
MONDAY, 5 DECEMBER 2022

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 10:00.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may be seated.

Hon members, I would just like to, for noting, thank Mr Charles Breda today, who has been here for 36 years and will be retiring this year, so thank you Mr Charles Breda for all the work you did. [Applause.]

Thank you very much. Order, members. Let me – just give me a second.

Before we proceed I would just like to remind members about some of the logistical arrangements. Good morning, to everybody here, to all our members online and to our guests out in the gallery. I am not going to go through too much of the logistics. You do know that your audio and visual needs to be clear if you are online, and this is a hybrid sitting. We also know that the media had been granted access and that any members of the public or the media, please to not interject or have any comments or switch on your microphones or video cameras during this Sitting, and hon members are reminded that no interjections are permitted during the hybrid Sittings in terms of Rule 40 of the Standing Rules.

I now recognise the hon Baartman.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 18 the hours of Sitting for Monday, 5 December 2022, today, shall be ten o'clock until adjournment.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Any objections? No objections? Agreed to.

I recognise the hon Baartman.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 163, the House considers the Principle and Finalisation of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3–2022] on Monday, 5 December 2022, today.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to.

Thank you very much. I now recognise the Leader of the Opposition, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker, also good morning to all the hon members.

Deputy Speaker, I just seek your guidance. You would be aware that the motion that was moved on Friday now appears below the line. What I would like to ask just in terms of proceeding with this particular motion, is whether the Secretary of the Legislature – we understand from the ATC that the membership of the former Speaker has ended, but firstly, can we just clarify to the House whether a vacancy has in fact being declared, number one, and secondly, given the resolution that was passed last week around the Secretary dealing with all matters which may potentially involve of litigation, whether

there has been any further update, any further information received by the Secretary? I think those are all important things to clarify before we consider how to process this motion, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Dugmore. So first, remember, this motion is below the line. First in terms of process, you need to request precedence. We cannot discuss anything while it is below the line. So if you want this above the line, you need to request that to me now on the record.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No, I understand that, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I cannot answer.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Sorry, Deputy Speaker, I understand that, but what I am saying is that this particular motion is based on certain information that we had on Friday. So what I am seeking clarity on is whether a vacancy has in fact been declared or not, and whether, as per our resolution on Friday, there is any new information that this House needs to be made aware of. So I would like clarity on those questions, before moving that this motion is lifted to above the line.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, so as the Presiding Officer I can only deal with two matters. I am sure you could get that answer once you have moved it

above the line, but I can only approve or disapprove above the line, and then I can only approve or disapprove of it then moving towards a potential vote. It is correct procedure, and I can only focus on those two, unfortunately, hon Dugmore, I cannot make any assumptions of information, which is not in my mandate as a Presiding Officer.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No, Speaker, I do want to move in terms of our Rules that this motion is placed above the line, but I would like to request that if the Table, as constituted today, can provide that information or, if not, then the Secretary of the Legislature briefs this House before we proceed with the motion.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, we can only do two things, until then nothing can happen. There are hundreds of motions below the line. You have to follow that process, if you want to get to the point you want to get to.

(Motion)

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes, I move in terms of our Rules that this motion is lifted above the line.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved above the line?

HON MEMBERS: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are no objections. Agreed to.

I now recognise the Leader of the Opposition.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, in terms of discussing this particular motion, which, as you know, clearly resolves to mandate the Secretary of the Legislature to make contact with the President of the Constitutional Court and ask the Constitutional Court President to delegate a Judge. Sorry?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, hon Dugmore. Can I ask you to read the motion into the Paper, please?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Ja, I will do that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Before any comments, so that for the record it is there.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Okay, I think it is all on the hon members' Order Paper.

(Motion)

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I give notice that I shall

move:

That the House, noting the ATC published on 1 December 2022, stating the former Speaker, Mr Masizole Mnqasela is no longer a member of his political party, and thus no longer a member of this House, resulting in a vacancy in the position of Speaker, and further noting that Section 20 of the Provincial Constitution requires that the Provincial Legislature must fill a vacancy, and believing that the Legislature cannot operate without a Speaker, that this House resolves to mandate the Secretary of the Legislature to make contact with the President of the Constitutional Court, as per Section 20(2) of the Provincial Constitution, to designate a Judge to oversee the election of a new Speaker by no later than next week.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. So you are moving that in your name?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes, that is correct.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, and you may address.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: But, as I am saying, Speaker, for the purposes of the debate on this motion, we need to be empowered as this House. We have passed a resolution, which delegated the authority to deal with matters of litigation to the Secretary. I think it is not practical; it is not possible or desirable for us to proceed and deal with a motion like this unless this House is provided with full information.

I think it would be a serious dereliction of duty if we proceeded with a motion like this and yet certain information is withheld from this particular House, so that is the request that I would like to make.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore. So in terms of the process again, the motion has now been moved on the Order Paper above the line. We have to now afford parties declaration of three minutes and a vote. That has to come through. I cannot stop it for some information that might be or might not be here. We are voting on the fact that you have brought the motion above the line, and that has to go to the vote. Thereafter you can proceed with further information, but I cannot stop the process in terms of the motion itself, because remember, it is a vote.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, I would like to have to express a view on this, I think it is against the Code of Conduct of members of this Legislature and staff, who have access to certain information to not share it with this House, and I think that it is not acceptable that members are asked to speak on a matter, and which we have now agreed to do, without this House being provided with the information, and, if that information is not provided, you are aware that there is a Rule which allows the mover of that motion to withdraw the motion?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sure.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So I would like to ask if you could indicate to this House, and, even if we have to have an adjournment and you can engage with the Speaker or the Legal Adviser, anyone who may or may not have received correspondence, so that we can go into this discussion with full information. So, I am asking you, Deputy Speaker, to consider that request and also consider an adjournment if you need to consult about whether or not there is information, I have asked, has a vacancy formally been declared? I have asked, is there any other correspondence which has been provided?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Sayed, your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, could I? It is not a point of order. Could I then just request that we have at least a five-minute adjournment before we resume with the Sitting also just for parties to consult each other. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Let me just check. Hon Baartman, Acting Chief Whip?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, in terms of Rule 20 of this House, we have brought a Notice of Motion above the line as moved in the name of the Leader of the Opposition in terms of Notice of Motion Rules, in terms of Rule 151.

The motion has thus been moved after that when the Leader of the Opposition read it into the record. The Rules of the House now dictates that we actually need to decide on this motion. Should political parties wish to make a declaration on this motion, obviously that is for the House, but we actually need to now vote in terms of the Rules of this House on this particular motion. To my knowledge, the information was in the tabling, as is indicated in this Notice of Motion on 1 December 2022, and if there was any new information, I have not seen it in a subsequent tabling, but legally, the House has already moved the motion and now this House must decide upon that matter. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Sayed, can I just – if you could indulge with me for a second. Do you want the five-minute break to consult with your party on the process? I cannot entertain on knowledge, if that is okay. I will grant you that five-minute break and if we can then come back and vote. Thank you. The House is suspended for five minutes.

Business of the House is suspended at 10:15 and resumed at 10:23.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If we can make our way. You may be seated. Hon members, am I able to proceed with the three-minute declarations, hon Dugmore, in order to follow the process?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Ja, thank you very much,

Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, it is clear that we are here today discussing this motion because of deep and serious factional divisions within the DA. That is why we are here. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: We have an unprecedented situation where the Leader of the Executive, the Premier of this Province, has given an instruction to the former Speaker to actually vacate his position. In the first place that is a classic breach of the separation of powers. So we have a Premier who, in fact, we believe, has breached his Code of Ethics because he has interfered directly in a matter of the Legislature. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Secondly, we notice the trend in the DA that if you do not happen to be white, if you are African or Coloured you tend to be dealt with in a certain way, and we have many examples of that... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...where Mayors of Saldanha, Mayco members... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members, can we allow everyone... [Interjection.] One minute, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Mayco members of the City of Cape Town... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, hon Dugmore, just have a seat, I just need to retain order. Hon members, everyone is going to have... [Interjections.] Hon members, please can I have our attention, hon Kama! [Interjections.] If I can just please get through this. It is three minutes, everyone is afforded three minutes, so let us allow hon Dugmore his three-minute right, as everybody else will. Hon Dugmore, you may proceed.

Mr P MARRAN: How many minutes left?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: [microphone off] ...interest of justice and that is why the DA is perceived out there as a party of the elite and a party that actually undermines the interest of the rule being that ... [Inaudible.] ...so that is a matter of record. Interference by the Premier, breach of trust, racism, kangaroo courts within the DA, and these are the issues which have actually affected this Legislature.

That is why we believe it is absolutely critical for a formal vacancy to be declared, and then the election of the Speaker to proceed. The problem, however, is and I want to place it on record... [Microphone on] ...that we have asked, through you, Deputy Speaker, and the Table, to provide us with information. If it should emerge that information was withheld from this House, then there is going to be serious consequences, because that questions the very integrity of the Deputy Speaker and of the staff of this Legislature, if they – because we know we passed a resolution mandating the Secretary to inform us.

The Secretary is not here today, he is not here in front of us, which is a serious problem, because then party matters are being placed above the interests of this Legislature, so from our point of view, for the sake of stability in this House, for the sake of actually making sure that we follow our Constitution, and that we follow the provisions thereof that we need to move towards the election of a Speaker to fill the vacancy that exists, but, what is happening here, the chaos that has been caused in this Legislature without any due process, in regard to the Speaker, lies at the door of the Democratic Alliance. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Dugmore. I now recognise – I am just going to say, Al Jama-ah, would you like to make a declaration?

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry, all parties? [Inaudible discussion aside.]
Yes, would you like to make a declaration?

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Yes, thank you for the opportunity. Hon Deputy Speaker, yes, it is very important for the business of this House that when we continue or if we continue with any business from today, from this morning, that it is – first of all it is very difficult for us to proceed with any business without a Speaker, and when it comes to the powers of the Speaker, those powers are so decisive and so important that it is virtually impossible for us to continue with any business of the House.

When it comes to yourself, hon Deputy Speaker, you are the Deputy Speaker, and whenever the Speaker is not in the House, then you are fulfilling that role, but that does not give you the same powers, the exact same powers as the Speaker itself, so on behalf of the Al Jama-ah, we also want to make a plea to the House on this beautiful Monday morning that, before we proceed with any of the business of the WCPP going forward, that if we can by all means complete the process of electing a Speaker. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I recognise GOOD. Are you online?

Mr S N AUGUST: Morning, Deputy Speaker, and everybody else. No

declarations. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I note by written correspondence that the EFF is not online today. I recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you. Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, I do not want to play political games with this. This is an important debate, but for the ACDP it is important to bring back some stability and also bring back what is best for the Provincial Parliament, and it is a new for us, the first time that we are sitting without a Speaker, and, of course, you know, like Al Jama-ah said now, that there are certain roles and responsibilities that are done by the Speaker that cannot be done by the Deputy Speaker, so I would also ask that we look at how soon can we get the election of a Speaker or what is the interim measure in order to bring stability?

I see what we see, we see in the media, and what we saw the other day in the House, that we do not have a Speaker and the problems that we have, but I do not think, just from my side, I do not think there is – I think business can continue, but the uncertainty without a Speaker is problematic and I would want us to make from the ACDP's side a decision what is best for Provincial Parliament and not make a political game out of this. So that is my request, Deputy Speaker, that we think rationally, and that we think of the people of the Western Cape. They look to this Legislature to give guidance and direction and if we can assure that there is stability, that there is progress in electing a Speaker, then I think we have done well, because remember also

now we are going in recess, and I do not think it is good thing to have a recess and come back next year with not a Speaker elected. So that is all from the ACDP's side. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Hon Makamba-Botya, I see even though that I have received correspondence, you are online. Would you like to make a declaration?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Deputy Speaker, my apologies for that. In fact with the EFF, we are actually in support with the sentiments of the Leader of the Opposition Party. It is clear, Deputy Speaker, that the DA is actually botching the processes and dragging us into their squabbles without following the due processes of the Parliament. So, with that being said, with the EFF, we are also in support of what the ANC is saying, that we need this House to follow the processes and take us into confidence pertaining to this issue. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much to you, hon member. I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Madam Deputy Speaker.
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! [Interjections.]

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Can you tell us... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: What happened to the Leader of Government Business?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, remember, declarations can be done by any member of the House. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...even the Premier, interfering in the... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: He is a democratic member, hon members, remember we gave everybody an opportunity of three minutes. Sorry, Premier.

Mr P MARRAN: The same person who asked the Speaker to resign.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No-no-no, no, can we just – remember we are following due process. The Democratic Alliance has the right to select anybody to speak on their behalf. I now recognise... [Interjections.] No-no!

Mr P MARRAN: I am just saying.

Mr A LILI: Even the Premier?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili, he is a member of this House, so I would like to proceed. Hon Premier, you may proceed.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. First of all, I rise specifically to counter a point made by the Leader of Opposition saying that “the Premier in this case”, and in actual fact, I did receive the whistleblowers’ accounts... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Where is it? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! [Interjections.] Order, members!

The PREMIER: I did receive the whistleblowers’ accounts and I did receive the request for protected disclosure. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you can sit, Premier. Hon Sayed, what is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Is the hon – I am not sure whether he is speaking as the Premier or the Leader of the DA caucus. Is he willing to take a question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: This is a declaration, hon Sayed, this is not a debate. [Interjections.] Hon members, can I just remind you about the Rules, this is a declaration. [Interjections.]

Hon Nkondlo! This is a declaration, not a debate, so remember there are no opportunities for questions. The DA can do their three-minute declaration and there cannot be interjections around what he is saying. You may stand up, hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. The ANC must know, they brought the motion, they need to at least listen. So, first of all, I received a protected disclosure with allegations of serious corruption and misconduct. I informed the whistleblowers that as the Premier, I could not act. [Interjections.] If they would only just listen! As the Premier I could not act because there is a separation of power. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: What I did do, was, I said to them that I will, as the caucus leader, engage with the Speaker, which I did do, I gave him the detail. [Interjections.] But, I also said to the Speaker that I am obliged to hand this information to the police, which the DA did do, number 1. Number 2, it is impossible for whistleblowers within an organisation to ask for a protected disclosure and then for me to hand those very documents to the organisation of which the person that they are accusing sits at the head. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: Please listen to what I have just said. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! [Interjections.] Members, hon
Sayed, can you just please, we have to allow the three-minute declarations,
right?

The PREMIER: This is absolutely not a joke!

Mr P MARRAN: Premier, did you ask the Speaker to resign? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please, members!

The PREMIER: Our country is dealing with very serious issues at all levels,
and we have to follow due process. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You did not follow due
process.

The PREMIER: I did follow exactly due process.

Mr P MARRAN: Leave the country and speak about the Province.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

The PREMIER: And so, I want to say, Madam Deputy Speaker, that it was handed to the Hawks and they are busy with their investigation.
[Interjections.]

Mr P MARRAN: Now allow the Hawks to finish their investigation.

The PREMIER: But I will also say to this House...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: Is that the whistleblowers will agree or have agreed that we can hand the documents now... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! Order, members!

The PREMIER: I wish they would listen!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! I think this is in your interest, if you are just listening, so if we can just hear this member of this House.
[Interjections.]

The PREMIER: The whistleblowers have now agreed that I can actually hand the documents to the Secretary. The record will show that the Secretary has asked me on a number of occasions whether the whistleblowers will provide

this Parliament with those documents. They have said no, but now there was a change, and so therefore, Madam Deputy Speaker, I would like to thank the hon Dugmore for bringing this motion to the House. I would like to thank the Al Jama-ah, ACDP and EFF for supporting this motion, and we will also support the motion. We will ask that, in actual fact it will be wonderful if it could happen today. Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, and just, hon members, before we go into any further deliberations on this, the Premier is quite correct, he has handed the information to the Secretary and the Secretary must deal with that. It is not for this Sitting, for us to deliberate on any of those reports. I now understand that there were no objections and that this motion has been agreed to formally in the House and this motion now belongs to the House and the process regarding this motion will continue and will follow through the Administration.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We now move over to the Orders of the day. Mr Stemele, would you like to please read the first Order of the Day?

MR STEMELE: Debate on Vote 6 – Health – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriations Bill [B3 – 2022]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Stemele. I now

recognise the hon Minister Mbombo.

†n AGBARE LID: Hoor, hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, Premier, the members of the House, thank you very much for this opportunity. Deputy Speaker, I rise tabling the Appropriation Adjustment of R29,095 billion from the R29,094 billion that was the Main Appropriation, which is the additional of R702 000. That makes it 0,002% of the total Budget. It is the first time that I even appropriate something of less than not only one million even, such less. Therefore, Deputy Speaker, I just want to be brief in regard to that.

Last week I did show how health, a healthy economy and a healthy population impacts on health. I also did show how unemployment, how poverty, how the inequalities, which are affecting the country, do impact on the socio-economic ills that ended up being absorbed by Health and become health problems. I did mention that our response is, when we say health is everybody's business, we have to fight against all of these as part of the whole-of-the-society approach, because social determinants of Health are what what we actually see in our health facilities. People go to the facilities, because they have been impacted economically, not necessarily in terms of their behaviour. That is the research that is there. Almost more than 50% of the environment related to social economic and lesser physical aspects, and

also as the individual impacts on health.

Now, Deputy Speaker, what is the response, that is what I am presenting today. The National response is that they dropped, they reduced our Equitable Share in response to what I just alluded to. In the next MTEF we have a reduction of more than a billion rand. Actually, it takes us even back to pre-pandemic, if you look at what is going to happen even from the following year. The response from National, it is about they have not resolved the wage bill, which they made a promise for three years ago, and now we are sitting in a situation of where the provinces, including us, have to do whatever we could do in order to be able to pay the monies related to the salary increase, which is for fairness and also for the justification about the healthcare workers specifically, even including other public services. They are the ones who have been at the forefront during the pandemic. So it is unfair that they cannot be able to get the raise, but unfortunately it means that that money must come from the provinces. There is no new money.

Also, Deputy Speaker, in terms of the National response, the Province is also penalised for trying to de-escalate some of the services and to create a wellness hub, so that people could be able to have what we call Health on Wheels, where we take Vaxi Taxis at the taxi rank, and we bring services anywhere in the community halls, where people reside, like there are not only the packages of medicines, but also some other services under one roof anywhere, but now they want to give us money per headcount at the facilities. That is the response that we are getting, and what I said.

Now, what is our response at the provincial level? At the provincial level, the research is on revisiting the whole of the service redesign to make sure that we are still responsive, where we are saying that we need to provide the right care at the right time in the right place, also at the right price.

Also, we aspire to become a health system that is people-centric, trusted, equitable toward a healthy society and also to do it at a local level to enable our local managers also to be an enabler, and also that we have reached out because we want to strengthen the partnership with academics, with the private sector, with the traditional practitioners, with everyone, so that we could be able to fulfil the approach that health is everybody's business. It is part of that, and, Deputy Speaker, you may recall that at the beginning of the year we made a promise, which we did fulfil in trying to fast-track the surgical backlogs, mental health, and also we even undertook the Violence Prevention Unit as part of the wellness health agenda, and also the journey.

In response to the Wage Bill, Deputy Speaker, the monies that were provided for this year, which includes the monies for COVID, we made sure we take that R385 million to put it there, because remember, the 3% that you have to make sure we pay the Wage Bill, there is no new money. So what I am appropriating, there is no new money that is coming from anywhere. It means that we have to dala whatever we must within our own Budget. So we have put now that 385 there so that when now there is a finalisation of the increase in terms of the 3% Wage Bill, we could be able to pay our workers.

Also, we took some of the money and added more to other hospitals like Khayelitsha and Paarl, because they have a high level of pressure. Remember, Deputy Speaker, people are unemployed; socio-economic ills and everything else contribute to the health problem. Also, Deputy Speaker, the infrastructure money specifically for the Catalytic Project, like Tygerberg, we have ring-fenced it and put it there in a ring-fenced fund so that we do have a commitment that by, whether 2028 or 2030, we could be able - especially for the one that has to do with the PPP - to have that money when actually it is required out there. Deputy Speaker, in regard to our staff, we have made sure that the Occupational Health and everything related to the wellness are there, so, Deputy Speaker, having said that, with a 0,002% of the Appropriation that I am tabling, that money covers the rollovers of about R97 million and also the internal shifts going to the various departments, specifically the Department of the Premier and related to the IT infrastructure, because we have to continue with IT, as we have seen, especially in regard to the Dashboard, the Unique Patient Identifier and so forth, and then also the other one to the public works, and also other adjustments are related to the realignment of our Provincial Budget, and also the shifting of the other funds and the rollovers in regard to that, so, Deputy Speaker, having said that, I have tabled, as I indicated, that with a 0,00,2% of the Adjustment, I have to speak 0,00,2. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister. I now recognise hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, on behalf of the ANC I rise to reject this budget. Today is day 11 of the 16 Days of Activism for Non-violence against Women and Children. Let us join efforts to end the scourge of GBV and femicide, both in the province and nation at large.

The Police Minister, Bheki Cele, recently stated that between July and September 2022 over 13 000 women fell victim of assault, 1 277 women were victims of attempted murder, 989 women were murdered, and over 10 000... [Interjection.] Listen! Ja, 10 000 rape cases were opened with SAPS. The Western Cape has increased by 23,6% for sexual offences, including 1 233 rape cases and 432 sexual assault cases.

Deputy Speaker, in response to this crisis the Premier, with much fanfare, announced the establishment of a first for South Africa, a Violence Prevention Unit, to be established in the Western Cape Department of Health. In a written reply to my question about the core function and budget of this Programme, the Minister answered:

“The Unit was intended to have three main roles, and that R10 million was allocated to it for this financial year.”

Through these Adjustments Budget Estimates, R7,4 million of the Violence Prevention Unit was not spent as a result of the job evaluation process; not finalised and, I suppose, it will be sent back to the Revenue Fund. Remember,

Deputy Speaker, the social ills, but the money was not spent. Why was the money not spent, and when will this unit start functioning? This level of complacency is completely unacceptable.

Deputy Speaker, DA complacency in the Western Cape is also exposing the failure of the Department to spend funds allocated for rebuilding of the G F Jooste Hospital. At this rate it is clear that the most needed Regional Hospital to cater for the Klipfontein Region will be completed after 2050.

One question on my mind, Deputy Speaker, is for how long will our Public Healthcare Centres, such as the Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain District Hospitals, be able to cope with the added service pressures due to the closure of the G F Jooste Hospital?

Deputy Speaker, the Standing Committee embarked on an unannounced visit to the two hospitals a few months ago and we saw for ourselves the horrible conditions at these hospitals. While I do not want to belabour this point, so I will focus on the central themes that came out of the visit.

Firstly, there is a persistent challenge with the referral system as patients who are supposed to be referred to Lentegur, Valkenberg and the Tygerberg Hospitals, end up staying for longer at these hospitals due to shortages of beds in the referral hospitals.

Secondly, there are severe bed shortages as both hospitals operate at about

their bed capacity. Mitchells Plain has 260 beds, but frequently accommodates 395 patients. Khayelitsha has 350 beds, and frequently accommodates close to 450 patients. Both hospitals are Level 1 and, yet, they are forced to take up Level 2 functions that are not funded.

Thirdly, there are severe staff shortages. Khayelitsha has 300 unfunded positions and another complaint that was raised sharply by the KDH management was for the two hospitals to be treated equally. KDH only has 650 staff members while Mitchells Plain District Hospital has 800 staff. Perhaps when the MEC replies she can shed some light on how the staff complements are determined.

Deputy Speaker, the Mitchells Plain District Hospital management said it needed R300 million to address its challenges, while KDH requested R150 million. There was also a request for the Department to review the levels of Mitchells Plain Hospital to a Regional Hospital.

In a written reply to my question how the Adjustment Budget will respond to these challenges, the Minister said: “KDH would only be allocated an additional R26,6 million while Mitchells Plain will only receive R2,4 million. Ceres Hospital, despite all its challenges, will only receive R1,5 million. It is evident from the above that this Provincial Government does not care. Its refusal to address these challenges further exposed the DA’s complacency and because of that we should correctly call it the Budget of Complacency.

The same complacency can be found at the Paarl Hospital. We recently visited the Paarl Hospital where a patient has to wait 11 hours to be assisted. The hospital is supposed to have three porters, but they are never there, and instead the security personnel are doing the work of porters.

I picked up a similar challenge during my visit to Willa Clinic in Villiersdorp where the community is very happy for the new clinic, but they raised their concern. The concern that they raised to me was about the two doctors who only come twice a week for eight-hour shifts, and there is a huge backlog of files that have to be signed off by doctors before patients can be prescribed medication. Many patients do not have medication as we speak now, due to this challenge. One sister at the Clinic said:

† “As dinge nie dringend gaan verander nie, gaan ons baie pasiënte verloor, dit wil sê pasiënte kan sterf.” [If things are not going to change urgently, we are going to lose many patients, in other words, patients can die.”]

Because they are without medication.

†n AGBARE LID: Skande!

[An HON MEMBER: Disgrace!]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: In closing, I wish to commend health stakeholders, including the TAC residents in Mitchells Plain and other communities for successfully blocking the closure of the Metro Clinics. The decision was a

victory to the people of the Metro. It is, however, disappointing that the R56,8 million Infrastructure Budget for Community Health Facilities has been cut from this budget. This money should have been used to build waiting areas for patients that start queuing in the wee hours of the morning outside these facilities. The ANC therefore correctly rejects this budget for complacency. We reject the reduction in the Tygerberg Hospital, capital and maintenance infrastructure funding. The ANC rejects the DA complacency, and we are disappointed, yet again. No allocation is made towards building the Wall of Remembrance for all the departed healthcare workers as a result of COVID-19. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I note that hon Xego is not in the House. I will then move over to the Democratic Alliance, hon Kaizer-Philander.

Me W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: †Goeie more, baie dankie, agbare Adjunkspeaker. [Good morning, thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.] Premier, Leader of the Opposition, hon members, and most of all the residents of the Western Cape.

Before I begin with my debate speech, I would like to categorically state that the DA supports the adjusted allocation of R29,095 billion to Vote 6, which represents an increase of R702 000 from the 2022/23 Main Budget. While this is a marginal addition, we know that the Department continues to provide quality healthcare to all living in our beautiful province.

Hon Deputy Speaker, this is a budget that upholds the Constitution. In Section 27(1) it states that:

- (a) Everyone has the right to have access to healthcare services, including reproductive healthcare;
- (b) Sufficient food and water; and
- (c) Social security, including if they are unable to support themselves and their dependents with the appropriate assistance.

Deputy Speaker, however, given the current crisis in South Africa, we have seen high and rising levels of unemployment, causing our residents to become poorer by the day, which has been completely aggravated by a constrained fiscal climate. We see families are finding it increasingly difficult, more and more to sustain themselves due to the rising cost of living. We see graduates standing on the street corners because they are unable to find a job.

Hon Deputy Speaker, these are some of the factors that hugely impact on the overall wellbeing and health of our citizens. It is this situation that we should view and debate this Budget in. Despite these worsening economic conditions, we see a Department that is doing its absolute best to ensure that services continue unhindered. The fact that members on the other side of the House have chosen to turn a blind eye to this, speaks volumes.

Hon Deputy Speaker, through you, all that we have heard since last Thursday, is cheap politicking against the Western Cape Government, when in actual

fact, this is the only province in South Africa that continues to outperform expectations, and the only province that truly gets things done.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: That does mean not everything is perfect, but we need to be honest, in that respect. At the National Health Department's briefing where the budgetary cuts were outlined, it was made apparent that there would be an impact on the delivery of infrastructure projects, due to the limited funding, through you, Hon Deputy Speaker. I fail to understand why member Windvogel did not take up these budget cuts with her national comrades, instead of insinuating that the Provincial Department is unable to deliver, which of course is not true. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It shows that... [Interjections.]

Ms W KAIZER-PHILANDER: May I be protected, Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, order, members!

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Instead of insinuating that the Provincial Department is unable to deliver, which, of course, is not true. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It is a fact.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Healthcare funding concerns are increasing, but what does the ANC care, and while our focus is that of the Western Cape, one cannot deny the truth that the worsening budgetary constraints are a result of the corrupt ANC National Government.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the ANC really has no shame. They sit here while their comrades in Pretoria have changed the Provincial Equitable Share formula for health. As a result, it means that there will be even less money going forward. This while failed SOEs get perpetual bailouts.

Hon Deputy Speaker, maybe we would have received more money if the Department's name ended in Soc Limited. [Laughter.] Despite the ANC's wilful ignorance, the Provincial Equitable Share for Vote 6 has been reduced by R63 430 000 and this was due to R7,4 million from in-year saving in the Violence Prevention Unit with an additional R28,5 million in infrastructure funding and 27,4 from Tygerberg Hospital's capital and infrastructure funding being redirected for the co-payment obligation in respect of the building of the new Tygerberg Central Hospital.

In spite of this, our fiscal prudence and responsiveness have meant that we have mitigated the financial pressures being placed on the Western Cape as far as possible. This is because the Department has been able to use its rollovers from the previous financial year to smooth the expenditure before next year's Main Budget.

Throughout this year, the Department has successfully protected our healthcare facilities against loadshedding by procuring extra diesel and collaborating with Eskom and the City of Cape Town. Additionally, extra capacity has been sought through procuring inverters and UPSes at smaller facilities.

Hon Deputy Speaker, let me remind the House that irrespective of how bad the Opposition wants to portray this Department, this is the only Health Department in South Africa to have ever achieved a fourth consecutive clean audit outcome. [Interjections.] [Applause]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Hon Deputy Speaker, we are hopeful for all our people, no matter where you reside, political will needs to exist in order to realise the change. This is why the Western Cape Department of Health and Wellness has adopted a reset strategy where health is everybody's business. The Minister on Thursday spoke to the reform occurring in three main categories to further this ideal, namely that in the service platform governance and public policy, we saw an example of this approach being successful. Recently the Hospital and Emergency Centre, Tracking Innovation Information System (HECTIS), has won the overall Innovation Award at the Innovative Award Ceremony for 2022.

Hon Deputy Speaker, in the Western Cape the political will to change people's lives for the better exists and the Standing Committee has seen it.

[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No, no. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): That is a fallacy.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: You have not been that often, hon member.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Hon Deputy Speaker, at the Khayelitsha District Hospital, despite pressures, it delivers more... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! Order, members! You may proceed.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. At the Khayelitsha District Hospital, despite pressures, it delivers more, more than what is mandated. A hospital that was originally established 10 years ago, has more than doubled the number of its specialists. [Interjections.]

In the coming year, we look forward to the 30-bed extension to be completed for its psychiatric ward which will significantly relieve the current pressures.

We need to be honest and bold when we say that Khayelitsha District Hospital will be able to cope.

Hon Deputy Speaker, as part of our oversight mandate, we also visited the Ceres Hospital, where the population is more than 146 000 and is supplemented by the migration of seasonal workers. The community also has a burden of diseases relating to trauma, violence, HIV/Aids, TB, chronic diseases, as well as mental health issues stemming from substance abuse due to Tik and alcohol. Yet, as a proactive Department, the following interventions were implemented:

- A second family physician and assistant primary healthcare manager were appointed with TB nursing staff at clinics and a sessional doctor to support chronic care patients.
- NGO support is provided to the TB and HIV patients.
- Community oriented healthcare was furthered with the Du Toit Public / Private Partnership;
- And we saw the revision of the relevant mobile services routes.

Hon Deputy Speaker, we acknowledge that in the light of the challenges, that the Department has indeed taken welcome steps to ensure quality healthcare. It is clear that our hospitals are the frontline responses to all societal ills in our communities.

During our Standing Committee briefing with the Department, as well as the Department of Social Development, we want you to understand the roles that

each stakeholder plays and the collaboration between different departments in providing mental health services. We have also scheduled to meet with the Department of Justice, with SAPS and other stakeholder departments so that we can further determine how National Government functions also impact mental health and psychiatric services within the Western Cape.

Hon Deputy Speaker, one in ten people are in emergency centres due to interpersonal violence. This furthers the fact that there are immense pressures on our facilities, including the impact of crime. Our facilities in the Western Cape absorb cases of violence, substance abuse, criminality, and other societal ills, whose root causes are beyond the control of the healthcare system. This means we truly need to expand our whole-of-society and whole-of-government approach to service delivery.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the ANC has got no political will or no plan whatsoever to fix this country. [Interjections.] When the ANC finally leaves the Union Buildings and ceases to exist as an organisation... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: We will be left with the most unequal country in the world – a far cry from the promises that was made in 1994 before the public purse was purged. Hon Deputy Speaker, this Department is doing the best with what they have under the circumstances. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order, members, order! [Interjections.]
Order, members! The Leader of the Opposition and the Premier, one minute.
[Interjections.] Can we just allow member Philander to finish? Please stop
the clock. You may proceed.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. This
Department is doing the best with what they have under the circumstances.
What is certainly clear is that this is a Department and a Government that
care about every citizen in every community. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: The ANC has failed us. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. It is
clear. The ANC has failed us and they will be punished through the power of
the ballot because South Africans simply had enough. As our communities
look forward to reconnect with families and friends at the end of the year, we
are assured that the Department will be ready to ensure that we all enjoy a
safe and a healthy festive season. Of course, Deputy Speaker we also have
the responsibility to behave and to abide by traffic and other safety rules.

In conclusion, Deputy Speaker, I would like to express much appreciation

towards the Minister, Dr Keith Cloete, and departmental officials and to each and every staffer in every facility in the Western Cape for their selfless service towards the residents in the Western Cape. Your efforts do not go unnoticed and we are truly blessed with the best.

Hon Deputy Speaker, on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, I move to support this budget. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise Minister Mbombo.

†n AGBARE LID: Mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Good!]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker, at the beginning of when I started, I said I do not want to speak more, not only because it is a small budget, but it is because I am really sad. I am sad, Deputy Speaker, because when we have so many challenges, where you have so many patients that are coming to us, and then you get a National Government that reduces your budget, what does it say? [Interjections.] What it says, because I just said, through you, Deputy Speaker, I just said... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: The Western Cape Equitable Share is being reduced for the next three years for over a billion. That is what I just said. The Equitable Share has just being reduced by over a billion. That part of it, is not me. It is coming from the National Treasury. Over a billion, for next year, for next year we have almost around about R400 million ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Where is the money? [Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: You are saying you are doing this but you do not... [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! Hon member.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members. Hon member, the Minister sat down because she cannot actually hear herself think. Please, can we allow her to finish? Over to you, Minister. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, please.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: That is one, and then number 2, Speaker, I have just said because of the increase, not only the population, but also even the patients, which the members have already

indicated. What we do, we are becoming smart, where you just like during COVID take other services, you take them outside, creating Hospitals with Wheels, creating Hospitals without Walls, where people are, you bring the services. I just said that we are being penalised for that because the headcount must be at the health facility. So all the efforts that we are trying to decongest the facility, mean that it is in vain, because we are being penalised for that. So that is number two, and then, Deputy Speaker, the other part is about the possible burden of disease: it is mental health, the evidence shows that with mental health the major contributor is substance abuse and alcohol, specifically among the young persons.

For mental health is also due to COVID, with the whole issue t there is, especially with the older persons, specifically women who have got anxiety and depression, taking care of the families is another contributor with the mental health. All those contributors that we have just mentioned, they are outside the health system, but we have to absorb them. So when you have so many of these patients, some of them ended up actually having a substance disorder, abuse disorder, meaning now when the addiction continues, they have to stay longer at a hospital and they have to go to a mental hospital, but the mental hospital is full. That is what we are saying. The whole thing happens outside the health system.

The other part of the burden of disease is maternal health. For maternal health we are doing far better than the whole country. It has been like that when it comes to maternal mortality and morbidity, but the issue of teenage

pregnancies, these teenagers do not get pregnant at the hospital. They are getting pregnant outside in communities, under the noses of the parents. That is what happens, the sector who ends up bearing all this burden is the health system.

The other burden of disease is child health, Within child health we are doing much better than any other province when it comes to child health outcomes, but the issue of what we see, although it might be in a few numbers, the malnutrition and also starvation among the children, it is not us who are supposed to feed. They are being not fed outside as a result of unemployment, but we have to absorb those problems.

HIV/Aids, because of COVID, we reduced the HIV testing, and also there are those who have to start IRVs for the first time, because of the access, but you are beefing up working with civil society. The Premier is chairing the Provincial Council of AIDS and TB around that, but sex is happening outside the health system in terms of unprotected sex.

The issue of interpersonal violence, you see the whole of accidents that are happening, trauma that is happening, there is an emergency, there is medical aid where Auntie Sarah might come with a stroke or fit, and then you have mental health, and then we have all these accidents, so all the crime is happening outside the health system. We absorb all of those, but we do not have a budget to respond to that.

It means for us we have to do on our own, how we respond to that. So when we took over the Violence Prevention Unit, which is not actually a health function, because we are data-driven we borrowed a model from the Wales Cardiff Model, where actually people will be the first priority when they have been beaten up or wherever they will go to the hospital, and not necessarily going to the police to report the case. Therefore, it made us to be easier accessible, immediately, within 24 hours our data can show there have been so many pedestrian injuries or people who have been beaten up, whether by gunshots and whatever, and we send that message to the relevant authorities, like law enforcement officers.

Member Windvogel spoke about the R10 million. Yes, indeed, we received the R10 million from the Provincial Treasury. What we have done around the post, with our unit or anywhere, you cannot just do things like that. We have to do things according to the DPSA, which is we submit it to the DPSA in terms of the ODI, which was to-and-fro. I actually confirm that they approved it, now we will have a structure to have those people, but you cannot pay people in advance without having a structure and also we do not want to be a VPU of the Dorp Street. It has also to do with all the districts and all the municipalities, so there is that part and also remember the Safety Plan for the Western Cape has got two arms. It has to do prevention and then also law enforcement. So for us we are in prevention in regard to the data, but the violence is happening outside the health system.

In regard to the Jooste Hospital, already the professional services, I think I

did mention that those people have been appointed, and remember we are the client of the Department of Public Works, who is the implementing agent. So in as much as that we may want things to move faster, there are the processes in terms of the infrastructure, the code, the contracting, the tendering system, and all of those, it is happening. But where I am sitting, the catalyst projects that we say have to be prioritised, and it has been confirmed, are the Helderberg Hospital, the Tygerberg Central Hospital, the Tygerberg / Belhar Regional Hospital, the Jooste Hospital which is the Klipfontein Regional Hospital. Those hospitals, they have to be staggered. The other one, 2028's, the other one was 2030, so it is there because we would be dropping the similar kind of plan when they are building. So it is already there.

In regard to the beds and all that member Windvogel has mentioned, I did actually indicate what I have just responded to about Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha. Mitchells Plain, the feeder areas, it includes the whole of Philippi. They are part of the Mitchells Plain substructure, the referrals pathway. It also includes Nyanga and Crossroads. It is part of Mitchells Plain.

Khayelitsha, it has always been Khayelitsha, but we added Mfuleni, which was going to Retreat, so we need to understand the referral pathways. The referral pathways, it is an international norm; it is a national norm, because the patient must be able to be exposed to all levels. It becomes easier because the files and the folders go to that level up to the specialist. So you must not think Mitchells Plain Hospital is only for Mitchells Plain.

On the medication again, please, I agree with member Philander that some of these issues you have to take it at the other level. We have got a National tender for pharmaceuticals for the medication. National tender, it is National for chronic medication for a three-year period that does the tender for the whole of the provinces, there was even a time when I went to Paarl Hospital, and one of the medications for mental health was not there. Because what normally happens, what they do is they will have added some other units or other medications as part of the tender, and unfortunately, those [Inaudible] companies, they cannot go back now and have to manufacture a bulk system. So when you have chronic medication, you must know first thing who is at fault, it is national, because you all have under “national tender”. But what we do, Deputy Speaker, because you do not want to have the out-of-stock throughout, within that sub-district or that municipality, we have to find out if it is about medication that can also be available at a primary care level. If we know Clinic A, you do not have it, you can get from Clinic B, but in most instances it is those chronic ones that are prescribed by the doctor for chronic medication because of the National tender. So it means that you have to borrow within the district. And then what we normally do, you end up taking out of our own pocket money that was not even budgeted for and then you have to go over the counter and buy at the manufacturer, probably at double the price, so that is the whole issue about that. Then in regard to the waiting areas, yes, we did make a commitment of the *afdak*. We are busy with, we have identified the areas, clinics where they need the *afdak* for the waiting areas and the psychiatry units as well in these District Hospitals, because as I

indicated, some patients, mental health for 72 hours, they have to sit also at the emergency centre, plus also the trauma and the chronic patients. Now we are taking those patients who might sit longer than 72 hours but are not yet qualifying, or there is no place at a specialised psychiatry hospital, so that rather they should be in the psychiatry unit in that small hospital.

We are already doing all parts of those, and then in addition to that, Bracken Gate for example, because we do not have many cases of COVID, it is a transitional hospital. We still have got those 300 plus beds that are there but what we do, transitional means that it becomes a step-down, or it becomes a step-up, which is in between, specifically for Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha. Some patients might be done at that hospital, but they are not ready yet to be going home. Therefore, in waiting, they could still be there at the Bracken Gate, before they go home, because you need those beds. So we are already doing all those parts, and then, lastly, Deputy Speaker. I did indicate that the expenses related to groceries, because there is a high-level increase, even in security, in the catering. When you see all these prices at the shops you must know that these are the same things that we are using the hospital.

†Ingxowa yeetapile, [A bag of potatoes] which used to be R45.00, which is the aartappels potatoes, for five or seven kilograms, just count how many patients we have to use those potatoes. That money that we have to buy all the groceries, for us it has been more, the more patients, the more we are

spending, so there is no new money, but we have to absorb all costs.

Thank you very much, member Windvogel and member Philander for that, and then in closing, Deputy Speaker, I just want to thank the team, Dr Cloete and his team. Yes, indeed, I think we are tired of bragging of having the four consecutive audit outcomes, but I think for me what stands out at the time that I checked the data, are the 16 000 plus of those who were infected with COVID, and also the 158 health workers who died during this period,

We might do as much of Wellness, because you can see now we are doing Wellness at the local level, we opened Wellness at Groote Schuur. There are also Wellness Champion positions everywhere, and people can go for counselling, but you will never be able to replace those. The long-COVID that we are talking about to the patients are also happening around us. We are still fractured, we are still not where we were before, but the resilience that has come out among the staff, we want to thank the staff there. There are no health services without health workers. All health workers, psychologically, I am not even talking about the physical that have been impacted, it means that our services would not be there. We will want to have more, yes, there is a staff shortage but we do not have money. We will want to have more, but there is no money, and the only thing to do so that South Africa will be able to have money is to review its economic policies, and we invest more, because when we invest more there will be more employment. There will be more taxpayers and then we could be able to build more hospitals and everything, but we have got nothing, but whatever we

could, we manage to be able to do. So thank you very much, Dr Cloete, and your team, and also to the Standing Committee for making us accountable. So do not take them like they are fighting, they are not fighting, they are helping us. Behind the scenes, member Windvogel says, “Can you please, I think he lay in Swellendam Hospital, if you could, whatever.” Something like that, so I said, “Can you please go for yourself and have a conversation.” Something like that. Outside these walls we are all at one as the MPPs of the Western Cape Government in different portfolios, but we are all doing it for the people of the Western Cape.

Thank you very much, Standing Committee, and also to my colleagues and then lastly, for my office, I just hope that because at least now we do not have so much COVID, they could be able to relax. We cannot be working 24-hours throughout. We are also drained, but at least because we know that it is a good cause, you are doing it. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister. That brings us to the end of Vote 6.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will ask Mr Stemele to read the second Order of the Day.

Mr STEMELE: Debate on Vote 3, Provincial Treasury, Western Cape

Adjustment Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2022]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise the hon Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you very much, Madam Deputy Speaker. When I tabled the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement and Adjustments Budget with the House nearly two weeks ago, I talked about tough choices and difficult trade-offs. With provincial budgets and depression and demand for our services greater than ever, the Western Cape will need to do more with less, prioritising, innovating and ensuring value for money. Doing so requires courage, leadership, and clear principles to guide us so that we deliver on the social contract that we have with our citizens to deliver jobs, to deliver safety and to deliver wellbeing. This, Deputy Speaker, is why this Vote is so important. Our Provincial Treasury as part of South Africa's Team Finance is essential in ensuring that we realise good governance and sound financial management, always treating the public's money with the greatest of care.

I would like to upfront thank the officials from the Provincial Treasury for their unwavering commitment to realising this objective, as well as for their hard work in running the budget process so professionally. They give effect clearly to what Thomas Paine said, and I quote:

“Public money ought to be touched with the most scrupulous conscientiousness of honour.”

Hon Deputy Speaker, there are many important projects underway that enable the important choices that we need to make in the Western Cape, while helping to build on the strong foundations that we and our municipalities need to govern for growth, and to stay on course.

One such initiative is the introduction of the Expenditure Reviews by the Provincial Treasury, enabling the Department to work with others to review both expenditure and programme performance, and constructively identify areas for improvement in the implementation of strategic priorities. This is an internationally recognised tool for improving cost effectiveness. In the 2021/22 financial year, 21 officials completed the Government Technical Advisory Centre (GTAC) Spending Review Training, and five expenditure reviews were produced by this Government. In September of this year, a second round of GTAC training commenced, aimed at institutionalising the expenditure review process, with five new expenditure reviews underway.

We are now incorporating the reviews into the budget process, and we are working with departments to land their recommendations. This project has received R924 000 for the 22/23 financial year. With a budget of R1,36 million in the 2022/23 financial year, another innovative intervention is our Public Entity Review, which will help us to further strengthen our monitoring of public entities, ensuring that we exercise effective oversight over them. We are also developing a financial monitoring and evaluation template to supplement existing oversight processes, as well as identifying

possible legislative amendments to strengthen board governance and ensure alignment to the Public Finance Management Act.

In line with the recently released Zondo Commission recommendations, we need to constantly find ways to strengthen oversight so that we stay ahead of the curve to governance risks and remain the best run government in South Africa, and this review will be critical for us doing so.

Hon Deputy Speaker, ensuring that we remain the best run government in South Africa will require that we embrace innovation and technology in our supply chain management. To achieve this the Provincial Treasury's Supply Chain Reform Project is fast tracking governance efficiencies in procurement processes and procedures, as well as embracing technology to enable and assist the Provincial Treasury in executing its core mandate. We expect this important component of the Reform Project, which has a R2 million budget, to be completed by the end of this financial year.

As we continue to embrace technology, we have also rolled out the eProcurement Solution (ePS), facilitating the procurement of goods and services by the Western Cape Government. For our departments, this makes it easier to comply with legislation, improve productivity and reduce paperwork. It also strengthens transparency and curbs opportunities for irregularities, fraud and collusion between suppliers and officials, providing a clear audit trail. For our suppliers this provides procurement opportunities to more businesses, stimulating competition. It also gives effect to our core

growth for jobs priority by making it easier to do business with the Western Cape Government, by making it easier to do business with Provincial Government through this project. Overall, R6,36 million has been made available in the 2022/23 financial year, including for solution architecture, hosting and tenancy.

Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape Government fully appreciates the very real challenges our municipal leaders and officials face as they try to govern for growth in a difficult resource constrained environment. We also know that they are at the coalface of service delivery, and, without them, we cannot achieve our North Star Priorities of Growth for Jobs, Safety and Wellbeing. That is why we are constantly looking for ways to support them to succeed and this year has been no different. With the introduction of the Asset Management System Governance and Capability Project, with a budget of R2,29 million, this project will help municipalities to benchmark the maturity of their Asset Management Systems and to quantify the strategic processes that inform their Asset Management Plans.

The aim is to establish and complete a fully fledged asset register at each municipality to enable them to have a full view of the state of their assets. This will allow municipalities to direct resources where they are most needed and to ensure that they deal with the direct challenge of aging infrastructure to maintain and improve basic services to our citizens.

Another way in which we are supporting our local governments is by

ensuring that vulnerable municipalities are given the right support to stabilise and to move forward. Good governance is the foundation for growth and every citizen, no matter where they live in the province, deserves to live in a well-run municipality. In this respect, we will continue to work closely with Beaufort West Municipality to ensure the effective implementation of their mandatory Financial Recovery Plan.

We will also continue to closely monitor and support other municipalities facing financial challenges and will not hesitate to take all steps that are necessary to address financial distress. Deputy Speaker, through this Adjustment Budget we have also allocated R17 million from the Western Cape Municipal Capability Building Grant to be transferred to municipalities. Of this total, R10,18 million is for a range of projects that will help municipalities to strengthen good financial governance, including setting more cost reflective tariffs, improving revenue collection and strengthening their financial systems.

The further R6,9 million will fund bursaries that municipalities can allocate to local learners so that they can develop a pipeline of future talent from their own areas that one day will work in their municipality. Through these transfers the Provincial Treasury is investing in further strengthening the financial management capability of our municipalities so that they remain financially sustainable and can sustain the platform for growth and job creation in local economies across the province.

Deputy Speaker, in my Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement speech before this Parliament, I shared how through modelling the Provincial Treasury was able to project our Provincial Equitable Share allocation in 2030, noting a reduction after factoring in inflation. This innovative use of data is the first of more to come as we roll out our exciting Fiscal Futures Project. With a budget of R1,6 million in this financial year, the project will enable us to be more vigilant in monitoring and extrapolating our data over the longer term, thereby allowing us to anticipate and respond dynamically to changes.

It will also equip our Government with the information it needs to ensure that the Western Cape gets its fair share of the Provincial Equitable Share in our engagements with National Government. I certainly look forward to sharing more of its insights with you in the future.

To adjust our sails and table a budget that cares and prepares in the Western Cape, we have released R2,79 million of this Vote to the Provincial Revenue Fund, therefore bringing the total Adjusted Budget of the Provincial Treasury to R318,32 million for the 2022/23 financial year. Of the R2,79 million, R1,7 million is in respect of the infrastructure earmarked allocation. The organisational design investigation regarding the establishment of a Chief Directorate for infrastructure in the Provincial Treasury is envisaged to be completed in the 2023/24 financial year.

R781,000 is in respect of the municipal intervention earmarked allocation; R381,000 of which will be reallocated in the 2023/24 financial year, and

R274,000 is in respect of the Financial Management Capability Grant, as the total amounts requested by municipalities for support were less than the allocation. This means our Administration Programme now receives R62,13 million; our Sustainable Resource Management Programme now receives R127,9 million; our Asset Management Programme now receives R76,9 million; and our Financial Governance Programme now receives R51,7 million.

In conclusion, hon Deputy Speaker, after hearing just some of the Treasury's pioneering projects, I think we can all agree that they are doing an outstanding job in steering this Province's public finances. I am so proud of the way that they embrace innovation, always strive for excellence, and how responsibly they manage the public purse. We must not for a second underestimate how important this is for the course that we have set out to achieve in the Western Cape. Indeed sound financial management, well run corruption-free provincial departments and local governments, value for money projects and a robust, transparent and professional budget process are the foundation that we need to deliver the better future that our citizens deserve. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Hon Minister. I now recognise the hon Nkondlo.

MS N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, perhaps as the Minister speaks about doing more with less, the Minister must actually

listen to the voice of the likes of the MEC of Health, who is crying about the budget cuts into social spending, Health in particular, and I am sure in other areas. As I think we must concede to the challenges of austerity policy, which the DA actually supports and is implementing here in this province, and as such, such austerity policies should not be accepted with a blanket check because already in 2014, I think writings have been done by academics about some of the challenges of austerity during recession, as a policy posture that does not necessarily, has not proven with data, that it actually helps to revive economies and in particular developing economies of our nature. So I am raising this that maybe MEC Mbombo, you must join the left in the ANC who also have been calling that the challenge of a blanket austerity remains a challenge for a developing economy like ours, and actually hoping that the Minister in your Department, that the fiscal futures that were established by the Premier, would actually help us to really indicate whether after this whole process, when we have done all of these budget cuts from COE and everything else, we are seeing any improvements, or the social problems actually are going to derive or realise even worse economic challenges for our communities. I stand here today on behalf of the ANC to object to this budget.

Firstly, we must decry what is currently happening in this House due to DA escapades, as a serious threat to governance and sound financial management in this province. Let me share a few of these.

We are here with no Speaker of this Parliament as the DA chose to

circumvent justice by trialling the Speaker using the draconian and unjust process, especially towards its Black members on allegations claimed to emanate from him as its public representative in the House. Actually the Premier was here trying at pains to explain himself as a member of this House, but a Premier in the Executive, a travesty of justice, as this Parliament is rendered toothless and unstable, where clear system and process to trial any misconducts, are available. Then we have a Conduct Committee, when that information of the whistle-blower arrived at the Premier, he had the responsibility to hand over through the systems of this Parliament, unless he already says “vote of no confidence” to this Parliament. This kind of encroachment has direct impact on the financial governance, as the same DA was on record about this, and you rarely mention it now, MEC, about the situation in Beaufort West Municipality to a point that a budget could not be discussed and approved within the stipulated times. Your HOD was lamenting this in the Committee that politics have got a serious way to collapse public administration, and here we see this Adjustment Budget here being concluded under a stewardship of House Chairs, a Deputy Speaker’s office marred by controversy and allegations of misconduct, a Secretary whom the House must be pushed to give executive powers, as the party saw it proper to paralyse this House only for party politics. Another of these DA theatrics that this House plays and is subjected to, is we have two MEC’s, one for Human Settlements and another for Transport and Public Works, and yet by decree of the handler, this House was plunged into an oversight quagmire where there is only one MEC in this Budget Adjustment accounting for two Votes, whilst the other was here presenting a budget during the Main Appropriation, and

today he must sit and watch.

An HON MEMBER: Who is the handler?

Ms N D NKONDLO: We cautioned the Premier about these abrupt announcements and their implications to order of the Administration, let alone this governance confusion he created. His announcement came after his DA booted out another Black person in the former MEC Madikizela, and now the new sheriff tells us in the Committee there has been a culture of non-accountability in that Department, painting a bleak picture of his predecessor. Now a young MEC is shoved off on the side as long as he earns the perks, as we are told the executive powers are given to his party leader and he is just to sit there and smile.

Lastly, an instrument to give teeth to and enable this House to make meaningful interventions to budget proposals by the Executive, in the form of the procedure on money bills for this House, has been delayed since ANC called for this in the last Administration, and yet the learned advocate in the Acting Chief Whip, Chairperson of the Budget Committee, treats us in a theatre of spectacle of workshop after workshop, as a delaying tactic to get this done, so again, here ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

MS N D NKONDLO: ... the WCPP, is toothless, and arrogance of numbers is

used by the DA-mob as logic to engage and bully those with less numbers into the budget choices of the Executive, where all this is a show, a charade for the DA-led to show who jumps and make the fanciest noises, jokes, ridicule and obfuscation effects to satisfy the master who holds the keys to their upward mobility in the party. The more noise one makes, the higher the chances of the best performers to be called in the main office for getting more perks, elevated to what is seen as powerful positions, even a chance of joining the handler's main dinner table. [Interjections.]

How do you realise good governance and prudent financial management in such a political climate? What happened to separation of powers as a tenet of liberal democrats?

Deputy Speaker, given this Adjustment Budget was presented simultaneously with the PERO and MERO with the MEC herself in her speech that stated that MERO empowers us with the information that we and our municipalities need to govern for growth in the Western Cape, yet, the MEC must explain a surrender of the R1,735 funds to the Provincial Reserve Fund that was meant for Infrastructure Development Improvement Programme. This happens whilst this Government argues for fixed investment as a way to deal with what in the PERO says, stopping job crisis not to be a social crisis.

Provincial Treasury has surrendered COE funds as delays to fill vacancies has become the order of the day, bursary funds also unspent in an environment of youth unemployment, a trend to shift this money to EPWP

projects. Further we see in this budget that funds are shifted to make provision for the impact of 2022, 3% wage increase, and this happens whilst National Treasury was here a few days ago to allocate money for the wage increment, and even on 21 November in the Select Committee on Appropriations, they considered that if there is any changes and there is a shortfall, such provinces will then be allocated. Now, what is this money put aside for provision of wage increment? We do not understand.

Similarly, the DA made some theatrics during COVID and put money aside to buy vaccines whilst there was allocation provided.

†Sidiniwe kule midlalo yenu yoonopopi.

[We are sick and tired of these childish theatrics.]

As this Provincial Government at this point continues to place austerity as leaner strategy on COE, we must remember what the same Provincial Treasury argued during the Quarter 1 performance. They said:

“Service delivery has increased need for staff...” [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

MS N D NKONDLO: “...need for staff and leading to pockets of burnout.”

This is the reality of many of the public servants that are placed into modern day slavery ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish up, member.

MS N D NKONDLO: ...and their dedication is undermined by this Government. The ANC does not support this budget. I thank you.
[Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you very much. I now recognise hon Makamba-Botya.

MS N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. The Economic Freedom Fighters is not happy about all these adjusted estimates of the Provincial Revenue in all the Votes across the board. The Department of Treasury has failed in its mandate and thereby failing the people of the Western Cape. Their endeavour to build capacity in the public sector has failed dismally. This is the Department with the Minister who spends 99% of her time blaming National Government for all the failures in this Province and takes credit for all smaller successes this Province achieves. With the mandate, Deputy Speaker, to build integrated partnerships to enable quality service delivery in a sustainable manner. The bulk of failures by all the Western Cape Departments should also be blamed on the Provincial Treasury. This is a province, Deputy Speaker, where municipalities are failing to deliver services to the people and the only thing celebrated is clean audits.

Clean audits, Deputy Speaker, do not constitute service delivery or improve the lives of poor people. We cannot have a Government that spends all its

time making sure that it acquires clean audits in the books but then at the same time people do not have services.

Deputy Speaker, this is a Government that awards big contracts to the companies associated and affiliated with those running the white monopoly capital. Its handlers have given in it a task which is to keep granting them these big Government contracts and making sure that the books remain clean.

Deputy Speaker, the EFF will not vote for any budget that fails to promote cohesion and take the poor people of the Western Cape seriously.

I thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Just note that we were not, you were not always audible, so I am not sure that the Hansard would be able to capture your speech correctly, perhaps you could send that in just to assist them. Thank you very much.

MS N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Noted.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now recognise hon member Murray.

Ms C A MURRAY: Thank you Deputy Speaker. The Provincial Treasury has an extraordinarily difficult task, considering our country's history. It aims to promote cohesion, and citizen centricity, and it aims to do so by building capacity in the public sector by being adaptive, innovative, and supportive.

It does so through integrated management and partnerships that enable delivery of quality services done sustainably.

As a Born Free, I have no comprehension of what many of my colleagues in this House have had to endure during the cruel apartheid regime. I have only heard the horror stories and I have seen the aftermath of deep inequality. Like many other Born Frees, seeing these injustices is extremely painful and we are left with the great burden of trying to fix what was broken by generations before us. But, Deputy Speaker, I am angry. My generation was told that we would live in a better society, but in my 28 years I have only seen crime, corruption and inequality get worse.

Our so-called liberators, the ANC, have only promoted division and focused on filling their coffers rather than helping those most vulnerable.
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take your seat. Hon Sayed, what is the point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: It is a request, is the hon Murray able to take a question on the history of South Africa?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Murray, would you like to take a question?

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] I did not ask a question. I said...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No-no, hon members. Sorry.

MS C A MURRAY: Thank you, the question was implied. I am not willing to take a question. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members. I cannot hear, hon Murray.

MS C MURRAY: The question was implied, I am not willing to take a question. I want to finish my speech. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Mr P MARRAN: She does not know the history.

MS C MURRAY: I will continue. Our so-called liberators, the ANC, have only promoted division and focused on filling their coffers since coming into government, rather than helping those most vulnerable. That is why I want to commend the DA-led Western Cape Government and particularly this Department ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

MS C MURRAY: ... on what they are doing to ensure that no person is left behind.

Mr P MARRAN: So the ANC liberated this member from what?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, no, hon Marran, no, no, no. You cannot do that. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Who liberated this country?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, hon Sayed. Hon Marran, no interjections in terms of Rule 40, please allow hon Cayla Murray to continue.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: The liberals who sat in apartheid Parliament liberated us.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed!

MS C MURRAY: ...fighting from the inside, on what we are doing to ensure that no person is left behind through the vision of cohesion and citizen-centricity. They are doing this with an Adjusted Budget of nearly R319 million for the 2022/23 financial year. The Budget, however, is constrained by the Provincial Equitable Share or lack thereof, a key source of the Budget for this Department. It has been reduced by R2,79 million, thanks to the ANC-led National Government, which is a decrease of 0,88%, and I think this is a laughable point by the ANC to talk about austerity measures being ineffective, particularly as they have a

skewed PES allocation towards our Province. But, Deputy Speaker, this adjustment had to be made by the Provincial Government in the face of spending pressures and failure of the National Government to add additional PES funding to service delivery. The ANC unsurprisingly are once again making it more difficult to promote cohesion and a citizen-centric approach to governance. Despite this, the Department will continue to strengthen its financial record keeping and reporting while contributing to clean audit outcomes.

Testament to this is that R62,1 million, an increase of 4,85% has been allocated to the Administrative Programme. Its Financial Management sub-programme has further received an increase of R4,44 million or 16,42%, bringing its Adjustment Budget to a total of R35,5 million, helping to achieve its mandate.

The DA-led Western Cape Government guided by its Recovery Plan has further redirected funding from the Sustainable Resource Management Programme to the tune of R2,8 million to support infrastructure project implementation and movable asset plans and provides reports to the Cabinet on the implementation of infrastructure projects. This will ensure that the Western Cape continues to create an enabling environment for job creation and promoting the values of freedom, fairness, opportunity and diversity for all. This Department is further bolstering service delivery and promoting cohesion through its Asset Management Programme, which has been allocated R76,9 million in the Adjusted Budget, an increase of 0,7% from the Main

Budget. Its Local Government Supply Chain subprogramme will also receive an increase of R1,58 million helping to streamline and improve services rendered to municipalities. A key function of this Department is ensuring that those services rendered by Municipalities are delivered in line with auditing practices, sufficient risk management and legal frameworks. This is done while maintaining the Department's status as an accredited member of the South African Institute of Chartered Accountants (SAICA). This is South Africa's pre-eminent accounting body and chartered accounting training office.

The subprogramme Corporate Governance will receive a welcome R7,96 million, or 56,6% increase, ultimately improving municipal service delivery.

The Chartered Accountant Academy has been permanently established within the Provincial Treasury and graduates have been absorbed in the public and private sectors. Demand remains robust and the programme is constantly or continuously replenished with new trainees. Discussions are further underway, which is incredibly welcomed with municipalities to latch on to the successes of the programme and add to the talent pool of professionals in the public sector. The increase will come from the Financial Governance Programme, which will receive nearly a 51,8%, or a welcomed 24,04% increase.

I also want to welcome Minister Wenger's announcement that this Department is continuing in its commitment to use Tech in its SCM processes

to ensure that Government is not left behind and keeps up with the demands of an increasingly digitised economy and digitised Government.

What underpins this Department's ability to drive cohesion and its citizen-centric approach is its unrelenting commitment to clean audits. Clean audits are not miraculously achieved as other parties might allude to. Rather, systems and frameworks are put in place and rigorously adhered to by the Department, which has a tangible effect on fiscal responsibility throughout the Provincial Government. This directly contributes to less money being wasted and more being available to deliver key services to our residents. This is evidenced by the Provincial Government receiving unqualified audits for all its departments in the last year.

It is clear that this Adjustment Budget takes its aim of promoting cohesion and citizen-centricity very seriously. That is why, as a Born Free, living in the very best run province in this country, that I am pleased to support this bill. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, very much, hon member. I now recognise the hon Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. I will say I definitely agree with hon Nkondlo, it is not right that the budget has been cut. In fact, the National Government cut the budget by R2 billion. That is not right, and one can see

how this affects key service delivery in departments such as Health and Education, and we do not have a blanket austerity approach. We in fact have a differentiated approach and departments manage their own cost of employment, and in fact this Province has buffered frontline services precisely to protect them from the cuts that we are getting from the National Government. I wonder if the hon member supports the SoE bailout, which took money away from provinces to burn at failing SoEs that are actively hindering our economy.

For the hon Makamba-Botya to say that the Department has failed on its mandate ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: I think I should use this opportunity to quote the Auditor-General, who said in her most recent report that:

“The consistent positive pattern of prior years continued reflecting an overall robust control environment with a solid and consistent pattern of good financial governance. This positive reflection highlighted the tone set by the accounting officers and authorities, instilling a culture of doing the right thing, being accountable and improving controls, key elements in achieving and sustaining clean audit outcomes.”

Now, I do not know if any other province could boast such a wonderful note from the Auditor-General, but certainly it is something that we take very seriously and are very proud of and work very hard towards. [Interjections.] In addition we recognise that clean audits are a milestone in our pathway to a destination... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms N D NKONDLO: Clean audits are... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Meanwhile disclaimers and adverse opinions are not, and on that note I would like to thank the Standing Committee under the loadshedding of hon Murray for the very important role that they play in conducting robust oversight over the two departments, and we really appreciate their inputs, the critiques and they help us to do better. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. That brings us to the end of the Vote 3.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will ask – hon Dugmore, do you have a point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: A point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. That brings us to the end of Vote 3. I recognise the hon Dugmore. (01:46:07)

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, I just seek your advice in terms of a motion in terms of 150(1), (2) and (3). As you know that motions need to be delivered to the Secretary before 12. I have established that the Secretary does not appear to be physically around. So I have actually sent him a copy of this motion. So I want to be within the Rules. Would it be possible that I can hand the motion to the Table, but I have sent the Secretary a copy of this motion.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may, within your rights deliver any motion before 12 o'clock in terms of 151(2) and (3). I am not going to make a big thing of it, you can put it to Mr Stimela. Just to let you know, for the record, that the Secretary is the Chair of SoCATT and so today he is officially on SoCATT duty.

So you may give it to Mr Stimela.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. So did he appoint Mr Stimela as the acting ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Mr Stimela is the director and senior management.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Okay, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: He assists us. I am sure he can receive it if you have put it in writing. I am going to not interfere with due process.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed, thank you very much.

I will ask, Mr Stimela, if you may, just to move and to read the Third Order of the Day. Hon members, I would like to get through that one before lunch. Thank you, over to you.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Opportunities and Tourism – Western Cape Adjustment Appropriation Bill.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Stimela.

I now recognise the hon Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

There can be no greater priority than rapidly growing the economy so that we enable opportunity and job creation for our citizens. After years of state capture, anti-

private sector, anti-growth policies and devastating loadshedding, the State has hindered and not helped the private sector to create jobs in this country.

While the Western Cape has taken a very different road, the impact of the approach nationally coupled with the global COVID-19 pandemic, has meant that we have much, much more to do to deliver the opportunity our citizens need to succeed. This is why our Framework of Hope, which I tabled before this Parliament, has at its heart the requirement that we realise private sector-led breakout economic growth in the Western Cape by landing a new economic growth strategy in the province.

Following our COVID-19 pandemic economic response through our jobs now and recovery plans, it is important that we move forward on our pathway from recovery to growth. This is precisely why this Vote is so critical for our Government and its objectives. Indeed achieving an ambitious target will require the coordination of a data-led all of government approach, as well as partnership with the private sector. The Department of Economic Development and Tourism will be key to achieving this.

In my medium-term budget policy statement I set out how we will need to adjust our sales as we finalise and adopt this new strategy, which we aim to do before the end of this financial year and I certainly look forward to sharing more with you in our Main Budget for 23/24 as we begin to align to this new approach, which seeks to leverage horizontal enablers to unlock higher levels of growth in our province.

To [Inaudible.] strategy by then we have in this Adjustment shifted a million rand to

enable the purchase of additional data subscriptions so that we have the necessary economic intelligence to finalise the work. A key requirement of this strategy is that we leverage economic data to inform our decision-making and so this intelligence is crucial.

We are also shifting R400 000 to this project to enable an intensified stakeholder consultation process. We ensure that it is an informed piece of work which all of society can unite behind.

Hon Deputy Speaker, a key horizontal enabler for economic growth is ensuring that our citizens have the right skills to access the job market. To support the creation of this talent pool we are investing in our citizens to ensure that they have the right qualifications, the right skills and the right experiences for the jobs available now and in the future so that we can take full advantage of the immense potential of our economy. This is why the Department of Economic Development and Tourism works hard with various partners and stakeholders across all levels of government, as well as international partners, to create more opportunities to upskill young people.

To enable this work further, nearly a million rand, R990 000, has been shifted in the Adjustment Budget to help deliver various digital skills and youth entrepreneurship programmes, as well as for upgrade and maintenance of IT infrastructure at the I-CAN Centre in Elsies River. This I-CAN Centre is a pioneering community-based centre developed in partnership with the City of Cape Town and which provides digital skills programmes to residents.

To date it has had more than 94 000 visitors, with 13 627 training opportunities being provided. We, however, know that we must do more with less in the difficult fiscal environment we face. I therefore also want to congratulate the DEDAT team for working hard to leverage external funding to boost skills in the province so that we can multiply this effect. I think it is worth noting that the Department leveraged more than R150 million last year alone to support our skills programme.

Another critical way to unlock economic growth in the Western Cape is through enabling small and micro enterprises to grow, succeed and employ more people. To do this the Western Cape Government runs the SMME Booster Fund which distributes funding to selected organisations to deliver training programmes on business development support and access to markets.

To enable the funding of multi-year projects by beneficiaries of this fund, R4,6 million has been [Inaudible.] to the 23/24 financial year.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it brings me great joy and lots of relief to see full flights of tourists landing in the Western Cape again. Every tourist contributes to job creation. So the fact that between January and October of 2022 Cape Town International Airport recorded 4,9 million two-way domestic passengers and 1,4 million two-way international passengers, this really is very good news.

One of our destination's core offerings for both domestic and international visitors is the fact that we are a global capital for events. From the International Jazz Festival to major medical conferences at our convention centres, we are a place where people

come together to gather, to meet, to learn and to have fun. Next year, I am pleased to note, our visitors will have enough reason to come to Cape Town in the Western Cape with the City of Cape Town being announced as the host city for the E-Grand Prix World Championship for the next five years. This electric motorsport event is held across 12 destinations on five continents and is expected to result in an economic impact worth hundreds of millions of rands, including major global [Inaudible.] for our country.

It also brings with it important conferences such as the Green Economy Summit and the E-Fest, which will help catalyse e-mobility and the take-up of green energy solutions in South Africa. To contribute to enabling this important event over the MTF, R3 million has been allocated from our budget to the lead department, the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sports.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I nearly fell off my chair when I received in my inbox a request to comment on the [Inaudible.] South African Shipping Company Bill, which aims to establish a state-owned shipping company in South Africa. Yes, you heard correctly. [Interjections.] The country just spent R30 billion bailing out struggling SOEs. Instead of a water-based zombie SOE, we rather need world-class working ports with excellent turnaround times for private shipping lines.

If we get the ports right, these shipping lines will call again and we, according to our own research, will significantly boost growth and job creation and the best way to do this is through ensuring private sector participation at our ports and most certainly the Port of Cape Town, which has surprisingly been excluded by Operation

Vulindlela. This is something we will continue to push to have changed because the Port of Cape Town is an excellent candidate for this initiative.

Hon Deputy Speaker, to continue our important work in unblocking the inefficiencies of the Port of Cape Town and to better align this work to our focus on exports and logistics, R1,37 million has shifted from Programme 2 to Programme 3 and additional human resource capacity will be added to the team to strengthen its work further.

Hon Deputy Speaker, together this means the Department of Economic Development and Tourism budget for the 22/23 financial year is adjusted to R510 million, which is tabled before you for debate today.

I would like to use the opportunity to thank the new Head of Department, Mr Velile Dube, for his leadership and hard work and to the officials within DEDAT for their commitment to realising the better future we hope to achieve. No matter how big the challenge, this team wakes up every day to help get our economy growing and I am so grateful for their passion. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. [Applause.]

I now recognise hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, the ANC does not support this budget. The MEC of Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism introduced a growth for jobs strategy, which is still transitioning between existing strategies at the moment. We must actually call and caution this Department's role that it is [Inaudible.] ensure economic development and opportunities for all in this particular province.

That actually the efforts of PERO and MERO remain an opportunity for this Department to actually play that leading role and deal with a racialised past and a fiscal policy that actually make choices to keep the structural inequality in this particular province.

The strategy for jobs that the MEC spoke about in the tail end of this particular administration is actually laughable because we are sitting here almost with a year to end and close books for this particular administration and yet we are told of a strategy for jobs that is going to be concluded by the end of this financial year and the question is where are the jobs that the Premier spoke about early in his first State of the Province Address?

He promised the citizens of this province that in each household he shall ensure that there is a job. Where are we in [Inaudible.] as the MEC speaks about putting together this particular jobs strategy?

Again we have been seeing reports and quarter one is once again more evidence, MEC, that on the jobs front the Department of Public Works, through the EPWP, registered more than 100 000 EPWP job opportunities. Are those the jobs that this

Province is able to deliver to the citizens of this country? And as part of that we are also told that 60 jobs out of R100 million investment by Wesgro, such jobs are very expensive I think to secure in this Provincial Government. Only 60 out of an investment of R100 million and others are marketing in vans and other things. The question is where are those particular jobs that we are talking about at this point?

We all know that when we talk about these new strategies that are always called upon, that we would like to caution once again about political posturing because we are going to another election in 2024, that new promises, new things gets to be promised to the citizens so that they are lured into being voting fodder, we want results and at this point, MEC, when there is once again a surrender of Compensation of Employees' funding, we ask the question: what is informed or what is behind these delays of filling up of vacancies? This has been happening year in and year out and at this point what we want to see is vacancies being filled from this particular Provincial Government and Department, particularly that has a responsibility to activate economic development.

We take note also of the R10.037 million for the SMME Booster Fund that was shifted from the Public Corporations and Public Enterprises, to Non-Profit Institutions in sub-programme 2.1 on Enterprise Development, and we shall always as the ANC, as we have done, support monies towards the SMME Booster Fund because we have all agreed that an economy of this nature of ours must allow SMMEs to actually pioneer new grounds of ensuring economic activities, and therefore that becomes very important and amongst others is to look at the point of infrastructure. I am sure MEC Simmers have been raising the issue of extortion and

criminality in the construction space and for me it is very challenging that this particular Department is silent on what are the fights in as far as safety is concerned around Business Against Crime, because also crime must be viewed as an economic act, an economic sabotage because those emerging contractors that are actually deprived an opportunity to participate in the construction industry and help us to reboot that industry, that has got a serious potential of employment and at this point we are not seeing much robust intervention in those communities where such infrastructure is required, and this is a concern, MEC, that for me I do not see the role of the Economic Development Department actually in that space.

Amongst others are the township economies which we shall not deter to actually raise with you the informal economy because once again as you claim that the PERO and MERO are information at your disposal and you shall always utilise it in good faith to decide on the proper policy choices to make, that here is the PERO providing in another financial year. I think MEC Maynier, as your colleague and your predecessor, can actually also tell you that this happened where jobs were registered, positive growth in this informal sector and once again it has done that, and amongst others, what it does it has shown employment of the sector or the designated groups that are not found in the main economy, particularly in terms of job creation because of structural problems in the labour market where black people, Africans in particular, and women are not necessarily absorbed and we are told [Inaudible.] because of education attainment, a low educational attainment levels, but the informal sector has demonstrated and the PERO is actually speaking about that. That it has demonstrated employment opportunities for those sectors of economy. So what is it that should be done for you, MEC, and your HOD and the team in Economic

Development to start taking informal economy serious and elevating it into the space it desires, to sit next to the formal economy and be attended to in the same vigour that you are doing as you now speak about the ports, and you seem to be very interested in the Port of Cape Town where you had poached the HOD and †iyahlebisa lo nto leyo....[And that is what makes people complain.]

... because there are other ports here in the province, there is the Saldanha Port, there is also Mossel Bay and there are also small harbours that I think could all be integrated so that if we talk about transportation of goods and services and processing towards a leveraged economy, such is integrated.

This one of this particular port of Cape Town †iyahlebisa [makes people complain.]

I must say because it seems that the only interest that you have is only on the Port of Cape Town and we actually commend the improvements that have been seen as we approach the season now, of the fruit growers in that particular space, that indeed there has been, out of the engagements that have been held, improvements in terms of capacity to ensure that the delays in the ports are things of the past.

As we conclude, hon Deputy ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please finish your sentence off, the time is up, hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: The ANC, as we continue to say, we shall focus and we want

this particular Department to focus on the structural inequality in this particular province and the ANC will never stop making this particular call, and the ANC does not support and therefore rejects this Budget. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Nkondlo. [Applause.]

I now recognise the hon member Mkamba-Botya.

Ms N MKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

I take note of what you have [Inaudible.] earlier on that I am having problems with network so I will send my speech to the guy for Hansard purposes.

Hon Deputy Speaker, an adjusted budget decrease of more than R4.7 million by Government that fails to create an enabling environment for meaningful job opportunities, is disappointing. Whilst the hourly national minimum wage rate of R23,19 is very low, the Department of Economic Opportunities also has a duty to encourage prospective employers with interest to invest in the provincial economy.

This whole issue, hon Deputy Speaker, of minimum wage rate [Inaudible.] has been taken [Inaudible.] mean that employers must always stick to even in situations where they can offer more.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it is shocking, for example, that the Provincial

Government would announce that the agricultural sector of this province is booming and whilst farmers make billions in profits from [Inaudible.] the hourly minimum wage rate of farm workers does not increase, even though they also played a big role in making sure that there is an increase in production and profit.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the same thing is also true in other sectors of the economy. One cannot celebrate more revenue and economic boom, but [Inaudible.] the lives of poor people do not change. In essence, hon Deputy Speaker, what is being celebrated is that inequality is widening. The owners of means of production continue to fill their pockets with billions of rands and a worker remains alienated with their situations not getting better [Inaudible.] salaries.

On that note, hon Deputy Speaker, the EFF does not support this Vote, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member, will you also send that speech? I think you had a few moments also with your connectivity.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I now recognise hon member Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, informal trading and street trading are not being recognised for their contribution to the province's economic growth. In Athlone's Gatesville, for example, informal traders who are mostly women that make efforts to sell their homemade products to uplift their families out of poverty, continue to be deprived of their right to trade in open available competitive spaces.

The current system is scuttling their trading and livelihoods instead of creating healthy environments for small informal traders. It is harming and restricting them from addressing their basic needs.

We question the Province and City of Cape Town's joint initiative of the Tourism Safety Units which will be unequally deployed to safeguard only certain tourist destinations. Again tourist destination on the Cape Flats ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: ... are not protected. The Al Jama-ah does not support this unequal Budget. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member.

I now recognise the hon member Murray.

Ms C A T MURRAY: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

In considering whether or not to support this budget, I have measured its success against the objectives set out in the Western Cape Government's Provincial Recovery Plan.

The plan is guided by its three North Stars of Well-Being, Safety and Jobs and it is this Department's specific responsibility to look out for the priority of jobs. The success of this plan is measured through evidence and data and this Adjustment Appropriation Bill offers us as a House – please listen – as a House the opportunity to use this data and evidence before us to determine whether the Department is on track.

In doing so it will guide us all in terms of whether this Vote should indeed be supported or not, but, hon Deputy Speaker, before I outline why it is that this Department is indeed on track, it is important to interrogate why the Provincial Government should be guided by a recovery plan at all.

The COVID-19 pandemic had a destabilising impact on both lives and livelihoods of residents. It exacerbated socio-economic inequalities in our communities and the road to recovery has since been tumultuous. Fast-forward one year since the establishment of the Recovery Plan and we see that across the country residents are struggling with sky high unemployment rates, the astronomical cost of living, loadshedding and crime. We even face the looming risk of being grey listed. It is extremely concerning.

What is more, the very value of a sovereign currency has taken a hit as the President is fighting to keep his job amid destabilising factional battles within the ANC. [Interjections.] Within the ANC. You have an impact on our entire country.

By implementing the Recovery Plan, the DA-led Western Cape Government was not only responding to the crisis at the time, but anticipating further issues so that it could respond to the best of its ability. This is indeed a data-based and evidence-led approach.

This Department is prioritising job creation as it is responsible for providing qualitative leadership to the Provincial Government through its intense focus on the ease of doing business, boosting investment and exports, enterprise development, work placement and skills development, as well as energy resilience. The importance of the job priority in the work that this Department is doing, is highlighted by the fact that the Western Cape Government has allocated an outstanding R16 billion to it this year.

It aims to achieve this through its Adjusted Budget of just R510 million for the 2022/23 financial year and it is doing so despite a key source of the budget for this Department being constrained, namely the Provincial Equitable Share, which has declined by R5,619 million or 1,14%, which means, as the Minister has said, the Department has to do more with much less.

Despite this, hon Deputy Speaker, the Department is continuing to accelerate the ease of doing business through initiatives, including the Red Tape Reduction Unit. It

is important to note that while it is not Government's job to create jobs, the DA-led Government is creating an enabling environment for the private sector to ensure job creation. This is essential if we are to reduce the country's exorbitant burden of debt thanks to the ANC-led National Government and ensure that more money is spent on empowering those most vulnerable in our society.

The commitment to the ease of doing business is situated under the important programme of Integrated Economic Development Services, which has been allocated R47,8 million for the adjustment period and taking an evidence-led and data-based approach, this programme has realigned its funding to the tune of R4,6 million for 2023/24 financial year, to fund future financial years for the SMME Booster Fund Project. This will ensure that funds are spent on supporting SMMEs across the province to flourish and to create more jobs. It will further enhance the governance standards within the Department by preventing advance payments for the delivery that will only be affected by the following year.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the SMME project is a flagship project and I have had the privilege of seeing its successes first-hand. It is tackling the job priority head-on by supporting SMMEs that are owned by women, that are owned by youth, that are owned by differently-abled persons, as well as those who are based in townships and those who are based in rural communities. Of course there is always more that needs to be done to empower the informal sector, but while the ANC argues that this Department does little to support township economies, the Adjustment Bill shows that this is blatantly untrue.

Of course supporting SMMEs is not a silver bullet and ensuring that we are supporting the growth of businesses requires that we are also developing a sustainable skills pipeline. This Department does exactly that through its Skills Development and Innovation Programme, which will receive nearly R95.9 million this year.

I would like to commend the Department on their foresight as they further increase the revenue to the tune of R851 million for the manufacturing, engineering and related service sector educational training authority [Inaudible.] skills development programme.

In essence this project is supporting the creation of a skills pipeline for the tech intensive jobs of the future [Inaudible.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, among the ways in which this Department is taking a database and evidence-led approach to ensuring that it prioritises jobs is through its focus on research. It is continuously looking for new and better ways to inform policy that will enable growth. The Department has received an increase of R2 million or 17,67% for its knowledge management and R1,59 million for its research development sub-programmes.

This will focus on engaging with the private sector to ensure that Government is responsive to their needs and provides economic policy research and strategy development to the Provincial Government.

This budget has been made available through the Economic Planning Programme which will receive approximately R150,4 million through this adjustment, which is a considerable increase from the Main Budget, but, hon Deputy Speaker, creating jobs requires that we not only focus on the local economy, but also on the global economy, ensuring that we leverage every opportunity for growth.

That is why approximately R74,8 million has been allocated through this adjustment to the Trade and Sector Development Programme. This is a marked increase from the Main Budget and it will see additional funding allocated towards prioritising key job creating sectors in our province, including agri-processing, manufacturing and services to increase exports and investment in those sectors. The programme provides the support by addressing trade barriers, sector specific research and facilitating cooperation between stakeholders at different levels.

In an ongoing effort to prioritise job creation, the Department has further shifted R3 million from Tourism, Arts and Entertainment Programme to the Provincial Department of Cultural Affairs and Sports. This programme will consequently be allocated R71,5 million.

The shift will put our province on the map and further market us as a global tourist destination as it will be used to support the Cape Town E-Prix which will take place in February 2023. This event is momentous and even historical as it is the very first time that the FIA has held a race in South Africa since 1993, pre-democracy. While generations before my time have never had the privilege, we are of course all looking forward to it and it is a massive vote of confidence, so to speak, in the DA-

led Western Cape Government.

I want to commend hon Minister Wenger, HOD Dube and the officials of this Department for their hard work and ensuring qualitative leadership to the provincial economy. They are helping to identify economic opportunities and contributing to the administration's economic priority of jobs.

In the last year alone 203 000 jobs were created in the Western Cape. Unemployment, according to the QLFS, has also declined if you look at the expanded and official unemployment stats and I think this is noteworthy for hon member Nkondlo who has alluded that unemployment is not being sufficiently addressed, as we specifically see that there is quarter-on-quarter decline in unemployment, but of course this is a clear indication as well that the Department is taking an evidence-led and data-based approach to its priority job creation.

I would also like to commend the members of the Standing Committee for their cordiality, professionalism and unwavering commitment to uplifting the people of this province.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it gives me great pleasure to support this Bill today. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

I now recognise the hon the Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

I will attempt to amalgamate the inputs in the debate. Thank you very much hon members for your contributions.

The PERO and the MERO are indeed early guiding documents that we certainly use in our work and, yes, the Premier promised job creation in his maiden SOPA, that has not changed, but we cannot continue on the same trajectory when the world around us has changed fundamentally. We had a once in 100-year pandemic which devastated jobs.

So that [Interjections.] means we have to adjust our sails and that is exactly what the Department did. It had a jobs now strategy and then a recovery plan and now we are moving from recovery to growth and therefore the growth for jobs strategy because Government needs to be agile and responsive to how the world changes to be able to tailor its responses.

We do not have a one size fits all because that is how we are going to reach our objectives of job creation in this province and just recently last week we heard in the quarter three jobs results that 85 000 jobs were created in the Western Cape in quarter three. That is 203 000 jobs year-on-year, and when we talk about the growth for job strategy we definitely include townships, an informal economy, because those are essential parts of our economy. So those are definitely an important part of

the strategy that has been developed [Interjections.].

In terms of trading permits and tourism, the Safety Unit, I think the hon member is in the wrong Vote, in the wrong Legislature, but let me just say this, we have [Interjections.] allocated R1 billion for safety, for boots on the ground in communities that need it the most [Interjections.]. Those communities that are most affected by crime, R1 billion, okay? [Interjections.]

So ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: And in addition to that the hon member and myself had a conversation on the floor here in the suspension of proceedings, about how important tourism is for jobs, especially for women in tourism and how we both enjoyed the local tourism offerings.

So the fact that 0,2% of the amount of the Safety Plan's budget has been put towards a collaboration with the City of Cape Town to ensure that tourists can enjoy tourism experiences in the province, really, I do not know how that could be criticised because it is to ensure safe experience for you and for you and for you, as well as visitors that come and enjoy our tourism offerings from Gauteng, from the Eastern Cape, from KZN and so on, and those visitors who come from outside our borders.

We know that tourism creates jobs and a part of that is having an enjoyable experience so that people come back [Interjections.] and they enjoy our destination and when they come back, they explore even further into the province and so that is an important part of ensuring our recovery to growth in the tourism sector as well.

Then I think that responds then to most of the issues raised in the debate. I would like to thank the members for their inputs. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. [Applause.]

Hon members, I am going to suspend the House for lunch right now because we will have an afternoon programme that we have to get through. The proceedings will be suspended and will resume at 2 o'clock. Thank you very much.

[The House adjourns at 12:30]

[The House resumes at 14:00]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I am now going to ask the Secretary to read the Fourth Order of the Day, Vote 5 on Education.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 5 – Education Western Cape Adjustment Appropriation Bill.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. I now recognise

[Interjections.] – okay. Thank you very much, hon member, I recognise you.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon House Chair.

Hon House Chair, you may be aware that before 12 this morning I tabled a motion and I would just like to ask whether you as the House Chair could inform the House about how you intend to deal with the motion, particularly in terms of the Rule which says that if the motion is unanimously supported then it can be dealt with on the same day.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member.

Hon member, the Deputy Speaker will be joining us to deal with that. I think she is still busy with that. Immediately when she comes to take a seat, she will deal with that, if it is okay with you, is that right? Thank you very much.

I now recognise hon Minister David Maynier. [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Chairperson.

Our budget is indeed a Framework for Hope; hope for parents, hope for our teachers and most crucially hope for our children, and so it gives me great pleasure to introduce the 2022/23 Adjustment Budget for the Western Cape Education Department, which increases our Main Budget by R17,85 million, from R28,03 billion to R28,5 billion.

Hon Chairperson, when I was appointed in this role I decided to take a slightly different approach to establishing my priorities. I embarked on a listening and learning programme to hear about existing and new ideas that will help us deliver quality education for our learners and hope for our province.

One fact that became immediately clear is that the principals, teachers, practitioners and officials that make up our Education sector, are the greatest asset we have. We entrust our children to their care, to nurture and to guide throughout their schooling career and as I said during my speech at the Provincial Teaching Awards, where I was joined by some members of this House, the one thing that the pandemic taught us is that schools matter and teachers matter.

It came as no surprise to us that our provincial winners went on to shine at the national awards, with no less than four of our teachers winning their categories and a further two placing second. I would like to thank all our teachers across the province for their innovation, for their dedication, for their integrity, for their commitment, for their courage, for their caring and most importantly for their love of our children here in the Western Cape. With such care and dedication in our classrooms, there is surely no limit to what we can achieve.

It is clear that we have great public schools in our province delivering excellent results across our province. We should be proud of their achievement and the work that our schools are doing, but we must not forget the challenges.

A few school visits really stood out for me during my listening and learning programme. At Gordon High School I experienced the reality of overcrowding in classrooms. Every available space in the school had been converted into a classroom, be it a storeroom or a staff room.

At Kalkfontein Primary School I learned that out of a full class of Grade R learners, only a handful had lunchboxes, bringing home the striking reality of our learners' home circumstances.

At Bardale Primary School, which is one of our oldest mobile schools in the province, it was clear that we have a great need for upgrading schools across the board, even as we build new schools.

At Manenberg High School the teacher relayed her traumatic experience of having a bullet fly through the window of the staff room showing just how difficult it can be to educate our children in areas plagued by violent crime.

One thing of course that these schools had in common was excellent leadership and profoundly committed and hardworking teachers. Every one of them was positive and proactive with a common sense and common purpose to uplift our children and I am truly inspired by their work. These schools all have great potential, we just need to help them get, but we cannot say, hon Chairperson, we cannot say that every child is receiving a quality education if they are too many learners in a class, if there are too few teachers in a school and if there are too few schools in our province.

I want us to have more beautiful, safe, inspiring schools that deliver great results in

poor communities so that we deliver better opportunities and brighter futures and indeed hope for all our children here in the Western Cape, which is why we are setting a bold new education agenda to do just that. We are employing up to 1 143 additional teachers to staff new classrooms and bring down class sizes. We are offering permanent posts to up to 500 qualified Grade R teachers already employed in our schools in subsidised posts, to retain their skills in the system and expand our provision of Grade R arm.

We are aiming to deliver up to 26 000 new places in our schools next year through our Unprecedented School Infrastructure Delivery Programme, and of course we are taking decisive steps to reverse the learning losses that have knock-on effects throughout our learners' schooling careers.

Hon Chairperson, we have just announced the biggest, fastest and most ambitious school infrastructure delivery programme in years, which aims to deliver 842 new classrooms for the 2023 school year. We are in a position to do so as a result of our budget increase, along with having greater flexibility in implementing our infrastructure programme.

The number of learners in our province's schools has grown by an average of about 17 900 learners every year for the past five years. Accommodating these new entrants alone would require the construction of 20 new schools each year, but there are a number of other factors affecting school infrastructure, such as the backlog in provision from past years, which has led to crowded classrooms.

We also have a very old portfolio of infrastructure, having inherited many buildings from the apartheid era that need maintenance and replacement. These needs must of course be weighed against the need for new infrastructure, despite the current projections that the average increase in learner numbers will continue.

Our province continues to draw new entrants to our school system as parents seek out better economic opportunities and higher quality education and we must of course make provision for this pattern to continue.

The 842 classrooms planned would provide 26 000 extra places in our schools, now spread over a number of different types of projects. Three brick and mortar new and replacement schools; five new mobile schools; 645 additional classrooms at existing schools and seven Rapid School Build Programme Projects.

As we outlined to the Standing Committee on Education, we have already completed 164 classrooms planned for next year and a further 510 are scheduled for completion by January 2023 and the final 168 are due to be completed by March 2023. The Rapid School Build Programme is an exciting new infrastructure programme that seeks to bring together various stakeholders with the aim of developing and building seven schools within six months to accommodate 3 200 learners.

The management, speed and cooperation of the Rapid School Build Programme differentiates it from typical projects. We are using new building technology like the Moladi technology which uses frames to mould permanent concrete walls. Our contractors have been very receptive to the programme and we will be working

through the traditional builders holidays to help us deliver more places for our learners.

All of these new classrooms will of course need teachers to teach them and so earlier this year, as I have said, we announced one of the largest increases in the basket of posts in quite some time, allowing us to appoint up to 1 143 extra teachers for the 2023 school year.

Now some hon members have already started criticising us for the scale of the school building saying that the programme is over ambitious. I am reminded of a great quote by Franklin D Roosevelt, when he said:

"The country demands bold, persistent experimentation. It is common sense to take a method and try it. If it fails admit it frankly and try another, but above all try something."

If there was ever a time to be ambitious, to lean in, a time to be bold and a time to try something, that time is now, and so yes, we are being ambitious, providing 26 000 new places for the 2023 school year. Yes, we have already had some challenges at some of our sites, which is extremely disappointing and any disruption or delay will deprive learners of places next year.

We have briefed the Standing Committee on Education openly on the considerable risks and yes, it is possible that some of the 842 classrooms may well be delayed, but that is not a reason not to try.

When I saw the speed at which the Moladi classrooms were going up at the Hindle High School last week and how beautiful the completed ones were at Westridge Secondary School, I was filled with a sense of optimism and indeed of purpose.

So while we are indeed aware that this is not an easy task and that there are many risks, I hope that we can all work together to prioritise the delivery of school infrastructure for our children.

Hon Chairperson, at the same time we must not lose sight of the fact that the COVID-19 pandemic had on learners already in our schools. Earlier this year we announced that the results of the 2021 systemic tests revealed severe learning losses associated with the pandemic. While we had previously made great progress with a steady increase in performance in years preceding 2020, these gains were unfortunately reversed by the pandemic.

The greatest learning losses of course were seen in the Foundation Phase. These learning losses will have serious knock-on effects as those learners progress through their school careers.

It was for this reason that we implemented a back on track intervention to reverse learning losses in the Foundation Phase. We took a decisive step of adding an extra two hours per week allocated to reading and one hour extra per week for Mathematics for all Grade 1 to 3 learners in this province, amounting to an increase of at least 60 additional learning hours per learner in these subjects, and I am

pleased to report that in a recent survey of our schools, 94% of teachers indicated that they would like the additional time allocation to continue in 2023.

The majority of teachers indicated that the additional time allocation was beneficial for the learners and 96% of teachers indicated that they could integrate life skills into languages with ease. Moreover, the early grade reading assessment results, which are measured twice a year, also show improvement across all eight education districts.

We have taken this information to the National Department and have already had a number of very positive conversations about implementing the additional time allocations across the country so that the unequal impact of learning losses can be addressed for learners in all provinces, not just here in the Western Cape.

Hon Chairperson, in the end what we want to see is schools that deliver hope for our children. The fact is that the vast majority of us in our country want to live together in harmony and want to improve the quality of life for all who live in our country. What we do not need in our country is division. What we do need is unity and compassion towards one another. Yes, we will face challenges and there are no doubt more difficult times ahead, but we will overcome those challenges if we keep in mind the central goal, the unity, quality and well-being of our children, and we will overcome those challenges if we all work together to achieve the vision of quality education for every child in every classroom in every school in the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister.

I now recognise hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Thank you very much, hon Chairperson.

We also thank hon Van der Westhuizen for the lamb shank, it is [Laughs.] – thank you very much, hon Chairperson.

Hon Chairperson, as articulated in our Standing Committee last week on behalf of the African National Congress, I rise to reject this budget. Hon MEC David Maynier speaks of a budget to bring hope, but unfortunately this budget represents the antithesis of that, notwithstanding the fact, and we thank the MEC that he does speak about the socio-economic conditions that our people are facing. We thank the MEC for that, but the budget does not speak to that particular reality.

While it is claimed that the Western Cape Education Department's budget increased over R17 million, the reality is that if it was not for the roll-overs of over R24 million, the budget could have decreased by R6,9 million. The budgets for early

Childhood Development and Infrastructure Development are decreased by R104 million and R130 million respectively. Such a move shows the DA's nonchalant attitude [Interjections.] towards access to quality education for all.

This budget is considered at the time when MEC Maynier promised to build 800 additional classrooms and seven new schools for 26 000 learners, as he articulated, in response to the DA's self-orchestrated crisis of unplaced learners year after year, and that will also see January 2023, and in response to us exposing these numbers and to us demanding that action be taken.

So oversight has worked to an extent. The budget cuts in the Infrastructure Development Programme show that the MEC's ambitious plan is merely DA spin. When MEC Maynier and his Department appeared before our Education Standing Committee last month, the public were told that as at 3 November 2022, over 25 000 learners were still in need of placement at schools across our province.

The budget cuts prove that the target to build 26 000 additional classroom seats will not be achieved and we know all too well the crisis that we will be faced with come January 2023.

We continue not to accept, however, any excuses for unplaced learners. A plan must take place. The ANC will fight that no child must be left behind in January 2023. That remains our motto. [Applause.]

It is extremely concerning that the WCED spending on its Infrastructure

Development Budget is slow compared to last year. There is a high probability that MEC Maynier's Department will underspend on this budget.

Under the Democratic Alliance since 2009, when they took office in this province, this Department has built a reputation for underspending on infrastructure development in particular. This Department's performance on infrastructure development can best be described as shambolic. This includes its dismal performance on maintenance and renovations at ailing schools in poor communities, both in the Metro and in rural areas.

One example is the delay, the long delay to renovate Portland Primary School in Mitchells Plain. The ANC first made calls for the renovations at the school during the Medium-Term Budget debate on 10 December 2021. Working closely with parents, community members and local ANC structures in the area, we continue to apply pressure on the Department. The school is now a construction site until 2023. That is a positive gain from active oversight.

We commend unsung heroes like the dedicated activist Mr Munir Hendricks, who is present in the gallery today. Sadly he was purged and suffered victimisation for reporting infrastructure challenges at the school while he was on the SGB and making demands for WCED to address the dangerous structural defects. Defects that impacted on his own children and other children.

Hon Chairperson, the ANC welcomes the over R10 million budget allocation for Public Special School Education. However, we are concerned by the shift of

R12,9 million for buildings and other fixed structures in special needs schools that will now be used in public ordinary schools. This is unacceptable as there are serious infrastructure needs across many special needs schools. We will continue to work with NGOs, some of whose representatives, like Terry Stevens from Autism SA, are present as our guest today, to stand up for our learners with special needs. Equally concerning is the fact that funds for Grade R in ECD Centres and public schools are being utilised for programmes such as Information Communication Technology.

In January 2023 we will sadly again, hon Chair, see learners from poor families being turned away from schools if they do not have money to contribute towards the compulsory donations set by certain schools in poor communities for Grade R classes. We witnessed this practice first-hand in Mfuleni and Elsies River last – not last year, this year January.

The ANC, hon Chair, is on record to have called on MEC Maynier to consider expanding the project of learner application pop-up banners to more shopping centres, beyond shopping centres and over a longer period to assist more of our parents. This was a programme which we called for initially in the time of MEC Schäfer and even actively went out to these pop-up banners to support the staff of WCED in doing their work.

We thus welcome the Department's commitment to provide more budget to expand this project. This programme should be fully funded and be implemented every year beyond shopping centres, to spaces such as taxi ranks, for example. The moratorium blocking school closures announced by MEC Maynier in the Sitting of 8 September

this year, will have an impact on the budget, which must be considered. This moratorium, however, is a victory for all progressive forces in the province. It is, however, disheartening that the Education Department has recently attempted to close Vleiplaas NGK Primary School near Barrydale in the constituency of the hon member Windvogel, despite this moratorium.

On 24 October this year I wrote to MEC Maynier, seeking clarity on whether the moratorium covered the planned closure of Vleiplaas. The MEC replied as follows:

"In the case of Vleiplaas the owners of the school building have indicated that they are not prepared to enter into a new contract with the Department." [Interjections.]

This response by the MEC indicated the Department's resolve to still close the school and to use the owners as a scapegoat.

I need to therefore acknowledge the efforts of dedicated education activists Ms Vanessa le Roux of the Parents for Equal Education in South Africa, for her fundamental role in collaborative efforts to now keep the school open. Ms Le Roux did the job that officials in the Department was supposed to do by engaging the owners towards reaching a workable solution so that the school does not close.

Hon Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, you can conclude.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... I want to raise concerns with regards to WCED's inconsistent treatment of school principals. The MEC has protected the principal of Zwaanswyk High School in Tokai, who faced serious maladministration allegations and bullying ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, your time is up, you can conclude.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: I am concluding, hon Chairperson.

Hon Chairperson, the African National Congress will not support this particular debate. We will not support a Vote of a Democratic Alliance that is based on neoliberal [Inaudible.] measures, that has got a Premier [Interjections.] that plunges this House ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... into disorder because he interferes with the running of this House ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... by interfering on who must lead this House.

I thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Your time is up, hon member.

Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon House Chair.

Hon House Chair, through to you, I want the Minister of Education to take note of what we are saying as EFF, that we are not impressed with the manner in which the Western Cape Department of Education handles matters that involves racial tensions in our schools.

The latest incident, hon Chair, is one from Fish Hoek High School which involves the Race Diversity Intervention Programme. The recent racial tensions in that school begun when a white teacher uttered slurs against non-white learners during an Afrikaans lesson. Instead of taking this white teacher to task, hon Chair, the Department and the school tried to sweep the matter under the carpet.

Now when aggrieved learners and parents raised their concerns, the Department now wants to be seen to be doing something by introducing the so-called Race Diversity Intervention Programme, which in essence had to be carried out in a manner that will nurse the egos of the same racists.

After realising that, hon Chair, the programme is not being taught according

to their own wishes, the Department now wants to kill a career and a company owned by a black woman who tried to contribute to the discourse of racism in a robust manner, by reading a certain poem.

Hon Chair, the Department is now in partnerships with organisations such as AfriForum in an endeavour to shift focus from the white racist teacher to an innocent black woman whose only sin in their eyes was to read an existing poem which speaks on the issues of racism.

We all know, Madam Chair, by now that this Department is failing dismally to carry out its duties of placing learners [Inaudible.] going forward because of its [Inaudible.] DNA.

Moreover, hon House Chair, the Department should also note that the period of colonialism and racism is over and white people will not dictate on how we should address issues of racism. We are not going to address issues of racism ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: ... in a manner that will make them happy.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, your time is up ...[Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTHA: On that note, hon Chairperson, the EFF will not support this Vote, thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member.

I now recognise hon member Christians.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Chairperson, and the ACDP as we said, supports the Budget Vote, but I want to bring a couple of concerns again to the Minister and the concerns are (1) the Department has increased the no-fee paying schools, but communities still struggling must pay something like R1 000 or more for stationery. They do not have money, but they are still burdened to pay stationery money and if they do not do that they are in trouble because they are burdened with those amounts.

Then another question to the Minister, we heard now again in the last time, report cards are held back by schools for people not paying school fees again. So if the Minister can give us a clear indication what is the policy of his Department.

Another big concern and I have mentioned it so many times, a child in Manenberg that applies to Wynberg does not get accepted because, as the Minister indicated, when we look at the traumatic experiences by a bullet ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, [Inaudible.] may conclude, your time is up.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Or the overcrowding of schools, that is why people want to give their children better education, quality education and they are not receiving. We are not on par when it comes to quality education. Thank you, hon Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member.

I now recognise hon member Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you very much, hon House Chair.

Hon House Chair, the Al Jama-ah Party cannot support this budget on Education as it is evident that the budget is not effectively aimed to solve crucial issues negatively impacting on the education of the poor.

We have seen how this DA-run province wastes money on court cases against the progressive principal of Heathfield High School, Mr Wesley Newman. This Department is even harassing educators who are supporting Mr Newman, not only wasting money on trumped up charges against Mr Newman, but also denying our children on the Cape Flats good teachers. We will not support this budget to build your unisex toilets in schools. We will not support this budget as it is not effectively addressing the need for safe and secure school environments. I thank you, hon House Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member.

I now recognise hon member Baartman.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP [DA]: Thank you, hon House Chair.

Hon House Chair, at the end of last week hon member Ricardo Mackenzie actually dubbed our Minister of Education as "Vinnige Fanie" and I just want us to note that it is quite ironic because in Afrikaans netball slang the "Vinnige Fanie" actually refers to the "VV" position in Afrikaans, or "verdedigende vleuel", and I would like to testify to the fact that in this particular year the Department of Education has truly been at the forefront of defending quality education for every child in every school in this province.

Together, the Health and Education budgets make up to over R168 billion over the MTF period or approximately 73% of the total budget and I would firstly like to congratulate the previous Minister of Education, Ms Debbie Schäfer, for achieving the unqualified audit for the Department for the past financial year [Interjections.], as well as achieving 100% expenditure on infrastructure for the Department, which is contained in the Annual Report of the Department on page 12, which was tabled at this particular House. [Interjections.]

Hon House Chair, Minister Maynier announced recently also that it would be constructing an additional 842 classrooms in the current financial year, which far exceeds the construction of 212 classrooms last year and as such will provide for at

least 26 000 places for learners. This Western Cape ground-breaking initiative will almost be 70% larger than the building of 499 classrooms, which Gauteng announced in the beginning of this year in comparison and thus the construction of these classrooms is crucial in sustaining our teaching capacity, and the WCED has indicated its commitment to working through the holiday season to make this happen.

You see, hon Chairperson, †verdedigende vleuel het visie en sy prioriteite is reg [defending wing has vision and his priorities are right.]

Hon House Chair, our educators are ... May I continue? Hon House Chair, educators are our frontline workers and without them we cannot achieve quality education. The WCED announced the appointment of up to 1 143 additional educators in 2023 and the estimated cost of the additional educator posts will amount to approximately R503,4 million. This will bring the amount of the teachers posts to over 36 000 for the 2023 year and will contribute to quality education in the province and the WCED will also be permanently employing 500 qualified Grade R teachers in the beginning of 2023.

I would like to take this moment also to congratulate Pinelands North Primary and Westend Primary for making it to the top three and top 10 in the World's Best Schools competition for overcoming adversity, hon House Chair.

Further, as the House may be aware, earlier this year the WCED took on the responsibility of the Early Childhood Development Centres from the Provincial

Department of Social Development. There are now 1 613 certified ECD Centres in the Western Cape that are financially supported by the WCED in order for them to carry out the operations. For those ECDs who have still not submitted their respective documents or submitted incorrect documents, we encourage them to contact the Department in this regard as they may know that they can only receive their funding if their documents are in order as per conditional grant criteria.

Additionally the WCED has spent more than R9,5 million on the Blocks For Growth and Step-Up programmes, which will provide 4- and 5-year-olds and 5- to 6-year-olds respectively with the opportunity to progress developmentally so that they can meet the demands of the learning environments. These funds are managed by social service organisations, namely the Learning Initiative and Knysna Education Trust.

Hon House Chair, during the course of this year the WCED also updated the Committee on the 2023 admissions process for Grade 1 and Grade 8 learners, after receiving over 117 000 applications for the 2023 school year. At that time 89,1% had already been placed as at 3 November this year, with the remainder in the process of being placed and of the total applications submitted, approximately 22 113 were received late.

This figure excludes the expected late applications which the WCED expects to receive towards the end of the year. We note that the WCED is working around the clock to still place approximately 12 000 Grade 1 and 8 learners for the next year. Hon House Chair, page 3 of that report, it is 12 000, not 25.

In comparison the ENCA reported on 27 November this year that Gauteng had over 35 000 Grade 1 and Grade 8 learners still to place for the new year, almost triple that of what the Western Cape is facing, and this is largely due to semi-migration across provinces to particularly urban centres.

If there are any parents who have yet to submit their children's applications they must do so urgently and contact the respective district offices and if there are any appeals in the respect to their child's placement, we recommend that they contact the Minister's office in this regard.

Honourable House Chair, March this year it was also revealed that the current growth rate of students taking at least one technical agricultural subject, is 3,26%, which exceeds the annual target of 2% this year. This is further proof of the essential role the industry plays in our province and economy, as well as the need to continue supporting education in this regard.

Agriculture as well as computational skills and the arts form part of the WCED's Science, Technology, Engineering, Arts, Mathematics, Agriculture and Coding or STEAMAC strategy, which aims to directly prepare learners for the career in these respective fields.

Last year the Department spent R2,6 million incorporating the disciplines of its arts subjects, consumer studies, agricultural technology, and agriculture management practices to STEAMAC. However, these developments further build on the progress that have been made over the years and since 2015 the WCED has then added 25

more schools which offer agricultural subjects.

Infrastructure allocations were initially made in 2020 to allow seven schools to accommodate agricultural technology, which was further expanded by 11 schools during the last financial year. It is clear that agriculture and coding will become more crucial in the education packages for our province has to offer and in August this year the WCED also revealed that it planned to establish 500 robotic encodings clubs in primary and high schools by 2024.

The Fourth Industrial Revolution is playing a significant role in transforming the economy and society. In South Africa alone there are thousands of jobs in the sector, where there are not enough candidates to apply and it is therefore crucial for our learners to easily integrate into an increasingly digitalised world.

Already the WCED has 211 robotic and coding pilot schools in place and has achieved 500 cost-effective robotics kits for schools, several coding and robotic committees, teacher orientation and training, as well as teacher professional development, the appointment of Deputy Chief Education Specialist in the WCED, which is a first in South Africa and greater collaboration between directorates to ensure efficiency in this regard.

While there is still a lot of work to be done, the Western Cape is laying the foundation for education to stay current, impactful and useful for our children.

Vinnige Fanie se prioriteite is reg, hon House Chair.

Hon House Chair, the long-term well-being of delivering inclusive education, previously known as special needs education, for learners still remains a funding concern and is currently not included in the National Treasury calculations for the Provincial Equitable Share formula. Without proper resources the Western Cape's progress will continue to be undermined, despite the budgetary ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, can you take your seat. Minister Sharna, I recognise you.

The MINISTER FOR SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon House Chair, is it appropriate for a member to call the speaker a blue liar? [Interjections.] Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon [Interjections.] – hon member, you are not [Interjections.] ... hon member Sayed, I recognise you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Can I [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Thank you, hon House Chair.

My understanding, hon House Chair, is that we just had the motion which was now passed for the ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... for the vacancy of the Speaker to be filled ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: That is not a point of order.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: I do not know which Speaker the hon Fernandez [Interjections.] is referring to ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Deputy Whip of the Opposition ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... we do not have a Speaker as yet, thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ... that is not the point of order. [Interjections.] and hon member Windvogel [Interjections.] ... hon member Windvogel ... hon members ... hon member Windvogel, you are not even on your seat. Can you really go to your seat so that I can be able to talk to you.

Hon member Windvogel, may I address you? [Interjections.] When you said, "The blue liars there," did you say that to any member in the House?

Ms R WINDVOGEL: No.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: She is a blue liar.

An HON MEMBER: Yes! [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. Hon member, you continue.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP [DA]: Thank you, hon House Chair.

I will deal with learning losses in our education system soon because there is a difference between a small "s" in a sentence and a big "S" in a sentence as well.

Hon House Chair, despite the budgetary pressures experienced in inclusive education even the National Department of Education has welcomed the advances the Western Cape Province had made. The Western Cape is the first province to have established inclusive education outreach teams who work in our eight districts of which there are 22 already in operation. These teams also join 64 circuit support teams wherein each has a psychologist, social worker and learning support advisor. [Interjections.]

The WCED has also launched a pilot with the Red Cross Memorial Hospital in relation to the policy of screening identification, assessment and support. This policy forms part of the framework as to how one determines whether a child needs to be

placed in a special school and with the cooperation of six doctors at this hospital the WCED has automated this process, which will allow greater efficiency in this regard. This process will also be reviewed with the hope that it will be rolled out to other large hospitals in the province.

Further the WCED has also recognised the need for staff to be able to accommodate [Interjections.] all learners and has begun the Teaching For All modules.

Thank you, hon House Chair. This project, which entails four modules, aims to provide teachers with the skills needed for inclusive education and while current teachers are being trained in cohorts, these modules will eventually become mandatory for teachers still undergoing the respective training.

All newly built schools in this category are also being built for accessibility for students with mobility difficulties and at least two current schools per district are being upgraded every year.

In terms of literacy and numeracy learning losses, hon House Chair, as we all know the pandemic has had profound consequences on our learning outcomes following the loss of face-to-face teaching and this translated into continual and steady progress which the WC had made during the years preceding COVID-19, being undone.

We saw this in the Western Cape systemic tests last year, the only province with such tests, where both pass rates and averages in Mathematics and Languages

decreased since 2019 and, hon House Chair, this is something that was experienced throughout our country, but here in the Western Cape we did not sit and wait around. This is why the WCED instituted its Back On Track Recovery Plan by allocating an additional two hours of group guided reading and one hour of Mathematics every week. It is expected that every Foundation Phase learner will gain an extra 60 hours of learning over the course of the third and fourth term and it is encouraging to hear from the Minister that 94% of teachers want this to continue in 2023 and the WCED has thus made the recommendation to National to also implement this across the country.

Further, hon House Chair, the WCED has facilitated the establishment of 571 food gardens at schools and has appointed 146 gardeners to ensure that these are sustained.

Further in the current financial year more than R451 million has been allocated to the National Schools Nutrition Programme, which is a conditional grant, which includes 1 024 schools and feeds over 500 000 learners. While there is no doubt that this programme ensures that many children do not go hungry, we are concerned about how the national quintiles system is excluding learners in need.

The system does not speak to the socio-economic status of the student and therefore results in insufficient funding allocated to the provincial departments and thus the respective schools. Thankfully, through savings that have been made in this programme, the WCED was able to fund selected quintile 4 to 5 schools for 190 days of the year and we encourage the Department to expedite its expenditure on the

programme for the rest of the financial year.

Hon House Chair, this budget further makes provision for the development of competency-based assessments of schools as it will be implemented by the Department of the Premier, as well as making R2,7 million available for the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport for the At Home Learning Programme.

The R16 million of rollovers from National is for committed expenditure, which will be for Math, Science and Technology expenditure conditional grant on page 69 of the budget, as well as for learners with profound intellectual disabilities conditional grant, also on page 69 of the respective budget, and the rest of the rollovers will be for the courier fees for June and November 2021 national senior exams.

Hon House Chair, I would like to conclude by thanking the members of the Education Committee, our procedural administrative staff of the Committee, the Minister of Education, the HOD, the departmental team, for their hard work during this past year and we hope to welcome them back in the new year, refreshed.

Hon House Chair, I would also like to take a moment to pay tribute to the late Chief Whip, Lorraine Botha, who was also the previous Education Committee Chairperson and who worked hard every single day to ensure that everything we do is in the best interest of the child. †Ons hoop dat ons braaf genoeg is om aan haar nalatenskap te kan voldoen. [We hope we will be brave enough to live up to her legacy.] We still have a lot to improve on in education, but we will continue working towards quality education for every child in every school in this province.

Hon House Chair, the Democratic Alliance supports this Vote. I thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member.

I now recognise hon Minister David Maynier. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Chairperson. [Interjections.]

As I stated during the debate, I want us to have more beautiful, safe, inspiring schools in poor communities to deliver better opportunities and brighter futures and hope for all our children. [Interjections.]

We are taking bold steps to expand the number of places for learners in our schools [Interjections.] by building schools and classrooms at an unprecedented rate and significantly increasing the number of teaching posts in our schools. In our interventions to reverse learning losses caused by the COVID-19 pandemic are bearing fruit, with the potential to be adopted across the country.

I would like to thank hon members of the House for their contributions to this debate and I would like to address a couple of the issues raised.

First on the whole question of ECD. The shifting of these funds, as the hon member

must know, will have no impact on ECD provision as of course the funds come from the Grade R sub-programme and this of course is due to the relatively lower cost requirements than projected at the start of the financial year because the programme, as the hon member knows, will now be implemented only from January 2023.

When it comes to learner placements we have briefed the Committee in detail and what the hon member appears not to have heard is that by 3 November 2022 the Department had placed 100 302 or 89,1% of Grade 1 and Grade 8 learners for the 2023 school year here in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

On the whole question of Fish Hoek High School. We have been absolutely clear that what happened at Fish Hoek High School [Interjections.] should never have happened and a full investigation is underway. That investigation is currently ongoing and of course to the extent that there may need to be interventions, they should always be aimed at building unity and deepening understanding rather than causing division and hurt at our schools, as appears to have been the case at Fish Hoek High School.

On the whole question of the Vleiplaas Primary School. The hon member is correct. The owners of the school building have indicated that they are not prepared to enter into a new contract with the Department and I can assure the hon member that we are negotiating with the owner and I expect such discussions to reach finality soon. [Interjections.]

I am concerned to hear about schools withholding reports and indeed schools where

parents cannot afford stationery. We do provide assistance and I would be delighted if the hon member Ferlon Christians would provide me with particulars of the matters which he raised so that we can deal with those schools.

The whole question of Wesley Newman and Heathfield High School. The hon member knows that the ELRC Commissioner has conducted a pre-arbitration meeting with the agreement of all parties present and dates have now been agreed to. I think we should not forget that Wesley Newman was found guilty of a number of a serious charges. He was nonetheless offered a second chance. He was offered a second chance, which he rejected and he was thus dismissed. We of course, hon member, are now focused on ensuring the teaching and learning at Heathfield High School continues in the best interest of the learners in a safe environment without disruption. I want to make it clear that we will not tolerate any attempts to disrupt and undermine teaching and learning at Heathfield High School.

Now the hon member Khalid Sayed, if hon members recall, made a lot of noise about not receiving the budget books during the debate, but the real question, hon Chairperson, is well, to what end? Because it does not appear that the hon member reads the Budget books. He claims that spending on infrastructure is slow, but indeed if he paid attention to page 78 of the Budget book, it says very clearly that spending, and I quote:

"Spending is higher."

And if he took the time to calculate the difference between spending on Table 5.3

compared to Table 5.4, he would find in fact that we have spent R260 million more on infrastructure this year compared to the same time last year.

An HON MEMBER: Comprehension. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

An HON MEMBER: Shame!

An HON MEMBER: Comprehension is very important.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Perhaps I could call on the hon Minister of Finance to convene a workshop for the hon member. [Interjections.]

Now the hon ...

An HON MEMBER: Special class.

An HON MEMBER: That is [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The hon member Khalid Sayed also makes ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, we cannot hear the speaker, please settle down. [Interjections.] Go on, hon Minister. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Hon Chairperson, the hon member Khalid Sayed makes another extraordinary claim [Interjections.] and that is that this is an austerity budget. Well, how do we explain the R6 billion increase to the Education baseline? The R2,5 billion infrastructure budget which has increased by R830 million. [Interjections.] The 1 143 additional posts.

Now I ask hon members [Interjections.] does this sound like an austerity budget?
No.

An HON MEMBER: No! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: No! This is a massive expansion in the budget.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: And a massive increase in access to education in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Hon Chairperson, in closing, this budget is indeed a framework for hope, hope for our parents, hope for our teachers and hope for our

children.

We know that we will face challenges as we seek to implement our bold new agenda for Education and we have been frank with this House about the nature of the risks involved, but as I said earlier, this is not a reason not to try. We will overcome those challenges if we keep in mind the central goal, the unity, the equality and the well-being of our children and we will overcome those challenges indeed if we all work together to achieve the vision of quality education for every child in every classroom, in every school in the Western Cape ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister, may you take your seat.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, is that a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Is the hon MEC able to take a question? Given that he does not respond, [Interjections.] he takes long to respond ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may sit down ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... is he able to respond ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister – sit down ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... to a question on the spending?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ... I heard you. Hon Minister, do you want to take a question?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Hon Chairperson, I mean this once again raises the question of whether it is not a requirement for another workshop because in fact I had completed my speech and cannot answer a question. Thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister.

That concludes the debate on this Vote. The Secretary will read the Fifth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development – Western Cape Adjustment Appropriation Bill.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Hon members, I now recognise Minister Fernandez.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon House Chairperson, hon Premier and Cabinet colleagues, hon members of the Provincial Legislature in the House and on the virtual platform, members of the media, citizens of the Western Cape, good afternoon, *goeie middag, molweni nonke, As-salamu alaykum.*

I rise to table the Adjustment Budget for Vote 7 as South Africa continues with its economic recovery following the devastating impact of the COVID-19 pandemic. Good afternoon.

We are still feeling the global effects of the Russia-Ukraine war and as a country we are battered by rolling blackouts which have a disproportionate impact on the lives and livelihoods of the most vulnerable in society.

The Department of Social Development has not been immune to the economic challenges and constraints imposed on the rest of the world and South Africa, over the last few turbulent years, but we remain resolute in our commitment to serving the most vulnerable with the limited resources and budgetary constraints so prevalent in all governments across our country.

One glimmer of hope is the R79,7 million increase in additional funding in our Adjustment Budget. This allocation increased our initial R2,2 billion budget to R2,3 billion. This increase will allow us to expand our current services in some areas such as food relief.

Hon House Chairperson, with this increase we will be able to allocate R25 million towards food relief for social relief of distress. The food relief programme will be extended to all municipal districts through the support the Department gives to community nutrition and development centres and community kitchens.

R7,5 million of the additional funding will address food shortages in areas without

Department funded food relief programmes, as well as at existing sites where current food resources have not been sufficient to assist all beneficiaries in need.

We are looking to extend the feeding days in vulnerable communities from two to five days a week and R6,8 million has been allocated for community-based organisations to provide meals in rural areas five days a week, while R6,7 million will go towards those kitchens in urban areas for feeding four days a week.

Over R2,7 million has been allocated to these community-based organisations to cushion them against rising food costs, transport and gas prices. The Department will also utilise R959 000 to procure food parcels for immediate relief as and when required.

In this way we will continue to address the dire need in areas across the Western Cape where the COVID-19 pandemic has impacted communities who are experiencing poverty, unemployment and socio-economic distress, which has in many cases plunged households below the bread line.

It is important, hon House Chair, to note that disaster relief is not this Department's mandate, but it is that of the South African Social Security Agency. We have to time and time again stand in the gap where and when this national agency falls short. We have to do this while still meeting our core priorities, often with staff and resources stretched to the limit.

However, we do so for the people of this province. We do so to remind citizens that

we are a caring Government and that we will do all we can to ensure that the knock-on effects of poverty, such as limited access to job opportunities, substance use disorder, crime and interpersonal violence and abuse, GBV especially, are addressed.

We have also heard the pleas from our social workers who tirelessly work to ensure that the needs of communities are met, often at great personal cost to themselves. In the wake of the COVID disaster and the current economic crisis the need for psychosocial support to citizens has increased, making it more important than ever before for us to increase resources in these areas and these services.

R43,9 million has been allocated to ensure the Department can sustain its need for social service professional capacity. This will cover the shortfall attributable to the implementation of the 3% wage increase, grade progress pay-outs to social work professionals and provision for leave gratuity and early retirement pension pay-outs.

It has allowed us, hon House Chair, to immediately fill 54 vacant posts of which 39 are social work professionals. In doing so we also aim to strengthen the Department's contribution to the Provincial Safety Plan, especially by addressing gender-based violence and child protection in communities. Many of these social workers and social auxiliary workers are being placed in safety hotspot areas where crimes against women and children are rife. These critical posts will not support child protections. services and gender-based violence interventions.

They will also offer relief to those social work professionals who are spread thin on the ground, especially in these areas with high rates of violence against women,

children and members of the LGBTQIA plus community.

Hon House Chair, R6,3 million was approved for rollover from the previous year and has been allocated for the modification, customisation and operations of vehicles for the transport of intellectually disabled children. Thus far we have handed over four vehicles to NGOs assisting children with severe to profound intellectual disabilities. The Department has placed an order for another two vehicles to ensure we fulfil our legal obligation of making provision for children with severe to profound intellectual disabilities to attend schools.

The Department wants to ensure that no girl stays out of school due to a lack of access to sanitary products. We have accordingly allocated R1,5 million toward the Province's Sanitary Dignity Project as mandated by National Government. This rollover of funds is to settle our prior year's commitment to deliver it in the current financial year.

The Department, hon House Chair, is targeting 300 schools across the province because there are certain conditions attached, with the possibility of more schools being accommodated should the Education Department identify further need.

R2,2 million has been approved for rollover funding towards substance abuse, non-profit institutions. This funding is aimed at mitigating the impact of budget cuts in the substance abuse programme. The Department has had to make significant reduction in services in both community-based treatment and residential centres due to funding shortages in the current year's budget.

Hon House Chair, substance abuse is a contributing factor to many social ills, like gender-based violence, domestic violence, child abuse, unemployment and crime. The interventions we were able to introduce to reduce these problems were detrimentally impacted due to the slashing of funds earlier in the year.

Hon House Chair, we have been able to reallocate a significant amount of funds towards necessary expenses for the good of our communities. Funds were reclassified towards the transport project to operationalise the modified specialised vehicles. This will enable us to support NGOs that provide services to persons with disabilities.

Within person interactions picking up post COVID, the Department has seen the increased need for social workers to travel to the people who require their services most. Travel and subsistence funds have been replaced or prioritised towards fleet travel costs for social workers who need to travel extensively in Government Garage vehicles in order to ensure the psychosocial needs of communities are met. It will also be allocated for subsistence programmes like parenting workshops where the provision of food is needed for parent attendees from impoverished households.

The COVID-19 pandemic, the global economic turmoil caused by warring nations and subsequent rising cost of living, have thrown us into choppy waters, which has been exacerbated by the plundering of the public purse, maladministration and corruption on an unprecedented level by a corrupt ANC Government. It has not been easy to steer the ship, but we will keep hope alive.

As a Department and as a Government we have tried to the best of our ability to make miracles happen with the limited funding allocated to the Province by National Treasury. Although we have been able to fill vacant social work posts, much more is needed. [Interjections.]

We have social work professionals close to burning out and facing harassment [Interjections.] when assisting clients and an increasing need for services, yet the funding required to alleviate the burden is inadequate.

The people of the Western Cape are placing their hope in our hands, yet it is being tied by a National Government far removed from the reality [Interjections.] of the lived experiences of those on the ground. Although we are near the end of 16 Days of Activism for no violence against women and children, we are committed to continuing the fight against the scourge 365 days a year. I believe if we stand united with one voice 365 days of the year, the second silent pandemic of gender-based violence can be drastically reduced.

I am therefore appealing to members of this august House to collaborate and actively champion GBV awareness in education in your respective constituencies.

Hon House Chairperson, I wish to thank my Cabinet colleagues at the Executive Council, led by Premier Alan Winde, for their continued support and motivation. I am also grateful to the Department of Social Development led by HOD, Dr Robert MacDonald, for their tireless efforts and commitment to serving the most vulnerable

citizens of this province on a daily basis.

Every staff member in team DSD is making a contribution and for that I wish to say I thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much.

I recognise the hon member Bakubaku-Vos. [Interjections.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: [Inaudible.] Thank you, hon Chairperson.

The ANC rejects this budget. While the R79 million in the budget is noted we, however, concede that this budget does not get near addressing some of the most pressing challenges in the province.

R43 million on this budget comes from the National Government to make provision for the impact of the 2022 3% wage increase. This means the increase is mainly towards the Compensation of Employees. We are very disturbed with the Department's cut of R5,3 million for Compensation of Employees, when we have been making calls on the Department to create opportunities for unemployment social workers graduate.

Yes, we take note of the fact that the Minister mentioned that they have employed social workers, but still we believe that this amount could have been spent to create more employment opportunities for these much-needed social workers. There is a

great demand for social work graduates in schools and we do have sufficient supply of this. Only thing that is lacking is the budget.

We have advised the MEC and the Department to engage the Western Cape Education Department to form a partnership that will see this graduates deployed in schools. To this date this has not happened and we do not know why.

Hon Chairperson, the ANC welcomes the additional R25 million allocation for the provisions for food relief for social distress. Even during the COVID-19 pandemic the ANC was among the first to call for this food relief programme to be continued. Our people are hungry and suffering from the increased cost of living. Many have lost their jobs as the economy is recovering slowly from the impact of COVID-19 and has been impacted by the ongoing global conflict.

It is for this reason that we believe this food relief must be a core mandate of this Department with an annual budget. This should not be a once-off allocation that can be discontinued next year.

Hon Chairperson, we are on day 11 of the 16 Days of Activism for No Violence Against Women and Children. We continue to remember all those victims of GBV and femicide.

This Department is taking the lead in coordinating this Government's response to Gender-Based Violence and Femicide. We are having this debate a week after the release of the Second Quarter Crime Statistics, which showed a 23,6% in sexual offences. I wonder where the Safety Plan is.

It is highly disappointing that no provision is made in this Budget to respond to such a high increase. Hence, the hon Premier will always say we have a Safety Plan. Even the members of the blue overalls or bakkies will say we have a Safety Plan, which serves in another country or other provinces that we do not know of, but not here in the Western Cape. This budget is allocating R68 million for the Victim Empowerment Programme. This small amount is too little to address the 23,6% rise in sexual offences. Clearly, the Department has failed to prioritise the safety of women and children.

As the ANC, we want the Department and Provincial Government to increase the budget for Victim Empowerment. Hon Temporary Chairperson, the budget for service to the persons with disabilities programme has been increased by R7,2 million to R198,9 million. While this increase is welcomed, we have to ask if this is enough to ensure the protection of persons with disabilities. More NPOs in the rural communities must be prioritised for funding in order to ensure that the Department has a footprint in areas where these services are needed. If there were not enough NPOs in Nduli for instance, the Department would not rely on us as the ANC to give them information about Ms Cynthia Bles who continues to live in an abandoned building with her physically challenged son.

I welcome the Acting HOD's commitment to follow up on the matter of Ms Bles. Ms Bles, an elderly woman and her son, must be prioritised for a house and this Department must take the lead in ensuring that no other

elderly person nor disabled person suffer the same fate as Ms Bles. I hope the hon Minister of Human Settlements is listening.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, we note with concern that funds for the Child Care and Protection Services programme have shifted to another sub-programme as a result of closure of NPOs. A closure of NPOs will have devastating impacts on children in the province. This also means that those people will lose jobs. We do not know the reason for the closure of NPOs, but we hope it is not because of noncompliance. We have been calling on the Department to assist NPOs with compliance.

The reduced budget for Compensation of Employees could have gone a long way to employ more staff members to assist NPOs to be compliant. Many NPOs working with children have received warnings of possible reduced budget allocation for the next financial year. This will have a negative impact on these organisations and on children. This decision by the Department will lead to job losses and to a closure of more NPOs. The ANC is opposed to this planned reduced budget for NPOs working with children. We want the hon MEC to tell us the reason for these planned cuts. The ANC rejects this budget. I thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. Hon member Makamba-Botya, I recognise you.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Thank you very much, hon Temporary

Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, early this year during his State of Province Address, the hon Premier of this Province made an empty promise that shelters will be made available for homeless people. However, hon Temporary Chairperson, if one is to take a simple walk from the CPUT campus in District Six and walk along the outskirts of the Castle of Good Hope, then one would realise that the plight of homeless poor people does not matter to the Democratic Alliance Provincial Government.

This situation, hon Temporary Chairperson, of homeless people who are sleeping inside plastic shelters and eating from the bins at the time of that speech earlier this year, is very much the same, if not even worse. As I stand before you now, we see billions of rands being appropriated to the Provincial Department of Social Development and they now are to receive another extra R79,7 million, but homeless people continue to suffer more.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, homeless people ... [Audio distorted.] whose rights continue to be violated on a daily basis, they remain ... [Audio distorted.] coupled with ...[Audio distorted.] include mental health. Therefore, hon Temporary Chairperson, it becomes difficult if not impossible, for most of them to know their rights and exercise them. It is then this reason that a pro-rich Provincial Government such as this one, neglects them.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, it can never be right to say you have a budget for homeless people in your coffers and then, not spend the budget on them. The DA-led Government must understand that taxpayers' money does not

belong to them. In this country, we have laws governing socio-economic rights which are entrenched in the South African Constitution. Hon Temporary Chairperson, making shelters, food, and other necessities available to homeless people is a constitutional obligation required from the Government by the Constitution. It can never be that in every financial year, money is being surrendered to the Provincial Revenue Fund and under-expenditure, but then people remain poor and homeless.

On that note, hon Temporary Chairperson, the EFF does not support this Vote. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon member Dan Plato.

Mr D PLATO (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson, thank you very much for the opportunity. The past two years have been very hard. We have suffered through two years of COVID-19. We have seen the cost-of-living skyrocket with basic necessities, such as fuel and bread, becoming unaffordable for far too many of our citizens. In part, this is the result of circumstances out of many South Africans' control and in part, it is due to the endemic corruption and maladministration which has infested this country for many years.

But, hon Temporary Chairperson, the only reason I make these statements is to have them on record. Our people do not need to be told these things because they are aware of them already. They know the price of bread and

that of fuel. They know how much they are owed in grants, and they know the grants that they are given ...[Audio distorted.] in comparison to massive inflation and the ever-rising cost of living. They know these things because they experience them every day. They do not need me or anyone else to remind them.

What our people are crying out for is leadership, credible leadership. Leadership to take charge of the country, to take charge of situations and issues, and it is on us as elected representatives to give it to them. We can no longer sit back and accept the situation we are in. Yes, COVID-19 and the war in Ukraine have damaged our economy and even economies across the world. Yes, National Government is constantly corrupt. The only question is: what are we going to do about it?

The issues around the head of President Ramaphosa is not helping. It is just corruption from the top to the lowest level and as a result, not enough budget for service delivery. In any other country from the west to the east, the President would have resigned already. Only in South Africa, the action around the President gets seen as common practice. Even the ANC's own poor suffer as a result.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, spending tens of millions more on Social Services is a good place to start. [Interjections.] In tabling this budget, hon Minister Wenger told us that there is reason for us to be cautiously optimistic of our economy's future. Our Provincial GDP is growing, our tourism sector

is recovering, and the newly released employment figures show that we are fixing unemployment in the Western Cape, but we still have a long, long way to go.

This Adjustment allocation of almost R80 million to the Department of Social Development will ensure that the poorest of the poor are not left behind, as the province's economy grows. In fact, this spending decision demonstrates in clear terms the ultimate goal of this Government to leverage economic growth to help the underprivileged and to eradicate poverty, unemployment and inequality. But if we can deal with corruption in this country, we can do much, much more.

Corruption is hampering budgets around the country. Not only in this province, in the Eastern Cape, in North-West, in the Northern Cape, all over. It is a free for all to take from the poorest of the poor. That is why we do not have enough budget available for our services in this province. [Interjections.] But we welcome the increase in budget. This increase is important, and I do thank National Government for taking enough responsibility [Interjections.] to ensure that we have the funding we need to support that increase in our province. But the stark truth is that National Government's funding does nothing to move us forward [Interjections.] and to fix the social ills whose ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, can you sit down, please?
Hon members from the Opposition, can you please just not drown the hon

speaker. [Interjections.] Let ...[Interjections.] Honourable ... hon members, let us allow hon member to speak. I think the other speakers are listening to him, so it will be adding value for you to also listen, from both sides. Also, hon members, from my righthand side, just give the hon member a chance for you to listen to his debate. You have been doing well throughout the day, continue that way. Hon member Plato, over to you, sir.

Mr D PLATO (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson, that is why I am so pleased to see that the Western Cape Government have seen an increase in the budget for the Department of Social Development. This is the money that will make meaningful change in the lives of those who rely on the work of the Department of Social Development. This is the money that will pay for more social workers, as we have heard; more feeding schemes, as we have heard; more substance abuse treatment facilities, as we have heard. It is money that will fund initiatives such as Sanitary Dignity Projects, and also to fight Gender-Based Violence and for the support of this 16 Days of Activism drive countrywide. It is important for us to be seen focusing on that issue as well.

This budget is one which inspires hope, something which is so desperately needed in our country today. A wise man once said that we make a living by what we get, but we make life by what we give.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, this Government has demonstrated and continues to demonstrate that it will give. It will stand by the poor and the hungry against whatever adversity may come. With this budget, we begin the

process of rebuilding and of moving our province forward. This Adjustment will allow the Department of Social Development to continue with its important task of providing vital services for the poor and the vulnerable in our province and empowering them so that all of us in this province can move forward and grow into the future together.

But I have to repeat, and I will continue to repeat this: if corruption by the ANC Government was being dealt with appropriately and if they stop stealing from the purse, more budget will be available for the poorest of the poor, to deal with the poorest of the poor's issues. [Interjections.] There will be hard times ahead, hon Temporary Chairperson, especially for as long as the ANC continues to rule, but that will not stop us. [Interjections.] This Government and this hon Minister care deeply about the people of the Western Cape, even when our Opposition does not. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, really!

Mr D PLATO (DA): This Government will continue to do everything it can ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Plato? Hon member Plato, may you take your seat. Hon members, the more the hon speaker is trying to make sure that you hear him, you also raise your voices. [Laughter.] Hon members please, just keep the decorum of the House so that we continue with the debate. [Interjections.]

Mr D PLATO (DA): This Government will continue to do everything it can to improve the lives of our citizens, even when it is not seen and when it does not result in votes. For these reasons, hon Temporary Chairperson, I will support Vote 7 and I urge every other hon member of this House to vote with me for a budget that puts our people first. Thank you. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Amandla! Power!

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): And ...[Audio distorted.] belongs to the ANC ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Plato. I now recognise [Interjections.] hon Minister Fernandez.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Laughing]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Temporary Chairperson, allow me to thank the hon members for their contribution to the debate. To the hon Bakubaku-Vos, your inputs are legitimate, and I echo your sentiments. However, the fiscal constraints are real and unfortunately, as much as I would want to expand the VP Programme or Substance Use Disorder Programme, we have to cut our cloth according to what it is we have.

To the hon member Makamba-Botya, I would want to say that you, too, raise – the hon member raises legitimate inputs on homelessness, but in this regard, I wish to advise that DSD has increased the number of funded bed spaces for homeless shelters by over 800 in the past 15 months. We have now moved from 1 500 funded bed spaces to 2 298 in the last little while. We have also made provision of R18 million to build a homeless shelter in the CBD. The Memorandum of Understanding is well underway between DSD and Public Works, and we have in the last quarter increased our subsidised beds to shelters in Elsies River, Fish Hoek, Philippi, and Wellington. So, we are, despite the challenges, making huge efforts to try and address the gaps, the immediate gaps that affect the most vulnerable.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, in closing, I would want to thank the Committee Chairperson, the Committee members, especially the hon Bakubaku-Vos who often provides – and I am not singling out, but I do have to say hon Bakubaku-Vos engages in a positive manner. She will follow up with me after any Sitting or session and say, ‘hon Minister, can you assist?’ and I would try my best to ensure that we assist with the immediate needs. So, hon Bakubaku-Vos, thank you to you, the hon Makamba-Botya and my DSD colleagues for their input. Thank you for holding the Department to account in a very robust manner, but yet, in a very dignified and respectful manner. I appreciate the engagement.

I also wish to thank the Committee Coordinator for her support and the professional manner in which she conducts herself. I would then like to say

thank you to my hon Cabinet colleagues, to the hon Premier in absentia, and then, to the team from the Department of Social Development, Dr Robert Macdonald our HOD, the senior management team, some of which are present here today and the entire Team DSD. They have really led and steered the ship through difficult waters and real choppy waters and yet, we have managed to come through. I think the Department also needs to be credited for a ninth clean audit. So, to the individuals sitting in the box: thank you, from the bottom of my heart.

And then finally in closing, I need to acknowledge the Ministry staff under the very capable leadership of Ms Ananda Nel, our Head of Ministry. The Ministry staff are, indeed, the wind beneath my wings. They provide me with constant motivation and support, and their dedication in resolving issues, especially those raised by hon members of this august House, as swiftly as possible. It makes me very proud to lead Team DSD. Hon Temporary Chairperson, on that note I wish to thank every single hon member and ask them in closing: will you please assist us in becoming ambassadors for Gender-Based Violence and Femicide by spreading the message of hope and keeping it alive for 365 days, not just 16 days. I thank you. [Applause.]

[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. That concludes the Vote. [Interjections.]

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, order please. That concludes the Vote on Vote 7. Hon members, I am – thank you very much – I am now just going to deal with the side motion. Is that a point of order, hon Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: It is a point of exigency in my other life. I just want to clap for my hon MEC Maynier. I did not clap for him. [Applause.] [Laughter.]

MOTIONS

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I would like to proceed. [Interjections.] Hon members, if I can have your indulgence – order! I have received confirmation from the Secretary that the hon Leader of the Opposition has submitted a Notice of Motion in terms of Rule 151(1) of the Standing Rules at 11:50 this morning. In terms of the Rules, the Notice of Motion must be placed on the Order Paper and cannot be dealt with today, except with the unanimous concurrence of all hon members present.

Does the hon Dugmore wish that the concurrence of all hon members be obtained in terms of Rule 151(3)?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: If I may address you, hon Deputy Speaker, yes. That is what I would like to request. You would recall,

hon Deputy Speaker, that this morning, the House supported a motion that the vacancy be filled, that the Secretary contacts the President of the Constitutional Court to approach a Judge to oversee that and we supported that.

In this particular motion which I am sure we need to circulate to test the unanimity of the House, it is simply a motion which requests, as we did previously when the other motion was tabled, that all hon members of this House are provided with information regarding any possible litigation, any other correspondence. So, I cannot, from my own point of view, see any reason why hon members of this House would not agree to such a motion and possibly, I do not know if the Table has the motion, but if not, I could actually read it out. What is the procedure?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So, you have risen in terms of Rule 151(3) to obtain unanimous ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...concurrence to move the motion. If you allow me then to proceed.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Mr Dugmore has requested that I determine if there

is a unanimous concurrence to allow him to move his motion. Before I ask for concurrence from the hon members of the House to allow the motion to be moved, I shall read out the Notice of Motion for the benefit of hon members and for correct procedure, if I may, hon Dugmore.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

I move in terms of Rule 151(1), 151(2) and 151(3) of the Provincial Legislature that this House, noting the resolution adopted by the House, that the Secretary be mandated to deal with all matters regarding possible litigation involving the Legislature thus resolves that all information received by the Secretary regarding possible litigation, is provided to all hon members before the conclusion of business today.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

I now put the question to the House. Is there any objection to the motion giving notice by Mr Dugmore, hon member Dugmore, at 11:50 this morning, be moved today?

HON MEMBERS: Yes! No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you could just put it, read it into record, hon Acting Chief Whip.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. In terms of Rule 151(3) I hereby object, also noting that the motion you have read out in terms of Rule 60 that:

No member may reflect upon any decision of the House taken less than six months previously, except for the purpose of moving that the decision be amended or rescinded.

The motion that you have read out is exactly the powers you have given to the Secretary, but in terms of Rule 151(3), I hereby object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon members, as there – is there a point of order, hon Sayed? You may rise on a point of order.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I rise on a point of order. The hon Acting Chief Whip: is she reading out Rules just to say, ‘I quoted this and quoted that?’ It does not necessarily mean ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...that you are speaking to the Rule. [Interjections.] The Rule 151 ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...subsection (3), which the hon Acting Chief Whip quoted, does not speak to anything that she just said.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: *Ja.*

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): So, I mean, I really – I do not see the basis for objection, but ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Sayed. So, I do not want an explanation, but I am going to do the following and follow strict procedure. And the strict procedure was I asked the question. As there is an objection and that is for any motion, hon member, as there is an objection [Interjections.] to the motion – may I finish? [Interjections.] May I finish? As there is any objection to the motion being moved today, the Notice of Motion will be placed on the Order Paper below the line for consideration of a future date. [Interjections.] I hereby rule. Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

Alright, thank you. Can we move onto the Order of the Day, please. Much appreciated. [Interjections.] I will now ask Ms Ngqaleni please to read the Sixth Order of the Day.

Ms NGQALENI: Debate of Vote 4 – Community Safety – *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B3-2022]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. We now move over to the hon Minister Allen. [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I would like to ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. We have lots of guests in the House.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Deputy Speaker [Interjections.], I pre-empted that we will not be having a silent debate. I have pre-empted like we have pre-empted so often [Laughter.] how the Opposition will act. However, there was one particular matter where I did not pre-empt what the Opposition will say and that was when the hon Dugmore indicated to the hon Premier: make Reagan the MEC. I do want to say, hon member Dugmore, †baie dankie [thank you.] Thank you so much for your support towards this particular role because I have often said we will not be able to do it alone as a Department. We will not be able to do it alone as Government and we need communities, we need NGOs [Interjections.] and if I consider [Interjections.] and if I consider the Order Paper of this entire day, hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: If

I consider the Order Paper of the entire day, it is actually in alignment because the Western Cape Safety Plan [Laughter.] and the only province that has a comprehensive Safety Plan that would have a Violence Prevention leg, but also the Law Enforcement component. And that whole of government approach with regard to the role that the Department of Health plays and this morning, they have echoed the sentiments and the support in that regard. The role that Treasury plays. Earlier on, the role that Finance and Economic Opportunities play, the role that Education plays and the role that Social Development plays, and the role that I will currently discuss is that of Community Safety.

On that particular note, I do want to say I am thinking of our permanent member on the Standing Committee that is currently not present here today and I wish a speedy recovery with regard to matters that the permanent member that is not present is dealing with. Because, hon Deputy Speaker, I want to echo again: I do not think that this entire four pages will be silent, but here we go.

I want to first and foremost say [Interjections.] I want to first and foremost say that we have dedicated officials [Interjections.] we have dedicated officials and instead of echoing a sentiment at the end of this particular speech, I want to first go to the Department. †Ek wil sê baie dankie, [I want to say thank you,] thank you so much. The last seven and a half months have been a rollercoaster and I do appreciate the support and the dedication that we have seen from officials. I appreciate the reviews and the sentiment that

we often hear from the Standing Committee after we have been held accountable in the Standing Committee. So, thank you so much. If I am only able to confidently echo sentiments in this speech, it is because of your work and because of your dedication. So, under the leadership of Adv Pillay, †baie, baie dankie, [thank you very much. [Interjections.]

Because ensuring [Interjections.] [Applause.] the reports ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! [Laughter.] Just note, hon members, I have to really listen carefully because the hon Minister is quite far away from my table.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Ensuring safety and security for those who live in South Africa is the responsibility of the South African Police Service as the lead agency. The SAPS which are managed by the National Government can only effectively fulfil their mandate if they have the required and needed resources. It is a fact that the dedicated and committed men and women in blue have literally been left to fend for themselves. I think from the Standing Committee's side as well, hon Deputy Speaker, we often hear from senior management in our Province, how they are also relaying messages and correspondence to National Government with regard to the under-resourcing.

If I am allowed to demonstrate this particular point it is that in 2011/2012 financial year, the South African Police Service at a national level should

have had 157 000 members – 157 000 members. During this period, there was a shortfall of 31 200 members. [Interjections.] Fast forward to 2015/2016. There should have been 176 000 SAPS members. They only had 119 000. Today, there should be 193 000 SAPS members. They are sitting on 105 000 members.

There needs to be no need to get someone – †wat wiskunde doen om vir ons hier te kom verduidelik nie – [who does arithmetic to come and explain to us] –because it is very clear. Our SAPS officers on the ground are doing the job of not only one, two, nor three, but of actually four people. They are overburdened, overstretched and we are doing everything in our power to ultimately help and assist them.

Before I go on, I was recently – and I want to thank the hon Deputy Speaker that we had an adjournment of an hour and a half, in that I could visit Manenberg. Over the last week, there have been multiple [Interjections.] there have been multiple shootings in Manenberg [Laughter.] and I was engaging SAPS, Metro Police, Traffic together with our Law Enforcement Advancement Plan (LEAP) deployment, together with the Community Police Forum (CPF) and Neighbourhood Watches in the Manenberg area in this regard, to see the collaboration, to see that we are working together.

Hon members in this House are fully aware that we have echoed sentiments of how gangsters and criminals are working together. We are seeing over the last seven months a steady show towards working together, ultimately,

holding each other accountable, being real, being open because I am going to play open cards and say that yes, we have a long way to go, but we are making strides. In the last quarter we have seen where other provinces are going up in terms of the murder rate by 29%, 31%. Here in the Western Cape, it could have been so different if it was not for Provincial Government, the City of Cape Town and National Government playing a role – everyone playing a role – and we want to be real in that regard.

But let me bring it back to the Western Cape. The province was due to receive, hon Deputy Speaker, 1 939 new recruits during the current financial year. Now only 1 118 will arrive. This is 821 fewer officers. We have not been told why we are not receiving the full allocation, but it is a fact. Just last week, during our visit to the SAPS forensic lab, a very senior police officer had to remind a Deputy Minister in the Presidency about them being under-resourced and the need for urgent intervention. That we are getting 800 fewer officers is very significant, hon Deputy Speaker, as already this province is grossly under-resourced, and we are sitting with a 10% vacancy rate. A 10% vacancy rate!

Since I arrived here, I wanted to make sure that in the Department, we address any particular concerns with vacancy rates so that we can up it. We have a very, very low vacancy rate in terms of the Department. Maybe one day, if I am able to echo those sentiments that we have a very low vacancy rate when it comes to SAPS, I am hopeful. I am hopeful because when we are not going to spread hope that is built on a solid foundation that is real,

then where will we be?

But adequate resourcing – let me first say, we are constantly hearing that this province is, in fact, the most resourced. We hear it often that we are the most resourced, as amongst others. There is an Anti-Gang Unit which other provinces do not have. †Dit is die waarheid, agb Adjunkspeaker. [It is the truth, hon Deputy Speaker.] These are not new members that came into the Service or the Unit. These are members taken from other sectors and stations, but they have not been replaced at those sectors and stations.

Let us take it a step further. During the current financial year, 363 vehicles have been ordered for the Western Cape – 363 vehicles have been ordered for the Western Cape. To date, 54 have been delivered. That is a delivery rate of 14,8%. In four months [Interjections.] I am bugging and I am doing everything in my power to ensure that we hold SAPS accountable in this regard, that over the next five months leading to the end of this financial year, that we will not have a 14,8% delivery rate with regard to vehicles that were actually ordered and that should actually be on our roads creating visibility that ultimately leads to crime being reduced.

Adequate resourcing and capacitation are clearly not prioritised, which means that the National Government is not concerned whether SAPS is empowered to do their jobs. I think when we consider a man and a woman that wake up in the morning not knowing if they will return home, they are committed. They are feeling that the National Government, which they are under

currently, are not supporting them. But this Western Cape Government, hon Deputy Speaker, is the opposite of what is transpiring in the country and in other provinces. We care for our people because they matter to us. Whenever we are accused of being biased, please, accuse me of being biased because I am biased towards people, and we will remain biased towards people because we want our people of the Western Cape to be the best that they possibly can be.

This is part of the reason why we have our Law Enforcement Advancement Plan officers which stems from the Western Cape Safety Plan because the National Government is failing to support SAPS and failing to protect our residents. We, as the Western Cape Government, had to step in because when a sphere of government fails to step in, we have had to step up and we have stepped up. We have stepped up to such a point that we are seeing those successes because a function and the responsibility of the National Government, which they have not been fulfilling, that had to be addressed. Hence, we stood up.

The irony is that SAPS members will tell you how grateful they are for these extra boots on the ground, the extra resources that are now working side-by-side with them. I was in Manenberg now ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I

was in Khayelitsha, in Gugulethu, in Philippi East. [Interjections.] Those are the priority areas that we have identified ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Talk to me, hon Minister, talk to me.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
...and they are there. [Interjections.] †Die 13 gemeenskappe [The 13 communities [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
...where the LEAP officers ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: The maintenance of Nyanga.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I
...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Windvogel? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I wrote a note here that as soon as I get to the last two pages, the silence will start to evaporate. [Interjections.] So, it has been pre-empted. Like we have had to pre-empt, hon Deputy Speaker. We have had to use data; we have had

to use an evidence-based approach in order to make sure that we seek the successes. We have always had to pre-empt. This Government has always been at the forefront, the only Government that has a Provincial Police Ombudsman, the only Government that would have Court Watching Briefs, the only Government in our entire country that has stepped up and we will continue to pre-empt. So, as the silence quiets down, it will pick up again. I can guarantee you that.

So, where these 1 257 LEAP officers are deployed will tell you that they are making a real difference in their areas. Their mere presence brings about a feeling of safety. We are putting our citizens first because we care about our people. I almost want to shout 'amandla' 'power' [Laughter.] because I am thinking amandla means power and if I shout amandla I will hear?

An HON MEMBER: Awethu! [power to the people]

An HON MEMBER: Awethu! [power to the people]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I will word that to the people because even if we are talking about devolution [Interjections.] if we are talking about devolution, we are ultimately saying let us give power to the people. [Laughter.]

An HON MEMBER: Amandla! [Strength!]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

Let us give power to the people ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

...and when policing is closer to the people, we will see the results, but I will not go there. So, let me first say. This is a R400 million investment ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

...for the current financial year that is being optimally utilised in spaces and places where it is most needed, and which is backed by data and evidence. So, the deployment occurs in a strategic, yet deliberate manner. [Laughter.] Between 7 and 20 November 2022, these officers effected 412 arrests for various offences with 35 of these relating to firearms. I can further state that since LEAP's inception up to 20 November 2022, 274 firearms have been confiscated.

Hon Deputy Speaker, documents and research have shown that for every one potential firearm that is on our streets, an illegal firearm, it could contribute towards 14 to 25 murders. Here, we have removed 274 firearms off our streets. I indicated I was in Manenberg. Just last night, two firearms were

removed in Manenberg as well.

So, the reality is that the National Government is mismanaging everything in our country, and this places a squeeze on the fiscal environment ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I do feel that this particular line, [Interjections.] I will repeat, hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.] Just one minute, hon Minister.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: This line ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just one second. Two our three hon members here. Hon Makamba-Botya – I mean, apology. Hon Bakubaku-Vos? Hon Bakubaku-Vos. Hon Nkondlo, can we allow the hon Minister to finish? Thank you. [Interjections.] You can proceed. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I will [Interjections.] I will wrap up. [Interjections.] I will wrap up, hon

Deputy Speaker. Our budget has been adjusted downward by 0,03% or R304 000, which means it is a decrease from the R776 million to R775 million. It must however be noted that the Department's Budget increased with 29,2% from the 2018/2019 financial year when the allocation was R335 million.

There has been a significant injection in the Safety space, and this is what you do when you are serious about keeping citizens safe. So, thank you to the hon Premier that since his arrival as the hon Premier of the Western Cape, we have seen a budget increase in our Department from R335 million to R775 million. And this is what you do, like I have said, when you are serious about keeping our citizens safe. It is also important to mention that the R304 000 is being transferred to the Department of the Premier for the development of a software system for Safety projects. We are enhancing the Safety spaces with the incorporation of further technology. [Interjections.]

The SAPS Budget, hon Deputy Speaker, has consistently decreased and during the 2020 Midterm Budget Policy Statement, I was listening to it online and it was probably one of the bleakest days in my life, [Interjections.] because on that particular day ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
...on that particular day [Interjections.], 2020, there was a mass shooting

...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
...in the Khayelitsha area and I listened to the Midterm Budget Policy Statement where R11,7 billion was taken from Police, from Education, from Social Development at a national level and it was given to a failing State Owned Enterprise, in SAA. [Interjections.] So, that was one of the [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
...the bleakest days and to confirm [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
...that the SAPS budget has been decreasing. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. I cannot hear the hon Minister.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

Hon Deputy Speaker [Interjections.], hon Deputy Speaker, in my notes have pre-empted that [Interjections.] I have pre-empted once again, that once I get to the last paragraph, this will happen. [Laughter.]

So, for the financial year, our Neighbourhood Watch Programme has an allocation of R600,15 million which will ensure that we are well resourced and capacitated and they are a critical cog in the local crime fighting scene. Since my appointment, I am delighted that I have been able to have so many engagements across our province from the City of Cape Town to the West Coast to other districts, working with these Neighbourhood Watches, patrolling with them and with CPFs. I have consistently sent that particular invitation to hon members of the Opposition that you are more than welcome to join me on those particular patrols in order to get a first-hand indication of what we are doing.

The CPFs budget is also something that I am pretty sure is contributing effectively to the CPFs, which is R660 000 for Safety projects and training. The Reaction Unit is allocated R6,9 million and just last week we had the official launch of the Unit at the Moorreesburg weighbridge. Ensuring that our K9 Units are well resourced, there is an allocation of R8,8 million, while our district funding for Safety projects, as we do not treat our rural areas as stepchildren, is R6 million.

Hon Deputy Speaker as I conclude, it was quite upsetting a couple of months ago to identify that the SAPS †Honde-eeheid [Dog Unit] was reduced by

27% since 2018. [Interjections.] was reduced by 27%. We have had to step in, we have had to step up by allocating money for our K9 Units in order to do a job that is ultimately the lead agency's main priority which is SAPS. We have had to step up. We consistently step up because we know that we need to do everything in our power to help and assist.

But this is commonly known as we are putting money where our mouth is, which is not under a mattress or a couch and is also not in a foreign currency. [Interjections.] [Laughter.] Because I think [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: This is actually very ...[Interjections.] Hon Deputy Speaker, I know this is the end of the day and that I apparently have now unlimited time. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: But I want to say ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, just take your seat for a second. Take your seat. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I want to say ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, just take your seat for a second. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...money [Interjection]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, take your seat for a second. Hon members, we are just prolonging a very long day. [Interjections.] If we can just allow the hon Minister to complete his speech, please? I appreciate that. Over to you, hon Minister. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you so much. [Interjections.] I do want to say, hon Deputy Speaker, that I ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, I am not part of that conversation. Thank you. Over to you. [Laughter.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I do want to say, hon Deputy Speaker, that I sense, and I feel for hon members of this House. I know it is extremely difficult to defend the indefensible. I know it is extremely difficult to speak and to echo a sentiment that one

...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Come and join ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
...to speak and to echo a sentiment of something that you do not believe in.
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order, hon members.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
And I do know that is extremely difficult. [Interjections.] So, I do have
sympathy for that because we have fostered in this House ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
...valuable relationships and I do know that to reject this Adjustments
Budget, would be to reject the people of the Western Cape ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Ah! ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: It
will be to reject their safety. It would be to reject those from Manenberg,
those from Kayamandi, those from Swellendam, those from Paarl, those from

Nyanga, and those from George. And those from Athlone and from Strand.
[Interjections.] It will be to reject ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
...all those where hon members of this House that are present, that are
serving us. So, as I conclude ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
...I can clearly state that the people of the Western Cape and particularly,
their safety matters to us. We will continue being resolute in achieving
greater safety across the province while working our socks off to reduce the
murder rate by 50% by 2029. We have to, hon Deputy Speaker, as the
National Government has been wholly unreliable. And I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. [Applause.] Hon Acting
Chief Whip. Do you want to stand on a point of order?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon
Deputy Speaker, I was standing up earlier even though the hon Minister was
still busy with his speech, in terms of Rule 42, in terms of maintenance of
order. It is very difficult for me to be able to hear what the hon Minister is

saying with all the noise in the House and perhaps, if he could repeat some of the last paragraphs so that I can just make sure exactly what is occurring in this particular budget that we will be voting on today in this House. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon members, it seems that every time hon Minister Allen stands up, there is a need to just shout him down. I think we need to have decorum in the House and [Interjections.] and he. It is a common occurrence, it seems. I am not so sure why, but maybe, I can – no! No, hon Minister Allen, we are not starting that. I am now going to move over to hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kama, you are going to have to ask your hon colleagues to quiet down, thank you.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): No, thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I would have earlier appealed to the hon Chairperson of the Standing Committee that there is no need to audition because the handler was only here today to finish what he had started with the hon Speaker. But I see the handler is back, so I will leave it up to him. Hon Deputy ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kama, before you start. I just want to caution you. Remember, we cannot cast aspersions, so do not mention any names. At the moment, it is on a fine line. Okay, we do not – we always have decorum in the House for all our hon colleagues. [Interjections.] One minute, hon Kama. [Interjections.] Hon Bosman ...[Interjection.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...what is your point of order?

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order, hon members.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, I would like to know if the hon Shadow MEC for Cultural Affairs and Sport is prepared to take a question. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): I do not have time to waste.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, you may begin, hon Kama. You are on your

– your time is now ticking.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): No, thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I just had to make that point because it looks like our responsibilities in terms of Safety are getting more and more by day, and now we have to protect black hon members from the DA who are continuously being victimised by the handler. Hon Deputy Speaker [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. You see, hon Kama what happens when you make statements, it becomes a furore. So, your time is ticking. Can I please ask you to continue with your speech.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Let me also say, hon Deputy Speaker, it is true that we supported hon member Allen when he was still the Chairperson to become an MEC. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr M KAMA (ANC): We supported him because as a Chairperson then, he used to share the same frustrations that we have around the issue of making sure that communities play part of fighting crime. We supported him because he, also like us, was frustrated by the continuous politicking by this Government when it comes to crime. But hon Deputy Speaker, today marks exactly nine years since the day we were informed about the passing of our great Nelson Mandela, who throughout his life fought for peace in our land.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): He fought for peace in our land. Hon Deputy Speaker, in the legacy of Comrade Nelson Mandela ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. I cannot hear the hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...we stand here today to reject this budget. The hon Premier changed the name of this Department to Police Oversight and Community Safety. We thought there will be more funding allocation for the Police Oversight function, but instead, there are budget cuts for the Office of the Police Ombudsman. This was just a desperate measure and posturing from the hon Premier. They wanted to escape scrutiny on the part of this Government. The notion of Community Safety and we want this Government to understand, that the notion of Community Safety does not start and end with policing. It has everything to do with creating an environment where people will feel safe, whether they are in their houses, whether they are in the streets or whether it is black hon members in the DA, but they must feel safe and that is Community Safety. [Interjections.] This Government prides itself ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Order!

Mr M KAMA (ANC): This Government prides itself of ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...on being evidence-driven on its decisions and key interventions, yet, during a period in which the 17 community ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...reported serious crimes, it increased by 19,9% to 760 873 cases, the DA-led Government responded by cutting the budget. This level of recklessness by the Department is highly deplorable. What is the justification for decreasing the budget of this Department when the murder rate has increased by 3,9%? When sexual offences and rape increased by 23,6% and 22,2% respectively, and when car hijacking increased by 38,6%? This is a clear indication that this Government does not care, and that crime will always remain a political ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Also, as shown by the intensification of calls on the National Government to devolve Police powers [Interjections.] as well as the investigation by the Police Ombudsman ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! I cannot hear the hon members speak. Hon Kama, just take your seat. Please stop the time, Mr Poggenpoel. Hon members, it is very difficult, both with hon Minister Allen and hon Kama because they are quite far away. So, if I can just ask for your indulgence. You may proceed. Start the time, Mr Poggenpoel.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Mr Poggenpoel.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): This politicking also includes the divisions between Neighbourhood Watches and Community Policing Forums which involve the preferential treatment of Neighbourhood Watches and the underfunding and weakening of CPFs.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the CPFs when given the necessary support and sufficient resources, can do wonders. It was through the dedicated effort of these CPFs, as well as operations by SAPS, that resulted in a drastic reduction of murders from 89 in Quarter 2 of 2018 to 40 between July and September 2019. This was before the idea of the Safety Plan was even conceived. In the second quarter of 2022, Nyanga recorded the highest increase in the country in terms of murders. This increase coincides with the period in which the DA-led Government deliberately destabilised, underfunded, and weakened CPFs in the province.

Through the proposed Adjusted Budget Estimates, the location of Community Police relations is cut by R5,1 million. This clearly shows that this Government does not see value in community participation in the fight against crime. The increase in the murder rate in Nyanga and the province, should be placed squarely on the DA's doorstep. When crime is reduced, the DA claims all the victories and praises the Safety Plan, but when it increases then it is SAPS and National Government that must be blamed. The DA hypocrisy knows no bounds.

Through these Adjusted Budget Estimates, the allocation for Safety Partnership is increased by R7,3 million to over R474 million. The amount includes the transfer to the City of Cape Town for the LEAP officers. Once more, I wish to reiterate the ANC demands for increased oversight over the City of Cape Town. We continue to throw funds to the City, and they do not account to the Committee for it. We continue to fund the so-called Safety Plan and yet, none of us have actually seen the Plan. Yes, we are presented with the concept document. We were presented with the ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...the concept document, but there is no Plan. There is no Safety Plan. [Interjections.] We want the hon Premier ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...to present us with a ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...plan and we want J P Smit and the senior management in his Department to prepare ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...an Annual Report for the LEAP programme and appear before the Committee to account for the funds that we give them.
[Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, we reiterate our calls for increased funding for Rural Safety ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): This Department transfers R418 million in transfers to provinces and municipalities. A large percentage goes to the City of Cape Town, while rural municipalities are not prioritised. While we do acknowledge that strides are being made at establishing rural safety plans in municipalities, we are, however, not satisfied with the amounts given to rural regions for this purpose. This Provincial Government must stop thinking that rural safety is about farms and small holdings. It is far bigger than that.

We have always maintained that the Safety Plan will not yield any positive results for as long as it continues to ignore the needs to address the causative factors. Earlier, we were hearing here the hon MEC ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...of Health complaining [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Oh! [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I promise you your time is up. And you know what, Mr Poggenpoel even forgot for a little time, to even put the clock back so you got extra time. Thank you very much, hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It gave you extra time. Thank you, I now recognise hon Makamba-Botya. Are you online?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Yes, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, can I have some order, please?

[Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Hon Deputy Speaker, I am not sure if I should proceed?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. What kind of government celebrates achievements and success against crime, but then Stats shows that the situation has worsened. This Department, hon Deputy Speaker, has pronounced winning a war against crime whilst the top 17 community reported crimes are all in the same province. The DA-led Government, hon Deputy Speaker, likes to brag about leading other provinces when it comes to service delivery and clean audits. This obsession about leading has now gotten into their heads to a ... [Audio distorted.] standard they now celebrate being a leading province when it comes to contact crime and sexual offences, which is a shame.

Hon Deputy Speaker, millions of taxpayers' money is being wasted in an adventurous exercise called the Safety Plan, which no one even dares to explain what it stands for. Is it ... [Audio distorted.] seeks to achieve. Hon Deputy Speaker, small businesses in townships which are just operating so that households can make ends meet are often being exposed to marauding gangs who constantly demand protection fees.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the children in townships are being kidnapped each and every day. Women in townships, such as Mitchells Plain, hon Deputy Speaker, and Manenberg experience a higher risk of being sexually violated than in any other place in this province. Hon Deputy Speaker, everyone is just not safe in this province, but then there is a decrease of more than R300 000 in the Budget of the Department of Community Safety.

On that note, hon Deputy Speaker, the EFF will not support this Vote. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, the ACDP supports this Budget Vote and I want to say that with the Western Cape SAPS being so under resourced, we as the ACDP want to state it on record again that we are calling for the devolution of powers of the Police to the Province. A major reason for this is ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): ...that the shocking report by a Western Cape High Court Judge that there is evidence that gang members infiltrated top management of SAPS and now, today we heard after the investigation from the Western Cape Ombudsman that there is substance to these allegations.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it is clear that crime will be a problem if gangsters are controlling the Police. There is no proper control when it comes to SAPS, and we will only resolve that problem when powers are devolved to the provinces that will do a better job to make sure that our people are safe.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians. I now recognise hon Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Bismillah Hir Rahman Nir Rahim The DA Province's calls to devolve the Police powers will not solve the high crime rate in the province. That call to devolve Police powers remains sinister. The Community Safety Department lacks the will to effectively deal with crime. The Province knows the crime hotspots; the Province knows the crime hotspots. It knows that the thousands of shebeens on the Cape Flats are springboards for criminal activities, rape, and murder. The Province and the City of Cape Town jointly launched the Tourist Safety Units to protect a particular important sector. So, too, can it deploy more Metro officers in hotspot areas, in townships and on the Cape Flats.

The Al Jama-ah does not support this Budget. [Interjections.] I thank you,

hon Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Good afternoon, hon Deputy Speaker, hon members of the House, hon Premier. I know the hon Premier is here today as both the Leader of the Executive, as well as my caucus leader. [Interjections.] But hon member Kama, through you, hon Deputy Speaker, I know your handler, hon member Sayed and hon member Pat Lekker have already left, and I see the incoming Chief Whip has now also abandoned you. So, I do hope you are taking notes. Good afternoon as well to the people of the Western Cape whom we are here to represent. [Interjections.]

Today, hon Deputy Speaker, we are here to pass a budget that will further work to expand the successes of the work done by the Department of Community Safety, a department that strives to cocreate safe and cohesive communities. Especially as we observe 16 Days of Activism for No Violence Against Women and Children and especially since the Commander-in-Chief of the Republic of South Africa has been silent and missing in action for the last few days, as we look at 16 Days of Activism. [Interjections.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, this Adjustment Budget sees the Department of Community Safety being allocated ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order, hon members.
[Interjections.] Order, hon members. Hon Windvogel, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Someone has ...[Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, we are – there is an hon member delivering his speech. If I can ask for you indulgence. Hon Dugmore, please? Over to you, hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): This Department, hon Deputy Speaker, is getting almost R776 million to help its needs of coordinating its vision of cocreating safe and cohesive communities across this province. Hon Deputy Speaker, we know this Department has a lot of work to do and we know that it has acted with more enthusiasm and innovation than the national agency, the very agency who is responsible for the constitutional mandate of protecting and servicing our communities. A national agency that has a Minister in the form of a talking hat who constantly forgets that he is no longer the National Police Commissioner, but the Cabinet Minister assigned to exercise political oversight and provide political direction. This talking hat has not been able to adequately provide for the protection of the people of this Western Cape.

The South African Police Service has confirmed to our Standing Committee that their Western Cape Anti-Gang Unit has a vacancy rate of 38%. This means that out of the 232 granted positions, only 144 police officers are

currently deployed to operate in this Unit. And I want us to stop and think of the family of Constable Ashwin Pedro who was shot earlier last week in Parkwood by gangsters. If that Unit was fully capacitated, we could have had those 232 officers respond to that incident. Even though the vacancy rate has decreased from 76% to 38% in the last financial year, it has remained the constant for the past three financial years with this Unit also experiencing a decrease in its operational budget.

We are still waiting for more details on the Crime Intelligence budgets and we have had to resort to a Promotion of Access to Information Act (PAIA) application to get that, through you to hon member Windvogel, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] It is concerning that given the recent flair-ups and murders in our province and the crime-stricken communities across Cape Town and the rest of the Western Cape, that the current capacitation of the Anti-Gang Unit remains unchanged. For us to be able to fight crime effectively as the hon Acting Shadow MEC for Police Oversight, hon member Kama has asked us to do, we need to fight crime efficiently and strategically and every structure needs to have the necessary resources ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...and personnel in order to operate ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...as effectively as possible.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Take your seat please. Hon Kama, do you have a point of order?

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I would want to check if the hon Deputy Provincial Minister of Police is prepared to take a question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think you better name who that Deputy is.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Yes, certainly. [Interjections.] Certainly, hon Deputy Speaker. I am happy to take a question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There you go. Over to you.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): No, thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. We do know that out of the 205, now in terms of the current stats, out of the 202 gang-related murders, 175 are from the Western Cape. And Nyanga, Harare, Philippi, Mfuleni, are part of the top ten car hijackings. Delft, Harare, and Strandfontein ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...are part of the top ten in terms of rape.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your question?

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Now, the question ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: On minute, question. Your question, hon Kama?
[Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Now, the question to the hon Deputy Minister is: asides from the boots on the ground, what amount is this Government spending to address the causative factors in these areas that I have counted and what are the targeted programmes ...[Interjection.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): ...to ensure that we address these [Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you, honourable [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: He is [Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member is a Chair, but he may continue to answer the question. [Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.] No, no. [Interjections.] Hon member, hon Bosman speak to me, please? [Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, I would love to lead a workshop on how to read the Blue Book [Laughter.] but I am not as clever as hon Baartman and ...[Audio distorted.] So, I am just going to respond to hon member Kama by saying that he earlier reminded us that the notion of safety is something. And I want to remind hon member Kama that notion is a conception of belief in something, and the people of the Western Cape do not have the belief that your National Government and the Police Service by your Minister can protect them. So, of the more than R1,5 billion that has already been spent on our comprehensive Safety Plan in this province, that is where you need to go look for that money, hon member Kama. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bosman. Hon members, order please!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Honourable ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bosman, please focus on me!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, as I said it is concerning given the recent flair-ups in murders in crime-stricken communities that we are standing here, and I am being heckled when we talk about Safety. [Interjections.] It is concerning that during 16 Days of Activism for No Violence Against Women and Children, hon members of this House cannot listen to a speech or a debate contribution without raising points of order that are frivolous. [Interjections.]

But it is for this reason, hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...that the Western Cape Provincial Government introduced its own Reaction Unit in February last year ... this year. The Unit operating within the LEAP programme acts as a force multiplier to assist SAPS because we work collaboratively. This Unit goes out when flair-ups in crime take place and as the DA, we look forward to this Reaction Unit being expanded to further boost and keep up the efforts of keeping our communities safe.

Hon Deputy Speaker, in the recent SAPS Annual Report, Minister Cele quoted former President Nelson Mandela, when he wrote in the foreword:

“If you want cooperation of humans around you, you must make

them feel that they are important, and you do that by being genuine and humbler.”

It is such a pity the Minister is not able to provide political and policy direction or even use his words to echo what former President Nelson Mandela wanted us to do. The Minister is in charge of creating a Police Service that is caring and a Police Service that serves and looks to its people, but he cannot do that. A Police Service that acts with integrity when he addresses our hardworking men and women in blue, but this Minister cannot do that because he insults them, and he screams at them. [Interjections.]

We want a Minister that is able to take responsibility for his words, his actions and his portfolio, but he cannot even do that. It is really time for Minister Bheki Cele to resign and finally show that at least he is competent at one thing, except for playing fast and loose with the lives of victims of Gender-Based Violence and crime. Hon Deputy Speaker, we wish that our National Minister with the budget and political authority over policing, can use those considerable resources to properly resource police stations in a way that is innovative and create a safe workplace for the men and women in blue, as well as for victims of crime.

Hon Deputy Speaker, in some of our oversight visits since I have joined this portfolio, we have identified the concerning state of police stations and how it is affecting their general operations. Particularly those in Kwanokuthula Kleinvelei, Elands Bay and Kwanonqaba in Mossel Bay. The responsibility

for maintaining police stations does not lie with this Government, but it lies with SAPS and the Department of Public Works and Infrastructure nationally. SAPS also leases police stations from municipalities, and they work with DPWI to maintain these buildings, but what we saw were not buildings that were maintained.

As such, due to this complex system, there are delays in certain procedures that prevent projects from coming online timeously. For example, as the hon members of the Opposition and the hon members on this side witnessed at the Kwanokuthula Police Station, a leased station, there are literal holes in the floor. The construction of a new station is only anticipated to be completed in March 2028. At the Kleinvlei Police Station in the Metro, at the Elands Bay Police Station the planning and the design for new stations are only expected to start in 2024/2026. Let us not even talk about Mossel Bay.

I was shocked, hon Deputy Speaker, that during our Standing Committee meeting the Provincial Minister, hon Reagan Allen, revealed to us that letters to the National Minister of Public Works and Infrastructure regarding this important issue, have gone unanswered. [Interjections.] Even the National Police Commissioner, Commissioner Masemola said he is struggling to engage with them. This not only highlights the inability of National Government to support our men and women in blue, it shows that while SAPS has a long road ahead before it meets any of its infrastructure and assets at a proper standard, SAPS is still trying very hard, but they are being failed. But, hon Deputy Speaker, there is hope. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Windvogel. [Interjections.] Hon Windvogel! [Interjections.] Hon Windvogel! [Interjections.] Hon Windvogel, can we just have order, please? That is a running commentary. Over to you, hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape has once again shown not only to be a pillar of good governance, but also just to be doing the basics and doing it well. It remains the only province to provide a Policing Needs and Priorities report to the National Government every year and it outlines in the PNP, areas of intervention. Through that, we have seen that they have complimented SAPS resources with LEAP officers, something which the new Premier in Gauteng is rapidly adopting and rolling out.

As members of the Legislature, we look forward to doing more oversight on this work and hopefully, when we engage with our counterparts in Gauteng, we can see how they are copying from the Western Cape. Hon Deputy Speaker, as always, the Western Cape through our hon Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety has come to the rescue of the people of the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): During the last financial year, the Department has prioritised the following to support the Provincial Safety mandate.

[Interjections.] More accreditation of Neighbourhood Watches has taken place, there has been an expansion of the K9 Dog Units across municipalities, continued support to LEAP officers and Reaction Units in municipalities. We have had Rural Safety summits. There has been a complete focus on Occupational Health and Safety within the Western Cape Government, as well as at police stations through the reports we have provided. There is also a firearms harms reduction strategy in place to make sure we get guns off the street. While the ANC sends guns back to gangs, we get them off the streets.

Through you, hon Deputy Speaker, these objectives and the objectives that have been outlined, shine through in the Department's delivery. While crime has shown to increase in the recent crime stats, the successes of the Safety Plan has once again proven that the murder rate was lowered in Mfuleni, Kraaifontein, Gugulethu, Khayelitsha, and Harare ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...compared to the same period last year. In closing, hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members, order!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...with the festive season upon us, I would like to wish the Tourism Safety Unit and our officers on the ground working hard, all the best as they are keeping our streets across the Western Cape safe.

Additionally, I want to appreciate the efforts of all of our safety structures, including our CPFs and our street committees in the form of our Neighbourhood Watches. I want to commend them for the hard work that they are doing so that we can sleep with at least one eye closed at night. It all goes without saying, hon Deputy Speaker, that the DA supports this Adjustment Budget.

I want to extend a further thank you to Mr Waseem Matthews, our Procedural Officer in the Standing Committee, who not only supports the Committee with procedural advice and logistical support, but very often is able to get information to members at breakneck speed because we know our members are constantly learning, even though they are not always comprehending, hon Deputy Speaker, through you.

A very big thank you to hon Minister Reagan Allen for your commitment to Safety and for always being able to assist members of the Committee and members of the public. Thank you to the HOD, Advocate Pillay, and your team sitting in the box, for your continued support and for enabling the people of the Western Cape to at least feel the notion of safety in this province through your intervention.

I want to thank the members of our Standing Committee for their hard work and I want to wish them well over the festive season because I know when they walk past a LEAP officer, when they walk past a Reaction Unit officer, when they walk past a Chrysalis graduate, they will say thank you because we

know that they will feel safe in this Western Cape. As I said earlier ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): As I said earlier, hon Deputy Speaker, we know who are the hon members on the Opposite side. Their handler is *Vinnige Fanie* and hon Lekker who were not here earlier, but I know hon Sayed is back and we hope ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Honourable [Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...we hope that [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...the concept.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bosman, please take your seat. Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I think between hon member Bosman [Interjections.] between hon member Bosman and hon member Baartman there is a confusion [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No! Is that a point of [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...as to the former player of the South African cricket team.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Which one is *Vinnige Fanie*?
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member! Hon Sayed [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): *Ja*, and [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is not, that is not [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): And the last I saw *Vinnige Fanie* was a fast bowler, not a spinner [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, that is not a point of order.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...like the hon MEC's pointless stories.
Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, that is not a point of order. Please, hon members! [Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, I am always amazed by the responses I am able to elicit, and I thought that after the lamb shanks hon members would be fast asleep by now. [Laughter.] But ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! I understand it is ...[Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, through you. We know the lamb shank redemption is a slow process, [Laughter.] but I want to say to the hon members ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...that this Province leads in getting clean audits, it leads in good governance. It does not compete with provinces who cannot even make it to the start line. This Province focuses on delivering to the people of the Western Cape and once again, I want to thank the members ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...I want to thank the members of the Standing Committee for knowing that sometimes we are not friends because we are here to defend the people of the Western Cape and for as long as the ANC

National Government ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): ...fails the people of the Western Cape, hon Deputy Speaker, we will continue to robustly engage even with our friends. I thank you. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Applause.] Thank you. Hon members [Interjections.] hon members can I continue with the Vote, please. I just cannot understand why Community Safety creates such a furore. Hon Minister [Interjections.] Hon Minister, over to you. I am going to try and control the last part of this Vote before we actually vote on our Vote. So, please can I have your indulgence. Over to you, hon Minister. [Interjections.] Please, hon members, it is the last part of the sitting. Thank you.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Deputy Speaker, I will not be long. We do know that time is running out and that we need to do everything in our power to work together. When the hon Premier approached me a little over seven months ago, he said, 'Reagan, Safety is now' after hon member Dugmore advocated [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
...after hon member Dugmore advocated [Interjections.] and hon member Brinkhuis advocated. [Laughter.] The last seven and a half months, I want to say to hon members of this House through you, hon Deputy Speaker, it has not been easy.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: It has been very difficult in our province, but we have seen the strides being made. Hon member Kama, through you, hon Deputy Speaker to hon member Kama. I know hon member Kama's time ran out. I will make it my mission to get the last four pages of his speech because I would want to interrogate that. I remain open to engaging. I would read each and every single word [Interjections.] [Laughter.] I will read each and every single word that is echoed because we are wanting ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
...to foster the working relationships. [Interjections.] I want to say ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon member.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
...to each and every hon member ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, Bakubaku-Vos. Hon members,
please, I cannot hear the hon Minister.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
He is still an alternate on the Committee and I do want to say thank you for
his input. He indicated that I was frustrated as the Chairperson. I wish to
place again on record: I am still frustrated. Everyone on this side of the
rope, of the aisle remains frustrated about Safety and what we need to do and
how National Government needs to step up. [Interjections.] We will remain
frustrated in that regard. We will continue to expand our oversight role
whenever funding has been allocated. In the Ombudsman's office, hon Deputy
Speaker, it is with regard to ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
...a post that was not filled as anticipated and then, we had to act in order to
make sure that we are actually spending finances. So, the additional funding
that is being taken from the Ombudsman's office has been allocated towards
EPWP stipends.

I have indicated that I am going to obtain hon member Kama's speech, but I

will also make the Safety Plan available to hon member Kama again ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...so that he is able to interrogate the Safety Plan [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. I cannot hear the hon Minister.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...so that he is able to interrogate the Safety Plan because it is a whole of government approach, each and every department playing a role. I also want to thank hon member Christians on his firm view on devolution. [Interjections.] I think everyone in our province that is working in the Safety space, is deeply frustrated that choices are made regarding SAPS, 1 500 kilometres away from where we are, all the way in Pretoria. We would want SAPS to be closer to the people. Hon member Brinkhuis, thank you so much for your input. I highly appreciate [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I highly appreciate your input. I just wanted to state for the record that in

terms of the Safety Plan, over R2 billion is allocated towards looking at Violence Prevention, looking at the socioeconomic circumstances, but also stepping up in the Violence Prevention and in the Law Enforcement. Of that amount, 0,02% has gone to the Tourism Safety officers: 0.02%. And in our engagements with the Tourism sector, over 90% of them answered [Interjections.] over 90% of them answered ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
...over 90% of the Tourism sector answered one question, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
What will contribute to making sure that the Tourism sector can boom again and they said safety. We even want to do so much more, hon member Brinkhuis, in that particular space because when we grow the economy, when we make sure that people are employed, we will be able to create safer spaces. So, from the work that Health does, Social Development, Education, all our departments, Cultural Affairs and Sport, together with Community Safety. Holding that space is creating safer spaces. [Interjections.]

But we want to say R660 000 given to CPFs. I was at the CPF Board

[Laughter.] I was at the CPF ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I was at the CPF Board meeting most recently, the last two weeks ago [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! This is a serious topic. Please, hon members.

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I was with the Provincial [Interjections.] I was with the Provincial Board CPF. [Interjections.] I am [Interjections.] I was ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Focus on me, hon Minister, please. Hon Dugmore. [Interjections.] Hon Dugmore, one minute. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: As a [Interjections.] As light reading [Interjections.] and as engagement, I do want to say in my engagements [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, we cannot get through today's Votes. [Interjections.] Hon Bakubaku-Vos, it is a consistent commentary coming from you. If I can please ask so that the hon Minister can finish his Vote.

[Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
 May I, hon Deputy Speaker, through you, hon Deputy Speaker. May I request if there is any hon member in this House that is engaging the Safety structures, to please provide me with information on the sentiments on CPFs. I came from Manenberg now. The CPF was present. I have engaged the Provincial Board and we are doing amazing work together with our Neighbourhood Watches. [Interjections.] So, if you have one particular CPF that is not happy or not showing that we are making the right strides, please share that. I am open to that engagement.

I do want to once again say, hon Deputy Speaker, as I conclude. I look to those in the box, I look to the Standing Committee as well, but †vir hulle in box wil ek sê baie dankie. Een en elk, die rol wat julle speel, dit beteken so baie. [for those in the box I want to say thank you. Each and everyone, the role that you play, it means so much.] I would not have been able to stand here fully aware that we have a daunting task, but fully aware that we are capable and that we are making the strides. And that we will work with SAPS as we hold them accountable, as we press for devolution because it is for each and every hon member in this House, for each and every person in our community that we are fighting. So, thank you so much for the support and thank you, also, for the help. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members!

The MINISTER FOR POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I also want to say hon member – I also want to say, hon Deputy Speaker, as I conclude. I could name hon members here over this last seven and a half months that have helped me. I want to say thank you. Your words of encouragement, your input. Agbare Premier, baie dankie. Hon Minister Maynier, baie dankie. Almal hier. [Interjections.] [Hon Premier thank you. Hon Minister Maynier, thank you. Everyone here.] I also want to look aside, this side, and I want to say thank you. [Interjections.] Ek wil sê dankie. Dit help. [I want to say thank you. It helps.] [Interjections.] And I am going to break the Rules now. [Interjections.] Ek wil sê baie dankie my broer, baie dankie. [I want to say thank you my brother, thank you.] [Interjections.] And I conclude, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you very much, hon Minister. [Applause.]. That concludes the debate on this Vote.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will give a minute if you would like to leave the Chamber. Thank you very much to the Administration. Thank you, hon members. Can I have your indulgence, please. We will now proceed, and I will now ask the Secretary to read the Seventh Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Considerations of Votes and Schedules – *Western Cape*

Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3-2022]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Secretary. Order! I have to announce that there are currently 36 hon members present and entitled to vote and the House is therefore quorate. Parties now have an option of making a general [Interjection]

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ...declaration. Is there a point of order? Hon Marran, what is your point of order?

Mr P MARRAN: Yes, thanks, hon Deputy Speaker. My hand ...[Audio distorted.] for clarity. I just wanted to check with you, hon Deputy Speaker. I have ...[Audio distorted.] the hon Daylin Mitchell ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marran, that is not a point of order ...[Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: Is he an MEC or not?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am on the next Order of the Day. Please mute the hon Minister ... the hon member. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]... interrupt.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member. I am going to proceed with the Votes. So, parties have an option of making a declaration now to cover all the Votes, hon members, or decide on a specific Vote that you may want to make a declaration on individually. Is there anybody, are there any of the parties that would like to make declarations on any of the Votes at this stage? A general declaration? None? Okay. Are there any objections to Votes 1 to Vote 14 and the Schedules of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill?

HON MEMBERS: No! Yes, yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. There are objections, I will proceed. Those in favour of the Votes and Schedules of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill being adopted, please say 'yes'.

An HON MEMBER: Aye!

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

An HON MEMBER: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those not in favour of the Votes and Schedules of

the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill being adopted, please say 'no'.

HON MEMBERS: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr P MARRAN: No!

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Then I have it that the ayes have it. Votes and Schedules of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill has therefore been adopted. Thank you. I will now ask the Secretary to read the Eighth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: *Finalisation of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill including Clauses and Short Title.* [B3-2022]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Secretary. I recognise the hon Minister of Finance.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Thank you very much to the hon members for their inputs on this framework for hope and a budget that cares

and prepares, and we ask that the Bill, Clauses and Short Title be finalised.
Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. There are being no lists of speakers as far as I understand. Are there any objections to the Bill, Clauses and Short Title being finalised?

HON MEMBERS: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections, agreed to. I have to announce that there are currently – if I can just confirm, Mr Secretary – 36 again, hon members present and entitled to vote, and the House is therefore quorate. Those in favour of the Bill, Clauses and Short Title being finalised, please say ‘yes’.

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those not in favour of the Bill, Clauses and Short Title being finalised, please say ‘no’.

HON MEMBERS: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The ayes have it. The finalisation including Clauses and Short Title of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3-2022], is therefore approved. The names of the individual hon members

present and their support or otherwise for the question before the House, will be recorded in the Minutes of Proceedings to ensure a full record of the voting on the Bill. The Secretary will read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Secretary. The Bill will be sent to the hon Premier for assent. I would now like to move over to the parties addressing the House at the end of this session. As a tradition, hon members, I will now afford representatives of parties an opportunity to address the House on the occasion of the end of the year and the end of this session. I recognise the ANC.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Colleagues, Charles Dickens opens the novel *A Tale of Two Cities* with a sentence that has become famous, and I quote:

“It was the best of times, it was the worst of times, it was the age of wisdom, it was the age of foolishness, it was the epoch of belief, it was the epoch of incredulity, it was the season of Light, it was the season of Darkness, it was the spring of hope, it was the winter of despair, we had everything before us, we had nothing before us, we were all going direct to Heaven, we were all going direct the other way – in short, the period was so far like the present period, that some of its noisiest authorities

insisted on its being received, for good or for evil, in the superlative degree of comparison only.”

2022 may be described as one such year. The *Tale of Two Cities* is a novel. We live in the real world. This is not a year that any of us, I believe, will easily forget. Having lost lives during COVID-19 and after, people having lost jobs and the GBV, crime, gangsterism, extortion continuing to be a blot on our society and serious pathologies, we need now to rise to the occasion. Our job, hon Deputy Speaker, is to provide leadership, hope and transformation in the lives of our people. Nelson Mandela said, and I quote:

“To be a great leader, one must never give up, try to bring people together and be selfless. Leadership is about working with and for others to achieve a common goal that benefits everyone.”

The ANC wants to thank everyone in the House, irrespective of political affiliation, for the collegial and actually, the cordial manner mostly, in which we conducted our business as a collective. As colleagues serving on committees holding the Executive to account, we really got to know each other better on our oversight visits, and learned the one truth that, I think, all of us hold dear, that each one of us loves our province and country dearly and wishes to improve the situation facing our people.

We laughed sometimes at the hon former Premier Marais jokes. We appreciate his wisdom. Sometimes, we mock each other across the floor and

we sometimes, hon Deputy Speaker, only sometimes have loud shouting matches. But we do all of this in serving the people of the Western Cape and South Africa. When we differ robustly from vantage points of our political homes, we do so to ensure that the citizens are served.

We thank the hon members of the Executive who have been available to the committees and to answer our questions. We remember with deep, deep sadness the passing of the hon Chief Whip Lorraine Botha and may her soul rest in eternal peace. We thank our hon colleagues in the Ruling Party in this Province, our fellow Opposition parties especially EFF, GOOD, Al Jama-ah, who keep us on our toes and appreciate the commitment of the ACDP and the Freedom Front Plus to taking up, especially, community issues. It would be wrong of me not to say thank you to the hon former Speaker, hon Masizole Mnqasela. Who knows, hon members of this House, we may see him back soon. That is now a matter for the Courts to decide should that avenue be pursued.

Thank you to the Secretary of the Legislature who is here and all the staff for their hard work. We cannot afford a situation where ongoing battles amongst hon members of this House place staff members in an invidious position. Despite the difficult year, the staff of this Legislature have simply been incredible. We thank the staff of our respective political parties, the South African Police for your service to the province here in this building. In particular thanks to my comrades in the ANC caucus for their hard work in serving their constituencies and holding the Executive to account.

Our spending time with our families to reflect – I am asking that we reflect on our role, the actual honour and the privilege that we have been given and come back determined to serve the people of our province better. It is at times like this in our country that we should appreciate the immense value of our Constitution and the need for us to defend it and to also implement its redress positions.

In conclusion, a quote from one of those who helped liberate our country, Chris Hani and he said:

“Socialism is not about big concepts and heavy theory. Socialism is about decent shelter for those who are homeless. It is about water for those who have no safe drinking water. It is about healthcare, it is about a life of dignity for the old. It is about overcoming the huge divide between urban and rural areas. It is about a decent education for all our people. Socialism is about rolling back the tyranny of the market. As long as the economy is dominated by an unelected, privileged few, the case for socialism will exist.”

Now, hon Deputy Speaker, whether we define ourselves as socialists, social democrats, liberals, whatever the definition is that we might describe ourselves ideologically, the challenge posed by Chris Hani remains: to achieve a better life for all. A life without oppression and exploitation and a

life where the basic needs are met; where wealth is shared and where the land belongs to those who work it. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Dugmore. [Applause.] I purposely did not put a time constraint on that because I felt that you deserved to have an end of your words. I now recognise the EFF, hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. The EFF wishes to send our best wishes to the hon members of Parliament and staff over the festive season. We must all be safe, and we must come back to this Parliament and restore hope to the Western Cape community, more especially, those who are previously disadvantaged and also strive to bring an end to inequalities of this province. I thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise GOOD.

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. GOOD would like to say that it is our first year or my first year in this House. I came in in February. I would like to say thank you to all the hon members that welcomed me, the good relationships that we could build and finding each other in our oversight visits, both on Cluster and also, Standing Committees. The love and caring, a part of the members towards me, always advising and

assisting. I would also like to say thank you to the staff and that we all have a good Christmas and a good festive season. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, on behalf of the ACDP, I wish every hon member and the officials Godspeed over the festive season and safe travelling mercies. Hon Deputy Speaker, the legacy that this Parliament must leave behind, must be a legacy of a safer, prosperous and healthy province. With robust discussions and debates, we will achieve a better life for all of the people of the Western Cape. I want to bless hon members and the officials by reading from the Word of God Number 6 verses 24 to 26:

“The Lord bless you, the Lord keep you; the Lord make his face shine upon you and be gracious to you; the Lord turn his face toward you and give you peace.”

Shalom.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I know the Freedom Front Plus is not in the House. I recognise – over to you, hon Brinkhuis, Al Jama-ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker for this opportunity. First of all, I want to say that all praise to Allah [2:50:36] and salutations on the Prophet Muhammad [2:50:41] and we will never be able to thank Allah [2:50:44] that he has carried us through the year with all our work that we have done here in the Western Cape Government. And I also would like to take the opportunity to thank the hon Premier and to thank all my colleagues and hon members of Parliament, and especially the hon Deputy Speaker and the hon Speaker that is not currently with us. I would like to end off with a prayer for myself and for everybody. [2:51:09 – 2:51:30] Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. It is known as the Season of Goodwill in most Western countries, but the December festive season is, of course, not a universal one. Here in South Africa, Christmas is a public holiday and most South Africans celebrate the day for very many different reasons, ranging from religion to culture to custom to tradition or to simply just have holiday fun; or even only because of our children, many too young still to consider ideology. They want gifts and treats like all the other children they see around them.

†Tradisioneel is die Desember-vakansie die groot Suid-Afrikaanse wegbreek.

Sommige van ons gaan see toe, Bosveld toe, of huis toe waar ons grootgeword het. Ons onthou die dinge wat ons in ons gelukkigste tye met vriende en familie saamgebind het en ons raak aan ons beste herinneringe in hierdie dae. [Traditionally the December holiday is the big South African breakaway. Some of us go to the sea, to the Bushveld, or home where we grew up. We remember the things that bound us together in our happiest times with our friends and families and we touch on our best memories in these days.]

Perhaps, we should focus on the fact that all may wish for happiness and joy and goodwill to all. †As die feesseisoene 'n impak kan maak op ons begrip van geregtigheid en gelyke geleenthede, dan kan ons maar feesvier, ongeag die rede vir die viering. [If the festive season can make an impact on our perception of justice and equal opportunities, then we may celebrate, irrespective of the reason for celebration.]

So, hon colleagues on both sides of the House and logged online, let us be happy and let us relax. We all have worked hard this year. I believe we all deserve a break, but let us not forget, indeed, let us not forget that the people we were elected and appointed to serve do not all have the same privileges and opportunities and certainly, not the means we have to make and to relive happy memories.

Let us reflect during our celebrations and our fun that we need to redouble our efforts to make possible an equal opportunity for jobs, for houses, for

food, for electricity, for water, for health, for education, for recreation. The basic services, sadly people in our province are taking for granted, but so many in the other eight provinces are yearning for as we speak.

Let 2023 be notable year of good governance to the benefit of all. That the spirit of goodwill guides us not only during Christmas, but always as we discharge our duties, as we do the all-important work to make better lives possible and real for our citizens in the Western Cape. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, [Applause.] hon Minister. Hon members, that concludes the business for the day. I wish you all a very safe and festive season. The Secretary will now end the meeting and the hon members will be exited. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 16:57.