?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, may I rise on a point of order?

The SPEAKER: Hon, I have got hon Marran. I have got hon Makamba-Botya and I have got hon Kama and then hon Mitchell.

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Speaker, I am basically covered by the hon Lekker on

this particular matter and I also think that you gave clarity and leadership on this particular issue. Thanks.

The SPEAKER: Alright. Thank you, hon Marran. As long as we understand, there are two sets of motions. The notices of a motion, a motion where notice is given, and a motion without notice and we are dealing now currently with a motion without notice and that is where we are and that is where I am saying, Rules do not make provision for a member to read such a motion except the member herself should be reading that motion. I now give hon Makamba-Botya an opportunity. What is your point of order?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Speaker. No, I was just going to raise a point of consistency on this particular issue because currently I am sitting with a challenge whereby member Xego is struggling with network problems where he is sitting and he is being sent from pillar to post by the Chief Whip and Mr Poggenpoel, in terms of this matter. So now that you have made a ruling that it is not going to happen, so I was going to raise an issue of consistency now that the member Botha was about to read the notice on behalf of a member who is absent in the House. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Makamba-Botya. [Interjections.] That request would have ... [Interjections.] Who is making noise now? That request would have sufficed if it was in line with a notice of a motion. Then Rule 152 would have assisted you, but in terms of motion without notice, Rule 150 does not make such a provision, but there seems to be an appetite

from members to allow for this, especially given the lay of the land. But we must deal with it in terms of the current amendment of the Rules that we are dealing with, led by hon Mitchell from the Rules Committee. Hon Mitchell.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. I respect the reversal of your ruling, however I want to categorically state that the reversal of the decision was done on a point of order and I want to refer the House to Rule 66(3) that a point of order cannot be raised on a point of order. And hon Botha raised a point of order when she asked for clarity. I also want to refer to Rule 67 where it categorically states in the Rules that a member can act on behalf of an absent member. We are all hon members, and we cannot question the integrity of hon Botha, where she informed the House that she has got the approval of the member, the absent member, to act on that member's behalf. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mitchell.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Your point of order is not sustained in terms of what we are dealing with. In terms of motions it is specific and unfortunately we have to deal with the Rules. This is not any other debate. This is specific on motions without notice and Rule 150 is specific and I am dealing with that in terms of the Rules and unfortunately these are our Rules and I have to respect them as the Presiding Officer. [Interjections.] Hon Wenger?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Mr Speaker. I see I have got a message from hon Maseko who has now changed devices and is now able to hear the proceedings and is online. Would you permit her to then read her motion please?

The SPEAKER: She is very much welcome to deliver her motion. Thank you very much hon members. Hon Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with sadness the passing of Dr Anwah Nagia; Dr Nagia served as the Chairperson of the District Six Beneficiary and Redevelopment Trust; the founder of the District Six Museum; and the Al Kaaf Human Rights Centre and Palestine Museum. The District Six Beneficiary and Redevelopment Trust has championed the cause of claimants since its establishment in 1998. He was also the Chairman of multiple NGOs which include the Mustadafin Foundation which feeds approximately 1,2 million people a year and is one of the largest relief and feeding schemes in the country; in the 1980s, Dr Nagia established learnerships for adult basic education in clothing factories and in the mid-1990s as the Deputy Chairman of the Western Cape Nursing Council, he fought for the protection of the Woodstock and Somerset Hospital for the continued use of those facilities for their communities.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Maseko.

Mr P MARRAN: Now that was a statement, hon Marais.

The SPEAKER: Hon Marran, you have not been recognised. You are being unruly now. Let me mute you there. Thank you for muting yourself. Thank you. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Are there any objections to the motion itself? No objections? Motion agreed to. I now recognise hon Baartman.

Ms D M Baartman: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its sincerest, heartfelt condolences to the family, friends, and loved ones of the late Professor Daniel Plaatjies, who passed away on Saturday 10 October 2020; notes that Professor Plaatjies served as the esteemed Chairperson of the Financial and Fiscal Commission since 2017, has been a towering figure in the academic field, and a dedicated civil servant whose advice and council on public policy, finance, and governance have been of great value to both this province and the country; commends the legacy of Professor Plaatjies as the founder of the Rosemead Institute, the former Head of the School of Governance at the University of the Witwatersrand, and

played a fundamental role in the establishment of the South African Social Security Agency; acknowledges with utmost respect that Professor Plaatjies was furthermore an executive civil servant and researcher at public institutions, such as the National Treasury and the Human Sciences Research Council; and pays tribute to Professor Plaatjies as a dedicated individual who worked for the good of the country and truly understood the challenges that South Africa faces. He dedicated his life to facing those challenges in a dedicated effort to the upliftment of all. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Baartman. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Are there any objections to the motion itself? No objections? Motion agreed to. I now recognise hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much. Hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House acknowledges the address by President Ramaphosa made to the Joint Sitting on 15 October and welcomes the plans and interventions which have been announced by the President, both in regard to the need to boost public employment and to work with the private sector in growing jobs in an inclusive manner, while at the same

time not dropping our guard in regard to the ongoing fight against the pandemic caused by COVID-19. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? Are there any objections to the motion itself? No objections? Motion agreed to. Hon members, I recognise hon Mitchell.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Mr Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the tragic passing of Provincial Traffic Officer Willis Smith, who lost his life whilst in service for Provincial Traffic in Worcester; extends its sincere condolences to the Smith family, friends, and loved ones of Officer Smith; acknowledges that Officer Smith was a dedicated official who is described as respectable, obedient, and one who was committed to serving others; and calls for a swift, thorough investigation, noting that a case of culpable homicide was registered. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mitchell. Hon members, are there any

objections to the motion being moved without notice? Are there any objections to the motion itself? No objections? Motion agreed to. Hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes some of the most horrific road accidents took place during the past month, with four people who died on the N1 in a head-on truck collision between Three Sisters and Beaufort West; seven people died in a crash between a bakkie and a car on the N2 on Saturday between Riviersonderend and Storms River, a baby is one of the injured taken to hospital; a 27 year-old traffic officer died on his way to an accident scene near Worcester when his car also crashed. Two other people died and a third was critically injured; and calls for a new provincial strategy to be investigated before the upcoming peak season. I so move, hon Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mvimbi. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? Are there any objections to the motion itself? No objections? Motion agreed to. I now recognise hon Philander.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the average of a 10% increase in COVID-19 cases across the country; recognises that a resurgence of COVID-19 is defined by the National Department of Health as an increase of more than 20% in new cases over a seven-day period; further notes that the Western Cape has recorded an increase of 13,65% of COVID-19 cases over the past seven days, which does not constitute a resurgence per definition; welcomes the Provincial Government's ongoing data-led strategy to manage hotspot and bushfire locations; acknowledges that there has been no increase in the positivity rate recorded in hospital admissions in the Western Cape, and that the province's recovery rate exceeded 90% at its peak; further welcomes the transparency of the Western Cape Government in its distribution of data and critical information to all residents; calls on other provinces to emulate the Western Cape's transparency and data-driven strategy, and for the National Minister of Health, Dr Zweli Mkhize, to ensure the compliance of all provinces in this regard; further urges residents to remain vigilant and committed to the 'Five Golden Rules' in order to limit the spread of COVID-19. I so move, Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Philander. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? Are there any objections to the motion itself? No objections? Motion agreed to. I now recognise hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the blatant snubbing of our provincial public service commissioner, Leon Goosen, at a recent Standing Committee meeting where his report was discussed, without him having being invited to participate in this particular meeting. I so move.
[Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore.

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, the objection has been noted. The motion will be printed in the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Maseko. Hon Maseko? Alright. Let us now move to hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that there are various serious challenges which continue to deepen inequality in education in our province, with reference to schools that are not safe and broken fences not being

fixed, also with references to closure of schools arbitrarily, and there are various schools to mention in this regard. Uitsig High School, Graafwater High School, and Wellington's Voor-Groenberg Primary School to name but a few. The untenable situation at the Ottery Youth Care Centre, which also includes allegations of corruption and mismanagement and the unstable learner transport due to tensions between WCED and small bus operators with no contingency plans in place; and the high rate of unplaced learners in poor and working class communities, and that this House demands that these matters are addressed before the 2021 academic year starts. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. Your motion will be printed in the Order Paper, hon Sayed. Hon members, I now recognise hon Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House wishes all matriculants well in their National Senior Certificate examinations which began on 21 October but for all participants on 5 November 2020; notes that this is the biggest exam to be administered under the unprecedented circumstances; and that we all call on and encourage learners to #CommitToFinish as obtaining one's NSC opens many opportunities. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Botha. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Are there any objections to the motion itself? No objections? Motion agreed to. I now move to hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the great successes by the police in the battle against crime and commends SAPS and all agencies on finding back R5 million's worth of stolen jewellery, 12 cellphones and cash in Bellville South and Stikland and arrested two suspects; note the arresting of a Pacaltsdorp man for murder after stabbing his pregnant girlfriend several times; also note a Marina da Gama couple was attacked on Saturday. The 65 year-old Francis Carter was stabbed to

death and her 71 year-old husband William survived despite a shot in the abdomen; note a man was caught near Dunoon for having a bag with 12 illegal hand guns; notes two Kraaifontein suspects of 17 and 18 years-old appeared in court on Monday after Duran Visagie got hit in the head by a stray bullet and the machines were switched off. Four kids were helped with donor organs; and notes new information was received about the controversial relationship between boys of the posh school Bishops and former teacher Fiona Viotti given by an eye witness; also notes three people, including a pastor and his fiancée, appeared in George Court for a 2018 knife murder on a 25 year-old woman on whose life a R3 million policy was taken out; and notes the 25 year-old rapist of an 8-year-old neighbour's child was sentenced in a Bellville Court to 15 years in jail; and lastly notes that two male suspects appeared in the Bellville Court after two Oak Glen sisters, aged 83 & 76 years, were attacked and robbed; and wishes the police Godspeed and community support in executing their task. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? Are there any objections to the motion itself? No objections? Motion agreed to. I now recognise hon Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commends the Department of Community Safety for the launch of its one of three K9 Units, with the first being in the West Coast; that this House welcomes the successful deployment of over 400 Learner Law Enforcement officers under the Law Enforcement Advancement Programme; and acknowledges these interventions by the Provincial Department of Community Safety that supplements and enhances the role of the South African Police Services to build a safer Western Cape for all. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Allen. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Are there any objections to the motion itself? No objections? Motion agreed to. Hon Lekker, I see your hand is up. Is it inadvertently up or do you want to raise a point of order? Alright, I guess it is an omission, which you will have to lower your own hand. Thank you for that. I now recognise hon Bans.

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes traditional initiation ceremonies that usually take place in winter, and that could not be held so far due to the COVID-19 lockdown, will start in December, say traditional leaders; further notes

the need for all places of initiation to be prepared as soon as possible by authorities. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bans. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Are there any objections to the motion itself? No objections? Motion agreed to. I now recognise hon Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates former principal of Harold Cressy High School, Victor Ritchie on his 90th birthday; that this House acknowledges the excellent role he played in the education as principal at Harold Cressy for 37 years; Mr Ritchie also received an honorary degree in Education from the University of Cape Town along with many other awards & accolades; we commend him for his exemplary leadership and wish him a happy birthday. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Botha. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Are there any objections to the motion itself? No objections? Motion agreed to.

I now recognise hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes more eviction of farm workers and other residents are continuing to take place despite restrictions against it, like now with people dumped next to a Kraaifontein road. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marran. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Are there any objections to the motion itself? No objections? Motion agreed to. I now recognise hon Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the reopening of Zeitz Museum of Contemporary Art Africa; calls on local artists to participate in their reopening exhibition, free of charge; and notes that every participant will receive an admission ticket to use in the museum for a period of three months; and welcomes the platform created for local artists, collectors, and other artistic, creative individuals alike. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Allen. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? No objections? Motion agreed to. I now recognise hon Bans.

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes development plans to change the soon to be redundant Newlands Rugby Stadium into a residential complex for more than a thousand students. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bans. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? Are there any objections to the motion itself?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Sorry, hon Speaker, I did not hear what the member was asking for. So I missed that part. I do apologize.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mackenzie. You may please take your seat. Hon Bans, will you please read your motion again?

Ms A P BANS: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes development plans to change the soon to be redundant Newlands Rugby Stadium into a residential complex for more than a thousand students. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bans. Again I put the question. Are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? Are there any objections to the motion itself? No objections. Motion agreed to. Thank you, hon members. I now recognise hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you. Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes many experts seriously question the fact that former SAPS Colonel Chris Prinsloo is out on bail after only serving four of his eighteen year jail sentence in 2016 for his role in supplying about R5 million worth of guns to Cape gangs; and also notes the alleged assassin of top gang cop Lieutenant Colonel Charl Kinnear is probed as the suspected Zane Killian is not a registered private investigator as previously claimed. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama. Hon members, are there any

objections to the motion being read without notice? Are there any objections to the motion itself? No objections? Motion agreed to. Hon members, I recognise hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I will pass, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Alright. Thank you, hon Lekker. Hon members, that concludes the Notices of Motion. That concludes the Motions without Notice and that brings us to the end of our business for the day. Thank you very much, hon members and the Table staff and the people of this province. That concludes the business for the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 13:20.