
THURSDAY, 13 APRIL 2023

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid Sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may be seated. A very good afternoon to our members of this House and to all the guests, and those that are online. If I may, please.

Before we proceed, I would like to remind members about some of the logistical arrangements. If any of our members are online, please can you ensure that you have good quality data connection and audio and video connection and that there are no disturbances where you are, and please note that from this side the hybrid system is functioning well. We have also granted access to the media, and I please ask that all guests and media keep their microphones on mute.

Hon members are also reminded that no interjections are permitted during the hybrid Sittings, and to this end I draw the hon member's attention to Rule 40 of the Standing Rules.

I now recognise the Chief Whip.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 20(1), precedence be given to the Subject for Discussion. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved? No objections? Agreed to.

We will now deal with that Subject for Discussion in the name of the hon Bakubaku-Vos as printed on the Order Paper. I recognise... I am going to... okay, I recognise the Chief Whip. Over to you, Chief Whip, yes.

The CHIEF WHIP: Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. The papers in front of us do not indicate member Bakubaku-Vos introducing.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The CHIEF WHIP: So does that mean she will introduce the debate?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I would like her to at least just introduce the debate, and then to the first speaker, hence my hesitation.

The CHIEF WHIP: Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Over to you, hon Bakubaku-Vos.

SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION

Freedom Month:

Socio-economic freedom for some people in the Western Cape

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, our debate today is based on the debate of Freedom Month, socio-economic freedom for some in the Western Cape, Western Cape Provincial Parliament. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bakubaku-Vos, that is all in line with our Rules. I now call on the hon Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you to my colleague, the hon Bakubaku-Vos for arranging during the debate on Freedom Month a topic close to my heart, but also close to the hearts of the people of South Africa because this is a party introducing the topic where they stole the freedom of South Africans for the last 30 years and therefore this is a political debate and I welcome this debate and thank you, hon Bakubaku-Vos, because you are now, and your party introduced a debate because this is a debate sponsored by the ANC of the arms-deal, the ANC of Sarafina, the ANC of state capture, the ANC of Nkandla, the ANC of Phala Phala, and now stage loadshedding. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister...

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: This is the party that introduces this debate. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you can take your seat. Hon Deputy Chief Whip?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, can the hon Leader of Government Business please speak through you and not directly to our member?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Over to you, please, Minister, speak to me.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Deputy Chief Whip. In politics we know what the tactic is. We have been around here for the last 15 years. This topic is clear for us. [Interjections.] This is the ANC, Deputy Speaker. This is the ANC of the brown envelopes. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: This is the ANC of Travelgate. This is the ANC of PRASA. You have introduced a political debate. [Interjections.] Let us debate the politics of your topic.

Hon Speaker, but there is a former President who introduced this discussion when he said – Thabo Mbeki, he made an honest assessment and he said: " It has impacted negatively on the standing of the ANC with many of the masses of the people. In a different way," he says, "they have destroyed the freedom of the masses of the people." In this sense Thabo Mbeki unknowingly was confirming the sentiments of millions of South Africans and so it is time for the ANC to pack up and go. [Interjections.]

An ANC, who cannot even hold a Provincial Congress in the Western Cape introduces a topic for debate, hon Deputy Speaker, to put it differently, the ANC participated in this debate today. They cannot even arrange a drunken party in a winery, Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, and I quote:

“Our world is not divided by race or by colour or by gender or by religion. Our world is divided into wise people and fools, and fools have divided themselves by race, by colour, by gender or religion.”

These are the words of the human rights activist, Mohamad Safa. Hon Deputy Speaker, the fools that Mohamad Safa is referring to, is not sitting on this side of the House. Hon Deputy Speaker, the lived experience of farmers and agri-workers who have encountered the DA difference, speaks to what is possible when you have a caring DA confident capable state and that is access to socio-economic freedom. That is the real debate we are looking for and opportunities instead of an ANC Government that tramples and destroys your opportunities. The socio-economic freedom of our people and then shamelessly refer to itself as the leader of society, bare-faced, brazen and blatant.

Hon Deputy Speaker, we have supported economic freedom, real freedom, a farmer, Wadea Jappie, she and her family are experiencing the opportunities enabled by a DA-led Government, accessing these opportunities, has led to socio-economic freedom for her, her family and the employees on her farm, and the Premier visited her, I visited her, members of this side of the House visited her. She started planting dhanya for personal use on a smallholding in Philippi. This is the real socio-economic freedom, supported by her mentor, Johan Terblanche, and the Western Cape Department of Agriculture, we have seen her business grow to where it now produces tons of dhanya

annually and I know the Deputy Speaker loves dhanya in her food, so thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, for supporting the dhanya industry. She also supplies crop salads under the Dew Fresh brand. I know the Deputy Speaker loves her salads. It is coming from that farm.

In addition, her business expands and is providing now 10 000 eggs per day to Nulaid, to top restaurants, even to Mugg & Bean. I know the Deputy Speaker loves the Mugg & Bean. I know she loves the salads coming from this farm. There are 10 000 eggs produced per day. I know the Deputy Speaker loves her boiled eggs in her salad. Wadea Jacobs Jappie and her husband considered themselves first generation farmers, whom one day can comfortably hand over the business to their sons, Nabeel and Tawfeeq.

Another farmer, Werner Dirks of Piketberg, I just passed there half an hour ago, moves through life smiling as he knows too well what it feels like to be sad, and so, through support from this Department, he experienced firsthand socio-economic reform, socio-economic rights, and so this ambition is real. It is happening. It is not a space to dream. It is a space to deliver, hon Deputy Speaker, but this is through hard work, tenacity, support and mentorship. [Inaudible.] Whernit Dirks completed also a Farmer Development Programme.

Hon Deputy Speaker, this House knows that there is only one province that has a Farm Worker Development Programme. That programme's purpose is to allow for socio-economic reform. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: I know the hon Chief Whip ...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, members! [Interjections.] Order, members! Continue, Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: May I continue?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may continue.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you to hon members on that side of the House that try to decode what I am saying because the message has not yet landed. These projects that I am now thinking of is for us important because the ANC, they are thinking – their thinking is beyond the masses. It is beyond outdated, beyond outmoded, obsolete rhetoric. The ANC is missing in action. [Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, this is a different story, because we are the only Department in South Africa where we have an Agri Worker Support Programme and the Referral System, which links agri-workers to the Government departments. If you want to talk about socio-economic rights of workers, show me in any province where this happens outside the Western

Cape. It does not happen. They do not care. Our program is also making available an awareness and information session to provide agri-workers and rural communities with the applicable services and opportunities to access the following. This is socio-economic development: rural youth school, employment, rural safety, transportation, rural economies, entrepreneurship, Western Cape Prestige Agri-workers, Rural Safety Projects and many others. Also, great work being done by my sister Department of Health through the Philani Healthcare Services. Socio-economic development.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the above is only possible when you have a DA Government that is caring, that has competence, that has accountability, that has integrity, that has innovation, that understands responsive governance. That is when you get socio-economic stuff happening in our province, and so the data is before us. Stats SA confirms every single year... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! Order, members!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Deputy Speaker, the data for this debate is both in the Human Development Index, which shows that the Western Cape under the DA has the lowest inequality in South Africa. The data confirms it, but more importantly, that data confirms from Stats SA that the lowest performance on basic services, water, sanitation, refuse collection. access to electricity is happening now in the ANC Government. The highest level of socio-economic, the topic that you introduced, we get the highest. In the topic that you introduced the ANC gets the lowest. [Interjections.]

So, hon Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, members. Take your seat please, Minister. Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP: Deputy Speaker, I rise on Rule 39. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members, we have a member. Premier, we have the Chief Whip standing. Hon Dugmore and Premier, we have the Chief Whip standing.

The CHIEF WHIP: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The CHIEF WHIP: I rise on Rule 39... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The CHIEF WHIP: The loud conversing on the other side does make it difficult to hear the speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, yes. I did call, I did call the Premier... [Interjections.] Thank you very much, hon members. Minister, you may

proceed.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Deputy Speaker, I want to really thank the hon member for introducing this debate because for the last 28 years the party that she represents has undermined the socio-economic rights, as per the Constitution, and therefore we have constitution building on the one side and we have institution building on the other side, and the institutions confirmed that this debate belongs not to the Democratic Alliance, but where it belongs to the people, where the DA is governing. We do not want to claim the victory because people must feel the difference and so it is time for this debate, to say to hon member Bakubaku-Vos, your time is up, pack up and go. A new Government is coming into the Union Buildings in South Africa. [Interjections.] I believe that the Premier recently went to Pretoria. I asked him what was he doing there, he said: "I went to collect the keys of the Union Buildings." It is already in his pocket and so there can no more be meetings of your party, so we have the keys, hon Bakubaku-Vos, and my hon friend, I miss Mr Klaas. If you see him, I want the Premier to invite him for a cup of tea in the Union Buildings, because we want – I love Mr Klaas. He is a great man.

Where is he, Mr Klaas, are you online? [Laughs.] I miss you. I love you, but socio-economic development is happening where the DA is governing. I thank you, hon Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister Meyer. I now

recognise the hon Bakubaku-Vos.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, again the DA is showing us how much they do not care about our community. He is bragging now. He is bragging about these, your salads that you are eating in the expensive restaurants, while our people are suffering.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: They do not even get money to buy bread. Some of them they do not have even a place to sleep. Deputy Speaker...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bakubaku-Vos, just take your seat for a second. Chief Whip, what is your point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP: Hon Deputy Speaker, I believe that the hon member is misleading the House, the Speaker never spoke about any restaurant.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am going to dismiss. [Interjections.] Hon members, that is not a point of order. It is fine. It is not a point of order. You may proceed, hon Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker, I know

the Chief Whip maybe she was sleeping because really the Minister was rapping, you can sleep, because it is like he was singing, because he does not care... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! I am trying to listen.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Hon Deputy Speaker, we are having this debate in April, a significant month in the calendar of our country, Deputy Speaker, where we celebrate Freedom. Freedom Day as well, as the fallen heroes of the liberation struggle against apartheid. This includes the lives of Vuyisile Mini, born in April of 1920 and hung in November of 1964 by the apartheid Government. This month also marks the apartheid execution of Solomon Mahlangu, the barbaric assassination of Chris Hani and the passing of President Oliver Tambo.

We also celebrate the life of courageous Mamu Winnie Nomzamo Madikizela Mandela. We also remember many other local heroes who were active in the Boland, particularly in Drakenstein, like Frans Mawethu, Monde Kalase, Themba Moko, Phumla Ngana, Mteteleli Titana, Themba Titana and Sonia Titana and many more others. These and many other heroes dedicated their lives in the pursuit of a non-racial, non-sexist, united and prosperous society based on the rule of law and justice, equality and human rights of all.

It pains me that the remains of many of our liberation struggle heroes in the province, especially at Maitland Cemetery, lay in ruins. These include the

mortal remains of the Gugulethu Seven, Robert Waterwitch, Anton Fransch, Ashley Kriel, Dulcy September, Zulile Malindi and his wife and many others. Some of these graves have been declared heritage sites, but are not marked as such.

†Singumbutho weANC, simemelela kurhulumente wephondo ukuba isimo sala mangcwaba weenkokheli zomzabalazo mawalungiswe abe kwisimo esifanelekileyo nesinesidima.

[As the ANC, we request that the province take care of the state of these graves belonging to leaders who fought for freedom. These graves need to be reinstated into a respectable state.]

Deputy Speaker, we must acknowledge the gains made by the ANC Government over the past 29 years to improve the lives of South Africans, including broadening access to basic and higher education. MEC Wenger's reply to member Kama's question on youth unemployment showed that youth unemployment stood at 32,9% with 71,7% of this concentrated in the city. Africa and Coloured constituted 96,7% of unemployment in the province, while only 2,9% whites were unemployed.

†Somlomo, le ngxelo ibonisa ukuba urhulumente weDA uyasilela ekuvezeni amathuba emisebenzi kulutsha. Isakwabonisa kananjalo ukuba inkululeko sasiyilelwe isaxhamlwa ngabelungu.

[Deputy Speaker, this report shows that the DA government is failing in providing employment opportunities for the youth. It is evident that we are

not yet free from white oppression.]

†Ziimeko ezinjena eziphembelela ukunyuka kobundlobongela nokuba ulutsha luphele lusebenzisa isiyobisi notywala. Simemelela ukuba urhulumnte wephondo avule amaziko onyango lwabo basebenzisa gwenxa iziyobisi phakathi ezilokishini ukuze uncedo lusondele abantwini. Isisekelo sala meko kukuba imfundo esemgangathweni kweli phondo ixhanylwa ngabantwana babelungu kuphela. Abantwana bethu abavunyelwa ukungena kwizikolo ezisemgathathweni.

[It is this situation that influences the rise of crime and it leads the youth to using drugs and alcohol. We are urging the provincial government to create rehabilitation institutions for drug abusers within the township so that help is readily available to the people. The underlying issue to all of these problems is that high level education is only available to white children. Our children are not able to attend such good schools.]

†Bayanyazenliswa ukuba bafunde kwizikolo ezisezilokishini. Nalapha kwizikolo ezininzi ubafumana bengaphezulu kwamashumi asixhenxe kwigumbi elinye. Kwizikolo zabamhlophe awunakuze ubabone bengaphezulu kwamashumi amabini anesihlanu kwigumbi elinye. Lena yimeko eyenzwa ngenjongo ukuze kungasetyenziswa mfundo okanye imfundo ukuphelisa imeko yokungalingani kwezentlalo nakwezoqoqosho nokuphuhlisa amathuba okumane ukufumana imisebenzi kwabantwana bethu. Somlomo, imeko yokungalingani iyabonakala na xa uthelikisa impatho kumaziko wezempilo ezilokishini nakwiindawo zabamhlophe, kumaziko kwezempilo akwiindawo

ezihlala abantu abahlelekileyo, kuvamile ukuba abantu balale phantsi okanye ezitulweni iinstuku ngaphambi kokuba bafumane unyango.

[Our children are being forced to go to schools in the township. Within these schools you will find the number of pupils in the classroom bordering over thirty. In the white schools, you will never see the number of pupils in a classroom exceeding twenty-five. This occurrence is with the sole of purpose of making sure that living conditions and equal opportunities are not be available to all children. Deputy Speaker, we see this inequality even when we compare the treatment received at the healthcare facilities in the township compared to the facilities in the white areas. In poorer communities it is a common occurrence to see people lying on the floor or sitting on chairs for days before they receive any help.]

†Kuvamile ukuba amaxhego namaxhekozana evuka ngobumnyama ayokulinda ngaphandle kwamaziko okompilo nalapho achitha imini yonke abuya ngobumnyama, maxa wambi bengafumananga namachiza. Kwiindawo zabamhlophe awunakuze uyibone lo nto. Yilo nto iANC inyanzelisa ukuphunyezwa kweNHI ukuza wonke ubani axhamle kwezempilo ezisemgagathweni.

[It is a common occurrence that the elderly rise up in the wee hours of the morning to go and wait outside the health facilities only for them to still spend an entire day waiting and only returning home when it is dark, at times not having even received treatment. You would never see this in white areas. That is why the ANC is advocating for the NHI so that everyone receives equal healthcare.]

†I-ANC imemelela kurhulumentwe wephondo ukuba anyuse imali ayinka izibhedlela ezifana neKhayethitsha, neMitchells Plein District Hospital ukuze kuphuculwe izinga lenkonzo kula maziko. Sekukunje kwezi zibhedlela kungenxa yorhulumente weDA owavala isibhedlele saseJF Jooste kungekho sizathu. Ngoku wohlulakala kukusakha esi sibhedlele. Deputy Speaker, izolo sivuke sisiva iindaba ezibuhlungu zokuhlaselwa kubalawe abantu abathandathu kwingqinqi yaseOcean View.

[The ANC is urging the provincial government to increase the funds it is giving to hospitals such as Khayelitsha, Mitchells Plein District Hospital so that the standard of healthcare improves. The reason for these hospitals being in such poor condition is that the DA government closed JF Jooste without a reason. Now the provincial government is struggling to rebuild this hospital. Deputy Speaker, yesterday we woke to the news of painful news regarding the attacks and murders of six people in Ocean View.]

†Iziganeko ezinje, awunakuze uve ngazo kwiingqinqi zabamhlophe. Akuyompazamo ukwenzeka kwayo kwiingqinqi ezifana nezi nangona nakoomaKhayelitsha, nakoomaNyanga kwakunye neeMitchells Plein. Kumele siqalise ukubuza imibuzo yokuba amapolisa aqashwe ngenxa ye-safety plan azokutyalwa nini kwiingqinqi ezifana neOcean View neManenberg ukubonakalisa ukungakhathali kulo rhulumnte weDNA. Imali ye-safety planithe yathotywa ngezigididi ezingamashumi amahlanu kuhlalo lwabiwo lwemali lwalo nyaka. SiyiANC, simemelela kurhulumente wephondo ukuba anike inkxaso efaneleyo kwiCPFs...

[This is not a surprise that this happened in an area like this, as is also expected in Khayelitsha, Nyanga and Mitchells Plein. We need to ask the

question of when are police going to be employed specifically for a safety plan in areas such as Ocean View and Mannenberg. This shows the carelessness of the DA. Funds for a safety plan have been decreased by at least five million Rand in the yearly budget report. As the ANC, we urge that the provincial government give due support to the CPFs...]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Ayeke ukuba nedolo ngakwii-neighbourhood watches. Simemelela ukuba ongeza iimali zeenkqubo ezilwa ngokuhlukunyezwa kwamanina nabantwana kwakunye nokuza nezinye iinkqubo ezijongene nokulwa nodlwengulwa kwakunye nokubulawa kwamanina. Enkosi.

[And stop the non-support of neighbourhood watches. We urge the government to increase funding for programs that fight against the abuse of children as well as to further support programs that combat sexual abuse of women and children. Thank you.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Enkosi. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bakubaku-Vos. I now recognise the hon Klaas. Are you online?

Mr T KLAAS: Yes, I am online, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed, hon Klaas.

Mr T KLAAS: Deputy Speaker ... [poor audio connectivity]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Klaas, one minute. If I can ask you to speak very close to your microphone. We cannot hear you very well and for the Hansard we want to ...

Mr T KLAAS: Do you hear me now?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is much better.

Mr T KLAAS: Yes. Deputy Speaker, there is a CaseLines [Inaudible.] from 2004 onwards by the Constitutional Court starting from the case of Modderklip, providing a directive that all spheres of government, including provincial, that they have a duty to make land available to those in need. It is Part C of the judgment order that said that unlawful occupiers of Modderklip, a public farm, are entitled – my emphasis – to occupy the land until any of these three spheres of government provides them with alternative accommodation.

Deputy Speaker, this is a useful precedent in our South African jurisdiction, on how we must deal with this DA-led Western Cape Provincial Government.

Speaker, instead of taking the opportunity to turn the Tafelberg property into a social housing opportunity as ordered by the Western Cape High Court, it was this Government which continued to waste taxpayer's money by litigating that progressive judgment, all the way to the Supreme Court of Appeal. This is the type of Government that will rather spend money fighting against the poor as it was during apartheid, as opposed to use that money to change people's lives for the better.

Deputy Speaker, when you look at the number of people who are on the housing waiting list database we find that they stand at around 600 000 and not mentioning those who do not...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you okay, member?

Mr T KLAAS: Those mentioned who do not have [Inaudible.] the list was marred by all sorts of red tape so that the number of people on the list do not increase further.

Deputy Speaker, intermediate medical facilities such as [Inaudible.] are closed at whim just because the Department of Health wants to fire nurses and other staff. These are the sort of facilities that assist and release pressure from hospitals such as Tygerberg and others.

Deputy Speaker, the right to basic education cannot be assessed by the poor in this province. The school placement system in this province is a disaster.

As we speak there is a child who was allocated a school, which is 15 kilometres away from his home without a provision for learner transport, even though there are schools in this area. The child missed the whole of the first term of 2023...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Klaas. If you will finish off please.

Mr T KLAAS: Okay, let me finish saying that how is this delay impacting on the lives of people of Manenberg, Gugulethu and Nyanga? Which hospital now caters for their medical needs and where those medical facilities are accessible to them, since the majority of poor people cannot even afford transport. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you very much, hon Klaas. I now recognise the hon Shaun August. Are you online?

Mr S N AUGUST: Hon Deputy Speaker, residents in this province are standing off against waves of extreme poverty, a growing need for food, homes, community support, health services, and so many other factors are crippling our communities and the future of our children. Are our people free if they still live in the periphery of Cape Town and economic hubs across the province? Are we free if spatial segregation still paves the way for housing developments? Are we free when the Office of the Premier to this day still fights inner city social housing developments, Tafelberg being an example?

Are we free if there still exists different levels of service delivery dependent on your communities' economic muscle in municipalities across this province? Are we free when we hear Cape Town is still the most unequal city in the world almost 29 years into democracy? The DA-led Western Cape Provincial Government is known for prioritising the needs of the rich in the leafy suburbs, above our most needy residents in townships, the Cape Flats and informal settlements, but we are here to offer solutions to them today. Integrate communities as a matter of urgency, bring people closer to their places of work, establish channels where business opportunities can be explored in rural communities and informal settlements, make rural towns economically viable by imploring established companies to branch out to them; exploit our community's culture and heritage for tourism purposes; ensure that the standard of level of services is delivered to all residents for all municipalities. These are some of the solutions that would positively impact the socio-economic deprivation our people have been subjected to, we need to start building towards a truly free and fair Western Cape and South Africa. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon August. I now recognise the hon Pretorius.

Mr G PRETORIUS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker I previously stated that healthcare is the baseline of everything of every other issue we discuss in this House. Without adequate healthcare for our citizens, there can be no progress on other issues. So, Deputy Speaker, let us discuss

freedom today.

Deputy Speaker, access to quality healthcare is a fundamental human right in the Western Cape. Significant efforts have and are being made to the improvement and provision of quality healthcare. This Government has invested heavily in making our healthcare system more efficient and that efficiency has become even more important as our population grows, and our Equitable Share from National Government shrinks. The Department of Health and Wellness is a prime example of how this Government goes the extra mile and does more with less for the good of our citizens. To ensure that our resources are more efficiently allocated, the Department has introduced an electronic health record system, which enables our dedicated and hardworking healthcare professionals to exit access patient information quickly and efficiently. This not only makes sure that more patients can be treated at our facilities at a time, but also improves the patient-to-patient outcomes in our facilities. The Department has also introduced telemedicine services, enabling healthcare professionals to offer remote medical consultations to patients. This technology has been particularly useful in rural areas where access to healthcare services is limited.

Deputy Speaker, but more than this, this Government has invested in the human side of healthcare. The Western Cape has a robust training and development program for healthcare professionals including ongoing training and skills development opportunities. This program has been instrumental in ensuring that healthcare professionals in the province are equipped with the

latest medical knowledge and skills. As the result, healthcare professionals in the Western Cape province can provide high quality healthcare services to all citizens.

Deputy Speaker, I want to stress the importance of this point. Yesterday, we learned that South Africa has lost more than 20,000 nurses last year. Every nurse that we train in this province counts against this number, and every nurse that we can provide will result in a better experience for countless patients. But, Deputy Speaker, despite these gains, we know that there is more ground to cover. We are not blind to the challenges that we face. Healthcare is a multifaceted issue and serving the healthcare needs of more than 7 million people is not easy. We know that there will always be legitimate criticisms of our health system, but the last people who should be levelling those criticisms are members of the ANC, not least due to the fact that it is the actions of their party, which have created some of the greatest challenges for our doctors and nurses on the ground.

Deputy Speaker, as we gather here, as I speak to you now, we are sitting on Stage 6 of rolling blackouts. I cannot express how tragic I find it, that our healthcare professionals who care deeply about our patients are often so utterly hampered by a lack of electricity. This Government, as usual, is exceeding its mandate to provide power to our health facilities. More than 50 rural clinics are in the process of having hybrid inverters installed and this Department has spent more than R120 million on fuel for generators, but this is here in the Western Cape. In other provinces where the ANC governs there

is no plan. The ANC who has created the problem of rolling blackouts, has not lifted a finger to solve it and our people are suffering as a result. Where is the freedom in that?

The disparity in service delivery does not end there. This Government has placed a massive focus on the provision of psychiatric care to our people. Several new psychiatric units are being built in hospitals across our province, including Khayelitsha District Hospital. These units are particularly relevant in our province where substance use disorders and substance induced psychosis run rampant throughout society. To say that the same provisions are absent where the ANC governs would be a gross understatement.

Deputy Speaker, have we forgotten the Life Esidimeni tragedy? Have we so quickly forgotten the events in 2016, in which 144 psychiatric patients died as the result of their Provincial Government's callous disregard for their wellbeing? Where is the freedom in that?

Deputy Speaker, as we continue this debate, let us not forget regardless of spin or false equivocations, the fact remains that the DA works for its citizens and the ANC works against them. It is true that freedom is not universal in South Africa. It is true that it is present in the Western Cape, and it is tragically absent elsewhere.

For the good of our people, the ANC, Deputy Speaker, must be voted out next year, so that the DA can deliver its highest standard of services to our

people. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Pretorius. I now recognise the hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, when we speak about freedom, freedom is, amongst others, the attainment of a life free from political oppression, free from social stigma or poverty. It guarantees freedom to speak freely and grants unrestricted possibility for the individual to achieve his or her purpose.

Deputy Speaker, the former President of the ANC, Oliver Tambo said that the fight for freedom must go on until it is one, until our country is free and happy and peaceful as part of the community of men, we cannot rest, Deputy Speaker, but Oliver Tambo will turn around in his grave to see how the ANC has abused the freedom he has fought for. Previous speakers has mentioned this. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Loadshedding is the yoke of oppression upon the neck of this nation since 2007. Today, it continues to negatively impact the life of every citizen of this country. Deputy Speaker, how can we be free, if we saw what happened in Ocean View yesterday, with the brutal killing of six people? I do not care if they say it is gang-related or not, but the police has

failed us and that is why again, the ACDP is calling for the devolution of powers to the Province so that there can be proper policing. The ANC must stop with their political debates and they are the cause of where we are today. I want to remind the ANC today that freedom is not corrupt, to be corrupt. Freedom is not stealing from the poor and the ANC has tabled this debate, and they are the biggest obstacle to this freedom. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. I now recognize the hon Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you, very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, I want to thank the hon member Bakubaku-Vos of the ANC for bringing forth this very pertinent topic of discussion, social economic freedom. For some people in the Western Cape. poverty, unemployment, education, housing backlogs, health issues, crime, backyard shacks and informal settlements remain key challenges. Hon Deputy Speaker, you would agree that these key challenges are what is a far cry from freedom of misery. The learner teacher ratio has drastically increased since 2014, and so has a drop dropout rate from high schools. The high dropout rate in the province has been attributed to unemployment poverty indigent households. In fact, almost all the province key challenges I mentioned, the Western Cape is the third largest provincial economic hub in South Africa in terms of its contribution to the national gross value added. We have diversified economy opportunities for further economic growth and better infrastructure but we remain a deeply unequal society with social divisions, high unemployment

and mismatched skills, increased cases of HIV/AIDS and a drastic increase in crime, especially drug related crimes. There is only socio-economic freedom for some people in the province. Informal traders are brutally harassed by law enforcement officers and I am referring to cases in Gatesville. In Philippi recently a female business owner was shot dead for refusing to pay protection money to extortionists. Business people on the Cape Flats and in townships are not safe from the protection rackets and police are turning a blind eye to the crisis.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: [Inaudible.] in areas on the Cape Flats continue to be sidelined by local governments because their businesses are in high risk areas.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you, very much. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, your time is up. Thank you. I now recognise the hon Plato.

Mr D PLATO: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you very much for this opportunity. I am glad that this debate has been raised. Next year will see us mark 30 years since the elections of 1994 and sadly our democratic project

in South Africa hangs more precariously than ever. It does so because of people who have become justifiably angry with an ANC-led National Government that has promised so much but delivered so little. They become angry with a political system that they seem to have no impact on and they have become angry with a now entrenched system of cronyism and corruption that permeates every level of our society and threatens to render us a failed state. [Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, I agree with some of the historic issues raised by hon Bakubaku-Vos and we welcome her topic. Today, let us discuss freedom. That is why we are yet in this House today, and we know that there are many, many problems facing our country and we know that despite the best efforts of this DA-led Western Cape Government, to exceed its mandate and shield the Western Cape from these problems, they still affect us. And they also affect many, many South Africans. We also know that the ANC has taken no action to fix any of these problems and I am sure that members on the opposite side will disagree, but, Deputy Speaker, let us discuss gender-based violence. Our President and the leader of the ANC, Cyril Ramaphosa, has called GBV a pandemic and he said, and I quote:

“In a country with the most progressive of constitutions, which promises equality and dignity for all, the women and children of South Africa live in fear of violence every day...”

As mentioned by some of the members already.

“For how long must this go on? For how much longer must we say enough is enough only for it to continue? It simply cannot go on.”

Deputy Speaker, we on this side of the House rarely say this, but I agree with the President, or rather I agree with what he has said, but not what he has done, because that quote was delivered three years ago, and there has been almost no actions in that time. In 2020 the President promised that GBV shelters would be founded at key GBV hotspots in South Africa. Three years later, and the results are stark. There are currently 26 GBV shelters in the Western Cape DA-led administration. They have helped hundreds upon hundreds of women, even children as well.

Deputy Speaker, Public Works gave over a number of buildings to assist with this project to all of the relevant provinces. We developed ours into shelters in record time. Through you, Deputy Speaker, I would like to ask our members on the opposite side how many of these buildings have been turned into GBV shelters where the ANC governs? The answer is zero.

Deputy Speaker, when we discuss freedom, I hope that there is not a member of this House who will disagree with me when I say that we cannot celebrate freedom when our women and our children still suffer so much violence.
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjection.]

Mr D PLATO: And the truth is that the ANC Government has done nothing to fix the problem, but this DA-led Government indeed has, and let us discuss

economic freedom too. We know that this economy has been ruined by the ANC? This is through their rolling blackouts; their disastrous foreign policy that jeopardise trade agreements and the constant ever present looting, fraud, stealing of the purse. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Correct, ja.

Mr D PLATO: More than half of this country has been forced to rely on social grants, which are not delivered.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr D PLATO: I have seen the dysfunctionality for myself and we now hear that the Post Office is being liquidated and that multiple branches will close. While I am glad that no more public money will be spent on propping up yet another failing parastatal... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr D PLATO: I am worried by the fact that there has been no discussion of what will happen to those who receive grants through the South African Post Office, and Speaker, even when the ANC-led SASSA somehow manages to get grants to people, what impact do they have? How do you raise a child on R500 a month? How do you buy a month's worth of food for R350? Our people are resilient and intelligent and they all too often find ways of making

the impossible happen and living off these meagre amounts. [Interjections.]

Deputy Speaker, they should not have to. Our people deserve much better. They deserve opportunities. They deserve jobs. They deserve not to have to wait in line. They deserve... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr D PLATO: ...their pension money to travel far and wide to SASSA offices that cannot help them, or close without notice. They deserve not to be turned away due to load-shedding, staff shortages or unsafe buildings. They deserve so much better than what the ANC can give them. They deserve what the Democratic Alliance has to offer. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Plato, just take your seat, there is – hon Sayed is on the floor. Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I have noticed there is somebody online who has got her hand up, one of the... maybe we can just double-check.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am not sure if there is a hand up. There is not one on my screen but I am trying to see whose microphone is unmuted. If I can just ask our hon members or any guests to please make sure their microphones are muted. You may proceed, hon Plato.

Mr D PLATO: Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. Speaker, allow me to be clear on my own party's stance on this one matter. The ANC has previously attempted to portray our party as against grants. This could not be further from the truth. We stand for grants that will get our citizens out of poverty rather than keeping them dependent on the State. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, members!

Mr D PLATO: But more than this, we stand for an economy that will create jobs and raise our people out of poverty for good. [Interjections.] We have the blueprint for how to do this. The ANC obviously cannot. They prove themselves that they cannot do anything. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bakubaku-Vos!

Mr D PLATO: We have applied it already here in the Western Cape where we created 167 out of 169 000 jobs... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr D PLATO: ...created the last quarter, if you want true freedom, Deputy Speaker, there it is. The ANC cannot provide it, but we can!

Finally, hon Deputy Speaker, we know that the country is unequal but to

succeed as a nation we must raise the poorest of the poor upwards. We must invest in the poorest of the poor. We have the resources and the willpower to do it, Speaker.

In theory, fixing this country is not difficult, although difficult, but we need a government and a President that will talk less and do more. True social and economic freedom can only be achieved when there is enough of an economy for all to participate in, and with the loss of the ANC majority in 2024, this will finally be achieved. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Plato. Order, members! I now recognise the hon Marais. One minute, hon Marais. Hon Dugmore, what is your point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: The point of order, out of respect to the House, Speaker, is that we will be launching a silent protest against the fact that Mr Marais has not apologised for his racist statements. We will not leave the House as we did the last time, but we will have a silent protest against member Marais. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, I am going to ask hon Marais to proceed and I will look at previous rulings on this matter, but I am going to just move on. Hon Marais, can you proceed, please?

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you so much. ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, if it is going to be silent, one minute, one minute, hon member. Hon Bans, hon Bans, hon Windvogel! Oh sorry, hon Windvogel, if it is clearly silent, then it must be silent. ...[Interjection.] So I am going to wait for the silence, and hon Marais will proceed. Hon Marais, you may proceed.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, a report by the Health Organisation, UNICEF, the United Nations International Energy Fuel, Food and Agricultural Organisations in 2022 stated the following:

“Of the 828 million people in the world who face hunger, and extreme hunger, 278 million came from Africa.”

Now since 1994, when the ANC took over Government, South Africa faced high poverty, high unemployment, an energy crisis, rising energy tariffs, increasing interest rates and soaring food prices. ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

Mr P J MARAIS: The Court states South Africa produces food, but the food is not accessible to millions of its people. Deputy Speaker, although the Western Cape itself boasts the highest food production in the country, in fact, we are South Africa's food baskets, what people do not know is that 240 000 households in the Western Cape which is 11,6%, experienced inadequate and severely inadequate access to food, 290 000 households in the Western Cape

experience severe hunger, and of that 7,1% is black people, 7,2% is coloured people, and the Freedom Front demands this problem to be addressed with great urgency. The debate speaks of socio-economic freedom for some only, I found it quite astounding because Professor Lawson defined economic freedom and liberty as the ability of people of a society or country to take economic actions and trade with any person of their choice irrespective of colour. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais. Your time is up. Thank you very much, your time is up. I now recognise the hon Ms A Bans.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

†Me A BANS: Dankie, agbare Adjunkspeaker. Agbare Adjunkspeaker, 'n paar weke gelede het ek die geleentheid gehad om die Premier te vra oor Rooiland in Paarl. Ek was glad nie verbaas toe hy geen kennis daarvan dra nie, want dit was in 'n bruin gemeenskap, en dit is wat ons huidiglik het in hierdie provinsie. As bruin gemeenskappe honger gaan slaap, babatjies op die vloere lê, geen kos het nie, en onder dakke wat baie nat is, is dit nie 'n probleem nie, daar is nie 'n krisis nie, maar as dit in die ander rasse is, in een spesifieke ras wat ek later sal noem, dan is dit 'n probleem, maar ons los dit nou eers daarso.

Die gaping van sosio-ekonomie begin by kleuterskoolfase, *Deputy Speaker*. Kom ons gaan gou weer 'n paar weke gelede terug toe ons by 'n *oversight* was

in Kannaland. Ek dink in die kleuterskole kon jy die verskil sien van 'n bruin gemeenskap kleuterskool en 'n wit een, en die mentaliteit begin daarso. As jy nie 'n geleentheid kry, dieselfde as 'n ander ras nie, dan is dit vir ons ontmoontlik om *economic freedom* vir jousef te kan kry, want jy is nie genoeg geletterd nie en jy het nie die geleentheid gekry om gelyk te wees nie. Ek weet... ek weet dat dit... [Tussenwerpsel]

[Ms A BANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, a few weeks ago I had the opportunity to ask the Premier about Rooiland in Paarl. I was not surprised at all when he had no knowledge of it, because it was in a coloured community, and that is what we currently have in this province. If coloured communities go to bed hungry, babies are lying on floors, with no food, under roofs that are very wet, it's not a problem, there's no crisis, but if it is in one of the other races, in one specific race that I will name later, then it's a problem, but let's leave it there for now.]

[The gap of socio-economy starts at nursery school phase, Deputy Speaker. Let us now go back a few weeks ago when we were at an oversight in Kannaland. I think at the nursery schools you could see the difference of a coloured community nursery school and a white one, and the mentalilty starts there. If you don't get an opportunity, the same as another race, then it's impossible to gain economic freedom for oneself, because you're not literate enough and you did not get the opportunity to become equal. I know... I know that it... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†'n AGBARE LID: Presies!

[An HON MEMBER: Precisely!]

†Me A BANS: Dit slaan op 'n seer plek, ja. Ek weet dat die hon Meyer – ek weet dat die hon Meyer nou baie seer kry, want soos ons tans nou praat is hy goed genoeg om 'n leier te wees, maar nie 'n Premier te wees nie.

[Ms A BANS: It hits a very sore place, yes. I know that the hon Meyer – I know that the hon Meyer is now hurting a lot, but as we are talking now he is good enough to be a leader, but not to be a Premier.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, the hon Meyer says in this House that the ANC stole economic freedom from 1994, but he forgets to say that during COVID he took money from poor farm workers and diverted it from Casidra. He does not say anything about it and then he speaks only about the farmers and not the farm workers while we are witnessing it here. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Sure. Yes!

Ms A BANS: Deputy Speaker, the very same, I have been listening of course, the very same hon MEC, who was speaking of eggs, it is just a shame that the hon Bakubaku-Vos here speaks of restaurants. We are being listened to by communities here that do not have that privilege to have an egg on their table as we speak, that are being fed by municipalities that is governed by the DA, peanut-butter and bread every day, but yet we are bragging here speaking of

salads and eggs.

Hon Deputy Speaker, “the ANC is missing in action.” That is what the hon Meyer also raised here. In the same breath, he forgets Barrydale has just shown them some flames, and that is how present they are. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms A BANS: But let us leave it for now. Let us go to crime. The DA always, when we speak of crime in this province, they will bring in National Government and SAPS. They are the biggest critic of SAPS, but no, not once will you hear them taking responsibility. Let us speak about extortion here. When you say extortion, it is not taken seriously in this House. You know why? It is because it is happening in Khayelitsha, it is happening in Site C, it is happening in Delft, and it is not happening in Sea Point. Should it become a problem of Sea Point, we will hear serious debates in this House, and I feel very sorry for our colleagues that are entertaining that ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

Ms A BANS: ... because their families are staying there on the other side of the benches. ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members! Continue, hon Bans.

Ms A BANS: The hon Pretorius says the ANC has no plan. The very same hon member has been with us on our oversight in Kannaland, where we have seen NHI working in the small, small community, very progressive that clinic. If we have that model of NHI that is happening in Kannaland, being transferred into the whole province I am telling you today... [Applause.] ...we will not have that difference of the better ones that are getting access to health and the other ones who are not getting access to health. It is rural communities, NHI will work for us, and I think the hon Pretorius agreed on the model when we were there.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms A BANS: On social development, the same hon Pretorius speaks of Esidimeni, but little does he agree, does he know that Social Development, as a committee we have seen for the past year how many old age homes have been closing. If he did not do his homework, I can take one example, the *ouetehuis* that is in the Central Karoo, the *ouetehuis* called Huis Spitskop. I will not go into detail, just do your own homework and leave Esidimeni, we have our own Esidimeni right here under your nose, and the DA is not aware of that. [Interjections.]

Where the DA steals, Deputy Speaker, it is called “a lack of funds, we are running out of funds so we cannot do it.” That is when the DA is stealing, and then when it is the other parties, it is called “corruption.”

...[Interjection.] The hon Plato speaks here ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members! Order members!

An HON MEMBER: You are looking!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may continue hon member.

MS A BANS: The hon Plato speaks here of GBV and shelters, and they are funded by the Western Cape Government. Just last week we were saying in this House that there are no funds for GBV. I want to know where that money is coming from.

Deputy Speaker, as a Government that prides itself in good governance and accountability, the Western Cape Government sure does raise some concerns when it comes to the socio-economic freedom of the Western Cape province. The Western Cape Government sure has good governance, but the beneficiary of that good governance - I think we all know the answer to that one. For socio-economic freedom, we will forever remain an exclusive phenomenon in this province, while the DA governs. Everything is in rose-coloured glasses for this Provincial Government. Where was this accountability when you failed to account for the learners from Northern Paarl who could not go to the Weltevrede High School in Wellington, due to scholar transport unavailability? There are learners who sit at home unable to attend classes because the Government has not provided any transportation for them. This is

what leads to the increase of numbers in crime and we are currently faced with notable crimes, according to the PERO that have substantially increased. When we asked about the matter, this Provincial Government did not even have information on these learners. Talk about evidence led! We wonder where is all this evidence that they claim to be having.

Service delivery for our African, Coloured and Indian people in this province is lacking. This DA-led Province has failed to ensure community safety, provide adequate infrastructure, have an efficient healthcare system, and has definitely failed in local governance for the aforementioned. Just this past Easter weekend, a rugby tournament that comprised more than 60 rugby teams that was held in Khayelitsha received zero support from the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport. This tournament had visitors from townships, from towns and even from other provinces, Eastern Cape and Gauteng Province. Meanwhile, the MEC in this Department was smiling for the cameras at Saldana Super 8 Rugby Festival. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

†Me A BANS: Ons is net goed om te *vote*, die *black votes*.

[Ms A BANS: We're only good to vote, the black votes.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! [Interjections.]

MS A BANS: Can I continue, Deputy Speaker? ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.

MS A BANS: Meanwhile the MEC of this Department was smiling for the cameras at Saldana Super 8 Easter Rugby Festival. This leads to one wondering what qualifies for one to have assistance, and the other one not to get. Indeed, social economy is for some in the Western Cape province. We need to see more involvement of the Provincial Government on Black Economic Empowerment to show the importance of Black Economic Empowerment Policy. At its recent Lekgotla the ANC resolved that BEE-related Procurement Policies must be strengthened and decisively implemented... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, member.

Ms A BANS: ...as to contribute to inclusive economic growth and reduce barriers to entry for black businesses. ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

MS A BANS: Economic transformation ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish your, yes, your time, just finish your last sentence please.

MS A BANS: Economic transformation and economic participation of black Africans, Coloured and Indian people in this province is appalling. The ANC has been continuously contesting the participation of black businesses in this Western Cape economy. †Dankie, agbare Adjunkspeaker. [Applous.] [Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bans. I now recognise the hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Good afternoon, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, this debate concerns socio-economic freedom in the Western Cape, and we know that our people cannot truly be free until the scourge of crime and violence has been eliminated from our streets, a goal that the Western Cape is making progress on slowly but steadily. Today we have heard the ANC lament this Government's policy, a certain hon member who spoke before me did not even write a speech. She just responded to points made on this side of the House. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

Mr G BOSMAN: The ANC is here trying to convince us that the Western Cape is the worst-run province. ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members! Order members! Please, take your seat, just take your seat, hon. [Interjections.] Hon members, if we can just

have order. Hon Sayed do you have a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Just a proposal, can the hon Bosman maybe be taken through by the hon Premier on what is sweeping, just on the concept of sweeping. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is not a point of order. But hon Bosman, you may proceed, you are going to have to speak quite loudly, because you are [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, as I was saying...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members! Hon Bans, hon Premier.

Mr G BOSMAN: The ANC is trying to convince us that the DA-run Western Cape is the worst-run province, but we know that this is just another desperate attempt by a spent force trying to convince the people to vote for them. The ANC is now a political party so riddled with corruption, criminality and incompetence that they cannot even put up a debate to highlight some of the successes in this province.

Deputy Speaker, I welcome this debate by my dear colleague, hon Bakubaku-Vos, but I am saddened that the ANC spokesperson on Social Development ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon, please take your seat, take your seat. Chief Whip, what is your point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP: Thank you, Deputy Speaker, I rise on Rule 39, I think this speaker should be afforded the opportunity to continue with his debate. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon members on both sides of the House, it is getting rather loud. We are right at the end of this debate, so I can ask for your indulgence, please.

†Mnr G BOSMAN: Die waarheid maak seer, agbare *Deputy Speaker*.

[Mr G BOSMAN: The truth hurts, hon Deputy Speaker.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, as I said, I am saddened that the ANC's spokesperson on Social Development did not mention that the Post Office run by the ANC National Government is being liquidated, that thousands of pensioners in this province are scrambling to renew their Sassa Gold cards, but we want to talk about the quality of life. We know that even

ANC members are lining up at DSD offices asking for help because Minister Zulu does not care.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I really want to appeal to the ANC to start looking at what is being done in this province, and to stop with the cheap politics and to push their comrades in National Government to seriously support the work that is being done by this Government, especially when it comes to poverty alleviation, safety and crime. Let us not forget, hon Deputy Speaker, during the hard lockdown, the ANC National Government refused to allow us to feed schoolchildren. [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

Mr G BOSMAN: Deputy Speaker, safety is pivotal if we are going to create a free and safe Western Cape. The people of this province deserve a safe space to raise their families ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

Mr G BOSMAN: ...and to create economically thriving communities. I am sorry that the African National Congress has not supported any of the safety initiatives brought by this Government. Every Sitting they lambaste the hard work being done by us to keep our communities safe. They conveniently ignore, every single time, that we are putting measures in place to fill the gap left by Minister Bheki Cele under an incompetent National Government. The

South African National Police Service gets its orders from the ANC National Government. If we had a devolved police service, we would have deployed them readily like we are deploying our LEAP Officers.

Deputy Speaker, yesterday afternoon I went to Neptune Lane in Ocean View where six people were mercilessly gunned down. This happened 750 metres away from the Ocean View Police Station, but we know six people were shot dead in a community where kids were playing in the street. It is not only a tragic and unnecessary loss of life, but it is also a stunning indictment on the state of crime-fighting in South Africa. We do not know enough about this incident yet but we do know that the CCTV Cameras that were paid for by this Government did not work because of ANC sponsored loadshedding.

We now know more than ever that the ongoing ANC sponsored blackouts are affecting the socio-economic rights of the people in this province. We know that those disabled CCTV cameras could have carried vital clues to help us solve this problem. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr G BOSMAN: The area where the shooting happened, Ocean View, is served by the SAPS Station in Ocean View, one of the Western Cape's most drastically under-resourced police stations. Despite serving a population of more than 50 000 people, Ocean View only has 61 VISPOL officers at that station and they have 12 detectives. The problem of under-resourced

policing in the Western Cape is well known and the ANC spokespersons on safety knows this. The problem of under-resourcing is known to SAPS management and they have come to this House and they have admitted that it is under-resourced. According to the South African Police Service leadership in the Western Cape they describe the number of officers in the Western Cape as way below par, and the ANC comes here to talk about socio-economic rights, because we know in Pretoria when they start dishing out resources they ignore the people of the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr G BOSMAN: This incident, hon Deputy Speaker, is the latest in a number of shootings that have taken place across this province. It is spurred by other incidents that have also happened and the DA has once again and I join member Christians in reiterating the call for the Western Cape to have a devolved police service, but what we are also asking for is to improve the socio-economic status of the people of the Western Cape. Let us stop guns from ending up in the hands of gangsters because we know that those guns are being handed out by the South African Police Service. We have joined calls for a Western Cape gun destruction site and I hope that members of the ANC will think about the socio-economic rights of our people when we make these calls again to SAPS, because we cannot have a police service that hands guns to criminals, that undermines the socio-economic rights of the people of the Western Cape.

Deputy Speaker, what happened yesterday in Ocean View in Neptune Lane is a result of long standing issues in policing made manifest.

Loadshedding, under resourcing and the SAPS's role as the de facto dealers in illegal firearms, has resulted in these six deaths, and this event plays itself out in countless places across our province. We know how to stop the killing, but rather than join hands and fight crime with us, the ANC would prefer to come and criticise this Government's efforts. [Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, as we are discussing ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr G BOSMAN: ... the socio-economic status of the people in the Western Cape, we must look at some of the successes as has been highlighted by the different speakers. [Interjections.]

Through you, hon member Bans must have been at a very different oversight visit in Kannaland because we visited Bergsig and Zoar, two Coloured communities, and as the former constituency head for Kannaland, I can tell you none of those ECD Centres were in white areas, but I do hope that next time ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr G BOSMAN: ... the ANC comes, I hope that next time the ANC comes on an oversight visit they would be less worried ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr G BOSMAN: ... about the eisbeins and the tomahawks, and stop thinking, and think about the plight of our people. [Interjections.] Because we know in this province the DA stands for the upliftment of all the people in the Western Cape. [Interjections.] We know that the Western Cape Government creates safe spaces for informal traders to trade and in the Western Cape our economy is thriving. [Interjections.]

We know that LEAP officers have been deployed, despite the reduction in the LEAP funding, LEAP officers are still doing their work.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

† 'n AGBARE LID: Waar? Waar?

[An HON MEMBER: Where? Where?]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

An HON MEMBER: Have you ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members ...[Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN: We know that construction projects in this province are creating thousands of jobs, improving the lives of citizens. We know that in this province, and we have seen it through our oversight visits to schools, that we believe in providing quality education for every child in every classroom. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Bakubaku-Vos, hon member Bans.

Mr G BOSMAN: And we know that you, through you, hon Deputy Speaker, we know that the members of the Opposition endorse our education system ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Bakubaku-Vos.

Mr G BOSMAN: ... because their kids go to our schools in the Western Cape, because even, hon members, Western Cape Government-run schools ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, can you talk to me, please. Address me. [Interjections.]

Hon member Bans, hon member Bans, you cannot shout [Interjections.] – hon member Bans [Interjections.] ... hon member Bosman, please take your seat.

[Interjections.]

Hon member Bans, I have been speaking to you. You cannot just shout above [Interjections.] – hon member Bans, I am talking to you, please. Interjections are allowed but not shouting over one speaker and the Speaker.

So if we can just allow hon Bosman to finish his debate, please. Thank you, over to you. [Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN: As I conclude, hon Deputy Speaker, I would like to ask the hon members opposite us, please to go away from this debate contemplating freedom, think about what freedom means. [Interjections.]

Through you, hon Deputy Speaker, I ask them do you truly believe the people in your governments are free? Do you truly believe that the people living in the rest of South Africa enjoy the same socio-economic rights as the people in the Western Cape? [Interjections.] In your hearts can you truly believe that your party offers a government that can move people out of poverty? Do you truly remain committed to the mission of liberating South Africa, or have you completely given up?

You have been in power for almost three decades, you are unable to govern this country. It is time to go, it has been time to go, and when they do go, hon Deputy Speaker, which we know they will go, the DA will bring not just its expertise in government, through our ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr G BOSMAN: ... crime fighting strategies and our economic development strategies, but we will take the successes of this Western Cape Government to the national stage. We will fix South Africa's broken healthcare system, we will fix the degrading social welfare system, we will work towards ending corruption and we will end loadshedding, as we are already doing in this province. [Interjections.]

We will deliver hope ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Where?

Mr G BOSMAN: ... prosperity and jobs like we have done in the Western Cape. We will fund artists and arts organisations and ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Windvogel ...[Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN: ... ensure that the people of the Western Cape get to travel to other parts of the country to enjoy DA-run Government. I thank you. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

That brings us [Interjections.] – hon members, that brings us to the end of this debate. We now move over in terms of Rule 197 – hon member Windvogel, Bans, hon member Bans.

Okay, we now move over to Rule 197 in terms of Interpellations. I recognise the hon Premier Winde.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you very much to the hon member for bringing this question or interpellation to the House, and it actually follows on very nicely from this question that has just been asked, and I think quite evident in the debate probably the wrong question to have asked in this House.

I also want to say that you almost get a feeling that it is being trivialised and racism is a serious issue in our country. I think at the end of this debate, listening to the hon member Gillion when he was saying – hon member Bosman, when he was saying that do you truly believe in your hearts that you are still liberating South Africa? And I want to say that I wonder whether the strategy of the ANC to continually drive division in our society through race is the right strategy, because over the years sitting in this House all I see is that strategy continuing, and I see the numbers in this side of the House just diminishing and of course the hon member who asked this question, used to sit on this side of the House and slowly but surely that strategy obviously is not working. [Interjections.]

I also want to say to the hon member that this is a very similar question to me asked on 12 August last year, and of course he now asks it again today on 13 April, and so first of all before I get to the actual reply, because it is a very serious issue, I want to say to the hon member that my office got hold of the South African Human Rights Commission to ask questions about this specific issue and also I have drawn all of the data off their website.

It was interesting, the answer came back in voice notes and I had the opportunity to listen to those voice notes today as well, and some of the comments made, and I would actually say to the hon member that it would be a good idea if the hon member actually visits the Human Rights Commission, and ask them the same question because I heard in those voice notes words like, that they did not – the issues that they were working on was on a large backlog and they have worked down the backlog.

Then they said, "We are not sure whether IOL ..." – because obviously it is linked to an IOL article published in the *Argus*, which of course is, we know how much of a voice piece that is of the ANC, but how it was published there and said, "I do not, I am not sure whether I [Audio distortion.] statisticly."

The second thing it was said was, and I asked the hon member to go and actually interrogate because they said the data is actually sounding like in this article a statistical misanalysis, and that was quite interesting, and the current situation in the Western Cape does not have more than other provinces. That was said by the Commissioner.

So then when we go to the actual site and you see where we refer to, which I think the article was referring to, which included the backlogs and it says, a heading says:

"Carry over complaints per financial year."

And of course this does the last 10 years and in that case it said 1 140 backlog in the Western Cape, and of course that number does show much higher numbers than other provinces, and sure, why is it? We need to interrogate that, but if you look at the latest statistics and it goes complaints by province, because this is the question: why are these complaints in this province higher than any other province? Well, quite frankly, this province has updated complaints at 233.

Worse than us are obviously the Eastern Cape, which is 272, and then after that, let us have a look at, let us look at KZN at 494, or Gauteng at 457. [Interjections.] That was the basis of this question, but then let us get to the actual answer because I started off by saying this is a very serious issue, and whether it is 200 complaints, or 400 complaints, or one complaint, they need to be taken very seriously. You need to go and analyse, because the complaints are analysed there, and each of them gets dealt with and I think that is exactly what has got to happen, but the question goes on to say what is his Government's attitude to racism, and what are the details of the programmes put in place to racism?

So first of all I think the Western Cape Government promotes the founding provisions of the South African Constitution and its guiding values of human dignity ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] here in the House.

The PREMIER: Of human dignity.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon Premier. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Of human dignity, the achievement of equality and the promotion of human rights and freedoms, and non-racism and non-sexism as in Section 1. It is of paramount importance for us to ensure that we deliver on our mandate in the province ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The PREMIER: ... and if you go through each of our departments, it adds up to 18 pages worth of programmes ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The PREMIER: ... across every single department of where this policy and strategy is carried through and we take this very seriously.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier Winde.

I now recognise the hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

It is clear that the Premier's words about racism being serious is literally lip service and nothing more.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Because the fundamental part of the National, as well as the Provincial Constitution, which I still maintain the Premier has not read, talk specifically about redress measures in regard to those who have suffered unfair discrimination.

You cannot just nod your head through the hon Deputy Speaker because you are not taking this seriously because not in a single speech, hon Deputy Speaker, that this Premier has made, has he ever referred to an injunction of our Constitution, and when one looks at categories of persons who have been discriminated against, that involves race and what this province is actually about is race denialism, because if they understood and embraced what the Constitution says about redress, then there would have been more action.

We have got a fundamental problem here because according to this report there were 123 race-related complaints laid in the Western Cape from April '22 to January '23, and according to the Human Rights Commission, in the Western Cape 43 of these cases remain under investigation, while most have been resolved through mediation, but it is also important to note that Felicity Harrison from the Institute of Justice and Reconciliation said:

"In the work that we have done, the Western Cape has had continuing problems between and within racial groups that have gone largely unaddressed. Antagonism both within race groups and between them is continuing, a trend that is carried over into our attitude towards foreign nationals from Africa, spatial apartheid and the continuing inequality, which perpetuates apartheid cleavages, continues to exist."

That is the basis of inequality and racism, and nothing that this Provincial Government has done has actually redressed. In fact it was the Premier, hon Premier Winde and Helen Zille, who specifically refused a recommendation of their own Housing Department to integrate the City by developing Tafelsig, and instead offering that to private owners.

So that is the clearest indication that the people of Sea Point [Inaudible.] saving domestic and general workers who are black and African and coloured, were specifically being discriminated against, not following the redress provisions and actually giving that to a privileged private grouping.

This is the clearest example of the Democratic Alliance upholding racist privilege, those who benefited, and refusing to implement redress. That is racism.

These programmes you talk about in 18 pages, where is one anti-racism programme? We do not see it. Where is there a programme amongst learners? We do not see it. Where in those 18 pages ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Can you tell us a programme?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

I now recognise the hon member Fry. [Interjections.]

MR C FRY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, thank you to the hon Premier for his response.

As residents of the Western Cape we should all be proud of our diverse province. We are a beautiful melting pot of cultures and communities who have congregated at the foot of the African continent. Our histories are intertwined, but also incredibly complex and painful. It would therefore be remiss of me not to acknowledge that there are indeed elements within our society that would want to see this beautiful province and its people retreat

into racial and divisive lagers.

As members of this House we all have a collective responsibility to stand against and reject any and all actions that seek to discriminate, divide and be hateful, not only outside of these Chambers, but also inside of these Chambers. We need to be mindful of our actions and words and how they can impact on others, as well as the communities of the Western Cape.

In the Democratic Alliance our values are underpinned by freedom, fairness, opportunity and diversity. These are the values we want to see espoused within this province and across South Africa.

We welcome the Western Cape Government working towards creating an inclusive province and its commitment to delivering an open opportunity society for all. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Fry.

I now recognise the hon member Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Cassiem, as you online?

Ms A CASSIEM: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I do see you online. Hon member Cassiem, if you can just unmute yourself.

Ms A CASSIEM: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No. Alright. I will ask IT if you can just please get hold of the hon member Cassiem.

Hon member Dugmore, would you mind going ahead of [Inaudible.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

It is clear that we expected the hon Premier to be totally scant on details, and he has been, He has not named a single programme that is focused on anti-racism, building tolerance amongst young people, there is absolutely nothing. He has mentioned 18 pages, but we did expect at least that the hon Premier would take a firm stand against racism, and I must use this opportunity, hon Deputy Speaker, to take the hon Premier to task.

Now more than a month ago a member of this House whose thinking is completely outdated and downright racist, called hon members of this House foreigners, and after a month the Premier of the Western Cape, as the head of his caucus and this House, head of Provincial Government, has not uttered a single word condemning the utterances and the subsequent behaviour of hon

member Marais, and I think the DA should hang their heads in shame, or just basically admit that they tolerate racism because it comes from their coalition partner, the Freedom Front, but absolutely this Premier who leads this province, of everyone, did not stand up when a member of this House called members of the ANC foreigners, and that shows that the DA essentially has an agenda to preserve privilege and not to take on racism, because politically they fear they will lose support to the Freedom Front. That is what we are dealing with here.

The Premier's Government can have an intolerable attitude and say that that is serious, but he has shown, the Premier of this province, a tolerable attitude towards racism. In fact he is tolerating the racism. [Interjections.]

They can talk about programmes to fight racism, we know they do not exist, but he sits, this Premier, hon Deputy Speaker, silently while a member of this House makes utter racist remarks, and then therefore whatever programmes he talks about, he personally is actually tolerating racism, and I think that as men that have been classified white in this country, the Premier and I should actually be the first ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: ... to condemn racism. Say that it has no place and be intolerant of anyone who wants to take us back and our children back to a bitter past.

My history and the Premier's histories are different. We chose different paths, but the reality is both of us today need to set an example and to be unequivocal about our condemnation of racism, and when it does not happen from Premier Winde, it casts this province into in fact a province intolerant of black people, and therefore the issues of extortion in our communities, the issues of gangsterism which affect so many people, the issue of the lack of access to land, which affects mainly African and coloured people, are not being addressed because fundamentally the Premier and the DA do not believe in redress ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: ... and that is the problem.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Dugmore.

Hon member Cassiem, have you been able to connect? I know she had an inability to be unmuted. Has IT assisted her? [Interjections.]

Ms A CASSIEM: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Cassiem? [Interjections.]

Ms A CASSIEM: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No. Hon member Cassiem, I am going to have to move on. I apologise.

Hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Hon Deputy Speaker, I think it is difficult for her to get off mute, to basically unmute, so could IT maybe ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, IT ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: I have also got a message from the hon member Cassiem.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Hassam is [Interjections.] – Mr Hassam has told me he is trying to assist her. There we go. Hon member Cassiem – you were off line. Last two minutes. [Interjections.] Can I ask how far we are? I know Mr Hassam is trying to assist her. [Interjections.]

Hon member Cassiem, I am going to have to move on. My apologies. Right, I am terribly sorry. We will have to move on in the interest of time. I do apologise for that.

Hon Premier Winde, over to you to finalise the debate.

The PREMIER: Thank you, thank you very much and once again I will reiterate that this is a serious issue in our country and this is a serious issue that has to be dealt with and not made into political ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Premier Winde, if you just take your seat.

Hon member Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Hon Deputy Speaker, I can see on the screen that the hon member Cassiem is online at the moment.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, but we cannot ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: And she is indicating there that she is still having a challenge in terms of being unmuted.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: But it would be unfair if she is going to be, I mean ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I know, she [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: We do understand in the interest of time,

but if IT can sort the matter out. All hon members have a right to speak, and she is in the sitting. It is not like she has gone AWOL ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... or she has gone into a place where there is no signal, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Sayed. Just in terms of that, she has gone off – oh, there she is back online.

Hon member Cassiem, can you hear us now?

Ms A CASSIEM: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just if I can remind the hon members in the logistics remarks I make at the beginning of the sitting, I always state that you have to check your IT communication material in order to make sure they work.

Hon member Cassiem, I still cannot hear you, so I am going to have to make a call on this matter. I do apologise. Ja, I saw that she did go off and come back on, and somehow is unable to connect with us.

Please, hon members, you need to test your equipment prior to the Sitting.

Over to your, hon Premier, apologies.

The PREMIER: Thank you. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

I also just want to say then that it was interesting that the hon member Dugmore talks about data and then carries on quoting the media statement, which is actually up on the website, but it was interesting that the Human Rights Commission themselves were questioning this specific article. I wonder how long it is going to remain on that website because I think they are asking themselves that question right now, and of course that is when I went back to the actual data that was on the website.

The hon member Dugmore also then talks about redress and conveniently talks about the Tafelberg site, but every time he mentions the Tafelberg site, which is a 1,2 hectare piece of property, he never mentions the 11 hectare piece of property which is just next door to it, 11 hectare piece of property which we have been trying to do exactly what he is calling for, redress, next door to the Waterfront, prime land, to create housing opportunities in the middle of the City. [Interjections.] He never says one word about that.

So he is not actually serious, he is playing politics here. He is not serious about redress because then he himself would say, "Come on guys, stop this illegal occupation, let us get this property, let us get this property developed."

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.] Order, hon members.

The PREMIER: Let us get this property developed to actually allow for what he is calling for. [Interjections.] But again, let us also watch as soon as the outcome comes from the court case, because the court case on that Tafelberg site had to be challenged. It had to be challenged. The ruling ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: ...could not be tolerated of any government on how they should manage or deal with their pieces of land. [Interjections.]

Then he says let us talk about there is not one item, not one document. He says "schooling", so let us talk, let us start with the education.

So dealing with issues of racism in our schools; promoting non-racialism and topics dealt with in the curriculum from Grades 4 all the way to Grades 12. Then I have got Grade 4, Grade 5, Grade 6. Every single year exactly what they do ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: That is the national curriculum.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: We are dealing with exactly what has just been asked. [Interjections.] If you go into the depths of it and it starts talking about democracy ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The PREMIER: ... and human rights, develop an understanding of the following concepts: discrimination and violations of human rights, the first item, guess what it is, race. Then it goes into religion, language, gender, sexual orientation, xenophobia, human trafficking, etcetera. He says there is not one item in that document.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: It is the national curriculum.

The PREMIER: Then you can go through each and every one of these documents, but of course he would not go into those documents, which are made available every year in the budgets, the Annual Performance Plan of every single one of these departments, you can have a look in agriculture, you can have a look in every department. Here you have got, that is – then you go to Community Safety, then you move on.

Every single one of these departments in this Government takes this extremely seriously, and that is why you see it pulling through in every

single one of our documents on every department and how it comes through in all of our programmes. [Interjections.]

So once again I am going to say to the hon member Dugmore, I suppose you will just wait until – you will ask the same question probably in about four months' time again, and we will bring it back here again. Perhaps we need to get you the real issues and I would actually suggest that as he starts this interpellation with quoting from the Human Rights Commission, actually quote from their human rights documents and not a press clipping that is based on their website. I presume that that will not be there for long, and actually I think it would be a good idea for him to go and engage with the Human Rights Commission on this very question, and then when he does bring it back and we have this debate, what I really would like to see ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: What I really would like to see ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: ... is to give, give and quote what the ANC does in this regard in the provinces where they run things, because I promise you the only reason that they are going to lose power next year [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: ... is because they do not address this. They do not deal with it properly and their policies have not worked for 30 years. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier.

I now move over to Interpellation 3, hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Hon Deputy Speaker, I think it is not proper. We are continuing, the hon member Cassiem is still having a problem.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: And she is muted from our side. [Interjections.] If they can just attempt to basically, I mean we have got to Interpellations. The problem is going to continue. I understand the point you raised that members must make sure that their devices are working.

The hon member Cassiem is saying that she has made sure that the device is working. The problem is that she is not being unmuted. It is a technical issue.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: We cannot let the hon member be disadvantaged because of that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So, hon member Sayed, just to tell you, I am on direct contact here with the ICT, they are busy typing to me, they are busy with her. I will hope that – it is as much as I can do for now, please. If that is fine, but they are busy assisting her. I tried to unmute her here, but I cannot do it from this computer.

So I do apologise to the hon member Cassiem. I see that she is busy getting direct access, giving direct access into her laptop so they can try and sort out the problem. Thank you very much.

We now move over to the interpellation with regards to the Minister of Health. I now recognise the hon Minister Mbombo.

INTERPELLATIONS

3. Ms R Windvogel to ask Dr N Mbombo, Minister of Health and Welfare:

- (a) What is causing the delays in the building of the Klipfontein Regional Hospital and*
- (b) which tasks will be accomplished over the medium-term?*

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELFARE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I am not sure whether you can hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Loud and clear.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELFARE: Okay, four hours on loadshedding. I hope I am still going to be able to make it throughout the interpellation.

Thank you, hon member Windvogel, for the question, and it is really important, which is demonstrated by that, which is the same question, whether it is an oral reply or written reply, now interpellations, that I have been receiving on the same subject, it is about 10, and the last one has been 24 February this year, and also before that [Inaudible.] this year, which also was asked to hon member Simmers, the Minister of Infrastructure.

Having said that, let me respond to the question because it is very crucial. The origination in terms of what causes the delays, the original professional services providers tenders, that one was cancelled and had to be readvertised, evaluated and adjudicated. This resulted in a delay in the commencement of the project.

The readvertisement of the tender to appoint multidisciplinary professional service providers for the design and construction management of the Klipfontein Regional Hospital has been undertaken and completed, resulting

in the award of the tender. Again let me just emphasise that the Department of Health is the [Inaudible.] implementing agent is the Department of Infrastructure.

So some of it is based on our oversight on the Department of Infrastructure as implementing agent, and some of it is about where I have to ask them for more information.

Now the question about what task has already been completed, or that will be completed over the medium-term. The Infrastructure again is a contracting agent on behalf of us and they can be able to provide additional information and where hon member Windvogel can ask them as she needs [Inaudible.] beginning of the year to date the Department of Infrastructure has appointed a town planner to commence land application processes, which includes the rezoning and [Inaudible.] consolidation, and also a site topographical survey and prelim site investigation report has been completed.

A tender retainables have been received from the consortium, which includes high level development planning, quality management, a plan and empowerment implementation plan. The Department of Infrastructure also had a two day project briefing with the consortium and also with us on 31 October in 2022, and then also again a month later.

Prelim clinical planning briefing sessions, which is now also led by them and us, were completed. There have been about five times where we met. The

last meeting was on 25 January this year. Site visits have been conducted again with the consortium using some of the hospitals, like the Khayelitsha Hospital, Mitchells Plain, so that it could be able to understand what could this hospital look like.

The project technical meetings that were commenced last year, are still ongoing and we are meeting fortnightly. The appointment of the sub-consultants and other specialists also have been commenting. So that is where we are in regard to this. Again emphasis is that we are a client of the Department of Infrastructure. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister Mbombo.

I now recognise the hon member Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, we know the DA Government is known for the blame game. For the Minister to refer me to the Department of Infrastructure is really a shame, but nevertheless, hon Deputy Speaker, the decommissioning of the G F Jooste District Hospital was carried out between July 2013 and July 2014, and it was said that the construction will take 36 months to complete. It has been a decade since the Democratic Alliance took unilateral decisions to close down the only hospital that services the people of Manenberg, Gugulethu and Nyanga, as well as people from Khayelitsha and

Mitchells Plain. The decision to close down the hospital and the delays in its rebuilding is yet another display of arrogance and disregard for black communities in the Western Cape by the DA Provincial Government.

We are now told the rebuilding and decommissioning of the Klipfontein Regional Hospital will not happen until 2033. This means that hospital that was supposed to be completed in 36 months, will take 240 months or 20 years. This is some monumental failure by the DA. It exposes its incompetency and complacency. This DA Government cannot build anything. Even the Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain District Hospital were projects led by the ANC. The DA is only claiming easy victories. Hon Deputy Speaker, the people of Klipfontein will be disheartened to hear that to date nothing has been accomplished in the process to rebuild the hospital.

In a reply to my question in February this year on the details of all tasks that have been undertaken for construction of the hospital, the MEC could only give a long list of meetings attended and the site visits. The Blue Book for the 2023 Budget exposed that not a cent has been spent in the reconstruction of G F Jooste Hospital to date. No groundwork has been done or any single brick has been laid. We have every reason to doubt that hospital will be rebuilt and commissioned in 2033.

The injustice inflicted on the poor people of Manenberg, Nyanga and Gugulethu by this DA Government is despicable. The MEC must therefore tell us what causes the 10 year delay and what will she do differently to

accelerate the rebuilding process. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Windvogel.

I now recognise the hon member Pretorius.

Mr G PRETORIUS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Before I proceed, I am glad to hear that hon member Windvogel has rediscovered her voice.

Hon Deputy Speaker, through you, I would like to thank the Minister for her response and for her Department's hard work in pursuing this vital project. It goes without saying that the progress that has been made is very welcome and I am sure we all look forward to seeing this work continue over the next months.

This year we will see the Department of Health and Wellness spend an additional R1,3 billion on infrastructure, evidence of the Department's clear commitment to rolling out the facilities our people need. This is all the more impressive given the budget shortfalls the Minister's Department faces, primarily as the result of National Government's continuous withdrawal of vital conditional grants. In effect the Department has faced budget cuts amounting to hundreds of millions of rands.

With regards to this I would like to ask the Minister her opinion on what effect this continuous defunding of her Department by the ANC's National Government will have on the rollout of infrastructure projects like this one, going forward. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Pretorius.

I now recognise the hon member Klaas.

Mr M T KLAAS: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Klaas, are you online?

Mr M T KLAAS: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Klaas, last call.

Mr M T KLAAS: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am not sure what is happening with the EFF's connections today. [Interjections.] Hon member Klaas?

Mr M T KLAAS: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No. I am going to then move over to hon member

Windvogel. [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Are we sabotaging ...[Interjections.]

Mr M T KLAAS: I am online, I am online. Sorry, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you there? I am very happy to hear your voice.

Mr M T KLAAS: Yes, am I here, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed, hon member Klaas.

Mr M T KLAAS: Yes, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

It is more than eight years now since the G F Jooste Hospital was commissioned, and to this day people in the Klipfontein area, which comprises Manenberg, Gugulethu and Nyanga, are stranded as their right to access medical healthcare is violated. This is a Provincial Government Department which claimed to be effective when it comes to service delivery, but it struggles to complete a project which is key to the lives of our poor people.

Having said that, my question is as follows: how is this delay impacting on the lives of people of Manenberg, Gugulethu and Nyanga? Which hospital

now caters for their medical needs and whether those medical facilities are accessible to them since the majority of poor people cannot even afford transport cost? Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Klaas.

I now recognise the hon member Windvogel, back to you.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, according to the latest plan it will take the DA 20 years to complete the reconstruction and commissioning of the G F Jooste Hospital. I repeat and I will repeat myself again and again until the hospital is built, the injustice inflicted by the uncaring and dishonest DA Government by taking away an essential service like a hospital, is despicable and the people should reject them at the polls.

The 10-year delay has forced the people to travel long distances and spend money they do not have, to access health care services. Due to the ongoing gang violence in the areas, some are forced to risk their lives to cross the turf of rivals gangs in order to access healthcare services.

To add salt to the wound, it will take another 10 years before the hospital is rebuilt. Why is this happening? It is because the DA disregarded the people and failed to consult and took a unilateral decision to close down the

hospital. Since the hospital was decommissioned the DA Government has spent over R90,6 million in the former hospitals sites. Over R1,2 million of this was on property rates and a further R14,5 million on security. Not only is the DA's reckless decision inflicting pain on the poor, it is also costing taxpayers every month as the bill continues to rise.

Hon Deputy Speaker, when the DA demolished G F Jooste Hospital, they promised to construct a Manenberg School of Skills in the site. Even on this project too the DA has messed up. It has been [Inaudible.] before courts and work at sites has been halted. The practical completion date for the project is set for September 2024, and judging by the current DA standards the school will only be completed in 2044. The DA incompetence and complacency have been exposed. This party is good for nothing, it should be booted out of power in 2024, like in Barrydale.

The whole process of closure of G F Jooste has exposed the DA's complete disregard for black communities. The DA has failed the people of Manenberg, Nyanga, Gugulethu and surrounds. Clearly this party of whites will never love us. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

I now recognise the hon Minister Mbombo. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, hon Deputy

Speaker.

Listening to hon member Windvogel, one will assume that there is a benchmark when she is talking about the DA failures in the health system. [Interjections.] In not a single one out of the nine provinces or the eight provinces that are ANC, the health system is not going down ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Chair ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: ... the drain. In the Western Cape ...[Interjections.]: ...but there is still more to do ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: ... there will always be challenges, especially with the population ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is the thing.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: ... and the resources that we have, and already we did indicate that our budget has been dropped by over a billion rand for this year, from the money that we are supposed to get from the National Government, and also with the issue of the loadshedding that has also been perpetrated by the failure of the ANC Government, where there is

no money that has followed, that we have to make things happen.

So there is not even anywhere where you could compare the Western Cape health system, there is no benchmark, but back to the G F Jooste Hospital. We acknowledge that this is supposed to have gone up, but the issue was about why would you build a level one hospital again on that site that was actually less than even 4 hectares, instead of building a level two hospital, that will be specialised, take into consideration that the then G F Jooste Hospital was not offering services for children, offering services for women and also it was not actually having the whole package. When we open the Heideveld EC, because it is not that we left space empty, because Heideveld EC, which is a 24, it has to take that consideration, but again the issue of the budget, the resources and also other computing resources that we needed to look at. But as I can say, hon Deputy Speaker, that one thing that I have promised, which I still promise, that it is not only the G F Jooste Hospital and Klipfontein Hospital that are going to stand [Inaudible.] it does not matter how much it will take because of the resources, but also the Tygerberg Hospital, the tertiary hospital, [Inaudible.] Hospital and also the Bella Hospital that is going to come up.

So thank you, hon member Pretorius, in regard to giving such support. We do as much as we can. We have got staff shortages, we have got the whole issue related to other resources. The medicines going up and all of those, as a result of the economy that is going down the drain. We are in the fiscal cliff which has been perpetrated by how the ANC run its economy.

Therefore what you are appealing about you as the members of the [Inaudible] Provincial Legislature. Actually you have to help us in mobilising the resources from the National Government, even that we have got R1,5 billion [Inaudible.] dropped me, which is equal to the one year budget of both the [Inaudible.] the three hospitals' annual budget: Khayelitsha, Mitchells Plain and also the Karl Bremer Hospital. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you all for the contribution.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, the hon Minister Mbombo.

That brings us to the end of Interpellations. We will now in terms of Rule 202 deal with Questions as printed on the Order Paper – it is cold. I will ask if the temperature can be raised. I will certainly do that, please, it is very cold.

I would just like to remind members in terms of Questions, that there are four follow-ups and I will give the opportunity to the member who posed the question, the first bite.

So we will move over to Question 3, which stood over from Thursday, 9 March. I recognise the hon Minister Meyer.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Questions standing over from Thursday, 9 March 2023, as agreed to by the House:

3. Ms A Cassiem to ask Dr I H Meyer, Minister of Agriculture:

- (a) How many cannabis projects has his department assisted and*
- (b) how many black people (African and coloured) did his department assist in setting up cannabis farms in the province?*

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Baie dankie, agb Adjunkspeaker, en ook baie dankie aan ons agb lid Cassiem van die EFF, en ek wil haar ook bedank dat sy ingestem het dat hierdie vraag kan oorstaan as gevolg van my ander verpligtinge, so baie dankie vir daardie geleentheid.

Agb lid Cassiem en lede van hierdie Huis, die Wes-Kaapse Departement van Landbou het tot op hede nog geen cannabis-projekte ondersteun nie, behalwe vir die navrae wat ons sedert 2006 van verskeie rolspelers ten opsigte van die lisensiëringvereistes ontvang het. Benewens hierdie navrae is daar ook geen ondersteuning van die Departement spesifiek versoek nie.

Soos die agb lid weet het ons ook onlangs 'n cannabis-plan en hemp-plan bekendgestel, en hierdie plan se hoofdoel is om dus ook 'n roetekaartplan van geleenthede en uitdagings in die cannabis en hemp produksie- en verwerking,

en die agri-prosessering vir die landbousektor van die Wes-Kaap daar te stel, veral met die oog op ekonomiese ontwikkeling en werkskepping.

Aan ons agb lid Cassiem, die hoofuitdagings die afgelope aantal jare was die verkryging van cannabis- en hemplisensies wat oorspronklik deur die Nasionale Departement van Gesondheid uitgereik is, en tans deur SAHPRA, dit is die South African Health Products Regulatory Authority, uitgereik word en sedert 2021 word hemp lisensies ook deur die Nasionale Departement van Landelike Ontwikkeling en Grondhervorming uitgereik, en hierdie Departement het ook in 2021, dit is twee jaar gelede, die nasionale cannabis meesterplan bekendgestel, en ook 'n analise van die cannabis- en produksielisensies gebaseer op die lys wat beskikbaar is op die SAHPRA webwerf, gedurende Oktober hierdie jaar, wat toon dat daar 17 lisensies in die Wes-Kaap uitgereik is, wat 23% is van die totale lisensies in Suid-Afrika, en hierdie lisensies is uitgereik in die Weskus, Kaapse Wynland, Kaapse Metro, Overberg, in die Klein-Karoo, met die grootste konsentrasie ook in die Wynlande.

Agb Adjunkspeaker en agb lid Cassiem, ook in terme van die hemp-permitte, toon die laaste gepubliseerde inligting dat daar 11 permitte in die Wes-Kaap uitgereik is, met 300 permitte nasionaal. Hierdie permitte is oor die hele Wes-Kaap versprei en in 'n poging om belangstellende rolspelers in die produksie en prosessering van beide cannabis en hemp te ondersteun, het die Wes-Kaapse Departement van Landbou die ontwikkeling van die Wes-Kaapse cannabis-raamwerk en implementeringsplan vir die landbousektor opgestel,

ek het dit onlangs bekendgestel aan die media, en ek gaan ook binnekort dit na die Wes-Kaapse Kabinet neem sodat ons ook verdere ondersteuning daarvoor kan kry.

Hierdie plan is ook gefinaliseer op 28 Maart vanjaar toe ek my Hoofbegroting ter tafel gelê het in hierdie Huis, en in die plan, agb Adjunkspeaker, word inisiatiewe vir die Departement asook ander provinsiale departemente en vennote uitgelig, wat dan die grondslag vorm vir 'n ondersteunende benadering gekoppel aan die pilare van die nasionale cannabis meesterplan.

Die agb lid vra dan ook spesifiek of sekere bevolkingsgroepe hierdeur spesifiek voordeel getrek het. Die antwoord, agb Adjunkspeaker, is dat geen persone het tot dusver ondersteuning ontvang nie omdat daar nog geen aansoeke ontvang is nie, anders as die groot uitdagings tot permitte wat deur SAHPRA of DALRRD uitgereik word nie. Dankie, agb Adjunkspeaker.

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank, hon Deputy Speaker, and also thank you to our hon member Cassiem of the EFF, and I also want to thank her for agreeing that this question could stand over due to my other commitments, so thank you for that opportunity.

Hon member Cassiem and members of this House, the Western Cape Department of Agriculture has to date not supported any cannabis projects except for the enquiries we received since 2006 from various role players with regard to the licensing requirements. Apart from these enquiries, no support has been requested from the Department specifically.

As the hon member knows, we also recently introduced a cannabis plan and hemp plan, and this plan's main aim is to create a route map plan of opportunities and challenges in the cannabis and hemp production and processing, and the agri-processing of the agriculture sector of the Western Cape, especially with an eye on economic development and job creation.

To our hon member Cassiem, the chief challenges the past few years were the acquisition of cannabis and hemp licences that originally were issued by the National Department of Health, and currently are issued by SAHPRA, that is the South African Health Products Regulatory Authority, and since 2021 hemp licences are also being issued by the National Department of Rural Development and Land Reform, and this Department also in 2021, that is two years ago, introduced a National cannabis master plan, as well as an analysis of the cannabis and production licences based on the list available on the SAHPRA website, during October this year, which shows that 17 licences were issued in the Western Cape, which is 23% of the total licences in South Africa, and these licences were issued in the West Coast, Cape Winelands, Cape Metro, Overberg, in the Klein Karoo, with the largest concentration also in the Winelands.

Hon Deputy Speaker and hon member Cassiem, also in terms of the hemp permits, the last published information shows that 11 permits were issued in the Western Cape, with 300 permits nationally. These permits are spread across the whole of the Western Cape and in an effort to support interested

role players in the production and processing of both cannabis and hemp, the Western Cape Department of Agriculture set up the development of the Western Cape cannabis framework and implementation plan for the agriculture sector, I recently introduced it to the media, and I'm also going to soon take it to the Western Cape Cabinet so that we can get further support for it.

This plan was also finalised on 28 March this year when I tabled my Main Budget in this House, and in the plan, hon Deputy Speaker, initiatives for the Department as well as other provincial departments and partners are highlighted, which then forms the basis for a supportive approach linked to the pillars of the National cannabis master plan.

The hon member then also asks specifically if specific or certain population groups gained benefit from this. The reply, hon Deputy Speaker, is that no persons yet have received support because no applications have yet been received, other than the big challenges of permits issued by SAHPRA or DALRRD. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Baie dankie, Minister.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister.]

I recognise first the hon member Cassiem, who posed the question. Hon member Cassiem, I see you online, then I see hon member Van der Westhuizen and hon member Marran. Hon member Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is good to hear your ...[Interjections.]

Ms A CASSIEM: I missed half of the – thank you so much, it was not an issue on my side, it was an issue on your side there on IT, but I missed half of the Minister's response.

I did, however, read through the PDF documents that were provided, and based on those documents that I received from the Department, the cannabis licensing for purposes of farming is regulated by the South African Health Regulatory Authority. They operate nationally and they are the ones issuing licenses to farm cannabis for medical purposes.

Hon Deputy Speaker, this paper by the Department is nothing but a plan which only offer recommendations to the Western Cape Department of Agriculture, but they say more research must be done in this field which is new and still growing. The paper also does not respond to the question so far as it relates to how many cannabis projects in this province did this Department assist and how many black people did this Department assist to set up cannabis farms in the province.

It only mentions that according to the South Africa Health Regularity Authority, the province only has 17 licences in the hands of cannabis

production holders, which only represents 23% in the whole country, according to page 5. The rest of the population in the province also grow cannabis in small scale for own use and substances, as per page 6.

They conclude in this document by speaking about what they want to see as potential outcomes of this growing agricultural sector and they say going forward as the sector grows it must be able to create jobs and livelihoods, have an impact on the economic growth of this province, be – and transformed rather. However, they say this can only happen if the regulatory space is opened by National as well as addressing the value chain integration issues.

So in essence they are saying so far as inclusion and transformation in the sector are concerned, their hands are tied by strict regulations imposed by this authority when it comes to the issues of issuing licences. More so what they are not telling us is under the current circumstances as things stand, difficult as they may be, what are they doing to assist black people, extend the definitions, to set up cannabis farms. In conclusion, let me mention that last year when we asked the Minister about what he is doing to assist potential emerging black farmers to have access to land for purposes of farming, he said that his Department has no mandate to do that as that falls under the mandate of National Department of Agriculture.

So these DA MECs and the Premier are good when it comes to shifting blame and responsibilities. I will leave it there for now, hon Deputy Speaker, thank

you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Cassiem. Please, I let you speak because we did not give you the opportunity, but this has to be questions, not speeches. So please keep your second follow-up question, if you do, to a question.

Over to you, hon Minister.

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Agb Adjunkspeaker, ek wil eerstens die agb lid Cassiem bedank dat sy wel ons dokumentasie gelees het.

Sy is absoluut korrek in die waardeskatting en evaluering van die dokumentasie wat daar is. Ek dink die agb lid Cassiem maak wel die opmerking dat ons in die verlede verwys het dat dit binne die Nasionale Regering se domein is. Dit is korrek. Sy het 'n korrekte aanhaling gehad, maar ek dink daar het intussen ook 'n bietjie wetgewende en regulerende wysigings gekom wat ook bepaal dat *cannabis farming* en *hemp farming* ook nou binne die kriteria is van die Nasionale Minister van Landbou, en daarom is die Nasionale cannabis plan geformuleer, daarom het ons 'n Wes-Kaapse plan geformuleer, en ek kan die agb lid Cassiem verseker dat dit ook ons intensie sal wees om te kyk na die sogenaamde Comprehensive Agricultural Support Programme sodat hemp en *cannabis farming* ook binne daardie kriteria in aanmerking kan kom vir die sogenaamde distribusie of materiële beleide, want die bedoeling is om mense te help en uit ons navorsing wat ons

gedoen het, is daar ook duidelikheid oor wat is die planne vorentoe.

Ons het verwys na die toekomstige beplanning en ek kan vir u ook die versekering gee dat hoewel die groeitoestande vir cannabis en hemp nie eintlik werklik heeltemal optimaal in die hele Wes-Kaap kan plaasvind nie, veral ten opsigte van reënvalgebiede. Cannabis, 800 millimeter en meer van Oktober tot Maart, en hemp omtrent so 650 millimeter reën en meer in dieselfde periode, is die areas in die Wes-Kaap wat wel geskik is, sekere areas. Boere wat in die gewasse dus belangstel, en as die agb lid verdere inligting wil kry is dit ook miskien baie geskik dat ons ook 'n persoonlike gesprek het, sy kan my kom besoek, sodat ons ook die inligting kan deel, maar mense wat ook spesifiek dan belangstel kan ook dan in sekere gekontroleerde omgewings, byvoorbeeld in tunnelboerderye verbou, en die plaaslike en uitvoermark betree.

Ek het reeds twee jaar gelede ook die veldprojek besoek daar in Stellenbosch, waar ook in die tunnelaktiwiteite verbou word, beide vir die plaaslike en die oorsese mark, veral vir medisinale doeleindes, en hemp kan ook wel in oop lande verbou word, en dan die ontwikkeling van die waardeketting, die toegevoegde waarde, met ander woorde die agri-prosessering, dit is ook moontlik om dit hier te doen in die Wes-Kaap, maar soos die agb lid Cassiem tereg opmerk, daar is altyd ruimte en meer ruimte vir nog verdere navorsing.

Hierdie navorsing wat tans gedoen was bevestig ook dat daar nog meer navorsing is, want hierdie Wes-Kaap Regering glo dat daar voortdurend ook

navorsing gedoen moet word.

Daar is ook omvattende voordele verbonde aan hierdie praktyk. Ons is tans besig met 'n omvattende strategie vir groei, vir werksgeleenthede en ek is oortuig, agb lid Cassiem, dat hierdie nuwe sub-sektor in die lanbousektor, nadat die Nasionale cannabis- en hempplan goedgekeur is en ons het 'n Wes-Kaapse plan wat ek na die Kabinet toe sal neem, sal ons voornemende boere, opkomende boere, definitief – wat hierin belangstel – die nodige (a) tegniese ondersteuning gee; (b) die nodige finansiële ondersteuning, maar ook (c) die nodige beleidsraamwerke, die aansoekprosesse van baie van hierdie goed is dikwels baie gekompliseerd, en daarom sal ons ook daardie hulp verskaf aan ons boere. Dankie, agb Adjunkspeaker.

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Deputy Speaker, I want to first thank the hon member Cassiem that she indeed read our documentation.

She is absolutely correct in the value estimate and evaluation of the documentation that is there. I think the hon member Cassiem makes the observation that in the past we referred to it as being in the domain of the National Government. That is correct. She had a correct quote, but I think in the meantime some legislative and regulatory amendments came about that also determine that cannabis farming and hemp farming now also fall within the criteria of the National Minister of Agriculture, and therefore the National cannabis plan was formulated, therefore we formulated a Western Cape plan, and I can assure the hon member Cassiem that it will also be our intention to look at the so-called Comprehensive Agricultural Support

Programme so that hemp and cannabis farming can also come into consideration within that criteria for the so-called distribution of material policies, because the intention is to help people and from our research we conducted, there is also clarity on what the future plans are.

We referred to the future planning and I can assure you that although the growth conditions for cannabis and hemp are not wholly optimal in the whole of the Western Cape, especially with regard to rainfall areas, cannabis, 800 millimetres and more from October to March, and hemp about 650 millimetres of rain and more in the same period, the areas in the Western Cape are indeed suitable, certain areas, farmers who are interested in the crops, and if the hon member wants further information it is perhaps appropriate that we have a personal conversation, she can visit me, so that we can share information, but people who are specifically interested in certain controlled environments, for example in tunnel farming, and enter the local and export market.

I have two years ago already visited the field project there in Stellenbosch, where there is also tunnel farming for both the local and overseas market, especially for medicinal purposes, and hemp can also be cultivated in open fields, and then the development of the value chain, the added value, in other words the agri-processing, it is then also possible to do it here in the Western Cape, but as the hon member Cassiem rightly says, there is always room and more room for further research.

This research currently undertaken confirms that there is more research because this Western Cape Government believes that there should be continued research.

There are also inclusive benefits to this practice. We are currently busy with an inclusive strategy for growth, for job opportunities and I'm convinced, hon member Cassiem, that this new sub-sector in the agricultural sector, after National has approved the cannabis and hemp plan and we have a Western Cape plan that I will take to the Cabinet, we will assist prospective farmers, emerging famers, surely – who are interested herein – and give (a) technical support; (b) the necessary financial support, but also (c) the necessary policy frameworks; the application processes of many of these thing are often very complicated, we will also provide that support to our farmers. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Baie dankie, Minister.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister.] I now recognise the hon member Van der Westhuizen.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Baie dankie, agb Adjunkspeaker.

Agb Adjunkspeaker, deur u aan Minister Meyer. Minister Meyer, baie dankie dat u op 'n paar van die realiteite gewys het, naamlik die hoë watervereistes en dat baie dele van die Wes-Kaap nie aan die reënvalsyfers voldoen wat cannabis benodig nie, en dat daar dus besproeiing nodig sal wees.

Hoe is u gevoel op hierdie stadium in terme van die potensiaal vir broodnodige werkskepping in die verbouing van cannabis en hemp vir die Wes-Kaap? Dink u dat dit werklik die towerstaf is wat baie mense glo dat dit sal wees, in terme daarvan om vir 'n klomp mense werk te skep? Baie dankie.

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, through you to Minister Meyer. Minister Meyer, thank you for pointing out some of the realities, namely the high water requirements and that many parts of the Western Cape do not adhere to the rainfall figures that cannabis requires, and that irrigation will therefore be necessary.

What is your feeling at this stage in terms of the potential for essential job creation in the cultivation of cannabis and hemp for the Western Cape? Do you think that it is really the magic wand that many people believe it will be, in terms of creating jobs for a lot of people? Thank you.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Baie dankie. Minister Meyer.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister Meyer.]

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Agb Adjunkspeaker, baie dankie vir daardie opvolgvraag.

Toe ons hierdie plan bekendgestel het, het ons ook een van die - ek dink dit

was een van die burgemeesters, het ook daardie vraag gevra: wat is die potensiaal vir werkskepping uit hierdie spesifieke sub-sektor van die landbousektor, en ons data wys spesifiek dat in terme van ekonomiese groei en werkskepping, is twee van die vernaamse fokusareas van die Wes-Kaapse Regering, en beide cannabis, agb Adjunkspeaker, en hemp produksie en die verwerking daarvan, kan wel as 'n katalis dien in hierdie verband, want ons navorsing het daarop gewys dat die potensiële grootte van die cannabis-industrie in Suid-Afrika bereken word op ongeveer omtrent so R28 miljard.

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you for that follow-up question.]

When we announced this plan, we had also one of the - I think it was one of the Mayors, who also asked that question: what is the potential for job creation from this specific subsector of the agricultural sector, and our data shows specifically that in terms of economic growth and job creation, it is two of the chief focus areas of the Western Cape Government, and both cannabis, hon Deputy Speaker, and hemp production and the processing thereof, can serve as a catalyst in this regard, because our research showed that the potential size of the cannabis industry in South Africa can be calculated at about R28 billion.]

So, hon member Van der Westhuizen, the potential from research for the cannabis and hemp industry in South Africa is in the region of about R28 billion and I think because of the unemployment crisis we have in South Africa, we must do everything possible to inject new life into this industry as

well because the research also confirms that we can create between 10 000 and 25 000 new jobs across the whole value chain, and I will do everything possible to assist people in this particular regard, but, hon Deputy Speaker, like all new sub-sectors of the economy, my call would be on the hon member Van der Westhuizen and members of the Committee and hon member Cassiem, to assist us with trying to create, like in any sector in the agriculture, that we create a body, like in the citrus industry we have the Citrus Growers Association. They act in the interest of citrus. We have Vinpro, they act in the interest of the wine industry and the Red Meat Organisation, they act in the interest of meat.

So my call in this House today, is that we establish a similar organisation for the cannabis and the hemp industry so that in the Western Cape, when the Minister has to interact with people and future farmers, that we interact with an organisation with a body, with a constitution, with values, with goals, with clear outcomes, frameworks and also a governance framework, so that we have regular elections and so that there is democratic accountability.

So this is a new industry for us, we are going to make mistakes. I recently read a book called "Failing Forward". I am happy to fail forward, by Mr Maxwell. So we are going to try this, we are going to test it, we are going to make mistakes, and so the request to members of the Committee, once the Cabinet has approved, Mr Van der Westhuizen, the plan and the framework and the management implementation plan, I would appreciate if the Chairperson of the Standing Committee, Mr Van der Westhuizen, could invite

the Department to make some further submissions and to further ask us some questions and even difficult questions, because once you have difficult questions you sharpen the saw, to quote Stephen Covey in his book "Seven Habits of Highly Effective People". We encourage difficult questions, even questions that may upset me, welcome it, because that makes the industry better, sharper, focus the research and be in a better position to support the industry.

I humorously, hon member Mvimbi will know, I humorously in the past said I do not want to touch this industry because of my pastor, but I am now the Minister of Agriculture and there is a science, agriculture is a science, and my pastor understand the importance of science, and I know the Table staff will also appreciate that cannabis not – we can put unemployment, [Interjections.] we can decrease unemployment. I know Mr Kama is already on a high, I do not know if it has anything to do with cannabis, but I hope you are not on a high because of just hearing that word "cannabis", but I think collectively this is an industry.

We have identified certain areas where there is great potential for this industry; soil assessment, technical assessment. You are also familiar, as the former Minister of Agriculture, of our extension and advisory officers. We want to equip them because they also have to give the people the right advice, because I do not want hon member Kama now to just go and plant things that he should not be planting because the environment is not fit, the production capability is not fit and he is not trained in the agri-processing

and the value chain.

So, hon member Kama, if you want to experiment with hemp or cannabis, but if you maybe want to as a Member of Parliament, you have a constituency and members of your constituency may approach you and say you are a Member of Parliament, how can you help me, I want to grow into this business, and then you must be able to help them.

So you must have an interest and you must be on a high when you give them help, and that help ...[Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Not too high.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Not too high, but you must be able to give them enough energy, but on a more serious term. There will be a rollout. I plan to have a cannabis summit together with the Department of Health, the National Department, Wesgro, the Department of Economic Development, the City of Cape Town Mayors, because this is a new economy, this is a new growth potential and we believe the growth potential can unlock a number of opportunities. [Interjections.]

Yes, part of the regulatory framework, this is exactly what the hon Premier says and, hon Deputy Speaker, the best place, hon member Kama, for cannabis, according to the research, and I am not sending you now to the – you must stay here – is in the Eastern Cape and in KZN. You know the best

areas and I want them to succeed. That is why I am not interested that the Western Cape succeeds, I am interested that South Africa succeeds, and that is why I will be working with my colleagues and share this research also with the MEC in KZN and the MEC in the Eastern Cape for Agriculture, because we must make South Africa work and I want to thank hon member Van der Westhuizen, but the essence of his question is, we need to come and present the report so that we can have further discussion and sharpen our intervention before we roll it out over the next couple of years.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

I now recognise the hon member Marran and then hon member Cassiem, and that will be four questions. Hon Marran ...[Interjections.]

Mr P MARRAN: Thanks, hon Deputy Speaker. Am I audible, hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are, you may proceed. You may proceed.

Mr P MARRAN: Thanks very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, through you to the MEC. In your [Inaudible.] plan you mention the issue of the establishing of industry stakeholders coordination. Now when you have spoken now to the hon member Kama and we really want to take you seriously, is the fact that you do not know how many black

farmers are there in the Western Cape. You do not know how many land is under the ownership of black farmers.

We also note the absence of AFASA when you have presented your budget just the other day. Are black farmers part of the stakeholders? Are AFASA part of the stakeholders? And will they have a stake when it comes to cannabis farming within the Western Cape? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon member Marran, you are familiar that we want to make this part of the comprehensive of agricultural support.

Hon member Marran is also aware that the Comprehensive Agricultural Support Programme is exclusively for black people and so they will therefore benefit when they apply for this. It is a national conditional grant and we want to make it part of that conditional grant, and certainly they will be able to benefit.

I think the original question from hon member Cassiem was the number of black people that have benefitted. I have indicated that nobody has applied to get approval for this in terms of agriculture. There were some approvals in terms of the SAHPRA process, but in the Western Cape no allocation have been made, but I am certain that that will be the focus, that will be the strategy going forward.

Then hon member Marran has asked me now about AFASA. While I would very much like to ask – well, it is not my time to ask, I must answer, but I would very much like to know from myself, AFASA, I would like to see their Constitution, I would like to see when last were there elections, because like I now mentioned in terms of the governance framework for the hemp and cannabis industry, I would very much like a regulatory governance framework and the question is will AFASA – obviously anybody that is coming into the picture, the principle of this Government is social inclusion.

So the answer is indirectly yes, anybody in any organisation that meets the criteria and can submit audited financial statements, is very welcome to apply and I hope that AFASA can produce to us their constitution, their membership and give us audited financial statements. If they do that, they're most welcome to be part of any financial allocation process in agriculture and therefore I will have no objection, but the principle of good financial governance will be the foundation in terms of which we will proceed with any further financial allocation in this regard.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

I now recognise the final opportunity, I recognise the hon member Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM: Thank you, and thank you, hon Minister, for the feedback.

Hon Minister, if I can just go back to the documents. The fact that it says there that the province only has 17 licences in the hands of cannabis production holders; as the Minister, and I am pretty sure you are clued up on all the information and you have done your research, can you give an indication, out of that 17 licences in the hands of cannabis production holders in the Western Cape here, how many of those 17 holders are females, or rather women, and how many are black people? Do you have any indication of that at least? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Cassiem. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon member Cassiem, you will recall that I did mention correctly, as pointed out by you, that during October 2022 SAHPRA has allocated 17 licences in the Western Cape, which is about 23% of the total licences that have been allocated in South Africa.

I am quite happy to approach SAHPRA because these are licences that they have allocated and I am quite happy to find out, to write to them, for specific criteria that hon member Cassiem has requested me to do, and I will certainly come back to the House with the specific details. She asked how many black people out of the 17, how many are women, and I am quite happy to do that.

I have already indicated that we only have the geographical areas where these licences have been allocated, but I think her question is justified and requires an answer, and I am happy to do so.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

That brings us to the end of Question 3. We now move over to new questions. I now recognise the hon Minister Marais.

New Questions

1. Mr M Kama to ask Ms A J D Marais, Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:

(a) What informed her Department's decision to stop building new libraries and

(b) how many municipalities have been engaged and shown interest in the initiative of wheelie bin and container libraries?

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Thank you, hon member Kama, for the question. It is quite a lengthy answer.

Over this MTF cycle the Department's focus will be on keeping our 375 existing library staffed, stocked and efficiently operational. The current budget allocation unfortunately does not allow for the expansion of new library service points across the province. The new infrastructure projects will focus on enlarging and improving existing smaller libraries into modular or bigger library points.

In this regard we are funding R850 000 towards a modular library in Overhex in the Breede Valley, and R850 000 to contribute towards a modular library involved in Wagenmakers in Drakenstein.

The decision to build a new library facility also not only rests with the Department, but is a collective decision with a municipality. Before funding is provided to a municipality, they need to demonstrate that the facility can be fully operational once it is there and that they are able to cover the associated costs to operate the facility. Most municipalities are not financially capacitated to do so and the Department is not in a position to do so either. I do have a financial table which I will hand over to you, that indicates the budget allocations for the past five years for the National Community Library Services Conditional Grant and the Municipal Replacement Fund.

In 2020 and '21 a substantial budget is observed due to the COVID pandemic. The budget then increases only marginally in the subsequent years, trying to catch up to pre-COVID allocations, which was inadequate to begin with, and with this current funding trajectory and budget uncertainty of the National Community Library Services Conditional Grant and the Provincial Municipal Replacement Funding for vulnerable municipalities, the grants can simply not afford the establishment and operation of more libraries.

The existing grant allocations do not allow for the establishment of new or

upgraded facilities as the lion's share of the grant allocations are to maintain and operate our existing facilities, and notwithstanding the above, the Department makes every endeavour to assist where the need for library service is the most critical, subject to municipal capacity and budget availability.

To this end in the 2022/23 financial year, funding has been made available to the Theewaterskloof Municipality for the [Inaudible.] Modular Library and to George Municipality for Touwsrante Modular Library. In the 2023/24 financial year, the Department will provide funding for the erection of the Wagenmakers Modular Library in Drakenstein and Overhex Modular Library in Breede Valley respectively, and the second part, you have asked how many municipalities have been engaged and show interest in the initiatives of wheelie bin and container libraries.

I have got a list of 11 library for modular requests, 11 places, in George, Bitou, Breede Vallei, Drakenstein, Laingsburg, Swellendam and Witzenberg, I will also hand this over to you, and the municipalities provide the Department with a request for funding annually and the allocation of funding is subject to available budget and the adherence of compliance to the Western Cape Library Services' norms and standards for public libraries.

Ten municipalities have indicated the need for modular library facilities, while only one municipality indicated for container libraries, and no

municipality has indicated the need for wheelie wagons, and we have 21 wheelie wagons that are rolled out in our province already, and it is in Eden, Cape Winelands, Overberg and Westcoast District. Thank you. Oh, also in the Central Karoo.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, and thanks to the MEC for the reply, and I think also in line with what the MEC is saying, I think there was an article from *The Daily Maverick* in 2022 which was written by Tamsin and Michelle Banda, which said that public libraries are being called upon to do more with less and in the face of closures and tightened budgets and expanding mandates.

I therefore want to get an understanding now with this decision that was made by the Department, or the announcement that was made by the MEC, that there will be no new libraries that are built and that some will be supported with these containers and wheelie bins to provide the service.

I therefore want to get an understanding, hon Deputy Speaker, as to how will this decision impact on library services in the province, especially in those areas where the Department has closed down libraries in the past? Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, hon member.

As I have said it is difficult for us with the budget constraints to expand the library services, but we try our best, and one library that we really are very proud of is the new library in Swellendam, that we try to make it a community centre where you can have performing arts, as well as the artists, visual artists, and make it more accessible and also – †ek wil nou in Afrikaans sê dat daar meer gebruik gemaak kan word van 'n *library*, [I want to say now in Afrikaans that more use can be made of a library,] and as I have said the municipality must also ask for our assistance for a library, but we really try our best to expand or do the best with the libraries that we have.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Bosman?

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Through you, to the hon Minister. Hon Minister, can you perhaps elaborate a little bit more on how many people are currently benefitting from departmental initiatives and libraries? And also, if you do have the numbers at hand, how many books have been distributed this year?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, over to you.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, hon

member Bosman. The latest figures that I have got and I can get you the more recent ones, it is almost 11,9% of the population. It is almost a million; it is 700 000 people that make use of the libraries. But you must remember, not all – these are active members – not all are active members. They will use the library, but they are not active members. And seven million books were issued now and before COVID-19, it was 15 million. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker and I think the difficulty that one has, hon Deputy Speaker, is that every time when a particular service cannot be improved, we are told about budget cuts that happen nationally. But we have seen here in this province where the hon Premier can go around and ...[Interjections.] We have seen in this province where the hon Premier can go around [Inaudible.] means he can come with a billion to fund what the Government is ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...to fund what the Government says it wants to deliver, like the boots on the ground. Now, what I do not get is how is the Government of the Province committing because there are areas where libraries would have been closed and there is no service in that particular area. There are areas where libraries would have been banned. And I think as the ANC, we would always caution against the people who are destroying

public property as they disadvantage others in that area. But at the end of the day, children in those areas cannot be left to a situation where they do not have a library.

Now, the question that I want to ask to the hon MEC is whether this decision to no longer build new libraries, especially in areas where there are libraries that would have been closed – I think of Witzenberg in Ceres where their library was closed. Now, I want to understand whether there is a moratorium now that there are no other libraries that will be closed because even if you think of Imizamo Yethu Library which was closed due to mudslides causing foundations to be unstable, so how is the Government committing that it is going to ensure that the service of libraries is provided in those areas. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, hon member Kama. As I have said, we really try our best and in Ceres it was not closed. The community burned the library down. So, we put it right on the bottom of the list to rebuild that library. And then also, you know, most of our areas do have a modular library or a mobile library and I am very proud of what the Department in the Library Section is doing in the province, to make libraries accessible to all the communities.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Bosman?

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, through you. Last year we were alerted to the fact that the National Department of Arts and Culture was planning to spend R22-million on erecting a flag, money that could have been spent on building more libraries in this province. [Interjections.] And we also know that this Department has stopped funding the South African National Book Festival that used to take place in this province. So through you ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order, hon members.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Through you, hon Deputy Speaker, I would like to ask the hon Minister whether there has been any indication from the National Minister of Arts and Culture whether there will be an increase on the Conditional Grant for libraries or whether any of the money saved from that R200-million flag-folly that the National Minister wanted to erect, has been provided to [Interjections.] perhaps give more funding through to libraries ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.] Hon Bosman, is that your question? [Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): And ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: And?

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): And the second part of the question is also, if the hon Minister can perhaps elaborate a bit more on the new model of creating community-based centres where libraries are operating and whether that gets support from the new National Minister of Arts and Culture.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bosman. [Interjections.] Over to you, hon Minister. [Interjections.]

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Baie dankie, agb lid vir die vraag. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, hon member for the question. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Ek wil net noem dat ons geen indikatie van die nuwe Minister het of ons enigsins ekstra befondsing vir biblioteke gaan kry nie. En ons het ook op hierdie stadium geen indikatie wat gebeur het met die R22 miljoen wat nie vir die vlagpaal gebruik is nie. Maar ons het 'n MINMEC op die 24ste en 25ste April wat ek wel die vraag sal vra en dan kan terug kom na u toe daaromtrent. En dan die gemeenskapsgeoriënteerde biblioteke wat ons nou in werking gestel het – soos ek genoem het, Swellendam is een voorbeeld – doen ons absoluut op ons eie befondsing. Dit is 'n inisiatief van die Wes-Kaap en ons kry geen

ondersteuning van Nasionaal af nie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: I just want to mention that we have no indication from the new Minister whether we're going to get extra funding for libraries. And we also have no indication at this stage what had happened with the R22 million that had not been used for the flag pole. But we have a MINMEC on the 24th and 25th April where I will indeed ask the question and then come back to you about that. And then the community oriented libraries that we now put into operation – as I mentioned, Swellendam is one example – we do it absolutely with our own funding. It is an initiative of the Western Cape and we get no support from National. [Interjections.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Baie dankie, agb Minister. [The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister]. That brings us to the end of Question 1. Question 3 – hon members [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Windvogel!

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: In Swellendam, ja.
[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: In Swellendam, yes.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, I would like to proceed. Question 3 has been

withdrawn. We now move over to Question 4. I now recognise hon Minister Mackenzie.

4. Mr L L Mvimbi asked the Minister of Mobility:

- (a) What engagements has his Department held with the taxi industry,
- (b) what are the details of the complaints that were put forward by the industry and (c) how is his Department addressing them?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker and I must say, this is my first Question for Oral Reply. So, thank you very much, hon Mvimbi. And also, hon members, it is an interesting question from hon Mvimbi. He seems to have his sources because our meeting is taking place tomorrow. So, it is interesting that hon Mvimbi is asking these questions specifically because the meeting – sorry?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just take your seat. Hon Kama, is there a point of order?

Mr M KAMA: Yes, hon Deputy Speaker. According to the Question Paper that I have, we were now supposed to go to the question of hon member Bans to the Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That has stood over, apparently ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA: And in that, because I was checking now because the practice would be that if the hon MEC will not be here, they would inform the hon member that asked the question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA: And when I asked hon member Bans, she was not informed ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja, okay.

Mr M KAMA: ...of any of that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA: And that she ...[Inaudible.] from time to time before we start indicating if there is that also that question so-and-so have been requested to stand over because of any other reasons. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So, if that is the case, apology on behalf of the Administration. There might have been an oversight. I will ask into that, but the hon Minister Allen is [Inaudible.] next. So, there was a request to have this Question stand over and I will check why you have not been directly informed. My apologies for that.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Sorry, hon Deputy Speaker. He is chairing the MINMEC.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Oh, he is chairing the MINMEC. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes, hon Mvimbi, yes [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So, if we can give the space for hon Minister Mackenzie as it is his first question that he is going to be answering as a Minister. Over to you, hon Minister Mackenzie.

The PREMIER: Hear, hear!

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon colleagues and as I indicated before hon member Kama rudely interrupted me [Laughter.]. No, just kidding. That yes, I appreciated this question, hon members because seeing as hon member Mvimbi is aware of the meeting taking place tomorrow and he strategically posed this question for today, but we will respond honestly and frankly because that is how we are going to respond tomorrow as well. So, we will answer these questions in the House. But thank you for the question, hon member Mvimbi, this is a very important question because it is a matter that is affecting 70% of commuters in the Western Cape and we need to find a way in dealing with some of these challenges.

So, your first part of the question is what engagements has the Department held with the taxi industry? When I started, hon members, I think the first person I called that Monday I was sworn in, the second person because I spoke – my daughter was the first person I spoke to – was the Chairperson of SANTACO, Mr Mandla Hermanus, because there was an impending taxi strike. He was literally the second person I called after I was sworn in, to get to an understanding as to how do we stop the impending taxi strike that was going to happen that Wednesday.

We spoke and we had a lovely discussion because obviously as you know, hon member Mvimbi, you are part of the Committee, we had a relationship with the leadership of SANTACO before, when they came to our Standing Committee. So, I knew at the time there was a willingness from the taxi industry to work with Government. They were not averse to working with Government, but there were obviously elements, part of the taxi industry, that were not so eager to meet with us, but there were elements that were willing to work with us. So, I did reach out to Mr Mandla Hermanus, and we subsequently had a great meeting.

So, let me point out first on my formal answer which we will submit to you, hon Mvimbi, via you and because this now becomes a matter of public record, some of the content we will also share tomorrow with our colleagues. So, allow me to first point out that my office has an open-door policy with the minibus taxi industry and all public transport stakeholders. I have made this

clear since the day I took office and I have endeavoured to meet with our mobility partners to understand the challenges they are faced with and to find solutions to improve our mobility ecosystem because it is not just about the taxi industry.

I think sometimes individuals – and not everybody, hon Mvimbi – there are individuals who just try to regulate or deregulate our transport industry to the taxi industry. There is an ecosystem that exists which is taxi industry, the bus industry, the rail industry. I, myself, have travelled on bicycles. So, there is an ecosystem that exists, but for whatever reason, everybody seems to focus on the minibus taxi industry when things go wrong or sometimes, when things go right. So, I wanted to find a solution that will improve the mobility ecosystem and how the minibus taxi industry feeds into that mobility ecosystem.

And the story that I always tell at every meeting, including last week with my meeting with the National Minister, including the PRASA board members where we were at the meeting at Cape Town Station. I am happy that my colleagues, hon member Dugmore and hon member Nkondlo also joined that meeting subsequently. And I told them this story about how I used to travel, and it gives an understanding for those who do not understand the public transport sector. I used to take a taxi from Steenberg to Retreat Station. At Retreat Station, either the taxi or the bus to Cape Town and then subsequently, the taxi to Sea Point. So, there was an ecosystem that existed and that ecosystem for some other reason, has deteriorated or has been

destroyed over the past 16-years.

The reason I told this story is because I wanted to paint a picture as to how do we rebuild that ecosystem. So, once we start isolating it to the taxi industry, the trains, the busses, we are not trying to find a way to integrate this ecosystem. So, that is why and obviously, it predates my time. I can understand the hon Premier's vision as to why he calls it the Mobility Department because there is an ecosystem that must exist together. A mobility ecosystem because previously, we were just a transport system. You had a bus, you had a taxi, you had a train. Now, it is an ecosystem. So, I share the vision that the hon Premier has and that is why we want to work together with our colleagues.

So, our office, hon Mvimbi, we fully understand the role the minibus taxi industry plays in this ecosystem because they are a partner in this ecosystem. They do not stand alone in a transport system. And that is why we are looking at how all of us can enjoy the full range of economic educational opportunities that our province has to offer because we believe people must get to and from work safely. So, our Office of the Provincial Taxi Registrar has regular engagements with the leadership of the taxi industry because they have a statutory responsibility to provide as much guidance and support to the taxi industry as is reasonably possible, to enable associations and their affiliated members to remain compliant with legal prescripts.

The Provincial Regulatory Authority that is tasked to monitor and oversee

public transport in the province also had regular engagements with the taxi industry. These engagements not only allowed the Department to work with the industry, but to collectively address the key challenges that will allow us to identify early warning signs as potential conflict and instability in the taxi industry.

Just yesterday, in fact, I was with the Provincial Regulatory Authority, and they have standard engagements with the industry because sometimes, it is not just about permits, it is about queueing, it is about how do people get to the centre, it is about contactability between officials and between the taxi industry. So, those are I think, some of the concerns hon member Mvimbi is already probably worried about that we are trying to deal with, hon member Mvimbi. There are regular engagements, and they must take place on a continuous and ongoing basis.

So, since then, hon Mvimbi, I have established the Minibus Taxi Task Team with my colleagues in the City of Cape Town, local and provincial officials and the leadership from the minibus taxi industry. One of the things is, hon members, that they are part of the system that is working to resolve the problems because sometimes, as any government in the world, we make decisions, and we inform people that we have made the decisions. In this particular Task scenario, the taxi industry is part of the Task Team and that is why we are meeting again tomorrow. It is a series of ongoing engagements where we tackle issues and then try to resolve these issues.

So, what the Task Team is also doing, hon Mvimbi, in that Taxi Task Team, is that we are trying to address and deal with the special regulatory process and I will ask my colleague, hon member America – I presume he is online – to invite us to the Standing Committee where we can explain that special regulatory process in detail.

So, what we are working with, we are planning, we are regulating, and we are looking at the management and the enforcement of the industry because any government has to enforce any law. All of us are subject to the law where we come to Parliament. All of us are here today. We are online, we vote. So, any industry must be part of a regulatory forum. There is a speed limit, so all of us hon members in this Parliament adhere to the speed limit. So, despite the fact that we are working to regularise them, but there must also be enforcement as part of that process. And I am happy that the leadership understands that part as well.

So, we have developed the terms of reference – again, I will gladly come and explain that to the Standing Committee – with the Task Team. Again, this is not a term of reference that we have developed as the Western Cape Government. We sat, the first meeting, we literally spent the whole day, hon members, to say what are we going to talk about.

Hon member Dugmore will know it better than, I think, all of us in this House, the talks about talks that happen, what are we going to talk about. Because sometimes people put things on the agenda that they have come up

with, but then they are not the items that must be resolved. We have come up with the terms of reference that we discuss and that we are going to work together. So, no-one amongst that table, when they come to that meeting, can say 'we were not party to these discussions' because they agreed to the terms of reference as to what we are going to talk about. So, that is a very important matter.

The second important matter is I personally chair that Taxi Task Team and it is so important, hon members, and I can share it in this meeting. The Minister has invited me to Pretoria tomorrow for the release of the Easter, sadly, statistics of those that have passed away. I declined that meeting and I explained to the Minister why. We have taken the taxi's leadership into our confidence. We are meeting with them on a regular basis. Those are set up statutory meetings I call. We do not change them for anyone. It is non-negotiable.

So, I explained the Minister and she understood it. [Interjections.]. It is a non-negotiable meeting – it is a non-negotiable meeting with our National Minister and our colleagues ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ...and they fully support us in that. Because yesterday and the day before, our police in KwaZulu-Natal managed to sort out problems in a similar fashion. You can read about it in the newspaper

today. You would have read about it yesterday. I do not agree with the outcomes of the way they have solved, but they have adopted an inclusive approach as to how you deal with them because I shared with them two weeks ago, how we dealt with it in the Western Cape. So, that is why I am saying that ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ...hon Mvimbi seems to have known what is happening tomorrow. Hence why his questions.

Part (b) to these questions, hon Mvimbi, is also a very important question. What we have done is, we have grouped the concerns because there were many concerns. So, what we decided, hon member Mvimbi, is to group these concerns and these other concerns that they have raised. As you know, there is tremendous pressure on our broad-based public transport services, most of which have been absorbed by the demand-responsive minibus taxi industry because they are responsive. We have to agree to this.

So, there we have looked at what are the inequalities between the balance between demand and supply of the minibus taxi services. So, there is the special regulatory. So, the request from them, hon Mvimbi, is how do we expedite their efforts to balance the need between supply and demand in existing routes to address the capacity constraints to certain public transport facilities and also, to conduct feasibility studies and propose new routes to

identify where necessitated in residential and commercial developments. And here, hon members, we really need to look at – sadly, and I am going to say – look at what we teach at Varsity.

Because if you look at our shopping centres, and all of us go to shopping centres, go to any shopping centre today. The one near my house, Blue Route Mall. There is no proper taxi rank. Go to Cavendish, go to wherever you stay. So, how do the architects, hon Leader of Government Business at University, how do they study public spaces in the country? And it is consistent across the country that public transport, taxi ranks, are an afterthought. They design a shopping centre and two years later, there are six parking bays for you. [Interjections.] That is not how it should be done.

Universities should teach students who are architectural students to please take into account public transport. That means you must design a proper shopping centre with public transport so that our aunties do not walk across the road with shopping bags. And that is the original sin, actually, hon members. If we change our architectural design at Varsity, that is how we can address some of these matters. So, they are valid concerns that they raise.

The second concern, hon Mvimbi, is the registrations of drivers to improve driver behaviour and to ensure that remedial action is taken against offending drivers, and that they are not re-employed by other unsuspecting operators. The industry has also requested that drivers be upskilled through custom

designed training programmes. Hon members, a few weeks ago you saw the horrible situation where a woman was thrown out of a taxi ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Sjoe!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ...because she did not pay her taxi fare.

An HON MEMBER: Joh!

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Now, that was clearly behaviour from the taxi *gaatjie*, as we know it in Cape Town. That *gaatjie* was supposed to be trained and developed by the taxi industry to ensure that when somebody does not have money, they must find out why they do not have money. The solution is not to throw people out of a taxi. That is not something that all of us can work ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: So, we have to work with the industry, hon members, to upskill our drivers. We have seen it happen at Mitchells Plain [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is it a point of order?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ...Khayelitsha, at many other taxi

...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Take your seat.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Sorry?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Take your seat, hon Minister. Hon Mvimbi?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Deputy Speaker, I have asked a question and the hon Minister is trying very hard to answer my question. But the hon Minister has got two praise singers who are actually drowning [Laughter.] who are drowning us and we cannot listen now to the responses. If you may please speak to the hon Minister and the ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The praise singers. [Interjections.] Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hon Deputy Speaker, I will refrain from making any comments, except to know whether the hon Minister that is performing so well is available for a National Minister. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Mackenzie [Interjections.] Hon Minister Mackenzie, you have got three minutes which includes response [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: No, what?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So, either you are going to allow anybody to respond, but in about three minutes, I might give you one response and then, we call it a day.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Sjoe!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So, perhaps you want to give that time ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: I really – I have got so much more, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I can imagine, but we ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Okay, let me try and rush quickly. So, how do we improve that driver behaviour, hon members, in Mitchells Plain, in Khayelitsha and all those places? So, that is what the taxi industry is also asking.

The third thing is the tracking technology. Hon members, as you know we have had great success in the past with the tracking and interestingly, hon members, a few weeks ago I was in Gauteng where I met with SA Taxis, a big funder of the taxi businesses, and they had incredible tracking technology. They can see in real time where their taxis are, where their taxis are driving.

So, imagine that taxi in Delft, hon members, had one of those trackings on. We could have tracked that taxi that threw that Auntie out of a taxi. [Interjections.] So, there is a way we can assist them and work with them, hon Mvimbi.

The fourth one, hon member, is the branding and legal – no honourable – please speak to hon Bakubaku-Vos?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, hon members please?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: The fourth one, hon members, is the branding of legal and transport vehicles to allow others to distinguish between what is legal and what is illegal. That is a fair request, hon Mvimbi, from the taxi industry. So, all of us know if you have got a driver's licence, Ricardo can drive, or he cannot. If somebody has a gun you need a gun licence or you do not. So, that is a legitimate concern.

The other one, hon members, is to the conditions about wrongful impoundment. If a taxi is wrongfully impounded, any of us, somebody pulls you over, they take you and your car, you are going to be aggrieved as well. So, how do we deal with those matters and on the agenda for tomorrow, actually hon Mvimbi, it is that matter. That is why I am saying that you know very well what is happening and I appreciate it that he is very well informed. [Interjections.]

Both my Department and the industry leadership are acutely aware that we must work together to find suitable solutions for these concerns within the parameters of the law. We agree that enforcement is a non-negotiable and they have a collective responsibility to ensure there is a safe and dignified transport for commuters. I must point out that the planning, regulation and management of the public transport is a concurrent responsibility of all spheres of Government in terms of the Constitution.

All spheres of Government and organs of state have a constitutional responsibility to consult each other and to cooperate with one another on matters of mutual interest. We also have a duty to coordinate our actions and our legislations. In this particular case, the Task Team is a coordination between ourselves, the City of Cape Town and the minibus taxi industry. And that is how we are going to resolve the concerns that they raise.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I can continue, alright?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, I ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Because I see you are looking at me very angrily.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, I am now – we have now got to a full 90-minutes. So, even if you stop now, it would not be fair to continue asking questions because there is an asking question and there is a response which

could take another 30-minutes. So ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: I will submit my formal response.

An HON MEMBER: Perhaps, can he move the next [Inaudible.]?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Okay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am not sure that it can, but maybe you want to finish off, hon Minister, and then provide some of that feedback to hon Mvimbi ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: We will give the written response, yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...perhaps tomorrow?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: No, I just want to say thank you to hon Mvimbi ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: ...for this question. It is a very important question. I think the people of this province want to know what we are doing to sort out the public transport and this is a critical question asked ahead of a meeting taking place tomorrow. So, thank you, hon Mvimbi, you are clearly

well resourced. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister [Applause.] for your indulgence. And apologies, hon Mvimbi, for the follow ...[Interjections.] Tomorrow, probably, might be better. That brings us, hon members, to the end of Questions for Oral Reply. Outstanding replies will be printed in the Hansard. Hon Chief Whip, your point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. May I address you on the matter concerning the hon Minister Allen not being in the House?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, please, you may.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you. Earlier on, the hon Bans was not aware that the hon Minister is not going to be in the House. Hon Deputy Speaker, for the record, I wish to draw your attention to an email that was sent this morning at 8:36 AM addressed to the hon Bosman and the hon Bans, where the hon Minister apologises for not being here. But also stating that the reason for the short notice is due to the MINMEC having been rescheduled several times. So, I just needed to make mention.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): And to have that recorded. Thank you, Deputy

Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, for that clarity and I hope that that sorts things out. Hon Dugmore, do you have a point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you very much for asking the Chief Whip to inform the House about what is going on. But, hon Deputy Speaker, I want to in the light of that apology given and given that we therefore will not have the benefit of this response. And also given that our session for 4 May has been postponed allegedly because the Cabinet needs to go on a visit to Hermanus. That means we are going to have to wait, miss out on another session. I just want to ask you as a Deputy Speaker, whether you agree with the fact that literally, the Cabinet appears to be dictating to the Legislature as to when we can sit or not. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, you cannot ask my opinion on such matters. I do not have an opinion. I only preside in the House. Hon Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Based on the Leader of the Opposition's comment, am I allowed to address you on that?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may address me.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Just to rule out any confusion. [Interjections.] The Cabinet Programme has been formalised and communicated in January already. The hon members would see that did reflect on the Programme and also that the Sitting for 4 May is not cancelled. That is why the Sitting on the 25th is an extended Sitting, which will include Questions to the Premier as well as all other matters on any Order Papers.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): So, it is not a matter of any Sitting being cancelled. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Sayed, over to you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I think the first problem that arose was to give space to the hon Chief Whip of the Majority party to actually now go and speak on this matter because you had ruled already. But now, because she has spoken on the matter it is only going to be fair that you give me an opportunity to also speak on the matter, and the matter is already in the public domain.

Firstly ...[Interjection.]

The PREMIER: You have got the wrong information.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Firstly, no, no [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Firstly ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, hon members. Over to you, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes. Firstly, hon Deputy Speaker, the Programme of the Legislature already had 4 May as a day for an actual Sitting, dedicated to a Sitting, but it already had that. The Programme of the Cabinet is there, indeed, but the decision was taken only in the meeting that we sat on Tuesday, to cancel the meeting of 4 May. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): To cancel the Sitting of 4 May because it is cancelled. Whether you put one item of the Sitting, which is Questions to the Premier, to join it up with another Sitting, that does not mean that the Sitting has been postponed. It means it has been cancelled. Let us not play

semantics. We have put the matter out there. Let us continue with the Sitting ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): What we are putting on record is that the Democratic Alliance in the form of the Chief Whip of the Majority party, is trying to protect the Executive from accountability and wants to prioritise a Programme of the Executive ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. Hon members ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): In fact, in fact, instead of the hon Meyer standing here ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...and jumping around and clowning around ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Ah yes. Yes, yes!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...he should be meeting ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...with us as the Opposition
...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...and engaging on this matter
...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...as the Leader of Government Business.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Because it is unacceptable.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed. Hon members
...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: None of this has got to do with me. I do not have
the power. I do not have the power to change this. [Interjections.] So, first
of all [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja, sit down.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, can I just finish speaking? [Interjections.] I just want to finish speaking. The Programming Authority of which I am not a Committee member, sits with the Chief Whip and whoever is on the Programming Authority must raise this. So, please, I preside. I cannot have an opinion about this. If it has changed: what changed? I am not sure, but that is the prerogative of the Chair of the Programming Authority. It is totally an internal matter. ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Chair, Chair, you are absolutely correct ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: The Chief Whip is on the stair. He cannot speak now. Sorry!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, no, no, no. [Interjections.] I was recognised ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No, no, you abuse. Do not abuse.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I was recognised by the hon Deputy Speaker. ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Where did you come ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Do not disrespect the hon Deputy Speaker. The hon Deputy Speaker has recognised me. Hon Deputy Speaker, [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable, just take a seat please.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Interjections.]... Majority Party. Sit down.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will give you a voice. I will give you a voice.

An HON MEMBER: You are ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I actually want to agree with you, hon Deputy Speaker. I want to agree with you. You are correct. This has got nothing to do with you and hon Deputy Speaker

...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please, hon members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, it is out of order
...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...for the hon Meyer to bring my religion
into this context. This is this is Islamophobic, and I take strong offence.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It is Islamophobic.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It is discriminatory. He cannot bring
somebody's religion into the context of me raising a valid point.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. [Interjections.] I did not hear it. I will listen
to ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes. Can he please withdraw what he is

saying.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Can he withdraw what he is saying.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can you sit. Hon Minister, just before I ask you, can I just ask the Chief Whip. My apologies. I think we should not be entertaining this. We were absolutely on track. Can we end this discussion, hon Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Absolutely. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, but I believe this cannot go unchallenged because they are untruths that are spoken here today in the House. Hon Deputy Speaker, anything ...[Interjection.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Hon Deputy Speaker!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...that has to do with the Programme ...[Interjection.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Hon Deputy Speaker!

Mr M KAMA: Point of order!

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...is dealt with by the Programming Authority.
...[Interjection – audio distortion.]

Mr M KAMA: No, the ANC is calling ...[Interjection.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Oh, no, we will not allow this. We will not let
[Interjections.] abuse us.

Mr M KAMA: No, you cannot ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members! I have a right [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: She is ruling you, ruling.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: No!

Mr M KAMA: You ruled now!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA: [Interjections.]... has stay her ruling.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just sit for one second.

Mr M KAMA: You do not allow us to speak on the matter.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kama, you may not shout.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: You ruled. Why do you allow her to speak?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Baku ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA: But you have ruled on the matter. Why are you giving her space to speak again ...[Interjection.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Why you allow her to speak on this matter?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bakubaku-Vos, sit down, please. Please, can everybody sit down. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: You must all now ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, but I am the Speaker that you I can ...[Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: But he is now overruling the hon Deputy Speaker.

Mr M KAMA: [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kama, I have not recognised you. Just one minute. [Interjections.] You will get your chance, just ...[Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: I am rising on a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You cannot rise on a point of order on a point of order. Okay, let me finish ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA: I do not know what, but she did not say [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, I recognised her, hon Kama. You will get an opportunity ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA: I have raised an order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You cannot, while I am busy speaking to her, hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: [Inaudible.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): And it is clear she is not to respond.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is not out of order.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: You are out of order.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I was busy speaking.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): [Inaudible.]... to respond. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I was busy speaking, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I understand.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): No!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: But I said, can everybody sit down, and I have now recognised the Chief Whip to end the matter.

An HON MEMBER: You allow ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please sit down, hon Kama, and I will give you an opportunity democratically [Interjections.]. I know you ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): This matter has been closed ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, because I am ...[Interjections.] because ...[Interjections.] Because hon Sayed, like you – no, I have ruled – but like I also gave you an extra opportunity ...[Interjection.] Now, the Chief Whip has been standing [Interjections.] Hon Kama! I do not want to have to ask you to remove yourself. Please, can I just finish my conversation [Interjections.]

Hon MEMBERS: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I really do not want to.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): This is ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You need to tolerate dissent, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am tolerating, but I am busy focusing on the Chief Whip. ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): But hon Deputy Speaker, she has been given two opportunities, I was given one. Inconsistent. Rule on the matter ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are getting the second one.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...and do not allow both of us to speak. She should sit down; I will also sit down ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...and we continue with the Sitting.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can I ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, perhaps to make it easier. All I want to say is that I am retiring on the matter.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, thank you very much.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): We can resolve this in the Programming Authority. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you can sit down. Thank you very much.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, this is totally unnecessary and it is not about being unfair. It has absolutely nothing to do with this Sitting and

we are now deviating. I ...[Interjections.] no ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): She is the one ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...because there are two. There is a Chief Whip here. Hon Bakubaku-Vos, listen to me if you are going to want to get your attention. If the Chief Whip stands up, the Whips or the Chief Whip of the Opposition or the Deputy Whip of the Opposition, I recognise them out of the respect of the positions they hold. I actually did. Both of them stood up at the same time and I gave hon Sayed the opportunity.

So, the Chief Whip had already risen and it is in the respect of the Chief Whip, for me to be able to recognise her. But it does not help when everyone stands up. I am quite happy to let you speak but allow her to finish her conversation or her points of order or her reason for standing. But what I would like to do now, if I may, hon Kama, I am going to – if you want to rise on something related to this, but I am going to finally state I would like to end the conversation, if I may, and that for us to proceed no further. Please can I ask the Chairs who are in charge of these matters, to handle it internally. May I proceed. Hon Lekker, you are the Chief Whip of the Opposition, so you may stand up and speak.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: But I hope it is not going to be a belabouring of the

same points, but you may speak.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): In a way, I would like to respond particularly in the manner in which you have managed this situation. Allow me, hon Deputy Speaker, to say having sat here listening to how you were managing the House, I want to believe that the Standing Rules of this House are used as a weapon to silence hon members of the Opposition. You have indicated right now that 'hon Kama, do not make me to ask you to remove yourself'. For me, that is unacceptable, and it immediately sends a message that says Rules are used as a weapon. So, I would like to appeal to yourself to use a good command and understanding of the Rules, not to intimidate hon members of the House equally.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Lekker. And once again, if people are shouting at me while I am speaking, you are violating the Rules. So, if I actually ask and recognise you, there is no problem about the Rules, but if while I am speaking to someone else, you are shouting simultaneously, no one can hear, you yourself are breaking the Rules of the House. So, let us just work this both ways. This is no weapon. It really just is about managing the Sitting. Can we proceed, hon members. I now recognise the Statements by Members. I recognise the Democratic Alliance.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon

Deputy Speaker, the 2024 National Elections is a make-or-break election as many voters are desperate for change and hope, as the situation in South Africa seems increasingly bleak. Today, hon Deputy Speaker, I want to tell the people of our province and the country that hope is alive.

As South Africans languish under an expanded unemployment rate of 42,6%, the Western Cape created 167 000 jobs. As a convicted rapist and murderer escaped from prison without detection from SAPS for almost a year, the Western Cape Government is building LEAP stations to bolster the policing in the province, due to SAPS inefficiencies.

As businesses shut their doors and South Africans lose their jobs due to unrelenting rolling blackouts, and may I say, hon Deputy Speaker, that my home town is experiencing ten hours of blackouts today. I want to say to the residents of the Western Cape: swearing and ranting at the incapacities and blaming the National Government will not add 1 kilowatt hours' worth of energy. The only thing that will increase is your blood pressure. When you think of this failing State, we have a choice in 2024. Here in the Western Cape, the Western Cape Government is allocating R60-million for emergency powerpacks for indigent homes. As constant interest rate hikes drive up the cost of living, the Western Cape Government has allocated millions of rands to ensure that school feeding schemes provide nutritious meals to our children.

Hon Deputy Speaker, as the ANC National Government desperately clings

onto its waning power while systematically destroying every public institution and service delivery mechanism, the DA-run Western Cape Government is delivering services, creating jobs, and building strong communities. It is with this knowledge that South Africans will go to the polling stations ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...in 2024 and through the power of the ballot, pack up the ANC's things ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...and kick them out of the Union Buildings. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I now recognise the ANC.

An HON MEMBER: The WCCP is calling.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Alright, typical of this country. [Interjections.] Typical of the superficial time of a country. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable ...[Interjections.] hon members ...[Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Can I go? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Windvogel, your colleague is standing up. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: Okay. Hon Deputy Speaker, the ANC in the Province wishes to applaud the National Government together with the Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa, which is PRASA, with the completion of Phase 1 of the reopening of the Central Line from Nyanga to Langa. [Applause.] This comes after three years of inactivity with some routes that are now faced with informal settlement dwellers who live on the railway tracks, due to the unavailability of land and human settlement, land and human settlement which should be provided by the Provincial Government, as well as the City of Cape Town.

The National Government and the Housing Development Agency are trying to work together with the City of Cape Town to try and find alternative space for these dwellers and we hope that the City will cooperate in this regard, as this will actually mean cooperative governance in action. The City needs to work hand-in-hand with the National Department of Human Settlements on the relocation programme, in finding suitable land so that the routes occupied could be restored, while resolving the issue of another mode of transport. The reopening of the Central Line will alleviate the cost of transportation towards many public transport commuters who would like to see rail act as a

catalyst towards the rejuvenation of the BRT and the subsidisation of the minibus taxi industry, as this will act as a supporting structure towards the rail system.

Many low-income households cannot afford to travel into the city using bus services, MyCiTi or Golden Arrow for that matter, causing these households to go deeper into impoverishment. We look forward to Phase 2 of the restoration of this line and its completion, as well as the reopening of the Northern Line from Eerste River to Strand and from Eerste River to Muldersvlei. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hear, hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Applause.] I now recognise the EFF.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Decisive action
[Interjections.]

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Cassiem, are you speaking on behalf of the EFF? [Interjections.]

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Yes, I am. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Thank you. Tomorrow, 14 April, the last Friday of the holy month of Ramadan, millions of people across the world will commemorate the international day of Quds. The EFF wishes to encourage the public to participate in the programmes commemorating the day of the oppressed across SA, this in solidarity with the oppressed people across the world.

For decades, the people of Palestine have known no peace since their land has been invaded, seeing most of it gradually taken over by a series of invasions instigated by the illegitimate apartheid state of Israel, who has since tortured and murdered thousands of men, women, and children in what remains of our beloved Palestine. We know that tomorrow, just like any other day, this DA will not light up this Legislature in solidarity with the oppressed people of Palestine because the oppressed do not matter and they will not get the same attention as when the DA lit up the Legislature building in the colours of Ukraine, even going as far as issuing statements in support of the people of the Nazi Ukrainian Government.

The DA have never expressed the support for the people of Palestine and continuously openly express their support for the illegitimate state of Israel, just like in 2018 when they slammed the Government's decision to withdraw the South African ambassador to Israel. But it is understandable that a party

like the DA could never stand in solidarity with the people of Palestine, just like they cannot tackle racism and the oppression among their own ranks even within the province.

In conclusion, the EFF encourage all to stand in solidarity with Palestine and calls for the land to be returned and to fight for all forms of apartheid practices, not just in South Africa, but also to stand in solidarity with all those oppressed across the world. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Cassiem. I now recognise the DA.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, amidst the seeming onslaught of bad news and negativity in our country, it is always worth highlighting some successes. Last week, the Chrysalis Academy held the graduation ceremony for 220 of its candidates, all of whom were women. These candidates have received vital skills training in office administration, security training, as well as peace officer officiating. In addition to these skills, these candidates have also received instruction in personal mastery techniques that allow them to take charge of their own destinies and effect positive change in the lives of those close to them.

But more than this, these candidates have also been placed into employment, including with SAPS, the National Prosecuting Authority and several Western Cape municipalities. They will go back into their communities to make them

safer and more secure while simultaneously building the lives that they deserve for themselves and their families. The value of this cannot be understated.

Through a relatively simple and cost-effective initiative, 220 women, most of them from Beaufort West, will take charge of their own destiny equipped with skills which will give them economic and personal independence. Initiatives such as Chrysalis Academy should be backed across the country. These graduates should be proud of themselves, but so too should all those involved in the Chrysalis Academy. As our country moves through these tough times, it is institutions like this that will keep society on the right path. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, I recognise GOOD. Hon August, are you online? No. I will move over to the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, we are seen as the country in a downward spiral, a country in crisis aided and abetted by unscrupulous bureaucrats lining up their pockets with State money. SAA, Eskom and loadshedding and now, the Post Office. Where will this end? What will stop this downward spiral of once a powerful and much needed industry? The ANC seems to be hellbent on crippling a proven, profitable organisation. These companies are helped into bankruptcy by money-hungry bureaucrats and management. This mess is tangible, and we can see it. South Africa is now a failed state.

Change must come in 2024. We will not forget: a debt of R4,4-billion is a sum total of incompetence, dishonesty, corruption, and bad management. We must remember that the Post Office received a R2,4-billion bailout from National Government earlier this year and what happened was, that there was a provisional liquidation hold for people who collect. What is going to happen with the people that collect their SASSA grants?

Hon Deputy Speaker, the problem is that the Post Office services people with their SASSA grants. We know that all over in Mitchells Plain, post offices will close, and people are suffering. So, we need change and change must come in 2024 to save this country from an ANC that is busy ruining this country. I thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise the ANC.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, the people of the Western Cape are waiting patiently for Malusi Booi to spill the beans and he must speak. In the wake of the SAPS raid on the offices of the former MMC in the City of Cape Town, weekend reports suggest that the companies which are implicated in the corruption are not only linked to gangs and extortionists but were also used by this Provincial Government and long before Malusi Booi was appointed to his post. [Interjections.] We always knew that the DA was

corrupt and ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...and corrupt to the core. They can just hide it away very well. The exposure of corruption in the City of Cape Town and soon, in this Provincial Government, will open a can of worms for the DA. We have been saying that the DA works with gangs. That DA-councillors write glowing letters on behalf of gangsters in mitigation of sentencing and on City of Cape Town letterheads, *nogals*. The DA has no shame when it comes to striking deals with gangsters and getting involved in corruption.

Soon, the hon Premier will be exposed for leading a Cabinet which is funded by gangsters. In his SOPA, the hon Premier called for lifestyle audits of the top brass of SAPS. Where is the latest lifestyle audit on the hon members of his Government? His Cabinet has changed a whopping four times since 2020 when the last audit was done. We have yet to hear of the outcomes of the request to declare any interest in dormant or non-dormant business entities by the hon members of this Provincial Government. The hon MEC of Infrastructure ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...must take this opportunity and declare ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...that his Department is not doing business with entities linked to gangsters.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): The DA is corrupt. They just hide it better.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I now recognise ...[Interjections.] I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, hon America.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you. I rise today to acknowledge and commend the efforts of the Western Cape Traffic Services, in keeping our roads safe during the recent Easter holidays. It is with great pride that I share that there were no fatal accidents reported in the Western Cape during this time and this is an achievement worth celebrating.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Provincial Traffic Services played a pivotal role in ensuring that motorists adhere to traffic regulations and that our roads were

safe. Their hard work and dedication undoubtedly contributed to the success of the Road Safety Campaign during the Easter holidays. As we approach another long weekend, I would like to call on the Provincial Traffic Services to remain vigilant and to continue to enforce traffic laws in a fair and effective manner. We must continue to prioritise the safety of all road users and the Provincial Traffic Services must continue to lead the way in this regard.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it is important to acknowledge that road safety is a shared responsibility. All road users, whether drivers, passengers or pedestrians must play their part in ensuring that our roads are safe. We must all commit to responsible and cautious driving behaviour to prevent accidents and save lives. Let us continue to work towards safer roads in the Western Cape and beyond. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon America. I now recognise the Freedom Front Plus.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The Freedom Front Plus notes with great concern that the World Health Organisation and UNICEF report states that 2,078-million people currently experience hunger in South Africa. And of these, 1,925-million or 92% of those that experience this chronic hunger were black Africans. [Interjections.] Aggravating matters, it has been reported that SASSA lost half a billion rand through fraudulence and corruption and South Africa lost R250-billion through State

Capture by the Guptas and Jacob Zuma.

To aggravate matters, it is reported 500 000 people in South Africa have been brutally murdered in South Africa since 1994 and we hope that this irrefutable evidence of corruption, maladministration and inefficiency, as well as bad governance by the ANC will convince voters to finally turn their backs on this party. If not, they will go to their graves holding protest placards and humming meaningless freedom songs, but they will leave no inheritance or economic future to their children that stay behind. [Interjections.] Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise Al Jama-Ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, on the Cape Flats, several mass Iftars, Bukas, breaking of fast which we call Bukas and well known here in Cape Town, which many describe as a spirit of caring and sharing, have been taking place.

The past weekend, Al Jama-Ah along with other stakeholders, fed thousands of people in New Horizons, an area where poverty is written on the walls. In celebration of the Al Jama-Ah party's 60th birthday on 18 April, which is on the 27th day of the holy month of Ramadan, marking the beginning of the auspicious night of Laylat al-Qadr, the night of power, Al Jama-Ah will host

a mass breaking of fast in Riverlea, one of the poorest areas in Johannesburg. We will also honour three national heroes with citations for their role in the liberation of South Africa.

Al Jama-Ah calls on all justice- and peace-loving people to pray for the liberation of Palestine and to free all oppressed people. We appeal to all Muslims to fully observe the last ten days of the holy month of Ramadan with solemnity and devotion and prayers. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the Democratic Alliance.

Mr C FRY (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The City of Cape Town is now well on course to become South Africa's first loadshedding-free metro. This week, the City launched an impressive electricity purchase tender of 500 megawatts. This is in an effort to free the residents of Cape Town from Eskom's monopolistic grip and to protect the City's economy from rolling blackouts, in order to boost growth and job creation. Eskom's monopoly over power generation in South Africa, coupled with years of corruption and mismanagement of the parastatal under the watchful eye of the ANC, has resulted in a lack of reliable, diverse and reasonably priced power.

As a result, South Africa has been subjected to non-stop rolling blackouts without a clear strategy or political will from the ANC National Government. However, in the DA-run Western Cape's City of Cape Town and local

governments, not only do we have governments that plan and strategize to make our province loadshedding free, but they also have demonstrated their political will to deliver on these promises. Through the Western Cape Municipal Energy Resilience Initiative, the Province has thus far generated 1 008 megawatts of power by means of utility scale, low carbon generation that has gone into Eskom and municipal grids.

Hon Deputy Speaker, where the DA governs, plans with strategies regarding energy have tangible results which translate to actual power generation. The City of Cape Town 500-megawatt energy procurement is proof of this and we encourage all qualifying independent power producers to submit their tender bids.

I want to congratulate the Western Cape Government, local governments across the province and the City of Cape Town for their ongoing relentless work in making our province energy resilient and loadshedding free, even in the face of sustained Stage 6 power rolling blackouts. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. That brings us to the end of Statements. In terms of Rule 145(6) ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: On a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...I now give one or more hon members of the Executive present an opportunity to respond to Member Statements for not

more than five minutes. Before we begin: hon Mvimbi, do you have a point of order?

Mr L L MVIMBI: I am just rising on a point of order, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr L L MVIMBI: ...because I did not want to disturb during Statements.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Just on a matter that was raised, but you have said that you did not hear it being said whilst during the commotion that was taking place regarding the change of the dates for the Sitting, the hon Minister was overheard saying to the hon Khalid that he must not lie during Ramadan. That, on its own, it is actually infringing on the religion of hon Khalid Sayed. So, I would like you, hon Deputy Speaker, to listen to the Hansard or listen to the record and the hon Minister be asked to withdraw that statement as it might be trending on being Islamophobic.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Mvimbi. I did indicate at the time that I will definitely listen to Hansard and rule back on that. Thank you. Thank you very much. So, we will now move over. Are there any hon members of the Executive that would like to respond to any Statements? I see the hon Mackenzie, hon Minister Mackenzie, over to you.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, there have been, I think, at least four or five times and I really would like to encourage and invite, and in fact, I will write to the Chairperson of the Standing Committee, to present the issue of rail, to present the issue of the responsibility of a city, the responsibility of a province and the responsibility of national government. Because when your asset – I own a house – it is my responsibility to take care of my house. That is when it comes to rail.

So, there is a continued effort, and it came through hon member Mvimbi's statement, somehow the City or a province should have had the responsibility and now we must buy land. We consistently need to solve problems created by the National Government in this province. [Interjections.] It is not fair. So, I would like to encourage the hon members to invite us to the Standing Committee to brief him on the role of a city, the role of a province and the role of national government because we have worked tirelessly and we have gone beyond what is reasonable, fair and just in working with our counterparts to get rail working. But to expect the Province and the City to now go and buy land, it is just unfair. The responsibility of the asset holder, like any human being who has got a car, a laptop, a phone [Interjections.], it is your responsibility to take care of it. It is common sense.

An HON MEMBER: No, you are saying [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any other hon members of the Executive who would like to make any further comments [Interjections.] for the rest of the time? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): And now there are no comments.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, there are not. Hon members, remember that Rule is the privilege of the Executive to make those statements ...[Interjections.] on how, ja, how they make that. That brings us to the end of Members Statements.

MOTIONS

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We now will move over to Notices of Motion in terms of Rule 151. They were required to be delivered to the Secretary for placing on the Order Paper. These motions have been duly submitted and published on the Order Paper below the line.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Ms A CASSIEM: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the issue of access to land for poor, marginalised and emerging black farmers (African, coloured and Indian) in the Western Cape.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr T M KLAAS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates issues concerning the insourcing of all security guards, cleaners and general workers who are working for the Western Cape Government's departments and their entities through agencies.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms A P BANS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates gun violence and gun-related crimes that are on the rise in the Western Cape.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the 17,6% power tariff hike in the Western Cape.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms A P BANS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the sudden surge in child murders and kidnapping in Cape Town.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates Cape Town's new homeless plan, noting that the City of Cape Town has about 14 000 homeless people and the new plan will only make provision for 3 500 beds.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the poor service delivery at the Bishop Lavis Community Health Centre and other hospitals and clinics in the Western Cape, including delays in attending to patients, the untidiness of facilities and patients being turned away without medication on their appointment dates.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the increasing concern over attacks on social workers as they try to go about their work in certain areas in Cape Town, noting that Emergency Medical Services vehicles have been attacked and that staff members have been hijacked.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We will now move to Motions without Notice in terms of Rule 150. And just in terms of the Rule 150 pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolence and congratulatory were submitted to the Programming Authority prior to this plenary on 11 April 2023. Hon members are reminded that Motions without Notice pertaining to congratulatory, and condolence will not be allowed in this Sitting that have not been processed by the Programming Authority.

I have been informed that in the Programming Authority meeting of 11 April 2023, political parties did submit names of hon members in the desired order of speaking, and who had wished to move a Motion without Notice in this Sitting of this House. I will therefore, just for noting and for the purpose of the Minutes, call out those hon members whose names have accordingly been submitted and approved.

The following: hon America, hon America, hon America, hon Bosman, hon Bosman, hon America, hon Kama, hon Mvimbi, hon Bakubaku-Vos, hon

Lekker, hon Bans, and hon Sayed.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr D AMERICA (DA): I move without notice:

That the House sends its most sincere condolences to the Thomas family, who lost their two daughters, Nurah Thomas (2) and Nishaat Thomas (6), on 3 March 2023 after an unlicensed taxi driver slammed into the family's car; and honours their lives by standing together in the fight against illegal taxi operators.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr D AMERICA (DA): I move without notice:

That the House commends the Traffic Management Team for their contribution to stability and safety on the Western Cape road network during the nationwide shutdown; and commends all officers and officials for their continued efforts to keep the Western Cape roads and road users safe.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr D AMERICA (DA): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Minister of Mobility, Mr Ricardo Mackenzie, and his Department for setting up free vehicle testing at the Gene Louw Traffic College and for going above and beyond to protect our citizens on the roads during the Easter holidays.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): I move without notice:

That the House sends its thanks to Ouma Katrina Esau for her lifetime commitment to preserving the N|uu language; and congratulates her for obtaining her honorary doctorate agree in Literature.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates all the Western Cape athletes who won their respective events at the South African School Athletics National Championship.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr D AMERICA (DA): I move without notice:

That the House stands in solidarity with the Belhar woman who was thrown out of a moving taxi; wishes her a speedy recovery; and also condemns in the strongest terms the violence that so often takes place in the taxi industry.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr M KAMA: I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences on the passing away of Dr Wallace Mgoqi, a retired advocate, attorney, businessman and activist; notes that in his life Dr Mgoqi wore many caps and was a man of great stature; notes that he had a respected judicial and public service career, serving as acting judge in the Land Claims Court from 2014 to 2019, as Chief Land Claims Commissioner in 1999, on the Commission for Gender Equality between 2012 and 2019, and as City Manager for the City of Cape Town between 2003 and 2006; and extends its condolences and sends a message of strength to his family and friends.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa

(Prasa) for launching the Nyanga to Langa route to its Central Line service to the Cape Town CBD; notes that this is after the line has not been in service for three years and suffered from vandalism and theft; and notes that this project will help resolve the transport struggles for commuters who use this route daily.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Ouma Katrina Esau, the only remaining fluent speaker of the San language N|uu, who was honoured with an honorary Doctor of Literature degree by UCT; and notes that the honorary doctorate was conferred in recognition of her lifetime commitment to preserving the language. Congratulations, Ouma Katrina.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms A P BANS: I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates the team of young children from Stellenbosch farms who was chosen to represent South Africa in an international kayak polo competition; notes that the competition is set to take place in Ireland this July, and these farm kids have an opportunity to travel outside of the country for the first time; and roots for the team

and wishes them well.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Trafalgar High School in District Six on being declared a national heritage site; notes that the school was established in 1912 and the first learners walked through the school's gates in 1916 and has been part of the history of District Six and Cape Town at large; notes that some of the school's alumni were anti-apartheid fighters and human rights activists; and notes that among its many illustrious alumni is the first Justice Minister of the democratic South Africa and struggle icon, Dullah Omar; retired judge, Seraj Desai; philanthropist and human rights activist, Dr Anwa Nagia; and political prisoner, Achmad Cassiem. Congratulations to the schooling community at large.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections, agreed to. The Motions will now appear in the Minutes of the proceedings and in Hansard in the individual hon members' names as if the hon member had read them out aloud. I will now afford the opportunity to the hon members to move Motions without Notice as per the Standing Rule 152(d), which then

also include Motions without Notice that were not approved in the Programming Authority meeting. And the hon members are reminded that 30 minutes as per the Standing Rule of 152(d) will start now. According to my list, I recognise firstly the hon Sileku.

†Mnr I M SILEKU: Hon Deputy Speaker, goeiemiddag, dankie vir die geleentheid.

[Mr I M SILEKU: Hon Deputy Speaker, good afternoon, thank you for the opportunity.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Goeiemiddag.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Good afternoon.]

Mr I M SILEKU: I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the Acting Public Protector, Kholeka Gcaleka's report which has cleared Minister Anton Bredell of any alleged misconduct in the process of submitting a provincial investigation report concerning the George Municipality and that the House further notes that the allegations and subsequent request for investigation was a frivolous attempt at political grandstanding by a former member of this House and that the Provincial Department and Minister have been vindicated in acting in the best interest of the people of the George Municipality. I so move. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the Motion being moved without Notice?

Hon MEMBERS: No! No!

An HON MEMBER: Object.

An HON MEMBER: No objections.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] I recognise the hon America.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House notes and welcomes the Provincial Government extending the Provincial Regulatory Entity's digital footprint to allow for alternatives to process an application for public transport operating licenses. In addition to submitting applications in-person at public operating licence offices, applicants can now also submit applications virtually via email and through an online platform. That the House welcomes this innovation by the Western Cape which will once again streamline service delivery and Government services. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections, agreed to. Hon Cassiem, am I checking whether you are delivering that motion on behalf of hon Klaas? No. We will move that over. I now recognise hon Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates the work done by the South African Muslim Charitable Trust and other good Samaritans in restoring the dignity of old people in Cape Town, when the DA has failed to do so. These people helped the Kensington Home for the Aged build a new dementia unit and bought a minibus taxi to transport the elderly to hospital for appointments. The elderly home has been asking for assistance for the past 7 years from the DA-led Government and it took a good Samaritan to help them restore the dignity of old people. I so now so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Hon MEMBERS: [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Sayed, over to you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House notes that 14 April 2023 is the closing date for the school application admissions for the 2024 academic year; notes and supports the growing calls from parents for this date to be extended as many parents are affected by the technical glitches in the Western Cape Education Department's online application system; calls on hon MEC Maynier to extend the deadline and rollout out of the online application pop-up tables to avert another crisis of unplaced learners in 2024; and supports the calls by the ANC that #NoChildMustBeLeftBehind. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with pride the achievement of the 17-year-old Aksana Matokazi from Brackenfell, Cape Town, as she jets off to Los Angeles at the end of July to represent South Africa in the World Championships of Performing Arts; notes further and conveys well wishes to this Capetonian who will compete in the comedy, drama and singing categories; and acknowledges that if the Provincial Government could avail more funds to support creative arts, sports and culture, then we could produce more artists and athletes that represent the province and country in international competitions. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. I recognise the hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

The House notes and remembers the words of President Nelson Mandela that: “We know too well that our freedom is incomplete without the freedom of the Palestinians”; and condemns the ongoing apartheid Israeli atrocities against innocent Palestinians which include the expansion of settlements which are illegal and the siege on the al-Aqsa mosque; notes that Palestinian self-determination ought to be supported; makes clear demands on the international community to isolate apartheid Israel; calls on the hon Speaker of the Legislature to light the Legislature in the colours of the Palestinian flag; and urges the hon members of this House to support the International Quds Day march in solidarity with the Palestinians on Friday, 14 April 2023, in Cape Town. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Mr P J MARAIS: Yes, objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections. There is an objection.

[Interjections.] The motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

An HON MEMBER: Who did an objection? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now recognise the hon Bans.

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep shock and sadness the brutal murder of six people who were shot by unknown assailants in Ocean View on Wednesday, 12 April 2023; further notes police reports that say a vehicle pulled up in front of a house on Neptune Lane in Ocean View at approximately 10:50 and that the occupants of the vehicle went inside the house and started shooting at individuals where they left five men between the ages of 20 and 50 dead, while the sixth person died on arrival at hospital; notes further that SAPS suspect that the incident could be gang related; calls on SAPS to leave no stone unturned in investigating the matter and to bring the perpetrators to book and condemns the DA Government for cutting the budget for the LEAP programme while the people are dying on the streets due to gang violence; and implores the Provincial Government to work with SAPS and find ways to curb this violence in this province. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise hon Kama. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with pride the successful hosting of various sports tournaments in different communities in the province over the Easter weekend, including Rugby and Soccer tournaments that attracted thousands of spectators; appreciates that these activities are part of the development of young people and the building of social cohesion in our communities; congratulates the sports federations, sports administrators and small businesses operating in the different communities for making these events a success and presenting such opportunities to the youth at risk, despite not receiving any support and/or funding from the DA Government; notes further with disappointment and laments the absence of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport and the hon MEC in the delivery of these events; which shows that this Government pays lip service to presenting young people with alternatives to crime; condemns the hon MEC's failure to attend the Rugby Tournament in Khayelitsha which attracted thousands of spectators, but instead decided to join the Easter Rugby and Netball tournament for whites in Saldanha; and notes further and accepts that in the hands of this DA Government lie the lives of the many talented athletes and soccer players that we lose to drugs in

our different communities because of lack of support and development opportunities aided by Government; that these include examples such as the late Mateketa (Gotsi) from Mbekweni who we lost to Tik and I am sure, many communities can tell stories of lost talents that could have flown the South African flag high in the international arena. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Hon MEMBERS: I object.

An HON MEMBER: No, no objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, there are. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Finally, I recognise the hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with pride that the Employment Equity Bill has been signed into law by President Ramaphosa and that this law and its amendments will enable and promote diversity and equality in the workplace and empower the Government to set specific equity targets by

sector and region, where transformation initiatives have lagged behind; that this is also an effort to decrease unemployment as part of ensuring the employment equity objectives become reality; and that the law now compels labour inspectors to inspect workplaces and to issue employers with compliance orders. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

Mr P J MARAIS: That is racist! Racist! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members.

An HON MEMBER: [Interjections.]... is listening, he must come ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright. Hon members, [Interjections.] are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Mr P J MARAIS: Yes. It is a racist motion. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. That concludes Motions ...[Interjections.] Hon members, can I ask you to order.

An HON MEMBER: He must come to the Sitting.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That concludes Motions without Notice. Ms Nduneni will now read the First Order of the Day.

Ms NDUNENI: Consideration of the Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Annual Reports of the 13 departments of the Western Cape Government, including their entities.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I have been informed by the Chief Whip that the Programming Authority resolved that there will be no list of speakers and that parties who wish to do so, will now be afforded an opportunity to make a declaration on the Report for a maximum of three minutes. I recognise the ANC.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. For the first time since COVID-19, the Standing Committee on Public Accounts has been able to engage, give oversight and hold to account the Provincial Government departments and entities in person. We wish, once again, to take this opportunity to acknowledge and thank all departments and entities for submitting their Annual Reports, and pay tribute to the men and women who diligently work in these departments and entities.

However, hon Deputy Speaker, we would be failing in our duty if we did not raise the serious concern with the performance of the former Human Settlement Department, now Infrastructure, and Education. While we will be

slow to congratulate fishes for swimming, we must admit that these departments particularly can do much better. As SCOPA, we will be watching this space in Human Settlements.

Hon Deputy Speaker, as the Legislature, we must be emphatic that the poor of the Western Cape do not deserve just clean governance or a clean audit, they deserve and must get good governance. They deserve a provincial government which is responsive, a provincial government that is accountable and a provincial government that ensures equality and equity in service, which I think is possible, it can be done.

We of course also further note the regression of WesGro and also will be watching this very closely so that it can actually improve in its performance into the future. As SCOPA, we will continue to hold the Provincial Executive to account and give oversight to the work done by provincial departments and entities, and we hope that we will be united as the Legislature in holding the Executive to account. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the EFF.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The EFF is not

surprised that the Western Cape Government departments are complaining about their annual certification costs associated with complying with the Broad-Based Economic Empowerment Policy. It is common knowledge by now that the DA does not believe that black people must be empowered economically in any way. More so, as the EFF, we do agree that for the audit outcomes to have any substance or any relevance, there needs to be a move away from compliance-based audits to performance-based audits against Government departments and their entities. This would be important and for purposes of holding the Executive accountable and forging whether this Provincial Government meets its service delivery targets.

The problem regarding the over-height compliance-based audits is that they create a low threshold and do not offer much, for example a department just has to comply with the legislation and policy framework in order to receive a clean audit. So, the fact that the Provincial Government departments and their entities continue to receive meaningless clean audits, does not improve the quality of life in black and coloured communities.

More so, the EFF finds it shocking that the Department of Human Settlements received an unqualified audit report with findings. This is a result of their failure to comply with their low threshold of aligning with legislation in terms of expenditure management and utilisation of conditional grants, as well as predetermined objectives and internal control deficiencies. The sad part is that it is our poor people who will continue to be deprived of their rights of access of housing because the Department is led by incompetent

people who cannot even utilise conditional grants to their benefit.

The EFF further calls on all Provincial Government departments to monitor the utilisation of transfer to municipalities in order to make sure that these resources end up being spent on service delivery projects that will benefit our people. It is shocking that the Western Cape Provincial Government departments and their entities underspent to the tune of more than R700-million in the financial year under review. This is money that could have been used for the provision of housing in the province.

The Province is sitting with millions of unspent funds, but there is no plan in place to fund small businesses, both in the formal and informal sectors so that they can grow and create employment. This money could have been used to purchase agricultural land which is suitable for farming in order to be transferred to emerging black and coloured farmers in the province, for purposes of transforming the sector, create job opportunities and in conclusion, as well as improving food security in the province. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I do not think I see GOOD online. No, I move over to the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Hon Deputy Speaker, I do not have a declaration. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Noted, thank you very much. Freedom Front Plus?
No?

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): I have no declaration to make.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.

An HON MEMBER: For the ...[Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Did you say 'no', hon member?

An HON MEMBER: No.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): I do not have a declaration, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Noted, thank you. I hear you. And I move over the
Al Jama-Ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. No
declaration from Al Jama-Ah. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Noted, thank you very much. I recognise the Democratic Alliance.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, across the Western Cape, DA governments on provincial and local level oversee service delivery that makes tangible and meaningful changes in the lives of our communities. This is made possible due to the DA's commitment to providing clean, efficient, and stable governance to the residents of our province. This commitment was highlighted with the Auditor-General's release of the 2021/2022 audit outcomes. The results revealed 100% clean sweep of unqualified audits for the Western Cape Government departments, whilst ANC governments at every level failed to get even the basics right. The DA is building schools, training LEAP officers and generating electricity. [Interjections.] This is because we spend the people's money to the benefit of the people and not the benefit of cadres.

Last July, during a briefing on the 2020/2021 municipal audit outcomes in which 22 of the Western Cape's municipalities received clean audits, the AG's delegation attributed the outcomes to the firm leadership tone and strong controlled environment, as well as the competent workforce found within the Western Cape. Sadly, the hon members on the other side of the House can simply never achieve these results because the ANC does not know what it means to show the humility and care of firm leadership, strong controlled environments or appointing a civil service based on merit and not based on political affiliation.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Hear, hear!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, the Public Accounts Committee's report acknowledges the roles and oversight played by key stakeholders and how it contributed to the positive audit outcomes of the Western Cape Provincial Government and its entities. The report identified transversal concerns which were identified across departments during the Committee's deliberations.

These include, among others, the high costs associated with BBBEE certification to indicate compliance; the need for a move towards performance auditing as opposed to compliance auditing to measure the value for money appropriated to departments and entities in relation to their service delivery mandates; engaging departments on the value for money that was derived from transfers to municipalities and another concern raised during the Committee's deliberations was the expenditure incurred by departments to pay the AG for their auditing services.

The DA looks forward to engaging the Committee, provincial departments and entities' audit committees and the AG on these matters going forward.

The DA supports this Report.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now have to announce that there are currently 30 hon members present and entitled to vote, and the

House is therefore quorate. The question put before the House is that the Report of the Public Accounts Committee be adopted. Are there any objections to the Report being adopted?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): No.

An HON MEMBER: No!

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections ...[Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections, agreed to. Thank you very much. I therefore declare that the Report is unanimously adopted. That concludes the business for the House and the House is now currently adjourned. And Ms Nduneni will end the meeting for all hon members. Thank you very much.

The House adjourned at 18:10.