
THURSDAY, 5 MAY 2022

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I greet you all this afternoon. You may all be seated. We have converged here – thank you very much, Mr Poggenpoel, and the Table staff. We have converged here in our ordinary sitting. I am presiding in a very unique environment. We have undertaken a UK trip as the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. We are meeting the United Kingdom on an official business. When we come back, we will report on the very fruitful and productive engagement that we have had and we continue to have with the Greater Britain.

I just want to also welcome the guests who are the members of the media and of course the other stakeholders, who might be listening to this forum, to this sitting of the House. We are in a hybrid session and of course it means that we have to respect the instruments that guide this session in terms of the guidelines. As you would remember the directives that I published on 17 April 2020, give regard to the hybrid sessions, particularly the virtual platforms, of which one of the things is that you may not activate your microphone. You may not do so unless you speak and you have been recognised by the Presiding Officer, and number two, you may not activate your camera if you are a guest, other than a Member of Parliament, and you may not activate your microphone if you are a guest, except for the hon members. What is more important for the hon members here both in the Chamber and of course for the hon members, who are connected virtually, is that the hon members who are in the Chamber, you may not log into the system. You have been counted there so we now know that you are in the House. That is enough, but the hon members who are virtually connected, please do not speak unless you have been recognised, or just lift your hand or say in the chat room that you would like to say something. We are now aware of how these hybrid sessions occur because we have been doing this for over two years. So as I am about to finish on this particular area, I will not be presiding any further from now, I am going to be relieved by the hon Van der Westhuizen, who is one of our Temporary Chairpersons, who, in the event where he needs help, there are other Temporary Chairpersons. Hon Maseko is also here, amongst others.

May I thank the hon Van der Westhuizen for your support and obviously accepting to take this role for this session and to request the hon members to cooperate. This is your session and of course it must be like any other sessions.

Thank you very much, and may you have a great session and may this sitting be a success. May God bless you all. Hon Van der Westhuizen may take over.

[The Temporary Chairperson took the Chair.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Speaker, and best wishes for a most successful trip. Thank you very much. Hon members, I now recognise the Chief Whip.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Chairperson; I rise on two motions without notice. The first is:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 20(1), I move that precedence be given to the Subject for Discussion in the name of hon D Plato.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. The motion has been put.

Are there any objections to this motion? No objections? Agreed to.

I recognise you again, hon Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you Chairperson. I give notice that I shall move:

That, in accordance with Standing Rule 24, that the following members be reconfirmed to act as Temporary Presiding Officers: Maseko, L M; Van der Westhuizen, A P; Kaizer-Philander, W F; Mvimbi, L L; Bakubaku-Vos, N G; Makamba-Botya, N.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. The motion has again been put. Are there any objections to this motion? No objections? Agreed to. Thank you very much.

We will now deal with the Subject for Discussion in the name of the hon Plato, as printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Plato.

SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION

The impact of the illicit drug trade in the Western Cape
on the safety, health and wellbeing of communities.

Mr D PLATO: Hon Chairperson, hon members, I greet you. Chairperson and

members, I rise today on an issue which remains a blight on the face of our province.

The illicit drug trade continues unabated despite the efforts of many role-players to curb this trade. The substances not only destroy the health of our individual citizens, but tear apart entire communities. They provide money as a means of recruitment for violent gangs and also lay the foundations for the circumstances which lead to gender-based violence. Those who might have otherwise been breadwinners for their families are rendered unable to hold down even a job and the bonds of addiction hold so many of our children back from their undeniable potential.

On Tuesday, I visited the *Kindersorg* Children's Organisation with some of our hon members, which provides social services to a number of previously disadvantaged communities in the Western Cape in the Cape Winelands region and even parts of the City of Cape Town. I was inspired by the passion of the staff and the dedication of the management and we were addressed by a full house of management members and we really appreciate their commitment. But I was profoundly disturbed by some of what staff there told us, including the fact that children as young as nine years old have found themselves in the clutches of drug addiction. Chairperson, it goes without saying that this cannot stand, and we cannot agree to something like that.

What is clear is that policing alone cannot solve this problem. Make no

mistake, the illicit drug trade will only be stopped when SAPS plays its part and a key part of our strategy is to support the efforts of the police with our provincial initiatives, including LEAP officers, area-based teams and Canine Units, to name only a few, but that approach must be holistic, Chairperson. We must police our province intelligently using an evidence-based approach. We must ensure that our health facilities are equipped to deal with the down-line impact of drug abuse and addiction and we must ensure that we are able to mitigate and address the social damage caused by the illicit drug trade to our family units. There is a saying, “a saving grace for our province and this country, it is our ability to unite as a nation against that which would damage our society” and we have proven ourselves in that respect in the past. Communities across the Western Cape have shown their willingness to eradicate the threat that we know that we now face.

It is up to us in government to provide the leadership and the support for this to be achieved. I hope that my colleagues will join us in doing so across the political spectrum, in working towards this common goal which we all, I believe, share. I hope that this debate will mobilise a whole of society approach to the issue of illicit drugs in our province, and help us to achieve our goals of improving health, safety and security in the province and I want to reiterate Chairperson, it is all of our business, whoever we are and whatever we call ourselves, because if we are to defeat this evil, and I call it the evil in our province, and all our children across the political spectrum are affected, it does not matter which party we belong to. All of us must pull together. When I say all of us, I exclude no-one. I include our law

enforcement officers as well, both provincial and national.

I include our educators who see the effects of drugs on our youth firsthand on a day-to-day basis. I include our social workers that must go out under very trying difficult circumstances to talk and to deal with family life affected and who come to our aid of families ripped apart by substance abuse. I include every citizen of this province, young or old, urban or rural, and most of all, Chairperson, I include every one of us in this House today who must lead from the front in addressing this plague in our province.

Hon Chairperson, in conclusion, this Provincial Government is committed to the promotion of jobs, safety and wellbeing for all in this province, but there is a mountain standing in our way. But I have moved for this debate because I passionately believe that if we are working together taking a whole of society approach, we can overcome that mountain. I hope that this debate will bring us closer as a Parliament to moving forward on that journey. Chairperson, I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. Next on the Speakers' list is the hon Dugmore and I see he is joining us virtually. I recognise you, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you. Thank you very much, Chairperson of Committees. Can you hear me?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Loud and clear, thank you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you. Chairperson, as the ANC we want to be emphatic and say that we support and we welcome the Subject for Discussion in the House today brought to us by hon Plato. Drugs and substance abuse are having a devastating affect on our families and our communities. We need to spend more time, like we are today, discussing the real issues, like this one, which impact on the lives of millions without exaggeration, of people in our province. Everyone in this House today knows surely someone, whether a family member, a young person or friend who is addicted to drugs. We know the destructive force that these drugs have on our communities and our youth, in particular. We participate in this discussion today, not to score cheap political points, but to pledge support against the fight against and support for the fight against drugs, indeed the fight for the lives and the very futures of those addicted.

We too can point fingers and point out for instance that our Provincial Government does not have a Provincial Drug Master Plan yet. We come here today to participate and to pledge to work with this Provincial Government, Local Government and our people to defeat drugs. Hon Bakubaku-Vos will speak about and make proposals as to how the Department of Social Development can intervene and play their role.

The ANC finds this necessary because defeating drugs is not just and can never be just a Community Safety issue, not just a policing matter. It is a

holistic approach that is required. This approach must be inter-governmental, cooperative and hon Bakubaku-Vos will highlight some of the interventions put in place by the National Department of Social Development, while hon Kama will bring in the aspect of Community Safety and how important it is to work with the police and our communities in defeating drugs. We have seen the central role played by our Community Police Fora in working with the police to defeat drugs. Substance use must be replaced by hope, Chairperson, by employment, by opportunities and by finding role-models who can guide our youth. When doing a presentation on Community Policing Fora in the province, the South African Police that was at the National Assembly in November of 2019, they indicated that there was a deep link between gangsterism and drugs in our province, and how drugs are becoming far more widespread. I am not sure if hon members know, but that we have been told that nearly half of the known drugs dens, 47% in our province, are actually located in the rural areas.

The Committee also had to hear about how limited funds by the [Inaudible.] CPFs had to cover new programmes, “Vulnerable Children, Domestic Violence, Drug Awareness and Prevention.”

Again, Chair, I would like to take this opportunity to appeal to my colleagues on the other side, let us work with the South African Police and the National Government to fight this scourge. We have a former MEC, we have a current MEC. There is lots of experience in this House, hon Lekker and others, hon member Kama. We know that drug and substance abuse often lead to

domestic and gender violence.

The 2017 Study by the Centre for the Study of Violence had indicated that illegal drug consumption was set to cost the country R136 billion rand per annum. But we need to ask some questions: who are these wealthy drug lords? Who are those in the police that aid, abet and protect them in return for cash and, I must say in some cases, drugs.

Is it the thousands of gang members, the hundreds of thousands in fact, who are the problem, or is it those that make billions every year by keeping our young people enslaved? In the past our Provincial Government has suggested that 80% of the Health budget is spent on preventable conditions, no doubt drug and substance abuse are a huge cost driver. Hon Kama and myself will be meeting with the Provincial Police Commissioner and our deep concerns about the illicit drug trade to and in our province will be spoken about.

We must work together with SAPS to strengthen our CPFs and I appeal to the hon members, let us support our CPFs as well as the Neighbourhood Watches. We must work alongside SGBs to defeat drugs, especially drugs brought into schools. Our Department of Human Settlements must ensure that together with Local Government that houses are not turned into drug dens, but we must also provide our young people with alternative sports facilities, cultural clubs, bursaries, internet gaming cafés.

We welcome this discussion today, but it will be meaningless if we just use it

to play the blame game again.

Today we should hear, what are the next steps for us, and I want to conclude by saying that every possible solution must be considered and although I personally am not convinced, I do believe that we also must discuss seriously whether the legalisation of drugs worsens the problem or actually contributes to a solution. That is a debate that we must confront head-on. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Thank you, hon Dugmore. The next on the Speakers' list is the hon Makamba-Botya. Hon, are you joining us virtually?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: [No audible reply.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I do not see the honourable member. We then go on to the next person on the Speakers' list, who is the hon Allen. It is the hon Allen's maiden speech in his new position as the Minister for Community Safety and Police Oversight. Welcome!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY AND POLICE OVERSIGHT: Thank you, House Chairperson. Hon House Chairperson, the Premier, hon colleagues, allow me to state from the outset that I am filled with gratitude today. I am reminded of the words of Cameron Dugmore on 14 March, sitting over there and shouting to the Premier, "make Reagen Allen the MEC", [Interjections.] [Laughter] ...which shows that we already extended a hand

that we want to listen.

We want to engage, and we want to work together because Cameron Dugmore mentioned, we all know someone that has been afflicted and/or persons who lost their lives due to this affliction... [Inaudible.] and knowing that you have family members that have succumbed to that as well, so this is deeply – not only personal, but I am deeply committed to listening to member Dugmore and to Opposition members and I am looking forward to it because there is so much we can do. But let me say I would like to thank hon member Plato for bringing this topic to the House and also to make it clear that the Western Cape Government, we are fully committed to eradicate this evil that is plaguing our communities. Crime is not a laughing matter. Crime is not a joke. It is a joke that some members of the Opposition are not calling out their colleague at national level, the National Minister of Police for not providing us with adequate resources here in our province. The men and women in blue that are committed are being hamstrung because they often do the job of two, three or four other people.

As I go further, the Western Cape was due to receive 1 939 new recruits for this year in terms of what was budgeted for. I have received information that this has been reduced by 821 members. This is in an environment where we have a 10% vacancy rate across the province so in a 10% vacancy rate across the province, together with an already under-resourced SAPS establishment that can never be accepted, but it is also, and it is probably another joke that ANC members across the country, in our beautiful province, are supporting a

man that is supporting a war 12 500 kilometres away from here, and to supporting those dictatorship tendencies, and I am probably adding dictatorship as a courtesy, but we do know, we do know that crime is not a joke and I do want to say despite media articles - and this being my first speech - I think it will be appropriate to address it. Despite linking jokes and comedy, I do not think that will sit well because I want to work together.

We have a young man here from South Africa who just spoke at a correspondence dinner in the USA, Trevor Noah, an amazing guy! We know what Mark Lottering is doing, in terms of his charity work. Kurt Schoonraad, a young boy from Mitchells Plain, that founded the Cape Town Comedy Club, is doing amazing work to also eradicate crime and help other young people. So we know crime is not a joke, but the actual joke is that if we are unable to address the plague, and if ANC members are blue-ticked.

Illicit drugs and crime do not tickle, and it is no laughing matter or joy. It destroys and eventually it kills. The drug trade is too easily accessible and it can never be acceptable that we have 1 577 known drug houses across our province. Member Dugmore alluded to this as well and the 53%, which is here in the Metro, and 47%, which is in our rural areas. That can never be allowed, it can never be acceptable where in one drug house three generations have visited that particular drug house in order to purchase drugs, the grandfather, the father and the son purchasing drugs at the same house, and on 8 April, after a request that I have made in my role as the Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Community Safety, I approached the Western

Cape Police Ombudsman and office, that is one of a kind that is only here in our province, in order to investigate SAPS' inefficiencies with regard to shutting down drug houses, but also the transportation and the manufacturing of drugs. I am appealing to member Dugmore and other members to also approach the Ombudsman's office to provide those submissions so that we can obtain those recommendations that could potentially not only be implemented here in Mitchells Plain, but in Eldorado Park, in KZN and it can set the ball in motion where we are able to shut down those drug houses and that is essentially the Western Cape's Safety Plan in action.

Our Safety Plan is also to make sure that we do so much more in terms of preventative measures and measures to look at the root causes of crime because I know in terms of the supply and demand, if we are able to address the demand with social development and the whole of society approach that this Government has adopted, we are able to see that the supply can eventually dry up and that is the Safety Plan in action.

Furthermore, our school safety resource officers continue to play a significant role in combating crime, particularly within the school community. We have been informed by the City of Cape Town that these officers between January 2021 and March 2022, SROs confiscated 194 dagga joints and 66 *bankies* of dagga. To further demonstrate our commitment to addressing this issue at our schools, R8 million will be invested with R2 million from the Department of Community Safety and Police Oversight and R6 million from the Western Cape Education Department and this will

allow for more School Resource Officers (SROs) to be employed permanently under that particular programme. We are even taking that a step further to ensure a quick response in schools, and that is essentially the Safety Plan in action, and I do want to extend that hand to work together to see how we can have a bigger impact with the help of everyone, but the reality is that none of us can do it all alone. We need each other and if we are to effectively address this matter to ensure that it does not further fragment or cause harm in our communities, partnerships are key if we are to remove this evil from our midst, and in conclusion, House Chairperson, I would like to extend an olive branch to members across the floor to join the rest of us in this fight.

The members here on my side to the left are fully committed and are dedicated to ensure that we do as much as we can in order to eradicate this evil and you have heard some of our interventions here today, and we will continue to hear some of them during this debate. There are also others as well, as we do not take this any lightly, I have commenced last night on my first oversight and walkabout with Neighbourhood Watches in Tafelsig and I saw firsthand the men and women that are committed to making sure that we not only add extra boots on the ground via the LEAP Programme and the Violence Prevention, but work alongside CPFs and Neighbourhood Watches, so last night in Tafelsig Neighbourhood Watches and CPFs joined and we could see how we are able to bring about a safer environment, dedicated men and women that are marching, that are walking in order to help. We spoke to two particular gentlemen and the one said: "I needed help. I do not want to do drugs anymore", and we could facilitate that person in order to get the

specific treatment and I will be following up on that case.

One other mother ran out of her house to say that her son is not at home, she is worried, where is he, can we help, so it is real issues that are affecting our communities. It is not something to politicise and I am looking forward to this road ahead. Thank you to members that are across the floor that have reached out, that have sent messages. It is humbling, because my personal story is not even unique. It could have been so different and the members here fully understand and I think we are able to see how we are making a dent and how we are making sure that known drug houses are shut down, but also those that are linked to organised crime because the sad reality is the more drugs that are sold, the more the social fabric in our community is eroded, but more importantly, those drug houses and those merchants are ultimately strengthening their own hand in order to do so much more evil in our communities. So let us work together and we see how we are able to do this, even if you want to say it is all your work, I am okay, because if I must choose between a life and a vote, I will always choose to help someone and save a life. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Allen, and congratulations on your time-management – all the speakers up to now.

[Applause.]

The next speaker on the list is hon August. I do not know if he is joining us online. I do not see his name.

Mr S N AUGUST: Hon Chairperson...

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon August.

Mr S N AUGUST: Drug and substance abuse has torn down communities and family structures. The misuse and abuse of these substances are an enabler for crime and a rise in violence that people of this province has come to live with and consider as the norm. Just thinking about gender-based violence, and femicide and how the illegal drug trade further allows these heinous crimes to fester, I am reminded of cases in the past where a five-year-old could easily find a drug house and engage in these illegal activities. The question that comes to mind is why is it difficult for the South African Police Services in turn to find these hotspots and apply the law? We have lost so much as a province to violence and crime and the factor that fuels these statistics is how accessible drugs are both to the young and old.

Chairperson, we are all familiar with the story of a mother who silenced the drug-addicted son, as she could not stand the domestic violence and brutality that reigned in the household. How many more are considering this route? How many people are living in fear for their lives and their possessions that reflect a life of hard work and sacrifice? Our families are broken because of the free-flow of substances, which seems to continue unabated. Social Development, in conjunction with law enforcement agencies should empower communities to stand against the use and abuse of drugs, to empower people and to explore sustainable interventions that will grow the social fabric.

Today, I implore this House to consider an integrated departmental approach, finding solutions that will put an end to the illicit trade, develop a greater social net for communities and make treatment for addiction more accessible through health services. Thank you, Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon August. The next speaker is the hon Christians. I recognise you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Chairperson. Chairperson, the illicit drug trade is a harbinger of death and sacrifice of self, family life, dependency, morality, honesty, and truth on the altar of Mammon. This lucrative trade foisters far-reaching consequences that affect our communities. It sucks in the innocent and holds our communities in a grip of fear. Chairperson, I want to bring this to the House. Just Sunday, one of our counsellors received a call from a mother in Newfields. The mother was crying for help, because there were three drug lords standing in front of her house armed with firearms, saying if she is not going to pay them R1 200 for the debt of her son, then they are going to destroy her house. She called the SAPS. Two hours later, no police, and the joke is the counsellor then phoned Metro Police and they said no, we are going to phone SAPS, so this is the fear that our communities are living in. Now I was asking the question, where is the Safety Plan? Where are our LEAP officers because we do not see it on the ground. I can tell you stories in Manenberg, Hanover Park, Newfields, it happens, day in and day out.

I said in this House in the previous Parliament, I told the story of Ellen Pakkies, I think that is what the member is referring to. I spoke about Ellen Pakkies. There are plays about this. So, this is an old problem, and it cannot be sorted. I have said it over and over again, we cannot spend millions of rands on the LEAP officers. Your Neighbourhood Watches are the solution. There the Minister just said, we know that Neighbourhood Watches, if they are accredited, only get a lousy R10 000 so the same Neighbourhood Watches in Camps Bay get R10 000, the same Neighbourhood Watch in Khayelitsha, Bonteheuwel, gets R10 000. I want the Minister to look at this and to come and give our people that get up at five o'clock in the morning some stipends because they are doing the work, not our LEAP officers.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, thank you, hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I now see the hon Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you. †Mhlali-ngaphambili. Namhlanje sithetha ngombulalizwe, iziyobisi ezibulala ikamva lesizwe sakowethu, ulutsha kunye namasapho. Abazali abaninzi bangxunguphele kuba oonyana neentombi zabo zitshabalala ziziyobisi. Ukanti abanye bade bangamaxhoba okubethwa kwakunye nokubulawa ngabantwana babo ngenxa yalo mbulalizwe.

Amanye amaxhoba eziyobisi aphela edlwengula, abulale, de azibulale kwawona. Iijele zeli lizwe ziyaphuphuma ngamaxhoba alo mbulalizwe. Ukanti nezibhedlele kwakunye namangcwaba azaliswe ngamaxhoba eziyobisi. Mhlali-ngaphambili isicelo sam sesokuba amalungu ale ndlu angafuni ukusebenzisa le ngxoxo yamanhlanje ukuze bakhombana ebusweni okanye bonyelisana. Okubalulekileyo kukubambisana sisebenzisane ukulwa nalo mbulalizwe nokusindisa ulutsha lwesizwe. Intlupheko nentswela-mbeko kwakunye nongqongophalo kwamathuba emisebenzi zidlala indima enkulu ekubeni ulutsha luzinikezele kwiziyobosi. Umthandazo wam kubazali kuquka umphathiswa wesebe lezentlalo ntle apha kweli phondo, abaza nayo nentlungu yokuba nomntana osebenzisa iziyobisi. Urhulumente kumele angenelele adlale indima enkulu ekuthinteleni kunokuba asebenzisa imali eninzi ekunyangeni imiphumelo.

[Translation of isi Xhosa paragraphs follow.]

[Thank you, Speaker. Today I want to speak about a problem that is killing our nation, which is drugs. It is killing the youth as well as their families. Many parents are depressed because their sons and daughters are being destroyed by drugs. Others are victims of abuse from their children because of this drug problem.

Other drug users end up raping, killing and committing suicide. Jails are filled with these drug users. Hospitals and graveyards are filled with these drug users. Speaker, I want to ask the members of this house to not use this

platform today to point fingers at each other and accuse one another. What is important is that we work together to fight this drug problem so that we can save our youth. Poverty, lack of respect, as well lack of jobs play a big part in the youth giving themselves over to drugs. My prayer is that the Minister of Social Services in this province and the parents work together to solve this drug problem. The government needs to intervene and play a bigger role in preventing the problem instead of using lots of money in healing the ramifications.]

†Somlomo, [Speaker] the Department of Social Development at its 2022/2023 Annual Performance Plan acknowledged that drug use, misuse and abuse continue to present challenges to the health, safety and wellbeing of individuals, families and communities in the province. As a result, our district hospitals in the province are battling increased service pressure due to a rise in mental health issues resulting from drugs use, abuse and misuse. Moreover, mothers have been orphaned by drugs as their sons died in ensuing gang turf wars across the province.

Despite the above challenges, it is disappointing that midway through the Sixth Administration, the Western Cape Government Department of Education does not have any, any interdepartmental initiative to deal with the drug crisis and the only thing in place is a Substance Abuse Forum working towards developing a Provincial Drug Master Plan. There can be no justification for this delay in the development of a Drug Master Plan.

In launching the National Drug Master Plan 2019/2024 on 26 June 2020, Minister Lindiwe Zulu said, and I quote:

“The National Drug Master Plan (NDMP) is a blueprint for combating the scourge of alcohol and substance abuse which have reached epidemic proportions in South Africa. The overarching goal of the National Drug Master Plan is to prevent drug use before it starts, early intervention to ensure substance users receive treatment and rehabilitation services and reducing the demand for illicit drugs.”

All other plans will not work until there is a Drug Master Plan in the Western Cape. To stress the importance of this plan I want to cite the work of Justice Edwin Cameron when he said, and I quote:

“Drug use is a social and health issue. It is not a criminal justice issue – and it certainly is not a national security issue. There is no health rationale for invoking criminal law sanctions.”

This is exactly what the National Drug Master Plan seeks to address through its seven goals. The plan stipulates that law enforcement approaches to reduce drug supply in South Africa are moving its focus from mainly arresting the drug users, who constitute more than 80% of drug-related cases currently, to the manufacturers, distributors, and traffickers of drugs. This change necessitates coordination between the criminal justice system and the public health sectors, as well as policy reform to reduce drug supply.

This is the direction that the Western Cape should also adopt. Let us stop...
[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Bakubaku-Vos. You will have to conclude.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Let us stop persecuting the victims and move towards prevention and treatment. We need more funding towards treatment and rehabilitation centres in this province. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you so much.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you. [Time expired.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Bakubaku-Vos. †Die volgende *speaker* gaan ook aanlyn by ons aansluit. Agbare Mitchell, die Minister van Mobiliteit. [The next speaker is also going to join us online. Hon Mitchell, the Minister of Mobility.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you very much, Chairperson. Chairperson, colleagues, hon members. Chair, let me thank my colleague, hon Plato, for the opportunity to take part in this very important debate today and it is a great honour, Chair, to participate in this debate for the first time in my new capacity as the Provincial Minister of Mobility.

Almost two weeks ago, Chair, the Premier announced and made some changes to his Cabinet and gave me the responsibility of giving focused attention to the newly established Ministry of Mobility, which, among others, will be tackling the challenges of an inadequate public transport system that hurts our economy, undermines our safety and prevents the realisation of the dignity our residents deserve.

Also specifically mentioned, Chair, by the Premier in his announcement, was the important role of Provincial Traffic Management, and it is with that in mind that I participate in the debate today.

Chair, the availability and abuse of drugs pose a constant threat to the communities we serve and live in. To fight the scourge of substance abuse that is ravaging our communities, we must acknowledge the importance of working together as society and of coordinating our efforts to restrict the distribution of an access to drugs itself. Chair, while as the Provincial Minister of Mobility, I will limit my comments today to the work that is being done by the Provincial Traffic Services, and I want to place on record my appreciation for the similar supportive activities being undertaken by our municipalities.

Chair, we have to close all the gaps which are exploited by those elements who wish to distribute their very evil products. Our major roads network is regularly patrolled and is subjected to roadblocks and other operations, but it is important to note that drug smugglers try to use rural roads to move drugs

and to position it for distribution and, as a result, we have broadened our reach into the rural roads system.

Chair, the Department of Transport and Public Works implemented a range of innovative initiatives to improve the safety on our roads and in our communities to achieve the long-term vision of zero fatalities and zero serious injuries on our provincial roads. Chair, these initiatives included the improvement of the highway patrol and an interception unit.

Chair, currently work is being done to continue to reshape the Provincial Traffic Service into a modern high tech and hard-hitting force. Improved law enforcement at critical road access points has proven successful in curtailing the movement of illicit goods on the broad transport system and, more specifically, the roads network, and as a result, we now have available monitoring and enforcement technology to enhance and expand the footprint of existing enforcement operations on rural as well as urban roads.

Chair, this includes the Enforce System, an internal system, which enabled the immediate detection of road traffic infringement contraventions and crime including unroadworthy unlicensed and off-route vehicles, cloned number plates, fatigued drivers and vehicles known to be involved in crime.

Chair, these systems are underpinned by the ongoing establishment of the provincial-wide automatic number plate recognition camera network, enabled through partnership with local authorities and Neighbourhood Watch groups

and the use of the Department's own assets. Chair, we have designed and planned for the establishment of a Public Transport Inspectorate as a dedicated unit targeting public transport transgression, such as illegal operations, overloading, unsafe driving and unroadworthy vehicles.

Part of the expansion of the Habitual Offender Project that was rolled out in 2021 is to assess and monitor the driver behaviour of those that are part of the habitual offender listing and to link any fraudulent license plates to criminal activity.

Chair, from 2021 as part of the traffic management continuing improvement, technology is increasingly used to enhance operational effectiveness, improved road safety and to enable a proactive approach to crimes involving vehicles. Chair, a total of 176 patrol motor vehicles were completely fitted with in-vehicle technology and all 540 handheld devices were replaced to enable newly developed applications to function.

Chair, as a result, the capacity for confiscation and arrest of possession of illegal drugs has increased despite the challenges presented by the COVID-19 pandemic. The confiscation and arrest record of Traffic Law Enforcement is very impressive, and I want to place on record my appreciation to all our officers. A total of 27 motorists were arrested for attempting to bribe provincial traffic officers and 33 undocumented foreign nationals were arrested on provincial and national routes in the Western Cape during 2020 and 2021 financial year.

Chair, in conclusion, I am also pleased to report that the Department recorded and amount in excess of R7 million relating to the confiscation and arrest for possession of illegal drugs in the 2021/2022 financial year.

Chair, I want to commend the members of this critically important service for the excellent work that is being done on a daily basis under very challenging and often dangerous circumstances. I thank you.

†Die TYDELIKE VOORSITTER: Baie dankie, agbare Mitchell. Die volgende spreker op die lys is die agbare Marais.

[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Hon Mitchell. The next speaker on the list is the hon Marais.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Good day, Speaker, good day, members. It is nice seeing all of you again. The bigger question all South Africans should face and ask ourselves before we can address drug-related crimes, are: which South Africa do we desire, and what South Africa will our children one day inherit? How does our logic compare with the logic of successful nations throughout the Western world in combating those things we are still struggling with? Can we allow ourselves to travel beyond African failed liberation logic? Does our logic go beyond apartheid solutions? Does it go beyond total state dependency? Does it go beyond get rich schemes and sympathy for law breakers? We even sympathise with those peddling drugs. We blame it on apartheid. Crime is endemic in our country. Can we draft laws to let the Constitution work in favour of responsible law observers and brutal

punishment for those who still rape, murder, deal in drugs and destroy state infrastructure?

When will we stop feeling sorry for criminals? When will we stop police from getting payoffs from criminals, stop Government [Inaudible.] impound police documents on dump heaps, because they got payoffs, so that evidence is destroyed. No one goes to jail for corruption. They live in South Africa to enjoy golf. Criminals will flourish and drug lords will prosper in a paradise created for them by sympathetic liberals and Government corruptors.

†Die TYDELIKE VOORSITTER: Agbare Marais, u tyd is verstreke. Kan u afsluit?

[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Marais, your time has expired. Can you finish off?]

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you. Let us turn towards a federal dispensation for the Western Cape. Let us do it across party political lines and heal this province. That is my solution.

†Die TYDELIKE VOORSITTER: Baie dankie. Die volgende spreker op die lys is die agbare Brinkhuis. Is u gereed om aanlyn in te skakel?

[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. The next speaker on the list is the hon Brinkhuis. Are you ready to link up online?]

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you very much, Speaker. Good afternoon to all

the hon members. Speaker, yes, for years the prominent Anti-Drugs and Gangsterism Movement, PAGAD, People Against Gangsterism and Drugs, reiterated that SAPS officials are aware where the drug peddlers live and from which houses they ply their illicit trade. PAGAD has experienced in the past that police know very well, they know who the drug dealers are, and from which houses they sell drugs.

Hon Speaker, we have a very serious problem with illicit drug trading affecting communities, safety and wellbeing. What we need to root out from the illicit drug trading is a strong and non-corrupt force such as the united front consisting of honest SAPS officials, representatives of all political parties, magistrates, judges, NGOs, organisations, and the representatives of the various religious fraternities. Such a united front with high discipline and moral values must embark on organised action in support of the fight against gangsterism and drugs. The drug dealers and gangsters must be made aware that such a united front is against the evil and harm they cause to communities. The strong message to the drug dealers that they are people in SAPS, in the courts, in the business sectors, politicians, community organisations who are closing all avenues for drug trading.

Lastly, Al Jama-ah believes in a socio-economic response to assist in eradicating poverty, crime, gangsterism and drug-dealing. Thank you very much, Speaker.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you so much, hon Brinkhuis. The

next speaker on the list is the Minister of Health and Wellness, hon Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, Chair. Hon Premier, Cabinet colleagues and members of the Provincial Parliament. Thank you, member Plato for sponsoring this debate, placing focus on the matters which affects every community in our province.

Chair, the Department of Health and Wellness takes pride in preventing and treating disease, and improving well being and quality of life for all our citizens. They perform this task under immense financial pressure, and it often becomes a balancing act of prioritising treatment, which inadvertently leaves some behind, which, with us, and some of them with our hands tied behind our backs. Keep in mind the pressures which the Department is enduring. The health system also remains the universal acceptor, proverbial dumping ground for the outfalls of all socio-econopolitical cultural ills, one of which is the consequences of the illicit drug trade.

Indeed, hon Bakubaku-Vos, we cannot only look at the drugs and the substance abuse only from the lens of the criminal justice system. We have to look at the socio-econopolitical and cultural aspect of it.

Chair, illicit drugs filter through our communities and often the end-users are mostly our adolescents and also our young adults. My children, †*jou kinders, ons kinders*, [your children, our children,] they get caught up in the clutches of the tik, the heroin, the crack, Nyaope, and the numerous other street drugs

having them end up in our healthcare system. Our Hospital and Emergency Centre Tracking Information System, in short abbreviation is HECTIS (spelt), which is HECTIS, does indicate that we have a significant increase in mental health presentations of non-organic psychosis and mental health behavioural disorders relating to substance abuse. Non-organic, it means that people are not necessarily mentally ill. There is nothing wrong in regard to the chemical or clinical balance within their brains, but it is because of the substance abuse.

In 2021 alone, we admitted about 3398 such patients in the Metro and just in the first two months of the 2022 we have already admitted almost 824 cases. 554 more cases for the same period last year. These are the patients who are admitted to our 72-hour observation units at our hospital for psychiatry, assessment and treatment. Of course, some of them they ended up being referred to the specialised mental services, but the majority of them have to be released because they are not necessarily mentally ill. It is about the psychosis as a result of the substance abuse.

Chair, the treatment of substance related health disorders does not only stop at our 72-hour observation units, often these patients become long term mental healthcare users that need to be absorbed into our healthcare programs. This phenomenon is a call echoed in the 2021 Annual Report of our Mental Health Review Board, where they pertinently state that substance abuse either contributes to the symptoms of mental healthcare users, or is found to be the cause of mental health disorders.

Just to explain further, Chair, it is about whilst they come as the people presenting with a mental disorder because of substance abuse, if now they keep on being addicted, they ended up having another diagnosis of a cocktail of the mental disorders, called substance disorders. The treatment of this completely preventable disease comes at a huge cost, so much that during this year, you may recall that I did make an announcement that we are adding R30 million for this financial year in regard to mental health. The meant money spent on preventable mental health disorders could have been used for other corrective or preventive services, but because these patients are in crisis, we are compelled to treat them.

Chair, in short, what this means is that the ordinary Auntie Sarah will have to wait longer for her knee replacement now because the young men – most of them are the men [Inaudible.] out there, taking. The deserving community will continue to wait for the new clinic because most of the sum of our young people of that same community are using drugs because of these socio-econocultural ills that I have mentioned.

The problem of this illicit drug trade is huge, and does not only affect the health system, but it affects all sectors. Therefore, as a single Department or even a sphere of government we will never be able to combat this social ill. In terms of the Substance Abuse Prevention and Treatment Act of 2008, it does expect all departments and all governments, civil society and all stakeholders to develop and implement comprehensive inter-sectoral strategies aimed at reducing the demand and also any harm caused by the

substance abuse.

Chair, what are we doing in the Department, in as much as Health is not the custodian of that act, it is Social Development; we have established ACE, which is the Adolescent Centre of Excellence through the Red Cross and Groote Schuur and UCT, where adolescents, as we know that they are the ones, they make up a quarter of the population and in South Africa, as part of Sub-Saharan Africa, have one of the worst health profiles for adolescents. Because it is the time of confusion, it is the time of identity crisis, it is also the time of peer pressure, that is why it is crucial for this ACE. However, the crown jewel in our treatment basket is the Opiate Detoxification Unit at the Stikland Hospital and it also – to mention, Chair, that detox – not all people who are addicted to drugs, need a detox, but all people who are addicted to the drugs need rehabilitation. So, in most instances, what needs medical interventions when it comes to detox are the opiates, for example, the heroin, but some of the drugs like Tik, they are most psychosocial, their withdrawal is not as much as the same as with opioids. We have a dedicated 10-bed unit to assist users safely through their detox period and also supporting them on their journey to recovery. Again, when you are part of detox, you are supposed to be also part of the rehab, meaning starting from the beginning, for starting with the rehab, they come in having a detox, again back to the rehab. So it is a whole complex kind of situation where we have to make sure that we do not leave any stone unturned when it comes to responding to substance abuse.

Chair, this is not enough as the bed occupancy of this unit always exceeds 100% and we have treated more than 550 patients during this past year. 550 patients collectively are more patients than we can fit in a day even in our Khayelitsha Hospital.

In conclusion, Chair, the Department of Health and Wellness is experiencing added avoidable pressure related to this illicit drug trade in the province. This comes at a high cost, which we must absorb and it drops our community from receiving this healthcare which they deserve.

Hence, I do support the calls of making sure we apply the whole of society approach, not only the Government, the civil society, all other departments, everyone where we are supposed to be looking at this scourge that is affecting our communities.

I would not even mind to take the members to see for themselves in some of our ECs, because it is most of the ECs. So, when people come with trauma, with emergencies, with violence, interpersonal violence, they need to understand that we have also some of these patients who are there for observation in this regard.

As a government we will never be able to stop this trade alone, but as a society we should stand together to abolish the demand for the illicit drugs. We should not leave our children behind. Thank you, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, thank you, hon member Mbombo. Can you just allow, or would you allow the hon member Makamba-Botya, she has now joined us, to take the next slot, and then you will be thereafter. Thank you, hon member Makamba-Botya is joining us online.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you very much, hon Chair, and my apologies for this.

Hon Chair, a study of 2019 from the University of Cape Town estimated a gang membership in the Western Cape to be more than 1 000. This number must have increased by now in the year of 2022. The majority of these gangs happen to be concentrated within the City of Cape Town. The main source of income to sustain these gangs comes from trading in illegal drugs, such as Tik, heroin and nyaope, to name a few.

Hon Chair, the drug trade involving these substances does not operate in abstract. It affects the social fibre of communities we live in. It affects the young, the community at large, the economy, the well-being and the health of our people, as well as putting pressure in the health system.

A fight against illicit drug trade requires a determined government which is able to orchestrate society in a certain manner. It requires each and every Government department to play a leading role within their respective areas in assisting society to get rid of this social ill.

The Department of Safety must make sure that those that use and trade illicit drugs are put behind bars, but the Department must not only be one-sided and reactive in its approach. It must also partner with the Departments of Health and Social Development in an endeavour to partake in proactive initiatives such as road shows and other interventionist mechanisms, aimed at rehabilitation. Provincial Treasury makes funds available for such initiatives because prevention is always better than cure.

Chair, moreover, although [Inaudible.] plays an important role in the fight against illicit drug trade in society, at times it does not always produce the intended results associated with the rehabilitation. A huge number of young people are often caught up in the criminal justice system, and end up in jail where they are further inducted to these prison gangs. Later on, the same people leave prison as adults, only to form their own communities outside the prison walls, and the whole thing becomes just a non-ending vicious circle that leads society into a terrain of chaos.

Another issue, Chair, which also cannot be avoided, is that high unemployment rate also leads to young people participating in gangs and trading in illicit drugs. The Government has a duty to create employment so that people can be able to sustain themselves. If the Government gets the crucial part wrong, then it will pay a heavy price of having to fund the Departments of Safety for gang-related turf wars; Social Development for non-ending rehabilitation efforts [Inaudible.] within in its [Inaudible.] associated with drug use, and rehabilitation, and the list goes on, and it is

just a never-ending downward spiral. I thank you, Chairperson, thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Good. Thank you, hon member Makamba-Botya, and now I recognise the hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, Chair. Let me also welcome the debate today and perhaps maybe appreciate the manner in which hon member Dan Plato introduced the debate as I was worried with the manner in which it was phrased that we must come here and discuss the impact of illicit drug trade as if we do not know. We are tired of discussing things that we know and repeating what we know in this House, but just like hon member Bans and hon member Cameron did, we are really hungry to discuss solutions and not the impact which we know, like the address from Health that we just received.

Now let me, Chair, also welcome the input by the MEC. You know when the MEC speaks from the heart you really see the good man in him and the leader that wants to lead, but once he takes the paper and reads what the research unit of the DA has written for him, you lose him. You lose that good leader that is in him.

I think, hon House Chair, the research study by Komysa Hassan on the politicisation of crime and its impact on the relationship between law enforcement and the public, found that it undermines the core objective of law enforcement, public safety and negatively impacts institutional goals and

mindset. The implications of which reach beyond the police to society at large. In this regard we must call out the DA for its continued use of crime as a political tool to further its narrow political gains, joined by the FF Plus today.

In its latest attempts the DA, and as mentioned by the MEC, asked the Western Cape Police Ombudsman to investigate SAPS' alleged failure to close drug houses in the province. This is very pathetic and uncalled for. The Western Cape must use its resources to improve safety and not to target SAPS. Use LEAP officers and the K9 units to combat drug trade and not target SAPS. Why are you not asking the Ombud to probe the effective deployment of K9 units in municipalities that are inland, and not in the entry points to the province like Beaufort West. Where is the logic in that? Why do you only want to use the K9 units when the drugs have already reached the communities?

In executing the DA mandate, the Ombud has since called on communities to assist in identifying [Inaudible]. The DA in the province does not only value the important role of communities in the fight against crime, communities have been totally isolated from crime-fighting by the Provincial Government. This includes the continuing undermining and underfunding of CPFs with a clear intent to weaken and collapse them, and we hope the mention of the CPFs by the current MEC now will lead to a direction where the Department really reconsiders its decision to underfund CPFs, because some CPFs are not even funded.

The role of CPFs in society is to promote relations between the police and communities, and in turn communities play a vital role in helping police to fight crime. The DA deliberately isolated communities and as a result with a trust deficit between SAPS and communities. This is one of the issues we will discuss in the meeting that hon member Dougmore has mentioned, with the Provincial Commissioner, which we hope to be next week.

Hon House Chair, a wise man once said, and I quote:

“Shallow thinkers are those who are incapable and sometimes too lazy to look at all sides of an issue, or to explore the issues deeply before making judgment or decision.”

Today what we experienced here in the House are members on the other side who have this problem. The DA’s understanding and approach to address drugs and gangsterism is a result of shallow thinking.

Research by global initiative against transitional organised crime showed that, and I quote:

“South Africa is home to the largest and most established meth consumption market in East and Southern Africa, and that the substance is the most common drug of choice in the Western Cape and Eastern Cape. The South African meth is sourced from three major supply chains, including the Nigeria syndicate; locally manufactured meth

linked to the Chinese syndicate, which originates from Johannesburg; and the third stream originates from the Afghanistan/Pakistan border region.”

This has highlighted the need for intergovernmental, inter-regional and continental approach to combat the illicit drug trade. Instead of openly targeting SAPS, the Provincial Government must foster intergovernmental relations and support SAPS in efforts to combat crime.

They must address challenges to address the deployment of K9 units into the entry points of the province, and as we conclude, we really feel sorry for hon member Christians. We agree with everything he has said, but he must know when he jumps to support a budget of the DA that continues to waste resources on the LEAP officers, this is what you are going to get.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Thank you.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIR: Thank you, hon member Kama. [Applause]

†Baie dankie, agb lid Plato, u geleentheid vir repliek. [Thank you, hon member Plato, your opportunity for reply.]

Mr D PLATO: Thank you very much, hon Chairperson. I first want to thank

the House, all the parties in this House for their support for this debate this afternoon. Also for the input, the positiveness of the input. I nearly thought hon member Kama is going a little bit off track with some of his political inspired comments and that sort of thing, but I know where he is coming from, but I also want to caution the hon member no State department like Social Development or Community Safety will be able to stop this scourge on its own. It must be a collective, holistical kind of an approach, and there is one entity, I am not criticising the hon member, but the entity to arrest, Metro Police cannot investigate; LEAP cannot investigate. Unfortunately, the only entity to do that is SAPS. They can take the matter to court. Metro Police must hand over to the police and that sort of thing, and that is where the problem lies, and I listened carefully to what was said with regard to the syndicates.

Why are the syndicates operating in the country? What are our intelligence forces doing about that? But what is SARS also doing about that, but also what is SARS doing about the South African-based syndicates in this country, and can SARS track them down with regard to the riches? Are their monies stashed in a bank account? The answer is “no”, but it is somewhere, but they live in the Plattekloufs and in the Constantias and wherever, and they do not work. Their income is the drug trade, and we are not, we love SAPS, we are not criticising the police. We are saying collectively not only SAPS alone, but even us, and I made a point of it to say we all we must do more.

That is why I appreciate the input. I also appreciate the input of hon member

Brinkhuis; the input of hon member Bakubaku-Vos with regard to the Master Plan. We note that important input, but that is the issue, and my hon colleague, the new Minister for Community Safety, whispers in my ear just to make a point of it, I must not miss that point, the issue with regard to the Drug Master Plan.

So we note even what the Opposition are saying, and I see it as a collective effort by the Opposition because we must realise anyone standing in the way of these top guns in the underworld, and in the drug trade business, if you are standing in their way, what are they doing? They just kill you.

How many children killed in our communities, all the bullets in Manenberg and all the other areas on the Cape Flats, they do not care a damn. Anyone standing in the way they take them out, but let me further say to you in conclusion, hon Chairperson, that the Department of Social Development offers a range of measures which provide assistance for those who wish to escape patterns of substance abuse; that must be ongoing. These programmes are specifically focused on those who make use of the Department's homeless and GBV shelters, and I am very glad, I am not going to say much more about GBV. I think many of the speakers addressed that issue as well.

Hon Chairperson, no one department, and we have said it already, can solve the epidemic of drug addiction, but the Department of Social Development does absolutely everything in its power with all the other departments – Education and Health and who else, even Sport, Art and Culture with their

programmes – to mitigate the damage done by the illicit drug trade. Thank you so much for this debate, hon Chairperson, and God bless.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Plato. Hon members, that concludes this debate on the subject. We now move on to the next item on the agenda. We will now deal with Questions for Oral Reply as printed on the Question Paper. Chief Whip, I recognise you.

The CHIEF WHIP [DA]: Thank you, hon Chairperson. Just for the House to note that new oral Question 1 to Minister Schäfer will stand over, and Question 4 to Minister Meyer has been withdrawn.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, noted. Hon members, I wish to advise that once the hon Minister has started the reply to the oral question as printed on the Question Paper, hon members must use the chat facility for the sitting in the House to indicate that they want a follow-up a question.

There are four opportunities for follow-up questions, but the hon member who has posed the initial oral question as printed on the Question Paper, will have the first opportunity for a follow-up question. Thereafter other hon members may then use the remaining opportunities to ask a follow-up question. I now recognise the Minister for Mobility.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Questions standing over from Thursday 7 April 2022, as agreed to by the House:

Latest taxi violence in townships: cause of

1. Mr M Xego asked the Minister of Mobility:

(a) What is the cause of the latest taxi violence in townships such as Nyanga and (b) what are his plans to bring such instability to an end?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you very much, Chairperson, and thank you very much to the hon member for the question.

Part (a) of the question, Chair, but before I focus on the most recent incidents of taxi violence in Nyanga I need to make a few general remarks about the conflict and the instability within the minibus taxi environment.

Hon Chair, it is well-documented the main reason for conflict and instability in the minibus taxi industry is overtrading of illegal operators. This was confirmed by the Ntsebeza Commission of Inquiry in the Western Cape. Overtrading leads to aggressive competition for passengers; regression in vehicle standards; route invasion; violence, and ultimately the loss of lives.

Hon Chair, the indiscriminate recruitment of new members in excess of passenger demand, exacerbates the overtrading problem, but notwithstanding

new residential and commercial developments, the City of Cape Town has reported that some 70% of existing minibus taxi routes are overtraded in respect of legal vehicles. Despite this, associations and so-called “mother bodies” continue to undertake recruitment drives to attract new members. These new members are charged membership fees well in excess of the legislated amount, and they are given permission to operate on the route of the association without the required operating licenses.

We have on many occasions cautioned the industry leadership not to recruit new members in excess of passenger demand given that this results in a supply-driven transport system. We have also cautioned them not to create a parallel regulatory system. This is a vicious cycle where industry leaders are killed because they cannot deliver on promises made to these new recruits about operating licenses.

What is happening in Nyanga is a microcosm of this general problem. Whenever the City of Cape Town does routine law enforcement operations in the greater Nyanga area, and vehicles are impounded for operating illegally, or contrary to the terms and conditions of operating licenses, the taxi industry in this area responds in a violent manner.

We have received reports that these violent actions are perpetuated by the largely unregulated Amapelas Taxi Industry that operates under the auspices of a mother body. The most recent events are not isolated. There is a history of this type of criminal behaviour in the Nyanga area. As part of these violent

protests actions, Golden Arrow buses and other commercial vehicles have been torched; infrastructure has been damaged, and other public transport operators have been threatened and intimidated.

These illicit actions have left many commuters stranded and disrupted travel patterns. These actions, hon Chair, simply cannot go unchallenged. I have to point out for the report that the City of Cape Town, in partnership with my Department, has made a concerted effort to regulate and legalise the Amapela industry that mainly operates in the greater Nyanga area.

As part of this project, agreement was reached on a number of operating licenses needed to cater for the passenger demand, but sadly, hon Chair, many of these operating licenses were never uplifted because operators could not present roadworthy vehicles and could not meet some of the other requirements.

Infighting within a mother body and gatekeeping to decide who gets to be on the list submitted to the City of Cape Town, also contributed towards derailing this and the previous projects.

Hon Chair, I am informed that the City of Cape Town has indicated that they support 1 431 new applications for minibus taxi operating licenses as part of a special regulatory process. Furthermore over 533 proposed new taxi routes, as requested by the taxi associations, have been published in the *Government Gazette* as part of a public participation process.

Hon Chair, once these routes are approved in the prescribed manner, more new applications will be supported. Government therefore made a concerted effort to balance minibus taxi supply and demand, and there can be no justification for this type of violent behaviour from the taxi industry.

Hon Chair, law enforcement agencies have a mandate to enforce the law and to ensure a safe and dignified environment for public transport and other road users. The law is enforced consistently across the board, and these enforcement initiatives are not unique to the Nyanga area, and this type of violent response will not be tolerated.

Hon Chair, I want to move on to part (b) of the question. Hon Chair, since my appointment I have always made myself available to meet with industry leaders regarding critical challenges facing the minibus taxi industry, and to come up with workable solutions.

Hon Chair, this includes my meeting with the recently elected new leadership of SANTACO. I have also engaged municipalities on the industry's behalf to expedite regulatory processes as part of my duty to improve the planning, coordination and facilitation of land transport in the province. Hon Chairperson, but I am, however, not prepared to enter into discussions under circumstances of violence and threats. These violent actions will not go unchallenged and unpunished.

Hon Chair, to stabilise the situation I could have declared the Nyanga

residential area as a high risk in respect of taxi violence. This would have allowed me to invoke my powers in terms of Section 91 of the National Land Transport Act, and if the situation deteriorated any further, I could have consulted with the City of Cape Town to close certain routes and ranks in the area.

A transport contingency plan would then have to be developed and implemented to provide alternative transport solutions during this extraordinary period, if needed to be. Within the regulatory space, hon Chair, I have used the empowering legislation to ensure that offending associations and members are held accountable for their actions. The office of the Provincial Taxi Registrar has already sent out letters to all the affected associations to appear before a panel of assessors, and to answer the charges ranging from violation of the code of conduct, to non-compliance with operating license conditions.

Hon Chair, we have also requested that the South African Police Services prioritise the criminal investigation, and to dedicate adequate resources thereto. We will respond with sustained and integrated law enforcement initiatives to ensure that the safety of passengers, residents and other public transport operators and road users will not be compromised. The enforcement of law is a non-negotiable. Thank you, hon Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Minister.

Hon members, by mutual agreement between hon member Xego and hon member Makamba-Botya, the latter will be asking the follow-up question. Thank you.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you very much, hon Chairperson. Thanks to the Minister.

My question is, it is with regard to the march by the taxi owners on 24 March 2022, to the Provincial Legislature. One of their demands, hon Chairperson, was that the Government should release the taxis that were impounded, and which are said to be operating illegally in the contested B97 route between [Inaudible] and Bellville, which was previously suspended for purposes of the taxis.

So I want to know from the Minister, and I also want to know what is the latest development on that route? Where will the suspension for taxis be lifted? And what is the latest with regards to engagements regarding all the stakeholders which are involved in this matter? Thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Makamba-Botya. Over to you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you very much, hon Chairperson, and thank you very much for the question.

Hon Chair, there were two questions instead of one, but let me address that. I want to on record state that if any operator operates outside of the operating license requirements, that vehicle will be impounded. I have just given a detailed response on the reasons why, and I want to on record state that we will not tolerate any illegal behaviour on the roads, or on our routes, because we work with municipalities ...

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister, your sound has disappeared.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Apologies, can you hear me now?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You are back on, thank you.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Alright, yes. From a regulatory and law enforcement perspective we, and as Government we will not tolerate any illegal behaviour on our roads, and we have, I have made it categorically clear to the industry, and which most of the industry agrees that we need to ...

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister, your sound again disappeared.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: My apologies, hon Chair, can you hear me now?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, you are back on.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you very much. With regards to B97. The route is still closed until 26 May, and I have not yet applied my mind pending 26 May. Thank you, hon Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Good. Thank you, hon Minister. I recognise the following three members in the following order: hon member America, hon member Mvimbi and then the hon member Marais. Hon member America?

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, hon Chair. Hon Minister, thank you for your response to the question. Can you share with the House, according to your knowledge, were arrests effected by the South African Police Services following the violence at the Nyanga taxi rank? Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: [Inaudible]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you very much for that question.

Hon Chair, I am not a hundred percent sure if there have been arrests, but I know that the South African Police Services has been investigating, but I think it is important to also note at this point, that although there might be arrests, the real concern is conviction rates after the arrests.

So with the indulgence of the hon member, we will get that information, and I will put that in writing to the House.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Chairperson. Can you hear me?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Loud and clear.

Mr MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Chairperson, and thank you very much to the Minister.

I just want to check with the Minister whether with regard to the recent meeting that was held between SANTACO, CATA and CODETA, whether he and his Department played any role, or were they involved in facilitating the meeting? If not, why not? If so, what was the level of involvement, and how will he ensure that the peace and cooperation that this organisation committed to, are not broken?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you very much, hon Chairperson.

Hon Chair, that is a new question, but in the interest of the question and the interest of the House, a week prior to that, or a couple of days before that

engagement, I engaged the newly elected leadership of SANTACO. SANTACO being the body that Government works with. The associations are members of SANTACO, and the facilitation, or the meeting between the two so-called mother bodies, CATA and CODETA, was not facilitated by my office, and it was an initiative between the two associations. Thank you, hon Chair.

†Die TYDELIKE VOORSITTER: Agb lid Marais, u opvolgvraag?

[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Marais, your follow-up question?]

†Mnr P J MARAIS: Baie dankie, agb Voorsitter.

[Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Chair.]

†Ek dink dat die *taxi violence* is nou al holrug gery. Ek is nou moeg van hoor ons het 'n onbevoegde regering wat bang is vir die taxi-base. Elke keer kom ons hier en ons hoor dieselfde storie van taxi's wat mense seermaak; daar is verkragting in taxi's; hulle baklei oor roetes. Ek wil weet wat is die langtermynplan?

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[I think that the taxi violence has been exhausted. I am tired of hearing that we have an incompetent Government that is afraid of the taxi bosses. Every time we come here and we hear the same story of taxi's injuring people; there are rapes in taxis; they fight over routes. I want to know what is the long term plan?]

The people that are in fear? Should there not be a Bill of Rights for behaviour of taxis, and that Bill of Rights accepted by this House, must be pasted in every taxi with a hotline number for people to report transgressions, or if they feel unsafe, and licenses are withdrawn.

We are acting like a government that is in the clutches of taxi bosses, and too fearful to act. Can the Minister tell me, will such a proposal be acceptable? And if not, why not? To stop this scourge of taxi violence between taxi operators?

†Die TYDELIKE VOORSITTER: Baie dankie. Agb Minister?

[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Hon Minister?]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you very much to the hon member Marais for that question, and I could not agree with him more.

The reality is that as government we need to facilitate a safe and reliable public transport service. The taxi industry, being one of the modes of public transport that is available or should be available to citizens.

The problem that Government has, or that I have, is that my powers are only limited to the regulatory aspect thereof. Notwithstanding the fact that we have a close working relationship with the law enforcement agencies and the South African Police Services to try and address that, but absolutely I could not agree more with hon member Marais, that – I mean public transport, and

in particular the taxi industry, cannot be a crime scene and the rights of other people violated because of invasion of routes, or because operators cannot agree on routes and the over-subscribing of membership in mother bodies, but I take note of that very valid input. Thank you, hon Chairperson.

†Die TYDELIKE VOORSITTER: Baie dankie,

[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you,] thank you very much, hon Minister.

The next question was put to Minister Simmers.

Arcadia Place informal settlement: relocation

3. Ms M Makamba-Botya asked the Minister of Infrastructure:

Whether there are plans to relocate people staying in an informal settlement outside what was formally known as Arcadia Place in Observatory to a more suitable land; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you very much, House Chairperson. Through you to the hon member.

Firstly, thank you for the question hon member Makamba-Botya, but your question was sent to the City of Cape Town as they are the responsible sphere

of government and I will now read the responses I received from them.

“The City has now informal settlement, as per definition, located in Observatory. However, there are several vagrants or displaced people who erected temporary shelters or tents on the pavements, in public parks and next to buildings. The City's Displaced People's Unit has recorded approximately 36 such temporary structures across Observatory. There are spaces available in the City's safe spaces and in various shelters for occupants, but they are accommodated on a voluntary basis.”

Thank you, House Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Hon member Makamba-Botya, do you want to pose a follow-up question?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Chairperson, I think I am covered partly, thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, I recognise hon member Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Thank, hon Chairperson, and good afternoon to you, everyone present.

Hon Chair, through you to the [Inaudible] the MEC of Infrastructure, and we have also now been told that the question has been referred to the City of Cape Town. I just wanted to check with the MEC in referring this question to the [Inaudible] whether they have checked with the City of Cape Town, what basic services have been provided to those people; for how long they have been staying there, and whether basic services have been provided to them.

So I just want to check with the MEC whether he have taken it up or checked with the City of Cape Town, whether those people have been sorted with water and sanitation. Thanks.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Marran. Over to you, hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you very much, House Chairperson.

As much as I perceive that to be a new question, I wish to reiterate what hon member Makamba-Botya's question to me was and accordingly, as such, what I forwarded to the City. The hon member's question was whether there are plans to relocate people staying in an informal settlement outside what was formerly known as Arcadia, placed in Observatory, to a more suitable land. If not, why not? If so, what are the relevant details?

So as such, the City has responded accordingly, and if the hon member can

put his question in writing, I will ascertain the response from him. The same way I have done to the hon member Makamba-Botya. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Hon member Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, House Chair. Hon Chair, I just want to ask the Minister, for this financial year, Minister, how many informal settlements is the Department supporting and in general, what are the community dynamics that the Department faces or the municipalities face when the relocation processes are in place?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Maseko. Hon members, just a reminder that follow-up questions should follow-up onto the previous question, as well as to the Minister's response. Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, House Chairperson. The hon member refers to the plans in terms of informal settlements which relate directly to hon member Makamba-Botya's question, so I can respond to her question.

Hon member, the upgrading of informal settlements continues to be a priority for the province. As stated when I tabled my budget on 30 March. Now we have identified 50 informal settlements for a variety of upgrading interventions, of which 33 of them, hon House Chair, will see over 66 532

households benefiting from this targeted approach by our Department.

Obviously, this will be funded through the Informal Settlements Upgrading Partnership Grant, or the ISUPG grant. I can say to hon House Chairperson, through you to the member, that 99,47% of that specific grant will be used on phase 2 and 3 of informal settlement upgrading.

Obviously, part of the plan is premised that, and I think this House needs to take note, hon House Chairperson, that since 2016 the Western Cape Government households have always enjoyed the highest rate of access to basic services, compared to any other province, and also declared by the national averages.

Currently, hon member, our province has 958 informal settlements; 527 of those fall within the City of Cape Town region by definition of what an informal settlement is. The remaining 451 settlements are across the province. We have assessed them; we have categorised them; we have ranked them, and we have also prioritised per municipality, hon House Chairperson, through you to the member, exactly what needs to be done at those informal settlements because we do have an existing departmental informal settlement database, but obviously part of our plan will now shift to see if we cannot find innovative ways to address the issue of informality across the province.

Two of these options which we have conceptualised, and there are actually four, but two of the four we have engaged the national Department on and

they are quite amicable to our solution moving forward. This [Inaudible] focus on incremental housing as a possible solution in terms of informal settlements, but also to address the ever-growing housing backlog across the Western Cape, and this is premised on developing a 40 square metre wet core, like we do in the Western Cape, hon House Chair, but the difference now is we will also [Inaudible] 20 square metre stop structure, and the remainder obviously the qualifying beneficiary can then develop at their own ease, because there will be a pre-approved plan provided with that specific structure, and also title deed transfer will be done to that specific qualifying beneficiary, but what further improves the dignity of our people, hon House Chair, is that this House, or the 20 square metre component, will have a bathroom with a toilet. There will be a wash trough inside the structure. Also, a multipurpose concrete floor [Inaudible]. Ultimately the integrity of the structure is of such quality that they can actually build a multi-storey structure. Thank you, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Good, thank you, and then the last – thank you, hon member Marran, no interjections, thank you. Thank you, no interjections.

The next question belongs then again to hon member Makamba-Botya, who wants to put another follow-up question.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Chair, thank you very much. I just want to know from the Minister, I am satisfied with the answer, but I want to know if

there are any timelines attached to this location of these people. Thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Over to you, hon Minister. Hon Makamba-Botya, would you not just repeat that question? It was about the timelines, for your response [Inaudible]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Okay, my question is with regards to the response from the Minister. I want to know if there are any timelines attached with regard to the relocation of these homeless people? Thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister, you were able to hear the question now? Thank you. Please proceed.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you very much, hon House Chair, and thank you to the hon member for the question.

Once again, hon member, in my original response, as indicated, you know, there are spaces available in the City, safe spaces, and there are various shelters, which ultimately these 36 individuals that have been identified in Observatory can actually gain access to – but remember it is on a voluntary basis, so it is up to them. Thank you, hon House Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon member

Christians asked the hon member Allen. Over to you, Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety.

New questions

Oxford Village: Kuils River

1. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety:

Whether his Department has implemented any measures to safeguard the community of Oxford Village in Kuils River that is experiencing high levels of burglaries, hijackings and robberies; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
Thank you so much, hon member Christians, for this particular question; together with an engagement that hon member Makamba-Botya entered into with the community of Oxford Village.

In terms of the question that was posed, the Oxford Village in Kuils River falls under the Mfuleni Police Station precinct. The Department liaised with the South African Police Services and the Mfuleni Police Station management regarding the safety and security issues within the area.

The SAPS management confirmed the challenges experienced in the area, and the Department informed SAPS management to increase police visibility through sector policing and conduct Crime Prevention Awareness Programmes in the Oxford Village and surrounding areas. The nature of the challenge in the area emphasises the need for active community engagements in an attempt to increase safety.

A meeting was held with representatives of the Oxford Village residents where the residents were encouraged to revive their Neighbourhood Watch structure in order to patrol in the area, but I am also aware that in terms of the dynamics and when I became aware of the media article, I was aware that crime even happened after the Neighbourhood Watch stopped patrolling because the residents had to go back home at 11, because they are working the next day.

So this is a vital issue that I am definitely engaging, and I want to commend officials within the Department, that if even prior to my appointment already engaged the particular community, and I do know that in terms of the one group within that area that is advocating for this particular gate, and another group that is advocating not to have the group, which is a dynamic that we all understand, and that I am looking forward to engaging further, but we have been active in this regard. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Follow-up, hon member Christians, and then hon member Mackenzie, and then hon member Kama.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Chairperson. Thank you for the Minister for that question.

Now this community has high crime levels, as the Minister said. So, what the community did, as you mentioned, put up a gate and that brought the crime completely down, and they have tried to engage the Mayor, Geordin Hill-Lewis, with no avail. Then the ward councillor, “Let us get involved with the Department of Police Oversight and Community Safety.”

My question is what difference does that have, that gate there, and a boom at Llandudno? Because Llandudno also have access control, [inaudible] gate here. It is manned, nobody is denied access, it is safe for communities.

So, what is the difference between Llandudno and this gate? Why can we not, the City is now going to take legal action if the gate is not removed. So now they must take the gate down because otherwise there is legal action. Our communities are saying, “Listen, we are safer with the gate. It is not that we are denying people coming in, but we are not safe.”

So I am glad for that, and they say the Neighbourhood Watch is not going to work because of people working the next day, as you said. So, hon Minister, what is the difference? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
Thank you so much. In terms of the City of Cape Town and their engagement

and the extent that the officials within the Department went to in terms of wanting to engage the local councillor, as well as the Directorate in terms of the City of Cape Town and the SAPS management; I have received an update in this regard, and in terms of the policy, subsequent to the meeting that was held between officials and the community, the City and the local councillor, the City of Cape Town gated development policy, the Oxford Village complex did not comply with the requirements of this particular policy, and then the second point is that the policy placements of security huts on City of Cape Town-owned land, which is an alternative to the City of Cape Town gated development policy, was put on the table as an alternative by Mr Du Toit from the City of Cape Town, and the residents did not accept that alternative option of the security hut at this particular complex, and subsequently then the City of Cape Town issued a further notice for the gate to be removed.

I am waiting for a further update from the City of Cape Town in order to see this be dealt with in a practical way, and to encourage the residents even to see how that option can be entertained that the City put on the table, and then I want to further state that in terms of the consultation with the SAPS management, together with the councillor and the City of Cape Town, that is ongoing. So we are wanting to engage, but the option of putting the hut on City of Cape Town land, that option was put to the residents, but the dynamic, like I have stated in my initial answer, is that we have a portion of the community that is wanting the gate, and we have another portion of the community that is not wanting to have the gate, that is roughly about 150

properties within that particular area. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. There is somebody online that is not muted, please mute yourself. Please mute yourself. Can the officials please mute everybody? Thank you, hon members. The next person for a follow-up question is the hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon House Chairperson. Hon Chairperson, I just wanted to find out from our MEC if he visited that area, particularly the Mfuleni Police Station, and what was the outcomes of this visit? Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Mackenzie. I am not sure if the Minister could hear you. Would you not just repeat that question?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Chairperson. I just want to find out if the Minister visited that area, and the Mfuleni Police Station, and can he perhaps share with us what the outcome of that visit was? Can hear me, hon Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Minister [Inaudible]

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:
Thank you so much, hon member Mackenzie.

You actually reminded me in terms of the question ... you actually reminded me now, hon member Mackenzie, through you, hon House Chairperson, hon member Mackenzie reminded me of my visit to Mfuleni which happened actually on 11 April this year, prior to my appointment, and I visited Mfuleni for one specific reason, due to the extra amount of residents that are in that particular precinct, from Mfuleni all the way to Drift Sands.

So in terms of the population and the SAPS ratio, it was a concern to me based on a parliamentary reply, and I vividly remember 583 SAPS to population ratio for the Mfuleni precinct, which is higher than the provincial average, but also more concerning of that visit which was particularly interesting because my information that I received from the acting station commander and from speaking to members of the South African Police Services, is that the station is still on a colonel level. Despite the huge population that that particular station is now having to safeguard, but more concerning was that a parliamentary reply to me revealed that it had a zero percent vacancy rate.

However, I received documentation that it is actually more than 14% vacancy rate at that particular station, with 21 priority positions that have been forwarded to SAPS, but it has not yet been filled, and that is part of my engagement to see how we can engage the South African Police Services.

So, yes, hon member Mackenzie, I have visited Mfuleni even before my appointment in order to see how we can better strengthen the hand of the

South African Police Services, to work alongside the South African Police Services, because there are so many women and men in blue that are committing their lives, that are doing the jobs of three, four, five, six people all on their own. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Minister. The next question is that of hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon House Chair, and thanks to the Minister for the responses that have been provided so far. Hon House Chair, the reality is that these crimes, which can be considered as less dangerous, have a potential to even lead to murders.

Now what I want to understand, because the Safety Plan really in practice only talks about the LEAP officers. Now I want to check with the commitment that the Chair, at the point when he was the Chair, was making that there are going to be additional training and deployment that are going to be made.

I therefore then want to understand as to how will this assist in terms of responding to such instances and not only like following the crime? And if there are these, if we are really going to continue with the training of more officers, what are the relevant details around that? Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Kama. Over to

you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

Thank you so much, hon member Kama.

I have actually signed off my very first parliamentary reply. So you will be getting that parliamentary reply based on the question that you just posed now, and because you being a first, I do want to further entertain this question now, to state that in terms of the priority areas that were identified, the hotspot areas based on the crime stats; areas of concern, LEAP deployments are in those areas, and what I find particularly interesting is that we are able to zoom into a street, into a particular area, where we know where crime is happening because we have forensic information, we have ambulance information, we have information that is being forwarded via community groups, etcetera, in order to stop crime before it happens.

With the Oxford area, for example, it forms part of the Sector 3 of the Mfuleni precinct, in an environment where they should have roughly 500 members and be on a brigadier station. They are in a colonel station of 250 odd. The current person is currently on leave, and I want to say that because SAPS even needs leave. The current member, sector manager for that particular sector, is currently on leave, and I commend the SAPS members because they deserve leave in an environment where they are overworked, and as soon as that person comes back, because there is no one else to fill in, there is no one else to fill in in order to make sure that visible policing is

happening, but also to see that how communities can foster the trust within the South African Police Services, and I want to make this commitment. We should go to Mfuleni, and via you, hon House Chairperson, we should go to Mfuleni and we can see how we can further address this because I feel like I have not been there in a while, even though I was only there less than a month ago. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, and then the last and fourth opportunity for a follow-up belongs to hon member Makamba-Botya.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Chair, just to tell you, my hand was up three, four times, and you only saw the last time. So I do not know why you do not look in the House, because you saw my hand on the third of the fourth time?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, noted.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: My hand was almost up immediately when you mentioned the two speakers ahead of me.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you, hon member Christians. If you look at the chat [Interjections] you will see that hon member Makamba-Botya also raised her hand quite early on. Over to you, hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you very much, hon Chairperson. I just

want to comment on the issue of Oxford Village specifically. I think that incident should not be treated in isolation because City of Cape Town has got bylaws that are actually impacting on the lives and the safety of our communities. The bylaws of City of Cape Town need to be revisited and changed because they are compromising the lives and the safety of people.

We know for a fact that we have challenges with regards to the visibility of police. So those people in that village have taken an initiative to make sure that they take the issue of their safety in their hands by speaking to all the villagers in that area in terms of how best they can make sure that their lives are protected, and their children. There have been cases of hijacking in that area, break-ins and all of that.

So what we need to have here, we need to have a situation whereby all the stakeholders are involved, especially Human Settlements, where they are speaking on the issues of bylaws that have a serious impact on this issue.

This is not the first incident, it is actually an incident that is happening throughout the Cape Town or the Western Cape where there are gated communities, where people are not able to buy land because they do not have enough money, or they cannot afford to buy land as per the bylaws of the City of Cape Town.

So this incident needs to be taken seriously, and it needs to be taken with the urgency that it deserves. Thank you very much, hon Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I did not quite get the question, hopefully you did, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: I definitely heard a question in there. Thank you so much, hon House Chairperson, and I do want to say in terms of – this is a classic example of working together, from the ACDP to the EFF, because it was hon member Makamba-Botya who approached the City of Cape Town in order to obtain an extension for the notice period and for comment from that particular community.

So thank you, hon member Makamba-Botya, but I do want to state that the reply that I have received was very clear that the matter is now signed off, and it has been handed over to the City of Cape Town Legal Department for finalisation, and they are awaiting feedback in that regard. As soon as I get that feedback, I will make it available to yourself, to hon member Christians, and even drop hon member Kama in as well, because working together will be the only way that we are able to create safer communities and move this province even further forward. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. That concludes responses to this question. As you have noted, hon members, Question 2 will stand over, which brings us to question on the oral Question Paper. Hon member Kazier-Philander to Dr Mbombo, the Minister of Health and Wellness. Over to you, hon Minister.

EMS staff: attacks on

3. Ms W F Kaizer-Philander asked the Minister of Health and Wellness:

In relation to instances of attacks on EMS staff that have been reported over time:

(a) How many cases have been reported in the previous financial year and (b)(i) how does her Department intervene and (ii) what are the community initiatives to ensure the safety of EMS staff?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, hon Chair. We have loadshedding so I will not be able to put up my camera.

Thank you, hon member Kaizer-Philander, for the question. Just FYI for the House, I had received similar questions. This one is the seventh one. There were four in 2020; there were two in 2021. So just in case probably I might be repeating the same thing that I was asked.

So the question, the first part, indeed during 2021 there were 78 senseless attacks, and from 1 January 22 to date there have been about six attacks on EMS officials who risk their lives daily to save lives in the Western Cape [Inaudible] those areas have been identified, and EMS officials are not allowed to enter these areas without a SAPS escort. That is the second part of

the question.

The Western Cape Government and Health and Wellness EMS will declare an area as a red zone being assisted by the SAPS in the event of occurring staff attacks. If there is a spike in violence in the area, unsafe protest action and other contributing factors, that is what happens.

The red zone areas change regularly. I must indicate the current permanent red zones are Chicago in Paarl, Beacon Valley in Tafelsig in Mitchells Plain, and also in Hanover Park. Some other night-time red zones between 18:30 and 06:30 a.m. include, I mean at night, Manenberg, Brown's Farm, Nyanga, Gugulethu, Kalksteefontein, Site C, Harare and Mandela Park, the J Section in Lingelethu and Samora Machel in Khayelitsha. I mean Philippi.

The Western Cape Department of Health and Wellness have implemented a protocol which ensures that ambulance crews are not allowed to enter red zone areas without a SAPS escort. SAPS officials have been mandated to escort the crew into these areas from the nearest SAPS police station. The law enforcement officers, the LEAP officers, are also deployed to escort ambulances, and also on an *ad hoc* basis, when they are requested.

The other part of the question, the safety of our paramedics is a high priority to the Department. We are pleased that the red zones prevent paramedics from entering into a potentially dangerous zone without them taking precautions and being escorted by the SAPS. We are continually exploring

new ways to ensure that our staff are able to return home safely every day. There is an EMS staff safety plan, which I even indicated at the time based on those other questions, oral and written, that detail our initiatives.

This has not changed and the efforts are ongoing. It centres around the four key principles:

- The staff safety management strategies,
- Safety stakeholder engagements,
- Community initiatives. These community initiatives include, for example, the recent one when we are actually orientating the communities to the EMS, because some of the community members might only be aware of a health system at the health facility, and might not necessarily have been exposed to calling the EMS for the ambulance.

So, through the EMS, the Vaxi Taxi which has allowed the crews to strengthen relationships with community leaders and members, you will find now that there is a whole lot of interaction, so that they do not only wait until there is a service that needs to be rendered in regard to the EMS, but for their visibility there.

This initiative assists with a whole of society approach and builds on the trust factor between EMS officials and community members. In addition to the Vaxi Taxi EMS crews across the province are continually reaching out to

schools, institutions, soup kitchens, Neighbourhood Watch members, and community leaders who host the EMS teams at educational events within the district.

I must also indicate, hon Chair, that this is the manifestation of the crime that is happening in the communities. However, because the EMS most of the time they are only two, and also because of the kind of work they do, and also in terms of the attraction in regard especially to those people, some of them who might be abusers, or the [Inaudible] people who are using the drugs, and you will find that they want something that is quick, that they could be able to target and steal. There are many other attacks also within our health establishment, not only in the EMS, but we do not want to create the “what aboutism”; but what is crucial, why I can understand that with the members there is so much interest that I even have six questions within even less than a year period or so, it is about when an EMS is being threatened. It means because it is mostly, there was the time where people are in dire need to access an emergency, and therefore when now they end up being attacked it means that it not only robs that community, but specifically the most vulnerable.

In the rural areas like in Chicago – it is not rural, but I am talking out of the Metro – you find that where there is no 24-hour, that is the nearest, you will find that the nearest one is a hospital which is a Level 2 hospital, for example, in the case of Paarl. It means that their immediate contact to any health system is an EMS, which in most of the cases is in the rural areas.

But when people attack it, they are not only attacking the staff, but they are attacking the whole health system. They are also attacking the Constitution because it does say in the Constitution, in Section 27, that no-one should be denied medical emergency, but now when the community attacks the EMS, then it becomes problematic. As I indicated, hon Chair, you will find that in the areas where they are attacking the EMS, it is the same areas where they will attack the delivery vans that are coming with bread. You even get the areas where the police at police stations get attacked.

So, the issue is more about the social ills that are happening there that make people attack the people that they are supposed to be helping. Actually, across Africa, in most instances you will find that in these countries where there is a high level of civil wars, that they will always spare the healthcare workers, but in the case of South Africa, whether you are an EMS, whether you are a nurse, whether you are a doctor where you are supposed to help the people, the same people that you are supposed to help are the ones that are attacking you. Thank you, hon Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Minister, I recognise the hon member Kaizer-Philander, who posed a question. Do you have a follow-up question for the hon Minister?

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Yes, thank you very much, hon Chairperson and thank you very much, Minister, for your response. Hon Chair, through you to the hon Minister, the Department embarked on a tender process to

acquire 1 000 body cams. Can the hon Minister please indicate, has this process been concluded, are they currently in use and what impact has this had on EMS personnel safety? Thank you, hon Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Over to you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you for the question. This is actually part of the Safety Plan related to the EMS that I mentioned earlier, but noting that with the issue of the body cam, it is about assisting in the convictions because in some cases, these people will just attack and then, disappear. At least with a body cam, it is about when the potential perpetrator at least could be identified. But remember with criminals, in the cases you will find that they jump 6-metre-high fences where they will even, when they want to commit a crime, mess up the whole CCTV camera. They know almost everything.

But also take note that in some instances, you will find that the crew are on the road, like on the N2, where there will be stones that are thrown, in some instances. So, it means that they might not necessarily be, I mean the use of the body cam, might not be necessarily be of use during that time, especially when they are being approached from the side, from the windows.

And also, in some cases actually, where there will be a false call and when they go to pick up a patient, they find that there are no patients. It is just a house where there are some people who are doping, drunk and so forth, but it

is where they are just targeting any easy target where they will be able to get some fix by robbing them and so forth. Because there were cases where they will be robbed whilst they are picking up the patient. Not necessarily by the patient, but by the people from that house.

So yes, indeed, it is part of the plan, but also it only assists some aspect of the attacks, but in some instances we rely on the communities to be able to assist. As I indicated, there are some community leaders where they even volunteer to assist in cases when there is no availability of SAPS because remember, we are putting too much pressure even on SAPS. There was a time that I even went with them – I think that was in Mitchells Plain – where it took us more than 30 minutes whilst we were in the Mitchells Plain police station, waiting for them to escort us, I think that was to Tafelsig.

But by the time they were escorting us, there were already more than seven or eight calls within the car because they have got a monitor and everything. There were more than six in that case. We even had to deviate and go elsewhere as a priority one, without even going to the other place, but we had to wait for so long, 30 minutes, in order to be escorted because they were so busy. Because it is really unfair that the community has to put so much pressure even on SAPS themselves, because they are being needed. Thank you, hon Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Kaiser-Philander has indicated that she has got a second follow-up and thereafter,

hon Mackenzie.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Thank you very much, hon Chair, and thank you so much for the response, hon Minister. Through you, hon Chairperson, hon Minister: how does the Department deal with the physical and the psychological impact on EMS staff, following these attacks? Thank you, hon Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, over to you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you for the question. The ICAS, which is at the Department of the Premier, we have got the whole of the Occupational Health and Wellness Intervention programmes that are tailor-made for each and every need, which have been used even also for the staff with regard to COVID-19, in terms of the deaths, and in relation to the recovery and journey to healing.

So, similarly, with the EMS which has been there even before, not only during COVID-19, where it is not only about having these four people just being referred there, we have even brought some of this counselling to a branch level. Branch, meaning that like Tygerberg, where you will find that they could even have their own counselling as part of their occupational health, instead of only referring them to the Wellness, the DOTP, for counselling.

When I had an informal engagement with a service provider, it was at a social event, who assists the DOTP in that regard. They were saying that they actually sent some of the reports of the previous year to the Department of the Premier with regard to what kind of counselling, which people, most of them that they have counselled. They indicated that actually the majority of them had been through EMS in as much as that there have been other people who have been affected during COVID-19.

As I indicated earlier, through you, hon Chair, it is just common sense in the sense that even for me, when I am driving the car, inside the car, I was driving myself, I do not feel more comfortable until I get home, even if at home there might be a burglary or there might be some criminal activities whilst I am sitting there, but I will always say that at least I am home. But when you are in the car, in the moving vehicle, it is not about the accident, it is also about where you do not have the four walls to protect you.

Also, at the clinic, for example, like a house, you may find that there are also your other colleagues, who have got the security where there are people at least, even if I am in consulting room 5, at least by the time the criminal comes to me, he will have had to pass through security, he will have passed through all others up to the passage. At least there is that element of some safety. Maybe, they also have burglar bar windows, doors, and all of those.

But when you are an EMS, without even being attacked, the fact that you are in the moving vehicle and it is only the two of you, and you might have seen

that most of them are very young; that, alone, it does actually portray them as more at risk generally. Just imagine now when they are being attacked and they are being attacked whilst they are still doing their own job.

As I always have been saying throughout that when you attack a healthcare worker, when you attack an EMS specifically, you are not only attacking that individual, you are even attacking that community which will be denied access to health services. Actually, you are attacking the whole health system because now we have to wait for longer for the people to be escorted. It is not only unfair or an injustice, but also it is a whole issue about the Constitution that is now being attacked. Thank you, hon Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. The next question is being posed by hon Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Chairperson. Via you to the hon Minister, thank you for the responses. It is obviously heart-breaking to hear what other staff members are going through.

I want to find out from the Minister via you, hon House Chairperson, in terms of prosecutions, I do not expect the hon Minister to know the exact number, obviously, around to a formal parliamentary question, but has she been aware of any formal prosecutions of any of these individuals that keep attacking our healthcare system or in this case, our EMS staff members or our EMS people that assist in these cases. Has she been aware of any of the prosecutions of

these individuals? We understand, sometimes an arrest gets made, but part of the problem that I have identified is the prosecutions and if she has been aware of that? Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Your response, hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Yes, yes indeed. Thanks, hon member Mackenzie for that. One case I recall because I kept on going there during the court case in Khayelitsha, when the attack happened, there was a patient inside, a middle-aged lady there who they actually came to fetch. And then, whilst they were driving around the new way, that is when they were attacked, they were robbed. Not only attacked, but also being robbed. They even robbed and took the phone from the patient that was bleeding *nogal*.

But what now made it to actually have even a conviction in that case? Also, in some instances we report these we will find that it is only about the attack, but when we phrase it, they were being assisted by SAPS themselves, like in the case of Khayelitsha when we had to go to court in and out, there were also civil society groups. The faith-based and everyone was there. Some of them witnessed, although it was late; we had reliable witnesses and also, even the patient herself, it helped us because now it will strengthen the case, not only looking at one part of 'this is just a minor kind of assault', but it was broadly defined as an attack on the health system. And then therefore,

the impact because at the time that patient ended up not being able to be transported, they had to wait for another ambulance which unfortunately, because that area was already labelled as a red zone, it took longer.

So, that is why we always encourage the communities to report when they see these attacks, which I have seen in Gugulethu as part of the clinic committees or [Inaudible.], there was a time also that they were raising this awareness. When they see this kind of attack, when they hear about these kinds of things it must not be just that, 'oh, the EMS have been attacked.' It is not only about those two people that have been attacked, it is not all about that patient that was inconvenienced, but it is about the whole health system that has been inconvenienced. Please assist us to be witnesses.

Also, there was a case in Wynberg where there actually was a successful conviction with a heavy conviction compared to the others where it used to be just a minor 'oh, they stole a cell phone', something like that, but it was about attacking the health system. You did not attack only that *boetie* or whatever, that *sussie* that was there. I am not sure about the others. I am just mentioning now the other two that I have been part of, but I am able to provide more information in regard to the other convictions in other cases.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Minister, and the last question then, from the hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Chairperson. Hon Chairperson, the

continued attacks on EMS personnel, particularly in the red zones, are a cause of serious concern. Therefore, my question to the hon MEC with regard to measures implemented over the years: what are some of the success stories regarding community partnerships and why are these not effective in red zones like Philippi, where EMS personnel were recently attacked? Thank you, hon Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, hon member Windvogel. I think as I indicated earlier, if you look at the crime in those areas, it is not only the EMS attacks. As I indicated earlier, you will hear that they have attacked a bread service delivery van. They have attacked some other people, they have attacked previously, even the police themselves.

So, it is a crime that is there, but it is about, for example, when there is a child who will be on the streets late in the evening or when there is a woman, the chances of those two as vulnerable groups and also, in the cases of violence against women and children, they are more highly likely to be murdered or to be raped, as compared to when it is a man.

It is a similar kind of example when it comes to the EMS. So, there, in those areas, you will hear that in the clinic they will have come in, robbed and even the patients' things stolen, goodies and also will have even gone to the shops

and robbed them. So, it is crime that is happening in that area. But you will find that now the EMS becomes the target, as I explained in terms of vulnerability in regard to this type of service and also these types of health professionals. So, that is why I am saying that it is a whole of society approach.

Remember, they are being attacked in their communities – in the communities! So, in the communities, there are various stakeholders. So that is why we say that with the statutory bodies like the clinic committees, hospital boards and also, with the others like the KDF, just to make an example, and others in other areas, they do assist because it is a socioeconomic, a community issue. It is not a health issue.

Some of the other people, they even suggest that why do you not have – I think there was a question, hon member Windvogel, you once asked about having security probably to accompany them and so forth. There were some questions like that where we said that the issue is that our main job is about rendering a health service. You cannot render health services that are securitised. That is why even when there is a maximum prisoner from whether it is Valkenburg or, I mean, from Pollsmoor who is a patient, we tell that person who is looking after that patient, ‘you stand outside. Here, we are dealing with a patient’ because we do not militarise, we do not securitise a health system.

So unfortunately, until the issues are being addressed within the community,

which we try to, as I indicated earlier. The community must not only see them at a glance when they are having that [siren sound] ambulance thing where they have never seen them compared to how seeing them on a daily basis, the nurses, and then build a relationship. So, through the Vaxi-Taxi and also, even they, the EMS healthcare workers, they are able now to have that engagement with communities beyond the space when they are rendering a service.

So, it is the same with the patients because if you look at the areas from where the patients will come, with interpersonal violence, have been beaten, and so whatever story, it is the same area where you will find that there are attacks on others, but it will be even worse with the EMS because they are more vulnerable groups than any others within the health system. Thank you, hon Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Mbombo. Hon members that is the end of Questions for Oral Reply which brings us to the next item on the agenda which is Statements by Members. Are there any members from the DA? I recognise the DA.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Yes, thank you, hon House Chair. Hon House Chair, over the past number of years, South Africa's rail system has come under increased attacks by criminals. PRASA's lack of action only served to

exacerbate the targeted destruction of railway lines and stations.

After more than two years, our central line is still inoperable, owing to the destruction of property, illegal land invasion, theft of cables and other equipment. Without the concrete planned promises of the National Minister that the line will be restored soon, it remains a pipedream and our commuters will continue to suffer.

While SAPS has made numerous arrests in recent months, many cases have remained unsolved, allowing criminals to get away with these crimes. This is why the 20th sentencing of a man who set fire to a train, is encouraging. However, there are many cold cases that need to be dealt with.

Sadly, hon House Chair, a new form of violence has been unleashed against a long-haul bus company, Intercape. Over 150 attacks have been perpetrated against the assets of the company. These attackers have no regard for the pain it caused to the families and those drivers and passengers, who have become collateral damage to their extortion racket. It is therefore with sadness that Mr Bangikhaya Machana, an Intercape driver who went about his work to support and feed his family, was killed by a rogue element in the taxi industry on 25 April 2020. Today, a family in mourning and without a father and breadwinner.

Hon House Chair, I wish to call on SAPS to take whatever action necessary to apprehend and convict these criminals, who seek to destroy lives and

public property. We must protect lives and livelihoods. I thank you, hon House Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. The ANC?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): Hon Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Dugmore?

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Ek praat van ver. Kan jy my van ver af hoor?

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): I'm speaking from afar. Can you hear me from far away?]

†Die TYDELIKE VOORSITTER: Ons hoor u duidelik.

[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: We hear you clearly.]

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Ek praat van Oudtshoorn af, maar jy kan my hoor?

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): I am speaking from Oudtshoorn, but can you hear me?]

Hon Chairperson, there should be no doubt that the hon John Steenhuisen's visit to the Ukraine has absolutely nothing to do with the humanitarian response of facts, all facts, but everything to do with pleasing those funders

that he needs to please. Mass killings have been happening on the Cape Flats for longer than the hon Steenhuisen has been the Leader of the DA. In this province where his party governs, people in the Cape Flats live under siege of gangsters and daily, people have to face shootings. No visits to the Cape Flats, Khayelitsha, Hanover Park by the hon Steenhuisen.

Wars have been ravaging, hon Chair, on the African continent and these wars have a direct impact on our country. In many of these African countries, South Africa has direct interests. We have businesses there; we have academics there and no visit to these African countries by the hon Steenhuisen. Israeli's have been occupying the Palestinian territories for the last 55 years, hon Chair, and in the recent past, regularly bombarded Gaza. No visit to the Palestinian territories and especially, Gaza by the hon Steenhuisen. Afghanistan, Iraq, Yemen and Syria are just some of the other countries across the globe where wars have been ravaging and which have had devastating effects on the populations of these countries. No visit to these war-ravaged countries.

You will go further to note that the Ukrainian ambassador, in addition to meeting with our diplomats, will also be addressing the DA Provincial Council this weekend and while we have absolutely no objection to this, it is clear that the DA continues to have a biased approach to this conflict and this biased approach has a direct impact on the province's farmers and potential export markets, such as the one pursued by Wesgro in regard to mussels.

The visit by hon Steenhuisen cannot even be described as a publicity stunt because it was a PR disaster, receiving condemnation from a wide range, including a former DA National Deputy Executive Director who said, and I quote:

“It would be safe to presume that he is there to find the ‘facts’” ...

[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon, sorry, hon Dugmore? Your two minutes is ... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC):

“...that suit his already decided conclusion.”

We condemn this visit and continue to believe [Interjections.] that our National Government needs to be supported in trying to bring and end to this conflict with the global community. Thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Hon Dugmore, please note that you have got two minutes for each statement. Thank you. Next up ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): But in the other ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ... is the EFF.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): Hon Chair, in the other speech I actually used less time. You even complimented me that I used less time in my speech.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: [Laughs.] Thank you. Thank you, hon. EFF?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Hon Chair, thank you very much. The EFF finds it shocking that Premier Alan Winde is crying foul regarding the ongoing census results in the Western Cape for 2022. His main concern is the equitable share, money the Province could lose as a result of the outcome of these results.

Hon Chair, the majority of people the Premier is complaining about as not being counted are actually people from informal settlements who are neglected by the DA-run Government. The irony is that the same Premier who does not care about the poor in informal settlements, suddenly has an interest in them being counted solely because if they are not counted, then the Province will not gain more money in the form of an equitable share. If the Western Cape is to receive more money in terms of an equitable share, there is no proof that they will suddenly spend that money on the poor to build them houses and proper infrastructure they so desperately need.

Hon Chair, there is also no evidence that the Department of Health will buy more beds in Khayelitsha Hospital and hire more nurses and doctors around the Western Cape health institutions. There is also no evidence that the Education Department will all of a sudden hire more teachers to build more schools. We know all of this because we have seen it before from this Government. All they want is to get more equitable shares and then, keep it in their Provincial Revenue Fund because it gives them joy seeing money piling up there whilst the poor remain in squalor conditions. I thank you, hon Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Makamba-Botya. The next thing, DA. Hon Plato?

Mr D PLATO (DA): Hon Chair, thank you very much. Hon Chair, I wish to speak out on an issue of urgent importance to citizens across the Western Cape and South Africa at large. The R350 Social Relief of Distress Grant is a lifeline for many South Africans who have been left without a means of supporting themselves, as a result of the economic destruction brought on by the National Government's policies over the last two years. R350 is not a lot of money, hon Chair, but it is all that many people have.

And yet, SASSA has proven itself unable to provide even this pittance to the most vulnerable members of our society. We have heard reports of people who are yet to receive their money for the month of April and SASSA seems to be no closer to resolving this situation. The agency has indicated that the

delays are a result of the changing legislative framework due to the end of the State of Disaster. To this, we ask why this problem was not foreseen? How can SASSA leave 10 million people high and dry across the country with many of them in this province?

I have invited SASSA to appear before the Standing Committee on Social Development as soon as possible and my promise to this House today is that we will do all we can to hold them to account for the good of the most vulnerable citizens of this province. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you and the next is GOOD. Hon August? Thank you, we then move on to the ACDP, hon Christians?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Chairperson. Hon Chairperson, an Irish statesman, Edmund Burke, nailed it when he said:

“The only thing necessary for the triumph of evil is for good men to do nothing.”

In the media there were again reports on the new developments on the proposed draft guidelines on gender identity and sexual orientation in public schools. The hon Speaker of this House commented in that article to say that it would be great if the adoption of the policy happens as soon as June. He says it is definitely possible. The drivers of these guidelines are definitely the Western Cape Education Department.

As the ACDP we cannot keep quiet. I want to place it on record that these guidelines are evil and ungodly. We oppose this policy and ask this Western Cape Government to throw it in the garbage bin where it belongs. Many citizens of the Western Cape are asking what is the ACDP doing. On 26 April 2021, the ACDP picketed outside of this Legislature where we called for the rejection and scrapping of these draft bylaws on gender identity and sexual orientation in public schools of the Western Cape Education Department and we will continue to engage communities to reject these ungodly guidelines. The draft guidelines are awaiting the signoff of the hon Minister Schäfer after which it will become policy in our schools in 2023.

I want to ask the outgoing hon Minister Schäfer: within your eight years of hard work in the Education portfolio, is this the ungodly legacy that you are going to leave behind? How can we allow learners to dress in a manner that matches their perceived gender identity or how can we allow unisex bathroom facilities? How can we allow binary pronouns as ‘his’ and ‘hers’ to be changed to ‘them’ and ‘they’? The ACDP cannot be silent with this Satanic policy. The ACDP rejects this draft policy for what it is. ... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: A draft policy from the pits of hell itself. The ACDP rejects the attempt ... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...of corrupting fertile young men. The ACDP rejects this plan to hell where it belongs. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. ANC? No ANC?

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Hon Chairperson? Hon Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Yes, can you hear me?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: We hear you. We hear you, hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Chairperson. The ANC wishes to take this opportunity to commend the Cape Amalgamated Taxi Association, better known as CATA, and the Cape Organisation for the Democratic Taxi Association, also known as CODETA, for coming together to pledge cooperation and working towards peace in the industry.

At a recent meeting held in Makaza in Khayelitsha, where the northern and eastern regions were also invited, hundreds of taxi owners and drivers under the banner of the two associations, came out united in ensuring that they operate within a peaceful environment. As if to honour and pay tribute to the late Archbishop, the associations met in the Desmond Tutu Hall after

violence devastated the industry in the second half of last year.

The taxi industry is the largest means of public transport in our country and province, one would estimate suggesting that up to 70% of the people using public transport to get to work or to make the economy pump, use these minibus taxis. Yet, the taxi industry also remains the most disadvantaged industry within the public transport sector. They receive very little to no support from the Provincial Government and they are not subsidised as Golden Arrow is subsidised, as GoGeorge is subsidised or the MyCiTi is subsidised.

Even though National Government allocates transporting funding to this Province, a reported R1 billion will be allocated to Golden Arrow by this Provincial Government, yet the Provincial Government cannot even support and make taxis viable, but they want to privatise passenger transport. The future of public transport in our province and country is taxis. We must invest in it because it kills two birds with one stone: a means of public transport and a small business.

The ANC also takes this opportunity to commend the National Minister of Transport, Mr Fikile Mbalula, for prioritising the taxi industry, as well as SANTACO, for their role in the leadership they played in ensuring the dialogue between CATA and CODETA. The associations [Interjection.] must know that the ANC will always continue to work with them and be of service to them, as we have been in the recent past and we wish to encourage them to

continue talking and ensuring peace within this vital public transport industry. Thank you very much, hon Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Thank you, hon Mvimbi. The next is the DA.

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Thank you, hon House Chairperson. It is no surprise that finding a job as a young person is now harder than ever before. While the unemployment rate in the Western Cape is still drastically lower than the rest of the country, the economic downturns brought on by the pandemic and National Government's illogical lockdowns, have resulted in fewer opportunities for matriculants and graduates. It is our responsibility as leaders to proactively find ways to improve the prospects of our youth.

Take, for example, the issue of driver's licences: it is virtually impossible as a recently graduated or matriculated young person to get a job without a driver's licence. Even N2 level positions such as courier administration, call centre jobs, government clerks, internships which should provide the employment and skills development for young people, require a licence to gain employment.

In response to this, I recently acquired private funding from the Wheatfield Estate Foundation Trust to pay for 100 learners in my constituency to go through the process of gaining their licences. These learners will gain an invaluable skill for life, which will stand them in good stead as they move

forward with their careers. Basic Education Minister, Angie Motshekga, also recently announced that her Department has begun to investigate the possibility of implementing a similar initiative at national level.

While I applaud the prospect of more learners gaining this vital skill as they enter the job market, I have to ask why is such a simple, but impactful initiative taking this long to be implemented? How many learners across the country have missed out on this vital skill and therefore, vital job opportunities?

I would like to close this by wishing our learners from my constituency in Mitchells Plain well, as they write their exams this weekend and safe driving as they gain their licences. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Thank you, hon Mackenzie. The Freedom Front Plus?

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Thank you, hon Speaker. The bold initiative by AfriForum to establish, empower and finance the non-political affiliated NGO under the name Kaapse Forum to uplift members of the Coloured community economically, should be welcomed by everybody irrespective of political preferences, race or ethnic origin. So does the generous impress of financial aid given by the same AfriForum and the Solidarity Trade Union to flood victims in KZN. This is indicative of the great untapped goodwill that still exists in our country across ethnic, language and cultural divisions, and

should be applauded rather than the motives questioned.

Hungry, unemployed and struggling communities, whether black, whether Indian or whether Coloured, cannot be denied this type of help simply because of political policies practiced in years gone by. This is a huge first step into a better future and should be welcomed. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Next up is Al Jama-ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Chair. Al Jama-ah has no statement. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Brinkhuis and lastly, the Democratic Alliance?

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER (DA): Thank you very much, hon Chairperson. Hon Chair, over the past three years, governments across our country and around the world had to reprioritise spending in order to combat COVID-19 and to save lives of residents. Going forward, every hon member will know that much effort will be placed under pandemic recovery. However, at the same time we will need to look at doing things differently.

Hon Chairperson, this could not be more applicable than when it comes to delivering quality healthcare, particularly in relation to our interventions towards combatting TB in our province. Since 1 March last year, there have

been more than 41 000 individuals who have contracted tuberculosis in which just under a tenth of those, have resulted in death. It is for this reason, hon Chairperson, why the Provincial Government has pioneered in instituting various initiatives, such as the multi-sectoral Provincial TB Emergency Response Plan and the Provincial TB Dashboard. These are examples of a proactive government that innovates service delivery.

Hon Chairperson, now is the precise time for us to do more. This year alone, the Department will be spending R388 million on tuberculosis hospitals, which is more than a 5% increase from the previous year. Over the medium term, more than R1 billion will be spent on these hospitals. Coupled to this is the District Health Programme's Grant, the TB component has been allocated R68 million this year and almost R208 million over the next three years, hon Chairperson.

Hon Chairperson, health is everybody's business and we can clearly see that these plans are proof of a government that ensures the wellbeing and dignity of all residents. I thank you, hon Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you so much, hon member. Hon members, in terms of Rule 145(6), I now give one or more members of the Executive present, an opportunity to respond to Members' Statements for not more than five minutes collectively. Thank you, hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Chair. I will try to keep this very

short, so I will only deal with the Hon Makamba-Botya's statement. First of all, I think she definitely needs to go and read the Blue Book from Treasury because she will see where the money goes and how it gets spent. She should be getting behind this census, just like everyone else should, because this is not only about budget, it is about planning tools, it is about the Gini coefficient understanding the gap, something that they say they stand for. She should get behind it, stop complaining. It is about dealing with crime. It is about dealing with education, it is about dealing with healthcare, it is about dealing with poor people. It is definitely about getting the numbers right and it is absolutely disgusting that she actually stands against it. She should be standing for it for the poor people of this province. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Hon Bredell?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon House Chair. To the hon Dugmore, maybe he must stop trying to interfere in Government by meeting with officials in Oudtshoorn and come and do his job. [Interjections.] In this country, hon Chairperson, we have got 17 million people on a ground system because of ANC corruption, nothing else. 17 million people who suffer because of the war in Ukraine. 17 million people that will suffer because fuel prices will increase, food prices will increase, because of the war in Ukraine. If he does not understand that, then it is just to testify that the ANC as a party wants to keep people in poverty, hon Chairperson. So, he should be ashamed of himself. The DA will keep on the

course to fight for world peace.

Hon Chairperson, †ek gaan dit in my en agbare Huis Chair, en ek gaan dit in my moedertaal doen want dit is iets baie naby aan my hart ...[Tussenwerpsel.] [I am going to do it in my, and hon House Chair, I'm going to do it in my mother tongue because it is something close to my heart...[Interjection.]]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order!

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: En ek wil vir die agbare Christians sê dat ek het die hoogste agting vir sy waardestelsel, maar ek wil nie dit verlaag tot 'n politieke debat nie en ek sal graag 'n koppie koffie saam met hom wil drink, want deel ons in dieselfde geloof en aanbid ons dieselfde God, is dit 'n God van liefde, 'n God wat alle mense geskape het en dan moet ons teruggaan na Mattheus 7 toe wat sê:

“Ek sal nie oordeel nie, want die oordeel waarmee ek oordeel, sal oor my geoordeel word.”

En ek sê dit in alle liefde en hy sal dit verstaan, en wie is ek om 'n geskapene van God te oordeel? So, ons moet baie versigtig wees in hierdie debat.

Agbare Speaker en dan, aan die agbare Marais, ek het sy *statement* so 'n

bietjie gemis, maar ek wil vir hom sê

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: And I want to say to the hon Christians that I have the highest regard for his system of values, but I do not want to degrade it to a political debate and I would like to have a cup of coffee with him, because we share the same religion and pray to the same God, is it a God of love, a God who has created all human beings and then we have to go back to 7 Matthew that reads:

“Do not judge, or you too will be judged. For in the same way you judge others, you will be judged.”

And I am saying it in all kindness and he would understand, and who am I to judge a creature of God? So, we have to be very cautious in this debate.

Hon Speaker and then, to the hon Marais, I missed his statement somewhat, but I want to say to him,] and I need to put it on record that this was the first Province that offered help to KZN. I phoned the Premier, we discussed it and we said we will not go to the media because we help and we offer help to KZN because it is the right thing to do. We have sent rescue people there, we sent 4x4 vehicles there, we sent a JOC team there to help the people of KZN and the National Minister will thank us for that and she will testify to

that.

So, this Government is always there for the people of South Africa and we will always stand behind the people of South Africa. Thank you, hon Chairperson. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I recognise two more members of the Executive: hon Maynier and hon Mitchell. We have got some two minutes left.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Chairperson. I will be brief ... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Maynier?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Chairperson, I will be brief. Am I audible?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, hon Maynier, your voice disappeared. Your sound is breaking up.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Chairperson, I am obviously – am I audible?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you. I think what the hon John Steenhuisen's visit to the Ukraine highlights is the complete silence of National Government on a war of aggression perpetrated by the Russian Federation. It also highlights that while John Steenhuisen is talking about the victims of a war of aggression, the hon Cameron Dugmore is attending functions and sipping champagne with the perpetrators of the war of aggression which, of course, is the Russian Federation and that will not be forgotten and it will not be forgiven by the people of the Western Cape. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, and hon Mitchell, we have got one minute and ten seconds left.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you very much, hon Chairperson. Hon Chairperson, I think it will be remiss of me not to again put on record, because I have answered this particular question or the statement by hon Mvimbi in the past. The reality is this: the money that gets transferred from the National Government to Provincial Government in the form of the PTOG for Golden Arrow Bus Services is nothing different to what happens across the country. All provinces receive that grant.

When you speak about formalisation and subsidisation of the minibus taxi industry, it is on good record and on authority from the industry that the Western Cape Government is the only government that supports the minibus taxi industry. We have rolled out initiatives during COVID-19, in the height

of COVID-19, through the Red Dot and Blue Dot projects. We are still subsidising that for the remainder of this financial year.

Hon Chairperson, I have asked this in numerous Standing Committees to the hon Mvimbi, to please engage his national counterpart or National Government so that we can look at a process of trying to start subsidising the minibus taxi industry. A once-off R5 000 that the National Minister has awarded to operators that came months after it was promised, is no subsidisation, is no formalisation and the hon Mvimbi must not come here, mislead the House without putting the facts on the table that have been provided to him in the past.

I think it is important that in the interest of the commuters of this province, that we do not play up the minibus taxi industry with the bus services that are currently filling the void because of a failed rail system in this province. Thank you, hon Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Thank you, time is up. Thank you so much. That is the end of Members' Statements, which brings us to the next and last item on the agenda, which is Notices of Motion. In terms of the new Rule 151, all Notices of Motions by members are required to be delivered to the Secretary for placing it on the Order Paper. These motions have been duly submitted and published on the Order Paper below the line.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of the Public Procurement regulatory regime on the Western Cape, in line with Section 217 of the Constitution.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the benefits of gender budgeting for the Western Cape.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I give notice that I shall move:

That this House debates the ever increasing incidents of bullying and its adverse effect on learners in our schools and notes with concern that bullying has resulted in some instances in the suicidal death of the victimised.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr P MARRAN: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of rising food prices on the poor people and Government's intervention to mitigate the impact.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr P MARRAN: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the service delivery in poor working class communities.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr P J MARAIS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes that the issue of lending its full support to the City Mayor and his Council in their endeavours to take over control of the Metro Rail Services from the National Government and the urgent nature of the request.

[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: With Motions without Notice, we now move to Motions without Notice. I would like to inform you that in terms of the new Standing Rule 150, pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolence and congratulatory motions were submitted to the Programming Authority, prior to this Plenary on the 3 May 2022. Members are also reminded that Motions without Notice pertaining to congratulatory notices and condolences will not be allowed in this sitting, that have not been processed by the Programming Authority.

I have been informed that in the Programming Authority meeting of 3 May 2022, political parties did submit the names of hon members in the desired order of speaking and those who had wished to move a Motion without Notice in this sitting of the House. I will therefore, just for noting and for the purposes of the Minutes, call out the hon members whose names have accordingly been submitted and approved.

The following members' motions have been approved by the Programming Authority as follows: hon Brinkhuis Al-Jama-ah; hon Bosman DA; hon America DA; hon Lekker ANC; hon America DA; hon Botha DA; and hon Windvogel ANC.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: I move without notice:

That the House recognises that Athlone-born skateboarder Jean-Marc Johannes is the Guinness World Record holder for the highest number of

backside big spins; further recognises that the 30-year-old Johannes, a Windsor High School learner in Lansdowne, won his first skateboarding competition when he was 11 years old; notes that he has managed 18 backside big spins, beating the previous record of 12 held by the American Rob Dyrdek since 2002; further notes that Johannes smashed his latest record at the Cape Town Stadium on 6 April 2022; notes that he grew up under challenging conditions with no skateboard facilities on the Cape Flats; further notes that he is also asthmatic and, as a child, could not participate in any of the other usual sports that motivated him to try manoeuvres, such as Nollie heelflips, Fakie heelflips and boardslides; acknowledges that he recently qualified to take part in the 2022 Tokyo Olympic Games; further acknowledges that he became a professional skateboarder in 2017 and has competed on the international stage since 2011; recognises that during his international stints he has won various awards and competitions, including an accolade from Asia in the form of a Global International Podium in the Virtual Pro Skate Competition hosted by Indonesia; and extends well wishes to Petersen for making his hometown, Paarl, and South Africa proud.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr G BOSMAN: I move without notice:

That the House commends Herman Maritz and Dan Wells, creators of the EskomSePush app, for their ongoing service to the public; notes that the

app seeks to keep South Africans informed about load shedding through push notifications and predictions; and acknowledges the ongoing failures of Eskom and the importance of such apps, including the recently launched City of Cape Town load shedding app, in ensuring that the public stays informed.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr D AMERICA: I move without notice:

That the House commends the Department of the National Treasury for allowing and granting the City of Cape Town permission to undertake a feasibility study to determine the takeover of the Metro Rail network; and wishes the City well and pledges its full cooperation and support.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House records that the holy month of Ramadan has ended for South Africa's Muslim community and wishes the community Eid Mubarak or Slammat in the greeting traditionally used in the Western Cape; and also hopes that members had a peaceful Eid.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr D AMERICA: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the newly elected Western Cape members of the South African National Taxi Council (SANTACO) Executive Committee; and wishes the new leadership well during their term of office.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms L J BOTHA: I move without notice:

That the House expresses condolences after the death of constable Jonathan Adams, who was a police officer stationed at the Redelinghuys SAPS Station and lived in Piketberg; notes that the constable lost his life in a car crash on the morning of 28 April 2022; and notes his many years of service to the South African Police Services and his contribution to combating crime in all the stations that he has served.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: I move without notice:

That the House notes the passing away of the activist comrade Dexter Dowie in April 2022 at the age of 76; and commiserates with his family and loved ones.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I now put the motions duly submitted and approved by the Programming Authority to the House. Are there any objections?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: No.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No objections? Agreed to. These motions will appear in the Minutes of proceedings and in Hansard in each individual members' name, as if that member has read them aloud.

I will now afford the opportunity to members to move Motions without Notice as per Standing Rule 152(d). This could also include Motions without Notice that were not approved in the Programming Authority meeting. Members are reminded that the 30 minutes, as per Standing Rule 152(d), will start now. I recognise the first hon member. It is now your opportunity, hon Brinkhuis, to move.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you, hon Chair, I am covered. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Brinkhuis, we can hear you.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Yes, hon Chair, thank you very much. I am covered with the motion.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Thank you, hon Sayed, you are rising on a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, hon Chair. I think we were sent a list by, I think by the Chief Whip of the majority party earlier, so maybe we should go according to that. Thanks.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Correct. Thank you. Hon Brinkhuis, you have the opportunity to read your motion. I am going to give you an opportunity just to find it. In the meantime, hon Christians, would you like to move your motion?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Chairperson. I move without notice:

That the House extends our sincere condolences to the family of the late Suraya Barden. She was the school secretary of Primrose Park Primary School in Manenberg, a position she held for more than 20 years. The 61-year-old grandmother was fatally shot on her way to school. Her 6-year-old grandson with her in the car at the time of the shooting. Our prayers are with her family, colleagues and community. I thank you. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Hon member, I move that

that motion be considered. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? None?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): No.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: There is no objection therefore, agreed to. Sorry, hon Brinkhuis, I have put you on the spot, but your motion was agreed to by the Programming Authority.

Hon Dugmore, it is now your opportunity. Hon Dugmore, we do not hear you. Your motion was not agreed to in Programming and you have been given an opportunity to bring the motion to the House. Thank you, we then also have to skip the second motion of hon Dugmore. Hon Dugmore, are you online? Hon Dugmore, a last opportunity? Thank you. Hon Dugmore, we do not hear you. Thank you. Thank you, hon Dugmore, so that is that. Let us go on to hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Chairperson, I move without notice:

The House notes with a deep sense of concern the culture of racism in many former Model C schools in the Western Cape, that continues to rear its ugly head across the province and calls on this Provincial Government to put strict measures in place to prevent and deal decisively with the demon of racism in our schools; notes further that three Grade 11 pupils from Stellenzicht Secondary school in

Stellenbosch were racially abused by a fellow learner who referred to them with the K-word allegedly in the presence of teachers, and the learner was merely ordered to apologise for this; calls on the school to provide the affected learners with psychosocial support; and further calls on the WCED to reprimand the teachers and impose stricter sanctions for racism in our schools. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Mr D AMERICA: Object!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. The next motion is in the name of hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much. Hon House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House notes and commends the members of the South African Police Services for the arrest of four members of a car hijacking syndicate in Khayelitsha on 26 April 2022, after SAPS members from Harare pounced on a chop shop in Block 54, Kuyasa, where they found the suspects dismantling two vehicles; upon further investigations

showed the vehicles were hijacked in Rondebosch and Sea Point, several number plates and other car parts were also discovered in the premises; lauds the work and calls for more resources for similar operations to address the hijacking syndicate in the province. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to. The next motion is in the name of hon Bakubaku-Vos. [Interjections.] Order, order!

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: [Laughs.] I ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order! Order, hon members.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern reports of the kidnapping of a two-month-old baby Kai-isha Menier, who was snatched outside Shoprite in Bishop Lavis at the weekend; sympathises with the mother and family, and encourages and commends the Western Cape Missing Persons Unit founder for the support they have offered to the family during this difficult time; and calls on the police to leave no stone unturned in investigating the matter and making an arrest against the woman seen on

camera snatching the baby. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No? No objections, agreed to. The next motion: again, hon Kama. The next motion, hon Kama?

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, hon House Chair, I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern that a police officer and three other persons were wounded during a gunfight between police and robbers at the Eersterivier Post Office on Tuesday and wishes all the wounded a speedy and full recovery; commends the police for the swift response and calls on them to leave no stones unturned to bring the gun toting criminals, who managed to flee the scene, to book. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No? Thank you, agreed to. The next motion in the name of hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon House Chairperson. I

move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the persistent Learner Transport Challenges which have left scores of underprivileged learners stranded in the Moorreesburg area this morning; further notes that the crisis is exacerbated by the shortage of buses and spaces on these buses, the poor conditions on the buses and the lack of cooperation from the service provider in question, whose details I have forwarded to the WCED; and calls on the incoming Education MEC, hon Maynier, to find sustainable solutions to learner transport challenges. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Again, hon Sayed? Again?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon House Chairperson. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the reports that over 70 learners from the Eerste River have not been placed in schools as at May 2022; notes further that this is a persistent challenge as at May 2021 over 700 learners from the area were yet to be placed in our schools; concedes

that the learner placement challenges are part of the systemic failures left unattended to by the outgoing MEC for Education; and calls on the incoming Education MEC to put measures in place that address this failure. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, the motion has been put. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is an objection. The motion will therefore be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Laughs.] Thank you, hon House Chairperson. I move without notice:

That the House notes and condemns the Mondale High School in Mitchells Plain for wilfully contravening the South African Schools Act by forcing the learners who applied to the school to write competency tests in the form of an Entrance Examination for Grade 8; notes further that despite the Act clearly stating that governing bodies of public schools may not administer any tests related to the admissions of a learner to a public school, the WCED has failed to address the matter when it was brought to the attention last week already; and calls on the outgoing MEC to urgently intervene. Thank you. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. The motion has been put. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There is. Thank you. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Makamba-Botya, are you able to put your motion?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Thank you very much, hon Chairperson. I move without notice:

That the House notes that yesterday, young nurses marched to the National Department of Health and Treasury in Pretoria, calling for the permanent employment of nurses who were hired on short term contracts during the peak of the COVID-19 pandemic. These nurses also took an opportunity to outline the horrible conditions they are subjected to in these health institutions around the country, but they still persevered. The Western Cape Department of Health is also not immune to all of this. When provincial health institutions are under strain, they always turn to these nurses for assistance, but when there is a room for them to be made permanent, the Department looks the other way. Hon Chair, the EFF will continue to motivate these young nurses to continue with the struggle of fighting for permanency in order to assist the poor and those that are sick. Thank you very much. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. There has been an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Makamba-Botya, your second motion?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Thank you, hon Chair. I move without notice:

That the House notes that the recent Household Affordability Index for April 2022, shows that the average cost of the household food basket currently costs R4 500. Whilst the cost of the household food basket continues to rise, our people continue to grapple with issues of high unemployment rates, poverty and inequality. The effects of COVID-19 made the situation worse and the so-called economic recovery plans, initiated by various levels of government, do not seem to yield any results in helping our people escape this perpetual trap of poverty and unemployment. We find ourselves in a situation in which even those who are employed and earning a minimum wage, cannot afford the cost of living, let alone those that are unemployed. The situation is really bad and change must be imminent. Thank you, hon Speaker. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, the motion has been put. Are there any objections? None? Thank you. Your last motion, hon Makamba-Botya?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Hon House Chair, thank you very much. I move without notice:

That the House notes that yesterday, three bystanders, plus a police officer, were shot during an attempted cash in transit heist in Eerste River. The bystanders included a male and female aged 40 and a male elderly person aged 76. This is one in a series of violent crimes and robberies that continue to affect the Western Cape. It also shows that these criminals now operate within impunity and will not even be deterred by men in a blue uniform. Hon House Chair, crime in the Western Cape is a serious issue and unless those in power do something about it, the province will continue to remain in the state of anarchy. I thank you, House Chairperson. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, the motion has been put. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Indeed, there is. The motion will therefore be printed on the Order Paper.

Hon members, that concludes Motions without Notice. It also concludes the business of the day. The Secretary will now end the meeting ...[Interjections.] – Order, order! – and all members will be exited from this sitting. You are requested to remain in your chairs until the procession has left the House. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:15.