

---

THURSDAY, 4 AUGUST 2022

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may be seated. Good afternoon, hon members, our guests in the gallery and press and all our members that are on our hybrid session. If the Table staff could just monitor the screens while my computer is just being sorted out?

I have to announce that owing to the resignation of Mr A T Fritz and Ms Debbie Schäfer two vacancies occurred in the representation of the Democratic Alliance in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. These vacancies have since been filled by the nomination of Ms C Murray and Mr C Fry with effect from 3 August 2022. Ms Murray and

Mr Fry were sworn in by myself, the Deputy Speaker, on 3 August 2022 and from now on I will refer to them as hon Murray and hon Fry. A very warm welcome to this esteemed House. Thank you.

Order members, before we proceed, I would just like to touch on a few of the logistics for the record. Remember, it is your responsibility to ensure that if you are participating virtually and not from the Chamber, that you have good quality connectivity and both in terms of audio and video and that there are no disturbances and that your system is functioning well. I do note that you would have received from the WCPP a good system and set of audio microphones so I trust that that will help to ensure good connectivity. Hon members are reminded that no interjections are permitted during these hybrid sittings and in this regard I draw the attention of the hon members to Rule 40 of our Standing Rules.

I now recognise the Chief Whip.

## **BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 20(1), the Subject for

Discussion as printed on the Order Paper takes precedence for this afternoon's sitting.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Chief Whip. Are there any objections to the motion? No objections? Agreed to.

We will now deal with the Subject for Discussion in the name of hon P J Marais as printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Peter Marais.

### **SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION**

- [(i) The benefits, urgency and desirability of implementing the principles of subsidiarity, especially in the context of efficient, governance in the Western Cape;
- (ii) That all powers relating to the police, education, land reform and health, with the related fiscal provisions and guarantees, be devolved to the Western Cape Provincial Government by the National Government;
- (iii) That there should be open-ended approach, that amendments to both the National and Provincial Constitutions be considered and that provision for the incremental devolutions of further powers to the Western Cape Provincial Government be made.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Hon members, what I am about to deliver is not a political speech. It will be reaching out to the intellectual capacity of members in this House. It is a plea for political realism. I ask for open minds, pioneering spirits and a break with conformity and outdated concepts like “rule by a majority”.

For 28 years South Africa has flirted with a hybrid federal system. 80% of all powers in the hands of national central government and only 10% divided between the provinces and another 10% Local Government. Since 1994, the urgent need of provinces has been ignored, budgets slashed at will, unemployment allowed to rise to 70% and corruption continued unchecked and unpunished throughout South Africa. My plea therefore is for the application of a system of subsidiarity, which is well stated in our Constitution, the devolving of powers to the Western Cape instead of mere delegation of certain powers. It is the essence of good governance. Subsidiarity is a system that works all over the world. It is the passing down of powers and authority to other spheres of government, who have the capacity to handle and execute it more efficiently and effectively.

I will give you an example. In a multicultural society, it is foolish not to leave decisions to the people who live in that environment and who interpret the effects of policies on that society. Laws on education, for argument sake, can never be the prerogative of a single class or ethnic group in a cosmopolitan society, like we find in a Western Cape. The importance and validity of the Afrikaans language and Christian education per se, has not

been realised and this has resulted in a perception that Coloured and White people are ganging up against English. It is not so. We plead for the recognition on an equal basis of Afrikaans as a national language.

Speaker, we are living in fear in this country, especially the Western Cape because of rampant crime. We live in fear of rapists and murderers, who poke their noses at an ill-trained, poorly equipped, understaffed police force. There is a critical shortage of skilled nurses at our hospitals and hundreds of squatter camps paint an ominous picture of a failed state knocking at our door. We are in deep trouble. Let us face reality.

National Government policies with regard to job creation, border control, orderly land reform, education, crime, health matters, police deployment, public transport and housing has failed dismally.

Cadre deployment has further aggravated matters, appointing the best among us to critical positions in the public service. It is vitally important...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member...

Mr P J MARAIS: ...if we are to embark on a rescue mission... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up. Thank you. Thank you very much, hon Marais. I now recognise hon Allen, Minister Allen. My apologies, hon Allen.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
Thank you so much, Deputy Speaker. It is now today officially a 100 days since my appointment as the Provincial Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety, and I am delighted that the ANC is very happy for me because within this particular first 100 days we have been deliberate in ensuring that we build our capacity in the Department, but also ensuring that we conduct oversight visits to the South African Police Service and patrol with Neighbourhood Watches, that we engage CPFs. I have met regularly with the Provincial Commissioner and in my office is a particular quote...  
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
And in my office there is a quote that says “we are in the business of policing and safety and not politics” and that quote I got directly from...  
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
That particular quote I got directly from the Police Commissioner because we never want to play politics. “Politics literally means – “poli” means many “ticks” means bloodsucking creatures and from the arms deal to the Zondo Commission to State capture we have seen that the latter part has infiltrated

the political arena [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: So this is not about politics. This is about the daughter of member Ayanda Bans. We are talking about the daughter of Ayanda Bans that needs to grow up here in this beautiful province, that needs to be safeguarded, so thank you member Marais and this is definitely not, and I may or I may not be a godfather as well, but also, Deputy Speaker, it was on 20 July this year... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...when I published an opinion piece in the *Daily Maverick* with the headline “Devolving SAPS to provinces is the only sane solution.” This is also my topic for today with regard to the discussion, because most of us know that the definition of insanity is to do the same thing over and over and expect a different result.

Unfortunately, the management of the South African Police Service sitting up in Pretoria 1500 kilometres away from where we are have yet to catch on. For years they have maintained the same outdated, unresponsive, unscientific policing practices. Meanwhile, the world has moved on and so have our criminals leaving the SAPS behind. For our part it would be insane to allow

this to continue. The only manner we will see an impactful South African Police Service is if changes are made and these should be drastic and sweeping. Like tattoos, the National Minister of Police sees devolution as a criminal act.

In fact, it is this level of change that is required to start producing the different results we need from our hamstrung and mismanaged crime-fighting resources. The Western Cape Government believes that there is a firm basis for devolution of policing to provinces, particularly where we can show that we can do it better and we have consistently done that. [Interjections.]

In technical terms, reliance could be placed on the provisions of the Constitution read together with Section 206 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, a Constitution that people died for, and criminals have been able to organise that. That is why we have organised crime and we have seen to break that it should be devolved, because we also know, Deputy Speaker, that in laymen's terms it is fully within the scope of the Constitution for the National Minister to have these powers, knowing and I am sure that he does, that it would be better run here in the province because let me enlighten the House again. Section 206(4) of the Constitution also makes express provision for the assignment of policing functions to the Provincial Executive through national legislation and/or national policing policy in terms of which provinces could be enabled to exercise policing powers beyond mere monitoring and oversight, which has to date been the norm because despite the national Minister's firm stance against devolution,



we in the Western Cape Government have not stood by. Knowing the painful cost of crime for our communities, we have already begun to invest in resources to offset National Government's failure in this particular sphere. We have launched the LEAP offices despite policing falling outside of our mandate, because when National Government fails to step in, we ultimately step up because the National Minister would do well to stop clutching at power and instead take a leap out of the Western Cape Government's book by simply doing what is best to address safety for the sake of member Ayanda Bans' daughter. Because a police service under the Western Cape Government would undergo several interventions. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: We would immediately commence with the recruitment of more officers with the focus on re-enlisting those who have left the service in good standing, particularly from an intelligence and a detective perspective. We cannot have our detectives sit with a case load of 250 dockets on average, because we all watch CSI, and then a case is resolved within 60 minutes. Here we are living in an environment where our detectives are overburdened and overworked. Many of them require urgent counselling and attention because it is so difficult.

We would also conduct an immediate review of all stations and assets to put an infrastructure upgrade plan in place. I have already written to Minister

Patricia de Lille in that regard as well. We would establish a regular maintenance plan for all resources so that SAPS can be equipped. We will also then further learn from other countries across the world which have embraced technologies and systems to aid crime-fighting.

We would further in the interest of member Ayanda Bans' daughter, shift the ranking of officers to be based on qualifications and experience based on merit. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: We would also then reintroduce specialised units to address categories of criminal behaviour, but even more so we would invest in a world class Forensic Unit Lab. So Deputy Speaker, seven minutes is definitely not enough because I feel deeply passionate about this. I feel deeply passionate about members in this House, residents from Mitchells Plain to Swellendam, all the way to the Cederberg area, knowing that the men and women on the ground in SAPS are also yearning for better management and for choices not to be made all the way in Pretoria. Their lives are at stake, I went to Klawer and there was one female in the Community Service Centre, one female, which breaks the SOP of SAPS itself, but there was literally no-one else. That means that SAPS itself is in danger of being attacked.

Various police stations within this first 100 days, where I found and I heard

firsthand, criminals break into SAPS. They break into police stations, how brazen must one be to actually rob the very entity that should be serving and protecting us, because unless the management of SAPS is devolved to our Province I am afraid we will only keep waiting and keep suffering more losses and this is ultimately insane. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Can you hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Loud and clear.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Good afternoon to you, the Premier as well as other hon members in the House. I would like to make use of the opportunity to welcome the debate as proposed by hon Marais.

Deputy Speaker, on an occasion such as this, and when participating in a

debate of this nature, it is important that we recall our past. Too often the ANC is accused of always referring to history. Too often as the ANC we are always condemned for remembering those of us who were on the wrong side of history. The State and the Constitution we debate here today did not come cheap. The competencies and unity of the South African state did not fall out of the sky. The competencies and unity of the South African State came through blood and it cost lives. Yet, we do not expect everyone even in this House to appreciate this historical fact. On the occasion of his election as the first President of a democratic South Africa, President Nelson Mandela said, and I would like to quote:

“Perhaps it was history that ordained that it be here, at the Cape of Good Hope that we should lay the foundation stone of our new nation. For it was here at this Cape, over three centuries ago, that there began the fateful convergence of the peoples of Africa, Europe and Asia on these shores. When we look out across Table Bay, the horizon is dominated by Robben Island, whose infamy as a dungeon built to stifle the spirit of freedom is as old as colonialism in South Africa. For three centuries that island was seen as a place to which outcasts can be banished. The names of those who were incarcerated on Robben Island is a roll call of resistance fighters and democrats spanning over three centuries. If indeed this is a Cape of Good Hope, that hope owes much to the spirit of that legion of fighters and others of their calibre.”

The Western Cape, a part of the former Cape Colony has been and will

always be an integral part of this Republic of South Africa. The hon Marais knows all too well that the Union of South Africa formed by the British in 1910, but which excluded the majority of the people of this country was formed by the Cape Colony, among others. Without the Western Cape, there simply is no South Africa. We must therefore desist the thinking where this debate today comes from. We know exactly why we are debating this topic today. It is simply not about competencies of land reform, the competencies of police, the competencies of health and the competencies of education. This debate is simply not about subsidiarity, but speaks to the very heart of our nation as a country. For more than 350 years we fought for freedom and unity as a country. For more than 350 years some even sitting here today sought to divide our country through segregation, separate development, tricameralism and Bantustans.

Today they stand up in this House and ask us to debate federalism. Efficient and good governance do not depend on federalism, governments the world over are efficient and practice good governance, even without federalism. Today, we must commit ourselves to the unitary state that South Africa is because South Africa has got one Constitution.

Today, we must insist on the principle of cooperative governance, and ensure that its spheres of government work with each other to ensure a better South Africa for all its people. This must especially apply to Local Government, which is at the coalface of service delivery. This House has deliberately refused to hold accountable those local governments under its watch, but

while endowing them with funds.

The declaration in 1955 of the Freedom Charter that South Africa belonged to, all who live in it, black and white, is still as relevant as it is today. Yet, we must also acknowledge that the call for separatism of the Western Cape, especially as this motion suggests, by having an open-ended approach to the National and Provincial Constitution, is based on, if not solely, on race.

Racist opportunists call for the separation and the different treating of the Western Cape simply because the racial demographic is different than it is in any other province. The hon Marais and all those who put for separatism must know that the independence of the Western Cape will only mean subjugation of one race by another. When the apartheid regime tried to reform apartheid by introducing the tricameral system, it was the UDF which stood up and shouted “Apartheid divides, UDF unites.”

In his memoir, *Politics in my Blood*, the constitutional expert Professor Kader Asmal writes, while explaining the writing of our Constitution:

“Our Constitution will recognise, accommodate and even celebrate South African diversity and the multiculturalism of our country. The belief that a unitary state could accommodate South Africa's plurality will become increasingly important over the next two to three years when we will deny alternative constitutional models put forward by friends and foes alike that emphasise South Africa's heterogeneity.”

Part of the heterogeneity of our country is that Cape Town has a better governance system than Johannesburg. As the DA will have discovered, governing the cities of Johannesburg and Tshwane is not as easy as governing Cape Town. Yet, even more so we must realise that our strength lies in our unity. It makes no sense, whether politically or economically, to break away. Today the call by the Khoi and the San as expressed through their language in our country's motto rings loudly for all of us to hear. As diverse people we must unite. We must not divide. Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Mvimbi. Before I continue, hon Mvimbi, I see you are logged in as “Lulama guest” and that is not going to identify you and I am sure that we will eventually have to have rules that your name has to be evident, so did you have a problem logging in?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Yes, hon Deputy Speaker, I had a problem with my password for my email so that is why I am using my phone.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. No problem, that is fine. So you are confirmed as the person speaking. Thank you very much.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now recognise the hon Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I also experienced the same

problem of logging in. I am a guest speaker, but thank you, Deputy Speaker. From the onset we would like to make it clear that as the Economic Freedom Fighters, we do not support the proposition that powers relating to the police, education, land reform and health be devolved to the Western Cape. Supporting such a venture is tantamount to supporting this ever-increasing notion that the Western Cape should be declared a country on its own inside the Republic of South Africa. Such a notion is nothing but a pipe dream that will never be realised in this lifetime. In terms of the Safety Plan, the DA-led Provincial Government is already failing, with their so-called Safety Plan with mass shootings on the rise in the province, continuing to be a den for illegal drug trade. So imagine now trusting such a government with policing powers, when they cannot even turn its law enforcement into an effective force. The law enforcement remains useless and a waste of taxpayers' money even to this day. All they do is focus on evictions, when real crime is forever increasing in our townships.

The education system, under the DA-led Government, the Western Cape Education Department has been in crisis for a very long time now. This is a Government that struggles to place learners in schools. All the Department does is spend its time in the High Court trying to defend why it is failing to place learners in schools. So it will be a no-brainer to give such a government powers relating to education. In fact, this Government needs assistance. It cannot be left on its own to implement service delivery.

In terms of emerging black farmers, while a white-led Provincial Government



cannot be trusted with land reform, every year, when we pose a clear question to the DA-led Government on what they are doing to assist emerging black farmers with regard to the acquisition of land, we never get a clear answer. They always avoid answering this question and instead they will tell you that they assist. They assist emerging black farmers with internship. How is an internship going to assist anyone to acquire land for the peoples of farming, or except for providing food gardens for our people?

In terms of the health system, the health system in the province is also not so good under the Government, where patients are found sleeping on the floor in township hospitals. When the Provincial Health Minister is asked to intervene, she replies by saying that the situation will continue being like that, and then there is nothing that can be done by the Department. This alone coming from the Minister is an acknowledgement of failure. The elderly people are always found standing in long queues in clinics, even under the bad weather conditions with the zero implementation of the principle of Batho Pele from the health institutions. Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Xego. Thank you very much. I now recognise the hon Van der Westhuizen.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Agb Adjunkspeaker, ek is baie dankbaar dat ons vandag hierdie debat kan voer en ek is jammer dat van ons kollegas dink dat dit hier om afstigting gaan. Sentralisering van mag is

gevaarlik en onwenslik. Wat ons benodig is die sinergie wat verkry kan word in die uitruil van idees en beste praktyke tussen die onderskeie provinsies. Sentralisering is lomp, duur en oneffektief. In die afgelope twee dekades wat die ANC regeer het, het hulle hulself die reg toegeëien om al meer voorskriftelik te wees en wil hulle al hoe meer mag sentraal uitoefen.

Hiérvan is daar talle voorbeelde. Ons tegniese en beroepsonderwyskolleges wat onder andere voor-matriekkursusse aanbied en wat eens onder ons Provinsiale Onderwysdepartemente geval het, is oorgedra aan die Nasionale Departement van Hoër Onderwys.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I am very grateful that we can have this debate today and it is a pity that some of our colleagues think that it is about secession. Centralisation is dangerous and undesirable. What we need is the synergy that can be acquired in exchanging ideas and best practices between the various provinces. Centralisation is cumbersome, expensive and ineffective. In the past two decades that the ANC has governed, they reserved themselves the right to be increasingly prescriptive and do they want to exercise more and more power centrally.

There are numerous examples of this. Our technical and occupational teachers' colleges which amongst other things offer pre-matric courses and which once fell under our Provincial Education departments, have been

transferred to the National Department of Higher Education.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Deputy Speaker.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hierdie sentralisering bring enorme koste mee sonder dat opleidingsdoelwitte enigsins verbeter of behaal word.

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: This centralisation brings enormous costs without training goals being improved or achieved.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Van der Westhuizen, if you could just take your seat. Hon Mvimbi, what is your point of order?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Yes, just I want to find out, I would like to have access to the interpretation or the interpretation services if I am using this device so that I can follow the... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, apologies. I think you need a second device and if I can ask that the IT staff contact you and assist you and I know you want to actually listen to hon Van der Westhuizen's speech. If you have a second device and if the IT can help you, please, I do not want to keep the entire House waiting. Is that okay?

Mr L L MVIMBI: No okay, okay then, that is fine, hon Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

Mr L L MVIMBI: The hon can continue. It is fine.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Mvimbi. I will get assistance. You may proceed, hon Van der Westhuizen.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Baie dankie. Elsenburg Landboukollege het 'n lang tradisie van opleiding wat die unieke behoeftes van landbou in die Wes-Kaap aanspreek. Hierdie kollege se opleiding en fasiliteite is van uitmuntende gehalte, soveel so dat van die opleiding deur die Universiteit van Stellenbosch erken word.

Raai wat? Omdat dit met landbouopleiding in die ANC-beheerde provinsies so beroerd gaan omdat die diere van ander landboukolleges besig is om van die honger te vrek wil die sentrale regering Elsenburg oorneem – om moontlik darem een suksesstorie te kan hê. Sentralisering van mag is gevaarlik. Ons het meer kompetisie van idees tussen verskillende provinsies nodig. Kyk byvoorbeeld na grondhervorming waarna die vorige lid verwys het. In die Wes-Kaap het ons 'n model waar ervare landbouers deur aandeelskemas grondeienaarskap en transformasie bevorder. 72% van hierdie projekte is deur 'n onafhanklike studie as suksesvol geklassifiseer. Hierteenoor is daar die sentrale regering se model, 'n model waar ene mnr Ivan Cloete, 'n opkomende boer van Darling, op onwettige wyse van sy toegekende plaas afgesit sou word om plek te maak vir 'n MK-kader. Hierdie

Provinsie se model is een van private eienaarskap. Die Sentrale Regering se model is een van staatsbesit en 30-jaar huurkontrakte. Ek sê weer, ons het nie sentralisering nodig nie, maar 'n kompetisie van idees tussen verskillende provinsies.

Adjunkspeaker, kollegas, kan u u voorstel hoeveel beter die toekenning van viskwotas hanteer sou kon word as dit deur die Wes-Kaap hanteer is? Ek herinner u daaraan dat Minister Barbara Creecy haar eie Departement hof toe geneem het om die aanvanklike toekennings tersyde te laat stel. Met die tweede probeerslag is die proses weereens so ondeursigtig, om dit sag te stel, dat die leier van die ANC in hierdie Parlement vissers aanmoedig om nie die uitslag van sy eie ANC Nasionale Minister te aanvaar nie. Die agbare Dugmore het 'n veldtog begin teen sy Nasionale Minister en help vissers om appèlle in te dien.

Adjunkspeaker, deur u, baie dankie aan die Leier van die Opposisie vir sy insig en sy erkenning dat viskwotas eerder op provinsiale vlak toegeken moet word as vanuit Pretoria. Ek sê weer, sentralisering van mag is gevaarlik. Ons het meer kompetisie van idees tussen verskillende provinsies nodig. Die sentrale regering se vermoë om enige iets te organiseer is uiters beperk. Dit het ek onlangs weer ervaar. Dit was my voorreg om twee weke gelede 'n aantal plase te besoek saam met die Nasionale Parlement se Komitees vir Landbou, Grondsake en Landelike Ontwikkeling, sowel as die Departement van Indiensneming en Arbeid. Die reëlins vir hierdie besoeke was so swak dat enige twyfel oor die vermoë van die Nasionale Regering en sy

departemente om enige iets te bestuur, soos mis voor die son verdwyn het.

Uitnodigings na die driedaagse program is slegs een dag voordat die program begin het uitgestuur. Dag een se program op De Doorns het afgeskop met 'n openbare vergadering en sou afgesluit word met besoeke aan twee plase om eerstehands die lewensomstandighede van plaaswerkers en plaasbewoners in die omgewing te sien. Ernstige kritiek teen verskeie nasionale instellings, insluitende die Departement vir Arbeid en die Departement van Binnelandse Sake is uitgespreek in 'n verskriklik oproerige vergadering en die besoeke aan plase is op die laaste nippertjie afgelas.

Dag twee, 'n Saterdag, het op 'n vals noot begin toe die blouligbrigade en hul gevolg van ongeveer 30 voertuie aanvanklik die verkeerde plaas ingeval het. Dit blyk ons manne in blou het nog nooit van Google Maps gehoor nie!

Op die tweede plaas het die verteenwoordiger van die eienaar gesê dat hy nooit ingelig is van die omvang en doel van die besoek nie. Die indiensnemingsrekords was, soos wat 'n mens van 'n Saterdag kan verwag, agter slot en grendel en die groep het onverrigtersake die plaaswerf verlaat.

Dag drie se program het aangedui dat twee plase tussen Vredendal en Lutzville besoek sou word. Weereens het swak organisasie ons gelei na 'n plaas wat weens swak kommunikasie nie voorbereid was op ons besoek nie. 'n Ander plaas as die een wat eintlik deur die Surplus People Project vir besoek geïdentifiseer was se bewoners het tevergeefs vir 'n besoek van die Nasionale

Parlement gewag. Die kosbare tyd en belastinggeld wat deur swak organisasie gemors is, breek 'n mens se hart.

Dit sal soveel beter wees as die Nasionale Regering in die Provinsie sal gaan sit en verantwoordelikhede en rolle duidelik uitklaar en afwentel. Regeringsgesag behoort afgewentel te word tot op die laaste praktiese vlak om bevoegde provinsiale regerings te bemagtig om beter dienste aan ons mense te lewer – dienste waarmee die ANC Regering tans hopeloos misluk [Tussenwerpsel.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you. Elsenburg Agricultural College has a long tradition of training that addresses the unique requirements of agriculture in the Western Cape. This college's training and facilities are of outstanding quality, so much so that some of the training is recognised by the University of Stellenbosch.

Guess what? Because agricultural training in the ANC controlled provinces is so poor because animals from other agriculture colleges are dying from hunger, the Central Government wants to take over Elsenburg – probably to have one success story. Centralisation of power is dangerous. We need more competition of ideas between various provinces. Look for example at land reform to which the previous member referred. In the Western Cape we have a model where experienced agriculturists promote land ownership and

transformation through share schemes. 72% of these projects have been classified as successful by an independent study. On the other hand there is the Central Government's model, a model where one Mr. Ivan Cloete, an emerging farmer from Darling, would have been evicted in an illegal way from his allotted farm to make way for a MK cadre. This Province's model is one of private ownership. The Central Government's model is one of state ownership and 30-year leases. I say again, we do not need centralisation, but a competition of ideas between different provinces.

Deputy Speaker, colleagues, can you imagine how much better the allocation of fishing quotas could have been handled if it was handled by the Western Cape? I remind you that Minister Barbara Creecy took her own Department to court to set aside the initial allocations. With the second effort the process is again so obscure, to put it mildly, that the leader of the ANC in this Parliament is encouraging fishermen not to accept the result of its own ANC National Minister. The hon Dugmore started a campaign against his own National Minister and is assisting fishermen to lodge appeals.

Deputy Speaker, through you, thank you to the Leader of the Opposition for his vision and his acknowledgment that fishing quotas should rather be allocated at a provincial level rather than from Pretoria. I say again, centralisation of power is dangerous. We need more competition of ideas between different provinces. The Central Government's ability to organize anything is extremely limited. That I have experienced again recently. It has been my privilege two weeks ago to visit a number of farms along with the



National Parliament's Committees for Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development, as well as the Department of Employment and Labour. The arrangements for these visits were so poor that any doubt about the ability of the National Government and its departments to manage anything disappeared like mist before the sun.

Invitations to the three day programme were only sent out one day before the programme started. Day one's programme at De Doorns started with a public meeting and would have been concluded with visits to two farms to see firsthand the living conditions of farm workers and farm inhabitants in the area. Serious criticism was uttered against various national institutions, including the Department of Labour and the Department of the Interior in an extremely riotous meeting and the visits to the farms were cancelled at the last minute.

Day two, a Saturday, started on a false note when the blue light brigade and their entourage of about 30 vehicles invaded the wrong farm. It seems our men in blue have never heard of Google Maps!

On the second farm the representative of the owner said that he had never been informed about the scope and the purpose of the visit. The employment records were, as one could expect of a Saturday, locked away and the group left the farmyard without having accomplished anything.

Day three's programme indicated that two farms would be visited between

Vredendal and Lutzville. Again poor organisation led us to a farm which because of poor communication was not prepared for our visit. The inhabitants of another farm than the one that has actually been identified by the Surplus People Project for a visit, waited in vain for a visit from the National Parliament. The precious time and taxpayers' money wasted by poor organisation break one's heart.

It would be so much better if the National Government would go and sit in the Province and clear up and devolve responsibilities and roles. Government authority should be devolved to the last practical level to empower provincial governments to deliver better services to our people – services with which the ANC Government is currently failing with hopelessly [Interjection.].]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Sentralisering van mag is gevaarlik. Ons het meer kompetisie van idees tussen verskillende provinsies nodig. Baie dankie.

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Centralisation of power is dangerous. We need more competition of ideas between different provinces. Thank you.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Baie dankie, agbare lid.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.] I now recognise the hon August.

Mr S N AUGUST: Deputy Speaker, in our 2019 Manifesto, GOOD laid out a

plan to fix up Africa by fixing towns and cities. The rapid change we are seeing in urbanisation is due to the steady flow of people into cities and towns and it is estimated that more than 80% of South Africans will occupy town and city spaces by 2050. We cannot do government as usual, as this unprecedented shift towards economic hubs and urban centres will further drive the growing divide between the haves and the have nots.

Speaker, GOOD supports the call for metros to play an increasingly bigger role in providing services currently centralised in National Government as the societal makeup of South Africans differ from town to town and city to city. Therefore, a standardised approach will limit the urban patterns as the statistics are suggesting. We should be careful on how these calls for devolution are often opportunistic and used as political banter to feed an electorate hungry for change.

In turn, GOOD says that formal housing delivery should be devolved to metros. It will stop the expansion of low-income housing on the city outskirts as these fields urban sprawl and recreate apartheid-era dormitory suburbs of poverty.

Public transport should be integrated between buses and railways for a one ticket system to make provision for the cost-effective transport that saves time, money and reduces road congestion. We will build the infrastructure that is needed and will provide policy certainty to investments in the Metro. It will also allow the metropolitan areas to generate their own power.

Devolution can work but it must serve as a solution to expedite services to poor people in town and city areas and should not be made to be a power grab or fuel the egos of political parties who predominantly exist to serve the interests of a select few. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon August. I now recognise hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, although South Africa bears some elements of a federal system, such as the allocation of certain powers to provinces, it is nevertheless constitutionally and functionally a unitary state. South Africa as a unitary state under the ANC rule has proven to be a broken state. The ANC is playing politics with the lives of our people. Things are getting worse under the current ANC dispensation.

Deputy Speaker, there are calls from groups within the Western Cape for the Western Cape to be an independent country. This has nothing to do with racism. This is everything to do with a desperate attempt... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...to run away from the ANC as far as possible. People are sick and tired of ANC politics... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...sick and tired of corruption, sick and tired of looting state enterprises, sick and tired of this green-and-yellow monster that has been destroying this country since 1994. Now the answer is a strong federal system. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Provinces should have exclusive powers when it comes to policing... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order members!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ...education, health, transport and much more. Metrorail, which plays an integral part in transporting our workers to and from their places of employment, needs to be localised.

Deputy Speaker, the provinces have first-hand knowledge of the conditions of the communities and the communities deserve better services. The fact that our police services are under-resourced shows that the ANC Government does not have a clue what is happening in the provinces. The ANC is clinging onto power at all costs but this will change in 2024 where the ANC nationally will sit under Opposition benches. I thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Christians. I now

recognise hon Kaizer-Philander.

Ms W KAIZER-PHILANDER: Sick and tired, Deputy Speaker.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, I cannot hear the hon member.

Thank you very much.

Ms W KAIZER-PHILANDER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. In Schedule 4 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa it stipulates that health services are defined as concurrent competencies for both national and provincial spheres, as well as that of Local Government. These provisions are further elaborated in the National Health Act, where the National Department is primarily responsible for the development of policy and the province mandated to implement it. This means provinces are positioned as the agents responsible for running the majority of public healthcare facilities in our country. It is this framework which realises the structure of that uniform health care system. However, with the increasing pressures being experienced, this debate could not come at a better time as it is now where we need to expedite our efforts to devolution.

Hon Deputy Speaker, unfortunately for as long as the ANC is in control of the National Government they will not be interested in what the Constitution or any piece of legislation prescribes... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member! Order members! You may

proceed.

Ms W KAIZER-PHILANDER: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. †Die waarheid maak seer! [ The truth hurts!]

They are on a mission of destruction with the NHI as it aims to completely centralise healthcare. In the Bill the Minister of Health is given the power to designate certain central hospitals as National Government competence. As such the administration, management, budgeting and governance of central hospitals will be a competence of the National Government. Not only would this incapacitate public healthcare, but it would also undermine provincial powers as enshrined in the National Healthcare Act. Practically we would see the equitable share of funds to provincial departments being directed towards financing the fund. We all know that provincial departments are already stretched. Thus as a reduction in their equitable share will be disastrous and reckless towards health outcomes across South Africa. We see this in this year's budget too. While the equitable share and conditional grant contributions have increased, all of them are once again below the inflationary increases we have experienced over the past few years. This means the Western Cape will have to continue doing more with fewer resources. Despite the constraints the Western Cape finds itself in we have a competent administration dedicated to being innovative. R114 million rand was reprioritised in the departmental baseline to fund projects linked to addressing surgery backlogs, and many other more care and management capacities within our facilities. Moreover, a significant focus has been placed

on infrastructure, as spending on existing infrastructure assets increased by 10,91% with upgrades, additions, refurbishments and rehabilitation spending, having increased by 99,28% and 54,1%, respectively. Beyond this new infrastructure spending is 110,11% more in comparison to the 2021/2022 year.

Hon Deputy Speaker, this is how a department ensures quality healthcare for residents in the Western Cape and how our province is the benchmark for federalism. Despite our services being noticeably better, the ANC is of course going to argue the opposite. Their hymn sheet regarding the Western Cape's state of health, sounds like this: "long queues, people lying on floors, people waiting too long for services, staff shortages, infrastructure challenges", and yes, Deputy Speaker, these do exist, but we need to be honest about why do these exist? Let us do a reflection today. During recent oversights, it was clear that there are many socio-economic factors placing strain on our healthcare system.

Over time the demographics of the communities in which facilities operate have required them to provide more specialised services. This has translated in them going beyond the initial designs and mandates in order to serve the community. While they are able to do so for the foreseeable future in the long term, their designated funding would be insufficient for the projected demands. On top of that the healthcare system is wrapped up in immense bureaucracy from the National Government. Current legislation such as those relating to staff employment, mental healthcare and others mean that they are



systemic blocks to allowing the system to work more efficiently, but what the ANC refuses to realise is that this is an issue which affects all facilities across South Africa. The only difference is that in the Western Cape we continue to provide public healthcare that works within the current system with competent management and dedicated staff members who tirelessly care for patients. That is why it is crucial for South Africa to embrace federalism. The call to devolve healthcare is not something which is unique in South Africa. It is something that has already happened around the world. While members from the Opposition will argue that decentralisation would lead to a complete failure of health, then why is it that Nordic countries often seen as the model of a welfare state have all decentralised their healthcare systems and have coupled it with a fiscal federalism approach?

Devolved health means the Department can create policies that are more aligned with the community's needs to ensure that service delivery can be done in the most effective and efficient way possible.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Ms W KAIZER-PHILANDER: It will mean having more money being sent to provinces so that our facilities would be even more empowered.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thanks, hon member.

Ms W KAIZER-PHILANDER: It means that services can be streamlined, and

that patients no longer have to wait in long lines to get the assistance they need.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Keiser-Philander.

Ms W KAIZER-PHILANDER: I thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I now recognise hon Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, am I audible?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are, you may proceed.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: Thank you very much. The Al Jama-ah rejects in totality this ridiculous argument by the Vryheidsfront, instigated by the DA party for National Government to hand over powers of police, education, land reform and health to the province. We are against the DA's plans to exit the Western Cape from the rest of South Africa. The oppressed people have fought hard and sacrificed their lives and livelihoods for a democratic united South Africa. The DA is intent to bring back apartheid to South Africa...  
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BRINKHUIS: ...by plans to exit the province so it can continue to

oppress and to exploit the poor masses. I thank you very much, Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognize Minister David Maynier.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I was not in the House last week, but it is hard not to miss the fact that the hon Khalid Sayed has taken the seat normally occupied by the Leader of the Opposition, who, when I last looked, was the hon Cameron Dugmore. Perhaps the hon Pat Lekker... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... who speaks in a few moments, will tell us... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! Order members!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...in what is clearly a divided, demotivated and defeated party.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members! Remember, we have members on the virtual screen that need to be able to hear the Minister. Please let that not be an alarm. Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: It is a call of distress from the former

Leader of the Opposition. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister, Minister, if you can just take your seat. Hon members, just give us a second. If that is a fire alarm or not we may have to adjourn for a moment. If you can just hold on, please.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Panic in the ranks!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: People in the House... [Pause.] Thank you very much. That was a false alarm, with much relief. Hon Minister, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you so much, Deputy Speaker. I would also like to take this opportunity to congratulate the hon Reagan Allen on his 100 days and I would also like to note that it was so good of COSATU to join me instead in celebrating this important milestone. They must surely have been marching to the National Assembly, but then got lost and ended up out here celebrating your 100 days.

Deputy Speaker, if we step back, we lead the rest of the country in driving innovation to improve the quality of education of our learners and the education that they receive in the Western Cape. We have used the space available within our provincial mandate to implement innovations, including collaboration in schools, the school evaluation authority, annual systemic testing, and of course, most recently our intervention to reverse learning

losses in the foundation phase. Our Province is clearly seeking to move forward, but too often we find that National Government and its fellow travellers hold us back, but I can assure the people of our province that we will not back down from trying out new interventions to support our learners, and from creating new learning opportunities in the Western Cape. As members of this House are aware, we recently announced that our Province will be taking decisive action over the third and fourth term to enable an increase in time allocation for mathematics and reading in the Foundation Phase. These are the grades that were most severely affected by the COVID-19 pandemic and we must do everything we possibly can to ensure that our young students are not disadvantaged in later grades. The intervention will not increase the length of the school day, but that our learners have more teaching time in these critical subjects and we are pleased that this received the unanimous support of all parties in the House. Our Department is uniquely placed to identify and tackle learning losses because this of course is the only province that performs annual systemic tests in languages and in mathematics and of course, these internationally benchmarked tests can pinpoint the specific areas where learners are struggling and it is on the basis of this that we can implement the kind of forward thinking interventions that are needed to support our learners in the Western Cape.

Deputy Speaker, as a province, we are also leading the way in developing new types of partnerships in our schools to allow public schools to access additional resources and explore new ways to improve schooling.

Yesterday I visited Apex High School in Eerste River, an award-winning school that is implementing unique teaching and learning programmes to ensure that no learner is left behind. Many members will not be aware but this is a collaboration school, which is a partnership allowing the school to implement programmes such as reflective learning, which provides a personalised catch-up course to bridge learning gaps for individual learners. This kind of flexibility and support is unique to collaboration schools and is unique to the Western Cape. Without this model, hundreds of learners from our poorest communities would not have the opportunity to access quality education. The innovation by our province in schools stands of course, in stark contrast to the direction taken by National Government, which is currently engaged in an assault on provincial and school governing body powers through the Basic Education Laws Amendment Bill and as I have mentioned earlier, given the way in which collaboration schools are delivering quality, no-fee education to hundreds of learners in need, it is surprising that SADTU and Equal Education are joining forces to block the establishment of these schools. This unique model is delivering excellent results but it is being opposed because it is new, because it is innovative and because it works creating hope for learners in poor communities. This is the sad reality we face. While we try to move forward they try to hold us back. While we try to build up they try to break us down and while we seek to open up they seek to shut us down. If National Government and its fellow travellers believe that this will stop our Government from delivering on its mandate they are sorely mistaken. We will not rest in our efforts to achieve

our vision of quality education for every learner in every classroom in every school in the Western Cape. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister Maynier. I now recognise hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. The ANC welcomes this debate because we must expose the inefficiencies, lack of service delivery and transformation by this Provincial Government with the powers they already possessed. 20 years ago a member of this House stood up in this House and said:

“I have an African dream, but there are people in this House who have an American-European dream...”

Quoting Vicky Sampson’s hit song, the member went on to say:

“No more walls, no more walls, no more anger, my African dream, there is a new tomorrow...”

Deputy Speaker, that member who stood up two decades ago, who speak unity and building a better South Africa, was none other than hon Peter Marais. Today the hon Marais wants to build walls and sing of a white Freedom Front Plus, not a white DP. He is dreaming of a white Freedom Front Plus, just like the one he used to know where the Coloureds are tokens and promises broken

and councillors shunted to and fro. He is dreaming of a white Western Cape.

Today, we can easily include the Freedom Front Plus as a party stuck in the past, which cannot find itself at peace in a new South Africa, where majority rules. Today the very people who want to defend the Constitution against amendments of land redistribution are calling for the Constitution to be amended for their racist purposes. Today, it is very difficult to find people especially in this House, to admit that they supported apartheid. Yet it is through debates such as this, that we find those who have taken off their masks to reveal their racist selves.

Even today, as we see members of the DA, not only the Freedom Front Plus who supports this racist call to devolve powers, people who simply do not want to be governed by Africans, people who simply believe that Africans cannot run a country – racism to the core. This debate is not about efficiency or good governance.

If it were Jooste Hospital you would have long been replaced because health is a provincial competency. In 2014 when Theuns Botha closed Jooste Hospital, the DA-led Provincial Health Department, a competency full in the hands of the Province, said that the replacing facility will be opened in 2019. Eight years later, a full eight years, the facility is still in Phase 1. DA infighting between Botha and his fellow members in the DA eventually led to Botha resigning.

Who suffered at the end of the day, the poor who are reliant on the services



provided by Jooste Hospital. Our appeals for support of Mitchells Plain Hospital, Khayelitsha Hospital and Ceres Hospital have fallen on deaf ears. Luckily, we have the Constitution of the Republic, which allows us to appeal to our colleagues in the National Parliament to intervene. These are but some of the disasters in our provincial health, a provincial competency. Please do not refer us to ANC-run provinces. ANC provinces are not asking for more competencies. ANC provinces are not calling for more powers.

The MEC of Education, provincial competency, failed to appear before the Standing Committee meeting on Tuesday past. The topic of discussion was non-placement of learners and the difficult application system. In a multi-partisan approach the ANC called for the presentation by the MEC, and his Department so that we can assist the Department in this application process and prevent thousands of learners not being placed annually. These thousands of unplaced learners and those struggling with the online application system come from the ANC constituencies, the poorest of the poor. The MEC refused to make a presentation and be held accountable. Even worse still, the Chairperson of the Standing Committee agreed with the MEC that he did not appear. The DA members of this Legislature covering for DA members of this Executive, and yes, and yet this motion calls for more powers of the Legislature. Education is a provincial competency, and it is but one disaster which appears, happens annually.

The Provincial Constitution calls for the establishment of an Environmental Commissioner. Today Driftsands Nature Reserve, in the heart of a poor

community, but hosting some of the rarest species of flora in the world, is being deproclaimed. Yet there is power given by the Provincial Constitution to the Premier not being used.

When we have a perfect, perfect Education Department and healthy Health Department, when the Premier of the province is doing a sterling job...

[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...at implementing the Provincial Constitution, then we can come and have this academic debate in this House on subsidiarity. The MEC for Community Safety stands up today and brags to the media that in his 100 days he has done a sterling job. Surely the hon member Marais must ask what gangster in this province fears the MEC? What drug dealer will take this Committee ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... and MEC ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): What drug dealer will take this Committee and [Inaudible.] MEC for Community Safety *nogals* seriously? Yet members of

this House want SAPS to be under their comedian.

The motion calls for more provincial powers on land reform. The MEC for Agriculture is clear he will not emphatically support emerging African and Coloured farmers. When Casidra advertised funds from National Government for these farmers during COVID-19, the MEC instructed the withdrawal of the ad calling for applications. The ANC does not only read about land reform, we live with the injustices of land distribution in this country. The ANC does not only read [Interjections.] ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! Order, members!

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): The ANC does not only read about crime, our communities where we live [Interjections.] are ravaged with crime, drugs and our women ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... and children raped. The ANC does not only read about poor schools or poor health services [Interjections.], we live in these communities where our grannies must go and sit in [Interjections.] a queue from 3 a.m. Our children are the ones that are not placed. Our children are the ones losing schools daily, yet we see this disaster and we insist that our country is one that we want to be able to rely on National Government to intervene when necessary. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Hon members, I know you are having conversations across the way, but I cannot always hear the hon member speak. I now recognise hon Peter Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you so much. This was a very useful debate. Apart from some skewed interpretation of what devolution means, generally I think it was of a high quality and I want to thank members on this side of the House. I also ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P J MARAIS: I want to remind ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr P J MARAIS: ... hon member Lekker ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! I cannot hear.

Mr P J MARAIS: ... and Xego, I want to remind them that currently South Africa is run by an intellectually ill-equipped oligarchy. A small but powerful group of people who is running this country and they are drooling at the thought of replacing your President in December. That is how sure you are of 2024. [Interjections.]

We in the Western Cape ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr P J MARAIS: ... will be left as sitting ducks should the RET faction in the ANC emerge victorious. [Interjections.] We need to extricate ourselves from central domination. [Interjections.] Let me teach you what a famous writer has wrote, Maxwell J.

“If leaders demonstrate competencies, genuine concern for others and admirable character, then the people will follow them.”

Now I asked you why has the people stopped following you? [Interjections.]  
Is it not because you lack all these things?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr P J MARAIS: Here in the Western Cape we had such hon members of the ANC sitting here [Interjections.], but you are being led by corrupt people ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr P J MARAIS: ... that sit in National Government. You do not say what you believe, you say what you are taught by corrupt Ministers and if you

deviate you are out. I can say what I like and I will stay here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you ...[Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: That is democracy.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise the hon Minister Bredell. You are two minutes are finished.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... hon Deputy Speaker.

Hon Deputy Speaker, this debate has covered a lot of ground, but allow me to bring us back to the essence of the matter before us today. The principle of subsidiarity.

Subsidiarity is a general principle that says that Government should take place as close to the people and to the citizens, as possible. Subsidiarity protects lower levels of Government against undue interference from a National Government. Subsidiarity promotes the placing of functions and

powers at the lower level of Government where possible.

The European Union is a good example where the principle of subsidiarity is strongly embedded. The central EU bodies only exercise powers when they cannot be exercised by individual member states. Internationally the principle of subsidiarity is often recognised as important for the development of Local Government systems.

Back at home in South Africa our Constitution also speaks to the principles of subsidiarity. In Section 156(4) the role of Local Government is protected and it encourages National Government to transfer functions to Local Government where possible.

Hon Deputy Speaker. we have heard arguments ranging from police, land reform, education and health. That makes out a very strong case for transferring funded mandates in these, but also other spheres of responsibilities from our National Government to the Western Cape Provincial Government.

Hon Deputy Speaker, our situation is different from the European Union. Where the EU is working to benefit its members, our National ANC Government is clinging to power for the sake of its own political survival. Let me rephrase, our National ANC Government will throw its people under the bus if it is allowed them more time at the feeding trough. For us in the Western Cape it is a fight for getting what is rightfully ours.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I want to thank the hon member Marais [Interjections.] for this debate. He is quite right when he speaks to the budget of provinces, the shrinking budgets of provinces and Local Government because of the stealing and looting at a national level. We will not rectify that, hon member Marais, before we look at a different financial model because as long as the national corrupt ANC is in control of the money coffers of this country, they will keep the power there.

I want to congratulate the hon member Allen with his 100 days and thank you for your hard work. I have picked up on the CSI 60 minutes that it takes to solve a case. I think here it takes us 10 minutes to lose the dockets, but any case it is something that we need to look at, we definitely need to look at how can we protect our communities and I know that you and your Department will do your oversight role as good as you can.

To the hon member Mvimbi, you know the history is painful and nobody wants to deny our history, but I want to ask you what have the ANC done over the last 28 years, except for stealing, looting and running this country into the dumps?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Look at the Zondo Commission ...[Interjections.]



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you can just take your seat, there is a point of order. Hon member Sayed, what is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Hon Chair, on a point of order. Can the hon member Bredell speak through you please? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Bredell, please through me.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, they can just look at the Zondo Commission. [Interjections.] That is the commission which the ANC [Interjections.] President called into life and spent over a billion rand on to look at the looting of the ANC. They spent more than a billion rand, money that could have been used to support the poorest of the poor. That is what they have done.

This is not the race debate. This is an ANC failure debate, hon Deputy Speaker. The only thing that I can agree with the hon member Mvimbi is that diversity and unity is our strength and it is sad that the ANC have not realised that over the years and build us as one nation with one future.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, [Interjections.] I

want to congratulate the ACDP, hon member Christians, because yes, it is a broken state. ANC plays politics with our people's lives and they run, ja, they run from that ANC, they run from the green and yellow monster. You are quite right. You are a hundred percent correct, and the polls will show this.

Then I just want to touch also on the Standing Committee for Education. They did not refuse to appear before the Standing Committee, they just asked for postponement. They will come, they will enjoy it to come because we have got nothing to hide. We have got a good story [Interjections.] to tell and we will teach the ANC ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... how you invest in our children so that the whole of the Eastern Cape do not end up in the Western Cape.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the hon member Lekker has touched on a lot of things ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... hon Deputy Speaker, yes, and she started 20 years back and I think 20 years back the hon member Marais would

have, like most of us, had a lot of hope that the ANC will then build this country, unite the country and walk with the country. Nobody knew that they will just steal and loot and break it down as far as they go.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: So, and to the hon member Lekker I want to say, hon Deputy Speaker, that Africans can govern. Africans can govern. Nobody will deny that. The ANC cannot govern. That is the problem. The ANC can steal and loot, yes, that they can do damn well as well.

Hon Chair, but you know I would have been so ashamed if I was in the ANC because we sit currently with a 70% unemployment youth rate. We sit with a 40% unemployable, right? We sit with 13 million people who apply for a R350 grant [Interjections.]. A R350 grant ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Bakubaku-Vos.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... 13 million people apply for that. This is ridiculous. [Interjections.] It is a sin ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... they should be so ashamed of themselves, hon Deputy Speaker. So ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, if you can just take a seat. Hon member Sayed, what is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Hon Chair, to pose a question to the hon Minister Bredell about whether he is in the Opposition or in Government, but the question relating ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed, that is not a question. Is that a question?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, [Interjections.] when your National Government is as useless as ours you cannot not argue for more powers to be transferred to local levels. Police, land reform, education and health were debated today, but, hon Deputy Speaker ...[interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... what about Eskom, Transnet, SANRAL? What about SASSA? The disgraceful SASSA which must support the poorest of the poor, [Interjections.] must support women and children?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, order!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: The ANC is a complete failure, hon Deputy Speaker, and they sit here [Interjections.] with smiles on their faces. They should be ashamed of themselves.

Hon Deputy Speaker, every day we see how money is being stolen by cadres at a national level. Money urgently needed on a provincial and local level. We need new power stations. Instead we get Brian Molefe and Koko stealing our money at Eskom for themselves and their families.

We need trains, but we get a corrupt deal on trains that do not fit our rails. What an embarrassment.

We need new roads and harbours, but we get Minister Nathi Mthethewa who now wants to build a ridiculous flagpole. What a joke National Government has become.

Hon Deputy Speaker, these are but a few examples of our National Government ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... slowly squeezing service delivery and infrastructure development to death. This ANC National Government is not capable of serving and protecting our people. It is only interested in keeping its hands on the money and clinging to power.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape Government is making a very strong argument for more direct powers and budgets. Where we are in control service delivery to the people is simply better. Our safety and police oversight performance ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... support this. Our public and health performance support this. Education supports this [Inaudible.] ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... outcomes in the Western Cape support this. The Auditor-General outcomes support this ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... the Blue Drop, the Green Drop, our water quality support this ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, that is why the Western Cape Government supports this notion that allows the amendment of both National and Provincial Constitutions that will make provisions for the incremental devolution of further powers ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... to the Western Cape. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: ... very much.

Hon members, that brings us to the end of this debate. I do note that it has been a long time since we have had so many people in the House. Please may I remind you about the Rules and constant interjections. I am trying to allow much more of a free flow of comments, but please note that there are some Rules that govern that.

Thank you very much, hon members, we now proceed to Interpellations as printed on the Question Paper. I recognise the hon the Minister Allen. Over to you.

## **INTERPELLATIONS**

### *Illegal firearms: destruction of*

#### **1. Mr G Bosman asked the Minister of Police Oversight and Community Safety:**

With respect to the destruction of illegal firearms being centralised in Pretoria:

- (1) (a) What is the Department's position on the centralised policy and  
(b) would it not be best for such a competency to be devolved to provinces;
- (2) whether the province is in a position to take on this responsibility



if the mandate is devolved to the province; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

Thank you so much, hon Deputy Speaker.

It will be remiss of me to not highlight within this House that a *Daily Maverick* exposé highlighted the crimes of Colonel Prinsloo and within Mark Shaw's book it was stated that that particular crime of selling firearms to criminals here in the Western Cape was potentially the single deadliest crime in post-apartheid time.

So we have seen, hon Deputy Speaker, via parliamentary replies that illegal firearms that are confiscated here in the Western Cape or then bi-annually transported all the way to Pretoria, where it is then destroyed. That is a major risk. We have highlighted that risk continuously within this House and we will continue to do so.

In terms of this particular interpellation I wanted to thank hon member Bosman for raising it because it speaks to the previous topic as well, because we would ideally want to see the Western Cape have its own destruction site for illegal firearms so that we can do it on a more regular basis, but also ensure that guns never land up back in Hanover Park or in Mitchells Plain and kill many of our people. The deadliest single crime since post-apartheid era when an officer stole guns and sold it to criminals here in the Western

Cape. It was also estimated that around 9 000 guns were stolen and sold to criminals and I cannot overestimate that particular impact.

So, hon Deputy Speaker, in terms of Section 149 of the Firearms Control Act 60 of 2000, it imposes a compulsory obligation on the State to destroy firearms and ammunition which are forfeited to the State. The obligation to destroy weapons and firearms should clearly be a State function. The regulations of the Act require that no firearm may be destroyed without prior written approval of the Registrar and this function currently rest with the South African Police Service.

Hon Deputy Speaker, some of the greatest risk in the management of confiscated or stockpiled firearms and ammunition lies in the time between confiscation and destruction and the transportation and movement of firearms from one place to another. We have often heard in this House, in the media, that corruption is not only outside in national departments, it is even within our police service.

So the risk of transporting firearms and ammunition to Pretoria 1 500 kilometres away from where we are, from other provinces, obviously creates those risks. The Department is of the view that where possible the State must destroy confiscated firearms and ammunition within this particular province so that we cannot only oversee that, but also ensure that it does not land in Mitchells Plain, in Khayelitsha and in other areas.

So thank you, hon member Bosman, for raising this particular matter. The Province also in terms of its capacity to take on this particular responsibility, in terms of Article 9 of the Amendment of the SADC Protocol, it states that:

“State parties shall consider the safest and most economic option for the disposal of confiscated firearms, including burning them publicly or recycling them into non-hostile commercial or peaceful uses.”

It makes financial sense, hon Deputy Speaker. It also makes moral sense that it should be confiscated here. Furthermore, the Firearms Control Act regulations determine that:

“Firearms must only be destroyed under the regulation by melting, pressing or in another manner determined by the Registrar so that the original intent, design and purpose of the firearm or any part thereof is permanently and irrevocably destroyed.”

As a province we are obviously still investigating facilities ...[Interjections]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... are available and engaging the South African Police Service and this function is currently with the South African Police Service.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise hon member Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Through you, as hon member Mr Sayed would prefer us to do it, I thank the hon Minister for his response on this critical issue.

More than four months after raising this issue and requesting that the matter of a dedicated firearm site for the Western Cape be escalated to the National Department of Police, SAPS has now confirmed in a communique to this Parliament that the transportation of illegal firearms to Pretoria for destruction is not only costly, but it is also done at a high risk.

They further admitted that a decentralised process would be less risky and more cost effective to do. They have outlined that there are not any risk-free sites in the Western Cape with the melting facilities where these firearms can be destroyed, but in the past we have had two facilities. The ArcelorMittal facility in Saldana, currently that is no longer functional due to liquidity issues, and the Cape Town Iron and Steel Works in Kuils River which is still operational, but it is not recommended owing to safety reasons. Yet despite being aware of these risks, the National Government through the National Police Commissioner, has shown no initiative to establish a decentralised destruction site in the Western Cape.

This, hon Deputy Speaker, is a slap in the face to the countless families who

have lost lives and loved ones through guns provided by SAPS through Colonel Prinsloo.

When people get shot in this province, the National talking hat in the form of Minister Cele comes here and has an imbizo. Instead of having imbizos the Minister can put a dedicated destruction site in the Western Cape to ensure that hon member Bans' daughter is safe for her future. [Interjections.]

So through you, hon Deputy Speaker, can the Minister ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN: ... elaborate more on the investigations that are being done to establish a dedicated site in the Western Cape?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Bosman. I now recognise hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you to the Minister for the answer.

The question I have is as follows: there is a big risk by transporting the weapons twice a year up to Pretoria. I am thinking about innovation, hon Minister. When we looked at the court failing us, the Department came with the Court Watching Briefs to look at to up the conviction rate.

As your Department can you do something to make sure that those guns do not come back to the Hanover Parks, the Mitchells Plains? Because I think that is the biggest killer. [Interjections.] That it lands up in the wrong hands.

So I am looking at that, because I know what hon member Gillion is saying, but that it seems to me it is going to take forever. Do you have a plan to monitor to make sure, I do not know how, but some innovation to see that those guns do not end up in the streets, but get to Pretoria to be destroyed? Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians. Hon member Kama?

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Earlier today COSATU had to take away a mic from the MEC as he tried to misrepresent this Government as that which will work with COSATU, because they have sent many letters to the Premier and he had never responded.

Hon Deputy Speaker, as we mark the MEC's 100 days in office, we must quickly point out that violent crimes and mass murders are increasing, kidnapping and extortion syndicates are getting out of hand. The CPFs continue to be undermined and underfunded and our communities do not feel safe. So there is nothing to celebrate in his 100 days.

This Provincial Government is failing on its own Safety Plan. It is failing to

address causative factors of crime. It is driving young people to the life of drugs and gangs through the colour conscious poverty, unemployment and inequality, and yet it wants policing powers to be devolved to the Province. What are you doing to address the causative factors of crime and what are you doing to detect and remove illegal firearms from circulation?

We have a serious challenge of circulation of illegal firearms and ammunition in society and the Safety Plan has no strategy to address this. The DA clearly has a casual relation with gangs and therefore cannot be trusted with such an important competency.

The murder rate in the province, and Cape Town in particular, increased significantly because of decommissioned firearms that Christiaan Prinsloo and his cronies sold to gang bosses. It was an apartheid strategy to dump guns in the Cape Flats so that black and coloured people kill each other. Prinsloo is clearly an apartheid apologist and a possible supporter of the DA [Interjections.].

Around 2015 a Belhar ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr M KAMA: ... a Belhar DA white councillor submitted a letter in court appealing for a lighter sentence for a convicted 28 Gang member. The Western Cape, as one of the leading provinces with murder rate as a result of

gang wars, should preoccupy itself with more strategies to remove these illegal firearms than point-playing ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you ...[Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: ... politics and wanting some things that they will never get. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Kama. I now recognise hon member August.

Ms S N AUGUST: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Crime in South Africa is completely out of control. Daily we hear of the mass murders, mass shootings, robberies and all sorts of criminal conduct. The number of illegal firearms on the streets is worrisome. More so on the streets of the Western Cape where the province has seen over 400 shootings between June 2019 and December 2021.

If one should tie all this up with the investigative capabilities of the South African Police Service, the situation turns into a dire reality. SAPS has no control over the illegal firearms on our streets and how this further fuels criminal activities. I call on SAPS to consider the possibility of a Western Cape-based firearm destruction site as this would greatly influence the cost of transporting firearms to Pretoria and lower the risk of safety and security associated with these weapons.



As stated last week, SAPS is severely under-resourced and this is failure for our daily battle against crime. Instead we should consider ways that can assist National Government to expeditiously remove illegal firearms from our streets and if establishing a Western Cape firearms destruction site proves as one of the solutions, it should be considered.

All spheres of government should work together to combat crime and make South Africa a safer country. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise hon member Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you hon, Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, we all agree that violence is abhorrent and we all agree that gun violence is especially abhorrent, especially when it is State sponsored, when it is sponsored by the National Minister of Police in this country where guns aimed for destruction is actually sold by SAPS members to gangsters.

So I fail to understand how the shadow MEC for police oversight in this province can stand up and totally disregard the effects of gun violence in this province at the expense of protecting our national talking hat. I do not understand why hon member Kama can stand here and say that it is a Western Cape problem when it is national [Interjections.] guns transported by National Police ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

Mr G BOSMAN: ... by the National Minister. I really need to understand [Interjections.] how this is possible.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Bosman?

Mr G BOSMAN: That someone who is so ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you can just take your seat there is a point of order [Interjections.]. Hon member Nkondlo, can you give your ...

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Hon Chair, can the hon member Bosman, the Chairperson of Community Safety, tell us what is a national gun perhaps [Interjections.]? It is interesting, I have never heard of a national gun.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, hon members, that is not a point of order. Please continue, hon member Bosman. [Interjections.]

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I should have said “national looter”. I think they only know what national looters are, but we do know ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

Mr G BOSMAN: ... that these guns are sponsored by Mr Bheki Cele, the national talking head.

So when it comes to communities and holds imbizos and waste taxpayers' money, he is coming here to insult communities instead of providing concrete solutions.

So through you, hon Deputy Speaker, can I please ask our very capable Minister of Police Oversight to educate our hon MEC, our shadow MEC for Police Oversight on the process of disposing guns? Can you please, hon Minister, through the Deputy Speaker provide a detailed lecture to hon member Kama on what ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr G BOSMAN: ... the actual issue is that we are debating? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon the Minister Allen.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:  
Thank you so much ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, please! I cannot hear hon member Allen.

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY:

Thank you so much, hon Deputy Speaker, and once again I am baffled because hon member Kama would either agree that the Western Cape Government should have a dedicated destruction site for firearms, or he will be fine and happy with it being transported all the way to Pretoria. That is plain for everyone to see and it is plain for the communities to see and I would not want to be accused of misrepresenting anyone again.

So hon member Kama either agrees or he is fine and happy with the transportation, which happens bi-annually and I appreciate hon member Christians' input.

We are a government of innovation [Interjections.]. We are a government that is forward thinking under the leadership of Premier Alan Winde, so we will definitely consider. I was even already in my head thinking how are we going to drive behind that particular van and we are going to track it, but will I have the privilege just that once we leave the Western Cape what happens then?

So I am already thinking I would have to track it and maybe take hon member Kama with me so that he can get a first-hand experience in that regard.

So thank you for the innovative approach. We will definitely consider how we are able to do it because there is also interprovincial transport that will then have to be taken into account.

In terms of CPFs. In the first 100 days I would not want anyone to celebrate with me because we still know we have a long way to go. We still know that our work is continuing. So when we say that our goal is to have a dedicated destruction site here in the Western Cape, it is one leg also in order to see that the murder rate is reduced. We have an ideal goal that we say the murder rate must be reduced by 50%, but we know one murder is one murder too many. There are different legs and the Western Cape Safety Plan speaks directly to those socio-economic circumstances. [Interjections.] In front of me is Minister Sharna Fernandez ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... who has a Social Development component in the Safety Plan. In front of me is Minister David Maynier and there is an Education component [Interjections.] in the Safety Plan ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... we have other provincial Ministers that also have a component in the Safety Plan because it is that whole of government approach and, hon Deputy Speaker, [Interjections.] earlier on it was mentioned that no gang member will be afraid of me. I also would not want any gang member to be afraid of me, but what I do know ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... is that gangsters and criminals will be afraid of this Western Cape Government ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF POLICE OVERSIGHT AND COMMUNITY SAFETY: ... that is standing together and that is doing everything, everything in our power, even going beyond our scope and our mandate in order to ensure that our residents are safer.

So they should not be afraid of me, but they should be afraid of this Government. We are standing with the residents. We are fighting for SAPS to strengthen the hand of SAPS and having a dedicated destruction site here in the Western Cape is another leg component and it is plain to see it makes sense, it makes financial sense. It also ... it makes sense. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you [Interjections.], Minister Allen. We now move over to Interpellation 2. I recognise the Minister David Maynier.

*Mental health challenges at schools*

**2. Mr M K Sayed asked the Minister of Education:**

(a) What is the prevalence of mental health challenges at schools and (b) what are the detailed programmes in place to address such challenges?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you and thank you to the hon member for putting up this very important interpellation on the whole question of mental health challenges.

Hon Deputy Speaker, psychosocial support and wellness of course have been identified as a priority area for the Western Cape Education Department. The prevalence of mental health challenges is difficult to quantify, but in terms of the support required from our psychosocial support services in districts, the prevalent issues for learners include bereavement counselling, physical or sexual abuse or neglect, or mood disorders, or behavioural issues, witnesses to traumatic incidents, inappropriate sexual behaviour, substance abuse and teenage pregnancies.

The most prevalent issues which employees are accessing through the employee health and wellness programme are for trauma issues, personal relationships, work-related relationships and conflict, mental health issues such as depressive and anxiety disorders, and of course family matters.

The Department has a three-tiered approach to dealing with psychosocial or mental health challenges among learners. First high level support is provided by psychologists or social workers in circuits and districts, and this may include individual or group counselling or referrals to other Government departments, and of course moderate level support is provided at a school level in the form of case discussions with school-based support teams, or with individual teachers and through referral to community services, and then of course lower level or early intervention and prevention and proactive support are provided in the classroom, school or community level and includes workshops, training and online psychosocial support.

In cases where learners are manifesting symptoms of depression and may even be at risk of possible suicide attempt, or just need to talk to someone regarding their mental health, schools should contact the psychologist or social worker allocated to the school by the district support team, but in the case of more urgent needs, schools, parents and our learners may call the toll-free Safe Schools Call Centre on 0800 454 647 for assistance in locating immediate support.

The Department of course liaises with Safe Schools to supplement the services from the Department employed psychologists and social workers by working with the Department of Health and of course the Department of Social Development and many NGOs. Thousands of learners and teachers are reached through our well-being promotion interventions and one-on-one sessions dealing with anxiety, with bereavement, with depression, with abuse



and of course trauma.

Of course for teachers requiring support the Department has an employee health and wellness programme in place for all its employees. The service provides professional support for various issues, including family challenges, financial advice, relationships, medical advice and of course work-related challenges. Employees can contact the Employee Health and Wellness toll free number on 0800 111 011 to have a confidential conversation with one of their counsellors who will provide counselling support.

The Department also has a dedicated website for information for all employees about the programme and of course the services it offers. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I recognise hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Let me also thank the hon Minister for his response, quite forthright and a very, very useful response.

We enter these discussions not to score cheap political points, because it's a very, very sensitive matter affecting many learners in our community.

We also note on, I do not know if it is on a lighter note, but that there is talk

that the hon Minister may also soon be sitting in the Premier's seat at some point and we do look forward to seeing the dynamics around that, but, hon Chair, I want to commence also by quoting the professor at the Wits University, Linda Richter, who said, and I open quote:

“The consequences of mental ill-health, even in the short-term, are deeply injurious to the individual child and adolescent, their families and their society. Learning may stop and sometimes even regress interrupting their cognitive, emotional and social functioning.”

This is from her foreword to the South African Child Gauge 2021- 2022, which stated that children are vulnerable to a range of mental disorders. These include anxiety, depression, post-traumatic stress disorder, learning disorders, aggression, substance abuse, psychotic disorders, autism spectrum disorders and conduct, and attention deficit disorders.

The child gauge confirms that there are reasons to be concerned about mental health and well-being of our youth, especially school going youth. Now the effects of gang violence, bullying incidents, poverty that have taken place in our communities and the COVID-19 pandemic, have taken a heavy toll on the emotional well-being of learners, teachers and parents. Together with organisations such as Equal Education, we as the ANC in this House have been making emphatic calls to the Education Department to strengthen its psychosocial support structures, including ensuring that there is a social worker in every school and a psychologist in every circuit, not one in every

district, but in every circuit.

Today we want to ask the hon Minister, what has his Department done to respond to these specific calls? And what is his Department's plan to strengthen psychosocial support structures, including the deployment of social workers and psychologists to schools? The services listed in the Department's website in July 2020, including the employee health and wellness services provided by the Metro Health ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: ... and by the toll free number and the psychosocial support for learners to be provided by school social workers, psychologists, counsellors and social auxiliary workers were all ineffective.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Can we please get a response from the MEC? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Sayed. I now recognise hon member Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, firstly I would like to thank the hon Minister for the particular response.

Mental health challenges affect everyone, no matter where you work, how old or young you may be, and we have seen in COVID that this has been aggravated. Children during COVID could not see or play with their friends and it is crucial that we ensure that there are sufficient mechanisms in the education system so that every child is supported and in particular those also with special needs students.

We know that the Western Cape always seeks to find ways of doing so despite the constraints that we find ourselves in and based on this I would like to inquire from the Minister whether he is able to provide us with the number of psychologists and social workers that have been employed in our districts within the schools in the Western Cape. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Baartman. I now recognise hon member Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thanks, hon Deputy Speaker. The prevalence of mental health challenges in schools is a serious concern both for learners and educators. Bullying in schools amongst learners is one of the triggers contributing to mental health challenges and in the recent past we even witnessed some learners committing suicide as a result.

This issue is concerning because of often at times it is very difficult to identify learners or educators battling with mental issues until it is too late. In the recent past we had some educators asking for our assistance against the

Education Department for failure to conduct a conducive working environment that is safe.

We would like to concentrate on bullying and harassment for so far that they relate or would lead to mental health challenges. We have learners who bully both learners and as well as educators with the backing of an outside criminal gang at times. In our situation a learner even went to an extent to vandalising the female teacher's car. The teacher lodged a complaint with both the principal and Education Department and received no assistance whatsoever. That teacher also went as far as trying to complain with the South African Police Service and also did not receive any kind of assistance as the learner was referred to as being very young.

Now what I want to understand is that in situations where mental health challenges are caused to learners as a result of harassment by teachers or by both learners, what is the Department doing in such a situation? And also in a situation where educators are facing serious and enduring serious harassment from learners, what is the Department doing to save educators from such kind of circumstances that lead to mental and health challenges? Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise hon member August.

Mr S N AUGUST: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Schools are proving to

be and become important centres for mental health interventions. Drug-related problems, gangsterism, violence, poverty and anxiety are common factors of mental health challenges as pointed out by studies and by the MEC.

What we should be aware of is the intervention programmes and theory and as it presented by the MEC do not always filter down to those most in need of mental health services, counselling and support. South African communities are stricken with social challenges and these conditions often make it difficult for children to progress academically in support of working towards tertiary education.

Mental health is a multifaceted and the absence of functional intervention services often diminishes any opportunity children might have to break the cycle of poverty and socio-economic shortcomings. In turn the child submits the monstrous behaviour they grew up in and were subjected to. Measures of intervention should include the appointment of truancy officers, analyse how NGOs identify mental health cases. EPWP workers play a greater role as a schooling support structure. Put systems in place with various community stakeholders and adopt a family approach in dealing with mental health challenges at school.

I would like to ask the MEC how many counsellors are allocated to a school within the schooling district? How often do counsellors return to the learners to follow up counselling sessions and how many counsellors are currently employed by the Western Cape Education Department? Thank you, hon

Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

We have been saying as the ANC that to address this challenge we need an integrated approach between the Departments of Education, Health and Social Development to strengthen psychosocial support and mental health services in our schools.

We reiterate our calls for the WCED and the Department of Social Development to form a joint initiative to ensure placement of unemployed social work graduates in schools. This can even take the form of the Western Cape's own version of the Presidential Employment Stimulates. The situation at hand, as revealed by the Child Gauge and Equal Education's recent survey, demands of us to ensure that every school has at least one social worker, I repeat.

Given the glaring challenges of psychosocial support and the ineffective intervention measures by the Department – I am not saying that there are no measures taking place, MEC – it is time for a relook of the current measures. Can the MEC at least commit that he will be taking this matter up as one of

his Department's priorities going into the new financial year?

With regard to the partnerships held by NGOs for counsellors, social auxiliary workers and social workers to assist schools during the COVID-19 pandemic, can the MEC tell us how many of these are remaining in place and what was the impact of them?

Lastly, hon Deputy Speaker, I want to ask our MEC what his plans are to improve the effectiveness of the Safe Schools Call Centre which he spoke about. This is the call centre that learners call to report incidents of abuse and bullying. It is also used by our educators to report burglaries, vandalism and other related incidents and there have been many reports of a slow turnaround time. Spes Bona High School that we visited with the hon member Baartman and Mackenzie and Philander a few months ago, was broken into the day after we visited. The Safe Schools Call Centre was very slow in its response, but at least due to the intervention of the Committee led by the Chair, we were then able to engage them.

WCED by its own admission said that the Call Centre is mainly used by principals and school staff to report vandalism and burglary, and that reports of abuse and bullying by our learners are too few. Between 2013 and 2015 there were only, hon Deputy Speaker, 12 calls received from learners.

We also need to address the issue of staff composition of that particular Call Centre. It is unacceptable that there are only five trained psychologists



serving over 1 500 schools. Can the MEC please tell us what plans are in place to address this particular challenge? I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Sayed. I now recognise hon Minister Maynier.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The hon member Khalid Sayed must be relying on the State Security Agency for his information because of course it is completely false.

On a more serious note, the hon member Khalid Sayed, the hon member Baartman and the hon member August, I have been very clear that the psychosocial support is an apex priority of our Department and I think that that is evidenced in the resources that are provided.

The Department, as the hon member probably knows, has 64 circuits and in each circuit we have allocated a social worker and a psychologist and have 128 support professionals. We are the only Education Department in the country to have a social worker for every circuit, with some provinces doing referrals through the Department of Social Development instead.

We are also in the process of appointing social auxiliary workers to capacitate the districts and this of course is in the first phase. We have also appointed 160 care and support assistants in our high risk schools. In other words schools with a greater need for psychosocial support.

The CSAs work closely of course with the circuit social workers, and as the hon member notes some schools of course have their own social workers and counsellors appointed by their school governing bodies and of course as I mentioned in my opening remarks, the Department also works very closely with the Department of Social Development, as well as NGOs, to provide psychosocial support in schools across the Western Cape, but I will look into the matter raised by the hon member in relation to the Safe Schools Call Centre, which I will be briefed on in the next two weeks.

The hon member Xego raises a specific case which he is concerned about and I would be grateful if he would furnish me with the details of the specific case to which he referred so that I can look into the whole matter.

In closing, hon Deputy Speaker, I would like to remind members once again that psychosocial support and wellness is a priority of our Department, which is why we have 280 support staff across the province supporting our learners and staff over and above of course those employed directly by our schools.

These, hon Deputy Speaker, are difficult times and learners and teachers are in distress, and so I would like to say if you are in trouble or if you are struggling, please reach out to us. Speak to your teacher or call the Safe School hotline on 0800 454 647 to get the help you need. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. That brings us to the end

of Interpellations. We now move over to Questions as printed on the Question Paper. Just to remind our members, there are four opportunities for follow-up questions, that the member who posed the question gets the first opportunity. So we will now begin. I recognise the hon Premier Winde.

## **QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

### *Route B97: update*

#### **1. Mr M Kama asked the Premier:**

In light of the recent Enyobeni tragedy in the Eastern Cape:

- (a) What measures are in place to dissuade young children from alcohol abuse and
- (b) what is his Government's plans to curb alcohol harm in the province?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, and also to the hon member Kama, thank you very much for this actually very important question.

I must say that we are deeply saddened by the tragedy which occurred. You will all know as members of this House, the Enyobeni tragedy where so many young lives were lost in the Eastern Cape, and as you say it is a tragedy in

the Eastern Cape, but does this, or are we reflecting on it, and what does it mean for us, the youth in our province, and how are we dealing with it? And I want to say first of all on behalf of this Province once again our deepest condolences to those families who lost loved ones, and I think we all share in this tragedy together, and when tragedies happen like this we also have to reflect, we have to think are we doing the right thing? And this tragedy really underscores not only underage drinking, but also the way in which, I think, many traders flagrantly disobey their licence conditions, and if any person is witness to this in a Western Cape establishment, they must report it immediately.

I mean this tragedy and this loss of life surely says to those traders, to individuals in this province, if you are aware of this report, because otherwise you will have, if we have the same tragedy, blood of those people on your hands. Do not let it go, thinking that it is not your problem. It is all of our problem. We have seen this with COVID, that if we all stand together and tackle these issues together that we can actually find and achieve success together.

So I am calling on all liquor outlets to increase their vigilance. I am asking parents, I am asking citizens, please make sure that we do not enable this kind of thing to happen here. If you are the owner or involved in such an establishment, that you do not serve a single drink to anybody who is underage and put measures in place to ensure that this does not happen in our province.

Hon Deputy Speaker, we are determined to address alcohol abuse and have taken a whole of government approach to this. These interventions must be seen as additional to the role of each individual, which is the person who is consuming too much alcohol or consuming alcohol illegally because they are underage, parents and society at large in ending alcohol abuse. It is what we call the whole of society approach.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Department of Community Safety leads the following: first of all the Western Cape Liquor Authority. They conduct in themselves education and awareness activities about the harms associated with alcohol abuse. They work with communities, with broader society. These education and awareness activities include messaging about the negative impact of alcohol abuse and [Inaudible.] on children and young people specifically, and the importance of reducing the availability of or access to such alcohol. The conditions attached to liquor licences provide for proper control at all outlets to ensure that this is in the best interest of the public and the public are always protected.

The Western Cape Liquor Act 4 of 2008 provides or makes provision for the following specific measures to protect children being minors and the contravention and failure to comply with these provisions by licensees is an offence. And there is a huge range of them, as you can see this is a very long answer for this and I will get it to you, but amongst others, it says, no person may sell liquor to a person under the age of 18; no person may give or supply liquor to a person under the age of 18; or allow such person or in his or her

care or under his/her supervision to consume liquor; and so it goes on, not allow persons into the venue; make sure you have got adequate signage in place, etc. etc.

That is the Provincial Legislation, there is a whole raft also in addition to that, in the National Liquor Act, Act 59 of 2003, and that has also a whole raft of areas that outline what would be illegal in an outlet or in a licenced outlet. I can also say that during the last year, the 2021/22 financial year, the Liquor Authority follows through with regulatory interventions, with inspections, so we have had 13 425 inspections in the province; 317 integrated operations in collaboration with SAPS law enforcements and other agencies; six licences revoked; 107 suspension of licences; 89 warnings issued and stricter licence conditions imposed; 135 fines to the value of R3,76 million and so you can see that they have got the wherewithal of investigating. Again I must say we cannot just systematically follow this through, if anybody is aware, we also need to raise these issues with the authorities, so that we effect proper policing. You know illegal outlets are just that, they are illegal and so of course the legislation and the regulations are all about legal outlets, but we also have a huge issue with illegal outlets, and we need to be policing both.

I also want to say that across Government, because it is not only the whole of society, it is also the whole of government, so in each department there are different interventions, for example in the Education Department, and it is really good to see how alcohol and also substance abuse are dealt with across

Grades 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10 and 11 and each of them have sort of progressive programmes so that in Grade 5, you are really dealing with it. But you can see those programmes as it moves on, as our learners are moving from one grade to the next, they actually increase the depth of the discussions; the depth of the interactions around substance abuse; the effect of substance abuse, right down to saying how you can actually get help to deal with this from the WCED hotline, right to as we heard in a previous interpellation, how do we enable it through social workers in our schools, and of course that brings us to the Social Development Department. They too have a whole range of activities that they engage with around substance abuse and also creating that safety net so that we can make sure that when it is picked that we can actually help those young people get back on track. Right through to the Agricultural Department and looking specifically around the role that they play around alcohol. I think they are very involved in the foetal alcohol syndrome programmes. If we think about Transport and Public Works and their Safely Home programmes and even focusing right down to their TikTok and YouTube type programmes, focusing on youth and here they are focusing on youth that are 18 and are actually consuming alcohol, but also making sure that they get home safely, that they are not on our roads, etc. etc. and there is a whole range of interventions from radio spots to social media activities.

And then in (b) of the question, the Western Cape Government adopted an Alcohol Harms Reduction White Paper in 2017 which outlines the multi-pronged approach to prioritise the reduction of alcohol related harms. The

implementation strategy for the White Paper has been developed and a transversal Alcohol Harms Reduction Task Team was then set up. This team then comes forward with policy approaches; it looks at legislative changes; looks at issues, for example like pricing and the economy; unlicensed liquor outlets and the illicit liquor trade; enforcement; alcohol and road environment; health and social services; community based actions; education and awareness; information data collection; monitoring and evaluation; and institutional arrangements and then from there, what happens is we move into policy proposals and as we have right now, legislation that is actually being amended.

Of course, this again, is how we test to see if legislation actually helps us make a difference and this all comes from policy, because here this is where the Standing Committee and this Parliament can play a very, very strong role in effecting policy in bringing change to policy and then of course, the legislation as well.

Then, perhaps lastly, a huge opportunity which our team has been working on, and in actual fact I only got it through yesterday on the Alcohol Harms Team, we have attracted a global conference, it is a global policy conference on alcohol harms next year in October, so that again will be a platform, not only for us, but globally where policy makers come together across the world on Alcohol Harms and perhaps that is also an opportunity not only for us to show what we have done thus far, but also for us to learn, and for us to find ways to perhaps learn from others who have already put interventions in



place to make a difference so that we do not have such tragedies as we have experienced in our neighbouring province. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Premier. I now recognise hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, Deputy Speaker and let me sincerely welcome that lengthy response. I think this is what happens when you focus on what you need to do [Inaudible.] national. But I think, Deputy Speaker, as the Premier has said, that there was in 2017 this White Paper which was published on Alcohol Harms Reduction, and we believe it was a step in the right direction. And what we want to check now is how much Government spending has been set aside annually to fund these programmes which are related to alcohol harms reduction, than them being just a set of programmes in this particular Department, but a more focused programme in terms of addressing the alcohol harms. Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. I do not have the exact number here on budget spent so we would have to put that into a different question. But as I said, the White Paper set out a comprehensive set of interventions which I have mentioned; I went through them from pricing to unlicensed liquor outlets, etc. Those have already gone through the first draft, that draft has gone out to consultation, and it has come back again, we have already dealt with it a second time at a Cabinet level, made our suggested changes that has

gone again to that multi-party committee that is dealing with it. So it's the White Paper that gives the sort of frame-work to kickstart it and of course we will get the number, as the hon member asks, for the budget amount.

But in actual fact that is not the real area where we should be looking at spend. We should be looking at spend on how much is being spent in this environment on both sides of the equation. One is the regulatory environment, the policing, what has been put in place, but of course there is the other side of the equation which is not in the budget, it is the consequence and the measurement thereof and now that, I think is where we are starting to see some real traction coming out of our violence prevention tracking system through the Department of Health, so now we can start to ask questions on gender-based violence or alcohol abuse or drug abuse etc. because we are picking it up now in the measurement data. So I think that will be a really good conversation with the Standing Committee to say, are we asking the right questions, let us have a look at what we are measuring and then perhaps there is maybe a shortfall in saying, are we measuring the number of young people entering into the health system because of alcohol abuse and narrowing it right down to even alcohol abuse. Of course, we do know that our HECTIS system - and we really utilised this tremendously during the pandemic and national government utilised the data a lot during the pandemic because it is the only province that does measure alcohol abuse in our health system.

If I think back to the presentation that was made on Wednesday at the

Management Committee, you heard Dr Moodley now saying that that HECTIS system we really are looking to roll out at every single health institution that we have across the province, so that we are not only measuring in the five which have moved to the 27 but we are measuring them across the province because then we can also identify substance abuse, to gun shots, to knife wounds, to alcohol and we can even get a sub-set of alcohol in youth.

And I also think that coming out of that tragedy in the Eastern Cape, there is another area that we need to focus on. It is something that I know, I have kind had different portfolios in this Government over time, and I remember when I was the Agricultural Minister, I used to call the ale that is manufactured in this province liquid tik, because you do not know what is put inside that stuff and I mean we still do not. It has been quite long we have been trying to find out exactly what happened and what was the forensics on the detail of what happened to those young people that passed on. What was the cause, and I am distressed that we still do not have an answer on that. I mean we have got global best practice when it comes to detecting viruses and all sorts of things, we need to find out what it is. I have only got a gut feeling from what I have heard, what I have read that this was a concoction of various ethanols and things and that has gone wrong. If that is true, I mean that is murder, that is unacceptable, but we have also got businesses that do this. They find loopholes and they manufacture the stuff and people are addicted to it. So whether it is an alcohol or a drug it is the same thing, you get addicted to it, and we need to say then well what other regulations do we need to put in place?

The consequence or the reason why we have liquid tik in our market is because we thought we would write a good piece of legislation and we banned the *papsak*. We have said that the *papsak* was causing the problem. Well, the problem was we should have banned the liquid in the *papsak* and not the *papsak* because that is the container. Because now the container is that five litre plastic bottle with the same liquid in, and that is the problem. It is the product itself and how do we manage that through legislation and those are the kind of things that really do worry me, and have we got the right mechanisms in place to deal with this stuff when it ends up in the marketplace and we see the consequences thereof.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Premier. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker and my thanks to the Premier for a well-rounded response and I think it does take us somewhere indeed. In light of the Premier's positive response, could the Premier possibly tell us, with the benefit of hindsight, and given the tragedy that we are all reflecting on, would the Premier agree that it was perhaps wrong for the former MEC of Education and her Department to put forward legislation that now allows for the sale of alcohol at our schools albeit after school hours and during functions and will his Government reconsider, engage with the new MEC and see how we can reconsider that particular legislation? Thank you.

The PREMIER: [Audio connection lost] ... but I am not going to do that

because I think the hon Sayed really does not understand the power of schools themselves, government bodies and that piece of legislation. I only give him one example, one example. In my hometown we have a festival every year and this Oyster Festival creates thousands of jobs, and this festival happens to have a great component of it on a school sports field and that festival cannot continue if you could not allow ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members.

The PREMIER: ... if you could not allow the school to make the property available as part of their fundraising. Or perhaps it is for a wedding and that school hall is used for a wedding and they use the money for education purposes. And I would like to see, I would like the evidence, ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members.

The PREMIER: ... because of course, we change legislation based on evidence and based on impact of what that legislation brought in place.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, I cannot hear.

The PREMIER: I wish the hon Sayed to bring me the case of where alcohol is sold on school premises and is licenced in the way that he is saying. I would love to see that evidence and if he brings me that evidence then I would contemplate saying, let us talk about a change.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Botha and then hon Kama. Hon Botha? No. Over to you hon Kama, then hon Sayed.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. Premier, through you Deputy Speaker, so that member Sayed does not call a point of order – one of the arguments that is made in terms of why young people are encouraged to use or engage with alcohol is the issue of accessibility. You know everywhere they go – I think the Premier made a point here one time about broken homes in these previously disadvantaged areas and the mere fact that as they open their eyes, they see alcohol in their environment.

Now it is the schools. Now, shockingly, it is even at fuel stations. You know Pick n Pay sells alcohol at the fuel station, so I think the question is, does the Premier not think Government, through legislation, has a role to play to ensure that we protect other spaces from being used whether it is for fundraising – I get that – but that they are associated with the drinking of alcohol. Because a young person passing that particular school in the evening and people are drinking, does not know about an issue of [inaudible] drinking but knows the school as a place where you can also consume alcohol. So I think the question is does the Premier not think that there are spaces we need to protect so that as they grow up, they know these places to be places of this and not that which is causing much harm in our communities?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Premier?

The PREMIER: I think the right question would be ask how many licences have been issued to an application via a governing body at a school, because remember it is not the school, it is the event, the wedding that then says well we would like to serve a glass of champagne at this wedding and we are now hiring the school hall and the governing body says sure but you must make application, you must make an application for that licence. So it would be really a good idea because I mean of course ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members.

The PREMIER: ... if a school field was a shebeen on a Friday night, every Friday night, it would be exactly as the hon Kama is saying, young people would be going, hang on a second what is going on at my school? But it would be interesting to see if a single one has ever been issued in that ecosystem and environment. And of course, I think the hon member must also understand that in our society there is another way of dealing with it and that is saying well let us just ban it 100 per cent. But I think if the hon member reads history or understands that when it has been tried in the past, the whole prohibition and what happens around illegal manufacture and illicit markets and exactly what we saw happening when during the lock-down in the pandemic when it was absolutely banned, the illegal activity was unbelievable.

So you have to try and find a way to find a happy medium and that of course is what regulation is about, that is what policy is about and of course I would

welcome the ANCs input at this big international policy conference that is coming, they are more than welcome to put input there, ask questions and find out what happens in other parts of the world where it comes to liquor regulation and specifically liquor regulation around minors where it is illegal, absolutely illegal to sell alcohol to minors.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thanks, Premier. Hon Sayed, that is the final opportunity, done? Any further opportunity? No. Thank you, that concludes Question 1. We move over to Question 2, I recognise the hon Minister Maynier.

*Incentives to attract educators*

**2. Mr F C Christians asked the Minister of Education:**

- (1) Whether his Department has plans to increase educator totals in the province; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) whether his Department offers incentives to attract would-be educators to the profession; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker and thank you to the hon member for the question which traverses the whole question of educator totals in our province. Last month, hon member, I met with stakeholders ...



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please put your phones off, hon members.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ... as part of the Annual Consultation Process according to the Provisions of the Employment of Educators Act and announced that the basket of affordable posts for teachers will be increased by a massive 1,143 posts for 2023. This will allow for the appointment of up to 1,143 additional teachers to the current staff of the Education Department in the Western Cape. The details of the distribution of these posts are of course still to be finalised, as part of the stakeholder consultation process which will take place over the next couple of days. Of course, incentives for teaching are regarded as part of the conditions of service of teachers and the offering of any incentive is a competency afforded to the National Minister of Education as per the Employment of Educators Act. But of course, hon member, we do engage with universities in the Western Cape as to what areas of specialisation we require for teachers because around 600 Funza Lushaka bursary holders graduate and seek employment in our province each year and so we want to assure that we have a solid supply of teachers.

In addition, the hon member is probably aware we have a pool of educator assistants who have been making a huge difference in our schools over the past two years and I am pleased to report that in a survey that we did many of our assistants expressed their desire to join the teaching profession. These are the kinds of comments which were made by some of our educator assistants:

“It inspired me to study teaching, it is motivating for me and gives me hope and I am hoping that I will get a post when I graduate.”

Another educator assistant said:

“It has inspired me to follow my teaching dream because I love working with our kids.”

The Department also of course receives – and I am not sure if the hon member is aware of this – an allocation of 66 Funza Lushaka bursaries which are termed community or district based bursaries, for which we can nominate candidates without having them go through the national process and we are advocating these posts to our assistants to give them the opportunity to join the teaching profession and we are currently verifying with our assistants whether they meet the criteria for the bursary and we will nominate them if they do.

Of course, the hon member should also not forget that attracting candidates to the profession is not where the work ends. I recently visited the Cape Teaching and Leadership Institute where the training programmes include courses for novice teachers entering the system. It is important for us to support teachers right from the start so that we can develop and retain their skills in the system because, and I am sure the hon member will agree, our teachers, our principals and our staff are our greatest asset here in the Western Cape. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister, over to you hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Minister for that comprehensive answer. Of course, I think you also know that we are still worried about the educator/learner ratios. That is our biggest concern and I think the concern is the influx of learners that we get each and every year. So it is a good thing. If we have the same learner ratios that we have this year, but we get about approximately 20,000 learners from outside of the province, so will these 1,143 educators reduce the ratios in our classrooms? Just off, doing site visits in Mitchells Plain not so long ago you maybe have a capacity of 1,200 for the school but the capacity has now increased to 1,800 and there are no additional teachers to that. So I am just looking at that because year in and year out we sit with the problem of an influx of learners, and you think you have enough educators and then you do not and then we are still sitting with the teacher ratio difficulty. So, Minister, did you take that into consideration, learners coming in, and will that reduce the ratios? Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon member. Yes of course, the educator/learner ratio is of concern especially since we do have an average of 18,000 additional learners every year. But I am confident that the increase or the addition of 1,143 teachers next year, which is the biggest increase in many, many years, will go a long way to supporting us to manage

teacher/learner ratios and of course improve the delivery of quality education in the Western Cape.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Any further follow-ups? Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker and my thanks to member Christians for the question and to the Minister for the response. The Minister mentioned now and he reiterated the figure, the 1,143 teachers and I think this must be welcomed and we will most certainly monitor the level of deployment and we will monitor the manner in which this actually impacts on learning and teaching, but I just wanted to get a sense from the Minister, does the Minister feel that this is enough but more importantly at which particular circuits and districts will these be deployed to? Can the Minister maybe give us an idea as to the ratios per circuit and district because we know that there are certain districts where it is much needed, like Metro East for example? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The 1,143 additional posts ... [interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister, just one minute. Hon Smith, I see you, can you please mute your camera? Hon Smith is online. You may proceed

Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. The increase of 1,143 posts, hon member, is the biggest increase in many, many, many years in our province. But of course, if more resources were available especially more resources from National Government, I would have liked to be able to announce that we would have been able to employ even more teachers in our province. As to the distribution of those posts, per district or per circuit, as I said in my opening remarks, the distribution of these posts is of course still subject to a process which is determined in terms of the annual consultation process, which is determined in terms of the Employment of Educators Act and that process is still underway and will take place over the next couple of days in the Western Cape. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Any further follow-ups? Hon Sayed and then hon Christians.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker and my thanks to the Minister for that response. In the past there has been certain concerns raised, Deputy Speaker, that the additional teaching posts – and I think when we often fight for more teaching posts – those who are naysayers do raise this concern that the teaching posts are used to entice schools in poor and working class communities to take up more learners and that these often arrive late, these posts arrive late, so they get enticed to say look if you are going to have more learners, you are going to get more posts,

then the learners come and the posts come late. Can the MEC assure the House that these teachers will not be used to create more overcrowded classrooms and will instead alleviate the problems? What measures do we have in place? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Obviously, the situation which the hon member describes is something that our Department is eager to avoid and certainly we will not use these posts to, in his own words, “ entice schools to become overcrowded.” In fact, our objective is exactly the opposite. We want to create additional posts and utilise those posts to manage teacher/learner ratios and to reduce overcrowding in schools in the Western Cape. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Christians, over to you, final opportunity.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Minister, we always have a problem of late placements, and it makes it very difficult to allocate teachers to schools because of a late placement. What assurance do we have that those who apply timeously will be placed? Now people have three choices and usually they do not get their first or second choice of preference, they usually get the third one. I have been to a couple of parents that get the number 3's and not the number 1's because they want to have a better

education for their children, so just the assurance that people that apply timeously will be placed. Secondly that pupils that want to go to other areas – is there a possibility with the placing of the teachers that they will not just be: ‘I am from Manenberg so I must apply to the three closest schools to me, but I want my child to go the Claremont or to another area.’ Is there that possibility? Thank you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. In our province parents of learners are entitled to apply to any school of their choice and I would encourage them to do so. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. We now move over to Question 3, over to you hon Minister Maynier

*#BackOnTrack recovery plan*

**3. Ms D M Baartman asked the Minister of Education:**

In relation to the Department’s #BackOnTrack recovery plan:

- (1) Whether he expected the additional learning allocations to extend past the current academic year; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (2) (a) what are the other recovery plans already being implemented and (b) what are the details thereof?

THE MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker and thank you to the hon member for the question which deals with interventions in the foundation phase. As members are aware and as I may have mentioned in my speech a little bit earlier, last month we announced that our learners in the Foundation Phase will be spending an extra two hours on reading and an extra hour on mathematics each week to reverse the very severe learning losses caused by the Covid-19 pandemic.

This of course will amount to an increase of at least 60 hours per student in these subjects over the remainder of the year and we hope it will go a long way to reverse severe learning losses in the Western Cape.

And again, we are pleased that all parties in this House gave support last week to this intervention to get our learners back on track in these crucial subjects. The intervention of course will be monitored over the remaining weeks of the school year and a review report will be produced to inform the next steps that we will take in 2023.

But, of course, we are building on previous interventions. The following interventions have already been implemented and are in the process of either being implemented or procured to improve mathematics and reading. A synthetic phonics programme was rolled out to all English home-language schools to improve reading in the province.

An Afrikaans and Xhosa home language programme was piloted in 2021 and



2022 and will be fully rolled out in 2023 to all schools. An Afrikaans e-learning, e-classroom, was developed to support teachers in teaching reading through a synthetic phonics approach. Quarterly, virtual libraries have been provided to support reading at home and a procurement process is under way to provide a decodable graded reader to all schools for Grade 1 to 3 classrooms.

Maths curriculum online is currently being rolled out to about 500 schools in the province. A mental starters Maths programme is piloted in selected schools with the intention to roll out to all Grade 3 classes in 2023 and a procurement process is under way to provide Mathematics kits to selected schools in our province. And we hope that these interventions together with our important intervention to allocate additional time to Maths and Reading will go a long way to reversing severe learning losses in the Western Cape. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Over to you hon Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you so much, Deputy Speaker and thanks to the Minister for the answer. Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape is the only province with these systemic tests, and they are based on these international benchmarks so I am really excited that our children will have that extra two hours of Reading and an extra hour of Mathematics. It does not matter in which form that Mathematics comes, it is so important for children to be able to count and for children to have that mathematical background in

any industry that they end up in in the future. And I want to find out, Deputy Speaker, from the Minister, why the Department began with the Foundation Phase first in this particular programme and whether there will be a similar strategy for some of the older learners in other phases? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker and thank you to the hon member. As I mentioned earlier, our province is the only province to administer systemic tests and of course what we have found in these systemic tests was that the greatest learning losses were in the Foundation Phase, which of course, should not come as a surprise to hon members because that loss of contact, that loss of teaching time affects our youngest learners most because of course they tend not to have the maturity or the structure or indeed the self-discipline to cope with rotating time-tables and of course learning at home.

And of course, when we compared the 2019 systemic results with the 2021 systemic results, if you just take one data point which would be Grade 3, we see that there was a 13,8% drop in Maths and an 8% drop in languages and it is precisely for that reason that we thought that we should begin with the Foundation Phase.

As I have mentioned, we will of course be reviewing this programme and we will certainly be considering additional interventions for other grades in the

2023 academic year, here in the Western Cape.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. I now recognise hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much to the Minister and my thanks to the Chairperson of our Standing Committee for the useful question. Deputy Speaker, through you, given the intervention which we welcome on Mathematics, does the Minister not think that it would be also helpful to make use of some of the existing Maths and language tutors to support struggling schools? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I made the point earlier that we need to do everything we can to support learners in the Foundation Phase and I announced a number of measures that have been implemented and of course our new intervention, allocating more time to Maths and Reading. The intervention proposed by the member, yes, it sounds like a sensible proposal, and it is certainly something that I will discuss with my Department in the coming weeks as we consider further interventions here in the Western Cape.

†‘n AGB LID: Mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Good!]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Any further follow-ups? No.

Thank you, that brings us to the end of Question 3. We are moving over to Question 4. I now recognise the hon Minister Mitchell.

*Vehicle licensing centres*

**4. Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Minister of Mobility:**

With regard to vehicle licensing centres:

- (1) On which dates is it expected that larger vehicle registration centres, such as the (a) City of Cape Town, (b) Paarl and (c) George, will reach the maximum number of vehicles using the current numbering system of vehicle licence plates;
- (2) whether there are any other vehicle licensing centres that are also approaching a due date in the foreseeable future when the available numbers will run out; if so, what are the relevant details;
- (3) what is his Department's plans to resolve this potential issue?

THE MINISTER OF MOBILITY: I thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. Am I audible?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are loud and clear.

THE MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. Firstly, thank you to hon Mackenzie for the question. The first part of the question: it is difficult to determine an exact date on which a specific licence number range will run out because licence numbers are circulated on a daily basis by being issued to vehicles that are being licenced in the City of Cape Town and returning to the system for reissue for motor vehicles that are being licenced in other registered authorities. Notwithstanding this challenge, Deputy Speaker, the National Traffic Information System has built-in mechanisms to monitor availability levels.

In 2019, the City of Cape Town issued licence number CA999999 and subsequently the CAA licence mark was promulgated for use in the City of Cape Town. On 30 June, 2022 the City of Cape Town had over 1,3 million licenced motor vehicles and although many of those vehicles still have CA licence number plates allocated to them, there are thus more than sufficient number plates or numbers available for the foreseeable future.

On 30 June, 2022 Deputy Speaker, Paarl had over 85,000 licenced motor vehicles and there are thus more than sufficient numbers available for the foreseeable future.

On 30 June, 2022 Deputy Speaker, George had 78,000 licenced motor vehicles and there are thus more than sufficient numbers available for the foreseeable future.

The second part of the question, Deputy Speaker: no, there are no other registering authorities that will run out of licence numbers in the near future and the three previously mentioned registering authorities are the biggest in the Western Cape.

The third part of the question, it is not applicable, Deputy Speaker and the Department of Transport and Public Works has indicated that sufficient numbers are available for the foreseeable future. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister. Hon Mackenzie are you taking a follow-up?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Deputy Speaker and thank you Minister. No follow-up from my side, Deputy Speaker. Thank you for the comprehensive response.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Any further follow-ups? No. Thank you very much, that concludes Question 4, we now move over to Question 5. I recognise the hon Minister Fernandez.

*Child-headed households*

**5. Ms N Makamba-Botya asked the Minister of Social Development:**

(a) How many child-headed households are there in the province and (b)

what interventions has her Department implemented to assist them with whatever needs they have?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you to the hon Makamba-Botya for the question. It is a two-part question, question (a) a child-headed household is defined as household in which all members are younger than 18 years. At present there are currently 28 known child-headed households in the Western Cape. In terms of question (b), the Department supports child-headed households by providing funding to specialised NGOs that offer psychosocial support to the children when required, food parcels; the provision of school clothing; support for school fee exemption and oversight of school attendance. The children are also supported by community-based child and youth care workers or a designated family member or community member. Where needed the children are linked with drop-in centres where they can receive daily food and assistance with schoolwork and any other daily needs. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Makamba-Botya, are you going to take a follow-up?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Deputy Speaker and thank you to the Minister. Mine is just to check with the Minister in terms of, if any child is in that situation, how do they access such support from Social Development? She has made mention of the fact that they are utilising certain NGOs to cover that, so I want to know a child who is in that space, how do they get in

touch, in terms of getting answers to that support? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you to the hon member. There are various referral pathways. The one is directly through the Department of Social Development, at anyone of our 46 offices or any child protection agency like ACVV, Badisa or Child Welfare. Similarly, it could also be registered at police stations because SAPS also have a referral pathway as well as in Education where teachers would identify that the child is in a child-headed household and the Department of Education would refer that directly through to DSD. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Any other follow-up questions? I see the hon Botha.

Ms L BOTHA: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I would just like to ask the Minister, are there any child-headed households in the West Coast and how many are there if there are any?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, to the hon Botha. I do not have that stats available, however, I will ensure that the number of child-headed households be provided and I will pick up on the second



component in Hansard as I also have an outstanding response regarding 31 children from last week's sitting. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister. Hon Marais, over to you.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you. Minister. Child-headed households are a big problem with absentee fathers most of the time and these children are standing on the streets, and they are begging and that is definitely something that should be addressed. A child is not supposed to work in the first place below the age of 16, but they stand on corners begging for money. That can be construed as a type of job. What do you intend doing about it? Can you and the City come to an agreement on how to tackle this problem of child beggars at robots and street corners?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you to the hon Marais. It is a new question but I will answer it. Many of the children who beg on street pavements are actually not in child-headed households. They have parents, they come...I can give you examples of which children might come from Atlantis and beg at Table View robots and they will choose streets across the city, the Metro.

These children, sometimes beg because they are hungry, but often we find

that these are children that are being used criminally and they are in conflict with the law.

So, what I have discovered is that the minute I see a child begging, I would necessarily phone and say, 'can you please check on this?' The children, unfortunately, are streetwise. The minute they see a GG, they would relocate from that particular corner to another street corner for three or four days. So, we do have a plan and/or the social workers are there in the regions and there are children that are known to us.

Unfortunately, we cannot just take them off the streets because there is a process and if they are not children with behavioural problems or addiction or they are criminally charged, we cannot just place them in a Child and Youth Care Centre, and this is the crux of the matter. Children run away from home because home is an abusive space.

Over the weekend, I spoke to a young boy, and I asked him, '*nou, hoekom gaan jy nie huis toe nie?*' 'Now, why do you not go home?' *Hy sê, 'want my ma en pa is dronk, mevrou, en as ek by die huis kom gaan hulle vir my slaan.'* He said, 'because my mom and dad are drunk, ma'am, and when I go home, they are going to hit me.' I asked the young boy why he does not go to school, and he said to me his mother is too drunk to prepare his lunch and to assist him with clean school clothes. And out of shame and guilt, he has decided not to go back to school.

So, that is not a child-headed household. We then attach a social worker to that family, and we look at strengthening the family unit in trying to understand what is happening. In most cases, either the mother or the father is experiencing substance use disorder and that requires an intervention. And then, we need to look at the entire home situation and see whether the children need to be placed in foster care if they are neglected, and if they are not neglected, we need to provide that family with the necessary psychosocial support to help them get through that.

It is unfortunate that post COVID-19 we are seeing more children out of school because the rotation, the Monday/Wednesday/Friday rotations throw them out, but we are certainly working very closely with Education, especially around children who are not in school who should be in school. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much to the hon Minister and just following on from the hon former Premier's question. I want to thank the hon Minister, I think, for the collaboration with the Department of Education. It is a long time coming, but can we just get a sense as to what type of work is the hon Minister's Department doing to investigate exactly the number of child-headed households which were created by COVID-19 in particular? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you to the hon Sayed. That is a difficult question because we would only know once a matter is reported. So, we rely on community activists, we rely on members of Parliament, we rely on various agencies to alert us. But normally, you would pick it up if you saw a child begging.

You might, you are quite likely to find that that child has taken to the streets because of poverty at home or the fact that his or her parent may have relocated. And you see this especially in rural areas where the children live in one town and the parents might work in the Metro, and they are not comfortable with the guardian or the family member they are assigned to.

So, I cannot say definitively that we are actually looking for child-headed households. It is reported through the various referral pathways and that is how we would be able to assist, but as I said, when it is known to us. I am certain there are more that are not known to us, and I would rely on every hon member in this august House to alert us as soon as possible, if they become aware of any such situation. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. That brings us to the end of this question as well as to the end of Questions as our time is up. Outstanding replies will be printed in Hansard.

Hon members, we now move over to Statements. I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

### **STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS**

Mr D PLATO (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. I wish to use my Member Statement to place on record my disgust at the current state of affairs at the offices of the South African Social Security Agency in Khayelitsha.

In mid-July, SASSA abruptly shut its office which serves as a vital lifeline for thousands of grant recipients in a week. The office will have been closed for an entire month. For a moment, I would like all of us to put ourselves in the shoes of those thousands of people who cannot access grants, who cannot buy food and who are now told to go to SASSA office outlets far away, away from their area, incurring travel costs which they cannot even afford. How can we allow this situation to stand, to continue? How can we tolerate such categorical failure?

SASSA says that it was forced to close its offices due to renovations, but the Provincial Department of Social Development operates out of the same building and has seamlessly moved to alternate premises where they continue to serve the residents of Khayelitsha. This situation did not have to be the disaster it has become, but SASSA has made it this way. They pass the blame onto the City, suddenly demanding that they are supplied with facilities to

cover for their own uselessness.

In conclusion, hon Deputy Speaker, SASSA does not fall within the purview of the Western Cape Government, but the hon Provincial Minister of Social Development, hon Sharna Fernandez, has taken it upon herself to meet with her national counterpart to resolve this situation because she knows that we cannot allow this situation to continue. The example of the Khayelitsha SASSA office illustrates in the clearest possible terms, the difference between two spheres of government: Western Cape Provincial Government which works timeously to help its citizens and National Government which does not. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, I now recognise the ANC.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The African National Congress in the Western Cape would like to applaud the ANC nationally, on the policies that were proposed by the delegates who were deployed to the 6<sup>th</sup> National Policy Conference. In his opening address, the President touched on restoring State-owned Enterprises and rebuilding public entities. The Economic Transformation Commission proposed the protection of SOEs and those without a strategic role to contribute to the developmental mandate.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the proposals made this past weekend were what the ANC in the province has also envisioned for the economic future of our

country. These SOEs will contribute to the economic growth and development of South Africa, while alleviating the harsh unemployment conditions currently faced by the country. In support of this, President Cyril Ramaphosa acknowledged in his closing address that the SOEs should be stabilised, restructured and effectively capacitated to drive inclusive economic growth.

In addition, hon Deputy Speaker, another proposal commendable by these delegates is the proposal for reaffirmation of the necessity of a state bank and the accelerated process of establishing one. The state bank will be a driving force in economic transformation. Our goal is for an inclusive, non-racial, non-sexist country for the people of South Africa and the current banking sector does not demonstrate that. The introduction of a state bank will priorities inclusion, rather than marginalisation.

Hon Deputy Speaker, these policies are a clear testimony that the ANC's main objective is to liberate the people of this country while not losing focus in stabilising the economy, with an end of a developed South Africa. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the EFF.

Mr M XEGO (EFF): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The Economic Freedom Fighters welcomes the decision of the Stellenbosch University to expel the student, Theuns du Toit. Du Toit was expelled with immediate effect

following the recommendation of the University's Central Disciplinary Committee, which found him to have contravened provisions of the University's disciplinary code, as well as residence rules.

This follows actions of his racist conduct for entering the room of a fellow black learner and urinating over his belongings. The recent expulsion will go a long way in teaching those with racist mindsets that racism has no place in our society, be it in an academic institution, workplace or anywhere. We also hope that this decision will serve as a precedent to other institutions of higher learning, which have ideological roots in colonialism and apartheid, and which have often treated racism with soft gloves to an extent that they often fail to even apply their codes of conduct.

The Western Cape Education Department should also draw a leaf from this latest development and make sure that all schools have codes of conduct which embody zero tolerance for racism, and make sure that the racists are expelled from schools. As the EFF, we hope that this is not the end of the matter for Du Toit, as we expect law enforcement officials to also wrap up their investigations and send him for prosecution. Society should frown and act against racism of all forms, no matter the age of the perpetrator. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the Democratic Alliance.



The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, this week marked the beginning of Women's Month, a month where we celebrate the brave women who rejected the apartheid regime on 9 August 1956, as well as the countless other women who contributed to building a free and democratic South Africa. Since then, women have progressed significantly in society and assumed important roles in our communities.

Despite the fact that much has been accomplished, we indeed still have a long way to go in the fight for gender equality and the protection and advancement of women's rights. Women still live in fear in a supposed free society as seen by the appalling statistics on cases of gender-based violence in the nation.

Today, I would like to acknowledge the Western Cape Government's ongoing efforts to guarantee the dignity and upliftment of young women in the Western Cape, through GBV interventions and empowerment opportunities. The Western Cape is leading the fight against GBV with the Provincial Social Development Department, making significant efforts to guarantee that victims of GBV have access to safety, such as dedicated GBV shelters and Thuthuzela Centres, as well as offering counselling and mental health services to women in need.

The Province is also leading the way in uplifting women with the opportunity to upskill themselves via the hon Premier's Advancement of Youth Project. Over 60% of the 485 young people involved in the project, are female. These young women have been offered a once in a lifetime encounter that will equip

them with the skills, knowledge and experience necessary to enter the labour market and build their careers.

Additionally, a framework was established by the Western Cape Human Settlements Department last year that enables contractors, with a majority of female owners, to register for projects during the 2022/2023 financial period, expanding the possibilities for women in the construction industry and serving as a role model for young girls across the province.

Last year this time, women made up almost half of the Western Cape's LEAP officers who are deployed into some of the most dangerous neighbourhoods in the province. Yesterday, the hon Premier Alan Winde also participated in a foot patrol in Bonteheuwel with some of our women in the blue, together with the Cape Town ...[intervenes]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...Metro Police and SAPS colleagues. The DA in this Provincial Parliament commends the Provincial Government's commitment ...[intervenes]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...towards pursuing gender equality and building a more fair equitable society. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I recognise GOOD.

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Homelessness is becoming a grave challenge, both in the City of Cape Town and the municipalities across the Western Cape. I have spoken about this before and will continue to speak out until the Government and the Department of Social Development musters the political will to find a workable solution to address this spiralling challenge. About 200,000 South Africans sleep on the street. Of that, about 4,600 in the greater Cape area, although later research suggests that the number be more than 14,000 and approximately 700 in the CBD. Homeless people are being referred to as unsavoury, criminalised, space-takers and often treated with great disgust and subjected to inhumane treatment.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I have one question for the people of this province: is the Western Cape Government, and more specifically, the Department of Social Development under the leadership of the hon MEC Fernandez, doing enough for you to find a permanent solution for homelessness? The Cape Town Mayor was recently alarmed at the upsurge of homelessness and has called for the City to respond first and foremost in a way as humane beings helping human beings. How hypocritical when the same DA criminalises homelessness and poverty? There is no separation between Government and homeless people. They are citizens in need of your help. Do something about it. I am calling on a greater cooperation between the Province and all local

spheres of Government for decent, humane shelters, feeding schemes, rehabilitation centres and proper functional services. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, the ACDP is extremely concerned by the attacks on long-distance busses. On Sunday, 31 July 2022, an attack on an Intercape bus resulted in the bus driver being admitted to hospital for gunshot wounds he sustained in the attack. This is, but one of the series of attacks on long-distance bus drivers. In April this year, a 35-year-old driver, Bangikhaya Machana, died of his wounds after an attack on a bus he was driving. He leaves behind his widow and two young children.

The careless attacks occur while drivers are on duty applying their skillsets to provide for their families. Damage to these busses and intimidation of drivers seems to be the key to these attacks. Busses are attacked by forces intent on stopping them from performing their primary function and that is namely, to transport passengers from one city to the other. It was reported in the *Daily Maverick* on 2 August 2022 by the Intercape CEO, Johan Ferreira, that the murder of bus drivers is part of a campaign of violence against the industry. Intercape has pointed fingers at the taxi industry. Between January 2021 and February 2022, more than 150 attacks on these busses were reported to SAPS. The operators say the failure of the police to make any arrests so

far, will lead to further bloodshed. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I recognise the ANC.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much. Hon Deputy Speaker, the ANC is deeply concerned by the continued undermining of the oversight role of this Legislature by the Democratic Alliance, which strongly condemned the deliberate flouting of Rules of this august House in order to cushion hon members of the Executive from accountability, even when the hon members of the Executive and the case, the hon Education MEC do actually want to be held accountable.

This tendency has taken the form of questions that go unanswered by MECs with no consequences and municipalities like the DA-run City of Cape Town simply deciding that they are no longer accountable to this Legislature through the hon MEC for Local Government. This speaks to concerns raised by the hon Chief Justice Raymond Zondo in the Zondo Commission Report.

The latest incident happened earlier this week when the Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Education, the hon Baartman, unilaterally decided to cancel an important meeting to discuss the persistent challenges of unplaced learners across the province, on the request of the Education MEC. A meeting which was agreed to as early as June 2022. The *sub judice* principle was abused to stop this meeting from taking place.

Based on our legal advice which we have sought from two senior counsels, there is no basis for using the *sub judice* rule to block discussions on the 2023 admissions in particular. Moreover, the 2023 admissions are not even the focus of the Equal Education Law Centre's legal action against the Metro East District of the Department. They speak about 2022 and its possible impact on 2023. They merely mention 2023.

This is a textbook case of subversion of democracy where committee chairs are used as hired guns in order to protect a provincial government. The scheduled meeting was even removed from the programme before the Programming Authority even met.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, please.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We have written to the hon Speaker to ask for his urgent intervention on this subversion of democracy. If the hon Speaker fails to deal with the matter adequately ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...we will have no choice, but to consider legal action so that the Legislature can discuss ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...the learner placements and we can find collective solutions.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed. I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker. Am I audible?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I can hear you. You are just going to have to raise your voice a little.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. As we start Women's Month, we have an opportunity to reflect at the progress being made towards gender inequality and women empowerment because not much progress is being made.

Unfortunately, in a society where crimes have reached epidemic proportions, this reflection is at the risk of being marred by the fact that we have a Police Service not capacitated enough to deal with the illegal guns in our streets. Illegal guns that are being used to slaughter the women and children in our communities, illegal guns sponsored by our National Government.

The inability of the Traffic and Police Service to dispose of illegal firearms was reviewed by SAPS themselves when they stated that transportation of illegal firearms to Pretoria for destruction is not only costly, but it is also of a high risk. The fact that they also admit that the decentralised process in this regard would be less risky and more cost-effective shows that they have no initiative to deal with this issue.

Now, there are many other factors that lead to crime and violence in our communities. This admission indicates that SAPS themselves is a stumbling block to the reforms we need to take illegal firearms off the streets. Hon Deputy Speaker, it is time for decentralisation of such mandates to be taken seriously so that our attempts to make society safer for residents can truly be realised. If National Government does not do this, they will continue to hand illegal firearms straight into the hands of the people who seek to do harm. It is time for action. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bosman. I do not think that the Hansard would be able to completely decipher that two-minute Statement and it has unfortunately, I think, it would be to your disadvantage. I would suggest that you send a copy of that Statement in for Hansard printing, please. Hon members, it is your prerogative to make sure you have a clear, audible sound. We are moving over to the Freedom Front Plus.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Hon Deputy Speaker, the Freedom Front Plus wishes to express our thanks to the Programming Committee for giving priority to



the debate on the principles urgency and desirability of implementing the principles of subsidiarity in a context of efficient and good governance in the Western Cape.

I have also noted and appreciate the expected, but most enthusiastic support by the DA and also wish to mention the contribution and support by hon Christians of the ACDP and the hon member August of GOOD. The core by hon member August of GOOD, for a bigger role to be played by Metro Council in the provision of housing has been noted. The Freedom Front Plus having been instrumental in bringing about these minority coalitions in the metros of Ekurhuleni, Tshwane, Johannesburg and Mandela Bay, will certainly explore the possibility of a bigger role of metros in the provision of houses and discuss it with their alliance partners.

The descent by the ANC and its new, unofficial alliance partner, Al Jama-Ah, is regretted, but not unexpected as obviously, Al Jama-Ah is looking for warmth and that is the only blanket that they can share. However, Article 235 is evidence of the ANC's principled support for self-determination. They signed that agreement with the Freedom Front at the Kempton Park negotiations ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): ...to come here and to disagree. They must fight it out with their Executive.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon member.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Thank you so much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon members, please watch your time. I now recognise Al Jama-Ah. Hon Brinkhuis? No? No. Okay, over to you, to the Democratic Alliance.

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, the drivers and passengers of long-distance busses have been the targets of over 150 violent crimes since 21 January. These assaults have all involved violent shootings and other forms of violent intimidation. It has been claimed that the ongoing battle over taxi and bus routes, fares and licence issuing is the cause of these tragedies. These assaults have resulted in the death of an innocent driver in April this year. The 35-year-old Intercape driver, Bangikhaya Machana, was fatally shot three times, whilst another driver was shot this past weekend.

Hon Deputy Speaker, we as members of Parliament cannot stand by and watch as these tragedies unfold. We need to exert pressure on the South African Police Service to conduct thorough, strong investigations without fear or favour into these criminal cases. It is unbelievable that no-one has been sentenced for committing such heinous crimes over the past few years. Tomorrow, the Standing Committee will hear from the Intercape Bus Company, SAPS, SANTACO, the Ministry of Transport and Mobility, and the

Community Police Oversight, on how the Provincial Government can effectively support and protect long-distance bus drivers and passengers.

I want to commend the Western Cape Government for leading the charge in the battle against the abuse of long-distance bus drivers and all the ...[Audio distorted.] they have to endure. We call on SAPS and Crime Intelligence, and our colleagues in the ANC, to urgently speak to their national counterparts to deal with the violence against the national bus drivers, and to ensure that the culprits are brought to book. We also call on the justice system to start prosecuting those involved in these criminal actions to ensure justice is seen to be done.

I urge the ANC in the Opposition benches to engage their counterparts to come to the party and assist our regional powers to eradicate this scourge of violence in this industry. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. That brings us to the end of Statements. In terms of Rule 145(6), I now give the opportunity to one or more hon members of the Executive to respond to any hon Members' Statements for not more than five minutes. I recognise the hon Minister Maynier.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The hon Khalid Sayed seems to have tied himself into a political knot. The hon member claims that the matter to which he referred is not *sub judice*, but I

believe he conceded that part of the Committee's request is, in fact, *sub judice* and agreed that that matter should not be discussed. So, it seems that this Rule only applies when it suits the hon member.

He claims that the 2023 admissions process is not *sub judice* because the court papers quote/unquote:

“Only touch on it.”

A few moments ago, he said it is not the focus of the matter. He said that the court papers merely mention the 2023 admissions process, but that, hon Deputy Speaker, is just not true. If you look at the papers, in fact the relief sought by the applicants does traverse the 2023 admissions process and I quote from the court papers. The relief sought includes, and I quote:

“A plan on steps that will be taken to ensure that sufficient school places are available for learners at public schools, by the commencement of the 2023 academic year.”

Those are the court papers. It goes on to ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister if you can just take your seat? Hon Said, what is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, is the hon Minister

able to take a question on the application of *sub judice*? Can he tell us that a committee, whether a committee can actually discuss a matter that is *sub judice*? He must read the Rules.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute. I am not sure that the Rules allow you to ask a question under a statement which, and I will tell you what I will do is can I refer back to you on this matter. But I will leave it up in this instance to you, hon Minister, but I am not sure that is allowed under this. Well, that is the first time I have had to deal with that. Hon Minister, over to you.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I am responding essentially to a statement ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Correct. Correct.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: ...made by the hon member, and if you will allow me to continue?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, you may.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The relief sought by the applicant also traverses a plan to assist unplaced learners and late registration learners in the and quote:

“2023 academic year.”

So, the matter does traverse the 2023 admissions and it is not true to say that the matter does not focus on the 2023 admissions.

So, we are constrained by court proceedings, but hon Deputy Speaker, in the interests of openness and transparency, I have undertaken to provide the Committee, subject of course to legal advice, with a written report and I look forward to briefing the Committee as soon as possible under the circumstances, when it is appropriate and briefing the Committee regularly so that we can share information about the very challenging issue, which I know is of concern, not just to that hon member, but also it was raised earlier in the House by hon Fernandez.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, if you can just take your seat?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: So, you have to ask yourself, you have to ask yourself ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, there is a point of order. Hon Sayed, I can only take on a point of order.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Chair, this is a point of order, not a question, hon Chair. Is it within the Rules for the hon Minister to not want to deal with the matter in a committee because it is *sub judice*, but he is prepared to deal with the matter in the House?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, I am not able to answer the details of that. That would be a matter of interpretation. Over to you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The hon member seems a little bit desperate.

Let me conclude by saying that we have to ask ourselves, how is it? How is it that this hon member has tied himself up in a political knot and now, finds himself in a cul-de-sac? And hon Deputy Speaker, I would suggest that the reason is obvious. He has just not done his homework. And so, hon Deputy Speaker, I would like to suggest that you seriously consider requiring the hon member to write out: I must do my homework. I must do my homework. I must do my homework 100 times and handing it to you at the next sitting of Parliament. Thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. That is the end of Member Statements. I am not going to take any further points. We are moving over to Notices of Motion.

In terms of the – I would just like to read the following, hon members, into the record. So, in terms of Rule 151, all Notices of Motion by the hon members are required to be delivered to the Secretary for placing it on the Order Paper. These Motions have been duly submitted and published on the Order Paper below the line.

**MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the sudden closure of the SASSA offices in Khayelitsha.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the subversion of democracy in the Western Cape Legislature by the Democratic Alliance, and how this contributes to the weakening of the oversight role of the Legislature.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the ongoing challenges with regard to operation of SASSA and the sudden closure of its offices in Khayelitsha, and the ineffective role by the Provincial Government to assist.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*



Mr M KAMA: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the concerning rise in transnational organised crime in the country, and Government's plans to prevent it.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC):

That the House discusses plans to curb the ongoing operation of the kidnapping syndicate in the province.

*[Notice of Motion as printed on the Order Paper.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We move to Motions without Notice. I would like to inform you that in terms of Standing Rule 150 pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolence and congratulatory were submitted to the Programming Authority prior to this plenary, on 2 August 2022. Hon members are also reminded that Motions without Notice pertaining to congratulatory and condolence, will not be allowed in this sitting that have not been processed by the Programming Authority.

I have been informed that in the Programming Authority meeting of 2 August 2022, political parties did submit the names of the hon members in the desired order of speaking, who would wish to move a Motion without Notice

in this sitting of the House. I will therefore, just for noting and for the purpose of the Minutes, call out the hon members whose names have accordingly been submitted and approved.

The following hon members' Motions have been approved by the Programming Authority: hon Lekker, hon Bans, hon Marran, hon Dugmore, hon Sayed, hon Kama and hon Christians. I now put the Motions duly submitted and approved by the Programming Authority to the House.

### **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes with a great sense of pride and celebrates the 90<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Namaqua Methodist Church; and relays a message of appreciation to the church and its reverend, Mark Klassens.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Ms A P BANS: I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the South African national women's football team, Banyana Banyana, for bringing home the Women's Afcon Cup and for winning against Morocco; notes that Banyana Banyana has been nothing short of South Africa's pride in women's soccer; and

congratulates the fierce and committed players of the women's team.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Mr P MARRAN: I move without notice:

That the House notes and mourns the sad passing of the renowned and colourful game ranger, Anton Mzimba, who worked tirelessly in fighting to protect the wildlife against poachers; notes that Mzimba was shot outside his home on Tuesday, 26 July; and conveys sincere condolences to his family and friends.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates the ANC for holding a successful 6<sup>th</sup> National Policy Conference last week where it reviewed and reshaped its policy positions for the betterment of our country.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates comrade Naledi Maqonono on

being chosen as the winner of the Young Mandela 2022; notes that this young lion is a member in good standing of the ANCYL and has led in various position in the movement; notes that she is currently a lecturer at the University of Cape Town (UCT), lecturing Xhosa Communication for medical students; notes that she is completing her PhD in African Languages and her research focuses on language policy implementation; and conveys a message of gratitude and appreciation for achievement. Roar, young lion, roar.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Mr M KAMA: I move without notice:

That the House notes with profound sadness the passing away of Zanele Ncedani, a member of the ANC and ANCYL in the Trevor Vilakazi branch, Ward 93; and conveys sincerest condolences to family, comrades and friends.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I move without notice:

That the House expresses its heartfelt condolences to the family of the late Daffidol Faro (62) and her grandchild, Aseeqah Erasmus (10); notes that according to the newspaper (*Daily Voice* of 28 July 2022), the

victims were allegedly strangled by Ashley Faro (39), the victim's son; notes that the body of Daffidol was found stuffed in a freezer and little Aseeqah's body was found in a bath full of water, hidden under a pile of clothing, with water still running; and notes that our prayers are with the family and loved ones during their time of the bereavement.

*[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections? No objections, agreed to. The Motions will appear in the Minutes of the proceedings and in Hansard, in each individual hon members' name as if that hon member had read them out aloud.

I will now afford the opportunity for those hon members to move Motions without Notice as per the Standing Rule 152(d) and they include those that were not approved of. I begin with hon Bosman. Alright, I will come back. I recognise hon Philander.

Ms W F KAIZER-PHILANDER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the decision by the South African Nursing Council to block the proposal for private hospitals to train nurses. This will further add to the strain experienced in our healthcare system, where there are already many shortages being faced. It is

important that the public-private partnerships are formed so that we can fully capacitate our all-of-society approach efforts in changing our country for the better. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the Motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. I recognise hon Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House condemns the senseless killing of Hendrik Pistorius, a farmer in Piketberg; notes that the brutal nature of this crime has no place in our society; sends condolences to Mr Pistorius' family, friends and the community of Piketberg. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the Motion being moved without notice? No objection? Agreed to. Hon Plato.

Mr D PLATO: I want to reconfirm the message earlier from our hon Chief

Whip. I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the start of Women's Month, a month in which we celebrate the thousands of brave South African women who resisted and fought against the apartheid regime on 9 August 1956; while those brave women made a remarkable impact on our nation's history, the sad reality is that their contributions have been tainted by the ongoing incidents of Gender-Based Violence in South Africa, such as the heinous gang rape in Krugersdorp, which has shocked the nation. The House must reaffirm, and it is exactly what I am doing right now, its commitment to eradicating GBV in all its forms. I so move, thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections for the Motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to. Hon Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the arrest of 130 illegal miners in Krugersdorp following the rape of 8 women who were shooting a music video at that time. Whilst the EFF welcomes the arrests, we are also concerned about the reactionary culture of the South African Police Service as they allowed illegal mining to go on for so long and only to act now when the

tragedy has occurred. We believe and hope that more can be done as it is always said that prevention is better than cure. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the Motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to. Hon Xego, again.

Mr M XEGO: Thanks, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House joins the EFF in calling for the Western Cape residents to do everything in their best to save water. This follows the report from the National Department of Water and Sanitation, showing a decline of dam storage levels from around 76% in 2021 to 63,57% in 2022, around this time of the year. This decline is reported to have been caused by the below-normal rainfall amongst other things. We also call on the Provincial Government and municipalities in the province to attend to water leakages, especially in townships because it would be useless to call for residents to save water whilst pipes are continuously leaking. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*



The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the Motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to. Hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that the City of Cape Town has increased the tariffs, which includes rates at 5,2%, electricity at 9,5%, water at 6,5%, sanitation at 6,5% and refuse at 5%. This happens at the backdrop of a high unemployment rate, high oil and fuel prices, high food prices and no signs of improvement on our economy. Our people remain poor and cannot afford these increases. Hon Deputy Speaker, the City must just restructure its expenses and embark on cost-cutting measures in order to use that money to cover these extra costs they are throwing at the poor. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the Motion being moved without notice? There are objections.

An HON MEMBER: Object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Motion will be printed on the Order Paper

...[Interjections.]. I recognise ...[Interjections.] Hon members, I recognise hon Makamba-Botya, again.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that the month of August is dedicated to women as Women's Month. However, with the current climate of rape culture, Gender-Based Violence and femicide, it would seem women are only celebrated through lip service and reality proves otherwise. My wish is for all women from every corner of the universe, to unite and confront the common enemy. Having said that, I would like to take this opportunity to wish all women well in this month of August and in the future. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much ...[Interjection.]. Hon members, it is very close to the motion from hon Plato, but I will leave the Table staff to deal with that. Let me just, for the record, call: are there any objections to the Motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon Windvogel? No. Moving over to hon Lekker

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House ...[Interjection.] †Hoekom lag julle? [Why are you

laughing?]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you. I move without notice:

That the House notes with deep sadness the discovery of a body of a woman in a wheelie bin outside of the house in Old Crossroads, Nyanga, on Monday morning; notes further that a case of murder has been opened and search continues for an unidentified man who was seen pushing the wheelie bin; condemns this senseless murder and calls on the police and Government to provide psychosocial support for the grandmother and her children, who were traumatized by the discovery of a woman's body in front of their house; and calls on the police to leave no stone unturned in search of the perpetrators of this heinous crime. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Any objections to the Motion being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and commends ANC Ward Councillors of Nduli,

Khanyiso Yisa and Mr Andile Gili who conducted an oversight visit with me to visit Nduli Primary School and Iingcinga Zethu Secondary School in Nduli, Ceres, on Wednesday, 3 August 2022, where we interacted with principals, SMT and SGB members about the challenges at the schools; notes further that both schools face similar challenges of severe shortage of teachers; serious learner transport challenges affecting learners travelling from Wolseley and Tulbagh; classrooms that are overcrowded; dilapidated infrastructure including broken fences; and also the neglect of special needs learners; no fences, poor parental involvement and social ills such as drugs and teenage pregnancies; notes further that at their high school, there is a shortage of science lab equipment which adds to poor performance and a poor matric pass rate as three learners are forced to share one computer due to a shortage of computers; and calls on hon MEC for Education and the WCED to prioritise the schools for intervention to address these pressing challenges, especially fencing, infrastructure, learner transport challenges and staff shortage, matters that the WCED has been aware of and is aware of. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the Motion being moved without notice? There are objections. The Motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Last chance, hon Bosman. Are you here?

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Are you able to hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, I can. You may proceed.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House celebrates the 190 young people for recently graduating from the Chrysalis Academy. They will now embark on a 12-month paid career opportunity and will be working in several communities in the Western Cape, which further contributes to assisting other young people in need. All in all, these efforts will help our Province fight crime and make our communities safer. We thank the management of Chrysalis Academy for the sterling work they do. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the Motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to. Last chance for hon Windvogel? Okay. I do not see foresee she is here and just hon Kama, I have referred that back to hon member Kama, remember around the Programming Authority that was not changed.

Thank you very much, hon members, that concludes the business for the day. Lynne will now end the meeting and all the hon members will be exited from the sitting. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 17:45.