

---

THURSDAY, 10 NOVEMBER 2022

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The SPEAKER: You may all be seated. Thank you, hon members, distinguished guests, our visitors here, the people of the Western Cape. You are reminded that we are in a hybrid session of this Parliament and of course it is important for those who are visitors to understand that if you are a guest you are either here in the Chamber or you are in the virtual platform and you do not participate in the proceedings of this Parliament. You are an observer and therefore as an important visitor we appreciate you as a guest. Also important is the conduct of visitors, do not press your microphone online and do not activate your camera. For the hon members that are here with me in the Chamber, I would like to indicate to you, hon members, that do not join

the virtual session because you are in this hybrid venue. So because you are here, you do not have to necessarily be on the other platform, and that is in terms of Rule 40 to avoid disruptions which could hinder the ability for members, who are in the virtual platform, to engage in a much more productive way.

Finally, I would like to request that if you are here with us in the Chamber in the gallery, I know it can be at times exciting and you might be tempted to † ‘n handeklap, asseblief, [a clapping of hands,] but please do not, because if you want to clap hands, you are not allowed to because this is the House of Parliament.

Let me, before we begin with our programme, which is with our Order of the Day, indicate to the hon members that in the gallery, as you look up there, we have special guests and these are the guests from a school that I visited recently and it is the Breede Valley School of Skills, and those who live in the Breede River Valley Municipality will say they know that school in the Cape Winelands. I visited them recently and I invited them to come see us here today as the hon members. What is so special about them being here today is that this is a school that focuses on learners with special needs and it sends a message, it sends a strong message that this Parliament is a Parliament that is inclusive, a Parliament of all people, but a Parliament, of course, because they are in the *platteland*, that does not see itself as a Parliament of only for those people who live in Cape Town, because the *platteland* equally deserves to be in this Parliament. That is why we are all

from all the corners of this province.

Hon members, these are learners with special needs and they live with some form or more of disabilities and one of the most important things is, a disability is not something that shows that you are unable, you are incapable; it shows that there are some limitations but they, as part of an inclusive society, belong here equally like any other child in this province and in this country.

Can you please, hon members, kindly join me in welcoming Mr Syce, the principal of the school and the teachers that are up there, together with all the learners that are here, to this Provincial Parliament. Thank you. [Applause.]

Some of them said to me they have never been into an elevator. Ja. They said they have never – 2022. Some, they have never been on the sixth floor in an elevated building, let alone being in Cape Town. We really have a lot to do, but that is why we are here.

Thank you, hon members, the Order of the Day is the Interpellations followed by the Questions to the Premier without Notice and then there is Members' Statements. May I then at this point, with the first interpellation by hon Makamba-Botya to the Leader of Government Business, the Minister of Agriculture, Dr Ivan Meyer, and request the hon Minister to take the stand. Hon Minister.

## BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

### INTERPELLATIONS

#### *Transformation of Agricultural Sector*

**1. Mr N Makamba–Botya asked the Minister of Agriculture:**

- (a) How many black people has his Department assisted in acquiring or owning farms in the province since he assumed office and
- (b) What has he and his Department done to transform the agricultural sector in the province in order to represent the racial demographics of South Africa at large?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker, and to the learners in the House and the educators and the principal, thank you for joining us in one of the best well run functional parliaments in South Africa.

†n AGBARE LID: Sê vir haar!

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[An HON MEMBER: Tell her!]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, in terms of this interpellation from hon Makamba-Botya, she is fully aware that it is the function and the responsibility of the National Government and the Minister of the Department of Land Reform and Agriculture and Rural Development to allocate land for black farmers. Hon Speaker, we also know that the Government is failing black people in this province... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Your Government, your Government!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ...because they are not allocating land to black people. I have looked at the budget of the National Government for land reform in this province. Hon Speaker, you cannot buy – do proper land reform when your local National Department based in this province for land reform has only a budget of R20 million rand. You can absolutely do no land reform. [Interjections.] If you want to show me... [Interjections.]

If you want to show me your policy, if you want to show me your policy, show me your budget. No budget, no policy. It is absolutely a disgrace that this ANC Government is neglecting black people in South Africa. In fact, and when a black person gets a farm, he gets evicted by the black National ANC Government. This is what they are doing, so they have absolutely total disrespect for black farmers. They do not allocate land and if they do allocate land, hon Speaker, they do allocate the land to their own comrades, MK veterans and we have stopped it. We will not allow ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: We will not allow the ANC to abuse people in this province. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, will you please take your seat. [Interjections.]  
Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.]  
Order, hon members, there is a member on the floor, and that is hon Lili who would like to ask a question.

Mr A LILI: Thank you very much, Speaker. No, my question to the Minister is that is he going to maybe... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: I thought you wanted to raise a point of order?

Mr A LILI: Oh, because of this, there are too many loud speakers. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Speaker, on a point of order!

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister. [Interjections.] Hon members, how long have we not been seeing each other? It seems we have missed each other so much. You know what you must do, nè, because I see that we have missed each other. When we arrive we must have a moment for hugs and kisses. [Interjections.] Then it is not going to be like this, because hon Lili rises on

no point for support whatsoever, but, you know, he just wanted to be noticed by the hon Minister, so hon Minister, please proceed.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: I miss hon member Bakubaku-Vos. [Interjections.] I declare my love for her. [Interjections.]

†Die WAARNEMENDE HOOFSWEEP (DA): Ja, aitsa! [Tussenwerpsels.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes, hallo! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Speaker in this House we love each other. That is why we have this debate. You must not think there is hatred in this House. It is because of love that we differ, have different viewpoints, but we do not hate each other.

Hon Speaker, there is something fundamentally wrong in South Africa and this is that land reform has no budget. Your policies are measured against your budget and when the ruling party is allocating land to... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: What about your budget, you are talking about... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: My budget is extensive. [Interjection.]

My budget is extensive. In fact, we have done a study, hon Speaker. We have looked at land reform in South Africa, in the ANC National Government 90% failure, only 10% success; in the Western Cape, 72% success. That is the difference in terms of land reform and I am proud of what this Government is doing but I am not going to sit here and allow the ANC to steal the land and allocate it to MK soldiers. I am not going to sit here with ANC former Members of Parliament being allocated land; it is not going to happen under my watch. I will stop it. I have stopped it already here in Malmesbury. [Interjections.] So the point is very clear, hon Speaker. I am getting clear.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: The ANC is failing on land reform. The DA is making a big success in terms of land reform. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, thank you. †Baie dankie, agbare Minister. [Tussenwerpsels.] [Thank you, hon Minister [Interjections.]]

Order, hon members! Hon members, order! I now afford the opportunity to hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: †*Enkosi somlomo!* [Thank you very much], Speaker, and thanks to the hon Minister. I have actually, I was prepared for the response from the Minister because every time when we ask about land



transformation, we are always told that the Province has no powers and that its hands are tied and even now the Minister had just made mention that this is the function and the responsibility of the National Government. However, hon Speaker, Schedule 4 of the South African Constitution provides a functional area of concurrent national and legislative competence. Agriculture is one sector that falls under this concurrent competency of both national and provincial government. Moreover, *Somlomo*, Section 40 of the Constitution provides for cooperative governance, whilst Section 41 makes it mandatory that various spheres of government must assist and support one another. Furthermore, these spheres are mandated to consult and inform one another on matters of common interest.

Hon Speaker, these provisions I just mentioned above, provide avenues for the National Government and the Department of the Minister to work together in making sure that the agricultural sector in this province is transformed. So if this Department had even the slightest interest in transforming the agricultural sector in this province, to provide agricultural land to emerging black farmers, you will be engaging the National Government Minister from time to time for that purpose. This thing of thinking that Western Cape does not need the National Government and can be independent on its own should come to an end, because it is not on.

In 2018, hon Speaker, the National Government established an Agricultural State Land Allocation Project. Under this project instructions were issued for the establishment of vacant and underutilised farms. Provinces were also

engaged in this project to assist in identifying vacant and underutilised funds so that provisions can be made for those funds to either be leased or acquired for purposes of redistribution or turning them into productive use. One of the reasons why the provinces were engaged in this project, hon Speaker, was because they knew their surroundings better and this was also an opportunity for them to work together with the National Government on what one would expect to be a matter of common interest. Generally, there was cooperation under this projected project by the majority of provinces. Some provinces were not really cooperative, for example, when it came to the issue of identifying underutilised farms and to check whether there were any agricultural activities going on, some agricultural provincial departments just came back with the response that funds are occupied. The question was never whether the farms were occupied or not, it was whether they were utilised or under-utilised.

Now, because of this difficulty and lack of cooperation, this forced the National Government to initiate the Land Rights [Inaudible.] process, which now caused further delays.

Now, *somlomo*, lastly, I just want to know whether there was any initiative that the Minister has made an engagement with the National Government to specify specifically to make sure that there is transformation in the Western Cape agricultural sector. Thank you, *somlomo*.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon members, I now recognise hon Van der

Westhuizen. †Agbare. Agbare Van der Westhuizen, is hy daar? [Honourable. Hon Van der Westhuizen, is he there?]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: [No audible reply.]

The SPEAKER: Hon, the Deputy Chief Whip of the DA?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Chairperson, my suspicion is member Van der Westhuizen is also in the NCOP at the exact same time on a debate on land reform, but I will liaise with the Table staff in this regard.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon, the Acting Chief Whip of the Majority Party. May I then at this point request hon Marran to address the House?

Mr P MARRAN: Thank you, Speaker, and good afternoon everyone present. [Interjections.] Speaker, it is no secret that agriculture and agri-processing sectors are part of the key economic sectors of the Western Cape with an 8% contribution towards the Province's economy as per the latest PERO, but we must also examine the details where the devil is, and inquire who dominates these sectors.

Statistics provided by the South African Institute of Race Relations in 2018 illustrates that nearly 71% of urban land belongs to whites. Nearly 11% is owned by Coloureds, while 8% is owned by Indians and Africans owning only 3.5% of land in the Western Cape.

The Western Cape Government unfortunately once again throws hands up in the air and shouts that this responsibility making land available lies with National Government. When MEC Meyer was asked the question about the racial patterns and title deeds, he and his Department referred the ANC to the National Deeds Office.

According to the 2021 Western Cape Agricultural Sector Profile, the total value of agricultural exports in 2020 was R45,8 billion and yet this MEC cannot account how much the black farmers contributed to these figures.

The MEC and his Department do not find such data important, and yet, the Premier is always insisting on data and being scientific.

Now as we have heard, the MEC does not provide such data and therefore he and his Department pay lip service to the sustainability of agriculture and aquaculture sectors. Hence, there was an instruction that the Casidra notice, it was an instruction by MEC Meyer that a Casidra notice advertising funding for African, Coloured and Indian farmers during COVID-19 and funding provided by National Government, be withdrawn, because the MEC insisted whites must be included. In some areas, though, the Provincial Government does not throw its hands up in the air, as you all know, police is not a provincial function, and yet this Government... [Interjection.]

†Die SPEAKER: Agbare Marran, ek is baie jammer, jou tyd is weg, meneer!  
[The Speaker: Hon Marran, I'm very sorry, your time is gone, sir!] There is

no more time.

Mr P MARRAN: Speaker, is that two minutes?

The SPEAKER: Yes. I see you did not see that it is two; it is not three, because three minutes is for the member who asked the question.

Mr P MARRAN: It cannot be.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marran. Yes. I even gave you one or two seconds extra. [Interjection.] Hon members, order! [Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Hon, the Acting Chief Whip?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Speaker. Due to the toggling between the NCOP and the WCPP the delegate is here. I wanted to ask if it is possible for member Van der Westhuizen to take the slot after member Marran?

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Order, hon members!

An HON MEMBER: He is here.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order! Order, hon members! I now afford the opportunity to hon Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, hon Speaker and my apologies for having to run between these two Houses. In 1971 the Sectional Titles Act ushered in a new era in home ownership in South Africa. The Act provided for the division of buildings into sections. [Interjections.] Is it a declaration?

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Apology, my apology.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon Van der Westhuizen, do you have the speech for this one?

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: My apologies, Speaker, my apologies.

The SPEAKER: Yes, okay, you may proceed. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! Excuse me, hon Van der Westhuizen. Hon members, we all have those moments. There was once a member who read the motion, a different motion on a wrong motion. I forgave that member from some other side on the other side of the House, so let me give the opportunity when the hon member from the other side does the same thing. Please hon Van der Westhuizen, you may proceed.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you. Hon Speaker, the debate this afternoon in the NCOP is on land reform and I am very proud to say that in

the Western Cape we have a much higher success rate in terms of land reform than in the remainder of the country. Two studies done in 2014 and in 2019 showed that the Western Cape was making good progress with our success rate in the land reform sphere, improving from 64% success to 72% success. Mr Minister, I would like to know from you, what are in your mind the reasons why the Western Cape has got this much higher success rate in this regard. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. Thank you, hon Van der Westhuizen. Order, hon members? Order, hon members! There are a couple of other interpellations and there are Questions and there is still a lot in terms of our Business for the Day, I can assure you, there will be ample time to interface. May I now give an opportunity to hon Makamba-Botya?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Somlomo! Thank you very much. I so wish I could see the report that has been declared that the Western Cape has the highest success rate in land distribution, but my follow-up question, Somlomo, it is pertaining to the session, during the question and answer session that was held in 2020/21/22 Annual Reports on Agriculture, there was a concern raised that some suitable agricultural land in the province is being utilised for other purposes other than agriculture, for example, such as for the provision of housing and other developments. Now focusing on part of this land, which might be owned by either national, provincial or local government, what has this Department done to make sure that this land is acquired by the Provincial Government and land utilised for purposes of

farming that will benefit emerging black farmers or those black people who are interested to acquiring farms, either by owning them or leasing them.

In this case the role of the Provincial Department of Agriculture was not willing to buy the land using its own budget but to play a facilitating role between the Provincial Government and another sphere of government, owning that land in order to make sure that this land ends up being owned by the Province. The land can later be transferred to the Department of Agriculture by the Province for the purpose of land transformation. Now the question, *somlomo*, is that by now we know that the Department of Agriculture in this province spends millions of rands supporting farmers and farms through various activities such as making water available for the further support as well as through conditional grants of various natures. The Department also acknowledged that there is now a high dependence on grant funding from farmers. Now since we know that black farmers in this province represent a tiny percentage of those who own farms in this province, then this means that the bulk of this support goes to the majority of farmers who happen to be white and since this is a government support, this means that this money assisting these white farmers comes from the taxpayers money, so the question that I have, *somlomo*, as the Minister of Agriculture in this province, are you happy, Minister, that the majority of resources of this country through National Conditional Grants and those allocated to this Department are spent on the rich white minority group farmers / farm owners and not on the poor majority groups? Thank you, Chair.



The SPEAKER: †*Enkosi mancoba*. [Thank you very much.] Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker, for those who took part in this interpellation. I think hon member Makamba-Botya will appreciate that this Parliament respects the rule of law and that the outcomes of the judiciary, this Parliament believes in redress and transformation in agriculture is our business, it is my business. It is my agenda. We also appreciate that the previous court ruling made by the High Court indicated that the Western Cape in the case of Correctional Services, that the Western Cape demographics must be taken into consideration and not the national demographics.

Hon Speaker, in terms of grant funding, I think it is incorrect from the member to say that transformation for black farmers only is dependent on grant funding. It is incorrect, hon member. It is... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister, will you kindly take your seat? Is that a point of order, hon the Deputy Chief Whip of the ANC?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, it is a question, I would like to know if the hon MEC... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: No-no-no! No-no-no.

Mr P MARRAN: It is not a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, please take your seat. As a matter of fact, sorry, hon Minister, please take your seat, hon Minister. Hon Minister, will you please take your seat?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: I will take a question during tea-time.  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, what I would like to address with the hon members, I am seeing there is a trend, but let us stop this trend so that it has not become a custom in the House. There is always an opportunity and I guess it is a temptation when you rise, you want to ask that question, but what it does is that you will be sitting here and people will do that. So let us do it differently. You rise, fortunately you are the Deputy Chief Whip, hon Sayed, so you will help me to implement the Rules. Let us make sure that when you arise, before you say anything there is an opportunity that has been granted by the other side to ask that question, which is the member that is on the floor. I know that you do know that and all of us do, but I want to avoid us having a situation where it just becomes a custom. I think I have been noticing from time to time it happens from the House.

Hon Minister, we paused your time so you may proceed. Let me just bring it to your attention, you have used one minute, now you have three minutes to go.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker. I think it is important to note that the honourable member is correct. We cannot simply rely on grant funding to facilitate land reform in the Western Cape but anyway in South Africa. That is why I welcome the initiative by HortFin and last week I attended a function where HortFin, supported by HortGro, the industry, as well as by FNB Bank, as well as by the National Treasury through the Jobs Fund, have made a substantive amount of money together with my Department, available to fast-track and support land reform through proper mentoring, through proper partnership, I am also very happy that the National Minister has now publicly acknowledged the role that is being played by PALS which is a very effective Partnership in Agriculture Land Solutions, it is now a national model developed in Witzenberg and we support them as well. They are doing outstanding work.

In addition to that, hon members, and to the learners in the House and those online, my Department is right now busy with a program to develop 50 black commercial farmers, because I want export farmers, I want big farmers and so for me it is important that we understand that commercial farmers are important... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister. Will you please take your seat? I am again going to pause this. †Agbare Marais, [Hon Marais,] is that a point of order, †meneer [sir] will you please face your microphone?

Mr P J MARAIS: I just want to ask, will the Minister answer a question on

what he just said about black farmers?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais; I see your microphone was off. [Interjection.] Okay, thank you. Hon Minister, will you take the question? [Interjection.] You see, what I was stopping, what I was trying to achieve here, the same thing that I have just addressed, hon Marais rises, he does not want to – he does not ask whether he can ask the question, he asks the question. Now I want to assist the hon members so that we do not make this a custom, †agbare [hon] Marais. Now you have already asked the question, but ordinarily you ask whether you can ask the question, that is what the Rule says.

Now if the hon members want to change the Rules, I am happy, but then let us change the Rules to say that. I am trying to assist the House because you have elected me as your Speaker, you have not removed me yet, so let us please... [Interjection.] Do not tamper with the Rules. The Rules are clear. [Interjections.] The Rules are clear. Do not tamper with the Rules, right?

Now I am going to ask the Minister, hon Minister, would you like to respond to that question. [Interjections.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): The member was never here.

Mr P MARRAN: It is a national competency.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, out of respect for the senior member of the House I will take the question.

Mr P J MARAIS: I thank you, Minister, the gentleman you are. You said that you mentioned black farmers. Now there are some people who say: "we are all black, just because we are not white." Well, I am not black. I am a Coloured man, a Griqua. I want to know, can you tell me how much of that land that you said was given to blacks, actually were given to Coloured or whether it is Namaqua or whether it is Goringhaiqua or whether it is Khoi, he is not black, he is brown-skinned. How much of the land went to brown-skinned people?

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

Mr P J MARAIS: If you do not know brown-skinned you are not from South Africa. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Marais. Thank you. †Baie dankie, agbare.  
[Thank you, hon.] Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, this is an interpellation. I take that as a new question. I am happy to come to the House and to the Committee to give that statistical detail, but, hon member, I am particularly happy that the programme of black commercial farmers in the Western Cape

is on track. I am equally very happy, hon Speaker, that the question that was asked by hon member Makamba-Botya about the report, that report is available on the website. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: So she can study the report on the website.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister. There is another hand. Please take your seat. Hon, the Deputy Chief Whip of the ANC?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, I am rising on a point of order, just that that was not a new question; it is part and parcel of the topic of discussion from member Marais. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. Please take your seat, hon Minister. Hon Minister, you may please take your seat. [Interjections.] Let me – this is so nice. [Laughter] Hon members, the point that hon Sayed is making is correct but what is also important and correct is what the Minister said, that he, as part of the question that he is responding to and prepared for, that is a new dimension, which he will deal with post this matter as discussed today, so it is not a matter of saying “we are not dealing with Agriculture”, but it says: the specificity is what they will come back to us and it is recorded in Hansard so that the Minister, the hon Minister responds to

†agbare [hon] Marais. Can we then proceed on those bases?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Yes, hon Speaker the sponsor...

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat again.

Mr M KAMA: No thank you, hon Speaker, I just want to understand you better. Are we getting a sense that you will then submit a reply to that because the understanding I am getting from him is that we will come back some other time in the House. Now there is a question that has been asked and I understand because of the detail that is required that he will come back, is what you are given that the Minister will come back and give us a written reply or perhaps refer to that question?

The SPEAKER: Yes, thank you, hon Kama. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! There is one Speaker here. Hon Lili, hon Marran, there is one Speaker here. Now what I am saying, which I have intimated upon, is that the hon Minister has made an undertaking in this House, not in a small village somewhere so what is important is that when – because Hansard is recorded, right, so the Minister has a responsibility to report to this House on what he made commitment on. So that goes without saying that the hon Minister says he will do that and he is nodding, saying yes. Now, hon Minister, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, the sponsor of this

debate...

The SPEAKER: You have now about 13 seconds to conclude.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: The sponsor of this debate asked for the reports for these land reform success evaluations. The reports are available on the website of this Government and my Department and she can read that report that confirms the relevance of the success of our land reform. Thank you, Chair.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Order, hon members, that concludes the first interpellation. The order is that you went over the 13 seconds. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Without any response from you.

The SPEAKER: [Laughter] Order, hon members. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, my next speech will be 13 seconds shorter.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: [Laughter] Order, hon members, we are now moving to the second interpellation by the hon Kama to the hon Minister Allen, the Minister



of Police Oversight and Community Safety. I now recognise the hon Minister.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair.

*(Crime Statistics)*

**2. Mr M Kama asked the Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety:**

With regard to the police-recorded crime statistics for the first quarter of the 2022/23 financial year (April to June 2022):

- (a) What contributed to the 7,3% increase in the serious crimes reported in the province and
- (b) how did the Western Cape Safety Plan influence the crime statistics for the year under review?

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:  
Good afternoon, Speaker, good afternoon to all the learners that are here. I feel that I want to apologise in advance that if you hear anything from the other side of the House today, that seems irrational, I want to apologise for that. Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members, order! [Interjections.] Okay, hon members, Minister, if you can just... [Interjections.] Hon members, if you

can just – Minister, if you can just take your seat?

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:  
May I continue?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just take your seat. Hon members, I have just sat down, so I have not seen whose hand is up first. Can I see... [Interjections.] Hon members, one minute! [Interjections.] Order! Order! I recognise your hand, I recognise your hand. I am going to allow hon Sayed to come up first. Then I will recognise you and then I will recognise you, in that order. [Interjection.] Hon members, order, please! Can I just hear what you want to say? [Interjections.] Order, members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you very much, and welcome to the Sitting.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just on a slight point of order to my hon friend, hon Allen, he is addressing the learners. The learners are members of the gallery. He is not supposed to speak to the members of the gallery. He speaks to them through the one who is chairing the Sitting. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: May I remind the Minister... [Interjections.]

Ms A P BANS: He must apologise!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, hon Marais. Order, members.

Mr P J MARAIS: The Minister is now – he is setting a precedent. Now I know some people are very, very excited when they have an audience in this House, but to address the audience directly is going to start a train of events here, because I will bring all the Freedom Front people and allow them to answer questions. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members. Hon Bosman, over to you.

Mr G BOSMAN: Good afternoon, hon Speaker. I rise on Rule 40 and I would like you to call hon Marais, hon Sayed and hon Lili to order. They may not interrupt the member while he is on the floor. I know member Lili spends more time in courtrooms, member Marais spends more time in public meetings and member Sayed is auditioning... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN: ...but please, hon Deputy Speaker, I ask that you call them to order. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, hon members, order! Hon Lili, hon Marran, if you can just sit down for a second, Minister. Hon Lili, okay. Hon

members, it does seem unusually loud today. If I can ask that we allow the Minister to start this interpellation or else we are going to be here till eight o'clock at night. If you would like to speak, please raise your hand and then I will recognise you. Can I – hon Marran, are you speaking?

Mr P MARRAN: Speaker, no Speaker, the Speaker asked us to turn up the volume.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I did not recall him saying that.

Mr P MARRAN: I am just saying, because you are saying that we are a bit loud. The Speaker asked us to turn up the volume.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, that is alright. I hear what you are saying. If I can now proceed to the formal Sitting, if I may, hon members. Over to you, Minister, you may proceed.

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: Hon Deputy Speaker, please allow me to apologise for speaking directly to participants in the gallery. Deputy Speaker, however, I will not apologise for spewing the following facts, because this interpellation I would want the residents of the Western Cape to be fully aware of. The interpellation indicated what contributed to the 7,3% increase in serious crimes reported in the province.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:  
Now Deputy Speaker, let me not apologise for this answer because sadly the question came from member Kama, who is no longer the permanent member on Community Safety and if the permanent member of Community Safety were to have informed member Kama with regard to an NCOP briefing, member Kama would have been aware that the 7,3% increase in crime categories that we have seen in our province is a direct result of National Government's failure to adequately resource the South African Police Services. Deputy Speaker, we live in a world where the South African Police Services have indicated two weeks ago that the ideal amount of offices what we need is 193 000. I am going to repeat again, 193 000 members are needed at station levels across our country. We currently only have 105 000. In 2010 the ideal number what we needed was 156 000, 2010. We had 126 000 members in 2010. So from 2010 up until now there has been a reduction in SAPS members but even more so the need has gone up. So this increase in crime is a direct result because SAPS is at a national level. SAPS is managed by the National Government. The problems in our country, when we consider our learners that are here today, Deputy Speaker, when they have issues with regard to Home Affairs, getting an ID, Home Affairs is a national competency. We always hear of the issues in Home Affairs.

The South African Police Services, all national competencies run by the National Government seem to be run into the ground. [Interjections.] So let

me answer the question even more directly. It is a direct result, through you, Deputy Speaker to member Kama, the increase is a direct result because due to a failure of fiscal choices that were made by National Government, wide-scale corruption and looting, we are 20 years behind in the fight against crime as a result of National Government... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:  
But there are even more reasons for the increase so besides National Government's failure, and our country being 20 years behind in the fight against crime, and that is why people are dying. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:  
And that is why people are dying. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: That is easy to say.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members!

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:  
Because our province has been cleared, Deputy Speaker, even I would beg the ANC in the Western Cape... [Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: People are dying!

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:  
Give the management and the powers of the South African Police Services to  
a capable government.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up.

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:  
It makes sense that SAPS is controlled closer to the people and choices are  
not made 1,500 kilometres away but we have seen ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Your time is unfortunately  
up. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:  
But we have seen the successes, we have seen the successes, Deputy Speaker,  
in that we live in a province... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:  
We live in a province, where ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Allen, your time is up.

The MINISTER FOR COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT:  
...where we have deployed LEAP officers. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thanks, hon Allen.

†Die MINISTER VAN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID EN POLISIE-OORSIG:  
Die waarheid maak seer, nou skree hulle en daar is 'n gesegde – laat ek maar  
nie die gesegde sê nie. [Tyd verstreke.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: The  
truth hurts, now they scream and there's a saying – let me rather not quote  
that saying. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, your time is up. Thank you very  
much. I now call on hon Kama. Hon Kama, I certainly hope that it will not  
be as noisy for you. [Interjection.] You may go, carry on.

Mr M KAMA: No, thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. This is really  
painful. The Western Cape Government's response to the 2022/23 First  
Quarter Crime Statistics is both disingenuous and misleading. While we  
acknowledge that great strides have been made in fighting crime and



commend SAPS and its partners, including the Department itself, we must quickly point out that there is nothing in the stats that suggests the need to devolve policing powers. This is just a DA campaign that has been long coming. It has nothing to do with the stats. [Interjections.]

If anything, that these stats shine the spotlight on the Provincial Government's failure, including not implementing fully the recommendations of the multi-million-rand Zille Commission as well as the poor implementation of the Winde plan, the Winde Safety Plan. Many of the masterminds... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, if you can just take your seat. Hon Minister, what is your point of order?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hon Deputy Speaker, I am rising on... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marran, we have somebody standing up.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Kama is misleading the House. There is no such thing as the Zille Commission so if he can please refer to the correct name. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kama, I cannot rule on that here, but can I just.... [Interjections.] Can I just, hon Minister... [Interjections.]

Minister, I understand, but you are welcome to mention that in your statement. Hon Kama, can I... [Interjections.] Hon members, can I just ask you to caution to what you will put here, that will be in Hansard. Okay. Please. [Interjections.] Hon members, I trust that we can move on. Hon Kama, you may proceed.

Mr M KAMA: No, there is a Zille Commission.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No-no, hon Kama, please take caution. Thank you. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: So, Deputy Speaker, many of the masterminds behind serious crimes like cash-in-transit and extortion-related multiple murders in the province, are graduates of the Vura and Vato gangs that terrorised the Cape Flats between 2012 and 2015 and that report that Zille commissioned, it did speak about this and it was not implemented. [Interjections.] This Provincial Government's refusal... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M KAMA: This Provincial Government's refusal to implement recommendation 12 of the Zille Commission has resulted in the 7,3 increase on the '17 community-reported serious crimes. It has resulted in murders of 994 people in the first quarter of 2022. It has resulted in a 2% increase

compared to the same period last year, as well as in 1,115 rape cases. Of the total 176 gangs in the country, 161 are from the Western Cape. The Western Cape has 10 stations in the top 30 murder precincts... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, please take your seat.

Mr M KAMA: More concerning is the rise in the murder rate in Nyanga and Lingeletu West Police Station.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kama, please take your seat. Over to you, Acting Chief Whip. What is your point of order?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Chair, in terms of Rule 40 and 42 I know that member Lili has not necessarily been in the House and Committee meetings for a long time but ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): I am trying to listen to member Kama, I cannot hear member Kama, Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No! Hon members, hon Lili, hon Lili, you cannot come in here and disrupt the House. I have someone standing. We need to provide, if somebody stands from either side we have to listen to them. Now I did not hear a word that the Deputy Chief Whip is saying, so I would

request that I be allowed to hear. Over to you, Deputy Chief Whip.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Deputy Speaker, I rise on Rule 40 and on Rule 42 dealing with both interruption and maintenance of order. I cannot hear member Kama when member Lili is also speaking in between. I would like to know what member Kama is saying. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. Hon members, I am going to use Rule 50 and Rule 50 basically states that in the event of grave disorder of a meeting, now I am cautioning, please, that we are allowed to debate in the way that we know how to debate so that everyone can be heard. I am struggling to hear hon Kama myself, so if I can just ask for some, for just some caution on how to interject. Over to you, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, just as a point of order, I think, Deputy Speaker, you are aware that from our side as the ANC we have requested that both the Speaker and yourself recuse yourselves from these sessions... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, please take your seat. That is not a point of order.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...and actually appoint a panel, one of the Chairpersons as honourable ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, please take your seat. That is not a point of order. [Interjection.] Take your seat. It is not a point of order. This is in the middle of an interpellation. Hon Kama is not able to complete his interpellation because he is being constantly disrupted. So it can be a choice, but we will disregard that because it has nothing to do with this interpellation. [Interjections.]

Hon members, if this continues I will have to adjourn the meeting until we have some order. Hon Kama, would you like to proceed? You may proceed.

Mr M KAMA: And lastly, just to show, Deputy Speaker, that the DA in the Western Cape is more concerned about politicking about crime.

†n AGBARE LID: Ja.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M KAMA: When Nyanga decreased in terms of statistics, they said it is because of them, they put up LEAP officers.

HON MEMBERS: Jo! Ja!

Mr M KAMA: We told them it is not. There is a stabilisation intervention by

SAPS that is happening in Nyanga. Now they decide that they are no longer to fund CPFs. The operation in Nyanga was disrupted and as a first time now there is an increase in the murder in Nyanga. In Lingelethu the increase is influenced by the environmental design happening there. Police complain over and over again that they do not have a conducive environment and that cannot be a responsibility of SAPS, it is a responsibility of this Government, but this Government does not care at all. What it cares about is to paint a picture that SAPS is failing so that they are given powers. The next thing they want to exit the country and be a country on their own.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up.

Mr M KAMA: So they are politicking and they must take it upon themselves... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: ...that the death of the people and especially the young kids in high school is in their hands as a government. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you very much. I now recognise hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker as the Commission of Inquiry into the Inefficiency of SAPS in the

Khayelitsha Area found, that Commission asked that the Provincial Government put together a Policing Priorities and Needs document and submit that document to SAPS. What I would like to know today from the Minister, through you, Deputy Speaker, has there been any response from either the National Minister of Police and there has been a few National Ministers. Has there been any response from the Provincial Commissioners? There has been more Provincial Commissioners than there have been spokespersons on Community Safety in this Parliament. Has there been any response to that? Can the Minister also perhaps highlight some of the successes of the LEAP Program? The Opposition tends to argue that the LEAP Program and the Safety Plan do not work... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN: But as Minister Cele heard yesterday in the NCOP... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr G BOSMAN: Minister Cele yesterday in the NCOP heard that the Western Cape actually has a Safety Plan, because the ANC nationally does not have a plan. [Interjections.] As the Minister heard yesterday... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr G BOSMAN: We know certain members do not like safety in this province because they are lawless, but we will continue through you, hon Deputy Speaker, to protect areas like Ward 39 in Nyanga, where most days the police – the first tyres to be slashed are that of the police officers. [Interjections.] So the spokesperson for Cultural Affairs and Sports of the ANC... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN: ...comes here today and tells us that we are not serious about safety. R400 million is enough to be serious, so, Deputy Speaker, through you, I would like to know if the Minister can perhaps share some of the lessons learnt from the LEAP deployment. If the Minister can perhaps educate some of our young lions on how this program is working. Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise hon August. Over to you, hon August. [Interjections.]

Mr S N AUGUST: Deputy Speaker, it is sad.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No wait! Just hang on one minute please. Hon Marran, are you accusing me – no, I have two Table Staff and the time is well within. Well, put your own watch on. I take advice from the Table Staff in front of me. I can see the clock right in front of me. Thank you very much,



you proceed, hon August.

Mr S N AUGUST: Deputy Speaker, it is sad to hear how we are politicking about children's fathers being murdered, women being raped, children are being murdered and we are politicking about the ANC, the National Government, the Provincial Government, yet people of the Western Cape are dying. Those are the facts and what I want to say is and I want to urge the Minister, although not your jurisdiction, being a warden at Pollsmoor, go to Pollsmoor and see how our children are rotting in prisons. See how the communities are affected by the crime and the increase of 7,83%. See that whether it is police, whether it is LEAP, whether it is your enforcement, it does not matter, our people are dying.

I want to ask you, your hotspots, does your Department speak to Social Development, to Education to fix the social ills and our broken families in the Western Cape? We are bragging and bragging about LEAP but we have broken families in the Western Cape where our children are deregistered because they cannot attend school, because their brothers are gangsters. That is what I want to hear. Do not educate me, Minister. I am well educated on this point. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise hon Christians. [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker, Speaker, I must agree

with the Minister and this is a fact that the ANC has failed the people of this country, has failed this province when it comes to safety. That is a fact and the ACDP will continue... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The ACDP will continue to call for the devolution of powers to the province. That is a fact. I repeat, the ANC has failed us, but Minister... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members, I cannot hear.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The question I want to ask you is, that is why we have the Safety Plan and the Safety Plan was introduced to mitigate the failure of the ANC Government. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No-no, do not shout! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, hon members, sit down, hon member.

Ms A P BANS: You are asking people to sit down but can... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, order, please! [Interjections.]

Ms A P BANS: You are asking people to sit down!

An HON MEMBER: Hon Speaker...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Christians?

An HON MEMBER: Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members. [Interjections.] Hon Bans. [Interjections.] Hon members! [Interjections.] Right, I am going to adjourn this House now. This running commentary that has been going on and now I am standing under the Rule, we cannot proceed any further like this. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: But why are you standing?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, will you stand up please? Stand up please.

Mr A LILI: Will you sit down, Deputy Speaker, also.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Stand up! Alright. [Interjections.] Alright, sit down hon Marran, sit down. [Interjections.] Alright, under Rule 50 I am going to adjourn the House. Hon Lili, there needs to be some... [Interjections.] Hon members, this is embarrassing. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: But why are you standing? Why are you not seated, Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Under Rule 50 I am going to adjourn the House for 10 minutes. I think we need to take a real look at the way we are behaving in front of people and very much the youth, who are the future of this country, watching us carry on. [Interjections.]

Hon members, if I have to name you again, you will have to leave, so the House will be adjourned for 10 minutes, suspended for 10 minutes. Thank you very much.

Business of the House suspended at 15:15.

The House resumed at 15:24.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may be seated. Okay, if we can proceed to hon Christians. One minute 21. Thank you very much, you may proceed.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: The hon Minister is not here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think it is fine. Is the hon Minister outside? I will just check. Alright, I have to take – thank you. [Interjections.] Hon members, just remember we are streaming live. Okay, you may proceed, hon

Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, as I said that the Safety Plan was introduced to mitigate the failure of the ANC. Now, saying all of that, hon Minister, allow me to emphasise that the streets of Cape Town are not safe. Firearms used to shoot and kill, often are returned to those who kill further. So, according to the crime stats, when you look at it and you look at murder, for instance, that ten of the 20 stations are located in the Western Cape and that is unacceptable. So, I know.

The question, hon Minister, is knowing the failure of the ANC, we can blame them, blame them, but the Western Cape has decided to do something. So, can you give us, why is it Delft? If you look at contact crimes, Delft is number one in the entire country. If you look at Delft, it is unsafe. So, we can say Nyanga is no longer the murder capitol, but now we have Delft. It is seriously dangerous to walk in Delft and people are mugged and robbed every day.

So, hon Minister, I want to conclude by saying we can blame the ANC and blame them. They are to blame. They are failing our people, but the Western Cape Government will have to turn this around and these crime statistics are unacceptable. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Interjections.] I now

recognise hon Kama. [Interjections.] Hon members!

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I serve a God who wants me to be consistent with the truth. He will never allow me to come to the House and ask, 'where is the Safety Plan?' And the next week say there is a Safety Plan.

But the other point that we want to make as the ANC, hon Deputy Speaker, is that if this Government says the 7,3 increase is as a result of police, then this Government is saying the people of the Cape Flats and all these crime-ridden areas, are born criminals. If really, the situation is because there is a failure of SAPS because there are causative factors that they are supposed to address.

The crime statistics, once again, highlighted the contribution of liquor to crime. Hon Minister Cele recently said that alcohol was involved in 749 murder cases and in the commission of 1212 rape cases. Helen Zille spent millions on the Alcohol Harms Reduction White Paper, which is just sitting around collecting dust. I have to ask the hon MEC and the hon Premier: when will the Alcohol Harms Reduction White Paper be turned into an Act? What is causing the delays?

It is the conflict of this Government in the approach of addressing this issue because on the other hand, it is strangleheld by the white companies that are in charge of the liquor industry and trying to frustrate and act as if the

problem is with the informal traders in the communities. Instead of usual unfair targeting and imposing of unjust fines to informal liquor traders and while suddenly, Pick ‘n Pay and Shoprite are opening liquor outlets in townships and even in fuel stations in the province. A good starting point is to engage these stores and grant the groups of liquor traders in the townships franchises to take over their liquor stores in those townships.

This Government that prides itself on evidence-based decision-making, yet its implementation of the Safety Plan shows signs of a Government that is not in sync with reality. The Safety Plan must make resources available to deal with sexual offences and GBV, as more women and children continue to be targeted. It must place more emphasis on environmental design, as the lack of CCTVs, poor lighting and inaccessibility of various sections of murder hotspots, impede policing. The Legislature must get more oversight powers over the Safety Plan to be able to hold Government accountable for the millions that are currently going to waste. The Safety Plan must find ways to deal with the disturbing trend of kidnapping in the province.

In closing, I wish to commend SAPS, its partners and other stakeholders for the sterling work they are doing. With a better implementation of the Safety Plan, we can reduce crime levels to zero. We must encourage the hon MEC to consider all these suggestions and make the necessary amends. Crime is not a police responsibility only. It is a social responsibility.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr M KAMA: In that Safety Plan they are talking about, it is written there, but they do not understand it. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M KAMA: That is why it is not implemented. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now call on the hon Minister. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you so much. I am going to take my time in order to reply. I am going to be as calm as I potentially can be ...[Interjection.] because inside, hon Deputy Speaker, if I listen to those that provided input, I am saddened because the Western Cape Safety Plan is a two-pronged approach.

On the one side Law Enforcement, because that is needed, is a requirement. Every country in the world has a Law Enforcement component. On the other hand, we do know the Violence Prevention component is where we are hugely lacking because we are about 20 years behind in terms of the Law Enforcement component, together with corruption, in the South African Police Services, together with National Government entities. But let me go



to the first one.

Hon member Kama spoke about a Commission of Inquiry. Now, the Commission of Inquiry made a number of recommendations and I know, hon Deputy Speaker, that hon member Kama withdrew from the race to run as the Leader in the Province for the ANC Youth League, but let me say this in a very calm way. [Interjections.] Hon member Kama ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
Hon member Kama is my friend ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon members! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
Hon member Kama is my friend ...[Interjection.] hon member Kama is my friend. So, I know ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...I know hon member Kama withdrew ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Where are you going ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, hon Sayed ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I am getting there. If you ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Take a seat, hon Minister. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, no.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: So, I consider hon member Kama a friend. He has given solid input on the Committee many times ...[Interjections.] but let me read verbatim from the Matthew Goniwe Branch. Two days ago, the ANC Youth League said this ...[Interjections.]

“The ANC Youth League ...[Interjections.] The ANC Youth League notes ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Answer the questions.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I am getting there!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: He made inputs. I am replying to each and every input. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, who is sitting in the Chair? Alright, now you have to – the hon Minister has not broken any Rules. He is quoting so, you have to let him quote. [Interjections.] Just one minute, hon Minister, I see that hon August's hand is up. Point of order?

Mr S N AUGUST: Yes. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, a point of order as you would want me to say. The response from the hon Minister, as I said earlier on, we are dying here. The ANC Branch is irrelevant to the response [Interjections.] he should give to us. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr S N AUGUST: So, I am asking, hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

Mr S N AUGUST: ...if you can please ask the hon MEC to respond to the

questions which are affecting the Western Cape.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I understand that.

Mr S N AUGUST: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So, hon August, I am sure the hon Minister is using his time ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
Hon Deputy Speaker!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...to illustrate a point, I would imagine, and I am going to let him do this so that he can actually get to his point. [Interjections.] Over to you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
Hon Deputy Speaker, hon member August made input in order ...[Interjections.] in order to answer those questions and to adhere to the input that hon member August made that we need to take politics out of it. This is probably the most classic example of how we are able to ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon Deputy Speaker?

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:...highlight hypocrisy and take it out of this Chamber.

[Interjections.] So, the ANC Youth League said:

“Notes with sadness, once again, the empty promises made by the National Minister of Police and the Commissioner, regarding the Makaza and Khayelitsha area.”

Because the Commission of Inquiry that hon member Kama is speaking about, one of the recommendations was that Makaza needed to have a fully fledged SAPS station.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

They go on to say:

“Maybe, and only maybe, if Makaza had a full functioning police station, maybe Thandiswa” ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That your ...[Interjection.] cannot be serious.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

“...maybe Thandiswa would have been alive.”

So, we know ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Do not spread gossip in the House ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
...we need that ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: ...and you want us to take you seriously.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
...we need that. In this House, certain stuff was ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Gossip!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, do you want to still raise your point  
of order? ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You are putting gossip in the House. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, if you can take your seat.  
[Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: I have withdrawn. No, no, I have withdrawn.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, it is fine. You may proceed hon Minister.

An HON MEMBER: You cannot even comment here even in the House.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: He is done. So ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: When does a jury start in the room.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: So ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: So, here we have a number of words that are spewed in this House and it is not factual, it is hypocrisy.

With regard to hon member Bosman, thank you so much. I can confirm on the record that each year since 2014, we have submitted our policing Needs and Priorities Report [Interjections.], a constitutionally mandated process and up until today, we have seen little to no implementation of the Policing Needs and Priorities here in our province, which is another example on why we are calling for devolution.

In support of the comments made by hon member Christians, it makes sense

because our needs and priorities are not taken into account here. Some of those successes are that when our country is seeing an increase in murder of 21% across the country. Where LEAP officers are deployed, we are seeing an 8,2% reduction. In Nyanga, and hon member Kama saw the video of where Brig Ncata went on record to say that because of LEAP and all the other interventions, that joint cooperation, we saw a reduction in Nyanga. And then, four months ago, Brig Ncata was shipped out of our province and is now in the Eastern Cape ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: So, we have seen when the lack of leadership and succession is in an area, it does affect crime in that particular area.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister, your time is almost up.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
How much time do I have?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: About 10 seconds. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: All I want to say is that this debate is clear that ...[Interjections.]



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
...all of this. This debate is very clear that when you are trying to say something, people are still trying to speak and they are not respecting this House, but we will respect the citizens ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
...and we will do everything in our power to help and keep our communities safe. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister.  
[Interjections.] Order hon members, we are moving over to Interpellation 3. I now recognise – I am just giving the hon Minister a few seconds – I now recognise hon Minister Allen.

*(Rural Crime)*

**3. Mr S N August to ask Mr R I Allen, Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety:**

- (1) Whether his Department has made funding available to combat crime in the rural regions of the province;

(2) what plans are in place to support the rural regions?

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
Thank you so much, hon Deputy Speaker. Yes, hon member August, thank you so much for this particular interpellation with regard to funding to combat crime in rural areas and within our province.

I have visited a number of rural areas and we have already conducted three Safety Summits in rural areas. The next one is in mid-November, which is next week, and then the last one will be in the Central Karoo area, which will be in February next year. So, we have made funding available to combat crime in the rural regions of our province, as well as in the urban regions, to facilitate the capacitation and functioning of the safety partners in line with the Department's vision of safer and cohesive communities.

Furthermore, the Department has budgeted R3 million for this financial year, to integrate safety and security technology in support of rural safety. The key safety partners that the Department works with are Neighbourhood Watches, including our Farm Watches, local government, including our district municipalities and Community Safety Forums, together with our CPFs. Neighbourhood Watch structures perform important roles in community cohesion which underpins safety cohesion.

Therefore, the Department as part of its Department community-based strategy, supports Neighbourhood Watch structures, as per Section 6 of the

Western Cape Community Safety Act, through the Neighbourhood Watch Accreditation and Support Programme. Accreditation provides the Neighbourhood Watches structures with a governance framework to access the free training, funding and resources. The Department supports all accredited Neighbourhood Watch structures throughout the province.

In terms of this report to Neighbourhood Watch structures in rural areas, I will provide this particular breakdown. The Garden Route R290 000; Cape Winelands R280 000, Overberg District R120 000, the West Coast District R30 000, the Central Karoo, at this stage, R10 000, which is altogether R730 000. The training we have provided is across the various districts and I am on record, hon Deputy Speaker, to state that I would never want our rural areas to be regarded as the stepchild of the Western Cape because we have seen ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Because we have seen in the last quarterly crime stats, based on our analysis, that there is a 28% shift in crime patterns towards our rural areas and we remain committed to do everything in our power to keep our rural areas safer. In terms of our oversight role, in terms of the ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, order please.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: In terms of our approach, we have extended our oversight role over the South African Police Services because we have seen the lack of resourcing in our districts is chronically under pressure, because we have at times, one officer doing a VCP. A vehicle checkpoint: one officer. It is dangerous and it opens the room for corruption.

I have gone to so many SAPS stations where there is one officer in the Community Service Centre. This is also against the Standard Operating Procedure of SAPS. So, we are pushing at that end to make sure that our rural areas are fully capacitated, and we are working closely with our local district municipalities to ensure that we have the K9 Units because we have seen a 27% drop in the SAPS's K9 Units over the last four years.

We have seen the Reaction Units and we are working closely in the Swartland area, in the Overberg area and we are expanding on that particular model to ensure that our rural safety areas are prioritised. We are making a point and I will invite the hon member to also make sure that she is able to attend our District Safety Summits, because it is where all stakeholders come together and in line with the previous interpellation, in that the whole-of-government approach, whole-of-society approach in that we need Social Development, Education, Cultural Affairs and Sport. Each and every department has a role ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
...in the Safety Plan and that is cemented in our District Safety Plans as well.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise hon August.

Mr S N AUGUST: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The Law Enforcement LEAP officers are only in the City of Cape Town. What about Drakenstein, Saldanha, George and other municipalities? The communities are subjected to harsh realities of crime and this Government in turn focuses on hotspots only in the Metro, at the expense of the rural Western Cape where broken families exist. Crime does not just exist in Cape Town only, but everywhere in the Western Cape.

There exists a bolstering tendency from this Government and more specifically, those who occupy the position of MEC within the Department, to play a perfect role. They focus solely on public safety within the boundaries of the City of Cape Town at the expense of rural communities in other parts of the Western Cape. We have seen this tendency from the MEC's predecessor and now from him, too.

Billions are funnelled from the Government to the Metro and funds the Law Enforcement LEAP, which places young men and women with little training in harsh conditions, to stand against live ammunition in volatile crime

hotspots, placing their own lives at risk. This is due to a careless Government who is only interested in self-gratification. I note the establishment of Law Enforcement Reaction Units in the Overberg and Swartland District. The worrying factor is that these units are established not as a crime prevention solution, but more as to be activated after a crime was committed.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the billions funnelled into the programme such as LEAP has better potential to advance our provincial social net, which is a greater deterrent of crime, as opposed to just locking up people, this becoming the only known way that the DA-led Western Cape Government fights crime. Are there existing agreements between his Department and the Departments of Social Development, Health, Cultural Affairs and Sports, and Economic Opportunities, and Tourism, to support rural communities in their fight against crime? If not, why not? How is the funding being utilised effectively to address crime in rural communities?

I hear R730 000, hon Deputy Speaker, compared to the millions pumped into the City of Cape Town, so that we can have nice cars on the freeways to lock up our drivers. [Interjections.] Are there any measures in place that work against the politicisation of the Neighbourhood Watch model by ward councillors and committees, knowing our Neighbourhood Watch are DA members? All the Neighbourhood Watch and Walking Busses, DA members. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr S N AUGUST: So, how do we stop politicising this? If not, why not? If so, kindly provide the relevant details. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, many members of this House visited police stations in Kwanokuthula, in Mossel Bay and in Plettenburg Bay during our last Cluster visit. What we saw was disgusting and dismal. We called the National Police Commissioner, and he accepted our invitation, and he sat in this House and told us that SAPS police stations are managed by SAPS and by the Department of Public Works and Infrastructure nationally.

The state of these police stations, the inability of SAPS to report faults and the inability of the National Minister of Public Works to even respond to some of those requests, disgusted not just members of this Committee, but also members of the community. In Kwanokuthula, the police station is as small as a little shack where the Station Commander and the HR lady share an office. You could not even report crime because it was not a safe space.

Members of this House stand up here and grandstand after they tell us not to

politicise. [Interjections.] So, through you, hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...I would like to ask ...[Interjections.] I would like to ask the hon Minister, besides the hi-tech Joint Operation Centre that operates in the Mossel Bay Municipality, what intervention, what support has come from any National Government department to protect rural communities? [Interjections.] What has the National Minister of Public Works and Infrastructure done? What has the National Minister of Police done, to make sure that the Safety Plan is complimented, noting through you, hon Deputy Speaker, that the Gauteng Premier has launched their own version of LEAP today. [Interjections.]

So, please, through you, hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...hon Minister, please tell us whether the National Minister of Infrastructure has, through your Department, hon Minister, engaged either the Provincial Department of Community Safety or our Provincial Minister of Infrastructure, or whether any response to the many letters that the National Commissioner of Police has written to that DG, has been responded to? Thank you.



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, I now recognise hon Bans.

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I am sure our rural communities, as they are watching us now, really feel the neglect that this Province is doing to them because the question at hand is: how much is being funded for them and how are they being accommodated? I was listening earlier to the hon Minister when he was reading out the amounts that were given to the other districts. It is actually a shame, †dit is 'n skande, [it is a shame,] but nevertheless, I am not going to go there.

In September 2019, a week after the announcement of the Safety Plan by the hon Premier, the *Mail & Guardian* published an article titled ‘Women harvest fruits of abuse in rural Western Cape’, detailing horrific stories of violence against women on farms and in farming towns. Three years down the line, women in rural Western Cape continue harvesting the fruits of abuse and violence in the province. One example is a 58-year-old farmer that was arrested and charged for allegedly kidnapping and raping a 14-year-old girl near the rural town of Klaver. Despite these horrific stories of violent crimes outside the Metro, the Safety Plan still prioritises only Cape Town in these times. Are we still serious?

This Department’s resources are concentrated on the City to the detriment of rural safety. The Safety Plan must not be reduced to the City of Cape Town Plan. Public resources must be spent in a fair and equitable manner. The

favouritism towards Cape Town for ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Let us go to the House!

Ms A P BANS: ...and the programmes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, please.

An HON MEMBER: They need to be relieved! They are asking us to relieve them.

An HON MEMBER: To relieve them?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is Mr Stemele ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: He needs to join us. Could you join me in the House?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you can please urgently ask Mr Ngikhethe to – ja, thank you very much. That has been muted. [Interjections.] My apologies, you may proceed. Hon Bans?

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The favouritism towards the ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms A P BANS: The favouritism towards the City of Cape Town for almost all of this Department's funded programmes, including funding of accredited Neighbourhood Watches, the Chrysalis Academic recruitments and LEAP officers, is wrong and it must come to an end. I am sure that hon Minister Mitchell will agree with me that it is very bad that today in Beaufort West, trucks are not passing there to stop anymore because of crime. That must be addressed.

Of the Department's eleven conditional grants, three of these including hundreds of millions spent in recruitment, training and deployment of Law Enforcement officers, go to the City of Cape Town. It is wrong. The rural towns only get R7,2 million for K9 dogs and R8,5 million for the establishment of Reaction Units in Swartland and Overstrand municipalities. An additional of ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member.

Ms A P BANS: ...R9,3 million is sent to four municipalities for the Safety Plan implementation. The whole-of-society approach is wrong and must be condemned.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms A P BANS: We demand more safety resources to be sent to rural regions.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bans, I now recognise hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, the solution is simple. The ANC must be voted out in 2024. [Interjections.] The solution is in the people's hands. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Hon members, order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, 47% of known drug houses are in the rural areas. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Of the drug houses, 47% are in the rural ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Hon Christians, if you can just carry your voice. Hon members, every time hon Christians stands up, he does not have a chance to even be heard. Can I please ask ...[Interjections.] Yes, but we have to respect all parties here. Thank you. Hon Christians? [Interjections.] Hon Kama, give him a second. [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Ja, hon Deputy Speaker, as I said, 47% of the known drug houses is in the rural areas. So, it means that more drugs are going to the rural areas. If people sit in the Committee of Community Safety, they will know that I have asked for the roll-out of K9 Units because that will hamper the role of drugs in our rural areas.

So, gangsters have now seen that Greyton, Genadendal and those places are soft targets. I want to know from the hon Minister, is he talking to the police in order because according to our statistics, the police know where the drug houses are. What is done in order to get rid of these drug houses? But as I say, hon Deputy Speaker in closing, I need to say the solution is 2024 to get rid of the ANC [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...and that is the solution. I thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise ...[Interjections.] Hon members, order. [Interjections.] Hon Lili, you need to face me. Can I ask that hon August be allowed to respond.

Mr S N AUGUST: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Windvogel, please!

Mr S N AUGUST: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The question to the hon Minister was the following, whether his Department has made funding available to combat crime in the rural regions of this province. When the white farmer is murdered, his family is crying. [Interjections.] When a child on a farm is raped, that family is crying. So, where hon Bosman comes about with infrastructure at the police station, †hulle moet lees wat ons vra. [they must read what we are asking.] [Interjections.] They must read what we are asking and respond to that. [Interjections.]

What we are also asking is that the hon Minister does not, when he responds, come and joke because this is serious. South Africa and the Western Cape are watching us when we are going to respond and the previous question, he only had ten seconds to respond to constructive debate and he did not respond to it.

Hon Deputy Speaker, R730 000: a 28% hike in rural crime. Surely, we cannot have three summits now. You are in Government for how many years? How can we have three summits now? [Interjections.] I was not in the Province, and I do not have a ministerial budget. So, I ask that the hon Minister please responds to what plans are in place for the next three years ...[Interjections.] to combat the rural crime issues. We do not want to hear about the ANC, hon ACDP. We do not want to hear about the ANC. We do not want to hear about police stations where one member is sitting in there ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr S N AUGUST: We do not want to hear about the buildings falling apart ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr S N AUGUST: We want to hear what the DA's plans are for the rural crime in the Western Cape. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now ...[Interjections.]  
Hon members, hon members, can I allow the hon Minister to respond?  
[Interjections.] Hon Lili, can we have the hon Minister respond?  
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I am going to say this once, that if any person in this House would say I am joking, hon Deputy Speaker, when I joke, they would damn know I joked because it would be something they will not be able to sit like this. That particular narrative is old ...[Interjections.] That particular narrative is old. [Interjections.] It is a narrative ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

...that is being spewed and then, you keep talking ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: He is pointing at us that.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: So ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point your finger back at you. Hon Minister, the point ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: So, here we go. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, if you can take your seat, please?

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: When we talk about the three summits ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, take your seat, please. [Interjections.] I first saw the Chief ...[Interjections.] I have first seen the Chief ...[Interjections.] Hon Lili, have you forgotten all the Rules? I can send you a copy. I am first going to allow the Assistant ...[Interjection.] I understand, and then, I am going to allow the Deputy Chief Whip. The Chief



Whip, I am just going to call them the Chief Whip because it is just so complicated and then, I am going to ask hon Sayed. So, Acting Chief Whip, you may proceed. [Interjections.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, I am standing again on 40 and 42, and I am tempted to stand on 50 as well, but we would like to hear the hon Minister respond to the questions and to the Interpellation matters raised by the hon members of the Opposition. And I do not recall there being a Rule that says one cannot point, but I would like to listen to the hon Minister. [Interjections.] So, in terms of 40, 42 and hopefully, not 50, I ask that we please continue with this.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Sayed, I recognise you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. [Interjections.] I think for the sake of progress as well, I think we need to ensure that the Executive as well, are also urged to respond to the questions and not be side-tracked and get into other issues. We are here to exercise oversight and at the same time, I think on both sides of the House, at least if there are elements, I know that there was a Rule quoted, Rule 40, about issues of hon members being interrupted.

Now, what I am seeing is that hon members are not necessarily being interrupted. There is heckling happening, but the heckling must not reach a point of interruption. They understand that, but there is heckling taking

place. The Executive ought to also – that is why we have got mics as well – raise the voice, but also, let us stick to the topic at hand and not get side-tracked because that is going to then ensure that we are going to stand here until 9 o'clock. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Sayed. I would now like ...[Interjection.] Hon Lili. Hon Lili! [Interjections.] Hon Sayed has just outlined what he would like us to all do. So, once the hon Minister stands up, if we can just allow him to respond and I will ask the hon Minister to practice caution. Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much, hon Deputy Speaker. Just how much time do I have?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am going to give you – I have got three minutes 29 seconds.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: It takes roughly two minutes to get through one particular page ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I am going to make this entire reply available because not even in eight minutes, this reply will not be read out. So, I will ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon – you said immediately? Would you like the reply immediately? You may stand up, hon Sayed. Hon Minister ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I hope the hon member of the Executive realises that this explanation is also cutting into his time.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I understand.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): He must get to the point, thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Interjections.] We cannot control everything. Remember, this is an interpellation. This is a debate. Hon Minister, you do have freedom of speech here within the Rules.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
Thank you so much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So, you may proceed. Thank you very much.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
Hon Deputy Speaker, I am going to say again that in terms of rural safety,

our Province and the Western Cape Government are fully aware that we are taking rural safety extremely seriously.

So, I have been here a little over six months. [Interjections.] We have interacted with a number of all the districts and within these six months, I have already established solid working relationships across our districts. So, to arrange all the summits within a period of seven months is actually something that should be commended. I have come in and I have actually spent more time during these last two weeks outside of the City of Cape Town ...[Interjections.] outside of the City of Cape Town because the benefit that we are reaping from these summits are directly linked to crime prevention. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: So, when an hon member states that we need to be proactive and not reactive, the K9 Units are exactly that. It is proactive. It is to make sure that at the vehicle checkpoints we are confiscating abalone, we are confiscating weapons, we are confiscating drugs, and on a monthly basis, I release that information to the public based on the successes. [Interjections.] And those particular statements are each and every month on the successes, and those are drugs that could have landed up in our areas. Those are abalone that are directly linked through organised crime. [Interjections.] So, we are seeing the successes ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
...of that proactive approach.

In terms of the comments that were made, yes, we are keeping SAPS accountable with regard to the shutting down and the closing of drug houses. Over the last four months, we have seen a drop in the amount of known drug houses, now to 118, which were closed, and we are proactively making sure that the recommendations of the Police Ombudsmen are taken into account with regard to operations on closing those.

So, when it talks about the JOC and this reply goes further with regard to the R35 million that has been spent, the R35 million that has been spent and will be spent, is all towards rural safety. The work we do in the Garden Route with the JOC Centre that hon member Bosman mentioned, is a clear intervention from this Government. The work we do in the Overstrand, the work we do in the Swartland West Coast area, cross-boundary operations, is a result of a proactive Government that has taken funding from other departments, to put resources available due to the fact that there is under-resourcing in our LEAP agency. [Interjection.] So, we know that, hon Deputy Speaker.

This report and this particular answer, all five pages, will be made available

and I will request that the hon members peruse and read. I will even encourage that hon member August should join the Standing Committee on Community Safety because ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...I have sent a letter and to answer hon member Bosman. I have also sent a letter to the National Minister of Public Works and a follow up, and we have not received a reply in that regard, but we are obviously holding them ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...accountable and continuing in that engagement. But as far as I know, there has been no information. The National Minister of Public Works did not even rock up to our MINMEC the last time that she was invited.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Murray.  
[Interjections.] One minute. Interjections.]

Ms C MURRAY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute!

Ms C MURRAY: I rise on a point of order with regard to point 38 and 39 that relate to no conversing allowed, as well as no interruption. Hon member Lili has interrupted and been conversing aloud throughout the hon Minister's reply [Interjections.] and he has consistently reiterated the point that people are dying [Interjections.]. And the hon Minister has tried time and time again, to explain what the Western Cape Government is doing ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Murray.

Ms C MURRAY: ...and there has been no respect offered by the Opposition.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Sayed, what is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, that is not a point of order. That is not a point of order! What hon member Lili has been doing, he is heckling. It is not a point of order. [Interjections.] Can we continue and get to the next item, please. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, stand up. [Interjections.] Hon Lili, if you talk to me you must stand up. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: There is no point of order.

Mr A LILI: I am saying, hon Madam Deputy Speaker, they ...[Interjections.]  
they speak as they wish because you happen to be biased against them and  
that is wrong. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, take a seat ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: That is wrong, hon Madam Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, sit down. [Interjections.]

Ms C MURRAY: Point of order. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: Please, she must not speak as she wishes because she is in the  
ruling party ...[Interjection.]

Ms C MURRAY: A point of order.

Mr A LILI: That is out of order. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, hon Lili! [Interjections.] Hon Lili, are  
you going to listen to ...[Interjections.] Hon Lili, are you focused on the hon  
member or are you focused on me? You are talking to me ...[Interjections.]  
Okay.



Mr A LILI: He is interrupting me whilst I am ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can I ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: ...whilst I am talking. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can I respond?

Mr A LILI: He is shouting, shouting, shouting, shouting.

Ms C MURRAY: A point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili ...[Interjections.] Hon Lili, I have mentioned you three times. The fourth, you will have to leave the House. Stand up so I can talk to you. That is what I have been trying to do. So, can I, can I - no ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: I am being abused in this House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, can you just stop so I can actually, standing up, so I can respond. [Interjections.] So, if you speak and address the Chair, you must stand up according to the Rules. If you all want to, that is fine, but I would like to respond to hon Lili's question. Hon Marran ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Can I raise my hand, or can I speak? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Well, clearly, we cannot respond, so you will sit down. [Interjections.] But what I am going to say, hon Lili ...[Interjections.] Ja, well you cannot control your ...[Interjections.]. Hon Lili, I am mentioning you once now. If I mention you twice more, you will have to be escorted out. So, I am saying to you now, enough is enough. Your colleagues may stand up and play silly games, but we are here according to the Rules ...[Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: Not even a point of order, a point of order. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So, please sit down. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: What is a silly game? [Interjections.] Hon Deputy Speaker!  
Hon Deputy Speaker!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You have got all your hands up.

Mr A LILI: Hon Deputy Speaker!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, you cannot shout. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: Hon Deputy Speaker!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, I did not recognise you and

...[Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: Hon Deputy Speaker! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sit down, hon Nkondlo. [Interjections.] When your hon members have sat down, otherwise I cannot recognise 20 people standing up ...[Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: But hon Deputy Speaker, why ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: When your hon members have sat down. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: This is a protest. This is a protest.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Oh, hon Dugmore! Get over yourself. [Interjections.] Get over yourself. Hon Dugmore ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Interjections.]... Hon Madam Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, when your hon members have kept quiet, I will quite happily hear you out when your hon members have kept quiet. [Interjections.] Okay, until your hon members are quiet, I will not be

able to recognise you.

Mr A LILI: We are members of the House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: [Interjections.] When your hon members are quiet, according to the Rules, I will recognise hon Sayed. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: But you are saying your members are ...[Interjection.] or what? You are saying that his members... No, that is out of order. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: When he is done. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much. Hon Deputy Speaker, firstly ...[Interjection.] Firstly, hon Deputy Speaker, hon members are responding to heckling from the other side of the House as well. It is not one-way traffic. I think that needs to be made very clear.

Then also, I think hon Deputy Speaker, you ought to give us the Rule which indicates and gives provision for an hon member to be asked to stand when he or she is being addressed because I think that is really a problem here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sure.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): When hon members are being asked to stand, not to stand to speak, but to stand and rise when they are being told

something by the Presiding Officer because those things are contributing to the tension that we are having.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I think, can we get to the next item, please, because I mean, we cannot be interrupted by frivolous points of order consistently. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, no. I did not recognise you.

Mr A LILI: Honourable Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Now you will sit down, hon Lili, because I am busy, or I am busy responding to your ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Okay, give me after.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...your Deputy Chief Whip. [Interjections.]  
Alright. Now firstly, I think many of you have been here for almost three years. Most, if not more and some have been here since 2014. We all know

the Rules of this House that we rise on a point of order, correct, and that anybody could raise a point of order. If it is not a point of order, it is not a point of order.

Now, I did not because you were so busy shouting at hon Cayla Murray, that you did not even hear I had not responded to her. Hon Sayed is correct, but hon Lili, you are facing that way and constantly interjecting. So, all I am saying to everyone is I am allowing freedom of speech within the Rules. Let me finish, hon Lili, I know you are wanting to speak to me, and I will recognise you. But I would really like just a little bit of decorum amongst members.

This is a normal debate. We have been doing this for years now and this is such a serious matter. We have guests in the gallery – hon Lili, I will recognise you when I am done – but there is no harm in hon Cayla Murray raising what she thinks is her point of order. Whether I choose to decide and make a ruling on that, is not her problem. It is mine. I have not even responded. All I did was go from her over to hon Sayed. So, please, we need to be mindful of the Rules.

Also, whenever I rise during the debate, too, it does mean that hon members must sit down, alright. It is a matter of decorum for you to rise when you are speaking. You rise on a point of order. Okay. Now, hon Lili, I am going to allow you to just – we allow hon Lili to make his point of order or make his submission. Rise and I will recognise you. Over to you, hon Lili.

Mr A LILI: No, I think, hon Khalid is correct that you have been on my case to embarrass me in this House, asking me only in this House to stand as and when you are talking. But when it comes to other hon members, for instance, when I was talking, I was interjected here many times, howled at by the hon Minister of Human Settlements or Infrastructure or whatever. But when it comes to them, you seem to be biased and that is totally wrong. And even that hon member over there, she is not consistent when it comes to people who are ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, I believe that is not a point of order.

Mr A LILI: No, no, I am saying she is also not consistent when it comes to people who are interrupting. I am talking about that hon member over there.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, hon Lili, you must say 'hon member' ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Look now, she is interrupting me. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is fine ...[Interjection.], but let us just have respect for everyone. That is why ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: So, I am saying hon Deputy Speaker, please be fair and please do not try to embarrass me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, you must ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: If there is no law, there is no law that allows you to ask me to stand when you speak, then please do not do that. Not unless you have a law that says ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili!

Mr A LILI: No. If you have a Rule that governs you to instruct me to stand like a little boy in a church or in a street somewhere, then I will accept that, but if there is no Rule, then please behave ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, have you got your Rule...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Do not abuse your powers.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, have you got your Rule book in front of you? [Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Do not, ja ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: In terms of Rule ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Do not abuse ...[Interjection.]



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...51. In terms of Rule 51 ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Do not abuse your powers.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: In terms of – sit down, please.

Mr A LILI: Please!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: In terms of Rule 51 you must rise to speak to me.  
You must rise in the member's place addressing the Chair. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: You are ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Rule 51. ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: But you do not ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will recognise ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: You do not even before I stand ... I talk, then you said, 'please stand up.'

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Because you are ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: ‘...I am talking to you.’

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes!

Mr A LILI: That is rude.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Because you are ignoring. That is correct.

Mr A LILI: That is rude. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, hon Sayed. We are going to be here for hours. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, hon Sayed did way before you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker [Interjections.], Rule 51 speaks about the member standing when they want to say something.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Not necessarily standing when they have to be given a dressing down. I think that is what is adding to the tension here. Presiding Officers do not ask a member to rise and be given a dressing

down when they are standing. It has happened to the hon Windvogel before. It has happened to the hon Bakubaku-Vos before and I think that must not happen, hon Deputy Speaker.

And I ask for the Rule to be quoted which allows for that. Can you please give us the Rule because I cannot see such a Rule existing. [Interjections.] Rule 51 does not speak to that. So, I think it is two-way. I think hon members are getting excited, there is heckling. That happens. That is natural in the House but let us not introduce new Rules and humiliate members and let them stand up to be given a dressing down. They must stand up when they want to speak, but not to be spoken to. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will now, I would like to proceed. I think what is very important is that the House is in disarray and hon Lili, when you do – if I am speaking to you and you ignore me, then it will be very normal for me to actually call you to order. So, I do not want to hackle on this anymore. [Interjections.] That is for anybody. I would like to now proceed to Questions for Oral Reply.

Mr A LILI: Hon Deputy Speaker, I am expecting you to apologise at least. If ...[intervenes]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: ...not unless you believe that you are right. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Apologise for what?

Mr A LILI: No, for humiliating me to say I must stand. [Interjections.] For humiliating me.

An HON MEMBER: For what now? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: For humiliating me in this House. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Huh? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, [Interjections.] I am going to have to ...[Interjections.] You are causing a disruption in the House now. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: I am saying you must apologise. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am going to have to ask you to go. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Apologise!

Mr A LILI: But you must apologise for humiliating me in this House.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No! [Interjections.] Hon Lili, sit down.

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Apologise.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sit down. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: Not unless you have a Rule. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, I am going to name you three times. I am going to ask you to be removed. You are actually causing a disruption to this House. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: No, but I am asking you to apologise to me! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, sit down! [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: You must apologise to me! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will not have to do anything. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: I am demanding! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, you are named once. [Interjections.]  
You are named once. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Deputy Speaker, in terms of the Rules he needs to walk. The hon member must leave the House. He is being disruptive. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: I am asking for an apology.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, sit down. Otherwise, I am naming you twice.

Mr A LILI: You are abusing your powers. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Can we now move over to Questions for Oral Reply. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: I am not elected by you ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili! [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: You cannot abuse ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, will you please leave the House. I will

...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Hon Deputy Speaker, I cannot be abused! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, will you please remove ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: I cannot be abused! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please remove the hon Lili from this House  
...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: I cannot be abused! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...and I will refer him to a Disciplinary Council.  
[Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: You must apologise, you abuse me! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: A point of order! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House will be suspended for ten minutes.  
[Interjections.]

Business of the House suspended at 16:12.

The House resumed at 16:14.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, hon Lili ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Point of order! Point of order!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, I have asked you to go, please.  
...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have asked you to remove ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Deputy Speaker, on a point of order!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...yourself. I am talking. Hon Lili, I have asked you to remove yourself. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: You must apologise to me, hon Deputy Speaker!

An HON MEMBER: Hon Deputy Speaker, on a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Will you remove yourself? [Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Hon Deputy Speaker, you must apologise in this House!



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, the House ...[Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Hon Deputy Speaker, you must apologise to me!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 16:15.