
THURSDAY, 9 MARCH 2023

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid Sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The SPEAKER: Order! Before we proceed, I would like to remind members about some of the logistical arrangements. As has been practice to date, hon members will participate in the Sitting of the House both from here in the Chamber with the Presiding Officer and the Table staff and via Microsoft Teams. Our Standing Rules have accordingly been amended to accommodate such hybrid Sittings in the House.

The hon members experiencing challenges in connecting to the Sitting are requested to contact the WCPP ICT Colleagues who will assist to resolve their connectivity challenges.

The quorum requirements for the Sitting of the House are provided for in the Constitution and the Standing Rules. Members present in the Chamber and via Microsoft Teams have all the privileges and immunities imparted by law. Members who are considered out of order by the Presiding Officer will have their microphones muted and called to order.

The Serjeant-at-arms will record the members' attendance.

Members, in instances where these Directives do not cover a particular eventuality, the Standing Rules must apply. In instances where the Rules cannot be applied, the Ruling by the Presiding Officer is final.

Members, all microphones have been muted. However, for those members participating in the Sitting of the House via Microsoft Teams, you are requested to use the raise-hand functionality of the system when you desire to raise a point of order and the Presiding Officer will recognise you.

When a member in the Chamber wishes to raise a point of order, such an honourable member may address the Presiding Officer, as expected, but must mute their microphones when they have completed speaking. Hon members are requested to please ensure that their microphones are unmuted when the Presiding Officer recognises them, and when they are done speaking to please mute their microphones.

Hon members participating in the Sitting of the House via Microsoft Teams are requested not to sign into Microsoft Teams on more than one device, unless the second device is utilised with earphones for Language Translation Services, as all these actions result in the disruption of the sound during the Sitting.

The media and members of the public have also been granted access to the MS Teams meeting as guests of the WCPP. However, members of the press may not use the chat room or speak or activate their cameras while the Sitting is in progress. If an individual member who is a member of this House activates their microphone and video camera such a member or individual will be exited from the Sitting immediately. I request that those here today who are not members of this House, to please observe the decorum of the House.

For this Sitting, Language Translation Services are available in the Chamber as usual, and on Microsoft Teams via the respective channels. Hon members participating in this Sitting of the House must please access the Language Translation Services via a second device, for example, your cell phone, and if you have earphones available to please use them for the language translation.

Hon members, I would like to remind you that no interjections are permitted during the hybrid Sittings and, to this end, I draw the hon members attention to Rule 40 of our Standing Rules.

Hon members, before we proceed with the Business of today I would like to take this opportunity to address a tendency that has developed over the past few sessions that detrimentally affects the decorum and good order in the House.

This tendency affects both sides of the House and I am not apportioning any blame on any individual member or political party. Rather this is an attempt from my side to assist members to improve our institution in conducting its mandate and display behaviour befitting hon members. Recently I have noticed a pattern when nonsensical and irrelevant interjections, running commentary and dialogue between members were the order of the day to the point where constructive debate became impossible. We all know that we enjoy the privilege of freedom of speech in the House and that must be cherished and protected but sometimes this privilege gets abused and becomes a free-for-all which cannot and will not be tolerated. Not only do our Standing Rules not allow for that but such behaviour infringe the privileges of other members which is unfair and not permissible.

In my acceptance speech after my election as Speaker I committed to discharging my duties as Speaker and Chief Presiding Officer of the WCPP in an impartial and fair manner upholding the dignity and the decorum of the House. I accept that fair and impartial application of the Rules to the various parties and individual members is essential but I expect in return your cooperation I intend keeping my end of the of the agreement and trust that I will receive the cooperation from both sides of the House in this regard.

We owe it to the people of this province.

Thank you very much, hon members. We now proceed to the Business of the Day and the first order is the Interpellation as printed on the Question Paper.

I now recognise the hon Minister, Minister Wenger.

BUSINESS OF THE DAY

INTERPELLATIONS

- 1. Mr T Klaas asked the Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities:**
(*Interpellation 1 to be inserted)

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and thanks to the hon member for bringing this important topic here for debate by Interpellation. The Western Cape Government acknowledges the very important role that the informal economy plays in the Western Cape and South Africa. This point is demonstrated in the 2022 Provincial Economic Review and Outlook which showed that approximately 30% of employment in South Africa came from the informal economy and 19% of employment in the Western Cape which amounted to 439 000 jobs in the Western Cape in the First Quarter of 2022.

As shown in the 2022 PERO there was a declining trend in employment in the sector from Quarter 1 of 2017 to Quarter 1 in 2022. However, I was very pleased to see from the latest Quarterly Labour Force Survey from Stats SA that employment in the informal sector increased in the Western Cape by 22,2% from Quarter 4 of 2021 to Quarter 4 in 2022.

This was significantly higher than the rest of the country where it grew by 11,6% over the same period. It should, however, be noted that as informal businesses are registered and formalised employment from these businesses are no longer classified as informal employment but rather formal employment.

In the Western Cape Government we know that Government does not create jobs. It is the private sector that does, and the role of Government is to enable the private sector.

Our new Growth-for-Jobs Strategy, which is nearing finalisation, makes clear that the private sector includes informal businesses as well as businesses in rural and township areas with a very specific spatial lens. At its core is the understanding that we, as Government, need to play a role in getting the fundamentals of growth right, such as energy, water and infrastructure and this must include enabling the success of informal businesses as with formal businesses in the private sector.

Furthermore initiatives such as assisting informal businesses to register and giving them exposure to funding opportunities are important for economic growth and job creation. As such the Western Cape Government actively partners and collaborates with the private sector, civil society and other levels of Government to assist in this process as well as through our own projects and collaborations.

In this respect I am advised that the inability to access various kinds of support being offered to small businesses has placed a severe financial strain on some unregistered businesses.

Ah, I seem to have lost a page. Excuse me.

As part of making it easier to do business as an ECD, the Red Tape Reduction Unit housed within the Department of Economic Development and Tourism funded 48 ECD businesses to meet compliance requirements such as infrastructure, zoning and so on, in becoming fully or conditionally registered. The Project has had a direct – and this was during the COVID-19 pandemic. The Project has had a direct and immediate impact on job retention in township communities such as Khayelitsha, Westlake, Retreat, Steenberg, Lotus River, to name a few, and significantly impacts predominantly historically disadvantaged women.

The Red Tape Reduction Unit has also assisted municipalities to reduce red tape regarding informal trading permits and does so on a case-by-case basis.

All municipalities in the province have informal trading permitting processes and specific cases can be directed to the Department of Economic Development and Tourism for assistance.

Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I now see hon Klaas.

†Mnr T KLAAS: Baie dankie agbare Speaker, en al die mense wat hier is. Ek sê goeiedag vir almal en ook dié wat hier kom luister vir ons.

[Mr T KLAAS: Thank you, hon Speaker, and all the people who are here. I'm saying good day to all and also those who have come to listen to us.]

Within the small business sector one finds both formal and informal business operating in that sphere. However, it is without doubt that the number of informal businesses, the quantity continues to grow. While the individual businesses themselves continue to struggle in terms of profit, competition and substantive growth or upgrading from informal to formal. This lack of substantive growth or upgrade by those operating in the informal economy means that they will forever be outside... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Klaas, please take your seat. Hon Murray, is that a point of order?

Ms C MURRAY: Apologies, no Chair.

The SPEAKER: Excuse me, hon Murray, I cannot hear you.

Ms C MURRAY: Chair, Speaker, apologies. The hand was incorrectly raised.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. My apologies, hon Klaas. That was not a point of order, so you may continue.

Mr T KLAAS: Ja, you waste my time, Chief. [Laughs.] The lack of substantive growth and upgrade by those operating in the formal economy mean that they will forever be outside the periphery of the formal economy, remaining impossible for their business to have access to loans, overdrafts and other kinds of financial access facilities provided by financial institutes in their banking sector. As an environment like the one described above, called the Active Interventionist Provincial Government that will extend a helping hand to this business, to make sure that they have the requisite tools that they will assist them to operate, compete and grow. The aim is to run this informal business into formal business which will in turn not just create employment but formal employment, which will drive poor people out of poverty.

This Provincial Government must give the same amount of attention to the informal economy of this province, the same way they do when it comes to the foreign direct investment. The good part about investing in a local

business is that, unlike foreign direct investors, they will never threaten to leave the country when things are going well.

The number and the scale of the intervention initiated by the Department of Economic Opportunities in the province must match the number of small informal business operating in this sector, unlike the Pick n Pay Spaza Shop Modernisation Programme which was... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Klaas, your first opportunity has expired. You have a second opportunity. So please take your seat. I now see the hon Murray.

Ms C MURRAY: Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, the Western Cape Government has shown strong support for youth, women, differently-abled people as well as black entrepreneurs through its SMME Booster Fund. These SMMEs are an engine for economic expansion.

The SPEAKER: Hon Murray, please take your seat. Hon Sayed, is that a point of order? Hon Sayed, can you please stand up, you rose...

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No thank you, Speaker, I withdraw.

The SPEAKER: Alright, please take your seat. Hon Murray, my apologies. You may continue.

Ms C MURRAY: Thank you, Speaker. These SMMEs are an engine for

economic expansion and have an important part to play if we are to address the unemployment crisis in this country.

This Provincial Government is making sure our entrepreneurs have all the support they need to become profitable and sustainable drivers of job creation by providing funding for SMMEs to take the next step and grow their businesses. With that said, Speaker, I would like to ask whether the booster fund supports informal traders at all, and if so, what are the relevant details?

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Murray. I now see hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Enkosi Somlomo.

To member Klaas, I am sure if you would have asked this question amongst ourselves you would have just told him since the last administration till to date, this DA-Government has not been interested in the informal economy so that we move the conversation to what matters. We cannot keep on asking the same question and be given the sweetheart answers about the situation of informal traders in this province. What is what called programmes to support informal traders, that the MEC even refers to a PERO, year-in-year-out, but still fails to give specific interventions that are provided to the informal traders.

It is the SMME Booster Fund that she would refer to that actually gives more

money to intermediaries than the actual entrepreneurs. It is the Pick n Pay Market Stores that were launched by our hon Premier...

The PREMIER: ... [Inaudible.] ...in Gauteng.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Hon Premier here, who was boasting... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members, there is a member on the floor, order. [Interjections.] Order!

Ms N D NKONDLO: He was boasting about Nozinga Stores, and Nozinga was sitting here, her store is closed and the Premier moves from one intervention to the other.

Tourism Safety, when there is a threat of big business, money gets to be allocated here for tourism safety here in town, rural safety. Recently we ask the Chairperson of the Committee for extortion that is happening to actually attracting township entrepreneurs and businesses and no conversation takes place here with this particular Government on those issues. Lesley Ruiters actually recently spoke in Facebook airing the challenge of informal business owners that have been evicted here in the City of Cape Town, off the Belhar Mall, which is Airport Mall, from 28 February. These are informal traders that actually have been operating in this mall for the past 10 years. They get to be evicted without any option.

The SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, please wrap up. Your time has expired.

Ms N D NKONDLO: So we await the Informal Traders or Informal Economy Strategy that the MEC has been promising in this House. I thank you.
[Applause.] [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Nkondlo. Hon Klaas, your second opportunity?

Mr T KLAAS: Chief...

The SPEAKER: I am the Speaker, not Chief.

Mr T KLAAS: Oh, Speaker. [Laughs.] Ja, I am a politician. With the number of shopping malls continuing to grow in our townships and housing some of the big cooperations in the country, it is without a doubt that a healthy competition with the required end market as it will benefit consumers both in short and long term.

However, the reality on the ground is that the majority of small informal business struggle to compete against these conglomerates as the competitive mostly boils down the marketing power, price and quality as well as quantity. In an environment such as this one, if this small informal business struggles to access the correct market for purpose of stock, then they can get knocked completely out of business by these conglomerates and therefore creating a

competition vacuum in a market which will hit hard on township working class and the poor, as well affecting informal job opportunities in the formal business sector.

Having said that, I would like to know whether the Department has taken an initiative to ascertain the scale and the type of business operating in the formal sector with the aim of linking them with those that can assist them to register and grow these businesses. One way this could be done is by inviting various businesses to do road-shows, an awareness informative section with people from different townships and rural areas in the province.

An HON MEMBER: You still have a minute.

Mr T KLAAS: Ja, if I have a minute, let me just continue with this one.

The SPEAKER: You still have a minute. You may continue.

Mr T KLAAS: Ja, in line with the original question, are they programmes initiated by the Department in order to assist those informal liquor businesses as well as unlicensed irregular township loan sharks? Instead of calling this business illegal and all sorts of names, we want the Department to facilitate and be looked after. We do not want you to call this small business that are growing, even the liquor business, then illegal. We must make a way to make them legal. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Klaas. I now see the hon Minister. Hon Marais, is that a point of order?

Mr P J MARAIS: No, I was just... [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Okay. Alright, hon Minister, over to you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, Speaker. I would like to take this opportunity to announce that DEDAT has formally entered into a memorandum of understanding with the National Department of Small Business Development. Areas of collaboration under this MOU include the promotion and encouragement of the take-up by qualifying small businesses in the province of support and incentives offered by the National Department and other relevant National Departments, for example the Department of Tourism and agencies such as SEDA and SEFA as well as Red Tape Reduction, especially where the blockages and inefficiencies emanate from national legislation policies and business-facing services.

These efforts will also contribute to making it easier for businesses to register and to get exposure to business funding opportunities.

I would also like to share some of the initiatives of the Department and I am advised that since 2019 the SMME Booster Fund – and hon Nkondlo will be pleased to know – has included a category to support municipal infrastructure

development such as informal and township trading spaces.

To date the following municipalities have been supported to create markets to the benefit of the township sector. In Hessequa the Kwanokuthula Business Hub allows for the municipality to expand on small scale projects, to construct four business units in the hub to support more light industrial type businesses. In Oudtshoorn the business hub and trading area will house five traders in containerised units in Bongolethu. In Langeberg the Bonnievale informal trading sites and Montague informal trading site will serve 22 existing and new informal traders. In Mossel Bay the Mikeva business hub and Wolwedans Market site include the establishment of 17 refurbished containers which will house 23 local businesses. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: In Swellendam SMME Trading Zones in the townships of Smitsville and Barrydale... [Interjections.] ... LED units and supports six businesses. In Laingsburg the new business park is a trading facility that consists of four units to accommodate businesses in the retail sector. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: In Cape

Agulhas the Ou Meule Street trading area or Lesedi Square has six trading containers and hosts six businesses, a number of eight people.

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: In Witzenberg the Skoonvlei SMME Business Zone ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. My apologies. members, I am struggling to hear the Minister, so I have asked the Administration to check the microphones, but can I please ask that you allow the Minister to conclude or give her response, and please do not – this running commentary, Premier, and on my left-hand side, if you can please allow the Minister. She was on the floor. Minister, over to you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Skoonvlei SMME Business Hub in Ceres provides industrial and business space for traders through 10 customised containers. In Mossel Bay the Kwa-Nonqaba Youth and Business Park has 19 trader units that actively trade, and again in Mossel Bay, the D’Almeida Trader Hub ensures that 15 local businesses and three day traders have attractive and affordable spaces to do business.

I am further advised, and hon Klaas will be pleased to know, that the Construction Information Session Expo is a collaboration between the

Department of Transport and Public Works and DEDAT and the project is aimed at emerging contractors, both formal and informal, to develop their capacity to access construction procurement opportunities offered by the Provincial Government.

The Department presents:

- (1) Access to market opportunities, noting tender opportunities with various spheres of Government;
- (2) Access to finance linked to development finance institutions and other funding sources; and
- (3) Some of the common challenges that businesses experienced that hinder their growth.

The programme is rolled out in townships and rural areas across the province where future business opportunities are being planned by the Department of Transport and Public Works.

In 2022 the programme was rolled out in Grabouw, Ashton, Mossel Bay, Eersterivier, Kuilsriver, Hermanus and Atlantis and these sessions were attended by both formal and informal businesses.

So to conclude, Mr Speaker, the Department has assisted small businesses in the informal sector from townships and rural areas alike. Our vision of the economy is one that is inclusive, sustainable, resilient, diverse and thriving, generating confidence, hope and prosperity for all. Thank you.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, that is the end of Interpellations. We will now move over to Questions as per Rule 202, as printed on the Question Paper. I wish to advise hon members that once the hon Premier or a Minister has started the reply to the oral question as printed on the Question Paper, hon members must use the chat facility for the Sitting of the House to indicate that they want to ask a follow-up question and there are four opportunities for follow-up questions, but the hon member who has posed the initial oral question, as printed on the Question Paper, will have the first opportunity for a follow-up. After that other hon members may use the remaining opportunity to ask a follow-up question.

I now recognise the hon Premier.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

1. Mr T Klaas asked the Premier:

During the 2022 State of the Province Address the Premier promised that the vacant Robbie Nurock Clinic will be turned into a homeless shelter as part of the initiative to help homeless people:

(1) Whether there are any other buildings or spaces that the Provincial Government has earmarked as shelters for homeless people; if so, what are

the relevant details;

(2) when will the Robbie Nurock Clinic be turned into a homeless shelter?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Speaker, and thank you very much to the hon Klaas for the question. So the reply:

- (1) The Provincial Department of Social Development has requested the use of the Tafelberg Crèche and Constitution Street in Zonnebloem. This is erf 116944 in Cape Town, for the purposes of establishing a new homeless shelter in the CBD. This project has been allocated R18 million for this coming financial year and the shelter is due to be operational before the end of the 2023/2024 financial year..

The strategic brief has been completed and it is envisaged that the project will go to tender in July this year. Between the City of Cape Town and the Western Cape Government significant efforts are being made to create more spaces for homeless persons. The City currently funds 1 150 bed spaces for homeless adults and is planning to add a further 330 added spaces in 2023, making a total of 1 480.

The Western Cape Department of Social Development funds 2 398 bed spaces across the province and with the additional 120 planned for the new site will be funding over 2 500 spaces by the end of the new financial year.

The same Department, DSD, also funds social workers at all the shelters that

we work with in order to help homeless adults reintegrate with their families and or communities, and then the formal Tafelberg site crèche building has been requested as an alternative replacement to the Robbie Nurock site. The latter, and of course they are quite close to each other, was found to be unsuitable. When the contractors went in there is extensive asbestos in the building and so that is why the second building has now been put into the process for rebuilding and we are having to reassess. We have to remove that asbestos first before it can get any other building or project aligned to it. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon Klaas.

Mr T KLAAS: Thank you. Since there is an increasing number of homeless people in the province and you have already undertaken to assist them, under your leadership, is your Government going to continue in this trajectory to identify some vacant Government buildings and turn them into shelters at a faster rate? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Klaas. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you for the follow-up question. Obviously this is a role that we play as a Government and also at municipal level, and it is not only just the identification of the shelters, it is also the process, and we all know that COVID-19 exacerbated quite terribly the number of job losses, the number of people who were forced out of wherever they were living and

ended up on our streets, all without shelter. Of course it is not only the provision of shelter but it is the processes that we have got to do to find alternatives, and you know it is find dignified shelter. Those shelters have got to make sure that they have got comfort in ablutions, at least two meals a day, access to social workers on site which I have mentioned, personal development plans. But it is interesting at the moment, and if I think about what is happening in the City, how I think now almost all homeless in the City have been interviewed three times, and it is part of a process to understand what is the issue, how come you ended up here, can we help in a way to get you rehabilitated?

In some cases you find out that they have perhaps come to look for work, they want to go home and so then how do we get people to wherever they want to get home to, or perhaps it is a mental wellbeing issue, how do we help that person from that point of view. Is it reunification with the family, and social workers play quite a prominent role in the reunification processes, and then of course as you also then say what about other plans, and so there are plans, we have to make sure it is not only just in the City, because the question was about Robbie Nurock, but what about in the other towns as well, and between DSD and the Province making sure that we are getting that right, that there is the safety net of housing of those social spaces, but at the same time it is also understanding that it is in balance with the other services that get offered to people.

I think about Sassa and the role that Sassa plays, and also sometimes the

failure that Sassa is, where it is failing our citizens, because this is the basic of basic needs, and when you cannot even get service, at the moment in our province we have 1,6 million people who are receiving Sassa grants. Of course it is a way smaller number who are not able to find shelter, in other words homeless is which we speaking about here, but it is another layer, and when that system fails it just exacerbates the problem and makes it even worse, or as I mentioned the interviews to find out exactly what were the causalities, was it a job loss, is it a family issue, is it a mental well being issue, what are the issues so that we can help citizens.

So often it is just the ability to get an ID book so that you can actually register yourself so that you can get your grant, so that you can find a job, so these are the kinds of services that are also letting down, so often, our citizens when a Sassa office or a Home Affairs office does not work. We really have to make sure that it is a multi-pronged approach that we get to help these citizens who are actually in dire straits and that is where social nets are so critical in making sure that we can help these individuals. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. I see hon Bakubaku-Vos and then hon Marais after that.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I would like to pose a follow-up question to our Premier, hon Winde.

During the 2022 State of the Province Address, the Premier promised that the vacant Robbie Nurock Clinic will be turned into a homeless shelter as part of the initiative to help homeless people. Where are there any other buildings or spaces that the Provincial Government has earmarked as shelters for homeless people? If so, what are the relevant details; and the second one, will the Robbie Nurock Clinic be turned into a homeless shelter, as you promised us. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bakubaku-Vos, that is the oral question as printed on the Order Paper and I think in the Premier's first reply he answered hon Klaas' question directly, because that is directly the question as printed on the Order Paper. So, Premier, I do not know if you want to add to your initial reply, alternatively I will move on to hon Marais. Can you just on the record, for the record.

The PREMIER: It is the question that the hon Klaas asked and I did answer it. I will say it again, thank you, hon member, but you read off exactly the question that the hon Klaas did ask me and I think I have answered it. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you very much, I now see hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, Speaker. Premier, the term "homeless people", do you equate that with people on the housing waiting list also and, if not, why not, because who has a bigger claim to being helped, those who waited

patiently for 10, 20 years for a house, staying in a shack in the backyard of somebody or those who just rush into town and live under a bridge, and is never on a waiting list? Do you differentiate between the two and why, and who should get preference, law-abiding citizens who waited 20 years on a housing waiting list, living in a caravan or a shack, or those who come, do not go to the housing office applying for the house, who just sit here under a bridge or wherever they can find a place, are they in terms of your policy going to receive preferential treatment? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much to the hon Marais, and I think it is a really good question that, because I think many people are confused, but obviously the waiting list is a separate issue to a homeless person, and it is two different departments that actually intervene here so, if someone is on the housing list living in a shack or in a backyard, they are on a Human Settlements waiting list and the Human Settlements Department will deal with that through the municipality.

This is a separate issue but I do want to say that there are times when it overlaps. So I spoke about the City at the moment in the process that they are doing interviews with each and every person that are homeless, it is to find out what the issues are, why and how it happened to you in your circumstances; how did you end up here, but one of the questions are also, have you got an ID, if you have got an ID what is your ID number, where do

you live, where have you come from, are you on a waiting list? So that question is also asked. Have you been on a waiting list?

It was very interesting looking at some of the answers to these questions, and some of the individuals actually come from places as close as Delft and actually go home on a weekend and come back during the week, and so I do not know the exact cause is, because when I was looking at it I was thinking I wonder what the cause of this is, is this because public transport is becoming inaccessible and more expensive, and we know that already that because of the failure of the rail system, 650,000 people should be travelling on the Central Line. But of course the Central Line we know, does not operate anymore, there are 13,000 people who live in informal dwellings on the railway reserve and so that train line cannot operate, and so I do not know, when have to go deeper into some of those answers, but it was one of the questions that I was asking when I saw that people were actually coming into the city living on a pavement during the week, is that because it is more commercially viable, do you have a job in the city? We need to go even deeper into those questions, but it is also because there is this absolute failure of our train system which should be the lowest, cost efficient, on time, but of course it is a total failure. It is another one of those total failures of Central Government on their ability to provide those kinds of services. [Interjections.]

They cannot keep the lights on, they cannot keep the trains going, they cannot keep the Sassa offices open and get the grants going on time, they

cannot get ID documents to people who need them, so that central space within our country which is totally failing our citizens, is another exacerbation towards how people themselves find themselves in these dire straits. But your question is they are two separate departments, but there are inter-leading questions that have to be asked, because you cannot be advantaged because you suddenly find yourself as homeless, but it is a different support that the State gives you through the Social Development Department and the same in the City or by municipality and the province. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. The last opportunity is hon Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Premier, with regards to the recent Court judgment granting to the City permission to evict the homeless people and anticipation for a high volume of homeless people who will be in need of shelter or other forms of assistance; what intervention measures has his Government put in place, and how many other shelters are earmarked to assist? Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Before you go, hon Premier, there was more than one follow-up question, so Premier, I am going to hand over to you to answer as you deem fit.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. Thank you very much to the hon

member. Obviously asking a question about a different sphere of Government, but I will endeavour to answer that question comprehensively, and the first part of the question is so what are you doing about this because... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order members!

The PREMIER: ...the hon member is obviously referring to a process that is on the go right at the moment. I presume it is the process that you are referring to right now that the application has gone to the Courts where in April they are asking for an eviction process, but also at the same time showing exactly what has been put in place before that can happen, and... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order members! Hon Kama.

The PREMIER: If the hon member Kama will just listen, I will reiterate on those things that are being done. So of course interact... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order members!

The PREMIER: ...interactions with individuals who find themselves on the street and creating that net, that social net, so I will reiterate again. So, the City currently funds 1 150 bed spaces for homeless adults and is planning to add a further 330 at its safe spaces in 2023, making a total of 1 480.

The Western Cape Department of Social Development funds 2 398 bed spaces across the province, with an additional 120 planned for the new site, and this is the new site as referred to in this question by the hon Klaas, and I thank him for that question, which takes our placements up to 2 500. Of course that is what you need to do, you need to be creating these safe spaces because you want to get someone off the street to a safe space that has a meal, or in actual fact in this case two meals, that has the social services supplied to them, that has dignified shelter, that has comfortable ablution facilities, and so it is about dignity, it is about showing that you care as a Government, that you are creating these spaces.

That is what it is about and so to the hon member, again, that is why the further 18 million is being funded, and it is not only the 18 million that is funded for the actual structure itself, but it is about the support that goes into it, with social services, with the funding for the meals, with the operations, that is extra funding that goes in our Department. Of course I am sure that you will interact in the budget process that is coming up very shortly, because we are moving into a new financial year in a couple of weeks, and once again a Government that will table its budget next week, debate that budget, approve that budget, before we start the new financial year, the only Government in South Africa that actually does it, other Governments in our country start spending their money even before their Legislatures approve. We will do it beforehand, and in that process I think that is also a further time, not only questions to the Premier, but a further time for the Standing Committee to actually go into depth and interrogate where the money is being

spent, how that social net is being put in place so that we are showing that we are safeguarding and caring for those citizens that are most in need. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon members, that concludes Question One. Hon Chief Whip, is that a point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP: No, hon Speaker. Just for the House to note, that Question Three under new questions will stand over, and concurrence has been reached between the Minister and the member. Thank you very much, Speaker.
[Interjections.]

[Question 3 to stand over.]

The SPEAKER: Hon, order, hon members! Hon Marran, hon members!
[Interjections.] Hon members, I just want to alert you that the clock is ticking for question time, so I am going to allow you to continue your conversation and when you are ready we will continue with Questions. Hon members! Hon members are you... [Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Speaker, this is unacceptable. You have to apply the Rules here.

The SPEAKER: Hon members!

Mr P J MARAIS: This is unacceptable. I am not prepared to sit and listen to this chatter here. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members!

Mr P J MARAIS: Unruly! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Go home! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members! Okay, hon members, please settle down! Settle down members, and I will now allow the Minister of Education his freedom to address the House. Hon Minister, over to you.

3. Mr M K Sayed to ask Mr D I Maynier, Minister of Education:

How much has his Department spent on the Wesley Neumann matter since its commencement to date?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Speaker, and thank you to the hon member for the question. Wesley Newman was found guilty by an independent Presiding Officer of acting in a manner that was inconsistent with his duties and obligations as a principal and manager in the education system. He was found guilty on the charges of failure to carry out a lawful order, disrespect in the form of abusive or insolent behaviour, bringing the Department into disrepute, misusing his position by inciting personnel and or

learners and/or the community on social media platforms not to attend school or to report for duty, and breaching his employer's social media policies.

He has decided nevertheless to take the matter further legally. So as of 31 January 2023, the total expenditure is as follows. R1,5 million for the disciplinary hearing which includes the cost of the independent presiding officer and legal representation for the Department, R357 000 in legal costs related to the appeal, and R651 000 in legal costs related to the arbitration currently underway before the Education Labour Relations Council.

An HON MEMBER: That is R2,5 million! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Now it is – did the hon member say R5 million?

An HON MEMBER: R2,5 million.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, can you please speak to the Chair. [Interjections.] Order, members!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, you will have an opportunity, if you wish to

pose a question to the Minister, you can indicate that you would like to do so, but this interjection and continuous commentary must please stop. Hon Minister, is that a point of order?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: It is, Speaker. There are some blasphemous remarks coming from the opposite benches which are quite offensive and I do not think are parliamentary. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Alright, hon. Thank you, hon members.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: If you could look into the Hansard please.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, I will revert back to the House after I had an opportunity. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: What is that now? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I am on the floor. Hon Marran, I am addressing the House.

Mr P MARRAN: Sorry, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, I will revert back to the House after I had an

opportunity to consult Hansard. Hon Kama, is that a point of order?

Mr M KAMA: No, thank you very much, Speaker. Speaker, I want to address you on the interjections. I do not think there was running commentary from our side, but the Minister was easily distracted. The Premier was doing that when our members were speaking, but they were not distracted, so when we are just heckling, there was no running commentary, so it is him who wanted to answer because there was something valuable that was being said here, so we cannot be blamed and be told that it is distraction, and the Rules must apply equally. It is this behaviour that makes us to believe that we must be on a defensive mode because we are being targeted from the Speaker's seat, so I think can you please be fair and apply the Rules equally as we continue to heckle where necessary. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Alright, if you – firstly that is not a point of order, but secondly I completely understand your concern. The reality is the Minister is on the floor, and if you want to have a question or pose a question to the Minister, please indicate so and I will allow you an opportunity to officially pose that question to the Minister, but please do not ask the Minister questions in his response. There is a difference between heckling and running commentary and interjections because as per Rule 40 it is not allowed. So hon Minister, over to you, and can I please ask that you speak to the Chair, and not directly to the members.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker. I will do exactly

that. I was really just diverting from my prepared reply, just simply to compliment the Opposition who seemed to be much better at addition than percentages, which they struggled with a little bit during the Premier's debate earlier.

Speaker, I think on this question it is very important to note that the costs related to the appeal, which as I mentioned earlier, the costs related to the appeal are R357 000 in legal costs, and R651 000 in legal costs in relation to the arbitration which is currently underway before the Education Labour Relations Council. That those costs have been incurred, and this is an important point, as a result of Mr Newman deciding to appeal the external Presiding Officer's decision to dismiss him, and of course despite being found guilty on these very serious charges which I outlined earlier and which included the failure to carry out a lawful order, disrespect in the form of abusive or insolent behaviour, bringing the Department into disrepute, misusing his position by inciting personnel and or learners and or the community on social media platforms not to attend school, not to attend school or to report for duty, and of course breaching his employer's media policies. Despite being found guilty on these very serious charges, the Provincial Minister of Education at the time, my predecessor, in response to the appeal gave Mr Newman a lifeline, instead of dismissal, instead of dismissal he could have taken the offer of a Head of Department post as an alternative to dismissal. But Mr Newman declined this offer and decided to take the matter further legally to the ELRC, which of course he is entitled to do, and which we are now obliged to defend. Therefore the costs of the ELRC

arbitration are a direct result of Mr Newman declining the offer made to him and his decision to take the matter further legally. So had Mr Newman decided to take the lifeline that was offered to him, he would have saved the Department and indeed the public about R650 000.

Speaker, I would like to just remind the hon member, who I can see is eager to ask a follow-up, and the House, that this matter is currently a part of an active ongoing arbitration hearing before the Education Labour Relations Council, which is... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order members! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...which is set to... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order members! Members, can I please ask that you, and I have been doing this in the last few sittings. I do not want us to get to a point where we start naming, but I need you to please work with me. The Minister is responding. There will be an opportunity for questions, follow-up questions, please use that opportunity to pose your questions to the Minister. Minister, over to you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you hon Speaker, as I was trying to say, I would like to remind the member and this House that this matter is currently part of an active ongoing arbitration hearing before the Education Labour Relations Council which is set to resume, I believe, in about

mid-April, and so while I would like to provide comprehensive replies and indeed I intend to do so, I may be constrained in the replies that I can provide to the House. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I have got hon Sayed who will have the first question, the first opportunity; the second opportunity hon Cassiem, then hon Fry, and the last one hon Baartman, in that order.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Let me firstly greet the members of the Wesley Newman Action Committee who are present, Colleen Titus, I have seen her around at present and for standing with Mr Newman through this just struggle.

Let me express my disappointment in the hon MEC's response. The MEC actually did not respond to the crux of the question, he is going around in circles and what he does, which is very, very unfortunate, is to deny – Mr Newman like any employee in the State, has the right, he has the right to appeal – and if Mr Newman was wrong, why offer him the promotion? I thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, please take your seat.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): In the written reply to my...
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, please take your seat.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Okay, I am getting to it.

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, please take your seat. There is a point of order. Hon Minister, is that a point of order?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: It is, Mr Speaker. Is this member's statement or oral questions time? [Interjections.]

I did not hear any question. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, thank you very much. I am listening carefully and hon Sayed has indicated that he is getting to his question. Hon Sayed, please, hon Sayed, can you please address me?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Ja.

The SPEAKER: Members, there is a member on the floor.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Unfortunately Speaker, I watched the hon Maynier for many years in the National Assembly, and this is how he used to pose his questions.

The PREMIER: Hon Sayed, can you get to your point, and can you get to your question.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Sorry, let me get to it, ja. [Laughing] So, in a written reply to my question in September 2022, despite omitting important expenditure items such as cost of employing the principals who took the Newman persecution bill to R2,6 million, the Department has incurred, and we are getting that info now through this answer, has incurred further costs due to the ongoing arbitration, which has been in a sense deliberately delayed. I therefore want to understand from the MEC what is the total, the overall cost, everything, not only the cost in Court, but the cost that the Department has spent, even when it has come to having to implement certain changes at the school because that is a cost to the entire case, what is that overall cost as a result of the overall persecution of Wesley Newman; the result of having senior counsel as well. That is what I want to know and then added to this... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Alright, alright, thank you hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you.

The SPEAKER: That was a question. Hon Minister, over to you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker. It is good to know that at least in the form of the hon Khalid Sayed I have at least one fan

in my... [Laughter] ...and who has watched me carefully in the National Assembly. He is a very rare bird. There are not many... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, speak to me and not to the hon Sayed.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. Hon Speaker, I am a little bit perplexed by the hon member's follow-up question. He says that I have not responded to the crux of his question. Now the crux of his question is how much was spent on the Wesley Newman matter. Now I set that out in great detail in my reply and I will repeat this.

R1,5 million for the disciplinary hearing, which includes the cost of independent Presiding Officer and of course the legal representation for the Department, R357 000 in legal costs related to the appeal, and R651 000 in legal costs related to the arbitration currently underway before the Education Labour Relations Council.

Now what I did not provide there of course was a total. One hon member took a stab and said R2,5 million, given the challenges the Opposition experiences with arithmetic it was not a bad guess, the total cost is R2 012 171.20. That, hon Speaker... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: What about the cost of the [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...to the crux of the question in very great

detail. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I now see hon Cassiem. Hon members, hon Cassiem is online.

Ms A CASSIEM: Thank you, hon Speaker.

According to the media or media reports rather, and affidavits that were handed in to the police two years ago, there was evidence of bribery where a senior official of the Department allegedly bribed and intimidated a teacher with a position if he cooperated with the department by falsely testifying in a disciplinary hearing against Mr Newman. This was about two years ago. The police confirmed the case, said no arrests were made and no charges have been made as the investigations were continuous.

What is the outcome of this investigation and what has been done on the Department's side with the amount of evidence and affidavits that were handed in from different individuals?

Secondly, how can the presiding officer ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Cassim ...[Interjections.]

Ms A CASSIM: ... be independent ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... that – hon Cassim, you are entitled to ask one follow-up question. You are now going into your second follow-up, so I am going to ask that the hon Minister responds to your first question.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker, and I would like to thank the hon Cassim for her question and indeed to welcome her as a new hon member to this House.

Now I am not aware and I do not have the particulars of the matter to which she refers and I would invite the hon member to put a ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... detailed parliamentary, a written parliamentary question and I will provide her with a comprehensive response on this matter in due course. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I see hon Fry.

Mr C FRY: Thank you, hon Speaker.

To the Premier – sorry to the Minister, apologies, sorry about that. What support is currently underway for the class of 2023 in this ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! There is an hon member on the floor.

Order, hon members!

Mr C FRY: What support is currently underway for the matric class of 2023 at Heathfield High? Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister, that in fact is a new question, but I am going to allow the Minister to decide if he wants to answer that or not. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: If you are able to.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: It does relate to the matter at hand and I would like to take a stab at replying to the question. [Interjections.]

Generally the situation at the school I think is stable and productive. [Interjections.] Learners are attending class and vacant posts are being filled, and I think there really is much to celebrate at the school and I really want to see the school succeed, and I really do commend the efforts of the acting principal together with the SMT on the progress that they are making, and of course the school is focused very much, as the hon member suggests, on the class of 2023.

The school, under the leadership of the acting principal and SMT, have put in

a very comprehensive programme to support the matric class of 2023.

There are a number of measures which are being put in place. First, after school classes will be held which cover all subjects, as well as classes on Saturday. The school is embarking on a mentorship programme where a group of five or six learners will be assigned to a teacher who will meet with them to support and advise them and to monitor their progress throughout the year.

The school also is setting up a resource centre for those learners who do not necessarily have a suitable space to study at home and this will of course ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat.

Hon Sayed, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Ja, on a point of order, hon Chair.

When the hon member of the EFF was posing the question, it was said no, it was not relevant but now the MEC is responding and speaking something completely different to the original question. [Interjections.] Just on the issue of relevance.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you, hon Sayed.

Hon members, there was a question posed. How the Minister responds or answers is not for me to adjudicate, so I am going to allow the Minister to complete.

Continue, Minister. Please note that there was a question posed.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, thank you, hon Speaker.
[Interjections.]

The hon member claims that the question put by the hon member Cassim was somehow dismissed. It was not. The hon member put a question about an event that occurred, as I understood it, two years ago and I am simply not familiar with the facts, but I have offered the hon member an opportunity to put a written question so that I can establish the details through the Department and provide her with a comprehensive reply. [Interjections.]

The hon Christopher Fry does ask a pertinent question and the question that he asks is what support is being put in place to support the matric class of 2023, which broadly is about how the school is putting new programmes in place to support teaching and learning and how the school is stabilising and making progress. [Interjections.]

So as I was saying, the school is setting up a resource centre for the learners who do not necessarily have a suitable space to study at home ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... and this will have all the necessary textbooks and subject information for the year available.

Matric learners will of course, as is usual, have access to winter and spring school support in the district and district officials stand by to support the school and I think that the measures that have been put in place, hon member, are a huge credit to the acting principal and the SMT at Heathfield High School. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Order, hon members!

The last opportunity is hon Baartman who is also online. Hon Baartman. [Interjections.]

Order, hon members!

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Thank you, hon Speaker, and good afternoon to everyone.

Hon Speaker, I wanted to find out, given the response the Minister has now indicated regarding what is happening at the school in terms of the programme, I wanted to find out, I read in the *Cape Times* on approximately,

I think it was 6 February, a letter from some concerned learner groups who made allegations regarding no timetables and schedules at the school, and I wanted to know whether the Minister has responded to the detailed allegations that was contained in this letter that was submitted by the respective learner group? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Baartman. Hon Minister. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon member.

Before I sort of reply, I heard an hon member say that the hon Chris Fry did actually in fact put a question that was unrelated to Heathfield High School.

The SPEAKER: Hon ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: In fact ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, can I please ask that you address me [Interjections.] ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: You can see, you can see he is under pressure on this.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Hon Speaker, I do apologise, let me address you. [Interjections.]

The hon member said that the hon Chris Fry asked a question unrelated to Heathfield High School. In fact the opposite is true. The hon Chris Fry asked a question about how the class of 2023 was being supported at Heathfield High School and the reply which I provided gives a comprehensive outline of the programme being implemented by the school to support the class of 2023 at Heathfield High School.

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] under pressure. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members! Hon members! [Interjections.] Hon members! Hon member Maseko, is that a point of order?

Ms L M MASEKO: ... who is speaking, except to call attention to point of order or a question of privilege. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you very much, hon Maseko.

Yes, indeed, hon members, can I please ask that if you want to raise a point of order, that you do so, but please do not interrupt the Minister while he is answering the question. [Interjections.]

The question was posed, how the Minister chooses to respond is not for me to

adjudicate. If you do not like the answer, that is unfortunate, there is nothing that the Presiding Officer can do to that. If you want to use the parliamentary mechanisms to oppose the question then please do so.

Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker.

It is hard not to notice that the Leader of the Opposition has just received a rather big brown envelope. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon [Interjections.] ... hon Leader of the Opposition, that is against Parliamentary Rules. [Interjections.] There is a ... there is an emblem. [Interjections.] You cannot display [Interjections.] – you cannot display – hon members!

You are not allowed to display any political party or political regalia in this House. Hon Leader of the Opposition, can I please ask the Leader of the Opposition to please assist me so that we can maintain the decorum in this House.

You are a seasoned politician and you know that that is not allowed. [Interjections.]

Hon Dugmore, is that a point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Hon Speaker, thank you.

If I could just address you on this. [Interjections.] I received a big brown envelope. I did not know what was in it. It is quite big.

So if you mind I will just leave the House, fold it up so that no emblem is showing and then I will bring it back. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Can you please leave the [Interjections.] ... Hon members! Actually the fact that we are laughing about that, I mean is an indication of how seriously we are actually taking our jobs as hon members that represent the citizens of this province. I do not actually think that this is funny.

I think it is about time that the Rules of this House need to be adhered to. [Interjections.]

Hon member Kama, I am addressing the House, can you please take your seat. [Interjections.]

I mean we have citizens watching this and we think it is funny to just [Interjections.] – to affect the decorum of this House.

So the rest of the Sitting, can I please ask that you assist me so that we can maintain the decorum of the House and in particular the leaders of political

parties.

Hon Minister, you may continue.

Hon member Cassim, is that a point of order?

Ms A CASSIM: Thank you, hon Speaker.

I would like to raise a point of order. The Minister is misleading the House by lying in saying he does not know about the bribery case, when the Minister responded in a media article with regards to that bribery case. I was the investigative journalists in the article and you responded to me.

So can I get an update on that bribery case, please?

The SPEAKER: Alright. Thank you, hon member Cassim. What is your point of order?

Ms A CASSIM: The Minister is misleading the House. He is lying when he says he does not know about the case.

The SPEAKER: Hon Cassim, you – it is unparliamentary to call, to say that a member, an hon member of the House is lying. I will take that first part of your point of order by saying that the Minister is misleading the House, the content of which I cannot adjudicate.

So we will revert to Hansard and come back to the House.

Hon Minister, was that a point of order?

Thank you, hon member Kama, is that a point of order?

Mr M KAMA: No, thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, I would like you to redirect the Minister because really the reason why we even went to have that disruption is because he was speaking to everything that is happening here than the question itself. [Interjections.]

So I think you need to redirect him to focus on the business of the House and what is on the agenda so that this House does not really – if he does not have an answer he can just say he does not have it and sit down. [Interjections.]
Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Alright, hon member Kama, that is not a point of order, but I want to address all members.

We are all hon members in this House. Can I please ask that you respect each other, that we respect one another, we are all hon members. So when you address a member that you please address the hon member as an hon member and not a he and a she.

So, hon Minister, you were on the floor, so I am going to allow you an opportunity to continue with that last question that was posed by hon member Baartman.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you to the hon member Baartman for putting the question.

Yes, I am aware of a letter drafted by a group referring to themselves as "a concerned learner group", and they raised of course several concerns about the state of Heathfield High School. I of course immediately investigated these claims, members and I, after discussion with the Department and indeed the principal, we of course very strongly deny the allegations that were made in the newspaper to which she refers.

The claim that there was no school timetable, we believe, is false. Full-time teaching and learning have been underway at the school and of course the senior management team, again to the credit of the new acting principal, was brought back earlier for the first time to complete proper planning and ensure that the school year got off to a smooth start.

A matric afternoon programme was already underway and additional lessons were being provided to matric learners after school at that time for four days a week.

The claims that most grades do not have teachers was patently false and the claim about the assembly hall was also indeed false. Parent meetings across all grades were in fact being held that week in keeping with the school's commitment to keep parents informed and we are concerned, and of course we urged the group responsible to be careful about the impact of these kinds of false claims, because of course they always risk instigating discontent or disruption at the school, which of course is unacceptable and undermines the acting principal and SMT's huge effort to get teaching and learning to resume at Heathfield High School. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister.

That concludes Question 1 that was standing over from 2 March. We will now, I see the Minister of Education, Minister Maynier, for Question 3.

The MINISTER FOR EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you to the hon member for putting the question, which of course relates to the recent blockade by the taxi industry here in the City of Cape Town.

So my response is, yes, we did in fact take a number of steps to end the blockade. Hon Speaker, prior to 13 March 2023 schools in and around Khayelitsha began reporting to our district office that some of their learners were absent as a result of the harassment and intimidation of our contracted learner support scheme drivers by minibus taxi associations.

Academia Primary School, which I visited, for example, informed us that over 50% of their learners had been absent over the past week and one of our special needs schools informed us that their learner transport, which was taking some of our most vulnerable learners to school, had in fact been turned back.

On Friday, 10 March 2023, 2 400 learners in the area were absent from school.

On the weekend of 11 and 12 March (sic) February? 2023 a threatening voice note began to circulate on WhatsApp and caused alarm in our schools and amongst parents. The translated transcripts reads as follows:

"On Monday the people who have children that use public transport to school such as kombis, Avanza vans, etcetera, on Monday, we want to let you know, that children will be taken out of these modes of transport as they have started with buses. Children who will not be taken out of these transports are people using staff transport with CODETA stickers.

Children using transport with CODETA stickers will not be taken out of these cars, whether going to school or creche, they will be taken out of these transport. If they are using a transport with CODETA stickers they will not be taken out of the transport on Monday.

If you have a child going to school on Monday arrange for them. If there are many, hire a minibus taxi with CODETA stickers to transport them on Monday. This is what is going to happen on Monday. I am just letting you know.

People who are going to have children taken out of their transport are those using private cars. This is what is going to happen on Monday."

This threatening message was distributed to parents all over Khayelitsha.

On Monday, **13 March** (sic) 2023, these threats then materialised. All non-CODETA vehicles transporting children to school, including parents driving their own children to school in their own cars, were stopped from doing so.

Videos and photos began to surface on social media showing learners being forced off buses and children hiding in the footwell of cars to try to evade the thugs seeking to stop them from going to school.

In this climate of fear, harassment, intimidation and uncertainty over 5 100 learners, hon Speaker, over 5 100 learners did not attend school and when I visited Academia Primary School that morning, the principal informed me that the absenteeism rate was now at about 90%.

Parents were outraged by CODETA's actions. I am sure that some of the hon members watched the *Carte Blanche* excerpt this past Sunday and heard Zibonele FM's representative stating that 98% of the calls they received were totally against CODETA's actions.

Parents started to organise on social media with a plan to protest the taxi ranks and prevent them from operating. CODETA, then had to change tactic by publicly announcing that they would stop harassing learner transport with the exception of our contractor learner transport service buses.

Their official letter stated, and put it very simply:

"We would like all the people who transport our children to school to start doing so tomorrow morning. This is in exception of the buses and in this case CODETA will provide transport to these learners free of charge from 16 February 2023 to 23 February 2023."

And, hon Speaker, in effect what CODETA had announced was that they would be illegally hijacking our learner transport scheme.

The letter was signed by the general secretary and indeed the chairman of CODETA. It was completely brazen, hon member. Our Department would simply not tolerate this lawlessness and accordingly we took several actions.

We met with the provincial leadership of the South African Police Service and agreed to a plan of action that includes SAPS operations to end the criminality. I laid a criminal complaint of common assault, intimidation and extortion with the SAPS against the minibus taxi associations who prevented our children from getting to school. We refused to meet and engage with any minibus taxi association and finally, of course, we approached the Western Cape High Court for an urgent interdict against CODETA and its members, to prevent them of course from obstructing, interfering and stopping the transport of learners in the Western Cape. The Court granted the interdict and has sent a strong message to the minibus taxi mafia.

There is no excuse, there is no excuse for violating the constitutional rights of our children or for putting parents in the terrible position of having to choose between their children's education and keeping them safely at home.

It would also put an end of course to the hollow claims made by CODETA that they were somehow not involved in the criminal actions they announced that they were taking.

The Court ordered, and I quote, that:

"The respondent and its affiliated members are interdicted and restrained from obstructing, interfering and stopping the transportation of learners within the Western Cape and that the respondent and its affiliate members are interdicted and

restrained from issuing threats to the applicant's service providers, learners and members of the public to the effect that they ..."

Of course which refers to the respondent:

"Will obstruct or interfere and stop the transporting of learners within the Western Cape. The respondents have also ..."

And this is important:

"... been ordered to pay costs."

Which of course we will pursue and we will pursue relentlessly.

I also of course communicated directly, hon Speaker, with parents of the affected schools through letters distributed via principals to keep them informed of our progress and so, hon Speaker, I would like to commend and thank parents of Khayelitsha who stayed home from work to look after their children, who diligently collected work packs, who travelled on buses to make sure their children were safe, who created lift clubs in the absence of contracted learner transport, and who stood up, who stood up to the minibus taxi mafia by demanding that their children be able to travel to school without harassment and indeed interference.

We now encourage our parents to send their children back to school if they feel comfortable doing so, so that our teachers can determine how much work needs to be caught up and of course implement plans to do so. Thank you.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very, hon Minister.

Hon members, there are 40 seconds left, so I am not going to allow for a follow-up question.

That brings us to the end of Questions for Oral Reply. Outstanding replies will be printed on Hansard.

Hon members, we now move on to Questions to the Premier without Notice as per Rule 204. I kindly ask hon members or remind hon members that two follow-up questions may be posed by the hon member that is asking the question relating to the original question or reply.

I see hon member Bans.

Questions without Notice to Premier:

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker and to the hon Premier, I hope that the hon Premier is aware of

the recent murder of a young man by a security company during an eviction of people at Rooiland in Magnolia Flats in Paarl East. That was ordered by Drakenstein Municipality.

It is concerning that evictions are on the rise again in the province, especially given that the City of Cape Town approached the Courts for permission to evict the homeless people.

I therefore want to ask whether the Province has an emergency housing plan to accommodate people in need, especially those who have been evicted and how are this implemented? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, and thank you to the hon member Bans for the question.

I am not fully aware of the detail of the Drakenstein application and of course one knows that when an eviction is sought, that from time to time the Courts will ask whether there is alternate accommodation provided. Sometimes they do not. I know of one where they did not ask for alternatives. Often the municipalities are burdened with the outcomes of those Court applications.

I also think that much of the question now asked by the hon member was

dealt with earlier in the question around homeless people and of course homeless people, and I think that was the eviction that she was talking to in the City of Cape Town, and I think in that earlier question from the hon member Klaas I went into detail about the process being followed even prior to an eviction being sought, and that answer is definitely yes, alternate, safety net accommodation being put in place, making sure that there are homeless shelters, and of course, that is about dignity, that is about caring and that is where a Social Development Department will be involved, and that was, I think, quite a lot of detail in that earlier question.

When it is other forms of eviction we have to wait for the Courts to make those kind of rulings. It is not that municipalities will then go and prepare a whole lot of homes before they would evict an illegal occupation. We know that during the pandemic times with lockdowns we had lots of areas that were illegally occupied, many of them illegally occupied which already had services in place and were to be allocated to people who were on the waiting list. So that also causes a real conundrum when someone, and I think that goes to the question that the hon member Marais asked earlier, the difference between the two: a homeless person on the one hand versus perhaps someone who is living in an informal settlement or a backyard, and how do they fit onto the list and what kind of safety net is produced there. That is the money that is spent through the Human Settlements Department or will be spent soon to be through the Infrastructure Department, and they operate according to strict criteria with lists, etcetera.

The PREMIER: So, ja, I think if the hon member wants a bit more detail from me on the question in Drakenstein, I would be happy to get the detail for her, but she would have to put that question, I think, to me specifically because I do not have those. I try to prepare before I come, wondering what people are going to ask me and I have got lots of notes here that I have prepared myself with, but I did not have the detail on the Drakenstein eviction process.

But I think the courts, we have separation of powers and I mean, the courts also play their role here and we have got to obviously respect the outcome of those court processes, but it is also those court processes that are enabling our municipalities and our Province to go through the processes of eviction.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon Bans, do you have a follow-up question?

Ms A P BANS (ANC): Yes, hon Speaker. Thank you, hon Speaker. I actually wanted with my initial question, to check if the Province has an alternative housing plan that is in place as a province. I did not get that from the hon Premier.

However, my follow-up is: is the hon Premier aware that there are 56 people evicted from Rooiland – I understand he said that he does not have the detail – including 30 children consisting of 16 school children and 14 toddlers; that are currently housed in a shed belonging to a community leader; where the municipality only offers them peanut butter sandwiches once a day with no

water or proper ablution facilities; and have to fend for themselves for other meals and services. And whether the Government will ensure these families are provided for with adequate services and proper emergency housing. I just wanted to check that, hon Speaker. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you, hon Bans. Hon Premier, I do not know if you got all those follow-up questions, but ...[Interjection.]

The PREMIER: I think first of all, that question around 'alternate' and I think that goes to the point about, it is not an alternate system. We have a policy, we have lists, we develop opportunities through a Human Settlements Department with those processes. The same happens at Local Government level. So, that does not need an 'alternative', that is the policy, that is the plan and of course, the other one which I referred to earlier in my answer and earlier in the previous discussion in the interpellation around the question to do with homeless people.

So, that again, it has its own set of policies, its own approach as to how that is dealt with. I again say, and I mean I hear the numbers quoted by the hon member, but I need that detail. So again, I would say if she is looking for further answers she has my mobile number, she has my email address or can go through the parliamentary process and put a formal question.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you very much, hon Premier. That concludes the first Question to the Premier without Notice. I now see hon Baartman.

Ms A P BANS (ANC): I have one question left, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: My apologies. There is one more opportunity. Sorry, my apologies. Hon Bans.

Ms A P BANS (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. I welcome the hon Premier when he says that I can forward details to him. However, hon Speaker, I have received a letter from the affected families pleading for intervention. Amongst their cries, they demand an in-depth investigation into the hiring of the security company and why live ammunition was used against innocent people.

Yes, the hon Premier said that he is willing to help, but I therefore want to ask whether the hon Premier will make enquiries personally into the recruitment of the security company by the Drakenstein Municipality. The security company that shot and killed this innocent young man, even one man now living with a bullet in his body. By when can I receive feedback of such enquiry and whether your office will hold the Mayor and his Executive accountable for the inhumane conditions that our people live under in the municipality? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bans. Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. Obviously, in the same vein I am not

aware of the issues as raised, but again I say, if there is a question around our security company appointment and process, that can also be put into exactly the same question and I will engage with the municipality to find out what those processes were.

Obviously, the latter part of her question was, if it is true what she has just said now, then I mean, that is – when people get shot at, I trust there have been criminal charges laid with the police because there is no way that a security company or individual or anybody can start shooting at people. So, I really trust that those charges have been laid and please, you must give me that detail and we will definitely follow up on that.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon Bans, thank you for your indulgence. I am now going to move on to hon Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, one of the vision priorities the hon Premier has ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon members, there is an hon member online virtually. The hon Premier must be able to listen to the question being posed to him. So, can I please ask that you allow the hon member to pose it. Hon Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, one of the Vision priorities the hon Premier has previously indicated within

his term relating to energy security has been for the Western Cape to become the first loadshedding-free province in South Africa. And we are currently being held hostage as a people to loadshedding, especially since Eskom is a national entity. And given the current National State of Disaster that was declared by the National President, could the hon Premier please indicate to this House what the Western Cape Government is going to do to make the Western Cape the first loadshedding-free province in South Africa. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Baartman. [Interjections.] Hon Premier. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We ...[Inaudible.] National Government [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker and thank you very much to the hon Baartman. I think I got most of that question. I think first of all, obviously declaring a State of Disaster by a President in a country must be taken very seriously. And of course ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You asked for it. I mean, you asked for it. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You asked for it.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You asked for it.

The SPEAKER: Hon members! You are drowning out the Speaker. Hon members, can you please allow the hon Premier to answer the question. This has been going on the entire day already. I mean, this is a complete disrespect for somebody on the floor. Hon Premier, over to you.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. So, obviously it is a really serious issue and the Hon Leader of the Opposition is correct. In actual fact, the Democratic Alliance asked for a specifically ringfenced disaster declaration on energy and you know, it is a total disaster. You just have to go to any household in this country and you will know the devastation of the lack of management, the devastation on the lack of willingness from the ruling Party in South Africa to fix this problem in the last 15 years. And it has exponentially just got worse year after year after year.

We know that and I do not have, I said I brought detail with me. I was wondering about this question, but I wish I had brought the speech that I delivered in the National Assembly because I got down to the days of how many days it had taken since the previous President in our country said that we will only have two years left of loadshedding and it will be missing and gone forever. [Interjections.] And then, the current President in our country

told us that loadshedding would end. [Interjections.] And then we wonder why we are battling to create jobs in our country, why our economy is tanking the way that it is. It is because of the effect of loadshedding on citizens, on businesses, on business confidence, on investment. It really is hectic.

So, as part of the question to me is our plan for making sure that this Province becomes resilient and in actual fact, produces sufficient energy so it would not have to rely on Eskom. So, you will see our short-term plan. That is absolute, immediate intervention. I have already started a digicon process that we used to do during the COVID-19 pandemic where we would every week have an open, transparent session – open to the media and the public through all social media platforms and also ask questions. You know, tell the public what is happening right now, get questions back from the public, from the media, something that does not normally happen at a presidential level in our country, but here, we do that. We allow people to ask those questions and we try to give all of the feedback and we are totally transparent on what we are busy with.

So, for example, immediately reduce our take off between 500 and 750 megawatts for this province. That is the short term intervention and today, if you were on the digicon you would have seen we had one municipality, the George Municipality, showcasing exactly what they have done already and what their plan is in the short term. That is up to 7 megawatts in a municipality like George, which is one level of loadshedding. The year after

that, how they take it to the next level of loadshedding. These are the kinds of plans we want to see and we are making them detailed and transparent because we must be held accountable to that. But at the moment, we do not have detailed and transparent data on how South Africa is going to deal, just this year, with the urgency and, of course, the implications of loadshedding.

Then, we move onto the medium term: 1 800 megawatts to by 2027 and 5 700 megawatts by 2035. The point that the hon member asked is so what is that plan about resilience? Now, we are probably using just over 4 000 megawatts at the moment at our peak, so 5 700 megawatts going into the future will definitely give us that opportunity. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, given the response I wanted to find out how loadshedding's impact has been on the safety in our province because when the lights go off our streets become unsafe. When it goes off, the mics in the courts go off and the judges have to postpone court rolls because legally, they are not even allowed to hear certain applications when the mics are off. Hairdressers and butcheries are severely affected and some of the police stations are even closing their doors and the officers are going home. So, if he could please just give us some detail on the impact that has been currently on the safety in this province. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, and exactly, you just have to visit citizens and see the implication of loadshedding on safety. I think and I will use the words of the Gauteng Premier. He said the criminals have more tech and seem to be more armed than our police and this is the problem that we have at the moment. I think that you just have to be anywhere on the Cape Flats and citizens will tell you: as soon as the loadshedding starts, the shooting starts as well. And it is criminals who are using that specific space to really put and exacerbate our crime situation that we find ourselves in. Of course, that for me is why and I think I referred to an earlier question on having a look at the future budget. I was looking at how we are spending our money on Neighbourhood Watches and making sure that Neighbourhood Watches get the detail of when loadshedding is to happen, how we continue to support them. The same thing about making sure we support Community Policing Forums. Often in this House we get accused of not funding Community Policing Forums. You will see R310 000 funding sitting so far on the 2022/2023 budget and then of course, rural safety as well. We might have extra deployment in our hotspots right here in the City, but what about the rest of the province and I see 2022/2023, R21 298 000 going into safety projects in rural areas because it gets exacerbated. We already have got a big crime problem and a failure of our policing system to make it safe and so, we have got to make sure that we are now trying to plug these gaps that loadshedding is bringing to citizens, the fear that it brings when loadshedding hits. It is a big, big problem.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon Baartman, do you have another follow-up?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes, hon Speaker. I wanted to find out other than safety, whether loadshedding has had any impact on the infrastructure programmes within the Western Cape, especially those such as delivery of homes, of schools and other services that we are required to deliver. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, over to you.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. Yes, definitely. I mean, I think the loadshedding impact just straight on our budgets in our Health Department. You can already see the hundreds or in the hundred million mark that we are already spending on diesel to mitigate this risk in our hospitals. Our schools, much more difficult, but that is also part of this plan. It is how do we make sure we make our schools more resilient, what is the rollout plan to make sure that more and more schools get solar PV. I think we already said that is policy going forward into building new schools that will look at building them with solar PV and battery technologies. How do we take the first 100 schools and really look at getting that risk mitigated. And across the board. It does not matter where it is. In Government spaces, it affects service delivery directly and we have got to make sure that we mitigate that risk, just as much as it is hitting citizens and it really is. It is hitting citizens morning,

noon and night and their ability to just lead normal lives, to look after their families. So, that is why we have got to put so much focus in making sure we mitigate this risk of loadshedding. Our country cannot afford another 15 years of promises and loadshedding at the same time. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon members, there are 32 seconds left, so I am not going to allow another question to be posed. We then come to the end of Question to the Premier without Notice. I therefore move on to Rule 145, Statements by Members. I recognise the DA.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I want to, once again, bring to the attention of this House the persistent unlawful land invasions taking place across the Western Cape. Continued unlawful land invasions are a massive risk, especially for local governments as unlawful occupiers often demand services where no such infrastructure exists and place additional strain on municipal funds. It is not only local governments that feel the pinch, but also housing beneficiaries.

In many cases, land invaders illegally occupy land earmarked for housing development or housing structures meant for allocation to those on the housing waiting list. They occupy the land that is earmarked for the infrastructure being for economic development. They occupy the land invasion or the land parcels identified for housing. As we speak now, we do have over 500 000 backlog on the waiting list and attempts by the Provincial Government to decrease this figure is interrupted by land invasions, and now

increasingly, extortions.

Last year, hon Minister Simmers revealed that in the past three years more than 1 600 invasions of land earmarked for human settlement development were recorded. The Provincial Government has spent more than R100 million to prevent illegal occupations and secure land, but ultimately, housing beneficiaries continue to be the biggest casualties when it comes to land invasions. As you have a right to dignified housing, it is delayed and denied by illegal land occupiers, and we find the hon members like the EFF has been on the record over years in support of land invasions ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Maseko, can you please conclude.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): As members of this House, we have a responsibility to stand in favour of the rule of law and not to incite lawlessness, like hon member Lili and hon member Cassiem. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon Maseko. [Interjections.] Honourable – there is a point of order by hon Kama. Hon Kama, I recognise you. Is that a point of order? [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...[Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: No, no, hon Kama, you are hon Sayed.

Mr M KAMA: No, no, no, no. Thank you, hon Speaker. I think maybe the hon member should have ended where you were instructing that she must conclude because now at the end, she has now reflected on the integrity of the hon members by saying that they are ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order, hon Kama?

Mr M KAMA: She is saying hon member Lili and hon member Cassiem are ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: I am not going to. What is your point order, hon Kama?

Mr M KAMA: The point of order is reflecting on the character of the hon member ...[Audio distorted.] motion by saying that they are inciting ...[Audio distorted.]

The SPEAKER: I did not, okay. Thank you, hon Kama. I get the context or the context of your point of order. I am not going to make a ruling on that now. I am going to ...[Audio distorted.] what goes into the Hansard and come back to the House. If there is any aspersion cast on any hon member of this House or the integrity and dignity of that particular hon member. Hon Sayed, is that a new point of order because I have ruled on that point of order.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, hon Speaker. They should be bringing forward. The hon member must bring forward a substantive

...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Okay.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Just some advice, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, honourable ...[Interjections.] Thank you, hon
Sayed, I have ruled. That is not a point of order. I now see the ANC. Hon

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, this
Provincial Government is spitting in the face and on the graves of COVID-19
healthcare heroes and heroines. Despite the Provincial Government's
commitment to build a memorial wall in honour of the departed healthcare
workers, the Western Cape Government Health instead is terminating their
contracts. In March 2022, the hon MEC confirmed that 592 contracts of staff
employed in COVID-19 posts were terminated over the course of the
pandemic. During the same period, 221 contracts for staff in vaccination
posts were also terminated.

Hon Speaker, while we acknowledge that some of these health workers were
reemployed in non-COVID-19 posts within the Department, a significant
number remained unemployed. On 31 March 2023, the last remaining
COVID-19 healthcare heroes will lose their jobs as the Western Cape
Government Health is terminating the contracts of 214 Brackengate Hospital
staff, of which six staff members are present in the gallery today. We

acknowledge your presence: you are our heroes and heroines.

[Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, the ANC is opposed to the decision by the uncaring DA regime and we are in full support of the demands by the workers to stop the continued job ...[Inaudible.] in Health. Hon Speaker, there are staff shortages in almost all hospitals in the province and therefore, there is no justification for terminating these contracts. Part of the lesson learned from COVID-19 is the efficiency and effectiveness of step-down facilities, and hospitals such as Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain District Hospital have requested such facilities to deal with overcrowding and service pressure. Why is the hon MEC not transferring these healthcare heroes to the KDH and Mitchells Plain where their services are needed?

While workers are losing jobs ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Windvogel ...[Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): ...and while others are protesting for a better wage ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Windvogel, can you please conclude?

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): ...the DA and the hon MEC are nowhere to be found. We commend Minister Phaahla for cutting his parliamentary business

short to meet with the ...[intervenes]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Now, I will do ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Your time has expired.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): ...sort the problems of our healthcare workers.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you honourable ...[Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Windvogel. Thank you, hon members.

[Interjections.] Hon members, order, hon members. Thank you, I

[Interjections.] Hon members. Order, hon members. The next Statement will be delivered by the EFF online [Interjections.]. Hon Windvogel!

[Interjections.] Hon Windvogel and hon Bakubaku-Vos! Hon members, there is an hon member waiting to do their statement online. Hon Cassiem, I see you.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Thank you, hon Speaker. For more than a decade, informal settlements in farming areas remained the most ignored and

unserved areas under this DA-led Government, with its residents constantly having to fight for simple services like police and health facilities, which are often far from where they live. It is a disgrace that poor residents annually have to beg for critical services to protect themselves during times of need. Once again, in such areas, victims who are raped and abused cannot report their cases to the police as there is no place of safety to run to and their cases are often among those not reported, untold and forgotten. The EFF therefore calls for the Provincial and Municipal Government to prioritise the safety and rights of poor residents and to treat them with dignity in their times of need.

Police and Law Enforcement wasted on land invasion missions should also be shifted to informal settlements to provide much needed services and to make accessing easier for even ambulance services which do not enter such areas due to it being marked off as red zones.

I was also hoping that the hon Minister would be present today to respond to my questions relating to cannabis, specifically here in the Western Cape as to how many cannabis projects the Department has assisted, how many black people have received assistance from the cannabis farms and more so, what is she doing to empower women and youth in the industry as not much has been done here to educate them on opportunities in this industry. It is important that we destigmatise cannabis because the stigmatisation is only to gatekeep African and Coloured people from participating in a very lucrative industry, knowing that cannabis has many applications related to medicine and even industrial applications. But just like the issue of informal settlements there

is nothing more materialised under this DA-led Government when it comes to the poor and therefore, even with cannabis, black people, women and youth participation in this industry will never be prioritised and will only happen under an EFF-led government where it will be a major economic driver. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Cassiem. I see the DA.

Ms C MURRAY: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, our country's economy is being battered under an ANC-led National Government and we see this in the 1,3% GDP contraction South Africa suffered in the last quarter. We see it in SNP global downgrading South Africa's credit rating outlook and in the financial action task force greylisting our country. But we, as the DA-led Government, cannot stand by idly as our economy collapses. We must be proactive and solutions focused, unblocking challenges that inhibit the growth of our economy.

One solution is to attract the people with critical skills and those who can work remotely to our shores, with as little bureaucratic red tape as possible. This will bolster our economy and provide much needed skilled labour and support our tourism and entertainment industries. This game changing solution to drive economic growth is unfortunately being held back by the ANC-led National Government because of issues which include backlogs in processing visas, ambiguity in interpreting existing legislation, poor service delivery by foreign missions and issues with online visa applications. What

is more concerning is that the DA has uncovered that only 1,5% of critical skills visas get adjudicated within four weeks, with an average turnaround time of ten weeks. I have written to the Office of the Presidency to request an update on Operation Vulindlela and its implications and findings on implementing remote working visas. Unsurprisingly, I have received no response to these questions to date. National Government is supposed to provide a regulatory environment that enables the economy to flourish, not stand in the way of companies getting the skills they need to expand and to grow. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now see the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the ACDP in the Western Cape is on the move. If you look at today's paper, the *Daily Maverick*, in an article it said and reported on yesterday's by-election in Stellenbosch Ward 21 and it reads as follows:

“The DA lost some ground in the by-election, but still recorded a big win. Most of its trouble came from the ACDP which had a credible second place finish.”

And that is in the article today.

Hon Speaker, the ACDP voter support grew from 3,4% to 16,3% from November 2021 to 8 March 2023. We are extremely proud of our candidate,

PR Councillor Okkie Jooste, for taking the ACDP in the Western Cape to higher heights. Hon Speaker, the result is that the DA had 72%, the ACDP 16%, the Independent 5,9%, GOOD 4%. The ANC 0,68% and the EFF 0,47%. The ANC and the EFF: the writing is on the wall. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): The people of the Western Cape have rejected them. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. I see the ANC. Hon members, there is an hon member on the floor. Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, the ANC welcomes our National Government's reallocation of the Education infrastructure grant to the Western Cape. The Western Cape Education Department has been reallocated R115,4-million of the R411-million rerouted from the Eastern Cape and Mpumalanga. While it is sad to see that these two provinces forfeit this significant portion of the conditional grants, we must however commend our National Government for bringing this money to the Western Cape, where there continues to be serious challenges of unplaced learners and overcrowded classrooms.

Just yesterday we saw firsthand that in Zimasa Primary School and Langa

High School, up to 65 learners are crammed into a classroom. This reallocation is in addition to the R830-million increase in the WCED's infrastructure budget in the 2022/2023 financial year. Lack of funding from National Government has often been used as a smokescreen by the Democratic Alliance, for this Provincial Government's failure to plan for learner growth and for not building new schools. It is concerning that additional funding from the National Government tends to be spent on temporary solutions, such as shack schools being built by the WCED through its Rapid School Build Programme. Not all of them are that. We just wanted to clarify.

The ANC will closely monitor the spending of this additional R115,4-million, so as to ensure that it is used appropriately to improve access to quality education for all. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed. I see the DA, hon Plato.

Mr D PLATO (DA): Hon Speaker, thank you for the opportunity. On Monday, I performed an unannounced visit to the offices of SASSA in Atlantis. I spoke to beneficiaries, many of them justifiably angry. They face long queues and have been standing in the queue since 5 o'clock in the morning, some even since 4 o'clock, in the pouring rain. They face a massively inefficient system, although the staff is trying its best under difficult circumstances. Something they cannot do much about. Many clients waiting for hours to perform simple tasks, such as handing over of documentation.

They could not even do that and go home. They had to stand in the queue for their turn, even if they stand in the queue for four/five hours and that is completely unacceptable.

These are problems we face at many of the SASSA offices across the province and, I suppose, even across the country. It is a managerial problem; it is a leadership problem [Interjections.]. There is no political will to address these matters. [Interjections.] We need a clear plan from SASSA leadership of how best they are going to address these issues. [Interjections.] It goes without saying that many of our most vulnerable poverty-stricken citizens rely on SASSA grants for vital social assistance and other forms of assistance. SASSA Western Cape will be asked to come and explain to the Social Development Standing Committee, how best they are going to address these issues. I thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Plato. I now see the hon Marais, Freedom Front Plus.

†Mnr P J MARAIS: Speaker, verlede week het ek Minister Meyer, die Minister van Landbou versoek om aandag te gee aan voedselsekerheid vir armes, veral stapelvoedsel soos brood. Die Vryheidsfront Plus loof dus Castle Lager en SA Harvest vir hulle inisiatief om goedkoop brood te maak by hul brouerye met koring en gars. Dit is inderdaad prysenswaardig.

[Mr P J MARAIS: Speaker, last week I requested Minister Meyer, the

Minister of Agriculture to pay attention to food security for the poor, especially staple food such as bread. The Freedom Front Plus therefore commends Castle Lager and SA Harvest for their initiative to produce cheap bread at their breweries with wheat and barley. It is indeed praiseworthy.]

We also call for the empowerment of Coloured and Khoi emerging farmers in this province, entrepreneurs and indigent households who are on housing waiting lists as these minorities are neglected and receive very little benefits in terms of the Labour Equity Laws and Housing; having to compete against numerically superior African blacks, whose influx to the Western Cape has changed the demographics of this province. Racial tensions are increasingly building up. We call on the Western Cape Government to take remedial action to prevent racial tensions escalating and flaring up because of a fight for scarce resources by the influx ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P J MARAIS: If anybody here calls me a racist... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order members, order!

Mr P J MARAIS: The racists are the ANC at national level. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais. [Interjections.] Order, members. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are marching in the wrong way, sir.

The SPEAKER: Order, I see Al Jama-ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr G BRINKHUIS: *Bismillah-ir-Rahman-ir-Rahim.*

The SPEAKER: Members! [Interjections.] Members!

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Al Jama-ah is concerned about the increasing incidence of criminal activity... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members! [Interjections.] Hon members! [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You are members, you can ...(Inaudible.)
[Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Uh-uh, no, you are... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Lekker. [Interjections.] Members!

Mr P J MARAIS: You are foreigners! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Lekker. Members!

Mr P J MARAIS: You are the foreigners.

The SPEAKER: I see the Chief Whip.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip.

An HON MEMBERS: Calling blacks even foreigners in their own land!
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, members. There is a member on the floor. Hon member, hon Chief Whip.

An HON MEMBER: You are racist (?) [Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Speaker, they cannot be the only ones... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Marais, there is a member on the floor. [Interjections.]

There is a member on the floor. [Interjections.] Members! Hon Nkondlo!
Hon Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you. Thank you, Mr Speaker. I rise...

Mr P J MARAIS: I am a Khoi-Griqua.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, there is a member on the floor! Hon Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Speaker. I rise at this moment feeling worn out and at pains with what is happening in the House, particularly when we are being foreigners in our own country.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I really do not take it kind in whatever the altercation was, to refer to black people in particular as foreigners is an insult of the highest order and I want you to rule on that matter. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip. I will come back to the House with the ruling because I could not – I mean, if I make a ruling now I am not going to be able to do so with all the facts in front of me. So, I will come back to the House and if there was any attack on any hon member of this House, I will rule so. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I think you do not know [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I see hon ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...in South Africa.

The SPEAKER: There is an hon member on the online system that is also. I think it is hon August, so I am first going to see hon August.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Hon Speaker, has my time lapsed or?

The SPEAKER: No.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH):Sorry, ...[Audio distorted.]

The SPEAKER: No, we are not. We are still coming to you, hon Brinkhuis. Hon August, I saw your hand. I did not allow you an opportunity for a Member Statement because I received an apology from you. So, I do not know if that is an indication that you also want to deliver your Member Statement.

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Hon Speaker, yes, I also want to deliver my Statement, thank you. I will ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: *Ja*, I will allow you that opportunity after I have dealt with the points of orders in the House. Hon Dugmore and then, hon Nkondlo, and

then, hon Klaas.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I would like to just address you on your ruling. As the Chief Whip of the ANC indicated, the comment by hon member Marais describing hon members on this side of the House and clearly referring to black African members as foreigners is deeply insulting and hurtful.

We have noted that you have indicated that you want to consult Hansard, but I think, hon Speaker, I would like to address you and to say that there has been a clear insult to hon members that feel that right now. And I want to appeal to you to ask hon member Marais to withdraw that now and then come back to us later. But that statement, and I think that is part of the problem that when the hon member says something like that, if he does not realise how hurtful and how racist a statement like that is, then I think there is a serious issue.

That has not happened in this House before that an insult like that has been levelled at hon members. It is clearly racist. He was pointing particularly to black African people and I really want to appeal to you to be decisive on this because we really do not have time for you to go back and consult. It is clearly offensive. [Interjections.] Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Alright. Hon Nkondlo and then, hon Klaas and then, hon Marais. Is this a point of order, hon Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Hon Speaker, I would like you to rule on statements that get to be made in this House, that has got a duty to uphold democracy and the Bill of Rights, where such statements have got racist or racial undertones. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Hon Klaas.

Mr M KLAAS (EFF): Hon Speaker, I will want to rise on a point of order on hon Marais. When he indulges, he raises his voice higher than it is supposed to be. So, I would like you to rule upon saying that that was wrong when his voice has risen more than it is supposed to be here. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Klaas. Hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Hon Speaker, I think that hon members must listen because they speak too much, they do not listen. I was talking about Coloured and Khoi people who because of Labour Equity Laws and ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): ...in terms of the Equity Laws ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): ...do not get jobs.

The SPEAKER: Hon Marais, is that a point of order? I am not going to – I do not want to allow you ...[Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Oh, you are not going into the merits. Okay, fine then.

The SPEAKER: No, no, I am not getting into the merits of it. I am asking ...[Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Thank you.

The SPEAKER: ...do you have a point of order.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): No, I do not have a point of order ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): ...but if they want me to apologise, I refuse. The Khoi were here first.

The SPEAKER: Okay, hon ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Marais, that is not a point of order. [Interjections.] Hon Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Is that a new point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It is a new point of order. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay, because you cannot rise on a point of order on a point of order.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It is a new point of order. There was a clear appeal that hon Marais must withdraw. Now, what he is doing is far from it and if that is how he chooses to adhere to a request that was made, I am afraid me being black and an African woman, I am not going to sit in the same House that I am insulted in.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. Hon members, I appeal to you. Based on my initial ruling, I want to be able to come back to this House with a considered view on all the facts in front of me. [Interjections.] And for that reason, I am coming back to make a ruling on that House [Interjections.] with and that is in line ...[Interjections.] and that is in line with the point of order

raised by hon Nkondlo. So, I want to rule on all of that together. I have made a ruling stating that I am going to come back to the House. [Interjections.] I will come back to the House.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): That is not ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I will come back to the House.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You are not even, you are not even a ...[Inaudible.]

We cannot throw away ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You cannot!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker [Interjections.], Hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon members! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, can I appeal that given given the sensitivity of the matter and the fact that racism is outlawed in this country and in humanity, that instead of going back to Hansard, you adjourn the House for five minutes, you look at the Hansard and then, you return [Interjections.] instead of waiting until a next sitting. It is a serious matter.

[Interjections.] So, I want to propose that as a way forward and as a middle ground. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Absolutely. I am prepared to do that because I take that point of order very, very seriously. Let me put it on the record. And for that reason, I want to be allowed an opportunity to look at all the facts and all the comments made. That is why I made the ruling. So, I am happy to suspend for five minutes in order for me to do that, if everyone is in agreement. The House is suspended.

The SPEAKER: Please be seated. Thank you, hon members. Hon members, I have suspended the House for a couple of minutes in order to apply my mind to a point of order that was raised earlier. I then suspended the House. I am not able to apply my mind accordingly, so I am going to ask that the Deputy Speaker will take over the Chair in order for the House to continue with the business on the Order Paper.

I will come back before adjournment of the House with a ruling. So, I please ask that you allow me this opportunity to apply my mind based on that point of order and I will come back with a ruling before we adjourn for today. Thank you.

[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Good afternoon, hon members. We will proceed

with GOOD, the hon member, to actually continue with his Statement.

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The Cabinet reshuffle of Monday past is not only a disappointment for South Africa and more specifically, the people of the Western Cape, but more so a slap in the face of women, youth and persons with disabilities who are now represented by a 74-year-old in Cabinet.

The President had the opportunity to take the nation into its confidence and give non-performing, incompetent Ministers the boot and replace them with solution-driven individuals who are able to champion the mandate of their various portfolios. What is evident is that the competence pool in the ANC is shrinking and South Africans are suffering daily because of this. The decisions taken for the reshuffle was short-sighted, ill-conceived and the result of it shows a great lack of urgency needed to turn our ailing nation around.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the plight of the youth and the perceived urgency of our leaders to tackle the challenges of this demographic has become cheap political rhetoric that only enjoys airtime closer to the elections. A 74-year-old Minister is now representing 35,7% of the population between the ages of 18 to 35. This should be considered a shame for our country posing as progressive. Hon Deputy Speaker, now bringing it closer to home.

What is this Government realistically doing for young people? Youth cafés

are situated too far from the youth to successfully use them for too few ...[Audio distorted.] the existence. The skills shortages amongst the youth should be urgently addressed by promoting vocational training and including society's most vulnerable amongst the work force. Academia such as Chrysalis should be branched out to more communities. Our youth deserve a prosperous future with the ability and means to build a livelihood. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise Al Jama-Ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. *Bismillah-ir-Rahman-ir-Rahim*. Al Jama-Ah is very concerned about the increasing incidents of criminal activities at public healthcare facilities in the province. Our healthcare workers should feel safe and not be exposed to robbery and assaults inside and outside clinics and hospitals. The healthcare workers are not only exposed to robbery and assaults, but also verbal abuse, theft and even having their vehicles stolen from parking areas at healthcare facilities. The current security personnel are ill-equipped and at a disadvantage to hold off criminal attacks. We call on the Province to deploy efficient security personnel at healthcare facilities.

We commend National Government's free circumcision and *viva* to the ANC for those services that are available at most clinics throughout the country. Whilst these free circumcision services are available from the age of 15

years, many poor families within the Muslim community are deprived of having their male children circumcised at an earlier age. Private circumcision can cost up to R1 500.

Al Jama-Ah calls on the Province to take the lead in lowering the age restriction for free circumcision at clinics for those who cannot afford to have it done privately. This will not only benefit the Muslim community, but also communities of other faiths who would like to have their male children circumcised at an earlier age. *Viva* the ANC. Long live the ANC. The ANC will take the Western Cape. [Laughter.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you to the hon member from Al Jama-Ah. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.] I was a little confused there. I was convinced I was speaking to Al Jama-Ah, but we will now move over to the Democratic Alliance. [Interjections.]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, today I want to put a renewed focus on the endless failure of the ANC National Government to complete critical infrastructure projects. According to their Minister of Water Affairs' reply in 2009 in the National Assembly, construction on the old and unsafe Clanwilliam Dam wall was to start in the 2010/2011 financial year, with a completion date in the 2015/2016 financial year. The project cost was estimated by the Minister at R677-million.

The increased wall height would have ensured greater water security and

access to water for irrigation to particularly emerging farmers. In just 14 years, the projected cost has now increased sixfold. The cost to the agri-economy, the suffering due to job opportunities lost, the shattered dreams of emerging farmers that were promised access to water and the plight of those looking for employment during the construction phase probably exceeds the construction costs. As recently as September last year, Minister Mchunu promised that construction work would start in February this year. Well, February has come and gone, and the contracts for construction work have still not been finalised.

The delays in increasing the dam wall height resulted in members of the Lower Olifants River Water Users Association accessing only 41% of their allocated water quotas during this summer. Yet, they are still required to pay as if they are receiving their full allocations. This is negatively affecting agriculture production, as well as job creation. With loadshedding already placing strain on farmers' ability to irrigate, the delays in the Clanwilliam Wall Dam project are simply unacceptable. In closure: the ANC National Government has for too long, through incompetence and entrenched corruption when it comes to the awarding of tenders, disregarded the people of this country. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. That brings us to the end of Statements. In terms of Rule 145(6), I now allow one of more hon members of the Executive present to respond to Members Statements for not more than five minutes collectively. I recognise the hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. So, I will try and use a little bit of that time and I am sorry that some of our nurses that were here have left. I wanted to use this opportunity to say to them: thank you very much for their commitment and for the role that they have played during this pandemic. We really do appreciate it and I wanted to say to them, 'thank you.'

I also wanted to say to them and to the hon members of this House that we all have contracts. Even those nurses signed a contract, and they knew there was a start date and there was an end date. These hon members here have contracts. The voters decide at the end of their term whether they come back on their contracts. The nurses: we have engaged with them since October and they know that there are vacancies for which they can apply and I really hope that they do apply, to get into a new contract. But I want to say to them: thank you, for what they have done.

Then, I would like to just further say to the hon August that he asks what this Government is doing for the youth. I would refer him to the Blue Book: R25,7-billion or R25 700 million of our budget every year, goes to youth programmes.

And then lastly, following on from the hon Murray who spoke about jobs and the economy, and the failure of national policies to deliver. It is interesting to see that in the quarter on quarter numbers that came out for jobs where

there are 169 000 new jobs in South Africa in total, 167 000 of those jobs are in the Western Cape and 2 000 jobs to the positive in every other ANC province put together, 2 000 jobs in all of the rest of the country put together in the ANC provinces. 167 000 jobs in this province where DA policy is put in place. That is where ANC policy is put in place. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. I recognise hon Minister Maynier. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, please, hon members. [Interjections.] There are still three minutes available for the hon Minister to respond. [Interjections.] Order! Over to you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I think we all in this House know that budgets are tight. The Education infrastructure grant has been declining in real terms for many years.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: That is why I would like to associate myself with the hon member's comments and welcome National

Government's additional funding in the amount of R115-million, which we will use and allocate to our Rapid School Build programme, where we aim to build beautiful new schools in poor communities in the Western Cape. We certainly hope that in the future, National Government will consider allocating more money for this purpose and match the huge fiscal effort being put into Education by Provincial Treasury. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Any further responses from our hon Executive members? No. I am going to take that as a 'no'. This is the end now of our Members Statements. We move over to Notices of Motion.

MOTIONS

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: In terms of Rule 151, all Notices of Motion by hon members must be delivered to the Secretary for placing on the Order Paper. Accordingly, these Motions have been duly submitted and published on the Order Paper below the line.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates that over 400 learners are yet to be placed in the Western Cape. While other learners are preparing to write end of term

tests, some parents are still struggling to find placement for their children.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the GBV and femicide in the Western Cape, as well as sexual harassment cases within the Provincial Government.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the backlog of elective surgeries in the Western Cape Hospitals.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the challenges related to Health, as well as decommissioning of COVID-19 hospitals.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr M KAMA: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the case of sports in the Western Cape.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms A P BANS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the emergency-staff targeted crimes in the Western Cape.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: In terms of Rule 150, we move to Motions without Notice. Hon members would please note that in terms of the new Standing Rule of 150 pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolence and congratulatory were submitted to the Programming Authority prior to this plenary on 7 March 2023. Hon members would further remember that Motions without Notice on the congratulatory and condolence matters will not be allowed in this sitting if the Programming Authority has not processed them.

In this regard, the Table staff informs me that in the Programming Authority

meeting of 7 March 2023, political parties submitted the names of hon members in the desired order of speaking and indicated their respective members with the desire to move a motion without notice in this Sitting of the House.

I will therefore just for noting and for the Minutes, call out the hon members whose names have accordingly been submitted and approved. The Programming Authority approved the following hon members' motions as follows: hon Sayed, hon Kama, hon Kama, hon Dugmore, hon Bosman. I now put the motions duly submitted and approved by the Programming Authority to the House.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the 18-year-old Nande Popo, hailing from Mfuleni, Cape Town, on becoming one of the top national achievers of the 2022 Engen Maths and Science School (EMSS); notes that Nande was in matric last year at the Mfuleni High School; notes that she was honoured with this award at the EMSS award ceremony held at the Cape Peninsula University of Technology (CPUT, Cape Town Campus) on Saturday 18 February to honour Grade 10 to Grade 12 EMSS learners in the Western Cape; and notes that she is currently busy with her first year in Medicine at the University of Cape Town. Halala Nande.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr M KAMA: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the South African Women's Cricket team on reaching the Cricket World Cup final; notes that this achievement will go down in the history books as they are the first SA team to progress to the final of a Cricket World Cup; notes that, although they did not win the cup after their match against Australia, the team came second; and congratulates Cape Town-born fast bowler, Shabnim Ismail, who ended the tournament as the world's leading wicket-taker in the history of the Women's T20 World Cup.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr M KAMA: I move without notice:

That the House notes with pride the sterling work done by Cape Town-born football coach who is widely credited with being instrumental in Marcus Rashford's revival and scoring form; and notes and congratulates Benni McCarthy on winning the EFL Cup Tournament with Manchester United where he is the first team coach working with strikers.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I move without notice:

That the House conveys its deepest sympathies to Linda Herbst, her family and friends on the tragic passing away of Paul and Sevaughn Herbst; notes that, while serving as part of the Gift of the Givers rescue team in Turkey, it was reported that Paul rescued an 80-year-old woman who had been stuck in the rubble for eight days after the earthquake; notes that Paul Herbst was the director of the Medi Response KZN and was well known among the international rescue community; and notes that Sevaughn, the son of Paul and Linda, tragically died in a motorbike crash a few days after his father's passing.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr G BOSMAN: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the South African Women's Cricket Team on their sterling performance during the ICC Women's T20 World Cup, which saw them progress to the final match of the tournament; and notes that, while they did not claim ultimate victory this year, the entire team and its coaching staff should be immensely proud of their performance, which saw them exemplify the highest standards of South African sport.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections, agreed to. The motions will appear in the Minutes of the Proceedings and on Hansard, in each hon members' names as if that particular hon member had read them out aloud.

I will now allow hon members to move Motions without Notice as per Standing Rule 152(d). This could also include Motions without Notice that were not approved in the Programming Authority meeting. Hon members are reminded that the three minutes, as per Standing Rule 152(d) will start now. According to my list, I now recognise the honourable – Oh, Chief Whip, my apologies. I did not see you ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): My apologies. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): May I ask that Motions 12 and 14, in terms of Standing Rule 152(a) and 153(a), please be referred to the Programming Authority. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: 12 and 14, if I am correct, for the record ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): 12 and 14.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: 12 and 14, for the record. Thank you very much, hon Chief Whip. I now move over to hon Klaas.

Mr T M KLAAS: I move without notice:

That the House notes that on 7 March 2023, staff members from Brackengate Intermediate Care Facility comprising of nurses, social workers, admin staff, cleaning staff and doctors marched to this House against unfair treatment by the Western Cape Department of Health. This follows the move by the Department to terminate contracts of these workers as of end March 2023 and replace them with new employees from elsewhere. Further notes that these workers joined the Department at the height of the COVID-19 pandemic at the time when it was not fashionable to do so and risked their own lives in the process. The EFF calls for the Western Cape Department of Health to insource these workers at the Brackengate Care Facility or related facilities or alternatively place them in clinics or hospitals. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I see objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Bans.

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep concern the rising levels of extortion targeted at people who receive construction tenders in the Western Cape, with the latest incident being three contractors who were shot at the City's R500-million Delft Symphony Way housing project last month; further notes and accepts that the DA in the province started and sustained the extortion mafia in the province through awarding of lucrative tenders to companies linked to known gangsters, including the housing tender that was issued to a family member of a known gang high-flier, as well as the three WCED security contracts in Delft that are allegedly awarded to gangsters; acknowledges that the DA is the founder of the extortion racket in the province, like the apartheid regime it funds gangsterism and civil unrest in the poor working class communities; condemns the DA and calls for urgent intervention to bring an end to extortion in the province, as well as investigations into contracts the DA Government has awarded to gangsters in the province. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bans. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections.

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Bans, before you go off, I recognise you again. Hon Bans? I am going to move over to hon Marran and then, I will come back to hon Bans.

Mr P MARRAN: Thanks, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House notes and lauds the National Government for the successful completion of Brandvlei Dam; further notes that the dam came at a cost R21-million; it will unlock 5 000 hectares of agricultural land; it will create between 5 000 and 10 000 new job opportunities and it will benefit almost 70% black farmers and other black businesses; and further supports Government efforts to improve food security in the province and country at large; notes further with pride that while Minister Senzo Mchunu officially opened the dam on 10 February 2023, the National Government has also set in motion plans for the

construction of the Clanwilliam Dam; and commends the National Government for its successful efforts to make the Western Cape a better place. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections ...*[Interjection.]*

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Agreed to.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marran, are you – I mean, hon Bans, are you there?

Ms A P BANS: Yes, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, you may proceed with your second one.

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the rise in stoning of SAPS vehicles in parts of Cape Town, which CPF members claim as the new way in which gang members are recruiting youngsters; further notes the cry from the community that these kids need to be in school and that as the result of many unplaced learners, they end up being recruited into gangs; notes further that a constable who was responding to a murder scene in Manenberg was injured after his vehicle was stoned; wishes him a speedy recovery and calls on SAPS, the Western Cape Education Department and the communities to prevent the children from being recruited into gangs. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bans. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections, agreed to. Hon Marran, over to you.

Mr P MARRAN: Thanks, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House notes with sadness the housing crisis in this province, the issue that affects most black people. the Provincial Government does not care. Over 500 000 people are without houses in Western Cape, yet they are registered at the Department of Housing database for housing opportunities. The number of people who have registered dates back to 1997. As we speak, 200 occupants of the abandoned Helen Bowden Nurses Home located on the corner of Granger Bay Boulevard and Beach Road, Green Point are facing a possible eviction without a solution. When the occupation of the building started in March 2017, this Provincial Government switched off electricity and people have been living in those conditions ever since. The hon Premier criticised the Reclaim the City occupants during the State of the Province Address last month. He said that the number of housing beneficiaries affected by extortion has risen dramatically in the past few months from 18 000 to 21 000 residents. If anything, this shows this Government do not know how to deliver services. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that 8 March is celebrated as International Women's Day, a day that honours the women's rights struggle, as well as a day to step up the fight until it is won for the social, economic, political, and cultural liberation of all women; further notes that women in the Western Cape are still suffering from the yoke of triple oppression of unemployment, poverty and inequality, while Gender-Based Violence and Femicide as well as sexual offences are at an extreme high; remembers all the victims of GBV and Femicide in the province and country at large, especially the victim of Farrel Payne who remains at home while the perpetrator remains in his position through the support of the hon Premier and his MECs; calls on all the hon members of the House to band together and reaffirm their commitment to ending the triple oppression of women, patriarchy in all of its expressions, Gender-Based Violence, and Femicide in order to create a society that is really inclusive, non-sexist, and democratic; calls on the Provincial Government to prioritize this struggle by allocating more resources towards combating the scourge of GBV and Femicide; and celebrates and honours all women out there. *Malibongwe Igama*

Lamakhosikazi, malibongwe!

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: *Malibongwe!*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Hon MEMBERS: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that during an oversight visit to Langa High and Zimasa Primary School in Kwa-Langa, there were serious challenges which were exposed as an impediment to the provision of quality education in the province; calls on the Education MEC, hon David

Maynier, to take note and urgently attend to these challenges which include overcrowded classrooms where there were 50 learners in one class at the primary school and 65 learners in a class at the high school; further notes with deep shock and sadness, the carelessness of the Western Cape Education Department's Safe Schools Unit on matters of school safety at schools in poor and working class communities as the visit highlighted the high occurrence of substance abuse, gang activity and break-ins at these schools which have gone unresolved for years; notes further that following an engagement with the ANC, the South African Police Service, together with the local CPF and the safety volunteers in the area, have agreed to conduct regular patrols and search and seizure operations; and commends them for the swift response and calls on the WCED to deploy a social workers to each of these schools.

I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. On behalf of the People's Movement, the African National Congress, the Government in waiting as affirmed by other political parties ...[Interjection.]

I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep concern and calls on the hon MEC Maynier to institute an urgent investigation into the reported incident at Esangweni Secondary in Khayelitsha where the principal is said to have chased away spiritually gifted learners at the school and further prohibited them from coming back to the school, including a Grade 12 learner who is forced to stay at home because she is in the process of being a traditional healer; further notes that the reported incident at the schools adds to a long list of incidents in which learners have been discriminated against on the basis of their culture and traditions; calls on the Western Cape Education Department to run programmes to sensitize educators to respect various cultures and traditions; condemns the principal of Esangweni Secondary and instructs him allow the learners back to school; and calls on Western Cape Education Department to review all schools' codes of conduct and to work with the House of Traditional Leaders and other stakeholders, to formulate uniform codes of conduct and a policy against discrimination of religious and spiritual beliefs. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: *Haibo!*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I hear an objection. [Interjections.] The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Nkondlo. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Jesus.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move on behalf of the Government in waiting, the ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, just take your seat for a moment. Hon Minister, what ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Hon Deputy Speaker, this relentless, blasphemous remarks from the ANC is quite disturbing and I would like you to ask hon Lekker to please withdraw that comment.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Your ...[Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Your blasphemous comment, [Interjections.] it is deeply offensive.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): How so?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: As a Christian, it is deeply offensive ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: No, your word!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members!

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members! Can we not have a conversation ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Hon Deputy Speaker, the word should please be withdrawn because it is used in a context that betrays the sanctimony of my God and I would like that that be please ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I understand. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Laughs.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, [Interjections.] just take your seat for a moment. Hon Nkondlo, I have the ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Laughs.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have the Deputy Whip ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Laughs.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...one ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]... we were in order. We were saying nothing. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute! Hon Nkondlo. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: *Haibo*.

An HON MEMBER: What is blasphemy?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Okay ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, I cannot hear. ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, just take your seat.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, of course, religious sensitivity, as well as race sensitivity always needs to be taken into account in the work we do. But I think it is also unfair for the hon Minister not to give context and substance to what the hon Chief Whip has raised. I picked up no offence, no blasphemous remarks in that regard and I did not even hear the hon MEC elaborating on what was wrong with what the Chief Whip had said. She just stood up and made a general statement. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

Perhaps the hon Minister or the hon MEC could have asked what I said. I will repeat. I said: does she know anything about traditional calling?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Is there anything blasphemous about it or what? Perhaps the hon MEC can clarify it better.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Lekker. Hon members, thank you very much. Can I just ask. I am not quite sure if there is something in the air today, but all I am asking is please for us to practice tolerance on all levels and high sensitivity. So, I have – I did not clearly hear what hon Lekker said. Hon Lekker said she said that. I can check it on Hansard and always come back, and make a ruling on that, hon Minister Wenger because I now am not clear. But can I just ask ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...can we get through the motions and please, hon members, we have been in this House for some time, and I am ...[Interjections.] Please, hon members ...[Interjections.] I am still speaking. If I can just ask for your indulgence and your tolerance. Hon Marran, hon Kama? Hon Nkondlo, you may ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is there anybody who has got a point of order online because I am hearing voices? No? Okay. Hon Nkondlo, you may proceed.

Ms N D NKONDLO: I move without notice:

That the House notes and welcomes a meeting held at the Rusthof High School last week in Strand, to look at issues of school safety at the school and others around the Helderberg region; notes further and lauds the Lwandle SAPS Police Station for participating in the discussions and thereafter, formulating a School Safety Plan which includes among others: establishing a school safety forum to ensure safety within school premises, maintaining police visibility inside and outside school premises, conducting random school searches at any given time; notes and supports the calls by local stakeholders for School Resource Officers to be deployed to all schools around the Helderberg Region, as well as for the School Safety Plan to be implemented in all schools; further commends all the stakeholders that took part in that meeting, as well as encouraging all police stations in the province to also develop their own School Safety Plans. I so move, thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections

to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep concern the nationwide National Education Health and Allied Workers Union (NEHAWU) protests which have resulted in disruptions to a number of hospitals in the province, particularly the KDH, and the loss of two people and a little child; notes further that while we acknowledge and supports the workers' right to protest, we are however not in support of the closing down of hospitals and intimidation of other workers who are not on strike. We call on the National Government and the Alliance Partners, especially NEHAWU and Cosatu, to go back to the negotiation table and speed up the process of negotiations so that our nurses could go back to work; and calls on the National Government to recognize the important role the nurses play in the public healthcare system and give them the better wage they deserve. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and condemns the unreasonable back-to-back scheduling of the budget deliberations in committees which makes proper oversight difficult. The DA does this only as a tick box exercise. There is no real commitment to work, serve and to ensure public participation. They are avoiding accountability and cover-up for their Provincial Executive. This is not the first time the ANC raises this in this House. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.]

Hon MEMBERS: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Bans. Are you there, online? [Interjections.]

Ms W F KAISER-PHILANDER: Yes, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, sorry, sorry. No, no, no. I did get that message, my apologies. I recognise point 13, hon Kaiser-Philander.

Ms W F KAISER-PHILANDER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

I move without notice:

That the House notes and objects to the changes announced by President Cyril Ramaphosa to his Cabinet on Monday evening ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No!

Ms W F KAISER-PHILANDER:

...that this was in fact not a reshuffle, but rather a bloating of a Cabinet already bursting at the seams with fat cats and cadres; that the unconscionable decision ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Ms W F KAISER-PHILANDER:

...to add two new Ministries within the Presidency will contribute an

estimated R74-million to South Africa's public sector wage bill at a time of record unemployment and job losses, poor economic growth and a rolling blackout crisis threatening food and job security; that the newly recycled Cabinet is a slap in the face of the South African people as there is clearly no accountability within the Ramaphosa administration for the bungling of the energy crisis, economic crisis, job crisis, crime crisis, GBV crisis, basic and higher education crisis, infrastructure crisis, healthcare crisis and service delivery crisis, among the many other crises our nation faces; that the House urges the National Government to cut the fat and stop the abuse of taxpayers' money to bankroll the lifestyles of fat-cat ANC cadres; and follow the Western Cape example of a lean, efficient, and caring Government that puts the interests of residents first, not the interests of the politically-connected elites. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. There are objections ...[Interjections.] So, there are objections, the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] I now recognise the hon Pretorius. Order, hon members. [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: There is a lot of ...[Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Windvogel! [Interjections.] Hon Premier, I would like to move over to hon Pretorius. Hon Pretorius, are you online? Hon Pretorius? I am going to move over to hon Maseko. Hon Maseko? Alright, last call. Hon Maseko or hon Pretorius? No? That brings us to the end of Motions without Notice. [Interjections.] Hon members, if you can just allow my indulgence. I am just going to hand over to the Speaker.

[The Speaker takes the Chair.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, thank you very much firstly, for your indulgence for allowing me an opportunity. I have now had an opportunity to listen to the audio recording of the Debate, particularly the speech by the hon Marais, points of orders and interjections, and the transcription of the proceedings today are not yet available. Regrettably, some comments, especially interjections, are not clearly audible and therefore, a considered view is not possible until I have had the benefit of the transcribed recordings of today's sitting.

Under the circumstances and since this is a very serious matter, I will give a considered ruling on the allegations at the first opportunity next week Tuesday, as I am not in a position to do so today.

Hon members, that is my ruling on this. I just want to check with the Table staff that all the business has been dealt with. Hon members, that concludes

the business for the day. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:27.