
THURSDAY, 9 SEPTEMBER 2021

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The SPEAKER: You may all be seated. Hon members, both in the Chamber and in the virtual platform, I am elated and deeply honoured to see the growing appetite by the hon members to once again come to this Chamber. At least I am not alone here with the Deputy Speaker. It is quite a handful of the hon members. You are all welcome and thank you for joining me here. Hon Maseko, hon Minister Mitchell, hon Minister Simmers, hon Mackenzie, hon Botha – thank you very much and I also see the seats on my left are not empty. I see hon Kama and hon Sayed. Thank you very much. I am very grateful for your physical presence here.

The hon members virtually, I would like to request that we observe the necessary protocols in terms of the hybrid sessions. I am not going to go through the laborious process of what you should know, in fact what you know already, but to say if there is a point of order, please do not shy away from communicating in the chat box or raising your hand. I have all the instruments here, and obviously I hope that you are all connected because we do not have load shedding that has been declared. If there is a challenge with an hon member being unable to be audible, that will be because of your systems and your location, but not necessarily our own making as this Parliament. We do have our systems in place and thanks to our ICT infrastructure and the unit that does all of this.

Hon members, I think at this stage before we proceed, the members of the media in the gallery, you are all welcome and just please also help us to observe the necessary protocol, not to activate your microphones and also not to activate your camera.

Hon members, I recognise the Chief Whip.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much and good afternoon, Mr Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provision of Rule 20(1) the sequence of

proceedings today, 9 September 2021, shall be Interpellations, Questions, Subject for Discussion in the name of hon Xego, Statements by Members and Motions without Notice.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion? No objections? Motion agreed to.

I recognise the hon Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. I move without notice:

That, notwithstanding the provision of Rule 18, that the next sitting of this House scheduled for Thursday, 30 September, and the sitting thereafter scheduled for Tuesday, 30 November, commence at 10:00, so therefore the sitting for Thursday, 30 September, and Tuesday, 30 November, begin at ten o'clock.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Chief Whip. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion, no objections? Motion agreed to.

Hon members, in terms of the Order Paper, we have one interpellation and one question. I do not think that reflects on the appetite for members for debates or questions, but we just happen to have the one today.

May I request the hon Minister, we do have the Minister. The question has been asked on the Interpellation by hon Christians, to the hon Minister of Community Safety, the hon Minister Fritz. I now recognise the hon Minister.

INTERPELLATION

Nyanga: decrease in crime rate

1. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Community Safety:

What interventions led to the decrease in the crime rate in Nyanga;

whether the same interventions can be implemented in other townships, particularly in Delft; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you Mr Speaker. I also want to say thank you to the hon Christians for this question, because I think it is an important question to illustrate the impact of our LEAP Programme and our Safety Plan so far, so I want to start off by saying that the downward spiral in crime in Nyanga is observed as a positive sign, that we are on the right track with our interventions. The Department has put in place several measures under the auspices of the Western Cape Safety Plan to eradicate crime hotspots in the Western Cape and we are saying eradicate crime hotspots.

You know, crime will always be there, but the hotspot-phenomena, where Nyanga used to be the murder capital it is not the murder capital anymore. We are talking about just bringing down crime, really bringing down specifically the murder rate.

These interventions are always based on data, Mr Speaker, and evidence, and our design to address the challenges of violence holistically, the criteria used to identify the hotspots are based on data sourced from the Department of Health, area profiles and the South African Police data. The focus for implementation is a priority, in priority areas, using a geographical approach with Nyanga Policing Precinct as one of the identified areas.

The Department worked closely with all law enforcement agencies with the Community Police Forums, with the Neighbourhood Watches, with faith-based organisations and that all other, amazingly soccer clubs, soccer federations, everyone, sports federations, everyone, because all of them will assist in giving youngsters alternative opportunities. In partnership with the City of Cape Town, Mr Speaker, the Department launched the Law Enforcement Advancement Programme, which is called – commonly known as the LEAP, in February 2020, which resulted in the deployment of the first phase of law enforcement officers in Nyanga as part of the first group of stations. The operational approach is executed in an integrated manner with all internal stakeholders and that is internal to the City Departments and external stakeholders. Those are national and provincial departments, operational role-players in each of the identified policing areas through the

area-based teams and I think this is important through the area-based teams.

The operational approach is planned, executed, monitored and coordinated on a weekly basis through the operational meetings between the law enforcement agencies, and all the enforcement agencies are sitting on that. It is important, Mr Speaker, to mention that SAPS in the identified area, station areas, is the leading law enforcement agent in terms of planning and execution of the operational approach.

The objective of LEAP is ultimately to ensure that visible policing numbers and actions increase, and it is all about people seeing the police, the people of Nyanga seeing our law enforcement officers and our LEAP and everyone else. Even our Safety Ambassadors are helping in some areas.

As stated above, the key strategy followed by the Department has been to focus on building strong community policing partnerships to assist with policing and increase community trust in the police.

This approach is based on the following two important aspects:

- (1) Community-based interventions about safety planning was intensified by the Department. These interventions took place with various safety partners and were based on the principle of sector policing. We are dividing a large area into smaller spaces, more manageable areas...

[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...has borne the dividends with increased safety and violence reduction.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hand of hon Chief Whip of the Opposition. Before I recognise you, hon Christians, I just want to see, is that a point of order hon Lekker?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Good afternoon, Mr Speaker. I would like to ask a question to the Minister.

The SPEAKER: You are part of the debate. Remember, this is not the questions yet. We are doing the interpellations.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I do understand, but maybe that is a decision that must be made by the Minister, whether he is willing to take a question or not.

The SPEAKER: The thing is he has no time left, hon Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I have raised my hand a long time ago, Mr Speaker, but it is fine.

The SPEAKER: I fully accept that, hon Chief Whip, my apologies. I see it now, but he has already run out of time. I will correct that next time. My

apologies. I now recognise the hon Christians. Hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Speaker, and thank you to the Minister for the response. Speaker, I am referring to the crime statistics and it shows that the Western Cape, six stations in the list of 30, are where we have problems with crime. So Nyanga was 18 out of 30 on the list, but in Nyanga there shows a marked decrease of 48% in their crime rate, and I think the Minister will answer the second part of the question concerning Delft, but Delft, out of 12 out of the 30, shows an alarming increase of 122,4% over the previous year and that is why my question. The Departments, and we know that they all work together, the interventions are all strategic and, as the Minister says, it is integrated and there is a set criterion.

Now if Nyanga – that was the murder capital – shows a decrease, and then you get Delft showing an increase, is the Minister and his Department using these because I know it is difficult because the crime springs out in different areas. It seems to me the gangsters know where you have visible policing, law enforcement, then move to a next area and a next area, so they also have their own intelligence moving from one area to the other. So it is almost like you are making progress in the one area, Nyanga, and then it seems to be you are going backwards when it comes to Delft, and when you sort out Delft, it moves to Steenberg and all the other areas, so my question is and that is why I have asked the question, but the question I want to pose to the Minister is what about their intelligence?

Is the intelligence good enough to pick up and probe on certain things that are going to take place and how gangsters are moving from one area, because I think, Speaker, gangsters, they themselves have got an integrated approach and they know how to operate and work from one area to the other and they almost go to soft areas and then it becomes a problem. So, with the Minister saying that it is a targeted approach, how can we prevent the one area being successful and then you go backwards in the other area and that is a concern because now we will talk about Nyanga. We will talk about Delft. Tomorrow we are talking about other areas.

What is the intelligence on the ground saying and is the intelligence sophisticated enough because the gangsters got sophisticated intelligence, so is the Department and all the role-players – their intelligence – good enough to pick up where the next target is. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. You must never say I never gave you more time. I gave you one second more. [Laughter.] Thank you, hon Christians. Hon members, I now recognise the hon member Allen, who is the Chair of the Committee.

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you, Speaker. I wish to echo the sentiments shared by Minister Fritz in thanking the hon Christians for raising this particular interpellation. Speaker, during July this year I visited the Browns Farm Satellite Station, which serves part of Philippi and Nyanga and I was accompanied by local councillors, CPF members and Neighbourhood Watch

members. There we heard firsthand how the station is still suffering due to the fact that the station is without electricity supply and relies on using a generator, but that the Browns Farm Station closes 17:00 pm per day due to security risks.

I have subsequently written to the Police Commissioner and I received a reply in which the Commissioner indicated the following, and I quote. He says:

“This office, the PC’s office, has on numerous occasions via the Department of Public Works nationally inquired about the lack of electricity at the Browns Farm Satellite Station. DPWI, the Department of Public Works and Infrastructure indicated that PRASA is reluctant to replace the cables.”

It goes on to say that from the PC’s side they have done everything in their power in order to compel the Department of Public Works as well as PRASA to take ownership and to take responsibility for the lack of electricity. But if I look, the station, Speaker, supplies part of Nyanga and Philippi and serves the community, but I am delighted to hear the Minister’s reply and interventions and I want to commend force multipliers like the LEAP Programme, Neighbourhood Watches and CPF members and the Department for their intervention. So as I close, Speaker, I wish to state that following the release of the crime stats we saw for the first quarter there was a 49% contact crime across the province and the National Minister attributed this to

working in crime [Inaudible – audio distorted.] as well as budgetary cuts, so I want to hear from the Minister in terms of what prospects, Minister, through you Speaker, to the Minister... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr R I ALLEN: ...what prospects to improve interventions through the devolution of SAPS? Does the Minister know?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you very much. Hon members, I now recognise the hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Speaker, and thank you to the Minister of Safety and Security. I just have two questions to the Minister. The first one is whether his own Department has the competency to intervene directly anywhere in the province in an attempt to reduce crime, and number two, whether his Department has the competency to indirectly influence the rate of crime in the province and whether he can pinpoint a scenario in which they can do so. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I would like to now give the opportunity to the hon, the Chief Whip of the Opposition. Hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Mr Speaker. First and foremost, allow me, Mr Speaker, to say that it was Amílcar Cabral that said: "Tell no lies,

and claim no easy victories.”

The problem with these liberals is that they are not grounded in political theory. They thrive on misinformation and claim National Government victories while they are quick to deflect all criticism for their failures to National Government. Most importantly is the fact that today we received a response from the Minister, which at no stage indicates the role which was very much significantly played by the Nyanga CPF in ensuring that the crime in Nyanga is coming to a decrease, rather than coming and highlight the good and the worst that has been done by either SAPS or the Law Enforcement itself, and it is very much surprising because to date it has been almost a year and a half since the meeting of the ANC with General Matakata on 8 February 2020 to discuss the crime situation in the province, wherein she pointed out that there was a significant increase in murders in Delft and Khayelitsha whilst there was a significant decrease in Nyanga as a precinct.

The decreasing murder rate in Nyanga is due to the impact of SAPS Anti-Gang Strategy and other such operations whilst the CPF also played a major role in that and surprisingly enough the response given to this House is nowhere close to the response that the South African Police Service provided to the Minister. The Minister has withheld information with relation to the efforts played by the CPF and to date we have seen and bore the fruits of the hard work of the CPF, which consistently implemented social crime prevention projects in the community and included the business community with very much support.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): So the Minister must not come and sleep in the House today, but acknowledge the role played by SAPS and the CPF.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Lekker. Your time is up, thank you. Hon members, I now recognise the hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Speaker. That is definitely not what I have asked what the ANC is saying, but that is fine, because I am trying to get to a point to see how we can put our heads together and all the force multiplying in order to bring crime down. You know, I always speak about crime. How do we combat crime?

I want to know from the Minister is the Department investing in crime prevention initiatives when it comes to the Community Police Forums and are they functional in Delft and these areas. You know, expressly your hotspot areas, and also I know the Department always has a problem when it comes to the accreditation to Neighbourhood Watches, one year they are credited, the next year not. Is that sorted out and expressly in the areas, the hotspot areas where we have force multipliers, but your Neighbourhood Watch plays a specific role and also your Community Police Forums?

I also want to ask the Minister what incentives are there for our Neighbourhood Watches? You know, it is community members putting their

lives at risk when they patrol to ensure that they have safe communities. I have asked this question some time ago at the opening of our Parliament in Rocklands, Mitchells Plain, where I said to Premier Alan Winde, some of our people they go out and they risk their lives and yet Neighbourhood Watches do not have the luxury when they are killed, you know. They may be the breadwinners and they lose their lives. Is there some sort of cover that we can give to these Neighbourhood Watches when they are out patrolling?

I know it is a debate going and I have asked that some time ago but is the Minister to give those people more confidence when they go out, and it is people going out because they care for the community. They want to help when it comes to reducing crime, and if the Minister can tell me, is the Department on track to halve the murder rate? Is the Department on track to halve the murder rate and under who will we see peaceful communities where people can walk and sit safely in their homes? I thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. Hon members, I now recognise the hon Minister of Community Safety.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: †Enkosi [Thank you] Mr Speaker. You know, when I listen to the hon Chief Whip of the ANC it is really, really signs of a dying horse, that organisation is really dying. That is why they ask such nonsense in this House, and you know, I explicitly said in my answer that the CPFs – now we are talking about all the CPFs and then Nyanga, if she gives me a chance, in Nyanga the CPF played a phenomenal

role. In fact, the CPF in Nyanga, the Policing Forum parted with the station management to embark on mobilising the community by establishing Neighbourhood Watches who deployed on a 24-hour basis in the hotspot, in that hotspot area, and they were doing monitoring and evaluation. They did actions steps – all of that.

Now she comes here and talks absolute nonsense, about are we not acknowledging National, the SAPS. SAPS is the people, I just said so. It seems she did not listen to my answer. I said SAPS was the commanding force and we do everything under SAPS, but the ANC is so, they cannot even register their candidates. That is why we have this violence probably in our townships because they are sympathetic and the fundamental point that they must not forget, that the ANC must not forget, is that this province is under-resourced. It is out of desperation that we employed and got this 1000 that we are working towards LEAP officers. It is out of desperation from the Provincial Budget, because we are under-resourced. This province, because it is a DA province, it is constantly being always – †ons suig aan die agterste speen, al die tyd! Nou kom sy... [we're always getting the worst share, all the time! Now she comes...] Now she comes and talks nonsense here in this House [Inaudible.] were not grounded. What does she know about grounded here? It is really absurd.

To move on, Mr Speaker, I just also want to say to hon Christians, he asked about, and I think the point we were making, hon Christians, the issue around when we do the application of the Community Policing Strategy, where there

was increased community involvement that happened in Nyanga. We have crime in Delft, and I promise you we are going to get it right. Those people from the Not-So-Good Party can say what they want to. We are going to get it right! We are going to persist. We are working with our youth already in Nyanga, *ag*, in what is the place, in Delft, very extensively, because those are the people who join gangs and we are ready to go and work in a collaborative way with all our community forces, with a multidisciplinary integrated collaboration. Those are strong factors in Nyanga, so we are trying to approach, but I also want to warn people that we have very different communities. The demographics and the dynamics in all those and in all of our communities are completely different and to just make a comment to what the hon Reagen Allen was saying, today I am leaving here and then I am going to the NCOP where the Minister is grandstanding again, but the problem is we have extensive constitutional powers in this province and it has been completely watered down, and so we are focusing for the next and I think someone asked about whether we have the competency. Yes, the legal competency we will take from the Constitution, and we will work on it, because we are just being given many of these very important legal competencies, provisions within the Constitution given to us as a province. It has completely been just watered down by National because they think we are stupid. Unfortunately I think we are far more brighter than some of them so we are going to focus on that, Mr Chair, Mr Speaker, we are going to continue to see how do we push the envelope in terms of our interpretation and even if we have to go to Court to get the devolution of policing powers to provinces, and we do not want the police force, we are talking about the

current police force. We are talking about what is in existence, we don't want to create another [Inaudible – speaking simultaneously.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: We are talking about what is in existence at the moment.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, sir, I thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Okay, thank you, Speaker.
[Time expired.]

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, with that the Interpellation has now been concluded and the debate thereof. We now move to the Questions for Oral Reply, which is a question by the hon member Xego to the hon Minister of Human Settlements. I now recognise the hon Minister Simmers.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Housing opportunities: Winning Way in Milnerton

1. Mr M Xego asked the Minister of Human Settlements:

With reference to the reply to Interpellation 1 of 20 May 2021:

Whether he can provide an update on the process to move the families that are living in congested conditions in Dunoon and Kosovo; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon Speaker, hon members present in the House, but also virtually, thank you hon member Xego for the question.

Firstly, in terms of Dunoon, hon member, through you, Speaker, the residents have not been relocated. Applications for rezoning and subdivision in terms of the Municipal Planning By-law were made to the City of Cape Town in May and June 2020. The applications were approved by the Municipal Planning Tribunal or MPT on 1 September 2020 and 3 November 2020 respectively. Upon approval each rezoning application by the MPT, the Racing Park Property Association appealed the decisions. This led obviously to delays.

The appeals in respect of the two approved rezoning applications were only heard on 9 March and 13 April 2021 respectively. The City of Cape Town's Appeal started to issue the approval decisions on 8 June 2021 and 27 July 2021. These approvals, however, came with conditions that require additional work prior to the commencement of construction. The conditions relate to stormwater management and capacity of the main Potsdam Water

Treatment Facility to accommodate the development. The project team is in the process of aligning various technical documentations in order to respond to the conditions of approval before construction can commence. The development is part of both short-term and long-term planning for the area.

It is, however, anticipated that site clearance will commence later this year, which will be followed by services installations. Construction of top-structures is expected to commence during the 2022 / 2023 financial year. In terms of the Kosovo Informal Settlement Project, hon Speaker, Phase 1 of the Greater Kosovo Project has commenced with the construction of 454 houses on Farm 694 New Woodlands, where 217 Kosovo informal residents will benefit.

The next phase will include sites from within the Weltevreden Wedge, where it is envisioned to provide 1,500 initial opportunities in a transitional residential development to occupants from the Kosovo Informal Settlement. The Weltevreden Wedge site is expected to yield a total of 6,500 opportunities in total.

A professional team has been appointed and is currently conducting initial investigative studies to identify the most appropriate site with the least development challenges including the provision of bulk services on which the transitional residential development will be delivered.

Beneficiation in the form of beneficiary sign-ups and verification have

commenced and are ongoing for the Kosovo Informal Settlement. It should, however, be noted, hon Speaker, that there are currently disputes in the area about this process and around the project steering committee members. This is proving to be quite challenging. Our stakeholder component along with the project manager are attending to this challenge and we trust it will swiftly be resolved.

The construction of the Transitional Residential Development is expected to commence in 2023 followed by the remainder of the Weltevreden Wedge Sites. Once relocations have taken place to the transitional residential area from Kosovo, construction will commence on the Kosovo main site which will be developed in phases. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Is the hon member Xego intending to ask a supplementary question?

Mr M XEGO: Yes, Speaker, yes, sorry.

The SPEAKER: I have - after your contribution, hon member Xego, I have hon Maseko in the Chamber and hon Kama in the Chamber. Are there any other contributions? If none, then you may proceed, hon Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you very much, Speaker. I just want to ask the Minister whether he is aware that a shack caught fire in Kosovo last week, which affected several shacks as two people died and others were dispossessed.

Now what we want to understand is that whether he has plans in place to accommodate homeless residents as a result of the outbreak of this fire, as this community, we know that is part and parcel of the community that is supposed to be benefiting from the initial project. Thank you very much, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Xego. I now recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you hon Speaker, and thank you, hon Xego. Regarding the fire in Kosovo, yes, I am well aware, but the hon member would also appreciate that it is the first port of call, the local sphere of government, to respond to disasters within the area. If they cannot or they struggle to obviously assist their residents, then they approach the Provincial Department and then we will see how we can assist.

A case in point is Masiphumelele, obviously where we assisted the City of Cape Town. Imizamo Yethu is another example, but once again the first port of call, with due respect to the local sphere of government, is that they need to actually keep their function first. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I now recognise hon Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Minister, again thanks for your response to member Xego's question. I just want to find out when can we expect some of the first residents to move into their new homes

in Farm 694 where 217 residents from the Kosovo Informal Settlement will benefit, and how will this improve on their living conditions? I thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Maseko. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Speaker, and thank you member Maseko for the question. The ultimate provisioning of the Farm 694 Project is to create an integrated community; hence we have a 50/50 split in representation of qualifying beneficiaries, 50% from New Woodlands, 50% from Kosovo. On the one side, which is the New Woodlands Project site, member, we literally have all our qualifying beneficiaries in place.

On the other side of the road is where the problem is, due to internal – for lack of better word – contestation regarding the Project Steering Committee, members and leadership quarrels. That process is stalling.

Now recently I visited the Farm 694 Project with the hon Mackenzie and other members of the New Woodlands Project Steering Committee, because, once again, the Kosovo side did not pitch up because of their infighting, and we are on track to start handing over the first houses by later or before the end of this year. The problem is that we would have loved, we would like to see the Kosovo side sorting out their internal issues, because the original

movement plan is 50/50, so as to complete the units, because we want to integrate the community to be representative as we hand out the units of both sides that ultimately contribute to this new community, which we will be forming, but the concern for me is that on the Kosovo side, the beneficiaries earmarked are those that live in formal structures and even our backyarders that live in informality on the Kosovo side, to answer your secondary point.

Similar to the New Woodlands, the entire qualifying beneficiaries are those that live in the backyards, so the objective is to improve people's quality of life, but there is one thing which we did not have control over, member Maseko. The houses will be finished in time. On the Kosovo side we cannot control the leadership's quarrel at the moment, which will have an impact on our movement plan for those qualifying beneficiaries. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I now recognise hon Kama, and then again hon Maseko in that order.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, Speaker, and let me thank the MEC for the responses that have been provided so far. I want to just check, Speaker, how much has the Provincial Government received from the National Government for this project and what were the timeframes that were attached? Thanks.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama. I recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much,

Speaker. Thank you for the question, hon Kama. In total the Farm 694 Project, the First Phase, the 434 has two funding streams. One is the USDG which is the grant which only Metros get. That contributed more than R200 million. In terms of the Human Settlements Development Grant, which is also a national grant disbursed to provinces, the balance of the funding came. In total it is just under R400 million.

The initiation or idea of this project is plus minus four years ago and if you look at the impact of COVID-19 we have still managed to keep this project on track, so I hope I have answered that question fully. Thank you, hon member.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I now recognise the hon Chair of the Committee, hon Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Speaker. Minister, again thank you for the response. I note that you mentioned that what we call “community dynamics” around members of the Steering Committee has created challenges in moving forward with the project, so my question is, what exactly is the dispute about regarding the Steering Committee and how has this dynamic impacted on the project in Dunoon.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Maseko. I now recognise the Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, hon

Speaker. I just want to make one thing sure, through you to the member. Is it the community dynamics in Dunoon or community dynamics on Farm 694? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Maseko, ai-jai-jai!

Ms L M MASEKO: My apologies.

The SPEAKER: [Laughter] You may continue, hon Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: My apologies, Speaker. He is Chairing Human Settlements that you tend to do what I did. It is the Farm 694, hon Minister.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Maseko. I now recognise the hon Minister.

†Die MINISTER VAN MENSLIKE NEDERSETTINGS: Ek wou net dubbel seker maak dat ek dit nie verkeerd gehoor het nie.

[The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I just wanted to make doubly sure that I did not hear it wrongly.]

Hon Speaker, through you to the member, and for her to understand, for the hon member to understand my answer, I am going to paint a full picture so all the members of the House can understand.

When we initiate a project to ensure community participation throughout all the processes, through my Stakeholder Relations Unit, we do convene what is

a Project Steering Committee, which is ultimately representative of beneficiaries in the community. The councillor plays his or her part, in this case the City of Cape Town, but also my Department, but the objective is always to ensure that the Project Steering Committee is at the centre of all of this. They decide how the units will look, and they get informed how the criteria will be. They get to decide like in the Farm 694 Projects case, how the job is going to be split, which was 50/50.

They get a chance to ultimately, when they scrutinise the criteria for qualifying beneficiaries and on Farm 694 site, it is a 50/50 split. They then sit. They go through the entire list which they get from the relevant sub-council, and then they scrutinise the list, but in the case of Kosovo's side, since the project inception to where we are now, for some or other reason mid to late last year a new Project Steering Committee was allegedly elected. It has been disputed or the election of this Project Steering Committee has been disputed. When I did visit the site, I actually asked the relevant councillor but why is there this bone of contention in that community.

He said the problem was the original Project Steering Committee members allegedly also benefited financially because they worked on site and some of the community members felt uneasy with a Project Steering Committee member also benefiting financially through the project and they ultimately, without, I believe, informing the relevant processes, elected a new Project Steering Committee and that is where the bone of contention currently is, hon

member.

The dangers of that happening and this is not the only project in the Western Cape where we have a change in leadership causing a delay in our project, in our case expenditure is on track. We are ready to start handing over the first units later on this year, but until such time that the Project Steering Committee deadlock is resolved for the Kosovo side, the [Inaudible.] will sign off on the beneficiaries, which means their units will be standing vacant, or something which we would not love to do, move the entire batch of people from New Woodlands. That is not what we want to do because the original objective was to ensure integration and it is a pity that on the Kosovo side, the leadership squabbles are now going to be a speed bump for an entire community which is supposed to benefit, and if I can take this opportunity through you, and just by me thanking the hon Maseko about that, I think all members listening to me to understand it, we all have to play a role to ensure community cohesion to ensure our projects remain on course and on track. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister and for the hon Xego and all the hon members who participated in the question. Hon members, that concludes the Questions and of course this particular question. May I now move to the Subject for Debate and I just want to request the hon members that in terms of the Speakers List there was no amendment to the existing Speakers List for the Subject for Discussion. I now recognise the hon member Xego.

SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION

(Strengthening Western Cape health facilities
for building a world-class health system)

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, hon Speaker. As the EFF we raise this debate, strengthening of Western Cape healthcare facilities towards building a world-class healthcare system. South Africa's colonial and apartheid past gave us a horrible experience that efficient and adequate livelihoods are for the wise and the rich, whilst third-class citizenship meant it must be reserved for the black majority, who are the entities and as people of this land.

This has been the experience through land dispossession, poor service delivery for our people and particularly in the health sector which continues to offer services that range from poor to substandard on a daily basis. The demand for proper healthcare facilities with capacity is growing by the day. Thanks to the EFF's 2016 Local Government Elections Manifesto, which called for the health facilities in townships and in remote areas of the province to operate 24/7, this call, which will continue to be canvassed by the EFF, did indeed sink amongst the majority of residents in the province, who now demand a proper healthcare system with capacity that can cater for their needs.

Moreover, it should also be mentioned that the very same call recently became apparent with the residents of Grabouw, which is half an hour's drive

away from the closest hospital. When they protested that their clinic must now be opened 24/7, the Democratic Alliance Government, through the hon Dr Nomafrrench Mbombo, had no choice but to deliver a 24-hour service clinic service in this area. A proper healthcare system is needed in the province in order to stage a fight to try and kerb the scourge of COVID-19 and other deadly diseases affecting our people. It is said that in the year 2021 our people still get infections and other diseases, queuing in the long lines waiting to receive medical attention.

The provision of healthcare cannot be reduced to a 7-hour service. That is currently provided by the Democratic Alliance Government. The EFF will continue to apply pressure and in the end the voice of reason and that of the people will tire.

Challenges in our hospitals range from lack of adequate medical supplies, proper medical equipment, shortage in staff, whilst other hospitals such as Tygerberg are in a decayed state, with plans to revamp them still stuck somewhere in the pipeline.

At the end of it all it is the poorest of our people who are on the receiving end of this incompetence and negligence from the Provincial Government. Thank you very much, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Xego. †Siyabulela [We thank you.]

Hon members, I now recognise the hon Minister of Health, Dr Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Good afternoon, Speaker. I just want to apologise, I am on the road to Vredendal, Matzikama, for the programme that I am joining National Minister Creecy, and therefore I will not be able to put up my video because of the network and the bandwidth. Can you hear me, Speaker?

The SPEAKER: You are audible. You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you. I am in the car just in case that you hear some other cars passing by. Hon Premier, Cabinet colleagues, members of the Provincial Parliament, the Chairpersons of the Standing Committees, especially for Health, Speaker, I want to thank member Xego from the EFF for sponsoring the debate, strengthening the Western Cape's health facilities towards building a world-class health system.

Speaker, as a healthcare worker, currently as a political hat and also previously who has been in previous roles in the South African health system from being a clinician and health programmes manager and also the facility managers in the various provinces from the Eastern Cape KZN; as an educator, a researcher and academic and also an authority on healthcare systems not only in the Western Cape in South Africa in the African continent, internationally, but specifically from the African perspective

globally; this is a topic that is closer to my heart. I thank you.

Now Speaker, speaking with authority on the subject, I can confirm that there is no one perfect health system in the world. There is no such thing that talks about a world-class health system, unless you unpack it further, because one size does not fit it all.

We talked about, for example, the socio-economic cultural political determinants of health, their epidemiology that influence what type of health system that each and every government has to respond to. Wealth and health are twins, and you cannot create binaries of the two. Therefore, any health system would be affected by the poverty, by the economy, employment and all of those, plus also disease in that particular country, for example, Speaker, the Third World, which is when member [Inaudible.] was talking about the world.

We have a Third World, Sub-Saharan Africa, which South Africa belongs to, and also even parts of Asia, where they are affected by diseases of poverty, such as TB and AIDS. Whilst the first-class health system which is known for example like the US, UK and Scandinavia and all of those, where we find that they are being affected by the sedentary lifestyle diseases such as cardiovascular disease.

The world-class health system can be that South Africa, what kind of that South Africa can mimic – say MS, with the Western Cape. Do we mimic

the world health system just like the UK that focuses on the universal health system, or the primary world-class care system like Cuba or Israel or the Brazil community services or Australia's world-class with more focus on mental health and well-being or the Scandinavian, the Nordic countries like Sweden and all of those that focus on health promotion or research and development and also the GP which is the general practitioner services, like in the US; the innovation in India that focuses on the comms; the technology that Singapore has; the aged that Japan focuses on or on the African continent that focuses on community empowerment that we have. So Speaker, South Africa, for the past 27 years, when we undertook democracy, had a choice to have the best and own a health system.

But it is the ANC that chose the worst health system, that segregated people further and resulted in people not being able to afford healthcare and services that are mostly unavailable and inaccessible to many South Africans. South Africa chose a health system where people have to wait an average of three years to access, for example a minor operation like a cataract eye operation, seven years for a knee operation.

I am quoting Western Cape figures because you wait no more in other provinces. There is no kind of intervention or surgery when one has to pay R230 000 for kidney dialysis at a private health facility or else, if you cannot afford it and are a public patient, you will have to die at home because it is too expensive. It is the ANC who chose a health system where 80% of the population gets the equivalent of the national health budget that the other

20% gets, which are the haves. For 27 years the ANC still has not been able to implement regulations to regulate the private half in order to access the affordability.

So Speaker, now what kind of a narrative is the ANC trying to achieve? The reason they have kept the people of South Africa in this kind of dilemma is because they want to advance a narrative that suggests that the public health system is bad because of private health, which are lies, lies, lies because they want to be divisive and to divide us.

Now they have brought the worst form of national health insurance, pretending that it will create equitable and affordable access to health services. No Speaker, it is not like; Universal Health Coverage is a must, and the National Health Insurance is a must, in order for people to get the best care, quality services and affordable services, but not what they propose because that is about benefiting their comrades which is what we have seen. And also, it's about where now it is going to be determined by the thickness of their wallets which has got nothing to do with human rights as per Section 27 of the Constitution.

Speaker, the ANC reduced the health sector budget this year as in previous years and they even stole the PPE money. That is murder according to the WHO definition because if you are selling PPEs of a lower quality for healthcare workers it means you are exposing them to infection, and they may die. So as the Western Cape Health Department we have to do something

because we have got the constitutional power of concurrent function to render health services to the people of the Western Cape who voted for us; we cannot wait anymore.

You will realise, Speaker, that everything that we do as a province is about improving wellbeing and quality of life. WHO identifies the building blocks to build a health system and human resources is a system on its own and that is why you will find the Western Cape has got the lowest COE in regard to their staffing. Our staffing has always been there; we have got the lowest turnover because our staff do not go anywhere.

If you look in terms of medical specialists, we have got the highest number because people want to stay here, even helping other provinces. Previously, under the current Deputy Health Minister, who was an MEC in KZN, we even had to rescue them in training the medical specialists.

Leadership and governance are the second part of the building blocks; a health information system is part of the building blocks. We are the only ones that ended up having the innovation of unique patient identification. We even have a strategy to be a disruptor in doing business unusual. We are the only ones.

We are the only province that has had clean audits. You will never get that anywhere; unqualified audits throughout for the past ten years. We have availability of medicine; we drop medicines everywhere especially now

during Covid so that the Aunty Sara's are able to get their medicine without queuing. Ideally, Speaker, we should have been able to have 24-hour clinics but with the budget that we get from the ANC Government we can only have mobile clinics but there is no one left behind. Aunty Sara might be going to a specific mobile clinic on that day but in that clinic, we have added packages that you will never get anywhere else: like eye care, occupational therapies for those people who need rehabilitative care; dental, x-ray and all of those as part of the package.

Similarly, with regard to the services, if you look in terms of the burden of disease: maternal health, child health, mental health, interpersonal violence and all of those happening in South Africa, if you look in terms of the figures in regard to where we are in South Africa, we find that we are the best. It is there, not only from Stats SA but also from the Government.

Hon Speaker, do you know that in this period of Covid we did not only focus on the virus? We had projects like the Vector Project where patients with diabetes, who were at high risk during the Covid peak periods, were preemptively identified. That is how we were able to know who is more at risk than anyone else. The public private partnership is our actual flagship where we demonstrated that you do not need the ANC NHI in order to work with the private sector. We have got clinics through farm owners who have been able ...

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister.

The HEALTH MINISTER: ... to provide the clinics throughout. So Speaker, having said that, I just want to say there is no one perfect health system but as the Western Cape we try our best, leaving no one behind. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I now recognise hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you hon Speaker, and hon members. Speaker, Darrell Huff in his book *How to Lie with Statistics* said, and I quote:

“A well-wrapped statistic is better than Hitler’s “big lie”. It misleads, yet it cannot be pinned on you.”

Darrell Huff cautioned us against the danger of using statistics to cover the sad realities of service delivery, failures in our communities. Speaker, the Western Cape Health Department thrives on this misinformation tactic by using statistics to hide objective realities. Carefully selected statistics are often used to portray a picture of the best run Department, whereas, on the ground, our people sleep on the floors in healthcare facilities, people stand for long hours in the cold and sun outside health facilities, waiting to be admitted. Chronically ill people and the injured die while waiting for ambulances which arrive after five hours. The public healthcare system in the Western Cape caters for the rich, while the poor are deprived of their rights to healthcare services and emergency treatment.

Speaker, Section 27 of the Constitution is clear: every person has the right to have access to healthcare services, including reproductive healthcare and that no person may be refused emergency treatment. Below I intend to prove that the Western Cape Health Department is in contravention of Section 27, and I have written to the Human Rights Commission to urgently intervene and investigate. This may also be in contravention of Section 42(d) and 3(b) of the National Health Act for free health service in a public health establishment.

Speaker, my office has received a very sad and shocking story of a patient that was diagnosed with kidney failure in March 2020 and has been denied much needed and lifesaving renal replacement treatment by the Department. Mr Daniel's application for renal replacement treatment had been rejected by the Tygerberg Hospital as he was told he did not meet the criteria for the Department's renal replacement programme. After a successful appeal process his application was approved for only a year on condition that he will have to join a medical aid at the end of the programme.

Speaker, he received renal replacement treatment three times a week in the programme until mid-August when the Department informed him in written communication that he will receive his last treatment on 31 August 2021 and that he needs to join a medical aid to continue with treatment at a private institution. The condition of Mr Daniels is worsening, and he was admitted at Tygerberg Hospital on 29 August 2021. According to the medical expert renal replacement treatment can cost anything between R79 000 to R80 000 per

annum excluding medication.

Speaker, Mr Elridge Daniels is unemployed and survives on his monthly disability grant of R1 900 per month. The cost of renal replacement treatment at private institutions is about R1 800 per session. Mr Elridge Daniels needs about three sessions per week. Since the end of August, he depends on family and NGOs to pay for his treatment. His health is worsening by the day. When I enquired about this, the Department said, and I quote:

“Healthcare managers are faced with the very difficult task to ration care between so many deserving candidates with limited resources. We fully understand the empathy of member Windvogel to the patient’s plea, however there are so many other patients who are in the same position as Mr Elridge Daniels. He has been re-evaluated and found not to qualify for the renal replacement therapy in the public sector. We have been sympathetic to Mr Elridge’s case, he was put onto haemodialysis on one of our bridging slots which gives a patient a year to join a medical aid and accommodate the waiting period. Note that not all patients have this chance as we have just two slots in the waiting list for same.”

Speaker, renal replacement therapy is a lifesaving option until a suitable organ donor is found and until then a patient will die if they are not on treatment. I call on the Premier and MEC to intervene in the case of Mr Daniels. It cannot be acceptable that the Western Cape Government tells

us about better life expectancy, clean audits and better facilities when in actual fact, it is denying poor people access to lifesaving treatment.

There are many similar families in similar positions to Mr Elridge Daniels. Speaker, every time these issues are raised, the Provincial Government switch goal posts and blame insufficient funding from National Government. The above case is a clear example of why South Africa needs full implementation of the National Health Insurance so that the poor like Mr Elridge Daniels and so many others can have the opportunity to live longer. The Democratic Alliance must end its opposition to the NHI. I thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Windvogel. Hon members I now recognise hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, let us build a world class health system by focusing on the quality of the service at the public facilities that so many of our residents rely on. This means not being distracted by political opportunism and false promises.

The SPEAKER: My apologies, will you please take your seat. I see the hand of hon Marais. Hon Marais, is that a point of order?

Mr P J MARAIS: I apologise sir, my finger slipped. Sorry sir. It is not a hand sir; it is a slip-up.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais. Hon Herron you have two minutes in total, you just used 16 seconds of those minutes, so you still have your time. You may proceed sir, thank you.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, Speaker. So this means, Speaker, that we should not be distracted by political opportunism and false promises. When President Ramaphosa announced the vaccination programme roll-out and indicated that the programme would start by the second quarter of this year, the Premier and the DA suddenly became very focused on vaccinations. Before that there was not a peep from them. Before that they were focused on contesting or whining about every restriction and every regulation that was introduced, second guessing what the President was being advised to put in place to reduce the impact of the pandemic; second guessing and criticizing even when they had no real alternatives. They dabbled for a short while in natural herd immunity playing Russian roulette with our lives.

The Premier jumped on the vaccine bandwagon long after it had left the starting point. He announced that the Western Cape would procure its own vaccine because National Government could not be trusted. In the State of the Province address, the Premier indicated that provincial officials had commenced a procurement process and they were reaching out to vaccine manufacturers. But Speaker, when you examine what the Province actually did, you will see why I said in response to the Premier's announcements that this is embarrassing. According to the Premier's answers to written questions

from this Parliament, they only called two manufacturers, Pfizer and Johnson & Johnson, both of whom said what we all already knew, that they were only dealing with national governments. The rest of the reaching out was letters to the consular corps and the diplomatic corps.

Speaker, money that could have been used to improve the quality of healthcare facilities and services was burrowed away to give this grand announcement a slither of credibility. Those funds should have been released to the Health Department to be invested in quality healthcare services and facilities not placed in some suspense account to prop up a promise that had no real prospects. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Herron. Hon members, I now recognise the hon, the Chair of the Committee, hon Philander.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Hon Speaker, here in the Western Cape we have made some incredible changes to our health platform over the last 12 years. This has been achieved through a people-centred approach, exemplary leadership and innovation and the result speaks for itself.

Life expectancy in the Western Cape remains the highest in South Africa. Life expectancy may only refer to the average number of years one is expected to live under certain predetermined factors in relation to mortality rates, but we know that access to healthcare services is a key driver of life expectancy gaps, not only in the country but across the world. So where care

is restricted, we enter public, private partnerships and deliver care.

The extension of these services means that in this province residents live within 30 minutes from a healthcare facility. The delivery of chronic medication and the establishment of the world class CTICC COVID-19 Field Hospital, South Africa's first, are additional examples of agility and the move towards world class systems in the Western Cape.

Speaker, it is through good and principled governance by which the hon Minister for Health today could share the strides that the Provincial Department has made towards achieving universal healthcare in the Western Cape without overburdening the already stretched taxpayer. We already have seen enough of the ANC and EFF's failed policies. We know and have experienced this through rolling budgetary cuts and many provincial governments left hamstrung in demand for care.

Speaker, the Provincial Government has been the only Health Department to have received consecutive clean audits. A clean audit means transparent and accountable governance, it means good governance in the best interests of people. But Speaker, it is a dire shame that the Western Cape stands alone as a beacon of healthcare delivery. The rest of the country is seen as a poster child for gross neglect of the public health system through failed governance, corruption and sheer incompetence.

Speaker, a reporter shared an account of three infant deaths due to a hospital-acquired infection in Gqeberha and an account of the availability of one

nurse for 28 newborn babies but when the publication asked the now fired National Minister of Health, what would be done to rectify the dire circumstances in the Eastern Cape, he answered zero of the 89 enquiries.

Speaker, how we manage the public healthcare system is a matter of life and death. Stats SA reports that 17 out of 100 residents in South Africa cannot afford medical aid. This means that 42 million people are entirely dependent on public health facilities. Speaker, now our public health system is on the brink of a complete overhaul with public hearings for the NHI Bill which commenced on 18 May 2021.

A study by the South African Medical Research Council on the comments made during public hearings showed that whilst there is a desperate need for access to quality medical care, residents have severe concerns on the state of corruption, capacity to deliver on the major reform of healthcare financing and the delivery system that is proposed. The study shows that concerns have been mirrored by shortcomings laid bare by National Government's COVID-19 response. This speaks to ANC failures in centralised leadership and power, institutional incapacity, the collapse of parts of the healthcare system and poor planning and foresight in relation to accessing and rolling out vaccines.

It is worth remembering that these policies and failures are the vision of the EFF too. Contrary to the EFF and ANC's failed ideas, the World Health Organisation indicates that best practice is decentralised health systems. It

argues that community-based care is at the core of universal healthcare. But what the ANC and EFF endorsed NHI will do is centralise the funds for this. In other words, Speaker, centralise the money for more looting which we all know is the ANC and EFF's favourite pastime, whether it is on the streets or in Treasury.

It is quite ironic for the EFF to call for this debate when it has avoided constructive input in the management of COVID-19 and when its party was seen participating in destructive activities instead. Speaker, the only viable alternative is the Western Cape model. We have shown we can expend quality, affordable and accessible care in stark contrast to National Government's COVID-19 management. The Western Cape Government showcased good governance through innovation and the ability to establish and provide world-class facilities.

The Provincial Government was recognised for its partnership with the private sector which would be completely evaded with the implementation of the NHI and centralised State-led healthcare as the EFF and ANC prefer. Speaker, there is no need for drastic reform, not a single citizen can afford this in terms of health and wealth, it will only be through a commitment to capacity building, through competence, through a true focus on dignity and wellbeing, via capable and innovative governance by which we achieve a world-class system. I thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Philander. There is a point of order, hon members in the Chamber. What is your point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: My point of order Speaker, is the fact that this bench continues to be challenged by a technical issue that I have raised at least four times: that the plugs in this particular bench and in that particular bench where the Leader of the Opposition normally sits have simply not been working. I am not sure Speaker, if you can tell us which of these plugs on this side are as they are there specifically to charge laptops and phones. I have raised this issue at least four times and it just never gets done. I am not sure if we need to call a session of this House to deal with this problem or if I need to write to you personally, but it is becoming incredibly frustrating. I am not sure whether the DA plugs work but these plugs on the Opposition side, they do not work.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It is very difficult for me to continue to participate in this debate unless these plugs are dealt with now. So could I just ask you if these plugs could be fixed up so that we can continue with the work that we are trying to do here? Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore. I think, hon members, it is a very fair point. Will you please switch off your microphone there, hon Dugmore? I just wish to raise it with the accounting officer, who is here, to attend to that expeditiously. We will just monitor that, and I need feedback on that, but we are not going to have a debate on it. We will just make sure we fix them

because it is something that must be addressed expeditiously. I do not want us to even get to a debate, it must be done, it was supposed to be fixed. The next time we sit here, hon Dugmore, they should be working. In fact, I am giving an undertaking now that they will be working. There is no way that we can have such points of order in a sitting like this one. So we have to address that, and I will attend to that.

May I then request that the proceedings continue with the request that I have made. Hon Christians, I apologise. It was an important matter of tools of trade for members here. May I then request that you proceed, and you have got two minutes.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you Speaker, thank you for that. Speaker, a world-class system functions optimally. It is guided by accepted standard operating procedures. It is staffed by trained and qualified personnel and has access to research and development within its sphere of operation and works within its budgetary guidelines.

Now as we know South Africa has more than 400 public hospitals and 200 private hospitals. Of these Tygerberg Hospital and Groote Schuur Hospital are training hospitals in the Western Cape and I must say that these institutions produce doctors and nurses that are sought after worldwide as witnessed by them being employed abroad.

But Speaker, there is one concern and that is where we saw shortcomings in

the system with COVID-19. People were turned around when they got to hospitals for oxygen and were told to go to private hospitals. They were not on medical aid and private hospitals said we can only assist you if you contribute something like R100 000. Speaker, we heard this from people phoning us and asking us if we could intervene. So people, the poor, are still struggling to get services that require – and it is between life and death.

Hon Speaker, requirements that we need when it comes to world-class status are a stable work force, trained personnel, financial resources, technology and equipment and we know what I am referring to. I am going to close there because I see my time is up but just to say that South Africa needs, the Western Cape needs a world-class system, and we can really improve. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. Hon members, I now recognise hon Bans.

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, Speaker. Hon Speaker, it is important to state up front that the COVID-19 pandemic did not create our healthcare challenges. It exposed the already existing challenges and worsened them. Many of these persistent challenges such as poor and dilapidated infrastructure in many facilities, shortages of staff and service pressures have long existed and were overlooked and ignored by the Provincial Government.

The decommissioning of the GF Jooste Hospital in 2014, the only hospital

serving the Klipfontein area which comprises Manenberg, Gugulethu and Nyanga, added to the health challenges in the province. We still want to know why the DA closed that hospital without any plans to build a new one and even worse, why they had to lie about it and said the replacement hospital would be completed by the end of 2018/2019 financial year. It is because of such senseless decisions that the majority of the healthcare challenges are found in our poor working-class communities.

Allow me to take a few examples from the South African Communist Party's Hunger, Health And Housing Campaign Report which found glaring challenges in the province. At Hanna Coetzee Clinic on the West Coast there are reports of long queues of people standing outside the facility and patients waiting over five hours to be attended to. There is only one toilet for the staff, the reception area is crowded with unattached documents and there are no doctor's consultation rooms. According to the clinic manager, they are experiencing staff shortages. The clinic only has 11 nurses, only four nurses are working per day whereas there are supposed to be six. Nurses are also complaining about not having ambulances. Doctors only come to prescribe patient's medications three times a week without examining them.

Similar challenges were found at Diasville Clinic in Saldanha. The prefabricated facility has eight consultation rooms, a waiting room and a reception area. The original clinic was burnt down during service delivery protests. The report found that there was no social distancing at the clinic especially in the long queues outside the facility. There is no triage system as

people living with disability, chronic illness, children and elderly people queued outside for long hours. There are only two nurses at the clinic and no fulltime doctor. The doctor only comes twice a week.

†Somlomo, [Speaker], we picked up similar challenges during our own oversight multi-party visit to Swellendam Railton Clinic and the Worcester Community Healthcare Centre where there are glaring infrastructure challenges and staff shortages. For example, in Swellendam one door to enter the clinic facility, the same door for exit. Should there be a fire what is going to happen next?

I do not want to speak, hon Speaker, about Worcester Clinic; should there be pouring rain, the entire community has to wait outside. It is a disaster. The DA must take responsibility. In the Karoo, where I reside, chronically ill people are forced to sleep on benches the whole night in the cold waiting room awaiting an ambulance from Beaufort West to Groote Schuur or Red Cross hospital. The waiting conditions are traumatising and add more to their illness

†Umntwana omncinci, Somlomo, una-eight years, uya eKapa uya ukuyozifumanela iyeza nje ukuba makafumane i-chemo. Instead ukuba makanyangelwe nge-chemo, uthi efike kweli Kapa, sele egula kakade kwingqele ayichole phaya kwesa sibhedlele, Ukulinda ubusuko bonke.

[Translation of isi-Xhosa paragraph follows.]

[Speaker, a small eight year old child has to go to Cape Town for chemotherapy. They end up having a fever or cold that they picked from hospital from waiting all night to be seen to.]

The DA must take responsibility, it cannot continue like that, Speaker. †Ons kan nie so onverantwoordelik wees en maak asof dit gewoonlik is en elke keer die blaam skuif na die Nasionale Regering toe nie, dit is onaanvaarbaar. [We cannot be so irresponsible and pretend that it is the usual and shift the blame to the National Government every time, it is unacceptable.]

This is precisely why South Africa needs the National Healthcare Insurance as a means to ensure and improve quality healthcare services especially for the poor people. At its 54th National Conference, the ANC reaffirmed its resolutions on the NHI and that its implementation remains a priority of the Government so much so that the ANC will ensure that the legislative framework on the NHI is finalised by the end of the current term.

Through the NHI, the ANC Government seeks to move the country into universal health coverage where everyone will receive quality healthcare regardless of his or her economic status stopping the attitude of saying that the Western Cape is doing its best while we are fabricating what is really happening. Through the NHI the ANC seeks to address challenges faced by people in rural communities such as the West Coast who cannot easily obtain healthcare. It seeks to address standards of healthcare gaps between the rich and the poor which continues to widen.

Speaker, the majority of our people in the poor working-class communities rely on overcrowded public health facilities with few health professionals and poor equipment. The right to health should not depend on one's economic status or where one happens to live. †Somlomo, [Speaker] despite all these benefits of the NHI, the DA remains vehemently opposed to it for five reasons which were outlined by its former leader, Mmusi Maimane, mainly consisting of concerns that the NHI will leave the province powerless and that it will collapse the private sector and the economy. Whose interests are we carrying? This clearly shows the DA does not care about the poor, it only cares about the private sector and the white-run economy. The NHI will reduce the cost of private healthcare, it will still provide a good income for health professionals and health institutions in the private sector but will use a more cost-effective method of payment than currently used by the medical aid schemes. †Ndiyabulela, Somlomo. [I thank you, Speaker].

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Bans. †Siyabulela, kakhulu. [We thank you very much.] I now recognise the hon Minister of Transport and Public Works.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I welcome the opportunity to make a contribution to this very important debate as a Minister whose Department has taken significant steps to empower and transform the minibus taxi industry in South Africa in the process of supporting and strengthening the Western Cape Health facilities towards building a world-class health system.

Speaker, as you and the members of this House will recall, under the Alert Level 4 regulations of the National State of Disaster last year, public transport had to stop operating at 7 o' clock and could only resume at 5 the next morning. This was obviously problematic for the many public health employees whose shifts ended at 7 o' clock. In response to this unacceptable situation created by the lack of clear planning nationally, my Department came up with an initiative to assist the Department of Health employees who needed to travel to and from work during difficult times.

Speaker, this led to the birth of the Red Dot Lite. Speaker, Red Dot is a partnership between the Western Cape Government and the minibus taxi industry to deliver critical transport services as part of the fight against COVID-19. The service is called Red Dot because of the sticker on the vehicles making them easily identifiable for the intended passengers.

It continued to transport safely; essential healthcare workers who had been left stranded due to the limited public transport operating hours in the evenings as long as these restrictions were in place. Speaker, even now the service currently offers staff of Brackengate Field Hospital transport in the morning and the evening from their houses or nearby landmarks to and from Brackengate. Speaker, we did not end there. People who tested positive for COVID-19 and were required to go into quarantine because of high risks, were also assisted by my Department.

Because many people Speaker, were unable to quarantine or isolate

themselves, we established public quarantine and isolation facilities across the Western Cape using state and private property. Red Dot supported the effective functioning of these facilities by providing safe transport for those who needed it. As a government, we are carefully monitoring the service with trackers and intelligent transport systems linked to the Department's transport hub as well as on the ground monitoring. Because Speaker, we are a government with a vision and a government who cares about its people, we then took this service a step further. The Red Dot taxi is now providing transport to vaccine sites for those who are unable to travel themselves, including those who cannot afford or do not have access to public transport.

The Provincial Department of Health identifies those in need of transport through its on the ground local community liaison officers and they are then transported by the Red Dot taxis, through my Department. Speaker, we prioritise the elderly and those with special needs. To date Speaker, 7 809 passengers have been transported through the Red Dot initiative. More than 240 000 healthcare worker trips have occurred through Red Dot since 18 May 2020.

At least 25 hospitals were supported including Groote Schuur, Tygerberg, Helderberg, Lenteguur, Khayelitsha District Hospital, Brackengate and a number of other clinics. Over 27 000 quarantine and isolation trips have occurred since 30 May 2020, transporting patients both to and from public quarantine and isolation facilities in the Metro and non-Metro areas. The Red Dot transport service transported 3 100 discharged patients home from

1 January 2021.

Speaker, in total Red Dot made 280 000 passenger trips across this province. This year alone the Western Cape Department of Transport and Public Works has brought online 32 isolation and quarantine facilities with a bed capacity of 2 115 across the province for residents who are not able to isolate or quarantine at their own homes. We have also established the dedicated 864 bed CTICC Hospital of Hope for COVID-19 patients. This hospital has since been decommissioned and the services moved to the Brackengate Hospital of Hope. Speaker, we are not only providing transport and quarantine and isolation facilities to help improve the health system of this province; we build world-class health facilities too.

The new Observatory Forensic Pathology Institute that has been built by my Department will add significant capacity to our current pathology services. Speaker, the R287 million, Level Four forensic pathology facility which is located at the entrance of Groote Schuur, will replace the existing forensic pathology facility in Salt River. This three-story facility will enable better integration of the work of the Provincial Forensic Pathology Service and the National Health Laboratory Service, coupled with resources to support the University of Cape Town's academic training in this field.

The design and construction of this facility is of a highly complex nature and takes into consideration processes aimed at extracting, analysing and preserving the integrity of evidence for use within the criminal justice

system, if and when required. Once completed, Speaker, the following core facilities will be incorporated into this world-class facility: 26 autopsy tables; 360 refrigerated body spaces; 180 admission fridges and 180 despatch fridges. In addition, Speaker, the building will be able to accommodate up to 100 visitors to the bereavement centre per day, up to 10 waiting undertakers and up to 20 students at a time.

Speaker, I am very proud to be part of a government that is building a healthcare system that is of the highest standard, further boosting the reputation of the Western Cape as a centre of excellence for medical and related services. The Western Cape Government cares for the people, it does not just talk about caring. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Mitchell. I just want to request the hon members not to clap otherwise you create a problem which is inconsistent with the Rules of hybrid sittings. Thank you, hon Minister. I now recognise the hon, the Leader of the Opposition.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, Speaker. I think we must just recognise if the DA does not clap for themselves, no one will. I also want to say thank you very much to Mr Wayne Naidoo who has made an interim arrangement here where my laptop is now being charged. I really appreciate that.

Allow me to start, Speaker, by welcoming this debate which the EFF has

sponsored today. We have to strengthen the health system within our province especially in building what we refer to as a world-class system. But the question is what is a world-class system? The MEC unsurprisingly failed today to give the poor and vulnerable hope in ensuring that they too have access to quality and affordable healthcare. Access to quality and affordable healthcare to the poorest of the poor, that Speaker, is a world-class health system.

We are clear as the ANC, we must introduce a healthcare system that will ensure that all our people, especially the poor and the working class have access to quality healthcare. It is for this reason that the National Health Insurance System was introduced. The NHI, as with other healthcare systems across the world, is the response to ensuring that our country indeed develops a world-class healthcare system.

It is clear that the DA does not want that kind of a world-class healthcare system. For them a world-class healthcare system means access, to the few who can afford it, to healthcare. To the DA, medical aid remains the answer and they see health as a commodity; to the DA, the exploitation by medical aid schemes of workers is the answer; to the DA, it is the survival of the fittest and if you cannot afford medical aid and private healthcare, then it is just too bad.

Speaker, the DA's health policy says, and I want to quote:

“Based on our experience in running the Western Cape Health

Department since 2009, we believe that the goal of adequate universal health access to health for all in South Africa citizens can be achieved largely within existing administrative structures and the available resource envelope.”

You go to Hornlee who have been waiting for six years for a community clinic and you ask them whether they believe that they have a world-class system. In other words, the DA wants the status quo to remain. Yet the status quo according to Stats SA is that South Africa’s current healthcare system works only for 16% of South Africans but as the DA health policy says, for them the existing administrative structures and available resources, that envelope is sufficient.

The DA believes that the current healthcare system in fact should remain the same. We can understand this because they speak not on behalf of the poor and working class of Mitchells Plain, Khayelitsha, Pacaltsdorp or Paarl East; no, the DA speaks on behalf of those who can afford to go a Panorama, a Pallotti or a Peninsula. This debate today proves that. There is no commitment to ensure that all of our people have access to quality and affordable healthcare. Like access to land, like access to public quality and equal education, like access to unemployment insurance and so on because the DA even opposed the issue of the minimum wage when the President came with the minimum wage and consulted which was R3 500. The DA said, no, that is too much you must have an opt out clause for R1 800. We and our people will never vote for this Democratic Alliance again, they have proved

themselves an elitist, racist party not interested or concerned with the majority. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon the Leader of the Opposition. Hon members I now recognise the hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you hon Speaker and thank you for giving an opportunity to take part in this debate. Indeed, as my colleagues Dr Nomafrench Mbombo, Chairperson, Wendy Philander and Minister Daylin Mitchell have indicated, the Western Cape health system is indeed world-class. But we also need to do more work to strengthen what we have got. This is how the Western Cape delivers, we are not immune to criticism, we take things into account, and we improve.

Can I actually start by responding to hon Xego. I wanted to respond to hon Dugmore but there is nothing really that he said, the fact that the party says that we do not care for the poor, we do not have a healthcare policy is actually bizarre ... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You do not, I quoted ... [Interjection.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ... given the fact the hon Dugmore's party's healthcare ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ... policy seems to be let us steal from the poor.

The SPEAKER: Will you please take your seat, hon Mackenzie. I would like to request the hon members not to interject in terms of the Rules of hybrid sittings. We do not do that, otherwise the House is going to descend into chaos, so let us please be consistent with our Standing Rules. May I request the microphone there in front of you hon Dugmore, to be switched off. Thank you. Thank you, hon Sayed. May I request the hon Mackenzie to proceed.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Speaker. I will leave hon Dugmore for last, through you, so that he can in the meantime try and find some money to pay his staff. Hon Xego, the Western Cape Government does not lack adequate medical supplies. In fact, through you hon Speaker, the hon Xego said that it was and to quote him: “the poorest of the poor are receiving negligence by the Provincial Government”.

That is quite rich coming from Hon Xego because it was hon Xego and his party leadership that led a march in a global pandemic without masks by the poorest of the poor. It was hon Xego and his political party that stormed Clicks, 452 stores with pharmacies in their stores, of which a woman ended up in hospital. It was hon Xego’s party that assaulted journalists in Parliament that needed a world-class healthcare; it was hon Xego and his party’s leadership that fired rifles in the air in an open stadium for people

that needed the world-class health facility; it was hon Xego's party and the leadership that marched to the South African Health Products Regulatory Authority's office with thousands of people, many without masks, during a global pandemic. Those people needed world-class health services.

So hon Xego's party is very hypocritical and of course he will bring in the expropriation of land with health which I will respond to, hon Speaker. If hon Xego must know, when you build a world class health facility, you need money and when you go to a bank to borrow money, you need surety, you need security, and that surety is land. So if you take land without compensation from the private sector, from people, they will not have money to lend, and you will not be able to build a world-class health facility. Given that hon Xego's party in my research submitted a Bill to Parliament; the Bill bizarrely was shut down by Parliament as undesirable. Now imagine how poor your Bill has to be for a group of undesirables such as the ANC to call you undesirable. So hon Xego, you actually do not have a health policy. Hon Brett Herron interestingly ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: [Inaudible.] will you please take your seat.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: I found your health policy, via you, hon Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: There is a point of order. Hon Sayed, what is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, on a point of order, the hon Mackenzie is directly addressing the hon Herron and the hon Xego. Can you please rule on that.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed. Hon Mackenzie, please take your seat. I was listening carefully and hoping that I will [Inaudible.] that earlier but he was not in any way transgressing the Rules initially, but I think towards the middle of his address he got a bit out of the way there, so if you could please, hon Mackenzie, observe the Rules. You can do whatever you wish to do through the Speaker, please, so that the Presiding Officer remains in charge of the House.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Speaker. Through you, to hon Herron, I managed to find that in his not so good party manifesto, buried on page 7, second from last, there seems to be a rough remark made to the health policy and looking at it and looking at the DA policy, it seems like it was a 'cut and paste'. So hon Herron, via you Speaker, if you do not know how to cut, do not paste. Hon Herron also referred to Premier Alan Winde, via you Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon Mackenzie. What is your point of order, hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIP WHIP (ANC): Chair, if you listened carefully, he did it again just before he spoke through you, he did it again, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed. Let me just say this now so that we are on the same page. Often, when he refers to a member, he first says, through you Speaker, so if I heard him incorrectly, I am sure the hon Mackenzie will assist me. Will you please proceed, hon Mackenzie and observe the Rule.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you. Through you, Speaker, hon Herron, through you, Speaker, talks about political opportunism and false promises but is not that what the hon Herron, via you Speaker, is busy with, taking pictures with kids playing in parks, without masks by the way, hon Speaker. In fact, hon Speaker, the Premier Alan Winde did the right thing at the beginning of the vaccine strategy. Hon Winde did the right thing. He said, to quote hon Herron, via you Speaker: "Do not trust the National Government." And look where we ended up, the Minister of Health, R182 million, Digital Vibes and his Director General and his Chief Financial Officer. So, via you, hon Speaker, hon Winde was right, and I admire his strategy to say seeing that the ANC Government cannot be trusted, we will do it alone and that is what this Government believes in.

Hon Windvogel, via you, Speaker: we do use statistics, that is how we work. We use facts. The ANC unfortunately does not use statistics because facts do not lie. So hon Windvogel, via you Speaker, this Government will consistently use facts because that is how we govern, and we will continue to govern like that.

Via you, Speaker, hon Bans, you are absolutely right, I agree with you 100%; COVID-19 did not create our healthcare challenges. It was the ANC that created our challenges before COVID-19.

In fact, via you, Speaker, the ANC were world-class thieves before COVID-19 and COVID-19 exposed them to become Olympic champions, gold medal thieves, that cannot pay their own staff salaries nor register their own councillors. So long die the ANC; the ANC must be dead for South Africa to survive.

Hon Speaker, via you, hon Bans was absolutely right, to quote her, she said: “people come to the Western Cape for health services, but they take longer to get the care.”

Now the question, hon Bans, via you Speaker, must ask herself is why do people come to the Western Cape for health services? They come here because the corrupt ANC in the East is incapable of providing health services and furthermore hon Bans, via you Speaker, we send doctors, specialists from the Western Cape to go and help the Eastern Cape. So the hon Bans, via you Speaker, should be very grateful for the great Western Cape Government.

We do not need the NHI and via you, Speaker, member Dugmore talked about the same thing around the NHI. The same people that want to build up the NHI are the same party that stole billions of Rands during a global pandemic and I can name them: Dr Masuku from Gauteng was fired; in the North West,

Dr Tshabalala; an MEC in Nelson Mandela Bay, I mean there are names and names. I can write a book from here to Timbuktu. During a global pandemic, how many ANC MECs and Ministers were fired because ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Mackenzie, will you please take your seat. I have paused the watch. I have got a hand in the virtual platform, the Chief Whip of the Opposition. Is that a point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, it is a point of order, Speaker. Hon Mackenzie in his speech says hon Bans said that people came to the Western Cape, and I would like you to rule on that because hon Bans did not say people come to the Western Cape but she said people are driven from Beaufort West to Red Cross or Groote Schuur. So I want to ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... understand from him if he deliberately said that hon Bans said people are coming to the Western Cape when they are actually in the Western Cape.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Lekker. As the Chief Whip I am sure that you will accept that that is a point of debate. It is purely an opinion that you are expressing because in terms of the Rules, if the hon member wishes to address the Speaker on being misquoted, she must follow the Rules and Rule 65 will afford her the opportunity to do so. I have done this previously where

I have requested the hon members to do so if they so wish, but I do not think there is a point of order there to be entertained. May I request the hon Mackenzie to proceed.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): He is misleading the House.

The SPEAKER: I see the hand is still up. My apologies again hon Mackenzie. Hon Lekker, what is your point of order and what Rule are you rising on?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I am rising on the same Rule that you have highlighted Speaker, but you say ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: [Inaudible.] let us ...

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You really need – on Rule 65, Mr Speaker, that hon Mackenzie is misleading the House. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Well, it is not really the correct Rule, but the point is that again I will give the same response and I would like to recognise the Chief Whip of the majority party, her hand is up. Hon Wenger?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. I rise on Rule 66 (5). You have made a ruling on the matter and Rule 66 (5) says a member who is aggrieved may not challenge a ruling in the House which is what the Chief Whip of the Opposition is attempting to do. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Chief Whip. I just want to request the hon members just be a bit patient. I think we are almost done with the debate, and we have been having a good spirit and I must say there is no need for us to go on like this and there is now another hand from hon Mbombo, the Minister of Health. What is your point of order Minister?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, Speaker. I just want to indicate that although you have ruled about it, but hon Bans said that in Xhosa. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you hon Minister. I have made the ruling on this matter, and I want us to proceed. I am not going to entertain any other points of order. May I then request the hon Mackenzie to proceed.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Speaker may I ask ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Mackenzie, you have used five minutes 41 seconds and then that means you have got just over three minutes.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Speaker, just a pity I have been consistently interrupted but hon Speaker, there is a big difference between the DA and the ANC-led Government and as hon Dugmore said, via you Speaker, 16% of people have access to healthcare but who is to blame for that? Where did the billions go in the last 27 years? Medupi's over budget by tens of billions of Rands, the money is still missing. So the reason we have

only 16% access to healthcare is not because of the DA but because the ANC cadres keep on stealing the money and that unfortunately, whether other members will like it or not, is a fact.

Hon Speaker, via you, whilst the DA Western Cape Government during the global pandemic was building temporary hospitals like the CTICC and investing in permanent infrastructure, we saw how the ANC in the Eastern Cape, which is the most corrupt government in the country, were using wheelbarrows as ambulances, a disgrace to millions of the poorest of the poor they keep on mentioning in their speeches. That is the difference between the DA.

Hon Windvogel, via you Speaker, talked about Mr Daniels. Now there would be more money left to serve Mr Daniels and other people like him if the ANC stopped stealing; if they stopped cutting budgets in the country; if they start fuelling the economy and not reappointing fired cadres like the President's spokesperson who was fired; now she is promoted to a Deputy Director General. That is the difference between the DA and the ANC-led Government.

Hon Speaker, last week the SIU was in Parliament. In Gauteng, where the ANC governs, 1 813 open cases of corruption: PPE. Nearly R7 billion during a global pandemic, all under the ANC. So, the more Mr Daniels that needs help as quoted by member Windvogel, the more we can help them if the ANC stops stealing. The municipalities that were named in the SIU report –

Kannaland, Cederberg, Matzikama – ANC Government stealing Health money during a global pandemic. That is the difference between the DA and the ANC. So, we do not need the NHI because the ANC will just steal more. That is the reality. So, long die the NHI, may the NHI die.

Interestingly, member Herron did not once issue a statement in this House, as far as I know, condemning the billions in corruption, the bed partners of the ANC, so the voters of the Western Cape must know – do not vote for people that do not speak out against corruption of the ANC. Why is the GOOD, ANC alliance †so tonge, honger tonge vir die Kaap? Want hulle wil steel om die ANC se salarisse te betaal want die kwyle tap vir daardie *billions of billions* [showing tongues, hungry tongues for the Cape? Because they want to steal to pay the ANC salaries because they are salivating for those billions of billions] of taxpayer's money in the City of Cape Town because they want to pay their staff with taxpayers' money. The people of this province should not allow them, not give them any municipality to govern because we know, just like what they did during the global pandemic, stealing billions of rands? That is exactly what they will do for the City of Cape Town.

So, the people of the Western Cape know our health service is good, we have bad health services in the country and this Government will continue to invest in a futuristic health service under the DA-led Government that has done extremely well under the leadership of Dr Nomafrench Mbombo, Premier Winde and this whole Cabinet where the ANC has been stealing and looting. And like I said, †die kwyle tap [they are salivating] for those

billions of rands in the City of Cape Town that they want to steal. So consistently, the DA governs better, we invest in health care ...

[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: And we deliver world class health services. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon Mackenzie. I know it can be very tempting not to clap, but please, hon members, let us exercise some restraint. I now recognise the hon Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, hon Speaker. Let me borrow from the very same words of hon Lekker, who earlier quoted Amílcar Cabral, when he says:

“Hide nothing from the masses of our people. Expose lies whenever they are told. Mask no difficulties, mistakes and failures. Tell no lies. Claim no easy victories.”

I just want to wish to remind the hon Mackenzie, through you, hon Deputy Speaker, that actually, it was the Democratic Alliance, led by the Minister of Agriculture, who taught the people of the Western Cape that we can gather during the lockdown regulations and restrictions in Parliament, when he led a group of land thieves to come and claim that there was a genocide of white

farmers in South Africa. It was actually the DA-sponsored protest that filled all the beaches in the Western Cape where people were violating lockdown regulations and they risked the lives of South Africans.

So, indeed, the hon Mbombo is trying her utmost best to see to it that we have got an amicable solution to the challenges facing the health system, but unfortunately, the hon Mbombo is coming from a wrong party that does not support the very same understanding of which she is trying so hard to improve the lives of our people in the Western Cape. But it is very clear that she is being sabotaged from within because the pilot project of Grabouw that she has started is, indeed, an idea of the EFF and of which we appreciate what she has done. Let me quote for the last time from Amílcar Cabral that when he says:

“Always bear in mind that the people are not fighting for ideas, for the things in anyone’s head. They are fighting to win material benefits, to live better and in peace, to see their lives go forward, to guarantee the future of their children.”

What we are asking for is not a policy position, we just want the implementation of seeing to it that the saving of the lives of the people of the Western Cape takes centre stage and it is implemented by a Government who claims to be caring, under the Democratic Alliance Government. So, to come here and blame the National Government, instead of taking full responsibility for your failures, as the Democratic Alliance, is a serious challenge that we

are faced with. And it is a clear sign that the Democratic Alliance, indeed, is still not the people's choice going forward to the Local Government elections. It is a sign of people who are throwing in the towel and who are not prepared to take our people forward.

And lastly, to the hon Philander who earlier responded in defence of the Democratic Alliance's negligence, through you, hon Deputy Speaker, it was Minister Mbombo who claimed that Cuba, as one of the inspirations of the EFF, is implementing the current system that is people-centred at the present moment. So, we welcome ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M XEGO: Dr Mombo's acknowledgement of such and she must just give lessons to these ones in the Democratic Alliance. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time is up. Thank you very much. That concludes the debate on this subject. We will now move over to Statements. I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS:

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Winter has come and gone, and five months after the 108 families of District Six

were expected to return home, they are still waiting for concrete timelines from the National Department of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development, to hand over the keys to Phase 3 on Hanover Street. Without communication from the National Department, District Six residents are left with only uncertainty.

Recently, District Six residents have approached the DA and the Western Cape Government about the resettlement of their community. A 94-year-old former District Six resident, wrote to Premier Winde requesting assistance in making National Government aware and also, the Land Claims Commissioner, of the time urgency, when it comes to restitution for herself and other elderly residents of District Six. Her family received a letter from the Land Claims office in 2018 stating that after 19 years of waiting, her claim has been put on hold pending the National Assembly's decisions on land claims in District Six. And so, three years later and she is still waiting.

In August, we received a request for assistance in getting feedback and an update on the claim for an 82-year-old resident. Despite being allocated residency in the area, she has not received any feedback from the Department on the progress of her home. The claimant's family have raised their concerns about the progress on the District Six Restitution and how the delay is negatively affecting her health.

I bring this matter to the attention of the Department and this House, because this matter should be a priority. That is why I will continue to voice the

concerns of these residents and call on National Government to act with urgency. It is time that District Six residents went home. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the ANC.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. In reply to my written question about the total amount spent on the Western Cape Safety Plan to date and details about training, MEC Fritz indicated that a total amount of R576 541 724 has been spent on the Safety Plan up to 31 July 2021. Despite this high expenditure, the 2021/2022 first quarter crime statistics shows a 29,3% increase in the murder rate between April to June 2021. And in the same period in 2021/2022, over R500 million has been spent on the Plan since 2019, yet there is nothing to show for it as crime and violence worsens in the Western Cape.

When Premier Winde launched the Safety Plan, our immediate reaction was that the plan was nothing but an electioneering ploy. The ANC reiterates that the Safety Plan is a sham. It is uncoordinated and will only result in waste of scarce resources without achieving its intended outcomes. For as long as the Safety Plan does not address the underlying causes of crime and violence, then it will never succeed in decreasing the murder rate. The plan must address the environmental design challenges in the top ten crime hotspot areas, which are hampering SAPS' ability to combat crime. It must respond to

unemployment, poverty and inequalities.

Under ministerial responsibilities, MEC Bredell is responsible for the review of policies and processes, to improve safety through urban and rural planning, design and spatial planning. He must give an update to this House on how far he is in the process and MEC Fritz must tell the House why the initial proposal to appoint 250 detectives was not implemented. They have an opportunity today to respond to this statement. The Safety Plan is a DA-election ploy to disperse patronage through paying stipends for the Safety Ambassador Project and Area-Based Team so they can get votes during the upcoming Local Government elections. The DA provincial police force campaign is in line with its campaign for the reestablishment of the Cape Colony. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member, your time is up. I now recognise the EFF.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The EFF vehemently condemns the dedication of a monument in honour of an unhonourable man in the form of DA Saldanha Executive Mayor, Marius Koen. This is the same man who lied, not long ago, about possessing qualifications which he does not have. In an effort to try and purify his image, the same man orchestrated a cheap political campaigning tactic, using staff at the municipality to try drive praises and honour in his direction. When his evil move failed, the same man tried to play hero again by making

remarks that he ordered his staff not to celebrate him, as he is only a public servant.

The DA should be ashamed to have a white man who is an attention monger and draws attention to himself, even when it is not necessary. It is extremely insensitive and shocking that Koen and the DA-led municipality would use municipality resources in the form of a South African Heritage grant to celebrate nonsensical things. As the EFF, we call on the broader society to reject the honouring of white supremacy on any given time and day. Here we are dealing with a party and an individual who will go to any lengths to celebrate the children of colonisers who took the land away from the indigenous people of this land, the real people of the First World, which is Africa. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

Ms W F PHILANDER (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, recent data from provincial hospitals paints a very clear picture. COVID-19 vaccines are working and they are saving lives. Data, this week, from Groote Schuur Hospital shows that all COVID-19 patients on ventilators or in ICU, are unvaccinated. Not one vaccinated resident is in ICU at that academic hospital, but we still have a long way to go. Only about 17% of South Africans are fully vaccinated against the virus and vaccine hesitancy remains a challenge we must all confront.

Recent interviews conducted by the Bhekisisa Centre for health journalism indicate that empathy is crucial in helping a friend, a family member or a neighbour to make the decision to get vaccinated. People are worried about side effects, they are fearful of any truth to conspiracy theories and in a world of rapid change, they are understandably anxious, but we cannot afford to be dismissive. We need to listen with empathy and take the time to understand valid concerns.

We cannot ignore the fact that many of our vulnerable communities have previously been excluded from healthcare and so, the very idea of a free life-saving jab is an entirely foreign concept, but what we can do is focus on the positive outcomes. We can share our own experiences and applaud our fellow residents for taking the time to seriously consider the vaccine in the first place and by being honest about the side effects, we build a bridge of trust.

Finally, hon Deputy Speaker, we have got to keep the message of hope alive, hope that we will see our grandchildren graduate, hope that we will keep our parents in our lives for so much longer and hope for a kinder, safer future. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise GOOD.

Mr B N HERRON: Hon Deputy Speaker, we have no statement. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, the ACDP is in direct opposition to mandatory vaccinations, as contemplated by the Western Cape Government under the leadership of Premier Alan Winde. The Western Cape Government under the leadership of Premier Winde is in direct conflict with the Constitution which states, Chapter 2, subsection 2(b) in the Bill of Rights, that:

“Everyone has the right to bodily and psychological integrity, which includes the right

(b) To security in and control over their body”

The ACDP believes strongly that forcing people to vaccinate against COVID-19 is a direct contravention of the Bill of Rights. Then, to top it all, the Premier of the Western Cape is contemplating if some sort of identification must be given to those who are vaccinated.

Hon Deputy Speaker, many people have contacted the ACDP that is against mandatory vaccination. Just today, before this meeting, I was contacted by a mother from Stellenbosch saying her daughter, who is an occupational therapy student at the University of Stellenbosch, received a letter with the heading:

“Getting vaccinated is a priority”

She further informed me that News24 has also reported that the South African Committee of Medical Deans has now recommended mandatory vaccinations for all health and science students.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the ACDP is opposed to people being forced against their will, to vaccinate. It must be a choice. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise the ANC.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. As the ANC, we are aghast at the blatancy of the disregard for the truth by this DA-led Provincial Administration, with respect to the Children's Commissioner. Be that as it may, the ANC wishes to recognise its role and the role played by many in civil society who championed the very establishment of this Office of the Children's Commissioner.

After many years of pleading with this Provincial Administration, the deliberate refusal by Helen Zille's administration, after having promised this in 2009, to establish the Commissioner and after continuous pressure placed on this current Premier and his administration by the ANC and civil society, the Provincial Government finally relented.

The ANC, again, together with civil society, finally welcomed with all parties, the appointment of Christina Nomdo. We wish to take this

opportunity once again to commend the work Ms Nomdo is doing and alert her that the ANC has noted the restraints placed upon her and her office, by the Department of the Premier.

The ANC continues to commit its fervent support and backing of the Commissioner and her Office and calls upon the Provincial Treasury to fund the Commissioner's Office directly, rather than through the Office of the Premier. The Commissioner, as a Chapter 9 institution of our Provincial Constitution, is accountable to this Legislature, hon Deputy Speaker, not to the Department of the Premier. We condemn any attempt to house the Commissioner in the Department of the Premier and the ANC does not fear fighting this next fight because with the DA, you have to fight and fight, but eventually, you do win.

The ANC calls on civil society to join it again, in order to ensure (1) the independence and impartiality of the Commissioner, that the Provincial Treasury (2) directly funds the Children's Commissioner and (3), that we continue to pursue the path of pushing for the Environmental Commissioner, also a provision of our Provincial Constitution, victories which we will attain, but which the DA, no doubt, will then, again, claim dishonestly, 'we want the Environmental Commissioner, we have the Children's Commissioner' ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thanks.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: But we continue to advance their role and objectives in this province. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, on Tuesday morning a horrendous and fatal crash occurred between Villiersdorp and Grabouw on the R321, which resulted in the deaths of three in an SUV and two in the cab of a truck transporting farm workers. I believe that I speak on behalf of all members in expressing our condolences to those injured in this accident, and to the friends and families of the deceased. There is no doubt in my mind that the death toll would have been much higher if the passengers were not seated in an enclosed BAS-type vehicle.

The Standing Committee on Agriculture has been attending to the issue of the safe and dignified transport of particularly farmworkers. As a Committee, we have already resolved to support both the Provincial Department and Agri Western Cape in their recommendations that employers transport passengers to no more than 50% of the registered carrying capacity in their vehicles and that COVID-19 health protocols are adhered to.

While human error remains the biggest cause of accidents, a lot can still be done to improve the safety of passengers. This accident, again, highlights the lack of legal frameworks to ensure the safe transport of agri-workers.

However, it should not stop there. There is consensus amongst all of us that farmers should be supported in providing safe transport options, including safe public transport.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I call on members to engage our colleagues in the National Parliament and particularly, colleagues in Cabinet, to realise the necessary legal and fiscal challenges in this regard. The agricultural industry is a significant contributor to the Western Cape's economic activity. We must do everything we can to ensure the safety and dignity of our farm workers. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise the Freedom Front Plus.

Mr P J MARAIS (FF PLUS): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. The Freedom Front Plus notes that in a poll commissioned by the Cape Independence Advocacy Group, 73,4% of people polled said, and I quote:

“South Africa was going in the wrong direction.”

69,6% said:

“Minority groups are being treated unfairly.”

67,9% said that:

“Provinces should be given more powers.”

And 52,3% wants the Western Cape to hold a referendum on the issue of independence for the Western Cape. Recently, in a subsequent poll, more than 800 000 people in the Western Cape voted for independence for the Western Cape. The Freedom Front Plus fully supports the call for an independent Western Cape to escape the runaway entrenched State corruption, lawlessness, incompetence at national, provincial and municipal levels and the economic implosion of our country. South Africa deserves a better government at all levels of government and the Freedom Front Plus will be leading the campaign for full Cape independence. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Now, I recognise Al Jama-Ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Local Government plays a pivotal role in South Africa's system of government. In addition to all the roles Local Government plays, it also has a specific role to play in providing adequate housing. In terms of Section 25 and 26 of the Constitution, legislations have been put in place to demarcate the role of municipalities in evictions. This spells out a framework within which municipalities must react to and deal with evictions.

In this province, we are witnessing unwarranted eviction scenes, reminiscent of the apartheid era Group Areas Act. Many eviction orders are not just and

equitable, as courts fail to take into consideration the relevant circumstances of people facing eviction, such as the rights and needs of the elderly, children, disabled people, and households headed by women where the land has been made available to relocate the unlawful occupier, circumstances under which the land has been occupied, the time period of occupation and most importantly, the availability of suitable alternative accommodation of land.

We commend the recent Cape Town High Court ruling that the City's policy was inconsistent and illogical in its application to evict 23 poor families from the Bromwell Street cottages in Woodstock. The Provincial Legislature should play a more effective oversight role in housing and must intervene to prevent the City's unreasonable and illogical court applications for evictions. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise the DA.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, yesterday I submitted a dossier to the Presidency for the urgent attention of the National Council on gender-based violence and femicide. The response that I received today from the Office of the President was disheartening. I was redirected to the Ministry of Police, the same ministry that could not be bothered to oversee their departments which have failed us, resulting in our current GBV crisis.

Minister Bheki Cele is already aware of this problem and has done nothing to

fix it. I had hoped that the President, in charge of this, spearheading this National Council, would have taken our concerns more seriously, instead of side-lining us and consequently, the survivors of gender-based violence in our province. We cannot continue, hon Deputy Speaker, to put the lives of women in the hands of an ambivalent Minister and a broken police service.

We took the initiative to alert the Office of the President after our parliamentary oversight activities revealed a backlog of over 37 000 sexual assault cases in our province alone, which is a result of the inefficient, manual DNA processing methods being used by the South African Police Service at its forensic labs. The critical work at these labs has the purpose of collecting evidence, solving cases and ultimately, supporting justice served through the court. However, the information that we have gleaned from a recent parliamentary reply and oversight activities, is a damning indictment of the incompetence from SAPS at a national level and that this resulted in thousands of women being denied their right to justice.

Hon Deputy Speaker, in criminal cases, the National Prosecuting Authority has a duty to prove its case beyond reasonable doubt. This is a high standard of proof required, meaning that DNA evidence is imperative to building a case and making sure offenders are properly sentenced. SAPS has had to rely on manual processing, as many of the machines at the FSL labs are out of service and have been for more than 1 200 days, leading to a minimum 18-month backlog of cases, this arising out of the inability for the Acquisitions Department of the National Office to facilitate a credible tendering process

for their maintenance.

Our request is for the National Government, especially, the political leadership of police, to give effect to the gender-based violence ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): And Femicide National Strategic Plan and for the President to act urgently. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. That brings us to the end of Statements. In terms of Rule 145(6), I now give one or more members of the Executive an opportunity to respond to any of the Members' Statements, for not more than 5 minutes collectively. Are there any Ministers who would like to respond? I do not see any names. I am going to proceed. Thank you very much, that brings us to the end of Members' Statements.

We now move over in terms of the new Rule 151, all Notices of Motion by members are required to be delivered to the Secretary by placing it on the Order Paper. These motions have been duly submitted and published on the Order Paper below the line.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Mr P J MARAIS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House, in anticipation of the adoption of the much-welcomed Municipal Systems Amendment Bill into law and the positive outcomes its application will have on good governance at municipal level, urges the Provincial Minister of Local Government to take all the necessary steps to get his Department in a state of readiness to meet the existing challenges presented by poorly managed municipal councils resulting in habitual, irregular and unauthorised spending to the detriment of communities.

[Notice of motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We will now move to Motions without Notice. I would like to inform you that in terms of the Standing Rule 150 pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolence and congratulatory were submitted to the Programming Authority prior to this plenary on 7 September 2021. Members are reminded that Motions without Notice pertaining to congratulatory and condolence, will not be allowed in the sitting as they have been processed by the Programming Authority.

I have been informed that at the Programming Authority meeting of 7 September 2021, political parties did submit the names of the hon members in their desired order of speaking and who had wished to move a Motion without Notice in this sitting of the House. I will, therefore, just for noting and for the purpose of the Minutes, call out the hon members whose names have accordingly been submitted and approved. The following members'

motions have been approved by the Programming Authority as follows: hon Van der Westhuizen, hon Brinkhuis, hon Wenger, hon Botha, hon Lekker, hon Maseko, hon Sayed, hon Maseko, hon Mvimbi, hon Kama, hon Wenger and hon Kama.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the South Africa Rooibos Council (SARC) and all the producers in the industry for the recent registration of ‘Rooibos’ in the EU’s Register of Protected Designations of Origin and Protected Geographical Indications; notes that it is an important milestone, as it reflects the victory in an almost three-decade-long battle to prevent others around the world from misusing the name; notes that this means that the product can only be referred to as ‘Rooibos’ if it is from the *Aspalathus linearis* plant in the Western Cape and Northern Cape regions; and notes that, being the first food of African origin to be added to the register, this recognition will go a long way in supporting the industry’s 8 000 agri-workers and in providing the growth potential in the upstream sectoral activities.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr G BRINKHUIS: I move without notice:

That the House notes the achievement of 27-year-old Themba Mkhangeleni from Nyanga East, the first black artist to win first place in the Vuleka Art Competition on 7 August 2021; notes that he was a graphic-design student forced to drop his studies due to financial challenges; recognises his winning painting called ‘Ubuhle bendalo kaThixo’ (‘The beauty of God’s creation’) that depicts a young girl with a skin condition looking at a butterfly; further recognises that he is a self-taught artist climbing the ladder of an independent and full-time artist; commends him as the son of a single parent, noting that his mother has been selling chips, sweets and meat for more than 30 years to feed the family; and extends its congratulations to him.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Mr Charles ‘Charlie’ Breda for his over 35 years of service at the Western Cape Provincial Parliament; notes that Mr Breda commenced his employment at the WCPP on 1 September 1986; and commends Mr Breda as a stalwart in public service, specifically as a Service Officer at our Provincial Parliament.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms L J BOTHA: I move without notice:

That the House expresses condolences to Estelle and Rene, wife and daughter of Ernest Scotsman; and notes that Ernest lost his long battle against cancer. May his soul rest in peace.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes that a dedicated ANC community activist, Phumeza Nomzazi, was brutally killed in a hail of bullets at her Khayelitsha home; and expresses condolences to her family, friends and comrades.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms L M MASEKO: I move without notice:

That the House expresses its heartfelt condolences to the family, friends and colleagues of the former Speaker of the Breede Valley Council who recently passed away; and notes that Speaker Mercuur was a dedicated servant of the democratic process and placed fairness and the integrity of the Breede Valley Council above all in his work. May his soul rest in peace.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House sends condolences to the family, friends and comrades of Kebby Maphatsoe, the late Deputy Minister of Defence and Military Veterans, ANC Parliamentary Whip for Police and Sport, soldier on the battlefield against the apartheid forces, leader of the MKVA, and mentor to many young people, including young people in our province. May his soul rest in peace.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms L M MASEKO: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the current Mayor of the Breede Valley, Antoinette Steyn, for the good work done by the Breede Valley Municipality; notes that the Municipality, under her leadership, has lived up to its motto of being a caring valley of excellence; notes that the Municipality has improved its audit outcome and received a clean audit for the 2019/20 financial year, showcasing its consistent work to service the residents of the Breede Valley; notes that Mayor Steyn's work is an inspiration to women and public servants across the province; and wishes her success with her campaign in the upcoming Local Government elections.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: I move without notice:

That the House commends the postgraduate science students of the University of Pretoria namely Mancha Mabusu, Franchinah Ratsmina, Caitlin Fourie and Sade Magabotha, who sailed from Cape Town on the Agulhas II for research near the South Pole.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr M KAMA: I move without notice:

That the House commends our guardians in blue from the SAPS for their continued fight against crime and the successes they have had with recent busts on drugs dealers, the poaching of wildlife, violent crime and illegal firearms.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Alderman Felicity Purchase on her election as the new Speaker of the City of Cape Town Council during a full special Council meeting on 21 May 2021; notes that Alderman Purchase was previously the Mayoral Committee Member for Transport and has served as a councillor for 26 years; notes that she replaces Dirk Smit,

who retired last month after 45 years in public service; and wishes her well in this role and expresses no doubt that she will serve the Council with distinction.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr M KAMA: I move without notice:

That the House commiserates with the family, friends, comrades and compatriots of the 46-year-old sergeant Andile Sirunu of the Lentegur visual policing who was hijacked and shot dead in Eerste River. May his soul rest in peace.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now put the motions duly submitted and approved by the Programming Authority to the House. Are there any objections?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections, agreed to. The motions will appear in the Minutes of the proceedings and in Hansard, in each of the individual member's names as if that member had read them out aloud. I will now afford the opportunity to members to move Motions without Notice as per Standing Rule of 153(d). This could also include any of those Motions without Notice

that were not approved in the Programming Authority meeting, and we are just reminded that there are 30 minutes as per the Standing Rule, which will begin now. According to my list, I now recognise hon Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the City of Cape Town on spending 99% of its Informal Settlements Upgrading Partnership Grant and 95% of its Urban Settlements Development Grant. Importantly, the City maintains its track record of delivering safe and dignified housing opportunities and leveraging every cent for the residents of the Metro.

Since 2012, more than 60 000 housing opportunities have been created across the City, with 2 000 in central Cape Town; currently nearly 2 500 housing opportunities are in the pipeline in and near economic hubs. The fact that the City has spent nearly all of its budget, despite multiple hard lockdown levels and cuts to its grants from the National Treasury, is testament to its drive to bring housing opportunities to the metropolitan area. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the order paper. I now recognise hon Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commends the hard work by the Provincial Minister of Finance and the Provincial Treasury to bring sound economic practices and stability to the Western Cape Government and all its municipalities. In particular this House should note the decision by the Provincial Executive to intervene at the Beaufort West Municipality in terms of Section 139 of the Local Government Municipal Finance Management Act, 2003 (Act 56 of 2003) (MFMA). The decision by the Provincial Executive to request the Municipal Financial Recovery Services to prepare a Financial Recovery Plan which will be approved by the Provincial Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities; and that once the Financial Recovery Plan has been approved, its implementation will be binding on the Municipality in terms of Section 146 of the MFMA. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

HON MEMBERS: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections coming from the Chamber. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker I move without notice:

That the House notes the various unnatural deaths and violence in the Western Cape; like:

- (1) Five passengers – of which two were farm workers – who were killed Tuesday in a vehicle crash near Villiersdorp. Thirty farm workers were injured;
- (2) That it notes four young men murdered on Tuesday by kangaroo justice in Samora Machel and set alight. It is the second incident in less than a week on the Cape Flats as a similar murder took place in Mfuleni two days earlier;
- (3) That it notes a gender-based violence murder where a young girl was killed and set alight near the Drakenstein Rail Station of

Mbekweni and that the scene was visited by some of and including the newly appointed convener of the ANC Youth League in the Western Cape, Comrade Beulah Hewu;

- (4) That it notes that a SAPS sergeant has been shot and killed in Parow;
- (5) That it notes a 15-year-old was killed on his way to school on Tuesday by two cars in Lansdowne;
- (6) That it notes armed men stormed the Vredelust Child and Youth Care Centre for girls in Elsie's River and attempted to gain entry, and on Monday night the Department of Social Development had to evacuate the premises to keep the girl safe; and
- (7) it notes a Nyanga man of 37 years, was shot dead in his house for a TV set;

And that the House notes the above was only a slice of a few hours earlier this week in the province of murders and violence; and this House calls on the investigating authorities to tighten the noose on the criminals. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to

the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections, agreed to. Thank you very much. I now recognise hon Nkondlo. Hon Nkondlo, are you online? I am going to move on, I can always come back. I now recognise hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without ... [Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Apologies, hon Deputy Speaker, my apologies.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, what? Hon Makamba-Botya, if you could just wait a second. Hon Nkondlo is online. You may proceed, hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes ongoing complaints by Cape Town residents, especially the elderly on a fixed income from working middleclass families, about the unaffordable rates, tariffs and taxes, including debt recovery imposed on electricity costs per unit in the City. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible] Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, that was very, very difficult to hear and there has been a complaint in the House that they did not hear that motion that was given. I would like to ask that hon Nkondlo please re-read the motion and for the Minutes, that my decision is weight-based on her re-reading the motion in order for members in the Chambers to be able to hear.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Okay, hon Deputy Speaker, can you hear me now?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I can. If I can just ask that everybody else be muted? Thank you.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Okay. I move without notice:

That the House notes ongoing complaints by Cape Town residents, especially the elderly and the working class, about the unaffordable rates, tariffs and taxes, including the debt recovery imposed by the DA in the City of Cape Town, that has made electricity costs per unit exorbitant. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, it is not the motion that I have received. Can I just check? It is not the same motion that the member has just read. If you can just give me a second, it was not the same.

Ms N D NKONDLO: It is the same, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have had some advice. The Table Staff says it is the same motion. Alright, my apologies, member Nkondlo. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections in the Chamber, member Nkondlo. Thank you very much. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Thank you very much, we will move over to hon Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thanks, Hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House:

- (1) Welcomes the decision of the Western Cape High Court for stopping an eviction attempt by the City of Cape Town against 26

family members residing in Bromwell Street in Woodstock.

- (2) This follows an attempt by the City of Cape Town to evict these families with an attempt of taking them to a far alternative accommodation without taking into account that there are children who attend school around Woodstock.
- (3) Had the City got its way, it would have meant that the kids had to drop out of school since their parents would otherwise not afford school transport as they are unemployed and poor.
- (4) The decision of the court ordering the City to provide these families with emergency housing within the inner-City precinct must be welcomed, and as the EFF we hope that similar decisions by our courts will become the order of the day. I so move. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Object.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with particular concern that the Western Cape Education Department's Metro South Education District's reluctance to investigate and resolve the seven charges of gross mismanagement and abuse of power that were laid against the principal of Zwaanswyk High School in Tokai and that I, as a member of this House, will be officially writing to the Public Service Commission to ask them to investigate these allegations and all other corruption allegations at schools in the Western Cape, because the Education MEC and the Democratic Alliance have failed to show leadership in this crisis of corruption at schools. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Object!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Object.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Xego again.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, Hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

- (1) That House notes the passing of two people who died as a result of a fire breaking out in a shack in Kosovo informal settlement about 5 days ago.
- (2) The fire also destroyed several shacks resulting in a number of residents remaining displaced and homeless.
- (3) Kosovo is one of the congested informal settlements in which the Provincial Minister of Human Settlements promised to initiate a de-congestion process by moving the residents to three storey temporary units in mid-last year, but subsequently failed dismally.
- (4) Had the Minister kept his promise and used the housing budget accordingly, today we would not be talking about loss of life and some residents being homeless. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute. Minister, do you have a point of order?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Point of order, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Just one and I do not know if I perhaps listened incorrectly, but the hon member referred to Kosovo, which I never committed to densifying. It is actually Dunoon.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister Simmers.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: He is again misleading the House, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, point noted, but not taken because ...
[Interjection.]

Mr M XEGO: But that is not a point of order. He is just further misleading the House with that one.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: This is not a point of order ... [Inaudible – audio distorted.] And ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: If you have a problem with that ...[Inaudible – audio distorted]

An HON MEMBER: We object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Fair enough. You may have the full right to object. So, there is an objection to the motion being moved without notice and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Thank you very much, hon Minister. I then move over to hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, Hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with grave concern that the Bloekombos High School principal, a dedicated educator and a public servant of great ethics, is in a safehouse after allegedly receiving death threats and basically, after her car was followed – and this is in connection with her stance against corruption – and calls on the Western Cape Education Department to urgently investigate all corruption allegations, to work

closely with the law enforcement agencies, and to work with all stakeholders to create an environment where those who address corruption at our schools can do so without fear and not being victimised. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Are there? Did I, sorry, did I hear? There are no objections? Agreed to. Thank you. I now recognise hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House:

- (1) Condemns the recent ill-advised remarks made by the Western Cape Transport Minister, Daylin Mitchell, blaming the parents of 22 learners who were involved in an accident when a minibus taxi they were travelling in, crashed into a wall of Parliament back in August.
- (2) The Minister in question uttered remarks which goes to the effect of placing a duty of checking the safety and roadworthiness of vehicles on parents, rather than traffic officials.

(3) Whilst we agree that parents must raise concerns when they see obvious defects on vehicles transporting their kids, one cannot expect them to always inspect these vehicles by trying to replace the work of traffic officials who are otherwise trained and paid for being on the roads to check whether vehicles are licenced and roadworthy.

(4) The Minister must stop this thing of throwing blame everywhere when his Department fails to execute its functions. I so move, hon
Deputy Speaker

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

HON MEMBERS: Object! We object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections across the House. That motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon members, that concludes the Motions without Notice ... [Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, can I address you?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: And the business of the day ... [Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Secretary will now end the meeting and all the members will be exited from this sitting. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 16:55.