

---

THURSDAY, 13 NOVEMBER 2014

---

The House met at 14:15

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see p

The SPEAKER: I recognise the Chief Whip.

(Notice of Motion)

Mr M G E WILEY: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That notwithstanding Rule 198, precedence be given to a motion in the name of the hon member R D Mackenzie and the subject for discussion as appearing on the Order Paper.

The SPEAKER: Any objections? No objections. Agreed to. The next item on the Order Paper is the draft resolution in the name of hon member R D Mackenzie.

## **WESTERN PROVINCE RUGBY TEAM**

(Draft resolution in terms of rule 144)

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I move the draft resolution, as follows:

That the House welcomes the Western Province Rugby Team as we promote their excellence. We proudly congratulate the team for bringing the Currie Cup home once again. We thank you for being the positive role models our youth need. We commend you in personifying an active lifestyle through sports which makes the youth of our communities aware that there are alternatives to substance abuse and gangsterism. Irrespective of their backgrounds and challenges faced, they rose above their adversities and excelled as prolific sportsmen representing this great province. I move so. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: I recognise the ANC.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The ANC congratulates the Western Province Rugby Team for their achievements during the past season and especially its senior side for their triumphant record, 34th success in the Currie Cup. We further convey our condolences to the union, teams and all players in the passing of the Western Province veteran and former Springbok, Tinus Linee. We applaud the national Sports Minister, Fikile Mbalula, for conferring upon Tinus Linee the Steve Tshwete Lifetime Achievement Award and for naming the Rugby Academy in his honour.

The ANC further impresses upon the union to go further by ensuring expansion of

diverse school participation in sports to all communities in tribute to him. Once again, we congratulate you and thank you. [Applause.]

AGB LEDE: Mooi!

The SPEAKER: Do I see the EFF?

Mr M N PAULSEN: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Good afternoon members and distinguished guests; the Western Province Rugby Football Union and the management. From the EFF side we would like to congratulate the management of the Western Province Rugby Football Union and its players for an excellent year and for their distinguished achievement.

We call on this Western Cape Government to make sure that they improve facilities in all communities so that more young people would choose this positive lifestyle and choose to follow these positive role models and to participate in sport that would not just develop them but would also advance them later in their lives. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: I see the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The ACDP welcomes the Western Province Rugby Team representatives in the Provincial Parliament today. We commend them on their success in winning the prestigious Currie Cup trophy in a thrilling final played at Newlands and thank them for being sporting heroes to our children. We are

encouraged by the depth of youth in the team and we wish you well in the 2015 Super 15 campaign. Continue with the good work. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: That concludes the discussion on this draft resolution. Are there any objections to the draft resolution being adopted?

HON MEMBER: No.

The SPEAKER: No objections. Agreed to.

The next item on the Order Paper is the subject for discussion in the name of the hon member Mr D Joseph as printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon member Mr Joseph.

**SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION:**

The on-going gang and drug related killings and the effect it has on our children.

Mr D JOSEPH (DA): Thank you, Madam Speaker. The debate today relates to gang and drug related killings and the effect that it has in our children. While preparing for this debate, reading through research documents and the newspapers and other forms of media, I am of the opinion that our beloved country is moving to a crisis situation.

Another lost generation will rise in our lifetime if we do not take action, a generation that will destroy opportunities for millions of young people. Gang and drug related

killings are a crime against humanity. We should fight against it with the same passion that we fought against apartheid which was defined as a crime against humanity. In a young democratic country like ours, with one of the best constitutions and a Bill of Rights, we have many reasons to celebrate our achievements and even in the Western Cape Government Constitution it acknowledges the democratic values that we have, family structures and government responsibility.

Agbare Speaker, dit wil voorkom asof groepe bendeleiers en georganiseerde misdaad dwelmbase miljoene mense se lewens drome gevang hou en ons demokrasie wil ondermyn.

According to research done by Steinberg, the history of gangs date back to the early 1900's and is defined within a social context and the nature of these activities is to confine to street level activities as well control over territory. Irwin King who is well known for his work amongst the communities, stressed the overlapping concepts between gangs and organised crime. Youth at risk in conflict with society often end up in trouble with the law and some develop to the point where they show total disrespect for society in pursuit of power and money and some even blood experience and some even dead bodies. For them, it is a sense of achievement.

What is it that makes gangsterism and drug related activities so attractive to the youth? Gangs offer opportunities of acceptance, identity, recognition, a sense of belonging and leadership and even brand names. We do not even want to talk about the false sense of importance.

We cannot ignore the environment that lends itself to attraction of opportunities towards gangs and drugs: like unemployment, poverty, absence of family structures and childhood experience in violent families. Organised crime has structures with sophisticated networks and a market which operates like an illegal economy. The international underground Mafia is like a disease. It knows no boundaries, no colour, no culture and no religion. This global virus has become a global crisis.

Die rol van die media moet nie onderskat word nie. Ons is dankbaar vir die media se rol waar die regering en die gemeenskap dadelik ingelig word deur die media en wetstoepassers ontvang genoeg inligting om geharde kriminele elemente te verwyder uit die samelewing wat in harmonie wil leef.

The complexity and the nature of our historical social disintegration of society needs an integrated approach. Youth at Risk are showing the results. The programs of rehabilitation centres are showing the results and the number of youth and adults who need this help is a reflection that our government is in crisis management. South Africa lacks a co-ordinated, integrated, whole of society approach to drugs and gangs. That is what we need and the central authority is mandated to co-ordinate the work of different government departments.

In our vision for an open opportunity for all, drug dealers are not able to roam the street. We should not tolerate that and families and communities must be free from crime. The law is applied to drug dealers and addicts and we should ensure that it is adequate for them. The support and the overcoming of addiction need those support structures. Given the authority, in the Western Cape Government and the DA we will

reinstate the Narcotics Bureau. [Interjection.] We will probably resource Drugs Central Authority [Interjections.] create a public private enterprise ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members!

Mr D JOSPEH: ... to fight drugs and crime and devote sufficient funds to rehabilitation. The long national waiting list for existing rehabilitation centres emphasises the enormous need for more of these facilities and state funds are needed and it must be regularly available for the rehabilitation centres.

In closing, to redress the scourge of gang and drug related crimes, all stakeholders in society must be noted and we do appreciate all the stakeholders that have done so much thus far. It needs an inter-governmental co-operation. I commend the Western Cape Government in its efforts thus far [Interjections.] to combat gangsterism and substance abuse and we are very eager to hear from those who will debate on this topic so that we can ensure proactive steps are taken to ensure the safety and prosperity for the people of the Western Cape. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: I see the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Madam Speaker, the ACDP welcomes this topic today, namely: the on-going gang and related killings in our city. A child being brought up in poor areas like Bishop Lavis and Elsies River and surrounding areas [Interjection.] faces drugs and gangs on a daily basis. Poverty, inequality and the search for acceptance by these young kids make them vulnerable to being swallowed

up by gangsterism. In fact, that innocent little boy, that innocent little girl - they are saying nothing good can come from Manenberg, Bokmakierie and Hanover Park.

Drugs and gangsterism seem attractive and lucrative and the easy way to rise above poverty. Many absent fathers in our communities [Interjection.] are failing in their responsibility to take back communities. We cannot place the blame alone on government and police. We as fathers, we as community leaders, must take back our communities.

'n AGB LID: Hoor-hoor!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: When I spoke to a ten year old the other day, he told me he was recruited by a gang to hide firearms. This young boy wants to get out of the gangs but cannot because he must kill to exit. This young boy becomes a statistic. UCT stated the other day that in this year alone, 1 071 boys and girls, our boys and our girls, were killed. These young boys and girls become statistics. According to the latest media reports approximately 100 people were shot dead in the Western Cape thus far. [Interjection.] Rooi mannetjie, hou jou mond. [Laughter.] In fact ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Order!

Mr M N PAULSEN: Madam Speaker ...

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: In fact, just three days ago eighteen people were shot dead in a



matter of three days.

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired member.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi? Order Members.

†UMnu Q R DYANTYI: Somlomo, ndifuna ukwazi, noxa sele egqibile nje. Ndifuna ukwazi ukuba kungumgaqo wePalamente na ukuba ilungu lithi kwelinye “Vala umlomo nkwenkwe.”

\*Madam Speaker, I want to know, even though he has finished. I want to know if it is parliamentary for an honourable member to say to another member: “shut your mouth little boy.”

†Is it parliamentary for a member to refer to another member “hou jou mond mannetjie”? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, at the cost of the House going into disarray, I think we will consult Hansard and check exactly what was said. [Interjection.] Hon member Mr Paulsen, I am speaking, take your seat please. Thank you. Let us manage this House in a manner that accords with the dignity and decorum of the House. We will not have this become a circus, so I am appealing to all the members present here today. We have guests. Please manage yourselves in a way that is parliamentary. I am appealing to you all. We have got a busy day and we need to get through the day

so I expect your co-operation. Thank you. I now recognise hon Minister Plato.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY (DA): Thank you, Madam Speaker. The Western Cape has a serious gang and drug problem. The origins and prevalence of gangs and drugs in the Western Cape have taken a dramatic turn. Where we used to see our children impacted by gang and drug warfare they are nowadays at the centre, waging war themselves. Where we saw and still see kids falling prey to druglords, youth getting hooked on drugs and our children being killed by stray bullets, we now see kids themselves peddling drugs, youths becoming drug king-pins and our children becoming hitmen and therefore killers.

Organised crime no longer just affects our youth as our youth are now also deeply involved. Our approach to deal with the impact of the on-going scourge of drugs and gangs needs to also look at preventing our kids becoming involved in these negative social behaviours. The situation is untenable.

The latest crime stats show that the Western Cape accounted for more than 40% of the national drug related crime over the last six years. Despite it decreasing by 33% this year, the Western Cape records almost three times more drug related crimes per 100 000 people than the national average. The latest Western Cape SAPS Annual Report shows gang violence increasing alarmingly with 311 bystanders falling victim - 311 innocent people killed by gangsters in one year. We cannot accept this situation as normal.

This is not a debate to politicise. This is not an issue where we must assign blame. This is a crisis which is impacting on the youth, stripping innocence, stealing futures and sidelining a generation. The culture of gangs, drugs and of organised crime threatening social cohesion is one which has to be broken down. We will not be successful in breaking down this culture if we try to do this each as an individual, a political party, a sphere of government, a department or as the police, in isolation from one another. We will have to unite. We must however question the reason why 85% of all police stations in the province are under-resourced? We must question why almost 60% of this country's police vacancies are in the Western Cape?

A handful of convictions in gang related crimes, when thousands of gangsters still terrorise our communities, unfortunately does not equate to unilateral success of a strategy meant to counter gangsterism in the Western Cape. This is particularly true when convictions around gang affected areas are as low as 10%, with Khayelitsha being as low as 1%. 1% of crimes result in the criminal going to jail – 99% walking free.

We need specialised gang and drug units to be re-introduced. These units possess the necessary resources and expertise to investigate and make arrests and come with a track record of success. While some operations might have limited success, they are not achieving what is needed. It is not quick enough. Where is the massive crackdown on gangs? They shoot openly on our streets every day. Even today, just a couple of minutes ago, before this meeting, I received another report of on-going gun shootings in Hanover Park.

It is critical that police intelligence begins to focus on the trafficking of weapons in this province. This is one of the major issues. As much as 35 guns, weapons, are being confiscated per week on the Cape Flats. How are these guns getting onto our streets in the first place? We know that the national government and SAPS had some concerns around the reservist service in 2009. There were almost 5 000 active police reservists, yet in 2012 there were not even 2 000. With less reservists and less officers recruited our crime situation falls into perspective. If the police do not have the adequate resources to eradicate the problems how can we expect the police to curb the violence and the crippling effect of gangsterism and drug abuse in our communities?

This is why the Western Cape Government has at times called for the temporary deployment of the SANDF as a visible peace keeping force to free up the police to do the necessary investigative work needed to ensure arrests. That is what we are asking for. [Interjections.] Earlier this year, the army was deployed in other provinces. The army was successfully deployed in other provinces to restore calm [Interjections.] in a situation of community unrest but not in the Western Cape where people are dying from gangsters' bullets. [Interjections.] You do not know what you are talking about.

With the communities at the centre we need help from the police and other spheres of government but most importantly from parents as well. Active parenthood [Interjections.] is more valuable than any government or police intervention. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The parents' roles in being role models for their children, guiding their children on paths, steering clear of substance abuse and drugs and ensuring that their children know the difference between right and wrong are an essential part of a child's upbringing. We have to prevent our children getting involved in gang related activities. I call on parents to work with us in this regard. [Interjection.]

The SAPS management in this province has shown an honest desire to work with us, to increase safety because it is only by working together that we will accomplish anything. The Department of Community Safety has partnered with FET Colleges where they have made bursaries available for young people to apply and study. We partner with the religious fraternity to provide alternative opportunities to youth during holidays through the Youth Safety and Religious Partnership.

In June 2014 more than 80 organisations reached more than 14 000 youth. Through the Chrysalis Academy we are providing development and training opportunities to youth between the ages of 17 and 25 to empower them economically, morally and spiritually. The success of the Chrysalis Academy is being replicated with the establishment of a second similar academy at Wolwekloof just outside Ceres.

We partner with municipalities, city improvement districts, neighbourhood watches and community policing forums in the strategic deployment of Safety Kiosks as a visible ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon member.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... deterrent for criminal behaviour. I thank you. And you must put your name on the Order Paper to speak. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon member Mr Paulsen, order please. I see the ANC.

Ms P Z LEKKER (ANC): Thank you, Madam Speaker. This DA-run government has wretchedly failed the next generation of youth in our province by not aggressively assisting to remove children off the streets. [Interjections.]

Our youngsters' aspirations are stifled due to early childhood development, lagging behind and its ineffectiveness to impart new life skills to offset the daily violence they witness in their homes and communities.

This DA administration is liable for every youth's death due to substance abuse and gang violence as it is negligent and in dereliction of its duties to aggressively upsurge its fight against this scourge. This government has failed our youth. [Interjections.]

At the upper echelons of their administration, the DA Premier went on a destructive course to paralyse and destroy the machinery they had inherited from the ANC [Interjections.] proven to be an absolute success to fight drugs and the gang culture

which sought to give effect to their covert narrative that they govern better at the expense of our communities' safety.

An HON MEMBER: Ja!

Ms P Z LEKKER: The DA illegally dismissed members [Interjections.] of the social transformation team under their direct control ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... appointed to oversee much of the moral regeneration programme of the provincial government ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms P Z LEKKER: ... as envisaged in the Western Cape's 'Social Transformation, Gang Prevention and Intervention Strategic Framework' resulting in a vacuum being generated. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member Ms Lekker. On a point of order. I would just like to ask the members to allow the hon member Ms Lekker to deliver her speech. Asseblief mense, bedaar. Let us have one person speaking. You may take the floor. [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Paulsen, I will not call you to order again please.

An HON MEMBER. Mmmm. Mmmm.

Ms P Z LEKKER: The mere introduction of the Expanded Partnership Programme (EPP) and other pilot projects such as Watching Briefs, Youth Work Programme and Youth, Safety and Religious Partnership do not match the amount of young people affected by gang and drug related killings. This integrated policy document is the basis for every presentation by this government on drugs and gangs, but too little is done to implement it.

Hon Minister Plato has tremendously failed Western Cape residents by not adhering to his provincial policy. Instead he and his government work tirelessly in their attempts to destroy it, their efforts directly targeted at discrediting our criminal justice system. Rather than placing more effort into fighting drugs and gangs, he employs his energy to entertain hardened criminals and gang leaders. [Interjection.] He fights the police from every possible platform - even funerals. Now we need to ask ourselves, is it proper to attack the police even at funerals? Is it moral or what because those people are grieving and yet we continue to bring grief in there. [Interjections.]

The national role-players all delivered, built more stations, appointed more staff and secured dedicated skills to prosecute the criminals. They have made huge gains in bringing gangs to their knees. The courts mete out comparable sentences and 43 provincial jails are filled to capacity. The statistics bear testament to this assertion.

To get the information, perhaps the MEC should speak to the police rather than creating an acrimonious atmosphere through his disparaging remarks about our men in



blue. He and the DA choir, including JP Smith and his rogue metro police should work with SAPS and not work against SAPS. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Working together we can do more.

Ms P Z LEKKER: The key of this whole strategy is intergovernmental and societal co-ordination which needs him to play a pivotal role in this.

Instead of working towards these goals, the Department sends people to mortuaries and courts to count bodies and cases in numerical futility. Instead of running the engine room with all the information of an integrated assault on the criminals and gangs, the MEC makes petty party politics to deflect attention.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly! [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: The last remark made by the office of the Premier was that of information received from angels in dreams and who reportedly assaulted the same source with a cricket bat when he came to collect his reward. [Interjections.] MEC Plato has appeared in newspapers with gang lords, like Saliem Johns, who was subsequently sentenced to three life terms in prison. [Interjections.] This DA led government has failed our youth. [Interjection.] You should have raised it when you had an opportunity.

The SPEAKER: Order hon members! I see the DA.

Ms M M WENGER (DA): Thank you, Madam Speaker. For any crime to occur there are two things that need to be present: first, one needs a motivated offender and second, you need an opportunity to commit a crime. Remove one of these elements and a crime is prevented. Once a crime has occurred, however, this is when the criminal justice system kicks in. A good functioning criminal justice system that catches crooks, however, serves to remove motivators for crime because the motivation may be lessened if a person is more likely to get caught and a proper rehabilitation program for offenders removes motivations to offend again.

I want to focus on both sides of this equation as it relates to gang violence. The first is the prevention side, removing opportunities and motivations and then on the criminal justice response. As we well know, the provinces have no mandate or control over the criminal justice system. They are all national government competencies. That being said, however, provinces have a very important role to play in promoting and preventing those things that could create opportunities or motivations for crime. The Western Cape Government and the City of Cape Town have a plethora of projects and programs which in some way or another address opportunities and motivators for crime. The MOD centres, for example, keep children busy in sport and in safe environments. The Department of Community Safety runs partnerships with FET colleges to get our youth to finish their studies and learn a trade so that they can be included in society and included in economic activity.

The Department also runs a partnership with religious organisations to help youth development during school holidays when children are vulnerable to violence or prevent them from becoming involved in gang activities. Roughly 25 000 children have already benefitted from this. As mentioned the Chrysalis Academy is a R9 million intervention to help youth at risk reach their value and potential. The Department of Social Development runs Youth Cafés to develop our youth and provide them with opportunities. The Department also works on drug treatment and the Western Cape is the leader in the availability and provision of rehabilitation services. The City of Cape Town runs Youth Cadet Programmes to encourage youth to be part of the solution. It runs a violence interruption project in one of the worst gang affected areas of Hanover Park.

Western Cape Government departments run and partner with NGOs to help youngsters participate in sports because we know that sport is imperative to the well being of young and developing bodies and minds. As an American baseball player once said:

“A team is where a boy can prove his courage on his own. A gang is where a coward goes to hide.”

Every effort is made to guide our young men and women on the right path and discourage those things that lead them towards gangsterism. However, while the Western Cape Government is doing this to stop more of our children from becoming tomorrow’s gangsters, we already sit with gangs and gang violence. This needs a response from the criminal justice system.

In the Western Cape, eight out of ten murders will not result in a conviction and for gang related murders this rate is likely even worse. We have a very high number of drug related crimes and unfortunately the decision has been made to go for the one-stop Tik users, instead of targeting the top bosses who feed and sell our children this rubbish.

Yes, we have gang task teams but we need more than this. As Minister Plato said, we need specialised units which incorporate the police and the prosecuting authority and have dedicated resources to investigate on a permanent basis. There are many theories on what leads to gang formation and gang violence and what we can do to solve this problem. Theories range from legalising abortion, if you ask a behavioural economist, right through the unleading of petrol, if you ask certain scientists. Last week a leading gang academic told us that malnourished pregnant mothers can influence the foetus, which can impact on gang violence. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member.

Ms M M WENGER: The point is that there is no one [Inaudible.] to treat the scourge and I certainly did not hear any solutions coming from the ANC. There is simply no silver bullet. Crime and violence is a demoralising problem. It affects each and every one of us. Victims of this violence suffer injury. They sometimes lose their lives. They suffer financial loss and intimidation. Everyone is affected but most especially those who live in crime affected areas. Citizens of those areas are sometimes deprived of life's normal opportunities and pleasures because of the social and economic impact of gang related crime and by the alienation and despair that accompanies the

fear of crime and random bullets. Can we ever fully eradicate gang violence? Probably not but it is reasonable to believe that gang violence can be reduced if each of us plays our part. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: I see the ANC.

Ms M N GILLION (ANC): Madam Speaker, it is a fact that social economic conditions are directly related to crime and this DA government does not care for the poor and vulnerable communities. [Interjections.] The DA makes many promises like this document but it repeatedly fails our people on a daily basis when it comes to implementation.

This is evident in the way the DA deals with the issues of drugs and our youth. The DA is not serious to bring change or improve the lives of our people. It treats [Inaudible.] with programmes the ANC put in place but shamefully does not execute the policies of this government.

The Department of Health was supposed to beef up security of clinics and hospitals [Interjection.] in or close to risk areas [Interjections.] and deal with gang injuries and disputes which left staff traumatised and unsafe. This Department was supposed to be part of the Inter-Departmental Liaison Committee of the Social Transformation and Gang Prevent Strategy. CPF's and Bambanani volunteers were supposed to assist with the patrols of the parameters of these health facilities in risk areas. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Ms M N GILLION: The Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport was supposed to support sports clubs and schools in affected communities and to provide alternatives to crime, drugs and gangs. It had to set up cultural forums in rural areas, transport, school coaches, link with NGOs to promote competitions in prisons and use art in the Gang Prevention Strategy.

The Western Cape Department of Education has seen a rise in violence and gang activities in various schools and learners suffer. It had as a matter of urgency to give special attention to 109 identified priority schools in risk areas, supply access control and CCTV cameras, give information to the central point of the province as an early warning when gang fights are expected, train principals for this and establish an integrated school safety board. Further it was to assist with environmental modification, attitude and behaviour changes and the setting up of a system program to address systematic development, community relations and effective partnership.

Learners in conflict with the law were to be referred to NGOs to influence or change their behaviour. They were also to be supported by the learner support officers or safety resource officers who serve as a mentor or a coach to the learner. The Department of Social Development was supposed to be at the forefront of the Provincial Drug Master Plan with responsibilities for treatment of abuse victims as well as dealing with children at risk. The Department of Social Development has to manage the local drug action committees under the National Drug Master Plan.

Did the Department of Social Development link the Master Plan to the Provincial

Gang and Social Transformation Strategy as agreed in this policy? [Interjections.] The Department of Social Development must raise awareness of drug abuse and treatment of victims. In addition ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member Gillion, on a point of order. Please be seated.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you.

Ms M N GILLION: Do not waste my time.

Mr D JOSEPH: Thank you, Madam Speaker, I would like to know if the hon member Ms Gillion is willing to take a question.

An HON MEMBER: No.

Ms M N GILLION: No, no, no, no. Do not waste my time comrade. Madam Speaker, please! In addition it was to work with street youth and indigent families. Where is the campaign the Department of Social Development had to start to restore moral values of communities affected by gangs or the employment opportunities it created for unemployment and marginalised youth [Interjection.] or the skills training for the youth? Where is the restorative justice and the ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Ms M N GILLION: ...diversionary options that the Department of Social

Development had to create for young people in trouble with the law? Where are the 1 000 Siyabulelo volunteers Social Development had to train to give support and the [Inaudible.] ground for prevention of substance abuse and early intervention? Did it roll out and maintain the Kimojo Programme in 70 schools across the province as required? Is this Department of Social Development working with the CPF's as per the policy to establish local drug action committees?

In most cases the answer is no or it is not enough. Instead of dealing with the gang issue in a holistic way the DA has forced departments back into the silo approach and doing things piecemeal and divorced from the integrated central policy of this government. This DA fails the people it should serve [Interjection.] This is the document.

An HON MEMBER: You are talking about Gauteng!

Ms M N GILLION: Man, we are in the Western Cape here.

The SPEAKER: Order. I see the EFF.

Mr M N PAULSEN (EFF): Thank you, Madam Speaker. [Interjection.] Can you just quieten the House please. [Laughter.][Applause.] Especially [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Drugs and gangsterism are the most controversial crime



categories in the country, the Western Cape being the main hub. There have been calls for increased police presence in areas hardest hit by crime, calling in the army in some instances. Do any of these interventions do any good? In 1971 there was a famous Stanford University experiment where 18 healthy young men had volunteered and were equally split into guards and prisoners and enacted their roles in a make-shift prison on campus. The results were devastating but truly reflective of what happens when you put good people into a bad place.

Instead of rehabilitating offenders they manufacture monsters. The psychological damage that was done to those young men in six days was appalling. They were dehumanised, confused, fearful, isolated and extremely angry. They were objects in which feelings of hopelessness and worthlessness had been instilled. The authority and power that had been given to the guards transformed them into evil men.

Now our history of forced removals and locating our people in concentration camps on the Cape Flats, along with economic exclusion, which still continues today, are directly responsible for the dire straits of our communities. It is no mere coincidence that conditions in these sub-economic areas, which lack decent facilities for proper human development, have bred gangsterism and an alternate economy based on drug industry. Drugs and gangs do not just kill our children but traumatise those who survive for life. They break communities and families apart, they turn good young men and women into bullet dodging zombies with no future or aspirations. Drugs and gangsters are not as dangerous to our children as racism, capitalism and sexism are.

The issue of drugs and gangsterism cannot be looked at in isolation without addressing

the underlying systematic issues. Drugs and gangsters are in fact a result of these three. Until when will we keep treating symptoms while the cure is available? The fact that over 350 years later our people are still dispossessed and landless and government keeps on drafting bills and policies to keep things as they are, should have us more worried. Now that is violence and a crisis worth debating about. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the DA.

†UMnu M MNQASELA (DA): Enkosi Somlomo. \*Thank you, Madam Speaker. In 1997 the former State President †ISithwalandwe \*the respected †ubawo \*father †uNelson Mandela, made this observation:

“A country as young as South Africa, given its terrible history, needs a program to ensure that we regenerate not only the social behaviour but the soul and the spirit of our people,”

and invited church leaders to participate in that engagement.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] caucus.

Mr M MNQASELA: I can tell you that was a very noble idea that led to the then President doing that. In 1999, after the elections, the then State President, the respectful president †ubawo \*father †uThabo Mbeki, UZizi, uDlamini, appointed his Deputy President to deal with the program to enhance what he then called Social

Behaviour Through Moral Regeneration. But I can tell you, the current President, he has no role [Interjection.]. He has no role.

Mr R B LENTIT: Skande!

Mr M MNQASELA: He has no place ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Talk about the [Inaudible.]

Mr M MNQASELA: He has no say ... [Interjection.]

Mr R B LENTIT: Skande!

Mr M MNQASELA: ... in this very profound and quite emotional idea. A noble idea that †Ubawo uGqirha \*father, doctor †uNelson Mandela put on the table for the country to embrace. We are very disappointed that the current President of our country does not see the importance of moral regeneration. [Interjections.] In this province ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: We are talking today about the kind of challenges confronted by the children of the Western Cape, the youth, ravaged by gangsterism, ravaged by drugs and abuse. [Interjections.] Now I am saying this year, to you sitting on that side, [Interjections.] go and tell our President: please come and assist the Western

Cape in the programme to fight gangsterism, to fight drugs ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, please hon members.

Mr M MNQASELA: The Western Cape programme is the one that has been spoken about by the hon member Ms Wenger and by Minister Dan Plato. If you were not listening he spoke about that.

Mr D JOSEPH: They hear but they do not listen.

Mr M MNQASELA: We have declared war on gangs and drugs. The Premier has constantly repeated the call to consolidate our fight against gangsterism to the national government [Interjections.] but let me tell you ... [Interjections.] Their response is: we do not care about the Western Cape because those voters rejected the ANC. [Interjections.] You cannot punish voters for rejecting corruption. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: For rejecting maladministration.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

Mr M MNQASELA: For rejecting everything that is characterised by the word bad done by the ANC.

Mr R B LENTIT: Skande! Skandelik.

Mr M MNQASELA: We want clean governance. [Interjections.] We want an accountable government [Interjections.] but more so we want a government that has values and the principles that the learners in our schools, the children who are young in pre-schools, can begin to see that least they have hope, have a sense of belonging and that one day this country will be a better place than it was yesterday, but we have to do it right today. I am not preaching something that is not there. The Premier that is sitting here, †umama \*mother †uHelen Zille, has been driving a programme saying: †Bhatala imali yepapa. Amadoda makabhatale imali yepapa. \*Pay maintenance money. Men must pay maintenance money. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M MNQASELA: And we are saying no. We do not want [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mnqasela, your time has expired.

Mr M MNQASELA: When you give birth to a child you must support the child.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: [Inaudible.] there because families ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mr Mnqasela. Your time has expired.  
[Applause.] Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Madam Speaker, to help your team I am already timing myself.  
Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Please do. Hon member Mr Dyantyi, could you please stand behind your desk and speak into the microphone.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I want to speak.

The SPEAKER: You are obscuring the hon members behind you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI (ANC): In the midst of brutal killings the most vulnerable are innocent children and the elderly hence we have this debate trying to understand the issue. We went through this pain before but we triumphed because we were in the hands of decisive leadership. For those with short memories, let me take you back a few years.

Premier Zille was part of a lame duck government [Inaudible.] MEC for Community Safety when Pagad was blowing up the Cape, scaring tourists and investors. She was part of that lame government. Only the ANC brought that under control and we removed all high flyers and we brought stability into this province. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Under Premier Zille's watch as we speak [Interjection.] drug crimes, gangs and even vigilantism is on the rise. This is backed by evidence that for the last five years all priority crimes have been on the rise. Here is the evidence. The report of SAPS shows it. In the five years under the ANC it went down. When the DA took over it went up. [Interjections.] This is not cheap talk. These are ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member, Mr Dyantyi. Order. You are on the floor. Can you please take up your rightful place when addressing ... [Interjections.] No, no. He has been coming forward. I just have to ask you to step back please. Thank you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I hope you are timing my time as you stopped me.

The SPEAKER: Yes, you can be sure about that.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: We went through this pain before as I said but we triumphed. Many years ago, during that difficult time, the government of Bester and Premier Zille thought the only solution to the problem was calling the army. We must have more police, create a gang unit, create more laws and regulations. Just put blame on the national government as hon member Ms Wenger did yesterday. In rugby terms we call that kicking for touch, [Interjections.] gaining no territory, getting out of jail. It is solving all problems. It is a sign that the powers that were are out of touch with reality. What the DA fails to understand is the simple fact that this is a societal

challenge, not just a problem for the police and the justice system.

An HON MEMBER: Or national leadership.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The DA administration has failed to deliver on basic essentials.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I am not going to go into the problems that you all have mentioned. These problems of unemployment and informal settlements are compounded further by the fact that the DA administration, as I have shown you here, has inherited a good track record on crime but what it did was pull out the plug and the next thing you ask us to do is “debatteer”. Wat? Why must we debate when you must act and save the lives of innocent people?

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

An HON MEMBER: But that is what we [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It ignored the multi agency approach that worked so well during those years. [Interjections.] All that you do now is speak of the whole of society. Rubbish! [Interjections.] You demobilised the bambanani’s, you diluted the role of the CPF’s and today you come and say let us debate. You have to act. You are in government. [Interjections.] You have failed to implement your own promises. Where



is the [Inaudible.] research to bring down the drug trade and gangs this government had to do? [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mr Dyantyi. Sorry on a point of order.

Mr R B LENTIT: Will the hon member Mr Dyantyi take a question? [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I will take his question when I am done. So he must wait. [Laughter.] This is a point that we were saying you must do.

An HON MEMBER: What?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You must go back to the basics and embrace what works regardless of who started it. [Interjection.] We have got records, we have got ... [Interjections.] No, it can work. During that time we did not have these problems. We destroyed Pagad. We [Inaudible.] Go back to what worked. [Interjections.] Deal with the factors that cause young people to join gangs in the first place. Do not come and tell us about symptoms here.

Mr R B LENTIT: What about Nkandla?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Deal with those factors which are employment and housing and all of those things that you fail to do. [Interjections.] In the SAPS report we are told of the beautiful successes that the gang of 16 “Fancy Boys” from Atlantis were successfully convicted. [Interjection.] It was a programme that was started many

years ago before you were in government. You should learn how you can succeed using those things. [Interjection.]

Your municipalities are failing to spend on capital budget for us to be able to address those problems that you were listing so nicely and so eloquently and yet you call yourselves in government. Stop talking, act and save lives.

An HON MEMBER: Your municipalities steal the money!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: State interventions need to be more holistic, more carefully considered and should acknowledge that organised crime reflects a dysfunctional society in Cape Town. That is what we have. No amount of police will solve that when you do not solve the root causes. You are elected to deal with the root causes not to come and cry about police in this House. That is what you were elected for. [Interjections.] Without an overarching strategy organised crime will continue to plague affected communities and you will come and blame Riah Piyege as hon member Ms Wenger was doing. You will come and blame the President as he was trying so badly to do. [Interjections.] That is not what you are in it for. You have to act and show that you have got an appetite to govern. The voters elected you. You mentioned that but you are failing them.

Mr D JOSEPH: Ask the voters.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Let us settle down. I see the hon Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Madam Speaker and hon members. I want to make this one comment. [Interjections.] When I look at that wonderful cup in the corner I really get encouraged and I really also want to congratulate all those youngsters involved in obtaining that cup. It is in that context that I again get hope for the future of our young people and the future of our children.

I cannot help but stand here and listen to the issues raised by some of my colleagues in the Opposition. I want to start with one fundamental point. Let us agree in this House that the one competency of policing - and I agree with the hon member Mr Dyantyi - alone will not solve the problem. There is a responsibility on the South African Police, which is a national competency. It says in the Constitution that every individual citizen of our community has a right to safety and a right to life.

What you guys are doing on that side is that you are violating that responsibility, that constitutional right of every citizen in those areas of Manenberg, Hanover Park, right through. And you know what I am coming to believe, I don't want to but I have to come to this conclusion. I was with the National Minister last Friday and I can come to no other conclusion but that the ANC is punishing this province because they did not vote for them, that they voted for the DA and that we are being punished [Interjections.] and that every child who is dying in Hanover Park, in Mitchells Plain ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Order please.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ..every child dying in Mitchells Plain is an indication of that punishment that the ANC is dishing out to our people in those communities. Let me go further. They raise the narrative all the time, specifically now also from the police, that it is caused by the socio-economic conditions in all those areas, and of course I agree. But let me make one point, which is we have to start creating jobs, not bringing in new laws that stop tourists from coming into this province with stupid little visas. We must stop doing that because in this province tourism is fundamental. Until we stop doing that we are going to continue with these socio-economic conditions, no jobs will come and youngsters will go to gangs. But allow me to make this point. The hon member Mr Dyantyi said that I am not talking holistically.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Please! [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon member Mr Dyantyi.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Let me also say there is a responsibility on every mother and father and every family in this society to really start reviewing their role within the family and to build that family. And I think one of the hon members, member Mazi, made a very interesting point that sometimes our role models are our current presidents, and if we look at some of the issues then I wonder whether we have role models. But I want to make a further point hon member. [Interjections.] I want to make a further important point and I want to specifically refer to the hon member Ms Lekker. [Interjections.]

When she says ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ..when the hon member Ms Lekker says this DA government has failed the youth, I want to say to the hon member Ms Lekker - and I hope she is listening – you are completely wrong. You and the hon member Ms Gillion spoke about us not dealing with the drug situation and the substance abuse. Let me just remind you, when you were in government in this province there were only eight treatment centres in this province. We now have 24 treatment centres [Interjections.] Yes, 24. [Interjections.] and it is a far ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Now I know. Now... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I know, numeracy is a big problem but please subtract 8 from 24 and you get a very good idea of the gap that we have increased. Let me ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Let me address the issue of drug abuse because we have seen that we are dealing with treating people all the time, and I am asking who are the syndicates? Where are the kingpins? The drug lords are not the small guys selling it in Hanover Park. They are not these guys who sell it in Gugulethu or in Manenberg. The drug lords live in Durbanville, in Constantia, in all those big houses. I tell you now, we have a very sophisticated police system. You want to tell me that you do not know who the drug lords are going after because I have seen a former Deputy Minister under investigation for drug peddling and I wonder sometimes what that means. [Interjections.] I wonder what that means.

I want to make a further point... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: For the record I want to make this point, and I happen to have been in the position that Minister Plato is in. The Department of Community Safety and the Minister of Community Safety are constantly engaging the police but they have a responsibility to deal with what they see happening in their society. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Stop fighting our police...

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: That is not fighting the police. The Minister and his department are doing their observation and the oversight. They are continuing to do the oversight. [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: You are still working with Jeremy...

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes, why not? I will support working with everyone. We will support working with everyone.

An HON MEMBER: It has to be a deciding vote.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Exactly, exactly. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Let us talk about the other point that hon member Ms Lekker made. Ms Lekker I like the point, you always make very intelligent points, but the reality is you miss the facts... [Interjections.] The facts are very *lekker* to miss sometimes. And in this regard I want to remind you that I agree with you; we cannot only depend on the criminal justice system but you need a functioning criminal justice system Like the hon member Ms Wenger was saying, we need a functioning criminal justice system. We cannot be satisfied with a 4% conviction rate for crime in the province, specifically drug related crimes. That is the statistic, only 4%. [Interjection.] That is *your* statistics. So the point hon member Ms Wenger was making is that there is no demotivating factor for people to continue selling drugs, using drugs. In fact what they do is to arrest all the small guys with the one little lolly and one fill for which the hon member Mr Paulsen is always chasing them about in the community, and it is they who fill up our prisons. So the statistics that you and hon member Ms Gillion are raising are false statistics. [Interjection.]

That is about all the young boys around who got caught with one and two little lollies. But I also want to go on and, I want to really commend the hon member Ms Wenger for reminding us; you say we do nothing. We have the Chrysalis Programme which you messed up, which you almost destroyed, where you created huge bureaucracies, while we have a lean and a very mean machinery running and yes, yes... [Interjection.] ...we also have a very, very... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ...powerful... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry Minister.

An HON MEMBER: It is okay in a running business.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Is it parliamentary for the MEC to mislead the House by saying all these treatment centres are run by the department while only two out of 24... [Interjection.] ...run by NGOs, by large ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry hon member that is not a point of order. Sorry that is not a point of order, thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I can remind my dear comrade that we fund most of them and yes we run two but we fund all of them. Yes, we fund all of them. [Interjection.] You have not funded one.



The SPEAKER: Order hon members!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Let me remind the honourable comrade... [Interjections.] ...that and [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker ...

The SPEAKER: Someone is on the floor. There is a member on the floor.

Ms M N GILLION: Madam Speaker, can we ask the MEC to stop pointing fingers in the House please. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Fritz, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you. I also have to remind the House that hon member Ms Gillion was saying that the Bambanani's were stopped or almost stopped by us. It is in fact their comrade who almost stopped the whole programme. [Interjections.] I am a very dear friend of the comrades, I know what I am talking about. [Interjections.] But allow me to go on. We are talking around... [Interjections.] I just want to make a quick comparison. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I want to remind the hon ANC colleagues of mine that in the Northern Cape there is not one substance abuse centre. In [Inaudible.] not one. There is now a conditional grant been given by the national government to build those ones, so please, compare apples with apples. [Interjection.] I want to make another point, and someone was talking about the drug blueprint. Now this is what the ANC and the national government are very good at. They just get all these blueprints and white papers that mean absolutely nothing. Come let us go and change the conditions in getting real treatment and real preventative systems in place.

I really want say to the hon member Masizole; he makes very, very important points. [Interjections.] He made the point ... [Interjections.] He makes the point and he puts in place... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: He puts in place the context in which we have asked that the army must be called in to the province. We did not lightly ask that the army be called into the province. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And the reason why we asked the army was that... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Fritz, order!

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Okay.

The SPEAKER: A point of order hon Minister Fritz. Hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: The hon MEC has promised this House to make a fundamental point and he still has not actually made that point. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: That is not a point of order hon member Mr Dugmore.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: We have so many fundamental points. The hon member Mr Dugmore did not have any, not one fundamental point. The point we want to make this afternoon is that we were in fact calling for the army just to stabilise the situation. We are not saying that the army will come and shoot everyone. We asked because there was a crisis and because when it happened in the Eastern Cape they immediately brought in the army and the place was stabilised. [Interjections.] A gang war in the Eastern Cape existed for two weeks and it was stabilised by the army. We asked for the same and you know what, they refused because the people of this province did not vote for the ANC. They voted for the DA and we won that election and you are punishing us and that is the reason why we are being punished. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon members, order please! Order! That concludes the debate on this subject, however, before we move [Interjections.] Before we move to

interpellations, the House would like to acknowledge the presence of the Linee family who are with us today and on behalf of the Provincial Parliament we wish to extend our condolences to the family and thank you for being here with us, and we would like to express our support and solidarity with you in this tough time. Thank you.

Can we now move to Interpellations please? We will go to Interpellations as printed on the Question Paper and I recognise the Minister of Local Government, hon Minister Bredell.

## **INTERPELLATIONS:**

### *Western Cape Land Use Planning Act*

#### **1. Mr Q R Dyantyi asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:**

Whether Western Cape municipalities are ready to implement the Western Cape Land Use Planning Act, 2014 (Act 3 of 2014) as previously undertaken and what credible plan is in place by his Department to achieve this?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie agb Speaker. Dit moet in gedagte gehou word dat die implementering van die Wes-Kaapse Wet op Grondgebruikbeplanning, LUPA, afhanklik is van die verwagte implementering van die Nasionale Wet op Ruimtelike Beplanning en Grondgebruik 2013 (SPLUMA), sowel as die implementering van die munisipale grondgebruik verordeninge.

SPLUMA is nog nie geïmplementeer nie aangesien die relevante regulasies nog nie deur die Departement van Landelike Ontwikkeling en Grondgebruik gefinaliseer is nie. Dit volg op die pas afgelope advertering van die regulasies vir kommentaar. Desnieteenstaande is verskeie pogings aan die gang om die munisipaliteite met die voorbereiding van die implementering van die nuwe beplanningsbedeling, insluitend LUPA, by te staan. Dit geskied ingevolge die Beplanningsveranderingsbestuurstrategie en onder toesig van die Loodskomitee. Die Beplanningsveranderingsbestuur Loodskomitee is 'n omvattende forum met verteenwoordiging van die Departement van Landelike Ontwikkeling en Grondhervorming, SALGA, verskeie munisipaliteite, die Departement van Plaaslike Regering, die Departement van Ontwikkelingsake en Omgewingsontwikkeling, die Suid-Afrikaanse Beplanningsinstituut, die Suid-Afrikaanse Vereniging van Konsultasie... [Tussenwerpsel.]

An HON MEMBER: We do not need all that we just... [Inaudible.]

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ...vir Provinsiale Beplanning, die Wes-Kaapse Ontwikkelingsforum... [Tussenwerpsel.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: We do not need all that.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen!

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN

ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ...en die Suid-Afrikaanse Grondeienaarsvereniging. Die primêre aktiwiteite vervat in die Beplanningsverandering-strategie wat deur die Departement van Omgewingsake en Ontwikkelingsbeplanning (DOSOB) gelei word, word hierna gelys as:

#### 1.DIE STANDAARD KONSEP MUNISIPALE GRONDGEBRUIKS-

VERORDENING: Die Departement het al die munisipaliteite in die Wes-Kaap met die voorbereiding en die implementering van die nuwe beplanningsbedelings bygestaan. Dit is gedoen deur middel van die opstel van 'n standaard Munisipale Grondgebruiksverordening wat benodig sal word om SPLUMA en LUPA te implementeer en om die grondwetlike mandaat ingevolge hul munisipale beplanningsfunksie te vervul. Die Departement het hierbenewens munisipaliteite met die opstel van die standaard-advertering en advertering van die verordeninge bygestaan, asook die lysing van items vir bespreking deur rade en die monitering van elke plaaslike munisipaliteit ten opsigte van vordering met advertering van die Munisipale Grondgebruiksverordeninge. Die Stad Kaapstad sowel as 23 uit die 24 plaaslike munisipaliteite het reeds hul verordeninge vir kommentaar gepubliseer. Oudtshoorn is die enigste munisipaliteit wat dit nog nie gedoen het nie, maar daar is besluit dat dit nie nou die beste tyd sal wees nie en dat dit later gefinaliseer sal word.

#### 2.Tweedens DIE STANDAARD KONSEPSUALISERINGSKEMA

VERORDENING: Die Departement het Standaard Konsepsualiseringskema Verordeninge vir munisipaliteite opgestel.

3.DIE WET OP BEPLANNING VAN GRONDGEBRUIK REGULASIES: Die Departement het die regulasies ingevolge LUPA wat binnekort vir kommentaar gepubliseer sal word, opgestel.

The SPEAKER: Order hon Minister, your time.

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, Madam Speaker. If I may address you before I start. [Interjections.] The straight line is there and I am not crossing it, I am in my territory, if you can allow me to speak. I want to thank the hon Minister Bredell.

†Ndifuna ukuthi ke Mphathiswa ndiyakuva njengokuba ubeka apha. Ndibudana kuba xa bendikumamele kule veki iphelileyo phaya kwiNCOP uthethe kakuhle kakhulu, njengokuba abanye beDA bebethetha imbudane, phaya kwiNCOP. Watsho kwavokotheka , uthetha izinto ezichanekileyo, kodwa namhlanje ubuyela kundalashe. Ubuyela kulaa nto yokuba urhulumente wesizwe abe lisebe lokubambelela xa nisoyisakala ukwenza izinto. Uyaphinda ngoku uthi, emva kokuba nityhale natyhala nikhawulezela ukuba makubekho umthetho wephondo. Ngoku anikwazi kwenza nto kuba urhulumente kazwelonke akakenzi nto. Ingaba loo nto ithetha ukuba bekungekho sidingo sokuba kwenziwe lo mthetho wephondo? Okulandelayo , umbuzo umi wokuba

ingaba oomasipala bakulungela kangakanani na oko. Ukuba ngaba iSPLUMA besele silungile ingaba oomasipala bebeza kube bekulungele na oko? Ingxelo ephuma kwelaa sebe lakho ithi oomasipala abaninzi abakawulungeli kwalo mthetho wephondo, iLUPA. Babini qha , ngaphandle kokuba uza kuthi ke emva kwenyanga bonke bakulungele. Ndifuna ukuthi ke Somlomo uMphathiswa andimva kakuhle xa esithi yonke into ilungiselelwe, kodwa benze lo mthetho wafana neminye imithetho abayenzayo kweli phondo, nokuba ngumthetho wokhuseleko loluntu, ifakwa eshelufini. Senza imithetho apha siyenzela ukuba ingasebenzi, simosha iimali.

\*I want to say MEC I hear you as you speak here. I am a bit disappointed because when I listened to you last week at the NCOP you spoke very well, while others from the DA were speaking rubbish, at the NCOP. You spoke at length, saying all the right things, but today you are going back to the old. You are going back to the tendency of making the National Government a scapegoat when you fail to perform. Again now you are saying, after you have pushed and pushed in a hurry for a provincial law. Now you cannot do anything because the National Government has not done anything yet. Does that mean there was no need to formulate this provincial law? Subsequently, a question still stands as to how much the municipalities are prepared for that. If SPLUMA was ready would the municipalities be ready for that? A report from your department states that many municipalities are not even ready for this provincial legislation, the LUPA. Only two, unless after a month you will say they are all ready. I want to say therefore, Madam Speaker, that I do not understand the MEC when he says everything is in order, but they have formulated this legislation to resemble other legislation they have formulated in this province, be it the Community Safety Act - they are shelved. We make laws here that do not work, wasting money.



An HON MEMBER: Well said.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Lentit.

Mr R B LENTIT: Thank you, Madam Speaker. During August this year the Western Cape Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning briefed the Standing Committee on the law reform initiatives that have been completed in terms of the land use planning and renewed role of the province and municipalities. At this meeting the Department presented the Readiness Programme which provides the necessary assistance to Western Cape municipalities ensuring effective implementation of LUPA and SPLUMA in the implementation of the new functions and systems and processes. The Standing Committee were satisfied as the Readiness Programme has been rolled out to ensure that service delivery would not be affected. I can tell you the members of the ANC in that committee are aware of this. Hon member Mr Dyantyi does not sit on a committee and this is what was presented to us; this was a survey, I have got all the proof. [Interjections.] Here is documentary proof of what is going on in that committee. Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: ... municipalities.

Mr R B LENTIT: The City of Cape Town.

An HON MEMBER: They do not have to.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Allow the hon member Mr Lentit to speak.

Mr R B LENTIT: Once again hon... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon member Mr Paulsen, you requested silence when you spoke, please afford the hon member Mr Lentit the opportunity at this stage. Thank you.

Mr R B LENTIT: Once again, the Standing Committee was satisfied as the Readiness Programme has been rolled out to ensure that service delivery would not be affected at municipal level when the additional functions of SPLUMA and LUPA are transferred to the municipalities. The City of Cape Town and Drakenstein Municipalities were invited and they also presented their implementation of the Readiness Programme and expressed willingness to work closely with the Department during and after the implementation phase. It is against this background that I am proud to announce that the Western Cape Municipalities are ready to implement LUPA. The Western Cape Government under the leadership of the DA are always ready; they are always prepared; they are always on time; they are always on target; they are always ready to implement and they are always ready to roll out whatever comes their way. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order! Hon member Mr Dyantyi, I see you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I appreciate what hon member Mr Lentit has put forward. The question for me remains that this Department under leadership of the MEC has certain goals and said this is what we want to do. And

when they get to a point where those things are not done, they always find creative ways to pass the buck... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: They are ready.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ... and shift the blame to somebody else because as part of that planning of LUPA, you cannot come and tell me here now that in the scenario planning that you did, there was never an anticipation that at some point there were going to be some delays, and you find a way to mention, very opportunistically, Oudtshoorn in your input because you know that Oudtshoorn is a municipality in trouble under you [Interjections.] as if that is the only municipality that is not ready, but it is not the only municipality that is not ready. [Interjection.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Madam Speaker, on a point of order. The hon member is pointing fingers at the hon Minister all the time.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I will withdraw my finger but I make the point. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Mnqasela.

†UMnu M MNQASELA: Enkosi Somlomo. Ndifuna ukuthi, njengokuba uMphathiswa ebephendula lo mbuzo, ndifuna nje ukuqinisekisa ukuba xa kusithiwa masiqalise singene endimeni, ziya kube zikhona zonke izixhobo zokuqinisekisa ukuba wonke umntu ukulungele , kangangokuba kwikomiti, ndinexhala nje kuba akekho phaya

kulaa komiti obekekileyo uMnu Dyantyi. Xa besihleli sixoxa, uphethwe ndim kuleya yoomasipala. Ngoku besihleli kule komiti sixelelwe kakuhle ngamagosa aphele lo mcimbi ukuba bakulungele ukuqinisekisa ukuba oomasipala bakulungele ukumelana nalo mthetho umtsha ubekwa ngurhulumente. Ndicinga ukuba ke into ebekufanele ukuba sizame ukuncedisana ngayo singamalungu epalamente kukuba sihambe siye kuyibeka esweni le nkqubo xa imiliselwa, yaye siza kuyijonga ke Mphathiswa ukuba iyenzeke loo nto xa iqala le nkqubo. Oomasipala bangafunyanwa belambatha xa kufuneka besebenzile, bezama ukuqhuba le nkqubo sithetha ngayo. Enkosi Mphathiswa.

\* Thank you, Madam Speaker. I want to say, as the MEC was responding to the question, I just want to make sure that when we are instructed to start working, all the tools to make sure that everyone is ready will be in place, in so much that in the committee, I'm afraid the hon Mr Dyantyi is not in that committee. When we were sitting and discussing, he is under me in respect of municipalities. When we sat at this committee we were well informed by the officers who are handling this matter that they are ready to ensure that municipalities are ready to face this new legislation that is promulgated by the government. I think we are supposed to try and help each other as members of parliament and go and monitor this programme when it is being implemented, and we will watch the MEC that that happens when this programme starts. Municipalities will be found inefficient when they have to work, trying to implement the programme we are talking about. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Dyantyi.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Perhaps only the MEC speaks

because part of the question is asking very specifically, what is the concrete credible plan to intervene going forward? It is one thing to say we are ready but are you able to present that plan that says this is A, B, C and D that we are going to do in terms of the readiness of those municipalities? This is not the only thing that municipalities are charged for, there are a number of other things. In the same committee, not even two weeks ago, we were sitting in a meeting where we were told that for the Western Cape the municipalities are performing very badly on issues of capital expenditure, and when you make that point, everything is what we are doing. I thought it was a misprint. It was part of the speech that you wrote and you had to read that but... [Interjection.]

Mr R B LENTIT: Do you want me to brief you?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: ...the picture is not as rosy as they put it.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Nobody can plan any scenario for the incompetence of the ANC. Nobody can plan for that. [Interjections.] Okay and the hon member Mr Dyantyi [Interjections.] should respect the fact that LUPA needs to align with SPLUMA. We can implement LUPA tomorrow because we have designed it to stand on its own legs but it will be stupid because then we are going to confuse each developer within this country or within this Western Cape. We have struggled for five years to work away the backlog that we have inherited from

the ANC on all the EIA's and things and as soon as we start to get ready and to deal with the applications and so forth, they come up with SPLUMA. Now SPLUMA, there are also constitutional challenges towards that but that is the incompetence of the ANC that we need to deal with. My team is very ready. I am very proud of the work that they have done; the enormous effort that they have put in.

Just to show you, we have got five work groups; the first work group is a Standard Municipal Planning Bylaw group. They work on standard bylaws to assist the municipalities because to come up with LUPA is one thing and that is one thing which the national government missed. They thought if they came up with SPLUMA then their work is done. They forgot about the regulations and now they are busy with the regulations which they by the way advertised. They advertised for public comment and they closed the public comments on 4 September but they implemented it on 1 September.

The second work group is Standard Zoning Scheme Bylaws, the third one is Provincial Regulations; the second one is training for our municipalities and the third one is a Readiness Programme for our municipalities. We had five workshops with municipalities over the last year. They are very ready. [Interjection.] The capital spending within municipalities they do not have to worry about. We have always managed to be the best province spending. [Interjection.] It is the first quarter. As an ex-MEC you should know that in the first quarter you do not spend according to. You cannot take 100% divide it by four and say you will spend 25% each quarter. [Interjection.] No, it does not work like that. Sometimes you spend less money on the planning sessions as so forth and on the third and fourth quarter you will make up and

the municipalities will be ready. [Interjection.] I am very proud, I am very comfortable but as I said, I cannot plan for the incompetence of the ANC and I do not know if SPLUMA is going to withstand the constitutional challenges. I thank you.

Debate concluded.

The SPEAKER: That concludes Interpellation 1. We now move to Interpellation 2. I recognise the hon Minister Alan Winde, Minister of Economic Opportunities.

*Structural unemployment in the province*

**2. Ms B A Schäfer asked the Minister of Agriculture, Economic Development & Tourism:**

What is the Western Cape Provincial Government doing to address structural unemployment in the province?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM:  
Thank you very much, Madam Speaker and thank you very much for the question. Structural unemployment in South Africa, as well as in this province, is probably one of our biggest problems and that is why in this Provincial Government our strategic goal number one, that first primary goal, has been about growth and jobs because we have to try and deal with this huge scourge, this massive problem.

In our province, unemployment has risen to 675 000 people who do not have a job in our province. But on the other hand, we have then implemented in the last five years,

lots of programmes in lots of areas, where we can be very proud of the framework within which we operate. With the ANC, from a policy point of view and a management point of view, it is so shocking, they cannot run any of our institutions. Quite frankly they cannot... [Interjection.] ...quite frankly the ANC cannot even run a bath. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: They cannot even run a bath. [Interjections.] But within this context, look at the programmes that we have had in place for the last five years, whether they be the initial programmes around the youth wage subsidy or the Work and Skills Programme, which has now been adopted as a South African tax deduction for young people in employment thanks to the work that was done in this province; the PAY Programme where young people get opportunities. [Interjection.] The Artisan Development Programmes that are running on the same principle, that are also having a massive influence at a national level now because we are showing them how to run these things, knowing that they cannot run anything at a national level. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: ... form of government.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: From the skills forums to our interventions like SSME support or Red Tape interventions, all of these things are put in place primarily... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: JV started Red Tape before you had...



The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM:

No he did not.

An HON MEMBER: He did, I can show you...

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM:

No he did not, I guarantee you he did not and you worked for Trevor Manuel's office when we implemented it as an initial pilot project. You should know that.

[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: I will show you.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM:

But quite frankly, in this province we can be very proud of a number of the programmes. The 2,2 million people that do have jobs in this province. [Interjection.]

And if you measure the last five years and you look at growth; you have to think of growth in the same context. This country at the moment is being downgraded to 1,4%

projected growth going forward under the management... [Interjection.] ...this ANC -

we are going to be growing at half the rate of Greece in the next year. I mean that is totally embarrassing and that is why it shows you this ANC cannot run a blooming

thing. [Interjections.] We in this province, if you start to measure the last five years.

[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM:  
So if we take tourism as our best performer, the GDP value in the province of tourism grew at 6,8%. But more importantly than that, the jobs number grew at 7,8%. Jobs were even growing faster than the GDP growth and we are now sitting at 204 000 people in jobs in the tourism sector. [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Good!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM:  
Aquaculture, 5,8% growth ...

The PREMIER: Good!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM:  
...with a 7,7% growth ...

The PREMIER: Good!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM:  
... in jobs. If we look at BPO 4,8% growth but a 6,5% growth in jobs, and so we can go through sector by sector where we intervene, where we make the difference...  
[Interjection.] ...where we create the right environment, we are getting those jobs created in this province.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I now see the hon member Ms Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The ANC government under the leadership of President Zuma has not delivered on its job creation promises. [Interjections.] The President promised to create five million more jobs, yet the fact remains that since 2009, 1,4 million more people have joined the ranks of the unemployed. Economic growth has declined by 2%. Unemployment which includes our discouraged work seekers has increased to more than 34% and youth unemployment is 71% of the labour market. That is about six million young people and remains amongst the highest in the world.

Structural unemployment creates discouraged work seekers because of a lack of requisite skills, competition, technology and legislation that hamper job creation in the market place. While the ANC talks lip-service to job creation, the national government fails to look at the real issues. Promoting jobs without paying attention to competency levels will only prolong the jobs crisis.

The World Economic Competitive Report states that South Africa's inadequately educated workforce is the single most problematic factor for doing business in this country. Despite South Africa's budget on education being more than G20 countries, we still rank 132<sup>nd</sup> for quality of primary education and 143 of 144 countries on maths and science education. Should a learner make it to university, the picture is no better. More than a third of students drop out in their first year at university. After five years only, one in three has obtained a three-year degree. Even then, employers say that many graduates emerge inarticulate, unable to think critically and barely able to read

or write. So until education is really fixed, unemployment will remain high and economic growth will stagnate.

The importance of sound basic skills taught at school level are relevant for the working world. Through interventions led by the DA's Western Cape Education Department they are able to increase the number of qualified maths and science teachers by offering them 96 pre-service bursaries to potential teachers. Undertaking tests at grade three, six and nine in language and maths, has resulted in a steady improvement in the quality and number of passes in grade 12 from 81% to 87%. While the ANC can continue to blame the global economic outlook for its unemployment numbers, it fails to explain how in the very same market, on the very same planet, other emerging countries have achieved growth of more than 5%. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The DA's matric results are fourth in the [Inaudible.]

Ms B A SCHÄFER: But instead, the ANC's alliance with Cosatu has prevented it from implementing reforms to drive growth... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms B A SCHÄFER: ...and create jobs. That it cannot decide whether to lean towards the new growth plan on the one side or the Industrial Policy Plan on the other or with the National Development Plan in the middle. [Interjections.] The DA's policy for growth and jobs is already showing that sound intervention at all levels is working and

the Western Cape has created more jobs, less structural unemployment and greater economic growth than in the rest of the country.

HON MEMBERS: Hear, hear.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Ms Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Madam Speaker. You know it is so interesting to see that even when our colleagues are facing the realities, they are still politicising the problems that we are facing as a country. [Interjections.] But on that note, the Western Cape Government has recognised the need for a differentiated approach particularly when dealing with international partners as it relates to promoting the province's comparative advantages being economic, social and cultural. I hope they were listening to the hon Minister and my colleague, hon member Ms Schäfer, to understand the reality of poverty. We are talking about poverty. Now listen, Red Tape Reduction is one of the initiatives that is effectively... [Interjections.] ...producing unnecessary rules ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen order!

Ms L M MASEKO: ...and regulations that hamper the private sector's ability to create jobs. [Interjections.] As much as we... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms L M MASEKO: As much as we create the skills, we also have to have the conducive... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: A DA peasant.

Ms L M MASEKO: ... place where you can hire those skills. [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: DA darkie.

Ms L M MASEKO: The Department of Economic Development and Tourism assisted 2343 businesses to increase their economic footprint through a combination of business support, coaching, mentoring and leveraging of funding or non-financial support. I hope that you will listen so that you can teach your colleagues at the national government. [Interjections.] Our provincial government's role is to create an enabling economic environment...

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms L M MASEKO: ...which is conducive to growth. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Maseko, there is a point of order!

Ms L M MASEKO: Okay thank you.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Madam Speaker, on a point of order, I want to know if

it is parliamentary for an hon member to refer to someone in the DA as a DA darkie?

[Interjections.] I asked you four times to repeat it. You repeated it four times. It is unacceptable. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Can the hon member - the hon member in question.

Mr K E MAGAXA: What is that?

The SPEAKER: Did you make the comment?

Mr K E MAGAXA: To who?

The SPEAKER: As the hon Minister Botha stated.

Mr K E MAGAXA: I never referred to anyone. [Interjections.] I said... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: In fact, Madam Speaker, if I may, I want to qualify it even further. The first remark was a “DA peasant” and then it was a “DA darkie”.

The SPEAKER: Okay. We will go to Hansard and scrutinise the record. Hon members please! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Ask him whether he said it!

The SPEAKER: Hon members, hon members! A statement was made that a hon

member made a disparaging remark. The hon member says he did not make a disparaging remark. We cannot get into a 'them' and 'us'. We will revert to Hansard and we will get the final version and we will have to come back with a ruling.

I do want to remind the hon members in terms of Rule 41, it is my duty to maintain order in this House and I am a little bit concerned, especially on the side of the Opposition, there seems to be giggling and laughter, similarly at the same time on this side, please afford the individual who is speaking the opportunity to speak. Heckling and interjection is allowed but when it drowns out the individual who is speaking, it becomes unnecessary and unwarranted. So I am appealing to you, maintain yourselves and your composure so that we can get on with the business of the day. Thank you. Hon member, Mr Maseko. Hon member, Mr Paulsen, I am speaking to you too. Hon member, Mr Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I appreciate that you struck the chord from our position. Our provincial government's role is to create an enabling economic environment which is conducive to growth, development and inclusion... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: ...and yes... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Sorry to interrupt, is it a point of order hon member?



Mr K E MAGAXA: Is it parliamentary for hon Minister Botha to tell me I am a weak guy? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: If you allow me the opportunity I will elaborate on that.

The SPEAKER: Colleagues, hon members, I have appealed for order, please contain yourselves. Please contain yourselves. Hon member Ms Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you. Our provincial government's role is to create an enabling economic environment which is conducive to growth, development and inclusion and yes... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Ms L M MASEKO: ...where we govern we deliver services to the people. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: I see the hon member Mr Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: The free market and equal opportunities trumpeted by provincial government under the DA rule have clearly failed to redirect apartheid economic landscaping in order to boost employment and build an equal society. The main point here is that unemployment is qualitatively different to anything that we have seen in the past. It is not cyclical, it is not even a reserve [Inaudible.] of the unemployed. This is a permanent organic or as bourgeoisie economists call it, [Interjections.]

Structural unemployment. The system is designed not to absorb... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Stop thinking... [Inaudible.]

Mr S G TYATYAM:...numbers of workers. Also the system on the contrary cannot even keep ... [Interjection.] ...employment to those only who are already employed. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr S G TYATYAM: And those who are employed today, they know... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr S G TYATYAM: ...that they might be out of work because of the system. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: We do not know... [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: Very confused.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Capitalism as espoused by the DA, unemployment is a permanent feature. They know it. They also knew it when they were bluffing around about the six million jobs that were part of the election campaign. They know they will never create six million jobs because it was just a ploy to confuse people.

[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Leave... [Inaudible.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes. [Interjections.] However... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr S G TYATYAM: ...unemployment... [Interjections.] ...strikes the young and old, strikes men and women and strikes blacks in particular, educated and uneducated, skilled and unskilled. The person who is 40 years old now, he or she knows that if he loses his job now, he might not even get another job going forward and this is what is being espoused by the DA. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yebo.

Mr S G TYATYAM: The fact that the DA refuses to intervene in the industries and also in the economy as government, shows that they are not interested in creating those jobs. Further than that... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Tyatyam, your time has expired. Finish your sentence please.

An HON MEMBER: Five minute job maybe.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Yes. Through the "mess" that was created under the ANC we were able to create employment in the Western Cape.  
[Interjections.][Laughter.][Applause.]

Mr M G E WILEY: Draw up the Hansard and frame it!

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members! I see the hon member Mr Lentit.

Mr R B LENTIT: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. The Premier's Advancement of Youth projects, also famously known amongst the young people of the Western Cape as the PAY Project, creates job opportunities during the first quarter of every financial year for underprivileged matriculants. [Interjection.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: How many?

Mr R B LENTIT: This is a skills development initiative where qualified candidates are selected from a genuine pool of applicants whose parents are poor.

Mr C M DUGMORE: How many?

Mr R B LENTIT: These parents have struggled for 12 years to keep their kids in school and are faced with another challenge where they cannot afford to pay for planned further studies, but the PAY Project is a forward thinking approach where the intake of previously disadvantaged youngsters get paid as interns to gain work experience, acquire skills to improve job readiness and to become more employable.

The strategic intent of this skills development initiative is good for economic mobility, as young people are granted entry level opportunities to be included in the mainstream economy. I thank you.

Mr DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, the hon member Ms Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, now the hon Chum-Chum blames structural unemployment on bourgeoisie [Interjection.] – Chum-Chum – and capitalist ideology. Then in another breath he has just admitted to creating a mess through the ANC, I really rest my case. But really the question here is, how is the province addressing structural unemployment through competition and technology specifically? How does roll-out of broadband specifically address this issue? How does a competitive and innovative society create more economic growth? Hon Minister, how do we in the Western Cape create a demand for jobs specifically in the oil/gas industry? After all, Saldanha's IDZ is waiting to take off and we have great expectations for the West Coast in this regard.

The EYG20 entrepreneur barometer in 2013 shows that while South Africa has great opportunity for entrepreneurship, it also shows great barriers for success for local entrepreneurs. While it is relatively easy to start a new business, how can we ensure that a more favorable environment can be created to assist and support new small businesses which can assist to create a decline in structural unemployment? How do we bridge that gap in the mismatch of skills needed? How can the private sector help us to achieve a better result? And hon Minister, how can we support the various types of enterprises specifically so that the challenge of structural unemployment can be

addressed, that of necessity driven or informal enterprises, many of which reside in township or rural areas?

Secondly, the opportunity-driven or SSME's such as a vibrant tourism sector of this province. But finally, what motivates the ANC government to continue with this insider/outsider economy, which is institutionalised by the Apartheid government, with big business and big unions and some anti-competitive... [Interjection.] on the one side and with millions of discouraged work seekers on the other.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister Winde.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT & TOURISM: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker, and I think the most telling point here was, how do we create the right environment because we have to have the environment for the economy to grow? Our biggest problem that we have in South Africa is that we are sitting with a massive problem in the lack of leadership. [Interjections.] It was actually put right in front of us once again, right here where we have comments made across the floor, where there is no integrity, where a leader cannot stand up and say 'I made a comment and withdraw' and sit down again. [Interjections.] We have to diffuse it. There is no leadership whatsoever and from no leadership there is no policy and with the bad political leadership we have got - that is why I said earlier, the ANC cannot even run a bath.

Have a look at their faces now; how well are we running Eskom at the moment?

[Interjections.] How well are we running the Post Office at the moment?

[Interjections.] How well is our airline SAA being run at the moment? What are the corruption levels in our country at the moment? And this talks about how we are running this country of ours. The ANC are running it into the ground... [Interjections.]... and we have to be creating an environment where we can create jobs, an environment where our economy can grow, an environment where we can attract investment; we can attract skills, we can grow those skills and change the lives of our people. [Interjection.] We cannot do this. We cannot get back to the initial point of our structural unemployment in our system, we cannot fix those things while we have such a disaster at a national level of leadership within our country.

The ANC who should be taking this country upwards is taking it right down into the doldrums and you can see it from the 1,4% downgrade. I promise you, before this year is out, you are going to see another downgrade projection for that 1,4% in growth. You are going to see it being narrowed down again and again until this country is bankrupt. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Who designed [Inaudible.]?

The SPEAKER: Order! Thank you that - order! That disposes of Interpellation Number Two. Interpellation Number Three. Order! I see the hon Minister, Minister Grant.

Debate concluded.

*Traffic services: upcoming festive season*

**3. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

Whether the traffic services are adequately equipped to deal with the influx of motorists during the upcoming festive season?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker and thank you to the hon member Mr Christians for this interpellation. The Traffic Services of the Department of Transport and Public Works have developed an operational plan that seeks to address the following seven traffic law enforcement aspects during the upcoming festive season:

- (1) Integrated operations
- (2) Visible traffic policing
- (3) Overload control management
- (4) Matric end-of-year celebrations
- (5) Public transport operations
- (6) Moving violations
- (7) Driver and vehicle fitness

The operational plan was developed in consultation with operational partners such as SAPS, local authorities, Metro Police and Inter-provincial Traffic Law Enforcement entities. Provincial traffic officers will be deployed at integrated operations and maintain a 24/7 visibility on all national and provincial routes in the Western Cape.

There will be 450 provincial traffic officers involved in this plan, the extent of which is reflected in the following details of the planned operations:



We will have 66 K78 roadblocks; 450 roadside vehicle operations; 88 fatigue management operations; 250 speed law enforcement operations planned; 15 inter-provincial operations; eight public transport operations; 170 weighbridge operations. We plan to screen approximately 5 000 drivers for alcohol abuse. We will have 180 weekend alcohol blitzes and we plan to stop and check approximately 320 000 vehicles during this period.

Further the current 32 provincial traffic students will be deployed to specific traffic centres over the festive season which will increase the law enforcement complement in order to combat the increase of traffic volumes due to the influx over the festive season.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you Minister, for that comprehensive reply. I have seen, and what is concerning at the moment, is if we look at the statistics to previous festive seasons how many road fatalities we had, when we look at 2010/2011 festive season, 185 people died. The following year 163 people died from December to January. I am concerned because now again if we look in the newspapers and we look all over the road accidents, it seems like it is increasing all the time. I have got the figures here but I am not going to go to it, I just want to say in September I have read about your “payday-blues”, where you identified weekends where people have extra money and consume alcohol and you have roadblocks all over. But just an example, in September 2014 the death toll in one weekend was 26 people. So that is concerning and then in

the month of October 83 people died in road fatalities. What is also a concerning is...

Mr Deputy Speaker, this red man is pestering me all the time. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will try and curb it. Please continue.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I called him the “rooi mannetjie”, but he is the “red man” also.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! That is a subject of discussion for the speaker still so I am not going to rule on that ... [Interjection.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Can I continue Madam Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...but please continue.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Can I? [Interjections.] With the festive season also referred as the “silly season” approaching, it means that we are going to have more and more motorists using the road, so it seems like our Traffic Department, especially our Provincial Traffic Department, are under-resourced. What are the reasons that we cannot increase the staff complement of our provincial traffic? I know you work in conjunction with municipalities, Metro Police, and police, but I want to know because you are talking about 450, so I know you do not have all the resources, but Minister Grant, why do we not have more provincial traffic police on the roads?

You have made concerted efforts addressing the road fatalities, but we are still having

a high number. Another factor that I have noticed and am concerned with, are all the visitors over the festive season; it will increase, but thank you for giving us that run-down. I hope that you did not give your game away for those who will booze over the festive season. Thank you, Minister Grant. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mr Mnqasela. [Interjections.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The challenge that we are confronted with is that many people travel between the Eastern Cape and the Western Cape during this festive season because it is time to go and see their families. You know, people come here to work and some come to study. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Because there are no jobs for the ANC.

Mr M MNQASELA: Because [Interjections.] Ja, no they are running away from your province that is badly governed, called the Eastern Cape. So the issue here that I want to [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: They also go to Gauteng. They also go to Durban.

Mr M MNQASELA: I want to make this point. [Interjections.] Mr Deputy Speaker, please protect me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I am doing that.

Mr M MNQASELA: The point that I am making is that we need then to see what the actual plan is to monitor issues of over-speeding on these highways, the N2 in particular and the N1 and the whole question of excessive drinking and people then still driving afterwards, and the other area where you will find that many of the people ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Drinking cough mixture.

Mr M MNQASELA: They do not only drink and drive alone. The passengers, because of the overloading, become a very big problem, and the road rage on the road, so I am simply saying that we need to hear this plan, that we are really going to see an improvement. You have seen for instance that 44% of the deaths on the road is due to passengers being killed by cars because people just over-speed. They do not even take note of the traffic lights, all the traffic calming measures are ignored, especially when you go closer to townships. I normally drive in Nyanga East, in Khayelitsha and Gugulethu, but there is a place next the bus terminus in Nyanga East, there are traffic lights there but they are ignored as if people are just driving in an open road, and you know that if you work in your constituency, members from the other side of the floor...So I want to ask from the Minister, because there is [Inaudible.] ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Please finish off... [Interjection.]

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you. I think that is the point that I have made. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. You have made your point. The hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. It is pity that hon member Mr Christians' question goes along the lines of asking the MEC about the influx of motorists. It is not only that. That is actually a question which refers to one part of the problem as the honourable member speaking before me has indicated. This issue about December is both people travelling in and people travelling out of the Western Cape and I think we would like the MEC when he responds to give us more of the strategies. He mentioned a number of categories, specifically in regard to the traffic of people moving out of the province to other destinations, whether for home or for holiday. I think that is a critical issue. But I think the one concern that we have is that in regard to the overall approach of the Department we do not see enough of a proactive engagement with, for instance, the Liquor Board, who have a particular strategy and some resources available particularly on the preventative side. When we have tried to enquire about the existence of an integrated strategy to deal with alcohol abuse in particular the relevant departments have not been able to satisfy us that there is an integrated approach. It was clear at this time, and at other times, one of the major contributing factors to the accidents is the issue of alcohol abuse. So for instance we would like to ask the MEC what has been the programme up until now to inform drivers about the consequence of driving under the influence of alcohol? It is not just about telling this House that there are 5 000 screenings that are going to happen. What are the actual pre-emptive behaviour change strategies at venues where people do engage in abuse of alcohol, whether those are sporting facilities or at the beaches or at various other social events, because we believe that a preventative approach based on

awareness about consequences and actually talking to people about what their alternatives are other than getting in your car when you have had too much to drink. These are alternatives which should be explained to those ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: ...which we think will have a lasting impact. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired. Hon member Mr Hinana.

Mr N E HINANA: Thanks. There is a reason that there are this road rage and the accidents that are happening, especially in the Western Cape, because of the reasons that have been highlighted. But I want to say to the members as well that we need to educate the people who are destroying the robots, that we find it very much irrelevant that when people are being angered, because of their complaining about the service delivery, that is poor, they take their anger and uproot the robots. An example is that you cannot in your house when your child is not listening to you and because you are angry, take up the hammer and you smash everything in the house because your child is not listening.

An HON MEMBER: ANC!

Mr N E HINANA: And this is what is happening in the community. ... [Interjections.] ...that they do not respect the property of the state and the one that is also helping the community.

An HON MEMBER: They do not want to work.

Mr N E HINANA: So it is unreasonable to encourage the people because they are greedy, they are angry because of the lack of the services and they go ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Just finish your sentence. Your time has expired.

Mr N E HINANA: ...and they go and uproot the robots. That is irresponsible and therefore that should be the responsibility of the leaders to educate the communities.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Your time has expired.

Mr N E HINANA: Thank you very much. [Time expired.]

'n AGBARE LID: Mooi.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member Mr Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I also have another concern when it comes to the taxi drivers making a Kyalami of our roads. They get impounded, but then they are out again. They get caught and it seems like they just continue to use the roads as their own track. The problem that I have with the 24-hour service is that you are minimising your visibility when it comes to areas where you need to impact, so yes, like I said it is going to be a coordinated effort with SAPS and others, but I

still think that provincial traffic should be strengthened. When you drive out on the N2 you do get them in the regular places but I still think we should strengthen that service.

The other problem that we have is that taxi drivers ignore warrants when they are arrested. There are warrants out and nothing happens, so Minister can you give us the plan when it comes to those guys out on the road, who have more than four, five warrants outstanding and they are still out on the road? What is your department doing about that? I just want to latch on to what hon member Mr Dugmore said; I am worried about the Western Cape because we get more people coming in than going out and that is my concern. So when you have the road fatalities already now occurring on a weekly basis, and you have payday weekends where you have extreme accidents and horrific crashes, what will happen when this number that we have now increases in December? So if you can just guide us on that. [Interjection.] Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Grant.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you. I have two minutes to reply, is that right, or otherwise I can go on for 20 minutes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Two minutes, correct.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: This debate or this interpellation has morphed somewhat. Let me just say that the statistics quoted by the



hon member Mr Christians, if you look back to 2010, we lost 1714 people that year, which have now reduced to about 1204, a 30% drop. This is in contrast to an increase in road fatalities which Minister Peters estimate at about 18 000 a year, which costs this country's economy R306 billion. So we are taking the issue of safety on the road very, very seriously, and the people travelling, we do have [Inaudible.] traffic flows especially around times that the matrices leave, schools close; so we plan and monitor to cope with those traffic flows.

As far as integrated approach is concerned, I have had a look at our operations here in Goodwood and I can compare them to the Gauteng Freeway Improvement Project. The difference with us in the Western Cape is that we have an integrated approach where we have not only provincial traffic and metro traffic but we also have disaster management in the same location, so with technology we are able to keep tabs on where things are going right and where things are going wrong.

We are doing our very best to work with Santaco and other taxi unions to help them keep their members in order and believe you me those warrants and issues are dealt with at our provincial regulatory entity. I get hundreds of letters and complaints from taxi owners and operators who feel they are being aggrieved, so we do enforce the law.

I really want to thank everyone who has participated in this interpellation because we are taking the issue about road safety very seriously and it is really up to each one of us to spread the message. These are on the electronic boards. We just had Transport Month ... [Interjection]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Minister Grant, your time has almost expired. Please finish off.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ...and we need everyone to participate and improve road safety in the Western Cape and reduce the deaths.  
[Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That disposes of the third interpellation. We now proceed to the Question Paper. New Question Number 1 to the Premier.

## **QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

*New question to the Premier*

### *Lwandle Commission of Inquiry*

#### **1. Mr M L Fransman asked the Premier:**

- (1) Whether she and her government accept the recommendations of the Lwandle Commission of Inquiry; if not, why not; if so, what are the timeframes;
- (2) whether there will be repercussions for members of her government who do not respect the Commission's outcomes; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much Mr Deputy Speaker. The Leader of the Opposition has asked the question and now he is not here; but I am not surprised that he has run away from this question because it is an extraordinary waste of a question opportunity because he has asked: "...whether she and her government accept the recommendations of the Lwandle Commission of Inquiry; if not, why not; if so, what are the time- frames?" But he seems not to have read the Commission's report itself, because only one of the recommendations refer to provincial governments in general and not to the Western Cape Government in particular, and even that recommendation is wrong in law because that recommendation - recommendation 15 - requires provincial departments of local government to monitor and ensure compliance by local authorities with court judgments especially relating to evictions handed down against them.

Now you know, anyone with a slightest understanding of the law will know that it is not a provincial government's duty and nor could we legally enforce court orders. It does not fall within our mandate. So it is a nonsensical recommendation, which shows just what happens when you appoint ANC apparatchiks to a political hit squad. That Commission had no basis in law and its findings are legally nonsensical as the recommendation as it applies to the province - and the recommendation is what is being asked for here - is legally nonsensical. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up question? I see the hon member Mr Magaxa first.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, and thank you Madam Premier, but I think my question is a follow-up. I just want to ask the Premier if she is trying to tell us here that the Provincial Government has nothing to do with people, children, old people who have been thrown out of their houses, which they have built themselves to be there in the cold in winter, and also spending many, many months and weeks in those halls. [Interjections.] Does the Premier say as a provincial government they do not see any responsibility that they should have had in that instance?

An HON MEMBER: Exactly, exactly!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa, just keep your question short, shorter, that is a bit of a long question [Interjection]

The PREMIER: That is a speech actually ... [Interjection]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...but I will allow the Premier to respond.

The PREMIER: The fact is that that was not what the question was. The question was about the recommendations of the Lwandle Commission and whether we are going to abide by them, and we can obviously only abide by those recommendations that affect us, and only one does and it makes legal nonsense, so that is a ridiculous follow-up question. Maybe that is what the Leader of the Opposition meant to ask, but he did not ask that. So either the person who writes his questions does not know how to do his job, like most people in the ANC [Interjections.] [Laughter.] ...or the Leader of the

Opposition [Interjections.] has not read the report that he is asking me questions on. But let me just in answer to the hon member Mr Magaxa say to him that he is expecting this province to do a whole range of things after Ses'khona and the ANC organised a land invasion on Sanral land that they knew there was an interdict on. [Interjections.]

Now let me say to you what has happened in Gauteng and maybe we can find out what the Gauteng Government is doing about this, because the headline of the report today reads:

“Metro seeks interdict against Nellmapius Land Grabs...” and hon member Mr Magaxa would not have caught up with this news yet, this refers to what is happening in the ANC governed City of Tshwane and it reads the following:

“The Tshwane Metro is making an urgent application in the High Court in Pretoria to block the occupation of municipal land in Nellmapius, east of Pretoria. ‘We will go to court today but I do not know what time’...”

They do not know much.

“...said city spokesman Blessing Manale. He said it wanted a specific interdict against the Economic Freedom Fighters following clashes with police in Nellmapius on Wednesday.” [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order Madam Premier, there is a - is it a point of order or a

question?

An HON MEMBER: I have a question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is the Premier prepared to take a question?

The PREMIER: Yes I am, but I mean, I am answering the question. ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: She is answering the question. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Actually the Premier ... [Interjection] Order! The Premier is correct, she is replying to the question, so you can take a question afterwards as a supplementary question.

An HON MEMBER: No thanks Mr Deputy Speaker, but ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier please continue.

An HON MEMBER: It is not relevant to what we are dealing with in any case.

The PREMIER: It is very relevant. [Interjections.] It is very relevant because the question here is whether we are abiding by the recommendations. Then the follow-up question shows that they asked the wrong question in the first place so I am answering the follow-up question which is highly relevant, here we go. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: But your responses has nothing to do with the [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: Manale said “the city had obtained a separate order against occupation of municipal land that is in ANC governed areas, but that a fresh one was needed. The initial order interdicted any person from unlawfully invading or occupying vacant land owned by the Municipality...”

And then we have [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: “Large groups of people converged in Nellmapius on Wednesday demanding they be given free land to build their own houses.”

When violence erupted, police - that is in an ANC governed province, listen first:

“Police fired rubber bullets to disperse the crowds. The residents retaliated by throwing stones...” ... [Interjection]

Where is the Commission, Minister Sisulu? Where is the Commission? You see, this exposes the ANC’s double standards ... [Interjection]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: It exposes the ANC’s double standards. We are having a commission

of inquiry and there is shooting in Tshwane and where is the Minister? †Stumm  
 \*Mute! †Sy sê nie 'n woord nie. †Akathethi, akathethi. \*Silent, silent. [Interjections.]

“The Nellmapius branch of the EFF announced its support for the attempted  
 occupation. We found...” [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! ... [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: They organised the occupation. There you get it. They organised the  
 occupation. [Interjections.] And now listen to this: this is my best part: “...but as a  
 democracy...” - this is now the ANC speaking in Tshwane:

“As a democracy, which the EFF was unfortunately elected through...” ...  
 [Interjection]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The PREMIER: ...very unfortunate for the ANC ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Madam Premier, there is - is it a point of order?

Mr M G E WILEY: Yes please, sorry, Mr Deputy Speaker, sorry Madam Premier. The  
 noise on the other side - they are not even the slightest bit interested in listening to the  
 questions. If they are not interested they could leave.



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will look at it and Madam Premier can continue, but I agree with the Chief Whip, there is a bit of a noise coming from that side. Please contain it. Madam Premier I have allowed a lot of latitude ... [Interjection.] Order! Order! I have allowed a lot of latitude in the response to this question. It does not relate exactly to the Lwandle issue, but if there is a comparison I will allow you to briefly to conclude. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Sorry Mr Deputy Speaker, may I address you [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The PREMIER: May I address you on that point?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes please.

The PREMIER: I answered the question. Then there was a follow-up question that had nothing to do with the question, which you allowed. Now I am answering the follow-up question by showing what a hypocritical follow-up it is in any event, because the ANC is doing exactly what he claims we are not doing, which is ignoring people, pushing them out of their houses, shooting people and doing all of those things. There is no commission of inquiry where the ANC does far, far worse than the DA administration has ever done.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. Please continue Madam Premier, I will ... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: So it is absolutely relevant to the follow-up question, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

The PREMIER: Now I am quoting what the ANC said:

“But as a democracy, which the EFF was unfortunately elected through, political parties cannot simply implement their views when not in government,” he said.

An HON MEMBER: We can [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: “Political parties cannot implement their views when they are not in government”, says the ANC [Interjections.] and then [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Tyatyam and hon member Mr Olivier.

The PREMIER: And then we have the whole story coming out.

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P UYS: The Premier is totally off the point, totally irrelevant to the question at hand and I think you should stop it here. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: I am answering the follow-up question.

Mr P UYS: Totally irrelevant! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order Premier, I have asked that you finish off that part of the question. I think it is a little bit wide off the topic.

The PREMIER: Sorry. Mr Deputy Speaker, you allowed a follow up that was off the topic. Now I can answer the follow up. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier, are you finishing?

Mr P UYS: That is the way [Inaudible.] a speech.

The PREMIER: I am not at all finished. [Interjections.] I can take as long as I like to answer and I am absolutely within the parameters there. In the *City Press*, talking about the Tshwane land invasion[Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: That is not the point.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The PREMIER: The ANC through its spokesperson Dumisa Ntuli said: “The land grab is not only wrong...”

Mr P UYS: On a point of order Mr Deputy Speaker.

The PREMIER: “...but undermines the ANC Government...” [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker on a point of order! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Behave man!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

An HON MEMBER: Order!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier ... [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: Sit down and behave.

Die PREMIER: Hulle tjank.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier, just take your seat.

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I cannot see two people at the same time.

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, the Premier is totally off the point. She is reading a prepared speech here. When she wants to make a statement we will allow her to do a statement, but not in the question time. She is wasting time here. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, I cannot prescribe exactly what the Premier must say. All I am pleading for from the Chair is that the Premier must [Interjections.] Order! ...that the Premier must link her reply to either the question or the supplementary question ... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: That is right, exactly.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...and if the Premier's reply is linked to the supplementary question I will not stop the Premier. I will look at Hansard if it is [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Absolutely.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If the Premier is out of order then I will curtail.

The PREMIER: The supplementary question was do we not care about poor people who are building their shelters when they occupy land and I am demonstrating what a hypocritical question that is given what the ANC does. Furthermore, I anticipated that such a stupid follow-up question would come so I prepared to answer it. [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: On a point of order.

Mr P UYS: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr P UYS: On a point of order Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip?

Mr P UYS: We ask that the Premier withdraws that and apologises. How can she say it is a stupid question? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It was a stupid question. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! [Interjections.] I do not regard... [Interjections.] Order! Order! I do not regard that remark necessarily as unparliamentary. It is ... [Interjection.]

Mr P UYS: And stop the stupid answer then. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is also parliamentary. Please continue Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: Fine, fine. You see it would have been intelligent if they had asked

that question as the main question, but they asked a completely baseless question as the main question; asked the real question in the follow-up and now I am answering that question. Now in the *City Press*... Hulle het in hulle eie gat geval man; in hulle eie gat geval. [Tussenwerpsels.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order members, order! [Interjections.] Order! Order! [Interjections.] Order! Hon, please take your seat. Please take your seat.

†INKULUMBUSO: Hlala phantsi \*sit down.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We cannot continue in this vein. [Interjections.] Order! Hon member Ms Dijana, while the Speaker, while the Chair is speaking, you remain quiet. I am saying we cannot continue in this vein. We will sit here the whole day.

The PREMIER: That is okay, I have got the whole day.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We are busy with Question Number One still.

The PREMIER: I have got the whole day to answer, Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please allow the Premier to reply.

The PREMIER: I have got a whole day's worth of exposure of hypocrisy.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier before you reply ... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: On a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is that a question?

Ms P Z LEKKER: On a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Lekker, is that a question?

Ms P Z LEKKER: On a point of order, Chair.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I am listening.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you. I just want to know if it is parliamentary for you to rule on hon member Ms Dijana when she speaks at the same time as yourself and Madam Premier to do the same when you have actually ruled her out?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Lekker, I was busy addressing the House and when the Chair addresses the House no member may speak at the same time. That was the only request I had. There are only two ways that you can actually get the attention of the Chair. The one is by way of a point of order and the other one is by way of a question. So if a member rises, the Chair has to ask: "Are you getting up on a point of order or on a question?" Hon member Ms Dijana simply got up and at the same time started speaking. That is why I asked her to please take her seat so that I can speak from the Chair. May I appeal again to members to please allow the House to



continue now, otherwise we are going to waste our own time, of the House and the inhabitants of the province and we owe it to them to conduct debate at a different level to what is happening now. Madam Premier, please continue.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. I have got a lot of material to answer this question and I will continue. [Interjections.]

In the *City Press* of the 11<sup>th</sup> of November 2014 [Interjections.] the ANC Gauteng spokesperson Dumisa Ntuli said ... [Interjection.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: “The land grab is not only wrong, but undermines the ANC Government’s determined efforts to work...” [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order Premier. Hon member Mr Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Mr Deputy Speaker, we are not going to really agree to this abuse. There is a question that was asked here [Interjections.] clearly about Lwandle; clearly about families and children who are left outside in the cold. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr S G TYATYAM: She is not answering that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, the Premier did respond and she persuaded me that the supplementary question went much wider than the original question and she is responding to the supplementary question.

Mr S G TYATYAM: No we are dealing ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take your seat. Madam Premier [Interjections.]

Mr S G TYATYAM: Let us limit.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Premier, please continue.

The PREMIER: Thank you. I have got pages, pages to prove the hon ANC's hypocrisy on this matter when they come here and say that we are abusing families when in fact the City of Cape Town was the only entity that looked after the families. [Interjections.] But listen to what the ANC spokesperson, Dumisa Ntuli, said when he condemned the land grabs:

“The EFF cannot impose Nazi policies to orchestrate and influence people to grab land illegally.”

That is what they say where they govern, but they do something quite different where they are in opposition. Then they use their own so-called Nazi policies to orchestrate and influence people to grab land illegally.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order Premier. Is that a point of order or a question?

Mr M N PAULSEN: Yes Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: What is it?

Mr M N PAULSEN: Yes, it has to do with the land grabs, and I just want to let the ANC know there is no way when [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Order hon member.

Mr M N PAULSEN: ...where black people occupy the land that it can be called “land grabbing.” [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Paulsen, please take your seat. You cannot just get up and speak if you want to. You must ask a supplementary question after the Premier has concluded. Madam Premier, please continue.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much indeed. Now there has been a rather ironic boomerang in the Lwandle Commission that has many, many angles, but one of the angles is that in order to persuade Andile Lili and Loyiso Nkohlhla who were key in Ses’khona to the land invasion at Lwandle, not to stand for the EFF in the Western Cape. They established this Commission to try and back them and support them, but that gave Andile Lili so much muscle that he is planning to stand against Marius Fransman as the leader of the ANC in this province [Interjections.] En kyk hoe lyk

Andile Lili nou. [Interjections.] Look what happened to Andile Lili as a result. No wonder the hon Leader of the Opposition is not here to follow-up questions from the one that he put to me in this House today. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! There is a second follow-up question, hon member Ms Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. In light of the EFF-orchestrated land grab in Tshwane and the condemnation of this land grab by the Gauteng ANC as the Premier has read to us, do the recommendations of the Lwandle inquiry report of Minister Sisulu support the ANC's or the EFF's position on land invasions?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier. [Interjections.] Order! Order!

The PREMIER: You know there is only one critical law that the ANC has never learnt and it is called the law of unintended consequences - *the law of unintended consequences*.

The Lwandle political hit squad masquerading as a commission was supposed to embarrass the DA and boost the ANC. What it has actually done is boost the EFF inside the ANC in the Western Cape to make them strong. They want to be able to take over the ANC from the inside: Andile Lili, Loyiso Nkohl and others, and they know it is true. They know it is true so it really has come back to bite them and boomerang. [Interjections.] As you can see it has massively boosted campaigns to invade land all over South Africa and now they are going to be more embarrassed than

they already are in Pretoria - we have seen that - to try and stop land invasions in the provinces where they govern, while encouraging them and supporting them here. [Interjections.] So that actually completely exposes the bankruptcy of this party and the hypocrisy. But what it actually did was support the DA's position because we have seen what the ANC does with commissions, not only the Erasmus Commission or the Desai Commission, but what it did with this political hit squad. Denzel Potgieter was one of the guys who tried to be a front for Marius Fransman in setting up a commission, there he is. Annelise Van Wyk, we all know about her ANC bias. Buhle Dambuza, an ANC MP. Mampe Ramotsamai, who was arrested after 15 000 Mandrax tablets were seized from her home and she is still an ANC stalwart which is probably why she got off the charges, and then there was Ses'khona's own lawyer, Barnabas Xulu, whose job is to defend them, who was on the commission to investigate it. It was an embarrassment. Compare that commission to the Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry. Compare that to the excellent Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry and the brilliant report that it produced.

Now the inquiry was facilitated and controlled in all its interactions with the community by the ANC Councillor Matha, who chose who would speak to the commission, what they would say and how, and the commission just accepted her report. Go and read it. You obviously have not read it. It is in the report. I will tell you which page. Go and look at page 51 in the commission's report, in the inquiry. Go and look.

An HON MEMBER: 51.

The PREMIER: You clearly ask me questions about a commission report that you have never read. [Interjections.] It is a disgrace. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Absolutely!

Mnr R B LENTIT: Dis 'n skande man.

The PREMIER: Then they did not even get the basic facts. They could not even ascertain how many structures and people were affected by the evictions. They could not verify the numbers, but the people admitted they were members of Ses'khona and did a deliberate land invasion. They were protected by the ANC, and there was no evidence that there was any attempt by the inquiry to probe the discrepancies in evidence by the various groups. It is a disgrace as a commission of inquiry. It is a disgrace. It is a political hit squad and if anything this inquiry supports the DA's claim that the ANC is such a corrupt government that it abuses lawyers and other people to set up political commissions of inquiry that are not meant to find the truth. There are those political hit squads to hit their opponents, that have no basis in law, that are totally hypocritical because they aim at the DA and nothing happens at all in other provinces, and it gets used to making arguments that make land invasions easier everywhere. Therefore they are being splashed by their own spittoon and hung by their own petard, because they have refined how much this total corrupt abuse of commissions of inquiry helps continue the corruption to the core of this party and will finally destroy this democracy unless we stop them. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there another follow-up question? I want us to get going

on this. Are there other questions? I will allow another one.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker, I just want to find out if the Premier is really alright.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Whether what?

Mr K E MAGAXA: If she is fine? [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is a bit of a frivolous question. Madam Premier, we can ignore that question. Is there another follow up? No further?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Sorry.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Botha.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, on a point of order, the definition of “fine” in this question [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is fine.

An HON MEMBER: Fine is fine!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I did not speak to you. [Laughter.]

Mr P UYS: That is not a point of order.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The definition of “fine” in this question is really which I will now place on your desk to consult and think about because I think it is unparliamentary. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will have a look at it. I have already ruled it is a frivolous question, but if there is a further meaning to that I will come back to the House if necessary.

An HON MEMBER: Fine is fine!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip.

Mr P UYS: On a point of order, linking to that Mr Deputy Speaker, I think you must also take this into context. The Premier has been drinking medication all afternoon.

An HON MEMBER: Ja [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Uys, that is an unfortunate comment as well, but I will consider. [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: It is not unfortunate. What is that? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we move on to the next question, Question Number 11.



Hon member Ms Wenger to Minister Plato. [Interjections.] Order! Order! Minister Plato, Question Number 11. [Interjections.]

'n AGBARE LID: Kyk daar man. Kyk wat daar staan. Watse medisyne is dit? [Tussenwerpsels.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Minister Plato [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is none of his business.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Plato, Order! Please can we have order. Minister Plato, are you with us? I am calling the name for the next question, Question Number 11 standing over.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I am sorry, a third matter which I have to bring to your attention on a point of order. This member has just said to me: "I think you are also not fine." [Interjections.] Now really this member is writing his own book, his own story. He is digging his own hole, but can you please ask him whether he will confirm that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will have a look at it.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Ask him whether he will confirm that please, Mr Deputy Speaker, and deal with it then.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is it hon member Mr Magaxa? Did you say that?

Mr K E MAGAXA: Yes, based on our conversation ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: But I just want to check ... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: He has said to me ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...were you the person who said it?

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...I am weak.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I will also ... [Interjection.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: He said I am weak.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I have heard that. We will consider that in Hansard and come back if necessary. Hon Minister Plato, Question 11.

*Question standing over from Thursday, 4 September 2014, as agreed to by the House:*

*Saldanha Police Station*

**1. Ms M M Wenger asked the Minister of Community Safety:**

Whether, given the development of the Saldanha Industrial Development Zone,

there are any plans to provide additional capacity and resources to the Saldanha police station; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you, and also to hon member Ms Wenger for the question. The answer is as follows: the allocation can only be done once activities can be measured for a specific demarcated area and this is currently not possible. SAPS Saldanha will remain responsible for policing in the area and when activity around the IDZ commences, police will relook its current manpower situation. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker. This means the police have not started planning for the Saldanha IDZ and it will be running in roughly three years, and as we know it takes years for new stations to build up capacity and resources. Surely this area is a priority. Minister, will you be taking this matter up with the national Police Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I will do exactly that, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister Plato. We continue to the next question: new Question Number 2, Minister Botha.

*New question:*

*Maintenance of hospitals and health facilities*

**2. Ms D Gopie asked the Minister of Health:**

Whether his Department has a provincial plan for the maintenance of hospitals and health facilities; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, thank you very much to the hon member Ms Gopie for this question about the maintenance of hospitals and health facilities.

Yes, the department has a plan for the maintenance of hospitals and other health facilities. The maintenance is primarily divided into the following broad categories:

- Scheduled maintenance, undertaken by Transport and Public Works as Health's implementing department. These are maintenance projects flowing out of condition assessments or lifecycle planning and which are included in a list in the User Asset Management Plan.
- The day-to-day maintenance, undertaken by institutions and Directorate Engineering and Technical Services within our department. This is maintenance that takes place on an *ad hoc* basis including minor repairs, modifications or replacements.
- Then there is also routine preventative maintenance, undertaken by institutions

and Directorate Engineering and Technical Services, also an internal division. This is regular ongoing work that is necessary to keep equipment operating and to prevent premature failure. Routine maintenance includes repairs to render equipment fully compliant with all statutory requirements.

- Then lastly there is the emergency maintenance, which is also undertaken by the Directorate Engineering and Technical Services. These are repairs that are unforeseen and require urgent attention due to the presence of or the imminent risk of an extreme or emergency situation.

Ongoing maintenance of our facilities has been recognized as a priority area. A significant portion of our budget has therefore been allocated to address the current maintenance backlog. Budget allocation is also being made for routine preventative maintenance for all new projects. The Department annually develops a User Asset Management Plan (U-AMP), which *inter alia* outlines the conditions and the suitability of each facility utilised by Western Cape Government Health. Scheduled maintenance and preventative maintenance lists, covering a three-year period and which are reviewed and monitored on a very regular basis, are incorporated in the User Asset Management Plan.

The scheduled maintenance projects that are currently being prioritised by means of a facility condition assessment undertaken by Transport and Public Works and inputs received from the end-user itself. These assessment reports have cost estimates and priority ratings to determine budget allocation for maintenance needs. The projects are prioritised according to the following categories to ensure that critical works are

receiving urgent attention:

- Currently critical;
- Potentially critical;
- Necessary but not critical.

In the previous term of our predecessors, the ANC, the period from 2005 to 2009, R435 million was spent on infrastructure maintenance of health. During our term in office, the previous five years, we have spent R1 billion on the maintenance of our facilities. This is more than double than that spent by our predecessors.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Is there no follow-up?

Ms D GOPIE: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move on to question - is there a follow-up hon member Ms Gopie?

Ms D GOPIE: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please ask your question.

Ms D GOPIE: Minister Botha, is the extending of the clinics also part of the maintaining the facilities?

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Dit is [Tussenwerpsels.]

Mr M G E WILEY: [Inaudible.] removed from the question.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agbare Botha.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Ek is nie 100% seker of ek die vraag verstaan nie. Bedoel u die uitbreidings aan fasiliteite?

Me D GOPIE: Ja, ja.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Goed, nee. Die uitbreiding aan fasiliteite, agb lid me Gopie, is kapitaalprojekte wat dan uit ons kapitaalebegroting vir nuwe fasiliteite bestee word, maar daar word dan 'n begrotingsplan daaraan gevoeg vir die instandhouding en herstelwerk daarvan in die toekoms. Ek hoop dit beantwoord u vraag.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Agb lid me Gopie nog 'n vraag?

Me D GOPIE: Ja, en dan word dit nie voltooi in die tydperk wat daarvoor vasgestel is dat dit voltooi sal wees nie? Like for instance it was supposed to be done maybe by December and it is now already November and some facilities are not yet fixed or done.

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Ja wel, uit die aard van die saak het elke

fasiliteit sy eie plan en sy eie begroting wat ons dan daarvoor gebruik in terme van daardie batebestuursplan, en ek sal dit in terme daarvan moet nagaan so ek sal dit waardeer as die agbare lid vir my miskien van sekere fasiliteite kan voorsien. Dan kan ek vir u spesifiek daardie inligting gee. Ek nooi u graag om dit te doen. In die algemeen wil ek vir u sê ons het nie genoeg geld om al die onderhoudswerk te doen nie. Dit is baie, baie moeilik om te bepaal wat die totale bedrag is wat ons benodig vir onderhoudswerk maar ons vermoed dit is in die koers van R4 miljard en ons het dus 'n agterstand. Ons het die besteding alreeds verdubbel en ons het beter planne vir die toekoms in plek gestel maar om u ander vraag te antwoord, ons het nie genoeg geld vir al die onderhoud nie.

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Ons gaan voort na Vraag Nommer 3, weer die agb lid me Gopie aan Minister Botha. Sorry Minister Botha, there is a follow-up. Is there a follow-up question?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Lekker, sorry, I did not see you.

†UNksz P Z LEKKER: Enkosi Sekela Somlomo. Ndicela ukubuza ukuba ngaba ucoceko lwezibhedlele ingaba luphantsi kwecandelo likaMphathiswa uBotha kusini na, kuba besenze utyelelo, safika kwikliniki yaseHeideveld kumdaka, akukho neemaski kuyanuka. Amathuba okuba abantu baphinde bathathe izifo ngelaa xesha basekliniki maninzi kakhulu. Ndicela ke uMphathiswa athathe inxaxheba awuqwalasele lo mcimbi kuba uyo sikisa. Enkosi.



\* Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I want to ask if cleanliness at hospitals falls under the MEC's department, because we took a tour and when we got to the Heideveld clinic it was dirty, there are no masks and the place smells. There is a great chance for people to contract diseases while at the clinic. I appeal to the MEC to take action and look at this matter because it is scary. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Ms Lekker. Minister Botha.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Yes, the member asked two questions. The one is whether that is our responsibility to look at the cleanliness of facilities and the second question was whether I would be willing to look into it, so it is actually two questions. No problem.

Yes, it is our responsibility to look at the cleaning and many of the supporting services to the mainstream business that we have. Most of it is outsourced and involve contractual agreements and I would say we are, in general, happy with the service that we receive. Unfortunately it does differ from facility to facility also in terms of who the contract is awarded to, so if there is a specific instance, as you have mentioned now, I will look into that.

The other general remark I just want to make is that our facilities are confronted with different volumes and pressures of services and many of our facilities were designed for a demographic profile which does not fit our current clientele at all. The best example which I can quickly think of, just to share with you, is the Helderberg Hospital which is on the northern periphery of the leafy suburbs, I can almost say, but

it serves a community which is totally on the other side of town, and that facility was developed and planned 40-50 years ago for a totally different disease profile, disease burden and population. So it is very challenging, but we replace facilities, extend facilities and add facilities at a very steady and healthy rate. We spend our money well. Contracts are executed on time, within budget, and we climb this mountain day by day, but I will gladly assist you with the specific problem that you have.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Dijana.

UNksz T M DIJANA: Enkosi Somlomo. Ndicela ukubuza kuMphathiswa ngendaba yaseRed Cross ukuba ngawaphi amanyathelo abawathathileyo kuba kukho iipilisi needriphu ezilahlwe ePhillipi. Benza ntoni belisebe ukuze iphele loo nto kuba kokwesibini kucholwa izinto phaya.

\* Thank you, Madam Speaker. I would like to ask the MEC about the issue of the Red Cross Hospital as to what steps have they taken regarding tablets and drips that were found dumped in Philippi. What are they doing as the department to bring that to an end because it is the second time that such things were found there?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Botha did you get the question?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, I think there is a challenge with the translation here. He mentions that things are ripped out of Red Cross Hospitals and Philippi and so on. I do not understand.

Ms T M DIJANA: Yes, Uh-huh.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Can we help him?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: What do you mean with “rip”?

An HON MEMBER: The drips [Inaudible.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: What hon member Ms Dijana says is there were drips and tablets that were found abandoned somewhere in Brown’s Farm and it was then alleged or the response was that those were from Red Cross Hospitals, so what are the measures that are going to be put in place in order for that particular incident not to occur because it has now been the second time that those things were found?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you for the clarification. The protocol in terms of medical waste management is a very, very strict one. The protocol in terms of the transport and storage and dispensing of medication is a very strict one, but you know to some extent this is sometimes beyond our control and where it is beyond our control is typically where you have issued medication to a patient, and then it is actually that patient’s property and they can do with it whatever they want to. They can throw it out into the streets. I do not have any specific information. If you would give it to me I will immediately have an investigation and react to that.

The medical waste component is a very strict regime, a very strict protocol and if there was any medical waste that is very serious and I would urge you - I would make

a general plea to all members of the House - to take my particulars and call me. We react immediately to any problem, regardless of what day, what night, what time of the night.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move on to the next question. Again Minister Botha, hon member Ms Gopie, Question Number 3. Minister Botha. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

An HON MEMBER: What is your cell number?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: My cell number, 0837004790. I give my cell number to staff. I gave it to 32 000 staff members as well. [Interjections.] Yes, I am. [Interjections.] They keep me busy at two o'clock at night when you sleep soundly.

An HON MEMBER: Who are you talking about?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: You. [Laughter.]

An HON MEMBER: Rooi mannetjie.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Rooi mannetjie.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Botha, please continue.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: My question [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue with... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Sorry Mr Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

'n AGBARE LID: Dis orraait, jy is 'n kort mannetjie. Jy is 'n kort mannetjie.

*Department of Health: human resource plan:*

**3. Ms D Gopie asked the Minister of Health:**

(1) Whether his department has a human resource plan for all levels of staffing; if not, why not; if so, (a) what are the problems foreseen and (b) how many vacant positions are provided for;

(2) whether he will make a copy of the plan available?

Die MINISTER VAN GESONDHEID: Ja, ek is, kort maar kragtig! Hon member Ms Du Toit Marais, thank you very much for the question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Botha, it is Question Number 3.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Where am I now?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Gopie.

An HON MEMBER: Question 3. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Where are you [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Question 3, Hon member Ms Gopie, sorry. I have too many questions. Sorry for that. The Department has a human resource plan, yes, and that includes all staffing levels. The problems foreseen are as follows:

The human resource capacity is not where it should be in the Department due to financial constraints as well as retention problems. I think that is a general government problem throughout the country and the world. Everyone would want to have more staff members. An analysis of the current supply of the core competencies within the Department was conducted and indicates a limited availability in a number of occupational groups that have been listed as scarce. Most of these groupings are located within the health professional occupations as well as finance and human resources.

Areas of focus with regard to the human resources: One is leadership and management training; assess management skills and standards of heads of institutions and their respective management teams; line and staff in the execution of functions; identify priority training and develop a training plan for leadership and management development. Areas to be addressed are lean management delegations, labour relations, difficult conversations, tools to empower the line managers in HR issues.

The second challenge: our focus is recruitment and retention strategies to assist with

the following core competencies that have been identified as scarce skills.

One is nursing in specific speciality areas, not nursing in general but speciality areas, such as trauma emergency care, theatre, intensive care, advanced psychiatry, advanced midwifery and paediatrics.

Family physicians within the district health services in the rural areas, that is very challenging. Radiographers in ultrasound especially in the rural areas. Radiographers, sorry. Engineering technicians across the service platform, forensic pathology officers, emergency care technicians and paramedics, clinical technologists, industrial technicians.

The vacant funded posts: on 15 September (I do not know why they chose this date) the total of vacant funded posts in the Western Cape was 1 797 which constitutes a 5.47% vacancy rate in the Department of Health. I am not certain what the average of the country is, but it is about ten times this, between 40 and 50%.

In my predecessor's term of office again from 2005 to 2008 the average vacancy rate was 13% and our average rate was 4.5%. The Department will make a copy of the plan available to you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up hon member Ms Gopie?

Ms D GOPIE: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, you can ask, proceed.

Ms D GOPIE: Minister Botha, there is understaffing in the clinics and Bishop Lavis staff were taken from there to Belhar; what was the reason for doing that?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: From where?

Ms D GOPIE: Bishop Lavis.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Botha.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: To Belhar. I repeat, we can do with many more staff than what we currently have in terms of the approved norms and standards and budget that we currently work with, we have a vacancy rate of only 5.47%. In terms of nurses it is lower. I know it is lower because I made a speech about that a day or two ago. It is closer to 5%. So in nursing itself there is actually no shortage. I must actually stress to you that we have more nurses, and produce more nurses, than what we can employ.

Five, six years ago we had a shortage of nursing students, successful nursing students qualifying with the interventions that we have implemented. The successes of that are that today we are in the position where we have a significant number of nurses more than what the platform can afford, and we actually make them available to other provinces without expecting them to refund us for the academic period. So we are actually now, to a certain extent, exporting nurses in that regard and one of the provinces that benefited much from this was the Northern Cape, and they have placed



a new order for more nurses again. So let me stress that in nursing staff we actually do not have a shortage. We have a shortage in specialised nurses and that is what we are currently addressing very seriously. On the other issue which you mentioned now about the movement of staff from Bishop Lavis to Belhar again, I unfortunately must still get the information so please allow me the opportunity to get the information. I will contact you personally and share with you. There will be a plan, a reason and an explanation for it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Makeleni. Hon member Ms Makeleni first and then you can have another shot.

†UNksz P MAKELENI: Enkosi Somlomo. Ndicela ukubuza apha kuMphathiswa ukuba le department human resources plan yakhe iyathetha na ngabantu abamnyama nabantu abakhubazekileyo, abantu abamnyama bomthonyama ingakumbi ukuqinisekisa ukuba ihambelana nophuhliso lwabo neemfuno zolingano kwezengqesho. Enkosi.

\* Thank you, Madam Speaker. I would like to find out from the MEC whether his human resources plan does take into account black people, disabled people, especially indigenous black people to ensure that it is in line with their development and the requirements of employment equity.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you for the question. Obviously we adhere to all laws and legislation in our administration and therefore we apply that also in our government and in our department, the equity laws and everything that goes with that. I must just say that you referred specifically to management. I have been to the

National Health Council, which is the Health Minmec, a week ago where the national Minister actually asked the Western Cape to share with the other provinces our appointment system on how we appoint people, how we are able to appoint people who do the job correctly on the service platform and specifically in the financial division. He also asked us to do a presentation on our management structure, how we employ managers and so I must tell you that I am actually very proud of the achievements that we have been able to record in that regard.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Ms Gopie, your third one.

Ms D GOPIE: Minister Botha says in terms of nurses we are not understaffed, but in our oversight visits to Kraaifontein, Heideveld and even Bishop Lavis we were told that they are understaffed and the Minister is saying we are not understaffed; and then the previous point that Minister Botha said I must provide him with the information so that he can come back to me. The Belhar Clinic was supposed to be finished by December and it is now November - last year, and they say the contractor has ...  
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes hon Chief Whip, I am listening carefully.

Mr M G E WILEY: There needs to be a question hidden here somewhere.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think she is... [Interjections.] There was a question

slipped in there.

Ms D GOPIE: No, the Minister did ask me for information so that he can get me the ...

[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Ms Gopie, order. Minister Botha, will you reply?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I am the guilty one. I asked her to provide the information.

Ms D GOPIE: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will take the blame. I will take the blame for that. Actually what I mean hon member Ms Gopie is provide me with the information outside of this forum, because I cannot make notes here, you know. If you want to I can get someone from my office to contact you to obtain the information from you but I cannot sit and take it down here. It will be very unprofessional and so on. I will deal with that. The question about the nurses is a repeat question of the first one.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Can we move on to the next question? Question 4, Minister Bredell.

*Small, black-owned construction companies (CIDB grading CE 1,2 and 3)*

**4. Mr M N Paulsen asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental**

### **Affairs and Development Planning:**

What is being done at municipal level to ensure that small, black-owned construction companies (CIDB grading CE 1, 2 and 3) are able to tender for construction opportunities in the province?

Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Dankie aan die agb lid mnr Paulsen vir die vraag. Ek antwoord die vraag nadat ek van die ander departemente geraadpleeg het; die Departement van Vervoer en Publieke Werke, dankie; Ekonomiese Ontwikkeling, dankie vir julle insette en ook provinsiale Tesourie.

Die Wes-Kaap Regering moedig die munisipaliteite aan en ondersteun hulle in die ontwikkeling van die plaaslike konstruksiebedryf deur verskeie programme en inisiatiewe. Die Departement van Vervoer en Publieke Werke se KBOR Afdeling gee ondersteuning aan munisipaliteite in die ontwikkeling van kleinkontrakteursontwikkelingsprogramme.

As deel van die ondersteuning word personeel aan beide die tegniese en die verkrygingsdepartemente opgelei in die samestelling van 'n projek wat behels die korrekte projekgrootte, die projekontwerp en die tenderspesifikasies en die voorwaardes. Plaaslike kontrakteurs word geïdentifiseer vanuit die KBOR kontrakregister en word uitgenooi na werkswinkels waar opleiding verskaf word in die voltooiing van tenderdokumente, kontrakkooreenkomste en die bestuur van die finansies van klein besighede.

Verder ondersteun die Departement van Ekonomiese Ontwikkeling munisipaliteite in die ontwikkeling van plaaslike ekonomiese ontwikkelingstrategieë wat die ontwikkeling van die konstruksiebedryf en in besonder die klein opkomende kontrakteursegment insluit.

Die departement van die provinsiale Tesourie is ook in die proses van die ontwikkeling van 'n voorkeurverskaffersbeleid wat gedurende die 2015/16 begrotingsjaar aan die munisipale rade vir goedkeuring voorgelê gaan word. Die beleid maak 'n doelgerigte benadering teenoor plaaslike kontrakteursontwikkelings moontlik en sal spesifieke doelwitte stel om dit binne 'n bepaalde tydsraamwerk te bereik. Die Departement sal ook opleiding verskaf in die implementering van die beleid, in besonder die oorskakeling van die beleid in generiese tenderdokumentasie en -spesifikasies.

Die beleid maak ook voorsiening vir wysigings aan die algemene kontrakvoorwaardes deur afwykings van die noodigheid van waarborge, verminderde maandelikse retensiegelde en korter betalingsperiodes om sodoende 'n meer gunstige omgewing vir die groei van potensiële opkomende bedrywe te skep. Die promovering van besighede wat deur swart eienaars besit word, word tans deur die toepassing van die BSEB statusgradering as deel van die voorkeerpuntestelsel bevoordeel.

Die Departement van Plaaslike Regering verskaf 'n platform vir departemente om met munisipaliteite te kommunikeer rakende die jongste ontwikkeling op die gebied van kleinkontrakteursontwikkeling en ondersteuningsprogramme op hul maandeliks MIK-

koördineringsvergaderings. Munisipaliteite word ook aangemoedig om projekte so saam te stel en te ontwerp om hul onderskeie kontrakteursontwikkelingsprogramme te ondersteun deur die MIK-projek beoordelings en registrasieproses. Ek dank u.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, is there a follow-up?

Mr M N PAULSEN: Yes Mr Deputy Speaker, and thank you Minister Bredell for the response. What I would like to know is you spoke about training and what we should be doing to assist them. What I would like to know is would this mean that contracts would then be made available for lower graded contract engineers or electrical contractors whereby the Grade 4s would not then get the contract and then go and subcontract it out to Grade 1s, 2s and 3s and then sit back and someone else does the work and they collect payment?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Bredell?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Obviously that is currently one part of the problem but there are vast problems and this is why within this whole sector they have embarked on training after they have done a lot of research with especially your smaller BEE companies, especially your local companies, to understand what their problems are, why do they not get tenders. I think that was very important and part of this was the tender specifications, all those kinds of things, and that is included in new legislation that is proposed, so we work very closely. It is definitely not the right thing to hand a tender to one person who is sitting back and then sub-tender and somebody

else does the work. That is not what we want to achieve. At the end of the day we want ownership and we want our local communities to benefit within the tender process, especially within the local municipalities. We must also realise that with regard to a MIC programme like this, we are talking about a capital budget of around about R450 to R500 million. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, we then continue to the next question, Question 5, Minister Grant.

*Copper: theft of on train lines*

**5. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:**

Whether his department, in conjunction with Transnet, Sanral and the South African Police Services is implementing strategies to curb the theft of copper on train lines; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker, and thank you to the hon member Mr Christians for the question, and the answer to it is no, there are no formal joint strategies between my department, Transnet, Sanral and the South African Police Services in this regard.

Given Transnet's and Sanral's distinctive mandates this is not surprising. However, the major threat to the rail service component of public transport is the theft of electrical cables for copper trading purposes and the sabotage of signal points. However, this impacts essentially on the services of Metrorail. The City of Cape Town

has a dedicated Metals Theft Unit called the Copperheads which is active in areas of the City's jurisdiction and my Department has also worked together with Metrorail to curb copper theft on train lines by funding amongst others 25 scrambler bikes to improve the efficiency of security guards employed to reduce such theft.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We can continue. Question Number 6, Minister Schäfer.

*Corporal punishment at schools*

**6. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Education:**

Whether corporal punishment is still used as a means of disciplining learners; if so, (a) at which schools and (b) what action is being taken against educators found guilty?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Let me make it quite clear that the Western Cape Education Department has a zero tolerance policy on corporal punishment. Corporal punishment is illegal in terms of the South African Schools Act and this is emphasised regularly to our teaching staff. The WCED works closely with schools to ensure that they develop alternatives to corporal punishment when dealing with discipline in schools. These alternatives must respect the learner's rights. This includes an approach called diversion to encourage positive behaviour and various forms of punishment such as detention, academic work and service to the school. The WCED has provided extensive guidelines to schools on how to maintain discipline. The popular guidelines are available on the WCED's website. Our district



also provides ongoing training on managing discipline at schools. The WCED provides training to teachers called “Know your rights” on how to manage discipline without resorting to corporal punishment.

From time to time however some individual teachers wrongfully resort to corporal punishment. The Department views these cases of corporal punishment in a very serious light and investigates each case vigorously.

The answer to (b): our records show that we do not hesitate when it comes to investigating, prosecuting and reporting incidents of corporal punishment. We follow due process rigorously to ensure fair and just compliance with the law. Action that has been taken against educators found guilty of corporal punishment includes a final written warning and a fine or a final written warning and a suspension without remuneration or dismissal in cases of assault to commit grievous bodily harm. Sanctions obviously depend on the circumstances of each case as well as whether they are repeat offenders.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Is there a follow up, hon member Mr Christians?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Minister Schäfer for that answer. No, the reason I have asked that question is because when the national Minister answered in the National Assembly she said that the Western Cape has the highest number of corporal punishment cases in the country. She said that there were 247 cases reported and 188 cases were in the Western Cape. So that is the concern, but thank you Minister Schäfer

that you are addressing the problem and that there is a zero tolerance, but it is just concerning when you see figures like this, that we have had the highest in the country for three years in a row. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I think the critical point lies in the word “reported”. We are the only department in the country that accurately records cases and reporting of cases in our view. We do not believe we are the worst in the country but our records are probably the best in the country.

The PREMIER: The best in the country, yes.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The records - sorry. [Laughter.]

An HON MEMBER: According to you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: No, according to what we know, but our records are immaculate and we do not believe that we are the worst in the country, but our records are the best.

The PREMIER: Exactly!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Is there another follow-up, hon member Mr Dugmore.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Yes, Mr Deputy Speaker, can I just ask firstly for the MEC to substantiate her statement that no other provinces besides the Western Cape report on these statistics accurately. If she could provide the authority for that statement and secondly the question very clearly asks at which schools. Could the MEC give us at least a sense about how many schools have been involved in administering corporal punishment whether from individual teachers or not. I think the question is to try and get a sense and therefore I would like to ask you how many of our schools have reported incidents of corporal punishment. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I cannot substantiate it because we do not have records. That is the whole point.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Then you cannot make a statement like that.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I can make a statement like that, because it is based on our experiences in the province.

Mr C M DUGMORE: You cannot, it is nonsense; it is absolute nonsense.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Second of all it is a new question, but I can answer it, and we have had 78 schools where corporal punishment has been reported and dealt with. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We have reached the end of question time. The

unanswered questions will be printed in Hansard.

*[Outstanding replies to Questions Numbers 7 to 17 to be printed in Hansard.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We now proceed to Questions to the Premier Without Notice. I see the hon member Mr Dugmore.

### **QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE:**

Mr C M DUGMORE: Thank you very much Mr Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr C M DUGMORE: I would like to ask that given that almost five months ago on the 20<sup>th</sup> of June 2014 the Premier in her State of the Province Address said that we are currently working on a new housing model that incorporates innovative partnership strategies with the City of Cape Town and other municipalities, whether the Premier can give this House an explanation as to why five months later this new housing model has not been produced and whether she can give the House a date when it will be completed.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: The hon member Mr Dugmore must have been out of the province when we held the major exhibition of all of the very innovative responses from the

private sector which includes the informal sector in terms of contributing to the new housing model. There was the most extraordinary exhibition on the station forecourt which was part of that model which we have termed broadly the “Better Living Challenge” and there must have been 15 exhibits drawn from a very, very long list of entries ranging from a very innovative new brick made out of prickly pears that can be used to build houses right through to extraordinary alternative building materials that are affordable, fire-resistant and applicable to poor circumstances. If the hon member Mr Dugmore missed the speech that I made there, however, and if he has missed the entire Better Living Challenge let me speak to him about that now.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Please do not. Answer my question.

The PREMIER: I am. I am answering your question. [Interjections.] I am not.

An HON MEMBER: Be serious now.

The PREMIER: I am being very serious. [Interjections.] If any of the hon members on the other side of the House had bothered to go along and view all of those models they would not put such an uninformed question to this House in an unprepared question.

The new model is needed and I will tell you why it is needed, because if you go to the reason why something is needed you understand what is produced. The new model is needed because the rate of demand of housing is growing so quickly that there are more people who need state subsidised housing today than was the case in 1994, and because the government only provides a house for people whose entire household

earns less than R3 500 it leaves hundreds of thousands, indeed millions of people, without any access to support or finance and the new model has to support people who are in the section of the market called “lower gap” who cannot get any support from the bank, who cannot get support from the government and who sit in terrible conditions. So the Better Living Challenge is producing a range of opportunities for people who can afford something to live in dignity and decency and not only have we unveiled what it is but we have had an entire physical exhibition on the forecourt of the station that was seen by hundreds of thousands of people. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Madam Premier. Hon member Mr Dugmore, a follow-up?

Mr C M DUGMORE: I would like to ask as a follow-up if the Premier could answer the first question I asked, which was when will this new housing model - not an exhibition, but an official Provincial Government strategy - be adopted, as you promised five months ago. I am not talking about an exhibition.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: It has been adopted. The exhibition was part of that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dugmore, your second and last question.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Okay, could I ask the Premier that, given the official statistics that have been provided by the national Department of Housing which show that while

the ANC governed this province an average of 20 000 houses were built each year in comparison to the 12 000 since the DA has been running this province, is she happy given this lack of delivery by the DA and will this model, which she now informs the House has actually been adopted, which no-one in the Standing Committee has seen by the way, does that model target at least 20 000 units per year?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: It seems that the hon member Mr Dugmore does not even listen to the national Minister, because according to her model nobody under the age of 40 should get any access to State support for a house. That is the ANC's model and it is a public disgrace. So the ANC has announced their model. Our model is entirely different.

Mr C M DUGMORE: Where is this model? Can you give it to us?

The PREMIER: It has been articulated so often; every time the Minister speaks, he speaks about it. [Interjections.]

Mr C M DUGMORE: Where is it? Where?

The PREMIER: The model is as follows. The model is as follows ... [Interjection.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: It is in the air.

The PREMIER: ...that the money that the State allocates to housing cannot be used to

meet the demand on the basis of a completed house for every family. No country in the world does that. No country in the world can afford that; nor can South Africa. So the model is that you divide the database into affordability categories without discouraging people from trying to improve their circumstances and enable a partnership to develop between State support playing the role of land and services and some support towards building a house; the funding institutions which we have been meeting to bring them in to support poor households and families; the individual initiative of families plus a whole lot of service providers who have ingenious ideas around informal housing. The purpose of the exhibition was to bring precisely those people in to see what options were available and in the first day one of the innovative solutions sold eighty to customers who just arrived on the first day - to poor people. So the model is very simple. It is to ensure that everybody contributes something to their houses in relation to their means and that the government plays its role, support individual initiative, provide serviced land and free basic services, which by the way people were amazed to hear about in Europe because they think those are socialist policies. But we defend them because it is the right thing to do for poor people, and to ensure that everyone without their means of affordability contributes something to their own housing and that there is not this huge gap of complete unaffordability left gaping by the ANC, which now will be added to immeasurably in numbers because Minister Sisulu has said that no-one under 40 can get any assistance from the State.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We move on, the hon member Mr Paulsen.  
[Interjections.]

The PREMIER: That is the model.



Mr M N PAULSEN: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I really do not know which country the Premier is living in, but many of us cannot even afford a house.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, please limit your remarks to a very succinct question [Interjections.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: With regard to evictions, I would like to know what provision this Western Cape Government is going to make for elderly people and disabled people who are not able to pay their bonds and who will soon be homeless.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: There is no country in the world that can build a completed house for any family who needs it. [Interjections.]

That is a real model. That is a real model. [Interjections.] That is a real model.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Do not say no [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: That is a real model of progress and development and innovation, yes.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Do not say no then [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: And what about humanity; are humanity [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Just like the old Soviet Union was. You should have been there to listen to what Gorbachev said. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Where it is illegal, illegal to have aid.

The PREMIER: That is why everybody wanted freedom in the old East Zone.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Everybody without [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Go and see them. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: Mr Deputy Speaker [Interjections.]

Mr K E MAGAXA: At least you know now that you are wrong.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Magaxa, please allow the Premier to respond.

The PREMIER: I will respond and I will respond to that interjection. [Interjections.]

One of the most moving experiences of my life was to hear President Gorbachev talk about his realisations about why Soviet Communism was wrong, and that is something that the other side of the House still has to learn about. [Laughter.] [Interjections.]

Mr Deputy Speaker [Interjections.] He just goes where the money is, do not worry. That is what kind of a Communist he is. Can I just say to you [Interjections.]

'n AGBARE LID: Dis waar jy sit man.

The PREMIER: And you are sorry that you cannot be with us, are you not? Ja, ja. [Interjections.] There is no place for you, my friend. Okay, there is no country in the world where the government can or does build a house for every person who needs it, and secondly there is no government in the world that can take over everybody's bond when they cannot afford to pay it. That is when people downsize or make arrangements to let rooms in their house or do something, but there is no government in the world that can pay people's bonds when they cannot pay them.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, do you want to follow up?

Mr M N PAULSEN: Yes Mr Deputy Speaker, I do not know what is in that bottle, but I do not think the Premier heard my question properly. I was speaking [Laughter.] I was speaking about ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen ... [Interjection.]

Mr M N PAULSEN: I was speaking about ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Paulsen, that remark calls for a

withdrawal.

Mr M N PAULSEN: [Laughter.] I withdraw, no problem.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Continue.

Mr M N PAULSEN: I was asking the question, we were speaking about elderly people here. We were speaking about disabled people. Is the Premier saying that she has got a good excuse as to why elderly and disabled people must now become hobos in this province, because a government has no obligation to provide housing for everyone; not even the sick, not even the infirm, not even the elderly?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Paulsen. Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: You see, I do not think that the hon member Mr Paulsen remembers what question he asked me.

An HON MEMBER: Yes. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: He was talking about the elderly and the disabled who can no longer pay their bonds. That is what he was talking about. That was his question: who cannot pay their bonds. That was his question, so he must have forgotten what question he asked me in the first place.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Can I respond?

The PREMIER: But if the hon member Mr Paulsen ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, you will get another bite at the cherry as a second question. Please take your seat.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Okay Mr Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier please continue.

The PREMIER: But if the hon member Mr Paulsen has a particular case in mind, can he please bring the details to me and we will see what is possible within the framework of policy.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, now your last opportunity, a short question.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Thank you very much. With regard to evictions and people who can no longer pay their bonds, I am going to take up the Premier's offer and I am glad this is going to go on record. We are going to give her a good couple of people that she could assist, and since she is such a kind-hearted and well meaning woman, I thank her very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen, that was an opportunity for a question, not for a statement.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Ja, but ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You abused that opportunity. You must ask a second question. Minister Botha.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Mr Deputy Speaker, I really think that hon member Mr Paulsen is deliberately undermining you and the Rules of this House. He does not even listen to what you are telling him and I ask you to please also rule on that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I will look at that and I agree with the sentiments that the hon member Mr Paulsen must have a look at the rule book from time to time, but from the Chair we will try and control him as well. Hon member Mr Dyantyi is the next one.

Mnr Q R DYANTYI: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, will you allow me to ask the Premier a question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is your right to ask a question. You may continue.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: You do, thank you. Madam Premier, will you support any of the Western Cape municipalities ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: We cannot hear you.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: The Premier, can you hear me Premier? ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi.

The PREMIER: I would like to learn my Xhosa as well [Inaudible.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I will speak in English.

The PREMIER: Ja, and I am very [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Madam Premier, would you support any of our municipalities in the Western Cape or departments if they employ members of the rival Hard Livings or Ghetto Gangs to provide security in the upgrading of flats?

An HON MEMBER: Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: You stopped with the translation. I think the translator got lost.  
[Interjections.]

The PREMIER: I know the question. I just wanted to hear what a gang was in Xhosa.  
[Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: What gang is this? What gang is this?

The PREMIER: There is no gang, I was just listening [Interjections.] I was listening to

the Xhosa translation. [Interjections.] Everybody listens. Why do you think we have a translation? ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

An HON MEMBER: Can this House adjourn? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It is a respectable language.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier, you may continue. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: That is okay, I understand.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister Botha, just allow the Premier to continue.

The PREMIER: This is the kind of question that starts with “are you still beating your wife?” If the hon member has any information of any gangs employed to do security anywhere could he please bring it to me with evidence. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there a follow-up question, hon member Mr Dyantyi, otherwise we continue. [Interjections.] Hon member Mr Dyantyi, I am asking you, is there a follow-up question?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: She is not answering.



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If not, you can take your seat. Hon member Ms Wenger is the next one.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I said I have two questions to ask.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: But I have asked you whether you want to use the opportunity and you sat down.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: I thought you were going to first clarify that she did not answer the question. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Dyantyi, the Premier may respond to the question the way she thinks fit. Please get to your question.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Let me proceed with the second question, if you will allow me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have allowed you two times now. Please continue.

Mr Q R DYANTYI: Madam Premier, if information is submitted to you about any of

the municipalities in the Western Cape or a department, who are employing members of the rival Hard Livings and Ghetto Gangs, what would you do?

An HON MEMBER: Report them to [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: Okay, I will study what is brought to me. I will investigate the validity and depending on the outcome I will make a judgement.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Dyantyi, your last opportunity to ask a short question?

Mr Q R DYANTYI: They are always short. Madam Premier, would you act on information provided to you about the possible employment of gang members, by any of the municipalities or provincial departments in this province?

The PREMIER: Well, before I investigate I have to have something to go on, I do not want to go on a blind fishing expedition everywhere, so if the hon member has any information can he please submit it to me and I will take it from there.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. We proceed, hon member Ms Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. Given Eskom's supply challenges and the recent and constant threat of load-shedding, does the Premier have

any insight on the scale of the problem and how it might impact the province?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Madam Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. The scale of the problem as I understand it from people who are very close to the centre of what is happening is close to catastrophic and the collapse of that silo is really indicative of what is happening to Eskom, and just at the time when Eskom is seriously collapsing the national government wants to make a move to ensure that Eskom has to reticulate all electricity in local authorities, which is a complete disgrace and will mean that every single city will sit in the dark in the not too distant future. Just at a time when we should all be following this extraordinary example that has emerged in one of the suburbs of Cape Town where an individual family is generating electricity and selling it back to the City, which is a model that we should be replicating because we have got such fantastic sources of green energy, just at this time and using the energy crisis President Zuma announces that they are going to go nuclear in a deal with Russia that is a done deal and that deal I have no doubt is to rescue the ANC from bankruptcy.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear.

The PREMIER: And they are going to get a massive kickback from this deal, I have no doubt, which is meant to rescue the ANC from bankruptcy, but in doing so will bankrupt the country. [Interjections.] It will bankrupt the country and so this symbolises how the ANC governs South Africa. It is all about themselves and their advantage and their riches, while they are destroying this country and the crisis for our

future and our growth is unprecedented. Nuclear energy is something we do not need, something that we do not want, and something that we cannot afford, and indeed there is a wholesale abandonment of green energy because there are not enough kick-backs for friends and not enough under-the-table-money for ANC cadres and for the ANC as an organisation and we will continue putting an effort into green energy. I did a lot of research on that while I was in various institutes and institutes of technology in the past week. There is extraordinary new research being done on, for example, storing green energy, transporting green energy, and that is the direction that this province is going, and as Eskom collapses if the ANC want to use that as an excuse to bring in nuclear, the protest against the E-tolls will look like an hors d'oeuvre. We will make sure that this country is not abused so that the ANC can use its corrupt links with dictators in other parts of the world to bankrupt the society. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon member Ms Wenger, no follow-up question? The time allowed for this has expired now. We continue with statements by members. [Interjections.] The first one is the DA, hon member Mr Lentit.

## **STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS**

Mr R B LENTIT: Thank you very much, Mr Deputy Speaker. The *Mail & Guardian* reported in an article three weeks ago that the ANC is broke and in response to this allegation the ANC was quick to defend and protect their own financial and economic status and insisted that they are not broke, or did they forget to mention that they are looting their own coffers?

I just wish that we can have the same quick response to daily media reports on how the poorest of the poor still do not taste the fruits of our hard-fought democracy. Especially from the ANC Western Cape that is morally, ethically, politically and socially bankrupt it is also no surprise that the ANC National have run the South African economy into the ground.

Moody's have just downgraded South Africa with two points and we feature now just above "critical". The ANC broke the vision of Tata Mandela. The ANC broke the vision of a prosperous South Africa and their tit-for-tat visa requirement tactics is now directed to break the economic prospects derived from foreign investment.

I beg this august House to do whatever it takes to protect our Constitution and we must not allow anybody to mess up our country and I hope that they do not get it right to destroy and get rid of the good intentions of the NDP. Since 2009 the DA was on a let-us-fix-it mission and they have fixed the Western Cape after the ANC messed it up. I am glad to report that nothing is broken in the Western Cape. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, the ANC. Hon member Mr Tyatyam.

Mr S G TYATYAM: The ANC calls on the Hawks to investigate the crimes committed under the DA Provincial Government of the Western Cape. Not long ago all were in shock to learn that the final findings of the Public Protector on the corruptive Western Cape communication contract deviated vastly from the preliminary findings, which raised substantial matters about the criminality and unlawful tender process taking place in this DA Government.

Under the direction of the Premier, Director-General Brent Gerber roped in amongst others DA deployed cronies Ryan Coetzee and Gavin David to join the tender panel as judges. [Interjections.]

The Premier promised to resign if the probe found that irregularities in the handling of the contract were there. [Interjections.] Four counts of maladministration were found. Of course the Premier retracted as she continues to retract on election promises, but the question is did she know that the final report of this investigator is going to change and did she know that this person is going to resign from the Public Protector and join her office?

'n AGBARE LID: Hoe nou?

Mr S G TYATYAM: Clearly where we are sitting a deal was made in hell that substantially changed the content of the preliminary report and where is the advocate today? She is working in the office of the Premier like many others in fact who have done that, some of them we know they work for the IEC. Now they are in the office of the Premier.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Tyatyam, your time has expired.

Mr S G TYATYAM: Thank you. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The DA, hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. The question of housing needs urgent attention in this country. We have 2.3 million South Africans who are on the housing National Database. Those are people who say “we need houses.” I tell you that the budget that has been set aside over the MTEF is R558 billion to build 1.5 million houses for people. The expectation created by the national government led by the ANC is that every person in South Africa will get a new house and that is a wrong expectation. [Interjections.]

That is a wrong expectation. You must go and tell people the truth, that you will never be able to give a house to everybody in this country. [Interjections.] In this province we get less than 3% of the amount that we require to build houses and we have provinces led by the ANC that are unable to deliver on the very huge budget that you allocate to them. The only sin that we have in this Western Cape is that the voters chose the DA Government over the corrupt ANC government. [Interjections.]

Mr R B LENTIT: A broken ANC.

Mr M MNQASELA: We need to fix this problem and go out and tell the citizens of this country that the ANC has failed to govern; that the ANC is not the ANC of Oliver Tambo; is not the ANC of Nelson Mandela, is not the ANC of Yusuf Dadoo, is not the ANC that liberated people in 1994 including us.

Mr R B LENTIT: They broke the ANC.

Mr M MNQASELA: This ANC is broke and corrupt to the core and we are going to fix the Western Cape and make sure that people do not suffer because they voted for us.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Mnqasela, your time has expired. The EFF.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Thank you Mr Deputy Speaker. This beautiful City of Cape Town must be the most racist city in South Africa. [Interjections.] Let me just mention three of the many daily occurrences. When it comes to violent racist attacks you will see it is always blacks who are on the receiving end.

On Thursday the 2<sup>nd</sup> of October Cynthia Joni had been walking from Harfield Road Station to the home of her employer when Tim Osrin drove towards her from the opposite direction, swerved to a halt, got out of his car and started assaulting her. His excuse was that he thought she was a sex worker. What is wrong with sex workers?

On Sunday the 9<sup>th</sup> of November, Muhammed Makungwa was confronted by a 55-year old white man while he was on his way to work in Rondebosch. The man attempted to knock Muhammed down. He then jumped out of his white BMW X5 and then started whipping Mohammed with a sjambok. The perpetrator's excuse was that he thought Mohammed broke into his car.

But here is a nice one: also on the 9<sup>th</sup> of November two white men got their just desserts for using the k-word. Simply issuing statements condemning these



occurrences is not enough. Talk is cheap, we need to do something concrete. You can start by sloganising your condemnation of racism, like you did with the spy tapes.

[Laughter.]

Furthermore, the Western Cape Government needs to embark on a campaign to undo the ongoing project of racism. This occurrence will not stop, not while you feel the blacks are mere refugees, prostitutes and thieves in their own land. You need to prioritise the empowerment of black people and you can start by reflecting that in the senior management of the departments in the Western Cape Government. This is your third term of governing this province, yes, your third term. The first being when many of you were still in the National Party in 1994. Yet, you have done very little to address the injustices of the past. You speak of reconciliation as a prerequisite for peace. You need to see justice as a prerequisite for reconciliation.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon member Mr Paulsen.

Mr M N PAULSEN: You need to end this state of denialism where the Western Cape...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just finish your sentence, your time has expired.

Mr M N PAULSEN: ...where the Western Cape Government refuses to accept their role in the perpetration of these crimes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M N PAULSEN: We as the Economic Freedom Fighters have chosen to fight for the restoration of the dignity of the African child. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Your time has expired now. The DA.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. In our dreamscape we are haunted by the magic mirror that reflects the past, present and future of human society in our province. What drives us is the hope we are giving to the Western Cape population.

My mother passed away when I was five years old. My grandmother who was unemployed raised me and my two brothers. She was allocated four hectares of ploughing land. She ploughed and planted herself. Her harvesting secured for us 80 kilograms of mealie-meal monthly for the whole year, along with morogo which was sun-dried and stored for winter season when there is no fresh morogo. Our mud house with a pit toilet was the only home we had. One of our daily chores was fetching water at the dam. We never lost hope, because we had someone who took the responsibility to be the voice of reason, our guardian and above all our role model. She instilled in us the importance of education even though we had no clothes or shoes that were needed to go to school.

Now the question is, are our moral compasses turned towards communities we serve? The Western Cape Government together with the private sector make it possible for people to change their lives. People are empowered to change their living conditions

and improve their lives, guidance on how to bring about that real change is provided.

I would like to thank the Western Cape for placing people first and delivering services to all. DA-led government in the Western Cape has truly showcased again in the annual reports that it is the only hope to the people of the province and the country by creating an opportunity society for all. The only thing remaining is to workshop the national ANC government to have their moral compasses adjusted to the right direction, as it is now lost. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, the ANC. Hon member Mr Magaxa.

Mr K E MAGAXA: Mr Deputy Speaker, the shameful illegal evictions and breaking down of 233 dwellings in Nomzamo where many people without any alternative to stay were cold-bloodedly thrown out of in an icy pouring winter rainstorm ...  
[Interjection.]

The PREMIER: What about Tshwane, what about Cato Crest?

Mr K E MAGAXA: ...in June this year on the instance of and directed by the City of Cape Town is an indictment against the DA. This is also the finding of the Lwandle Commission of Inquiry.

The heartless DA-led Cape Metro Municipality actively assisted to abuse a restraining court order that prevents land invasion and presented this as an automatic eviction order to by stealth forcefully manhandle poor people, shoot at them and indignantly

destroyed their meagre worldly possession. Babies, school children and women were left out in the open in the harshest of conditions that caused a massive humanitarian outcry. The City also denied them emergency shelter for the night in a community hall.

The PREMIER: Rubbish man.

Mr K E MAGAXA: What is even more disconcerting is that both the City and Provincial Government did not take the Commission and the poor seriously enough. It refused to under oath be tested at the hearings on the claims it made in a written presentation. The DA has peddled many lies in its efforts to shift the blame. No shred of evidence exists to substantiate the DA's fabrication that the Ses'khona human rights group was behind the occupation. It was all lies and left the demonising DA unmasked as the corrupt liars that they are!

The ANC calls on all spheres of government and agencies to implement the recommendations soonest and people not to illegally occupy land, even if they are desperate.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Mr Deputy Speaker, the protection of human rights is of paramount importance in any democracy. The DA believes in an open opportunity society or all and while evidently the national ANC government is closing the doors of opportunity for the vulnerable in South Africa. Earlier this year, the national Department of

Labour announced a cut on its subsidy to the Institute for the Blind in Worcester. Seven of the Institute's workshops provided employment to over 280 partially sighted and blind people. This is not only cutting funding to an organisation catering to visually impaired individuals but also robbing the vulnerable of their independence in being self-sufficient and shutting the door of opportunity for people in the Western Cape.

The National Basic Education Department also said that nearly 16 000 Kuruman school pupils will have to repeat their grades next year. These pupils, including 462 matriculants were negatively affected by protest action against the ANC government to tar a stretch of road. This is unacceptable. Children have the right to education and the ANC's lack of service delivery is violating this fundamental human right. [Interjections.]

I encourage the ANC members present today to liaise with their national counterparts to protect, not hinder, the human rights of our people. I encourage them to use the DA led Western Cape Government as an example. I urge them to join the DA in commending Minister Fritz and his department for their swift reaction to the alleged abuse of the elderly in the Western Cape. This personifies the DA's vision to create an open opportunity society for all so that people can live lives they value. The question remains, how long would the vulnerable have to suffer in other provinces under the national ANC government?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Ms Botha, your time has expired.

Ms L J BOTHA: I thank you. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The ACDP. The ANC, the ANC, hon member Ms Gillion.

Ms M N GILLION: Mr Deputy Speaker, the DA seems to be blind and deaf-mute as the arbitrary and constructive evictions of poor farm workers continue unabated. The vulnerable labourers and farm dwellers have nowhere else to go and suffer under extremely severe work and living conditions.

The DA does not care one bit that these people are left next to main roads or land up in the squalor of informal settlements. In fact this DA Government of the Western Cape effectively partner with and defends too many landowners in their continued abuse of workers. The ANC takes this issue extremely serious... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: How many charges have you laid?

Ms M N GILLION: ...of the evictions in bad faith ... [Interjection.]

Mr M G E WILEY: How many charges have you laid?

Ms M N GILLION: Like in Wellington recently.

An HON MEMBER: Where?

Ms M N GILLION: And the unfair or inequitable treatment of workers as well as

abuse as it does not make moral or economic sense.

Mr M G E WILEY: Sorry, did you make [Inaudible.]

Ms M N GILLION: The ANC therefore thanks the Deputy President Cyril Ramaphosa and a senior government delegation that came to the Western Cape to meet all role players in the agriculture industry. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms M N GILLION: The ANC endorses the outcomes of this summit to cease all evictions in order for negotiations to take place and for all role players to find solutions to stabilise the sector. [Interjections.]

If farmers do not voluntarily stop evictions or victimising workers the ANC says national Cabinet should formalise a legal enforceable moratorium. The ANC also calls for the full participation ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Just continue, just finish off. Your time has expired.

Ms M N GILLION: ...it is finished now. The ANC also calls for the full participation of all citizens in the economy of this province as less than one percent of land had been transformed to date. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Gillion your time has expired. The DA.

Hon member Ms Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Thank you. Mr Deputy Speaker, Finance Minister Nhlanhla Nene's medium term budget takes R30 million away from police detectives and allocates it instead to VIP security. [Interjections.]

This is a slap in the face for victims of crime. For every citizen that has been a victim of crime and whose matter was not properly investigated because their detective was overburdened with cases; for every family member whose loved one was murdered where in eight out of ten murders in the Western Cape no-one was convicted for taking their life; for every woman who has been raped and is forced to see the perpetrator continue living in her community; for every family that lives in fear because their homes have been violated, this budget reprioritisation is a slap in the face.

The ANC government is taking money away from detectives and investigations to instead protect politicians in what is one of the world's largest cabinets. Detectives work with preposterous case loads of between 100 and 150 cases each, when they should be working with 20. There is simply no justifiable reason to prioritise VIP security over funding detectives and prosecuting the real and devastating crimes in our communities.

It is clear that the ANC government prioritises looking after itself rather than looking after its citizens. The Democratic Alliance calls for a cap on VIP protection expenditure to limit the extent of President Zuma's bloated Cabinet consuming ever



increasing police resources intended to benefit the vulnerable. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. That is the end of member's statements.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We now move on to motions. Are there any motions where notice is given? Hon member Mr Dugmore.

### **MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

Mr C M DUGMORE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That this House debates the intention of the DA City of Cape Town to evict more than 30 families from South Road community to make way for the proposed MyCiti route, which proposal has not been consulted with residents from the affected Plumstead and Wynberg areas and further considers the ANC's call that eviction notices be withdrawn; that a public meeting be convened with the affected communities and that a task team, which is an inclusive one, be established to explore alternatives to the MyCiti route as proposed by the City.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice is taken. Any further, hon member Ms Wenger?

Ms M M WENGER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates community responses to improve safety, as safety is everyone's concern and everyone's responsibility.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Ms Du Toit Marais.

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the Western Cape as a preferred health destination.

*[Notice of motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Hon member Ms Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House urgently debates the many denials of blood dialysis to critical or terminal kidney patients by this Western Cape Provincial Government.

*[Notice of motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Are there any further? We then come to motions without notice.

Can I just say before we get to the point, can I just give some guidance. [Interjections.] Is that under the next heading, under my notice? Ja. Can I just refer to the previous sitting? The procedures applied by the Chair at the previous sitting - the Chair was myself - during the period of motions caused some confusion. The Chair took the view of the Chief Whip of the two parties as the definitive party views while it was possible that individual members may have had a different view on a motion. That caused the confusion.

The rules provide that a motion may be moved without notice provided “it is dispensed of with unanimous concurrence of all the members present.” That is Rule 146(F).

The Chair will therefore in future apply that rule strictly. In practice it will mean that a motion will not be allowed to be moved without notice if any member, and not only the Chief Whips, objects. Any individual member therefore has the right to object to a motion being moved without notice. The effect of such an objection is that the motion will be printed in full on the next Order Paper. I trust that will assist the House.

## **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Then I see the hon member Mr Mackenzie first.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House expresses our sincere condolences to the family and friends of the late great Tinus Linee, a former centre who played nine tour matches for the Springboks between 1993 and 1994 and 112 matches for the Western Province between 1992 and 2001 and he was a member of the 1997, 2000 and the 2001 Currie Cup-winning Western Province team.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice?

No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen first, I saw him first. Hon member Mr Paulsen, I saw you first.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House pays tribute to 23 year old Sandiso Makamba-Botya gunned down in Ilitha Park on 25 October and Anita Williams gunned down on 1 November in KTC, Z Memani Street and to the thousands of blacks who suffer the same fate: no arrests; no identikits; no rewards. Anita's funeral will be this Saturday, 15 November in Gugulethu 103.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice?

No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the senseless murder of Bafana-Bafana soccer captain and Orlando Pirates goalkeeper Senzo Meyiwa on 26 October 2014 and commiserates with his family, friends, comrades and followers across our country on his untimely death.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice?

No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House moves to congratulate the global winners of the Responsible Tourism Awards held recently at the World Travel Market, London; the V & A Waterfront as Best Destination Gold Award and Hotel Verde as the Best City Hotel in the world.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice?  
No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House sympathises with the family, friends and comrades of world 800 metre and Commonwealth champion and Olympic silver medallist Mbulaeni Mulaudzi's premature death in a car accident on 24 October 2014.  
(Not August)

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice?

No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates the Municipality of Bergrivier for winning the 2014 Greenest Municipality Competition and also for receiving a certificate of Outstanding Achievement for their Climate Change Response.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice?

No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon member Ms Du Toit Marais. She has been trying for a long time.

Ms A J DU TOIT MARAIS: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulates the Western Cape Department of Health for improving service delivery and increasing wellness as they officially opened a new Psychiatric Ward as well as a Family Medicine Ward at George Hospital on 24 October 2014.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice?  
No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns and notes with sadness the murder of Zithobile Mthandeki, current affairs presenter of Radio Zibonele who was shot on 7 October 2014 outside his house in Site C as well as conveys heartfelt condolences to his wife, family and the entire community of Khayelitsha.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice?  
No objection to the motion itself?



Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Wenger.

Ms M M WENGER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Western Cape Police Service for taking action against alleged corruption at the Parow Police Station and for arresting ten officers implicated in fraud and corruption last week

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice?

No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House commends the Minister of Education, Debbie Schäfer and her Department for their support to special needs education in the Western Cape as illustrated by her visit to the Pioneer School for the visually impaired in

Worcester last month. This is indicative of the WCED's commitment to inclusive education in the Western Cape.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice?

No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House conveys its condolences to the family, friends, comrades and boxing supporters of Phindile "Zulu Girl" Mwelase who died on 25 October 2014 of bleeding on the brain after being knocked out in a match on 10 October 2014 and never regaining consciousness.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice?

No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Schäfer.

Ms B A SCHÄFER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House congratulate Jerome Thomas, general manager at Kanonkop Wine Estate, Stellenbosch, named as the Western Cape Farm Worker of the Year 2014.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The PREMIER: Mooi! [Applous.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice?

No objection to the motion itself?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen?

Mr M N PAULSEN: I object to that motion.

An HON MEMBER: Oh nonsense!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Do you object?

Mr M N PAULSEN: I object to that yes. We are not just [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! Order! If you object, you object; then the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Do you want to move your own motion?

Mr M N PAULSEN: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please continue.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House, following the series of racial attacks in Cape Town in the past few weeks, recommend that the Western Cape Government collectively work on a programme or campaign that will uproot the historical sense of entitlement whites have to specific physical spaces and social status bestowed on them based solely on their skin colour.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

Ms B S SCHÄFER: I object.

An HON MEMBER: Objection. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order! There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the hon member Mr Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the nine Western Cape teachers who received excellence awards at the 15th Annual Western Cape Provincial Teaching Awards held on Friday 7 November 2014. The excellence and high levels of professionalism of these teachers most certainly contribute to the provision of quality education to the learners of the Western Cape.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice?

No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Wenger first and then I will see hon member Ms Makeleni after that.

Ms M M WENGER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the South African Animal Sanctuary Alliance (SAASA), which includes Birds of Eden, Monkey Land and Jukani Wildlife Sanctuary in Bitou for receiving the SKAL Award in Mexico City on 26 October for the World's Best Animal Attraction. Furthermore, last week on 5

November the SAASA was declared the winner of the World Responsible Tourism Award for the Best Animal Welfare Initiative at the World Travel market in London. Local attractions such as these not only promote tourism to the Western Cape and the Garden Route... ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Ms Wenger, you are not allowed to motivate. You must put the motion.

Ms M M WENGER: Okay, alright.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We have heard your motion. Is there any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House sympathises with the family, friends, comrades and followers of the former Kaizer Chiefs soccer striker Valdez “Shaka” Ngcobo who died at the age of 64 after cardiac arrest on 1 November 2014.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice?

No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Gopie, I am seeing you now.

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the noble and dedicated efforts by Durbanville doctor Thandeka Mayekiso who was the sole physician for four days saving lives of victims of the church building collapsed in Nigeria, whilst she was not even on duty.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice?

No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the Paulus Joubert High School for their collective effort with community members and *alumni* to create an enabling environment for learners in Paarl who would not otherwise have the opportunity to reach their full potential through mentorship, adoption, building self-esteem, positive self-concept and integrity.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice?

No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Paulsen.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House re-investigates the case of five construction companies who committed billions of rands worth of corruption, only to get off with a slap on the wrist. Furthermore we demand that Zuma pays back the money.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: [Interjections.] Order! Order! The second one is not part of



the initial motion, so that one will not be moved now. [Interjections.] I put the first motion, no objection? Is there an objection? No objection?

Agreed to.

An HON MEMBER: No, that is wrong.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry? [Interjections.] Who objected? [Interjections.]

Mr P UYS: What section of it is carried?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Oh, the one about Nkandla or Zuma is not part of the original one. I am talking [Interjections.] Will you please read the first part again? We missed that. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Everything.

An HON MEMBER: You can give both.

Mr M N PAULSEN: Okay, the first one: I move without notice:

That the House re-investigates the case of five construction companies who committed billions of rands worth of corruption, only to get off with a slap on the wrist.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there an objection to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Yes, there is. It is quite subjective and it cannot be without notice. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It will be printed on the Order Paper.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see the hon member Ms Gillion.

Me M N GILLION: Mnr die Adjunkspeaker, ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat die Huis kennis neem van hierdie DA-beheerde regering se vals gespog met Doringbaai se perlemoen-inisiatief sonder om 'n sent self daarin te belê en die gevolglike skandalige afwesigheid vandag met die amptelike bekendstelling van die goeie nuus ANC-storie deur vier nasionale departemente, wat ook die Presidensie insluit.

*[Voorstel soos deur lid voorgestel.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Is daar enige beswaar teen die voorstel sonder kennis? Daar is beswaar. It will be printed on the Order Paper.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Wiley.

Mr M G E WILEY: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Premier on winning the prestigious Friedrich-Naumann-Stiftung Freedom Award, presented recently in Germany, for her efforts to uphold democracy and promote freedom in South Africa.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any further, hon member Ms Lekker.  
[Interjections.] Hon member Ms Lekker you may proceed.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commiserates with the families and the school, Luhlaza High School, after the tragic death of two Grade 12 pupils Bukhosibethu Tywaku, 18 years old, and Odwa Macuphe, 18 years old as well, who drowned in a pool while swimming during the matric preparation camp in Strandfontein.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice?

No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: Mr Deputy Speaker, it is not a motion. [Laughter.] If you will allow me ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Order, Chair.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Kivedo.

Mr B D KIVEDO: If you allow me, I think it is a sad day in our country's history when somebody is being awarded for fostering peace in this country ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order!

Mr B D KIVEDO: ...and it is being rejected.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Kivedo. That is not a motion. We are busy with motions at the moment.

Mr B D KIVEDO: I know, but I just felt I had to make this point.

An HON MEMBER: Objection, Chairperson.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Mr Kivedo. You are out of order.

Mr B D KIVEDO: You can object as long as you wish ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection Chairperson. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Mr Kivedo.

An HON MEMBER: Objection Chair. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are out of order on this point. I see the hon member Mr Olivier.

Mr R T OLIVIER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns with strongest contempt the onslaught on the Uitsig High School learner Justin Langley of Elsies River who was attacked with an axe and knives by a group of young criminals on Sunday 9 November 2014 and that this House should convey its heartfelt condolences to his mother, Bridgette Langley, family and friends, the school and the entire community.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice?

No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Makeleni.

Ms P MAKELENI: Thank you, Mr Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House in celebrating Disability Month acknowledges paralympian, Lucas Sithole, the reigning US tennis champion, who recently released a Maskandi album as a tribute to his late father and against the prevalent political violence; that the House recognises this giant's inspirational character and his ability to show what is possible despite his perceived disability.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objection to the motion being moved without notice?

No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Mr Mnqasela.

Mr M MNQASELA: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That this House extends condolences to the wife, children, family and friends of Thomas Petersen, Oom Tom, as he is fondly known, who died two weeks ago. Uncle Tom, as he was fondly known, was born and raised in Hawston, and a member of the Griqua Tribe. He was also a pastor in the ACTS Mission Church in that town. Uncle Tom was a DA activist who served his community and the DA since 2000. May his soul rest in peace.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Ms Gopie.

Ms D GOPIE: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House forms an *ad hoc* committee consisting of a multiparty delegation of members together with external experts to investigate the present umpteenth serious shortage of vital medicine in the Western Cape Province as well as inferior service delivery to poor areas.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself? [Interjections.] Is there an objection? There is an objection. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Are there any further, hon member Ms Lekker?

Ms P Z LEKKER: Mr Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commiserates with the family, friends and community of Nyanga after the murder of 30-year old Ayanda Bebe who was killed on Monday, out of the blue shot by gangsters.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection to the motion being moved without notice? No objection to the motion itself?

Agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any further? Are we done? That then brings us to the end of business for the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 18:25.



