

---

THURSDAY, 17 AUGUST 2023

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid Sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

Hon member Maseko took the Chair and read the prayer.

**BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may be seated. As has been our practice to date, hon members will participate in this Sitting of the House both from here in the Chamber with the Presiding Officer and the Table staff present, and via Microsoft Teams. Our Standing Rules have accordingly been amended to accommodate such hybrid Sittings of the House.

The hon members experiencing challenges in connecting to this Sitting are required to contact the WCPP ICT colleagues who will assist to resolve their connectivity challenges.

Should a member of this Provincial Parliament elect to participate virtually and not from the Chamber, in that case such a member's responsibility is to ensure that he or she has a good quality data connectivity, good quality audio and video, that there are no disturbances where they are. Members will note that the hybrid system has been functioning well. Poor audio and/or video are not attributable to the system but rather the quality of data connectivity.

The media have also been granted access to this MS Teams meeting as guests of the WCPP. However, members of the press may not use the chat room or speak or activate their cameras while the Sitting is in progress. If an individual, who is not a member of this House, activates their mic or video camera, such an individual will be exited from the Sitting immediately.

I request those here today who are not members of this House to please observe the decorum of the House.

For this Sitting, Language Translation Services are available in the Chamber, as usual, and on Microsoft Teams via the respective channels. Hon members participating in this Sitting of the House must please access the Language Translation Services via a second device, your cell phone. If you have earphones available, please use them for the Language Translation Services. Members are also reminded that no interjections are permitted during these hybrid Sittings. To this end I draw the hon members' attention to Rule 40 of our Standing Rules.

Before we continue I just want to acknowledge the Mitchells Plain SAPS Women's Network that have joined us in the Sitting today. You are welcome here. Thank you very much.

Hon members, I recognise the Deputy Chief Whip. Member Dugmore?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, Chair. The point of order I would like to raise is under Rule 66 in regard to Rule 3(A). Speaker, when you were reading the prayer, I noticed that or I heard that from the side of the DA benches there was a cell phone that went off. I think that is not conduct in terms of 66(3)(A), and I request you to please not only request members of the DA to ensure that they respect the House prayer by having their phones off, but to also actually ask the Chief Whip of the DA to investigate which of their members are to blame. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, thank you very much. I think the decorum of this House, responsibility is with all members, so if we can adhere to that, irrespective of which political party. That is what our communities are expecting to see from you as leaders. So I am talking to members from both sides of the House, that that will be the case for this Sitting until we end the day.

Thank you very much, member. Member America?

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, Chair. Chair, it is my telephone that went off and I do apologise. It was unintentional. I was not aware and I deeply regret that it has gone off during the prayer. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. That is noted. Member Marran?

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks Chairperson and good afternoon to everyone present. The hon America has now admitted that it was him. Can the hon Van der Westhuizen please apologise to me because he blamed me as the culprit.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member that is not a point of order. Let us continue with the business of the day. It is going to be a long Sitting if we are going to start on that note. I suspect you will be here until nine o'clock, nine p.m. if you are going to go in that fashion. So let us continue. I recognise the Deputy Chief Whip.

(Motion)

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, House Chairperson. I move without notice:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 20(1), precedence be given firstly to the Subject for Discussion, and then Questions to the Premier without Notice. I so move.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Deputy Chief Whip of the Majority Party. Are there any objections to the motion? No objection? Agreed to.

The Subject for Discussion today, we will now deal with the Subject for Discussion in the name of hon Brinkhuis as printed on the Order Paper. I recognise hon Brinkhuis.

### **SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION**

*That land and agricultural start-ups be released especially to women who are involved in food gardening and community gardening projects and to women living on farms*

Mr G BRINKHUIS (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and good afternoon to you and good afternoon to all the colleagues.

Hon Speaker, poverty in the Western Cape remains at high levels and recent statistics revealed that the situation is not improving at a satisfactory pace. Cape Town is recognised as a global city and characterised by inequality. We are a province with deep-rooted inequality in the economy, education and health sectors, which reflects the income of families and their access to well-balanced and regular meals.

A 2022 report by the United Nations on the UN Habitat State of the World's Cities, "Bridging the Urban Divide", made mention that South African cities had an income coefficients from 0,69 to 0,75 and at that time Cape Town's estimated coefficient was 0,69. The most recent figure for 2021 is 0,63, an unacceptable high level according to the United Nations who describes a coefficient of 0,4 as reason for concern.

The historical urban inequality in South Africa was further entrenched by the racist segregation under apartheid laws. We all know the effects of the apartheid system which included the restriction on quality education, healthcare and economic opportunities. The existing spatial development is no different than during apartheid. The townships on the Cape Flats are bursting at its seams with informal settlements and backyard dwellers, characterised by high unemployment and poverty. These are all tangible proof of a city of inequality.

Cape Town is South Africa's second largest city with a population of more than 4,7 million. Our unemployment rate has increased from 18,3 in 2011 to 29% in 2021, which was exacerbated due to the COVID pandemic. Stats SA calculated an unemployment rate of 57,9% in 2021.

Food insecurity: in the Western Cape food insecurity is more common among Black, African and Coloured communities. An estimated 53% Africans and 41% Coloureds do not have adequate access to food.

Just over a year ago, the Legislature released figures to a question by the hon member Bakubaku-Vos that 13% of children in the Western Cape are living in households that have insufficient food; 21% of children live in households where meals were skipped due to insufficient funds or resources for food.

Sadly, not only are children affected by insufficient food, but also the elderly, who in most cases rather see that their grandchildren have food to eat. Young children are stunted due to lack of nutrition, nutritious food, and they become more susceptible to childhood diseases. We see on public roads how children are forced to scurry for food, and doing so, they are exposed to sexual abuse and exploitation.

Proactive solutions: Speaker, identify women in communities involved in feeding schemes. Many of them do not have land to grow food and the necessary resources to maintain their humble gardens, which support their feeding schemes. Women living on farms should be provided with land to plant their own food and sell to the local markets or to support feeding schemes in the area.

Provincial Government must give substantial support to implement more feeding schemes in poor areas, provide land and agricultural start-ups. The ordinary auntie who makes soup or food or hands out sandwiches should be recognised and given the necessary assistance for her selfless deed.

Introduce agriculture as a subject from primary school level, teach young children to grow food. Schools that do have food gardens lack support with resources to help them maintain the gardens. The current feeding schemes are not sufficient as it is only enough food to relieve hunger and school food gardens are another way to provide nutritious meals to its learners.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Brinkhuis, can you conclude.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (ANC): Thank you, Speaker. Food gardens at schools continue to receive support with agricultural start-ups even during holidays. Early Childhood Development, ECDs... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (ANC): Thank you very much, Speaker.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I now recognise hon member Van der Westhuizen.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Agbare Voorsitter, ek wil graag die agbare Brinkhuis bedank dat hy hierdie mosie na die huis gebring het, veral in Augustus wat algemeen bekend geword het as Vrouemaand.



Suid-Afrika se ekonomie was vir baie jare tot en met die ontdekking van ons minerale rykdom gebou op landbou as die grootste bydraer tot die ekonomie, en alhoewel nywerhede, die finansiële sektor en veral deesdae die rekenaarwêreld intussen groot werkgewers geword het, bly landbou uiters noodsaaklik.

Die hele wêreld sit met die uitdaging om jaarliks meer voedsel te produseer vir 'n groeiende wêreldbevolking. Die vraag na voedsel en veral bekostigbare voedsel is 'n immerstygende uitdaging en Suid-Afrika is bevoorreg om een van die netto produsente van voedsel te kan wees. Verstedeliking is 'n realiteit en in die proses word al meer mense die geleentheid ontnem om grond te besit waarop kos verbou kan word.

Die Wes-Kaapse Departement van Landbou het daarom oor die afgelope aantal jare baie opleiding, hulp in die vorm van grondontleding, toepaslike saad toerusting en advies verleen aan gemeenskapstuine. Tot 'n groot mate produseer hierdie tuine voedsel vir eie gebruik, maar ook vir gemeenskapsorganisasies soos crèches, skole, en so meer. In die meeste gevalle is hierdie tuine relatief klein. Tog vind derduisende mense reeds baat by die vars gesonde produkte, meestal groente, wat hierdie tuine produseer. Dit is waarom die Departement van Landbou hierdie jaar alreeds 700 nuwe voedseltuine ondersteun met 66% van diegene – betrokke by die bestuur van die tuine – wat vroue is.

Die vestiging van klein intensiewe groentetuine is nie uniek tot Suid-Afrika nie. Ek is sowat 40 jaar gelede die eerste keer bekendgestel aan Nederlandse *Volkstuinen*, voorheen bekend in die arm tye selfs as *kooltuinen* of *allotments*. Nederland beslaan maar sowat 3,4% van Suid-Afrika se oppervlakte, en tog is daar in Nederland 240 000 van hierdie geregistreerde tuine. Waar die aanvanklike doel was om gesonde voedsel vir hoofsaaklik eie gebruik en ruilhandel te produseer het die bewerking van sulke stukke grond verskuif na die ontspannings en terapeutiese waarde en die persoonlike vreugde wat mense daaruit put om iets – in hierdie geval vir plante te sorg en te sien hoe dit groei. Daar is gevolglik 'n lang waglys vir hierdie tuine of stukkie grond, maar gemeenskapstuine is nie beperk tot Nederland nie. Ons sien dit ook tot in 'n meerdere of mindere mate in baie ander lande soos Frankryk, Duitsland, Engeland en Kanada. Met meer en meer mense wêreldwyd wat noodwendig op kleiner stukke grond en in woonstelle gehuisves moet word, is dit belangrik dat meer entiteite – en ek verwys hier na SANRAL, Propnet van Transnet en die Nasionale Departement van Openbare Werke as maar sommige voorbeelde – meer van hulle grond beskikbaar sal stel vir gemeenskapstuine. Die Staande Komitee op Landbou, Omgewingsake en Ontwikkelingsbeplanning het onder andere al verneem van die hoë terapeutiese waarde wat tuinbou vir mense inhou. Tuinbou is ook dikwels 'n aktiwiteit wat ingesluit word in die rehabilitasie van middelafhanklikes, gevangenes en as deel van die herstelproses vir pasiënte met geestesongesteldhede. Tuine wat goed onderhou en deeglik bewerk word kan ook 'n groot bydrae lewer om die omgewing te verfraai.

My waarnemings klop met die van die agbare Brinkhuis, naamlik dat vroue dikwels diegene is wat die leiding neem in die versorging van hierdie tuine en daarvoor het ek groot waardering en respek, maar, Voorsitter, deur u aan die agbare Brinkhuis, ek tel in sy mosie op dat hy vroue hoofsaaklik sien as persone wie se bydrae beperk is tot primêre landbou; dat dit sy begeerte is om vroue te sien as die mense wat die fisies harde werk moet doen om in die tuine te werk.

Die Demokratiese Alliansie se droom vir vroue is egter baie groter as dit. Ons sien 'n toenemende getal suksesvolle vroue-entrepreneurs in die veel groter sekondêre landboubedrywe. Dit is waar die grootste werksgeleentehede wag, en ons het verskeie pragtige voorbeelde van vroue in ons provinsie wat besig is om hulle merk te maak in sekondêre landbou, te veel om op te noem.

Ek kan verwys na die ikoniese wynmaker, Ntsiki Biyela, of Natasha Williams met haar eie wyn genaamd Lelie van Saron, of Carmen Stevens van Carmen Stevens Wyne, volgens berigte die eerste swart Suid-Afrikaner wat die kuns van wynmaak formeel studeer het.

Die Wes-Kaapse Departement van Landbou het dan ook al kompetisies aangebied waar spesifiek erkenning verleen is aan vroue entrepreneurs in landbou en waar Minister Ivan Meyer die pryse oorhandig het.

Ek sluit af met nog drie voorbeelde van die baie vroue se prestasies in landbou. Dis die tipe rolle wat die DA vir vroue in landbou sien.

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Hon Chair, I would like to thank the hon Brinkhuis for bringing this motion to the House, especially in August that has generally become known as Womens' Month.

South Africa's economy has for many years up to and including the discovery of our mineral wealth been built on agriculture as the greatest contributor to the economy, and although industries, the financial sector and currently especially the computer world have become large employers, agriculture remains extremely crucial.

The whole world has the challenge to produce more food annually for a growing world population. The demand for food and especially affordable food is an ever-rising challenge and South Africa is privileged to be one of the netto producers of food. Urbanisation is a reality and in the process more and more people are denied to own land on which food could be cultivated.

Over the past few years, the Western Cape Department of Agriculture has therefore provided training, aid in the form of soil analysis, applicable seed equipment and advice to community gardens. To a large extent these gardens produce food for own consumption, but also for community organisations such as crèches, schools, and so on. In most cases these gardens are relatively small. Yet thousands of people are already benefitting from the fresh healthy products, especially vegetables, that these gardens are

producing. That is why the Department of Agriculture is already supporting 700 new food gardens with 66% of those involved in the management of the gardens being women.

The establishment of small intensive food gardens is not unique to South Africa. Some 40 years ago I was introduced for the first time to Netherlands' *Volkstuinen* (people's gardens), previously known in the times of poverty as *kooltuinen* (cabbage gardens) or allotments. Netherlands constitutes only about 3,4% of South Africa's surface area, yet there are in the Netherlands 240 000 of these registered gardens. Where the initial purpose was to produce healthy food for mainly own consumption and trade, the cultivation of such land has shifted to the recreational and therapeutic value and the personal joy that people derive from – in this case caring for plants and observing how it grows. Consequently there is a long waiting list for these gardens or parcels of land, but community gardens are not restricted to the Netherlands. We also see it in a greater or lesser extent in many other countries such as France, Germany, England and Canada. With more and more people worldwide, who necessarily have to be accommodated on smaller parcels of land and in apartments, it is important that more entities – and here I am referring to SANRAL, Propnet of Transnet and the National Department of Public Works as only some examples – make more of their land available for community gardens. The Standing Committee for Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning has amongst others learnt about the high therapeutic value of gardening for people. Gardening is often also an activity included in the rehabilitation of substance

dependents, prisoners and as part of the healing process for patients suffering from mental illnesses. Gardens that are maintained well and are cultivated properly can also make a big contribution to enhance the environment.

My observations correspond with those of the hon Brinkhuis, namely that women often take the lead in the maintenance of these gardens and for that I have great appreciation and respect, Chair, through you to the hon Brinkhuis, I pick up in his motion that he mainly sees women as persons whose contribution is limited to primary agriculture; that it is his desire to see women as the people who have to do the hard physical work, to work in the gardens.

The Democratic Alliance's dream for women, however, is much greater than that. We see an increasing number of successful female entrepreneurs in the much greater secondary agricultural industries. That is where the largest job opportunities await, and we have several excellent examples of women in our province who are making their mark in secondary agriculture, too many to mention.

I can refer to the iconic winemaker, Ntsiki Biyela, or Natasha Williams with her own wine labelled *Lelie van Saron*, or Carmen Stevens of Carmen Stevens Wines, according to reports the first Black South African who formally studied the art of winemaking.

The Western Cape Department of Agriculture already presented competitions

where women entrepreneurs in agriculture were specifically acknowledged and where Minister Ivan Meyer awarded the prizes.

I concluded with three more examples of the many women's achievements in agriculture. These are the type of roles the DA sees for women in agriculture.

The first woman I would like to mention is Ms Jacky Goliath. Ms Goliath is the co-founder of De Fynne Nursery, a 100% black-owned business. They have expanded from a back-garden nursery focusing on only two species of fynbos to a premises of 22 hectares in the Paarl area. This allowed them to expand production of the nursery, increase employment and gave them the opportunity to diversify the business. De Fynne currently employs 22 permanent and 15 casual workers. De Fynne is now also producing and growing plums. Lavender plants are grown and packaged, especially for Woolworths and other commercial nurseries, as well as well known wine farms count amongst their clients.

The second woman is Ms Marleen Hoekstra. Ms Hoekstra has been involved together with her late father with the growth of the Hoekstra Group for many, many years. Ms Hoekstra was appointed this new CEO when her father passed away in January 2022. The Group is currently farming on 14 farms, covering 350 hectares. Over the years she has developed an extensive knowledge of the industry. She played a leading role in the deregulation of the South African fruit industry and Marleen was one of the founder members

of Independent Fruit Growers and Exporters. She also realised that the company would need to build a dedicated cold store to manage their future exports and Noord Agter-Paarl Koelkamers became the first producer-owned cold store in the industry.

The last of the three ladies that I want to particularly highlight today is Ms Ilse Rutherford, managing director Compagniesdrift, a wine bottling and temperature controlled storage facility on Baden-Powell Drive. Ms Ilse Rutherford obtained her Diploma in Marketing from Stellenbosch College in 1996 while I was serving as the Deputy Principal of that College. I am therefore particularly proud of her. She hails from Pniel, joined the wine industry in 1997 and then served in wine exports for four years. She has been the managing director of Compagniesdrift since 2012. Compagniesdrift is currently serving about 60 clients, including some of the best known wine farms in the Boland. Ms Rutherford was named Top Female Entrepreneur for Agro Processing by the National Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries in 2014, and what did she do with her prize money? She donated part of her prize money to establish a vegetable garden at Compagniesdrift, from where currently various preserves and other products such as pickled onions, beetroot chutney and chilli sauce, amongst others, are produced.

Chair, hon Brinkhuis, we fully support the proposal that even more land should be released for community gardening projects. I assume that you know that the Department of Agriculture is standing by to support in expanding



these initiatives, but I trust that you will join us in the Democratic Alliance and share our dream of tens of thousands of women in the Western Cape, joining the ranks of the excellent women that are already succeeding as entrepreneurs in agriculture. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise hon member Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): During this Women's Month, Speaker, the ANC welcomes this debate today sponsored by the hon Brinkhuis. For once we can discuss an issue which speaks to the very heart of; we are here representing the people of the Western Cape, rather than cheap political point-scoring. The reality, Speaker, of course, is that this Provincial Government can offer no substance and yet what this discussion calls upon today is substance. This discussion is in line with what I consistently raise in Social Development Standing Committee and my MEC, hon Sharna Fernandez, knows what I stand for. I stand for the poor. *Mpatiswa*. I will repeat again, take care of our poor people, and I have been raising this.

†Imibutho eskuhlaleni incedisana nokulwa ukuhlukunyezwa kwamanina kwakunye neminye elwa nendlala nokhuseleko nokutya. Uninzi wale mibutho lukhokhelwa ngamanina. Athi ke achukumiseke ngokubona iingingqi abahlala kuzo ngoba kugcwele abantwana ezitrathweni ngenxa yokulamba. Abafazi soloko ingabo abangamaxhoba ngenxa yokulamba kwiintsapho zethu.

[Local organisations are assisting in fighting the abuse of women as well poverty. They are also advocating safety and availability of food. Most of these organisations are being led by women. They are indeed touched when they see the areas some of the women live in, with children living on the streets because of poverty. Women are always the victims of poverty in their families.]

Speaker, the DA rejects identity politics. It rejects race and class and yet in its own growth-for-job strategy it speaks of women economic empowerment, but we know, we know this is just ticking the box. The DA and this Provincial Government pay lip services to real women economic empowerment, while the Growth for Jobs Strategy speaks of women's empowerment, more especially in the economy; especially in the local production of the key renewable and energy component.

It is absolutely quiet on the role and participation of women in the agricultural sector. When it comes to the Water Resilience Programme this Provincial Government relates or relegates women to economic sectors such as childcare facilities and personal care industries. This is what the DA thinks of women: childcare and makeup.

Again, the Growth for Jobs Strategy points out the role of women is a micro business, but as an example, consigns from the DA. It is only the ECDs that women can work at.

For the Provincial Government and the DA, women cannot own farms. Women cannot run farms. Women must only take care of children and look pretty. This DA Speaker, the issue discussed here today does not only speak to the transformation of our provincial economy, which is a must. It does not only speak to the agricultural sector, which remains one of the backbones of our provincial economy, and which must diversify if it were to survive, but land for agriculture purposes, start-ups and community gardens speak to the very issue of food security and women continue to bear the brunt of food insecurity.

In recent years, statistics indicated that 17% of the population of the Western Cape had food insecurity. Just over 7% of people in the Western Cape is said to suffer for food access, which is severely inadequate.

Chairperson, the Western Cape remains one of the few provinces in South Africa, in fact, one of two, the other being the Northern Cape, where agriculture employment outnumbers subsistence farming, and while the province has one of the biggest commercial agricultural sectors in the country, only 2,7% of households are involved in agricultural activity – the lowest in the country. This means that there is a huge gap between commercial farming in our province and those pursuing agricultural activity for food security or subsistence and purposes.

Deputy Speaker, this means that in other words, our system in the Western Cape forces our people to buy food instead of growing or farming it

themselves. According to the National Statistics, the Western Cape remains one of the lowest provinces where women benefit from land distribution, whether it is in terms of the number of farms, hectares or numbers of women beneficiaries.

†Mhlalingaphambili, [Chairperson] the ANC is consistent in this House and saying agriculture plays one of the most significant sectors in which growth and sustainable livelihoods can take care. When we debated the doomed-to-fail Growth for Jobs Strategy, the hon Nkondlo pointed out agriculture must be taken more seriously by this Provincial Government.

All the evidence so far shows that agriculture is not taken seriously by this Provincial Government, more especially when it comes to the Black farming people and women at large.

The budget allocated by this Province to Agriculture remains one of the lowest in the country. If this Provincial Government took agriculture seriously it would be promoting the role that women play in the sector and the hon Nkondlo pointed out if this Provincial Government took agriculture seriously, it would be diverse, the sector, more African... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Bakubaku-Vos. Hon member, may you take your seat, please. Hon member, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): House Chairperson, I would like to find out whether the member is willing to take a question?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Do you want to take a question, hon Bakubaku-Vos?

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): You are wasting my time.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, continue.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): In her budget, as the hon Nkondlo pointed out, if this Provincial Government took agriculture seriously it would be diverse, the sector would have more African, Coloured and Indian farm owners; more ownership of farm workers of farms and yes, more women on farms, owners.

In her Budget Vote address to the National Assembly, Minister Thoko Didiza highlighted what the ANC National Government is doing to ensure more involvement of women in the agricultural sector. In particular she mentioned the blended finance facility with the Industrial Development Corporation and the Land Bank, which created jobs, of which 30 and 33% of the jobs created respectively when the... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, conclude, your time is up.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Thank you, Deputy Chair or Chair of the session. When we debated the doom of the Growth for Jobs Strategy...  
[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker of the session.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I am going to continue. Hon Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): The South African agricultural sector plays a significant role in contributing to the country's GDP. Similarly, the Western Cape remains the leading exporter of primary agricultural products and its economy heavily relies on this sector. However, the majority of women in the province, especially our African and Coloured women, remain excluded from benefiting financially from the sector compared to the White counterparts. Our African and Coloured women in the Western Cape are mostly used as seasonal farm workers where they work for about six to seven months in a given year and then thereafter their services are no longer needed until the following year.

Whilst the importance of food security in the province cannot be overstated, there is also need for an economy that benefits everyone irrespective of gender and race. It is true that the majority of women in the Western Cape

are involved in food gardens compared to men. However, the majority of these food gardens are mainly for subsistence as opposed to commercial gain, and whilst they respond to the issue of food security, they somewhat fall short generally in alleviating poverty.

The downside about farming for subsistence is that while one can put food on the table, the same person solely remains poor as they are unable to afford the forever rising price of electricity, municipality rates and other necessities of life. The majority of townships in the province are congested, with little to no land for one to run a food garden big enough to produce fruits and vegetables that can be used for both family consumption and surplus sold in markets.

The reality is that this DA-led Government is happy with our African and Coloured women or specifically people to only involve themselves with smaller food gardens than to own farms and also benefit financially from the agricultural sector.

In conclusion, the majority of people in this DA-led province are still stuck in colonial ways of thinking along the lines that the small White population must own the majority of land, while the majority of African and Coloured population must be excluded and work on White farms as nothing other than seasonal farm workers earning wages, which account to literally nothing.

Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon Sileku.

†Mr I M SILEKU (DA): Sihlalo lwendlu, mandibulele. Ngelishwa ke andizokungena kwezopolitiko ngoba lo mba sithetha ngawo ubaluleke kakhulu. So, kubalulekile ukuba ezopolitika khe silibeke calanye.

[House Chairperson, let me thank you. Unfortunately, I will not go into a political discussion because this matter is more important than politics. So, it is important we put politics on hold for now]

House Chairperson, thank you to member Brinkhuis for bringing this debate to the House, especially during Women's Month.

House Chairperson, much has been said and written about the challenges women, especially women from disadvantaged communities, face in our country; challenges that range from the horrible prevalence of gender-based violence to the more subtle but equally real challenge of glass ceilings women in the corporate world still experience when competing with men for senior positions.

These challenges are reflected in the latest employment statistics released by Stats SA this week. Unemployment for men actively seeking employment has gone down to below 30%. Unemployment for women actively seeking employment has increased to 35,7%.



House Chairperson, let us reflect a moment on the fact that women of South Africa are grappling with these challenges whilst at the same time being devoted grandmothers, mothers, sisters and wives in our communities. So as a South African man, I want to acknowledge all the women in my life, but also in my country. Thank you for representing the better half of us. A 2021 Research Study on Gender and Environment by the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development found that globally women are disproportionately affected by climate change, deforestation, land degradation, decertification, growing water scarcity and inadequate access to sanitation. The research found that the COVID-19 pandemic made these gender inequalities even worse. The research found that gender focus response in areas such as land, water and transport management would allow for more sustainable and inclusive economic development and lead to the increased well-being of entire societies. House Chairperson, the above is from international research, but it also holds true to South Africa. Land reform and land and food security are both important projects of South Africa, but let us not restrict women to food gardens and land reform projects.

It is my belief that we should focus on removing the stumbling blocks that are perpetuating gender inequalities we have in our society. We need an enabling environment that will allow women equal opportunity to access land or for a small scale female farmer to progress through the agricultural value chain as far as their individual aspiration and talent allow. Women in South

Africa have the constitutional right to be free from the chains of gender, race or cultural beliefs we sometimes bind ourselves with.

House Chairperson, when we talk about farmers, big or small, male or female, we are also talking about Mother Nature. Climate change, water security, water quality and air quality are environmental challenges which affect our entire society. Food gardens, small scale farmers and commercial farmers all need access to clean water.

The Department does alienate clearing in our catchments. We cannot differentiate which category of farmer is going to benefit from the improved downstream ecology, but they all depend on it, and as a Government it is our responsibility to protect and manage our natural resources for the whole of society, while at the same time remove the recognised stumbling blocks for women. I would like to commend the work the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning is doing to address gender inequality while at the same time focusing on managing and protecting our natural environment to the benefit of our entire society.

The Department developed a 2020 to 2025 Gender Equity Strategic Framework with annual targets for all five years. They have committed to mainstream gender responsiveness into our culture, governance and practise, and are systematically working through each of our discipline areas. On a more practical level, Cape Nature is promoting opportunities for women through its participation in the Expanded Public Works Programme. Cape

Nature in 20/22/23 created 608 employment opportunities through this programme. A total of 60 communities benefited from the programme, with the majority of the employment opportunities being created in rural towns, and communities close to us surrounding the entity's protected areas. For many families these opportunities present a lifeline to sustain households and actively participate in the local economy.

In terms of the vulnerability targets required for the EPWP, Cape Nature achieved 60% for women, whereas the target was 60%. 76,7% for youth, the target was 55%, and 2,4% for persons with disability, the target being 2%. Furthermore, 16 work integrated learners and graduate interns were appointed during the reporting period, exceeding the target of 15%.

House Chairperson, I conclude. It is Women's Month and this Government recognises the enormous role women fulfil in our society. We also recognise research that shows women often suffer disproportionately from social and environmental challenges. My call to this Parliament today is that this and our similar debates should not be mere lip service to gender equality.

Let us leave gender equality when we go home tonight. Let us treasure and acknowledge our mothers, wives and daughters. With those words, thank you very much. *Enkosi. Baie dankie.* Happy Women's Month.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, member Sileku. I now recognise member De Villiers.

Mr P T DE VILLIERS (GOOD): Thank you, Chairperson of the House. The GOOD party supports Al Jama-ah's call for land and agricultural start-ups to be released to especially women who are involved in food gardening and community gardening projects, and to women living on farms. It is easy to say that the Western Cape has the highest percentage of Black female farmers, but what does that percentage mean? Let us look at the reality. Of the more than 40 000 farmers in South Africa, only 3 900 are Black. Of those, only 234 are in the Western Cape and 40 are female. The Western Cape is also the province that leases out the least of its agricultural land, only 5%. Much of the talk around urban agriculture in Africa deals with poverty, hunger and accessing food. 40% of Africa's urban residents practise some agricultural activity. These activities include producing eggs, fruit, milk, but the majority from farms are farming vegetables.

Doing so helps to buffer these households against seasonal shortages or food-price hikes. Researchers on urban agriculture in the Western Cape have found that female farmers use more of their produce to feed their families and those in need than male farmers.

This means that the food grown by women is more accessible to those without the money to buy it. I thank you, Madam.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS (FF PLUS): Speaker, food gardening is not something new which we have to debate here at length for hours. It is already Minister Meyer's project and we have visited several of the projects. He has taken the Agricultural Committee on sightseeing. Some of them are doing very well, others not so well. What we need to do now is to debate the necessity and value of food gardens only to analyse its successes and failures and best practises.

First of all, we need to determine and recognise certain things. Do they have prior knowledge or learning of food gardens? Are enough land and water available in the size of the land? Should land be held in trust or do we make use of the people's own backyards? Is water available? What is the selection criteria? Do we interview the people in the project? Did we make an assessment? Did we close the gaps in their abilities, if there are, or non-abilities? Did we formulate an outcomes-assurance plan or proactive interventions to ensure healthy gardens? Do they have sufficient equipment? Are we to attend to the project? Is there a project manager? Can we make use of Elsenburg Training College to act as a project manager?

Candidates selected must be on-boarded onto the programme and supervised continuously. We need management by objectives. We cannot just give a person a lot of seed and say, now listen, just put this in the ground and you put water on it and then you are going to have food for the rest of the year. It is not going to happen. Food gardening without sufficient training, with the

necessary assessment of the people who qualify, sufficient land, sufficient water will end up as a failure. No matter all our nice lofty ideals, beautiful speeches, it will be a failure if we do not have a check-book here to check it. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon member Murray.

Ms C MURRAY (DA): Thank you House Chairperson. I welcome this debate on the important role of women in agriculture as we commemorate Women's Month. In the Western Cape, food gardens are just one of the myriad programmes through which Provincial Department of Agriculture is uplifting our communities and especially women.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Honourable member Murray, can you take your seat please. Hon member, you were standing up. Did you need my attention?

An HON MEMBER: [No audible reply.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay, thank you very much. You may take your seat. My apologies hon member, you may continue.

Ms C MURRAY (DA): Thank you House Chairperson. As I was saying, the Provincial Department of Agriculture is uplifting our communities and

especially women who are the bedrock of these communities. In this financial year alone, the Department will support 3 000 food gardens throughout the province, helping to build food security during this tough economic period. Many of these gardens are managed by women who have taken the lead and upskilled themselves to feed their communities. But, House Chairperson, that is only the tip of the iceberg, as far as the women's involvement in agriculture is concerned. More and more women are entering the industry through the support of the world class agricultural education provided by Elsenburg Agricultural Training Institute. They are more prepared to succeed in their chosen field.

In the 2021/22 financial year, 69 bursaries were awarded to female students at Elsenburg and of the 197 students who graduated in February, 66 were female. That is not to say that there is not a whole lot more that needs to be done to empower women in agriculture, but it is also demonstrative of the DA remaining committed to unlocking the talent of women within our communities. This will take us, our agriculture and agro processing industry from strength to strength.

House Chairperson, boosting exports is a key aspect of the Growth for Jobs Strategy. This whole-of-government approach will see us decisively tackle unemployment in the province. It is not a tick-box exercise.

The DA-led Western Cape is already on course. The latest Quarterly Labour Force Survey demonstrated this as our unemployment rate has been reduced

by six percentage points in just one year. Over the past 20 years, the province has shown robust growth in exports, almost doubling its share of national exports by value from 8% in 2000 to 15% in 2021, something that I believe the ANC clearly and deliberately fails to acknowledge.

Roughly half of the province's exports consist of agricultural products, including citrus, wine and stone fruit. Through G4J, DEDAT and Wesgro are working tirelessly to expand market access to more of our producers. This is being done through initiatives to support export councils for all our major exports, and to get these councils up and running where they do not exist, putting our producers in the best possible position to create jobs.

Of course, House Chairperson, to physically get products into markets, you need a high functioning port, and unfortunately, high functioning and Transnet do not belong in the same sentence, especially when it comes to running the Port of Cape Town, but thankfully DEDAT has invested heavily in research to improve the port and stands ready to work with Transnet, as well as the private sector to get the necessary infrastructure in place and move cargo at maximum capacity.

The recently released Transport to Congestion Report has already identified many of the problems of the port, and contains evidence-based recommendations on how to address them.

House Chairperson, I would now like to take a moment to reflect on an issue



that will have a detrimental impact on the growth of our exports, as well as the empowerment of our women, namely the African Growth and Opportunity Act, which the ANC so love.

Contrary to my colleagues in the ANC, AGOA affects every single person in agriculture, male or female, farmer or farmworker, because this tariff-free market access which promotes exports to the US market, cannot be allowed to lapse. That is why I have been engaging with Minister Patel to brief the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Development and Tourism on the details of these negotiations, but true to ANC form, the Minister has failed to meet and engage the Provincial Standing Committee in the Legislature despite countless invitations. We need clear blue water on what steps he is taking to prevent this province's Titanic agricultural industry from sinking. His lack of willingness to meet is in no way reassuring.

Of course, the reason our inclusion in a renewed AGOA is in doubt, is that the ANC tacitly supports Putin's illegal invasion of Ukraine, something that is directly at odds with US foreign policy interests. The ANC would rather act out of a historical sense of loyalty and fear of Russians than do what is best for the people of South Africa.

We will not allow the ANC's moral bankruptcy to cost us thousands of jobs. The DA will make sure that DTIC is accountable to the elected representatives of the people of this province.

The US Senate has moved the Commissioner Report from the Secretary of Defence, consultation with the Secretary of State and other relevant federal departments and agencies that assess the extent to which South Africa's foreign policy poses a threat to US National Security interests.

Surprise-surprise! This shows us that South Africa's current foreign policy is posing a significant threat to our trade relationship with US and our inclusion in AGOA. While tariff advantage with AGOA is relatively small, the scaling of additional cost is significant. So what this means is that without this advantage of AGOA, tariffs on US agri exports would have skyrocketed from R26 million to R267 million. That is huge! Urgent clarity is therefore needed to instil investor confidence and lay concerns of the affected industries and protect thousands of jobs of women and men alike in the province.

House Chairperson, if we look into the future of farming, we see the advancement of agricultural tech, and that it will have a massive, massive advantage for reaching peak efficiency.

That is why the Provincial Department is already training farmers and officials in the use of Fruitlook and drones to monitor soil conditions and crop yield.

Nine women have already been trained as expert drone operators by the Department of Agriculture, but House Chairperson, that is the DA difference.

We have laid the groundwork so there are more opportunities for women to enter the agri industry, innovate and thrive. By creating more opportunities for women in agriculture, we will enable more young women to succeed. We create more role models. We create more opportunities. The DA is empowering women to be leaders in agriculture, as their success benefits everyone. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the hon member Marran.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks very much, Chairperson. The hon Murray, Chair, the hon Murray spoke about exports from the Western Cape to overseas markets, and last time when I listened to the MEC, he spoke about 50% of South Africa's exports, comes from the Western Cape, and then she spoke about AGOA, where they run straight for the Americans.

The day before yesterday the hon Van der Westhuizen released a statement on the West Coast, and the damage this causes to agriculture, and he then asked the President of this country to come to the rescue.

Why then do you run to the EU, as you have run to the Americans on the AGOA issue? Now you want the President of this country to step in. No! When we ask the hon Murray, when we ask your MEC ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): When we ask your MEC about the exports of 55% ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Honourable, it is going to be difficult if you have a conversation with your colleagues ...Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Through you, thank you, Chair. Sorry, my apologies.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Ja, so Chair, when the MEC of member Murray spoke about the 55% that comes from the Western Cape, and we then posed the question, both written and oral asking, how many of this 50% are Black, how many of this 55% are Black women? The MEC's response was: "I do not know." You do not know because you do not want to know. You do not want to know how much land, how many Black farmers, how many Black people, how many Black women are in agriculture in the Western Cape.

I now hear the hon Van der Westhuizen spoke about three women. In September, the hon Van der Westhuizen has now organised an oversight visit to the West Coast because White farmers are affected. Never have I heard about the oversight visit to farms of these three women that he has mentioned now and even for farmworkers. Never have I heard that, Chair. The same hon Van der Westhuizen, a couple of years back in a Standing Committee meeting

said that the DA has done an audit and the outcome of that audit is that Black people do not want land. All that they want is jobs. All that they want is jobs, and then one of the top leaders, the MEC, who is part of the Federal Leadership in 2019, when they drew up the Manifesto of the DA, said there that farmworkers should only earn a minimum wage, and many of the farmworkers, most of them are women, a minimum wage which is equal to the Old Age Pension Grant – a slave wage! This is what they think of Black people, Black women in agriculture. Speaker, this ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member ...[Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Speaker, I want to start off again welcoming this discussion introduced today by the hon Brinkhuis but before I go that far, I want to acknowledge women that I have invited to this Sitting: Lungiswa Zulu, Phillis Beyer. They are here looking for an opportunity to get into the agricultural sector, but there is no hope in the Western Cape Government, because when we ask them about land reform, the MEC's response is: "But it is a national competency, it is not ours, we do not deal with land reform."

As the hon Bakubaku-Vos pointed out, it is discussions such as these, which expose the lip service and service delivery by the DA in this Provincial Government. Lip service! Today all we got again from the DA speakers is lip service. Take for example, the Annual Report of the Department of Agriculture, and we await with excitement this year's annual reports, take for example in the last Annual Report of the Department of Agriculture when

they spoke about women empowerment. Human capital development programmes, not to upskill women in agriculture start-ups, not to build women capacity to develop community food gardens, but to send our mothers and daughters to the substance abuse awareness and prevention projects.

†Dit is wat hulle dink van ons mense, van ons moeders en van ons susters.

[That is what they think of our people, of our mothers and of our sisters.]

We welcome the Labour Rights Projects, also targeting women, and we know the Rural Youth Intervention. Both of these do not have the detail. Lip service! We remain concerned that less than a third of enrolments in the farming group skills training programme are women, when only a third of students graduating in February 2022 were women. Why is this important, because it is this programme that is supposed to equip women, young people with skills inventions such as agriculture start-ups; sub-programme 3.3 of the Department that deals with food security, which must include aspects of food gardening and community gardening projects.

How many food gardens, promotions and awareness programmes did the Department roll out? Two, according to the annual report; two, only two. Not three, not four, not five, two!

The reality, Speaker, is, like the hon Bakubaku-Vos pointed out, this Department of Agriculture pays lip service to women and their involvement in the agricultural start-ups, food gardening and community projects. We see

this in the details of the annual reports and we need to look no further. Indeed, the MEC will complain and blame the MEC, he always blames the MEC for everything, but he refuses to admit that his Department makes no provision for women and their involvement in community food gardens. If only he could for once thank the ANC-led National Government for CASP, for CASP, because whatever is done in this province for women in agriculture is thanks to National Government CASP Programme. Without CASP in the Western Cape, women in agriculture will continue to be relegated by this Provincial Government as being substance-abusing persons and farmworkers.

In his budget, the Department admits that participants in the Premier's Advancement of Youth will not be paid from the Department's coffers, or even from the Premier's coffers. No! Participation by young people from the Department of Agriculture, in a whole the Premier's Programme will be funded by National Government. In the same budget the MEC of the Department of Agriculture cut the food security budget by over a third, by one third, 34%.

The programme that must provide and ensure community food gardens, never mind the inclusion of women, cut by a third, so what we are really getting here today is lip service – nothing more. Whatever is said by the DA, whatever is said by its MEC, is not maths in the Annual Report, it is not maths in the Budget. Lip service! The MEC's Department will not support women. The Department will not support women in getting them into

agriculture start-ups. They will not support family and community food gardens and involvement by women in these, because it is the practise of the Department to support large White commercial farmers, the *Boers*. They are not interested in women and community food gardens.

I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, honourable member Marran. I now recognise Honourable Minister Ivan Meyer.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon House Chair. I want to welcome the members in the gallery, but I want to address them so that they do not leave this House with a misunderstanding and absolute confusion, because here is the Constitution. All the members in this House, as well as my friend, hon member, through you, Mr Klaas took an oath of office. This oath of office, together with that, we have Standing Rules of this House. We have the Provincial Constitution and we have a National Constitution, absolutely clear that it is the responsibility of the National Government according to the Constitution, that they must allocate land to people and there is a Section 25 in the Constitution. They have tabled expropriation of land to make it available and they are the majority in the House in the National Parliament. The ANC is the majority, so with having the majority and they fail in this execution of this clause, that tells you that these people are nowhere where it comes to land reform. They took an oath of office and I am on the record that they took an oath and in terms of this oath, they said this is



the responsibility. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Minister, may you take your seat please.

Minister can you take your seat, please?

Hon members, interjections are allowed, but we cannot have the self-appointed commentators for every speaker. So if you can allow the Minister to debate so that those people that are connected online also can hear him and not hear you as you interject. We will appreciate. I think they will appreciate that, Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon House Chair, I want to thank hon member Brinkhuis for this topic that he brought here in this debate. I want to thank him for raising the very important matter of food security in the Western Cape. Food insecurity and hunger are realities, and affecting the poor communities. My hon colleague, the Minister of Social Development, Minister Fernandez is frequently reminding us of the issues of well-being and dignity and the shortage of food and hunger in the communities.

I also want to thank hon member Brinkhuis for raising the issue of more agricultural schools and I think he brings a new dimension and I want to thank him. He says that we need also to start not only a primary and secondary school. He says, start earlier, and I want to thank him for that contribution, but, I think, hon member, the members of this House have highlighted the importance of the role of women as it is in this debate. We

know that agriculture in this province is 11%, 4% primary agriculture, but there are more opportunities for women in secondary agriculture 7%. That is where the real money is. That is where the real wealth is and so we certainly want women in that, but women are leading in agriculture, hon Chair.

Let me start with my own Department. The Deputy Director-General, Dr Ilse Trautmann, is a respected scientist responsible for managing seven world-class research farms in the Western Cape. I am proud of her contribution. She also ensures that demand-led research responds directly to the needs of the agricultural sector. Agriculture is a science and the science needs research.

Dr Noluvuyo Magadla is a respected veterinarian.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister, can you take your seat?

There is a raised hand of member Kama. Member Kama, I recognise you.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you very much, Chair. Can you hear me?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, loud and clear, sir.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Yes, thank you very much, Chair. I had raised my hand even from the start when the Minister was introducing his speech. I want to check, Chair, is the MEC prepared to take a question?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Minister?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Not today, but tomorrow.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: That is "no."

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: The hon Deputy Director-General is a respected scientist but also Dr Noluvuyo Magadla is a respected veterinarian and responsible for ensuring animal health in the Western Cape. She leads a team of dedicated state vets and understands the importance of bio-security and the link between animal health and human health and therefore the promotion of one health.

Agricultural economist, fantastic, hon Bakubaku-Vos, you know the great work that is being done by Bungiswa Matoti, the Head of my Agricultural Economics in the Western Cape; she supports the agriculture-led approach we follow in the Western Cape and she is unlocking a lot of opportunities for women.

Well, another opportunity is Ms Ashia Petersen. She leads a team of engineers and specialists that ensure that our most important assets, namely water and land and natural vegetation, are protected, well managed and, where necessary, migration measures are conceptualised and implemented.

These ladies are not only respected civil servants, but also leaders in their

field and they are also leading agriculture in the Western Cape.

Now I agree we need more of them. Berene Sauls started in the wine industry soon after completing her school. She is now the owner of Tesselaarsdal Wines in the Hemel-en-Aarde Valley. She exports wine to the USA, to the United Kingdom, the Netherlands, Denmark, Japan, Norway, Switzerland, South Korea and Canada, and I think, hon member Klaas must visit the United States. You will find her wine there. The Netherlands, you will find her wine there. Denmark, you will find it there; Japan, you will find her wine there. You will find her wine in Switzerland. You will find her wine in South Korea. You will find her wine in Canada.

Another hon member, and I think Mr Brinkhuis is familiar with Wadea Jappie, never imagined that selling their produce to friends and family will start a lucrative business, and I think hon member Brinkhuis is fully aware of the work that she is doing.

In 2005, the family-registered Chamomile Farming Enterprises, they started with 100 chickens and are currently having, Mr Klaas, 10 000 chickens in their shed. Chamomile Farming Enterprise has the biggest client, Shoprite and Checkers. They also produce eggs for Nulaid.

Marice Skin was founded also by a woman, by Marice, a mother, the entrepreneur fuelled by her desire to use pure and safe ingredients to create a product that could cure her daughter's eczema, from the West Coast from

Clanwilliam.

Marice Skincare was founded by her, a mother, an entrepreneur fuelled by a desire to use pure and safe ingredients to create a product that could cure her daughter's eczema. Amazed by the results of her efforts, Marice then started experimenting with glycerine soap and Rooibos tea. Their entire family followed suit, using the product daily, encouraged by the friends and family, continually experimenting with Rooibos and quickly found herself supplying soap to a handful of curio shops and guest houses in the small West Coast village of Clanwilliam.

Hon Speaker, House Chair, women are leading in this province. The successful ones are often the results of partnerships and collaboration, working together with municipalities providing the land. The Western Cape Department provides extension and advisory and technical services to make this thing available, but, hon Deputy Speaker, where I really appreciate the work of Natasha Johannes, there is a dumping ground next to her plot and I am so happy that this woman showed us real leadership when she started cleaning the dumping site and then started a Garden of Hope in Mitchell's Plain to produce fresh vegetables. She started planting it in 2017 and applied for CASP-funding and the same year the application was approved. Natasha's intention is to start more, helping more people, and I am so happy for the work that she is currently doing in that field.

The land belongs to the City of Cape Town, hon Bakubaku-Vos, and, as you

know, there is a partnership. We support with irrigation, we support with the seed, the water tanks, the irrigation, the cold storage. We support them, garden tools and various production inputs, like seeds.

Hon member Klaas, when you bring members in the public and say there are opportunities, bring them to my office. Let us sit down and make things happen. Do not bring them here and shout in the Parliament because you are not going to help them. [Interjection.]

Bring them to my office. I am happy to assist them because that is what we want to do. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon member, Langebaan, we have seen in Langebaan, a community garden in Langebaan, Mr De Villiers. The next time when you visit, Mr De Villiers, look to your right, because there you will see an urban agricultural policy that was approved by the Saldanha Bay Municipality. The goal was to contribute towards food security and improve the quality of the lives there in that community.

I visited them numerous times. They are a group of 24 gardeners from the Langebaan community who entered into a memorandum of agreement, and I met with SPAR, SPAR is even now buying some of their produce – real empowerment.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I mean, House Chair, Christine Jephta, another small holder farmer was granted a long term lease on municipal land in Stellenbosch in 2019. Christine Jephta produced tomatoes, lettuce, brinjals, green beans and spring onions. I know Mr Klaas loves his spring onions, which she also supplies to Subtropico Epping Market and locals and surrounding communities, and the business now, hon member, has six...  
[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Minister, please conclude, your time is up.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Oh! Hon Chair, I want to ask hon members in this House, if they know of anybody that wants to start a vegetable garden, my office is downstairs, you can come to my office and we make it happen because this is a Government for the people, a Government for you that delivers for you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. That concludes the debate on this subject. As per Rule 204 we now come to Questions to the Premier without Notice. I recognise the hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: [No audible reply.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Leader of the Opposition,

I recognise you, it is Questions to the Premier as per the Order Paper, online.

[Hon member N G Bakubaku-Vos takes the Chair.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It is unacceptable that the Premier is not here in person. Last week he, as you know, was not available and we agreed and I was called and one expects that the Premier is present in this House and I want to say that for noting and now proceed to my question.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): House Chairperson, I rise in terms of Rule 66, but I also rise in terms of the Rules governing virtual proceedings, as this is a hybrid session. The Premier is in the House, the same way some ANC members might be online and some ANC members might be in the Chamber. There are some DA members that are online and some DA members that are in the Chamber, and the Premier has the right to be online. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: That was not a point of order. You may proceed, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, House Chair, I think for the record, we must note this is the first time since the Premier became the Premier that he has not been in the House to respond to a question without notice to himself.



The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may start.

**QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE:**

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: But my question is as follows, Premier, as you are no doubt aware the Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Premier and Constitutional Affairs, hon Fry, introduced a Bill on Provincial Powers to the said Standing Committee and no doubt you are also aware that this is the first time in the history of the Legislature that a Chairperson of a Committee has introduced a Bill. My question to you is do you know the names of the person or persons who drafted this Bill on behalf of hon Fry?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Premier, you may proceed.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Chair. Yes.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: My follow-up question, could you please provide – my first supplementary question, I have a second one, could you please provide the names of those who drafted the Bill on Mr Fry's behalf, given that you have said that you know them, could we have the names now please, hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Yes, the lead drafter, Advocate Bishop.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Sorry, I did not hear the  
...[Incomplete.]

The PREMIER: I will say it again ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Proceed, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Chair, thank you very much, I will say again, the lead  
advocate, Advocate Bishop.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Is who? We do not hear  
...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: We do not hear you, can you  
...[Incomplete.]

The PREMIER: Can you hear me now?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes.

The PREMIER: Advocate Bishop, the lead advocate.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): I heard Advocate Bishop.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Sorry, just, Chairperson, you would

note that my question was the person or persons. All that the Premier has provided is a name. He does not even give the first name of the advocate, he just says Advocate Bishop. I asked for all the members. So if advocate Bishop, could we have a first name and could we have the other, if he is the lead drafter who are the other members of the Committee who drafted this Bill for Mr Fry?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Premier, I recognise you.

The PREMIER: So one would be [Inaudible.], one would be probably, sitting in there would have been even some of the members of the National Assembly, but it was led by Advocate Bishop, not by me.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you. For my second supplementary question. Hon Premier, what is your comment on the fact that the legal advisor of the Provincial Legislature at the Ad Hoc Committee established to discuss the Provincial Powers Bill, held on Wednesday 16 August, described the Bill as "spurious with generalisations unfounded, unsubstantiated and unresearched" and having politically loaded statements?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Premier, you may proceed.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. I obviously was not present in that

Standing Committee hearing. Obviously the words that are being used now do not sound very legalistic and I presume that now what will be asked is for the legal representative of Parliament to supply the legal opinion in writing so that it can be then taken into consideration.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may proceed, hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you, House Chair. The person I am referring to is the legal adviser to Provincial Parliament.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Dugmore ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: He is the legal adviser.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Dugmore? Hon Deputy Chief Whip, do you want to say something?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes, Chair. Chair, in terms of admissibility of questions in terms of Rule 196 read with Rule 66, we are only allowed to follow-up questions ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Is that the point of order or you have ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): The two Rules that I have quoted was 196 as well as 66 and that is in terms of questions and when it comes to questions to the Premier you are only allowed two follow-up questions. The Premier has answered two follow-up questions, so I am not understanding why hon member Dugmore is allowed a third.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Thank you, hon Deputy Chairperson. Hon member Dugmore, yes, the Deputy Chief Whip is right. I now recognise hon member Fry.

Mr C FRY (DA): Thank you, hon Chairperson. Hon House Chairperson, last week – to the hon Premier. Last week we saw the senseless violence and criminality and devastation reeked our province as a result of the minibus taxi strike. We have seen damage to public infrastructure, private property and the intimidation of Western Cape communities, commuters and residents.

My question is in which ways has the strike action last week impacted the Provincial Government's position for more devolution, particularly in terms of transport and rail, in order to create a more efficient and integrated public transport system?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Fry. Hon Premier, you may proceed.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Chair, and thanks to the hon member Fry for the question.

I must say that, ja, obviously it was a tough time in the province and in the City last week and of course in the House. I could only get to the House quite late because I was personally in some of those negotiations.

Of course we want to build forward into a public transport system that is fully integrated, that has a backbone of rail because rail forms the backbone of any public transport system and right now with a broken rail system we end up with the scenario that we have at the moment, where in actual fact a single private sector almost, through going on strike, can hold a whole economy and citizens to ransom.

So of course I think the devolution of rail is exactly what should be focused on. We have been trying for a long time, it has been written in a White Paper, it has been agreed to by certain Ministers, but a lot of Ministers change at a national level [Inaudible.] agreement that there will be a devolution, then there will be no devolution and I think the latest Minister again comes into office and says there will be no devolution and officials in her office correct that a week later and say yes, there will be devolution.

I think that also goes to the reason for the piece of legislation that we are calling for, that enables further devolution of various failure aspects of Government at a national level, where the ANC cannot deliver to the citizens and we are saying devolve those power and I mean obviously for me primary would be policing power. I think PRASA, linked to a vision of future mobility and you started your reference to the strike. At the moment, I think as we speak there is a court challenge happening right now and that court challenge, of course I hope that what comes out of it will be that everybody abides by the agreement and we make that agreement an order of the Court and that we go and find an area where we can negotiate.

There are issues around legislation where we pass a licence from provincial legislation where perhaps fines are not effective enough to get behaviour change and our commuters are at risk, for example. I mean, when we have school kids transported by taxis and we have seen the horrendous accidents, we really are trying to make our roads safer and we need to use different mechanisms of the law. Those are the discussions that are now moving into the taxi task team, but even when we get all of this negotiation sorted out, how are we moving towards that future mobility system?

If we think we have got a colliding, broken transport system, public transport system on the one side led by this broken rail, and then on the other side we have got massively growing populations.

So in the not too distant future we can start to think about a city that is going to be 8 million people. I mean within the next seven years the province is going to go past 8 million citizens, but the city will not be far behind that and we cannot have 15 lanes of road coming into a city centre and 15 lanes going out, we just do not have the space for it. It is not what is happening globally. We are actually seeing freeways being taken away.

We have got to see it in city design and primarily I think that is why we have to get devolution. We have got to get devolution and more federal powers to provinces that are capable and able, and this is not only this province. In PRASA and devolution of rail in Gauteng is exactly what the Gauteng Government is asking for. Exactly what the Metros in Gauteng will be part of and exactly what we would want to do in the City.

We would want to make the City and the two City Bowl or City region municipalities, being Drakenstein and Stellenbosch, part of an entity that takes over control with the Province of the trains, then brings in private sector partners and makes sure that we get, as happens around the world all the time, operational trains and then you back-up those trains with taxis, with buses and then you really get an integrated public transport system where you start to minimise risks if there's the failure in any of those partners, that you can still keep an operational system. I think the strike last week really showed everyone in the city that you can actually, when you do not have a proper balanced system that is actually moving towards a proper integrated public transport system, you get the failures of what we all experienced.



Of course I am not going to go into the actual strike itself because the strike itself raised a whole lot of questions around how picket lines are managed and how customers, because the taxi industry has got customers and those customers are left behind when an immediate strike is called, and we saw people unacceptably, customers of a business, walking home until late in the night, the crime that went with it and of course the anxiety, mothers could not find their children, etcetera, etcetera, and I am very happy that we have got an agreement now to a 36-hour notice for a strike and that our citizens and our public hold the industry to that agreement.

We have built in an escalation system so that we do not end up with the absolute unacceptable situation that we had when a strike is called and of course everyone has a right to strike in our country. Our Constitution enables that, but what you do not have is you do not have a right to destroy other people's rights and of course we mourn the passing of five people in that strike. The number of other people who were hurt and injured. You know, we really do feel very, very sorry for them and then of course the mass of structural damage from burning of ambulances and buses and police vehicles is just unacceptable and then the structural burning, and I was at one of the police stations yesterday that were burned during that strike out in Stellenbosch.

We know that a number of our health facilities took a lot of strain and were damaged badly, let alone bus terminuses and taxi terminuses. This is all stuff

that has got to be built back now, but I agree absolutely. We need devolution of power and then a long-term plan for integration of public transport.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon member, Fry.

Mr C FRY (DA): Thank you, House Chairperson. There have been those, including parties in this House, who have sought to lay the blame of the violence and criminality we have seen last week, at the feet of the Western Cape and the City of Cape Town Governments and have attempted to assert that the two spheres of government are unfairly targeting the taxi industry.

What is the hon Premier's response to these claims and why is it important that the taxi industry be properly regulated?

The PREMIER: Thank you to the hon member, Chair, if I can go ahead? I think the first of the question, I mean I think it goes much deeper than that. There are a lot of areas that I am, or I do have huge concerns around the lead-up to the strike. You know, I saw lots of political involvement and I even want to reference damage to municipal buildings that we saw yesterday in Swellendam and the politics around the process that led to the burning and destruction of infrastructure again and I must say that in our province, as we move closer to an election, we actually need political parties to take far more responsibility. We cannot be irresponsible in this process and even in the middle of the strike I even think that some of the comments, I think sitting in

the meeting with SANTACO and seeing even the National Minister go exactly opposite to what was discussed shortly prior to that, did not help.

So you talk about Provincial Government ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The Premier is out of order.

The PREMIER: You talk about Provincial Government and Local Government. I think National Government as well, in my engagement with the President just prior to that specific meeting, was that we need to make sure that at least Government across all three spheres is on the same page and we have had in the last week a number of meetings with the National Minister, with her Director-General, with our teams, with the legal teams and there are definitely some issues that are being raised directly with the President through the MEC or the Minister and the National Minister at the same time. We also had a single meeting with the National Minister where Minister Ricardo Mackenzie actually confronted her on that division, because it was unacceptable in the midst of the strike, so I worry about those political inputs into the system and we have got to make sure that we deal with those, and I truly hope that the investigations that are happening at the moment, if they do find political interference in any of the strike or the protest action that is happening at the moment, that of course knowing that politicians actually swear allegiance to the Constitution and that they will be arrested and dealt with accordingly should that be found to be true.

Of course that again says ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are too arrogant.

The PREMIER: Sorry?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Premier, are you done?

The PREMIER: No, Chair ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may continue.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. I do not know if that is a point of order?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Ja, point of order, hon Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: There is a point of order. You may, Minister Allen. Ag, Wenger, I do not see him in the system.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Chair, I am raising a point of order. I do not know who put my hand down. Chair, can you hear me?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I cannot even see you the system.  
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Minister Wenger.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Wenger. Minister Wenger, you may speak, but I do not see you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, House Chair. One of the hon members referred to ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Can you – but I am giving you opportunity ...[intervenes]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... the Premier as "arrogant". I would think this would be in breach of the Rules. If you could kindly rule on that.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Can you repeat yourself, Minister Wenger?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: It is Wenger, colleague, it is Wenger.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay, thank you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you so much, House Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, sorry.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: It seems that one of the ...[intervenes]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I was using Afrikaans. Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: ... hon member – ja.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Wenger is Afrikaans.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: One of the hon members referred to, on the virtual platform referred to the Premier as "arrogant", which is in breach of the Rules. If you could rule on that, please.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Who is that? Who said that? Who was arrogant, Minister? Can you elaborate?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: One of the members on the virtual platform, if you could please revert to the Hansard and make a ruling on this because this offends the Rules.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Minister, I did not hear that, but I will listen to the Hansard and rule if it is necessary, thank you very much.

Hon Premier, you may proceed. If you are done we can proceed.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Chair. I think with that interruption I will take that follow-up question is done.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay, thank you very much. Hon member Fry.

Mr C FRY (DA): Thank you, House Chairperson. What message does the City and Province's approach to the intimidation tactics of the taxi industry send to the public?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I recognise you, hon Premier Alan Winde.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Chair. Ja, I think obviously at the end of the day no matter what happens we have got to make sure that the rule of law is at all times in place.

I mean we find ourselves in this situation because first of all a train system does not work primarily because the rule of law is not upheld and people who act illegally can then break a whole system of public transport and nothing happens.

They either steal all the cables that run the trains and nothing happens, there is no rule of law and [Inaudible.] trains do not operate and then there is illegal occupation of the trainlines itself and now it is going to take months, if not years, to get this specific public transport system operational.

Then what happens is we have [Inaudible.] legislation that enables the taxi industry, through a licensing process and then a set of Rules ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may conclude, hon Premier, your time is going to be finished now, please.

The PREMIER: Thank you, Chair. So there is a set of Rules, 46 of them, and you have to adhere to the Rules and that was what was happening in the process.

The strike said, "Can we review some of those Rules?" and ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Minister, your time is up.

The PREMIER: And they get [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Premier. Sorry for



saying "Minister". Your time is up.

I now ... we have finished the Oral Questions. Now this is the end of Question to the Premier. We now go to the Interpellations. I now recognise the Minister, Minister of Agriculture. I mean Education. You may proceed, Minister Maynier.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Hon Speaker, point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may proceed, hon member Marais, what is your point of order?

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Last Sitting, I was on the list to ask a question to the Premier and they asked for a postponement and they postponed it to this week, gave me the assurance I will be allowed to ask my question today.

Now you again rule that the question part is over.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, sorry, hon member Marais. As you know, hon Marais, we have a time limit when it comes to the questions. 20 minutes have finished, we are done. Can we proceed with the interpellation.

Hon Minister, you may rise.

## INTERPELLATIONS

### 1. Mr M K Sayed to ask Mr D J Maynier, Minister of Education:

What caused the vacancy for the position of principal at the Hoërskool Tulbagh and (b) what have caused the delays in filling this vacancy?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Chairperson. The principal of the Tulbagh Combined School retired before the school became a high school at the start of the 2022 school year, which of course created a vacancy.

The recruitment and selection process for a new principal was conducted by the school governing body at the end of 2022. Unfortunately there were some irregularities in the process and as a result the district proposed that the process be restarted from the short listing stage. The SGB agreed to the proposal that an interview committee comprising of experienced district officials and parent SGB members would conduct the process.

The SGB has now withdrawn the agreement and the Department is engaging with the school to resolve the matter. Thank you.

*[Hon member Maseko takes the Chair.]*

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. I now recognise hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Chairperson. I thank the hon Minister for the response, but the ANC remains deeply concerned with the situation at Hoërskool Tulbagh, where the position of the principal has been vacant since last year.

The SGB followed the correct procedures in appointing the new principal in January this year already. However, MEC Maynier's Department decided to restart the process, as he has alluded to, with an allegedly impartial panel.

The WCED has not provided to date any justifiable reasons for restarting the process. They claim that they received complaints from members of the community, but the governing body has never seen or even discussed these complaints.

The WCED has also claimed that the Public Service Commission received letters of grievance from community members, but these grievances have not been shared or dealt with by the SGB.

The ANC therefore calls on MEC Maynier to make these complaints public. Where are they and why have they not been shared with the School Governing Body? The School Governing Body is a legal body elected by parents and they should be entrusted to follow the mandate to nominate a candidate of their choice.

The Department is trying to impose its own candidate on the school and this is a clear violation of the School Governing Body's autonomy and is undermining democratic process.

The acting principal, Mr Manuel, is a local Tulbagh resident that has taught at the school for many years and has been the acting principal at the school for approximately one year. He applied for the vacant principal position and he followed all the processes. He emerged as the preferred candidate and the recommendation was forwarded to the Department.

The absence, hon Chairperson, of a permanent principal has caused a great deal of uncertainty and instability at the school.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon member Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon House Chairperson. I would just like to find out from the Minister, given that this affects HR and given that this is legally in law in terms of how particular persons are appointed, why it is so important for recruitment and selection processes to be conducted properly? Thank you so.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker. At the end of

the day it is very important that procedures be followed because I think we would all agree in this House that great school leadership is vital to having a great school and that is why it is imperative that the process to appoint a principal is correct and free of any irregularity so that our parents can be confident in the leaders of their children's schools.

In this case the process was not free of irregularities and it is precisely for that reason that our Department must act in the best interests of the learners of Tulbagh High School and why we will continue to engage with the school and of course assist to ensure that the correct process is followed. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister. We now continue with Interpellations. Oh, sorry. I skipped hon member Sayed, my apologies. You can continue, hon member.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Chairperson. I see I am supposed to have spoken after the Minister, but it is fine.

Hon Chairperson, and I have heard both responses now from the Minister, I am only supposed to hear one, but the documents related to the process to fill the vacancy 109(4), because this is the vacancy, went missing during the handover process after a new circuit manager assumed office, as we have heard the Minister spoke about the new circuit manager.

So the SGB was made aware of these missing documents in March of this year and after consultation with the new circuit manager, submitted all the documents and it was confirmed by the WCED that this was in order. We have got this in writing.

If the missing documents, hon Chair, were resubmitted to the WCED, why was it then necessary to restart the process?

Hon member Baartman spoke about following a proper process. We want the MEC to investigate this as well as to how these important documents also went missing.

The delays, and I will repeat, in filling the position of principal at Hoërskool Tulbagh have had several negative consequences. The vacant position has created a leadership vacuum which has made it difficult for the school to function effectively.

The delays have also caused uncertainty and anxiety amongst staff and students as they do not know who their new principal will be. The students are worried about the future of their school.

These delays have hampered the school's ability to improve as it has been difficult to also implement new initiatives or to make necessary changes due to the absence of a full-time principal.

It is clear that MEC Maynier and his Department have learned nothing from the Wesley Neumann persecution, which hampered progress at Heathfield High School.

The WCED's decision to restart this particular process at Hoërskool Tulbagh will have similar effects if it not stopped. This is highly unacceptable. It is in the best interest of the school for the Department to allow the Governing Body to appoint a new principal without any further delays.

Finally, another disadvantage is the closure of the school hostel which provided accommodation for many students who would come from distant farming communities. We urge the MEC to reopen the school's hostel, to get the Department to reopen the hostel. The MEC must intervene and ensure that the Governing Body is allowed to appoint a principal of its choice so that we can have stability at the school.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Hon Minister, you have not used all your time. You still have one a half minute. You can use that to respond.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Chairperson. I note that the hon member raises the whole question of the appointment process of Wesley Neumann.

Now he said that he at one point had full confidence in the independence and

fairness of the ELRC. Well, let me remind him that the very same ELRC which he has full confidence in, found in respect of Wesley Neumann the following:

"As far as I am concerned ..."

And I am quoting from the document:

"As far as I am concerned there was not an iota of evidence presented by the applicant to support that he had been unfairly targeted."

As I said previously, our responsibility is to act in the best interests of the learners at Tulbagh High School and it is precisely for that reason that we will ensure that the appointment of the principal is free of irregularities and that is why we are currently engaging with the school to assist them to ensure that the correct processes are followed and that we get a great school leader at Tulbagh High School. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. That was the end of the first interpellation and we are going to continue with the second interpellation.

I now recognise Minister Ivan Meyer.



**2. Ms A Cassiem to ask Dr I H Meyer, Minister of Agriculture:**

The National Land Reform Framework Bill of 2017 of the National Department of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development found that White people owned 72% of agricultural land in the Western Cape, while Black people owned only 1%:

What is his Department doing to make sure that agricultural land in the province is made available to Blacks and Coloureds in line with the racial demographics of the province?

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Dankie, agb Huisvoorsitter, en dankie aan agb lid Cassiem vir hierdie interpellasie.

Die Nasionale Grondhervorming Raamwerk, ook bekend as die National Land Reform Framework, van 2017 van die Nasionale Departement van Landbou, Grondhervorming en Landelike Ontwikkeling het bevind dat dit belangrik is dat ons moet kennis neem van wat daar gebeur in die grondhervormingstrategie en daarom is dit vir ons belangrik om te kyk na die regstaak, want volgens die Grondwet is grondhervorming 'n nasionale mandaat en daarom word provinsiale departemente in Suid-Afrika nie toegelaat om grond vir landboudoeleindes te koop of te bekom nie.

Hierdie standpunt is wetlik bevestig nadat ons 'n poging aangewend het om grondhervorming in die provinsie te versnel deur die aankoop van grond,

maar dit is geweier weens die grondwetlike bepaling oor grondhervorming deur die Nasionale Regering.

Agb lid Cassiem, dit is daarom om hierdie rede dat my Departement grondhervorming-inisiatiewe, soos die Witzenberg PALS, ondersteun deur die private sektor wat ook 'n bydrae kan lewer tot die breë grondhervormingsagenda. Ek dank u, Agbare.

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon House Chair, and thank you to the hon member Cassiem for this interpellation.

The *Nasionale Grondhervorming Raamwerk*, also known as the National Land Reform Framework, of 2017 of the National Department of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development found that it is important that we take note of what is happening in the land reform strategy and therefore it is important to us to look at the legal task, because according to the Land Act, land reform is a national mandate and therefore provincial departments in South Africa are not allowed to buy or acquite this land for agricultural purposes.

This standpoint is legally established after we made an effort to fast-track land reform in the province through buying up land, but it was refused because of the legal condition about land reform by the National Government.

Hon member Cassiem, it is for this reason that my Department, supported by the private sector, supports land reform initiatives, such as the Witzenberg

PALS, that can also make a contribution to the wider land reform agenda. I thank you, hon.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise hon member Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Thank you very much. In terms of the Western Cape population demographics it is estimated that 49% of people in the province are Coloured, followed by Black people at 33% - sorry, by African people at 33% and then White people at 16%, while Indians and Asians only account for close to 1% of the population.

However, it is the ownership of agricultural land that boggles the mind. White people, who only form 16% of the population here in the province, own more than 70% of the agricultural land in the province, while Coloured people own only 15%, followed by Indians of 4% and lastly African people with a shocking 1% of ownership.

The Premier of this Province is always at pains to stress the issue of concurrent competency of powers between National and Provincial Government as outlined in the Constitution, but this DA-led Western Cape Government even went at length to introduce the so-called Powers Bill, which is nothing but a desperate attempt to observe powers assigned to the National Government.

However, the same DA Government does not use the same energy and resources to make sure that African, Coloured and Indian populations in the province also receive a fair share when it comes to the ownership of agricultural land and that is why the Premier of the Province had sleepless nights and even travelled to the USA for a holiday under the pretext that he was going to discuss the AGOA.

It is because he knows that AGOA enriches only White people in the province immensely and does not do much to benefit the majority of African and Coloured people in the province.

Having said that, I would like the Minister to respond to the following: is there any section or constitutional provision in South Africa which prohibits the Province from using its own agricultural land suitable for farming for the benefit of African, Indian and Coloured people so that they too can farm? Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon member Van der Westhuizen.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Agb Voorsitter, soos wat die agb lid so pas gehoor het is grondhervorming in terme van die Grondwet die verantwoordelikheid van die Nasionale Regering en die ANC het in hierdie opsig gefaal soos wat die agb lid Cassiem se statistiek aandui.

Wat wel vir my en vir ons uit ons oorsigrol as Provinsiale Parlement belangrik is, is die sukseskoers van grondhervormingsprojekte wat deur die Wes-Kaap se Departement van Landbou gesteun word.

'n Paar jaar gelede is die Nasionale Vergadering ingelig dat slegs 10% van grondhervormingsprojekte in Suid-Afrika slaag. Daarteenoor het die Wes-Kaap 'n 62% sukseskoers behaal in die 135 projekte wat op daardie stadium ondersteun is.

Agb Minister, my vraag is, hou die begroting wat die Wes-Kaap jaarliks onder die Comprehensive Agriculture Support Programme, oftewel CASP, en die Ilima/Letsema programme ontvang, tred met die inflasiekoers sodat u Departement hierdie opkomende boere kan ondersteun? En indien nie, wat sê dit van die Nasionale Departement van Landbou, Grondhervorming en Landelike Ontwikkeling se erns met grondontwikkeling? Dankie.

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Hon Chair, as the hon member has just heard, land reform in terms of the Constitution is the responsibility of the National Government and the ANC failed in this respect as the hon Cassiem's statistics indicates.

What is actually important to me and us from our oversight role as Provincial Parliament, is the success rate of the land reform projects that are supported by the Western Cape's Department of Agriculture.

A few years ago, the National Assembly was informed that only 10% of land reform projects in South Africa succeed. In contrast to that, the Western Cape achieved a success rate of 62% in the 135 projects that were supported at that stage.

Hon Minister, my question is, does the budget that the Western Cape annually receives under the Comprehensive Agriculture Support Programme, or CASP, and the Ilima/Letsema programmes, keep up with the inflation rate so that your Department can support these emerging farmers? And if not, what does that say about the National Department of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development's commitment to land reform? Thank you.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I recognise hon member Marran.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks, Chairperson. Schedule 4 of the Constitution also highlights the issue of rural development and land reform, but this particular Government only chooses to ask for the devolution of police powers. So it is their choice.

Hon Chairperson, in the post-apartheid era, South Africa confronts a range of challenges stemming from historical injustices endured by Black citizens during apartheid. One major issue is the unequal distribution of land which the first democratically elected Government sought to address through comprehensive land reform programmes rooted in the Constitution. However,

the Western Cape's compliance with and proper implementation of these programmes have been lacking.

The 2017 National Land Reform Framework Bill exposed a striking disparity in land ownership in the Western Cape where 72% of land is owned by White individuals, whilst only 1% is owned by Black individuals. The discrepancy raises concerns about ongoing marginalisation and exclusion of impoverished and Black communities from accessing and better benefiting from land resources in the province.

The constitutionality endorsed land reform initiatives aim to rectify past racially discriminatory laws as perpetuated segregation, leading to extreme inequalities in land ownership and usage. Agriculture remains pivotal to the Western Cape economy, contributing significantly to the national agricultural sector, but Black people do not benefit from this sector. Even now they are the ones doing the labour work.

It is crucial to recognise that the apartheid associated political entity called the DA, has adopted legislative measures akin to those used by the apartheid regime to enforce racial segregation.

This context underscores the urgent need to address land reform challenges ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: [Inaudible]... conclude ...[Inaudible.]

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): ... in order to rectify historical inequalities and promote a more inclusive and just society. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon member Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Thank you. Section 25(5) of the South African Constitution requires the State to use reasonable legislative and other measures within its available resources to foster conditions which enable citizens to gain access to land on an equitable basis.

We all know that the Provincial Government also forms part of the State and Schedule 4 of the South African Constitution has also given competency to the Province where there are gaps not covered by National Government.

With this in mind and the constitutional requirement of cooperative governance amongst the three levels of Government, what has the Minister's Department done to realise the requirement of Section 25(5) of the Constitution in making sure that people of this province gain access to agricultural land on an equitable basis?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise Minister Ivan Meyer.



†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Dankie, agb Huisvoorsitter. Ek is baie bly om te noem dat Artikel 25, waarna agb lid Cassiem nou verwys het, dat my party, die Demokratiese Alliansie, teen daardie klousule gestem het.

Ek weet ook dat die EFF in die Nasionale Parlement ook teen daardie Artikel gestem het, duidelik vir verskillende doeleindes, maar dit is ook belangrik om te noem dat agb lid Van der Westhuizen is korrek, daar was twee studies gedoen om te bepaal oor die doeltreffendheid van grondhervorming in die Wes-Kaap en grondhervorming in die res van Suid-Afrika.

Die navorsing het bewys [Tussenwerpsels.] dat die ANC se grondhervorming het misluk met 90% en dat die DA – daar is agb lid Van der Westhuizen korrek, die eerste keer, twee studies is gedoen. Die eerste studie het bevind dat dit 62% suksesvol was in die Wes-Kaap en die tweede een het bevestig dat 72% is suksesvol, en dit is [Tussenwerpsels.] baie belangrik om te noem dat grondhervorming is die mandaat van die Nasionale Regering, maar as agb lid Cassiem wil hê dat die DA Wes-Kaap daardie funksie moet oorneem, moet sy asseblief hierdie Western Cape Powers Bill *support*, want dan kan ons meer magte van die Nasionale Regering afvat, and I really like her notion and the trend of her discussion: take the power from the National Government.

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon House Chair. I am pleased to mention that regarding Section 25, to which hon member Cassiem has now referred, that my party, the Democratic Alliance, voted against that

clause.

I also know that the EFF in the National Parliament also voted against that Section, clearly for different reasons, but it is also important to mention, hon member Van der Westhuizen is correct, there were two studies done to determine on the efficiency of land reform in the Western Cape and land reform in the rest of South Africa.

The research has proven [Interjections.] that the ANC's land reform has failed by 90% and that the DA – there hon member Van der Westhuizen is correct, the first time, two studies were conducted. The first found that it had been 62% successful in the Western Cape and the second confirmed that 72% is successful, and that is [Interjections.] very important to mention that land reform is the mandate of the National Government, but if hon member Cassiem wants the DA in the Western Cape to take over that function, she must please support this Western Cape Powers Bill, because then we can take away more powers from the National Government and I really like her notion and the trend of her discussion: take the power from the National Government.]

They are failing the people in land reform and if she wants us to take it, I want her to support the Western Cape Powers Bill because the ANC is failing the people of the Western Cape.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. That is the end

of the Interpellations.

Order, hon members. We will now deal with the Questions as printed on the Question Paper.

I wish to advise hon members that once the hon Premier or Minister has started their reply to the Oral Questions as printed on the Question Paper, hon members must use the chat facility for the Sitting of the House to indicate that they want to ask a follow-up question. There are four opportunities to follow-up questions, but the hon member who has posed the initial oral question as printed on the Question Paper, will have the first opportunity for a follow-up question.

Thereafter other hon member may use then the remaining opportunities to ask a follow-up question. I recognise the hon Premier.

## **QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

### **1. Mr T M Klaas to ask Mr A R Winde, Premier:**

- (1) Why has the Provincial Government not asked the National Government to devolve land-reform powers to the Province for the purpose of land redistribution;
- (2) whether the Provincial Government has a concurrent competency to deal with matters involving land redistribution in line with

Schedule 4 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa; if so, what are the relevant details?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Chair, and thank you very much to the hon member Klaas for the question.

The Western Cape Government has primarily been engaging the Regional Land Claims Commissioner with regards to availing of provincial state land as identified by the Regional Land Claims Commissioner for the settlement of land restitution claims.

The Western Cape Government has also, where possible, attended to the availing of such identified land for the settlement of land restitution claims. The Western Cape Government also developed a process and policy consideration which serves as a guide to decision-making with regard to provincial state land and land restitution purposes. That is for the first part of the question.

The second part of the question is the Western Cape Government does not have concurrent competency to deal with matters involving land redistribution.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Hon member Klaas.

Mr M T KLAAS (EFF): Thank you, House Speaker. I am glad to see a woman leading this Parliament today. I want to see in future we are led by women.

Hon Premier, it is not a big question, but honestly you must be honest that you know that we want [Inaudible.] what is his Government doing to make sure that there is an equal distribution of land in the Western Cape to the benefit of previous disadvantaged groups such as Blacks, Coloureds and Indian population?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much again for that follow-up, hon member Klaas, and I think this fits very nicely into the discussion that we have just had with the previous interpellation, as well as the debate that we have had today and I think a lot of those answers have been given by various speakers and specifically brought together by the Leader of Government Business and the Minister of Agriculture in his answer to that debate, but I again would maybe like to reiterate that we are busy with the Powers Bill in the Province and the Land Reform Department, I think, is also a dismal failure in our country.

We know that land reform, where it sits directly within the ANC control at that level, they first of all have one major problem which I actually think the EFF has too, because you all talk about land and land ownership and it would be very nice if you could in this debate actually tell the citizens, do you believe that people should be, especially dispossessed people or people who

were disadvantaged because of the apartheid government and could not own land, do you think that people should own land? Because the Democratic Alliance believes absolutely that you should own land, and you believe, I believe, in your policy, is that it should only be leased to people, as does the ANC.

The ANC does not believe that people should have land ownership either, although I do see that they keep on quoting percentages when they would not even give leases let alone land ownership through the land Reform Department. They only give leases sometimes when it suits them, or if the person that is getting the lease is an ANC connected cadre, because we have seen that in so many cases in this province where legitimate real farmers, like Ivan Cloete, who is a farmer that can farm and gets chucked off land because of some ANC lackey who has never farmed in his life before and gets put on an operational farm, but even there the leases never come through.

So it would be interesting to see if the EFF are not changing their policy, saying that land ownership is the thing that we should all be striving for. I agree and I think he should support the Powers Bill because not only can we talk about SAPS, because I think that is exactly what I would like to see devolution. PRASA and we have just had a discussion on trains. Energy, I mean energy is failing South Africans every single day and the ANC have messed that up.

So devolution of power there, but Land Reform, Water Affairs, we should

devolve Water Affairs and decision around water allocation. That connects directly with land and empowering and enabling people to use land effectively and turn land into viable pieces of agricultural profit-making spaces.

What about fishing? That also should be devolved, and I mean we are talking about SASSA ...[Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): You want to create a *boerestaat* here. You want to create a *boerestaat*. We have passed that stage, Premier.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Nkondlo, you know better than doing what you just did. Continue, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: You see, Chair, the problem is the member in the ANC does know that the ANC has messed up, totally failed the citizens of our country and this province and we have got to make sure, and I think this question is pertinent and so that is why I think the hon member should definitely support the devolution and this Bill that is in Parliament at the moment, number one. We need more powers at provincial level.

The second thing is the hon member should speak to his caucus at a national level and get them to actually put in a Bill nationally to say why do not we devolve the devolution, let us devolve land reform powers to provinces and enable provinces to actually get involved with directly giving land to people,

and then perhaps my last point is the ANC and the EFF only believe in leasing people land. They do not believe that people should own land, which is absolutely wrong.

They also keep on quoting the wrong number as 1%. It would be very nice if they went to look for this 1% number and where the research comes in to give them the 1% and I would challenge the hon Pat Marran to come forward at the next Sitting and give us chapter and verse of how he found the 1% because I guarantee you it is incorrect. Thank you, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I now recognise hon member Marran.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks, Chair. The Western Cape Government got two farms, only two farms that belongs to them: Waaikraal and Amalienstein. They have messed it up.

The communities of Zoar and Dysselsdorp for the last 10 years have been waiting for this Government to hand over the land that belongs to them. You have messed it up. Two farms and you speak about land reform. You cannot even manage two farms.

In 2014 at the Land Reform Summit in Stellenbosch when the Premier, this Premier, was still the MEC of Agriculture, gave the agricultural sector three months to establish District Land Reform Committees. There is the Chairperson. There is the Chairperson.



Did they do it? Have they established this District Land Reform Committees and if so, how has it helped land reform in the Western Cape? I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Chair. No, because of the way the ANC goes about doing this work and quite frankly all we have done is hit our heads against a brick wall when it has come to the Land Reform Department and specifically one would have thought it would have been better because there was a Deputy Minister who at least came from this Legislature before, he knows this Parliament, he knows this province, Deputy Minister Skwatsha, but he is absolutely missing in action. We have hardly ever seen him in the years that he has been the Deputy Minister and one would have thought that he would have actually made a difference in land reform, but zero, nothing, nada and, ja, so quite frankly, and maybe I should put the challenge back again to the hon member Marran, is to say please tell us where you get the 1% and perhaps add to that to tell us about the Committees that you have established in the other provinces and the massive, massive successes that you have attained in the ANC-run provinces. I have yet to see one.

We know that the measurements in this province where we have measured twice land reform and we are actually measuring it where our Government is helping those that are on that land, that is finally, if we are lucky enough to

get a lease and that is where we help people and that is where you can see that it moved from 60% to 70% success rate.

The ANC is too scared to measure land reform in any other province because they are such a dismal failure and quite frankly if I think about this question and about the previous debates, while the debate [Inaudible.] on and we were talking about commercial farmers and Women's Day specifically, I started noting down farmers that are helped and specifically winemakers that are helped to build their brands and now you see them growing out their agricultural platforms, owning land and growing their farms. I think of Carmen Stevens, I think of Tanya Kleynhans, I think of Ntsiki Biyela, I think of Jessica Saurwein, I think of Natasha Williams, the Seven Sisters and look at how successful they are becoming. I think of Denise Stubbs and Thokozani. I think of the [Inaudible.] and all the ladies involved at [Inaudible.] in their wine brands. I think of Ses'Fikile Wines, I think of Moody Wines, I think of Rosemary Mosia and the Bridge of Hope Wines. I think about J9 Wines and Janine Petersen, and – ja, women who are being supported by programmes in Government and are doing amazing things and taking their brands, as the Minister of Agriculture was saying earlier, into international markets and they are getting into these markets on the back of AGOA and on the back of arrangements through trade agreements into the EU, and they are doing unbelievably well and it is this Agricultural Department and this Government that is supporting them and enabling them.

If we got a devolution of land reform powers and enabling us to put land in

the place of ownership of citizens of the province, we get things done. Just imagine how different it would be. Imagine not only in agricultural land, but also in cities, or in the City of Cape Town where that military land could be made available. Big tracts of land owned by Public Works that just get held *vas*, there is no ways they want to devolve it because they know we get things done and then of course I think National Government's most dismal, dismal, dismal failure is District 6 and quite frankly I cannot believe that they cannot get that going.

Just imagine if there were six or seven Conradie Sites on District 6 right now [Interjections.] how much of a difference it would make in the middle of the City of Cape Town. Thank you, Chair. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Premier. I now recognise hon member Fry.

Mr C FRY (DA): Thank you, House Chairperson. My question is to the hon Premier, has his Government made any call for the release of land owned by the National Government for the purposes of housing and has there been any resistance to these calls?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Chair, and thank you very much to the hon member Fry for that question.

We have got letter amongst letter, document amongst document of specifically, as I said earlier, military land held by National Public Works being transferred and then of course in the agricultural space, when I was in that position that Minister Meyer is in right now and we were speaking earlier about leases versus ownership of land, time and time again saying, please release this land because there are farmers that want to own this land, and of course that goes back to the ANC's failure and the ANC's policy position which ultimately is a failure because they do not want ownership of land, and the second thing is they do not know how to release land to farmers and to land owners. They really do not know how to do it.

They have not shown us anywhere where they are fully in government and they definitely have not managed to devolve any of those pieces of land here in the province or in any of our municipalities.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Premier. I now recognise hon member Dugmore, which is the last question for the follow-up.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, House Chair. What I would like to ask is that in hon member Klaas's question he had specifically asked why the Provincial Government had not asked the National Government to devolve land reform powers.

So what I would like to ask the Premier to confirm is that in terms of Section 99 of the National Constitution it says that:

"A Cabinet member may assign any power or function to be exercised or performed in terms of an Act of Parliament to a member of a Provincial Executive Council or to a municipal council. An assignment must be in terms of an agreement between the relevant Cabinet member, the Executive Council. It must be consistent with the Act of Parliament and takes effect upon proclamation by the President."

Now the specific question which follows up from hon member Klaas's question, has the hon Premier in his former role as an MEC and his current role as a Premier ever approached the President specifically in terms of an assignment or function in terms of Section 99 of the National Constitution? Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Chair, and I think that is the whole purpose of our piece of legislation, is to actually enable the devolution of power and we use that exact section in the Constitution, but what I would like to say and directly to giving land reform power to us, but I think it is an excellent idea and I am going to ask that this gets put to the President in the National Assembly and I expect the EFF and the ANC to both support that

Section in the Constitution immediately, that that gets devolved to the Province because I think it is an outstanding idea and it seems to be ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members! Order, hon members!

The PREMIER: In this House and we will do that immediately. Thank you very much, hon member Dugmore.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. That was conclusion of the first Question.

We are going to continue with the second Question. I recognise Minister Simmers.

**3. Mr P Marran to ask Mr T A Simmers, Minister of Infrastructure:**

With reference the reply to Question 8 of 14 July 2023:

(a) When was his Department made aware of the soil erosion due to illegal water connections and (b) what other interventions will his Department be making?

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon House Chair. Through you to hon member Marran.

The (a) part of your question. My Department became aware of the illegal water connections when it conducted assessments of soil erosion along the informal structures of the SST informal settlement on 8 July 2023.

The (b) part of your question. The City of Cape Town has identified a decanting site for the relocation of all the affected families. My Department will monitor the progress of the relocation of all the affected families and also assist to accommodate the elderly and most vulnerable qualifying beneficiaries in the Silvertown Project to enable implementation of superbloking to de-densify the SST informal settlement. The relocation of elderly is dependent on the completion of units which is estimated to commence on the third quarter of 2024/2025 financial year.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Hon member Marran.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks, Chairperson. Chair, it must firstly be noted that these same questions were asked in a written request and the Department could not answer.

So in terms of the Rules I had to submit the question for oral reply. That is why the question is here today.

Chair, the reality is that the MEC's Department was not on top of the task in

respect of soil erosion at the site and, Chairperson, and the MEC assured the residents of the Western Cape that he will actually take his job seriously and ensure that houses are built in the province so that this kind of occupation of land with devastating consequences does not reoccur. Thanks.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Minister.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon House Chair, first and foremost I am happy that this has now gone on record because the hon member Marran has just lied. My Department did indeed respond to the hon member. So it is on record that he has just lied, thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, the hon MEC or Leader of the DA in the province has just quite clearly stated that the hon member Marran has lied. He is casting aspersions on the hon member. He needs to bring a substantive motion in that regard. Can he please be cautioned and requested to bring a substantive motion.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Sayed.

Hon Minister, we know the Rules. Let us use the ways that are acceptable within the House and continue with the question. Can you continue, hon Minister? You may continue.



The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon House Chair, indeed we did respond to the written question from the member and indeed I will bring a substantive motion because viewers of the Western Cape are actually observing this Sitting and I am tired of this House being used to mislead our people out there and indeed within our limited resources we do provide housing opportunities to qualifying beneficiaries across our province, once again with limited resources. Thank you, Madam House Chair, which is to respond to the hon member's question, the secondary part.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Hon Minister. I do not see any hand. We are going to continue with the third question.

I recognise hon Minister Sharna Fernandez.

**4. Ms N G Bakubaku-Vos to ask Ms S G Fernandez, Minister of Social Development:**

In respect of complaints received by her Department about as well as other challenges at the Huis Spitskop Old-age Home:

(a) What are the details of all complaints received and (b) what has been done to address these complaints?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon House Chair, I think whilst the hon members are sorting out their dialogue and in the spirit of the

debate and the interpellation, hon member Bakubaku-Vos, if you would allow me to respectfully acknowledge all women in this House on the virtual platform in the gallery and in the province, for advancing the cause of women by empowering and uplifting each other and their communities, not only on Women's Day, Women's Month, but 365 days a year. Women of strength, I salute you.

Now to the hon member Bakubaku-Vos's question. Thank you, hon member Bakubaku-Vos.

There have been numerous complaints regarding Huis Spitskop. The first, as far as I have tracked, goes to 17 July 2019 where PAWUSA complained about the Board and refused to sign an agreement with them.

The union also indicated it wants to discuss internal issues pertaining to staff members. The Department informed the union that it cannot be involved with the matter since the Department is not the employer. It was also advised that negotiations should take place between the union and the employer. The composition of staff is prescribed by the regulations of the Older Persons Act and the Department brought it to the attention that the staff composition must be implemented according to the minimum norms and standards in terms of the Older Persons Act 13 of 2006.

In September 2021 a complaint by a Member of Parliament was responded to and matters included in the Service Delivery Development Plan to be

addressed by the Board.

On 2 September 2021 another complaint by a member of the Standing Committee regarding the following matters: the Board composition and management, the unpleasant environment and working conditions of staff members, care and services of residents, no blankets, clothes and meals. The Department responded by submitting a written report dated 15 September 2021 to the member of the Standing Committee after an investigation was concluded.

A monitoring visit was conducted again during 2022 with various follow-ups by the region.

The Board and management was engaged in person and the monitoring report was also submitted to them. A Service Delivery Improvement Plan was concluded and signed by the Board on 30 June 2022 for implementation. The Service Delivery Improvement Plan is currently being monitored. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Minister. I now recognise hon member Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Thank you very much, Speaker. I welcome your response, hon MEC of Social Development †imbokodo [rock] as you already said we should respect each other and we must always work together. We must unite again against the poor people and the poverty in this

country or this province.

My follow-up question is in a written reply from you, hon Minister, on this matter you indicated that the last HM for the organisation was held in 2019 and I want to understand from the MEC why has there not been an AGM since then and what steps is the Department taking to ensure that an AGM is held as soon as possible?

As we visited that old age home the Board members are still the same, nothing has changed.

Can I get clarity on that matter? Thank you very much, hon Minister.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon member Bakubaku-Vos. I think it is very important to highlight that the Department is responsible for monitoring norms and standards. The management of the boards of facilities we have no control over.

So I just, I think to give context to that we currently fund 114 old age homes, 27 assisted and independent living residential facilities, so we have 143 facilities, and then we have 180 private homes that we do not fund, but we need to check on all of them for the norms and standards, and we also have older persons' private lodges that need to be monitored.

So our capacity or mandate when it comes to the running of any older care facility is to ensure that norms and standards are in place.

I have received probably four or five complaints where there is infighting in the Board, there is political contestation and there are allegations going to and fro, and unfortunately the Department does not have the mandate to prescribe to the Board how they constitute themselves, but if they are found wanting in terms of the transfer payment agreement, that is when the Department will act and send in a team to do a rapid assessment. Thank you, hon member Bakubaku-Vos.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I recognise hon member Plato.

Mr D PLATO (DA): Hon Speaker, thank you very much for the opportunity. To the Hon Minister, just one or two quick questions.

Is Huis Spitskop a DSD funded facility and then secondly, link up with the Minister's answer right now, how many homes do DSD monitor and how many does the Department assist with funding? Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon member

Plato. As I indicated we have 143 facilities and Huis Spitskop is one of the funded homes.

We also have, in total we have over 400 NGOs in the older person sector. So the question regarding monitoring and evaluation, we have a team of 6 monitoring officials and we have 365 days in a year, less the working days. We cannot get to every one of the 400 facilities in any one cycle, but there is a three-year cycle. However, where there are problematic facilities, and there are a few, I am aware of one in Touws River that is experiencing difficulty and Badosa has also informed the Department that they are looking at four homes that are likely to be closed.

So the sector is under immense pressure and our mandate is to support them as best we can in terms of equipping them with the necessary skills and the performance management assessments to help them stay abreast of I think what is a huge societal challenge where all our NGOs and NPOs have been affected negatively post-COVID. Thank you, Speaker.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. I do not see any hand raised online and also in – hon member Bakubaku-Vos. [Interjections.]

Before you [Inaudible.] hon member Dugmore, surely you can hear that noise that it is going to disturb every member in the House. Deal with it. Hon Minister. Hon Bakubaku-Vos, you can continue.

Ms N G BAKABAKU-VOS (ANC): [Inaudible.] and address the allegations of ill-treatment and racism. Thank you very much, Minister.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Deputy Chair. Again, as I said, hon Bakubaku-Vos, there is a plan in place, a development plan. It was signed off and agreed to on 30 June. It is currently being monitored and I will request the Department to provide me with an update so that we can check and assess what is happening.

However, there could be, I have heard rumblings that the home is quite likely to consider closure due to all the challenges that they are facing.

So that has yet to be confirmed, but as I said to you it is something that is being talked about and once we get clarity I can provide the Committee with feedback on that decision. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon member Bakubaku-Vos, I recognise you.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Thank you, Chairperson. I do not, let me say, hon Minister, I do not want to leave this. This is the month of women and we [Inaudible.] focus on the women of strength. I know you are working

very hard to make sure that this Department is providing for our poor people, but really that old age home seems that they do not follow the rules of Social Development as the NPO Board members and the NPCs are family members.

I think there is something that needs to be done because constitutionally that is not accepted. Thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Deputy Chair. Before I respond to the hon member Bakubaku-Vos, there seems to be some contention by your colleague regarding our engagement and I think it is important for the House to note that Social Development cannot and should not be politicised because poverty, unemployment, it affects everybody irrespective of the colour of the T-shirt that you wear and as is with Huis Spitskop in Murraysburg, it is a diverse community that lives there, but they all suffer due to mismanagement, maladministration or a lack of leadership, whatever it might be.

So I remain committed, hon member Bakubaku-Vos, to have the Older Persons Programme follow-up as a matter of urgency regarding the status of the improvement plan and also whether the facility is still a going concern. Thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Minister. That



was the last follow-up from Question 4 on the Order Paper. We are going to continue with Question 5.

I recognise you, hon Minister Mackenzie.

**2. Mr L L Mvimbi to ask Mr R D Mackenzie, Minister of Mobility:**

In the light of the nearly 700 road deaths that have been recorded in the province this year, including 80 children and more than 300 pedestrians:

(a) What is (i) the root cause of these deadly road crashes and (ii) his Department doing to address them and (b)(i) what is the vacancy rate in the Directorate: Traffic Law Enforcement and (ii) why are these vacancies not filled?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, House Chairperson. Hon members, it is reported that the Western Cape is experiencing a large volume of semigration of citizens from other provinces.

This is adding to additional pressure and movement on our road network, in addition to our current registered vehicle population of 2 123 000. This vehicle population does not include our unregistered motor vehicles, nor the daily additional fleet of heavy motor vehicles that transport our essential goods due to the inadequate railway service.

Socio-economic conditions lead to many pedestrians that must walk to various destinations seeking or going to places of work, school or health facilities. In the City of Cape Town alone, 387 836 trips are by bicycle or on foot in many across the province.

Provincial Traffic Services is responsible for 29 000 kilometres of our major and secondary routes. The highest recorded number of crashes and fatalities, especially that of pedestrians, is recorded within the Metro. Driver negligence, which includes, but not limited to distracted driving, speeding, reckless and negligent driving, drivers and passengers not wearing safety belts, driver fatigue, is still the highest contributing factor to our road crash fatalities. This number one cause is followed by motor vehicle fitness.

Two, one of the Department's goals is the reduction of road fatalities by 50% by 2030. Pedestrian fatalities are the largest contributor to road fatalities in the Western Cape. The Department is in the process of implementing the Non-Motorised Intervention Strategy Framework with all key stakeholders and role-players focussing on the identified hotspots within the Metro.

We are in the process of increasing our Road Safety Management officers by an additional 33 officials.

Our daily law enforcement programme will continue to deploy our resources to pre-determined locations on our major routes as identified via our Advance Data Analytics application to address driver behaviour, vehicle fitness,

speed, driving under the influence of alcohol.

In conjunction with our Safely Home Communication Programme we will ensure that we can reach our target audience to address the current situation with our vulnerable pedestrians.

(b) The vacancy rate in the Traffic Management Branch is 20%. The majority of the vacancies are for provincial inspectors and senior provincial inspectors. Plans are currently underway to have another student traffic officer intake which will commence from 8 January 2024 to fill vacant provincial inspector posts on the establishment.

The posts have been advertised on 4 August and will close on 20 August 2023. Thereafter the recruitment and selection process will proceed across the province to recruit the suitable candidates.

The recruitment process for the Chief Director: Traffic Management has been initiated. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise hon member Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you. Thank you very much, hon House Chair and thank you very much to the hon Minister for the response.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you. Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson and thank you very much to the hon Minister for the response. However, hon Temporary Chairperson, it is a known fact that part of the root cause of the deadly road crashes are human factors, such as reckless driving, speeding, and driving under the influence of alcohol and drugs. And to effectively address these, we need additional traffic officers on our roads. We know that over 100 BMWs for traffic officers are gathering dust in the Government garages while our people perish on the roads. And lately, the hon Minister divulged that traffic law enforcement is experiencing an annual exodus of skilled and experienced provincial inspectors.

I therefore seek an understanding from the hon Minister how his Department is dealing with the high number of road carnages under these circumstances and to ask differently, what is the Department doing to retain experienced personnel and to ensure that the BMWs are on the road so that our traffic law enforcement officers are adequately resourced. Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. I think there were three questions, but I will respond to the first question. One is; indeed, the hon member is absolutely right. I mean, negligence, drunken driving, speeding, reckless and negligent driving. I mean, these are severe causes of accidents and one of the things that we have, for example, over the

last week, we had 254 integrated roadblocks where we searched nearly 41 000 vehicles that were checked. But it comes down to human behaviour.

If I can just give you some of the examples, some of the stats that I saw over the weekend. A driver was caught driving 171 kilometres in a 120-kilometre zone. Someone was caught driving 140 kilometres in a 100-kilometre zone. Another person, I think, 125 kilometres in an 80-kilometre zone. That comes down to individual responsibility and driver behaviour. So, obviously, our continued enforcement and as the hon member will know, we have seen a decrease in the last year in road fatalities in the Western Cape and road deaths across the Easter period and including in the December period. So, our enforcement, our education programmes are working, but more needs to be done. One road death on our roads is one too many. So, I agree with him, more needs to be done and our traffic officers are working to get this done.

I will answer his second question as well, despite the fact that there was a secondary question. We are working as urgently as possible to get those BMWs out on the road as the previous written reply, which was given to the hon member as well, clearly indicated why the BMWs were not on the road. But our guys are working speedily to get them on the road quite urgently. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Let me recognise hon America and sorry for skipping you.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Minister, I would like to ask with regards to the latest taxi strike action, whether you are aware of any accusations that the ANC and EFF members were (a) involved in or (b) instigated violence that we saw unfold during the strike action. If so, do you have any details about that? Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon America. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, hon members! Order!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Okay.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Klaas, is that a point of order?

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Yes. The strike ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may proceed.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): The point of order is that the strike was not implemented by the EFF. The EFF is always supporting the ground. Yes, when there is a programme, the EFF supports that programme. That is what I

am trying to say. So, we will never be ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Klaas, can you sit.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): ...and the struggle. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, but that was not a point of order. Would you like to speak, hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): No, hon Temporary Chairperson, you have covered me in terms of Rule 66 subsection 3. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Hon Minister, you may rise.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. By the admission of the hon Klaas himself, they always support the ground, and they were present on that day as widely reported. So, the hon EFF members, the hon ANC members on the day the strike was announced, they were present at that venue and some of them even spoke loudly on TV about this matter. So, they need to account for their behaviour, hon America.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, hon Klaas. Order, please. Hon Mvimbi, please! Thank you very much. I like you. We may go on. Do we have any – you may rise, hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. I am intending to exhaust all the available opportunities of follow-up questions. In his written reply to a question on road crashes and carnages in the province, the hon Minister pointed out that there were 342 pedestrian deaths on our roads of which 80 were children, but in the same reply did not mention any specific action that the Department is taking to address these high numbers of deaths on our roads. I would therefore like to get an understanding from the hon Minister, what are the specific interventions that the Department is taking to make our roads safer for pedestrians and children? Thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Mvimbi. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. On that reply, perhaps I can just inform the hon member on what we have done on the weekend, but I will start again. What we are doing, we are implementing the Non-Motorised Intervention Strategy Framework that is in the Metro and also, outside of the Metro. We have continued with our Law Enforcement programme where we deploy our resources to predetermined locations on our major routes, where we are also looking at obviously addressing driver behaviour, vehicle fitness, speed driving, and that, hon Mvimbi, has led to the arrests over the last weekend.



We had, I think I said, 250 integrated roadblocks over the last weekend or over the last week, sorry, 41 000 vehicles were checked and in that we had, I think, 300 or nearly almost close to 400 speeding offences. And that is what we are doing. We are trying to get these drivers that are reckless, irresponsible, drinking and driving, using fraudulent documentation, to remove them from our roads which coincidentally, are also part of the Safety Programmes that we are doing for our commuters and passengers in the minibus taxi industry. So, that is exactly what we are doing.

We need to remove individuals off the road who are drinking and driving, irresponsible behaviour. The vehicles are not fit. You know, these are the individuals that we are removing off the road. That, in conjunction with our Safely Home Programme and our Communication Programme [Inaudible.] enforcement, education. That has led to a reduction in fatalities over the Easter Weekend period and including over the December period.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister. You can proceed, hon America.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Minister, can you elaborate on the role that road users, those are drivers and pedestrians, could play in contributing towards reducing road fatalities on our roads. Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon America. And I think that is

probably the crux of the forward long-term solution in this matter because we can have another 50 000 road blocks, we can have another 10 000 traffic officers on the road, but we cannot have a traffic officer for every car, we cannot have a police officer in everyone's house, we cannot have a social worker in everyone's house and we cannot have a teacher in everyone's house. That is not the long-term solution. It comes down to driver behaviour, personal responsibility in these matters that we need to encourage our constituents not to be reckless and negligent, and to be responsible.

So, hon America, if your friend comes to your house and he comes for a braai, for example, you must tell him: order an Uber. You know, do not drink and drive. Those are the basic things that we all have to do as a society with our families and friends because these are the situations that cause accidents, that cause crashes, that lead to the numbers hon Mvimbi was talking about. Children dying on our roads. So, we, all of us are in this, hon members of Parliament with our family members, with our relatives, we can speak to them and talk about our changed behaviour because that is what ultimately will reduce all these crashes and accidents on our roads so that our hospitals are not full because we cannot have a police officer, a traffic officer, a nurse in everyone's house. There is not a government in this world that has a police officer for everyone, a traffic officer for every person. It all comes down to personal responsibility and changed behaviour.

And we as members of this Parliament and any parliament, must encourage our friends, our families to change their behaviour and that is how we are

going to ultimately reduce these numbers. Obviously as Government, we also have a responsibility to enforce the law, to educate people like our Safely Home Programmes, advertising, communication, roadblocks et cetera, et cetera. But it has to be in partnership with what we are telling our families and friends and communities and constituents. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Now I recognise hon Klaas.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Thank you. Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. My question is that ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may sit, hon Klaas.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson, to my knowledge, the four questions on this particular question to the Minister of Mobility have been exhausted in terms of admissibility of follow-up questions. This ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Deputy Chief Whip. Let us move to the sixth question. Sorry, hon Klaas, for that. Now, I would like to recognise ...[Interjection.]

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): To escape, escape.

†The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Ngubani ongxolayo? Hon Klaas noMinister, ndizokunikhuphela ngaphandle.

[Who is by speaking? Hon Klaas and Minister, I will ask you dismiss you.]

**3. Ms L M Maseko to ask Mr T A Simmers, Minister of Infrastructure:**

With regard to allegations of extortion at construction projects:

- (1) Whether his Department is aware of any criminal investigations into these allegations; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) whether his Department is collaborating with the South African Police Service to hold those implicated in extortion to account; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, thank you to the hon Maseko for the question. The first part of your question is that the Department of Infrastructure is aware of eight investigations into allegations of extortion at construction projects. These investigations involve SAPS stations in Manenberg. There are four cases. Delft, one case; Milnerton, one case and Gugulethu, two cases. The cases in question relate to the unlawful supply of material, demolitions, site security and intimidation.

The second part of your question. The Department works closely with all

relevant stakeholders to enable law enforcement agencies to pursue these investigations.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise hon Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon Minister, I just want to find out. Looking at the delays that are happening within construction because of this, is there any strategic plan that maybe the Department does have working together with the municipalities as it is a problem that is within the whole province.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Through you, to the hon member. No, indeed, hon Maseko, we do have a plan in place. We do work closely with all stakeholders given the impact and the far-reaching implications of extortion across the province. So, we do have a preventative plan in motion which does include them. It is not only the stakeholders outside of our control, but inside of our control which are the Project Steering Committees and also, the local ward council because the council plays a very, very pertinent role in that plan. We have seen outside of the City of Cape Town, this being very successful in some of our key projects. Obviously, the lessons we have learnt will now come to the City of Cape Town itself, where this is a massive problem. Like I have

mentioned, all the eight cases are in one specific part of our province which is the City of Cape Town jurisdiction. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise hon Nkondlo for the follow-up question. Thank you. Before you proceed, hon Nkondlo, I see a hand. Is that a point of order? Okay, you may remain seated for now. Hon Nkondlo, you may proceed.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Can I ask the hon MEC whether he has asked the assistance of J P Smith in the City, who seems to have all the solutions for lawlessness, to help him with the crisis or the challenge of construction mafia; and what has been the improvement or a response in that regard. Thanks.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister, over to you.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. I do take note of the hon member Nkondlo's question. Like I said, we do involve all key role players. We have learnt lessons outside of the City's jurisdiction and those substance lessons we have learnt, we will be realising in the City as well. I do emphasise: all role players, which means each stakeholder, even the key portfolios within the local sphere of government where we are focusing on. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Minister. I now

recognise hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks, hon Temporary Chairperson. Ja, in a previous sitting the hon Christians said that we know who these people are. Hon MEC, can you tell us whether it is true that those who are participating, companies, in a bidding process and who are losing out on that particular process by not getting a contract, are they responsible or are they some of these six forces. And if so, are they still bidding, participating in bidding processes, are in contracts to build houses in this Province? Thanks.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister Simmers, you may respond.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Temporary Chairperson, once again, the original question posed to me was relating to criminal investigations and I have confirmed there are eight criminal investigations. All eight are in various police precincts within the City of Cape Town. As such, one would now need to allow those eight investigations to run their course. One cannot speculate, but you know, obviously, there are certain drivers with specific things happening in specific communities and I hope that these investigations actually do show that as a fact as well. So, I cannot comment on the rest until such investigations are concluded and hopefully, the rest of the law process runs its course, and we actually see prosecution in a court of law. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise hon Klaas.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Need to have my chance. Hon MEC, PRASA is one of the most, no, community transport is one of the cheapest for the poor, but the problem is cable theft. Cable theft. Now, my question. On the issue of cable theft, did you recognise that failure? How would you recover on that because most of the trains are not taking people to work earlier because of cable theft. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. There is a hand. Hon Matlhodi.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, I think the hon member just twists and turns the question. We are not there yet, hon member, we are still on extortion.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Ja, I will keep it.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Can the House be quiet. Hon members, I think now we are done. Before we go to Question 7, I will allow hon Matlhodi Maseko to rise and ask her question.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you. For the follow-up, hon Minister, I just want to find out. The issue of extortion is not just in the Western Cape only,



it is within the whole country and that it is a challenge to other provinces. I just want to find out. Looking at the commitment from the stakeholders or SAPS, to what extent is there success in other provinces with their intelligence and if that is the case, which provinces are there that they are successful in dealing with extortion within the construction industry?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister Simmers, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Through you, to hon Maseko. Hon Maseko indeed, this is a phenomenon across all nine provinces. Various cases have been lodged and they are under investigation. So, at the moment there is no success story to tell although as a Provincial Government in the Western Cape, we are quite proactive in following up these investigations to ensure that at least some of these cases can go the full course of the law and that we can see prosecution, which is our ultimate objective and will be the ultimate success. But unfortunately, there is nothing I can give you that is positive in that regard at this moment.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Let us move to Question 7. I now recognise hon Matlhodi Maseko.

**4. Ms L M Maseko to ask Mr T A Simmers, Minister of Infrastructure:**

- (1) Whether there is any collaboration between PRASA and his Department to facilitate the reconstruction and enhancement of crucial rail infrastructure in the province; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) what is the current status of these projects;
- (3) whether the projects are progressing according to the planned schedule; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Are you not going to respond to my question, please?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Before you, I would like the hon Minister to rise. Sorry.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. I know it is a long day, we can get tired at times. Hon Temporary Chairperson, through you to hon member Maseko. Hon Maseko, the simple answer is no. There is no collaboration between PRASA and my Department due to the fact that the management and the maintenance of the rail infrastructure in the province is still vested with PRASA and the National Department of Public Works and Infrastructure. We have no mandate in terms of the rail infrastructure and that is why we have established the Western Cape Department of Infrastructure to play an active role in

enhancing the rail network infrastructure in the province.

We have been advocating for the devolution to take over the management of the rail network, to take charge within our province of maintenance, the operation, and the enhancement of all rail infrastructure in our province as the Province will do, I think we all can agree, a much better job than the ANC Government is doing nationally at the moment.

The second part of your question ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may sit, hon Minister Simmers.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: At the moment, there is no movement with projects into the ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: May you sit. Hon Marran. Okay, you may rise.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): [Inaudible.] is alright.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Noted.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Temporary Chairperson, the second part, hon member Maseko. At the moment, there is no movement with projects due to the unlawful occupation of the rail network.

The third part of your question. Once again, projects are not progressing according to the planned schedule do to the approximate 30 000 unlawful occupiers on the rail network.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, hon Minister. I would like hon Maseko, followed by hon Marran. Thank you. In that order.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you. Thank you very much. Hon Minister, looking at the Western Cape with the Department of Infrastructure, I just want to find out if you have ever tried to communicate with PRASA in trying to assist them as a province, that what are the – what is the word, it is a long day – how can you go about in helping them or maybe, the plan that you have in Infrastructure looking at the needs that are within our communities, more especially in transport within the Western Cape Government. What role the Department can play in adding value to our communities.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Indeed, hon Maseko, the forego of the Department of Infrastructure, Transport and Public Works. We did actually write numerous letters to the Board's chairperson of PRASA, but needless to say, we are still waiting for a response 18 months later. So, it is not that we have not

attempted to form or build a working relationship with PRASA because we do have the expertise to assist them. We do know that they have a lack of technical skills at certain levels. But above all, we have an approach of seeking to work together, noting the importance of our rail infrastructure and our rail network. Moreso, for those community members. We do realise we do not have the trains on a daily basis which [Inaudible..] at the moment, cannot. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Hon Pat Marran.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon MEC, you know that the HDA have made land available for those families to relocate and we all should know that the City of Cape Town has blocked those relocations of those families to the land that the HDA has made available. What is your Department doing, hon MEC, to expedite, to assist the relocation of those families to the land that has been made available by the HDA? Thanks.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Hon Minister, you may proceed, and you have limited time. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. First and foremost, let us get the facts to the floor on this House. Much has been said about this land. The land has not been purchased. So, you cannot move people to land that has not been purchased.

Number one.

Number two. There is due process. Once the land will finally be purchased, to actually rezone the identified parcels of land for human settlements development. That is a fact. That is what we have said as well. So, in terms of that, hon Marran, until such time that the HDA actually acquires the land and follows due process in terms of the City of Cape Town's planning processes, we have a specific role to play ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): And the City of Cape Town refused this week ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: ...through our ...[Interjection.]  
human settlements ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Speak the truth!

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: ...and that will only activate once the transfer and sale of the land has been completed. In terms of the MOA, hon Temporary Chairperson, we have a specific role to play, and that role will come to fruition once the HDA actually purchases the land, which they have not. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Now we come to the end of our Oral Questions. Thank you very much. Let us move to our

Statements. I now recognise the ANC.

## **STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS**

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.  
...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Sorry about that. I think I love this ANC so much, I forgot. I now recognise the DA. Sorry.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. We note your love for the ANC, but we will always come first. Hon Temporary Chairperson, on Sunday, the Department of Community Safety and Police Oversight revealed that 1 098 individuals were arrested by our successful LEAP officers in the 28-day period between 3 and 30 July. LEAP officers also participated in the confiscation of 30 illegal firearms, meaning that an average of more than one illegal firearm was taken off the street every day.

In addition to this, more than half of these arrests were drug related with 699 individuals arrested by LEAP officers for dealing in/or possessing illegal narcotics. For a moment, let us consider what this means.

The Government's crime fighting units have taken an average of one gun off the street every single day. They have confiscated illegal firearms from almost every precinct to which they are deployed, and each one of the nearly

700 arrests for drugs represents a reduction in the revenue for the gangs that profit from tearing our communities apart.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, these results are what happens when a capable government is allowed to shine. When we in the DA discuss devolution in this House, results like these are what we mean. We have shown that a data-led decentralised model of policing works, and it saves lives. To dispute this is to ignore the facts and to refuse the devolution of policing to this Government is to allow political pride and blind ideology to get in the way of crime fighting and doing what is right for our people. I hope that our LEAP officers will continue to bring safety and hope back to our communities and in so doing, play the most meaningful role in the memory of their fallen comrades: Toufeeq Williams and Zanikhaya Kwinana. May these two heroes rest in peace and may those responsible for their deaths be swiftly brought to justice. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Bosman. I now recognise you. Before, I can entertain hon ...[Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, just on a point of order. The hon member is misleading this House by saying that the LEAP officers belong to the Western Cape Provincial Government. I will bring a substantive motion to prove that the LEAP officers belong to the City of Cape Town, J P's LEAP officers. Thanks.



The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, but I know we have only Chair, nè? I know everyone has an interest in this question, but on this point of order, that is not a point of order. Thank you very much. I now recognise the ANC.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, the ANC Government has made significant strides in women empowerment. This includes increasing women's representation in leadership positions, promoting economic participation and addressing GBV. The ANC has introduced a number of progressive policies such as BBEE to break down gender-based barriers. It has also set aside 40% of public procurement for women-owned businesses. The ANC has acknowledged the pivotal role that women play in agriculture and implemented policies such as the National Policy Framework for Women Empowerment and Gender Equality in agriculture, forestry, and fisheries to support them. It has also launched the National Strategy Plan on GBV and Femicide.

Contrasting this with the Democratic Alliance's approach in the Western Cape, it is evident that the DA has not matched the ANC's strides in women's empowerment. The DA's record on women empowerment in the Western Cape has been less impressive, despite being in a position to influence provincial policy, the DA has fallen short in creating an enabling environment for women's economic advancement.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, there are disparities in income and

representation within the province's workforce and there is no uniform GBV policy or updated Sexual Harassment Policy. As a result of this, female Government employees have fallen victim of sexual harassment and other violations by senior male counterparts who enjoy the protection of members of the Provincial Executive. The ANC acknowledges that more work still needs to be done. It is a concern by the Commission of Gender Equality finding that there has been no significant improvement in spending on women-owned businesses since the President's pronouncement in 2020 ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Conclude, hon member.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): The ANC calls on the DA Government, including the hon Premier Winde's Government to improve this. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the EFF.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Students protested to National Parliament against the arbitrary rule by NSFAS. On Wednesday, 16 August 2023, students from universities and TVET colleges took to the street to march against a new rule introduced by the National Financial Aid Scheme. The students complained that the newly introduced NSFAS bank cards are problematic as they often experienced glitches resulting in allowances not being received. They further called for the increase of accommodation allowances. A R45 000 per annum

amount is very limited considering that accommodation closer to situations of higher learning is mostly expensive, more especially in the Western Cape. The other limit is that NSFAS does not grant an accommodation allowance to students who have completed modules which account for less than 60 credits.

As the EFF, we call upon NSFAS to come to its senses and review its recent policy changes for disadvantaged students. The majority of students who rely on NSFAS for funding, mostly come from indigent families. Policy changes, such as this, encroach on the dignity of these students and subject them to unwarranted hardship. It is a no-brainer to expect a student to study and pass while on an empty stomach as a result of some backward payment system intended for their food allowance. Similarly, limited amounts ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Conclude, hon member.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): ...of accommodation and not providing an accommodation allowance to learners. We once more call upon NSFAS to review and revise its rule whilst taking the concerns of learners into account. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Klaas. I now recognise the DA.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Agb Voorsitter, ek dink in hierdie

Huis is almal baie goed bewus van die uitstaande reputasie van die Wes-Kaapse wynbedryf. Ons het 'n tradisie van wynmaak wat teruggaan na eeue gelede en ons produseer sommige van die beste wyne ter wêreld deur kommersieel lewensvatbare volumes. Hierdie bedryf lewer 'n groot bydrae tot ons ekonomie. Dit het R55-miljard tot Suid-Afrika se bruto binnelandse produk bygedra verlede jaar en net die uitvoere alleen het 'n waarde van R10-miljard.

Nogtans, soos met alles in die land, sukkel die bedryf onder die druk van beurtkrag. Pompe benodig elektrisiteit, wingerde wat nie op die regte tye besproei kan word nie, lewer klein oeste. Aan die produksiekant is wynmaak 'n baie gespesialiseerde wetenskap en kunsvorm met kelders wat miljoene belê in hoë kwaliteit toerusting. Temperatuurbeheer is uiters belangrik om kwaliteit wyn te kan maak en hierdie toerusting, soos in botteleringsaanlegte en koelkamers, het elektrisiteit nodig om te werk. Selfs waar plase alternatiewe energie kan bekom en in werking stel, is dit 'n baie duur kapitale belegging wat baie van ons kleiner plase eenvoudig nie kan bekostig nie.

Wanneer jy dit saamvoeg met die vinnig stygende prys van Eskom se elektrisiteit, word dit uiters moeilik vir die bedryf om sy produksie te handhaaf, laat staan nog enige uitbreiding. Eskom se mislukking raak elke aspek van ekonomie ...[Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Hon Chair, I think in this House everyone is very well aware of the outstanding reputation of the Western

Cape's wine industry. We have a tradition of winemaking going back centuries and we are producing some of the world's best wines in commercially viable volumes. This industry makes a great contribution to our economy. It contributed R55 billion to South Africa's gross domestic product last year and the exports alone have a value of R10 billion.

However, as with everything in the country, the industry struggles under the pressure of load shedding. Pumps require electricity, vineyards that cannot be irrigated at the right times produce small harvests. On the production side winemaking is a very specialised science and art form with cellars investing millions in high quality equipment. Temperature control is critically important to be able to produce quality wine and this equipment, as in bottling installations and cool-chambers, need electricity to function. Even where farms can acquire and activate alternative energy, it is a very expensive capital investment that many of our smaller farms just cannot afford.

When you add it to the rapidly escalating price of Eskom's electricity, it becomes extremely difficult for the industry to maintain its production, let alone any expansion. Eskom's failure affects every aspect of economic ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You must complete now.

†Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): ...maar gelukkig is ons in die Wes-

Kaap vinnig besig om alternatiewe energiebronne aanlyn te bring. Die DA sal nie toelaat dat winsgewende besighede misluk en mense werk verloor net omdat Eskom nie hulle sake in orde kan kry nie. Ek dank u.

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): ...but fortunately we in the Western Cape are quickly bringing alternative energy resources online. The DA will not allow that lucrative businesses fail and people lose their jobs just because Eskom cannot get their matters in order. I thank you.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise GOOD.

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. The Mayor of Cape Town and the hon Premier reacted with great pride to the newly published unemployment rates and claimed that 56 000 new employment opportunities created in Cape Town were responsible for this good news. I would like to know from the hon Premier whether they included the following job opportunities in their calculations. The 1 000 learners advertised in the Safety and Security Department, the 1 020 LEAP officers, courtesy of the Western Cape Provincial Government officers on a fixed term contract. Does it include the Chrysalis Academy learners working within different Government departments on a one-year stipend? The learner systems at schools on fixed term contracts. The thousands of EPWP workers in the City who are contracted or outsourced to third parties. Does it include those employed through BEP Programme?

You cannot build this province on casual or outsourced labour. While it might be true that the Western Cape has lowered its unemployment rate, it has lowered its wages, too. This province has the highest housing rental rates in the country. It is also the province with the most people employed on stipends, rather than salaries and earning an income under R500 per week. This makes it on average the most oppressive employing province in the country. This is glorifying entrenched slavery. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. [Interjections.] Order, order, hon members. I now recognise the ACDP. Hon Christians, are you there? Okay. Thank you very much. Now that the ACDP is not responding, I now recognise the ANC.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks very much, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Before you continue, hon member. Deputy Chief Whip?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson, while I am not in the business of protecting other political parties, the hon member of the ACDP is overseas with the hon Speaker and the hon Deputy and the hon Chief Whip of the Opposition as well. So, it might be that, you know, in between the flight back that he is not able to log on.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Deputy Chief Whip. We

may proceed, hon Pat Marran.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, I rise today to express my deep shock and disappointment at the DA-run Western Cape Government's dismissal performance in delivering housing. The statistics shared by the Department during the recent Standing Committee meeting to discuss the Department of Human Settlement's Fourth Quarterly Performance Report for the period January to March 2023, are truly shocking.

Only 1 436 out of the 2 000 FLISP subsidies were provided, leaving many families in limbo. Only 3 672 out of the 6 213 breaking new ground houses have been delivered and only 1 230 out of the 2 747 serviced sites have been provided. The DA Government is also failing on its favourite programme of title deeds transfers. Out of a target to transfer 10 182 title deeds, only 3 701 were transferred. An upgrade of informal settlements is also a low priority for the DA Government. Only one out of the six informal settlements has been upgraded. This means that many people will continue living in informal settlements without access to basic services. This is a disgrace.

The right to a decent home is not a luxury, but a fundamental human right. By failing to deliver on this right, the DA is showing a glaring disregard for the plight of the poor and marginalised. This is especially concerning at a time when our people continue to perish in informal settlement fires, whilst waiting for the promise of a house. One example is the recent SST informal



settlement fire that claimed the lives of residents who were waiting for houses in the Silverton Emergency Housing Project. It was delayed by the DA. The DA must shoulder the blame for these deaths, and it must not hide behind extortion for its failure to build houses. The people of the Western Cape deserve better ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may conclude, hon member ...[Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): They deserve the ANC.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...Marran.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Thank you very much, hon Marran. I now recognise the DA.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, the recent taxi strike underscored the urgent need for the development of an integrated transport system in the Western Cape. Transport must extend beyond just taxis, it should encompass a network of taxis, buses, e-hailing, cycling and trains. In this regard, considerable strides have been taken by the DA Government towards realising this vision. Hon Temporary Chairperson, what the taxi strike taught us is that we in this

House, should singularly focus on the restoration of the Passenger Rail System. Regrettably, I must add, our appeals have fallen on deaf ears as certain politicians prioritise party politics over the welfare of the people of South Africa.

Just this week, Mayor Geordin Hill-Lewis wrote the President Cyril Ramaphosa urging the establishment of a joint working committee dedicated to the devolution of Passenger Rail Services. Shockingly, this request was met with silence. The repercussions of such neglect have led the City of Cape Town to rightfully initiate an inter-governmental dispute procedure. Moreover, the DA has taken necessary steps by formally reporting the National Minister of Transport, Ms Sindisiwe Chikunga, to the Ethics Committee. It is concerning that she appeared to align herself with the taxi industry's demands, prioritising the release of unroadworthy vehicles ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may conclude, hon America.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): ...over her ministerial obligation. That is ensuring the roadworthiness of all vehicles on the road. The ANC's approach to the recent taxi strike has been massively a flipflop. Following the tragic car accident involving the death ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Your time is up hon member, you may sit. Thank you.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member America. In terms of Rule 145(6), I now give one or more hon members of the Executive... Sorry, sorry. I think I am really tired. Let us go to hon Marais, the Freedom Front Plus.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. The Freedom Front Plus congratulates the trade union, Solidarity; congratulates them for having scored a major victory against the Government's implementation of the proposed race-based employment equity legislation. Solidarity has a further dispute to the International Labour Organisation and the courts ruled in their favour. The International Labour Organisation recommended that the Commission for Conciliation and Mediation facilitate the dispute and the parties have agreed that there will be made a court order that number one, stipulates that no absolute barriers must be set for the employment or promotion of any race group and that no-one's employment may be terminated in any way as a result ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please conclude.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): ...of racial programmes and a race may not be used as a criterion only skills. It is therefore with shock and dismay that the Freedom Front Plus notes media reports ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: [Inaudible.]

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): ...that the Cape Metro has refused to renew beach trading licences of Coloured beach vendors ...[Interjections.] and that they require you to stipulate your race now on application forms [Interjections.] and a Mr Cela, his wife and several other Coloured traders have had their licences rejected and not renewed after 20 years of trading on our beaches ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Honourable, hon Marais. There is a point of order.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): His point of order ...[Interjection.]

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): His time is up ...[Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): ...or statement is now.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: My, my, my.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): And I hear, he looks tired. He looks tired.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Can you please sit.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): You are not tired, you are stupid, man.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may proceed, hon member.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Thank you. We further bemoan the fact that race classification has now been made point scoring criteria where Blacks get the most points, Coloureds second most and Whites ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Your time is up, hon member Marais. Thank you very much.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): You must teach Klaas manners.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I now recognise Al Jama-ah. Hon Brinkhuis, you may proceed.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, we are all relieved that the taxi strike has been called off and we pray for further peaceful and reasonable solutions that would prevent similar or horrific incidents and the disturbing manner with which the City of Cape Town dealt with the crisis. The Al Jama-ah party has given its support to its leader and member of Parliament, hon Ganief Hendricks to submit a Private Members Bill on transport, to propose amendments to the Act, to remove the powers which provinces and local governments have to implement provincial laws and bylaws.

The Speaker of National Parliament has requested the Parliamentary Legislative Drafting Team to assist hon Hendricks with the Private Members Bill. The first step will be to amend the Constitution to give National Government full control on the conditions allowing the impounding of taxis. Al Jama-ah wants an interim unit within the Department of Transport to speed up ...[Interjections.] to speed up the Minister's decision for a national structure to regulate the taxi industry in South Africa. Al Jama-ah was deeply disturbed by the heavy-handedness of the City of Cape Town when dealing with offences committed by taxi operators. We are of the view that there are other measures to use when confronting ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may conclude, hon member.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): ...those who disregard road safety. Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. I am finished.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Al Jama-ah. Thank you very much, hon Brinkhuis. I now recognise the DA. Hon Fry, you may proceed.

Mr C FRY (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. During a meeting of the Ad Hoc Committee on the energy crisis on Friday, the Western Cape Department of Health and Wellness revealed that there has been a 56% increase in all infrastructure emergencies at health facilities between the

2022/2023 and 2023/2024, with a specific increase of 140% in generator and electrical emergencies during the same period. Currently, 193 facilities across the province make use of generators for essential power supply during rolling blackouts.

However, relentless loadshedding hours have resulted in the extended use of generator capacity at health facilities, which comes with its share of challenges. The Department stressed the point that generators are not designed to be default energy suppliers, and this has thus resulted in more frequent breakdowns and electrical emergencies. Some further operational challenges identified by the Department in regard to the extended use of generators include delays in operations as procedures cannot go ahead when the facility is on generator power, the cost and availability of diesel with the Department already having spent R12-million between April and June this year; challenges in keeping up with planned maintenance as emergency maintenance occurs more frequently and escalating costs of repairs.

The Department has taken steps to support generator operations during blackouts. Some interventions include the appointment of a second contractor to support the maintenance of generators and improved quality of oil used in generators to ensure longevity. The Committee agreed that it is pleased by the Department's proactive approach and its continued innovation and resilience to ensure quality services for patients ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Your time ...[Interjection.]

Mr C FRY (DA): ...in the Western Cape.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member. Thank you very much, hon member Fry. Now, in terms of Rule 145(6) I now give one or more hon members of the Executive present, an opportunity to respond to Member Statements for not more than five minutes. Hon Minister Simmers, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson and indeed, I do rise just to correct the hon Marran who is now not in the House. Quite befitting. Because, hon Temporary Chairperson, on Friday I appeared before the Standing Committee, and it is – I am dumbstruck how an individual can attend the session and still get the figures wrong. [Interjections.] It is not the first time, it is the second time because even his statement he issued was wrong on Monday.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, just by way of example. In terms of the total BNG units that we have delivered, the figure the hon member gives is totally, totally incorrect. [Interjections.] The number of units that we have delivered including the Quarter Four figures which he seemingly believes is the total annual figure, is well over 7 000 opportunities, hon Temporary Chairperson.

Secondly, in terms of FLISP. Once again, this is the leading province, but the hon member once again got it totally, totally wrong. Because in terms of



the Fourth Quarter and our annual figure, the number with the hon member quotes, and I am quoting the audited figures, hon Temporary Chairperson, through you, is actually that we have outperformed our own target. So, I would encourage the hon member to remember that leaders are readers and are factual. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Perhaps we could offer the hon Marran some extra classes just to support him to get back on track. Hon Temporary Chairperson, on the question of NSFAS, I would just like to remind the hon member that NSFAS falls under National Government. So, to the extent that it may be failing students and it is failing students, perhaps he would consider raising his concerns with his doomsday coalition partners sitting right there in this House. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Who is [Inaudible.]? Must I allow him? You may rise.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): No *meh*, I am trying to respond on what the hon Minister ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No, man! Hon ...[Interjection.]

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Give me that chance to his response. Hon Minister, honestly, you are dealing with the worst ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Klaas.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): ...and the crisis is ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Klaas! We need, we need to go home. I know you miss each other. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hon Temporary Chairperson?

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): He lied!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You love. You love each other.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hon Temporary Chairperson, there was still a ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...so much, but we need to finish the business of the day.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hon Temporary Chairperson, there was still a minute left for Executive Statements.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Let us move to the Notices of Motion. That was the end of the Members' Statements. Let us move to the Notices of Motion. In terms of the new Rule 151, all Notices of Motion by hon members are required to be delivered to the Secretary for placing on the Order Paper. These motions have been duly submitted and published on the Order Paper below the line.

### **MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the Western Cape abalone syndicate.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

Mr M KAMA (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the safety measures of summer initiation schools in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the WCED's school readiness as the placement

period for next year's schooling looms.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the devolution of powers by the DA.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Motions without Notice, Rule 150. We now move to Motions without Notice. I now recognise hon member Sileku. Must I finish? We now move to Motions without Notice. I would like to inform you that in terms of the new Standing Rule 150 pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolence and congratulatory were submitted to the Programming Authority meeting prior to this plenary of 15 August 2023. Hon members are reminded that the Motions without Notice pertaining to congratulatory and condolence, will not be allowed in this Sitting and that have not been processed by the Programming Authority.

I have been informed that in the Programming Authority meeting on 15 August 2023, political parties did submit the names of the hon members in the desired order of speaking and who had wished to move a Motion without Notice in this Sitting of the House. I will therefore, just for noting and for the purposes of the Minutes, call out the hon members whose names have

accordingly been submitted and approved.

The following members' motions have been approved by the Programming Authority as follows: hon Kama (ANC), hon A P Bans (ANC), hon A P Bans (ANC), hon Kama (ANC), hon D America (DA), hon G Bosman (DA).

### **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

Mr M KAMA (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates the eleven learners from Ocean View for their outstanding achievement of winning 19 medals at the cycle tournament in the Interprovincial Youth Tournament that was held in Oudtshoorn from 10 to 14 July 2023; notes that securing a total of 19 medals is a remarkable feat and a testament to their dedication, hard work and skill in cycling; notes that their accomplishments not only reflect their individual talents but also highlight the supportive environment provided by their school and community; notes that this achievement surely brings pride and recognition to Ocean View and its learners; and congratulates the cyclists and everyone who contributed to their success.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Ms A P BANS (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with sadness the passing away of five people who were gunned down (men aged 12, 14 and 34 and two female victims aged 32 and 39) in Chris Hani Street, Mbekweni, in Paarl on Monday 7 August 2023; and extends condolences and sends a message of strength to the family and friends.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Ms A P BANS (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes the passing away of Talia Morris (17); notes that Talia was struck by a stray bullet while walking home in Hanover Park on 5 August 2023; and extends condolences and sends a message of strength to the family and friends.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Mr M KAMA (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates 16-year-old Josh Boer from Eerste River, Cape Town, on being selected to compete in the Bloemfontein Shotokhan Karate Championships on 17 August; notes that Josh is a Grade 10 learner at the Forest Heights High School and a member of the MB Shito-Ryu Karate Club and has been doing karate

since he was four years old; and notes that this is a remarkable opportunity to showcase his skills on a competitive stage and to inspire others with his determination.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Mr D AMERICA (DA): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates both the Western Cape Government and the City of Cape Town for successfully negotiating the end to the taxi strike; and notes that they were able to set a precedent for the rest of South Africa, showing that the taxi industry will get nothing from the Government if they engage in violence and destruction.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the 33 men who were chosen for the Springbok rugby team that will represent South Africa at the upcoming Rugby World Cup; notes that 19 of the 33 players have a deep-rooted connection to rugby in the Western Cape, and their achievements fill us with tremendous pride; notes that the Western Cape has always been a fertile breeding ground for exceptional rugby players, and this squad exemplifies that legacy; further notes that, as they gear up for the Rugby

World Cup, we send them our best wishes for a successful preparation period; and notes that they are on the cusp of making history by striving to become the first team ever to secure a fourth Rugby World Cup victory.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I now put the motions duly submitted and approved by the Programming Authority to the House. Are there any objections? No objections, agreed to. The motions will appear in the Minutes of the proceedings and in Hansard, in each individual hon member's name as if that hon member had read them out aloud.

I will now afford the opportunity for hon members to move Motions without Notice as per the Standing Rule of 150(2)(d). This could also include Motions without Notice that were not approved of in the Programming Authority meeting. Hon members are reminded that the 30 minutes as per the Standing Rule 150(2)(d) will start now. I now recognise the hon Sileku. Hon Sileku, are you here?

†Mr I SILEKU (DA): Sihlalo Wendlu mandibulise. [Greetings, House Chairperson.] I move without notice:

That the House commends the Stellenbosch Municipality for becoming the first municipality in the Western Cape to introduce a municipal



inclusionary housing policy; notes that this grants the opportunity for a more integrated, inclusive town centre in Stellenbosch; notes that this inclusionary step is a massive one in the right direction and sets the stage for local businesses and corporates to also provide and support inclusionary opportunities that will now present themselves. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Sileku. Are there any objections? No objections. I now again recognise hon Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the Western Cape Government has allocated over half a billion rand this financial year alone for upgrading initiatives to improve informal settlements. Some settlements set for upgrading include Dunoon, Airport Precinct, Kosovo Main, Thabo Mbeki, Welmoed, Silvertown, and many more. Further notes a significant sum of R506-million is being invested to provide essential services such as clean water, sanitation, electricity, and other basic amenities to our informal settlements this year. This will be funded by the Department of Infrastructure's 2023/2024 Informal Settlements Upgrade Partnership Grant. Further notes that there are 40 projects underway across the province, each at various stages of development. Notably, ten of these

projects are in the implementation phase and are set to deliver 2 007 serviced sites, while three projects are already providing basic services to their beneficiaries. The remaining projects are being prepared for delivery over the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework period. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Maseko. Are there any objections? No objections, agreed to. I now recognise hon Maseko again.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you very much. Hon Temporary Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House notes and commends Ms Anita Arendse on being appointed as the first female Chairperson at the Western Cape Rental Housing Tribunal. Notes that the Rental Housing Tribunal was established 22 years ago in 2001 in terms of the Rental Housing Act, 50 of 1999 (RHA), and has since played an important role in the rental housing sector in the Western Cape. Further notes that Ms Arendse is a qualified attorney and conveyancer and will lead the Board for the period of 1 July 2023 to 30 June 2026. Also notes that Ms Arendse previously held the position of presiding officer in the Western Cape Liquor Authority, was the director at a law firm, and was a prosecutor at the Western Cape Public Protector's office; notes that the citizens of the

Western Cape can be confident that the Rental Housing Tribunal Board is in capable hands; and further notes that this is another example of defining moments for women, as a country we still have a long way to go but every stride made is an achievement to be celebrated by all. We need to find a way of celebrating women more as an integral part of a changing society that is still trying to get its identity. There is still more that needs to be achieved to empower women and their celebration in progress. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Maseko. Are there any objections? No objections, agreed to. Hon Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, I move without notice:

That this House notes that the Provincial Department of Infrastructure has allocated an overall budget of R2,25-billion over the Medium-Term to the West Coast District municipalities. In total, 96 multi-year projects across the region are either underway or planned by the Department; notes that investment in infrastructure can be a catalyst for economic development in the region. Further notes that some projects include the R529-million for the Malmesbury Bypass Project. The project will create 220 job opportunities and 37 SMME opportunities;

further notes that the two fast-tracked projects include repairs to the R303 in Citrusdal, a road that was reopened to traffic within 10 days after being washed away by recent flooding, and the Middelpoos Primary School project which will accommodate over 1 800 learners; also notes that road infrastructure for the Saldanha IDZ will also be prioritised; hon Minister Tertius Simmers officially launched the Saldanha IDZ access road. Construction of the R24-million project commenced in September 2022. The early completion of the project further highlights the Department's commitment to service delivery for jobs and economic opportunities to the benefit of communities; further notes that the Standing Committee on Infrastructure will embark on oversight visits to engage with all involved stakeholders to assess the progress of all the projects that are presently underway or in the process of implementation. These multi-year projects are projects that will instil dignity and hope in our communities. Infrastructure investment is crucial for sustainable development outcomes and key to economic growth. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Maseko. Are there any objections? Thank you. No objections, agreed to. Hon Bosman, you are recognised.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House commends the Western Cape Government, alongside their partners, the City of Cape Town, for successfully hosting the Netball World Cup. This historic event marked the first-ever Netball World Cup to be hosted on African soil and also to set a precedent for future major events to be hosted in the Western Cape. To ensure that everybody got a chance to watch the Netball World Cup action, the Department set up a number of viewing centres all across the province. Cape Town, Eden, Central Karoo, Overberg, Cape Winelands, and the West Coast all had multiple viewing centres and they were an extreme success. That this House further notes that there are hundreds of sporting and cultural events still set to take place in the province throughout the year, all of which will play an important role in nation-building, job creation, and economic growth. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

[The hon Maseko takes the Chair]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. Is there any objection to the motion?

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, we object that it is moved without notice.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, just repeat. I could not hear you.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): I am saying, hon Temporary Chairperson, we object that the motion is moved without notice.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay. The motion will be on the Order Paper, will be recorded on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon member Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates both the Western Cape Government and the City of Cape Town for being announced as the host for the UCI Mountain Bike World Championships in 2028. We have seen a bumper number of major sporting events hosted in the Mother City in 2023, including the T20 Women's Cricket World Cup, the Netball Quad series, the Women's Ice Hockey Championship, the Formula E, and the Netball World Cup. Our province is fast becoming the hub of major sporting activities in the country, which brings an important economic boost to our shores. And that this House notes that large cycling events like the Cape Town Cycle Tour and the Cape Epic continue to be very popular and the addition of the UCI World Championships will boost cycling

even more in the province, all while boosting the economy and creating jobs. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member. Is there any objection to the motion? No objections ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, hon Temporary Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Kama?

Mr M KAMA (ANC): We object that it is moved without notice.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. We continue with the motions. I recognise hon member America.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, I move without notice:

That this House notes that the Western Cape Mobility Department is currently recruiting traffic students for the completion of a Further Education and Training Certificate in Road Traffic Law Enforcement at

the Gene Louw Traffic College in Brackenfell. The deadline for these applications is 28 August 2023 and the 12-month training course will commence in January 2024; that this House encourages young people to apply for this opportunity to learn from, and potentially join the ranks of our Provincial Traffic Services. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being ...[Interjections.] Are there any objections? Agreed to. We are going to move to the motion by hon member Sileku.

Mr I SILEKU (DA): †Sihlao Wendlu, mandibulela. [I move without notice:] Thank you, House Chairperson.

That this House condemns the destruction of the Swellendam municipal offices and looting of shops during violent and unlawful protest action, which saw 106 people being arrested, of whom 19 were minors. While we respect and acknowledge people's rights to protest or to voice their dissatisfaction, this should never happen through the destruction of property or unlawful behaviour, as was the case in Swellendam which saw the municipal offices being set on fire. When municipal infrastructure is damaged or destroyed, all residents are affected. With the assistance of the Department of Local Government, additional firefighting equipment from the City of Cape Town could be redirected



to Swellendam, and a provincial task team is being established to see how support can be offered to the municipality. That this House further notes that there are currently rumours doing the rounds that these violent protests were instigated by none other than the ANC. While these accusations are currently not confirmed, we will be requesting the South African Police Service to investigate these accusations so that those who are responsible, can be held accountable. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): We object.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Mr M KAMA (ANC): We object. We can be protected to rumours. We object.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon member Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson, I move without notice:

That this House acknowledges and celebrates the significant

contributions that Mr Johaar Mosaval made to the cultural fabric of the Western Cape. That the House acknowledges the passing of Mr Johaar Mosaval and extends its support and condolences to his friends and family. Johaar was born in District Six and faced substantial challenges under the apartheid system when he embarked on his dancing career in the 1940s. Regrettably, he was denied the opportunity to fully realise his potential in South Africa due to the restrictions imposed on accessing theatres and stages. In 1950, two visiting dancers recognised his talent and facilitated his scholarship to attend Sadler's Wells Ballet School in London. He subsequently joined the Royal Ballet School and within a year, graduated into the Royal Ballet Company. In 1956, Johaar was promoted to soloist and marked his debut with a solo performance during the coronation of Her Majesty Queen Elizabeth II at Covent Garden. Her audience included dignitaries and leaders from around the world. Johaar's illustrious ballet career spanned 25 years as a principal dancer before his return to South Africa in 1976. In 1977, he established his own ballet school, which unfortunately was later forced to close. He stood as a genuine inspiration, garnering admiration from individuals across South Africa. May his memory endure as a testament to his legacy. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are no

objections, agreed to. Will you continue hon member Nkondlo, I recognise you.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. I move without notice:

That the House notes the reservations about the Provincial Powers Bill put forth by the Democratic Alliance. This proposed legislation has raised significant concerns among citizens who value the principles of unity and equity. The Bill's potential to undermine the central authority of the National Government, fragmenting our nation's cohesive policies and programs, is deeply troubling. Granting provinces substantial powers could exacerbate disparities ...[Audio distorted.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Nkondlo, we lost you.

Mr I SILEKU (DA): Loadshedding.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC):

... that we have made towards ensuring equal opportunities for all South Africans. ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Nkondlo. ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC):

In these challenging times, it is ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Nkondlo, we lost you a bit there. Can you start with your motion again, please?

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Can you hear me now?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes. From the beginning.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Okay. Okay, thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. I move without notice:

That the House notes the reservations about the Provincial Powers Bill put forth by the Democratic Alliance. This proposed legislation has raised significant concerns among citizens who value the principles of unity and equity. The Bill's potential to undermine the central authority of the National Government, fragmenting our nation's cohesive policies and programs, is deeply troubling. Granting provinces substantial powers could exacerbate disparities and hinder coordinated efforts to address critical issues like healthcare, education, and social welfare. The envisioned devolution of authority may jeopardise the progress we have made towards ensuring equal opportunities for all South Africans. In these challenging times, it is paramount that we prioritise national

unity and collaborative governance over measures that might inadvertently divide us. We call on the DA to reconsider the implications of the Provincial Powers Bill in light of our collective commitment for a stronger, more united South Africa. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] We continue with the Motions. Motion 11 has been withdrawn by hon member Dugmore, so we will continue to Motion 12. Hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, can you hear me?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, I can hear you. Continue, hon member.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, I move without notice:

That the House notes the deeply troubling issue that persists in the Western Cape: the alarming disparity in land ownership. The fact that 72% of the land is owned by White individuals, while merely 1% is owned by Black individuals, is a stark reminder of the ongoing legacy of injustice that plagues our nation. This chasm in land ownership raises significant concerns about the perpetuation of historical inequalities and the marginalisation of vulnerable communities. We cannot ignore the echoes of apartheid-era policies in these stark statistics, a period when land was systematically taken away from Black citizens, reinforcing systemic discrimination. Furthermore, we must address the disturbing parallels between the Democratic Alliance's policies and those of the apartheid regime. The adoption of similar tactics, particularly in matters of land ownership, is deeply disheartening and contradicts the spirit of progress and inclusivity that post-apartheid South Africa aspires to achieve. I so move, hon Temporary Chairperson.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Object!

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: There are objections, the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. We continue with the motion of hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.  
I move without notice:

That the House remembers and draws inspiration from the exemplary leader of the South African anti-apartheid struggle and a revolutionary intellectual, Ruth First. She was murdered on this day in 1982 by the racist apartheid regime through a letter bomb whilst in exile in Mozambique. May her soul rest in peace and may we build a better society by drawing on her legacy. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon members, that concludes the Motions without Notice, and that concludes the business of the day. The Secretary will now end the meeting and all hon members will be exited from the system. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 18:04.