
THURSDAY, 14 NOVEMBER 2013

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p

INTERPELLATIONS:

Provincial office properties: inefficient use of space

1. Mr E J von Brandis asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

What is his department doing to address the inefficient use of space within provincial office properties?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Thank you also to the hon member Mr von Brandis who asks what the department is doing to address the inefficient use of space within the provincial office properties. We house about 23 000 people and it is a major pillar of the department that we should house them in the most productive, efficient and let us say green way. This relates to our

accommodation policy which is covered in this document which members are welcome to, the Property Efficiency Report, and basically it follows the following principles:

One is that we prefer to own our offices rather than to lease them and the cost savings of that are enormous. To that extent we have already started the process in the Tower Block and at number 9 Dorp Street to convert the space to more efficient use. We will also start presently with a 15 storey building on Leeuwen Street to house the Education Department, and we will be purchasing a further building, probably in Wale Street, which will mean thereafter we will not really have any significant leases in the City.

We have already done this in George where we have purchased York House and we will over time then dispose of the leases in that area and move all of our people into York House. The savings are enormous.

The second thing is how we use our space. In effect, what we find is that while our costs per person are not markedly different to the private sector, in fact, the average employee in the province uses twice as much space as in the private sector because we live here in kind of 19th century Dickensian type conditions. These will be eliminated. These will not occur in our new buildings and these will be eliminated steadily in all our old buildings at a cost of about R300 million which, will then be converted to open plan and that money will be recovered in about four years, and thereafter there will be a significant profit.

The first thing will be to then have a much more efficient usage of space per person but, more important is the quality of that space, that where people work in properly designed open-plan circumstances, they are not in little boxes, in little cells, and they in fact are able to connect with the people and the activities around themselves, and in that sense they become much more efficient.

The SPEAKER: Order. Please finish off. Hon Mr von Brandis, over to you.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Notwithstanding the findings of the discussed report which illustrates the need for modernisation and better designed future use of provincial space, it is reassuring to know that the Department of Transport and Public Works is intent on maximising efficiency and plugging financial sinkholes.

The question as always is, what can this government and its departments do to better use scarce resources? One is the development of space allocation standards, something which has been done in the private and public sector around the globe. These standards are by no means complex. They simply outline the allocation of available space, but these standards should not be at the expense of functionality and management. Requirements of staff should be adequately provided for, but simply put 60 square metres for an office is unacceptable. Using prestige as a yardstick in planning, especially when public funds are being used, is often an unfortunate occurrence. Departments

and the buildings within the provincial portfolio should be encouraged to plan their own space according to these set guidelines and within the framework of reducing waste. The reason behind this is that space needs to be flexible and that requirements will differ from building to building and defined by the function of those that occupy it. That is why the programmes look to set maximums for space usage with a set of codes which can be used to prevent waste in future planning. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon minister, over to you.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Speaker and thank you to the hon member Mr von Brandis. Quite right with everything he says, Sir. You would be interested to know, Mr Speaker, that the worst over-usage of space by staff is right here in this building, almost double what it should be, in fact more than double what it should be.

So we proceed with that and the long term savings in that respect will be by 2020 about R600 hundred million per year. Then, not after that but simultaneously, we are involved in various measures to make our buildings more efficient in other ways. We have obtained a grant from the United States government of US\$500 000 dollars to retain consultants who will use the roofs of our buildings here in the City to generate energy and that should reduce - when that system is fully implemented - our energy costs by between 9 and 19%.

We will also increasingly green the buildings. For instance, the new building in Leeuwen Street, with the exception of certain religious needs, will have water free toilets. Toilets will not require water and increasingly in all our buildings we will re-use or sell the grey water and also use natural water which lies under number 9 Dorp Street. We also will try to reduce the traffic of lifts and indeed, where we can, the incidence of lifts by ascertaining where the busiest traffic is and ensuring that that traffic is either on the ground floor or close to the ground floor [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please finish hon Minister. Hon member Mr Stali, over to you.

Mr Z C STALI: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Can the hon Minister tell this House why lots of open space has not being used? Can the hon Minister tell us why many state buildings, especially schools, are being used as drug dens? Minister we are also concerned that intended buildings especially for the Department of Health and Education are not being built as budgeted for. So existing buildings are under-utilised and far too few new buildings are being rolled out. This year only 62 building projects were completed by the hon Minister's Council Department in comparison to the 140 of last year. The target of 27 was not achieved. Only 55 projects were completed within the budget compared to last year's 133, an unachieved target of 27. Even maintenance of government buildings leaves much to be desired. Only seven or nine projects are under implementation this year compared to last year's 921. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr von Brandis, over to you.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Speaker, reducing costs and maximising efficiency should be the business of any government. Accordingly there is work to be done in reducing this waste and the department will have to ensure it gains maximum utility from leased or government office space which it appears to have made provision for in the annual report.

Reading from the Department of Transport and Public Works Annual Report of 2012/13, the report states, as the Minister also reported on, that the department is currently in the process of reducing its leased space in favour of permanent space, such as the York Park building in George, my home town. It also notes that during this process the department would provide user departments with office accommodation in accordance with approved space norms. Assuming that these space norms are adhered to, future space under the department's authority, will be benefited by better planning and modernisation.

The annual report also notes that consolidated use of space by departments will reduce inefficiencies in productivity, illustrating that reducing the waste of office space is therefore as much about the physical as it is the mental. Mr Speaker, achieving parity within the province's offices and administration spaces will reduce costs through better use of space and set precedents for future planning. New norms and standards, once implemented, will allow the

province to derive full utility from its properties and related office space and in a process make better use of taxpayers' money. I thank the Minister and his department for their efforts in this regard. I thank you.

Mr M OZINSKY: Is your office big enough for you?

The SPEAKER: Order. Hon Minister, over to you.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and thank you also to the hon member Mr Stali. Just to continue what I was saying. All of the areas where the public need to engage with us will be dropped down to the ground floor as has already been done at 9 Dorp Street - the walk-in centre which I hope you have all visited. This will happen with regard to all the buildings here, including the Tower Block building. Now I listened with a degree of astonishment to the hon member Mr Stali, who I think was actually addressing the Gauteng legislature and not the Western Cape legislature [Laughter.] I think he is confused, okay but let me ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Maybe on his way,

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Maybe he is on his way. I am told there is going to be a mass migration of hon members. Those who are not coming here are going to the Northern Cape [Laughter.] [Interjections.] But let me share ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Order, hon members. Hon Minister, order. Hon members, order.

Ms L BROWN: We can actually lease there is that what you are saying?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Steve Biko said, do not worry what other people say about you; it is what you feel about yourself.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please address the Chair.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Speaker, just to give the hon members some figures; under the ANC for the four years ended 2008 they spent R700 million on schools. In the next four years under the DA we spent R1,7 billion. That is nearly three times more, and in the next three years we will be spending R3,3 billion [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I do not know. What more does he want us to do? [Interjections.]

But let us talk about health: in the last four years under the ANC they spent R1,1 billion on health. In the same period we have spent R2,7 billion on

health [Interjections.] I want that hon member to share our pride in these achievements [Interjections.] He is part of this. He is part of the legislature that has done these wonderful things and he should not criticise. He should, like the hon member Mr von Brandis, stand up and say “well done Western Cape legislature” [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members

Ms L BROWN: I wish you were so bold in your debate.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member Ms Brown. We now proceed, hon members, to the second interpellation. I recognise the hon Minister Fritz. Over to you.

Debate concluded.

Substance abuse treatment centres: operational status

2. Mr R B Lentit asked the Minister of Social Development:

What is the operational status of Western Cape government funded substance abuse treatment centres in the Western Cape?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Mr Speaker and to the hon member Mr Lentit for the interpellation. The allocated budget for

2013/14 in terms of Vote 7 for substance abuse programmes is R81 437 000, and of this a total of 58% of the budget is earmarked for transfer payment to NGO's and 42% earmarked and allocated to own source treatment and outsource treatment centres. The second part is the department's subsidised six in-patient treatment centres, namely; Salvation Army Hesketh King Centre, False Bay Community Centre, Tehillah, Namaqua Treatment Centre, Toevlug Treatment Centre and Ramot Treatment Centre.

In addition, the Department of Social Development has its own in-patient treatment centres at the Novo and two out-source treatment centres in Kensington and the other one in Eerste River called the Western Cape Youth Rehabilitation Centre. The Novo targets 85 clients per treatment cycle, Kensington 40 clients, and the Western Cape Youth Rehabilitation Centre also target 40 clients per treatment cycle. There are 18 community based treatment programmes. I want to emphasise, 18 community based treatment programmes which are out-patient treatment centres. They have 4 200 clients and these are all community based treatment centres which are fully utilised. I think it is an important point that they are out-patient treatment programmes because everyone thinks that anyone with the first attempt of any form of tik or anything must go to an in-patient treatment. There are phenomenal programmes that deal with out-patients.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon minister. Hon chief whip, do you want to address me?

Me A ROSSOUW: Mnr die Speaker, die agb lid mnr Lentit is siek in die hospitaal en hy vra verskoning. Hy kan nie deelneem aan die interpellasie nie.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I am also sitting with an official letter from the hon member Mr Lentit. So can we then proceed to the next interpellation? Hon member Mr Uys?

Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, just to be clear, are we going to conclude this interpellation?

The SPEAKER: Yes, of course.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Yes, we will. Definitely. Hon member Ms du Toit Marais, over to you.

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Dankie, mnr die Speaker. Die Wes-Kaapse regering is 'n regering wat omgee. Ons identifiseer probleme en implementeer oplossings. Dwelmmisbruik plaas ook 'n hoë premie op ons gesondheidssorg. Verhoogde bedkapasiteit in distrikshospitale soos beklemtoon in die jaarverslag is ook beskikbaar gestel. Samewerking met NRO's dra by tot die bekamping, voorkoming en behandeling van dwelmmisbruik. Verder is die toepassing van die matriksmodel een van die

meer suksesvolste gegewe in die kompleksiteit van dwelmafhanklikheid. Die gemeenskapsmodel vir voorkoming en behandeling dra by tot die holistiese benadering van die department en regering. Ek is seker dat as ek Minister Fritz vra by die suksesse van dwelmbehandeling in onder andere Mitchells Plain sal kan uitlig, Minister Fritz kan ook noem hoe ons benadering vergelyk met die van voor 2009. Ek dank u.

The SPEAKER: Minister, over to you.

Die MINISTER VAN MAATSKAPLIKE ONTWIKKELING: Ja, baie dankie aan die agb lid me Du Toit Marais. Daar word altyd gesê dat daar in Mitchells Plain net een sentrum is wat behandeling bied vir die mense van Mitchells Plain, wat natuurlik 'n absolute leuen is. Ons het byvoorbeeld in Mitchells Plain die Tafelsig matriksperseel wat in Tafelsig geleë is die middelpunt van waar dwelms vrylik beskikbaar is, maar die nasionale polisie doen niks daaromtrent nie.

Die Cape Town Drug Counselling Centre is in Mitchells Plain in Woodlands, die Woolworths-arkade, by Symphony Walk in die sentrale deel van die dorp in Mitchells Plain. Sultan Bahu is een van die ander sentrums daar. Ons het 'n nuwe benadering met ons plaaslike kantore waar ons die eerste vorm van behandeling en onmiddellike intervensie ook aan mense lewer wat hulle kinders bring. Hulle is desperaat en bring hulle kinders na ons toe. Ek is bly om vandag hier te kan aankondig dat ons binnekort by feitlik elke ander daghospitaal wat ons het of kliniek wat deur Kaapstad beheer word, die

matriksprogram ook daar gaan uitrol. Ek dink dus dat dit alles wonderlik is, dames en here, agb lede, mnr die Speaker, maar dit is 'n probleem en ons moet die probleem aanpak en dit is die basiese punt.

The SPEAKER: Hon mem Ms Magwaza, over to you.

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Certainly, the department of Minister Fritz has consistently regressed in its provision of support to those suffering from drug abuse. We have witnessed a decrease in the number of people accessing substance abuse services. [Interjections.] This decrease has happened in a province where drug abuse is increasing. Mr Speaker, we have come to discover that the majority of those affected by drugs in this province have to wait between three and four months, as the department's centres are often full. We hope that operationalising of substance abuse centres will make provision for this. The South African National Council for Alcoholism and Drug Dependence in the Western Cape says that only a few addicts can afford in-patient facilities, even if State subsidised. The department also must invest much more in drug prevention programmes. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister, please conclude.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: That is not true.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you. I want to say - yes, the numbers did come down, hon member Ms Magwaza ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Hon Minister Carlisle, order.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The numbers ...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon mem Ms Magwaza, order. Hon Minister, proceed.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The numbers did come down, Mr Speaker. You know why the numbers came down, because they stopped; this department stopped doing this so-called mass awareness that they chase numbers for annual report purposes – that is why the numbers came down. They had a hundred people in the room and they said, oh you must not take drugs and the woman who told the children not to take drugs is 105 years old. So how does a 15 year old listen to a 105 year old woman? This is the problem with them, and I can say to the hon member Ms Magawaza ... [Interjections.] ... one of the issues that I can say to her now, that in 2008 when they were in charge, there were eight treatment centres in this province. There are now 27 treatment centres. Very simple mathematics – very simple graphic mathematics. Agt plus agt is 16 en nog agt is 24 en dan tel jy nog drie by dan kry jy 27 – dis die tipe somme wat ‘n mens vir hulle moet maak en dit is baie eenvoudige somme. Soveel toe en nou is daar soveel; dis die verskil wat ons ... And I am telling you where we are going because we are giving substance and impact treatment, not little awareness

programmes where you chat to 100 and no one listens. This is the point we must reach – stop chasing numbers and get impact and make a difference to the people out there. Thank you, Mr Speaker. [Interjections.]

Debate concluded.

The SPEAKER: Hon mem Ms Brown, order. [Interjections.] Hon Minister, your time has expired. Order, please. Hon Minister Fritz, order. We now proceed to the last interpellation, the third one. I recognise the hon Minister Madikizela.

Housing: occupation by intended beneficiaries

3. Mr K E Magaxa asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

Why are there houses still not occupied by the intended beneficiaries whilst there is an extreme housing shortage in the Western Cape?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, there are various reasons why sometimes houses are not immediately occupied when they have been completed. Sometimes incomplete application forms are sent by the intended beneficiaries to the department, and sometimes it is the contestation between different groups and communities who want to be prioritised first before others, and in some instances it is the policy of Eskom to only electrify projects when they are

80% completed, so some of the beneficiaries choose not to occupy those houses until they are electrified. Sometimes we identify structural defects before people can move in and we deal with those structural defects so that people can move into structurally sound houses. These are some of the reasons why certain houses are not immediately occupied after they are completed. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon mem Mr Magaxa, over to you.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Speaker, this is another living example of the DA's negligence and corrupt tendencies when Minister Madikizela actually uses houses built to divide communities for the DA to get membership and support. These houses have been built from conditional grants delivered by the national government under the ANC. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Delivered by me! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon Minister Carlisle, order please.

Mr K E MAGAXA: The N2 gateway in Langa, which is a national project started by the former MEC Jantjies and the former Minister Sisulu, is now falling under the same new Minister Madikizela. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order.

Mr K E MAGAXA: They are unoccupied; there are unoccupied houses for almost three years while there are people on the waiting list anxious to have houses. The DA is still looking for supporters like the hon Minister Madikizela who can be bought over these houses. The same problem is taking place in Eersterivier where houses were built some time ago but are still unoccupied. The DA is still looking for voter fodder. In Grabouw she is losing support; the DA has begun to use houses deemed for the community in Dennekruin in the same way, resulting in intended beneficiaries remaining on the waiting list. The land for these houses was transferred by the national government to the municipality as early as 2003. Now when the houses are built, intended beneficiaries are not getting the houses. Instead the DA councillor who happens to be African, brings Africans from other areas to move into those houses so as to divide the communities and create animosity, so that at the end of the day the DA gets supporters there.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Can you prove that?

Mr K E MAGAXA: In Nyanga backyard dwellers are given priority for the houses where residents for whom the houses were built remain on the waiting list.

The SPEAKER: Order, order. Your time has expired. Thank you very much. Hon member Mr Figlan, over to you.

†UMnu A M FIGLAN: Enkosi kakhulu Somlomo, ingxaki endinayo yintokuba kukho umahluko phakathi kwezindlu eziyi NBA, izindlu zeRDP, nezindlu zebank ngoku ingxaki yam ke zezindlu zikwaLanga zingenabantu zizindlu zebank apho kufuneka umntu asebenzisane nebank abone into yokubana inkcukacha zakhe zezimali zimikanjani.

* Mr A M FIGLAN: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. The problem I have is that there is a difference between NBA houses, RDP houses and Bank houses whereby an individual will have to work together with their bank in order to know their financial profile.

The housing waiting lists are long and getting even longer as all the people from other provinces want to share in the benefits of the good governance in the Western Cape. The unfortunate fact that certain houses are still standing empty after six years, makes one realise the extent of manipulation by various role players in the allocation of houses. [Interjections.] Most importantly, beneficiaries or hopeful beneficiaries should make sure that their documentation residing ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr A M FIGLAN: ... with the department are regularly updated. All people, especially the younger generation, should take special care to ensure that their financial standing with financial institutions like banks are in order. Without a clean financial record you cannot buy a house.

† Umzekelo ke ngulo bendithetha ngawo, wezindlu ezise Eersterivier nezindlu ezise N2 Gateway.

*The examples are the ones I have just mentioned, the houses in Eersterivier and N2 Gateway.

We welcome rent-to-buy opportunities which also provide the potential especially to blacklisted buyers. This mechanism to rehabilitate themselves financially while renting to buy a house - more use should be made of this facility. Most young people fail to understand the importance of a clean financial record and only realise the implications of a bad credit record when they want to buy a house. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Madikizela, over to you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. I think the hon mem Mr Magaxa must differentiate between speaking at a rally and in Parliament because at a rally everybody believes whatever you say. You must do your homework and get your facts straight before you come with your ...

N2 Gateway houses for example; those are bank houses. We have a land availability agreement with FNB and it is the responsibility of the bank to market those houses so that the beneficiaries who qualify in terms of the criteria then occupy those houses. The same thing applies in Eersterivier. There were 821 houses built there of which 221 were affordable houses,

under the program FLISP, and those houses are being sold because beneficiaries again must qualify to get a bond from the bank before they can occupy those houses. [Interjections.]

Again in Grabouw, those houses are being allocated and as I said, there were minor snags that the municipality is busy with. They will be allocated next week. The same thing applied in Nyanga. I think I have explained this several times now that the people who ended up benefiting from those houses in Nyanga were not the people who should have benefited and that is why the backyarders contested the allocation of houses to those people living there. We are dealing with that. Even though we do not condone the vandalism of those houses by the backyarders, they had legitimate concerns that they were overlooked and people who settled there, later after them, were given those houses. That is the correct information about what is happening with those houses. Thank you very much, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa, over to you.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Speaker, I think the hon Minister can confuse some of his colleagues on that side of the House, not us. Those houses, even though the bank contributes, the State, our government, contributes there. Therefore it is the responsibility of the MEC also to create the conditions for those houses to be occupied. He cannot allow the waste of our money there. It is his responsibility to intervene. If the reason that these houses are unoccupied is because there is a contestation by the groups why do we have

to pay an MEC if he does not see it as his role to create conditions conducive to people occupying those houses? What is his role? We pay the MEC to engage the community so that if the government spends money for people to live in those houses, we cannot build houses and spend three years with houses lying there unoccupied because there is a problem with the community. Why do we need an MEC?

Secondly, the question of structural defects: structural defects are all over. We went with your colleagues to Mossel Bay. In respect of the houses that people are living in there, there are processes to correct those problems. There are no defects in the houses in Nyanga. The reason they are demolished is because they have been standing there for more than three years now, unoccupied. All the reasons you referred to in Nyanga has nothing to do with that problem. The problem in Nyanga is precisely because the DA wants to create confusion and conflict in that community so that at the end of the day they can use those houses to buy votes. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Speaker ...

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Minister, over to you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Speaker, this member is an embarrassment in this House. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Let me say this ... perhaps ...
Just keep quiet. Just shut up. Let me perhaps educate this member.

The SPEAKER: Order. Hon Minister. Order. Hon Minister, please can you
withdraw “shut-up”. It is unparliamentary. We cannot allow it.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I withdraw it, Mr Speaker.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky. Hon members, order.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Let me take a few seconds to
educate the member about the process because he clearly does not understand
how the process works when it comes to affordable housing. Now, even
though the State contributes

An HON MEMBER: Do not give him a lecture.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I must.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: He needs it.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Speaker, I did explain that we signed a land availability agreement with the banks so that the banks can then assist those people earning above R3 500. Now what happens is that we do not contribute to people if they are not approved by the banks first. That is how the process works. People must go and apply to the bank and then get approval for a bond from the bank, and we can then assist people with our subsidy in terms of the Finance Linked Individual Subsidy Programme. So, there is no state money that is wasted there. If there are no people occupying those houses it simply means that they have not received any subsidy from us. That is how the process works, so there is no state money that is wasted. I think that must be made very clear upfront.

The issue of the structural defects; again I think I must make this point very clear because this administration currently accounts for R60 billion nationally on the houses that were built in the manner in which he proposes that we must. Now, what we need to do, in fact, what we are doing currently, is that we make sure ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please conclude Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: We make sure that we do not allow people to move into houses that are structurally unsound as is the case currently nationally. [Interjections.]

Debate concluded.

The SPEAKER: Order hon members. Order. We now proceed to questions as printed on the Question Paper. We will start with the questions that stand over from 17 October 2013, that is question number four to Minister Bredell.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Question standing over from Thursday, 17 October 2013, as agreed to by the House:

Private premises: basic services

***4. Mr J J Visser asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

- (a) What is the current state of affairs in respect of the rendering of basic services to people who live on private premises where the owner does not render any services;
- (b) whether this is a common occurrence in the Western Cape; and
- (c) which private landowners are especially guilty of this problem?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dankie, mnr die Speaker, en dankie aan die agb lid mnr Visser vir die vraag. Die antwoord is soos volg:

4. Die Stad Kaapstad, in terme van die *Wet op Munisipale Finansiële Bestuur*, word die nie toegelaat om basiese dienste te installeer of te verskaf aan inwoners wat woonagtig is op private eiendomme nie. Met betrekking tot informele nedersettings wat geleë is op private eiendomme waar eienaars nie basiese dienste verskaf aan inwoners nie, verskaf die Stad wel dienste op die grens van daardie eienaars se eiendomme ingevolge die grondwetlike verpligting. As 'n minimum vlak van dienste, verskaf die Stad toegang tot water en riool, asook die verwydering van vaste afval op die eiendom. In die geval van agterplaashuishoudings woonagtig op munisipale huureiendomme is die stad besig om dienste uit te rol wat elektrisiteit, riool en vullisverwydering insluit. As gevolg van die wetlike voorskrifte is die verskaffing van dienste aan agterplaashuishoudings woonagtig op individuele private eiendomme nie moontlik nie. Binne-in die stad is daar ongeveer 300 hektaar private eiendomme waarop informele nedersettings gevestig is. Dit gebeur gewoonlik as gevolg van grond-besetting. Mnr die Speaker, met die toestemming van die lid wat die vraag gevra het, het ek elke munisipaliteit se ontleding laat opstel, maar toe ek hier staan en lees het ek gedink dat ek miskien al die tyd vir vrae in beslag neem. Die kwessie gaan ook oor die Morawiese sendingstatsies waar daar nie behoorlike dienste is nie. ons is besig om te onderhandel met die Morawiese Kerk, veral in Bergrivier en soortgelyke gebiede. Hulle het verlede week hulle eerste vergadering gehad. Dan kyk ons ook baie verder tussen my en my kollega van

Landbou, Minister van Rensburg, hoe ons gratis 50 eenhede elektrisiteit vir ons plaaswerkers kan gee. Ons is besig met daardie stelsel en hopelik sal ons a besigheidsplan teen die einde van hierdie maand op die tafel hê. Dankie.

The SPEAKER: Any follow up questions? None. We then move to the new questions. Question number 1, Minister van Rensburg, over to you.

New questions:

Agriculture as a school subject

***1. Mr J J Visser asked the Minister of Agriculture:**

- (a) How many schools in the Western Cape have agriculture as a school subject;
- (b) how many of these subjects as special projects are supported and/or funded by the Department of Agriculture; and
- (c) how many of the special projects are supported by the private sector?

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Baie dankie, mnr die Speaker. Die vraag is hoeveel skole die landbou as 'n vak aanbied? Die antwoord is soos volg:

1. Daar is tans 20 openbare skole wat landbou as 'n vak aanbied. Dit word nie deur die Departement van Landbou finansieel ondersteun nie want die verantwoordelikheid lê by my kollega van Onderwys. Hulle betaal ten volle vir daardie skole. Ons werk wel saam met PSO 11 waar ons saam kyk hoe ons landbou kan bevorder by daardie skole. My departement is nie bewus van enige spesiale projekte wat deur die privaatsektor ondersteun word nie. Dankie, mnr die Speaker

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Visser, follow up?

Mnr J J VISSER: Dankie, mnr die Speaker. Hierdie openbare skole wat landbou as 'n vak aanbied, is dit net teoretiese onderrig wat kinders kry of is daar 'n praktiese deel van hierdie onderrig ter sprake agb. Minister.

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Mnr die Speaker, by drie van die skole wat as landbou skole gekwalifiseer het, en dit is ... [Onhoorbaar.] Boland en Clanwilliam, is daar ook 'n praktiese gedeelte. By ander in 'n kleiner gebied wat net skooltuine het soos byvoorbeeld by Nduli in Ceres probeer ons hulle help om 'n skooltuin aan die gang to kry.

Mnr J J VISSER: Dankie, mnr die Speaker. Agb. Minister, sou dit moontlik wees om dalk met boere 'n ooreenkoms te kan maak om kinders wat landbou as 'n vak neem by die skool toe te laat om op die boere se plase van hierdie praktiese onderrig te doen?

Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Mnr die Speaker, ek dink dit is moontlik. Daar is selfs boere wat bereid is om klaskamers op te rig vir landbouvakke by sekere skole waarvan ek bewus is. Ons kan altyd 'n samewerkingsooreenkoms kry met òf die munisipaliteit waar ons 'n tuin vir die skool kan kry òf met van die landbouers in die omgewing.

The SPEAKER: Minister Madikizela, over to you. Question number two.

RDP homeowners: title deeds

2. Mr A M Figlan asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

What is the status of the RDP homeowners in the Western Cape with regard to receiving the title deeds for their homes;

- (a) how many title deeds have been handed over to the RDP homeowners and in which areas were the title deeds given;
- (b) how many people have not received their title deeds and in which areas have they not received title deeds; and
- (c) what are the reasons for not receiving or handing over title deeds?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. The reply is as follows:

2. Up until 2009 there were more than 86 000 beneficiaries who had received RDP houses in the province who had never received their title deeds. There is a list I can provide as to which areas.

To the second part of the question, how many people have not received their title deeds and in which areas? As I said I will provide a list of those.

What are the reasons for not giving title deeds to the people? There are various reasons, Mr Speaker. They vary from the fact that in some areas the land was never properly proclaimed, which means the previous administration just built houses all over the show before planning processes were completed. As a result of that some of the people cannot get their title deeds. In some instances we find that packing was not properly done [Interjections.]. In some instances we find that packing was never properly done. In some instances we find that beneficiaries who are now occupying ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Speaker, can I be protected from the hon member Mr Ozinsky.

The SPEAKER: Order. Hon member Mr Ozinsky.

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order hon member Mr Ozinsky. You may proceed, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In some areas, Mr Speaker, people who are there are not the original beneficiaries, as we know that the selling and renting of houses is one of the big problems. But since 2009 we

have reduced that backlog by issuing almost 21 000 title deeds to those people who have less complicated situations. We are dealing with those situations where there are problems, as I have just outlined.

†UMnu A M FIGLAN: Enkosi kakhulu Mphathiswa, umbuzo endinawo Mphathiswa, kwaba bantu njengokuba bekukhe kwenziwa uphando kwafumaniseka ukuba abantu abahlala kwezi zindlu zingena Tittle Deed ayisingabo aba bebenikezelwe izindlu, ingaba isigqibo seDepartment sithini ngabo?

*Mr A M FIGLAN: Thank you very much hon. Minister. The question I have hon Minister is: among these people as we know there was an investigation conducted of which the findings were that those people living in those houses without title deeds were not the owners that were given those houses. What decision has been taken by the department regarding those people?

UMPHATHISWA WEZOKUHLALISWA KOLUNTU: Hon ... Enkosi Mhlekezi into esiyi qwalaselayo, ngoba ngokomthetho xa umntu ehlala endlini engabizi yena, kwaye le yinto esasiyenza ngaphambili, umthetho uthi kufuneka uadvertize uzokwazi ukufuna umnikazi walendlu, emva kwexesha elithile xa ungamfumani umnikazi walondlu, ujonge kengoku kwababantu bahlala pha into yokuba ingaba bakulungele ukufumana izindlu zikaRhulumente ngokwe criteria esetyenziswayo ukuze kuqalwe iprocess kengoku yokuthintela ezizindlu emagameni abo, nantso into esiyiqwalaselayo ngoku Mhlekezi.

*The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you hon member Mr Figlan. Our main focus...because by law if a person lives in a house that is

not registered in their name we used to use this before. Legally the house should be advertised in order to find the registered owner of the house and if the registered house owner is then not found after a certain period we then look at the people who are currently occupying the house. Where they qualify for government houses based on the qualifying criteria, this will then lead to the protection process in registering the houses in their names.

†UMnu A M FIGLAN: Enkosi kakhulu Mphathiswa ingaba bakhona ababesebencedakele abantu kwaba nithe nabafumana, kwacaca into yokuba ke banalo ilungelo lokufumana uxhamlo?

*UMnu FIGLAN: Thank you very much hon Minister. Are there people that have been assisted among those you have found? Was it clear that they are qualifying beneficiaries?

†UMPHATHISWA WEZOKUHLALISWA KOLUNTU: Njengoko besenditshilo into yokuba sayiqale lenkqubo eMakhaza, bakhona abantu abancedakalayo emva kwalo nkqubo. Nalapho, kwaye kwa advetaizwa kujongwa into yokuba ingaba abanikazi bezazindlu basekho nana. Nalapho kwafunyaniswa into yokuba aba bagna ngafumanekanga, izindlu zakwazi ukuthintelwa kwababantu. Senza lonto nakwezinye inginqi endingazibala njenge Samora ngoba sijonge ngoku into yokuba abantu ekudala behleli kweza zindlu, ukubangabana siyifumene into yokuba baya qualifiya kwaye kukhona ubungqina bokubana kudala behleli kuzo nabanikazi bazo abaziwa, siqale le process yokuba sizitshintshele kumagama abo ezizindlu enkosi.

*The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: As I have said we started this

programme in Makhaza and there are people who benefited from this programme. Even then advertising was done to find the homeowners' availability. Out of that advertising, if the findings were that those homeowners were not found, these houses were then protected to those people currently living in the houses. This was done in compliance with the investigation proceedings and proof that they had indeed been living in the houses for a long time. The same thing in other areas such as Samora. We are now looking at people who are already living in the houses. If they qualify for government houses and once that is in place we then start the process of protecting the houses in respect of name change registrations.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ncedana. Do you have a question?

†UMnu M NCEDANA: Somlomo, bendicela nje ukubuza kule mpendulo kaMphathiswa ethi kukho iindawo ekwathi kwakhiwa kuzo izindlu ngaphandle kokuba kubekho izicwangciso zokwakha ezizindlu, zeziphi ezondawo apha eNTSOstona Koloni?

*Mr M NCEDANA: Mr Speaker, I would like to pose a question to the hon Minister's reply stating that there is a place where houses are being built without discussions taking place to build the houses. Where are these houses in the Western Cape?

†UMPHATHISWA WEZOKUHLALISWA KOLUNTU: Ndinalo uluhlu lwezo ndawo Mhlekezi ziliqela kwaye ndingavuya ukunikezela, koKhayelitsha, Philliphi, njalo njalo lide uluhlu endizakunika lona ecacisayo ngoba

kuphando esasithe salenza lasixelela nje kamhlophe into yokuba kulendawo into ebangela ukuba abantu bangakwazi ukufumana iTittle Deed zezizathu ,nezizathu, kule ndawo zezizizathu nezizizathu, kwaye nolaphando futhi singakwazi ukukubonisa ukuze uzokubona ezingxaki sithetha ngazo, zibangela abantu bangazi fumani iTittle Deed.

*The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I have a list of the areas hon member Mr Ncedana and there are a number of them. I would be happy to hand it to you. Khayelitsha, Phillipi and so forth and so-on. It is a long list that I will hand to you detailing the investigation that clearly states the reasons why in these areas people are not able to attain their title deeds. We can even share the investigation report with you in order for you to see the reasons why people do not get their title deeds.

The SPEAKER: We now proceed to the next question. Minister Plato, over to you, question number three.

Northlink FET College

***3. Ms J L Hartnick asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

What progress has thus far been made in respect of the co-operation between his department and Northlink FET College?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and to the hon member Ms Hartnick for the question. The reply is as follows:

3. Very good progress has been made so far and we are looking forward to continuing with the good relationship, because jointly we have so far reached out to many communities across the Western Cape Province. The purpose of the intervention, as the hon member Ms Hartnick is aware, is to afford unemployed youth from disadvantaged and crime affected backgrounds an opportunity to further their education and develop skills. The areas identified are predominantly affected by gang violence and high levels of crime. These communities can become a breeding ground for the recruitment of youth into gangs. This initiative aims to give alternative opportunities to the youth who cannot afford to pay for their further education. For all the above sessions the youth were mobilised by the Department of Community Safety to attend, and Northlink College made a presentation at each of the public meetings and provided all participants with the necessary application forms for completion and for submission directly to the college. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Any follow up questions? Minister Bredell, over to you, question number four.

Functioning of Oudtshoorn Municipality: role played by the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

- *4. Mr P Uys asked Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

What is the role played by him in the functioning or lack of functioning of the Oudtshoorn Municipality in the past year?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mnr die Speaker, dankie vir die vraag. Die antwoord is soos volg:

4. Sekere uitdagings bestaan sedert vroeër vanjaar met betrekking tot die funksionering van die Oudtshoorn-munisipaliteit en in besonder binne die munisipale raad. Gegewe hierdie situasie het ek gewis 'n rol in die funksionering van die munisipaliteit gespeel. As deel van my provinsiale oorsigfunksie was ek verplig om in te gryp toe dit duidelik geword het dat die munisipaliteit nie sy jaarlikse begroting vir die 2013/14-boekjaar goedkeur nie. Ek, met die provinsiale Minister van Finansies, Ekonomiese Ontwikkeling en Toerisme, het met inagneming van toepaslike wetgewing en regspraak 'n leidende rol in die hantering van hierdie aangeleenthede gespeel en na behoorlike konsultasie met die betrokke partye aanbeveel dat die provinsiale uitvoerende gesag ingevolge artikel 139(4) van die Grondwet goedkeuring verleen vir 'n tydelike begroting vir die munisipaliteit.

Die provinsiale uitvoerende gesag het op 17 Julie 2013 'n tydelike begroting goedgekeur en die munisipaliteit gelas om nie later nie as 30 September 2013 of op 'n sodanige vroeër datum waarop die raad sou besluit die 2013/14

jaarlikse begroting goed te keur. Hierdie datum is later uitgestel tot 29 November 2013. Die provinsiale uitvoerende gesag het deur die goedkeuring van die tydelike begroting vinnig en binne die regsraamwerk opgetree om toe te sien dat die uitgawes van 17 Julie 2013 deur die Oudtshoorn-munisipaliteit aangegaan, gemagtig en regmatig is, om voortgesette dienslewering te verseker. My Departement van Plaaslike Regering het met my medewete en goedkeuring 'n gedetailleerde spesifikasie opgestel met die doel om die toekomstige bestuurder se operasionele reëlins van die Kangogrotte te bespreek.

Gedurende Maart 2013 het die departement met die destydse waarnemende munisipale bestuurder en ander senior amptenare vergader en is daar voorlopig oor die pad vorentoe ooreengekom.

Na die dood van Mnr Lot, die waarnemende munisipale bestuurder in April 2013, kon geen verdere vordering gemaak word nie. Die voortgesette politieke en wetlike dooie punt het dus 'n negatiewe uitwerking op verdere onderhandelings gehad. Klagtes is van Oudtshoorn se belastingbetalers ontvang oor geraas en veiligheidskwessies wat deur die vlugopleidingskool se aktiwiteite by Oudtshoorn se munisipale lughawe veroorsaak word. Aangesien ek ernstig besorg was oor enige moontlike veiligheidsmaatreëls het ek my Departement van Plaaslike Regering versoek om aandag te gee aan die kwessies. Hoewel dit blyk dat daar verdere probleme ten opsigte van die gebruik van die lughawe is wat nog aandag moet kry, is ek die versekering gegee dat die vlugaktiwiteite wel oor die nodige goedkeuring van die

tersaaklike lugvaartowerhede beskik.

My Departement van Omgewingsake en Ontwikkelingsbeplanning oorweeg tans 'n artikel 24(G)-aansoek ingevolge Nema ten opsigte van geboue wat vir vlugopleidingsdoeleindes by die lughawe opgerig is.

Verskeie ander inisiatiewe in die Oudtshoorn-munisipaliteit is deur my Departement van Plaaslike Regering tot uitvoer gebring. So byvoorbeeld is terugvoering in Januarie 2013 aan die bestuursspan gegee oor 'n diagnostiese assessering wat deur 'n multi-dissiplinêre span onder leiding van die Departement van Plaaslike Regering gedoen is oor die stand van die funksionering van die munisipaliteit. Die uitkoms van hierdie assessering het die basis gevorm van die bystand wat deur die munisipaliteit benodig word en is deur die plaaslike regering se omdraaiprogram aangespreek.

As gevolg van die onstabiele politieke situasie is daar wedersyds tussen die departement en die bestuur van die munisipaliteit ooreengekom om die omdraaistrategie of ondersteuningsprogram tot tyd en wyl agterweë te hou. Verder is 'n munisipale kode ontwikkel wat binne die volgende week of twee aan die munisipaliteit beskikbaar gestel sal word.

Wat my rol as vierde respondent in die saak tussen *McPherson & Andere en Mnr Stoffels, die Speaker & Andere* betref, het ek opgetree om te verseker dat die demokratiese proses wat die gevolg is van 'n wettige uitkoms van 'n tussenverkiesing gehou op 7 Augustus 2013 kan realiseer deur toe te laat dat

daar oor 'n mosie van wantroue gestem word. Ek glo dat waar die demokratiese proses in die wiele gery word daar van my as provinsiale Minister van Plaaslike Regering vereis word om in te gryp, soos ek in die omstandighede gedoen het. Soos u seker verneem het, het die Kaapse Hooggeregshof op 12 November 2013 sy beslissing in die saak bekendgemaak. Onder andere het die hof bevestig dat die onlangse optrede van die Speaker onwettig en *mala fide* was. Dankie.

'n AGB LID: Hoor, hoor!

The SPEAKER: Any follow-up, hon member Mr Uys?

Mnr P UYS: Baie dankie, mnr die Speaker, en baie dankie aan die LUR. LUR, waarom het u die munisipale raad en die DA-komponent geadviseer dat die raadsvergadering gehou op 31 Mei 'n wettige vergadering was en wie het u geadviseer om sodanige besluit te neem?

The SPEAKER: Minister.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Speaker, ek adviseer alle rade. Ek adviseer nie 'n DA-komponent van 'n raad in my hoedanigheid as LUR nie en die agb lid mnr Uys moet dit nou asseblief eens en vir altyd verstaan dat my departement nie 'n onderskeid tref tussen watter politieke party in beheer is nie. Met dissiplinêre verhore het ek nog altyd die standpunt gehad dat 'n

persoon, 'n raadslid, 'n regverdigde verhoor sal kry ongeag, en ons rekord bewys dit. Hy kan die boeke gaan naslaan en gaan kyk. Wanneer 'n raad dus deur 'n demokratiese proses was, en ons kan 'n lang tree terugwaarts gee hier, ons kan teruggaan na Minister Richard Baloyi. U moet onthou dat die DA-komponent eintlik hierdie raad 'n maand voor die verkiesing - seker sewe weke voor 7 Augustus, oorgeneem het om stabiliteit te kry en om te sorg dat die inwoners nie die reg in eie hande neem nie. Ek het met Minister Baloyi onderhandel, met al die ANC-raadslede en hulle regsverteenvoordiger - wat ek dink eintlik geskrap behoort te word van die rol - vergader, en daardie vergadering ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, is the hon MEC allowed to make statements about ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes, actually [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: ... officers of the court in such a way in this House without them being given a right to reply?

An HON MEMBER: He is not talking about the court. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Speaker ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, order! [Interjections.] Order, hon ...

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.]

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN
ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ek is nie op die rol nie - I am not on the
roll.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, Order! Order!

'n AGB LID: Hy is nie 'n prokureur nie.

An HON MEMBER: He is expressing an opinion.

The SPEAKER: Is it a point of order hon? Let us address firstly the issue of
hon member Mr Ozinsky.

An HON MEMBER: I wanted a question, who is the Speaker?

The SPEAKER: No, no, take your seat. Take your seat. Hon member Mr
Ozinsky, the hon Minister expressed himself in Afrikaans and that is not my
language, so at this stage I cannot ... [Interjections.]

Mr M SKWATSHA: The translation is there. The translation is there.

The SPEAKER: Order! Do you want me to suspend the sitting for translation?

Ms M TINGWE: Yes. Yes.

The SPEAKER: Order, but I will then check in Hansard, hon member Mr Ozinsky, and I will come back to the House with a ruling on that matter.
[Interjections.] Order! You may proceed, hon Minister Bredell.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN
ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Speaker, kom ...
[Tussenwerpsels.]

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The money was paid to your attorney.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN
ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: In die vergadering met Minister Baloyi ...
[Tussenwerpsels.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: R8 million rand.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN
ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: En u moet onthou ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

'n AGB LID: Dis 'n skande.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN
ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ek het heeldag tyd. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members, order!

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN
ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ek het heeldag tyd.

The SPEAKER: Order! Minister Carlisle. Minister Carlisle and hon member
Mr Ozinsky, order.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN
ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Speaker ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Minister, order!

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN
ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Speaker in daardie vergadering
om die humeure te kalmeer en om - teen eintlik my eie party se medewete het
ek onderhandel en gesê kom ons vergeet hierdie kortstondige uitkyk na die
7de Augustus. Die 7de Augustus sal bepaal wie regeer Oudtshoorn al dan nie.
Daar was drie tussenverkiesings in daardie stadium, agb lid mnr Uys.

Indien die ANC al drie gewen het, sou hulle in beheer gebly het. Indien hulle een sou verloor het, sou die DA oorgeneem het. Dit het ons vir mekaar gesê, ons het dit geweet en in daardie vergadering het die ANC saamgestem dat indien hulle een van die tussenverkiesings verloor, sou hulle 'n konstruktiewe opposisierol gespeel het en ek het dieselfde namens die DA onderneem.

Mnr P UYS: Ons is terug by die 31ste [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dit het nooit gebeur nie, so mnr die Speaker om terug te kom na die hof, ek is besig om te antwoord. Daar was baie opinies. Daar was baie en ek het die hele hofuitspraak hier as u dit wil hê. Ek kan dit vir u lees, want dit lyk my nie u kan lees nie.

Die MINISTER VAN VERVOER EN PUBLIEKE WERKE: Hy kan nie lees nie.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Kom ek gee vir u kortliks 'n opsomming van wat gebeur het. Ek het die hof genader en ek het gevra dat - uit desperaatheid en om die gemoedere in Oudtshoorn te kalmeer - of die hof my kan help sodat ons 'n wettige raadsvergadering kan hou. Die hof het gesê dat dit is nie die LUR se verantwoordelikheid isom 'n dag en 'n datum van 'n raadvergadering te bepaal nie en ek berus daarby en ek aanvaar dit, maar die

regter het verder gegaan, mnr die Speaker, en hy het toe drie ander items aangeraak. Hy het die vergadering van die 4de September sowel as die vergadering van die 20ste September onwettig verklaar. Hy het gesê “the Speaker, the first respondent, to pay the costs of the application in his personal capacity.” [Interjections.]

'n AGB LID: Aha, ja, ja, die ANC!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Okay, “the Speaker’s conduct was *mala fide*. The Speaker prevented the motion of ‘no confidence’ from being put to the vote thereby securing his own position”, so it is all about a selfish motive from the ANC coalition ... [Interjections.] ... and that is the hon member Mr Uys’ advice to them. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The fact that the Speaker refused two of the councillors to vote ... [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: On a point of order, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms L BROWN: I want you to make a ruling on the fact that the hon Minister Carlisle said “for stealing, to you, for stealing from the poor” and he is addressing the hon Chief Whip. I want you to make a ruling whether that is right or not. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Minister Carlisle, please will you address her.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: No I - on this occasion - was not addressing the Chief Whip. I was explaining to the Chief Whip that the Speaker in Oudtshoorn is stealing his salary from the poor, which he is.

Ms L BROWN: On a point of order, Mr Speaker. If that is true, Mr Speaker, then is it true when the hon Minister Madikizela for example does not build the number of houses that he is supposed to build in a year [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Take your seat.

Ms L BROWN: Is he stealing from the poor and does that apply to every other MEC here?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Brown, take your seat. That is not a point of order. [Interjections.] Order! Order! Order, hon members, order! Hon member Ms Brown, order. Minister, over to you.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker, the judge further said that the Speaker, by refusing two of the councillors to vote without any process on the advice of the ANC provincial leadership, and the member Mr Uys is one of them, was *mala fide* and unlawful. Okay, to prove the point ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Ek praat van die 31ste.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: But, Mr Speaker, this does not surprise me at all.

Dit is 'n tipiese werking van die ANC in die Wes-Kaap. Hulle aanvaar nie demokrasie nie.

'n AGB LID: Ja, hoor so.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Vir die agb lid mnr Uys om terug te kom Parlement toe het hulle net die agb lid mnr Skwatsha se takke ongeldig verklaar, toe kon hy genoeg stemme kry om in te kom. [Tussenwerpsels.] So daar is geen prosesse nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

So now the hon member Mr Uys is bad and the hon member Mr Skwatsha must now move to the national Parliament, but he has the support.

An HON MEMBER: In the Northern Cape.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: He has the support. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: And we all know that.

The SPEAKER: Order hon members! Is it a follow-up? Order!

Mr P UYS: It is a follow-up, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Is it a follow-up, hon member Mr Uys? [Interjections.] Order hon members!

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Wil jy nog 'n pak slae hê?

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Of course, Mr Speaker, the MEC never referred to the 31st of May as I asked the question, but let me follow-up. Watter optrede beplan hy en het hy in werking gestel om op te tree teen

raadslid Nel wat op 'n bedrieglike wyse geld ten bedrae van R4,5 miljoen van die munisipaliteit wou steel om sy regskoste te betaal?

'n AGB LID: Wou steel? [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mnr P UYS: Ons het dit gestop.

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mnr P UYS: Ons het dit gestop.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Speaker, die agb lid mnr Uys, die agb lid me Brown het opgestaan en nou 'n vreeslike relaas gemaak oor 'n bewering. Ons moet nou baie pasop dat ons nie vryheid van spraak misbruik in die Huis nie.

'n AGB LID: Ja. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Daar is geen bewys nie. [Tussenwerpsels.] No, I did not do it, I did not do it. [Tussenwerpsels.] Jy het ook die stem verloor; saam met die agb lid mnr Uys en Fransman gekonkel, so jy kom ook nasionaal toe. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys, just give - Order! Order! Just give the Minister a chance to answer your question.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Julle weet mos dis die waarheid.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Ja, hy sal antwoord - sy rekening ...
[Onhoorbaar.]

The SPEAKER: Ministers, order.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ons almal weet wat daar gebeur het. Mnr die Speaker, in enige raad is daar 'n proses. Die ANC het hom weer eens skuldig gemaak aan korrupte optrede, want hulle het 'n verslag onwettig uit 'n DA-koukus gekry, [Tussenwerpsels.] Ons het - ons glo in ...
[Tussenwerpsels.]

Mnr P UYS: Jy het dit vir ons gegee.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We believe in this country in the rule of law, Mr Speaker.

Mr M OZINSKY: What law?

An HON MEMBER: Yes, what law, what law? ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: And, Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order!

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN
ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Die agb lid mnr Ozinsky is nou baie
skaam vir sy eie party. Ek verstaan dit.

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Ozinsky!

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN
ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Speaker, die agb Nel is skuldig
bevind aan niks. Daar was 'n gesprek en 'n koukus en die DA het dit gestop,
nie ek nie.

Mnr P UYS: Onwettig.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN
ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: 'n DA senior bestuurspan het ingegryp en

gesê dit sal nie gebeur nie. Ons sal nooit belastingbetalers se geld gebruik om 'n interne dispuut op te los nie. [Tussenwerpsels.] Dit was nie die agb lid mnr Uys nie. Dit was nie hulle regsspan nie. Hy was te besig om met Fransman te konkel sodat Skwatsha se mense nie kon stem nie. Dankie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. The MEC referred to the *mandamus* he tried to get. Did he in any way try to get it in any other municipality except Oudtshoorn? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon member Mr Uys, we work with a lot of municipalities. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order hon members.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Speaker, ons werk met 30 munisipaliteite. Ons leer ook volgens 'n regsproses wat ons mag en wat ons nie mag doen nie. Ons probeer tans om 'n 500-bladsye bestuursverslag van die Ouditeur-generaal in Cederberg te bekom sodat ons korrupsie kan voorkom en sodat ons stelsels daar kan invoer om te help, maar weer eens is die ANC in beheer en druk hulle die ding onder die mat in want hulle dink ons wil ingryp of iets doen.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Hoekom help hulle jou nie?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ons wil net help. Hy sal my nooit help nie, want hy is te besig om sy eie posisie te verseker [Tussenwerpsels.] Mnr die Speaker, ons tree dus op as 'n departement om alle munisipaliteite te help en weens ons goeie ondersteuning is ons 30 munisipaliteite die top munisipaliteite in die land. Dankie.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Hoor, hoor!

'n AGB LID: Nee man, jy hoef nie skaam te wees nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order. This is the last chance, hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Yes, thank you, Mr Speaker. It is just strange that the MEC did not say the report is with the MEC of Finance, but Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: What is your question?

Mr P UYS: Did Minister Bredell now learn from this that he has got no *locus standi* and that he will accept what the court rules?

The SPEAKER: Order! The question, the question?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: What is the question?

Mr P UYS: Will he accept that? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Ms L BROWN: That is the question.

'n AGB LID: Dis nie 'n vraag nie.

Ms L BROWN: That is the question.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSKE EN
ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Mnr die Speaker, ek sal dit baie graag wil
antwoord.

Mnr P UYS: Hy het nie *locus standi* nie.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Ek het begin deur te sê dat ek my berus by die hofuitspraak en ek dink dit was 'n baie goeie uitspraak. Dit is 'n uitspraak wat die demokrasie in hierdie land beskerm teen politici soos die agb lid mnr Uys wat alles wil manipuleer vir eie gewin.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Mooi! Mooi!

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dit is wat hierdie uitspraak doen. As ek môre in dieselfde posisie gestel word, sal ek heel moontlik dieselfde roete loop want ek moet ook die mense daarbuite kalm hou om te verseker dat die wil wat hulle uitgeoefen het die 7de Augustus toe hulle vir die DA gestem het en vir die ANC gesê het “ons is moeg, siek en sat van julle korrupte bestuur van Oudtshoorn-munisipaliteit” uitgevoer word Dit was die boodskap, mnr die Speaker [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mr M OZINSKY: It was only one ward. The other two wards voted ANC.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: En nou wil hulle hul mag verseker en vasklou daaraan ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mr M OZINSKY: It was only one ward! [Interjections.]

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... deur allerhande speletjies en dit sê die uitspraak baie duidelik: onwettige *mala fide*-optrede van die ANC. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Hon order! Order! Order! Hon member Mr Ozinsky, hon member Mr Ozinsky, I have warned you several times in this House that your interjection is very loud and we cannot allow it in this House. [Interjections.] Order! Order, hon members. We are not going to allow that and if you carry on, keeping on doing that, definitely you will leave this Chamber. [Interjections.] Order! That is the end of the question to Minister Bredell. Take your seat, hon member Mr Visser. That was the last question. Hon Minister Madikizela, we then proceed to question number 5, over to you.

Meeting between developers and Minister of Human Settlements

***5. Mr P Uys asked the Minister of Human Settlements:**

(a) What was the purpose of the meeting arranged by him for 21 October 2013 with developers and (b) who are the developers who indicated that they would attend the said meeting?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. The reply is as follows:

5. The purpose of the meeting with the developers, through you, Mr Speaker, to the hon member Mr Uys, was to engage the developers to unlock the challenges that exist in the affordable market. As you know, a number of people who are earning above R3 500 to R15 000 continue to be homeless because there is this huge reliance on grants, and we wanted to engage with the developers around partnerships that we can form so that we can unlock challenges that exist there so that we are able to roll out more houses in that particular space.

As regards the second part of the question, the response was overwhelming. There were a number of developers there. I have a list of the developers who signed the attendance register. There were about 45 developers who were there and I am very happy to share the list with you. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Thanks, MEC. Did you consequently identify the land and make that available publicly?

The SPEAKER: Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Well, the first part, I mean there is a process that we are going to follow. The first part obviously was to test the market, call the developers, engage them, share with them our

challenges and hear from them.

The second part is that we have identified pieces of land where we are going to call requests for proposals from the developers, because what we want to do is to get the right institutional arrangement and the funding model so that we do not rely on the grant too much in order for us to unlock challenges there. The next step is to then call for proposals which would be a public tender where everybody will be welcome to submit his or her proposals.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you Mr Speaker. Then why did your spokesperson Bruce Oom say the availability and the information around land are not for public information?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Well, as you know we did not want to put the cart before the horse. What normally happens ...
[Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: You wanted to cover up!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: What normally happens ...
[Interjections.] What normally happens, Mr Speaker, is that as we all know that once you start talking about the available land and where it is we have experienced a number of invasions and that is why you want to follow the

correct process so that you communicate that when we are at the point where we need to be. That is why I am saying it is going to be an open tender where people will be told these are the pieces of land and they will then submit their proposals and we are coming to that process, so that is the reason. So there is no secrecy around it. We just wanted to make sure that nobody has more advantage than others and make sure that we follow the process correctly.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Minister Madikizela, would you also go the route where the developers can identify the land and come forward to you with a proposal on land that is available from their side?

The SPEAKER: Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Certainly. Actually that is the process that the City has started already. In fact, the process at that particular level is that the City has already done that. The developers have come forward with the pieces of land that they own and the City is now in the process of getting the correct institutional arrangement and to also discuss the funding model with those developers, so that process has been followed by the City. We did not want to follow more or less the same process, but these processes are more or less similar. It is our land from this side, and on that side the City is engaging the developers to come forward with their own

land.

The SPEAKER: Last chance hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. This is only for Gap housing as I understood you correctly, if we define it like that. Why go this route only for that and not also for the lower income people to identify land in the same process?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: What we want to do, hon member Mr Uys, is to get the right mix. It is therefore not only going to be for Gap housing. By and large we want to address Gap housing, but we want the developers to get the right mix in terms of different percentages of these income categories, which will then also include the low income earners, the affordable housing and the higher end of the market. That is what we want to achieve. The land - the pieces of land that we have identified - are not exclusively for the Gap market, but by and large that is the market that we want to address, because that is where the challenges exist. We are doing a lot in terms of the low income earners from the grant that is coming from the Government.

Mr P UYS: Not for the poorest of people.

The SPEAKER: Order! That was your last chance, hon member Mr Uys. We now proceed to the next question. That is question number 6, Minister Botha

over to you.

Triage system: training for medical staff

6. Ms A J du Toit Marais asked the Minister of Health:

Whether there is any training in place for medical staff with reference to the triage system in public health facilities; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, Mr Speaker. The question is whether there is any training in place for medical staff with reference to the triage system in public health facilities. The reply is as follows:

6. In 2005 a standardised triage scale was developed by the Western Cape. It was called the Cape Triage Score. It was subsequently tested for reliability and validity in the Western Cape hospitals and in the 24-hour facilities. These studies showed a high reliability and viability when used by clients by different cadres of healthcare staff and high accuracy in identifying sick adults and children.

The triage scale has been continuously revised and improved and its implementation has been monitored and evaluated. The Cape Triage Score was then renamed to the South African Triage Scale after it had been adopted by many hospitals throughout South Africa. Since 2006 we

have been training Western Cape healthcare staff. The training is conducted by Ms Tomey who has a PhD in emergency medicine. The training included doctors, nurses and admin staff at hospitals and at the 24-hour facilities and the ambulance staff. Refresher courses are run every two years and staff trained since 2010 in all districts. 713 ambulance staff have also been trained in all the districts. 8-hour Clinics have not been receiving training as the load of patients is mostly non-urgent and a modified version is used in those facilities.

With the recent interaction with a company from the Bandwidth Barn called Tomsa, they have developed an electronic triaging system which I found very interesting and we have undertaken a pilot project at the Khayelitsha Hospital of which I hope to get the outcome very soon, although the early indications are already that it is a very well developed programme and assisting staff much in the efficiency of the triaging system.

I am also informed by some authority that the system that we currently use in the Western Cape is amongst the best in the world.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Any follow-up question? None. We then proceed to the last question. That is question number 7, Minister Madikizela over to you.

Projects 8448 and Mau Mau: construction of

7. Mr A M Figlan asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

When is the construction going to start on Projects 8448 in Gugulethu and Mau Mau in Nyanga?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you, Mr Speaker and thank you to hon member Mr Figlan for the question. The reply is as follows:

7. A tender for the construction of civil engineering services was advertised by the City of Cape Town and all supply-chain processes were followed. It was anticipated that should there be no objections after the 21-days appeal period the starting date for the commencement of services construction will be the end of September, but unfortunately something was identified where the overhead high voltage of the power lines was identified as a problem. The City is now redesigning the layout plan so that they can go out to tender again.

The SPEAKER: Any follow-up? None? Thank you very much, hon Minister Madikizela. Questions for the day have been exhausted. Order! I have been informed by the Chief Whip that the Premier is unavoidably absent today, so the questions to the Premier will then stand over.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. What is normal practice from all MECs in this House is to write to the members who pose the questions to apologise and say she will not be here or they will not be here and then consequently

say is it fine that we let this stand over. We did not receive any apology or any letter from the Premier indicating this and I would like to ask, there is normally an apology given to say the MEC is at Minmec. Where is the MEC [Interjections.] and Mr Speaker, where is the Premier? [Interjections.] Just one sentence. Let me finish, Mr Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order hon members! Order, just one sentence hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Just one sentence and then ... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Sorry, which rule of the House ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: If the Premier is not here why did she not appoint an acting Premier? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Take your seat, hon. It is very ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: It is one sentence!

The SPEAKER: It is very clear what you are saying, hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Where is the acting Premier then?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Interjections.] Do you - hon Chief Whip, there is no-one? [Interjections.] Order hon members! Order! [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, may I address you on this issue?

The SPEAKER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: In my capacity as leader of the House.

An HON MEMBER: No!

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Wie is jy? [Tussenwerpsels.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order, order! [Interjections.] You have only one - hon members – you have only one minute, hon Minister Botha.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys, order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, the hon Chief Whip of the Opposition and other parties were well informed of this at the programme authority as you know. So, I do not know what big issue you are trying to make of this, but you were informed, and you kept your comment until now

and did not use it when you had the opportunity to say so. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The rest ... [Interjections.] Mr Speaker, the Premier - this is now the second occasion that the Premier cannot reply to the questions. The previous one ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! There is a question from hon member Mr Uys and the hon Minister Botha is trying to answer you on where the Premier is.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: And I am addressing you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Please! Listen to him.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The Premier, Mr Speaker, on the previous occasion was at the Presidential Coordinating Council which is the Minmec for Premiers as he should know, and so she was on official business. The Premier has no reason to explain to the Chief Whip of the ANC about her whereabouts today. [Interjections.] She has not left the country and if he knew anything about the position of the Premier and the rules of this House he would have known that there cannot be an acting Premier when the Premier has not left the country. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please conclude, hon Minister Botha.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: But I want to say this, I want to conclude, Mr Speaker, by saying this: maybe what the ANC should do ...
[Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: No, do not order us!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... is they should compare the questions that has been replied to by other Premiers throughout South Africa and the President ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Shut-up man!

An HON MEMBER: That is nonsense!

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, there was a remark from the hon member Mr Ozinsky to say I must shut-up!

An HON MEMBER: No, Ozinsky did not say... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon, hon order! ... [Interjections.] Minister Botha, order! You will - I just want to give the opportunity - take your seat, hon

member Mr Ozinsky. Can you address me?

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Speaker, I have been sitting silently and neatly here since you admonished me earlier. I have said nothing.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: That is true. He did not say anything.

The SPEAKER: If then - Order! - if then hon member Mr Ozinsky said: "I did not know about it", we will refer to Hansard. Hon Minister Botha, please you have ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Mr Speaker, is it parliamentary for a member - hon member Mr Magaxa said to hon Minister Botha he must shut up? It is him who said you must shut up. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order! Order, hon members. Order. Take your seat, hon member Mr Skwatsha. [Interjections.] Take your seat. Take your seat. There is a question from hon Minister Madikizela that needs to be addressed first. What are you saying? Are you saying it was not hon member Mr Ozinsky, it was hon member Mr Magaxa?

Mr M OZINSKY: [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: We will also then refer it to Hansard. We will check who is the one who said it. [Interjections.] Okay. Order! Order! Order! Hon members, order! [Interjections.] Hon order! [Interjections.] Before you - hon Minister Botha before you conclude, there is a point of order.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Is it parliamentary for the hon Minister Madikizela to point at the hon member Mr Magaxa? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Will you take your seat. [Interjections.] Will you take your seat, hon member Mr Skwatsha. No, that is not a point of order. Hon members, order! Hon Minister Botha will you please conclude?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, may I just ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: May I just say, Mr Speaker, if the remark came from him, do not worry, no-one listens to him. [Interjections.] Mr Speaker, I want to conclude by saying that the Premier has a very good track record of being present in this House, much more than the Leader of the Opposition. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Order! Your time - Order! Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Okay, I am done.

The SPEAKER: Your time is over, hon Minister Botha. Your time has expired. Thank you very much.

Mr M SKWATSHA: How much time did you give him? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: No, it has expired. [Interjections.] Hon members, let us then proceed to the next item. We now move to statements by members. I recognise the DA. The hon member Mr Figlan.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Mr A M FIGLAN (DA): Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. Re-blocking has been successfully employed in the Mtshini Wam settlement, and other communities throughout the Western Cape should follow the example set by the City of Cape Town's informal settlement and pro-actively participate in the re-blocking of areas to ensure disaster-free living conditions for all.

† “uMtshini wam” eningawaziyo useMfuleni ... [Kwahlekwa] *“my Machine” that you do not know of is at Mfuleni ... [Laughter.] †I am sure ... I think they are going to change it to the President's name. The re-blocking of informal settlement is an

important and urgent reorganisational measure to decrease the negative impact brought about by overly dense areas. It must be ensured that re-blocking is not used as a political ploy to destabilise communities, but rather used to strengthen them through constructive restructuring.

Communities must re-align themselves in order to make use of the financial assistance and project structures established to facilitate the constructive relocation of communities and where individuals have to be relocated that it is done in the least disruptive manner. It is important that an informal settlement community is able to utilise service deliveries offered to them and make it easier for the City to perform regular service delivery tasks which are essential for healthy, organised living conditions.

The fact that the houses would be further apart would stem the spread of communicable diseases like measles, easy accessibility for an ambulance to reach a patient as soon as possible, minimise human suffering and save lives. It is imperative that fire engines timeously contain potential devastating fires. The regular removal of waste material and the services of water, sewerage linkages make for healthier everyday living.

Most important is the bigger open spaces re-blocking would allow where children can play under the watchful eye of a caregiver. Mr Speaker, the re-blocking ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr A M FIGLAN: ... of informal settlements is strategically focused to make the City of Cape Town an open opportunity city ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Figlan, your time has expired. Thank you very much.

Mr A M FIGLAN: Thank you very much. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: ANC over to you.

Mr P UYS (ANC): Thank you, Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, is there a captain steering the DA machine?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Yes.

Mr P UYS: Over the past weeks we saw the real DA unmasked due to the erratic outbursts, inconsistency and the psychopathic DA left without policy or principle. [Interjections.] The turncoat DA cannot decide on whether it supports the realities of this country or not.

It somersaulted on employment equity after it voted in support of an amendment bill. After this controversial flip-flop the DA caucus was shouted at, threatened and shifted around. The same schizophrenic DA ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members!

Mr P UYS: ... under the same leadership in the Western Cape provincial legislature in the last sitting supported an amendment bill to Black Economic Empowerment yet it voted against the very same bill in the National Assembly on Tuesday. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Uh uh, not true! [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Can the real DA please rise, and that is true. The directionless DA is like a beached whale that goes from bad to worse. The few survivors after the DA plane crash are now shipwrecked and on the rocks. [Interjections.] The split personality ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, order! [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

Mr P UYS: Mr Speaker, the split personality DA is in shameful disarray. It publicly bleeds on its own inflicted wounds. The DA is not good for governance or oversight. The personality disorder DA takes instructions from the team leader, namely absent Premier Helen Zille. With her the silly DA cannot even get a simple thing right such as to support or oppose a bill. Clearly the head is not in control of its divided members. Is it any wonder so many abandon the doomed DA ship? [Interjections.]

The DA's double standards are fast catching up with it. Instead of getting out of the ditch, Mr Speaker, it digs in deeper. Will the DA show any leadership or shall we see it do another frantic about turn on legislation today?

The SPEAKER: Order! hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! DA over to you.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Jy bring hulle in die skande.

Mr J J VISSER (DA): Thank you, Mr Speaker. Good is slowly to starting to reign over evil. We all know that people have a right to voice their unhappiness by means of demonstration. We all however also know that you cannot infringe on other people's rights while doing so. The ANC, and more particularly the union partners, apparently do not understand this very well.

It is embedded in the ANC's philosophy to disregard other peoples' rights, safety and property. They never take responsibility for their actions as well. The DA has set an example on how you take responsibility for your actions. Maybe hon member Mr Uys, the ANC should learn from this.

The farm protests which started in November 2012 and which were funded by

the ANC and mainly driven by the labour unions, especially Nosey Pietersen's Bawusa, resulted in one person dead and millions of rands worth of damage to property, but had another unintended result for the ANC, however. It led to the formation of farm worker forums which expressed its dismay of this type of action by the ANC [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: And rejected the work of the police.

Mr J J VISSER: Recently we saw a march by more than 3000 real farm workers where they peacefully protested against the ANC anarchists who threaten and assault them and deliberately infringe on their rights to decent work and a living, making their own decisions and a peaceful life.

When the court case started in Wolseley where a policeman was brought before the court for the shooting of a farm worker, Michael Daniels, Nosey Pietersen held a meeting trying to convince people to go on a march and burn down the court. [Interjections.] Real farm workers also attended that meeting and asked the other meeting members not to adhere to this plan of anarchy [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr J J VISSER: ...but instead to send Nosey Pietersen alone to do his own dirty work and to be there personally, not to be misused and abused by him any further. There was no march or burning down of the court or any other

anarchy on the day of the court sitting.

The SPEAKER: Order hon member Mr Visser, please conclude.

Mr J J VISSER: As I said, Mr Speaker, the ANC will not take responsibility for these anarchistic actions and condemn it.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Visser.

Mr J J VISSER: Thank you. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. COPE over to you.

†UMnu M NCEDANA: Enkosi kakhulu Somlomo,uRhulumente okhathalayo ekhathalela bonke abantu nguRhulumente esimbona ngezenzo ezicacisa oko. Lonto ithetha ukubana nguRhulumente oyakuthi agxininise, ukuba abantu banendlela yofumanan amanzi acocekileyo, banendlela yokufumana ucoceko kwezelindle nokufuma izindlu.... [Uphazamiso]... Now what we have experienced in the Western Cape is contrary to that, in particular in the area of provision for sanitation. ... apho khona abantu bakuthi besahlala besebenzisa iBucket System ekuzithumeni. Apho khona abantu bakuthi basazithuma kwi ndlela uN2 xa usiza emsebenzini ekuseni... [Uphazamiso]

Mr M NCEDANA: * Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. A government that cares for all people is a government that shows this by clear action. This then means that the government should ensure that people have access to clean

water; that they have access to proper sanitation, and have access to houses [Interjection]... Now what we have experienced in the Western Cape is contrary to that, in particular in the area of provision for sanitation ... where our people are still using the bucket system to relieve themselves and where our people are still using the N2 to relieve themselves. This is what is witnessed whilst on our way to work in the mornings. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mr Skwatsha. [Interjections.] Order! Order! Hon member Mr Skwatsha, hon member Mr Ncedana is on the floor.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member!

Mr M NCEDANA: As if it was not an embarrassment or an insult enough to use a bucket system, now they have been forced to stay in the house, to sleep in the house and eat in the house, and the toilet is in this house.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, just like in my house.

Mr M NCEDANA: This is a clear indication of a Democratic Alliance that does not care, has no regard for black people.

†.icace nasesidengeni into yokubana umntu omnyama uyokuhlala eyimfene kwezi nkokheli zeDA, ngoba ukubangabe besinoRhulumente okhathalayo,

bekungenokubakho uRhulumente ochitha pha kwizigidi ngezigidi zamawaka 4-5 million rands... ekuncediseni ezi toilet iPotepote...

*It is clear to any fool that a black person will always remain a baboon in the DA lead government, because if we had a caring government we would not have a government that spends R4-5 million in support of sustaining the use of porta-potties

†It is most expensive compared to the installation of infrastructure which would be decent and everybody would have access to. Shame on you.

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Hon Minister Madikizela! Hon members, order! [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Ncedana, hon Minister Madikizela. Order! [Interjections.] Member, can you please cool down? Order, hon member Mr Ncedana! Hon Minister Madikizela, order please. Order hon Minister, order. Hon member Mr Skwatsha, is it a point of order?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Over to you.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Is it in order for the hon Minister Carlisle to be embarrassed? [Laughter.][Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ANC over to you, statements, ANC.

Mr Z C STALI (ANC): How many more blacks must die and be buried before this DA led Western Cape provincial government regularise and assist ... [Interjections.]

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Are you accusing us of murder?

Mr Z C STALI: ...to defuse the growing taxi war in this province? Five people died so far in less than a week after they were shot in the Delft area. During October ten people lost their lives. The uncaring DA was warned repeatedly in this House about the problem dragging ... [Interjections.]

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Give us the national police ... [Inaudible.]

Mr Z C STALI: ...on for months whilst MEC Minister Carlisle laughed and mocked people about this serious matter. On whose head is the blood of all these victims?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: That is a good question.

Mr Z C STALI: Transport services are disrupted in affected areas and many commuters left stranded. They are too scared to go in the streets where bullets fly.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Speak to Mthethwa.

Mr Z C STALI: Where this DA government interfered and intervened
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] ... police, if they are not busy corrupting ...
[Interjections.]

Mr Z C STALI: It added more tensions ... [Interjections.] Only a few
individuals are preventing a settlement to be reached. [Interjections.] The big
associations are ready. The department must work out a new dispensation for
that area ... [Interjections.] ... to regularise the operators and issue permits.
The department's refusal to talk to operators who do not at this stage have
permits... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order Minister Carlisle, Order!

Mr Z C STALI: ...will have an even heavier cost ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: You must be mad.

Mr Z C STALI: ... with more people dying.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Carlisle, if you carry on, you will definitely
also leave this Chamber. [Interjections.]

Mr Z C STALI: The only reason why ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa, over to you. Order, take your seat, hon member Mr Stali.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Speaker, is it parliamentary for Minister Carlisle to say to the hon member Mr Stali he must be mad?

The SPEAKER: Minister?

An HON MEMBER: It is a question.

The SPEAKER: Did you say that to hon member Mr Stali?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Speaker, I say it out of honour to him because only a mad person can ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order hon Minister! Can you withdraw that statement please?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: All I can say is he is sane ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Carlisle can you withdraw without ... hon

Minister Carlisle.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I withdraw.

The SPEAKER: Okay, thank you.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I can apologise, but I will not do it. [Interjections.]

Mr Z C STALI: It is very unfortunate that the people who are dying happen to be black and that is why he does not care ... [Interjections.] ... and that is why he keeps on laughing. It is so unfortunate that the people who are involved in the taxi wars happen to be black and are in the black communities.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: They want to come and talk ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Carlisle.

Mr Z C STALI: ... and that is the reason why he does not care. You do not care! [Interjections.] That is the reason why you do not want to talk to them. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Carlisle! [Interjections.]

Mr Z C STALI: You are laughing. It is a laughing matter to you.
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon Minister Carlisle, I have warned you and that is the last warning to you. [Interjections.]

'n AGB LID: Kalmeer nou.

The SPEAKER: DA over to you. [Interjections.]

Ms J L HARTNICK (DA): Mr Speaker, November commemorates Diabetes Awareness Month and yesterday signified World Diabetes Day. Mr Speaker, 3,5 million South Africans suffer from diabetes of whom some are present in this House today, and there are many more who are undiagnosed.

More often than not the main focus in Africa is on infectious diseases such as HIV Aids, TB and malaria. There is little awareness around diabetes and its complications and many patients go undiagnosed or do not receive treatment in time. According to Dr Anil Kapur, managing director of the World Diabetes Foundation, few people realise that in Africa more than in any other continent, there are interactions between these three conditions and their various treatments.

Patients who receive anti-retroviral drugs are at a higher risk of developing

diabetes as some of the drugs cause glucose intolerance as one of the side-effects. People with diabetes have a greater risk to develop TB as diabetes reduces the body's immunity. In addition, the interaction between drugs to treat diabetes and TB reduces the effectiveness of both the TB drugs and the diabetes drugs, so it is difficult to control both diseases.

Mr Speaker, the fact that many diabetic patients only get help when they already have complications also places a great burden on the healthcare system, whereas 80% of type-2 diabetes could have been avoided through following a healthy eating plan and regular exercise. With this I commend Minister Botha and his department in their efforts for primary prevention, raising awareness.

The SPEAKER: Order! Thank you hon member Ms Hartnick. ID over to you. Chance not taken, DA.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE (DA): Mr Speaker, I believe that education is the best investment any person or institution can make. Look at the fabric of our past and you will see that education was one of the primary targets of race-based disenfranchisement. However, this fabric I speak of has over the past 19 years been monopolised to frame a narrow political agenda of success, an agenda which has begun to tank.

We are currently at the point in our democracy that can only be described as a "turn to lowest common denominator governance." Performance is instead

being shunted for personal benefit, prestige and power. Our opponents love to beat their chests when they succeed, yet our successes are often either rejected or simply hijacked.

Mr Speaker, I refer here to two research reports that have provided solid evidence that this government is taking structural, strategic, managerial, scholastic and financial tasks in our education very seriously. Yes, we have a long way to go, but every year we are closing that gap.

The Department of Performance Monitoring and Evaluation in the presidency recently released their report on the education sector for 2012/13, and its findings are very clear: the Western Cape Education Department is the best performing education department in the country, evidenced by the best overall MPAT key performance area score.

The second report is the report on the national school monitoring survey recently released by the Department of Basic Education at national level on 2000 selected schools. Out of the 15 indicators used in that survey study the Western Cape Education Department was the top performer in all ...
[Interjections.]

Mr H P GEYER: Hoor daar!

Me C LABUSCHAGNE: ...and is the only province to score a “1”, the highest extent of meeting each indicator. Mr Speaker, this government does not

aspire to mediocrity and these results are proof of that. Thank you.

Mr H P GEYER: Hoor, hoor!

The SPEAKER: ANC over to you.

Mr M OZINSKY (ANC): The DA provincial government continues to make the constitutional oversight role of the Western Cape Provincial Legislature a joke in the eyes of the public. Last week the Western Cape Education Department leaked the audit report on learner transport to selected journalists, whilst it has refused to allow Scopa to discuss the report in public for more than two years.

Mr M G E WILEY: It is deemed classified.

Mr M OZINSKY: The spurious arguments MEC Minister Grant and HOD Vinjevolt gave to Scopa in the House have now been shown to be false. [Interjections.] Worse still must be the embarrassment of the DA members of Scope, hon members Wiley, Labuschagne and Geyer, now and then supported by Walters... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr M OZINSKY: ... who vehemently supported the false reasons the department gave to Scopa in order to cover up this matter. Now that the

department has let them down, their kowtowing approach to oversight has yet again been exposed.

Even the Chairperson of Scopa, the ACDP's hon member Mr Haskin, is squirming in his seat for allowing, in the face of legal opinion by senior counsel to the contrary, the department to make presentations on the audit report without it being made public. Instead of arguing the reasons they gave Scopa in the House in front of a Court, the Western Cape Education Department simply gave the report to the press when confronted with the *Protection of Promotion of Access to Information Act* request. This shows the department knew the reasons they gave Scopa and the House were false and would not stand up in court. This should be a lesson to my colleagues in Scopa. I warned them the report would be made public. The only question was whether they were prepared to stand for principle or not and make it public. Yet again they have failed the test and have egg on their faces.

Even today after the WCED has leaked the report, I as a Scopa member am unable to discuss or share the contents of the report with members of the public ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M OZINSKY: ...because I received the report on a confidential basis in Scopa from the department. The ANC sees this as an attempt by the department and its political leadership to silence Scopa members in the

public debate on this matter ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mr Ozinsky.

Mr M OZINSKY: May I just finish my last sentence?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

An HON MEMBER: No.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Order. You may finish, hon member Mr Ozinsky.

Mr M OZINSKY: The ANC sees this as an attempt by the department and the political leadership to silence Scopa members. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mr Ozinsky.

Mr M OZINSKY: I am still finishing the sentence.

The SPEAKER: No. Thank you, your time has expired. [Interjections.]
Thank you very much. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon member Mr Ozinsky.
ACDP over to you. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! Hon members,
order! ACDP.

Mr G C R HASKIN (ACDP): Thank you, Mr Speaker. The ACDP is pleased that the Khayelitsha commission of enquiry has begun its work, recognising that this is a significant step towards understanding the reasons for and the extent of the breakdown in relations between the community and the police, and why the community have resorted to unconstitutional and illegal actions including mock-justice and necklacing rather than trusting the police and criminal justice system.

The ACDP appeals to community members, organisations, institutions and businesses in Khayelitsha to monitor and even participate in the commission's work and to make their voices heard to ensure that the commission is best able to fulfil its role for the benefit of the Khayelitsha community, SAPS and all in the Western Cape. The outcomes must effect community police relations throughout the Western Cape and improve police responsiveness and accountability.

On a second note, the government cannot allow Bawusa and its reckless self-serving officials to again threaten the Boland farming region's harvest season by intimidating farmers and farm workers, causing damage to property and crops. Instead of protecting and working for farm workers and the sustainability of the agri-sector in the Boland, Bawusa is threatening to plunge the region into further turmoil. Immediate action must be taken against all Bawusa officials and others who are inciting violence and further wildcat strikes and to destabilise the region, socially and economically.

Finally, the ACDP calls on the Western Cape Education Department to ensure the removal of ANC party political billboards from public school properties around the province if they have not already done so, and to bring to book those in the education department and in the ANC who made this happen.

In the lead-up to next year's elections the ACDP calls on all political parties to uphold all aspects of the law including the *Electoral Act* and those acts relating to the use of public infrastructure for party-political purposes. To adapt the words of president Reagan: "Minister, take down those billboards."

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mr Haskin. [Interjections.] Order! That is the end of the statements by members. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! We proceed to motions. The first motion, the Chief Whip.

MOTIONS

Me A ROSSOUW: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel die voorstel gedruk in my naam op die Ordelys, soos volg:

That the House rescinds the resolution adopted on 17 October 2013 with regard to the *Intellectual Property Laws Amendment Bill* [B 8 B - 2010] and confers the authority on the Western Cape's delegation in the NCOP

not to support this bill.

The SPEAKER: We are on the speaker's list. I see the hon member Mr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker. On 17 October 2013 this House took a decision with regard to the *Intellectual Property Laws Amendment Bill* to support this bill with no objections - all members. Today, Mr Deputy Speaker, the 14th of November, we have a motion from the DA to rescind that resolution. From the 17th of October to the 14th of November they changed their minds.

The first issue I want to address, Mr Deputy Speaker, is a ruling that you must make in terms of Rule 145 (2) (a) that no draft resolution may be moved in the House which is the same in substance as a draft resolution which was approved or rejected by it during the preceding period of six months.

Paragraph (b) refers to a situation where the six months is not applicable. All documentation that you read applies to this - six months, Mr Deputy Speaker, but in case you do not rule in this regard and I get the impression that that might be, let us try and understand why the DA is now all of a sudden opposing this piece of legislation? Why?

Mr Deputy Speaker, the object of this legislation is to amend the *Copyright Act*, the *Trademark Act*, the *Design Act* and the *Performance Protection Act*. But what is the objective here?

The objective is that the wealth of indigenous knowledge held by indigenous people of South Africa be recognised, preserved, protected and promoted and made accessible to the public. That is what the DA is now voting against, again voting that those poor people not be included in this.

Secondly, Mr Deputy Speaker, indigenous knowledge is a valuable economic as well as a cultural resource. By not voting for this we are keeping it away from the indigenous people, people sitting here in the gallery; people even in the House here. Mr Deputy Speaker, and its objective will benefit the country and ensure that fair financial benefits will also be received by indigenous communities and persons.

The principles have been agreed upon by international bodies like the following: the World Trade Organisation and the United Nations, confirming that indigenous knowledge shall be recognised and protected. Why must certain performers be protected in South Africa, whether it is a record, whether it is art, whether it is poetry, whether it is anything they are protected, but indigenous people are not protected? Again, it is the line that we see, Mr Deputy Speaker, employment equity - that problem there.

An HON MEMBER: Ah come on!

Mr P UYS: Broadbased economic empowerment - a problem there; indigenous people - a problem there. Why not protect them? We say here we reject this.

What the DA wants to do here today and we will oppose it, not only here but also nationally.

Ms L BROWN: Hear, hear.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Mr Haskin.

Ms L BROWN: Why bother with indigenous people, as long as indigenous people vote. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Rossouw.

Me A ROSSOUW: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, soos verwag probeer die ANC nou weer politiek maak van hierdie administratiewe regstelling, en net om dit sagkens te stel, ekonomies ... [Ohoorbaar.] [Tussenwerpsels.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Me A ROSSOUW: ...om hierdie aangeleentheid te plooi en te pas met riool-politiek wat hulle deesdae net aanhou bedryf. Wat is eintlik die feite? Op 17 September en is die komiteeverslag, op 17 September het die komitee dit goedgekeur [Tussenwerpsels.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: You were in the committee.

Me A ROSSOUW: Ja. Op 17 September het die Staande Komitee oor Finansies en Ekonomiese Ontwikkeling aanbeveel dat die Wes-Kaapse afvaardiging na die Nasionale Raad van Provinsies met die gesag bekleed word om nie die *Intellectual Property Laws Amendment Bill* te ondersteun nie. Dit is soos wat dit in die komitee goedgekeur was. [Tussenwerpsels.] Die komiteeverslag is op 18 September 2013 in die *Aankondigings, Tertafelleggings en Komiteeverslae* gedokumenteerd en gepubliseer en die komiteebesluit is aan die Provinsiale Raad van Provinsies in daardie stadium so gestuur.

Mnr P UYS: Verkeerdelik.

Me A ROSSOUW: Nee, dis nie verkeerdelik nie, want dit was die komitee se besluit op daardie datum. [Tussenwerpsels.] Die komiteeverslag waarin dit duidelik verduidelik is dat die wetsontwerp nie ondersteun word nie is op 17 Oktober aan die Huis vir ratifisering van die mandaat voorgelê. Ongelukkig het die administratiewe personeel wat die gids vir die voorsittende beampte voorberei het, fouteur deurdat die gids die teenoorgestelde ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde! Orde!

Me A ROSSOUW: ... posisie gereflekteer het.

Mr P UYS: But they voted ... [Interjections.]

Me A ROSSOUW: Dit is so in die Huis gestel en aanvaar...[Tussenwerpsels.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde! Orde!

Me A ROSSOUW: ... dit word hiermee reggestel. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde! Orde! [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mr P UYS: On a point of order, Mr Deputy Speaker. I think it is totally wrong for any person to attack the Table and the administrative staff when everybody voted for that.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr P UYS: It is wrong. It is wrong. It is like attacking you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. I did not read it as an attack, but ...
[Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Of course, they blame them.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we please tone it down.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Jy 'fight a sole battle' daar waar jy sit.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are you done? [Interjections.] Thank you.

Me L BROWN: Julle het aan die slaap geraak. Ek sê julle is aan die slaap.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Have you made a decision, Mr Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Is it a point of order?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yes, I wanted to, but have you made a decision yet?

Mr P UYS: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: I want to just add if I may. The Chairperson ...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: It is a point of order, yes it is.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: A point of order.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: It is a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, please continue.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: The reason why they voted was because the Chairperson was not here and they were sleeping. That is why it happened.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I have heard the point. [Interjections.]
Order! Order! Hon member Mr Uys, order!

An HON MEMBER: Wake up!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have had the opportunity – Order, please. I have had the opportunity to listen to the point of order. I will now put the question ... [Interjections.]

Hon member Mr Uys, I am busy putting the question and before I do that, your point of order is not a valid point of order. This is definitely not something envisaged by Rule 145 of the same substance. The House at any time has the power to rescind any decision.

Mr M OZINSKY: Whenever the DA suits itself ... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: And this is what is happening here. [Interjections.]
 Can we then put the question? I put the question. Those ... [Interjections.]
 Order! Those in favour of the question will say “aye”.

HON MEMBERS: Aye.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those against will say “no”.

HON MEMBERS: No.

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think the ayes have it, and so they have. We move
 on to motion number 2. [Interjections.] Order! Motion number 2. The Chief
 Whip.

Me A ROSSOUW: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel die voorstel soos gedruk
 inmy naam op die Ordelys, soos volg:

That notwithstanding Rule 161(3) the House considers the finalisation
 of the *Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill* [B 7 - 2013] should
 the principle of the Bill be approved.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Motion number 2 on the Order Paper in the name of
 the Chief Whip has been put. I put the motion, those in favour will say “aye”.

HON MEMBERS: Aye.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those against “no”.

HON MEMBERS: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think the ayes have it. I think the ayes have it, and so they have. The motion is carried. [Interjections.] We then proceed to the other motions.

Agreed to.

'n AGB LID: Jy slaap alweer, slaap alweer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We proceed to motions where notice is given. Are there any motions where notice is given? Agb lid me Marais.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek gee kennis dat ek sal voorstel:

Dat die Huis die gereedheid van die Wes-Kaapse regering ten opsigte van die komende feesseisoen debatteer.

[Kennisgewing van voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon Mr Stali.

Mr Z C STALI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the spike in the taxi violence relating to the Delft and Khayelitsha taxi road conflict.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Any more? Is ons klaar, Hon member Mr Skwatsha?

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the DA's lies around the funding and planning of the Mitchells Plain Hospital.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Ag nonsens.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Are there any further? For the last time? Hon member Ms Prins.

Ms E PRINS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the myths around job losses.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde! Agb lid me Prins, is u mikrofoon aan?

Ms E PRINS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the myths around job losses on farms since the announcement of the 52% increase in the minimum wage.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Kennis geneem. Notice taken. Hon member Mr Skwatsha.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the arbitrary closure of the Hanover Park Day Hospital arising from the provincial government's failure to address gang violence in the area.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Mr Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the DA's creation of slums in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Mr Stali.

Mr Z C STALI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the fact that more corruption charges are levelled against provincial traffic head Mr Kenny Africa.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

Ms L BROWN: And we warned you [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Agb lid mnr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the blatant corruption on the part of DA

councillors.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Are there more? Hon member Ms Prins?

Ms E PRINS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the growing dissatisfaction on the part of labourers in the Western Cape farming areas.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Are there any further, hon member Mr Ozinsky?

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the absence of any assistance by the provincial government to military veterans.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Agb lid mnr Uys.

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the DA's failure to discipline their councillors who contravened the rules of council.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Kennis geneem. Notice taken. Are there further, hon member Mr Ozinsky?

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the statement by the hon Minister Madikizela to Scopa that the Auditor General agreed that the Housing Fund submit its annual report of 2011/12 late.

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Are there any further? Agb lid mnr Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discuss the appointment of Mr McBride to the position of IPID. [Interjections.]

[Notice of motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Are there further; any further? [Interjections.] Okay, nothing further. Then we continue. Are there any motions without notice? I see the hon Leader of the Opposition first.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Ms L BROWN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House extends its condolences to the family and friends of Dr Pat Gorralla, a leading businesswoman, a former member of the UWC Council and former President of the Anglican Women's Fellowship, who passed away this week.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objection to the motion being

moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

Mnr J J VISSER: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis kennis neem dat die kategoriewenners van die Boer van die Jaar-kompetisie al drie van die Wes-Kaap afkomstig is en derhalwe sy gelukwense oordra aan Rossouw Cillie van Ceres, Witzenberg, wat die kategorie Nasionale Boer van die Jaar gewen het; aan Andre Cloete, 'n boer van die Overberg, as wenner van die kategorie Nuwe Toetreder tot die Kommersiële Landbou; en aan Professor Nick Vink van die Universiteit van Stellenbosch wat die toekenning gekry het as Landboukundige van die Jaar.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing nie? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie?

Goedgekeur.

Mnr H P GEYER: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis mnr Cornelius Paulse gelukwens met sy aanwysing as die Wes-Kaapse Plaaswerker van die Jaar tydens 'n spoggeleentheid op 25 Oktober op Stellenbosch. Mnr Paulse is ook vandag ons gas daar bo in die

galery. [Applous.]

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Mnr Paulse, baie geluk van ons kant af. Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing nie? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie?

Goedgekeur.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family, friends and comrades of former MK operative Agnes Nokhatywa who passed away in KTC.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

Me A ROSSOUW: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis mnr Marius Scholtz, die skoolhoof van Hoërskool

Piketberg gelukwens met sy benoeming onder die top tien onderwysers en as wenner in die afdeling Uitnemendheid in Hoërskool Leierskap, wat op 9 November 2013 deur die Wes-Kaap Onderwysdepartement aangewys is. Mnr Scholtz se loopbaan strek oor 33 jaar en onder sy leiding het die Hoërskool Piketberg se hooffokus geword om 'n werk- en leerkultuur te skep. Hy dien as inspirasie vir ons mede-opvoeders en leerders. Ons wens hom voorspoed toe met sy nasionale deelname.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing nie? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie?

Goedgekeur.

Mr M C WALTERS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its congratulations to the Western Cape Minister of Agriculture, Gerrit van Rensburg, who was recently inducted into the *Confrérie des Chevaliers du Tastevin* in Burgundy, France, in acknowledgement of his contribution towards the promotion of food and wine in the Burgundy region of France. This is Minister Van Rensburg's second accolade. He was also inducted into the *Commanderie du Bordeaux* in 2012 for his contribution to the South African Wine Industry and his work to promote South African Wine in France. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by member.]

AGB LEDE: Mooi! Mooi!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

Mr G C R HASKIN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Sister Maria Goodier of Ruyterwacht on receiving the annual Cecilia Makiwane Nursing Award and applauds her lifetime of dedication and selfless service to the people of the Cape wherever she has served.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

Ms V HANI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family, friends and comrades of the former MK operative who also served the Military Intelligence of

Sundown, Sizwe Mpolweni, also known as Dlayani Sithole, who died after a long illness.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself? Agreed to. I see the blue before I see the green, hon member Ms Hartnick first.

Agreed to.

Me J L HARTNICK: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die balletdansers Kim Veira, Jesse Milligan en Ivan Boonzaaier gelukwens met hul benoeming as die beste dansers van die jaar deur die Kaapstadse Stadsballet. Balletdansers wat ook met spesiale erkennings vereer is, is Laura Bosenberg. Sy ontvang die Geoffrey Nieman en Brian van Rheede-toekenning, en Rosamund Ford ontvang erkenning vir die mees belowende Opkomende Danser van die Jaar.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

Ms L BROWN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family, friends and comrades of former Gender Commissioner Tebogo Maite, who also served the Anti-Apartheid Movement as an MK operative.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion itself? No objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection?

Agreed to.

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die senior hip-hop span Vuelta van die Wes-Kaap gelukwens met die derde plek en brons medalje wat hul tydens die 2013 FISAF Internasionale Fiksheid en Hip-Hop Unite Wêreldkampioenskappe in Belgrado, Serbië, ontvang het. Die span is Marzanne le Roux, Wesley Jantjies, Regan Domingo, Ziane le Roux, Kelly Erntzen, Joseph Louw en Eric Daries.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder

kennisgewing nie? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie?

Goedgekeur.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family, friends and comrades of Youth Activist and ANC member Mzuvukile Ntunja who was buried last week.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

Ms C LABUSCHAGNE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulations the following persons: Avril Crouch, Wendy Horn, Lorna Such, Roelene Loots, Ingrid Leukes, Junain Adonis, Marsha Schwartz, Hywil Appolis en Christian Hattingh, all of whom were honoured in their respective categories for their dedication and service to education in the province at the Western Cape Teachers Awards held on the 8th of November 2013.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion without notice? No

objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House sympathises with those who have lost family members and have been displaced as a result of shack fires over the past few weeks.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis Louise Driver gelukwens met haar toekenning as Global Fundraiser of the Year, wat sy in ontvangs geneem het by die Internasionale Fondsinsameling-toekenningsaand in Nederland. Louise Driver is die hoof van die Children's Hospital Trust.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing nie? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie?

Goedgekeur.

n Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family and friends of 51 year old Ralph Smit who was shot and killed in Lotus River.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

Me A ROSSOUW: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy medelye betuig met die gesin, familie en vriende van Joe Dauth, digter, skrywer en biograaf van die legendariese “Troebadoer van die Tankwas, Dirk Ligter”. Hy is op 6 November vanjaar op die ouderdom van 76 oorlede.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing nie? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie?

Goedgekeur.

Ms B G MBALO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its condolences to the family and friends of 15 year old Chuma Booï who was stabbed on a bus by eight gang members in Khayelitsha.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House extends its congratulations to *The Test Kitchen* in Woodstock and head chef Luke Dale-Roberts for being named the Best Restaurant in the Country for the second year in a row at the Annual Eat-out Awards held over the weekend.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing nie? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie?

Goedgekeur.

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that 40 nursery school children have tested positive for TB after being exposed to their teacher's infection in

Hermanus after doctors treated her for a chest infection but failed to test for diseases.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

Mnr J J VISSER: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis Warren Bam gelukwens met sy toekenning as die mees belowende jong boer van 'n voormalige benadeelde agtergrond. Hierdie kompetisie word jaarliks deur Agri SA gehou en die toekenning is by Nasrec Expo Sentrum in Johannesburg gedoen. Bam is ook 'n Wes-Kapenaar en hy kom van die plaas Lushof in die Tulbagh-area. Dit is in Witzenberg. Twee van die ander finaliste was ook Wes-Kapenaars, naamlik Andre Cloete en Nicolaas Slinger.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing nie? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie?

Goedgekeur.

Mr M OZINSKY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates freedom fighter and military veteran Robert McBride on his nomination as the next head of the Independent Police Investigative Directorate as we are convinced that his academic qualifications, his work experience and his history as a victim of the abuse of power by apartheid forces, some of whom are here ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M OZINSKY: ... make him well qualified for the task.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Hear, hear!

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Enige beswaar teen die voorstel? Daar is beswaar. Dit sal op die Ordelys gedruk word.

An HON MEMBER: Shame on you ... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde! Orde!

Ms M TINGWE: Shame on you, shame on you.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Hear, hear.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! I see the hon member Ms Mbalo.

Ms B G MBALO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns MEC Anton Bredell's unwarranted and illegal attack on the office of the Auditor General and discrediting the credentials of employees in the office.

[Motion as moved by member.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yes.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Is daar enige beswaar? Daar is beswaar. Dit sal op die Ordelys gedruk word. It will be printed in the Order Paper. Anybody on this side, hon member Ms Labuschagne? Sorry?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Is it parliamentary for a member to say "gat" to us?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I did not hear that. What did this member say?

[Interjections.]

'n AGB LID: O ja, jy het gesê hy is 'n dronkgat.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid mnr Von Brandis.

'n AGB LID: Jy is 'n dronkgat.

Mnr E J VON BRANDIS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek het nie gesê - ek het dit nie gesê nie, hoor.

'n AGB LID: Hy het.

Mnr E J VON BRANDIS: Ek het gesê ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Ek weet nie wat u gesê het nie, maar het u die woorde wat hy genoem het, gesê?

Mnr E J VON BRANDIS: Ek trek terug en ek vra om verskoning.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: U trek terug, baie dankie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

'n AGB LID: Hy het dit nie gesê nie, man. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Goed, ek sien - orde - wie is volgende, agb lid mnr Geyer.

Mnr H P GEYER: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy gelukwense oordra aan mnr Fanie Nel, die hoof van die Augsburg Gimnasium Skool en voorsitter van die Wes-Kaapse Jeugskou wat by die Jeugskou op Kroonstad die trofee gewen het vir die provinsiale span wat die meeste punte behaal het, asook aan me Annelien Van Wyk, ook van Augsburg in die Wes-Kaap span, wat die trofee vir die span met die beste

administrasie verower het. Die Wes-Kaapse leerders het 12 brons, 13 silwer en 13 goue toekennings ontvang.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Enige beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing? Geen beswaar?

Goedgekeur.

Me C LABUSCHAGNE: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis mnr Donald Grant, Minister van Onderwys, die Departement van Onderwys Wes-Kaap, en alle bestuurspanne op distriks- en skoolvlak bedank en gelukwens vir die wyse waarop die verskaffing van boeke aan elke leerder vir elke kernvlak en elke graad vir 2014 verseker is. Dit is 'n eerste in die provinsie en dit is prysenswaardig.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing nie? [Tussenwerpsels.] Order. Is there an objection? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Ms Tingwe.

Ms M TINGWE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates 23 year old Sibahle Tshibika from Khayelitsha who won the "So You Think You Can Dance Competition" on

SABC3 and is now able to build a home for her mother and pay for her grandmother's funeral.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

ME A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis alle rolspelers en in besonder Minister Botha gelukwens met die opening van Mitchells Plain-hospitaal. Dit is 'n tasbare en sigbare bewys van uitnemende dienslewering. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde! Orde! Agb lid, die laaste woorde het weggeraak. Kan u net weer herhaal? Ekskuus. [Tussenwerpsels.] Orde!

Me A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Dit is 'n tasbare en sigbare bewys van uitnemende dienslewering deur 'n DA-beheerde regering.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Is daar enige beswaar teen die voorstel? [Tussenwerpsels.] Orde. There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Ms Mbalo.

Ms B G MBALO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Mbalo, please continue.

Ms B G MBALO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that CapeNature has signed another agreement with farmers allowing them to cull jackal and caracal.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

Me J L HARTNICK: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy gelukwensings oordra aan Jan Duminy van Ou Meule tehuis in Riversdal wat op Woensdag 13 November sy 109de verjaarsdag gevier het.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Sjoel Dankie vir die voorstel. Geen beswaar teen die voorstel van die agb lid nie? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder

kennisgewing nie?

Goedgekeur.

Mnr M C WALTERS: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis sy gelukwense oordra aan Heinrich Kulsen en Elmarie Botes, twee deelnemers aan die Kaapse Wynmakersgilde Protégé-program. Hulle het pas teruggekeer uit Frankryk as deel van die Wes-Kaap en Boergondië se uitruilprogram.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing nie? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie?

Goedgekeur.

Mnr E J VON BRANDIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates Cape Town for placing third in the Lonely Planet Survey of the best travel destinations in the world.

[Motion as moved by member.]

'n AGB LID: Ja, ja.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

Mnr H P GEYER: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis Phillip Huisamen van die plaas Gifberg buite Vanrhynsdorp gelukwens met sy aanwysing as die Rooibosboer van die Jaar.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing nie? Orde! Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie?

Goedgekeur.

Mnr J J VISSER: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis die jongmense van Witzenberg welkom heet en tuis laat voel met hulle opvoedkundige besoek vandag aan die Parlement.

[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie, agb lid. Ons neem kennis daarvan. Geen beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennisgewing nie? Geen beswaar teen die voorstel self nie?

Goedgekeur.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We proceed. The next item on the order paper is

the subject for discussion in the name of the Leader of the Opposition as printed on the Order Paper, as follows, the socio-economic state since the DA has been in power. Ek sien die agb Leier van die Opposisie.

SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION

The socio-economic state since the DA has been in power

Ms L BROWN: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. The DA's open opportunity society policy ignores the current glaring economic and therefore social inequalities brought about by a long legacy of apartheid, exploitation and oppression, and as much as you whinge about it, it happened apparently.

The DA's flip-flopping around the *Employment Equity Bill* says: Let us keep the employment in the country essentially white and male and let African and coloured people deal with the legacy of apartheid as if all is equal.

The DA's position around Black Economic Empowerment tells us very clearly that they desperately want to keep the economy in white hands. How do you change the socio-economic conditions of the past if you do not want to share and you do not make any efforts as government to share the fruits of the present economy and if the state will not use our tax money to improve the quality of all our people's lives?

In fact, it is those who are most vulnerable who are the first casualties of the DA government. One of the first things the DA government did when it came

into power was to take away the free trade from seniors at the cost of R3 000 per month.

An HON MEMBER: Where do you come from?

Ms L BROWN: And I thank God for Tony Ehrenreich and Cosatu who picked it up. In fact, let me tell you, you are paying today R17 500 per day to Vusi Pikoli and R7 000 to Kate O'Regan. The case against the police or the Commissioner of Police ... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: And R18 million is ... [Inaudible.]

Ms L BROWN: ... has not even started. I am here in the Western Cape. I have been elected in the Western Cape. I am interested in what happens in the Western Cape ... [Interjections.] ... and for months and months and months they have been doing nothing but getting R17 500 per day to work per day.

Mr M C WALTERS: Unprincipled.

Ms L BROWN: Very unprincipled, very, very unprincipled [Interjections.] In fact, the DA has a wonderful mantra that they pay almost R14 million for. Well, they do not pay, they pay TBWA R14 million. It spends R14 million to create perceived wisdom amongst commentators, but does it hold up to the facts? The mantra is that the Western Cape is governed and there is better service delivery because it is run by the DA.

An HON MEMBER: Yes. [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: Well, I do not know. [Interjections.] I do not think any of you live in Imizamo Yethu. I do not think any of you live in Parkwood Estate. I do not think any of you live in Mitchells Plain. I lived there. I grew up there. I was born in Parkwood Estate.

An HON MEMBER: You did not count Khayelitsha.

Ms L BROWN: In fact, few who make this point ... [Interjections.]

Ms E PRINS: Do not laugh. It is a serious matter.

Ms L BROWN: ... actually looked - they laugh at poverty in this province. That is the problem.

Ms M TINGWE: Yes.

Ms L BROWN: They laugh at the fact that they have taken away resources from poor communities. Shame on you!

Mr H P GEYER: That is an assumption!

Ms L BROWN: Shame on you! You laugh because you have taken resources

away from the poor. Let me tell you ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We will get to the truth.

Ms L BROWN: As we have come to this province, you know hon Minister Botha, we have had a decision taken to build two hospitals; one in Khayelitsha and one in Mitchells Plain.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: [Inaudible.] Mitchells Plain.

Ms L BROWN: You know... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You stopped it!

Ms L BROWN: You know that we ran a programme for SMME's. You stopped that programme in 2009/10 at a time when Casidra told us that SMME development through the red door came to - made R20 million. You stopped it.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: We have a way better programme. We proved it.

Ms L BROWN: But you cannot prove anything. You cannot prove anything. Take housing - I am sorry Minister Madikizela is not here.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: We do not steal the ... [Inaudible.]

Ms L BROWN: According to Census 2011 - well, I mean, those who steal should please stand up and say who steal, and I am now talking to the Leader of Government Business. [Interjections.] In 1996, 82% of the population already lived in formal housing in the Western Cape. By 2011 this declined to 80.2%. By comparison to Gauteng percentages are not 1.1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, just as a lesson to you hon member Mr Walters. Do you understand, percentages; do you know percentages; by comparison to Gauteng which experienced a 10% higher in-migration over the same period, they increased access to formal housing from 74.8% to 79.8%. The actual number of houses in Gauteng is far higher given that the population is more than double that of the Western Cape.

During ANC governance housing delivery increased year-on-year. In fact, in 2009/10 with an ANC budget the DA delivered 16 500 houses [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member Ms Brown, please finish off.

Ms L BROWN: And since then it has declined year-on-year, 2010/11 you only delivered - you delivered 2000 houses less year-on-year.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Your time has expired.

Ms L BROWN: Thank you. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon Minister Botha.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much for the opportunity and to the hon Leader of the Opposition for actually being so brave to put this point on the agenda for discussion in debate.

I want to start with an opening statement by saying that I think the biggest honour and response that government can do and responsibility a government has towards its citizens is to govern properly, because when you govern properly everything else falls into place. That is something that we have changed in this government. What we inherited was not a good government and everyone knows that. That is why you changed your Premier. That is why you, the hon Leader of the Opposition, had to try your very best in the last few months to save what was left of what was once a government. We inherited that and we have in a very short period, Mr Deputy Speaker, been awarded by the national government's measurement tools, the MPATs. We have been awarded for strategic management as the best province in South Africa with 95%, while the Eastern Cape for instance got 49%.
[Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: The ANC government also won that award! The ANC government also ... [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: We also won that award.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Governance and accountability: we have been awarded by the national government as the best province with 70%, while the Eastern Cape - listen to this - had 16%.

An HON MEMBER: Ah! Jo!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: In HR management, Mr Deputy Speaker, we got the award as the best with 55%, while a province like Gauteng got 14%.

'n AGBLID: Sjoe! Wow!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: In accordance with financial management, you know, you cannot do socio-economic development if you cannot get these things in place and have them in place. With financial management ...
[Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: That is why we build fewer houses year-by-year.
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: With financial management we obtained the first position in the country within four years, from a bad government we inherited at 81%, while the Northwest got 10%. It is as if it does not exist when you have that type of percentage. As if that was not enough, in the Stats South Africa we obtained some other very unique achievements. I want

the hon member Mr Ncedana to listen to this because he got a little bit lost in his message or in his statement which he made today. We have the lowest unemployment in South Africa. If you have the lowest unemployment then surely you must be successful in socio-economic development, but when you have a 99% - and this is the best performance in South Africa. 99.1% of the people of this province has access to piped water. We are the best in South Africa with 91.1% with refuse removal. We are the best in South Africa with 93.4% for electricity provision. We are the best in South Africa with 96.9% with toilet facilities. [Interjections.]

'n AGB LID: Aikona!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Toilet facilities! So I do not know what you use. I do not know what you use. [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker, those are only a few general statistics which I am giving this House ... [Interjections.] ...or reporting in this House on what was given or awarded to us by independent adjudication. Year-on-year we achieved an average of 78% of our budget spend on the poor community in the Western Cape [Interjections.] So if you have spent 78% year-on-year you have spent by far the most, but the difference is we spend the money. [Interjections.] If you look at the performance of the other provinces they do not spend it.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes, you spend the money to feed the rich.

Ms L BROWN: Yes, you close the clinics where the poor are.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: No clinic has closed. Let me tell you what. Beds declined ... [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: Where the poor are!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Hospital beds declined under Pierre Uys, hon member Pierre Uys [Interjections.] and staff declined under the hon Pierre Uys. The opposite happened with us. [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: Your nose is growing.

An HON MEMBER: That is not true. You know it is not true.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, the hon Leader of the Opposition is very - she is very restricted with the information she gives about housing, for instance. Why does she not say that R400 million of the housing budget was without their notice top-sliced to do other development, urban upgrade, and that was finance granted from the national department, so we could not perform ... [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: You could not perform ... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: But we did, we did deliver 111 500 housing

opportunities, and that is better than what you delivered in your term of office. [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: What? [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Pinocchio!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: Your nose is growing!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We are the only Department of Health in the country with an unqualified audit year-on-year, the only department.

Ms L BROWN: Yes, and ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: No, no.

Ms L BROWN: Yes.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Year-on-year, year-on-year. Mr Deputy Speaker, when we took office we had 26 000 staff members in health, because it has been reduced by my predecessor.

Ms L BROWN: No, no.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Now we have 32 000. [Interjections.] We employed 6 000 more people in the Department of Health.

Ms L BROWN: Your nose is growing!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We deliver services to 5,3 million of the 5,8 population in the Western Cape, which is the highest percentage in the country. We have the highest TB cure rate in the country. We tested a million people during the past four years. It is more than double what you tested in your era. We have increased the number of people on ARVs. What we inherited from you, 16 000. We increased that to over 120 000; 120 000 people.

Mr M C WALTERS: Gee! Mooi!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We improved the immunisation. We reduced many diseases and I cannot go into the detail of all of this because there are too many to mention, but for instance the mother-to-child transmission rate of HIV ... [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: We started that, we started that.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You had it at 8% ... [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: We started that.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We are at 1% ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: You know it is not true.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The best in the country, Mr Deputy Speaker.

Ms L BROWN: We started that!

Mr P UYS: It was not 8%

Ms L BROWN: We started that.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We transport 92% of all ambulance cases within 30 minutes. When I took office it was more than 45 minutes.

An HON MEMBER: That is not true.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, the CDU project ...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The CDU project, Mr Deputy Speaker ...
[Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Yes I started that ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: When we took it over you had dealt with 120 000 prescriptions. Mr Deputy Speaker, we currently do 220 000 prescriptions per month. We more than doubled it. [Interjections.]

We have changed and improved the patient experience with the hotline SMS which we have implemented, which gives real time solutions to patient problems within 15 to 20 minutes. We have the best triaging system in the world as I have mentioned during question time. We have employed Ernst & Young to do behavioural modification for us amongst our staff to improve the treatment that our patients have and that they should experience. Mr Deputy Speaker, but there was specific mention by the hon member - what is his name? - Mr Stali, about the public facilities. We have opened more than a 100 new facilities. You did 35 in your era. We have already opened ...
[Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: That is not true. You know it is not true.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We have already opened more than 100 facilities over the past four years. You spent R1,1 billion. I have already

spent 2,7 billion.

Mr P UYS: That is not government's money.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You planned R4 billion; you planned R4 billion. I am planning R10 billion. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The money was ... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We inherited a dysfunctional government. [Interjections.]

Ms M TINGWE: Oh please!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: And a dysfunctional government cannot create economic development and uplift the social economic standards of the people of our province.

Mr P UYS: And this is what we are going to inherit next year.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: There is, however, one department of which we have a dual responsibility in this province in as far as we have oversight in that regard, and that is in community safety and the SAPS. But, Mr Deputy

Speaker, the real responsibility of that department lies with the national government, and if you analyse this government and the activity in this province, that is the only department that is dismally failing the people of the Western Cape. We have improved on everything except on community safety, because SAPS has never ever, and yesterday was the last blow I must say, with Robert McBride that was really the last blow. I must tell you, Mr Deputy Speaker, SAPS cannot sink ... [Interjections.]

Mr H P GEYER: Shame on you!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: SAPS cannot sink any lower.

Mr H P GEYER: Shame on you!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It cannot sink any lower and what are you doing to socio-economic development if you cannot even guarantee people's safety ... [Interjections.] ... if you cannot even guarantee people's safety? [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker, what we have done in our government is we have not only - we have not only improved socio-economic standards in this province by outperforming everything as I have mentioned here, we have also redressed the legacy of apartheid, our best and most important objective to rectify. We build our facilities, we are changing the ratio of teachers to pupils. We are changing the ratio of doctors to community. We are improving all those things by redressing. Mitchells Plain Hospital, Mr Deputy Speaker, through you to the Leader of the Opposition, was a hospital that her

government stopped. They stopped it. Why? Was it for political reasons?

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: My department - it is under my leadership that that hospital project was revived and approved and built in our era and is one of four new hospitals ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: It is not true.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: ... with which you had nothing to do.
[Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: Show me where?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Minister Botha, your time has expired.
[Interjections.] Order! Is there a point of order?

Mr M G E WILEY: It is a point of order. Mr Deputy Speaker, the Leader of the Opposition says that the hon Minister Botha lied, and it is on top of the fact that constantly from the other side there is an allusion to lying by saying he is a Pinocchio, which is totally unacceptable in parliamentary rules.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, the second one I had my own doubts about,

but I let it go, but the reference to lying, I did not hear. Did the hon member say that?

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That must be withdrawn please.

An HON MEMBER: Absolutely!

Ms L BROWN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I said ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Just withdraw. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hey, do not shout.

Ms L BROWN: If you are rude to me one more time... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order please. Get to the point. I was asking whether you used ... [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: If you are rude to me one more time! Shut up, you!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Hon leader. [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: Sit down! And I did say shut up, you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M G E WILEY: Sorry, Mr Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Did you say that? Did you say you withdraw?

Ms L BROWN: Sorry?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Did you withdraw that?

Ms L BROWN: Did I withdraw what, Sir?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The fact that you said "lie".

Ms L BROWN: I did say he is lying.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Then that must be withdrawn.

Ms L BROWN: And I withdraw it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We can continue. Hon member Mr Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, a direct threat has been made against

me. That is also unparliamentary. [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: I would like to address you on the matter. A direct threat for a black woman living in South Africa is when a white man screams at her and says: "Speak."

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms L BROWN: That is a direct threat. So I am asking you to ask him not to threaten me!

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. Order! [Interjections.] Order! Order! Please calm down. Please calm down. Hon member Mr Wiley, I did not see that. I did not hear that, but please tone down. [Interjections.] I was actually on the point of giving the floor to the new speaker, hon member Mr Haskin. I am not going to rule on that one.

Mr M G E WILEY: I do not want you to rule on it. I would like to defend myself. You have just ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No you cannot ... [Interjections.]

Mr M G E WILEY: You have just ... [Interjections.] With all due respect, Mr

Deputy Speaker, you just accepted that what she said is the truth. It is not the truth.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I did not say that. I asked the House to calm down, because I am not going to allow these accusations across the floor while we had a decent debate up to now. Please tone down the personal reflections upon one another and concentrate on the very important topic before us.

Mr M G E WILEY: Yes. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: And please, hon member Mr Haskin, you can have the floor.

Mr G C R HASKIN: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is easy and tempting to spew out statistics to demonstrate that socio-economic conditions in the Western Cape have either improved or not since the DA has been in power. The ACDP does not want to participate in this, primarily when it denies the plight of the majority of our people who find themselves languishing in poverty due mainly to unemployment and inequality and the lingering affects of apartheid. The reality is that the Western Cape and Cape Town in particular has been the beneficiary of government development for multiple generations. Socio-economic conditions in the Western Cape are always clearly better than the rest of South Africa. They have been for generations and they will be for generations; pre-1994 and since, and in particular whether the ANC or the DA has been in power or not.

Ms M TINGWE: Yes.

Mr G C R HASKIN: Therefore it is disingenuous for parties to now take credit for this beneficiation, although of course we do recognise the successes of governance and delivery by both the ANC and the DA whilst they have been in government. Undeniably we all know that this beneficiation has had a significant impact on generations of citizens ... [Interjections.] ... whose access to and reliance on public infrastructure and increased economic and lifestyle opportunities and whose ability to springboard these for a better life have exceeded those in the other provinces, but much more still needs to be done. The apartheid legacy continues to exist in and to affect all of life. Few people can escape its impact, but too many people choose to ignore the reality.

I wish to raise two concerns in this debate. The Blikkiesdorp temporary relocation area was set up well over five years ago and was meant to be temporary, but it has become permanent. Instead of emptying and closing it, it has been further populated. Conditions started off mild to okay but they are now appalling and worsening. For them - for the thousands of people who live in Blikkiesdorp temporary relocation area - their socio-economic conditions and outlook have worsened significantly. We continue to call for the relocation of all those families and for the closure of Blikkiesdorp. It should be an embarrassment to any government. The ACDP remains concerned at the City of Cape Town's concerted efforts to continually raise

municipal rates and tariffs to near unaffordable levels ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Please finish off.

Mr G C R HASKIN: The ACDP has repeatedly called for a 0% rate increase and further rates rebates to help secure our people's dwellings, but these fall on deaf ears. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Your time has expired. Thank you hon member Mr Haskin. [Interjections.] I see the hon member Ms Bevu.

Ms T N BEVU: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Minister Botha, you cannot compare Buffalo City with the City of Cape Town; you really cannot.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I beg your pardon?

Ms L BROWN: No!

Ms T N BEVU: You cannot compare Buffalo City of the Eastern Cape with the City of Cape Town in the Western Cape, you cannot.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I did not.

Ms T N BEVU: You did, you did.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I did not.

Ms T N BEVU: You did!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I did not.

Ms T N BEVU: We have in the past demonstrated that poor people's living conditions in the Western Cape are worse than the national average. Poor people since 2010 have experienced a lessening growth spending income in this province. As a result, there is a larger increase in the poverty gap in the Western Cape than at national level. [Interjections.]

We said this leaves us with only one conclusion. That is that the trajectory of economic growth in this province is against the poor majority, which is why inequalities are growing at an alarming rate. Worse, there is evidence to show that the current economic trajectory is not just a random consequence of market forces; it is the deliberate actions of DA government to defend and continue the apartheid generational advantages in the Western Cape.

To demonstrate what we meant we used data from Census 2011 for Cape Town's 132 suburbs. Take a working age population greater than 5000 and you will discover that even though the Western Cape prides itself for having the lowest unemployment rate, which is still too high in global rates in the country, it also has the highest unemployment rate in poor areas. The deceptive low average is reached because of Cape Town's highly affluent

areas that virtually have no unemployment rate. For example in Sonstraal Heights and Rondebosch the unemployment percentage is around 3%, whilst in places like New Crossroads and Kosovo it is around 51%, which is the highest unemployment rate in the country.

We believe this status quo is deliberately being kept in this manner by the DA government that does everything in its power to develop the CBDs and affluent areas of the province, but turns its back on the poor areas that are predominantly black.

The DA refuses to meaningfully invest in informal sector business, to start public sector initiatives that are run by and for the benefit of people living in these areas. Even the EDP has become just another club for old white boys with brown window dressing here and there. It does nothing for the poor areas. In fact, it marginalises them further. Instead the DA government chooses to downplay our socio-economic realities that are the major legacy of apartheid in order to “cosy-up” to white big business.

This was demonstrated by the recent U turn they made in supporting the *Employment Equity Act Amendment Bill*.

Mr M G E WILEY: Ah, come on!

Ms T N BEVU: Also, the DA deliberately chooses not to fulfil its constitutional mandate of providing people with decent human settlement. Its record of housing delivery is pathetic. For what? To satisfy elitist tendencies

that are ultimately designed to exclude the poor from any meaningful participation in the economic life of this country. You can come with all sorts of sophisticated arguments about how the Department of Human Settlements is not just about providing houses to people. The truth of the matter is that it has failed in its core responsibility, which is providing decent living space for our people, which includes serviced sites that the DA was talking about when we started in this legislature.

The department lowered its target to a ridiculous number of 5000 units per year for the whole province and still failed to deliver even that. Meantime the MEC himself has said the backlog was around 500 000 for the province, and you are going to tell us this is not deliberate sabotage and neglect of black poor people in this province?

All the social cluster departments are failing. Why? Because they are chiefly responsible for servicing the poor and the DA could not be bothered. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Ms Magwaza.

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Mr Deputy Speaker, whilst the DA claims to govern a Western Cape where opportunities are open to all, we have seen that since they came into power the vulnerable have been shut out of this so-called “open opportunity society”. Our vulnerable youth are victims of crime in the townships, the ill have no access to private healthcare, the homeless and

women in poor communities are disempowered by the DA-led provincial government. Their social conditions have regressed since the DA came to power.

In one of the most violent provinces in the country where gangsterism reigns supreme, where 68 women are sexually violated per day and in which one in five children are addicted to tik, MEC Plato reduces CPFs to oversight committees. MEC Fritz oversees the taking away of funds from NGOs like Nicro and many others. The amount of drugs and alcohol being peddled from council property across the Cape Flats is further proof of the incompetence of the DA. Drug lords dictate their own terms and our people are innocent victims of the DA's inability to effectively deal with the social ills of the communities.

It is ridiculous that the DA-led provincial government chooses to close down the Ottery Youth Centre. Instead they keep the Horizon Youth Centre open.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: It is still open. It is still open.

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Shut up! Sorry, sorry, sorry. I am sorry. I am sorry.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Just withdraw that.

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Yes, I withdraw. Sorry.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, carry on.

Ms N P MAGWAZA: But you shout at me, man! Recently! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Fritz, you will get your chance.

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue, the hon Minister Fritz will get his chance.

Ms N P MAGWAZA: Recently residents of Cape Town were shocked following revelations of torture at Horizon Youth Centre. The DA's public denial of these facts was laid bare when a senior magistrate removed the two boys from the Horizon Youth Centre and placed them in the Ottery Youth Centre and education centre for their own safety. The irony of this sordid affair is that the DA intends closing down the 67 hectare Ottery Centre at the end of 2013 while propping up the Horizon Youth Centre with millions of rands of wasted taxpayers' money.

Why close down the Ottery Centre if this state asset already exists with infrastructure, grounds and staff? Who are the new owners of the prime piece of the state land in Ottery? What is their connection to the DA-led provincial government and why is this sale taking place before the 2014 elections? I am

asking.

Instead of assisting the NGOs with adhering to financial reporting criteria, which the ANC will do when it governs the Western Cape, this DA government takes away funding from those, from them, because in their view they feign intent of financial reporting. Instead Minister Fritz wastes his department's money on paying the salary of the head of department, who is Enoch Richardson, whilst he is not playing the role of HOD and playing the acting HOD.

The black majority in this province are forced to utilise public healthcare, which is not on the level of private healthcare, which the white minority are accustomed to. The DA is not radically transforming this tardy balance. The elderly continue to experience medicine dispensing chaos at the Hanover Park day hospital as has been exposed in the media, with long waiting times. When the hon member Mr Skwatsha raised these issues around Hanover Park in this House, MEC Botha dismissed the claims. Now due to gang violence the DA wants to relocate the hospital away from Hanover Park. There is no concrete plan to address the high rate of teenage pregnancies. Instead Zille focuses on lottery prizes for girls who do not fall pregnant. The DA has turned back the clock on the ANC's healthcare gains in the Western Cape. When the ANC led national government sought to ensure equal quality healthcare through their introduction of the NHI, emphasising a publicly funded medical aid, the DA opposed it. They tell us that the private medical aid companies and private hospitals will suffer. For the homeless people of the province life has become

a constant nightmare under the DA. No less than 42 homeless people have died on the streets of Wynberg alone. Has the DA investigated this tragedy? No!

Instead Minister Fritz has the audacity to say that the people of the Western Cape must make life uncontrollable for people living on the streets by not giving money to beggars. This heartless approach fails to recognise that homelessness requires a multi-pronged approach.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Finish your last sentence please. Your time has expired.

Ms N P MAGWAZA: The DA has lurched from one failure to the next with regard to the most vulnerable in our province and it is time for them to be removed from political power. I thank you. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, your time has now expired. Hon MEC Fritz.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Mr Deputy Speaker, the hon member Ms Magwaza must tell that to the voters and she will see what they do.

I want to start off by saying that the ANC is always accusing the DA of neglecting the needs of especially poor people in the Western Cape. This is

the usual banter and propaganda which they repeat over and over again, and we know in history Joseph Goebbels, Hitler's propaganda Minister in Nazi Germany, said: "If you repeat a lie often enough people will believe it and you will even come to believe it yourself", and so I can only assume that this is what the ANC is trying to do by repeating the blatant lie. Like Ottery is a blatant lie, Mr Deputy Speaker. We are not - who said we are closing Ottery and who is getting Ottery? That is a blatant lie and they start to believe it. That is the problem with my hon colleague.

How ironic is it, and it is even more ironic when these allegations are tested by official structures that publish scorecards and yardsticks with which to measure progress in various provinces because we must compare with something. We cannot compare with Robben Island. We must compare with another province, and when we do the comparisons, Mr Deputy Speaker, let us give you some of the examples.

The financial and fiscal commission in the submission for the division of revenue in 2014/15 found that the Western Cape Department of Social Development spends the biggest portion of its budget, which is 68%, on transport payment to NGOs, more than any other province in this country. And then the hon member comes to this House and blatantly tells a lie about it. The department also ensures exceptional value for money. I want to repeat that, they ensure exceptional value for money, as no-one can run away and steal money.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Orde, agb lid. Order! Order! You cannot say that she told a blatant lie.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I withdraw. I withdraw.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: These NGOs are rendering services in our most vulnerable communities and most poor communities, not in Constantia, and this is the other myth that they continue to tell here in this House.

Childcare and protection is a major focus in this department. We fund over 1060 ECD centres across the province and are currently also working on 800 unregistered facilities to help them to comply with norms and standards as directed by the *Children's Act*. These facilities are in our poorer communities. Mainly, and because we understand the consequences of limited resources, we are going out of our way to assist and upgrade these facilities. We also train over 800 ECD practitioners to actually get quality education into our ECDs.

Nearly 100 000 children across the Western Cape benefit from safety nets created by these ECDs, but it does not stop there. This is also job creation to more than a thousand people. This is job creation. It is an income for people in the poorer areas, and this is the point that we want to emphasise.

We also place between 2200 and 2500 children in foster care every year, and not only does this result in better living conditions for many children but it adds to the household income in many of those foster care homes. The foster care grant helps with the income and the impact in that house. Since 2010 we have diverted nearly 10 000 children and over 16 000 adults away from the criminal justice system to alternative sentencing and through our diversion programmes.

It is so interesting, Mr Deputy Speaker - the former MEC that gave Bosasa the Horizon contract that we now have to manage because it is their buddies, it is their friends who get the contracts. Bosasa is one of their very, very best friends, and therefore we now have to manage it. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Order! There is a point of order.

Ms L BROWN: I mean he accuses the previous MEC hon member Ms Magwaza of giving contracts to her buddies. I do not think that is right. You cannot make an accusation like that here because then I can make accusations about you too, which I want to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Fritz, are you going to help us?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I withdraw that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Victim empowerment, the hon member was talking about it earlier. Victim empowerment has also seen a major boost under the DA run Western Cape government. This year's budget alone of R18 million is literally double from last year and it is massively triple from when we came into this province, where they did nothing about it, and then they point fingers and this is the joke about this debate.

We have increased the youth development budget from R2 million to R30 million in this province. We have written ... [Interjections.] ... and we have just finalised a phenomenal programme on youth development, specifically as it pertains to the needs of those young people not in employment, education or training. This year alone we have absorbed nearly 700 young people in extended public works programmes in our programme.

These young people are now able to contribute financially to their households, which in turn has a direct positive result on the entire family. These are some of the practical points. It is not mythical issues. It is not assumptions. These are factual issues that I am raising here.

The other programme - our favourite programme which I know my hon friend and comrade hon member Ms Magwaza- the Chrysalis Academy, have now placed over 600 young people into work opportunities. These are practical

things. Ons praat nie - ons doen! *Facta non verba* - in Latin for you!

Let us also look at a matter that is close to the heart of this province and to most and every parent sitting here. The children of this side, they do not go to private schools, they go to the school nearest to them. [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: Which is in Gugulethu.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The state of our education system, a system that attracts over 15 000 learners from other areas: I do not even want to mention it, but people are fleeing those areas because of poor education. They come to the Western Cape where there is good quality education, and so let us unpack that. We have reduced the number of underperforming schools from 85 to 26, but to them it was okay. Teachers could just do what they wanted to. They strike, forgetting about the teaching. That is what they have been doing. The average national senior certificate pass rate in our poorest schools in Quintile 1 to 3 increased, Mr Deputy Speaker, it increased from 56.9% in 2009 while they were in government to 70.9% in 2012. Those are tangible measurable results, and this is what they cannot get away from.

The national senior certificate pass rate has increased from 75% in 2009 to 82.9% in 2012. There has been an increase in a number of candidates writing the national senior certificate. Over 430 000 learners receive lunch every day at school, every single day, and she is saying we have taken away. So hon

member Ms Magwaza with respect, please listen to this, please pay attention to what we are saying.

In last three years the DA-run Western Cape government have allocated the highest amount in the country for provision of fee compensation to cover some of the cost of poorer learners - the highest in the whole country, and the hon member is saying: "We do not care for the poor." What a dismal refrain. We perform better than any other province in the annual national assessments and they know it. They know it. That is why people are deserting schools in the Eastern Cape to come here. The Western Cape Education Department is well ahead of any other province in terms of textbook provisions.

Ons ken Limpopo. Ons het gehoor wat gebeur het. Limpopo collapsed. That is the point. They stole the money of the books and this does not happen in this province [Interjections.] Telematics - since the success of the telematics pilot in 2009 the programme has continued to expand year-on-year in the Western Cape, and today a total of 146 schools across the province receive broadcasts. We are now even broadcasting to the Free State and to the Northern Cape. Even they are using the telematics programme, and this is the point. Let us help. Let us produce. Let us assist, hon member Mr Skwatsha. Let us give to everyone. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I want to finally say, Mr

Deputy Speaker, that we need to - everyone spoke about the open opportunity - practically illustrate today that it is an open opportunity society where - and for all, not for any colour, for all that will make and save this country. Everyone spoke so eloquently about the EE but they do not say that part of the provision says that national demographics will be applied in the Western Cape. They do not say that, because they know. No-one will vote for them if they say that. I thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] I see the hon Minister Plato.

Die MINISTER VAN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID: O genade! Mnr die Speaker, ek het nou nie my oog op die debat gehou nie.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Plato, going, going, gone. Dan sien ek die agb lid mnr Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Skewed development patterns are inherent to the DA racist and liberal ideology. The contradictions of this ideology are currently playing themselves out in the DA's embarrassing internal fallout around the *Broad-Based Black Economic and Employment Empowerment Equity Bill*.

In its attempt to maintain their traditionally white racist support base they attract naïve Africans like Minister Madikizela. The DA seems not to know if

it must support transformation on the surface or remain stuck in its reactional approach that insists on maintaining the racism status quo. When the ANC governed the Western Cape the number of houses built increased every year. However the number of houses built has actually decreased every year since the DA took over in 2009. It is a shame that a province that has always been advantaged even before 1994 has a major housing backlog.

In the Western Cape in 1996, 82% of the population already lived in formal housing. This declined to 80.2% by 2011. By comparison, Gauteng which experienced a 10% greater increase in population than the Western Cape in the same period, increased access to formal housing from 74.8% to 79.8%. The actual number of houses built in Gauteng is far higher given that their population is more than double of the Western Cape. Instead of building houses for our people, making land available for building of houses, the DA wastes hundreds of thousands of taxpayers' money to take people to court who wish to make their land available to homeless people.

The uncaring DA dragged Sheikh Abdulla Parker before Judge Desai in the High Court as he had provided accommodation for about 500 homeless people on his own land, dubbed "Jim se Bos" in Philippi.

According to court papers the DA claimed that property was being used as an illegal dump and was a fire hazard. Judge Desai ruled that Parker was the sort of gentleman that should never appear before a court, and accused the provincial government of choosing to deal with the dispute in a very illegal

way. The taxpayers' money was illegally squandered by MEC Bredell on this court case.

Why are our people not being accommodated on the open urban spaces lying unused all over the Peninsula? In June 2006, when Mayor Helen Zille promised to accommodate backyard dwellers from Parkwood in Pelican Park whilst standing on an open piece of state land in the leafy suburb of Fairway. The truth is that those people are still waiting on Zille to make good on her promise. The land in Fairway, the size of about eight rugby fields, remains barren. In February this year the houses of fourteen black families were damaged by fire that destroyed most of their belongings. Despite residents having proved that a faulty cable from electric poles caused the fire the DA led City of Cape Town has still not compensated them. According to the 2011 census the Western Cape is not the province with the highest percentage of household with access to flush toilets. That is the fact. Under the DA we are also amongst the provinces with the highest percentage of bucket toilets.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Then which province has the highest?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, it smacks of hypocrisy for the City of Cape Town to speedily roll out eight new MyCiTi routes in predominantly white and upper class areas whilst continuing to delay the MyCiTi service to the Cape Flats. The MyCiTi N2 express route link to Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha with the City Centre was meant to be rolled out in December this

year. Unfortunately the City says it will only be rolled out in July. No delays are experienced when MyCiTi is rolled out in white areas. These excuses were not made for the Milnerton roll-out. Millions are being spent to subsidise routes where most home owners have cars. It is in this context of a DA imposed unequal society that the Western Cape, which is one of South Africa's richest provinces, dominates the headlines for public unrest. Even today there were marches. There were two marches here. Whilst we condemn the looting that took place in the city centre last month we are clear that the DA-led Western Cape government treats our people with utter contempt.

The DA's refusal to accept the memorandum with thousands of protestors' service delivery demands, is an insult to the poor of this province. The DA failed to send a senior elected public representative to receive a memorandum from the people. They have instead tainted a known partisan civil servant, the legislative secretary, Royston Hindley, by sending him to accept the memorandum on behalf of the DA government. The people's memorandum was addressed to the government and not to the legislature. Zille must tell us when she ever had the decency to receive a memorandum from the poor protestors. Instead even today she has treated public representatives with disdain by not being present in this important debate. Unfortunately, Mr Deputy Speaker, the people of the Western Cape are beginning to see who this unprincipled DA really is. The DA support days has been dropping during bi-elections since 2011 across the province. Our people are ...

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Your last sentence please.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Can I finish, Mr Deputy Speaker? Our people are heralding in the ANC-led government in the Western Cape that listens to our people's demands and seriously engage them, as it was. The ANC will always subsidise houses for people who do not qualify... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr K E MAGAXA: Let me finish the sentence. [Time expired.]
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have given you time. Order! No! Your time has expired. I see the Minister of Finance, Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I think first of all the question on the Order Paper asked by the hon member Ms Brown, the socio-economic state of the province since the DA took over, I think in short – is in a much better state. But let us get into this discussion and this debate and I think first of all I want to start off by asking can we trust and believe what we have been told from that side of the House. I will get back to that just now - can we trust and believe?

Before I get there I think there has been much said about investment,

specifically in poor areas. You know that we have upped the infrastructure spend by three times in this province from what we inherited when we took over from this ANC.

It was interesting when we opened the Mitchells Plain Hospital just the other day. There was a row of empty seats, but cleverly those people that had RSVPd and said they are coming, their names were written on the seats. It was interesting that it was ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: We were not invited.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: It was the hon member Mr Skwatsha's name that was sitting on the seat. [Interjections.] It was the ANC members who did not pitch to the launch of this infrastructure built in the middle of the area. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Order! Is that a point of order?

†UMnu NCEDANA: Ewe Somlomo sisiphakamiso , kulento ayithethayo ngezitulo. Llento yokubana izitulo bezingenabantu besibiziwe?

* Mr M NCEDANA: Yes, Mr Speaker. It is a point of order. Referring to the statement made regarding empty chairs, were we invited?

Ms M TINGWE: Yes. Yes.

An HON MEMBER: That is true. We were not invited.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I cannot answer that question. The Minister must please continue. That is a question of invitations.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I trust, Mr Deputy Speaker, that this is going to obviously not count into my time.

Mr M OZINSKY: Of course it is. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The next thing is, let us talk about infrastructure. I remind this House again of that hospital. You can go to any private hospital in the city in this country and in the world and then go and visit the Mitchells Plain Hospital. It is better than any private hospital - and they laugh. It is obviously because he has not been there. [Interjections.] I dare him to go and have a look. It is better than any private sector hospital I have ever been to across the world. [Interjections.] Then let us have a look at, and perhaps while I am talking about infrastructure spend, when last - you have not been to that hospital. I dare you to go. When last have you been to Harare in Khayelitsha and had a look at the nearly R1 billion that has been spent there and seeing the difference that it has made? Go and have a look at the police stats on the 11% decrease in crime that is happening in Harare in

Khayelitsha, because of the investment of money that is being put into that space. What this side of the House is saying, nothing happens in those areas, in that infrastructure spend ... [Interjections.]

Mr M OZINSKY: And what about the ... [Inaudible.] ... in Khayelitsha?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... and the whole time this side of the House - we heard from the hon member Mr Magaxa that he was talking about the service delivery protest. Have a look at every single time there is a service delivery protest whether there is an elected ANC public representative or if there is an ANC head of a branch or a structure that is standing in the front of that service delivery strike, every single time. [Interjections.]

At the same time have a look at the R4 million that the Minister of Agriculture gave to Nosey Pietersen to ramp up the strikes in that space. Look at what happened at the IDZ and the 3000 food parcels that were handed out. Those same ANC leaders of those branches were trucked in from across the province again ... [Interjections.] Look at the cuts in the flights. Every time they do these things to try and slow down economic growth in this province, we will show them we will turn it around. [Interjections.]

But let us have a look at - I am not going to repeat the stats that the hon Minister Botha spoke about, the 99%, the 91% and all of those kind of high percentages that this province gets rated at - the 1% that he left out. You

have to look at some of the service delivery in some of the parts of this province, especially in conjunction with infrastructure spend. There is a town in this country that has had huge infrastructure spend, huge, and it looks like it is going to get billions more. But the service delivery level provided to the residents of that town is only 32%. That is Nkandla - 32% is the service delivery to the people that live in that town, except this huge infrastructure spend was only spent in one space.

When the hon Leader of the Opposition talks about the ... [Interjections.] ... how it has changed in the province ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... what we should look at ... [Interjections.] ... is the key measurement. It is called the Gini coefficient. Have a look at the Gini coefficient. Have a look at the Gini coefficient of Johannesburg - the worst, then followed by East London, then followed by the East Rand, then followed by Pretoria, then followed by Port Elizabeth [Interjections.], then followed by Durban, and the best in South Africa, Cape Town. It shifted over the years, and you go and have a look at that and that is the best measurement to go and check. But perhaps what you should also go and have a look at over time is the graph that shows South Africa - do you see this one rising up here, that is South Africa. Go and have a look. Go and have a look at this one. This is Brazil and benchmark yourselves against these countries. South

Africa has progressively since 1999 just got worse and worse and worse every single year - the worst in the world. Unacceptable!

The hon Minister Fritz spoke about pupils fleeing under-par Eastern Cape schools. [Interjections.] So obviously there are things that are being done in this province that are making a difference, and that is why people are coming here. In the last four years since this government has taken over 309 000 people - the hon member started talking about economic development and where we are intervening - 309 000 people in the last four years in this province have received some skill training, 309 000. Seven times more than when you were in government, seven times more than when you were in government. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Ms L BROWN: As long as you ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: If you have a look at foreign direct investment, which is a really interesting indicator, the FDI South Africa has decreased. In 2008 it was R100,291 billion. Then Jacob Zuma took over. Last year it was R1,673 billion. Look at that drop. Go and have a look at what happened there and then ask yourselves those same questions about what you are doing. I am not going to talk about the MPATs and the Saica measurements - all of those things are measurements across the board that are showing what is happening.

But let me come back to whether we can trust what is being said on this side of the House and whether we can believe what is being said from this side of the House. You would have all seen of late that there are some billboards being put up illegally, against the law, in schools. This party is putting up things against the law. I mean that is just totally unacceptable. How can you trust a party that breaks the law? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Minister, order. [Interjections.] Order! Order! There are too many conversations going on quite apart from what the hon Minister is saying. I am looking at the hon member Ms Hani and the hon member Ms Bevu. Please calm down, and there are others as well. Give the Minister a chance to speak in silence.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But then let us have a look at what they are saying on these posters, and it is very interesting. I have just seen an article that is being released by Africa Check and Africa Check says: "Question the detail." So first of all you break the law by putting up a poster.

The second thing you do is you do not tell the truth about what is on the poster. So you say on this one - 1994, 5 million people had access to sanitation. Your speech had a lot to do with sanitation. Here you say 2013, 41 million people have access to sanitation.

Africa Check asks the question: “how on earth since census 2011 have you delivered 12,7 million accesses to sanitation between census 2011 and when you put up this poster?” Impossible! So where is the truth and how can we believe what you are saying on your posters that you are erecting? How can we believe what you are saying in the debate today? [Interjections.] You need to clarify and put your facts in place before you go and do things like that.

You also talk about household electricity provision. [Interjections.] It is quite interesting that electricity is being delivered to 20 000 households. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... electricity is being delivered to 20 000 households at this moment. Specifically in Philippi, Khayelitsha, Blue Downs, Mfuleni, Dunoon and Atlantis from Eskom that are being facilitated by the City. We had a discussion with Eskom the other day and they actually wanted to understand this process of how we do it, the only place in the whole of South Africa where Eskom and the municipality are actually working together to deliver electricity connections to households. In other parts, in other informal settlements across the country it does not happen anywhere. 20 000 happening right here in the City in the space that this whole debate on this side of the House says nothing happens where this government is involved in specifically poorer areas. That is informal settlements.

Then if you look at the same poster that I am talking about, let us have a look at what the Western Cape census says happened between 2001 and 2011 in respect of electricity: 93.4% of households now have electricity, the highest in South Africa; the highest in South Africa coming from 88% to 93.4%.

Let us also perhaps talk about this - the honesty, etc around this billboard and perhaps one other point that I have raised in the House. I know that the hon member Ms Brown is going to be speaking after me, so perhaps she can clarify the ANC's position on the detail on these posters and whether it is true or not, or why it is being checked. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Please!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Perhaps she can also clarify to this House the question that I have asked of this House before. The infrastructure that we are investing in with taxpayers' money in this space, that private sector invest was still not paid for when the election of that party's leader in this province took place. How many years ago did Fransman get elected? Three years ago? Three years ago, R1,5 million was still owed to the CTICC.

'n AGB LID: Dis 'n skande!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: Something that belongs to the people of this province, something that your party also invested in that sat on the chair of that organisation ...

[Interjections.]

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Betaal julle goed man!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND
TOURISM: You still have not paid that account. [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: Why do you not do something about it!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND
TOURISM: We have gone to court already and had a court order against you and you still have not paid that account. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND
TOURISM: What about Golden Arrow? R300 000, and you have not paid that account either. What about the hotels? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Minister, order, your time has expired. Your last sentence please.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: Will you please answer us on when you are going to pay the accounts for the infrastructure and whether you are telling the truth on these boards or not? [Time expired.] [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: I am not listening. I am not listening. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Order! The hon Leader of the Opposition to reply.

Ms L BROWN: You must know I stopped doing what you have requested me to do now a long time ago and I have not - I do not really take your orders at all. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Maybe you do not have the answer.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: No, you do not have the answer.

Ms L BROWN: Let me speak about the facts. I am going to ask the hon Minister Fritz to do himself a favour and read the trial gauge. The trial gauge speaks differently to what you do. We do not spend so much money on the poor children in this province. The facts are that the provincial equitable share grows year-on-year and that is why the budget grows. The budget does not grow because you think it is a good idea for it to grow. The most important thing, Mr Deputy Speaker, is the fact that we live in two worlds. You do not have to go to Nkandla to know that there are poor people. You do

not need to go to Nkandla to do it. You can do it right here in your own province. [Interjections.]

Go to Imizamo Yethu on a weekend, any weekend on any day; they do not even collect the rubbish.

An HON MEMBER: What did you do?

Ms L BROWN: But go to Hout Bay, which is what the whole area is called, but the Africans live in Imizamo Yethu and the coloureds live in Hangberg. There is nothing happening in those areas. It is not in another province. This is your province. It is in my province. We live in two ... [Interjections.] ... we live in two provinces.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms L BROWN: Where you live is different ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Ms Hani.

Ms L BROWN: ...to where poor people live in this province and that is the difference. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: There are nine provinces.

Ms L BROWN: Because you think that every class in the school in this province has a 35 to 1 ratio. It is not true. There are children who are more than 50 children in a class. You think that every person has a roof over their heads and every House has a toilet. It is not true. Where people are poor it is not true. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms L BROWN: It is not true. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms L BROWN: So what I think is more important is the fact that you have only built on basic services year-on-year.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Ms Brown. Your time has expired.

Ms L BROWN: You have not done 93% of basic services. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Your time has expired. We have come to the end of this debate. That concludes the debate on this subject.

Ms L BROWN: That is why you never asked us. You know that is not true. [Interjections.]

Debate concluded.

The SPEAKER: Order hon members. The Orders of the Day. The Secretary will read the first Order of the Day.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

1. Consideration of principle of the *Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill* [B 7 - 2013] (Minister of Finance, Economic Development and Tourism).

The SPEAKER: I recognise the hon member Mr Von Brandis.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I just want to read the report of the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development on the *Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill*, dated 4 September 2013, and it reads as follows:

“That the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development, having considered the *Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill* referred to the committee in terms of the Standing Rule 187, reports that the committee supports the principle of the bill.”

I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Haskin, over to you.

Mr G C R HASKIN: Thank you, Mr Speaker. The bill before us gives effect to the recommendation of Scopa based on the resolutions of the committee. The reasons for the unauthorised expenditure amounting to R53 million are listed in the bill. Scopa engaged thoroughly with the department on at least two occasions regarding the request for authorisation, looking into the veracity and the desirability of the request, and have acceded to it. The perspective that one should bring to this, to the consideration of this bill, is that the audit outcomes track record of this department is that they have been financially unqualified with findings since 2006/7. To spend upwards of R14 billion per year it requires the department to spend around R60 million a day of every working day in the year. This unauthorised expenditure bill is R53 million, so what we are talking about here is less than one day's expenditure of the Department of Health. It should be approved. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Ms Beerwinkel, over to you.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you. Mr Speaker, unauthorised expenditure is expenditure incurred but not budgeted for or it is expenditure incurred contrary to the conditions of a grant from another sphere or organ of state. It is also expenditure not permitted in terms of the *Public Finance Management*

Act, No 1 of 1999.

If unauthorised expenditure for a previous year 2011/12 is only been dealt with now there must have been many problems, but as you have heard Scopa has adequately dealt with that, and we will now discuss what the bill contains.

Against the background that I have just given you now we are now expected to condone and agree to a department that did not do proper planning and forward thinking and was found spending without proper procedures followed and permissions granted. This happened in 2011/12 already and will now be funded via a direct charge to the Provincial Revenue Fund. I am going to stop at two things, but I first want to mention one. What needs to be mentioned is that a standing committee's duty is to question and interrogate, because that is its oversight role. We are not expected to just rubber-stamp when requests come our way. What was very disconcerting in our standing committee was the arrogance with which the officials came to explain the reasons to Scopa when questioned as to why they needed this money to be condoned. The reason given for unauthorised expenditure would not have been condoned by the DA had the shoe been on the other foot. Health, by its very nature needs to do emergency services and the people who render that service mostly work overtime and at night. Disasters do not ask for a time to happen, but by now the department should know how to plan adequately for the remuneration of these employees.

Another reason given was that machinery that was delivered earlier in that specific year had to be paid for. We still did not get the full reason for the urgency to pay it in that year as opposed to the year in which it was budgeted for. [Interjections.] Instead they caused ... [Interjections.] ... Mr Speaker, is the hon Mr Wiley a speaker on this topic? If not, let him be quiet.

The SPEAKER: Order, order, order, hon member Mr Wiley, order. [Interjections.]

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Yes, he thinks so. Instead they caused unauthorised expenditure. Mr Speaker, there was also a long drawn out debate between the province, the Department of Public Works and the City regarding sewerage and utility charges that needed to be paid. That one understands, but I am going to stand still at two reasons and I am going to refer to page 209 of the report of Health for 2011/12. The one speaks about equipment but the other one speaks about accruals that had to be carried forward to the 2012/13 year that they chose to pay in the 2011/12 year. Then worse, in a further effort to reduce accruals commitments, orders were followed up and paid during March 2012. Now March 2012 was the end of the financial year which then speaks to fiscal dumping. There was money left which they did not know what to do with and that is how they covered it.

This over-expenditure is couched against the fact that there was an over-collection in the Health Department and the over-expenditure would be covered by that. Health is an essential service to the community. One trusts

that this kind of fiscal dumping, as is the case with some of these accruals, will not happen again and that those people who sacrifice their lives to work in EMS are properly budgeted for in the future. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Minister Botha, over to you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, thank you very much for the opportunity to speak on this. Firstly, let me say in real terms the shortage or the unauthorised expenditure is actually R32 million not R53 million, because of the savings on other divisions within the department. It reflects 0.3% of the budget of R16 billion. It was mentioned by some of the members that there was no proper planning and that staff were, and the officials were, arrogant. I must say it is for me an indication of a lack of understanding of the department.

The operations of a department the size of the Department of Health is an education. Just to give you an indication, Mr Speaker, on the last Monday of the financial year, we had R190 million in the bank, on the next day R168 million was paid out. Just to give you an indication that was in the last week, so the hon member Ms Beerwinkel is also a bit lost. She says we must budget better, well she is actually meaning we should plan better. There is a difference between a budget and planning, but coming from her I accept that.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, there is another reason why, and the hon member Mr Wiley mentioned it here, from the back. We have a track record in the Department of Health in the Western Cape to pay our invoices in 32 days. I think the average in South Africa is probably 32 months. We pay within in 32 days. We have the minimum accruals and the accruals are a natural consequence, not an unnatural consequence. We do not overspend as with some of the provinces with R3 billion. We also do not run out of medicine in the third month of a new financial year. [Interjections.]

We also do not pay - we are also not a province where doctors and nurses have to wait sometimes six months for salaries, so our planning is actually very good and the execution is very good. The officials were certainly not arrogant. For them it is a very serious matter and our audit outcome indicates that. [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: You were not there.

The SPEAKER: Order hon member Ms Brown, order.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, I want to apologise on behalf of this Parliament to the remark made to the officials, the senior officials of the Department of Health. I am sorry that that was said by a member of this House. I apologise on her behalf. But, Mr Speaker, what is perhaps more interesting to say and to recognise is that in 2003/4, 2004/5, 20005/6,

20006/7, 20007/8 and 20008/9, this was when it was a much smaller budget, much smaller. Our budget is currently R16 billion. That was probably a budget of about R10 billion. R 266 million was overspent by the former colleague across the floor. Maybe that is the reason why they have not given him an opportunity to speak on this topic. What is more interesting - it was explained to us and we accepted their explanations at the time as the Opposition because we realised ... [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: You were not ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: No, we did not.

Ms L BROWN: You did!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: We realised how important it is and how difficult it is with a department like this. I want to say that the budget, the planning and the execution of the Department of Health in the Western Cape are examples to any Department of Health in South Africa, and I ask you to please approve this. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Minister Winde, over to you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: Thank you. Mr Speaker, first of all this is the introduction of unauthorised expenditure. It is not fruitless and it is not wasteful expenditure. It is also, as

has been said, the kind of percentage that we are looking at in spend here of R53 741 946.9 million is 0.436% of the total Health budget. It is a very, very small percentage; it was used for the payment of overtime to meet minimum response times of emergency medical services; it was used for the payment of outstanding sewerage and utility charges which were paid after the protracted interaction with the Department of Transport and Public Works, the City of Cape Town, and myself in trying to fix something that we inherited that was a real, real mess of non-payment of rates and taxes to local authorities. It was for the payment of equipment scheduled for payment in 2012/13 that was delivered early. We could not just let these people wait. They delivered it early; we took it, we paid for it, but it was such a very, very small percentage and I am sure that this House can very easily condone this kind of over-expenditure or unauthorised expenditure. It was not foreseen. You could not budget for it. But I hear what the hon member Ms Beerwinkel says, and she says we have got to plan better, but I ask her in contemplating whether they should vote for this or not and considering that the amount of R50 million is a little bit different from the previous two years when we took office of nearly R90 million which was the ... [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: That was forward buying and you know that. That was forward buying.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM:
... the nearly R 90 million was actually ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Brown, order.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ...was actually R89,179 million that this House condoned in exactly the same space under the leadership then of Mr Fransman and the R114,2 million under the leadership the previous year of the hon member Mr Uys, more than double ... [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: It was forward buying.

An HON MEMBER: Can you believe it!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: But we are asking this House to condone this. It is not wasteful and fruitless as I said, and I am pretty sure that if I had to say to the hon member that if it was not 0,74%, if it was 25%, then I would have no problem jumping up and down with you and screaming and shouting, because quite frankly on 13 October 2011 for the 2010/11 financial year, 25% in the national Department of Health on irregular expenditure had to be agreed to by the National Assembly, amounting to R5,7 billion. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Brown, order!

An HON MEMBER: 5,7?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM:
 Now, you are talking about how you can vote against this kind of thing, but I think in this space the hon member Ms Beerwinkel must concede that at 0,4%, the kind of money where this was going to, not fruitless, not wasteful, this is the kind of thing that this House can definitely condone. The Health Department runs their systems incredibly well. We make in this government 7 000 payments every day and of course we are going to be put under pressure when three years before you are starting with your budget planning, there are things that are going creep up, but at 0,4%, I have no doubt that this House cannot but support this piece of legislation. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Is it a point of order hon member?

†UMnu M NCEDANA: Ewe Somlomo andiqinisekanga nokuba sisiphakamiso kodwa ndifuna ukuqonda apha kuwe...ndicela ukubuza apha kuMphathiswa Botha othetha ngentokubana yi32 lemali, ayiyo 53,sibe sixakeke yiBill apha? [Uphazamiso.]

*Mr M NCEDANA: Yes, Mr Speaker. I am not sure whether this is point of order but I have a question to ask the hon Minister who mentioned the amount is R32 not R53 while we are busy with the bill. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon member. †Andizikuphendulela uMnu Botha apha...*I will not speak for hon Minister Botha here... Order.

The SPEAKER: †Hlaphantsi. *Sit. If there is something ... Order! Can you

please put it in black and white to the Minister and then Minister will answer you.

Mr M NCEDANA: No, no. Mr Speaker, I am clear. We are about to pass the Bill or approve the Bill. Now there are two amounts provided to this House.

Ms M TINGWE: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Order. Order!

Mr M NCEDANA: And that is where the House needs to resolve itself.

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon member Mr Ncedana. Hon Minister Botha's time has already expired. Do you suppose to pose that question during the ... [Interjections.] Order, during ... [Interjections.] I am not going to be able to answer on behalf of the hon Minister Botha now, or Minister Botha do you want to, order now, order, order.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, may I address you on this?

The SPEAKER: Order, order, let us start with the hon member Mr Skwatsha.

Mr M SKWATSHA: Thank you. Mr Speaker, I think hon member Mr Ncedana says he might want to support the Bill. He wants to be clear what we are supposed to support because we thought it was a particular

amount until hon Minister Botha said no it is not this amount; that is all.

The SPEAKER: Okay. Hon Minister Botha, do you want to give us a ...
[Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Speaker, I want to address you on this, but may I just say in addressing you on this that I am experiencing here today something which I have never seen in this Parliament, because what the hon member did, there is no rule that gives him the permission to do what he did, ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: But what did you say?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: But what I said and maybe the hon member Mr Uys will also understand this now. I said that the unauthorised expenditure is this, as in the Bill, but in real terms the net amount of money relates to savings we had in other departments. That does not change the amount that we ask to be approved today.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: But the member must at least act as if he knows something.

The SPEAKER: Order, order, Thank you hon members. I am not going to

allow any member now on this subject please. [Interjections.] Hon members! Take your seat, hon member Mr Skwatsha. [Interjections.] Order, hon Minister Botha! Ministers order, members!

That concludes the debate on this Order. On this order hon member Mr Uys, are there any objections to the principle of the Bill being approved?

HON MEMBERS: Yes, yes. Yes.

An HON MEMBER: No.

The SPEAKER: Is it yes? If there is an objection, order. [Interjections.] Order hon members! I put the question, those in favour of the principle of the bill being approved will say "aye".

HON MEMBERS: Aye.

The SPEAKER: And those who are against will say "no".

HON MEMBERS: No.

The SPEAKER: It seems that the ayes have it. We now proceed, hon members. Now for the finalisation of the Bill; are there any objections to the Bill being finalised?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

HON MEMBERS: No!

The SPEAKER: Is it yes?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Is it yes, hon member Mr Uys?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: If that is a yes, I put the question: those in favour of the bill being finalised say “aye”.

HON MEMBERS: Aye.

The SPEAKER: And those against will say “no”.

HON MEMBERS: No.

The SPEAKER: I think the ayes have it. Thank you very much. We now proceed. The secretary will read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: The *Western Cape Unauthorised Expenditure Bill*.

Bill finalised.

The SPEAKER: The Bill will be sent to the Premier for assent. Thank you.

The Secretary will read the second Order of the Day. Order!

2. Consideration of the report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning on the *Sectional Titles Amendment Bill* [B 11B - 2013] (NCOP) dated 7 November 2013 (See Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, p 201) (Ratification of final mandate).

The SPEAKER: The House received a report of the Standing Committee on Agriculture and Environmental Planning on the *Sectional Titles Amendment Bill*, conferring the authority of the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support the Bill. This mandate has been sent to the NCOP. Are there any objections to the ratification to confirm the authority of the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support the Bill?

HON MEMBERS: No.

The SPEAKER: No. Thank you. The Secretary will read the third Order of the Day.

3. Consideration of the report of the Standing Committee on the Finance and Economic Development on the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill [B 38 - 2013] (NCOP) (Ratification of final mandate.)

The SPEAKER: I see a speakers list in front of me hon members, I recognise the hon member Mr Von Brandis.

Mr P UYS: One sentence.

An HON MEMBER: Please. You must not go and start now.

Mr E J VON BRANDIS: Thank you. Mr Speaker, I just want to read the committee report, we must just ensure ourselves, because this is a money bill. Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Development on the *Division of Revenue Amendment Bill*, dated 7 November 2013, as follows: - and it was approved by all members - The Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development, having considered the subject of *Division of Revenue Amendment Bill*, [B 38 - 2013] referred to the committee in terms of Standing Rule 220, recommends that the House confers on the Western Cape delegation (NCOP) the authority to support the bill. Report to be considered.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Beerwinkel.

An HON MEMBER: Say aye.

An HON MEMBER: What is wrong with you?

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Thank you, Robin. Mr Speaker, once again the

national government has seen it fit to assist provinces to be able to carry out their mandate by allocating additional funding for different purposes. This DA-controlled province which always claims to be this self-sufficient secessionist province was also a recipient but also one that was punished for not spending their allocated funding. The adjusted allocation to this province is as follows ... [Interjections.] R52,1 million for improvement of conditions of services.

Ms L BROWN: Be careful what you say about the youth.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: 93 ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: R963 000 for provincial equitable share to assist with the costing related to the improvement of clerical positions and that total was R53,06 million. An increase to the FET colleges of R1,66 million. Disaster allocations to the Western Cape for the repair and maintenance and flood damage amount to the following and these are conditional grants: Agricultural support programme R1,5 million; Provincial road maintenance grant R17,17 million; human settlements grant R1,16 million. However, a new municipal disaster recovery grant was introduced for reconstruction and repair of municipal infrastructure damaged by flood, and even there this province benefited to the tune of R6,688 million divided between Langeberg and Eden, each receiving R0,104 million and R6,5 million respectively. Two

very important departments, health and transport and public works were punished for not spending. National Treasury took R15,2 million from health for not spending on their health facility revitalisation programme and R70,2 million from the Department of Public Works for not utilising on their provincial roads maintenance grant.

Ms L BROWN: Oh, shocking!

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Now, Mr Speaker, if one unpacks these final two departments ... [Interjections.] The one where complaints are continuously reported about conditions at facilities and worker conditions then you wonder and you understand why there is this inability to utilise the funds at their disposal for the services to the people who need it most. Road maintenance on the other hand is a job creator. EPWP programmes could have been rolled out, and if you see the conditions of some of the roads in the rural areas then it is a shame that National Treasury needs to take back and rethink the allocation to provinces. We do, however, thank National Treasury that in spite of the poor delivery here in the Western Cape in certain areas, they still consider the people of this province important enough to allocate more funding for better services and we support them. This is the Western Cape Province, the Western Cape Province. The Western Cape Province.

The SPEAKER: Order. Hon members order. Hon member Mr Haskin, over to you.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon Minister Winde, Minister Winde?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM:
Thank you very much. Mr Speaker, this is the kind of Bill that normally this House would not say anything on, but it is quite interesting that the hon member Ms Beerwinkel decides to pick this up. First of all, does she realise that the taxation that gets distributed via the national government comes from this province, the people of this province, all of the people of this province. [Interjections.] They actually pay. [Interjections.]

Ms L BROWN: We know. We know.

An HON MEMBER: You do not know.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, order.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM:
There is not an ANC ATM machine that Pravin Gordhan takes the money out of.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: But you do not know how to spend it.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: I

will get to the spending now.

An HON MEMBER: No.

An HON MEMBER: Nonsense!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: I will get to the spending now, but ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members order. Hon member Mr Skwatsha! Order
Hon member Mr Skwatsha!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: I know the hon member Ms Beerwinkel's colleagues do not want to actually let her hear the truth, but the hon member Ms Beerwinkel needs to hear the truth. 15% of the GDP, 15% of the taxation raised in this country comes from this province, and 9% comes back. [Interjections.] So the people of this province actually subsidise other provinces.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, subsidising.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: The taxpayers of this province. But then let us talk about the over- expenditure or the non-expenditure that is taken back. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members order.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM:
When 0,2% of our budget is not spent, and this is a policy I absolutely agreed on with the hon Minister Gordhan when I first got into office and we had long debates on it and said that when governments cannot spend then take the money back, but I did not notice the hon member Ms Beerwinkel speaking to us with a loud voice last year when we got R600 million back to this province to build the Asidi Schools that was taken away from other provinces who were not building their schools. She had no word to say about that at all. She only has a word when money gets taken back from this province. Surely her allegiance is to this province, and she should be saying you know this is where my support lies. [Interjections.] But, Mr Speaker, I think that in the *Division of Revenue Bill*, the money that is going to the support for those areas that has suffered damage for floods, the money that we have heard about and where all the money is going to, we support this division of revenue. We thank you very much that this is on the table and I think that it has been heard from the committee report that even the hon member Ms Beerwinkel supported it in the committee.

Ms C F BEERWINKEL: Of course it is a great ...[Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Order, hon members order, order. Hon member Ms Brown, order! The House has received a report from the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Development on the *Division of*

Revenue Amendment Bill conferring the authority of the Western Cape ...
Order, hon member! Hon member Mr Skwatsha, order! ...conferring the
authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill.
This mandate has been sent to the NCOP. Are there any objections to the
ratification of the conferment of the authority of the Western Cape
Delegation in the NCOP to support the Bill?

HON MEMBERS: No.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much hon members. That concludes the
business for the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 18:03.