

---

THURSDAY, 8 JUNE 2023

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid Sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

**BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

The SPEAKER: Please be seated. Order, members! Before we proceed, I would like to remind members about some of the logistical arrangements.

As has been our practice to date, hon members will participate in the Sitting of the House both from here in the Chamber with the Presiding Officer and the Table Staff and via Microsoft Teams. Our Standing Rules have accordingly been amended to accommodate such hybrid Sittings of the House.

Hon members experiencing challenges in connecting to this Sitting are requested to contact the WCPP ICT colleagues who will assist to resolve their connectivity challenges.

The quorum requirements for this Sitting of the House are provided for in the Constitution and the Standing Rules. Unless there is an indication of unanimous concurrence, voting will be confined to members present in the House and on the hybrid system, who are entitled to cast their votes. Members present in the Chamber and via Microsoft Teams have all the privileges and immunities imparted by law.

Members who are considered out of order by the Presiding Officer will have their microphones muted and called to order. Hon members, the Serjeant-at-Arms has recorded members' attendance.

In instances, hon members, where these Directives do not cover a particular eventuality, the Standing Rules must apply. In instances where the Rules cannot be applied the Ruling by the Presiding Officer is final.

Members, all microphones have been muted. When an hon members in the Chamber wishes to raise a point of order, such an hon member may address the Presiding Officer, as expected, but must mute their microphones when they have completed speaking.

Hon members are requested to please ensure that the microphones are unmuted when the Presiding Officer recognises them, and, when they are done speaking, to please mute their microphones.

Hon members participating in this Sitting of the House via Microsoft Teams are requested not to sign in, into Microsoft Teams, on more than one device. The media have also been granted access to this MS Teams meeting as guests of the WCPP. However, I would like to remind members of the press that they may not use the chat room or speak or activate their cameras while the Sitting is in progress. I also request that all members that are here today in the gallery may not participate in the proceedings of the House.

For this Sitting, hon members, Language Translation Services are available in the Chamber, as usual, and on Microsoft Teams via the respective channels. Hon members, I would like to remind you that no interjections are permitted during the hybrid Sittings and to this end I would like to draw your attention to Rule 40 of the Standing Rules.

We will now deal with Questions as printed on the Question Paper, but before we do so I wish to advise, hon members, that once the hon Minister or the Premier has started to reply to the oral question as printed on the Question Paper, hon members must use the chat facility; for those on the online system, to indicate that they want to ask a follow-up question, and an indication by hand for those members in the Chamber.

There are four opportunities for follow-up questions, but the hon member who has posed the initial oral question as printed on the Question Paper, will have the first opportunity for follow-up to that question, and then the remaining three opportunities will be presented to the members.

With that being said, hon members, hon Deputy Chief Whip is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I do not know what to call it, but I am receiving messages from our members who are on the hybrid platform, indicating, and I also checked my email, that they did not get the Order Paper in their emails so it could be because of the technical glitches still as a result of the IT problems, so I do not know whether they can just check and the Team can maybe just look into that and maybe try to send that. Is it only us or ...[Inaudible \_20230608\_Sitting of the House\_Pickup 00:09:32] Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Chief Whip. I am just going to take guidance from the Table Staff. Thank you very much. I have been informed by the Table Staff that they will resend the Question Paper and Order Paper to all members. Hon Deputy Chief Whip?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, thank you very much. I know I am being a spokesperson for those outside and my apologies. I beg your indulgence.

I have also received a message now from a journalist asking whether there is a problem with the sound on the YouTube, a Media24 journalist. I just want to get a sense as to whether there is a sound problem and, if indeed so, to correct that. [unclear\_20230608\_Sitting of the House\_Pickup 00:10:34]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Chief Whip. I am just waiting for feedback on that. If the hon members can just give me one second to see if there are any issues with the connectivity or sound. I do not want to start with the first question, if the YouTube channel cannot be heard, so please just – I am begging for an indulgence.

Thank you very much, hon members. I have been informed that the IT Team is dealing with that. It will be a two to three-minute delay.

Hon members, my apologies, with your indulgence I am going to suspend the House for ten minutes just to ensure that the IT Team are able to fix the technical glitch. The House is suspended.

Business of the House suspended at 14:25.

Business of the House resumed at 14:30.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon members, and to the members on the virtual platform, my apologies for the technical glitch. I appreciate your indulgence.

Hon members, I am going to go straight to the Question Paper as our first item for today. Just for the interest of all members, Question 5 was withdrawn. That is Question 5 that stood over from Thursday, 25 May 2023.

## **QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

*[Question 5 standing over from 25 May 2023 withdrawn.]*

The SPEAKER: So, we move on to Question 5 from Thursday, 1 June 2023, so that is the first Oral Question. With that being said I recognise the hon Minister, Minister Maynier.

*Question standing over from 1 June 2023:*

### **5. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Education:**

*Whether the incorporation of Early Childhood Development into mainstream primary schools will be implemented; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?*

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Speaker. Attending an ECD programme is of course beneficial for the child's wellbeing but also more importantly, and I think this is possibly the reason that the member has put the question; the child's academic development, or as a colleague of mine likes to say, "getting children school ready."

So I would really like to thank the member for raising this matter and the idea of integrating Early Childhood Development Centres into our schools is certainly something that we can consider. But the ECD landscape, as the hon member very well knows, is relatively new for our Department and very complex and it is for that reason that this time we are working with the World Bank to plot a way forward for the sector in terms of both improving access but also improving quality care of Early Childhood Development in the Western Cape.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise hon Christians, hon Sayed and hon Baartman, in that order.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: (ACDP) Thank you very much, Minister, for that reply. Just, you know, a Census was done last year and then the Basic Education Minister said that there are 42 000 Early Childhood Development schools in the country and 1,4 million of children attend those schools, but there is always a problem when it comes to appropriate books, so what is the situation in the Western Cape and also that 40% of these schools do not have flush-toilets. A person is saddened when you hear about a child dying at an Early Childhood Development Centre and this happened this week where a baby died in Bonteheuwel, an eight-month-old baby died in Bonteheuwel. The child got to hospital and there was nothing wrong with the child the morning when he left school. The child's name is Mohammed Canterbury, so that is the concern.

So, you know there are problems and it will just be easier to monitor if they moved into the primary school space. Thank you very much, Minister.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Before the hon Minister responds, just the fourth opportunity is hon Cassiem on the virtual platform.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon member. The hon member raises national statistics. I am not aware of the statistics in our province, but of course if the hon member wants further particulars, he is welcome to put a parliamentary question and we will, of course, then respond and provide him with a comprehensive reply. As the hon member says, I am aware that the young child passed away recently at a crèche in Bonteheuwel and we certainly extend our deepest condolences to the parents, to the family and to the friends.

I wish to assure the hon member that a rapid response investigation will be instituted into the applications of norms and standards at the crèche, but also I am aware that the matter is being investigated by the South African Police and the Department of Social Development is offering support to the family but I am sure that the hon member and the entire House join me in extending our condolences to the family and to the friends. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise hon Sayed.



The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and thank you to the hon Christians for a very relevant question and to the Minister for his response. He had spoken to the Bonteheuwel matter but my question speaks to both actually, to the mainstreaming as well as the conditions of some of the ECDs. We are facing a challenge, Minister, and I am sure the Minister is aware, various ECDs are not yet registered and they have not registered because they are failing to meet the compliance, and one of the calls that have been made on our oversight visits is that lots of these ECDs are not meeting compliance because of all the conditions, and those conditions are correct. They need to be there. We do not want a free-for-all, because otherwise we have situations happening, as what happened, but what is his Department doing to ensure that ECDs are capacitated in order to get to the level of compliance, so not necessarily the assistance when there are ECDs, that they should do, but the capacitation to assist them to get to the level of compliance. Has his Department thought of engaging NGOs who are already working with ECDs in communities to probably get them to assist and to support those NGOs with that. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed. I just want to remind members, you have one opportunity for one follow-up question. Minister, I am not going to dictate how you answer that, but over to you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Speaker. I think the hon member raises a very relevant question and as he well knows, the Department, the Social Service organisation and, of course, the relevant

municipality are jointly responsible for registering ECDs. The process of course, starts at the municipal level and as the hon member rightly points out, it is complex. It involves, for example, compliance in relation to zoning, land-use, building compliance, fire and safety compliance and environmental health and food preparation compliance, and, of course, it involves site visits and the issuing of certificates, but the Department is looking at how we enable ECDs to register and certainly this is a problem that the Department is focused on and we are working on how we streamline the registration process and are part of the development. I am sure the hon member would be delighted to hear, part of the development of a Registration Management System, which we believe will enable the registration of ECDs.

Certainly, his idea of engaging NGOs is something that can be considered and also, as I alluded to earlier, the complex process of registration is certainly a major part of the work that we are doing with the World Bank so that we can, as I said earlier, improve both access and the quality of Early Childhood Development in the Western Cape. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: You thank you very much, hon Minister, I now recognise the hon Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Speaker. To the Minister, I want to ask, with respect to the expansion of access to early learning and ensuring that our children are school ready; Grade R is an important school year and it is currently not compulsory at present, but what is the WCED

going to do to expand the access and investment within Grade R? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon Baartman. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you to the hon member for that question. I think we all accept that if we get the early school grades right, we can make an enormous difference in a child's development and, as the hon member says, Grade R is not currently a compulsory school year, but as we all know, the Basic Education Laws Amendment Bill, the BELA Bill, seeks to change the age of compulsory school attendance to include Grade R. Now of course, that, as we all know, is going to have massive funding implications and it is not clear at this stage whether National Treasury will make additional funding available. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Do you support the BELA Bill?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: But, nonetheless, nonetheless, we are taking steps to expand access to Grade R. [Interjections.]

We have, as hon members know, offered permanent posts to 500 qualified Grade R teachers this year, to retain their expertise in the system and we believe that that was a very important intervention. That intervention, as members of the Committee will know, will cost approximately R321 million over the next three years, which is a considerable additional investment in Grade R and early learning, but in addition to that, hon member, we are also

constructing 61 Grade R classrooms over the next three financial years, increasing the number of physical spaces for Grade R learners, and we believe that all this taken together will no doubt contribute to getting our learners, as you like to say, school-ready in the Western Cape. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister, I now recognise hon Cassiem on the virtual platform. Hon Cassiem.

Ms A CASSIEM (EFF): Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, with the incorporation of ECDs in mainstream primary schools, already looking at the current shortage of space for learners in primary and high schools, and who either have been placed on waiting lists or have to travel to another community to attend school, how will this Department ensure space for hundreds of young children, especially those in informal settlements and other unprivileged communities, who would need to be placed in registered ECDs as there is also a major lack of registered ECDs in such communities as member Sayed has said previously. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Cassiem. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon member, I think this is an important question. We all accept in this House that early learning is vital, but as I said in my introductory remarks, the early learning landscape is complex and it is precisely for that reason that we have engaged or are engaging with the World Bank to look at all these issues to consider how,

given the current fiscal constraints, we can improve both access and learning outcomes in the early learning environment in the Western Cape, so we are looking currently at all options as we engage with the World Bank, as I said, to improve early learning in the Western Cape.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon members, hon Minister, that brings us to the end of Question number 5 from 1 June 2023. We now move over to new Questions.

## **QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

The SPEAKER: Hon members, just for the sake of clarity to all members, Question 1 on the Order Paper for today has been withdrawn, so we move over to Question 2. I now recognise the hon Minister, Minister Mackenzie.

*[Question 1 withdrawn.]*

### **2. †Mnr D America vra die Minister van Mobiliteit:**

*Watter ondersteuning sy Departement aan munisipaliteite in die provinsie verskaf om plaaslike vervoerinfrastruktuur en -dienste te verbeter?*

### **2. [Mr D America asks the Minister of Mobility:**

*What support does his Department provide to municipalities in the province to improve local transport infrastructure and services?]*

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Speaker.

†Aan lid America, die Provinsiale Volhoubare Vervoerprogram (PVVP) is deur die Departement geïnisieer om die ontwikkeling en implementering van volhoubare vervoerstelsels in die Wes-Kaap te ondersteun. 'n Volhoubare vervoerstelsel is een wat billike en veilige toegang tot geleenthede fasiliteer; wat bekostigbaar is, ondersteun 'n lewendige, inklusiewe ekonomie; en beperk die impak op die omgewing.

Die Program het aanvanklik gefokus op hoe die Departement met plaaslike munisipaliteite in die provinsie, afgesien van die Stad Kaapstad, kan saamwerk om openbare vervoer en nie-gemotoriseerde vervoer in ooreenstemming met die Wet op Nasionale Landvervoer (Wet 5 van 2009) te kan verbeter. Die benadering is ingelig deur die lesse wat geleer is deur die implementering van die George Geïntegreerde Openbare Vervoernetwerk (GGOVN), wat deur die Departement gelei word. Met verloop van tyd het die program uitgebrei om ander provinsiale vervoerstrategieë in te sluit.

Die fokus is op verbetering van plaaslike vervoerstelsels in vennootskap met nie-metro-munisipaliteite, en met 'n fokus op openbare vervoer en nie-gemotoriseerde vervoer (NGV) in arm en gemarginaliseerde gemeenskappe. Dit sluit 'n inkrementele benadering tot die verbetering van openbare vervoer in wat lei tot vinnige en aantoonbare verbeteringe aan die gebruikerservaring, maar op 'n wyse wat die kapasiteitslas op die Regering verminder, die onmiddellike koste verlaag en die risiko van transformasie in die openbare

vervoerbedryf verminder. Dankie.

[To member America, the Provincial Sustainable Transport Programme was initiated by the Department to support the development and implementation of sustainable transport systems in the Western Cape. A sustainable transport system is one that facilitates equitable and safe access to opportunities, that is affordable, supports a vibrant, inclusive economy; and limits the impact on the environment.

The Programme initially focussed on how the Department could partner with local municipalities in the province, apart from the City of Cape Town, to improve public transport and non-motorised transport in line with the National Land Transport Act (No. 5 of 2009). The approach was informed by the lessons learnt through the implementation of the George Integrated Public Transport Network (GIPTN), which is led by the Department. Over time, the Programme has expanded to include other provincial transport strategic priorities.

The focus is on improving local transport systems in partnership with non-Metro municipalities and with a focus on public transport and non-motorised transport (NMT) in poor and marginalised communities. This includes an incremental approach to improving public transport that results in rapid and demonstrable improvements to the user experience, but in a manner that reduces the capacity burden on Government, lowers the immediate cost, and reduces the risk of transformation to the public transport industry. Thank

you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister Mackenzie. I recognise the hon America and hon Mvimbi and then hon Bans, in that order, please.

†Mnr D AMERICA: Baie dankie, Speaker. Baie dankie, Minister, vir u breedvoerige respons in antwoord op my vraag.

[Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, Speaker. Thank you, Minister, for your thorough response in reply to my question.]

Minister, I would like to ask you, in addition to the support that you provide to municipalities, what other support does your Department give to provide universal access mobility options to the residents of Western Cape? Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon America. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you. We also provide guidance to municipalities on the integrated transport services and on the universal transport service, I think all of us who stay particularly in the Metro know the Dial-a-Ride. The Western Cape Government provides support. In this final financial year we will be giving R10 million to the City of Cape Town to improve the Dial-a-Ride service for universal access in Cape Town.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Hon Mvimbi.



Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon Speaker, for those of us who reside in the rural areas like the Karoo, we know, for instance, that lack of poor transport and infrastructure are the only challenges. Accessibility of transport is a big issue. In reply to a question I posed to MEC Madikizela in April of 2021 he cited the National Housing Travel Survey of 2013, which showed zero percent of people use buses to commute. This has not changed and it is not because people do not want buses. It is because there are no buses for the people in the Karoo. I therefore wish to understand from the MEC what are the updates with regard to the implementation of the Provincial Sustainable Transport Programme, which aims to improve public transport across the Western Cape and when can we expect to see impact in areas like the Central Karoo?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mvimbi. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, hon Mvimbi. The Provincial Transport Integrated Programme is in the implementation phase. Part of that is the rolling out of the Go-George Bus Service of which the member is fully aware. When the service will go to the Karoo, at this stage I cannot tell you when buses will go to the Karoo, but I am sure working with my colleagues we can approach National Government in applying for the funding that was made available for the implementation of Go-George, to ensure that the Karoo gets the same service as Go-George. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Bans?

†Me A BANS: Dankie agbare Speaker. Agbare Speaker, [Ms A BANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker], my question to the Minister is what criteria are being used by the Department to determine the demand invested in municipalities for road infrastructure and what percentage is going to the City and what percentage is going to rural municipalities? Thank you, Speaker. [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: That is a bit too vague. [Inaudible.]  
00:38:35]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bans. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you, this is actually quite an easy question, member Dugmore. That question belongs to the Department of Infrastructure. Thank you. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. [Interjections.] Hon members... [Interjection.] Hon members, there is one opportunity left before I move on to the next question. There are no further questions?

I then move on to Question 3 on the Question Paper. Hon Minister Mbombo.

**3. Mr F Christians asked the Minister of Health and Wellness:**

- (1) Whether her Department has any measures in place to ensure that health workers are not lost to other countries; if so, what are the relevant details;*
- (2) whether her Department has any plans in place to upskill COVID-19 healthcare workers to ensure their integration into mainstream hospitals; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?*

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Enkosi.

Thank you for the question, member Christians, which is very crucial. The question about what measures are in place to ensure that health workers are not lost to other countries. If so, what are the relevant details; and the second part is about the COVID-19 healthcare workers.

On the first part, and noting that in terms of the legislation it is not compulsory to provide a reason for resignation for any staff, thus we cannot be able to accurately provide information why people leave. However, the Healthcare 2030 Plan, which was published in 2014, outlined a specific policy framework in order for us to create strategies in regard to their retention. Part of that is about recruitment and retention strategy, performance management, education and training, leading and managing change, employee wellness, occupational health and safety, sound labour relations and collective bargaining. I could actually send you that information. I think is also on our website.

In terms of specifically on the retention of the scarce skills, note this is not only for the Western Cape, across the country you have got the whole issue of the scarce skills. If you recall, when the Minister of Home Affairs firstly gazetted the list of the scarce skills, some of these were not included from the Health side, but now they have been added so it impacts for the whole country, for example, specialised nursing, pharmacy, clinical psychology, radiographic, prosthesis and orthotics, clinical technology, clinical engineering, forensic pathology and emergency care. That includes technicians and paramedics so it affects the whole country. So what are we doing in regard to that? The use of specialists to train staff in identified areas is what we provide in addition to the basic qualifications for the bursaries, which is, after, for example, for nursing after four years of their training at the Nursing College. One, we have to work back those hours in those years, so basically until four years. Similar with the medicine, all of those, but for scarce skills we give bursaries, like your advanced mental health, advanced psychiatry, midwifery, occupational health or the theatre, we provide as such.

The provision of relief staff to free up the individuals for training: it is difficult to reappoint other people, so it means that you have to pay Paul and pay Pauline to move staff across, mostly in the same unit, although in some instances you will find that there is reluctance. For example, I used to work in the midwifery and in maternity units during my time and then when they said that I must go to work in a medical ward, I used to scream and throw tantrums because my speciality was in the area of maternity.

Implementation of the occupational specific dispensation, which is the OSD, to provide better regulation to attract and retain staff, taking note with the OSD there has not been any national revision of that strategy, I think, until 2017, the tenures were expired. [Inaudible.] Even at the time, some of the categories were not taken care of, for example, clinical nurse specialists mostly where I belong, it has never been taking place.

Improving the working environment to retain talented staff and scarce skills, especially like in the area of emergency in the context where the Western Cape has got high levels of interpersonal violence. We need as many of the emergency staff in that area as possible.

Developing a reputation of being the employer of choice, and marketing the Department accordingly to attract staff, I think I have done as much as I could, which is I am still continuing to make sure that the Department of Health and Wellness becomes the employer of choice, and you see many people they say that they "we want to come here." Unfortunately, there is no money but when you look at the Piracy Culture Survey that we have conducted [Inaudible] it showed that the current staff that are here at least they espouse the values and they are happy in terms of where they are right now, using innovative ways to advertise posts, undertaking task shifting to free up existing staff and scarce skills to be optimally used, [Inaudible]

...which sometimes is a challenge when you are – especially in one discipline

and then, as I made an example to be asked to go elsewhere, but we will find that our staff sometimes are actually very flexible in that regard.

Also lastly, we do have a Provincial Nursing Strategy which is the first in the country that was developed then. To increase the supply of nurses, such as establishing an Integrated Nurse Training Framework, just making an example, we made sure that we have identified in the Nursing Strategy the critical skills within the disciplines of nursing. Plus also, what is the phased approach where we say this year we take more generally so that the College trains general nursing, and then in the second, the following year, we take more of the specialised nurses so that you have that kind of a balance.

Now in the last question related to the health workers, related to COVID, as everyone knows that every province or nationally or even with us, we contracted appointments of the health workers in relation to the COVID-19 funding, which ceased at the end of March 2023. No more COVID funding, which is not only the health sector, businesses, small business, they will tell you in terms of UIF where they receive money, schools they received additional resources where they have to open up for the school. So that money ended March 2023. There is no COVID money, and the people that were appointed at the time specifically for this, over the course of the pandemic, there were 319 staff who were employed in COVID-19 posts and also they were reemployed – the same staff – in other posts within the Department, including non-COVID posts, and 107 employed within the vaccination posts, were also reemployed. So 319, even although they are not

necessarily for vaccines and also for COVID, because by March 2023 there was not much of the COVID, but the funding ended at the end of March. So there are currently still recruitment and selection processes being conducted such as the Brackengate Intermediate Care Facility, taking note, in our 54 hospitals in the Western Cape and also in other facilities.

COVID interventions, including shifting beds, having additional beds and so forth, and adding staff, this was happening throughout. So the 319, they were not necessarily for Brackengate, they were across the province. So previously staff were contracted to the COVID-19 Field Hospital, but now it is an intermediate care facility. It is not the only one that was a field hospital, the City ICC and in George the Harry Comay; in Paarl, Cape Winelands the Sonstraal, and also additional hospitals, I mean additional beds and wards like in Vredendal, where we converted a boiler room and also in Hermanus where we converted a store room as part of it. I am just making an example of those. In Khayelitsha actually we had a field hospital as part of the Thusong Centre where together with the NSF we have appointed other staff through the COVID everywhere in the province, it is not only Brackengate. However, with Brackengate it is the one that we said let us go for the intermediate because it is part of the 2030 Healthcare Plan, intermediate care or transitional care where specifically in the Metro where you could be able to relieve pressures from acute beds like in the Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain, Eerste River, Karl Bremer Hospital for those patients, especially for terminal ill patients palliative care, where you will say: "Go home, terminal cancer, terminally ill, go home."

But now we could be able to say you still need to be cared for, especially for multidisciplinary, occupational health, for the physio and all of those as part of that.

Now it means that COVID is done. All other staff everywhere for COVID gone, gone, gone! Others we have been able to absorb everywhere. Now for Brackengate it was about its part of the intermediate care, so now it has and we also expanded, they extended their contracts from March into May, so that is where things are. So all staff within the employ of the Department have access to regular training as part of their development journey.

Owing to the shortage of staff being experienced nationally, the Western Cape has implemented several interventions to increase the supply of nurses. I did make an example about the Western Cape College of Nursing (WCCN) which is the first one in the country. You have probably been following up in terms of what has been happening with the colleges. That ended up actually being accredited by the Council for Higher Education and also for their professional board, the Nursing Council, to offer the Bachelors in the Nursing Sciences, plus also other certificates related to specialisation, whereas all others have been accredited. So we are trying as much as we can. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Hon Minister, hon Christians, and then I have hon Marais on the online platform and I have hon Windvogel and



hon Klaas and that is the end of the four opportunities.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, Speaker, and thank you, Minister, for that comprehensive answer, a very good answer. Just to tell and I think you know about this, that there is now a recruitment drive to recruit healthcare workers from the Western Cape specifically. The article that I have is that nurses with one or two years' experience and especially bedside registered nurses for one or two years, you have organisations, Visa Solutions Healthcare that comes in the province, wrap up our healthcare workers. Now that is a problem because you invest in those workers and then other countries, the US come and they take the cream of the crop. So I am glad that you said you are looking at all the things to retain our healthcare workers, but I think it is going to be difficult when the US comes and they take out their money, their cheque books and they cart off with our healthcare workers. So it is a difficult task, but of course you outlined what your Department is doing in order to retain your healthcare professionals here. So it is a big concern and especially if the Department has invested so much in nurses and then you lose them to the US. This one, this article was specifically talking about the US coming into the Western Cape specifically to recruit our healthcare professionals. So thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, and I like that you are not asking a question – we are having a debate – which is true, but

noting it is not the first time. I made an example about myself. In our first year group at the time at the University of Fort Hare for a Bachelor of Nursing Science, 40 at the time, I think probably there are five of us who are still in South Africa. The rest, they are all over.

So South Africa will always and actually has been attracting many of the countries who want to recruit South Africans. The majority is in the Middle East – actually the majority is in the UK and then the second most are in the Middle East. The whole of the [Inaudible.] they are there because we train the best, not only for nurses, actually for health professionals – physio, doctor and whatever, they are sought after because we have never compromised on the issues of skills, but our challenge in South Africa is that we do not have money to appoint them, yet we spend so much in training them.

For example, with the medical doctors we have got about 8 or 10 medical schools in South Africa; two here in the Western Cape. The production of those, even when they start with the internship, none of them we are able to absorb at once, once they are completed. You get doctors where for two or three months they are unemployed because we cannot be able to accommodate them – we talk about the internship – yet internship is a statutory body of the country, but it is because we have to pay them.

It is similar with the nurses. When I started here for nurses, even for the community serve, after they have done their four years qualification in the

universities, they have to do the community services – and we gave them bursaries, which they are supposed to pay back by working four years, but because we have to pay them you use the same salary because they are already professionals. We made arrangements with the Eastern Cape and the Northern Cape where we are providing these because they were also sought after.

So the challenge that we have is that we need them, all health professionals, we need them because our hospitals are full, they are short-staffed and the current ones that are working there are really exhausted, but the issue there is, there is no money to pay them.

I made an example of the 7,5% wage bill increase of the Department of the Service Administration agreement with the unions, through you, hon Speaker, it means that for us, for the Department, we need to be able to give away about R1,2 billion. We are not arguing that they do not deserve it, because they do deserve the increase, they deserve more than 7,5%, but remember this is a discussion that happens at the national level. From the health side, the National Department of Health does not own hospitals, they do not own health professionals, they do not own patients, it is the provinces.

So when they make these decisions, they do not consult with the provinces and the provinces are supposed now to take their existing monies and pay for these salaries. That is why we ask, we urge the National Treasury to pay back the money. That R1,2 billion equates to 2 362 of the posts that we need

to freeze in order to be able to pay that money.

So we need all of these health professionals, physios, occupational therapists, pharmacists, doctors, nurses, but they are being recruited outside and for most of them it is not about it is their choice to want to go overseas, it is because there is no job and some of them still owe several monies to the universities. Unfortunately that is the kind of situation, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. I now recognise the hon member Marais on the online platform.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Minister, your problem started way back before you were a parliamentarian. It started with your predecessor at national level, Minister Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma, who came with a policy of downsizing ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon ...[Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: ... right sizing. Now ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Marais, please just – there is a point of order. Please ...[Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Ag no.

The SPEAKER: ... just take your seat. Hon member Sayed, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Yes, Chair, on a point of order. Hon member Marais must be patient, he did not hear the point of order. We are not fighting. Can he speak through you, please, and not directly to the Minister. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Sayed. That is not a point of order. Hon member Marais, you may continue.

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Speaker, that is time wasting. I take exception. What we have here is serious stuff, it is health.

Now because of that downsizing we depleted a whole nursing component in the whole Western Cape for many years. Now we have another Bill coming here. When there is a shortage of health workers and nurses, they come with a Labour Equity Bill which gives race quotas per job, per level in any department. How is that going to affect you, hon Minister, healthwise? Will it lead to more layoffs, or will you ask National Government to exempt the health services, because it is an essential service, from the effects of the Labour Equity Law?

How can you train nurses if you cannot find nurses of a particular colour? Because there must be so many percentage Coloureds, so many percentage

Indian, White and Black. That is now the new Labour Equity Bill.

How are you going to prevent that from negatively affecting health, nursing staff in the next 10 years? Thanks.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Marais. Hon Minister, did you get the crux of the question?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: I think what is different, although we are the Department, we are part of the Government and any policy will impact on us, but when we talk about the coalface and also for service delivery, we are professionals. Like health is not a commodity, it is a human rights issue, and also it is scientific in regard to when you do the allocation of staffing, it is about the skills that need to respond to a particular disease, stroke, epidemiology in that area.

Just to make an example, it is about if in the southern part of the Metro the disease profile shows a high level of heart diseases, it means that the staff that you will be appointing in those facilities will be more of – if it is medical it is going to be more of the cardiologists. Whether a cardiologist is White or Black or green, for us it does not matter because when I say it is professionals, because we are bound by the oath and the pledges that we – there is no yellow diabetes or White hypertension or Black TB. A disease is a disease, irrespective of whoever deals with it.

So when we open up for the people to apply, just like in the case of Brackengate, where we say that now that we have closed off COVID and the money is gone, let us open up for the people to apply, including those who have been working in Brackengate, if they qualify to be able to render intermediate care, then they can compete.

So if you look at the Nurses Pledge, which I belong to, where it says that the patient is the first consideration and also you will never be deterred in terms of the matters of race, of nationality, religion, creed and so forth. So that is how we operate. So we do not have colours. Health is not a commodity.

So the EEE probably might apply on the issues at a very higher level, [Interjections.] but not necessarily on the issues of the coalface. Thank you very much. You can ask the question.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, the hon Minister. Hon members, I now recognise hon member Windvogel.

†Me R WINDVOGEL: Baie dankie, agb Speaker. Ek wil net agb lid Marais daaraan herinner apartheid was daar en dis 'n werklikheid en hy was een van hierdie wat voordeel getrek het daaruit en ek wonder nou net [Tussenwerpsels.] of hy die Minister van Gesondheid ook sien as 'n *refugee*. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Me R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Speaker. I just want to remind hon member Marais that there had been apartheid and it is a reality and he had

been one of these who had benefited from it, and I'm just wondering now, [Interjections.] whether he also sees the Minister of Health as a refugee. [Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, my question to the Minister, what is the number of healthcare workers in their respective occupations that we have lost to other countries during the Sixth Administration, and do we have any shortages of skills as a result of this? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Windvogel. Hon Minister. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you. I think I did mention that as a province, when people have been employed and then they are leaving our employment, there is no legislation that compels them to indicate why are they leaving.

Therefore I would not know how many of the health workers have left the Western Cape Department of Health and Wellness to go overseas because it is not a requirement. I would not know that.

However, just now to assist you. Because it is compulsory for them to register with a professional body, all our health professionals, be it nurses or whoever, the Nursing Council is able to locate those people who are not necessarily now registered to practice in South Africa. They are able to look at that and the agents who are recruiting those people going elsewhere, they



could be able to give that, but an employer will not be able to do that, to ascertain where they are going or whether they left for overseas or if they go.

Even if they go for the private sector, like next door they go to Netcare, we will not be able to know what was the reason, but we can pick up later that the person is coming back, whether through the PERSAL, like, "Oh, you were from the Western Cape," but we will not be able to know what is happening.

I did indicate through you, hon Speaker, to hon member Christians, that South Africa does have the issue of the brain drain, just like Africa has the issue of the brain drain. Most of it is not necessarily pull factors. I made an example that among our group at Fort Hare Basic and also when I went to Natal, KZN, some of the people that I went with, they are all over the world, not only in the UK or wherever, but what I am saying, anecdotal evidence shows that people do not leave South Africa because of the pull factors, they are chasing after the pound, after the dollar, after the whatever.

You will find that they are still dedicated to still work in South Africa, including doctors, everyone, but it is because of the push factors. It is not the pull factors, it is the push factors.

One is about the remuneration. Like in the case of the nurses you will find that you can study as much as you can, but you will not be able to get the salary that matches that, and the other part is about the conditions. When you ended up working in an environment, you want to check the blood

pressure, but you do not even have the BP machine, it causes moral injury, because how will you be able – like in the case of the North West where they were using boxes as a substitute for incubators because there were no incubators. Yes, there were 25 babies, I think so, I think that is what they said – I mean there 50 babies, 55 babies in a ward that has got 25 incubators. Where are they then going to put those incubators?

As a health professional, to save lives, it means that we have to improvise. So for them it is about they ended up having to use those boxes, but who is liable for that? It is us. When I say "us" I mean that us as the leaders or the managers in that context, that how do you make a health professional to go up to the level that you use a box because we have not been able to provide resources for such.

So it is mostly the push factors. The conditions are worse because you ended up now going overseas, also for your safety and because of the love of your profession, instead of just managing patients on the floor or in the cardboard boxes. Thank you, hon Chair.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister, and the last opportunity is hon member Klaas.

†Mr M T KLAAS: Enkosi, Mhali-ngamphambili. Speaker, ndifuna nje...umbuzo wam ukhona, kodwa ndifuna nje kuqala sithethe inyaniso. Babaleka, Minister, oogqirha. Oogqirha ebisinabo apha besibafumana eCuba.

Abo gqirha ke baseCuba bafundisile uthutyana. Uninzi ingxaki yethu nina niyafundisa kakhulu kodwa nibafune aba bantu ukuba mabasebenzile ngoba umnotho wenu umncinci gqitha. Kule ndaba yeCOVID akusikukuba bemtyiswa yimali. Babaleka, besoyika ukufa. Naze nina...ndiyayazi, ukhona ugqirha endimaziyo wayeka ukuba ngugqirha wemka. Ndingakubizela negama. Yayingugqirha wam. Now ngokubaleka kwabo, apho sizokukuxelela ingxaki kakuhle, nina nasebenzisa aba bantu benibafundisile. Basebenza. Ukusebenza kwabo nithe xa nibona iCOVID ukuba iphelile naba-rend as useless people that they cannot continue with the work. Yilo nto ngoku namhlanje sinibuza le mibuzo: Kutheni ningabaqeshanga? Kutheni uthi ngoku xa kufuneka ngoku besebenzile, uthi abaphumeleli...abakawlifayi...

[Mr M T KLAAS: Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, I have just one question, but I want us firstly, to speak the truth. Doctors ran away, Minister. A lot of the doctors we had we sourced from Cuba. These doctors from Cuba only taught here for a short time. A lot of them not only taught, but you wanted them to work hard as well because the economy is bad. With regard to Covid, they not leave because they were not being paid enough, they were afraid of dying. I know this because there is a doctor I know of personally who has left because of those reasons. I can even give you a name. He was my doctor. Now, as regards to them leaving, I will tell you what happened. You ended up using the people whom you trained. They worked. After they worked and COVID came, you started rendering them as useless people that they cannot continue with the work. That is why we are asking you these questions. Why did you not employ them? And why to you now deem them unqualified when

you need them to do their work?]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Klaas, I do not want to disrupt or interject you, but this opportunity is for you to pose a question. So I have allowed a lot of latitude ...[Interjections.]

†Mr M T KLAAS: Yes, ndifikile.

[Mr M T KLAAS: Yes, I have gotten to point.]

The SPEAKER: ... to get there ...[Interjections.]

†Mr M T KLAAS: Ndithe kuye...ndifuna kuqala...

Mr M T KLAAS: I said to him...I want to start...

The SPEAKER: ... but can you please just ...[Interjections.]

†Mr M T KLAAS: Yes, ndifikile. Andizokuthetha olunye ulwimi ngaphandela kwesiXhosa. Ndifikile.

Mr M T KLAAS: Yes, I've come to my point. I will not speak another language besides isiXhosa. Yes, I've come to my point.

The SPEAKER: ... can you get to the question?

†Mr M T KLAAS: Yes, Uthi ke ngoku umbuzo, sixelele ke ngoku ukuba bangaphi abasebenzi bakho apha eWestern Cape one-sure yokuba basebenzela

i-health department. Bangaphi abaye bakushiya esithubeni? Bangaphi ngoku obafunayo ukuba mabaze qha awunamali? Enkosi.

Mr M T KLAAS: Yes. This is my question: Tell us how many workers do you have here in the Western Cape that you are sure that they really work for the health department? How many have just absconded? How many workers would you like to employ but are not able to because you do not have the funds? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Please just get to the question. Thank you, hon member Klaas.

Mr M T KLAAS: No vernacular.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Klaas. [Interjections.]  
Hon Minister, you got the question at the end? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: I think let me answer you first and then I will do the other, Faku. Through you, hon Chair, †Enkosi ngombuzo wakho. Zange sibenabo oogqirha in the Western Cape department apho sasenze i-contract ne-Cuba. Zange. Nanini na. The only time thina sasine-Cuban doctors, it was the time that was facilitated at the beginning of the COVID by National for certain skills specialists.

[The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Through you, hon Chair. Thank you for your question. We have never had doctors in the Western Cape Department that we have employed from Cuba. Never. Never ever. The only

time we had Cuban doctors.]

I think we had biostatisticians, epidemiologists related to primary healthcare for a short period. †Ngoku bekuqala iCOVID. But wena you are asking into yokuba there were Cuban doctors before COVID and they ran away.

[Interjections.] [At the start of COVID. You are asking whether there were Cuban doctors]

We have never had any arrangements or contract between Western Cape and the Cuban Government, never, but it does not mean that we do not have Cuban doctors who would have applied and ended up working, because we will have German doctors, German nationals of whom some are now South Africans [Interjections.], we have Americans, we have got Indians, we have had everyone, but we have never had any of that arrangement, Cuba and the Western Cape. [Interjections.] We never had that. [Interjections.]

So the reason I am laughing is because uFaku is saying that we had the doctors and then we chased them away and some of them left because there was COVID [Interjections.], that is what I was trying ...[Interjections.]

†Mr M T KLAAS: Yima. Point of objection.

[Mr M T KLAAS: Wait. Point of objection.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Klaas – hon Minister, please take your seat.

Hon member Klaas, is that a point of order? [Interjections.]

Mr M T KLAAS: Yes.

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order?

†Mr M T KLAAS: Khange ndithi bagxothiwe. Ndithe babalekile.

[Mr M T KLAAS: I never said they were dismissed. I said they ran away.]

An HON MEMBER: Okay.

Mr M T KLAAS: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: Yes! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Klaas, that is not a point of order. Hon Minister, can you please speak ...[intervenes]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: [Laughs.] No, I am not going to take the question because it is not relevant to the main question.

So I was entertaining it, but, hon Speaker, can I not take his question.

[Laughs.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, it is not for me to determine how you respond to follow-up questions. It is not my [Interjections.] – I do not adjudicate on the content of your responses.

With that being said, the Minister has now concluded. Hon members, [Interjections.] thank you very much. That brings us to the end of that question, which will also bring us [Interjections.] – it also brings us to the end of Questions for Oral Reply. We now move on to Questions to the Premier without Notice, as per Rule 204.

Hon members, I just want to remind members that the member posing the question have two follow-ups. So it is only the member that initially poses the question.

So in this case, the first member would be hon member Mvimbi and it is only hon member Mvimbi that can ask follow-up questions. Hon Mvimbi, I recognise you.

### **QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE**

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and I will use all the follow-ups that I have. [Laughter.]

Hon Speaker, good governance entails not just applying the letter of the law, which is being legal in its dealings, but also ensuring that the Government is



ethical in its dealings. Does the Premier's Administration believe in ethical governance when it award tenders or business to companies, who in the Premier's own words are "profiteers of crime"? Which means going beyond just doing what the law says, and if yes, why is this Government doing business with gangsters and state captures? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Mvimbi. Hon Premier. Hon Premier, can you just put on your microphone for the record.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and, hon Speaker, thank you very much to the hon member Mvimbi for that question, and the answer is absolutely yes, but obviously we also have something called the Rule of Law, we have something called "innocent until proven guilty", and as frustrating as this is, we have to obviously apply those principles. But I really am looking very hard for a new process because we cannot rely on the current legislation, the current direction that is given to us by the MFMA, and of course what the hon member Mvimbi is speaking about primarily is this latest R282 million contract awarded to a good friend of the past President Mr Zuma.

The scary thing about this whole process is that all of these allegations - and of course they have got to be treated as allegations - and specifically embedded in something called the Zondo Commission, billions of South African taxpayers' money was spent on producing a report where this individual is fingered in this report, but there is no conviction. Zero,

nothing, no conviction, and, you know, it is quite interesting, because this Government takes this very seriously, as the hon member asked that question, we take it very, very seriously, and you know that there is a court case from last year where we took our forensic unit. We said ethically we have got questions on this company. Not the one that you are talking about from KZN, this is another company that we raised issues about on 1 April – you have asked me a question on ethics, I am going to answer your question ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, please address me and, hon member Mvimbi ...[Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Thank you very much ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... you will have an opportunity to ask follow-up questions.  
[Interjections.]

The PREMIER: The individual must listen to the answer.

An HON MEMBER: Speak to the question.

The PREMIER: And this company, on 1 April 2022 a judgment was delivered, because in 2021 we went to court because our forensic team said, "Hang on a second, let us have a look at this company's ethics and you know, it is quite interesting when you read the judgment, and this is how horrendous

our current system is, if we really are serious about dealing with corruption, and in the judgment here, Clause 37 in the judgment it says:

"The provisions ..."

Because remember we said there is ethics involved here and we cancel this contract. The Judge says:

"The provisions of PRECCA ..."

Which is the Prevention and Combatting of Corrupt Activities Act, the perfect piece of legislation to deal with these specific kinds of issues. That Act, he says:

"The provisions of the PRECCA indicate that termination of a contract can indeed take place, but ..."

The Judge says:

"But only after a conviction."

Only after a conviction and that is the real frustrating part of this specific question that is being asked of me, and it is not only that tender of yesterday, or the tender that I was brought or made aware of on Friday via a WhatsApp and the press issue of yesterday, it is also this one, the alleged gang boss's

wife, a lucrative contract, that is exactly the same thing. We, hon Speaker, I have written to General Patekile, the Police Commissioner in this province and said to him, "Please give me information on this person, on the company. Is there anything that you can think of that we can deal with this specific tender ..." ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: ... because we want it off. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: We want it off ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, my apologies, please take your seat. Hon Chief Whip, is that a point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP [DA]: Yes, thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I rise on Rule 39. It cannot be that the Opposition ask the question, they pre-empt and still interrupt while the Premier is responding to the relevant questions. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you very much, hon Chief Whip. Hon members, can I please ask that you allow the Premier, there was a question posed to the Premier. The Premier is responding. Hon member Mvimbi, you

have two opportunities to ask follow-up questions.

Can I please ask the hon members to not drown out the speaker? Interjections are allowed, but you cannot drown out the speaker on the floor. Hon member Sayed, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Hon Chair, precisely. Interjections are allowed. That is a misrepresentation of the Rule by the hon Chief Whip of the Majority Party. Nobody is asking questions, nobody is interrupting. We can all clearly hear the Premier, even the audience outside can hear the Premier via YouTube. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you very much, hon Deputy Chief Whip. Hon members, I please ask that you allow the member, whichever member is on the floor, to make the representation and if you want to rebut, in this case, hon member Mvimbi, you have two opportunities after this.

Not yet, the hon Premier was not done with his first response. So, hon member Mvimbi, please take your seat. Hon Premier, my apologies, you may continue.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. So as I said, in the previous case and in this case, now written to the Police Commissioner. I have not had an answer back on the previous letter, but reiterated I need an answer on this and now added the second case to it.

In addition to this of course when it first came to light that I got given the information, I also, through our Provincial Treasury, contacted National Treasury and said, "Please can we understand why this company is not blacklisted?" Because we have a process in our country that says if a business is guilty of such conduct it gets blacklisted, and even at a National Treasury level they do not have the system to do it. They do not have the system to do or put that blacklisting in place, but what I did do is make sure, through my office, that all procurement processes were followed and that my office has gone through all of the documentation, all of the process, who engaged where, what and how, and all of those processes were followed exactly according to the book and the Rule.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: We know you did not.

The PREMIER: And I trust that the hon member Mvimbi will tell me, or in his question will say to me how, where in ANC municipalities or departments, this is how they manage the ethics and do not contract with such companies. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon members, hon member Mvimbi, your first opportunity. [Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I am asking here as a member of the Provincial Legislature, if the Premier wants answers in the

municipalities he can speak to the councillors of the DA in those municipalities. [Interjections.]

Now it is important to point out that, hon Speaker, every time – like the last time, this is the second time I had an opportunity to ask the Premier a question. He is always giving very long explanations, but not the answers, and he is very longwinded, but it is not the answer, but now let me answer the question then for him.

An HON MEMBER: Ja! [Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: His Administration does not mind doing business with gangsters. [Interjections.] That is clear. The Premier's Administration does not mind doing business with gangsters and people involved in state capture because his administration is only interested in ticking legal boxes and not ethical governance.

An HON MEMBER: Ja!

Mr L L MVIMBI: Given that according to media reports the Premier was in the newspapers as outraged when he heard about this contract being awarded to Royal Security.

The SPEAKER: Hon ...[Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: I just want to ask did the Premier meet with his MEC for Infrastructure, and if so, what were the details of those discussions?

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon members. Hon Premier.

[Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. Absolutely I have engaged with the Minister on this issue, and absolutely I am outraged. I am outraged because the Zondo Commission who raised these issues, nothing has happened after the Zondo Commission, zero, nothing. [Interjections.] Who is in jail? No one. [Interjections.]

The hon member starts off with talking about good governance and absolutely this is where it lands, but you know in the investigation of this specific company, and he says his, the Premier's, Administration does business with gangsters and people involved in state capture, and it was interesting in my investigation of this specific case, getting to the detail of how this procurement happens, does this company do business with Government and where does it do business with Government? [Interjections.] And I am sure the hon member Mvimbi will be very keen to know that this company has even got a contract with the Auditor-General of South Africa.

An HON MEMBER: Jôh!



An HON MEMBER: So that is why you are [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: This company has contracts with ANC departments  
...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ... and ANC-run municipalities in this country  
...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ... and so the hypocrisy of what this hon member says and how he phrases his questions, he should look at his own party first before he comes here with these kinds of questions. You know, it is also interesting when I was doing the investigation ...[intervenes]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The PREMIER: ... on this specific company, and I did say that there were ANC-run municipalities that are contracting with this business. [Interjections.] I also noticed on social media that there was one member of the National Assembly, none other than Mr Brett Herron, who made a very quick judgment call and slated the DA Government on how it [Interjections.], how on earth ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ... can it have contracts with a company like this, and it is nice that the hon member's party, GOOD, is also represented in this House because he can perhaps go back and ask the hon member Herron, when he speaks to him later this evening or tomorrow or whenever they speak, if they speak, he could ask him, "How come Minister De Lille, when she was in Public Works nationally, did business with the very same company? You had a lot to say." [Interjections.]

So it is interesting, I wonder what the hon member Herron is going to do ...[intervenes]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ... when he finds out that his very own Minister, who was responsible in that space, also has got exactly the same problem. Why on earth is a company that has the blemish that we pick up in the Zondo Commission, not ended up in court? Not as per these judgments been found guilty? Because that gives us the wherewithal to actually remove them from the tender processes, to put them onto blacklists, but we will deviate in this Province, following this. We will go and find mechanisms in this Province. We will not use the National Treasury blacklist, because obviously it does not mean anything. [Interjections.]

I have also written a letter to Judge Zondo because I want to know from Judge Zondo, who now was part of the Zondo Commission report which highlights companies like this, but at the same time now in the new position that he holds, what about the National Public Prosecuting Authority? What about the judiciary, when they actually know this kind of stuff goes on? [Interjections.] How on earth do we get it to a stage that I can start to put these companies on blacklist? Because there is no ways I want to do business with companies like this. Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon members. Hon members ...[intervenes]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Let me try me once more. Hopefully I will have an answer from the Premier.

The SPEAKER: Hon members – hon members Mvimbi, I now recognise you. [Interjections.] Hon member Mvimbi, can you – hon member Mvimbi, your microphone, please.

Mr L L MVIMBI: I ask about the details of the meeting with the Minister. I did not get that, but the Premier just kept on blaming the National Government, nothing else. [Interjections.] I think – we know that the Premier has got a hobbyhorse of blaming the Government. That is the Premier's hobbyhorse. On anything the Premier just blames the Government, whereas

the people of the Western Cape elected him to be the Premier of the Western Cape, not National. [Interjections.] If people want you in National they will [Interjections.] – I can see that when you are responding ...[intervenes]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... when you are responding you are responding for purposes of making headlines, news headlines. You said you were outraged and yet when we listen to you ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon ...[Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... the response is very weak ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mvimbi ...[Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... but then what I would like to ask ...[intervenes]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mvimbi ...[Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... can the hon Premier tell the ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... please take your seat. Hon Deputy Chief Whip of the DA, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [DA]: Yes, Chair, I would like to rise in terms of Rule 204(9), which clearly states that a member called may put one question in a concise form and immediately after reply thereto, two supplementary questions, which questions must relate to the member's original question or to reply which deals with the [Interjections.] to the Premier without notice.

Can we please ask the hon member what is the question?

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.] Hon members, order. [Interjections.] There was a point of order raised by the Deputy Chief Whip of the DA [Interjections.] – order, hon members!

There was a point of order raised by the Deputy Chief Whip. I am listening very carefully, hon Deputy Chief Whip, and I have allowed some latitude because these are questions to the Premier.

So, hon member Mvimbi, can you please pose your questions. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. Hon member, Mvimbi, please take your seat. Hon Deputy Chief Whip, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Yes, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, it is completely out of order for the hon Deputy Chief Whip of the Governing Party to be rising on a point of order when the member has actually started

posing his question.

There was a preamble, he was busy posing his question and then we have to hear a long diatribe here and quotation of the Rules, as if we do not know the Rules and as if we cannot read the Rules ourselves.

The hon member was asking. Can he just continue and ask his question? Thank you, and you have given guidance, so that is fine.

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you and I continue giving guidance? That was not a point of order, hon member Sayed. Hon member Mvimbi, you may continue.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Just, hon Speaker, while I am still developing my question. [Laughter.] Now it looks like [Interjections.] ...

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... because now ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mvimbi ...[Interjections.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: ... it is clear that, hon Speaker, we have got a very weak response from the Premier on a contract of more than R200 million. The response that we have got is a very weak response. Can the Premier tell the

House what measure he will take to ensure that his Administration no longer does business with profiteers of crime?

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mvimbi. [Interjections.] Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. It is interesting because the prelude to the question was a diatribe, but absolutely and I have already told you in the previous answer already the steps that have been put in place. I did give you an answer to the previous question as well, that I did engage with Minister Simmers. In actual fact that I also engaged with all members of the Cabinet. I also engaged with the Director-General and I engaged with the Head of Treasury, and of course my office also engaged with all of the procurement processes and the procurement team on how this happened, because what we have to do is we have to build a mechanism that actually disallows this.

A mechanism that gives us the legal standing to actually say no to these kinds of companies, and that is why in my answer I have told him exactly what we have done, in making sure that we are not caught out like the last time we were caught out when we cancelled the contract because of hearsay, or because of non-tested court information, because of course everybody is innocent until proven guilty, and that is the fundamental flaw in this space.

Exactly I think the competition is on with the hon member Mvimbi's party, and of course how we are going to challenge this, because I promise you we will come up with some solution on how to make sure that these kinds of things do not happen in this Government, because we have got to make sure we find those tools and those levers, because corruption in our country is a major problem. It is rife and it is a cancer that we have to cut out. We have got to root it out in our country.

I am determined to make sure that we find mechanisms in our procurement processes that enable us to legally identify these kinds of companies and make sure that we do not enable any kind of contract with them whatsoever.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. That brings us to the next question to the Premier. I now recognise hon member Kaizer-Philander.

The CHIEF WHIP [DA]: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the release of the 2021/2022 Auditor-General Municipal Audit Outcomes once again highlighted that the Western Cape has the best run municipalities in the country. Four out of the five top municipalities in South Africa are in the Western Cape, with Cape Town being the best run Metro in the country.

Hon Speaker, through you, I want to ask the Premier what is the key messaging from the Auditor-General about the recent municipal audit outcomes, and what are the reasons for the Western Cape municipalities doing much better than the rest of the country? I thank you, hon Speaker.



The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Chief Whip. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very, hon Speaker, and thanks to the hon Chief Whip for that question and, you know, I can see a lot of documents here and it is interesting, I do not have the Auditor-General's report, but I was actually reading again a document that was tabled yesterday, the Consolidated Municipal Budgets Performance Report of our municipalities in the province. We were engaging with that report at Cabinet yesterday, and when the hon member speaks about messaging, it was very interesting, and I probably, hon Speaker, through you, almost want to say to the Auditor-General thank you very much for the compliments that she paid this province when she was presenting to the National Assembly, as to the leadership style in this province, how we as a Government and as departments engage with our municipalities, specifically really trying to make sure that we are building a better and better platform of governance. Even linking through the previous question by the hon member Mvimbi, it is critical that we get governance right, and of course in our province we are trying to get to the stage where governance is a habit, good governance is a habit, and then you focus on service delivery. But it is interesting because it is one thing that really stands out above any other province in South Africa, the audit outcomes of the municipalities across the country, the 257 municipalities in this country, and you have a look at the different provinces and if I remember correctly, the closest province to us was Northern Cape with four municipalities with a clean audit, and every other province worse off than that, three twos and

ones. I think Limpopo was one, Gauteng was two. The provinces got one or two clean audits across South Africa, and in this province 90% of our municipalities attained that kind of governance record.

So you feel quite proud of the municipalities, of the leadership in the municipalities and to the Chief Whip, thank you for the question because we need to say to those CFOs and Mayors and Mayco members and Councils and administrations, well done and thank you for doing it, because good governance is the foundation before you can get to the stage of delivering services to citizens.

So in this province 19 of our municipalities – not two or one or three, 19 have clean audits and 21 have clean audits without qualification, and guess what? The ones that do not make it, who are they? Which party runs them? [Interjections.] It is always the same old, same old, same old and we cannot – yes, what about TWK? Who runs TWK? [Interjections.] What about it? It is regressing at a fast rate ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ... of knots. [Interjections.] My own hometown, it is so sad to see my own hometown of Knysna and the shocking governance given to that town by this ANC party and their deployees into municipal level across this province. [Interjections.]

The citizens ...[intervenes]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ... the citizens ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ... of Knysna have got a 30 ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Order!

The PREMIER: They have got a 33% increase in their rates and taxes. I mean it is just unbelievable how badly run the town is. If you look at Beaufort West and the Auditor-General speaks about Beaufort West ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: And let us not even get to Kannaland.

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Mossel Bay?

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The PREMIER: To Kannaland.

An HON MEMBER: No-no-no-no. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Mossel Bay is not on that list. [Interjections.] [Inaudible.]  
even get to Kannaland, who cannot even ...[intervenes]

The SPEAKER: Order – hon Premier ...[intervenes]

The PREMIER: ... [Interjections.] submit their financials ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, please take your seat. [Interjections.] Hon members – hon members, hon members! [Interjections.] Hon members, interjections are allowed, but you are drowning out the speaker. I am not even able to [Interjections.] – hon member Mvimbi! [Interjections.] Hon Minister – hon members, you are drowning out the speaker. There was a question posed the Premier, he is busy responding. Interjections are allowed, but you cannot drown out the speaker. Can I please ask that you allow the Premier to make his presentation. Hon Premier. Hon member Windvogel, is that a point of order?

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Yes, Chair.

The SPEAKER: You may ...[Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Speaker. The Premier must not mislead the House. Kannaland is in coalition with the DA.

The SPEAKER: Hon member [Interjections.] – hon members, [Interjections.] that is not a point of order, hon member Windvogel. Hon Premier, you may continue.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. Can I say thank you very much, hon Speaker. I know my time for this question time is finished, but you can see that when you talk about good governance and you talk about that 257 municipalities and the volume of municipalities who the Auditor-General is saying are unacceptable, these are the disclaimers, these are the qualified audits, and if you go and have a look at which political party runs those municipalities, what party do those Mayors come from? You will find it is the ANC, and the same old, same old, in this province ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Kannaland is DA.

The PREMIER: ... it is exactly the same. [Interjections.] It is exactly the same thing in this province, but ...[intervenes]

The SPEAKER: Alright, hon Premier, can you please conclude?

The PREMIER: I shall do so. Thank you very much to the Chief Whip for that question, and it is critical that our municipalities get into unqualified and clean audit status, and we will commit to that from our point of view, from our oversight point of view, from Minister Bredell's office, from Treasury and we are in those municipalities wherever possible and where accepted, because we have to change the lot for the voters in this province. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon members, that concludes questions to the Premier without notice. We now move on to Statements by Members as per Rule 145. I recognise the DA.

#### **STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS**

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, during the last week's debate I was bombarded and interrupted by racial degrading, unacceptable comments made by certain members on the other side of the House. Comments such as, and I quote:

"She is a White lady in a Black person's body." [Interjections.]

And I quote again:

"A Black person attacking another Black person, *sies*."

A quote from the ANC's benches. Not only were these comments loaded, but they were made without a shred of care for my dignity, and they were made without any consideration of how these words would affect me and others in this House, or even people at home who look like me.

Hon Speaker, the ANC often reminds this House of how they fought for the freedoms we as a society hold so dear. Freedom of association, freedom of opinion and human dignity. Yet they will boldly sit here and malign me for exercising my constitutional right to choose my political home.  
[Interjections.]

While no one can deny our history ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Ms L M MASEKO: ... in South Africa, Opposition need to understand they do not have a monopoly over our experiences, our views, or our beliefs.  
[Interjections.]

I want to remind my colleagues from the other side of the following. As we navigate our political differences and work towards the consolidation of our hard fought democracy, I urge you to show grace and tolerance and not to fall for the same traps of the past, which saw us stripped of our dignity and humanity. I thank you, hon Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Maseko. Order, hon members! I now recognise the ANC. [Interjections.]

Ms A BANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Bans, you may continue.

Ms A BANS: Can I continue? Okay. Hon Speaker, the ANC wishes to rise in this House today to note and welcome the work done by SAPS and a number of successful arrests. These arrests include Namibian lawyer, Marén de Klerk, the self-confessed paymaster, famous for the Namibia's "Fishrot" corruption case; the alleged killer of Warren Rhooode, and the four suspects who shot a woman outside the Magistrate's Court in Wynberg.

While the hon Premier of the Province does not know that LEAP officers cannot arrest somebody, we must give praise where praise is due and, in this case, we must acknowledge the work done by the SAPS. These arrests send out a clear message to people that they cannot act with impunity and that they will have to account for their actions. Our communities must be encouraged to work with the SAPS to point out those allegedly responsible for crime, and not to hide or to be secretive about these people.

The challenge of course, is that we sit with an hon MEC and Provincial Government who think that the way to fight crime is to have communities fight against the SAPS, instead of the criminals. The Provincial Government



mobilises communities against the SAPS, also that they can achieve their political goal of devolution. These arrests prove that the SAPS is working. These arrests prove that the devolution promises nothing. The ANC continues to call on the hon Premier and his administration to take crime in our communities as a priority and fight crime together. LEAP officers cannot arrest, hon Speaker. That we know. Instead, LEAP officers should be deployed into this House and address the issue of race and make sure that racists are detained. Thank you, hon Speaker. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Really?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. Please, hon Members, please take your seat. I now recognise the EFF.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Langa Food Gardens feed the indigenous. [Interjections.] The EFF would like to take this opportunity and applaud the residents of Langa living on the N2 Gateway social housing projects flats. These pioneers have transformed dumpsites in their surrounding areas by turning them into vegetable plots, which generate some income and feed indigenous households. They grow a variety of fruit and vegetables, including but not limited to lemons, naartjies, oranges, spinach, potatoes, cabbages, rosemary, lavender, and many more. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): The residents are assisted with seeds and trained by a church, one [Inaudible.] Food Chain Enterprise, as well as by a farming NGO. This project assists those who are unemployed to work in the projects in order to feed their families, as well as generating an income for themselves. For example, a bunch of fresh spinach can be bought for as little as R12.

However, the project is not without challenges as the residents are still in need of funding for purposes of fencing, tools, water tanks and boreholes, just to mention a few, as they receive no assistance from the DA Provincial Government which does not care about the poor ...[Interjections.]

Hon MEMBERS: Ah!

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): ...in the townships. Moreover, members of the project had high aims as their future goal is to end up supplying fresh produce to supermarkets, schools, and old age homes. Their aim is to contribute to food security ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Klaas, can you please conclude.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Okay. With that then being said, one can just imagine what a group would achieve if they had access to proper agricultural land, coupled with Government support.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Klaas. I now recognise the DA.

Mr I M SILEKU (DA): A new colour. Somlomo. Hon Speaker, u-Kongolose likes to argue that clean audits do not mean that services are delivered to communities, †maar die uitgaande Nasionale Regering se wind word elke jaar uitgeskop wanneer ons verslag na verslag beter presteer as die uitgaande Nasionale Regering [but the outgoing National Government gets winded every year, when we achieve better report after report than the National Government.] Even President Ramaphosa said in his weekly letter that, and I quote:

“Efforts to improve the lives of South Africans will only succeed when we effectively address the challenges in Local Government. Local Government provides infrastructure and services that help improve people’s livelihoods.”

Clean governance directly benefits our communities. Now that the darling of the ANC has said it, †ek hoop dit gaan nou sink [I hope it’s going to sink now.] Following the Blue, Green and No Drop reports raised by the Department of Water and Sanitation, the Western Cape once again outperforms other provinces in several key areas. Number one: we are the province with the greatest number of households connected to a reliable water source. Number two: we lose the least amount of water between the point of production and a point of consumption. Number three: we are the province that has the lowest water consumption levels, making us the most

waterwise province in the country. Number four: we are the province with the least infrastructure leakages. The list goes on and on and on.

†Agb Speaker, skoon bestuur is die grondslag van effektiewe dienslewering en die naderende verkiesing bied 'n beslissende geleentheid vir Suid-Afrika. Deur stemme uit te bring ter ondersteuning van die DA kan ons ware verandering teweegbring, beter dienste verseker en die volledige verval van ons geliefde nasie onder die uitgaande Nasionale Regering voorkom. Ek sê baie dankie. [Applous.]

[Hon Speaker, clean governance is the basis of effective service delivery and the approaching election offers a decisive opportunity for South Africa. By casting votes in support of the DA we can bring about true change, ensure better services and prevent the total demise of our beloved nation under the outgoing National Government. I say thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sileku. I now recognise GOOD.

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): Hon Speaker, as an hon member of this House I would love to highlight that I do not suffer fools too easily and the colour of my skin does not indicate a deficiency in my intellect. And so, when the DA launches a campaign painting the picture that the leader of the GOOD party, the hon Minister Patricia de Lille is, in fact, a ghost Minister of the ANC you force my hand in reminding the nation that her appointment is one of two appointments of the hon President of his Assembly and his own party, and this practice has been common practice since 1994. Even more significant is

this comment ...[Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): Even more significant is that this comment is being made by a party that has had a number of its members appointed as Ambassadors by the ANC Presidents. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): Mr Tony Leon to Argentina [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P DE VILLIERS (GOOD): Douglas Gibson, Ambassador to Thailand, Sheila Camerer, Ambassador to Bulgaria, and Sandra Botha, Ambassador to the Czech Republic. [Interjections.] It seems as if your superior attitude is preventing you from seeing your own hypocrisy. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon de Villiers. Order, hon members. I now recognise ...[Interjections.] Hon Christians, before I recognise you, can you please ...[Interjections.] Order, hon members. [Interjections.] Hon members, are you done now? Hon Christians, you may continue.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, as the

House is aware that the ACDP is on record, and I want to place on record again that we do not support Pride Month. The point I want to make today is why will a brand like Woolworths support Pride Month in the order – in other words, supporting the LGBTQI+ community. Woolworths talks about commitment, it talks about diversity, and it talks about the inclusion of instore promotions and a Pride theme apparel. By aligning them to Pride Month they are excluding Christians, they are excluding Muslims and they are excluding Jews.

The SPEAKER: Order! Order. Hon Christians, hon Murray, is that a point of order?

Ms C MURRAY: Yes, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I would like to know whether the hon member's comments actually inflict on residents' rights to equality. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Murray. Hon Murray, I am not going to rule from the Chair. I will revert back to the House. If there are any infringements, I will rule in that manner. Hon Christians, you can continue.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Hon Speaker, Woolworths is putting the livelihoods of their staff at risk because millions of shoppers will not shop at Woolworths for this month. Their income will drop significantly for this month. [Interjections.]

Hon MEMBERS: No!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): What is shameful, ...[Interjections.] what is shameful is even that the Pride apparel is also made available to children. Disgusting! As the ACDP, we are Christians first and we are guided by the Word of God, the Bible. That is what we are guided by. So, we are not haters; we are not homophobic. [Interjections.] We cannot and will not support Woolworths, and we will not support or condone the lifestyles of the LGBTIQ community. It is wrong; it is a sin. South Africa needs God more than ever and I want to remind the House what the Bible says in 2 Chronicles 7:14:

“If My people which are called by my name, shall humble themselves and pray...” ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Christians, can you please conclude.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP):

“...and seek my face, then ...[Interjections.] then; and turn from their wicked ways; then will I hear from heaven, and will forgive their sin, and will heal their land.”

The SPEAKER: Hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): I thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. I now recognise the ANC.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, I rise today to call on the hon MEC of Education, David Maynier, to urgently intervene in our Province's learner transport crisis. Action needs to be taken on the Route 280 Rawsonville and Bitterfontein matters, both of which his Department is well aware of. In my meeting with the Rawsonville parents and the Breede Valley Education Forum last week in Worcester, I learned that there are 350 learners registered at seven schools, mainly in the Worcester area, from poor families in Rawsonville who are till today without transport. They have not attended school since January this year.

This matter has been brought to the attention of hon MEC Maynier's Department and the Cape Winelands Education District in particular, and they have received no assistance. I have personally written to the Head of the Department, Mr Walters, on 30 May 2023. Due to the non-responsive attitude by the Department, criminal charges have now been laid by the parents against the Winelands Education District.

A similar situation persists in Bitterfontein in Matzikama. Hon MEC Maynier's Department refuses to subsidise transport for poor learners to Nuwerus High School, which is 16 kilometres away. In my meetings yesterday with both the Nuwerus High School principal, Mr Ferdi van Dyk,



and the parents of the Bitterfontein learners, a clear call was made to me to urge hon MEC Maynier to ensure that his Department subsidises the scholar transport from Bitterfontein to Nuwerus High. In fact, WCED refused the principal's direct request in this regard. Hon MEC Maynier's Department is instead unfairly forcing poor Bitterfontein parents to chose between either sending their children to the school's hostel, which will become tough to manage with the addition of these learners ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, can you please conclude.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...or fork out the money for transport. This is an unfair choice. The ANC calls upon hon MEC Maynier to direct his Department to subsidise the learner transport from both Rawsonville ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...and Bitterfontein as the policy does allow for such.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I thank you.

The SPEAKER: I now recognise the DA. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, today I wish to speak, actually, to a religious passage I read last night. It is from 1 John 4 verses 7 to 8 in the Bible. It reads, quote:

“Beloved, let us love one another, for love is from God, and whoever loves has been born of God and knows God. Anyone who does not love does not know God, because God is love.”

Hon Speaker, as someone who forms part of the LGBTQIA+ community, there are certain personal truths that I try to live by. These are kindness, integrity, trust, respect and most important of all, love. I believe as a society these are truths we all strive to live by. Pride Month has spread and is celebrated across the world during the month of June and it both honours the movement to protect LGBTQIA+ rights and freedoms, and it celebrates culture.

During my personal reflection I asked myself a few things. I asked myself whether I am open to love. Hon Speaker, I am. I asked myself what do I seek in a partner. Hon Speaker, I seek kindness, I seek integrity, I seek trust, I seek respect, I seek quality time. I asked whether I am deserving of living and breathing in a safe environment. Hon Speaker, I am. I asked whether I am deserving of love. Hon Speaker, I am. And I asked myself whether I promise to defend our rights and freedoms as protected in the Constitution and hon Speaker, I do.

As a South African I am not asking for much and many others like myself are not asking for much when we ask for equality, when we ask not to be discriminated against and when we ask for the freedom to love. So, to the hon members of this House I ask the same way we protect your right to love, please help us protect ours. Happy Pride Month and long live Woolworths. Hon Speaker, I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Baartman. I now recognise the Freedom Front Plus.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the Freedom Front Plus welcomes the tabling and introduction of the DA's Western Cape Powers Bill. Soon ...[Audio distorted – 1:35.55] after, I myself gave notice of the Western Capes Peoples Bill. We believe that once debated and amended and passed in this House, its implementation in whatever form will lead to great economic stability and growth for the whole region and all its people living within our borders, people who can then live free from fear of crime, corruption, incompetence and poor service delivery by a National Government that is corrupt and incompetent. And it could signal a new beginning in good governance. It was an absolute necessity. We now have two Bills. One will launch it ...[Audio distorted – 1:36.54] will have the necessary power to launch and then when that launch is over, the other Bill will be the one that carries the package so that the people of the Western Cape can land safely after the Moonshot. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marais. I now recognise Al Jama-Ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Speaker and good afternoon to everybody. Hon Speaker, Al Jama-Ah is not shocked at all about hon Reagan Allen's announcement – hon Reagan is also a very great friend of mine – that the Western Cape has more drug dens than schools. In fact, this province too, should not be surprised by it. Research has shown that Gender-Based Violence is largely fuelled by alcohol which is easily accessible. We know the saying: there is a shebeen on every street corner and this refers to residential areas where the poor are living. It is true that we have more drug dens than schools and also, more drug dens than recreational facilities.

In a question to hon Reagan Allen in August last year, he confirmed that there were 3 208 illegal shebeens in the Western Cape. It is common knowledge that shebeens not only sell liquor, but also drugs. The hon Premier and the hon Allen recently in partnership with the Drakenstein Municipality went on a walkabout in Sector 1 of the Paarl East Precinct, a casual walkabout on the precinct that is not doing justice to solve crime and illegal activities. The walkabout should enter crime-ridden areas where one will see the shebeens and drug dens in every street. Why did the hon Premier and hon Allen not go further on to Mbekweni, Fairyland and Smartie Town to count how many drug dens there are compared to the number of schools?

Stop preventing anti-crime movements like PAGAD from helping you to do your job. The more than 3 200 illegal shebeens are also outlets for drugs. I am sure hon Allen is fully aware of that. ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member, please conclude. Your time has expired.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): I have concluded. Thank you, hon Speaker. [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the DA.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the MyCiTi bus service is coming to Khayelitsha, Mitchells Plain, Nyanga, Philippi, Ottery, Hanover Park, Wynberg and Claremont.

An HON MEMBER: Hmm!

Mr D AMERICA (DA): The DA-run City of Cape Town is spending R5,2-billion on rolling out the MyCiTi bus service to Phase 2A. Formally known as the Lansdowne/Wetton Corridor, this expansion will accommodate a further 1,5-million commuters. Not only will the expansion MyCiTi be of a safe, affordable and reliable transport option for the City's most in need communities, but the expansion is also said to create an estimated 9 000 job

opportunities in the Metro Southeast communities and an additional 1 800 jobs will be created to operate these expanded services.

This expansion will drive economic development, hon Cameron Dugmore, and support equality and inclusivity by providing access to economic activities and opportunities to our most marginalised communities. Hon Speaker, the DA is often wrongly accused of only caring for the rich and wealthy, but the Opposition always fails to mention the billions of rands DA governments are constantly spending to create integrated communities and drive equality, all while ANC governments are stuffing their cultures with US dollars and Russian rubles. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon America. Hon members, that brings us to the end of Members' Statements. In terms of Rule 145(6), I now give one or more members of the Executive present, an opportunity to respond to Members' Statements for not more than five minutes collectively. Hon Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, I rise in response to the reference of the Western Cape Powers Bill. This is a DA-sponsored Bill to make provision for more powers in line with the principles of subsidiarity and the principle of federalism. We can no longer sit and see how the South Africa under the ANC ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ...is fast becoming a failed state.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon Sayed, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Is the hon Meyer able to take a question? I know he normally is able to, so I want to know ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, that is not ...[Interjections.] Honourable, I am going to ...[Interjections.] Hon members! This is not an opportunity for a question being posed to that hon member of the Executive, hon Sayed, so no. Hon Meyer, hon Minister Meyer, you can continue. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon Sayed, I have ruled. That is not. The hon member is not on the floor for any other reason, other than responding ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): But...

The SPEAKER: ...as per Rule 145(6) to respond to Member Statements already delivered.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): And if the hon MEC decides ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...that he wants to respond ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, please take your ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You are not supposed to answer on his behalf.

The SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, please take your seat. I have ruled. Hon Minister Meyer, please continue.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, I rise in response to the reference of the Western Cape Powers Bill. This is a DA-sponsored Bill in line with the provisions of the principles of subsidiarity and federalism. We can no longer sit here and see how South Africa is fast becoming a failed state under the ANC.

Therefore, we are introducing this Powers Bill to prevent the ANC from taking the Western Cape to the levels of North West and the Free State, who



are already a failed state. So, we are introducing a Western Cape Powers Bill not to secede from South Africa, we want South Africa to succeed. We want to be part of South Africa, but we want to observe the political powers that are contained in Schedule 4 and Schedule 5 of the Constitution, namely concurrent powers, and provincial exclusive legislative powers. So, hon Deputy Speaker, we are ready to introduce and fight for more powers to prevent the Western Cape from becoming a failed state.

[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much to the hon Minister. That concludes the end of Members' Statements. ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Deputy Speaker, do we still have time?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: My apologies hon Minister, over to you.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Sorry, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am on a rush.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS

AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I rise with love and kind  
...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): When are you going to give some time to  
Hon Maynier ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): On the point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute. [Laughter.] Hon members, just one  
minute. [Interjections.] We know that this is the privilege of the hon  
Ministers. Please stop the time. Are you okay ...[Interjections.] Yes, and  
five minutes. They are only on three minutes. So, the hon Ministers have all  
their right to use up the five minutes. Over to you. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS  
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, I rise with love  
and kindness in my heart. My favourite piece in the Bible is Matthew 7:

“Thou shall not judge.”

An HON MEMBER: Uh-huh!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS

AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: We must be very careful in this House when we start to think that we can be the judge. There is only one Judge and that is God. Not even His son Jesus is allowed to judge. He is there to intervene for our sins. [Interjections.] So, we must be very careful because that was a very hard lesson I had to learn as a Christian. And I will invite my friend to come for a cup of coffee because I think this needs a deeper discussion because we need to acknowledge our diversity and we need to build the country on that diversity, but we cannot be judges. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I also recognise the hon Minister, hon Minister Allen, but I will recognise hon Minister David Maynier before the hon Minister Allen.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, please, hon members!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. To the hon Khalid Sayed, we do regularly review our learner transport routes and I would appeal to the hon member to provide me with the information and especially, the names of the learners he claims have now been denied access to education, which we have not received, so that I can follow up with the Department.

I would also, hon Deputy Speaker, like to congratulate the hon Klaas on his support for enterprise, on his support for entrepreneurship, on his support for small business, which, of course, is everything that the EFF high command is opposed to. Thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon Minister Allen. [Interjections.] You have just over one and a half minutes.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much, hon Deputy Speaker, for confirming the time. Hon Deputy Speaker, my mind is boggled by the comment made by hon member Bans that stated the LEAP officers are unable to make arrests or cannot make arrests. Hon Deputy Speaker, that is so far away from reality, it is so far away from the truth that it actually borders on absurdity. The LEAP officers have made so many arrests that it is actually also leading ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...to convictions ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

...and we will continue in that regard. ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: But also, the comment made that we are mobilising in order to bring politics in and to ensure that our ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...residents ...[Audio distorted – 1:47.59] That is also not factually correct. We have been very deliberate by working with all our stakeholders, all our Community Policing Forums and that is, for the record, that each and every person in the Western Cape would be able to attest to.

But also, the comment about the drug houses. As the Chairperson, it was me that actually lodged a complaint with the Police Ombudsman with regard to the inefficiencies in the South African Police Service to shut down these drug houses. The increases we are seeing now are because we have fostered valuable relationships where the community members are actually reporting known drug houses more and more, so the numbers are increasing exactly because we have fostered trust. ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
...with community members and we will continue in that regard.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Your time is up. Hon  
Ministers and hon members, this is the end of Member Statements.

## **MOTIONS**

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We now move over to Notices of Motion. In terms  
of Rule 151, all Notices of Motion by the hon members are required to be  
delivered to the Secretary for placing on the Order Paper. These motions  
have been duly submitted and published on the Order Paper below the line.

## **MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the learnerships offered by big business and the  
benefits thereof.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

Ms A P BANS (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the fact that the Western Cape has more drug dens than schools.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the fact that that more than 30 000 children are in the foster care system in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

Ms R WINDVOGEL: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the NICD reports of an increase in Western Cape influenza cases.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates a worrying flare-up of animal diseases in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates racial discrimination in property rental markets in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the sanitation backlog causing people to still make use of the unsanitary bucket system.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We now move to Motions without Notice. I would like to inform you that in terms of the new Standing Rule 150 pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolence and congratulatory were submitted to the Programming Authority prior to this plenary on 6 June 2023. Hon members are also reminded that the Motions without Notice pertaining to congratulatory and condolence, will not be allowed in this Sitting that have not been processed by the Programming Authority.

I have been informed that in the Programming Authority meeting of 6 June 2023, political parties did submit the names of the hon members in the



desired order of speaking and who had wished to move a Motion without Notice in this Sitting of this House. I will therefore, just for noting and for the purposes of the Minutes, call out the hon members whose names have accordingly been submitted and approved.

The following member motions have been approved by the Programming Authority: hon Bosman, hon Mvimbi, hon Kama, hon Lekker and hon Christians.

### **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): I move without notice:

That this House sends its condolences to the friends and family of Eusebius McKaiser who tragically passed away on the 30 May 2023.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Mr L L MVIMBI: I move without notice:

That the House sends deepest heartfelt wishes of condolences to the families, friends, and the community of the 5 children who tragically died in a scholar transport accident. We also note and welcome the arrest of the perpetrator and how the law is moving swiftly to serve justice for the families of the deceased; and want to recognise and thank

the various local businesses for offering to assist the grieving families.  
May their businesses grow beyond greatness.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Mr M KAMA (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with pride and congratulates Itsitsa Primary School in Mfuleni for winning four trophies at the Metro North District Music Competition held at Saffier Primary School in Parow on Saturday 27 May 2023. The competition featured seven primary schools from the Metro North district. They competed in various music categories for places at the provincial music competition next month. Initiatives like these ones assist in keeping children off the streets and being swallowed by the vile and popular gangsterism in Cape Town.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Mandisa ‘Mandy’ Gavu on being nominated as Founder of the Year Africa awards in Kenya. Mandy hails from Gugulethu and is the founder of Gugs FM, a fast-growing radio station with a wide audience of a unique demographic that is young, growing, and multicultural. She is nominated for the Mediapreneur of

the Year under-30 category. Congratulations and good luck Mandy.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): I move without notice:

That the House notes with great pleasure and congratulates Durbanville Library as they celebrate 100 years of existence. The library was established in 1904 in Vrede Street. In 1923 it moved from the two rooms it occupied in the Durbanville City Hall to a storeroom of the Anglican Church. (*Son* newspaper – 27 May 2023) The library moved to Durbanville Civic Centre in 1960. 1973 saw it move from the Civic Centre to its current location in Koeberg Road. This library has the 2<sup>nd</sup> highest circulation in the City of Cape Town with 8 169 members. Between January and April of this year their circulation grew by 1 492 new members; and commends the dedicated staff of the library and wishes them well for the future.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now put the motions duly submitted and approved by the Programming Authority to the House. Are there any objections? No objections, agreed to. The motions will appear in the Minutes of the proceedings and in Hansard, in each individual members' names as if that member had read them out aloud.

I will now afford the opportunity to hon members to move Motions without Notice as per the Standing Rule of 152(d). This could also include Motions without Notice that were not approved of in the Programming Authority meeting. Hon members are reminded that a total of 30 minutes as per the Standing Rule will start now. I recognise the hon Klaas. [Interjections.] Hon Klaas? Over to you. [Laughter.]

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): Eish, I was already ...[Audio distorted – 1:51.04]

The PREMIER: Yes, but you contacted the national command.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): I move without notice:

That the House notes the proposed Western Cape People's Bill by the Freedom Front Plus to the Western Cape Provincial Legislature; further notes that this Bill is nothing but a desperate, hopeless, and unconstitutional ...[Laughter.] piece of waste intending to usurp power using other people; and concludes that this Bill together with the Western Cape Powers Bill are desperate attempts by the FF Plus [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: No, no, no, no, no. Do not ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Klaas, please proceed.

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): ): You allow this guy to do this here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Klaas!

Mr T M KLAAS (EFF): So, I must ask you... [Interjections.]

...that the DA please, and to make them excited ahead of the 2024  
Elections. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

Hon MEMBERS: [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any motions  
...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No objections.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): There are no objections.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Agreed to. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No, we object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise the hon America.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Objection!

†Mnr D AMERICA (DA): Baie dankie, Adjunkspeaker. Ek stel sonder kennisgewing voor:

Dat hierdie Huis die gruwelike moord op Pierre en Belinda de Kock betreur, wat tragies hul lewens op hul plaas die afgelope naweek verloor het; die dringende behoefte aan groter veiligheidsmaatreëls in ons landelike gemeenskappe erken sowel as die dringende vereiste vir verhoogde teenwoordigheid en ondersteuning van wetshandhawingsagentskappe; dat hierdie Huis verder die diepgaande smart wat veroorsaak word deur die ontydige afsterwe van Belinda en Pierre de Kock erken, sowel as hul geweldige bydraes tot die welstand van hul gemeenskap; dat hierdie Huis eensgesind staan in solidariteit met die gemeenskap van Aurora, Piketberg, en daarby aandrang dat die Suid-Afrikaanse Polisie diens aanhou om hul pogings te intensifiseer om

die skuldiges wat nog nie gevang is nie, vas te trek; en laastens, dat die Huis ons gedagtes en gebede aan die De Kock-familie, hul geliefdes en die gemeenskap van Aurora stuur tydens hierdie tyd van beproewing en hul tragiese verlies. Ek lê hierdie mosie ter tafel, agb Adjunkspeaker.

[Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House deplores the gruesome murder of Pierre and Belinda de Kock who tragically lost their lives on their farm over the past weekend; acknowledges the urgent need for greater safety measures in our rural communities as well as the urgent requirement for increased presence and support of law enforcement agencies; that this House further acknowledges the deep grief that was caused by the untimely death of Belinda and Pierre de Kock, as well as their considerable contribution to the wellbeing of their community; that this House unanimously stands in solidarity with the community of Aurora, Piketberg, and insists that the South African Police Service continues to intensify their efforts to apprehend the guilty persons who have not yet been arrested; and finally, that this House sends its thoughts and prayers to the De Kock family, their loves ones and the community of Aurora during this time of ordeal and their tragic loss. I so table this Motion, Deputy Speaker.]

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: †Baie dankie, agb lid. [The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.] Are there any objections to the motion being

moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. I recognise the hon Fry.

Mr C FRY (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the comments in the recently released 2021/2022 Auditor-General Municipal Outcomes Report which once again lauds the Western Cape and its Executive's firm leadership and strong controls in creating a stable local government environment; that the House further notes the report that states that the AG's *"interaction with the [Premier] was positive, as his focus was on the communities' experience in relation to service delivery, which validated [the AG's] service delivery insights on key projects and additional consideration of selected clean audits for the current year"*; it further notes that *"[this] year, [the AG] observed that most of the municipal managers and their senior management maintained this tone and continued to implement and maintain good controls through well-capacitated and competent staff."*; that the House commends hon Premier Alan Winde, hon Minister Anton Bredell, the Western Cape Department of Local Government and the municipalities across the province for achieving a remarkable 21 clean and unqualified audits; and finally, that this House notes that these results follow the release of the Ratings Afrika 2022 Municipal Financial Sustainability Index which confirmed that the top five best-run municipalities in the country are DA-run. These include Saldanha Bay, George, Mossel Bay, and Swartland, with Cape Town once again emerging as the best-run Metro in the entire nation; and recognises that



these outcomes across the board highlights that where the DA governs, it governs well! I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): I object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now recognise the hon Windvogel. [Interjections.] Oh, Bosman. We will do Bosman before. Just one minute. I recognise the hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House recognises World Bicycle Day held on the 3<sup>rd</sup> June and commends the Western Cape Government's Mobility Department and hon Minister Ricardo Mackenzie handing over bicycles to Neighbourhood Watches and the Langa Bicycle Hub as part of the Langa 100-year

celebrations; and further recognises the Mobility Department and hon Minister Mackenzie for their learner's programme in rural communities enabling youth and communities from small towns such as Ceres and Vredendal to become up-skilled and employable. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections? There seem to be objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are objecting to becoming employed ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I recognise the hon Windvogel. [Interjections.] Hon Windvogel? [Interjections.] Order!

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes and commends the Treatment Action Campaign for a successful campaign in which it advocated for improved security in healthcare facilities in the province which prompted the City of Cape Town to launch the new Facility Protection Officers Law Enforcement Unit in which 280 officers will be deployed to facilities to protect them from extortion, theft and vandalism; notes further that while the ANC

welcomes this development, it is concerned that once more such services are reserved only for the Metro; and calls on the hon Premier to allocate more resources to expand the programme beyond the Metro and to include other Government services such as schools and social development. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Are there objections? No objections.

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection online. There was an objection online. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise the hon Bans.

Ms A P BANS (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that Cape Town and the Western Cape have become a hideout for international fugitives running from justice. This follows the arrests of Namibian Fishrot self-confessed paymaster, Marén de Klerk, in Paarl; the arrest of Rwandan genocide suspect Florence

Kayishema; the killing of Bulgarian Nikolaev Kamenov, in Constantia; and the arrest last year of Israel's most wanted fugitive, Yaniv Ben Simon, amongst others. Further notes made by forensic consultant Paul O'Sullivan who described the Western Cape in this context as being [and I quote] "*being particularly attractive, as most of the year the city was swamped with tourists, so the foreign fugitives from justice can hide in plain sight.*" [close quote]; calls on the hon MEC for Community Safety to start doing his job and work with communities to out these international criminals walking and living amongst us. [Interjections.]  
I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections?  
[Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] I recognise hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the ongoing conflict instigated and perpetuated by

the Democratic Alliance at the University of Stellenbosch which is causing deep instability in the management of that institution. Calls on the Freedom Front Plus to intervene in the situation and defend the current Vice-Chancellor ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr M KAMA (ANC):

...Dr Wim de Villiers from this onslaught by the DA; further calls on the leadership of the Freedom Front Plus to stop allowing its only MPL in the Legislature to be a DA Lite by actually being an opposition and not a coalition partner or it will cost the Freedom Front Plus at the polls. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections?

Hon MEMBERS: Object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise the hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you very much and good

afternoon to everyone present. Am I audible?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, you are perfectly audible.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the unsanitary and unsafe bucket systems still being used by people who live in Western Cape townships and informal settlements. The DA Government has no immediate plan to eradicate this system. When asked about the sanitation backlog and eliminating the bucket system, hon MEC Simmers responds with a plan that will only be done in 2030. Various communities have expressed that these toilets are unsafe, and children could fall into the toilet holes and die but these concerns have fallen on deaf ears. We call on hon MEC Simmers to speed up the sanitation backlog and prioritize safe and sanitary toilets for all people. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion ...[Interjections.]

Hon MEMBERS: *Ja*, objection. Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Marran, over to you again.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House notes with concern the recent outbreaks of Avian Flu which has resulted in the culling of over 500 000 birds and the dire impact this will have on the livelihoods of those within the poultry industry and on food security in the Western Cape. We call on hon MEC Meyer to provide a report on the extent of the outbreak and measures that have been taken to mitigate against further loss. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. The hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no!

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! [Laughter.]

Die HOOFSWEEP (ANC): †Julle kan maar *object in advance*, nè. [Gelag.]

[The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You can object in advance, nè. [Laughter.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Nee! [The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No!] No, no!

Please, you have your right ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes the lack of a clear implementable winter readiness programme by the Western Cape DA-led Government and calls for a clear plan to be implemented as a matter of urgency. The Provincial Government mentioned that there are disaster relief teams who will assist vulnerable communities, yet NGOs had to step in at the Gangxa informal settlement in Gugulethu – the hon Premier cannot pronounce that word, nè – due to flooding and Government was absent. However, it did not even take them two days to go and assist the residents of the affluent Pringle Bay and Betty's Bay. The DA Government pledged R2-million for homeless people during this winter, but we walk every day in the rain and see how people are still in the streets and have to live in those conditions. I so move.

[*Motion as moved by Member.*]



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

An HON MEMBER: Object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections? ...[Interjection.]

†Die HOOFSWEEP (ANC): Ek het geweet mos!

[The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I just knew!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved? There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. The hon Sayed.

An HON MEMBER: Object! [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, can we allow ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with sadness the tragic death of a baby at a...

Okay, sorry, hon Deputy Speaker. I have to do it all over again.  
...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, please.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): My apologies. I move without notice:

That the House notes with sadness the tragic death of a baby at a development centre which was not registered, in Bonteheuwel, Cape Town. This particular Early Childhood Development Centre is not on the verified list by the Provincial Government. The African National Congress has made numerous calls for the WCED to support struggling ECDs to be compliant, yet these calls have been ignored. We repeat our call to hon MEC David Maynier to ensure that his Department works closely with the existing ECD support NGOs to capacitate our ECDs in poor communities to be compliant and to serve our children in the safest of conditions. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. The hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Welcome to the House. I move without notice:

That the House notes the criminal complaint laid against the DA Hessequa Mayor, Grant Riddles, at the Still Bay Police Station along with a dossier of evidence including audio recordings where the Mayor is clearly audible telling housing beneficiaries to lie about their income in order to qualify for housing subsidies; allegations about massive corruption in the Traffic Department of Hessequa currently under investigation by the Hawks, an internal municipal hearing which found a senior official in the Council guilty of fraud and theft of prepaid electricity, as well as allegations of conflict of interest against the CFO and a company awarded work by the Municipality. And further, that this House therefore calls on the DA, in particular its acting Leader, hon Mr Simmers, to immediately suspend Mayor Riddles and for the hon MEC Bredell to conduct a full forensic audit into all allegations of corruption in the Hessequa Municipality. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Why?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] The hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with grave concern that increasing amounts of learners who applied correctly and timeously are being rejected, especially by the former Model-C schools in the Western Cape as the School Governing Bodies with the full backing of the WCED, are hellbent on keeping these schools to be White enclaves; notes further that Ms Namhla Manjezi, whose case I raised with the WCED officials, still finds herself in the same predicament as last year as her relative continues to be rejected by schools near her home, such as Sunningdale Primary School near Parklands and others who use frivolous excuses to keep the child out. Ms Manjezi is told that the child is underage for Grade 5 whilst her results are excellent; notes further that Ms Nawaal Jattiem who applied timeously and correctly for a child at six different schools, namely Gardens Commercial, Claremont High School, Camps Bay High School, Oude Molen and Cape Town High School, has had her child rejected by all; and further notes that this is the same experience of Ms Ngeyi whose child was rejected at all schools she applied to including Queens Park High and Sea Point High, despite applying on

time and submitting all documents. The House welcomes the fact that these cases help to dispel the myth and deliberate untruth pushed by the DA that the crisis of unplaced learners in the province is caused by late applications and learners arriving from other provinces, especially the Eastern Cape. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections?

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon members, that concludes Motions without Notice. That also concludes the business for the House and the House is now adjourned. The Secretary will end the meeting. Thank you very much.

The House adjourned at 16:45.