
THURSDAY, 8 SEPTEMBER 2022

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The SPEAKER: You may all be seated. Welcome the hon members, the Premier, leaders of political parties and of course the hon members. Some are connected in a virtual platform. We have a large contingent of the hon members in the House and we appreciate that, that the Chamber is very warm today with both sides of the House fully clothed, so thank you, hon members, for being here with us here in the Chamber. I also need to appreciate the stakeholders who are connected in the virtual platform in the Chamber in the gallery, of course, in this gallery here in the Chamber and the gallery in the virtual platform.

Let me just remind the hon members that you know the rules of the virtual platforms. It is not for me to remind you at this stage because you are accustomed to our systems. We have been really using this system for over two years so we really are all au fait with how the systems work. Kindly observe the protocol of the conduct of the virtual meetings and of course, this is a hybrid meeting. Do not activate your camera if you are not speaking and your microphone if you are not speaking, but also the hon members who are in the Chamber, please do not connect on your virtual platform, because you are here in the Chamber with us.

I also need to request kindly that everybody else who is not a member of Parliament, please do not activate your microphone and your camera at any given stage because you will not be participating in the debate, but you will very much observe, and we appreciate you being here with us today.

Hon members, without taking much of your time, this Rule, Rule number 40 in terms of the Standing Rules has become more important lately because members, as you know, there will be a debate later. I would like to request that we respect one another and we conduct ourselves within the decorum that is expected of a hon member of this Parliament.

At this point, I wish to recognize the Chief Whip. I have been informed that now it is still very difficult. I am going to recognise the Deputy Chief Whip.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

(Motion)

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House recognises the invaluable contributions of the late Chief Whip of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, Ms Lorraine Botha, whom this House deeply mourns; notes that Chief Whip Botha was elected to the Western Cape Provincial Parliament in 2014 and, during her time, served as the Chairperson of the Standing Committees on Education, Social Development, as well as the Premier and Constitutional Matters; notes that she also served as the Democratic Alliance Caucus Chairperson until she was appointed as Chief Whip of the DA's Western Cape caucus in May this year; notes that Chief Whip Botha also served as the DA constituency head for Berg River; therefore resolves; that its heartfelt condolences be conveyed to her sister, Jeanette Maistry, family, friends and colleagues.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon, the Deputy Chief Whip. There is no list of speakers and we will request that the hon members, if you recall this is a motion that is in the Order Paper in the name of the Deputy Chief Whip, as we remember the late hon Botha, and I would like to request that the hon members who so wish to participate as the political parties, do so, so that we

are able to respectfully, as this House, do so to recognise the late Chief Whip. I recognize the ANC. No speakers?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Speaker, our Chief Whip will be doing so virtually.

The SPEAKER: Oh, thank you. Hon, the Chief Whip, †Mankwali?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): May I ask that we pass for now, Speaker. I will come back.

The SPEAKER: You will come in?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Sorry, hon members, alright. May I then, hon members, begin with the EFF. The EFF, not here?

Mr M XEGO: We are here, Speaker, we are here.

The SPEAKER: The GOOD. You are here. †Ngena Ngconde. [Come in Ngconde.]

Mr M XEGO: Okay, thank you, Mr Speaker, and let me also welcome the Premier in the House, but on behalf of the EFF we wish to express and extend

our sadness and as well as our condolences to the Democratic Alliance as the ruling party for having lost one of their members who served as the Chief Whip of this august House and made sure that under the circumstances we lead our House with the gratitude it deserves but in essence what we want to appeal on is to look very well towards each other. What we have noted, that this giant member, fellow member of Parliament passed on with her boots on. It meant that we ought to look at each other's wellness. There needs to be within the system, I am appealing to you, Mr Speaker, a way where we would be able to detect if we are all still well, and if needs be that there should be assistance that is provided to assist some of our members. We do not wish to have a repetition of such a case, and furthermore, to appeal to the Department of Health and Wellness, that as Government, as we are going to extend such a service to the greater citizenry of the Western Cape, it should start with the House, but to the Democratic Alliance, the Botha family, the people of the West Coast and the Western Cape, we say be strong, because we knew how strong this leader was and let us remain accommodative towards each other and work well with one another, because we do not know when will we lose each other. Thank you very much, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Xego. Hon members, I now recognise the GOOD Party.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Comrade.

Mr S N AUGUST: Hon Speaker, on behalf of the GOOD movement, its

leaders, public representatives, members, supporters and our constituents. I would like to pass my condolences to the family, friends and loved ones of the late hon Lorraine Botha. On Wednesday 31st August 2022, the Western Cape Provincial Legislature lost a tree amongst its ranks, an individual who cared deeply for the work of this House, her portfolios, her role as a public representative and whose sole purpose was to change as many lives as possible.

At the memorial service of hon Lorraine, we had the opportunity to be reminded of her kindness, love and generous spirit through the memories of family, friends and members of this institution. She touched many hearts and changed numerous lives and the principles in which she upheld her Oath of Office was done with a great deal of integrity and respect towards the Constitution and the institutions in which she served both politically and within Government.

Speaker, public servants of such high calibre are hard to come by. As servant leadership is the model compass setting the cause for their work, the example of hon Botha will now serve as a guide to many here and elsewhere and it is my wish that we all adopt this exemplary style of leadership in all the diverse capacities in which we serve. I would like to convey my wishes of strength and comfort to the family and her colleagues during this trying and difficult time. I can assure you all that it will be hard and let no one tell you otherwise. It is my hope that they find comfort in the memories of her, find peace in their love and know that she invested her life in changing the lives

of others, a greater and more remarkable sacrifice does not exist.

Rest well, hon Lorraine Botha, till we meet again.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon August. Hon members, I now recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Speaker. On behalf of the ACDP it was with a sense of shock and disbelief when I received the news of the passing of not just a colleague, but a friend of mine. Words fail to come to mind to come to grips with her sudden passing. I met Lorraine Botha in 2014 in the Legislature, and she was my Chairperson when it came to Education, and we served on Community Safety together, and, as I said, she was just not a colleague, and as I said at the memorial, we had a convention. We may differ in the House, but outside of this House we made a commitment to be friends forever.

As the ACDP and we want to commend her devotion and the passions she had for people and the contribution she made. She was hard, but she was also friendly, and she was straightforward. She was also a mother-figure to many younger colleagues. She could be trusted, Speaker, she could be trusted and she would never betray anyone.

We want to thank her and again, you know what it is to be in a political party and when you are in a political party, any political party, you are like family,

so the DA will miss her, because you are like family, but you know, when it comes to death, we cannot determine death, but everybody must die, and, as I said, we will miss her outwardly, but not inwardly, because her memories will last forever, and I really pray that to her family and friends, the memories, the memories that she created, that they will become the carriers of that memory going forward and the memory that I want to leave with this House is that she was a caring person, a loving person, and gave everything that she had. She was a committed worker, giving everything she had to uplift the people of the Western Cape and this country. May her soul rest in peace. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians, for those kind words. Hon members, I now recognise the FF Plus.

†Mnr P J MARAIS: Geagte Speaker, ek wil my medelye uitspreek teenoor die familie, vriende, kollegas in die DA en ook aan die Opposisiekant van die ontslape agbare lid, Lorraine Botha. 'n Mens besef en weet nooit die pyn wat 'n ander voel nie, so ek wil nie sê “I feel your pain” nie. Ek wil my dus slegs uitspreek oor hoe ék voel nadat ek die tyding ontvang het van haar dood. Ek was verslae. Ek was geskok. Ek was hartseer, maar as 'n Christen glo ek die Here het haar vir ons geleen. Die Here het haar teruggeneem na haar hemelse woning. Ek glo as gelowige dit was alles deel van God se plan vir haar, soos met elkeen van ons wat hier sit. Ons weet nie God se plan met ons nie. Ons berus ons daarby met innerlike hartseer want die mense van die Weskus het hulle ligting verloor, 'n ligting wat drenkeling-matrose kan wys, “kom

hiernatoe, kom na my toe, hier is hulp.” Weskus se mense het daai ligstraal wat van die lictoring kom, me Botha, verloor. God het dit finaal afgeskakel. Hierdie Huis sal die vakuum wat sy nalaat beswaarlik kan vul.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Speaker, I would like to convey my condolences to the family, friends, colleagues in the DA and also on the Opposition side of the late hon member, Lorraine Botha. One does not realise and never knows the pain that others feel, so I don't want to say "I feel your pain". I therefore only want to express myself about how I feel after I received the news about her death. I was devastated. I was shocked. I was sad, but as a Christian I believe the Lord has lent her to us. The Lord took her back to her heavenly home. I'm convinced as a true believer it was all part of God's plan for her, as with each of us sitting here today. We don't know what God's plan is with us. We resign ourselves with inner sadness because the people of the West Coast have lost their lighthouse, a lighthouse that can show drowning sailors, "come this way, come to me, there is help here". The West Coast's people have lost that beam of light coming from the lighthouse, Ms Botha. God finally turned it off. This House will hardly be able to fill the vacuum that she had left behind.]

She has left a vacancy in this House that will be difficult to fill. We must mourn her death but also build on the example she has set for everyone in this House. Thank you.

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie, agbare Marais.

[The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais.] Hon members, I now recognise the Al Jama-ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, on behalf of the Al Jama-ah I would like to extend my heartfelt condolences to the family, colleagues, members of the DA, all the members of the Western Cape Legislature at the sad passing of hon Lorraine Botha, the Chief Whip of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. We will remember hon Botha who held her position as Chief Whip of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament with great pride and in a warm and friendly manner. We further salute her for her dedication and commitment to change the lives of the indigent people.

May the legacy she leaves behind be an inspiration for all of us, who continue to be at the service of our constituencies. We pray to the Almighty to shower contentment over her loved ones and all those whose lives she has touched. I thank you very much, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Brinkhuis. Hon members, I now recognise the ANC, the Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Mr Speaker. The sad passing of Lorraine Botha on the last day of Women's Month is significant. The dreadful news of her untimely death was met with great grief across the caucus of the ANC in the Western Cape Provincial Legislature. At such a

time political differences are put aside to appreciate life and acknowledge the great strides the person had made to improve the lot of others.

The late Ms Botha served as my counterpart as Chief Whip for the Democratic Alliance for just under three months. We had entered the Legislature together in 2014 and had to learn the ropes of serving the people of the Western Cape together. A hard worker who died with her boots on in her office, Ms Botha was impeccable in her appearance and gracious in her demeanour. Whereas we thought she could have done more to hold the Provincial Government to account, she did not think twice of holding fellow members of the Provincial Legislature accountable. When fellow MPLs referred to oversight visits as trips, she would promptly remind them that it was not a trip, but that they were still doing their jobs. These visits funded by the taxpayers deserved the necessary professionalism and had to produce the required outcomes.

First and foremost for Ms Botha came the people of the Western Cape. During her first term, the hon Botha served as Chairperson of the Standing Committee of the Premier and Constitutional Affairs. In 2014 she led the processes on the proposed amendments to Sections 71 and 78 of the Constitution of the Western Cape. Though neither of these amendments were eventually passed, the hon Botha emphasised that at that time engagement by the Western Cape Provincial Parliament with the people of the province is a function of democratic constitutionalism. It amounts to government by the people, as it allows for public input into matters that affect citizens. She was

committed to deal with this.

On her re-election in 2019, Ms Botha was elected as the Chairperson of the Education Standing Committee and prioritised the welfare of educators and learners. Paying tribute to the former maths educator, Thulani Manqoyi at Heinz Park Primary School when he was shot and killed while sitting in his car on the school's premises in 2021, Ms Botha said that:

“Teachers are pillars of communities and there is no doubt that Mr Manqoyi leaves behind a legacy of upliftment to all who passed through his classroom.”

As a former teacher herself and a pillar in our Provincial Parliament, Ms Botha went on to chair the Standing Committee on the Premier and Constitutional Affairs again earlier this year and was then promoted as the DA’s first black woman to be Chief Whip in the Legislature. The significance for me, the ANC’s first woman Chief Whip was not lost and while she had succeeded Mireille Wenger MPL there was consolation that our Provincial Legislature was finally giving recognition to capable women. Our thoughts and prayers continue to be with her family, her children and colleagues in the DA. As someone who loved the West Coast, the words of the Afrikaans poetess, Ingrid Jonker, come to mind when thinking of the now late Lorraine Botha:

“Small blue Namaqualand daisy

answering something, believing something, knowing something.”

May her soul continue to rest in peace. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip and of course †siyabulela Mankwali ngamazwi amnandi. [Thank you Mankwali for the nice words.]

I now recognise the DA. Deputy Chief Whip.

†Die ADJUNKSWEEP (DA): Agbare Speaker.

“Liefste, jy mág nie doodgaan nie
jy mag nie eers dúrf dínk aan dood nie
ek, wat agterbly, balsem jou in taal
vou jou in woorde
dat môre jou kan erf en kan hê en kan hou”

Ek dra hierdie geskrewe woorde van Antjie Krog op aan ons rooibosdogter, die wyle Hoofswep, die agbare me Lorraine Botha, ’n gemeenskapsaktivis van formaat, opgelei as ’n maatskaplike werker. Sy het agter ieder en elk gekyk. Vandat sy by die DA aangesluit het, het Lorraine die vroeë dele van haar loopbaan by die Departement van Maatskaplike Ontwikkeling by die Bonnytoun Plek van Veiligheid deurgebring, waar sy haar daaraan toegewei het om die beste moontlike sorg aan hoë-risiko jeug te verskaf.

Sy het tyd saam met die SOS Kinderdorpe deurgebring wat 'n lewenslange affiniteit vir kinders weerspieël het en 'n begeerte gehad om die mees kwesbare op te hef, 'n toegewyde staatsamptenaar en 'n fel parlementêre advokaat. Haar toewyding was aansteeklik, soos ons sal sien in Gesondheid-, Onderwys-, Maatskaplike Ontwikkeling-, Plaaslike Regering- en Premier-portefeuljes. Later sal ons sien hoe sy verhef word tot die eer van HoofswEEP, erkenning van hoë standarde, uitnemendheid, passie en bekwaamheid. Sy sal deur haar suster Jeanette Maistry en haar niggie en neef Angelo en Angelique onthou word.

Ons sal haar in ons harte koester en soos Antjie Krog ons herinner, ons gaan nie toelaat dat enige iemand durf om te dink aan die dood van jou nalatenskap nie. Môre sal jou onthou, ons Rooibosdogter. Ons sal seker maak ons gaan, ons sal, ons moet. Sy het ons elke dag herinner aan ons verkose plig aan ons gemeenskappe, want ons werk met die mense se geld. Sy was regverdig en het na alle kante geluister. Sy het geveg vir elke kind van die Wes-Kaap, van Matzikama tot Beaufort tot Bitou tot Kaapstad.

Ek gaan ons sonneblomplantessies mis, ons rooibosafsprake, ons verlore raak in vreemde plekke, ons skemerkelkies met sonsondergang, ons mosselpotte en ons omstrede oud-en-jonk advies vir mekaar oor verhoudinge en hoe die nie-so-skoner seks se brein werk, die gelag en die gejubel, maar ook die trane en seerkry.

Hierdie week neem ons afskeid van 'n vriendin en kollega. Ons hoop net dat

ons braaf genoeg is om aan jou nalatenskap te voldoen.

Jy mág nie doodgaan nie. Jy mág nie doodgaan nie. Jy mag nie eers dúrf dínk aan doodgaan nie.

Rooibosdogter, vandag plaas ons jou nalatenskap in die boeke van parlementêre geskiedenis ter tafel.

Speaker, ek plaas hierdie mosie op jou tafel. Ek dank u.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker.

*“Liefste, jy mág nie doodgaan nie
jy mag nie eers dúrf dínk aan dood nie
ek, wat agterbly, balsem jou in taal
vou jou in woorde
dat môre jou kan erf en kan hê en kan hou”*

I dedicate these written words of Antjie Krog to our rooibos daughter, the late Chief Whip, the hon Ms Lorraine Botha, a formidable community activist, trained as a social worker. She looked after each and everyone. Since she had joined the DA, Lorraine spent the early parts of her career at the Department of Social Development at the Bonnytoun Place of Safety,

where she committed herself to providing the best possible care to high-risk youth.

She spent time with the SOS *Kinderdorp*e which reflected a lifelong affinity for children and she had a desire to uplift the most vulnerable, a committed civil servant and a strict parliamentary advocate. Her commitment was infectious, as we will see in Health, Education, Social Development, Local Government and Premier portfolios. Later we will see how she was elevated to the honour of Chief Whip, recognition of high standards, excellence, passion and competence. She will be remembered by her sister Jeanette Maistry and her niece and nephew Angelo and Angelique.

We will cherish her in our hearts and as Antjie Krog reminds us, we will not allow that anyone dare think of the death of your legacy. Tomorrow will remember you, our Rooibos daughter. We will make sure that we will, we shall, we must. She reminded us every day of our chosen duty to our communities, because we are working with the people's money. She was fair and listened to both sides. She fought for every child of the Western Cape, from Matzikama to Beaufort to Bitou to Cape Town.

I'm going to miss our sunflower planting sessions, our rooibos appointments, our getting lost in foreign places, our cocktails at sunset, our mussel pots and our controversial old-and-young advice to each other on relationships and how the not-so-fair sex's brain works, the laughter and jubilation, but also the tears and hurt.

This week we say goodbye to a friend and colleague. We just hope that we are brave enough to live up to your legacy.

You may not die. You may not die. You may not even dare think of dying.

Rooibos daughter, today we table your legacy in the books of parliamentary history.

Speaker, I am placing this motion on your table. I thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Deputy Chief Whip. Before we conclude with the motion, I would like to request the Deputy Sergeant-at-Arms to light the candle in memory of our former Chief Whip.

[Candle lit in memory of the late hon Botha]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr Naidoo. Hon Premier, hon members, the leaders of political parties, the staff members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, the staff on the fifth floor that worked with hon Botha, the DA team on the fifth floor, I want to start off by thanking all of you for your cooperation and bringing dignity to someone who respected this institution, that when we asked that we suspend the business of this Parliament for the week which she passed on, you all agreed to do so.

I remember talking to the political party leaders, nobody questioned why.

That shows the maturity of our democracy, but of course, the respect of one's life and collegiality that we saw in this Parliament. I thank you all for having done that.

Hon Premier, on Tuesday during the memorial service, you would forget that there are political parties here that have different ideologies. Everybody spoke so well that even Botha, when she looks down, she would look and wonder whether there is something called political parties in heaven? It seems there is one party there, and that is the service of God, but I want to thank the following people: Dr Bernadette Faye who came here when she was called on to respond to the emergency.

Hon Premier, the leaders of political parties, hon members and staff, it was a sad moment. It was painful. We were there when she gave her last breath. We were there. It was so painful, and I want to thank Reverend Fry, when he was called upon to come to an emergency by hon Fry, his son. Thank you, hon Fry. He did not ask, he jumped and he was here. We were then able to release hon Botha with dignity. We did not know how to respond to this so this is not something that one can get used to, but I want to thank the staff who came and respected the process of releasing the Chief Whip with the necessary dignity that she deserved. We had a staff meeting that day, hon Premier, hon members. We had to adjourn everything. Imagine those many souls here who were heartbroken.

We called the family here. Even they could not believe that it could happen

in such a short space of time, but I want to say to the political parties here, let this be not the last way of respecting each other, but let it be the last one where we have a death in this Parliament, and as a result, I will convene an Interfaith Memorial of all religions to come and pray for this institution. We need prayers here. I wish to request the hon members to rise in a moment of silence.

[Moment of silence observed.]

The SPEAKER: May the soul of the late hon Lorraine Botha, our Chief Whip, rest in eternal peace.

Thank you. You may all be seated.

Hon members, thank you very much. The candle will remain illuminating until the end of business tomorrow and the condolences book is also there for those hon members who have not had the opportunity to sign and the staff and the people of this province, it is here in the Memorial Hall just behind the Chamber for that purpose. For the hon members and staff and the people of our province, the funeral is in Piketberg on Saturday, 10 September 2022, and proceedings will begin from 09:30 am in the morning, for those who wish to attend.

Just to end on a good note and a more lighter note. Where is Charles Breda?

†Roep hom asseblief. [Call him, please.] Hon members, I wish to ask that

we wish Charlie, Charles Breda, a happy birthday today. Charlie, happy birthday! [Applause.]

Mr C BREDA: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: The last time Charlie came to me he wanted to know, “Speaker, I have been working here for too long, but can I get an increase?” [Laughter] So hon Mayor, you do not know how to respond to that question. You say: “Charlie, I will think about it.” So Charlie, happy birthday.

Hon members, I now recognise hon Kaizer–Philander.

[Motion]

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Thank you very much, Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House, in accordance with Rule 119(1) of the Standing Rules, appoints the following Ad-hoc Committee to conduct oversight over the work of the Provincial Executive regarding its response to tuberculosis-related matters, including oversight over any provincial executive authority, any provincial department, any provincial organ of state and any provincial entity involved in activities dealing with TB-related matters.

The Committee shall consist of 15 members appointed in accordance with Rule 120 of the Standing Rules with the membership allocated as follows:

- (a) Democratic Alliance: 8 members
- (b) African National Congress: 2 members
- (c) Economic Freedom Fighters: 1 member
- (d) GOOD: 1 member
- (e) African Christian Democratic Party: 1 member
- (f) Freedom Front Plus: 1 member
- (g) Al Jama-ah: 1 member

The Committee must report regularly to the House on its activities.

The names of the members representing the aforementioned political parties must be submitted to the Speaker of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament as soon as possible for publication in the ATC.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kaizer-Philander, that was nice and sharp. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved? No objections? Motion agreed to.

Thank you, hon members. I now recognise the Deputy Chief Whip.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Speaker, the second motion is in hon

Kaizer-Philander's name.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Deputy Chief Whip. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved?

No objections? Motion agreed to.

Now in terms of the Order Paper we are now dealing with the Interpellations.

Hon Deputy Chief Whip?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, just Motion Number 2 from member Kaizer-Philander on the establishment of the TB Ad-hoc Committee, in Programming it was agreed that political parties would have three minute declarations on Motion Number 2.

The SPEAKER: When there were – Deputy Chief Whip, when there was just a smooth way of taking us through with the programme, I thought the hon members did not have the intention to speak, but let me put the question before the House. Are there any objections to the establishment of the Ad-hoc Committee? No objections? Motion agreed to.

Are the parties wishing to say something, really what I want to know if you want to say something, the Deputy Chief Whip of the DA?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Chief Whip, in a similar fashion as Motion Number 1, every party will be receiving a three minute declaration opportunity, as agreed to by Programming.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Deputy Chief Whip. Thank you, Mr Secretary.

Hon members, in terms of what the hon member Kaizer-Philander moved the motion, just on the establishment of the Ad-hoc Committee to deal with the TB matters, there was a request by parties at the Programming Authority that they want to speak for three minutes and that is what the Deputy Chief Whip is dealing with, so I was putting it again to the House whether the hon members wish to say something, so with that in mind, I am not going to follow a particular order if you do not indicate. I am simply going to request, I will come to the DA last.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Speaker, my hand is up.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you, Ma'am. So we recognise your hand, we will bring you later. I see hon, I see the ANC. I will just follow the party list. The ANC and then we would be followed by the EFF, GOOD, the ACDP, FF Plus, Al Jama-ah and the DA, in that order. Thank you.

I assume that no-one wants to say anything? The ANC, hon Windvogel?

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, the ANC welcomes the establishment of the TB caucus in the Western Cape and calls for the process

of its appointment to be accelerated as it is long overdue. We are lagging behind other provinces such as Gauteng, Limpopo, Mpumalanga and Northwest that have already launched their TB caucuses. The establishment of the TB caucus signifies our commitment as this august House towards the Barcelona Declaration on Tuberculosis and to advocate for a more effective response to the TB epidemic.

Speaker, among the demands made in the Barcelona Declaration was that:

“Every patient, regardless of who they are, where they live or their ability to pay, shall have access to quick, accurate diagnosis and high-quality treatment and that TB diagnosis and treatment never result in the impoverishment of patients or their families.”

This is more important for the Western Cape as the TB report shows a 50,2% positivity rate with over 46 000 cases and over 4000 dead. The majority of these cases are from poor working-class communities. The social determinants of TB include poor living conditions, like overcrowded spaces with lack of ventilation, food insecurity, which sometimes leads to poor nutrition and compromised immunity as well as lack of economic opportunities that place limitations on people's ability to access health services because they cannot afford taxi fares to health facilities.

Speaker, these and more are challenges that will lead the province to miss its TB targets. We need to appoint a TB caucus or Ad-hoc Committee now so

that we can start with the advocacy work. We must encourage all members to sign the SA Version of the Barcelona Declaration. I urge all members to adhere to the principles outlined in the Barcelona Declaration:

- (a) to working across geographical and political divides in a non-partisan and inclusive fashion;
- (b) to engage with civil society and all other stakeholders involved in the fight against the TB epidemic, and
- (c) to confront social isolation associated with the disease.

As members of this House, we have an important role to play in holding the Government to account. We must not politicise this TB Caucus. I thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Windvogel. Hon members, I now recognise the EFF.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, Speaker. You may pass.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Xego. Hon members, I now recognise the GOOD party, hon August.

Mr S N AUGUST: Hon Speaker, the TB crisis in South Africa has been a challenge both nationally and in the Western Cape Province. South Africa forms part of the 30 high-burden TB countries globally, and it contributes 3%

of the global TB cases.

The Premier in his 2021 State of the Province Address stated that the TB epidemic in the Western Cape must be fought with the same seriousness as the COVID-19 pandemic. A resounding call of urgency should ring, as TB claimed 4 078 lives in 2020 and in the following calendar year 2021 for the month of August only, TB positive cases stood at 3 041 in the province.

Key takeaways from the COVID-19 response indicates that a multi-sectoral approach should be developed and implemented to share data and information on TB, promote awareness through digital marketing and media broadcasting, deploy community-based healthcare workers for door-to-door campaigning and to destigmatise conversations around TB and TB statuses.

The Western Cape launched the TB Dashboard, which functions in the same way the Provincial COVID-19 Dashboard did. Monitoring, evaluation and contact tracing proved instrumental as part of safeguarding citizens against COVID. However, tuberculosis has been around for decades before COVID-19 and we must apply the same urgency and deploy mass resources to capacitate our provincial healthcare facilities, install specialised care personnel at primary healthcare institutions, incorporate technology as part of our response plan and use community networks, places of worship, civil society and the private sector to strengthen our overall Provincial Plan against TB. If not, we will lose the fight against this epidemic.

Speaker, a good government will consult with its people on the best approach to deal with community-based care as community networks often have solutions and best practices that Government at times overlooks. I implore the Premier as Chair of the Provincial Council on AIDS and TB to not alienate themselves or the work of the Council from grassroots community engagements, or to operate in silos. We moved as a united front against COVID-19 and our unity will be our line of defence against tuberculosis.

The Provincial Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport should develop a comprehensive TB Awareness Campaign, vested in performing and visual arts, dance, music and the promotion of healthy lifestyle through sports' programmes. This, in turn, will inject capital into a sector of society most times forgotten by the very department mandated to promote its interest, but also create jobs, transfer and hone skills and assist the provincial TB Response Plan with relatable content to educate the indigent people's opinions on TB.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, finish off.

Mr S N AUGUST: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise the ACDP, hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: No declaration, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. Hon members, I now recognise the FF Plus, †agbare Marais [hon Marais.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Speaker, TB tops the biggest cause of death in South Africa, aggravated by HIV. TB cases diagnosed between 1 September 2020 till August 2021 were 38 846. The danger here is that 4% of these cases were drug resistant, which means they just go on spreading. The people cough and they spread this, I was shocked that they say people must wear masks for COVID, quite unnecessary, but people with TB can walk again without masks. There is no regulation saying “if you have been diagnosed with TB, then you must wear a mask.” So we have these cases spreading tuberculosis all over.

Deaths in South Africa in 2018 of tuberculosis were 454 014, in 2018, 454 000 and the causes of tuberculosis, mostly poverty, HIV, homelessness, substance abuse, medication that weakens the immune systems, kidney disease and diabetics. So we are sitting with a huge problem and that is why the Freedom Front supports to call in the motion by hon member Kaizer-Philander that a serious look must be had on TB, much worse than COVID. Thank you.

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie, agbare.

[The SPEAKER: Thank you, honourable.] Hon members, I now recognise the

Al Jama-ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Speaker, TB is a potentially dangerous and serious infectious disease. There are five main factors contributing to TB, which include homelessness, malnutrition, due to poverty, alcohol, indoor pollution, tobacco smoke, injection by drug users and persons with HIV infection. If we look at most of these factors, which contribute towards the spread of TB, it says a lot about the socio-economic condition of people in the Western Cape.

The mayor recently expressed shock, I do not know why he was shocked, in the absence of homeless people on the streets of the city. In 2020 the Province had a housing waiting list of 600 000 and the average waiting period for a house is 15 years. The Western Cape Health Department confirmed that it has seen an increase in screening of TB. Whilst we commend the work done by the TB Dashboard monitoring of TB cases, we call on the Province to relook at its Multi-sectoral Emergency Response Plan to drastically reduce or eliminate the spread of TB. Let this Emergency Response Plan include a plan of drastic action to eliminate the underlying factors giving rise to TB. These factors are known to us and they are a menace to society. Close the shebeens. Close the drug dens. Introduce antipoverty relief programs. Speed up the allocation of decent housing. Do not house people from already bad conditions to worse conditions like what is happening in the Drakenstein Municipality where evicted people have been provided with alternative accommodation in a park where they lived in tents

for the past eight years, have now been moved into makeshift zinc structures without any foundation, water and sanitation facilities.

The shelters for homeless should have the TB Dashboard and healthy nutritional meals. Schoolchildren in impoverished areas should be monitored and provided with a daily nutritious meal. Reopen the clinics, which will serve and provide TB patients with something to eat. Many TB patients do not bother to take their medicine as they have not eaten proper meals. The Province must act on the underlying factors if it is serious about wiping out TB. I thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Brinkhuis. Hon members, I now recognise hon Kaizer-Philander.

Ms W KAIZER-PHILANDER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Speaker, the House is well aware that TB is an endemic disease in our province. In the first half of this year, almost 23 000 people were affected and it has subsequently taken the lives of around 9% of those diagnosed in this period. Furthermore, we know of the immense impact that the COVID 19 pandemic has had on the Western Cape's ability to diagnose patients. Between the first and fourth wave of the pandemic, the rate of diagnosing new cases decreased by 76 to 83% per day, in comparison to those in previous years. Speaker, while these rates are now recovering, we need to continue tackling this disease to protect our residents.

Fortunately, we have a Provincial Government that has already pioneered in instituting various initiatives, such as the Multi-sectoral Provincial TB Emergency Response Plan, and the Provincial TB Dashboard.

Additionally, this year alone, the Department will be spending R388 million on tuberculosis hospitals, which is more than a 5% increase from the previous year. Over the medium term, more than R1 billion rand will be spent on these hospitals. Speaker, coupled to this in the District Health Programme Grant the TB component has been allocated R68 million this year, and almost R208 million over the next three years. These are examples of a proactive Government that innovates service delivery.

However, now is the time for us as a Legislature to contribute to these efforts in our oversight capacity. By forming this Ad-hoc Committee it will empower the Western Cape Provincial Parliament to do the following: to advocate for budgets to be ring-fenced and reviewed to support necessary TB interventions; result in legislation being evaluated and drafted to promote TB services; to allow for greater accountability over the public institutions that are responsible for the implementation of TB programmes and to bring about more advocacy in communities with greater consulting with civil society and NGOs.

Hon Speaker, this will not be oversight for the sake of oversight. It will be an opportunity for the Western Cape Provincial Parliament to positively contribute to curbing this disease, which affects so many lives in the Western

Cape. Speaker, it is my sincere call that all members of this House support this view for us to make a difference. I thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kaizer-Philander. Hon members, now we reached the end of the input by parties. Are there any objections to the motion?

No objections? Agreed to.

I just need to indicate to the House for the record that as of now, which is 11 minutes past three, according to my watch, there are 36 hon members present. There are 20 in the DA that are present, there are 11 that present in the ANC, one GOOD party, one ACDP, one FF Plus, and one Al Jama-ah. So we almost have a full House!

So the question, hon members, that is put before the House is that the appointment of the Ad-hoc Committee be adopted and the question to the members, which has already been put, is that there is no objections but for the record, are there any objections? Thank you. Motion agreed to.

(Motion)

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 18, the hours of sitting on Tuesday, 20 September 2022, shall be: 10:00 to adjournment.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Deputy Chief Whip. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion?

No objections? Motion agreed to.

We now go to the Interpellations. The first interpellation is by the hon Sayed to the hon, the Minister of Education. I now recognise Minister Maynier.

INTERPELLATIONS

Unplaced learners

1. Mr M K Sayed asked the Minister of Education:

(a) How did it occur that 36 learners are still unplaced at schools in July 2022 and (b) what are the plans to ensure that all these learners are placed before the end of the year?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Speaker. I obviously rise following the tribute after the passing of the hon Lorraine Botha, and I wish to acknowledge and thank the hon members for their beautiful speeches on, of course, both sides of the House.

I wish to obviously thank the member for putting the question, which is the subject of our interpellation today.

My response, Speaker, is we must, of course, accept that at any given time throughout the school year, there will be learners seeking a place in our schools almost always as a result of migration, from within or indeed outside the Western Cape, and, in fact, it is not unusual to see an increase in these types of late applications for a placement in our schools after the school holidays, as learners migrate to other provinces or indeed towns for a whole range of reasons, looking to start the new school term afresh.

The 36 learners in question have already been placed, but of course, given the fluidity of the system and the natural movement of learners, the number of learners requiring a place in our school changes all the time so, for example, on 10 August 2022 there were 10 applicants seeking a place in our schools. They, of course, have all been placed.

Also on 30 August 2022 there were eight new learners seeking a place in our schools, and, of course, we are currently dealing with those placements. The reality is that children move during the school year, and there is a period during which their application is being processed according to their specific needs, and so it is simply wrong to suggest that learners who are transferring as a result of migration from either inside or outside the province are necessarily unplaced. As with the 36 learners in July, and of course, the 10 learners in August, and of course the applications of the eight learners, all

will be processed on a case-by-case basis according to their unique circumstances.

We can of course only place learners when their parents apply, and to do so parents must take responsibility and apply for a place in school, of course, in a timeous manner. If any member is aware of any parent who has not applied to the Department for a place in a school for the current academic year, please urge them to approach the District Office immediately so that we can assist and so that we can place the learner. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, I now recognise the hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, in a written reply to my question the MEC Maynier confirmed the following and I quote:

“In 2019/2020 25 learners were not placed in schools for the entire academic year. 2020 to 2021 two learners did not attend school for the whole academic year.”

As of 25 July 2022 as the MEC indicated, 36 learners were not placed in schools in the province. This is a crisis. Despite what the MEC is saying about migration, that is the old-age DA excuse about in-migration. It proves a lack of planning. We have even now for the 2023 academic year, as I was

sitting here, there are emails that I am going through from parents consistently, parents having applied at multiple schools and they do go to the district. They do come to us. We refer it to the Department so those records are all there. It is not that we should be blaming parents for this. The Department and the MEC are in direct contravention of the South African Schools Act and the South African Constitution, the Constitution that the DA claims to love so much, which places an obligation on the MEC and his Department to ensure that every learner of school-going age is placed in schools, regardless of the excuses that they come up with. This is why this Department has been taken to court more than once in the past two years for its failure to place learners in schools. The Department was actually ordered by the Western Cape High Court to place seven learners in schools in the Metro East District by 10 June 2022, as has been alluded to by the MEC. The ANC demands a progress report on this. We want to know how many learners exactly are yet to be placed in schools for the 2022 as well as 2023 academic year. The MEC must not run away from accountability in this regard, and make excuses. The MEC must stop hiding behind also, and I want to repeat, the *sub judice* principle, to avoid accountability.

The DA is even undermining the authority of you, hon Speaker. Speaker made a firm ruling on the abuse of *sub judice* by committees. Yet the meeting where the Department was meant to brief us on the 2022 unplaced learners and the 2023 enrolments is yet to be rescheduled. As the ANC we demand that MEC Maynier and its Department appear before the Committee as a matter of urgency so that we can devise strategies to avoid the crisis of

unplaced learners in January 2023. This must happen even if we need to subpoena them. This is the future of our children, the future leaders and we cannot allow the Democratic Alliance to gamble with it. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon the Deputy Chief Whip of the ANC. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order! I now recognise the Chair of the Committee, hon Baartman. [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I want her to explain why she does not want to look through the case ... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, I welcome the interpellation as many parents across our province feel anxiety when they are faced with their child not having been placed in the school. It is a feeling I cannot possibly imagine. [Interjection.]

Regarding the scheduling of the Committee meeting, having accepted the fact that the recent Court matter is a challenge the Minister previously indicated that he wishes to brief the Committee on this matter as well as committed to submit a written report in this regard. Having listened to the previous guidance given by the Speaker in the draft Hansard, and having read the draft

Hansard indicating that the Speaker was satisfied with the Minister's response on this matter, we then furthermore in the Committee meeting of 16 August unanimously agreed to request the specific documentation to ascertain the relevant Court date and await written report from the Minister and to subsequently then schedule the respective briefing in this regard.

The Democratic Alliance, ACDP and ANC were represented in this meeting and, in fact, I specifically paused to ask member Kama at this stage whether he was satisfied with the approach, to which they agreed. This was then reiterated again in the Committee meeting of 23 August, where we repeated the respective approach, where again no objections to the above were received, and in that meeting again members Kama and Sayed were also present.

Moving forward, the Committee looks forward to receiving the respective written report and scheduling the respective briefing. As the Committee, we have also started implementing a follow-up procedure, so that we are able to receive feedback on the matters that we send to the Minister respectively, so that we are able to ensure that no person is left behind.

Minister, I would like to ask through you, Speaker, whether you could indicate to us the process for the unplaced learner compared to someone who is transferring from a school within and outside the Western Cape, because many families do move from one area to the next and would require a temporary placement when transferring. Further, Speaker, I would like to

inquire from the Minister, what the Department is doing to ensure there are enough spaces in schools for our learners. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Baartman. Hon members, I now recognise hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Speaker. Speaker. I have mentioned it before and we know that we have approximately 18 to 22 000 learners every year migrating to the province. The question I want to ask the Minister is do we have enough road-shows' awareness because although we speak to parents, some of the parents are just reluctant to enrol their children. So are there enough road-shows, is there enough awareness and what is the Department doing better to tell our parents, "listen, register on time"?

Another question I want to ask, if a child registers on time will that child be placed in the next academic year? That is an important question and maybe the last question I want to ask, I know that the registration date for learners to apply has moved forward to make people aware. Is there also a provision where learners do not come back. You know, we have a situation where you drive and you see youngsters have dropped out of school. I talk about primary-school youngsters. Is there some sort of idea that the Minister can give us, what is happening to these youngsters that stand at the robot and from primary school, that are not in school. Thank you, Chair, thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. I now recognise hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and my thanks to the hon Chair and the hon Christians also for their questions. In fact those types of questions that they have posed point further to the fact that that Standing Committee meeting needs to sit. It is well overdue. These are the kinds of issues that should actually be aired out and engaged on in the Standing Committee. I am not saying that we should not be raising them here, but those are specific matters, which will really help practically.

Hon Speaker, Professor Jonathan Jansen and Samantha Kriger in their recently released book, “Who gets in and why? Race, class and aspiration in South Africa's Elite Schools”, said, and I quote:

“What the schools of the southern suburbs...”

The southern suburbs in Cape Town:

“...have perfected is how to talk about race in admissions, without having to bring it up.”

Until we address the weaponisation of admissions and language policies to gate-keep and discriminate against black children, African, Coloured and Indian, this problem will remain unresolved. This issue is now used for political expediency by the DA and other races formations, who are

mobilising their constituencies who in the main are beneficiaries of racist unjust policies to reject the amendments introduced in the Basic Education Laws Amendment Bill.

School admissions remain an albatross, because we have heard about parents being anxious, but school admissions remain an albatross around the neck of this DA Provincial Government, and a thorny issue that requires us to work together towards a common goal of equal and quality education for all children in this province, not just in the leafy suburbs. This crisis is causing emotional distress to thousands of parents whose children have not yet been placed in the 2023 academic year. Education remains our apex priority hence as the ANC we will never seek to play cheap politics with this matter. Our request for an urgent Committee meeting, yes, despite all the things that were said, our request for this meeting to discuss admissions was purely to understand the WCED's preparedness and to find meaningful solutions to avert another admissions-crisis next year. Why is the MEC and the Department with the full cooperation of the DA running away from accountability? What have they got to hide?

There are many challenges with a colour conscience application system, which simply rejects applications without even providing reasons. I am sitting here now with an application around an issue with SACS where an employee who works even in the Department, but the child is denied admission to SACS after having applied a long time ago. He works in the Department of the Premier. We need to discuss such challenges as a matter

of urgency.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We need to discuss the issue of public schools that are underutilised with only 20 learners in a class while we are faced with persistent learner placement challenges.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed. Your time is up.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): The MEC and the Department must account. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections, speaking simultaneously.] Order, hon members. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Who said so?

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Order, order! [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, we have a long sitting. [Interjections, speaking simultaneously]

Alright, I now recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Speaker. I wish to obviously thank the hon member for putting the question to the House on late applications, which of course is an important issue, and I want to reiterate that such late applications are not uncommon especially around the time of school holidays as learners migrate to other provinces or towns and seek to start the new school term afresh. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, will you please take your seat. There is a point of order. I will pause the timer.

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, Speaker. On a point of order we cannot continue when our number 1, the Premier says we are speaking rubbish and we continue as if it is nothing. Can that be taken into note and please make a ruling on that. Thank you, Chair. It is unparliamentary.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. Thank you hon Bans. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. Alright, hon Premier, did you say the hon member is talking rubbish?

The PREMIER: I did, hon Speaker, because he was speaking rubbish. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No, withdraw. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier.

Ms A P BANS: And you are doing rubbish!

The SPEAKER: I do know that we are all hon members here in the House and we cannot certainly refer to the hon members in that way. Will you please withdraw that? [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Hon Speaker, I withdraw the word “rubbish” and replace it with “nonsense.” [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No, no!

An HON MEMBER: You run away!

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. [Interjections, speaking simultaneously.] Order, hon members.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): That is why you cannot address unplaced learners!

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, we have a convention. Some of the rulings... [Interjections.]

Ms A P BANS: You are saying nonsense!

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, I want your cooperation. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. I need your cooperation. The Premier has withdrawn the word “rubbish”. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: And replaced it with “nonsense”.

The SPEAKER: Now with him with the hon Premier replacing it with nonsense, I will not make that ruling right now. Remember, we have a Ruling Digest. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. Order, hon members. I want to draw your attention. There is only one Presiding Officer and I am trying to do just that, to preside, okay. So there is a Ruling Digest that we produce timeously and we do so all the time so what I am requesting is that I will come back to this matter. I have requested the Premier to withdraw a particular word which he did. Now he replaced it with a different word which I am saying I want to look at the previous rulings on the same matter so that this House is not inconsistent in how the rulings are made on a particular matter. Remember, we have the Rules Committee currently busy with the revision of the Rules, because the work is continuous, but I do not want to make these rulings on a knee-jerk reaction. I need to make a substantive ruling on that matter when we sit again and that is my ruling on this matter. I see the hand of the hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I very much welcome your ruling on this matter. May I also request that when you do that ruling please do it so in isiXhosa. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: †Ndiyenze ngesiXhosa? Enkosi Jola. [Should I do it in isiXhosa? Thank you Jola.]

Hon members, there has been a request that I do so in isiXhosa, so we will look at that because ordinarily we do them in all languages. It is in English, isiXhosa, Afrikaans either way, so we do that. So you want me, when I do the ruling, to read the Xhosa version?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Yes, hon, because nonsense in English might be nonsense, but nonsense in isiXhosa might actually be meaning something else, so please, I would like you to please do that in isiXhosa. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I will endeavour to speak my mother tongue.
I see the – thank you, hon Mvimbi. Hon Meyer?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker. Can we also have it in Nama? [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: And in Korana. Hon Meyer, and in Korana.

†Mnr P J MARAIS: En in Kaaps.

[Mr P J MARAIS: And in *Kaaps*.]

The SPEAKER: And Cape Khoi. [Interjections.] Alright, let me say for the record, I have made this ruling that when we get together in the next sitting

I will make this ruling and I will do so in order to ensure that there is no confusion, because there are, as I indicated, there are conventional rulings that have been made, which become the guide in how we deal with this matter. We do not want anyone who sits there make their own ruling as they wish. So otherwise we are going to have a chaotic Parliament in that fashion, so this matter is now put to bed until we do so, as I have indicated, until we come back together again.

Hon members, we have concluded that question. Now I request the Minister to proceed. Hon Minister, you still have your full minutes minus 26 seconds. so that is technically full. You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Speaker. As I was saying before I was rudely interrupted, late applications are not uncommon, especially around the time of school holidays as learners migrate to other provinces or towns and seek to start new term afresh. We will of course assist every one of those learners to find a school as quickly as possible and provide support to them when needed.

Speaker, contrary to what the honourable member alleges, there is no crisis. The member was obviously listening with his mouth and not his ears, because I was very clear that the 36 learners to which he refers and is the subject of this interpellation, those learners have been placed. Of course, the hon member refers to 25 learners in 2019 and 2020 and two learners in 2020/2021.

The SPEAKER: Order, order, hon members.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: But what he neglects, what he neglects to tell the House is that the 25 learners did not present themselves to the Department or a school in the Western Cape. The two learners that he refers to did also not present themselves to the Department or a school. These are crucial facts, of course, which the hon member ignores. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Facts are facts!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: That is on the whole question of the report... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister... [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Speaker, we have to accept... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon Minister, order!

An HON MEMBER: That is nonsense!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Speaker, we have to accept... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: That is nonsense!

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, will you please take your seat.

An HON MEMBER: That is nonsense.

Ms A P BANS: Nonsense! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order, hon members! Let me, hon members...
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Which school?

The SPEAKER: Alright, you may proceed as you wish. I will be watching!
Hon members, order! Someone says: “Khanyithule”. [Laughter] Please,
order! Hon, the Deputy Chief Whip, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, I know this was an interpellation,
but is the hon MEC willing to take a question given that we do not have him
appearing in front of the Committee. Can he take a question?

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon, the Deputy Chief Whip. Hon Minister, are
you willing to take a question?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I am not, hon Speaker. I think the hon

member needs to work on his listening, and I hope he will spend some time doing that. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Well, please proceed with your speech, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I wish to remind you, Speaker, that the hon member has not handed in his 100 lines on the whole question of *sub judice*. [Laughter] [Interjections.]

Now on the question, and of course this is National Literacy Week, we hope that the hon member might spend some time reading up on the subject as his contribution to reading in this province. On the whole question of the report, we have to accept, hon Speaker, that this matter is now before the Court and that does present us with a challenge but we want to be as open and transparent and as accountable as possible and so under the circumstances, we have indicated that we are going to provide the Committee, obviously subject to legal advice, with the report and I am delighted to report that that report now has been drafted. It is with legal services and I look forward to furnishing the Committee with that report in due course. We are also keeping the Committee advised on when this matter is likely to be heard before the Court so that the hearing can be scheduled and certainly I and the Department look forward to appearing before the Committee to brief the Committee on the whole question of admissions 2023.

We have, indeed, to the hon Baartman, we have allocated through largely the

generosity of the former Finance Minister, R6,2 additional billion to the Education budget, which has allowed us to increase the affordable basket of posts by 1 143 posts and indeed, it gives us the opportunity to spend R830 million more on infrastructure and we believe that that will go a long way to helping us address the very high demand for school places in the Western Cape.

We have also, to the hon Christians, put in a big effort in for admissions 2023, a much bigger effort than before to assist parents with pop-ups at malls, opportunities at schools and venues throughout the province where the Department has gone beyond what it has done in previous years to assist parents with admissions for 2023.

I wish to close, hon Speaker, by again reminding members that should anybody have any information about learners who need to apply particularly for 2023, please ensure that both parents contact the Department and the District to so that we can do all we can to assist those learners to be placed in our schools in the Western Cape. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Excellent, well done!

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, I wish to thank all of you for participating in this interpellation and, hon Sayed, for raising it.

May I now request the hon member Nkondlo to get ready. The next interpellation is asked of the Premier by the hon Nkondlo. I now recognise the hon Premier.

Political economy of crime

2. Ms N D Nkondlo asked the Premier:

- (a) What is the political economy of crime in the Western Cape and
- (b) how has his Safety Plan responded to it?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Speaker, and can I thank the hon Nkondlo very much for the question. The political economy of crime for the purposes of this parliamentary question can also be explained through the socio-ecological model of crime and violence reduction. This model puts forward the risk factors for violent and criminal behaviour, which can be found at four different levels: individual, relationship, community and society.

This is outlined in most others, in the Safety Plan, which the Western Cape Government has launched to reduce crime in our province. Of course, the studies and the influence that go into creating such a plan are based on various inputs and of course, if you analyse the political economy of crime and papers that have been written over time, for example, the Michael Lynch Paper from the Southern Florida University or Robert Rainey from the

London University of Economics or William Chambliss, this is, those first two are pretty recent. William Chambliss of the University of Oslo 1976-paper, and R Penn of Portland State University. Many of these papers, when you analyse it, I think if you have to bring out one of the biggest causalities they all seem to come to the same conclusion, the absence of State enforcement.

Of course, it is also driven by history and our own very history and that is why you will see in our Safety Plan and driven through not only those papers and our own universities, also through international partnerships, like the Bavarian Government or the Institute of Security Studies, who play an important role, not only in the formulation of the plan, but also in monitoring and re-evaluating that plan as we move forward.

The Safety Plan brings in three risk factors of crime and violence. It has three delivery pillars, three enabling pillars and as enforcement by international and local evidence of what works to reduce violence. The first is, of course, the law-enforcement stream, the second being the violence-prevention stream and then of course, the urban-design stream and these are all brought together by evidence which aims to enable that plan to get the law enforcement on the ground, the area based teams that have been put in place across this province, and then violence prevention and it is very interesting, and I really like this question being put by the hon member because it has created a new debate. I spent two days at the beginning of this week with the National Cabinet Lekgotla in Tshwane, and if I had to think about the debate

that took the most of my time with an individual minister, it was with Minister Bheki Cele.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Nonsense!

The PREMIER: But it was also interesting to see the difference between what the President is saying and what Minister Bheki Cele is saying. The President is saying: “Yes, I see the change that has been brought about. I see the difference that this plan is making.”

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon Premier, will you please take your seat. Hon, the Deputy Chief Whip. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Speaker, I thought I heard the member Bakubaku-Vos say the word “nonsense” to the Premier while he was speaking and I just wanted to check... [Interjection.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: I said nonsense to the Premier.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... and I just wanted to check whether you could check the Hansard and come back to us on the same matter as previously. [Interjections, speaking simultaneously.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order, hon members. [Interjections] Hon members, are you going to make this ruling from the floor? Hon Bakubaku-Vos, did you say the Premier – hon Bakubaku-Vos. [Interjections.] Order, hon members.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: I will repeat it, yes, Speaker, in Xhosa †Uthetha ububhanxa. [He is speaking nonsense.]

The PREMIER: 100 times.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. What I have said on this same matter, I have indicated, thank you hon Baartman, for raising that; I have indicated that I will make a determination when we meet in the next session. May I request though, both sides, may I request, nobody should second-guess that determination. That means in this Sitting we do not continue raising a question around the Presiding Officer's determination and ability to do so on this matter, because I have indicated that when we meet in the next round in the next Sitting I will make a ruling on this matter. That means both the right and the left, in isiXhosa.

That was a request by hon Mvimbi. I agreed. [Interjections.]

Now I am requesting, hon members, that let us please for the purposes of this particular sitting not to say somebody is talking nonsense [Interjections.] until I have made that determination because if you do so then you might as well just govern from the floor. [Interjections.] Hon member Fry?

Mr C FRY: Hon Speaker, I thank you for your guidance, but I also heard hon member Bakubaku-Vos use the word “suka”. Could you please rule on that because that is a derogatory term in isiXhosa. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: [Interjections.] No, huh-uh, huh-uh. Hon member Fry [Interjections.], hon member Fry, that – [Interjections.] hon member Fry – order, hon members. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.] I must say you really missed each other because [Interjections.] when you say “suka”, I have never heard something like that being out of order.

So it is a Xhosa word that means something, but not derogatory. [Laughs] Ja, ja, so I can say many words in Afrikaans, maybe hon member Meyer or *agb* Marais, but in this particular sitting the one thing that I have made certain, please assist the presiding officers, myself and any other presiding officer after myself for this particular sitting, please do not call each other “nonsense” until I made a ruling on this matter in the next session.

I do not want to, because if you throw it around then it becomes too much of a nonsense. So let us not do that. [Interjections.]

May I request the Deputy Chief Whip again from the ANC who have a hand up?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: No-no, thank you very much, hon Speaker, for your guidance as usual. We, as the ANC, will abide by the

ruling, unlike the hon member Maynier who has not abided by your ruling on the issue of whether they should appear before the Committee, but that is ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Laughs]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... a debate for another day.

The SPEAKER: Thank you ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Thank you, hon Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon the Deputy Chief Whip of the ANC. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! Order. Hon Minister, will you please conclude your speech?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Oh, Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The PREMIER: So as I was saying, and I am not sure which part of either the

President part or the Minister Bheki Cele part is the nonsense according to the hon member Bakubaku-Vos, [Interjections.] but it was a very interesting discussion around crime and specifically because it was driven about by the results of the last crime statistics, where in actual fact where the Western Cape Safety Plan is bringing down murder where those interventions are in place and so that is starting a debate at a national level, which I really, really ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The PREMIER: ... am in full support of because that is exactly what we need to happen. Because if you look at the political economy of crime and one of the main drivers is the absence of State enforcement. In other words no management, no plan and no direction from a national level. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. Order, hon members. You know, both Rule 39 and Rule 40 [Interjections.] are important for the House – hon member Marran, †asseblief, agb [please, hon.] You may as a member of this House have some interjections, it is nice to throw them around, especially when we meet in person, but it must not be in such a way that it drowns the hon member that is speaking.

So the hon Premier is here to respond to the question by hon member

Nkondlo and it will not be fair that we are not able to get the response that is desirable insofar as the question is concerned, or even misquote or have the risk of not hearing what the Premier says. It becomes a danger to the House itself and we do not want that.

May I please request that we all respect and assist the Presiding Officer in this regard. Hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: †Enkosi Somlomo. [Thank you Speaker]. It is very interesting, hon Premier, in your response as you emphasise on the notion of political economy of crime, on the absence of State enforcement, as a lens that you choose you may well be aware that we come from a history, as you also just passed by, of such State enforcement that has been used on people, particularly black people, with laws that were actually passed and utilising that State enforcement to actually legitimise human injustice and crime.

So I must caution you on your argument about a political economy of crime in the current day, modern South Africa in particular, to only punt the notion of State enforcement because at this point you are able to argue your own political views with the National Government because such may border along the lines that you may want to present yourself as if a notion of State enforcement is actually the solution to deal with challenges of crime in communities. That is why I am raising to you something that actually State enforcement on its own does not necessarily resolve crime and in any way here in this province we have seen the same State enforcement or absence

that you are talking about, where such can be biased and varied because interestingly, hon Premier, I am sure you are aware here in the Western Cape, here in the City of Cape Town as an example, that when you talk about enforcement laws in suburbia, here in town, you even have got tourism patrol, you come to Long Street, 24 hours, you can actually be safe in town.

That is not the same and the question is why? Why such a policing, such concerns of safety of patrons, of safety of businesses in commercial spaces are not necessarily applied across.

So I am raising this to say whilst you talk about this it is actually very interesting you mention the notion of your socio-ecological model because this socio-ecological model that you have presented as part of your Safety Plan, what is interesting is that it is actually divorced of the historical facts about the notion of the politics and the economics of crime in this country in particular.

The SPEAKER: †Enkosi Mazikhali. [Thank you Mazikhali] you still have another chance. Thank you.

Hon member Fry.

Mr C FRY: Thank you, hon Speaker and hon members of this House. As we have all seen and heard the Western Cape Government and the City of Cape Town have implemented a number of strategies to guarantee that crime is

reduced across the board in all of the province [Inaudible.].

This House should be aware that criminality is further aggravated by the ANC's National Government failures. Due to the inadequacies of the ANC administration and the ineffective SAPS in our communities, crime still remains a huge challenge in the province.

Through LEAP officers the Western Cape Government has accomplished more in this province over the past year than SAPS has. The most dangerous township in the country used to be Nyanga. Hon members, thanks to the resources the Western Cape Government has committed to the fight against crime this is no longer the case. This is what happens when municipal and provincial levels of government are given authority as the ANC is incapable of managing the police in this province. I would implore hon member Nkondlo to speak with her national counterparts in the Union Buildings to devolve policing powers.

I would therefore like to ask the Premier [Interjections.]: (1) in what ways have LEAP officers helped the Western Cape Government reduce crime in the City of Cape Town, and (2) does the assistance offered by the LEAP officers suggest that municipal and provincial levels of government should be granted more policing power? Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Thank you, hon member Fry.

I now recognise the hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Hon member Fry, take me take me serious, I am not a messenger here. I am sure you have got DA members there in Plein Street.

Actually a young girl of 14 years old was kidnapped and raped last week by a 50-year old farmer in Klawer, hon Premier. So where was the Safety Plan? The Safety Plan is also absolutely silent on organised crime in the role that this plays in the incidence of violence, murder and other crimes in our communities.

The Safety Plan omits any discussion on poaching and the connection that poaching of rhino horns, abalone or species of herbs or plants have with the drug trade. There is a complete failure by the Safety Plan to understand the socio-ecological impact that gangsterism and drugs has had on our families and communities.

Gangsterism, which was perpetuated by decades of apartheid regime, is woven into the communal fabric of our townships and locations. Actually the Safety Plan mentions the first top 10 areas, murder areas, and it is interesting that nothing is being said of why these particular areas, why Mfuleni, why Delft, why Gugulethu and all of that. [Interjections.]

What the Safety Plan does it simplifies an enormous complex political economy which involves various actors and which unfortunately is the reality

of the vast majority of our communities in that crime has proven to pay.

For example, in linking urban renewal to crime reduction, Tony Samara writes in the *Journal of South African Studies* that in defining street children primarily as a threat to social order, local elites, including the media, police and renewal authorities, are reproducing deeply embedded and recurring notions of a black menace that emerged during times of real or perceived social upheaval and threats to social order.

Samara continues that it is his contention that this panic is indicative of an ongoing struggle over urban public spaces that expresses a deeper conflict regarding changes in the city, which has to do with unresolved contradictions of race and class, and that is something that your Safety Plan is oblivious to. [Interjections.]

As with street children, this Safety Plan simply criminalises poor and the working-class communities. [Interjections.] Yet even more so as Samara points out crime and gangsterism and therefore crime has fundamentally to do with apartheid spatial planning and up until you realise that, hon Premier, and in your endeavours with your evidence-led and data-driven responses, you will need to bring those issues into cognisance so that your infrastructure budget must then speak to those kinds of problems of these particular geographies where you find these challenges of crime.

Apartheid spatial planning to date did not confine crime, but rather it

perpetuates it and keeps it alive. It is this apartheid spatial planning that Bonginkosi Madikizela points out in his recent [Inaudible.] when he wrote and I quote:

“An example of this is an area such as Brackengate. About 30 taxis from Khayelitsha and about 30 from Nyanga transport workers there every day, but these taxis are often impounded because ...” ...[Interjections.]

[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, your time is up, hon member.

Ms N D NKONDLO: ...

“... a route has not been established by the City in this area. How must these people travel to and from these places of work?”

Ask Madikizela. It would seem that suddenly Madikizela ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, your time is up.

Ms N D NKONDLO: ... [Inaudible.] after leaving office when he was the MEC responsible for Transport ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: [Interjections.] Hon member, thank you very much ...[Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: ... I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... I now recognise the hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The most interesting thing about the place that we, or the space we find ourselves in in discussing the Safety Plan and crime in our province on a regular basis, is primarily driven by the failure of the ANC in South Africa ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: ... and the ANC have failed when it comes to policing. [Interjections.] Because in actual fact our job, according to the Constitution, is about the policing needs ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ... and priorities. The only province that really produces a proper policing needs and priorities document and on Monday I had the opportunity to place it directly in the Minister's hands. I also gave a copy of

the PNP to the President at the *lekgotla*, but it is interesting.

So the Safety Plan is a plan that this Province puts in place that goes beyond, or as Minister Reagan Allen says, we paint outside the lines. We are not going to stick to, well, this is what every other province does in the ANC and there is no real change [Interjections.], there is no real change to crime. I mean did you see the reports now in the Eastern Cape? The Eastern Cape is the crime hotspot province of South Africa. It is no longer Nyanga. It is no longer those spaces. [Interjections.]

It is quite interesting how the ANC's [Interjections.] kneejerk reaction ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Go to Nyanga [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: ... on this – yes, go to Nyanga. [Interjections.] Which is no longer even in the top 10 because of the deployment of these officers [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order!

The PREMIER: And it is interesting because the data does not lie. The data tells us exactly what is going on, and last week in Parliament the President said, I think based on what the Safety Plan of the Western Cape is delivering and how it is changing lives of citizens in this province and in the City of

Cape Town, [Interjections.] that there is now a need ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Go in the day.

The PREMIER: There is now a need to have a further discussion on the policing model in South Africa. [Interjections.]

The very next day Minister Bheki Cele ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The PREMIER: ... says, “Not over my dead body,” [Interjections.] but at least the President and half of the ANC are saying actually the ANC is failing the people of this country when it comes to policing. There needs to be much better management to bring about a safer society. [Interjections.] We cannot, we cannot continue where our citizens are feeling so unsafe.

It is interesting that the 1 235 LEAP officers, [Interjections.] 1 235 LEAP officers every month remove more firearms from in this province, every month, than the 20 000 police officers in this province. There is another statistic ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The PREMIER: ... but the hon member then goes on to talk about poaching

and about all these other things that are actually the primary job of the police. The police, under the management of the African National Congress [Interjections.] and their failed State policies.

They are failing the citizens of South Africa [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ... so badly. [Interjections.] That is why murder went up by another ...[Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: I cannot be pointed.

The PREMIER: ... 11% in South Africa, the ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take your seat, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: ... only places that are coming down is where our plan ...[Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Hon Deputy Speaker?

The PREMIER: ... is being put in place.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: [Inaudible.] please take your seat.

What is your point of order, hon member?

Ms N D NKONDLO: What is this thing of pointing when you speak?

[Interjections.] Really?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon – no-no-no-no. [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: What is this thing of pointing? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo, you talk to me, please, and not to the Premier. [Interjections.]

So that is not a point of order. You may proceed, hon Premier. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: So if I can end again, hon Deputy Speaker, [Interjections.] the real issue in South Africa is that the ANC is failing the people of this country across the board [Interjections.], a failed State, but in policing and safety that is their ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The PREMIER: ... primary goal. [Interjections.] The National Minister of Police does not have a Safety Plan, he does not have a clue as to what to do and that is why every single time he stands up to give statistics on crime in

South Africa, it keeps going one way: getting worse, more people dying, more gender-based violence, more crime because he does not have a plan. They have failed in every single aspect of keeping citizens safe in this country. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. [Applause.]

Hon members, these constant interjections are not allowed. [Interjections.] Hon member Nkondlo, you cannot just go and speak to the Premier when it chooses. Please, can I ask that during this debate and these debates, that we respect the Rules of the House because there will always be a time when, hon member Nkondlo [Interjections.], you are running your own – no – hon member Nkondlo, you would want to have the same respect when you are running your debate coming up. So I would ask that we respect both sides of the House. [Interjections.]

Hon member, I am talking! Hon member, I am talking, will you keep quiet please so that everybody could – here is the Rule, I preside in this House, not you. [Interjections.]

Thank you very much. We will not proceed.

Thank you, hon members, we have now come to the end of Interpellations. [Interjections.] We now move over to Questions. [Interjections.] I now recognise the hon Premier Winde.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

New question to the Premier:

Departments of Infrastructure and Mobility

1. Ms N D Nkondlo asked the Premier:

Whether the two new Departments of Infrastructure and Mobility have been fully established and is operating in full; if so, (a) how much is the budget for each and (b) when were these budgets approved?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, and to the hon member Nkondlo, thank you very much for the question, although I do note that this question has been asked previously in this Parliament.
[Interjections.]

To the hon member Nkondlo, through you hon Deputy Speaker, planning and the legislative work required towards the establishment of the two departments are at an advanced stage and it is envisaged that the two new departments will be established and fully functional by the start of a new financial year 1 April 2023.

In practice the breaking down of silos is already taking place through the integration of management processes. Budgets for these departments will be

concluded through the Western Cape Budget Planning Process which actually starts in the next few weeks. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

Hon member Nkondlo, do you want to have your first bite of the response?

You may proceed.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you.

The question, hon Premier, because I think we had asked this around 20 May and it continues, the goalposts seem to be moving. One would be interested to know at what point if then these departments are already in place, were there any particular personnel implications in as far as the new departments are concerned, and in terms of programming, were there anything that have changed in terms of programmes in the previous departments as you would have known that we had, what is it, Public Works and Infrastructure?

So are there any new programmes under the new design, similar to the other department?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much.

As it has always been when you make an announcement there are processes to follow and it has always been that that work has to happen this year so that the new department can start on 1 April next year.

I mean this is just how it is done anywhere in the world and of course in this country, in this country as well, [Interjections.] and of course it has to go through a budget process, it has to have budget allocation, [Interjections.] it has to be agreed through consult ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

Premier, you may proceed.

The PREMIER: It has to be agreed through consultation with the unions. These are called proper due processes and it is exactly the same as the last time I answered this question. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. [Interjections.]

Any further – you may proceed, hon member.

Ms N D NKONDLO: These due processes of yours, hon Premier, they always come after according to your own planning in this Provincial Government [Interjections.] because you seem to be pronouncing things and then follow due process thereafter. Is that what you are telling us? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Premier? [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: I do not know how long the hon member has been in politics or even understood how it works. Whether the President makes an announcement or the Premier makes an announcement, that is how government works. You make an announcement, these are your plans for the next year and then they get implemented. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Chairperson, and that you, hon Premier.

Hon Premier, I am sure you have listened to the State of the Nation Address, I am sure many people has. Does the President not announce his plans during the State of the Nation Address and then afterwards in the budget debate the Minister announces it and furthermore the departments in April?

Now is there no such a process and are you differentiating from that process?
Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Thank you, hon member, and that is exactly what happens because you make the announcement. Then of course this is a change in

department, you have got to engage with the people who ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Where are the jobs? You announce jobs? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, we have to give the Premier – these are questions so we have to give the Premier the opportunity to answer. You may proceed, Premier.

The PREMIER: So you have got to engage [Interjections.] ...

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: [Inaudible].

The PREMIER: You have got to engage with the staff and then once you have engaged with the staff you have got to then put the legal processes in place. There is a formation, you got to apply to the Presidency so you can rename that department. [Interjections.] I do not think the ANC understands how this process works, but let us talk about announcements.

I wonder where the bullet train is? That moves across from Johannesburg to Cape Town and Johannesburg to Durban ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The PREMIER: ... that was announced by the President how many years ago,

let alone, hon Deputy Speaker, let alone ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Let alone the announcement of remote working visas and, I mean it just goes on and on. At least when we make announcements then processes happen and change then happens. When the ANC makes announcements nothing happens after that, but if I may and of course I always enjoy interjections and the hon Leader of the Opposition asked about the war room.

So perhaps if I am going to indulge this Parliament, is that the War Room was an initial partnership between Harvard University and this Government. [Interjections.] That War Room work was then concluded in that partnership during the middle of this pandemic and it was embedded into an operation across this Government.

I was in a meeting ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: I was in a meeting about four weeks ago where the process was being reported on each of those plans or the new plans that the War Room works on, which is now the embedded system, and it was Oxford University and of course Harvard that have developed the ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: How much did you pay for it?

The PREMIER: Nothing, they gave it for free, [Interjections.] and after on the ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore.

The PREMIER: It was Oxford University that actually made a comment that said there are many countries around the world that are now embracing this new way of problem-driven iterative adaptation, the PDIA process. There is only one government in the world that has taken it even further and embedded it into how you actually fix problems across departments and that is this Government. The only one in the world. That is this Government. [Interjections.] Because the ANC do not have a clue about that kind of stuff. [Interjections.] They do not have a clue.

That is why our country is that failed state because of this political party and what they have done to the citizens of this country. No hope, they have destroyed everything and that is why this province, this province, the Cape ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The PREMIER: And that is why this province, the Cape of Good Hope is

actually the Cape of only hope for South Africa because it is the only place that the DA governs and not the ANC. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Any further – yes, I see you, hon member Fry.

Mr C FRY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, I only saw hon member Fry now, that is ...

An HON MEMBER: He did not raise his hand.

Mr C FRY: I did raise my hand.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, he did raise his hand. [Interjections.] You may proceed, hon member Fry.

Mr C FRY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I would just like to ask the Premier, just for clarity's sake, because my learned friends across the aisle is not getting this.

So what benefits will the new departments have in terms of serving the people of the Western Cape? Thank you. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: This is a very [Inaudible.] question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: So obviously there are two new departments: infrastructure and mobility, and you need to design your government to bring about solutions for your citizens and in South Africa when we talk about infrastructure that is failed. The electricity infrastructure, where is it? Eskom. Loadshedding. That infrastructure, total failure. Tail infrastructure, failed. Water infrastructure. [Interjections.]

How many years does it take to get the Clanwilliam Dam going? We have rebuilt freeways, we have redone everything that needs to happen from our side, and nothing from the National Government. A failed, failed infrastructure. [Interjections.]

So that is the whole idea to say let us actually – and the question is what difference will it make? Well, as a province, if it happens in this province ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

Hon Premier, please take your seat. Hon member – you want to take a question? You want to respond? Is a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Mine is, I have got my hand up for a follow-up question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, it is the final follow-up, unfortunately, it is closed.

You may proceed, hon Premier. [Interjections.] We have done four follow-ups.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. Thank you ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, I know you have not been here often in the House, but this is the final follow-up, that was hon member Fry. Remember two from hon member Nkondlo, and hon member Mackenzie and hon member Fry.

So please allow the hon Premier to finish off this question and we will move further on. You may proceed, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: So it is called realigning your government to solve the problems that our citizens face. Infrastructure, a massive problem and primarily as a province driven because of national failure.

So we have to step in and make sure we get the infrastructure right, like we are doing. I mean there is only one city in South Africa that avoids two

loadshedding levels.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The PREMIER: It is where the infrastructure is being invested in, where plans are being put in place because of a failure at National Government, a failed state at that level. Rail infrastructure, these things – and you need to be able to respond because of course this Government is responsible for making sure we make a difference to the citizens of this province.

Exactly the same thing about mobility. How do citizens get around? And so the same thing, setting up a vision about mobility and how people can move around. How do we devolve the power of the rail in our country? How do we get it right? It is interesting, you hear all the noise from the ANC here in the Legislature. You go to National, you end up in Gauteng and guess what? I do not know if he is the outgoing Premier in Gauteng, David Makhura, engages with me and his team because they too are saying together we need to make sure we get devolution of rail down to the Gauteng region and down to the province region. Exactly we agree on the same thing. Why? Because National have failed again and that is why we need to have this vision around mobility and how people can get safely from A to B, how they can get efficiently and cost effectively from A to B because the failure at national level costs the citizen in their pockets every single day, and just on those two areas of loadshedding on the one hand, costs us jobs and costs us investment and on the other hand, people cannot get from A to B because of the failure of

National Government's ability to move things on rail.

Do you know that the National Government at the moment is spending money on a border post to increase the ability to flow 20 kilometres of trucks in the north of our country so that they can get product out of the Namibian port – out of the Mozambican port? We are spending extra money to make sure that our products gets through an efficient port in the next door country.

Our current trains that are supposed to be running between Durban and Gauteng, they used to be running at 20 trains a day. We are not even getting to five trains a day at the moment, and so what are we doing? We are not fixing the trains out of the Durban port to Gauteng, we are rebuilding the border post so we can get more products out of Mozambique. It does not make any sense to me at all. Again total failure at the National Government level, and that is why we are saying we need to redesign government to actually take bigger responsibility, further than our normal mandate, which I do not want to do.

I would not need to do it if we had a successful National Government, but we need to do it because we need mobility. We need safe, secure public transport systems. We need infrastructure that enables economic growth and job creation. That is why we are putting these departments in place.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier.

That brings us to Question 2. I now recognize the hon Minister Maynier.

Questions standing over from Thursday, 18 August 2022, as agreed to by the House:

Pupils: abuse of by teachers

2. Mr F C Christian asked the Minister of Education:

With reference to the *Cape Times* article titled “Bella Vista teacher removed over allegation of hitting pupils with plank”:

Whether his Department has steps in place to prevent a reoccurrence of similar incidents at other schools; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker, and thank you to the hon member Ferlon Christians for putting this question, which of course concerns discipline in our schools.

I think, but before I reply to the question, I do think I should raise an issue based on a comment made by the hon member Khalid Sayed, who seems to have, hon Deputy Speaker, a curious relationship with the facts.
[Interjections.]

Again, again, yes, again, he referred to, as hon members will be aware, the Speaker's statement which was made in this House on 11 August 2022, and I wish to remind the member that the Speaker in that statement said the following, and I am now reading from Hansard:

“I think ...”

I know the truth hurts, hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, if you can take ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I know the truth hurts ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can you take your seat, please? There is a point of order. Hon member Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Chair, on a point of order. This what the MEC is now speaking about has absolutely no relevance to the question that was posed by the hon member Christians. It is actually an abuse towards the hon member Christians and towards learners who are being beaten up at schools, for him to now use this opportunity to speak about that matter and we all know it is going to be far from the truth, but still he should be responding to the questions, not running away. He is used to running away from responsibility. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed, I cannot police the Minister's response. I am sure the Minister is going to get to the question and I am sure hon member Christians will hold him to account to answer the questions. So I am going to hand it over back – sorry, hon member Dugmore?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: [Interjections.] Hon Deputy Speaker, I am arising on a point of order in regard to relevance again.

Now you sometimes, hon Deputy Speaker, wonder why this side of the House thinks that you are partial, this is exactly why, because it is very clear that that is not relevant.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Dugmore, please quote the Rule into which you are ...[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No, I am saying ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... stating I am being selective.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: There is relevance. [Interjections.] There is – I am on a point of order. The fact that you just interrupt me is another example of bias.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sure, sure.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Is another example of your bias. This is not relevant. The question has been asked by hon member Christians. The fact that you want to tolerate what the MEC is saying is a clear indication of your bias. Could you please be fair to this House? Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Dugmore. That was not a point of order. [Interjections.]

Hon Minister Maynier, you may proceed. Hon member Christians, as I will repeat for the record, will have the opportunity to hold the Minister to account for his question and I am sure he is able to speak for himself.

Hon Minister Maynier, [Interjections.] you may proceed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: On a point of order Chair. Chair on a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed, what is your point of order on terms of the Rules?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Chair, you are completely out of order. We are all members in this House. [Interjections.] It is not hon member Christians's responsibility around his question. He is responding to hon member Christians question, but accounting to the entire House. It cannot be

put in hon Christians's place to say no, he must hold the MEC accountable.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: The MEC has to speak to all of us.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I understand, but I cannot as yet determine whether the Minister is answering the question as yet or not. It is not for me to determine that as yet. [Interjections.]

So I – once again we do not know, he has not finished speaking, hon member. He has the time to respond. Once he sits down we will determine whether there is relevance, but at the moment you have all interrupted him and he has not been able to determine its own relevance. [Interjections.]

Hon member, what is your point of order? Sorry, hon member Bans.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I am rising in terms of Rule 44.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Because you seem to be always interested when this side asks a point ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... in issue you always ask them on which ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Correct, thank you.

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... section, but then when the question comes from that side you never ask them on which Rule, but I am rising in terms of Rule 44, which is irrelevance or repetition.

Now I would like you, as hon member Sayed Muhammad has asked the issue of the relevance on the question of the Minister. If you may please rule on that subject [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So thank you, hon member. Thank you for quoting the Rule. The Rule states very clearly:

“When a member persists in irrelevance, persists in irrelevance or repetition of arguments, the Presiding Officer can call attention to the conduct of the member.”

Now firstly the Minister has just begun his response. There is no persistence in irrelevance and there is no repetition of argument. I have to allow, in terms of Rule 44, the Minister to complete his response and then we can see if he has persisted and whether he has been repeated in his argument.

Now, hon members, I trust now that that is my ruling in terms of Rule 44, that we allow the Minister and we will then see whether he has broken Rule 44. That is my argument and that is my final ruling. The ruling stands. May I please ask Minister Maynier to proceed. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and I wish to thank the hon member Ferlon Christians, who has got a smile on his face, and I think if he would just please bear with me.

Of course, Deputy Speaker, this matter is relevant. It relates broadly to discipline. In this case the discipline of [Interjections.] the hon member Khalid Sayed. [Interjections.]

Now I was referring before again I was interrupted to the Speaker's statement on 11 August 2022 and I wish to quote from that statement. The Speaker in that statement, and I am quoting here, Deputy Speaker, from the Hansard. The Speaker said:

“I think the Minister dealt with the matter and dispensed with it in the manner in which, in my view was, satisfactory.”

Now the hon member Khalid Sayed completely ignores that fact.

Now what does satisfactory mean? And for that, I think we should turn to the *Oxford Dictionary of English* [Interjections.], the world's most reliable

dictionary.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon member Sayed, I hope that is a point of order.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Hon Chair, this is a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, alright.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: On the same basis that comrade, I mean that hon member Lulama rose [Laughs] – apologies. It is now, and based on what you have said, he is now repeating, it is repetitive, he is repeating his irrelevance and turning this Chamber into a circus as he has done previously when responding to issues of the interpellation. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: We have a question on Bella Vista. Can the MEC please respond? The parents of Bella Vista are listening.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Sayed.

Hon Minister, I hope now you will proceed to answering the question, thank you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Hon Deputy Speaker, I will get to the matter, but I just wanted to turn again to what “satisfactory” means. “Satisfactory” in the *Oxford English Dictionary* means:

“Fulfilling expectations, acceptable.”

Now I asked, hon Deputy Speaker, a few weeks ago that the hon member be allocated 100 lines on the whole question of *sub judice*, and I wonder, hon Deputy Speaker, if you would consider composing an essay given the fact that it is National Literacy – composing an essay of no more than 100 lines on the meaning of “satisfactory”. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is that your answer? Thank you. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Hon Deputy Speaker, then let me turn to the question put by the hon member Ferlon Christians and let me thank him in ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... advance for – for bearance and good humour in this matter. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You have lost our respect, that is all. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, I have just said will you proceed to the Minister, please allow the Minister to finish. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is not relevant.

An HON MEMBER: He is [Inaudible] the question ...[Interjections.]

THE DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please proceed.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

I wish to thank the hon member for his question, which as the other hon member suggests is on the whole question of discipline and on Bella Vista School.

We must, hon Deputy Speaker, have of course, a zero tolerance approach with regard to assault and corporal punishment, and all such allegations of course are regarded in a very serious light. We all know, hon Deputy Speaker, that in terms of Chapter 2, Section 28(2) of the Constitution that the child's best interest is of course of paramount importance in every matter concerning the child.

So Section 10 of the South African Schools Act states that, and I quote:

“No person may administer corporal punishment at a school to a learner and that any person who does so is guilty of an offence and liable on conviction to a sentence which could be imposed for assault.”

Now there are several policies and circulars that are relevant here and let me take the House through them. I can see the hon member Kama is listening very attentively, unlike the hon Khalid Sayed who is distracted by his telephone.

Of course the ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... first policy is the Abuse No More protocol, which I am sure the hon member is familiar with, but of course Circular 12 of 2019 on the prohibition of corporal punishment is also relevant and Circular 11 of 2019 which traverses the whole question of guidelines for principals on the role in reporting and managing alleged misconduct and disciplinary hearings and unfair dismissal disputes. [Interjections.]

Corporal punishment of course is defined in the Abuse No More protocol, and I quote as:

“Any deliberate act of a child that inflicts pain or physical discomfort used to punish or contain him or her. This includes, but of course is not limited to spanking, slapping, pinching, paddling or hitting a child with a hand or with an object; denying or restricting a child's use of a toilet; denying meals, drink, heat and shelter; pushing or pulling a child by force or indeed, forcing a child to do exercise.”

The Abuse No More protocol to which I have referred, spells out in detail, in great detail, hon Deputy Speaker, the roles and responsibilities of all parties in dealing with a case of abuse. It prescribes an approach for employees of the Department to identify, to intervene, to report and to provide support in cases of child abuse, deliberate neglect to children who are victims of various offenses.

The Department presents various training and of course induction sessions at district school and head office level that raise awareness on abuse and the consequences thereof.

It is very important that victims, not just of course of corporal punishment, but also of any other kinds of abuse know that there is help available for them. The Abuse No More protocol outlines in detail the process to be followed when a learner reports any kind of abuse, providing advice on reporting procedures, how to support victims and how to deal with perpetrators.

We, hon Deputy Speaker, have a very strong pathway in place to ensure that learners receive the help they need from our district specialist support staff, counsellors and social workers, non-governmental organisations and other departments in the Western Cape Government.

Now, hon Deputy Speaker, some hon members would be aware that we have 64 circuits and indeed in each circuit we have allocated a social worker and a psychologist for a total of about 128 support professionals. We are the only Education Department in the country to have a social worker for every circuit, with some provinces doing referrals to the Department of Social Development.

We are also in the process of appointing social auxiliary workers to capacitate the districts more. In this first phase we have appointed one per district. We have also appointed 160 care and support assistants in our high risk schools. In other words schools with a great need for psychosocial supports. The CSAs of course work closely with the circuit social workers.

Some schools also have their own social workers or counsellors appointed by the school governing bodies. The Department works with the Department of Social Development and various NGOs to assist us dealing with certain issues.

An incident involving abuse at schools can be reported to our toll free Safe Schools call centre, which can be contacted on 0800 45 46 47 and callers of

course can get advice and support to victims of abuse. Of course the Employee Health and Wellness Programme also provides support to staff members who have been assaulted.

While these mechanisms to report such abuse are integral to this process the Department can only institute disciplinary steps after reliable evidence has been found for charges of misconduct.

In terms of the Bella Vista Primary School, the Department initiated an investigation. There was some initial hesitancy, I am advised by parents, to give consent, but after consulting with them on the process the necessary forms were provided to the Department. Also psychological support was provided to learners on an ongoing basis. I wish to assure the hon member that disciplinary charges have been brought against the teacher in this matter and the hearing, we expect, will take place a little bit later this month. We have also asked the teacher to provide reasons why she should not be suspended.

We urge of course any learner who has experienced corporal punishment, assault or indeed any other type of abuse in our schools, to come forward so that we so that we can help and I appeal to members that they too have a duty to speak up immediately if they become aware of a case of abuse that has gone unreported.

We must all, I think, work together to stamp out any abuse of any kind in our

schools and I certainly look forward to your support in doing so. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon member Christians, would you like to respond?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Minister, for the response.

[Interjections.]

Hon Minister, a couple of questions. You know, the teacher also threatened the children to say, “Go call your parents because I have got lawyers.” Why is this, this is a very difficult case because it took so long for the Department to act because it has not happened to one learner, one learner wet the bed, they went to school and ran away. I know that they receive psychosocial support and it is being investigated, but according to one of the NGOs in the area said it took a long time to remove this educator from the school.

So if we have all these policies in place, why does it take so long to remove an educator and the educator is still teaching. I want to hear from you is the educator – because she is not suspended, is she still teaching? And is she still a danger to our learners because they are terrified and children do not want to talk about it.

So, you know, learners are already struggling at home and come to school for a safe place and being abused at school. It is a big, big problem. Thank you, hon Minister.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon member. I again wish to assure the member that we have taken action, that disciplinary charges have been preferred and we do expect a hearing and of course this teacher has been asked to provide reasons why she has not been suspended.

I will obviously look into the reasons why this matter may have taken so long to deal with, but I can assure the hon member I am advised the teacher in question was in fact on sick leave, also on the question of support to the learners. Support, I am advised, was provided and sociopsychological support was provided to the victims at Bella Vista Primary.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon member Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Hon Chair, I thank the hon MEC for finally responding to the question.

In a 2017 written reply on sanctions against teachers found guilty of corporal punishment the former MEC stated that the Department does not have jurisdiction over school governing body employees and that goes beyond just the issue of corporal punishment, and accordingly does not have information in that regard.

I just wanted to ask the MEC as to how corporal punishment cases, in

particular against SGB, against those who are employed by the SBS, SGB staff, are handled in schools and whether any of these have been reported this year. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you for the question, hon member.

Again I want to assure the hon member that we are going to take the whole matter of corporal punishment and indeed any other kind of abuse seriously in our schools and as I said in my reply, there will be a zero tolerance approach.

I am obviously not familiar with the reply in 2017 which of course was provided to the House by my predecessor. I will certainly look into this whole matter and I will revert to the hon member. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Baartman?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, often with disciplinary processes those are processes that you put in place in reaction to something and I would like to ask in terms of discipline in the schools in a proactive regard, what measures are there thus to improve disciplines in school given that corporal punishment is illegal? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr P F MARAIS: That is a good question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon member. I have said that we want to take a zero tolerance approach and of course we must take a zero tolerance approach, particularly to those kinds of offenses which in the Act are defined as serious misconduct, and those kinds of offenses include, and not all hon members will know this of course, those learners who may have used or had in their possession or selling or distributing dangerous objects, alcoholic liquor or indeed illegal drugs; learners who commit an act of bullying or assault or theft or arson or malicious damage to property; learners who commit an act of gross insubordination, learners in possession of unauthorised copies, for example, of tests or examinations; learners who attempt to bribe any person; learners who try to gain an unfair advantage; learners who, for example, engage in public indecency; learners who are, for example, found guilty of transgressing the learners' code of conduct.

We do need to ensure that of course there is discipline in our schools and of course the key issue here, hon member, is that school governing bodies must enforce their school's code of conduct and take disciplinary action in the case of any infringements of this code and we of course, and this relates to the question put by the hon member, we provide training to schools on how to do

this.

In addition we also provide training to teachers on how to identify and manage problem behaviour among learners, as well as classroom management and methods of maintaining discipline that do not involve physical violence.

It is crucial that we of course identify and intervene in anti-social behaviour as early as possible and help of course is available from the Department.

We also, as the hon member may know, have positive behavioural interventions in our schools, such as our Positive Behaviour Programme and indeed the Transform To Perform Strategy.

When we look at behaviour like I have described, I think we must also be honest, hon member, we also have to ask ourselves what are these kids learning at home from their parents? Parents need to be clear with their children, that they must respect their teachers, respect their classmates and abide by the code of conduct for learners in the Western Cape. Thank you.

Mr P F MARAIS: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Any further – hon member Sayed? Apologies, hon member Sayed first.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you very

much, and thank you to the hon Minister for the response.

Just as a follow-up and this is relating to behaviour of teachers. I just wanted to know whether it has been brought to the MEC's attention the incident at Diazville High School in Saldanha Bay, where learners are allegedly, and particularly African learners, it is a trend, where African learners, when there is any allegation of misconduct, they are then asked by teachers to clean the windows and also the other thing that tends to happen is when female learners, there is an allegation that when female learners at this particular high school are in the toilet, you have certain male teachers, male educators, who are alleged to be videoing those learners. This has come to light when I have gone to visit the area and engaged with parents.

I just wanted to know whether the Department, through the district, coming from the circuit manager, has brought the matter to the MEC's attention because the matters were raised with the District and with the circuit manager. If the matter has not come I am more than welcome to actually submit them to the MEC once the parent sends the issues to me. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you to the hon member for drawing my attention ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: By the way I did not wait, I just got it

last night ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Sayed. [Interjections.]

Hon members, order.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I would like to thank the hon member for bringing this matter to my attention. I was not aware of the matter and of course it is deeply concerning. I will obviously immediately take up this matter with the Department, but I wonder whether the hon member would in any event please furnish me with any particulars that he may have so that the Department can take action. I will not tolerate this kind of behaviour in schools in the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. That concludes Question 2. We move over to Question 5. Are you ready, hon Minister? I now recognise hon Minister David Maynier.

Schools: plans to close down

5. Mr M K Sayed asked the Minister of Education:

Whether his Department has any plans to close down schools in the province during the 2022/23 MTEF period; if not, why not; if so,

(a) what are the relevant details and (b) what informs this decision?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. You can see that I am certainly ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are busy today.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... working hard this afternoon [Interjections.] and earning my salary.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: There is no need [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Well, now that the hon member has raised the question of leaving ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please, hon Minister, keep to the question.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... from what I read in the newspaper, the only person in this House that is leaving is the hon member himself. Leaving as the Leader of the Opposition and of his party here in the Western Cape, although that is what we hear, I cannot confirm it. [Interjections.] I believe that the hon member Khalid ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, Rule 44, please, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... Sayed will know much more ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Maynier, Rule 44, please. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... on this subject. There has been discussions, I believe, hon Deputy Speaker, among the three branches who are active here in the City of Cape Town. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Maynier, Rule 44, please.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Deputy Speaker, [Inaudible.] of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: The point of order is that I want to ask whether it is correct for the hon member Maynier to mislead the House whereas in fact there are 250 branches with over 100 members.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Dugmore, for that clarification.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you. Except, hon Deputy Speaker,

I really do apologise for misleading the House ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please, can I have you focus on the question.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... however, I note that the hon member does not deny that he is leaving. I wonder if he could confirm whether in that respect I might have been misleading the House. Otherwise we would have to draw the conclusion ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Maynier, we will be ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... that in fact he is leaving.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: This hot seat is getting really overheating now.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Hon Deputy Speaker, perhaps ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can you focus on the question.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... I am better informed than the hon member about his future.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, can we focus back on Question 5.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Now hon member Nkondlo asks what has happened since I have got to Education and why do I not go back to Finance. I think I should answer, I need to answer that question.

I have got new purpose and new energy in this portfolio. I am sure that the Minister ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Stand up if you want to put a point of order, hon member. There you may, what is your point of order?

An HON MEMBER: My point of order, when we are saying these things, we are told that it is not right, it is unparliamentary ...

An HON MEMBER: Right!

An HON MEMBER: ... and then when the MEC decides he wants to entertain conversations, he has conversations and just speaks haphazardly. That is fine, the Deputy Speaker does not rule on that. I do not know what the joke is but there must be consistency here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sure, and maybe you listened to Hansard, and I said three times Rule 44, so the Minister is on a fine line, he knows that. He is pushing the boundaries. Hon Marais, what is your point of order.? Hon members I cannot hear hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: I wish to appeal to members; this is not the ‘fun house’.

An HON MEMBER: Seriously, be honest.

Mr P J MARAIS: It has become so bad in this House that I do not think it is worthwhile for members to even turn up for these sessions. It is becoming a joke and I want you to make sure that those members who want to listen, to participate in constructive debate and get the facts which they need to do their job, get a chance to listen. But there is just laughter and giggling and interjections as though that is the role of Parliament. I want to make an appeal to all members and to the Chair to re-establish order in this House please.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, thank you very much. Hon Minister Maynier, can you proceed please to Question 5.

Schools: plans to close down

5. Mr M K Sayed asked the Minister of Education:

Whether his Department has any plans to close down schools in the province during the 2022/23 MTEF period; if not, why not; if so, (a) what are the relevant details and (b) what informs this decision?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, I will ignore the interjections from the hon members and I take the point which is made by the hon member. I do wish to thank the hon member for his question, and his question of course traverses the whole question of school closures. The simple answer to the hon Khalid Sayed's question is this, no. No, I decided to place a moratorium on all school closures because we are not convinced by the National Department's framework for closing schools, which of course essentially says that if a school is a micro-school and has multi-grade teaching, we should close it.

According to the standard parameters for closure and merger of micro-public schools, dated 25 March 2017, which of course is a policy of the Department of Basic Education, the National Government, the rate of implementation of the closure and merger of micro-schools under the school rationalisation and realignment process is affecting the progress made towards ensuring that schools meet the provisions of the minimum norms and standards for school infrastructure.

Now the process for closure contained in the Department of Basic Education's guidelines for rationalisation and realignment of public schools is a holistic approach which was dated 7 December 2017. According the DBE,

the publishing of these two documents of course is intended to facilitate school rationalisation and realignment of schools, but the DBE then further states that schools that are classified as micro-schools, according to the regulations relating to minimum uniform norms and standards for public school infrastructure, which was also published in a *Government Gazette* on 29 November 2013 should be considered for closure or merger.

This refers of course to primary schools with learner enrolment figures of fewer than 135 and secondary schools with learner enrolment figures of fewer than 200. We are just simply not sure that this is the best way to approach the unique circumstances of each school and we want to develop our own data-driven policy in line with our vision before proceeding. And it is for this reason, hon member that I have placed a moratorium on school closures pending a review of our approach and my answer to your question is no.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Sayed would you like to follow up?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Let me firstly welcome the announcement of this particular moratorium. It is a positive step in the right direction following the kind of pressure we had to exert on the former MEC and the recalcitrance in that regard, so we want to welcome this move from the current MEC. We differ at times, but this is where we will agree.

Just linked to that, in the MEC's reply to my question in July 2022, on the planned closure of the Kleinfontein Primary school in the Overberg, near Swellendam, he outlined the process that will be followed to arrive at a decision to close this particular school. I wanted to just get a sense, would this school also fall under this moratorium number one, but linked more importantly, I want to ask the MEC to provide an update and place on record, because he has spoken about the moratorium but whether this school falls in that category and given that there is the moratorium then, what is going to happen then in that instance because there is an argument that is being made by the Department that there are far too few learners in that particular school and there is another school nearby and there needs to be a merger. So I just want to get a sense as to what will be happening in that particular regard? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you hon member for putting the question. I am not sufficiently familiar with the particulars of the case to which you refer, and I wonder if you would put a written question so that I could provide you with those particulars. But I have decided to place a moratorium on all school closures and there are no exceptions. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Baartman, then I see you hon Marais. Her hand was up before.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, in many of our rural areas we often have schools that have a very small amount of learners in them, so they are often affected by this national framework regarding school closures and I wanted to therefore welcome this announcement by the Minister and ask what led to this decision and whether there might be some backlash with National? Are we going to then fight that backlash if any? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you for the question, hon member. I obviously cannot anticipate the response of National Government, which would obviously be in the hands of our National Minister. I must say I want to be in the business of opening schools, not in the business of closing schools in our province and I do not think that simply because a school is small and simply because a school is a multi-grade school, it should necessarily be closed. And it is precisely for that reason that I want to review our approach.

As I have said we have a data-driven policy that is in line with our vision so that we can proceed in a way that is rational and data-driven, not just simply driven by a guideline ... [interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It is sensible.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... and sensible and says that because a school is necessarily small and employs multi-grade teaching, that it should ipso facto, be closed. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Marais?

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you so much, Speaker. I am covered by what the hon member Baartman asked, especially as it affects farm schools and I am sure the official Opposition will agree with me that the children of farmworkers might be the first to be affected if numbers determine whether a school is closed or not and they are the people who need education, perhaps mostly.

I also want the Minister, and I do not want him to respond, but in his future vision for this, what will happen to those schools; whether he must consider that in the events when schools close down for whatever reason, they are still made use of for educational purposes of a different type. Our youth have become delinquents and children do not have proper teaching, perhaps, or discipline at home. Could those schools become a place of assisting in the process of readjusting young people that have become wayward in terms of the law?

Instead of letting these schools become the target of people who destroy them, I have seen many schools in Elsies River totally destroyed, the buildings have been destroyed. Could we perhaps utilise schools? I know it is a different question and I do not expect an answer now. I just want the

Minister to look at the possibility of saving the building and putting better use to it in an educational way.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you hon member. I want to thank you for your contribution. On the whole question of farm schools which are often as you say micro schools with relatively few [Inaudible.] youth learners, it is precisely for that reason that I have decided to place this moratorium on school closures. Of course I said to the House that I have done so pending a review of our approach and I think your proposal of carefully considering how we use existing infrastructure and whether that infrastructure can be repurposed is a very sensible suggestion and I will certainly take it on board as we review our approach to school closures here in the Western Cape. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon members, any further follow-up questions? No there are not. That brings us to the end of Question 5. I think I have got just enough time for the last question, Question 8. I now recognise the hon Minister Wenger.

Pick n Pay Market Store Project

8. Ms N D Nkondlo asked the Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities:

What (a) challenges have been encountered in the Pick n Pay Market Store Project and (b) lessons have been learned from it?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. In response to the hon member's question, small businesses in townships and rural areas are faced with many obstacles in achieving business growth. Obstacles include constraints that are common to most start-ups, such as an absence of affordable finance, market competition, external risks including crime and high regulatory barriers. Access to markets is the most limiting factor for businesses and despite the presence of finance, businesses require access to markets to manage and sustain their operations.

The Pick 'n Pay Market Store project was an attempt to address some of these challenges, through the conversion of existing spaza shops or suitably located sites within townships into independently owned mini supermarkets in townships. The initiative involved improving the infrastructure, building, machinery and equipment in the township retail sector.

The Department of Economic Development and Tourism provided R3,6 million financial assistance to qualifying beneficiaries in the form of grant funding to facilitate the refurbishment of market stores. Part of our approach in this regard is a commitment to partner with the private sector, which of course includes the private sector in townships, while innovating and trying

new things so that we can keep on pushing ourselves to do better.

In this context, the Pick 'n Pay Market Store project was an innovative collaboration which involved the conversion of existing spaza shops within townships into independently owned mini supermarkets. Six of the eight stores that were opened in the Western Cape through this collaboration remain operational. Employment pre-conversion across all stores was 24 jobs. Unemployment as at 30 June 2021 was 151 jobs.

Part of attempting new approaches is to learn lessons from them and in this respect, I appreciate the spirit of the member's question on the challenges encountered and the lessons learned. Some of the challenges faced relate to the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic and the related restrictions. Further, high set-up costs, the impact of crime, finding a suitable location for the stores and store managers were some of the challenges faced.

We have also seen how regulatory processes can impact small and micro enterprises, in particular. During the course of this programme the Department has learnt that more intensive training for business owners is needed over a longer period of time and that store owners must be actively involved in the daily operations of the business for it to be successful and to thrive.

This should include regular onsite mentorship. We also need to ensure that we fast-track regulatory processes in the beginning stages of the programme

to avoid it becoming a barrier later.

Going forward, Madam Deputy Speaker, we will certainly leverage lessons learnt from this project as we focus on delivering an enabling environment for the private sector in communities' right across the Western Cape.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Perhaps the Minister can clarify, because she said six out of eight and if my arithmetic serves me well, she means only two failed. According to the information I have, I have got no [Inaudible.] NY that has closed, was disfranchised, Thembi in Langa, the ones that the Committee visited and the two ladies in Delft, that is the third one and one is in Stellenbosch. So, is the Minister not aware of these other shops that also were part of the initiative and actually their businesses did not do well?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you to the hon member for the question. As far as the information I have available and have been briefed on, six of the stores are still operational and two have closed down. I do not have any further information about other shops having closed down, however, if the member has information that I am not in possession of, I would be very grateful for that to reach my office.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Mvimbi, I recognise you and then hon Murray and now I have – you will have to put your hands up. I have got only one opportunity, so hon Mvimbi you may continue. Sorry, sorry hon member it is over to you. No, no hon Nkondlo you are after. You may proceed hon member. My apologies.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister I just want to ask whether these spaza shops that were assisted by the Provincial Government via Pick 'n Pay, were existing spaza shops or did they start from fresh? If they were existing, why was the money not given directly to them as spaza shops because that is what we do with other businesses that the Provincial Government, via the Department, funds like some of them we visited, the Provincial Government does give money directly to those businesses B&Bs, be it other small businesses in the white areas. So why could this money not be given directly to the spaza shops?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. Thank you to the hon member for the question. As far as I am informed two of the participants had trading histories while the remaining six did not. Then just to clarify the Department of Economic Development and Tourism provided grant funding to the store owners directly and we did this to assist the store owners because we understand that challenges exist in opening businesses. The funding that was provided was

specifically to assist the store owners with infrastructure and that was not loan funding, that was grant funding for things such as air-conditioning units, refrigeration, security systems, uniforms for staff members and that was provided directly to the store owners themselves.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. I now recognise online, hon Murray.

Ms C A T MURRAY: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker, my question is what other support does the Western Cape Government provide to SMMEs?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you Deputy Speaker and thank you to the hon member for the question. What support do we provide to other SMMEs as Provincial Government: obviously creating the right conditions that will help SMMEs to start and expand which is very important to us. So we do this by trying to create an enabling environment and removing barriers that might stand in the way of small businesses.

For example, one of the key barriers is funding and so we have recently launched in 2022 the iteration of the SMME booster fund which aims to enhance the sustainability of rural, urban, township-based youth and people with disabilities as well as women-owned SMMEs, specifically. R16 million

will be distributed to selected organisations that help deliver training on business development support as well as access to markets for SMMEs.

Since the first iteration of this fund in 2019, I am informed it has allocated just under R60 million in funding and supported 730 SMMEs in the province. So far, this fund has supported 386 township-based businesses from areas such as Mbekweni, Idas Valley, Khayelitsha, Gugulethu, Dunoon, Macassar, Philippi, Delft, Kwanokuthula and Zwelitshwa to name a few. However, with the COVID-19 pandemic hitting small businesses in particular, and the Western Cape Government's COVID-19 Supplier Development Programme was another intervention that worked to increase the capacity and ability of micro enterprises that manufactured cloth masks and sanitisers and other related products.

Businesses were supported through this programme which sustained 71 jobs including in areas such as Mitchells Plain, Diazville and Seawinds. Furthermore, as the member will see reflected in the 2022 Main Budget, the Western Cape Government has allocated the following amounts over the 2022 MTEF: R78,5 million for enterprise development; R18 million for regional and local economic development; R67 million for red tape reduction and red tape reduction is of course very important because by removing red tape businesses can be assisted even further. At the moment this unit has been able to maintain a successful case resolution rate of 93% for the last financial year and we look forward and I am trying very hard to improve this record for the year ahead.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. That brings us to the end of that question. Unfortunately, we are way over time, we need to move on. Thank you, members, that is the end of questions for oral replies. Outstanding replies will be printed in the Hansard. We now move over to Questions to the Premier without Notice in terms of Rule 204. I recognise the hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker and thank you very much for the opportunity to ask a question to the hon Premier. Hon Premier, my question is related to the Chapter 9's as well as Chapter 10 Institutions and their relevance and how you actually hold them in higher regard. As the Head of the Executive in the Western Cape and as the custodian of the Constitution and particularly constitutional matters. Does the Premier respect and uphold Chapter 9 and 10 Institutions of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Premier?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much to the hon Mvimbi for the question and the answer is yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Premier for that response. If you do respect and uphold these institutions and given that you have decided

to protect a certain MEC, MEC Bredell, could you give us an update on the progress of the review application and the Public Protector's response in respect of the Public Protector's report, implicating yourself as well as the MEC, in the cover-up of maladministration, corruption and fraud in Oudtshoorn, which was released a year ago and also the Public Protector's report released earlier this year on MEC Bredell's improper conduct on instructing the DA caucus members of the appointment of a senior official in George?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Premier?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much to the hon Mvimbi for that follow-up and I know that it was yesterday at 9 o' clock I signed off the legal papers because as I think the hon member does know that we were granted leave to appeal and in actual fact the legal team that is going to court on the appeal application, those forms were actually signed with the State Attorneys yesterday at 8:30, 9 o' clock.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. It is the end of question – you have had two follow-ups – last one, that is correct.

Mr L L MVIMBI: The interesting thing then, on the same Minister, I am going to ask because you seem to have acted differently on just mere allegations against other Ministers in the past. For example, hon Madikizela is out based on issues that were raised; hon Fritz is out based again on

allegations but on this one there were actual factual reasons. Actually, if you consider the decision of the Public Protector as binding in terms of the remedial action that you process, I would have expected that you would have acted on that but in the cases of Madikizela and Fritz they were just mere allegations and you removed them. On this one there are facts on the table that he has been found to have actually flouted the laws. Questions have now been raised on the appointment of the HOD in MEC Bredell's Department and an interview panel on which the Premier was listed as an observer. The Chairperson of the interview panel was MEC Bredell. The person proposed for appointment is alleged to be a family member of the MEC's head of office. Now will the Premier abide by the findings of the Chapter 9 or 10 Institutions should such a Constitutional entity find the appointment to have been a case of nepotism.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Premier?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much and obviously there were like three questions in one there so let us deal with the first part. The hon member took three separate Ministers in this Government and then tried to crowd them into one space and a decision. He must understand that how the Rule of Law works and then in actual fact every time any allegation is made, it has to be investigated and of course whatever that investigation comes out ...
[interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The PREMIER: ... with you have to then apply your mind to the outcome of that investigation. You cannot have one ruling that just applies to everything, blanket, then his understanding of the Rule of Law is limited. You cannot do that first of all. Secondly, obviously you know, let us see what happens through an investigation. He did note HODs and that I act as an observer in appointments of HODs. I am pretty certain that the hon member knows that when it comes to appointment of Heads of Department, it is the Premier that appoints Heads of Department and so what I do in order to enable myself to make sure that panel have applied their minds when it comes to me, I sit in on the interviews and I have done since the beginning of this term, so that I can hear what the applicants are saying and what they are putting forward.

Every single time when it comes to the end of the interview, I excuse myself, so I am never part of any deliberation that the interview panel has and every single interview, as it starts, it is pointed out to every candidate that this is the interview panel and over there is the Premier who is just going to observe, he only has observer status.

I have done that in every single case and of course then what happens is after their deliberation they make their finding and then they send it to me for signing off. Of course, if I wanted to, I could be part of the interview panel, seeing as I am the one who needs to appoint but I prefer to do it at an arm's length and only observe and then allow the interview panel and then they send it to me because I believe it is an extra layer of oversight.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise hon Marais, your question?

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Premier, in light of your frequent calls on the National Government to devolve powers over police to the Western Cape in terms of Chapter 6, Article 99 and Article 146(2) (a) and (b) of the Constitution of the Republic and your party's declared policies supporting subsidiarity and federalism and your own wish of redesigning government like you just said, what are the powers except police, that you would similarly want to be devolved to the Western Cape and how soon?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Premier?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much to the hon member for that question. Absolutely, I mean I think first of all policing powers and devolution, and I think I have said earlier today that if I look at crime statistics across South Africa, we have to try something else, we have to do something else. We cannot just keep on doing the same thing and hope for a different or better outcome.

So I am really encouraged as of the last two days and last week's questions in the National Assembly to the President that he has now said that we will have a look at and at least have that discussion, so for me that is one major step forward that there is a recognition that in actual fact crime is out of control and we need to have a second, a different look at how we deal with it.

The second area I think it is commonly said and that is one of rail, devolution of the management of our passenger rail service and again there, as I think as I said earlier today, also an encouraging discussion in the first two days of this week where at least with the Gauteng Government and the Western Cape Government there is *ad idem* that this is something that needs to take place and the National Minister is already indicating that he is looking at 2026 as a possible date for the devolution of that power.

I think that there is always the tendency in everything that happens to say when something does not work that I would love to take that over. I also think that as a province you cannot just take over everything so the list could be unending.

I do not usually use the protocol lounge at the airport, and I came through it the other day and it was terrible. I wanted to phone international relations and say I want to take over the protocol lounge because it is an embarrassment. I mean they had a President coming from another country and no-one even knew where the carpet was at the entrance, and it was a total disaster. Then your automatic instinct is, well, here is another area that we need to take over but of course we cannot take over everything.

So I think that as our new democracy evolves that we need to see areas that perhaps are failing or areas where in the founding principles of our Constitution it says when a local government or a provincial government, which is closer to the people, have the ability to deliver that service, that that

should be devolved.

So I think it should just be seen as a common principle that in actual fact closer to the citizens is where decision making, and power should be and that a National Government has much more step-in clauses when there is failure instead of the other way around which it is at the moment.

I mean there is a very big discussion happening right now around powers of provinces when it comes to Section 139 of the Constitution and local governments and there is *ad idem* across all of our provinces that local governments do not have sufficient powers in oversight when it comes to local government.

A lot of discussion also happening this week around how do we change those powers; how do we get to intervene before it is a disaster and a failure because the disaster and the failure happens and at the end of the day the citizens suffer because everything has fallen to pieces and the citizens are not getting the service.

So I think that is another area, policing, rail and probably local government oversight. The Local Government Extended Cabinet, about a month ago, sent an extended document to the Presidency based on what we think should change with regards to the oversight model of local government and the powers of provinces to intervene when failure happens. But I think in principle it should be devolution closer to the people at local government

level and provincial level and that oversight happens at national. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Marais?

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank so much Premier for your well-structured response. But I want to ask what progress has been made and which processes have you initiated since 2019 to achieve any of these objectives which you have just mentioned to us? Can you just take us into your confidence?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much hon member. First of all, with regards to policing powers, we established a committee of constitutional law advisors, we established a committee of people from our universities, criminologists, on looking at what would the structure look like and how could we get devolution of policing. Those documents were all put together in part of a framework of the application.

Then I want to say, as I have just said, that it is either a constitutional change which has its own processes or what we are pushing for is an assignment change, which is Section 99 of the Constitution. Although in my discussions on Tuesday specifically with Minister Bheki Cele, he does not agree with me that it could be a Section 99 but those are further discussion that we have agreed that we will have, so our same committee will now be looking at further discussions that we can enable through legal, it will start with legal and then – Monday and Tuesday was in Pretoria - on Wednesday morning, also in discussion with our own legal team, we are now revising our first

initial documents they sent through. Our legal team, along with senior council, have actually got some other ideas which we are going to – they are going to come back to me to say perhaps we can try a further discussion around Section 99 or as we have also been saying, Section 206 and that is around that the National Government can write policy and through that policy, enable different decision making.

At the moment with policing powers, we do have a system where we have a Provincial Police Commissioner and we do have a Joint Operations Commander, JOC, which does have representation of Local Government, Provincial Government but unfortunately when it comes to real decision making then that moves to one level higher and then we do not play a role anymore. So we are trying all sorts of angles to say how do we get to a stage where we actually rethink and reinvent, specifically around the policing model.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Marais, your final question?

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, Premier, very concise to the point and encouraging but my next question: a process must be put in place, how do you get to the final instalment? So I want to ask you, does the provincial referendum of consulting [inaudible.] form part of your plans and will Opposition parties be part of the processes to determine the way forward and the nature of the questions to be asked in such a referendum, because as you

know, Mr Premier, the result of a referendum depends largely on the nature of the question asked.

I want to ask you; did you have it in mind to go it alone on the formulation of a question or will you be prepared to get together a committee made up of the official Opposition and other smaller parties to determine what is to be asked before we progress further on this road?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Premier?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much for that, actually a very important question. So a province within the Constitution can call a referendum, it is written in the Constitution, a Premier can do it. Unfortunately, the regulation which has to be written within that constitutional mandate has not been formulated. That has to be formulated by National Government. In actual fact my predecessor, Premier Zille, engaged with the previous President to say please we need to have the regulations written to create the environment in which a referendum can be called. We have reiterated that again to say to the current President you need to be able to write those regulations to enable a referendum to be called.

So first of all, I know a lot of people talk about referendums, unfortunately even though it is mentioned in the Constitution, it is not a possibility within our current regulatory environment. Those regulations still have to be written, number one.

Number two, of course a question in a referendum has to be properly thought through. The most interesting thing I find are these people that talk about Cape exit, and they want to have a referendum on Cape exit, and they want to ask the Western Cape citizens the question. If you want to say, you have to ask all citizens of South Africa, not just the citizens of the province. You cannot just ask the one party the question, you have to ask both parties the question because it is about tax, it is about national pride, it is about our economy, it is about all sorts of things. The logic does not make any sense to me whatsoever. So the question has to be critical, and you have got to find the right question, I absolutely agree. And if you look at the results of different referenda around the world, if that question is not put properly the consequences could be dire and really have long-term effects on your citizens.

I want to say when it comes to a referendum, in actual fact there is a referendum in our province every five years. That referendum says, 'citizens of this province here is a manifesto, here is a question, here is a plan, do you support it, yes or no' and the voters decide. That is a referendum and in actual fact that should be the ultimate referendum because that is how democracies work.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, that brings us to the end of Questions to the Premier. We now move over to Statements by Members in terms of Rule 145. I now recognise the ANC.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. President Cyril Ramaphosa continues to show exemplary leadership to our country. On 28 August 2022, our President announced the launch of the National Anti-Corruption Advisory Council. The commitment to dealing with malfeasants and corruption has seen the strengthening of SARS, the NPA, the HAWKS as well as the SIU. These agencies are now doing their work without fear or favour.

The battle against corruption and crime is not an easy one. Its tentacles extend to the private and the public sector and has also made its presence felt in civil society. This council is made up of members of civil society, business and other stakeholders and will provide strategies and develop policies in line with the NACC strategy.

Our President has shown the willingness and commitment to rid the administration and broader society of corrupt practices, to put in motion the processes that will develop preventative measures, install capacity in Government institutions and provide the necessary resources to prevent corruption from happening again.

The council will also provide advisory input on matters related to Government's comprehensive response to the recommendations of the judicial commission of enquiry into allegations of state capture, the Zondo

Commission. We applaud the proactive stance that our President has taken, the seriousness with which he is dealing with this, and we need to say that we fought for a democratic constitution which is clear in its commitment to redress the imbalances of the past.

The independence of the judiciary and the rights of victims and accused are enshrined. As the ANC we want to make it clear that we support other internal organisational changes adopted by the National Executive Committee such as the Step Aside Resolution and the establishment of an ANC Integrity Commission and will resist populous attempts to undermine these measures from wherever they come.

At the same time, we support that our law enforcement agencies act without fear or favour and the constitutional imperative of the presumption of innocence until proven guilty are followed. We hope that the DA pays attention instead of paying R460 000 for the legal fees of Nora Grose who is actually in court ... [interjection.] for fraud and corruption. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, there is little doubt that the Western Cape leads from the front in terms of delivering quality education to learners in our province. In the Bill of Rights, education is enshrined as a fundamental human right. However, considering the high levels of poverty currently being experienced in our country, we know that many are negatively impacted by malnutrition and growth stunting, and this is no exception in the education sector.

It is for this reason why the National School Nutrition Programme was established. In so doing through this conditional grant funding, the Western Cape feeds 507 332 children in 1 024 schools. While this programme ensures that many children do not go hungry, we are concerned how the national quintile system is once again posing a problem and is excluding learners in need. This National Conditional Grant funding only provides for quintiles 1 to 3, which means that poor learners in other quintiles, such as 4 and 5, are negatively impacted by this. Thankfully, through savings of the NSMP funding the WCED has been able to fund selected quintile 4 to 5 schools for 190 days of the year.

In the end we find ourselves having to deal with a system that does not speak to the status of the student and therefore results in inefficient funding being allocated to the respective provincial departments and we call upon the National Government to review the quintile system so the Conditional Grant Funding such as this specific grant, can be more impactful for our learners. For children to be able to learn holistically it is essential that they are properly nourished so as to not experience stunting in their growth. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise the EFF.

Mr M XEGO (EFF): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. The EFF condemns the ANC-led Theewaterskloof Municipality for conducting a municipal event only in Afrikaans in order to create a language barrier to non-Afrikaans

speakers.

The Economic Freedom Fighters would like to take this opportunity to condemn the attitude of those running the Tweewaterskloof Municipality for using the municipality resources to create a language barrier against non-Afrikaans speakers. This follows a municipality event held on 6 September 2022, meant to mark the closing of Women's Month being held strictly in Afrikaans without making any interpretation mechanisms available to non-Afrikaans speakers and thereby deliberately excluding them from the event.

Whilst the EFF does not have a problem with Afrikaans as a language, however it is wrong to use State resources in a manner that is exclusionary. Imagine a situation where a group of people embrace women and their rights and with the very same energy exclude some of those women using mechanisms meant for language barriers.

South Africa comes from a painful past where language was deliberately used to advance some whilst excluding others for social and political and economic ends. I cannot imagine State resources of the municipality being used to create a discord amongst its members to an extent that others leave the event without hearing anything and leaving with a feeling that an event held on celebrating women was useless.

This was very sad and when it is done by those who should be deemed as leaders, especially the former liberation movement. Thank you very much,

Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the DA.

Mr C FRY (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon members of this House, like many countries around the world, South Africa has been hard hit by a cost-of-living crisis. The Western Cape Government has been implementing a variety of measures to guarantee that this province's most vulnerable residents are taken care of, uplifted and given access to a life of dignity and wellness during these difficult times.

We, as leaders of this Provincial Parliament, should spare no effort to use every means possible to guarantee that the Western Cape Government improves access to nutrition, food security and safeguards the most vulnerable people whom the cost-of-living crisis threatens to impact the most.

The DA commends the Western Cape Government for employing a number of measures to ensure that food security for all our residents is achieved. One of these initiatives is the Western Cape Education Department's food gardens. This initiative has assisted in the establishment of 571 food gardens at schools and has appointed 146 gardeners to ensure their sustainability.

This initiative between the WCED and the public sector partners has made

valuable contributions to ensuring that vulnerable learners have access to sufficient and nutritious meals at all times. We also commend the Province's continued leadership in keeping the Western Cape thriving despite the economic downturn. According to Stats SA Quarterly Labour Force Survey for the second quarter of 2022, the DA-governed Western Cape has the lowest expanded unemployment rate in the country.

This Parliament should continue to work alongside the Provincial Government to ensure that we can continue to grow our economy and provide support to the most vulnerable in our society. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise GOOD.

Mr S N AUGUST: No statement, thank you Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, today I yet again want to highlight the unemployment of our youth and our unskilled youth. As parents we all have dreams and plans for our children. At birth we are wide eyed with the prospect that they can achieve something in their lives. Our minds are lifted with the plans of visions for the future generation.

Sadly, Deputy Speaker, in today's economic climate, our hopes are dashed as parents because it seems that youth on the streets have no future. It can be said that young men and young ladies are doomed because many of our young men and ladies are unskilled. It is sad to see that ambitions that they once had, are now pushing trolleys in the streets, picking up cardboard in the roads to make a living.

In the townships our young girls fall pregnant, and they are jeopardising their futures but when you speak to these youngsters on the streets, they say we are unskilled, we are unemployed, and we cannot find jobs. Speaker, this is a major problem because if that is the future of the next generation, we are in serious trouble.

So the ACDP wants to appeal that more must be done to employ and skill our young people so that the wheelie bins that they pull in the streets and the trolleys that they push and the cardboard that they pick up to make a living, are not the future for a better South Africa. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the ANC.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. The taxi industry emerged in the 1970s when the apartheid regime refused to spend on safe, reliable and affordable transport for racialised cheap labour in the townships. It survived through the 1980s.

The continuous harassment by the regime by J P Smith is repeating today. The taxi industry survived that harassment during apartheid days. The ANC in the Western Cape Legislature notes and condemns in the strongest possible terms the recent taxi violence in and around Nyanga, which negatively affected innocent commuters and destroyed infrastructure.

The ANC is of the view that the City instigated this recent violence through their draconian raid on permit holders and impounding taxis while they do not regularly issue permits. We call on SAPS and other relevant authorities to investigate whether J P Smith, through his cowboy-style handling of the situation, did not instigate this violence.

We agree with former MEC Madikizela that the confrontational approach of this Provincial Government in the City will not address the root causes of this problem. Government's failure, especially the Provincial Government's failure to subsidise the taxi industry, while it spends billions annually to subsidise Golden Arrow bus services and MyCiti, is part of the problem.

Secondly, we asked MEC Mitchell earlier this year to intervene on the failure of the municipality to develop and include an integrated transport plan in the IDPs.

Lastly, the inconsistent issuing of operating licences is the major contributing factor. There are too few operating licences and taxis get impounded daily because the Provincial Government and the City refuse to

open more routes and issue operating licences. The silence and absence of both the hon Premier and the hon MEC Mitchell on this matter, is deafening and too loud. They must please ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr L L MVIMBI: ...intervene.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise the Democratic Alliance ...[Interjections.].

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. In the healthcare sector, emergency medical services play an integral role in providing essential care to those involved in serious injury or illness. Owing to the nature of this work, it requires these medical professionals to often be transported to areas where their own safety cannot be guaranteed. This has led the Western Cape Health Department identifying red zones, such as Manenberg, Brown's Farm, Nyanga, Gugulethu, Kalksteenvontein, Lingeletu, Harare, Mandela Park and Samora Machel, where police escorts are required before entering. While this is a delicate system that is dependent on a common resource pool, it means that EMS workers are thus dependent on waiting for police at stations before being able to get to a particular scene.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it does not take a genius to see what problem arises

from this. It is common knowledge that SAPS has been consistently underfunded and under-capacitated to deliver on its mandates. Right now, we see how it is affecting red zone operations for EMS workers. As of now, it takes on average 104 minutes for EMS workers to respond to an incident in a red zone. While this is an improvement from the 2019/2020 financial year, where it took more than two hours, it is still an abomination as a few minutes, quite literally, are the difference between life or death when responding to certain emergencies.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it is time for SAPS to be fixed so that the Western Cape can continue saving lives. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise the Freedom Front Plus. I do not see – no. Ja, I will move on. I recognise Al Jama-Ah. No. I recognise the Democratic Alliance.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, honourable ...[Interjection.]

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you. Over to you, hon member.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Heathfield High School was prominently known as one of the schools with high academic performance and good discipline. During the term of sacked

principal, Mr Wesley Neumann, who was well-loved by the learners and the school community, the school has built up a reputation of high discipline and a well-managed institution. It is, however, disappointing that the WCED has chosen Metro Police along with Casspirs, to invade the school to confront protesting learners recently. This was clearly provocative and unnecessary, as the police presence at the school only aggravated the already volatile situation further.

Female learners have complained of sexual abuse by law enforcement officers during the recent standoff with them. The learners are known to be among the most peaceful and hard-working learners in the Western Cape. This tension at the school is the result of the Department's unfair dismissal of one of the best principals the school ever had. Al Jama-Ah demands an end to police occupation of Heathfield High School.

Whilst we agree that there should be the usual safety measures in place, we question the Department's sudden reason to have invaded the school with the flimsy excuse to search learners for weapons and drugs. No such searches were necessary or carried out while Mr Neumann was principal at the school. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the DA.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy

Speaker, today PRASA signed the Social Impact Agreement with communities living on the Central Line. Sadly, as is the norm with the ANC National Government, they do not consult, they never consult with all affected communities and I, for example, only received an invitation yesterday – yes, hon members, yesterday – to an event of such importance this morning.

Councillors in Mitchells Plain, including myself as constituency head, were shocked when we heard the news that land occupiers are being moved to the hatch area in Mitchells Plain. In fact, I was on Langa Station a month ago, when the hon Minister made such an important pronouncement. [Interjections.] How is it possible for this move to be made without due public consultation with the community of Mitchells Plain of nearly a million? How is it possible that a community is the last to be consulted about this decision by the ANC National Government?

This is unacceptable and the impression created in Mitchells Plain is that communities, such as Mitchells Plain and others on the Cape Flats, that the ANC Government rewards those people who illegally occupy land. We urgently call on PRASA, the Housing Development Agency to rethink the relocation to the hatch in order to conduct a full public consultation process with the community of Mitchells Plain.

Furthermore, PRASA must look for alternative land and consult those affected communities as well. A lack of public participation on the side of

the ANC National Government will cause unnecessary friction between communities of Mitchells Plain and Philippi, which the ANC is solely responsible for. It is the poor governance on the part ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...National Government to simply move thousands of families, without ensuring due public participation from the local community. It is also poor planning by the Housing Development Agency to move thousands of people to the area without proper service delivery mechanisms, such as schools, police stations and clinics in place. This is the infrastructure that the ANC National Government, PRASA, the National Minister, and the National Department ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...must first look at before they move people. [Interjections.] The original sin here, hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...is the ANC Government that destroyed ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...the train services and that is why the people have been moved. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Thank you, that brings us to the end of Statements. In accordance with Rule 145 ...[Interjections.] Hon members, Point 6 ...[Interjections.] Hon members, I now allow one or more hon members of the Executive present, to respond to Members' Statements for not more than five minutes collectively. Are there any, hon members? I recognise the hon Minister Mitchell.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, it is very telling again, hon Mvimbi's Member Statement, but I think it is important that I put on record the misinformation presented by hon Mvimbi.

Hon Mvimbi states that the City of Cape Town and the Western Cape Government does not want to issue permits. So, let me give hon Mvimbi the facts. A couple of years already, 400 permits were recommended by the City of Cape Town that were endorsed by the Western Cape Government Transport Department. Of that 400 permits, hon Deputy Speaker, only 170 of those 400 applications were applied for and issued. Of that 170, hon Deputy Speaker, through you to hon Mvimbi, only 17 are currently still kept up-to-date and valid. So, for hon Mvimbi to come here, to mislead this House by saying that permits are the issue for what happened in Nyanga, is absolutely not true.

Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Mvimbi then makes the assertion that myself and the hon Premier were nowhere in these discussions. Now, let me tell the hon Mvimbi, while he was sleeping, I was at the Joint Operations Centre, at the Disaster Centre Management to ensure that we keep the lives of commuters safe during this operation.

On Friday, I met with the Provincial leadership of the various taxi associations. With the concurrence of those leadership in the industry, hon Deputy Speaker, we then agreed that we will reconvene on Sunday, the past Sunday. On Saturday, I received a request from the industry leaders to postpone that same meeting that was scheduled for Sunday, at my request, hon Deputy Speaker, for Monday. In fact, that meeting happened on Monday with all the industry leaders, including the City of Cape Town, the Western Cape Government and various officials, and my counterparts in the City of Cape Town.

Hon Deputy Speaker, at that meeting again, again I recommitted this Government's commitment with the City of Cape Town, to ensure that of those 400 applications and permits that have been allocated, that this Government with the City of Cape Town, will assist the industry to make sure that we provide the necessary support to ensure that operators are compliant with the law. It was never about permits; it was about keeping commuters safe. Is hon Mvimbi saying to this House that the commuters of Nyanga do not deserve a safe and reliable public transport system? ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, if you could just take your seat. There is a point of order. Hon Sayed, what is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I rise on a point of order, hon Chair. The hon MEC has accused hon Mvimbi of misleading the House. That is not true. That is actually casting aspersions on the hon Mvimbi. He has not misled the House. He must withdraw that remark. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Mitchell ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Or he must come with a substantive motion.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Fair enough. Hon Minister Mitchell, are you willing to withdraw that statement?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members, can I listen to the hon Minister? Yes, hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hon Deputy Speaker, I will withdraw if the hon Mvimbi feels that I have cast aspersions on his character, but I will not withdraw the facts that I have tabled in this House ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So be noted. You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Hon Deputy Speaker, I want to move onto the assertion or assumption that this Government does not support the minibus taxi industry. Hon Deputy Speaker, if hon Mvimbi, that has been briefed on numerous times about the interventions from the Red Dot service and the Blue Dot service that we have partnered with the minibus taxi industry over the last few years, that is a system or a contribution by this Government that has not happened anywhere else in this country.

Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Mvimbi refers to the PTOG grant that is a subsidy. It is a national grant, hon Deputy Speaker, that gets allocated annually to the Golden Arrow Bus Services. It is not a provincial grant, a national grant that gets facilitated or distributed through the Provincial Government. Again, hon Deputy Speaker, I feel that hon Mvimbi has been – we have been through Standing Committee after Standing Committee, highlighting exactly the same questions that are being raised again in a Member Statement. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

MOTIONS

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. That is the end of Members' Statements. In terms of the new Rule 151, we now move over to Notices of Motion. All Notices of Motion by the hon members are required to be delivered to the Secretary for placing it on the Order Paper. These

motions have been duly submitted and published on the Order Paper below the line.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the increasing incidents of kidnapping for ransom in the Western Cape and its impact on the community.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr P J MARAIS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House places a bigger focus on talks with national Ministers with regard to the devolution of powers and authority to their provincial counterparts in terms of sections 146(2)(a) and 99(a), (b) and (c) of the country's Constitution; that the Premier appoints a multi-party task team to examine and report on the financial implications and the extra capacity required to ensure a smooth takeover; and that such a report be tabled within a period not exceeding nine months.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms L M MASEKO: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the challenges that are delaying or halting the implementation of housing projects in the Western Cape.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates cases of maladministration and improper conduct by the DA-led Western Cape Government, including the recent findings by the Public Service Commission against Ministers and other Government officials.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr P MARRAN: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the ability of Western Cape municipalities to pay Eskom debts.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the recent unrest caused by taxi drivers in Nyanga that resulted in the setting alight of a number of Golden Arrow buses, as a result of the City of Cape Town's clampdown on sedan taxi operators, known as '*Amaphela*', and the impounding of taxis.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr P MARRAN: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the living conditions of farmworkers and those evicted from farms in the Western Cape.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr M KAMA: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the latest crime statistics that showed a remarkable increase in crime in the Western Cape.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr G BRINKHUIS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses changes in the funding of policies that will extend the stay of abused women at shelters until they have found jobs,

suitable accommodation and have gained skills to empower them.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr M KAMA: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the high number of drug-related convictions in the province.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the role of the City of Cape Town and the Provincial Government in fuelling the ongoing taxi unrest in Nyanga.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr M KAMA: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the findings and recommendations made by IPID against 15 SAPS stations in the Western Cape in its Annual Report.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We will now move to Motions without Notice. Hon members would please note that in terms of the new Standing Rule 150, pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolence and congratulatory were submitted to the Programming Authority prior to this plenary, on 6 September 2022.

Hon members would then further remember that Motions without Notice on congratulatory and condolence matters will not be allowed in this sitting if the Programming Authority has not processed them. In this regard, the Table staff informs me that in the Programming Authority meeting of 6 September 2022, political parties submitted the names of hon members in the desired order of speaking and indicated their respective hon members with a desire to move a Motion without Notice in this sitting of the House.

I will therefore, just for noting and for the Minutes, call out the hon members whose names have accordingly been submitted and approved. The Programming Authority approved the following hon members' Motions as follows: hon Brinkhuis, hon Botha, hon Baartman, hon Christians, hon Bakubaku-Vos, hon Dugmore, hon Windvogel. I will now put the Motions duly submitted and approved by the Programming Authority to the House.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: I move without notice:

That the House notes the achievement of Nuha Shah from Grassy Park who won a gold medal in the Mixed Martial Arts (MMA) Youth World Championships on 18 August 2022; further notes her victory in the Female Youth B 48 kg division while representing the IMMAF Youth World MMA Championship in Abu Dhabi; recognises that she only started competitively participating in MMA a few months ago; further recognises that two months ago she was selected for the Western Province MMA under-14 youth team; notes that she was the only girl who made the Western Province team to compete in Johannesburg where she won a gold medal; further recognises, prior to participating in the MMA, she was a SA and an All Africa Jiu-Jitsu champion for her division for several years in a row; commends her parents for their sacrifices and successful fundraisings that enabled them to send Nuha to Abu Dhabi to compete in the MMA Youth World Championships; and extends congratulations to her.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Ms Leah Maarman who celebrated her 93rd birthday on 9 August 2022; notes that Ms Maarman's milestone birthday serves as a reminder that we should continue to celebrate the elderly in our communities and their invaluable contributions to enriching our society; and conveys our best wishes to Ms Maarman and may God grant

her good health and prosperity.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the team from Paarl Girls High School on winning the Western Cape Working on Fire annual environmental education debate on Monday, 22 August 2022; notes that the competition's theme this year focused on climate change and the effects it has on our society; and notes that, by providing an inclusive platform for young people to debate, we create the awareness that is needed to tackle these issues, as well as furthering our youth's development efforts.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I move without notice:

That the House offers our sympathies to the Buys family of Heinz Park; notes that Junior Bester reports in the *Daily Voice* of 26 August 2022, of a fire that took the lives of three people: Felicia Buys lost her 65-year-old mother Cynthia, 8-year-old daughter Esmeralda and 6-year-old son Denzil in the blaze; notes that the dwelling and other structures were destroyed in the fire; and conveys our sincere condolences at the passing

away of her mother and her children.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep sadness the untimely passing away of Ms Mabel Patronella Mentor, known as Vytjie Mentor, following a long illness on 23 August 2022; further notes that Ms Mentor was a former Member of Parliament for the ANC until 2019; and notes that at the time of her passing she was a member of Action SA. *Hamba kahle*, Cde Vytjie.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep sadness the passing away of Comrade Thembisile Gladstone Ntamo, a gallant fighter and a dedicated anti-apartheid activist who joined the ranks of uMkhonto we Sizwe; further notes that Comrade Ntamo, a councillor of the ANC in the City of Cape Town, was an outstanding fighter, a leader of his people and the society at large, a political commissar and commander on the battlefield; conveys our deepest sympathies to his family, friends, his loved ones and comrades; and may his revolutionary spirit rest in peace. *Hamba*

kahle, Mkhonto.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Delmaine Cottestatuslor, on being elected as chairperson of the subcommittee of the City of Cape Town, Khayelitsha; and we have no doubt that he will serve with integrity, and we are proud of him.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections, agreed to. The Motions will appear in the Minutes of the proceedings and on Hansard, in each hon members' name as if that hon member has read them out aloud.

I will now allow hon members to move Motions without Notice as per Standing Rule 152(d). This could include Motions without Notice that were not approved in the Programming Authority meeting. Hon members are reminded that 30 minutes, as per the Standing Rule, will start now. I recognise the hon Murray.

Ms C A T MURRAY: Thank you, hon Madam Deputy Speaker. I move

without notice:

That the House notes the importance of creating an enabling environment for the tech ecosystem to thrive; commends Taurus Energy, WiPo Wireless Power, RBI Drone Tech and Delta-Scan on their completion of the Investment Readiness Accelerator Programme; notes that these businesses were able to complete these programmes because they were selected by the Saldanha Bay Innovation Campus, following their efforts at the Drone Tech Showcase pitching event; notes further that innovation businesses like these, strengthen our economy and that Provincial Government should continue to create an enabling environment for the growth of such businesses, especially in the post-COVID-19 recovering economy.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the Motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon Murray, I see you are number 2.

Ms C A T MURRAY: Thank you again, hon Madam Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the R1-billion investment by Truworths to build a massive new distribution centre in Cape Town; notes that private

investments of this kind are needed for the Western Cape economy to recover and create jobs; further welcomes the fact that this development will make use of green technology, highlighting the important role of the private sector in protecting our environment.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the Motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. I recognise the hon Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House wishes all learners a happy International Literacy Day today. We welcome this year's theme as it is premised on using literacy in order to ensure quality, equitable, and inclusive education for all around the world. We look forward to the WCED continuing its work in delivering quality education. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the Motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. I recognise the hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Sorry, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Do you want me to move on one more?

Ms N D NKONDLO: I move without notice:

That the House notes the laudable and with profound admiration and pride the work done by Mr Tumelo Pudumo (TP) and Mr Loyiso Landu (Pisce) who are affectionately known by their Trademark and duo name TP Nala Pisce. The duo are recognised as living legends and a well-respected brand in the community of Gugulethu and neighbouring communities.

The company has a passion for the development of its people and seeing the negative altered into positive. Its footprints can be found through its partnerships with NGOs, NPOs, Youth in Depression, working with Shalom Haven and the Elevator Ground Project, that seeks to provide sanitary towels for young persons. At the centre of its role in society is its shared power space, where young people from all diverse groups and integrated industries of trade come under one roof to develop and map out development, amongst other things creating partnerships.

We therefore call that the Western Cape Provincial Government join in recognising the continued commitment of these two individuals behind their brand, providing them with the needed support and resources to

continuously aid them in their bid to alter and empower their communities. I so move. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the Motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. I recognise the hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House notes and welcomes the incredible strides taken by our local legendary cricketers, Proteas former bowling coach Vincent Barnes and former international batsman Ashwell Prince, who have teamed up to create opportunities for young players from poor schools across the Western Cape. Using their experience in sports and the challenging environments which often hinder opportunities of many of our young people, the Barnes Prince Foundation will use their platform as a driving force to create and hold space for young people to succeed in sport and education. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Are there any

objections to the Motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon Dugmore, unfortunately, I cannot accept that Motion. It is a condolence and as we said, pertains to Rule 150. My apologies. I will move on to hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and commends the Minister of Forestry, Fisheries and the Environment for listening to the grievances of farming communities regarding the fairness and accuracy of the 2021 Fishing Rights Allocation Process; following many complaints received from the fishing communities, the Minister launched an audit of the entire process followed in verifying and recognising small-scale fishers in the Western Cape, and then based on the results of the audit and legal advice, she made an application to the Western Cape High Court to review and set aside the process of registration, verification and declaration of small-scale fishers in the Western Cape; further notes that on 31 August 2022, the court reviewed and set aside the 2016 verification, registration, declarations and rights allocations process as per the Minister's request; commends the ANC and ANC Youth League leadership in the Western Cape, and in particular the Leader of the Opposition and the Deputy Chief Whip, for the extensive engagements with the ANC study group, as well as fishing communities lobbying for this action by the Minister; welcomes the court ruling and makes

demands for transformation in the Oceans Economy. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the Motion being moved without notice? There are objections. The Motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] I now recognise hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that some disciplinary punishments given against learners at Cloetesville and Kylemore High Schools, undermine their right to learning; amongst other things, learners are turned away from entering the school premises for being a few minutes late and are forced to remain at home for an entire day, thus resulting in their exposure to criminality and gangsterism; and the House advises that instead, other disciplinary measures which do not hinder access to education and learner safety are considered instead. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the Motion being moved without notice? There are objections, hon Sayed,

and the Motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Xego. [Interjections.]

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, hon Xego. [Interjections.]

Mr M XEGO: Yes. I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members! Can ...[Interjection.]

Mr M XEGO:

That the House welcomes and notes the initiative by the Rugby World Cup Sevens 2022 to turn plastic cup waste that will be collected at the tournament into bricks that will be used to build affordable housing in the Western Cape. This initiative follows a pilot project by South African Rugby earlier this year in a test match, where they collected waste and converted it into pellets which were used to manufacture bricks. This will go a long way in making sure that the poorest of the poor get houses quicker. Unlike the previous plan of the DA-led Provincial Government, which planned to teach communities how to build the so-called better shacks for themselves. I so move, hon Deputy

Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the Motion being moved without notice? There are, hon Xego. That Motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise you again, hon Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House condemns in the strongest terms the conduct of a police sergeant stationed at Samora Machel, who collided with three pedestrians, whilst using a police vehicle under the influence of alcohol and on duty. The accident resulted in the death of a 7-year-old girl whilst the other two women were seriously injured. It is sad that we find ourselves in a situation whereby those who should administer law and order, are actually doing the total opposite. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the Motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon members, that concludes Motions without Notice. We will now begin the Subject for Discussion.

[Hon member L L Mvimbi takes the Chair.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: For your attention, hon members, it is me in the House now. If the House may please ...[Interjections.] come to order. We will now deal with the Subject for Discussion in the name of hon Nkondlo, as also is printed in the Order Paper. I will hand over to hon Nkondlo.

Subject for Discussion

(The Western Cape economy and the strategic potential that the township economy holds in combating unemployment, inequality and poverty)

Ms N D NKONDLO: The hon one ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I am the Presiding Officer now.

Ms N D NKONDLO: †*Jola*. Let me greet those that are still left in the gallery who have attended this debate. This week marks five months since the lifting of the National State of Disaster. At the time, hon President Ramaphosa said, and I quote:

“We are hopeful that the worst is behind us, and we are confident that there are only better days ahead. Now is the time to grow our economy and create jobs; now is the time to get our country back on track; now

is the time to heal, to recover and to rebuild.”

The ANC proposed the topic of this debate today, cognisant that it is less than two months away from the Medium-Term Budgetary Statement and a month away from the PERO. We will be watching carefully whether this Provincial Government places the necessary priorities on the areas which will facilitate the creation of jobs, tackling inequality and denting poverty, particularly for the poor.

As the ANC, we remain consistent in the pursuing of policy clarity of this Provincial Government on the matter of township and informal economy, as part of realising an inclusive and equitable growth. From townships to town, after apartheid spatial segregation remains. Lisa Findley is a professor of architecture and Liz Ogbu is a designer and social innovator who is also an academic.

They write in this paper that townships continue to be sites of struggle and resilience, as they have been throughout their history. They constitute a distinct urban typology that must be addressed by practitioners, policy makers and scholars, if we are to transform the spatial legacy of apartheid into a landscape that better reflects the multiracial aspirations of the nation. Townships are a product of apartheid segregation and the racial construct engineered as geographies of social economic and political exclusion.

Further, the authors tell us that apartheid was more than a political construct,

but architecture and planning were critical to implementing apartheid policies. Design practices became cultural extensions of State power, and some professional designers validated the power of the white minority. That is why you would find that if you talk about townships, predominantly, it is a black race that is found there.

The deliberate disregard and oblivion of these historical facts and their past dependencies to the current circumstances of these townships today, is mindboggling and their implied sophistry in perpetuating these spatial inequities leaves much to be desired under the scam of equal opportunities, in a land and the province of unequals.

The National Development Plan adopted in 2012 and which the DA agreed with, highlights the importance of creating incentives and programmes which will shift jobs' investment towards the dense townships on the urban edge. The Plan had noted that there is also little support for the informal economy, while township economies are unable to retain local spending power or attract productive investment.

Two years after the Plan was released, Gauteng acted while it took the Western Cape six years to commence an initiative under the Township Revitalisation Strategy. Gauteng is fast accelerating its dent into unemployment and poverty, notwithstanding COVID-19, while in the Western Cape there exists no meaningful intervention that can be attributed to this Provincial Government's seriousness on how it perceives the township

economy.

For their part on writing in the journal of developing areas, Thomas Udimal and Mduduzi Biyase write, I quote:

“The development of township economy is crucial to the development of the country. Township economic activities play an essential role in the action between the rural and urban economy. The transition of most economies from poverty driven to wealthier economies, is attributed to the promotion of SMMEs. This sector plays an essential role in the growth of any economy. As defined by the Gauteng Township Economy Revitalisation Plan, the term 'township' refers to ‘old/new, formal and informal human settlements that are predominantly African, Coloured and Indian, characterised by high levels of poverty, unemployment and low incomes, as well as distance from their main centres of economic activities’.”

Yet, in a rural urban province such as this province, unlike Gauteng, which is predominantly urban, the Provincial Administration of the Province must also take into cognisance the development of our rural and small towns areas. The Gauteng Township Economic Development Act has now backed this Revitalisation Plan in Gauteng and identifies about 12 sectors within the township economy, which includes retail, manufacturing, tourism, transport, ICT and even, the creative industry.

It is a historical fact that in townships with strictly controlled environments informal spaces activities emerged and flourished, sometimes as a matter of survival, other times, as a political act. Private minibuses, more commonly known as black taxis, filled the service gap between the need for urban transport and the capacity of the State system. It remains unfortunate that the taxi industry and its entrepreneurship has not been fully integrated into our mainstream economy and troubled with violence that leaves these same communities they had served for decades, further vulnerable and depressed.

The biased approach that undermines this industry, generalised them as criminals rather than businessmen and women, whilst entrepreneurs in their own right, in an act of injustice and criminal by itself. We condemn acts of violence and intimidation aimed at ordinary citizens, vulnerable children and women who fell victim in this sketch. The disregard of this Provincial Government of the taxi industry and the combat warthog of J P Smith in the city, is reflective of the DA position towards a predominantly black-owned and run industry. Whilst they, through Golden Arrow Bus Service are happy with the subsidies of R1,4 billion, the taxi operators are treated like children with a carrot and stick approach through the Blue Dot.

Again, we call for the continuing rollout of the Red Dot in providing transport to clinics and day hospitals for our elderly and the disabled, but this, too, has fallen on deaf ears. Again, we have called for the development of a rural public transport system in order to revitalise the rural economy and rural towns, and again, this proposal has fallen on deaf ears.

Another historical fact is that townships have lived and provided for their livelihoods through illegal bars or shebeens run out of matchbox houses, providing a much needed social and often, political venue. Spaza shops were all run from homes and serve as small scale convenience stores integrated into the township landscape. The poor and inadequate response by the municipalities in the province, especially the City of Cape Town with its draconian enforcement strategies, led by the same J P Smith, to informal traders, unreasonable permit renewals and requirements of licenced liquor traders, let alone exorbitant fees for zoning, bylaws that are seemingly far removed to what these spaces and geographies are, at most, predicated on suburbia special design and demands.

The Provincial Strategic Plan 2019/2024, not the PERO nor the MERO, does not mention spaza shops and we have no idea how much this industry contributes to the Western Cape economy because this Provincial Government is not interested in acquiring such data, let alone even the positive growth which was registered during COVID-19 of the informal sector. Such is leaving this particular Provincial Government silent on the issue of the informal economy.

Again, we calculate the burial societies and the funeral insurance. This industry was valued to be worth R25 billion in 2014 in Gauteng. Again, we have no reliable data on the industry from the Provincial Government. We shall be putting a private member's note ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please finish up, hon member.

Ms N D NKONDLO: ...on the township economy. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You are on borrowed time now. You must try and round up. Thank you. [Interjections.] I now give the hon Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER FOR FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you very much, hon Chairperson, hon members. Thank you very much hon Nkondlo for sponsoring this very important debate.

Just this week, we heard the news that South Africa's economy contracted by 0,7% between Quarter 1 and 2 of this year, largely attributed to the ongoing and crippling loadshedding and the impact of the KwaZulu Natal flooding. This regression is, indeed, devastating news for many South Africans who hope for a better tomorrow, especially after the very two difficult years that have just passed following the COVID-19 pandemic.

Hon Chairperson, I hope the news this week serves as a wakeup call, loud and clear, that we need major, bold reforms to get South Africa's economy growing again. We do not have the luxury of time. The reality is that South Africa is at a fork in the road, facing significant challenges including high unemployment, loadshedding, elevated public debt service costs, along with rising inflation and interest rates. This is worsened by high levels of

corruption and the consequences of years and years of State capture and mismanagement of the country's economy nationally.

In the Western Cape, we have not been insulated from the policy decisions that have been made at the national level. Our growth rates have largely mirrored national trends, although performing better. We do, however, welcome that in the 1st Quarter of 2022, our GDP exceeded the 1st Quarter of 2020, representing an expansion compared to pre-pandemic levels. The Western Cape also has an overall higher labour force participation rate than South Africa and at the end of last month, I welcomed the news that 46 000 jobs were created in our province over the last Quarter. This is an increase from the 37 000 jobs created in the previous Quarter on Quarter reporting period. This higher labour force participation rate means that we have more people looking for work in the Western Cape, which is an indicator that job seekers who had given up looking for jobs during the pandemic, are now in search again.

Overall, the Western Cape maintains the lowest expanded unemployment rate in South Africa, according to the latest Quarterly Labour Force survey. While there are some promising signs emerging, it is clear to me that we need to do more to match the increasing demand in the Western Cape, and we are determined to do so. To be clear, just recovering to pre-pandemic levels is not good enough. We want to achieve breakout economic growth, delinking our province's growth rate from that of the rest of the country. And to do this, we need to enable the private sector to grow and succeed, so that they

can get on with their job of creating jobs.

And as part of the private sector, SMMEs including informal and township businesses and entrepreneurs – lots and lots of entrepreneurs – will be critical to achieving this objective. Recently published statistics estimate that there are around 30 to 40 businesses per thousand people in townships.

An article from *Business Tech* quotes:

“FNB is saying that this translates to around 800 000 to 1 million businesses across South Africa.”

Another financial institution, Investec, estimates that approximately 17% of employment in our country, is through the township economy. The Department of Coffee and Estratweni Mobile Foods are some fantastic examples of the more famous township businesses helping to grow their local economies in the Western Cape. These businesses provide products and services tailored for the needs of the local communities in which they serve and are set up. In addition, township businesses offer and provide immediate accessibility.

It is for this reason that the Department of Economic Development and Tourism supports small businesses, including small businesses in townships across the province. Firstly, our dedicated Red Tape Reduction Unit works with businesses across sectors and across Government, as well with other levels of Government to remove barriers that emerge for these entrepreneurs.

This Unit has been able to maintain a success rate of 93% for the last financial year and we are working hard to improve this even further.

This Unit continues to support efforts to bring services and information closer to businesses, especially in township communities. They have done this by translating all informational material into the three official languages of the province and the information is freely available at various community centres and business incubators in marginalised communities. Creating an enabling environment for SMMEs to succeed, also requires providing positive support to businesses so that they can grow and succeed.

It is for this reason that we have the SMME Booster Fund which aims to enhance the sustainability of rural, township-based youth, people with disabilities and women-owned SMMEs based in our province. So far, this Fund has supported over 386 township-based businesses from areas such as Mbekweni, Kayamandi, Idas Valley, Khayelitsha, Gugulethu, Dunoon, Macassar, Philippi, Delft, Kwanokuthula and Zwelitsha, to name a few.

With the COVID-19 pandemic impacting on small businesses in particular, the Western Cape Government's COVID-19 Supplier Development Programme was another intervention that worked to increase capacity and the ability of micro-enterprises, who manufactured cloth masks, sanitisers, and other kinds of products. The programme was supported by 11 businesses which sustained 71 jobs, including in areas such as Mitchells Plain, Diazville and Seawinds,

Another way in which we can provide support to SMMEs is by making it easier to do business with the Western Cape Government itself, which spends billions in procurement each year. The Provincial Treasury has established the Procurement Client Centre, which is based in Century City – which I hope the Committee will be able to visit soon – offering a range of services to small businesses to help improve the ease of doing business with Government. They help and guide suppliers, many of whom are SMMEs, through the tender process and assist suppliers with the registration on the National Treasury's Central Supplier Database, as well as the Western Cape Supplier Evidence Bank. This service often makes the complex environments a little bit easier to navigate.

Provincial Treasury has also recently gone live with an innovative user-friendly platform or dashboard, which allows businesses to filter information specifically to access all departmental procurement plans for the 2022/2023 year. These procurement plans include roughly 4 000 tenders in the current financial year. This functionality will help suppliers, which include small businesses, to access and plan for future tender opportunities.

In conclusion, hon Chair, we know that if we want to achieve breakout economic growth that drives job creation, we must enable and support SMMEs across all sectors, including the township and informal economies. We must cut red-tape and provide the support that is needed to ensure that every single entrepreneur has the opportunity to succeed in South Africa, no matter who they are or where they were born. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now call on hon Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, hon Chairperson. Sorry, for a second. We have got loadshedding here. Alright. More than 70% of the Western Cape economic activities are concentrated within the City of Cape Town alone, whilst there is little or almost nothing done to boost our economy in other regions in the province. Communities in the regions such as the Central Karoo and elsewhere, experience high levels of unemployment, poverty, and live in squalor conditions without any assistance from the Provincial Government. Most municipalities in those areas rely heavily on traffic fines in order to generate revenue into those municipalities, which is still not enough.

Following the effects of the COVID-19 pandemic on the South African economy at large, there are expectations of the economy to positively pick up the City of Cape Town within the tourism sector, which continues to show great potential. However, the same thing cannot be said about the township economies. Whilst township economies boost a great potential to eradicate unemployment, poverty and inequality, there is no investment into these economies either from the Provincial Government or the private sector or coupled with a lack of infrastructure development.

Whenever people from the townships try to operate small business, their stock gets confiscated by the law enforcement officials due to lack of operating permits. And whenever they apply for those permits, they

experience all kinds of red tape measures. The City of Cape Town charge e-hailing drivers, exorbitant amounts of money when they are applying for operating permits and make them wait for years before getting those permits. Another way of making money by the City of Cape Town is to impound vehicles of e-hailing operators.

Nothing is being done to transform the Western Cape agricultural sector, which continues to be dominated by white people, with black people only accounting for less than 2%. The Department of Agriculture in the province is not doing anything to transform this sector, with its MEC actually doing everything to please whites in maintaining the status quo.

The Pick 'n Pay Spaza shop Modernisation Programme is nothing but a failure, which left those who participated swimming in deeper debt. This is so, despite Government telling us that the initiative is a success. However, before the end of 2023, there will be no spaza shop left which was part of the programme. It was just a scam. For the economy of this province to prosper it will require leaders with greater ideas who will advance the economy into greater heights and eradicate poverty and unemployment ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: [Inaudible.]

Mr M XEGO: Thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Hon C Murray.

Ms C A T MURRAY: Thank you very much. I will begin now. The role of Government should not be to overly regulate or create unnecessary red tape for business, but rather it should be to listen to the needs of businesses and respond by unblocking bottlenecks faced, while promoting the ease of doing business. Supporting local businesses, particularly those based in townships, is vital if we are to overcome the inequalities that have resulted from our cruel past and which have been exacerbated by State Capture.

This inequality is painfully clear and plays itself out in increasing homelessness, joblessness, spatial segregation and limited access to resources and services, which we see across the country. The solution, however, rests in our ability to support the township economy so that it can create opportunities. The township economy is robust, dynamic and a competitive space. You need only visit Dunoon where in Dumani Street, you can see the bustle of local shisanyamas, as well as the local taxi rank, or you can walk around Mnandi Street where you can feel a constant buzz pulsating around the nearby Shoprite, the barber shop, the salons, and recycling business.

Despite the many socio-economic challenges within our townships, the township economy is unapologetically innovative. In the heart of Khayelitsha, Annette Skaap has opened Khayelitsha's very first luxury hotel, the Spade Hotel and Spa. Annette Skaap's hotel is an example of what can be achieved if we support township business, rather than hindering it through over-regulation. This is because well run businesses, particularly in historically disadvantaged communities, help to create jobs. They further

help to enable communities to put food on the table, to provide good education to children in that community, to buy homes or leverage assets and to even start further businesses.

An example of this, despite the ANC's discontent, is the Market Store Project which was formed in public/private participation with Provincial Department and Pick 'n Pay. The Market Store Project focused on the establishment of mini-supermarkets, and it worked to improve infrastructure in the township retail sector. The Department provided financial assistance to the tune of half a million rand, to qualifying beneficiaries to refurbish, as well as set up their Market Stores.

This partnership enabled Ms Dike, the owner of Thembi's Market, to start a Pick 'n Pay Market Store in Langa. She started her business on 28 August 2022 and employed a total of ten people, generating a significant monthly revenue of R426 000 for June 2021. According to the March budget process, Thembi's Market received R750 000 from DEDATs and almost R1,7 million leveraged from the private sector. When visited by the Standing Committee, she explained that she started the Market Store to support herself and her children. This clearly demonstrates that by supporting the township economy and not overly regulating it, we are, indeed, providing more opportunities, particularly to those who need them most.

This sector has immense potential, but requires further support not only from Government, but from the private sector as well. An example of this is the

Bitcoin Ekasi in Mossel Bay. Bitcoin Ekasi is using the well-established Surfer Kids MPO to create a bitcoin economy within the local township, through the already well known MPO. They do this by equipping the surfing coaches with knowledge on how to use bitcoin and providing them with a salary so that their learners are able to access food through payments of bitcoin.

Supporting a township economy is critical, given the number of people who depend on it. As the hon Minister Wenger highlighted previously, Investec estimates that 17% of the country's total employment comes from the township economy. Statistics SA also estimates that there are approximately 40 businesses per 1 000 people townships and according to FNB, that translates into approximately 1 million township-based businesses in the country.

The state of our economy demands that each of us do everything in our power to support and empower all business. While the ANC's approach to the economy is to bog it down with laws and regulations that make doing business difficult, the DA-led Western Cape Government works to prevent this and even incentivises successful businesses to become a part of the formal economy. We do this through interventions which include incubators, the Red Tap Reduction Unit, the SMME Booster Fund, to name a few.

I choose to believe that each of us in this House would want to live in a South Africa which has more opportunities and where businesses, particularly

those in townships, are given every opportunity to flourish. That is why I hope for and welcome a robust debate today, and during future committees, ensuring that we truly do support the township economy and create more opportunities for those who need them most.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: We are now moving to hon August.

Mr S N AUGUST: Thank you, hon Chairperson. Based on hon Minister Wenger's speech, very informative speech and I would like her to email her speech me, I therefore withdraw my speaking time. Thank you.
[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay ...[Interjection.]. We move on to hon Christians. [Interjections.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Chairperson and thank you, and I welcome this debate today. [Interjections.] Hon Chairperson, according to the ACDP, we believe that small business is the solution to radically reduce unemployment, and not big business. The township economy plays an integral part when it comes to reducing unemployment. The question that we can pose: what makes township economy so special? When you hear communities saying, 'local is *lekker*', but in the township we say, 'local and *lekker*', meaning everything is a local content and tasty and delicious.

Hon Chairperson, hon Minister Wenger mentioned that there are two

businesses that I also saw, the Department of Coffee. It was started by three young men in July 2012, with a vision to change the coffee culture in the townships. But hon Chairperson, even they in 2016, the Department of Coffee, this business was robbed and vandalised in 2016, and yet they thrive. There is another business mentioned by Estratweni Mobile Foods, a small business that was started with one person borrowing R200 loan from her sister and now, they bake and sell muffins in the early hours of the morning from half past 5. That must be commended.

But hon Chairperson, what I want to say is when we look at small business, small business in townships especially, are threatened by robberies, threatened by vandalism and I want to say, hon Chairperson, that I want to agree with what the hon Premier said this morning: Minister Cele must implement the Western Cape Government's latest policing needs because one of the policing needs mentioned was the continued skew policing resource allocation, especially in poorer neighbourhoods.

So, hon Chairperson, just in closing, loadshedding plays a huge part in crippling our small businesses and loadshedding should come to an end. And I hope that soon, the Western Cape ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may conclude, hon member, your time is up.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you. Thank you, hon Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I now call on the hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Chairperson. Hon Chairperson, local economies are the heartbeat of our cities, our towns, our villages, and our neighbourhoods. It is thousands of individual engine rooms that when combined, represents the economy of South Africa. Get it right and you will prosper. Get it wrong and you will suffer.

As a government, we need to ask what we can do to create an enabling environment for our people to have a safe and dignified existence in their communities. How can we help these individual engine rooms in our communities, to run at an optimal level? From a Local Government perspective, basic services are the starting point: water, sewerage, electricity, refuse removal. These aspects, if managed properly, contribute to a living environment that is clean and safe. It helps to create streets and neighbourhoods that are inviting and where communities can connect and build dignified lives.

According to national reports, the Western Cape is doing well in terms of local government service delivery to its residents. The National Household Survey states that the Western Cape is the leading province in South Africa providing basic services: water 97% of our households; electricity 98%; sewerage and sanitation 97%, solid waste management 97%. The Auditor-

General states that the Western Cape is the leading province in terms of financial management and reporting, with 27 out of 30 municipalities either clean or unqualified audits. The Department of Water and Sanitation, in its Blue Drop Report, states that the Western Cape is the leading province in providing clean and safe drinking water. The same Department, Green Drop Report, states that the Western Cape is the leading province when it comes to the management of wastewater. Western Cape municipalities are paying Eskom for electricity. The four municipalities that are behind are being supported by my Department and our Treasury, to put plans in place to make payment arrangements with Eskom.

Hon Chairperson, taken together, these basic services create an environment that attracts investment from the private sector. Investment creates jobs and people that can provide for their families, create dignity and a sense of purpose and a belief in the future for our people. In the Western Cape, we go further. We currently have 32 Thusong Centres, 22 permanent and 10 mobile, that house government services under one roof, making it accessible to people who struggle to commute from one Government building to the next, for services.

Our Inclusionary Housing Programme is addressing the way in which we balance inequalities in housing opportunities, while at the same time encouraging densification of residential areas. Our AC programme uses planning and design to create safer and healthier living and working areas, through intelligent design.

Hon Chairperson, but if you walk the streets in our poorer communities and if you spend time with the people trapped in poverty and unemployment, and you listen to their struggle on a day-to-day basis to survive, you will know that we have got more work to be done. Why are we still experiencing poverty and unemployment in our communities?

Hon Chairperson, the ANC Government has since 1994, systematically destroyed the institutions meant to build our country. The ANC has destroyed our State-Owned Entities, such as Eskom and Transnet. Every day, we hear about more corruption being exposed. Earlier this week, Mkhize DG of the Office of KZN Premier, was arrested for intimidating the Chairperson of the Water Board. Hon Chairperson, that is why taps are running dry in ANC municipalities. Not because there is no water, but because the water is being stolen. Brian Molefe, the wonderchild of the ANC, who was at one stage mentioned as a future Minister of Finance for South Africa, was arrested this week for his involvement in Transnet and Eskom.

Hon Chairperson, why do South African people struggle with loadshedding and public transport? Eskom and Transnet used to be excellent organisations. What change is the arrival of the ANC Government? The ANC allowed and supported the looting of and the destruction of the entities such as Eskom and Transnet. Hon Chairperson, in the same manner that Eskom and Transnet have been destroyed, the management of local governments in South Africa has been destroyed where the ANC is in power. [Interjection.]

Hon Chairperson, even the Auditor-General is frustrated. Only 16% out of the 257 municipalities in South Africa can manage their finances. This is only 41 municipalities. It means that 216 municipalities in South Africa are stealing money and for services from our people. Hon Chairperson, after 41 municipalities who are accountable, 27 of these municipalities are in the Western Cape and remember, there are only 30 municipalities in the Western Cape. Hon Chairperson, who oversees the three municipalities that cannot account for their money in the Western Cape: Laingsburg, Kannaland, Beaufort West? All ANC-run municipalities. [Interjections.]

Hon Chairperson, in municipalities where there is sound and stable management, you will find private sector investment which would lead to job creation with a healthy economic base ...[Interjection.]

†Die TYDELIKE VOORSITTER: Jou tyd is op.

[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Your time is up.] hon Minister.
[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...that Government can support and protect the vulnerable members ...[Interjection.]

†Die TYDELIKE VOORSITTER: Jou tyd is op.

[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Your time is up.] [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...of our communities. Thank you, hon Chairperson. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please round up, hon Minister. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, I am very allergic to noise and howling. Please, if you can just do it orderly when you do it. [Interjections.] Hon Brinkhuis?

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you very much, hon Mvimbi, Chairperson. It is so nice to see you in that position. The ANC will rule the Western Cape very soon again. Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

We all agree that township economy is vital to the economic growth of any city. A thriving township economy will add to combatting unemployment, inequality, and poverty as the topic of today's debate suggests. Can this Provincial Legislature verify where the ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Six farms and suddenly was a very successful businessman, but he was keen to retire and to plant this garden.

...[Interjection.]

Mr G BRINKHUIS: There is some noise. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Brinkhuis? [Interjections.]

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Yes? [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: We cannot hear you. You have cut off. But do not worry, we have stopped the watch. You will not lose your time. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: ...has taken this from America on the ships ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Can you hear us?

Mr G BRINKHUIS: I can hear you, but ...[Interjection.] there is some noise in the background. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please continue, we can hear you.

An HON MEMBER: When they got here ...[Interjection.]

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Can this Provincial Legislature ...[Interjection.] There is

some noise in the background, hon Chairperson. Okay, now it is fine. Can this Provincial Legislature verify whether sufficient and efficient oversight is done at municipalities whose enterprise and skills development initiatives should be directly aimed at and address the challenges that indigent communities face? Do they help to equip small business? Do they support these small businesses through their chain management?

We cannot only focus on incubators' catering services, waste removals. There are upcoming entrepreneurs in manufacturing clothing, stationary, toilet papers, covers for manholes, who are deliberately being overlooked by supply chain management at municipalities, hospitals, education departments, traffic departments and the list goes on. How many of these institutions buy local from entrepreneurs in their local municipality? Local municipalities and other State organs must set the precedent by supporting local entrepreneurs. I thank you, hon Chairperson, and may the ANC rule the Western Cape very soon. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: [Interjections.]

Mr G BRINKHUIS: It will be nice to see you in that position. Thank you. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No, hon Mr Brinkhuis.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: [Interjection.]... hon Brinkhuis and also

for being generous on your time. We now go to hon Marais, the former hon Premier of the Western Cape. Hon Marais? Okay, and then we move to hon Dan Plato, the former Mayor of the City of Cape Town ...[Interjections.] I am teasing. [Laughs.]

Mr D PLATO: Hon Chairperson, just a message to hon Brinkhuis, with his ruling request and suggestion. With corruption and with loadshedding, that is how we want it. [Interjections.]

Hon Chairperson, I am glad that this debate has been moved in the House today, improving the status of our economy is and always has been a top priority of this Government. We, in the DA, have a firm vision of empowered and rich citizens who are able to make the life they deserve with the support of their Government. At least we look after the poorest of the poor, something you cannot do because you steal the money of the poorest of the poor. [Interjections.]

For many of our citizens, the township economy is where this vision will start. Already, so many people ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Plato? Hon Plato? Hon Plato, there is a point of order.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): A point of order, hon Chairperson. I do not like to do a point of order on the former Mayor because he has got that

stature, but just a point of order on the [Laughs.] on the hon Mayor, with deep respect. He is referring to you. Now, he is supposed to speak through you, hon Chairperson of the House. He cannot refer to ANC members as 'you'. He must speak through you as the Chair. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay, okay. We will correct that. [Interjections.] We will correct that. Hon Plato?

Mr D PLATO: Point taken. Already, so many people in this province demonstrated the ingenuity by establishing their own small and microscale businesses in their own communities. Hon Chairperson, we want to stand by these people and leadership in those communities. We want to give them the skills, the tools, and the opportunities they need to push themselves and their communities forward. That is what all of us want, must happen.

But before we can equip our citizens with these tools, we must create a baseline, a social security net, that ensures that the basic physical needs of the poorest of the poor are met. For us, that is of paramount importance. In many of our township communities, residents are confronted daily by hunger, the bonds of drug and alcohol addiction, and violence. After all, you cannot think of starting a business, gathering starter funds, or building a client base when many believe that is impossible.

It is in this way that this Government's efforts to improve the social wellbeing of its citizens, have definite economic impacts on the province's

poorest communities, as many of the previous speakers have indicated. When this Government spent R16 million on ensuring that disabled are cared for. It is investing in a more skilled, more competent workforce when it acts to find jobs for the homeless and provides family support at its shelters. It boosts the economy by getting the most vulnerable employed and economically active, and much, much more should be done. But, hon Chairperson, uplifting the poorest and most vulnerable, should be a goal in itself. By doing so, also has a profound impact on the upliftment of society from the grassroots level and the economic wellbeing of our province.

This Government has brought its services into the heart of communities that needs them and continue to do so, regardless of circumstances. When a public building in Julius Tsolo Street in Khayelitsha closed in July, the Department of Social Development did not stand idly by, as SASSA did. They made sure that their services were not interrupted, seamlessly moving into new premises, and ensuring no interruption to their services. The City of Cape Town then ensured that SASSA had a place to go. This is because our leaders in this province are obsessed with solving problems in real terms, in ways that matter to the citizen on the street.

Hon Chairperson, things are tough for our citizens, but we want to do more than keep them trapped in poverty, scrapping together a meagre existence on grants and low paying jobs. We want to give our citizens the tools they need to realise their path from poverty and that starts with mitigating the effort, the effects of poverty and social ills here and now. And hon Chairperson,

that counts for this whole House. All of us, we need to put our political issues aside and not play politics with peoples' lives, with the poorest of the poor. That is for the ANC, DA, and whoever in this House and we owe it to the poverty-stricken communities out there. They need our assistance, and they need it right now.

I am confident that this Government is doing everything in its power to do so and I look forward to seeing the results of this hard work over the years to come. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Plato. You have been very generous on time. We are now going to hand over to hon Bans. [Interjections.]

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Chairperson. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: We have indicated that. Hon members, I did indicate that while hon Dugmore was outside, I am very allergic to howling and noise. Please try and keep it. [Laughs.]

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Chairperson. Hon Chairperson, before I address the House today in this debate, I must as a young woman, condemn the actions made by the National Leader of the Democratic Alliance, describing his former wife as a roadkill and a flat chicken. [Interjections.] Yet, what is really shocking is that hon Mr Steenhuisen has not been taken to

task by his party and we have heard nothing from the women in the DA to express their contempt for such remarks. Again, this confirms a misogynist culture within the DA. The DA thinks nothing of women and therefore, they can use sexual harassment as a political tool in their factional battles. I just thought, hon Chairperson, I must raise this today ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER FOR FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Point of order. [Interjections.] Hon Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: There is a point of order, hon Bans.

Ms A P BANS: Hon Chairperson?

The MINISTER FOR FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Hon Chairperson, I raise on a point of relevance to the debate topic. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay. [Interjections.] *Ja*, okay.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): That is ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Continue, hon Bans. I have taken note of that. Please do not repeat that then. A point of relevance must not be repeated. It must not be repeated, so continue. [Interjections.]

Ms A P BANS: Hon Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You have got an? Is there another point of order, hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No hon Chair, that interjection from the hon MEC further proves the disdain that the Democratic Alliance has towards cases when its leaders ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER FOR FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: That is not a point of order, hon Chairperson.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...undermine women in their party.

The MINISTER FOR FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: The hon member is out of order.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...it further points to that, hon Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon. Can we, hon members, allow the hon member to continue with her speech?

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Chairperson. I hope communities are watching that women are not standing with women on relevant issues and

measuring it as irrelevant, just ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER FOR FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Point of order, hon Chairperson. The Rules require us to stick to the topic and the hon member is decidedly off topic here and she is now treading on casting aspersions based on a point of order which I am legitimately entitled to raise. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay, hon members, let me just explain something and thereafter, I am going to make a ruling on the matter. Now, you see on the point of relevance that is referred to in terms of the Rule and also casting aspersions to hon members, it refers to hon members of the House. Now, the person that was mentioned by hon Bans, is not even an hon member of the House, but be that as it may, hon members. Hon Bans, can you please continue with your speech and stick to the topic?

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Chairperson. Hon Chairperson, I also note as we are having a very important debate here today, I must say I take note of not seeing the hon Premier and hon MEC Meyer on such an important topic, that I think it is affecting them as one of our head leaders here on this topic. It also says a lot.

Hon Chairperson, the previous speaker, hon member Murray, was speaking on Market Stores ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: On a point of order, hon Chairperson?

Ms A P BANS: The hon MEC ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: On a point of order?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: That is hon – who is that? Hon August?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: No ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon August?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: No, Meyer.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Oh! Yes, yes, yes. Ja, hon Minister Meyer?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon House Chair. The hon member has now just referred that I am not in the House. I am on the platform hybrid. I have heard everything she said about me. Can she withdraw that statement please? Thank you. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay. Okay, thank you very much, hon Minister. We have taken note of that. You are present, but you are not in the House. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: But she must withdraw.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Which one? [Interjections.]

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, can we please allow hon Bans to continue ...[Interjection.]

Ms A P BANS: Thank you ...

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Proceed.

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Chairperson. Hon Chairperson, I just did not see the hon member in the House. Apologies for that. Hon Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, accepted.

Ms A P BANS: The hon Murray on the other side, was speaking on Markets here and it is actually a shame. Two were mentioned: Tembi's Market, and one in Mossel Bay. At this day and age, we cannot even account up to five. I think earlier, hon member Nkondlo was mentioning a number of Markets that are supported and they were in contradiction with what the hon MEC was giving here. So, I think for this day and age, it is actually a huge †skandaal,

[scandal] like they would say in Afrikaans. It cannot be like that. Even the more of Tembi. As we speak, she is left with a debt of close to R7,5 million from the Pick 'n Pay project. It cannot be that we are proud of mentioning something like that.

Hon Chairperson, the next month will mark exactly two years since the hon Premier stood up in this House to announce the Administration's Recovery Plan for the job economy. The ANC, therefore, finds it apt that today we debate the state of our provincial economy, two years after this announcement. After a devastating drought, even though the DA-led City of Cape Town was warned about the then upcoming drought in 2012 and after COVID-19, the ANC believes that fundamental and therefore, deliberate omissions were made in the last several years to alter cause and figures of unemployment, inequality and therefore, poverty in this province.

This Government services just a few privileged. Thanks for the recognising by the hon member Plato earlier in this speech. He said we need to do more. So, it means he is actually in agreement that it is only the few that are privileged that are getting service from this Government. Because of DA policy, our province is worse off today than it was before. The hon Premier's Recovery Plan for jobs and economy announced in 2020, because of a lack of political will and wanting to be a nice guy, the hon Premier and his administration oversaw the continuation of favouritism shown to big business and old money in our province. †Somlomo [Speaker], R9 million over COVID-19 was given to black farmers. The advertisement went out through

Casidra. It was withdrawn and it was said that it is going to all farmers. Today, ask yourself the question: where are those black farmers? How many of them have survived COVID-19 while the privileged ones benefitted? ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It is lies.

Ms A P BANS: Because of the DA ineptitude, inequality between whites and blacks in this province has risen. Hon Chairperson, when you land on the plane in Cape Town, you can just see the difference of inequality. You do not need to ask. When you drive on N2 from Nyanga to Clifton here, it is just admin, we do not need to see, but still today, we are living in denial of the realities. Because of the DA's laissez faire approach, the overwhelming majority of Coloureds and Africans continue to live in poverty, while unemployment continues to affect in the main, Coloureds and Africans.

While the DA may be denialist, we insist on being scientific and follow the statistics which confirm that race continues to characterise poverty, unemployment and inequality in our province and country. Two years ago, the hon Premier announced his job and economic Recovery Plan. We received the details five months later. Today, two years later and according to Stats SA in the latest quarterly labour force survey for the 2nd Quarter of 2022, the Western Cape led with the highest increase in unemployment in the country.

All other provinces in the country, except for the Western Cape and Northern Cape, saw a decrease in their expanded unemployment rate. While the Western Cape was only able to create 46 000 more jobs, they were far surpassed by ANC-run provinces, such as Gauteng, where employment increased with a creation of over 200 000 new jobs. Data does not lie. I agree with the hon Premier when he said that earlier. Limpopo created 126 000 new jobs in the 2nd Quarter. KZN 110 000 new jobs; Mpumalanga 85 000 new jobs; and even the Eastern Cape, which this Provincial Administration likes to speak despairingly of, created more than 50 000 jobs.

The Western Cape under hon Premier Winde, came in sixth place in creating jobs. Hon Minister Bredell spoke earlier of when you speak of people in the communities, we are living in these communities. We know their challenges; we know their struggles and it is not a matter of hearsay. We go back to them, or we sleep with them in the community. So, when we speak here, we do not speak of what we read in the book or what you find on data. It is what we are experiencing every day.

Speaking of transport, comorbidities were spoken about here. There is no planning even for rural areas. In a rural area, you must travel by using your own last monies for those that do not have money. They must use their last pennies moving just to Shoprite 160 kilometres, yet here in Cape Town, we still have the City to City. No subsidies for rural communities. The situation in rural areas gets even worse. According to the same quarterly's labour survey, discouraged job seekers in the rural areas increased by 61 000 people

between the ages of 15 and 64 in the last quarter. The metro saw a decrease of 2 000 discouraged jobseekers. In other words, as shown by the data, this Provincial Government is driving more people to the city instead of creating jobs in the rural areas.

The ANC has consistently highlighted how Provincial Government neglects the sector, which has been able to withstand all catastrophes in the last decade. The agricultural sector continues to be the most promising sector, but because of DA free market economics, neither of the hon Premier nor the then hon MEC for the Finance Sector, are deserving of mention in the SOPA and budget respectively. Because of DA free market economics, not providing more State intervention and support, the agricultural and aquaculture sector data tells the devastation of this neglect by the Provincial Government: 16 000 jobs lost in this sector in rural areas, yet the Premier's Recovery Plan for jobs and the economy of our province is ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Just finish your sentence, your time is up.

Ms A P BANS: ...yet the Premier's Recovery Plan for jobs and the economy of our province is shallow. And as the Safety Plan is weak, the Western Cape township revitalisation initiative launched in the last days of the hon Premier, being then MEC for Economic Development and Tourism, the Western Cape was finally ...[intervenes]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms A P BANS: ...catching up with Gauteng, who launched their Township Economic Revitalisation Plan five years earlier.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms A P BANS: The result today speaks for itself. In the last Quarter, the ANC-led ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bans, thank you very much. The time is up. The Table staff have let me know. Thank you very much. [Applause.] I now recognise hon Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Sorry, my laptop battery went flat, but I have got it in my head. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker and thank you for hon Bans for that last 40 seconds of your speech because I must say, it was probably the most factual minutes that have ever been, contribution ever been given by hon members of the House.

But, you know, it was former Deputy Minister Gert Oosthuisen, Oom Gert, they used to call him. He said if you do not know how to cut, do not paste because if you did use all the numbers in your unemployment numbers – as I said, my laptop went off, but I am doing it from my head – I would have quoted you all those numbers from Stats SA figures. So, you did use some of

the right figures, but not everything on the figures. [Interjections.]

If you did use those figures, you would look at the expanded unemployment figures in the Western Cape, which by far is terrible in the country – it should never have been – which is by far the lowest in the country. Of the Eastern Cape, sadly, terribly so, which should never have been, 50% of the people in the Eastern Cape do not even look for jobs.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon members! [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Where in the Western Cape [Interjections.] we have got by far ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon members, order hon members.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: I have listened to the hon members. If they are allowed to listen to me then I will ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja, please let us just [Interjections.].

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Which is by far in the Western Cape the lowest in the

country. So, please quote all the figures when you quote unemployment figures. [Interjections.]

And then, the hon member asks for more names. I will give you more names: Nozinga Market, Ndwamba Market, Mbekweni Market, Nabe Market, Luzukile Market. So, there are five more that you asked for, hon member Bans, and Tembi Market, as you say. ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: And then, hon Nkondlo, thank you for opening the debate. You spent two minutes, as I counted, and 40 seconds on the definition of this debate. Of your seven minutes that you debated, you did not even bother addressing the core issues of the debate. So, let me contribute to your debate. [Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape and its DA municipalities have again demonstrated why good governance matters. The AG confirmed that a firm leadership role and strong controls of governance, as well as a competent workshop, contributed to our clean audits. Why is this contributed to our culture? A valid question by hon Nkondlo. Let me go to page 3 of my notes.

Look at Khayelitsha township versus Tembisa township. Good governance matters; clean governance matters. Tembisa township, hon Deputy Speaker, where Tembisa Hospital is, where it is governed by the ANC and let us start

with what happened in the last few weeks and let us first of all say: rest in peace, Ms Babita Deokaran, who was terribly assassinated in a township where she governed over the hospital administration called Tembisa Hospital, governed by the ANC. She was assassinated, terribly so! [Interjections.] Township ...[Interjections.] No, no, the township where you have a township debate. The debate, hon Deputy Speaker, the township is ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Tembisa where the hospital is based. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: She asked what does good governance matter? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon members.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Let me just explain to you how does it matter. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sit down please. Hon member, I recognise the Deputy Chief Whip. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Deputy Chief Whip? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Deputy Chief, what is your point of order?
[Interjections.] Hon members, one minute. Yes?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): In terms of Rule 40 and 42, I cannot hear the hon member and the hon member is even sitting next to me. If the hon members on the Opposition can just please be a little bit softer in their heckling then I will be able to hear the hon member who is actually sitting next to me. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Quite correct. Hon members, in terms of Rule 39, remember the loudness and I am also struggling to listen myself. [Interjections.] We are almost at the end of the debate. If we can allow hon Mackenzie to proceed. Thank you, you may proceed.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, she knows I did not blame the township people ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon members!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: The hon Nkondlo asked me question across the aisle, which I am responding to. Clean governance matters; good governance matters. Take two townships: Khayelitsha and Tembisa township, where the Tembisa Hospital is based. Terrible, under the ANC-led Government. The woman investigating township corruption in Tembisa Hospital was assassinated in the ANC [Interjections.] They cannot handle the truth.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon members!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Where they, the ANC Government spent R10 000 for a bucket. Half a million rand was spent on jeans, kiddies' jeans. That is how you develop townships. You use money, not for corruption ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon ...[Interjection.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...by developing townships.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, please take your seat. I recognise the hon Dugmore. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] I would like to ask whether the hon Mackenzie would take a question? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, you may proceed. [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Hon Deputy Speaker, I am responding to the hon members. So, those are facts. You do not have to like the facts, but you have to listen to them. So, when you develop townships like Khayelitsha and Tembisa, we do not steal the money. R850 million at Tembisa Hospital

...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...was stolen by the ANC and their cadres. [Interjections.] Not once did members of this House say: why are they spending R10 000 on a bucket that you can buy at the flea market for R40? They did not say that. That is the difference between the DA and the ANC. That is why our townships are busy developing. That is why in Khayelitsha and in Mitchells Plain ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...they have the most and the highest percentage of building plans that have been approved in the City, have been in Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon members!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: If you go to the new boutique hotel in Khayelitsha, they would not have that in Tembisa because they are stealing buckets of money. If you go to the new call centre in Mitchells Plain, there is a difference. None of these hon members, by the way, have visited the new call centre in Mitchells Plain. It is a disgrace. It is a disgrace.

The DA Government has allowed it – and the building plans are widely advertised, they have been approved by us – has allowed township development to take place. [Interjections.] The hon Xego says he has a problem at the moment with loadshedding where he is speaking from in the House, but why does he have a problem? In which municipality is he right now? Not in the City of Cape Town because we do not have loadshedding in the City of Cape Town. That is the difference between the ANC ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...and the DA. So, when you talk about development, hon members, you cannot develop where in townships where you then have no trains.

Last week, hon members, in a widely circulated clip, people standing with AK47s in broad daylight, shooting in townships. Where was Crime Intelligence? Why was the railway not functioning at Netreg? Because the ANC has destroyed rail in this country. Townships like Nyanga, Khayelitsha, Langa, Kalksteefontein, Mitchells Plain cannot develop without a functioning rail line. Who has destroyed rail? Who has mismanaged rail? Under whose governance has corruption taken place that a train station that is supposed to take people ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...to Khayelitsha, Nyanga, to develop the townships, cannot take place.

The hon member talked about rural development. Rightfully so. Hon member and from the Beaufort West, via you, hon Deputy Speaker, when last did you see a Trans Karoo in Beaufort West? When last did the hon member see the Trans Karoo in Beaufort West or Shosholoza Meyl? She has not seen it ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! I cannot hear.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...for the last two and a half years. [Interjections.] Why not? Because the ANC Government has destroyed long distance rail. So, when she talks about rural development, she must talk about ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...how did my party destroy the rail that Beaufort West, the beacon, the third biggest connection line in this country, does not even have a train station? It is a disgrace, hon members. [Interjections.]

And hon Marran was shouting, ‘Oh, Gayton McKenzie is doing this in Beaufort West.’ They do not even know that they are doing it on the ANC’s land. I had to alert hon Mbalula at the railway line here in Cape Town, Do

you know whose land they are building on, by the way?’ [Interjections.] He WhatsApped Leonard Ramatlakane who says, ‘Oh, is it our land?’ I said, †‘Jirre!’ [Lord!] This was a month ago. That is the patheticness of the leadership in PRASA, the destruction of what we see in our communities and out townships under the ANC. I am coming up to that.

The hon member talks about the taxi violence and the allocations, and how we treat it. We are probably the only government and the Blue Dot System, we are the only government in this country that during hard lockdown, that implemented the Blue Dot and the Red Dot system. Not one other government in this country did it. Which government did it? Which government did it? She cannot answer. That is the reality.

The allocation to Golden Arrow is done via national allocation. It has been set since time immemorial and since 1994. How the hon members can come here on 8 September to blame to the DA, is absolutely bizarre. It is bizarre. It is in the legislation by the ANC. They give us the money; we transfer the money. It is called a transfer payment. It is in the annual report. *Jissie!* Hon member, so when they talk about the rule of public transport system, I have dealt with that. So, there is nothing more to say.

The hon member talks about the MERO. Are spaza shops not in the ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: We do not use words like that because we respect the business people there. So, in the MERO: a simple Google search, hon member, which my colleague just did, shows 367 mentions of the word ‘informal economy’ ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Why? Because we respect those businesses. We do not use spaza shops ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: 367 mentions. That is what we do because we are a caring Government [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: So, township economies will flourish under the DA and not under the ANC. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. [Applause.] Hon members, that brings us to the end of the list of speakers and concludes the debate on this subject. That concludes the business for the day. Oh, thank you. Just one minute, please? May I thank hon Mvimbi for being the Chair.

I think he has finally understood what it means to be the Chair of the House.

Thank you, the Secretary will now end the meeting. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 19:08.