

---

THURSDAY, 22 AUGUST 2013

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The House met at 14:15

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Before we start the interpellation may I welcome in the gallery a group of students from the Department of Conservation, Ecology and Entomology from the University of Stellenbosch. They form part of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament's Education Programme. They are one of three programmes or groups of students/schools that form part of our programme, the others being the Political Science Department of the University of the Western Cape and the School of Journalism of the Peninsula Technical University. You are most welcome in our midst here.

## INTERPELLATIONS:

### *Textbook Education - Alternative: Western Cape*

#### **1. Ms J A van Zyl asked the Minister of Education:**

Whether his department is considering any alternative to textbook education for schools in the Western Cape?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker, and I would also like to thank the hon member Ms van Zyl for the new debate.

Mr Deputy Speaker, I think it is important for me to first highlight the importance of textbook education within the system before I go on to alternatives. Any alternative to textbook education would need to support and enhance teaching and learning based on the use of textbooks. It would definitely not replace it. It is common knowledge that schooling went through a retrogressive period in South Africa with some of the decisions associated with the introduction of OBE, particularly in the form of Curriculum 2005. These decisions down-played the importance of quality textbooks and highlighted self-discovery of knowledge and the use of whatever material happened to be available to teachers. Fortunately this is now a thing of the past and the need for quality texts is not questioned but encouraged. For example a recent report by the National Education Evaluation and Development Unit, known as Needu, on the state of literacy teaching and learning in the foundation phase stressed the need to have texts enriched environments in our schools. It states that it is not possible to develop a systematic understanding of any subject without

being able to read a range of materials. Therefore provincial education departments should increase their budget allocations to better equip schools with increased quantities of reading materials. What Needu is recommending is what the Western Cape has been doing for some years now. In fact it is pleasing that the Needu report acknowledges that the Western Cape exceeds other provinces in terms of reading and writing and the provisioning of readers with textbooks in classrooms. Building texts rich schools is one of our significant interventions to date and the department has committed itself to providing schools with key texts needed by learners to support the delivery of a quality curriculum. The WCED however is not blind to alternative and complementary mediums such as the use of ICT in the classroom.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Agb van Zyl?

Ms J A VAN ZYL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. On 8 July 2013 at Spine Road Secondary School in Mitchells Plain, Premier Helen Zille accompanied by MEC Grant, announced and was quoted in an article in the *Cape Argus* that her government was working on providing tablet textbooks instead of hard copies. MEC Grant confirmed that they are aiming to provide 973 000 pupils with tablets. Furthermore there are 1 100 schools ear-marked for broadband roll-out by the end of 2014, but MEC Grant did not specify which schools.

We feel the Western Cape government is jumping the gun here. We have not yet solved our infrastructure backlogs. According to the 2011 NEIMS report, 47% of Western Cape's public ordinary schools were without a library, 65%

were without science laboratories and 39% were without computer centres. Has the department considered the cost of not just providing but running the tablets as well? In South Africa with almost 72% of 15 to 24 year olds having a cell phone would it not be wiser for now to rather explore possibilities of entering into open-source agreements with textbook publishers and then provide these textbooks to learners via free social networks like Mxit or Facebook? For learners who do not have access to e-textbooks the department can also explore the solutions of a print on demand with publishers which allows the legal printing or copying of textbooks. Thank you.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Mr Deputy Speaker, in an era in which humanity moves towards greater technological conversions evaluating how we educate the next generation requires particular attention. We cannot let this next generation enter into an economy they are not prepared for technologically or educationally. The prediction of the demise of the textbook negates questioning. The role of textbook education in today's knowledge economy is thus sensible. Any education department would be wise to consider all possibilities when it comes to improving learning. The road to creating a modern and alternative education environment, one that is wholly supported by technology in South Africa, will be a long one. Current challenges to existing systems are hard enough but what we can aspire to and which the department has taken steps to achieve, is the exploration and readying for such a classroom. Arguably at least until that time the adoption of both the new and the old in the classroom could be better achieved by closing the gaps in technological take-up. For now, even in sophisticated education systems, new education technology or

e-tech has not been rigorously tested or studied. Barriers to getting this technology into even these sophisticated classrooms has been a trying process. However, according to the *Economist*, studies conducted in United States on education technology adoption have shown that certain applications have met with positive improvement in maths and reading skills amongst learners using such applications. Studies such as these, even based internationally, are encouraging given the Western Cape's Education LitNum Strategy. Mr Deputy Speaker, any progress in adapting education technology is exciting. It will be a long road but one that will be filled with possibility and improvement.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Western Cape Education Department has developed an e-education vision which supports and enhances the use of textbooks in schools. This includes the increased use of information communications technology and the tablets to which the hon member Ms van Zyl was referring earlier. ICT is not an alternative to printed textbooks but it is rather an additional resource for both educators and learners which enhances the delivery of the curriculum to ensure our learners receive a better quality education.

The department is currently supporting e-education through a number of channels including the provisioning of technology to new schools and the upgrading or advancement of technology in existing schools, researching and evaluating the use of e-education methodologies and cutting edge technology, training for ICT for educators, the sourcing, procurement and provisioning of digital resources through multiple access points and on-going support for e-

education at schools. The department has developed an e-education platform in the form of a curriculum website and a learning management system. That site is [www.curriculum-dev.wcape.school.za](http://www.curriculum-dev.wcape.school.za). This platform currently houses a repository of educational digital resources that are in line with the curriculum and provide facilities for teachers, for learners and departmental officials to communicate and collaborate with each other in support of teaching and learning. To date we are able to use this platform to access over 400 free digital learning objects, a collection of free software for educational purposes and a collection of apps for tablets which can be obtained in formats such as documents, videos, animations and simulations.

Ms M TINGWE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The empty public stance made by Madam Premier at Spine Road High is just another sign that indeed they are creating an elite education system. I am not too sure whether you have come to the realities of this province that you are ruling Madam Premier, because you have rural areas that do not have access to networks and computers. How are those learners going to learn when you introduce these tablet textbooks when we still have problems with the network systems? At Concordia High School, which is supposed to be an e-learning focus school, they do not have efficient computer equipment, but still the Premier can talk about tablet textbooks. Come to the real issues of this province and to the real world Madam Premier. The question to you hon Minister Grant is whether, in your Minmec meetings, there has been any discussion or debate around what Madam Premier promised at Spine Road.

Mr Deputy Speaker, it is really evident that the DA government only cares for the rich and resourceful. Those who are poor will remain poor because ...

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS : But we don't steal from the poor anymore!

MS M TINGWE: Anymore! I like that one. I like that one ! I am so interested to see... [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker, can you protect me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, order! I will protect you. Please continue.

Ms M TINGWE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I am so interested to see this cheap politicking and public stance made by Madam Premier Zille becoming a reality. Last year in October in this House, when she came to do annual reports, the very same much talked about broadband system could not work in this House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Your time has expired.

Ms M TINGWE: Okay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your last sentence.

Ms M TINGWE: The last sentence is - I guess we are really heading for

disaster in the education system in this province. [Time expired.]

Ms A J VAN ZYL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. South Africa is a democracy in the making. In first world countries such announcements of providing tablets instead of textbooks is a given whereas, with the social problems especially here in the Western Cape, this very same technology tool to better the outcome of education could put learners lives at risk. Where will the tablets be safely kept, at home or at school? It is patently clear especially in the informal areas keeping it at home or at school is equally dangerous. What about the rural areas in the province? This idea of tablets instead of textbooks is just creating expectations amongst learners. First things first Premier Zille and Minister Grant. Level the playing field of education by providing each learner with the basic infrastructure at schools and then roll out this programme. [Interjections.] There is nothing wrong with the idea and we welcome it but would the Premier and Minister Grant agree that this announcement, at this point in time, is premature. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Order! Hon Minister Grant?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. What a delightful debate [Laughter.] We are very excited about the introduction of broadband connectivity in our schools. This debate started about textbooks and alternatives. It seems to be have been shunted into a different siding but we believe that broadband will enable the department to further improve the quality of education in this province through the provisioning of high quality



curriculum material and teaching aids, improved communication as well as remote technical support. The department will also continue to explore new opportunities, for example mobile devices, as the province rolls out its broadband programme. Again I must stress that ITC is not an alternative to textbook education which was the focus of the debate but rather a complementary resource. We will therefore continue to ensure that all our learners in this province have a textbook in each course subject that they are taking. This is the commitment I made in this House three years ago, a commitment that we will fulfil by January 2014. In the last two years the department has ensured that the following has been provided to schools free of charge: firstly all learners in grades 1 to 7 have received a mathematics textbook. Secondly, reading schemes have been provided to schools for learners in grades 1 to 6 and each grade 10 and 11 learner has received the 7 core textbooks. We are currently completing the final roll-out of textbooks for the 2014 school year. This includes the provisioning of textbooks for every learner in grades 7 to 9 and grade 12.

Just to respond to the hon member Ms Tingwe, yes, most certainly we have discussed these issues but it was not at a Minmec meeting. It was a council of Education Ministers' meeting, the statutory body. The national Minister and her teams have been down to the Western Cape to see what we are doing. We are also in contact with Gauteng and currently with our telematics programme ...

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Please finish off.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... are broadcasting to more than 144 schools which now include schools in the Northern Cape and the Free State.

Debate concluded.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Your time has expired. That disposes of interpellation number 1. Numbers 2 and 3 have been withdrawn. We move on to questions for oral reply.

Interpellations 2 and 3 withdrawn.

## **QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

*Questions standing over from Thursday, 1 August 2013, as agreed to by the House:*

### *Mobile classrooms: information*

#### **5. Ms M Tingwe asked the Minister of Education:**

- (1) How many mobile classrooms were there in the Western Cape as at the latest specified date for which information is available;
- (2) whether his department is investing mainly in mobile classrooms; if not, what are the relevant details in this regard; if so, why?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The reply is as follows:

5. (1) There were 1 877 mobile classrooms on the WCED moveable asset register as at the 30 March 2013.

(2) Mobile classrooms are not regarded as a permanent alternative to brick and mortar infrastructure. They are used for the following purposes: temporary classrooms for learners when schools are being built or rebuilt; to relieve pressure where there is overcrowding and permanent infrastructure is still being planned; thirdly, where a new school is scheduled to be built but suitable land is currently unavailable, a temporary mobile school is erected on the grounds of an existing grounds of an existing facility; and fourthly, to meet short or medium term accommodation needs that are expected to alleviate overcrowding. The mobile units are redeployed when the usage at a given location is concluded.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Tingwe, supplementary question?

Ms M TINGWE: Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to know hon Minister – thank you for your response – whether there have been any mobile classrooms that have been in the schools around Western Cape for more than three years?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I did not hear the question properly. Sorry,

you dropped your voice at one critical moment. Would you mind just repeating it.

Ms M TINGWE: The elder is disrupting today. I would like to know, Minister Grant, whether there are schools in the Western Cape that have been sitting with mobile classrooms for more than three years?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, the answer is yes.

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, what is the lifespan of a mobile classroom at those schools and what is the plan because they should not be mobile classrooms but brick and mortar classrooms?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, when I came into office with this government there was no plan for the infrastructure of education. In fact, we are sitting with mobile classrooms that have been there since the 70's and 80's that we are still using.

Ms M TINGWE: Where are those schools?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: But what has happened since 1994? That is the point. What we have done is to supply and build 47 new schools. We have 28 schools in the pipeline this year and we will build up to 72 in the following two years including the 28. So, believe you me we are doing our best to catch up with an infrastructure backlog which I estimated, in education, to have been

between R6 billion and R7 billion in July 2009.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha, follow-up?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Hon Minister, does that mean that when the current Premier was Minister of Education she did not build any schools?

The PREMIER: I was there twelve years ago ... [Inaudible.] [Laughter.]

An HON MEMBER: Three months.

An HON MEMBER: Six!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, that was long ... It is not true. [Interjections.] Of course, she built schools. Of course, she built schools. I will tell you something; after the shorterened term of the Premier, you guys closed more schools than you built up to 2009.[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The last supplementary question?

Ms M TINGWE: If I hear the hon Minister correctly, he said there were mobile classrooms that have been there for more than 20 years. I would like to know what is the situation with these mobile classrooms. Are they in a condition fit

for learners to learn in?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, no they are not in a pristine condition. I have been in some where there is grass growing through the floor and where snakes come into the classroom, but the point is, where the need is greatest we have done what we can to remedy the situation. That is the answer. Thank you.

*Primary school in zone 9 Thembaletthu, George*

**\*10. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Education:**

- (a) What is the need for a primary school in zone 9 Thembaletthu, George and
- (b) when will a school be erected in the area?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I was looking forward to today in the House. I have been missing it. The reply is as follows:

10. Question 10 (a): The need for a new primary school in Thembaletthu in George was identified due to the enrolment pressure on existing primary schools in the area of Themablethu and Pacaltsdorp. The exact location of the new primary school has not been determined and will depend on the availability of land and the location of new housing developments in the area of Thembaletthu and Pacaltsdorp. Public Works are busy with that exercise.

In terms of (b): According to the 2014/2015 draft U-AMP, the estimated

site handover date for the start of the construction on the new Themba lethu Primary School is September 2015 and the estimated practical completion date is October 2016.

Mr P UYS: Thank you for the answer Minister Grant. What is the need in that specific area and why did you say you actually do not have a site and now you say it is going to happen in 2015?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, the reason for that is because Public Works are in the process of actually acquiring a piece of land which is not big enough for a school and are also looking at an adjacent site. They are busy with those discussions, so that we can have a big enough space, with the local council in order to build a proper school there.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That disposes of that question. Hon Minister Madikizela, can I just get your attention? The next question is from the Leader of the Opposition to the Premier.

*New questions:*

*Z83 application for employment form: scrapping of*

**1. Ms L Brown asked the Premier:**

Whether the use of the Z83 form when applying for employment in the Western Cape Government has been scrapped; if not, why not; if so, why has the use of the Z83 form been done away with?

The PREMIER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The answer is no. The Z83 form is prescribed for job applications in all public service departments.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No follow-up. Second question, hon member Mr von Brandis to Minister Winde. Sorry, is that a follow-up to the Premier's question?

MR M SKWATSHA: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You were rather late but I will allow it.

MR M SKWATSHA: The question is, is it still being used?

The PREMIER: I said yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Then, we proceed to this question to Minister Winde. I am looking at the Whips.

An HON MEMBER: The hon Whip is sleeping.

Mr H P GEYER: Mr Deputy Speaker, Minister Winde is ill and we request that this question stand over.

*Question 2 stands over.*



*Taxi operations and identification: Silvermine Mountain, Fish Hoek and Simon's Town*

**3. Mr M G E Wiley asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

- (1) (a) How many taxis operated in the area south of the Silvermine Mountain, namely the Fish Hoek valley and Simon's Town areas, as at the latest specified date for which information is available, (b) how are these taxis identified, (c) to which taxi associations do they belong and (d) which routes are they allowed to use;
- (2) whether any illegal taxis are operating in this area; if so, how many?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you also to the hon member Mr Wiley. He asks questions about taxis operating in the area south of Silvermine Mountain, and the answer is:

3. (1) (a) Our records show there are 119 legal vehicles authorised to provide minibus taxi-type services in the Fish Hoek, Ocean View, Masiphumelele, Kommetjie, Noordhoek and Simon's Town areas. Legal minibus taxis can only be identified through inspection of the operating licences. In terms of the NLTA, the original operating licence or certified copy must be kept in the vehicle at all times and must be presented to an authorised officer when requested. All minibus taxi associations and members are also required to register

with the office of the provincial Transport Registrar. This is a prerequisite to applying for an operating licence to provide minibus taxi-type services. This information is captured in the Registrar's administration system. All operating licence information is stored in the land transport permit system. An operating licence is issued for a very specific route or network of routes but may authorise different types of services.

- (b) The land transport permit system is a national system which is currently administered and updated by regulatory entities and is not without its problems, hon member Mr Wiley. Information extracted from the Registrar's administration systems shows that 106 members are registered for this area. Between them they hold 119 valid operating licences. Obviously, some members have more than one, for routes connecting Fish Hoek, Ocean View, Masiphumelele, Kommetjie, Noordhoek and Simon's Town.
- (c) Three minibus taxi associations are registered with the office of the provincial Transport Registrar for the area south of Silvermine Mountain namely, the Fish Hoek valley and Simon's Town. They are the Fish Hoek Ocean View Taxi Association, FOTA, Ocean Valley Taxi Association, OVTA, which is also not without problems, and Masiphumelele Taxi Association, MASITA.

Our records show that an unregistered group has applied for

registration to provide minibus taxi-type services to and from the Red Hill area. This application is currently being processed but I cannot see where they can be accommodated without them infringing on the routes of one or more of the other associations I have mentioned.

- (d) FOTA members predominantly provide services from Fish Hoek to Ocean View and are also authorised to provide services to Sun Valley, Retreat and Wynberg. Members of Ocean Valley Taxi Association provide services from Ocean View to Sun Valley, Kommetjie and Simon's Town. MASITA are authorised to provide minibus services to Fish Hoek, Sun Valley, Kommetjie and Simon's Town. They also provide regular inter-provincial, so-called long distance services.

Then I have got all the routes listed here. I am sure the hon member Mr Wiley will not want me to read them all out.

- (2) The extent of illegal operations is determined by matching vehicle registration numbers recorded during minibus taxi surveys against the land transport permit system. The City of Cape Town undertakes regular surveys of all minibus taxi ranks and along the route network to determine passenger demand and the number of unique vehicles operating on a particular route. The City has provided my department with a list of unique registration numbers for these areas. Each registration was checked against the LTPS to determine if the vehicle is linked to an active operating licence.

Finally, a total of 251 unique vehicles were observed during the survey process. Of these 90, that is 36%, were linked to valid operating licences to the routes in question. A total of 58 that is 23% of the vehicles operated without valid operating licences and no matches were found in the system for these vehicles. A further 103, 41%, were found to have operating licences but not to provide minibus taxi-type services in the area referred to by the hon member. Most of these vehicles were linked to charter operating licences. These operators therefore, operated contrary to the terms and conditions of their operating licences.

Let me say in general to the hon member Mr Wiley that this is an area which is heating up in taxi terms.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, thank you very much for that full and comprehensive reply. You mentioned that there were 119 legal and 106 registered; can you explain why there is a discrepancy between those two aspects? Explain the difference.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Your short-term memory is better than mine. Let me just see where we are here. 106 and 119. 106 operators; that is 106 persons who have operating licences, but some have more than one operating licence. Not in this case, but in one case for Peninsula Transport an operator has 394 operating licences.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. In relation to point (b) of question one, the identification of these taxis; are the route markers the same as they used to be which is a bit of a square thing with a taxi on it with blue writing because a number of them have red and mirrored type figures of the same format but different colours. Are they valid?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Well, they should not be. They should all be the same. We actually supply those decals that are put on. What they look like is that little taxi symbol if you like at the top and then the route numbers that that area covers. In addition, the taxi should also have the name of the operator and his cell number. If they do not then they are almost surely illegal and as the hon member Mr Wiley is aware, there is a problem with illegals in this area and we do impound them as often as we can when our Metro police and traffic police are not busy cleaning up the N2.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I was just wondering whether the Minister could tell us now that we have identified a number of illegal operators, which necessitates the policing thereof? Is it done by his department or must the Department of Community Safety and the City do that? Who takes the decision?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Let me say first of all, my department has no law enforcement capacity at all, so it is done either by the municipal law enforcement, traffic or Metro in this case, or by the provincial traffic police who do not operate much in that neck of the woods, or

by the South African Police. The South African Police, in addition to their normal reluctance about things, are particularly reluctant in this area because they say they do not understand operating licences etc. We have offered to train them specifically in this area and hopefully that will reach somewhere. But, clearly as the hon member Mr Wiley has recognised by putting the question, this area is heating up and is due for some intensive surveillance and pretty active impounding of illegal taxis.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you very much.

*Mitchells Plain Hospital fire: financial and budget ramifications*

**4. Mr E J von Brandis asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

- (1) Whether there have been any financial and budget ramifications arising from the delays caused by the fire at the Mitchells Plain Hospital; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) what are the total costs that have been incurred in respect of the completion of the hospital?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, and also to the hon member Mr von Brandis. He asked about the Mitchells Plain Hospital. One of our glories of the south east. He asked if there was any delay in respect of a fire which occurred there. The reply is as follows:

4. No, there was no delay to the completion of the hospital. Practical completion was achieved on 18 February 2013 as per the contract. There have been no ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: ... December.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I do not know where the hon member gets that from. There have been no financial implications for the provincial departments of Health or Transport and Public Works as a result of the fire in the emergency centre on 9 May. The final account for the project is currently being prepared. The total cost incurred to date amounts to R510 071 213,42. From the South African taxpayers'... [Interjections.] We have this lovely myth you know that it is an ANC government that dishes out its money to us. It is the tax payers' money. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! No follow-up? Question – order! Question number five. Hon Ms Marais to the Minister of Community Safety.

*South African Police Service/VIP protection: complaints of abuse*

**5. Ms A J du Toit Marais asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

Whether, during the latest specified period of three years for which information is available, the South African Police Service (SAPS) has

received any complaints against (a) ordinary SAPS members and (b) members of the VIP protection unit in the Western Cape accusing them of abusing the blue lights on the vehicles they were driving in non-emergency situations; if not, how was this verified; if so, (i) how many complaints were received, (ii) what was the outcome of the investigation into such complaints in each case and (iii) what action has been taken in each case?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much for the question. The reply is as follows:

- 5 (a): Yes, complaints were received against four ordinary SAPS members for allegedly abusing blue lights during non-emergency situations. In one incident, blue lights were utilised in an official capacity that merits the use of blue lights and in the three remaining incidents, the perpetrator could not be identified due to insufficient information supplied.

An HOM MEMBER: Driving too fast.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: No action was then taken.

On question 5(b): The VIP protection unit is a national competency and resorts directly under the national commissioner of the South African Police Service and we can – that is up to the member, Mr Deputy Speaker - get the information from the commissioner. The Department of Community Safety has received



three complaints about the abuse of blue lights on such vehicles. Two complaints were about ordinary members and one complaint was about the VIP protection unit. In the case of the VIP protection unit, subsequent investigation concluded that the members used the blue lights within the prescripts. The complaints about ordinary members; one is still being investigated and one was finalised. No action was taken against any of these members. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No follow-up? We continue with ...Is there follow-up? Mr Skwatsha.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, with regard to the complaints you are referring to, do those complaints include the use of blue lights by a convoy of the Premier in Gugulethu at NY 111 two years ago?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Read the legislation; you will not ask silly questions.

Mr P UYS: There is no legislation.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, that is a brand new question.

An HON MEMBER: No it is not!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I am not aware of such an incident. I can ... [Interjections.].

THE MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The legislation says “if life is at risk”.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P UYS: That is not your question man.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Please continue Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I can get the information for the member and provide that. Thank you.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is it a point of order?

MR M SKWATSHA: Yes, I need protection from you Mr Deputy Speaker. The Premier says I put her life in danger.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please, no. There is no point of order. Mr Skwatsha ... [Interjections.] Order! Order!

Mr SKWATSHA: You and the Premier, yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr SKWATSHA: [Inaudible.] ... from me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Mr Skwatsha, that is not a point of order. It is a political point. Please take your seat.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Okay. I have a follow-up on that. I still have a follow-up.

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Mr Skwatsha?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes.

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you want to raise a point of order, you raise a point of order, or if it is not, then take your seat.

Mr M SKWATSHA: No, no I am through with the point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you asking a further question?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, I am with you. Second follow-up question.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes, I dispute that it is a new question. The hon Minister is responding to three year's from now.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: What is the point?  
[Interjection.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: What I am saying ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: What is the question?

Mr M SKWATSHA: The questions is – shhh. Shut up. [Laughter.] The question, Sir is: part of the complaints the hon Minister has been dealing with ...  
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Question.

Mr M SKWTASHA: ... was it – the abuse of the blue lights by a convoy of the Premier, was it part of those complaints you were investigating?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: No, it was not an abuse.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Abuse ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, the hon member Mr Skwatsha is referring to a specific incident and as I rightly said earlier, I do not have the information regarding that specific incident. I can get it for the member. It is as simple as that.

Mr M SKWATSHA: It was not a new question.

*South African Police Service VIP protection unit: discipline/dismissals*

**6. Ms A J du Toit Marais asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

Whether any (a) members of the South African Police Service or (b) members of the VIP protection unit in the Western Cape have been (i) disciplined or (ii) dismissed for abusing the blue lights on their vehicles during the latest specified period of three years for which information is available; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you and thank you also to the hon member Ms Marais for the question. The South African Police Service informed me as follows:

- 6. (a) No. That accounts for (a) (i) and (a) (ii) as well, and then;
- 6 (b) The VIP protection unit again, like the previous question, is a national competency and resorts direct under the national commissioner of the South African Police Services and we can get the information from

them.

And then, our own department's response: The department does not have any record of a SAPS member disciplined or dismissed for abusing blue lights on their vehicle. Thank you.

*City of Cape Town urban edge: Philippi horticultural area*

**7. Mr M Ncedana asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

Whether his department supports the proposal to move the urban edge of the City of Cape Town towards the Philippi horticultural area; if not, why not; if so, why?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The reply is as follows:

7. Due to the fact that it may still be necessary for me to apply my mind to the development proposal on the Philippi horticultural area, I therefore, cannot at this stage express my opinion on the matter.

*Construction standards for building of houses: Western Cape*

**8. Mr M Ncedana asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

What are the construction standards in the Western Cape when building a house funded by his department?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The reply is as follows:

8. All the housing construction funded by the Department of Human Settlements complies with standards contained in the National Housing Code of 2009, SANS 10400 national building standards, NHPRC standards, as well as minimum standards drafted by the Western Cape government. I have a long list of those building requirements or standards attached to this answer, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Ms T BEVU: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Does that include the top of the doorframe that is the lintel – on the top of the doorframe?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker.

*Water shortages/Conservation statistics: Western Cape*

**9. Mr R B Lentit asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

- (1) What were the relevant statistics in respect of water shortages in the Western Cape as at the latest specified date for which information is available;
- (2) whether water conservation and demand management by-laws or plans are in place in all the municipalities of the Western Cape; if not, (a) why not and (b) what is his department doing to address this situation; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mnr die Adjunspeaker, baie dankie en aan die agb lid mnr Lentit vir die vraag.

9. (1) So ver my kennis strek, ondervind geen munisipaliteit tans in die Wes-kaap watertekorte nie as ons kyk na die definisie soos uiteengesit, met ander woorde, nie langer as sewe dae sonder water nie. Dit is die wettige definisie.
- (2) Waterbewarings-verordeninge en/of planne, is in plek by alle munisipaliteite in die Wes-kaap. Waterverliese en die nie-inkomste uit water, is wat ek persoonlik dink die twee grootste problem waarmee ons te doen het in ons munisipaliteite. Hierdie twee bedrywighede



deur dorpe in die Wes-kaap word deur die Departement van Waterwese op 'n driemaandelikse basis gemonitor, en hulle kry verslae daaroor. Die Departement van Waterwese ondersteun sommige munisipaliteite finansieel deur middel van die Accelerated Community Infrastructure Program, die ACIP soos ons hom ken, met sommige waterbesparingsprojekte. Die Departement van Waterwese ondersteun alle munisipaliteite in the Wes-kaap met betrekking tot die ontwikkeling van detail wateraanvraagbestuurstrategie. Die implementering van hierdie strategieë is in verskeie stadiums van voltooiing. Die Municipal Infrastructure Grant, die MIG-program, finansiër ook verskeie waterbewaringsprojekte met die nodige ondersteuning van die Departement van Plaaslike Regering. Dankie

*Safe Schools Campaign*

**10. Mr R B Lentit asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

With reference to the Safe Schools Campaign, how has the information provided by schools and the awareness campaign influenced the demand for safety at schools in the Western Cape, especially in the metro region?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much, for the question. The reply is as follows:

10. Please note that the safe schools campaign falls under the Department of Education and questions of this nature should in future be directed towards

that department. Due to the ongoing gang violence in the province, the demand for safety at schools in the metro has escalated. The need is currently being addressed through a joint partnership between the Western Cape government, the City of Cape Town and the South African Police Service. My colleague, Donald Grant the Minister of Education in the Western Cape, ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: How can he answer this.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... has a number of initiatives aimed at tackling safety at schools. This province's education department carries out its safety operations ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Is there a point of order?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Raise your point of order.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: He wants to complain about the noise from hon member Mr Ozinsky.

Mr M SKWATSHA : No. In terms of the rules, is the MEC allowed to answer for something that he says he is not in charge of?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Minister may answer the question in the way he prefers. Minister, you may continue.

Mr M OZINSKY: That sounds like President Zuma over here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please, continue.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: May I continue.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you. Firstly, the use of physical security measures are introduced at schools. This includes safety measures such as safety gates, burglar bars, alarms, perimeter patrols by community volunteers and armed response as well as metal detectors and search and seizure operations that are performed together with the SAPS. Principals and staff are also encouraged to conduct their own search and seizure operations on the school premises. Should they reasonably suspect any learner of carrying dangerous weapons, the Western Cape Provincial School Education Act provides clearly defined powers to conduct search and seizure operations at schools. The majority of the violent behaviour is happening after school and off the school premises, but while we have the learners at school, during school time, we try our utmost to still give them a sense of responsibility, mutual respect and encourage positive lifestyles over and above the day-to-day education curriculum. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mr M OZINSKY: Could the hon Minister tell us which section of the Western Cape Schools' Act gives these powers?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: That for me is a new question, Mr Deputy Speaker. I can provide the member with the necessary answer at a later stage.

Mr M OZINSKY: Could the hon Minister tell us how much his department has spent on what he has been talking about?

An HON MEMBER: It is a new question.

Mr M OZINSKY: It is not a new question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I understand why hon member Mr Ozinsky is asking the question.

Mr M OZINSKY: Asseblief. You do not know what you are talking about. That is why.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Let me say to him that there is a clear link between education, and that with regard to safety at schools the two of us are working closely together. My colleague sitting right next to me, it is his budget that is in place here. Thank you.

Mr M OZINSKY: Does the hon Minister or his department have any powers under any legislation to do what he is talking about?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I have said to the member that safety, to a large extent, is also my competency to deal with.

Mr M OZINSKY: Why is Minister Bredell laughing at you.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I am not laughing at him. I am laughing at you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order Minister Plato. The next question is number 11, Mr Ozinsky to Minister Plato. Your question?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you.

Mr M NCEDANA: Point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry. There is a point of order.

Mr M NCEDANA: May I enquire if it is parliamentary for a member of parliament to say to another member “He is very stupid”?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: He is what?

Mr M NCEDANA: He is very stupid. He is stupid.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, it is not the thing to do. So, if a member did say that I would prefer that he withdraws it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is not proper. Who said that? Minister Plato.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I withdraw that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. You may continue with your ...

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: May I continue?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, please.

*Affidavit to Public Protector: relevant details*

**11. Mr M Ozinsky asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

- (1) With regard to the affidavit by a certain person whose name has been furnished to the Minister's department for the purpose of his reply, which was given to the Public Protector by the Minister, on what day did the office of the Minister receive the affidavit by registered post;
- (2) whether the Minister had a copy of the affidavit before he received it by registered post; if so, what are the relevant details in this regard;
- (3) whether he showed or provided the affidavit to any person beside the Public Protector; if so, to whom?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, and thank you for the question. The reply is as follows:

11. The affidavit was posted on 19 September 2012 as date stamped on the registered mail envelope and was received at my office a few days thereafter. An email was sent to my PA on 17 September 2012 from the Human Rights Office, and I quote from that email:

“The original affidavit will be sent by registered mail to Minister Dan Plato and we thank Minister Plato for the support regarding our client.”

And, I quote from a further email dated 21 September 2012:

“Dear Mr Plato. Please find attached the scanned affidavit. The original affidavit was sent by registered mail and you should receive it soon too.”

(3) The author of the affidavit informed me that he submitted it to some journalist at the same time that he had given a copy to me. The affidavit was discussed with my office staff and legal advisers. Based on their feedback I then submitted it to the Public Protector. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

Mr M OZINSKY: Did you give copies of that affidavit to any members of the press or any members of the public?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: No, not to members of the public, but to members of the press.

An HON MEMBER: Whoa!

Mr M OZINSKY: When you told the House that you were required to give the email, sorry the affidavit, to the Public Protector or another agency to investigate why did you not tell the House that you were distributing the same



email to the press as it is the truth?

An HON MEMBER: Why does he have to?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: At the time I submitted it to members of the press the affidavit was already public knowledge because as I said the author of the affidavit had already done it at that time.

Mr M OZINSKY: Did you meet with the author of the affidavit before you received either the email or the registered letter?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, no.

Mr M OZINSKY: Did you have any communication by phone, by email, by sms, by Whats -up, by Mxit or any other form with Mr Wyngard before he made that affidavit?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Speaker, I can gladly answer that question. No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, we continue to ... [Interjections.]  
Order, order, order! We continue with question number 12. Minister Grant.

*Rheenendal bus accident: legal representation and process*

**12. Mr M Ozinsky asked the Minister of Education:**

Whether his department retained legal representation for the inquest into the death of the 14 school learners who died in the Rheenendal bus accident in August 2011; if so, (a) when was the appointment made and (b) what process was followed in this regard?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The answer to question 12, Deputy Speaker, is as follows:

12. Yes. The services of an advocate were retained to represent the Department of Education. In terms of question (a), the office of the state attorney briefed the advocate on 18 June 2013; (b), Legal Services requested the services of the state attorney to act as the attorney's of record for the department. The office of the state attorney briefed an advocate to represent the department in consultation with Legal Services.

Mr M OZINSKY: Thank you, hon Minister. Has there been any cost incurred to the ...

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, yes. There has obviously been costs accrued, but I do not know what it is so far.

Mr M OZINSKY: Hon Minister, given that you know that the inquest has been coming for a long time, why was the first step only taken on 18 June?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, if I can recall from the myriad of press there were delays due to witnesses and expert testimony which needed to be collated prior to the inquest.

*Proposed closure of 27 Schools: costs to taxpayers*

**13. Ms M Tingwe asked the Minister of Education:**

What were the costs to the taxpayer of the court case relating to the proposed closure of 27 schools in the Western Cape?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: It is a busy day today, Mr Deputy Speaker. The reply is as follows:

13. The costs of the high court case were R1, 155,846.00, which includes both the high court proceedings and the approach to the constitutional court.

Ms M TINGWE: Was it value for money spent on the court cases?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: We did not start the court case. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Minister Carlisle. Please continue, Minister Grant.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is essential that we get clarity from the court on what is required to properly effect school closures

and the value needs to be also asked about the main reason for school closures, which is to enhance learning opportunities for children. I would therefore like to turn the question around and ask what the lost opportunity cost to the approximately 1700 children was who could have had access to a better education from January 2013?

The PREMIER: What about the 300 schools being closed ... [Inaudible.]  
[Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: Can the hon Minister share with us the breakdown of that R1, 155 million?

The PREMIER: And the 1000 schools in KZN.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker. I have just had it from her colleague Mr Magnus de Jongh through an enquiry to the *Son* on my iPad. I just want to say that it says here that Magnus de Jongh is questioning these figures. I want to share with the House that the R1.1 odd million I have mentioned is correct, on the back of verified invoices received for services rendered.

To corroborate this please find attached the answer the Minister has given to the legislature to this afternoon - which I have just given you. I would also like to point out to the hon member Ms Tingwe that our total fees are an indication of how carefully the Western Cape government manages its finances. The

application for leave to appeal and the appeal itself will also not add significantly to the legal costs as the majority of the documentation has already been prepared for the original high court processes and our legal team concerned are familiar with the matter. The value of providing quality education to these learners far exceeds the legal costs incurred.

Ms M TINGWE: The second one was not responded to because I asked for a breakdown.

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ask that question again if you want to.

Ms M TINGWE: I am still asking for a breakdown of the money?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I will gladly provide the hon member Ms Tingwe with the invoices that we have totalled up to just over R1.1 million. She is welcome to have them.

*Hessequa municipality: fire-fighting services*

**\*14. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

What is the current situation with regard to the rendering of fire-fighting services in the Hessequa municipality?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dankie aan die agb lid Mnr Uys vir die vraag. Die antwoord is soos volg:

14. Brandweerdienste in die Hessequa-munisipaliteit word tans deur Eden-distriksmunisipaliteit gelewer volgens 'n tydelike diensooreenkoms aangegaan tussen die twee munisipaliteite. Die vorige kontrak het op 30 Junie 2013 verstryk en word tans hersien. Daar is twee brandweerstasies, naamlik Riversdal en Stilbaai. Eersgenoemde word op 'n 24 / 7 grondslag beman terwyl laasgenoemde tydens die dag beman word en snags is die personeel op bystand. Die ander dorpe in die Hessequa-munisipaliteit word deur hierdie twee stasies bedien.

Spesialis brandweerdienste is beskikbaar vanaf ander brandweerstasies in die Eden-distrik. Die Wes-Kaap regering het vanaf 1 Desember 2012 tot 31 Maart 2013 vier brandbestrydingsvoertuie by Riversdal geplaas. 'n Soortgelyke reëling sal geld vanaf 1 Desember 2013 tot 31 Maart 2014. Dankie.

Mnr P UYS: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. LUR, het u enige klagtes gekry van die Hessequa-munisipaliteit oor die swak diens of geen diens wat Eden-distriksmunisipaliteit aan hulle lewer?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Nee, ek het geen formele klagtes ontvang

nie maar ons is bewus dat die diens dwarsoor die Wes-Kaap onder druk is. Dit gaan natuurlik om begrotings, maar met die beperkte begrotings wat ons het, is ek baie trots op wat hierdie span tot dusver al bereik het. Ons het 28 vliegtuie wat ons in die brand-seisoen orals oor hierdie provinsie heen plaas. Ons het 66% van ons brande binne die eerste uur geblus. Ons is bekommerd oor sekere dorpe by Laingsburg wat aan die N1 geleë is nie genoegsame brandweertoerusting, ens. het nie, maar ons is voortdurend besig om die kapasiteit sowel as die behoeftes aan toerusting op te bou in hierdie afdeling. Baie dankie.

Mnr P UYS: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Die LUR het gesê dat daar 'n diens op Stilbaai is. Hoekom het die diens op Stilbaai nie gereageer op die brand in Melkhoutfontein onlangs nie wat bloot een of twee kilometer van mekaar af is, en wel van Riversdal af wat u weet 40 kilometers ver is?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: We will try up here, I will give you that.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, as agb lede spesifieke probleme het, moet hulle dit tog vir ons deurgee. Ons het nie gesê die diens is perfek nie. Ek meen, op die platteland - ek kom van die platteland af - wanneer jy 'n dorpie bel om 'n brandweertrok vol water wat teen 50 kilometer per uur ry op 'n ander dorp te kry, teen die tyd wat jy daar kom is die huis afgebrand of die struktuur het uitgebrand. Ons besef dit, maar as u 'n spesifieke

probleem het, gee ons die probleem deur. Ons sal gaan kyk wat daar gebeur het en met 'n sinvolle antwoord terugkom, maar ek weet nie van elke oproep wat in die provinsie gemaak word na ons brandweerstasies toe nie.

*Land use planning: process for provincial or draft legislation*

**\*15. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

What process does he follow or will he follow to ensure that provincial legislation or draft legislation with regard to land use planning is brought into line with, and complies with, the National Spatial Planning and Land Use Management Act 16 of 2013, that was promulgated in the *Government Gazette* recently?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker vir die vraag. Die antwoord is soos volg:

15. Dit is 'n wetlike vereiste dat die toekomstige wet op Wes-Kaapse grondgebruikbeplanning met die onlangse gepromulgeerde Nasionale Wet op Ruimtelike Beplanning en Grondgebruikbestuur, Wet 16 van 2013, moet ooreenstem. Afgesien van die inagneming van die 62 stelle kommentare wat na afloop van die openbare deelnameproses oor die Wetsontwerp op Wes-Kaapse Grondgebruikbeplanning, 2013, wat gedurende Januarie en Maart vanjaar gehou is van belanghebbendes ontvang is, het my



Departement van Omgewingsake en Ontwikkelingsbeplanning ook probeer om die vereiste ooreenstemming met die nasionale wetgewing te bewerkstellig. Die departementele taakspan het ook in navolging van hierdie doelwit met die nasionale Departement van Landelike Ontwikkeling en Grondhervorming beraadslaag. Die hersiende provinsiale konsepwet word deur die hoofdirektoraat Regsdienste in die Departement van die Premier asook ons senior regsadviseurs hersien.

Hierdie oorsig sal ons help om die Wes-Kaapse Grondgebruikbeplanningswet met die Nasionale Wet op Ruimtelike Beplanning te versoen voordat die konsepwet na die provinsiale wetgewer verwys word.

Mnr P UYS: Baie dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Sal dit beteken, LUR, dat daar verdragings is met die LUPA soos u dit noem, en watter verdragings sal daar wees?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, dit is 'n baie beknopte of 'n beperkte tydraamwerk wat ons vir onself gestel het omdat dit rêrig van kardinale belang is dat ons hierdie wetgewing deur kry sodat ons beplanning nie in 'n lugleegte beland nie, maar u moet onthou ons verkeer in die baie moeilike situasie dat ons eintlike beplanningswetgewing deur die howe herskryf word, en dit alles baie moeilik maak. Ons het dus 'n tydraamwerk uitgespel en as alles goed verloop, sal ons die wetgewing betyds by die

Parlement kry, maar u moet onthou dat daar ander hofuitsprake is, grondwetlike hofuitsprake soos die Lagoon Bay, wat moet kom en dit kan soos ons sê in Engels 'n 'curve ball' na ons kant toe gooi, maar ons moet per slot van rekening aan die grondwetlike vereistes voldoen. So ja, ons beplan, ons gaan dit deurkry, maar dit is nie 'n definitief nie.

Mnr P UYS: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker, kan ek dan vra, gaan die Lagoon Bay-uitspraak of die moontlike grondwetlike uitspraak daaroor, 'n impak hê op u LUPA?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Of dit 'n impak gaan hê weet ek nie maar dit kan 'n impak hê. Dit hang af van die uitspraak en so ook enige ander grondwetlike uitsprake. Die Lutherse Kerk verlede week was een ten opsigte waarvan die departement ongeag wat die media gesê het, presies gekry het wat ons gevra het. Ons het die hof gevra om daardie uitspraak te gee. Die hof het saamgestem en nou moet die grondwetlike hof daarna kyk en dan sal alle aansoeke dienooreenkomstig hanteer word. Ons het dit gedoen omdat artikel 44 in baie uitsprake al vir ons in 'n rigting geneem het wat vir ons gesê het dit kan ongrondwetlik wees, iets waaroor ons nou sekerheid gekry het. Sodat almal weet, dit het veroorsaak dat ons oor die afgelope paar maande nie besluite geneem het oor beplanning nie, want ons wou nie ongrondwetlik optree nie. Daar is dus 'n agterstand van omtrent 400 aansoeke wat ons nou na hierdie uitspraak kan verwerk en baie vinnig deur die stelsel kan kry. Dankie.

Mnr P UYS: Baie dankie. Kan ek net vra of die LUR dan sy beleid aangepas het en ook die wetgewing aangepas het, LUPA aangepas het, en artikel 44 geskrap het of nie meer in ag neem nie?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dit sal ons doen na die grondwetlike hof alles bekragtig het. Ek is meer bekommerd in hierdie stadium om eerlik te wees, agb lid mnr Uys, oor die nasionale regulasies, want ons wetgewing moet voldoen aan nasionale wetgewing en ons kry nie die nasionale regulasies, PLUMA, sodat ons regulasies in lyn daarmee kan wees nie. 'n Ander probleem is - onthou ons munisipaliteite moet in lyn gebring word - dat ons as provinsie nie regulasies vir 'n munisipaliteit kan skryf nie omdat hulle 'n regeringsfeer is. Ons gaan dus help om met 'n stel regulasies na vore te kom, maar dit sal van elke munisipaliteit afhang om daardie regulasies te aanvaar of dan hulle eie te skryf, maar die grootste knelpunt wat ons tans het, is dat nasionaal kan nie vir ons hulle regulasies gee nie, want as nasionaal vir ons kan sê dit is hoe hulle regulasies lyk en ons kan nou al ons s'n in lyn bring dan sal die proses baie verhaas word. Dankie.

Mnr P UYS: Baie dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Ook in die nasionale wet word daar gepraat van die integrering van die informele nedersettings met bestaande ontwikkeling. In watter mate sien u gaan hierdie twee integreer?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dit sal wonderlik wees as ons dit kan

regkry, maar eerstens moet ons dit op skrif kry. Daar word baie op nasionale vlak gepraat. Ons het ons stel regulasies nou vir hulle gegee en gesê: “Kan julle vir ons afmerk watter julle sien in lyn met julle s'n is?”, want ek gaan sit met 'n scenario, en ek kan nie weer wag soos met die hofuitspraak van die DFU toe die nasionale span twee jaar lank niks gedoen het nie. Ons het gewag en nou moet ons ons wetgewing doen. Dit vat te lank. Ons skryf dus solank ons stel wetgewing en regulasies en hopelik met ons interaksie met nasionaal sal hulle vir ons sê wat in lyn is, sodat ons hopelik as 'n span vorentoe kan gaan en nie die beplanning in 'n lugleemte laat nie, want dit sal ontwikkeling tot stilstand bring.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That brings us to the end of questions. We now proceed to statements by members. I see the DA first. Hon member Mr Walters.

## **STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS**

Mr M C WALTERS (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Coprophagy is practised by many animals, ranging from some mammals and many insects and mite species. Common coprophagous species include dung beetles, houseflies and others which breed in manure.

The ANC-associated campaign to utilise human faeces and the strewing thereof on the steps of the Western Cape Parliament ... [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: The ANC?

Mr M C WALTERS: ...ostensibly as a protest against averred service delivery shortfalls ... [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: Not the ANC, not the ANC!

Mr M C WALTERS: ... is really an extension of their tactics to make the Western Cape ungovernable. It raises the following question: should the persons involved in this sick manifestation not be named “coprophiles” and the practice of it be dubbed “coprophilia”?

An HON MEMBER: Craprophiles.

Mr M C WALTERS: Not only is this a disgusting tactic incompatible with acceptable behaviour in all societies, but it also constitutes the exposure of the wider population to a range of infectious materials which pose serious threats to health. There are two ways in which this behaviour, unacceptable to all communities, can be countered:

1. The full weight of the court should be deployed on these coprophiles under all the laws and by-laws that can be brought to bear;
2. The opposition party should put pressure on these associates to stop unacceptable attacks on the values and sensitivities of the diverse

communities of the Western Cape as well as the environment.

They should also be charged with the destroying of council property, depriving the people of Cape Town of essential basic services and exposing others to a wide range of contagious and infectious diseases.

Merely expressing mild disapproval of such unacceptable behaviour will only further alienate public opinion regarding such behaviour.

The Democratic Alliance in the Western Cape expresses its utmost disgust with and abhorrence of this practice. We are convinced that all responsible citizens of all political convictions share our disgust.

By introducing such reprehensible actions into political debate, these coprophiles degrade the unique dispensation achieved in 1994 and the achievements of Nelson Mandela. [Time expired.]

Ms M TINGWE (ANC): Enkosi Sekela Somlomo. It is a dark day in the Western Cape since the Democratic Alliance Education MEC Donald Grant announced he is continuing with his illogical cause to wage war ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Dark day of the ANC!

Ms M TINGWE: ...against the poor and to close poor black schools.

The PREMIER: Oh really? What about the closing of schools in KwaZulu Natal?

Ms M TINGWE: It is part of the DA's plan to punish farm workers ...  
[Interjections.] ... as the majority are in rural areas and Afrikaans speaking.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: That is the ANC!

The PREMIER: A lot of nonsense!

Ms M TINGWE: This Democratic Alliance government under Premier Helen Zille lurches from crisis to chaos as the controversial closure has already been overturned twice by the high court. The constitutional court also rejected an application by MEC Grant. [Interjections.] He could not convince anyone ...  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms M TINGWE: ... that he acts ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Ms Tingwe.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: On a point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker. The hon member Ms Tingwe is misleading the House. The

constitutional court has not ruled on this matter. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, I gave some guidance last week that that is not a point of order. It is a political point [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: ...acts in the best interest of the learners as hard earned taxpayers' money is squandered by this DA ... [Interjections.] ... it continues to gamble with the future of our innocent children for narrow political objectives.

Ms M TINGWE: MEC Grant and the Democratic Alliance were repeatedly warned ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: A good education ... [Inaudible.]

Ms M TINGWE: ... but continued to disregard good advice and waste money.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: [Inaudible.] ... what you gave!

Ms M TINGWE: It is not surprising, Elder Carlisle, that the Democratic Alliance and MEC Grant now proceed with trumped-up reasons to discriminate against and disadvantage poor black learners.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Why is that



discrimination?

Ms M TINGWE: It is indefensible ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: We give them a good education; it is more than the ANC ... [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: Minister Carlisle, not one of more than 40 unavailable former model C schools ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Appropriate funds of a party to ... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Minister Carlisle, please just give her a chance to continue. Please continue. Please continue. [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: It is indefensible that not more, not one of more than 40 unviable former model C schools in so-called white areas is touched. This DA refuses to integrate many struggling small town's apartheid style schools, instead of waiting for national guidelines to be revised and put in place to regulate school closures ... [Interjections.] ... indeed MEC Grant is off recklessly burning more money in schools ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M TINGWE: ...that can be used to secure schools at risk in gangland areas.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Your time has expired hon member Ms Tingwe. The last sentence.

Ms M TINGWE: Okay. Remove the Democratic Alliance from government as it does not care for the poor. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: We sealed off the poor from the ANC but you do not ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Minister Carlisle, there is a point of order.

Mr P UYS: A point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker, from the moment hon Minister Carlisle walked in here he has really given us a running commentary. I would like you to address that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will watch that. I have been watching it myself, but I have also spoken to him since then but I will look at it from the Chair.

Mr P UYS: And secondly, Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Listen to the point of order please.

Mr P UYS: The Premier said to hon member Ms Tingwe “nonsense”, that is unparliamentary. I want her to apologise and withdraw that.

h AGB LID: Ag, nonsens!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, “nonsense” as far as I am concerned is not unparliamentary so I am not going to rule against that.

An HON MEMBER: That is nonsense.

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I am not going to address you on that. I would like to ask you to look at previous rulings. That was ruled unparliamentary.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, if we start ruling that ... I will do that. I will do that but if we start ruling that unparliamentary we are really stifling to a large extent. Let us carry on. The next one is the DA, the DA.

Mr H P GEYER (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. In the 2011 municipal elections the citizens of Stellenbosch overwhelmingly voted for the Democratic Alliance. Since then the DA has set a new vision and mission for Stellenbosch to transform Stellenbosch into the innovation capital of South Africa. This is a never ending mission which the municipality has been working on with great

success.

One of the major innovations is the rollout of wireless internet programs, aiming to make sure that all public spaces have access to internet. The rollout of the project has already begun with the town centre and Cloetesville being the first areas to benefit. The aim of the municipality is to make sure that all citizens in Stellenbosch have access to free internet, opening up unlimited innovation potential and liberating education possibilities for all.

In support of the Western Cape's 110% green initiative and part of the municipality's push for innovative job creation and the green economy plan, the municipality launched a "one million tree project" which aims to plant one million trees within the municipality, but more than that it aims to create jobs. Instead of buying seedlings the municipality will give seeds to communities to teach them how to correctly grow and care for the trees. The municipality will then buy back the trees from the communities creating skills in the process. Stellenbosch is the first municipality to undertake such a project in ensuring sustainable development.

The DA is committed to make Stellenbosch the innovation capital of South Africa.

'n AGB LID: Ja, ja.

Mr H P GEYER: The DA has showed political will in this municipality to help

it on its way ... [Interjections.] ... to become a leader in innovative local government solutions. I thank you.

Me J A VAN ZYL (COPE): Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Minister Carlisle, order, hon member Mr Ozinsky.

Me J A VAN ZYL: COPE verwelkom die ingryping van die Wes-Kaap regering om leerders te beskerm teen bendegegeweld in Manenberg, maar wat egter kommerwekkend is, is die bedrag van R6 miljoen uit die onderwysbegroting wat geneem is. Premier Helen Zille word aangehaal in die media dat sy nie in daardie stadium geweet het van watter program of programme van die onderwysbegroting van R12 miljard hierdie bedrag geneem word nie.

Bedrae is nou net deur die Minister van Onderwys genoem van R1,155 miljoen vir die regskoste ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Minister Carlisle, is it a point of order?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: As I heard the hon member, Mr Deputy Speaker, she referred to the hon Premier as Helen Zille. I just want to know if that is appropriate in this House during ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No. I did not hear that but if she did say that please

refer to the member as “honourable member”.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

Me J A VAN ZYL: Bedrae van meer as R1.155 miljoen word genoem vir regskoste ten opsigte van hofsake ... [Tussenwerpsels.] Sou hierdie bedrag nie beter kon aangewend word juis vir die 27 skole wat ter sprake is in hierdie genoemde hofsake nie? Alhoewel die lewens van leerders, onderwysers, administratiewe personeel en veilige skole nie onderhandelbaar is nie, moet gehalte onderwys in die provinsie ook nie in die slag bly nie. Die gebrek aan ingryping deur die nasionale regering en nasionale Minister van Polisie is 'n gruwelike onreg aan die mense van die benedegeteisterde gebiede op die Kaapse vlakte. Die ANC-regering se magspel en/of onvermoë of onwilligheid om in te gryp in die Wes-Kaap plaas menselewens op die altaar.

In belang van die mense van die Wes-Kaap en meer spesifiek benedegeteisterde gebiede vertrou COPE dat die vergadering wat agb premier Helen Zille met minister Mthetwa gehad het die rigting sal aanwys met betrekking tot hierdie probleem. Dankie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Ms V HANI (ANC): As it is women's month we especially hear the cry of mothers whose children were killed, raped, robbed or poisoned by drugs and gangsters across the province. We hear those whose mothers and children were

killed in increased gang warfare.

The spiritual and angel-guided DA community safety MEC Dan Plato served by some support staff that are suspected of being high on drugs, dalliances with known hardened criminals like drug lords and gangsters. In the meantime the DA is pumping public money into dubious fronts to fund gangsters and their activities. MEC Plato plays no little role in this endeavour to assist gangsters or to spend precious time with criminals ... [Interjections.] ... must tell him in the caucus. His antics are condoned by the DA and its leader Helen Zille who has this provincial government.

Me J A VAN ZYL: Honourable.

Ms V HANI: This indicates that this DA is standing behind the door while it tries to pin on the national government the spike of gang warfare since the DA took office. All the DA does is to send in its own politicised rogue municipal police force led by J P Smith. The ANC calls on the national police minister to take firm control of the situation in Manenberg and other gang riddled areas ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He must do his job.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: He did take control.

Ms V HANI: ... as this DA has no moral position ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Please finish off, hon member Ms Hani.

Ms V HANI: The ANC calls on the national police minister to take firm control of the situation in Manenberg and other gang riddled areas as this DA has no moral position to deal with law-abiding communities to assist in ridding these areas of criminals. Therefore they have to come in as national to help you in this province. [Time expired.]

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Go to your caucus and say that there!

Ms J L HARTNICK (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker, more often than not ...  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Please continue.

Ms J L HARTNICK: Mr Deputy Speaker, more often than not the youth is both perpetrators and victims of crimes. Today I focus less on the youth.  
[Interjections.] Please, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will. Hon member Mr Skwatsha, just give her a fair chance. Please start again. I will give you time. Please start again.

Ms J L HARTNICK: Mr Deputy Speaker, more often than not the youth is both



perpetrators and victims of crimes. Today I focus less on the youth and more on their parents, families and care givers. Criminological studies acknowledge the family environment as a significant contributing factor to the presence or absence of youth offending. A study on the causes of juvenile crime found that delinquency could be attributed to bad parenting. Criminological literature typically represents bad parenting as ineffective, inept or dysfunctional parenting and is commonly depicted as a risk factor for unhealthy social development and consequently such families become incubators of juvenile criminality.

Mr Speaker, over 2000 years ago Socrates wrote: “Children now love luxury. They have bad manners, contempt for authority. They show disrespect for elders and love chatter in place of exercise. Children no longer rise when elders enter the room. They contradict their parents, chatter before company and tyrannise their teachers.”

Sadly not much has changed. Reasons for this include neglect of parental authority, improper conduct, disproportionate severity, undue indulgence, permitting absence from school, weakness and other parenting deficits.

That said, Mr Deputy Speaker, I commend the Department of Social Development in its efforts to redress youth offenders and the lack of parental responsibility in the Western Cape. This includes the Children and Families Programme which is aimed at promoting the wellbeing of children and building resilient families and communities. In this way families are given the

opportunity and support to be self-reliant and able to care for and develop their children. It starts at home and as James Baldwin said: “Children have never been very good at listening to their elders, but they have never failed to imitate them.” I thank you.

Mr R B LENTIT (ID): Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA cares for the poor. A need for reliable public transport during morning peak hours is one that commands urgent attention. [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: But they are not doing that ... [Interjections.]

Mr R B LENTIT: During the constituency period I have taken the time to experience what our commuters go through on a daily basis as they are literally battling to make their way to their workplaces. Stations like Kuilsriver, Blackheath and Bellville are only three examples in the metro area that are packed with commuters from as early as 05:15 in the mornings.

A large fraction of these communities are low wage earning individuals whereas others battle to save costs on the ever increasing fuel price and peak hour road traffic. Though rail transport is the quickest and most economical it is also the most unreliable means. To many, Mr Deputy Speaker, it is the only means. Two to three decades ago these areas were not as densely populated. The extension of these areas seems to be the main cause of overcrowded trains and rail fatalities.

This has proved that the national government ignored census statistics as they

do not plan according to population growth. We must find ways to alleviate the high demand of rail commuting such as adding additional bus routes and schedules to accommodate areas lacking bus services, sometimes unsafe taxi services.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the critical state of the rail service as it is has a direct effect on our economically active population as well as our provincial economic wellbeing. We should be doing everything that we can to find solutions to this problem as it has a ripple effect on all segments of government in this province including education and health. I thank you.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE (DA): Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA has, since winning the Western Cape, committed itself to delivering a better life for all. This administration is driven to help the people of this province. We believe in the spirit that “better together” invokes, but there are those that have decided that this is not a goal worth working towards.

ANC Western Cape chairman, Mr Marius Fransman, is one such an individual. [Interjections.] His actions in this province prove that he does not want a democratic society but an ANC society. These two are not the same. Not a thing he says is without question.

’n AGB LID: Haai, o!

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: I shudder when I am reminded that he is a deputy

minister for internal relations and cooperation ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Internal?

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: He illustrates the type of character the ANC appoints to state positions ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

An HON MEMBER: Is the national outperforming ... [Interjections.]

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Is this department of international relations aware that the moonlighting Mr Fransman and his long-time associate Magnus De Jongh run the “Save our Schools” from that office? ... [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: Where? Can you show me? Can you prove that?

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Paraphrasing section 96 of the Constitution, it says ... [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: Commissioner’s enquiry.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: “A deputy minister may not undertake any other paid work, act in a way inconsistent with their office nor expose themselves to a conflict between their official responsibilities and private interests.”

[Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: Which other work? Which other work is he doing?

[Interjections.]

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: I doubt Mr Fransman even knows this section of the Constitution exists ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Perhaps next time he slips into the province to be the chairman of the Western Cape ANC, he best be reminded of it.

An HON MEMBER: Nice try!

Ms M TINGWE: Oh please.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Hon Mr Deputy Speaker, if Mr Fransman and Mr De Jongh cared so much about creating better opportunities ... [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: They do.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: They would be out fighting across the other eight provinces for other hundreds of schools ... [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: No, if they decide they ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon, Order! Order, hon member Ms Tingwe. Come on please.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: ... but they are not interested in better learning outcomes, only in furthering dirty campaigns for cheap political points. [Time expired.]

Mr M SKWATSHA (ANC): The ANC and our nation this week celebrated the glorious history of the freedom struggle under the banner of the United Democratic Front, which was a broad front to advance the cause of freedom ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Fransman was very bold in that he ... [Interjections.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: ... and its goals as it is now enshrined in our Constitution. We celebrated three decades since the start of the UDF and 22 years since we closed it down and buried that vehicle after the ANC was unbanned and we had won our freedom. The founding of the UDF was necessary as we resisted the National Party's social engineering and the tri-cameral Parliamentary elections founded in 1983 when we also resisted dispossession, repression and exclusion of our people through the 1913 Land Act.

The Mass Democratic Movement and its leaders worked with social society structures to unite against apartheid plans in order to gain a non-racial, non-sexist democratic South Africa. The UDF and its leaders' objective was to overturn the apartheid injustices, which was declared a crime against all of humanity. The ANC is still the only party that can realise the aspirations of our people.

Ms M TINGWE: Amandla!

Mr M SKWATSHA: As apartheid divided the UDF united our people, so today the ANC still unites while some continue on the lost road to nowhere to follow the National Party incarnate Democratic Alliance. [Interjections.] As the DA is still busy with its agenda to divide communities and sow division, exclude our people from various opportunities and continue with inferior services to poor black areas, we call on all people of the Western Cape to unite behind the ANC to fight this modern day monster and create a prosperous Western Cape. Long live the spirit of the UDF, long live! [Time expired.]

Ms M TINGWE: Long live!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: When was Fransman in the UDF, hon member Mr Skwatsha? Where was Fransman?

Mr G C R HASKIN: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Minister Carlisle, your voice is very strong and the frequency of using it today - that combination is very deadly in the House.

Mr G C R HASKIN: It seems he has changed his batteries.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Mr Haskin.

Mr G C R HASKIN: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Standing Committee on Community Safety visited the Manenberg SAPS station on Tuesday as part of our oversight role. The ACDP found this to be most informative in terms of the level of detail of information provided by station commanders ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! No, no, no. We cannot simply start shouting here. I am appealing to the House, please give the hon member a fair chance. Please continue.

Mr G C R HASKIN: The ACDP found this to be most informative in terms of the level, the detail of information provided by the station commander and his team and the cluster commander. For that the ACDP thanks and commends them. It was also instructive in terms of the many causes and solutions to the crisis that they are proposing whilst so many political and media commentators have been focusing almost solely on and criticising the role of the SAPS and their partners in the situation demanding that they act immediately. The ACDP has repeatedly called for all role players and not just SAPS to urgently work



together to find sustainable solutions.

I was pleased to note that Brigadier Van Dijk and his team have echoed this call but intensely disappointed and angered to note that the education role players in Manenberg continue to be largely unresponsive to SAPS calls for partnership and cooperation.

Brigadier Van Dijk informed us that he has not even been able to get school leadership including principals, educators and school governing bodies around the table, even recently, to discuss how they can help the SAPS, contrary to claims in media statements in this regard. This is clearly unacceptable and has probably contributed to the crisis in Manenberg. Some of the challenges cited include that truancy in Manenberg is high already and increasing to some 80%; that more and more school girl learners are being close with, and even part of, gangs because searching them is hard and transporting drugs and illegal firearms has become easier. Teachers leave the area at 2 pm leaving the learners to their own devices for the rest of the afternoon.

The ACDP's call is simple. Minister Grant and the head of department must step in themselves to ensure that the education stakeholders in the 26 Manenberg schools immediately become active in their support for and work with the SAPS, to become part of the solution to the challenges in Manenberg. Instead of spending millions as we have heard today, on legal challenges, they should be channelling that money towards this crisis.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please finish off. Your time has expired.

Mr G C R HASKIN: We are convinced that if all 26 Manenberg school leaders stepped in to assist the SAPS as they should have been, we will see solutions that are long term becoming evident to the community of Manenberg. [Time expired.]

Mr M G E WILEY (DA): Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. If I may, I just wonder how many of those teachers in Manenberg belong to SADTU.

An HON MEMBER: That is a good question!

Mr M G E WILEY: The Western Cape Constitution states in section 67(3) that “the provincial Parliament must receive an annual report from the provincial commissioner for policing in the Western Cape.”

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.] ... your attitude.

Mr M G E WILEY: May I have some protection please?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Please continue.

Mr M G E WILEY: A recent ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please members, please allow the member the

opportunity to start his statement and do so in peace.

Mr M G E WILEY: A recent legal opinion by the new parliamentary adviser has confirmed our rights as described above, not only that, but that the annual report must have a specific format and content. Several requests to the SAPS over the last few years for such a report have not borne fruit and this legislature has had to be content with presentations in question and answer sessions from the provincial commissioner's office.

It should be clear to all that a specific annual report has to be tabled with Parliament and not just an annual presentation of a report to a standing committee. It has now been confirmed that the SAPS does in fact produce an annual report in the Western Cape but fails to submit it to this legislature. This was last done in 2006 and even the Department of Community Safety last received a copy in 2007/8.

Furthermore, it has been confirmed that the SAPS does formally submit annual reports in other provincial legislatures and we have received copies of reports for the year 2011/12 from other provinces. Annual reports contain critical information which allows the relevant committee to interrogate the department with this base information.

The failure to submit a formal annual report has several significant impacts. Firstly, it is a breach of the law and can have audit implications. It prevents comparative statistical analysis from one year to the next; it prevents informed

critical criticism of failed strategies and poor results, and more importantly, restricts one's ability to constructively contribute to identifying solutions - in this particular case the Annual Policing Needs and Priorities Plan. The only question remaining that must be asked: have the people of the Western Cape been negatively affected by crime because the legitimately elected government has been denied critical tactical information?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That brings us to the end of statements. We now proceed to motions. Are there any motions where notice is given? Hon member Ms Labuschagne.

### **MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

Me C LABUSCHAGNE: Dankie, mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek gee kennis dat ek op die eersvolgende sittingsdag sal voorstel:

Dat die Huis kennis neem van die volgehoue prestasie van die Wes-Kaapse Departement van Onderwys sedert 2009 ten opsigte van LitNum-uitslae, retensievlakke vir Grade 10 tot 12 en onderpresterende skole, en derhalwe die Premier, die Minister en sy Departement gelukwens en hulle alle voorspoed toewens vir die uitdagings wat die toekoms van die onderwys in die provinsie inhou.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, notice is taken. Are there any further? Hon member Ms Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses Cape Town Mayor Patricia De Lille's wastage of R500 000 on the Cape Town Fashion Week's gala dinner whilst the fashion industry is in need of funds.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice is taken. Any further, hon member Ms Tingwe?

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses why 50% of the learners in Mitchells Plain did not attend school when the DA closed schools in Manenberg in response to gang violence?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice is taken. Any further, are there any further? Hon member Ms Hartnick.

Ms J L HARTNICK: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates parental responsibility amidst increasing youth delinquency, substance abuse and gang violence in the Western Cape.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice is taken. Hon member Ms Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the Western Cape government's ploy to undermine the work of the South African Police Service and run away from its

responsibility in combating gangsterism by calling for the deployment of the army to the Cape Flats.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice is taken. Are there any further? Any further? Hon member Mr Skwatsha, are you getting up? You are not giving notice of a motion? Any further notices of motion, hon member Ms Tingwe?

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the poor state of learner transport in the province, especially in rural areas.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice is taken. Are there any further? If not, then we proceed to motions without notice. Hon Rossouw.

## **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

Me A ROSSOUW: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy gelukwense oordra aan die nuwe DA-raadslede wat op 7 Augustus verkies is in Bergrivier, Oudtshoorn, Overstrand en George, te wete raadslede Danny Smith in Bergrivier; Jurie Harmse in Oudtshoorn; Melvin Naik in George en Kari Brice in Overstrand waar die ANC slegs agt stemme gekry het.

[Kennisgewing van voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any further, Hon member Ms Tingwe?

Ms M TINGWE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its heartfelt sympathy to the family and friends of the learners killed in the Rheenendal bus tragedy, as Saturday will mark its second anniversary.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Von Brandis.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis me Jacqui Gooch gelukwens met haar aanstelling vanaf 1 November 2013 as nuwe hoof van die Departement van Vervoer en Publieke

Werke, en verder dat die Huis mnr Johan Fourie bedank vir sy 40 jaar lojale en toegewyde diens as staatsamptenaar en veral vir die laaste drie jaar as hoof van die Departement van Vervoer en Publieke Werke.

[Kennisgewing van voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie. Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing nie? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie?

Goedgekeur.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid me Witbooi.

Ms J WITBOOI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its sympathy to the thousands of people who have lost their homes due to the flooding in the City of Cape Town and call on the people of the Western Cape to come to the assistance of these people.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.



Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid me Labuschagne.

Me C LABUSCHAGNE: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die Minister van Onderwys en die Wes-Kaapse Departement van Onderwys gelukwens met die feit dat 100% van die klagtes wat gedurende April en Mei 2013 by die presidensiële ‘hotline’ aangemeld is aan die einde van Mei opgelos is. Dit is ’n bewys van die minister en sy departement se erns en toegewydheid tot onderwys.

[Kennisgewing van voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing nie? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie?

Goedgekeur.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Tingwe.

Ms M TINGWE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that on a recent oversight visit members of the National Assembly expressed their concern at the high drop-out rate in farm schools in the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion without notice? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further, hon member Ms Hani.

Ms V HANI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Lorna Scheepers and Charmaine September for being elected Cederberg Mayor and Deputy Mayor respectively during women's month.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion without notice? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? For the last time, hon member Mr Walters, are you getting up?

Mr M C WALTERS: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is a bit slow but you are getting there.

Mr M C WALTERS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its congratulations to the Springbok rugby team and its coach Heyneke Meyer on their record victory over Argentina.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Prins.

Ms E PRINS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the Western Cape High Court has overturned MEC Anton Bredell's unconstitutional go-ahead for the controversial plan to spoil a landmark and historic precinct in the heart of the Mother City around the Lutheran Church complex.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion without notice? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? Hon member Mr Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House requests the President to rename the cabinet post of the Deputy Minister of International Relations and Cooperation to that of Minister of Internal Unrest.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there an objection to the motion without notice? Order! There is an objection. There is more than one objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Ms Prins.

Ms E PRINS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses its gratitude to Richard van As for making and donating the robo-hands to Flippie Engelbrecht, 19, who lost his eyesight and developed epilepsy after he was allegedly assaulted by a farmer when he was 15 years old, and thanks the ANC in the Western Cape for bringing this to light.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself? [Interjections.] Sorry, is there an objection? I couldn't hear Minister Carlisle, was there an objection?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The objection will be noted. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further? Order! Are there no further? Hon member Mr Ncedana.

†UMnu M NCEDANA: Eee... hayi bendicela Somlomo indlu ihalalisele

uMphathiswa wezemidlalo ngala ngqungquthela ebethe wayenza ibizwa ngobana yi Mandela day eRhawutini, apho khona sitsho sabona abantu baseMzantsi Afrika bedibene kunye, bexhentsa kunye bevuyisana nokukubona iSiport sipromota, noku fund raisela ke ne Mandela children fund.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

\*Mr M NCEDANA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Minister of Sport regarding the celebration that was held for the Mandela Day children fund in Johannesburg where we witnessed people of South Africa united and dancing together in celebration, and for the promotion of fund raising for the Nelson Mandela Childrens' Fund.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you giving notice of a motion? I did not get the whole thing, but you must have a signed copy for the Table.

Ms M TINGWE: Amandla!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any further? Sorry, is there an objection to that? No objection?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any further? Nothing? Before we continue

with the Order Paper and get to the subject for discussion the Speaker has allowed the hon Minister Dan Plato to make a personal explanation in terms of Rule 63 and the Minister has three minutes to do that. Minister Plato.

### **EXPLANATION IN TERMS OF RULE 63**

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you very much. Mr Deputy Speaker, the impression has been created that the affidavit in question is my affidavit and that I played a role in drafting it. This is blatantly untrue. The information is not mine and the affidavit is not mine. The allegations were not made by me but by an individual who approached me with his lawyers from the Human Rights NGO. People approach my office on a daily basis with all kinds of complaints. They are studied and then referred to the relevant authority or addressed internally. When there are allegations of a criminal nature it is my duty to report these to the authorities. It is not my duty, nor my mandate, to investigate whether criminal allegations are true.

Hon member Mr Ozinsky wants to know what I did to verify the allegations. I sought legal opinion on what best to do with the information and then on this advice I submitted it to the Public Protector. Hon member Mr Ozinsky said that I should have verified and investigated the claims in the affidavit but I could not do this because it is beyond my oversight mandate and powers. In the past the ANC has complained in this House and accused me of trying to overstep my powers in the form of the Community Safety Act, an Act that they voted against, yet the Community Safety Act does not give me powers of investigation that the

member now wishes to confer on me.

The member also questioned the so called links between this Government and the Projects Abroad Human Rights Office. I could pose the same question back. The NGO runs two legal clinics, one of which is via the Proudly Manenberg Centre. The Chairperson of Proudly Manenberg is none other than Mario Wanza, a known ANC stalwart.

Mr M OZINSKY: He is not in the ANC any more.

An HON MEMBER: He is not anymore!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, the NGO is registered with the Cape Law Society as a legal aid clinic. The legal experts from this organisation that assisted the person told me that the affidavit had sufficient detail and consistency to be taken seriously. They believed I was obligated as Community Safety MEC to follow up on these allegations. I did so within my limited mandate. I gave it to a Chapter 9 institution to be investigated impartially and independently ... [Interjections.] I did so discreetly and made no public fuss about it.

Mr M OZINSKY: That is also a Chapter 9 institution.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I did it because criminal activities come at the price of safety and lives. The complainant in an interview with

*Weekend Argus* confirmed that the allegations were his own. He confirmed that I did not draft the affidavit for him ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: He was told by an angel to say this.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: He confirmed that he stands by his story that certain top ANC officials are involved in criminal activities ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What?!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The Human Rights Office confirmed that as well. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Order! Hon member Mr Ozinsky. Before we carry on to the next point on the Order Paper, let me just make a short ruling about this issue. Minister Plato has now had an opportunity to make an explanation and on 1 August the Hon member Mr Ozinsky was allowed to do the same. It is clear from these two episodes that the rules governing personal explanations need to be tightened just a little bit. It is certainly not fair to allow a member an opportunity to make an explanation and in so doing effectively afford the member an opportunity to criticise or attack another member or to make controversial statements and then not allow an aggrieved member the right to reply.



The current rule only provides that the member must confine himself or herself to the vindication of his or her conduct. In my view this leaves a gap for a member to go further and criticise or attack another member or cast aspersions or make controversial statements. I do not think that was the original intention of our rule drafters and it should therefore not be allowed. I will therefore ask that the interpretation and possible amendment of this rule be placed on the agenda of the Rules Committee. Allowing a personal explanation or not is always at the discretion of the Chair. Until the Rules Committee expresses itself on the matter any further request for an opportunity to make a personal explanation will therefore be considered by the Chair only upon a fully motivated written request to the Speaker accompanied by the text of the explanation and the Speaker concurs with the proposed action. The Rules Committee meets next week, by the way.

Thank you, that disposes of this. I think the Speaker will take over now.

Mr M OZINSKY: And that should come in 2019.

†UMnu M NCEDANA: Ewe Somlomo ...

\*Mr M NCEDANA: Yes, Mr Speaker...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry, is that a point of order?

Mr M NCEDANA: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Raise your point of order.

Mr M NCEDANA: The point of order is on the Speaker's list.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We have not reached the next point yet, but I will hear your point of order.

Mr M NCEDANA: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, I note that the ID has six minutes in total in the Speaker's list and when I spoke about the matter with the Chief Whip she said the small parties are given six minutes when they are sponsoring a debate. Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to register in this House that every time COPE and the ACDP are sponsoring the debate they are not given six minutes ... [Interjections.] So this is happening for the second time. When it happened last year I stood up and I raised it and when we sponsored the debate we were not given that six minutes. Whenever it is the ID they are given extra time.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mr Ncedana. I get the gist of what you are saying. Unfortunately the Chair cannot make a call. I cannot make a ruling on issues which are really for the programming authority. May I then request the programming authority when they meet again to discuss the subdivision of times between and among parties. If there is an issue then it must be sorted out but unfortunately for this debate it must stand as it stands. That is my ruling. Thank you.

Mr M SKWATSHA: So for this debate the ID gets four minutes?

An HON MEMBER: Six.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The ID gets the minutes as printed on the speakers' list.

### **SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION**

*The success of the Democratic Alliance Cape's pro-poor programmes  
and proposals that it will be benefiting the people of the Western Cape.*

Mr R B LENTIT (ID): Mr Speaker, 76% of the Western Cape provincial budget is directed towards opening opportunities for people in poor communities ...  
[Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: That is not true ... [Inaudible.]

Mr R B LENTIT: ...through education, health care services, housing and social development programmes. This is redress in action. [Interjections.] This is reconciliation. This is service delivery. This is bridging the divides between the rich and the poor of the Western Cape province.

Mr Speaker, it is common knowledge that the ANC voted against an average of 96% of departmental budgets over the past four years in this House and 100%

against IDP's and council budgets where they are in opposition. Around 80% of the Western Cape Education Department's budget is allocated to items including text books, stationery, learner transport and feeding schemes to the poorer 60% of the Western Cape learners.

Mr Speaker, all healthcare services are prioritised in poor communities and 80% of all patients receive free services. The Western Cape Department of Social Services has introduced a feeding scheme at MOT centres in the poorest areas which provides meals to children on a daily basis. In each of the municipalities where the DA governs the ANC voted against DA budgets and proposals intended to benefit the poor people of our province.

Here are some of the facts: in Mossel Bay on 30 May 2013 the ANC voted against the budget which includes 50 units of free electricity and 60 kilolitres of free water. It also included an increase on the joint income limit of pensioners to qualify for a discount of 50%. In Drakenstein, on Friday 24 May 2013, the ANC voted against the approval of a community driven budget. The practical implication of the budget for poor households are 100 free electricity units per month, free refuse removal, free sanitation service and free housing rental service for poor households.

In George, at a council meeting on 29 May 2013, the ANC rejected the George Integrated Development Plan and the ANC described the budget as a "waste of time". The ANC voted against the proposal for arrears related to housing instalments or rent to be written off. Skande!

Mr Speaker, the City of Cape Town's budget for the financial year, for this financial year, focuses on the poor with nearly 60% of the budget being allocated to direct service provision to previously disadvantaged areas. In February the ANC under the leadership of Tony Ehrenreich abstained from voting on a decision to write off arrears for poor residents ... [Interjections.] ... while the DA majority voted in favour of writing off the arrears for properties with a municipal valuation of R300 000 or less. Skande! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member Mr Skwatsha. Order!.

Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, on 29 May the ANC caucus in the City of Cape Town voted against an amendment to provide free electricity for the poor in Khayelitsha. If it was not for the DA majority vote the poor people of Khayelitsha, Gugulethu, Elsies River and Mitchells Plain were nearly denied 30 amps connection access to free basic electricity.

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Lentit. Your time has expired.

Mr R B LENTIT: In conclusion, Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr R B LENTIT: In conclusion, Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon members!

Mr R B LENTIT: In conclusion, Mr Speaker, if the ANC continues to vote against the DA poor initiatives the 2014 election budget will be opportunity ...  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you hon member [Interjections.]

Mr R B LENTIT: ... as the people of the Western Cape will reduce them to size at the ballot box ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member Mr Lentit, order!

Mr R B LENTIT: I thank you. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Skande!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Von Brandis over to you. [Interjections.] Order honourable members!

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Speaker, I want to start by saying that South Africa's unemployment has reached its highest level since the beginning of our democracy.

Mr P UYS: In the Western Cape.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: South Africa's economic growth is well below the level needed to grow jobs. It will be some time before the country can reverse this but the Western Cape government has drawn up budgets and policies that will help this government to achieve economic growth, address the plight of the poor and redress inequality. We know that inequality of assets and opportunity hinders the ability of poor people to participate in and contribute to economies leaving them trapped in a cycle of poverty. Pursuing pro-poor growth policies are critical to creating and achieving sustainable growth. Having a job and acquiring an income provides an opportunity to grow social mobility and to lessen poverty.

Official unemployment in South Africa is now at 25.6%. The Western Cape's unemployment is at 24%, but this government believes that one unemployed person is one too many. Mr Speaker, while the unemployment in the Western Cape is 1.6% below national average it is also far better than in the rest of the country. Looking at some of the other provinces, Gauteng's unemployment rate sits at 25%, Northern Cape at a staggering 35.9%, Mpumalanga 29.4%; and the Free State 33.1% ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members! You may proceed.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: The DA led ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Is it a point of order, hon member Mr Skwatsha?  
[Interjections.] Order! Order hon members! Hon member Ms Hani, order! Is it a point of order, hon member Mr Skwatsha?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Is the hon member Mr Von Brandis allowed to mislead the House?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha, what do you mean to “mislead the House”?

Mr M SKWATSHA: There is no province called “Mapumalanga”.

The SPEAKER: It is not misleading the House. It is a pronunciation so you cannot say the member is misleading the House. Order! No thank you, hon member Mr Skwatsha. You may carry on, hon member Mr Von Brandis.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Thank you. Mr Speaker, the DA-led Western Cape has committed itself to creating an environment where all citizens but especially our poorer citizens are given a chance to live better lives. A good economy does not just create jobs. It creates opportunities but you need the government and budgets that can do this. Mr Speaker, the Western Cape government focuses the spending of South African taxpayer’s money on our principal departments, not ANC money. With the present president managing the taxpayer’s money as his own for example Nkandla, we can understand the ANC’s members’ confusion in



this regard. In any case we spend it on health, education and human settlements in less advantaged areas and communities so that we can improve living conditions and standards and increase access to opportunity. That is why we spend 76% of our budget on poorer communities.

Mr M OZINSKY: On salaries! On salaries!

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: In health 78% of the - on yours as well.

Mr M OZINSKY: On your salaries!

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: On yours as well.

Mr M OZINSKY: It is 80% on salaries.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: In health 78% of the provincial department's budget is spent on providing health services ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: On salaries!

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Ozinsky, order!

Mr E J VON BRANDIS (DA): ...to the poor municipalities across the province and wards in the City of Cape Town. 80% of our patients receive free services or pay a nominal fee dependent whether or not they fall in age one of the

national income bracket. In education there are some 673 no-fee-schools in the province to which over half a billion rand has been allocated. We know how education is a key in creating opportunity which is why we are tackling the plight of learners in poorer areas through these interventions. In Human Settlements the department spends 90% of its budget in poor communities. The provincial government is funding twelve housing projects in the Cape metro area alone. There are a 1002 early childhood development centres and 70 after-school centres in the province. We care for the elderly through the funding of 126 old age homes and 226 service centres. 61% of the Cultural Affairs and Sports budget is directed towards the poor areas. Some R29 million has been designated for 180 MOD centres throughout the province. This DA-led government cannot be accused of not having pro-poor programmes in place; nor can it be said that this government does not care about bettering the lives of our poorer citizens. We know from research that pro-poor growth is effective at reducing poverty. The DA-led government will continue to drive forward with its pro-poor programmes and continue to run a functional government capable of delivering without corruption on these programmes if we are to achieve sustainable economic prosperity.

On a national level the black management forum believes however that corruption continues to be the biggest threat to democracy, and I quote: "It robs us from achieving our goal." Thank you.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL (ANC): Thank you. Mr Speaker, I was astounded when I learnt that the Democratic Alliance chose this specific topic for debate this

afternoon. I was astounded because I found it shocking and profoundly insensitive for them to want to sing their own praises in the face of the string of brazen failures in the province. I will not continue to repeat stats. You have heard enough of it from the other two speakers. I will give you the real picture; the overall picture that you see.

Service delivery protests, lack of sanitation, hospital staff taking own initiative for better working conditions ... [Interjections.] ... farm worker strikes, unemployment growth rate; slow pace of economic opportunities in the rural areas are all examples of what is happening in poor areas, proving that the DA's pro-poor policy means exactly the opposite. It is one thing for the DA and the DA government to profess in public that they follow a pro-poor policy. It is quite another thing when the actual poor live a much different reality.

An HON MEMBER: That is right yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: And it is in the face of that hypocrisy that I find the choice of today's topic particularly callous. I find it callous because while they want to rant and rave about their supposed successes in reality, while we speak, Mr Speaker, we have a Manenberg that is virtually in lock down.

HON MEMBERS: Why? Why?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: MEC Plato, instead of accepting ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Why?

The SPEAKER: Order! Order honourable members! Order!

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Von Brandis order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Instead of accepting affidavits from gangsters who speak to angels look after the living angels in our communities - our youth! Implement safety measures at schools with whatever is at your disposal.

An HON MEMBER: Which is exactly what we did.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Spend your budget on measures to eradicate gangsterism.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Because in spite of your hours of discussion with gang bosses on the pretext of finding solutions, crime in this province is actually escalating.

An HON MEMBER: That is your mandate ... [Inaudible.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Do not use CPF structures to collate information about the police. Work with them instead of badmouthing their initiatives... [Interjections.] As a matter of fact ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: They are running away.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: As a matter of fact, Mr Speaker, the plan to avert the crisis in Manenberg was tabled and put together by the police of Manenberg. [Interjections.] On Monday we attended a meeting with all of those teachers and the police ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Minister Carlisle, please stop this running commentary please. Minister Plato, sorry, Minister Carlisle. Minister Plato!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Speaker, the DA professed policy of an open opportunity society supposedly seeks to affirm the poor, yet the very poor remain the forgotten citizens of the Western Cape. Mr Speaker, let us see how poor pro-poor MEC Grant ... [Interjections.] was when it comes to Manenberg. Here we have an MEC who is so disconnected from the realities of Manenberg that he thinks by closing fourteen schools the children would be safer at home. Astounding!

An HON MEMBER: SADTU members ... [Inaudible.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The MEC pro-poor does not consult with the affected

poor, does not suggest alternative places of safety, does not know that closing schools would leave children unsupervised and more at risk ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Listen!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... but he takes up the arrogant attitude when addressing teacher representatives. Just how much is this MEC spending on securing safe communities or - no - I will get to that part now. That is MEC Plato ... [Interjections.]

h AGB LID: Ja, maak reg.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: No, because if he did he would have known that in the ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... in the poor gang infested areas unlike in their favourite rich areas schools are in fact a place of refuge and safety but of course as we have seen in yet another court judgement the supposed pro-poor MEC is not one for consultation, completely disconnected from the poor. What he does do, Mr Speaker, is to deploy one of his favourite - shame, a fall guy - poor Mr Lyness to be the face of consultation on his behalf. We need to ask what exactly must still happen for MEC Grant to get off his arrogant horse and learn to first engage with people who will be affected by his desktop decisions. Even the

recent court judgment lambasted him and his department ... [Interjections.] ... for their supposed consultation, saying it was lacking in qualitative engagement. It was mechanical and merely ticking boxes for compliance but guess what, Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Of course, what do you think? But guess what, Mr Speaker, this pro-poor MEC now again uses taxpayer's money and wants to appeal against this decision. Has he even applied his mind to the inevitable social costs of all his bureaucratic decisions?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: What about the social costs of not taking this decision?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: This and the Manenberg school closures just show how distant he is from the reality of the poor.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The ANC closes schools.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: We in the ANC have always maintained and we still do that pro-poor DA is gradually but definitely closing down the democratic space to interact with people.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Ag shame!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Again professing open opportunity but in reality closing down the space. The DA now wants us to debate the successes but they have over the years stumbled from crises to crisis in this province.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Their management of this province has at best been reactive and at worst seriously lacking.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Compared to whom?

The SPEAKER: Order hon member.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: This clearly indicates the sorry absence of a macro interventionist's plan to address the underlying causes of our social ills. Their reactive and patchwork management of people's lives reflects the absence of the macro plan. That is why they want to call in the army to manage troubled communities even though they have been repeatedly told that the army have a different mandate ... [Interjections.] ...but that is Manenberg. [Interjections.] We have not even begun to speak about the gang violence and shootings in places like Kleinvlei, Nyanga, Mitchells Plain, Kraaifontein and other poor communities.



What is the pro-poor action plan for these areas? Do these honourable pro-poor members of the DA even know where for instance Kleinvlei is?

An HON MEMBER: I know where it is. ... [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: But you see they want to deflect the attention away from the absence of a plan by calling the army ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Why did they vote for us in the Western Cape, hey?

The SPEAKER: Minister Carlisle!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...so that they can blame national government ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Why did they vote for us [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Minister Carlisle, order please.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...for their failure to carry out their mandate, but in actual fact admitting that they need national government ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Whose mandate? The police ...

[Inaudible.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... to alleviate their incompetence. The DA government continues to profess to be a pro-poor government yet as we can see there is a remarkable disjuncture in what they say and in their approach to address the underlying causes of our social integration. MEC Grant should learn from his colleagues. Unfortunately ... [Interjections.] MEC Winde is not here today. As an example MEC Winde will go and sit and stake out a shebeen until two o'clock in the morning to see whether the complaints that the poor people have made have truth in them and only then will he make a decision. This is only one example of somebody who takes the poor into consideration before making a decision.

An HON MEMBER: That is the DA. That is the DA.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Speaker, he must learn, he must teach his colleagues. ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Speaker, I can also mention ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member Ms Beerwinkel please take her seat. Is it a point of order Minister? Take your seat, hon member Ms Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Alright.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Mr Deputy Speaker, I was just wondering if the hon member Ms Beerwinkel knows that I had nothing to do with the closure of those fourteen schools for the two days.

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Hon Minister Grant that is not a point of order. You may proceed, hon member Ms Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you. Mr Speaker, I also would like to mention MEC Fritz' social spend to alleviate the plight of the poor and how he has refused to fund NGO's. Actually MEC Fritz, you know, through you Mr Speaker, I would have thought that MEC Fritz coming from Hanover Park would have been more empathetic to the causes and problems in Manenberg.  
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Which ones and why?

An HON MEMBER: What is that?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I want to speak about my MEC ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order honourable members!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I want to speak about MEC Bredell's Thusong centres

which by the way is a Sesotho word which means a place to get advice or assistance, in some areas is just non-functional as we discovered ...  
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Where? Where?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: In Worcester, in Worcester.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Worcester  
[Inaudible.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I want to discuss how MEC Winde's youth wage subsidy is actually subsidising big businesses' salaries and how people ...  
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yes, and I can say the same. I can contradict also. I can do both. ... [Interjections.] ...how the closing of the red doors and the loss of assistance is still hampering poorer communities; how MEC Botha's department neglects the poor communities in health service and so on.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mitchells Plain Hospital is a typical example. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Carlisle!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The DA can continue to ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Carlisle Order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Speaker the DA can continue to profess pro-poor whilst the people's reality is pro-inequality. They can shout "pro-poor" but their concrete actions speak of pro-indifference.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Julle sal bly wees ... [Onhoorbaar.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: They can continue to shout pro-poor but to the actual poor, this DA government means pro-stagnation. What it actually boils down to when we really strip down to the DA's pro-poor policy is that when it comes to the poor of this province the DA is really pro-status quo. Open opportunity society... [Interjections.] My advice to the community is that they should open their eyes and their ears to the fallacies of this Western Cape and their policies, thank you.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] do not believe you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. Order! Hon Minister Plato, over to

you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. I want to say firstly that the majority of the budget for the Department of Community Safety and almost all our programmes ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Goes on salaries!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... are focused on improving and making the lives of the people of the Western Cape safer. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: But it is making it worse. It is not improving! ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The Chrysalis Academy is funded entirely by the Western Cape government and is focused ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: It is focused on salaries!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... specifically on empowering and equipping the youth at risk in this province with the necessary skills to become active and positive members of society. We also host tabled the forums in our most crime affected communities ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order honourable members! Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...where different spheres of government and community leaders meet to discuss solutions for safety concerns in the area. We have trained more than 4000 neighbourhood watch members over three years ... [Interjections.] ... and we provide funding for 149 CPFs to the EPWP Programme. We have also developed very meaningful and valuable partnerships with the religious community to run youth programmes with the aim of keeping our youth off the streets and occupied in a safe environment.

Ms M TINGWE: In which areas? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: We have partnered with the FET Colleges to get the youth into education and away from a life of crime. [Interjections.] These are all run in the poorer communities of the Western Cape with the goal of making the lives of the youth safer and removing them from a life of crime. But, Mr Speaker, I would like to point out two specific areas where we have tried to improve the lives of the poor people of the Western Cape and in one case we were blocked from doing so and in the other we had to take money from other programmes to fill a gap being left by the national government.

The commission of enquiry into policing in Khayelitsha: the outcome of this enquiry would have a tremendous impact on making the lives of the people of Khayelitsha safer and would have a broader safety impact on communities

across the Western Cape and would most likely ensure a more efficient policing service to the public. Unfortunately and rather shamefully ... [Interjections.] ... the national government opposed this enquiry. Their move is an anti-poor move, Mr Speaker, and it is the kind of action that they take on a regular basis without any thought for those ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No that is not true ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...for those affected. In Manenberg we had to take money ... [Interjections.] ... from the budgets of several provincial government departments to ensure that schools in the area could reopen and learners and teachers could return to school. We had to deploy extra Metro Police officers which we are paying for because the SAPS, a national competency, have failed to secure the successful arrest and necessary evidence to ensure that the gangsters are locked up. Thank you, Mr Speaker. [Interjections.]

’n AGB LID: Hoor, hoor. Hoor, hoor!

Mr M NCEDANA (COPE): Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. The programmes should have an impact on people and the measurement of the impact should derive from the people who are receiving the services, and therefore it can never be that because I speak good English or ... [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: Yes!



Mr M NCEDANA: †...okanye ndithetha isiXhosa kamandi (\*perhaps I speak Xhosa nicely) and then that is translated to a programme that is impacting on the lives of the people. It is a fact that the people of the Western Cape, in particular from the poor communities, are in dire need of a better life. It is a fact that since 1994 the people of Manenberg, Khayelitsha, Mitchells Plain and other areas in the Western Cape, in particular the farm communities, have remained trapped in the poverty they were in before 1994. Therefore it would be very unfair for any member of a political party to stand up and say we are doing this and that. Yes, there is a little improvement, but very few people benefit from it. It must be acknowledged, Mr Speaker, that the service delivery protests ... [Interjections.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Are you listening guys?

Mr M NCEDANA: ...that have taken place in the province are an indication of communities who are extremely unhappy. That has nothing to do with the Democratic Alliance, but they are unhappy with the services that are not rendered to them and as leaders ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Improving police services.

Mr M NCEDANA: As leaders we should ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: And the toilet services ... [Interjections.]

Mr M NCEDANA: ...we should be members who ourselves confine ourselves to making sure that these services are delivered to those communities; not by merely the annual programme - the APP, not by that; not by just a plan but by a budget implemented ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: But the APP is a budget.

Mr M NCEDANA: The APP is a budget but if you do not implement the APP ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members

Mr M NCEDANA: The APP, the APP, Mr Carlisle, hon Minister Carlisle, we receive an APP... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member, address me please. Order! Minister Carlisle ... [Interjections.]

Mr M NCEDANA: We received an APP, Mr Speaker, that says we will deliver 12 000 houses but at the end of the year only 6000 are delivered. That is not

delivery.

HON MEMBERS: Yes, yes.

Mr M NCEDANA: And who is suffering those consequences, it is poor people. Now, Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.] ... the Minister of Public Works, I read in the *Argus*. He says: “We are doing everything to make sure that the motorists on the N2 are safe”, which is good, but what they are failing to address is the poor protestors †ababantu be potapota (\*the people with porta potties). Why are these people protesting?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: You tell me.

Mr M NCEDANA: Why is this government not entering into serious considerations to make sure that we deal with the cause and the cause is it can never be that ... †zekuthwe mandilale nekaka endlanam, zekuthiwe yamkelekile lonto. (\*to be told to sleep with pooh in my house and that must be acceptable.) It can never be †kuthiwe mandithathe ipowu ndiyibeka apha (\*take the potty and sleep) and then I sleep where I use the toilet.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M NCEDANA: It can never be. If it can, if it can as Madam Helen Zille says: “I am going to bring a porta-potty box in the next sitting”, she must take it and use it in her own house ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member Mr Skwatsha, your chance is coming. You are on the ... [Interjections.] Order! No, order!

An HON MEMBER: Bring it here.

The SPEAKER: Order! You must not express yourself. It is not your chance now.

Mr M G E WILEY: If you want to go down this passage you must let them ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable!

Mr M NCEDANA: If this is a government that cares of people it is a government that must not shy away from dealing with the critical issues that are affecting the people of the Western Cape.

HON MEMBERS: Yes. Ja.

Mr M NCEDANA: Mr Speaker, if you go to hospitals today - in the Khayelitsha hospital, if you are admitted you will be lucky to get a bed to sleep in, otherwise your family must bring blankets. You are going to be accommodated on the bench. You wait for the bed to be available. This is a kind of service we can boast about? No, it cannot be. There is a lot that needs to be done. There is

a lot that needs to be done and you must acknowledge that if we are truly claiming to be leaders ... [Interjections.]

Ms T N BEVU: Yes, exactly!

Mr M NCEDANA: ...that want to change South Africa and the Western Cape in particular, we need to be a province that delivers services to the poor and to all the people of the Western Cape. Thank you.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Who is going to do it better than the DA? You cannot even organise yourselves. ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members! Hon member Mr Von Brandis, order! ... [Interjections.] Hon members, order! Minister, over to you.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Speaker, alles wat vandag gesê word moet ons weet sê ons in die konteks dat van 2001 tot 2011 die Wes-Kaap met 29% gegroei het. Van 1994 tot 2011 het ons met 47% gegroei.

The National Development Plan has a vision to “eliminate poverty and reduce inequalities by 2030.” The Western Cape government, underpinned by these values of caring, competence, accountability, integrity and responsiveness, supports and is aligned with this vision. We must draw on the energies of our people, grow an inclusive economy, build capacity, enhance the capacity of this

state and promote leadership throughout society if we are to realise this vision collectively. In order to address our service delivery challenges we need to grow our economy by building capabilities.

CapeNature implementeer die uitgebreide openbare werke-program, EPWP Program, met die oogmerk op opleiding, werkskepping en sosiale ontwikkelingsintensies. Die vaardighede wat met behulp van geakkrediteerde opleiding en werksblootstelling oorgedra word stel voorheen werklose jeug in staat om hul loopbane te begin of te ontwikkel. Een van die sleutel opleidings- en vaardigheidsontwikkelingsinisiatiewe is die Groen Sebenza Program. Dit is 'n nasionale kapasiteitsbouprogram wat fokus op die voorbereiding van jong mense vir loopbane in die bewaringsektor. Gedurende 2013 tot 2015 het CapeNature 40 Groen Sebenza internskappe aangebied.

Gedurende die 2012/13-boekjaar is R 6 miljoen aan CapeNature toegeken wat ons in staat gestel het om ... [Tussenwerpsels.] ... om aan 137 individue in 15 EPWP-programme werk te verskaf. Werk is die oplossing tot armoede, mnr die Speaker. Dit kom neer op 171 voltydse ekwivalente van 190 werkgeleenthede vir 'n ononderbroke periode van 12 maande. Die suksesvolle implementering van die EPWP-projek het gelei tot 'n verhoogte begrotingstoekenning wat weer op sy beurt gelei het tot die daarstelling van R57,6 miljoen vir die mediumtermyn bestuursraamwerk. Die investering in armoedeverligtingsprogramme word versterk deur die Werk vir Water en Werk vir Vleilande-projek in die Wes-Kaap wat bestuur word deur CapeNature. Mnr die Speaker, as gevolg van die vorige suksesse met die implementering van

hierdie projek het CapeNature 'n toekenning van R46 miljoen ontvang om uitheemse ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Ozinsky, hon member Mr Ozinsky, order.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... om uitheemse indringerspesies te bestuur ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky, order.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... en is daar 'n rehabilitasieprojek begin. In die vorige boekjaar het dit die volgende voordele tot gevolg gehad, en dit is al waaroor dit gaan, mnr die Speaker, die voordele vir die armes. Dit het gelei tot die totstandkoming van 83 opkomende entiteite se deelname aan kontrakprojekte toegewys deur die Werk vir Water en Werk vir Vleilande-projek. Dit het gesamentlik 5681 persoonsdae vir opleiding opgelewer wat fokus op die uitvoering van geakkrediteerde funksies, vaardighede binne die norme en standaarde van die industrie. Terwyl ons kapasiteit bou is dit ook belangrik vir ons om 'n inklusiewe ekonomie te bou tussen ons mense en die staat.

Die Wes-Kaap Regering gaan voort om met behulp van die Thusong-gemeenskapsontwikkelingsprogram te verseker dat mense toegang tot

regeringsdienste het. Die uitreikprogramme deur die Thusong-sentrums het van 24 tot 41 toegeneem en het 'n positiewe impak gehad op die lewens van 42 000 mense wat deur hierdie tyd geld gespaar is omdat hulle deur die Thusong-sentrums bedien is. Gemeenskappe regoor die provinsie is en sal steeds bemagtig word deur inligtingsessies wat aangebied word deur middel van hierdie projek. 'n Reeks van 457 inligtingsessies het huishoudings bemagtig met onderwerpe soos MIV Vigs, maatskaplike verligting in nood, ken jou dienste, ken jou regte, paraffienveiligheid, ekonomiese geleenthede en lewensvaardighede.

Mnr die Speaker, volgens die onlangse sensus is daar 191 668 informele wonings in die provinsie. Hierdie huise vorm deel van ons beraamde bevolking van 5.8 miljoen wat almal geregtig is op dienste. In vergelyking met al die ander provinsies is die Wes-Kaap steeds op die voorpunt wat betref die voorsiening van basiese dienste. Vir die verslagperiode geëindig Junie 2013 het statistiek getoon dat 96% van die totale aantal huishoudings in die Wes-Kaap toegang tot water het, 96%. 93% het toegang tot elektrisiteit, 91% het toegang tot sanitasie, 94% het toegang tot vullisverwydering. Alhoewel toegang tot basiese dienste noodsaaklik is vir al ons mense het ons 'n duidelike begrip dat die mees weerlose mense diegene in informele wonings is.

Die Wes-Kaapse regering hanteer jaarliks twee rampseisoene, naamlik brande en oorstromings. Ons het ons brandbedstrydingskapasiteit vanuit die lug verbeter met die gevolglike laer impak van brande op ons gemeenskappe. Ons gaan steeds voort met die implementering van 'n bewusmakingsveldtog oor brande en



oorstromings in ons informele nedersettings en in ons skole. Ons het hierdie rampe geprioritiseer en kan verklaar dat minstens 66% van die brande binne die eerste uur geblus is wat onder ons aandag gebring is. Ons het ook aan sestion munisipaliteite ondersteuning gebied met die ontwikkeling van toepaslike rampbestuurhoofde ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Minister, please finish your sentence.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ek sluit af. Ons is die enigste provinsie wat die vierde jaar agtereenvolgend 100% van ons MIG infrastruktuurtoekenning gespandeer het. So diens ons die arm mense. Dankie, mnr die Speaker. ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you Hon Minister. ... [Interjections.] Order! Order! Hon members, order. Order! Order hon members, Hon member Mr Ozinsky. I recognise the hon member Mr Haskin.

An HON MEMBER: I do not think he is going to ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He is coming just now.

The SPEAKER: Oh, he is not in the House.

The SPEAKER: Chance not taken. ... [Interjections.] Order!

Ms A ROSSOUW: Hon mem Mr Haskin apologised that he could not be here and he asked us to take his name off the Speaker's list.

The SPEAKER: But on my list his name is still here. [Laughter.] Thank you very much, Chief Whip. Order! Hon member Mr Skwatsha, order. [Interjections.] Order! Order hon members! Hon member Ms Hartnick, over to you.

Ms J L HARTNICK (DA): Mr Speaker, with the mission of creating and open opportunity for all the DA has undoubtedly redressed issues within the Western Cape in order to benefit the people of this province especially the poor. I refer to recent programmes and initiatives between the timeframe of June 2013 to date. On 6 June 2013 the hon Helen Zille spoke at the official opening of a factory established by a Chinese electronic consumer goods manufacturer, HiSense in Atlantis. The new facility represents an important investment in the Atlantis area resulting in job creation and contributing to economic growth in the Western Cape.

On 16 July 2013 Premier Helen Zille unveiled the latest flagship project of the 110% Green Campaign, the "better living challenge" as a pioneering initiative to stimulate new solutions that improved the living conditions of poor people in urban communities. The Better Living Challenge will be a recognised project of the *World Design Capital 2014* and aims to mobilise business, academic and public sector players to design new green and alternative solutions for informal

and subsidy housing.

Mr Speaker, the role of Government is to make it easy to be an entrepreneur and not be an obstacle to innovation. Under the leadership of the DA the Western Cape government is committed to creating safe communities and are intensifying their efforts within their limited powers to do so. The Western Cape government's intervention aims to ensure that the people of the Western Cape receives better policing and also to ensure that police officers on the ground are given the resources and training that they need in order to deliver this service. The broad interventions from the Western Cape Government include establishing a commission of enquiry into policing in Khayelitsha, passing the Western Cape Community Safety Act, policing needs and priorities.

It is clear that the Western Cape government is dedicated to creating safe communities and are intensifying their efforts within their limited powers to do so. Of significant importance to me is that of the Cape Access E-Centres under the Premier's broadband initiative. On 7 August 2013 the Premier opened the Paarl East Cape Access E-Centre. Cape Access E-Centres are part of the Western Cape government's investments to breach the digital divide by providing computer and internet facilities to benefit poor communities. The E-Centres are usually based in libraries, Thusong Centres or schools. To address economic exclusion due to geographic and historic isolation low levels of ICT knowledge and skills, the lack of economic development and infrastructure in their areas and also the lack of information on job opportunities Cape Access, a division of the broadband project, provides access to information technology

which includes a fully equipped E-Community Centre, which will be available after hours and on Saturdays.

ICT Training offering basic ICT skills such as internet browsing, emailing, Microsoft Word, Excel and PowerPoint competency; access to the internet which is free for 45 minutes per day, communication with local and provincial government, South African Revenue Service and banks which will be made possible through the electronic transacting facilities. Evidently, Mr Speaker, the DA Western Cape's pro-poor programmes are indeed benefiting the people of the Western Cape. I thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT (DA) Thank you, Mr Speaker. I want to start off by saying that when I listen to this debate it becomes very clear that there are two little trump cards that the ANC consistently take out of their little hat. The one is when it suits them the race card; then it is "yes, you are white, you are white, you are white", and you get sick of the "white, white, white." The other one when it suits them, then it is: "You are poor, poor, poor, poor. You are not poor enough; you are not this, you are not that."

In the meantime to very sharply contrast their so called poor, pro-poor programme, you see their members driving Maseratis I cannot even pronounce the name. It is such a bloody ... [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order, order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Sorry, sorry. It is such a big contradiction.

Mr M SKWATSHA: What do you drive ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: No, it is such a contradiction, Mr Speaker, and the point I want to say ... [Interjections.] and the point I want to say and the point that I want to make is that ... [Interjections.] ... the ANC must stop talking and they must start doing more.

An HON MEMBER: You cannot even ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: They must stop talking about the poor and vulgarise the poor and have their cocktail parties. When we go to every national meeting we have a little special room called the VIP room and in that little VIP room there are very little VIP kind of snacks and there is all these great little things and ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order. Order Minister Carlisle, order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And I mean, where are the poor; the peasants? They are out there.

The SPEAKER: Order, order. Hon Minister, order.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And that is why they must stop vulgarising the poverty, the poor.

The SPEAKER: Minister, can you, when I say “order”, listen to that order please.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Mr Skwatsha, is that a point of order?

Mr M SKWATSHA: I wanted to know whether the hon Minister ...  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon, order! What is it, a question? Do you want to pose a question to the Minister?

An HON MEMBER: No, not that, Mr Speaker, you can ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M SKWATSHA: But why are you ... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: No, no, no. I want to know, do you want to pose a question

because you cannot just pose a question. I must ask the Minister if he is willing to take the question.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes, I want to know whether ... [Inaudible.] ...  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Take your seat; take your seat, order! Order hon members, Minister, are you willing to?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: No.

The SPEAKER: No. Okay, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It was perhaps most graphically illustrated - I heard the comment from the hon member Mr Ozinsky about the UDF and it was perhaps you know the beliefs and the great principles of the United Democratic Front - was perhaps best illustrated the other morning when they had a breakfast in Rocklands and the hall was basically empty because the people have lost faith in them and the poor has lost faith in them. The poor is not stupid, Mr Speaker. You see the poor are not stupid. The poor can be taken for a ride for a long time but there is a time when they say "enough is enough."

Mr M OZINSKY: Yes. DA your time is coming!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: This is exactly what happened in their case.

Mr M OZINSKY: No your case!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: This happened in their case.  
[Interjections.] Let me also for the fact ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order, order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Let me also say, let me say, let me say, Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Let me say, Mr Speaker, I am checking my time, hon member Mr Skwatsha. Let me also just go on to make the point that the hon member Ms Beerwinkel makes. She says “you know that we spend the least on and that we are not paying.” Now you know National Treasury issues this. Here is the document and I want to please provide it to the hon members on that side. It says here that this province and the Department of Social Development in terms of transfers to NGOs at the moment are the highest, 68%. By far. The next one is 65%, which is Gauteng. By the way, we



give far more money to more NGOs. What happens with national? Their amounts go to R 2,1 billion and R1, something billion and we have R9 million.

The second point that the hon member Mr Ozinsky was talking about was that most of the money goes for remuneration compensation of employees. In fact, again, it is this government and specifically and in my case Social Development that spends only 19% on compensation. You know and then I listen with absolute respect to what the hon member Mr Ozinsky says. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Yes. [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order hon member Mr Ozinsky, order.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And then I wonder what the hon member Mr Ozinsky is saying [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: You lost it. [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon member Mr Ozinsky, order.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: What the hon member Mr Ozinsky is saying. We are at this point undoing the ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: It is at 90%

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky, order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It is one nine, 19%

Mr M OZINSKY: On salaries?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It is 19% on salaries.

Mr M OZINSKY: Oh yeah?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes, here it is, a Treasury note.

Mr M OZINSKY: I hope you sleep ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I want to at this point ...  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, order, order! Hon member Mr Ozinsky, I have requested you several times ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: No, no [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: No, take your seat hon member Mr Skwatsha. Hon member Mr

Skwatsha, take your seat ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Sit down!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha, take your seat. It seems that you totally undermine my authority. Please can you stop that, I request you. Hon minister you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and it is in that context ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... that they have a lot to say on that side, but when it comes to the doing for the poor, very little. I want to address the hon member Mr Ncedana and I want to say that I really, really appreciate the point that he is making around the poor and around the issues. I also want to say you know there is something called in the constitution ‘progressive realisation of the basic rights’ and it takes time. It is over a period of time that ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Order.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Speaker, I just want to find if it is parliamentary for a member to sit and read *Getaway* while we are

listening?

The SPEAKER: No, it is not. Who is the member?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It is hon member Mr Ozinsky.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky?

An HON MEMBER: Getaway, Getaway. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay, thanks. Proceed hon Minister Fritz. What is it hon member Mr Skwatsha, is it a point of order?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Did I hear Mr Speaker saying it is not parliamentary to read?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha, I did not say that it is not parliamentary to read. I said it is unparliamentary to read newspapers and all those things in the House.

Mr M SKWATSHA: But no-one is reading a newspaper here.

The SPEAKER: That is what hon member Mr Ozinsky ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: He is reading a

magazine that has got nothing to do with the debate. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Ozinsky! Take your seat, hon Minister Fritz. Please can you please close that book.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, there is nothing unparliamentary about reading a magazine or any other book in the House. The rules refer to newspapers and I am not reading a newspaper [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: That is a newspaper. What is that?

Mr M OZINSKY: We are allowed to read computers; we are allowed to read books.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky, that is a newspaper. What is that?

Mr M OZINSKY: It is not a newspaper.

HON MEMBERS: No, no.

The SPEAKER: It is not a newspaper?

Mr M OZINSKY: It is a magazine.

The SPEAKER: Oh, okay.

Mr M OZINSKY: A magazine is different from a newspaper.

The SPEAKER: Okay. Take your seat, sit down hon member.

The SPEAKER: Proceed, hon Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I thought that the DA was accused of closing the debate, the democratic space. I have seen the best way of closing the democratic space, when the truth hurts and this is the problem.  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Allow me to address the hon member Ms Beerwinkel's point around the wage, the youth wage subsidy and the internships that this government runs. I want to today talk about one specific intern and I want to use her as an example to the thousands or the hundreds of interns that we have in the province. This is a typical case of a young woman called Robin September who when she finished matric, a very good matric, started her university studies. She could not pay her first year at university and worked very hard and her family had to pay her first year's fees at the university. Eventually through her hard work and through absolute dedication, in a very unique field like auditing, she eventually got all her studies paid for because of her hard work. For two years, because she is from a township, she

stayed at home because she did not have an uncle and a brother who had some connection with some auditing firm. She stayed at home and her mother or someone saw an advert in the paper calling for people and for young people to come on internships and she grabbed that opportunity. She is today in my department. She is one of the best performing interns and would probably walk straight into a permanent job in that department. That story the hon member Ms Beerwinkel must hear. That little opportunity for that child who lay at home, who was not given an opportunity and who is called this and that, it is that child that says thank you when they send us a little email.

Let me also talk now to this whole debate after we unveiled the R87 million, R89 or R87 million for the substance abuse programme. You know, Sir, I wonder sometimes on what substance other people are because after we unveiled it the whole - a lot of our very very good leaders in this province who I absolutely have a lot of respect for - says that we waste R87 million on drug addicts, and then I say that to the mothers in Lentegur and in Tafelsig who are desperate to have assistance for their children to get them off drugs and to get them back into society. You know it is those kinds of contradictions that we get all the time from the opposite side in this House. When you pay R6 million to save - because no one else is doing it - Manenberg because our children were slaughtered and no-one else did anything they accuse you of wasting money.

The SPEAKER: Order! Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: This is the contradiction of the

ANC, this is how they are not pro-poor and this is how they will lose every time in this province.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I thank you.

Mr M SKWATSHA (ANC): Thank you, Mr Speaker. I think that the ruling party must listen properly to what we say before they respond.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yes.

Mr M SKWATSHA: More especially after listening to the speech that has just been delivered by the hon Minister Fritz. Before I forget, you know there is something here called a fact sheet, census 2011. Now the hon member Mr Lentit has sponsored this debate and you know that in this fact sheet it indicates the delivery of houses, province by province. One of the things that is indicated here, in the Western Cape - I will just read. I will not bore you with everything. In the Western Cape, between 1996 and 2011, 1996: 82.0%; 2011: 80.4% in the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: 81.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Now in the Eastern Cape, the percentage is 48.0% in 1996 and in 2011, 63.2%. In the Free State 62.9% in 1996 and in 2011, 81.1%.



The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT & PUBLIC WORKS: Of what?

Mr M SKWATSHA: In fact in respect of that particular delivery you are right. It was actually finished in 2009 and used an ANC budget. When the topic was decided, was sponsored by the ID, one really had to welcome the opportunity to participate in a debate that is sponsored by a young open frank South African who is really keen on open criticism. However I think that the hon member Mr Lentit would forgive that when I thought about this particular topic and having read in the last few weeks in the media and actually knowing that this House is a House in turmoil; having read about the DA and the ID shenanigans and the territorial tendencies of the mayor of Cape Town, I really wondered whether the hon member Mr Lentit is not setting up the DA, is not tramping them by introducing this topic here at this particular stage. [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: We care for the poor! We care for the poor!

The SPEAKER: Order, order.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Now the DA, the topic speaks about the DA's pro-poor policy but hon member Mr Lentit, all I know is that the DA is anti-poor.

Mr R B LENTIT: Really!

Mr M SKWATSHA: And I think that the hon member Mr Lentit and the hon

member Ms Beerwinkel have expressly explained to you ...

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Foeitog!

Mr M SKWATSHA: ... and a particular statement, ... [Interjections.] ... someone has actually given away his two minutes of speaking.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Facts!

Mr M SKWATSHA: Because he felt he cannot stand to stand up here and lie to the nation about the delivery of the Democratic Alliance that is not there.

An HON MEMBER: You are lying. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members.

Mr M SKWATSHA: The hon member Mr Lentit chooses to discuss the DA's pro-poor policies whilst gang violence and urban terror are on the rise. How can this DA be pro-poor that cause its own citizens to be refugees?

An HON MEMBER: Sjoe!

Mr M SKWATSHA: How can the DA be pro-poor when it deliberately wants to deny children from impoverished communities ... [Interjections.]

'n AGB LID: Hel, watse koeie gaan jy nou uit die sloot haal?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Their basic right to education ... [Interjections.] ... until that right has to be restored by a court of law; how can the DA be pro-poor when it refuses to address the apartheid induced underlying social factors ... [Interjections.] ... which gives rise to gangsterism and drug abuse. Is it not arrogance at its worst when the DA claims ... [Interjections.]

Mr H P GEYER: That is what the ANC does ... [Interjections.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: When the DA claims to be successful in implementing pro-poor policies when we all know that in this Cape Town some of the communities are the gang and drug capital in this country.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: And who is ... [Inaudible.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: In a society which is still rubbished by the structural efforts of apartheid, the notion of the DA's open opportunity is not only a pipe dream ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members order.

Mr M SKWATSHA: But further entrenches apartheid's inequalities. It would help if you listen because you are the next speaker. How does one even begin to

speak of a fit for purpose policy without redressing the inequalities of the past?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Facts, facts.

Mr M SKWATSHA: The DA's open opportunity society and its emphasis claim are not affected by the apartheid and is the basis for their anti-poor policy. The DA seeks to resist transformation when they say in their open opportunity society document that opportunities for the advantaged must not be shut off. According to Rhodes academic, Jane Duncan, the open opportunity society is a meritocracy where government enables individual advancement on the basis of supposedly inherent tolerance and industriousness measured usually through academic credentials rather than on characteristics such as race, gender, or political application. In a society with inherent inequalities is it fair to expect academic credentials to be a determinant for individual advancement?  
[Interjections.]

The open opportunity society provides an ideological defence of the capitalistic system. The children of the historically advantaged ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: He is talking about ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: ...invariably ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order hon members.

Mr M SKWATSHA: ...have a head start in realising inherent talent.

[Interjections.] This society attributes an individual's lack of success to individual weaknesses, not the system.

An HON MEMBER: Plagiarism.

Mr M SKWATSHA: The recent farmworkers' strike, quote, unquote.

[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon Minister Carlisle, I am worried, it seems that you are not going to get your last seven minutes.

Mr M SKWATSHA: The recent farmworkers' strike in De Doorn's are indicative of the inequalities in the agricultural sector which the DA has dismally failed to address.

Mr H P GEYER: The ANC's organisation.

Mr M SKWATSHA: You see the problem when the poor protest, as the hon member Mr Ncedana told you, you say it is ANC engineered ...

Mr H P GEYER: Yes, you are talking the truth. [Interjections.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: .... because you are very devolved from reality. The poor

working conditions and living conditions where farmworkers still do not have security of tenure ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members order. Hon members order.

Mr M SKWATSHA: De Doorns, the De Doorn's farmworkers earn a meagre R 2 500 a year whilst the farmers earn up to R 2,5 million a year.

The SPEAKER: Order hon member Mr Skwatsha. Take your seat please Minister.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Speaker I wonder if the hon member Mr Skwatsha will take a question?

Ms M TINGWE: No man.

The SPEAKER: You are not hon member Mr Skwatsha. You are hon member Ms Tingwe.

Mr M SKWATSHA: If I could be given more minutes.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha, are you willing to take a question?

Mr M SKWATSHA: If I am going to be given more minutes.

The SPEAKER: Okay you may proceed. There are no more minutes you are going to get hon member Mr Skwatsha.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Helen Zille supports them. The Premier Helen Zille supports inequality by consistently stating that the farmworkers in the Western Cape are well paid and well treated compared with the rest of the country ...

[Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Sent by the ANC.

Mr M SKWATSHA: The farming sector nationally has created 54 000 new jobs between January and March this year, at the same time farmworkers have been losing their jobs in this province and farmers have been complaining about paying the minimum wage. The Western Cape Department of Health has failed the poor invariably particularly those living in African and coloured townships. The black majority in the province are forced to utilise public healthcare which is most certainly not on the level of the private healthcare. The facilities in Hanover Park are very much different to those of Constantiaberg. Insulin for diabetes, inflammatory reducing and chemotherapy treatment are generally not readily available. Even pregnant women from amongst the poor are the victims of the DA's anti-poor approach as has recently happened in Gugulethu. As we witnessed yesterday with the members of the DA in Khayelitsha where a woman told us that she lost her baby and has not been seen by any doctor. We were together yesterday, not last year.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: We have got the lowest death rate in the country.

Mr M SKWATSHA: One of the major challenges at Khayelitsha Hospital is the shortage of medical staff. [Interjections.] The DA's Department of Health saw it fit to dismiss eleven doctors due to budgetary constraints. [Interjections.]

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: The hospitals without ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr von Brandis. What happened to you today?

Mr M SKWATSHA: The committee has informed the ... [Inaudible.] ... that the hospital is functioning with only 50% of the required number of doctors. This hospital, grand as it is when the ANC conceptualised it, it conceptualised it to also bring the best treatment to the ordinary. We cannot run away from the fact that the bucket system is an abhorrent system. What are we to believe from the DA administration when Mayor Helen Zille says that there is no bucket system in Cape Town? Premier Helen Zille says the porta-porta is to replace the bucket system, what are we to believe? When mayor Helen Zille says this; Premier Helen Zille says this ... [Interjections.] ... so in the mind of Mayor Zille the bucket system does not exist [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha.

Mr M SKWATSHA: But in the mind of Premier Zille it does exist.



The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha, hon member Mr Skwatsha. Order.  
Your time has expired.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Can I, may I finish?

The SPEAKER: Yes of course, you may. You may finish.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, we can do anything and everything we want  
and arrest people who are throwing “poo”, which we do not support.

The SPEAKER: Order. Your time is over hon member Mr Skwatsha. Thank you  
very much [Inaudible.] Thank you. [Interjections.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: But when you walk ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Skwatsha, take your seat please, take your  
seat.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Can I not finish this sentence?

The SPEAKER: Take your seat hon member Mr Skwatsha. Hon members we  
now proceed to the last speaker. That is the hon Minister Carlisle.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT & PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I am glad I made it. I thought that the only contribution of that side that was really of consequence was from the hon member Mr Ncedana. He said that we have to be working for a goal of a better life for all, and of course that is true. He reminded ... [Interjections.] ... and he reminded us that we are very far from it and he is right. He reminded us of the great differences between people in this population and of course he is right. It is to those things that this administration has committed itself, however imperfectly, hon member Mr Ncedana, but by God we have given every pint of blood that we have towards that end, and it is difficult to get there. But let us remind ourselves of two things.

First of all in this debate we have given fact after fact after fact and the reality of life is if you cannot measure it, it does not mean anything.

Mr M OZINSKY: But none of that is true! Not one of that is true!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The ANC has not given a single fact. They go on about things in the past so let us remind ourselves of the history, because they think that is important.

Mr M OZINSKY: What percentage ... [Inaudible.] ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order, hon, hon members. Order!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT & PUBLIC WORKS: In 1999 the DP got 11% of the vote in this province. We had four seats in that corner there initially. In 2004, we got 28%, but in 2008 ... [Interjections.] ... the stealing of money from the poor so disgusted these members in the front bench here that they, and they were here on this side of the House, that they took their Premier and threw him out.

Mr H P GEYER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: It so disgusted the hon member Mr Ncedana that he left this party and we all know that. In 2009 it so disgusted the electorate of this province that from 28% we went to 52% or 51%, and let me say this and hon members know it on that side, we will win again in 2014.

Ms M TINGWE: Are you sure?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT & PUBLIC WORKS: And there are members over here who will put their names forward for the DA list and they know it.

Ms M TINGWE: No ways.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT & PUBLIC WORKS: They know it, and you know it ... [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: You are dreaming. You are dreaming. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT & PUBLIC WORKS: Because the ANC ...  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order hon members, order!

Ms M TINGWE: You are wrong.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Tingwe, hon member Ms Tingwe, you are too loud please. Order, hon members.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT & PUBLIC WORKS: Probably, Mr Speaker, those who are making the most noise here will be the ones to put their names forward and the reason for that is plain and I accept ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon, order! [Interjection.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Do you want to take a question?

Mr H P GEYER: Do not waste time now.

The SPEAKER: What are you saying hon Minister, are you taking a question now?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: No.

An HON MEMBER: Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Speaker, the senior members should take questions but if a senior member as senior as the hon member Mr Skwatsha will not take questions then I am not wasting my time with him. When people give me time I will give them time. That they know. Now as I said what we have here is facts and what we have not heard from the other side is facts. So I am not going to try and repeat the facts that we have had from the hon member Mr Von Brandis and from the hon member Mr Bredell and others but I want to make a couple of points. What does one find, when one looks at the things we are trying to do and one looks back at the ANC when they were in power before they threw out their Premier. I want to make that point; I want to make that point that there is a marked distinction between the ANC 2008 to 2009 and the ANC before 2008. There is that huge difference so I am talking about before 2008.

If I just look in my own department, they were wasting money on roads that had no meaning. They were badly built, were twice the cost that they should have been. Today our last two really bad roads are being worked on right now. In four years we made that difference and if you do not think that that affects everybody's lives including the poor then you have no understanding of how a community or a society works.

Let me go on and say that in terms of road safety, when Mr Fransman was here - I think he sat right here - he never did a damn thing to save the lives of people on the roads. They know it, Sir, they know it and what do you think? Do you think that it is the elite that dies on the roads? Yes, some of the elite die on the road but there is a lot of poor people who die on the roads, usually at the hands of drunken drivers, and what did the hon member Mr Fransman do about drunken drivers? Nothing. Nothing.

Ms M TINWGE: That is not true.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT & PUBLIC WORKS: We have not done as much as we would like to do, but we brought the death rate down by 28%, so we have done something. We have actually made a difference. There are 2 000 people alive who would not otherwise be alive.

In terms of education we are spending three times as much as the ANC was before 2008, three times as much and by the end of this period we will be spending six times as much, but there will be problems along the way. For sure there always are, but the reason for that result is very simple, the reason for that result really resolves itself to a couple of things. We know what we want, we know what we want to achieve for South Africa, we know where we are going, we work together. We may have our differences but we work together and above all every rand is precious and it may not be stolen and it may not be wasted.

Mr H P GEYER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: That is our credo, Sir, and when it is the ANC's credo then hallelujah for South Africa.

An HON MEMBER: Well put, thank you. [Applause.]

Debate concluded.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister Carlisle. That concludes the debate on this subject. That concludes the business for the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:16.