
TUESDAY, 18 MARCH 2014

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The House met at 14:15

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The SPEAKER: You may be seated. Order. I recognise the Chief Whip.

(Kennisgewing van voorstel)

Me A ROSSOUW: Mnr die Speaker, ek gee kennis dat ek sal voorstel:

Dat ondanks die bepalings van Reël 18, die sittingsure op Donderdag, 20 Maart 2014 en Maandag, 24 Maart 2014 soos volg is: 10:00 tot verdaging.

The SPEAKER: Any objection? No objection.

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: I recognise the Chief Whip.

(Notice of Motion)

Ms A ROSSOUW: Mr Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rules 198 and 203 and 204, Interpellations, Questions for oral reply and Questions to the Premier without notice will be dealt with on Tuesday, 25 March 2014.

The SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? No objections.

Agreed to.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

The SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the first order of the day.

1. Consideration of principle of *Western Cape Appropriation Bill* [B 3 - 2014]
(Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism).

The SPEAKER: I recognise the hon Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:
Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. It is an honour to start off, or kick off this principal or this policy discussion, this political debate on the budget that I tabled on 5 March. Just for this House, just to put into context, just so as to refresh your memories exactly what we are going to be talking about, we going to be talking about the Western Cape's R150 billion budget that is going to be spent over the next three years or the next medium term expenditure frame-work period and it sets out how we are going to use that budget to create more jobs, improve the quality of public health and education, reduce poverty and crime.

Of course that is the R150 billion or again in those budget books that every member has been given, the R48 billion for the next financial year and how we are going to be spending that on health and education. We are going to have a look at the discussion around the 52 grade R classrooms that we going to be delivering in the next year, the 23 new schools, the 11 replacement schools, the further planning for a further 11 schools, how we are going to continue the education outcomes in the province and how we are going to continue growing the retention rates. In other words keeping more of our young people in class, creating more and more opportunities through education, a better education for the young people of this province.

It will be about how we spend this money in upgrading emergency services and the medical services, creating much more space for wellness in our province, the upgrading of the emergency centre at the Tygerberg Hospital, the development of the

psychiatric units at the George Provincial Hospital and Mitchells Plain Hospital, the building of the new community health centres and the emergency services centres across our province, how we continue to improve on the health services specifically in our province for the people of our province.

Of course also the discussion around infrastructure and the infrastructure spent, the R14.48 billion that we are going to be spending in our province over the next three years, specifically probably talking about broadband and how that R1.3 billion is going to be spent and perhaps I should pause there while we are talking about broadband. This morning I was in Delft at the Hague Primary School where we actually launched the pilot projects for free Wi-Fi into four communities across our province. These projects are part of the broadband on how we actually make free Wi-Fi available and we use these projects to monitor the usage, to see the effect that it has on school children, to see the effect that it has on parents, on job seekers and on the economy of the region. It was very exciting being at that school today also at the same time having those successful bidders from the Southern Cape who are going to be rolling out the free Wi-Fi in George, the Robertson area, the Atlantis region and of course Delft where we were.

It was also really good to see when we were at the school where they took us into what was the computer room, where you had those square PC boxes that you see in so many school computer rooms and you saw rows of these computers in the primary school in Delft and they showed us this, but that is old technology and that has been around for a while. And then we walked across the library into the new section of the school where the new classroom is laid out with the smart boards and the tablets and

some children came in and started doing work on the tablets and each child has got their own email address and they mailed their work to themselves and they leave their work in the cloud. You really get excited when you see the kind of opportunities that this project is going to be delivering and opportunities for the future in our economy. It really is very very exciting.

We going to talk about the R4 million that we are going to be spending on internet services in our local libraries. We are going to talk about the R7.5 million on the E-Knowledge I-Can Centres. We are going to talk about the pilot centres which are going to open their doors in Elsies River later this year. We can also talk about the EPWP programmes with 94 424 job opportunities that are going to be created, the successful MOD Centres, 181 of them and what they are going to do and the differences that they going to make to the people of this province.

We can talk about in this debate, the next three years and the R330 million that is going to be spent on skills development, on creating more opportunities for the future of our people, for the future of economies in our region, for jobs, for SMME's and for entrepreneurs. We are going to talk about the Work and Skills Programme and how that is now going to be developed in helping, that we now we have a taxation system which allows people between 19 and 30 year olds within their companies to make application for a tax subsidy. We are going to talk about how we are going to try over the next three years to pull 100 000 young people into this space, really set some broad targets, some hairy targets that we want to go out there and reach and let us create jobs for 100 000.

Let us talk about the, Pay Project and that delivery, let us talk about the Artisan

Project and how we really need to create jobs in the artisan space and up-skill artisans. We can talk about how the money is going to be spent across our regions, how much money is going to be spent in the central Karoo, the R1.857 billion and what difference that is going to make to the people of the Karoo region. The R11.6 billion in the Eden region and how that is going to make a difference to people's lives in that region. The Overberg region and the R4.6 billion, the R18.2 billion in the Winelands region, the R7.094 billion in the West Coast, the difference that is going to make in people's lives and the service delivery in this province over the next three years.

What we can also talk about is how this plan is delivered upon and from the medium term budget policy statement when that was tabled in this House we started talking about the Metacog, how the Metacog actually shows the four quadrants of where we are going to be delivering within this province. How the R150 billion is going to be spent over the next three years in infrastructure, the green economy, agriculture, improving competitiveness, how that links to the PSO's 1,3, 6, 7 and 11.

Then we look at reducing poverty, crime and social ills, the differences we are going to make in that space; the regional socio-economic projects, how that is going to make a difference; the lessons we have learnt through the VPUU and what has happened through that R1 billion investment right into the heart of Khayelitsha and how that is making a difference in peoples' lives; how it is reducing crime rates, how it is creating an opportunity for growth, how it is creating an opportunity for people to open businesses and change their lives so you can go onto delivering on education and health or increasing employment and decreasing unemployment.

All of these projects are outlined within the Metacog, using the easy to see framework of how the money is going to be spent over the next while. Before I hand over to listen to the debate and to understand the input that is going to come from all the different political parties in this House and their political reaction to where we spending it and how we spending it; I will perhaps start off by just commenting on a few of the comments that are already out there and a few of the questions that have already been asked in the processes post delivering the budget. So let us have a look at some of the comments that have been made. The hon member Ms Beerwinkel makes a comment that says “Winde’s budget presented no new projects and was a missed opportunity”.

I want to come back to say that is specifically what this is about. [Interjection.] That is what the plan is about. That is how we spend the money. We gave a thing to this House called the medium-term budget policy statement. That is the intent of how we are going to be spending money over the next three years. It is not about saying it as some other of our legislators in our country do it, they say it at that level and then they divert from the plan and spend money on food parcels and on quick interactions prior to an election.

This is about putting a plan in place, putting a long-term plan in place and delivering on that plan and so if you go back to the medium-term budget policy statement and see what was said you will see now the budget follows on what we said in that plan and so we will continue with that plan, making the delivery possible. But of course we are open to hear what you want to say on that specific topic. How would you spend that R150 billion differently? Are you going to put an alternate budget on the table today

or are you going to say, should you be in power, this is how you would be spending that money?

Let us have a look at another comment that the hon member Ms Beerwinkel made. She said that the budget “was just more of the same old stuff, it was not pro-poor”. I will get to the pro-poor because it was mentioned by a few people in this space. Let us talk about another comment specifically by the hon member Ms Beerwinkel “daar was niks wat uitgespring het”. Exactly the same point. It is about a plan and about sticking to the plan. Perhaps moving onto another member of this House and a comment that was made by the hon member Mr Haskin. I see he is not here today but he made a strong point about where money was being made available specifically for gang violence [Interjections.] and specifically on this point I would very much like ...

The SPEAKER: Order. Order, hon members.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... to ask the opposition members of this House to join us in our calls to the South African Police Services to really bring back their specialist focus units so that we really get into touch with the exact problems, we focus on them and we start to tick those boxes one by one, start to eradicate these problems, one by one and so make that difference. We need your support in that space because obviously we have got to petition at a national level for that, but obviously the hon member Ms Beerwinkel, your party can actually do that for us and so hopefully we will hear a comment on that in this, in this debate today.

Now I shall go to a point that gets brought up quite regularly post a budget speech and it talks about delivery to the poor. It talks about the knee-jerk reaction which says this money is not going to the poor. So we had a quick look at that. Let us have a look at where spending on the poor happens in the Western Cape. Let us see how that money is spent. There is also a question around the social wage and where the money goes to. The hon member Mr Ozinsky raised this in the House during question time. How is this money spent? He started taking about whether you put in salaries or take out salaries. He started asking those kind of questions but where is the Western Cape [Interjection.] spend on social wage, considering the above? The Western Cape government has directed considerable financial resources to the social wage. Important to consider is the provincial treasury view that the following elements that make up social wage, namely; education, health, [Interjections.] human settlements, social services, cultural affairs and sport, the provision of public works and transport infrastructure and public transport services, skills development and community safety initiatives.

But perhaps I need to say one other thing. If we go and have a look at how that money is spent in those specific spaces what we did was we did an exercise where we took up programme one. We actually removed it from each of those budgets. So the administration had been excluded from health, from education, from human settlements and social development and of course cultural affairs and sports programme 3.2, library services, sport, recreation and school sport put into the programme. That is where it makes a difference to specifically people who are less advantaged in our province. Transport and public works includes programme two; public works infrastructure, the transport infrastructure and sub-programme 4.2 public

transport services, community safety, social crime prevention and promotion of safety, economic development, skills development and innovation. So, when you go through and you remove those programme 1's you put that whole budget together with that lens and you come up with a percentage of our budget of the total provincial budget that goes to this space. In 2014/15, 86,3% of the budget; in 2015/16, 87.2 and 2016/ 17, 86.9% of the budget goes into that space. But perhaps I can say another thing and maybe also just to add that it does not matter whether we are working it out that way or you ask national treasury, and this document here - the highlights of the national budget - and you have a look at how the national budget is spent. You will see on the social services space; education and related functions, health, social protection, housing and community amenities, employment, social security etc. The same measurements.

Then let us go and ask ourselves a question. Let us go back to the hon member Mr Ozinsky's question about the percentage spent on salaries and wages within a province and let us have a look at the percentages across the board, across all the provinces of this country and what that percentage is. Guess, Mr Speaker and hon members of this House, guess which province's percentage is the lowest in South Africa?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hear hear!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Let us just have a look. Limpopo at 64%, Mpumalanga at 58%, Gauteng at 53%, North West at 57%, KwaZulu-Natal at 58%, Free State at 59%, Northern Cape at 54%,

Eastern Cape at %65% and 52% in the Western Cape. So I sincerely hope that that starts to answer some of those questions that have been raised but perhaps what we need to do is before I sit down and wait for this debate, I need to bring up one or two other items. The next is to talk about infrastructure spend in this province and have a look at the difference over the last five years [Interjections.] on infrastructure spend and the difference that that is making in service delivery to the people of this province [Interjections.] So let us have a look at the spend on education, works, health education and general infrastructure [Interjections.] In 2009 went from ...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...
... actual spend of R1,026 billion and every single year climbed to R1,4 billion, R1,5 billion and R1,8 billion now. if you want to see what the graphs look like you will see the continual climbing out of the hole that we were in on infrastructure spend and whether it is on education, whether it is on general, on works, you will see the difference. On every single one of these indicators you will see how that infrastructure spend continues to increase and the team that delivers on that infrastructure spend is not being increased. We are putting it together with the same number of people and that is really what it is about. It is about getting better value. [Interjection.] The provincial team that is actually now delivering on these services are getting better and better and better.

Perhaps, Mr Speaker, again before I sit down I need to raise two more issues. The next issue is the Cape's R10 billion consulting bill and this is the Auditor General's

report that was tabled in this House not so long ago. Very interesting on the tabling of this report and the reaction. The first reaction came from the hon member Mr Uys who obviously did not read the report [Interjections.] and put out a big scathing press statement on what was happening within the DA government. He then read the report and I noticed he went very quiet.

An HON MEMBER: Typical!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I also noticed specifically a letter written to the press by the hon member Mr Magaxa. He writes a letter to the press about exactly the same article, this R10 billion and he says in this article which is quite ... I am not going to read the whole letter to you but he talks in this about the spending and the AG raising this issue and in this letter he raises a question, "it therefore cannot be ruled out that some of the R10.3 billion could have been rechanneled through these consultants to DA coffers".

Now I put this to the hon member Mr Magaxa who wrote this letter. Did he read the AG's report prior to writing this letter [Interjections.] because quite frankly [Interjection.], quite frankly [Interjection.] if he did read the report he would have known that that was primarily under the hon member Mr Uys [Interjections.] and under the hon member Mr Fransman when they held those offices and that is when those consultants [Interjections.] were appointed. [Interjections.] He will also note ...

The SPEAKER: Order, order hon members. Order, hon member Mr Uys. Hon Minister Botha, order. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...

Mr Speaker, thank you. He will also know that the changes that have been made since that report has been made have been phenomenal, absolutely phenomenal. The DA takes those AG reports very very seriously. We put plans in place and we turn these things around. For example, in excess of 30% vacancy within the nursing space [Interjection.] primarily filled by contractors as they say but in actual fact labour broking positions that were filled by your honourable colleagues, through labour brokers which you make a lot of noise about, [Interjection.] filled those positions. When we came into power we changed that and now you have got, depending on the section, between one and four per cent vacancy rate [Interjections.] We made the difference. [Interjections.] We made the difference ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order hon members.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...

Mr Speaker, that is not really the question [Interjection.] that we need to ask ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa order. Order, hon member, order.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:

Mr Speaker, that is not really the question we need to ask, the question we need to ask relates to this “it therefore cannot be ruled out that some of the R10.3 billion could have been rechanneled through consultants to DA coffers”.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Is that how the hon member's political party works? [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... He asks the question [Interjection.] "is that how the hon members political party works?"

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Is he going to be asking the hon member Mr Fransman and the hon member Mr Uys whether any of that happened when those contracts were ordered? I sincerely hope he does. I sincerely hope he goes to find out because it sounds like that is how he thinks things work [Interjection.] Perhaps what I also need to say to you [Interjection.] is the item that was raised by the hon member Mr Ozinsky and the other members; how much money gets spent on the poor [Interjection.] and we show you statistically how the money gets channelled towards making a difference specifically to the poorer people of this province [Interjection.]. There is another difference in the Western Cape ...

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...
Another big difference in the Western Cape is that there is not a whole lot of money that gets stolen on the way to that delivery [Interjection.] as happens in other provinces. [Interjections.] Then, Mr Speaker ...

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] spent on Nkandla.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:
Then, Mr Speaker I need to talk to one last point before we listen to the other members in this debate [Interjection.] and that is specifically an issue that was raised yesterday in Scopa and it goes to money that has been spent on infrastructure at the moment in our province. It was an issue that was raised at Scopa where a certain individual from the public raised an item around saying that he has not been paid for his services and brought [Interjection.] the item to Scopa. I am sorry that the hon member Mr Haskin is not here to hear what I have got to say and the members of Scopa rightfully removed this item from Scopa because it does not belong in Scopa. [Interjection.] But to give an answer and I hear the hon member Mr Ozinsky saying to us ‘why are you covering it up?’, the board [Interjection.], the board has sent a full presentation on all of the answers to Scopa ...

Mr M OZINSKY: It has not!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... it

has, it was sent yesterday.

Mr M OZINSKY: It never ... It could not because it was not asked any questions.

The SPEAKER: Honourable ...

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It was sent yesterday ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, hon members.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... to Scopa and Scopa [Interjection.] checked on that before the sitting today. [Interjection.] It was sent to Scopa yesterday.

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.] asked any questions.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: If the hon member Mr Ozinsky wants it I have got a copy of it. I can actually hand it to him in the House. The second thing is that this specific issue that was politically tried to be brought into Scopa [Interjection.] inserted into Scopa through no proper process or system ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Wow!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Let me go back one year where I personally was involved in this process. Now this person [Interjection.] has been ...

Mr M OZINSKY: Oh so you know about it.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Of course I know about it.

The SPEAKER: Hon member, hon member Mr Ozinsky order. Hon minister, order. Hon member Mr Ozinsky, your chance is coming. Please can we allow the minister to really express himself. Please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: This individual, this person has been to the city, has been to the public protector, has been to public works, has been to me. When this individual came to me which was in March 2013 and the report, this a report from legal services ... This report states during March 2013 when this individual came to us and asked a question on whether he should be paid for work being done. I said I am not sure, I cannot answer this question and I gave the full documentation to legal services. Legal services then says to us that in respect of the outstanding financial and other obligations allegedly due to the individual by the Western Cape government and after having provided this individual with opportunities to represent his case both orally and in writing, in other words legal services have met with him on a number of occasions and he provided in writing ... The allegation stems from a project which was initiated during the period

from 1992 ...

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...
to 1995 ...

An HON MEMBER: Eish!

Mr H P GEYER: Hello!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...
and this person was part of a project which was called Blochner Procon Architects and
Realtors and this was a programme that was initiated between themselves and
Naspers.

An HON MEMBER: Naspers.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It
then states that this individual was subsequently appointed by that organisation as a
specialist in respect of project work on certain parcels of land that was originally
owned by Naspers and the City and worked on the project in accordance with that
original mandate from that company that he consulted to. In 2003 Media 24
terminated the mandate as well as that of the associate consultants. In our view this
surely includes the consultant to that company. Upon becoming aware thereof SHL

wrote a cautionary notice but no other legal action was taken to enforce the project and its alleged rights. This was in 2003, in 2004 there was an engagement between this individual and the Western Cape government.

An HON MEMBER: Which government is this?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:
This, in 2004 ...

Mr M OZINSKY: That is the ANC government.

An HON MEMBER: Oh that is the ANC government ja.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:
Then in 2005 to co-ordinate and manage [Interjection.] certain land use and planning applications this appointment was a specific purpose and was accordingly remunerated however after completion of the aforementioned specific mandate in 2006, SHL continued to work on the project without having been appointed and without a clear mandate until 2009.

An HON MEMBER: Eish!

An HON MEMBER: Oh!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:

Until 2009.

Mr H P GEYER: What happened in 2009? [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: An election happened and there was [Interjection.] a change of government. Thank goodness.

Ms M TINGWE: Why are you running away? [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So legal services advice in this process was during September 2013 ...

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... and after due consideration of oral and written submissions, legal services informed him that it had failed to prove that there was a valid contract between it and the Western Cape government or [Inaudible.] or any other basis on which it may have any claim against the Western Cape government. Since that day we have not had any legal claim, any further action [Interjection.] and then the next thing a political action trying to subvert this into [Interjection.] the Scopa standing committee ...

An HON MEMBER: Now why are you running away again?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:
 Now we cannot allow Scopa [Interjection.] to be used in that way because if we did allow Scopa to be [Interjection.] used in that way ... Perhaps what we would do - I remember in my constituency having someone come and visit me and tell me that they were the originator of phones in cameras and would I please make sure that we put a ...

An HON MEMBER: To put cameras in phones.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... plan in place to get every single phone manufacturer to pay this person the commission that was owed to them. We cannot have these kind of things [Interjection.] just coming up in Scopa because if that was allowed then probably the next issue to be raised in Scopa would be Nkandla [Interjection.] because that probably would be a good thing to raise in Scopa. So, Mr Speaker, what I put to you is this issue did not belong in Scopa ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It belongs where?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... and that is why it was not allowed [Interjection.] to appear.

Ms L BROWN: You are running away.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: We

need to make sure that the rules are adhered to ...

Ms L BROWN: You are running away.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...
and I hear the hon leader of the opposition say 'running away'.

Ms L BROWN: You are running away.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:
Nothing and nobody ...

The SPEAKER: Order, order hon members, order. Hon member Ms Tingwe. order!

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible] come on man!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: All
the slides that were put together by the board of Convenco have already been
submitted to Scopa. It was done yesterday and so all the members [Interjection.]
should be receiving ...

An HON MEMBER: Only yesterday?

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member, order.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It is already in the domain of that standing committee so with that, Mr Speaker ...

An HON MEMBER: Phew!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I sincerely look forward to hearing from specifically the political parties on that side of the House on hearing about their alternate budget, how they [Interjection.] would spend money, [Interjection.] how they would spend this R150 billion.

Ms L BROWN: [Inaudible.] Do not tell us how [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I look forward to the policy discussion on where they think the policy short-falls are and where they would actually be making the difference. I look forward to that and of course will answer the debate at the end. Thank you very much.

Mr M OZINSKY: You know what [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] shocking [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

An HON MEMBER: Of course you can.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr von Brandis over to you. [Interjection.]

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Geagte Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Minister.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Inleidend wil ek net graag namens die Huis minister Alan Winde gelukwens met sy verjaarsdag. Mag hy nog lank vir the DA en sy gesin gespaar word.

An HON MEMBER: En vir Suid Afrika.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Speaking of claims and running away, Minister, did the ANC already pay their long outstanding account with the Convention Centre? [Laughter.]

Mr H P GEYER: Ja!

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Speaker, the Democratic Alliance is bullish about the Western Cape and the South African economic future [Interjection.] but the DA does not share this same optimism for the ANC's economic and fiscal policies or the entire national cabinet for that matter. South Africa is brimming [Interjection.] with potential but it is becoming increasingly difficult to leverage that potential in this current political climate. Austrian economist, Frederick Hayek, wrote in the 'Road to Serfdom' that we must create conditions favourable to progress rather than planning progress. Mr Speaker, this is important because Hayek's words remind us of the

perils of the increasing role of the state in the economy. As the DA we look at breaking down barriers to business, not putting them up. We have made this province more business friendly and supported the development of enterprises, unlike the ANC which believes it can solve everything through more law and more state involvement. The DA constantly has to stand up against the ANC led national government's determination to legislate this country into a prison of red tape and regulation.

An HON MEMBER: And create more [Inaudible.]

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: While plutocrats are handsomely rewarded the poor toil under the weight of the ANC's system of patronage. That is why ANC rallies and conferences like [Inaudible.] look more and more like exotic car shows than political gatherings. Speaker for all the ANC's rhetoric of the DA being anti-poor the true culprit is the ANC itself. They treat the poor as nothing more than fodder for votes [Interjection.]. When the ANC ...

An HON MEMBER: Hai, hai [Interjection.]

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: When the ANC goes into communities and is not given a glossy welcome they stick their tongues out and say we do not want your dirty votes. [Laughter.] [Interjections.] Last week ANC members and their body guards opened fire on protesters in this very same town [Interjection.] Mr Speaker, former ANC spokesman Smuts Ngonyama once said "I did not join the struggle to be poor" which begs the question is this the mentality we want to exist in the men and women who run this country's finances? [Interjection.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Are you poor? Are you poor?

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: But, Mr Speaker, the reality is ...

An HON MEMBER: Are you poor?

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: ... these cadres of entitlement exists, it is not the reason our public sector wage bill continues to rocket above inflation ...

Mr P UYS: You are wrong.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: ... or the reason government departments under ANC led government continue to report massive financial wastages. Is this not the reason that Limpopo is under national administration or that South Africa faces yet another possible credit rating down-grade this year?

Mr M SKWATSHA: You cannot stand those [Inaudible.]

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: On the matter of corruption South Africa's international rankings in clean [Interjection.] government continues to decline. In 2007 the year President Zuma became 'over lord' of the ANC [Interjection.] ...

The SPEAKER: Order. Order, hon members.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: ... Transparency International Corruption Perceptions Index [Interjections.] ranked South Africa 43 out of 179 countries. [Interjection.] In 2013 South Africa fell 72 out of 175. The greatest drop was 29 places from 2012 to 2013. South Africa now lags behind our fellow African states; Botswana ...

Mr M SKWATSHA: He is going to finish ...

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: ... Ghana, Lesotho, Namibia, Rwanda and Mauritius.

An HON MEMBER: Only in South Africa?

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Simply put, Mr Speaker, the ANC cannot be entrusted to run a clean and constitutional government [Interjection.] not nationally and not provincially. This province deserves a government that has high standards, a government committed to becoming the best run regional government in the world. It is a standard that this country was promised in 1994. Finance Minister Gordhan in his 2014 budget stated that President Zuma's administration has got a hospital pass because of the economic slow-down. I read this statement as being nothing but a slap in the face of everyday of South Africans. They were the first ones to feel the effects of this hospital pass, Vietnam, Peru and Turkey have all grown well above 4% in this same global economy from similar stages of development while South Africa has grown dismally at only 2%, Mr Speaker [Interjection.] The answer is elementary. It is because the national government sends mixed signals in economic policy and planning. Mr Speaker, the DA-led Western Cape is committed to a clean and caring government and this has been proven time and time again. It is a province whose

leadership is dedicated and passionate about their portfolios and their committees.

[Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: Where is the Premier?

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: The ANC calls this an anti-poor administration yet this government spends the bulk of its budget addressing the needs of the people who are economically immobile and socially destitute. Over the MTF period we will accelerate our vision of this province, we will continue to prove to South Africa that the DA government can deliver and show that what South Africa lacks is not potential but capable leadership. A budget under our administration will always be one that achieves maximum utility. We have made great progress as a province over the past five year. It is now up to us to build on this progress and Mr Speaker, we will. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Beerwinkel, over to you.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: †Enkosi. *Thank you. Mr Speaker, I rise to speak on behalf of the national ruling party to respond to the Western Cape budget.

An HON MEMBER: Not for long!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: This province contrary to what Premier Helen Zille and the Democratic Alliance with their secessionist attitude want voters to believe it is not a separate republic. It is part of South Africa and as such dependent on national

allocations. The hon member von Brandis has now just said that he cannot support national fiscal policies. Then why just yesterday did you accept the Dora and the allocations from the Dora to this province? [Interjection.] Because that is how you survive. So I will do it. Thank you, National, for funding that keeps this Western Cape going [Interjections.] and in this case, 95% of your budget comes up from equitable share and conditional grants ... [Interjections.]

Mr SPEAKER: Order. Order, hon members.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... without which this province would sink.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Whose money is it?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you too, National Government, for policies [Interjections.] that the DA implements and then wants to call them their own. For example; 'connecting millions of South Africans to water' is an ANC policy not a DA one [Interjection.]. But that is the story and history of the DA, copying from the ANC. The next thing we will hear is that the DA liberated South Africa ...

An HON MEMBER: If you do something right we will copy you.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... and that Premier Helen Zille led the charge to free all South Africans [Laughter]. If the Premier is so brilliant Speaker why is she not leading her party from the national assembly?

Ms M TINGWE: Yes!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Because there she will sit in the opposition bench as opposed to running the show from here. Mr Speaker, no matter how the DA spins it, the state of the province is a reason for concern. Let me summarise some of the things that Treasury says [Interjection.] on page 27 of the overview.

Mr SPEAKER: Hon Minister Carlisle.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: It says ...

Mr SPEAKER: Order, please.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... “significant in-roads have to be made in the provision of municipal services and the quality of life, quality of public health and education services to attain the requisite outcomes. It also addresses the housing back-log, the need to create jobs to eradicate poverty and there are many more. Translated, Mr Speaker, that means that the DA is failing. Now, let me highlight a few of the budget ...

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: [Inaudible.] steal!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: This budget [Interjection.] ...

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes, yes.

Ms L BROWN: You are saying that. Not us.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... is one [Interjection.] that perpetuates the divide between rich and poor. If you disagree ask most people the following. What do they know about broadband? Ask them how many in their family are employed. Ask them if there are libraries in their area to access this broadband via the internet. Ask if they have proper housing and sanitation ...

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: You could rather have given it to [Inaudible.].

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... if they have easy access to primary health care and if they are treated with dignity when they go these facilities [Interjection.], if their children go to school in safe environments, if they feel safe walking in the area where they live, if pre-school kids all have an opportunity to attend ECD. Ask them of what [Interjection.] use the thousands spent on the cycle lane in the centre of town means to them. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Ask rural communities if they see opportunities and development coming their way, ask those evicted families in Joe Slovo and Dunoon with young children whether this DA government is a caring government. By the way that action again was shown up by the High Court as an unconstitutional action. They seem to run this legislature as I previously said. But, Mr Speaker, the answer to most

of the above would be an emphatic no. Ask them what this concept of active citizenry means because we, us my colleagues here, right here in this House or in our committees are not even allowed to practice the right of what the word parliament stands for and that is to speak [Interjections.]. Thousands are spent on travelling and equipment [Interjection.] for supposed public participation only to get to the place and either be rushed by some impatient DA member or nobody turns up.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The whole front bench!

Mr SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister Carlisle.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: We have also noticed where this government's priorities are vested. The Western Cape says it will spend R153 billion over the next three years ... [Interjection.]

Ms L BROWN: Stop bullying now.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: [Inaudible.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... but wait. The Department's Premier will get R3.2 billion.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: [Inaudible.]

Mr SPEAKER: Hon Minister Carlisle. Hon Minister, order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... while the Department of Community Safety will receive only R702 million. The Department of Economic Development and Tourism which is a job creator is allocated a measly R1.4 billion and the Department of Local Government which is supposed to assist municipalities will only receive R599 million [Interjection.]. The Premier's department is not a service delivery department ...

An HONMEMBER: Why [Inaudible.].

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... so if she cared more about service delivery and less on paying consultants to stroke her ego then she would have fewer protests in Wale Street. Mr Speaker, in education the matric pass rate is not enough. [Interjection.] We need to see that every child who should be in school, is in school. Thousands of our young people have a dream of improving their lives but, Mr Speaker, there is a link between crime, poverty and other social ills. Education cannot thrive under these circumstances and MEC Albert Fritz and MEC Dan Plato have failed our communities in that regard. However, we are surprised that the Premier has not replaced them because their records are pathetic but MEC Plato you must be extremely angry about the fact that your PA is placed higher on the list than you.

An HONMEMBER: Yo!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Speaker, the agricultural sector is a job creator ...

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: What about your

[Inaudible.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... but what we do not hear is a commitment to educate farmers on human rights [Interjection.], humane working conditions and living conditions for workers [Interjection.], many are of whom can be likened to modern day slaves [Interjection.]. We compliment those farmers who are trying to improve the lives of their workers. Mr Speaker, to counter the Premier and some of these front benches normal attack, yes some of us do come from the national party [Interjection.] but we erased the anti ANC brain washing. Yet, Mr Speaker, the Premier's back bench and cabinet are majority ex NMP members. Surely it is a case of the pot calling the kettle black. [Interjection.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Speaker, the Premier needed those former NMP members to strengthen her position here.

An HONMEMBER: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: But now for most of them sitting at the back there, it is the end of the road.

An HONMEMBER: Yes.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: We wonder why the Premier is purging Afrikaners from her party [Interjection.]. All of them are gone, all their hard work gone.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: All these gone?

The SPEAKER: Order. Order, hon members.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The DA also went to recruit the mayor of Cape Town, a person [Interjections.] who once was a member of a party that shouted “one settler, one bullet.” [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Beerwinkel. Hon members! Hon members. Hon Minister Carlisle!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: They are taking my time. He is clever. He is taking my time. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela, hon member Mr Ozinsky, hon Minister Carlisle, order please. We cannot hear the hon member Ms Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The DA also went to recruit the Mayor of the City of Cape Town, a person who once was a member of a party that shouted ‘one settler, one bullet’. We wonder if during that time the Mayor would have eliminated the hon Premier, a woman who according to her then political beliefs was a settler. Now in their desperation for credibility, the DA wants to hijack Nelson Mandela’s legacy of struggle for liberation and justice [Interjection.]. They are delusional. [Interjections.] Nelson Mandela would never have joined the DA. [Interjections.] The Premier having been a journalist surely must know the saying “you can fool some people sometimes

but you cannot fool all the people all the time.” [Interjection.] Just as our people know... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: On a point of order, Mr Speaker. The hon Minister Carlisle has continuously commenting to hon member Ms Beerwinkel, not giving her an opportunity. Please, Mr Speaker, you must address that now seriously. He is not listening to you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Uys. I think both sides ... I am sitting with a problem but you may proceed hon member Ms Beerwinkel.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Mr Speaker, I want my time back please. Just as our people know who fought for and won their freedom they also know who really wants to give them a better life. [Interjection.] Sadly they also know who benefits from the DA policies. [Interjections.] Some of these members on the other side ...

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Carlisle. Hon Minister, I have requested you several times. Will you please slow down now. We cannot hear the hon member Ms Beerwinkel and if you continue to carry on hon Minister then I have to really ask you to leave this House. Can you please ...

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yes. Thank you. Mr Speaker, the egg dance that the DA is now doing because of the composition of the candidates list is a case in point. Also, how open is their open opportunity society ...

An HON MEMBER: Very open.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... if the Premier could not even step aside to give one of the larger population groups of this province an opportunity to stand as a Premier. Mr Speaker, our people also know our slogans and they know that the concept of together is how the ANC operates on Batho Pele principles. Incorporating [that word] into a DA slogan to sound like ours is a despicable act of political plagiarism.

An HON MEMBER: Whoa!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The Premier wearing a ridiculous looking blue Beret does not make her a revolutionary but only exposes her as a politician who borrows and steals ideals and symbols from others. [Interjections.] Mr Speaker, double speak ...

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] a green top.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... is another common trait of the DA. [Interjection.] The other day MEC Meyer spoke very disparagingly about the President and then paragraphs later he goes on his usual self gratification tirade by waving about and boasting an assessments document for 2012 and 12/13. Where did they get it? From the very President's office he just painted as incapable of doing his job. [Interjection.] What does that mean? ...

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Nkandla, obviously.

Mr M G E WILEY: It does not apply to [Inaudible.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: He said the Western Cape - I read it for your information. He said the Western Cape was the very best in every KPA. What he did not say was that they shared that podium with other provinces as well and they were alone in one of the KPA's but what he also did not say is that that evaluation was based on a self assessment first on 31 standards [Interjection.]. Can you trust these people?

HON MEMBERS: No.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Now, Mr Speaker, MEC Alan Winde, as much as he stood up there and made a noise now and carried on about what the ANC does, he by far is the hardest working MEC in that front bench over there ...

An HONMEMBER: Yo!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... but what is his reward? He gets number 13 on the DA list and the worst performer who is always in trouble, hon Minister Madikizela, is at number 5. [Interjections.] How fit for purpose is that? [Interjections.] Shame Alan, I feel for you [Interjections.]. Mr Speaker, we only have to look at the newspaper headlines to understand the level of racism prevalent in the DA. [Interjection.] We wonder if the Premier called the journalists of Sunday Independent and Weekend Argus who wrote those reports and castigated them as she normally does. [Interjection.] The Premier talks about press freedom but behind the scenes she actually twitter harasses reporters [Interjection.].

Mr Speaker, MEC Winde has conceded in his budget speech that the Western Cape is struggling to meet the demand for government housing. [Interjection.] We suggest that the Western Cape works closer with the National Department of Human Settlement or else you will again be embarrassed as you were in Paarl last week when National Human Settlements Minister, Connie September, lambasted you for calling a housing development 'Dromedaris' and for not acknowledging that national government had pumped almost R100 million into the project [Interjection.] By the way, naming any development Dromedaris eloquently speaks of the DA's history and where its head is at. We join Minister September in calling for a name change in this development and we also urge the Premier [Interjection.] to apologise for ...

The SPEAKER: Order, order.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... the insults to residents there. [Interjection.] Mr Speaker, the DA in this House is led by an angry woman. After hearing all of the above the Premier may want to become mean and sarcastic and personal in response as she normally does ...

An HON MEMBER: You were [Inaudible.] personal.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: ... but may I suggest, Mr Speaker, that the Premier takes a page out of the hon Lindiwe Mazibuko's book and emulate her dignified manner of dealing with issues in the National Assembly. We also see how coloured people are up in arms at how the DA has betrayed them. We are saying farm workers eyes have

opened and they will vote for the ANC. [Interjection.] People on the Cape Flats as well. Their eyes have opened too. We are confident that there will be a turnaround because together we will take South Africa forward. [Interjection.] I thank you. [Interjections.] Na na na na na!

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon member Mr Haskin? I cannot see the hon member Mr Haskin in the House. Order. We now recognise the hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Mr Speaker. The Western Cape government fosters an open-opportunity society for all. Our vision is to build a province within which every citizen has access to socio-economic opportunities to improve their lives. Working better together with communities, other spheres of government and key stakeholders through co-responsibility leads to the management and maintenance of a healthy natural environment, on which our socio-economic systems depend.

One way to understand what the DA has achieved is to assess a performance against what the ANC left the province with. The DA came into power in 2009 and could only then grasp the magnitude of problems that the ANC left this province with. In the last period under ANC government not one of the 30 municipalities obtained a clean audit. The DA run government achieved seven completely clean audits in the first financial year [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: What about the City of Cape Town?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: And presently the number of municipalities with clean audits is 11, and 17 got unqualified audits with findings. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Not even the City got a clean audit [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: Oh, come on!

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Speaker, die twee munisipaliteite wat swak audituitkomste het, is beide onder ANC-beheer. [Tussenwerpsels.]

This, Mr Speaker, in itself should be an indication of more effective, efficient and controlled management by the Democratic Alliance. [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: Jo!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: It is clear that the DA has put the necessary work in to improve the governance of our municipalities. It is clear that since 2009 the DA-run Western Cape has only moved forward. The forward planning that has taken place in the province is an indication that the DA strives to improve on the successes even more.

Mnr die Speaker, wat dienslewering betref in die verlede het ek in hierdie Huis berig dat in samewerking met ander belanghebbendes die ondersteuning wat ons aan munisipaliteite bied hulle in staat stel om konsekwent 99% van hulle infrastruktuurtoekenning te bestee. Ek is verheug om vandag aan te kondig dat vir die verslagdoeningstydperk eindigende einde Junie 2013 ons 100% van ons infrastruktuur bestee het. Die naaste provinsie daaraan is 94% en die agb lid me Beerwinkel kan dit ook nagaan. Dit beteken in die praktyk dat ons 205 projekte suksesvol afgehandel het in hierdie provinsie; projekte wat die lewens van mense elke dag raak. Ons het 42 rioolwerke, 34 paaie, 44 waterwerke en so kan ons aangaan, mnr die Speaker, afgehandel. Vergelyk dit met 'n ANC-provinsie soos Limpopo wat R 1.2 miljard nie bestee het nie, met ander woorde 400 projekte het nie plaasgevind wat dienslewering na hulle gemeenskap sou neem nie, danksy die ANC wat daardie provinsie beheer.

An HON MEMBER: What is new?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Speaker, wat betref basiese dienste in al die kategorieë is ons die nommer een provinsie volgens Sensus 2011, maar wat dit soveel meer ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

Ms M TINGWE: The porta-potty.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: van waarde maak vir ons is dat gedurende hierdie tydperk die bevolking met 1.3 miljoen mense toegeneem het. Ons het dus nie net

gegroeï met 1.3 miljoen mense nie, ons het ook van 2001 tot 2011 die toegang tot water van 98.3% tot 99.1% verhoog.

'n AGB LID: Mooi!

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ons het die toegang tot spoeltoilette van 88.5% tot 91.6% verhoog.

Ms M TINGWE: Where, the porta-potty ... [Inaudible.]

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Die toegang tot elektrisiteit het ons van 78.8% tot 93.4% verhoog, mnr die Speaker, 'n prestasie waarop enige regering trots sal wees. Onder die DA-regering het ons die laaste - het ons in tien jaar 'n water en sanitasie infrastruktuurplan vir alle munisipaliteite in die Wes-Kaap geïmplementeer. Die Blue Drop telling het van 60% in 2009 onder ANC-beheer tot 94.2% in 2012 onder DA-beheer gestyg.

'n AGB LID: Mooi! [Tussenwerpsels.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: In the past few years we have learnt valuable lessons from the CDW programme and we are very sensitive to the training needs and development needed for the CDWs. To enhance the training of the workers even

further we will be rolling out an extensive skills training programme over the next 16 months to further capacitate our CDW workers. The Department of Local Government, in partnership with Local Government Sectoral Education Authority as the funder, and the University of the Western Cape School of Governance have joined hands to aid the skills development of the CDW programme and municipal officials working in portfolios such as public participation, Thusong programmes, counsellor support and client services. I am very excited about the partnerships with the local government Seta who is funding the programme to the tune of R 4.2 million. The training will be accredited and offer participants performance-based certificates in communication, conflict management, public financial risk and supply chain management, social analysis and geographical mapping, and human and social science skills. I am pleased to share with you that through the CDW programme we have done a collection of education and information sessions to the amount of 1 300 formal sessions and many more informal sessions.

As regards the Thusong Centre Programme, in 2009/10 the Department of Local Government started to manage the mobile Thusong Programme, which further enhances the service delivery agenda to communities by this government. A total of 30 000 citizens has been reached through the service delivery mode in 2013/14. In the past 12 months we have reached 72 341 people through the Thusong outreach and have provided services to a further 1.2 million people through our Thusong Centres. The CDW programme makes an effort to ensure that our communities are literate and have economic prospects. The CDW programme makes a concerted effort to link youth to opportunities and bursaries for universities, EFT Colleges and learnerships. Mr Speaker, in Mitchells Plain alone the CDW assisted youth with 208 applications to

Northlink College and various learnerships from pharmacist assistants to fire-fighting.

Wat werkskepping betref, mnr die Speaker, blyk dit dat die gemeenskappe omliggend aan CapeNature wat natuurreservate bestuur, sosiaal ekonomiese voordele verkry deur die aanstelling van die uitgebreide openbare werke en voltydse ekwivalent om die kritieke bewaringsaktiwiteite uit te voer. Hierdie is 'n broodnodige inkomste vir die werklose jeug en vroue en verskaf menslike hulpbronne kapasiteit om te verseker dat CapeNature aan sy bewaringsbiodiversiteitsmandaat voldoen.

Gedurende die 2014/15-boekjaar sal 410 voltydse ekwivalente en 1357 uitgebreide openbare werke program werksgeleenthede realiseer en daar sal gefokus word op die bou van kapasiteit deur middel van opleiding, vaardighede en maatskaplike ontwikkelings. Mnr die Speaker, dit is daarop gemik om die verbetering van toekomstige geleenthede sowel as groter begrip vir aanpasbaarheid tot maatskaplike uitdagings vir die deelnemers te verseker. In samewerking met die provinsiale Departement van Gemeenskapsveiligheid se padveiligheidsbestuurseenheid, het 76 bestuurders deelgeneem aan die voertuigveiligheidsveldtog wat in November 2013 begin het. Hierdie vennootskap sal 100 voltydse ekwivalente met leerlingklasse in 2014/15 aanbied.

Die samewerking met die Suid-Afrikaanse Nasionale Kankervereniging, Suid-Afrikaanse Polisie diens en die TB / HIV Aids Care word 'n platform verskaf vir alle UOWP-begunstigdes om meer oor alkohol en dwelmmisbruik asook die gevreesde siekte te verstaan, te bestuur en te leer. Tot op datum is meer as R 1 miljoen bestee aan opleiding en maatskaplike ontwikkeling en het 'n paar van die OUWP-betrokkenes

permanente of verbeterde werkgeleenthede elders gevind, insluitend by CapeNature. Ons is seker dat 2014/15 meer van hierdie sukses sal bring vir bewaring asook die deelnemers aan hierdie projekte. 'n Totale beoogde begroting van R 22.2 miljoen is geormerk vir hierdie termyn.

Mr Speaker, for the past five years my department has done all the necessary planning and groundwork and we are busy with the implementation of all these plans. Regional and intergovernmental land-use and development planning will be pursued more proactively in order to address developmental needs and to ensure optimal outcomes as outlined within the national development plan as well as One Cape 2040. My department gazetted a draft Western Cape land-use planning goal 2013 which will promote spatial justice, spatial sustainability, efficiency, spatial resilience and land-use planning, and good administration across the province. This Bill affirms our vision to govern as an effective and efficient regional government. While the Bill is aligned with the vision of the national development plan in terms of quality spatial planning it will set a benchmark in terms of provincial planning law reform. As part of the implementation of the new planning systems in the province my department has developed a planning change management strategy, and a municipal support programme will be rolled out across the province.

Mnr die Speaker, as ons kyk na brandbestryding, is die werk wat ons departement daar gedoen het met rampbestuur ongelooflik, asook wat dit vir die gemeenskap daar buite beteken. Ongelukkig kom 'n mens dit net agter wanneer daar werklik 'n ramp is, maar dit is 'n baie bekwame eenheid wat gestig is in hierdie provinsie. Ek luister na die agb lid me Beerwinkel en ek hoor wat sy sê van ons vorige president, die agb Nelson

Mandela, maar sy moes gelees het wat 'n oudstryder soos Ronnie Casrills verlede week in die koerante gesê het, naamlik dat hy nie meer mense kan oorreed om vir Zuma se ANC te stem nie.

'n AGB LID: Trevor Manuel voel ook so.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dit is wat aangaan in die ANC. Verlede week in 'n radio-onderhoud het een van hulle prominente lede erken dat die verskeuring, die divisies binne die ANC maak dat hulle nie kan regeer nie. Daardie lede, almal wat gehelp het om korrupsie te bestry of te beveg in hierdie provinsie, word geskuif na nasionaal toe, en die mense wat toe hulle vingers in die kasregister gehad het, word teruggebring. Dit is hoe die ANC dink jy kan 'n Wes-Kaap regeer. [Tussenwerpsels.] Daarom, mnr die Speaker ... [Tussenwerpsels.] ... kan ons nie hierdie debat hê oor wie gee geld vir wie nie. Ons werk almal met belastingbetalers se geld en dit is die manier waarop ons die geld spandeer. Dit is die manier waarop ons interaksie het met ons mense op die grond wat sal veroorsaak of ons vir hulle dienste lewer en of ons hulle geld verkeerd aanwend. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Minister.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ek sê vir u baie dankie, mnr die Speaker.

'n AGB LID: Hoor, hoor!

'n AGB LID: Mooi!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Lentit, over to you. [Interjections.] Order! Order, hon members! Mr Lentit, over to you.

Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, the DA Western Cape's pro-poor programmes and proposals for the next MTF period will again benefit the poor people of the Western Cape.

Ms M TINGWE: Where man? What about the ID? [Inaudible.] Where is my brother? [Inaudible.]

Mr R B LENTIT: In her 2010 State of the Province address Premier Zille outlined ten strategic objectives for the Western Cape. The hon Premier also outlined how her cabinet and the Western Cape government intended to meet these objectives in her first term of office. Over the past four years these intentions became reality and the poor people of the Western Cape benefited.

Ms M TINGWE: Where?

Mr R B LENTIT: These strategic objectives also assisted members on both sides of the House in oversight standing committees by raising critical concerns, and the pro-poor budget Minister Winde tabled will continue guiding members in their oversight roles.

Ms M TINGWE: You should then come back my friend.

Mr R B LENTIT: Whether constructive criticism from the DA members or out of context criticism by the ANC in opposition, we contributed to help the DA build and open opportunity society for all the people of the Western Cape.

Ms M TINGWE: Where?

Mr R B LENTIT: I salute the DA-led provincial government for putting action behind the vision and promises of its 2009 election manifesto and for taking the plight of the poor people seriously.

Ms M TINGWE: Where my brother?

Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, the Western Cape government's good stories will continue by building on the sustainable proposals and programmes initiated and implemented over four financial years. Just under 80% of the Western Cape provincial budget is directed towards creating opportunities through health, services, education, housing and social development programmes. This is how poor people in poor communities benefit from a government under DA control. Mr Speaker, it is common knowledge year after year that the ANC vote against nearly all the key pro-poor departmental budgets. The ANC in the Western Cape continue to reject pro-poor budgets despite President Zuma's call to adopt a pro-poor approach in all his State of the Nation addresses. This is an indication that the ANC caucus of Marius Fransman

does not share the vision of their own leader to better the lives of the poor people in the Western Cape, and they will stop at nothing to score political points, even if it is at the expense of the poor people who have elected them. Mr Speaker, the ANC is predictable, but I hope they will prove me wrong ... [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: I do my ... [Inaudible.]

Mr R B LENTIT: ... by not voting against departmental budgets that are intended to reduce the burden of disease in the Western Cape ... [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: Don't worry. [Inaudible.] ... tomorrow. [Interjections.]

Mr R B LENTIT: ... and a budget that provides housing opportunities for those who are nearly 30 years on the waiting list [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Where is the application? [Interjections.]

Mr R B LENTIT: I hope they are not going to vote against a budget ... [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: Don't worry! [Interjections.]

Mr R B LENTIT: ... to create jobs to lower the unemployment rate in our province.

Ms M TINGWE: Moenie 'worry' nie!

Mr R B LENTIT: I hope they are not going to vote against a budget to improve the quality of education in our province. In 2009, Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: Yes! [Interjections.]

Mr R B LENTIT: ... the people of the Western Cape voted for an alternative and this coming election the people of the Western Cape will vote for continuity.

Ms M TINGWE: Uh-uh, they are tired of you now.

Mr R B LENTIT: Mr Speaker, if the ANC of Marius Fransman continues to vote against pro-poor initiatives the few loyal ANC supporters and the ... [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: It is a pity you are not in ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

Mr R B LENTIT: ... poor people of the Western Cape will continue to reduce them to size at the ballot box on the 7th of May.

'n AGB LID: Mooi! [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mr R B LENTIT: There is a saying that goes: “Be careful for what you wish”, but the people of the Western Cape certainly don’t wish the ANC back in government. I thank you. [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: It is a pity you are not in again, shame! [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, order. Hon member Ms Tingwe, over to you.

†uNkz M TINGWE: Enkosi Somlomo. Mphathiswa Alan Winde * Thank you, Mr Speaker. Minister, Alan Winde, †do not disappoint me. You know I hold you in high regard.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:
Since when, since when ... [Inaudible.]

Ms M TINGWE: You know education and health are national policy imperatives so you have to spend on those areas. The question remains: where do you spend the money if not on national policy imperatives? After five years, Mr Speaker, of DA misrule in the Western Cape Province it is safe to say the weakest link in this executive council backed by the absent hon Premier Helen Zille is without doubt ...
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Where is your president?

Ms M TINGWE: ... the hon Education MEC Donald Grant.

Ms L BROWN: Sitting behind you!

Ms M TINGWE: He is the joke of the people in the street. He still does not understand his own policy even after he had to quickly read it up when he was appointed five

years ago. He is always ready to run away and not even a fence can hold him back as he does his high jump in a suit. [Interjections.] His term is marked by the arbitrary closure of poor schools [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: That is a compliment!

Ms M TINGWE: For the children of workers and farm dwellers ... [Interjections.] Once again we hear the MEC advocating the closure of all small schools in rural areas. [Interjections.] Don't worry my friend hon member Mr Lentit, I am coming to you. We saw many cases of a lack of learning material like books, resources like libraries and laboratories as well as critical teachers even for Matric candidates, and then the DA wants those learners to compete on equal footing with those from elite schools in the leafy green areas. He still brought tit-tat ... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Where do your children go to school?

Ms M TINGWE: ... and kept in this critical position ... [Interjections.] Don't worry, he is at Oakhurst. [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: Leafy green area.

Ms M TINGWE: [Inaudible.] I can afford, hey?

Mr R B LENTIT: Yes.

Ms M TINGWE: He is retained in this critical position to oversee one of the largest budgets in the province. Let us look at the realities in this province where not enough money is diverted to address the inequalities in education. How can the DA then talk cheaply of an equal opportunity society for all? The message is clear, Mr Speaker, this government is happy with the inferior schooling in poor areas.

An HON MEMBER: Oh, come on.

Ms M TINGWE: It is all part of its war on the poor. There are still schools struggling without teachers, even for Grade 12 ahead of their last school exams. It is even more alarming that ... [Inaudible.] ... schools still have vacancies for maths educators in township schools, in my constituency to be precise, and this is the province that preaches an equal opportunity society for all. Schools for the disabled are also a source of real concern. Not enough is done and provided for. Special needs schools like those for disabled in poor townships, like Nompumelelo and Notalo School of Autism. They struggle with the resources and you want to call them - you want them to ... [Inaudible.] ... be taught by a school of disabled. How can these children compete in the mainstream of the open opportunity society the DA so passionately advocates?

'n AGB LID: Nee man!

Ms M TINGWE: Not enough is budgeted to wipe out the infrastructure backlog. Money is reduced. This happens as the rich elite schools build indoor sport centres and spend millions of rands on outdoor and all-weather sport facilities, while the poor

schools have none.

Mr M G E WILEY: It is paid for by the parents.

Ms M TINGWE: The main focus is to build new schools, but the growing needs of many existing schools are ignored, as you once advocated, hon member Mr Wiley. How can these children believe in the DA utopia of an open opportunity society for all? This government, the MEC and its supporters are opposed to transformation and change. They want to preserve their apartheid gains and privilege. This is seen in the fact that in most rural towns there is still apartheid style segregation in schools. Within walking distance from another there are two schools using the same language of instruction, syllabus NTS. One is under-resourced and overcrowded in a poor area and the other with unused facilities and too much unused room. The one is mostly black or coloured and the other called a former Model C, but very white. One such case is in Villiersdorp where the MEC frequently make use of the De Villiers Graaff facilities but ignores the primary school on the other side. Then those former Model C schools use all sorts of gate-keeping including language, area, culture and religion to keep people of colour to a bare minimum, if allowed at all. In the meantime some learners are not yet placed in schools as we speak today for various reasons. Some cannot go to school due to unsafe conditions and drug wars. There are those left behind because of the uncontrolled learner transport system that fails them, and then there are still those unplaced learners.

How can these children compete in the DA's open opportunity society for some? It is time for change. Change this MEC, hon Premier, and change this government.

[Interjections.]

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: So you agree we are going to ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: Vote ANC to take South Africa and take this province forward. Spend money where it is needed most: school libraries, computer and science labs. I thank you, Mr Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Bevu, over to you.

Ms T N BEVU: Thank you, Mr Speaker. We are made to believe that this budget seeks to protect and support our most poor, most vulnerable, the elderly and people with disabilities and that it seeks to build bridges to better opportunities for all. As far as providing programmes for unemployed graduates this might be true, I don't know, and we commend the Western Cape provincial government for different initiatives they run in the province like the work and skill programme, but what about those who have fallen along the road, the so called "lost generation"? Is the nationally based EPWP enough for them?

The Western Cape provincial government could develop a programme that runs in conjunction with EPWP focusing on training and skills transfer so as to make EPWP more sustainable. The WCPG is promising pilot projects of youth cafes. This is a good thing, but coming from the DA government, you are aware of it. We are still sitting with promises of access to fast internet infrastructure development and skills training programmes for Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha that were promised as far back as

2009. What has happened to those promises? Indications are that the bulk of the R 1.3 billion money has been spent on fruitless consultations with the so-called experts. When the Auditor General questions and finds fault with the Western Cape provincial government's use of consultants, what does the Premier do? She questions the AG's integrity, engages in character assassination of the AG and the whole process by questioning even the definition of what the AG classifies as "consultants". Meantime she has no problem with the AG's definition when directed to national government or provinces the DA is not in charge of. She does that all the time.

With the HRSC, when questioned about the lack of progress in the racial quotas of the Western Cape in the employment equity report, when it questioned Western Cape's commitment to righting the wrongs of the past, both in public and private business, the Premier undermines the institutions of our democratic governance by trying to assassinate their characters, questioning their motives when they differ with her. It is extremely disconcerting and boring to think she is always right, they are wrong. There I say it is also a symptom of mental instability.

An HON MEMBER: It was not ... [Inaudible.]

Ms T N BEVU: We are concerned with the DA's cherry-picking use of Census 2011 when it favours them like in the issue of migration of people from the Eastern Cape to Gauteng, followed by the Western Cape. Africa Check recently took the Premier's spokesperson Zak Mbele on about the DA's statistics claim, something we have consistently raised in this House. MEC Winde also makes use of these DA bogus statistics in his budget speech by saying that the Western Cape Provincial government

created 60 000 work opportunities in the second half of 2012/2013 and 31 000 job opportunities, that 99.1% of households have access to piped water, 93.4% have access to electricity, 96.9% have access to toilet facilities, that Cape Town delivers more to the poor than any other city, that R 11 billion of the R 18 billion spent on service delivery in Cape Town was spent on the poor, and so on and so on. Ask the DA as Africa Check has done, where these figures are sourced so as to determine if they are correct. You will not get a clear answer. You will be left with a conclusion that it is made up as they go. Even where the stats are true, you discover it was so even before 2009 [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Stats SA ... [Inaudible.]

Ms T N BEVU: So the DA has not much claim to the delivery of services liked piped water and toilets. For instance, according to Stats SA's annual general household survey, 92.7 of Western Cape households had access to piped water in a house or yard in 2006, and that has now dropped to 92.5% since the DA took over.

Mr H P GEYER: Oh, come on, come on. [Inaudible.]

Ms T N BEVU: This significant drop in service delivery is more pronounced in human settlements since the DA came to power, as MEC Winde admitted they are struggling to keep up with the provincial housing needs. What he does not say is that this failure is not because of some unforeseen circumstances but intentional on the part of the DA who are fundamentally against giving our people free houses. If people cannot afford to buy houses the DA say they must stay in shacks or remain in the Eastern Cape and

not come here to be refugees - as we know that is the Premier's terminology, not mine.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] ... said that.

Ms T N BEVU: MEC Winde spoke in length about the EDP.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Who said that?

Ms T N BEVU: The truth is the MEC is not honest with all of us. If he is honest with all of us, it is not inclusive. It is not inclusive.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Are you saying ...
[Inaudible.]

Ms T N BEVU: It is not inclusive. [Interjections.]

Mr H P GEYER: Jy is deurmekaar.

Ms T N BEVU: It does not include people from all walks of communities in the Western Cape. It is just another white man's business club with an occasional foreign educated black face who has been coached to speak DA language and has no idea what is happening on the ground of our province. [Interjections.] Most disappointing is seeing that after all that talk about looking to Africa for new ventures nothing concrete has materialised, and this is mostly Wesgro's failure. Wesgro will as usual

use the R 225 million allocated to them to organise holiday travel for their managerial staff in the name of lobbying of ... [Inaudible.] ... countries. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Ms Bevu.

Ms T N BEVU: They refuse to change their focus to keep up with the times and prefers to be just another white man's club [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Bevu, order.

Ms T N BEVU: Hankering to be part of Anglo American ... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Ms Bevu. Hon member Mr Geyer, over to you.

Mr H P GEYER: Mr Speaker, I am not speaking to figures today. I am addressing performance, for performance is money; money either well spent or wasted and/or stolen.

We have virtually reached the end of our five year term of office of a DA controlled province. This province has taken the lead and has shown by example how a province should be governed, governed professionally with devoted officials and a cabinet of honourable and able ministers. Yes, Mr Speaker, fit for purpose and working better together ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Where? Where?

Mr H P GEYER: ... to ensure progress and economic growth. Hon members, Mr Speaker. soos die koerant sê: “Nie alle agbare ANC-kandidate is ewe agbaar nie.” Daarop pryk die name van bedrieërs, korruptes en mense wat hoegenaamd nie vir ’n openbare pos geskik is nie. ’n Vis vrot van sy kop af. Eerste op die nasionale lys is die einste Zuma. Dan is daar Dina Pule, Humphrey Mmemezi, Pule Mabe en John Block en andere. [Tussenwerpsels.]

In contrast to this the Western Cape provincial government has set a standard and it made a statement: no corruption in serving the people. Let me focus on a few core functions in the Department of Agriculture. The Department of Agriculture is providing an engineering support service to enhance sustainable farming practices such as conservation, aquaculture, to prevent pollution and to increase water-use efficiency of all irrigation farmers. Yes, Mr Speaker, unlike the ongoing pollution of mine water onto farmland and wetlands in Gauteng, as well as the contamination of drinking water in towns such as Carolina, agriculture in this province is promoting Agri BEE to ensure full participation of new entrepreneurs in the entire value chain and the uptake of new opportunities by established ones as well as providing marketing and Agri business, and support services to enhance competitiveness in the agriculture and Agri business sector.

The department facilitates and provides structured and accredited agricultural education and training in line with the agricultural education and training strategy to all participants in the agricultural sector in order to establish a knowledgeable, prosperous and competitive sector. Good work is also being done to facilitate

farmworker development through partnerships, funding and implementation of specific projects in farmworker communities. These, Mr Speaker, are only a few of at least 21 main services and core functions that are taking place.

Toepassing van hierdie funksies sal verseker dat landbou in die Wes-Kaap gesond bly en bloei soos vir groei, nie bloei soos vir doodgaan soos wat ons in Mpumalanga beleef het nie. 'n R 24 miljoen arbeiplaas was binne twee jaar tot niet. Die kantoorgeboue is murasies en die houtpale wat die skadunet gedra het, is afgesaag vir vuurmaakhout. Meer as 500 telefoonpaallengtes is afgesaag vir vuurmaakhout. Maar laat ek liewer terugkom na die groei en die bloei - that is the bloom - van die Wes-Kaap en na die onlangse toekennings van die departement verwys. Ten opsigte hiervan het hul drie toekennings gekry: Highest score achieved in the Western Cape. The second one: the score is the highest obtained by a department in 12 years; en dan derdens: the most consistent highest score over the past three years. Three times in a row overall winner!

That, Mr Speaker, is the difference between a well-governed province and the other provinces in South Africa. In this province knowledge transfer is important and therefore training takes place with prospective and current agriculturists, farmers and farm workers in the agricultural industry to promote career opportunity in agriculture. In this province a competitive and appropriate farmer support service is delivered with emphasis on the emerging farming sector on a geographically determined basis. Yes, Mr Speaker, far better than the strawberry fiasco I previously referred to.

Mr Speaker, in accordance with the National Development Plan it is the requirement

to underpin the strategy of developing partnerships with industries. For this reason the department will continue with the implementation of the commodity approach toward farmer support in the Western Cape. This partnership seeks to ensure that smallholder farmers gain access to mentorship support from commercial farmers, as well as access to existing market networks.

Another key innovation in the NDP is appropriate technology for agricultural producers. The department will support farmers in the province with innovative and problem solving research and development initiatives. With regard to the farmer settlement and development programme 114 farm plans will be completed to support sustainable land reform, land reform which has a success rate in this province of 62% compared with the 2% of the state. This is in stark contrast with what is happening elsewhere in other provinces.

Let me read to you: “Lack of funds forced farm closure.” One of the biggest citrus farms in Limpopo has collapsed due to lack of funds. More than 200 workers at Limburg Farm outside Mokopane have not received their salaries for the last four months. [Interjections.] ... 25 000 hectares granted by the Limpopo Agricultural Department through a land restitutional deal. This is how the ANC runs provinces. There is no expertise, nor support, if any support. Is that caring for the poor, which I have heard from the other side? Francinah Seloï has been working on that farm since 2001. She is a single parent with four children and she lives on handouts. She says: “We survive by asking for mealie meal.”

Back to the Western Cape, Mr Speaker. Land care projects of over R 4 million will

address job creation through the clearing of alien invasive plants, thereby protecting our water resources.

An HON MEMBER: Coming from national.

Mr H P GEYER: Then there is capacity building and creating awareness of the importance of sustainable natural resources management in the province. [Interjections.] Through these projects some 25 000 person days of work will be created by removing alien invasive vegetation and alleviating poverty. More than 6000 school children will be trained in land care principles and practices during two-and-a-half-day camps in the various districts. That is part of the good news story in the Western Cape, Mr Speaker.

Dr Sampie Terblanche skryf dat die ANC-regering Suid-Afrika oor die volgende 20 jaar op 'n glybaan na 'n mislukte staat sal plaas. Een van sy vyf redes is, en ek haal hom aan:

“As die Zumafisering van die staatsektor nog vyf jaar duur, sal die tradisie van beloning sonder bestraffing so diep in die staatsektor ingeburger raak dat dienslewering hopeloos ontoereikend sal word. Na nog vyf jaar van Zumafisering sal die staatsektor in so 'n mate in chaos gedompel wees dat President Jacob Zuma se opvolgers die siek tradisie nie ongedaan sal kan maak nie. Die staatsektor sal dan in 'n groef wees wat ook die private sektor sal lam lê...”

Kom ons vertrou dat hierdie ANC ontsetel gaan word voordat hierdie mooi land van ons 'n verdere inploffing beleef. Ek dank u.

'n AGB LID: Mooi. Mooi!

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Hartnick, over to you.

Ms J L HARTNICK: Mr Speaker, the DA is pleased that a large sum of the Western Cape budget is allocated to youth development programmes in the province. Positive youth development programmes enable youth to take responsibility for positive lifestyles and afford them the opportunity to contribute through skills development, behaviour modification, recreation and to participate in family and community activities as well as their own mental health and emotional wellbeing. Any financial aid appropriated to youth development programmes is essential for redressing the vast range of social ills our youth are faced with.

Mr Speaker, what sets the current Western Cape government apart from any other provincial government and the previous administration under the ANC is that the DA deliver on plans set out in the budget. We do not simply pay lip service to the public. In this way funds are not misappropriated for the personal gain of corrupt, extravagant public officials as many other provinces are accustomed to. I commend Minister Alan Winde and his department for allocating funds towards the youth development strategy which aims to assist young people in developing the tools they need to have the best opportunities for success, but also acknowledges the youth's responsibility to take advantage of these opportunities and create lives they can value to rise above

their often destitute circumstances.

In the near future the Western Cape government plans to open nine youth cafes in Athlone, Mitchells Plain, Khayelitsha, Atlantis and Bredasdorp as part of a pilot project. These centres provide our youth with safe places in which they can access opportunities, unleash their potential, channel their energy and receive mentoring. In addition the youth work programme will provide jobs for 1400 unemployed youths through these initiatives. More of our young people will be given the tools they need to play a meaningful role in the Western Cape's economic growth. Also depicting the good story of the Western Cape as its success speaks for itself, is the Premier's advancement of youth project to remind the ANC in this province about the Western Cape's good story and to lead the other provinces by example. The pay project has already provided 1476 matriculants on-the-job training in government departments for a year. Mr Speaker, the DA opened these spaces of opportunity for the youth of the Western Cape while the youth in other provinces are still bearing the brunt and missing out on opportunities as the ANC remain undecided on the youth wage subsidy.

Ms M TINGWE: I love your colour ... [Inaudible.]

Ms J L HARTNICK: Mr Speaker, over the last five years under the DA the Western Cape government spent nearly R 1.7 billion on skills development programmes providing real training opportunities to 98 000 individuals. Can the ANC say they have delivered services and opened opportunities of this calibre ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No!

Ms J L HARTNICK: ... to the people of the Western Cape pre-2009? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No.

Ms J L HARTNICK: Can the other provinces attest to such delivery? Mr Speaker, it is strongly unlikely. Another chapter of the good story of the Western Cape is that of the Western Cape Education Department. As much as the ANC hates to admit it, yet cannot by virtue of facts deny that under the DA the Western Cape Education Department has made significant strides in the province. During the period 2004 to 2009 the Western Cape government under the ANC built 36 schools. In the same period of five years from 2009 to 2014 the Western Cape government under the DA has built and completed 49 schools with four new schools and 17 replacements under construction in 2014. Mr Speaker, 70 schools in the space of five years.

'n AGB LID: Mooi!

Ms J L HARTNICK: Mr Speaker, in support of the Western Cape Education Department's vision to create opportunity for all through improved education outcomes, namely improving language and mathematics in primary schools, improving the number of quality passes in the national senior certificate and reducing the number of underperforming schools, and even adhering to hon member Ms Tingwe's request to move her daughter from Pinelands to Oakhurst ...

'n AGB LID: Mooi!

Ms J L HARTNICK: ... the DA welcomes the R 16.5 billion allocated to the Western Cape Education Department and the budget for the Western Cape as a whole. I thank you.

Ms M TINGWE: Viva Jenny. I love your callous manner. [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Nice speech, Jenny.

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon member Mr Ozinsky, over to you.

Mr M OZINSKY: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I would like to suggest the hon member Ms Hartnick go and read the census figures, because the census figures show very clearly that when the DA took over the high level of service delivery in this province was already there. That says one simple thing, namely that the DA government had nothing to do with the level of service delivery. [Interjections.] They found the high level and in crucial areas ... [Interjections.] ... like housing delivery. In fact, service delivery has gone down over the ten year period rather than up. [Interjections.]

They like to crow about things that they cannot claim as their own and they know it. [Interjections.] If they don't know, Dr Stegman should be telling them this.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The voters will tell us.

Mr M OZINSKY: It is the same when the hon Minister Winde comes to the House and

says that 80% of the budget is spent on the poor.

Ms M TINGWE: Yes.

Mr M OZINSKY: I raise one simple issue. Excuse me, 55% of the budget is spent on salaries and there is no civil servant in this province who is poor. Then he comes today ... [Interjections.]

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Are you poor?

Mr M OZINSKY: And that is an obvious fact. That is why he can't answer it.

Ms M TINGWE: Yes, he is. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: It is an obvious fact. [Interjections.] You can't spend 80% on the poor when you are spending 55% on civil servants. [Interjections.]

Mr H P GEYER: For the services.

Mr M OZINSKY: It is impossible. [Interjections.] He comes here today. He doesn't say about spending on the poor. He has now changed his line. Now he is talking about the social wage, but he never spoke about the social wage when he said 80% spending on the poor. He comes and changes the statistics and the issue involved because he has lost the debate.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Go back to school!

Mr M OZINSKY: Then he comes with a whole lot of statistics here. [Interjections.]

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Go back to school!

Mr M OZINSKY: The basic fact is that 90% of his budget comes from national, a very large percentage of that is on conditional grants. There is no political decision he has made about spending on the poor. Those are things that are forced on them by the national budgeting process brought in by the ANC. [Interjections.] On the very small amount of money over which he has discretion you should be very worried where he spends that money. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mnr H P GEYER: Waar het jy skoolgegaan?

Mr M OZINSKY: Let me give you one area where you could spend a lot more money. It is on internal audit. Every HOD has written to him asking him to increase the amount in the budget for internal audit and everyone has been turned down. That is what the DA thinks about fighting corruption.

An HON MEMBER: Oh, come on!

Mr M OZINSKY: You see, the DA fighting corruption is a political joke.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: We don't have corruption.

Mr M OZINSKY: It is something that they want to haul out when it is elections.

An HON MEMBER: We don't have corruption.

Mr M OZINSKY: When we deal with their own corruption they want to hide it desperately during the elections [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Where? Where?

Mr M OZINSKY: I am glad the hon Minister Carlisle is interjecting and saying we don't have corruption because he knows they have corruption. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Oh, come on!

Mr M OZINSKY: He is just good at covering it up. [Interjections.] For instance, Carlisle told the House many times that there was R 500 million initially of corruption in his department under the ANC. [Interjections.] Then he changed it to R 200 million. [Interjections.] The latest thing the department says is that they wrote off about R 130 million.

An HON MEMBER: It is now one rand!

Mr M OZINSKY: The really important point about this is to look at the action he took on all that corruption, hundreds of millions of rands. His department tells Scopa that the disciplinary procedures for all these hundreds of millions of rands, all taken by the hon Minister Carlisle, are two cautionary letters, two warning letters, ten no-steps taken, six not applicable. [Interjections.] So in respect of the hundreds of millions of rands corruption he found the action he took was that he gave two written warnings ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: What about the ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: ... and two warning letters. [Interjections.] Does that give you confidence that he is dealing with corruption in his department; two warning letters and two written warnings?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: What about the ... [Inaudible.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Not one person was fired for hundreds of millions of rands corruption ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members!

Mr M OZINSKY: What kind of fight against corruption is this? He had five years to do it and he did not take any action against anyone, two warning letters and two

written warnings. [Interjections.] You see ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Five years.

Ms M TINGWE: Yo, in five years.

Mr M OZINSKY: You see, the corruption fighter likes to cover up corruption and this is what he did yesterday. The hon Carlisle for the last two years has been desperately trying to get Scopa not to discuss the issue of the Convention Centre ... [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: Yes.

Mr H P GEYER: Oh, come on! [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: because it is just before the election and he is terrified of the damage it will do to the election campaign.

Mr H P GEYER: What damage?

Mr M OZINSKY: So the honourable Minister Carlisle writes to the chairperson of Scopa and says: "On the Convention Centre issue neither I, nor my staff, have knowledge of the details of this complaint, nor the outcome of the engagement with the City Council and the Public Protector." [Interjections.] Let me repeat: "Neither I nor my staff have knowledge of the details of this complaint." But this is not what the hon Carlisle told the House last year about this very same matter.

Ms M TINGWE: Jo!

Mr M OZINSKY: He tells the Scopa chairperson he doesn't know about it, but he tells the House that in fact the Public Protector enquired into this and published her findings to say that the price of the land was perfectly in order. This is the same Carlisle who said he did not know the outcome of the engagement with the Public Protector, but he told the House of the outcome of the engagement with the Public Protector. [Interjections.] That is something which shows you what he is trying to cover up. On the same day, the 4th of December last year, the Carlisle who knows nothing about the outcome says ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon Carlisle.

An HON MEMBER: No way.

Mr M OZINSKY: In regard to the suggestion problem of the appointment ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Ozinsky, please take your seat.

'n AGB LID: Sit, man.

An HON MEMBER: Sit!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Surely, Mr Speaker, he should have referred to me as the hon Carlisle who knows nothing. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: You see, Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Carlisle, I will provide hon member Mr Ozinsky ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: The hon Carlisle who knows nothing also told the House that in regard to the suggested - note "suggested" - problem of the appointment of architects, the architects drew up their own brief for a tender and they won the tender.

An HON MEMBER: Yeah, yeah.

Mr M OZINSKY: This is an architecture firm, one of whose partners is the life partner of the former CEO of the Convention Centre who is currently a board member of the Convention Centre representing another company. [Interjections.] This is a clear case of corruption that took place. In regard to that ... [Interjections.] ... to the suggested problem of the appointment of the architects there has been a forensic audit into that. The key point of the forensic audit is that there is no suggestion of corruption or favouritism or anything of this nature. There is nothing to be ashamed of in there. It is so that there are certain irregularities. Having dissed the whole thing he now says there were irregularities. [Interjections.] By the way, he writes to the chairperson of Scopa and says he knows nothing about any of these things, but he told the House he commissioned the forensic audit. [Interjections.] He says there are certain

irregularities ... [Interjections.]

Mr H P GEYER: I would like to see that ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: But those are not dishonest irregularities and certainly do not constitute grounds for trying to cancel the procedure. There were serious problems with the process. He admits that. [Interjections.] But he decides not to cancel the procedure. [Interjections.] And remember he told the chairperson of Scopa “that I have no knowledge of the details of the complaint, nor the outcome”. But he tells us what was in that. By the way, you would have expected that if he wanted to clear the name he would have given the forensic audit to Scopa. He says - Winde says today - hon Minister Winde says today [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I have never seen the forensic audit.

Mr M OZINSKY: But you quote it in the House.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I have never seen this.

Mr M OZINSKY: He never saw it but he quotes it in the House. [Interjections.] Hon Winde - in fact let me finish with the hon Carlisle. The hon Carlisle appoints a senior member, Mr Fischer, of his department to go clean up the mess in the board of the Convention Centre. He makes the appointment. He says he knows nothing of what is happening in the Convention Centre. [Interjections.] But he behaves directly like

someone who is covering up because he and his party try and threatened Scopa and that brings me to the other members of Scopa. [Interjections.]

Mr H P GEYER: [Inaudible.] We did not see that.

Mr M OZINSKY: Hon member Mr Geyer said he knew nothing about this issue being on the agenda ... [Interjections.] ... but in the draft parliamentary programme - and remember, he is the Deputy Chief Whip, he draws this up -in the draft parliamentary programme published on the 4th of March, that is two weeks before the Scopa meeting, where he said he knew nothing about ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M OZINSKY: ... this matter appears on the programming authority agenda [Interjections.] And then they come in front of the press - I am glad that they did it in front of the press; they did not think the press would come at seven o'clock in the morning, but the press came to see them – and they vote the matter off the agenda, and then you tell us there is no cover-up?

Mr H P GEYER: There is no cover-up.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: There is!

Mr M OZINSKY: There is a cover-up and the cover-up starts with Carlisle because he has been aware, let me tell you.

'n AGB LID: Skande!

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Lukey has a SMS from Carlisle who says he knows nothing about this. After Mr Lukey briefed Carlisle personally on the matter Carlisle sent him an SMS saying: “What do you want Steve? How can we sort this out?” [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Wow! [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Hon Winde and Carlisle tell the House they know nothing about the matter! [Interjections.] But he says ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon Minister Carlisle. [Interjections.] Hon Minister, order.

An HON MEMBER: Order!

The SPEAKER: Minister, order!

'n AGB LID: Jy!

Mr M OZINSKY: You see, let me come to ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky, your time has expired. Thank you very much.

An HON MEMBER: No! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: How shocking! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members! Minister Botha, over to you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, thank you very much ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... for the opportunity to also take part in this lively debate.

To be successful as a government you need good management, financial responsibility and political accountability.

'n AGB LID: Dit het nie gebeur nie.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: In our governance model and our APPs and our budget which has just been tabled by Minister Winde we are all aligned to achieve this success. It is not only in budgets about overspending, but it is also very much about under- spending. I want to remind you about what Minister Bredell has shared with us. He touched on it, but I will give you more detail. In the Free State on the municipal infrastructure grant they under-spent R 56 million; in Gauteng R 123 million, in Northern Cape R 137 million.

Ms M TINGWE: Where?

An HON MEMBER: Where are we now?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: In KwaZulu-Natal R 254 million. [Interjections.] In the Eastern Cape R 337 million [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon Hani! Order.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: In Northwest R 381 million, in Mpumalanga R 610 million and in Limpopo only R 1 014 million (R 1 billion and R 14 million) [Interjections.] That, Mr Speaker, is a total of R 2 912 million, almost R 3 billion by the ANC government collectively in South Africa [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Did not spend on the poor.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Did not spend on the poor. In the Western Cape we had the humble achievement of not under-spending a single cent. Mr Speaker, let me also say something about the state of health in other provinces. There is a story of lack of discipline and mismanagement and there is a story of no political accountability, and Mpumalanga a headline ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Mpumalanga.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mpumalanga. Remember to pronounce Botha also correct.

Ms M TINGWE: I always do. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: In the *Mail and Guardian* November last year there is an article that says: “Our children’s lives were lost due to the negligence of the Mpumalanga health system.” That whilst Mpumalanga Premier DD Mabuza is on a free, three-car R 5 million luxury car spending spree. I think this is a very bad story from the ANC government.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: For the poor, very bad for the poor.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: In Gauteng, Mr Speaker, I quote the national minister:

“Gauteng public health facilities are in a state of collapse.”

This is the National Minister –

“...and failing to deliver quality health services and care to patients after tender irregularities running into billions dealt the system a hard blow, disclosing that the province’s hospitals were running out of essentials due to huge deficits in their budgets and that efforts to rebuild the system could take a while.”

Motsoaledi explained or the hon Minister Motsoaledi explained that: “The problems have grown steadily over the past few years...” - I wonder during whose reign, “...and were about to explode now.” I quote: “From around 2007 hospitals have been issuing a lot of heavy tenders that had nothing to do with healthcare, leaving no money for the essentials”, the Minister said [Interjections.]

Mr H P GEYER: For the poor people.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: And so I can carry on about Gauteng, but let me rather cut it short because I am concerned I might be running out of time.

Ms M TINGWE: Yes.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: But there are also 104 ghost employees and so on and a few other things in Gauteng.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: And you do not ... [Inaudible.] ... someone like that.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: In Limpopo last year the 500 bed Mankweng Hospital which also acts as a referral centre for 500 clinics and 38 hospitals in Limpopo and is therefore a very, very important hospital, has been crippled by mismanagement and lack of equipment. At the time the newspaper reported as follows: “535 people died”. Only 535 people died between October 2012 and February 2013 - I think that is six months - due to the unavailability of resources, so it is not only about bad governance.

It is about people dying.

Mr M G E WILEY: Genocide.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Fridges in the mortuary - listen to this - have not been working for over a year resulting surprisingly in rotten unclaimed bodies.

[Interjections.] Put that on your plate! Put that on your plates.

'n AGB LID: Dis wat julle ... [Onhoorbaar.] ... dis hoe julle regeer.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Patients were on a chicken-and-pap diet because the procured company failed to deliver the food. [Interjections.]

Mr H P GEYER: They say it is good enough. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You've got the guts to say that. The laundry department does not function as machines are not working. And so I can go on. There is not an X-ray machine in working order. There are only four nurses in the hospital who have to serve 250 000 people, and so I can carry on. There is a severe lack of staff and the levels of - listen to this - the levels of hygiene are disturbing. The hospital has no disinfectant, no soap, no gloves and no cleaning material. [Interjections.] In the maternal ward woman give birth in dirty beds. The hospital lacks important medicine stocks and the hospital is not currently feeding patients, so the pap-and-whatever is also now 'kapot'. There is no food! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] ... for the poor!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: This is a wonderful ANC government story. Look up when I speak to you, dear colleagues. [Interjections.] The Eastern Cape - listen to the Eastern Cape. The end of last year the Eastern Cape Health Crisis Action released the following: “Death and dying in the Eastern Cape”, a harrowing report that describes the disintegration of the provincial public health service on which over 6 million people depend [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Let them starve.
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It is described as a broken, inhumane and collapsed health system where accountability is non-existent. SAMA issued a plea, SAMA, the South Africa Medical Association. They said: “Please, can you please pay 30 doctors who have not received their salaries”, for a period of already by then six months. Thousands of patients from the Eastern Cape are denied services and access simply because the provincial government is unable to provide the service. The Western Cape is consequently dealing with that.

An HON MEMBER: It is bloody time situation [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: And so I can tell you what is going on at Madwaleni

Hospital in Umtata where there are two clinical assistants; no nurses. KwaZulu Natal, - let's leave KwaZulu Natal. The Northern Cape: "In 2010 it came to our attention..." - this is now the National Minister speaking: "...that a mental health hospital..." Listen to this one, this is a good one. Hon Robin you will enjoy this one. "The mental health hospital under construction at Kimberley had clear issues of maladministration. The mental health hospital at Kimberley has been under construction for some eight years and Northern Cape officials had indicated that some of what has been constructed faced possible demolition. Do you know why, Mr Speaker? They forgot to put in a foundation when they built this new hospital. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is not maladministration [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: This after R 420 million had been paid to a now liquidated contractor on a project that was originally budgeted to cost R 297 million. Of the R 420 million a massive R 70 million was paid as professional fees and this is another beautiful ANC story, probably a John Block story as well. So, Mr Speaker, what did we - what has happened in the Western Cape? We inherited a few bad contracts, as we have heard here. In Worcester we lost R 48 million for three forensic pathology centres where we had to terminate the contracts that were entered into by the previous ANC government. I am not going to go into details. You know it is true. [Interjections.] Well, I challenge you. I challenge you. [Interjections.] I challenge you. I challenge you, because you are so wise in here, hon member Mr Uys. Bring the evidence and I will show it to you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Botha please [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: But you run away when we give you an opportunity to speak.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Botha, address the Chair please.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I wish I could get over the Floor and give him a shortcut. Roughly estimated, Mr Speaker, under hon member Mr Uys's watch and Fransman's watch, in Public Works ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon Fransman.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: What is honourable about Fransman? R 100 million as a result of their decisions, R 100 million was lost in the ANC due to the ANC's bad story in the Western Cape. [Interjections.] Mr Speaker, in the past five years, despite the escalating burden of disease especially chronic disease and health services that are under pressure and staff working in a stressed environment with limited resources, the department has maintained an "unqualified" - now throughout its term - an unqualified audit and has consistently spent over 99% of its allocated budget in recent years. The results of these efforts over this political term speak for themselves.

The Western Cape has the best outcomes in the country by far. The transmission rates for HIV from mother to children reduced from 3.6 to 1.7. [Interjections.] The Western Cape TB cure increased from 78 to 82%. Response time for priority one calls increased from 28% to 74%. Maternal deaths in facilities have decreased from 107 per

100 000 to 60 over 100 000. The under five-year child mortality rate in the Western Cape is now 29 compared to a national average of 54, and so we can carry on. We have the highest life expectancy in the country.

We have improved our health outcomes. Despite everything we have made person-centred experience the focus of our efforts. We expanded the health services platform. We commissioned state-of-the-art facilities. We increased the staff numbers to the current 32 000 staff with less than 4% vacancies, not only two nurses in a hospital, prioritised the concern for and care of staff, modernised our infrastructure, prioritised the acquisition of medical equipment the best money can buy and embraced advances in the ICT technology.

Mr Speaker, the budget that Minister Winde has tabled here for this coming financial year is a budget that addresses the imbalances of the past. It is a pro-poor budget. It is to embrace diversity. It is to improve service delivery and it is to escalate the Western Cape to a new level and new heights.

Mr Speaker, while I am still on the floor and have an opportunity I want to respond to one or two things that was mentioned here today. Firstly let me just say something about hon member Mr Ozinsky's argument about the money spent on the poor. He makes a deduction to say that 55% of the budget goes to staff so therefore it cannot be correct that we say that we spend 78% of the budget on the poor. I have never in my whole life, and really I must tell you, I am 53 years old, I have never heard an argument like that. [Interjections.] Have you ever heard an argument like that?

An HON MEMBER: Just simple terms. [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: So what you want us to do, is you want us to stand at the corner of the street like - yes, I won't say like what - stand at the corner of the street and hand out money to the poor. Is that what you want us to do? You have got to deliver the services, hon member Mr Skwatsha.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Botha, may you - your time has expired. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I will conclude by saying this, Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, I want to conclude by saying this: to be able to spend 78% of our budget on the poor you need professional staff and a qualified cadre of staff to be able to do that, to deliver the services and to ensure that the money is spent on the poor, and we have that. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Botha. [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: Don't hide [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members! Order! [Interjection.] Minister Winde, over to you. [Interjections.] Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:
 Thank you very much, Mr Speaker, and thank you to all of those who took part in this debate. I will endeavour to answer some of the questions and comment on some of the issues as raised. Perhaps first of all what I would like to do is to thank the hon member Mr Von Brandis for taking the opportunity to wish me well on my birthday
 [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: Oh, it is your birthday!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: On a birthday it is always good to give something out, so everybody got on their counter top one of these eco-cups. It is made by a local company, 100% biodegradable and very green. Of course you each got a couple of biscuits, and this comes from a company called Khayelitsha Cookies, a really outstanding small business that is getting bigger and bigger by the day offering great products and great services. So there you go, a little bit to snack on while we continue the proceedings today.

An HON MEMBER: This is pro-poor. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is not from Bishop's Court.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: No, no, Khayelitsha Cookies is a company in Khayelitsha. So thank you very much hon member Mr Von Brandis first of all for being the chair of the committee, taking the

process of the budget through. But of course we will also get to the stage where we deal with each vote, by vote, and I am sure that at that stage we will get into dealing with each of the budgets. You raised the question - I tried to get the answer for today - whether the honourable Fransman had paid his debt or that the ANC had paid their debt to the CTICC. As far as I know it remained the same. The original debt four years ago was R 1.5 million owed to that facility for the conference at which he was elected as leader, this leader who wants to take over the running of this province. This leader who at the moment I believe still owes of that R 1.5 million debt, they still owe R 1.3 million four years later.

'n AGB LID: Hulle gaan hulle nie betaal nie.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And that even poses a court case. The next thing you spoke about is the South African economy and the pressure that the economy is under and specifically risks going forward, the possible downgrading of our risk rating here as a country. Of course that is something that we really would not like to see, but the contributing factors to that downgrading are issues like corruption. We are getting the Nkandla report released tomorrow. We have a specific case that is going to have an effect on our economy, on jobs in our country and that is going to be reported on tomorrow. What is happening with our electricity supply will have another major effect on our economy, huge pressure, deterring investors and deterring the economy and job creation.

He also spoke about good governance and perhaps this is an area where I must again refer to those involved either being at treasury or at local government around the CGRO and the MGRO processes, because I think those processes are starting to bring

really good changes about, both within the provincial government and the governance space, as well as the service delivery that follows on the back of it, together with the MGRO process and local government and the role that local government is playing in respect of all this. I think Minister Bredell also spoke about that in his speech and those differences that are coming along.

Mr Speaker, I then want to move to the hon member Ms Beerwinkel. She started off by saying thank you very much to the national government. She obviously didn't read my speech or listened to my speech, because in my speech I again said thank you very much to the way that we have worked first of all with Minister Pravin Gordhan specifically over these last five years, also definitely the way in which this province works with National Treasury. Again I will follow on with you and say thank you again. You do not have to worry. We will say thank you where it is needed but the point that you make is that if this money that is being appropriated and spent in each of our provinces is kind of like this ANC money that they have got a big pot of ...
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The ANC money. [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It actually comes from the taxpayers. We need to thank the taxpayers for actually making sure that this money is there, always under pressure. The point the hon member Mr Von Brandis made is that the pressure on our economy is actually going to end up as pressure on our taxation system and actual pressure on our income. Then let us also perhaps look at the amount of tax that is raised within this region versus the

amount of money re-spent or re-appropriated. When 13% of the money that is raised nationally comes out of the taxpayers of this region, but they only get just under 10% back then already there is already differential where the taxpayers of this region are giving money into the system that is being spent, like we should do, where it is needed in other places. So just bear that in mind every time we want to say thank you very much to the ANC. Let us actually say thank you very much to the taxpayers and those people who commit themselves every day to continually trying to grow our economy ... [Interjections.] ... and to the people of this province thank you very much, because you do your bit as well. [Interjections.]

Then the hon member Ms Beerwinkel asked a question: what do people out there in rural areas, what do poorer people know about broadband. She asks the question. Well, I think you must go and actually do a little bit of a road trip around this province. That will be pretty good. I am not sure whether you just sit in your constituency all the time or whether you actually get into the province, but go to Harare and go to the library and just go and have a look at the queue of people that understand exactly what connectivity is.[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Exactly what broadband is.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: What connectivity and broadband is about. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Go to Robertson library,

you will see the same there.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Go and stand there and have a look at every library across this province. Go today, which I mentioned, I ask you to please go to that school in Delft. [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: To Delft.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Go and have a look at how those children - I mean I actually made a joke because the teacher was trying to get a programme loaded on the computer and I said and there was a Grade 3 I think, a primary school child busy working on a tablet. This child is busy going on a tablet and the teacher was on the laptop and battling to load a programme and I said in actual fact what we should do is actually ask this child. I am sure they will be able solve this problem very, very quickly and it is really great to see these Grade 3 kids on tablets inside this classroom, and this is in the middle of Delft. It is really an exciting project. I promise you those children know what broadband is about. [Interjections.] Ask the 118 000 people that Mxit are telling us are using the Mxit platform in Khayelitsha alone just to do maths and science projects and homework problems through an app-system that is now available to them. Go and speak to businesses, go and speak to the Silulu business, the company that comes out of Khayelitsha. They have just come back from London and has good opportunities in Europe. If you follow them on Facebook and on Twitter you will see the 17 training programmes, the training facilities they have already rolled out in poor areas in the Western Cape to specifically train people in broadband. Have a look at the queues of

people that this private sector company is empowering and creating opportunities for.

An HON MEMBER: But they don't really need broadband.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But perhaps we should also have a look at where we draw this from and see the difference that it makes and go to Columbia and see what is happening in Columbia around broadband and the difference it made in an emerging market economy. In 2009 when we came into power, at that same time in 2009 in Columbia, there were two million people making use of connectivity, internet usage and broadband. That almost doubled since the previous year 2008 to two million. Today, five years later, there are now 17 million people in that country connected, using it, making a difference in the economy. Go and have a look at the difference it makes in the economy overall and the number of jobs created. That is why we are doing what we are doing and that is why we will be rolling out this infrastructure.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The ANC will get rid of it
[Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:
With regard to ... [Interjections.] ... you commented on the spend on the economy and the spend on local government. If you had listened to the medium-term budget policy, if you had listened to the actual speech and if you had also listened to Pravin Gordhan, to Minister Pravin Gordhan's speech and how he pulled it through from the national development plan and the role that an economic development department plays, it is

not about what the size of the budget is. It is about the linkage to every other department, and you will see how strategic objective one (SO1) links into all of the projects within that budget. It links into what happens in transport and public works in the infrastructure spend because it has got an economic lens to it. It links to what happens in health and creating a healthier society, in education, a foundation to grow the economy. The economy is linked through every single thing that we do within this province.

Then you made a comment about the Dromedaris. I want to know if you have actually visited Dromedaris lately [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: That is not the point [Interjections.] [Inaudible.] We are speaking about the Jan Van Riebeeck ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But perhaps what we should do before you make ... [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: That is the Jan Van Riebeeck Dromedaris [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members, order! [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: I know about ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:

Before you make those kind of statements, perhaps visit the site, go and speak to the people who live there and ask the people what they think [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is not ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Speaker, I move on to Minister Bredell. I will not go into too many details on what Minister Bredell had to say, besides also looking at the differences that had happened. I mentioned CGRO and MGRO and the processes and the differences that are happening across local government around the governance space in our local government. The next phase, the next stage that we have to get involved in with these local governments and with this province when we engage in these processes of MGRO is to ask how does the governance component now link to the economy? How do we start looking at it from an economic point of view? How does putting efficiency into the system start to overlap into the economic space, create confidence so that the economy starts to reinvest and people start to look at specifically our smaller municipalities as a space of opportunity, wanting to invest because it is well run because the government is doing what they are doing, offering the best products and services they can within their means. Once we start to do that we start to change the income side in our economy in our local governments which is under huge pressure at the moment. I spoke earlier around the taxation and what is happening within South Africa and what the hon member Ms Beerwinkel spoke about, how that local government space of rates and taxes effectively end up in service delivery. At the same time we have to link it, link the economy to the visits we have now, to the support that we have, and the role that we play in conjunction with our local

governments.

You also spoke about the delivery record, the spend, you spoke about President Zuma's ANC. The list seems to contain a lot of people who had fingers in the till. [Interjections.] Yes, quite interesting.

Anyway, thank you very much. Mr Speaker. I am going to move on to the hon member Mr Lentit. Thank you very much for what you added to the debate. Your action to vision, that is exactly what is going to happen now over the next five years. You also talked about whether the ANC are going to vote for or against the budget and what that actually means for the people on the ground, because obviously we have not heard it today. We have not seen an alternative budget put on the table at all ... [Interjections.] ... so one presumes then that this House is actually going to vote for the budget.

The hon member Ms Tingwe talked about education, health and our Constitution, and you are right, that is exactly where our main money goes. We operate in a country that has a Constitution and of course that is what we are going to do. You ask about education and I ask you again, you make these statements, but how would you spend the money differently. What would you do differently and we have not seen that put on the table yet. You also spoke about the broadband. I want to again refer to that school today that I was at. The interesting thing about that school was the involvement of the parents. The first thing we saw was the number of parents that were there today when this project was being launched. They were really excited but they were really involved and that is also really great to see. So you have committed teachers but you

also have committed parents, and we need to commend every single one of those across this province. You asked about the difference in the schools. You said we are building new schools but what about the existing schools?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: But we are not building new schools. We are replacing schools.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Can I say to you that the maintenance ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Replacement schools.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The maintenance budget has gone up from 17% to 22% so at the same time it is about having a look at those schools that need the maintenance. The infrastructure stays relevant and stays in the space that can continue to deliver the education that needs to be delivered to our young people in this province.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] ... and then you learn about it.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Hon Ms Bevu, thank you very much; you made some comment about skills and some of the programmes and exactly that is what it is. You also said about the EPWP that it is not enough, what about the outcome, and I agree with you. It is not about just a job for ... [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: Like people. [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... a couple of hours a day or a week and then at the end ... [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: Race is about colour.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: At the end of a six months process you go back home and you haven't learnt anything. We need to make sure that when you have an EPWP opportunity that at the same time you actually are going up the ladder, that at the end of that six month period you have had that job you have more skills, you have something in your CV that enables you to actually get a better job because of what you have learnt. That is very, very key and I agree with you, but obviously that is the focus of what this government is about. It is about the youth cafes, the MOD centres, the skills programmes. If I look at the BPO sector when I first started in this job there were 7 000 people employed in the BPO sector. There are now 52 000 this year in that sector and they are all young people. They are all in that category of under 34 year old people in our province and they are the ones that are being given the opportunity in that space, and that is really exciting to see. There are 97 000 people in that EPW space who get an opportunity. You have to make sure, as we said earlier, that they get a lift up the ladder in that process. There are more than 5000 people in this province over the last five years who have had an opportunity through work and skills programmes, the pay programme, etcetera. How do we see that going forward? How do we turn that as I said earlier into 100 000

opportunities? But then you started asking questions about Stats SA and whether the numbers can be trusted. Then you started quoting Stats SA and obviously whatever we say in this House in statements we need to be able to say where that stat has come from. I can assure you that we definitely do have all those statistics and we always state where they come from.

Then you also said something about Wesgro. Four years ago, five years ago when I started this job the amount of product that we exported out of our region going into Africa was almost negligible. Today as we stand 25%, one in four containers, are now going into Africa. You asked the question about Africa, what is happening in Africa: one in four containers are going there.

The investment that Wesgro pulled in over the last four years was R 30.1 billion. At the same time, if you look at the previous four years when this political party was in power during a time when the economy was booming ... [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: That is actually not true!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... it was R 8 billion less. [Interjections.] R 8 billion less, period for period.

An HON MEMBER: Oh, come on!

Ms L BROWN: That is not true.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Of course it is!

An HON MEMBER: What is not true?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Do you want to ask me a question?

Ms L BROWN: No, I do not. I am telling you it is not true.

The SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Okay, well then do not worry. The hon member Mr Geyer, thank you very much for your input. You also spoke specifically about the number of people on the national list ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Ms Brown, thank you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... on the Zuma ANC list. You spent a bit of time on agriculture, the value chain, the market, the competitiveness. Obviously that is an area we need to focus on going forward [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Minister, Minister.

Ms L BROWN: A question.

The SPEAKER: Minister, please take your seat. [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: I just have to quickly think about the question.

The SPEAKER: A question, do you allow it Minister? [Interjections.] Order! Order.

Hon Ms Brown, would like to ask a question. Are you allowing it?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:
Yes.

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Ms L BROWN: I would like to know in which sectors they are trading at the moment into Africa and the cost of those sectors.

The SPEAKER: Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I cannot give you the cost, but I will furnish you with the costs. They will be in agriculture at the moment. That is exporting. That is our agriculture space. In the oil and gas space we are moving into Africa in a big way and in the skills space we are putting a lot of time into Africa. Thank you very much for that question.

Ms L BROWN: Over R 8 million. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: No, that was foreign direct investment into South Africa.

The SPEAKER: I did not allow you a follow-up. Minister, it was one question. You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, the hon member Mr Geyer spoke about the projects through the environmental affairs department on education for school children in our nature areas etcetera. Thank you very much for that. The hon member Ms Hartnick, again talking about the youth, youth development programmes, education, etcetera, thank you very much for your contribution to the debate. Now I need to move to the hon member Mr Ozinsky. [Interjections.] The hon member Mr Ozinsky also raised issues [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: Now how do you justify your running?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: He raised issues around the Census so let us first of all start with the Census, so let us have a look at 2001 and what the Census says. The population of the Western Cape was 4.5 million. Census 2001 4.5 million; access to water: 98.3%.

Mr M OZINSKY: Minister, do not waste your time. Just get to the point.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:
Flush toilets 88.5% and electricity 78.8% [Interjections.] Okay, have you got it? Now
we go to 2011: population 5.8 million; 1.3 million more people in the system.

Mr M OZINSKY: Well, you do not know how to govern those 1.3 million more
people. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But
at the same time with that increasing numbers ...[Interjections.] ... at the same time
with that increasing numbers the access to water went, as I said, from 98.3 to 99.1, so
it increased while also the number ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: A 1% increase, a 1% ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:
Exactly 1.3 million people more. [Interjections.] Flush toilets 88.5%.

Ms L BROWN: But that is not what he is saying. [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:
Including the 1.3 million people more went increased to 91.6% [Interjections.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Where?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And electricity for lighting ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Do your work!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: 78.8% [Interjections.] ... despite the 1.1 went to ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order hon members! Order! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... to 93.4% [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Do your work!

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Carlisle. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Will the MEC take a question?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:

Yes.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] You had a chance.

The SPEAKER: Yes, the MEC will. [Interjections.] Order! Order, hon members!

Mr M OZINSKY: Okay, now give us the same figures for the same period for the Eastern Cape or Northwest. [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: A declining population.

Ms L BROWN: And you see the ... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:
They definitely ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Do it!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:
They definitely are nowhere near these figures because these were top figures ...
[Interjections.] ... and I will supply them to you, but obviously I can't supply them

right now because I do not have them in this document. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Let us get to the next point, Mr Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa, order.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: We have shown him in every single area that he raised issue with, he has not got the answer for those specific numbers and every single one of them went up.

Mr M OZINSKY: Other provinces did better.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Including the 1.3 million more people in the system.

Mr M OZINSKY: Other provinces did much better! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] ... infrastructure.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Let us get to the next point, Mr Speaker.

Mr M OZINSKY: I am thinking about four million people. [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: That is where you are slipping. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And the next point was raised around where the budget goes and the budget for the poor. His argument is that people that work in this province are rich and they are not allowed to be in the equation.

Mr M OZINSKY: They are not poor!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But it is not about a salary. It is about the service. So what he is telling me? [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: But that is where the money went.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: That the money given to a social worker delivering a service to someone in this province is not delivery to the poor, that the money given to a teacher that is delivering education to a person who is poor in this province is not delivering to the poor ... [Interjections.] ... that giving money or paying a salary to a nurse ...

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: A doctor.

Mr M OZINSKY: Who is poor or ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:
...who is giving a service to the poor in this province ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky, order.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...
to the poor in this province does not count, that infrastructure spend when someone
gets a job in a building site is not money going to someone who is poor, number one,
but also making a difference for an infrastructure spend whether it is a school or a
hospital or a clinic does not make a difference. He cannot tell me that that salary does
not count. He needs a course ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Can I tell you now I will show you straight away ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:
Absolutely he needs a course. [Interjections.] Then let us have a look at his next point.
His next point was when he asked the hon Minister Carlisle: "What have you done?"
Well his head of Public Works, his deputy head of Public Works and his HOD - all
three are gone. A whole lot of cases lodged with the police and the investigations are

ongoing, but now let us get to the point that the hon member Mr Ozinsky raised ...
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: But this side defended the HOD, so how can you ... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Minister, order.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Let us get to the point that the hon member Mr Ozinsky raises around the CTICC. This is how the hon member Mr Ozinsky goes to work. He twists things and he bends things. It is very interesting. The first thing he asks is whether hon Minister Carlisle knows something, and when he asks, he is saying: “Neither I or my staff know what this issue is about.”

Mr M OZINSKY: Yes, ja.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: So we get notice from Scopa that we need to appear before Scopa to answer questions from a Mr Lukey. That is what we get, alright. [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: He never said that, no, he never said that.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: We then say: “That is all very well, but please we do not know what these questions are.”

Mr M OZINSKY: That is not what I asked.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:
That is exactly what he was asking.

Mr M OZINSKY: That is not what I asked him.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: We
need to know what the questions are. Give us that presentation ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: He said he does not know the ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...
so that we can devise those answers. The hon member Mr Ozinsky starts to twists that
and mixes it with a whole lot of other junk. It is not how it works. You have to give
the question. Those questions did come.

Mr M OZINSKY: I have no knowledge of the outcome of his engagements with ...
[Inaudible.] Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It
proves exactly that this did not belong in Scopa. I have already gone into that ...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky, order.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: As to why it did not belong in Scopa, because you cannot allow Scopa to be abused politically for those kinds of situations. [Interjections.]

'n AGB LID: Ja, ja, nee dis waar. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It cannot be allowed.

An HON MEMBER: On your version.

'n AGB LID: Dis waar. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I am actually also surprised. [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: So why did ... [Inaudible.] ... CPOS?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And then last of all, Mr Speaker, thank you to the hon Minister Botha for his contribution. He actually spoke about health delivery in South Africa and he raised a number of

very, very serious shortcomings across our country that were very interesting for me. He made a comment that says “look up”. It was very interesting to watch the body language on this side of the House, heads down, embarrassed about what is actually really happening around service delivery in the health space across South Africa. There are some horrendous, shocking stories [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Oh, come on!

Mr M OZINSKY: Every day in the newspapers [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And this is an absolute embarrassment. [Interjections.] Then he contrasts it with what is happening in this province and how the delivery changes in this province.

An HON MEMBER: Public Works roads [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: And quite frankly ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: A bum party!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Quite frankly I would like to say that obviously we continue to new heights. We will continue to push, that is what the next five year plan will be. It is about how we continue to improve those service delivery levels, how we continue to make a

difference in everybody's lives in that space, in the education space across the board. And so I come back, Mr Speaker, to where I started in this debate to talk about the budget, the R 150 billion over the next three years, the "metacog" which outlines how that money is going to be spend, in which quadrants or sectors, and how it relates to our policies; how it relates to our strategic objectives. It is all there. It is all a plan and a funded plan and that plan is going to continue from now for the next three years. I want to thank everyone who contributed to this debate. Quite frankly I do not think there was any alternative that we have to take into account or that we have missed in this budget. I think it is a great plan and I am pretty certain that the voters are going to agree with that as well. We will continue to deliver on that plan for the next five years, thank you very much. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes. Hoor daar! [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: That concludes the debate on the consideration of the principle of the Bill. Are there any objections to the approval of the principle of the Bill? No objection?

Agreed to.

The House will deal with the - is it an objection?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Oh! [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: Oh yes, we are.

An HON MEMBER: A big one. [Inaudible.] ... very big.

The SPEAKER: Then it is - I cannot hear you. [Interjections.] Order! Order! Hon members, then if there is an objection I will then put the question, those who are in favour to the approval of the principle of the Bill will say "aye".

HON MEMBERS: Aye.

The SPEAKER: And those who are not in favour will say "no".

HON MEMBERS: No.

The SPEAKER: It seems that the "ayes" have it. [Interjections.] Come again. Order!
It seems that the "ayes" have it. [Interjections.]

Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: We will now proceed. The secretary will read the second Order of the Day. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Voting against the poor, says no.

Ms L BROWN: You - if you understood Parliament you would be back here ...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order hon members!

An HON MEMBER: Where are you going with this?

The SPEAKER: Hon members order! [Interjections.] Hon Ms Brown, hon members Order!. The secretary is on the floor to read the second Bill. Yes, yes. [Interjections.]

2. Finalisation of the *Western Cape Independent Health Complaints Committee Bill*
[B 9B - 2013] (Minister of Health).

The SPEAKER: Minister Botha, over to you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, thank you for the opportunity. The Department of Health is committed to providing an efficient and effective quality health service. The department however acknowledges that at times lapses do occur and that although channels for clients through which they can seek redress, do exist, these do not always meet the expectation of the independent assessment of the complaint. In order to elaborate the systems of redress I want to establish an Independent Health Complaints Committee as an independent and objective structure where complaints can be lodged when the existing structures have not resolved complaints to the satisfaction of the complainant. That means, Mr Speaker, the establishment of an additional channel for the Minister and the head of the department

to refer difficult cases to for further investigation.

The Independent Health Complaints Committee will receive, investigate and make recommendations on complaints received by any person aggrieved by inadequate service delivery and any of the Western Cape Department of Health facilities and/or administrative functions of the department. The Minister of Health and the head of the department will have the discretionary power to refer complaints directly to the committee. At the conclusion of the investigation the committee will submit a written report to the Minister and the HOD with any recommendation that the committee considers appropriate to bring the matter to a satisfactory conclusion. The committee will not entertain any complaint with regard to labour and unemployment related matters which must be addressed through the grievances and labour law procedures, or matters which have not first been lodged appropriately via the existing structures of the department. The committee supplements but does not replace existing formal channels by which complaints may be handled. The Minister and HOD will review the efficiency of the committee on an annual basis. The Bill stipulates that the Minister will appoint at least four committee members who will represent the following areas of expertise. That is healthcare, legal, including medico-legal, human rights and public service.

Nominated individuals may not be in the employ of the Western Cape government. Individuals or organisations nominating members must note the following: on appointment the members will enter into a contract with Western Cape government's Department of Health. The position is voluntary and members will be paid at a predetermined tariff for attendance. Committee members will serve for a period of 12

months or such other period to be determined by the Minister of Health. The legislation together with the other projects implemented such as the SMS project and complaints hotline will bring about a fresh approach to address public complaints and to improve the overall patient experience. In the present absence of such legislation patients' only option to pursue any complaint currently after internal processes have been exhausted, is to resort to very expensive and time-consuming legal action. The national Minister has expressed his support for the initiatives by provinces to counter medico-legal claims and improve patient complaint resolution. I so move, Mr Speaker, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Botha. Hon member Ms Du Toit Marais, over to you.

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Dankie, mnr die Speaker. Die wetsontwerp is nodig om die provinsiale Minister van Gesondheid en die departementshoof te bemagtig om die ondersoek van klagtes aan te voor deur dit te verwys na die Onafhanklike Gesondheidsklagtekomitee. Hierdie prosedure sal die deursigtigheid en onafhanklikheid van die interne departementele stelsel verhoog. Die wetsontwerp vereis dat die OGKK binne 'n bepaalde tydperk die klagtes sal uitsorteer en terugvoer aan die verwysende persoon sal gee met die oplossing daarmee saam. Dit mag teenstrydig klink maar hierdie wetsontwerp verhoog die positiewe ervaring van pasiënte by gesondheidsfasiliteite in die Wes-Kaap. Ons ondersteun die wetsontwerp. Dankie.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Skwatsha, over to you. Chance not

taken. Hon member Mr Skwatsha.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Sorry. Mr Speaker, transparency and accountability make up the cornerstone of this constitutional democracy which the ANC so tirelessly fought for.

'n AGB LID: Ai!

An HON MEMBER: At last. [Interjections.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Our people, especially the poorest of the poor, need to have confidence that their service delivery concerns with all spheres of government are taken up and addressed. People will only have confidence that their concerns are taken seriously, when the institutions they take their concerns to are free from any kind of interference and manipulation by whoever, whether that person is the President, the Minister, the HOD and so forth. This is why democratic society's oversight committees must be independent.

It is in this light that the ANC opposes the Independent Health Complaints Committee Bill. It undermines transparency and accountability. Instead of enhancing service delivery in the health sector this Bill seeks to abuse state resources to invest all power in the hands ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Come on Skwatsha!

Mr M SKWATSHA: ... of the MEC ... [Interjections.] ... and this advice, this legal

advice was given to the committee to abuse state resources and to invest all power in the hands of the MEC and the HOD ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Did we get legal advice?

Mr M SKWATSHA: ... to shy away from properly addressing people's legitimate concerns. One suspects that it also has something to do with managing internal DA problems and factionalism. Mr Speaker, it makes absolutely no sense for the MEC to appoint this committee when complaints from the public to the committee will be against his own very department, and he is the one who has to adjudicate them solely. This committee cannot be considered independent therefore. The MEC's hands in fully dictating the course of this committee and rendering it ... [Inaudible] ... further strengthened by the fact that he will determine who chairs the committee. The MEC will most certainly ensure that the committee is an extension of his powers by handpicking surrogates to serve on the committee. If committee members do not toe the line ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: They get shot!

Mr M SKWATSHA: ... the Bill gives him provision to fire them. [Interjections.] Yes, they really get shot! They really get shot! [Interjections.] Mr Speaker, we know that the hon Minister Botha will use this committee probably as a deployment tool for those DA MPLs who are victims of Helen's, the hon Helen Zille's rent-a-black. [Inaudible] ... did not make the list. This is why the MEC ... [Interjections.] This is why the MEC is desperately rushing to push through this legislation before the next

administration takes over. [Interjections.]

'n AGB LID: Is dit deur 'n ... [Onhoorbaar.] ... gedoen?

'n AGB LID: Ja.

Mr M SKWATSHA: The manner of such hardworking people like Von Brandis, Geyer, Hartnick and many others will ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: And Stali and Skwatsha ... [Inaudible.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: ... might find themselves deployed as bait members of the Independent Health Complaints Committee ... [Interjections] ... whose remuneration will be determined by the MEC. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: [Inaudible.] Chairperson.

The SPEAKER: Order! Order hon members!

Ms L BROWN: I promise you this!

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order! Proceed, hon member Mr Skwatsha.

Mr M SKWATSHA: We will see MEC Bredell doing this with CapeNature tomorrow

and MEC Winde with the public entities, and the list goes on.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: But you are the chairperson of CapeNature.

Mr M SKWATSHA: With regards to the appointment of committee members the Bill seeks to give us the impression that the appointment of these members is not going to hinder the independence. The Bill states that the MEC will consult the HOD on the suitability of candidates. This too renders the committee subservient to the executive because it is the HOD's performance that is said to be investigated by this committee, whose appointment is done in consultation with him. There is a clear trend in the Bill of consult-seeking between the MEC and the HOD. Even though we are opposed to the idea of the MEC thinking for the committee and deciding who should be on the committee this trend calls into question the ability of the MEC to make decisions on his own. Mr Speaker, we know that the MEC and the HOD have determined this Bill. We know that the MEC hon Min Botha will not continue as the MEC for Health ...
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No. [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: ... and that the hon Meyer is going to become the MEC for Health.

An HON MEMBER: The hon who?

Mr M SKWATSHA: We also know that ... [Interjections.] We also know that the DA leadership does not trust the hon Meyer.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I thought he was going to be the Minister.

Mr M SKWATSHA: This is why the HOD will be taking the hon Meyer's powers and the Bill demands the MEC's consensus with the HOD.

An HON MEMBER: That is what you think!

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Speaker, the work of this committee which lacks independence will be characterised by cover-ups. The Bill is very clear that the public will be unable to submit complaints directly to the committee and that the committee is not allowed to investigate any complaint sent to them directly by the public. The MEC will refer people's complaints to the committee. This is the height of political manipulation of people's complaints. [Interjections.]

'n AGB LID: Ag, ekskuus tog!

Mr M SKWATSHA: Given the manner in which this MEC and this department have ignored people's complaints about poor service delivery ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Did any of you read this Bill?

Mr M SKWATSHA: ... at our clinics and hospitals ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Oh, come on!

Mr M SKWATSHA: ... it is clear that the MEC and HOD will screen and filter. They have ignored their own legal advice, you know.

Ms L BROWN: Yes, yes.

Mr M SKWATSHA: The whole process of complaints is further manipulated by the fact that the Bill requires the MEC and HOD to give the complainant the committee's response. In fact the Chair of the committee quietly agrees with us on this thing.

An HON MEMBER: No, that is not true. [Interjections.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Quietly agrees with us. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Of course, of course!

Mr M SKWATSHA: Committee reports on the complaints can only go to the MEC and the HOD. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Please note [Inaudible.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: Even the standing committee and the legislature is left out of this

process.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: You will be shot!

[Interjections.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: This provision will act as a safeguard for the MEC. He can now tell people that he is unable to respond to their complaints about inferior service as it is still sitting with the committee. The committee is set to act as a buffer for the MEC so that he can scat political responsibility and turn the committee into a scapegoat for his failures. Even the meetings of the committee are set to be micro-managed by the MEC.

An HON MEMBER: Ten minutes.

Mr M SKWATSHA: The MEC must tell us why. [Interjections.] I still have five minutes, sir. The MEC must tell us why he must determine the time and place of the first meeting. [Interjections.] He must tell us why non-members can only attend meetings with the MEC's approval.

An HON MEMBER: You are not being serious now.

Mr M SKWATSHA: This Bill not only undermines transparency ... [Interjections.] accountability and the very independence of an oversight body ... [Interjection.] ... but it allows the executive to unduly influence operational matters of the committee. This Bill is an insult to the democratic values of transparency, accountability and

independence which so many people laid down their lives for and ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No we never said that. [Inaudible.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: and this Bill is therefore opposed by the African National Congress. I thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister Botha, over to you. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Striving for freedom. [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker thank you very, very much for everyone who took part in the debate. I really appreciate that. Thank you very much to the chairperson of the standing committee for her work in this regard specifically, despite the fact that she quietly ... [Interjections.] ... coerced the opposition. Thank you for all the work done. The hon member Mr Skwatsha, through you Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Who is against ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: For me it was a work of art. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Entertaining!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Really I must tell you, it is a long time. To take a very simple Bill like this, which has got no evil in it, to take that and to write a speech like that, I really admire you, Sir. We have space for you on this side. You are creative. [Interjections.] You are creative! You are innovative! I will make space for you. [Interjections.] Transparency: the hon member Mr Skwatsha referred to transparency.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] ... the cost of who?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: When we talk about transparency I will leave words in the space like Nkandla, arms deal, and so on, brown envelope and those types of things. I throw those things into that space and you make with transparency whatever you want to, Mr Speaker. They oppose this bill and they say we are shying away from openness. You know, there is no mechanism currently, existing mechanism available. This is an effort to make a mechanism available where - let me explain it this way. Currently the situation is that if you have a complaint against the Department of Health you throw your name in a complaints box. I refer to the Ace-boxes, you throw your name into the Ace-box. It does not have anything to do with the previous MEC. Then someone opens it some or other time and they look at it and they say: "Oh well, the department is not guilty. There is nothing wrong. The complaint cannot go any further." Or at least then the complaint goes to the management and so on. The department does make an effort to try and see what is going on but, it is very difficult to investigate yourself. Then if you are still not satisfied with that outcome there is one thing left for you to do. You have to go the legal route. You have to invest a lot of money, have a top notch legal team. You should be prepared to wait a few years and

hopefully you will have a positive outcome, so it is 50/50. Now what we do, we say that is depriving people of an opportunity to get a fair an open assessment of the services that they have received from us.

An HON MEMBER: Especially poor people.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It is only about poor people. It is only about poor people, so this committee will then be ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM:
There is no cure for ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Let me speak about the definition of “independence”, because it all depends on that. If you speak about the definition of independence, such as the IEC, it is one definition. The definition of “independence” in this regard, the chairperson of the committee came to see me about that legal opinion. The definition of “independence” in this regard, Mr Speaker, indicates that we create a mechanism which would stand loose from the department. I think it is an attack on the integrity of the people who will serve on that committee. I think it is good if you warn us about that, but you should at least give those people who would serve on this an opportunity to show their dignity and to show that they are professional in what we expect them to do. [Interjections.]

At the end of the day, Mr Speaker, it is about issues such as people dying because of certain procedures, sometimes neglect, sometimes inferior systems or equipment. I

think our patients deserve a cheap or even a free mechanism to get to the bottom of their problems. It is not the ultimate solution, but it is something that currently does not exist. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: As previous practice.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: And there is no, there was no previous practice.

An HON MEMBER: A suggestion box.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: This is now the first one. You know, when you were in government you did not take any interest in people's complaints while you sat in that office. It was not important to your colleague how the problems of your patients would be resolved. It was not important to him. For us, we have a totally different approach and for us it is very important to deal with those issues.

Mr Speaker, I must just reflect on one issue which my colleague hon member Mr Skwatsha mentioned. He said he has a serious objection that the MEC would determine the first meeting place and time. Would you want to do that, Sir? You are welcome. I will give you the - I will cede that responsibility to the hon Minister Skwatsha. [Interjections.] So that he can call the first meeting [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: Likeminded that is ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: No, it is arrogant. It is arrogant.

Ms L BROWN: You are arrogant.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I will even - I will cede it to him so that he can call the first meeting and determine the place where we can meet. I mean, is that now important? [Interjections.] You must say that to your colleague.

Ms L BROWN: I am saying it to you.

The SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you very much, thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Ms Brown order.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It was absolute arrogant of him to mention something like that. Mr Speaker, I mean how can it be important who will call the meeting? It is a joke. It is absolutely a joke.

Ms L BROWN: So what is arrogant about that?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: So, Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: A joke and arrogance is not the same. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We also became aware - and I need to mention this,

and the national Minister is also very concerned about this - that there has been a very steep increase in the number of medico-legal cases throughout the country. In fact actually there are legal practices which are specialising in that now. I am tempted to use the word “exploiting” it. They advertise on the radio. They advertise on TV and they are looking for these cases. Actually you know, Mr Speaker, the people who are then the complainants, I actually refer to them as the victims, because they then become part of that medico-legal action and it is - there are high fees applicable, long periods and very often the complainants are still not happy after that whole process has been completed. We have to design and create mechanisms to prevent our people from being exploited to that extent.

Mr Speaker, that is now a lot said about a very simple bill to improve the quality of service that we offer to our patients and to our clients. I am very disappointed that the opposition is not supporting it especially in the absence of any better alternative solution. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister. That concludes the debate on this Order. Are there any objections to the finalisation of the Bill?

If there is an objection, I will put the question. Those in favour of the Bill being finalised will say “aye”.

HON MEMBERS: Aye.

The SPEAKER: Those who are against will say “no”.

HON MEMBERS: No.

The SPEAKER: It seems the ayes have it. Thank you very much.

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the third Order of the Day.

3. Finalisation of *Western Cape Monitoring and Support of Municipalities Bill* [B10B - 2013] (Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning).

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the Minister for Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning, Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker, thank you for affording me the opportunity to discuss the *Western Cape Support and Monitoring of Municipalities Bill*.

Die *Wes-Kaapse Wetsontwerp op Monitering en Ondersteuning van Munisipaliteite*, 2013, gee gevolg aan Artikel 154(1) en 155(6) van die Grondwet deur verder voorsiening te maak vir die ondersteuning aan munisipaliteite in die provinsie en vir maatreëls om die vermoë van munisipaliteite te ontwikkel, te versterk en hul verrigtinge te verbeter. Hierbenewens gee die wetsontwerp gevolg aan Artikel 106 van die *Wet op Munisipale Stelsels* deur in meer besonderhede vir monitering en die

ondersoek van vermoedelijke nie-verrigting en wanadministrasie in die munisipaliteit voorsiening te maak.

Mr Speaker, to put this in perspective, the proposed Bill speaks to the province and its support role to municipalities. The provincial government must perform an oversight role when it comes to municipalities and their monitoring thereof. In essence this Bill creates a mechanism that will allow provincial government to access information to assist them in the monitoring of municipalities. It allows reporting to be combined in one structure, easing the monitoring burden.

When a provincial MEC has reason to believe that a municipality is not complying with the statutory obligation or that serious maladministration, fraud or corruption is taking place, the MEC must in terms of Section 106 of the System Act request information from that municipality or request the Premier to establish a commission of enquiry in accordance with the *Western Cape Commission Act*. The current application of Section 106 makes investigation procedurally cumbersome and restrictive when cohesive powers are needed.

Mr Speaker, while it has been argued that there may be instances where cohesive powers are not appropriate it must be born in mind that in instances of fraud or corruption or serious maladministration where senior managers, accounting officers and political office bearers may be involved, the likelihood of cooperation is very slim. Provincial investigations in these circumstances require a degree of cohesive powers if information is not forthcoming and cooperative governance is not adhered to. The Bill is therefore not about the general monitoring of municipalities, but

monitoring in extreme cases.

Mnr die Speaker, gun my die geleentheid om die belangrike punte van die wetsontwerp met u te deel:

1. Dit erken die verantwoordelikheid van provinsiale regering om die munisipaliteit te ondersteun deurdat klousules 2, 3 en 4 provinsiale regering verplig om plaaslike regering te ondersteun. Geen verpligtinge word op plaaslike regering geplaas nie.
2. Onderskeid word getref tussen die versuim om gehoor te gee aan statutêre verantwoordelikhede as 'n gevolg van die onvermoë om erkenning te gee dat in die situasie die ondersteuning van die provinsie van uiterste belang is.
3. Derdens, dit bemagtig die LUR om 'n ondersoekbeampte aan te stel, maar maak voorsiening vir stappe wat die LUR moet volg voor ondersoek ingestel word.
4. Die beginsel van samewerkende regering word gehoorsaam deurdat die LUR eers inligting oor die aantygings verskaf en dan 'n versoek rig om meer inligting.
5. Ondersoekbeamptes kan dokumente versoek. Indien daar nie gehoor gegee word aan die versoek nie word 'n oortreding begaan.
6. Dit stel die LUR in staat om 'n proses te deurdink, en indien die feite 'n kommissie van ondersoek regverdig, moet hy die Premier nader om dit te

bewerkstellig.

In closing, Mr Speaker, when municipalities are investigated, especially in respect of allegations of fraud and corruption, it is not an attack on or erosion of municipal autonomy. An investigation falls within the municipal schemes whereby provinces exercise oversight over local government. I thank you.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie. Die agb lid mnr Visser.

Mnr J J VISSER: Dankie, mnr die Speaker. Dit is goed om te sien wanneer 'n Minister in sy departement positiewe stappe doen om dienslewering, beter funksionering en voortydige bepaling van hulpondersteuning te laat gebeur. Dit is presies wat die oogmerk van hierdie wetsontwerp behels waarom die agb Minister so pas gepraat het. Hoekom kan 'n Minister se departement nie munisipaliteite ondersteun deur wetgewing in plek te sit om inligting te verkry sodat die departement hul werk behoorlik kan doen en betyds probleme kan identifiseer en aanspreek nie? Moet die staande komitee die wetsontwerp regtig met 'n vergrootglas bekyk vanaf elke bestaande hoek om te sien of dit werklik nodig is vir die wetsontwerp en of dit sou inpas by bestaande wetgewing sonder om te oorvleuel met wetgewing en ook dat dit grondwetlik is en steeds die doel kan dien waarvoor dit bedoel is? Die agb Pierre Uys sal vir u 'n vreeslike tegniese lesing gee oor hoekom hierdie wetsontwerp nie daar moet wees nie. Hy sal aanvoer dat daar alreeds 'n nasionale en 'n provinsiale *Commission's Act* bestaan wat die Premier magtig om 'n kommissie van ondersoek in te stel indien die Minister dit so sou verlang. Hy sal ook vir u sê dat artikels 105 en 106 van die Strukturewet genoegsame leiding aan die Minister gee om toetrede tot 'n munisipaliteit te verkry.

Hy sal ook verwys na artikel 136 van die Grondwet wat bepalings in hierdie verband maak. Hierdie is egter alles 'n rookskerm wat die ANC gebruik om u aandag weg te lei van die werklike rede hoekom hulle teen die wetsontwerp is. Die werklike rede gaan daaroor dat die tyd toe hy 'n Minister was hy nooit 'n innovasie en visie gehad het om hierdie wetsontwerp in te stel nie. Laat ons dit maar 'n soort van professionele jaloesie noem dat die DA nou waarlikwaar die inisiatief het om hierdie stap te doen.

Hierdie is 'n deurdagte stuk wetgewing waarop die Wes-Kaap regering, veral die Minister van Plaaslike Regering, die agb Anton Bredell, en sy departement baie trots kan wees. Die wetsontwerp laat die Minister toe, soos hy self gesê het, om betyds toegang te verkry tot munisipale inligting sonder om die artikel 106 roete te gaan en formele ondersoeke te gelas. Hierdie formele ondersoeke is negatief. Dit versuur verhoudings. Dit is duur en dit is tydrowend. Teen die tyd dat die Minister die inligting het wat hy soek, is dit te laat om betyds ondersteuning te bied om 'n akute probleem op te los. Die meerderheid lede van die Staande Komitee oor Plaaslike Regering het die wetgewing gesteun en ons het kennis geneem van die agb lid mnr Uys se minderheidsstem omtrent hierdie wetgewing. Ek dank u.

'n AGB LID: Mooi.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid mnr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. In terms of the Constitution, Section 155(6), a province by legislative or other measures must provide for the monitoring and support of local government in this province. The extent of this Bill

must be restricted to the monitoring and support of local government. Mr Deputy Speaker, in the first certification judgment of the Constitution “monitor” is described and explained as “observe and keep under review”. In this sense it does not represent a substantial power in itself, certainly not a power to control local government affairs. We do not interpret the monitoring power as bestowing additional or residual powers of provincial intrusion on the domain of local government beyond perhaps the power of measuring or testing, at intervals, local government compliance with national and provincial directives, or with the Constitution itself. Mr Deputy Speaker, in the High Court judgement delivered on the 1st of September 2008 it was said that the monitoring power is weaker in the sense that it does not allow the province to control local government affairs or to launch legislative interventions, exactly what is happening here. It is therefore stated that the monitoring responsibility of a province does not in itself include an investigative responsibility.

Mr Deputy Speaker, Section 155(6) read with Section 154(1) of the Constitution do not include investigation within the concept of monitoring and support. In this comment on the Bill and I am referring to some of the comments that the committee received. Mr Koos Cilliers, legal advisor in the department of the Premier said: “The Bill purports to provide inter alia full monitoring of municipalities.”

But he said further: “Ironically, however, the term “monitors” and “monitoring” appears only three times in the Bill.” That is in the name of the Bill, in the long title, and Deputy Speaker, in the short title, but not in the content of the Bill. In the comment on the Bill by the Provincial Treasury they state:

“There is a ‘disconnect’ between the Bill’s title and content as the bulk of the Bill deals with investigation and not monitoring and support. The long title of the Bill refers to monitoring and investigation but then the DA members in the standing committee - and that was the only amendment - wrongly tried to justify that this Bill is only about monitoring and support. They deleted the word “and investigation” from the long title, Mr Deputy Speaker, but the full text remain the same, where Clauses 6, 7, 9, 11 are just focused on investigation.

In her comments on the draft Bill the Mayor of the City of Cape Town expressed her concern with regard to the following: “The legislative power ascribed to municipalities are not acknowledged; secondly the procedure that the provincial Minister must follow when a decision is taken in terms of Clause 6(A) and 6(B) of the Bill. Thirdly Clause 8 of the Bill pertain to an investigation of a municipality *in toto* and fails to take into account and/or provide for Section 106(4) of the Systems Act.”

I carry on with the Mayor of the City of Cape Town: “No sufficient criteria listed for the selection of investigators.”

I carry on: “No sufficient attention is being paid to the definition of terms used in the Bill.” Mr Deputy Speaker none of the comment or recommendations were included in this Bill.

Verder gaan ek die kommentaar van die Swartland Munisipaliteit meld dat die Departement van Plaaslike Regering nie die vereistes van artikel 36 van die IGRFA nagekom het nie. That is the *Inter Governmental Relations Framework Act*.

In the comment on the Bill the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning stated, and this department is not the national department: “The Bill specifically refers to monitoring in support of municipalities. The Bill, however, fails to adequately link and align with the relevant provisions contained in the *Municipal Systems Act* and its provisions related to municipal performance management systems.” And again, Mr Deputy Speaker, none of the comments or recommendations was included in the Bill. In the Bill provincial Minister means the provincial Minister responsible for local government affairs in the province, excluding - and that was a point that even the DA members agreed on with me, but did not change the legislation - excluding all other provincial Ministers through Section 106 of the Systems Act referred to it. An MEC means all MECs, not only one specific MEC, and this Bill was only drafted for one MEC; totally in contradiction of the approach of the powers and functions of MECs in general.

Mr Deputy Speaker, none of the agreements that were reached during the hearings were included in the Bill, not even adding the provincial legislature in the reporting loop. That was a very important point that was emphasised. But I want to get to some of the specifics of the Bill, Mr Deputy Speaker.

First of all this Bill was advertised from 6 December till 22 January 2013 to 2014, the recess time of all municipalities and all local governments and all councils. Then they say they give effect to Section 106(1) of the Systems Act, but the Constitution is very clear. They must give effect to the Constitution and in the long title they just delete the word “investigation”, but they were too lazy to apply their mind right throughout

the Bill to also make the necessary amendments.

Then there is a reference and most of the people who gave input in the public hearings had a problem with practice notes. The practice notes in one part of clause 4 says it is a “non-binding guideline”, but Mr Deputy Speaker when you read clause 6 it says if the municipality cannot fulfil its statutory obligation the Minister must ensure they implement practice notes. Now where do we stand?

I want to go further, Mr Deputy Speaker. Clause 7(1)(b) provides that the investigator - and where in your life can you hear this - “may determine the format and procedure to be followed in conducting the investigation.” It can’t be. It can never be. The format and procedure can’t be left in the hands of an investigation. This is at least the responsibility, and in terms of the terms of reference, something that the MEC must determine. Investigations determine who may be present or not at proceedings. Will the public be present? We all know they will be excluded.

Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA say “investigation” is also monitoring because that is what we heard there. They deleted the word “monitoring” so that is the same word, but then why did they delete the word “investigation” if they are so worried about that? If investigation is only monitoring then why all the reporting? They must report on the investigation to the NCOP, the national Minister of Local Government, the national Minister of Finance - so it is a very serious issue - and SALGA. Do you know what, Mr Deputy Speaker, I said but that report must also come to this House, to the parliament, this provincial parliament. That was ignored and it was just left out. Let us just refer it to national, to SALGA and to the NCOP - no reporting to the

legislature at all.

If you look at the regulations they are poorly drafted, with one sentence almost giving a blank cheque to the MEC to just draft regulations on every issue. If we look at the offences and the penalties, and there has been reference to that, a person who fails or refuses to produce any document in his or her possession or under his or her control when directed to do so by the investigator commits an offence. So you must hand over a document, if you don't you commit an offence. That makes sense. [Interjections.] So that sounds reasonable, you get a fine, imprisonment not exceeding 12 months, but then you get to a next section, Mr Deputy Speaker [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: The *State Witness Act* says two years, hey.

Mr P UYS: But, Mr Deputy Speaker, a person not cooperating with the investigation or not giving explanations, there is no penalty and it is not an offence. So when I get approached I will just say: "No I am not going to talk to you", but when there is a document I must hand over the document. Inconsistent, making no sense, but the DA just steamrollered this ahead.

This Bill could have been a very outstanding and a very good Bill. Unfortunately it is unconstitutional and it is full of flaws. This Bill I can say today will be on the shelf. It will not be implemented because it is not a practical Bill and it can't help to take local government forward. Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister Bredell to respond, to reply?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie, Mnr die Adjunkspeaker. Kort en bondig, baie dankie aan die agb Johan Visser en sy komitee vir die harde werk. My departement en ek is baie trots op hierdie stuk wetgewing wat ons voor u bring vandag. Die agb lid mnr Uys het 'n tegniese lesing probeer gee en probeer om items na te maak soos net die agb lid mnr Ozinsky kan, maar ek gaan nie daarop te veel reageer nie. Ons ken die ANC as 'n organisasie wat nie van dissipline hou nie. Hulle wil nie dissipline afdwing nie. Ons as DA sal dissipline afdwing. Dit is al hoe ons dienslewering kan verseker aan die mense daar buite en hierdie tipe wetgewing skop in, in 'extreme circumstances' wanneer daar rêrig ernstige vermoedes is van korrupsie ens. Ons kan nie elke keer 'n kommissie van ondersoek loods nie. Die goed kos R 2.5 miljoen elk. Dit vat te lank. Ons het gesien wat die ANC gemaak het met die SIU-ondersoeke. Ons wag sewe jaar na die tyd nog altyd vir uitslae. Ons kry nie die dokumente nie en om munisipale regering na 'n volgende vlak toe te neem moet ons daardie inligting kry. Ons het geen verskuilde agenda hier nie en ek wil van hierdie geleentheid gebruikmaak om al die munisipaliteite wat deelgeneem het te bedank vir hulle insette. Ons het dit geïnkorporeer sover moontlik. Ons het baie nou saamgewerk met ons munisipaliteite want ons is vennote in dienslewering. Ons is nie hulle baas of ons probeer nie vir hulle voorskryf nie. Ek wil my dank betuig aan die staande komitee vir al die ure en die harde werk. Ek stem saam. Ek dink julle het rêrig klousule vir klousule, sin vir sin deur hierdie wetgewing gewerk en dit was alles in 'n goeie gees en alles tot verbetering van plaaslike regering. Ek wil ook my departement se amptenare bedank. Ek dink hulle het ure hier ingesit; ure gedebatteer oor die rigting wat ons inslaan. Ons sê nie dit is perfekte wetgewing nie. Dit sal verander soos wat

ons aangaan soos wat dit nodig is. Dit is nie ongrondwetlik nie. Daarvoor sal ons staan. Dan, mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ook aan die regsafdeling van die Premier se kantoor baie dankie vir hulle werk en hulle harde arbeid met hierdie wetgewing. Ek dank u en ek stel voor dat ons die wetgewing so aanvaar.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That concludes the debate on this Order. Are there any objections to the finalisation of the Bill? There is an objection. I put the question. Those in favour of the finalisation will say “aye”.

HON MEMBERS: Aye.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those against “no”.

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think the ayes have it, and so they have. The objection of the ANC will be recorded. The secretary will read the Bill.

Agreed to (ANC dissenting).

Western Cape Monitoring and Support of Municipalities Bill.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Bill will now be sent to the Premier for assent. The Secretary will read the fourth Order of the Day.

4. Consideration of Report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture and

Environmental Planning on the *Marine Living Resources Amendment Bill* [B 30B – 2013] (NCOP), dated 27 February 2014 (See Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, No 8, dated 28 February 2014, p 12) (Ratification of final mandate).

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! When the House could not sit over the past few days the legislature received the report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning on the *Marine Living Resources Amendment Bill* conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill. This mandate was sent to the NCOP. Are there any objections to the ratification of the confirmative authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support the Bill? No objections?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the fifth Order.

5. Consideration of Report of the Standing Committee on Community Development on the *Judicial Matters Third Amendment Bill* [B 53 – 2013] (NCOP), dated 26 February 2014 (See Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, No 10, dated 4 March 2014, p 14) (Ratification of final mandate).

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! When the House could not sit over the past few days the legislature received the report of the Standing Committee on Community Development on the *Judicial Matters Third Amendment*

Bill conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill. This mandate was sent to the NCOP. Are there any objections to the ratification of the confirmative authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support the Bill? No objections?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the sixth Order.

6. Consideration of Report of the Standing Committee on Local Government on the *Legal Practice Bill* [B 20D – 2013] (NCOP), dated 4 March 2014 (See Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, No 13, dated 6 March 2014, p 19) (Ratification of final mandate).

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! When the House could not sit over the past few days the legislature received the report of the Standing Committee on Local Government on the *Legal Practice Bill* conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP not to support this Bill. This mandate was sent to the NCOP.

We have a speakers list and I see the first speaker, hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The *Legal Practice Bill* was referred to the provincial legislature in terms of Section 76 of the Constitution for deliberation and mandating. The legislation provide for the transformation and restructuring of the

legal profession. Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC supports this while the DA rejects this.

The current legislation pertaining to advocates and attorneys is fragmented and it is regulated by different laws which apply in different parts of the country, and in terms of which the former RSA and former homeland laws are still in operation in various parts of the country. The old order laws will be repealed and replaced by a single law regulating the profession in its entirety [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: So why did Dullah Omar not change it?

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC supports this while the DA rejects this.

Mr M G E WILEY: So why did Dullah Omar not change it?

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the legal profession is also not representative of the demographics of South Africa and entry into the profession is in many instances determined by outdated, unnecessary and over-restrictive prescripts. The legislation would broaden access to justice by putting in place a mechanism to determine fees chargeable by legal practitioners or legal services rendered by them that are within reach of the people. The ANC supports this while the DA rejects this.

It will provide for the rendering of community service by candidate legal practitioners and practicing legal practitioners.

Mr M G E WILEY: Why?

Mr P UYS: The ANC supports this and the DA rejects this. [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker, it will provide equal opportunities for all aspirant legal practitioners in order to have a legal profession that broadly reflect the demographics of the Republic. The ANC supports this ... [Interjections.] ... and the DA rejects this, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Because you are trying to chase them out of business.

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, a single statutory body will be created to regulate the affairs of all legal practitioners.

Mr M OZINSKY: Welcome Dr Verwoerd!

Mr P UYS: The legislation will protect and promote the interest of consumers of legal services. Mr Deputy Speaker, that is important [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: That is socialism.

An HON MEMBER: ANC.

Mr P UYS: This legislation will protect and promote the interest of consumers of legal services ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr P UYS: ... by the establishment, Mr Deputy Speaker, of an office of the Legal Services Ombudsman. The ANC supports this and we hear the DA rejects this. [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker, the legislation recognises the two existing categories of legal practitioners, namely attorneys and advocates, with their own areas of expertise. An attorney may convert his or her enrolment to that of an advocate and vice versa. This will provide for legal practitioners to change direction in their careers, either as attorney or as advocate. Mr Deputy Speaker, the ANC supports this and the DA rejects this. [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, the Minister will be allowed - and this is very important - to set a cap in respect of fees payable by the State for legal services rendered at all three spheres of government. Furthermore, legal practitioners will be required ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is fascism.

Mr P UYS: This is very important because it is all focused on the community and it is important for the people out there. Legal practitioners will be required to give their clients upfront a cost estimate for the legal services required. The cost estimates must include the process involved and mention the client's right to negotiate fees. Failure to comply constitutes misconduct and allows the client to refuse to pay until the matter has been resolved by the council. The ANC supports this but the DA rejects this, Mr Deputy Speaker. The standing committee received written and oral submissions ...

[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: And the Law Society.

Mr P UYS: In their submission the Law Society of South Africa ... [Interjections.] ... fully support the concept that legal practitioners must upfront provide the client with clear explanatory advice on the likely success of the matter and an explanation of the cost implications and how the costs are likely to be calculated, and the ANC supports this while the DA rejects this. [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, it is accepted that fees charged and the geographical spread of law firms have a direct impact on access to justice. In their submission the Black Lawyers' Association found the Bill to be acceptable, that it contains provisions which are progressive and directly affect the previously disadvantaged legal professions, but of course we as the ANC support this while the DA rejects this. After considering the Bill and acknowledging the positive impact this Bill will have on the legal profession and the community at large, all of us here, the ANC, support this Bill.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr R LENTIT: Jerry Springer [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, the hon member Mr Visser.

Mr J J VISSER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms L BROWN: [Inaudible.] You have not even read the Bill, Robin Carlisle.

Mr J J VISSER: Mr Deputy Speaker, to speak about this Bill is like speaking about a dead person. Whatever you say cannot revive the situation. The Bill is already old news. This Bill was referred to the standing committee and local government as a Section 76 Bill to be dealt with. The Committee went through the normal phases with this Bill, briefing by the national Department of Justice, having public hearings and legal advice to the members of the standing committee to be able to consider the Bill, whilst properly informed about it. It is apparent that the national Government is seriously busy with a process to try to gain control over as many entities as possible. The strategies put a high workload on the process, so those who have to work with it will not have adequate time to investigate to do proper public participation and inform themselves properly about the issues at hand.

The legal practice fraternity of South Africa has organised themselves properly and democratically. They have put their own watchdog in place to make sure their members keep to the code of conduct and if not so that they can be disciplined properly. They make sure that the quality of legal practitioners is without question and that the training is of a good standard and a good quality. They have developed a code for transformation in terms of gender equality and race equality and they have made significant progress in this regard. The national government now wants to gain control

over the legal practice community through this Bill. All except for one legal entity spoke against this Bill, asking us to vote against this Bill. It is exactly what the majority of the members of the standing committee did. The ANC voted for the implementation of this Bill, of course ignoring the plea of the people involved in this legal environment. They ignore this plea like they ignore in general the pleas of people out there on a daily basis about many things which touch their lives as ordinary citizens. This Bill is unnecessarily. It is costly. It wants to replace something which already exists and which is functioning properly without question and it is a very bad cut-and-paste copy of the Irish and Australian Bills. It is not necessary for us to always follow suit when other commonwealth countries do something. We must look at our own circumstances and do things which will enhance and better our functioning as a government and a country. This Bill will not have that effect. It is merely an effort to gain control over the legal practice in South Africa as the ANC tries to centralise everything. It is now or never because the ANC will not have the majority they have now after the elections and they know it. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order! That concludes the debate on this Order. Are there any objections to the ratification of the confirmative authority on the Western Cape's delegation in the NCOP not to support the Bill? There is an objection. I put the question, those in favour will say "aye".

HON MEMBERS: Aye.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those against "no".

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think the ayes have it, and so they have. The ANC's objection will be recorded.

Agreed to (ANC dissenting).

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That concludes the business for the day. The House is adjourned until tomorrow.

The House adjourned at 17:35