
THURSDAY, 17 SEPTEMBER 2020

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Good afternoon, hon members. Today we will be using, as usual, the hybrid model for the sitting of the House. We have hon members here present in the Chamber with the Presiding Officer and our Table staff and we welcome all those members who are online with us and we trust that these members are all able to connect. Please may I ask that once again you keep your microphones on mute and that you raise your hand should there be a point of order?

What I would also like to say is just to remind everybody that the same privileges apply during this hybrid sitting. There are language translation services, which are available both in the Chamber as per normal and on Microsoft Teams and please, hon members participating in the sitting of the House must access those via a second device as you have been doing and if you have any problems, please contact the ICT colleagues who are able to assist hon members.

As ruled by the Presiding Officer in the sitting of the House on 23 April 2020, no interjections shall be permitted during the debate. In this regard I also wish to draw the attention of hon members to Rule 40 of our Standing Rules.

I now recognise the Chief Whip.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 20(1), precedence be given to the debate and Order of the Day.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objection? Agreed to.

We will now proceed to the Subject for Discussion in the name of hon Christians, as printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Christians.

SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION

(The illegal land invasions or land grabs in the Western Cape)

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The debate for discussion today is a very serious one, namely illegal land invasions and land grabs. This illegal land grabs and land invasions are not only affecting the Western Cape, but this is a nationwide problem. Gauteng Community Safety MEC said: “Stop the invasion of our farms in the province,” saying that the land grabs are a problem that hurts white farmers as well as black farmers.

Three MECs here in the Province, the MEC for Human Settlements, the MEC for Community Safety and the MEC for Local Government after the invasion of land in Wallacedene, Bloekombos, Khayelitsha, were calling for the leading figures in these invasions to be arrested, and we echo that sentiment. Action must be taken, and action must be taken soon.

There is a spike of land grabs in the province. The other day I was in the Overberg area and you see the land grabs well planned and well-orchestrated. Between April and July 2020 law enforcement officers in the City of Cape Town alone have responded to 260 illegal land invasions, but we as the ACDP, we believe in the rule of law, but we are asking law enforcement agencies to evict and remove these invaders in a humane way.

Hon Speaker, I am asking the question, where are we heading as a country and where are we heading as a province? The ACDP recognises that South Africa is at the critical juncture in history with severe social, economic and political challenges, but this is no excuse to break the law. People have lost confidence in National Government and its inability to give clear direction and policy certainty and hence this contributes to the lawlessness of this country and also this province. We are in dire need for political leadership to solve the serious political issues in our country and in our province and I want to mention that my leader, Reverend Kenneth Meshoe, who is a committed leader, a reliable leader, a trustworthy leader and a God-fearing leader, says that we need to attend to all the needs of all of our people in our province and in our country. Under his leadership the ACDP has a strong vision to see a healthy and prosperous nation. Yes, South Africans, we have hope in this country, we have hope in this province, and Edmund Burke, and I quote, he said:

“Evil thrives when good people do nothing.”

South Africa and this province, there are many, many good people, and they should not leave this country because there is hope for this country, but unlike – hon Deputy Speaker, we have the leader of the EFF, Mr Julius Malema, who thinks he is above the law. They think with their actions they are above the law. With their despicable behaviour in Parliament, and now the latest Clicks debacle and the incitement when it comes to land grabs, we believe they should face the full arm of the law. Examples must be made

otherwise this will get out of control. They have already tarnished the decorum of Parliament and clearly they do not belong there. The ACDP is committed in seeing genuine change and the renewal in our country that is modelled on our value-based norms with integrity, with justice, honesty and respect, we ask you today, where is the respect, where have we gone wrong, and when you see the incitement of the red berets, we know where we went wrong and I believe next year 2021 the EFF will come to the fore because of leading our people astray.

As I said, hon Deputy Speaker, land invasions are a sore issue. When you go to the townships, and you speak to the gogo sitting there, she is a proud homeowner. When you go to the townships... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Okay, I will finish off, hon Deputy Speaker. Of course, the ACDP has got plans for this nation, but we believe that we need decisive leadership and that is where it starts. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. I now recognise hon Premier Winde.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you very much to hon member Christians for putting this debate on the Order

Paper today. I agree with you, absolutely, it is a very serious issue across our province and our country, and you said a critical juncture. I actually think in my mind I agree with you, it is a tipping point. We are at the verge of anarchy and we have to make sure that we deal with this. Now we are here in the Provincial Parliament, in the Legislature, where we legislate and write laws. We are elected to this House, representing the people of this province, and quite frankly, we are a democracy and a democracy can only survive if it has some bedrock foundations and of course those are freedom of expression, freedom of speech, the ability to raise those issues here and outside this House, but of course, for me the most fundamental bedrock in a democracy is the rule of law and the respect for the rule of law.

If I look at some of the words by Justice Mogoeng Mogoeng, where he talked about good governance systems that formed compliance with conventional legislative and constitutional governance prescripts, the entrenchment of human rights culture, the observance of the rule of law and giving priorities to, amongst others, their realisation of legitimate aspirations of the citizenry in terms of the law. And that is what we are all about and that is why I think this is such a critical debate to be having right now and we all need to make sure that every member in this House stands up, uses their freedoms, uses the rights being given to them through the electoral process, and what they took upon themselves when they stood right here in front of this House and swore an allegiance to the Constitution of this Parliament and of this country.

They need to make sure that they stand up and fight for the rule of law and

for the rights of those who are being taken away by this illegal activity and that is really critical at this moment. But of course governments must also lead, but governments also must make sure that the institutions of state are able to do their job as well and quite frankly right now what really bothers me is that we are not able to even get the institutions of state to follow through on the rule of law. So, for example, I mean we have had to put a safety plan in place in this province. The reason we have had to put a safety plan in this province and step up even more than usual is because the national space of policing is not giving us adequate manpower and resources to deal with this tipping point amongst many others.

We stand here in this House often talking about gender-based violence and murder. That is a big driver of this plan, but it starts with littering and the basic first principles of breaking the law, speeding, those things that half of us seem to turn a blind eye to, all the way through to the real serious issues like gender-based violence and we all condemn it here in this House. But sometimes we find some of our politicians leading the process that you have just spoken about, illegal land invasions, but before I get there, Madam Deputy Speaker, I want to talk about the policing.

Now we always know that we talk about too few policemen and women in this province and that is why we are putting extra resources towards that but again Minister Fritz is engaging at a national level because we need more public order police in our province. You spoke about the 260 land invasions in the last – since July, 11 July up until date, on that report.

How do you counter those land invasions? We need to be able to have the public order police to do so. Now if we have a look at allocation of public order police, this province, which in the month of July had the most public protests in the country, the second most protests in the country were in KZN and the third in Gauteng. But who has got the least number of public order police units? The Western Cape!

There should be reallocation of even more public order police units to the provinces that need it. We have four units, when the Eastern Cape has seven units, or the Free State has six units. KZN has seven units, and so we go on. We have four units. It is totally unacceptable, and we need this reallocated so that those who are not adhering to our Constitution and the rule of law can be dealt with.

Madam Deputy Speaker, we also need to talk about the land invasions themselves and the numbers are astounding, for this period last year only in the City of Cape Town - and remember it is happening in all of our municipalities - they dealt with 15 000 demolitions of structures that were illegally erected. On those 260 land parcels that the honourable member speaks about, so far they have demolished 60 321 units. We have had 28 230 units that have been pegged out but have not been built yet. This is nearly 100 000 illegal occupations. Now for me adhering to the rule of law asks for everyone to do so, and what happens is the people who suffer at the end of the day are the people in our province who adhere to the rule of law. Those people that sit on the waiting list year after year, calmly waiting, not taking

to the streets, not burning of tyres, it is unacceptable that they just get pushed back and back and back and my colleague for Human Settlements will be talking about this about how we need to rectify this and work hard to make sure we catch up. We have also got to get the economy going because it is not only governments that can provide this. We have also got to get people to be able to provide for themselves. And now in post-COVID-19 we are in a difficult position, both in the ability from budgets for governments to provide, but at the same time to actually get the economy going so that people can also provide for themselves, and this brings me to another point, not only illegal land invasions, but illegal building invasions.

Right now, and we will have an interpellation on this as well, on some of our buildings in our inner city, at the moment we have people occupying illegally the Woodstock Hospital, a site which has been identified to actually create opportunities for those people on the waiting list who wait patiently, but the illegal activity, the breaking of the law and claiming of this space, on 104 Darling Street, a National Public Works building, also illegally occupied. The Helen Bowden site, which we really want to create many opportunities for many people who deserve an opportunity by this Government, illegally occupied, fuelled and pushed forward through illegal practices, not upholding the rule of law. This is unacceptable. The Circus School, the Arcadia pavement, the Al Noor Building in Woodstock, and so we go on, illegal occupation of properties that push those people in our province who deserve those spaces further back. It is unacceptable and we have to bring this to a halt, and so, Madam Speaker, what I want to

say is that specifically the members of this Legislature we get elected and we swear an allegiance to the Constitution. It is absolutely unacceptable when members in this House and members of the political parties in this House incite people to behave illegally, incite people to move onto pieces of land where the land has been allocated to someone on that waiting list and it gets taken. That right gets taken away from them and I agree on your point of the full might of the law needs to come in here and if any member of this House, in this side of the House, in the ruling party's side or any other, we need the rule of law to be applied and those people need to face consequences even more severely than anybody else, because we have stood up here and signed allegiance. We are calling ourselves a democracy, when in actual fact the founding statement of a democracy is the rule of law.

We need to fight for this with everything that we have got within us and every single person in this Legislature needs to be fighting for that specific basic right and that basic foundational moment in any democracy because if we are at that tipping point, if we are at that juncture, to claw back if we go over the edge is almost impossible. You have to go through absolute anarchy and riot before you come back. History has shown us that. We cannot allow this province or this country to go down that road and every single person in this Parliament needs to in this debate agree that we will all stand together in making sure that we do not allow illegal activity to prejudice our province, to prejudice the people in our province. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier Winde. I now recognise hon Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Madam Deputy Speaker, all open fields in our working-class communities are targeted by land-hungry masses of our people. In Khayelitsha alone almost all existing pockets of land have been targeted, the latest being the one in front of the Khayelitsha Magistrate's Court. This has far-reaching consequences, especially for our public purse. We are on record condemning this spate of land grabs, particularly the criminal element associated with it, of people who invade land so they can sell it back to desperate people in society.

There has also been talk of the companies that provide basic services to informal settlements, as well as security companies being instigators of these illegal land invasions. The Government should institute an urgent investigation into the causes of these widespread coordinated invasions in the province. Where genuine concern such as the need for housing arises, then the Government should commit itself to accelerate the provision of human settlements in the province. Contrary to the persistent myths that the ANC supports the ongoing spate of illegal land invasions, the ANC is vehemently opposed to the land grabs.

In its 54th National Conference the ANC clearly denounced the Act and resolved that land invasions must be curbed through appropriate bylaws, which includes fast-tracking the amendment of the Prevention of Illegal

Evictions Act 1998 to deal with the land for housing development. These lies are often peddled by the DA when it wants to evade accountability and public scrutiny for all the pockets of land suitable for human settlements in addressing the apartheid spatial legacy that it has cheaply sold to private property developers since 2006.

For a 14-year period the DA in the Western Cape has been running roughshod over the livelihoods and rights of the land-hungry masses of our people. The capture of the DA by the private property developers has brought us to this crisis of land grabs. We have a feudal system of land ownership in the Western Cape, where property developers have nobility of power over the serfs.

To prove this, you have to look no further than the case of the Philippi Horticultural area where the Government tormented the emerging farmers, thereby threatening their livelihoods and those of the workers and placed food security at risk. These actions have triggered untold misery for the people. Once again, the Western Cape High Court had to come to the rescue. The draconian measures of the cruel Government to rezone the prime agriculture land for development, was stopped by the Court.

The Western Cape High Court was also involved in stopping the sale of the Tafelberg site to developers. At the core of the case was the charge by the activists that the State has failed to redistribute public land for housing

redress in the province. This failure to redistribute land has led to antagonism and apathy that we are seeing in the working-class communities towards the State. The poor have lost all hope that the State will ever build them houses and they have now resorted to the widespread land grabs. The people have seen the continual underspending and wasteful expenditure of capital budgets especially for housing in other mega projects and have given up on this Government. This is happening in the city and the province with a violent history of land dispossession during apartheid colonialism. The implementation of the apartheid segregationist policies included the policy influx control and the Group Areas Act of 1950, which saw thousands of black people removed from many suburbs.

The ongoing gentrification in certain parts of the city is the continuation of these apartheid policies. The Court told the Provincial Government and the City that in terms of Sections 25 and 26 of the Constitution they have a constitutional and statutory obligation to advance equitable access to land; realise the right to adequate housing and to redress spatial apartheid. The Court has ordered that they must comply with the obligations to address spatial apartheid and must submit a comprehensive report to the Court by 31 May 2021 which details the steps that they have already taken to do so, the future steps they will take to do so, and when will these future steps be taken?

While the DA awaited for the order to do the right thing, the ANC in its

54th Conference agreed that the creation of new cities and town planning should promote de-racialisation of society and development, consolidation of urban areas, and that this must include accelerating, the implementation and consolidation of human settlement development legislation to utilise suitably positioned land for housing and the enforcement of existing laws and bylaws.

Our call to the Premier is not to waste taxpayers' money by appealing the ruling. What is needed is a moratorium on the sale of all state and municipal land. We need an urgent land audit of all pockets of land owned by the Provincial Government and municipalities. Special focus should be paid to the Stellenbosch Municipality. In its 2016 Draft Policy for the Management of Municipal Agricultural Land, we saw that over 1400 hectares of land were leased. The majority of these leases commenced in April 1991 up until March 2041 – our people without land, whilst others are enjoying benefits of illegal apartheid land deals.

I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Smith. I now recognise hon Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Yesterday the Standing Committee for Human Settlements was brought up to speed on the devastating impacts which land invasions have on our residents,

officials, projects and ability to provide essential services.

R1,3 billion worth of housing opportunities are currently under threat by land invasions. In Cape Town alone these invasions deprived our residents of critical infrastructure upgrades worth R162 million to deliver one of the most basic needs – water.

With these infrastructure projects under threat, the promise of dignified sanitation and improved health will not be realised for the most vulnerable.

The question, hon Deputy Speaker, is what does land invasion mean to the Western Cape communities? It means 11 000 housing opportunities have been denied to deserving beneficiaries. It means that many housing beneficiaries who have already been on the waiting list for more than 15 years have to wait even longer. These are the residents who have respected the rule of law and put their dreams on hold while projects and budgets align to their advantage. Instead of realising this dream, they are assaulted by those who have no respect for the rule of law. These are people who think nothing of jumping the queue and holding both Government and taxpayers to ransom. They prey on the desperate through shack farming which they know will only bring people into conflict with the law. They work with political opportunists whose platform is about personal gain rather than respect for the Constitution and upholding the rule of law.

The shack farmers, invasion ringleaders and political opportunists are criminals and I, for one, support the call for new laws in our province and municipalities, which will decisively deal with such criminal elements. Deputy Speaker, it cannot be ignored. These invasions are symptomatic of an acute need for adequate housing near economic opportunities.

This DA supports a vision of integrated liveable cities which will undo the damage of apartheid spatial planning. It is this vision which underpins the programmes and projects of the Western Cape Government. In our approach to land invasions we must be mindful that there are real humans involved with real needs which we are duty-bound to uphold. We must be mindful of the real desperation felt by so many who simply want the security of a roof over their head and the hope of tenure that they will not have this roof removed and that they can return to the same place after a long day of work to their family and belongings.

While this desperation cannot be denied, the rule of law must be upheld. Those who qualify to receive a housing opportunity and who have been on the waiting list cannot be jeopardised by invaders. Delivering housing to those who qualify to receive a housing opportunity and who are on the waiting list is a priority in the Western Cape. It must be done fairly and equitably. Violent protest and the destruction that go along with it, do nothing to deliver housing opportunities. Hon Deputy Speaker, I applaud the excellent work dedication and high degree of professionalism demonstrated by our housing and security officials in grappling with this

complex issue. We must remain resolute in achieving our vision of achieving of delivering housing opportunities and essential services, infrastructure to deserving beneficiaries. We must not allow the sabotage of criminal land invaders and political opportunists to stop us. I thank you. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Maseko. I now recognise hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. What we are dealing with is a failure of supply of housing opportunities in the face of overwhelming demands and we will not solve this by focusing on policing and security alone. It is a fundamental and inarguable fact that a human being must live somewhere. Being human means that you must live somewhere at all times. That is not a choice. At the end of the day you must go home somewhere to eat, to sleep and to be home. We continuously talk about rapid urbanisation and it is a phenomenon in every developing world city but then we act surprised and outraged when land is occupied in an unplanned way.

When human beings have nowhere else to be and occupy land we are confronted by the reality that we have not planned a home for them and we created an environment ripe for exploitation and when they occupy land

that was meant for someone else that disadvantages another homeless person unfairly, but it is our failure to provide an alternative that we are confronted by too. Those who exploit the homeless, the poor and the desperate by so-called shack-farming or selling access to land that they do not have any right to sell, must be prosecuted for the fraud they are committing, but we must find solutions to neutralise the exploitation and to allow people to live somewhere we recognise as legitimate. The solutions do not exist if we do not acknowledge that our supply of housing is dwarfed by the demand and that everybody must live somewhere.

Our supply is constrained because we act trapped by the National Housing Programme and by the National Grant Funding, but we can find our own solutions. The pressure chamber of access to affordable housing exists across the entire income spectrum and we will only release this pressure in a manageable way if we increase the supply of housing by both the private sector and the public sector. We must increase the supply of housing across the full spectrum of income bands. The private sector needs to develop faster. They need to develop approvals faster and enhanced development rights in the right places and in return for those enhanced development rights they must contribute affordable housing units ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: End off please.

Mr B N HERRON: This is the very essence of inclusionary housing. Thank

you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise hon Marais from the Freedom Front.

Mr P J MARAIS: I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The question arises – is South Africa a failed state? There are only demands with limited supply, but nobody wants to admit it – they only demand, demand, demand! We had 238 land invasions, 60 644 illegal structures, a fence that even a handicapped person or a visually impaired person can cross over from Zimbabwe in pitch dark. That is our plan how we can cope. You cannot stop a bathtub from overflowing if you refuse to close the tap. The tap comes from our neighbouring states. The demand comes from neighbouring states for housing. They are overflowing our borders and we do nothing to stop it. We have shack-farming because we believe it is part of BEE.

But I want to ask the DA – what happened to the housing waiting list where hundreds of thousands of Coloured people are on, waiting for houses? Why does the Minister say that the list – something has happened; but there is no more list. Who let the list disappear? Is that part of the DA's policy to let the list disappear mysteriously?

I challenge them: publish the list, Minister Simmers. Dan Plato, publish the list of people who are on a housing waiting list for 30 years and

qualify for a house. Do not let Zimbabweans jump the queue. They jump the queue and they have the Human Rights Commission backing them, not even knowing where they came from.

Now I want to ask them, where is this list? We want to see the list. Do not go queue-jumping for housing and please define... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off please, hon member.

Mr P J MARAIS: Define what a family is. A naked man standing in front of a shack is not a family. He does not even have a wife or a child, but he is entitled to a house now ahead of people waiting for more than 30 years for a house.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon member. Thank you very much. I now recognise hon Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, yesterday during the Human Settlements Standing Committee meeting we again heard how DA-led governments have been vilified, hit with court case after court case and accused of being anti-poor in its attempt to prevent continuous and orchestrated land invasions, and yet how in the City of Johannesburg and Gauteng Province governed by the ANC, are being hailed for their decisive action in dealing with land-grabbing syndicates. Similar actions, hon Deputy Speaker, but different optics.

We further heard on what is occurring in other metros, like Buffalo City, Ekurhuleni and Tshwane, and unsurprisingly there is no sign of outrage by the National Minister of Human Settlements, Lindiwe Sisulu, or the ANC at large. Why the double standards?

Hon Deputy Speaker, now is not the time to be scoring political points. Here in the Western Cape we direct our efforts towards finding solutions. Firstly, it is high time that all metros and local municipalities recognise and acknowledge that the problem of land invasions is worsening at the expense of the provision of dignified housing opportunities and unless a coordinated and multi-pronged strategy is developed to address this scourge, every city and town is at risk of losing vast parcels of land to land-grabbers, which serves only to lengthen the waiting time on the housing list.

We can begin to see, hon Deputy Speaker, that if the ANC and its cohorts stop with this “us and them” narrative against the DA-led City of Cape Town, as in this province, which hinders any kind of collaboration on the problem and which is evident in the ploy to pin SAPS vs Law Enforcement.

Members of the ANC should also be aware that the attempt to deflect blame to the EFF does not align with the reality on the ground. The fact is that members of both parties have coordinated land invasion attempts and if the ANC truly believes what they said today, then what are they doing about their members that are invading land?

Secondly, hon Deputy Speaker, like the Premier mentioned earlier on, the extent of land invasions and the protest action within the City of Cape Town justify the need for public order policing members now more than ever.

The Institute of Security Studies recently confirmed that the Western Cape has reached the most protest actions since the start of lockdown between March and the end of July 2020 with the Western Cape recording 33% of all protest action within the country.

However, a recent reply to a parliamentary question revealed that the Western Cape had less Public Order Policing members than the Eastern Cape. This is not okay, hon Deputy Speaker. The role of POPS is mandated by the Constitution which determines that the main function of this service is to maintain public order. This includes land invasion which more than often lead to further service delivery protests as illegal occupiers will ultimately demand further services mostly on land that is unserviceable. Also, it is to protect and secure the inhabitants of the Republic and their property and to uphold the law and to enforce it.

Hon Deputy Speaker, this implies that POPS maintain public order intelligence driven combating and preventative operations, the additional POPS members that are needed to supplement a wider set of policing measures and the gathering of credible intelligence so that SAPS can ultimately investigate the high flyers and the instigators to make the

arrests that lead to successful prosecutions.

In conclusion, hon Deputy Speaker, I am further taken aback by the failure of National Government to correct the shortcomings of the Prevention of Illegal Evictions and Occupation Act, a request which SALGA have directed to National Government over several years. These shortcomings have created an unrealistic and undue burden on the public and private landowners to protect land which in part is fuelling the process. While I welcome the move by Minister Fritz for an increased allocation of POPS officers, I would urgently call for the investigation on the failures of the PIE Act and to put an end to the ANC's hypocrisy on this matter.

Here in the Western Cape, hon Deputy Speaker, we are a solutions-driven Government and we do not respond to every political cat-call but we call on our National Government where it fails in what is due to the Western Cape. The DA will use its oversight role effectively to support the development of sustainable housing opportunities in the Western Cape without compromising the safety of residents or respondents and one that promotes a viable use of public land in this province. I thank you.
[Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise hon Marran. Hon Marran?

Mr P MARRAN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Good afternoon to

everyone present. Hon Deputy Speaker, land hunger is very high in the Western Cape and this is mostly because this Province thinks it is a colonial entity on its own; it is above all other people. This Government does not understand the plight of the people and it thinks it rules like an emperor. It is locked away in its high ivory tower and it will speak and decide for all.

Instead of freeing up all available public land that is idling or unused, the DA gives it to private developers, opening up all communal land to take some of the pressure away. It is not an option for the DA. These residents need land for human settlements and dignified survival, and there are those that want to own a piece of land, take part in our economy and use that land as a business to create wealth, and to be a citizen that owns a piece of South Africa. They too want to be landowners and entrepreneurs despite decades and centuries of oppression.

For this we have a plan, to restore land to those who were arbitrarily deprived of it by colonialist apartheid, social engineering or forced removals; another plan to redistribute the land to have more people be the owners of this country.

In the Western Cape too few people share the land. Some say around 2% of the province's owners are of colour, which is far too little. It does not reflect the reality or demography of this province or region. Not even fractional ownership or share schemes substitute real and full ownership.

Colonialists came here with a single intent – to get hold of our resources, including land to build a hospital or two for disease-ridden sailors and produce for fresh food for them, and to get cheap labour, and they even brought slaves here. They did not bring land on these wooden vessels. These colonialists caused mega farmers to control the land and dominate farming-related industries and development goals today. Is it any wonder then that the DA sides with the elite farmers and the funding, even to the extent the DA fought for especially wine farmers in the lockdown period and went out of their way to legalise wine consumption and sales from the State school premises. Now that we also see the right-wing AfriForum disguised as a human rights group, running to the Cape High Court to so-called fight for farmers and landowners, a lobby group that is rich enough to fight its own legal and other battles. This lobby group and its partners resist all forms of restitution and reform. Even the most worthy causes are strongly opposed. In fact, they specialise in opposing anything black. They may make a few politically correct gestures but at heart they are still trapped in the past and colonial era gone by. They long for the centuries of land dispossession and are fine with the apartheid inheritance of colonial legacy. They even tried to convince us how good it is for us.

While we work hard as a country to correct many years of wrong there are those that want to use the impatience against us. Not before, during lockdown or after it shall South Africa allow people to grab other's property, in perpetuating the evil apartheid colonialism by misguided actions. The rule of law must prevail.

We will not permit illegal actions by those who are encouraged by people with ulterior motives. If you do not follow the legal route you will be dealt with by the law. Do not cry after. All are warned in advance. Those that incite others will be unmasked, publicly exposed and dealt with by the police – no excuses. Do not jump the queue and do not abuse other people. Instead, all must remain calm and make sure they have raised the interest at the relevant department, land or agriculture and municipalities where the master plan of a residential development should be. The DA learnt a few lessons as it tried during the lockdown to bully or bulldoze people, using eviction orders.

So keen is Cape Town where the biggest urban need for proper housing is that it had a citizen dragged out of his home, naked, in full public view and humiliatingly beaten up by law enforcement storm troops. The same City failed to spend its housing allocation over the last financial year. It failed to spend many a budget over multiple financial years. To go and listen to the plight of landless people cannot be seen as instigation. It is called decisive leadership - something the DA failed in, in this regard. To this shameless DA we say stop your silly games and negotiate with people with a real housing plan on how to fix the problem. I thank you.
[Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now

recognise hon Minister Simmers.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I would like to categorically state that illegal land grabs or invasions do not benefit anyone, except those who are seeking to act in an unlawful manner, create anarchy as we have heard so many speakers before me say and give vulnerable people false hope so the provision of a housing opportunity will be fast-tracked. This is not how the Western Cape works. †Ons is nie 'n banana-republiek nie. [We are not a banana republic.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, we have consistently shown to be a provincial government that functions within the ambit of the rule of law and we will continue to do so, particularly when it comes to the provision of housing opportunities.

†Ons gaan nie toelaat dat individue of groepe probeer om voor ander in die lyn in te beweeg nie. Inteendeel, ons is daartoe verbind om ons bejaardes, persone met 'n mediese gesertifiseerde gestremdheid, dié wat 15 jaar of langer op die behuisingswaglys is en ons agterplaasbewoners eerste te help. Dit is uiters belangrik, agb Speaker, dat elke persoon wat oorweeg gaan word tog op die behuisingswaglys moet wees, en daar bestaan 'n waglys, want indien jy nie geregistreer is nie kan dit letterlik onmoontlik wees vir ons as Regering om jou te kan bystaan.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[We are not going to allow that individuals or groups try to move into the queue in front of others. In fact, we are committed to first assist our aged, persons with a medically certified disability, those who have been on the housing waiting list for 15 years or longer, and our backyard dwellers. It is very important, Deputy Speaker, that every person who will be considered should indeed be on the housing waiting list, and there exists a waiting list, because if you are not registered it can literally be impossible for us as Government to be able to assist you.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, since taking office I have made it a priority to ensure that the provision of housing opportunities is accelerated particularly for our vulnerable people, as they are the ones that are being denied a housing opportunity when these land grabs occur.

†Is dit nie genoeg dat ons kwesbare mense reeds al so lank moet wag nie, en nou deur hierdie grondgryping word dit verder vertraag. Hierdie is absoluut onaanvaarbaar.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Is it not enough that our vulnerable people had to wait for so long already, and now through these land grabs it is delayed further. This is absolutely unacceptable.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, let us now contextualise this to what has been

happening over the last few months in this province. When it comes to a new Greenfield or brand new housing development, it takes in excess of three to five years for a project to be completed to the point that we hand over units to our beneficiaries. This process includes working smarter to obtain all the relevant and required statutory approvals which amongst others consist of town planning, environmental impact studies, land surveying, engineering services, and indeed the process of building the physical units themselves.

The moment land earmarked for housing development is illegally invaded it can delay our processes to deliver these much-needed housing opportunities by three months to five years and in rare instances in this province has been even longer. This delayed timeframe is so because it is often required from my Department to engage in lengthy to very expensive litigation to remove, ironically, individuals who illegally occupy these pockets of land and all these legal actions are funded from money which we need and wanted to and could have spent on delivering further units to the beneficiaries in our province. Every cent wasted on litigation means a cent less towards delivery to our law-abiding citizens.

Various projects in the City of Cape Town which have been earmarked to commence within this current financial year can no longer go ahead due to these illegal invasions and I will give some examples, hon Deputy Speaker. In Khayelitsha and to be exact and I hope member Marran is listening, in Enkanini 11 000 housing opportunities are lost, still in Khayelitsha, this

time in Macassar, Harare and Kuyasa, 1570 housing opportunities are lost, and in Maroela North just in Kraaifontein, 1687 housing opportunities are gone forever.

Due to these illegal invasions and the selfish and criminal action of these invaders more than 14 000 housing opportunities that were earmarked as development opportunities for our elderly and vulnerable persons with disabilities, backyard dwellers and those who have been patiently waiting for 15 years and longer, are now no longer available and this all within the last three-and-a-half months. It is gone!

†Dit is weg. Dit is vir ewig weg en dit is so weg soos wat die son die mis wegraap by 'n Karoo sonopkoms, iets waarvan agb lid Mitchell goed sal kan weet.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[It is gone. It is gone forever and as gone as the sun absorbing the mist during a Karoo dawn, something the hon member Mitchell will know about very well.]

Another example, and one that is outside of the City of Cape Town, is Schulphoek. Here the entire northern section of the area where a planned project was to occur, has been invaded with approximately 2 300 structures

on this piece of land as we speak and all of this in a timeframe of 18 months. Even though we have had various engagements and agreements with various stakeholders in this specific community, we continue to find certain individuals not cooperating and the effect of this, hon Deputy Speaker, no development can occur on that portion of land, opportunities are gone for much needy individuals within the community of Zwelihle. It can happen no more.

This clearly demonstrates how these illegal invasions are directly affecting people's lives, hon Deputy Speaker. The desperate pleas and tears of those that are waiting mean absolutely nothing to these illegal land invaders, and sadly the African National Congress and the EFF are the propellants of this. There is sufficient proof on social media. These invaders, just like these two parties that I have just highlighted, they do not have a caring backbone in their bodies. We keep on hearing history lessons when we talk to the realities of today.

Hon Deputy Speaker, further to this, when land is invaded we are also required to now divert much needed and limited resources away from qualifying beneficiaries who have waited patiently for an opportunity, towards those who have firstly illegally occupied the land, created new informal settlements and then they start with all of their demands for basic services. †Die geld val nie uit die lug uit nie. Dit moet van êrens vandaan af kom. [The money does not fall from the air. It has to come from somewhere.]

Should these services not be provided as the City of Cape Town so regularly experiences, they are even further disruptive and they start having protests, damaging social infrastructure and holding certain aspects of the City's economy to ransom, †maar hulle het onwettig die grond beset. Waar is die rasionaliteit in dit? [but they have occupied land illegally. Where is the rationality in that?]

†Agb Adjunkspeaker, dan wil sommige in hierdie Huis, en ek het nou aandagtig geluister vandag, vra waarom geormerkte geleenthede spreekwoordelik tussen die vinger en die duim wegraak. Besef die realiteit, skrik wakker en ruik die koffie!

Ons is almal bewus daarvan dat die huidige behuisingswaglys byna 600 000 aansoeke het en gemiddeld wag ons begunstigdes in die Wes-Kaap 15 jaar of selfs meer in sommige gebiede. Ons is daarop ingestel om hierdie agterstand aan te spreek en daarom is dit een van ons vereistes dat hierdie kwalifiserende wetsgehoorsame inwoners eerste bygestaan moet word, en ek kan nie toesien dat persone wat gister op die waglys gekom het of wat gister en vanoggend grond beset het nou skielik onmiddellik bygestaan moet word nie. Hoe verduidelik ons dit aan mense wat so lank wag, en dit ten koste van mense wat nie eers die wet oortree nie. Hulle woon alle gemeenskapsvergaderings by. Al wat hulle net vra is: “Sê net vir ons, wanneer kry ons ons kans...” – maar sommige mense wil nie wag nie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Hon Deputy Speaker, then some members in this House, and I have listened carefully today, want to know why earmarked opportunities figuratively disappear between the forefinger and the thumb. Grasp the reality, wake up and smell the coffee!

We are all aware that the current housing waiting list contains almost 600 000 applications and on average our beneficiaries in the Western Cape wait 15 years and even longer in some areas. We are committed to address this backlog, and therefore it is one of our requirements that these qualifying law-abiding citizens should be assisted first, and I cannot allow that persons who had come onto the waiting list yesterday or who had occupied land yesterday or this morning should now suddenly be assisted immediately. How do we explain that to people who have waited for so long, and that at the expense of people who had not even transgressed the law. They attend all community meetings. All they ask is: “Just tell us, when do we get our chance...” – but some people don’t want to wait.]

When I recently handed over houses in Vlakkeland, hon Deputy Speaker, I had the honour of engaging an elderly woman of 70 years old and in jovial isiXhosa, because she has lived in an informal structure for more than 40 years, she was so happy to receive her house, but more so because there was a threat, not only of land invasion of the Vlakkeland site, but also invasion of our specific units and there are over 400 units that are at

various stages of handing over, and her words – I am going to quote her, she said: “At least this moment has happened to me, and I hope that the attempts of invasion do not happen again because there are still others like me that are still waiting for their homes, Minister.”

Regrettably, Deputy Speaker, due to the illegal invasions there are thousands of deserving and qualifying beneficiaries, who will not have a similar moment of joy. †Hulle ontneem baie mense se oomblik van geluk. [They deny many people their moment of joy.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, large-scale Greenfield developments cannot occur without land and I need to emphasise development of land, and therefore as the Western Cape Government we have made more than 365 hectares of land available for integrated human settlements development and this will yield in excess of 20 000 housing opportunities, †maar ons kan alles maak in die Wes-Kaap maar ons kan nie grond maak nie, want nie alle grond behoort aan hierdie Provinsiale Regering of sy plaaslike owerhede nie. [but we can create everything in the Western Cape but we cannot create land, because not all land belongs to this Provincial Government or its local authorities.]

We have done this as we want to ensure that the most vulnerable and deserving beneficiaries are provided with this opportunity, but the reality is that more development of land is required and if all spheres of government make land available for development of integrated human

settlements we would be able to assist a lot more people every year.

Now the custodian of national land is Ms Patricia de Lille who has continuously refused to release specific pockets of land within the City of Cape Town which would yield 120 000 housing opportunities. These sites are Culemborg, Ysterplaat, Denel, Youngsfield and Greenfields, all well located and in the hands – sadly still – of the National Minister. She refuses to release it to this Province, but in addition to this, that which she has released, we have yet to receive power of attorney, because without power of attorney we as a provincial department and provincial government cannot do anything, hon Deputy Speaker.

†Beide konkrete voorbeelde wat ek nou genoem het, agb Adjunkspeaker, wys duidelik hoe belangrik dit is dat alle regeringsfere moet saamwerk om die Wes-Kaap se behuisingskwessie op te los. Dit gaan nie net oor een spesifieke sfeer van regering nie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Both concrete examples I have just mentioned, hon Deputy Speaker, show clearly how important it is that all spheres of government should cooperate to solve the Western Cape's housing issue. It is not about just one specific sphere of government.]

But it does, however, not stop there. Our communities also have a massive

role to play and I would like to take this opportunity to implore our communities to work with Government and to work through the relevant Government structures in respect of the housing needs. †Moet nie die reg in eie hande neem nie. Jy gaan lelik tweede kom. [Do not take the law into your own hands. You will lose badly.]

Those with a genuine housing need must ensure that they are registered on the Housing Demand Database and if they are, to ensure that we have the correct contact details for them. In addition to this they should also engage the relevant structures such as the Project Steering Committees and ward councillors to receive factual information and not allow so-called community leaders to mislead them.

Hon Deputy Speaker, in closing I would like to remind all members present here and virtually, we are all leaders in our own right and we should be part of the solution and not the problem, as this will demonstrate to the public, which we have been elected to serve, that we are true political leaders in service of them.

†In Afrikaans is daar 'n gesegde en ek wil weereens hiermee afsluit. Om onwettig iets te neem is so maklik soos 'n hanetreetjie, maar onbeskaamde hoop en regverdigheid triomfeer altyd,

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[In Afrikaans there is a saying and again I want to finish off with this. To take something unlawfully is as easy as a small step, but unbridled hope and justice always triumph,] †and what we have been observing the last three-and-a-half months will not last forever. The rule of law will prevail and those that are law-abiding citizens, we as the Western Cape Government care for our citizens and we will ensure, because you have done your part, that we will play our part. I thank you very much. [Applause.]

HON MEMBERS: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. That brings us to the end of the Order of the Day.

We now proceed to Interpellations on the Question Paper. I recognise the hon Premier Winde.

INTERPELLATIONS

1. Mr B N Herron asked the Premier:

The Western Cape High Court judgment in the Tafelberg review application found that the Provincial Government had failed to take adequate steps to redress spatial apartheid in central Cape Town and that the Government has no plans to do so:

(a) Why did the Court make this finding and (b) how will the Western Cape Provincial Government implement spatial integration and develop affordable housing in the inner city?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you very much to hon Herron for the question. My response is as follows:

1(a) – I would like to direct the hon Herron and all members of this House to page 210 to 214 of the judgment. The Cape High Court made no finding that this Provincial Government has no plans to redress spatial apartheid in Cape Town.

In fact the Court states at paragraph 487 of that judgment that the more recent decisions of the Province as regards affordable housing close to the inner-city demonstrates that a more inclusive approach to the aspect, which recognises the importance of reversing spatial apartheid incrementally, is now being applied.

As to why the Court made the findings it did in that matter, I am constrained to point out that in terms of Rule 196 (3)(d) any question in terms of which the expression of an opinion is requested, is impermissible.

Given that member Herron appears to be asking for my opinion on this judgment, I am constrained to refuse to offer member Herron my opinion as to why the Western Cape High Court came to the conclusion it did in

this matter.

And (b), the Western Cape Government is still in the process of considering the judgment and its effects on both the administration and the Executive of the Western Cape Government going forward. In consultation with our officials and counsel, this is being done both in the context of the wide-ranging declaratory orders that have been made as well as the ambit and effect of the structural interdict. It would be imprudent of me to provide any more detailed comment on the matter at this stage until that process is completed.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the question raised as to the Province's plans for further spatial integration in Cape Town, is however not dependent on this judgment or any appeal thereof, while this question should have been directed to Minister Simmers or Minister Bredell, given their respective portfolios of Human Settlements and Planning.

I can confirm that the Western Cape Government is committed to moving forward with the Conradie site as well as the Somerset precinct for redevelopment, both of which will be affordable housing at scale on a cross-subsidised basis.

We have every intention of completing these projects as soon as reasonably possible. The Helen Bowden site at the Somerset precinct has been rezoned for development. This development will put social housing on land right next

to the Waterfront, some of Africa's most prime real estate. The Conradie site is just outside the CBD, and is also close to an economic opportunity space, like Goodwood and Epping Industria and is within walking distance of train stations.

Construction of the first phase, which will include over 400 social housing units has already begun. The project will also include FLISP units, schools and open market housing. The Belhar CBD is at an advanced stage of development and includes mixed use housing near to the Bellville CBD. What is unique about this development is that it will not only provide housing, FLISP units and subsidised units for military veterans, it will also include student accommodation close to some of the Western Cape's largest universities. And so the same policy goes on in municipalities across this province and in CBDs across this province.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. I now recognise hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, I was not asking for the Premier's opinion, I was asking for the Premier to explain how we have a Vision Inspired Priority Number 4 which commits this Government to achieve mobility and spatial transformation and we have a High Court that found that no such plans exist.

In fact, the High Court said that it is evident to this Court that the Province's

policies in relation to the reversal of apartheid spatial planning and the promotion of social housing are, to all intents and purposes, non-existent. This case was argued in November 2019 in this term of office, and after this Premier had promised this Parliament to try and settle this litigation. That is why this interpellation is posed to the Premier.

If this VIP4 was in fact presented to the Court, it was obviously very unconvincing because the Court said the official line from the Province bears the hallmark of the entrenchment of apartheid spatial planning and a seemingly blunt refusal to engage with the problem and the Court found that the politicians were the ones at fault, not the officials. The officials were side-lined and ignored by three Cabinets. The Court said what is of concern about the approach of the Province is the apparent disharmony one sees between the frank admissions of the departmental functionaries as to the necessity for a programme addressing affordable housing generally on the one hand, and on the other hand, the uncompromising attitude of its political functionaries that there is no room for poor people in central Cape Town. The Court found that this Government believes that there is no room for poor people in central Cape Town. It is no surprise to me.

I was told in the last DA caucus meeting that I ever attended, that transformation is a swearword. So we know that as the Court found, this Government does not mean it. That is why, despite this nice glossy brochure and the well-crafted words that make up this VIP document which promises to release public land for housing that is centrally located, we hear the

Premier adding the fine print that this is subject to National Government doing so first. So VIP4 is a commitment that is conditional, and the judgment makes it quite clear that this arbitrary condition is unlawful.

But, hon Deputy Speaker, there are solutions to addressing spatial transformation that will take leadership and a change in attitude to achieve them, and I really had hoped that the Premier would have given us a direction forward instead of hiding behind a sub judice kind of approach and an approach that suggests that they may still appeal this and drag this out for decades still to come.

I could propose that the Premier brush off the 2010 Cape Town Central City Regeneration Programme, as well as the 2012 update to that plan, and implement those provincial sites as integrated development, mixed use and mixed income including social housing. The Province could also lead the way on inclusionary housing. VIP4 makes some oblique reference to inclusionary housing policies, but inclusionary housing has been referenced in Provincial Government documents since 2012, three Cabinets ago. But we do not have one and it is not referenced to in any of the current departments ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise hon Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker and thank you hon Premier for the response. I really have to enjoy sometimes the way hon Brett Herron selectively quotes when he was there. He does not tell the full picture of when he was there. The hon member clearly asks in point 3 (a) of his question why the Court made this finding but the question that he posed to the Premier clearly indicated that he wanted an opinion from the Premier on a finding of a court, which the Premier clearly indicated that the matter must still be finalised.

But, hon Deputy Speaker, it is critical that if we are to overcome the cruel legacy of apartheid spatial planning that we identify and create opportunities for affordable housing within the inner-city and within the immediate surrounds of the Cape Metro. Obviously, this will enable us to see previously disadvantaged individuals and families live closer to opportunities for work, play, education and build sustainable livelihoods.

Regardless of the Court rulings or our political ideologies and discourses, this is a moral and constitutional imperative which we all must uphold, and I think the Premier has clearly alluded to. For this reason I would like to ask the Premier, he did indicate some projects earlier, whether he can just perhaps reaffirm to the House, what the projects are within the Cape Metro that would serve to provide low-cost housing, and what is the delay in getting such projects and such developments off the ground? Surely, hon Deputy Speaker, if there are any impediments to such developments, we must find a workable solution to remove such impediments to ensure that we can achieve

those objectives. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I recognise hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The Western Cape Provincial Government is notoriously known for undermining the importance of public participation. Like in the apartheid days, the voices of the poor masses of our people do not matter to the Provincial Government of the Western Cape. When the decision to dispose of the property was taken in November 2015, the Opposition in this House as well as the activists in civil society objected to the sale and argued that the land must be used for housing and redress of the apartheid spatial legacy.

The activists argued that the sale was procedurally and legally flawed and failed to take account of the potential social use of the land. The Court agreed and set aside the illegal sale. It declared that the regulation under Western Cape Land Administration Act used to undermine public participation, was unconstitutional and invalid and ordered the City and the Western Cape Provincial Government to submit a comprehensive report by 31 May 2021 on how they will properly implement their duties to provide social housing and address apartheid spatial planning in the Western Cape, in Cape Town in particular.

Most prime land in the CBD is used for parking and many others are sold to private developers. While the Court has stopped the sale of Tafelberg, the

City is moving ahead with the sale of Site B, the prime land on the Foreshore. We reiterate our call for a moratorium on the sale of all public land in the Western Cape and for a land audit of all State-owned land, including by municipalities and SOEs. We must also pay special attention ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member.

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... to the long-term apartheid lease agreement at Stellenbosch Municipality. Today we must get ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mvimbi, your time is up. I recognise hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I really urge this Government to honour its constitutional commitments and its Court-mandated obligations and not to pursue an appeal. We can achieve major structural reform in the City of Cape Town if we are willing to do so. Let us go back to the drawing board for the Sea Point Main Road precinct which, in the regeneration plans and in the 2012 version, includes the Tafelberg School and the Vineyard Mansions.

The 2012 plan proposed 16 000 square metres of bulk development of mixed use, mixed income, mixed tenure development and social housing companies have already indicated that they are eager to develop affordable housing here. So let us make it happen. Then we can go to the City Bowl Block, right here

behind our Parliament between Loop, Dorp and Leeuwen Streets. The 2010 prospectus projected that this site could develop 25 000 sq. metres of bulk development, an excellent site for high density, mixed use development that can include affordable housing and with the right partnership this can be achieved at no cost to the Province.

The Transport and Public Works Department is planning to relocate the Government Garage. Let us use the well-located Government Garage precinct in Roeland Street for another mixed use, mixed income development. That 2012 regeneration plan projects that 100 000 square metres of bulk can be developed there. We can leverage this well-located development site to deliver affordable housing and integration right in the heart of the city. I can go through each of the sites in the 2010 and the 2012 city regeneration plans. They all present opportunities to achieve spatial transformation and they all have one thing in common, public land under the control of the Provincial Government.

Then, hon Deputy Speaker, let us adopt an inclusionary housing law that requires municipalities to implement inclusionary housing policies as part of their planning mandate. Inclusionary housing done right, can contribute to housing delivery numbers in real terms, supplementing what has been delivered directly by the State and reducing the affordable housing deficit.

Inclusionary housing can assist us with the constitutional obligation to address inclusion and address the apartheid spatial form. Fortunately, while

our Government has lacked courage across the board, national and provincial and local governments to implement inclusionary housing, private developers are showing leadership and are doing so voluntarily and private developers are demonstrating that inclusionary housing can work and they are willing to contribute, but what they are pleading for is policy certainty. So let us provide it. The work has been done and I can give the Premier the draft. It is really good to go. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Herron. I now recognise Premier Winde.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much and to all of those of you who participated in this mini debate. I think first of all to the hon Herron's first point about not asking my opinion. When I read the question that says "(a) why did the Court make this finding?" that is asking me for an opinion, so an opinion on the Court's findings. So he cannot come and react to what I am saying and then not base it primarily on his first question.

But let us get into the nuts and bolts of this deal. He also says repeatedly that I did not do anything with regards to trying to find a settlement before the Court actually made their finding. And I will clarify that today, to say to him that he can stop misleading the House, we definitely did try to find a settlement, and the answer is yes we did, and we obviously did not manage it but we did try.

The next point is about inclusionary housing, and I agree with him on this, and all I can say is that watch this space, because of course this is policy, this is planning policy and we are busy with it.

I also want to say, perhaps I will come back to him now, just to the hon Mackenzie, and I spoke in an earlier speech around land invasions, I spoke about the numbers of properties. I think in your question, what really comes to my mind is the Helen Bowden site. This is a site that is right next door to some of the most expensive real estate on the African continent and this is where we have already passed the planning processes. We are ready to deliver inclusionary housing right there and then. And of course, very interesting, the very same organisations who end up in the courts trying to get an outcome on the Tafelberg site, are the very same who break the law and actually invade the site. So my call would be to those organisations: if you really want this to happen in the inner-city, it is time to now go and actually ask those people who you put into those sites illegally, to please make way so that we can produce inclusionary housing for the people who need it and deserve it.

Then the hon Mvimbi, I just want to say it is very rich of you to come here and lecture us without giving us what you did when you were Mayor in Plettenberg Bay, because of course that is the model of how people have not developed while under your leadership, so I think I am just going to leave it there.

And then coming back to the hon Herron, and as I have said earlier we are absolutely committed. We transferred the property of the Woodstock Hospital to the City of Cape Town, when you were there, to actually produce inclusionary housing. We have committed our land and of course you mentioned some other properties and we will definitely be having a look at that. But the land that is already on the table, I answered in the earlier debate as well as to you in this question. Of course, it is about Local Government land, about our land and National Government land.

And perhaps this is where I would read a statement out and I am sure the House would agree, and the statement goes as follows:

“There are a number of really well-located parcels of land in the hands of National Government, for example Wingfield in Kensington. But although we have repeatedly requested transfers to include these sites in our housing plans, we do not seem to have enough influence to make it happen. Our repeated requests have been ignored.”

Of course, that is a quote. That statement was made by the hon Brett Herron in October 2017. And so I ask the hon Herron to also join us in this. I take what he said about inclusionary housing and our land and we have committed to that, and we will follow through on it but I want him to commit here, because all of a sudden he now has more influence, through his own political party, on this very piece of land and a few others. And I hope that I hear from the National Minister very soon ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: ... that that land will be transferred for the use for housing and inclusionary housing here in this province and in this city. I thank you.

[Debate concluded.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear.

[Interpellation 3 withdrawn.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. That brings us to the end of Interpellations. We now move over to Questions in terms of Rule 202 and just to recap we have four opportunities for follow-up questions and the hon member who posed the oral question, as printed on the Order Paper, will have the first opportunity for a follow-up question. We are starting on Question 3 and these are questions that have stood over from Thursday, 10 September. I recognise the hon Mbombo, Minister.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Questions standing over from Thursday, 10 September 2020, as agreed to by the House:

COVID-19: quality healthcare services

3. Ms W F Philander asked the Minister of Health:

What were some of the major contributors related to pre-existing infrastructure, facility management and administrative processes that ensured that quality healthcare services continued to be provided in the Western Cape during the COVID-19 period?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Can you hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I hear you. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you hon member Philander for the question about the major contributors related to pre-existing infrastructure, asset management, administration processes to ensure quality healthcare services.

This question is a general one, meaning that one cannot pinpoint exactly what the contributors are, but generally when you strengthen all the systems or the building blocks of that, you build a health system and then it makes every deliverable possible. The Department of Health has all these building blocks of the health system under one big major health system and they have been strengthened throughout. For example, we already had significant infrastructure in place pre-COVID that could be used for this.

Our hospitals and primary care facilities were able to manage their COVID case load even at the peak. There have always been strong governance structures in place within the Department and transversally with other government departments, even prior to COVID.

Whilst the COVID response was led by the Premier, as part of the Provincial Command Council and the entire Cabinet, with the Department of Health being the lead department, but we also had the whole of government where we had relationships with Local Government and also with National Government, which also contributed.

In addition, the Department has always had very strong and stable administrative teams who were easily able to step up in terms of COVID, for example, supply chain management. That is why the A-G did not find any irregular expenditure even in regard to the issue of PPE. The fact that we managed to erect temporary structures such as the CTICC and Brackengate is part of that. The same with the triage and testing sites, where we initially targeted 17, or what National called fever clinics, but we ended up adding even more in order for people to make use of those to stop the spread at a primary health care level.

The people management system that allowed us to allocate people accordingly and also the employment of contract workers are some of our strengths. So through our vigorous and transparent procurement system we have built up strong relationships with suppliers for many years with regular

[Inaudible.] This allowed us to source goods like PPE and ventilators with relative ease. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise hon Philander and then hon Windvogel.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you, hon Minister for your very comprehensive response. Through you, hon Deputy Speaker, Minister are you aware of any infrastructure failures that hampered service delivery during this period or any that required urgent attention? Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hon Deputy Speaker, there were no delays that impacted on the response to COVID noting that all infrastructure had to follow the regulations related to the lockdown. Some sectors like construction had to be put on hold, even those we initiated before COVID, for example, ambulance stations. Some additional infrastructure like new clinics had to be put on hold during the lockdown as per the regulations. But with infrastructure related to COVID, for example the field hospitals, not only those like CTICC, Brackengate and Thusong, although Thusong was under the MSF, those field hospitals and other additional hospitals that are attached to our existing hospitals still continued.

For example, the 32-bed Hermanus Field Hospital, where we converted the underground storeroom; the 15-beds for Vredendal Hospital where we converted the boiler room; the Harry Comay Hospital in George, 20 additional beds for COVID and now also for those who have got resistant TB. They still continued. The Sonstraal Field Hospital also still continued as did the tents, triage and testing sites, the fever clinics and primary healthcare facilities. They still continued. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I recognise hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Hon Deputy Speaker, can you hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I can hear you.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Through you, to the MEC. The reality is that the COVID-19 outbreak has exposed the disparities that exist between public and private healthcare. This forced the Government to pay a handsome sum of money to private healthcare to use their facilities. So I want the MEC to tell us about the challenges and lessons learned from this pandemic and how they will be dealt with moving forward? I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, hon member. Take note that the private aspect, starting from the licencing, is a delegated function according to the National Health Act that comes from the National Department of Health to the provinces. However, the National Health Act came later, I think in 2003, when the Western Cape Department had already promulgated the regulations related to the private licencing coming from the 1977 National Health Act. That Act is actually still active in all the provinces because of the dual competences for both Provincial and National. So that one still exists and that is why when it comes to the Western Cape, things might be a little bit different in terms of the relations between private and public.

Now to the question. Based on that, the responsibility of the National Department of Health was to first negotiate the tariffs. The tariffs were negotiated by the National Health Minister in regard specifically to critical care beds across the country, which is an international norm, where the public will have less beds. Even if they do have enough beds, the issue is also about critical care skills, like ICU doctors, nurses and all of those. So after the negotiations, now it came back to the provinces to negotiate the specifics.

For example, at the time I think it was around 16 300 for the whole package and also to negotiate what the average length of stay would be, because you would not want to have a public patient treated differently, whether the quality in private is the best or the worst where now you end up having different kinds unfair treatment whether the person is in private or public.

So for us, when I made that initial preamble it was to show that by the time the National Minister was busy with the negotiations we were actually waiting for him to the point that we actually put pressure on him to sign it off because we already had service level agreements between each and every hospital group, be it the biggest or smallest in the Western Cape, according to the relationships which we had, where I initiated the first meetings with them around the COVID.

The indemnity needed to be signed in that aspect, the clinical protocols that had to be developed so that patients do not get treated unequally or differently. And then lastly, taking note that in private the only healthcare professionals that are appointed by the groups are the nurses. A medical specialist is not an employee of let us say, Mediclinic or Netcare. They are individuals, they are private. A radiographer, a physiotherapist, a lab technician, they are not employees, they are not part of the hospital employment. Therefore we had to negotiate each and every one of those. Of course I want to acknowledge Dr Nicolas Crisp, an advisor to the National Minister, who fortunately resides here in the Western Cape, whom we previously worked with in the space of forensic pathology labs nationally at the time they were transferred from SAPS to Provincial Health.

So that part of the negotiations was done provincially, and it ended up that by the time we were ready the National Minister was not ready. At least he agreed. However, by the time we were ready for patients to be transferred, Dexamethasone was introduced and also high flow nasal flow oxygen and that

therefore meant, like at Groote Schuur, there was no need for patients to be hospitalised in the ICU. They were still using high care beds and therefore it ended up that people did not need to go to ICU, although they may have needed a critical or a high care space and therefore ended up with no need to transfer many patients.

We only sent four patients to test the system around that, but as I am saying that even up to this stage there has not been any need. That is why we further explored for private EMS, for private GPs and also for private labs, for other laboratories beyond COVID.

We can safely and proudly say that internationally, and also nationally, universal health coverage is where we are supposed to go to in regard to providing people with a comprehensive health service. It is very important to remember that you cannot implement UHC without private. Private includes private health as I mentioned, private includes civil society, private includes individuals who even offer a package for home-based care like at community healthcare worker level or even a senior principal medical specialist.

So that is why I was saying, for us we were ready. We have demonstrated that for COVID, it is doable. It does not stop us. If there is a need for any other discipline or if there was any other outbreak, or for any condition where our patients wait longer, let us say for any type of operation, just for example in the case of orthopaedic cases where they can wait for even three or four years, it does not stop us negotiating further where we can say, using a

similar kind of template that we used for COVID, could you please open additional beds for x, y, z, instead of now saying that patients in Khayelitsha have to wait on the chairs for ten days in order to get a bed for a specific kind of medical discipline. So that is where we are. We have not paid much money to private. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Hon Philander, that is you, I see hon Windvogel has put her hand down. Hon Philander, over to you.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Minister Mbombo, we have seen facility readiness in a matter of weeks in the Western Cape, and well done to team Western Cape and well done to all those partners involved. What were some of the lessons learned in terms of getting those facilities ready and how does the Department intend to utilise those efficiencies going forward? Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you. As I indicated earlier, there are many lessons that we have learnt from the COVID space, not only to demolish or dismantle the hierarchies, the red tape, when it comes to how Government works. For example, the Integrated Delivery Management System for infrastructure; for two years you will find that you are still in Stage 1 to 4, starting with the concept, the business case. Even after two years you might find there is still no foundation that you can see and the

people ask didn't you say that you are building ABC and you even had a short-turning time, and we say yes, we are still actually on time, but there is nothing because that is how the system works.

But with the CTICC, where we could do it in six weeks, when they asked we sent the request to Public Works because they are the custodians of infrastructure for the whole of the Western Cape Government. When the Department of Health said we needed a field hospital and you can see that this one will be ideal, in as much as at a national level, they were saying use the stadium because look at KZN, they identified the Moses Mabhida and we said no, in the Western Cape the weather is completely different, so we cannot. Even at the time the Department of Defence said that we have a whole field that you can use, and I said, no it does not work like that. For us, for now, CTICC is one of those and in addition if there is a need for extra, CTICC2 could also be used. So it took six weeks for these two departments, also with the Department of the Premier through the GD, to facilitate these. And then it went on, not only about the infrastructure but also the around 860 beds to have the oxygen installed in all those walls around that part of it, and also to ensure it meets the international standards in terms of the entry, the exit and all of those.

So, these are some of the kinds of the lessons that we can learn, but most importantly, it is about working together, a whole of society approach, a whole of government approach. Where it does show is as we keep on saying, most of our health problems are social problems, they are not ours. It means

everyone, local government, civil society, each and every Minister, MEC, every HOD is responsible for each hotspot across all our six districts including the Metro, plus the sub-districts within the Metro. Those people are not even health related but when they do the reporting, twice a week at the extended Cabinet as well as the main Cabinet for the HODs, you will find that they will talk about case management, they will talk about the humanitarian relief, they will talk about economic recovery, they will talk about quarantine and isolation. So it is one of these lessons that we have learnt that health goes beyond.

Lastly, the issues of poverty, inequality, unemployment and the economy, actually have an impact on the overall state of the country and also on the province and in the communities. Unfortunately, these things are beyond the health system, but we have absorbed all of those. So it takes them back now. Everyone is responsible for the things that we have been dealing with outside our hospitals, outside health, but at least now people are taking responsibility. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Hon Philander, over to you, last opportunity.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Through you, Minister, as infrastructure is not within your portfolio, Minister, but I would like to have your take in terms of facility management and administrative processes. In your view, what does this mean for ongoing discussions around

the provision and you have briefly touched on it, around the provision in the Western Cape with reference to the NHI Bill? Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Over to you Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It is another question that is not related to this, but I am fine to respond, because I have already touched on this earlier. As we keep on saying, the NHI Bill is a mechanism that has been initiated by National. It is a funding mechanism, according to them, to address the whole issue of affordability for patients and also to address inequality in regard to the funding of the health system.

There is nothing about Universal Health Coverage there. You can read about Universal Coverage which is an international approach on how to deliver services and financing as part of the whole of UHC, but for South Africa we are not talking anything about UHC. UHC is about the affordability, the availability, the accessibility and the quality of care where no one should die or should receive worse quality or receive no care at all on the basis of affordability. So what we are saying in the Western Cape is, for us, we are not waiting for the NHI Bill that actually is not going to address the issue. So that is why I was saying that at the end we should be able to test some of the tenets of the UHC in some of the areas.

If you may recall, Chair of the Standing Committee on Health, there was a

time in the previous term, where we, with the Eastern Cape and KZN, as MECs, initiated a pilot of UHC, in collaboration, in some of our areas. For example, we even used to alternate hosting meetings. They came to the Western Cape as colleagues plus their HODs or I went to the Eastern Cape. At the time we identified Saldanha Bay, which is outside the Metro, and also Khayelitsha, part of the Metro at the time, to be part of the UHC because for example at Saldanha Bay, the advantage is you are able to tap into the space of the employer to contribute towards some of the important packages. Like a person may have five operations and whatever, where the people do not have medical aid but as an employer, they can make contributions and so you do not leave anyone behind.

In the Eastern Cape, they identified parts of the BCM and also the Sabata Dalindyebo which is around Umtata as part of that. So we initiated that. MEC, Dr Dhlomo, was part of this but unfortunately there were changes of office and I am the only one who is left. But we are still exploring that part of it at Government official levels. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. We move over to Question 4. I recognise you again Minister Mbombo.

COVID-19: interventions regarding behavioural change

4. Ms W F Philander asked the Minister of Health:

(a) What is the Department's evaluation of the various districts' interventions regarding behavioural change in managing the pandemic and (b) what was the response from the public in this regard?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: So that I do not confuse, thank you, Deputy Speaker, is this the one on the Department's evaluation of the various districts' interventions regarding behavioural change?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is correct.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, hon member Philander. Rapid assessments were conducted to provide the basis for a province-wide review of the measures that were taken to combat COVID-19, and lessons were also drawn across from the weekly hotspot reports which I mentioned earlier on, the specific interventions that were used to compile some of these briefings and also part of the JOG across the provinces.

So what has been happening is that at a provincial level, where the Premier has been chairing the Provincial Command Council, which is a Cabinet, this has been extended to the District Mayors, and the reason for that is not only to follow the JOG1 as part of the Local Government but also from a health perspective, the District Health system is a provision, a structure, according to the National Health Act, in order to ensure that the health services do happen in the periphery.

So it made sense to include the District Mayors, but not only at the district level but also within the district which we call a sub-district, but using the municipality boundaries, where each and every district will have a conversation with the sub-districts specifically around behavioural change interventions and also the advocacy.

How do you measure these on a weekly basis? The Department of the Premier does share the COVID-19 research poll indicating the levels of public compliance to various measures, for example the wearing of masks, hand hygiene and all of those and then if we want to add any additional variables within there, where we might say can you please focus on what you have seen in Atlantis or in Dunoon or wherever, in the rural areas, we would be able to get all of these. It helps us to keep on reflecting and changing or reviewing some of the interventions or the way we do what we have actually proposed.

What is happening now is, I think by 20 November, we will have the overall holistic and province-wide assessment of the implementation of the Western Cape Government hotspot strategy where the key focus will be, amongst others, the extent of the contributions of these interventions, whether we have achieved them or not. For example, our containment strategy, our acute hospital plan, our public, private, which will answer the question that was asked by member Windvogel, how will we be able to know that we have achieved all these.

So I think there are about four areas that we are focusing on and this is being done together with the academics. Remember in the province we have got four academic hospitals and also outsiders. We will be able to make use of these, even for future district responses, not only for COVID but also for others, especially in regard to changing behaviours and also in preparedness for a resurgence, if need be. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister, hon Philander, over to you.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, through you. Hon Minister, in terms of interventions and innovations we have experienced during our oversight visits these past few weeks directly in terms of practice how medicine gets distributed, the adapted appointment system and to accommodate on-going care during the management of the pandemic, hon Minister, does the Department intend to continue with some of these practices in order to relieve the load or congestion that these facilities sometimes experience? Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you. With regard to the distribution of the medicine, this facility was there pre-COVID, the CDU, Chronic Dispensing Unit which we initiated. Prior to that it was a national intervention, the CCMD. So it has always been there. However, there are stringent criteria in terms of who should form part of it because you do not

want patients to relapse or default on their treatment.

So it is very critical where the clinician or specialist seeing the patient feels the patient might only be able to come twice a year, once in six months, and therefore distribute that medicine to where the person can pick it up, their nearest clinic. In some cases you might find in old age homes where voluntary community leaders are able to deliver the medicine, like to a ward councillor's office or churches.

For instance in Khayelitsha there is a guy who initially was cycling to get medication to people and now he has hired a bakkie and he also has an office. Now with COVID, especially in regard to people with comorbidities where we wanted to reduce the traffic of those people coming to the facilities, we ended up adding more and also loosening some of the strict criteria around that. We used Uber and community health workers for some of the areas. Then with others, who were supposed to come monthly, we gave them two month's supply and added more contract workers in terms of the distribution.

Then lastly, we initiated a WhatsApp application for those who were left behind, or if you knew of someone on chronic medication who might not be part of the programme. We are continuing this way. Some of these methods were used prior to COVID but now during this time we have had to increase them.

However, post-COVID or now that we have seen the epidemic at least

declining, we do not want to open it up widely in the sense that again, those people who are at risk, might come, flop back, where they ended up being exposed because we do not know what is going to happen, but at the same time we have to keep on opening up some of those. For example, with TB, people who were supposed to have started treatment as part of being diagnosed with TB. We can also see that there were less people diagnosed with TB during that time, although at the end of May, when we said we are initiating non-COVID cases, we saw an increase.

The same applies with the issue of the immunisation of children, although in the rural areas mostly because they are using mobile clinics to drive from the satellite clinics to the areas. We never stopped but we did see a decrease in the utilisation of Primary Health Care services. The same applies with the decrease in operations, such as eye cataracts and other minor operations and with elective surgeries which we need to beef up.

So there are many of these interventions which gave us more space to manage COVID, but unfortunately there were some disciplines, some services where we could not continue as such. We still must open it up for some of the people to come back, but still must protect the vulnerable. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Hon Windvogel?

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. While it is welcome

that the Western Cape has drastically reduced its infections numbers, it is concerning that the numbers are so high in areas like the Garden Route and Cape Winelands, while in a Metro district like Tygerberg we have had high numbers since March. So can the MEC tell us what has worked well for districts like Khayelitsha and why numbers are still so high in Tygerberg compared with other districts? Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. According to the data that is in front of me I am not aware of any high numbers. There is no one size fits all. Also when the epidemic entered South Africa, it was not in all in the provinces. It ended up being more prevalent in the Western Cape and started growing in the Metro because of various reasons.

You will find when it went to the Garden Route it might have been, say, four weeks later than the Metro in terms of comparison and then in the West Coast six weeks later, where in the Cape Winelands it might have been maybe three weeks and so forth. Even within the Metro, you might find that it might have been earlier in Khayelitsha and Klipfontein and let us say Tygerberg and then find that, or it might have been actually at the beginning, it was in the southern and the western areas and then it kept on going and going and going and so that is how things were. That is the nature of the virus because it moves with the people. We saw the same in Gauteng, in the Eastern Cape, in KZN and then we saw it with the smaller provinces. So, generally, in South

Africa the epidemic was not everywhere at the same time. The same applies in the province.

Having said that, they are also the first to see that the numbers have been decreasing, not only decreasing because of the cases but because we implemented different strategies in terms of testing because we have to respond according to the data we receive, especially to prioritise vulnerable groups.

Therefore it was based on the number of healthcare workers that tested positive, based on the number of the positivity rate which is important in the number of tests that we take to the national lab. What is the positivity rate? For example, we once had a positivity rate of about 40%. Right now we are sitting below 10% which demonstrates what I am saying. I am not aware of numbers having increased.

Again we are introducing a different strategy for testing, because now we are going to open testing for people who are going for surgeries, for operations. Also because there are more people who are going back to work it might therefore mean that we have to be open for people to be tested if they have been affected at work, especially at a time when they might infect more people. So we might have some changes where we can see more cases.

Also, other areas showing a decrease in numbers, in terms of COVID, is where we have seen hospitalisation numbers decreasing, including persons

under investigation and then lastly, the utilisation of oxygen supplies. We used around 60% oxygen in our oxygen bank, and it is now around 40% in terms of oxygen use which means that you do not have people needing oxygen because fewer people are being admitted.

Lastly, along with National, we are coming up with pilots in other interventions such as the introduction of serology, which is where we use blood to test for antibodies. We have used about 4 000 leftover specimens from people who came for ante-natal care and specimens of people who came for HIV, which is not a representation of anybody per se. We have seen around 40% of those were positive and then you see the most in the informal settlements which is where people are positive. Even as much as that, the number of cases may not have been higher, because I think we had 105, so it shows that actually some people might have been positive, asymptomatic, on the basis that you are seeing antibodies.

National is now expanding these throughout, where we will have household surveys where we can expand into some other facilities across the province because it gives us an indication of how many people might need to have a vaccine if need be. 20% of the population would give you an estimate of 12 million so that when they release the vaccination, when it is available, they will know how many people could be vaccinated. Probably they may reduce that part of it when they are aware that there are many people who have built up antibodies, taking note that with these antibodies there is no guarantee that at this stage those will be permanent. I think three months. It is not a

surprise because it is the Coronavirus. Even with the flu, you can have the flu in January, but you can get it in December again. So that is where we are. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Hon Philander, over to you.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Hon Deputy Speaker, through you to the Minister. Hon Minister come Monday, God-willing, how will the Department adapt its behavioural change initiatives? Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

THE MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you. Just assuming that you mean behavioural change for the people, not the Department. The issue of non-pharmaceutical interventions will stay with us for the next two years. So in the same way, as with HIV Aids in the early 90s where we spoke about using condoms and A, B, C, D, it will be the same. You will still have to use your mask, because that is the only way to avoid not spitting on another person and also in the case someone is spitting, at least you are also protected. So this is the only way.

The same with the washing of hands and the washing of surfaces because the issue is about spitting, sneezing, and coughing on surfaces or on your hand. So these are going to remain for some time. The same with gatherings.

Yesterday the President announced lockdown Level 1 and on the issue of gatherings you still must be cautious, whether 50 or 250. You may be safe to open the economy, but you are not safe from the virus, if I can put it like that. You still have to avoid non-ventilated areas and if you are in a non-ventilated area try not to spend too much time there. So that is why the open spaces are preferable.

You still must protect the vulnerable, the over 55-year-olds, those with comorbidities, you still must protect them no matter what. So these behavioural changes will remain with us for the next two years until we have a vaccine. We hear now some of the vaccine tests at labs have to be paused for various reasons, be it not safe for the patients and whatever other reasons. So that is why we must stick to these behavioural changes no matter what. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Hon Windvogel. Your hand is down. Are there further questions that you would like to pose? No? We then move over to Question 7, I recognise the hon Minister Madikizela. Minister, can you hear us?

COVID-19: strategy for mobility and access

7. Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

(a) What is the provincial strategy for mobility and access in the Western Cape during the COVID-19 pandemic and beyond, (b) how has this been implemented and (c) how has this been communicated to people in communities, such as Mitchells Plain?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Hello, Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We can hear you. You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you very much for the question from hon member Mackenzie.

The Western Cape Government has a comprehensive and a cohesive strategy for mobility and access in the Western Cape through a provincial sustainable transport programme, which has been adapted to respond to the immediate needs brought about by the COVID-19 pandemic, and we will be further informed by the longer term implications and potential changes to mobility patterns brought about by the pandemic.

The strategy, hon Deputy Speaker, has been focused on maximising safety of passengers and limiting the spread of the disease, whilst supporting essential services, essential workers and the broader community activity.

Now key components of the approach, hon Deputy Speaker, include:

1. The institutional communication coordination. With regard to this, the Western Cape has implemented appropriate institutional structures to ensure coordination and communication between different departments and role-players. The purpose of this was to understand COVID-19-related transport challenges, identify required interventions, and plan and oversee implementation.
2. The second part of this is the establishment of critical transport services to meet COVID-19 needs.

Now in response to this, hon Deputy Speaker, dedicated services were introduced to transport high-risk patients to and from quarantine and isolations sites, and to transport frontline healthcare workers. This has been implemented through the Red Dot taxi service, which is an innovative partnership formed between the Western Cape Government, my Department in particular, Umanyano Travel Services, which represent Santaco Western Cape, and of course the Department of Health.

Red Dot commenced operations in mid-May and has since provided over 10,000 trips for quarantine and isolation, and over 65,000 trips for frontline healthcare workers.

3. The third element of course is enabling safe contracted bus services. Contracted bus services, including the Golden Arrow Bus Service and GoGeorge, have continued to operate with standards and requirements revised to align with national directives, and to manage the spread of disease.

4. The fourth element was to spearhead safer minibus taxi services and facilities. With regard to this, the Western Cape has worked with the minibus taxi industry to adhere to capacity limitations and other conditions through the lockdown period, with dedicated focused taxi ranks. Nonetheless, hon Deputy Speaker, compliance and enforcements remain a challenge.

In response to this, the Western Cape Government is developing the flagship Blue Dot Minibus Taxi Incentive Programme, which would allow for the introduction and improved enforcement of COVID-19 and other standards for improved quality of service and safety.

5. The fifth element is supporting safe restoration of rail services and learner transport. The Department is supporting safe restoration of rail services, including establishment of an interim bus service to meet critical transport needs along the [Inaudible.] line. Efforts are also underway to ensure that learner transport services resumes in a way that minimises the risk of virus spread, maintains livelihood for operators, and supports efficient provisions of services, and of course,

hon Deputy Speaker, the learner transport is under the Department of Education, and we have been working together with the Department of Education in this effort.

6. The sixth element is the distribution of sanitising and hygiene materials. Availability and affordability of sanitising and hygiene materials have at times been a challenge. So the Western Cape has worked to support the provision of material to transport service providers, including the minibus taxi industry.
7. The seventh one is the monitoring, adherence, management, and smart use of information. This has been implemented by leveraging the integrated transport hub within the Department of Transport and Public Works for collecting passenger feedback information via USSD feedback, and managing data, through working jointly with the City of Cape Town to monitor and collect information at taxi ranks.

Again, the Western Cape Government recognises that the transport system in the Western Cape was in a crisis, even before the pandemic, with the collapse of the rail, stalling of the N2 Express Bus Service, and of course increasing congestion.

The strategy for access and mobility beyond the COVID-19 pandemic is encompassed in the Provincial Sustainable Transport Programme. It prioritises rail and minibus taxi services, as well as bus services, and is

underpinned by the Integrated Transport Hub, with the smart use of technology and data, and by the development of the appropriate institutional structures for resolving the transport crisis.

Communications regarding COVID-19-related transport measures have included the following, hon Deputy Speaker:

- A passenger App and free USSD service that has been developed, to enable passenger feedback on non-compliance with the COVID-19 safety plan protocol, such as capacity restrictions and availability of sanitisers. These services were advertised to the public via social media, on the Department of Public Works and Transport platforms, including Safely Home platforms, as well as Western Cape Government platforms, and large digital billboards.

This was further enhanced through media releases. COVID-19 communication materials were prepared and disseminated at public transport interchanges, such as taxi ranks.

Distribution of the material was done through Public Transport partners, including GABS, Metrorail, and Santaco. [Inaudible.] Red Dot taxi services, all vehicles are branded and fitted with passenger information pamphlets, which display the standards that must be adhered to, and contact information for reporting of the non-compliance, including a free USSD service.

I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I recognise hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you, Minister, for this comprehensive answer.

I obviously have to say I have been part of one of the initiatives, hon Deputy Speaker, at the Mitchells Plain taxi rank, and I have seen the benefits of the service to the community.

And I just want to find out from the Minister, given his answer, and we see now there has been a, if you like, an upgrading to an open business and more individuals are going to access the transport service. Has the communication strategy from the Department of the Minister been taken, or has there been planning, now that we are in Level 1, or going forward into Level 1, for the usage of the service, and a potential increase of the usage of the service in many of our communities, has that been taken into account, and if he – and I would not suspect, hon Deputy Speaker, the Minister would not have the exact details with him now, because it is partly a new question - can just share some details with us?

The planning, given that we are now moving to Level 1, is he seeing a

significant increase for the use of the services? Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

Of course there are a number of things that need to happen as we move to Level 1 from 20 September 2020. There will be an ongoing communication, hon member Mackenzie, through you, hon Deputy Speaker, and the available transport modes, vis-à-vis the number of passengers that will now be going to work, including of course the school children.

Part of that of course is our multipronged strategy to deal (1) with the rail challenges, working very closely with the PRASA and National Department of Transport, and I must say that since the lockdown the cooperation has improved immensely.

The second part of course is to deal with the challenges in the minibus taxi industry, because this is an industry, hon Deputy Speaker, [Inaudible.] that forms almost 50% of the entire passengers. So they transport the equal number of people with both rail and bus service combined.

So that is why you might have noticed that there has been a lot of focus, from

me in particular, to make sure that we deal with some challenges in this particular industry, and engaging the planning authorities, like municipalities, to really assess the supply and demand in terms of operating licences, because we do know that we have a large number of people who are operating without operating licences.

On one hand, hon member Mackenzie, through you, hon Deputy Speaker, they are saying that the demand is there. On another hand the planning authorities are very cautious, because they fear that issuing more permits might oversaturate the route, and it might end up not being profitable.

So this is now the discussion that we are having so that we can deal with the issue of illegal operators.

And lastly, hon Deputy Speaker, that of course we are waiting for the National Minister to give more details, particularly on other modes of transport since the announcement by the President, and our communication will then be based on that information that will be coming from the National Minister, and then we will take it from there in terms of making sure that we communicate in such a way that will actually address some of the concerns in the Department of Transport space in rail, bus, and the minibus taxi industry. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you, Minister, again for that answer.

Through you, hon Deputy Speaker. Minister, what we have seen is there has always been a lot of focus on the Metro, and obviously the Metro, being the City of Cape Town, you have got the big economy, but sometimes I do feel that our rural areas do not get the same attention, and I am here referring to Laingsburg [Inaudible, laughing.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Sorry [Inaudible.] I am talking Laingsburg ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ... Beaufort West, Vredendal, and part of our big challenges in this regard has been our communication, because ... [Laughter.] – hon member Maseko must stop doing that please.

Part of our big challenge – sorry, about that, Minister, through you – has been our communication challenges given that [Laughter.]

An HON MEMBER: Order, hon Deputy Speaker.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Order, please, hon Deputy Speaker, please help me here. Hon member Maseko, please stop doing that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Maseko, I do not know what you are doing, but I cannot see...

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Okay – has been ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...through – I do apologise – has been our communications with people from the West Coast – Langebaan, Vredendal, etcetera, and it has been a language barrier. And does the communication strategy from the Department, through the mobility and access, take into account English, Afrikaans, and isiXhosa? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister Madikizela?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Well, to answer this question, I will answer it in threefold. I agree, hon member Mackenzie, that it might seem as if the focus is in the Metro, because 70% of the population is here, but I am sure you might have noticed that I have now embarked on a province-wide engagement with the industry. In fact, a month ago I was in the Garden Route, and last week I went back there to respond to some of the concerns, and I have it on my

diary, hon member Mackenzie, where I would be visiting all the districts. The next one is Cape Winelands, and of course part of the reason why I have categorised them in that manner, hon member Mackenzie, is to look at where the challenges are.

If you look at the situation, for example, in George around GoGeorge, and the protests that have been happening there, that is why I started in that region, and the next one is Cape Winelands. There are challenges in areas like Ceres, and that is my next stop, and of course I will then go to all other regions.

So it is part of our communication strategy, because while of course we communicate through our adverts and also our pamphlets, I am a strong believer in engaging people face-to-face, and I think we are able to get the message across better when we meet with the industry face-to-face. Of course we are being cautious, we understand that there is a new norm in terms of how we must behave. We must adhere to the health guidelines, and that is exactly what I will be doing, hon member Mackenzie, to make sure that we just do not focus in the Metro, but take the communication to all the districts, as I have done already with the Garden Route district. So that is what we will be doing in all the districts, hon member Mackenzie. So we will also be going to areas like Laingsburg and Beaufort West, so rest assured that I will be going to those areas.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Madikizela. Are there any follow-up questions? I recognise hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you for that answer, Minister.

Hon Minister, with regards to the mobility strategy and generally when we speak we do talk about the taxi industry, but we do forget the transporting of the learners, and I just wanted to get clarity, and you did indicate that the regulations are probably going to come out soon from the National Minister.

What is the difference between filling up a taxi to a certain percentage, and filling up a school bus to a certain percentage? And how does that potentially, because the question is relating to the pandemic and we are in the pandemic, relate to possibly, and, hon Deputy Speaker, I use the word “possibly” very conservatively, an increase in numbers in the future, and do your strategies take that into account going forward?

And lastly, hon Deputy Speaker, when you responded you referred mainly to the districts, like Langebaan and Beaufort West. How does the strategy affect places like Merweville, Melkhoutfontein, and all the other very small towns that we generally do not get to? Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister Madikizela, before you answer, I just want to say the time is almost up, so if you could keep your answer succinct, that would really be helpful. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you. On the

first question, I must be frank and be honest with you, hon member Mackenzie, that the decision that was taken to load the taxis to full capacity, it was really a contest between science and economy, and I think the economic consideration trumped science, because I mean it is really not based on science, because if we are talking about social distancing and then at the same time load taxis 100%, there is a contradiction there.

But I must also say that it is a decision that I supported, because I do not want to sound as if when this decision was made and announced by the Minister, I am now singing a different tune.

My view is that we will really have to learn to live with this virus, because eventually things will get back to normal, and we need to take precautionary measures. Save lives, but also save livelihoods, and I think that really, if you look at the fact that the loading capacity of taxis is 100% and the buses still remain at 70%, as I said that decision was not based on science, and I think very soon we will hear pressure coming from the buses as well.

I think the only difference though, hon member Mackenzie, is that where we are directly involved with the Province in your GoGeorge and GABS, which is Golden Arrow Bus, is that they are subsidised and that is why you do not hear a lot of complaints when they continue to load 70%, because they are subsidised, but the taxis are not, and that is why you have that disparity. That is where the challenge is.

On your second part. It is a very difficult question to answer, because the transport in those areas is a huge issue that there is a gap, I acknowledge that there is a gap that we need to address, and the same strategy, in the limited transport that is available there, will have to be followed in terms of our communication strategy and our transport strategy that we are implementing across the province, but of course we understand that the situation there is really, really bad. There are areas where the transport really is almost non-existent, and it is a gap that we really need to fill going forward.

And it will require of course a lot of resources and partnerships, and I think it is a discussion for another time, hon member Mackenzie, through you, hon Deputy Speaker.

So that is all I can say, but I think there are steps that you will apply across the province in all the areas, but we do of course understand that even before the pandemic you had a number of areas where transport has always been a challenge.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister Madikizela.

That brings us to the end of the questions. We are now going to start with the opportunity for members to do the Statements. I recognise the DA.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS:

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Chairperson. The Province and the country at large face the challenge of defeating a culture of violence and entitlement by a select few. It is this culture of violence and perverse attitude of entitlement that fuels domestic abuse, gender-based violence, corruption and fraud, amongst other social ills.

The culture further perpetuates a cycle of patriarchy as exemplified just this week when a teenage entrepreneur, Asiphe Mkhafa, was threatened by taxi drivers, because she dared to start a taxi business. Asiphe nevertheless bravely continues her women-only taxi services based in Nyanga and remains unshaken in the face of what is often brutal entitlement in a male-dominated industry.

Hon Chair, turning to the inner-city of the Cape Metro, we further witnessed violence and entitlement through the significant rise in extortion and racketeering against bars, restaurants, and coffee shops. This is by opportunistic gang leaders seeking so-called protection fees. Such efforts are exceptionally alarming given that we need to safely move our economy forward and the efforts of small business such as these are incredibly important in doing so. We cannot have an environment, Chair, where business owners lack assurance of safety for both their staff and customers.

It is evident, hon Chair, that the Western Cape Government proactively works to defeat the scourge of violence, including within the taxi industry. The initiation of talks between the Department of Transport and Public Works, as

well as taxi bodies, CODETA and CATA, is testament to this. Given the current second pandemic of poverty, we need to get our residents safely back to work and the economy moving again, and there is no doubt that safe taxi operation plays a huge role in this.

In conclusion, hon Chair, it is only through the efforts of Government at all levels, civil society, the private and public sectors, and all residents, that we can collectively combat violence so atrociously imbedded in our social fibres. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Mitchell. I now recognise ANC. I now recognise ANC.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, Chair. Thank you very much...

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: We can hear you.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Okay. Chairperson, I rise today to sympathise with the family of Nisecelo Nosange Tsipa, a member of the ANC Women's League, who was murdered and buried in a dump area by her husband in Fisantekraal. We welcome the swift response by SAPS, and the accused has been arrested and appeared in court on 11 September 2020.

The *Crime Against Women in South Africa Report* by Stats South Africa, shows that the rate of murder of women in South African is unacceptably

high compared to the global average. In his letter from the desk of the President, the President this week acknowledged that the women of South Africa have had enough of lukewarm actions that do not address one of the most fundamental rights for all.

To live in freedom from fear, the President also said that the law is the one sure protector of all society, and when diligently and fairly applied, it is the most powerful guarantor of justice.

In this regard, three key Bills relating to gender-based violence have been introduced in Parliament. The ANC welcomes the introduction of these Bills and salutes the President for following through on a commitment made at the joint sitting of Parliament on 18 September 2019.

National Parliament must expedite the process of passing them. These Bills will fill the gaps that allowed perpetrators to evade justice. They include the Bill to amend the Criminal Law (Sexual Offences and Related Matters) Amendment Act. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member [Interjections.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: It will expand the scope of the National Register for Sex Offenders ... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, your time is up.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: ...to include the particulars of all sex offenders.

I thank you, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Bakubaku-Vos. I now recognise EFF.

Okay, the EFF is not in the House, my apologies, hon members. I now recognise DA.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, Chairperson. The recent attempt by the ANC at Cederberg Municipality to stop the search and seizure operation of the Special Investigation Unit on Monday 14 September 2020, has highlighted the Opposition parties' disregard for the residents of Cederberg.

The Municipality attempted to interdict the SIU from carrying out its constitutional mandate. This resulted in that the SIU had to obtain a court order to carry out its constitutional duties.

It is alleged that a member of this House, hon member Danville Smith, instructed the ANC caucus at a hastily convened special Council meeting, not to cooperate with the law enforcement agencies, and to destroy all evidence that may expose acts of fraud and corruption. This is against the Constitution and certainly against the oath of office of a member of this House.

Chairperson, in 2017, under DA control, the Municipality achieved its first

ever clean audit. This changed hands, it changed hands in good financial health to the ANC. In 2019, one year later, it is being investigated for fraud, corruption, and a host of other offences. The ANC is more concerned with looting and pocketing of money, than it is for the lives and wellbeing of the residents of Cederberg.

Chairperson, many unqualified cadres at exorbitant salaries, were appointed without due process being followed. Furthermore, the Municipality owes several millions to Eskom, even though residents continue to pay for services. Corruption, mismanagement, unlawful appointments of cadres, are the norm under ANC rule, resulting in ... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, finish up your last sentence.

Mr D AMERICA: ...collapse. In conclusion, for the sake of the people living in the Cederberg, clean governance, respect for the rule of law, need to be restored urgently. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member America.

An HON MEMBER: Chair, I have had my hand up for a while now for a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay, my apologies, hon member. What is the point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): My point of order was is it parliamentary, and possibly you could rule on this matter, for the hon member America to cast aspersions on the hon member Smith? Should he not be bringing a substantive motion on this matter? I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, it is not up to me about the statement to say that if it is a substantive motion, it will have to come, but I will do the consultation with the Table staff to hear if there are any cast aspersions to that statement, and then I will revert back to you. Thank you very much. I now recognise GOOD.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, Chairperson. This Government's commitment and its Vision Inspired Priority 1, is to fund, train, and deploy 3,000 law enforcement officers and investigators in the areas with the highest crime rates, and this Parliament was asked to support a Budget allocation of R1,3 billion over the next three years to fund the boots on the ground component of the so-called Safety Plan.

But we already know that the Safety Plan is not being implemented as promised. Despite promising 3,000 law enforcement officers, the Cabinet ultimately agreed to fund only 1,000. Despite promising law enforcement officers, the Cabinet ultimately agreed to fund only learner law enforcement

officers, and these learner law enforcement officers are being deployed into communities without having completed their training.

Is the massive R1,3 billion project really going to create safe and cohesive communities? In January this year a South African Police officer was shot dead by a City of Cape Town law enforcement officer on Heerengracht in the city centre, and in July this year three City of Cape Town law enforcement officers used their law enforcement credentials and their law enforcement vehicle to stage a house robbery in Mitchells Plain. On top of this we have also received complaints about illegal training methods, where recruits have been required to handle firearms without the necessary training.

This past weekend, a new recruit to law enforcement, no doubt funded by our R1,3 billion, was instructed to take part in a training session at Ndabeni. This new recruit was injured by the facilitator, who discharged a shotgun inside a shipping container. He was apparently and inexplicably demonstrating what a live shotgun round sounds like inside a shipping container. The information we have is that the training facility is not even accredited for firearm training.

Recently the National Police Commissioner raised questions about the competency certificates of the City of Cape Town's law enforcement officers.

So do we have law enforcement officers out on the streets using firearms without proper training? And how do we place inexperienced learner law

enforcement officers in our murder capitals and expect them to survive and also to make us safer? How is it that law enforcement officers who exit the service, retain their uniforms, badges, and credentials, allowing them to pose as law enforcement officers whenever they want to? Clearly we need answers about the competency, not of the officers, but of those trained or those assigned to train and develop them.

Law enforcement operates on a rank system, and if you want the title of chief commander, you must take the responsibility. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Herron. I now recognise ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Chairperson. The ACDP is appalled by the fact that even a COVID-19 patient is not safe from sexual abuse. Chairperson, the ACDP is referring to a recent article which highlighted an alleged rape of a 20-year old COVID-19 patient at a quarantine facility near Mossel Bay. The woman was in her room when the suspect, which is a cleaner at the facility, entered and raped her. The matter was later reported to the medical personnel, who informed the police. The 27-year old suspect is currently on trial in the Mossel Bay Magistrate's Court.

Chairperson, the ACDP would like to commend the medical personnel, the police for their quick response, as well as the victim for being brave to report the crime, so the criminal can be brought to book. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Christians. I now recognise ANC.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, Chairperson. The ANC welcomes the SIU investigation into alleged PPE tender irregularities at municipalities. We call on all municipalities to cooperate and provide the SIU with all the information and support required.

Chairperson, on another investigation. The SIU is probing the WCED for paying one company, Masiqhame Trading 1057 CC, 99,8% of the entire Department's PPE spending. The MEC grandstands in the media to call on the ANC to work with him to tackle corruption and ensuring good governance. If indeed this is true, Chairperson, why are these investigations targeting only ANC-run municipalities? Specifically Matzikama and Cederberg.

Chairperson, alleged irregularities in DA-run municipalities are ignored. Swartland Municipality spent over R73 million in its relief programme, including R265 000 spent on 77 food parcels, Chairperson, for soup kitchens, yet there is no investigation.

In the past we raised allegations of electricity fraud. Over R2 million and other financial misconduct by officials at Berg Rivier Municipality. This was also not investigated, *dololo*, nothing.

How can we forget the R53 million that was spent on the Strandfontein

concentration camp by the City of Cape Town, which included the hiring of tents for R48,4 million, for a six-week period. Chairperson, a six-week period. Therefore, in welcoming these investigations and the MEC's call, we further call for these to be extended to other municipalities in the Western Cape, specifically those run by the DA. The fact that all these DA shenanigans have been ignored, suggests that there is a witch hunt by MEC Bredell and his HOD and other senior officials. There is clear evidence of political meddling by the MEC to protect DA councillors, while they [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, your time is up.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: He pursues ANC councillors. An example is the MEC concurring with the recommendations of Council ... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: ...to expel ANC councillor [Inaudible.], yet he blocked the removal of ... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ... your time is up.

An HON MEMBER: ... former Cederberg Mayor, William Joseph Farmer, following a Council disciplinary for the same transgression [Interjections.]

The MEC must ... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, your time is up.
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: [Inaudible.] all do that.

An HON MEMBER: Mute her.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Maybe she cannot hear.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...hon member. [Interjections.] I now recognise the DA.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! Hear-hear!

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: House Chair, with Cape Town dams almost full, it is easy to forget that we faced running out of water as recently as April 2018. It is easy to forget how quickly the drought struck after 2014 when our dams were also overflowing.

Our dam levels improved spectacularly, despite us consistently experiencing below average rainfall figures since 2014. As at the end of last month (August 2020) and despite this August's rainfall figures being particularly high, the Boland was still 13 millimetres below the average rainfall for the

year-to-date. No wonder that large areas of our province are still in the grip of a serious drought.

Why is it then that the Cape Town dam levels have improved so much, despite these below average rainfall figures? The biggest factor in the recovery of our dam levels has been the careful use of water by consumers, both urban consumers and farmers alike. Thanks to the continued cooperation of consumers, we have seen previously unthinkable savings in consumption. Capetonians have, during the last summers in some months, saved up to 50% when compared to historic consumption.

The awareness campaign, known by many as “The Day Zero Campaign”, is still having its positive effect. Many citizens are still collecting the water in their showers in a tray for reuse. Those that could afford it installed greywater systems who are using water in water tanks to flush toilets.

I wish to thank each and every member of the public for still using water sparingly. Let us learn from the past and continue on this path. As the Department of Local Government and MEC Bredell used to say, “Let us save water while there is still water to save.” I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise Freedom Front Plus.

Mr P J MARAIS: [No audible response.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Marais, are you with us?

Mr P J MARAIS: Yes, I am. The Freedom Front Plus notes that the Western Cape has achieved the highest recovery rate from COVID-19, in the country. Currently this figure stands at 93,6%.

We have also taken note of the fact that a 40% reduction in new infections were achieved in the Cape Metro. The whole society approach adopted by the Western Cape Health Department in delivering a comprehensive service, succeeded in flattening the curve, through inter alia stringent and extensive serological testing and surveillance. This proves the devolution of powers to the provinces, without Central Government interference, can produce positive results to the benefit of all its citizens.

We therefore applaud the Premier and the Head of Department, Dr Cloete, and his Department, for their bold decisions and initiatives in this regards. We also applaud the Western Cape citizens for adhering more and for longer periods to these restrictions imposed and exercising such great discipline. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And Minister Mbombo.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. I now recognise DA.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Chair, on 10 September 2020, Minister Gwede Mantashe announced that the National Energy Regulator of South Africa had provided its concurrence to Section 34, Ministerial Determinations, which will provide for the procurement of 11,813 Megawatts of new electricity capacity, which will come online in 2022, including 6,800 Megawatts for wind and solar; 513 Megawatts from storage; 3,000 Megawatts from gas. This will allow for the opening up Bid Window 5 of renewable energy.

With our country facing the dire effect of a second pandemic of economic decline and job losses, I hope that Minister Mantashe wastes no time in publishing the determinations which can kickstart the procurement of cleaner energy options. Given that these determinations were initially published in February of this year, NERSA should have fast-tracked their approval of energy security, and it is a top priority for keeping businesses online. We cannot afford to let a single factory or a neighbourhood of people working from home, go dark.

We welcome this move and further encourage that in the short-term, Minister Mantashe should approve the City of Cape Town's application to buy electricity directly from IPP's. The Western Cape already houses 12 renewable energy projects in terms of IPP's, and head offices of 89 renewable energy companies.

Further, NERSA should increase the threshold for registering small-scale embedded generation for own use of under 1 Megawatt to 10 Megawatts,

without the requirement of having a licence. Every household that is financially capable to do so, should be allowed to assist us in making the Western Cape energy secure, and help bring power back to the people. Chairperson, I thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: *Amandla!*

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. In terms of Rule 145 I now give one Minister present an opportunity to respond to the Members' Statements, for not more than five minutes. Is there any Minister who is going to take the opportunity?

Okay, in the silence that seems there is not any Minister who is going to take that opportunity.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hello?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay, I recognise you Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hi, can you hear me? Can you hear me, Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, I can hear you, we can all hear you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I will be responding. Thank you, thank you, Chairperson.

Hon Chairperson, I welcome yesterday's engagement with the Minister of Police, Bheki Cele; Deputy Minister Cassel Mathale; Elderman J P Smith; the National Commissioner, General Sithole; Acting Provincial Commissioner, General Manzi; the Head of National Intelligence and National Police Intelligence, General Jacobs; the Head of Hawks, General Lebeya, and we really wanted to say all other generals from SAPS, regarding the extortion of business in Cape Town, CBD and surrounds, and I also want to point out that the extortion of businesses has also been reported in places like Khayelitsha and other areas in the Western Cape.

Chairperson, the meeting was deemed urgent, because we cannot allow criminal syndicates to continue acting with impunity, while jobs, economic activity, and livelihoods are under enormous pressure due to the impact of COVID-19 pandemic and the lockdown. Cape Town CBD and surrounds employ huge numbers of people in industries, including tourism, entertainment services, and related businesses.

The spate of extortion and intimidation further leaves businesses and patrons feeling hugely unsafe. The presence of these syndicates poses a direct threat to these businesses and to foreign direct investments and will really not be tolerated within this province.

I am pleased to state that a meeting was held in an extremely positive atmosphere. There was consensus on the need for maximum cooperation and integration between all spheres of government related to law enforcement and relevant State agencies, to tackle the scourge of extortion and gangsterism, syndicate gangsterism, Madam Chair, head-on.

We also want to indicate that we resolve to immediately establish a transversal Steering Committee that would spearhead the development and implementation of a comprehensive anti-extortion plan, but also an anti-syndicate criminal plan that will deal with all criminal activities by any form of syndicates, including the issue of perlemoen, of drug smuggling, and of course of these extortions.

The intergovernmental Steering Committee is set up not to only tackle extortion as I indicated in the CBD, but to also address all other organised crimes in the province. This includes extortion-related activity in areas such as Khayelitsha, in Gugulethu, in Mfuleni, in Mitchells Plain, also on the farms in the Philippi horticultural area, and this is a real ugly animal that is sticking out its head in the province. This includes extortion-related activities in Khayelitsha, organised crime links to smuggling of drugs, perlemoen, and all other organised syndicates in the province.

I also want to, in this statement, just remind the hon member Herron, that every single certificate of compliance and competency of every law enforcement officer has been handed over to the National Police

Commissioner on time, on the deadline that it was asked for, and I can tell you that meeting that took place in such a good spirit, was because everything was compliant and everything was in order. I thank you, Madam Chairperson, †InshAllah. [If Allah wills it.] I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: InshAllah?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ... Minister Fritz.

That concludes the Members' Statements. We are now going to move to the Notices of Motion. I have been informed that in the Programming Authority meeting of 25 August 2020, it was resolved that political parties would submit the names of hon members in the desired order of speaking, and who wish to move motions with notice in the sitting of the House.

I will therefore recognise hon members whose names have accordingly been submitted, alternating between the Majority Party and Opposition Parties. I now recognise hon member Smith.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Mr D SMITH: Chairperson, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House considers the double standards with which the DA governs in this province and municipalities, as the honourable Premier Alan Winde on the one hand wants all protective measures of the health pandemic removed, yet that party keeps illogical measures of control and even wants to limit calls for prayers under its notorious nuisance by-laws.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Smith, we are doing the notices of motions, not the motions without notice. I am now going to move to hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Chairperson, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the ongoing taxi-related murders.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Christians. Moving notices of motion, I now recognise hon member Mitchell.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Chairperson, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the state of trains, rail infrastructure, and the safety of commuters in the Western Cape.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. I now recognise hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the double standards by the DA in this Legislature, that fights all lockdown regulations aiding the bringing down of devastating alcohol-related crime and injuries, yet the hon Premier Alan Winde on radio this week admits these measures and regulations did bring down this type of violence.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise hon member Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Chairperson, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of the ongoing drought in some

parts of the Western Cape on food security in the Western Cape, as well as its impact on the local economies of rural communities. Chairperson, the drought has now been declassified by National Government as a national disaster, despite severe challenges still faced in areas such as the Karoo.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise again hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates and examines the use of the Western Cape Safety Plan Leap Officers in land invasions or evictions, and its impact on the fight against crime.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon member America.

Mr D AMERICA: Chairperson, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House (1) notes the serious allegation of fraud against a

member of this House, hon member Danville Smith of the ANC; (2) notes that this alleged fraudulent action relates to food parcel distribution within the Cederberg Municipality; (3) notes that a criminal case was laid with the Hawks (fraud case number 35/08/2020); and (4) agrees to refer the matter to the Public Protector for investigation.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise hon member Smith.

An HON MEMBER: Chair, our Chief Whip has her hand up. I think – ja, I see the Chief Whip’s hand up, Chair.

An HON MEMBER: Also hon member Kama’s hand is up.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I am going to recognise hon member Chief Whip of the Opposition Party first. Hon member Lekker, my apologies.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Chairperson. Greetings everyone. Chair, I wish to bring your attention to a fact that hon member America needs to bring a substantive motion in this regard. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): House Chair?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I am listening, hon member Wenger.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, House Chair. If the hon member Lekker listened carefully, she would have noted that it is a motion with notice, and therefore it is a substantive motion.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Chief Whip of the Majority Party. I now recognise hon member Lekker again.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [No audible response.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lekker, is it the old hand? Can I recognise hon member Kama in your absentia?

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, Chair.

Chair, I need your indulgence. Earlier when hon member Smith moved a motion with notice, you just ruled that we are dealing with motions without notice, and I assumed maybe that might be in relation to the structure of the motion that he has moved, but now that motion is in no way different to the motion that is moved by hon member America, but you are in this case of hon member America, accepting the motion as it is.

I would like, Chair, to request that you perhaps look at Hansard and really apply your mind in the motion that was applied by hon member Smith, because I believe that it does fit the required structure as he had given it with notice. Thanks, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. Hon member, when hon member Smith did the motion, it was [Interjections.] the motion without notice. Who is interjecting?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It is Pat Lekker. I had my hand up and I do not know what happened.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay, I will recognise you just now, hon member. Let me address hon member Kama first and then I will come back to you.

Hon member Kama, like I was saying, hon member Smith moved the motion without notice.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Mmm-hmm.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: And I [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...said...

An HON MEMBER: No, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: And if it was not the motion without notice, then I need to recognise that and recognise it as the motion with notice. [Interjections.] Can I recognise you, hon member Lekker?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Chair. Greetings once again. Indeed, hon member Danville moved a motion with notice when he first spoke.

Two, Chair, I wish to actually indeed appeal to your conscience that you properly consult the Table staff instead of listening to the Chief Whip of the Majority Party and allowing her to guide you on how you must rule on this matter. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I really appreciate your advice, hon member, but I will appreciate it if we can continue with the notices of motion so that we can, I can ... [Interjections.] without interjection.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): What is your ruling, Chair? [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon ... [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... in relation to the motion raised by hon member

America? You have not spoken about your ruling.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Ja. Hon member Lekker, if we can, I can recognise you, it is then that you will be able to hear what is it that I am going to say after you have spoken.

So when you interject immediately after you have spoken, it is difficult for you to know what is it that I am going to say, or anticipate what is it that I am going to say beforehand.

So allow me to come back to the notice of motion by hon member America, but I see the hand of hon member Wenger first. Can I recognise you, Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, House Chair.

In the definitions of the Standing Rules it says that:

“A substantive motion is a proposal for separate consideration by the House, including a motion relating to any allegation against a member in accordance with Rule 59(2).”

And that is precisely what hon member America did in motion with notice.

So therefore it is our view that it was procedural in the way that it was

presented.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Wenger. I will revert back to the two motions that are in question, of hon member Smith and hon member America, after consultation with the Table staff. Can we continue with the notices of motion? I now recognise hon member Smith.

Mr D SMITH: [No audible response.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Whilst hon member Smith is trying to connect, can I recognise hon member Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chairperson, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates why the Democratic Alliance hides behind so-called quality education whenever it is confronted with vast unequal education in the Western Cape. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Hon Sayed, again. It is your chance.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Chair, I give notice that I shall

move:

That the House debates the DA's attempt to evade public scrutiny and accountability on the Public Service Commission's *Investigative Report on the Extension of Employment for the Head of Department: Education, beyond Retirement Age*. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Hon Smith?

Mr D SMITH: Yes, Chair. [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I recognise you.

Mr D SMITH: Thank you so much, Chair. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the way the hon Local Government MEC, Anton Bredell, recently ill-treated two women namely Cederberg Mayor Silvia Qunta and Matzikama Mayor Mathilda Banks with a view to demand of the hon Premier Alan Winde to discipline the MEC. Thank you.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon members.

Hon members, I just want to remind the members that in the past there was a notice of motion, which was substantive as previously ruled on by the Presiding Officer. I think it was a motion that was brought in by hon Dugmore, by the Deputy Speaker, and there was no objection in that regard.

So, too, the motion that hon Smith has brought in, is the same motion that hon America also brought in. There was not any objection to that. So I hope with the precedence that was set, that it will continue as it is now. That brings us to the conclusion of the notices of motions. We are going to move on to Motions without Notice. I now recognise hon Marran.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr P MARRAN: Thank you, hon Chair. I move without notice:

That the House sends condolences to the Breede Valley Municipality, family and friends of Breede Valley Deputy Mayor John Levendal, who died yesterday morning after his short illness. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Is there any objection to the motion?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: The motion is agreed to. I now recognise hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Chairperson. I move without notice:

That the House extends our condolences to the bereaved families of the 29-year old Desmond Khoba and the 23-year old Giovanni Canterbury; Chairperson, the ACDP is referring to the two that were involved in a car accident in Elsie's River; Desmond just celebrated the birth of his son a few days ago before the tragic car accident took his life; it is believed that they were on their way heading to KFC; no-one knows who the driver of the car was that led up to the accident; Giovanni who was flung out of the car and was pinned down by an oncoming vehicle said his last words to his mother before passing away; a 3-year old boy named Mason was also in the car but was protected by another survivor and was discharged from hospital; Chairperson, our prayers and thoughts are with the families. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. I recognise the hon America.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with dismay that the ANC-led administration at Cederberg Municipality interfered with the work of the Special Investigative Unit on taking a resolution in the special Council meeting held on 14 September 2020; Deputy Speaker, through their purposeful interference to interdict the SIU, so they would not be able to fulfil their task, a message is sent that accountability and transparency do not exist in that ANC-led administration; Hon Deputy Speaker, that this House further notes that the SIU had to obtain a court order to execute a search and seizure operation in the Cederberg Municipality on Monday 14 September 2020. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. The hon Smith, I see your hand is still up ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can I just check exactly why your hand is up?

Mr D SMITH: We are objecting.

An HON MEMBER: We object, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. The objection is noted. That will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House recommends that the desirability and the feasibility of outsourcing the dispensing of chronic and other medicines to accredited pharmacists throughout the Western Cape be investigated to ease the burden on clinics and hospitals who cannot cope with the ever-increasing number of patients and the issue of social distancing. This will allow nurse aids to only visit and deliver medicines to elderly and handicapped patients as well as testing their blood pressures, sugar levels and keeping medical records of their general state of health; these nurse aids would also be able to report whether there are signs of neglect, malnutrition or abuse of the elderly; I further move that the Minister of Health in the Western Cape and her Department prepare a report in this regard for further consideration by this House. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections.

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Objections. There are objections. [Interjections.]

The motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

An HON MEMBER: It is the DA, it is the DA, hon member.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I recognise hon Marran.

†Mnr P MARRAN: Agb Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy medelye stuur aan die familie, vriende en druiweboere-gemeenskap in die Hex Vallei met die afsterwe van die 74-jarige Stefaans Rossouw wie vermoedelik op 10 September 2020 aan 'n hartaanval gesterf het. Dankie.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr P MARRAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the family, friends and grape farmers community in the Hex Valley on the death of the 74-year-old Stefaans Rossouw who on 10 September 2020 presumedly died of a heart attack. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Deputy Speaker, can I ask a question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry.

An HON MEMBER: Hon Deputy Speaker, before the question ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marran, did you disappear after you just made the statement? Hon Marais is there a point of order? You cannot ask a question, but if there is a point of order, I am willing to hear you.

Mr P J MARAIS: No, I just wanted clarity. I am not sure, I heard bubbling. Were there objections to my motion?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There was an objection to your motion. That is correct, hon Marais and it will be printed on the Order Paper. Can I please go back to hon Marran? I think he broke up there straight after I heard that he had a heart attack. If you could just continue from there, hon Marran.

†Mnr P MARRAN: Adjunkspeaker, laat ek liever oor begin. Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy medelye stuur aan die familie, vriende en druiweboere-

gemeenskap in die Hex Vallei met die afsterwe van die 74-jarige druiweboer, Stefanus Rossouw, wie vermoedelik op 10 September 2020 aan 'n hartaanval gesterf het. Dankie.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr P MARRAN: Deputy Speaker, let me rather start over. Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the family, friends and grape farmers community in the Hex Valley on the death of the 74-year-old grape farmer Stefanus Rossouw who on 10 September 2020 presumably died of a heart attack. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: *Okay*. Baie dankie, agb lid.

[The Deputy SPEAKER: *Okay*. Thank you, hon member.] †Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. I recognise hon Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the current turmoil at the Western Cape High Court over public allegations of improper conduct, undue interference, assassination plots, and nepotism; acknowledges that a strong, united judiciary is vital for the effective functioning of our country; calls on the Chief Justice Mogoeng Mogoeng to intervene to restore the dignity and proper functioning of the Western Cape High Court, in the interests of justice and democracy. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. I recognise hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Marais or Marran, hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: My apologies. Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the utter failure of the Western Cape Housing or Human Settlements Department over the last six years, for its failure to build houses on 1 000 service plots in De Doorns. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. There are objections in the Chamber. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Wenger.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House extends its deepest condolences to the family and friends of Mr Cederic Schilder, the father of Ms Nerine Schilder who serves Members of this House. Mr Schilder passed away yesterday, 16 September 2020 at the age of 77; Deputy Speaker, Mr Schilder spent 31 years of his life as a trawler fisherman, and before retirement, he served at the Meadowridge Primary School in Lentegueur; Mr Schilder will fondly be remembered as a real giant of care, one who spent his last days with his loving family; our hearts go out to Ms Nerine Schilder, and we trust that the family will find comfort in the legacy left behind by Mr Cederic Schilder. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. I recognise hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes vast quantities of cigarettes and alcohol confiscated under the COVID-19 protective lockdown period, by the Saldanha Bay Municipality, have disappeared without a trace and calls for a full report on this occurrence. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. Hon Philander?

†Me W F PHILANDER: Agb Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis met hartseer kennis neem van die afsterwe van raadslid John Levendal, onder-burgemeester van die Breedevallei Munisipaliteit, binne weke van die afsterwe van sy geliefde vrou Koekie. Onder-burgemeester Levendal was 'n skoolprinsipaal in die Hexrivier Vallei, alvorens hy gedien het as burgemeester van De Doorns Munisipaliteit in 1995. Ontslape onder-burgemeester Levendal het gedien in sy hoedanigheid in die Breedevallei Munisipaliteit sedert 2011 en was welbekend in die landelike gemeenskap, waar hy noemenswaardige verhoudinge opgebou het met landbouers en werkers

in die area; ek dra so ons innige meegevoel en simpatie oor aan die Levendal- en uitgebreide families en kollegas en vriende en ons wens hulle alle sterkte toe in die moeilike tyd. Ons salueer onderburgemeester Levendal vir sy leierskapsrol, die passie vir sy gemeenskap en sy lofwaardige liefde vir die gemeenskap van die Breedevallei; mag sy siel in vrede rus. Ek dra so in.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Ms W F PHILANDER: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with sadness the death of councillor John Levendal, Deputy Mayor of the Breede Vslley Municipality, within weeks of the death of his beloved wife Koekie. Deputy Mayor Levendal was a school principal in the Hex River Valley, before serving as Mayor of De Doorns Municipality in 1995. The late Deputy Mayor Levendal had served in his capacity in the Breede Valley Municipality since 2011 and was well-known in the rural community, where he established noteworthy relationships with farmers and workers in the area; I thus convey our sincere condolences and sympathy to the Levendal and extended families and to colleagues and friends and we wish them strength in the difficult time. We salute Deputy Mayor Levendal for his leader's role, the passion for his

community and his commendable love for the community of the Breede Valley; may his soul rest in peace. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie, agb lid.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.] Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the establishment of self-help organisations like Sustainable Bo-Kaap, that are aimed at building self-reliant, community-based food gardens and that we encourage all spheres of government to support such efforts. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. Hon Wenger.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without

notice:

That the House condemns the abuse of State resources by the African National Congress for the purposes of an official visit to Zimbabwe, and for flouting COVID-19 lockdown regulations; calls on the ANC to remember the importance of the separation of party and State in our democracy; welcomes the commitment by the guilty ANC officials to pay back the money which they stole from the State; and calls on the ANC to remain committed to the principles of the Constitution and to ending their project of State capture which has deprived millions of South Africans of their dignity and human rights. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Objection.

HON MEMBERS: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The ANC agreed to pay back the money!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House condemns the religious intolerance, bigotry and toxic masculinity that was displayed last week in Paarl when a man attacked a Muslim woman, tried to remove her veil and abused her verbally and calls on investigators to deal with such criminals.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. Hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with sadness the passing of architect Gawie Fagan; he is acknowledged by his contemporaries as one of South Africa's first architects of the 20th century, with numerous awards for his work which include honorary doctorates from the University of the Free State, and the University of Stellenbosch, the Gold Medal of Honour from the South African Institute of Architects, the University of Pretoria Chancellor's Award, and the City of Cape Town Civic Honours; he was known not only for his original architectural work which influenced generations of architects, but together with his wife

Gwen, for his conservation work which included the restoration of 24 historical houses in the town of Tulbagh that had been devastated by an earthquake. Over time they would become leading experts on the conservation and restoration of Cape Dutch era architecture; Gawie and Gwen were leading advocates for a movement to prevent the Foreshore highways from being completed and destroying a vital section of Cape Town's built environment which centred on Heritage Square, and extended into the Bo-Kaap. They would go on to lobby for the restoration of the Waterfront to the City's residents; which ultimately culminated in the world-famous V&A Waterfront development; I move that this House extends our sincere condolences to the friends, colleagues and family of Gawie Fagan, and in Heritage Month acknowledges his incredible contribution to the preservation and restoration of our historical built environment. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. I recognise hon Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes Local Government MEC, Anton Bredell, is about to abandon the sinking Western Cape DA ship with him at the helm as Provincial Chairman; also notes that he rather avails himself now as a DA Federal Chairperson; and lastly notes this sudden change of heart comes only after it was revealed he appointed Agriculture MEC Ivan Meyer's son in a senior strategic position within the Provincial Administration. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

HON MEMBERS: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, there are objections in the Chamber. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] Order members. Order. I now recognise hon Baartman.

Ms D BAARTMAN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House notes that there has been a decline of 67% in the tourism and hospitality sector in the country with job losses estimated at over 100 000 in the Western Cape due to the impact of the COVID-19 lockdown regulations; acknowledges that the City of Cape Town and the Western Cape has, over the last 10 years, hosted the most international association conferences in Africa with the Western Cape having hosted 57 international association meetings with approximately 21 000 delegates

and an average of 3,6 days per event with international congresses in 2019; recognises that in the 2019 fiscal year the City of Cape Town and Western Cape Convention Bureau secured bids with an estimated economic impact of R1 billion for this province; also notes that yesterday, 16 September, President Ramaphosa announced that international borders will open on 1 October, with the exception of high-risk COVID-19 countries; and welcomes the promise of a defined date for our borders to open and the Western Cape's strong commitment to safe and responsible tourism which was reflected in the award of the Safe Travels Stamp by the World Travel and Tourism Council. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the Witsand community is victorious in its long fight for a new primary and temporary secondary school in the area of Atlantis as the Education Department has approved a temporary school from next year onwards; and that the House encourages learners to grab hold of this opportunity to improve their education; and urges the

Government to ensure that water and electricity are operational from next year. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. Hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House notes the celebration of Heritage Day on 24 September, next week; that this House recognises that the diverse cultural and traditions held here in the Western Cape, encourages the celebration of these diverse cultures and heritage, and its contribution to South Africa as the rainbow nation; and that this House further notes that this is what makes our democracy unique and that such a celebration promotes social cohesion. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. Hon America.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes of the eight Metros polled, Cape Town once again emerged as the best-performing Metro in the country on overall citizen satisfaction. The City of Cape Town has received the highest score for the seventh consecutive year; Deputy Speaker, the *South African Citizen Satisfaction Index Report* conducted by Consulta, showed that Cape Town has the smallest gap in terms of what citizens perceive and receive through service delivery; Deputy Speaker, that this House congratulates the City of Cape Town and its staff, as it continues to lead the way and put its residents' needs at the top of its priority list. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member.

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Objection. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the long battle a learner in Hermanus encountered at the Curro private institution with a school bully and now wants to be transferred to a Curro school in Cape Town to complete his matric in peace next year. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. Hon Baartman.

Ms D BAARTMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that Minister of Mineral Resources and Energy, Gwede Mantashe, announced that the National Energy Regulator of South Africa (NERSA) has provided its concurrence to Section 34 Ministerial Determinations; further notes that this will provide for the procurement of 11 813 MW of new electricity capacity in terms of the 2019 IRP, which will be the next step in opening up the Renewable Energy Independent Power Producer Procurement Programme Bid Window 5, the Gas Independent Power Producer Programme and Energy Storage Procurement; recognises that the Western Cape already houses 12 renewable energy IPP projects and head offices of 89 renewable energy companies; and calls upon Minister Mantashe to urgently sign and gazette the final Section 34 Ministerial

Determinations which will allow for a more energy-secure future in the Western Cape and South Africa. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. Hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the DA double standards when it comes to findings of institutions that are established to support democracy; that the same DA praised the Public Service Commission when it made findings against the South African Police Services in the province, but now defies the recommendations of the very same Public Service Commission on the Education HOD matter without even approaching a court to have the report findings set aside; and that this House notes the DA wants to make it a law unto itself. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Objection! Go and check the facts. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. There are objections coming from the Chamber. Your motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] I recognise hon Philander.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House congratulates and extends our sincere appreciation to the CEO, Dr Matodzi Mukosi, all medical practitioners and staff at the Red Cross War Memorial Children's Hospital for the ground-breaking work they do at this world class facility; further notes, that during the COVID-19 pandemic the hospital was able to absorb adolescent patients from other health care facilities; the House further extends appreciation to the Children's Hospital Trust and all the various donors, who fervently support the facility, as we observed during our oversight visit on 16 September 2020; and that this facility does not only offer healthcare but fosters the inclusive family bond and social assistance in endeavouring complete recovery. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without

notice:

That this House notes the complaints by the community about the overcrowded and understaffed Enkanini Primary School in Khayelitsha; notes these complaints were brought to the Speaker by the school governing body this week; and calls for a full investigation by the Speaker and report back to the House on the complaint. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. There are objections coming from the Chamber. Your motion will be printed on an Order Paper. I now recognise hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes this week marks six months of the COVID-19 pandemic's shelter measure under the emergency medical lockdown and notes the Western Cape quickly led as a hotspot of infection and is up to date still the leading province with a death rate of more than 4 000 people. I so move. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Objection! Check your facts!

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, of course we all heard that objection

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Order, order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House wishes all matric learners well with the present preparation tests before their final exams; and expresses concern that a quarter of Grade 12 learners has not returned to school as yet. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Objection. It is not correct. The facts are not correct.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There are objections. Your motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Sayed, I recognise you again.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the unhappiness of the Crawford community over the construction of a new cell phone tower at the Thornton Road Primary School and calls on the Western Cape Education Department to investigate the problem and to report back to this House. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. There are objections to the motion being moved without notice. That is being recorded ... [Interjection.] Thank you

very much, Deputy Chief Whip. I move on to hon Bans.

Ms A BANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes famous Cape cook, Flori Schrikker, of Bonteheuwel died after a heart by-pass operation. She and Koelsoem Kamalie, who died earlier this year, regularly cooked together and even co-wrote a Cape cookbook, and that this House sends condolences to her family and friends. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the upsurge in violence, ill-discipline, staff turnover and poor academic performance at the Brooklands Primary School in Northpine allegedly due to poor management; that the school governing body has consistently raised these concerns with the Education Department; and calls on the Department to address this matter speedily. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] There are objections coming from the Chamber. Your motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may continue, hon Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the University of the Western Cape extended its numbers for almost 3 000 residents by taking into use a new R640 million hostel in Belhar – 100m from the Bellville Campus, and welcomes this step towards housing more students. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. Hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the Western Cape Government wants to issue all emergency workers with body cameras recording evidence; workers who are regular targets will get the equipment first; and it is done because of the growing number of attacks. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved? There are objections from the Chamber. Your motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commiserates with family, friends and comrades of the PR Councillor of the ANC, comrade Sibusiso Nkomiyahlaba who died after a short illness. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. Hon Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the latest GBV victim is a woman at a quarantine facility in Mossel Bay who was raped by a cleaner; and that the Provincial Department of Public Works moved the victim to another safer facility; and that SAPS investigates the incident. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. Hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes Paarl Boys High pianist, 13-year-old Mike Wann, won a national high school music prize. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. Hon members, just before I go on, I just want to ask that you remain online as I will deliver a ruling straight after the last motion without notice. I now move

over to Hon Bans.

Ms A BANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House appreciates police excellence in service by Brigadier Du Toit, cluster commander of the Central Karoo who went beyond the call of duty last week and successfully assisted in finding a young abducted girl in Swellendam outside the boundaries of his cluster; further notes his speedy response and dedication to his work after working hours and applauds him for his excellent service. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. Hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. If I may, firstly I want to communicate that after this motion I will have only one motion left as opposed to the two as one of the motions I wanted to move has already been moved by the Chief Whip of the Official Opposition. If I may then, Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed. Noted. Thank you.

Mr M KAMA: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes three suspects were caught with illegal drugs to the value of R4 million in an Elsie's River roadblock and lauds the police for pushing drug sellers back. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I do not have any motions left. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No problem, then I hand back to hon Kama who will deliver his last motion.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes two people were shot and killed, and their bodies dumped next to the Baden Powell Way in Khayelitsha – on Sunday a

man and on Monday a woman was found and calls on the investigators to solve these murders. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: No objections.

RULINGS

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. Hon members, that brings us to the end of Motions without Notice. I would now like to deliver two rulings – my apologies. That word just disappeared.

On the first ruling, hon members, on 10 September 2020 during the debate on Interpellation 3, the hon member Mitchell raised a point of order, wanting me to rule on the factual input by hon member Smith. As I did not hear specifically what was said at the time, I undertook to study the Hansard and rule on this matter at a subsequent sitting of the House. It is not for the Chair to determine the accuracy or otherwise of statements made by hon members during a debate and I therefore cannot make a determination on the intent of hon member as to whether he deliberately misled the House. Should hon Mitchell wish to pursue the matter further, he is welcome to utilise the existing process the Standing Rules provide for. I thank you on that.

On the second ruling, during Interpellations on 10 September 2020, the hon member Mitchell raised a point of order in terms of Rule 59, namely reflections upon members of the House and requested me to rule on allegations made by hon member Smith. As I did not hear specifically what was said at the time, I undertook to study the Hansard and rule on this matter at a subsequent sitting of the House. During Interpellation 3, hon Smith in his speech said the following and I quote from the Hansard,

“The son of MEC Meyer has been appointed as an Assistant Director in the Department of Local Government and Environmental Affairs. MEC Ivan Meyer, as one of the senior Cabinet members, and a member of the DA’s FedEx enjoys close relations with MEC Bredell as they have served together in the Provincial Government and in the DA structures for many years. There are reasonable grounds to believe that there is some form of influence in the appointment of his son in MEC Bredell’s Office Department.”

The remarks in question reflect negatively upon the character and the integrity of hon Min Meyer and is therefore unparliamentary and I must therefore ask hon Smith to withdraw these remarks. Hon Smith?

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, can you hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I can hear you now, hon Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you so much. I
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Smith, sorry.

Mr D SMITH: Yes?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is that you?

Mr D SMITH: Yes, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you. I hereby withdraw the
remarks as requested. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Smith. I really
appreciate that. The sitting is now adjourned. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Very honourable, very honourable.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, indeed.

The House adjourned at 17:56.