

---

THURSDAY, 19 SEPTEMBER 2019

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

**BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

The SPEAKER: You may be seated. I recognise the Chief Whip.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you hon Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 20(1), I move without notice that precedence be given to the Order of the Day.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Chief Whip. Order, hon members, are there

any objections to the motion? No objections? Agreed to.

Hon members, guests, ladies and gentlemen, please allow me to recognise as part of the guests in the gallery, visitors from the St. Florian Boys Choir from Upper Austria. [Applause.] They sang beautifully for us during lunchtime, and food was just flowing because we were enjoying the music. They even sang Nkosi Sikelel' iAfrika in all languages. They did not mess it up. They sang, all of them, beautifully. [Interjections.]

Yes, they sang beautifully. Also amongst our guests in the gallery we have Crystal High School from Bonteheuwel. [Interjections.] [Applause.] †Welkom by die Parlement. [Welcome to Parliament.] †Wamkelekile. [Welcome.]

HON MEMBERS: Hanover Park.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: ...and also Hanover Park. †Mooi! Welkom, welkom! [Applous.] [Good! Welcome, welcome! [Applause.]] You know, the Speaker works with a list that is before him so in future do not impose the list from the City, but we will make sure that my team forward this list in advance, but thank you, you are all welcome, equally. Please enjoy the sitting. The rules here are that you can enjoy by observing but you do not participate. To the guests from Austria, you cannot sing when you are excited here. [Laughter.]

Alright, now we are going to the debate as moved by the Chief Whip. I just need the speakers' list. Thank you. The person that is going to lead the debate is hon Derrick America from the Democratic Alliance. I recognise you, hon member America.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

### **ORDER OF THE DAY**

(Building Sustainable, Responsive and People-Centred Municipalities)

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you hon Speaker. Before I commence with the debate, may I declare that I was once a pupil at Crystal High School and I was a prefect also there. Thank you. [Applause.]

Having said that, Hon Speaker, Section 40(1) of the Constitution of South Africa stipulates that Government is constituted by three spheres, which are distinctive, interdependent and interrelated. With regard to the local sphere of government, Section 152 of the Constitution sets its main objectives to providing a democratic and accountable government to local communities; providing services to the communities in a sustainable manner, promoting social and economic development, promoting a safe and healthy environment and encouraging the involvement of communities in local government matters. This power is to give effect to the objective of the local government in municipalities that is vested in the Constitution. It empowers the

municipality to govern and manage its own affairs, while being subject to the provincial and national legislation.

Hon Speaker, the mandate of the National Council of Provinces outlined in Section 42(4) of the Constitution is to represent the provinces and ensure that local interests are taken into account in the national sphere of government. Bearing this in mind, the NCOP undertook its first provincial week of the Sixth Parliament this week. This included joint oversight visits with the respective Provincial Legislatures to monitor the delivery of services to communities. The provincial component of the delegation was a multiparty delegation consisting of the Democratic Alliance, the African National Congress, the Economic Freedom Fighters as well as observers from SALGA in the form of the Chairperson, Mr Anton Coetzee, and his delegation. In consultation with the NCOP delegates and the parties in the Western Cape Legislature it was agreed that the Bitou and the Mossel Bay Municipalities will be visited.

Hon Speaker, it would be remiss of me not to state from the outset that the Mossel Bay Municipality was rated as the Top Performing Municipality in the country according to the Good Governance Africa 2019 Index of local municipalities. This is of no coincidence as the municipality is led by the Democratic Alliance, a party which prides itself in clean and effective governance. Under the capable leadership of the Mayor, Mr Levendal, it was announced on arrival that the municipality is the only one with a comprehensive rural development and safety plan. The delegation has visited

KwaNonqaba Waste Transfer Station, Mountain View Housing Project, the Access to Basic Services Project and the Early Disablement Toilet Project.

The Mossel Bay Desalination Plant was commissioned in 2010 and 2011 and is fully functional. The dam level in the municipality remains a concern as it currently sits at about 50% and it is predicted to drop below the 50% mark. However, the plant will be back in operation in a week's time. Mossel Bay has a growing population in both the formal and the informal settlements. Despite this the Municipality's revenue for the 2018 and 2019 financial year has exceeded the R1 billion-mark and continues to grow.

Hon Speaker, in contrast, the ANC-led Bitou Municipality faces significant challenges with many key posts being unoccupied and financial challenges being of grave concern. It is to be noted that the Municipality has significantly overspent their operational budget. This led to the spending of R22.6 million being spent from the Municipality's Human Settlements Grant, to fund operational expenses. No credible explanation could be provided. Furthermore, the Auditor-General reported that the Municipality's procurement process and contract management is not compliant with legislation. This could lead to corruption and unnecessary litigation. [Interjection.]

Mr D SMITH: Talk about George.

Mr D AMERICA: It was brought to the attention of the Committee the

staggering number of law suits with third parties amounting to R22.4 million while the irregular expenditure of R16.7 million gives credence to our concern. [Interjections.] Hon Speaker, it is clear from the aforementioned that this municipality faces a myriad of challenges relating to governance and finances alone. Even the NCOP as an institution yesterday released a statement stating their concern relating to the bad management of various projects in the Bitou Municipality.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): We have a problem with the statement [Inaudible.]

Mr D AMERICA: The Bitou Municipality, hon Speaker, remains dependent on tourism in the area... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members, order!

Mr D AMERICA: Although some aspects of this are positive, it is not sustainable and fails to take on the development of new industries. The ongoing development of RDP homes and private estate homes in the municipality is a silver lining. However, despite this job creation is staggeringly low. Hon Speaker, the current economic climate of the country has placed massive pressure on municipalities to deliver. Additionally, population growth poses another challenge. Where there is political stability and capable administrators appointed the level of service delivery is significantly enhanced.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): So why did the voters vote against the DA in the Cederberg?

Mr D AMERICA: Municipalities implicated in corruption and malfeasance must be identified... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order hon members. Hon member Dugmore, order! [Interjections.] May I request, hon member America, will you please take your seat, sir. [Interjections.] Hon Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you hon Speaker. I ask that we respect the convention that a member delivering his maiden speech be allowed to speak without heckling. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Chief Whip. I think the Leader of the Official Opposition will help me and talk to the members of his party so that we respect that. Hon member America.

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Speaker, a point of order. All his interjections, is that not breaking the maiden status? He made so many interjections before his maiden speech, so this cannot be a maiden speech. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Marais! Hon member America, will you please remain seated, sir. I just want to deal with the one point of order by hon member Marais. That does not remove, hon member Marais, the privilege of

the maiden speech, because that was not in this debate, because now he is speaking in the convention and that I think we must just, consistent with the convention, respect that process. [Interjection.] Hon member Dugmore, the Leader of the Opposition?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): I am just on a point of order asking for your ruling. It is true, as the Chief Whip says, hon Speaker, that there is a convention that we do not interject when there is a maiden speech, provided of course and as my understanding of the convention goes, that the speech itself is not a party-political speech.

An HON MEMBER: It is not.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): ...and what we have seen from the hon member is that he is singing the praises of the DA in his maiden speech so he should not expect special treatment, especially because the DA has been defeated in Cederberg. That is going to happen.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Enjoy the [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Alright. Order! Order, hon members. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. Will you please take your seat, hon Chief Whip. Hon member Dugmore, I gather the point that you are trying to impress in the House. However, the convention is that we must respect that convention. The spirit here is that we must respect the convention. If there is somehow a place



where you felt that the rule has been broken by the member himself, there is an opportunity to deal with that during the debate. So I am going to do the same because we must be consistent so that there is a principle that we must uphold and that is the spirit and I am appealing to this House to respect at least that spirit as a matter of convention. So I hope that we are all on the same page in that regard. Hon Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker, just a reminder that the convention is that a person delivering their maiden speech should be allowed to speak uninterrupted, but the convention further is that the speech may be party-political, but it may not be controversial and I think that my colleague has not been controversial in his remarks and therefore would abide by your request here. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip. Thank you, hon members.

Ms N D NKONDLO: That is why we have the Speaker here. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, thank you. I just want to allow hon member America to conclude.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: You have a minute and a half.

Mr D AMERICA: Wow! Okay. Thank you. Despite the various challenges within the province it is clear that municipalities in the Western Cape exceeds in terms of service delivery and governance compared to the rest of South Africa. Empirical data and analysis support this.

As it was announced earlier this year that 12 of the best performing municipalities in the country are in the Western Cape, guided by the Constitution of South Africa, this DA-led Western Cape Government has fulfilled their duties of capacitating, monitoring and supporting municipalities to deliver on their development mandate.

Lastly, hon Speaker, I would like to thank the members of the delegation for their critical and constructive engagement in the various deliberations which we have had over the past few days and to our support staff for arranging the logistical support that they have provided us. I thank you. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon member America. For the purposes of the debate I think I just need to give context so that our guests understand what is happening today. We had the NCOP and Western Cape Provincial Parliament visit week, which lasted for three days, since the 16<sup>th</sup> on Monday, and hon members came back this morning. It was in Bitou and Mossel Bay. So this is the debate as the outcome of that visit. So we have got here the National Council of Provinces' members who are here and also we

have SALGA present here, the Chairperson of SALGA, hon Alderman Coetzee. So let us please remember in that context, that is what we are dealing with. Hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Speaker, and greetings to everyone in the House including members of the gallery. Let us thank the NCOP for the oversight week, including the debate that helps us to call for action in the observations made during the visit. I must say I am a bit shocked. I actually when I was listening to the Chair of the delegation, thought he was in a different visit than mine.

Having said that, Local Government remains a critical sphere known to be at the coalface of service delivery and in direct contact with the people. The citizens, in their endeavour to give meaning to their constitutional right to participate in government, uses the door of Local Government and have lived experiences and the concept of one government and therefore I think this week part of the visit helps us to invoke a Section 152 in looking at how our Local Government promotes social and economic development and encourages the involvement of communities in Local Government matters and I think with the observation I think the theme of the debate helps us to understand how far are we realising sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities in our province.

In the two municipalities in Bitou and Mossel Bay that we visited, which are part of the Garden Route District Municipality, the third-largest in the

province, I think one of the critical things that one observed is actually a visit that was, yes, informative but also exposed critical challenges that need immediate attention in these municipalities. The agenda for local economic development and its integration in pursuit of inclusive economy is a glaring point to share with the House.

Spatial realities continue to present the persistence of apartheid legacy when one considers the geography of poverty and under-development. Given the Bitou's location as the last town in transit to the Eastern Cape, which becomes prone to high levels of in-migration, the situation itself imposes service delivery demands as demonstrated in the increase of housing. This challenge then poses onto us as Government our planning and innovation capability to respond to this particular reality and whether we are prepared to depart from yesteryear's approach, especially the apartheid special outlook.

From the three projects that we visited one is concerned with how we seem to continue the old order with little room to break away from our past in both where we visited the housing developments KwaNonqaba and KwaNokuthula which predominantly have black townships and beneficiaries that are mainly low or no-income earners. What is available is the 45 square metre house, where about three to four households are to reside. In these there are minimal considerations of proximity to other amenities specifically economic activities. This situation and Government's response ferments the geographical poverty.

The Louis Fourie Development which we saw in Mossel Bay presents a different model from this that shows innovation combining the BNG and FLISP in Mossel Bay. Of interest in this project, hon members, is the stretching of the envelope by providing a habitable integrated development which in terms of the architectural design that is appealing and includes landscaping that surely will give fair property value to the development but includes things like shopping malls, a school and other amenities to consider the social and economic needs of this community. Is it not time that we actually look at how we roll this out in all other communities because what is important to us is to ensure that we really move away from our past and if this could be done by the Mossel Bay Municipality within the same BNG and FLISP grant allocation one begs the question, Minister of Human Settlements, why is it that we cannot look at this model to replicate also in other communities in providing the dignity to our people and the desired integration. One of the areas to be explored is also the economic beneficiation of the rand value spent in these infrastructure projects, which is supposed to give a chance and trigger economic opportunities to these beneficiaries. One of the things that once again we need to consider is that the comfort of EPWP jobs cannot be sustained, as even the reported challenges and the resistance of BEE contractors to forge the win-win subcontracting relations continue to present financial leakages of this deliberate investment by Government. The report from Bitou of how the main contractor and the local subcontractor strained relations actually resulted in delays in the project, which are unwarranted, and I think this also says how do we as Government respond to these particular challenges.

I must say, hon Speaker, one of the things that we should not ignore in our realities in these particular communities, is the labour dynamics that we continue to look at in these areas where the labour market extremes of low-skilled and unskilled versus the skilled results in huge income gaps. Actually it results once again in ensuring that we are slow in departing from the apartheid spatial relations and if then we get into both in the Bitou and the Mossel Bay Municipality you can actually be able to see the difference when you move from KwaNonqaba and you go into town, that you still are sitting in the Western Cape and in the South Africa of yesteryear.

One of the things that the HSRC study of 2017 tells us is that the 20 richest municipalities are mainly in the Western Cape and a strong correlation is to be found between the municipality level poverty rates where the higher the poverty rate a municipality had the more likely it was also going to have that in future years, so this suggests spatial patterns of poverty have not changed much over the years and these particular historical territorial distinctions, hon Premier, remain important sources of social and economic differentiation today, so if there is anything in as far as an economic war room I would call upon you to start elevating this matter that whilst we look at municipalities, and we want hon Chair of the Committee, to talk about the successes of the municipality only from the basis of party-politics... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member, I would like you to wrap up please.

Ms N D NKONDLO: We must also consider the reality of people that are

still living in such areas, on the basis of race and gender as the apartheid used to be. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Nkondlo. †Uyewandimamela kakuhle khangе undisokolise ungase benzenjalo bonke. [You have listened to me very clearly, you did not give me a struggle. I wish all could do that.] I now recognise hon member Makamba-Botya. *Manxuba*.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you hon Speaker, and greetings to the House and people in the gallery. I will not dwell much on the findings of the tour that we had with these two municipalities. The report is here to be tabled in this House by the Committee.

The visit to Bitou was rather an eye-opener to all of us how municipalities actually prioritise services to communities. Chapter 3 and 7 of the South African Constitution provide a general vision and mandatory policy framework which must be followed in order to build sustainable, responsive accountable based and people-centred municipalities. A recent report by the Auditor-General, Chapter 9 institution, on the performance of municipalities across South Africa paints a bleak image with regards to the governance of municipalities. The key problems established during the audit of municipalities include flouting governance laws, disregarding recommendations made by audit bodies, threatening auditors, concealing and hiding financial statements, amongst other things. Moreover in the 257 municipalities audited for the 2017/2018 financial year only 18 received

clean audits. This is a regression from 33 municipalities that had received clean audits in the previous year. 62 municipalities worsened and only 22 showed improvement. The principal causes of such poor performance by the majority of these municipalities are due to the lack of political will to do a right thing for the right reason by those who govern; lack of meaningful engagement with communities and lack of oversight accountability.

These factors combined constantly lead to irregular expenditure, material non-compliance with relevant mandatory legislative requirements and the inability to plan, spend and collect the revenue. Furthermore, Speaker, it is worth noting that the inability to collect debt from municipal consumers is widespread and often results in municipalities being unable to balance their books. It was the case with the Municipality of Bitou where they had a huge amount under bad debts so we have a serious problem there. These accounting failures normally lead to lack of service delivery for the people. Moreover such maladministration by those who govern these municipalities lead to lack of sustainable infrastructure with regards to roads, sanitation and water, to name a few. Commonsense provides that low capital spending on infrastructure cannot result in a sustainable infrastructure in the short and long term for these municipalities. Leadership sets tone at the top of any organisation. Where leaders are unethical, exercise disregard for proper governance, compliance, control and under-committed to transparency and accountability, this will filter through to the lower levels of the organisation and the results will be non-delivery of service to the people.



The possible solutions as EFF: Section 40(1) [\*00:30:12] of the Constitution mandates cooperative governance amongst the three spheres of government, national, provincial and local. The Constitution further makes it clear that although these three tiers of government are distinctive they however remain interdependent and interrelated.

Furthermore Section 154 (1) requires both national and provincial governments to support and strengthen the capacity of municipalities to manage their own affairs, to exercise their powers and to perform their functions so municipalities cannot be left alone to do as they please. Other tiers of government must exercise oversight. Assist them with strategies, programmes, funding and other resources to enhance internal capacity.

The SPEAKER: Hon member, you must please wrap up.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: This also must involve determined municipal politicians who are willing to take on the leadership. The amendment of the Public Audit Act 25 of 2004, which came into effect in 2019, is also another step towards legally pressing the accountability and responsiveness from the municipalities. Whilst previously the Auditor-General could only make recommendations to these municipalities, the new amendment act gives teeth to the institution by providing him with powers to refer ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: †Ndiyabulela kakhulu. [Thank you, your time is up.] Your time is up, thank you. Thank you hon member Makamba-Botya. Now I

recognise hon member Labuschagne.

HON MEMBERS: Hear-hear!

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Hon Speaker, hon members, we all know that the Auditor-General's report indicates a steady decline in the state of municipalities in our country. One of the biggest concerns in the 2017/18 report is the lack of accountability with the domino effect on financial stability of municipalities especially in rural areas.

A lack of leadership and management are further contributing factors of municipalities in distress. Building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities indicates the ideal we strive towards. The fact that we are debating this today is proof of this Government's commitment to accountable local governments and might be the reason why the picture of municipalities in distress is not that bleak in the Western Cape. We know that sustainability implies that our needs as humans should balance out available resources as well as ensuring future resources. Therefore, the biggest challenge for local governments are how to manage resources such as water, energy, housing, waste management and very importantly, finances. "Responsive and people-centred" implies that municipalities must focus on the needs of citizens and respond to those needs through effective service delivery. Hon Speaker, the role and functions of municipalities must also be understood within the context of the Constitution, specifically Chapter 3 that focuses on cooperative government and intergovernmental relations. Chapter

3 spells out that all spheres of Government are distinctive, interdependent and interrelated. It further makes provision for legislation to promote and facilitate intergovernmental relations.

Therefore the Systems and Structures Act provides the legal framework for municipalities as well as for Provincial and National Government regarding Local Government. Section 160 of the Municipal Systems Act is about non-performance and maladministration of municipalities. It gives the MEC of a province the right to request information or appoint a person to investigate if he or she has any reason to believe that the municipality cannot or does not fulfil their statutory obligations or that maladministration, fraud or corruption has taken place or is taking place.

In the context of the subject, namely building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities, as well as the serious findings of the AG report, we should ask ourselves the question: what are the contributing factors why the processes and systems as indicated in the Constitution and legal framework are not effective? The NCOP is the sphere of Government at the end of the line when Section 106 of the Systems Act must be implemented. In 2019 only, 15 Section 139 interventions have been initiated in the NCOP. That means that 15 more municipalities to the already more than 40 have been subjected to a form of administration or have been dissolved. Despite the concern that there is no real database on how many municipalities are under administration in each province or any indication of how effective each intervention was, the biggest concern is that regarding

misinformation to residents. Very often our work in the NCOP exposes members of Parliament to the political realities of dysfunctional or failing governments. We often bear witness to administrations that lack political will, transparency and ineffective management as well as municipal interventions that are often riddled with processes that are compromised and deviated from their intentional purposes. This is naturally coupled with politically manipulated blame games, misinformation and dishonesty with the affected communities.

On Tuesday we experienced this firsthand in Bitou where false perceptions and blame games were raised. Fortunately we were able to remedy these by having a constructive and engaging discussion that diffused any ambiguity. Considering the economic climate of the country it is becoming difficult to balance service delivery with available resources, coming up with new ideas and ensuring functional Local Governments that focus on the people. Even in our own political parties we must maintain a sense and level of ethical behaviour and governance. A frequent trend in the NCOP sees the interest of political parties supersede the interests of communities, especially when there are concerns, interventions.

Hon Speaker, while there is a lot more work to be done the Western Cape is already setting the benchmark for the rest of the country in terms of clean, effective, transparent and ethical governance. 12 out of the 18 municipalities received a clean audit from the Auditor-General for the 2017/18 financial year. This is indicative of the success of the Western Cape Government. The

lessons and successful methods of the Western Cape Government should not just be used for political bragging but should serve as inspiration for other provinces to strive for better governance. This can result in far more open relations and cooperative governance in the long term. It starts with leadership and the DA will continue to lead where we govern. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Labuschagne. I now recognise hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Speaker. The world and South Africa have changed significantly since 1994. Doing business or doing government as usual through a strongly centralised system is not allowing us to keep up with this changing world. In 2017, hon Speaker, 65% of South Africans were urbanised and we are predicting that 80% of South Africans will live in urban areas by 2050.

Hon Speaker, cities and towns are the pathways that South Africans will take to prosperity and local government is key to the future of our country but we have to ask ourselves whether local government is ready for this or empowered for this. Our municipalities must provide for people who are already living there and they need to be empowered to prepare for the future that is coming. This is why we need to turn government on its head. We must abandon centralised structures and instead empower municipalities with the powers and functions to build prosperous, safe and socially inclusive communities exactly where people are living. Local government must take

the lead to create an environment that is sustainable and liveable, where people are safe and employed with equitable access to services and opportunities. The duplication of functions at provincial and municipal government is expensive and wasteful. Devolving powers to municipalities will also bring Government and elected representatives closer to the communities they serve. Duplicated functions like housing, transport, health, climate change action should be progressively devolved from National and Provincial Governments.

The necessary economic growth to take our country and our people forward must be nested with an environmentally sustainable green economy. Our climate is changing far more rapidly than scientists have predicted and time is running out for us to meet our global warming targets. Developing countries are most at risk from climate change. In South Africa we have already seen the impact of floods, fires, droughts and heat waves. We must act urgently, hon Speaker, to reduce our carbon emissions and our impact on global warming and we will not achieve our targets without the leadership of municipalities.

Hon Speaker, there is no planet B and time is running out for the one earth that we have. Sustainable, responsible people-centred municipalities is the pathway to staying alive and municipalities must be given the powers and the functions to prepare for the future. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Herron. I now recognise hon

Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Speaker, the ACDP welcomes this debate today. It is an important debate, an important topic to talk about building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities, but firstly, hon Speaker, sadly to say after 25 years some of our poorest communities still do not have adequate services. Hon Speaker, I just want to refer to the Auditor-General's report, Mr Kimi Mkwetu is saying that two municipalities did not even hand in their outstanding financials. That is Laingsburg and Kannaland. Now hon Speaker, that is the smallest municipalities you can get under the sun and yet they did not render in any financials and then we have three municipalities in the Western Cape that had qualified audits: George, Oudtshoorn and Beaufort West. So hon Speaker, the problem is these have been sad stories and bad stories for a long time. I want to know what the Minister is doing with his Department to intervene because this is the frustration we see when we see people burning tyres, the throwing of stones because people are frustrated. They are not getting adequate services, because, hon Speaker, the important thing is people want to see leaders that are accountable; leaders that are efficient and transparent and that is the type of leaders we must emulate. As political parties we must make sure that we get the right candidates to be our councillors out on the ground because the important thing is that is - like the other speaker said - the coalface. People want to see. They do not look at Government and say National. They look at Government as a whole and they want services and something must be done about that. If I look at the report further where they have done the oversight

visit it is said that in the Western Cape and North West the bucket system is increasing. The bucket system is increasing if you go to the Statistician General, the bucket system is increasing. [Interjections.]

†Die HOOFSWEEP (ANC): Is dit seer?

[The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Does it hurt?]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: In North West and the Western Cape the bucket system is increasing. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: So it tells me, hon Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... that in certain areas people do not have any dignity because they cannot use toilet facilities and that is the problem. You check, you check, you check. You read, you read, you read. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, order! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Do not go there. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: You must try and wrap up, hon member Christians.



Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Speaker, so the Department of Local Government has got a vision, a vision of having well governed municipalities, integrated municipalities, sustainable municipalities and we want this Local Government to play a bigger role to ensure that our people get the services required. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians. I now recognise hon Baartman. [Interjections.]

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Speaker, fellow South Africans, this week we observed two contrasting life lessons. The first was characterised by Bitou Municipality's motto to be the best together. In particular the words "to be" always seem to refer to a future state - a continuous skirmish to a better tomorrow, but not today. The second lesson was characterised by Mossel Bay Municipality's motto, "Explore endless horizons", a lesson of exploration that permeated throughout every engagement and every programme we witnessed in the Mossel Bay area.

At KwaNokutula Waste Transfer Station in Bitou we learnt that the station can receive used oil, e-waste, household hazardous waste and general household refuse. Part of the waste is then transferred to the Petro SA landfill facility in Mossel Bay, the district facility, and the main concern, however, was that the vast amount spent on waste transport costs to Mossel Bay. The Mayor then indicated that they would like another permit to be approved for a new landfill site in Plettenberg Bay, but hon Speaker, money

is not always the answer and more is not always better. Upon inquiry I found that the reason behind the excessive transport costs was because the waste was previously transported via the rail system, which is now unsafe.

The inquiry also revealed that the railway and Kaaimans River railway bridge needed repairing due to the damage sustained during the floods of 2006. It was thought that the line to George would then reopen in 2020 but this is sadly not the case. So the money the Municipality requires to subsidise their transport costs and to acquire another landfill is not necessarily because there is more waste at the site, but because of the dilapidated bridge and railway. This has also negative impacts on the tourism economy as the Outeniqua Choo Tjoe was one of the main attractions in the area.

The Bitou Municipality further appealed to us that the new electricity licensing proposal from NERSA suggesting an increase in Eskom licensing distribution areas would impact the revenue stream and debt collection for other municipal services; while their belief that they would have capacity to take over the grid supporting the City of Cape Town's court application to prove that municipalities can distribute electricity. Bitou's problem is bigger than simply taking over the grid. It is bigger than more money and it is bigger than more permits. Their problem is a lack of vision, innovation and exploration. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: So you are correct [Inaudible.]

Ms D M BAARTMAN: In the Mossel Bay Municipality we found similar programmes for recycling but what set them apart was the local work at the Kwanonqaba Waste Transfer Station's Oom Roux, whose own initiative to go through the waste and then put any plants or miscellaneous recyclable items aside to repurpose in other residents' homes, was a success. What sets them apart was that they currently give teachers at the local primary school points for recycling and as a reward the Municipality provides classrooms with worm farms in which vegetables can be grown. Furthermore, in terms of innovation they could formalise their composting facility at Hartenbos and by doing so they could increase their recycling performance from 18% to 25% in the future. Despite not having enough waste to make large renewable energy projects viable at the moment, like the Drakenstein Municipality... [Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: Or Knysna.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: ...they still issued a notice to request any ideas from the community, local entrepreneurs and businesses in order to turn their waste into energy. [Interjections.] For turning waste into... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members! Please let us not drown the member on the floor. Please proceed, hon member Baartman.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: In order to turn waste into energy they would require 2000 tons of waste per day. Currently they only produce 8000 tons of waste

per month. They also identified a proposed special economic zone in order to grow their economy with the focus on the oil and gas sector and the ocean's economy. They have even found innovative ways to fund this proposed project through private partnerships and commercial loans. Their electricity losses are below the national average and more than a third of the electricity revenue comes from commercial and industrial consumers. In order to convince customers to use their grid instead of Eskom's they have packaged their services around their grid, making the areas assigned to the Municipality more attractive to investors. Further their technical services are already completely off the grid boasting that they are never looking back.

Hon Speaker, this week we indeed saw two contrasting stories regarding waste-to-energy programmes and these are critical to local economic development - a story of success and one of stagnation and it is up to leaders in various communities to decide whether they want to live up to their mottoes, continue waiting to be the best for tomorrow or whether they want to explore the endless horizons.

Do we want money or do we want innovative finance? Do we want houses or do we want communities? Do we want more landfills or do we want energy security? Waste may not necessarily be the most glorified industry, but it can help us to take back our power. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Baartman. [Interjections.]

†Die ADJUNKHOOFSWEEP (DA): Daai is warme kole.

[The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Those are hot coals.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members! I now recognise hon member P Marais.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Speaker, hon members, first I wish to congratulate the Minister and his Department for having received the most clean municipal audits for the years 2017/2018 [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: hear-hear!

†Me D M BAARTMAN: Afrikaans asseblief.

[Ms D M BAARTMAN: Afrikaans please.]

Mr P J MARAIS: 12 out of the 18 audits, announced nationally by the Auditor-General, came from the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

Mr P J MARAIS: However, there is no room for complacency and chest beating because what is disturbing is the fact that the percentage of municipalities in the Western Cape that achieved clean audits have declined from 70% to only 40%.

†Nou die Ouditeur-Generaal het dit toegeskryf aan 'n verslapping van beheer by sommige munisipaliteite en dit moet dadelik aangespreek word. [Tussenwerpsels.] [Now the Auditor-General ascribed it to a slackening of control by some municipalities and it should be addressed immediately. [Interjections.]] The West - I want to tell you what the Auditor-General said. [Interjections.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Dit is ou nuus!

[An HON MEMBER: It is old news!]

Mr P J MARAIS: We have observed that the lapses in controls in certain municipalities in this province were largely non-adherence to statutory submissions of financial statements and audits. Now, Mr Chairman...

An HON MEMBER: Hon Speaker.

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Speaker, I want to give a little bit of advice if I am allowed to? I do not want to complain. How do we solve this problem? It is all of ours problem. It is not a party problem. It is a Western Cape problem.

†Ek wil aanbeveel dat die Minister van Plaaslike Bestuur 'n ministeriële komitee in die lewe roep wat soos 'n rondgaande inspektoraat sal optree en munisipaliteite deurlopend en gereeld sal besoek. Hul stelsels en hul boeke nagaan en terug aan die Minister rapporteer. Miskien kan die Minister oorweeg om een van die Departement se direkteure, 'n verteenwoordiger van

SALGA en 'n gekwalifiseerde rekenmeester vir die doel aan te wys. Hulle moet onverwags by munisipaliteite kan opdaag of op kort kennisgewing.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[I want to recommend that the Minister of Local Government establishes a ministerial committee that can operate as a circuit inspectorate and visit municipalities continuously and regularly. Examine their systems and their books and report back to the Minister. Perhaps the Minister can consider appointing one of the Department's directors, a representative of SALGA and a qualified accountant for the purpose. They must be able to arrive at municipalities unannounced or at short notice.]

We need an early warning system if our oversight function is to be meaningful and effective.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Marais, you need to wrap up.

Mr P J MARAIS: I will, sir, and political parties must also take some of the blame. The educational qualifications and skills of some councillors and mayors are not impressive enough to qualify them as councillors in charge of effective, efficient service delivery because one cannot build a strong structure with inferior material. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Marais, your time is up.

Mr P J MARAIS: I thank you. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

†Die MINISTER VAN MENSLIKE NEDERSETTINGS: Klap hande, komaan!

[Gelag.] [Applous.]

[The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Clap hands, come on!

[Laughter.] [Applause.]]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon members. Order, hon members, I am sure we have clapped now. Thank you. I recognise hon Van Der Westhuizen.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Agb Speaker, die gebiede van beide Bitou en Mosselbaai het van die mooiste kuslyne en die pragtigste natuurskoon ter wêreld en beide steun swaar op vakansiegangers en toerisme vir hul plaaslike ekonomieë. Beide is sogenaamde B-tipe munisipaliteite en beide val onder die Tuinroete Distriksmunisipaliteit. Beide ervaar ernstige uitdagings wat nie uniek is aan daardie deel of die res van ons land nie; uitdagings soos met die hantering van afval in sensitiewe gebiede en veral uitdagings met die voorsiening van behoorlike behuising vir die vinnig-groeiende vraag na huisvesting en soos wat dit oral die geval is, is die begroting van die sentrale regering vir beide munisipaliteite vir die bou van huise nie genoeg nie en is al meer inwoners van hierdie munisipale gebiede aangewese op informele behuising. Daar is dus baie ooreenkomste tussen hierdie twee munisipaliteite maar die verskille wat ons hierdie week gesien



het, was oorweldigend.

Mosselbaai Munisipaliteit is gelukkig dat daar politieke stabiliteit is en dat die DA in beheer is, en dit is nie kontroversieel nie. Dit is 'n feit. [Tussenwerpsels.] In Bitou het die beheer 'n paar keer gewissel en word die beheer tans uitgeoefen deur 'n koalisie van die Active United Front en die ANC met burgemeester Peter Lobese die enigste verteenwoordiger van die AUF, 'n klein plaaslike party, en die verskil tussen 'n politiek- en administratief stabiele, soos in die geval van Mosselbaai, en 'n onstabiele politieke en administratiewe gebied soos in die geval van Bitou, kon nie beter geïllustreer word as deur die onderskeie aanbiedings van die twee owerhede hierdie week nie.

In die geval van Bitou is daar 'n gebrek aan begrip vir die rol van ander regeringsfere en instellings en hierdie onkunde lei op sy beurt tot spanning, agterdog, wanpersepsies en valse voorstellings. Om maar een so 'n voorbeeld te noem, alle distriksmunisipaliteite het 'n bepaalde oorsigrol ten opsigte van gesondheids- en omgewingskwessies en het die mag om aktiwiteite wat van die regulasies afwyk na inspeksie te sluit. Die burgemeester van Bitou het groot gewag gemaak van wat hy gesien het as ongehoorde optrede deur die Tuinroete Distriksmunisipaliteit deurdat hulle na bewering 'n geheime forensiese ondersoek ten opsigte van Bitou sou geloods het. [Tussenwerpsels.] Volgens die distriksmunisipaliteit was dit bloot 'n roetine inspeksieverslag rakende die vasteafvalbestuur in Bitou en waarin bepaalde tekortkominge geïdentifiseer is en waar Bitou die kans gegee is om die

gebreke reg te stel. [Tussenwerpsels.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Speaker, the areas of both Bitou and Mossel Bay have some of the most beautiful coast lines in the world and both are depending heavily on holidaymakers and tourism for their local economies. Both are so-called B-type municipalities and both resort under the Garden Route District Municipality. Both are experiencing serious challenges that are not unique to that part or the rest of our country; challenges such as with the handling of waste in sensitive areas and especially challenges with the provision of proper housing for the rapidly growing demand for housing and as it is the case everywhere, the budget of the Central Government for both municipalities for building houses is not adequate and more and more inhabitants are dependent on informal housing. There are thus several similarities between these two municipalities but the differences we have seen this week were overwhelming.

Mossel Bay Municipality is fortunate that there is political stability and that the DA is in control, and that is not controversial. It is a fact. [Interjections.] In Bitou the control has varied a few times and presently control is exercised by a coalition of the Active United Front and the ANC with Mayor Peter Lobese the only representative of the AUF, a small local party, and the difference between a politically and administrative stable, as in the case of Mossel Bay, and an unstable political and administrative area as in the case

of Bitou, could not be better illustrated than by the respective presentations of the two authorities this week.

In the case of Bitou there is a lack of understanding of the role of other spheres of government and institutions and this ignorance in turn leads to tension, suspicion, misconceptions and false representations. To name only one such example, all district municipalities have a definite oversight role with regard to health and environmental issues and have the power to close activities deviating from the regulations after inspection. The Mayor of Bitou made a big noise about what he saw as intolerable action by the Garden Route District Municipality in that they have allegedly launched a secret forensic investigation with regard to Bitou. [Interjections.] According to the District Municipality it was merely a routine inspection report in connection with the waste management in Bitou in which specific shortcomings were identified and where Bitou was given the opportunity to rectify these shortcomings. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It was good when we governed [Inaudible.]

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Onder die huidige politieke leierskap en administrasie in Bitou het 'n potensieel pragtige behuisingsprojek tot stilstand geknars met stygings in kostes en politieke onrus. Danksy die ingryping van hierdie Provinsiale Regering se Departement van Menslike Nedersettings is hierdie projek figuurlik uit die vuur gekrap [Tussenwerpsel.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Under the present political leadership and administration in Bitou a potentially excellent housing project ground to a halt with escalations in costs and political unrest. Thanks to the intervention of this Provincial Government's Department of Human Settlements this project has figuratively been pulled from the fire. [Interjection.]]

†'n AGBARE LID: Ag asseblief!

[An HON MEMBER: Oh please!]

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ...en word daar tans pragtige vordering getoon... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ...and presently excellent progress is shown... [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members!

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ...maar die gras wat oor die hope groei toon duidelik dat daar vir baie lank geen aktiwiteit was nie. Die spanning en dubbelpraat in Bitou het gemaak dat dit 'n baie bekommerde... [Tussenwerpsels.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ...but the grass growing over the mounds shows clearly that for very long there has been no activity. The tension and doublespeak in Bitou have caused that it was a very worried ...  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon member Van der Westhuizen, please take your seat. I recognise the Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): I was under the impression that we had agreed that we would respect the convention of maiden speeches. I therefore ask that hon Van der Westhuizen be allowed to proceed with his speech uninterrupted. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members, there is a point of order by the Chief Whip. Now the Speaker did not hear what the Chief Whip was saying because the noise was of unprecedented measures. I would then want to hear what the Chief Whip had to say. Hon Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you Hon Speaker, to repeat, hon Van der Westhuizen is attempting to deliver his maiden speech. I therefore ask that the convention be respected.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Chief Whip. Hon members, may we please as I have indicated earlier - I would not want to belabour the point; that we proceed in that regard. Are we all in favour?

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon member Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you Chair. How much time do I have left now, three and a half minutes?

The SPEAKER: You now have three minutes.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Three minutes, thank you. †Watter vars bries was dit dus om Mosselbaai hierna te kon besoek. Alhoewel hierdie munisipaliteit ook ernstige uitdagings het, is daar 'n positiewe gees onder die politieke en administratiewe leierskap en hulle getuig van goeie skakeling en samewerking met ander regeringsfere en uitstekende toegang tot eksterne geldbronne. Dit was verblydend om inisiatiewe te sien waarvolgens inwoners se lewensomstandighede daadwerklik verbeter word; inisiatiewe soos die bou van *en suite*-toilette vir veral bejaarde en verswakte inwoners; behuisingsprojekte met innoverende ontwerpe wat gemik is op die skep van gelukkige gemeenskappe, en dankie aan agb lid Nkondlo wat erkenning daaraan verleen het vandag. Dit was 'n plesier om te ry deur netjiese skoon woonbuurte, woonbuurte verteenwoordigend van die hele spektrum van sosio-ekonomiese omstandighede. Goeie politieke en administratiewe leierskap en stabiliteit is duidelik in die beste belang van kiesers maar as ons kyk na die uitslag van die Mei 2019 Provinsiale / Nasionale Verkiesings is dit duidelik dat al meer kiesers hul steun uitbring vir kleiner partye wat aan

weerskante van die politieke spektrum lê en die uitslae van verskeie tussenverkiesings insluitende gister onderstreep hierdie tendens. Daar is dus 'n groot moontlikheid - ek wil byna sê, daar is 'n gevaar - dat die stabiliteit in goeie dienslewering wat verskeie Wes-Kaapse munisipaliteite die afgelope jaar ervaar het, met die 2020/2021 verkiesings iets van die verlede kan wees.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[What a fresh breeze it was therefore to visit Mossel Bay afterwards. Although this municipality also has serious challenges, there is a positive spirit among the political and administrative leadership and they show evidence of good liaison and cooperation with other spheres of government and excellent access to external financial resources. It was heartening to see initiatives through which residents' life conditions are improved in reality; initiatives such as the building of *en suite* toilets for especially aged and vulnerable residents; housing projects with innovative designs aimed at creating happy communities, and thanks to the hon member Nkondlo who today gave recognition to that. It has been a pleasure to drive through neat and clean neighbourhoods, neighbourhoods representative of the whole spectrum of socio-economic circumstances. Good political and administrative leadership and stability are clearly in the interest of voters, but as we look at the result of the May 2019 Provincial / National Elections it is clear that more and more voters bring out their support for smaller parties on either side of the political spectrum and the results of various by-elections

including yesterday's underline this tendency. There is thus a big possibility – I almost want to say danger – that the stability in good service delivery which various Western Cape municipalities have experienced over the past year, may be something of the past with the 2020/2021 elections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Waarom is koalisies met kleiner plaaslike partye, na my oordeel, hoogs onwenslik? Die geskiedenis het vir ons gewys dat hierdie kleiner koalisie-vennote, die sogenaamde “king makers”, vinnig van vennoot verwissel en dat hulle keuse van vennoot dikwels berus op die vergoeding gekoppel aan die posisies wat hulle onder sulke scenario's aangebied word.

Bekwame senior amptenare word in hierdie tye van onstabiliteit te gedienstig geag aan die politieke party en word goue handdrukke aangebied, en met die vertrek van hierdie kundige en effektiewe amptenare word ons munisipaliteite geknou op 'n manier wat jare neem om weer te herstel.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Why are coalitions with smaller parties, in my judgement, highly undesirable? History has shown us that these smaller coalition partners, the so-called “king makers”, quickly change



partners and that their choice of partner is often based on the remuneration coupled with the positions that are offered to them under such scenarios.

Experienced senior officials are being regarded in these times of instability as being too loyal to the political party and are offered golden handshakes, and with the departure of these knowledgeable and effective officials our municipalities are damaged in a way that takes years to repair.]

†'n AGB LID: In Oudtshoorn.

[An HON MEMBER: In Oudtshoorn.]

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Na ons besoek aan Mosselbaai en Bitou [Tussenwerpsels.], kan 'n mens maar net weer 'n oproep tot kiesers rig: stem slegs vir partye wat u stemme ernstig sal opneem; wat 'n langtermyn visie het [Tussenwerpsels.] en waarvan 'n mens kan verwag dat hulle by hulle beginsels sal hou. Stem vir partye waarvan die openbare verteenwoordigers nie met posisies en beloftes van groter vergoeding omgekoop sal word nie, en waar daar interne dissipline is wanneer verteenwoordigers [Tussenwerpsels.] hulle beginsels versaak, en wees versigtig vir die talle nuwe politieke partye wat tussen nou en 2021 se plaaslike verkiesing soos sampioene gaan opskiet. Ek dank u. [Tussenwerpsels.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: After our visit to Mossel Bay and Bitou [Interjections.], one can only once again call on voters to only vote for parties that take their votes seriously; that have a long term vision [Interjections.] and from which one can expect to keep to their principles. Vote for parties of which the public representatives are not bribed by positions and promises of greater remuneration, and where there is internal discipline when representatives [Interjections.] start neglecting their principles, and be cautious of the many new political parties that between now and 2021's local elections are going to spring up like mushrooms. I thank you. [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Applause.] Thank you hon member Van der Westhuizen. Hon members, thank you. I now recognise hon member Gillion. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Speaker, before I start, let me raise this discomfort with the pre-empted political agenda, that was so obvious, by the DA in this provincial week. [Interjections.] This is not how we should support local government. [Interjections.] Otherwise we will lose the purpose of the Provincial Oversight Week.

The NCOP should also investigate the member who issued a one-sided media statement and the outcomes of the oversight visit, before we could even conclude a report.

An HON MEMBER: It should have been [Inaudible.]. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: But rest assured, Mr Speaker, we were not drunk or blind as the members this side of the House. [Interjections.] You cannot wish us away [Interjections.], we were part of this oversight. [Interjections.] I am very grateful, Mr Speaker, for the opportunity to be part of the team that is participating on the report-back session following our provincial week programme.

It is important to stress that the purpose of the provincial week was to solace the provincial interest and to ensure that we, the delegates to the NCOP, to keep abreast of developments, as well as service delivery challenges facing this province.

I am also very grateful to have been part of oversight visits to various municipalities in this province.

An HON MEMBER: Mmm.

Ms M N GILLION: I sometimes wonder where these members of the DA get their courage from to misleading the nation [Interjections.] through catch phrases like “corruption-free government” [Interjections.], or “best-run government”.

Evidence gathered from these visits to municipalities disproves all these

claims. [Interjections.] Bitou Municipality is the case in point.

An HON MEMBER: Of what?

An HON MEMBER: Who?

Ms M N GILLION: This municipality is experiencing serious cash flow challenges, which forced it to fund its capital expenditure from its own reserves. As the result decreasing municipal reserves. [Interjections.] The municipality also financially bridge the Human Settlement Grant with over R22 million.

An HON MEMBER: Yôh.

Ms M N GILLION: The AG also highlighted ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yôh.

Ms M N GILLION: ... that the municipality incurred [Interjections.] an operation over expenditure of R32.6 million, as it spent R605.5 million over its R573 million operation budget. Whilst some may be quick to judge and cast aspersions against municipal officials and council, but can we pause for a second, Mr Speaker, and ask what really cause these challenges?

The main reason is that the Provincial Government did not pay all DoRA

allocations ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ag shame.

Ms M N GILLION: ... for Human Settlement Grants. MEC Simmers and his Department must account for the R22 million it has not paid to the municipality. [Interjections.]

It is generally accepted that some of the serious challenges facing municipalities can be ascribed to weak provincial oversight and monitoring of local government and compliance, and lack of consequence management. This was explained to everyone present in the oversight visit.

When we speak of these challenges facing municipalities we should also put a spotlight on the ineffective oversight and interference by the Provincial Government and MEC ...[Interjections.]

†n AGB LID: Dit is julle mense.

[An HON MEMBER: It is your people.]

Ms M N GILLION: ... which resulted in destabilisation of certain municipalities.

Mr Speaker, the Finance MEC presentation clearly stated that district municipalities' sustainability is under threat. Some of the reasons for this

were listed as budget implementation [Interjections.] challenges and slow capital expenditure.

The presentation showed that Cederberg Municipality [Interjections.] did not report a positive cash and cash equivalent balances.

An HON MEMBER: You have been going on during [Inaudible.].

Ms M N GILLION: This will be a thing of the past [Interjections.] as the municipality is now back in good hands. After yesterday's by-election the ANC took over this municipality. [Interjections.] [Applause.] Allow me to congratulate the ANC ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Ms M N GILLION: ... on its resounding victory.

An HON MEMBER: Overwhelming. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Other municipalities, Mr Speaker, like Matzikama, Witzenberg, Drakenstein, Breede Valley, Overberg, Theewaterskloof [Interjections.], Kannaland, Mossel Bay, Bitou, Knysna, Central Karoo, Laingsburg and Beaufort West are experiencing liquidity risk. [Interjections.]

The Provincial Government seems to know what is needed [Interjections.] to

address these challenges.

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members, let us not drown out the hon member that is speaking.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you for the protection, Mr Speaker, [Interjections.] but somehow it is not implementing them.

The Finance MEC presented good governance drivers, which, if implemented, would help municipalities turn the tide. Good governance is at the heart of the effective functioning of municipalities. We were told this by Graham Paule, the HOD of Local Government. While the HOD reported that all councils in the province are functional, except for Cederberg, where there is instability, he did not stress the problem enough.

The Mayor of this municipality recently overstepped his legislative mandate by conducting disciplinary hearings against all ANC councillors and found them guilty for contravening the ...[Interjections.] - can I be protected?

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members [Interjections.]. Hon members, order. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you. ... code of conduct for councillors. Mayors do not have such powers. [Interjections.] This was brought to the attention of MEC Bredell, who refused to act against the Mayor. That Mayor does not

know his mandate and should be suspended, [Interjections.] but luckily was removed yesterday by the power of the people through the ballots. [Interjections.]

Mr Speaker, the HOD also mentioned that all municipalities have anti-corruption measures. I am worried and think these anti-corruption measures need to be revealed. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members [Interjections.] ... hon members [Interjections.], I need your indulgence. We have a very important debate and it is up to the conduct of members how we are able to take the matters raised by the communities forward.

Now it is a bit of a worrying situation, so I am requesting hon members, that we please respect the proceedings so that we are able to continue seamlessly. You have three minutes left, hon member.

Ms M N GILLION: I just hope you saved my time, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: I did.

Ms M N GILLION: I am worried and think these anti-corruption measures need to be reviewed, for example the NCOP has been busy with the “Love Knysna” petition since 2015, which raises serious issues of corruption and maladministration [Interjections.] in this municipality. It raises serious



irregularities with ISDF tender and places Premier Winde and MEC Bredell at the centre ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja!

Ms M N GILLION: ... of the challenges in the municipality. [Interjections.] Due to the seriousness of the issues raised in the petition, [Interjections.] the NCOP referred some matters to the Public Protector for investigation. Those who have are seen to be fighting corruption ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Ms M N GILLION: ... in the municipality ...

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Gillion, will you please take your seat. Hon the Chief Whip of the Opposition.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, we have a speaker on the floor and I would like to request that you rule on the levels of noise that are in the House. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you, hon Chief Whip. Ja, if you were to sit in this Chair. [Laughter.] You will understand the difficulty that the House in general is creating. I could point members on both sides who are making this difficult, but thank you, hon Chief Whip of the Opposition, I hope you will

assist me and the Chief Whip will also assist me on the other side. I recognise you, Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. It is really good to have the hon member from the NCOP back in this House and I welcome her back here, but I would like to ask - and she remembers the convention - the speaker on the floor whether she would take a question?

An HON MEMBER: No.

Ms M N GILLION: I will take the question when I am back here. [Laughter.]

An HON MEMBER: Never.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you, thank you, hon members. Then the question is not being entertained, hon Premier, unfortunately. Let us proceed. Hon member Gillion. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Those who have are seen to be fighting corruption in the municipality are targeted and purged. MEC Bredell is at the centre of attempts to discipline and remove Mayor Mark Willemse and councillor Peter Myers. This will result in the destabilisation of the municipality. [Interjections.]

It is unsurprising that the MEC is also at the centre ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Order! Please proceed, hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Can you please protect me against the MEC of Human Settlements. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Hon members [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] the money.

The SPEAKER: Order! Please proceed, hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Mr Speaker, I think you must add more time. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No.

Ms M N GILLION: It is unsurprising that the MEC is also at the centre of chaos in the George Municipality.

An HON MEMBER: Wow.

An HON MEMBER: Yôh.

Ms M N GILLION: Investigators, on 10 September, started the duty of looking ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member. Will you please take your seat. There is a point of order. Hon Chief Whip.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I rise on a point of order on Rule 59(1)(a). The member is imputing improper motives on another member of this House.

An HON MEMBER: It is hot in the kitchen. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip, thank you.

An HON MEMBER: It is hot in the kitchen.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I am sure we will recognise that we have agreed here that when you want to make a statement that has a bearing on the integrity or the dignity of a member sitting in this House, it must be done by means of a substantive motion, and the Rules allow for that, and in this case the hon member has not done so, and you are doing it differently and that becomes a matter that we cannot allow because it is out of order.

So you must proceed without feeling intimidated that you cannot speak, but do so within the Rules, please.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: And with that then you must withdraw that point that you made.

Ms M N GILLION: Which point, Mr Speaker? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: About the individual ...[Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Which one?

The SPEAKER: ... MEC.

Ms M N GILLION: Which one? [Interjections.] No-no-no, Mr Speaker, you cannot [Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: The ...[Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Speaker, please allow me to address you. You cannot just rule, "Withdraw the statement," and you do not tell me which one. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Gillion. I was still on the floor to assist the hon member. What you must withdraw is the statement where you said the hon member is part of the chaos in George. [Interjections.] Ja, but I

am saying “he is the centre of that”, ja. You know, those are the semantics.  
Do not draw the Speaker to the debate. [Interjections.]

So what I am requesting here, I think we have been doing this very well. We  
have been having a very good debate.

So I am simply highlighting the area which the member knows that you must  
withdraw that specific area, specific section of the speech, and then proceed  
with the speech.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Speaker, I never said he is part, I said he is at the  
centre.

So which one ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Remove the ...[Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: ... must I remove?

The SPEAKER: Remove the one “at the centre”.

Ms M N GILLION: Okay, I will do so. I withdraw.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. [Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: I withdraw “in the centre”. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please proceed, hon member.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you, thank you. [Interjections.] Okay, Mr Speaker, DA insiders are telling us that the DA caucus had a meeting with MEC Bredell ...[Interjections.]

Mr D SMITH: Yes!

Ms M N GILLION: ... who apparently gave the instruction ...[Interjections.]

Mr D SMITH: Yes!

Ms M N GILLION: ... to table the motion to suspend Trevor Botha, the municipal manager [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Indistinct.] making it wrong.

Ms M N GILLION: No, Trevor Botha thinks his suspension [Interjections.] is a demonstration of political retaliation after he reported the R350 million Old Mutual Investment ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Sanlam.

An HON MEMBER: Huh?

Ms M N GILLION: ... allegations of corruption to the police.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Sanlam!

Ms M N GILLION: Graham Paulse confirmed that there are only two Section 106 investigations underway. They are in Bitou and George Municipalities.

An HON MEMBER: Yôh.

Ms M N GILLION: I have my reservation with Horizon Forensic investigations in Bitou ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member, you need to wrap up.

Ms M N GILLION: We need to check the possible conflict of interest as this company was employed by the council to conduct an investigation [Interjections.], who never gave a report to the municipality, but sent it, sorry, to the MEC.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time is up.

Ms M N GILLION: Thank you. [Applause.]



The SPEAKER: I now - thank you, hon members. I now recognise hon member Sileku. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Another maiden.

Mr I M SILEKU: Hon †Somlomo [Speaker], hon members, fellow South Africans, Alderman Anton Coetzee, chairperson of SALGA Western Cape, †goeie middag [good afternoon.]

Since 1994 it has been anticipated that Local Government will play a significant role in the New South Africa. The 1998 White Paper on Local Government envisaged a local government sphere and a core of socio-economic development, a vision confirmed by the 2012 National Development Plan, NDP.

Numerous indicators unfortunately however suggests that Local Government sector is not optimally fulfilling its assigned mandate with many municipalities in disarray.

†Hon Somlomo [Speaker], during my first visit as a member of the National Council of Provinces, I have come to learn of a new phrase in Local Government, “ICU”. Meaning our municipalities are on life-support. When you are on life-support †zimbini izinto ezinokwenzeka, oyokuqala imeko yakho ingabangcono okanye imeko yakho ingaqhubekela ibemaxongo

ngakumbi. [There are two things that can happen when you are on life support, firstly your condition can get better or it can deteriorate.]

It can never be acceptable for us to allow †ooMasipala bethu bahambe beqhubekeka besiba kwi meko ezimaxongo sijongile. [our Municipalities are in bad condition and we are zooming in on this.]

Mr Speaker, we need to be bold enough as the Government when we deal with what takes place in our municipalities that are in ICU. All of us in this House know who and where the source of this comes from, because during our visit, which consists of all political parties, I was fortunate enough to be part of the conversation, uninvited of course, when a member of the ANC said, after a visit, “I am so worried about the ANC [Interjections.], because the ANC municipalities governed by them, are in disarray.” [Interjections.]

In the Amahlati Local Municipality [Interjections.] in the Eastern Cape [Interjections.] ... In the Amahlati Local Municipality in the Eastern Cape, municipal property was damaged with the main offices and other buildings having been torched, while in the Msunduzi Local Municipality in KwaZulu Natal, councillors intentionally avoided council meetings with the sole purpose of making sure there is no quorum. [Interjections.] In Kwakwani Local Municipality in the Northern Cape, the Mayor has been on sick leave for two years. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ANC.

Mr I M SILEKU: His family uses municipal property to do personal business without any consequences. [Interjections.]

Mr E Z NJADU: Order, Chair. [Interjections.]

Mr I M SILEKU: There is infighting amongst the majority party, which is the ANC ...[Interjections.]

Mr E Z NJADU: Order, order, Chair.

The SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.]

Mr E Z NJADU: Point of order, Chair.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.]

Mr E Z NJADU: A point of order, Chair. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, there is one Speaker, so I will help you here.

An HON MEMBER: There is only one.

The SPEAKER: I recognise hon member Njadu and then after which the Chief Whip.

Mr E Z NJADU: Chairperson, this oversight was in the Western Cape ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr E Z NJADU: ... and let us focus on the oversight which was on the Western Cape [Interjections.] and we must highlight the issues that were [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr E Z NJADU: ... the issues were in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr E Z NJADU: We cannot come with issues of - we are from the NCOP, yes ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr E Z NJADU: ... but Speaker, it was a provincial week [Interjections.] and not an NCOP week.

The SPEAKER: Hon member, please take your seat.

Mr E Z NJADU: It was a provincial week. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please take you seat, hon member. [Interjections.] Hon members ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Please remember that [Inaudible.].

The SPEAKER: ... please let us conduct ourselves in a manner that recognises the decorum of this House. [Interjections.] I recognise the Chief Whip, then the LOGB. The Chief Whip.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Speaker. First of all that was not a point of order in terms of our Rules, but what I would like to ask is that it is hon member Sileku's maiden speech in this House [Interjections.] and therefore that we respect the principle that we have agreed to, thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip. [Interjections.] Hon member Sileku, will you please remain seated. Thank you, sir. Hon LOGB.

The MINISTER FOR TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Speaker, thank you, but I am covered. I just wanted to draw the attention of the member who was raising the point of order. The topic of the debate. The

topic of the debate is talking about building sustainable, responsive and people-centred municipalities [Interjections.].

It says [Interjections.] ... No-no-no, no, I am talking about the topic of the debate. [Interjections.]

So there is absolutely nothing wrong from a member of the National Council of Provinces [Interjections.] drawing comparisons relevant to the topic with other areas. [Interjections.]

So relevance here is the issue and the member is very relevant. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you, hon members. [Interjections.] Hon members [Interjections.] ... Thank you, hon members. Thank you, hon Minister Madikizela, there is another point of order, hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Mr Speaker, I think we must remember what is our mandate. [Interjections.] We are discussing Western Cape and we are only responsible for the Western Cape, and we have no power and authority over any municipality in any of the other eight provinces, so I would agree with the member that we must discuss what is our mandate. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Alright. [Interjections.] Hon members, let me, let me assist

the House. We have, as part of the debate, members from the National Council of Provinces and you will agree with me that they go around the country and that includes the Western Cape as part of the country ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: ... because the Western Cape is not an island.

An HON MEMBER: Absolutely.

An HON MEMBER: Yes. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Now [Interjections.] ... now ... please do not speak whilst the Speaker is speaking.

An HON MEMBER: That is why [Inaudible.].

The SPEAKER: What then happens in that spirit is that because of the nature of the debate, it is a political debate. Members will not be circumscribed to specifications because of the nature of the debate. It is a wide-ranging political debate.

So I am requesting that members be tolerant of somehow a debate that might be unfamiliar in terms of what you expect it to be, because of the nature of

the debate, which is the topic of the day.

So that is in that spirit.

So I will entertain any conversation that seeks to talk to the matter, irrespective of the limitation in terms of provinces, especially from members of the National Council of Provinces, because we know we have got a convention here. When there is a topic it has to be consistent with our mandate, but NCOP's is broad.

Hon member Njadu?

Mr E Z NJADU: Mr Speaker, I am not saying that Western Cape is an island, but this event was a provincial week, meaning it was led by the Provincial Government. The issues that were discussed were the issues of importance for the province.

As a NCOP member I am representing the Province. All provinces [Interjections.] had their own provincial weeks.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you, hon member Njadu. Now I want to [Interjections.] - alright, hon members, I have already made the ruling on this matter. There is no further debate. Now we proceed. [Interjections.] Hon member Sileku.



Mr I M SILEKU: Hon Marais †ndiyakuva kodwa andiyiva lento uyithethayo  
[Hon Marais, I hear you but I am not hearing you.][Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: How many?

Mr I M SILEKU: Are we still in Polokwane? [Interjections.]. The salary bill  
is standing at 69%; that is way above the norm of 35%.

An HON MEMBER: Talk about [Inaudible.].

Mr I M SILEKU: Mr Speaker, I agree that we need to change the way our  
municipalities are governed in South Africa. [Interjections.] We must make  
sure, as others spheres of government, and do whatever is necessary  
...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.] Please proceed, hon  
member Sileku.

Mr I M SILEKU: [Interjections.] We do whatever is necessary in assisting as  
per the Constitution and other relevant legislation. It is very critical that the  
three spheres of government work together for the betterment of our people,  
especially the most vulnerable.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr I M SILEKU: We cannot allow what happened to the Clanwilliam Dam to continue.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr I M SILEKU: The feasibility study for this project was concluded in 2007 [Interjections.] and the construction is long overdue. The National Government has failed the community of the West Coast and their municipalities by taking more than a decade to implement the project.

If the Clanwilliam Dam was lifted in time, the community would not have been severely affected by the drought.

Hon †Somlomo [Speaker], if we are truly honest and care about the lives of the poor, we urgently need to look at how municipalities are funded by the National Government.

Currently 9% of the national fiscus goes towards local municipalities. It is a known fact that some municipalities are highly dependent on national grants and struggle to broaden their rate base. On top of that debtors have this disease of not paying for services rendered.

Mr Speaker, I know what I have said is very depressing to the ears but not all is lost. I have been part of a municipality that was confronted with the possibility of not paying salaries of municipal workers due to the decision

taken by the previous administration under the leadership of hon member Gillion, who was the Mayor for 2008 until 2010. [Interjections.] Incurred in [Interjections.] Overberg District Municipality.

When they got the municipality there was reserves, but when we got the municipality in 2011 we had to come and beg the Minister of Finance to allow us to pay out the grant in time so that we pay salaries of councillors [Interjections.] and what we have done because ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr I M SILEKU: ... you had a very decisive Government ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Sileku ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: 2010. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... will you please take your seat.

Ms M N GILLION: Even that is ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! I recognise the Chief Whip of the Opposition. Hon members, [Interjections.] order! The Chief Whip of the Opposition.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, I have taken note of members exchanging words in the House and in that respect hon member Maseko is using a phrase or rather a word “looters”, and I actually am concerned if whether that name is referring to any member of this House sitting on this side of the ANC. Thank you. [Interjections.] And also can you rule whether that name is parliamentary. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon the Chief Whip of the Opposition. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! Order. Order, hon members. Hon member Maseko, were you referring to a specific member? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What word?

Ms L M MASEKO: Mr Speaker, my freedom of speech must not be when I am in here really it has to be [Inaudible.]. I never said anyone is a looter, I said “looters”. Whoever who feels he is a looter will react, but I never mentioned anyone. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you, hon member, please take your seat. [Interjections.] The name itself, the question that was raised by the Chief Whip ... [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Armed robbers.

The SPEAKER: ... of the Opposition [Interjections.] ...

Ms N D NKONDLO: Armed robbers.

The SPEAKER: ... and the Chief Whip was asking whether the [Interjections.] ... Order, the Chief Whip of the Opposition was asking, hon member Lekker, whether the name itself is parliamentary. Yes, it is parliamentary, but it may not be used to point at an individual in terms of Rule 59. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: So if Rule 59 [Interjections.] - in this case the hon member has explained that she did not relate to a specific member, but she used the name, threw it in the air. In that manner then we proceed. Hon member Sileku, will you please take your stand?

Mr I M SILEKU: I am almost done, colleagues, do not worry. [Interjections.]

On top of that [Interjections.], hon †Somlomo [Speaker], you know ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He has hit a nerve.

An HON MEMBER: Huh-uh.

Mr I M SILEKU: ... that leadership that took over that municipality that was left broke by hon member Gillion even took a resolution that says we are going to forfeit our upper limits for two consecutive years; we did not get

any increases. [Interjections.]

And what we also did was to welcome the intervention from the Department of Finance in the Western Cape and Local Government in turning around the situation.

An HON MEMBER: Jô. [Interjections.]

Mr I M SILEKU: Today I can proudly say they rendered shared services in that particular Overberg District.

Ms L M MASEKO: Hear-hear!

Mr I M SILEKU: They pay salaries on time of employees and they receive clean audits.

An HON MEMBER: We are sheep.

Mr I M SILEKU: There is stability in that council; they work like, I am telling, a glove in a hand.

Hon †Somlomo [Speaker.] the first steps towards changing municipalities were well-described by his excellency, Deputy President of the Republic, D D Mabuza, when he visited NCOP. When he spoke about the Premier of the Province ...[Interjections.] he said:

“When I meet the Premier of the Province, I feel much confident, because when I look at the Premier of the Western Cape, he is focussed ...” ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: You need to ...[Interjections.]

Mr I M SILEKU:

“... he is focused; he does not play politics.”

The SPEAKER: You need to wrap up, hon member.

Mr I M SILEKU: And that is the kind of leadership that we need in Local Government. [Applause.]

We do not need leaders; we do not need leaders [Applause.] ...

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat. Thank you. Hon members - please take your seat, hon member Sileku. I recognise hon member Kama. Hon member Kama, what is your point of order, Sir?

An HON MEMBER: Nobody wants to [Inaudible.].

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, †Somlomo [Speaker]. I rise on Rule 59. [Interjections.] We were [Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: Please do not intimidate the hon member.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Kama, please proceed.

Mr M KAMA: The hon member, Mr Speaker, said that hon member Gillion left the municipality broke.

An HON MEMBER: Speaker ...

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M KAMA: That casting aspersion is exactly [Interjections.] ...  
Mr Speaker, it is exactly ... Mr Speaker, I do not know [Interjections.], I do not know whether ...[Interjections.]

†n AGB LID: Weet julle is klaar.

[An HON MEMBER: Know you are finished.]

Mr M KAMA: That is exactly, Mr Speaker, as saying the MEC is at the centre of chaos in municipalities.

An HON MEMBER: Yes. [Interjections.]



Mr M KAMA: Because he presides over the municipalities.

An HON MEMBER: Yes. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: Now he presides over the municipalities; now when you say he is at the centre, it is the same as saying a mayor has left the municipality broke. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Thank you, *baba*.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you, hon member Kama ...[Interjections.]

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Speaker, can I rise on a point of order?

The SPEAKER: Yes, hon member Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Can I ask you to ask your member that side not to point fingers at me while another member is raising a point of order [Interjections.] and the issue here is, Mr Speaker, history has no blank pages.

Mr J J LONDT: Just blank cheques.

Ms M N GILLION: No, history has no blank pages. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you, hon member Gillion. I would like to

ask the hon members [Interjections.] ... when you rise on a point of order, let us not rise on a point of debate, because there is a thin line, but the point of order that has been raised by hon member Kama on hon member Sileku, just be circumspect of the Rule 59. It is very important as we proceed here.

What is the exact point that you want the hon member to withdraw, hon member Kama?

An HON MEMBER: His finger. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: The point that it is hon member Gillion who left the municipality broke ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Bankrupt.

Mr M KAMA: ... because it implies that it is her who stole the money. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: She was the mayor. [Interjections.]

Mr J J LONDT: Are you saying she stole the money?

An HON MEMBER: She was the mayor.

The SPEAKER: I will consult my clever people and make a decision shortly.

[Interjections.] Because this is a matter of Rules, so I am going to rule before we adjourn the debate now, ja. [Interjections.]

May I please request that hon member Sileku proceed? Circumspect of the Rule 59.

Mr I M SILEKU: Ja, I am done. Like I was saying, the ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: You only have ...[Interjections.]

Mr I M SILEKU: ... excellent Deputy President ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: You only have 10 seconds.

Mr I M SILEKU: ... of the Republic said the Western Cape Premier is the best appointment, he is alright. [Interjections.]

This is the type of leadership that is needed. Not leaders that use municipalities as a tool to fight back when they have lost elections [Interjections.] during conferences, like the ANC does in North West; which is burning today. Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Sileku. [Applause.]

†'n AGB LID: Hier was die kole. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: Here were the coals. [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I recognise hon member De Jager.

Mr I DE JAGER: Mr Speaker, hon members, †salaam alaikum [peace be upon you] to each and every one, and to the guests in the gallery.

The South African Constitution states that the municipalities have the responsibility to make sure that all citizens are provided with services to satisfy their basic needs.

This part of services delivery is slow and no delivery has been done. Example: the rural areas in Swartland, namely Chatsworth and surrounding areas, has no roads, sanitation, infrastructure, no proper schooling and the high crime risk can go on and it can go on, and the Kalbaskraal housing issues, among other issues as well.

Mr Speaker, I have been listening to all the other members here today and it is a sad point when we go out to the areas and we see the conditions of the areas, and we are gunning one another here ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hey.

Mr I DE JAGER: ... on these issues, where we are supposed to go out and make the decisions and to repair these provinces or areas outside there.

I do not know why they take the oath here and they go on like this; gunning, taking the blame-game. This one blaming that one; that one blaming that one. Here, we are all here as one to repair and to make right whatever has been done wrong.

So I ask the hon members here to stop playing the blame-game; whether it is ANC, whether it is DA, whether it is who, but we are here as one to rectify whatever was wrong outside. I thank you. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member De Jager. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon members. I now recognise the Leader of the Official Opposition.

An HON MEMBER: Yes. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: Thank you. Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, all of us were in this Chamber, or most of us, on 16 September, and I want to refer hon members to the overview of the state of municipalities in the Western Cape, because what we have heard today, Mr Speaker, is comments around the two municipalities that we visited: Bitou as well as Mossel Bay.

Now when you look at the back of this document you will see there is a governance index where they actually list the capacity to deliver services

within the prescribed legislative framework and they mention here that seven Western Cape municipalities are in the national top 10.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: And I want to mention that Bitou in fact is number 5 in South Africa, and the hon members have been comparing Mossel Bay to Bitou, and in the Provincial Government's own survey, which they cite, in fact Mossel Bay is two worse than number 5; it is only at number 7.

An HON MEMBER: That is number 1.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: So here we have a situation where effectively, as hon member Gillion said, unfortunately a very important visit by the NCOP, because all of us would agree [Interjections.] that we have to focus on how we support Local Government.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: There are problems, but the challenge is that when the NCOP has a political agenda to specifically arrive and to only attack one particular municipality when they actually ignore what we were given here, that Bitou is number 5 and Mossel Bay is number 7.

So how do you reconcile what you are saying in this Chamber with the report of this Provincial Government's own department which cites that Bitou is in fact ahead of Mossel Bay in terms of its ability [Interjections.] to deliver services?

So I think, Mr Speaker, it is absolutely critical that we become objective, but maybe, Mr Speaker, the issue is that the colleagues on the other side of the House are particularly defensive today, because when you look at what happened yesterday, it is actually a tremendously ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Shocking.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: ... serious body blow ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: ... that has been delivered to the Democratic Alliance when it comes to Local Government. Do you know that in Buffalo City, for instance, the DA support dropped by 2%? Do you know that in Potchefstroom, Mr Speaker, the DA support dropped by 27% [Interjections.], and they in fact lost a ward to the Freedom Front? Do you know that here in Saldanha ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Sure.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... the DA lost 28% of their support in Saldanha mainly amongst Coloured voters?

An HON MEMBER: Unbelievable.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: And do you know that in the Cederberg [Interjections.] not only did the DA lose 21% of their support, but they lost that ward to the ANC.

So I think the problem that we are having here today is despite the fact that we want to be objective, the DA has not recovered from the body blow which was delivered yesterday ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes! [Applause.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... which indicates that their chances in 2021 [Interjections.] are being affected because of what voters actually feel about how you are governing [Interjections.], and I think we must, we must remember that, but clearly we also need to be serious about this debate, because the Constitution says very clearly that our local governments have got absolutely critical roles to play, and in our constituencies we have to make sure that services are being provided in a sustainable manner; that socio- and economic development is promoted; that we do get our local governments to work hard to provide a safe and healthy environment, and we must involve our communities and, Mr Speaker, one of



the concerns which I would like to raise with the NCOP members, is that when we visit municipalities one of the critical constitutional mandates is the involvement of community.

So we cannot go to a community and only meet with councillors; we have to meet with the ward committees; we actually have to meet with the beneficiaries of housing developments so that we actually get a better sense of what is going on [Interjections.], but what was very important in the NCOP briefing document - we want to thank our colleagues for that - amongst the key challenges which are mentioned as facing local government, are also, besides the lack of effective support and capacity of finance, there are two important issues that are mentioned as challenges. One is the inappropriate interventions ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... and also the absence of [Inaudible.] cooperative governance as required.

Now when we went to Bitou we had a situation where the Mayor, for instance, told us that he had worked very closely with the former MEC for Housing; where there was an agreed programme of action to deliver housing over a medium-term, but what had happened since MEC Madikizela had been replaced by MEC Simmers, there had not been a single engagement with the municipality to look at [Interjections.] the overall housing layout plan.

So what we have is one MEC ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Exactly.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: ... in fact undermining cooperative governance which had been built up in terms of a programme to deliver housing across the whole of Bitou, and instead what we have is an MEC, and it is hon MEC Simmers, Premier Winde, who has actually gone to individual communities there without once having actually met with the municipality and that is a fundamental problem. [Interjections.]

If we are trying to build cooperative governance, and I hope that SALGA ...[Interjections.]

Mr D G MITCHELL: We went to the community.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: ... will take note of this and that SALGA will be consistent and actually in our report indicate very clearly ...[Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: Make up your mind [Inaudible.].

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: ... that just as Mossel Bay Municipality - which happens to be under DA control and Bitou happens to be under coalition - that should not mean that any MEC can treat that

municipality with disdain, and in fact undermine ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: ... a programme of work that had been agreed to by a predecessor. That creates chaos and that is not a recipe for cooperative governance.

So I think it is important that when we ask MEC Bredell for him to not be inappropriate in his interventions, and to also make sure that he builds cooperative governance. I think the question that MEC Bredell needs to answer today to this House is how can it be when a municipal manager, following his responsibility, reports that a Maco member in George has in fact, has a situation where he has not declared that his son was involved in a R300 million investment in Old Mutual, of which his son is benefiting, why in that particular instance - and I am not, apparently not allowed to allege bias and I am not alleging bias, because apparently that is casting aspersions - but the MEC owes this House an explanation. Why was that councillor not actually dealt with when it is clear that he did not declare that his son was in fact the broker which scored the commission out of this particular deal [Interjections.], and it is that kind of lack of cooperative governance and fairness and consistency, which impacts on the quality of Local Government, and I think we need to - and once again hon member Danville Smith has reported that, "Yes, we acknowledge that the MEC did write back to the Cederberg Municipality and said ..." ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: You need to wrap up, hon member.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: ... “... that the Mayor had not conducted himself properly,” but why did you not act to suspend the Mayor for that kind of activity? [Interjections.]

So what we are asking for, let us take Local Government seriously, let us be consistent in the way that we deal with these ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: ... and Premier Winde, we are asking [Interjections.] Premier Winde ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: ... to ask MEC Simmers to show ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Your time is up, hon member Dugmore ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICAL OPPOSITION: ... Bitou respect and actually meet with the municipality. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: ... thank you very much. [Applause.] [Interjections.] Thank you, thank you, hon members, thank you hon the Leader of the Opposition.

[Interjections.]

Hon members [Interjections.] ... Minister, will you please take your seat?

Hon members, I can see that there is appetite to even cross the floor.

[Interjections.] But let us please not do so now; not at this stage, it is too early for that.

Hon member Londt, what is your point of order, sir?

Mr J J LONDT: Mr Speaker, I just want to find out, are members of the NCOP allowed to ask questions to the members in this House as well?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you are.

Mr J J LONDT: So I just want to ask if the hon Minister Bredell is willing to take a question? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Bredell? Hon Minister Bredell says yes, hon member Londt. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Mr Speaker, question.

Mr J J LONDT: Minister Bredell, do you think the fact that hon member Dugmore has not been in government for more than 10 years, is the reason why he does not know how Local Government works? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Bredell? [Interjections.] Hon Minister Bredell, I recognise you. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker, thank you very much. Thank you to everybody ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members! Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you to everybody who participated within this debate. I am very tempted to start to answer all, but I am going to stick first of all to the speech I prepared ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... because I really think that it is important that we do get to some facts.

I have asked the NCOP when they left here, that they go with an open mind, not an empty one, and really come back with some gist to their visit so that we can use this to build a better future for our people in this province.

Mr Speaker, upon reflection I ask myself the question: why do governments

exist and function the way they do? The simple answer I could come up with was we are here to serve and to protect the interests of the people who have elected us to be in this House here today.

I can state that my Department want all municipalities - it does not matter which political party is in control - all Western Cape municipalities to be successful, to be the top 30 municipalities in this country, and we will always keep on supporting our municipalities to reach that goal.

By improving the lives of citizens remain centre to the existence and the purpose of Local Government. The problems that are facing our society today is poverty, unemployment and inequalities.

Mr Speaker, I believe that we must build a sustainable, responsive and people-centred Local Government. Local Government is the sphere of government closest to the people. This is where the need for service delivery, both visible and immediately expected by our residents.

It is therefore important that if we are to address the challenges facing our society, we must [Inaudible.] in creating an enabling environment wherein municipalities are able to deliver on their mandate. We need a transformative Local Government that acts as an agent of change, which ensures acceleration of service delivery.

Hon members, a sustainable, responsible, people-centred Local Government

is municipalities that:

1. Actively respond to the needs of our citizens.
2. Engage and involve its citizens on the choices and decisions it makes in addressing their needs; and
3. Can balance the responsibility to deliver services against its ability to remain viable, and that is crucial.

Mr Speaker, municipalities therefore focuses on two distinct yet interconnected aspects which are both required in unison to ensure success. These aspects are internally and externally to a municipality.

The internal factors focus on the optimal utilisation of resources so that it can respond positively to the external environment and provide services to the communities. The reality is that the country is currently facing an economic downturn.

We have also got huge corruption within our country. We spend millions and millions of rand on Zondo Commissions, and yet no outcome. That money could have been spent on service delivery. We could have built schools; housing opportunities; create health opportunities for our people.

[Interjections.]

This is evident when you look at the number of households requiring assistance in terms of indigent subsidies which increase year on year. The



main focus of my Department is to assist municipalities to build their own capacity so that they are strengthened internally to be in a position to attract investors and to respond to the needs of the communities that they serve.

Mr Speaker, through various programmes my Department is focussing on building the capacity of municipalities for sustainability. The following are some of the examples:

- Implementation of a municipal specific support programme that focuses on the most vulnerable municipalities within this province; and to address the needs in terms of five key focus areas. This includes:
  - Good governance;
  - Service delivery;
  - Institutional capacity;
  - The need of communities; as well as
  - Financial sustainability of municipalities.

To date four have successfully exited this programme and of which three have recently received clean audits.

- Building capacity of both councillors and officials through training, mentoring and coaching opportunities.
- Training of our ward committees.
- Training of the impact members to improve oversight to municipalities.

- Training on the code of conduct of municipalities.
- Training and equipping ward committee members

Are all aspects that we need to make Local Government work within this province.

Capacity building of municipalities also includes:

- A focus on the external environment with a focus on innovation and improving service delivery. This deals with how municipalities are conducting their business.
- Developing a client service charter is an aspect that I am very excited about and that I know that my Chairperson of Local Government will support me in, to make this a success.
- How to pull resources within a particular area or focus area through facilitating shared service opportunities, and encouraging municipalities to enter into internal municipal cooperation agreements.

And I think that is also an aspect that needs more attention and we work very hard to pull this off in this province.

- Establishing of a special vehicle to address water security in the Greater Karoo.

A responsive and people-centred municipality continues to find innovative

ways of involving communities on aspects which affect their lives. This means that such a municipality has to stay well-informed of the ever-changing environment.

Mr Speaker, my Department is currently looking at new and innovative measures to intensify and modernise the way in which we consult our communities and ensure that public participation reaches the intended impact, and this is also where I want to call on the Standing Committee to support us and to help us and to criticise us, because at the end of the day we owe it to the communities to interact and to get our communication channels vested within our municipalities.

The following are some of the people-centred initiatives:

- Using technology to facilitate the responsiveness of municipalities to the need of their communities through the rollout of a web-based application, named GovChat, which will be available to residents in this province. GovChat will be launched by the National President and therefore some of the members will see that we have parked our initiative, because when the President announces GovChat, we want to put our resources and see if we can be the first province to pull that off. [Interjections.] We think we owe it to our people, and we are very excited that people can directly communicate with their municipalities.

We all need to understand that that will put enormous pressure on the back

office within municipalities and this Department will play a crucial role in trying to get that back office ready and up and running.

- Assisted municipalities with standardised websites which will facilitate ease of navigation for communities that are searching for information on a municipality.
- Roll-out of the Tuscon concept whereby a central facility within a municipal area is identified and designed to bring Government services closer to the community that they serve.

I am pleased to announce that during the Tuscon Service Excellence Award on 17 September, celebrating the 20 year anniversary since its start in 1999. The Department of Local Government in the Western Cape was the overall winner in two categories. The two categories are for the most outstanding province in Tuscon coordination, as well as the outstanding mobile Tuscon at provincial level, and I want to take this opportunity to congratulate my team. I think I have done brilliantly reaching 1.3 million citizens in this province.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Possibly the most challenging aspect is to maintain a balance between the financial sustainability of our municipalities, and affordability of services to communities.

In the next five years my Department will support municipalities with infrastructure development and asset care. These programmes are critical to service delivery as they ensure that the lifespan of the assets is expanded to ensure value for money.

In addition, my Department has embarked on a number of research projects so that we are in a better position to guide and to advise municipalities on a number of aspects; research on the following areas is being undertaken:

- Comparisons and trend analysis of service charges and tariffs charges by all municipalities.
- Comparison and trend analysis of poverty rate charges across the province.
- Research and trend analysis of a basket of services available to all our citizens.

And there I can also ask and call on this House when there is anybody knowing of bucket toilets, bring it to our attention, because we all in this House agree that people deserve better. We need to eradicate buckets and let us not make it a political thing in this House; let us bring the facts; let us go out there and let us fix the problem and my Department is committed to that.  
[Interjections.]

Mr Speaker, I cannot over-emphasise the need for a more pragmatic and proactive approach to manage the internal government systems to ensure

alignment between responsibility and capacity.

This is possible if all spheres of government work together in a coordinated manner. This is why my Department will be launching the joint District Metro Approach, which is a geographically district and team-based citizen-focused approach to provide Government services. This approach seeks to foster co-planning, co-budgeting and co-implementation; which translate into service delivery in communities.

Chairperson, to touch on one or two for the hon members, and I want to thank all my DA colleagues for well-articulated speeches and for their preparation. I want to just make a statement on some of the issues. If you look at hon member Nkondlo saying that 20 of the richest municipalities are within the Western Cape - that is not true. It is 20 of the best financial managed municipalities is in the Western Cape [Interjections.].

If we look at clean audits, it is very important [Interjections.] - one member, I think it was the EFF member - mentioned that Bitou [Interjections.], the balance sheet, their books; I can tell you that we have implemented what they have called a Revenue Enhancement Programme in Bitou, I think that was around about 2011. Bitou was bankrupt when we took over in 2011. They owed something like R60 million. [Interjections.] They were bankrupt. We then found a complete mess within Bitou. We ran this Revenue Enhancement Programme, it was a fantastic programme. [Inaudible.] R87 million and you must remember this year-on-year ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, you need to wrap up.

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING:: ... so we have done that and lastly I want to thank my colleagues for participating within this debate but I also just need to end off my mentioning to colleague Marais †dat skoon oudit en ongekwalifiseerde oudit is op teiken want skoon oudit word die *target* ook altyd voor geskuif, ons het altyd gesê dit is ons groepering, dit is wanneer jy goed doen, en die skoon en ongekwalifiseerde kategorie is 25 van die 30 munisipaliteite in die Wes-Kaap. Ons is baie trots daarop, en die vyf wat nie daarin is nie, is almal ANC-beheerd. Baie dankie.[Applous.] [that clean and unqualified audit are on target, because for clean audit the target is always shifted, we have always said, this is our grouping, that is when you do well, and the clean and unqualified category applies to 25 out of the 30 municipalities in the Western Cape. We are very proud of that, and the five that are not in there are all ANC-controlled. Thank you. [Applause.]]

The SPEAKER:. Thank you, hon Minister. [Interjections.] Hon members, order. I would like to make a ruling on the point of order raised by hon Kama. As I make the ruling hon members must be reminded of my earlier ruling that I made on hon Gillion on the statements she made against hon Simmers. It is no strange incident because if you look at what the Rule says, which is Rule 59, I will just read the Rule so that members understand what the Rule specifics are actually detailing in so far as this point I am raising here now.

Rule 59 (1) (a)(b)(c) is that no member may impugn improper motives or reflect on the integrity or dignity of a member or verbally abuse the member.

So what this basically says is that you may not cast aspersions on the integrity of a member or impugn the dignity of the member in such a way that you border on improperly alleging that the member may or may not have committed such an incident or an act.

So in this way the same ruling that I made in so far as hon Gillion is concerned applies in this case. So I would like to request that hon Sileku, you withdraw that specific reference to hon Gillion, not your statement but the reference to the member violates this specific Rule and therefore you are out of order. Hon member Sileku?

Mr I SILEKU: Somlomo, I am not going to do what hon Minister Lindiwe Zulu did in the National Assembly yesterday. [Interjections.]. I withdraw.

The SPEAKER: Alright. We do not know what she did, but thank you hon Sileku. Hon Sileku has withdrawn. Is that the case? Now if that is the case, this matter is now closed and also this concludes the debate but now we are going straight to Interpellations.

I am sure that members of the House will move. If you wish to release yourselves, you are free to do so NCOP. Thank you very much for your



presence here. This is a [Inaudible.] that we need to have when participate here and we will do this more often. Thank you very much. And thank you, SALGA. You may remain, it is up to you, but thank you very much.

We now move on to Interpellations, hon member Christians to hon Madikizela, the Minister of Transport and Public Works. I recognise the Minister.

### **INTERPELLATIONS:**

#### *Metrorail: strategy*

#### **1. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

Whether a strategy to ensure that Metrorail provides a safe, affordable, reliable and efficient transport service to commuters has been discussed by the relevant stakeholders?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. Let me thank hon member Christian for asking the question which is a very important question. It is very important because Mr Speaker, it impacts the residents of the Western Cape and also has a huge impact in our economy as the province. In order for us to achieve this, I think it is important, Mr Speaker, just to remind this House of the mandates of the Department of Transport and Public Works as far as this is

concerned and also the mandate of the National Department. And, Mr Speaker, I do want emphasise, I think it is one of the very first issues that myself and Minister Mbalula spoke about because for us to be able to fix this, hon member Christians, through you, Mr Speaker, I cannot emphasise enough the importance of inter-governmental relations and co-operative governance.

That is a commitment that we have made, myself, the leadership of PRASA and the Minister in order for us to be able to deal with the challenges here because my role really is very limited as the Provincial Minister. We all know that PRASA, as an entity, owns this infrastructure and also the rolling of the stock is also the responsibility of PRASA, which means then that we will need that working relationship between PRASA and myself.

The limited role that I can play of course, is to make sure that we work in partnership with PRASA and the Department to make sure that the safety aspect is dealt with in our trains because we do know that if you were to categorise the challenges that are faced by Metrorail, in particular, in that we are dealing with ageing infrastructure, which is again the role of the National Department and PRASA to deal with; we are grappling with the management of PRASA, which is again an issue that we raise very sharply.

We had a very constructive engagement yesterday with Dr Sishi, who is the head of PRASA. And in fact one of the very first things I said is that I do not think there is anything bad that I have not heard about PRASA so it is

not going to help me to dwell on everything that is bad about PRASA. I said to the PRASA management and to the National Minister what I want us to focus on is how do we fix the challenges that are facing PRASA? How do we partner meaningfully so that we can address the challenges that are faced by our passengers in the Western Cape?

I do want to say that the positive news is that all major stakeholders have developed strategies to address at least some of the major shortcomings and in brief these are: the Department of Transport, nationally, is finalising the National Rail Strategy in conjunction with the World Bank. This includes crucially taking a position on rail devolution because you will remember, just putting politics aside, that there was a call for rail function to be devolved and in fact that call was also amplified by the Premier of Gauteng and the Minister is applying his mind to this issue and of course we are dealing with it constructively and maturely as the leadership. The Department of Transport has also published a draft rail White Paper. PRASA is implementing a rescue plan in which it acknowledges the current low levels of service and growing customer dissatisfaction and it plans to do the following ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister, will you please finish off. I recognise the hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Thank you, hon Minister for that. I wanted to ask the Minister: there is a promise that they will

build a provincial rail service, so how far are they with that? But more seriously, people are losing their lives and people's lives are in danger when they enter the train. I have got the figures here. In 2018, 495 people lost their lives on the trains and 2079 were injured.

Now we know that the trains are a cheap way of commuting to work but people are too scared to use this train service. So the Minister has said – because I know the responsibility of the national, provincial and local – they have these rail enforcements units where they work together and I heard that they are extending the contract but it seems to me that it is not paying dividends because of all these injuries, all these fatalities that we have on the rail line.

I just heard, not so long ago, on the South rail line, four gunmen entered the carriage and people had to jump. So we must look after the safety and I think the Province can play an important role when it comes to the rail enforcement unit. So what is the Minister doing because safety is a problem when our people get on the trains and a lot of our females need to go early in the morning and late at night. So, hon Minister this is a really serious issue and I want you to really unpack for us how can we go out to our communities and say use the trains, because we also know the trains are underutilised because people are using other modes of transport so they are not even utilised.

We also know about cable theft and all of that. Metrorail is unreliable,

people do not get to work on time, services are cut but I think the integral part is the safety of the commuters, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians. I recognise hon Mitchell.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Mr Speaker and thank you to the Minister. Hon Speaker, according to a reply to a parliamentary question, only 34,4% of the PRASA-run train stations in the Western Cape have at least one CCTV camera. Now given that a Memorandum of Agreement has just been signed between the City of Cape Town, the Provincial Department of Transport and Public Works as well as PRASA, to extend the deployment of the Provincial Rail Enforcement Unit, how will the lack of CCTV cameras in train stations affect safety on the trains in the Western Cape and can the Minister provide any further details on the issue and how he would address this? Thank, you hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mitchell. Is that a point of order hon Marais?

Mr P J MARAIS: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Alright because we are dealing with interpellations.

Mr P J MARAIS: Oh.

The SPEAKER: It is only for the designated speakers but on the questions later, let us pray that there is one on this subject. Alright, thank you hon member. Hon member Herron?

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Let me start by welcoming the extension of the Rail Enforcement Unit that was announced yesterday. There was a lot of time and work that went into getting that unit set up. Hon Speaker, the DA manifesto of 2016, Local Government manifesto and the 2019 Election manifesto, both advocate for the rail function to be devolved to metropolitan governments or to cities and I think this is the correct approach if we want to have one integrated public transport network for commuters to move around towns and cities easily.

But despite the content of the 2016 and 2019 DA manifestos, in the City of Cape Town during the election campaign, we had posters promising a provincial rail service. We also have the City recently announcing that it is procuring a business plan for devolution of rail to the city and we have the Western Cape Provincial Government talking about, even as recently as this morning, the rail function being devolved to the Province. So we have these conflicting positions within the DA around the future of rail. We have the Provincial Government talking directly to private companies about operating a private service on the rail network, so I would really appreciate if the Minister, who is also the leader of the DA in the province, if he could clarify what the DA's vision is for rail and why there are these contradictions and does the DA want to operate Metrorail as the

operator or is it looking to have the rail network devolved to itself or to the City? I would submit to this House that seeking the devolution of the rail function in the form of Metrorail's operations would be an absolute disaster for whoever took it on. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Herron. I now recognise hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. The topic talks about relevant stakeholders and most of the time we like to take the stakeholders to be either PRASA, the Government, Provincial Government or the City. Very rarely do we also regard the commuters as critical stakeholders and I just – because I believe strongly in public participation and in a participatory democracy and you can only do that if you involve the critical stakeholders, who are the customers.

I know the hon Speaker cut you off just as you were about to talk about customer satisfaction but I would like to know to what extent do you really involve the commuters on the issues of rail. And also then just to be specific because I know there are other organs of civil society that are actively campaigning for safer rail commuting, like the United Commuter Voice, there might be others; I just want to know to what extent are they involved in this thing? Also, with regard to the issue of ageing infrastructure, have you got some way of quantifying this so that you know what the figures involved are? If you are saying that the infrastructure is

ageing, how much is it going to cost to actually repair or to service the ageing infrastructure? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: †Ndyibulela, enkosi [I thank you.] I now recognise hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Just to carry on where I left off, I just also want to emphasise what hon Mitchell said and as we read there are 122 stations and only 42 have CCTV cameras. Is the Department looking at that, and we are talking again about safety, rolling those things out, rolling the safety of our people out?

Another problem when speaking to communities if trains do not show up, they can use alternative transport, the buses, unless there is an arrangement. Now we know that the people that use trains are poor and they have limited funds when it comes to public transport and people – and I have got a lot of reading here – but the one thing is 27 passenger trains were cancelled on one day because of cable theft, then people must look at alternative modes of transport and yet I cannot use my weekly or my monthly ticket to get on a bus unless there is a prior agreement.

So can the Minister say, what is the thinking around that and how can we assist the people because people want to get to their work on time and sometimes these things happen over the weekend. Another important thing is that we also know that the sets, the units are vandalised on a continuous



basis and that talks again about, you are facing ageing infrastructure but you also have vandals when it comes to trains, arson and all of that. Does the Minister know, is there intelligence to show us who are the culprits behind these things? I heard a discussion the other day saying it could be the taxi industry because then they have more commuters and did they do an in-depth study in order to bring these perpetrators to book? I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians. I recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Firstly to hon member Christians, the impact of the Rail Enforcement Unit is really working. Looking at the last operation in terms of the contract that we are now renewing, it really has reduced some of the crime of cable theft significantly but I think part of what we agreed to do now is to change the modus operandi in two ways.

One, is to make sure that there is an investigative capacity, again within the REU, because as you know that is where we are facing some challenges, but also to make sure that in terms of the problematic routes and lines, we change the modus operandi and make sure that we have more law enforcement agencies on those trains, rather than them waiting somewhere. I think on the issue of CCTV cameras, which was also raised by member Mitchell, the accurate figure is actually 25% of those that are

not working. Out of about 8000 CCTV cameras it is about 2000 that are not working and I think PRASA is dealing with that.

Another good thing that has been done by PRASA in line with the call by the National Minister to have a “war room” to relook at all the challenges. There is a “war room” again that has been set right here in Cape Town and I will be visiting that “war room” on Monday so that we have closer co-operation in terms of dealing with these issues.

To hon member Herron, I think I partly agree with you member Herron, because you are quite right, there is a discussion currently as to where should the responsibility be if we are to talk about devolution, where should the responsibility be? We must appreciate that when we talk about rail transport it cuts across the province, it is not just a mode of transport that is used by Metro and we are having those discussions because it must be placed where it will service the entire province instead of just devolving it to the Municipality. So it is part of the conversations that we are continuing to have.

In terms of the stakeholders, hon member Mvimbi, a customer satisfaction survey was done to interact with the commuters. If you look at the challenges that we are facing in rail transport, in particular, most of the comments are coming from the commuters themselves and that is why the interventions that we are now coming up with are based on the views that are coming from the commuters themselves around the issues of safety,

around the issues of aging infrastructure and the stock.

In fact where we are now, we should have about 88 trains. We are sitting at 57 because of the vandalism and arson that has taken place. But, there is a very clear commitment, I think before the end of this year, to increase the number of trains. We are looking at between 63 and 65 but ultimately we want to end at 88 because that is what we need to operate at full capacity.

In terms of the issue that was raised again by yourself, the impact of the REU in terms of the safety ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, I am afraid I will have to do the same thing. Please wrap up.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The last thing I want to say is that I was actually criticising PRASA yesterday for under-reporting on the successes because we always focus on what is bad but they were telling me yesterday that the convictions of people involved in arson is over 200 years in prison already. So it is something that I was criticising them for, that we need to improve on, to communicate. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members that concludes this interpellation. The next interpellation was put forward by hon Xego to

Minister Fritz, the Minister of Community Safety. In the absence of hon Xego, hon Makamba-Botya will participate instead. I recognise the hon Minister.

*Police stations: rape kits*

**2. Mr M Xego asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

Whether all the police stations in the province are equipped with sufficient rape kits?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I must just indicate that this answer was provided to me by the police and I will bring my oversight role in the answer. I just want to state that up front. Thank you for the question from the EFF.

According to the police, the majority of police stations in the Western Cape currently have rape kits available. These kits are either at police stations or at the family violence or child protection and sexual offenses units, called FCS Units, located throughout the province. These FCS units are end-users of these kits as sexual offences fall within their primary mandate. There are very specialised, trained people in those units. In Beaufort West for instance, they must travel down to the other parts or in Oudtshoorn they must come over the mountain.

The Department of Community Safety will however, during the period

October 2019 to December 2019, as part of our response to the gender based violence campaign, be conducting and monitoring and embarking on a project in respect of the implementation of the Forensic Procedures Act. This will include verifying the availability of rape kits. The monitoring project was designed in collaboration with the National Secretariat of Police and will focus on a random sample of 21 police stations which were selected from those priority stations.

There is a list of the 21 police stations but I do not want to read the names because I think one wants to have an element of surprise and the whole issue of making it unannounced is so that you do not announce it before the time. But there are a whole lot of them from the Metro police stations right up the West Coast, right up the East Coast, in the Cape Winelands region, right in the Eden region. All of those regions are included in this list of 21 stations that we are going to tackle and make sure that the Act is implemented.

The overarching issue is that the women and children of our province are not safeguarded by our criminal justice system and that is what we want to make sure of – I think we need to play that role, make sure that our women and children are safeguarded by the criminal justice system. This has been highlighted time and time again by media reports and events in court and of course, it was again brought out by the recent crime stats that we have just seen. The prevalence of gender-based violence and the femicide in our country has reached preposterous levels, very bad levels and I think the

President spoke about it yesterday.

It is now the new thing. I have said for years – when I was in Social Development – that we cannot have 16 Days of Activism, it must be the whole year long and I still say that and I think we must launch it again tomorrow on Table Mountain. It is unacceptable that women and children should feel unsafe, for instance, just doing a normal thing like going to the shop or going to school or going anywhere. There is now a new kind of thing – and it is a form of really targeting women – it is a form of gender based violence, they are now stealing women's hair, they grab the hair of women and it is quite a hectic situation.

Mr Speaker we believe that the Premier's safety strategy that was launched this morning will also go a long way in addressing some of the gender based violence issues, specifically as they relate to the issues of collaborative co-operation and collaborative approach with all our other departments ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Will you please wrap up hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... for instance Social Development, Sports and Culture etc. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. I recognise hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, †Somlomo. [Speaker.] Through you, †Somlomo. [Speaker.] It is unacceptable for the Minister to tell this House that there are some police stations that do not have these rape kits, seeing that rape is the most common assault in the Western Cape. I think it is high time you give us the timelines on the process and how you intend to actually provide police stations with these kits because these are the things that actually delay the processes in handling these cases.

You highlighted a list of police stations where you have provided these devices, however, one of the police stations that has been struggling is the Kraaifontein police station. It is one of the police stations that has been affected by shortages of these rape kits in the past. Even this day, 19 September, that police station is still without these kits of its own. The police station further confirmed today that it does not even have the buccal swabs that are used to take DNA samples of the perpetrators of these rape crimes. This means even if they have rape kits available the police station will still struggle to match the DNA found on the victim of the crime against that of the alleged perpetrator of the crime, of the rape.

All of this continues to happen at a time where such crimes as rape and abuse against women has intensified in this country. So we appeal to you hon Minister, to give us timelines. When are you intending to provide these kits for these police stations? It is a primary need, it is needed and it is very crucial. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Makamba-Botya. I recognise hon member Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you, hon Speaker. We understand that without the rape kits that evidence from rape cases cannot be collected and without evidence the ability to successfully prosecute diminishes. Rape is evil personified and it is heinous in nature and we need to understand how that is linked to under-resourcing in this province. It tells us that we do not really require boots on the ground but it also requires us to have the tools required to have effective boots on the ground who can actually tackle crime and the cases of gender based violence, coupled with rape. To bring about those convictions we need all these tools including the rape kits.

SAPS reported in August of this year that they have averted this potential crisis by signing a procurement contract to supplement evidence collection kits to use in rape cases. But as we heard now that this is still not the case and some SAP stations are still without them. I wish to commend the Minister for the proactive steps that he is taking in this regard and I would urge him to keep this House informed but also to exercise the oversight with regard to the rape kits especially.

We are literally bleeding in terms of policing resources but like I said and to reiterate, we need the manpower, we need the HR supplementation because if you have a rape kit but you do not even have the officers in order to conduct those investigations, then we could be going down a road



where we left many people who have faced heinous crimes are let down. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Allen. I recognise hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Let me start by thanking the Minister for responding so promptly to my letter on Monday. I think I copied you in as well Mr Speaker but you have not responded or acknowledged my letter yet but I will wait patiently, a little more.

Mr Speaker, I wrote to the Minister about the tragic story that was reported in the *Sunday Times* on Sunday of a Khayelitsha mother who was prevented from reporting an alleged rape of her three-year-old daughter for four days after she was sent from one police station to the other, from pillar to post quite literally in trying to report this alleged rape of her daughter. Even when she ultimately got to reporting the rape, the police thought it was fit to bring the perpetrator to the mother's house and to accuse the mother of falsely accusing the perpetrator.

So last week when we debated gender based violence in this House, I asked the Minister to consider how women are treated when they approach our police stations in the province to report violence and sexual assault and whether our police stations are in fact environments in which they can do so in a dignified and proper manner. I wrote to the Minister asking him, as a follow-up to my request, that he conducts audits of the police stations in

the Western Cape to understand how women are being treated when they try and report gender based violence or sexual assault and I welcome the Minister's response that he is intending or will be conducting an audit.

So over and above the presence of rape kits at police stations I would like to understand from the Minister how he intends to conduct these audits so that we get a proper understanding of the experience that women have when they approach the police stations in our province for assistance. Thank, you Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Herron. I am glad the Minister has responded – I would have sent it to him. Thank you very much. There is only one Minister but we will talk about specifics, not just the letter itself. I recognise hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Speaker. I think I must from the onset say, we are always saying how we are going to respond to the challenges we have in society determined by [Inaudible.] but hon Speaker, I must say I am disappointed with the response because we have this and it happens in many cases. It might not be the Provincial Government, it might be other people at times, we only investigate after the fact. Now the reality is that, if you listened to the President yesterday, the debate, which I do not think the Premier did listen to judging from his response. [Interjection.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: He acted, the Premier acted.

Mr M KAMA: I don't think – but what I am trying to say, hon Speaker, is that if you listened to the President, there is an acknowledgement already that there are police stations that do not have rape kits and ...  
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Of course!

Mr M KAMA: ... that is a problem.

The PREMIER: And whose job is it to make sure they get them?

Mr M KAMA: Yes, that is a problem. The attitude we are talking about. They would want to investigate while they were asking who has that responsibility. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Take responsibility.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, please let us allow the hon member to proceed. You only have two minutes, so what is left now is less than a minute, so please proceed hon member.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Speaker. What I want to say is that oversight is not only meant for us to go and investigate, see if business is implemented or not, but we have a responsibility to provide solutions to the challenges that are there.

So an exercise that we must be engaged in is how do we make sure because the problem is not only rape kits being at police stations, the problem is also do we have the personnel to ensure that proper evidence is collected so that when presented in our justice system we are able to respond. So my question would be: in part of this investigation which the Minister will conduct ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Please put the question hon member.

Mr M KAMA: ... what is it that we are going to do to ensure that we support the work of the police stations ...

The SPEAKER: Thank you, your time is up.

Mr M KAMA: ... and also through other departments? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Kama. I now recognise hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Through you, hon Speaker, I just want to request that the Minister provides us with a list of the police stations that do not have these rape kits so that we are able to do an assessment on the number of cases that are pending or are delayed because of these kind of incidences. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Makamba-Botya. I now recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I just want to point out to the hon Makamba-Botya that I have never mentioned any of the police stations. I said in the answer – remember I said this is an answer from the police because we do not have control, we just do oversight but their answer was that most police stations have.

But what we want to now do, we want to take it a level further and I really want to welcome the hon Herron, hon Kama, hon Botya, the whole issue around when we do these visits to police stations, remember we visit every one every year but it is no use just to go and visit police stations and tick boxes. I think we must really look at what the situation is.

It is always good to get complaints that you can see Mrs X says she was badly treated so that we can investigate that specific situation and hold some people accountable at those police stations. And I want to say to this end, the role of the Ombudsman is a very important role because what they do is investigate very specific incidences and hold some police officers accountable. And I think hon Herron, as I listened to the debate now, apart from checking on kits and stuff, it is actually important to have that kind of interaction where we can get information around where people are treated badly because I think the point that you make and that hon Kama is making is are there also qualified officials who can deal with the way they

are treated.

I mean the hon Fernandez will tell you. She went to the Thuthuzela Centre and when there is a rape victim in the Thuthuzela Centre, if someone wants to go to the toilet the doctor must leave with – so that someone can use – it is unacceptable. That is at the hospital. I am saying at our police stations, we have those rooms – remember in places a Wendy house and other places a room inside and one of the other issues we want to look at – I think some people ask how or what are you actually going to look at? Do we have that victim support room and specifically as far as it pertains to children because you know children, they cannot handle the kind of roughness of a police station but that they actually get treated in that victim support room. I think we will have to do it and we have to do it properly.

Again we are even satisfied that in a cluster if you have one qualified specialist or a couple of specialist investigators with the kind of equipment in a cluster which is in close proximity, that if a rape case is reported to one of the police stations in the precinct that that group can then go there, the people do not need to wait forever but that the police station locally there knows how to deal with a person coming with a victim coming to lay the charge. And I think that should be the approach. I want to also say to – I will give you the list hon Makamba-Botya, I have the list here that we will target the 21 police stations - but I think we need to look at the broader way so that we can get a broader sense.

This is a very representative list but I think one must do it in a broader way and then one must go and target, specifically that the three-year-old and the mother the police station turned away and get answers so that we can come back to this House and report on those answers. For too long we are just complaining about the police and I do not want to point fingers because as all of us said let us get solutions. But we cannot just let people not be held accountable. I think that is the point we are making and we want to do it in a constructive way and when police officers know that there is oversight and that someone is going to come and check on them then they will respond to people in a far more responsible way, a far more humane way and then a far more accountable way in helping them.

So I want to thank those people, all the hon members who took part in the debate to say thank you so that we can move forward and again, if you have any – like the hon Herron, he wrote to us - if you have cases write to us, speak to us, engage with us so that we can solve the problem. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Thank you very much hon Minister. That concludes this interpellation. At this point I would like to request the hon members to join me in welcoming Ayabulela Lihla Kanjana who is sitting up there in the gallery. She is a young lady, ten years old. She has been at Red Cross for three years. She has been battling with leukaemia. She is now in Grade 4 and has been studying up to Grade 4 now while she is in the Red Cross. [Applause.] Ayebulela is a niece to hon

Ayanda Bans. Whilst she was sitting here she got cold and then she went to the fourth floor but she is back now and thank you for being strong Ayebulela. †Uqine ungavumi ukuba iLichimia okoyise uyaqonda, uyoyise sizokusebenza nathi sikuthandazise uyoyise. [Be strong. Do not allow Leukaemia to take over your strength do you understand? Be strong, be strong. We will work with you in prayer.]

†Wamkelekile, ungadinwa kumane usiza apha eParliament. [Welcome. Don't get tired of coming to this Parliament.] Thank you very much. Thank you hon members.

Now the next interpellation is the interpellation by hon Makamba-Botya to hon Minister Schäfer. I now recognise the Minister of Education.

*Race, culture and hair politics: schools*

**3. Ms N Makamba-Botya asked the Minister of Education:**

Whether her Department has measures in place to sensitise employees, teachers, school management members and learners about race, culture and hair politics?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much Speaker and welcome Ayebulela. You are a hero. Keep going on with your school work. Thank you very much to hon member Makamba-Botya for the



interpellation. The answer to your question is, yes, we have over the past few years. There have been various discussions, workshops, meetings and seminars on issues relating to race and culture.

This year we approached the Institute for Justice and Reconciliation to facilitate a two-day training course for circuit managers on diversity in schools. The focus of the training was to engage circuit managers in a critical conversation about the nature of diversity challenges in Western Cape schools and to equip them with the basic skills to manage these challenges as and when they arise.

The programme has been replicated to circuit managers at their circuit meetings to address the topic of diversity with principles, visual narrative exercises were taught, to train people to hear the stories of people around us and increase our understanding of one another. It enhances our empathy for them and allows us to identify commonalities that unite us and differences that make us richer as a community.

Another activity known as the 'privilege walk' forces workshop participants to confront the ways in which society privileges some individuals over others. It is designed to enable participants to reflect on the different areas in their lives where they have privilege as well as the areas where they do not. Other focus areas include stereotyping and how one simply generalises in one's mind, without engaging in actual dialogue and getting to know the person.

Diversity is addressed at meetings with principals. For example in Metro North, a director addressed issues such as race, culture, hair, uniforms, transgender issues, with 206 principals on this director's road show.

In Metro Central circuit managers had discussions with their school management teams advising how they can address issues focusing on diversity and social cohesion and engage with outside organisations, their staff and parents communities.

Another example is the Eden and Karoo District which just last month hosted a very successful seminar on diversity, in Geelhoutboom. 319 members of school management teams attended the sessions. The speakers unpacked issues such as cultural bias and how to ensure an inclusive ethos at one's school.

In 2011 the Department of Basic Education released guidelines that are intended to provide teachers, principals, subject advisers, administrators, school governors and other personnel, parameters and strategies on how to respond to learner diversity in the classrooms through the curriculum. They have also been developed to facilitate and support curriculum differentiation in the classroom.

Teachers have an important responsibility in making sure that all learners from whatever background feel included and affirmed in the classroom. The guidelines assist educators and staff who monitor our own beliefs,

attitudes and behaviours when responding to our learners. Some of the ways in which we do this are recognising biases as stereotypes we may have absorbed, treating each learner as an individual and respecting each learner for who he or she is, avoiding the use of language that is biased and undermines certain groups of learners, refraining from remarks that make assumptions about our learner's experiences, considering the unique needs of learners when designing learning programmes and lessons, constantly re-evaluating our methods for teaching and assessing learners in a diverse setting, considering different approaches, methodologies and strategies when teaching in our classroom and creating opportunities for all learners to participate in activities.

Every teacher needs to understand that the most significant way to respond to learner diversity in the classroom is through the curriculum. The NCS sets the content of what is to be taught but it is up to the teachers to plan how they will teach it to different learners in the classroom. One of the key strategies for responding to diversity is curriculum differentiation. These are just some of the examples of what we have been doing in this regard and will we continue to do so. Thank you.

*[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I see the hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Speaker. Thanks to the Minister for the response. I just want to highlight that it has become the norm, these racial issues amongst Western Cape schools are actually rife and are happening every day in the schools. I just want to know how often are these training sessions provided to the teachers and if that is the case, is it an ongoing process or is it a once-off thing that is happening? If that is the case, what mechanisms are in place to ensure they are compliant with this training. Is there a score-card actually highlighting that these kind of racial issues are being addressed and disclosed? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER: Thank you very much. Hon member Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. We are aware the school governing bodies in each school are responsible for the everyday management of the school and the SGBs must also decide on and carry out school policies that are suitable for the school including race, culture and hair politics.

I want to ask the Minister, in this particular case, has the code of conduct been communicated to parents and learners of the school via the SGB and at what time during the school year has that been communicated to parents and learners? Has this kind of issue happened in any other school within the WCED and how has the WCED or that school's governing body handled such a case and what was the outcome of the case, if there is another example? And how many schools ensure that parents and learners

understand the code of conduct?

I heard that the Minister say that, yes, the school governing bodies need to do it and they do it and that WC officials have workshops and all of that, but how is the communication conducted so that parents and learners understand the code and how they need to adhere to the code and the influences of the code on learners during their school year? Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Am I understanding that hon Kama is taking the place of hon Sayed? Yes.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Yesterday I shared the frustration of the good Premier when he was frustrated by talk shops and the irony is that he is not acting against these talk shops when they are happening in his Executive here. The ANC in the fifth administration called on the Minister to review the code of conduct of these schools to ensure that these happenings do not happen again because when these protests happen, it de-focuses and affects schooling time. Therefore we must act on it once and for all.

Now my question would be, is the Minister not prepared to conduct these reviews because we do not want to have an assumption that it is because these happen in schools that are former Model C schools and is afraid of acting against them. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. I see hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Speaker. I concur with the last speaker that has just spoken that I think the Minister needs to review some of the policies and in the light of learners constitutional rights being violated in public schools, such as the Malibu High school in Blue Downs, where black learners were compared to apes and bears for having afros, which is their natural hair, and further given disciplinary hearing letters.

This follows similar past incidents in 2016 at San Souci Girls School in the province where black girls learners were told to cut off their afros. So this actually becomes a norm in the Western Cape where people of colour are being marginalised by their teachers and in addition to that, what are the additional measures that you have in place for the teachers who are non-compliant in these kind of things. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I see the hon Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you for the comments. I think we need to interrogate the issue of the statement that has been made as a fact that these issues have become a norm in the Western Cape. It is completely untrue and a gross distortion of the reality. There have been two incidents regarding hair, now and in my last five year term, and that was the one at Malibu and the one at San Souci, so I would hardly describe that as a norm

when we have 1500 schools in the province.

As far as the training is concerned, it is ongoing – I cannot give you exact, specific dates, I do not believe in the school card of the teachers. But it is not only teachers either. It is the school, it is the governing body, the governing bodies make the code of conduct. We do a lot of training of governing bodies and we have a chance to form strategy in the Department which incorporates a very strong focus on values and amongst those values are inclusivity and diversity.

Quite some time ago, I requested that the Department embark on a diversity strategy which is part of, I believe, what is happening here along with the training of our staff. So it is not in the school card but it certainly is an ongoing focus of ours and one which we will continue to do.

Member Botha, I presume the school you are referring to is Malibu. It was not specifically stated in the question. Codes of conduct are made by governing bodies and the usual process in any school is for parents when they apply to the school, for them to accept that code of conduct and agree to comply with it. If they have any issues with the code of conduct their remedies then would be to go to the SGB and ask them to change it.

Now the incident in question here, also linking with member Kama is, it is not an issue of reviewing the code of conduct because it would not have been apparent from the code of conduct what this issue would end up being

because there was an issue of what was defined as outrageous hair.

So first of all I do not have the capacity in my office to review 1500 school's codes of conduct given the fact that there have only been two incidents, we have also not had reason to go and look at every single school's code of conduct but we have asked schools many times to look at their codes of conduct regularly and to review them in line with the Constitution and many schools have in fact done so.

So when there is one particular issue we will certainly intervene and look at that and work with the school to ensure that is amended appropriately and that is the case with what is happening with Malibu at the moment.

As far as disciplinary measures are concerned, has an issue like this happened before, member Makamba-Botya also did mention the issue at San Souci, which was the only other issue relating to hair that I have had and I went to the school personally. I spoke to the girls there and at the end of the day that issue was very amicably resolved. The principal in fact resigned or retired and the policy was changed. So we are completely committed to inclusivity and diversity in our schools and will do whatever we can to ensure that that happens and that everyone feels welcome and valued in our schools.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. That is the end of Interpellations. We now move over to Questions. I recognise the hon



Premier.

*Questions for oral reply*

*New question to the Premier*

*Safety of the people of the province*

**1. Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Premier:**

During his election campaign and his SOPA address he promised to fight for the safety of the people of the province:

What steps has he taken, including working with local governments, to ensure the safety of the people of the province?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker and also thank you to the hon Mackenzie for asking this question. In actual fact I am in a better position to answer this question today than I would have been last week, because we had the opportunity to launch the Western Cape plan today.

So today I officially launched our safety plan for the province which includes both a law enforcement and a violence prevention component. This is because we know that boots on the ground are not enough, we must

also work on improving the environment in which children are raised and the circumstances that our communities are faced with. The plan will see 3000 new law enforcement officers deployed where and when crime happens. Deployment based on data led technology; 150 investigators to prepare dockets for prosecution; a world-class evidence led and integrated violence prevention programme; and a safety priority for every Cabinet Minister with accountable transparent metrics.

Hon Deputy Speaker, during my election campaign I committed to a priority committee on crime and safety, however safety is now so incredibly important to our strategic plan for the province that I have decided to incorporate that proposed committee into Cabinet meetings where it will be designated as a Safety Cabinet where Ministers will be held to account on their safety metrics and we will exercise and focus criminal justice system oversight.

Each Minister has a measurable safety priority and they are personally responsible to deliver on and the safety priorities will focus on both law enforcement as well as violence prevention while also being managed with a measureable system together with the criminal justice system.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon member Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon Premier, what is the

timeframe for this project to be introduced?

The PREMIER: Parts of the timeframe will be, for example, 1 000 of the 3 000 within this year, 50 of the 150 investigators within this year. But the other programmes will, as I have said, last beyond my term because these are those embedded programmes that we need to start to see changes that actually start with young boys and changes that start where we are identifying risk; the 1 000 days programme that the Minister of Health will be following through on. This is what came out of our Safety Summit, this is the kind of stuff that is spoken about in other countries around the world that have developed practices where we have seen change. It is those kind of things that are going to be embedded and you can go down – each of the Ministers here have chosen a priority project that is going to make it safer.

So those will just be ongoing and of course I think the other thing is, these are new interventions that provinces have not really overall been that engaged with. We are doing this more than any other province has ever done before and I also believe that we must be dynamic enough to say we have invested in something, we are trying this and it is not giving us a result – well, then that measurement does not show us then we must reinvent it or we must reshape it. You know we cannot just keep doing the same things over and over again and expect other outcomes.

This Government already has, and I think across the whole of South Africa we have a number – and if you think about gender-based violence at the

moment – of interventions. I have asked that we measure those interventions, what is the efficacy of them, because across the country we have these high numbers. Are they not working at all? Are they working and if we did not have them we would have even higher numbers?

And so those are the kinds of questions that we have got to be asking ourselves, but that is the outline of this plan and, yes, I think specifically here in this House, the Standing Committee, that you, Chair, but also the Standing Committee that the hon Allen chairs, and then of course every Standing Committee will also have a component in this oversight to see exactly how we are measuring it and whether we actually are making a difference.

I have also said; we put a bold statement out there: let us halve the murder rate in the next 10 years. Let us see what happens and if nothing happens I will have to fall on my sword but you know, I mean we have really got to start changing things.

In our country crime is out of control. We are in a war zone. The United Nations says 1 000 murders per year in a region or a country means you have become a war zone. We had 3 600 murders in our province last year. It cannot be. So we have to, we definitely have to bring changes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I saw the hon Christians and then hon Kama and then hon Herron. Is that correct? Yes. Sorry, those are the

three names that came up first.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. If the hon Premier can just tell us under which Act will these people, the law enforcement officers be employed? Because the Province does not have powers over law enforcement officers, where will they employ and what are their powers? Is it the same as municipal? Are they going to be stationed under municipalities or which powers, because we do not know. Thank you.

The PREMIER: That is a very good question and in actual fact these questions are also – and I think specifically in the oversight, this is the process between myself and hon Minister Fritz, which will be taking the lead specifically with the 3 000 deployment and the 150 investigators.

But first of all, the deployment, the training; you will see it is a partnership with the City of Cape Town for exactly that point. I still believe that provinces should have policing powers, should have policing control, should have policing management. That is a long discussion. We have also heard hon Minister Bheki Cele say: no ways.

So we cannot sit back with 3 600 murders; I do not know what is happening in Gauteng with their 4 300 murders or KZN with their 4 500 murders, but in this province where I and us, we are responsible, so now we have to find a way. And that way is that what we have done is we have got an agreement with the City of Cape Town because also the City of

Cape Town's powers were devolved from the National Minister in the law enforcement officer space and that is what we are using. [Interjection.]

So we are using the training and the City of Cape Town's law enforcement space. They have created the space for the training and they will be deployed through that mechanism. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: But the management, control and command will sit in the Province. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: But of course we are developing this now. We have made the statement: this is what we are going to do. We have got the agreement, we will put the 3 000 in place; 1 000 this year. What hon Minister Fritz will be doing now is setting up the management process. Post-today, post the announcement. I then had a telecon with General Sithole ... [Interjection.] to explain what we are after. General Sithole is very happy with setting up the programme of how, because of course we cannot just do this on our own, we want to deploy in conjunction with the police and in conjunction with all of our municipalities because it is across the whole province.

But, interestingly enough, the regulation that allows the City to deploy law enforcement officers or those stabilisation unit officers, like they deployed in Bonteheuwel, that piece of legislation actually says that the City could deploy them within the bounds of South Africa. So the City could even lend some of their enforcement officers perhaps to Durban or Bloemfontein. [Interjections.] It could happen in this process but, of course, we are interested only in ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: That is the first thing. The second thing is that with regard to ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: ... the 150 investigators, hon Minister Fritz will now be engaging with the head of Public Prosecutions as well as the judiciary to secure the process of how. And it is not as if this is new because the private sector does it; I am fully aware of dockets being drawn up in Plettenberg Bay through the Neighbourhood Watch system, so we are just following through on that. But we know there is a massive shortfall on investigations, we know that our investigators have over 200 docket case-loads per person when the norm should be between 20 and 30, globally. So all we are doing is, we are now saying: well, how do we also help, and these 150 per 1 000 so that we can also add extra helping hands and we

have started now with that process. I have also sent off the documentation to the Presidency today and hon Minister Fritz is busy engaging with the Provincial Commissioner and also making sure that hon Minister Bheki Cele is also apprised of what these plans are.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thanks, hon Premier. Hon Kama?

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Maybe firstly suffice to say that we welcome any initiative to fight crime.

My question would be, I think this is the announcement that we were promised yesterday; the hon Premier made the announcement today. In the promise he mentions that he will find the money but there are going to be projects that are going to be affected.

Now I would want to get an understanding of which are these projects that are going to be affected, because our understanding is that even crime is as a result of many contributing factors. So we would not want a situation where we come and give the boots but we are opening more ground for crime to be committed. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much for that question, obviously a very important question. It is an important question for this House and as well



as for every single Minister sitting here, a very important question for them as well.

We have already gone through – and of course we have got a R60 billion budget – and in the budget, the boots on the ground and the 50, so that is the 1 000 and the 50 for now, Treasury has already secured that first year funding.

A number of the other smaller funding line items are in that process. We have secured a lot of them and a lot of the items are actually budget items that already exist but are going to be ramped up and of course each Minister will make those announcements as their programmes – for example, let us think about the after-school work that hon Minister Marais does.

The big question is how; we seem to miss a lot – I suppose sometimes it is not seen as cool to go to these – how do we get more of those kids attracted to the system? So that is what we are applying to it, but that budget exists already, so we are tweaking that budget.

Behavioural change budgets within the Department of the Premier, we will be using some of the behavioural change budget that already exists and looking at how we can help the Education Department with that budget so that some of those items which Education will be responsible for, is already budgeted for within the Premier's Department.

And of course when you make these kind of policy decisions and you make money available, specifically my own Department and I have to lead with this, so I am busy with a whole lot of processes on budget cuts but I will also leave the actual numbers for the hon Minister of Finance when he announces those in the Adjustment Budget which comes in a month or so's time.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon Herron?

Mr B HERRON: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. My question is similar to hon Christians. I am still not clear from the hon Premier as to who is the employer? Is it the Provincial Government or the City of Cape Town? And what type of employment are we talking about for these law enforcement officers? Are they permanently employed or are we talking about EPWP employment?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: So it is exactly the same system that is being used at the moment with the Stabilisation Unit in Bonteheuwel at the moment. So we are using that exact same process, we are using that exact same piece of regulatory framework that allows for that to happen, but the command and control will then happen from the Province and the training will happen from the City.

So we will transfer the training funding to the City for them to train up those 1 000 officials or those 1 000 officers. But as I said also, there are discussions that we had today post the announcement, first of all with General Sithole as well as with the City themselves and the MOU that is being drawn up at the moment. We started the framework yesterday. And so we will complete that framework within the next couple of days, which will outline exactly how that control and command happens because obviously it has to happen not within the confines of the City, it actually happens in the confines of the Province. But that regulation which the City operates under at the moment, as I said before, when it was handed down to the City it said not within the bounds of the City, it said within the bounds of South Africa. So we are actually using that loophole as the mechanism to arrange it across the province.

And then lastly, we also have to then secure, through the MOU, for example if we were going to go into Avian Park, because the data and the statistics showed us that that is where crime was increasing and we were going to go and put enforcement and boots on the ground in Avian Park, then what would happen is the MOU would have the capability of that specific municipality also entering into that MOU so that we can actually then have the agreement to go across from one municipality to another.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. [Interjection.] There cannot be a follow-up, unfortunately, hon member.

Mr B HERRON: The hon Premier has not actually answered the question. I asked who the employer was and what type of employment?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Unfortunately I cannot control what the hon Premier answers, that is his prerogative as an hon member of this House.  
[Interjections.]

We are moving over to Question 5. I see the hon Marais.

*Questions standing over from Thursday, 12 August 2019, as agreed to by the House:*

*West Coast: soccer and netball teams*

**5. Ms L J Botha asked the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:**

- (1) Whether there are soccer and netball teams on the West Coast linked to her Department; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) whether her Department has received any requests to support soccer and netball teams on the West Coast; if so, what are the relevant details?

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Baie dankie, agb Adjunkspeaker, dankie aan agb Lorraine Botha vir die vraag.

Ja, daar is sokker- en netbalklubs in die Weskus wat deur die Klub Ontwikkelingsprogram met die Departement skakel.

*[Translations of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, thank you to the hon Lorraine Botha for the question.

Yes, there are soccer and netball clubs in the West Coast that liaise with the Department through the Club Development Programme.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marais, if you could just take your seat for a second, there is a point of order. What is your point, hon member?

Mr L L MVIMBI: My point of order, hon Deputy Speaker, is that I want to find out whether, if a question is being asked, can the person refuse to answer a question because it is the second time that is happening in the House. If it does allow, so that we know and then we do not waste time and ask questions.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Unfortunately, again, I cannot judge the quality of an answer at any level. So if you want to, maybe you should suggest to write an email to the hon Premier if you want more clarity, but in this House it is the hon members' prerogative on how they want to answer,

including the Executive. Thank you. Can we continue, hon Minister Marais? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you. †Ja, daar is sokker-en netbalklubs aan die Weskus ... [Tussenwerpsels.] [Yes, there are soccer and netball clubs on the West Coast ... [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, please.

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: ... wat deur die Klub Ontwikkelingsprogram met die Departement skakel en klubs word ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: ... that liaise with the Department through the Club Development Programme [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Klubs word deur hul onderskeie sportfederasies benoem. Daar is 11 netbalklubs. Ek kan dit noem, dit is Darling wat in Swartland is; Velddrif Netbalkklub en Bergrivier; Saldanha Netbalkklub; die Villagers Netbalkklub in Brakfontein, Cederberg; Good Hope, Riebeeck-Wes, Swartland; Coastal Links; Steenberg's Cove; Hopefield – dit is in Hopefield; Majestics in Citrusdal, Cederberg; Synith Eagles is in Clanwilliam, Cederberg. Dan die River

Fresh Netbal is in Porterville, Bergrivier en die Young Blues in Citrusdal, Cederberg. En twee sokkerklubs, Diazville Sokkerklub in Saldanha en die Diaz Leeds Sokkerklub in Saldanha.

En dan die tweede deel van die vraag: ja, versoeke is ontvang en word steeds ontvang en hou verband met die ondersteuning wat verleen word aan klubs wat deel uitmaak van die Klub Ontwikkelingsprogram wat oor 'n periode van drie jaar geïmplementeer word.

Die meeste versoeke is gewoonlik vir vervoer, toerusting en uitrusting, kapasiteitsboukursusse, affiliasie en / of registrasiegelde.

*[Translations of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Clubs are nominated by their respective sport federations. There are 11 netball clubs. I can name them, it is Darling that is in the Swartland; Velddrif Netball Club and Berg River; Saldanha Netball Club; the Villagers Netball Club in Brakfontein, Cederberg; Good Hope, Riebeeck West, Swartland; Coastal Links; Steenberg's Cove; Hopefield – it is in Hopefield; Majestics in Citrusdal, Cederberg; Synith Eagles is in Clanwilliam, Cederberg. Then the River Fresh Netball is in Porterville, Berg River and the Young Blues in Citrusdal, Cederberg. And two soccer clubs, Diazville Soccer Club in Saldanha and the Diaz Leeds Soccer Club in Saldanha.

And then the second part of the question: yes, requests were received and are still being received and relate to the support that is rendered to clubs that are part of the Club Development Programme that is implemented over a period of three years.

Most of the requests are usually for transport, equipment and outfits, capacity building courses, affiliation and / or registration fees.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Botha.

†Me L J BOTHA: Dankie agb Minister. Ek wou net vra, die lys genoem nou deur u, hoeveel van daardie spanne is van die spanne wat wel aansoek gedoen het vir ondersteuning?

[Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, hon Minister. I just wanted to ask, the list mentioned by you now, how many of those teams are from the teams that have actually applied for support?]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister.

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Dankie. Sover my kennis strek het al die spanne aansoek gedoen vir ondersteuning.

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you. As far as I know all the teams have applied for support.]



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any follow-ups? No. We move over to Question 7. I see the hon Minister Schäfer.

*Quality of teaching: mechanisms to monitor*

**7. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Education:**

- (1) Whether she and her Department have a mechanism in place to monitor the quality of teaching to learners who are struggling with certain subjects; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) what are the reasons for the decrease in the matric pass rate across the province?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker and hon Christians. Yes, we do have mechanisms in place. We track learner performance via a number of tests, firstly, including the annual systemic tests in Grades 3, 6 and 9 in language and mathematics, diagnostic testing in Grade 8 as well as quarterly testing in Grades 10 to 12.

The intention of these tests is to identify the subjects where learners are performing poorly and to provide support to teachers at schools. For example, last year using the systemic tests we were able to determine that Grade 3 learners were struggling to identify patterns and functions and are

struggling with algebra and data handling, as well as that the Grade 3 learners' writing skills have declined.

So we were able to use these test results to design interventions to assist the Grade 3 learners in these areas, which we would not have been able to do without the systemic tests. They provide the most objective picture possible of learner performance in language and mathematics, giving us the opportunity to assess whether we are improving the quality of education in the province.

We have used the systemic tests over the years to design our recruitment strategies and specific interventions and training programmes for schools and teachers at the CTLI and this has led directly to some of the improvements that we see in the system.

Diagnostic and statistical analysis is also used to plan intervention and support programmes. Diagnostic tests focus on Grade 8 language, maths and science. Diagnostic tests for maths, home language and natural sciences were piloted in 2015 and implemented in 2016. The WCED is investigating the possibility of conducting these tests during the fourth term of Grade 7 as well, so that the results will be readily available as they enter high school.

Diagnostic tests assist in increasing learner participation rates in mathematics and physical sciences in FET as teachers are able to

determine what a learner's abilities are and to use a differentiated method of teaching in support of enhanced learning for every learner.

Statistical analysis looks at the term results in Grades 8 to 12 and as far as matric is concerned, there is also a per question analysis of NSC results, which also include reports of moderators and examiners and a variety of teacher and learner support initiatives are implemented at head office and the eight education districts with the support of subject and curriculum advisers.

Part two of the question, the reason for the decrease in the matric pass rate: the main subject that contributed to the decline in the 2018 NSC was business studies. Since the introduction of the CAPS in 2014 there has been a significant decline in the NSC business studies results, both nationally and provincially.

There are a number of challenges experienced in business studies, including a negative attitude towards the subject, the lack of classroom management skills of certain teachers, inadequate curriculum pacing and curriculum coverage, ineffective teaching methodologies and absence of effective remedial interventions impacts negatively on the performance of learners.

There are also some challenges with the curriculum which we are trying to address with the DBE, but there are also other reasons for the decline as

well. One is that the Western Cape has the highest retention rate in the country between Grades 10 and 12 at 64%. The more people who stay in the system, which is one of our strategic priorities, the higher the chance that the overall pass percentage is going to decrease because the weaker learners are kept in the system, not kicked out.

In addition, we have been saying for several years now that budget pressures that we are facing over the last number of years, which has resulted in bigger class sizes, will lead to a reduction in performance. And in addition to that, we have many learners coming from other provinces in Grade 10 with backlogs from their education systems. So in 2018, for example, there were 731 learners who came into the Western Cape from other provinces in Grade 10 only, who failed the 2018 NSC. So the provincial pass rate would have been 82.7% if they were not included, which is obviously an improvement of 1.2% from what our reported pass rate was.

In addition, many of those learners who come in Grade 10, the ones that do pass, are also passing on average at a lower percentage which brings down the entire percentage. So people are coming here for opportunities but that is having an impact on our ultimate performance.

Lastly, our performance must also be looked at through the lens of the multiple exam opportunities. In 2018 the Western Cape had the lowest percentage of MEOs in the country. Other provinces that recorded

increases, supposedly, in pass rates, had many learners who did not write the full matric exam and some up to as much as 25%.

I have heard reports of learners in other provinces also being forced to write the MEO; in the Western Cape we did not force them to write it. They had a choice as to whether to write it or not. So I am really, really pleased that that has now been scrapped from next year but it really just shows the dangers of looking simply at pass percentages without interrogating how they are calculated. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Christians?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Minister, for that comprehensive answer. Hon Minister, I have pulled the Metro East and Metro South, all those statistics here where subjects impacting on school performance, like accounting, they have identified all of that.

Just to think, we were at an oversight visit and while we were at the oversight visit teachers were sending, a principal was sending correspondence to say they are shooting again in Manenberg and bullets infiltrated the classroom against the blackboards and stuff. Is something being done about that, because when I spoke to the educators there they said that it definitely impacts on the performance of learners. So what is your Department doing? And I know it is a big thing but I am just saying now the bullets, gangsters are coming into the school with balaclavas,

taking out who they need to take out and that is all trauma. So all these interventions are good and I appreciate that, but the safety aspect – it is not normal for learners to be taught in such hostile environments.

So that is happening at schools and it is going to have a detrimental effect on the outcome at the end of the year. So I do not know if you heard about it but we got an email to say that they had to lie flat on the ground and they could not teach but they had to come back tomorrow and continue as normal.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much. Yes, I mean that is completely correct. I agree with you 100%. The incident you are referring to, as far as I recall, was not shooting inside the school, it was from outside the school premises and it came into the school. So as you know, we cannot do anything about controlling outside school premises but that is part of the hon Premier's safety plan which he announced today, which is a cross-cutting plan for everybody in every department to work with the police to try and prevent this kind of thing from happening. I completely agree, the safety of our teachers as well as our learners is constantly under threat in areas like Manenberg, Hanover Park, Lavender Hill, Elsie's River and it is unnatural and we completely agree with you and that is why we are embarking on the safety strategy.

Part of the trauma issue is also that with Social Development we will be announcing part of our strategy together, as well as how we are going to address that in schools. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thanks, hon Minister. Hon member Botya, Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Chairperson. My question is directed to the hon Minister. Does the Department have a process in place to deal with children who are struggling with certain subjects and who are still not coping after special interventions made by the school? If that is the case, do you have a process whereby the child must go for an assessment, because sometimes the school will declare a child not suitable for a mainstream school. So is there a process that is in schools to place that child in a special school or a skills school? Is there such process in the Department? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thanks, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. Yes, there is indeed. We are, as with most things, under constant pressure for places in special schools and schools of skill. I have managed to get two extra schools of skill up and running in the last few years, but we do have a very proactive and a very responsive Special Needs Directorate in the Department and people who are battling, struggling, certainly can be sent for assessments

and then we do our best to place them in a suitable facility.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Kama?

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you to the hon Minister for the responses. I think firstly, what the results have shown, which hon member Christians mentioned, is that there is a decrease in how students are performing or learners are performing. And one of the challenges, hon Minister, that was mentioned which affects the performance of the school is the issue of how currently the quintile system describes other schools.

So what I want to know is what is the hon Minister doing to consistently advocate for the review of how schools are defined in terms of the quintile they belong to? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. That is kind of a new question but I am happy to answer it because it is something I have been taking up with the National Minister since I was appointed in 2014. It is a national policy. I would welcome any support from the ANC's side to assist me at a national level because it is inequitable. It is not reflective of the true state of affairs on the ground.



I do have the power to change quintiles on application and our Department is processing a number of applications. I have made some of them but the fact is, without extra money to cover the difference in the fees, we cannot carry on – we cannot do it for every school like we would necessarily like to do.

It is also the fact, though, that some schools are not managing the money they get as well as they should and that is something that we are also trying to get our districts to check on. But I agree, the quintile school system – at the time it might have been fair, it is not fair anymore.

The other thing is, National Department is also not checking that every province is complying with the policy either. So we have Limpopo who is supposed to have 70%, for example, of the poorest learners in their schools; they have 90%. So you know it is really not fair when the Department makes a policy but other provinces do not comply. We do; we try and manage our money effectively but our learners are suffering. So I am looking very sympathetically at applications but we are obviously going to require extra funding and also that affects the school nutrition programme as well.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any follow ups? No. Thank you, we move over to the next question.

*Waveren High School: poor state of infrastructure*

**8. Mr M K Sayed asked the Minister of Education:**

Whether she and her Department have plans to address the poor state of infrastructure at the Waveren High School; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see hon Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes, thank you. I see hon Sayed is not here but thank you for allowing the question to stand over from last week.

We do have a plan in place. The school is due to be partially replaced through the WCED replacements programme. A portion of the school is made up of *plankie* buildings, therefore next year this part of the school is due to be replaced with new classrooms and a new school hall built. Construction is due to commence next year with completion in 2022.

Public Works is currently on site addressing repair and maintenance needs at the school. However, a review of some of the buildings has led us to accelerate the demolition of some of the classrooms and mobile classrooms will be built in the interim to house learners from the demolished classrooms.

DTPW is also currently scoping what work needs to happen in the

classrooms that will be retained and this will be actioned as soon as possible.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Moving over to the next question.

*Mitchells Plain: placement in high schools 2020*

**9. Mr I de Jager asked the Minister of Education:**

(a) How many learners in Mitchells Plain have not been placed in high schools for the 2020 academic year and (b) what measures are in place to ensure that these learners are placed in schools near to where they stay?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see hon Minister Schäfer again.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon De Jager, for the question. He is not here either.

Part (a) of the question is premature and I cannot answer it at this point because the process for placement for 2020 is not yet finalised. It is still in process. There are many people still double-parked in more than one school and also the schools have to look first of all at who is going to perhaps not progress to the next grade for next year. So we are not yet at final figures.

Part (b), planned measures to ensure successful placement of learners for 2020, to place learners at available places at various schools that may not be their first choice. Additional possible classes to be opened. As I say, schools are still cleaning up their enrolments and we have asked schools to finalise their admission lists and their waiting lists. This is an ongoing process that is ever-changing and evolving due to learners being admitted at multiple schools and having to finalise who is going to repeat grades next year or not.

The biggest challenge that the Department experiences is parents' schools of choice as it is not always possible to accommodate learners at schools of choice and parents will have to settle for places offered where accommodation is available.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Christians.

Mr F E CHRISTIANS: Hon Minister, we had a briefing, I think last week or two weeks ago, that there are pupils this year, 2019, that were not yet placed. Is that the case?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: To my knowledge all learners were placed. I am not sure if you are referring to Grade R because Grade R is not yet compulsory. So if it is Grade R then that may be the case but there are always people coming in and out. Sometimes people are transferred during the year and there are sometimes people who are not placed at a

certain point but I am not aware of people who should have been placed, who are not, and if you are aware of that please give me names and I will follow up.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Kama and then hon Mackenzie.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I think the challenge that we have in Mitchells Plain has been the increasing population in the area. So the question therefore would be: what are the plans in place to ensure that we are able to accommodate this in the future? Already in one of the briefings we had there was an indication that we are going to have unplaced learners from the districts, that we are going to have learners that will not have a place to learn. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. Mitchells Plain is only one of many areas where we have an ongoing increase in the population. As soon as we build a new school it is already full. It is an ongoing problem which we have been highlighting every year but every year our budget gets cut and we are now being told it is going to be cut again by 5%. If that is the case we will definitely have unplaced learners. There is nothing we can do about it.

So our infrastructure grant has also been cut by R132,503 million over the

last few years by National Government. We were also then given an extra R298 million but they took away R250 million of it, so which leaves us with R48 million which is not even enough to build one school. So as long as we continue in this environment where we simply are not getting the funding to provide the schools and to provide the teachers, then it is going to be a problem. But in Mitchells Plain particularly we certainly do have plans; we have plans everywhere, it is just that we simply cannot always keep up with the numbers as much as we can.

Then also we sometimes build a school, like we did in Mfuleni and then the parents did not want their children to go to that particular area, they wanted them to go somewhere else. So we need also to ask our communities to work with us so that when we do have school places available, that they help us to get their children into those schools.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, is the Department planning to build any new schools in Mitchells Plain?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Hon Mackenzie, I anticipated that question from you, so luckily even though it is a new question I have an answer. We are building a new school in Woodlands, Weltevrede. It is a new mobile primary school. [Applause.] I am glad someone is happy. It will be called Washington Drive Primary School and it is to be erected on

a property in the northern part of Mitchells Plain. It will consist of 10 classrooms, eight single, one double with stacking doors to open up and be used as an assembly area, two admin units, ablution facilities for 400 learners and 12 staff and a feeding kitchen.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No further follow-ups. We move over to the new questions. I see the hon Minister Bredell.

*New questions*

*Cederberg Municipality: council vehicle misuse*

**2. Mr D America asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

- (1) Whether it has been brought to his attention that a councillor of the Cederberg Municipality, whose name has been furnished to his Department for the purpose of his reply, is alleged to be using a municipal council vehicle permanently while receiving a car allowance from the Municipality; if so, (a) what are the relevant details and (b) was the Council's permission obtained; if not;
- (2) whether he will investigate the matter and report back to the House?

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie, agb *Deputy Speaker*. Dankie aan die agb lid vir die vraag. Ek is ingelig dat die aantygings wat teen raadslid Pretorius gemaak was, onwaar is in ‘n mate wat beskryf sal word: (b) hy gebruik ‘n munisipale voertuig en soos vereis word volgens Artikel 9(1)(e) van die *Staatskoerant* Nr. 42134 van 21 Desember 2018; die Raad het voorsiening gemaak vir die gebruik van raadsvoertuie deur raadslede volgens die Raad se resoluëie op 29 Maart 2017; verder, soos per munisipale rekords, ontvang raadslid Pretorius geen motortoelaag nie. Die (b) gedeelte: volgens die munisipaliteit word die gebruik van die voertuig wat in munisipale besit is, slegs gebruik in ooreenstemming met Artikel 9 van die *Staatskoerant* gedateer 21 Desember 2018, met die goedkeuring van die burgemeester en Speaker. Dankie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

***[Translations of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]***

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you to the hon member for the question. I have been informed that the allegations made against councillor Pretorius are untrue, to the extent that will be described: (b) he uses a municipal vehicle and as required by Section 9(1)(e) of the *Government Gazette* Nr. 42134 of 21 December 2018; the Council has made provision for the use of council vehicles by councillors in terms of the Council’s resolution on 29 March



2017; further, as per municipal records councillor Pretorius does not receive a vehicle allowance.

The (b) part: according to the Municipality the use of the vehicle owned by the Municipality, only occurs in terms of Section 9 of the *Government Gazette* dated 21 December 2018, with the approval of the Mayor and the Speaker. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon America?

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, Hon Deputy Speaker. I am satisfied with the answer provided by the hon Minister. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No further follow-ups.

*Bullying incidents: combatting of*

**3. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Education:**

Whether she and her Department have measures in place to combat the scourge of bullying incidents occurring at schools in the province; if so, what are the relevant details?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Then we move over to the next question, thank you, and I see the hon Minister Schäfer. She is busy today.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Hon Christians is also busy today. Yes, we do have measures in place. Obviously we are very aware that bullying is happening in many schools, in fact all over the country and internationally and now that we have internet it has also expanded to include not only verbal and physical bullying but also cyber bullying and we all know also what pain and trauma it can bring to people. It can lead to depression, anxiety, self-harming and even suicide in some cases.

Learners address the issue of bullying through the life skills orientation curriculum. It is also addressed through various District engagements. Districts hold a variety of workshops for teachers and learners on the issue and there are also after-school and holiday programmes that address it. Psycho-social support is also provided by the Districts to schools on request and intervention programmes where schools have indicated that they need support.

We have also emphasised that schools should include in their code of conduct an anti-bullying policy which outlines behaviours that are unacceptable, even out of school, where social media bullying is rife.

I have mentioned earlier the Transform to Perform Strategy and an integral part of this is a Values Programme that is currently being implemented at schools. Training of educators in values in education is underway. Schools have been asked to choose 12 values for each month of the year and to explain, talk, show and live these values. These values include respect for

one another, kindness, caring and so on. Schools are to have ongoing discussions with learners on values and to undertake various initiatives that showcase them.

Early indications have shown that there has been a decline in learner bullying at some schools because of this as they are being taught how to respect and consider one another and their feelings. Two examples are: from Beaufort West Primary School where Mr Amsterdam says:

“Through the Values Programme we are experiencing less bullying and fighting. They are starting to look out for one another, especially in class. We have become one class, one school, one family.”

And another one is Mr Samsodien from Kannemeyer Primary in Grassy Park who says:

“We have seen, through our little way of introducing this at our school, how the attitudes have changed, how behaviour has changed and how attendance has increased.”

So we certainly are dealing with that. The issue of social media, as I have said, has heightened the risk of bullying and we embarked on a campaign in August 2018 to highlight the effects of bullying on learners and to draw attention to the fact that learners who film, post or distribute videos are also participating in the bullying. The campaign has been called “Raise

Your Voice, Not Your Phone”. It included the distribution of two videos on social media highlighting the implications of filming or distributing content across social media and it provided tips as well as to what one can do to help victims who are being bullied.

The second phase of this campaign is now being developed and we are very grateful for the public participation of Paxton Fielies and Carl Wastie in this campaign. I have done a number of anti-bullying road shows with Carl Wastie and hope to continue to in future.

In addition, through our E-Culture stream and our E-Learning Directorate we have distributed various policy documents and guidelines in the area of cyber wellness and dangers associated with social media, including bullying. Guidelines were issued to all schools on social media and social networking in public schools and I would encourage all officials, principals, educators and SGB’s to study these.

We have also recently launched a new cyber safety programme called Web Rangers, where we train learners in schools on issues of cyber safety and they are going to go back into their schools and share that information. And we are also busy developing a cyber safety curriculum with Google, which we hope to input into the national system. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Christians?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Minister, for that answer. It is just disturbing to see almost every day in the newspaper here – last month, an Elsie's River High School †*meisie* [girl] tried to kill herself after allegedly being bullied at school. And then a 13-year-old from Mitchells Plain, Parkhurst Primary, that allegedly was bullied and she tried to kill herself. Then the article goes on, a 12-year-old boy that was bullied and so on.

So this is still happening and are these interventions taken by the Department enough? I know that last term our Education Committee was briefed by people on bullying because it is an ongoing problem. Are these interventions enough, because it is sad to read, if you open the newspapers, that pupils want to take their lives because of continuous bullying.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes, it is. I agree with you completely. What is enough, when is it ever enough? It is also not the Department's sole responsibility. We need to get our parents at home as well as community organisations assisting us to help us get those values back into society.

But having said that, bullying is not a new phenomenon. It has been with us for centuries actually. So I think also the fact that it is much easier to publicise nowadays maybe makes us more aware. I am not convinced that

there are necessarily more of these events but one is too many, I agree with you, which is why we are doing absolutely everything we can possibly do and focusing on the values in schools to try and engender respect for each other; it does appear to be helping, just from these two anecdotes that I have mentioned which are really encouraging.

So we are doing everything we possibly can but we cannot do it alone either. We really need support from communities and from parents.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Christians?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Minister, what is the remedy if a pupil goes through the necessary channels at school and nothing has been done? What is the remedy for that learner going to the principal, reporting the cases continuously and nothing has been done? What is the remedy for that pupil and also the parent?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. We have a Safe Schools Hotline which we publicise at every school, 0800454647. It can be anonymous and I would really encourage them to use that hotline. If there is a particular issue that you are aware of, again you are welcome to contact me with the details and I will try and take it up with the relevant people in as sympathetic and empathetic a way as I can.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Noted, thank you. We move over to the final

question.

*Youth Café in Mitchells Plain*

**4. Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Minister of Social Development:**

(a) How many young people have been assisted at the Youth Café in Mitchells Plain, (b) what services are offered to young people by the Youth Café and (c) how is the effectiveness of these programmes being monitored?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister Fernandez.

The MINISTER FOR SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Deputy Speaker, I wish to thank the member for the question. It is pertinent to the Youth Café in Mitchells Plain.

Part (a): the Youth Café in the 2018/2019 financial year reached a total of 2 498 people at that centre. In the first quarter of 2019/2020, 372 young people were assisted.

Part (b): what are the programmes? The Youth Café offers a number of programmes and services to young people in Mitchells Plain. The after-school support and skills development courses are offered at two schools in the Mitchells Plain area for youth in transition, that is Grade 10 to 12,

and this programme is in line with the After-School Game-Changer focus and is meant to make the Youth Café visible and accessible to young people after school.

The Youth Café also presents a compulsory life skills course to all participants. Irrespective of the course that young people attend, during the first quarter of 2019/2020 a total of 100 participants were trained in leadership and mastery as part of this compulsory life skills course for needs of youth.

Furthermore, computer basic training and job readiness programmes are offered every three months as the students require these courses for further job opportunities. Specialised courses are also offered, such as project management, hospitality, graphic design which started in August and will continue until the end of the year, and entrepreneur exposure. Four participants established their own businesses and the Media Hub.

Part 3: The effectiveness of the programme is monitored by feedback from the students. It is also monitored by each staff member who follows up on a group of assigned beneficiaries, as well as connecting some of them with possible job opportunities. A database of all participants is kept and annual follow-ups are done to monitor progress.

One of the challenges with the Mitchells Plain Youth Hub is the element of crime in the precinct that it is located. Thank you.



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Mackenzie, are you up? No. I see hon Bans and I see hon Marais.

Ms A BANS: I would like to ask the hon Minister, I understand that the hon Minister said that there are two more Youth Cafés that will be opening this year. Has there been a decision yet where the Youth Cafés will be opened?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER FOR SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Bans, we have not committed any funding. There is one commitment that was carried over from the former Minister's period that is in place, but obviously with the cuts we will need to revisit now where it is we are going to place our cafés and once we know what the budgets are we will revisit that programme. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Deputy Chair, I am very impressed with the answer given by the Minister. I must say I was not aware of it. I just want to know, do you intend extending this to other areas that there seems to be, like in the case of Soweto, everything happens in Soweto. So now everything happens in Mitchells Plain and we do not ever get any other towns benefiting from this, where there is a need.

Do you intend expanding this programme to the Manenberg, to Elsie's River, or is Mitchells Plain the only star project?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER FOR SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Marais. There are in fact Youth Hubs established across the province. They are in George, Oudtshoorn, we have Mitchells Plain, Uniondale, I think we are going to be looking at ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Groot Brak.

The MINISTER FOR SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Groot Brak. So I do not have the whole list of it offhand but it will fit in, the Youth Café fits in with the focus of Government going forward in terms of keeping youth off the streets, getting youth at risk to come in, learn, get the valuable life skills and try and prepare them for employment in terms of the programmes that are offered.

It is an expensive exercise. One needs to find the best location, you need to know that there is the demand but I can tell you in our engagement with all the 30 municipal mayors, every single mayor wants a Youth Café in his or her municipality. So it is something we are going to need to revisit but of course the budget cut of 5% is going to affect some of our programmes. I cannot say if that will be one. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Botha?

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, I just want to know and you have alluded to the crime, the gang-affected crime. I want to know how has this affected the number of youths who visit the Youth Cafés and have the numbers decreased and how have they decreased, if they have?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER FOR SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Botha, I do not have the full detail but we are actually doing an assessment of all our Youth Cafés to see, from inception, what the numbers were. But I am aware that the location in the town centre – it is in the town centre, hon Mackenzie – is quite a hot spot area and youth are discouraged from coming with laptops and cell phones for fear that they might get robbed. So we might need to revisit location but again we are busy with that exercise and once I have all the detail I can certainly provide that to the House. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, to the MEC, I just wanted to ask whether her Department is willing to prioritise the rural areas in terms of establishing these Cafés. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER FOR SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Obviously scale, hon member, is important because, as I say, it is a costly exercise to set up but we would want to see the spread across both the metro and rural areas because it is in the rural areas where the need is the greatest in terms of preparation for the world of work and also the necessary life skills to equip them. So as I said, there are 11; we are revisiting, we are looking at the numbers and obviously the commitments that were made but it is sought after and every mayor wants a rehab, wants a Youth Café and wants a safe house. So I have got a shopping list that I need to work on over the next five years and we are going to all need to pull together to make it work, yes. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. [Interjections.] That comes to the end of the questions for oral reply. We now move over to Questions to the Premier without Notice. I see, I recognise the hon Bans.

### **QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE**

†Me A BANS: Dankie, agb Deputy Speaker. Na die pragtige prentjie wat vir ons so pas geskets is oor die plaaslike regering, het ek die volgende vraag aan die agb Premier.

[Ms A BANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. After the beautiful picture that has just been painted on the local government, I have the following

question to the hon Premier.]

Whether the hon Premier is aware of allegations of corrupt practices, sedition and destabilisation in various municipalities like in George, Knysna, Swellendam. If so, what is the hon Premier doing to address these challenges?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: So I do know that there have been various allegations received and emails received and I know that the Minister of Local Government, when we receive them we deal with them, we put the investigations in place and allow the processes to follow their course.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Bans?

Ms A BANS: The De Swardt Vogel-Myambo report found a series of corrupt practices in Knysna Municipality, including the legal adviser who backdated the municipal manager's appointment, illegally approving R4 million for Knysna Tourism to a private company that had not tendered. What I want to know, hon Premier, can you tell us what progress was made in terms of the implementation of that report? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: That was your mayor. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: First of all, that report was never sent to me. I am not sure if it was sent to the local government, number 1. Number 2, I was listening to what you were saying and you indicated that the Tourism money of R4 million was paid to a private company. I know that it is not a private company because that is the tourism organisation which is not a private business. It is a non-profit organisation that is set up to market tourism as in all towns at the moment across South Africa. And that brings into question the veracity or even the quality of the report but, as I can say, I have not formally received that report and I am not sure if it has been sent to this Provincial Government.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bans?

Ms A BANS: Let me choose my question now because it is the last one. I would love to follow up on that because I just have one opportunity, hon Premier. What I would want to know now, if an MEC is found fingering somewhere into these processes, for example, hon MEC Bredell who refused the recommendation to Council to investigate corruption allegations in Knysna Municipality under the former mayor who is now the DA MP. What would the process be? How would you handle that situation?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So I think first of all if the MEC refused to investigate a corrupt case then obviously what you should formally do is write to me as the Premier and request the reason why and I will investigate it to find out.

Secondly, if you are aware of corruption I would also expect you to also go to the police station and lay a charge of corruption because of course the laws of our land say that if you are aware of that corruption you are complicit unless you do something about it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I move over to hon Bosman.  
[Interjection.] There are only two follow-ups.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Through you, I would like to ask the hon Premier, the hon Premier recently welcomed the extension of the South African National Defence Force's deployment on the Cape Flats, provided that certain changes be made to the deployment and operations. Can the hon Premier please detail for the House what changes he hopes to see and what enhanced support he would like to see to tackling gang-related violence on the Cape Flats?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thanks. Hon Premier?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So I think it is no secret that I have supported the deployment of the military to our region, but I think it is also no secret

that both myself and hon Minister Fritz have really worked hard at saying, well, how can we as a province play a much stronger role. We have an existing oversight role; can we even play an oversight role? And many is the time that we get absolutely denied that role, but I want to say that, again, in writing to the President, I requested the President that we continue with the deployment because I do believe that a two-month deployment is definitely way too short, number 1, to find any really meaningful change.

Number 2, I have actually been disappointed in this last two months' deployment because I have not seen strategies, I have not seen mechanisms of measurement. Even when we asked for the Acting Provincial Commissioner to come and report this to the Cabinet, it was quite a high-level report on lockdown and it really did not enable us to engage into what was the real strategy and how did the police use the military in making sure that we make a difference and a dent in this unbelievably high murder rate and crime rate, specifically in the initial 10 hotspot areas but also that expanded to 15 hotspot areas.

So when I wrote to the President to request that we believe that we should extend the deployment, I said in that request that I really would like to see proper strategic management, I want to see measurable objectives within that management. I want to see blitzes because at the moment when you see the deployment of the military it is sort of this big, noisy machine that comes rolling into town for two hours and then leaves again.



[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Tourists.

The PREMIER: I mean if you are a gangster you get warned very early of what is going on. I need to see 2 o'clock in the morning lockdowns and that is actually what they are used for. The police need them to use the military as the mechanism to lock down an area – it is Section 13(7) of the Police Act – and then the police go in and what they do is then they blitz from one area to another. There are endless anecdotes of arriving at the wrong house and getting the wrong information. I mean this kind of intelligence is not difficult to get, just go and walk the streets yourself. Everyone knows the gangster lives there or the gangster lives there, this is who they are, this is what time they operate; if you wait till 9 o'clock they will be here, they will meet these guys at 10 o'clock. I mean everybody knows, the intelligence is on the ground everywhere.

So that is a real problem and that is what I have asked the President to please have a look at doing and I have not heard a formal reply back, I have only received a letter that the President sent to the Speaker and I presume the same applies to my colleague, Minister Fritz, that we have not had any formal further engagement. But as I also announced, that what we will do now is we will also set the questions beforehand and ask the police to report specifically on the military on a regular basis.

However, I must also say that if I think about those joint committees that have been set up, that at least the Province and the City are involved in those joint committees now, between the City, Province and police, so that we at least do have some input in that process around what is happening with the military deployment.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bosman?

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you very much for that reply. I understand that none of the representatives from the Western Cape Government were invited to the recent Crime Summit. Would the hon Premier perhaps please elaborate more on the relationship between the National and Provincial Government in terms of policing and safety issues?

The PREMIER: Now that is a really nice follow-up question. I think that a number of us in this room were at the first Crime Summit and I remember at that first Crime Summit walking out onto that stage and pledging to the Minister that he has the full support of this Government, of every single department in this Government. I never said one negative word when I went out and neither did my colleague, hon Minister Albert Fritz.

Of course we then followed up with the Minister coming with a whole lot of blame and game and you need to do this and you do not provide that and the City hasn't got lights and you are not doing your job. But we just held back and said: We are committed to partnering to make sure that this is a

project that will make this province safer. Too many people are being murdered and are dying in this province ... [Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Hear-hear.

The PREMIER: ... every single day. Interestingly, a second Crime Summit gets called and I was on my way to the provincial funeral of the late Chester Williams and I get a message from someone in the audience of the Crime Summit. Now I am not sure if anybody in this room was at the Crime Summit?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Kama.

The PREMIER: Aha! So maybe he can corroborate this because obviously I was not there. Apparently we are not going to start this Crime Summit because where is the Premier? He has not pitched up, where is he? Where is the MEC? Then they said no, the MEC is at Mugabe's funeral. [Laughter.] I mean what absolute nonsense and rot. But I get the call to say: where are you? So I replied to say: I am not sure what you mean, where am I? I am on my way to Chester Williams's funeral, it is a provincial state funeral. So they said but you are supposed to be at the Crime Summit? I said: what Crime Summit? They said: the Crime Summit, we are all waiting for you, you are supposed to be here.

So immediately I get hold of my PA, I get hold of hon Minister Fritz and I

say: Guys, are we supposed to be at this Crime Summit? And then we start investigating as to who was invited to the Crime Summit. Well, an invitation did actually come to this Province, I will give you that. It came to some officials in this province to come to the Crime Summit. There was no invite to my office, nothing, *nada*, nothing and neither to hon Minister Fritz's office, nothing, *nada*. [Interjections.] Three of our officials did attend. Our officials did attend and I did say that our officials were invited. We were not invited.

That actually reminds me of the previous time that the Oversight Committee from the National Assembly ... [Interjections.] was here in the province, in Mitchells Plain.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The PREMIER: Exactly the same. This is like an ANC strategy, I think. [Interjection.] Do not invite and then we will do this big blame, ah, look at these guys, they are not serious about crime, they do not even pitch to the meetings. Invite us to these meetings then we will come along.

So again I get a message: why are you not at this meeting? So I have got to investigate because I promise you ... [Interjections.] if we get invited to one of these kind of meetings we will be there, unless there is something like a Cabinet meeting or whatever. And then we will send the right people to the meeting so that we are fully represented in this province.

So now we start investigating. Now they are making a big noise about the Premier is not there and the Minister is not there, so we interrogate. This is a Friday, this is a Friday ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Hon members, order.

The PREMIER: This is a Friday and an official National Assembly Standing Committee oversight on crime, because this is such a serious issue in our province. And guess what? An invitation was sent! And invitation was sent to attend the National Assembly's Standing Committee on oversight on crime. It was sent at 16:11. Eleven minutes past four on the Thursday afternoon, prior to this meeting [Interjections.] and it was sent to the hon Reagen Allen. The only invite to this province gets sent to the hon Reagen Allen [Interjections.] and then, and then [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Order members.

The PREMIER: The Chairperson ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: ... Joemat Pietersen and the teams continued to rant and rave. Now .. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: ...I am saying it here, answering in this question. [Interjections.] Answering this question in the House [Interjections.] but you know, quite frankly, I have said this before and I have said this to the Opposition and we have members of the Opposition who are serious about fighting crime in this province, who are serious about bringing down the murder rate. I would expect someone from the Opposition to stand up and say, listen guys, if we are serious, let us send these invites. Let us not play politics with these spaces. Let us send these invites. Let us build these partnerships. Exactly the way that I did today when I launched our plan in this province.

I sent the full plan to the President. I sent the full plan to the National Commissioner. I then phoned the National Commissioner to have a discussion with him. Min Fritz is doing exactly the same thing with the Provincial Commissioner, with the Minister of Police and with the Public Prosecutions and the Justice cluster here in this province, because we are serious about making this province safer.

We are all elected hon members of this House and we need to act honourably and stop making politics [Interjections.] specifically if we all agree that we have got to fight crime in the best interests of the people of this province.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Premier. Hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Madam ... [Interjections.] Deputy Speaker, just on a point [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order please members, I cannot hear the member [Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN: Just a point of clarity [Interjections.] Did the Premier say [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order please, hon members [Interjection.]

Mr G BOSMAN: ...that the hon [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order please, hon members

Mr G BOSMAN: ...that the MEC was at former President Mugabe's funeral and that member Kama was at the Crime Summit? Because I remember member Kama was in Laingsburg with us. So, perhaps it was member Kama who was at Mugabe's funeral? [Laughter.][Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Premier.

The PREMIER: I mean I did, that is what I got back. [Interjections.] I got back from that meeting. That is the kind of stuff that [Interjections.] gets said in these meetings. No-no, do not worry. He has gone to Mugabe's funeral.

But quite frankly, I mean again, that is shocking. We should not have to – this is a very, very serious issue and I think we spoke about this in the beginning of this term.

I agreed with the Leader of the Opposition [Interjections.] that we need to change the tone of our Government. We need to be serious about what we want to achieve and change and there are times that we can make politics and scream and shout, but I actually want to call on this House to say, when it comes to crime, when it comes to the number of people who lose loved ones every single day in this province, we cannot politicise this.

We really, really have to work together. You know, Deputy Speaker [Interjections.] I was actually, I felt ashamed to be a South African yesterday when I was at the National Assembly when the President was telling us a story around xenophobia.

An HON MEMBER: There were no mistakes.

The PREMIER: The President was telling South Africa a story about the xenophobic attacks, condemning it, and I support him 100%. And he was telling the story about us as South Africans and he tells the story that in parts of our country the litmus test, the test of whether you should be beaten up or not, or ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Killed.



The PREMIER: ...killed or not in a xenophobic attack is whether you can pronounce a word. It was not only the President. It was also a speaker from the Northern Cape saying, can you pronounce the word †“agt-en-tagtig” [eighty-eight] and as well, you heard the President say in the language of that region, can you pronounce the word for “elbow”. If you cannot pronounce the word for “elbow” well then quite frankly the South African that asked you the question would beat you up.

But guess what, when he was telling the story, and I listened to the story and I think, oh my goodness, I mean, who are we as South Africans when that is what we do? But you know what really got me? Is half the National Assembly started laughing when he tells the story about, if you cannot pronounce the word for an “elbow”, you are now seen as someone from outside of that region, you must be beaten. We have got a lot of work to do in our country [Interjections.].

We really, really have. And we all need to stand up and take responsibility and specifically on the issue of crime, I really do appeal to this House that we really do take this seriously. That in actual fact I would really expect someone from the Opposition on the two issues that I have raised about when we get invited to these meetings. Please just speak to your colleagues. Speak to your colleagues in the [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No.

The PREMIER: ...National Assembly. Min Bheki Cele, speak to the head, to the Chair [Interjections.] Just speak to them and say ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ...let us rather just ask a question: invite. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Order, hon members.

The PREMIER: I really, really am pleading that people in this House would take this leadership role in trying to change the crime platform in our province, in our country, very, very seriously. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We are moving over to hon Wenger.

An HON MEMBER: The MEC's official is for the Zimbabwe [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Given what the Premier said a short while ago about the deployment of the SANDF, this is a short term intervention. I would like to understand what medium and long term violence and crime prevention measures the Premier and his Government will be putting into place during their term.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Premier.

The PREMIER: Okay. Thank you very much for that question. I think obviously that talks to, or first of all the military and I think we always have seen the military as a temporary stop-gap. Maybe the last thing on the military is that if you just walk the streets; if you listen to people who live in areas that the military have been deployed to; live in areas where there is a bigger focus, it is sad for me that I have not seen a drastic reduction in the murder numbers. They did dip and they are back up at around about an average of 50 per weekend in the Metro area, which is lower than the sort of 75 that it was peaking at, but at least a little bit lower, and many people are reporting, it feels a little bit safer.

I must say, I was on a late night radio show the other night, around the military deployment and the request and it was interesting to listen to the phone calls that were coming in and specifically coming in from the Metro areas that were not of the 15 hotspot areas.

Parts of Khayelitsha, parts of Nyanga. People are saying, please, please, please, we need to make sure the military come and what about getting military to some of our areas? And you can feel that desperation in people's voices. You can feel it, that people really, really want us to create an environment that we can build a safer society.

So it is a temporary measure, but we have to do whatever we can, while that temporary measure is effective or ineffective, whether it gets down to strategy and gets the measurements in place and we can see the different

things that blitzes in programs and management; but whether that happens or not, what we have also got to do at the same time is put our own interventions in place. And that is what I announced today. Those 3 000 extra officers on the ground, so that we can actually help with putting the numbers right.

We have also got an indication from Minister Bheki Cele that he will redeploy a further 1 000 police officers to our region by the end of the year. Suddenly what that does is, over the next couple of months and moving into middle of next year, we start to build the numbers to what is probably getting more to even what Minister Bheki Cele's target is of population ratio to police, because we really are starting to boost those numbers at local government level. Now through this political intervention and provincial intervention of the extra 3 000 and another 1 000 coming from the Minister.

So, now you are starting to see us building part of a medium term. I think I also said, the long term is all of these other strategies that are going to be implemented, because they are starting to look at interventions at youth, etcetera. And building that value set and changing how we have rural safety and so really embedding long term programs.

But, I also want to say and maybe then in this answering the question that came earlier that the hon Herron said that I did not answer. The 3 000, it is not about a once-off. If we want to raise the money this year, we could find savings to raise the money this year. The big challenge for this Government

and the big challenge for the Minister of Finance is that once we have deployed, we need to continue with the pull-through that it goes beyond the [Inaudible.] and that is where it really starts to become difficult, because we are starting to make long term commitments.

And so this is a long term commitment. So, those individuals that are going to be employed, they will then be employed as per their existing, and what I said by the City, because the legislation and regulation do not allow us to employ police officers or safety officers. And so they will be employed by the City. We will make that transfer. They will be on the books of the City, but it is a permanent pull-through and we will commit now already for the term and I think with that program in place, and obviously, I also said we are going to measure it, and those long terms commitments that are going to come from every department, this is actually a medium going right into a long term, because we have got to get behavioural change.

The change or the crime that we are dealing with in our region as a country and as a province, it is not as if it just happened overnight. There are a whole lot of reasons. It is something that has been growing over time and so we have got to reverse those, and those things are not quick fixes. And it is not a perfect science either. There are lots of clever people who have helped us devise this plan and helped us make choices to say rather choose this than that, but you know, it is a medium to long term plan, because that is actually what we have to put in place to make change.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thanks, Premier. So we are coming to the end of Questions. I will allow one follow-up, then I would like to end because we have actually reached the 20 minutes of question-without-notice time to the Premier. We now are going to be moving over to Statements by the members, in terms of Rule 145. I recognise the DA.

### **STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS**

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, the biggest challenge that the Human Settlements has, has always been the issue of its database and I am so happy as a Standing Committee Chairperson to inform this House that the Western Cape Department of Human Settlements has embarked on a pilot project for housing database verification and registration drives in the George Municipality area this past weekend.

Over a period of two days, 3 290 residents participated in registering, updating and verifying their details on the housing database. Housing remains a pertinent issue, due to an ever-increasing population size and demand. It is crucial that this Government prioritise a radical and integrated approach in housing delivery.

A first step towards achieving this is through encouraging citizens of the Western Cape to take personal responsibility and to ensure the accuracy of housing waiting lists. Given the launch of the project in the George Municipality, it is important that this continues in the other areas around the

province to ensure that no community is left behind.

It is particularly imperative in communities that have been affected by illegal land occupation and growing demands, without overlooking vulnerable groups and those currently on the waiting lists. The Department of Human Settlements through this pilot project has demonstrated their commitment to accelerating the delivery of housing.

In addition to this, residents of the province are encouraged to visit their local libraries and housing offices to obtain application forms, if they wish to receive housing opportunities. As such, I commend Minister Tertius Simmers and his Department for undertaking this important project in preparation for the full rollout later this year.

The DA Western Cape Government remains committed to delivering sustainable human settlements in an open opportunity society for all. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, time is up. Thank you. I see the ANC. Hon Smith.

Mr D SMITH: The DA's implosion in continuing an unspectacular and just yesterday ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Sit down, you have said that [Interjection.]

Mr D SMITH: ...we have seen the DA [Interjections.] still in a tailspin spiral.

An HON MEMBER: In a what?

Mr D SMITH: In the two by-elections [Interjections.] the DA suffered severe losses and it contributes to the downward trend we have seen of late. In Cederberg Ward 3, Maxwell Heyns is the new councillor.

†'n AGB LID: Baie geluk!

[An HON MEMBER: Congratulations!]

Mr D SMITH: Where the ANC grew from 35% to 58%. [Interjections.] And the DA fell from 35% [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.]

Mr D SMITH: The DA fell back to 35% from 57%. [Interjections.] The DA was beaten comprehensively. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.]

Mr D SMITH: In Ward 14 of Saldanha Municipality, the DA fell from 84% support [Interjections.] to 56%, in its heartland Langebaan. The DA loses control and is no longer marketable. [Interjections.] You can fool some people [Interjection.]



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members [Interjections.]

Mr D SMITH: ...sometimes, but you cannot fool all people all of the time. To add injury to defeat ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members. I cannot hear.

Mr D SMITH: To add injury to defeat, the DA also lost the ward in the North-West to the Freedom Front Plus. [Interjections.]

†‘n AGB LID: Dit maak seer, nê!

[An HON MEMBER: It hurts, hey!]

Mr D SMITH: The ANC has said before that this space should be watched. [Interjections.] Keep a close watch on this issue as the DA is digging its grave even faster. [Interjections.] The Cederberg victory is big indeed. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members [Interjection.]

Mr D SMITH: It is now possible for the ANC to outright govern this municipality. †Nog ‘n DA-beheerde raad het geval! Nog gaan val. Hou dinge fyn dop. [Applous.] [Another DA controlled council has fallen! More are going to fall! Watch things closely. [Applause.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the EFF. [Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. The Economic Freedom Fighters [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Wait, hon members, I cannot hear a thing! Can we have some order in the House?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: [Inaudible.] protect you. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Makamba. [Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: The Economic Freedom Fighters – can I be protected Speaker, please?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Sjoe! Thank you, on Deputy Speaker. The Economic Freedom Fighters condemns the unbecoming and inhumane conduct by the City of Cape Town for evicting an 80-year old Kenneth Blaine and his son Alain from their home in Woodstock, without prior notice. On Monday 16 September 2019, Mr Blaine and his family were evicted from their home in Woodstock by the sheriff of the court [Interjections.] as a result of an eviction order granted by the Court, which was initiated by the DA-run City

of Cape Town.

Mr Blaine has lived in the Plein Street house for 43 years and has battled with the City since 1981 in order to get the title deed of his house to his name, which is currently in his mother's name. The actions of the City resulted in Mr Blaine and his son sleeping in the streets. This is despite the fact that Mr Blaine is recovering from a foot-injury which makes it difficult for him to walk or stand. And his son, who is still recovering from a motorcycle accident which occurred earlier this month.

The Economic Freedom Fighters would like to thank representatives from Reclaim the City, a non-governmental body fighting for the rights of the poor people, for supporting the Blaine family throughout their hardship. Reclaim the City also successfully interacted potential auction of the family's house, which took place on 17 September 2019 and helped uncle Kenneth Blaine and his family to get back into their house.

The actions of the City must be viewed with utter disgust and as an attempt to drive out the poor from suburbs such as Woodstock into the streets. So I move.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, I see the DA.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, vehicle tracking and fleet management group C-Track has

estimated that the South African logistics industry is worth R480 billion and according to the University of Stellenbosch and the World Bank, South Africa's logistics sector contributes an estimated 11,8% to the GDP.

As such, the recent violent attacks on truck drivers in the Western Cape and across the country are a direct attack on our national and provincial economy, directly affecting hundreds of thousands of jobs. We must address these acts of criminality as a matter of urgency if we are going to protect our residents and the logistics sector, which is a crucial contributor to the South African economy.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I am glad to see that an inter-ministerial task team has been established to deal with these crimes, but we cannot ignore the root cause of these attacks and all other forms of crime in our country. South Africans are desperate for jobs and opportunity and this desperation manifests into violent acts of crime and frustration across the country with one of the world's highest unemployment rates.

But by attacking truck drivers and disrupting our country's logistics industry, we are only seeking to set ourselves back. Investors are reluctant to bring capital to our country and dissuaded by these acts of violent crime. We must not only make use of law enforcement to stop these attacks, but we need to ensure that the root cause of crime is addressed through opportunity and growth.

Attack on truck drivers must now involve Crime Intelligence Services, to identify hotspots and provide preventative safety measures for this industry, across the province. The South African development community is largely reliant on South African logistics infrastructure such as seaports, airports and extensive roadworks to transport goods across countries and borders.

Attacks on truck drivers not only affect our country, but the economy and wellbeing of the entire region. We must address this issue as a matter of urgency or risk threatening one of our economy's most thriving industries. The safety of truck drivers from attacks, petrol bombs and intimidation from unions ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...cannot be tolerated. It is in the interest of our country, hon Deputy Speaker, and our economy to put a stop to this crisis immediately. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I move over to GOOD. Just one minute, hon Marran. We take names out of a hat. So you are on the list. Just in three statements' time. I do recognise you.

Mr P MARRAN: No problem.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is GOOD first, then ACDP and then you, hon

Marran. GOOD.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, the City with a massive affordable housing crisis, the City of Cape Town's DA government, continues to demonstrate a could-not-care-less-attitude to their constitutional obligations. Section 26 of the Constitution requires the state to take reasonable measures to achieve the progressive realisation of the right to housing. Section 26 also prohibits arbitrary evictions.

The DA Government and the City are acting unconstitutionally and grossly dishonestly. Last month the DA Government cancelled 5 viable inner-city housing projects. Between the Mayor and the Mayco member for housing, they gave four different and conflicting excuses. None of them are legitimate.

The most absurd of all was the Mayor's claim that disposing of sites without development rights is unlawful. In that same week the City advertised four sites for disposal with no development rights. The cancellation of the five inner-city housing projects is unreasonable and intentionally prevents the progressive realisation of housing.

This week the same DA Government attempted a mass sell-off of public land by way of auction to the highest bidder. This included land parcels that do have development rights. For example, there were parcels in Durbanville that were zoned general residential one, which permits medium density, low rise blocks of flats, perfect for affordable housing. Included in this wholesale of

sell-off the public properties was a house in Plein Street in Woodstock.

Mr Kenny Blaine as we have heard, has been a tenant in this house since 1976. He has paid his rent to the City every month for 43 years. I visited him yesterday. He told me that he even paid his rent for the month of September. To sell off this house, the City got an eviction order against Mr Kenny Blaine and the family and the sheriff evicted him on Monday, the day before the auction.

This is an old house in Woodstock, where the tenant is an 80-year old man, in good standing for 43 years. There can be no urgent or pressing reason for the sale of this house or the eviction. The eviction is arbitrary, and the City has violated the Constitution [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Time is up [Interjection.]

Mr B N HERRON: While the DA's election manifesto [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Time is up [Interjection.]

Mr B N HERRON: ...makes promises of spatial integration [Interjections.]  
the DA Government consciously works to entrench apartheid ideology.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you. I see the ACDP.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: It is impossible! [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Deputy Speaker [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Wait, members. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: There is another side to this story. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Leader of the Opposition [Interjections.] Chief Whip of the Opposition [Interjections.] Hon Chief Whip of the Opposition [Interjection.]

Ms L M MASEKO: You make a mess and you run away now [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Maseko. Thank you. I see you, hon member.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, it came to the fore again where there is a legal battle over the burial of an unborn child. Legislation says that a foetus up till 26 weeks and earlier is treated as medical waste. These young mothers that carry these babies up till 6 months, have no right to a burial. Deputy Speaker, in an article a young mother had a still-born baby and wanted a burial for her baby. When she got to the hospital, the baby was already given to a medical waste company.

In a separate article, another mother lost her twin girls after her pregnancy of



23 weeks, but was not allowed to bury the twins because the tiny bodies were automatically incinerated as medical waste. Speaker, the ACDP stands with these institutions that want legislation to change and the ACDP wholeheartedly believes that a foetus is a human being and should be treated with dignity and respect.

Deputy Speaker, the ACDP cannot condone that foetus younger than 26 weeks is regarded as medical waste and accordingly disposed of. This is improper and inhumane. Deputy Speaker, the ACDP is asking the provincial Minister to interact with the counterparts to have this legislation changed so that females that carry an unborn child, have closure by having a burial and say their final goodbyes. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see now hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Thanks, hon Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, the growing cause for a forensic investigation into farm worker equity schemes in the Western Cape should be supported by this House. In fact, the Legislature itself should be probed. The funding methods of the Department of Agriculture is ploughing millions into these schemes that are not serving the purpose.

Having noted that labour power was never fully compensated for in the form of wages as clearly demonstrated by the vast difference between the affluence of the farmer and the abject poverty of the farm worker, the ANC

Government introduced a system of collective ownership, based on relative equity holdings to restore the dignity of the farm worker. In the Western Cape the equity schemes are not working as the majority of the beneficiaries still live in dilapidated houses.

Agriculture in the Western Cape generates R21 billion per year .. [Interjections.] and at some stage we have bragged about a R44 billion [Inaudible.] industry in the Western Cape, of which provides 70% of the total work force in the province. Workers are not getting their share of that income. Thus we believe that landowners are using them to get BEE status.

There are also gross irregularities like Crispy Voerders in the Witzenberg, where shareholders since 2003 have not received a single dividend pay-out and then they are asked now in 2017 to sell their shares back to the company for only R30 000. Let us welcome the commitment by Deputy Minister Skwatsha to investigate these complaints on equity schemes following his meeting with farm workers in that particular area. I call on this House to consider an investigation into equity schemes and the funding of it in this province. I thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): He must just apologize for what he did [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I see the DA [Interjections.]

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, [Interjections.] although crime has [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mitchell. Hon members. Hon Mitchell. Too loud. I cannot hear hon Allen. There we go.

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I welcome the fact that the SANDF's deployment to various communities within the Western Cape has been extended for another six months. For this deployment to be successful all the various role players ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R I ALLEN: ...should play an important role. Although crime and safety has already taken centre stage today, I wish to commend the Western Cape Government under the leadership of the Premier Winde, together with the Executive and the City of Cape Town, who today unveiled the most comprehensive safety plan this country has ever seen. And when all the law enforcement officers and investigators are deployed, R1 billion will be spent towards making our province safer and the implementation of crime...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R I ALLEN: ...prevention programs. This ultimately means that we put

our money where it is most needed. [Interjections.] I would challenge the Minister of Police to join ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R I ALLEN: ...the fight towards making our province safer by ensuring that we have more boots on the ground, where the Premier also provided additional law enforcement officers. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members.

Mr R I ALLEN: I wish to call the [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: What happened to the [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You do not need jobs to [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Continue.

Mr R I ALLEN: With regard to the announcement of the extension, the General stated that the army was nobody's wish granted [Interjections.] He possibly said this to root out all political related jargon but what I would like to say is to reiterate what the Premier said, to speak [Interjections.] to ask your colleagues within the National Assembly to help in this regard because crime ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker.

Mr R I ALLEN: ...is affecting everyone. The conditions laid out by the Western Cape Government with the deployment of the army [Interjections.] is there to make this province safer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members.

Mr R I ALLEN: Is to make this province safer, because I think we can all agree that we need clear indicators [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members.

Mr P MARRAN: Are you speaking to me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No. I am just talking to all of you, so I can hear what he is saying. [Interjections.] Hon Allen, please continue.

Mr R I ALLEN: The conditions outlined by the Provincial Government, and I will reiterate, it is that we need clear indicators ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off. [Interjection.]

Mr R I ALLEN: ...of the successes and we need a measuring tool to be put in place in order to track the deployment of the army [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Is my time up?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is unfortunately up.

Mr R I ALLEN: Okay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the [Interjection.]

Mr R I ALLEN: Safety is a major concern. We need to help.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Allen. [Interjections.] Hon Marais.  
It is your chance. Are you speaking? [Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: I do not have a written speech to hand in. Am I supposed to have a written speech?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr P J MARAIS: I do not have one.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr P J MARAIS: I will pass.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marais. We finish off with the DA.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, Hon Deputy Speaker. The Western Cape province posts a plethora of iconic attractions that appeal to millions of visitors each year, such as our mix of mountains, vineyards, oceans and nature reserves. [Interjections.] It is thus important that these features are safeguarded, not only to conserve our environment for future generations but to continue growing our economy and for the betterment of the citizens of this province.

Hon Deputy Speaker, climate change and a rise in temperature, especially as we enter the fire season, is a warning that we must heed. I therefore welcome the Department of Local Government's "Fire is everyone's fight" campaign, that seeks to alleviate fire-related incidents by rolling out awareness programs and initiatives as preventative measures.

Part of these initiatives include the installation of smoke detectors in informal dwellings where to date, more than 9 000 detectors have been installed. This is of particular importance given that the people [Interjections.] ja, this is of particular importance, hon Smith, given the analysis of ex-business week, we have warned that people and properties are more likely to be affected by hot and dry conditions this season. [Interjections.]

In addition to this, the Department of Local Government's "First Hour Saves Lives" Initiative will see 21 helicopters ...[Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Where?

Mr D AMERICA: ... and specialised aircraft deployed as rapid responses to veld fires [Interjection.]

HON MEMBERS: Where?

Mr D AMERICA: ...in order to prevent further losses of life, infrastructure, the property and the environment [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, finish off please [Interjection.]

Mr D AMERICA: Prevention is better than treatment. [Interjections.] We therefore urge citizens of the Western Cape to be ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon America [Interjection.]

Mr D AMERICA: ...cautious and vigilant during this season. The DA Western Cape Government will continue to make ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you [Interjection.]



Mr D AMERICA: ...progress by taking innovative [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon America [Interjection.]

Mr D AMERICA: ...and decisive steps to make this province safe. Okay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Interjections.] That is the end of Statements. Is there a Minister who wishes to respond as contemplated in Standing Rule 145.6 for not more than 5 minutes? I see the hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. First of all I want to say something on Cederberg. I want to congratulate the ANC with their win. [Applause.] But hon Deputy Speaker what is more important is that the ANC must realise ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...that the DA took a bankrupt municipality to three years of clean audit. We all watch this space, hon Deputy Speaker. In a democracy the voters get what they deserve and I really hope that the ANC do not disappoint them [Interjections.] but I can bet you the money I do not have [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...that the ANC will disappoint again [Interjections.] because we remember four years ago when the management report ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...of Cederberg Municipality was 398 pages long. [Interjections.] Hon Deputy Speaker, to the hon Brett, I see that there is a press release from the City of Cape Town also, saying that they negotiated with this family since 2014. I do not know if he was part of that negotiations or not [Interjections.] but I take what he is saying, and I ask the hon members of GOOD and EFF to send me their motions. I will investigate it. My Department will investigate it. If they are unconstitutional he can also go to the police station and lay a charge there, but I think, as a caring Government, we cannot stand for [Interjections.] we cannot stand and put a cold shoulder towards any elderly citizens losing their houses and we will need to look into this but get the facts on the table, and not make it an emotional ...[Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: The City of Land.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...issue. We are talking to this matter now [Interjections.] and again the ANC thinks this is a joke. We will investigate that, and we will look into this and if there is any wrongdoing we need to find a way to rectify that. I thank you [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Ag, you are a very sore loser.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. [Interjections.] We now move over to Notices of Motion. Are there any motions where notice is given? I see the hon Baartman.

### **MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of special economic zones on the Western Cape, I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the scourge of crime in Western Cape province, following the release by the National Minister of Police, hon Bheki Cele.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any more notices of motion? I see the hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the decline in the matric results in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Any other motions? Hon Baartman.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates Waste-to-Energy plans in the Western Cape in order to secure clean and renewable energy alternatives for the province.  
I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the ongoing implosion of the DA at local government level. [Interjections.]

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Any other notices of motion? [Interjections.] Last call. Any other notices of motion? Okay. We are moving then over to Motions without Notice in terms of Rule 150. Hon Marais.

## **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

Mr P MARAIS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the results of yesterday's victory by the Freedom Front in Potchefstroom, recording 677 votes against the DA's 489. This resounding defeat that the DA shows, the Freedom Front Plus growth among voters to have increased since 2016 by 56% and the DA's decline by 65%. We further note that this represents the second successive by-election victory ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr P MARAIS:

...of the Stilfontein against the DA, since May 2019. Both these seats were previously held by the DA in 2016. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved? [Interjections.] Are there objections? [Interjections.] The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I am moving over to this side. Hon America.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that,

1. The Department of Local Government in the Western Cape was the overall winner of two awards for the most outstanding province in Thusong Centre Coordination and outstanding mobile Thusong Centre at provincial level at this year's National Thusong Service Excellence Awards held on 17 September 2019;
2. We further note that Thusong Centre's Green Government Services and Information closest to the most vulnerable communities and the

impact and critical role that it played in service delivery, reaching over 1,3 million people in the Western Cape this year;

3. This House further extends our congratulations to the Laingsburg, Riversdale and Mossel Bay Thusong Centres, who emerge as the big winners for their partnerships;
4. Lastly Madam Deputy Chair, we further note that the Department of Local Government under the leadership of Min Bredell is committed to continue working on improving the lives [Interjections.] of the citizens of the Western Cape and ...[Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Too long! It is too long!

Mr D AMERICA:

...enhancing access to services, I so move. [Interjections.]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] There are objections. Hon America, that is a little bit long. I know you do come from the National Assembly. [Interjections.] But I would like you to look at your future motions. They need to be shorter. I see the ANC, hon Smith. I go one side, on side.

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the DA's plan to quickly get rid of the George municipal manager, Mr Trevor Botha, failed and that this is the umpteenth time the DA in the Southern Cape destabilised their own governance and tries to oust people put in positions of power. Thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections? There are objections. Motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] Hon Mackenzie. [Interjection.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the comprehensive safety plan, valued at R1 billion, announced by Premier Winde, which aims to reduce crime and make the Western Cape safer; further notes that it is the most comprehensive plan ever produced by any province in South Africa and ask that all communities work with the Western Cape Government to ensure the effective implementation of this plan. I so move.  
[Interjections.]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member, I see you.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, Hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the Constitutional Court of South Africa has found that it is inconsistent with our Constitution to spank children at home and that it is now illegal to assault children in the name of discipline. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] Any objections to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Over to the DA, hon Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that on Saturday, 14 September 2019, the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport honoured the Western Cape's top achieving sports people at the annual provincial sports awards in Pinelands; these awards are the culmination of a process of regional awards ceremonies where winners in the categories from all six regions

went through to compete for the top honours as the province's best; that this House congratulates all the winners in the various categories and wish them all of the best as they compete in the National Sports Awards later this year. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself?

The motion is agreed to. Hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that on 13 September 2019, a fire broke out at both Tygerberg Hospital and Mitchell's Plain Day Hospital. The details of what caused these fires have not been made public, even today; further notes that these incidences left patients, staff and society shocked and traumatised; members of society make use of public hospital facilities as a place of safety and to get assistance with regards to their health and not to be subjected to further trauma; the EFF further calls on the Minister of Health to investigate the cause of these fires and to take appropriate steps to measure in making sure that the public health facility remains a safe space for the people to receive assistance with regards to their health. Thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] Objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] I see this side. Anybody? Over to member Wendy Philander, and then I move over to you.

Ms W PHILANDER: Thank you, Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the passing of the late Emeritus Professor David Saunders, founding director of the School of Public Health at UWC and the founding member and Co-Chair of the People's Health Movement; that this House shares the loss to the fraternity and expresses its utmost gratitude for the contributions of the late Prof Saunders; that this House further extends its sincere condolences and sympathy to his wife, children, family and colleagues. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Bans.

Ms A BANS: Thank you Hon Deputy Speaker for noting me. I move without notice:

That the House notes a boy of seven years drowned in an unused swimming pool at the Tygerberg Hospital over the weekend; calls for this tragedy to be properly investigated and report submitted to the said Legislature; that the House' commiserations are conveyed to the family and friends of the victim. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Are there any objections to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. We go back over to hon Smith.

†'n AGBARE LID: Nou weer een *motion*. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: Now one motion again. [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am listening.

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the Cape Town fire fighters embark on an industrial protest against the employer, who they claim is not fairly paying them proper wages, which places under suspicion claims that Cape Town is ready for the fire season. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Allen and then hon Christians.

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move a motion without notice:

That the House congratulates the Ndlovu Youth Choir on their spectacular performance during season 13 of America's Got Talent; even though they were not named as overall winners they certainly made this country proud as they championed the potential of youth in our country.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Grade 6 pupil, Azraa Mallick, age 11, of Arcadia Primary School, Bonteheuwel, that was crowned top achiever in her grade; her achievement was so significant that she was recognised by the Head of the Department and her teacher, Ms Rowena Hermans, for her work ethic and enthusiastic behaviour; according to her teacher

Azraa displayed two leadership skills, as always willing to assist fellow classmates. The ACDP wishes her well. Thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? Motion agreed to. Hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice [Interjections.]:

That the House notes Cape Town based Communicare housing agency struggle amidst concerns that it is not able to secure its property from hi-jacking and other forms of illegal occupation and calls on this institution to make sure it takes care of rental stock in order to be able to collect money to fund or cross-subsidise its social housing program. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without

notice:

That the House notes with shock that while the DA claims to be committed ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marran.

Mr M KAMA:

...to the fight against crime, a DA councillor Seth Sekhokho from Rand West City Local Municipality ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M KAMA:

... was arrested for armed robbery; call on the authorities to ensure that this councillor receives maximum prison sentence if found guilty. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] Motion is objected to. It will be printed – order members! The motion is objected. It will be printed on the Order Paper.

[Interjections.] Hon Mvimbi. Order members. [Interjections.] Hon member Mvimbi, do not start yet, please. [Interjections.] Order members, so that we can actually hear the speaker. Hon member you may begin.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that less than a third of CCTV cameras at rail stations work and that this does not assist properly in the war against violence and vandalism that destroy our infrastructure and services on a daily basis; therefore the House calls on Metrorail and PRASA to urgently fix and upgrade this vital protection tool. [Interjections.]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: No objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections. Any objections to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Back over to hon Kama. [Applause.] Hon Kama [Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:



That the House notes President Cyril Ramaphosa again conceded to the DA calls for the deployment of the SANDF in the Cape Flats drugs and gangs ridden areas; that we guard against regarding this as a permanent solution; instead of complaining, encourage the Provincial Government to bring forth the inputs of the imagination they had when they called for the SANDF to come and work in the Western Cape.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] Any objections to the motion itself?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Sorry, Deputy Speaker, can I just raise an issue?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an ...[Interjection.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: We just want to be clear. Is that in his statement or is that something else he read?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I cannot ask for explanation here. I see that there has been objection by the Premier.

The PREMIER: I object to a really †*swak* [poor] statement!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So, it will be printed on the Order Paper. Member

Nkondlo first, and then I see you over on this side.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the DA is busy closing ranks to protect its national leader Mmusi Maimane from himself and his lies as he first claimed to have bought a house of R3,85 million in the Southern Suburbs and now he changed his story to say he leases a house; could the DA play open cards with the people of this province to tell them precisely what the real facts are and we see the safety plan of the Premier working, starting with Mmusi Maimane.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] There is objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. I think I saw someone here? No, and then I see hon Smith. Sorry hon member Mvimbi. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are lying! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Smith. Order please.

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes Cape Town is again at its usual shenanigans by selling off prime inner-city land to the highest bidder under the guise of development while apartheid spatial inequality remains largely unaddressed and which angers residents like those in Green Point. [Interjections.] I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections?

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Mvimbi. [Interjections.] Hon Smith, can you take your seat please?

An HON MEMBER: Objections! He has got a [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Smith, please take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon Smith, please take your seat. Thank you, hon member Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that 27 commuters were injured when a Metrorail train derailed near Bellville recently. [Interjections.]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Applause.] Any objections to the motion itself? The motion is agreed to. Hon member Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the ANC leader Marius Fransman has reached an agreement with his victim and it is noted that he had sexually harassed her. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] Are there any objections to the motion itself? [Interjections.] The motion is agreed to. [Interjections.] Moving over. Are there any more motions without notice? No motions without notice? There were no objections. There was no objection. [Interjections.]

Members, that concludes motions without notice. [Interjections.] If I am clear. We will now move to the Order of the Day. The Secretary will read the Order of the Day.

†Die SEKRETARIS: Oorweging van die verslag van die Staande Komitee oor

Finansies, Ekonomiese Geleentehede en Toerisme oor die aanbevelings vir die aanstelling van kandidate vir die Wes-Kaapse Raad op Dobbelary en Wedrenne, gedateer 23 Augustus 2019.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows:]*

[The SECRETARY: Consideration of the report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on the recommendations for the appointment of candidates for the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board, dated 23 August 2019.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I will now afford parties an opportunity to make a declaration if they so wish of two minutes each. I recognise the ANC.

An HON MEMBER: No, they were not here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: They were not here? [Interjections.] Okay. I am following the process. I then recognise the EFF. [Interjections.] Okay, members, I am following the process. I now recognise GOOD. No? I recognise the Freedom Front Plus. [Interjections.] No? I recognise the ACDP. And I recognise the DA.

†'n AGB LID: Ons wen!

[An HON MEMBER: We win!]

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Four vacancies occurred on the Western Cape Gambling ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order please.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: ...and Racing Board due to the upcoming expiry of Board Memberships at the end of March 2019, and one resignation due to [Interjections.] an appointment [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: ... of HOD to the Department of Finance. The Provincial Treasury advertised the vacant board member positions in the *Provincial Gazette*, Vukani, the *Mail & Guardian*, *Die Burger* and *Weekend Argus* on 26, 27 and 28 July 2018, as well as on the Provincial Government's job portal.

The committee was requested by a letter of referral sent on 30 July 2019, to the office of the Speaker at the WCPP to recommend candidates to fill the four vacancies and the matter was referred to the committee on the ATC on 2 August 2019.

Section 3(1) of the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Act, as amended, stipulates that quotes to the board shall consist of seven members, appointed on a part time basis by the Executive Council in accordance with the

prescribed procedure which shall provide for public participation in the nomination of candidates for appointment, provided that the Standing Committee of the Provincial Legislature responsible for this act, shall evaluate all candidates as to their suitability for appointment, closed on 6 August 2019. The Provincial Treasury briefed the committee on the process leading to the short-listing. The committee was provided with a list of 13 candidates to evaluate and we resolved to evaluate the candidates through an interview process. One candidate declined the interview as she had already accepted another position on the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board.

The committee, having interviewed 12 candidates, reached consensus and recommended candidates in alphabetical order as contained in the report, to be submitted for consideration by the House and thereafter submitted to the Minister of Finance for consideration by the Executive. The Committee further resolved to review current legislation and that Provincial Treasury should review the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Regulations with specific regards to the timelines afforded to the Provincial Parliament. I so move.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. That concludes the debate on this report. Are there any objections to the report being adopted? No objections. Agreed to. That concludes the business of the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 19:11.