
THURSDAY, 15 JUNE 2023

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid Sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The SPEAKER: Please be seated. Order! Before we proceed, I would like to remind hon members about some of the logistical arrangements.

As has been our practice to date, members will participate in the Sitting of the House both from here in the Chamber with the Presiding Officer and the Table staff and via Microsoft Teams. Our Standing Rules have accordingly been amended to accommodate such hybrid Sittings of the House.

Hon members experiencing challenges in connecting to this Sitting are requested to contact the WCPP ICT colleagues who will assist to resolve their connectivity challenges.

Hon members, please be reminded that the quorum requirements for this Sitting of the House are provided for in the Constitution and the Standing Rules. Unless there is an indication of unanimous concurrence, voting will be confined to members present in the House and on the hybrid system, who are entitled to cast their votes as per the ATC issued on 11 August 2020. Members present in the Chamber and via Microsoft Teams have all the privileges and immunities imparted by law. Members who are considered out of order by the Presiding Officer will have their microphones muted and called to order.

In instances, hon members, where these Directives do not cover a particular eventuality, the Standing Rules must apply and in instances where the Rules cannot be applied the Ruling by the Presiding Officer is final.

Members, all microphones have been muted. However, an hon member participating in the Sitting of the House via Microsoft Teams, you are requested to use the raise-hand functionality of the system when you desire to raise a point of order, and I will recognise you. When an hon member in the Chamber wishes to raise a point of order, such an hon member may address the Presiding Officer, as expected, but must mute their microphone when they have completed speaking.

Hon members are requested to please ensure that their microphones are unmuted when the Presiding Officer recognises them, and when they are done speaking to please mute their microphones.

The media have also been granted access to this MS Teams meeting as guests of the WCPP. However, members of the press may not use the chat room or speak or activate their cameras while the Sitting is in progress. If an individual, who is not a member of the House activates their microphone and video camera, such an individual will be exited from the Sitting immediately. I request those guests here today, who are not members of this House, to please observe the decorum of the House.

Hon members, for this Sitting, Language Translation Services are available in the Chamber, as usual, and on Microsoft Teams via the respective channels. Hon members, I would like to draw your attention to Rule 40 and remind you that no interjections are permitted during these hybrid Sittings and with that being said, hon members, I now recognise the hon Chief Whip.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 20(1) that deals with the sequence of proceedings, that precedence be given to the Subject for Discussion. I so move, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Chief Whip. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion? No objections? Agreed to.

We will now deal with that Subject for Discussion in the name of the hon I Sileku, as printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon, the hon Sileku.

SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION

*The recently released 2021/22 Auditor-General Municipal
Audit Outcomes Report and the Western Cape's
record of good governance on local government level.*

Mr I M SILEKU (DA): †*Mandibulele Somlomo* [Thank you Speaker] Good afternoon, colleagues, and especially to our guests.

Hon speaker, imagine a South Africa where every municipality thrives with caring and convincing leadership, where the well-being of communities is prioritised and where accountability and efficiency is the norm, a South Africa where the Auditor-General's report becomes a statement to progress and success rather than a reminder of dismal shortcomings.

Hon Speaker, trust is the bedrock upon which our institutions are built. Citizens place their fate in elected officials to ensure transparency, accountability and efficient utilisation of public resources.

Hon speaker, the Western Cape is leading this charge. One of the key mechanisms to assess the effectiveness of Government's stewardship is through audits conducted by independent bodies.

Each year, the Auditor-General unveils the audit reports, a window into the financial performance conducted on municipalities. These reports serve as a wakeup call that there is truly only one party that has consistently shown that it is able to govern much better than any ANC government. Within its pages lie profound insights into the Western Cape, clean audits, compliance with legislation and upright internal controls. It shines a light on the DA governance and lays bare the consequences of ANC mismanagement. Amidst the sea of challenges other provinces are currently facing, we find a beacon of hope in the Western Cape. The Western Cape stands as shining example of what can be achieved when leadership cares and convincingly steers the ship of progress.

The report's latest findings revealed that the Western Cape stands out significantly from the rest of South Africa, with a remarkable 21 clean unqualified audits. All the other provinces pulled together, could not even come close to this number.

Ratifying South Africa's issues begins at local government level and through the continuous provision of clean and reliable governance in the Western Cape, we will remain a shining example for the rest of the country. At the forefront of this remarkable journey is the Department of Local Government.

They are not mere spectators but active participants, ensuring that municipalities embrace clean governance practises. Through their unwavering support and guidance, they empower municipalities to comply with the law, make sound decisions and improve their governance standards. The Department of Local Government understands that good governance is not a buzzword but a vital ingredient in our collective prosperity and service delivery. Driven by a severe sense of responsibility, the Department spearheads initiatives that breed life into good governance principles. They strive to enhance the performance of municipalities to build their capacity and to strengthen their ability to deliver services with effectiveness and efficiency. Unfortunately, Speaker, the Department can only offer a helping hand and it is up to the leadership of the municipalities whether or not they accept the support offered. However, we simply cannot turn a blind eye to the dark clouds that loom over certain municipalities. I am talking from my home hometown. Beaufort West, Kannaland and Laingsburg are names that weigh heavy on my heart. [Interjections.] These municipalities, challenged by a lack of ethical and strong leadership, continue to be battle grounds where communities experience the direct consequences of ANC maladministration and corruption. [Interjections.]

In these places, service delivery becomes a distant dream and infrastructure crumbles under the weight of neglect. What a scandal! [Interjections.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Skande!

[An HON MEMBER: Disgrace!]

Mr I M SILEKU (DA): ...a grave injustice to the very people who should be the beneficiaries of progress that other municipalities in our province are experiencing. Good governance is the cornerstone of a prosperous and thriving society. It is the essence of effective and accountable leadership, shaping the way governments operate, make decisions and serve their constituents, but, Speaker, what does good governance truly entail? It entails accountability, participation, rule of law, transparency, efficiency...

†Die ADJUNK-HOOFSWEEP (DA): Sê vir hulle.

[The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Tell them.]

Mr I M SILEKU: ...ethical leadership, long term vision, collaboration and partnerships. [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: Yes, yes.

Mr I M SILEKU: These pillars form the basis for municipalities where citizens' rights are protected, opportunities are abundant, and the Government works diligently to serve the common good of their communities. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Not in Khayelitsha.

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr I M SILEKU (DA): Hon Speaker, the ANC can no longer deny the truth. Clean audits are not just empty numbers on a piece of paper.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes!

Mr I M SILEKU: They are the very foundation of effective service delivery. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr I M SILEKU (DA): It is truly astonishing to witness the ANC's ignorance in dismissing this fundamental connection. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sileku, please take your seat. Hon members, can I please remind members that there is a member on the floor. Hon members, interjections are allowed, but you are drowning out the speaker. If you are on the Speakers' List, you will have an opportunity to rebut whatever has been said. [Interjection.]

Hon Bakubaku-Vos! Hon Bakubaku-Vos, I am addressing the House. Can I please ask hon members that you do not drown out the speaker on the floor and allow the member to make their presentation? Interjections are allowed, but please do not drown out the speaker. Hon Sileku, my apologies for interrupting you, you may continue.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): We can rebut.

Mr I M SILEKU (DA): Oh, jealousy makes you nasty! Speaker, as I was saying, it is truly astonishing to witness the ANC's ignorance in dismissing this fundamental connection. Clean government means more than just balancing the books. It means ensuring that every cent is accounted for and there is less looting and no looting at all. This translates into more resources being available to invest in critical infrastructure and roll out improved services to our residents. Clean audits, clean audit outcomes also enable us to attract investment, both domestic and foreign, into our province. Investors are drawn to jurisdictions that have a reputation for good governance as it provides them with the confidence and assurance that their investment will be protected and nurtured. Thanks to clean government, the DA-led Government stands tall as a shining example of what clean government can achieve.
[Interjections.]

†Luister dat ek vir julle 'n bietjie 'n storie vertel.

[Listen, let me tell you a story.]

Through clean government the DA-led Western Cape has connected the highest number of households in the province to a reliable water source, number one. Number two, we are leading the way in tackling load-shedding with various municipalities said to become load-shedding free. Quarter after quarter we lead in job creation. It remains the easiest to start a business in

the Western Cape. [Interjections.] Our healthcare system remains the best. Our sporting infrastructure is unparalleled. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr I M SILEKU (DA): Our education system is amongst the best.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr I M SILEKU (DA): Thanks to the efforts of our LEAP officers, crime hotspots continue to drop off the top ten list, making our communities safer. [Interjections.] Our tourism sector flourishes, attracting visitors from far and wide, while foreign investment pours into our province, fuelling economic growth and prosperity. [Interjections.] The list of achievements, hon Speaker, goes on and on.

Hon Speaker, the DA-led Western Cape Province has shattered every barrier through the power of clean government. We continue to lead. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): To lead.

Mr I M SILEKU (DA): Not just in numbers, but in making a real and positive difference in the lives of our residents. People from across the country are flocking to our province to experience nothing else but the DA difference first-hand.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

Mr I M SILEKU (DA): Hon Speaker, we have become the epitome of attractiveness, where the promise of clean government, accountability and service delivery is turning dreams into reality. I thank you. [Applause.]

†Baie dankie. Enkosi. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, hon Sileku. Hon members, I now recognise the hon Mvimbi.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): It is a maiden speech, nè. [Laughter.]

An HON MEMBER: We enjoyed it.

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): For there, hon Speaker, once again the ANC welcomes this debate today. If anything, this debate introduced by the hon Sileku allows us to give the hon member a lesson or two on good governance. [Interjections.]

One is not sure if the hon member went to some courses provided by universities such as UWC or Wits where they will teach you what is good

governance, especially given that, like me, he has some local government experience.

Speaker, it is important to remind hon members of the DA that clean governance does not equal good governance. [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Yes, yes, yes. [Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): If this debate was about clean governance... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): ...then it was another thing altogether. If this debate was about clean governance then it was another thing altogether, but the hon member is confused between good governance and clean governance.

Now let us look at the definition of good governance, because it is good governance that we are debating here today. For example, from the United Nations Office of the High Commissioner, and I quote:

"From a human rights perspective, good governance refers primarily to process, whereby public institutions conduct public affairs, manage public resources and guarantee the realisation of human rights."

Yes, to manage public resources is there, but good governance is also about how this Provincial Government conducts its public affairs and how it guarantees the realisation of human rights.

According to the UN Economic and Social Commission, good governance has eight characteristics and these are participation; consensus orientated...

An HON MEMBER: Yes, from the ANC nationally [Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Accountability.

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Transparency; responsiveness... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members, members!

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Effective and efficiency, equitable and inclusive, and the rule of law ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members! Hon Mvimbi, please take your seat. Please take your seat. Hon members on my right. [Interjections.] Hon members, in particular the hon members on my right. The hon member is on the floor. He is not having a dialogue with you. Hon Mvimbi, can I please ask that you address the Chair, so that you do not have a dialogue with the members

opposite you. I am trying to protect you.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, please allow the member to continue.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you very much for the protection, hon Speaker. Interestingly, the UN Economic and Social Commission does not include clean government in its definition of good governance, and if you examine each of these then this Provincial Government is left wanting in each of these characteristics, so Speaker, the concept of good governance is off the mark here in this debate. In fact, when one looks at the tragedy that had happened in Hammanskraal, one can certainly see that the DA is not interested in good governance. [Interjections.]

Tshwane, Hammanskraal, and Tshwane is under the DA and they are actually having serious problems. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): When one sees the collapse of municipalities such as Joburg, when it was under the DA, and Tshwane, we can see that the DA is not interested in good governance. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Their priority is clean governance even if it means our people must live in sewerage and squalor, as long as they can get clean governance. They do not care about any other thing.

Allow me to quote from the same Auditor-General's report which the MEC and hon Sileku quotes from when she says:

"The City of Cape Town did not include all the performance indicators in its Plan and Performance Report, despite reporting to the National Treasury quarterly and annually on these indicators. Where a metro, such as the City of Cape Town, did not include these indicators in their performance report, the reliability of the reported achievement was not audited, which limits transparency and accountability."

In other words, the City of Cape Town gets a clean audit but does not even report on its underachievement on its own performance indicators, as outlined in its IDP. Our councillors in the City... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, please take your seat. Hon Deputy Chief Whip is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): I would like to know whether the member is willing to take a question.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): No man!

The SPEAKER: Alright, hon Mvimbi, are you prepared to take a question?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Do not interrupt the flow.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): I do not have time.

The SPEAKER: Hon Deputy Chief Whip, the member is not...

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): I do not have time for frivolous questions.

The SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi! Hon Mvimbi! Hon Deputy Chief Whip, just for the record, the member is not prepared to take a question. You may continue. [Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): In other words, the City of Cape Town gets a clean audit but does not even report on its underachievement on its own performance indicators, as outlined in its own IDP. Our councillors in the City complained to us that continuously the DA-led administration in the City simply lowers their targets when they do not achieve their goals. Again, let us look for examples, the Directorate of Human Settlements in the City. What does the AG's report on the City's Human Settlement Directorate say? It says there was a 26% underachievement in the Human Settlement Directorate. [Interjections.] The report said when the City had a performance indicator of 1 904 formal site services, the achievement was only 1 423 so the Auditor-General's report points out how municipalities, like the City of Cape Town,

the crown jewel of the DA in the Western Cape, consistently fails to deliver. Failure to deliver services will get you a clean audit report because when you do nothing, you cannot make mistakes. [Interjections.]

We know the DA is doing nothing to improve the lives of the poor in the Western Cape... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): But even when the DA gets a clean audit report in the City of Cape Town, they still have half a billion rand in irregular expenditure in that municipality. So let us speak about the so-called clean governance. Let us take this opportunity to congratulate the Theewaterskloof coalition for a clean audit. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): They had a clean audit here. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): They had a clean audit... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order members!

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): ...despite the DA doing everything. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Despite the DA doing everything in its power to destabilise the coalition in the Theewaterskloof, that municipality under the ANC, GOOD and PA has not only been able to deliver for the most vulnerable in that municipality, but it is also achieved a clean audit.

The SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, please conclude. Your time has expired.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): One would have expected the hon Sileku to be there first to congratulate the leadership of the municipality... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): ...from where he hails. I thank you. [Time expired.]
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Mvimbi. Please take your seat.
[Interjections.] Thank you, hon members. Thank you, hon members, thank you, hon Mvimbi.

Mr I M SILEKU (DA): They will be qualified...

The SPEAKER: Hon Sileku and hon Mvimbi, you can take your conversation outside the Chamber. You had an opportunity. I now recognise the hon Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, just to emphasise again, clean audits do not always equate to good governance. They simply mean compliance with key legislation and the financial statements are free... [Interjection.]

Ms A BANS (ANC): They do not understand that.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Speaker, are you going to speak to your people on the right as well, as you spoke to the people on the left? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, hon members, interjections... [Interjections.] Hon Cassiem, please take your seat. Hon members, interjections are allowed but the minute you drown out the speaker, then it becomes a problem.

Can I please ask that you allow the member on the floor to make her presentation? If you are on the Speakers' List, you will have an opportunity to rebut that. If not, please do not drown out the speaker and I am speaking to all members of the House. Hon Cassiem?

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, clean audits do not always have a link to improvement of human life, eradication of poverty and

the rendering of basic services. Speaker, for example, at the backdrop of these clean audits the Auditor-General still found Western Cape municipalities have incurred unauthorised expenditure to the tune of R130 million. This is expenditure done outside of the purpose of the vote or main division, which includes over-expenditure. Speaker, so this means that it is easy to find money intended to provide basic services in poor communities, such as the provision for housing, to end up being used for unnecessary services in leafy suburbs just because this DA wants to please its white voter constituency. Speaker, the Auditor-General also found that not involving public participation in the planning process often results in core functions not included in service delivery and budget implementation plans, and with regards to the City of Cape Town, Speaker, she found that the municipality had no plans for water and sanitation, energy and electricity, as well as housing and community facilities. Speaker, part of this explains the lack of proper infrastructure in the City and most municipalities in this province, and bad drainage systems, which often result in floods during the winter rainy days, as in the case of today.

Speaker, money that should be spent on service delivery spent on consultants because municipalities hire unskilled personnel in key positions based on nepotism and patronage. Now Speaker, because municipal offices are sometimes occupied by people who are illiterate, they end up outsourcing basic services to consultants while spending millions of rands in the process and according to these audit outcomes 90% of municipalities in this province spent a combined R45,25 million on consultants for purposes of financial

reporting. Speaker, money which should be spent to render services for the people end up being used on consultants in order to cover for the incompetence of staff in these municipalities.

In conclusion, Speaker, Schedule 4(B) of the South African Constitution places a duty on municipalities to ensure electricity reticulation, while Section 153 provides for the provision of services, which includes electricity. Speaker, in conclusion, once again the Western Cape municipalities have been failing in this regard whilst also owing Eskom R130 million in electricity arrears over the period under review, but in conclusion, with that being said, it is safe to say that Western Cape municipalities under this DA-led Government also contributed then to load-shedding in this province. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Cassiem. Hon members, I now recognise the hon America.

†'n AGBARE LID: Gooi kole!

[An HON MEMBER: Throw coals!]

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, thank you, Speaker. Speaker, a caring government is one that prioritises service delivery and strives to meet the needs of its citizens.

†'n AGBARE LID: Waar? Waar? Waar? Waar is dit nou?

[An HON MEMBER: Where? Where? Where? Where is that now?]

Mr D AMERICA (DA): It is one that actively listens to the concerns of the people and takes appropriate action to address them. Hon Speaker, the positive audit outcomes once again demonstrate that we in the Western Cape have a government that is not only attentive to the needs of its residents, but also accountable for its actions. Time and again the DA-run Western Cape Province distinguishes itself as the only province within the country that consistently achieves an exceptionally high number of clean audits. Good governance is vital for creating integrated transport systems and the DA-led Government exemplifies this. By ensuring funds are not misused, more resources are able to be allocated to upgrade and expand public transportation in the province. Just yesterday, PRASA said that it needs R6 billion to get its operation in working order. The CEO has stated in Parliament it will take five years to recover the ailing rail network system, five years are far too long, Mr Speaker.

We support the Mayor of Cape Town in his communication to the President, seeking clarity on the devolution of rail transport to capable metros, as agreed to by Cabinet last year. This position was contradicted by the Minister of Transport this year, without a word from the President.

Speaker, this morning a Metro rail stopped on the southern line just before Claremont Station. A number of terrified elderly commuters were forced to climb out of the train. The drop between the train door and the tracks is quite

high. These passengers were then forced to walk along the tracks to the station. This is humiliating and extremely undignified to the passengers.

Speaker, the dysfunction at PRASA is putting people's safety and lives at risk. We need to devolve rail to the City of Cape Town to the Western Cape Province now. So while PRASA consistently fails to meet its deadlines, the DA-led Government perseveres. R5,2 billion is currently being spent to roll out the MyCiTi Bus service... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It is a national conditional grant.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): ...to Khayelitsha, Nyanga, Mitchells Plain, and other south-eastern communities in the City of Cape Town. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr D AMERICA (DA): This provides safe, reliable and affordable transport options to about 1,5 million people. Similarly GoGeorge bus service continues to build its fleet and provides reliable and affordable bus services to our communities in George. GoGeorge now proudly boasts a fleet of 133 vehicles encompassing a diverse range of buses. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr D AMERICA (DA): The remarkable expansion of the GoGeorge Network has facilitated over four million passenger trips per year, covering a remarkable 70% of households in George. [Interjections.]

Ms A BANS (ANC): When are they going to set up...

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Unlike PRASA, GoGeorge has continued its upward trajectory, experiencing a remarkable 20% increase in passengers within a single year, while operating at 23% of their routes, more routes. Under the leadership of this DA Government, GoGeorge remains the most affordable transportation option in the region, so hon Speaker, public transport plays a vital role in connecting not just urban areas but also serving as a lifeline for our rural communities. Recognising its significance, the DA-led Western Cape Provincial Government collaborates closely with municipalities to expand and improve the transportation system in rural areas. Together we are bridging the gap. The Department is working with local municipalities to improve non-motorised transport in the Western Cape by supporting the development of better, safer infrastructure, the distribution of bicycles and the provision of affordable public transport alternatives for those who currently have to walk far distances. The Department is spending more than R11 million to enhance non-motorised transportation infrastructure across the province...

An HON MEMBER: Go George.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): ...and this year alone approximately 700 bicycles will be distributed to communities across the province. A sum of R4,5 billion has also been set aside for delivery and maintenance of a sustainable and integrated transport network across the province. Not only is the DA-led Government creating more transport options, but it is also spending massively on maintaining and upgrading our transport network that would really lead the way in South Africa. So, hon Speaker, while South Africa grapples with the devastating consequences of corruption, maladministration and incompetence, the DA-run Western Cape serves as a shining example of progress and hope. Rather than squandering resources, this Government invests in the wellbeing of its residents, ensuring that their hard-earned money is spent on bettering the lives of our communities. We call on the people of the Western Cape to support this DA-Government so that we can provide better services to all the people in the Western Cape. Thank you, Speaker. [Interjections.] [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Hon America, your time has expired. Thank you very much, hon America. [Interjections.] Order, members! I now recognise the hon De Villiers.

Mr P T DE VILLIERS (GOOD): Hon Speaker, whilst it is true that the Western Cape led with the clean audits, we cannot afford patting ourselves on the back when along with Gauteng we also had the most regressions. I refer

you to the statement made by the Auditor-General on releasing the report and I quote:

"The big summary I would offer is that there is a deterioration if you look right across the board, even in those provinces where you see some improvements, there is concern that the improvement is not happening at the type of pace required."

For the past five years the City of Cape Town Metro itself has regressed from its clean audits in 2014/15 and 2015/16. As has been noted by the Auditor-General on a few occasions, the regression is as a result of a lack of effective controls over revenue management and lack of consequence management. These aspects are fundamental to good financial governance in Local Government. We must note the criticisms levelled at us. Reasonable steps were not taken to prevent irregular expenses being occurred.

Number 2, bid specification was drafted in a biased manner and did not allow all potential suppliers to offer their goods and services. The financial scenario presented in these years does not bode well in terms of municipal finance governance. Despite the Auditor-General's last year advising incoming councils to fill critical vacancies, there has been an increase in these. The Province also incurred the irregular expenditure of R330 million in 2021/22. I again quote the Auditor-General in summarising:

"The foundation laid by mature tenacious control environment is commendable, but should be leveraged and further enhance the impact on

service delivery to the people in the province."

I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much hon De Villiers. I now recognise the hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Hon Speaker, just under 15% of South African municipalities received clean audits for the 2021/22 financial year. In other words, only 38 out of 257 municipalities received a clean audit. According to the Auditor-General, the plea from the Auditor-General each and every year is leadership and accountability. Many municipalities are failing in performance, in good governance and integrity.

Speaker, what does it mean? It means failing on performance; there is poor financial management. Failing on good governance means paying for goods and services that they did not use or did not receive. Failing on integrity, that is displaying corrupt politicians, officials, dishonest officials and politicians. That is the order of the day. Speaker, what is sad is that Kannaland received a disclaimer. [Interjections.] Now people must know a disclaimer is the worst of the worst. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): It is not a clean audit, it is not an unqualified

audit. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): It is not a qualified audit. It is not an adverse order... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Christians, please take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon members, hon members, on both sides of the House. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is your baby.

The SPEAKER: Hon members! [Interjections.] Hon Dugmore, you will have an opportunity further down on the speakers' list. Hon members, there is a member on the floor. Can I please ask that you allow the member to make his presentation? Thank you, hon Christians, and my apologies.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, Speaker. Kannaland could not provide sufficient evidence in the form of documentation, a lack of evidence, a lack of information contained in the financial statements. Other municipalities which are problematic are Beaufort West and Laingsburg. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Speaker, what does this mean?

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): It means our people are suffering.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Communities lose hope.

†Die ADJUNK-HOOFSWEEP (DA): Sê vir hulle.

[The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Tell them.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Sê vir hulle van Kannaland.

[An HON MEMBER: Tell them about Kannaland.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): But, Speaker, with everything said, we have one common denominator... [Interjection.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Ja, van Kannaland.

[An HON MEMBER: Yes, about Kannaland.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): ...when it comes to bad service delivery and corruption, the ANC. I thank you. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon members. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: A common denominator.

An HON MEMBER: A homophobic coalition.

The SPEAKER: Members, please, members! Please settle down! I now recognise the hon Minister, Minister Simmers. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Speaker, hon colleagues in the Cabinet, all members of the House, our guests present. [Interjections.] Hon Speaker, it is difficult to think where to begin, given over the last few weeks what we have had to observe by the Leader of the Opposition in this House. So many lies, fake news, alternative facts, misrepresentation, deadcatting, disinformation, bullhorning, spinning, smearing, propaganda, absurdity, prejudice but above all, false flagging and absolute ANC deception, †in sy top-graad! [Tussenwerpsels.] [in its top grade! [Interjections.]] It is difficult, therefore, hon Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: So very, very difficult to find anything in the ANC and its Opposition Leader here in the benches to smear,

to get your teeth into.

†Me R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Ja, vertel ons van Kannaland.

[Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Yes, tell us about Kannaland.]

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: There is nothing, absolutely nothing, †want daar is nie eintlik 'n ANC Wes-Kaap meer nie. Hulle is dood. [Tussenwerpsels.] [because there is not really an ANC Western Cape anymore. They are dead. [Interjections.]]

†'n AGBARE LID: Niks van Kannaland nie!

[An HON MEMBER: Nothing of Kannaland!]

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Speaker, I am sure that many of us are aware that four of the top five municipalities in the country are from the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Yes, hon Dugmore, DA-led municipalities, the top four of the five, are from our province. [Interjections.]

But you will also agree with me... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon Bakubaku-Vos, is that a point of order?

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Yes, yes, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order?

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): The hon MEC cannot address hon Dugmore straight. Refrain. You just pointed at him.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bakubaku-Vos. When you raise a point of order you raise it to me. Hon Minister, can I please remind you to please speak through the Chair and not directly to members. You may continue.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker. Apologies. I am sure that many will agree with me if any of these results or in any municipalities where the ANC and their little babies, the PA and the EFF and GOOD govern, we would have actually witnessed a party that would last a whole week. That is how seldom they actually reached the top five in our country at the moment. [Interjections.] They would have equated that party to a World Cup ceremony, to be quite honest.

Hon speaker, in 2009 the late NBA star, Kobe Bryant, who assisted his team to win a very crucial finals match, was asked why he seemed unhappy after, after all, assisting his team to win, and he said, what is there to be happy about? The job is not finished.

Is the job finished? No, I do not think so and that, Speaker, is crucial for us as the DA in the Western Cape, because we believe that this is the same sentiment that we share because until all of our municipalities perform at the peak and all of our residents in our province and beyond our provincial borders live a dignified life and have access to opportunities, then our job is not done as the DA.

It is for this reason that we do not just only focus on the municipalities where we govern in our province. However, we go out and engage those municipalities under ANC-led coalitions and Opposition coalitions as well. We do this as an effort to empower and emancipate them so that the citizens living in those towns on the streets do not lose hope but receive adequate services from the Government and urgently, so.

†As hulle natuurlik na ons luister!

[If of course they listen to us!]

Speaker, earlier this week, I spent a number of days in the much travelled ANC / PA-governed Central Karoo District, which, by the way, the worst performing municipality, which is Beaufort West, governed by yours truly across here, hon Speaker, that is a district that I went to visit, because my Department and I engaged with the three respective Councils...

Ms A BANS (ANC): I hope you are going to point them out to say...

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: ...with the District Mayor present, when he was present... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: ...to ensure that we could assist them and try to persuade them to restore the dignity of the residents in some of these municipalities, which have been eroding since the 2021 Elections, where we highlighted to them the glaring red flags of projects that have been stagnant and dormant for several years, some as long as eight years because of political instability in some of those Councils. [Interjections.]

Ms A BANS (ANC): And the houses that you promised?

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Due to the incapacity of these municipalities, hon Speaker, that is the main reason why they are stuck where they are, due to poor governance by the ANC-led Government over the past eight years... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: And unskilled management, which was appointed by the ANC who are the lead coalition party in many of those municipalities... [Interjections.] But also they lack serious individuals who understand the subject matter, but I will come to that in a few seconds.

[Interjections.]

Many projects remain unlocked due to, among other things, hon Speaker, multiple compliance related to approvals not being granted and get this, hon Speaker, because the staff do not know how to complete a simple form to initiate the planning processes of those projects and I give practical examples because unlike the Opposition Leader in this House, I talk facts. I do not suck facts out of my thumb. And I will take one example. The ANC / PA governed Beaufort West Municipality, four projects stuck for six years that could have delivered 1 111 housing opportunities. If it cannot happen at the moment, why? Because cadre deployment has seen people that cannot even fill in a simple form being employed in the Beaufort West Municipality...

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Tell us about the houses!

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: 1 111 housing opportunities.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: But, hon Chairperson, Speaker, the solution or better yet, the remedy for the Beaufort West matter is quite simple... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: They need to extricate infrastructure procurement and infrastructure management ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon members!

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Member Bakubaku-Vos!

The SPEAKER: Hon members!

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Letta Matlhodi!

The SPEAKER: Hon members, there is a running commentary happening throughout the Minister's delivery.

An HON MEMBER: Name them!

The SPEAKER: Can I please ask that you allow the Minister to continue with his speech. Hon members, you cannot engage, it is not a dialogue, it is a debate and I am speaking to both sides of the House. We cannot continue like this. Can I please ask, Minister, that you continue.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker. The solution or better yet, the remedy for the Beaufort West matter is to extricate

infrastructure procurement ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon Bakubaku-Vos, is that a point of order?

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Haibo. Speaker, I want to know if the MEC can take a question?

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): No.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): You are not him.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you very much, hon Bakubaku-Vos. Hon Minister, are you prepared to take a question?

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Not at the moment, I am busy giving a speech. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Bakubaku-Vos, the Minister is not prepared to take a question. Hon Minister, you may continue. [Interjections.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): It is your loss! [Laughter.]

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Speaker, the solution or better yet, the remedy for the Beaufort West matter is to extricate infrastructure

procurement and infrastructure management from the day-to-day management by this poor performing, or better yet, the worst performing municipality in the Western Cape.

It cannot be allowed for the ANC / PA-governed municipality to have projects stagnant for over five years and to be allowed to continue as though there is nothing wrong with that. I personally saw the Mayor. I was quite stunned that he saw nothing wrong with this yesterday when I spoke to him.

†'n AGBARE LID: Wie is dit?

[An HON MEMBER: Who was it?]

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: This is a serious governance issue. [Interjections.] However, due to the Napoleon complex, which I observed yesterday in Beaufort West, it is your Coalition Party. Do not run away from your baby! These municipalities... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: These municipalities will continue to under-perform in the Central Karoo, but hon Speaker, we have seen at least some within this province, within the ANC, who do acknowledge when they fail, when they do need this Provincial Government's help, and here I take my hat off to the former ANC Ward Council in Qolweni, which is in Bitou, who could acknowledge that he was seeing his own party was failing while they

were governing Bitou. He handed over the Qolweni project and guess what, hon Speaker, within record time we restored that community's trust in this Government, in this Administration... [Interjections.] But also, we provide job opportunities. We ensure that houses were built within time. We handed over keys in time, and you know what, that hon councillor is not a councillor of the ANC any more, as we speak. He said: "Now I have truly seen the party that can govern for all of our people in the Western Cape. Those were his words. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You have governed for a long time.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Speaker, now let me do the kind thing and spend some of my allocated time to hopefully advise the ANC, but to do that would be pretty useless given the reaction we have observed in this House. [Interjections.]

I do want to quote from Proverbs Chapter 30, and it says:

"There be three things which are too wonderful for me, yea, four which I know not, indeed five: the way of an eagle in the air, the way of a serpent upon a rock, the way of a ship in the midst of the sea, and the way of a man with a maid..."

And, Speaker, the fifth thing: "the most difficult thing to understand is the almost inconceivable defamatory of the ANC to point any finger at anything. ANC cadres should hide from sight for shame of broken promises, of broken infrastructure, of broken municipalities where they govern, of broken service delivery, of broken trust, of broken healthcare, of broken security, of broken transport, of broken water provision, of broken electricity provision, of a broken economy, of broken communities under their government. Everything is broken. The only thing, hon Speaker, that is not broken is the finger-pointing of the ANC trying to point out less failings of our party, to divert attention from everything that has been broken under their Government's ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon Chief Whip, is that a point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes, Speaker. Speaker, can I please ask that you rule in terms of Rule 45. You have been constantly asking and the same Rules have been contravened by the members on the opposite side. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Chief whip. Hon members, can I please again remind you that running commentary is not allowed. I do not – I have allowed a lot of latitude and leeway because it is a political debate, and I do not want to stifle robust debate in the House, but can I please ask that you respect the member on the floor and allow the member to make his or her

submission. Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, in the next few minutes we will see the Leader of the Opposition stand up, and through you to hon Dugmore, instead of going around abusing this House and going on social media and spreading misperceptions of how the DA is running corrupt municipalities, which we will be hearing from you in the next few minutes, go spend time amongst your comrades that are failing the people of Beaufort West, that are failing the people of TWK, that are failing the people of Laingsburg, go and address your failures. ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please conclude your time is expired.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Speaker, the top five municipalities are in the Western Cape, and do I really have to speak to the whingeing of cadres who cannot run municipalities... [Inaudible, speaking simultaneously.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you very much hon Minister ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: I think not because we are proving that the DA can govern... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you Minister, please take your seat.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: I thank you. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: I now recognise the hon Marais, hon members the next Speaker is hon Marais on the virtual platform. Hon Marais, can you hear me?

Mr P J MARAIS (FF PLUS): I can hear you quite clearly, Speaker.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

†'n AGBARE LID: Een sakkie saad!

[An HON MEMBER: One bag of seed!]

The SPEAKER: Hon Marais, can you hear me?

Mr P J MARAIS (FF PLUS): I can hear you, sir. [Interjections.]

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Hoe gaan dit met die rassis vandag?

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: How is the racist today?]

Mr P J MARAIS: Can you hear me?

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, hon Marais, please just take your seat. Hon Dugmore, did you just refer to a member of the House as a racist? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes.

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, please rise.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Speaker, I can tell you exactly what I said, and that was: † "*Hoe gaan dit met die rassis vandag?*" ["How is the racist today?"]

The SPEAKER: So I am asking you, did you refer to anyone in House, to any hon member in this House as a racist? [Interjections.] Order, members!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker, I must be very clear. [Interjections.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Hy is 'n *racist*.

[An HON MEMBER: He is a racist.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I said, † "Hoe gaan dit met die agbare rassis vandag." ["How is the hon racist today?"]

†Me R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Rassis.

[Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Racist.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Because he is the very person without your sanction immediately who called members of this House refugees / foreigners.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Yes, he said we are foreigners.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Now you are saying, are you saying to me that because I refer to a member as a racist, which clearly he is, that and now you want to rule me out of order now? That is double standards.

The SPEAKER: I am ruling, if you are referring to any member of this House as a racist, I am asking you to withdraw ...[Interjection.]

Order, members! Hon Dugmore, if you referred to any member of this House as a racist, can you withdraw? [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Speaker, I did refer to hon Marais, †as n rassis, [as a racist] and if you are asking me to withdraw, I will withdraw, but please, why did you not ask ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He is not asking.

The SPEAKER: Hon members! [Interjections.] Hon members!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Why did you not ask hon Marais... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...to withdraw immediately? That is double standards. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Because I heard you! Are you now withdrawing, just for the record? [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I said so.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): You were all quiet when he talked of refugees... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Speaker, you have asked me... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Speaker, u het my gevra om dit terug te trek.

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Speaker, you asked me to withdraw it.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Ag, do not be biased!

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: En ek het dit gedoen en ek doen dit, ek trek dit terug... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: And I did it and I'm doing it, I'm withdrawing it.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Dugmore.

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Maar ek wys jou dubbel standarde uit.

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: But I'm pointing out your double standards.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Dugmore. Hon Marais, you may continue.

†Me R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Hulle waarheid kom uit!

[Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Their truth is coming out!]

Mr P J MARAIS (FF PLUS): Thank you Speaker.

†Me R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Hulle sit langs Blacks en Coloureds [Ms R

WINDVOGEL (ANC): They are sitting next to Blacks and Coloureds] but they do not treat us...

Mr P J MARAIS (FF PLUS): South Africa consists of builders, and we also have breakers, but the only builders in this country are to be found in the Western Cape, and this Auditor's Report proves it, and all the other reports I ever laid my eyes on. The Western Cape we heard is the only beacon of hope and the breakers they eye us with greed and jealousy and name-calling. A shocking report of the Metro's Department of Water and Sanitation revealed recently that within the next 20 years, 53% of all new housing structures will be informal settlements, 53%. Between March 2016 and June 2020 the number of informal structures in the Western Cape increased by 60 000. They are running away from ANC-governed provinces, they are running away from the very party which they put their hope in for a better future. The ANC's policy at national level is one toilet for every five families, and one tap for every 25 households. Is that now the things which a liberation supposed-to-be movement offers the people they liberated? In contrast the Cape Metro under the DA at the end of the first quarter of this year has provided 4 070 toilets to homeless people and 507 taps. The ANC and Mr Dugmore ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Marais, can I please ask, hon Marais, please conclude, your time has expired.

Mr P J MARAIS (FF PLUS): ...your petticoat of jealousy is showing. Thank

you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais. I now recognise the hon Dugmore.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Hear, hear.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, Speaker. Speaker, the essence of this debate goes to whether the DA's claim to good governance is true or not. The evidence shows that DA good governance is a lie.

†Daar is bewyse oor die Wes-Kaap dat die DA korrup is. Elke dag kom daar meer en meer bewyse van DA-korrupsie na vore. [There is evidence about the Western Cape that the DA is corrupt. Every day more and more evidence of DA corruption comes to the fore.]

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Vra die ouditeur.

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Ask the auditor.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: What is more telling are the shocking attempts by the DA leadership in this House to cover up this corruption and actually then attack those who are exposing the DA from within and also from other parties.

†Hierdie is die duidelike tekens van 'n party wat besig is om dood te gaan, 'n

party wat so arrogant geword het, [These are the clear signs of a party that is dying, a party that has become so arrogant] so arrogant that they actually think that they are above the law. As the ANC we want to put it on record that we support the need for all municipalities to account for their finances and achieve clean audits.

We also are fully behind the recent amendments to the Auditor-General Act which gave more powers to the AG to ensure criminal and civil prosecutions against those who steal from the public purse. We need to pay tribute to the late AG Mr Kimi Makwetu for pushing for these changes.

However, Speaker, when a municipality achieves a clean audit, does this mean that there is no corruption or nepotism or fraud? No, it does not. Does a clean audit imply that the municipality concerned is delivering basic services to all, especially the poor, the unemployed, and also is transforming the local economy? No Speaker, it does not, the Constitution of our Republic outlines in 152 what the objects of Local Government are, to provide democratic and accountable government for local communities, to ensure the provision of services to communities in a sustainable manner, to promote social and economic development, to promote a safe and healthy environment, and to encourage the involvement of communities and community organisations.

Now if you take a town like Touws River, it was this Provincial Government, Speaker, that had to be dragged kicking and screaming to the Imbizo in Worcester. There hon Philander issued a really bad statement questioning

why is the President coming, but at that Imbizo, †die mense van Touwsrivier kon opgestaan het daar en gesê het hulle soek ondersteuning [the people of Touws River could have stood up there and said they're seeking support] for an industrial park and an energy project and the result of the follow-up of that Imbizo is that today there is actually a meeting to try and make that industrial park develop, but then in Touws River, we also have a high school, hon Shadow MEC, Khalid Sayed.

An HON MEMBER: The Shadow Minister.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: We have a high school there that for 20 years, Hoërskool Touwsrivier, that has not been used, that is lying disrepute, that this Department is spending money on. †Waarom kan ons nie 'n TVET kollege daar in Touwsrivier daarstel, vir die *up-skilling* vir ons mense daar? [Tussenwerpsels.] [Why can't we establish a TVET college there in Touws River for the up-skilling of our people there? [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Because of no action.
...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Let me give you an

example, Speaker, about clean audits. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Let me give you an example about clean audits and bad governance. The recent Portfolio Committee of CoGTA heard evidence this week from the Hawks, the SIU and the NPA, and there were revelations that the Western Cape has the highest number of municipal corruption cases under investigation in the whole of South Africa.

†Dit is die feite, laat *MEC* sy ore oopmaak, *MEC* Simmers, laat hy sy ore oopmaak en luister na feite. Daar is 14 sake Nasionaal, 5 in KwaZulu Natal, een in Limpopo, en agt in die Wes Kaap, dit beteken, [These are the facts, let the MEC open his ears, MEC Simmers, and listen to facts. There are 14 cases National, 5 in KwaZulu Natal, one in Limpopo, and eight in the Western Cape, that means] in other words [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: In other words, close to 60% of all Local Government corruption under investigation is from the Western Cape. That is facts. Speaker, do you know that the City of Cape Town ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... achieved a clean audit from 2006 until 2021, but do you also know what makes it work is that these investigations in terms of the City are not the result of the efforts of the political leadership, but because of whistle-blowers who have come forward and have exposed, and my question to the DA today is why after four years has a forensic report into the City Housing Maintenance Department, the so-called Construction Company issue, still up until today, not been released. I challenge the Mayor to release that forensic report, †en dan gaan jy die korrupsie, die wurms van korrupsie sien uitkom [and then you are going to see the worms of corruption come out.] The centre of DA corruption can be found in Matzikama, in Bergrivier, in Cederberg, in Saldanha... [Interjection.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Yes.

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: In Drakenstein, in Witzenberg, in Langeberg, in die Breedevallei, in Stellenbosch, in die Overstrand, in Kaap Agulhas, in Swellendam, in *Mossel Bay*, in Hessequa, in George, in Bitou, in Oudtshoorn, in die Stad Kaapstad, [The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: In Drakenstein, in Witzenberg, in Langeberg, in the Breede Valley, in Stellenbosch, in the Overstrand, in Cape Agulhas, in Swellendam, in Mossel Bay, in Hessequa, in George, in Bitou, in Oudtshoorn, in the City of Cape Town,] and the Garden Route District Council, in all of those, †daar is korrupsie [Tussenwerpsels.] [there is corruption

[Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Order members!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: These cases range from the suppression of internal investigations such as in Matzikama, and fraud by a DA councillor who lied about her father's death. From procurement corruption in Witzenberg, from corrupt and racist leases in Stellenbosch, corrupt and racist leases in Stellenbosch, and the ongoing sale of land...

[Interjection.]

I am sorry, I am battling to even hear myself, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Check my time please.

The SPEAKER: Hon members!

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE (ANC): Die waarheid maak seer, ek weet, die waarheid maak baie seer. Die waarheid maak seer.

...[Tussenwerpsel.]

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): The truth hurts, I know, the truth hurts a lot. The truth hurts. ...[Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, I was trying to protect you, but you are protecting yourself. [Laughter.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, can I please ask that you do not give this running commentary, and hon Dugmore, perhaps speak to me and not directly to the members on the opposite side.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, Speaker. I am saying that in Stellenbosch, the ongoing alienation of land and manipulation of land use zoning applications to help DA donors, †en hulle, daai *donors* het self besluit wie moet die Burgemeester van Stellenbosch wees, ons almal weet dit. [and they, those donors decided for themselves who should be the Mayor of Stellenbosch, we all know it.]

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Wie is dit?

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Who is it?]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: And we also know that the fraud in the DA, it amounts ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Hon Dugmore, please take your seat. Hon members! [Interjections.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Die waarheid maak seer! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: The truth hurts! [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Meyer, is that a point of order?

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Dankie, Speaker.

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, Speaker.]

The SPEAKER: Please just put on your microphone.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Chair, I would like to know if the hon Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr Cameron Dugmore, if he would like to take a question from hon member Klaas. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: That is not a point of order. Hon Minister, that is not a point of order. Hon Dugmore, you may continue. †Jou tyd raak skaars. [Your time is running out.]

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Dit wys vir jou net dat 'n nasionale leier van die DA eintlik net 'n pop is. Wie kan hom ernstig opneem? Hy is 'n leier van die Nasionaal.

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It just shows you that a national leader of the DA is actually just a doll. Who can take him seriously? He is a leader of the National.]

So we have in Hessequa open fraud, Speaker, in regard to the DA Mayor who is heard on tape, telling people, †om te lieg... [Tussenwerpsel.] [to lie... [Interjection.]]

†'n AGBARE LID: Om te lieg!

[An HON MEMBER: To lie!]

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Om te lieg oor hulle inkomste. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: To lie about their income. [Interjections.]]

So do not say to me that I am not talking facts. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: But the one fact, Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: The one fact, Speaker, that I do want to correct, because when there is a fact that comes to my attention that is wrong, I want to correct it, and that is that ASLA did not desert the site, they simply cannot continue because of the housing corruption.

†Vandag was daar... [Tussenwerpsels.] [Today there were... [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Order!

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Ons het 21 mense gekry in Melkhoutfontein, ek gaan die bande vir die MEC stuur, van mense wat veronderstel was om huise te kry, eintlik in 'n posisie is waar hulle nie huise het nie deur die korrupsie van die burgemeester self, want die party is nie bereid om daardie waarheid...

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: We found 21 people in Melkhoutfontein, I'm going to send the tapes to the MEC, of people who were supposed to receive houses, who are in a position where they don't have houses because of the corruption of the Mayor himself, because the party is not prepared to ...]

I want to go further, a more recent example is a revelation by the former DA councillor from Mossel Bay, Anco Barker, that the DA Mayor...

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ag nonsens!

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Oh, nonsense!]

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Nog 'n burgemeester, [The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Another Mayor,] withheld

correspondence from the National Minister of CoGTA and MEC Bredell when they put forward the issue of the appointment of an MM, they withheld that information. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Dugmore, please take your seat. Hon Deputy Chief Whip, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes, Chair. I am asking in terms of Rule 59 given that the member has named Minister Bredell, whether that is a reflection upon the member of this House. Thank you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Minister Simmers was doing the same with the Leader of the Opposition.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Deputy Chief Whip. Hon Deputy Chief Whip, I cannot rule at this point. I will have to consult Hansard and I will revert. Hon Dugmore, you may continue.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I am not raising any issue with MEC Bredell. He wrote a letter to the Mayor. That is fine, and he should have done that. The National Minister wrote a letter to the Mayor. The problem is the DA Mayor withheld that correspondence from the Council and what has happened now is that an MM has been appointed at the highest

notch, costing over R500 000, but the former DA councillor's problem, Anco Barker, is the fact that that was withheld. That is fraud. That is corruption, but there is no action from the Leader of the DA, Simmers. He comes and makes jokes here, but he is not prepared to actually act. I know it is difficult for MEC Bredell, because his party leader is the one who always covers up corruption.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: No!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: That is the issue. He covers up corruption. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, please take your seat. [Interjections.] Please take your seat. Hon Deputy Chief Whip, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes, Speaker, it is again in terms of Rule 59, at first the... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): At first the Leader of the Opposition indicated that the Leader of the DA, Minister Simmers – and then he went further to accuse Minister Simmers of corruption and I would like you to please consult the Hansard regarding whether that is a reflection on a member

of this House.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Before I rule, hon Dugmore, did you refer to hon Simmers as corrupt?

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Nee, mnr die Speaker, wat ek gesê het, [The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No, Mr Speaker, what I said,] he is covering up corruption. †*Inyani ibuhlungu*. Die waarheid maak seer! [The truth hurts!]

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: *Inyani ibuhlungu!* Ja.

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, we are still on the point of order.
[Interjections.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Dit maak seer! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: It hurts! [Interjections.]]

The SPEAKER: Order members! The hon member Dugmore said he did in fact not say that, but I will consult Hansard as per your request and come back to the House. Hon Dugmore, you may continue.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: And, speaker, that is why

Councillor Barker has resigned from the DA, in disgust, and then there is the case of the Hessequa CFO, Lien Viljoen. It is alleged that she only has a matric qualification, that the consulting company Ducharme Consulting, of which she is a member, is given numerous contracts by this very municipality. My question is, is it not strange that the Auditor-General did not pick up this clear conflict of interest between the CFO and the consulting company that she is part of. Let us once and for all recognise that the recent South Africa Auditor-General outcome does not reflect the lived reality for the citizens of this province. Let us also note once again for the record that clean audits do not translate to good governance, and dispel the myth that this DA is clean. They are corrupt to the core, they cover up corruption and protect certain DA members. Speaker, I want to say that I do not think it is a healthy situation that the costs of the audits, which are done by the AG, are paid for by the same municipality being audited. It would be far better if the National Fiscus funded the costs of these audits. Earlier this year, the MMC for housing in the City of Cape Town offices were raided by the Hawks for alleged corruption, that has been going on for years. [Interjections.]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Did we charge?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Several officials have been arrested within the same Department, yet the City of Cape Town pats itself on the back because of a clean audit. This simply cannot be the case and we are convinced that the evidence of corruption will be laid bare. I bring your attention once again to George where nepotism was rife. Municipal funds

were used to enrich a DA Councillor's son, Mr Stag Cronje, and I would like to ask when that happens and where the son of a senior DA politician is enriched by an Old Mutual investment, but there is nothing that happens to them. This is the fact that there is no political will. ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, your time has expired, please conclude.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I would like to conclude that clearly – †die DA korrupsie stink. [the DA corruption stinks.]

An HON MEMBER: That stunk!

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Dis vuil en dis oral oor en die waarheid gaan uitkom in al die munisipaliteite. [Tyd verstreke.]
[Applous.]

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It's dirty and it's all over and the truth is going to come out in all the municipalities. [Time expired.]
[Applause.]]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore. Hon members, thank you very much. [Interjection.] Order members! The next speaker is hon Minister Bredell.

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Nou gaan julle sien.

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Now you'll see.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Kap hulle, Minister.

[An HON MEMBER: Hit them, Minister.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Speaker, allow me to thank the hon members who participated in this debate today, and let me be frank to the House – we are not perfect. We know there are challenges in our communities. There are challenges in some of our municipalities, especially where we are working with unstable coalitions. We are not blind to poverty, crime and unemployment that are out there in our communities. Speaker, the difference between this side of the House and the other side of the House is how we should address these challenges. That is why we need debates such as this one, and if the quality of the debate is high enough, it will shape better understanding and better plans to deal with the shared challenges out in our communities. The topic of clean audits can be easily become a boring conversation. I think there are two reasons for this. The first, people do not understand the link between clean audits on the one hand and service delivery to the public on the other hand, but I will expand on this a bit later. The second reason is many of our hon members in the Opposition has never been part of a team that worked to achieve a clean audit, so they have no appreciation for the hard work that goes into it. I will also say something about this a bit later, but Speaker, let me start off by congratulating the 27 Local Governments within this province with clean audits, all 27 of them.

[Applause.]

Hon Speaker, what an achievement. According to the Consolidated General Report of the Local Government Audit Outcomes 2021/20, 21 of our 30 municipalities received unqualified clean audits with no findings. Six municipalities received clean audits with findings. So hon Speaker, 90% of our municipalities, and this is the important part, can account to the public who entrusted them with their money on every cent that they have spent. So, and that is what is important, they can explain every single cent of their budget.

Hon Speaker, there is a direct link between clean audits and good service delivery. There is also a direct connection between qualified audits and bad service delivery. It really is as simple as that. If you do not believe me, pick any town in South Africa, hon Speaker, and hon Dugmore and his party can try this. Pick any town with an unqualified audit and go and visit that town. I can promise you if you do that, you will see, if it is a town with an unqualified audit or a clean audit opinion you will find good quality roads, you will see residences with safe drinking water, there will be a thriving business centre, and we will see a functioning economy that provides jobs to residents. When you visit this town you will think how can I stay a bit longer. You will look at house prices, at schools you will start to think how can I relocate my family to this town.

Speaker, on the other hand, the other town with the qualified audit, the ANC town, you will find potholes everywhere, residents will be waiting in long

lines with containers to get drinking water from tankers. [Interjections.] The business centre of the towns will be run down and there are many empty shop fronts on the main road. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order members! Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: You will see many unemployed people in the streets. This is the town you do not want to stay in longer than to fuel, refuel your car. This is the ANC town. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Minister, please take your seat. Hon Deputy Chief Whip, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes Speaker, I am struggling to hear the Minister explaining what it looks like in an ANC town because he is being drowned out, so if he could possibly just explain that again because I think it is important for the people and the residents to hear what that is like.

An HON MEMBER: That is not a point of order!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Rule 39 and 40.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Windvogel. [Interjections.] Order members! [Interjections.] Order members!

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Only White people!

The SPEAKER: Hon Windvogel, thank you very much for trying to assist me but I am quite capable from the Chair. That is not a point of order. Hon members, please do not drown out the speaker. We are at the end of the debate. Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, most of our towns and cities have the potential to be thriving centres of commerce and economic activities. Our towns have the potential to provide employment and infrastructure that all our residents need to live a dignified life, but most of our towns are doing the opposite. Our rural areas have become poverty traps, and people are leaving to the big cities and to the Western Cape Province searching for a better life.

Speaker, if you do not believe me just explore it for yourselves. 125 000 people last year alone agree with me, they moved to the city of Cape Town. Pick one town in South Africa with a clean audit and pick one town with a qualified audit. Go and visit them hon Speaker, and you will see and experience it yourselves.

I now want to turn to my second point about the hon members of the Opposition not having experience of being part of a team that has worked

towards clean audits. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Speaker, achieving a clean audit is very difficult. It takes hard work and it takes enormous discipline. That is why municipalities who have managed to develop a system and people to reach this level, work extremely hard to maintain it. That is why the Western Cape also has 19 municipalities with more than two consecutive clean audits, and also why we have municipalities with more than 10 years of consecutive clean audits. It is safe to say that for these municipalities sound financial management is now part of their DNA.

Speaker, in this lies the very valuable insight in human nature. People or organisations that are disciplined and honest in one area will also behave with the same values in other areas. Therefore you will see that good financial discipline and honesty become visible in all areas of the municipal activities.

Speaker, for these municipalities I am prepared to fight for more recognition from our National Government, if you have proven time and time again that you can account for taxpayers money, let us trust you with more, let us support you with less time consuming reporting practises so that you can focus on delivering the best possible services to your residents. Speaker, but

let us get practical, because we have municipalities with good financial management practises in place, we can do things with them. R89 million made available by this Province for backup power generation to protect water systems against load shedding. R100 million has been budgeted over the next three years to secure water resilience projects in this province.

More than R120 million was spent in the past decade to support municipalities with 65 fire trucks and equipment. We could install more than 13 000 smoke alarms in informal settlements to save lives during shack fires. The MER Programme where we are supporting municipalities to become self-sufficient or independent from Eskom's electricity, is going to be proved in future as one of the most forward-thinking initiatives in South Africa. Speaker, these and many other projects are affecting the quality of life of people out there. Clean audits also reflect in other reports which affect our people. The Blue Drop Watch Report, safe drinking water, the Western Cape number one in the country. Green Drop Watch Report, Wastewater Treatment Works, the best in the country, the Western Cape. The No Drop Watch Report indicates the lowest percentage of non-revenue water in the country, the Western Cape.

Hon Speaker, if I turn to the hon Mvimbi then, to tell me that clean government does not speak to good governance, it is just blatant nonsense. Good governance is the outcome of clean governance. I also want to point to the hon Mvimbi because he was the Mayor, the two of us were Mayors then, when his party had the target of getting all municipalities in this country to

clean audit status by 2015, that was an ANC target. They failed miserably, miserably, and now they want to turn it around to say but you cannot. [Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, to speak to human rights without clean audits, how can you speak to human rights and dignified service delivery if your party steals the money? You cannot. It is a farce. So what is the ANC's solution to clean audits? Let us steal the money and see how we going to serve the people then. [Interjections.]

TWK must go and check, we will see next year, and I will be the first to congratulate them, but currently this financial year, they still brag with ANC Government's clean audit. We will see next year what is going to happen.

We are very proud of the achievements of the City of Cape Town because for a Mayor getting a clean audit is excellent. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please conclude. Your time has expired, please conclude.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Speaker, it is a pity that the hon member Dugmore does not take up the right route and goes to the police station and lays the corrupt charges and does not use freedom of speech to misuse the opportunity in this House ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... to badmouth good governance.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Applause.] Thank you, hon Minister. Hon
Mvimbi, I saw your hand, but I did not want to – because the time has
already expired. [Interjections.]

Thank you very much, hon members, that concludes the debate on the subject.
[Interjections.] We now move on to Interpellations as per Rule 197 as printed
on the Question Paper. I recognise the hon, the hon Minister Maynier.

INTERPELLATIONS

1. Mr M K Sayed to ask Mr D J Maynier, Minister of Education:

- (a) What is the future of collaboration schools in the province and
- (b) what plans are in place to manage challenges resulting from the poor
management of these partnerships, as in the case of the Zwelethemba

High School in Worcester?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker. Our collaboration schools model is a unique public private partnership that provides high quality, no fee education to thousands of learners in poor communities.

Our collaboration schools donors have contributed to the value of about R325 million to our schools to date, a contribution to our education sector that might otherwise not have been made. We are generally seeing a positive trend in matric and systemic test results at these schools, but this is not the only reason that the model is valuable.

Learners at collaboration schools also benefit from access to opportunities made possible by the involvement of operating partners. The involvement of operating partners allows additional resources to be brought in, like career guidance counsellors and mentors; partnerships with Governmental organisations; promoting the mental health and wellbeing of learners; resources for remedial education; teacher training; support for the school's financial management, and other interventions to support teaching and learning. One needs only to look at collaboration schools like Apex High School, Jakes Gerwel Technical High School and Boundary Primary School to see the benefits of that model.

We have seconded a chief education specialist and indeed an assistant

director to the Collaboration Schools Programme to ensure effective cooperation. We have also established a Collaboration Schools Working Group, which addresses challenges and strengthens relations between our departments and our operating departments.

Of course there are scenarios where existing collaboration schools feel that the model is not suitable for their school. That is why we have built in an exit option into the model so that the schools revert to public ordinary schools, as is the case with Zwelethemba High School.

When it comes to the future of collaboration schools, the unfortunate court case by SADTU and Equal Education has introduced a measure of uncertainty for our operating partners, but we of course remain committed to continuing the model going forward because there are clear benefits for learners in poor communities in the Western Cape. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I see the hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and my thanks to the hon Minister for his response, while I do not necessarily see eye-to-eye with him on the concept of collaboration schools.

Hon Speaker, the current management crisis at Zwelethemba High School in Worcester actually vindicates the ANC, SADTU and Equal Education's firm

opposition to collaboration schools in the province. Collaboration schools, hon Speaker, threaten the very essence of public education, open the door to profit-driven motives in our public education system. It also undermines the role of parents in school governance and subdues the rights of teachers and minimises the level of accountability.

On 31 May 2023 I met with the school governing body of Zwelethemba High School, whose members are tuned into this particular sitting and we welcome them, to discuss their concerns regarding alleged corruption, maladministration and mismanagement at the school. I have printed their memorandum that they sent to me at that time. I have also printed the memorandum which they have just handed over two hours ago to the WCED in the Cape Winelands District at their protest, and I will hand it over to the MEC following this interpellation.

The contract between the school and the School Turnaround Foundation, the STF, its collaboration partner, expired on 31 December 2022. Yet the STF continues to act as a school operating partner and still has access to school finances and even pays teachers. Sadly MEC Maynier's Department allows this illegality to persist. According to the Governing Body, when the STF ran out of funds to support its services, without the consent of the SGB the STF began using school funds which were paid by the WCED into the school account for the payment of its own services.

The STF also allegedly decided to reduce the salaries of teachers so that it

can finance its services. As a result, the attrition rate skyrocketed as disgruntled teachers began to leave the school due to low salaries.

The School Governing Body also discovered, hon Speaker, major discrepancies between what the WCED paid into the school account for teacher salaries and what is being paid to the teachers by the school itself. The MEC must tell us where the money is going. We want to follow the money. This has been brought to the WCED's attention, which has refused to investigate. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Sayed. I now see the hon member Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I am not sure if the information for today regarding Zwelethemba High School is the same as which hon member Sayed brought to the Committee, but as Chair of the Education Committee I can say that the procedural officer assisted us with forwarding the respective information ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... to the WCED office and that the Department has committed to the Committee to giving us a report and the Committee will then scrutinise such report. [Interjections.]

Secondly, I am a little bit at odds regarding the content of the hon member regarding collaboration schools, given also that the Minister indicated that about R325 million has been contributed to the education sector. The hon member specifically says that he disagrees with collaboration schools, but the National Minister has chosen to abide by the Court decision on this matter and the National Department is currently visiting schools to see the success and how it operates in terms of this particular school.

So to the Minister, I actually want to find out, our Provincial Minister, has the National Minister communicated her position on collaboration schools to your Department, and does this contradict the stance of the Western Cape ANC and SADTU? Because from the current information in the media, hon Speaker, it does not seem as if the National ANC and the Western Cape ANC are in the same WhatsApp group. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Baartman. [Interjections.] I now recognise hon member Klaas.

Mr M T KLAAS: The time has come for the Western Cape Minister of Education to pull a plug on the so-called Collaboration Schools Pilot Programme. [Interjections.] The programme is nothing but the moneymaking scheme and a vehicle for corruption, money laundering and fraud. Taxpayers' money is being misused by politicians and officials in the Western Cape Department of Education in order to enrich themselves and their friends.

Revelations by members of the School Governing Body at Zwelethemba High School leave a lot to be desired. The school is neglected at the hands of vultures who are ready to devour whatever is left of the school budget, whilst learners and teachers are on the receiving end of this misfortune that has descended upon the school.

The architects of this collaboration programme orchestrated this pilot programme as a cash cow so that those involved can assist their representative political parties ahead of the 2024 Government National Election, with funds stemming from corrupt activities.

As things stand, teachers at Zwelethemba High School are not adequately remunerated, resulting in them leaving their posts after three months on average, still with a salary being owed to them. The school is always running short of teachers much to the disadvantage of learners. The collaborating partners at the school operate with impunity, charging exorbitant funds which are way above of the market price of services.

With that being said, can the Minister respond why teachers at the school are not on PERSAL, and further confirm whether they have proper employment contracts setting out their income packages and whether these are comparable to those ...[intervenes]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Klaas.

Mr M T KLAAS: ... to those teachers in [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Klaas, your time has expired. Thank you very much. Hon member Christians.

Mr M T KLAAS: Thank you.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I was part of the public participation in the previous term when we did public participation with, amongst other, the collaboration schools.

Now we as the ACDP had a problem when it came to the School Governing Bodies, but, hon Speaker, when we look at collaboration schools, the big thing is how do you improve schooling? How do you uplift the pupils? And when I looked at Zwelethemba High School, I saw in 2018 they had a 100% pass rate the previous year, because they opened in 2017. They had a 100% pass rate, and if you go through the website it looks like a very good functioning school.

So I am glad that the MEC mentioned that there is an exit clause if people do not want to be part of it anymore, but it was an idea how do you improve the education of the marginalised, the disadvantaged, and that was the idea behind the schools.

So I also now heard what hon member Sayed said. You know, I do not know

if it is all true, but that must be investigated. We cannot sit and wait for the House, we need to act and we need to bring it under the attention of the Education Department, because it was meant to help our learners in the poorest of poor communities to have a better quality education.

So that is what it is all about. It is not a cash cow, it is how do we assist our learners, and like I said when I looked at the website, it is a good story to tell, and if there is any fraud or corruption, it must be brought under attention, and I want to hear from the Minister that if he received the documents, will there be investigation? Will he immediately attend to that problem? Because we cannot steal the future of our children. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians. Hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Let me thank the three members also for their responses and I want to welcome and thank hon member Christians, while I do not agree on his perspective on collaboration schools, I want to thank him for his keenness around the issue, and I know we will trust that I will have his support to ensure that we get the information as soon as possible from the Department, and that we visit the school as a matter of urgency.

I also want to thank the hon member Klaas and the EFF for taking up the issue. Hon member Cassiem also brought the issue to my attention a few

months ago as well. So we will collectively take on this issue.

Hon member Baartman is rather disingenuous, because all the facts from the perspective of the Governing Body were sent to the procedural officer and yes, indeed we are waiting for the Department to get back to us, but that cannot be an excuse as to why we do not speak to the matters here in the House. Our accountability will never stop and unlike the Democratic Alliance, we as the African National Congress in this particular province as an Opposition, will not be blindly following everything that National Government says, even though it is the same political party. We are critical. On quintile issues we were critical, on the sale of alcohol at schools we remain critical.

So we are not some blind followers just because a Minister or a DG says something, then we just blindly follow. We are critical as an Opposition. [Interjections.] Unlike the Democratic Alliance.

Zwelethemba High School teachers undergo rigorous training and possess valuable skills and experience, yet they are paid meagre salaries, as little as R12 000 a month. This not only devalues the hard work and dedication of our teachers, but diminishes their role in shaping society.

In addition to this the teachers at Zwelethemba High cannot even apply for benefits such as home loans, which other teachers have access to, because they are not paid under the PERSAL, but under the SGB contracts. The

SGB's efforts to have the WCED provide PERSAL numbers for all teachers have been ignored. What is the MEC going to do to intervene to end this enslavement of our dedicated teachers by the SOP?

Even more concerning, hon Speaker, is the fact that since the SGB came into office it has been asking for bank financial statements, financial reports from the school management, but these have not been provided to them. Through its investigation the SGB has discovered that there are teachers who left the school but are still receiving a salary advice from the school's finance officer after they left. This gives legitimacy to the concerns that there are ghost teachers at the school.

It is also alleged that teachers' payslips reflect bonuses for December 2022, but this did not reflect in their bank statements. The MEC must demand that the acting principal provides his Department and the parents with a detailed financial report.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Sayed, your time has expired.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): As I close, hon Speaker, the MEC's Department has now dissolved the Governing Body. They have dissolved the Governing Body and we are demanding that the ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... interim governing ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... at least includes parents ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... hon member Sayed, your time has expired.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... as it does not include parents at this time, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker. I am grateful to the hon members for this opportunity to discuss what we think is a groundbreaking collaboration schools model which does improve learning, hon member, and provides high quality, no fee education to thousands of learners in poor communities in our province.

I wish to assure hon members that we are aware of the various allegations being made regarding the school and they are currently being assessed. What the hon members do not seem to realise is that Zwelethemba High School has decided to end their partnership with their operating partner and the school felt that they ought to look for another operating partner, but unfortunately

they were unable to secure an alternative partner and thus the school reverts to a public ordinary school on 30 September 2023, and from time-to-time we have to accept that partnerships at collaboration schools might not work out.

We are going to learn from these decisions and improve the model over time as a result, but the exception does not prove the rule and collaboration schools do provide high quality, no fee education for learners from poor communities.

The role of the National Minister, I think, is a pertinent point and of course as the hon member points out, the National Minister chose to abide by the Court's decision instead of in fact siding with Equal Education and SADTU on this matter, which of course gives rise to a curious case where the National Minister is prepared to abide by the Court's decision, where the National Department of Education is visiting collaboration schools because they, unlike those hon members, believe that the collaboration schools offer hope to learners in poor communities and yet the hon member together with his allies in Equal Education and SADTU, of course take the opposite position and oppose collaboration schools and ultimately, ultimately oppose a model which of course provides better learning for learners in poor communities in the Western Cape. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, that concludes Interpellation 1. We now move on to Interpellation 2 and I recognise the hon Minister, Minister Maynier.

2. Mr M K Sayed to ask Mr D J Maynier, Minister of Education:

(1) Whether the Herzlia High School in Cape Town is receiving any form of support from his Department;

(2) what oversight responsibility does he and his Department have over the school?

[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker. I think we need to pause for a moment and be honest about what this interpellation is really about. Let us pause for a moment.

It is, and I think it is obvious, it is clearly an attempt to use a school to pivot, to deflect and to draw attention away from the monumental international relations shambles on Russia's invasion of the Ukraine.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: We are all familiar with this issue. [Interjections.] The shambles began with the Minister of International Relations and Cooperation, Naledi Pandor, believe it or not, calling for Russia to withdraw from Ukraine, but then ...[intervenes]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... but then there was an about turn and the National Government fell back on its proclamation of non-alignment, but of course that was before the Lady R political bomb dropped, blowing that claim out of the water.

The fact is that South Africa's warm embrace of Russia is clear and present danger, with our AGOA benefits now teetering on the brink and thousands of jobs on the line in the Western Cape. That is the real issue. That is what this interpellation is really about.

Of course ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, hon member. Hon Minister, if you could just take your seat. What is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Point of order, hon Deputy Speaker. The interpellation is based on a question. The hon MEC has failed to answer the question.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): He is speaking about Russia and Ukraine. What has it got to with Russia and Ukraine? Stick to responding to

the question. [Interjections.] If he is embarrassed about the DA's stance in supporting apartheid Israel ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... then he must tell us that he is embarrassed ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... and the he wants to isolate ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... the Russia and Ukraine issue and comes and preys on that. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I note relevance, but I am still not here to judge the Minister's response, but the Minister does know there is a Rule around relevance. [Interjections.] So I caution just on that matter. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, the hon member needs to be patient, but of course the real issue is Russia and the Ukraine. [Interjections.] Of course the hon member knows all independent

schools are required to follow the regulations relating to registration of and subsidies to independent schools.

Support provided to independent schools is largely related to curriculum assessment and examination matters. The school in question receives such support, but it does not receive a financial subsidy from our Department, but the fact is, hon Deputy Speaker, no amount of pivoting, deflecting, zigzagging or pirouetting will draw attention away from the monumental international relations shambles on Russia's invasion of the Ukraine. [Interjections.]

It is extraordinary that a person like the hon member who professes to care about human rights, especially the rights of our children, would support a country whose leader has been charged with the forced relocation of ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... 16 000 children. [Interjections.] So I will take this opportunity to ask the hon member a question. Does he support Vladimir Putin, yes or no? And given the fact that he was posing for selfies with the Russian Consul-General Aleksei Malenko, and celebrating Russia's National Day a few days ago, [Interjections.] I think we already know the answer to the question. [Interjections.] The hon member Khalid Sayed is undoubtedly ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... another Vladimir Putin's ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... fan boy. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise the hon member Sayed. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I hope ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, if you can just take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon members on both sides of the House, could we have some order, please, so that we can continue with the interpellation. [Interjections.] Hon member Bakubaku-Vos, hon member Bans, everybody, please. Thank you. I see you, hon member Bakubaku-Vos. No, it is hon member Bans, yes. You may proceed. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I hope that the hon Minister Maynier is ready with their LEAP officers to effect

their laughable arrest of the Russian President ...[intervenes]

An HON MEMBER: We are ready! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... and just to indicate, the African National Congress's position on the issue of Russia and Ukraine is the same as that of National Government and he knows it full well.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members, order!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Three weeks ago, three weeks ago in an interview with Ms Lidar Grave-Lazi ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Bakubaku-Vos, now it is you. You may [Interjections.] – I know, but I cannot hear the hon member Sayed. I cannot hear him. You may proceed, hon member Sayed. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Three weeks ago, hon Deputy Speaker, in an interview with Ms Lidar Grave-Lazi of the ILTV Israel News, Mr Geoff Cohen, the Director of Education, and Mr Andries van Renssen, the executive director at Herzlia High School in Cape Town, confirmed the school's strong relations to political Zionism and the apartheid state of Israel.

An HON MEMBER: Jôh!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): But obviously for the DA if it is an apartheid state it does not matter because they are protectors of the apartheid legacy. Some of them we know fought in the apartheid Defence Force and were in the Air Force.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I am not going to mention the name here, but we know he is in this House. [Interjections.]

In response to a question as to why it is important for the learners to maintain a strong connection to Israel, Mr Van Renssen said:

"What we find is that quite a large portion of our matriculants after the final year of schooling are going to Israel. At the moment 22% of our pupils go to Israel the year after school, either to study or go to the army. So that connection is a very real one and we are trying to make it practical."

It is critical that we recognise the power and influence of educational institutions in shaping young minds and moulding our leaders. By maintaining ties with the apartheid state of Israel, schools in the Western Cape risk compromising their integrity and undermining the values that they seek to impart.

Israel's policies towards the Palestinian people have long been subject of international concern and scrutiny. The Israeli Government's ongoing illegal occupation of Palestinian territories, expansion of illegal settlements – yes, 1967, post '67 occupation is considered illegal. [Interjections.] Read the United Nations resolutions, and violation of human rights have been extensively documented by numerous human rights organisations.

The UN and various countries have condemned these actions, recognising them as obstacles to peace and justice in the region. It is distressing to learn that schools in our province meant to foster critical thinking, empathy and a commitment to justice, are associated with a regime and military that inflict such injustice.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Sayed. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Interjections.] I now recognise the hon member Baartman. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Given that the Minister has indicated that the respective school does not receive financial support from the Department, I do note that in Programme 3 of this year's 2023 budget, pages 187 to 189 in case Hansard wanted to know, deal with the Independent School Subsidies Programme in the Western Cape, with

the purpose stating, quote:

"To support independent schools in accordance with the South Africa Schools Act."

And sets aside R152 million for the programme. To note that is about 0,5% of the total Education Budget, hon Deputy Speaker, of R29 billion, and this is in comparison to the R20 billion of the R29 billion budget, or approximately 69,85% of the budget that is being set aside for the Public Ordinary Schools Programme.

So given this, I wanted to find out how are these funds then supporting independent schools in the Western Cape per the requirements of the South African Schools Act? I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Baartman. I recognise the hon member Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, it is an insult to watch this DA Government act innocent in condemning a war in Ukraine, but they are doing absolutely nothing with regards to the specific school which is aligned with the apartheid state of Israel and which encourages and teaches its learners to partake in apartheid.

Section 46 of the South African Schools Act gives the MEC the power to

determine grounds on which the registration of independent schools may be granted or withdrawn by this HOD. So here we already establish that the Department could register and then also deregister any independent school.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it is very clear and it is done publicly on the school's website and social media pages, that they encourage their students to go to Israel to join the army and it is something very dear to them and that they encourage yearly.

So with this being said, hon Deputy Speaker, what I want to know from the Minister, through you, hon Deputy Speaker, and also as a reminder of how the Premier also plan to utilise LEAP officers on Putin, I would like to know from the Minister, hon Deputy Speaker, will the Minister's Department deregister the school based on the fact that it is pro-Israel and that it engages in politics which are inhumane and which encourages learners to ~~in~~ condone apartheid? What is the Minister going to do about this issue? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon member Christians. [Interjections.]

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I believe it is absolutely shameful that a question like this is posed in this House. [Interjections.] This school, Herzlia ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: ... is doing exceptionally well with a 100% pass rate and over 95% obtaining university exemption. [Interjections.]

Now, hon Deputy Speaker, let me put it on record, let me put this on record ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: That the ACDP supports Israel and we support Israel and they have got a right to defend themselves. [Interjections.] They have got a right to defend themselves.

Mr P J MARAIS: Hear-hear!

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: I want to state on record this ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: ... this is an independent school that does exceedingly well and the ANC will stoop so low to bring it to this House. [Interjections.] Why? Why? Do not use ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: ... school children, do not use school children in order for your political agenda. [Interjections.] You have no place ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: ... you have no right ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Just stop the clock. [Interjections.] Hon member Christians, just take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon members, can I have your order, please. If I can just have your attention. Remember that you cannot tell other people to say things you do not want to hear. It is the ACDP's response and we need to honour that. It is his response. [Interjections.]

So, please, you must also allow him to speak so that I can hear him. So, hon member Christians, you may proceed. [Interjections.]

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I had the privilege to visit the school not so long ago. I will go back and learn from them how do we improve our education system, because they are an example. I thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians. I now recognise the hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I am not surprised by the hon member Christian's response. He will also learn from them how to go and assist the murderous Israeli soldiers because the defender [Inaudible.] has yet again, like he has supported the homophobes, he is now also supporting the racist apartheid state and their military, and we are not surprised that the DA is in a Moonshot coalition with the ACDP. They are both on the right of our political spectrum.

MEC Maynier's response is typical of the DA when it comes to dealing with the promotion of racism and oppression. The DA simply takes a pedestrian approach on such matters and wants to shift the goalpost. Moreover this particular school's ties with Israel risk creating an environment of exclusion and discomfort for students who sympathise with the plight of the Palestinian people.

In 2018 when hon member Christians was a member of this House, a storm erupted at the school after the two students went down on one knee in protest of the treatment of Palestinians, during the playing of the Israeli National Anthem at Herzlia High. The students were themselves Jewish and believed that the gesture first introduced in 2016 to draw attention to police brutality and racial inequality in the US, was appropriate. It was an appropriate form of protest against Israel's illegal occupation of Palestinian territories and aggression against innocent people.

In fact, in this year alone 158 innocent Palestinians have been killed by the Israeli regime. In response to the protest the same Mr Geoff Cohen of the school said the boys' protests were embarrassing, inappropriate and it brought the school into disrepute. As a result of their protest the learners were disciplined by the school. The DA was silent on that, hon member Christians was silent on that.

In 2016 Daniel Linde, a lawyer with Equal Education Law Society, yes, our allies, MEC Maynier, a Herzlia alumnus, briefly mentioned the occupation when addressing the learners. Principal Marc Falconer objected to Linde's reference to Palestinian human rights and assured parents that the school would immediately enforce a more rigorous process of vetting future speakers at the school.

Schools should be safe spaces for all students irrespective of their backgrounds or beliefs or their perspectives. By endorsing partnerships with Israel, by silencing those who are critical of Israeli oppression, Herzlia is marginalising and silencing even some of its own learners ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... and those who have been to the school.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): The ANC trusts that freedom-loving voters ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... will in these elections see through the DA's spin ...[intervenes]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... and unmask their complicity with pro-apartheid indoctrination. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Sayed. Thank you. I now recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. The school is an independent school and we will certainly not be deregistering the school. The real issue, as I have said before, is a desperate attempt on the part of the hon member to pivot, to deflect and to draw attention away from his own party's failings, including what I have called the monumental international shambles on Russia's invasion of Ukraine. [Interjections.]

The real insult here is that a person who professes to care about human rights

would support a country whose leader has been charged with the forced relocation of 16 000 children. The real insult here, hon Deputy Speaker, the real insult here and it is disgraceful that members of the Opposition would be partying up the storm with Consul-General Aleksei Malenko, in the middle, in the middle of Russia's devastating war of aggression in Ukraine and it is indeed shameful, shameful that this hon member has used a school to play politics here in the Western Cape. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. That brings us to the end of Interpellation 2. We now move over to Interpellation 3. I recognise the hon Minister Allen.

3. Ms A P Bans to ask Mr R I Allen, Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety:

In respect of the Police Recorded Crime Statistics for the fourth quarter of the 2022/23 financial year:

(a) What are the police interventions that led to the reduction in the murder rate when compared to the same period last year and (b) what role did communities and other community crime fighting structures play towards the reduction?

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much, hon Deputy Speaker. I wish to thank hon member Bans for this particular interpellation. The reply that I have received from the

South African Police Services reads as follows:

"The contributing stations were identified and the root cause analysis conducted to determine causative factors. Some of the causative factors for murder were arguments, misunderstandings, road rage, provocation, retaliation, revenge, punishment, gang-related, mob justice and robbery.

- Increased and targeted police operations were implemented leading to an increase in the recovery of firearms, which are the main instruments utilised in murder, and the increase in arrest of suspects wanted for murder.
- Intensified community and stakeholder engagements to discourage mob justice."

Part (b):

"Community mobilisation with community policing forums increase visibility through deployment of Neighbourhood Watches, Community In Blue patrollers, and other community stakeholders.

- Community awareness initiatives such as Community Outreach, public education and crime awareness campaigns were enhanced through the participation of these structures."

Hon Deputy Speaker, it will be remiss of me also to not mention a quote from General Matakata yesterday during a SCOPA meeting. I then relayed this particular quote in the Standing Committee as well and I was saddened that

there was only one particular ANC member in that SCOPA meeting. However, I do want to, for the record, once again say thank you to the Chairperson for the manner in which he has conducted the SCOPA meeting yesterday, where we, as a department, could present on the successes and the challenges of the LEAP programme, but we could also share a number of data-related information with regards to LEAP, but let me quote General Matakata:

"LEAP has helped us. We work with LEAP and of course they are increased boots on the ground and it is something that we highly appreciate. We have seen arrests and recovery of firearms that could have been used in robberies and murders. So it is good that we are working with LEAP. They understand the community because they have been well-orientated. I think we need this kind of cooperation between the police, the Western Cape Government and the City of Cape Town to continue."

He goes on to say:

"This can only strengthen so that we can continue to see these successes."

That particular quote was also, for the record, relayed during our SCOPA meeting yesterday and again, for the record, twice for the record, I want to say to the Chairperson thank you for the manner in which he has conducted

SCAPE yesterday. We take that Committee very seriously and the challenges we could ventilate, we could discuss and we could get input, but also we could share all the successes since the implementation of the LEAP programme.

So the successes we are seeing when murder is increasing across our country by 3,8% in the last quarter, here in our province we are seeing a 14,1% reduction and it is because of that collaboration. A concerted effort to ensure that we work together and that we ultimately see crime being reduced. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise the hon member Bans. Before you rise, hon member Bans, do you have a point of order hon member?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Yes, just a point of correction, hon Deputy Speaker. The Minister obviously he is correct, a very good presentation, but also he is incorrect in saying that there was only one member, because there is only one member of the ANC, the other alternate member is out of the country, she could not attend. So ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mvimbi, but I will rule against the fact that that is not a point of order, but you managed to get that message across without me stopping you. You may move on, hon member Bans. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. [Interjections.] No-no-no, no

more.

Mr L L MVIMBI: For you information she is in Tanzania. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, it is fine. Thank you very much. Hon member Bans ...[intervenes]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Political mission.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No-no, hon member Mvimbi. Do not even answer him. [Interjections.] There we go.

Ms A BANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you.

Ms A BANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I rise today to commend the South African Police Service (SAPS) and celebrate its remarkable achievement in reducing crime levels, in particular the murder rate. It is my honour to share with you that the murder rate in the Western Cape for the fourth quarter 2022/2023 financial year decreased by a whopping 14,1%.

The Western Cape has long been plagued by a high incidence of violent crimes with a murder rate reaching alarming levels. SAPS have always been blamed for this and so it is only fair that we give them all the credit they

deserve.

According to the police recorded crime stats for the quarter January to March 2023, the Western Cape had eight police stations in the top 30 stations, and four of these recorded significant reduction in murder rate, including Harare, Khayelitsha, Kraaifontein and Mfuleni. This reduction is a testament to the unwavering commitment, hard work, professionalism and strategic planning, and diligent execution of such plans by our men and women in blue, and other community crime fighting structures.

We must give General Phathekile his flowers. He is doing a great job and deserves all the credit. In our recent engagement about decreased murders he credited the communities who played a pivotal role and made special efforts to combat crime, especially the Khayelitsha and Nyanga cluster. The great teamwork between the police and all other crime fighting stakeholders is what made the difference. He also commended the Minister of Police, Bheki Cele, for playing a pivotal role by deploying additional police officers from other provinces to the Western Cape.

We must acknowledge that the LEAP officers as force multipliers also assisted, if they were to be used correctly and not as J P Smith and the DA's private army. There is a lot we could achieve as a province.

I therefore wish to ask the MEC what are his plans and programmes to support SAPS and to maintain this reduction in the murder rate in the

province? I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the hon member Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I firstly just want to thank the Minister for the respective reply that he has relayed from SAPS. I do find it interesting that the reply specifically makes no mention of LEAP, of Rural Safety units, of K9 units, of the peace officers, the Neighbourhood and Farm Watches, or any of the other institutions and initiatives implemented by the Provincial Minister's own Department against crime.

The only mention of it in the Minister's response was regarding the recent meeting engagement that he had and we know from the crime statistics mentioned in the question that the Western Cape was one of only three provinces to reduce incidences of murder on a year-to-year basis. We also know that with a 14,1% reduction in murder, the Western Cape achieved the largest reduction in South Africa.

So my question to the Minister is thus whether the worsening state of crime outside the Western Cape and the well-known lack of resources provided to SAPS within the Western Cape, provided by National Government, would the Western Cape's progress in combating violent crime have been possible without the initiatives of the Minister's Provincial Department? I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Baartman. I recognise hon member Christians.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, when it comes to one murder, one murder is too many. So what I am saying is although there is a reduction, I am sure the Minister will agree with me that one murder is too many, but we know that it is an integrated approach. SAPS plays a role, with the LEAP officers, with the Neighbourhood Watches, with the CPFs. That is the approach that we must use, but the ACDP is always very strong on the Neighbourhood Watches. It is people staying in the community, working in the community, knowing what is happening. That is number one.

Number two, we spoke about it last week. I still am a firm believer that the Walking Bus was of great help getting our learners to school and to home.

The last thing that I want to say, hon Deputy Speaker, is that if we play politics about this it is not a good thing. We are speaking about people's lives at stake and everybody should contribute to make sure that this is a safe city and a safe province. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Christians. I recognise the hon member Bans. [Interjections.]

Ms A BANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, the success of SAPS in reducing the murder rate is a testament of effective partnerships between local communities, various spheres of government and safety stakeholders. This achievement demonstrates the power of partnerships and the importance of putting communities at the centre of crimefighting.

While the DA made concerted efforts of frustrating and destabilizing CPFs, SAPS strives to establish strong relations with communities through community engagements. Our police strive to build trust, foster dialogue and encourage community members to actively participate in crime prevention initiatives.

We are aware that behind every statistic there are people's lives lost to crime. These include the likes of Michael Lukhubene, the former Chippa United and Royal AM coach, who was shot dead with another victim in Site C over the past weekend. We convey our sincerest condolences to the families and call upon SAPS to leave no stone unturned to bring the perpetrators to book.

It is also true, however, that behind the same statistics there are lives saved, futures protected and families preserved. The reduced murder rate in the province is a clear indication that the hard work of SAPS has not been in vain, hon Deputy Speaker.

General Phathekile attributes his success to the fact that he had dedicated focus on community participation and support of community patrollers;

community awareness; special focus on drugs and illegal firearms that we have seen; crime prevention operations from Thursday to Monday morning, focusing on hotspots; dealing with illegal liquor traders, and spiritual crime prevention, and school safety campaigns, amongst others.

SAPS had various proactive strategies and are finally yielding significant results. Increased visibility through foot patrols and the deployment of additional resources to high crime areas have not only deterred criminals, but also reassured law abiding citizens.

The fight against crime is an ongoing battle, hon Deputy Speaker, and there is still much work to be done. The SAPS will continue to face numerous challenges, including resource constraints and under-resourcing of crime intelligence, amongst others. Instead of making frivolous calls for devolution of policing powers in the DA, we can support SAPS efforts. We commend SAPS for its sterling job. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the Minister, Minister Allen. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much, hon Deputy Speaker. I highly appreciate the input. I will attend to the input as per the comments that were received, but, hon Deputy Speaker, I feel encouraged, hon Deputy Speaker, in the fact that SAPS is finally yielding the successes. From day one in this particular role I

have made it very clear, our oversight must lead to better service delivery. Our oversight must lead to improved service delivery, otherwise I will be failing.

So I want to say thank you, hon member Bans, for acknowledging that SAPS is finally seeing some successes. Thank you that that is in the record, because otherwise I would not be doing my job, but I will be the first one to say it is not merely one department, it is an integrated approach.

So I do want to again stress and the comments that hon member Christians [Interjections.] – we are very clear. We collaborate, we foster working relationships, we hold each other accountable so that we can see these successes and in this role I will continue to do that. So thank you so much, hon member Christians, for your input as well. I can confirm as well that we have already sent the communication to all the municipalities with regards to their interventions, specifically with the Walking Bus.

I want to thank hon member Baartman, thank you for asking that deliberate question as well, on what we are doing on our side because it is when we are stepping up, when we are stepping in, knowing that our dedicated SAPS officers, men and women in blue – sadly over the last week we lost two officers off duty and we have conveyed our sincere condolences to SAPS, to the broader community as well. They are risking their lives. SAPS members themselves are aware that they are 20 years behind in terms of the allocation of SAPS officers that we need.

I meet with General Phathekile on a weekly basis. So when quotes are selected from General Phathekile, I can say quotes that they have said to me directly on how we are holding each other accountable, how we are working together, where we are wanting to strengthen the hand of the South African Police Service, and how appreciative the National Minister and our Provincial Commissioner here is for the interventions and the help from this Western Cape Government. It is for the record as well.

So on K9, we will continue to invest in our K9 units. We are seeing amazing success across the Swartland as well as in the Overberg area. [Interjections.] We are now branching out to the Mossel Bay area key routes. One specific question and comment that hon member Bans made about a certain politician's army: the Western Cape Government's Safety Plan is built on data and of evidence, and the hon member missed out on the SCOPA meeting, so let me just rehash again how we work.

There is a data-led approach.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: That particular ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... hon member, please take your seat. You have

crossed the line, you are actually infringing on the Rules here. As you know, maybe I should remind everybody, that you cannot cross the line when somebody is speaking. [Interjections.] Yes, it is an offence. Please – yes.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Take a seat – yes, hon Minister ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... as you would know that this is a serious offence ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... and not a laughing matter ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... of this House, and I would like you to rule.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja. Please. Hon members, it is about respect and it also is about the respect of the House as it runs in session. So, hon member Sayed, as a Deputy – yes, alright, thank you very much. Your apology is accepted, for the record. You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Our Western Cape Safety Plan and the law enforcement component are based on data and on evidence. The data is very straightforward, but it is also very strategic.

So how it works is we monitor what type of murders, we monitor then where it occurs. The where, which is important, street, place, hotspot areas. We then go into when, day and time of the day. Why, the motives, because there are motives, gang-related motives, there are arguments, misunderstandings. Who, so that we can understand the preventative measures that we need to put in place, the age and the gender. Then how, if it is a gunshot, if it is a sharp object.

So it is very detailed in our approach because this is an internationally recognised policing approach, data-led and evidence-based, so that we can deploy the limited resources where it is most needed so that we can see a 14,1% reduction and we are working with SAPS in that regard. The South African Police Service, with the leadership of this Government, had a joint workshop on data-led and evidence-based approach. So we have seen it.

So the oversight role leading to better service delivery, showing that our oversight is leading to an improved South African Police Service, which ultimately makes it very credible ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... for this Government to call for devolution. Credible that we can show in our oversight it leads to better service delivery, but also ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, your time is up, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... that we will be able to manage and have those powers to see beyond 50% reductions in the murder rate. So thank you so much for the value input.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister, your time is up. Thank you. That brings us to the end of Interpellations. In terms of – hon member Windvogel, do you have a point of order? No? Yes?

†Me R WINDVOGEL: Dankie, agb Adjunkspeaker. Ek wil net weet of die agb Minister bereid is om 'n vraag te beantwoord ...[Tussenwerpsels.]

[Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I just want to know if the hon Minister is prepared to answer a question ...[Interjections.]]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dit is nou 'n bietjie te, dis 'n bietjie nou ...[Tussenwerpsel.]

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is now a little too, it is now a little... [Interjection.]]

†Me R WINDVOGEL: O, oukei.

[Ms R WINDVOGEL: Oh, okay.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is over the time.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: I just want to check if he is ready, these LEAP officers ready for Putin. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No-no-no, thank you. [Interjections.] We move on, hon members.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
The International Criminal Court ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, sit! [Interjections.] Hon Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP [DA]: Are we moving along with the Order Paper?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, we are definitely moving along with the Order Paper. I am not sure if the rain has somehow made things a little bit fluid.

The CHIEF WHIP [DA]: Hon Deputy Speaker, may I address you?

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The CHIEF WHIP [DA]: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. In terms of the Question Paper for Oral Reply, the first question stands over as the hon member were informed and also agreed to it. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Many thanks, hon Chief Whip. As the Chief Whip has alluded we move over to Questions and just to remind our members that there are four opportunities for follow-up questions, and the hon member who posed the oral question will have the first opportunity for the follow-up. I now recognise the hon Minister Maynier.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

[Question 1 stands over]

1. Mr M K Sayed to ask Mr D J Maynier, Minister of Education:

Who has the power to appoint School Electoral Officers for the establishment and election of School Governing Bodies in public schools?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The

District Director has the power to appoint School Electoral Officers. A school is selected to provide the electoral officer to oversee the elections at another school, and the principal or acting principal of the selected school is thus appointed as the electoral officer. The SEO will receive a letter of appointment from the District Director.

Schools were appointed to provide SEOs for the period from 2021 to 2024.

As per the *Guidelines Relating to the Election of Governing Bodies of Ordinary Public Schools*, the SEO is responsible for conducting all the nominations and elections, as the case may be, of parent, educator and non-educator members to the governing body of a school designated by the District Electoral Officer.

A principal may not act as SEO for the designation of election of members of the governing body at his or her particular school, owing to the fact that the principal is already a member of the SGB of his or her school.

An SEO may only be appointed for one school and may not be twinned with another school, meaning that the principals of two schools may not be the SEO of each other's schools. Of course a principal may also not act as the SEO at a school where his or her child attends or indeed is enrolled. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon member Sayed, do you

have a follow-up?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, and my thanks to the hon Minister for the response. According to Regulation 10.1 of the *Provincial Gazette Extraordinary* 8390 of 19 February 2021, it says that:

"Procedures for the establishment and election of governing bodies at public schools, that the District Director appoints a principal or second in charge if needed."

And it aligns what the Minister has said:

"Of another school, or if the case may be a circuit manager of the relevant district office in writing as the School Electoral Officer."

I therefore would like to seek clarity from the hon MEC as to whether this was done for the appointment of the Electoral Officer to preside over the School Governing Body's bi-elections at the Heathfield High School on 29 May 2023, and if so, can the MEC provide us with the letter of appointment? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon member. I am not

familiar with all the details of the case in question, but I am aware that the Department is providing advice to the relevant School Governing Body on the correct procedures for the election, particularly of additional SGB members. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise hon member Sayed and then hon member Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, and my thanks to the hon Minister for the response. We will most certainly be pushing further, because I am in possession currently of a letter that has been sent by Mr Colin Davids, the acting principal of Heathfield High, to Mrs De Stadler, the principal of Steenberg High School, on 16 March 2023, informing her that she has been appointed as the Heathfield High's Electoral Officer for the school's SGB bi-election.

It is thus clear that if the District Director had indeed written to Mrs De Stadler then there would not be a need for Mr Davids to also write to her, hon Deputy Speaker.

I therefore want to understand from the MEC whether he agrees that this was procedurally flawed and in contravention of the *Gazette* which I mentioned in my first follow-up, and if so, what remedial steps will be taken?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister.

The DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon member. Again I am not familiar with all the particulars of this matter, but I can assure the hon member that we are providing advice to the School Governing Body on the correct procedures again, so that in respect of the election of additional members to the SGB to which he refers.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I wanted to find out, given that the Minister has indicated that he has been providing advice to the school and SGB, whether the Minister can also indicate whether there has been an update on the current activities to support teaching and learning at the respective Heathfield High School?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon member. Yes, I can assure the hon member that our Grade 8s, our Grade 10s and Grade 12 learners at the school are participating on our Back On Track Programme with extra classes, and in addition to that our Grade 12s are also attending an intervention programme set up by the deputy principal to boost and improve performance.

Grade 12 learners are also part of a mentorship programme, which I have spoken about at length previously in this House. Each matric is assigned to a teacher who will ensure that learners have the support they need to succeed. Mentors work with the learners to ensure that they have a study timetable and are studying regularly. They are assisted with setting of tasks for each subject and submit all their assignments and tasks, and the mentors of course keep in touch with the matric parents.

I believe that the school will also be supporting Youth Day tomorrow, playing rugby and netball at an event organised by Cool Play, and so I think that there is much to be celebrated at Heathfield High School and the people that want it to succeed, and certainly we are going to support the acting principal's effort as the school community moves forward. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I want to welcome some of the interventions that have been made in terms of teaching, but unfortunately they have not really been reflecting in the results that we are seeing or not seeing at the school, but we all hope that these interventions do succeed.

Just based on the Minister's, his response to my particular question and the fact that he now says that he is not aware and – but if the Minister ought to

be made aware and if the facts, as we have stated them, are indeed going to be in his possession, then if the Minister then based on that agrees that the process followed for the SGB bi-election was indeed flawed, then will he agree to the demands of parents to, number one, institute an investigation against the conduct of Mr Davids, and number two, for the election process to be repeated as the one followed was flawed? I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Over to you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Again, hon Deputy Speaker, I can only assure the hon member again that we are indeed providing advice to the School Governing Body so that they follow the correct procedures for the election of additional members to the SGB. That work is already underway. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. That brings us to the end of Question 2. We move over to Question 3, hon Minister Mackenzie.

3. Mr L L Mvimbi to ask Mr R D Mackenzie, Minister of Mobility:

With regard to the Mitchells Plain tragic crash on 30 May 2023 that claimed lives of learners on their way to school:

(a) What measures are in place to ensure the safety of learners on the roads and (b) what interventions will his Department put in place to ensure that all learner-transport vehicles are roadworthy and that the

drivers abide by the rules of the road?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, thank you, hon member Mvimbi for this question. As the Minister responsible for mobility in the province I want to convey our sincere condolences to the families of the victims, the affected schools and their respective communities. I am under no illusion that we have to take all steps that are considered necessary to put in place the necessary measures to prevent a recurrence of this horrific event.

Nelson Mandela once said:

"There can be no keener revelation of a society's soul than the way it treats its children."

We have to realise that we have a collective responsibility for the safe transportation of learners. This is a polycentric matter with various areas of influence and control. We have to coordinate our actions and legislation to ensure that our children are transported in a safe and dignified manner.

Our biggest challenge in respect of learner transport services is the prevalence of illegal operators. Many of these operators make use of vehicles that do not comply with the required safety standards, or vehicles that are not in a roadworthy condition. I have to point out that the transportation of persons for reward in the goods compartment of a vehicle,

is illegal in terms of Regulation 250 of the National Road Traffic Regulations.

The Transport Priority Committee that is jointly chaired by my Department and the South African Police Services, ensures that there is coordination between various stakeholders in respect of public transport enforcement. There are regular integrated/joint law enforcement operations where illegal vehicles are impounded. Suffice to say, we will increase our support for this.

We have also asked traffic officers to use their respective powers in terms of Section 3 of the National Road Traffic Act (Act no 93 of 1996) to direct any motor vehicle used for the transportation of learners, whether legal or illegal, that are not considered to be in a roadworthy condition for a testing or for inspection, examination or testing, or that that operation of that vehicle be discontinued with immediate effect if it poses a danger to people or property.

I want to point out that we only issue operating licences to vehicles that comply with the safety specifications enshrined in the National Road Traffic Act and associated Regulations (as amended). We have a duty to ensure that the vehicle or vehicle type used for the operation of the service, is suitable that purpose.

A legal operator is also vetted by the regulatory entities to ensure that he or she does not have any previous convictions for an offence related to the operation of that service and is able to provide the service in a manner

satisfactory to the public. A number of generic and mode-specific conditions are also imposed on all learner transport operating licences to ensure that learners are transported in a dignified manner and that the vehicle and the service comply with the provisions of the National Road Traffic Act and associated Regulations.

Where the conditions of an operating licence are violated, the regulatory entity may withdraw or suspend the operating licence.

Point (b) of the hon member's question. As mentioned we, through the National Priority Committee, requested all transport agencies to be on the lookout for illegal learner transport vehicles, vehicles that are not in a roadworthy condition or vehicles that do not comply with the required safety standards in place for that mode of transport.

These vehicles must either be impounded, directed to go to a testing station for examination of the operation and that vehicle must be discontinued temporarily until the defects have been remedied.

Before operating licences are issued, the vehicles are also physically inspected by traffic officials to determine compliance with requisite safety standards and to identify ongoing glaring defects. The operator must also produce proof that the vehicle is in a roadworthy condition and is properly registered and licensed before an operating licence is issued.

Various stakeholders have a role to play to ensure that drivers abide by the rules of the road and comply with the operating licence conditions. We are in the process of producing posters and other social media material that will outline the legal requirements to provide learner transport services. As part of our continued focus on learner transport services, we wish to continue working with the Western Cape Department of Education and we will also engage School Governing Bodies and parents to have conversations about learner transport.

We will use this platform to educate parents on the legal requirements, to caution them not to allow their children to be transported in the goods compartment of vehicles.

We also have regular engagement with learner transport operators and representative structures to capacitate them on the requirements in respect of transport of learner services. We also impress upon them that the safety of our learners is our primary responsibility and consideration, and they have a duty to exercise proper control over their drivers. Ultimately they will be held vicariously liable for the conduct of their drivers. They also have a duty in terms of the law to use drivers that are properly qualified.

We also have regular engagement with the Western Cape Department of Education. It is important that schools also monitor the conduct of these service providers and to provide feedback where appropriate. There needs to be regular debriefing sessions with learners to determine if there are any

challenges in terms of the conduct of drivers or the condition of vehicles. This information must be forwarded to the regulatory entities to take the necessary remedial action.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the answer was particularly long, to ensure that we cover all bases in terms of the law. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon member Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you very much to the hon Minister for such a very comprehensive and long response, and also let me actually join the Minister in sending condolences to the bereaved family because the event was very, very tragic, and also bearing in mind that it is actually not the first time that such incidents have occurred on our roads, where scholar transport gets involved in this type accident.

It actually gives the notion that the reality is that officials such as those, particularly under LEAP, are much more interested in arresting President Putin than implementing traffic order and ensuring that drivers transporting people are doing so in minibuses and actually have PDPs.

The Department of Mobility simply have to strongly insist that drivers are driving the proper vehicle and have the requisite PDP licences. In view of this, hon Deputy Speaker, can the Minister indicate whether the driver

involved in the Mitchells Plain crash has a PDP? Whether he had any fines relating to the illegal transportation of children? And if not, can the hon Minister explain why traffic control in Mitchells Plain is not taken seriously? Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon member Mackenzie.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. You know, I would have loved to answer that question, but the hon member brought in Putin in a space where five children lost their lives and it is actually quite sad, and that is my answer to that question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Any further – hon member America?

The D AMERICA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] Minister, I beg your indulgence, in your extensive response to the question you may have touched on the question I am about to ask, but if so I would like you to just reiterate your answer that you stated.

So, hon Minister, given the tragic events that unfolded in Mitchells Plain, has anything changed since that accident that occurred at the time? And what action is the Department encouraging, and what consequences would the Department impose on people transporting people illegally? Thank you. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you for that question. Learner transport operation is probably one of the most difficult thing to do for parents, because people are going through tough times at the moment. I said it before and I will say it again, there is no mother in this world who wake up in the morning and put a child on the back of a bakkie. Times are tough, interest rates are very high, people do not have money, and we are continuing with our operations and I am proud of my colleagues in the City of Cape Town, who again yesterday pulled off a taxi and it was a 16-year old driving that taxi.

The harrowing part of that is that when the law enforcement officers called the parent of that vehicle, the parent was aware of it. The guy who was driving the taxi was a son of a grown man who willingly gave that child that taxi to drive with children in it, and it is heartbreaking that people are so irresponsible, and I am proud of my colleagues in the City and law enforcement who have continued and increasing the operations to remove these illegal operators off the road because they are the danger to our children. Illegal operators who wake up the morning, put children in their vehicles. A man willingly gave his 16-year old son a taxi to drive. It is ridiculous.

So yes, sir, we are doing increasing operations and through our coordination

with the learner transport operations my Department will work with those individuals that want to change, that want to apply for permits and that want to legally and legitimately transport children.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon member De Villiers.

Mr P DE VILLIERS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. We have to pose these questions. Why is it that 30 years after the birth of our democracy there are still children that live 4,6 kilometres from their schools and why do their parents resort to allowing them to be transported illegally?

Number two, why are our schools in these areas not providing school transport, or at the very least providing parents with details of transport services that are approved and verified by the Department of Education?

Three, why is it that after all this time the divide between the haves and the have nots in Cape Town is still of a nature that whilst members of one group ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member De Villiers, my apologies for interrupting you. You are only allowed to give one question.

Mr P DE VILLIERS: Only one? Sorry.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So choose which one.

Mr P DE VILLIERS: The first one, please.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The first one? And ... if you just want to repeat the first one ...[Interjections.]

Mr P DE VILLIERS: I can repeat it, I can repeat the question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, please just repeat it, thank you.

Mr P DE VILLIERS: Why is it that 30 years after the birth of our democracy there are still children that live 4,6 kilometres from the schools and why do their parents resort to allowing them to be transported illegally?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Many thanks. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I wish every child could live a kilometre from the school, I wish every child can live 500 metres from the school. So to ask why do children still live 4,6 kilometres from the school, it is how long is a piece of string? Because I wish I could have an own school for my child at home, but I cannot. That is the reality of most societies in the world. South Africa is not unique, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon member Mvimbi, over

to you, the last opportunity.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I really would like you also to assist us in holding the Executive to account. In other words, when we ask questions we expect answers. We do not actually expect them to ridicule the questions that we are actually asking, and we will rely on you, hon Deputy Speaker, to direct them accordingly, because you are also supposed to be assisting us.

So I am going to again ask the question I have asked. Can the Minister indicate whether the driver involved in the Mitchells Plain crash has a PDP, whether he had any fines relating to the illegal transportation of children? And if not, can he explain why traffic control in Mitchells Plain is not taken seriously by his Department?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: If the hon member earlier on did not bring Vladimir Putin into a conversation where children are busy dying, I would have answered that question clearly to him, but during a straight question about the death of five children he brought in Vladimir Putin. That is not

holding the Executive to account. That is not so. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Answer the question.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: On his question that he is asking, the hon member knows the gentleman was in court this morning. The matter is currently being investigated by SAPS. I think it is his third appearance today and I am sure that is the reason he is asking the question, but he would have followed the court proceedings and we will certainly, once the matter has been concluded, he will get more information on that, but I think on his last part is probably the most important point.

We are taking public transport seriously, that is exactly why yesterday the taxi that was stopped, but in context a Condor, not a normal taxi, you know, but it is still a taxi, the seven seater. It was stopped because we take enforcement seriously.

The hon member, through his colleagues in the City of Cape Town, the information is readily available, the amount of roadblocks, stops, enforcement, joined ops that was published on Facebook, 42, I think, last week. Another 32 two weeks ago, by the City of Cape Town's Mayco member responsible for law enforcement, it is on his Facebook page. It is readily available for anyone who wants to see, and the councillors can also ask those questions to the City of Cape Town, but we will get those answers for him as well if he wants us to do it. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. That brings us to the end of Question 3. We now move over to Question 4. I recognise Minister Maynier.

4. Ms A Cassiem to ask Mr D J Maynier, Minister of Education:

Whether he is aware of any school in the province that sends matriculants to join the army in Israel; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. The reply is no.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Cassiem, you want any follow-ups on that matter?

Ms A CASSIEM: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I am not sure if the Minister finds the issue of Palestine is a joke to say no, knowing that for the past few minutes we spoke about that in the Interpellations, I clearly stated that as well, but being as it may, hon Deputy Speaker, it is clear that the DA and the Minister in his response are in full support of Israel and of thousands of innocent Palestinians being killed daily, and that he has no intention of dealing with a school that encourages apartheid and murder.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it is of no use to debate with such a Minister who finds

absolutely nothing wrong with the encouragement of criminality, because by not taking action or doing anything means that this DA and this Minister would then be guilty of abetting and aiding acts of criminality. [Interjections.]

So my question to the Minister, hon Deputy Speaker, seeing that he cannot even utter a word of support to the oppressed in Palestine, does this mean that the Minister is okay with what is happening at the school in terms of sending the learners to Israel? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Cassiem. In future just keep your questions succinct. Over to you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. It is obviously not worthwhile debating with this hon member. The hon member put a question, I replied to the question and the reply remains the same. The answer to that question is no.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there – hon member Baartman, over to you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I wanted to find out given the type of claims about sending children overseas, whether the hon Minister is perhaps aware of a plan to send South African children to Russia?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Indeed, I think hon members in this House would be surprised, given the fact that the International Court is trying to bring Vladimir Putin to justice for the abduction of children, that the ANC-led National Government is arranging to send children from South Africa to Russia in November. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is in order. What is wrong with that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The paperwork I have seen on this visit, makes alarming references to training in the use of surveillance equipment, protecting information against internal threats. Sending our children to a country currently engaged in a war ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...and accused of child abduction, is surely not something that can be sanctioned. And I, of course, have informed National Government that our Department will not participate in any of these programmes. Thank you. [Interjections.]

[The Speaker takes the Chair]

The SPEAKER: Are there any follow-ups? Hon Mvimbi?

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Yes, no, I will go to Russia any time I want.
...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Do not go!

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): *Ja*, any time. Russia is when the apartheid government was killing people like flies, it was Russia that came with us and supported us. So, any time we have an opportunity to go to Russia, we will go. [Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): You are doing your own ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members! Hon member Mvimbi, can I just remind you that it is a question.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Russia has got no history of killing innocent Black people and of oppressing innocent Black people and killing ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, what is your question?

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): ...them like flies in apartheid.

The SPEAKER: Just pose your question.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): *Ja* ...[Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Who killed people with cholera?

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Hon Speaker, I am glad that you are actually back in the House because we are observing a trend that now when the hon members of this side are asking questions ...[Interjections.] – when the hon members of this side are asking questions, the Executive either does not answer those questions or they ridicule them. But when the hon members of their own political party question, they give lengthy answers.

The SPEAKER: Okay, hon Mvimbi ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): So, I would like ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Can you please ask your question.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): No, I am asking that why are they not actually responding to questions that we are asking from this side?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: It was replied.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you ...[Interjections.] Thank you, hon Speaker. There is a very obvious answer. The hon members on my left have asked excellent questions and therefore ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...they get comprehensive replies.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. The last follow-up question, hon Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Hon Speaker, mine is on a point of order. Is it not misleading for the hon Minister to say that he does not know that students from that school are being sent to the Israeli army when we spoke about it in Interpellations. [Interjections.] His response – you were not here, hon Speaker. [Interjections.] His response was he does not know about it.

An HON MEMBER: How can you ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Cassiem. That is a point for debate. I am not going to rule on that because it is content and I do not have the content and context with me, but I suppose that is the question that I will accept. Hon Minister, if that was a point of order with a question. So, I am not going

to allow you to respond unless hon Cassiem indicates to me that that is, in fact, a question to the hon Minister and not a point of order.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Cassiem, can you please ...[Interjection.] Hon Cassiem, can you please rise and put your microphone on.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Hon Speaker, the hon Minister in his response to me, misled the House by saying he does not know about the issue. That is misleading. Am I right? Would you not see this as misleading? [Interjections.] We spoke about it for over four minutes.

The SPEAKER: Alright. Hon Cassiem, we must not confuse the two issues here. You rose on a point of order saying that the hon Minister is misleading the House. I then ruled that I cannot, on the context or content, make a ruling. Then, the hon Minister was ready to respond. So, I am asking are you putting that to the hon Minister as a question and then, the hon Minister can respond. So, I am asking you, is that a question to the hon Minister because that was the last opportunity for a follow-up.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): He responded with a [Inaudible – microphone off.]

The SPEAKER: Okay, so then that, in fact, is then not a question, hon Minister. That is a point of order and I have ruled. Hon members, are there

any follow-ups for the final opportunity? No follow-ups. That brings us to the end of Question 4. We now move on to Question 5. I see and recognise the hon Mackenzie.

2. Mr C F Christians to ask Mr R D Mackenzie, Minister of Mobility:

- (1) Whether the vehicles used for learner transport are subject to annual roadworthy inspections; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) Whether the drivers of learner-transport vehicles are tested and vetted before they are allowed to transport learners; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Speaker. Thank you, hon Christians, for the question. The period of validity of a roadworthy certificate is prescribed in Regulation 145(1) of the National Road Traffic Regulations (as amended).

In terms of this Regulation, the roadworthy certificate issued in respect of a motor vehicle shall be valid from the date of issue thereof, until the date on which the licence disc issued in respect of the vehicle concerned becomes null and void. However, in the case of a bus, the validity period of the roadworthy certification shall be six months. This effectively means that only buses have to be presented for roadworthy certification every six

months. All other vehicles contemplated in Regulation 142(1), including vehicles used for reward, are subjected to annual certification.

It is important for me to point out that our regulatory entity has a process in place to vet the applicant/operator of a learner transport service. In other words, the holder of the operating licence is vetted by the regulatory entity. As part of this process, the regulatory entity will consider whether the applicant has any convictions relevant to the provision of the service and if he or she is able to provide the service in a manner satisfactory to the public.

The holder of the operating licence assumes overall responsibility for the transport business and will be held vicariously liable for any delict by the driver that falls within the scope and duty of his/her employment.

In terms of Regulation 115 of the National Road Traffic Regulations, a professional driving permit shall be held by the driver of a motor vehicle used for the conveyance of persons for reward. To obtain a professional driving permit, a person must hold a valid driving licence, must have been certified as medically fit by a doctor and must not have a criminal record (in the past five years). No person who is the owner or operator of a motor vehicle shall employ or permit any other person to drive that vehicle on a public road unless that person is licenced in accordance with the National Road Traffic Act (Act no.93 of 1996) (see Section 31).

In terms of Regulation 42(1) of the National Land Transport Regulations, an

application to provide learner transport must be accompanied by a letter from the principal or authorised official of the school in question approving the operator and the transport, a copy of which must be kept in the vehicle as well as certified copies of professional driving permits of all drivers that will be used for the service. The requirement for a professional driving permit and driver's licence is also imposed as a condition on the operating licence and the licence may be withdrawn if these requirements are not adhered to.

From the date published by the National Minister in the Government Gazette, all drivers used for learner transport will also have to be submitted for eye and medical tests in addition to the test for a professional driving permit and obtain qualifications in basic first-aid, defensive driving and advanced driving. We will forthwith write to the Minister to enquire about the publication of this notice. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise the hon Christians. Are there any indications of any follow-ups? Hon America?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, as the hon Minister said and thank you, hon Minister, for the answer; there are official regulations in place. The problem that you have also identified previously are the illegal drivers and vehicles.

Now, maybe you should speak to the hon Minister of Education because parents know when their children go to school the vehicles they get into. So,

somehow there must be communication to the parents to say do not use unlicensed vehicles or do not use whatever it is. Because all the outcries are there now, but we can prevent this if parents also play their part by telling them not to allow their children to get into unlicensed vehicles or unroadworthy vehicles.

Do you think that is maybe something that will work? Because you have Law Enforcement, you have all of that, but I think the parents have got an integral role to play in the safety of our learners. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Christians. Yes, indeed, I agree one hundred percent with the sentiment. I have particularly shied away from the parental responsibility blame type of game, if you like, because five parents have lost children. So, I did not want to go into that route for obvious reasons.

But I am mindful, and I agree with you that there has to be more communication, the risks need to be highlighted and I have asked my Department to start working on more posters, more communication, more advertisement because the risk is real. Five parents have lost five children. It should not have happened, but people are going through tough times. We

have to be pragmatic as well.

And I am going to repeat what I said earlier on: there is no parent who deliberately wants to put their children in harms way. Times are tough. People do not have money, but we are doing more communication, hon member Christians. I agree wholeheartedly with you, but as I said, I did not want to do it immediately because I did not want any parent to feel a sense of guilt. But other parents have to be warned and have to be alerted to the real danger of putting children in vehicles not suitable for scholar transport. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon America and then, hon Lekker.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Minister, thank you for your comprehensive response to the question. I am in awe and inspired by all the bases that you covered with your response. Hon Christians has pre-empted part of my question, so I am just going to rephrase it and certainly, hon Minister, I think you will provide a ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon America ...[Interjection.]

Mr D AMERICA (DA): ...a clear response to the question.

The SPEAKER: Can I remind you to pose your question.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): So, hon Minister, what is the role and you have alluded to it, of parents and other people using scholar transport? Have you as a ministry and you as a Minister in particular, thought about other pragmatic measures to address people getting their driver's licences; because you alluded to a 16-year-old driving and certainly, that 16-year-old does not have a licence. Thank you, hon Minister. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon America. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon America. A few weeks ago, hon Speaker, I participated in a colloquium and one of them was – it was the United Nations Child Safety Week – and one of the questions posed – that was before this accident, obviously – what more can one do? Because every year, I think, 1,2-million people die around the world on our roads.

And I actually asked people to just think for a minute. I think all of us have done our driver's licences, but how long have we spent in a car? Honestly, if all of us were to be honest with ourselves. Most of us do one hour of driver's licence per session, ten lessons per hour. Those are ten lessons over a ten-week period if we are lucky, probably, over a three-week period. And I asked the audience, would you let a doctor operate on you that had studied for ten hours? Would you let somebody do a heart transplant on you that had studied for ten hours? But all of us who have done our driver's licences over a period of time, have at minimum, probably maximum, spent 15-hours in a

car, but we drive on the road.

That is a question we have to ask ourselves. Is that really fair on all road users to spend 15 hours on driver's licences, and then we go and pass our tests. I do not know whether 15 hours are enough; I do not know whether a three-month course is enough. I can imagine people would be upset if you told them they must go on a three-month course to get their driver's licence. But would you have somebody operate on you who has done ten hours of training, and I think that is the question we all have to ask ourselves in the long run. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister and just, hon members, just for clarity and for your information: it is hon Lekker and then I have got an indication that hon Kama will be the fourth follow-up. Hon Lekker.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. You know what, that morning I broke down because for me it was very painful. And as a parent, myself, with children that are schooling in Mitchells Plain, from Nyanga first to Mitchells Plain, every morning I witness transport that comes into the township to pick up those learners. That transport is in good shape. The drivers are the correct drivers.

What does not happen, hon Speaker, perhaps the hon members of this House do not understand, what does not happen is to have Law Enforcement officers on the road. Because when they pick up children at our houses, they go

elsewhere in Mitchells Plain and that is where they take out our children from those good-looking taxis and put them into those shady-looking taxis. No parent puts their children in shady-looking transportation. I want this House not to blame parents for something that they are not responsible for. If you carry a child for nine months, you will never risk your child's life and put that child into transport that is shady.

And my question to you, hon Minister, sorry to direct a question to the hon Minister. My question would be is it not possible to have Law Enforcement officers particularly on the routes of Mitchells Plain, on the routes of Gugulethu and Langa, to have Law Enforcement officers policing the learner transport as and when they come out of the townships because that is where the problem is. If that is possible to employ more Law Enforcement officers, what will it take this House from participating in a process of ensuring there are more Law Enforcement officers that are appointed in order to police this kind of industry. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Lekker. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Speaker. There is no-one. I think I deliberately said that while we did not go post that accident to a parent advertising medium was because there is no parent, and I agree with hon member Lekker, and I think I said it as well, there is no parent in this world who wakes up in the morning and says, 'I am putting my child on the back of an un-roadworthy vehicle.'

But the reality is there are bakkies that are not roadworthy. Bakkies are not meant to transport children. That is why it is called a goods vehicle. Bakkies are not meant to transport children! But we are a pragmatic Government in this province, and we have met with the scholar transport operators. We said what more can we, as a Government, do to assist those with vehicles that need permits, not bakkies, vehicles that need to be roadworthy checked and those sorts of things, so we can direct you where to go.

From a Law Enforcement perspective, I agree with hon member Lekker. There has to be more Law Enforcement and that is why yesterday, that Condor taxi was pulled over and when they checked, it was a young man and they further checked. And they checked that no, this young man is too young to have a licence and then, they discovered he was a 16-year-old. That came from an operation in that area. But certainly, I agree with hon member Lekker, there must be continuous Law Enforcement.

But there is also a responsibility on all of us, including hon members of this House, to make sure that when we leave our homes, when we see vehicles that are clearly not meant to transport children, that we need to alert the authorities to that so that that vehicle can be stopped. Phone in. I personally phoned the other day while on Vanguard Drive. I dialled the 082 480 7700 number because I saw something that was not right and I think if we all do that, we can try and curb this issue because I would hate to see what

happened again on that fateful Tuesday morning. It is not going to leave me. It is not a sight to see. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise the hon Kama on the virtual platform.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I think we must refuse to be people that react to events and exactly as, I think, one hon member said it is not the first time that we have these incidents and we have long known that there are these vehicles that the hon Minister is talking about, which are not in good condition to transport learners.

Now, I want to get a clear understanding. I get that the hon Minister is saying they would meet with the operators, but I want to get a clear response as to: does the Department not have a programme to assist those who are illegal operators to become legal and give the necessary support? Because it does not help to meet with these people now just because this has happened, but you do not have in your annual plans, a programme that is going to assist these collateral transport vehicles to become legal and also support them. Because as we do that, we must also measure the issue of many people who are transported to schools and do not have access to other transport and might fall for these illegal operators. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama. Hon Minister, have you got that?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. In fact, what makes it even more heartbreaking, hon Kama, is we met with the scholar transport operators before that accident. I had a meeting with the scholar transport operators at Hazeldene Primary on Friday, two weeks ago, before that accident. That is what makes this so heartbreaking. So, no-one can say they did not know. And the following Friday before – the accident was on Tuesday – the following Friday the Provincial Regulatory Entity staff from my office – because I was stuck in another meeting – went again to meet with them before that accident.

So, I can confidently and honestly tell the hon members of this House, we did not react to that. The two engagements we had with them took place before this fateful accident that Tuesday. This is what actually makes it more heartbreaking because they cannot say they did not know. This is what makes it so much more heartbreaking because I personally met with them and with some of the principals previously simply because I work in Mitchells Plain. I have been working there for eight years. I have seen this. It is not new to me. That is why the initiative we are trying, we are trying it as preventative measures. As part of the outreach programme, Minister Kama ...[Laughter.] sorry, hon member Kama ...[Laughter.] the Department does go out and try and help to assist ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ...the operators' safety awareness

...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): I agree.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ...education programmes to try and help them to try and legalise those that should be legalised. But if your vehicle is not roadworthy, we cannot legalise it. That is the law. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, that is the end of Questions for Oral Reply. We will now move over to Statements by Members as per Rule 145. I recognise the DA. Hon Plato.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Mr D PLATO (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. The last 48 hours have seen the Western Cape part of our province come under heavy rains and strong winds. Winter rainfall is vital for our province, but for many in our province, the rainy season represents a time of immense hardship as flooding and the cold weather cause widescale disruption in the daily lives of our people. This has been especially true with the strong weather of recent days which has seen roads, houses and businesses flooded and electricity supply disrupted.

Our thoughts are with all of those who are suffering and also, with our First Responders, maintenance workers, Disaster Management teams and Law Enforcement officers as they work timeously to keep our City and our towns

running, safe and to ensure that all of our citizens are kept from danger. Our worldclass Disaster Management personnel continue to monitor and evaluate the situation, deploying resources as necessary while the City's teams are working around the clock to clear water from roads and restore electricity to affected areas.

The Western Cape Department of Social Development is utilising the full might of its 37 shelters to provide urgently needed cold weather gear and meals to the homeless, as it has planned to do under its winter readiness programme. Last, but not least, NPOs have stepped up, and we need to thank them as well, to the plate in many areas in our province to assist and we are immensely grateful for their efforts. I wish all of our residents the very best and I hope every hon member of this House will join me in keeping those who work to shield us from the effects of this storm in our prayers in the coming days. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Plato. I recognise the ANC.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, despite the DA-led municipalities providing very few opportunities for young people in this province, the ANC commemorates the fallen young people of 1976, the young people who sacrificed their youth to go into exile or to go underground, and to celebrate the young people of today. Every year, young people are celebrated on 16 June. They are celebrated because it was them who set off the necessary changes that came about in South Africa during the 1980s.

While the young hon Mayor was benefitting from the tricameral system, young people across this province and country were taking up the cause for freedom. Christopher Truter from Bonteheuwel was shot and gave his life during the 1976 uprising. James Ngculu was a member of the June 19 Detachment, joined Umkhonto we Sizwe and indeed, had the honour to serve his people and his country. The late Carol Moses from Oudtshoorn, worked tirelessly to mobilise young people in the Klein Karoo and ensured the launch of initiatives such as *Saamstaan* (stand together).

Therefore, today's young people stand on the shoulders of giants. Despite the vast unemployment among their numbers, despite the gross inequality of which young people are at the coalface and chronic poverty which young people suffer from, young people must seize the opportunities created for them today. The young people of today must develop and become their own heroes. As young people, we must realise that we are the leaders we have been waiting for. Now is the time for us as young people, to better organise ourselves. We are not born criminals, neither were we born to drown our lives in drugs. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Kama. I now recognise the EFF. I am going to move on. I recognise the DA.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): No, I am on the line, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Klaas, I have recognised the DA or the hon Van der Westhuizen. So, I will give you an opportunity after this, if that is in order. Hon Van der Westhuizen, you can continue.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Thank you. †Geagte Speaker, ons weet, om dit sag te stel, dat Suid-Afrika se ekonomiese groei oor die afgelope 15 jaar erg swak presteer het. Selfs ons wonderlike minerale rykdom en uitstekende arbeidsmag kan ons nie beskerm teen die swak besluite van die ANC-regering nie, besluite wat gelei het tot die afgelope 15 jaar se beurtkrag, 'n uiters stremmende faktor in enige ekonomie.

As Voorsitter van die Staande Komitee vir Landbou kan ek getuig: landbou ly besonder erg onder beurtkrag. Beurtkrag veroorsaak dat voedselkoste styg en ook die inval van Rusland in die Oekraïne jaag voedselkoste op. Ons sien dat gesonde voedsel, vir al meer arm mense, onbekostigbaar geword het.

Die goue rand om hierdie donker wolk van swak ekonomiese groei was die goeie styging in landbou-uitvoere, veral die afgelope twee jare. [Tussenwerpsel.] Dit is die resultaat van jare se harde werk om nuwe markte te vestig, markte wat ons moet beskerm en koester. Maar kopers van produkte verkies om 'n land te ondersteun met 'n goeie morele kompas. Daarom is dit uiters betreurenswaardig dat die ANC se houding teenoor Rusland, ons land as 'n land wat vrede bo oorlog verkies, so skade aandoen en ons vervreem van ons grootste handelsvennote.

En daar is geen duideliker beeld dat ons aan skerwe lê as die beeld van 9 Junie 2023 deur Senator Christopher Coons, voorheen 'n groot vriend van Suid-Afrika, aan Senator Anthony Blinken, die VSA se Staatsekretaris en ander senior amptenare nie. Hier word gevra dat Suid-Afrika nie meer die gasheer vir die AGOA Beraad moet wees nie. Suid-Afrika se steun aan Rusland kos ons duur. Agb Mvimbi, Rusland kos ons Swart mense duur. Ons kan nie bekostig dat voedsel se pryse nog verder opgejaag word ...[Tussenwerpsel.]

[Hon Speaker, we know, to put it mildly, that South Africa's economic growth over the past 15 years has achieved very poorly. Even our wonderful mineral wealth and excellent labour force could not protect us from the poor decisions of the ANC Government, decisions that led to the past 15 years' load shedding, an extremely stifling factor in any economy.

As Chairman of the Standing Committee for Agriculture I can testify: agriculture suffers quite seriously under load shedding. Load shedding causes food prices to increase and also the invasion by Russia in the Ukraine pushes up food costs. We see that healthy food, for all the poor people, has become unaffordable.

The golden ring around this dark cloud of poor economic growth has been the increase in agricultural exports, especially the past two years. [Interjection.]. It is the result of hard work to establish new markets, markets we have to protect and savour. But buyers of products prefer to support a country with a good moral compass. Therefore it is extremely lamentable that

the ANC's stance towards Russia is causing so much damage to our country, as a country that prefers peace above war, and alienates us from our largest trade partners.

And there is no clearer image that we are in tatters than the image of 9 June 2023 by Senator Christopher Coons, previously a great friend of South Africa, to Senator Anthony Blinken, the USA's Secretary of State, and other senior officials. Here it is asked that South Africa should not be the host for the AGOA Summit anymore. South Africa's support of Russia is costing us dearly. Hon Mvimbi, Russia is costing our Black people dearly. We cannot afford that food prices are pushed up even further ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable [Interjections.]

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): ...tot hulle nadeel nie. Dankie.

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): ... to their detriment. Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Van der Westhuizen. Hon Sayed, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, procedure. Is the hon member speaking directly to the hon Mvimbi? I know he gets very emotional on this particular issue, as if he is part of the Ukrainian Defence Force ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: That, that ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...and the US Army. ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable ...[Laughter.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): But he must not speak directly to hon member Mvimbi. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Deputy Chief Whip of the Official Opposition, I will remind the hon members again. Please speak through the Chair. With that being said, also when you rise on a point of order there is no need for you to elaborate or give me an explanation on why you are rising. That is my job to determine whether it is a point of order or not. I now recognise the EFF, hon Klaas. Hon Klaas, it is now your opportunity. [Laughter.] Hon Klaas, I am going to move on. [Laughter.]

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Hon Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: I can hear you. I can hear you.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Evidence provided to the Standing Committee of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs at the National Assembly this week, suggested that the City of Cape Town has the highest number of corruption cases in the whole of South Africa. Members of Law Enforcement

from the South African Police Service, HAWKS, Special Investigation Unit and the National Prosecuting Authority confirmed that out of 14 serious corruption cases in the country, one was reported in Limpopo, five in Kwa-Zulu Natal, and eight in the Western Cape and of the eight reported from the province, four are currently on the court roll.

These corruption cases vary from construction tender fraud cases involving inflation of prices and kickbacks between third parties and City officials, as well as the DA members of the Mayoral Committee. Other cases also involve City officials receiving gratification in the form of holidays, hotel accommodation and airline tickets from 2013 in exchange for tenders awarded in 2010, as in the case of Bosasa, while some cases include tenders which were awarded illegally.

It is without doubt where the DA Government is, corruption becomes the order of the day. It then makes sense why the City's construction sites in various township areas have turned into warzones, in which construction workers are shot and murdered on a daily basis as gangs and City officials continue to fight indirectly. The DA-led City of Cape Town has long opened itself to corruption and now cannot deal with their gang counterparts, who are now taking what was promised to them. The DA has long been unchecked in corruption as a way to fund its election campaigns and to sponsor the lifestyle of its members ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Klaas, your time has expired. Please conclude.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): At the Provincial Government level, since they have introduced lifestyle audits to hide ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Klaas.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Thank you.

The SPEAKER: I now move on to GOOD.

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): Hon Speaker, this is an official statement by the hon Premier of the Western Cape of yesterday and I quote:

“Our delegation in the US is hard at work securing the Western Cape and SA’s eligibility to remain part of the AGOA. At a host of meetings on Capitol Hill this week, robust and candid discussions have been held.”

End of quote. The GOOD party in the House, I am sure, would like to know is AGOA not an agreement between the State of the Republic of South Africa and the USA? Does that not imply that should any negotiations pertaining to this matter be required that such negotiations need to be held by the National Government and not a delegation from the Western Cape?

An HON MEMBER: It is not a country as well.

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): How did the Western Cape and South Africa ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): ...become separate entities ...[Interjections.]
on an agreement that was originally signed by South Africa as a nation ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): ...and not South Africa and the Western Cape? Is the delegation officially authorised to represent the South African nation and if so, by whom? With whom did the Western Cape delegation meet? Under whose authority do negotiations, international affairs relating to South Africa, fall? This is clearly an act of undermining the Department of International Affairs or is this again just an attempt by the DA to try and fool the general public into believing that they are more important than they really are? I thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon De Villiers. Hon Minister, is that a point of order?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, it is a point of order.

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order, hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: I think the hon member referred to a statement of an hon member that is not in the House now and I would like to ask him to put that question to the hon Premier when he is back.

The SPEAKER: Honourable ...[Interjections.] Hon Minister, that is not a point of order. During Members' Statements, hon members have an opportunity to raise any topic which they so wish to raise and as per the Rules, the hon members of the Executive will have an opportunity at the end of Members' Statements to rebut or make comments to that. With ...[Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.] I will then move on and I recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. As the ACDP in the Western Cape, we are totally convinced that the ANC wants to destroy ...[Laughter.] this beautiful country ...[Interjections.] with passing and proposing legislation that is ridiculous. It is so absurd that the communities in the Western Cape want the ANC to cease beyond the 2024 election. Firstly, hon Speaker, the ACDP rejects the Employment Equity Act. [Interjections.] In other words ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): In other words ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): ...we reject apartheid in reverse. This Act is discriminating against White, Coloured and Indian South Africans, ...[Interjections.] people like me. [Interjections.]

Secondly ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): ...the ACDP rejects ...[Interjections.] the Department of Water and Sanitation's published Regulations which determine enterprises, especially against the farming community, by applying a water licence. And if it is up to 1-million cubic metres of water, it must have 75% Black shareholding. That is apartheid in reverse. [Interjections.] It is a racially driven regulation ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): ...and will further divide this country.

Thirdly ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thirdly, hon Speaker, the ACDP rejects the Basic Education Law Amendment, the BELA Bill. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): The BELA Bill gives the Minister, in Section 41, unlimited powers ...[Interjections.] unlimited powers. It also criminalises parents with time in prison and also a fine, and also reduces the powers of School Governing Bodies. We reject it! The Government has the final say when it comes to language policies ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Christians, please conclude.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): ...when it comes to admissions, ...[Interjections.] when it comes to curriculum, which includes comprehensive quality ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): ...education. ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): We, as the ACDP, will fight against this ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): ...the ANC.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you very much. I now recognise the ANC. [Interjections.] I recognise the ANC.

†'n AGBARE LID: Hulle wind is uit. Hulle wind is uit.

[An HON MEMBER: They're winded. They're winded.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip, I am going to move on. [Interjections.]

† 'n AGBARE LID: Die wind is uit. Hulle wind is uit.

[An HON MEMBER: Winded. They're winded.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. There is an hon member on the floor.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, contrary to the propaganda that we heard today in the discussion on our municipalities, the ANC continues to

note with deep concern the serious challenges that are found in the Department of Local Government and the lack of support that they are providing our municipalities with. Today, the City of Cape Town, despite its clean audit, is the number one municipality with corruption investigations into it in the country. Today, the City of Cape Town, contrary to DA propoganda, has eight of the highest corruption investigations into it in the entire country.

Two weeks ago, the hon MEC stood up in this House and dismissed the stopping and reallocation of over R60-million in Conditional Grants from National Treasury into our municipalities. He said that the reallocation of Conditional Grants affected all municipalities across the country, but he will also tell us that DA municipalities are better than the rest of the country. This is the hypocrisy of this Provincial Government.

The hon MEC was much happier with the R400-million that the Western Cape is receiving, but we should actually have been using R460-million and not losing R60-million. I do not know how the hon MEC thinks, but an additional R460-million, nearly half a billion rand, in my mind, will definitely make a difference to improving service delivery. So, how can he dismiss the concerns and say service delivery is not affected by the reallocation of these funds? So, at the end of the day, we only got R340-million extra, when in actual fact, we could have had an extra R120-million in Conditional Grants. Again, we heard of all the excuses, unforeseen circumstances like a pipe laying in a piece of land, but where is the proper

planning? Year after year, during the annual report season, we must hear of how challenges in supply chain management ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Lekker [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...which then ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Please conclude, your time has expired.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...obviously, lead to delays and the late appointment of contractors. Tenders are awarded to companies which have no capacity, and this is only discovered after the tender ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...is awarded. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Lekker. I recognise the DA.

Ms C MURRAY: Hon Speaker, under the administration of the National Government's Transnet Port Authority, the Port of Cape Town has faced significant inefficiency issues in recent years, leading to it ranking among the worst performing ports worldwide in 2021. Fortunately, the Democratic Alliance ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms C MURRAY: ...does not simply wait for others to address these problems.

In this case, the Provincial Department of Economic Development and Tourism has collaborated with both Transnet and the Transnet Port Authorities to tackle the challenges plaguing the Port. Numerous engagements have taken place involving stakeholders from various industries that rely on the Port's services. These engagements have provided ample opportunity for identifying and addressing the blockages impeding its efficiency.

Several interventions have resulted from these efforts, including the launch of the Cape Town Container Logistics Dashboard, facilitating more efficient allocation of berths and resources. Additionally, the installation of hydraulic tensioners on two port bays has improved stability during mooring, thereby increasing the efficiency of loading and unloading operations. Furthermore, the addition of a ninth ship-to-shore crane and a third mobile harbour crane, along with the provision of better staging areas for trucks and significant infrastructure investments in rail corridors for freight to the Port of Cape Town have contributed to the Port's transformation.

I welcome the substantial progress in addressing the Port's inefficiencies. Transnet has recently confirmed that the Port is back on track to achieve the Department's high growth scenario by 2026, creating 240 000 direct and

indirect jobs. The DA consistently goes above and beyond to advocate for wellbeing, safety, and jobs of the people of our province and the remarkable progress achieved at the Port serves as yet another shining example of our commitment. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Murray. I now recognise the Freedom Front Plus.

†Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Thank you, hon Speaker. Speaker, die Vryheidsfront Plus verwerp in sy totaliteit die ANC en sy satellietpartytjies se voortgesette en waansinnige flirtasie met Marxisme, Leninisme. Die ANC se kamtige gedaantewisseling vanaf 'n gevaarlike revolusionêre beweging na 'n sogenaamde politieke party is blote oëverblindery van 'n proletariaat. Die werkersklas word met vals beloftes van 'n beter toekoms vir armes verblind, met rasskool tussen arbeidswette, 'n Nasionale Gesondheidsplan wat nie sal werk nie en wysigings aan primêre skoolregulasies wat die gesag van ouers sal ontnem oor hulle kinders en hulle opvoeding plaas in die hande van kommunistiese leiers op nasionale vlak, die staat.

Dit is niks anders as die misbruik van 'n demokratiese stelsel om daardeur 'n eenparty sosialistiese diktatorskap te skep in Suid-Afrika nie. Die ANC se pseudo [Speaker, the Freedom Front Plus rejects in its totality the ANC's and its satellite little parties' continued and mad flirtation with Marxism, Leninism. The ANC's apparent transition from a dangerous revolutionary movement to a so-called political party is purely a delusion of a proletariat.

The workers class are blinded with promises of a better future for the poor with racial schools between labour laws, and National Health Plan that will not work and amendments to primary school regulations that will remove the authority of parents over their children and place their education in the hands of communist leaders at national level, the state.

It is nothing less than the abuse of a democratic system to thereby create a one-party socialist dictatorship in South Africa. The ANC's pseudo] revolutionary movement posing as a political party within a democratic order, they are still dreaming of a classless, communist society and should be removed from power. The Freedom Front Plus pleads with voters to wake up and rid ourselves, and South Africa, of such a dangerous dictatorship headed by communists and socialists. Thank you.[]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais. I now recognise Al Jama-ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, Al Jama-ah pays tribute and salutes the youth of the 1970s and 1980s for their bravery and selfless commitment in the struggle against colonialism and all oppressive laws. Apartheid and its discriminatory policies have left a continued legacy of inequalities among the previously disadvantaged people. Youth continue to face various challenges such as high unemployment, poverty, education, inequality, gangsterism, drugs and a lack of access to mentorship programmes.

However, critical early interventions are needed to deal with youth living in high-risk areas. The youth in areas in the townships on the Cape Flats do not have safe and secured environments to play, socialise and to learn. We recognise the mentorship programmes in place, but its capacity should be reviewed to accommodate more youth in other outlying areas.

The 1976 students' uprisings were not only against being taught in Afrikaans, but a revolt against an over-oppressive system, economically and socially. As we commemorate Youth Day, we are reminded of the critical role that youth play in building democracies and suitable development. We call on the Provincial Government to give youth more opportunities to take their communities and villages out of poverty, give them access to technology, establish more aftercare facilities, to put mechanism in place at schools to identify the ...[Audio distorted.] necessary support.

Al Jama-ah welcomes the Province's commitment to prioritise youth employment and we hope that it includes scopes to develop their skills for employment and opportunities to further their education. We also call on the Province to encourage municipalities to aid youth who need financial support to attend sports tournaments to represent the province or the country. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise the DA.

Mr C FRY (DA): Hon Speaker, tomorrow, South Africa will celebrate Youth

Day, a day of reflecting on the sacrifices made by young people in the fight for democracy, a day of celebrating the contributions the youth are making towards our society, but also a day of solemn reflection and concern about South Africa's future.

Approximately half of South Africa's youth are unemployed as the youth unemployment rate stands at a staggering 46,5%. These are millions of young South Africans living lives of hopelessness and desperation with no hope. To these young people I want to say: do not be discouraged. In the Western Cape there is hope and there is a Government that is urgently working to turn the hopelessness into opportunities and prosperity.

Not only is the Western Cape Government implementing various strategies such as its Energy Interventions and the Jobs for Growth strategy to stimulate economic growth and create opportunities for young people, but this Government is also actively empowering and upskilling the youth of our province. One such initiative is the Premier Advancement for Youth Programme. In a reply to a DA question, the Department of the Premier revealed that a total of 7 704 youth has participated in the PAY programme since its inception. These youth were provided with workplace experience while close to 100 young people have received permanent employment within the Western Cape Provincial Government.

Hon Speaker, the PAY programme is changing lives and giving hope to the youth of this province. My hope for this upcoming Youth Day is that more

governments across the country put in the work to empower, upskill, and create environments for young people to prosper.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Fry. Hon members, that brings us to the end of Members' Statements. In terms of Rule 145(6), I now give one or more members of the Executive present, an opportunity to respond to Members' Statements for not more than five minutes collectively. I recognise the hon Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker. I rise on the matter of the hon Premier's visit to the United States and their AGOA discussion. This House passed a resolution in support of AGOA, and as the Executive Authority of this Government, the hon Premier executed his constitutional responsibilities since trade, including international trade, is a concurrent function in terms of Schedule 4 of the Constitution.

AGOA is up for review in 2025 and the hon Premier is in the United States because the United States is the biggest trading partner of the Western Cape and 55% of South Africa's agricultural exports comes from the Western Cape, and the hon Premier is in the United States, and his delegation, to protect our agricultural exports.

The hon members know that there are about 600 United State companies operating in South Africa and creating thousands of employment opportunities. In addition, there are 1 800 products that receive favourable

export mechanisms from South Africa to the United States.

Hon members, the hon Premier will on his return brief this House of the outcome of his visit. The reason why the hon Premier is in the United States is because the National Government is failing to protect jobs and employment. Whilst the foreign direct investment from the United States, the United Kingdom and the European Union is in the region of 77%, the foreign direct investment into South Africa from China and Russia is a mere 6%. The others are 77% and so the hon Premier is in the United States to protect foreign direct investment into South Africa and then secondly, into the Western Cape.

And so, the hon Premier will at the appropriate time, brief this House because this House gave him a mandate through the resolution that was passed in this House. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon Bredell, hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I want to thank the hon member Plato for his statement. It just showcases that if you invest in Disaster Management during good times, then they will be ready when there are problems. And I think we can proudly say that we run the best Disaster Management Centre in Africa.

But also, we need to acknowledge the fact that we do not do this alone. Our partners, the NGOs out there, NSRI, SARFA – that’s the 4x4 people. The SAPS Rescue Squad is fantastic. They have helped a lot in the City of Cape Town. The Fire and Rescue Squad, not only protecting people in the City of Cape Town, but throughout this province. We call on them and they come and help us. They are now on standby to come and help us because we must also release water from the Clanwilliam Dam and the Wemmershoek Dam. So, downstream, the communities are on high alert and again, the City of Cape Town stepped up and put their hands up to say they are ready to come and help us. So, I want to make use of this opportunity to thank them, but also to warn everyone that there are another two cold fronts on their way – Saturday and Sunday – so we need to be ready.

The eight corruption cases that were mentioned. Hon people, I do not understand what the Opposition do not get. At least we act. I just wish that we can get the same commitment to capacitate the NPA’s office and the HAWKS offices so that we can get to the bottom of corruption and get these people into the courts and hold them accountable. We will not shy away, as the DA Government, from holding people accountable. And again, I am not going to explain to people who do not want to understand, that you give R60-million back, but you gain R454-million because you are doing your job. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister Bredell. Hon members, I

have got no further indication. That brings us to the end of Members' Statements.

MOTIONS

The SPEAKER: We now move over to Notices of Motion as per Rule 151. In terms of Rule 151, all Notices of Motion by the hon members are required to be delivered to the Secretary for placing on the Order Paper. These motions have been duly submitted and published on the Order Paper below the line.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Ms A P BANS (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the increasing gun related killings in Cape Town townships.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the number of unregistered Early Childhood Development sites that outnumber official facilities in Western Cape.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the incident of 100 addicts who escaped from Cape Town rehab centre.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms A P BANS (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the increase in smash-and-grab incidents in Elsie's River, Cape Town.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, we then move on to Motions without Notice as per Rule 150. I would like to inform you that in terms of the Standing Rule 150 pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolence and congratulatory were submitted to the Programming Authority prior to this plenary on 12 June 2023. Hon members are also reminded that the Motions without Notice pertaining to congratulatory and condolence, will not be allowed in this Sitting that have not been processed by the Programming Authority.

I have been informed by the Programming Authority meeting of 12 June

2023, political parties did submit the names of the hon members in the desired order of speaking and who had wished to move a Motion without Notice in this sitting of this House. I will therefore, just for noting and for the purposes of the Minutes, call out the hon members whose names have accordingly been submitted and approved.

The following member motions have been approved by the Programming Authority as follows: hon P Z Lekker, hon L L Mvimbi, hon M K Sayed, and hon M Kama.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with profound sadness the passing away of the ANC MP and former Minister, Tina Joemat-Pettersson, who died at her home in Cape Town on Monday 5 June 2023; notes that Joemat-Pettersson was a member of the ANC's National Executive Committee and the Chairperson of the Police Portfolio Committee, and previously served as Minister of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries and Minister of Energy, as well as Education MEC in the Northern Cape; further notes that she was also a stalwart of the ANC Women's League and liberation struggle; and extends condolences and sends a message of strength to her family and friends.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep shock and sadness the brutal murder of an ANC member of Drakenstein's Ward 12, and Chairperson of the taxi association Codeta, Siyabulela Mandyoli; notes that Mandyoli was shot dead in front of his house in the Mbekweni area on Tuesday afternoon, 6 June 2023; notes that he served as both the Deputy Chairperson and Chairperson of the Bulelani Mangena branch; notes that he was also a Sanco and Congress of Democratic Taxi Associations (Codeta) Chairperson; notes that Mandyoli was a significant figure in the discussions that resulted in the reopening of the B97 route and that he was instrumental in securing the peaceful cohabitation between the two opposing taxi associations (Cata and Codeta) operating in Mbekweni; and sends heartfelt condolences to his family, friends and colleagues.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep shock and sadness the passing of a 20-year-old female student who was stabbed to death by a male student on Tuesday, 6 June 2023 at the Nelson Mandela University, George Campus; and sends deepest and most heartfelt condolences to the family

and friends of the deceased student.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes the passing away of Mark Mausenbaum, affectionately known as “Coach Mouse”; notes that he was one of the founding members of the Milnerton Surf Lifesaving Club; notes that, when he joined the club in 2010, he touched many hearts in the broader lifesaving community; notes that his enthusiasm for the lifesaving movement has helped to nurture the lifesaving club that exists today; notes that Mausenbaum touched every corner of life at the club over the past 13 years in his many roles as nipper coach, chairman, club captain, barman, gear steward, cameraman, but mostly as a friend; and sends deepest condolences to his family and friends.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now put the motions duly submitted and approved by the Programming Authority to the House. Are there any objections? No objections, agreed to. The motions will appear in the Minutes of the proceedings and in Hansard, in each individual member’s name as if the member had read them out aloud.

I will now afford the opportunity to hon members to move Motions without Notice as per Standing Rule of 150(2)(d). This could also include Motions without Notice that were not approved of in the Programming Authority meeting. Hon members are reminded that as per the Standing Rule 150(2)(d), that 30 minutes are allowed for this section which will start now. I recognise the hon Dugmore. Is that a point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No.

The SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I would just like to do a motion. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Is he going to [Inaudible.] at the congress. After the manager ...[Laughter.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Who is the congress manager? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I recognise the honourable ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Kama?

The SPEAKER: ...Kaiser-Philander

Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Jy weet alles, nè.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You know everything, né.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with profound sadness ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, there is an hon member on the floor. Hon
Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I move without
notice:

That the House notes with profound sadness the passing of Marlene van Staden on Thursday, 8 June 2023; at the time of her death, Marlene was serving as the Mayor of Modimolle-Mookgophong local municipality and was the Democratic Alliance's first Mayor in the Province of Limpopo; Marlene was a force for good in her municipality and served the communities of her town with grace and dignity. She was a

formidable female leader, not only in our party, but also in Government; Marlene fought various obstacles to bring good governance to Modimolle-Mookgophong. Her dedicated, optimistic and committed leadership should serve as an example to all those who serve in government across South Africa. We send our thoughts and prayers to the family, loved ones and colleagues of Marlene. †Ons is inniglik dankbaar vir haar toegewyde staatsdiens en haar voorbeeldige leierskap; rus in ewige vrede, Marlene. Ek lê hierdie mosie ter tafel. Dankie Speaker. [We are deeply grateful for her dedicated civil service and her model leadership; rest in eternal peace, Marlene. I table this Motion. Thank you Speaker.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Chief Whip. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objection, agreed to. I recognise the hon Fry.

Mr C FRY (DA): Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House notes with sadness the passing of legendary former Bafana Bafana coach Clive Barker on Saturday, 10 June 2023, at the age of 78; notes that he has been laid to rest today and sends its heartfelt thoughts and prayers to his family, loved ones and the South African football fraternity; and notes that his son at the funeral said he was a

coach to the end. Notes that this House honours Clive's dedicated service to his country. He was a courageous figure who defied the apartheid regime in order to develop the game of football in Black townships and it is precisely this unmatched commitment to the sport and passion to overcome deeply rooted divisions which left an indelible mark on the hearts of many South Africans. That this House notes that during a time of much tribulation and division, Clive led the South African men's football team to victory at the African Cup of Nations in 1996 on home soil and was a key figure in bringing pride and cohesion to our country during that delicate period; that this House honours Clive as a truly great South African, who inspired a nation and has left a indomitable legacy. His famous 'flying bird' celebration will forever be imprinted on the hearts and memories of South African football lovers across the nation. We bid thee farewell, Coach, and we thank you for your service. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Fry. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The SPEAKER: No objection, agreed to. I now recognise the hon Van der Westhuizen.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Agb Speaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Ek versoek dat die Huis erkenning sal gee aan die uitstaande prestasie van mnr Christi van den Heever wat gisteraand, 14 Junie 2023, as die Agri Wes-Kaap Santam Jong Boer van die Jaar aangewys is; dat die Huis kennis neem dat mnr Van den Heever boer op die plaas Rietfontein in die Koue Bokkeveld en so ook sy deel doen om ons land te voed; verder kennis neem dat mnr Van den Heever toegewyd is aan sy gemeenskap en dat hy werkskepping vir die Koue Bokkeveld-gemeenskap as een van sy kern (toekoms) doelwitte sien; en erken dat sonder uitstaande jong boere soos hy, sou ons provinsie se landbousektor nie die hoogtes kon bereik wat dit oor die afgelope dekades bereik het nie. Ek stel so voor.

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

I request that the House recognises the outstanding achievement of Mr Christi van den Heever who last night, 14 June 2023, was chosen as the Agri Western Cape Santam Young Farmer of the Year; that the House notes that Mr Van den Heever is farming on the farm Rietfontein in the Koue Bokkeveld and thus also does his share to feed our country; and further notes that Mr Van den Heever is dedicated to his community and that he sees job creation for the Koue Bokkeveld community as one of his core (future) goals; and acknowledges that without outstanding young farmers like him, the

province's agricultural sector could not reach the heights it has over the past decades. I so move.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objection, agreed to. I recognise the hon Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House recognising that Youth Day is approaching, acknowledges the commendable efforts of the Western Cape Government in organising a youth empowerment open day in Gugulethu, which aims to provide youth from the greater Gugulethu area with access to various empowerment opportunities; notes the Department of Infrastructure will host similar youth empowerment sessions throughout the province in the coming weeks; commends the remarkable progress achieved through the Conradie Park Apprenticeship programme, which is currently catering to the needs of 100 young individuals. The programme offers monthly stipends to incentivise the participants. During a recent conversation with the Minister, 23-year-old Jordan Samuels expressed her deep appreciation for the programme, highlighting its personal significance and impact on her life; commends the great work being done by the

Masakh'iSizwe Bursary Programme. Hon Minister Simmers awarded 96 young people bursaries for the 2023 academic year. The new bursary recipients were deeply honoured to be accepted into the MiS Programme in their respective academic disciplines; further notes the bursary offers support for full-time studies towards a degree or diploma in the transport, engineering, and built environment disciplines; commends the DA-led Western Cape Government's commitment to prioritise and support the youth, who are undeniably the most vital demographic within our society. They represent the future of our country and possess the potential to drive significant positive change. Hon Speaker, I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Maseko. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Object.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise the hon Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House notes with pride the imminent construction of the Lunar

Exploration Ground Site (LEGS) in Matjiesfontein in the Karoo; notes the fact that Matjiesfontein has been chosen for this purpose for its ideal location, climate, and existing infrastructure; notes that this facility, constructed on behalf of the United States' National Air and Space Administration or NASA, will play an important role in the Artemis III mission which aims to return human explorers to the surface of the moon for the first time since the Apollo 17 mission of December 1972; notes that the Artemis III mission is intended not only to send the first ever woman and person of colour to the surface of the moon, but also to establish the basis for human lunar habitation; and expresses its immense pride in Matjiesfontein and the Western Cape's role in this exciting next giant leap for humankind's exploration of the cosmos. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: Wow!

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Baartman. Hon members, Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Object.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Thank you very much. Hon Dugmore, I recognise you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. On behalf of the ANC ...[Laughter.] I would like to move that: ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I move without notice:

That this House expresses its deep concern at the impact of flooding on the lives of people across the province and believes that once again, the DA's refusal to make land available to those in need, as well as the lack of a proactive strategy to lessen the impact of flooding, add to the misery of the poor and landless in the main; this House therefore resolves to establish an ad hoc committee to investigate the current situation in regard to flood damage and makes recommendations to deal with land availability and other measures to reduce the impact of flooding across the Western Cape; and further calls for the urgent establishment of the Environmental Commissioner so that on climate change matters and mitigation measures, this Legislature can be adequately advised. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore. Hon members, are there any

objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Hon MEMBERS: Object!

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Yes, I object.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise the hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the excellent performance by the Cape Town Spurs Football Club who have been promoted to the DSTV Premiership after five years in the National First Divisions. The Cape born legendary and ultimate warrior, Shaun Bartlett, who is the head coach is the person who made all this possible, noting that his career as a senior football player started at this very same team. That the House calls on the Western Cape Government and local authorities to increase their support to our provincial teams which participate in South Africa's topflight league. A progressive government should realise and take the opportunity of using sports to address social ills faced by young people. Football in the Western Cape has the most participation and membership, mostly from poor and crime ridden areas, but it is poorly funded in the province. The promotion of Cape Town Spurs brings our

teams to three in the top league. This victory of Cape Town Spurs reminds us of and should encourage all football loving people in the Western Cape to never lower their guard in defence of Athlone Stadium, the pride of Cape Town's football history. Let us use football to kick crime for touch. I so move, hon Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Kama. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: I object.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] Hon members, can I also just remind hon members ...[Laughter.] Hon members, order, hon members! We have moved on. Hon members, I just want to remind you that there is a sequence. Hon Kama, I did not want to stop you midway, but can we just follow the sequence. So, I am going to now move on to number eight on our sequence, which is also hon Kama. When we get to number 13, your number 7 will then be your number 13. Hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Yes, thank you, hon Speaker. Apologies for that. Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House moves that the Provincial Government immediately constitutes the Provincial Sports Council which should, amongst other things, adjudicate on matters of disputes of sports federations in the Western Cape. The continuing disputes in sports federations are against all efforts of sports development. The council should be appointed through fair and equal participation of different stakeholders in the different sporting codes. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: I object.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. Can I please put the question, hon members. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No objection.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now move on to hon Windvogel. No, no, hon Kama is up. Just for the clarity, hon members. Hon Kama, can you please just stop the watch, the clock. Number 13 that hon Kama delivered or moved in the House will replace his number eight. We will deal with that later on, so it is now hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the passing of the National Health Insurance Bill in South Africa. This momentous occasion marks a significant milestone in our journey towards achieving universal healthcare for all our citizens. The NHI Bill represents a profound commitment to improving the quality and accessibility of healthcare services across the nation. It is a testament to our collective efforts in building a fair and equitable healthcare system that prioritizes the well-being of every individual. With the implementation of the NHI, we envision a future where no South African is denied essential medical care due to financial constraints. This transformative legislation will ensure that everyone, regardless of their socio-economic background, can access the healthcare services they need and deserve. Let us celebrate this milestone and embrace a future where health is a fundamental right for all. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: Mandla!

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Windvogel. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Hon MEMBERS: Object!

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Yes, I object.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, and the motion will be printed ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: I object!

The SPEAKER: ...on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] Hon members, we now move on to hon Lekker.

An HON MEMBER: Objection! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: There is and hon members, we have moved on. We are now with hon Lekker. [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that 13 June marked the day on which President Nelson Mandela and other Rivonia trialists were sentenced to life imprisonment at Robben Island. We remember these gallant fighters and celebrate their selfless sacrifices in the fight against apartheid.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. I now recognise hon Bakubaku-Vos. Order, hon members. Hon Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the ...[Audio distorted.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Bakubaku-Vos, we are not able to hear you.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Oh dear.

The SPEAKER: Hon Bakubaku-Vos, I am not able to hear you. Alright. Hon members, can I please ask that the ICT team just gets in contact with hon Bakubaku-Vos and I will continue and give an opportunity later on, if that is in order. Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker ... hon Speaker, apologies. I move without notice:

That the House notes and is deeply disturbed by the recent racist incidents at the Westerford High School in Cape Town which are currently under investigation. Such behaviour is not only reprehensible, but also goes against the core values of respect, inclusivity, and equality

that should be upheld within our educational institutions. Racists unfortunately feel comfortable in the DA-governed Western Cape due to the DA's defence of institutionalised racism. We stand firmly against any form of discrimination or prejudice and express our solidarity with the affected students and their families. It is crucial that the school administration takes decisive action after investigating these incidents thoroughly and hold those responsible accountable for their actions. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Sayed. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Object!

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Kama, I now recognise you and that is your Motion without Notice number 8.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House moves without notice for the Premier to increase the budget for youth development. A youth directorate in the office of the Premier should be established with an aim to coordinate all youth

programmes in his Government and support the establishment and running of youth development offices in the local governments here; that his Government should immediately advertise all Government funded posts and deliberately target young people and women for recruitment. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Hon MEMBERS: Object! Objection!

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Can I just check: hon Bakubaku-Vos, are you able to do your motion? Okay, I am going to move on to hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep concern that the unplaced learner crisis persists in the Western Cape as we discover on a daily basis more cases of parents who applied timeously and correctly, but are getting rejected by all schools they applied to; notes further that Ms Mqikela applied for her daughter at five different schools, namely Glendale High, Mondale

High, Spine Road Secondary, Portlands High, Cedar High; further notes that Mr Banjwa has written to the WCED to express his disappointment after he applied to 7 different schools for his niece who is currently doing Grade 7 at Claremont Primary and the application was unsuccessful at all the schools with no valid reasons given; laments the continued weaponization of Admissions and Language Policies to keep Black learners (African, Coloured and Indian) out of former Model C schools; and calls on hon MEC Maynier to attend to this matter as the lie of late applications and in-migration of learners from other provinces will not be accepted by the public.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: I take it you move? Thank you, hon Sayed. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Hon MEMBERS: Object! Objection!

The SPEAKER: There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] Hon Bakubaku-Vos?

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. I am here.

The SPEAKER: Hon Bakubaku-Vos, just before you continue. The last motion was also your opportunity [Interjections.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Am I audible?

The SPEAKER: ...so the next two are yours.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Can you hear me, hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Yes. I can hear you, hon Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Okay, thank you very much, hon Speaker.

I move without notice:

That the House notes the poor drainage system in the Drakenstein Municipality in the Western Cape. The drainage system is in its worst condition and has been so for years. The DA is doing nothing to invest in infrastructure, they have been unmoved for years while these floods continue to terrorise our people. With just some rain for 10 to 30 minutes, the streets are fully blocked. We call on the Provincial Government to investigate this problem as the rain season has started. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bakubaku-Vos. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Bakubaku-Vos. Hon Bakubaku-Vos, the next opportunity is yours.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep concern that 10 households at Smartie Town in the Drakenstein Municipality have been without electricity for the eight months due to cable theft; notes further that when the matter was reported to the Municipality it ordered each household to pay R3 000 for the cable and another R3 000 to get a certified electrician to install it which would cost each household a total of R6 000. I call on the hon Premier and the hon MEC of Local Government to intervene as the people do not have this amount, as most of them are unemployed and depend on social grants; also calls on the hon MEC of Social Development to intervene as there are two people living with disability affected, as well as seven pensioners and 11 children who cannot cope with living without electricity during winter. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bakubaku-Vos. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The SPEAKER: There is an objection, and it will be printed. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon members, that concludes the business for the House and the House is now adjourned. The Secretary will now end the meeting and all hon members will be exited from this sitting. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 18:11.