
THURSDAY, 22 JUNE 2023

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid Sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The SPEAKER: Please be seated. Order! Members, before we proceed I would like to remind members about some of the logistical arrangements. As has been our practice to date, all hon members will participate in the Sitting of the House both from here in the Chamber, with the Presiding Officer and the Table staff present, and via Microsoft Teams. Our Standing Rules have accordingly been amended to accommodate such hybrid Sittings of the House. Hon members experiencing challenges in connecting to this Sitting are requested to contact the WCPP ICT colleagues who will assist to resolve their connectivity issues.

Hon members, the quorum requirements for the Sittings of the House are provided for in the Constitution and the Standing Rules. Unless there is an indication of unanimous concurrence, voting will be confined to members present in the House and on the hybrid system, who are entitled to cast their votes as per the ATC issued on 11 August 2020. Members present in the House and via Microsoft Teams have all the privileges and immunities imparted by law. Members who are considered out of order by the Presiding Officer will have their microphones muted and called to order.

The Serjeant-at-arms have recorded all members' attendance.

In instances where these Directives do not cover a particular eventuality, the Standing Rules will apply, and in instances where the Standing Rules cannot be applied the Ruling by the Presiding Officer is final.

Hon members, all microphones have been muted. However, for those hon members participating in the Sitting of the House via Microsoft Teams, you are requested to use the raised-hand functionality of the system when you desire to raise a point of order, and I will recognise you. When a hon member in the Chamber wishes to raise a point of order, such hon member may address the Presiding Officer, as expected, but must mute their microphones when they have completed speaking.

Hon members are requested to please ensure that their microphones are unmuted when the Presiding Officer recognises them, and when they are done speaking to please mute their microphones.

Hon members participating in this Sitting of the House via Microsoft Teams are also requested not to sign into Microsoft Teams on more than one device. The Media have also been granted access to this Microsoft Teams meeting as guests of the WCPP. However, I would like to remind members of the press that may not use the chat room or speak or activate their cameras while the Sitting is in progress. If an individual, who is not a member of the House, activates the microphone and video camera such an individual will be exited from the Sitting of the House immediately.

For this Sitting, hon members, Language Translation Services are available in the Chamber, as usual, and on Microsoft Teams via the respective channels. Hon members, I would like to remind you that no interjections are permitted during these hybrid Sittings and to this end I draw the hon members' attention to Rule 40 of our Standing Rules.

With that being said, hon members, we are now proceeding to Interpellations as printed on the Question Paper and I recognise the hon Minister, Minister Wenger.

Hon member Marais, is that a Point of Order?

Mr P J MARAIS (FF PLUS): Hon Speaker, I ask that my Motion on the Western Cape People's Bill be given preference in order of procedures, if there is no objection. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is not a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Alright, hon members, before that, if there is any objection? There is a request by the hon member Marais for the motion to take precedence, so I will put the question... [Interjection.]

Hon Chief Whip, is that a point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): I will await your ruling, Speaker, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon members. As per the Rules of Parliament, there has been a request, and I will put the question to the House. Those in favour of the motion being moved by hon member Marais being adopted, please say "yes."

[No audible reply.]

The SPEAKER: Those not in favour of the question or the motion please say "no."

HON MEMBERS: No.

The SPEAKER: That brings us to the end of that question. The motion will not be dealt with as precedence. I now recognise the hon Minister, Minister Wenger.

INTERPELLATIONS

1. Ms N D Nkondlo asked the Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities:

- (a) What are the employment equity targets for the province, and
- (b) How does her Department support the efforts of the Provincial Government to achieve these targets?

The PREMIER: It must be because there is a Conference coming up.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Have your own Conference. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members, there is a member on the floor. Minister Wenger, you may continue.

An HON MEMBER: It is the Premier. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members! Hon Minister, my apologies.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, there is a Minister on the floor. Hon Mvimbi?

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, just on a point of order. I do not think it is normally a norm where a member is asking you to rule on a matter, if you are able to rule that time to say you cannot rule. I remember there was a matter of hon Christians where he was actually in being... [Inaudible.] He was attacking bisexual people and I think hon Marais stood up and said that you must rule, whether it was that important what he said. We thought that by now we would have had your ruling on that.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mvimbi, I will make rulings when I am ready to do so. I now recognise the hon Minister, Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. With respect to the hon member's question I respond as follows.

The Employment Equity Act (Act 55/1998), Section 20, as amended by Section 6 of the Employment Equity Amendment Act (Act 4/2022) requires that, and I quote:

"A designated employer must prepare and implement an Employment Equity Plan which will achieve reasonable progress

for employment equity in that employer's workforce."

The employment equity targets as defined by this national legislation of both the Provincial Treasury and the Department of Economic Development and Tourism are outlined in the respective Employment Equity Plans which have been presented to this House and are contained within the Annual Reports for the Provincial Treasury and in the Department of Economic Development and Tourism respectively, which are all publicly available.

In respect of the Department of Economic Development and Tourism, the Employment Equity Plan identifies annual targets that would incrementally result in the achievements of the five-year goal set at the onset of the planning period valid from 1 June 2020 until 31 May 2025. Further to this the Employment Equity Plan sets specific measures and actions including developmental interventions to be achieved for each year.

In respect of the Provincial Treasury, the Employment Equity Consultative Forum and Workforce Implementation Report support the efforts of the Department in its efforts to achieving targets. For transversal information on the Provincial Government more broadly and beyond the Departments I am responsible for, the Corporate Services Centre is better placed to respond. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise the hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Hon Speaker, the people of the Western Cape have come to understand that the DA is all talk and never practice what they preach. While they run with the fake news that Coloured people would be losing their jobs because of the Employment Equity Regulations they have been no better in employing the same Coloured people whom they wish to defend.

For example, according to the Provincial Treasury Annual Report 2021/22 the situation in the MEC's Department and entities look dire in terms of equity. Of the top three managers in Provincial Treasury in the top management two are White men. Of the 22 posts in top and senior management in Provincial Treasury seven or nearly a third of posts are held by Whites while there are no African women at these levels. At the same time we see that three African men were recruited into the senior management levels during the 2021/22 financial year but we have to point out sadly that the Provincial Treasury is still recruiting White men. While there may only be 19 White men serving in Provincial Treasury, 18 of these are serving in level 9 to level 16. In other words they are not found in junior positions, which seemingly are reserved for Blacks. The Department of Economic Development and Tourism is no better. Nearly a quarter of the top and senior management posts are held by Whites.

Again, of 23 posts only three are held by Africans. Again, White males are only found in levels 9 to level 14. This Provincial Cabinet has yet to set an

employment of people with disability target whilst National Government has set a target of 2%. The Department of Economic Development and Tourism has a people-with-disability rate of 1,5% and is therefore below the national standard.

Again, we must raise objections to White males being recruited by this same Department. While these may be professionally qualified and experienced specialists and mid-management, it is difficult to understand how there cannot be Coloured and African people, including Indians, with the same skills or is it a case of, as Helen Zille said, "Coloured people are not qualified enough." I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Nkondlo. I now recognise the hon Murray.

Ms C MURRAY (DA): Thank you, and through you, Speaker, I would like to thank the Minister for her response. The DA does not support race-based policies that serve only to divide our country further.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Refer to it.

Ms C MURRAY (DA): If 28 years of ANC Government has shown us anything, it is that their version of economic empowerment has done exactly the opposite.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): And apartheid then?

Ms C MURRAY (DA): They have failed to empower historically disadvantaged people in our country while enriching a small elite group of cadres. This creates a clear blue water between us and the ANC or us, the DA and the ANC's position on economic empowerment. The DA advocates for an open opportunity society for all, but the ANC does not.

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor, hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

Ms C MURRAY (DA): The proposed Employment Equity Regulations are nothing more than the last kicks of a dying party, Speaker... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): White re-capitalism!

Ms C MURRAY (DA): ...trying to paint itself as the champion of the poor, but South Africans have had enough and they see right through this. They have seen that the ANC has no plan for economic empowerment [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Murray, please take your seat. Hon Sayed, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Is the hon Murray willing to take a question?

The SPEAKER: Hon Murray, are you prepared to take a question?

Ms C MURRAY (DA): I am flattered, but no thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: The hon Murray is not prepared to take a question. Hon Murray, you may continue. [Interjection.]

Ms C MURRAY (DA): Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, the ANC has no plan for economic empowerment, but the DA does. We must start focusing on growing the economy rather than sowing further division amongst our people. Through you, Speaker, I would like to ask the Minister, how will the Growth for Jobs Strategy address inequality in the Western Cape? I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Murray. I now recognise the hon Christians. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: People just do not... [Inaudible.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, the ANC just drives race-driven politics... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

†'n AGBARE LID: Ja!

[An HON MEMBER: Yes!]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): That is what the ANC drives, race-driven politics. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: And you are homophobic...

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): They had more than 30 years to address the inequalities, and what did they do? They gave jobs to cadre deployment. What did they do? They gave †*baantjies vir boeties* [jobs for pals] and enriched themselves and that is why we are struggling. The ACDP is on record... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): ...that the best person for the job, we need to retain the skills in our country and in our province. We are driving them out with this... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): That is why at the old end the people will suffer, because we do not have the best skilled people doing the jobs, so what the people of the Western Cape want is the job to be done and not cadre

deployment because give the ANC another opportunity and they will do exactly the same, so we are against the Employment Equity Act and, Minister, my question is, what are you doing to improve the lives of the people in this thing. That is important to the voter out there. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Order, members! Thank you very much. [Interjections.] Members, can I please ask... [Interjections.] Order, members! [Interjections.] Members, there was a member on the floor. Interjections are allowed but you cannot drown out the speaker. Hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Thank you, Speaker. It is indeed a pity. It is said a new type of racism these days is to deny that racism exists, and actually we all know that we sit in this country as a function of a racialised system over years. That is why some of us come from Gugulethu and others come from Constantia. It is not an accident of history, but it was man-made and it was engineered by males and those that are sitting here, who are beneficiaries of the system. That is why there are proxies to the system and they spoke, they will speak louder because they are supposed to go back to the table where they receive the crumbs. It is so unfortunate, hon Christians. It is a pity that the matter of employment equity to correct the injustice of the past, are paid lip service in this House. It is disingenuous for the DA now to proclaim, let us not talk about race, when they are the ones to cry foul in the first place.

The actions of this Department set the norms and standards for the private

sector in the province; consistently in the last 14 years the numbers of Coloured people employed in our Provincial Economy have declined, yet the DA today and its bedfellows, the Freedom Front Plus, want to stand up to defend Coloured people.

In 2009, the ANC left the Provincial Government – Coloured women comprising 24% of the economically active population in the Western Cape. In 2020, a decade after the DA rule, that figure of Coloured women participation in the economy stands at 20%, from 24% in 2009 to 20% in 2020. It is interesting to ask where have they disappeared to?

In 2009, Coloured men comprised 27% of the economically active population. In 2020, a decade later, Coloured males comprise only 25% of the economically active population. So the DA does not protect Coloured people. Where the DA governs, less Coloured people lose their places in the economy, so the people of the Western Cape must know that this DA is just about scare tactics. Actually it continues to entrench tricameral Parliament that seeks to divide the Black community, who are actually enjoined together in the problems of inequality. Together with the Freedom Front Plus all they can do is to win on fear and actually recruit from these communities their proxies.

Let us be emphatic, employment equity must benefit all those who suffered under apartheid, Africans, Coloured and Indians. The legislation is clear and we must promote all our people's access to employment opportunities.

Unfortunately, we live in an unequal society, and this inequality is based on race and there is no amount of rhetoric or denialism that can actually take away this. We have to confront this generation of [Inaudible.] sitting in this House. We have to confront this particular scourge. We therefore urge this Provincial Government, who profess to be defenders of the Constitution, and who wish to govern by the rule of law, to address the injustices of the past... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, please conclude.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): ...and to implement the legislative prescripts such as the Employment Equity, BEE which seeks the economic emancipation of Africans, Coloured and Indian. I thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Nkondlo. Please take your seat. Thank you very much, hon Nkondlo. Hon Minister, Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and thank you to the hon members for the questions.

The Western Cape Government, as articulated through our Economic Growth Strategy, sees growth to support redress as a core value that underpins our approach to growth and jobs. In this respect we believe that redress is best achieved through ensuring active economic participation by pulling more

people into the economy, stimulating competition, improving skills and productivity.

We know that it is best made possible through an open market economy with positive interventions that enable businesses to grow and to create jobs. Fundamentally, we believe in creating equality of opportunity through a state that facilitates economic opportunity for citizens, expands choice as well as the independence of its residents without limiting individual freedom. The Western Cape Government's policies are accordingly designed to achieve equitable representation of vulnerable population groups in the workforce over time through improving productivity, attracting investment, creating and enabling environment for businesses and reducing unemployment, an approach which is aligned with the Constitution and the achievement of substantive equality. This is our alternative to the National Government's approach currently required by national legislation.

Development lessons show that addressing the root causes of under-representation of vulnerable groups is the most effective approach to achieving a fairer society, a post secondary school qualification, and generally at least five years job experience is often the requirement to be eligible for skilled positions. Consequently the cornerstone policy to transform representation in the labour market is a high quality education from Grade R for all.

(b) Closer alignment between the curriculum and marketable skills, and

(c) Helping people build networks that connect them to jobs.

Furthermore, the policies and strategies of the Government are developed to address the root causes of under-representation of vulnerable groups in the skilled labour market, while supporting the economy's growth, because structural transformation cannot be achieved unless the economy is creating jobs. We are extremely concerned about the impact that the imposition of sectoral numerical targets will have on the economy. In addition, I am concerned about what it will mean, in particular for women in employment. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES:
Workforce statistics demonstrate that women are more acutely affected by unemployment than men. [Interjections.]

Yet the draught regulations set higher quotas for men than for women across all population group sectors and occupational levels. The Regulations are poorly compiled and are incoherent with very little information provided to guide an understanding of the various numerical targets for each sector and occupational level and how they will be applied. As such, they provide insufficient information and clarification for us to be able to comment. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: They appear on the face of it to be irrational and can be questioned whether they will in their application advance equality, notwithstanding that this may be the intention. Insofar as this is the case, there is a material risk that the draught regulations in their current form fall short of the legal standard required by the Constitution.

In addition the procedure followed in enacting the Amendment Bill was incorrect insofar as the Amendment Bill was tagged as a Section 75 Bill, we provided, the Western Cape Government provided substantiation for the view that the Bill ought to have been tagged as a Section 76 Bill. Our objections regarding the specific issue were ignored and it was finalised as a Section 75 Bill. The Amendment Bill and Draft Regulations are hence at serious risk of being found to be unconstitutional. The Draft Regulations should accordingly be withdrawn, the Amendment Act repealed and consideration given to addressing the root causes of the problem. All spheres of Government must be adequately consulted as part of an evidence-based SCIA process prior to any future legislation in this regard being published for comment. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister. Hon members, that brings us to the end of Interpellation 1.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: We will move on to Interpellation 2 and I recognise hon Minister Wenger.

2. Ms C Murray asked the Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities:

How does the Western Cape's red-tape reduction efforts compare with the rest of South Africa?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and thank you to the hon member for the question. Creating the right conditions for businesses to thrive and grow requires an environment that is business friendly and competitive, where the foundations for growth such as energy, infrastructure and water are available and where there is a growing pool of skilled individuals to recruit from. This enabling approach to economic growth is the very basis for the Western Cape's new Growth for Job Strategy.

In this respect, making it easier to do business in the Western Cape by cutting red tape and systematically removing barriers that stand in the way of the private sector's success, is an important pillar of our approach to growing the economy. It is for this very reason that the Western Cape Government set up the Red Tape Reduction Unit in 2011 with the aim of solving the problems that make it difficult for businesses to grow and in so doing, ensuring that we work to create an enabling environment for businesses both big and small in

our province.

We are proud of the work done by the Red Tape Reduction team, which has helped thousands of businesses tackle the inefficient Government bureaucracy that restricts their growth. I am informed that this unit is and remains the only provincial unit with dedicated resources to reduce red tape in South Africa. I am further informed that there are no similar units established in other provinces, although we are aware that the KwaZulu Natal Provincial Government, through a partnership with the Department of Small Business Development, has introduced an Administrative Simplification Programme with selected municipalities.

The Gauteng Provincial Government has also reached out to the Western Cape Red Tape Reduction Unit to present to their stakeholders on the work of the unit as they were considering the establishment of such a programme. I am told that this workshop took place on 8 September last year.

On a national level there have been several attempts or programmes to reduce red tape along these lines. I am informed that the Department of Small Business Development established the Red Tape Reduction Unit. However, I am informed that the unit is undergoing a restructuring process. The RTRU was integral in the establishment of the Inter-Provincial Red Tape Reduction Task Team. The Western Cape Government served as the Deputy Chair supporting the Department of Small Business Development to set the agenda and objectives and continue to participate in these programmes.

Indeed, the Western Cape Red Tape Reduction Unit actively participates in several National programmes with the objective of reducing red tape and is often called upon to provide strategic advice. For example, when the Presidency's Red Tape Reduction Team was announced, the Western Cape Government was called upon to provide inputs to the areas of priority. We continue to serve as a key member of the Presidency's Red Tape Reduction Reference Group. More recently, at the end of May of this year, our Red Tape Reduction Unit was approached to host the Red Tape Reduction Peer Learning Webinar in partnership with the Investment Climate Reform Programme and the Department of Trade, Investment and Competition. The event brought together all role players, including other provinces where the Western Cape Government and the City of Cape Town were asked to share approaches, lessons learnt and successes. The sessions were moderated by representatives of the International Finance Corporation, with key inputs from other programmes aimed to reduce red tape.

In summary, the Western Cape through the Red Tape Reduction Unit and the City of Cape Town remain the forerunner and model for an institutionalised approach to reducing red tape. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: You thank you very much, hon Minister, I now recognise the hon Murray.

Ms C MURRAY (DA): Thank you and through you, Speaker, I would like to

thank the Minister again for her response. We all know that it is up to the private sector to create jobs and that it is up to Government to create conditions that put our entrepreneurs in the best position to do this and the ANC can dispute this, but even their President has agreed to.

He took a leaf from our own book in the Western Cape, and went as far as to commit to the establishment of a Red Tape Reduction Unit as far back as February 2022 in the State of the Nation Address. Unfortunately, this has not yet come to fruition at a national level, but in stark contrast, the work done by the Red Tape Reduction Unit since 2011 – that is eleven years before the announcement made by the President – is unblocking bottlenecks, and it is doing so to clearly make sure that our business people have every opportunity to thrive, to start businesses, to sustain their businesses and to grow businesses, creating much needed jobs. I am excited to see how this work will be bolstered by the implementation of the Growth for Work or the Growth for Jobs Plan which was tabled earlier this year. Through the Red Tape Reduction Unit the Western Cape Government is actively supporting job creation in the province and building on the momentum that we already have as the province with the lowest unemployment rate and with booming industries in agriculture and tourism, to name a few.

It is innovative governance, Speaker, in tough conditions that have become a hallmark of DA governance, where we go the extra mile to deliver for our residents and this has become commonplace. If you doubt that, simply look at the stark contrast with the efforts or lack thereof in other provinces and

nationally.

I welcome today's robust engagement on this issue, highlighting how we can further bolster our efforts in the Western Cape and share a leaf with provinces and National.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Murray. I now recognise the hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): *Enkosi Somlomo*. The ANC supports all efforts to create a business friendly environment, both in the province and nationally, where businesses can thrive and where economic opportunities can be realised. Red Tape Reduction is one of the means through which this can be achieved. I am actually very worried, Speaker, of what the DA is doing to a very young, bright young woman in the Chairperson of this particular Committee. It reminds me and how she is actually wrongfully, conscientised. It reminds me of the writing of Nat Nakasa, which stated in his observations very early in the 70's / 80's: "Afrikaner Youth got a raw deal."

In a statement released by MEC Wenger last month, she said between 2019 and 2022 the Red Tape Reduction Intervention saved the Province's economy R1,85 billion. It is a matter of more serious concern that the Departments Red Tape Reduction Unit launched over a decade ago, still cannot provide simple information of how many black-owned companies and businesses

owned by members of the previously marginalised groups have been assisted by the Red Tape Reduction Unit.

The Unit's Case Management System has not yet reached this level of analysis, according to the MEC and as we are always told that this Government operates on an evidence base, one of the basic lessons on monitoring and evaluation, MEC, is around the results chain, results-based monitoring and evaluation, which look not only on outputs, which is the amount of money that you have spent and you grandstand here. What we want to see is outcome and impact. In any way we have to go back to what would have been the theory of change when we are considering red tape reduction.

Were you interested in the big White corporate companies, both in the country and nationally or were you considering those that are entrapped and encircled in the Cape Flats in township-based environment where they have difficulties... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, please conclude. Your time has expired.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Allow me, Speaker, to commend President Ramaphosa for establishing this Red Tape Reduction Task Team situated in his private office. The Task Team's areas of interest include informal trading permits and licences and Early Childhood Development... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): I thank you. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Nkondlo. Hon Christians?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, I want to echo one of the previous speakers to say that Government's role is to create an environment for economic growth. It is not for Government to create jobs. It is for Government to create that environment. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members, order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): So, Speaker, if I can say the following, Premier Alan Winde said in 2014... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members! Hon Christians, please take your seat. Hon members, there is a member on the floor. Hon members, there is a member on the floor. Please allow the member to make his contribution. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members! Hon Christians, you may continue. Hon members on my left and on my right, there is a member on the floor. Hon Christians, you may continue.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, Speaker. 2015 Premier Alan Winde said, "Red tape makes it difficult for businesses to succeed, grow, create jobs and invest in infrastructure and development," and that is why the Red Tape Reduction Unit was established way back, but what I want to know from the Minister... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): ...if there are stories how the businesses, I believe, are still getting paid after 30 days and in this economic climate they need to be paid on time. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): So I want to ask the Minister two things: tell us, is this unit making progress and is it helping businesses to thrive in the struggling economy? I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. Hon members, before I recognise hon Klaas, hon members, please, when there is a member on the floor, please allow that member to make their contributions. I at no point want to stifle debate or interjections, but the minute you start drowning out the speaker it becomes a problem.

An HON MEMBER: Jealousy! [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order! Hon Klaas.

Mr T KLAAS (EFF): When every member of the Democratic Alliance is made to believe that the Western Cape is an independent country from South Africa, that is why they spend too much time comparing the province with the rest as the country. [Interjections.]

This kind of thinking owned its roots from a system of colonialism and apartheid, which used to separate this country along the lines of colonies and Bantustans. It then explains... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr T KLAAS (EFF): ...while the Premier recently went to holiday in the US, this is discussed as a trip to negotiate the African Growth ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members! Hon Klaas, please take your seat. Hon Marais, is that a point of order? Please take your seat, hon Klaas.

Mr P J MARAIS (FF PLUS): Yes, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order?

Mr P J MARAIS (FF PLUS): There is a Rule that you cannot read your speech here. You can refer now and then to it but you cannot read your whole speech. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr P J MARAIS (FF PLUS): I want you to rule on it, Sir. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr T KLAAS (EFF): Speaker, I would ask myself... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order members! [Interjections.] Order, hon Klaas! [Interjections.] Hon Klaas, order members! Hon Marais, I note your point of order. I am not going to dictate to the member how he must deliver his contribution. Hon member, but can I please also ask that you address me and not address the Minister directly. Hon Klaas.

Mr T KLAAS (EFF): Thank you, Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: Benefited from apartheid, that one.

Mr T KLAAS (EFF): If they will explain why the Premier recently went on holiday in the US, which is disguised as a trip to renegotiate the African

Growth and Opportunity Act on behalf of the Western Cape. That is so because their Premier sees himself as the President of the independent Western Cape State, which is an illusion. We were told that this red tape initiative saves billions of rands for the provincial economy and that is crucial for job creation.

However, we know that this initiation was created for big business to save money and for the friends to be able to score Government tenders in the extent of kickbacks.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

Mr T KLAAS (EFF): Donation to DA coffers, gratitude for DA officials to form fully paid up holiday trips overseas. This so-called red tape initiation does not centre for many of these small businesses operating in the province. This Provincial Government was not able to show us how much small businesses alone in the province serve as a result of this initiative. That is why we have many taxis in the province operating without permits due to the red tape imposed by the Provincial Department of Mobility, together with the Provincial Regulatory entity...

The SPEAKER: Hon Klaas, your time has expired, please conclude.

Mr T KLAAS (EFF): Can the Minister tell us how much more business alone in the province were we able to save as a result of this red tape initiative?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Klaas, please take your seat.

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You will not get that with us.

The SPEAKER: Hon Murray, I recognise you.

Ms C MURRAY (DA): Thank you, Speaker, Speaker, I would just like to start by saying that the DA is a party that believes in agency. It is the party that believes in the individual... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order members!

Ms C MURRAY (DA): ...and while I understand that the ANC might find it strange to see a 28-year old woman... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Ms C MURRAY (DA): ...as a Member of Parliament, it is normal for the DA who respects the individual. [Interjections.]

Speaker, I also want to ask, through you, does the President believe that having a Red Tape Reduction Unit will ever be effective, particularly within his Cabinet, and the reason I ask that is because he placed it in the

Presidency rather than in the respective Department in which it should have been sitting. So, with that, does he think his own Cabinet is so corrupt that he cannot delegate them with the responsibilities that are due to them? [Interjections.] The National Government and other provinces should take a note of what is happening in the Western Cape. Governance and regulations at all levels... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms C MURRAY (DA): ...should not be a limiting factor for economic development. [Interjections.] They should be driving growth and they should ensure that residents are upskilled, that their welfare needs are met. They also need to ensure that the right infrastructure is in place so that we can grow businesses and unlock jobs. That is why the Red Tape Reduction Unit is such an important initiative by actively helping businesses to navigate the slew of Government bureaucracy that exists. The Western Cape Government is going above and beyond to help our business people to get our residents working and help our young people become entrepreneurs. I want to stress that last point, young entrepreneurs. [Interjections.]

Now the Premier and Minister recently visited the US and while some members might refer to it as a holiday, they are quite confused. The Premier and the Minister were not on holiday. They were saving face for South Africa. They were representing our country and saving jobs... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, members!

Ms C MURRAY (DA): ...while the President was an embarrassing state to our country in Poland. What happened there? Why was he there? What kind of peace mission was that? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order! Hon Murray, please take your seat. [Interjection.] Hon members on both sides of the House, this is the third time that I have asked you to please allow the member on the floor to not be drowned out by your interjections. Hon members, this is the last time that I am going to request you to please allow the members on the floor to make their contributions. Do not drown out the Speaker. Hon Marran, is that a point of order?

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Yes, yes, Speaker. Then you must also remind hon Murray not to address us directly, but to address us through you as the Speaker, because she was speaking directly to us and therefore she prompted a response. I will respond.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): She will get a response!

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): If she addresses us directly. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay, hon Marran. Hon Murray, can I remind you to please address the Speaker. All further contributions today, please, members. This

is a reminder to please address the Speaker. Hon Murray, you may continue.

[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: That aggression does not suit you... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Ms C MURRAY (DA): Speaker, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Ms C MURRAY (DA): I again would like to remind the Opposition, through you, Speaker, that this is a party that believes in individualism and agency. We are not defined by the collective as the ANC ideologically believes. [Interjections.]

The DA understands that too much Government regulation deters economic activity and is taking steps to address that at a provincial level. Just imagine what we could achieve when we win the Union Buildings in 2024! I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Murray. I now recognise the hon Minister, Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Cutting red tape is a key priority for this Government because businesses, especially small businesses which are so important to growing the economy and creating jobs, should be able to focus on expansion rather than being bogged down by red tape and bureaucracy. This is why I would like to celebrate with you that between May 2019 and September 2022 the Western Cape's Red Tape Reduction and ease-of-doing-business interventions resulted in the saving of R1,8 billion to the provincial economy. [Applause.]

In addition to the financial savings achieved, the Red Tape Reduction Case Management System recorded a total of... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms C MURRAY (DA): ...of 519 cases in the last financial year, with a resolution rate of 93%. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms C MURRAY (DA): I was particularly pleased with the fact that the surveys conducted with businesses who have logged cases on the system, reported an 80% satisfaction rate, indicating that the unit is able to effectively assist in making it easier to do business in our province. I am also excited to confirm that today I am announcing the Municipal Red Tape Reduction Challenge Fund for 2023/24 which will fund interventions in

municipalities aimed at reducing the regulatory burdens, improving business processes through digitisation and ensuring effective communication to businesses. Through these interventions, the main goal we aim to achieve is to improve development planning and building environments in which businesses operate in local municipalities.

In answer to hon Murray, in addition to the impressive work done by the Red Tape Reduction Unit, this Government also works on a number of key areas to unlock economic growth by making it easier to do business. We are moving from a purely red-tape-reduction perspective to an ease-of-doing-business approach which helps all businesses, big and small, in the economy and we include ourselves in that.

Thank you very much, hon Christians. A report by the National Treasury in 2021/22 indicated that the Western Cape Government paid 99% of all invoices for goods and services within 30 days.

In addition to our ease-of-doing-business approach, we are looking at ways to improve the efficiency of the Port of Cape Town with the aim of boosting our proudly Western Cape exports so that we can help exporters to expand and create more jobs. We are also mapping the regulatory constraints for top export commodities and undertaking an analysis to identify sector barriers and engage regulators across all levels to create an enabling export friendly environment.

Another key area that inhibits the growth of our economy is the broken South African visa regime. The fact is that the current visa regime is a significant deterrent to investment and the expansion of existing businesses. It is costing us jobs and economic growth at a time when we can ill afford to lose either. It is for this reason we have also introduced a dedicated project that will provide evidence-based research to assist the Western Cape Government to advocate for visa reform in South Africa. This is outcome and impact.

While we know that there is still much work to be done, our efforts are bearing fruits and which is why, according to the most recent Quarterly Labour Force Survey, that 62 000 new jobs were created in the last quarter in the Western Cape and that is why we focus and continue to focus on removing barriers to growth, cutting red tape and the regulatory burdens on businesses and why we are on a mission to take decisive action to ensure that the Western Cape is the easiest place to do business in South Africa. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Order, order. Hon members. Members, that brings us to the end of Interpellations.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: We will now deal with Questions as printed on the Question Paper, and I wish to advise hon members that once the hon Premier or the

Minister has started to reply to the oral question, as printed on the Question Paper, hon members must use the chat facility for the Sitting for those online and an indication by hand for those in the Chamber if you wish to ask a follow-up question.

There are four opportunities for follow-up questions, but the hon member who has posed the initial oral question as printed on the Question Paper, will have the first opportunity for a follow-up question. Thereafter, other hon members may then use the remaining opportunities to ask a follow-up question. Hon members, before I recognise the Premier, I just want to remind members that Question 1 on the Question Paper stood over from Thursday, 15 June 2023, as agreed to by the House.

I now recognise the hon Premier. Hon Premier, please take your seat. Hon Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, Speaker. Can I just draw...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Is that a point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Just in terms of the Order Paper, may I address you?

The SPEAKER: Yes, sure.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Speaker. The Question Paper for Oral Reply, Questions 3 and 6 to stand over and the members have accordingly been consulted. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, so noted. Hon members, I now recognise the hon Premier.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Question standing over from Thursday, 15 June 2023, as agreed to by the House:

1. Mr C M Dugmore asked the Premier:

- (a) What (i) is the value and (ii) are the details of the contracts that a certain company, whose name has been furnished to his Department for the purpose of his reply, has concluded with his Department and Government,
- (b) how many contracts are still ongoing, and
- (c) in respect of reports that the company played an active role regarding incidents of state capture reported at SARS and
- (d) how does this affect the image of the Provincial Government and his Department?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Speaker, and thank you very much to

the hon Leader of the Opposition for the question.

The service provider in question has provided specialist research, advisory analyst and skills development services to the ICT resources of the Province. Their extensive set of services and resources, both local and international, are primarily accessed through the membership subscriptions for Western Cape Government's ICT professionals and no consulting work was or is sourced from the company in question.

The total cost of the subscription for the Department of the Premier and the Provincial Treasury for 2022/23 was R3,09 million and the estimate for the financial year is R5,72 million. The increase is due to the development and research needs of many additional officials. As it relates to the image of the Western Cape or the Western Cape Government admittedly it was disappointing to learn of the involvement of the company in question in the SARS case. However, we are confident that the company resources that were involved in the SARS case have never in any way been linked to the rendering of any Western Cape Government services.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. I recognise the hon Dugmore. Can I just get an indication if there are any follow-ups, hon Fry? Alright, hon Dugmore, please do your first follow-up.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, Speaker, and thank you as well to the Premier for the response. Premier, in developing my

follow-up question, I think we must be clear that we are here talking about Royal Security, the company.

An HON MEMBER: That is correct, yes.

The SPEAKER: Order, members. Hon Dugmore, please address me.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So the name provided to the Premier's office is Royal Security, previously owned by Mr Roy Moodley and the amount in question is not R3 plus R2 million, but R282 million, and the Premier, surprisingly, Speaker, did not mention the fact that rival bidders have actually taken this matter to court, accusing the Provincial Government, the DA Provincial Government of bid rigging and it is very clear that in the Court papers it is alleged that the test was failed because the Cape Town offices were essentially a shell and not able to... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, I just want to remind you that this is a follow-up question.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Ja. It is important that I give the context and also I want to ask the Premier... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: No-no. [Interjections.] Order, members! Hon members... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So I want to ask the Premier, I want to ask the Premier, was he aware that in terms of Royal Security that the officials of his Department then provided a waiver and went to the Durban office because the Cape Town office did not meet these particular criteria?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore. Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. I can confirm that the name given to our office was definitely not Royal. It was a different name.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Fry?

Mr T FRY (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Through you, I would like to ask the Premier what are the ways that this Government can institute or strengthen cheques and balances within its processes so as to ensure issues like this or matters like this do not arise in the future? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Fry. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. You know, obviously and you heard the hon Leader of the Opposition talking about and my office just confirmed that the number that was given, the name that was given was not Royal. It was a different company and that is obviously why the answer was as such, but of course the issue that the hon Dugmore is speaking about is also in the

public domain. I have been very vocal on this specific case.

In actual fact, today is one year since the Zondo Commission Report in which this company is one of the companies that do business with Government, that come out of that report and it is one year later and zero has happened and that is the real critical issue, is that when a company's name appears in a report, as I said in the last time in this House, there is no mechanism other than the blacklisting mechanism that National Treasury has in order to remove that company from the supplier database. That is the mechanism that one uses to exclude a company, and of course that is why I have engaged with our supply chain people in the Province. I have, as of this week, also further engagement with our supply chain people and understanding these issues and that is why I have again solicited the support or information from the National Prosecuting Authority on specifically all of these cases, because the same would apply to a bank. A number of our banks appeared in that same report. The same would apply to many businesses and does that mean that they all must be removed from the database; so this is the difficulty that we have, and without going into all of the detail of the company that was now mentioned secondary by the Leader of the Opposition, at the end of the day, legally this company does not have that person as its shareholder. That is the father of the person who is the shareholder. Does the system legally allow us within the rules and within the law, to say: "But your father is linked to whatever, in an untested court case and therefore we are ending a tender agreement," and these are the real difficulties that we face.

So, of course I have contacted the National Prosecuting Authority on all of

these cases to say what is happening, why are none of these cases being tested in court. The Minister of Justice, exactly the same question to the Minister of Justice. To the National Treasury, because they are the one instance that does have the tool, but the tool is not being used and then of course, I again have rewritten to the South African Police Service about these companies to say, please can you give me any detail of whether there has been any arrests or any detail that I can use in a process of supply chain to make sure that this Government does not do business with companies that are found guilty of corruption, or are involved in corruption or in gangsterism or in any other kind of crime, because we definitely do not want to be doing business with anybody involved in criminal activity.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. I recognise the hon Mvimbi and then hon Dugmore, you have the last opportunity.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Hon Premier, in view of the fact that you are vocally critical of the activities that happen at the state capture and this company was actively involved, I should also mention that as well. Are there any plans of you trying to recover the money that this company has made out of the Provincial Government, like it is the case at National Government because I believe the company was made to pay some of the money and then also is the Provincial Government going to recoup some of its money from this company? Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mvimbi. Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Thank you. Obviously, at the moment, we have a legal contract and hopefully – there is a court case at the moment and that will also be very good at giving us that... [Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): A High Court case?

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Hi listen!

The SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, you had an opportunity to pose your question. The Premier is now responding. Premier. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, and obviously if it is found to be guilty, then we would want to recoup every single cent, so the answer would be yes.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Premier. Hon Dugmore.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Speaker. Speaker, it is clear that on the one hand the Premier is talking about Bain. On the other hand, we are talking about Royal Security, but what I want to ask him because all these companies have been linked and identified to state capture. I want to ask the Premier when he was MEC for Economic Development, can he confirm that despite the fact that his own officials told him that this particular work could be done internally, that he, as the MEC for Economic Development,

instructed his HOD to appoint McKinsey, and further to that, I would like to ask the Premier if anyone in his office had a private meeting with a particular individual in McKinsey, who was also then directly appointed. McKinsey, of course, Speaker, being one of the companies fingered during the Zondo Commission. So I am asking you directly, did your officials tell you that they could do the work and did you overrule them and send your HOD into that meeting to tell them that... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order, members!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: That is what I want to know.

The SPEAKER: Order, members! Order, members! Hon Premier, before you respond, there were two follow-up questions. I just want to remind members you have an opportunity to ask one follow-up question as per the Rules, so Premier, I am not going to dictate how you answer that question, but please note that, members, there is one opportunity for one follow-up question. Hon Premier. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, and obviously, Speaker, as you said I can answer as I see fit, so first of all, the original name given by the Leader of the Opposition was a different company to any of the other companies that he has mentioned here today. It was Gartner.

Then of course, he has now mentioned Bain, McKinsey, Royal. I think the hon member is quite confused. He does not know exactly which question he wants to ask, but I stand by those answers. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

The PREMIER: I stand by those answers that I have given in this House, a few weeks ago and I stand by the answers that I have already given in the questions, and then the last question, it is absolutely no, because politicians in this Government do not get involved in supply chain.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Your office, I asked you to confirm.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon members. That brings us to the end of Question... [Interjections.] Order, members! That is the end of Question 1 that stood over. We now move over to New Questions, Question 1, as printed on the Question Paper. I recognise the hon Premier.

New questions:

1. Mr T M Klaas asked the Premier:

- (1) Whether the secession of Western Cape from the rest of South Africa is possible under the current constitutional scheme; if so, what are the relevant details;

- (2) whether the Provincial Government is in support of such a move; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, and thank you very much to the hon Klaas for the question. I answer to (1), the Constitution does not contemplate secession and number 2, the Western Cape Government does not support secession. Rather, the Executive Council of the Western Cape, under the leadership of myself, supports the decentralisation and devolution of certain critical functions and powers away from the National Government to more localised centres of power, such as provinces and municipalities, as contemplated in our Constitution.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier, I recognise hon Klaas, you have the first opportunity for a follow-up question, and then hon Fry.

Mr T KLAAS (EFF): If you indeed do not support cessation of the Western Cape from the rest of South Africa, Premier, what prompted your visit to the US under the pretence of the AGOA agreement... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr T KLAAS (EFF): ...between South Africa and the USA? I ask this question because the argument in the question is between two nation states... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Klaas... [Interjection.]

Mr T KLAAS (EFF): ...and not between a state and the province, as you would like to believe... [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): They are getting confused... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Klaas, you have posed your question. Members, when you do a follow-up question it is not for you to make a statement. You just pose the follow-up question to the response by the Minister or the Premier. So, hon Klaas, you have posed your follow-up question. Hon Premier, I now recognise you. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker, I would really urge the hon Klaas to go and read his Constitution and have a look at concurrent powers.

The SPEAKER: Hon Klaas, you can ask another follow-up question, but you have posed your question...

Mr T KLAAS (EFF): Can I ask...

The SPEAKER: No-no, not now, not yet, not yet. I first need to recognise... [Interjections.] Order, members! Order! [Interjections.] Hon Fry, I recognise you.

Ms A BANS (ANC): There is no answer, how do we follow up?

Mr T FRY (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker, through you to the Premier. How would the Western Cape Provincial Powers Bill be beneficial to devolving the devolution of powers to capable local and provincial governments? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. So, again, as I said to the hon Klaas and I thank him for asking this question. He needs to understand his Constitution which talks about concurrent powers. So obviously the concurrent power of trade and tourism, but the hon Fry, thank you very much for that question, because it links exactly to what the hon member Klaas was talking about and that is where in the Constitution of our country it says that the basis is that we should move decision-making, management and powers, closer to the people where the competency lies within Local Government and Provincial Government, and of course – and I want to thank the hon member Fry as being part of the new Bill, which says how do we enhance those constitutional powers even further and specifically where National Government absolutely fails the citizens of this country, and we know the National Government is failing us ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: ... in policing and keeping our citizens safe. We know that the National Government is failing us in enabling us to catch a [Interjections.] to catch a train ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ... to catch a train to work or ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: To catch a train to work or school or hospital. [Interjections.] We know that the National Government is failing us in our ports. We know that the National – and I could go on and on, because the National Government fails in so many areas, and that is why ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ... the Constitution is absolutely supported in a way that we actually need to enable, and that is why I think that the idea around this piece of legislation that the hon member Fry is talking about, is excellent because it really creates a legislative framework for provincial governments to enable them to serve their people where National Government fails.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon members, hon members, if you want to pose a question as a follow-up, there is one opportunity left. [Interjections.] Hon member Klaas? [Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.] You may pose your follow-up question. [Interjections.]

Mr M T KLAAS: So why are you creating a parallel unwarranted dialogue with the US, absent a mandate to do so from South Africa [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Klaas. Hon Premier, did you get that question?

The PREMIER: I got the question and I say again to the hon member Klaas, he comes from the premise that AGOA is a bilateral trade agreement between countries. It is not. He needs to go and understand that as well. It is an Act. It is an Act. It is not a bi-lateral agreement. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: Then he must go back to his Constitution. [Interjections.] He must go back to his Constitution which talks about concurrent powers, hon Speaker. The man is sitting in a legislative space [Interjections.] ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ... a representative in this Parliament ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, please take your seat. Hon member, is that a point of order? Hon member Kama?

Mr M KAMA: I just want to check with you really, hon Speaker, because now the Premier is just making reflections on hon member Klaas's understanding or not of the Constitution.

An HON MEMBER: He is not answering the questions.

Mr M KAMA: You know, and even going towards doubting why is he even here, but he does not understand the question, instead of answering the question that he is given. Is that really [Interjections.] – because is that really ...

The SPEAKER: Parliamentary?

Mr M KAMA: Parliamentary? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Kama. Hon member Kama, that is not a point of order. As the Presiding Officer I cannot dictate how a question is responded to and I do not adjudicate on that, and based on my listening there was no – the Premier did not refer to the integrity of the

member. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

Is that a ...[Interjections.]

Mr M T KLAAS: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: You may address me. Order, hon members, there is a member on the floor. [Interjections.]

Mr M T KLAAS: I [Inaudible.] talk about the integrity of the person or [Inaudible.] a right to talk about or to answer what he has been asked. I just wanted [Inaudible.] to comment. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Klaas. I have just ruled on exactly that point. I cannot dictate how a question is answered or the content of the response, and I have listened really carefully and I do not think that the Premier has referred or reflected on the integrity of you.

So, hon Premier, you may continue. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Thank you very much [Interjections.] ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Premier, please take your seat. Hon member Klaas, what is your point of order?

Mr M T KLAAS: Point of correction. [Interjections.] From you, please, hon Speaker, you said it did not refer the member to me, but he said why I am here in the Legislature, but I do not know nothing. [Interjections.] What ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you, hon member Klaas. Hon member Klaas, I have ruled. I did not say he did not refer to you. I said he did not reflect on your integrity. If you have an objection to my ruling, please follow the process. You cannot – it is unparliamentary and against the Rules to question my rulings in the House, but, hon Premier, in the interest of time, I am going to let you continue.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. So just reflecting back on the question. The question first of all stated that I was acting incorrectly in the place of where a state-to-state agreement exists, and so that is the first mistake that the hon member made, is that this is not a trade co-agreement between two states. This is an Act within the [Inaudible.] ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, please take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon member Klaas, is that a new point of order? Because you cannot raise a point of order on a point of order.

An HON MEMBER: No that Act does not ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! There is a member on the floor.

[Interjections.]

Mr M T KLAAS: The correction is that he said I said he is not correct. I did not say ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Klaas, that is not a point of order. That is – please take your seat. [Interjections.] The hon Premier is responding. If you have another follow-up question there is one opportunity left in this, but you cannot correct the response because you do not like it. That is not a point of order. Hon Premier, you may continue.

The PREMIER: So again that, the question from the hon member Klaas, I have every single power to interact with the United States and the committees in the United States on a piece of their legislation that benefits the businesses and the citizens in this province. I have absolutely the right to do it because I am empowered to do so through the Constitution which says we have a concurrent power on trade.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon member Klaas, do you have another follow-up question? [Interjections.]

Mr M T KLAAS: Yes, I have got a follow-up question. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon Premier and hon member Marran, there is a follow-up question. [Interjections.]

Mr M T KLAAS: My follow-up question is that ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon member Klaas, please speak to me. Hon members, there is a member on the floor.

Mr M T KLAAS: My question was that the Premier was there but has not been asked by South Africa. He goes there as if being asked, but he stands for South Africa. That is why the question rises from the US, to want to intervene in the Act. That is why we said he acted parallel. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier. [Interjections.] Hon Premier, please say it in the record.

The PREMIER: Thank you, hon Speaker, that was not a question.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon members, that brings us to the end of Question 1. I now recognise the Premier for Question 2.

1. Ms P Z Lekker to ask Mr A R Winde, Premier:

What measures has his Government put in place to prevent corruption at municipalities in the province?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much and thank you very much to the hon

Chief Whip of the Opposition for the question. The answer is as follows: It should be noted that it is the primary responsibility of the municipality itself to prevent corruption within its organisation. Again as per our Constitution we have three spheres of government.

Notwithstanding the above, in terms of and in accordance with the Provincial Government's functions and responsibilities relating to monitoring and support of Local Government, the following measures have been put in place to prevent corruption:

- The Minister responsible for Local Government assesses the appointment of senior managers to ensure due diligence and compliance with the applicable legal framework governing such appointments.
- The Provincial Government and Minister responsible for Local Government institute litigation to challenge unlawful appointments made in respect of senior managers.
- Allegations received within the mandate of the Provincial Government are assessed, after following due process, to determine if there is reason to believe that maladministration, fraud, corruption or any other serious malpractice has occurred or is occurring in a municipality in the province.
- Independent forensic investigators have been appointed in terms of

Section 106 of the Local Government Municipal Systems Act.

- Provincial Government officials engage with and assist, where requested, other organs of state with measures to prevent corruption.
- Provincial Government officials sit on the Local Government Anti-Corruption Forum Steering Committee and participate in the Forum itself.
- The Provincial Government assists Municipalities with the development of bylaw policies and standard operating procedures.
- Provincial Government strengthens internal control through monitoring and supporting municipalities with the effective functioning of risk management, internal audit functions and audit committees.
- As per Section 5(4) of the Municipal Finance Management Act, number 56 of 2003 (the MFMA), the Provincial Treasury has an oversight role over the financial affairs of municipalities and other institutions in the local sphere of Government and must promote the objectives as encapsulated in the MFMA.
- Provincial Treasury also monitors the implementation of adopted budgets and adjustment budgets on a monthly, quarterly and semi-annual basis through the In-Year-Monitoring, the IYM process, which serves as

an early warning mechanism to identify and correct undesirable performance.

- In terms of Section 5(3) of the MFMA (Act 56 of 2003), a Provincial Treasury may assist municipalities and municipal entities in building their capacity for efficient, effective and transparent financial management.
- The Supply Chain Management System is governed by Section 217 of the Constitution, which provides for the procurement of goods and services in the public service which should be conducted through a system of fair, equitable, transparent, competitive and cost-effective processes.
- In relation to the above, the Provincial Treasury is mandated to provide support and training to the municipalities in the Western Cape on the regulatory framework that governs Supply Chain Management.
- To bring to effect the above obligation it is required that Provincial Treasury Local Government Supply Chain mechanisms as endeavoured to build Supply Chain Management capacity at municipalities within the Western Cape Province.
- The Provincial Treasury mandate is embedded under four main quadrants which seeks to capacitate municipalities' Supply Chain Management

units and line functions in the areas of deficiencies:

- SCM Governance and Policy;
 - SCM Training and Capacity Building;
 - SCM Technology and System Management;
 - SCM Strategic Procurement and Sourcing Strategies
- Also continue reducing red tape and streamlining processes in Supply Chain Management, while maintaining a level of compliance and improving access to procurement opportunities, in other words good governance.
 - Then the continuous Supply Chain Management Training and Support Programme for municipalities and suppliers, focused on addressing gaps and continuous improvement within Supply Chain Management.
 - The Provincial Government monitors and supports municipalities with the implementation of the disciplinary regulations and the formation and establishment of disciplinary boards.

Then the answer that I have got also gives a full spreadsheet of the training programmes in each of the municipalities, the dates that those training programmes took place, the topics of the training programmes and the workshops, for example, it could have been financial misconduct, or it could have been [Inaudible.] how to maintain public accountability to ensure

effective and efficient service delivery towards communities, and so it goes on, a few pages of it, and of course the hon member will receive that spreadsheet as well.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. I recognise the hon Lekker. Hon member Lekker or hon member Fry.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. I think the first step that the Premier must take to prevent corruption in municipalities, is to recognise that the DA is corrupt. [Interjections.] If the Premier wants to prevent corruption in our municipalities, he must admit that the DA is corrupt to its core and that it just has the ability to cover up its corruption better, and my follow-up question therefore ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

†Die HOOFSWEEP (ANC): Julle moet luister man. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You must listen, man. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, speak to me.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): My follow-up question is given that the Premier meets weekly with the Mayor ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... of the City of Cape Town, what has his discussion with the Mayor been in regards to the DA corruption in the City of Cape Town?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Lekker. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Would the hon member please supply me with this so-called DA corruption, so then I can answer to it.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon member Fry.

Mr C FRY: Thank you, hon Speaker. Given what we have seen in Local Government in Kannaland, Beaufort West and Laingsburg, I would like to ask the Premier, given his comprehensive answer to the question, when will these initiatives be implemented and how will they be done so? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you. These are already in place. They are part of the programme in which we work with Local Government as a separate sphere of Government, but we do have a constitutional mandate in oversight and in support.

I also want to say that there are definite areas of improvement and part of the

last PCC meeting with the President and the other Premiers, it was a lengthy discussion on the failures at Local Government level and the interesting thing is listening to the hon member Lekker, and then the municipalities as mentioned by hon member Fry, that those municipalities who are always errant in the audit outcomes, Section 106 applications for support because they cannot manage their municipalities properly, always seem to be the ANC-run coalition municipalities in this province, but we have said that there is an issue around Section 106 ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ... and it is supported by the ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The PREMIER: ... National Minister of Local Government, as well as it was, it got a good support from other Premiers to say that we really have to have a relook at provinces' ability to actually intervene, because we all know in South Africa that Section 106 really needs a rethink and a redesign. We have not really managed to use it sufficiently well in our country to address some of the major failures, and of course Local Government is critical because it is the government that is the closest to the people, it is where direct services are given to our citizens, whether it be water, whether it be electricity, whether it be refuse removal, those direct services are Local Government services, and of course we need to make sure that we improve wherever

possible.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon member Mvimbi and then hon member Lekker, and that will bring us to the end of the follow-up questions for this particular question.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. In view of corruption in Local Government I just want to find out from the Premier as he is aware of the activity that took place in the George Municipality, involving the son of a councillor in George in the name Stag Cronje, Mr Cronje's son, are you not regarding that as corruption? And I will also like to find out whether the corruption that is taking place in the Hessequa Municipality, are you also not regarding that as corruption? Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I just want to remind you again, you have an opportunity to ask one follow-up question.

Mr L L MVIMBI: One sentence, it was one sentence. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: It is two questions. One follow-up question as per the Rules. [Interjections.] Hon Premier, again, like the previous time, I am not going to dictate how you respond to that question, but I just want to, for the record, note that there were two follow-up questions.

The PREMIER: Thank you. Yes, you can answer probably, you can probably

ask 40 questions in one sentence, but both of those questions actually need the same answer and of course issues are raised every single day and I want to caution the hon member to, when he makes these statements, of course all of these are alleged corruption and they need to be investigated, absolutely, and that is why you will see we have forensic units in place and of course over and above forensic units we also have a criminal justice system, and I trust that the hon member, because we know the Combatting of ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! The hon Premier is responding.
[Interjections.]

The PREMIER: We all know that the Combatting of Corrupt Activities Act actually puts the onus on any individual within South Africa being aware of corrupt activities, and is actually asked to lay charges at the police and not doing so actually makes themselves liable, and so again I think that the hon member needs to make sure that that happens because I have heard it being said in this House and you need to make sure that these, any of these allegations are investigated.

Our country is plagued by too much corruption. If all the money that got stolen in our country through corruption was actually put into service delivery, we would be in a very different position right now.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon member Lekker.

[Interjections.] Hon member Kama, you cannot ask a question to the hon Premier across the floor, the last opportunity is the hon member Lekker. Order, hon members. Hon member Lekker, please take your seat.

I am not going to continue until, hon member Kama, you finished dialoguing across the floor. Can you [Interjections.] – order, hon members. Hon member Lekker, you may continue.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. It is common knowledge that law enforcement officers gathered in the office of councillor Malusi Booi in the City of Cape Town. Will the Premier tell this House what has his Government done particularly in the allegations that were levelled against that DA councillor? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Lekker. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Again obviously from a constitutional point of view, we [Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: Hon members! [Interjections.] Hon Premier, please take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon members, we have guests in the gallery. I have been asking you the entire Sitting to not drown out the speakers. I do not know what is happening today.

An HON MEMBER: Congress.

The SPEAKER: But can we, can I please ask that you respect the speaker on the floor, but more so that there are citizens watching us, there are guests in the gallery. [Interjections.] I trust that this is the last request for your indulgence. Hon Premier, you may continue. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. You know, obviously for a forensic investigation to take place someone needs to lay charge. I cannot just say our Province is going to investigate every single time anybody arrives in any office in this province. [Interjections.] It does not work like that and I am sure the hon member knows that. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. [Interjections.] Hon Premier – hon Chief Whip and hon Premier, you had an opportunity with this question. I now move on. Just for the record again, Question 3 is standing over.

[Question 3 standing over, as agreed to by the House.]

I recognize the Hon Minister, Minister Allen. Hon Minister Allen.

4. Ms A P Bans to ask Mr R I Allen, Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety:

In respect of the high number of known drug houses in the province:

(a) Of the 1 819 known drug houses in the province, how many are municipal-owned properties and (b) what role do his Department and the Provincial Government play to ensure that state-owned houses are not used for drug trade?

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
Thank you so much, hon Speaker. I wish to appreciate this question from hon member Bans. I wish to state for the record that this particular question should be directed to the various municipalities. Custodianship of any state-owned houses will either rest with the Department of Infrastructure or the relevant municipality within our province. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon member Bans.

Ms A BANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I think I have written the same question, in fact not the same, a similar question almost a month ago to the MEC and I have so much interest in – it is not the same question. I have interest in the question, hon Speaker, because it is actually said that my response from the question that I was asking as to how many drug dens are in state-owned properties, and then you get an answer that says go and ask the municipality.

Then it means that really it is a mandate from the DA. However, hon Speaker, what I want to know now, what is the plan together, the municipality and the Government [Inaudible.] of the Department working

together, what is their plan to addressing these state-owned houses that are occupied by drug dens of the state, what plans are put in place? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Bans. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much, hon Speaker. Let me state categorically, drug houses, whether it is a state-owned house or private property, are unacceptable. We, as a Standing Committee, hon Speaker, with hon member Kama, together with hon member Bans, on that particular Committee, since the year 2020 were very clear that as a Standing Committee we highlighted the amount of known drug houses, knowing it is a scourge leading to so many communities being extremely vulnerable.

So let me state for the record, hon Speaker, again, whether it is a state-owned house or private property, it is unacceptable. We are working closely with the South African Police Service and knowing exactly where those houses are, is actually empowering us because since the Western Cape Police Ombudsman launched his investigation into why SAPS is not shutting down those drug houses, hon member Bans will also remember that that particular investigation was actually substantiated, which confirmed that there was severe lacking in terms of why it was not shut down.

So we are working with all law enforcement agencies. The plan in place is

joint operations. There are also Section 252 operations that are being conducted. That is also part of the recommendations made by the Police Ombudsman and I would also, based on this particular question, encourage the members of the Standing Committee to also invite various municipalities, invite various entities, should they have any specific questions in this regard. Thank you.

†Die SPEAKER: Dankie, agb Minister. [Thank you, hon Minister.] Just for the record, I have got hon member Christians, hon member Kama and hon member Bosman. Hon member Christians.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Minister, for the reply. Just a question, hon Minister. You know that drugs tear families and communities apart. You were quoted in the media by saying that the community is the eyes for the police, the communities are out there, they know the known drug houses.

What is your Department doing in order to make sure that communities are protected when they come to the fore and report these drug houses? Thank you, hon Minister.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much for that particular question. I think it is very vital,

colleagues, that if we track back to the year 2020, the initial reply that I have received when I was the Chairperson, indicated 252 known drug houses were in our province, 252. [Interjections.]

Via the Standing Committee I then queried that particular number because I knew that number was not correct. The second number we received as a Standing Committee, was 1 557 known drug houses.

In the last year we have closed down 458 known drug houses, but as things stand today, the number, which fluctuates each and every quarter, it is now 1 819 known drug houses, and the reason why I say when we are empowered to know where these drug houses are, we are able to then be targeted in our approach to make sure it is being shut down and linking my comment now to the question, it is very clear that community members, CPFs, various stakeholders are supplying the information.

The Ombudsman's office is still getting information with regards to known drug houses. That goes via the Ombudsman's office to the South African Police Service. It is then verified and colleagues in this House will know that in terms of the Criminal Procedure Act, Section 252, which allows for sting operations, which ultimately verifies whether a house is a known drug house or not, and that operations are ongoing, it is anonymous and we will never disclose whenever a member of the community, whenever a school principal or any person provides us with information on the whereabouts of a known drug house, that will always be confidential because we understand

that in this environment we are dealing with organised crime, we are dealing with gangsters and we are dealing with criminals that should ultimately be behind bars, and by shutting down these drug houses we will slowly but surely dismantle organised crime to ensure that our communities actually live in safer communities.

I also want to thank the hon members of this House that if they have any information and if they have any input with regard to the interventions to tackle the scourge, it will be highly welcomed so that we can take it further under consideration. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon member Kama. [Interjections.] Hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. [Interjections.] Hon Speaker, I want to and I think we agree with the MEC, that whether it is private or state-owned property, the mere fact that it is a drug, it is a house that is identified to be having drug activities, but the question is surely if state-owned, what is the Minister doing to work with other municipalities, which is your Local Government? We are giving a billion here to the City of Cape Town, so we cannot be told that we must go to other municipalities. [Interjections.]

So what are you doing to work with other municipalities to ensure that there is no drug activity happening in state-owned properties? Because SAPS

would have identified that part of the challenges that we identify a house and some of these houses are state-owned and we need Government to help us.

So what are you doing as Government to work with other spheres of Government to ensure that you close these drug houses ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member ...[Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: ... which happen in state-owned properties?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
Thank you so much. This allows me to answer very broadly and I do appreciate this particular question from hon member Kama. Hon Speaker, crime and the illicit selling of drugs in our communities are extremely complex matters.

What we have done is to work across our entire Western Cape Government knowing that we are working with the Department of Social Development to ensure that the demand for drugs is attended to. We are working closely with

the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport, knowing that our young people need to ensure that they have cultural activities, sporting activities, so that they do not enter a life of gangsterism and crime. We are working extremely closely with municipalities and it is very tricky.

One particular incident that has left me deeply upset was the fact that there was a gentleman and this particular gentleman in a Council-owned property was selling Mandrax in this particular area. However, there was a grandmother, there was another daughter and there was a 7-year old also living in the same property. We then made sure that sting operations were happening so that that particular perpetrator can be behind bars.

It is deeply complex when we consider in many of those known drug houses there would be family members that are also in that property and to obtain an eviction order is very difficult, but my mission is very clear. I want to ensure that there are no drug houses.

When you have lost a family member as a result of drug abuse, when the school I attended in Mitchells Plain, directly opposite that school they sold drugs to three generations; to the grandfather, to the father and the son and the grandson. I have seen that personally. So that drug house is no longer in operation.

So we want to ensure that we work with all the stakeholders to ensure that SAPS can do the 252s, so that we can build a credible case and that the high

fliers, hon Speaker, those that are controlling the drug trade, that they are caught and land up behind bars.

So we are working with municipalities, we are working with stakeholders and especially it is this Parliament that has placed this particular matter front and centre, and I will continue to do everything in my power, hon Speaker, to ensure that these drug houses are shut and that it actually remains shut.

The reality is that when the criminal justice system, to a large extent, appears to be broken, when a drug house is considered to be shut because the person that was selling drugs is no longer there, and he comes out of jail two weeks or three weeks later and opens up again, it does not bode well for community confidence and for trusting the South African Police Service.

So we are working, whether it is state-owned, or private property. Also, hon Speaker, I think it is very clear that the modus operandi in terms of the selling of drugs has changed, whereas it is happening across our nightclubs, it is happening across open spaces, which is not necessarily just linked to a particular dwelling, but it is a matter where we need this Parliament, for everyone to pull in the same direction so that we can ultimately ensure that these perpetrators, those that are crippling our communities, are behind bars. As a Western Cape Government under the leadership of the hon Premier, we have received clear instructions that we need to ensure that the whole of Government approach in terms of the Safety Plan, lands in our hotspot areas where drugs are prevalent, so that we can eradicate this scourge from our

communities. Thank you so much. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Hon Minister. Hon member Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Through you, hon Speaker, I think it is important to note that the former President of the country and the former President of the ANC is on record as being in cahoots with gangsters in the Western Cape, and I think we also have to think of the impact of that. I am reminded of an incident in 2001 when an ANC member, her house was raided because of drugs that were found on her property, but ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Bosman, can I just remind you that you must ask a follow-up question. [Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you for the reminder, hon Speaker. I was hoping that the hon member Sayed would do it.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] know nothing, look at your side!

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Speaker, my question to the hon Minister would be since the Minister's Department is doing so much to identify and to target drug houses, what role has the South African Police Service, which is the

custodian of crime fighting in our province, what role have they placed to eradicate the more than 1 800 drug houses in the Western Cape?

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Hon members!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
Thank you so much, hon member Bosman.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon members ... hon Minister, you may now continue.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
Thank you so much, hon member Bosman, for that particular question. When we live in a province where there is potentially, hon Speaker, a SAPS establishment that is 20 years in terms of the resourcing, it does make it extremely difficult for the South African Police Service to eradicate drug houses and those high fliers in our community, but in terms of our oversight we are working closely with the South African Police Service, and to quote hon member Bans, that we are continuing to see sterling success in terms of the South African Police Service, which contributes to lower murders that we have seen. But we will continue in our fight, hon member Bosman, through you, hon Speaker, to hon member Bosman, we will continue in our fight to ensure that we work with all our law enforcement agencies, and that includes

the South African Police Service and with all our departments here in the Western Cape to ensure that the scourge of drugs is eradicated from our communities, and I trust that the Standing Committee will continue in their fight to ensure that the South African Police Service, Metro Police and various other municipalities are invited to have these discussions and plans in place. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, that concludes Question 4. We will now move on to Question 5. I recognise the hon Minister, Minister Mackenzie.

5. Mr C F Christians to ask Mr R D Mackenzie, Minister of Mobility:

What progress has been made to relocate the railway shack dwellers who are illegally occupying the Central Line between the Philippi and Langa railway stations?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Speaker. Thank you, hon member Christians, for the questions. Hon members, we are all well-aware that commuter rail services on the PRASA/Metro Central Line have not been operational since October 2019 as a result of vandalism, theft and land invasion. Over 5 000 households have settled on the rail network, including at a number of rail stations.

My Department has informed me that in June 2021, the Department of Transport sought and received approval from the National Treasury to

appoint the Housing Development Agency to manage the relocation of the illegal occupiers.

One of the conditions of this approval was that identified Government structures and agencies had to be signed, and they signed an Implementation Protocol to facilitate the resettlement of the occupiers. This was done and involved the National and Provincial Department as well as the City of Cape Town and the HDA.

Subsequently, after discussion with the various communities involved, the then Minister of Transport tabled a social compact for adoption by the signatories to the IP.

The Central Line Relocation Programme has also been declared a Presidential Project.

The decision-making and management institutional arrangements consist of a Project Steering Committee and the Implementation Protocol Project Steering Committee. Under the management there are five workstreams, which are as follows:

- Land and Planning
- Implementation
- Funding
- Stakeholder engagement

- Communication.

On 27 July 2021 PRASA brought a Court order application to evict the illegal occupants from its rail reserve. The resultant Court order indicated that the process of eviction and relocation to sites in Eerste River had to be completed by 26 November 2021. The relocation of these sites could not be effected as a result of a threat of court action.

As a result of various delays PRASA has approached the High Court three further times for an extension, the latest which has a cut-off date of 30 November 2023, this year. In line with the Prevention of Illegal Eviction From and Unlawful Occupation of Land Act, the Court order requires that suitable alternative land with the necessary basic services be secured before any relocation can take place.

The relocation process will require in excess of 50 hectares of land. As a result the envisaged programme has been divided into three stages. Some success has been achieved with Stage 1, which has a focus on the Langa Station and line. This is referred to as "Operation Bhekela".

A full rezoning application for further identified land is being submitted. In addition, while limited funds are available, a decision has been made to approach the National Cabinet for funding for the remainder of the costs.

There have been no meetings of the two Committee structures mentioned

above since March of this year, although meetings have been scheduled and subsequently cancelled. Thank you.

[The Temporary Chairperson takes the Chair.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Hon Minister. I now recognise hon member Christians.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Chairperson. Hon Minister, thank you for that response. Just a question, with your interaction with the National Minister. According to the National Minister the line will be opened in December, is that still on track because with your problem with the illegal informal settlements in the area – Philippi, Khayelitsha and also Nyanga? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon member Christians. I hope and I pray that the line can be opened by December, but I have to say it is not possible. With the greatest of intention of the new Minister, which I hold in high regard, it is not technically possible for the line to be opened by December.

One of the sad incidences that happened a few weeks ago, and we all are aware of it, is the killing of Loyiso Nkohlhla, who was an activist, and he worked with the community in trying to facilitate the relocation of people to a more suitable space of land. Unfortunately he was murdered and that is

also a setback for the commuters of the Central Line who wish to get back onto the train.

So despite what the National Minister has announced, I can say with confidence it is not going to happen by December and despite the fact that we want it. Everybody wants the Central Line to be back by 1 December, even sooner, but it is not technically possible. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise hon member America on the virtual platform.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, through you. Hon Minister, considering that safety is a major reason for relocating shack dwellers along the Central Line, are you aware of any action taken by the National Government to hold someone accountable for the incident on the Southern Line where passengers' safety was compromised when they had to jump off the train and walk along the railway tracks to the destination? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member America. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hon Speaker, I am honestly not aware.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon member Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and thank you very much to hon member Christians for the question, and then also thank you, hon Minister, for the very comprehensive response you have given and I can promise you I will not ask you any question about Putin today, because I want you to ...[intervenes]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mvimbi, please address me and please pose your question.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Speaker, that I know that there have been quite a lot of efforts that have been made by the National Government together with HTA and Department of Transport, to relocate these people and then also there have not been that much cooperation from the Provincial Government as well as the City of Cape Town.

I just want to understand from the MEC with regard to the ongoing engagement between his Department, the National Government and other stakeholders, what are the details of land parcels under consideration to relocate the people? Is the land near Mitchells Plain still under discussion and how is the Department assisting? It is not Putin.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Mvimbi. Hon Minister, again there was more than one follow-up. I am not going to dictate how you respond to that.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Speaker. If I can just – first of all the hon member said there has not been cooperation to an extent, and I think that is not fair to say that because it is simply not true. There has been [Inaudible.] cooperation from our side definitely, from the City of Cape Town, in trying to find a solution to this problem.

It is not normal that the biggest line in the City of Cape Town is standing still for three years, and there is not one person in this province who would legitimately try to stop or stall this process because it is not in our interest. It is not in our economy's interest that people struggle to get to work. It is not in our economy's interest that people have to pay three times more as they should. It is not in any of our interest for the Central Line to be stalled. So there has been extensive cooperation from our side, I can guarantee the hon colleague that.

The delay, and I think I have mentioned it before in this Parliament, and I want to put context to it. When the R111 million was transferred on 31 March, I said at the time – in fact when I replied to a question – there should be criminal charges laid against Minister Kubayi for transferring money on 31 March without any feedback, and why she transferred the money.

As I expected, yesterday I asked my City of Cape Town finance colleague, "Where is that money?" R50 million of that money, hon members, on 19 June, R50 million was sitting in a bank account. In a country with 42%

unemployment, in a country where we have loadshedding. I warned – you can go back to the minutes of this meeting ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... you can listen to the minutes when I warned about this, because I ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... suspected it was going to happen. [Interjections.] You cannot ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ... touch money that you transfer in the middle of nowhere. No one, not even the President can tell the Mayor of Cape Town or us, "Touch that money." Because I knew it was coming. That is why I said you can go back to the minutes of my reply. I said criminal charges must be laid because I knew it was going to happen. So R50 million of that money was sitting there. The City of Cape Town cannot touch it, National Government cannot touch it, because it is sitting somewhere in the middle of nowhere.

My colleague, Geordin Hill-Lewis, as I suspected he will do and I was hoping

he was going to do it, has taken R61 million of that money, written to National Treasury and told them, "If you do not reply to us by 21 June, we will use that money for health services in Khayelitsha." I have just asked them if they replied here, they have not received a response. It is not normal some of the things our colleagues at National Parliament are doing.

42% unemployment, people do not have toilets in some areas of this country. You just transferred money in the middle of nowhere expecting it to go somewhere. It is unacceptable and I hope my colleagues will this weekend, I know normally at conferences national colleagues come and visit, will whisper in their ears, "Please do not transfer money in the middle of the desert because no one can touch it."

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. Hon members, we have come to the end of Questions for Oral Reply. So, hon member Mvimbi, the time has expired for oral questions.

Hon member Mvimbi, is that a point of order?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Speaker, I ask about the land, not the money. I know about the money. [Interjections.] I ask about the land.

The SPEAKER: Hon ...[Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: I know about the money. I said the land ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mvimbi ...[Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... in Mitchells Plain ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mvimbi, that is not a point of order. You have posed your questions, how the Minister chooses to respond is up to the Minister. I am now going to move on. We have come to the end of Questions for Oral Reply. [Interjections.] We have now come – order, hon members!

We have now come to the end of Questions for Oral Reply. We now move on to Questions to the Premier without Notice in terms of Rule 204. I just want to remind hon members that two follow-ups are allowed, two questions to the Premier without notice, but it must be posed by the hon member who initially poses the question.

I recognise the hon, hon member Bans.

QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE

Ms A BANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, my question to the Premier would be if LEAP officers are allowed to arrest people? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Bans. Hon Premier.
[Interjections.] Order, hon members!

The PREMIER: Yes. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon member Bans.
[Interjections.] Order!

Ms R WINDVOGEL: JP is the Minister of ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon members Marran and Windvogel, there is a member next to you on the floor. Hon member Bans.

Ms A BANS: Hon Speaker, my first one before I accept that one of saying yes, because the last time I checked we were not aware of that and the Premier must also inform the House when there are Rules like that, I am on that Standing Committee.

We are having gangsters flying around here. Given that the Premier is so passionate about arresting President Putin, can he tell us how many flying gangsters have LEAP officers arrested in the last five years in the Western

Cape? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Bans. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: So I think what the hon member Bans is asking is a very serious question and one would hope that the hon member would actually ask that question so we could have the actual number details, because I would have to look to the hon member of the LEAP – the number of LEAP arrests. I mean I have seen it, I could probably quickly search for it on my laptop – 17 000 arrests that LEAP officers have made. We would have to then go and interrogate how many of those LEAP officers had arrested gangsters in that process, but they have had many thousands of arrests, and of course ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ... the question that the original, or the original question that was asked. There are two pieces of legislation that enable LEAP officers to do what they do and obviously the hon member knows, because she has been here for quite a while, that when a LEAP officer does arrest someone of course they can, they have then got to enter those people into the criminal justice system, and so that is when a peace officer or peace officer status, which is what LEAP officers are, they take that individual to the local police station and they then get processed. Of course a traffic official can also arrest anybody because they have exactly the same piece of legislation that

enables them, but of course the hon member Bans also knows that even as a citizen, as a citizen of South Africa within our Constitution, you can actually arrest someone, but a peace officer has ...[intervenes]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: And a peace officer within the regulatory environment in which they operate, there are a whole range of serious ...[intervenes]

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, please take your seat. Hon member Kama, I have now warned the members on both the left and on my right since we have started the Sitting. This is unacceptable behaviour. There is a complete dialogue happening across the floor while the Premier is responding.

If you do not want to ask a follow-up question to the Premier, then ...[intervenes]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Can you – I am on the floor. Hon members, this is the last time I am going to warn you. Hon Premier, my apologies for interrupting you.

The PREMIER: Thank you, but that interruption was very handy because I need to correct my 17 000. It is actually 15 000 arrests have been effected by

our LEAP officers since the coming into the action or putting in place the LEAP officers as part of the Safety Plan, and of course they operate within a regulatory environment and that gives them their powers to arrest.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon member Bans.

[Interjections.]

Ms A BANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Bans, in order to protect you, can you please take your seat. Hon member Marran and hon member Windvogel, please allow the member on the floor to pose a follow-up question. You are interrupting, you are drowning out the speaker. Hon member Bans, you may continue.

Ms A BANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I have been worried and I have been thinking how President Putin would have been arrested, but today I got some clarity as to how the process would have been. I think the public also can hear it, but in a nutshell, hon Speaker, my last question would be I get statistics here that I would not even get from the MEC. Where is the Premier getting his stats from? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Bans. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: There were a number of questions in that follow-up question and I will start with the arrest of Vladimir Putin, and I am going to say to the hon member that I think she should go and have a look at the regulations and the regulatory powers, the regulatory powers of peace officers and she will see in there that it will even say international people are able to be arrested by LEAP offices. Foreign people from other countries, they are even empowered to arrest people in that process, but of course I think the hon member also knows that if someone of the ilk of a president of another country was to be arrested, especially based on the Court ruling of the International Criminal Court, and I have already said it in this House a few times, obviously the hon member was not listening to that reply, that no matter what happens we would have to still go to our local Court to get the warrant of arrest because it is a planned arrest. [Interjections.]

A LEAP officer would arrest an international person if they saw them in front of them doing something wrong. If it was someone who was wanted in another country, for example Putin, and I have already said in this House, we will go to our Courts and we will find that empowering Court order so that we can hand it and we would hand it to the LEAP officer, we would also hand that warrant of arrest to the South African Police to execute that arrest, and that is why the President of our country is in such a dilemma at the moment, because he is obliged within South Africa to arrest Putin should he come to this country.

That is why he is in this panic to try and get China to host the next BRICS

conference. He is trying to persuade President Putin to please log on online and not come to South Africa.

So that being the first part of her question.

An HON MEMBER: He is coming.

The PREMIER: I also want to say that the statistics that the hon member speaks about are released regularly by the hon Minister in this Province, Minister Allen. [Interjections.] He releases those statistics regularly and of course the bulk of those statistics were released at the end of the last quarter results, which were three weeks ago and again it was really encouraging to see the Safety Plan and the statistics released on all of those data, whether it is arrests, whether it is firearms. You know that the LEAP officers are now taking more firearms off the street, illegal firearms off the street than SAPS are.

We have got 1 200 LEAP officers taking more firearms off the street than the 20 000 SAPS officers in our province. Why? Because there is a focus in specific areas to reduce the murder rate and in South Africa those statistics – I spoke about the thousands of arrests, but the most important statistic for me was the 14% reduction in murder again in this province, where the focus is of the Safety Plan and LEAP officers in the murder hotspots of this province, and it shows you that that is where murder is coming down because in the rest of the country it is not coming down, it is going up.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. That brings us to the end of the first oral question. I now recognise the hon member Pretorius.

Mr G PRETORIUS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Premier, over the past two weeks heavy rain and stormy conditions resulted in flooding, the destruction of property and some towns being cut off across the province.

What, hon Premier, disaster management interventions has the Western Cape Government implemented to assist communities?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Pretorius. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you, thank you very much, hon member, for that question, and I think I would like to start off by saying that of course the floods have been devastating. It is the worst that we have felt in this region for 40 years and I would like to start off by sending condolences to the families of the two individuals who have lost their lives in this flood. I think that is the first thing this House should do, but secondly, over and above that, past the condolences, I want to say that we have a huge debt of gratitude to the very disaster management team that the hon member speaks about.

I think they have really shown – every time we have a disaster our disaster management teams, both in the province, but also across all of our municipalities, step in immediately and we need to say thank you to them, but

they are the coordinators. When Minister Bredell and I were at the Disaster Centre earlier this week, 45 organisations have been involved and coordinated through this disaster, and of course I think of a number of them. I mean we must think of the volunteers that are out there, whether they are the volunteers at Gift of the Givers, unbelievable work that they are doing; whether they are the firefighters that make themselves available, while not a fire, a flood, but they are there helping citizens in need. Whether it is NSRI as a volunteer organisation. Those soup kitchens and those citizens that are out there making the biggest difference that they can, and it really is shown when we are able to really save lives.

I think it could have been so much worse, but at the same time, you know, we must thank from the Air Force to SAPS to every single organization that come together, those 45 that get pulled in, and then of course I must think of our departments. From the Health Department and what they do, from Social Development and what they do. I think about the traffic officials that are out there.

I think about the teams that are obviously from the hon Minister Bredell's Department at Disaster Management, the big difference that they have made in this panic.

And then, I want to say: Infrastructure. I get a report every single day as to the roads that are closed, the roads that are open, the effects of the flood and the 11 o'clock report today was that there are still ...[Audio distorted.] There

are 38 roads actually, in our province right now that are still closed. We had the opening this morning of the Bains Kloof Pass. There are 16 of those blocked passes that have now been opened. Seven are partially opened and working day and night.

When we were having the presentation, one of the ladies that work for the Department of Infrastructure, pregnant with twins, in the middle of the night in the pass going through to Worcester, there she is in the rain in the middle of the night, making sure that things are coordinated, and the Yellow Fleet is opening up so we can get movement of people, get movement of goods, emergency vehicles, etcetera.

So, I must say that ja, I think the disaster teams need recognition, but it actually is across the board in South Africa, I mean, in the Western Cape that there really has been unbelievable support to mitigate risk in this huge flood that we have just had.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon Pretorius, your first follow-up.

Mr G PRETORIUS (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. I will ask one question at a time. Hon Premier, how important is proactive disaster management preparedness and were the Province's Disaster Management interventions adequately prepared for the floods? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Pretorius. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you, hon member. If I did not know better, I would have said that the hon Minister Bredell planted that question with you because he has for many years, has many, many years while being in this Government, advocated for more and more budget, more and more preparedness, more and more sharing of best practice around the world with our teams. More and more making our teams available to go to disasters around the world and in other provinces, to enable us to be able to respond because every disaster is different. Every disaster has its own unique risks and challenges, and I think the evidence is clear that the years and years of investment, the years and years of budgeting, the years and years of improving to make sure we can respond is definitely paying off.

I saw at the Disaster Centre now, the modelling that we use on how much rainfall happens. Whether a dam breaks or not, they can quickly model as to how far the water spread will be. That is where they go to homes to say you need to evacuate. And the problem is, people say, but why must we evacuate? There is no rain or there is no water. And that modelling says in two hours the water is going to hit you. And unfortunately, one of our deaths that happened was someone who said, 'I refuse to leave my home' and unfortunately the next day, the person was found drowned.

But it is unbelievable that that investment is actually giving us the wherewithal to be worldclass when it comes to responding to disasters. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon Pretorius.

Mr G PRETORIUS (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Premier, over and above the NGOs and their contribution they made that you referred to, has there been any assistance from the National Government and other provincial governments during this time, to the Western Cape? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. I am not. Well, I know from National Government, let me start there. I know that Minister Godongwana, the Minister of Finance has already made contact with hon Minister Wenger to say, you know, please let us know and keep us up to date because obviously, this is a disaster and there are processes that need to follow when a disaster is declared, but we have still got to get there. So, that is the first contact from National Government.

Of course, we are still repairing those roads, we are still opening those roads, we are still making sure that lives are saved and people are looked after in their halls and in the spaces that have been provided for them. So, the real assessment is only starting to happen now. Also, the waters must subside before you can get the real assessment of the damage. But that first question on disaster: I am pretty certain that when all the data comes in it will be declared a disaster, but that process must still be followed. So, that is the

first contact.

The second is also the National Disaster Team. I mean, the National Disaster Team were actually in the JOC or in the Disaster Management Centre when I was there earlier this week and they have also been involved. I am not too sure from a provincial point of view. We would have to find that detail. I see hon Minister Bredell says 'no'. So definitely, yes, with National on a number of fronts, not necessarily at a provincial level.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. I now recognise the hon Sayed for your question.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I just wanted to know from the hon Premier as to when is he going to get his LEAP officers to arrest the CEO of Steinhoff, Markus Jooste. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Premier. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: If we need to get a warrant of arrest, I will be happy to do so and then, enable them to do that arrest.

The SPEAKER: Your first follow-up, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Is the hon Premier not aware that a German court has actually issued a warrant of arrest for Mr Jooste? Thank

you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. I did read that. I will actually have a look and see if it is possible. I also wonder whether nationally, the ANC is going to ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No!

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ...operate in exactly the same way that the hon Sayed is saying. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Sayed, your final opportunity.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): So, the hon Premier wants to arrest Vladimir Putin now through the LEAP officers. But will the hon Premier admit then that his Provincial Government has double standards, is not interested in dealing with corruption of the funds of those who are poor and those who are downtrodden, of the workers, but he wants to go and arrest globally ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Will he admit? Can he give us a 'yes' or a 'no'?

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: I heard a little comment from behind me, something about ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: It is normally 'leaders are readers', but it has something to do with listening: listening is a real skill. And obviously, the hon Sayed worked his questions out on his phone, but he did not realise that he must change the last question had there been a different answer on the previous question. And so, if he would have listened, he would have heard that I already said 'yes, I would' and in actual fact, I will go and have a look again.

I also at the same time say that I do sincerely hope that at his Government level, that exactly the same thing does happen because of course, the criminal justice system, the policing where powers actually sit as well, also rest at that level. And I presume he will be doing the same. Perhaps we should say this is a competition to see who gets it done first, either the hon Sayed or myself. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

An HON MEMBER: Hmm.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon members, that brings us to the end of the time allocated for Questions to the Premier without Notice. We move on to Statements by Members in terms of Rule 145 and there will now be an opportunity for members to deliver their Member Statements. I recognise the DA. I recognise the DA, hon Deputy Chief Whip.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, yesterday the City of Cape Town signed an agreement with the French Development Agency which guarantees an astounding €100-million in development financing. This money will be used to improve and expand vital

infrastructure in the City, including water and sanitation, as well as urban mobility. Crucially, hon Speaker, a portion of these funds will also be used to improve and expand the City's energy infrastructure, helping us to achieve our goal of ending loadshedding in the City within just a few short years.

But more than this, hon Speaker, we must consider what this investment implies. This money represents international recognition and acknowledgement of a fact that all of us in the Western Cape have known for a very long time: DA-governance works! France's Development Bank knows that its funding will be effectively spent for the maximum benefit of our people. The funding will not be stolen; it will not be wasted. It will put to use to build infrastructure and move this City and the Province forward. We congratulate Mayor Hill-Lewis and the City of Cape Town for securing this funding and we look forward to seeing these wonderful improvements as we build.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Baartman. I recognise the ANC.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks, hon Speaker. The Stormers will never represent South Africa in a World Cup. [Laughter.] We find ourselves with the Western Cape Government not happy to be a Provincial Government. Also, AGOA is an Act which provides eligible countries, sub-Saharan countries, African countries, with duty-free access to US markets, not individual provinces. And therefore, hon Speaker, your decision to go on a taxpayers funded ...[Audio distorted.] to the US during the Western Cape

winter storms which left thousands displaced and claimed two lives of two people, was a gross act of negligence and dereliction of duty. It was a show of how hon Premier Winde's priorities are out of touch with the needs of the people.

The storm caused extensive damage to infrastructure, as well as agriculture which the Provincial Government established to between R750-million and R1-billion for the agriculture sector. We are disheartened by the reports of severe damage to several houses in Transnet's housing projects which damaged roofs, windows and walls. Our thoughts and prayers are with affected families, and we call on the relevant authorities to urgently intervene.

The handover of these houses began around March last year in part of Phase 1 of the project. It is too early for these houses to be falling apart. In fact, March this year. It is March this year. It is too early for these houses to be falling apart. This exposes the cancer of poor-quality workmanship in the construction of Government low-cost housing. The contactors awarded the tenders for this project must be investigated and held accountable. Immediate action should be taken to remedy the situation.

As a result of substandard construction practices, families have been left vulnerable and exposed to cold and rainy weather like in the case of Mama Cynthia Bless, who continues to live under terrible conditions ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Marran, please conclude. Your time has expired.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): ...with her disabled son in the Witzenberg Municipality. This Government, through hon MEC Simmers and hon MEC Bredell will not do anything ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much ...[Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): ...to assist the affected families.

The SPEAKER: Hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): I thank you.

The SPEAKER: I recognise the EFF. [Applause.]

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Hon Speaker, all of us, we are reading, and I do not know what the confusion is from the old man.

The Economic Freedom Fighters would like the opportunity to condemn the DA-led City of Cape Town Municipality and its Mayor, hon Geordin Hill-Lewis, for their constant threats of eviction against homeless people residing outside the Castle of Good Hope on the land owned by the National Department of Public Works. The bullying tactics and arrogance by the DA's

hon Mayor in an attempt to force a National Department to yield to its demands, leave a lot to be desired.

This is testimony of what happens when minority parties in the country are given a little bit of power. They then try to rule through the Courts. The same City does not even have shelters or alternative accommodation to house homeless people. All they are concerned about is to hide these poor, homeless people from the view of tourists, whilst pushing the propaganda that if these homeless people are not evicted that the image of this tourist attraction will be tarnished.

However, the opposite of that has been proven to be true as the COO of the Castle indicated that in the past, 2022, the number of tourist visits to the Castle has, in fact, increased from 33 000 to 67 000 people. Tourists do not only want to see the beauty of Cape Town, but also the poverty that goes within it. As homeless people are neglected by the City and the Provincial Government without any job opportunities or provision of shelter in order to assess whether particular Government parties are able to deliver in the service deliver mandate.

One has to look at the manner in which they treat the poor, the homeless and the marginalised and we know by now that the source alone ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Klaas, your time has expired. Please conclude.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): DA will receive zero. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Klaas.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): [Laughing.]

The SPEAKER: I recognise the DA.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): ...in approving of this what we want them to approve.

The SPEAKER: Hon Klaas, your time has expired. Hon Pretorius.

Mr G PRETORIUS (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, on the 12th of this month, the highly controversial National Health Insurance or NHI Bill was forced through the National Assembly by the ANC. This means that South Africa is one step closer to a future in which our people have no say in their medical funding and one in which the looting of the public funds continues unabated. I do not believe it is an exaggeration to say that the NHI will bankrupt this country. Even wealthy countries like the United Kingdom and China struggle to maintain their social healthcare services and frequently face shortages of personnel and resources.

The NHI envisions the implementation of a similar system here in South Africa with none of the resources to back it up. National Government wishes to take control of all healthcare in South Africa, when it cannot even shield

our hospitals from the loadshedding it created. Hon Speaker, this Bill does not represent an attempt at healthcare reform that runs before it can walk. Rather, it represents an attempt to fly before we can crawl. But hon Speaker, I take heart of the fact that this Bill, even if passed into law, will take more than ten years to implement. By that time, the ANC will be out of power. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

Mr G PRETORIUS (DA): This tragic misstep of the legislative process will have been consigned to the scrap heap and South Africa will be flourishing under a new government. Despite the fact that our country is going through hard times, a change in leadership at the highest levels of power will herald a bright, bright future. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Pretorius. I recognise GOOD.

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): Thank you, hon Speaker. The DA is introducing the Western Cape People's Bill for its first reading today. I am a little confused why do we ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member. There is an hon member on the floor. Members on my right.

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): Why [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon De Villiers, my apologies. Please take your seat. Hon Deputy Chief Whip, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes, hon Speaker, it is a point of order. The Democratic Alliance has not introduced the Western Cape People's Bill and therefore, I would like to know whether the hon member is misleading the House.

The SPEAKER: That is not a point of order. If there are any corrections, there is an opportunity as per the Rules where an hon member of the Executive will have five minutes to reply or rebut any Member Statement. Hon De Villiers, I will allow you the opportunity to continue. I am not going to adjudicate on your content.

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): The DA is introducing the Western Cape People's Bill for the first reading today. I am a little confused. Why do we need a Western Cape Bill giving us permission to do something we can already do? And why does the Western Cape Government not lead by example and devolve some of its powers to Local Government?

This City is in the best sphere of government to manage public transport in the functional region. Why has the Western Cape not devolved the Golden Arrow Bus Services contracting authority to the City so that the City can integrate it with the MyCiTi Bus Service and improve efficiencies? Why

does the Western Cape not devolve the public transport operation licence functions to the City to improve the integration of minibus taxis and bus services? The National Land Transport Act says this should be devolved. The Western Cape does not conform to this devolution so, why introduce a Bill specifically aimed at ensuring the devolution of powers?

Early in the week during a podcast, Phil Craig reviewed ...[Audio distorted.] that the Cape Independence Party had secured a question on the secession of the Western Cape from the rest of the country on a referendum the DA plans on holding once this Bill is passed. Why should the hon Premier for once not opt for his favourite dance, the sidestep, to come clean on the DA's real intent with introducing this Bill? I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon De Villiers. I now recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. The ACDP in the Western Cape is appalled and also wants to strongly condemn – yes, condemn – the move by the Department of Basic Education with cooperation with the Stellenbosch University to change the Teacher's Manual for nursery schools. Yes, nursery schools! Nursery schoolteachers are urged to make children sing rhymes and songs that are gender neutral.

Hon Speaker, this is ridiculous. It is so ridiculous ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Order!
 [Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Order, hon members!
 Hon Christians, you may continue.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. It is so ridiculous if you look at the rhymes:

“Hush little baby do not cry; Papa is going to buy you a mockingbird.”

Now, you must change that to a gender-neutral pronoun or noun. What is the Department of Basic Education doing? What are they going to do with the Three Little Bears? Papa Bear, Mama Bear, and Baby Bear? [Laughter.] What are they going to do with Goldilocks? Does Goldilocks become an it, a them or they? [Laughter.]

Hon Speaker, this is shocking and the reason behind this is that children at a very young age must express or explore their own gender. A disgrace! The Department of Basic Education is confused and should not confuse our children. Genesis 1:27 says:

“So God created mankind in His own image; in the image of God He created them; male and female, He created them.”

There is no in between ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Christians, your time has expired. Please conclude.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): There is no confusion. I want the voters of South Africa to know ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very ...[Interjection.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): ...that what the ANC is doing.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Thank you, hon Christians. Hon Murray, is that a point of order?

Ms C MURRAY (DA): Yes, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order?

Ms C MURRAY (DA): Hon Speaker, I again want to ask the question of whether the remarks made by the hon member do infringe on the rights to equality of residents in this province? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Murray. I am not going to rule on the content without having an opportunity to listen to the context, so I will wait for Hansard and revert back to the House. I now recognise the ANC.
[Interjections.] Order, hon members. There is an hon member on the floor.

Hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. At its plenary sitting on 12 June 2023, the National Assembly passed the National Health Insurance Bill. The Bill has been sent to the NCOP for concurrence. This historic milestone marks a significant step towards achieving equitable access to quality healthcare for all citizens, even †Antie Anna in Meneer Van der Westhuizen se kombuis [Auntie Anna in Mr Van der Westhuizen's kitchen].

Hon Speaker, the ANC Government is committed to prioritise the health and wellbeing of all citizens, regardless of their socio-economic background. The NHI will address the existing disparities in our healthcare systems, as well as various accesses thereby ensuring that no one is left behind when it comes to receiving quality medical care. The NHI envisages the creation of the National Health Insurance Fund and sets out its powers, functions and governance structures. The Fund will purchase healthcare services for all users who are registered with it. We are not all surprised by the fierce opposition of the NHI from the DA and its right-winged coalition led by AfriForum and Solidarity.

Hon Speaker, Minister Phaahla was correct when he said:

“This one represents the narrow interest of the privileged few. They do not care about the masses of our people, the vulnerable groups that would benefit from this policy.”

The ANC warmly welcomes the passing of the Bill and lauds the National Assembly for facilitating effective public participation on the NHI Bill. I thank you. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Windvogel. I recognise the DA.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Over the past two weeks, parts of the Western Cape have been devastated by the impact of the widespread floods which saw the destruction of property, public infrastructure, the displacement of communities and sadly, also the loss of life. On behalf of the Democratic Alliance, I want to extend our thoughts and prayers to all those affected by the floods and send our heartfelt condolences to the families and loved ones of the deceased.

I would also like to use my time this afternoon to send our sincere gratitude and thanks to all the emergency service workers, first responders, municipal workers, law enforcement, and civil society organisations across this province who sprang into action to assist communities. These past few weeks, we once again, saw how important and effective our Whole of Society approach is in assisting communities and providing support to the most vulnerable.

Hon Speaker, the Provincial Disaster Management Centre played a pivotal role in leading and coordinating the response, but also in bringing together the various stakeholders involved in emergency and humanitarian efforts. We extend our appreciation in the Western Cape Provincial Government and its proactive disaster management interventions, as well as stakeholders such as the City of Cape Town, the National Sea Rescue Institute, Gift of the Givers, the South African Airforce, the South African Police Service and the many other good Samaritans who stepped up to do their part.

Hon Speaker, there is still a lot of work to do, and we wish all the relevant teams well at the Disaster Management Centre and on the ground, as the mop-up operations continue. We wish them all the best. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Chief Whip. I recognise the Freedom Front Plus.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Hon Speaker, I have no statement today.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise Al Jama-ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Speaker and good afternoon to everybody. *Bismillah-ir-Rahman-ir-Rahim*. Hon Speaker, it is very disheartening to observe that the Western Cape Legislature is giving its full support to Herzlia High School, an institution where learners who are supposed to learn about social justice and fairness, are encouraged to

embrace Zionism that is akin to apartheid. They further use the learning environment by encouraging its Jewish matriculants to not just travel to apartheid Israel, but to go for military training, an act that is against our democratic policies.

Hon Minister Maynier, an Education member of the Executive Council in the Western Cape Legislature, is quoted in the South African Jewish Report that the school will not be deregistered. Why should this hon member argue along these lines when the school has transgressed South African educational and related policies? Compare this with the draconian action taken against Heathfield High School principal, Mr Wesley Neumann, who was dismissed for keeping the school closed during the peak of COVID-19 in 2020. Herzlia administration subtly teaches values that support the Zionist project, one that publicly views all Palestinian Muslims and Christians as second-class communities. And for the record: there are those Jewish groups that have spoken and continue to speak out against these policies.

Herzlia High School, being a registered institution in our province, has been abetting Zionism without it being censored. Why should our country's democratic educational policies be flouted and disregarded in this way by the school's ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member? Hon member, please conclude. Your time has expired.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Speaker. We call on the WCED to deregister the school. Let us all be reminded ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise the DA.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I recently read an article which described a visit by the South African Police Service's top brass to China in order to discuss 'Smart' policing. Hon Speaker, I am very glad to see that the policing leadership of this country is taking the initiative to provide a better standard of training for our all too often overworked and under-appreciated frontline officers.

But hon Speaker, why would the ANC's top cops fly halfway around the world when there is a worldclass 'Smart' data-driven policing effort taking place right here in the Western Cape. It was through the intelligent data-driven deployment of limited resources that our Province was able to reduce the number of murders by 14,1%, not due to the under-resourced and poorly efforts led by the National Police Minister. Before flying to China, Minister Cele and his entourage should first come to the Western Cape.

Hon Speaker, there are broader reasons for concern about the move by SAPS. The trip in question saw Minister Cele and several top police officers meet with the security apparatus of a regime that has repeatedly and without remorse, employed violence against its own citizens. Those same officials that our National Minister met with, preside over the agencies responsible for

brutally suppressing human rights and freedom of expression, and our Government's collaboration with them represents a tacit endorsement of these ideals.

When SAPS says that they have gone to China to learn about 'Smart' policing, I hope that this is not a euphemism to employ similar tactics.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Inaudible.]... object.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): In fact, with the ANC cosying up to Russia ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable, honourable ...[Interjection.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...I cannot help but view these postings ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Bosman, please take your seat. Hon Sayed, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Can the hon Bosman take a question, please, on the ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...Government's relations with China?

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, please take your seat.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): On the Government's relations with China?

The SPEAKER: Please, hon Sayed, you have asked if the hon member is prepared to take a question. You do not pose the question without ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Inaudible.]... posing, I said.

The SPEAKER: Hon Bosman, are you prepared to take a question in your Statement slot?

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): No, I am not, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: No, the hon [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): I have no voting rights at this weekend's congress. In fact, with the ANC cosyng up to Russia, I cannot help but view these meetings as another stepdown ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...in the path to tolerance for authoritarianism
...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Honourable ...[Interjection.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...and the anti-democratic practice ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Bosman, please take your seat. Hon Sayed, is that a
point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, it is a correction. The ANC does not
have congresses, we have conferences. The Youth League ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: That is not, that is not ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...of hon member Kama has congresses.
He must study political parties if he wants to dissect them.

The SPEAKER: That is not a point of order!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): He must not expose his level of ig
...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members! That is not a point of order, hon Sayed, for

the record. Hon Premier, is that a point of order?

The PREMIER: ...the hon member on a point of correction.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, no. That is not allowed.

The PREMIER: ...congress in [Inaudible.].

The SPEAKER: Honourable, honourable ...[Laughter.] Hon Premier, please take your seat. Hon Bosman ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You can have a congress. [Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. It is very sad to say that all the hard work that the previous Minister Schäfer put into educating hon Sayed on the Rules, has not paid off. [Laughter.]

Hon Speaker, with the ANC ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...cosying up to Russia, I cannot help but view these meetings as another step down in the path of tolerance and authoritarianism and the anti-democratic practice that we know the ANC wants to implement. We should be condemning these regimes, not condoning them. And one hopes

that no-one within the party opposite harbours these same totalitarian ideas.
If they do ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Bosman, please conclude. Your time has expired.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): If they do, they have yet another reason for the voters of the Western Cape to vote them out next year.

The SPEAKER: Thank ...[Interjection.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bosman. Thank you very much, hon members. That brings us to the end of Members' Statements and in terms of Rule 145(c), I will now give one or more hon members of the Executive present, an opportunity to respond to Members' Statements for not more than five minutes collectively. Are there any – I recognise the hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I will try not to take too much time. First of all, to the hon De Villiers. In his statement he says I am a little confused. I would like to say he is very confused, out of his depth. [Laughter.] The hon member, it is not the DA putting forward the motion today, the hon member behind you is putting forward the motion today. So, he is definitely not a little confused, he is out of his depth, on the wrong field, probably playing with the rugby ball in a swimming pool with a hockey

stick.

Hon MEMBERS: [Laughter.]

The PREMIER: Then, of course, I would like to reflect on the hon member who noted the NHI. I would like to say once again, the NHI is not workable and needs to be rejected in totality.

And then the last point on the issue as raised around AGOA and the competency on dealing with AGOA. And of course, for me, the real confusion from our National colleagues, DIRCO.

I would like to point out on 23 March officially we wrote – 23 March, three months ago – we wrote to the Ambassador in Washington in letting her know about our visit. On 24 March to DIRCO, letting them know about our visit. There was no complaint of it whatsoever. And then, of course, before I left, I also engaged with the member responsible, Minister Patel, and we had a long conversation before I left and in actual fact, today I have let him know that a report will be on the way to him before he goes to talk about AGOA in July. And also, for the hon member's information, that DIRCO's officials were in the meetings that we had in Washington. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Are there any other hon members of the Executive that would like to respond? If not [Interjections.] that brings us to the end of Member Statements.

MOTIONS

The SPEAKER: Hon members, we will now move on to Notices of Motions as per Rule 151. Hon Marran! In terms of Rule 151, all Notices of Motions by the hon members are required to be delivered to the Secretary for placing them on the Order Paper. These motions have been duly submitted and published on the Order Paper below the line.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the proposed National Health Insurance Bill and its concomitant impact on society.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the number of unregistered Early Childhood Development sites that outnumber official facilities in Western Cape.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms A P BANS (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the targeting of SAPS officials in shootings in the province and the lack of response by the Western Cape Provincial Department of Police Oversight and Community Safety in preventing SAPS officials from becoming targets.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the outbreak of taxi violence again on the Drakenstein–Bellville routes and the clueless involvement of the Minister of Mobility in preventing this violence.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the displacement of thousands of people and the loss of life in the Western Cape because of flooding, which resulted in damage to their properties.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the rise in school-targeted robberies in Western Cape.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms A P BANS (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the Tafelsig Neighbourhood Watch camera surveillance room that has been shut down by the City of Cape Town.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We now move on to Motions without Notice as per Rule 150. I would like to inform you that in terms of Rule 150 pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolence and congratulatory were submitted to the Programming Authority prior to this plenary on 20 June 2023. Hon members are also reminded that the Motions without Notice pertaining to congratulatory and condolence, will not be allowed in this Sitting that have not been processed by the Programming Authority.

I have been informed that in the Programming Authority meeting of 20 June 2023, political parties did submit the names of the hon members in the desired order of speaking and who had wished to move a Motion without

Notice in this sitting of this House. I will therefore, just for noting and for the purposes of the Minutes, call out the hon members whose names have accordingly been submitted and approved.

The following member motions have been approved by the Programming Authority as follows: hon D M Baartman, hon G Bosman, hon I Sileku, hon D M Baartman, hon A P Bans, hon M K Sayed, hon M Kama, hon M Kama, hon R Windvogel, hon R Windvogel, hon P Z Lekker.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the learners from the Schoonspruit Secondary School, a focus school for the arts in Malmesbury, who kicked off the first phase of the Swartland Municipality's Mural Project to raise awareness of gender-based violence, femicide and violence against children; notes that this initiative will not only create awareness, but will also serve to educate and inform the community about the scourge of violence against women and children; further notes that additional schools and artists from the area will participate in the project, supported by the Swartland Municipality and the Western Cape Department of Education; and notes that the young learners and artists from the community have been empowered to utilise their skills for the education of others and the upliftment of vulnerable groups.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): I move without notice:

That the House sends its most sincere condolences to the friends and family of coach Mike Lukhubene who was tragically killed on Sunday 11 June 2023; notes that it is very unsettling that this incident occurred at a place of entertainment outside the Site C sports grounds in Khayelitsha; and notes that, while we encourage children and adults to be involved in sports and outdoor recreational activities, incidents like these prevent people from enjoying such events in their own communities.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr I M SILEKU (DA): I move without notice:

That the House commends the unwavering dedication and tireless efforts of numerous Disaster Management teams across the province that are working ceaselessly around the clock to avert any loss of life amidst the ongoing flooding; and, furthermore, extends its commendation to these teams for their relentless work in promptly clearing roads, once deemed safe, to ensure a smooth passage.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Rustenburg Girls High School (RGHS) for its inclusion on T4 Education's shortlist of the 10 best schools in the world in the category of 'Supporting Healthy Lives'; notes that this represents recognition of the inclusive and holistic approach to education employed by RGHS, which seeks to balance academics, sport and cultural activities; notes that this achievement represents the culmination of RGHS's continuous embracement of excellence; and wishes the staff and learners of the school well as they compete for the honour of best school in the world.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms A P BANS (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes the brutal murder of the former manager of Chippa United, Mike Lukhubene; notes that Mike Lukhubene was gunned down along with another individual after a football match between Hot Spurs and Tottenham Hotspur FC in Khayelitsha, Cape Town, on Sunday 11 June; notes that Lukhubene coached Chippa United and Royal AM previously and was coaching an amateur team at the time of his death; notes that South African football has lost another much-loved coach; and

sends its heartfelt condolences to his family, friends and colleagues.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Akili (Kiki) Molele, who is in Grade 7 and who passed her audition to be part of a chorus of 24 children for the Cape Town Opera's upcoming production of *Tosca*; notes that over 100 children from across the city between the ages of 9 and 15 queued for the audition; and notes that Kiki is a member of the Senior Choir, KATS, and is busy preparing to sing solos at the Tygerberg Eisteddfod.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates Tete Dijana (35) and Gerda Steyn (33) who claimed victory in the record-breaking Comrades Marathon that took place on 11 June; notes that Gerda Steyn set the Comrades Marathon down-run record with a time of 5:44:54 to become the fourth woman to run under six hours for that race; and Tete Dijana claimed the men's title by running in a record time of 05:14:30.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with sadness the passing away of former Bafana Bafana head coach, Clive Barker, at the age of 78; notes that Barker was renowned for leading South Africa to victory in the Africa Cup of Nations in 1996; notes that, throughout his remarkable 42-year coaching career, Barker mentored various teams, including AmaZulu, Manning Rangers, Durban City, Durban Bush Bucks, Santos Cape Town, Wits and Maritzburg United where he concluded his coaching journey in 2016; notes that he guided Durban City to consecutive league titles in 1982 and 1983, as well as leading Durban Bush Bucks to victory in 1985; and extends its heartfelt condolences to his family and friends.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep sadness the passing away of Jamahi David Scheepers from 42 Murray Street, Swellendam, who died on 9 June due to excessive smoke inhalation; and conveys sincere condolences to the Scheepers family.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes and conveys sincere condolences to the Santsaba family after the passing away of their infant son in Petunia Street, Swellendam, due to cot death.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes the brutal murder of Ntsikelelo Konisani from 3752 Block 7, Lower Crossroads, in Philippi East; notes that he was killed on Wednesday 14 June in a hail of bullets on suspicion of extortion; notes that Konisani was a young and upcoming businessperson and community developer; and conveys heartfelt condolences to his parents, wife, children and the community of Lower Crossroads.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The SPEAKER: I now put the motions duly submitted and approved by the Programming Authority to the House. Are there any objections? No objections, agreed to. These motions will appear in the Minutes of the proceedings and in Hansard, in each individual member's name as if the member had read out the motion.

I will now afford the opportunity to hon members to move Motions without Notice as per Standing Rule of 150(2)(d). This could also include Motions without Notice that were not approved in the Programming Authority. Hon members are reminded that there are 30 minutes as per the Standing Rule 150(2)(d), that will start in the next second. If I can just get my – thank you. That will start now. I recognise the hon Sileku.

Mr I M SILEKU (DA): †Mandibulele, Somlomo [Thank you, Speaker] I move without notice:

That the House acknowledges the findings of the Auditor-General, highlighting that the current state of Beaufort West, Kannaland, and Laingsburg can be attributed to a lack of leadership. This cannot be disputed by the †*amper* [almost] incoming provincial leader and ANC member, hon member Cameron Dugmore, who was in the Committee meeting when this was confirmed by the Auditor-General; that this House further acknowledges that these municipalities are governed by the ANC and their allies; that this House recognises ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr I M SILEKU (DA):

...that the Department of Local Government had extended assistance to Beaufort West, Kannaland, and Laingsburg; however, it is regrettable

that assistance can only be provided to those who actively seek it;
...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: In Kannaland.

Mr I M SILEKU (DA):

... that this House ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr I M SILEKU (DA):

...expresses ...[Interjections.] serious concern ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! If you have an objection, you can indicate that when I put the question, but until that point, please allow the hon member to deliver the motion. [Interjections.] Hon Sileku, please continue.

Mr I M SILEKU (DA): Go to Knysna. †Myeke [Let him be] [Interjections.]

That this House expresses serious concern over the Auditor-General's Report, which reveals that these municipalities made limited efforts to enhance their financial management; that this House appreciates the

Auditor-General's encouragement for the DA-led Western Cape to serve as a leading example by promoting a culture of compliance and adherence. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Sileku. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: No!

Hon MEMBERS: I object ...*[Interjection.]*

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House notes with excitement that the City of Cape Town has secured €100-million in Infrastructure funding from the French Development Agency, which equates to about R2-billion; this will go towards the City's record-breaking R43-billion medium-term infrastructure budget. This funding will be used on improving water and sanitation, public transport, and access to electricity; that this House

notes that the City of Cape Town alone, has an Infrastructure budget twice the size of the entire Gauteng Province's Infrastructure budget; that this House notes that the DA-led Western Cape now has an Infrastructure investment portfolio of R120-billion over the next 10 years; that this House acknowledges the significant role this money will play in addressing socio-spatial inequalities and contributing to the creation and restoration of vital infrastructure throughout the City. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Maseko. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Hon MEMBERS: No! No!

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise the hon Klaas.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): [Laughing.] I move without notice:

For the House to note that yesterday on 21 June 2023, hundreds of community members marched to the Gugulethu Healthcare Centre

demanding better services at the clinic. The residents complained about the issue of a leaking roof when it rains causing wet floors, long queues, missing patient files, robberies, maltreatment at the hands of the nursing staff and further called for a hospital to be built in the area just like the one in Khayelitsha; furthermore that there have been robberies in the area targeting patients visiting the clinic, ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Really?

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF):

...as well as the security personnel. So, residents are experiencing a lack of proper healthcare services at the clinic and also feel unsafe as they are robbed inside these clinics. All this is testimony that the DA-led Government does not take Black people living in townships seriously. ...[Interjection.]

Ms L M MASEKO: Objection!

Mr I M SILEKU (DA):

I so move. [Laughing.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Klaas. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): [Laughing.]

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Can I please ask that the hon Klaas, please ...[Interjections.]. I now recognise the hon Lekker. Hon Lekker, can you just put on your microphone or lift it up for the record.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes the concerning trends reflected in the latest crime statistics for Brackenfell. While it is encouraging to note the low incidence of violent crime, we express deep concern over the rise in common robbery, business burglary, car theft, and theft from cars. These offenses pose a significant threat to the safety, security, and economic wellbeing of our community. We call upon the Provincial Government to work with law enforcement agencies, local authorities, and community organisations to collaborate and implement targeted strategies to combat these specific crimes, ensuring the protection of residents, businesses, and vehicles. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Lekker. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Do not disappoint me.

The SPEAKER: There is no objection, agreed to. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]
Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House acknowledges the positive impact of the Rainbow Nation Kids Songs driven by a young woman, Lungi Naidoo in KwaZulu-Natal and urges the Western Cape Education Department to develop similar projects for schools in our province. Rainbow Nation Kids Songs has successfully promoted unity, cultural diversity, and social cohesion amongst young learners. Recognising the value of such initiatives, the WCED must invest in projects that celebrate our nation's diversity, foster inclusivity, and promote cultural understanding in schools across the Western Cape. By encouraging the development of similar programs, we can cultivate an environment that embraces our collective heritage, nurtures tolerance, and empowers our learners to become compassionate, global citizens. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Sayed. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise the hon Marran. Order, hon members! Hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks. Thanks, hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the devastating impact of recent floods on the Western Cape's citrus and potato harvests, which has the potential to incur significant financial losses for our farmers and farm workers. Recognising the urgency of the situation, we call upon the Provincial Government to swiftly intervene and provide the necessary support to those affected. Immediate assistance, such as financial aid, infrastructure repairs, and access to resources, is crucial to mitigate the economic burden imposed on these agricultural communities. By taking prompt action, the Government can help safeguard the livelihoods of our farmers and farmworkers and ensure the continued stability and productivity in our agricultural sector. I so move, thanks.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marran. Hon members, are there

any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): I object, they are already there.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Lekker. [Interjections.] [Laughter.] Order, hon Lekker – hon members. Hon Lekker, I recognise you. My apologies.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the concerning rise in numbers of small business owners fearing a potential turf war between extortion gangs in Cape Town. This alarming situation poses a significant threat to the safety, security, and livelihoods of these hardworking individuals and their communities. We call upon law enforcement agencies and local authorities to prioritise the protection of small business owners and their businesses, implementing proactive measures to prevent criminal activities, dismantle extortion networks, and ensure the safety of all residents. By taking decisive action, we can create an environment where all business owners can operate without fear and contribute to the prosperity and diversity of Cape Town. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Lekker. Hon members, are there

any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: In support.

The SPEAKER: There is no objection. Motion agreed to.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Just two votes.

The SPEAKER: I recognise the hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. On behalf of the people's movement, the black, green and gold African National Congress, I move without notice:

That the House notes the pervasive issue of the exclusion of Black people from the economy of the Western Cape. That there is an urgent need for equitable representation and economic opportunities. We call upon this Western Cape Government and relevant stakeholders to actively work towards dismantling systemic barriers that hinder the full participation of Black individuals in the region's economy. This includes implementing policies that promote diversity, equity, and inclusion in hiring, procurement, and business ownership. By fostering an environment that embraces diversity and provides equal access to economic resources, we can create a more just and prosperous Western Cape for all its residents in the Western Cape. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Kama. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Hon MEMBERS: Object! Object.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with grave concern the high number of unplaced learners who despite having applied on time and correctly, were rejected by all schools they applied to; notes further that the latest of these cases involves Mrs Keet who applied for her daughter at five schools in the Stellenbosch area and all applications were unsuccessful at schools like Rhenish Primary, Louw Laerskool, Eikestad Laerskool, and various other schools; notes further that Mrs Keet has lodged an appeal at Rhenish Primary and calls on hon MEC Maynier to intervene and ensure placement of this and other children at schools; notes further and acknowledges that the unplaced learner crisis in the Western Cape is exacerbated by discriminatory and racist practices especially by the School Governing Bodies of largely former Model-C

schools who, with the backing of the DA, the ACDP and the Freedom Front Plus, use the admissions and language policies to gatekeep and block (mainly) Black learners (African, Coloured and Indian) from enrolling at their schools; resolves to call on hon MEC Maynier and his Department to appear before the Standing Committee to brief members about the root causes of this crisis with an action plan. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Objection.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Sayed. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

Hon MEMBERS: Objection!

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I am not surprised. The Moonshot coalition objects. [Laughter.] I move without notice:

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members. Hon Sayed, you may continue.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice, hon Speaker:

That the House notes with grave concern and condemns the endless illegal extension of the National School Nutrition Program (NSNP) contract by the Western Cape Education Department whereas the B/WCED 2915/21 (National School Nutrition Program) and B/WCED 2916/21 (MOD Centres) were advertised on 13 May 2021 with the closing date of 14 June 2021. Only the award of bid B/WCED 2915/21 was publicised on the Western Cape Tender Bulletin dated 12 December 2022. Until to date, bid B/WCED 2916/21 has not yet been awarded. Instead, its validity period is being unendingly extended, including on the following dates, 11 December 2021 till 31 March 2022, 31 December 2022 till 31 July 2022; 31 July 2022 till 31 October 2022, 31 October 2022 till 31 January 2022, 31 January 2023 to 27 March 2023 and from 27 March 2023 to 30 June 2023; notes further and even the June 2023 date is being extended to 30 September 2023 according to the internal notice we have received; and resolves to call on the WCED to immediately end the illegal extension of the NSNP. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Sayed. Hon member, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Hon MEMBERS: Yes. I object! Object!

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] Hon members, we have now come to the end of Motions without Notice. I will ask the Secretary to read the Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Introduction: Western Cape Peoples Bill.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I will now afford the hon Marais five minutes to introduce the Bill. Order, hon members.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Hon Speaker, hon Premier, hon members ...[Interjection.]

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Read, do not read, do not read.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Today, I feel extremely honoured to have been tasked by the Freedom Front Plus to present the House with what is called the Western Cape People's Bill. The reference to the Western Cape People's Bill fills me with pride. †Ons is mos Wes-Kapenaars. Ons moedertaal is oorwegend Afrikaans en ons geloof, dié van die Christen-gemeenskap, maar ook van Moslems en Jode. [We are West Capetonians after all. Our mother tongue is predominantly Afrikaans and our religion is that of the Christian community, but also of Muslims and Jews.] All I ask is that hon members

have clear receptive minds, void of anger relating to past injustices. It is time to leave the past behind and plan for future ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): ...generations.

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Some people are stuck in the past and cling to the idea of one-party domination. Group domination is an outdated ideology. Federal autonomous states are the new narrative. I remember that in 1996 I already went to court to challenge the ANC on provincial powers when I was Minister for Local Government and I won the court case.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Hon Speaker, I pray for by-parties and the approach to move away from centralised government control. It is time for decisive action. Renew, or democracy will die in this country. The preamble to the Western Cape Constitution reads, and I quote:

“In humble submission to Almighty God, we, the people of the Western Cape, through our elected representatives – recognising the striving to heal the injustices of the past.”

The Constitution also says:

“Endeavouring to promote the development of the Western Cape and a better quality of life for all its people through just and effective government.”

The recognition of the family values etcetera ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: On the point.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): As party representatives in this House

The SPEAKER: Hon Marais, my apologies.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): ...we should be mindful of it.

The SPEAKER: Hon Marais, please take your seat. Hon Klaas, is that a point of order?

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Yes.

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order?

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): My point of order is that he is not addressing the hon

Speaker, he is addressing us. So ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: So, it is not a point of order, hon Klaas. Please take your seat. Hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Intelligence takes time. [Laughter.]

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): That, you give me!

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): So, it does not. Our Constitution does not read ‘We, the people of South Africa’, it reads:

“the people of the Western Cape”

And it says that through our own Western Cape elected representatives we will do this and that and that. The wording has been rectified by the Constitutional Court so there can be no discussion about it. But we are currently centrally governed by force, not by our choice. The people of the Western Cape are entitled to exercise their right to self-determination. It will be consistent with Article 235 of South Africa’s Constitution, something negotiated between the Freedom Front Plus and the ANC at Turnhalle. I was there. Hon members now objecting were not there. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): The people of the Western Cape can rely also on Section 31(1)(b) of the National Constitution which requires that when interpreting our Bill of Rights and a dispute arises, then International Law must be considered.

On 9 July 1996, the South African Government rectified their African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights and this Charter states that:

“All peoples have the right to self-determination and to pursue economic and social development policies according...”

And this is important:

“...according to their own choice.”

It does not say ‘according to central government choices’. On 10 December 1998, South Africa also rectified the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, which states inter alia:

“All peoples have the right to self-determination.”

On 12 January 2015, South Africa rectified the International Covenant on Economic and Social and Cultural Rights. Self-determination comes in various forms. Yes, I know some people talk about corporate federalism, others call it federal autonomy, others fear it might mean secession, but that

is not something for political parties to decide. That is something the people of the Western Cape must decide ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): ...through a referendum.

The SPEAKER: Hon Marais, please conclude. Your five minutes has expired.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): The people of the Western Cape are distinct and should be recognised by the State as culturally unique, linguistically and ideologically. We have distinct values ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): ...compared to the rest of South Africa ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): ...as a whole.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very ...[Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Hon Speaker, I present the House with the Western

Cape People's Bill.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais. Thank you, hon Marais. Hon members, I will now request that the hon Marais please table the Bill. Thank you very much, hon Marais. The Bill has now been officially tabled. Hon members, with that being said, that concludes the business for the House and the House is adjourned. The Secretary will now end the meeting and all hon members will be exited from this Sitting. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:14.