
THURSDAY, 21 MAY 2020

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

[Virtual online sitting held through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order! I trust that everybody has now been connected to participate in this meeting. This is a sitting of the Provincial Parliament in terms of Rule 1(a) of the Standing Rules, with all our members in remote attendance by electronic means. This is our fourth official sitting of the House remotely.

The Western Cape Provincial Parliament remains fully operational, with members doing constituency work to assist the general public in whatever way possible, as well as our committees playing their oversight role in an effective, efficient and transparent manner. Our sitting today will be conducted in terms of the Standing Rules and directives issued by me on 17 April 2020.

Hon members, please allow me to highlight some of the important directives in this regard:

- The Secretary and his administration will ensure dedicated technical support at all times during the sittings.
- The quorum requirements for sittings of the House are as provided for in the Constitution and the Standing Rules.
- Unless there is an indication of unanimous concurrence, voting will take place by members present entitled to vote, to cast their votes by clearly identifying themselves to the Presiding Officer, verbally expressing their vote.
- Members who are present have all the privileges and immunities imparted to them by law.
- Hon members who are considered to be out of order by the Presiding Officer; their microphones will be muted and they shall therefore be called to order.
- The attendance of the hon members will be recorded by the Serjeant-at-Arms.

In instances where these directives do not cover a particular eventuality, the Standing Rules must apply. Hon members, in instances where the Rules cannot be applied, the ruling by the Presiding Officer is final. Hon members, all microphones have been muted. If that has not occurred, they will be muted immediately. You are therefore requested to only unmute your microphone when you need to raise a point of order and for that you will be recognised.

Hon members, you should then first state your name and surname in order for the Presiding Officer to recognise you so that when you speak, the only person that speaks is yourself, not everybody else speaking at the same time. Please ensure that your mic is unmuted as you do so, and when you are done speaking, please mute your microphone again.

Hon members, the members of the media as the fourth estate have also been granted access to this MS Teams and they in this meeting will have an observer status as guests of the WCPP. Members of the press may, however, not use the chat room, speak or activate their cameras whilst the sitting is in progress. For the purpose of this sitting via Microsoft Teams, I am requesting that hon members are sensitive to the language needs of other hon members, since no interpretation services are available for this sitting. The Secretary and the ICT component are continuing to explore options for translations for future sittings of the House, in this regard.

As ruled by the Presiding Officer, which is myself, in the sitting of the House on 23 April 2020 also via this platform, no interjections shall be permitted during the debate. In this regard I also wish to draw the attention of the hon members to Rule 40 of our Standing Rules. Hon members, those are the directives which have been on record since we started off with the first session of the House and this is therefore how we are going to proceed with the sitting today. I therefore wish to recognise the Chief Whip. I recognise the Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): My apologies. Thank you, Mr Speaker. I move the motion printed on the Order Paper in my name:

That, cognisant of Section 116(2)(c) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996, which provides that, “The Rules and Orders of a Provincial Legislature must provide for financial and administrative assistance to each party represented in the Legislature, in proportion to its representation, to enable the party and its leader to perform their functions in the Legislature effectively ...”; proposes that the House hereby resolves to authorise the Speaker of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament to determine the matters provided for in Section 116(2)(c) of the Constitution. In determining such matters, the Speaker is accountable to the House and must report to it when any such determination is made. If the House is not in session, any such determination must be ATC’d within 14 days.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip. Are there any objections to the motion? No objections? [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The SPEAKER: Is there an objection or no objections? Agreed to.

Thank you, hon members, now we go to the Questions in terms of Rule 202. We see as they appear in the Order Paper, the hon Minister’s reply to the

question as printed accordingly.

Excuse me, hon members, I am just getting my Question Paper here. Where is my Question Paper? I recognise the Minister.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Speaker, if I could just come in there, it is hon Minister Meyer.

The SPEAKER: Minister Meyer, I recognise you, sir.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Ban on the transport of wine: level 5 lockdown

1. Mr A P van der Westhuizen asked the Minister of Agriculture:

With regard to the ban on the transport of wine for export under the Level 5 lockdown regulations:

(a) What is the expected loss in foreign revenue that wine producers in the Western Cape will suffer due to these regulations and (b) what was the content of the letter that he received from the national Minister in response to his appeal for these regulations to be reviewed?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Good afternoon, hon Speaker. Thank you for this opportunity and thank you for the question from hon member Van

der Westhuizen. The total number, value of South Africa's wine exports amounted to R9,57 billion in 2019. This is roughly equal to R184 million per week. The implication is that the direct loss in export value is R920 million. It is almost 10% of annual exports over the five weeks that wine could not be exported from South Africa. However, the immediate cost is not the biggest loss to the economy. Approximately 50% of the wine harvest is annually exported and 95,9% of South African wines are in the Western Cape Province. For this reason, it is not strange that wine is the third biggest export product of the Western Cape economy and contributes to 6.5% to the value of exports from the province.

However, although important for the province, in particular for the rural economy, it is a very small player in the global field. The South African wine industry is also the twelfth biggest exporter of wine and has got the market share of 1,8%. It follows that any interruption of supply by the local industry could very easily be made good by wine from a range of other countries such as Australia, Argentina, Chile, and the United States of America. Obviously, we want to protect our local market here in South Africa and particularly here in the Western Cape. Due to the fact that competition for shelf space in retail outlets of export markets is very fierce, one of the key requirements to secure shelf space is the nature and the quality of service provided. As South African wine exporters were not able to honour their agreements, the risk is very high that local wine exporters will be branded as not being reliable.

It is important to remember that shelf space or market share will be very difficult to recover once it is lost. It is calculated that a 5% decrease in market share will lead to a direct loss in export earnings of R478 million per year over the longer term as well as the destruction of 15 000 jobs, a loss which the South African economy can ill afford at this stage.

At this stage it is too soon to provide a clear indication of the real size of the market share loss. Also, hon Speaker, the second part of the question, I did write three letters on wine-related matters to the National Minister on the following dates: on 26 March this year, requesting that critical work in wine cellars could be exempted from the lockdown in order to allow the harvest of wine grapes to be completed during the 2020-season. I wrote again to the national Minister on 3 April, supporting the wine industry in its attempts to get exemption from the lockdown in order to allow the export of wine.

Also, the third letter that I wrote was on 17 April, hon Speaker, requesting the assistance of the national Minister to allow the transport of wine to ports in order for wine to be exported.

Other than the acknowledgement of receipt, no letters responding directly to the matters raised were received by my office. However, we believe that our submissions made a difference due to the fact that the regulations were amended as follows:

Regulation 419 was published in the *Government Gazette* 43168 of 26 March 2020 allowing harvesting and storage activities essential to prevent the wastage of primary agricultural goods.

Secondly, Regulation 453 was published in the *Government Gazette* 43211 of 7 April 2020 allowing the export and transport of wine. It is unfortunate, hon Speaker, that this regulation was subsequently rescinded by Regulation 456 as published in *Government Gazette* number 43232 of 16 April.

Lastly, hon Speaker, Regulation 480 was published in the *Government Gazette* 43258 of 29 April, allowing the export of agricultural products, including wine as well as the transportation of all agricultural products to ports, that is land, air and sea, and it was for this purpose to export.

We believe that our submissions and also the submissions of my colleague, the Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities, who also wrote to colleagues in the National Department of DTI, together with Wesgro, and I am confident that all of our letters had an impact on this.

The wine industry, hon Deputy Speaker, is a very significant industry in the Western Cape. 98% of all the wine cellars here in South Africa are based in the Western Cape and we need to protect this very special important sector of the economy and we are now taking the fight up to also see that we can have E-commerce and online wine cellars for the local

market but that is the next chapter, but we will certainly engage with the National Department in this regard. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister of Agriculture. May I request the follow-ups, I am going to give the hon member Van der Westhuizen, who asked the question, who put the question to the Minister, an opportunity and then I will give him the first right for a follow-up thereafter and then I will take other hon members who wish to raise questions. I have recognised there are certain hands, for instance I see hon member Marran, so I have noted you. Hon member Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, through you to the Minister. Minister, you have just informed this House that the National Minister did not respond to any of your letters. What signal did the Minister send out by her lack of response and would it be correct to deduct that the job losses in the Western Cape agricultural sector as well as the substantial loss in foreign currency caused by this silly ban on transport that had nothing to do with the spread of the virus, is of no importance to the National Government?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Van der Westhuizen. Hon Minister Meyer?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you hon Speaker and thank you for the follow-up question.

Well it is certain, the Premier has indicated through our Cabinet that we must work through the cooperative structures, engage with the National Command Centre, engage with the various MECs and certainly work within the framework of cooperative governance, and I will continue to do so. Later this evening at six o'clock we will have an Agricultural Minmec discussion and for us it is important that we continue on behalf of the citizens of the Western Cape Government on behalf of the economy of the Western Cape that we do everything possible, despite all of these particular challenges and sometimes politics coming into the play. It is my job as the Minister of Agriculture to do my utmost best to see that we protect this sector of the economy. Here agriculture is about 10% of the GDP of this province, 17% of the labour force, and I will certainly continue, despite the complexities and difficulties that we have, given the great challenges and the volatility, the uncertainty, even the ambiguity that we experienced in this situation, together with my Cabinet colleagues and the Premier leading this situation, do our utmost best to protect the economy despite the challenges. Even when the Premier started his term of office he introduced the concept of resilience, meaning that whatever obstacles we receive, even letters not being answered, we will continue to push the boundaries for the benefit of the people as we have been elected to serve the citizens of the Western Cape and certainly I do this as well as all my colleagues in the Cabinet. Thank you, Chair.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I now recognise hon Marran. I have noted you, hon member Marais. Hon member Marran, please proceed.

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Speaker, thanks, good afternoon and good afternoon to everyone else in this sitting. Hon Speaker, hon member Van der Westhuizen raised questions in a manner as if he knows how to raise those people who have died, from the death.

Hon Speaker, one question quickly to the Minister, because the question only refers to the regulations. Does the Minister think or believe that if there is indeed a case, a loss of foreign revenue, it is attributed to only the regulations or also – especially the European markets who have closed their ports of entry like your airports, seaports and so forth? Is it attributed only to the regulations if there is a loss, or is it a mixture of issues, which includes foreign countries that have closed their ports of entry? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marran. Hon Minister Meyer?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you to hon member Marran. I think firstly we must understand that this loss on revenue for the fiscus will be massive in South Africa. Certainly, the chop and change of the regulations has a huge impact. Firstly, wine was allowed to be exported, and then suddenly a regulation was then published to say you can no longer export wine. Now during that period of time we must understand that when the first regulations were allowed to export, people had already some of their consignments on the way to the harbour or already at the harbour and so this has posed a particular risk, because now you sit with a stock in the harbour that cannot be exported due to the sudden change of

the regulations. Well, I think hon member Marran is absolutely correct. I think the massive loss of revenue was on both sides.

Firstly, I think it was partly due to the irrational and illogical change of the regulation. It made absolutely no sense to prevent the export of wines because the regulations that were published initially allowed for agricultural production. It allowed for agricultural exports, particularly our wines, and so the sudden change, there was no reason, no logic, and so what we have also seen globally as a result of COVID-19 it is actually correct, we have seen that certain of the major global ports have been closed and we know those particular ports, particularly the Hamburg port, the port in Rotterdam – one of the biggest ports in the world, as well as the ports in Asia were closed for imports on their side. But certainly we want to protect our market share, particularly our shelf space because once people order wine and you are unable to deliver on your commitment, certainly people are not going to wait when South Africa – through our regulatory framework – gets our act together; they look somewhere else, particularly Australian wine, they look even at California, also a wine producing region, as well as in South America. We know those particular markets, Burgundy in France and many other regions in France, so it is important that we protect it. But in short, the loss of revenue will be massive, it has both to do with our irrational regulations, as well as a result of COVID-19 the international community having protected their borders and closed also some of their ports, so that is my answer, hon Speaker. Thank you for that.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Meyer. I recognise hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I listened with great interest to the Minister's responses and I could not help, but I have a slight giggle here. The Minister said the regulations make no sense. We want to protect our market share. We know our markets.

Minister, can you tell me, does your party support the federal solution so that you can have all those powers so that these nonsensical regulations will not be applicable to the Western Cape, where you can decide for yourself what to export and what not to export? You cannot have it both ways. You cannot agree to a unitary system and then complain if you do not have federal powers. Now how are we going to resolve this issue?

Can you tell me what is your party's policy with regard to the devolution of powers to provinces so that they can decide for themselves what to export and what they cannot export, whether it is Level 5 or whether it is Level 3? Do you want those powers or are we forever going to hear moaning and groaning but you stick to the present system? I would just like to hear your views on that.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marais. Hon Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, this is a very important

question in the geopolitical landscape of South Africa. The centre of this question is, what does our Constitution allow us to do and what is my party's position in this particular regard? The Constitution is very clear in terms of Schedule 4 of the Constitution. My party believes in constitutional democracy, expending the powers of the Constitution within the framework of the Constitution. So, Schedule 4 makes it absolutely clear, where is the concurrent powers between the National Government and the Provincial Government. What we have done over the last ten years in this province is to expand the powers to the extent that it is within the concurrent powers, therefore we have, on numerous concurrent powers, adopted the strategy to push the boundaries through legislative reform and therefore we have seen for example that even in the previous term our Minister of Education has pushed for some education reform in the Western Cape through legislative reform. That is part of pushing the boundaries of legislative reform. So we have done that in particular regard to push the boundaries for, because Schedule 4 tells us the National Government must develop the broader framework and within that framework the Province must exercise their policy and legislative opportunities, and certainly we have done so.

Schedule 5 of the Constitution is even more dramatic. Hon member Marais, as you know, it speaks directly to exclusive provincial legislative competence and if you look at that space, hon member Marais, you will see that my party the Democratic Alliance is the only party that has really over the last ten years and even when you were the Premier, have expanded the basis of Schedule 5 legislative reform, by having all of those things as laws in the

Western Cape that allow for that. Issues like for example the Western Cape Cultural Commission, the Western Cape Heritage Commission, the Western Cape Language Committee, there are many similar institutions, even Wesgro, all of these public entities with a good-standing record. So hon member Marais, my party believes in constitutional democracy. We believe in expanding the powers of provinces and we have done so over the last ten years and even before that and I think we have been very successful.

The second part of your question, hon member Marais, is does my party believe in getting things done at the lowest level? Well, you would be pleased that my party has approached and adopted an approach that is called the whole issue of subsidiarity. Subsidiarity means let things happen at the lowest level where the local knowledge dictates and the local solutions to be found in that particular regard and that is why we even went, when there was an attempt to centralise the food distribution, to the Human Rights Commission and the Human Rights Commission has ruled in our favour that they are not in favour of the centralisation of food. We believe in the principle of subsidiarity that churches, the organisations in the communities, can do a better job than having to centralise this at a national level.

So, to conclude, hon Speaker, to the direct answer of hon member Marais, we believe in constitutional democracy, expanding the powers of provinces and we believe in the principle of subsidiarity, let things happen at the lowest level where you can get a much better return on the service delivery than having to have it centralised. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Meyer. There is a last follow-up on this question, and that is hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: I thank the Minister for that very broad response. I know about subsidiarity and subsidiarity merely means federalism. There is no other word, or a canton system or a federal system, so we are on the same page, it seems. That is a big jump for the DA and I must say I am not unhappy, because that is the Freedom Front's policy. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you, hon members. I see that there is still another member on this question. Unfortunately, we have exhausted the time in terms of the follow-ups. We can only do four follow-ups in terms of the Standing Rules, and with that we move to the next question. Hon Minister, Dr Ivan Meyer, it is again your turn. I give you the platform.

COVID-19 infections: Witzenberg municipal area

2. Mr A P Van der Westhuizen asked the Minister of Agriculture:

To what extent can the recent spike of infections of COVID-19 in the Witzenberg municipal area (a) be attributed to farming or related activities and (b) affect primary or secondary agriculture production in that area?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, thank you for this

opportunity to answer the second question from hon member Van der Westhuizen.

Yes, there is no doubt that a number of workers have been affected by the infections. However, it is impossible to determine whether the spike is directly attributed to farming or related activities as no scientific analysis has been done within agriculture to determine the root cause of the spikes. What compounds the issue is the fact that the correctional facility in the area had also seen a spike in infections. It should further be noted that agriculture is deemed an essential service and therefore critical to ensure a sustained food supply for the country and its citizens.

Similar to other essential services being affected by the COVID-19 pandemic the agricultural sector and/or specific geographical district area within the agricultural domain cannot therefore be singled out as a contributing factor for the spread of the virus as no industry or social class is immune to this pandemic. Notwithstanding the aforementioned all cases of COVID-19 that the Department was made aware of, were reported to the Departments of Employment and Labour, as well as the Department of Health, in order to ensure that all required protocols are adhered to.

Hon Speaker, the agricultural sector and the agro-processing sector are required to adhere to a number of regulations to ensure food safety and safe working conditions.

In addition to regulations, these are also private standards that the sector must comply with. These include ethical standards, that are implemented by, amongst others, the horticultural sector, comprising fruit and wine industries and since the outbreak of COVID-19 the Sustainable Initiative of South Africa, also known as SISA, has also developed guidelines to assist companies in managing their processes in order to comply with the five golden rules of the pandemic. The ultimate aim is to prioritise the safety of employees so that production is not disrupted. The guide is further complemented by the prevention and management of COVID-19 in the workplace, which is Circular H70 dated 6 May, which was recently released by the Department of Health, and it is an extensive list of how to prevent and manage COVID-19 in the workplace. We have also set that particular protocol with the agricultural sector and certainly it is well received in that particular sector. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister, I have not seen any other follow-up for now but I recognise hon member Van der Westhuizen. I can see now there is a follow-up. Hon member Van der Westhuizen and that will be followed by hon member Marran.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, through you to the hon Minister of Agriculture, as the Minister has stated, farming has fortunately and quite correctly been deemed as an essential service and we are grateful to all in the agricultural sector for keeping us food-secure in these days, despite the dangers of this epidemic.

My question is, what has your Department done to support and protect our agri-workers during this lockdown period “from the death”, as hon member Marran has stated it.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Van der Westhuizen. I recognise the hon Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you to hon member Van der Westhuizen. Well, the Department of Agriculture in the Western Cape has done a number of initiatives. The first one was to develop frequently asked questions to assist the agricultural sector during the lockdown period. Because of these numerous guidelines it was important to us to indicate to the sector how they need to deal with COVID-19, so we have published on the Western Cape Department of Agriculture website the frequently asked questions, and we regularly update it as new information becomes available.

Secondly, hon Speaker, we have issued PPEs or the masks, and the Western Cape Department of Agriculture has issued 100 000 face masks to our farmers and farmworkers to protect our workers in the agricultural sector. In addition, hon Speaker, hand sanitisers, we have also received a donation of an alcohol-based sanitizer and we have made it also available to the sector and we want to put on record here our deep thanks and appreciation to Distell, and I want to thank the Premier for also alerting me to Distell which I have subsequently post our conversation visited, and we have also

handed out some of these sanitisers in the region of Witzenberg specifically.

In addition to that, hon Speaker, we have developed protocols, we have either developed it ourselves or assisted the sector with the development of health-and-safety protocols for the agricultural sector and the most recent circular 870 dated 6 May on the “Prevention and Management of COVID-19 in the Workplace” from our Western Cape Department of Health, is an outstanding circular which we have also shared with the agricultural sector and there is also a specific chapter dealing with “Fighting COVID-19 in the Agricultural Sector.”

In addition, hon Speaker, with the hygiene measures to follow at the workplace, we have also advised the industry on these particular protocols and recently we have also done some spot checks at the agricultural places to see that these regulations are being implemented and adhered to in the workplace.

Lastly, hon Speaker, we also have, as you know, our extension officers. We have asked them to also shift some of their work responsibilities to also assist the Department of Health, the Department of Labour, also to pay spot checks and visits to some of these farms and the rural communities in particular to make sure that we adhere in the sector in terms of COVID-19 regulations. So this is what we have done and in addition we have seen that both the African Farmers Association of South

Africa (AFASA) as well as Agri Western Cape, have also made extra efforts and issued some protocols to protect the workers and the agri-industry in the Western Cape. Thank you, Chair.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I now recognise hon member Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Speaker, thanks. Hon Speaker, I just want to check with the Minister whether he is aware, because the question is whether agri-workers attributed to the number of cases and the spikes in the Witzenberg area, whether they are responsible, whether the Minister is aware that on 7 April 2020, 70 workers were sent home by CFG when the first worker showed symptoms.

Also, hon Speaker, I just wanted to check whether the Minister is aware that on 15 April after the first case in Witzenberg was registered at CFG on 15 April, when the Department of Health went in to screen, that 60 workers were sent home, hon Speaker, to self-isolate within their communities, people at Nduli, for instance.

Also, hon Speaker, the Minister raised the issue of correctional services. He raised it in response that it cannot only be agriculture when a number of people within correctional services have tested positive. Is he aware that the wife of one of those prison wardens is one of the workers that was tested positive at CFG, which might be the link between the number of

prison wardens that have tested positive at correctional services Koue Bokkeveld, to be specific, and the female worker which is also the wife of the prison warden that has tested positive at CFG site? Thanks.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Marran. I recognise the hon Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker, I will try to answer the question very broadly. Firstly, in the context of Witzenberg currently as of yesterday we had in Witzenberg a total of 211 positive cases, but we must put this also in context that of those 174 have subsequently recovered, which leaves us with about 37 cases currently because eight have died. There are currently only 29 cases in Witzenberg that are active.

The question is from the agricultural sector, yes, I am fully aware of all of these incidences that hon member Marran has spoken about and the Department of Labour as well as the Department of Health have visited the institutions and I think we must also remember the protocol is very clear, when an incident happens at an institution or the workplace, when the Department of Health comes in they normally advise what needs to be done at that specific sector. If one person has been found to have tested positive they normally make a recommendation based on their own assessment and criteria in the space of the workplace, and if they make a recommendation that the workplace people must go for tests that is

normally what happens. That does not mean that the people are positive. They will be properly screened and certainly that will be the case.

I think it is important if we want to make the causal link between what has happened at CFG and the link between the Correctional Services, I think this is something that I will rather leave to our medical practitioners to determine, that medical link in that regard. It is plausible. I do not want to dismiss it. This could be plausible, but I think that is something for our medical and healthcare professionals to advise us on that, based on evidence that they can trace.

I think we know that from the agricultural sector there were six cases in farms in the Western Cape in the Witzenberg area. Two of those have recovered and three are currently receiving treatment. Sadly one has died and it is suspected that there are currently not more than 20 cases in the agricultural sector in Witzenberg affected by this, but once a case is reported, it is important that everybody gets screened and those who are in the high-risk category also go for testing and observe all the necessary health protocols and the five golden rules that we often speak about in terms of the COVID-19 regulations here in the Western Cape. Thank you, Chair.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I have a couple of members, so I am going to take the next two hands. It is going to be hon member Nkondlo and followed by hon member Bans and that will be the end of the

speakers on this particular question. I recognise hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, †Somlomo. [Speaker.] I just wanted to follow up and I am partly answered with the response that the Minister just gave... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Okay, thank you.

Ms N D NKONDLO: ...that since the question is asking about the correlation between the spike in infections in the agricultural sector to the production processes itself, and to me he already indicated that at this point there was no study or research investigation actually done in this regard.

Now my question to him is, given that particular reality and the fact that in the absence of any scientific data, at this point it becomes reckless and irresponsible to say, to dispute that those particular cases of infections in that area may actually have a causality to the production system, taking note that work spaces itself, including workers that are working on the farms are part and parcel of the ecosystem of food production. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Nkondlo. I recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker, and to hon member Nkondlo. I think the Premier is on record, this Government is on record that we believe in data-led evidence-base practice and certainly we will certainly be following up on these particular matters. It will certainly take some time to make the causal links and certainly when all the evidence and the research point in the various directions we will be very glad and happy to come back to this Chamber to report on those particular scientific reports, but for now I think we have seen some major changes in the workplaces, protocols that are being adhered to. We are concerned about the agricultural sector because it is a significant sector in the economy, but one of the trends that we have certainly seen and we have observed it as well during our recent visit with the Premier to Witzenberg area, is that the agricultural sector does a great job in terms of managing and preventing COVID-19 in the workplace.

During this week we also had a presentation by Commissioner Klaas from the Correctional Services, who did also indicate the issue of the prison in terms of the Warm Bokkeveld Prison, because as of yesterday there were 22 cases and obviously these are wardens that also live in the community and we are certainly, from the Witzenberg COVID-19 Response Plan, monitoring the situation very closely and certainly we are concerned firstly about human life. We are concerned about the impact that it will have on the agricultural sector and we have seen also in 2018 that we had about R43 billion agricultural value production in this province and certainly it will have an impact on the agricultural value production, the

COVID-19, and I am happy once that research is done we will come back to the House and produce that report more on a scientific basis. Thank you, Chair.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. I now recognise hon Bans.

Ms A P BANS: Hon Speaker, mine is simple and straightforward. Witzenberg is a hotspot, hon Speaker, there is no doubt about it and we also know that the agricultural sector plays a big role in that area. What I would want to know from the Minister is that have you considered a special plan noting that with what we have already there that we are in crisis, that the Department itself should start taking upfront responsibility the same way we have done it with the export of wine using the same method now to the human lives? I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Bans. That is the end of the follow-ups on this specific question. Now I must thank you, hon Minister, Dr Ivan Meyer. That is the end of your questions for now, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: You are welcome, sir, you are welcome, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker. I will be very brief. Thank you, hon member Bans, I think you are absolutely right,

we must take a dedicated approach to save lives. That is the first prize of this Government and therefore this Western Cape Government has adopted a Witzenberg COVID-19 Integrated Response Plan, not only a response of the Health Department, but the whole-of-government approach, the whole-of-society approach, and therefore you are asking me what is this plan. Let me briefly indicate to you and also part of your question you indicate that this Department must take the lead. I am happy to report back to this House that the Western Cape Cabinet has mandated me as the MEC for Agriculture in this province to lead the Western Cape Health Response Plan in Witzenberg and this is what has subsequently happened.

Firstly, the Western Cape Cabinet has approved the plan near the end of April. The plan involves that the additional resources that must be allocated to Witzenberg and additional resources in terms of screening and testing has been done. Also, we are still looking to increase the further testing through a mobile testing facility. We still currently have some problems with the National Health Laboratory Systems, but the Premier has written to the President in this regard. We are also doing public sanitising of the roads in the Witzenberg area together with the Cape Winelands District Municipality.

I have recently also visited Nduli in Ceres to observe and inspect the sanitising of the public roads because this is for us very important. As I have indicated the plan also involve allocating 100 000 face masks. We have already allocated or distributed 35 000 face masks in the Witzenberg

area alone.

Also, in terms of this plan we have isolation and quarantine sites in the Witzenberg area. We have also looked into Wolwekloof. We found it not to be a place to be conducive for the facilities that we have in mind and certainly we have, through Transport and Public Works, found also some facilities in the Tulbagh region.

We are also working with the Department of Labour and our District Health to implement inspections and enforcement in high-risk areas to ensure that the regulations are being implemented. Also, we have requested that we do some greater control over access routes in and out of Witzenberg. There are some 24-hour patrols in law enforcement. We have also requested through our law enforcement agencies, particularly the South African Police Services and the South African National Defence Force – we are still waiting for those. They have not yet been deployed in Witzenberg but we continue to work on that.

We have also, together with the Department of the Premier, Witzenberg Municipality and Cape Winelands, now developed a very comprehensive plan. The hon member Bans will appreciate that we have also now asked one of the wardens that have tested positive and who have now recovered from COVID-19 that that person also take part in the communication campaign and that person has been on the radio stations, WRFM in Witzenberg, so that the message gets across because our Health

Department is currently looking into behavioural change in this particular regard.

Also, we have developed some protocols. The protocol that we have also developed for Witzenberg in particular is the transportation of seasonal workers to other regions in the Western Cape and also in particular to neighbouring provinces.

In addition we have also implemented the transport protocols together with Minister Madikizela of Transport and Public Works, also working very closely with the Department of Labour and I am very thankful, hon Speaker, for the Minister of Local Government and Environmental Affairs, Minister Bredell, because through him and the national, Provincial Treasury has allocated R800 000 for immediate food relief to the food bank in Witzenberg because nobody in that area must go hungry, and so we have also promoted the five golden rules throughout.

The plan is much more extensive but time does not allow me to go into greater detail, but I can say that I have been in touch today with Dr Titus from the hospital in Ceres to check up. I am in regular contact with Mayor Claassen to follow up on the implementation of this plan and certainly I am happy to report back at a later stage about further developments in the Witzenberg Health Response Plan as part of the Government Integrated Plan.

This is not only the responsibility of the Health Department. We adopted the whole-of-government approach and I am particularly happy that we are making progress and if we look at the figures in Witzenberg that I have received also today I think I am very positive that today the figures is that we only have 29 positive cases in Witzenberg. 174 have recovered, eight unfortunately died, and I think we are making significant progress and in our conversation with Dr Keith Cloete he did indicate that the rate of increase of COVID-19 cases – he presented it to our Cabinet in Witzenberg area – is now increasing at a slower rate, which means we are making an impact. Thank you, Chair.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister of Agriculture. I thank the hon members who dealt with the follow-ups on the question. I now move to Question number 3, which is asked by hon Bosman to the hon Minister of Social Development. I now recognise hon Minister Fernandez. [No audible reply.] Hon Minister Fernandez? [No audible reply.]

Alright, I think we are missing the Minister. I will have to proceed for now to the next question.

[Question number 3 to stand over momentarily.]

The SPEAKER: The next question is Question number 4, which is asked by hon Philander to the hon Minister of Health. I now recognise hon Minister, Dr Mbombo.

Chronic medications: shortage of

4. Ms W F Philander asked the Minister of Health:

With reference to an article in the *Rapport* on 3 May 2020 that stated that there was an alleged national shortage of certain chronic medications:

Whether there is a shortage of medication; if so, (a) which medications, (b) what interventions has her Department taken to manage or prevent the shortage in the province and (c) what is the impact of the shortage on affected persons?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thanks for the question but noting that the question refers to an article dated 3 May and now we are almost three weeks later, there might be some discrepancies.

In reference to that the response is about the countrywide lockdown, even the lockdown applicable in other countries internationally. There will always be some medication that will be in short supply so South Africa would not be exempted.

As some of you might be aware, we are using the National Department of Health central procurement as per the National Treasury for most of the common medications. At this present moment there are items that are not

available. Sometimes we have got more than 20 000 of whatever items. Without boring you in terms of what kinds of medications are not available, when we have a stock shortage, we use an alternate supply. With some of those we do have essential drug lists that we are using medications from and if they are out of stock the clinicians are able to use these alternatives.

The Medical Depot places orders and once deliveries are made, which may be part-deliveries, we have to make a point that we rob Paul and pay Pauline in terms of the stock. For example if there are six packs that need to be provided to a person but you find that there is a shortage of that medication, you might provide the person with maybe two and then you say, "I owe you, and come back again". However, because of the lockdown, most of the medications are delivered by community health workers. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister Mbombo. I recognise hon Bosman and then I have got ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Speaker, sorry, hon Speaker, can you hear me?

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, we will talk, you will come in after the current question. I can hear you clearly now.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Alright, alright, thank you, because my mic was muted centrally. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: You are welcome, Hon Minister. Let me acknowledge the following members for this question. I have got hon Philander and then I have hon Bans in that order. Hon Philander.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Minister, thank you very much for the response. The article appeared and yes, this is an ongoing concern for many communities. Minister, can you perhaps please provide more insight into the procurement processes and where does the Province exactly fill in with the procurement processes of national and how do the two complement each other in order to assure that there are adequate stock at our health facilities? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Philander. I recognise the Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It is quite complex, but what I can say is that we have got information system technology that is in place, which from the Western Cape's side we initiated a provincial one even before National introduced their national one.

Let me qualify what I am trying to highlight. You should be able to tell whether there is a shortage of medication in Bitou, in Kranshoek or

wherever because the clinic there relies on the medical manager or on the team of the Bitou substructure. When they do not have it, it means that they have got their own decentralised depot, for example in Oudtshoorn, where they are able to get the medication. But once the medication is there, automatically from the Oudtshoorn side which they might be offering for the Garden Route, it triggers within our Centralised Medical Depot, which is here in the province. So, you will already know in advance if you are going to have any type of shortage and if there is actually a national shortage there.

For example, there was a time pre-COVID, when there was a shortage of BCG drugs, a shortage of contraceptive drugs, a shortage of some cancer drugs, penicillin and so forth. We knew already that because there was an international shortage because of raw materials that were not available. In that case we provided clinicians with a circular that instead of using item A, they should use item B when they are out of stock. I am talking about those where you would be able to provide an alternative, or if there is no three months contraceptives injection, inform the people that they must explore whether they could use other methods, whether it is oral and so forth.

Of course in terms of the National Treasury, using the different regulations according to the Treasury, there are those that are centralised. Then after three years National Health advertises the tenders, and in some instances we find that when they advertise the tenders they might have left out some

of the medications that are being used in the provinces and now when the service provider must call companies internationally, those ones will probably have changed and maybe they now want to be service providers. Then you might find that it becomes too late in terms of making that product and then you might see a situation for almost six months or more that provinces do not get that medication, whilst the national tender now has to review their system and look for alternatives.

In some instances in the province, when we cannot wait anymore, when something like that has happened, we have to use our own money, from our pocket, noting that we will already have provided money to national procurement. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Mbombo. I now recognise hon member Bans. [No audible reply.] Hon member Bans, and then I also have hon member Marran. Let us go to hon member Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Speaker, thanks very much. Hon Speaker, I just want to check with the Minister, she was saying that before COVID there was a shortage of certain drugs, but it seems her response was that it was not necessarily because of our Government's own doing, but an international shortage. I just want to understand that correctly.

Secondly, hon Speaker, the Minister has spoken about some shortages. It seems that the percentage of drugs not available is very low and it seems that

National Government including the Provincial Government is actually doing very well within this period to make sure that chronic medications are there on a regular basis and that if there is a shortage that that shortage is actually very low. I just want to make sure in terms of the response of the Minister.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Marran. I recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, hon member. The shortage, pre-COVID, was about where internationally the drug was no longer available, perhaps because of raw materials. For example, the BCG vaccine that we give to babies because it was – although in South Africa you will find that we might have our own pharmaceutical labs but when the raw material is from let us say India, and then India runs out of it or that they are going to use it for themselves, then it means that that shortage is beyond our control.

The same applied when there was a shortage of penicillin. It was because of the raw material. So, it is beyond our control and therefore the clinicians have to come up with what would be an alternative drug that could be used during that time. It has always been like that.

Another contribution to the shortage is when there is a national tender which they normally do every three years. Actually, we even made a recommendation that they must not do the tender six months before the other one expires, they must do it earlier and also, they must indicate which drugs will need to be available. Because remember every now and again some of

the drugs that are being changed are based on new evidence.

So, what used to happen, especially in the period from November to about March, when people say †ayikho, ayikho [it is not there, it is not there], out of stock, it is about that tender. Now when there is a new one you will find that if they are saying that there are 20 drugs that we need for South Africa, then out of those 20 they will say we need so many based on the Western Cape. We will make the request. They will say we need 5000, Eastern Cape 3000 or whatever, something like that and then down the line find that out of those five that say they requested, the pharmaceutical companies will only will be able to produce three in those large bulks and then two are not available. Therefore, it becomes their fault in the sense that they did not add their number C and number D.

As a result now, specifically for us provinces, it means that number C and number D we have to find elsewhere, not necessarily that it is out of stock. That means that we have to ‘out of our pocket’ look for some of the others and then we trigger urgency in terms of the procurement and supply chain as approved by Provincial Treasury.

Now with COVID, the drugs that we are talking about, are some of those that are related to – because the production of it might be a company, for example in China [Inaudible.] or wherever, affected by COVID. So, they are unable, not only to produce but also it might be because of a shipment that will take longer because there is a lockdown on that side, or they have paused the

production of such drugs. So, I think the article was related specifically to the latter. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. I now recognise hon Philander.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Through you, it is indeed very reassuring, Minister, that we have a system in the province that beforehand indicates what our stock limits are, whether there would be a shortage and then that we have alternatives available and then we also make use of own money to procure in the process.

Hon Speaker, that covers my question in terms of remedial action. I just want to ask the Minister, is she aware of any deaths in the province that occurred due to medication shortages? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Philander. I recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you for the question. I am not aware of any death related to the shortage. Thank you.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. Hon members, I have got one last opportunity. I was looking for hon Bans earlier but I could not get hold of her. Now I am going to proceed and give hon Marais ... [Interjection.]

Ms A BANS: Speaker ...

The SPEAKER: Hon Bans?

Ms A BANS: I am back, Speaker. Thank you, hon Speaker. My question to the MEC was to actually find out how often we have to buy medication as the Province, noting that we are aware of medication being borrowed from one region to another or from one aunty to another; how many times do we find ourselves in a situation where we have to tap into our own pockets? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bans. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, hon member. I would not know. It is difficult to quantify such. On borrowing, my understanding is that it is about getting medication where if, let us say, Garden Route has more and then you transfer it to the Central Karoo. But remember it is still part of the province. That is allowed because it is still the Department of Health. One can do such borrowing.

Then on the issue of us buying from our own pocket, it has always been like that because of the three-month gap from the National Procurement and Supply Chain, when they do not add some of their medications.

Also, with some pharmaceutical companies, although the item would have been added to the list, when they realise, for example, if that item is used by South Africa, Tanzania or Brazil, where they produce it in bulk, in terms of the economy of scale, if the other countries now no longer use it they will find that down the line when they are supposed to produce, that actually it will not make much profit, then they end up dumping us and we have to find our own means.

But at least at that level you will find that National will know and then say, "Province sort out yourself", but what is irritating is every three months when there is an exchange of the service providers of the tenders, then you will find that there has been a mistake. They hit us hard on the chronic medications for those people with cancer, those who have got bleeding tendencies and then also some of them who need other chronic medication like diabetics. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister and to hon Philander and all the hon members who asked questions. I am going to request now that hon member Allen and hon Bosman who asked the questions to the respective Ministers, Community Safety and Social Development. Those questions hon members will stand over and it is Question numbers 3 and 5 because we have now exhausted the time for Questions in this particular sitting. Sorry hon Fernandez, I know you are at that glitch there. I hope you will forgive us.

Now, let us go to Members' Statements. Hon members and the first member

statement I recognise is the Democratic Alliance.

MEMBER STATEMENTS

Ms L J BOTHA (DA): During the State of the Nation Address of 2019, President Cyril Ramaphosa announced that over the next six years every learner will receive a tablet starting by 2020. In his SONA 2020, the President announced the introduction of coding for Grade R to 3 learners which will be fully implemented by 2022.

Not only was this too much of a simplistic view to have for the contested nature of public education in South Africa, it also lacked basic substance on how we would achieve these aims, similar to Minister Motshekga's announcement late Tuesday evening after yet another two hour postponement. She merely reconfirmed the reopening date. The substance of real plan is again missing.

Yes, the rapid spread COVID-19 came with no warning and every public department faces unprecedented challenges, but this must be no excuse for the ANC-led National Government's poor prioritisation and planning of education for the last 20 years.

At this stage there is still no clear picture on how learners in their foundational education stage will be returning to school. The National Department of Basic Education leaves parents and teachers with no updates on the curriculum and the effect it will have on already low literacy and

numeracy levels.

Hon Speaker, this is completely unacceptable. I put it to this House that if the ANC was serious about prioritisation of education, we would have national at-home learning tools and an e-learning system that is beyond reproach. Instead the Western Cape Department of Education has provided tools such as this and more for our learners and parents. The Provincial Department fills the gap where sadly National fails.

Hon Speaker, I make an urgent call for the ANC-led National Department of Basic Education to finally take a forward thinking, evidence-based approach to support our children's future. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms L J BOTHA: Vague regulations and inconsistent policies and promises have failed the young people of this country. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Botha. Hon members thank you. I recognise the ANC.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Speaker, I am here.

The SPEAKER: Yes sir, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much. Hon Speaker, as

public representatives it is crucial that what and how we communicate is carefully guided by the reality and sensitivity on the ground, and of course by what is in the best interests of the public and our tone and approach must not manifest a lack of awareness of our material privilege and comfort due to our deployment and a sense of [Inaudible.] and removal from reality of the majority of those we serve.

Now is the time for the hon MEC for Education to provide leadership and to simply do her job to ensure the protection of our educators, staff and learners and especially those who are in vulnerable circumstances and in overcrowded classrooms.

Hon Speaker, the cavalier approach which places human lives at the altar of profits and petty party politics, as articulated by our party's national leadership and even some of the provincial bosses such as MEC Madikizela is not going to assist us. We are all in the same boat in unchartered waters, yet some have the responsibility to lead and to work with stakeholders to ensure maximum safety of our educators, staff and learners and the ANC here in the province will play its role in that regard.

Many of our educators, including learners, are terrified at the moment. Seemingly many are forced to wait for departmental last-minute deliveries and in fact many schools opened without any mandatory equipment or supplies. In stark contrast, hon Speaker, many schools in leafy areas are buying the best protective care and sanitisers. Some shop for screens to put

on desks between learners and many have cloth masks made in some of the school colours but the poor in this province, who need this assistance the most, are sadly being left behind in most cases. Gagging our educators especially principals who are managing our schools and ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... in the trenches will not help. Together we must acknowledge the fear ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... proceed with caution and hope the MEC will rise to the occasion and lead. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon members before we proceed. I am going to request that, because we are dealing with members' statements, I know it is only two minutes, so if I say your time is up, I often do it just five seconds before your time. Just try and wrap up so that I do not have to keep saying it because it also can be disruptive on the side of the hon member speaking. I now recognise the DA.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, hon Speaker. In the midst of the global pandemic we have been presented with an opportunity to adapt change and rapidly move towards doing things differently. The lockdown has left us with

a challenge in a way which traditionally interacted with our people. The Standing Committee on Local Government has been forced to change the way in how we carry out our constitutional obligations of public participation. In dealing with the need for public engagement and legislation, the Municipal Structures Amendment Bill presents us with a unique opportunity to test the various participation options. Our inability to meet with the various stakeholders due to limitations placed on social interaction should not restrict us in engaging the public in our work.

In order to comply with the National Lockdown legislation and regulations and the Constitution, the Committee needed to adapt to the changing environment. Consequently, public participation in this instance will be conducted through various online platforms and so an innovative [Inaudible.] engagement thus allowing individuals to have their say, voicing their opinions whilst staying at home.

Hon Speaker, we will not risk the lives of those in our province in order to come to a consensus on matters which must be conducted through a process of public participation. I am calling on the people in the province to embrace a new way of participation, both virtually and digitally and make their voices heard. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon America. I now recognise the EFF. EFF, okay you are not there. I now recognise the DA. The DA has no one to speak.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Yes, thank you hon Mitchell.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): My apologies. Hon Speaker, we welcome the Western Cape Government's commitment to continuously adopt innovative ways to combat the spread of COVID-19. The whole of government approach continues to evolve.

On 18 May 2020, the Minister of Transport and Public Works, Minister Madikizela, launched the Red Dot Service. This is a first in South Africa, hon Speaker. This service will support essential service healthcare workers by safely transporting them between the workplace and home after the seven-p.m. public transport cut-off.

This is another example of Western Cape filling the gaps left by poorly constructed, ill-informed, ANC National Government lockdown regulations. Fortunately, the DA in the Western Cape has a forward-thinking whole of society and caring approach. We will not see these vitally important employees left stranded. A further arm of the service commences from 1 June. This service will transport residents who have tested positive for COVID-19 or who are considered high risk after exposure. They will be taken to isolation and quarantine centres in safe, reliable conditions, aligned with the necessary protocols and measures. We must all recognise and appreciate the progressive measures this Government continues to introduce to curb the spread of this virus. This is about preserving human life and not about our

individual narrow self-serving interest.

In light of this, the company utilised to deliver these lifesaving services is called Umanyano. Umanyano meaning unity in isi-Xhosa. At a time like this, stakeholders including SANTACA and the taxi industry, can and have put all political differences aside to serve the people of the Western Cape.

Hon Speaker, this is clear evidence that the Western Cape Government has the best interests of its residents at heart. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mitchell. I now recognise GOOD, hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, the World Health Organisation says that contact tracing and quarantine are critical activities to reduce transmission and control the epidemic and the US Centre for Disease Control confirmed that contact tracing is a core disease control measure employed by local and state health departments for decades and is a key strategy for preventing the further spread of COVID-19.

In South Africa, Professors Madhi and Mendelson, both members of the National Ministers' Advisory Committee, confirmed that South Africa's ambitious community testing programme relies on identifying infected persons, isolating them, tracing their contacts and isolating or quarantining them.

South Africa's planned response to the virus was widely welcomed, but as data is made public it is clear that we have all been focusing way too much on the testing being undertaken across the provinces. The results of testing are giving us numbers and maybe a picture of how the virus is taking hold in our country. But the recommended health protocols to manage transmission requires some action from the public health authorities. That is to use the positive case data and immediately identify the positive cases contacts, trace them and quarantine them and this appears to be failing and it appears to be failing across the country.

Professors Madhi and Mendelson indicated that any single case will on average have 20 close contacts – probably higher in South Africa – that should be traced. By our calculations the tracing rate in the Western Cape is about 1.3 contacts per positive case and that is self-evidently way too low. If we do not maintain a vigilant adherence to the full chain of pandemic management, we will fail to manage the rapid transmission of the disease.

I ask the MEC for Health to use the opportunity, per Rule 145(6) ...
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Wrap up, hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: ... to explain to this Parliament what is happening with contact tracing. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Herron. I now recognise the ADCP, hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. The ACDP in the Western Cape supports the call by the Provincial Government and many others that the move to Level 3 lockdown is a move in the right direction. If we remain at Level 4, the mortality rate, as a consequence of unemployment and starvation will be more devastating than the virus itself. People in the most vulnerable communities are saying the likelihood of them dying of hunger is more likely than of the virus.

Government cannot provide for everyone and the unemployment rate is rapidly growing. This means more dependence on the State. This is not good for our sinking economy. We all know the purpose of the lockdown was to slow the spread so that the Western Cape and the rest of the country can be ready for its peak. We know that lives are important but so is the livelihood of so many others.

As the ACDP, we are asking the ANC in the Western Cape not to obstruct this progression to Level 3 but to support it because together we can defeat this virus and revive this economy. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon, Christians. I now recognise the ANC.

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Marran Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Speaker, while the Corona epidemic hits the Western Cape the hardest on the continent too many people are forced to migrate away from this province.

It came to light that Western Cape farmers stuffed symptomatic seasonal and other workers into taxis on their way to the Eastern Cape and other destinations. During the grace period, many workers crossed the border that were found to be positive for COVID-19 contamination. Many could not be found again after results came. These heartless farmers left many workers at their own risk and many without means to get to their homes. Many were found hopeless and abandoned next to roads, even during the lockdown, in the quarantine period, this happens.

This is not an occurrence this year only. It too often happens that Eastern Cape and other migrant workers are used during high season in the Western Cape only to be discarded like rubbish at the end of the harvest. The ANC says the Provincial Government and [Inaudible.] Western Cape must join hands with labour and other interest groups to find solutions and better workable plans to deal with this and with the occurrence of migrations. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Marran. I now recognise the DA. You may

proceed hon Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): I welcome the Department of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development's R1,2 billion COVID-19 relief fund to support farmers. Unfortunately, this relief was limited to small-scale farmers. These farmers contribute only 1,6% of our food basket.

Applications for this fund closed a month ago. The Department envisaged that the evaluation process would be completed by 8 May and that these small scale farmers would have received their vouchers, capped at R50 000 per farmer for the purchase of much needed input such as feed, fertilisers, seed etc., by now. When we learned yesterday that only a third of those that applied were successful. Individual applicants are still waiting to hear who qualified for the COVID-19 support.

Unfortunately, the criteria to qualify for this support has not been aimed at important aspects such as the potential to save agricultural jobs or to improve agricultural output where threatened by major factors such as the on-going drought.

When will this Government wake up and realise that COVID-19 does not know race and affects everybody, and the Government should support those that will benefit most from a hand-out. We are facing a pandemic where food security could be at risk. While I welcome the support to marginalised groups, it is a global pandemic, not a demographically selected pandemic.

I call on the National Department of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development to prioritise their communication regarding the allocations, to issue the vouchers soon and after all, to target future support to those that would benefit most. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Van der Westhuizen. I now recognise the FF Plus, hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Speaker. The Freedom Front Plus notes as a matter of great concern the dangerous situation existing at some Checkers supermarkets. Pharmacies are operating within Checkers stores and all customers use the same entrances and exits. Serving sick patients with medicine. These patients who may show mere flu symptoms and be assisted by pharmacists may in fact be infected with COVID-19. Having sick individuals mixing with people doing their normal grocery shopping poses serious risks and we should request the Premier to propose at the next PCC meeting that the regulations be amended to address this serious issue.

We should further note that a Checkers supermarket in Durbanville in particular, has been closed three times in April because its staff were infected with the COVID-19 virus. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais. I now recognise hon Brinkhuis, Al Jama-ah. Okay. I will then proceed to the last member's statement, that is the DA.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Mr Speaker, we have exhausted all four statements.

The SPEAKER: Okay, that is fine Chief Whip. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Sorry Speaker, has it exhausted all members statements?

The SPEAKER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Oh sorry, I was going to respond, alright thanks.

The SPEAKER: No, they exhausted the speakers. There is now an opportunity in terms of the Rules, Rule 145, subsection 6 that one of the members of the Executive will respond. So, if you want to take that opportunity hon Minister, you may do so.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, hon Speaker. I wanted to respond to the issue of contact tracing because it is crucial that we understand what it entails and what the contribution is from the Western Cape health side with regard to that. Indeed, it is true, that contact tracing is crucial because it starts with screening, testing and then you isolate the positive person. You quarantine those who have been in contact with the positive person and that you can only do tracing. But one has to also consider that the virus mirrors

itself in every contact, in every population. The same applies in terms of its origin. Across South Africa it has been through imported cases, but you find that when it comes to the Western Cape there have been a higher number of imported cases plus also the associates of the imported cases. Of course, at the beginning we were trailing behind when it comes to contact tracing because of that.

For example, you may have had a tourist who came here and probably planned to go elsewhere, the Kruger National Park and so forth and then you need to trace the people that would be close contacts, because you need to differentiate between a close contact and a casual contact. If you recall, at the time flights were still available. You have to look in terms of, in the plane, the chair behind you and the two rows of chairs behind you, the two rows of chairs in front of you, plus the two persons seated next to you and then that is what you call the “contacts” in terms of those tourists who would have probably got into an Uber and then gone to a hotel and then waited for the quarantine period. Therefore, that is one of the reasons why we trailed behind in the beginning. However, Speaker, those you have to balance again. As I indicated it mirrors differently.

With the clusters that started as well, it meant that now do you go and ask who was sitting next to who? Which other tourist was next to these tourists who ended up as a close contact? Or when you have got these clusters in the shop; most of these people come from poor communities, so you rather go and target test to be able to trace those people who are in the poor community

so that you can make interventions. That is why we have got the hotspot interventions now.

So that is what I am trying to highlight, hon Speaker. You can increase contact tracing but, at the same time, you lose in terms of getting to people who may be positive so that you can make interventions. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. That concludes Members Statements and now we move to Notices of Motion. I recognise hon Baartman.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Thank you, hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House at its next sitting debates the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic and regulations on the Western Cape economy and efforts to save jobs. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Baartman. I now recognise hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House, having noted recent developments in the province, which includes over 10 000 COVID-19 cases and 183 deaths and 440 people in hospital, of which 128 are in ICU or high care, calls for an urgent debate into the handling of COVID-19 outbreak by the Western Cape Government. I thank you.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Windvogel. I now recognise hon Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Good day, hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the influx of cases of police brutality and heavy-handedness in the enforcement of the lockdown regulations, and the impact it has on residents in the Western Cape. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Allen. I recognise hon Xego. I recognise hon Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates at its next sitting the impact of COVID-19 on food security in the Western Cape, and the regulations on support provided in this regard. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Van der Westhuizen. I recognise hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you, hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes with concern and condemns with the strongest possible contempt the reckless and unscientific utterances by the DA provincial leader, Bonginkosi Madikizela, who on Sunday called for the province to be moved down to Level 3, because the number of infections in the Western Cape occurred under Level 5 and 4 of the lockdown, and that death is something that will visit all of us at some stage, and we cannot stop living our lives because we are scared; and therefore I move that the House debates the calls for the province to move down to Level 3. Thank you, hon Speaker.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, on a point of order.

The SPEAKER: I recognise you, hon Mitchell. What is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, I want you to rule as per Rule 59(1) and (2), that any member who wishes to bring any improper, or in their view, unethical conduct on the part of another member to the attention of the House, may only do so by way of a substantive motion, comprising of a clearly formulated and properly substantiated allegation. I am of the view that hon Mvimbi did not do so when he raised the allegation against hon Madikizela, and I want you to please rule on that before the House adopts that motion.

Mr L L MVIMBI: On a point of order, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mitchell. I recognise you, hon Mvimbi and then I am going to make a ... [Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Speaker, Rule 59 (1) says that:

“No member may impute improper motives on, reflect on the integrity or dignity of/or verbally abuse another member. A member who wishes to bring any improper or unethical conduct on the part of another member to the attention of the House, may do so only by way of Substantive Motion.” [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: What is your point, what is your point, hon member?

Mr L L MVIMBI: My point of order, none of what has been raised by hon Mitchell is actually reflected in Section 59. He is actually misrepresenting that clause.

The SPEAKER: Alright. Thank you. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): That is your view. That is your view.

The SPEAKER: Hon Mitchell, I remember I gave you an opportunity to speak and I do not want us to have a debate across the floor at this point. Let me acknowledge the Chief Whip of the Opposition.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Mr Speaker. I think it is important that as and when we interpret the Rules, we interpret them in an obvious and sound manner for everyone to understand. Now what member Mitchell is doing is actually trying to put the Rules as a way of hindering other people from operating and exercising their constitutional rights in the House. And therefore, hon Speaker, I do not see any reflection of what member Mvimbi said to what is said in Rule 59. I thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, if I may?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip Lekker. I am going to request that at this point I will give the last opportunity hon Mitchell, and then I will make a ruling for now.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you Speaker. Hon Speaker, I do not want to belabour the point. The reality is nobody is taking the right to speak away from hon Mvimbi. All I am saying is that in the event that hon Mvimbi wants to table a motion of improper conduct, to bring it to the attention of the House, he must please follow the Rules and by that I mean a substantive motion needs to be tabled and not a Motion with Notice. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. I now have to provide some guidance on how we should proceed. I am going to look at the contents of the motion by hon Mvimbi and in the next sitting I am going to make a ruling on that.

Mr L MVIMBI: Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. I hope we are fine now. Hon Marais. I recognise hon Marais, for the motion. [Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the efficacy and sustainability of the Cape Agency for Sustainable Integrated Development in the Rural Areas (Casidra) with special emphasis on job creation, food security and empowerment of emerging farmers. Further that consideration be given to requesting a thorough investigation by the Western Cape Public

Service Commission in this regard, and to table its report to this House within six months. I so move, hon Speaker, because this agency has done nothing to empower black and coloured emerging farmers since 2007.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais. I now recognise hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes with concern that seven staff members of Food Town Hyper in Khayelitsha, who defied orders of management and went to get tested for COVID-19, after a colleague of theirs was infected, has been fired by management; notes further that management has threatened employees not to get tested last week and refused to close down as per the protocol. Calls for an urgent investigation into the conduct of this company. I so move.

The SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, that is a motion without notice, and we are dealing with the notices of motion, so, that will not qualify for this exercise, for this particular process right now. Your name was here on notices of motion but we will deal with it later on. Perhaps you misplaced that one. I am going to proceed for now to hon Windvogel. Alright. Let us proceed to hon Lekker, Chief Whip of the Opposition.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker, am I audible?

The SPEAKER: Yes, yes Chief Whip. We can hear you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Okay. Thank you, Mr Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the many successes by SAPS in its battle with abalone and marine poaching in the Western Cape. Thank you.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you very much, hon Chief Whip. I now recognise the hon Bans. Hon Bans ... [Interjection.]

Ms A BANS: Thank you, hon Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Yes, hon Bans, I recognise you, but before you proceed I would like to state the following, that, hon members, this was a motion for hon Bakubaku-Vos, but it was brought to the attention of the Speaker that she is unavailable to proceed and therefore hon Bans will take the motion. You may proceed, hon Bans.

Ms A BANS: Hon Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the failure of the Western Cape Department of Social Development to maintain safe social distances between poor visitors in and around its offices. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Bans. Hon members, that concludes the notices of motion. We now move to Motions without Notice. I recognise hon Philander.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with sadness the latest total of six healthcare workers who have sadly succumbed to COVID-19 in the Western Cape. Their service to the people in the Western Cape has certainly not gone unseen. Also, hon Speaker, please let us do everything possible to ensure their safety as well. My heartfelt condolences and prayers to their families, friends and colleagues. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Philander. I now recognise hon Nkondlo.

MS N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and makes a call to the Provincial Government through the Economic Recovery Workstream to be active in finding employers in the Western Cape who have claimed UIF COVID-19 benefits but still not paid it to the deserving beneficiaries; further calls on the Provincial Government working with municipalities to heighten awareness to employees on how to apply directly to this fund, using all available media awareness including local radio and newspapers, especially in non-metro regions where there may not be satellite offices of the Department of employment and Labour; and calls on the Department to provide weekly reports to the WCPP Ad-hoc Committee on progress. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Nkondlo. Hon members, I recognise, hon Philander.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with sadness the passing of Reverend, Doctor and Professor Mary-Ann Plaatjies-Van Huffel; daughter of Wellington.
 †Prof Plaatjies-Van Huffel was ‘n baanbreker. Die eerste vroue-

dominee van die Nederduits-Gereformeerde Kerk in Suid-Afrika; die eerste vroue-aktuaris van die VGKSA Kaapland; en die eerste Moderator van die VGKSA se Algemene Sinode in 2012. In 2013 was sy verkies as een van die Adjunk-Presidente van die Wêreldraad vir Kerke en as President vir Afrika van die Wêreldraad vir Kerke. Sy was 'n merkwaardige mens, met besondere leierseienskappe en sal onthou word vir haar belangrike bydraes wat sy plaaslik, asook internasionaal gemaak het; 'n vrou van standpunt wat die grense van stereotipering vir alle generasies en generasies na ons, verskuif het. Ons dra ons medelye oor aan Ds Dawid van Huffel, haar susters en uitgebreide familie, asook haar geliefde kerkgemeenskap. Dankie, agb Speaker.

[Kennisgewing van voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Prof Plaatjies-Van Huffel was a pioneer. The first female minister of the Dutch Reformed Church in South Africa; the first female actuary of the URCSA Cape Region; and the first Moderator of the URCSA's General Synod in 2012. In 2013 she was elected as one of the Vice-Presidents of the World Council of Churches and as President for Africa of the World Council of Churches. She was a remarkable person, with unique leadership qualities and will be remembered for her important contributions she had made locally as well as internationally; a woman of standpoint who shifted the boundaries of stereotyping for all

generations and generations after us. We convey our condolences to Rev Dawid van Huffel, her sisters and extended family, as well as her beloved church community. Thank you, hon Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Philander. Hon Xego is not in the House. I then recognise hon Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you. [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, point of order.

The SPEAKER: Okay. Hon Allen, please take your seat. What is your point of order, hon DA Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Mr Speaker, I am just checking if the House agrees to the motion?

The SPEAKER: Oh, thank you. Thank you, hon Chief Whip. Hon Members, the motion by hon Philander, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No, objections. Agreed to. Thank you, Chief Whip for bringing that to my attention. I now recognise hon Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House wishes the Western Cape Muslim Community a blessed Eid Mubarak, which is due in the coming days. We know that the month of Ramadan is a time for reflection, prayer, giving and sacrifice and that this House wishes all Muslims within the Western Cape a happy and peaceful day. Thank you. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Allen. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Thank you very much. Let us proceed. The motion is carried. I now recognise hon member Sayed. Alright, I will proceed to hon ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Sorry, hon Speaker. I was on mute, hon Speaker. I did not realise I was on mute.

The SPEAKER: Oh, okay. That is fine. Alright, that is fine. You may proceed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that Ms Noluthando Nogcinisa, a youth activist and a member of the Western Cape Provincial Executive Committee of the

ANC Youth League, has been hospitalised after she contracted COVID-19; notes further that Noluthando was moved away from the quarantine site in Dennebos to the Ceres Hospital after her condition became serious; and wishes her a speedy and full recovery. I thank you, hon Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Sayed. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. I recognise the Chief Whip, hon Wenger.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that as Christians celebrate Ascension on Thursday 21 May 2020, may this occasion be celebrated with peace and love in our hearts. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. I now recognise hon member Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House sends condolences to the family, friends and colleagues of Tygerberg professional nurse, Anncha Kepskey, who on Wednesday died of COVID-19. Sister Kepskey is the fifth health worker in the Western Cape who became a victim of the pandemic and was the assistant manager of the trauma unit at Tygerberg Hospital in Bellville. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon Windvogel. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to. Hon members, I recognise hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House condemns the National Department of Social Development's attempts to centralise the distribution of cooked food and control nutritional programmes being run in communities across the country. That this House further notes that the South African Human Rights Commission has labelled this a violation of human rights as the Democratic Alliance lodged a complaint against the National Department. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bosman. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: Objection. Objection, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Alright. Thank you, hon members. The objection has been noted and the motion will be printed in the Order Paper. Hon Lekker, the Chief Whip of the Opposition. We are going to wait, number 1, 2, 3. Now we will proceed. [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Speaker!

The SPEAKER: Yes? So, you are listening. [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, I wanted to check if I am audible enough.

The SPEAKER: You are audible, Chief Whip, you are.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Mr Speaker. On behalf of the ANC, I move without notice:

That the House notes an 82-year old Mbekweni resident tested positive for the Corona virus and was sent back home to self-quarantine and calls on the provincial Health Department to investigate this matter and urgently report about it to this Legislature. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Lekker. I would like to establish from the members, whether there are any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections.

An HON MEMBER: No objections.

The SPEAKER: Motion agreed to. I recognise hon Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House applauds the work being done by the Western Cape Department of Human Settlements to continue social housing projects during lockdown. This is part of the Western Cape Government's efforts to provide sustainable human settlements to those who need it most. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Maseko. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. I now recognise hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes ANC senior Legislature member hon Gladys Bakubaku-Vos has fully recovered from COVID-19 and is back at work serving her community. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Windvogel.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Amandla! Amandla!

An HON MEMBER: Whoo-hoo! Amandla!

An HON MEMBER: She is not at the House.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): That is actually unparliamentary.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. That is not how we behave in the

House. May I request the House to note the motion and thank the fact that hon Windvogel is back and well and we welcome her back on duty. Are there any objections to the motions ... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Sorry, on a point of order.

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Point of order. Point of order. Point of order, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: What is the point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: The point of order, hon Speaker, is that you actually referred I think incorrectly to hon Windvogel being back in the House, whereas I think the reference was to hon Bakubaku?

The SPEAKER: Oh, did I? I did not notice that. Thank you, hon Leader of the Opposition. I ... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It is a pleasure. It is an absolute pleasure, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It is an extra vote for him.
It is an extra vote for him.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I talked to hon Bakubaku-Vos all the time. I am glad that she is back, and we thank God for her. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to. Hon Philander.

†Me W F PHILANDER: Baie dankie, agb Speaker.

[Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, hon Speaker.] I move without notice:

That the House notes and extends sincere thanks and appreciation to all community organisations and individuals in the Drakenstein municipal area, who are working day and night to provide social relief and assistance to the vulnerable society in Drakenstein. I further extend sincere thanks and appreciation to all donors and all volunteers that are opening their hearts to social relief initiatives, on a daily basis. Your tireless efforts during these challenging times are commendable. Let us continue to be each other's keepers. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Philander. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No objections, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: No objections. Motion agreed to. Hon members, I now recognise hon Bans.

Ms A BANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes the Central Karoo District Municipality flaunts hon MEC Anton Bredell's instruction to host virtual video meetings. The DA Mayor Annelie Rabie calls regular contact meetings and rakes in subsistence and travel allowance by almost daily commuting between Prince Albert and Beaufort West; and calls on the MEC to investigate and urgently report to the Legislature on this matter. I so move, hon Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bans. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: No objection.

An HON MEMBER: Object. I object.

An HON MEMBER: Object.

The SPEAKER: Alright. Objection has been noted. The motion will be placed on the Order Paper. Thank you, hon members. The next motion is by hon Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House recognises the work being done by Al-Maamana, a volunteer group based in Lentegur, Mitchells Plain that have taken up the task of feeding hundreds of residents during this difficult time. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Mackenzie. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No objection, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: No objections. Agreed to. I now recognise hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with sadness an Overberg resident of 62 years last week became the first casualty of COVID-19 in that region and that this

Legislature sends its condolences to all family and friends of those that died of Corona virus-related problems. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Windvogel. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections.

An HON MEMBER: No objections.

The SPEAKER: Agreed to. I recognise hon Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commends the Hawks on a successful drug bust on the N1 in Cape Town amounting to 36kg of cocaine. That this House further notes that drugs and gangsterism are stealing our young people's future; that this House commits to continue and ramp up its efforts to build society's resilience to crime, in families, in the school environment, amongst youth at risk, as a result of the harms caused by substance abuse. And that this House calls on all law enforcement agencies, together with the entire criminal justice system to play their role towards ensuring that drug premises are closed, and criminals are brought to book.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Allen. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Agreed to. Hon Bans.

Ms A BANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House bids a Central Karoo resident, who on Monday became the first recorded positive patient in that region, a speedy recovery. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Bans. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. I recognise hon Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Mr Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the commemoration of International Day Against Homophobia, Transphobia and Biphobia 2020 on 17 May 2020. I move that this House supports events to raise awareness of the violation of LGBT rights in the Western Cape. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Allen. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion ... [Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Speaker, I do not know what all those phobias mean. Can he explain what all those phobias mean – otherwise I am going to object.

The SPEAKER: We do not explain that motion.

Mr R I ALLEN: A quick Google Search will help the member.

The SPEAKER: We do not explain. I think, I would like to hear from hon Marais, whether that is an objection? No objection?

Mr P J MARAIS: Yes, I object.

The SPEAKER: You object. Alright. Hon member, the motion will be recorded in the Order Paper. The objection has been noted. I now recognise hon Lekker, the Chief Whip of the Opposition.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commiserates with the family, friends and compatriots of Prof Mary-Anne Plaatjies-Van Huffel, 61-years old, of the Stellenbosch University Theological Faculty who died on Tuesday after an operation

and also notes she was the first black ordained preacher of the Dutch Reformed Missionary Church. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Lekker. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. Hon Lekker, I recognise you. Alright.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Is it hon Lekker? Hon Lekker or Windvogel, Speaker?

The SPEAKER: I have got, on the list here, hon Lekker, in terms of the list of submitted motions.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Okay.

The SPEAKER: But they follow each other, so I bet there must have been an error. Now we will proceed to hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes the overload of hospitals and the health staff workload due to serious COVID-19 contamination and that hon MEC Nomafrench Mbombo reports to this Legislature on the situation and readiness ahead of a possible upsurge. I thank you, hon Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Windvogel. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

Ms L M MASEKO: Objection.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, I object that the motion is moved without notice.

The SPEAKER: Alright. Thank you, hon members. Hon members ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. We are dealing with motions ...
[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Who is that?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker. It is hon Lekker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip. Yes, the Chief Whip of the ...

[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I was in the middle of reading my motion and then there was this conversation between yourself and member Windvogel.

The SPEAKER: Alright. We will finish with this motion now and then I will give you the opportunity, hon Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? I have recognised the objections and the motion will now be recorded in the Order Paper. The objections have been noted. I now recognise hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Mr Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the attack and robbery last week on the ANC ward councillor in Old Crossroads, Nokuthula Bolitye and her 13-year-old son, and bid them a speedy recovery from the wounds they sustained. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Lekker. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. I now recognise hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and calls for an urgent establishment of CWP's branch, COVID-19 Committee, that will investigate the socio-economic impact of COVID-19 in the province as it relates to women and children, including poverty, hunger, job losses and the general labour conditions and care support in both public and private sector work spaces, as well as to include GBV during this period; further calls for investigation into the impact of COVID-19 on women-owned enterprises and how their basic human and labour rights have been undermined during this time; and calls for a report to be tabled and debated during the Women's Parliament in August 2020. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Nkondlo. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. Hon members, I also, the next speaker is hon Nkondlo. I recognise you, hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the poor services to informal traders in the townships and the absence of an inclusive database of all informal traders in the City of Cape Town, despite there being the highest concentration of them in the province. Notes further that this has led to exclusion and difficulties for informal traders to trade with businesses of essential services and goods during the lockdown as the City, supported by this Provincial Government, flatly refuses to permit those traders, as they choose to only provide to those that they term “suitably vetted”; and condemns this practice as it further entrenches the inequality that has been existing in the province and further perpetuates abuse and misuse of regulations that keep informal traders out of the economy, and calls for an enhanced effort similar to the City and deeded investment in urban markets like in Sea Point, Woodstock and CBD, I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Nkondlo. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The SPEAKER: The objection has been recorded. The motion will now be ...

[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. The objection has been recorded. The motion will be recorded in the Order Paper. May I now request hon Nkondlo? Before hon Nkondlo, I see hon the Chief Whip of the Opposition, you have got your hand up.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, hon Speaker. It was during the time where I was busy with the motion.

The SPEAKER: Alright. Thank you for that. Hon Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Speaker. That ends my motions that I have. I am not sure of a fourth one.

The SPEAKER: Okay. Thank you, hon Nkondlo. Now you had three in a row. All written in your name.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Yes. And I have read all of them.

The SPEAKER: Maybe, the computer fell in love with you. Let us now proceed to hon Sayed.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon the Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): My apologies. Have you concluded with the motions of notice?

The SPEAKER: The next one is the last one.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Okay. I will raise my point then, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip. I recognise hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the ward councillor of Hout Bay, Roberto Quintas, has downplayed Hout Bay as a COVID-19 Hotspot as identified by the Western Cape Provincial Government and has actually undermined the Premier and the Provincial Government by releasing a statement stating that the Provincial Government provided the wrong statistics for Hout Bay. I so move, hon Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Sayed. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Yes. Moved without notice, because we have not seen the facts yet, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Are they not watching SABC TV?

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjection.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: No, we do not watch propaganda.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. The objection has been noted.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): They must speak to their members in townships. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Sorry, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Apology accepted, sir. I have got a nice comfortable space to accept apologies. Thank you very much. I would like

to put to the members that the objection to the motion has been noted and will be recorded on the Order Paper.

I hear the Chief Whip wants to say something, but what I would like to do now, at this stage, I would like to request that you please relieve me. It has been a wonderful day up to now and the Deputy Speaker will take charge. I can see her face there. She is ready to relieve me. Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. Hon members, thank you. Deputy Speaker, over to you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Over to you, Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you. I just thought before the Speaker leaves, there are no decisions of the House on the first two motions without notice.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is correct.

The SPEAKER: Oh. Thank you, Chief Whip. I am going there now. I remember, Chief Whip, you drew my attention to the motions when we started with the third motion and we inadvertently omitted to go back to the first two. Thank you for bringing my attention to that. Hon members I would like to put the question. Are there are objections to the motion being moved without notice? And that was the first motion. No objections. Agreed to.

And then the second question by hon Nkondlo. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The SPEAKER: Who is objecting?

Ms D BAARTMAN: Deidre Baartman.

The SPEAKER: Oh, objection. The objection – thank you hon members. The objection is noted, and the motion will be recorded in the Order Paper. Thank you very much, members. That concludes the motions. Over to you Deputy Speaker, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Speaker. We will now deal with the subject for discussion in the name of honouree Brett Herron from the Good Party, as printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the honouree Herron. Hon Herron, my apologies. My apologies.

SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION

(Addressing spatial justice in the Western Cape: centuries of injustice
and three democratic decades of neglect)

Mr B N HERRON: [Laughs.] I do not know what “honouree” is. Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, the manner in which societies organise space has a key bearing on social and economic dynamics. In South Africa, race and space remain indelibly linked. More than 26 years of democracy has miserably failed to unravel colonial and apartheid town planning. Nowhere is this more apparent than in Cape Town, where conservatives and the DA have found ways and means to block every single affordable housing project proposed for development in areas that their National Party fathers designated for whites only.

The DA’s record mirrors that of the ANC, when it held the reigns in the City. A big fat zero. On the Cape Flats, to this day many families do not speak about where they live. They speak about where they come from. And where they come from is not Lavender Hill, Grassy Park or Nyanga. It is Constantia, Newlands, Sea Point, District 6 and Simon’s Town.

Spatial injustice is the axle on which the wheels of inequality and the cycle of poverty turn. Families with the least household income must travel furthest to get to work, to the stadium, shopping mall, hospital or school. By the time you have paid for transport, what do you have left? They return to impoverished neighbourhoods and communities where social issues like gangs, drugs and crime take root. Without jobs, as many are, people are trapped in their immediate environments. There is no way out.

Between 2016 and 2018, when I was responsible for Housing in the City of Cape Town, our team doubled the delivery of affordable housing. Between 2016 and 2018, we initiated multiple projects to deliver affordable homes in good parts of the City. Thousands of inner-city homes would have been under construction now, but the reality is, not a single home is being built. The DA stopped these projects. They also stopped people travelling out of apartheid townships. For 5 years MyCiTi provided safe, affordable transport to residents of Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain. 8 months after I resigned from the DA, they stopped the service. That was almost a year ago. The Province has fared no better. The Premier shows off Forest Village as his Government's commitment to spatial justice. Forest Village is at the very outermost edge of the Metro. A location for the poor in a very poor location. Far from work. Far from education and far from whites.

I understand it may be scary for conservative politicians to consider coloured and black people living in their neighbourhoods, just as it is difficult for them to countenance leaders such as De Lille, Mazibuko, Mashaba or Maimane, but to continue developing dense settlements for those with few real rights, out of sight and out of mind, is not a viable alternative. DA leaders must come clean with their constituents and supporters on the Cape Flats, among other areas, and tell them why they do not want them in their suburbs. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. It is indeed a fact that the history of this injustice is long and undeniable and the last 100 plus years was quantified into a number of abhorrent pieces of legislation. These statutes all had their own specific goals, but the overall intention was clear – depriving some people of their right to ownership of fixed property and limited access to the infrastructure needed to deliver a decent standard of living.

This is, indeed, Deputy Speaker, a very long history. It started before 1913, but 1913 produced the Native Land Act – the first piece of segregation legislation passed by the Union Parliament and in 1934 we saw the Slums Act designed to displace black people from urban areas and in 1950 the Group Areas Act was produced, which led to various forced removals, which left still existing scars on our society and which shaped much of the residential patterns of this legacy.

The list is depressing and seemingly endless, hon Deputy Speaker and this is a South African phenomenon and that is why we still have Mamelodi and Pretoria, you still have Umlazi and Durban and you still have Khayelitsha and Cape Town. Hon member Herron must not give the impression that this is something unique to the Western Cape, because that would be disingenuous.

So, hon Deputy Speaker, infrastructure was used as a strategic instrument to segregate people spatially, based on race. Provision of water,

accommodation, electricity, sanitation, education, health and so on, all require infrastructure and this was denied or provided only in the most basic form.

Given the limited time available for this discussion, Deputy Speaker, it is not my intention to attempt to address all the steps taken or not taken to address spatial inequality by the various spheres of government involved. I will instead limit myself to a few aspects of my present portfolio. I have no doubt that my colleagues, like Minister Simmers, will also cover pertinent aspects of the work already done and being done in his Human Settlements portfolio.

It is very disheartening, Deputy Speaker, to hear smoke and mirrors from member Herron and yet, he has got nothing to show for his track record when he was the Mayco member in the City of Cape Town, besides telling us how bad his former party was and all the attempts that he failed. Therefore, I was hoping, that when he raised this debate, he would at least give us some indication of his track record where he succeeded in dealing with the challenges that we are facing.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the work undertaken by my Department is ensuring the properly planned, financed provision of accommodation which breaks down the entrenched patterns of spatial inequality. It is very important for us, when we have this debate, to really be honest about the practical steps that we need to take, because I get a sense that some of us has this notion that to address spatial injustice you need to take everyone to task.

The reality of the matter is that you have areas like Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain that you cannot wish away. And therefore it is very important to also note the interventions that have been made in those specific areas, even though they are not enough, to make sure that you create an environment in areas like those so that people can live a decent life.

In partnership with the City and private sector, the Department developed and implemented a Better Living Model example on well located urban state land and that will support positive social-economic and spatial integration with a view to being able to replicate this on the other side in future.

In 2012, the former Conradie Hospital site was identified as a suitable location for the pilot of this example for Better Living Model. This development will create affordable, integrated housing opportunities close to Cape Town CBD and transform the site into an integrated place where people can live, work, play and learn. The primary objective is to create an affordable residentially-led mixed income and mixed use development that optimises urban land use and incorporates a range of grant-funding housing.

A total of 1 764 grant-funded units will be made up of 1 235 social housing units and 529 FLISP units. There will also be 1 838 open market units, giving a total of 3 602 units. This is one of the examples, Deputy Speaker, that the Provincial Government, together with the City of Cape Town and a number of other municipalities across the province are doing in terms of

addressing the spatial injustice. As I alluded to, this is a very long history which all of us are grappling with and I think the interventions that have been made thus far are proving that we are moving in the right direction.

If you look at the overall Somerset Hospital precinct, it is defined by three sites, the former Helen Bowden Nurses Home precinct, the Somerset Hospital precinct and the old City Hospital precinct. Residential land uses the largest component of the land use mix in the Somerset precinct, and as you are aware, hon Deputy Speaker, and a number of members in this House, that with the support of some of the members in this House, that particular precinct was now invaded by people and we are engaging them with an intention of making sure that we are developing that area for the benefit of many of the people, including some of the people who are residing there currently.

The Somerset Development would enable over 1 300 households to live close to work, shopping, entertainment, and other urban services, including a minimum of 20% affordable housing in an area that is now well served by public transport.

The third intervention by this Government is Founders Garden, which is situated in Roggebaai in the CBD of Cape Town, south of the elevated freeway, Nelson Mandela Boulevard. This site has historical and urban design significance. Rezoning approval obtained from the City of Cape Town was for residential allocation of a minimum of 2 900m², including social

housing.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it is understandable that the spotlight of spatial transformation has in recent years fallen increasingly on the CBD and Cape Town. The need is real, and we acknowledge that. Opportunities are limited and various organisations have driven an intensive campaign, often advocating actions which have led to the unlawful occupation of properties, but that is a topic for another day, Deputy Speaker.

My Department has not however, limited its efforts to addressing spatial transformation to only the CBD of Cape Town. We have made available to Minister Simmers, and even prior to making available property to Minister Simmers, a number of interventions were made in a number of towns outside Cape Town, where integrated housing developments were implemented and executed, benefiting thousands of people in those towns.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister, kindly finish off.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: We have also made available a number of sites to Minister Simmers so that we can continue with this work in areas like Woodstock and a number of areas surrounding Cape Town and in the city centres of various towns.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. [Inaudible – poor audio connection.] about how all should be part of every aspect of the economy. This is also true about land ownership and a place to stay. All people around the globe think and know about our massive challenges since COVID-19 brought the whole economy to a standstill and as masses sought shelter from this virus.

As the world and economy wakes up to a new dawn, so too must we open up ownership and opportunities. Here in this province we will soon see a fresh transformation in equitable redistribution, also of land to people. This should include apartheid spatial planning that was part of the social engineering and manipulation to suit white supremacy plans and white living zones or special segregation. The apartheid spatial scars today are still too visible and especially in rural areas. People who are kept separate by a river, a road, a railway line, dam or wall are seen everywhere. Deputy Speaker, can you hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. Absolutely. Carry on.

Mr P MARRAN: When settlers came to the Cape, they travelled in their ships, loaded with equipment and slaves. None of them brought land here. They used the land that was here to advance their plans and to pile up wealth.

Those that were marginalised by hateful apartheid colonialism, together with racism and gentrification, all must work for a new order and integration.

The old socio-economic system by people who thought they could forever be superior from behind their guns, must be changed. The outdated legacy of this apartheid virus needs to be conquered. Within our laws land must be availed, unproductive land redistributed, identified land allocated and a long-term plan funded to bring a new planning system. Food security and the agricultural economy must be maintained, but the back of the cruel apartheid spatial planning dragon must be broken once and for all. Integration cannot be avoided anymore.

Municipalities have a bigger role to play in the process to speed up and unite people to find solutions. Security of tenure must be taken seriously for homelessness. Poor people and social housing are priorities as this evil apartheid virus damage must be reversed. The new approach lacks in the conservative Old Boys' club backrooms of the DA whose members masquerade as liberals. They seek privilege for a few over decades and even less payment for workers than the national determined minimum wage.

Things have got worse in the DA since leaders like Mmusi Maimane while we were left on the wayside by those people protected in the very white interests of the DA money supplies. The present provincial regime of the DA has yet to change its approach and we have not seen any movement or strong desire for change under Western Cape Premier Allan Winde's tenure thus far.

The DA can show its mettle and unconditionally join the ANC's call for a moratorium on the sale of all land, not leasing for long periods or vacant land for a pittance, and not allowing [Inaudible.] to perpetuate apartheid spatial planning that divides people.

The DA Leaders have a moral obligation to protect and support the poor, not to advance the interest of big businesses. Those who benefited in the past were investors with deep pockets.

Hon Deputy Speaker, let me end off by quoting one of the ANC presidents, John Langalibalele Dube, when he addressed an ANC conference in the early 1950's. He said, and I quote:

“Land is everything. Without land we are nothing. On land we plant food, on land we build houses, on land we practice our cultures and we pray. Any race, it does not matter what colour or creed, are doomed to fail without land. Therefore the restriction of landownership based on race shall be ended.”

Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I recognise the hon Minister Simmers.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon

Premier, hon Cabinet members and hon members of the House. Hon Deputy Speaker, on social media platforms words and phrases are being compared with or referred to as a person. If you Google the word “hypocrite” therefore, or open your dictionary right now, you will see a picture of the sponsor of today’s debate next to this word.

When someone is in a position where they have an opportunity to make a difference and do not use it optimally, yet seek to criticise others, we should all be alarmed.

Perhaps some might feel this is harsh as hon member Brett Herron, while he was still the Mayco member of Transport and Human Settlements in the City of Cape Town, spoke about the potential social housing project at the Salt River Market and in Pine Road, Woodstock. Where are these noteworthy projects he keeps on talking about, one should ask?

It was during hon member Herron’s tenure in the 2017/18 financial year, Madam Deputy Speaker, that the City of Cape Town had to return R166 million of its Urban Settlements Development grant to the National Department of Human Settlements. This amount would have produced approximately 1,038 housing opportunities. †Waar is die verskil dan nou wraggies? [Where then is the difference now, indeed?] Undoubtedly an opportunity missed by this hon member in his previous life as a councillor, to make a difference in the lives of more than 1,000 people in the City of Cape Town.

When addressing spatial injustice, you have to transform spaces and places. Have we managed to achieve this as a province? Not fully yet. Have we made strides on our path to transform our spaces and places? This is an emphatic “yes”.

Hon Deputy Speaker, addressing the apartheid spatial planning legacy is a provincial imperative, and as such, well-located, affordable housing has been designated as a priority, as our aim is to remarkably improve the lives of the most deserving in our communities, while also seeking to address the injustices of the past. These are inclusive of the elderly, disabled, backyard dwellers and those longest on the waiting list, where we are ensuring that our people are moved into an improved area and dwelling, which they call home.

Hon member Herron is fully aware of this Provincial Government’s impeccable record of delivery, but not only that, through this delivery we have improved and transformed the lives of thousands of people across this province. Had the hon member, while in the City, spent the USDG for the 2017/18 cycle, it could have been a different picture that we are talking about today.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the sponsor of today’s debate should familiarise himself with my Department’s 2020 to 2025 strategic document, particularly since he is part of the Standing Committee of Human Settlements. By doing so he will note how spatial transformation is pertinently expressed in this

document for the entire province. I could also advise that this hon member starts visiting the various projects throughout the province to obtain a full and clear understanding of what is happening, and not just focus on Forest Village itself.

It is not always advisable to only write no-good newsletters that are based on fake news. One of the ways we are addressing spatial transformation is through the social housing programme which we have throughout the Western Cape. †So pleks van 'n kwak selfverkoper, Ondervoorsitter, spreek ons die ware nood van ons mense aan, anders as die borg van vandag se debat. [So instead of being a quack self-seller, Deputy Chair, we address the real need of our people, not like the sponsor of today's debate.]

In the Metro we have the Glenhaven Project in Bellville, Regent Villas in Mitchells Plain, and phase 3 of the Bothasig Social Housing projects, where together over 900 individuals will benefit between now and 2021. This year we are also looking forward to the commencement of the Pine Road Social Housing project in Woodstock. Others have blown hot air about this, but this we are doing right now. Furthermore the 1,055 units which are intended to be developed around Goodwood Station will also occur in due course.

Social rental housing is, however, not limited to the Metro, as 11 [Inaudible.] municipalities are working towards establishing smart partnerships with social housing institutions across our province.

The province has secured R500,000 from our social housing partner, SHRA, to help the Stellenbosch Municipality investigate the development potential within specific municipal precincts. This is making steady progress. We also have the Dal Josafat Social Housing project in Paarl, which is in the planning phase. Approximately 400 units are expected and last Friday Council approved its SHI company which will assist them with this.

Hon Deputy Speaker, we are a forward thinking and planning province and Department, and with this said approximately 82 further potential projects are being explored and packaged over the next 10 years. This entails approximately 22,000 social housing unit opportunities. Some of these potential future initiatives include the Salt River Market development, which is proposing 216 social housing units, with 448 market-related units.

If you make your way to Mossel Bay you will also find the Mount View development, where in excess of 300 social housing units will be constructed in due course as part of a bigger project site plan, hon Deputy Speaker.

In conclusion, hon Deputy Speaker, COVID-19 is teaching us that it cannot be business as usual. Policy, budgetary realignments and by-law amendments, particularly at National and Local Government levels are urgently required if we are going to effectively and speedily address the needs of our people, and to address injustices of the past.

In conclusion, as a provincial department, but also as the DA-led Provincial

Government, we remain committed, as we have been over the past decade, to accelerate human settlements delivery where it is needed the most, by promoting social inclusion throughout the development of these integrated projects, to ensure they are resilient, safe and sustainable, but above all in an open-opportunity society for all our deserving people in the Western Cape. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Simmers. I recognise the hon member Xego.

Mr M XEGO: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Not here? Okay, I will move on to hon member Baartman.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, fellow South Africans, today in history in 1932, after flying for 17 hours from Newfoundland, Amelia Earhart landed near Londonderry, Northern Ireland, becoming the first woman to undertake a trans-Atlantic solo flight. Amelia Earhart inspired us to soar. There was no term “spatial justice” in 1932, but Amelia Earhart defied the rules and took up her space in our history books. She famously said:

“Never interrupt someone doing something you said could not be done.”

Hon Deputy Speaker, the quarterly Labour Force Survey released in February this year by Stats SA, revealed that the Western Cape's official and expanded unemployment rates in the final quarter of 2019, dropped to 20,9% and 24,1% respectively, compared to the previous quarter. In the last quarter of 2019, the Western Cape created 24,000 more jobs and remained the province in South Africa with the lowest unemployment rate. We need to recognise injustices of the past and actively address those challenges through opportunities to achieve a more just and equitable society.

Further, the Western Cape Gini coefficient decreased from 0,56 in 2009 to 0,52 in 2015; lower than Gauteng at 0,55; and lower than KwaZulu Natal at 0,61 - our economic counterparts - as published by Stats SA in the inequality trends report of November 2019. The Gini coefficient is the most commonly used measure of inequality.

In the 2018 Global Financial Centre's Index, Cape Town was named the top financial centre in Sub-Saharan Africa, overtaking Johannesburg. This is because Cape Town and the Western Cape make good business sense for all. The Western Cape consistently comes out as South Africa's top province for good governance, according to the Presidency's Performance Management Assessment Tool.

Within the first 10 years of a DA-governed Western Cape, a total of 508,000 jobs were created; R1 billion in economic savings were generated through our red tape reduction and ease of doing business strategies, and 70% of South

Africa's renewable energy manufacturing now takes place in the Western Cape.

Hon Deputy Speaker, there is still much to be done, more jobs to be created, more girl-children to educate, but the Western Cape Province is an example of doing something most people said could not be done.

We have already built the runway. We now need to remain focused on ensuring everyone receives an opportunity to board the plane to a brighter future. Amelia Earhart would say:

“Some of us have great runways already built for us. If you have one, take off; if you do not have one, it is your responsibility to grab a shovel, build one for yourself ...” [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Time is up.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: ... and those who will follow after you.”

Hon Deputy Speaker, I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the hon Christians.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, as a young child born and bred in a poor township called Bonteheuwel, this topic is very close to my heart, but I was born there because my mother was removed from Wilkinson Street, Newlands, through the Group Areas Act.

So being a chef in Rondebosch, my mother previously walked to work, and now, thrown and chucked into Bonteheuwel, had to commute to and from work. Because of her long hours we hardly saw her.

Hon Deputy Speaker, as apartheid moved people far from their workplaces, on the outskirts, where nobody wanted to live, they created Mitchells Plain. They first created Bonteheuwel, then Manenberg and then Mitchells Plain. So people were moved far away from their workplace, putting a tremendous strain on the family, with parents leaving home early in the morning and arriving back late at night.

Hon Deputy Speaker, this is still the case in many families. In many families this is still the norm, and, hon Deputy Speaker, although I heard what Minister Simmers was saying, collectively: National, Provincial and Local Government must do more. Many of our vulnerable communities are still constrained by the legacy of economic disempowerment, and after living many-many years in a democratic society, this legacy is still prevalent in our townships.

When you walk the streets in the Manenberg and Bonteheuwels and Heidevelds, young people early in the morning are still roaming the streets, and this is testament that we still have a long way to go. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon member Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, the majority of the hon members of this House would have loved to see much higher levels of integration in our neighbourhoods. It is no secret that integration of our neighbourhoods will feed mutual understanding and nation building. Yet we see very little integration. Why? Spatial injustices have a lot to do with economic injustices. I want to say again: Spatial injustices have a lot to do with economic injustices.

We will lack racial integration for as long as these injustices are not corrected, made evident by Stats SA showing vast differences in the average incomes of races.

Why do we still have these vast differences despite the Government actively, and as we have recently seen, even aggressively, pursuing racial redress. One of the biggest contributors to the widening gap in incomes is the lack of economic growth, caused by incoherent economic policies.

The ANC Government, through its highhanded manipulation of the economy, has actually widened the inequality gap in South Africa over the past years. This despite our Constitution demanding of Government to ensure greater equality amongst South Africans.

Some believe that affirmative action should also include the uneven subsidisation of land. They believe that well-placed and valuable pieces of land should be allocated for free, or at values far below market prices. These developments are marked by the high levels of contestation, leaving questions on how to become a beneficiary, and because there is a limited number of people that can be accommodated in this way, it often causes a lot of tension within communities.

High monthly expenses such as rates, linked to the possibility of realising a quick and handy profit, often persuades – and I can almost say “forces” – poor people to sell their properties. While they then make a nice profit, it is a once-off shot in the arm.

The choice is therefore:

- (a) Let a few individuals enjoy vast benefits - which are often short-lived;
or
- (b) To unlock the value of the properties by selling them from the onset at actual market value, to developers and then use the considerable proceeds to benefit and uplift many people by the provision of affordable housing opportunities.

Some political parties, such as the ANC, are known for their propensity to enrich chosen individuals with public money. The Democratic Alliance on the other hand believes that public money should be used to improve the lives of as many beneficiaries as possible, and that summarises the differences between the DA and some of our other political parties, when it comes to the allocation of land. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon member Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Brinkhuis, are you there?

Mr G BRINKHUIS: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I move over to hon member Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much. [Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Deputy Speaker, the lists show I am supposed to be next. Why have you changed the list order?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Apologies. Just one minute, hon member Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Okay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you asking me on a point of order, hon member Marais? I have a list ... [Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Asking on a point of order, hon Deputy Speaker. I have received a list which shows me as speaking after hon member Van der Westhuizen. Now why has that changed?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: My apologies, it probably has not changed. It is according to my list. It might have changed, and I will take note from the Table staff. If we can just ask hon member Maseko to wait, I will go on to hon member Marais.

Ms L M MASEKO: I do not mind waiting, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Maseko. Over to you, hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you. Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, spatial justice involves, and I quote:

“Fair and equitable distribution of socially valued resources and opportunities to use them.”

This is a quote by Edward Soja 2009, a French academic.

I argue therefore that spatial injustices were already dealt a deathblow and a heavy blow through the scrapping of the Group Areas Act, and the constitutional right to freedom of movement and association. What is left is to create economic opportunities for the new, restless, emerging black and coloured middle class, capable of sustaining themselves economically to access existing resources and facilities currently in more affluent areas.

The Western Cape has felt the brunt of failed socio-economic policies and ideologies that has created the disastrous notion of entitlement, with little or no effort to become self-sustainable. We have become a nanny state with deeply flawed economic policies.

Spatial justice should not be equated with forced social integration, land grabs and social engineering. We need new approaches. If we are to win the battle against poverty and the lack of access to those facilities, which could improve the quality of life of the indigents, then we need a totally new approach.

Hon Deputy Speaker, crime, gangsterism, drug trafficking, prostitution and homelessness are products of poor education, moral decay, psychiatric disturbances, and not one of spatial planning alone. We must protect and motivate hardworking, law-abiding, self-sufficient people that contribute

towards the economy, and not punish them further to satisfy the insatiable needs of those to whom social handouts has become a lifestyle.

I therefore propose a relook at my proposal of 2000, when I, as City Mayor of the City Cape Town ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, your time is up.

Mr P J MARAIS: ... asked for a new City for 1,000,000 people on our West Coast to be built, so that spatial justice can be given to ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Marais, your time is up.

Mr P J MARAIS: ... those who do not have it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Be aware of the time. Thank you very much. I then recognise the hon member Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much. Hon Deputy Speaker, spatial planning is about methods and approaches used by – in this case – Government to influence the distribution of people and activities in spaces of various scales.

The Western Cape is one such example of what a society can achieve when its Government prioritises workable, bold and pragmatic plans to enrich the

lives of its citizens.

It therefore comes as no surprise that the Western Cape is constantly brought under scrutiny where contentious and complex issues are concerned. This, hon Deputy Speaker, should be worn as a badge of honour in a country where Government has long ceased to account for its actions, and without any fail, plunders its citizens at every opportunity in sight.

The Western Cape simply outperforms every other province in maintaining our constitutional obligations. This is a bitter pill the Opposition parties in this House have no choice but to swallow.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the DA-led Western Cape is the only province with a solid track record in delivering human settlements to our most vulnerable. The Provincial Department of Human Settlements, under the leadership of Minister Simmers, achieved a number of ground-breaking projects within a year of taking office. Despite the increase in housing demand, the Province has prioritised backyard dwellers by including their participation in the province's housing opportunity priority group. This means that when the Department undertakes the Greenfield Project, these individuals will be prioritised.

This year alone, the City of Cape Town has allocated approximately R2,1 billion for formal housing; R4 billion for informal settlements and backyard dwellers, to name a few.

These, hon Deputy Speaker, are just a few examples of what this Government has achieved thus far, after it once again received a clear mandate from the people of Western Cape in May last year.

The truth of the matter is that this Government has consistently demonstrated our commitment to improving the lives of those affected by spatial injustice and ensuring that we promote social inclusion through the development of integrated, safe and sustainable human settlements.

The ANC at some point needs to put their pride in their pocket and learn from the Western Cape, if they are serious about giving dignity to all South Africans who do not have the privilege of living under a capable government.

#LetsGetToWork means less talk and more action. This is precisely what we are doing, and no amount of cheap politicking will deter us from establishing quality and inclusionary housing for those who need it the most.

The Democratic Alliance is determined to build a more inclusive, integrated and vibrant province, that addresses the legacies of our past in rectifying existing imbalances. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon

Deputy Speaker, and thank you very much to hon member Herron for raising this debate.

I think when MEC Madikizela talks about the fact that other provinces have not made progress, he forgets Johannesburg, he forgets Tshwane, and other cities, including PE, which have actually made major progress in terms of building various options in the inner city, including rent-to-buy; but we want to give notice that we have reached a point where we are no longer going to wait for a provincial government and a Democratic Alliance that actually has no political will to really move towards integrated human settlements which will actually reverse apartheid spatial planning. That is why we, as the Opposition, will go ahead to reach agreements with farmers, with landowners, with property developers and others, in line with the policy which we are busy pursuing, which will clarify in what circumstances expropriation without compensation should happen, and a host of other measures.

So we are not going to wait for MEC Madikizela, we are not going to wait for the Premier. We are going to talk to the people of the Western Cape who are willing and who realise that we have to move on this patch. We will do this not only as the Opposition, but in fact as a government in waiting, because the people of the Western Cape ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: [Laughing.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... have lost faith in this ...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... particular province. For instance, we know very clearly in regard to what MEC Simmers has said, when he begins to attack hon member Herron and says that the Provincial Government has got a good track record. The reality is that it was the Provincial Department of Human Settlements, while MEC Madikizela was the MEC, that formally pushed a social housing proposal for Tafelberg, but it was this previous Provincial Government, led by Premier Zille, who is now the *de facto* leader of the DA together with the Institute of Race Relations, that actually pushed back on a proposal that the officials had made.

We welcome hon member Christians in regard to talking about solutions being needed at all spheres of government, and for sharing his own painful experience with us, but, hon Deputy Speaker, we need to understand that this Corona virus period that we are in, is not the first emergency that the world is dealing with.

At the time of the economic crisis referred to by the Cubans as the “special period”, which came as a result of the fall of the Soviet Union in 1989, bringing adverse economic turmoil as resources dwindled, the citizens of Havana took matters into their own hands, and this is an example in other

countries in a post war situation. They started in this instance a “grow your own revolution”. It was during this period that urban farms and allotment sprang up across the city and these remain sustainable resources of food to this day, hon Deputy Speaker.

As we are battling with the outbreak of Corona, which has exposed many challenges in our society, including the apartheid spatial legacy, which has meant the majority of Corona cases are found in working-class communities as well as food security issues that come as a result of job losses. As the ANC, we wish to make a call today to all municipalities to make available pockets of land in their jurisdiction for the use of urban farmers and allotments, the way the British did after the war. Instead of calling for the reckless opening of the economy, the DA should actively be positive and support the campaign proposed by us as the African National Congress in this Legislature.

The continued calls to end the lockdown make it clear that the DA does not have the interests of the poor at heart. Many of the [Inaudible.] we face in the province can be traced back to the brutal legacy of colonial dispossession and the evil system of apartheid spatial planning.

In fact, we remember that it was the Oudtshoorn Municipality who actually celebrated and congratulated themselves on being the first municipality to enforce group areas. The ANC remains committed to building a national democratic society, which would address the historical injustices via the

redistribution and of course the restitution of land and other resources; employment equity and the eradication of apartheid productive [Inaudible.]

The stumbling block, we all know, is looking us in the face, and that is the DA Government committed to its own backward conservative policies which actually increasingly look like those of the apartheid emerging across the [Inaudible. – audio lost].

What is clear is that the glib articulation of an open, equal opportunity society does not provide any answers. They talk unity, but they ignore the demon of racism, as if the word “racism” is a swearword never to be mentioned in the same breath as an equal opportunity society.

[Inaudible. – audio lost] ... ideally suited for social housing. The cynical sale of well-located land by the DA continues, and in fact has provided the environment in which gentrification takes hold in communities like Woodstock and Observatory.

The President, in his State of the Nation address in 2019, said:

“In the immediate term Government will accelerate efforts to identify and release public land that is suitable for smart, urban settlements and for farming.”

[Inaudible. – audio lost] ... our resolve to expropriate land without

compensation as resolved by the ... [Inaudible.] that each municipality during this COVID period, as we said earlier, identifies allotments for growing of food. That can be done immediately, and also the completion of a transparent and accessible land audit of all national, provincial, municipal, as well as state-owned enterprises properties, not just for well-located human settlements, but also land and buildings, so that we can also identify well-located private land, and I would in this instance refer to a place that the Speaker knows well, the area in Hermanus, Paradise Park, which clearly needs to be expropriated to actually make sure that we provide for housing of the poor and working-class in that area.

Central to all of this must be to integrate Cape Town and our rural towns, by actually taking concrete steps. We appeal to the people of the Western Cape, realise that the DA is not going to do this. Support the ANC and progressive organisations. We have even heard the call from the Freedom Front Plus today, unequivocally saying that so-called coloured and black people have been denied land, but land is about wealth, land is about building the security on which to build a family, to build a community, and to build a society.

So we are going ahead. We are not going to wait. We are going to give leadership to this province. We will be sitting with Agri Western Cape, we will be sitting with property developers, we will be sitting with unions, we will be sitting with landless communities, and we are convinced that as our President has called for social compacts, it is possible for us to develop a social compact, and in fact what is going to happen is that the DA is going to

be a distant memory, a bad memory, in the minds of people, because in fact they are all-out in terms of preserving the legacy of apartheid spatial planning and upholding privileges.

It is very clear to us ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish up hon member.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... that the DA has blocked and stopped the experiment to broaden their base and are now simply looking at narrow interests. We will never allow this, and we put on record we are going to change this province with or without you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I recognise the hon Minister Bredell.
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): First win an election.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, I wonder if the hon member is aware this is the Provincial Parliament and not the National Assembly. Hon member Herron and his ANC/Good coalition government run the country. Your coalition government is in charge.

So I want to ask you, sir, when will your coalition government provide us

with adequate land and budget to build houses for the poor in the inner city and towns in the Western Cape?

For the past 25 years the ANC has been the major stumbling block to reducing spatial inequalities in this province and in this country, and now the Good Party has joined them in a government of national unity.

Allow me to repeat an example that really matters: District 6. Hon member Herron is speaking after me and I want to ask him to provide this House with a guarantee that he will lobby his national coalition partners to release District 6 land to the City of Cape Town speedily, so that we can finally start moving people back to where they belong. As hon member Herron is well-aware, District 6 has been under the control of National Government since 1994.

You remain silent about it, hon member Herron. Why? Is it because you do not want to jeopardise your chance of becoming a Deputy Minister in the ANC Cabinet?

We will put 60,000 people back in District 6. Give us the money and the land, and we will do it. Can you put your money where your mouth is? Or are you all bark and no action?

Hon Deputy Speaker, we should not be surprised that so very little has been done on a national level to reduce spatial inequalities in South Africa. The

facts are simple: The ANC and its coalition partners do not care about spatial inequalities. They also do not care about the poor. 6,000 schools in this country, hon member Dugmore, 6,000 schools, to this day – under ANC control – are using bucket toilets; none in the Western Cape. None so blind as they who choose not too to see. None so blind.

I will highlight another example: The fact that the ANC/Good coalition government allows all SASSA offices to close down in one day of ongoing COVID lockdown. Those partners then demanded that poor and vulnerable communities go online and register for help during the ongoing seven week, and counting, lockdown period. The result is an ongoing humanitarian crisis that is rapidly escalating. What a disgrace, and that disgrace is on the ANC and Good government, and you say you are a government in waiting. Please, save our people.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the ANC/Good Party alliance have no idea what things are like on the ground. They are totally out of touch with the people. The closest they get to communities is on Facebook and Twitter. Their leaders breaking lockdown regulations, going to fancy dinners, where they post their wine drinking on social media, while vulnerable people lose their jobs and struggle to find food to eat.

We should not be surprised. Do not forget that the ANC sold out long ago to enrich themselves. Remember the Gupta family? It has been estimated that the Guptas may have looted up to R100 billion from this country, R100

billion, hon Deputy Speaker. We could have built 625 000 houses for our poor and vulnerable communities, but hon member Dugmore will not touch on that. How many times have you heard the Good Party's secretary general, hon member Herron, demand that anyone of the many implicated National Cabinet members step down for their alleged links to corruption? What has happened to morals and integrity?

Hon Deputy Speaker, it would be remiss of me not to remind members that the hon member Herron was in fact the Mayco member for Transport and Public Works in the City of Cape Town, when his friend and leader was the mayor. Those are the two most powerful positions in the City of Cape Town. What did they do to address spatial inequalities during their time? Nothing. Nothing, hon Deputy Speaker, but today they want to be clever.

Allow me to further remind you what happened in September 2018, only two years ago, when hon member Herron's friend resigned as the Mayor of Cape Town and hon member Herron, who was a proud member of the DA, applied for the position of mayor. When he did not get his way, like a spoiled child he threw his toys out of his R800,000 Mustang and resigned from the DA. Suddenly all of us are racist. What a hypocrite.

Hon Deputy Speaker, hon member Herron, the most senior member of the City, in charge of driving low-cost housing in the city centre, then slammed the City for the slow provision of low-cost housing. What a joke. You failed the people. You failed the people of the City of Cape Town, no one else.

Hon Deputy Speaker, this Province is working day and night to address the legacies of apartheid.

Ms N D NKONDLO: On a point of order, Deputy Speaker.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We are fully aware of the triple challenges of poverty ... [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: On a point of order, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Bredell, one minute.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, who am I speaking to on a point of order? What is your point of order?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Hon member Nkondlo.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: What is your point of order?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Hon Deputy Speaker, is it parliamentary – because it is the second time – it was MEC Simmers and now it is MEC Bredell – to call

another hon member a hypocrite, and the debate just continues and you are not calling this out of order. Is it parliamentary to use such language in the House?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo, we are not going to stifle free speech. “Hypocrite” is not a derogatory word at all, and I will let it go under the circumstances. We are in the House and there has to be at least some free speech rather than being limited to anything more. I mean we already have limitations at this point during COVID-19. Let us allow some free speech. [Inaudible.] carry on please. [Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: So “hypocrite” is free speech?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo. I have made the ruling. I will continue with the Minister.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. This province is working day and night to address the legacies of apartheid. We are fully aware of the triple challenges of poverty ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, on a point of order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... inequality and unemployment, and therefore we do our utmost best ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Bredell, if you can just wait? What is your point of order, hon member Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I raised this last year and even this year, and I want to rise on this point of order, that the MEC is speaking directly to the hon member Herron. He should address yourself as the Deputy Speaker. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Sayed. Minister Bredell, if you could address me. You may proceed.

Ms N D NKONDLO: I am sure it is free speech.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: On a point of order, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, who is ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: They are trying to waste time!

An HON MEMBER: On a point of order, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The clock has stopped.

An HON MEMBER: On a point of order, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, one minute.

An HON MEMBER: On a point of order, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I recognise you, yes, what is your point of order?

Mr L MVIMBI: Yes, hon Deputy Speaker, so that means that in future, even
if I refer to you as a hypocrite, that will be allowed as free speech?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Free speech.

An HON MEMBER: As free speech.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: This is the House ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] freedom of speech.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, this is the House.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Make use of [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): On a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please do not speak when I am speaking to you. Hon member, can I answer you? That is my ruling. I am not going to downplay freedom to speak here. I do not believe “hypocrite” is a derogatory word that needs to be outlawed in this Parliament. I have now made a ruling and my ruling stands. I will move over to the Minister.

Mr P MARRAN: The Speaker is a hypocrite.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It is not your House.

An HON MEMBER: Hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, please!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): On a point of order.

An HON MEMBER: Point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is a point of order. [Interjection.] Hon Deputy Chief Whip?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I rise on Rule 62(1):

“That no member may reflect on the honour or competence of the holder of an office, whose removal from such office is dependent on the decision of the House.”

And what the African National Congress has just done, is that they have reflected on your honour as the Presiding Officer. I ask you to please rule that they withdraw their unparliamentary statements.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is the hon member who called me a hypocrite prepared to withdraw?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Can I address you, hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: First I would like the person who said it to withdraw.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I would like to address you before that, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, you can speak.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, I am listening.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [No audible response.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Madam Deputy Speaker, I also have a point of order to raise.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: What is your point of order, Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): My point of order is on Rule 66(5) which states that:

“A member who is aggrieved by a ruling may not challenge ...”

[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Can I address you, hon Deputy Speaker?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): “... a ruling in the House.”

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker! Can I address you, hon Deputy Speaker?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): And therefore ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just one minute. Hon member Lekker?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): And therefore I ask ... [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): When there is a member on the podium that has been recognised, you must – hon Deputy Speaker, I am not sure if you said I must sit down while you were attending to the Chief Whip of the House, because I was still on the floor and you did not say anything. You simply recognised her while I was speaking.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): You were not speaking.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, you were not, we did not hear you. I will come back to you. I would like to finish with the Chief Whip, and I will absolutely give you the time to address your grievance, yes.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. I was rising on a point of order in terms of Rule 66(5) which states that:

“A member who is aggrieved by a ruling may not challenge such in the House.”

And therefore I would like that you call to order that hon member that is in fact in breach of the Rules and in terms of that Rule, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Chief Whip. Over to you, hon member Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I rise on a point of order raised by the Deputy Chief Whip, where he actually singled out a point that was part of a full sentence, and decided in that moment that he would then associate that part, and I think it is disingenuous of hon member Mitchell to say to the Deputy Speaker what the ruling must be, because in the first place he took it out of context and made it a point.

So I would like you, hon Deputy Speaker, to revisit the Hansard before you make any decision, because he is deliberately misleading and causing confusion in the House. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I recognise you, hon member Wenger.
[Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): There is now a point of order on top of another point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): You have accused the Deputy Chief Whip of ...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY ORDER: Order, please. Order!

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, what you are doing?
[Interjection.] You are allowing a point of order on top of another point of order, without even ruling.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Mute her! Mute her!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, order please! Now can I have

one person address me at a time.

An HON MEMBER: Can I address you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Can I address you, hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am now recognising the Chief Whip as I have chosen to recognise her, and I am allowing her to speak.

An HON MEMBER: Okay [Inaudible.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will recognise you if your hand is up. So I recognised the Chief Whip and then I recognise hon member Sayed.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. It has been ruled previously that saying “deliberately misleading” the House is unparliamentary, and the Chief Whip of the Opposition has accused hon member Mitchell of deliberately misleading the House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I hear you, thank you very much. Hon member Sayed, what is your point?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, if I heard the hon member Lulama Mvimbi correctly, he was not necessarily saying that you are

a hypocrite. He was saying would it be correct for him to say that you are one. So I think we need to also have a ... [audio lost.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have lost you, hon member Sayed. Are you there?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... will assist.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. Thank you very much. Anybody else? Hon member Mackenzie, I see that you have your hand up?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. When the hon member Mvimbi left – hon member Sayed rightfully said – his last words, as he was departing were that you are a hypocrite, referring to you as the Deputy Speaker. That is what my colleague, the Deputy Chief Whip, wanted you to rule on, and even ask him to withdraw and apologise for that comment.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, thank you very much. Have I recognised everybody who has got their hands up? Hon member Mvimbi, I recognise you.

Mr L L MVIMBI: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, your hand is not – all right, your hand is not up.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute. Hon member Mvimbi, can you start from the beginning, I did not hear you?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Yes, sorry, my apologies, I was on mute. Hon Deputy Speaker, I never said to you you are a hypocrite. I gave the example that if I say you are a hypocrite, is that allowed in the House, and you said yes. When I stopped there was another voice that said you are a hypocrite. It was not me. Hon member Mackenzie must not create stories here. It was not me. I heard that voice that said that you are a hypocrite. It was definitely not me. That was the first point I want to clarify.

The second point, hon Deputy Speaker, hon member Mitchell is constantly misquoting Rules of Order in the House. It is now the second time. He did that when ... [audio lost.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have lost you again, hon member Mvimbi. There we go.

Mr L L MVIMBI: No, I am here. Hon Deputy Speaker, as I am speaking I notice that there is someone who keep on muting me. Every time I speak.

So now, hon Deputy Speaker, hon member Mitchell read Rule 62. He said no member may reflect on the honour or incompetence of the holder of an office.

As far as I can recall nobody, nobody has actually reflected on your honour, hon Deputy Speaker. There is nobody, hon Deputy Speaker. Nobody has ...

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... reflected on your competency. So hon member Mitchell is actually notorious ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. Order, order! Hon members, I have made a ruling on the word “hypocrite”. I am standing with that ruling, but what I will ask is that the Table staff listen to Hansard, and we will revert in terms of the word “hypocrite” or whether I was called a “hypocrite”, and revert back in the next sitting, and also in terms of being “deliberately misled”. I just have to ask the Table staff who actually said that. So I will come back to you in the next sitting.

I would like us to conclude with hon Minister Bredell’s speech, please.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): *Amandla*, hon Deputy Speaker.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS

AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... when it comes to delivery, our record speaks for itself. Ask Stats South Africa, the Auditor-General, any institution. When it comes to delivery of basic services and opportunities to the poorest of the poor, on every level there is no province that can match the Western Cape.

We are the only province that have implemented the Provincial Spatial Development Framework throughout all our councils, but, hon Deputy Speaker, perhaps I can ask hon member Herron to tell the House how the coalition government of the ANC and Good Party sees justice. Give us an example of where the ANC has done it right. Instead, under the coalition government ... [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Same province with high inequality.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... more people in South Africa have been arrested for being on the beach, than have been arrested for state capture.

The hon member Dugmore can do honour to his word and just arrest one person that was involved in the state capture. Then we will maybe listen to him.

Hon Deputy Speaker, in South Africa the UN has received reports of police

using rubber bullets, teargas, water guns and whips to enforce social distancing, especially in poor neighbourhoods. Hon member, is that the type of social and spatial justice you endorse? If not, can you tell this House how you have taken your partners at National Government to task to prevent this ongoing brutality against our people?

Hon Deputy Speaker, when we look at hon member Marran, he quoted a previous ANC president. I wonder what that same president would say today if he looked at the ANC's looting of the state; if he looked at land – like what happened at the farm in Vrede in the Free State and I wonder what the hon member Dugmore would say about that then. The member Dugmore mentioned sitting, sitting, sitting. I can promise him after the 24th election, he will also be sitting on the street. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Bredell. I recognise the hon member Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. It is quite astounding to me that Ministers Bredell and Madikizela want to know what I did when I was in office. I mean, Ministers Bredell and Madikizela have been in the Cabinet for 10 years and they have both held the most crucial portfolios, housing and spatial planning, to achieve spatial justice, and they did nothing in 10 years. In fact, they have now been there 12 years, and they have done absolutely nothing.

I was responsible for Urban Development for 18 months, and within six months of that appointment, I began implementing the DA's manifesto about integrating communities and providing affordable housing in good locations. That was the 2016 Local Government Manifesto.

I identified 11 sites within six months of that appointment, and three months thereafter we had a request for proposals published, calling for proposals, and four months thereafter there were 13 proposals.

The reason that I resigned from the DA is because the DA stopped those projects. It is because I was told in a DA caucus by the Deputy Provincial Chairperson of the DA in the Western Cape, J P Smith, that "transformation" is a swearword, and that was the last DA caucus I attended.

So it is astounding to me that they are saying, "What did you do?" They know very well that I fought very hard to get 11 projects in Woodstock and ...
[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: That is not true, that is not true.

Mr B N HERRON: ... Salt River launched, but they stopped it, and now they are saying, "What did you do?" They have been there 10 years in the Cabinet, earning fat salaries, and they have changed nothing.

So I am absolutely astounded that that is the response, because if that is the response, then the DA is standing still on the other side of the Rubicon, where P W Botha left them in 1985.

To Minister Simmers, let me say the USDG underspend was in the Informal Settlements Department and that Department was managed by Xanthea Limberg. So that has nothing to do with me.

Really, hon Deputy Speaker, I want to say that we can move forward with spatial justice. We do not have to stay stuck in the past forever. There are alternatives to the outdated housing models. The Province should not pursue ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Time is up.

Mr B N HERRON: ... building housing on rubbish dumps in Khayelitsha, costing billions of rand. We can stop sentencing people to the fringes and focus on the middle, and not matchbox homes on the edges ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr B N HERRON: ... but affordable homes, integrated with good expensive homes, in new sustainable communities. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: On a point of order, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon Minister, I recognise you. Hon Minister Madikizela?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Can I just get clarity? Did hon member Herron just call the community of Khayelitsha a dump area? I just want to get clarity.

An HON MEMBER: No, we did not.

Mr B N HERRON: I would like to clarify.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela, we should not be clarifying our speeches here. Hon Minister, hon member Herron, you are now, you have ... [Inaudible.]

Mr B N HERRON: The point that I made is that the Provincial Government wants to invest two or R3 billion in building housing on a dumpsite in Khayelitsha, and I am saying that there are better options than that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: That is not true, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am now concluding the debate for today and the subject of discussion. Hon members, thank you for your time, and this concludes the business of the day. The Secretary will now end the meeting, and hon members can exit. Thank you.

The House adjourned at 17.42