

---

THURSDAY, 7 APRIL 2022

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams.]

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

**BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

The SPEAKER: You may all be seated. Order, hon members! Welcome to the hybrid session of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. As you are all aware this is a session that is held in terms of the Standing Rules and of course in keeping with the hybrid sessions and the instruments that guide that and I would like to indicate to the hon members who are connected virtually that please do not activate your microphone if you are not speaking.

Equally, kindly ensure that you refrain from activating the microphone when you want to raise a point of order. Let us be circumspect of the instruments and the Standing Rules. That means you must indicate by a show of hands in your device, alternatively write in the chat room so that we are able to identify the hon member, and you will be afforded an opportunity by the Presiding Officer to raise that point of order.

The members of the press and all other members of the public, because the press is the Fourth Estate and we take you very seriously, you are an important stakeholder for us, but please behave as you would otherwise do when you are in the gallery here in the Chamber. That means you do not press anything, you do not create, you do not even activate your camera, you do not speak. You do not write in our chats, because this is a sitting of the House and for everybody else, please remain a spectator. Do not participate, except for the members of Parliament.

On that note, in terms of Standing Rule Number 40, let us respect the decorum of the House, and allow members who are speaking at a time not to be compromised because of the running commentary in the sitting.

Hon members, without further ado, today we have Interpellations, we have Questions without Notice to His Excellency, the Premier of the Province, hon Alan Winde. He is here with us in the House. Thank you Premier, for doing it from here, and that is going to be following later on, so I am going to ask that we go straight to the First Order.

I will ask the Secretary to read the First Order. [Pause.]

Oh, that is fine. Thank you, Mr Secretary. Sorry, hon members, I apologise. The First Order is the Interpellations and I have the hon Minister, Minister Marais.

## **INTERPELLATIONS**

### *Mass shootings: curbing of*

#### **1. Mr M Xego asked the Acting Minister of Community Safety:**

What are her Department's plans to curb mass shootings that have claimed several lives in areas such as Manenberg, the Endlovini Informal Settlement and the Enkanini Informal Settlement over the past weeks?

The ACTING MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Speaker, thank you, hon Xego, for this question. While I strongly condemn these senseless killings, I wish to once again convey my sincere condolences to the family and loved ones of those who have lost their lives to these heinous acts of violence and crime. I call on anyone with information regarding these shootings which could assist SAPS in their investigation, to immediately come forward and report such, either to the local station or by calling Crime Stop on 0860010111.

We must all play our part and assist those who are denied the freedoms enshrined in our Bill of Rights and the right to live in making our community safer for you and those around you. Through its constitutional mandate of oversight the Department of Community Safety supports Neighbourhood Watches in the community. From September 2020 to date the Department has supported 32 Neighbourhood Watches structures in Khayelitsha, of which nine received funding, 14 resources and six received training. The Department is currently looking to increase the support as the budget and capacity allows.

In partnership with the City of Cape Town, the Department launched the Law Enforcement Advancement Plan, which deployed 1 102 law enforcement officers in the crime hotspots to enhance law enforcement capacity and to support the South African Police Services in the Western Cape.

Manenberg as well as the Endlovini and Enkanini informal settlements in Harare all form part of the said deployments. Almost 90 LEAP members are deployed on a 24-hour basis seven days a week. The SAPS have a constitutional mandate to prevent, combat, investigate crime and are responsible to ensure that effective and efficient measures are put into place to prevent such occurrences from happening. The Department of Community Safety through its oversight mandate, conducts oversight visits to oversee the effectiveness and efficiency of the police. The priority crime hotspots policing areas are prioritised with regards to oversight visits. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, I now recognise the hon member Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you. †Somlomo [Speaker] and thank you to the Minister for the response. Apart from the three townships that were mentioned mainly in the said question, just recently between March and April there have been concerning reports of gunshots and further mass killings in a number of communities within the Western Cape. The recent mass shootings took place in Jerusalem informal settlement in Delft on the past Sunday, and three people were killed and shot there. The same weekend a disabled man was shot and killed in Belhar by robbers of a spaza shop. In Hanover Park the unidentified body of a man was discovered, whilst two others were also shot and injured elsewhere.

In the Lost City in Mitchells Plain, Lavender Hill, Bonteheuwel and Wesbank gunshots have been an order of the day so what we want to understand now, hon Minister, is that the crime does not stop only with murder. We expanded to take this into account – physical assaults, sexual crimes, robberies and all the forms of atrocities that are faced by our people. The problem then starts when the communities are taking the law into their own hands. Now what we want to understand is that having faced all these recent forms of mass shootings and styles and everything that dominate our communities, what are other alternative plans that the Department has in ensuring that we protect our people and we curb these mass killings, in particular where criminals have never been brought to book. So, if we can be able to understand the

Department's plan as far as this is concerned, because I would assume that these challenges would require a different approach than what has been previously utilised, so what is the Department aiming to see to it that there is change in that regard? Thank you very much. Somlomo.

The SPEAKER: †Enkosi Ngconde. Siyabulela. [Thank you Ngconde. We are grateful.]

Hon members, now I call upon the hon member Allen to address the House.

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you so much, Speaker. I trust that I am audible.

The SPEAKER: You are. You may proceed, hon member.

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you so much, Speaker. Speaker, through you, I wish to welcome the Minister's initial reply to the question posed by the EFF as well as welcome the EFF's input.

Speaker, I think it is noteworthy to mention here today that following the five murders which occurred in Manenberg, which I firstly want to commend the decision taken by the Premier, by the Minister as well as the Department to ensure that the LEAP Reaction Unit was deployed to Manenberg as quickly as possible. I have visited Manenberg and saw firsthand how the unit further capacitated and bolstered the operations led by the Anti-gang Unit as well as the Metro Police, which are aimed at curbing gang violence in the area.

Speaker, there can be no doubt that efficient service delivery is best achieved through cooperation between different spheres of Government. I thus call on the National Government to urgently address the under-resourcing in our province.

Speaker, the Safety Plan is working and we have seen the countless successes in our communities with the LEAP programme showcasing how the Western Cape goes above and beyond the mandate of a provincial government, but more importantly also, Speaker, is that the Western Cape Government and the City of Cape Town are testament that capable Sub-National Governments have the ability to keep our residents safe, but we also know that SAPS as the leading agency, plays a vital role and we wish to ascertain from the Minister, through you, Speaker, whether there has been any discussions further with SAPS with regard to addressing the skewed allocations within our province. In Khayelitsha, for example, all three of those stations that cover the areas in Khayelitsha, have a police-to-population ratio which is far above the provincial average, and they have a 12% vacancy rate. Thank you.

†Die SPEAKER: Dankie, agbare lid, jou tyd is weg.

[The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, your time is gone.]

†Mnr R I ALLEN: Baie dankie, Speaker. [Tyd verstreke.]

[Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you, Speaker. [Time expired.]]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. †Meneer, baie dankie. [Sir, thank you.] Hon

members, I now recognise hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Speaker, Hon Speaker, the mass murders are not new and are becoming a norm in the province. In September 2021, three young girls were shot dead in execution style in Site B, Khayelitsha. A month later a mother of three lost her life in a drive-by shooting at a 21st birthday party in Montclair, Mandalay, which left seven others injured. In 2022 eight deaths were reported in Manenberg in one weekend. In Delft three people were shot dead in an informal settlement. Last week in Khayelitsha there were mass shootings; mass shootings were reported between March and April, involving five, six and three deaths, respectively.

Speaker, why are these murders only happening in poor communities and not in affluent suburbs where the hon MECs, their families and DA voters reside? What are the causes? What are the root causes of these violent crimes in poor working-class communities?

Part of any safety strategy is to provide answers to these questions. The Safety Plan only pays lip service to addressing causative factors of violent crimes. Four of the mass murders I mentioned above took place in informal settlements. What are the plans of this Government to improve accessibility and lighting in these informal settlements? In all the mass shootings I mentioned above, police made arrests in only two. If there were CCTV cameras, more perpetrators could have been arrested. What are the plans of this Government to install CCTV cameras in these murder hotspot areas?



Lastly, as the bloodbath continues and the body count rises, the Premier is caught in DA party politics and cannot appoint a fulltime MEC for Community Safety. In all these mass shootings, MEC, how many families did you visit and how many incidents did you go to?

A video shared by JP Smith demonstrates how CCTV cameras can assist SAPS in policing crime. Why not invest in the installation of CCTV cameras in the crime-ridden areas? Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Enkosi. Hon members, I now recognise the hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, the concern that we as the ACDP have and I understand the role of the oversight role, but if you spend millions of rands on the LEAP officers, surely there must be some results. I want to ask two questions. The one question is on Neighbourhood Watches. I just heard the Minister said nine receive funding out of 32 in Khayelitsha. Now, we know, I have addressed this before, because Neighbourhood Watches only receive R10 000 for the entire year. Not much to do and I said this, if you go from area to area, some areas do not need the R10 000. Others need more than R10 000 because they do not have cars. They do not have the necessary equipment, so I want the Minister to look at that, and the other question I want to ask, what happened to the ShotSpotter? We here in this, previously we were briefed in the previous administration on the ShotSpotter, millions and millions of rands went into the ShotSpotter, and

no results. So is that millions wasted by the City of Cape Town because that was the initiative by JP Smith and we want to know what happened to the ShotSpotter because you see, you see it on Facebook, crime has gone down.

We see it on Facebook that Nyanga is no longer the murder capital, by the DA, the DA – the LEAP officers work, but in the lives of these people, these mass killings, we do not see it working. So, I want to ask you, Minister, to look at the money that is given to Neighbourhood Watches and why are only nine out of 32 – I am just talking about Khayelitsha – accredited; why are they not being assisted and what is the picture in the Western Cape when it comes to Neighbourhood Watches because I believe that is where we can make a difference. Thank you, Speaker. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. Order, hon members, order! [Interjections.] Hon members, I now recognise the hon member Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you †Somlomo. [Speaker.] Another issue which is concerning, hon Minister, is a lack of using relevant and proper technology to fight and combat crime. It is no longer enough for one to stand up and say we have employed more boots on the ground and use money to employ more law enforcement officers, but at the same time, the rate of crime is not slowing down.

It is high time that we invest and learn from more developed countries on the use of technology to combat crime. We must enter the realm of using drones

and predictive analytics as mechanisms to both prevent and fight all sorts of criminal elements. What I wish therefore, to understand, Minister, is that having said all this, I would like to ask the Minister why the use of such technology has not been piloted as part of the Safety Plan, and whether there are plans to make use of a similar technology to combat crime, and perhaps if it is used well and also successfully, maybe the South African Police Services will also draw relief on that, because putting the lives of Neighbourhood Watches and as well as the Community Police Forums that are assisting on their own as human beings, will not deliver the ultimate results. What is a possibility is that the Department would employ other technological options to ensure that we combat crime, and also monitor crime in our hotspot areas. Thank you very much. Somlomo.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Xego. Hon members, I now recognise the Minister.

The ACTING MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, Speaker. Thank you for everyone's input on this very... [Interjections.] I am going to ignore that.

The objective of the Western Cape Safety Plan is to halve the murder rate in the province over the next 10 years via integrated law enforcement, social cohesion and urban design interventions and these interventions are based on data and evidence and are designed at addressing the challenge of violence holistically, guided by whole-of-society and whole-of-government approach.

To date the total, as I have mentioned, a total of 1102 LEAP officers have been appointed in terms of the LEAP. The decrease in the murder rate in the Western Cape for the last two quarters is the biggest indicator of success.

The LEAP officers confiscated 161 firearms, searched 415 434 persons, confiscated 918 dangerous weapons, confiscated 18 900 litres of alcohol and conducted 4 546 joint operations with SAPS, and accordingly Neighbourhood Watches, we are looking to support more and did allocate budget in our budget cycle now for the Neighbourhood Watches. We again call on the National SAPS Minister to fill the vacant posts and reduce the understaffing gap within SAPS in the Western Cape. It quite frankly is a matter of life or death. I thank you.

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie, agbare Minister. Baie dankie.

[The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Thank you.] Hon members that concludes the Interpellations.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: We are now going to head straight to the Questions for Oral Reply. Hon, the Leader of the Opposition is not really helping me today. Hon Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Mr Speaker. For the House to note that by agreement with the questioner, Oral Questions 1 and 3 will stand over.

Thank you.

## **QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Madam Chief Whip. Hon members, let us now observe that Questions 1 and 3 will stand over and that has been recorded as such. Thank you, Madam Chief Whip.

[Questions 1 and 3 stand over.]

The SPEAKER: Now we now move to Question number 2, hon members, and I will now recognise the hon, the Minister.

### *Medication: shortages*

#### **2. Ms N Makamba-Botya asked the Minister of Health:**

Whether any clinics and hospitals in the province are experiencing shortages in medication; if so, what is her Department doing to address this?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Yes, thank you, Speaker. I will not be able to put my camera on, because of the location where I am in regard to the bandwidth.

Thank you, member Makamba-Botya, Ngombuzo, for the question.

About medications and the shortages: generally in South Africa, the medication procurement is managed through central contracts by the National Department of Health. In all provinces, including the Western Cape, there may be sometimes a shortage, but we will normally always have these alternatives that are available.

In the Western Cape we have got the Cape Medical Depot that places orders and once deliveries are made, which may be partial deliveries, not necessarily all of them, the stock received is apportioned to ensure all facilities receive stock, even if it is not the full order quantity. The facilities that have an electronic pharmacy system, they can electronically review stock levels at other facilities and then arrange redistribution of stock; through redistribution of stock and making available alternatives, the Department can ensure clients continue to receive the medication appropriate for their conditions.

For example, in the event of supplier performance, where there is a poor supply and resulting in low stock levels, our Cape Medical Depot will use their best endeavours to source alternate supplies available so as to meet the Department's needs.

The National Department of Health is approached to procure medicines from international sources using the relevant legislation as well so generally it is

the NDOH who does the procurement for all provinces. Provinces submit their request on an annual basis, and the contractors and the tendering system – this normally happens around after three years by the National Department of Health. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I now afford the opportunity to hon Makamba-Botya. Remember, hon members, the approach here so that you do not forget. I know we do not have these sittings a lot these days. It has been budget processes. The first opportunity is to the member who posed the question and then if the member does not have a question to follow up, then all the other hon members will then be able to pose questions, but you all lift your hands now as an intention. I see the hand of hon Wendy Kaizer Philander. You will speak after the hon member who has asked the question. So, I now recognise the hon member Makamba-Botya.

Unksz N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Enkosi Somlomo, ndibulele ku Minister ngempendulo yakhe but ndifuna ukuqonda ku Minister njengoba esithi I procurement yale ye medication yenziwa e province ingaba I benchmark yabo is based on what because into ebangela ndibuze ngolohlobo ...

*[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]*

[Thank you Speaker and thank you to the Minister for her answer but I want to find out from the Minister as she is saying that the procurement of this medication is made here in the province. What is their benchmark based on

because the reason I am asking is] †because we have a serious problem †eyenzekileyo Ceres. [that happened in Ceres.]

In Ceres, the Ceres community was up in arms over the past few weeks complaining about shortages of medication in their clinics and that even after queuing for hours in the searing sun, when they eventually got their turn to be assisted, they were told that there is no medication. So, I want to understand from the Minister in terms of the acquisition of the medication, what is it based on regarding making sure that it is sufficient for everyone who needs medication, especially in the public clinics and the public hospitals? Thank you. Somlomo.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Makamba-Botya. I also note the hon Windvogel. You have been noted. You can keep your hands up. The hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you. It depends, honourable, I am making an example. If it is mostly the chronic medication that is not available, like cancer medication, in most instances it will have been probably as a result of National in regard to that, but there were times where we did not have some of the cancer medication at the time, because they did not put that particular item in their tendering process, or they have put up an alternative, an alternative to that kind of a treatment. So, in some cases, for example, I do not have any information in regard to the specifics of the medication that †bebeyikhalazela. [they were moaning about.]



But generally, in some instances, it is about when they feel [Inaudible.] “I was deserving to have a Panado...” It cannot be [Inaudible.] where you will find that in terms of the essential drug list, in terms of providing that particular medication it is not necessary that we even have to give on that particular case, so it is always case by case. There was a time also where †kwakhe akwabikho ifamily planning [there was no family planning.]

Family planning, I think it was in Gansbaai, a clinic, where there were no particular – I think it was an injection for family planning that was not available, but it was because of the whole overall supply even to South Africa. There was a time where there was no BCG, only to find that it was because of unavailability of the raw ingredient that is coming from elsewhere, I think, from India and so forth, so it is always case by case but generally, for us, the medication we order as much as we have an understanding of what are the epidemiology and also the needs. I am talking now about the chronic medication, area by area, but generally †yinto engafane ibekho [this thing of medicine being unavailable is rare] unless it is related to the issue of the tendering.

As I indicated earlier, if it so happened that we end up out of stock because of the tendering unavailability from National, we always make sure that where now have to do a province to the individual pharmaceutical, but... [Inaudible.] because if there is now – the economy of scale will not be able to be applied. The reason that at the National level, a part of the country benefits generally, when you order for nine provinces, maybe if the Western

Cape needs 50 or 500 of a diabetic treatment and similarly with the other provinces, so in terms of economy of scale they could be able to get it at least at a far much better price in terms of [Inaudible.] discount, whereas if the Western Cape can order that only by themselves, that is why we always say for us that we can negotiate nationally in regard to what type of medication, but we procure locally. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, I now recognise the hon member Kaizer Philander.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Thank you very much, Speaker. Speaker, through you, Minister, the shortage of medicine directly speaks to the appeal that was made to President Ramaphosa to reform South Africa's Patents Act in order to ensure an equitable access to health products. Minister, from your response, it is very clear that shortages will occur in some instances and it is a relief here today to hear that in the case of the Western Cape Health Department that from the placement of orders, as you have responded, the placement of orders at the depot, the electronic review of the stock levels, the redistribution of stock and the provision of alternative measures to ensure that patients in the Western Cape are able to receive their lifesaving medication at our facilities. Minister, through the Speaker, how will the completion of the process to amend the South African Patent Law, how will that impact on the overall availability of lifesaving medication? Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Hon members, I now recognise the Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, Speaker, and member Philander. That was quite a tick kind of a question. I will try to unpack it based on my understanding.

One, it is about the Patent Law in regard to how it will have an impact on the availability of medicine. Just to give a brief background, I know that I am wasting time, Speaker, but just a brief background.

All medicines in South Africa must be registered to SAHPRA, the South African Health Products Regulatory Authority and when they have to submit an application, just like as we have been going through like for example with the vaccines, they have to follow a process which is the same process that is being used even for the patented medicine or even generic equivalent and the applications then depend. The patent can be 10 to 20 years and so forth and it can also expire. So with us, we make sure that, for example, whatever happens we focus on the active ingredient rather than the trade name. Just to make an example, we have got paracetamol, where it is also called Panado, because it is also produced by Panado, but whatever happens it is about that ingredient that we order, which guaranteed that it will always be remaining the same throughout, whether there was a time after the patents that Panado changed to Painamol or whatever, something else. So it makes it quite more stable in regard to the availability of the medication, in regard specifically to

the active ingredient, so in short the Patent Law, as described in your question, will actually not affect the medicine's availability. Then lastly, member Philander, I know that it is just semantics. In the health space, when we talk about the health products and medicine, we have to keep on thinking using the definitions as according to the Medicines Act, the Medicine and Related Substance Act in regard to that. I am just making an example. Some people want a patent that is not necessarily part of a medicine that is part of the essential drug list, even though it will have been approved by the SAHPRA, for example, it might be sold in some of the chemists, pharmacies that are not necessarily part of that is being utilised and approved as part of the essential drug list that is needed to be utilised in our health facilities. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, I now recognise the hon member Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you so much, Speaker. Speaker, it has happened in the past that the number of clinics in the province experience shortages of chronic medication, such as TB drugs and ARVs, and I really know the Minister explained what the factors are, the type of factors why there is this shortage, but what I want to understand from her, what measures are in place to avoid the reoccurrence of this and what are the details of clinics affected by the current shortages, if any, because at the moment it is not a new thing; it has been for years the same story. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Windvogel. I now recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, Speaker. Thank you, hon Windvogel. Unfortunately, there are things that are beyond our control – as Health Services is a concurrent function between National and Provincial; in as much as that they do not own hospitals, they do not own patients, they do not own health professionals, it is the provinces. So that is why we keep on saying that in some other aspects the issue of subsidiarity and also decentralisation, when the decisions are being made, all other elements of strengthening the health system are done at a local level. It makes it easier for us who are these local levels, I mean at the provincial level, to be able to execute some of these.

Just to make one example, Speaker, during COVID in December 2020 when the whole country, specifically the coastal areas, us specifically because we were the one who was hit the hardest, and also the Eastern Cape with COVID that time, we were about to run out of oxygen. If we would not have received oxygen within less than 12 hours at the time during that Christmas, it means that all our hospitals would have already run out of oxygen, because actually there was nothing from the private sector. But the issue it was about, they centralised one service provider for the whole country to provide oxygen and at the time when we were calling, because it was during the Christmas period, even the bosses of that company they were nowhere to be found. So we have to [Inaudible.] whatever it was in order to make things work, so I am making

that example. I am coming back to the issue of the procurement of medicines, that we have National that has to contract, as I indicated, Speaker, that in terms of economies of scale, it is okay where in terms of the decisions, I mean the negotiations, that they could do it on behalf of all the provinces, but the issue of the procurement should be at the local level. I am not sure if it was also prior to COVID, I remember at the time Dr Beth Engelbrecht was here, where we had to be running around trying to get access – it was cancer medication, hypertension medication that I recall at the time, it was nowhere to be found, where we have to rob Paul and pay Pauline, where you find that, okay, there are two or three somewhere at Beaufort Hospital, but we need more for these patients in whatever hospital. The issue was about the time because they normally review these tendering systems after three years. At the time it was about them missing out to add some of the other items when they were tendering the specs.

Unfortunately, how it works with pharmaceuticals, they will focus more on where there are orders, so they ended up not procuring, I mean in terms of producing that specific drug, and yet it was still part of public health of the essential drug list. Just imagine now, Speaker, where now you have to take extra money; remember, we pay these in advance. When you have to take extra money now, you have to do the bilateral dialogue conversations with the individual pharmaceutical companies where we have to beg them: “Can you please do ABC urgently?” So the question is how do we ensure that there is procurement, all of those where we find that the procurement system rests with National, it is beyond our control. It means we are still going to

be suffering in that regard, but because of availability of medicine, it is part of the packages, you have to make sure that at least we have to do something about it. So that is why, Speaker, now at a local level, if there is no medication – let us say some medication in Garden Route, even if probably it is because of the National tendering, but there is still the same medication in another district, because of the electronic system. You could be able to say: “So and so, can you please, man, lend us this clinic and whatever the medication”, and then lastly, Speaker, at the advantage of our health system where we have a strong district health system and a strong sub-district system, it makes it easier that CEO of that hospital for example, Witzenberg, there Doctor... [Audio connection lost.] ...for the whole of Witzenberg, so if there is no medication in Clinic A or Clinic B, they could be able. That is also part of their management, the pharmaceutical person, chief pharmacist who is responsible for all the medication in that particular sub-structure. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I have the last hand now. I see your hand, hon Philander. Are you still on the floor?

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Yes, thank you, Speaker. That is a fresh hand.

The SPEAKER: You may go ahead, hon member.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Minister, I note in your initial response to

the question in terms of how the Department monitors supplies, how they redistribute and provide for alternatives. You have partially covered me by your latter response, Minister, but I want to ask specifically in terms of the emergency measures that are instituted especially by National Government, who administers these central contracts in terms of medicine procurement and if the Minister can please give us an indication of what the holistic effects are on provinces? Thank you very much, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kaizer Philander. I now recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, Speaker. Yes, member Philander, as you alluded to that I have covered some aspects of your questions, but just in addition to what I have already covered. Again, Section 21 of the Medicines Act and Related Substances Act, it does talk about when the NDOH engages directly with the suppliers or even externally, they could be able to even register, to import a drug that is not necessarily registered yet in terms from SAHPRA, where they could use it as part of a Section 21 for human use. One example is Ivermectin for human use, not only for animals in this case. So, there are various ways of making sure there is availability of medicine but also there are also ways to make sure... [Audio connection lost.]

The SPEAKER: Your line is not helping you there.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Sorry?



The SPEAKER: Your line is on and off.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: The runaway, probably... Okay, I think I have covered, Speaker, so thank you.

The SPEAKER: There is a *tokoloshe* there, man.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: I do not know. [Laughter.] No, I do not know what is happening. Thanks, Speaker, because I have not moved, I have stayed in the same place.

The SPEAKER: All right. Okay, thank you. Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, this has now ended this particular question. We do not have the luxury of more speaking opportunities. I see you, hon Makamba-Botya. We have four follow-ups and yours was number one until the fourth, so I will advise that in future if you want to speak again you keep your hand up, then it makes it easier, because your hand was not up and the other members hands were up. My apologies for that Manxuba.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: †Somlomo [Speaker.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. May I now move to the next question and that is Question number 4 by hon Allen asking the question to the hon Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport, in that capacity. Hon Minister.

*Lockdown regulations: changes to*

**4. R I Allen asked the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:**

With regard to the decision by the National Cabinet and the National Coronavirus Command Council to alter some lockdown regulations on 22 March 2022:

- (1) What impact will the allowance of 50% capacity at all venues have on her Department's plan for COVID-19 recovery in the sporting and cultural sectors;
- (2) Whether her Department foresees any financial implications in terms of expenditure and revenue as a result of the new regulations; if so, what are the relevant details?

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Baie dankie, Speaker. Met betrekking... baie dankie aan agbare Allen vir die vraag.

Met betrekking tot die besluit deur die Nasionale Kabinet en die Nasionale Coronavirus Bevelsraad om sommige Inperkingsregulasies op 22 Maart 2022 te wysig, die Departement verwelkom die terugkeer van toeskouers na vermaaklikheids- en sportbyeenkomste aangesien dit deurslaggewend is vir die herstel van die ekonomie na die impak van die COVID-19 pandemie.

Mense wat ingeënt is of onlangs 'n negatiewe COVID-19 toetsuitslag getoon het, sal nou sportgeleenthede in stadions, musiekkonserte en ander sosiale geleenthede kan bywoon. Binnenshuise- en buitelig lokale kan nou tot 50% van hulle kapasiteit gebruik sonder 'n maksimum beperking solank die kriteria vir toegang bewys van inenting of 'n COVID-19 toets van nie ouer as 72-uur is nie. Waar daar egter geen voorsiening vir bewys van inenting of 'n COVID-19 toets gemaak word nie, sal die huidige maksimum beperking in werking bly naamlik 'n 1000 mense vir binnenshuise geleenthede en 2000 mense vir buitemuurs. Die provinsie het talle groot sport- en kultuurgeleenthede, insluitende die Kaapstad Fietstoer, ABSA Cape Epic, die Mejuffrou Suid-Afrika Kompetisie en die Kaapstad Marathon aangebied en data van die verskillende hoëprofiel sportbyeenkomste toon dat die getal infeksies baie laag was.

Daar het verskeie lonende ekonomiese aktiwiteite regoor die spektrum van die waardekanal, insluitend die gasvryheidsektor, plaasgevind. Ons sien uit na verdere opheffings van beperkings op toeskouers en bywoning van geleenthede om die aanbieding van sport en kultuurgeleenthede meer finansiële lewensvatbaar te maak. Die Departement se ondersteuning van verskeie sport- en kultuursektore sal voortgaan volgens die mandaat van die Departement en soos in die Jaarlikse Prestasieplan van die Departement uiteengesit word.

En die tweede deel, die terugkeer van toeskouers na byeenkomste gaan 'n positiewe impak op die bedryf hê, aangesien dit aan praktisyns 'n geleentheid

sal gee om weer te begin werk en ook ander sektore te gaan ondersteun wat afhanklik is van werksaamhede in die sportarene en kuns- en kultuursentrums. Ons verwag om meer van die Departement se werksaamhede, wat in vorige boekjare negatief deur inperkingsregulasies geaffekteer is, te kan onderneem. Dit sal uitgawes in die betrokke kwartale verbeter, aangesien ons voorsien dat minder werksaamhede vir later in die jaar uitgestel sal word. Dankie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, Speaker. With regard to... thank you to hon Allen for the question.

With regard to the decision by the National Cabinet and the National Corona Virus Command Council to amend certain lockdown regulations on 22 March 2022, the Department welcomes the return of spectators to entertainment and sports events as it is crucial to the recovery of the economy after the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic.

People who had been vaccinated or recently showed a negative COVID-19 test result, will now be able to attend sports events in stadia, music concerts and other social events. Indoor and outdoor venues can now use 50% of their capacity without a maximum limitation as long as the criteria for access proves vaccination or a COVID-19 test not older than 72 hours. Where there is no provision for proof of vaccination or a COVID-19 test, the present

maximum restriction will remain, in other words 1000 people for indoor events and 2000 people for outdoors. The province presented numerous large sports and cultural events including the Cape Town Cycle Tour, ABSA Cape Epic, the Miss South Africa Competition and the Cape Town Marathon and data from the various high profile sports events show that the number of infection were very low.

Various lucrative economic activities had taken place right across the spectrum of the value channel, including the hospitality sector. We look forward to further lifting of restrictions on spectators and attendance of events to make the presentation of sports and cultural events more viable. The Department's support of various sports and cultural sectors will continue according to the mandate of the Department and as set out in the Annual Performance Plan of the Department.

And the second part, the return of spectators to events will have a positive impact on the industry, as it will provide an opportunity to praktisyns to start work again and also support other sectors that are dependent of the activities in the sports arenas and art and culture centres. We expect to undertake more of the Department's activities that were negatively affected in previous financial years by lockdown regulations. It will improve expenses in the relevant quarters as we anticipate that fewer activities will be postponed later in the year. Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, I have the hand of

hon Allen, the hand of hon Kama. That will be the order I will follow. If there are more we will recognise them. I now recognise the hon Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you, Speaker. My first follow-up in terms of the question, I just want to say thank you to the Minister for the reply, and I am delighted that the Department remains steadfast in promoting its vision of a socially inclusive, creative and active Western Cape. I want to double-check through you, Speaker, whether the Minister is able to elaborate on steps taken by the Department to mitigate the negative impacts that were caused by the pandemic with specific reference to the sporting and cultural sectors. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Allen. The hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, Speaker. †Dankie hon Allen, deur deurlopende kommunikasie en gesprekke met ons sportfederasies, die konfederasies, die geaffilieerde sportgroepe en klubs te hê, sowel as ons kultuur sektor en al ons vennote, kan ons behoeftes van hulle aanhoor en ons kan oplossings vind en dan implementeer dan volgens hulle behoeftes.

[Thank you, hon Allen, by having continuous communication and talks with our sports federations, the confederations, the affiliated sports groups and clubs, as well as our cultural sector and all our partners, we can listen to their needs and we can find solutions and then implement according to their

needs.]

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, Speaker.

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie, agbare Minister.

[The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.]

Hon members, I now recognise hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Speaker. To the hon Minister, through you, Speaker, I would want to check whether the Provincial Government, taking into consideration the economic impact that the MEC was talking about, is the Government in support of the decision to allow supporters back into stadia, and what engagement has the Department held with the Department of Health to manage the spread of COVID-19 in these sporting events? Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama. †Agbare Minister. [Hon Minister.]

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you for the question. Hon Kama, we are busy with the Regulations with the Department of Health and for sure, 50% is not the ideal so we would like 100% and we would like all our spectators back into our stadia and in our theatres, but we are working with Health to change or see what we can do for the Regulations

to have the full stadia back, as I have said. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, I now recognise hon Makamba-Botya.

†UNksz N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Enkosi Somlomo ndibuza kuMinister into yokubana njengoba siphumile kulento yeCovid 19 restrictions ingaba ikhona na into eyenzekayo or action plan eseyikhona kwidepartment ukwenza sure intobana izinto zibuyela kundalashé and if there is anything in particular ezobeneficta abantwana abahlelekileyo abahlala kwindawo ezifana nelantuka itownships ezilokishini so ndifunukwazi intoyokuba.

[Thank you, Speaker, I want to know from the Minister now that we are out of these COVID-19 restrictions is there anything happening or action plan that is already there in the Department to make sure things are getting back to normal and if there is anything in particular that will benefit the poor kids that lives in places like townships, So I want to know] †is there an action plan pertaining to that thank you.

†Die SPEAKER: Agbare, baie dankie.

[The SPEAKER: Hon, thank you.] †Enkosi kakulu [Thank you very much.] hon Makamba-Botya. Thank you for doing us that great favour. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you Speaker



and thank you for the question. As you know we do have a footprint in almost all our areas in our communities for sport and culture and we are working, as I have said, we are working very closely to our federations and our club development, and with all the people in the communities to roll out as best as we can with the Regulations at this moment. Thank you.

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie, agbare Minister.

[The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.] Hon members, I now recognise the hon member Allen.

†Mnr R I ALLEN: Baie dankie, Speaker. Speaker, vroeër het die Minister aangeraak rondom finansiële implikasies wat sy moontlik voorsien ten opsigte van die nuwe Regulasies, maar ek wil net uitvind, nè, in terme van die finansiële implikasies op organisasies en op dié wat deelneem in die sportterreine soos Rugby Wes-Kaap, die fiets-sektor wat baie geld verloor het as gevolg van COVID-19, het die Minister dalk 'n *estimation* of is daar enige iets wat die Minister kan verduidelik rondom hoeveel geld verloor is in terme van die COVID-19 *Regulations* wat in plek gewees het. Dankie.

***[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]***

[Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, earlier the Minister touched on financial implications that she possibly foresees with regard to the new Regulations, but I just want to know, nè, in terms of the financial implications on organisations and on those participating in the sports terrains

like Rugby Western Cape, the cycle sector that lost a lot of money as a result of COVID-19, does the Minister perhaps have an estimation or is there anything that the Minister can explain around how much money had been lost in terms of the COVID-19 Regulations that were in place. Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Allen, baie dankie. Agb Minister.

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Baie dankie, agb Speaker.

Ongelukkig het ek nie 'n getal wat verloor is nie, maar ek kan vir u sê dit was 'n geweldige groot impak ekonomies op al ons geleenthede wat gebeur het, sowel as op ons sportvroue en sportmanne, en op ons kunstenaars.

Wat ek wil noem, die KKNK was nou verlede week, en alhoewel die KKNK voel hulle speel gelyk, sou hulle dit waardeer het as ons honderd persent al ons teaters kon vul, want ons kaartjies was alles uitverkoop; ons mense was honger daarvoor. So soos ek weer sê, ek het ongelukkig nie 'n getal nie, maar as u dit wil hê dan kan ek dit vir u kry, maar dit het 'n geweldige invloed gehad op die ekonomie, vir ons kunstenaars en die Wes-Kaap.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, hon

Speaker.

Unfortunately I don't have a figure on what had been lost, but I can tell you it had an enormous impact economically on all our events that took place, as well as on our sports women and sportsmen, and on our artists.

What I want to mention is that the KKNK took place last week, and although the KKNK feels they are breaking even, they would have appreciated it if we could have filled our theatres hundred percent, because our tickets were all sold out; our people were hungry for that. So as I say again I unfortunately do not have a figure, but if you want it I can get it for you, but it had an enormous influence on the economy for our artists and the Western Cape.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, that concludes Question number 4. We now move to Question number 5 by hon member Plato to the hon Minister of Social Development. I now recognise hon Minister Fernandez.

*Youth Café initiative*

**5. Mr D Plato asked the Minister of Social Development:**

- (a) How many individuals have become members of her Department's Youth Café initiative since its inception and (b) how many more young people are projected to join this year?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Good afternoon, hon Speaker,

am I audible? Can you hear me loud and clear?

The SPEAKER: Loud, crystal clear.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you very much. Good afternoon to all the hon guests and thank you to hon member Plato for the question.

The answer is that since 2015 to date, the Youth Café initiative has reached 73,321 young people. Youth Cafés also submit quarterly reports stating the number of youths attending the programmes, amongst other things, to the Department as part of the transfer payment agreement.

So that is the response to the question as it was posed. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon member Plato?

Mr D PLATO: Hon Speaker, thank you very much, and also to the Minister for the question.

Just a short follow-up. Looking at the Minister's figures, does the Minister regard the Youth Cafés as a success?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Plato. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you for the follow-up question, hon member Plato.

Currently we have 12 Youth Cafés across the province. The introduction of the Youth Cafés has played a critical role in uplifting the lives of thousands of young people in this province since its inception. It is borne out of the Provincial Development Youth Strategy which calls for improving education outcomes, developing crucial skills for employment and opportunities for youth, mainly focusing on those not in employment, education or training, otherwise known as NEETs.

The Youth Cafés also seek to provide youth with a platform where they can access skills and personal development training, economic and social development opportunities, and creative spaces, where they are able to express themselves at a local, provincial, national and global scale.

Furthermore, our NPOs and Youth Cafes determine the programme content, focusing on work preparation, skills development and job placement, and these are critical skills that our youth need. The programme targets the most vulnerable, with a focus on the following:

Life and personal skills development;

Work skills development;

Leadership development;

Mentoring, and

Informal skills development, amongst others.

I would like to say that the progress we have seen in the Youth Café space has only been positive. I recently opened a Youth Café in Riversdale on 24 September, which was last year, and two weeks ago I opened the Sozo School of Skills in Capricorn Business Park, which is an extension of the Youth Café in Vrygrond.

So I would say to the hon member there is definitely a benefit to be had, and our youth are experiencing the advantages of having a Youth Café in their vicinity. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Hon Minister. I have the hon member Windvogel and hon member Botha. We will follow that order. I now recognise the hon member Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, given the increase in the NEETs rate and youth unemployment ...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Windvogel, you are soft. You can come closer and see with if your microphone will help you.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Can you hear me, hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Yes, ma'am, loud and clear. You may proceed.

Mr R WINDVOGEL: Thank you so much, hon Speaker. Given the increase in the NEET rate and youth unemployment and its impact on many anomalies faced by users, does the Minister think Youth Café is the best strategy and enough to deal with these challenges? And secondly, hon Speaker, whether her Department is in support of the view that there is a need to develop a Youth Development Policy for the Western Cape? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Windvogel. Hon Minister, did you get the question?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Yes, thank you, hon Speaker. To the hon member, thank you for the question.

The Youth Cafés are just one of the interventions aimed at youth, and the hon member was in the Standing Committee where I indicated the whole of government, transversal approach, and the fact that youth is being driven from the Department of Sport, Arts and Culture with other departments like Education, Health, in support of the programme.

So the response remains the same. It is one component of a much bigger, broader initiative to ensure that our youth get into jobs and that we upskill and assist them to take up their role in society. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, I now recognise hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Am I audible?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you are, ma'am, you may proceed.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you very much, hon Speaker and thank you to the Minister for that response. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Ms L J BOTHA: Hon Speaker, can hon member Windvogel mute herself?

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon member Botha, I will protect you from any member. You may proceed.

Mr L J BOTHA: Thank you very much. Hon Speaker. I just want to say thank you to the Minister for that response, but I also want to ask in regard to the 12 Youth Cafés that we currently have in the Western Cape, per district how is it spread? And then is there a plan at all to increase the number of Youth Cafés that we currently have? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Botha. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you to the hon member Botha. Hon Speaker, I have a detailed response and it can be forwarded, but I would just share where we have Youth Cafés:



Crossroads Youth Café, that is in the Metro.

George Youth Café is in Eden Karoo.

Oudtshoorn Youth Café is Eden Karoo.

Uniondale Youth Café, Eden Karoo.

Hessequa Youth Café, Eden Karoo.

Sozo Foundation is in the city.

Great Brak is in Eden Karoo.

Villiersdorp Youth Café is Winelands Overberg.

Bredasdorp Youth Café is Winelands Overberg.

Mitchells Plain Youth Café is Metro.

Gugulethu Youth Café is Metro.

Velddrif Youth Café is West Coast.

Saldanha Bay Youth Café, West Coast.

RLabs in Rocklands.

RLabs at Vangate Mall.

There are districts that do not have Youth Cafés. However, budgetary constraints prohibit us, in this coming financial year, from establishing more, but we will certainly try our best to keep the ones that are operating currently, and open, and support that, and hopefully when the economic climate changes, we will have to do an evaluation in terms of reach, and then determine what the next steps would be. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, I have got the hon member Sayed in the House. May you please proceed, hon member.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and my thanks to the hon Minister.

Hon Speaker, my question to the Minister is, given the responses now, is the Minister in support of the development of a coherent Youth Development Policy for the province specifically? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Sayed. The hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Speaker. I have said this on numerous occasions on numerous platforms, in terms of our whole of government approach, the Well-being and Dignity Youth Stream, which I lead together with Ministers Mbombo, Schäfer, Marais and Meyer, the youth strategic thrust is with the Department of Sport, Arts and Culture, and we sit and meet as a working group, and we are focusing around the Youth Initiative for this province, which DCAS is the custodian of, but we have our transversal meetings; we feed into Cabinet; we have a Mancom, and it gets presented at Cabinet. So I do support the approach that we have adopted. Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you for the question.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. No, †dit is klaar nou [it is finished now.] No, no more opportunities. [Laughs.] Thank you, hon members. Those who are connected virtually, there was a question whether there is another follow-up. We have now concluded this particular question, and the follow-ups.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, I now go to Question number 6. We do have a bit of time depending on the appetite of members. I will now go straight to the hon Minister Marais.

*K9 Unit: Swartland Municipality*

**6. Ms L J Botha asked the Acting Minister of Community Safety:**

- (1) What is the rationale for placing the K9 Unit in the Swartland Municipality;
- (2) Whether the unit serves and/or has an agreement with any other municipalities to provide assistance should they request it; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you hon member Botha for this question. To contribute towards making the West Coast region a safer destination, through the involvement of specialised services promoting professional policing, drug trafficking routes between Cape Town and the West Coast District or the Northern Cape Province, are mainly on the N7 and R27 West Coast roads, and the Swartland Municipality had the necessary infrastructure and willingness to enter into a partnership with the Department of Community Safety for the establishment of a specialised K9 unit.

This dedicated team of officers with special resources, that is dogs, in the West Coast region, are to enforce all legislation and prevent trade and transportation of illegal and illicit substances on these main routes and within communities in the West Coast region.

And the second part of the question, at the District Municipality a safety forum was established where all municipalities within this district are represented. This forum provides a platform for all safety concerns and requirements to be discussed or tabled. This is also the platform where the assistance of the K9 unit can be requested. Normally all operations are under the leadership of SAPS, which daily requests the assistance of this specialised unit, whereby integrated operations are conducted. Thank you.

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie, agb Minister. Agb lid Botha?

[The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon member Botha?]

†Me L J BOTHA: Baie dankie, agb Speaker, en dankie aan die Minister.

[Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you to the Minister.]

Hon Speaker, I just want to know from the Minister, in regard to timeframes, what is the timeframe for the complete capacitation of the Swartland and Overstrand K9 units that are currently being established, and also along the West Coast does a MOU exist between all municipalities in the district in regard to the use of the K9 unit? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Botha. Before the hon Minister

responds, just for the attention of the hon members, currently I have hon member Allen online in the virtual platform. I also have the hon member Kama in the virtual platform, and I have hon member Mackenzie in the House. I also have hon member Sayed. So it cuts at hon member Mackenzie, for the hon members who also wished to speak. Unfortunately, that is the nature of our Standing Rules at the moment. I will now afford the hon Minister to respond. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, hon Speaker. Thank you, hon member Botha. We do have MOUs in the West Coast District and with the Municipality, and then also the timeframe for the Overstrand. We just had our first meeting. So if everything goes well, our timeline will be in about the next six months. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon member Allen?

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you so much, hon Speaker. My question to the Minister is, I am firstly delighted that this particular programme continues to support the K9 units, which we know are in the City, Swartland and Overstrand, and there will be a continued support to establish K9 units in Stellenbosch and in Mossel Bay.

Is the Minister able to indicate whether there is a timeline for the implementation and the establishment of those respective K9 units in those parts in our province, namely Stellenbosch and Mossel Bay, which is

according to the APB. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Allen. †Agb Minister? [Hon Minister?]

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you. Regarding Stellenbosch, we are just in the beginning phase of the K9 unit. We did receive a preliminary request, that is for Stellenbosch. For Mossel Bay we have already allocated the budget for the K9 unit to Mossel Bay.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I now recognise the hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Minister, can you tell us of any successes of the K9 unit in the Swartland District Municipality since the establishment?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mackenzie. †Die agb Minister? [The hon Minister?]

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you. I can provide you, in writing, with all the successes, but I can mention that in the Malmesbury District they have been very successful with finding drugs, and also it was more or less more drugs, but I can give you the results in writing. They have had a lot of successes and we are very happy with the unit. Thank

you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, that was the last response to the question. I must say that ...[Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: Sorry, hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: ... we had – who is asking now?

Mr M KAMA: I thought you are keeping the best for last.

The SPEAKER: Oh, hon member Kama. [Laughs.] I skipped you. My apologies. My apologies, †mhlonipheki [honourable.] Thank you, hon Minister. Hon member Kama, it is your opportunity now.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, through you to the Minister, if the Minister could give some details around the criteria that are used to identify municipalities where these K9 units are deployed, because one thinks of Beaufort West that would be your entry level, and what would be the effectiveness in that regard? And perhaps on whether these dogs are all owned by Government, or are there some of them rented from private service providers? And what are the reasons for that?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Kama. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER FOR CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, hon member Kama. I will give the details for you, in writing, to all of your questions. I think that will be the best. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon member Kama, thank you, and hon members, on this particular question. The hon Minister has made certain undertakings and that is to correspond with the hon members in order to respond to specifics on the questions they have raised. That has been recorded and it will be followed as such. Thank you very much, hon Minister.

Hon member, that concludes the Questions, and this question in particular. We now move to Questions to the Premier without Notice. Hon members, you have got two follow-ups after you have asked your question. If you do not have a follow-up it is okay, but if you did not ask the question, you cannot jump into that follow-up. In terms of the list of the speakers, I recognise hon member August, that is the first member.

### **QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE**

Mr S N AUGUST: Hon Speaker, hon Premier Winde, you claim to run a clean ship and clean administration, but corruption and maladministration in DA-led municipalities are as rife in the Western Cape as in the rest of South Africa.

In George, a councillor invested R350 million of George public funds into



Old Mutual and got a slap on the wrist. When will you stop avoiding the issue and discipline your political senior, and I repeat political senior, MEC Bredell, on the second breach of the Executive Ethics Code, when he has failed to act on corruption and maladministration in a DA-led municipality?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member August. I now recognise the hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and before the hon member Sayed stands up, through you to the hon member August, thank you very much for the question.

The soon to be frontbencher, the hon member Sayed. [Laughter.]

But thank you very much, hon member August, for those questions. Obviously, these are very serious questions, and his opening statement was, “You run a clean ship.” and I definitely work very, very hard at that.

The first question he asked is about a local authority, and he knows, and I would imagine better than I do, that a separate sphere of government is Local Government.

So the first question he asks me is about Local Government, and of course my position as Premier in the Province and the role that we play in an oversight role over Local Government, and then he raises a specific issue in the George

Municipality.

Now what I know and can remember about this specific case that he reiterated here, but I believe that both the Hawks have investigated this matter, as well as the Public Protector, and that both of them have thrown out the issue.

So I am not too sure what else he would like me to do, or of course this Executive in this Government, but he also plays a role as a member of the Committee, and there is nothing stopping him using the Committee and the oversight that the Committee plays in also dealing with these issues.

I would imagine that he would then ask the Committee to call the Hawks and the Public Protector and ask them the same question. I cannot give him any further answers on that point.

On the second issue around Minister Bredell and the role that he plays as a Local Government Minister, and specifically the issues as raised by the Public Protector; now I am not sure whether he knows or not, but that in actual fact, we have taken the Public Protector's position on review, as many, many issues that have been raised here by the Public Protector we are taking on review, because we think that in a number of areas the Public Protector has overstepped the mark.

I personally met with the Public Protector on a roadshow not so long ago, and

of course again asked the Public Protector to come to the PCF, which happened this week. The Public Protector presented to all of the Mayors and Municipal Managers at our PCF, along with a number of us from the Executive.

There again we reiterated that of course the Public Protector has a role to play, but where we do not, or where a municipality does not agree, we will take it on review, and specifically this issue that has been raised, and raised by the hon member August, is being taken on review. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon member August, do you have a follow-up question? You may come through.

Mr S N AUGUST: Hon Speaker, I just want to correct the Premier. I did not say that they do run a clean ship, I said they claim to run a clean ship. So that is a different story.

Mafia style politics is playing out in the DA-led George Municipality, as a councillor and his wife have been getting death threats when he uncovered irregular appointments. In Swartland Municipality, MEC Bredell did not act on evidence of corruption, and now a councillor is threatened yet again by the Speaker of the Council. The MEC is clearly incapable of acting on misconduct in DA-led municipalities.

So my question is what will you do, hon Premier, to address the

incompetence that is MEC Bredell, and protect the lives of those that are uncovering corruption and maladministration and receiving death threats in return?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. Hon member August, in terms of the Rules, whilst you have the privilege of asking follow-ups, they must be linked to the first question. I am just trying to guide in terms of the statutes because if it does not, it becomes challenging. The hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Again, through you, and thank you to the hon member August for the questions.

I think the first one, obviously, I mean I get asked this question, I have no idea about this, but I would like to ask the hon member August to (1) probably within the next 24 hours to please submit the names of the individual councillors that are receiving these death threats, and also what he has done about it.

Obviously as a member of this House, if he knows that someone is receiving death threats, one will imagine that he has already also laid a charge with the police and raised it. I would like to have those details, and then I will be able to tell him exactly what I will do with that specific case.

On the case that the hon member is mentioning in Swartland, I am not sure if it is the same case because I do not have those full details in front of me, but

I presume it is to do with the sale of a piece of land, and I do know that the Hawks are investigating. If that is the case, they are investigating it at the moment, but again if there is a threat I need the names, and we will also engage then with the Hawks or SAPS and find out what is going on, because you cannot have death threats being received by people and nothing happening about it.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon member August, do you have a follow-up question? Alright, thank you, thank you. Hon members, I see the hon member Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Speaker, through you to the hon Premier. Hon Premier, following your announcement during your State of the Province Address, indicating that the Western Cape Government will embark on an institutional refresh of the Provincial Government, can you explain why the Western Cape Government decided to embark on such an institutional refresh process, and how will this process align to your vision for the Western Cape?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Van der Westhuizen. Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and to the hon member Van der Westhuizen for the question. Yes, institutional refresh and why? Obviously, I did speak about this at the State of the Province Address, but I think just for this House, once again, why would we embark on something

like an institutional refresh, or really even re-examine what we do, why we do it, how we do it?

I think at the end of the day, whatever we do, we do for the citizens who are our customers in this province, and we look at the data, I just think about the data that we have just received on the unemployment data across South Africa, as well as this province.

Often, I say that we might have the lowest unemployment rate in South Africa, the best absorption rate in South Africa, jobs absorption rates in South Africa, but quite frankly the really scary number is in this province, even though we might be the best, we have just gone to an expanded unemployment rate to 30,4%. That is frightening. That is really frightening.

I do not know how Premiers in other provinces are dealing with this because those numbers are sitting at the 50% mark, but 30% and 28% unemployment. That is a really, really worrying number.

So if we think about that number; if we also think about the environment we find ourselves in, both the ability for National Government, Provincial Government and Local Government to deliver on the mandate, deliver on the dream; if you think about the dream of the Rainbow Nation from 1994, if you think about those original ideas that were put on a table by the then President of our country, Nelson Mandela; if you think about our new Constitution and the ability that that Constitution gave us to put a government together in

order to deliver change to the citizens of our province or our country, in order to fix those problems of the past, in order to change those unemployment rates, give people hope, find the wherewithal that we can actually play a better, stronger role where we are here in the southern tip of Africa, in the world. Of course, those things come with giving opportunities to your citizens.

Now in our constitutional mandate, of course, primarily health care and well-being now, primarily education, preparing our youth, and then of course we have the social net, the social development role, the economic role, all of our other departments, the roles that they play in creating an eco-environment.

But quite frankly, if you think about water infrastructure and the droughts that we have had in the last while; if you think about our rail infrastructure and the ability for citizens to get to and from work or school or healthcare; if you think about all of the blackouts or the loadshedding schedules that we have, over many years and still the prediction of many years to come, from infrastructure at a national level and the ability for us to create jobs and change that unemployment rate; if you think of our province and the infrastructure demands in our province for more schools, we should be probably getting enough funding for 28, 30 schools a year; if you think about the healthcare demands and the growth in healthcare demands; if you think about Local Government levels, just issues raised in this House over the last sitting while on sewerage infrastructure, on road infrastructure; if you think about those three spheres of Government; if you think about private sector

infrastructure that is put in place that enables an economy.

I have spoken about infrastructure; I have spoken about mobility; these are the problems that we face. If we keep doing the same thing over and over again, and expect to get a different outcome, well that is the first sign of madness, right?

So we have got diminishing income; we have got the same Government as designed by our Constitution that has been in place for many, many years; expecting different outcomes with less money, and more and more and more demand from our citizens in all of those spaces, and many more.

If you do not analyse, if you do not relook at yourself and your delivery mechanism within government, you are never going to really make a difference where the demand is coming from the outside.

So about 18 months ago our Government sat down, it was actually at Techno Park, we had one of our *bosberaads*, and we spoke about what should we be doing differently. There is a vision. Now in order to deliver on that vision, is the system that we got in place adequate enough to deliver on the vision, to deliver on the demands that we see, and it was evident in that discussion that it was not.

So I said, well, let us actually start a process of refresh. Let us have a look and ask ourselves those questions, and we went through this process. It was



an involved process. I think I have said in the past, in this ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon the Leader of the Opposition. Hon Premier, you may proceed.

The PREMIER: Thank you. I hope he speaks via you when he interjects as well, Hon Speaker.

We started on this process. Some of the ideas put on the table were quite radical and they created debate, and – I am going to look at Minister [Inaudible.] [Laughs.]. We asked ourselves hard questions, should this department exist or should it be different? Or should that department or should we join departments? Should we separate them? Will we create new ideas and what are those blockages in the system, and we went through many months of different processes until it got to the stage of the SOPA, where I said, alright, let us have a look at what we should do now; the start of organisational refresh and understanding the why; understanding the pressure that our citizens feel every single day; what are those higher priorities?

We know that we have got to change the unemployment rate in our province; we have got to make this a province of opportunity, where you can find a job, where you can open a business, where you can get a skill to be able to play a proactive role in our Government and in our system, in our province, in the private sector, in the ecosystem of the Western Cape.

So we said, okay, what are those things that we need to do? We know we are

focusing on jobs, on safety and on dignity and well-being. That is where we are focusing. So what structurally should we change in the system?

That is how this refresh came about, and we said alright, infrastructure, the demand is infrastructure, both national, provincial and local, we need to up our game. Let us create a focus department that not only delivers what we deliver at the moment, and we are proud of what our Department delivers at the moment. They get clean audits; they get rated in South Africa as an outstanding department of delivering, but our Department then says, "But we do not deliver dams, or we do not deliver rail, and I am saying let us up our game.

I know we are not going to deliver it, but how do we up our game to make sure that we facilitate, we push, we cajole, we are meeting our national counterparts on a regular basis, we really make sure that all of those shortfalls are being dealt with so that we get the infrastructure right.

Our municipalities are working damn hard to make sure we get rid of loadshedding. So let us help them. Let us make sure that we get our trains up and running again. I looked at the latest plan from Minister Mbalula, I looked at that plan and quite frankly he says three months on his plan; I got some documents from Minister Simmers the other day, and I looked at that plan. Well, he will be lucky for three years if they really get their act together. There is a major issue facing that piece of infrastructure, our rail infrastructure.

Let us think about our port and the blockages in our port. There are lots and lots of infrastructure, and we need to make sure that we are doing whatever we can to change that.

The same thing with mobility. I have just spoken about rail, public transport, the issues with our taxi industry; how do we really focus on mobility? And then of course I have also looked at policing and safety. I am super, super proud of what we have achieved in the last two and a half years with the Safety Plan. On one of the programmes where we have said in 10 years we want to halve the murder rate. I heard the debates today in this House on some of those questions on safety, but quite frankly how do we make sure that this becomes a safer province?

Now that Plan, for 10 years of halving the murder rate, I am super proud of the fact that there is only one part of South Africa where we see the murder rate stabilising or coming down, and that is in the places that we are focusing the Safety Plan; where we have deployed our boots; where we are following in now with the violence prevention stuff; the area where it is changing people's lives and giving people opportunities. We have said a 50% reduction in five years. In Langa at the moment the reduction is 32%. Two and a half years, 32%. In Kraaifontein, 41%.

Okay, I do not know if it's going to stay there. We are going to have to work damn hard for it to get to 50%, but we are going to do it because we do not have all the levers. They sit at national level. Those are SAPS levers;

Criminal Justice System, but we know that our interventions are helping, and so at the same time as those interventions, how do we take it to another level?

Well, quite frankly, we are going to up our game even more on police oversight; on making sure – because it is not our job. The Constitution says it is SAPS’ job and the Criminal Justice System. I cannot sit back and listen to what was said here in this House about multiple murders and shootings and say, “Well, it is the police's job.” I am sorry, it is in this province. We will partner wherever possible, we will push, cajole, and we will make sure that we up our game to get this province safer for the citizens of this province.

Then of course violence prevention. That is the other part of it, with our Department of Health. They are really excelling in that space and the work that they have done, especially the learnings out of COVID-19, but now we are creating a dedicated unit that follows on the back of the deployment of those LEAP officers, where we have seen it already.

The HECTIS system is which measures trauma in our hospitals because what is the trauma? A shooting, a stabbing, a drug overdose. It is those communities that are affected, those murder hotspots, they face those same issues and so how do we up our game there as well on violence prevention? And of course, these are the areas where this refresh is focusing.

Now of course refresh does not just happen with an announcement from me.

It is a process now. Tomorrow, I engage with the unions, because we need to engage now on this process over the next year. We need to engage, we need to make sure that our team, here, the staff members that work for us in this province, are all on board with this change, we all are on board to say we are going to up our game, we are going to a new level. These are the new departments we have go to form, there are processes that happen, we will engage with the teams in our departments, and I am sure they are going to put ideas on the table as well that are going to say, well, if we do this and this we will get to another level, or we need to increase the skills levels because if we are going to create this department, who is going to make sure that we have got the right skills for energy. Or maybe we need to go and send people to university now in our team to upskill on landing green energy, because it is a new field, or water or whatever.

So that is the refresh system. There is going to be a roll-out. Of course, the Standing Committee also needs reports this year over the term as we start getting Refresh aligned and in place. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. I think, hon members, the challenge that we have is the time; it is always our enemy. Hon Van der Westhuizen, your follow-up has been swallowed by time. I see you have your camera active there, but in terms of the time I am tied up. My apologies and thank you very much to all the members who asked questions and those who intended to ask questions, and thank you to the hon, the Premier.

Now, hon members, we are going to move straight to Members' Statements as we have just concluded the Questions to the Premier. The first member statement is by the DA.

## **STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS**

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, may I ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: I recognise hon member Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, in response to my written question on special needs education. It was revealed that over the past five years the Western Cape Education Department has spent R785,7 million on the funding of special needs schools.

Just last year the Department had spent 25% more than what was provided in 2017. Learners who have barriers to learning are weighted according to the category of disability. Thereafter a learner then receives the amount that the public ordinary school learner receives, multiplied by that weighting for the category of the disability that they have.

These categories make provision for learners with mild to moderate intellectual disability, severe intellectual disability, epilepsy, physical disability and cerebral palsy, severe behaviour challenges and learners who are blind or on the autism spectrum.

These weightings range from a low 2,5 weighting to a weighting of six. For example, in 2021, a learner in a public ordinary school received funding equalling R1 466 from National. A learner who has severe intellectual disability carries a weighting of three. Thus, the amount allocated to the learner with a disability would be R4 398.

Special needs schools are an essential component in providing education to the 20,000 children who need it and require additional funding to make it possible. We hope that National Treasury will stick to their promise to review the determinants of the education variable of the Provincial Equitable Share formula this year.

The Western Cape has been lobbying for this issue to be addressed, as it is not sustainable for the province to bear the brunt of badly written formulas. We hope that our national counterparts will take this issue seriously and be cognisant of the needs of these learners in the Western Cape. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Baartman. Hon members, I now recognise the ANC.

Ms R WINDVOGEL (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker, am I audible?

The SPEAKER: Yes, ma'am. If you could lift up your voice a bit.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Speaker.

†Die SPEAKER: Dankie, agbare.

[The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Hon Speaker, in November 2021, DA strong man, Jean-Pierre Smith, and Premier Alan Winde, discussed the sexual misconduct allegations against Albert Fritz, through a telephonic conversation. In the conversation the Premier urged Smith to get the victims to submit sworn affidavits to his office in order to act against Fritz. In January 2022, Premier Winde receive six complaints from EPWP workers and interns in Fritz' office, exposing the rot of alleged sexual abuse and grooming of young girls by Fritz and officials in his office.

Fritz was suspended in January, pending the outcome of an independent investigation by Advocate Jennifer Williams. Hon Speaker, William's report found sufficient evidence that Fritz had created an environment conducive to sexual harassment or alternatively, taking advantage of young women sexually. Despite the Williams report being funded through taxpayers' money, the Premier refuses to submit it to members, which is a clear violation of Rule 221(d).

The Premier erred when he first discussed the DA sex-for-jobs scandal with his party before accounting to the Legislature. We hope that he has not shared a copy of the report with the FedEx as he continues to sidestep accountability in the Legislature.



The Premier also erred when he only asked Advocate Williams to investigate and did not encourage the alleged victims to approach the SAPS. It is for this reason the ANC demands that the Premier urgently reports the matter and hands the investigative report to SAPS for further investigation of the criminal elements of Albert Fritz's conduct. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Windvogel. Hon members, I recognise the EFF. Alright. I count one, two – no one? Thank you. I now recognise the DA.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Speaker, the Western Cape is working hard to grow our economy, but National Government needs to get out of the way in order to stimulate our economic recovery. The Airports Company South Africa has revealed that the influx of airline passengers to South Africa has seen a recovery of 53% in comparison to pre-pandemic levels, but, hon Speaker, most concerning is the fact that the arrival of international travellers to South Africa, which has only seen a recovery of 33%, is lagging behind domestic travel.

While we still see further recovery this year, a slow response from the National Department of Transport will dampen this recovery if swift action is not taken by making sure that airlines are able to come to the Western Cape and bring tourists directly to our shores.

Hon Speaker, we urge the National Government to play its part, and we urge

the National Minister of Transport to sign the bilateral Air Service Agreement that will enable Delta Airlines to fly a triangular route between Cape Town, Johannesburg and Atlanta. These flights do not pose any risk to our domestic airlines, and it will stimulate freight and passenger routes between the Western Cape and the United States.

The National Department claims that they will seize every opportunity to support the recovery of air travel in South Africa, but to date the Department has acted as a roadblock to this recovery. We wish our Provincial Minister Maynier much encouragement in his inter-governmental dispute to ensure that the interest of the Western Cape is protected. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Bosman. Hon members, I now recognise the EFF, hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Thank you very much, †Somlomo [Speaker]. Apologies for the previous incident; we had a problem with the network.

†Somlomo [Speaker] on 6 April, the EFF marked an important day in the history of South Africa where black people, who are the indigenous population of this country, came into contact with intruders who would later colonise, dispossess and rob them of their wealth in their motherland.

It was exactly on 6 April 1652 where employees of the Dutch East India

Company established a colonial settlement in the southernmost part of the African continent, where we are sitting today. †Somlomo [Speaker] what these intruders do next is a tragedy of untold proportions, which still haunt and continues to keep a black African child in perpetual poverty.

Black people were not only robbed of their land but were also robbed of their minerals that go with that land. The results today are such that South Africa remains one of the most unequal societies in the world, with those who stole the land and its minerals continuing to be rich, whilst black people languish in poverty on the periphery of the social structure that prevailed.

In the year 2022, the efforts of a black child to have access to land and mineral resources are blocked by a small provision in a piece of paper, called the Supreme Constitution, whilst these efforts to change the language of such provisions to distribute land equally have been blocked by a certain black majority political party, which is doing everything to retain the status quo.

The Ruperts and the Oppenheimers are the descendants of those who robbed black Africans of their land and dignity. These families continue to wield power and control every fibre of our lives, as those who claim to hold political power dance to their tune. When an opportunity presented itself for a black child to take back the land in 1993, a certain group of a few black individuals, who claimed to represent the entire black population without being voted to do so, sat around the table with the colonisers ...[Interjection.] and made sure that they gave away economic power in exchange for the mere

right to vote.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, †Somlomo. [Speaker]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Is that a point of order, hon Deputy Chief Whip of the ANC?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Yes, hon Speaker, but it is fine, I think you came in at the right time. I was going to say that the member's time has come to an end. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon Deputy Chief Whip of the ANC. I like it when the Whippery helps the Presiding Officers. That is exactly what I expect from the Whippery. Thank you very much, I appreciate that.

The hon member August, you have a member statement? Alright. Thank you, sir. Hon member Christians, member statement, okay?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the ACDP in the Western Cape is very concerned about the safety of the EMS

staff in the province. We urge the Western Cape Government to do more to protect our EMS personnel. They serve on ambulances; have answered their call, their profession to save lives. They live out their calling with dedication, commitment and passion.

When they respond to emergencies, to apply their training to save lives, their lives are in danger. In danger from the very elements that they need to protect and serve. They go into gang-infested areas where turf wars are the order of the day. They come face-to-face with death almost every day.

Now, hon Speaker, the problem is it has happened over and over again where they are threatened with their lives, and also, they are robbed at gunpoint, hijacked, and then they sit with the trauma.

So our urge to the Western Cape Government is to do more for our EMS personnel. We know of cases where patients that were fetched in townships; they were delayed and robbed, and patients died. So it is not only the lives of our EMS personnel, but also people – a young boy, I believe, that was 8 years old, died because they could not get to the hospital, because they were held to ransom.

So that is the plea from the ACDP. That the Western Cape Government does more to protect our EMS personnel. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians. Hon members, I now

recognise the ANC.

The CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: †Enkosi, Somlomo. [Thank you, Speaker.] The ANC rises today in support of the efforts by President Matamela Ramaphosa and his administration's leadership on the Ukraine conflict.

Our country has taken a pragmatic approach to the conflict instead of taking an ideological stance as this Provincial Administration has. Our National Government, led by President Ramaphosa, has put the national interests of South Africa first. Unlike the Western Cape Provincial Government, the ANC-led National Government will not put trade in general, and exports to Russia in particular, in jeopardy. We must ensure that we keep channels open and ensure that our relations with our BRICS partners are strengthened.

In 2020 alone, trade between the Russian Federation and South Africa was estimated to be at nearly R10 billion. However, we must also use this opportunity to condemn NATO aggression and expansion in Central Europe. As the people of the African continent, we are all too aware of what NATO did in Libya in 2011. Russia was not only the ally of many African countries and their liberation, but also today the Russian Federation continues to support many African countries in fighting, among others, poverty and insurgencies.

We also note the efforts by President Ramaphosa's Government in ensuring that the United Nations responds adequately to the humanitarian situation in

Ukraine. We commend the South African Government for insisting on the principles of humanity, neutrality, impartiality and independence when advocating a humanitarian response to the conflict.

The ANC-led National Government remains steadfast that only through an atmosphere of dialogue, mediation, diplomacy and de-escalation will the current crisis be resolved. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: †Enkosi [Thank you] Makwali. Thank you, hon Chief Whip of the Opposition. Hon members, I now recognise the DA.

Ms L J BOTHA (DA): Hon Speaker, we all want to see the children of the Western Cape thrive and achieve their full potential. We must commend the work and dedication of the Commissioner for Children in promoting the interests and rights of children in our province.

The Western Cape remains the only province with a Commissioner for Children dedicated to creating a society and provincial government which are accessible to children, meeting them where they are, and in ways that they need.

We must celebrate the programmes and projects that the Commissioner for Children has achieved in the last year, including appointing Child Government Monitors, who partner with the Commissioner in sharing their perspectives on children's rights, social justice and governance.

The insight has seen submissions made to the UN and to the National Parliament on the Children Amendment Bill of 2020, and while in June this year we will celebrate the second-year anniversary of the Office of the Commissioner for Children. We are excited about the continued progress to fully capacitate this office. In the 2022/23 financial year, the Western Cape Government has increased the allocation to the Commissioner for Children by R2 million.

This Provincial Government is serious about making the Western Cape a government focused on protecting, promoting and supporting our children.

Hon Speaker, let us wish the Western Cape Commissioner for Children well.  
I thank you.

[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member.

That brings us to the end of Statements. No, sorry, apologies. Let the Table staff – just assist me here. My apologies, I have looked at the wrong DA line there. I now recognise the Freedom Front Plus.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Hon Deputy Speaker, the Freedom Front Plus considers the replacing of the State of Disaster with new regulations by the Department of Health, published in the *Government Gazette* on 15 March,



with the supposed aim of managing any pandemic in the future, no more than a transfer of political power.

Its attempt to amend the National Health Act with new regulations means that the Government can simply continue to impose limiting economic restrictions. The proposed regulations are clearly not well thought out, and the Government has apparently learnt no lessons from the previous restrictions in terms of the State of Disaster.

The Freedom Front Plus warned against this in a Parliamentary Portfolio Committee on Health in October 2020 already. It is unacceptable that the Government is still clinging to senseless and restrictive regulations which have already caused the country so much damage. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise Al Jama-ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, several parts of the Western Cape, specifically on the Cape Flats, are ruled by gangsters and criminals. The City Safety and Security Mayco member, J P Smith's statement that the Delft Law Enforcement Advancement Plan officers have made consistent and impressive arrests, and confiscated arms, is laughable and an insult to the dignity of the people of Delft.

The DA must stop blaming National Government and be focused on eradicating gangsterism and crime on the Cape Flats. Every week there are murders of innocent children, women and men. The Department must listen to the people on the ground who daily experience the violence perpetrated by gangsters. Community policing forums have described the City's approach to crime as stagnant and outdated. Why must the Cape Flats and townships remain the playground for violent criminals? The City knows that the thousands of shebeens and drug dens are springboards for criminal acts, but refuses to take action.

Al Jama-ah calls on the DA-run Province to speed up the appointment of a Safety and Security MEC. We are still waiting for a full report on sexual harassment charges against your disgraced former Safety and Security MEC, Albert Fritz. It is a shame that the Province is delaying to make known the full report on Fritz and officials in his Department, guilty of sexual harassment of women staffers. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, one of the challenges in our country is inequalities within our society. History shows us that the role of women, their interests and even their needs have often been sidelined or ignored. Whether it is in the private sector or government, gender issues and interests have not always received

the care and attention that they deserve.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the gender mainstreaming seen in the Provincial Government, through its policies and budgets, is critically important if we are to offer women, youth and other marginalised groups the opportunities and support needed to reach their full potential. The Western Cape Government is ensuring that the needs and interests of these groups are considered in every aspect of their work. Take the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning: in its work, the Department is ensuring that it plans, approves, executes, monitors and audits its work in a gender responsive way, which is needed if we are to achieve our constitutional vision of a non-sexist society.

In the Department of the Premier, the Provincial Strategic Management Programme has embedded gender budgeting to ensure that the concerns of women and other marginalised groups are considered, and resources are allocated to their needs. Ultimately, these policies work to create an inclusive government where the act of caring, of protecting the vulnerable, and the recognition of the importance of each and every person is woven into the very fabric of our Government and our society in the Western Cape. Gender responsive policies and budget, hon Deputy Speaker, are the gateway to creating a functional, safer and equal society that we can be proud of. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. That brings us

to the end of Statements. In terms of Rule 145(6), I now give one or more members of the Executive present, an opportunity to respond to any of the Member Statements for not more than five minutes collectively.

Are there any Executive Statements being made? I do not see any: no. Thank you very much. That is the end of Members' Statements.

Hon members, we now move over to Notices of Motion. In terms of Rule 151, all Notices of Motions by members are required to be delivered to the Secretary to be placed on the Order Paper. These Motions have been duly submitted and published on the Order Paper below the line.

### **MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

Mr G BRINKHUIS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the Legislature discusses the decision taken by the Premier to ban Provincial exports to Russia.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the continued, traumatising and senseless attacks on the Emergency Medical Services (EMS) of the Western Cape.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the rising child hunger and food poverty in marginalised Western Cape communities.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

Ms L J BOTHA: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the state of local government and service delivery in the Central Karoo, and the impact of the Financial Recovery Plan on the Beaufort West Municipality.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the rapidly increasing inequality in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the opportunities for blended learning and the digital economy within the Western Cape.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates structural challenges bedevilling education in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

Mr L L MVIMBI: I give notice that I shall move:

That the house debates strategies to address accelerating unemployment, particularly among the youth, in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the Western Cape Government's irresponsible,

reckless, disingenuous, damaging and hypocritical handling of global conflicts.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

Mr M KAMA: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates strategies to enhance community participation in the fight against crime.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

Ms R WINDVOGEL: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the prevalence of sexual assault and violence against women, as well as the absence of a GBV policy and updated sexual harassment policy in the Western Cape.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: In terms of Motions, we now will move to Motions Without Notice.

So, just to reiterate, I would like to inform you that in terms of the Standing Rule 150, pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolence and

congratulatory were submitted to the Programming Authority prior to this plenary on 5 April 2022. Members are also reminded that Motions without Notice pertaining to congratulatory and to condolence will not be allowed in this sitting, that have not been processed by the Programming Authority.

I have been informed that in the Programming Authority Meeting of 5 April 2022, political parties did submit the names of hon members, in the desired order of speaking, and who had wished to move a Motion without Notice in this sitting of the House. I will therefore, just for noting and for the purpose of the minutes, call out the hon members whose names have accordingly been submitted and approved.

The following members motions have been approved by the Programming Authority as follows: hon Brinkhuis, hon Christians, hon America, hon Botha, hon America, hon Botha, hon Allen, hon Kaizer-Philander, hon Botha, hon Kaizer-Philander, hon Marran, hon Windvogel, hon Lekker, hon Lili, hon Kama, hon Dugmore, and hon Kama. I now put the motions duly submitted and approved by the Programming Authority to the House. Are there any objections? No objections. Agreed to.

The motions will appear in the Minutes of the proceedings and in Hansard in each individual member's name as if that member had read them aloud.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: I move without notice:



That the House recognises the International Cricket Council award to South African Keegan Petersen as ICC Player of the Month for January 2022; further recognises that Petersen is the Proteas' new number three batter who scored 224 runs in the three-match test series as the Proteas defeated India 2–1 this summer; notes that the 28-year-old Petersen, who is from Paarl, was also awarded Player of the Series; further notes that the independent ICC Voting Academy comprised of former players, broadcasters, and journalists from throughout the world adjudicated the award; acknowledges that he also played for Boland, the Cape Cobras, the Knights and the Northern Cape in national cricket; further acknowledges that his debut for Boland was in 2012 and his international debut for the South Africa cricket team was in 2021; and extends well wishes to Petersen for making his hometown, Paarl, and South Africa proud.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I move without notice:

That the House commends the Cape Muslim and Slave Museum after receiving a national accolade as the Preferred Heritage Destination at the Golden Shield Heritage Awards of 2022; notes that the Cape Times of 28 March 2022 reported that this award, coming a few months after the launch of the museum, is a great accolade for the museum, and also belongs to Cape Town and its people; notes that Igshaan Higgins,

founder and curator of the museum says, “Our museum is actually a showcase for social cohesion in this country. To receive such an award from the National Heritage Council is huge and will bring light into the Castle of Good Hope. The challenges that we suffered was that the colonial forces determined what our heritage was and particularly our indigenous people.”; notes that, through a visual story, the museum showcases the artistic and cultural heritage of Muslims in our country; notes that the museum brings attention to forced removals, the effects of Apartheid, the Immorality Act and the Mixed Marriages Act; notes that the museum raises awareness of the pain and suffering of our people in a chronological display that traces the history of the indigenous people of the Cape over a 400-year period; and notes that the work done by the museum is indeed commendable and worthy of this lofty award.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Mr D AMERICA: I move without notice:

That the House commends the efforts of the City of Cape Town and the organisers of the Cape Town Cycle Tour on the resumption of this race; notes that the 18 000 participants as well as the spectators of the Cape Town Cycle Tour brought a half-a-billion-rand boost to the local economy, especially the hospitality industry that was hard hit by the pandemic; and notes that more than 3 000 people were put to work as a

result of the event.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Ms L J BOTHA: I move without notice:

That the House expresses condolences to Joan Lottering, wife of the late Councillor Cornelius (Neels) Lottering, Councillor for ward 2 of Witzenberg, who died suddenly on 2 February 2022; and further notes that the community of Wolseley lost a dedicated and dutiful community leader.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Mr D AMERICA: I move without notice:

That the House commends the City of Cape Town's Traffic Chief Officer, Heathcliff Thomas, for dedicating 39 years of his life to working for the City's Traffic Department; and wishes him well on his retirement as he reaches the age of 60.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Ms L J BOTHA: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Western Cape Provincial Disaster Management Centre for receiving a prestigious award at the 77th Annual Batho Pele Award Ceremony in the category “Best Responsive Government Institution” for the year 2021/22; and notes that this is a reflection of the good and speedy responsive governance of the Western Cape provincial government.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Mr R I ALLEN: I move without notice:

That the House commends all the involved stakeholders, including the departments of Health and Cultural Affair and Sport, on the safety standards of the summer initiation season, which saw no fatalities among initiates; and recognises that these results represent the hard work of many stakeholders who cooperated to ensure the safety of this culturally significant period.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: I move without notice:

That the House expresses its condolences to the families of the more than 200 healthcare workers who passed away as a result of COVID-19; notes that, as residents of the Western Cape, we owe them a deep sense

of gratitude as they were the brave heroes who risked their lives in order to protect the society during the most difficult periods of the pandemic; and may their souls rest in peace.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Ms L J BOTHA: I move without notice:

That the House commends the Department of Local Government, the Provincial Treasury and the Beaufort West Municipality for working together to develop a Financial Recovery Plan for the municipality; and acknowledges the advantages of such cooperative relationships where service delivery comes first.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: I move without notice:

That the House commends Dr Barry Smith, the medical manager of the Karl Bremer Hospital, after he received the Silver Award in the Best Doctor of the Year category at the national Batho Pele Excellence Awards ceremony; notes that this award celebrates his leadership during the second wave of the pandemic when he played a key role in fighting COVID-19 at the hospital; and notes that we are forever grateful for his contributions during these pressing times.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Mr P MARRAN: I move without notice:

As we approach Easter, the House wants to wish those in the Christian community well over this time, which is one of the pivotal events in their calendar. Christians celebrate Easter to mark the Resurrection of Jesus Christ three days after his crucifixion. It's a time of peace and reflection. In our country, Easter is also a time when fatalities and injuries on our roads escalate. The House calls on all road users in the Western Cape to exercise extreme caution and patience and to be respectful of other road users.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Ms R WINDVOGEL: I move without notice:

The House is saddened by the passing of a stalwart of the struggle for liberation, anti-apartheid Muslim cleric and democratic South Africa's former Ambassador to Saudi Arabia, Sheikh Abdulhamied Gabier, a resident of Plumstead, Cape Town. Sheikh Gabier died last month at the age of 86 and will always be remembered as a person of faith who epitomized the unity and solidarity among different religious leaders in leading the internal part of the freedom struggle. We are filled with gratitude for the role this lifelong President of the Muslim Judicial

Council filled in the march to freedom. Our condolences go to this son of the Western Cape, his family, loved ones, community and our country.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Ms P LEKKER: I move without notice:

The House notes with admiration and appreciation the sterling efforts of the Proteas women's team that made it to the semi-finals of the cricket World Cup in New Zealand. They played tough, exciting cricket that won them many accolades. England beat them by 137 runs to stop them from continuing to the final. The Proteas stars were far from disgraced and went down fighting. They kept our flag flying high and proud. We salute them for doing South Africa proud.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Mr A LILI: I move without notice:

The House notes that our country is on the cusp of the beginning of the Muslim Holy month of Ramadan. For Muslims Ramadan is a time of fasting from dawn to dusk, reflection and prayer. Ramadan is a commemoration of the revelation of the Holy Quran to Prophet Muhammad (Peace be upon Him). It is also the most sacred month in

the Islamic calendar as it celebrates the origin of Islam. We wish our Muslim brothers and sisters a peaceful Ramadan.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Mr M KAMA: I move without notice:

The House wants to congratulate Lieutenant-General Sehlahle Fannie Masemola on his appointment as the new National Commissioner of Police. A career police officer, the general has been a police officer for 35 years and has the experience, insight and authority to turn around the South African Police Service and turn the tide against crime. He needs support from all law-abiding people in our country. We wish the men and women that he leads from today well in their battle against crime. Our country wants them to succeed. They can count on our support.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Mr M KAMA: I move without notice:

The House salutes President Cyril Ramaphosa for appointing a new National Commissioner of Police, Lieutenant-General Sehlahle Fannie Masemola. In appointing a dedicated public servant to head South Africa's only and official law enforcement agency, the President has



once again shown that his government is serious about fighting crime in our country. We congratulate the President on his choice.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I move without notice:

That the House notes the passing of Salesian Father Padraig Pat Naughton on March 23, 2022 and convey sincerest condolences to his family and loved ones; notes further that in 2021 Father Pat celebrated his golden jubilee of priesthood; and acknowledges that the fountainhead formed by St Francis de Sales flowed from Savoy into Turin in 1841 to be embraced by Don John Bosco, who devoted his ministry to creating practical and holistic support for young people affected by the Industrial Revolution — abandoned, lost, ill-educated and unskilled; and that it flowed into Cape Town in 1896, first to Buitengracht Street, then in 1910 to the Salesian Institute in Somerset Road, a cherished landmark and lighthouse of compassionate ministry that pulses to this day with an empowering and inspiring message of hope for those who are lost and, through Salesian skills training, find themselves.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Mr M KAMA: I move without notice:

That the house congratulates Mr Asisipho Solani, a member of the Western Cape ANCYL's interim leadership, on obtaining his Masters of Arts: Political Studies qualification from the University of the Western Cape and his graduation earlier last week.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will now afford the opportunity to members to move Motions Without Notice as per the Standing Rule 152(d). This could include Motions Without Notice that were not approved of in the Programming Authority meeting. Members are reminded that the 30 minutes as per Standing Rule 152(d) will start now. I recognise the hon Dugmore.

#### **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates President Cyril Ramaphosa and his Cabinet, together with members of the National Assembly, for defeating the frivolous motion of no confidence to Parliament last week, moved by the Leader of the Opposition, Mr John Steenhuisen.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved? There are objections.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Objections.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Object!

Ms L J BOTHA: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon members, are there any further motions? Yes, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that yesterday, April 6, 2022, marked the 43rd anniversary of the commemoration of the day that Solomon Kalushi Mahlangu took his last 52 steps to the gallows at the Pretoria Central, now renamed Kgosi Mampuru Correctional Services; remembers his message to the people:

“Tell my people that I love them and that they must continue the fight, my blood will nourish the tree that will bear the fruits of

freedom, Aluta continua.”;

Calls on this House to make April as hero’s month in honour of Solomon Mahlangu and many other liberation struggle heroes and heroines who paid the ultimate price for their fierce opposition to apartheid colonialism; and supports efforts to open an inquest into his death. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Mr D AMERICA: Object, object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon members, any further motions without notice? Hon Dugmore, do you have?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Just for the record, was that the hon member America who objected from the ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There was an objection and it sounded like hon member America. Thank you very much. Any further motions without notice as per the Standing Rules? Hon Kama and then, hon Makamba-Botya. I will

recognise you afterwards, hon Sayed. Hon Kama? Hon Kama, are you there?  
I am going to go onto hon Makamba-Botya, hon Kama can ... [Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA: Can you hear me now, sorry hon Deputy Speaker, I did not say  
I am not ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I can, I can. You may proceed, hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the continued bloodbath in the streets of working-class communities in the province following the death of Lameez Johnson, a 15-year-old schoolgirl who died in a shooting incident in Lavender Hill last Sunday, and that many other victims of multiple mass shootings were reported in Khayelitsha, Delft, and Gugulethu over the past few weeks; notes further that the recent shooting sprees, which have been characterised by some as a gang pandemic, expose the failures of the so-called Safety Plan which has failed to address the causative factors of violent crimes and ignored the need to address elements of spatial planning which makes the environment conducive to violent crime; calls for more reinforcement of LEAP officers in the crime hotspot areas; and commiserates with the family of Lameez Johnson and the many other victims of violent crimes in the province. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Are there objections? Hon member ... [Interjection.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Just ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Not to the content but because it is without notice.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is without notice. Correct. Are there any objections? I did hear a 'yes'. Is that correct? If there are objections, the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Was that correct, Table staff, did I hear a 'yes'? I did hear it ... [Interjection.] Can I just check: did someone objection online to that motion? In the House, okay. There has been ... [Interjection.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: It is without notice, not the content, without notice.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Correct. Noted. Thank you very much, I understand hon Mackenzie. Thank you very much. We now move over to hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House condemns in the strongest terms the killing of dear, old disabled Abraham Wingrove by an extortion gang in Belhar. Mr Wingrove was shot and killed whilst intervening to stop a marauding gang who were extorting money from his tenants who operated a spaza shop in his yard. He was shot at close range, multiple times, in cold blood. This goes to show that we are still living in a highly unsafe society, with criminals who have no regard for the disabled and the most vulnerable people in our society. It also shows that the gangs are still in charge in the Western Cape as we remain at their mercy. The EFF calls upon all the law enforcement institutions in the province to work together in defeating crime for the better and safety of our people. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to. We now move over to hon Nkondlo. You will bear with me, hon Sayed? Thank you.

Ms N D NKONDLO: †Enkosi, Sekela Somlomo. [Thank you, Deputy Speaker.] I move without notice:

That the House notes and commends the Gauteng Provincial Government on its efforts to pass into law the Township Economic Development Bill which will enable townships to become areas of employment and further enhance commercial activity in the townships; further notes that the ANC Government in Gauteng, which prides itself on valuing public participation and engaging with people, has since embarked on stakeholder engagements to drum up support for the Bill during the public hearings; and lauds the Gauteng Provincial Government which is taking concrete steps to develop a thriving township economy, unlike this Western Cape Government where there is a clear conviction to use State resources to advance and preserve a white dominated economy, while the black majority remains on the periphery as sources of cheap labour. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. ...  
[Interjection.] Are there any objections to the motion being moved? There are objections.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Objection!

Mr G BOSMAN: Objection, she must go to Gauteng.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order hon members, order. The motion will be



printed on the Order Paper.

Ms N D NKONDLO: With pleasure, hon Chair.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry, member. Thank you very much. I now move over to hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! Okay, you may proceed, yes.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and supports calls by the Hanover Park residents for disciplinary action to be taken against Ward 47, Councillor Antonio van der Rhee, for various grievances, including his failure to call a public meeting in the past four years, yet he continues to take drastic decisions like appointing ward committees with no public participation; notes further that this complaint together with 19 other grievances, including allegations of misappropriation of funds and manipulation of EPWP contracts, were given to the Mayor of the City of Cape Town, to the Speaker and to the DA Chief Whip, in successive meetings they held with the community between November 2021 and February this year; further enquires why these serious allegations that

have even reached the DA FedEx have not been given the necessary attention they deserve, or is the DA managing party divisions; and calls on the MEC for Local Government, the hon Bredell, to institute an urgent investigation into this matter. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there ... [Interjection.]. Are there any objections to the motion being moved? There are objections.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Object.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Object!

Mr G BOSMAN: Object, that was a statement.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, it is very loud. There are objections ... [Interjection.] The motion – order, hon members, the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Windvogel, you may proceed. Order, hon members.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I just want one minute, hon Windvogel. We have a

large, very loud meeting. Hon members? Hon members, thank you. Hon Windvogel, you may proceed.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that today, 7 April , the world observes World Health Day under the theme 'Our Planet, Our Health' to put a spotlight on global warming and the polluted planet, and to further highlight the inequalities in the world as exposed by the COVID-19 pandemic, and to make demands for the urgent need to create sustainable, well-being societies committed to achieving equitable health now and for further generations; and in contributing to this, calls on the Western Cape Government to make available resources to improve healthcare services for the poor, including the R150 million needed at Khayelitsha District Hospital; further supports efforts to fully implement the NHI and commits to establishing an Environmental Commissioner in the Western Cape. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Object!

Ms L J BOTHA: Object, object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections, hon member. We will then proceed to hon Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the decision of the Western Cape High Court which halted the construction of the Amazon's new headquarters built in this province. This is after the stakeholders involved failed to meaningfully consult with the Khoisan community who are the original inhabitants of the land and who also hold it in high regard as being sacred. We are tired of this Government making boardroom decisions with corporates without having regard and respect for the rights, customs, and values, culture and heritage of the original inhabitants of this land. We hope that this is a lesson that will set a precedent for future generations to come. The Khoisan are the original people of this world and this land, and they should be afforded the respect that is due to them. I so move. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Chief Whip, before I close the motion, I guess that is a point of order.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): It is a point of order, hon Deputy Speaker. It is my understanding, and I am not sure if it is correct, but I understand that there is a judicial decision pending on this matter. I am just trying to find the Standing Rule which says that that prevents us to discuss matters ...  
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: In terms of it being sub judice?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes. I cannot find the Rule at the moment, but I would like to raise the objection if there is a judicial decision ...  
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... pending.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon Chief Whip. If I may, hon members, I would like to rule on this and take some advice whether this is sub judice or not and whether this motion will stand, hon Xego, according to the Rule. So, I will take advice and I will revert back. Hon Sayed, do you have a point of order?

An HON MEMBER: We object.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, looking at Rule 63:

“Reflections on courts judicial offices and court proceedings”

I do not see a clear contravention, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): If you look at it. No member may, so if you look at the three points under Rule 63, there is no clear contravention thereof. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you for that interpretation. I think, based on the sensitivity, if I may still come back to a ruling, hon Sayed, just to be absolutely sure if that is okay. Thank you very much. Hon members, I am just going to go down my list. I see hon Brinkhuis also has a motion without notice?

Mr G BRINKHUIS: I am covered, hon Deputy Speaker, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are covered? Okay. But hon members, can I just take some advice there? Hon Brinkhuis, your motion is printed and was submitted. Are you not reading it or are you withdrawing it, that is regarding

the Holy Month of Ramadan? You have to read it into the record.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Yes, thank you hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

The House notes that the Holy Month of Ramadan commenced on 3 April 2022 in South Africa and Muslims throughout the world will observe the fast during this month; we further note also that Ramadan is the ninth month of the Muslim calendar, and it begins and ends with appearance of the crescent moon; and we also understand that fasting is one of the five pillars of Islam; further, we understand that Muslims fast is an act of worship, a chance to get closer to his or her Creator; and we acknowledge also that fasting is not only spiritually uplifting, but has health benefits such as it heals the body, it is good for one's mental and physical well-being and detoxifies the body; further we acknowledge also, the increased acts of charity to those in need and the moral benefits such as self-restraint, self-confidence, perseverance, and contentedness. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I am then

moving over to hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you or were you going to test that first?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute please, my apologies. I got a bit thrown there. Before we continue, are there any objections to that motion being moved without notice? My apologies, hon Brinkhuis. No objection. Agreed to. You may move over and move onto your motion, hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and lauds the South African Police Services for apprehending three suspects who were due to have appeared in the Blue Downs Magistrate's Court yesterday for the murder of off-duty Mfuleni police officer, Andile Sirhunu, last year; welcomes these arrests and calls on the judiciary to expedite the process to bring justice to the Sirhunu family. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to. I move over to hon Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:



That the House condemns the continued ... [Inaudible - poor audio connection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you there, Hon Xego, we cannot ...

Mr M XEGO: Am I clear? You cannot hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, repeat that, please?

Mr M XEGO: Can you hear me now, hon Deputy Speaker? I will repeat. I move without notice:

That the House condemns the continued attacks on members of the Emergency Medical Services in our townships. This follows an incident that took place this past weekend in Philippi where EMS officials attending to a scene were accosted and highjacked at gunpoint in which a female official was hit with a pistol before the criminals drove off with the emergency vehicle. This is not the first time we witness attacks on EMS officials in this province as they were prevalent during the height of the COVID-19 pandemic in the past two years. At the time, the EFF raised concerns regarding the safety of EMS personnel in townships, and our fears and discomfort were laid to rest by the Provincial Health Minister at the time who told us that there is a safety plan in place to protect EMS. Today it seems like the so-called Master

Safety Plan has failed, as these officials find themselves again at the mercy of criminals. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. That motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

Mr M XEGO: You object?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Xego, will you please read your last one. It is a quick one and I want you to just complete that?

Mr M XEGO: Ah, but they are objecting unnecessarily. Okay. I move without notice:

That the House takes this opportunity to wish the Muslim community a successful and prosperous Ramadan in the Western Cape Province and across the world. Thank you very much, I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Xego.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Support! Support!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. I now move over to hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: †Enkosi, Sekela Somlomo. [Thank you, Deputy Speaker.] I move without notice:

That the House condemns the double standards applied by the Democratic Alliance-led governance in the Western Cape when dealing with issues of gender-based violence and sexual assaults. This follows their actions in appearing to be pro-active at a Provincial Government level when dealing with former Community Safety MEC, Albert Fritz, for sexual misconduct allegations. The same party, hon Deputy Speaker, then turned a blind eye against their councillor at Theewaterskloof Municipality, Dawid Jooste, who is formally charged and appeared in court on charges of sexual assault. It then begs the question whether the party has a stance or a policy on matters relating to sexual assault and gender-based violence, and if they do, the next question would be: why is it applied differently to different individuals

of the same organisation? Well, be it as it may, Dawid Jooste must be suspended pending the finalisation of this case if there is some moral compass left in the DA. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are objections ...  
[Interjections.]

Ms L J BOTHA: Object!

Mr D AMERICA Object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper ...  
[Interjection.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: What objections?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections, hon members. Let us move on. I now recognise hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move with notice:

That this House notes that the alleged sexual misconduct ...  
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: A point of order. Hon member, please take your seat. Hon Chief Whip, what is your point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): We are dealing with motions without notice at this point.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, you do have a motion without notice? I am going to move on in the interest of time and hon Dugmore can come back. Thank you very much, Chief Whip. Hon Lekker, if you can begin and then ... [Interjection.] while hon Dugmore gets sorted out. Hon Lekker, what is your motion without notice?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, I withdraw hon Chairperson.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lekker, your motion without notice was submitted. You will have to read it into the record or withdraw it.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, no, no, I thought we were at motions with notice, that is why I raised my hand.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, but I have a motion without notice on the submission. One minute: hon Chief Whip, what is your point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, the ANC clearly has not read the Rules. Motions with Notice are submitted previously and are printed on the Order Paper. So, there is no slot hereafter for Motions with Notice. We are dealing with Motions without Notice at this point. There is no opportunity to submit Motions with Notice unless they were submitted previously and printed on the Order Paper.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is quite correct. So, hon Lekker, you have a Motion without Notice. If you could read it into the record? If not, then you would have to say on record that you withdraw that. But while you are waiting to check on that, I am going to ask hon Dugmore to read his motion without notice. Hon Dugmore, over to you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I would like to move a Motion without Notice.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I hope it is the one that matches my sheet.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I move without notice:

That this House takes note that the alleged sexual misconduct against against former DA Interim Provincial Leader, MPL and MEC, Albert Fritz, was investigated by Advocate Jennifer Williams and a full investigation report was presented to the Premier; and notes further

that no member of this Legislature or Committee has been given the full report as the Premier refuses to table it in the Legislature, even in Committee, despite having spent public funds on the investigation and therefore, resolves that the conduct of the Premier is unparliamentary and may be in contravention of Rule 221(d), which demands that the Premier tables the full report in the Legislature and further instructs the Premier to send a copy of the report to the South African Police Services for further investigation of the criminal elements of Albert Fritz's conduct. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you very much. For the record, are there any objections? There are objections ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible. - poor audio connection]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper ... [Interjections.] Order, members! I am going to move over to hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that the City of Cape Town is only proposing to provide a mere additional R10 million to the budget aimed at building shelters for the homeless people. This is despite the report by the Human Rights Commission of South Africa finding that the majority of homeless people still complain about access to ablution facilities, clean water and shelters that can accommodate families. Hon Deputy Speaker, most shelters provided by the City are not up to standard with health and safety requirements. The majority of homeless people still do not have access to those unsafe shelters as most of them complain that they struggle to even get R2 in order to pay at public toilets, and as a result they end up relieving themselves in open spaces. Hon Deputy Speaker, homeless people also all deserve to be treated with care and dignity; this should also reflect in the budget allocated for their needs. They are one of the most vulnerable groups in our society who also deserve to be treated with care and dignity by the government. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are objections ... [Interjection.]

Mr D AMERICA: Object!



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Windvogel. Hon Windvogel, are you there?

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I withdraw.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You withdraw, that is withdraw both motions. I just want to write that for the record. You are withdrawing Motion 10 and Motion 14. Hon Sayed, you have got a few motions still outstanding. Would you like to proceed? Yes.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that hundreds of learners missed out on the first term of the 2022 academic year, due to a lack of placement spaces in schools; notes further that while the African National Congress welcomes the new way that is being introduced by the WCED to have pop-up stands in various centres across the province, especially in our malls to assist parents with applications for the 2023 school year, we are very concerned with the lack of budgeting for this programme as it was limited to only a few weekends in a few communities; calls on WCED to avail funding for this programme and to expand its scope so it can be extended to more communities, especially poor and working-class communities. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections, the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Sayed, you have another one outstanding, you may proceed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the rise in reported bullying cases at Western Cape schools which have increased from five last year to 53 during the first term of this year; further notes that marked increases are reported in the Metro South, Metro North, and Metro Central Districts, including the incident that widely spread over social media, of a Grade 8 pupil at Bridgetown High School in Athlone who was taunted. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to. Hon members, I am just going to check. Hon Windvogel, you have a third one. I am going to assume that it is withdrawn as per your last statement, just for the record? Okay and I also ... [Interjection.] recognise hon Lekker. If you are not going to read in the motion then, I am going to – I would like to know if you are going to withdraw that Motion without Notice?

Ms R WINDVOGEL: It is fine.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, all the motions that I had were approved on our Programming Authority Meeting on Tuesday.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am going to check on that with regards to my Table staff and if it was not approved then, of course, we will have to withdraw this motion. I would have to check on that, hon Lekker, my apologies. Give me a second? Hon Lekker, no, it was not accepted at the Programming Authority. It would have to be withdrawn now or read out to the record. You have a minute before the 30 minutes is up to do so.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Alright ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So, we are – okay, you may proceed. One minute.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just one minute, hon Lekker. Hon Mackenzie, is this a point of order?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Yes, hon Deputy Speaker. So, you did not see my hand earlier on. Hon Sayed, through you, stopped his motion halfway, so, I do not know if he finished his motion or did he? Because I do not want him to say something that we did not agree to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think he finished it at insufficient budgeting. Is that correct, hon Sayed? And the last part for this programme, as it was limited to only a few weekends and a few communities. He calls on the WCED to avail funding for this programme, but what we will do is, we will only print the motion as spoken, as per the Hansard. Correct. So, hon Lekker, you may proceed because I have given you permission, despite the time being up. You may proceed.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with admiration and appreciation the sterling efforts of the Proteas women's team that made it to the semi-finals of the Cricket World Cup in New Zealand ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lekker?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Unfortunately, that is not the motion that you, that is printed here. This is the one regarding SOPA.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Oh, okay. Let me just look for it, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you going to proceed, hon Lekker?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I am looking for it now. I cannot find it ...  
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lekker, unfortunatly now, the time ...  
[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I will withdraw it, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I am saying I am going to withdraw it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You will withdraw it? Thank you very much, hon

Lekker ... [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I would not like to waste your time. Oh, here it is, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, hon members. Hon Lekker, I cannot hear you?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Can I come in, hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Did you want to read it out now?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, if you do not mind?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lekker, because there have been quite a few interruptions I will allow you to read it.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without motion:

That the House notes with concern that DA member, Deidre Baartman, did a dishonourable thing when she deliberately misled the House during the 2022 SOPA debate by stating that honourable member Bakubaku-Vos was a Board member of the Khayelitsha District Hospital, while knowing that this was untrue as she had documentation with the full facts of the

matter; denounces this misconduct by member Baartman; orders her to withdraw her deliberate mistruth and unconditionally apologise to the House and the member for casting aspersions. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. For the record, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are objections ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection, objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon members, that concludes Motions without Notice. I am sure over time we will get back into the swing of things with our Motions without Notice. Mr Stemele, ... [Interjection.] you will read the Order of the Day, please?

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Hon Deputy Speaker, my hand is up.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Windvogel, do you have a point of order?

Ms R WINDVOGEL: No, it is not a point of order, hon Deputy Speaker. My hand has been up for a while now because I only withdrew one of my motions.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Unfortunately, hon Windvogel, there are only 30 minutes allocated and once the 30 minutes are up, the motions will be printed on the Order Paper and unfortunately, we did not get to you objecting to three motions being withdrawn. Thank you. Mr Stemele, you may proceed.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Public Accounts Committee, having considered the 2020/21 Annual Reports of the 13 departments, including their entities, of the Western Cape Government as part of its oversight role.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Stemele, I have been informed by the Chief Whip that the Programming Authority resolved that there will be no list of speakers and that parties who wished to do so, will now be afforded an opportunity to make a declaration on the report for a maximum of three minutes. I will now allow that declaration to be made. I recognise the ANC. Any declarations?

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker. Can you hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I can, hon Mvimbi, are you making a declaration?

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Yes, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.



Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, of course the Public Accounts Committee is very pleased that this report is being tabled today. As a practice of the Committee, the Committee is always eager to give credit where credit is due and so we must once again commend the departments and entities across the Provincial Government for obtaining clean audit outcomes as they did.

Indeed, in some instances, additional notes were made by the Auditor-General, but that is nothing that the Department or the entities cannot improve on. We commend the Provincial Government of the Western Cape for clean governance, but let us remind ourselves that clean governance, clean audits are not necessarily clean governance.

Good governance, yes, does tick all the boxes of clean governance and complies with the law, but it also ensures that we have a government that is responsive to the needs of the most vulnerable members of our society. The Western Cape is good in terms of ticking boxes, but we must do better to ensure that we tackle poverty and inequality.

We must ensure that the clean audits translate into changing lives and generations. Of particular note, I wish to take the opportunity to highlight the resolutions that the Committee did take. Among our resolutions and recommendations, we have required to be briefed by the Department of the Premier and the Provincial Treasury on the implementation of the Integrated Financial Management System.

The Committee also resolved to call in the Provincial Treasury to brief the Committee on the Red Ant Security Relocation & Eviction Services, and also, to request a briefing from the Provincial Treasury on the instruction notes issued by National Treasury and possible deviation from these instructions.

Hon Deputy Speaker, again, our emphasis must be on the impact and consequence management. We must start to begin to implement consequence management where it is required, as is required in terms of the Public Auditing Act as amended. We must ensure a performance management system that demonstrates the quantitative impact made by service delivery on our people. We must also begin to concentrate on performance auditing as against just auditing. ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, finish up, hon Kama, I mean hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): The quantitative approach of simply reporting on targets and ticking boxes cannot be the sole focus of the Provincial Government. The ANC wishes to take this opportunity to commend all the hard-working workers of the Provincial Government of the Western Cape ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): ... and hopes that there will be no political party

politics being played in doing the work of auditing ... [Interjection].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mvimbi. I now recognise the EFF.

Mr M XEGO (EFF): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Am I audible, hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are audible, you may proceed.

Mr M XEGO (EFF): Thanks very much, hon Deputy Speaker. As much as the majority of the departments have received clean audits, as the EFF we wish that the clean audit that is seen on the books could be converted into service delivery out there.

Therefore, the EFF also wishes to stress that the majority of people, and in particular the Democratic Alliance, would stop encroaching in terms of the powers of the SCOPA and when we call the different departments in front of us we hope that they will make a U-turn and reverse as far as the issue of accountability is concerned because they play a big part in being protective of departments, rather than holding departments to account, and also, questioning the mandate of the SCOPA as far as that is concerned.

So, as the EFF, we say as far as that is concerned, hon Deputy Speaker.  
Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Xego. I recognise GOOD.

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): No declaration, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): No declaration, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Noted, thank you. The Freedom Front Plus? No. Al Jama-ah?

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): No declaration, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER (DA): Noted, thank you. I recognise the Democratic Alliance.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. As evidenced from the audit reports of the various departments and entities, when compared with other provinces, the Western Cape is and continues to be light years ahead, as seen in the audit outcomes of 24 auditees in the province, 13 departments, the Provincial Parliament and 10 public entities.

Hon Deputy Speaker, 86% of the departments and the Provincial Parliament received clean audits. That is 14 clean audits with no findings, whereas only two departments, which constitute 14%, received unqualified audit opinions with findings.

Insofar as the entities are concerned, 8 of the 10 or 80% received clean audits and 2 or 20% received an unqualified audit with findings, an achievement that is unparalleled compared with the eight other provinces governed by the ANC.

A common thread amongst our departments and entities is the tone set by the accounting officers. We have instilled a culture of doing the right thing, being accountable and improving controls where weaknesses are identified. The tone which starts at the top is then cascaded to the various levels of leadership throughout the units responsible for reporting.

Hon Deputy Speaker, our departments and entities generally have highly competent, experienced and knowledgeable officials heading up the various units. This is attained, not through cadres' deployment, but through the recruitment and appointment of competent and fit-for-purpose personnel.

Hon Deputy Speaker, our audit committees and internal control units in the Province have made remarkable strides in contributing significantly to enhancing the governance and oversight responsibilities. Our public accounts and portfolio committees also focus on all critical areas within departments

and public entities which contributed to the audit outcomes.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it is pleasing to note that the ongoing litigation between the Department of Agriculture and the A-G's Office is finally behind us, that audit outcomes of the past years that resulted in disclaimers, have now been reinstated as clean audits. The Premier and the Cabinet colleagues need to be commended for their tenacity in pursuing this matter in the interests of good governance in the Western Cape.

And then lastly, hon Deputy Speaker, we owe a huge debt of gratitude to all our employees in the Western Cape ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off.

Mr D AMERICA: ... who through their hard work and dedication, continue to make the Western Cape a shining beacon of hope, of what South Africa can look like where corruption is not ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): ... tolerated and good governance is the norm. I, therefore, ask the House to support the report. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I have to announce that there are 34 hon members present and entitled to vote, and the

House is therefore quorate. The question put before the House is that the report of the Public Accounts Committee be adopted? Are there any objections to the report being adopted? No objections. Agreed to.

Hon members, before we conclude, I just would like to do two rulings – order!

### **RULINGS**

On 14 March 2022 during the presentation of the Western Cape Budget Vote by the hon Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities, the hon member Kama raised a point of order requesting me to determine if the Standing Rules provided for the Presiding Officer to rule that hon member Ricardo Mackenzie be brought to the Standing Committee of Community Safety, to answer questions on his, member Mackenzie's involvement in the Fritz saga which emerged in the preceding week. While I ruled on the matter, I nonetheless undertook to consult Hansard and listen to the recording and read the transcript. I hereby confirm my ruling made during the House proceedings of 14 March 2022.

The Standing Rules do not provide for the Presiding Officer to rule on whether a member be brought to a committee to answer questions.

In terms of my ruling 2: member Sayed raised a point of order citing Rule 66(3)(a) and 66(3)(b), also alleging an unparliamentary conduct or behaviour on the part of hon Mackenzie. I confirm my ruling that Rule 59(2) is the

correct avenue to raise matters of this nature.

Further to Rule 59(2), hon member Sayed rose on Rule 66(3) and Rule 66(3)(b) of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament's Standing Rules. The Deputy Speaker's ruling on hon Sayed's point of order:

1. The House would recall that I made a ruling on this matter when member Kama brought member Mackenzie's alleged unparliamentary conduct or behaviour to the attention of this House, by directing the member to Rule 59(2).
2. I further cautioned the hon Sayed as the Whip of this Parliament in terms of Rule 66(3)(b), as the matter he rose on was not pertinent to the business of the House on that day.
3. Consistent with Rule 66(3)(d), as a Presiding Officer, I had already ruled on the same matter. As a general ruling, I place it on record that members must refrain from raising frivolous points of order with the intention of disrupting the proceedings and the decorum of the House.

In terms of my ruling 3. Hon Brinkhuis rose on a point of order on 30 March as follows:

“On what basis did you declare the Western Cape Provincial



Parliament's support on Ukraine? Is this a DA Provincial Parliament?"

In terms of Rule 66(3)(b), the matter raised by member Brinkhuis was not pertinent to the business of the House on that day and therefore, could not be entertained.

In terms of my ruling 4: at the same sitting on 14 March 2022, the House observed a display of black placards inside the Chambers by members of the Opposition. The Rules are silent on the display of placards in the House, and I have therefore referred the matter to the Secretary for a recommendation in this regard, if necessary. Placards containing offensive or unparliamentary language and those that create disturbance, and affect the decorum of the House, will, however, not be tolerated.

And finally, order on 30 March 2022, during the debate on Vote 2 Provincial Parliament Western Cape Appropriation Bill, member Lekker raised a point of order whether it was parliamentary for the Speaker to mislead the House.

My ruling 5 is: hon Lekker did not allege that the Speaker was deliberately misleading the House and as such, there is nothing unparliamentary in the Speaker's utterances.

Point 2: the hon Marran raised a point of order alleging that the Speaker may have used a derogatory term when he referred to those that have taken a

neutral stance on the Ukraine matter as ‘cowards.’ Since the Speaker did not refer to any specific member of the House, I find no fault with his utterances on the matter.

Hon members, which brings us to the close, concludes the business for the day. Mr Stemele will now end the meeting and all members will be exited from the sitting. The House is adjourned. I thank you.

The House adjourned at 17:05.