
THURSDAY, 19 MARCH 2015

The House met at 14:15

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The SPEAKER: Order! Before we start with the proceedings of the day I would like to request members to rise and observe a moment of silence at the sudden and untimely passing away of the National Minister of Public Service and Administration Mr Collins Chabane and his two protectors, namely Sergeant Lesiba Sekele and Sergeant Lawrence Lentsoane.

[Moment of silence observed.]

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLING AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p

The SPEAKER: You may be seated. I recognise the Chief Whip.

(Notice of motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 18, the hours of sittings on Tuesday, 24 March 2015; Wednesday, 25 March 2015 and Thursday, 26 March 2015 shall be 10:00 to adjournment.

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections? Agreed to. I recognise the Chief Whip.

(Notice of motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the following members be appointed in terms of Standing Rule 24 to act as temporary Chairpersons:

Joseph, D

Marais, A J D

Kivedo, B D

Gillion, M N

Davids, S W

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections? Agreed to. Chief Whip.

(Notice of motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That in terms of section 6(1) of the *Remuneration of Public Office Bearers Act*, 1998, (Act 20 of 1998) the upper limits of the salary and allowances of the Premier as proclaimed by the President of the Republic of South Africa by Proclamation No 5, 2015, published in *Government Gazette* 38470 of 13 February 2015, be determined as the salary and allowances of the Premier of the Western Cape with effect from 1 April 2014.

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections? Agreed to. [Interjections.] Order, order members. We now proceed to Interpellations as printed on the Question Paper. I recognise the hon Minister Schäfer.

INTERPELLATIONS:

Quality of teaching in the Province

1. Mr B D Kivedo asked the Minister of Education:

What (a) measures does her Department have in place to improve the quality of teaching at schools in the province and (b) are the plans to update all language and mathematics strategies?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you Madam Speaker and thank you hon member Mr Kivedo.

(a) The WCED has a number of programmes in place. The improving of the quality of teaching at schools in the province such as the High School Improvement Programme and LitNum projects. The programmes include some of the following key interventions:

- Providing schools with detailed analysis of results to assist with planning interventions;
- Identification and formal notification of underperforming schools in terms of the South African Schools Act section 16(A) and section 58(B);
- Putting in place support and intervention measures through School Improvement Plans and approved District Improvement Plans.
- Interventions in the LitNum programme have focused on improving the quality of teaching in literacy and numeracy.
- Interventions in the High School Intervention Programme have focused on both learner support and educator development. Teachers have also been supported through in-service training courses offered at Cape Teaching and Leadership Institute.

The HOD holds quarterly review meetings with each district to monitor and track performance. The HOD has also personally visited underperforming schools to support improvement strategies.

(b) The process of changing and updating the LitNum strategy to a language and a mathematics strategy began at the end of 2014. The development of the strategies is currently in an advanced stage. In the next week the strategies

will undergo scrutiny by outside experts and the plans will be finalised within the next month. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Thank you Madam Speaker, I thank Minister Debbie Schäfer. In terms of quality of education I think we have to distinguish very clearly between the quantifiable or infrastructural issues where we look at schools as being spaces of learning and then institutional capacity regarding human and social capital development, and I think that is where the Western Cape really shines in terms of focusing on human and capital development in terms of quality, delivering quality education, not changing numbers but in terms of transformation also as a cornerstone of nation building, restitution, so the broad national question...

What is also evident is upskilling and re-skilling of teacher educators, and that is an extremely important thing, keeping people posted in terms of the latest developments. As we know we are living in a technological age, technological era with fast and furious changes taking place [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are speaking about the Minister, not the [Inaudible.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: ...and we have to keep our learners up to date [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr B D KIVEDO: ...and up to skill, and what is also important...
[Interjection.] ...for quality learning is the articulation aspect and also the
affordability aspect of linking the teaching to the workplace and also
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr B D KIVEDO: ...making it relevant in terms of pupil or learner retention
as another issue. I think quality education can only be contextualised in terms
of space where there is discipline and where there is mutual respect and
where teaching and learning are being valued. But most crucial, Madam
Speaker and hon members, is the whole issue of developmental education,
that we are capacitating and empowering our learners for the world of work
in terms of career pathing and also in terms of adapting to the changing
circumstances in the country.

I want to say and, I want to make it quite clear, that in terms of these
imperatives and perimeters that the Western Cape Education has up to now
succeeded in terms of achieving this. [Interjections.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Wag 'n bietjie!

An HON MEMBER: But why did you ask that question then?

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Wag 'n bietjie!

Mr B D KIVEDO: They succeeded in achieving this and I am extremely proud to announce that we are even going to improve. [Interjections.] We are not satisfied with what we have achieved. There is still room for improvement and the proof of the pudding lies in the eating... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Member, your time has expired.

Mr B D KIVEDO: ...and it is going to happen. Thank you so much, Madam Speaker. [Time expired.]

An HON MEMBER: Ag please!

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Baie dankie. Praat soos 'n LUR. [Gelag.]

The SPEAKER: I see the hon Botha. Order please members. Hon member Ms Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Madam Speaker, in July last year a study reported that matric maths teachers in KwaZulu Natal performed dismally when tested with a past matric maths paper. Out of the 253 teachers tested in the province 57% [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Ms L J BOTHA: ...57% was the average result with a quarter of them obtaining below 39%. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: You know, that is embarrassing to everybody else...

Ms L J BOTHA: The question then surfaces [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members.

Ms L J BOTHA: Are teachers competent and fit to provide quality education to our learners? We commend the Department on the interventions and measures put in place to improve the quality of teachers in this province the Western Cape. However, we are still awaiting the assessment of maths teachers to be determined by the Minister Angie Motshekga as indicated by her in her written reply.

An HON MEMBER: We do not have that Minister.

Ms L J BOTHA: Professor Jonathan Jansen said it is the first time the Department recognises that we have a problem with the state of knowledge of maths teachers, but yet we are waiting for the assessment. A serious concerted effort to improve the national quality of teachers is essential for the future of South Africa as a whole. I thank you.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: [Onduidelik.] Jy moet nou kom luister!

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Olivier. [Interjection.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Nou luister nou!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, you have a member on the floor.
Hon member Mr Olivier.

†UMnu R T OLIVIER: Enkosi Somlomo. Asiyazi ke ukuba lo mbuzo ubuzelwani ngoba umntu owubuzayo uwuphendule . Somlomo kwingxelo ebesiyifumana apha kwi-five year strategic yale department sibona sibona igrade 3 mathematics isihla igrade 9 kwi-language kwiminyaka emibini elandelayo iyehla kodwa namhlanje sijonga iKZN. Silibile ukujonga apha ngaphakathi. Sithetha Somlomo nge-technological era esithi sifundise abantu nootitshala bethu kodwa kulo nyaka siya kuwo kwi-APP sibona ngo-2015/2016 zero target kule nto kuthiwa makufundiswe iititshala zikwazi ukufundisa kule nto intsha kuthiwa yi-e-learning kodwa sithi sifuna kuyiwe kwi-new techonological era. Somlomo siphinde sibone xa sithetha ngokufundiswa kweetitshala sisabona kweli phondo ukuba sizama ukuza neempendula xa sijonge i-39000 abapasileyo kubhale abantu abayi-47 000 le nto kuthiwa yi-matric pass rate nayo simane siyibaleka kodwa sithi eli phondo liphondo elihamba ngaphambili ekufundiseni kodwa siyabona ukuba siya sibuya umva apho besikhona. Okwesithathu, Somlomo kwakulo mbuzo ubuzwayo siyabona ukuba unational unestrategic plan anaso esibizwa ukuba

yi-NSL (National Strategy for Learner Attainment) kukho ke apho iimpawu eziyi-27 esibona ukuba kweli phondo akukho nto ivelayo icacisa ukuba baza kukwazi njani ukuhlangabezana nezi njongo beleli sebe. Ngoko ke Somlomo sizama ukuthi kwezi titshala zikulo nyaka ziyi-600 eziqeqeshwayo kule e-learning kwizikolo eziyi-1 4 ... esinootitshala ... singabuza ke thina singulo mbutho ukuba lo target asiyo-resiphi yedisaster na.

*Mr R T OLIVIER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. We do not know the reason for this question because it has already been answered. Madam Speaker in a report we got about the five year strategic plan for this department we have seen grade 3 mathematics and grade 9 language results going down in two consecutive years but today we are looking at KZN. We have forgotten to look inside our province.

Madam Speaker, we are talking about a technological era that we teach our people and our teachers but this year in the APP we have seen zero targets in 2015/2016 to teach our teachers so they are able to teach e-learning but we say we must move to a technological era. Again, Madam Speaker, we see when we talk about teaching teachers in this province we try to get answers and we have seen the 39 000 pupils who passed when it was 47 000 who wrote the exams which we call a pass rate and we often run away from it saying that this province is the leading province in teaching but it is lagging behind now. Thirdly, Madam Speaker, there was a question on whether national government has a strategic plan in place which is called NSL (National Strategy for Learner Attainment) where there are 27 goals which

we see in this province. There is nothing that shows how they are going to meet these goals as the department. So, Madam Speaker, we trying to say: of 600 teachers that are being trained this year in e-learning in 1 4 – schools – we ask as this party if that target is not a recipe for disaster.

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired. Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, thank you very much. It is so sad that this member who sits on the Education Committee clearly did not bother reading his books [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You are just imagining it!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...because he would have picked up from the retention strategy that the Western Cape is by far the best in the country. [Interjections.] It is by far the best in the country. [Interjections.] I just thought I would just help him right there, because he did not listen to the presentations as given in the Committee, clearly, so next time, member, I will re-school you in the Committee when you appear, but let me get back to the Speaker. [Interjections.]

Madam Speaker, we are fortunate to have some of the best teachers in the Western Cape and I appreciate what the Minister is saying in terms of e-learning and strategies, but part of what we need to do as well-teaching is

not only the job of the teachers. There is parental responsibility. There is a community responsibility and you can have the best strategies, the best e-learning in place, but if parents do not pitch up for SGB meetings and parents do not partake in school meetings then it would not help us. Some of these members are with us on the oversight committees where some schools have 10% of parents pitching up for school committee meetings. So that is an important matter. For the Minister and the Department what you are doing, it is well done on the new strategies that you are putting in place. We are certainly looking forward to it and it is exciting what is coming, but again it is up to the parents who have a big responsibility to play, and also the members on that side of the House need to encourage those parents to attend the meetings and to participate in SGBs. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired, hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you Madam Speaker. [Time expired.]
[Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We must have SGB dates.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Kivedo. [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: You can ask them for it. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] the dates for SGBs. [Interjections.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: Madam Speaker [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Schools!

The SPEAKER: Order please, members. There is a speaker on the floor.

Mr B D KIVEDO: I think hon members, the teaching and learning and development is not only the core critical function and responsibility of government but it is a matter of a community buy-in process and I think that is where the quality and the qualitative aspect comes in when the community takes ownership and becomes proud of their assets. I think, furthermore, the capacitation of teachers, back to my fellow member Olivier, is a very important issue. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You have through the Minister [Inaudible.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: The same applies to School Governing Bodies as well, so that they can also get on par with the workings and the functions and strategies and policies of school. Furthermore, I want to say and this is a plea, that we should also look in terms of quality learning in vocational and skills and trade schools, that we bring alive the teaching, the theoretical part with the practical part, in-house training and learning in the workplace, but I think the critical issue is that each one should teach one and that we should look, actually look at the re-schooling society that each space and every

space should become a learning space... [Interjections.] ...and it is not only for the DA but for you as ANC and the EFF and ACDP as well...

An HON MEMBER: Especially for the [Inaudible.]

Mr B D KIVEDO: ...for us as South Africans to become proud South Africans because most of our pathologies that we are confronted with in this country, crime and all these vices, the only solution is education and education for the nation and inspiration for the nation, to become proud South Africans. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Kivedo, your time has expired.

Mr B D KIVEDO: And I end off, an open opportunity society... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo, your time has expired.

Mr B D KIVEDO: ...and by saying an open opportunity society... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo your time has expired.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Well! [Time expired.] Thank you Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister Schäfer. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you Madam Speaker. I am going to start at the end. I will not talk about education for the nation, but one thing I will talk about is starting with hon member Mr Olivier about training for our e-learning. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No, you must now speak about education.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Excuse me. How are our teachers supposed to teach and use e-learning in their curriculum if they do not get trained, unlike some other provinces in this country who make huge announcements about e-learning roll-outs, do not discuss it with their administration so it does not actually get into the APP or [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members!

Mr R T OLIVIER: There is a zero tolerance.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Our e-learning strategy is completely and utterly... [Interjections.] I am responding to what was raised in the speeches. Do not look at that. [Interjections.] Our e-learning programme has been very carefully planned and very carefully costed so that it is workable [Interjections.] Khanya Labs are not exactly in the e-strategy if you have read it.

An HON MEMBER: They are not.

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Can I please, thank you, Madam Speaker. It is very well costed and it is in the APP. It is in our budgeting process so it will be delivered. We are monitoring it very closely. It is realistic and the training is completely realistic. It is not at all a recipe for disaster. It has already started. We have already trained our first group of principals and we are very excited about the roll-out.

As far as the NSLA is concerned, hon member Mr Olivier, I stand corrected but if I recall correctly from our HOD the Western Cape is in fact the only province that has made any representations to the DBE on the national strategy, the SLA, the strategic learning strategy for learner retainment. We are the only province. The others did not even bother to do anything about it, but one thing we do need to understand is that we are not a sub-branch of the DBE. We have a concurrent competence in the Western Cape and which does not seem to be actually understood by some people in the Department of Basic Education including the Minister and Deputy Minister... [Interjections.] ...and we know how to separate party and state and unlike Deputy Minister Surty who yesterday claimed to open a school in Uitsig with members in ANC T-shirts which I will be taking up with him. [Interjections.] As far as the maths... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members, order.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Because it is unacceptable and you should know better. That is why. It is setting a bad example. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: As far as Grade 3 maths is concerned I do not recall the figures, I do not have them with me. It was not the subject of the discussion but maths is one of our number one priorities. It is one of our... [Interjections.] Sorry Madam Speaker, can I please be protected?

The SPEAKER: Order please members, there is a speaker on the floor.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Maths is one of our number one priorities and we are including it in great detail in our maths strategy as well as our English strategy. I hear an irritating noise in my right ear, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, do not pose [Inaudible.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: Of course, I can still teach her to listen. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Teachers are integral to the success of

maths in our province and they will be [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: I will teach you a lesson. You must wait. You are going to get the lesson.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Sorry Madam Speaker, I cannot speak.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, you are out of order please. There is a speaker on the floor.

Mr M N PAULSEN: [Inaudible.] They ordered me on that side.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, compose yourself please.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Those people [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: You may proceed hon member Ms Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you Madam Speaker. I know he gets very excited about education, but I think he needs to control himself.

Mr M N PAULSEN: I do not get excited.

The SPEAKER: Order hon member Mr Paulsen! You are out of line!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. The maths strategy is going to focus very much on improving. We have been improving since 2009 before which time all of our key indicators were reducing. They have been improving every year since 2009 and we are focusing on intensive ways to make sure that they go up even further from now onwards.

Quality of teachers, yes, thank you very much, hon member Ms Botha. The quality of our teachers is overall very good and we have very committed teachers in the province, who also play a huge role in our learner retention and take great pride in assisting our learners to stay in school often at great cost personally and physically literally and figuratively in putting in extra hours.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Schäfer, your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. [Time expired.]
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. That concludes Interpellation 1. We move to Interpellation 2. I see the hon Minister Bredell.

Mandate of the Western Cape Disaster Management Centre

- 2. Mr L H Max asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

What is the mandate of the Western Cape Disaster Management Centre for potential disaster risks that may occur or threaten to occur in the province?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie agb Speaker. Baie dankie vir die interpellasie.

Die Wet op Rampbestuur 2000, nommer 57 van 2000, fokus op die vermindering van ramprisiko, die voorkoming en die verligting en slegs wanneer die bedreiging nie voorkom of verlig kan word nie moet ons voorberei vir en reageer op die gevaar wat 'n ramp kan veroorsaak. Die eerste stap in die beplanning van 'n effektiewe ramprisiko verminderingsprogram is die onderneming van 'n ramprisiko assessering. Ramprisiko assessering ondersoek die waarskynlikheid en die uitkomst van verwagte rampe wat verwante gevare en toestande van kwesbaarheid ondersoek. Die provinsie het 'n uitgebreide ramprisiko profiel. Hierdie profiel was gebaseer op 'n uitgebreide risiko- en kwesbaarheidstudie op metro-, distriks en op munisipale vlak.

Die Wes-Kaap Rampbestuur het al die distriksmunisipaliteite ondersteun in die opgradering van hul risiko assessering. Die Wes-Kaap Rampbestuursentrum het as deel van die proses 'n gestandaardiseerde ramprisiko assesseringsmetodologie ontwikkel om 'n eenvormige benadering

tot ramprisiko profielbestuur in die provinsie te verseker.

Die gestandaardiseerde ramprisiko assesseringsmetodologie bestaan uit twee komponente. Een, 'n wetenskapgebaseerde risiko assessering en twee, 'n gemeenskapsgebaseerde ramprisiko assessering. Die distriksvlak ramprisiko assessering het munisipaliteite in staat gestel om hul risiko te prioritiseer en nodige risiko verminderinge en gebeurlikheidsplanne te implementeer. Die Wes-Kaap Rampbestuursentrum het in samewerking met die Distrik Rampbestuursentrums plaaslike munisipaliteite ondersteun met die ontwikkeling van gemeenskapsgebaseerde mikro-assesseringe in die poging om die identifisering en die implementering van risiko verminderingprojekte in plaaslike munisipaliteite te verseker.

Die gemeenskapsgebaseerde mikro-assessering fokus op wyksvlak en behels uitgebreide openbare deelname omdat die assessering in 'n werkwinkelomgewing gedoen word. Die gebruik van hierdie metodologie stel munisipaliteite in staat om 'n idee te kry van die aard, die ligging en die omvang van die gevare wat gemeenskappe affekteer. As gevolg van hul hoë risiko vir blootstelling aan rampe het die Wes-Kaap Rampbestuursentrum tot op hede ondersteuning verleen aan die plaaslike munisipaliteite van George, Bitou en Mosselbaai met die uitvoering van gemeenskapsgebaseerde mikro-assessering.

Die Wes-Kaap Rampbestuursentrum is tans besig om in samewerking met die toepaslike distriksbestuursentrums ondersteuning te verleen aan die plaaslike

distrikte van Knysna, Cederberg, Bergrivier en Beaufort-Wes met die uitvoering van gemeenskapsgebaseerde mikro risiko assessering. Die risiko profiel is beskikbaar op die webgebaseerde rampbestuur besluitnemingsmodel, Disaster Management Decision Support Tool, wat toegang bied... [Tussenwerpsel.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Bredell, you may conclude.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie. [Tyd verstreke.]

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Max.

Mnr L H MAX: Dankie Agb Speaker. Dankie vir die Minister se inset hieromtrent. [Tussenwerpsel.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Die nuwe [Onduidelik.]

Mnr L H MAX: Dis ook dan 'n gegewe feit dat natuurrampe [Tussenwerpsels.] ...nie ras, klas of politieke verbintenisse ken nie. Dit slaan almal ewe hard.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Jy lyk soos 'n nuwe [Onduidelik.]

Mnr L H MAX: In die winter oorstroom plakkershutte. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

Mnr L H MAX: In die droë uitgerekte somers verwoes brande huis en hut asook Moeder Natuur rondom ons.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Mooi!

Mnr L H MAX: Die armes van die armstes word die ergste geraak deur hierdie rampe [Tussenwerpsel.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is true.

Mnr L H MAX: ...want daar is min, indien enige, sosiale ondersteuning. Wanneer die watervoorraad opdroog soos ons destyds en steeds in Ladismith ervaar... [Tussenwerpsel.] ...Zoar, Amalienstein en Kannaland word mense se grondwetlike reg op toegang tot water en veral skoon water erg geraak.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Wat het dit te doen nou met [Onduidelik.]

Mnr L H MAX: ...en enersyds die natuurbronne wat nie meer aan die mense se behoeftes voldoen nie, maar [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mnr M N PAULSEN: White caps.

The SPEAKER: Order please, members.

Mnr L H MAX: Maar dit is dan ook so dat plaaslike regerings
[Tussenwerpsels.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hy is uit die lyf uit.

Mnr L H MAX: ...plaaslike regerings aan die behoeftes moet voorsien van die mense in wie se diens hulle is. Ons het ook so pas die vernietigende vuur ervaar wat in die Kaap in die Skiereiland heers of geheers het sowel as Stellenbosch waar fauna en flora en veral fynbosgewasse en eiendom verwoes was en in die poging om hierdie brand te blus het ons 'n ervare en hoogs-bekwame vlieënier met die naam Bees Marais verloor...

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, ja, that is [Inaudible.]

Mnr L H MAX: En daar is ook ander brandweermanne wat hulle lewens in hierdie bestryding van hierdie dreigement verloor het. Dit is dan ook 'n gegewe dat die verskillende vlakke van regering nood- en aksieplanne in plek moet hê om die impak van natuurrampe sover moontlik die hoof te kan bied en in die stryd beskerming te bied aan mense, eiendom, plante en diere.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Mnqasela.

†UMnu MNQASELA: Enkosi Somlomo ndifuna ukuba silisebe siyi-Standing Committee on Local Government sikhe sathatha inxaxheba kwi-oversight apho

besijonga ukuba umsebenzi esiwufumana kwizinto ezibhalwe phantsi ebantwini phaya on the ground kunjalo na, savuya sibuye sincoma ke sonke siyiKomiti siqhwaba izandla sisithi hayi iyasebenza le department sathi huntshu Mphathiswa kweli Sebe Local govern ngakumbi abantwana abasebenza nzima kwi-Working on Fire because that Working on Fire is a team that is committed which has done tremendous amount of work and over and above that uyibone ke maan ngeli xesha bebesebenza beleqa imililo apha eKapa kuya le nale intoba nyani nyani liyasebenza eli candelo. Ndifuna ukuthi ke qhuba Mphathiswa ndithi ke xa ndiyibopha sinexhala ngoomama abasebenza kweli sebe lakho kuba bayanyanzeleka ukuba bafihle izisu xa bekhulelwe kuba besoyika ukugxothwa okanye ukucuthelwa imali yabo ye-overtime, ithi ke ngoko lo nto Mphathiswa wenza njani ukuqinisekisa ukuba ayenzeki le nto, oomama mabafumane amalungelo alinganayo nootata njengoko isitsho iLabour Relations Act bangacalulwe ngokwesini sabo. Ibalulekile ke lo nto ngakumbi xa bezinikezele kangaka emsebenzini wabo. Wonke umntu ke ungaba ngabuza. Wonke umntu ayiphelelanga apha eMzantsi Afrika qha kwihlabathi jikelele bathi iwestern cape or cape town izinikele ngokupheleleyo ukulwa imililo ekhoyo ehlasela amahlathi ethu. Siyabulela kakhulu Somlomo.

*Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. We as the Standing Committee on Local Government took part in an oversight role where we looked at what we get out of what is written down compared to what is happening on the ground. Is it the same? We were so happy and commend the work done by all of us as the committee. We applaud the work being done

saying this department really does its job and we commend the Minister of the Department of Local Government and those who work especially hard in Working on Fire because that team is committed and has done a tremendous amount of work over and above what we see. They are busy chasing fire wherever it is in Cape Town to show that really they do work hard. I want to say: carry on Minister with what you are doing.

In conclusion I want to say we are concerned about women working in this unit because they are forced to hide their tummies when pregnant so they do not lose their jobs or to have their overtime salaries cut. That bring a question as to what is the Minister doing to ensure that women get their rights like their men counterparts which is what is enshrined in the Labour Relations Act; not to be discriminated against because of their gender. This is of importance especially because they work hard and they are committed in their work. You can ask everybody, it is not only here in South Africa it is happening worldwide; they say the Western Cape or Cape Town is wholly committed in fighting fires in our forests. Thank you very much, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mnqasela, your time has expired. I see the hon member Mr Dyantyi.

†UMnu Q R DYANTYI: Enkosi Somlomo. *Thank you, Madam Speaker. †I thought it was not working. Just to say, thank you very much, Minister Bredell. There are two things I want to say in the two minutes that I am

allocated. The issue of disaster risk reduction is clearly about two things: it is the level of preparedness as a country or anybody that you have to reduce the damage, the extent of damage, and secondly it is about the post disaster action that you take and for that reason I speak here today. As we speak, in Sendai in Japan there is a UN Conference on Disaster Risk Reduction. I am hoping that you did send the Department to be represented to learn new things out of that and also to say we have just witnessed fires in Muizenberg, to really say good work was done in that. But if you are going to look in terms of the level of effort that was put in there much could have been done, because we are told today that part of the reason includes arson and other issues that caused that fire. Therefore the kind of campaigns that we need to do, and law enforcement is doing, is very important, but in terms of the post-disaster analysis and action that we need to talk about it requires that after that you begin to look at what are the after-effects. It could easily be environment as we have seen, human life, or the issue of economy and there I want to go and take you back two years ago in 2013 in BM Section in Khayelitsha, people caught fire. That was a disaster.

Today they are still sitting in shacks. There is nothing happening in terms of movement because the next thing you are going to get is going to be haphazard depending on where we are sitting... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, speak to the Chair please.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...and so the test of leadership therefore and the success

achieved in terms of disaster, it is not understanding the mandate only. It is about what you do to be well prepared to reduce the levels. You cannot avoid natural disasters but at the same time it is about what you do thereafter. You cannot two years thereafter still sit with the kind of problems that we are sitting with and we are going to expect from this Minister to give us a report, we hear that is about R6 million.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi your time has expired.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...about what the cause is in terms of the environment. We know about Mr Marais. May his soul rest in peace... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...and lastly the issue of the economy. Thank you Madam Speaker. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Madam Speaker, thank you very much and I appreciate this opportunity given. One of the responsibilities of this Department is that wherever there is disaster there must be coordination and there must be the management of that disaster to prevent the loss of life, property and everything else. The classical example is what the members have said that the Department has been always alert that wherever these disasters strike they

will respond positively and part of responding is that there should be resources, and we have just received the news that the amount that was spent in fighting the fires was R6 million. It means, therefore, that the Department is always ready that whenever there is a disaster they respond accordingly to save whatever needs to be saved, and today as well in Prince Albert there was a collision of cars ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please hon member Mr Tyatyam.

Mr N E HINANA: ...where two people died but because that is a freeway the disaster management responded very well diverting the cars to a different route and taking those who were injured to the hospital. It means therefore that whenever there is a disaster... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: ...each department must always be ready in terms of finance but the last thing that I want to raise Madam Speaker... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired.

Mr N E HINANA: ...is that there needs to be more people there. [Time expired.]

An HON MEMBER: Who is the spokesperson [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Max.

Mnr L H MAX: Dankie agb Speaker. Gegewe dit wat die Minister vandag vir ons gesê het hier in die Huis, ons waardeer daardie mandaat en dit is ervaar ook in die verlede dat dié wat getaak is met daardie mandaat daardie mandaat uitvoer, maar ek wil ook daarby sê dat dit het tyd geword dat ons beter erkenning gee aan die manne en vroue wat daardie mandaat uitoefen. Ons aanvaar dit as 'n gegewe, hulle moet net daar wees, maar as jy kyk na die gevaar wat hulle in die gesig staar, dis lewensgevaar en dan ook die vrywilligers wat sonder beloning, sonder enige polisse op hulle lewens ingespring het om ander se lewens te red en eiendom te red. Ek dink hierdie Huis skuld hulle ook dan daardie waardering en ons hoop dat die Minister dit sal oordra. Hulle is gewoonlik die 'unsung heroes', nie ons 'politicians' wat elke dag in die koerant is nie. Hulle is die mense wat regtig agter die skerms sweet... [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mnr L H MAX: ...om hierdie gevaar te trotseer en daarom doen ek 'n beroep op die nasionale sowel as provinsiale regering dat sover moontlik ons as 'n regering alles moontlik doen om hierdie mense te voorsien van hulle hulpbronne en dan ook te kyk na verdienstelike vergoeding vir hulle wat daardie taak verrig... [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Conditions of service.

Mnr L H MAX: ...en ek wil ook dan net vir die Minister vra dat hy dan ook namens ons in hierdie Huis ons dank en waardering oordra aan elkeen wat 'n bydrae gelewer het om die inwoners van die Wes-Kaap te beveilig in hierdie omstandighede. Baie dankie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] at the next conference. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please. [Interjections.] Order please members. I see the hon Minister Bredell.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie agb Speaker en baie dankie aan die agbare lede vir deelname in die interpellasie. Ek gaan net in die breë antwoord.

Disaster is everybody's business. I think we need to get that concept and it is everybody's fight because if we join hands we can be successful at the end of the day.

Natuurlik is programme soos 'Working on Fire' kardinaal tot die sukses, en dis baie lekker om saam te werk wanneer ons nasionaal aan boord kry en provinsie en plaaslik, dat ons suksesvolle verhale het om te vertel.

Rampe gaan baie verder as net brande. Ons gaan nou in die winterseisoen in so ons moet voorberei. Ons moet ons rade kry om hulle stormwaterdreine skoon te maak want dit alles koop vir ons tyd. Ons sit met droogtegeteisterde gebiede aan die een kant en heel moontlik aan die ander kant gaan jy sit met oorstromings. Ons moet reg wees daarvoor. Ons het oor die 120 plus mense seker 150 in die Wes-Kaap opgelei in 'building collapse' If there is a big earthquake how to deal with patients, how to get people out of buildings that collapse.

Ons is besig met verskillende opleidingsprogramme in Wolwekloof. Ons het al ses daar deurgevoer. Rope climbing, those kinds of things, so we are always busy investing back into our people, but what we need to acknowledge is that there is really on the fire side more or less three areas that we will need to look at, informal settlements, the formal settlements and then wildfires. Now wildfires, formal settlements, I think we are there, but informal settlements we still need more work.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ja, baie werk, ek stem saam, baie werk.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We are busy doing a lot of research, there is still a lot of work that needs to go in. We are busy sitting with the private sector pulling them in, getting their resources also on board because we need to join forces if we want to win this war against informal settlements. Fires; obviously education is going to play a huge role within

that and therefore we are running various educational programmes within the youth component within disaster management sector within the informal settlement. The highest risk people within fires especially is the youth. It is middle aged males and then over 65 and we will need to deal with all various aspects of the risk in the future. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister. That concludes Interpellation 2. We now move to Interpellation 3. I see the hon Minister of Finance.

Debt intervention strategies: Municipalities

3. Mr Q R Dyantyi asked the Minister of Finance:

- (1) Whether the current debt intervention strategies employed in municipalities are successful;
- (2) What is the actual plan to normalise the situation?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you Madam Speaker. Thank you to hon member Mr Dyantyi for the interpellation.

Municipalities in the province have debt management policies and strategies in place. In addition they are also exploring various initiatives and fiscal efforts to ensure effective collection of revenue. However, there are some external risks impacting on the debt intervention strategies employed by

municipalities. In the main the current economic fiscal situation in the country make it extremely difficult to have 100% debt collection.

These risks have a direct impact amongst others on the unemployment levels and as a consequence the ability of citizens to pay municipal accounts. Notwithstanding these risks, municipalities in the province continue to employ debt management interventions strategies that would ensure optimal revenue collection. Municipalities are also continuing to explore debt intervention strategies and initiatives to ensure optimal collection of revenue.

Key initiatives in this particular regard include the following:

- The monthly monitoring of revenue collection against the set budgeted targets as part of the in-year monitoring process also known as the IYM reports.
- Secondly, there is also monthly monitoring of the classification and analysis of debtors in terms of the aggregate in terms of the age analysis and customer type and income and year-on-year comparisons via the IYM process.
- Thirdly, there is also continuous evaluation of credit and debt management policies and strategies applied within a given municipality and there is also improved IGR cooperation to ensure the payment and reduction of debt in key accounts particularly in the context of National and Provincial Governments;
- Lastly there is also continuous support from the Provincial Treasury

with revenue enhancement initiatives, appropriate cost-reflective tariff setting initiatives and revenue policies that are responsive to the socio-economic objectives.

I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Dyantyi. Hon member Mr Dyantyi please [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, Minister.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Mr Dyantyi, please address me from your seat if you do not mind. [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am addressing you, yes.

The SPEAKER: Not in the aisle.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There is the line, Madam Speaker, please. You educated me about the line. You give me an extra minute for that please. Thank you Minister. [Interjections.]

I think just about three months ago we were talking about this, Minister. It is back in the House today for the very simple reason that the situation in relation to this municipal debt is not improving. It is getting out of hand.

This is the issue why it is brought back and I am hoping that the kind of things that you said three months ago and you just repeated some of them, either you are going to tell us today that you have no solution to this problem that is getting out of hand so that we can see what has to be done because debt for household is rising for the entire province and this is a step that the Minister knows.

We are talking about R6.2 billion of debt in municipalities and out of that R6.2 billion - just the Western Cape - R5.5 billion is from the households. Now this is serious so municipalities are owed by households; not government, not commercial, the household, R5.5 billion. It was by June last year it was less than that. It is getting worse. Now the question is, what plan does the Minister have for us to normalise this situation? If the municipalities had credible plans to deal with this why would it be rising if we have those credible plans? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Eskom and the Post Office [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Talk to him. Thank you. Talk to him. Help him. Help him. Help him. [Interjections.]

But also to make the point, the bulk of the debt is in about three areas. It is in water, it is in property rates and surprisingly it is in waste management. The fourth one is electricity but the bulk of that is taken away by Eskom and so we understand where the problem is. It is no longer going to be justifiable

to come and stand up and tell us: “No the economy is not performing. There is poverty. There is unemployment.” That is no longer justifiable. The situation is getting out of hand. What do you do? You are the government elected to put systems in place [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members.

An HON MEMBER: Do something and stop complaining.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Allow me to proceed.

An HON MEMBER: Create jobs!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...and quite clearly because the Minister just listening to him... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members! Sorry.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...has repeated everything else that he said in this House just over three months ago. It clearly says to me he must just say “Ek gooi my hande op die lug.” Dis wat hy moet sê vandag. [Tussenwerpsels.]

'n AGBARE LID: Nee, in die lug.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Joseph. [Interjections.]

Order please members.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He is not standing [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Sorry. Order! There is a speaker on the floor please.

Mr D JOSEPH: The credit control and debt management policy is a very important function of the municipality. According to the Municipal Systems Act 2000 there must be political will [Interjections.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ek stem saam.

Mr D JOSEPH: ...from any government, any province in any country that needs to manage credit control. Public meetings, community forums, work committees are part of customer care and how to manage the credit control and the debt management. It is important that you measure the services accurately in terms of the various services that are available and also make sure that the municipal accounts payable are measured accurately, regularly and the outstanding amounts or arrangements that people can make particularly for the indigent clients due to the economic climate are important and the municipalities make provision for that, and the allocation of revenue is also important towards the services that are rendered for various services from the municipality.

It is important that the 30 days or 60 days or 90 days measurement is used and also the accounts that are outstanding of 100 days or more, the huge accounts, that that is managed properly from the debt management control policy review.

In the Western Cape the Treasury Department offers sufficient support and advice to those municipalities in the Western Cape particularly to focus on tariff and re-engineering and what is important in this municipality there should be zero tolerance on employees and councillors that are in arrears with their municipal accounts. I think that is important that we have to keep on monitoring that, but we have good examples of our municipalities, good communication between the municipalities and our Treasury Departments and the financial expertise that we have at all spheres in Treasury and I am confident that we are making progress in this regard. I thank you Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: The hon member Mr Dyantyi. I see you.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Baie dankie agb Speaker. Just to help the member, before the Minister comes in, just for the staff as an example for the City of Cape Town, out of just over R4 billion because the bulk of that is in the City of Cape Town, there is less than a million owed by staff. It is actually just below R500 000. So you are talking a drop in the ocean but that is still important. The problem is bigger than that. The Minister knows the problem.

This is my point, because if you are talking about debt collection and the kind of opportunity that we have out of this R5.5 billion of household, there is R1.6 billion of that that is collectible that the municipality and the City of Cape Town have put together to say: "This is what you can do", but it still leaves you with a bulk of where you need to solve that problem, so again, some municipalities have put in indigent policies but even that does not go very far to come to terms of how you solve this R5.5 billion, so you can close taps, stop electricity, the problem is not going to be stopped. You need something more than that to help the situation.

We are always told of the Western Cape and this is the essence of it. The Western Cape economy is performing very well. Now if it is performing and you still have the kind of problems that we are indicating here today it simply says to you we have an economy here that is not inclusive. It is meant for a very few if it is performing and we will come back to you about that later on, Minister Winde.

Yes, National Treasury is supporting municipalities in terms of the creative innovations. We are here even listening to National Treasury, the division of revenue, that there are a number of revenue options open to municipalities and I think as the Standing Committee we will be watching those giving support to those municipalities as to what else they can do because this problem is not just people outside of here... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, kindly finish. Your time has

expired.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It even affects some of us who are here as part of that debt. I am coming back. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, what the hon member does not tell this House is that there is a political economy behind this particular question and this is the reality. When we tabled the Medium Term Budget Policy Statement for the first time the economic projection was 2.7 but because the investors have no confidence in the way the ANC manages this country the economic outlook was downgraded from 2.7 by the IMF to 1.7.

The PREMIER: Shame!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: In addition, further deductions when the National Minister tabled the Medium Term Policy Statement, the National Treasury made an additional downward projection from 1.7 to 1.4 because investors have no confidence in the way the ANC is managing the South African economy and large parts of that mismanagement of the economy has to do with the way the ANC is managing public entities. I will mention them. You know them by now, but what this matter is about is the ANC failing to inspire confidence through their corruption and mismanagement and people have no faith to invest in the South African economy and that is punishing

the poor people. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Meyer, your time has expired. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: That is the real reality Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired, thank you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you. [Time expired.] [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: [Inaudible.] speak to your leader.

An HON MEMBER: You need the facts of it [Interjection.]

'n AGBARE LID: Asseblief!

The SPEAKER: Order please members, Order! The hon member Mr Dyantyi, I see you.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ek is so teleurgesteld. [Tussenwerpsels.]

An HON MEMBER: Shame! [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The Minister... [Interjections.] The Minister, instead of addressing the problem [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: The issue - he becomes emotional.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...on his table [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members, there is a speaker on the floor.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Instead of addressing the problem on his table he is taking a flight to Pretoria. Call him back. Kom terug na die Wes-Kaap. Die probleem is hier. [Tussenwerpsels.]

An HON MEMBER: He is on the way to Pretoria, do not worry.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: He is going to Pretoria and tries to blame everything in the sky, Minister [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members. We have a speaker on the floor please.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: In every situation under a democracy ... and I am putting this point forward, I am putting the Minister on the spotlight because we are dealing with something very serious here. The NDP that you speak about, speaks about three challenges: poverty, unemployment and inequality and this discussion is just highlighting [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: And corruption.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...the issue of poverty that we have got to deal with...

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: And corruption.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And if you are saying to us... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...this Western Cape Government has no answer to rising poverty that is manifested in terms of the debt that you see in many municipalities, say so, so that we know what next we need to do, otherwise I do not think that the Minister in his - I hope when I sit down he is going to change his tune and tell us [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...exactly, because the question is what is the plan to normalise. If his plan to normalise is to blame National Government, okay, that is fine. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon Minister Meyer. [Interjections.]
Order please members.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Madam Speaker, they cannot hide from this

reality that this ANC National Government is hugely mismanaging the economy in South Africa and as a result of that mismanagement poor people are getting poorer and as a result of that particular poverty are having particular problems, but [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: What is the response of the national...

The SPEAKER: Order please, members.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: What is the response of this government towards the poverty crisis here in the Western Cape? We have developed a Provincial Strategic Objective One, namely growing the economy and growing, creating more jobs [Interjections.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Wag 'n bietjie daar, wag 'n bietjie. Ons wil [Onduidelik.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: That is what we want to do because if more people have jobs if we grow the economy and more people have jobs more people will be able to pay the municipal account. That is what we are doing but in addition to that we have in the Provincial Treasury and in this government also implemented two strategies to ensure... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister, kindly take your seat. Is it a point of order hon

member Mr Tyatyam?

Mr S G TYATYAM: No I want to check if the Minister will... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: No-no, are you [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: I want to know if the Minister can take a question from what he is raising.

The SPEAKER: Minister Meyer, will you take a question?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I only take questions from senior members of the ANC. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: No question. [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: That is why I am here. [Interjections.] That is why I am here. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Tyatyam, take your seat.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Okay.

The SPEAKER: You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you Madam Speaker.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Can I ask [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I am only taking... [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: I am a senior member. Can I ask?

The SPEAKER: He is not prepared to take the question. [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: He does not know... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: You are not a senior member.

The SPEAKER: Minister, are you prepared to take a question?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Ai, we are useless. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: He is not a senior member, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: The Minister is not prepared to take the question.

[Interjections.] Order please members. [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Are you still standing for Chair? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Yes, what is this government doing in terms of this particular question? We have developed two particular instruments that do not exist in any ANC province to deal with this matter. [Interjections.]

One is the LGM Tech assessments of municipalities. We do the assessments. We give advice. We follow up in terms of the recommendations, we engage with the CFOs of municipalities and we have established a CFO forum where we regularly interact with them through the LGM Tech assessments.

In addition, what we are doing in this particular case that something that does not exist anywhere with the ANC's running is the so called MGRO processes through the MGRO engagements. Part of these engagements is to interrogate the budgets of municipalities particularly as far as it is concerned with revenue collection. We make recommendations. We learn through other experiences, we share the policies and the instruments that we are using so this is something that we do in the Western Cape that does not exist anywhere in the country. I thank you Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Meyer. That concludes the end of Interpellations, members. [Interjections.] Order please members, Order!

We will now deal with questions as printed on the Question Paper. The first

question, I recognise the hon Minister of Human Settlements.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Department of Human Settlements: planned innovative projects

1. Ms L M Maseko asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

What new innovative projects are his Department planning for 2015?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much Madam Speaker. Allow me to welcome back in the House the Chief Whip, the Chief Whip of the ANC. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Welcome yourself. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members. Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: This is done in a very good gesture and it must be accepted in that spirit. My Department has identified a range of catalytic projects that will propel the Department in the development and delivery of housing programmes aligned to the provincial and departmental strategies. That is to address the gap housing market, the

affordable housing market, and the upgrading of informal settlements. These projects will be fast-tracked hoping to start delivery by the next financial year and have been committed in terms of the Provincial Business Plan. These projects will bring along greater integration and innovation including sustainable settlements.

My Department is planning, amongst many projects that we are planning in the upcoming financial year, the Block and Foundry Road. Both involve the mix of social housing and open market units and will be undertaken by urban status ventures / vendors. The block is an integrated project that will provide almost a 1 000 affordable mixed tenure housing opportunities in two, three and four storey walk-ups. Of these 416 will be social housing units and over 500 open market units.

Similarly Foundry Road is a Greenfield integrated housing apartment building with very good linkages to transport at the Salt River Station. I mean it is opposite that site. It provides for a mix of private rental and social housing units. Both projects are centrally located well within reach of the Cape Town Central Business District and are expected to be lodged in 2016/2017.

Lastly, we continue to use alternative building technologies currently underway. These projects will yield more than 1900 housing units in Delft Symphony, Precincts 3 and 5. The structures consist of light steel frames with magnesium oxide panels filled with polyethylene. Even though my

Department is not prescriptive the project nevertheless must meet the standard as set by the NHBRC and accepted by Agrimo SA.

Thank you very much, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Ms Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you Madam Speaker. I just want to find out from the Minister, we have R3500.00 for the low cost housing and then there is a gap housing which can be from R3500.00 upwards. Do we have the funding where you find out that a person does not have money, has about let us say on a scale of from R5000.00 to R3500.00, is there a mechanism in the Department where you can accommodate them because it is still lower than the range for a living wage?

The SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker, for that question. We have about 16 programmes within our housing code. For example the income category that the hon member is referring to is accommodated in social housing, which is part of the project that I spoke about. We have social housing accommodate beneficiaries that are earning between R1500.00 to R7500.00. That is for rental but over and above that we have taken a decision as the Department of Human Settlements, in order to cater for those people who are earning between R3500.00 to R7000.00 that in

the past these people were required to purchase the site so that they can build incrementally on their own, but we took a decision that these people must be provided with free sites that are committed to basic services and we must then transfer. We then transfer the site in their name so that they can incrementally on their own through their savings build their own houses. So that is how we cater for people within that income category.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes, I just want to check, where exactly is this project which the Minister is referring to? He has mentioned the station but I do not actually know and wish to know exactly where are they located?

The SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I just said that both the Block and Foundry Road projects are just opposite Salt River Station and in fact I will be sharing with the House more information in terms of the projects that are strategically located that speaks directly to the concerns that the hon member Mr Magaxa has been raising for some time, that we are not integrating communities and I think during my Budget speech I clearly outlined a number of areas where we are clearly indicating as department that we are integrating our communities so the project that I mentioned, as I said, is just opposite Salt River Station.

The SPEAKER: Is the member finished? No more follow-ups that is
[Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: No, no, no. It is a follow-up.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Ja. Thank you Madam Speaker. I would like to ask MEC Madikizela whether he will be able to complete the provincial housing strategy as referred to by the Premier in her State of the Province Speech in 2014, whether you would be able to complete that strategy in 2015? Yes or no?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It is a new question, Madam Speaker but let me... [Interjections.] Let me... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The Chief Whip in training [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order please members.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Let me answer that question directly and say that already in terms of the strategic direction that we are taking, that is in line with the PSG4 and also the game-changer that we have identified as the Department of Human Settlements. We are now calling for

the service providers to assist us to finalise that strategy and it will be implemented in the upcoming financial year 2016/2017.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Just to confirm, is the MEC saying that that strategy as referred to by the Premier in 2014 will be finished in this financial year? Are you giving this House that commitment?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I am not too sure about the strategy that the Premier referred to, whether it is this one. Well, I would not want to mislead the House by responding to that question. If he can show me then I would be able to give a specific response to that specific question.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. We now move to Question 2. I see the honourable Minister Plato.

FET Colleges: Partnership Programme

2. Ms M M asked the Minister of Community Safety:

Whether the partnership programme with FET colleges has been successful; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, thank you very much and also to the member for the question. During the programme very successful. During the past year the Department in partnership with Northlink

FET College engaged with youth from various communities and serious violent and crime affected communities to apply for bursaries through Northlink College in order to further their education. This was done as part of the Department's approach to provide meaningful alternatives by equipping them with the opportunities to succeed in life and divert them away from the social ills in society. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Ms Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you Madam Speaker. I would like to ask the Minister how many youth have benefited from this partnership programme?

The SPEAKER: Minister Plato, I see you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Madam Speaker, thank you, during these visits we have seen over 3000 prospective learners at community gatherings during the 2014/2015 financial year of which 1231 are on record having enrolled at Northlink College to further their studies. Another 800 applicants have already been successfully accepted to study in 2015 and further to that \pm two weeks ago my office submitted another 1000 new applications to the college. I can further say we have visited areas such as Manenberg, Lavender Hill, Hanover Park, Gugulethu, Elsies River, Khayelitsha, Kraaifontein, Delft, Mitchells Plain, Nyanga, Worcester, Robertson, Bonnievale, Touws River, Atlantis, Vredendal, etcetera. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Any follow-ups? We move to Question 3. I see the hon Minister Madikizela.

Support to municipalities with limited resources and capacity restraints

3. Ms L M Maseko asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

Whether there is a process in place to support municipalities with limited resources and capacity constraints; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much Madam Speaker. We use municipalities as our implementing agents in all our projects, except of course in provincial projects or national projects that we are doing on behalf of the National Department, in fact jointly with the National Department, and therefore we do offer support. For example I think two to three years ago when we identified this gap in terms of planning we then appointed professional resource teams to assist the municipalities so that they can come up with credible plans. They have created a pipeline and that is why we have now a healthy pipeline of ready projects that can be implemented. Over and above that understanding as well that some of the municipalities have a number of challenges particularly in infrastructure because the MIG funding that they normally get is nowhere near enough to deal with that infrastructure problem and from time to time we use our

discretionary funding to augment that bulk, that MIG funding, so that we can unlock some of the projects that are constrained due to bulk infrastructure problems.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you Madam Speaker. I just want to find out from the Minister, in which category are most of the municipalities that are having their capacity constraints?

The SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Well, almost all the municipalities because it depends what kind of capacity you are referring to. For example if you look at the problems of bulk infrastructure capacity constraints, that is a problem that you find across the board starting from the City of Cape Town to all the other municipalities and that is why for example the Urban Settlement Development Grant was introduced so that it can assist the Metros to deal with that particular problem. With regard to problems of planning this is the problem that you find mostly, almost in all municipalities because there is this constant complaint from municipalities that human settlement delivery is an unfunded mandate. Because of that not many resources are dedicated to staff their offices and that is why we then support them by making sure that there is enough capacity in terms of planning so that as I said, they can come up with a credible pipeline, so that we are able

to spend the money that we transfer to the municipalities.

The SPEAKER: The hon member Ms Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you Madam Speaker. I just want to find out again from the Minister, is there any skills development for the housing officials as they come in and go, because you will find that in the municipalities there is most of cadre deployment that come in and out and you will find out they do not understand what it is; is there any skills development programme that after an official comes in he/she can go for training to be able to understand all the policies involved in human settlements? [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is all fit for purpose.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Well from our side as the Department of Human Settlements we do have a problem. We call it BESP or Built Environment Support Programme, and that programme is designed to capacitate human settlement practitioners in all levels of municipalities so that they understand the delivery. I mean they understand the whole spectrum of human settlement delivery starting from the policy to the programmes and also the implementation, so we do provide that capacity through that programme as Department of Human Settlements.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you Madam Speaker. I would like to ask the MEC if he can inform this House in the light of the question posed as to how many municipalities within our province have applied for accreditation from the National Department and how many of those municipalities' applications have been supported by the Provincial Department of Human Settlements?

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much. I cannot say for sure the number of municipalities but I do know that municipalities have applied for different levels of accreditation, for example there is only one - that is the Metro - that has applied for level three, that is the full assignment. I would request Mr Deputy Speaker that I provide that information in terms of the number of those municipalities because I do know it is quite a number of them who have applied for level two, for example because all the municipalities they start at level one, and I do know there are some who have applied for level two, but it is only one that has applied for level three, so I will request the indulgence of the member to come back with a specific answer to that question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move on to Question number 4.
Hon Minister for Social Development, Minister Fritz.

Department of Social Development
Research on impact of programmes

4. Ms A J du Toit Marais asked the Minister of Social Development:

Whether his Department have a research plan for measurement of the impact on communities for their programmes in their objective for care and support services to families; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Deputy Speaker, yes, since 2012 the Department's Care and Support Service to Families Programme identified the need to evaluate the existing Family Strengthening Programmes in the province.

The initial plan was to research the impact of funded NGO Family Strengthening and Parenting Programmes that promote positive outcomes for children in vulnerable communities across all regions in the Western Cape.

Now there are three levels of research that were commissioned. One, to the University of Western Cape by the Department; another by NGOs to some of our universities and so within 2012/13 financial year the Care and Support Services to Families Programme commissioned an evaluation study into Family Strengthening Programmes in the province. Twelve NGOs that provide Family Strengthening Programmes and prevention services to

families as well as the prevention of family breakdowns were selected.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No follow-ups. We move on to Question number 5, again Minister Fritz.

MOD Centres: feeding scheme

***5. Ms A J du Toit Marais asked the Minister of Social Development:**

What are the details of the feeding scheme provided by his Department to Mass Opportunity and Development Centres (MODCs)?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Department of Social Development supports the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sports MOD programme by providing meals for participants and the provisioning of social services. Participants in need of social work services are referred to the local Department of Social Development and NGO offices for such interventions.

The Department of Social Development has appointed MOD Centre assistants and they are basically interns that administer the feeding process and also to do referrals of such participants. A Social Work Service Directory per region has been developed in order to assist the MOD Centre assistants in this regard.

We have appointed 48 service providers to render this service and I have a whole list that I can provide to the hon member just to assist you with further understanding the whole thing. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No follow-ups. We continue with Question number 6, the Minister for Local Government, Minister Bredell. Sorry Minister Bredell, just one second, was there a follow-up? You must rise, you must stand up when you want to follow up a question.

Ms P MAKELENI: Oh I thought it [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thanks Mr Deputy Speaker. †Sekela Somlomo ndifuna ukuqonda Somlomo kulo nyaka ophelileyo besichazele ukuba ziyi-32 kuphela i-MOD Centres ezifumaneka ukuba bezinokunikwa ukutya ngenxa yokungafumaneki kwe-MOD Centres eziphilayo, ngoku ndifuna ukuqonda ukuba kulo nyaka uphelileyo xa unyaka ubuqala xa uphela benze 32 kuphela ezinye 101 ezinye ezi kwenzeka ntoni ngazo, zitya nini zona ezo MOD Centres.

*Mr Deputy Speaker I just want to know: last year we were told that there were 32 MOD Centres getting food subsidies because they were the only working MOD Centres found. Now I want to know: last year towards the end they provided for only 32 MOD Centres. What is going on with the other 101 centres? What do they feed their children?

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agbare Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon member, Mr Deputy Speaker, I did not get the numbers correctly; if I can just get the numbers again?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just repeat the number?

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker it was reported that in the last quarter there were only 32 MOD Centres that were found and in the last quarter there were 101. Now out of the 181 MOD Centres we only fed these ones. What I want to know is what happened to the rest of the MOD Centres?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Ja, we have started with 101, Mr Deputy Speaker and hon member Ms Makeleni, and we have increased that I think to 146. Once again I have the list. I can actually give you the full list of exactly where and how many schools are provided. I just want to say a new development because of the Department of Social Development doing something, the Department of Sports and Culture doing another thing, Education doing another, we have now looked at the whole rationalisation of those services and actually take that whole service over to the Department of Education, who have existing kitchens at schools and who will be able to do a far better job, in our opinion. It is a challenge when you have this kind of fragmented approach to providing feeding at the schools, because remember

there are other feeding schemes in the morning that are done by other service providers. In the afternoon we come with our own service providers. It is just a 'kopseer'. So we have consolidated that we move as soon as this year to try and see how we can actually transfer that function over to the Department of Education to consolidate the whole nutrition programme in schools.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is another, are you finished? Thank you. Is there another follow-up? Yes, you may proceed.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Minister, it was also reported last year that in some MOD Centres there was rotten food found and I want to know what is your plan in making sure that this does not happen again?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you. We have actually had those places tested where it was reported. The one problem was that because there are three different service providers it could not be proved that it was our food that was rotten, so we have also brought in the Department of Health to give us specifications and to actually put in very, very important systems to check the kind of food and the quality of food that is provided. I want to say hon member Ms Makeleni and Mr Deputy Speaker, this is a big challenge. This is part of the issue I am having. When we stop funding we get flack in this very House by people who support those people who serve rotten food to our children and so in my opinion I will not tolerate anyone, we will stop the contract immediately. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Hear, hear.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We will then proceed to the next question, Question 6, Minister Bredell.

Municipal water provision: pressure to provide

6. Mr L H Max asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

Whether any town in the province is under pressure to provide water to the people in its municipal area; if so, what are the relevant details?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, baie dankie, dankie vir die vraag, agb lid mnr Max. Die Departement van Plaaslike Regering is tans besig om die waterkrisis in Eden die hoof te bied deur die volgende inisiatiewe:

- Gereelde koördinasie met alle relevante belanghebbendes;
- Direkte ingenieurskundige hulp ten opsigte van nood, kort- medium- en langtermyn intervensies.
- Dan hulp ten opsigte van kommunikasiestrategie en bewusmakingsprogramme ten opsigte van waterbesparings en die

gebruiksbestuur;

- En dan die skakeling met verskeie provinsiale departemente en ander liggame ten opsigte van finansiële hulp.

As ons kyk na die dorpe wat tans baie swaar trek, dan het ons Zoar. Die Departement van Plaaslike Regering is tans besig om met die munisipaliteit te help met die nodige ingenieurskundigheid en het befondsing beskikbaar gemaak deur sy Munisipale Infrastruktuur Ondersteuningsprogram om die risiko van watertekort op kort- en mediumtermyn uit te skakel. Medium- en langtermyn intervensies is tans in voorlopige fase om 'n soortgelyke waterkrisis in die toekoms te voorkom. Die waterkrisis word eers suksesvolle bestuur totdat die winterreëns kom waarna die dorp weer van water voorsien sal word vanaf sy hoofwaterbron, die Tierpoortdam.

In Ladismith area: die uitermatige warm droë seisoen tesame met die beperkte stoorkapasiteit in die dorp se hoofwaterdam, die La Grange-dam wat deur die vorige vloede beskadig is het die dorp in 'n baie kwesbare posisie geplaas. Die Departement van Plaaslike Regering via sy Munisipale Infrastruktuur Direkoraat en Wes-Kaap Rampbestuursentrum is tans besig om die munisipaliteit aktief by te staan met ingenieurskundigheid, onderhandelings met belanghebbendes asook die fasilitering ten opsigte van moontlike befondsing. Die Departement het ook hulp verleen deur twee addisionele boorgate met pompe en pypnetwerke toe te rus asook die opknapping van kragopwekkers wat as 'n noodmaatreël op korttermyn sal dien. Voldoende water is tans beskikbaar as gevolg van waterbesparing,

waterverbruikbestuur en die koördinasie met die groter waterverbruikers in en om die dorp. Hierdie tydelike reëlins word op 'n lopende basis gemonitor en sal genoegsame water verseker totdat die winterreëns aanbreek.

Calitzdorp: daar is tans nie te groot krisis nie en die behuisingsprojek word weliswaar tydelik gestaak totdat die hoofmaatsdienste sal voldoen aan die noodsaaklike gebruik. Dankie.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Is daar 'n opvolgvraag, agb lid mnr Dyantyi.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ja baie dankie, ek het verwag dit is 'n 'sweetheart' een. Behalwe Eden Distrikmunisipaliteit, watter ander munisipaliteite het waterprobleme? Dis my eerste vraag.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ek het 'n lys. Dit is die volgende vraag basies, vraag 7, waar die agb lid mnr Max ook gevra het of enige dorp in die provinsie onder druk verkeer en dan het ek die lys. Ek kan dit vinnig noem, maar dit is Prins Albert, Wittewater, Dysselsdorp, De Rust, Volmoed, Ladismith, Calitzdorp, Zoar. Dit is die dorpe waarmee ons tans...
[Tussenwerpsel.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, the second question?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: This is follow-up?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: As part of the work that the Minister has done with his Department in the Eden District, what amount, what part of what you have done constituted leakage, because that is a big problem in terms of water, which also contributes to some of the debt and so on. Have you found any of that as part of the work that you have done?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We always talk to municipalities on a - if I understand the hon member Mr Dyantyi correctly it is on actually the loss of water or electricity and there is an average. We try to get municipalities on electricity and not... around about 10%, not higher than that; water, 15%. A water loss of 15% is acceptable. Obviously the lower the better.

In Kannaland Municipality it is problematic. The loss will go up to 34%. If you go to Zoar it can go up to 80% even 70%, but now we must look at the whole scenario of poverty in that area, of not metering in that area, and so we are busy with that part of our infrastructure programme also to get the right metering going within those kind of municipalities. The metering problem is specifically in the Calitzdorp or the Kannaland Municipal area.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Dyantyi, your third

follow-up question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes, in any of the municipalities that you have mentioned including Eden as a district, do their IDPs reflect the plan for this water-crisis including the special development frameworks?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I have mentioned it in the interpellation that we specifically look at the area. I expected actually a follow-up question why in that area, because Eden is one of the disaster prone areas within this province. Let me focus quickly on Mossel Bay, Bitou, George, those areas, to help them and support them because it was three years ago when Mossel Bay nearly ran out of water, so it is part of that process, but it is huge investment, obviously. We are dependent on rain otherwise we must look at desalination, again huge capital expenses. The current problem and I can mention it, I do not know if there are any other follow-up questions, but the current problem that I foresee is that hon member, as soon as we start with boreholes in Zoar with generators we expect that the diesel that they are going to use will amount to anything from R150 000 to R250 000 a month, a small municipality, it will have a huge impact on their cash flow and with Treasury we are also looking at that because we will need to look at support. It is no use we come up afterwards and say where they cannot manage. It is a cash-flow problem as well creeping onto them. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We then proceed to the next question,

Question 7 again Minister Bredell.

Ladismith, Calitzdorp and Zoar: assistance with water crisis

7. Mr L H Max asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

Whether plans are in place to assist the towns of (a) Ladismith , (b) Calitzdorp and (c) Zoar with the current water crisis; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, we have touched on it and with the permission of the House I can quickly mention the towns that we are looking into that are currently on high alert: Prince Albert, Wittewater, Dysselsdorp, De Rust, Volmoed, Ladismith, Calitzdorp, Zoar.

Just to mention, you can also see some of these are the old Moravian Church kind of settlements. There is also a problem. We are busy with the Moravian Churches because we cannot just spend money because of the MFMA and the PFMA but we are busy going into an arrangement because we are still of the opinion that when it is about core services we need to step in and support the communities there. So we are busy with that. With the permission of hon member Mr Max and the House I would like to hand this in because I can stand and read every town's specific problem, but it is very lengthy.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No follow-up questions. We move on to Question number 8. Minister of Health, Minister Mbombo.

Slangrivier community: complaints regarding clinic

8. Mr C M Dugmore asked the Minister of Health:

(1) Whether any complaints from the Slangrivier community concerning the fact that the clinic is only open for three days of the week has been brought to her attention; if so, what are the reasons for this; if not;

(2) whether she will investigate and report back to the House?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: There have been no complaints received from the Slangrivier community. Slangrivier has a population of 3469 and the service is sufficient for the population and burden of disease for the area. The norm used for the workload per professional nurse is 35 patients per day. The workload in the whole of the Hessequa Clinic ranges from 26 to 38 patients per day and Slangrivier sees an average of about 35 patients per day, which is the norm and we provide them the full package, which is the curative, the preventative and rehabilitative services three days per week. A doctor visits the clinic two days per week as well, and the staff compliment at the clinic for the days of the service, you have got a clinical nurse

practitioner, enrolled nursing assistant, a counsellor and a cleaner.

In addition to that area there are about four mobile roads, because they have a mobile clinic that is around that area that renders the service to the farm areas when the clinic is closed and ten kilometres from there you also have the Heidelberg Clinic. That is the main clinic, because of this the Slangrivier becomes a satellite clinic. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore, a follow-up question?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to ask the MEC whether she is aware of the fact that her own departmental officials have proposed that instead of contracting two general practitioners from the private sector that it would actually be more cost-effective to employ a State doctor that would be able to serve both Slangrivier as well as Heidelberg and provide additional hours to both of those medical facilities.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Just a reminder that Eden is one of the NHI pilot site districts and I think within the Western Cape we implement the GP project where you use the GPs unlike in how they plan the practices in other districts across the country. For those private GPs we pay directly from our side whereas in other provinces they are being paid straight from the National Department of Health or through private. So in terms of that the experience that we have seen is that people do not want to go to work in the rural areas. We get very few. I think it is only in Central Karoo where people who

volunteer have an emotional attachment to the area, where they volunteer to stay there, but generally most of the doctors, even with other health professionals, they want to stay in the urban area, so it is very rare that you get people to work full-time in the rural areas. Actually it is not even now. Previously if you recall we used to have the district surgeon system where the doctor will see patients in their own rooms but now we stopped that, instead the private doctor must go to the public service. We call them sectional doctors, which is a common practice and it is part of the piloting of the NHI.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore your second question.

Mr C M DUGMORE: I would like to ask the MEC if there are doctors available to work for the public sector to serve that component of the Hessequa Municipal area and, secondly, if that would cost less than contracting the two general practitioners, and as I have indicated to you is actually supported by your own officials in that area as a better way to service the community as well as cost less, would you consider that?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Just firstly as I indicated in terms of that this is a pilot project; number 2, as I indicated that because of the shortage of doctors, but what we are doing is that we are expanding the training of the medical so we have approached the UCT and Stellenbosch and I am aware that sometime they are supposed to submit their business plan and how we can extend that. Also there will be some challenges because we need

infrastructure in order to train the medical doctors. In terms of which one is cheaper, which one is cost effective, actually that is why now nationally some of these GPs now pull out, the private GPs, they pull out because the complaint is that we are getting little. I think it is R300-and-something per hour and that is why they prefer for themselves that they can rather sit in their rooms and where the patients they can come in, because national do not pay the distance, the travelling time and most of them will for example in the area of the Hessequa sub-district come as far as Mossel Bay in order to go there, but now for Slangrivier specifically the doctor comes twice. The clinic opens Tuesday to Thursday and the doctor comes twice, so actually it is quite covered compared to the population which is about 3000. The whole population of the Eden District is about 10% of the Western Cape population and then for that sub-district alone it is only about 3000, so I do not think that there is much of the suffering within there. But also in addition to these services we have got the school health mobile, the bus for the school children and also in addition to the school health bus we are busy now conducting training because most of these are at the farms; the training for the communities, we call that EFAR which is Emergency First Aid Response for the communities and the individuals so that they could be able to respond to the emergency in terms of the first aid. So it is not only the health facilities but also in terms of what is happening within the community, and also lastly also for the emergency, because remember that for the emergency care they have to go to Riversdale, which is a district hospital, which is 24 hours, so it means that then in terms of the hotline most of the farms they cannot, they might not, have access to telecom landline for the 086-number, but in terms

of the complaints and whatever, but for the SMS please call the response is within 15 or 30 seconds.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore another follow-up question?

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Could I ask then given the very serious complaints around service delivery that were raised during the visit of the National Council of Provinces, given the meeting and I would like to inform you that I had with the Health Committee of Slangrivier yesterday, and their request to actually formally meet with you as well as your officials, would the MEC indicate whether she is prepared to actually meet with the Community Health Committee of Slangrivier in the presence of her officials to deal with these service delivery complaints which have been raised including solutions to deal with the problems of adding extra hours for medical practitioners to visit the clinic? My question is would you be prepared to actually attend the meeting with the community health committee of Slangrivier?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Actually it is part of what we are already doing. It is part of it. Actually there is a provision through the District Health Council and also through the Health Committees within those clinics because in the sub-district of the Hessequa there are about four clinics, there are about four of these satellites and about four of the mobiles. So as part of the provision within the Western Cape District Health Council Act, I have an

obligation to meet with the District Health Council which is chaired by the District Mayor plus the ward councillors plus the community because it must be 50% of the community members. In addition to that we have to meet with the Health Committees because these are the satellites, so now I am in the process of having the combined weekly clinics to have a sort of a board in order to meet with them and then with the presence of the communities. Yes, I will meet them and I am open to that.

†UMnu Mr C M DUGMORE: Mphathiswa uza ku [Akevakali.] Slangrivier? Enkosi.

*Mr C M DUGMORE: Minister, you are [Inaudible.] ... Slangrivier? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is that your last question or was that just a statement?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is a statement. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: No, I asked her whether she agreed to come to Slangrivier and she said yes. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The next question, Question 9, hon Minister Bredell.

Approved appointment and procurement procedure

9. Mr Q R Dyantyi asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

- (1) Whether the George Municipality abide by its own council approved appointment and procurement procedure; if so, what are the relevant details; if not,
- (2) Whether there are any cases where these procedures were not followed; if so, what is the role of the Minister and his Department in these cases?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you to hon member Mr Dyantyi for the question. With regard to the first part of the hon member's question I received the following reply from George Municipality. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hey wena!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: "Yes, the George Municipality manages all their recruitment and selection in line with the recruitment and selection policies of the George municipality."

The second part: “No, none such cases were brought to my attention to date. If, however, the hon member is referring to a matter which was recently investigated by the Public Protector I wish to inform you that the municipality at the meeting held on 25 February 2015 resolved not to take any disciplinary actions against the municipal manager for alleged maladministration relating to the appointment of an official of the George Municipality. The Public Protector was advised accordingly in a letter dated 2 March 2015 and I was informed thereof on the 6th of March. I have in the meantime requested the Department of Local Government to study both the reports as well as the resolutions of the Municipal Council and to provide me advice on my role and further involvement of the Department of Local Government, if any.”

Then the second part of the question, I think the hon member will acknowledge that this is a question actually for Treasury but with regard to the second part, hon member, I wish to inform you that I have contacted Provincial Treasury under whose jurisdiction this question resort and they react as follows:

“Yes, but only to the extent where the Provincial Treasury has been exposed to procurement activities in the municipality. The municipality has a supply chain management and a preferential procurement policy in place that guides their procurement activities.”

Through the Provincial Treasury and compliance assessment, the clean audit

status of the municipality, there appears to be no evidence of cases where procedures were substantially not followed by the municipality. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Bredell. Hon member Mr Dyantyi, follow-up.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you Minister Bredell. Is the MEC saying the George Municipality is not responding, is not following the recommendations of the Public Protector even when the Public Protector in that report says both the Municipal Systems Act and the George Municipality Appointment Policy were breached? Is therefore that municipality saying they are not responding to those recommendations? That is my first question.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We received the answer from the municipality and they are busy investigating as I have stated that I received this on 6 March so we are busy with the process. It is the municipality's right. You always hear both sides. I have also seen the report of the Public Protector and therefore my Department works on both and they will interact and we will decide on the way forward.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, your next one?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Is the MEC aware that the person who is the subject of this investigation has been appointed despite the fact that she has got Grade

10 when what is needed is a BTech?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I cannot work these things out beforehand. We need to work with the facts. We need to work with the facts. I need to get the facts. I need to get the facts before I take a decision. I cannot work on rumours. There are a lot of rumours within the municipal domain. I have received a couple of these reports that we are busy working through including the Public Protector's report, including the answers that they received from the municipality that the Touws River and I can go into the whole depth of [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Touwsrand.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Touwsrand, sorry. Touwsrand, but I think it is premature. We need to wait now for the investigation. The Department will work through all these documents. We will come back. We will look into it. If there is any fault we will act accordingly.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The third question hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Yes thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Thank you MEC for that response. My next question is accepting that your Department is going to set aside staff in the process, if the Department comes with the same

conclusion that the Public Protector has come to, is the Minister able to say to us here that you will be able to act on those recommendations which includes that the municipal manager must face a disciplinary hearing and that Mr Buys, who has been appointed, that his contract must be discontinued?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Deputy Speaker, to be quite honest now, a bit naughty now, but from a governance perspective it is very difficult because then we need to interact in places like Oudtshoorn and on their appointments, because if you want to see illegal you must go there, but I can promise you from a Democratic Alliance point of view we will not tolerate not adhering to the legal requirements within any municipalities.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The last opportunity hon member Mr Dugmore?

Mr C M DUGMORE: It is a follow-up question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may pose the last one in this slot then.

An HON MEMBER: Why are you quiet now?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Okay. Thank you. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to ask the MEC if he is aware that Mr Buys was a party organiser

for the DA, the one with the Grade 10 now, the one with the Grade 10. Is he aware that he was a party organiser and is he aware and that it is alleged that the Mayor instructed the municipal manager to appoint Mr Buys despite the fact that this post required a BTech?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Bredell?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: No. I am not aware of it but I am just trying to find it. It is on the first page, I think, of the report. The George Municipality is very upfront with the Public Protector telling them that the complainant is an “ou stryd-os van die ANC, and he drives an ANC agenda and will always come up with these kinds of allegations.”

That is irrespective. My Department must interact, intervene where possible, work with the municipality from a governance point of view but I can promise this House, from the DA’s perspective, the DA leadership in this province will not tolerate any non-adherence to the legal requirements within the municipalities. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move on to question 10. Hon Minister Madikizela, Human Settlements.

Ward 91 victims of fire

10. Mr K E Magaxa asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

What is the progress pertaining to Ward 91 victims of fire that were temporarily accommodated in the OR Tambo Hall in Khayelitsha Site B?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much Mr Deputy Speaker. After that very unfortunate incident in Ward 91 the City of Cape Town moved with speed to find alternative accommodation for the people of BM Section and of course while the City of Cape Town was busy finding a solution those people were then relocated next to OR Tambo because they could not be relocated back to BM.

The City of Cape Town moved with speed. The site was identified. The contractor was appointed and while all that was happening there were ongoing negotiations as it is the case everywhere that whenever you are relocating people to a particular community you always engage with the nearby communities that always feel entitled as well to that development.

An agreement was reached with the community of Mfuleni that they will also benefit from the development. As the contractor was busy on site one or some of the people from the same community came up with more demands which were very unreasonable and the unfortunate part is that this whole thing is instigated by the ANC councillor and the ANC leaders, who have now subsequently instigated people to prevent the relocation of people from BM Section to go there [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Ja [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: And it is so unfortunate that we are now in a situation. Now this is a fact and we must not joke about it. It is now so unfortunate that after the agreement was reached the councillor of Mfuleni instigated some people not to allow people of BM Section to be relocated there. In fact, the container of the contractor was burnt because these people were adamant, quite adamant that they do not want people from BM Section to be relocated there despite the fact that there were a number of negotiations where the agreement was reached that they will benefit and therefore also the people of BM Section will benefit. Now as things stand the honest answer is that that whole development has been grinding to a halt.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Ja, that is what the ANC does to the people...

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. My following question [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Disgraceful.

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...because I then want to respond to allegations. I just want to check with the Minister now, now that he has acknowledged all those

problems, what is he doing in the Ministry to renegotiate or perhaps to meet with that community, because the situation is that that place where they are was a temporary arrangement and it is almost the third year now with those people there.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Look, I share the concerns of hon member Mr Magaxa, I honestly share those concerns. In fact yesterday I had a meeting with a Mayco member of the City of Cape Town and I did because the City of Cape Town, the Mayor in particular, was at the forefront of this particular project. There are two things that are likely to happen if I can just answer that. [Interjections.] ...of the project, the project.

There are two things that are likely to happen. The first thing is that there is a development that we are doing as the Provincial Department of Human Settlements which is aimed at accommodating the spill-over of the N2 people particularly from Kwa-Langa.

Now that development was also going to benefit people of Mfuleni because we wanted to integrate them. People of Mfuleni, people of Kwa-Langa and people of Eerste River.

Now when I discussed this issue with the Mayco [Inaudible.] I said there are two things that I would like to have and one is that we are again going to engage the councillor and the perpetrators who have caused the situation that we find ourselves in, failing which I will then inform the councillor that the

opportunities that were made available to people of Mfuleni will no longer be made available if they behave like this, which means we are now going to look at accommodating people from BM Section. So this matter is receiving attention because I fully agree with you that the situation that they are in is unacceptable because as you said that was meant to be a temporary arrangement.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Another follow-up, hon member Mr Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes Mr Deputy Speaker, I think it will be my last one. I just want to check therefore in the light of this resistance from the Mfuleni area, is there any other land? Is there any availability of land where you can make a permanent arrangement for those people towards this other site, because I think also you must acknowledge that there is a tendency of driving African and the Coloured people towards the Grabouw [Interjections.] ...while there is a lot of land on this other side [Interjections.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Hy is baie seer.

'n AGBARE LID: Hy bly daar, hy bly nog op Elsies.

'n AGBARE LID: Dis wit in Elsies.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Look, let me answer that in two ways. The first thing is that that was an emergency. Obviously what we

had to do was to find land that we own as government, because most of the portions of land that we are talking about are privately owned, so if you deal with an emergency you cannot find land that is owned by a private owner. That will take you five years to buy and develop so the first thing that we had to do... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is perfect!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Do you know how long the process of expropriation takes? So the first thing that we had to do was to find land that we own, land that was ready for us to move in with speed, with all the services and we are already doing development in that site next to Bosasa. That is why we identified it.

It does not mean we cannot identify another site but given the fact that that was an emergency it is going to take longer and that is not what we wanted. So it is true that we can identify other sites, but the reason why that site was identified is because the work was already happening there. Because we are dealing with emergency we were going to move those people there quicker. In fact if it was not for this unfortunate impasse that we find ourselves in now those people would have been relocated a long time ago but we are busy with that process of finding alternative accommodation.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move on to Question number 11, hon Minister Madikizela.

“Pota-Pota” sanitation, addressing rejection of

11. Mr K E Magaxa asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

What (a) is he and his Department doing to address the rejection of “pota-pota” by communities and (b) progress has been made to address or change this form of sanitation?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much again. Portable flush toilets have not been rejected by the majority of residents. I think we need to put that on record. There are currently close to 20,000 portable flush toilets being serviced by the City of Cape Town. All of these have been provided to people who have chosen to have them after education and awareness on the typology that was provided. Portable flush toilets are entirely voluntary but the roll-out of the system has been plagued by politicising it in many communities and that has been a pet-project of Ses’khona. Portable flush toilets are a top-up service. Again this is very, very important. Because most of the ablution facilities, given the fact that informal settlements are too densely populated, are far away from their homes. This was a top-up type of service so that people can use it particularly at night because of the complaints that we often receive. As we know it is very, very dangerous in informal settlements. So no informal settlement is entirely reliant on the portable flush toilets typology except where the typography of certain sites does not allow the installation of

underground services. So it should be noted then that no new portable toilets have been installed. The existing ones continue to be serviced three times a week by the City of Cape Town contractor free of charge to the beneficiaries.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any follow-up question, hon member Mr Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker. I just want to check with the Minister because he is saying the majority is not - how does he get to those facts because I do not remember any referral made there in relation to those. How does he reach the conclusion, because the last time I checked the Ses'khona people in a massive way marched to this City of Cape Town and they continue doing that kind of a challenge. At some point they even threw that thing in his car.

An HON MEMBER: There are 20 000 [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Well it is very easy to come to that conclusion. By the way most of the people who were at the forefront of that march, including you, do not use portable flush toilets. In fact you are living in a posh area so you cannot judge the numbers of people who are here and come to a conclusion that they are massive because many of those people are coming from decent homes, like yourself, so the situation of many of those people it is not acceptable. Let me make that point very, very clear.

We are dealing with a situation where there are certain areas where people need to be relocated in order for them to get flush toilets because the ultimate

goal of this government - and as you will see as we talk about this during my budget - is that ultimately we want to see each and everyone having a flush toilet. We are not proud of providing these temporary portable flush toilets but this is a temporary measure to deal with the situation where people cannot be able to use portable flush toilets because of the situation where they live. So out of all the areas that find themselves in that situation we could count the number of those areas and the number of people and that is why we are able to tell you that out of the number of people that we know are in this situation, the majority of them accepted the portable flush toilet, except the few that were led by Ses'khona and you in order to score political points.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a further follow-up question, Mr Magaxa?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes Chair, I think the Minister is not answering my question properly. [Interjections.] I just want to check, I was just simply asking how does he reach that conclusion that the majority of people in those particular communities are satisfied with those things and not rejecting that. I think the same question. [Interjections.] Of course about me, I am not staying in a "pota-pota" house. I have a nice big house, yes.

An HON MEMBER: We know.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes, nearer to the "pota-pota" it is just a small walk.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you member, the question? [Interjections.]

The question is clear, Minister Madikizela?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It is very simple, Mr Deputy Speaker, so that I do not waste your time, very simple. The City of Cape Town conducted a study to see how many people do not have flush toilets and then they offered all these people the portable flush toilets out of the number of people that were calculated, and we can say more than 20,000 portable flush toilets are being used and that is how I am able to say that there is a majority.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Because they do not have an option.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: But I did explain.
[Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: It does not qualify [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I did explain that this form of sanitation is not permanent and the reason why we had to offer this form of sanitation is because of the situation that people find themselves in but over and above that it is voluntary because no informal settlements entirely depend on portable flush toilets.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: There is not any informal settlement [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Yes, lecture them.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The reason why we offered this is because toilets are very far because of densely populated informal settlements, so that is why we are offering them. We are not proud of it. We are not saying it is a permanent solution but judging by the fact that when I went home, by the way, because I still travel between here and the Eastern Cape, I saw that some of these portable flush toilets found their way outside this province, it means there are people who find them useful.

The PREMIER: Lots of people use them.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: But we are not saying we are proud of this as a department. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to the next question, Question number 12, Minister Meyer.

Department of Finance

Support to Oudtshoorn Municipality

***12. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Finance:**

What support did the Oudtshoorn Municipality receive from him and his Department for the past three years?

Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Dankie mnr die Adjunkspeaker en dankie aan agb lid mnr Uys vir hierdie vraag. Gedurende die afgelope drie jare is die Oudtshoorn Munisipaliteit deur die Provinsiale Tesourie soos volg ondersteun: ondersteuning ten opsigte van oorsig en regeringsbestuur en verslagdoeningsperspektief oor die afgelope drie jare. Daar is ook maandelikse en kwartaallikse jaarverslae geëvalueer.

Daar is ook steun met behulp en kommentaar op die maandelikse binne-jaar moniteringsverslae, dit wil sê op inkomste- en uitgawe bestuurspraktyke en tendense, debiteure- en krediteurebestuurspraktyke, asook reageer op die versoeke hetsy finansieel of nie-finansieel of die hantering van aangeleenthede rakende die lewering van dienste, steun met die ondersteuning van verskeie begroting- en ander diensleweringfunksies; die fasilitering met die betaal van skuld ten opsigte van provinsiale en nasionale regeringsrekeninge via die geïnstitutionaliseerde Skuldbestuurskomitee asook die lewering van kommentaar op die jaarlikse begroting; die nakoming of nie-nakoming en die reaksievermoë en geloofwaardigheid van die begroting via die Plaaslike Regering Mediumtermynuitgawe Komitee en die geïntegreerde

ontwikkelingsbeplanningsprosesse asook deur die halfjaarlikse sogenaamde MGRO-prosesse en assesserings daarvan.

Daar is ook lewering van spesifieke hulp om die goedkeuring van die 2013/14 Aansuiweringsbegroting asook die 2014/15 Hoofbegroting te verseker om sodoende te verseker dat die munisipaliteit die deurlopende vermoë sal hê om die nodige dienste te kan verskaf. Daar is ook hulp aangebied deur die Provinsiale Tesourie aan Oudtshoorn ten opsigte van die bestuur van die jaareinde gereedheidsassessering en tegniese oorsig van die 2013/14 finansiële state alvorens dit ingedien word by die Ouditeur-generaal asook ondersteuning gebied deur die Provinsiale Tesourie ten opsigte van die fasilitering van verskeie opleidingsgeleenthede insluitende Excel Spreadsheet Opleiding ter voorbereiding van die jaarlikse state asook die ondersteuning aan die munisipaliteit vir die GRAP-opleiding asook die openbare sektor kontantvloei bestuursopleiding, die openbare sektor ondernemingsrisiko bestuursopleiding, voorsieningskettingsbestuur en begroting binne jaarverslagdoeningsopleiding asook laastens, mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ondersteuning is ook deur hierdie Provinsiale Tesourie verskaf vir die samestelling van die jaarlikse maatskaplike sosio-ekonomiese profiele.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie, agb lid mnr Uys, 'n opvolgvraag?

Mnr P UYS: Baie dankie mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Waar die LUR vir ons sê en dit belangrik is dat hy die volle vertroue van 'n gemeenskap in 'n munisipaliteit en 'n raad moet hê, hoe regverdig hy en hoe gaan hy die raad in

die toekoms benader waar hy as leier van die DA en ook as kiesafdelingshoof 'n optog na die munisipaliteit toe lei? Maak dit nie sy taak as of Minister of LUR daar onmoontlik of as kiesafdelingsleier in Oudtshoorn nie, en sal hy een van die twee moet laat vaar.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, juis omdat die Demokratiese Alliansie anders as ander politieke partye 'n skeiding handhaaf tussen die politieke administratiewe en die wetgewende en uitvoerende gesag, is my rol absoluut duidelik.

Indien ek 'n politieke agenda gehad het dan sou ek geensins hierdie ondersteuning aan daardie munisipaliteit gebied het nie. Juis omdat ek nie 'n politieke agenda het as politieke hoof van daardie kiesafdeling nie, verstaan ek duidelik my uitvoerende gesagsverantwoordelikhede en daarom bied ek binne die raamwerk daardie ondersteuning aan hierdie betrokke munisipaliteit en ek is daarom baie seker indien ek daardie lyn sal oorskry, sal hierdie Kabinet my voor stok kry.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid mnr Joseph, 'n opvolgvraag?

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker. Given the political instability that exists in Oudtshoorn after the ANC has refused to hand over Oudtshoorn Municipality after the DA has won the by-election I want to know [Interjections.] I want to know if the Minister is aware that the community is

very upset and someone wrote a letter to Minister Pravin Gordhan.

An HON MEMBER: Someone.

Mr D JOSEPH: So I want to know from the Minister, is he aware who asked the Minister, who wrote this letter? Is he aware of a letter and who wrote this letter and what are the details in the letter that was written to Minister Pravin Gordhan? Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: That is a good question.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb Minister Bredell.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Agb Speaker, ek dink dit is 'n baie belangrike vraag want daar is 'n besoek gelewer deur agb Minister Pravin Gordhan aan Oudtshoorn Munisipaliteit as deel van sy oorsigfunksies as die Minister verantwoordelik vir Plaaslike Regering Nasionaal. Tydens sy oorsigbesoek daar by die munisipaliteit is hy nie baie hoflik ontvang deur die Oudtshoorn Munisipaliteit nie, en hy was ernstig beskuldig, en na daardie besoek aan Oudtshoorn Munisipaliteit het Oudtshoorn Munisipaliteit 'n skrywe gerig aan die agb Minister Pravin Gordhan en die agbare lid het nou vir my gevra wat is die inhoud van daardie skrywe.

Ek wil graag vir u voorlees wat Oudtshoorn Munisipaliteit vir mnr Pravin

Gordhan geskryf het na aanleiding van sy besoek aldaar; and this is the letter from the Oudtshoorn Municipality to Minister Pravin Gordhan. They write, and I quote:

“Following your visit I enquired from our Executive Mayor and the municipal manager whether they knew of your visit and they both are of the view that your visit was rather embarrassing for the reasons I will state below. Oudtshoorn Municipality...”

Look at the tone of the letter of the Oudtshoorn Municipality to Minister Pravin Gordhan. [Interjections.]

They also write to the Minister Pravin Gordhan. They say:

“What troubles Council is that its Minister Gordhan, who is supposed to protect them, is accompanied by criminals on his visit to the Municipality...”

The PREMIER: Ooh!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Oudtshoorn writing to the National Minister in this tone. [Interjection.] In addition this letter was also written to the Minister, they write to him that he acted in bad faith and they say:

“We are very disappointed that you, the Minister of Local Government

openly align yourself with criminals who stole money from the taxpayers.”

This is Oudtshoorn writing to Minister Pravin Gordhan. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Like Julius. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I am continuing, Mr Deputy Speaker, to the question asked by the Deputy Chief Whip.

The PREMIER: Well the President is a thief.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: This is what Oudtshoorn Municipality, ANC aligned municipality, are writing to Minister Gordhan as follows, and I quote:

“I place on record that the municipality will turn to the Courts to test any action that you may embark on which in our view has the intention of undermining the independence of our municipality...”

In addition they write, Mr Deputy Speaker, look at the tone of this letter, the next paragraph. They write:

“In addition, we will ask the Court for appropriate cost order against you in your personal capacity.”

The PREMIER: Yoh!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, this is how Oudtshoorn Municipality, the mafia that is running that municipality, is replying to the National Minister who is just trying to do his oversight function in that municipality, but in addition, when the ANC went there to try to instruct the Mayor to suspend senior officials of the municipality, forced him to write a letter, which he wrote. As soon as the ANC left the town the true colours of the Mayor came to light again. He then withdrew that particular letter [Laughter.] and rejected the ANC leadership because he said to them, and we have some evidence [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Skobbejak!

Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Skobbejak! [Gelag.] This is the attitude of the Mayor of Oudtshoorn. He belongs in jail and he will be in jail and he is currently before Court. He stole cement, stone, and klippies van die munisipaliteit... [Gelag.]

The PREMIER: He is trying to build Nkandla.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: And he is currently building... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Nkandla.

Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: 'n Viswinkel... [Gelag.] in Dysselsdorp.

'n AGBARE LID: 'n Viswinkel.

Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: En hy het nie 'n bouplan nie. [Tussenwerpsel.] Sy watertoevoer is afgesluit. [Tussenwerpsel.] Hy het besluit hy sit self die water aan, mnr die Adjunkspeaker.

'n AGBARE LID: Nee, fire hom.

Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Ons het hier met 'n Mafia burgemeester te doen.

'n AGBARE LID: Skande.

Die MINISTER VAN FINANSIES: Want as u hierdie toon van hierdie brief lees is daar in Oudtshoorn nie 'n munisipaliteit nie, maar 'n Mafia wat daar aan bewind is.

Die PREMIER: Daar's hy.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Hear, hear. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You can get the last one. Hon member Mr Uys first.

Mr P UYS: Thank you. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. A question to the MEC then: will you support national intervention in the Oudtshoorn Municipality and why was there no provincial intervention so far in Oudtshoorn Municipality?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, like myself, the hon Chief Whip is a student of public administration, so he understands the separation of powers. He should understand the principle of separation of powers [Interjection.]

Die PREMIER: Hy wil nie verstaan nie.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: But if he does not want, let me then explain it to him. He understands that in terms of Section 139 in terms of putting the municipality under administration there are three partners. He understands that there is the partnership between the National Department of Local Government, Cogta in this case. There is the relationship with the Provincial Executive, which is the Cabinet, and then thirdly the NCOP.

The hon member knows what the situation is currently with the NCOP. The NCOP did have a public hearing in George on the 7th and I am very thankful, Mr Deputy Speaker, that he also chaired one of those particular sessions regarding this particular matter that hon member Mr Uys is now raising.

I am particularly happy to see great progress in that particular space because this is not simply a function of one sphere of Government, you need the cooperation of the executive, you need the cooperation of the National Minister and you need the cooperation of the NCOP and the NCOP is currently planning to visit Oudtshoorn during the period of 13 to 17 April and I am very pleased to hear the message coming out from the Chairperson of the NCOP in relation to the situation in Oudtshoorn.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I will allow the last supplementary question, the hon member Mr Paulsen.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I just would like to know from the Minister what were the successes based on his Department's interventions in Oudtshoorn?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon Mr Deputy Speaker to the hon member, I think it is mixed successes in the case of initially supporting the municipality wanting to make certain things work, but one of the things that came

absolutely clear, there is no political will to listen to any advice. There is a Mafia and a corruption culture but we have monitored many of these activities. For example I have here a letter that was written to the Premier from Eskom indicating to thank her for her interventions in getting many municipalities to pay their outstanding accounts and this letter, the situation has subsequently changed, but this letter is dated 6 February and up to the date of 6 February Eskom has thanked the Premier in a letter addressed to her for the intervention of this Government in terms of debt collection in this particular space, but I think the situation in terms of the financial situation in Oudtshoorn is now critical because the municipality has now done another thing.

The PREMIER: Ooh yes.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: The money that the municipality is deducting from the staff for pension, medical aid, UIF, is now not being paid to the pension fund and to the medical aid fund and because of this the staff of the municipality has demonstrated to the municipality on Monday. I was in Oudtshoorn on Monday when the whole town was on fire. They burnt tyres right in front of the municipality because this is theft by conversion.
[Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Because they paid the Eskom bill.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Also Mr Deputy Speaker, I have also

received a briefing by the police. A criminal case has been made by SAMWU against the municipality because this is pure theft of people's pension money and the money from the medical aids, and so there is a criminal case against the municipality and I do have the case number and so I am really seriously concerned about the financial stability in that particular municipality.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That brings us to the end of Questions.

The PREMIER: What about my question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Madam Premier, unfortunately we have used all the available questions, only four per question.

The PREMIER: Oh.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Question time has expired. The outstanding replies will be placed in Hansard, printed in Hansard.

[Replies to outstanding questions 13 to 15 to be printed in Hansard]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We now come to questions to the Premier without notice. I see the hon member Ms Beerwinkel first. [Interjections.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Gooi kole! Gooi kole!

An HON MEMBER: She is burning.

'n AGBARE LID: Gooi as!

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: U kan voortgaan.

QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dis koud in die Huis.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Madam Premier, why as the first citizen of this province would you consciously and with intent flout the laws and bylaws of your own DA-run City to assist rich farmers and their elite clientele so that they can further enrich themselves by hosting a market on the lawns of Leeuwenhof? [Laughter.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier to respond. [Interjections.] Order! Order!

The PREMIER: I reject the tendentious assumptions made by the hon member Ms Beerwinkel. In fact... [Interjection.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Dis 'n boetie-boetie [Onduidelik.] Dis wat daai is.

The PREMIER: Many people, and a lot of them poor, have jobs now and earn an income because a public facility paid for by taxpayers has some public purpose for the very first time. [Interjections.] And it is possible for a lot of people now to come and sell their produce and invitations have been put to a whole range of people including Abantu Basekhaya and we are going to be opening a craft section and a whole range of other sections so that we can meet our number one priority in this province, which is creating jobs and beating poverty and I would imagine that the hon member Ms Beerwinkel and the hon opposition in this House would be very pleased that in fact what we are doing is using a public facility in the public interest for the public good. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Beerwinkel, follow-up.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker I am going to repeat my question, because it was not answered. Why did the Premier flout the bylaws of the City of Cape Town to allow the market on the lawns of Leeuwenhof?

The PREMIER: I understand that all the necessary permissions and papers and agreements and event management requirements and everything have been met, Mr Deputy Speaker [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Oh, is it.

The PREMIER: And I understand that all of the processes have been gone through including a decision by the Provincial Cabinet. In November and December of last year we had not been through all the red tape yet, but because at the last minute the market was forbidden from operating where it had always operated at Homestead Park and because they desperately needed another venue and because a lot of jobs were at risk, I offered them the prospect of using Leeuwenhof, where I currently live, to save those jobs and to enable the market to continue.

An HON MEMBER: Thank you.

The PREMIER: I take full responsibility for that and indeed we moved very quickly to put all the permissions and all the red tape requirements in place and if I had to do it I would do it again. Red tape is there to serve a purpose for the public and when the public interest, which is to me the number one criterion, is at stake, we can make sure that all of the permissions fall into place, which they have done very expeditiously, as we pursued them in parallel with allowing jobs to continue.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Ms Beerwinkel your last chance.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker by the Premier's own admission in the newspaper she did this to circumvent the red tape that would have stopped these people from being able to do business. However, my question

now is having realised that the clientele on the day was predominantly white with produce... [Interjections.] ...was predominantly white with produce from predominantly white suppliers, can the Premier now tell us whether the lawns of Leeuwen... [Interjection.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Leeuwenhof. Leeuwenhof, moenie worry nie.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Leeuwenhof. I am Zevenwacht. Leeuwenhof are now open to the informal traders of Mitchells Plain and Gugulethu and Kraaifontein and rural areas and if so, what are the processes that they have to follow to be able to get this kind of concession? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

An HON MEMBER: No, you would not understand.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Winde, Minister Winde, give the Premier a chance to reply.

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, the market is open to everyone.

Me B A SCHÄFER: Ja.

The PREMIER: And I am not aware of any trader who has asked to be able to sell their goods at the market who has been turned away, not one. I have seen

traders of all races and all backgrounds selling their goods. I have seen people of all races and all backgrounds enjoying the lawns and I rejoiced that at least some people are enjoying the lawns because I very rarely have a chance to be there and in any event it would be a waste just for a small number of people in my family.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Ons kom daar, nou, nou.

The PREMIER: It is a very, very good thing that the public can use it. The public whatever race, whatever social background they are, who have come there have been unfailingly warm and pleasant to each other, having unfailingly reflected the spirit of Cape Town. The swimming pool is always full of children having fun and if anybody would like to sell their wares there at the market, they are very welcome to apply. My plan is to expand the market not to retract it and my plan is to turn Leeuwenhof into a working farm so that [Interjections.] [Laughter.] Yes, that is my plan. My plan is to turn Leeuwenhof into a working farm.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Why not.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: So that we do not have the perennial flowers that have traditionally grown there but that we have fynbos and orchards and vegetables that the very fine gardeners who work that garden can also sell the

produce at the market on a Saturday. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear.

The PREMIER: We are going to return Leeuwenhof to a place that grows food and where the workers who work there can sell food. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The next question, hon member Mr Hinana. Order!

Mr N E HINANA: Thanks Mr Deputy Speaker. My question to the Premier is that how does the provincial strategic goals of the Western Cape address the fundamental social problems which is alcohol... [Interjections.] [Laughter.] ...which is drug abuse and that have devastated the safety and health of the province so that we can revert back to the normal situation despite these problems that I have just highlighted. What are the plans?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much Mr Deputy Speaker. We are obliged by law to put together a provincial strategic plan and we have done so with four overriding provincial strategic goals and eight game-changers, as we call them.

One of the game-changers is after-school activities, which we hope will

involve all the learners of this province eventually in productive after-school activities so they can play sports in teams; so they can improve their own schoolwork; so that they can undertake cultural activities and not get involved in gangs and drugs.

Also, we have a game changer that we are still designing on trying to curb alcohol abuse because alcohol abuse is one of the most serious issues in this province. It underlies most interpersonal violence. It underlies almost all domestic violence. It underlies most car crashes and it underlies a great deal of our crime. It costs this province billions of rands and often has a terrible effect on children because they are born permanently brain-damaged as a result of something that is 100% avoidable, so we are trying to focus on the very best practice from everywhere in the world to deal with alcohol abuse. Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. There is no follow-up question there? We continue with the third one, hon member Ms Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I would like to ask what the Premier's reply is to the accusation that racism in the Western Cape has recently escalated due to her historical references to "black as refugees, professional blacks, artwork collectors; doctoring degrees or elephants" that gave an upsurge to the people in the leafy communities to attack blacks and to treat them like criminals. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Premier.

The PREMIER: I have never said any of those things about black people.

Ms P MAKELENI: Yes you have, yes, you have.

An HON MEMBER: No, no.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up question? If there is no follow-up question we continue. The fourth one, hon member Ms Du Toit Marais.

An HON MEMBER: There was a follow-up.

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: A follow-up?

An HON MEMBER: There is a follow-up question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Du Toit Marais, is there a follow-up?

Ms P MAKELENI: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue, before. Yes, please continue.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. As much as I have a proof for you which I will deliver to you of all these incidents, I would like to know why would people increasingly use utter racial abuses and physically assault innocent black people in your province. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Premier I did not quite get that question. Did you get the question, Premier?

The PREMIER: I have absolutely no idea what the member is on about. First of all you will recall Mr Deputy Speaker, how I exposed the ANC's - if it was parliamentary in this House to say lies I would say "lies", but seeing that it is not parliamentary I will say "complete distortions of what I have said".

Ms P MAKELENI: Talk to the issue at hand.

An HON MEMBER: There is no issue at hand.

Ms P MAKELENI: There is!

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, with reference to my referring to black people as elephants, I have never done that. I referred to "an elephant in the room" which is an idiomatic expression. [Interjections.] It is quite extraordinary, it is quite extraordinary that the ANC generalises from a specific contextual issue and focuses it on all black people, which is the worst form of racism practised by them. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja, ja.

The PREMIER: They take a specific issue and they generalise it to all black people because it suits their racist agenda of racial mobilisation
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: The ANC is racist.

The PREMIER: ...and I have said none of those things about black people as they are trying to make out here today and I reject it with contempt and I think that those kinds of hypothetical and distorted questions that would be defined as outright lies outside this House, should not be allowed.
[Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: You continue speaking everything that counts [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a last follow-up question, your last opportunity?

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you Madam Speaker, maybe the Premier must go and check Hansard Thursday 28 February 2013.

An HON MEMBER: Yes because she did not get this.

Ms P MAKELENI: My second question to you, Premier, is what the Premier says about reports that her Community Safety MEC claims “the introduction of green cards carried like an apartheid dompas by black workers...”

[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order, member! That is a totally new question. Your question must relate to the original.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, a follow-up.

The PREMIER: I think it does relate. Let me answer that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am still... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier no, that question does not relate to the original question.

Ms P MAKELENI: No it does, yes, it does.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Does it relate?

Ms P MAKELENI: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay if you are happy then please continue.

Ms P MAKELENI: Let me start again. What does the Premier say about reports that her Community Safety MEC claims “the introduction of green card carried like an apartheid dompas by black workers to restrict their movement in the more affluent suburbs of Worcester, is merely as a security measure...”?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Sorry Mr Deputy Speaker, the Premier can use her discretion if she so wishes. However the member’s original questions were based on the Premier’s quotations. Now she is quoting one of her MECs.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Wiley yes... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: It is a different question altogether. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That was my first impression also but I think the member brought it closer to the original question. I am happy that the member’s question touches on the Premier’s original question. [Interjections.] Madam Premier, if you want to respond to that.

The PREMIER: Yes, I would very much like to respond to that, because this in fact was an initiative of the South African Police Service.

Mr D JOSEPH: National.

The PREMIER: It had absolutely nothing to do with the DA. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The PREMIER: It had absolutely nothing to do with the local authority and it had absolutely nothing to do with the Provincial Government.

An HON MEMBER: National Cabinet.

An HON MEMBER: The ANC.

The PREMIER: SAPS is a function of the National Government so perhaps the ANC should ask the National Minister Mr Nathi Nhleko, [Interjection.]

Mr D JOSEPH: Yes.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Exactly!

The PREMIER: ...when he stops trying to fire the head of the Hawks for wanting to investigate Nkandla, why they are introducing the dompas again.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Ja. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: But the interesting thing is the first place that the dompas

was introduced again was in Gauteng. It was in Gauteng, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Mr D JOSEPH: National.

The PREMIER: There was an agreement and this time [Interjections.] ...this time it was not only - it was not only the SAPS and various other things. It was a proud announcement by the MEC, the ANC MEC Nkosi-Malubane and published in *The Star* some while back, about a new dompas.

An HON MEMBER: Dompas.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Ja.

The PREMIER: A new rural safety strategy promoted by the ANC in Gauteng.

'n AGBARE LID: Eina!

The PREMIER: And here it says “that farmers must hire legal and documented workers...” Listen to this. [Interjections.] This is what the MEC Nkosi-Malubane [Interjections.]

Ms P MAKELENI: Stop telling us about. We are not talking about the ANC. Speak about Cape Town. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: I am answering your question. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Let the Premier answer the question. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: This is the introduction of the... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mnr R B LENTIT: Skande, skande!

The PREMIER: This is the introduction of the dompas long before we even learnt about the South African Police Services dompas in Worcester.

An HON MEMBER: And you like it here.

The PREMIER: What the MEC Nkosi-Malubane in Gauteng announced, one of the measures she announced was “that farmers must hire legal and protected workers and create profile cards to be verified at local stations.”

'n AGBARE LID: Ja, vertel hulle.

The PREMIER: Exactly the same thing that started with the endorsement of the ANC and especially the MEC in Gauteng. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: We stopped it. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Now listen to this: “During a weekend of talk shops and consensus building South Africans from across the ideological social racial and economic spectrum, including the ANC, came up with a strategy to promote safety, which was the dompas.”

They say: “Ideologues, politicians, farmworkers, trade unions, and their aids all agreed that a passbook for modern informal workers would be a splendid idea and leading that was the ANC’s MEC Nkosi-Malubane.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Oh yes.

The PREMIER: In fact, in fact the only person that protested was the DA spokesperson Kate Lorimer and she issued a statement saying: “This is outrageous. It is unconstitutional and we cannot have it.” [Interjections.]

Five minutes later it sticks its head out [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: In your province.

The PREMIER: ...in Worcester as an SAPS strategy loaned from the ANC in Gauteng. [Interjections.] So this is an ANC strategy. It is even done in ANC colours. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: In your province.

The PREMIER: I am amazed we have not put “a better life for all” on it.

Ms P MAKELENI: Those are IFP [Inaudible.] not ANC [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: ...or “a good story to tell” on the cover.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Ja, you see.

The PREMIER: This is your strategy.

Ms P MAKELENI: In case you do not know [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: It started in Gauteng and we will kick it out of the Western Cape because we do not want it here. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! The honourable... [Interjections.] Order! Order! Hon member Mr Uys. [Interjections.] Order please, hon member Mr Uys, I am listening to you.

Mr P UYS: Just a point of order. I waited till the two follow-up questions was done. Mr Deputy Speaker the Premier said, “If it was said outside it would have been a lie, but inside I am not allowed to say that.” By that she is implying and then we will always say, “Premier you are telling a lie” if we

are outside the House and inside the House... I would like you to rule on it. I think it is wrong.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I will, I listened very carefully when the Premier spoke. She referred to the ANC and not to members.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Ja.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: But I will again look at Hansard. If the reference was to members in this House certainly that would be unparliamentary. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: She spoke about the dompas. She referred to...

The PREMIER: The ANC started the dompas.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we continue, the honourable Marais, hon member Ms Du Toit Marais. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: ...but you just love; it is a racist province. (?)

An HON MEMBER: No. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Madam Premier.

An HON MEMBER: What is the point of order?

The PREMIER: The critical issue here is... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Premier, is it a point of order?

The PREMIER: No. It is my answer to the question. [Interjections.]
[Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take your seat. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: We did not endorse or support this initiative in the Western Cape. We fundamentally rejected it. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! [Interjections.] Please come to order. Premier your time has expired, that was beyond your time. [Interjections.] I have already asked the hon member Ms Du Toit Marais to continue. [Interjections.]

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. With reference to the recent Cape Times article about a child named Thomas, did the Western Cape Government take any steps to assist Thomas who was born with foetal alcohol syndrome on a Western Cape farm? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: So much research is done on [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: Yes, I read about baby Thomas. [Interjection.] It was on 5 March in the Cape Times.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: They do not even know what they are talking about.

The PREMIER: Now that of course was a highly suspect story because at least half of it was plagiarised.

Ms P MAKELENI: ...the dompas [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: And we have followed up with the social workers in the area and we have looked through all of the registered hospitals and other places and so far we have not located this child, but I am determined that if this child, this specific child does exist and has fallen through the cracks of our system, as sometimes may happen, that we will track this child down and so we are going to be meeting with the social workers in the area, the farmers in the area, the workers in the area, the labour inspectors in the area, because if this child Thomas and his alcoholic mother, Rose, have fallen through the cracks and he is in the kind of terrible condition described in this article we will track down this poor child and we will help him.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Ms Du Toit Marais.

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Has the Premier been able to get the name of the farm which is allegedly still using the Dop-system?

An HON MEMBER: The dompas?

An HON MEMBER: The Dop-system.

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, we know that paying people in alcohol is a criminal offence. It may not happen. Now and again allegations pop up that the Dop-system is still in operation on our farms and every single time I ask people for the details, which farms? You do not have to reveal your sources. Just even point me in the direction and we will do our own investigation because I personally will lay a charge against any farmer who pays his worker in wine. That does not mean to say we can stop workers buying alcohol with the wages they receive. This is an open and free society and we cannot stop adults deciding how to spend their money, but if anybody is paying workers in wine I will make sure that that farmer or that employer is criminally charged and lands up in jail.

'n AGBARE LID: Hoor!

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear.

The PREMIER: Now it is quite extraordinary to me that a newspaper can run an anonymous allegation that paying people in wine is still common in the Wellington area, and when my office asks the editor of the newspaper to please point us in the direction of where these criminal offences are still happening, he answers in one word with two capital letters: NO.

So the bottom line is that I will scour that area and if anybody has any allegations of any farmer or any employer who is paying his workers or her workers in wine or partly in wine I want to know about it, because it is a criminal offence and we will lay charges and we will put a watching brief on the case and it will result in a prosecution if there is evidence. Thank you.

'n AGBARE LID: Hoor!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That concludes the questions to the Premier.

An HON MEMBER: That is good governance.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to party statements. I first see the DA. Hon member, are you getting up for a statement?

'n AGBARE LID: Nee, nee.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Yes. It is member Maseko.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Maseko, you are first.

An HON MEMBER: Oh sorry, sorry.

Ms L M MASEKO: Ja. Okay.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

“A right is not what someone gives you. It is what no-one can take from you...” by Ramsey Clark.

Women rights are basic rights that every person of every colour, culture, regardless of their agenda or age has. The list on human rights is contained in the Bill of Rights in Chapter 2 of the South African Constitution.

As human rights apply to all persons so do the responsibilities that go along with them. Often I have listened to my colleagues from the ANC as they undermine our constitution in this House. They do this by labelling every black person who has exercised his or her right to be a member of any political party other than the ANC. Each one of us has the right to freedom of association. As public representatives they should rather uphold the bill of

rights and ameliorate a culture in which human rights are protected, respected universally and not selectively.

As human rights go along with responsibilities so too does freedom of expression. Freedom of speech is a political right to communicate one's opinions and ideas. As legislators we are all tasked with reflecting the will of people and the collective morality of the society. We must never fail to remember that we are all sitting here accountable to the Constitution and must comply with the standards set out within the Constitution. South Africa has a difficult past that so many of us are unable to communicate our opinions because of the colour of our skin. It will be a disgrace to see us regression towards that sort of conduct especially as we are tasked with the vital responsibility of nurturing our young democracy and moving it forward.

However we also have leaders in our communities. They have different views and innovative ways of seeing circumstances. We must listen to what is truly being said. In this way we uphold human rights and the culture of sharing an understanding through listening.

Madam Speaker, to lessen the confusion on the part of the opposition in this House I am honourable Letta Matlhodi Maseko. I am a proud public representative for the Democratic Alliance. I do not need nametags from the ANC.

There is an ever growing number of black South Africans who are members

of the Democratic Alliance. They do not need nametags from the ANC either.
I thank you, Madam Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: I see the ANC. [Interjections.] Order please, members.
[Interjections.] Order please members, speak to the Chair and not the
member. Hon member Mr Olivier, Chief Whip Mr Uys, if you can address
your members please.

Mr P UYS: Did you see anybody speak? [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: No, I did not. I just saw you looking at them. I did not see
anything other than that. You cannot simply just... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Does the Chief Whip [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ANC hon member Mr Fransman.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: This DA-government is again reeling under another
scandal caused by the leader of the Western Cape Provincial Government and
her administration. A wrong and irrational decision was taken by the
Executive Committee to boycott buying the black-owned *Cape Times*. In your
anger, your hatred... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: ...and your disgust for black ownership in the media has been exposed in this action. The ANC does not accept the excuses that this was first due to poor reporting and now all of a sudden an austerity measure directive to stop buying newspapers. We have picked up in the last three days three different reasons being given. The real reason is it has decided to target, to punish and to bully just one specific title.

Mr M G E WILEY: The real reason is because [Interjection.]

Mr M L FRANSMAN: The postulations on why this was done...

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: ...does not add up. It appears to be done to justify a decision and to cover up ulterior motives or DA tyranny. The issue here is the collapse of the party and this state into one in this province. They have decided to go on a witch-hunt on the independent newspapers and a party-political interest. Could the real reason be that this government want to penalise the *Cape Times* for its pursuance of the unfolding Filcon disgrace?

This assault to gag the newspaper is an assault on our democracy, constitutional values, freedom of speech, media freedom, the media and the media as such. It has nothing to do about choice, but it is all about bullying the paper that does not want to listen to her Majesty's voice. The hon Zille should come clean and tell the truth or else she will be fuelling growing

speculation that she harasses all and sundry and she does not want to be held accountable. In fact it is a well-known view amongst the media that Premier Zille abuses the office to bully... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Fransman, finish, your time is up, finish your sentence.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: ...to bully news editors into submission. This we should not allow. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] I see the DA. Hon member Ms Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you Madam Speaker. Land reform in this country is locked in by a populist affair, an occasional shout-out from the sidelines of both the ANC and the EFF with little substance or action. It is the reason why South Africa continues to fail in its objective [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...to redress the past. There is at present a failure rate of over 92% in land reform projects across our country, while Ministers rally around rhetoric that contradicts the National Development Plan while the President focuses on a tiny percentage of foreign owners and sidesteps real issues of communal and state owned land, the only thing we have is a paying

of lip service to something that impacts on the lives of the poor and the vulnerable in this country... [Interjection.] ...while written questions in the National Assembly reveal that the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform has lost R205 million in irregular fruitless and wasted expenditure between 2009 and 2014, the dispossessed people of South Africa will remain as such. Yet, Madam Speaker, the DA-run Western Cape has worked closely together with privately owned farms and found other ways to restore [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...to restore the dignity of the people through their commitment to the National Development Plan and their support to programmes such as the Land Reform Advisory Desk that will take land reform in the Western Cape to a 70% success rate within five years. But while forums such as the African Farmers Association criticising the Western Cape on our share equity schemes, the Western Cape is yet the only province to show a 62% success rate in shared ownership and a positive contribution to the agricultural economy. Even more concerning, how does the ANC think that they can move towards meaningful transformation in land reform when Gwede Mantashe, Secretary General of the ANC, in his recent comments persists in creating fear and uncertainty. Maybe the ANC should come clean with what its true intentions are with land reform in South Africa.

Yes, Madam Speaker, the DA-run Western Cape is the only province that is

putting measures to create and ensure meaningful land reform in this country.
Thank you.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Less than 1% ownership, black ownership. Less than 1%.

Mr M G E WILEY: That is not true, you know.

The SPEAKER: I see the EFF. [Interjections.] Order please members.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Less than one percent.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Thank you Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr M N PAULSEN: It took the advent of a revolutionary movement like the Economic Freedom Fighters to resurrect the memory of those brave men and women who opposed those unjust laws that required indigenous people of South Africa to carry passes in the land of our forefathers. In 1960 on 30 March more than 30 000 men and women from Nyanga and Langa marched to Caledon Street Police Headquarters to protest against that injustice.

An HON MEMBER: It was not the EFF, it was not.

Mr M N PAULSEN: The South African Government responded to the ensuing unrest by declaring a state of emergency. By 9 April 1960 448 civilians were either killed or injured. 29 black policemen were either killed or injured. No white policemen were killed or injured - black-on-black violence at its worst. In 1985 on 21 March in the township of Langa in Uitenhage more than 21 mourners were shot dead mostly in the back. The state reached a total settlement of R1.3 million with the families of the victims. Black lives are cheap.

The Economic Freedom Fighters commemorates the sacrifices of our fallen heroes on Saturday 21 March in Langa at 10:00 a.m. You are all invited, members.

What has changed in post-apartheid Western Cape over the past 55 years it was in the town of Worcester where blacks were again required to carry a green card in order to secure piece-jobs in the mainly white suburbs. This was done with the full knowledge of the South African Police Services of a post-apartheid South Africa. We need to ask why people in the Western Cape would think it is acceptable to resurrect apartheid practices.

Could it be that the Premier's past utterances has set the tone for this ensuing madness? It could also be the Chief Whip of the DA that followed suit telling mainly black opposition that they have a short attention span. Racism is racism however subtle, Madam Speaker. [Interjections.]

Telling an hon member he should do maths literacy or replacing the term refugees with migrant population is so subtle it goes by almost unnoticed. We should have that much-needed conversation about race and racism. We should make history a compulsory subject up until Matric... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen.

Mr M N PAULSEN: ...so that learners are reminded of our past and are able to avoid repeating it. Let us also work towards removing the statues... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen your time is up. Kindly finish up.

Mr M N PAULSEN: ...of the men that came here to plunder, loot and rape our land. [Time expired.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Sit down!

Mr M N PAULSEN: You do not tell me to sit down. I will moer you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mackenzie, are you standing on a point of order?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: On a point of order. The hon member Mr Paulsen,

which he will fail to do, he said he will “moer” me, which is not parliamentary. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is unparliamentary. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, did you indeed utter those words?

Mr M N PAULSEN: Yes Madam Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: Withdraw.

The SPEAKER: Withdraw please.

Mr M N PAULSEN: I withdraw the word “moer”. I will beat him up.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen. [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Wiley, before you... [Interjections.] Members, hon member Mr Paulsen, will you withdraw please.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: And apologise this time.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Apologise.

Mr M N PAULSEN: I withdraw.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: He must also apologise, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: I see the DA.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Members, some cooperation here please; there is a speaker on the floor.

Mr D JOSEPH: The national crisis in Eskom and the ability of Eskom to ensure that all South Africans use electricity on a daily basis is not over yet. Electricity contributes to the quality of life and economic growth. It was said by an engineer Andrew Kenny that by the year 2030 a massive 18000 megawatts will be a shortfall to deliver service. If our economy grows at 3%, which is 2% lower than the expected percentage in the NDP, our supply and demand of energy will not be met.

Eskom does not have a magic button. Eskom needs good governance. It needs good leadership. It needs people with a vision and it includes appointing qualified people who understand the long-term planning on economic and population growth.

Agb Speaker, elektrisiteit word al duurder [Tussenwerpsels.] en die publiek

en die munisipaliteite moet nou die prysverhogings bo inflasie absorbeer terwyl Eskom 'n swak diens lewer. Meer as 10,000 mense in die Wes-Kaap het alreeds 'n petisielys geteken teen Eskom se swak diens en die beurtkrag en die buitensporige bonusse wat die senior bestuur ontvang.

Government, the public and the industry need value for money from Eskom. We need more distributors of energy. We need safer alternatives than nuclear energy. We need affordable energy. We need competent board members, competent managers, competent political leaders to reverse the situation and the crisis in Eskom.

An HON MEMBER: We need DA.

An HON MEMBER: Yes we need DA. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I see the ANC. [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you Madam Speaker. Saturday is the United Nations Day for the eradication of racism. This matter is important for this House because for the past since 2009 we have seen the backward process that has taken place in relation to non-racialism and nation building in this province. Racism is not what the Premier preaches, but what she does, she does to make sure that certain people feels superior and certain people feels inferior and the DA problem is when you talk about racism there is no-one who wants to listen as if this issue we must not as members in this House

discuss and lay a foundation for our society. It becomes important that we do not become howlers in this case when we are dealing with matters of racism because in the past year we have seen an escalation of racial fights amongst our people of this province.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: In Gauteng now. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] The Western Cape.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Therefore it becomes important... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: There in Claremont where you live.

Mr S G TYATYAM: It becomes important that we must not wonder why people in our province are divided according to race. Why race is deepening under the DA-rule in our province, because ours [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What about the ANC?

Mr S G TYATYAM: We call people refugees. We call people many...

The SPEAKER: Order! Sorry hon member Mr Tyatyam. Hon Paulsen and whoever you are engaging with I cannot see, kindly refrain. There is a speaker on the floor. If it is Minister Winde and Minister Grant, please. [Interjections.] Members, we need your cooperation. There is a member

speaking. You may proceed hon member Mr Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: When the leadership of government speaks racism and support certain items such as refugees and many other words they use to belittle people we must not be surprised when we see the people going around urinating on other people, beating other people, assaulting other people, because only because they are black, it is because the leadership has not taken the matter of racism serious in this... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Tyatyam, kindly finish. Your time has expired.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Okay, thank you. We must be ashamed not to have allowed a process to discuss this matter in this house and it is important that [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired.

Mr S G TYATYAM: It is important that the DA that is lead by the Madam must deal with this matter henceforth. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Tyatyam, your time has expired. Thank you. I see the DA.

Mnr B D KIVEDO: Agb Speaker, ek dink ek wil nou vir eens en vir altyd die

hele groenkaart in die bed sit of in die kooi sit dat dit loop slaap en hopelik 'n stadige en genadiglike dood sterf. Ek roep die Nasionale Regering via die SAPS tot verantwoording vandag dat hulle so 'n afgryslike angswekkende stelsel kon instel soos die sogenaamde groenkaart, die dompasstelsel... [Tussenwerpsels.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja, but the people in [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mnr B D KIVEDO: ...'n stelsel wat die integriteit, die vryheid van beweging sowel as die gelykheid van burgers ontnem. Toe ons as regering kennis dra van hierdie sinistere aksie, het die Minister van Gemeenskapsveiligheid, Minister Dan Plato onmiddellik uit die blokke gespring en die Kommissaris kennis gegee, die Provinsiale Kommissaris kennis gegee om ondersoek in te stel en die proses stop te sit.

Generaal Phiyega, die Nasionale Kommissaris, is al te bewus van hierdie saak gewees. Sy het dit erken. Wat haar motiewe was kan ons maar raai, maar by 'n landelikeveiligheidsspitsberaad in Gauteng wat deur die ANC bestuur word was daar alreeds aanduidings van so 'n program. So die beskuldigings dat dit 'n DA geïnnoveerde saak is, is vals. Dis onwaar. Daar is net een waarheid en dit is die regte waarheid en die waarheid maak ons vry.

'n AGBARE LID: Die waarheid.

Mnr B D KIVEDO: Hoe kan 'n dorp soos Worcester wat die enigste dorp in die land is wat spog met 'n waarheids- en versoeningsproses wat die nasionale vraagstuk hanteer in terme van nasiebou 'n dompasstelsel aan die ander kant instel? Dis mos belaglik.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo, your time has expired.

Mnr B D KIVEDO: Dit is mos heeltemal belaglik. Die enigste kaart wat ons dra is die blou kaart van die DA van hoop en versoening.

The SPEAKER: Hon member your time has expired, hon member Mr Kivedo, your time has expired.

Mnr B D KIVEDO: Baie dankie. [Tyd verstreke.] [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: I see the ACDP.

'n AGBARE LID: Haai shame, nou eers.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Madam Speaker, alcohol abuse and speeding on our roads remain a serious problem in this province. The Western Cape was doing extremely well when it came to road accidents, but this past March again indicated a high, high killing on our roads. 58 people lost their lives in this province. Victims include drivers, motorcyclists and pedestrians, but

strangely enough fifteen people of these killings were pedestrians. More than half of the figure, 65% of the figure these drivers were intoxicated.

We as the ACDP welcome the job of the law enforcement by keeping blitzes and stopping motor vehicles day after day, but we believe that this is not enough. We believe that awareness campaigns will have to include pedestrians when it comes to the safety of our roads.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The ACDP believes that motorists and we know that is a hard topic at the moment, should not drink and drive. That is the answer to the solution because 65% of the motorists were intoxicated when they collided on the roads. So we believe that motorists should not drink and drive. The ACDP also believes that pedestrians should only cross the road in designated areas and that is awareness campaigns. We will have to tell that because the onus is also with pedestrians.

The ACDP still believes that the Western Cape Government must play the largest role when it comes to the safety of individuals. I thank you.
[Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: Pastors must go and reach out to the other people.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ANC. [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: You come, I will preach to you. Okay, if you come there I will preach to you. [Interjections.] I will show you.

The SPEAKER: Members, order please.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Doing what to me?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa, hon member Mr Christians.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I am risky, man.

An HON MEMBER: High risk, high risk.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I will show you.

The SPEAKER: Order please members, there is a speaker on the floor.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Don't you take that risk to me; never. [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa. [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Olivier I see you.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, and I hope my Chairperson of the portfolio Education will agree with me on this one that this ruling party here

[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: The ruling party?

Mr R T OLIVIER: This ruling party, you in this Western Cape, does not really care about our children.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Olivier, can you take your seat please. A point of order, Minister?

†UMPHATHISWA WEZOKUHLALISWA KOLUNTU: Somlomo, ingaba lilungelo lelungu ukuba lisinyole xa lithetha nathi [Kuyahlekwa.]

*The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Speaker, is it right that the hounorable member points a finger when he talks to us. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Olivier, the request is that you not point your finger across the way at the ruling party.

Mr R T OLIVIER: I will put my hands in front of me Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] You may proceed. It is going to be very difficult to work with your hands in front of you. I do not know how you are going to hold up the paper, but ja, proceed please. [Interjections.]

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, this is evident that in numerous schools problems that comes to the fore in newspapers, including the *Cape Times*, on social media and reported across the province, major threats to the just and equitable education of our children are plentiful learners still out of school. They already missed the first term of learning. Hundreds of children have still not been placed and the number that we have, the latest number we have got from the department was just over 300 that were not yet placed, 300 too much, that is looming the streets of our townships. Parents need to be guardians while they need to be at work, of children who are not at school and churches are not doing really too much to assist. Children are still found in tents and on community halls without needed learning material to support and therefore, Madam Speaker, I hope I am supported that really the Education Department in this province is not really serious about the future of these 300 kids, if it is 300.

The appalling conditions of facilities and inadequate infrastructure and during our visit of few schools this can be confirmed by the members of the committee, is still appalling. We saw the conditions of school, not conducive for learning for those learners at school.

The other problem is the safety of our children at schools and in this instance safety of our children from the principals of schools and teachers, it is a serious concern that needs really to be looked at. This government is quick to threaten protestors about new [Inaudible.] prohibiting dangerous weapons but cannot control the very same weapons brought to school and this is a serious

concern. Too many principals, teachers are still abusing our kids at school and little is being done to deal with this matter and the mitigating factors in this regard is always questionable.

An HON MEMBER: Do they belong to SATWU?

Mr R T OLIVIER: When will this government, this DA Government walk the talk on education?

An HON MEMBER: Hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, before I start, I just want to indicate that hon member Mr Fransman earlier talked about why the Premier was looking for reasons why she cancelled her *Cape Times* subscription. He was a member of the Cabinet Lekgotla that made the decision in 2013 to say that the circular 13 [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Mackenzie, can you be seated please. There is a point of order. Hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: I would like to address you on a point of order Madam Speaker. As far as I can see from the Order Paper we are busy with member statements.

The SPEAKER: Statements.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: And it is already into my statement, when I speak, ja.

Mr C M DUGMORE: The member is not making a statement and that is my point of order.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore it is in the member's statement time so he is using his own time. [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker let me continue, but just the point he was a member of the Cabinet that made that decision to cut austerity measures so now he is making a different point. He is very hypocritical but during each parliamentary proceeding it is becoming increasingly more difficult to refer to Opposition members of this House as "honourable", yet as champion of the Constitution and because of the integrity of the DA we abide by the Standing Rules of this House. Addressing members as honourable is generally accepted in this House, and stem from the fact that all members are deemed honourable and must act honourably at all times. This, Madam Speaker, has unfortunately not been the case of recent. We have become witness to the intentional neglect of honourable decorum from the ANC, not only in this House, but in committee meetings as well. As of recent the ANC members has gone out of the way to bring about disorder, distortions, half truths, uncouth demeanour and behaviour. We have the

Leader of the Opposition spewing untruth in an attempt to score political points, yet he and other ANC members as well fail to attend important committee meetings as they are constitutionally mandated to do so. Madam Speaker, the ANC's failure...

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mackenzie, take your seat. There is a point of order, hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: A point of order, he said the Leader of the Opposition is fuelling untruth and I would like you to ask him to withdraw that and apologise.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mackenzie will you repeat what you said please.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, perhaps we can consult Hansard afterwards. Can I continue, because I am going to lose my time. Madam Speaker, the ANC's failure to [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: No, no, hon member Mr Mackenzie, sorry, there was a point of order. I have asked. You will not lose time. I need you to repeat what it is you said because you were going so fast unfortunately. I was not keeping track.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: I am not going to lose my time, Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: No you will not lose your time.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: I will start again, with the Leader of the Opposition, speaking untruth in an attempt to score political points, yet he as well as other ANC members failed to attend important committee meetings as they are constitutionally mandated to, Madam Speaker [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mackenzie, sorry, if I have to stop you. That is considered unparliamentary. I need to ask you to withdraw please.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: I withdraw Madam Speaker. The ANC's failure [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: What about the ACDP.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...to attend important deliberations of the different departments' recent Budget Appropriation, is anything but honourable. The ANC is not honouring the vote of the public who elected them to their position. I take this opportunity to remind the honourable members of this House, in a sense back the ANC, to uphold, respect and embody the nature of being honourable. We owe it to the people of the Western Cape which put them in this position as they are duty-bound to do so because they also receive a salary to attend sessions. As you can see today, there are members of the House absent today as well. Many times the Leader of the Opposition

does not come to committee meetings. [Interjections.] They were not absent, they were here. Your members did leave the budget to [Inaudible.] today they are not here. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: So Madam Speaker, I beg you to please remind the honourable members to read the definition of honourable and that they behave like honourable members in this House and in committee meetings. I thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Order please members. [Interjections.] Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: He is just proving it is wrong. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: That then is the end of members' statements. Order please, members. We have just had a discussion on "honourable".

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Can we be honourable in our dealings in the House please? We now move to Notices of Motion. Are there any motions where notice is given? Hon member Mr Mackenzie I see you.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House note that during the debate on the State of the Province Address, the hon member Mr Fransman alleged the following:

- The Premier of the Western Cape led a walkabout of members during the State of the Nation Address on 12 February;
- Employment equity has regressed to the extent that 72% of senior management in the public sector in the Western Cape are white;
- That 1,000 children in Mitchells Plain are not in class and thousands are struggling to get access to schools;
- That hundreds of children in Kraaifontein were not in class;
- And school learners in Gugulethu did not receive their school books.

Therefore resolve that an *ad hoc* committee be appointed to investigate whether Mr Fransman deliberately misled the House in making the above statements, and the committee to have the power to take evidence and call for papers. I thank you.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Mr Fransman.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the institutionalised forms of racism under the Provincial Government of the Democratic Alliance in the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: There is an objection? Notice taken. Hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr P UYS: I missed that one, did you ask for objection?

The SPEAKER: No I asked if there was an objection over there, but it is hon member Mr Mnqasela getting up, sorry.

Mr P UYS: But this is not a section for objections.

The SPEAKER: It is a motion, I understand, hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Okay.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mnqasela was not very...

Mr M MNQASELA: Yes, I jumped immediately, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: I recognise you.

Mr M MNQASELA: What I wanted is clarity because the hon member is saying “the institutionalised racism under the DA Government” so I want clarity on that and I would like you to rule on that.

Mr P UYS: Ja, it is a motion. [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: I know.

Mr P UYS: You do not know.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mnqasela, it is a motion of notice which will have to be debated and I think then the merits of the case, the merits of the matter will be discussed. At this stage it is a notice. [Interjections.]
Order! Order please members. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: And member Pierre Uys is saying this.

Mr M MNQASELA: So you are saying this. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Officials as well. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: May we proceed? Members, we are busy with notices of motion. Hon member Mr Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That this House debates the disconcerting flaws in the school transport system of the province under the DA Government and the bakkie-system used especially by students in townships.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Mr Paulsen.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the EFF proposes that we end the ongoing separation of members and staff in this Legislature: we work together, we dine together as equals.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. [Interjections.] I see the hon member Ms Wenger. Order please, members.

Ms M M WENGER: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates mandatory debriefings for law enforcement agencies to assist with managing stressful and traumatic events.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Ms Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the Provincial Government's lack of results to reduce long queues and the bad attitudes of staff at health facilities across the province.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Mr Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the closure of Western Cape schools and the process that needs to be followed.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Notice taken.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Those processes have been followed. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: We are still busy with Notices of Motion. That is it? That

concludes Notices of Motion. We are now moving to Motions without Notice.
I see the hon member Mr Wiley.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Mnr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extend its deepest sympathy to the family and friends of Collins Chabane, Member of Parliament, who died tragically, together with his two protectors. Minister Chabane and I served in the Senate together from 1994 to 1997 and again worked together when he was an MEC in Limpopo in 2002. He was always approachable, personable and lucid in his arguments. South Africa has lost a rich talent.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No?

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: I see a lot of jumping. I thought it was hon member Mr Dugmore but then I see hon member Ms Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its deepest condolences to the family, friends and supporters of artist Zayn Adams who died after suffering a heart attack and recognises Adams was part of the Cape Minstrels since he was eleven years old and entertained many in a career that spanned the past fifty years.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Any there any objections to the motion? No.

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Lentit.

Mr R B LENTIT: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Kirstenbosch National Botanical Garden for receiving the 2015 Garden of the Year Award, presented by the International Garden Tourism Network, beating out competition from all around the world. The Botanical Garden recently saw a record of one million visitors in 2014. That is a 27% increase from 2013.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: There is no objection? Are there any objections to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House expresses our heartfelt condolences to the family and friends of Russel Riffel and Denzil Boonzaaier, the two rugby players from the Franschoek Rugby Club, and supporter Abraham Lybrand, who tragically passed on due to a bus crash on 7 March 2015.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: No objections? Any objections?

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: I see hon member Ms Wenger and then hon member Mr Paulsen. Table, I need your support in helping me identify who. Hon member Ms Wenger.

Me M M WENGER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its heartfelt condolences to former member of Parliament and Bitou Councillor Stuart Farrow as well as his family for the tragic and untimely loss of his daughter Kerry Anne earlier this month.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen and then hon member Mr Tyatyam.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House joins the call to remove the statues of colonisers from our public spaces.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: No objections. Are there any objections? Okay, there is an objection.

An HON MEMBER: [Laughter.] You like colonisers....

The SPEAKER: The motion will be printed, hon member Mr Paulsen. Sorry.
Hon member Mr Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House pass on its condolences to the family, friends and comrades of Yolanda Botha, Frans Nkoana and Nelson Diale, recently departed stalwarts of our struggle.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Objections? No objections?

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: The hon member Ms Makeleni and then hon member Ms Dijana after that.

Ms P MAKELENI: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with sadness the passing of André P Brink on 6 February 2015 at the age of 79 years – a renowned South African writer that played a key role in the Afrikaans Literary Movement *Die Sestigers* that used his talents to speak against the apartheid government who had his novel *Kennis van die Aand* banned by the apartheid government in 1973.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: No objection? Any objection?

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Ms Dijana.

Ms T M DIJANA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the time of the Western Cape's top cop Lieutenant General Arno Lamoer and senior officials was wasted to call them to account on the arrest of some DA members at Sona presented by President Jacob Zuma, while the bullying DA fully knew General Lamoer cannot account about such operational matters coordinated at a national level.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Objections? It will be printed on the Paper.

An HON MEMBER: Very, very, very much so.

The SPEAKER: The hon member Ms Dijana, after hon member Ms Dijana was hon member Mr Lentit, hon member Mr Kivedo, hon member Mr Lentit

and then hon member Mr Dugmore. I am sorry, I am taking my guidance from the table. Hon member Mr Max. Hon member Mr Max.

Mnr L H MAX: Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy medelye betuig teenoor die families van die vier oorledenes wat vanoggend op die N1 tussen Laingsburg en Beaufort Wes in 'n trompop botsing tussen 'n passasiersbus en 'n vragmotor gesterf het. Dat hierdie Huis ook 'n spoedige herstel toewens aan die ongeveer dertig beseerdes.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections.

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: The next person is hon member Mr Mnqasela and then hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Professor André van der Merwe, Head of the Division of Urology at Stellenbosch University, and the entire team of surgeons from the University's Faculty of Medicine and Health

Sciences, who performed the first successful penis transplant in the world. This procedure was performed on 11 December 2014 at Tygerberg Hospital in Cape Town, after a 21 year old young man lost his penis during a traditional initiation ceremony three years ago.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: No objections? Any objection?

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Dugmore. [Interjections.] Order please, members. There is a speaker on the floor.

Mr C M DUGMORE: There seems to be a lot of excitement in the House about this matter; lots of excitement about it, but on a very serious [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please, members, there is a speaker on the floor.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep sadness the sudden passing of Mr Melvyn Caroline, Director for the WCED District East and further notes and appreciates the massive contribution he has made to improving the

quality of education in the Western Cape, as teacher, school principal and District Director where, working with the team at the district and our schools, he oversaw the steady improvement in the quality of matric passes and built solid relationships of trust with the communities he served. I further move that this House formally conveys its condolences to Mr Caroline's wife and family as well as his colleagues at the WCED.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: No objections? Any objections?

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates Nosipho Poswa, the former Springbok rugby player from Khayelitsha who, despite failing Grade 12, was determined to help other children, and obtained a teaching degree from UWC.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: No objections, any objections?

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Ms Beerwinkel, after that hon member Ms Wenger. Hon member Ms Beerwinkel proceed. Hon Beerwinkel.

Me C F BEERWINKEL: Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die Mullersrus Primêre Skool by Buffelsjagsrivier geluk wens met 'n toekenning wat hul verwerf het met die derde plek in die provinsiale wedstryd vir middelslag voedseltuine.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

The SPEAKER: No objections? Any objections?

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: The hon member Ms Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House:

- (1) Notes National Library Week, which commenced on Saturday, 14 March and ends on 21 March 2015.

- (2) Acknowledges the role libraries play in realising the right to freedom of access to information and in building community development by opening the doors of learning; and
- (3) Commends the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport on their outstanding efforts to improve library services for the people of the Western Cape.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: No objections? Any objections?

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Mnqasela. Members, I am getting my cue from the Table and I am trying to ensure fairness so I will go as directed by the Table. Hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House commends the fire-fighters and volunteers for their tireless and selfless efforts in fighting aggressive and dangerous wildfires in our Cape Flora; and that this House conveys its sincerest gratitude and appreciation for their heroic and outstanding performance during this period.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections, any objections?

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extend its deepest sympathy to the family and friends of Hendrik Bees Marais, who died tragically while water bombing fires at Cape point. Former Colonel Marais epitomised a professional and exemplary aviator having flown for the air force, the South Africa Police and later for years as an air ambulance and rescue pilot before becoming a pilot contracted to the Working on Fire Programme.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: No objections, any objections?

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Professor Tyrone Pretorius who succeeded Professor Brian O'Connell as rector of the University of the Western Cape at the beginning of this academic year.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: No objections? Any objections?

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Ms Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates the Tech Hub, Bandwidth Barn on its successful launch in Khayelitsha yesterday. This IT incubator is aimed at assisting young entrepreneurs with tech and business support in and around Khayelitsha.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: No objections? Any objections?

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Ms Beerwinkel. Did I get it right this time, Beerwinkel?

Me C F BEERWINKEL: Yes. You can say tavern, whatever. Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die Micky Mouse Kleuterskool in Swellendam, wat as die Wes-Kaap se beste sentrum vir vroeë-kinderontwikkeling aangewys is, gelukwens.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

The SPEAKER: No objections? Any objections?

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the determination of Eric van der Byl from Hanover Park who walked 34 kilometres every day because he could not afford to pay for transport, in order to obtain his teaching degree.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: No objections? Any objections?

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Paulsen.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the Western Cape Education Department makes History a compulsory subject up until matric, so that our youth can learn about our history and will guard against repeating the injustices inflicted upon the people of this country.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: No objections? There is an objection. It will be placed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Ms Makeleni. First hon member Ms Makeleni, yes. [Interjections.] Order please, members. There is a speaker on the floor.

Ms P MAKELENI: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the unconstitutional, illegal and illiberal so-called

security green card of Worcester likened to the apartheid dompas-system to keep blacks out of white areas and calls on Community Safety MEC Dan Plato to explain why he seemingly defends this system.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Objections. It will be placed on the Order Paper. An objection has been noted members. It will be placed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Ms Beerwinkel and then the hon member Mr Mackenzie.
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No-no, no, no man.

An HON MEMBER: You are not defending.

An HON MEMBER: Oh come on man.

An HON MEMBER: You are not defending.

The SPEAKER: Order. Order please, members. Sorry hon member Ms Beerwinkel, is it a point of order?

Mr M G E WILEY: We are objecting to the fact that it is being moved without notice, because it should be a substantive motion.

The SPEAKER: A substantive motion.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Ja, that is right. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, there are technical aspects to our business. I think it is important that we familiarise ourselves with the rules before we come into the House so that we can cooperate and get through the proceedings. Hon member Ms Beerwinkel, you may speak.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Madam Speaker, the next time you will call me a jack-in-the-box the way I am up and down here.

The SPEAKER: And if I might just comment on that, I sat in the House of Commons and it is quite amazing how they just do this up and down. So it is a little bit like that today.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you. I am in London now.

The SPEAKER: We are in London. [Laughter.] [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Okay, I am going to sit again.

The SPEAKER: You may proceed hon member Ms Beerwinkel.

Me C F BEERWINKEL: Up and down! Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder

kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis twee uitblinker baristas van Swellendam gelukwens met hul prestasies, naamlik Rihano de Wee, wat die beste in die Wes-Kaap is wat by 'n onlangse byeenkoms aangewys is, en ook Hilian Soldaat, wat die derde plek verwerf het.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

The SPEAKER: No objections? Any objections?

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its heartfelt condolences to the family of Teagen Martin, a Grade 1 learner at Victoria Primary School in Worcester, who was tragically killed in a vehicle accident last week.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: No objections? Any objections?

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates all the award recipients of the 2015 Western Cape Cultural Awards held on 9 February 2015 at the Baxter Theatre as the crème de la crème of the provincial arts and culture fraternity and that they were honoured on that evening.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: No objections? Any objections?

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Fransman. [Interjections.] Order! Please.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the Palestinian activist Leila Khaled visited South Africa in February; that she was widely welcomed to South Africa by various eminent groups and people... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Oh you have got to be joking.

Mr M L FRANSMAN: ...that supports freedom and calls on the provincial leadership of the Government here in the Western Cape, to join the cause against the injustices that the Israeli Government mete out against innocent people.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Objection. There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the... [Interjection.] Order please, there is one speaker in this House hon member Mr Mackenzie. Hon member Ms Wenger, you may proceed.

Ms M M WENGER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House notes that 13 March 2015 commemorated International Sign Language Day, which celebrates the achievements of the Deaf community.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: There is no objection? Any objections?

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: I see the honourable... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Are you objecting to your own member?

An HON MEMBER: No man [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, I do not get your name. Sorry. First I have called that member first before hon member Ms Schäfer. Hon member Ms Lekker, you may proceed.

†UNksz P Z LEKKER: Ndiyabulela Somlomo ...

*Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Madam Speaker ...

The SPEAKER: Just hold on. Sorry excuse me, can I just get order? There is too much noise, members. I cannot hear the member speaking. Hon member Mr Paulsen.

Mr M N PAULSEN: I did not do anything [Inaudible.] You listen to her. How can you trust the ANC?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen. Hon member Ms Lekker you may proceed.

Ms P Z LEKKER: †Enkosi Somlomo. *Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House deplores the attack on protesting learners of Phillipi High School who demand a functional school that was promised to be built for them by the Department, and left scores of children with injuries.

[Motion as moved by member.]

An HON MEMBER: Public Works.

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections?

An HON MEMBER: Public Works! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. It will be printed. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Public Works was objecting. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Oh please. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Ms Schäfer. Order please, members.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Groot Constantia Wine Farm for winning the Award Best Chardonnay in the world in the 22nd Annual Chardonnay du Monde competition.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections?

Mr M N PAULSEN: I object. We have got an alcohol problem in this province, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: It will be placed on the Order Paper.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Oh please!

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its deepest sympathy to the loved ones of Cecil Herandien, a former MEC of the Western Cape, who passed away last week.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections?

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Olivier. Order please, members.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with grave concern the first term of the new school year is coming to an end with hundreds of children still idling in the streets of the Cape Flats and other townships because of failure to be successfully placed.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There is an objection. It will be placed on the Paper. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: But it is true [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: That is true.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Objecting, but there are 300 not at school. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mnqasela, I see you. Order please members.

Mr M MNQASELA: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the EFF's only member desist from making noise in this House.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: That is not a point of order hon member Mr Mnqasela.

[Interjections.] Hon member Mr Mackenzie, I see you.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates all the recipients of the 2015 Provincial Sport Awards held on 13 March 2015 to honour the Western Cape's finest athletes, coaches and administrators. We wish them the best of luck and continued success at the National Sports Awards in November.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections?

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: Are there any other motions without notice? Hon member Mr

Mackenzie I see you and then hon member Mr Tyatyam. First hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Carla Johnson from Steenberg High School, who achieved second place in long jump at the African Junior Athletics Championships in Addis Ababa in Ethiopia earlier this month.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections.

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Tyatyam I see you.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the campaign currently underway at the University of Cape Town to rid the campus of the honorary statue of the colonial butcher Cecil John Rhodes and commends the stance of the students that are involved in the transformation of that.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper.
[Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Madam Speaker we object to that being moved without notice. It should be moved as a substantive motion. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, if you are going to make anything that borders on an accusation or there is any kind of... [Interjection.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: It is a fact not an accusation.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, we have a mechanism called a substantive motion. So we would need to engage a substantive motion to bring a matter like that to the floor, but there has been an objection, hon member Ms Schäfer objected. It will be placed on the paper. [Interjections.]
Hon member Mr Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Madam Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Mr Dennis Karelse, the principal of the Albertina High School for receiving the third prize for leadership at the national awards for Education Department.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The SPEAKER: Any objection? No objections.

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Ms Beerwinkel.

Me C F BEERWINKEL: Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis twee leerlinge van die Bontebok Primêre Skool in Swellendam wat by die Boland-atletiekbyeenkoms brons medaljes verwerf het, naamlik Danica Conradie en Austin Windvogel, gelukwens met hulle deelname aan die Boland-atletiekbyeenkoms, en brons medaljes verwerf het.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self?

Goedgekeur.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates JP Duminy for claiming South Africa's first ever [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Duminy, not Dominee.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...the first ever Cricket World Cup hat-trick against Sri Lanka during the 2015 Cricket World Cup.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to. Any further?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is that the last one? Hon member Mr Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its heartfelt sympathy to the family and loved ones of Nazeem Davies, the young fire-fighter who overturned his vehicle in the Dassieklip Pass after fighting a fire in Tulbagh, and also his friend Mr Niklaas Nel, who was injured.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo, you must have a written signed motion ready to the service officer as soon as possible.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any further? We then proceed with the Order Paper and the Secretary will read the first Order of the Day.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

1. Consideration of principle of the *Western Cape Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill* (2014/15 Financial Year) [B 1 – 2015] (Minister of Finance). (See Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, No 15, dated 9 March 2015, p 55).

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the Minister of Finance.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Mr Deputy

Speaker, I have tabled the Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill in the House to the value of R26 million and I am now looking forward to the debate on the Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, the hon member Mr Joseph.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The Western Cape Government led by the Democratic Alliance do not... do support the principle of... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Do not support, ja.

Mr D JOSEPH: ...of universal coverage on health. However we do not support the NHI Policy as presented by the ANC. [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You do not support [Inaudible.] You are such a hypocrite [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: The Additional Appropriation given to the Western Cape ... [Interjections.] ... happens with a reason. [Interjections.] Notwithstanding our different views on how a health policy must be in support of the poor, the Western Cape Government offered to participate in the National Health Insurance and Mr Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape is doing well in this project particularly with reference to the general practitioners assisting in Government Hospitals.

[Interjections.]

In the Eden District where this pilot project is underway the community experienced the benefits of the doctors who volunteer and who are committed to the National Health Insurance project unlike in other provinces where this project is failing. [Interjections.]

The National Health Insurance project is failing in other provinces where the ANC governs but where the DA governs we will, besides the fact that we have voted against this policy, we are doing our best to implement it to the best of our ability... [Interjection.] ...and hence the reason we received the support from National Treasury.

An HON MEMBER: And [Inaudible.] is going to continue.

Mr D JOSEPH: The reason for us receiving the R6 million, just over that, ± over R6 million from National Treasury, is the fact that we bought into this pilot project and we were able to motivate and convince the doctors to participate in this project. Billions of rand is needed. Billions of rand is needed to fund this project in a declining economy and where corruption is rife under a national leadership.

With regard to the money received for the housing the department will spend this housing on the military veterans, a project in Bardale near Kuilsriver and a project that will create opportunity for youth skills development and this

R20 million grant is given to this province because the ANC Province in Limpopo could not spend this money.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief! We do not have to agree because that is your [Inaudible.]

Mr D JOSEPH: That is the reason why this money was transferred to the province. [Interjection.] So the three projects namely the National Youth Brigade Programme, the Mashengani Programme and the EHP Projects that is allocated to this province to spend the money and the Human Settlement Department will use this R20 million in the current or in a new PHP Project and will demonstrate that we will deliver service to vulnerable people in particular the elderly, in particular those who are connected to the military veterans.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the Additional Appropriations or the adjustments for 2014/15 given by National Treasury to this province is in an indication of good governance and good leadership. I thank you. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, I see the hon member Ms Beerwinkel. [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC wants to express its gratitude to the National Minister for her intervention with this additional allocation.

An HON MEMBER: Intervention? [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: What is more, what is... [Interjections.] Listen! What is more commendable is that the youth will be empowered to learn skills of business. Therefore big business and construction companies should not lick their lips to get a cut of this allocation as youth will be trained in the starting up of co-ops and the skills of building a House and as such the different SETAs will be involved in all of the training that is needed. Once these houses have been completed it is envisaged that the database will be studied to find at least 50% of beneficiaries to be allocated to military veterans also to the aged so that they can at least be afforded or allocated a home.

It is actually a sad day that a National Minister needs to intervene so that youth can be specifically targeted and veterans and the elderly, those people who today are in the sunset in their sunset years can be afforded a decent home after having spent the better part of their lives and years fighting for your freedom and mine.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Luister! Daar kom die ding! [Tussenwerpsels.]

'n AGBARE LID: Bo-op die kat se kop!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Health services is a basic need and also an essential

service and therefore the ANC also thanks the National Minister for an extra allocation from the NHI to assist in the health service by facilitating... [Interjections.] ... in extra GPs to be contracted at a district level [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You do not need aid at any time, because you do not live with the poor. That is your problem.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: A service that will allow at least eighty more GPs in primary healthcare that are envisaged in this pilot to render a better health service to the communities of the Eden District. What is of concern though, is that this DA-run province as you have just heard now, has expressed all sorts of concerns and problems with the roll-out of the NHI. It does not really support it but will now gladly accept this extra funding to sign contracts with private practitioners to render this service in this pilot project. [Interjections.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Daar is hy!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: What will also need to be monitored is how this allocation will be committed and possibly rolled over because there is no way that these funds will be spent in this financial year. Again this is something that the NCOP visit to the Eden district, which is shortly forthcoming, will

closely monitor. Again we thank the National Minister of Health for acknowledging the need for increased health services in the Western Cape especially at the entry point to this province and in spite of technical glitches still managed to make the allocation to this province... [Interjections.]

Mr D JOSEPH: And acknowledged, and acknowledged that it was not done.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ...in spite of their complaints against the NHI.

Mr D JOSEPH: And the acknowledgement [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon member Mr Paulsen.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I think it is quite appropriate that additional funds are allocated to both human settlements and health. The poor living conditions of our people is a major contributor to the state of the health but we do know that given the severity of our people's live reality this will not bring an end to their suffering. Of major concern is that the government has not yet taken care of the needs of our military veterans and they will only now derive benefit from an additional allocation.

The good part of the story is the skills development that our youth will gain because of this allocation. The additional allocation is problematic in that it will have very little effect on the huge housing crisis. It also raises the question what would have happened to the military veterans and the aged if it

was not for the allocation or skills development among the youth for that matter. While these are only afterthoughts we cannot support this.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Christians.

Mr F CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ACDP supports the Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill 2014/15. Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker, we must say thank you to the National Government but the hon member Ms Beerwinkel was not man enough to say that the government of the Western Cape... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Man enough?

Mr F CHRISTIANS: Or woman enough that the government of the Western Cape was doing a sterling job! [Interjections.] You see, this is what the ANC does. They will criticise the DA Government. Now they say thank you. She mentioned it three times, thank you to the National Minister, but they gave the money to the Western Cape because it is a well run government!

Mr D JOSEPH: Yes. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Is that not so? [Applause.] You see Mr Deputy Speaker, you cannot also, now the EFF comes: "We reject. We reject." Do

you reject the money now to improve people's lives? [Interjections.]

Do you now reject skills development? So tell the poor people, "We do not want the money because we do not want you educated; we want you illiterate." That is what you are telling the people. [Interjections.] So we welcome the R20 million for human settlements. We welcome the R6 million for health. We think it is well deserved but also because the government of the Western Cape is doing a sterling job. Thank you National Government for giving the money. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Order! The hon Minister. Minister Meyer. [Interjections.] Order, order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Firstly I would like to thank the members for participating in this debate. As indicated earlier during the tabling of the adjustment of the funding that follows a decision by the National Treasury to take back about R660 million in housing funds from the Limpopo Province. This resulted in an amount of R26 million being allocated to the Western Cape.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the allocation not only confirms the growing confidence in the Western Cape Government's ability to administer public funds efficiently, effectively and economically, but also that the concept of a

capable state as envisaged in the National Development Plan is firmly being entrenched.

Being a capable state implies amongst others that the Western Cape Government can be trusted to work responsibly with taxpayer's money. Mr Deputy Speaker, what is shocking in this case is that the Limpopo Government from whom this money has been taken an amount of R660 million has increased its staff from 1 October 2014 to the end of December 2014 the staff complement grew with 2449 additional staff members. They have already 120 000 staff members in Limpopo and in spite additional 2449 they have been unable to deliver the goods and hence the money has been taken away from that particular province.

'n AGBARE LID: Hoor, hoor!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: But I think interesting stuff is happening here in the Western Cape, because what is also happening is that we are championing the prioritisation of elderly people. There was an outrage from the ANC when we prioritised the elderly. This is additional to the work that we already are doing and starting in this particular province.

Mr Deputy Speaker, we received this money because we are a capable state and National Treasury is acknowledging this. Also the National Minister of Health through this allocation of more than R6 million is expressing confidence in the provincial Minister of health and likewise the National

Minister of Human Settlements is also through the R20 million in this Additional Adjustments Appropriation Bill expressing confidence in the work done by my colleague the Provincial Minister of Human Settlements and I am very happy that members of this House agrees on one thing and that is we are creating further opportunities for the youth through these Youth Brigades, through the human development settlement grants creating further opportunities not only for employment in the human settlement space but also in the space of skills development and I am quite certain Minister Madikizela will do an outstanding job in this particular regard.

I think there is consensus and I want to thank hon member Mr Christians for his support because he articulated exactly why this money came to the Western Cape and I really want to thank him and I would like to invite you for a cup of tea after this debate. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! That concludes the debate on the consideration of the Principle of the Bill. Are there any objections to the Principle of the Bill being agreed to?

HON MEMBERS: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections? Agreed to. The Secretary will read the Bill.

Consideration of principle of the *Western Cape Appropriation Bill*

(Bill 2 - 2015)

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House will deal with the two separate votes from now onwards. The secretary will read the second Order of the Day.

2. Consideration of principle of Western Cape Appropriation Bill [B2 - 2015] (Minister of Finance). (See Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, No 20, dated 19 March 2015, p 64).

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I have tabled the Western Cape Appropriation Bill for 2015/16 financial year in this House on 5 March 2015 for debate in this House. I am now looking forward to the debate on the Western Cape Appropriation Bill 2015/16. I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Ms Beerwinkel. [Interjections.]

'n AGBARE LID: Hoor, hoor! [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Laat ons nou hoor.

'n AGBARE LID: Ons doen. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Deputy Speaker, everything about a government's commitment to addressing the needs of the citizens will be reflected and entrenched in the way that they allocate and implement their budget to better people's lives. This will mean nothing if the citizens do not live that change.

My colleagues and I will show that this R52 billion does not address the needs of the underprivileged and continuously marginalised people of this province with its stark inequality, that this notion of "whole of society and partnership principle" has nothing to do with the far flung rural areas but everything to do with further enrichment of those in the metros.

Of the R52 billion R38 billion is the national per capita allocation. Added to that the tiny amount of own revenue over which the DA has discretion to distribute. This DA province spends an inordinate amount, approximately R28 billion or 53% in compensation of its employees, about 84 000 of them, of which 8000 are contract workers. The question is for how long already and for how much longer still and we are not including the negotiated conditions of employment rates for doctors and nurses and teachers and essential workers. It is these bloated departments that I am referring to like the Premier's office with a staff complement of almost 1200 mostly office-bound employees. This has nothing to do with the amount of posts needed in that department but everything to do with the control and mistrust of the Premier to allow other departments to do their own work.

A department like Economic Development has 229 employees, R580 million

with an R84 million allocation to Wesgro - the supposed driver of opportunities for economic upliftment. But let us stop there for a minute. Tim Harris, appointed on the pretext of advisor to Mayor De Lille, sat at the Wesgro offices almost on the lap of the CEO Nils Flaatten.

Then when Nils Flaatten left Tim Harris moved smoothly into the post he had been earmarked for anyway, but wait, who then took his place?

Carl Greyling, all white males - another stark example of cadre deployment by this pontificating DA. But let us move to agriculture. Of the almost 1,000 employees only 41 are involved in rural development with one community development worker per region. This I discovered during the illegal farm worker eviction in my constituency. The poor employee had to travel all the way from Bredasdorp where the office is.

Mr Deputy Speaker, this has nothing to do with developing the rural community, but everything to do with allowing rich farmers to get away with some of the worst oppression of farm workers. Casidra on the other hand with its identity crisis is the convenient conduit for distributing funds meant for rural development. This DA preaches about economic growth and development in rural areas, but their budget-spend clearly does not reflect this.

Local Government: a shocking 0.39% allocation; Environment Planning and Development: 1% of the total budget.

All of these MECs as they sit here with their theoretic plans and their APPs and their budgets will come to nought if the two aforementioned departments do not function, because the optimal use of land in a municipal area is where implementation should happen. All of the above, Mr Deputy Speaker, has nothing to do with the DA's own whole of society policy, but everything to do with the entrenchment of privilege to the haves and very little to the have-nots.

Now let us take the latest tantrum of the Premier about stopping subscription to the *Cape Times* under the guise of cost cutting; a miniscule amount out of the advertising budget anyway. This has nothing to do with fruitless and wasteful expenditure, but everything to do with the *Cape Times* being the bulldog that will not let go of revelations that could embarrass the DA like the Filcon-story. [Interjections.]

It has everything to do with the curtailing of freedom of speech and controlling information and not allowing others to form their own opinions. [Interjections.] But then, why then has the consultant budget increased by 66% from R30 million to R50 million for the year if cost cutting is the objective?

An HON MEMBER: It is for DA cadres. [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Fruitless and wasteful expenditure is possibly the

trip to London by the Premier to get a briefing by Ryan Coetzee. [Laughter.] Time will tell. Fruitless and wasteful expenditure, is the extra funds needed that will be spent after the illegal market for the elite that was held on the lawns of Leeuwenhof.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: She wants to rezone.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: This province has a large proportion of struggling SMMEs trying to eke out a living but are regularly forcibly removed; their goods confiscated, but instead this DA throws the red tape book at them. Again, everything to do with looking after white farmers and their elite clientele and nothing to do with assisting those who need it most.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the Premier boldly talks about game-changing principals, but these are the games that the Premier and that department and these MECs play with the poor people whose lives just do not change in this province, but then again, this Premier is known for playing games to change people's lives.

An HON MEMBER: Where is she?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: How can we forget about MEC Botha Cabinet's shove last year and Lindiwe Mazibuko's the previous year? These moves had nothing to do with MEC Botha's personal health or hon Minister Mbombo's competency to deal with the health portfolio.

Mr M G E WILEY: Are you a physician now?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Why was the hon MEC Mbombo not acknowledged from the get go for her ability to run the Health Department? It had nothing to do with Lindiwe Mazibuko's ambitions for further studies. It had everything to do with how the Premier deals with political opponents and anyone that dares to disagree with her.

Mr Deputy Speaker, unemployment particularly amongst young people, the lack of opportunity and development in rural and non-metro areas glaringly show how the marginalised people of this DA-run province will struggle daily. Our forthcoming visit with the NCOP in April will prove this. This DA Budget proves to the people that the DA games have not stopped and it proves to them that their lives again will not change for the better. To them and for them this DA Budget says everything. It actually says that nothing will change. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I did not know we had a doctor in the House here but I am glad to know that hon member Ms Beerwinkel is a medical physician.

Madam Speaker, there is no doubt that the Western Cape Government is a government at work. A comparison with any other province will prove this.

There are numerous Auditor General and MPAT reports stating that where the DA governs we govern well.

The deputy, former Deputy Minister is leaving as well, sitting in the parliament doing nothing, earning money.

Madam Speaker, those who have elected us as a public representative should have been the first priority and not simply be used as pawns to score political points in order to support personal gain and fulfilment as the ANC has become accustomed to. I only have to mention the Cape Minstrels of which the patron who sadly got out, were part of destroying. Even the Cape Malay Choir currently is in distress through political manoeuvres. The absentee patron has now left us.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Asseblief!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: As a result of the ANC's nonchalance to the plight of those people the people of the Western Cape has openly rejected their governance by electing the DA with an outright majority at the recent national elections and the local upcoming elections will prove no different.

The ANC failures such as incorporating the specialised units to deal with gang violence in our communities and the mismanagement of our heritage sites in the Western Cape such as Robben Island and the Cango Caves are part of why the people have rejected them. These sites should be telling our

stories of the past, create job opportunities and increase economic growth in the Western Cape. Instead, due to the ANC's mismanagement nationally and the political manoeuvring of these sites, the people of the Western Cape are bearing the brunt of these closed opportunities.

The recent deliberations of the budget appropriation it is clear that the Western Cape Government through their objective is to build social cohesion and social inclusion by allocating additional funds through cultural affairs and sports. In fact the Western Cape Government has redressed delinquent behaviour through the incorporation and improvements of the MOD Centres across the province and will consistently do so for the upcoming financial year. In fact Mr Deputy Speaker, as recently as last week over 70 students from the MOD Centres partook in the Cape Town Carnival in the Western Cape that took place in Cape Town. In fact the Western Cape Government has adopted an innovative approach through youth development and I can only name the Western Cape advancement of youth project as one example.

We recognise, inspire and honour Provincial Sports and Cultural Affairs stars. We also nurture, train and give them these opportunities with our recent awards as mentioned through my recent motion without notice. In fact recently, on 27 April – sorry February - the Department handed over cycling equipment to twelve schools across the province, and most of those people will partake in the Cape Argus next year. I can only imagine that the prosperity and hope that we create in the Western Cape, as soon as we take over the other provinces, and nationally in 2019, that we will soon, and very

soon, take over those provinces and imbue prosperity and hope into those people as well. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. The hon Mr Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, when any person, young or old, whichever colour, looks at Appropriation, they want to know is there hope for me? That is what they want to know. They want to know is there hope in that budget, that is what they want to know. Now you cannot come and play race politics all the time. You cannot do that. You cannot do that all the time. You see, when you have a cake you can only cut so much of the cake. [Laughter.] You cannot do otherwise. Now the people of the Western Cape are looking for hope. Hope is there in this budget...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Hon member Ms Makeleni, this not a dialogue, allow the hon member to make his speech, please.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Is this hope talk, is the budget talking about creating jobs? Yes, it does. Does it talk about breaking poverty? Yes, it does. Does it talk about education? Improving it? Yes, it does. And if you look at the Western Cape, the education gap is big, but this budget addresses much of that. If you look at ... hon member Dugmore, don't interrupt, you know you are far off, far off. Mr Deputy Speaker, he is talking about R24 million for safety of schools, he does not even know how it works when that is not the prime responsibility of education - it's law enforcement that is being taken

off track here. R51 million is allocated for skills development in the 2015-2016 year. [Interjection.] And then over R55 million for the 2016-2017 year and over again R25 million for 2017-2018 year. For what? For youth development. How do we get our youth off the street? I don't think you walk the roads and the townships where youngsters sit from morning to night on street corners. How do you get them off? They are unemployable. So you get them skilled so that they can be employed. Maybe you must go and see for yourselves what is happening in the townships. You maybe must do that. [Interjections.] The ACDP is also very excited about e-learning. Education after school programmes. You know, I speak to churches, I speak to leaders and they tell me the biggest problem they have is children do not have parents at home, because they must work. So now the Government comes with an aftercare programme and you are against that as well. [Interjection.] Now what are you for if you are against this budget? I need to ask you a question. In education, we know that there is going to be smart classrooms. You know that, hey? They are going to upgrade classrooms; you know that, you read about that. [Interjections]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Hon member Mr Christians, just address the Chair as well.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Okay, okay. [Interjections]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order!

MR F C CHRISTIANS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ACDP is satisfied that this budget addresses skills development. It is important. It addresses education.

An HON MEMBER: How much?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: We sit on education, and you know in these committees the ANC sits and we accommodate them in these committees and then they come to this House and they tell us that they do not agree with the budget. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Your time has expired, hon member.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: So quick?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired. [Interjections.] Order, order! Hon Minister Grant.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Deputy Speaker and hon members of this House, in his Budget speech to this House on 5 March this year the Minister of Finance, Dr Meyer, indicated that the 2015 Budget and I quote: “focuses on balancing public finances while managing risk and maintaining fiscal stability in a weak economic environment whilst giving effect to the 2014/19 Provincial Strategic Plan”. The management of risk has become a crucial feature of what any responsible government or corporate structure does as a matter of course. Minister Meyer’s focus is

obviously on the management of fiscal risk in a tight and sometimes volatile economic environment. But that is how it should be. And that is how the Western Cape Government as responsible government does its business.

But Mr Deputy Speaker, there are other dimensions to the management of risk which also have to be addressed and I want to spend a few minutes this evening highlighting a few of these and illustrating what can be done in practical and sometimes quite small ways. In 2014 the World Bank entitled its annual World Development Report: Risk and Opportunity, Managing Risk for Development. This report points out that as the world changes, many new opportunities arise. This is particularly true for people in developing countries. Unfortunately, along with these opportunities, old and new risks appear. From job loss, increased crime and disease to financial turbulence, social unrest and environmental damage. These risks, if not managed and perhaps even eliminated, have the potential to roll back advances and improvement made to people's lives and their opportunities. Not surprisingly, the report emphasises that it is almost always the poor and vulnerable who are hardest hit when that happens. The report also highlights the critical role which governments have to play in managing systemic risks by firstly putting into place an enabling environment for shared action and responsibility. Secondly, for managing the flow of direct support to people at risk and providing at least part of that direct support. There are classically three critical steps to be taken by government or authorities in preparing to minimise these risks. These are the acquisition of the information about potential risks and their outcomes so that uncertainty is reduced. Secondly,

the creation of more effective protection, for example the better allocation of resources to reduce risk. And thirdly, the provisions of systems and resources to deal with shocks when they occur.

For this to happen, effectively requires that all levels and spheres of government fulfil their obligations to citizens and to communities. A failure of part of the protection system makes the entire system vulnerable and too often drags people back into the poverty from which they are trying to escape. In this, there is much talk of breaking the cycle of poverty. It is widely accepted that for this to happen in a sustainable manner, requires a number of things to be working in tandem. Including effective health care, good schooling and infrastructure to support their delivery and to allow people to move about. In addition there must also be commercial opportunities; the free flow of accurate information; a conducive employment environment and a positive human rights culture. These are givens in successful nations with governments working constructively in partnerships with other sectors in the best interest of their citizens.

However, Mr Deputy Speaker, there is another ingredient in this mix without which all the important considerations above are less likely to result in successful outcomes. This ingredient is confidence, or as some would have, trust. It is what is missing when there is for instance loose talk about the removal of land security, particularly in the face of inability to implement policies already in place. Secondly the reality of poor planning and management of energy security on the part of the National Government.

Thirdly evidence of large scale fraud, mismanagement of public money and the abuse of political office for personal gain. [Interjection.] The next issue; the low levels of personal safety. And finally a criminal justice system which fails people it is meant to protect.

My Department is, by nature of its mandate, involved to a greater or lesser extent in supporting all five of the strategic goals of the Western Cape Government. It has therefore to do whatever it can to reduce any risks to these goals, even those which result from sources outside of the Western Cape Government. Allow me briefly to mention two of these. Every day in this province, hundreds of thousands of our citizens are dependent upon the services of Metrorail to get to their places of work, education and social interaction. Leaving aside for the moment questions of reliability, passengers have to feel that if they use the trains that they are safe. Unfortunately there are too many incidents of robbery, intimidation and physical attack on these trains. Metrorail has limited capacity to deal with these, while also trying to protect the rail infrastructure. I am pleased to say in conjunction with my Cabinet colleague at Community Safety, I have initiated a pilot scheme with Metrorail whereby we, as Provincial Government, will supply additional security capacity and technical support to enhance existing protection for passengers. We cannot stand by while our citizens are at risk at the hands of lawless elements. Once this pilot has had time to prove its effectiveness, we will take the necessary steps to implement it as widely as possible through the Metrorail system. I would like to place on record my appreciation to Mr Richard Walker of Metrorail and his staff for their co-operation.

One of the game changers in Provincial Strategic Goal 3, is the reduction and the impact of alcohol abuse on the population of the Western Cape.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Ban alcohol!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Doing something effective about those who drink and drive, is part of this. Up to now our attempts to bring people to book for this offence, have been hampered by the ongoing incapacity of State forensic laboratories to process the blood samples needed to obtain a conviction. The backlog is staggering. Over 58,000 nationally, despite the commendable improvement in the laboratory in this province, which services also the Northern and Eastern Cape Provinces. We cannot allow this situation to continue. We are, therefore, on the basis of legal advice, exploring the possibility of setting up and using mobile laboratories, after ensuring that the results they produce will meet the requirements of evidence acceptable to the courts. It comes as no surprise that we are meeting with some resistance from a number of national agencies. However, we will not be dissuaded from our intention to be able to hold people who drink and drive to account.

In closing, Mr Deputy Speaker, I would like to add my voice to that of the many South Africans who have expressed the sense of loss at the unexpected death of minister Collins Chabane. A hard-working and competent member of the National Cabinet and one not afraid to acknowledge the good quality

wherever he encountered it. On 25 February this year, he wrote the following letter to me: “Acknowledgement letter on the extraordinary performance of your Department in the area of information technology security.”

Our Department was one of six provincial departments to attain this accomplishment countrywide. And he wrote to say that he would like to take the opportunity to congratulate us on this outstanding achievement. It can only be as a result of dedicated and a committed team to excel even in the areas where most departments, 94.62% of them, are failing. Outcome 12.46 of the Medium Term Expenditure Framework 2015/2019 strives for efficient and effective management and operation systems. The deployment of IT within the public service is recognised as a strategic tool to improve service delivery and achieve the set outcome. In closing, in his letter to me, he says: “IT security is one of the foremost enablers of the adoption of e-government. Given the performance of the Department in this area, it would be much appreciated if your permission is granted to share IT security experience and documents with the Department of Public Service Administration to service good practice. Yours sincerely, Colin Chabane, MP.” May he rest in peace.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear! [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Olivier, you may continue.

†UMnu R T OLIVIER: Sekela Somlomo. Singazifaka mfana kaMnqasela ezi zinto zethu.

*Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker we can put our earphones on honourable member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr Deputy Speaker, MEC, I must note from the onset that part of the contribution to this budget comes from the National Government. Am I correct, MEC? [Interjections.] Yes, so we must also ask that the MEC acknowledges and thanks the Government of the ANC. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Please continue.

†UMnu R T OLIVIER: Sekela Somlomo, ndiyibeka le nto kuba kuzo zonke iintetho kolu hlahlo-mali aluchaphazeli ukuba babulele nakomnye urhulumente bafuna thina sibabulele ngomsebenzi abathi ungcono abawenzayo. Kubo ngabo bodwa abakwazi ukwenza izinto ezingcono kweli lizwe ngaphandle komnye urhulumente okanye oorhulumnte abaphetheyo ngokwesininzi nangentando yabantu beli lizwe. Masibulele, ayisithi sodwa abarhuqa le nqanawa siyirhuqa Sisonke ukusuka kurhulumente wesizwe ukuya koomasipala kwaye sihleli apha nje urhulumente olawula eli lizwe ngurhulumente kaKhongolose ANC osinika le mali sithetha ngayo namhlanje.

*Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I raise this because in all their budget addresses they do not mention gratitude to other government bodies. They only want us to thank them for what they say is a better job. To them it is only them who can better job in this country without any help from any other government who was elected democratically and by the majority of this

country. Let us thank everyone. It is not only the DA who drives this ship of success. It is the national government as well, municipalities and as we are here it is the hard work of the national government of the ANC who gives us the budget that we are talking about here today.

†I must also raise that if you look at this budget the worrying trend to this Provincial Budget is the hidden expenses under equitable share, the unplanned expenditure on advertising, minor assets, contractors and agency support outsourcing services. All of this as if we do not have the capacity internally. Property payments and operating payments: the unexplained expenditure can be easily utilised for other reasons. Close scrutiny needs to be done at all times. This budget set new game changers. The question that arises is what will happen to the huge backlogs particularly in infrastructure, in education, of R138 million which was reported in the 2013-2014 financial year as money not spent.

Today as we speak, we see many hospitals are still witnessing on a daily basis shortage of chronic medication for elderly and chronic patients. Long queues are the order of the day and waiting periods up to five hours daily with no provision for nutrition, food supply. Infrastructure development and maintenance especially in the very old hospitals and clinics such as the Gugulethu Daycare Hospital, need urgent attention, but we do not see this coming to that direction in terms of this budget. More allocations are directed also to MOD Centres and we have heard earlier today that only 32 centres have been reported being functional. The rest are not fully functional.

†Aiyiyomali esiyigalela kwingxowa evuzayo Mphathiswa kuPhuhliso loLuntu sisoloko sithatha imali siyigalele kule nto sithi ijonge ukulungisa abantu abatsha kodwa amaziko ethu engasebenzi ngolu hlobo sicinga ukuba makasebenze ngawo. Zii-feeding Schemes ngamafutshane. Injalo.

*It is not that we are wasting funds on the Minister of Community Development. We always use and fund what we hope will shape the youth but our centres do not function as expected. They are just feeding schemes in short. That is how it is.

†Sometimes I wonder whether this Provincial Government really cares about the democratic values as enshrined in the South African Constitution as they always are flagging the South African Constitution in the face of the country. [Interjection.] If we, as members of this Provincial Legislature, struggle to get dates for example for governing body elections from the Western Cape Education Department and it seems they do not have that data according to them; the date is 6 March when the letter was sent to the HOD and we have learned today that they do not have that information. It is ridiculous. It is a failing department altogether. [Interjection.] What about ordinary parents? This is a clear breach of our own Constitution. How do we as this government perpetuate the question of really supporting public participation while we do not even have the simplest information at hand to provide to Members of Parliament. What about the members on the street.

†Sithi ke lo rhulumente wale DA asiyiboni indlela yakhe yokuthatha abantu abahambise kule democratic dispensation ngakumbi xa sijongene nothatho-nxaxheba lwabantu kwizikolo esikuzo,

*We say to this DA lead government: we do not understand why they move people from this democratic dispensation especially when we look at public participation in our schools.

†One of our serious challenges in school especially in the poor communities is theft of equipment, burglaries, youth gangsterism, and also at times during school hours. How are we as public representatives supposed to interact with the role players if we are denied the information and the opportunity to support schools. The reason why we have asked for this information is to really support and be part of what we are calling a participatory government. What is the programme of this government to deal with the safety of schools in this province? A programme that is interconnected, integrated and sustainable. We do not see that. There is no clear plan according to us. One does not comprehend raising racial utterances and attacks in this province and once we raise it we are perceived of not having other agendas, but we believe this is a serious matter that needs to be dealt with. As recent as in the past few weeks, we note with shock that one of the cleaners in this building where we are at was once again called by the K-word in this precinct. This is unacceptable. Some sections of our communities are being taken backwards ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members!

Mr R T OLIVIER: ...in terms of being assisted in moving forward. This is really unacceptable. Nearby this House in Heathfield an old apartheid flag was flown on top of the roof. It would seem that families are faced with everyday hunger and poverty.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Oliver, kindly finish up, your time has expired.

Mr R T OLIVIER: This indicates, Madam Speaker, that this government is supporting people that must go back to the era of Pharaoh.

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired, hon member Mr Olivier. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: That's a bit half-hearted. Come on!

The SPEAKER: I see hon Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. Come on guys, you could have given him a bit more of an applause there, I mean, your guy really put some effort in. Thank you very much, Madame Speaker. You know, this debate is actually the political debate on the Budget, and I think so many speakers seem to not get that; when they go into detail on the Budget which they are going to actually have to do when it gets down to the actual Budget,

and so you are going to have lots of debate over the next two weeks where you can really get into those details. This is the debate where you should start to talk about the policy. But I am really looking forward to when the hon member Mr Dyantyi speaks, because as the next leader of the ANC in this province, I presume that he is going to speak a little bit more like a leader and kind of talk about policy. [Interjections.]

In order to produce this document, in order to put this Budget on the table, takes a lot of work, but it is not only the work. There has to be a framework within which it has to be delivered. [Interjection.] [Inaudible.] And I need to, because exactly the kind of quality that was coming out of that side of the House, hon member Mr Dyantyi, in actual fact, perhaps I should go back ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...and react to what you just said. The point that was raised here by my hon colleague that shares my bench, says these people need to actually go to Equitable Share 101 classes, because ... [Interjections.] ...Yes, yes, the ANC in this House... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order, please! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Do you agree with that now?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...because there needs to be a plan. From that plan we then devise the Budget and that plan is the Constitution, it is the National Development Plan, it is our own very plan and then from there on this House then has to keep us accountable on the delivery of that plan. [Interjection.] So we have got it. The Hon member Mr Dyantyi actually mentioned a little bit earlier in one of his questions that the National Development Plan, and I wrote his words down here. He said: “The National Development Plan is here to deal with poverty, unemployment and inequality.” That is exactly the challenges that come out of the National Development Plan and that is what this Budget is there to speak to.

So, what does the National Development Plan say? Now let us just have a look at how that Development Plan has to influence or feed into how the Budget is formed. What does it say? So it calls for policy certainty. You agree. The plan calls for policy certainty. I quote: “Private investment will be attracted by the improved conditions as a result of policy certainty.” Quote out of the National Development Plan. But when the President stands up to speak, he creates policy chaos. [Interjection.] Absolute chaos. Half the Ministers when they speak in the National Assembly, create chaos, policy uncertainty par excellence. What does the NDP say about economic growth, about that very point on addressing those challenges of poverty, unemployment and inequality. It says these goals, this is to address these problems and to get growth into our system, it says these goals will be

achieved only if the country confronts the current structural and policy weakness.

An HON MEMBER: How?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: That is what it says. But you know, that no following of that plan can be seen and felt at a national level in this country. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: That is the plan that has to form the basis of this Budget. That plan. So instead, what do we get? We get flip-flop kind of positions and I am going to work through each of these as we go forward. Flip-flop positions from our national colleagues in the ANC, because there is no policy certainty.

Let's have a look at what the National Development Plan says around growing our economy. Let's see what it says around tourism. Because it talks about tourism and agri-processing, two spaces that are significant opportunities to create low-skilled jobs specifically, but across the whole range of skills and specifically rural areas. That is what it talks to. So what do we have to do? It says that we need to adopt a more open immigration system to expand supply of high level skills. But what do we do? We have a

Minister, flip-flops around, does not listen to the National Development Plan and makes it some of the hardest visa regulations in Africa and across the world, specifically ... [Interjections.] ...specifically in those areas of ... [Interjections.] [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members! You may proceed, Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...specifically in those countries that are supposed to be our partners. The BRICS countries and Africa. Those are the countries that find it the most difficult to come here to work, to come here on holiday, to come here and invest. What do we do? We flip-flop around. Then it says ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please, hon members!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: No, it is not the same speech, I wrote the speech now two minutes ago. So, then it says what does the National Development Plan say around connectivity? What does it say around Broadband? What does it say...let us have a look at what it says. It says we need competitively priced Broadband. That is what it says. Do you all agree? You all agree? So what does ... now, but that is exactly what it says. Competitively priced ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please hon members.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...Broadband. It says we need cheaper, faster internet. We need increased ICT skills. You agree with the plan? But then...

The SPEAKER: Minister, please address the Chair.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But then when it analyses the space, the National Development Plan also says the following. It says: "Poor returns from the State's investment in Telkom is the reason why we are not effective in the delivery of this what it calls for faster and cheaper internet." It also says South Africa needs to commit to incentivising private sector involvement in the ICT sector. So guess what happens. In this province, despite much, much pressure, we go out and advertise ... [Interjections.] ...I'm happy, if you are prepared to give me a class afterwards, I will attend.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It goes out and it advertises exactly what the NDP says. It puts it out to private sector and we get the best, cheapest roll-out plan on the table. Far more cost effective than anything else in the market. And it comes from the private sector from an open tender process. [Interjections]

The SPEAKER: Minister, please address the Chair.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Sorry. But what happens at the national level? Even despite the NDP talking about Telkom and this organisation state-owned enterprise that cannot even consistently deliver landlines. It says we are going to give the roll-out of Broadband to Telkom. Unbelievable. Every single thing that the NDP says that really starts to arrest the problems that we have in our country, the flip-flop ANC sitting at national level, can't deliver on that plan, let alone anything else. Let's see what happens in energy. [Interjections.] I'm coming to that. Let's see what happens in energy. Exactly the same thing. It talks about energy. The NDP says move Eskom system operator planning and power procurement, power purchasing and power contracting functions to independent systems. Get this process into the private sector. It says market operator and accelerated procurement of independent power producers. [Interjections.] No, no, no...

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon member! Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: This is your National Development Plan. It also says ... are you going to react to this? I hope. It also say- You are going to tell us how you are rolling out the NDP nationally. It also says that South Africa needs a thoroughly investigated and thought-through plan and investigation of

nuclear energy. It calls for thorough investigation into nuclear energy. Because it is costly, the financing options and the institutional arrangements and the safety environment and costs and benefits; it needs a full investigation. We disregard all of that, we get all flip-floppy again and we announce that we are now putting nuclear power into our system. [Interjection.] ...I hope you are going to tell us about that.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So quite frankly, Madam Speaker, the framework in which we have to produce this Budget and the plan, the main plan of South Africa is not being adhered to at all by the ANC. But in this province, we will adhere to that plan. We will follow that plan and that plan formed the basis of how we put this together with our plan.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: They too work like this. And that plan has given us this budget. And Madam Speaker, that plan now starts to talk to - when we talk about red tape - it talks to the Red Tape Unit that we already had in place for three years and rolling out. It talks to our energy game changer workshop that we have already had because of the crisis that Eskom is in at the moment, we as Province are now going ahead with our own energy supply. We are working

with local authorities and it is quite interesting how when the Premier goes to the Presidency or to the PPC that the President says how can you be working on energy supply? We are tasked with energy supply in this country. Well quite frankly, once again, because of the flip-flop they are failing with energy supply in this country.

The SPEAKER; Hon Minister Winde, your time has expired. Kindly finish your sentence.

An HON MEMBER: Sit down! Sit down!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Madame Speaker, I was going to speak about corruption and what that does, I was going to talk about Agri and specifically around the agricultural flip-flop, but I will do that next time.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Winde, your time has expired. [Applause.] Thank you, I see the hon member Mr Paulsen.

Mr M N PAULSEN: When you drink cheap wine, you talk too much. [Interjections.] I do not drink alcohol. Thank you Madame Speaker. To refer to the Western Cape's 2015-2016 Budget allocation, as an election budget it is a very poor analysis of the Budget. Anyone who makes this analysis is inadvertently agreeing with the DA that this budget is pro-poor. It is not.

An HON MEMBER: It is pro-poor!

Mr M N PAULSEN: Using the words 'game changer' to describe the Budget is also misleading, hon MEC - he is not here, he has gone. Your new liberal Budget actually puts more profits into the coffers of those countries who do business with this government. They do not deliver more houses. That is a fact, not so, MEC for Informal Settlements? Let me make an example as to how we can come up with a pro-poor budget. This would also assist MEC Madikizela. On numerous occasions he admitted he does not understand what it means to build government capacity. I understand why, because in the absence of real government capacity, you would not know what it entails. [Interjection.] It is actually not that difficult. Let me start ...[Interjections.]...I am black too. Let me start with the Economic Freedom Fighters third non-negotiable cardinal pillar, building state and government capacity that will lead to the abolishment of tenders. That is the problem. You don't want to abolish tenders. We can start by establishing a provincial construction company. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please, order! There is a member on the floor.

Mr M N PAULSEN: That company would employ every skill needed to deliver a house, bricklayers, carpenters, plumbers, electricians, etc. We can go even further and establish a cement producing company or a brick manufacturing company. We would be able to employ skills which are going wasted and we would be able to add to our skills base. We are not profit

driven, we are service driven. The demand for housing is so high that this company would be sustainable. The MEC for Informal Settlements can not even give an accurate figure as to what the annual growth for the housing demand is. I don't think he really cares. I am not convinced that there is a reliable electronic housing database. The Human Settlements Committee is yet to be presented with evidence of such a database. The records for housing demand must be in such a shambles, yet no decent measures has been put in place to remedy the situation. There is a good reason why the DA Government dismisses the very notion of building real capacity. The tender system suits you very well. You can buy patronage and secure funding to buy the Obama blue T-shirts and fund the DA (Pty) Ltd. Thank you very much, Madame Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order, please, hon members. I see the Hon Minister Madikizela.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much Madam Speaker. It is not surprising that the EFF has only one member in this House. [Laughter.] Madam Speaker, allow me to please welcome the Budget speech that was delivered in this House on 5 March by the hon Finance Minister Ivan Meyer. It is indeed a speech that gives hope to the people of this province, which is what we need in the ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Madikizela, there is a member on the floor. Can you take your seat, please. Is it a point of order, hon member Mr Paulsen?

Mr M N PAULSEN: Speaker, could the Chief Whip of the DA please speak to hon member Mr Mackenzie about carrying on the way he does, this is not a school playground, Madame Speaker. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mackenzie and all hon members, can I ask you to try and co-operate, it is rather late in the day. We would want to get through proceedings without frivolous interjections. You may proceed, hon Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. It is indeed a budget that gives hope to the people of this province, which is what we need amidst social economic challenges we are facing as the country. In his budget, hon Minister Meyer mentioned that the Department of Human Settlements has been allocated a budget of just over R2 billion for 2015-2016 financial year which will assist us in increasing the housing opportunities and improving settlements functionalities, efficiencies and resilience. Now, hon member Ms Beerwinkel made mention of the fact that this budget is not pro-poor, because there isn't much that it is going to do for the rural areas. But let me give you the figures. In fact, almost all of the Budget of the Human Settlements go to the poor, because we don't build houses for people who are living where hon member Mr Paulsen lives. We build houses for people. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Which of these houses [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: For example, we all know that 64% of the residents of this province reside in the City of Cape Town, but only 62% of this budget goes to the City of Cape Town. 36% of the people are living outside the Metro and 38% of the Human Settlement budget goes to the rural areas, which is a clear indication of a bias towards the rural poor of this province. [Interjections.]

Now again, I think there seems to be confusion on this side of the House, because they give the impression that we must praise the National Government for giving us money. This money is coming from taxpayers.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: We know!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: No, you don't seem to understand that. But clearly, if you are unable to spend the money that you collect from taxpayers, you must give it to us, because we know how to spend it. So you are not doing us any favour by doing that. You are doing what you are supposed to do, because we are the only province that knows how to spend the money. Now let me ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Now let me talk about the challenges that we normally face as Department of Human Settlements where we deliver. We have acknowledged that we are still faced with a number of challenges, but if you look at the number of protests that we have experienced as the Department of Human Settlements, I can take you through to each and every area. The unfortunate thing about those protests is that they normally happen where we are delivering. And the reality again, which is a very sad reality, is that they are often started by the ANC leaders. Because it is very, very clear ... [Interjection.] No, I can count you a number of areas. The number why we are delayed in Delft is because your ANC members there were at the forefront of the protest, because they were trying to block us from delivery. [Interjections.]

So the reality here is that the more we deliver, the more the ANC feels threatened. In fact, with everything that they are saying, it is really surprising why the people of this province brought us back with an increased mandate. So it is very, very surprising. So it must be understood that the Western Cape Budget Allocation for Human Settlement is not in line with the population growth. Hence it is impossible to keep up the pace so that people can get the services that they deserve.

An HON MEMBER: So you have given up?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The reality here is as we have been saying, it is a pity that hon member Mr Paulsen is not here. Again, I really need to dispute the argument that he is advancing that we are unable to give information about a number of things that he has mentioned, particularly the housing demand. We are constantly doing a study to update our housing demand and we have reported at a Standing Committee meeting that we are now sitting at around 521 000 families and the City of Cape Town alone, as of last month, was sitting at more than 278,000 families.

But the reality as I said, is that it is very difficult to really be up to speed with the figures because the rate of emigration is happening at a very fast pace. So as we are talking now, more and more people are coming to the Western Cape as they should, and they are welcome to come here, but the reality is that more and more people come here to look for jobs... Yes, exactly. But you must also acknowledge that the Western Cape is the second province after Gauteng that is experiencing the most number of people. [Interjections.] Yes, I do. We are not disputing that. Now during his National Budget Speech for 2014-2015, Minister Nhlanhla mentioned and I quote: "Across the world, tough questions are being asked about how to generate growth and how to reduce inequality. Governments everywhere face difficult choices, because the gap between what is required and what can be afforded, is very wide. And so we have to be steadfast in our resolve to do more together with less." And when we are doing exactly what the Minister is saying, hon members, this side they are accusing us of not focusing on building houses. We are diversifying here, because if we are to follow the

same approach of trying to build a house for every person in the Western Cape who needs it, the reality is that it would take us not less than 35 years to deal with the current backlog.

Now if you look at the current allocation, vis-à-vis the backlog, hon member Cameron, it will take us no less than 35 years to deal with the current backlog and you know that the backlog is a moving target as I said. Now the plan is the following, because as I said we are diversifying. If you look at the principles of what the National Development Plan is saying, it is very clear and the plan is as follows: 1. We have got to make sure that we improve the living conditions of the people, particularly in backyards and informal settlements. That is why we are dedicating more resources to make sure that those people who continue to wait in informal settlements, at least wait under better conditions by making sure that they have access to water, they have access ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... they have access to sanitation, they have access to electricity, they have also access to roads so that we can minimize the risk of fires. And that is exactly what we are doing. If you look at our strategic goals going forward, this is one of the areas that you are going to be focusing on, because we do acknowledge, because it is not going to help us to continue lying to people. We do acknowledge that there are going to be people who are going to wait for houses for a very, very

long time. So even the NDP acknowledges that at least by 2030 we must have upgraded. It does not say we must have built a house for everyone. The NDP is saying by 2030 we must make sure that all the informal settlements are upgraded. Because even the people who put together that document acknowledge the fact that we will have informal settlements for a very, very long time. So that is what we are doing. But also more importantly, is that we cannot continue spending all our money providing one form of accommodation for our people. That is why it is important to diversify, that is why we are now partnering with developers, with the financial institutions, so that we unlock the challenges that exist in the affordable market space.

I did mention in this House that what we are doing currently is that we have realised that we can no longer rely on the National Department or the National Treasury to give us money to deal with housing challenges. We have our own resources, particularly land. So what we are doing now, we have called upon developers and we are putting land as an equity so that they build houses for the people above the R3 500 threshold and these are your nurses, policemen, teachers, etc so that these people can also have a roof over their heads.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Madikizela, your time has expired, you might want to finish your last sentence.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I was just starting. [Laughter.]
Thank you very much, Madam Speaker and it is unfortunate that the hon

member is not here, so I will end here.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Ms Lekker.

†UNksz P LEKKER: Ndiyabulela Somlomo. *Thank you, Madam Speaker. I just want to make this point clearly. That the Western Cape Provincial Government is not the only province that got the money. All other provinces got, in fact, Gauteng got more than us. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members!

Ms P LEKKER: Now let me also say that, Chair, the doors of learning in culture shall be opened. The ANC has noted with sadness that in some parts of the Cape Flats there are still learners that have not enrolled for the year 2015. The WCED officials have undertaken to provide temporary classrooms. The first quarter of the academic year is almost over, yet these learners are still without any form of formal learning and teaching. The DA led government does not care about the academic future of a poor child. This is not the life you hope to live in over 20 years of democracy or the life that our Constitution promises us. Just recently a tragedy came at the doorstep of learners from Philippi High School. They have been forced by circumstances to study in containers for the past 8 years. On 6 March 2015 they embarked on a peaceful demonstration to the offices of the WCED in Cape Town, demanding a new school. The officials from the WCED arrogantly refused to listen to the plight and sadly SAPS were called in. Learners were brutally

assaulted and injured by stun grenades. I am still in shock, unable to fully comprehend the horror that I saw. Learners were admitted to hospital and this reminded me of the dark days when we lived in old apartheid times. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please, hon members.

Ms P LEKKER: The arrogance displayed by the WCED is the same attitude that used to be displayed by the Department of Education and Training. You will remember, we called it the DET back then. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mr Mackenzie.

Ms P LEKKER: How did we get to this state of madness? Nothing justifies the tragic incident. The learners paid dearly with their blood all in the name of seeking a just cause. [Interjection.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: I hope you don't [Inaudible] the Minister.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mr MacKenzie, you are out of order. Sorry, hon member Ms Lekker. I need to caution you, the hon member is on the floor, constant interjection not on, hon member Mr MacKenzie. You may proceed.

Ms P LEKKER: Surprisingly, this DA led government went to ground and did

not condemn the actions of the WCED and the SAPS, but yet they acted quickly and summoned the SAPS Provincial Commissioner to appear and a Standing Committee on Safety when DA members were arrested ahead of the opening of the Parliament. Poor communities continue to receive inferior services from the DA lead municipalities, especially when these communities have been affected by disasters such as fires. The Premier in her capacity as the Leader of the Government is never or seldom there, because she does not care. Guess what? In the recent fires that engulfed the mountain bush of the Southern Suburbs, the Premier herself was there, brought a donation and even helped to raise over R3 million. What hypocrisy. Communities such as Rolihlahla, IsiQalo and Marikana informal settlements have no emergency services at all, including basic services. This once again shows how this DA led government does not care about the living conditions of the poor. This is definitely unacceptable. This is pure gross negligence on the responsibility by the Minister of Local Government led by MEC Anton Bredell.

Elsewhere in Mbekweni informal settlement under the Drakenstein Municipality, the sewerage pipe system is overflowing and no-one is doing anything about it. Young children are exposed to contagious diseases as they are forced to play on filthy surroundings. The people of Theewaterskloof are also crying for better services. The same applies to Mandlenkosi and Rosedene in Beaufort West. As the ANC we are calling on the Provincial Government to replace the ancient pipe system. This department has clearly shown that it does not have long term infrastructure upgrading plans and continues to deal with current infrastructure problems in a piecemeal manner.

This current budget does not speak to these challenges.

In the past weeks we have seen a rise in violent killings, including mob justice related killings in different parts of the province. From the mob style killings of six young men in Kraaifontein to the execution style of four men and a young woman in Nyanga East in a township called Mao-Mao. The gruesome murder of a 46-year-old man in Gugulethu by a group of 20 youngsters two weeks ago also took place right under our nose. The MEC of Community Safety did not even bother to send his condolences, or visit the families of these people, particularly the ones of Gugulethu and Nyanga East. We have only seen the responsibility of the Station Commissioner of Gugulethu visiting one family and sending a delegation. Now I want to put it out clearly today that the Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry recommended in Recommendation 12 that a multi-sectoral task team must be put in place, headed by doCS. To date this has not happened. Yet, so much money was spent on this Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry. I want to invite the Department of Community Safety to walk the talk. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Madam Speaker, thank you very much. Let me agree with the latest speaker, Ms Lekker, on the issue of education when she said that the doors of learning will be open. But I can further stress that in the Western Cape we are saying the trees of learning will never grow only that [Inaudible.] will be built. In Western Cape we are saying the trees of learning

will never grow because schools not giving education classes under the trees, because we are implementing the NDP, the Education budget allocation is available.

The Department of Health has got this budget because it is primary that you must implement the NDP. You cannot implement the NDP if you do not have the budget. In Nyanga the hospital they call the Joshua Hospital, that is upgraded, and between Phillipi and Mitchells Plain there is a state of the art hospital that is providing the services for both communities and communities from as far as the Eastern Cape; my mother received the services in that hospital. It is because people are coming here because of the better quality services that they are getting. Today my mother is a proud mother who has been healed from the sickness she had. It is not only in Phillipi that we are getting this, you go to Khayelitsha Hospital, when you talk to the patients there they tell you I'm coming from Free State, I'm coming from the Eastern Cape, because this is where I get the better and quality services. [Interjections.]

This proves that people, wherever they are, they know where the better services are and they will go there. The people are not only coming here for job opportunities, they come for various issues, and we are saying if we have to implement the NDP even in other provinces, people will see and immediately say there is a better quality, there are getting better services. People should not only talk about the NDP, that is so good ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order please hon members.

Mr N E HINANA: ... they should also talk about how to implement it. The practical example of what we are doing here in the Western Cape, when they talk of [Inaudible.] go to Eden District Municipality. Although it is a pilot project, it is functioning. We have even given the additional R60 million because we want that to be a progressive programme that can be emulated by other provinces. So we are not always talking about the quality of life, we do not talk about individuals, we talk about the community, we talk about the residents. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr N E HINANA: It has to be mentioned that in Mitchells Plain we have introduced the [Inaudible.] Centre in Klipfontein and Heideveld that provided services and a community data centre. The Hospital is a member of the Global Green and Healthy Hospitals. These are the issues that we say that the better life is not only when you talk about how the people are experiencing it, and when people experience the better life, their health improves. And when their health improves, they are becoming better workers, so that they can work for themselves. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Ms Wenger.

The SPEAKER: Order please hon members.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you Madam Speaker. Safety underpins almost everything that we do and everything that we endeavour. The Western Cape Government has been a pioneer, the leader when it comes to safety and police oversight. It has proven itself to be a government at work, for example the Community Safety Act; this is the first ever provincial act to deal with safety at a local level. It is now operationalised through this budget. This legislation has seen the introduction of Court-watching briefs; the establishment of the first ever Provincial Police Ombudsman to ensure efficient and effective policing for the people of the Western Cape; the Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry to improve policing in one of the Western Cape's hardest crime hit communities as well as the whole of society approach to increasing safety in communities where there is most need. However, Madam Speaker, this government cannot do it alone. It relies on the South African Police as a capable partner in the fight against crime and improving safety.

The National Police Department, SAPS, is responsible for combating and investigating crime and protecting the inhabitants of our country. It is then evident by our crime statistics and the state of the service that we cannot rely on that partner as the Constitution intended. The Police Minister is too busy interfering in state institutions that ought to be independent, like the Hawks and the IPID.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

Ms M M WENGER: I would also like on the Khayelitsha Commission to remind Honourable Member Ms Lekker that the MOU between the Department of Community Safety and SAPS is needed to implement these recommendations. But so distracted is the National Minister that he has not even bothered to sign this Memorandum of Understanding, which would set in motion the Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry recommendations. [Interjections.] These interferences come at the expense of safety in Khayelitsha. [Interjections.] So distracted is he that he ignores... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please!

Ms M M WENGER: ... the Western Cape which has a declining police service. So severe is the problem that some police stations in rural areas are forced to close because we simply do not have enough officers to man them. So distracted and dysfunctional is the service that minimum service levels of visible policing are being done away with and detectives at some stations must deal with 150 dockets, when the national norm is 20 dockets at a time.

To further exacerbate the situation, the Civilian Secretariat has published the third Policy Paper in as many years. The White Paper wants to further centralise policing to Pretoria which will come at the expense of community safety needs. This White Paper seeks to subjugate municipal police under SAPS and relegate municipal police to mere traffic and bylaw enforcers. The White Paper mentions the National Development Plan but is silent on all the

important policy proposals. For example, the NDP states that specialised units must be re-established but the White Paper does not. Why will National Government not reinstate specialised units for gangs and drugs in the Western Cape? Why does the National Minister ignore our pleas and why does he ignore communities that have categorically stated that specialised dedicated resources are needed if we are going to make any improvement.

It is poor communities that suffer the burden of crime the most. The police therefore have an obligation to all communities but most especially an obligation towards poor communities. That would be a government at work; a government that serves the poor. Every two days the SAPS receives more budget; the SAPS receives more budget than the Provincial Department of Community Safety receives in an entire year. Despite this enormous budget, we see very little evidence of National Government at work. Where is our partner the police in the Western Cape? Where Madam Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, thank you Madam Speaker. The Western Cape Provincial Government has announced a whopping 52 billion rand Budget for 2015/2016, rising reasonably in the MTEF. [Interjections.] It is driven by what the Madam Premier defines as game changers; critical interventions to realise the promise of the money. Whereas the ruling party in this province offers nice to hear language, evidence-based practices, inclusive economy, public value, etcetera, the actual details reveal something

contra. The lack of transformation of the Western Cape economy means that the levels of inequality pointed out in the NGP will remain for a very long time.

Minister Winde spoke about structural weaknesses when he was in Pretoria but I want to speak to him about structural weaknesses in Cape Town so that you take back the fly. Because part of the reason why the Western Cape economy is not soon to be transformed is that there are deep structural weaknesses here and you are tinkering around the edges; you are not dealing with the actual issues in the Western Cape.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So I wanted you to talk about this here. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: At the root I will dig down.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You also have glaring inconsistencies which in policy intent announced by the Premier and the MEC for Finance and where the actual money goes. For instance this government is spending a total of 17.3 billion in infrastructure for 2015 and 9 billion for roads infrastructure. However there are no targets that are set for HDI's and whereas MEC Grant a few weeks ago was bragging about percentages to HDI's. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja but it is true.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: But we are saying as we stand here there are no...
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... in the APP's we are seeing none of those targets for HDI's and therefore that is one inconsistency. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please hon members!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: They say this and then they do something else.
[Interjections.] These are the details we need to go and get into.

An HON MEMBER: You have got the wrong end of the stick.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The growing profit margins will only accrue for the already established in this province, not for the poor because the poor they speak of Public Works, EPWP's and all that; the crumbs of the economy.

An HON MEMBER: No it is not.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is what they are doing.

An HON MEMBER: That is not true.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Prove it if it is not. Prove it if it is not.

The SPEAKER: Order please hon members!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Prove it if it is not. Policy pronouncements are not backed up by concrete action plans. In fact by her own admission, the Premier has promised that action plans for what she calls game changers will only be complete in August; she said it in this House. That is what she said. So she should try to create a whole that is not there that we are only going to be able to do this in six months' time. Meaning you are likely when you get to the Adjustment in October, to speak about virements, run-overs, money not spent because nothing would have happened until August and I will give you a few examples of that.

If you take what has been her highlight, the Broadband; the Broadband. The four streams of the Broadband as we speak today, none of those are operational; they have no action plans. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: They are on the announcement.

The SPEAKER: Order! Sorry hon member Mr Dyantyi will you take your seat; is it a point of order? [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Will the hon member take a question?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi will you take a question?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I will definitely take a question when I am done.

The SPEAKER: Okay. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Where were you yesterday?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So watch this. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Where were you yesterday? [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The only thing that we are told is that... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member Mr Dyantyi please hold on. Order please hon members! [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: [Inaudible.] in the meantime. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Or must I sit down?

The SPEAKER: Please.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: I just need to address the hon members; there is a speaker on the floor. Hon members you cannot engage in a dialogue across the floor while there is a speaker addressing the House. Please kindly refrain. Minister Winde, I need to ask you to compose yourself – please. You may proceed.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Ek is baie bewus dat hierdie is bietjie pyn – daar is pyn vir hulle. [Tussenwerpsels.] Daar is pyn. Now let me continue Madam Speaker and say... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Please do.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...we are told of pylons but there is no indication where these pylons are as part of the Broadband. [Interjections.] They are even failing Madam Speaker, they are even failing on their current process, let alone what the game changers will do. For example on the upper culture development that you announced in 2014; 2600 jobs were promised in Doringbaai. None of these were delivered. You are coming up with

something new again. This is the hope that you talk about from this budget. That is your hope; that is your hope. [Interjections.] And the list goes on. Part of that we can take it even to the issue of maintenance that hon member Ms Lekker spoke about.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The lack of maintenance and security for community halls as part of the [Inaudible.] is happening. Khayelitsha's O R Tambo was burned down because there is no proper security.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: By your own members.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: That is a DA government. If you go to Kraaifontein... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Please hon members.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... if you go to Fisantekraal, community facilities are not maintained. We are still going to spend more money because of the lack of maintenance and all of that is happening in the poor areas, in the Cape Flats and in the townships; I have got details of that. We will come back for that. [Interjections.] Let... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let me go to what the Premier about two years ago spoke about as a game changer... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...then, what is called the Red Tape.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Here is the programme for the Red Tape. [Interjections.] And that programme falls under this Minister, Minister Winde. If you look at his own APP, this is the Red Tape rubbish in that APP. [Interjections.] This is it. There is absolutely nothing and it is not starting this year in 2015/2016, it has been there, yes thank you, for three years. [Interjections.] In those three years, we have been told, the Red Tape is going to be an enabler of the game changers and yet it has already failed. This is what we are told because in this Red Tape over 2000 cases were reported. [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: There is no record and report as to what they did about those cases and yet they are saying – there is none, there is none. Don't ask what we do. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Please hon members.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please let them keep quiet because I think it is painful for them now. I am not about to stop. Now as part of that Red Tape Reduction as an example, because they speak about reviewing legislation, all they are talking about is the visas, that is all they are interested in. [Interjections.] They are talking about lobbying and advocating. A government that says it is going to lobby an advocate, you are not a civil society. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Mr Dyantyi please speak to the Chair, thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you sorry. Sorry Chairperson. Sorry Chairperson. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Speaker.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So you do not have measurable things to do in this what is called the Red Tape. Let us go to another game changer; the energy game changer. The energy game changer, it is even worse than the Red Tape. The only thing they are able to speak about is that they are going to engage with Eskom on Tuesday because the Premier... [Interjections.] There was the Premier's forum Eskom was presenting. [Interjections.] That is part of what they think... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Call them to order please so that I can continue.
[Interjections.] So please there is no actual plan from this Province as you would have in Gauteng. Gauteng stands up and says for energy, this is one, two, three that we are going to do; there is none of that in this. The only thing they do is they blame Eskom, they go to Pretoria as they normally do.
[Interjections.] That is all they do. [Interjections.] And so we can go to each and every one of the so-called game changers and then we know...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Please hon members.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... the game changers. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Bad news for us.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: In fact the game changers themselves need intervention for us to go forward. Let me proceed and talk about... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, you need to finish up your time has expired.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is about to expire?

The SPEAKER: Ja. It has expired, you may complete your sentence sir, thank you hon member.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Okay, let me make the point about... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: You may finish the sentence hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I want to finish that sentence now. Please give me space to finish that sentence. [Interjections.] This Minister speaks about NDP alignment. The NDP alignment is in 14 departments. There is only one department that has been able to demonstrate how... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi your time has expired thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...to other things. So even your department is not...

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: So do not speak about that.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi your time has expired thank you. Order please hon members. [Interjections.] I recognise the hon member Mr Fritz. Order please members! Can we settle down just a little bit, there is too much noise in the Chamber.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you hon Madam Speaker. How appropriate is it that we are standing on the eve of Human Rights Day, the 21st September. Sorry 21st March and the debate is precisely why 69 people in Sharpeville and a number of people in Langa here in Cape Town died for absolute better human dignity and for services to be delivered. And today we are having a very appropriate debate because the debate underlines three important points. The debate says that... [Interjections.] The debate says Madam Speaker that there are three fundamental issues in governance and it also underlines the issue that... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order please!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...this government in the Western Cape when the hon Minister delivered that Budget speech the other day, there were three underlying issues that were very, very important to us and the one was accountability; the second one was a competent and capable state. A capable state. Someone that if you get money, spend the money. If you get something to go build a hospital, go build a hospital. Do not let Limpopo give the money to the Western Cape because they cannot spend the money... [Interjections.]

And the third point is the issue of the rule of law. I think those – I want to please put to those debates within that context because it is because of those values and the integrity added to it of the whole issue of absolute service

delivery that we really debunk the notion that the ANC theme talks to firstly that it is not a pro quo budget, and I even then sit and I wonder, give me the rich where we deliver the Budget because I cannot think of anyone. Hon Madikizela building houses for the rich in Constantia, yes. Minister Fritz delivering grants for the rich, yes. So they cannot tell us where the rich are and where we deliver our budgets. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Sorry is it hon – hon Minister if you can be seated. Is it a point of order on...? [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I want to tell you where.

The SPEAKER: No, no, no you cannot tell him where. Is it a – you are out of order hon member Mr Dyantyi. You are out of order. You may proceed Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And the sad point hon Madam Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Wiley.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The sad point about the debate today; you know and I could see hon member Ms Lekker getting up not really having any spirit because she knows most of the stuff that she is saying does not hold water; even before her time was done, she did not have

any spirit when she was talking as usual as a speaker with conviction. Hon member Mr Dyantyi tried hard to have some kind of spirit, he could not do it because they know, the ANC knows. [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Theo Olivier, a man whom I have a lot of respect for being far more intelligent than the stuff he spoke here. Really I mean, I was quite disappointed in the kind of comments he made. But because the ANC knows, Madam Speaker; what they realise is this is a pro quo budget and they cannot get away with it and it is this; one of our speakers in this debate spoke to the issue and I think it was honourable ... one of the hon speakers spoke to the reason because we seem to forget that we were elected back into this government by over 60%. Now that is a fact. We cannot invent that like you invent all the other stuff; that is a fact. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Which means they lost.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Exactly, and they did not just lose they lost badly and that is the point. Not this budget of DA led Western Cape government. [Inaudible.] also hon Madam Speaker, to create a society that you do not want to speak about openly. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order please! Hon member Ms Lekker.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: We do all of this. Today there was a big issue today about the Premier opening Leeuwenhof. That is a typical example of the ANC government. They always want a little VIP

place, closed, no access to the poor, they just talk about the poor but the poor are left outside.

And then the other thing that this ANC government unfortunately does - this ANC government brings in the element of race into everything because they have nothing else, nothing else and therefore that is the point that they unfortunately make. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order please hon members!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: What is very interesting, they always when it suits the hon Opposition on the other side, specifically the ANC, they will say with the disasters “ha, the fire-fighters came from the Eastern Cape”. The minute you raise government in the Eastern Cape then they have an issue and then allow me to raise a few issues. [Interjections.] There were two issues that I always found interesting as an illustration of ANC governance. The one was a mental hospital in the Northern Cape and I was personally involved and so I know exactly what I am talking about ... [Interjections.]

That hospital overran to more than a billion rand. Do you know why they overran to more than a billion hon member Ms Lekker? Hon member Ms Lekker, why it overran to more than a billion rand was because they just cannot use the conditional grant, they cannot use the money allocated to them to build a hospital. But you know what, that is fine to laugh because you

know what Mr Deputy Speaker, those people with mental disabilities, because the hospital is not built, because service cannot be delivered, they are kept in the prison in Kimberley. That is this kind of disgust that we talk and we laugh about or we talk about why people died in 1960 in Langa and in Sharpeville; and it's those kind of impacts of our non-spending of government resources and money on the poor, and here we have the people that laugh when we talk about it.

The other point that I want to talk about in the Eastern Cape was 1900 toilets that were supposed to have been built. In most cases the toilets did not appear ever and secondly they even appeared to collapse and you know what, these are the same people who run around and throw poo here in the Cape but they cannot even build a simple toilet. This is when you misuse the government and the budget that is allocated to you. So what we are talking about, it hurts the ANC because the ANC knows they are incapable and runs a completely incapable state; they represent an incapable state. That is why in the Western Cape people will never, ever vote - and I think in many other provinces - for them again. They will actually vote for an alternative state that can make a difference to the people. [Interjections.] They do not even vote for the ANC, now that is the proof you know that. [Interjection.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, what is very interesting; what is really interesting around some of what we are saying. [Interjections.]

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: What is really interesting about what my colleagues have spoken about, and I really just quickly want to go and refer to some of the kind of issues [Interjections.] Hon member Ms Beerwinkel tried and I think she speaks with sincerity when she speaks. The stuff just falls hollow unfortunately because it does not make sense. But one of the important points that the hon member Ms Beerwinkel was raising in her debate was that the DA has as a whole of society ... is not true. And then she raised the issue of the *Cape Times* and the subscription issue and saying that we stop advertisements which is completely untrue, we have not stopped advertisements. [Interjections.]

She also spoke about the agriculture and the issue of farm worker abuse and I really, really want to ask the hon members - and I talk for both sides of the House - where we have farmers who are abusing anyone on the farm and workers, please alert us, alert me if you know. Just, I will go with you to show me where it is so that one can do something and... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: I did.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You have not alerted me. The other point that the hon member Ms Beerwinkel speaks so beautifully about is unemployment among young people in the Western Cape. She says... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is not beautiful.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...and she says I watch unemployment in the Western Cape and then I say to her, you know if I now want to use tit for tat, what about unemployment in the Eastern Cape; I worked in the Eastern Cape extensively, let me just make that point. And I have worked and I tell you I know better than most people here. Some of them are from [Inaudible.] I know it better. The point and the reason why I want to say that, as I came back every time from a trip, I had six people who came with me. This place is so bad, these people are so evil in the Western Cape, but six people will come with me from the Eastern Cape to Cape Town. And I was actually a human trafficker. I can create work for people here! [Interjections.]

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I think hon member Mr Mackenzie made a very important point. [Interjections.] And hon member Mr Mackenzie spoke very extensively about everything that is touched by the ANC like Robben Island, a fantastic facility, a great facility, it crumbles in front of you. It crumbles literally and we were there, the three of us were there, it is crumbling in front of us and it is a sad, sad state.

I think the point hon member Mr Christians and hon member Ms Madikizela were making, they made the point that this budget installs hope in our people.

It installs hope in our young people. It is wrong and it is – I want to say it is not true. I want to say to hon member – one of the members who spoke - the hon member Mr Dyantyi made a point that our point of job creation is extended Public Works. I just want to remind the hon member that we inherited the idea here in the Western Cape when it came in and we were the first to stop the nonsense. When you get any person doing extended “dan vee hulle strate”, they are always cleaners. We stopped it and we made our people youth developers we made them crèche assistants; we made a lot of them very, very substantive work, far better than always cleaning streets and parks. Stop reducing our poor people to nonsense and this is the point around that.

51 million is a good point I think for youth development and absolutely Minister Meyer, we welcome that. We also want to – some of us you know, I think that was hon member Mr Christians who asked about a very important point; he asked what are you when you are against everything? And hon member Mr Winde was whispering to me; he was whispering to me and he was saying “you know what is interesting, really ask the ANC please present all the budget”. You don’t even do that. You stand there and criticise stuff that you cannot criticise.

Hon member Mr Donald Grant and hon member Alan Winde spoke about policy certainty and I think those are some very, very important points that we need to talk about. And then my hon dear friend with a lot of intelligence, hon member Mr Theo Olivier, spoke about criminality in our

communities and he blames the government... [Interjections.]

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister your time has expired, just finish off your sentence.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... criminality and the government. I just do not understand the logic honourable member, you are far more intelligent than that, please my friend.

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister your time has expired. I see the Minister Meyer; Minister to you to respond.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you for members who took part in this debate. When I delivered my Medium Term Budget Policy Statement in 2014, I highlighted that the Provincial Budget Policy Framework is designed to balance, as my colleague Minister Grant has indicated, the finances while also managing the risk and maintaining fiscal stability in a very, very constrained economic environment. While we will implement the National Development Plan, the Medium Term Strategic Framework and the provincial priorities as per the Western Cape Provincial Strategic Goals, the provincial strategic plan, the National Development Plan as well as the Medium Term Spatial Framework and the 2014 nineteenth Provincial Strategic Plan will form the basis for this year's operationalisation of the Western Cape Budget.

We have on the Order Paper the issue of the Consideration of the Principles of the Western Cape Appropriation Bill. The policy principles that inform this particular Budget is firstly Constitutionalism, only do what the Constitution allows you do; operate within the framework of the Rule of Law; act within the whole of society approach. We have also introduced the principle in the Budget Policy Committee of Evidence-Based Practice and simply anybody can make a meaningful input into this debate by providing us with the evidence and some members do, but others do not and if any member has some evidence, hard evidence, we are happy to listen to that evidence because this Budget Policy Committee has introduced Evidence-Based Practice. We cannot simply one morning wake up and decide to spend money, this is how we work.

Also hon Mr Deputy Speaker, all my colleagues that took part in this debate highlighted the importance of partnerships. Also, we do not start from the state, we start from the citizen and hence this Budget Policy Framework also looks at citizen centric and in addition, fundamentally as the Minister of Finance, I want to find out whether this Budget adds or creates public value.

I further highlighted that this Budget's reductions will be implemented for all votes as a result of the tight fiscal framework; we have deliberately and intentionally decided that we will protect three departments in the Budget cuts and that is the Department of Health, the Department of Education and the Department of Social Development. Now this is to ensure that the impact on the poor is minimised. The Budget Policy Committee resolved to protect

the poor in this Budget.

The citizens of the Western Cape deserve as Minister Fritz has indicated, a capable, accountable and a transparent government and it is our collective duty to provide them with the best government possible. According to the Auditor General, the Provincial Government of the Western Cape has over the past two years assumed the lead in the drive towards clean administration with 78% clean audits in 2013/14. This was due to the Provincial Treasury, the Office of the Premier's continued support and embracing the assurance initiatives and leading the collective effort through the CGRO process to see significant improvements in the Provincial Audit outcomes.

An HON MEMBER: ... party's a clean audit but you heard [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Mr Deputy Speaker, within the municipal space, the Department of Local Government in collaboration with Provincial Treasury holds municipalities accountable through the Municipal Governance Review Outlook Process to work towards the achievement of clean governance and clean audit outcomes. Hon member Mr Dyantyi will you please note, next week I will be meeting the Auditor General and he will again be shocked about the progress we have made in this particular space. [Interjections.]

The Auditor General's further comments is that they recognise the commitment and the spirit of co-operation of the Western Cape Cabinet and

the public commitment to accountability and consequences management and also, yes rightfully so, pledge of the Legislature to enhance oversight of the Executive Accounting Officers and authorities and senior management and that includes all of us here in this House. I recognise that particular responsibility and we ask you hon member Mr Dyantyi to sharpen your pen because the more your pen becomes sharpened, the more sharpened your question is, the more sharpened your pen is, the better this government... [Interjections.]

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... comes together we can serve people, so sharpen your pen in the oversight responsibilities. [Interjections.]

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Meyer just one second. Hon Chief Whip?

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, hon member Mr Dyantyi is making a running commentary and disturbing the Minister in... [Interjections.]

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes I agree with that I will check on him. Mr Dyantyi please contain yourself.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you hon Chief Whip, I appreciate your leadership. Agb mnr die Adjunkspeaker, die begroting van die Wes-Kaap vir 2015/16 spreek tot die vyf strategiese doelwitte. As 'n regering is ons

gefokus op dienslewering en die implementering van die Nasionale Ontwikkelingsplan. Ons wil graag hê Suid-Afrika moet slaag en daarom is die Wes-Kaapse Regering verbind tot die bevordering van die breë doelwitte van die Nasionale Ontwikkelingsplan. In die gees van samewerkende regering het die Wes-Kaapse Kabinet die Nasionale Ontwikkelingsplan loodsprojekte geïdentifiseer, befonds en geïmplementeer.

Die Wes-Kaapse Regering wil hê die Nasionale Ontwikkelingsplan moet slaag omdat ons wil hê Suid-Afrika moet slaag. Die Nasionale Regering moet die Wes-Kaap sien as 'n vennoot wat erns het met die implementering van die Nasionale Ontwikkelingsplan. [Tussenwerpsel.] Maar agb mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ons moet egter ook ons kommer uitspreek oor die tendense van die Nasionale Ontwikkelingsplan, my agb kollega Minister Alan Winde, as hy net wil luister, is korrek as hy sê daar is ideologiese konflikte in die Nasionale Regering wat die Nasionale Ontwikkelingsplan kelder.

Tweedens, die Nasionale Ontwikkelingsplan soos agb Minister Winde uitgewys het, stel voor dat in die konteks van die energie-krisis moet ons oorgaan na hernubare energie, maar soos die agb Minister aangetoon het... [Tussenwerpsel.]

An HON MEMBER: Do not see that as his problem.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... spandeer die nasionale regering eerder een triljoenrand op kernkrag met Rusland [Tussenwerpsels.] die...

[Tussenwerpsel.]

An HON MEMBER: The renewables are already happening, there is no escaping [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Die Nasionale Regering vra vir hernubare energie, President Zuma sê “kom ons koop kernkrag by Putin”, ons weet hoekom. Dit gaan nie oor die “energy mix” nie, dit gaan oor die korrupsie wat daaruit gaan voortspruit. Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, die Nasionale Ontwikkelingsplan verwys na ’n “capable state”, maar die Ouditeur-generaal asook die Presidensie se eie impakverslae dui daarop dat ’n “capable state” ontbreek in alle ander provinsies en munisipaliteite in Suid-Afrika.

I am convinced that the National Development Plan is collecting dust in the Union Buildings. I want to repeat; the National Development Plan is collecting dust in the Union Buildings. I will repeat this in Afrikaans. Agb mnr die Adjunkspeaker, die Nasionale Ontwikkelingsplan vergader stof in die Unie-gebou. President Zuma en Minister Grant, as hy ook net wil luister, is korrek. Hy het vir my gesê dat President Zuma stof net hierdie plan af as hy indabas toe gaan en wanneer hy... [Tussenwerpsel.]

An HON MEMBER: That is right.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...Internasionale investeerders ontmoet, maar verder vergader hierdie plan stof in die Unie-gebou. Wanneer die DA in die

Unie-gebou is sal ons vir hulle wys hoe om hierdie plan te implementeer. Ons is op pad na die Unie-gebou. Whilst the National Development Plan is collecting dust in the Union Buildings, the wheels of the National Development Plan are rolling in the Western Cape because this is a province at work. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: But where is it rolling?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon Mr Deputy Speaker, it is rolling because the Presidency's Office has said so. We are the only province that is able to deliver it and the President's report says "well done to the Western Cape" because the wheels are running. [Interjections.] Let me now turn to members who made a contribution in this debate. Agb me Beerwinkel het verwys na die landelike areas. The Western Cape will spend a total amount of 124.4 million on the Regional Socio-Economic Project over the MTEF. Now this Regional Socio-Economic Project, hon Mr Deputy Speaker, is to roll out upgrading and safety projects in poor neighborhoods in rural areas in this province.

The Regional Socio-economic Project is entirely a rural project of this government. In addition, we will spend approximately 1.5 billion rand on broadband technology. The bulk of this technology will be rolled out to the rural areas. Hon Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Minister Winde and hon member Mr Dyantyi, you are really making a nuisance now of yourselves.

The Minister is delivering his reply, we want silence for his reply.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Tell us something else.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I will tell you something else because we have rolled out an extensive rural ICT project all over the Western Cape to give ICT rural connectivity to rural municipalities in the particular libraries all over the Western Cape. So, and this is not stuff that we are planning... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Are you sure?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: This Monday I paid a visit to Bongolethu Library in Oudtshoorn. There I saw the roll-out of the rural ICT, so it is happening; the learners were behind the computers and they were accessing free internet provided through this broadband technology. So hon members, it is happening as we speak. It is not stuff that we are planning. We have also heard from hon Minister Grant that this government will spend 17 billion rand over the next three years for infrastructure development all over the Western Cape. [Interjections.] These targets, these Ministers will indicate these targets, particularly for education. The targets are set for health and the targets are set for road infrastructure. The Minister of Public Works and Transport will respond to this during his Budget vote.

Again the bulk of the infrastructure budget is targeting rural areas. Hon member Mr Christians is correct, this Budget creates hope for the citizens of the Western Cape. Hon Member Mr Christians, for us hope is also an acronym because this is exactly what this government does, creating higher opportunities for people to excel in. This is what this Budget is about. iThemba. And you know iThemba means not only hope it also means trust and these people have put their trust in the Western Cape and that is why we won the election. iThemba.

Hon member Mr Christians, thank you for your support because you are supporting the youth of this province. Thank you for supporting education and skills development because education is 17 billion rand of this Budget and over the next three years we will spend 175 million rand for skills development. Thank you for your support for the youth.

Hon Minister Grant is correct, there are global and local risks in that this Budget is to protect the citizens against those risks. I am pleased with the partnership approach of Minister Grant for both the private and the public sectors because Minister Grant is also tapping into other resources to make us better together. [Interjections.]

Hon member Mr Olivier, I really like you and I will continue to like you. [Interjections.] I am happy to have a cup of tea with you; if you like Rooibos tea we can arrange or if you want some Chinese tea we can also do that since

we have some Communists in the room. [Interjections.] But hon member Mr Olivier you will note that in the Constitution there is a section 220 that deals with the establishment and functions of the Finance and the Fiscal Commission. So I understand that you understand that all money that is collected goes into the National Revenue Fund and then it is distributed according to the formula of the Finance Fiscal Commission and I think that is allocated to every particular province, and I think we can further have a nice discussion over a cup of tea in a more informal environment. We need to do more of these things in this House.

Hon member Madikizela, I think hon Minister Madikizela is determined, hon Mr Deputy Speaker, to spend his budget two billion rand on the poor. I have just looked at his budget for the next three years. The Department of Human Settlements will get a budget of 7.7 billion rand over the next three years. That is our commitment to deal with the poor and this Budget is entirely pro-poor, the whole of the two billion rand budget.

But what is shocking, I have now heard here in this House about that Minister Madikizela is underspending on Human Settlements but here is the shocking news. Gauteng has underspent 3.4 billion rand on Human Settlements. [Interjections.] Hon member Ms Lekker, this is a national scandal. [Interjections.] Minister Madikizela is delivering and hence he has received an additional 20 million rand in the additional Adjustment Appropriation Bill. Hon member Mr Hinana is right, we must not speak, hon member Mr Hinana, I think it is right, we must no longer speak about the National

Development Plan but we must now speak about the National Implementation Plan while the rest is talking about the Development Plan... [Interjections.]

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We are now talking about... [Interjections.]

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Beerwinkel the Minister...
[Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... and the National Implementation Plan.

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please contain yourselves.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon Mr Deputy Speaker, hon member Ms Wenger is also right; this government takes the safety of our citizens very seriously. To this effect the Budget will allocate an amount of 729 million rand for the safety of the citizens of the Western Cape over the MTEF. For the safety of schools an amount of 17 million rand has been made available. I am really shocked that a hon member of the ANC can call a project of the NDP – I am shocked - can call a project of the NDP and I use his words; you must check the Hansard, “crumbs under the table”. [Interjections.] I am shocked. But this demonstrates the point that Minister Winde made. Minister Winde said this happened because there is ideological confusion and division in the ruling party and hence some speak about the NDP; it is collecting dust

in the Union Buildings... [Interjections.] ... And another party is calling it “crumbs under the table”. I am shocked. [Interjections.]

We will take the Hansard minutes and send it to President Zuma because he must know what his colleagues think of the National Development Plan – “crumbs under the table”. [Interjections.] We will send it to Trevor Manuel because it is described here as “crumbs under the table”. I am shocked. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Deeply shocked.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: It is collecting no wonder, dust in the Union Buildings. Mr Deputy Speaker, it is collecting dust, hon member, it is collecting dust... [Interjections.] It is collecting dust hon member Mr Dugmore. [Interjections.]

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Minister you may continue.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I will proceed thank you hon member Mr Dugmore. I will proceed on your request. But there are shocking revelations in this debate. There is another one; very, very sad news. While we were debating this Budget in this House, Eskom’s credit rating has just been downgraded to junk status. [Interjections.] While we have this debate. Hon Mr Deputy Speaker, even Tito Mboweni tweeted that we are now in deep trouble.

We are now facing a real crisis in the energy space and I hope when we have another debate, my colleagues will tell us exactly what we are doing...

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: There is nothing there.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We will explain to you in great detail in three budget votes...

An HON MEMBER: When?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Next week. In three budget votes, we will explain to you what we are doing in terms of every particular annual performance plan and the indicators. [Interjections.] Hon Mr Deputy Speaker, my colleagues will indicate next week in the Budget Vote what we are doing in terms of renewable energy and particularly in the space of the green economy. We are having a crisis, we must get serious in this House.

An HON MEMBER: You are not doing anything in this province. All you do is to point; you are just blaming. [Interjections.]

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member Mr Dyantyi you cannot continuously comment on everything said from the other side. Be more reserved please. Minister you may continue.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon Mr Deputy Speaker, every time I touch this book, the National Development Plan, I feel something happening that side of the House. It is like an earthquake is moving. [Interjections.] Something is happening here in this House. I do not feel I am on stable grounds. But when I put this book down; when I put this book down, there is stability back in the House. [Interjections.] But when I take out this book, there is some nervousness in that side of the House but I know why Mr Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ...because they regard this as crumbs under the table. Hon Mr Deputy Speaker, let me conclude. [Interjections.] Ja I think I must conclude. Hon Minister Fritz's budget is entirely spent on the poor. Minister Fritz is leading, if you listen... [Interjections.] If you listen Minister Fritz is leading a massive campaign to improve the governance of the NPO's and the NGO's in this province because in his Budget Vote he spent one billion rand on transfer payments for NGO's.

Hon Minister Fritz was outlying in great detail what this government is doing for youth development. But to show that we are not working in silos; Minister Schäfer if she listens, Minister Fritz, Minister Winde if he listens, Minister Mbombo if she listens, Minister Grant if he listens, Minister Madikizela is listening; they are all having programmes focusing on youth

development and they will come back next week in this House to outline what programmes we have in this government for youth empowerment.

An HON MEMBER: Do not bother to... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon Minister Fritz is absolutely right hon Mr Deputy Speaker, when you come and debate a budget that you reject, Minister Fritz is absolutely right, then you put an alternative budget on the table. I have yet to see the alternative budget; I see there is movement again that side. I have yet to receive the alternative budget from the hon members of the Opposition. In the National Assembly, the Democratic Alliance presented an alternative budget in the National Assembly but there is no... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is not the plan.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: There is no alternative budget from this particular members in this House. But hon Mr Deputy Speaker, I want to end off on a good note; because I have seen the ATC in this House today and I have seen the report of the Budget Committee and I am very happy to read that the Budget Committee having debated on the subject of the Western Cape Additional Adjustment Appropriation Bill 2014/15, referred to the Committee in terms of the Standing Rule 187, reports that it has concluded its deliberations on the Bill and that it supports the principle of the Bill; I thank the Budget Policy Committee.

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, [Interjections.]

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, [Interjections.]

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Order!

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, [Interjections.]

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am listening.

Mr P UYS: We are busy with the Appropriation Bill that was; let me tell the MEC, 14/15 was the one that we discussed two hours ago. Wake up please and do not mislead this House.

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order hon member Mr Uys. I presume that was a point of order?

Mr P UYS: Absolutely.

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: It was on the verge of not being a point of order but I will take your point. We have come to the end of the debate on the Consideration of the Principle of the Bill. Are there any objections to the

approval of the Principle of the Bill?

HON MEMBERS: Yes, yes.

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: If there is an objection I am going to put the question; those in favour will say “aye”.

HON MEMBERS: Aye.

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those against “no”.

HON MEMBERS: No.

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think you – order! I think the aye’s have it.
[Interjections.] The ANC’s objection will be recorded. Order! Order! Order!
The House is not adjourned. Please take your seats. The Secretary will read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: Western Cape Appropriation Bill.

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House will deal with the separate votes onwards. The House is not quite adjourned yet, the Speaker will take over from me and then she will adjourn the House.

The SPEAKER: Order hon members! Please order! On Tuesday the 24

February 2015, during the debate on the State of the Province Address, the hon member Mr Wiley raised a point of order, requesting me to rule on the hon member Mr Magaxa allegedly calling the Premier a racist. He alleged that when the hon Leader of the Opposition was delivering his speech, the hon member Mr Magaxa said “and the Premier is a racist” and also “the man behind the Premier is a racist”. Because I did not hear such words being uttered, I firstly enquired from the hon member Mr Magaxa to address the House and he denied using those words but that he said “he and she is a neo-liberal”. I then promised to study Hansard. A copy of Hansard was made available to me and I can confirm that hon member Mr Magaxa did indeed use the word “neo-liberal” to refer to the Premier and to hon member Mr Wiley. However knowing the transcript with the words “you are a racist” captured, I am therefore not in a position to rule on the point of order as raised. [Interjections.] Order please hon members!

Then during the debate on the Premier’s State of the Province Address again on the 24 February, the hon member Ms Gillion raised a point of order and requested me to rule on whether the following utterances allegedly made – order please! - allegedly made by the hon Madam Premier were unparliamentary and I quote “you are talking rubbish”. As I did not hear specifically what was said at the time, I undertook to study the unrevised Hansard and I also made the point to the House at the time that the context in which words are used will always guide whether to rule such words parliamentary or unparliamentary. I have now had the opportunity to study the unrevised Hansard, the revised Hansard and I want to rule as follows.

There is nowhere in Hansard where it is recorded that the hon Madam Premier had used the words as alleged by the hon member Ms Gillion. I therefore cannot rule on the utterances that are not on record in Hansard and I did not hear from the Chair.

Having said that I would like to caution hon members not to use words or language, whether on or off record which have a demeaning effect when directly addressed to an individual member. In order to ensure orderly proceedings with regard to the business of the House, Presiding Officers will also intervene and call members to order for using expressions that could be construed to be inflammatory or inciting. Even if such words may not be regarded as unparliamentary when ordinarily used in a different context. As stated previously, context will always guide whether to rule certain words as parliamentary or unparliamentary. I trust members will exercise their freedom of speech with some circumspection and that there will be less need for intervention from the Presiding Officers.

I would also like to draw members' attention to a related incident further down in the same debate and it is on page 144 of Hansard. When hon member Mr Botha was on the floor and I was calling the House to order, at that point hon member Ms Dijana took to the floor and directed the following words at me as Presiding Officer in isiXhosa. "It is because of you that there is noise. You do not intervene. You are rubbish, you are rubbish".

At that time I called her to order for saying that I as Presiding Officer was

the cause of the noise and lack of order. Having studied the Hansard and after verifying the isiXhosa translation with our Language Unit, I discovered that not only did hon member Ms Dijana not withdraw the part I could hear and called her to order for but that she addressed me directly saying that I am rubbish. I regard that to be a gross violation of our privileges as members of the Provincial Parliament, not because it was directed at me as a Presiding Officer but that it was highly unbecoming of a hon member of this House to refer to any member in such an insulting way. Hon member Ms Dijana, I order you to unconditionally withdraw the remarks and apologise to the House.

†UNksz T M DIJANA: Somlomo ndiza kuxolisa kodwa andikhumbuli ndisithi uyi-rubbish ndandithe “that’s rubbish” kukho umahluko phakathi ko-uyi-rubbish no-tha’t rubbish kodwa ndiyaxoli.

*Ms T M DIJANA: Madam Speaker, I will apologise but I do not remember saying you are rubbish, I said that is rubbish. There is a difference between you are rubbish and that is rubbish but I apologize.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Dijana I thank you for your apology. As I said I have consulted with the Language Unit and their interpretation as it was stated said “you are rubbish, you are rubbish”. I do however accept your apology, the House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 20:06.

