

---

THURSDAY, 4 JUNE 2020

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Virtual online sitting held through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

**BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! I was hearing a noise at the back somewhere. Is that a point of order during prayer? You do not do that during prayer!

As we are about to begin the meeting, the sitting of the House, hon members, I trust that all of us have now been connected in order to participate in this sitting of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament in terms of Rule 1(a) of the Standing Rules, with all our members in remote attendance by electronic means.

The WCPP remains fully operational and we have done so since before lockdown, until to date we have never stopped, and our committees have also been functioning and this has been done to ensure that we play our oversight role in an effective, efficient and transparent manner. Our sitting today will be conducted in terms of Standing Rules and directives issued by me on 17 April 2020.

Hon members, please allow me to highlight some of the important directives in this regard:

- The Secretary and his administration will ensure dedicated technical support at all times during the sitting. We will make sure that we are all connected, as best as possible, in order to participate in this democratic process.
- The quorum requirements for sittings of the House are as provided for in the Constitution and the Standing Rules.
- Unless there is an indication of unanimous concurrence, voting will take place by members present and entitled to vote, to cast their votes by clearly identifying themselves to the Presiding Officer, verbally expressing their vote.
- Hon members who are present will have all the privileges and immunities imparted by the law.
- I also wish to say to the House that the hon members who are considered to be out of order by the Presiding Officer, their microphones will be muted and the members will be called to order, and that is the last thing

we want to do, but if you force us to do so in terms of these directives which were approved by the House, that is what the Presiding Officer will do.

- I also need to say to the hon members that the attendance of members will be recorded by the Serjeant-at-Arms, as we have done in many other sittings before this one.

In instances where these directives do not cover a particular eventuality, the Standing Rules must apply. In instances where the Rules cannot be applied, the ruling by the Presiding Officer is final.

Hon members, all microphones have now been muted. You are requested to only unmute your microphone when you need to raise a point of order in terms of these Standing Rules. You should then first state your name and surname in order for the Presiding Officer to recognise you. When you speak, please ensure that your microphone is unmuted and when you are done speaking please mute your microphone again so that the next hon member is unhindered during the address to the House.

Hon members, in this sitting the media has also been granted access and this is done in order to ensure that we work with the Fourth Estate, as we have always done when we are here in the building, in the Chamber here in Parliament, but I also need to impress upon the members of the press, please do not press your microphone. Do not activate your microphone. Do not activate your camera. Observe the sitting, as you would otherwise do, when

you are a visitor or a guest here in the House. If you activate these in any way that will then be your disqualification to the meeting.

For the purpose of this sitting via Microsoft Teams, I am requesting that hon members be sensitive to the language needs of other hon members, since there is no interpretation services, and I must say that since we started off with the virtual sittings we have really done pretty well, and I am comfortable that hon members have been tolerant and under extremely difficult times in some cases, but thank you for your support and cooperation in this regard.

The Secretary and the ICT component have been looking at various means to look at how we can intervene in the issue of translation for us to be able to use the interpretation services, and we have not succeeded up to now. Hon members, as ruled by the Presiding Officer in the sitting of the House on 23 April 2020 also via this same platform of Microsoft Teams, no interjections shall be permitted during the debate. In this regard I also wish to draw the attention of the hon members to Rule 40 of our Standing Rules.

Hon members, I just want to request that as you see the pane, the control pane that you have before you, if you want to ask a question, if you want to raise a point of order, you do so by activating your microphone and once you have been recognised by the Presiding Officer you just need to press that hand.

There is a hand like this, you tick there, or you put a message in the chat room, but I know that the members who are using a mobile device like this one are unable to have that opportunity to raise your hand, but you will be able to do so by just sending a message on the chat room. I hope that is acceptable to the hon members. That is what we have been doing since we started off.

At this point I wish to request the Deputy Speaker to take the seat, and I will withdraw until she is done. Hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can you hear me? Can you hear me clearly?

The SPEAKER: Yes, hon Deputy Speaker, we can hear you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon members, I am going to deliver a ruling on the use of the word “hypocrite” during the debate on 21 May 2020; the hon the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning used the word “hypocrite” after which a point of order was raised by the hon member Nkondlo, questioning whether the use of the word was permitted when in relation to a member. I responded that I did not think the word “hypocrite” was a derogatory word and that I was not going to stifle free speech in the House.

Later on during the same debate a member in an interjection said: “The Speaker was a hypocrite,” upon which the Deputy Chief Whip of the DA

on a point of order drew the Chair's attention to the Ruling 62 stating that no member may reflect on the honour and competence of the holder of an office, whose removal from such office is dependent on a decision of the House, except on a substantive motion.

Clearly the Deputy Chief Whip of the DA was of the view that calling a speaker a hypocrite was a derogatory and negative reflection on the honour or competence of the individual. When members speak in the House it is important to preserve the character of parliamentary debate especially in terms of how they refer to other members. All hon members are hon members of this House.

Words that may be tolerated by the Chair when used in other circumstances may be required to be withdrawn when used in relation to hon members. The context in which the words are used must also be taken into account when determining if an expression is unparliamentary or not.

I have had a look at some of the definitions of "hypocrite" and it is generally indicated as someone who pretends to have qualities, beliefs or feelings that they do not really have, who acts in contradiction of his or her stated beliefs.

Although members enjoy freedom of the House, that freedom is curtailed by Parliament's own Rules so that the decorum of the House is upheld at all times.

Given the above and after consultation with the Speaker and the staff I wish to rule the word “hypocrite” unparliamentary as it speaks directly to the person.

However, I wish to state that the use of the word “hypocritical” be allowed without hindrance to protect the freedom of speech of members in this House as it speaks to action and not the person directly.

Given my previous stance and ruling on the matter, I am not going to ask members who used the term on 21 May to withdraw, but I will do so in future if members persist in using the term “hypocrite” in relation to other members or Presiding Officers. That concludes my ruling on this matter.

I wish to make a ruling on the criticism of holders of office with regard to myself as Deputy Speaker in the last sitting.

On Thursday 28 May 2020, the hon, the Leader of the Official Opposition gave notice of motion as follows:

“That the House appoints an *ad-hoc* committee consisting of a representative of each political party represented in this House, and chaired by the Speaker of this House, to investigate the very serious allegations against the Deputy Speaker of the Western Cape Legislature, who is alleged to have informed a labour inspector that he cannot enter premises because there is a great possibility that the labour inspector carries the Coronavirus. In the light of this allegation, I further move

with notice that the Deputy Speaker of the Provincial Legislature of the WCPP is suspended with immediate effect and that the Speaker takes the necessary measures to set up the *ad-hoc* committee.”

Immediately after notice was given, the Deputy Chief Whip of the DA rose on a point of order and intimated that a reflection on a holder of office that is dependent on the removal by a decision of the House, that a substantive motion must be submitted. The Deputy Chief Whip furthermore asked me that the motion without notice not be tabled and adopted and accepted by the House.

On a further point of order the hon the Leader of the Opposition said:

“I do not think it is correct that in terms of the motion with notice that I have moved, which reflects on the office of the Deputy Speaker, that as the Deputy Speaker you should rule on this matter. I therefore request you to recuse yourself and allow the Speaker to deal with on how this particular matter is going to be handled.”

Furthermore, the Minister of Community Safety on a point of order pointed out:

“...that it was very clear, if hon Dugmore has any issue, he must come with a substantive motion and that the motion be placed before the House, so that we can make... You do not go anywhere. You sit there and you just reject his motion.”

I then stated that this was clearly a violation of the Rule and therefore this motion would not be tabled.

After numerous further points of order by various members I reiterated my stance on the matter and indicated that the ruling stands. For the record, various other points of order were raised by hon members, not material to the matter under consideration.

The crux of the matter and the reason for me addressing the House today is to consider and rule whether the honourable, the Leader of the Opposition actually used the correct procedure to bring an allegation of wrongdoing by a Presiding Officer to the attention of the House.

In terms of Rule 62, no member may reflect on the honour and competence of the holder of an office, whose removal from such office is dependent on a decision of the House except on a substantive motion. The question then arises, what constitutes a substantive motion? The Erskine May, the most authoritative and influential work on parliamentary procedure, defines a substantive motion as “a self-contained proposal submitted for the approval of the House and drafted in such a way as to be capable of expressing a decision of the House, whether as a resolution or as an order. In general, substantive motions require notice before they can be moved, while other motions do not.”

The National Assembly Guide to Procedure defines a substantive motion as

“an independent self-contained proposal concerning a concrete item of business.”

In terms of our own Rules a substantive motion is defined as “a proposal for separate consideration by the House, including an allegation against a member or against the holder of office in accordance with Rule 62.1 of the Standing Rules.”

I have reflected and consulted on the matter and wish to inform the House that the notice of motion as given by the hon Dugmore complies in respect with the requirements of Rule 62.1, and I therefore rule the notice of motion as procedurally admissible and I have instructed the administration to publish the notice of motion on the Order Paper. This particular notice of motion will be treated as all other notices and could be programmed for consideration by the House by the Programming Authority. I here so move.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon members...  
[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Speaker... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon member Dugmore, I recognise you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Speaker and thank you also to the Deputy Speaker for that ruling. I would

just like to enquire, hon Speaker, you know, I have prepared a “substantive motion”, in inverted commas, as I understood the Deputy Speaker was requiring then.

Would this mean that I no longer need to move that substantive motion or could I still move a motion later on in today’s proceedings?

The SPEAKER: Thank you honourable, the Leader of the Opposition. In terms of the Rules, the ruling that the Deputy Speaker has just made now defeats any need for a similar motion being tabled on the same sitting, especially when it is on the Order Paper, so that then suggests that you will not be able to table the same motion today.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: You are most welcome, hon the Leader of the Opposition. Hon members, now that brings us to the next ruling which I am about to table.

Hon members, during the debate on 28 May 2020, the hon the Leader of the Opposition in his member statement referred to the Deputy Speaker of the House, and I quote:

“...as having allegedly blocked a labour inspector from visiting a Maitland factory.”

The hon Deputy Chief Whip of the DA, on a point of order in terms of Rule 59(1), asserted that the Leader of the Official Opposition was reflecting on the integrity and dignity of a member of the House as well as imputing improper motives, read in conjunction with Rule 62(1) under the reflection of a holder of office, and asked me to rule on this matter. I responded that I would revert to Hansard and make a determination later and requested the hon member Dugmore to proceed, since the time allotted for members' statements was only two minutes per member.

The hon, the Chief Whip of the Majority Party echoed the sentiments of the Deputy Chief Whip in a further point of order, and asked me to not allow the Leader of the Opposition to continue referring to the same matter. Hon members, I indicated to the hon Dugmore that his time had expired, and that I would rule on the matter at the next sitting, which is now here.

During the same sitting the hon Dugmore gave notice of a motion on the allegation against the Deputy Speaker and indicated that he intended moving for an appointment of an *ad-hoc* committee to investigate the allegations against the Deputy Speaker.

Hon members, the hon the Leader of the Opposition was out of order to raise the issue involving the Deputy Speaker during the opportunity for members' statements but ultimately used the correct procedure as required by Rule 63 of the Standing Rules in this regard. Hon members, I now request the hon Dugmore to withdraw all references to the Deputy Speaker made during his

member statement on this matter. Hon Dugmore, if you were inside the House, I would ask you to rise and withdraw this member statement in the manner in which I have read.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much for your ruling, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, as you are well aware, having referred to the statement that I made, I specifically used the words “allegedly” and in my interpretation that clearly indicates that there would need to be an investigation.

However, in terms of your Ruling it is clear that even the fact that I had raised the issue as an allegation, that it could be interpreted as casting an aspersion so in that context, given your ruling, I therefore withdraw the statement made at last week’s session. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon, the Leader of the Opposition. Hon members, I am now done with this ruling and the hon member has just withdrawn his member statement. Thank you very much, hon members. At this point I recognise the hon Chief Whip.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 20(1), precedence be given

to the Order of the Day.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion? No objections? Agreed to.

Hon members, we now move to the Subject for Discussion in the name of the hon member Mackenzie as printed in the Order Paper. I recognise the hon member Mackenzie.

### **SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION**

(The importance of preserving life whilst at the same time preserving livelihoods in the economy.)

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, when the President announced the commencement of the nationwide lockdown, he was met with great support from citizens, Opposition parties, civil society and several sectors of our economy. The reality, hon Speaker, is that governments across the globe were caught between a rock and a hard place. Despite unpopular decisions, citizens complied with the regulations and took the necessary precautions to help flatten the curve.

Hon Speaker, this cooperation soon dissipated after the lockdown turned into a full-blown humanitarian crisis, characterised by hunger, severe job losses and illicit trade on a mass scale. What South Africa needed at the beginning

was a strategy to balance both the containment of the virus and pending economic collapse, which in fact is equivalent to the threats currently facing South African lives.

It is a false choice to distinguish between the loss of lives and the loss of livelihood, as both are directly and robustly interrelated. Economically productive citizens contribute personal earnings to our national fiscus which get channelled into welfare programmes, hospitals and other public services. If our livelihoods are not preserved our economy will inevitably suffer. Whilst we understand that the lockdown aims to flatten the curve and prepare our health sector for the rise of infections that are yet to come, it is simply unsustainable and tantamount to economic suicide. Hon Speaker, the Western Cape Government has demonstrated its commitment to preserving lives and livelihoods through its whole-of-society approach, support for the health sector and strategies to jumpstart the provincial economy. In addition, Speaker, our Legislature continues to conduct oversight on the work of the Executive, more so than other Provincial Legislatures and National Parliament itself. Mitigation of the impact of COVID-19 demands a comprehensive response from Government based on meticulous communication and trust between itself and members of the public.

Hon Speaker, the DA-led Government has in fact demonstrated this based on empirical evidence to ensure that we preserve both lives and livelihoods in the Western Cape. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjection.] Thank you, hon member Mackenzie. Order, hon members! Let us practice some restraint. I now recognise hon member Nkondlo.

Before that, hon member Nkondlo, there is a hand from hon member Herron. Hon Herron, is that a point of order?

Mr B N HERRON: Yes please, hon Speaker, on a point of clarity. I thought the Chief Whip had asked that we continue as per the Order of the Day. Are we starting with the Subject for Discussion when the first item on the Order Paper is Interpellations and Questions?

The SPEAKER: The Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. I move that precedence be given to the debate as the Order of the Day, and as agreed to by the Programming Authority.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip. Hon member Herron, I could not read what is before the Chief Whip there, but what I could hear is the preference for the Order of the Day, but I just wanted to make sure that we are on the same page. Are you satisfied, hon member Herron?

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Speaker.

I guess my query arises because two weeks ago we had a topic for discussion

and it was the last thing that was debated, so I mean I was not part of the Programming Authority but I wonder why this has been bumped up to the first thing to be debated, when the last time when we had a topic for discussion it was the last thing on the Order of the Day paper.

The SPEAKER: Alright, hon member Herron, we are not going to debate this now. The Programming Authority can deal with these matters. We are in the middle of a debate and therefore we cannot proceed retrospectively. I hope that is in order.

May I request hon member Nkondlo to proceed. Please take your podium.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Speaker. Am I audible enough?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you are, hon member.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Speaker. The global outbreak of the COVID-19 pandemic has disrupted lives of communities, livelihoods and businesses worldwide. It has decimated incomes and threatened food security of many people, especially the working class and the rural poor, and centrally it has threatened life. The concept of life is fundamental in human existence as a basis of everything side-by-side with livelihoods. All agree that the right to life remains a basic human right, high up in the list as such protected under civil liberties as sacrosanct.

How did it happen that we got to a human crisis where this fundamental truth is placed on the spot? What has interfered with this logic?

Is it the path of self-righteousness that humans through a system of brazen capitalist accumulation, promoting profits first against human life and nature; what brought us to this quagmire? Such a system has for decades evolved into a beast that undermines the essence of life and poses an existential crisis to mankind.

Karl Marx in 1856 had this to say:

“There must be something rotten in the very core of a social system which increases its wealth without diminishing its misery.”

Already two centuries ago humanity was warned of the human cost of rampant accumulation, as if without ears and no brains to centre man’s reasoning, market fundamentalists have lived to deny this truth.

Today, centuries later, we are visited by another human crisis of unprecedented proportions to remind us of the question of fundamental human existence that is life. We shall not hesitate to speak truth to power and tell no lies, and equally, there are no easy victories. As a generation of men and women representatives in this House, enjoined with our citizens in their class outlook, the writing is clearly on the wall.

Articulations and orientations of what either side believes as truth on the

question posed today mirror the class disposition either with the ruling elite or to save the economy and live off to feed the market interest of the oppressed class bustling in agony to free themselves from the... [Microphone lost contact]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Nkondlo, we have lost you there. I will wait for you to come back to the House. Will the Table staff please stop the time; just pause the time. If the hon member Nkondlo does not come back in the next few seconds, I will go to the next speaker and we will take her when she comes back to the House. [Pause.]

Alright, hon members, we will proceed. We note that hon member Nkondlo will join us again. These are technical challenges on her part. Let us welcome the hon Minister of Health, Minister Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, hon Speaker. I think hon member Nkondlo is back, but anyway, let me proceed, I continue. Thank you, hon member Mackenzie, for the sponsorship of this debate. Indeed, there are no binaries between the economy and health. The health policy will affect the economy and the economic policy will affect health and the livelihoods.

A healthy economy needs healthy people, a healthy workforce and healthy labour force for the production.

The same applies that if the labour force is sick, it means that there will be

less production and it will even affect their livelihoods. Therefore, for us as Health, that is why as part of strengthening the health system you have to strengthen the human resource, which is the people themselves, in building a healthy system.

Hon Speaker, COVID indeed has affected many people. South Africa, there was no way that we could be able not to have a virus. We have seen countries in the whole world with a strong economy with a strong health system, for example the US, the UK, even Asia, China, Singapore, now also parts of Europe, Spain and Italy. Now we have seen it in Latin America, Brazil and all of those, so there was no way that we could be able to run away from it. Similarly, hon Speaker, in these countries that I have mentioned, you will have seen that it starts; it targets one particular area when it ends up being the epicentre. I think for us as South Africa, the mere fact is at this stage it started to affect one province and then as we have heard it is going to go throughout in other provinces. Therefore it provides an opportunity for South Africa to learn and employ all resources so that we could be able to escalate and replicate the interventions when it hits other provinces, hon Speaker.

For us the issue of lockdown or no lockdown, taking into consideration that when the lockdown was introduced it was not to stop the virus because there is no way that you can stop the transmission, but to assist Health in order to be able to get ready, and therefore for us, whether there is lockdown or not, the basic principles of the golden rule of hand-washing, surface hygiene,

wearing your mask, keeping a distance and also staying at home when you are ill, and also the issue of the coughing etiquette and sneezing etiquette, are always crucial.

When it started in the Western Cape through the international community, which was contributing actually to our economy through tourism, because already it seeded through that route, it then went to the clusters, so when we had these clusters, these are the essential workers, these were the contributors to the economy. We are talking about retail, the pharmaceutical industries and the essential services clusters like the health workers and also from the law enforcement, the officers. That is why we said these people, they are not always individuals as workers. They have got homes, they go back to their communities and as the labour force in the economy you will find that in the vulnerable communities. That is why we immediately initiated a hotspot strategy so that we are able to contain the virus.

Come August/September, hon Speaker, we do know, as the evidence we have seen coming also from the National Office, that we will have an exponential growth and a curve. That is why it is important for us to ensure that at the end, even if the virus continues, that people should still be able to remain with their livelihoods. In our strategy we have included the humanitarian support. We have included the provision of the other sectors of the economy and within that space, hon Speaker, in the economic sector, we have provided protocol management where each and every sector could be able to engage with the cluster, not only now that it is Lockdown 3, but even at the lower

level of the lockdown which we initiated, at Lockdown Level 5. So if you are working in a petrol station, whether you are working in an office or whatever sector, we have got all of those protocol managements in terms of what kind of PPE you need. Also, what is the responsibility of the employer, what is the responsibility of the employee with regard to that space, and then lastly, hon Speaker, the issue of the health response in terms of the number of beds, in terms of the number of quarantine and isolation sites, and also the number of the staffing that we have to take into consideration, noting this is a new virus. Each and every day is a learning curve. It is a learning phase. We learn from it, whilst at the beginning we transplanted some of the lessons that happened overseas and all of those, but taking note that there are various impacts and it mirrors differently in each and every population. There is no homogeneity, so for us we are on a learning curve, but we are not only doing that as South Africa, as the Western Cape Province, but we are also doing it for the whole country.

Lastly, we need to celebrate the recoveries. Yes, each and every positive case or every death does count, but you need to understand that 90% of the population do not have to be hospitalised. These are the people who are still going to remain as a labour force, as a work force that we need to nurture in terms of what I have just mentioned, in terms of prevention and promotion, especially in the community space. We also need to understand that it needs all of us. This is a new virus. We need to – all of us – unite in fighting the spread of the virus. It does not need time now for politicising the issues. It does not need time now to create binaries, whether economy-wise or even in

the issue of the House, but also amongst ourselves, because it does not choose anyone. It does not discriminate.

It does not discriminate according to class... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It does not discriminate according to education. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister Mbombo, your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Therefore, I appeal to my colleagues also to be coming forth with solutions.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon members, we have hon member Nkondlo back in the House. I now wish to recognise hon member Nkondlo. We will start from the beginning. [Pause.] Are you back, hon member Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: [No audible reply.]

The SPEAKER: Alright, hon members, I was under the impression that hon member Nkondlo is back. [No audible reply.]

In the absence of that we will then proceed, I recognise hon member Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, our world has changed irreversibly with a global pandemic that has created a global recession and the global climate is changing as a result of our own rampant consumerism.

The notion that it is a livelihoods versus lives debate is a false one. Sweden adopted an open-economy approach to the virus. Its neighbour, Norway, did not. The death rate in Sweden is now ten times that of Norway's and the economic benefit for Sweden seems to be none. Norway's economy is expected to contract by 5% this year, where Sweden has warned that their GDP would decrease by 7%. Sweden's death rate per capita reached the highest in the world this week and too many people died in a failed experiment to save the economy. Like Sweden, we do not operate in a closed economy. Our economy is one of the most advanced on the African continent and is an open economy that seeks to trade with the world. We are highly dependent on trading with developed nations and our trading partners face unprecedented mortality rates and massive economic contraction.

Expecting that saving livelihoods is simply reopening the economy for business as usual, is obviously nonsensical. Normal is gone. Everything we

were doing on this earth, including consuming every resource it offered us without regard for its or our sustainability, was interrupted.

As we contemplate our future, we have the opportunity and the urgent need to reinvent ourselves. We all know that we are in for a tough time. This Government must take steps to prepare for the recession, implement steps to aid economic recovery where it can and make sure it mitigates the spreading of the virus.

As we work through this, our plans must be to build a world that is more equal, more just and more sustainable. We can stop talking about an inclusive economy and a green economy and we can start to build one. It cannot be business as normal because normal ended last year and we can resuscitate an economy, but we cannot resuscitate a dead body. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Herron. Hon members, I see that the hon member Nkondlo is now back. Will you please indicate that I am correct to say so, hon member Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Yes, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Now you may please take the opportunity and speak and address the House.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Can you indicate the time because I did not notice at

what point I got cut?

The SPEAKER: You had six minutes and one minute was gone by the time you got cut off, so you have got five minutes.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Okay, thank you, hon Speaker. Let me quickly go back to my speech. Okay. Jeff Rudin in the *Daily Maverick* writes:

“The brutal reality that needs facing is that the only real choice open to the poor is to decide how to die, or, more accurately, of what to die: Coronavirus, hunger, lockdown-compounded gender-based violence, or TB, HIV-AIDS, cancer or any of the other diseases and conditions that have been de-prioritised to make way for the Coronavirus.”

The parents and community leaders of Nomzamo Primary School had little and no choice this morning but to brave the cold winter morning only to demand the protection of lives of their children as the authorities of WCED refused to close and decontaminate the school premises after one of the educators tested positive and was sent to quarantine. Similarly, a number of workers succumbed to COVID-19 in the line of duty when accumulation again brought fatal misery to them and their families. The Social Justice Coalition, in analysing the City of Cape Town’s 2019/2020 Budget, points out the choice made to provide temporary facilities rather than investing in long-term infrastructure.

Mayor Dan Plato is reported to announce R589 million under the guise of the

upgrading of informal settlements, which in essence shows undignified temporary toilets wherein R235 million thereof is for temporary sanitation facilities; R220 million to service providers for the renting, servicing and maintenance of potable non-flushing chemical toilets, which we call *Mshengu*; R50 million of this to supply and deliver potable flush toilet units, called porta-potty. The report further shares with us how the daily janitorial services have been de-funded and services temporarily halted since the 2017/2018 financial year, from an annual budget of R73 million down by 80% by the following year and reasons provided being delays in vaccination of janitorial staff as a health requirement.

Janitorial services ensured that the communal flush toilets across informal settlements are kept clean. It is said on average 600 to 700 cases of diarrhoea in children under five are reported each week in the City of Cape Town. This picture draws clearly on the misery of the market economy and its social system and the misery that even a five-year-old child is not spared. As if it is not enough, these children and their families were found wanting by the unannounced visit of COVID-19 under these conditions and this issue is still being considered by those like us who hold power over their lives. What have we done and what has been our response? Have we used the COVID-19 to go back and correct these atrocities? With the window of budget reprioritisation for COVID-19 demands, the pandemic tests, our hygiene and safety standard, so did we, with the MEC of Finance, move to do all in our power to get the janitorial services resumed with speed in the City of Cape Town?

When the Health Department under the able leadership of the MEC of Health and its machinery tested some individuals residing in these areas, and sent them home to isolate in those conditions, using the same *mshengus* and porta-potty that have not been serviced, were we not aware or flatly in denial and opted to finger-pointing, we declared this known misery with a new term: hotspot.

Is it hotspots due to COVID or the underlying condition we choose to deny? History repeated itself first as tragedy and secondly as a farce. We must then help each other to make a radical shift away from niceties but take the leap of faith to confront and deal with the human cost in accumulation, fashioned by the economic choices of our time. We must be true to those that are human shields and suffer the misery of the carnage of this social system. Ours is to deal and confront inequality right in our shores. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Nkondlo. I now recognise hon, the Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, governments around the world are having the same debate: we are not alone. All countries face this dilemma and in particular poorer ones where poverty can be as big a killer as the virus. It is estimated that South Africa's lockdown could cause 29 times more deaths in the long run than the virus itself.

Professor Paul Romer, Nobel Economics prize winner, in an interview last month on the Coronavirus and developing nations, wisely said that “each society should have a conversation about which way to go to ease the pain” and this, hon Speaker, is why this debate is so important. Saving lives and livelihoods are not mutually exclusive. We can and we must save both. Poverty and mortality are related, so by allowing poverty to spiral out of control we will not contribute to saving lives.

South African economist, Mike Schüssler, and health expert from the University of Stellenbosch, Dr Kerrin Begg, argue in a similar way that we are arguing today, that “lives and the economy are actually inseparable.”

Hon Speaker, a simple binary of health versus of the economy is over-simplifying a complex issue and ignores the fact that both the pandemic and the lockdown affect the most vulnerable in our society.

Mauricio Cárdenas, former Finance Minister of Columbia, was quoted just two weeks ago saying that there are ways to save lives and improve the economy at the same time. He said this of a country that is substantially similar to ours, one that battles poverty, unemployment and inequality in a population roughly the same size as ours. Cárdenas said it could be done if it is controlled and with protocols in place.

The Western Cape is doing both these things, controls and protocols through the hotspot approach, all aimed at protecting citizens from the

virus. This notion that we are trying to implement herd immunity must be rejected as ill informed.

Last week the Opposition seemed to impress us with their newly learnt phrase “herd-immunity.” Healthline tells us that this can happen in two ways. The first is when many people contract the disease and build an immune response, or second, when many people are vaccinated against a disease to achieve immunity. Given that there is no vaccine for COVID-19, we can only assume they were referring to the former.

We are not aiming for many to contract the Coronavirus, quite the opposite. We are aiming to prevent people from contracting it. Other protocols such as contact tracing are also in place to identify and isolate those who have the disease. Since the end of May the Western Cape has traced an estimated 63 000 contacts which is almost four times what the Opposition is claiming it to be, but what really needs to be addressed is the elephant in the room – testing capacity.

In the space of one week the test backlog for the Western Cape at the National Health Laboratory Service has ballooned from 18 000 to 27 000 and result turnaround times are getting slower and slower. We were showed in March that the NHLS had adequate testing capacity and equipment to meet demand and in April we were assured by the NHLS that “the NHLS has also secured supplies to maintain the 15 000 testing capacity over the next three months and further, if required,” on daily

tests. Yet, the ten-day average for testing in the public sector has been sitting at about 10 200 tests only – two thirds of declared capacity.

This failure of being able to process tests means that this Government has had to take the extraordinary and very difficult decision to strategically limit testing to ensure early detection for those with the highest risk of dying and ensure greater protection for our healthcare workers on the frontline who are saving lives.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): In conclusion, hon Speaker, Columbian economist and news reporter, Luis Carlos Velez said a few days ago:

“It is easiest to lock everyone up and stand in the corner and say, ‘I told you so’, when inevitably the numbers increase.”

True leadership finds a balance between our economic reality and saving lives.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip, your time is up.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): The one is determination and the other is opportunism. Thank you. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip, thank you, your time is up. Hon members, the next speaker is hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, this is a very, very important debate today, and, as a person, I have more questions than answers because I want to ask, what is the right thing to do and not be politically correct, because we get reports on the increase of infections in the Western Cape and also nationally and deaths too, and there is a rise of anxiety when it comes to the country and also globally and also in the Western Cape. The health of our family members and friends and loved ones are crucial and it is non-negotiable, but when we see the impact of the pandemic on human lives and how severe it is and when loved ones are succumbed by this pandemic, like a friend of mine witnessed yesterday, the entire family plummets into grief. So, hon Speaker, lives do matter but on the other hand this pandemic has a real impact on the livelihood of our people. A proud father who is unable to provide for his family because he has a barber shop, is unacceptable. People are losing their jobs, so the question today is, and it is a terrible question to ask: Do we look at livelihood or do we look at sacrificing lockdowns and sacrifice the lives of many? Hon Speaker, to avoid permanent destruction of livelihoods we need to prepare to deal with this virus and to shorten the strain on the economy, but hon Speaker, as I said, there are many, many questions.

If we continue with the prolonged lockdown, how many companies will be bankrupted and can the supply of essential goods and services be

maintained? Two things are certain: if we do not deal with the virus effectively many people will die, but if we do not stop, if we stop the virus at all costs and lockdown goes on... [Inaudible – speaking simultaneously].

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians. Your time is up, sir.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I will conclude now. Our economy will be damaged severely and beyond recovery and livelihoods would be lost. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians. Hon members, we understand the technological space that we operate in, but when the Presiding Officer informs you that the time is up, that means that your time has expired.

In the event where you perpetually address the House despite the warning, I would be very much uncomfortable to get to a point of muting the microphone, but if you do not help the Presiding Officer, that will be the sanction as I indicated from the beginning of the sitting, but it would not be necessary because you will help me. [Laughter.]

I now recognise the Minister of Finance, hon Minister Maynier.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Speaker.

We know that the COVID-19 pandemic will have a devastating impact on lives and livelihoods across South Africa. Some people think that we have to choose as other hon members have said, choose between saving lives and saving livelihoods, but of course this is a false choice because we have to save lives and we have to save livelihoods in South Africa, which is why my Department has been working hard to support business not only to open the economy, but to open the economy responsibly and safely so that we can save livelihoods in the Western Cape.

We have set up a COVID-19 Content Centre with our partners at Wesgro and the City of Cape Town to provide support and advice for business during the crisis. We have launched the COVID-19 Support Finder, which helps businesses navigate and access the many financial relief packages that are available during this crisis, and we have launched a smartphone app for entrepreneurs which is a fantastic resource for businesses who need information about how to start a business, scale up a business or grow a business and of course we have launched the weekly Go Digital Western Cape Webinar Series and the Tech Volunteer Programme, which bring leading experts in the digital technology to present ideas and advice to small businesses on how they can adapt and innovate during the crisis. Of course our Red Tape Reduction Unit, which is well established, has played a critical role in assisting businesses to understand the risk adjusted regulations and the additional red tape which they have created.

Over 73 000 visitors have used our support business website. Over 2 300

queries have been dealt with by the COVID Content Centre and over 6600 businesses have used the COVID-19 Support Finder and finally, over 1000 queries have been dealt with by the Red Tape Reduction Unit. But that is not all. We have also worked hard to ensure that all employers and employees implement and adhere to critical safety measures to stop the spread of the COVID-19 virus in the workplace, and we have made a number of valuable resources available for employers and for employees returning to work which can of course be found on the Western Cape Government's website.

We have made available health guidelines and information materials on preventing and managing COVID-19 infections in the workplace and we have assisted businesses to find personal protective equipment, suppliers through our PPE marketplace. We have provided employees with frequently asked questions, that advised them on how to stay safe in the workplace and what their employer needs to do to ensure their safety, and of course we have provided employees and indeed customers with a mechanism to report businesses that are not following the necessary health guidelines to stop the spread of the virus in the workplace.

Hon Speaker, with the national economy expected to contract by at least 7% and with an estimated 1,8 million job losses, economic recovery of course is imperative if we are going to save lives and if we are going to save livelihoods in South Africa, but we have to confront the fact that the so called V-shaped recovery, a sharp rise following a steep decline in

economic growth, is unlikely in South Africa.

Hon Speaker, we have Exhibit A, the ANC's document entitled "Economic Reconstruction", which is a remarkable document because it proposes new mad ideas on top of existing mad ideas on the economic recovery in South Africa. We have the normal mad ideas, a tax on the Central Bank, establishing a State Bank and establishing a State Pharmaceutical Company on top of new mad ideas including raiding private pension funds in South Africa. We are told that the State, which cannot run an airline and which cannot pay unemployment insurance because of what is referred to in the document, and wait for it, as subjective weaknesses in cadreship, must provide higher levels of guidance on economic development in South Africa and that is to say nothing of National Government, who now seems determined to rescue our national airline from business rescue, which will cost a further R21 billion in bailouts.

The fact is that the pandemic, hon Speaker, has surfaced some of the worst tendencies in National Government, with the Minister of Trade and Industry, Ebrahim Patel, micromanaging the micro-economy, issuing directives on what you can and what you cannot buy at clothing stores in a way that would have made State planning officials envious in East Germany. They could only dream of issuing decrees to instruct clothing stores to sell shorts-sleeve T-shirts, provided of course that they are promoted and displayed as undergarments for warmth.

We will therefore have to ensure that we take a different path to economic recovery by creating an enabling environment for the private sector and for the markets rather than for the State to drive economic growth and create jobs in the Western Cape, and we will have to all pull together and we will have to work together over the coming days and over the coming months to save lives and to save livelihoods in the Western Cape. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Maynier. Hon members, I now recognise hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the COVID-19 situation continues to be grim in the Western Cape, with 29 deaths out of 37 reported in the country yesterday. Out of the 37 525 confirmed COVID-19 cases in the country, 24 657 came from the Western Cape, with 597 deaths out of the 792 nationally.

Hon Speaker, this should be blamed on complacency, carelessness and gross negligence on the part of a Government, which seems to put the needs to open the economy above saving lives.

Due to sloppy containment and civilian strategies, the Western Cape is in a worse position to control the disease as it is now battling widespread community transmissions mainly effecting densely populated Cape Flats and rural communities.

Hon Speaker, there are international examples to prove the effectiveness of strict lockdown measures, in controlling the spread of the virus. Countries like New Zealand have recorded zero new cases while China has been reporting zero digit transmissions for months.

In South Africa, too, the nationwide lockdown showed glimpses of hope as it slowed the rate of infection. It was only in the Western Cape that we continuously witnessed a rapid rise. What worked best for these countries is that, together with the strict lockdown measures, they also mounted an extensive testing-and-contact-tracing operation.

The Western Cape was an antithesis of this. It failed to contain the spread and was very poor in tracing contacts. For an example, data from National Government showed that out of the 7 798 confirmed cases in the province in mid-May, only 7 614 contacts had been traced. This means that as at 15 May the province was tracing less than one close contact of a COVID-19 positive case. Contact tracing, isolation and quarantining positive cases are instrumental in the containment of COVID-19.

In the Western Cape confirmed cases from densely populated working-class communities were forced to quarantine in their homes, which they share on average with four other family members. The Government's complacency and gross negligence have led to hospital outbreaks. Over 1 000 health workers have tested positive. Health workers have been complaining that their facility management refuses to

isolate and quarantine them, even after their colleagues test positive.

Hon Speaker, this negligence is also evident in the Provincial Government's decision to defy National Government orders to not open schools this week. Schools are slowly becoming the new hotspots with a number of positive teachers that are reporting for duty, as well as those that have passed on. The reckless decision by the WCED to open schools when it is clearly not ready to do so and thereby placing the lives of many teachers and learners at risk, should be condemned with the contempt it deserves.

Hon Speaker, the best way to describe the Provincial Government's handling of the COVID-19 outbreak is shambolic and chaotic. I get shocked sometimes when certain leaders of society decide to shower the Government with presents.

The issue highlighted above seems to be part of a carefully grafted strategy to pursue herd-immunity in the province. The aim was to expose as many people as possible to the virus so we can reach our peak and lift and end lockdown and reopen the economy. The interest has always been the economic overlies.

The recently introduced new criteria of COVID-19 testing in the Metro indicates that the Government is stopping the testing and contact-tracing component of the Communities Surveillance Programme and moving

towards self-reporting of symptoms. It will result in widespread undetected community transmissions. The end result of this will be the misrepresentation of COVID cases in the province and a false sense of security as the number of reported cases will drop drastically.

Many carriers will be the affected high-risk population, including TB, HIV patients, due to not knowing their status and not being told to isolate. As the ANC we are passionately opposed to this strategy and we would like to call on the Premier and the MEC to reconsider it. As the country moves to Level 3 and now opening up the economy we need to remind our people that we are not opening up people's social rights. People should continue to observe social distancing.

†Mense moet weet hierdie DA stel wins bo arm mense se lewens. Daarom moet hulle hul gedrag verander om hulself veilig te hou, want die *Western Cape Government* gee nie 'n flenter om vir hul mense nie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[People should know this DA puts profit above poor people's lives. Therefore they should change their behaviour to keep themselves safe, because the Western Cape Government does not care a hoot about their people.] I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Windvogel.

†‘n AGB LID: ‘n Flenter.

[An HON MEMBER: A hoot.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member, is that a point of order, or did you inadvertently activate your microphone? Thank you, I can see it was a mistake, thank you.

Hon members, let us now recognise the hon Minister of Social Development, hon Minister Fernandez.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Good afternoon, hon Speaker and hon members, can you hear me clearly, hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Yes, I can hear you, hon Minister Fernandez, and I am sure other hon members do so too.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you. Hon Speaker, I wish to draw the attention of the House to the fact that we are in the midst of Child Protection Week, and yet sadly, children are being gunned down as we speak, and I am asking us to all take care of our children, not just during Child Protection Week, but every day.

Coming back to the topic of sustainable livelihoods, I am going to talk to a forgotten approach during COVID-19, hon Speaker. The United Nations in 2013 published a document called “Livelihoods and Economic Recovery in

Crisis Situations”. This guide provides a neat summary of the impact of a crisis or disaster on people’s livelihoods.

Hon Speaker, the guide states that:

“An immediate impact of a crisis is the destruction of livelihoods and local economies, poverty, hunger, frustration and idleness, which in turn contribute to the greater social and economic insecurity and rights violations.”

The COVID-19 pandemic and the hard lockdown, which has recently been eased, has caused a humanitarian crisis, and violated the rights of millions of South Africans in the process. This has been confirmed by the spate of judgments handed down recently.

Hon Speaker, we urgently require, in unprecedented times such as these, interventions and strategies that are intended to bring people together, yet observing the social distance, and reduce vulnerability. Such interventions must contain safeguards against the risk of creating further social divisions or exacerbating the conflict. To that end the Western Cape Government stepped up to the plate and created the necessary whole of government and whole of society approach to address the COVID-19 pandemic.

I would like to thank civil society, faith-based organisations, donors, individuals, municipalities, public reps, MPL’s, everyone who has given a

hand in some small way to contribute to keeping a family going, whether it was with a cash donation or with a plate of food.

Since President Ramaphosa announced on 23 March 2020 that lockdown in South Africa would continue, we have in this province provided over 130,000 food parcels – that is to at least four or five people for a month – to people from every corner of this province.

With the ongoing support of various entities, including NGO's and municipalities, we are currently feeding roughly 200,000 people per day from kitchen feeding schemes, and well over 1 million meals have been provided to children across the Western Cape through the Emergency School Feeding Programme.

However, hon Speaker, there are a few concerns that I must touch on. These concerns are directly linked to the many livelihoods being completely decimated by indecisiveness and incoherent decision-making at a national level, and it could not be evidenced more than in the family space, where you could not buy clothes, warm winter clothes; you could not buy underwear; children now in ECD at Level 3 need to stay at home, but their parents have to go to work. It is completely bizarre.

So for the first part of the lockdown, the ECD sector was left completely in the cold by National Government, and the hon member Nkondlo touched on the *Daily Maverick* article which was published on the 28th, and that very

eloquently sums up the situation we find ourselves in.

Hon Speaker, on 18 March 2020, all ECD-centred playgroups and day mothers were instructed to stop operating by National Government. Many ECD operators are non-profit organisations and micro-social enterprises, and are mostly run by caring mothers and grandmothers, aunties providing a service in poor communities with limited cashflows. These women often earn below the minimum wage.

Hon Speaker, at this point our ECD sector has had no easy access to any of the economic relief packages offered by the National Government, and more than half of them might not be able to reopen once National DSD gives the green light for childcare to commence.

This raises serious questions about child safety and focuses attention on the enormous role ECD's play not only in families' lives, but in our country's economy and its prospects for social development.

The Centre for Early Childhood Development started a petition demanding that Government announces dates for the reopening of ECD's. According to this petition, around 2,3 million children attend around approximately 32,000 ECD's across the country and are cared for by about 100,000 ECD workers. The sector ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, will you please wrap up.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Speaker. The sector, according to the petition, contributes R10 billion to the South African economy annually.

My request today, and I stand in complete agreement with Grace Matlhape, Chief Executive of Smart Start, an early leaning social franchise, let us reopen our ECD's responsibly in Level 3, yet get everyone back to work. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Fernandez. Hon members, I now recognise †agb Marais [hon Marais.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Man shall live and work by the sweat of his brow, not social dependency and ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon member Marais, is not ... [Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS: ... government handouts. That is what my Bible says.

The SPEAKER: Order.

Mr P J MARAIS: While I agree that the right to life is non- [Inaudible.], that right is subject to availability of food, shelter, jobs, housing, health services, and none of these are available to everybody equally in this country.

If members of Parliament had to rely on UIF payments, then this debate would have taken a totally different course.

You cannot destroy the economic cycle of a country and hope to preserve the cycle of life. Economics is the railroad on which the political train runs. Remove that railroad and the train will crash.

The Sakeliga judgment ruling, that the regulations are unconstitutional and irrational, begs the question: What remedial action do we seek and expect from Government?

The Latin maxim *ubi ius ibi remedium* reads:

“Where there is a right, there is a remedy.”

South African, being a member of NEPAD, must choose which economic policies will help us achieve our aims of eradicating poverty and promoting sustainable economic growth and development.

It cannot be financed by shutting businesses, reducing our tax base as a consequence, and leaving people unemployed. We cannot look and follow Africa, because Africa itself is looking for help elsewhere, and to ourselves. We must stand on our own feet and become self-reliant or become simply another failed African state. Open manufacturing and establish our economy if we want to preserve life.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Marais, will you please wrap up?

Mr P J MARAIS: I will obey you, my Speaker, and I wrap up. I say let us think with our heads and not with our hearts if we want to survive this era of COVID-19.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marais, your time has now just ended. Thank you very much. I now recognise, hon members, the hon Minister of Education, hon Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I think we need to note that key to this discussion is the understanding that we are not faced with a zero-sum game, in which we have to either preserve life or preserve livelihoods. This is a false dichotomy that has been perpetuated by the Opposition.

These two goals are not mutually exclusive. The Western Cape Education Department has clearly demonstrated that we can do both at the same time.

First we must consider the impact that COVID-19 has had on our learners' immediate health and well-being. The hard lockdown had a devastating impact on many families with the loss of jobs and income, putting their access to sufficient food in danger. Hunger has become a widespread reality in our country as a result. The national agency tasked with responding to such crises, SASSA, closed its offices, leaving our residents without access to support, where learners who ordinarily rely on the National School

Nutrition Programme during the school term, faced an indefinite period without the support when schools closed.

We agreed with Minister Motshekga that the NSNP funding needed to be preserved for term time when this was initially discussed, as the intention was that the lost teaching and learning days would be made up later in the year, and we would need that funding for then, but this closure was no ordinary school closure, no ordinary holiday. Large numbers of parents do not suddenly lose their jobs and income over school holidays, or have limited access to supplies, as was the case during lockdown.

As the lockdown persisted, so too did the need for support. The Western Cape Government made emergency funding for food relief available. We, as Education, received R18 million to run an emergency school feeding programme, using our infrastructure and knowledge to effectively deliver meals to as many of our learners registered on the NSNP, as possible.

Despite vehement opposition, this programme has run successfully and served 1,2 million meals to learners safely, thanks to the dedication of WCED officials, school staff and volunteers. They implemented the detailed safety protocols that were sent to schools, including maintaining strict physical distancing and taking the meal directly home, rather than eating it at the school.

At the same time, we are also aware of the toll that this epidemic has taken

on the futures of our learners. The Brookings Institution recently estimated that the loss of future income for United States school students from just four months of school closure, would be 2,5 trillion US dollars.

This is not a case of economy versus lives. We must recognise that losing out on their education has a direct impact on their future health, food security, safety and earning capacity.

Finding a way to keep learning going during the lockdown and beyond was thus a priority for the WCED. As soon as a lockdown period became likely, our e-Learning Team sprung into action, expanding the WCED e-Portal to add more content, and improve the server capacity as the number of users to the site increased. We have been working on having the site zero-rated, but this has proved a complex process, and we are now part of a joint effort to have education sites zero-rated.

We develop weekly lesson plans to provide guidance for home learning, to help provide direction for learning taking place at home. We also have a special focus on reading with tips for improving reading at home, and matric learners have their own section of matric resources.

We have also expanded our support for teachers learning to use digital platforms for teaching, including making a [Inaudible.] online course available. However, we are aware that not all learners have access to the internet. Schools have been finding innovative ways to address this also.

- At Westlake Primary, work packs were sent home with learners coming to school to collect take-away meals.
- A teacher at Hermanus High School assisted Qhayiya Secondary to get sponsors for data for 200 learners.
- Teachers at Klapmuts Primary School have used Facebook groups to support remote learning.
- At Groendal Secondary School, WhatsApp groups are being used to support learners.
- A teacher of [Inaudible.] High School even designed a special box that teachers can make at home to help them record videos to teach their learners.

But even with this amazing work being done by our schools, there are learners who are reliant on in-class teaching, and the longer schools are closed, the more they are disadvantaged.

It is for this reason that our WCED officials, principals, teachers and non-teaching staff, SGB's and parents, pulled out all the stops to make sure that we were ready to reopen schools for Grades 7 and 12 learners on 1 June 2020, the date gazetted twice by the National Minister of Education for their return, after she was given the go-ahead by the National Cabinet for schools to reopen in a phased manner, and after approval by the National Corona Virus Command Council, the National Institute for Communicable Diseases and Paediatric Association, all agreeing with those decisions.

We have spent R280 million on PPE's and cleaning materials so far, before placing the secondary orders. This includes face masks, temperature scanners, hand sanitisers, bleach, liquid soap and disinfectant. We have issued detailed guidelines to schools on numerous aspects of safety and cleaning and managing confirmed cases of COVID-19. All are available on the Back to School page of the WCED website.

We have said that no school may open for learners unless the required safety procedures are in place. We are thus committed to ensure the safety of all our staff and to the saving of lives. At the same time, we have to save livelihoods as well. It is imperative that for parents to go back to work and the economy to open, schools must open. Whilst protecting our children now, we must also ensure that their futures are not compromised. Obviously that also applies to our teachers and we have put in place measures to ensure their safety as well, and to respond to the hon member Windvogel, there was no defiance of any National Government instruction, to the point that the Human Rights Commission has even acknowledged that the *Gazette* is a lawful, legal document, and that we are in compliance with it.

We are the only province that actually was ready, other than Gauteng, and Gauteng unfortunately is completely captured by SADTU which is the only reason they did not open.

The SPEAKER: Minister Schäfer, if you will wrap up, please.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thanks, hon Speaker. So we are completely committed to getting our children back to school as soon as possible, contrary to the unions who seem to want to keep on ensuring that they stay out of school, as long as possible. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Schäfer. Hon members, I now recognise hon the Chief Whip of the Official Opposition, hon member Lekker.

The CHIP WHIP (ANC): [No audible response.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lekker, are you winning?

The CHIP WHIP (ANC): [No audible response.]

The SPEAKER: Okay. Hon members, I am unable to get hon member Lekker on the system. She seems to be having trouble there with the connection. I am going to give her a minute to see if I am able to get her in.

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Speaker, does it mean we extend the length of the debate, or take it off hon members' time?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marais. That was not a point of order, but for information, we are now moving ahead with the debate. It is hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Speaker. Just for the record, so is hon member Lekker still going to speak or not?

The SPEAKER: If she does not come back whilst we are still on this item, because remember this is the subject for discussion. If you are done speaking and she is not in the House, then she will not be able to speak anymore, because we will have concluded the debate, and therefore the answer is no, but if we are still busy with the debate and she comes back, we will give her the opportunity.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Speaker, for the clarity. I see she is online, because once a sweeper sweeps, you sweep. You cannot have people speaking after a sweeper.

The SPEAKER: Let me see if hon member Lekker is back now. I just do not want to hold the House indefinitely. One does not want to do that. Hon member Lekker? She is here now, I can see, and the mic is on, it is not muted. Yes, hon member Lekker, thank you, welcome. Oh, she is on the phone.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: No, she is ...

The SPEAKER: Okay. Hon member Lekker, can I assist you? We can assist you from where you are if you are struggling, and one of the ways you can call the Presiding Officer to put you on the microphone, or call one of the

members and then you will be on the microphone. We need to be as creative as possible. Hon member Lekker?

The CHIP WHIP (ANC): [No audible response.]

The SPEAKER: Okay, there is a message on the chatroom:

“I can hear, I was on the phone with IT.”

Okay. No, it is fine. Are you able to join us, hon member Lekker?

The CHIP WHIP (ANC): [No audible response.]

The SPEAKER: Okay. I think if I proceed now then that will mean she will not have the chance to participate, because I do not see her coming back into the House, but she is in the chatroom, hon members.

The CHIP WHIP (ANC): [Inaudible.] to your phone?

The SPEAKER: Yes, yes, we can hear you.

The CHIP WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. I will just start by echoing the words of an English journalist, Suzanne Moore, when she said:

“We must stop the inane talk of saving lives; let us start saving the

economy.”

And the public knows what really matters. Hon Speaker, she went further to say that even if patients are [Inaudible.] the fact remains that we fear death more than recession.

Our apex priority should be to save lives. A life lost is too high a cost. We cannot save the economy without saving lives. This is in line with the Health MEC when she was saying earlier to strengthen the economy, we need to strengthen health and [Inaudible.]

This I fully agree with. However, the reality is that in the province we have failed dismally to save the lives of the labour force. Many workers in retail and other clusters have fallen victim to COVID-19, with some paying the ultimate price of death. Even our frontline workers in health are not spared. Thousands of health workers have been infected, and some have died. Labour unions have put the blame squarely on negligence and complacency. We have been made aware of various cases where the workplace refused to close down and decontaminate after positive cases were found.

While the DA wants to hide these realities behind claims of better testing and tracing, there is no explanation for the high fatality rate in the Western Cape. The Western Cape has nearly two-thirds of the fatalities. All opportunities to save lives and to promote livelihood need to be explored. The vitriolic diatribe that was spewed by the MEC is laughable. He picks and chooses

what he wants to put aside. While his Government only created a marketplace to preserve the economy of white elite, the National Government has been working around the clock to save livelihoods.

As the MEC of Economic Opportunities, he should have told us how, under his watch, many companies that were operating under Level 5 and lockdown, managed to in fact [Inaudible.] many workers, which [Inaudible.] in order for it.

While the MEC of Health was trying to explain the sector management protocol, the reality is that it did not help the province to halt the infection. While the DA Chief Whip rushes to defend her party's herd immunity agenda, the public sentiment shared by some of her party proved this point. One example is the statement of MEC Madikizela:

“The country's current ‘house arrest’ is not only causing a major economic crisis, it also puts lives at risk. Death will visit us all at some stage. We cannot stop living our lives.”

In closing, the court case that was mentioned here, which declared the national lockdown as unconstitutional. I highly doubt it would pass the scrutiny of a higher court. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Lekker, the Chief Whip of the Opposition. Hon members, I am sure we can all see there was a serious

challenge that side, and it would have been very unfortunate not to have allowed hon member Lekker the opportunity to address the House. Thank you very much for your indulgence. I now recognise hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you for the hon members contributing to this debate. Can I just say, hon member Nkondlo, in the future when you quote Amilcar Cabral, please do it properly. It is not your quote, so you have to reference who you are quoting in the debate so everybody out there knows whose debate it is.

Minister Nomafrench, I wholeheartedly agree with your sentiments in terms of saving lives and preserving livelihoods.

Hon member Herron, if I can just add, I agree with part of what you are saying. However, as you know, Sweden did not put plans in place that the Western Cape Government has done. We are talking quarantine sites, mass screening sites ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon ... [Interjection.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ... CTICC, etcetera. Chairperson?

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mackenzie, will you please address the Speaker.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Okay, I am addressing you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Speaker. Via the Chairperson ...  
[Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: On a point of order, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: What is your point ... [Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: On a point of order, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, can you just correct, hon member Mackenzie. I never quoted Amilcar Cabral. He must go and read if he wants to posture here as some ... [Interjection.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: That is not a point of order, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon ... [Interjection.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: That is a point for debate.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. You know, there is one Speaker here. Hon member Nkondlo, that was not a point of order, it is a point for debate, but let us now look at another hand here. Hon member Bakubaku-Vos, I see you have your hand up. What was your point of order? Is that a point of order?

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: [No audible response.]

The SPEAKER: Or you have inadvertently pressed the - lifted your hand? I hope you made a mistake. Then we can proceed. Hon member Mackenzie ... [Interjections.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Sorry, hon Speaker.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Speaker. With regards to hon member Herron, I agree with you, you cannot resuscitate dead bodies, but you can also not resuscitate an economy with dead bodies, so you have to look at both sides of the fence.

I agree wholeheartedly with what hon member Wenger was saying, and similarly hon member Christians, and hon member David Maynier.

Hon member Windvogel, it is clear that – and I do not know where you got your information from - you are using outdated information via the Speaker. The Western Cape has tested more per 100,000 than any other province. The ANC-led Government, as you know, has dropped the ball on testing. The National Health Laboratory Service ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ... has ballooned from 18,000 to 27,000 ...

[Interjection.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Point of order, hon Speaker.

Mr R MACKENZIE: I do not know if that is done deliberately to stop ...

[Interjection.] how fast the virus ... [Interjection.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Point of order, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mackenzie, will you please take your seat. I hear there is a voice, who is that, hon members?

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: It is hon member Bakubaku-Vos, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Oh, so your hand is now up, correct?

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Yes, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: What is ... [Interjection.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: But hon member Mackenzie is repeating what he has done to hon member Nombi. He is addressing hon member Windvogel now.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Bakubaku-Vos. I would like to

address you, hon member Mackenzie, on the same point.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Apologies, hon Speaker, I will rephrase it.

The SPEAKER: Remember you are addressing the Speaker, so please do not ... [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Yes, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: ... let me call your name again. Please proceed.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: I will rephrase it, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, hon member Windvogel clearly uses outdated and old information.

The Western Cape has tested more per 100,000 people in South Africa, but the ANC National Government completely dropped the ball on testing. By the own admission of the National Government, the backlog from the Western Cape has gone from 18,000 and ballooned to 27,000. It is clear, hon Speaker, that hon member Windvogel has got no clue what is happening in New Zealand. How long does she want to be under lockdown? We already have the world's longest hard lockdown. A year, two years, three years? I do not know.

The problem is when people cut and paste from the internet, if you do not know how to cut, do not paste, because they cut headlines not reading the full

story, and, hon Speaker, via you, the National Government †gee nie 'n flenter om [does not care a hoot] about the people in this country, which is exactly why we are in this situation that we are in today. †Hulle het die land kaal gesteel, [They have stolen the country blind] and the hon member, via you, hon Speaker, clearly did not listen what hon member Maynier said.

There is a document by the hon member's party on the table. They want to take her own pension money. She did not even mention it. The National ANC Government wants to take her pension money, †die laaste bietjie geld wat oor is, [the last bit of money that is left], to further make South Africans poor, and via you, hon ... [Interjections]

The SPEAKER: Please wrap up, hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ... via you, hon Speaker. Saving lives without saving the economy is exactly the debate that the DA-led Western Cape Government has been saying all the time. You cannot have the one without the other. I thank you.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mackenzie. This, hon members, concludes the debate in the name of hon member Mackenzie, as he has just done so now, and we proceed to the next order.

I will now request that the Deputy Speaker take over. I am taking a break.  
Thank you, hon members. Hon the Deputy Speaker, are you ready?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thanks.

*[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair.]*

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. We now proceed to Interpellations as printed on the Question Paper. I recognise the hon Minister Schäfer.

## **INTERPELLATIONS**

### *Schools: clean running water*

#### **1. Mr M Xego asked the Minister of Education:**

Whether all the schools in the province have adequate clean running water?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and to the hon member for the question. The answer to the question is yes, all schools except three have adequate clean running water. The exceptions are

Fairdale Primary School in Mfuleni; Washington Drive Primary School in Mitchells Plain; and Sunridge Primary School in Milnerton. These are mobile schools and the City has a backlog for applications for permanent connections.

In the interim the schools have been provided with water storage tanks that will be filled with water, until the permanent connections are done. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I recognise hon member Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Yes, thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. In terms of what the Minister has now said, we have done our moving around the schools, and what we have also picked up, hon Minister, is that during this week of reopening of schools, there was a serious shortage of soap in the schools.

Now, in terms of ensuring that there is adequate clean and running water there, and the implementation of surface hygiene and consistent handwashing, how is the Department ensuring that schools are opened under hygienic circumstances? Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I recognise hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. During the 2017/18

financial year an audit was requested into school sanitation infrastructure, after the death of two learners in the Eastern Cape and Limpopo, respectively 2017 and '14, when they drowned in pit latrines, and today this is still inadmissible.

In the 2018 audit report presented at the NCOP as a work in progress, at the same time the WCED presented its progress, and revealed that it spent just under a hundred percent of its infrastructure grant.

Furthermore, in its presentation, it met all targets, including upgrading of infrastructure, new schools and halls built, storm damage and general refurbishments, as well as its drought interventions, as required at the time.

One can thus welcome the fact that despite these challenges, the Provincial Department can provide clean water to all schools, especially during this time of crisis where hygiene is critical in fighting the pandemic.

I want to ask, hon Minister, please can you speak to whether there is a difference in having clean, running water at the Metro school, versus having clean, running water at a rural school, and including those schools who are situated on privately owned land, or where the Department is leasing the school building. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIP WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Firstly, I want to commend my colleague, hon member Xego, for a well-thought-out question that he just posed. I think it is very, very relevant for the current context, but, hon Deputy Speaker, from visiting schools and from engaging stakeholders, we as the ANC are convinced that not all conditions have been met for the return of Grade 7 and Grade 12 learners.

Safe and secure water supply remains a major challenge for far too many poor schools in our province, and in many of our so-called rural areas water supplies at schools are suspect. Some with too little flow, and then there are others with not the required quality, hon Deputy Speaker. Even in the Cape Metro the water infrastructure at schools is generally not conducive for the mass handwashing that is especially required during this particular period. Many washrooms are not hygienic, or remain under pressure, with some not even having basins.

This week, hon Deputy Speaker, we discovered various schools in Philippi as well that have got no water. Mzamomhle Primary and Siyazakha Primary School are two examples.

Now, hon Deputy Speaker, as the MEC has responded, and I am glad that she has mentioned it, in Fairdale Primary School in Mfuleni there is still no water, no electricity connection and refuse bins, despite the MEC's reply – and she has given this particular reply about the water connection ...  
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIP WHIP (ANC): ... and no water, despite her reply to my parliamentary question, stating that the school has achieved contractual completion, and that water was in use. I would like an explanation as to the contradictory answers that we are getting now, and the response that I got earlier in this particular term. This just shows, hon Deputy Speaker, that ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up, hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIP WHIP (ANC): ... the DA-led Provincial Government is obsessed with the well-heeled in the leafy suburbs, with this Trump-like approach to our ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIP WHIP (ANC): ... education system. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I recognise hon member Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. With regard to the response that was given earlier by the Minister, to paint the picture that the current Government is ready to reopen the schools in the province, the reality on the ground is a totally different picture of what the MEC has painted. It will not

only result in risking the lives of the young ones, but also to subject the workers, as well as the teachers to unhygienic circumstances.

Shortage of water in a province that is predominantly rural in terms of its five district municipalities that are outside the Metro, is a serious challenge, in particular in the rural farming areas.

So now what I want to understand is that how is the MEC going to deal with issues especially in areas where there are farms, with privately owned land under farms in the rural areas; what is the intervention going to be from the MEC's side? Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon member Xego, the shortage of soap, I would like to know specifics, please. The fact of the matter is that if there is sanitiser then that is also adequate for people to sanitise their hands, but we are also obviously going to be delivering soap to schools.

Of course schools also do receive Norms and Standards funding, which they should also ensure that they use for things like soap, because that is something that should be at the school anyway, but if you have any specific schools that you are concerned about, please, will you send it to my office by

tomorrow, and we will certainly investigate.

How are we ensuring that there are highly hygienic areas? We are ensuring that by making sure that there is a thorough cleaning of all schools before they open. We are making sure that there is an additional cleaning once the learners go back, either in the morning or after they leave in the afternoon, to ensure that it is sanitised with bleach, and we are also ensuring that there is sanitiser at every one of the schools, and my reports say that that is the case.

So if you have evidence to the contrary, I would appreciate it if you sent it immediately to me.

Hon member Botha, there is no difference – I mean we all need water, whether it is running water as in connected to a pipe, or coming out of a container, we still need water, whether in rural schools or not.

So that is an essential, especially for being able to wash down the school and diluting the bleach and so on, to be able to do the cleaning. That should apply even on private land.

Hon member Sayed, you have mentioned two schools, Siyazakha and Mzamomhle, and if you have any others, I will certainly investigate those. My information is that everything has been delivered to all schools.

So if that is not the case, again, I would like to know about it, and I will take

that up internally with my Department. There is water at Fairdale. It is just not running water. It is not connected, as I said, because the Municipality has not yet been able to do the installation.

Then hon member Xego again, as I say if there are any schools – we had three schools that did not have running water, which we made alternative arrangements for. It is fine to say that we are not convinced, that the conditions are not met. Well, if you are not convinced, you need to give me evidence, because my evidence on the advice of my Department and officials is that they have been met, and if you have got evidence to the contrary, then you need to give that to me. You cannot just say that you are not convinced, because I am also convinced that they have been.

So I would need to be convinced that they have not by proof, and we will then investigate immediately at any particular school.

We have said all along that if a school is not ready, they must inform the circuit manager immediately, and they will be assisted to get ready. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. That concludes the first interpellation. We are moving over to the second interpellation. I just wanted to check, is hon member Makamba-Botya in the House today? I have not, we

have not received apologies, and it is part of her interpellation. If not, then I suspect we will just ask ICT to call her, to check, and in the meantime, we will start the second interpellation with the hon Minister Marais.

*Arts and creativity: financial assistance due to lockdown*

**2. Ms N Makamba-Botya asked the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:**

What assistance has her Department been providing to those who rely on arts and creativity as their source of income and who can no longer receive an income due to the COVID-19 lockdown restrictions?

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you for the question.

The regulations related to the National State of Disaster and the subsequent lockdown, which have limited movement and gatherings of people, have had a devastating impact on the arts, culture and heritage sector, because of the cancellation and postponement of events.

Further to this, it has resulted in uncertainty amongst South Africans, particularly when it comes to spending. Even the consumers may defer major consumption decisions because of uncertainties for 12 to 18 months. Consumption will focus on essential items because of this experience, and

this will have a further, protracted, negative impact on spending on the arts long after lockdown.

In response to this, Government has come up with a number of relief options for various sectors of the economy. The National Department of Sports, Arts and Culture has allocated over R150 million to provide the much-needed relief to practitioners in this sector. This will be used to render various forms of support to practitioners during this period.

The bulk of these initiatives announced by the National Minister of Sport, Arts and Culture, cover activities that have a national footprint, and not just those in provinces which are crucial for a provincial and national GDP.

It was therefore important for the Western Cape Government to make efforts in support of the creative economy, given the significant impact that it has on the economy of the province, as well as its significance in building a socially inclusive society; a key component to our productivity as a region.

The Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport developed relief options for a culture in a creative sector. The relief options have focused on two of the three phases in the fight against the COVID-19 outbreak. It also focused on two of the three pillars of the national response: social relief and economic recovery pillars.

Aware of the very complex and evolving COVID-19 environment, the DCAS

relief targeted areas of relief which could be achieved quickly, focusing on categories where support was most needed and most helpful. The Department focused on efforts that would have a direct impact on artists, specifically those whose sole source of income was their craft. This effort went further to provide support to organisations and venues which are platforms for artists to earn an income, and here we prioritise support to organisations who were having difficulty meeting their obligations to artists because of the cancellations.

An effort was also made to look at those artists who may have been disproportionately impacted by COVID-19, particularly those older than 60 years of age.

As already indicated, efforts are made to support artists within both the business continuity phases, as well as the recovery phase post lockdown. The relief options addressing the above are as follows:

- Event cancellation support for DCAS-funded events or projects.
- Arts venue and production cancellations.
- Artists or creators.

And the funds in this form of relief are targeted at freelance workers, and this is inclusive of session musicians, buskers, visual artists, stage managers and other creatives along the value chain.

- Community arts education and training organisations.
- Humanitarian relief for our Legends grant, and
- A public call for application was published on 6 May 2020 and closed on 19 May 2020. We received 1,332 emails; some containing several applications in them, and we are currently processing these in preparation for the adjudication process scheduled to begin on 4 June 2020 – this is today.

The Department will also be making the following interventions in support of the culture and creative economy to deal with the impact of the National State of Disaster.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, Minister Marais.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you so much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Can I just check if hon member Makamba-Botya is in the House? It does not seem like it. I am going to move on to hon member Allen.

Mr R ALLEN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Are you able to hear me, hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I can hear you clearly.

Mr R ALLEN: Thank you so much. Minister Marais, thank you for giving us feedback in terms of the relief funding that was made available by the Provincial Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport. I firmly believe it should be welcomed, it should be commended, and I would appreciate it if you are able to speak more in terms of the adjudication process to make sure that that process obviously needs to include representatives from various sectors in order to promote fairness, because we have seen at a national level with the National Department of Sports and Culture, their support funding application, according to media reports, was abruptly closed on 6 April 2020, and it was widely critiqued for its discrepancies within its application process, which obviously led to an exclusion for many artists who are in need of support.

Also, I believe that in terms of the national funding, it lacked detail on the criteria related to the qualification for funding, which obviously opens a door for manipulation in the selection process, and here in the Western Cape I firmly believe that if we are taking that lead, and I will appreciate your answering this regard ... [Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Order!

Mr R ALLEN: ... because we need to fill the gaps that National Government appears to be unable or unwilling to undertake. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Lili, can I have your

attention, please. That came directly from you. I am not sure why you are calling out “order”, but the last time I checked I am in the Chair. Can I ask that you please do not actually make statements or comments like that, if that is called a comment. Thank you. I move over now to hon member Bans.

Ms A BANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, for over 10 weeks artists have had nothing to eat. They are starving in their homes, not knowing where their next meal is going to come from.

Many artists who have lost their livelihood due to COVID-19 are asking for only R3,500 in relief to put food on their table. While the Western Cape has a provincial relief fund for cultural, creative and sport sectors, I have it on good authority that many artists, especially the rank and file, will not benefit. The biggest hurdle is the red tape involved in the process, and I want to challenge the MEC to tell us her plans to cut red tape, and to accelerate the release of the relief fund.

I have been in constant communication with TUMSA, a union of musicians that was founded right here in Cape Town, with a national membership of 2,000 members, 700 of them coming from the Western Cape. The union is calling on the MEC to find ways to assist artists. They have met with her several times, but they have not found joy in those interactions.

I learnt that over 70% of TUMSA members did not apply, because the application process was too tedious and complex, sometimes requiring over

12 forms to include in the application. This means the poorest of the poor artists who needed the relief most, will not be getting it.

For many years the plight of the poor artists in the province was ignored. I rise today to call on the Provincial Government to hear the cries of our artists and to show some urgency on its response to their plight.

The Department must cut its red tape in the process. It must allow unions and associations who have a database of artists and athletes, to assist with particulars of beneficiaries in need ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off, hon member Bans.

Ms A BANS: ... of the relief. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Can I just check if hon Makamba-Botya is back in the House? No. We will then finish off with the hon Minister Marais.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I am going to start with hon member Bans. I just want to mention that we will meet with TUMSA, and I have had discussions with TUMSA as well, and we have met almost a year ago, not on the relief fund.

So we will meet with them now in the near future; and then thank you so

much to hon member Reagen. I am very happy to say that the Adjudication Committee is very diverse, and they will send you the list of names.

Then as we emerge and rebuild our communities, we will continue to monitor a legislation informed by the alert levels, to prepare for the return of the cultural and creative economy.

We will also continue to provide updates on private and public funding opportunities, as well as support creative resources to get us through these unprecedented times.

Then finally, and just for the record, I have received a national list of beneficiaries, and only a few of the Western Province received funding, and therefore even though we have a small budget, I am more than grateful to our Department to allocate the relief funding to assist our Western Cape artists. I thank you.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister Marais. That concludes Interpellation Two. We move over to the third interpellation. I recognise the hon minister Mbombo.

*Reopening of schools*

**3. Ms W F Philander asked the Minister of Health:**

- (a) What is the role of her Department in the reopening of schools and
- (b) what kind of support does her Department provide to the education system?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Am I on?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, I hear you. Yes.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, yes. Thank you, hon member Philander for the question. Firstly you need to understand that we always play a role in schools, irrespective of Covid or not, for example, we have got a school hub as a sub-system of health services that we render, and we have got dedicated school nurses that are there, according to the districts and also allocated to schools.

Then in the case of some vaccines and also some of the interventions, for example, the issue of HPV, which is the vaccine that we give to young girls to prevent early cancer of the cervix, the uterus, and also some of the vaccines, like tetanus and hepatitis, are part of it. So there is a school nurse that is dedicated to every school.

The same applies that with Grade R and the Grade 1's. We have got buses in Metro and also in the rural areas that are dedicated to school health services. So irrespective of Covid or not, we always have such.

So when it comes to the reopening related to Covid, actually any sector cannot open without bouncing with Health. Whether it is in the Western Cape or in the whole world, you cannot, we have to bounce, because it is all going to go back to the Health.

So that is why, just like in all other sectors, we engage with them and develop guidelines. The same applies with ... [connection lost.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Mbombo, we have lost you. Minister Mbombo?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have completely lost her. Alright, Minister Mbombo, one last try.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I apologise. If you can try and please try and call Minister Mbombo to come back on. We will move over to hon member Philander.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. The reopening of schools has sparked criticism and a lot of reaction from parents,

pressure groups and to a point where the Human Rights Commission is threatening court action.

We do understand the concerns around learner health and their safety, and inevitable readiness preparation by schools with the support of the departments in order to continue with teaching, but keeping learners safe, which is already beyond their sectoral objective.

We welcome the readiness of the Western Cape schools to reopen on 1 June 2020 in terms of gazetted regulations. We further welcome the role and the support that the Western Cape Department of Health has offered, and still offers during this time, and the integral part it has to play in the hotspot strategy adopted by the Western Cape Government as the province remains the epicentre.

In yesterday's Standing Committee, hon Deputy Speaker, the Department announced that there is a de-escalation of services to free capacity in dealing with the pandemic, one of which immunisation is of importance to young lives in this province. The Department also noted a decrease in immunisation, especially in hotspot areas, upon which they embarked on deep recalibration efforts in order to continue with non-COVID-19 healthcare.

These efforts, hon Deputy Speaker, with regard to pickup points, delivery services and community healthcare worker efforts, must be commended. Hon Deputy Speaker, this period has brought a lot of uncertainty.

The new testing strategy adopted by the Western Cape Government is focused on saving lives, all lives. Also, that the delay in National Health Laboratory Services is simply not [Inaudible.] option, of which we understand the global demand, and that's the provision in South Africa as well.

We therefore welcome the strategy to save lives in the Western Cape, with emphasis on all lives, that shows true commitment from a caring government in the Western Cape.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I wanted the Minister to elaborate on the WOSA approach and the intergovernmental and departmental approach and collaboration. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Philander. Can I just check that hon Minister Mbombo is back online. She has two minutes 20 seconds left of her speech time.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: [No audible response.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: All right. If we can try and sort out that line, while we move over to hon member Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. In mid-May France recorded 70 cases of COVID-19 in the first week of reopening schools. The Israeli Government yesterday announced it has threatened to close down 42

kindergartens and schools after 244 students and staff tested positive after opening schools. Over 6,800 students and teachers are in home quarantine by Government order.

These examples are dispelling the often-repeated misinformation and deliberate mistruth, that students have some form of immunity from the virus as fewer cases than that have been recorded.

The role of the Provincial Health Department should be to study these international trends and advise the WCED and Government about the dangers of reopening schools, but the opposite is happening in the province. The Health Department is playing a central role in the Provincial Government's herd immunity agenda. There is absolutely no need to rush to open schools in the province, especially when there is clear evidence that the province is not ready to reopen schools.

The WCED announced that 37 educators had already been infected. In the Standing Committee for Education, the Department's official stated that the Province will not be deep-cleaning and decontaminating schools because of an advice received from the Department of Health. It has also been stated that they sought a waybill from the Department not to adhere to some social distancing regulations when all grades return to school. I hope this was a ...  
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off ... [Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: ... misrepresentation of the Department by the WCED officials. I call upon the MEC to clarify these claims. I repeat, our priority must be to ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: ... preserve the lives of our teachers and learners. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Windvogel. We go back – can I just check again on hon Minister Mbombo. I think I am going to wait to the end for her to respond. We will move over to hon member Philander.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The Western Cape Government clearly proved their commitment to all communities in this province by aligning and adjusting strategy during this time of crisis, based on real events as to what our people experience on a daily basis.

This was again proved when National Government adopted the hotspot strategy during alert Level 3 of lockdown, and came to realise eventually that an integrated plan is needed in society where lives and livelihoods are equally important, especially in the context of South Africa, which education is key to prosperity, and health remains a key stepping stone.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the debate on COVID-19 is not a political debate, †en

ek wens die ANC wil ophou om ons mense te mislei. [and I wish the ANC would stop misleading our people.] In fact, in the Western Cape people that fall ill – a healthcare worker or someone that is at high risk – †sal nie meer sewe tot 12 dae hoef te wag nie, [will not have to wait seven to 12 days anymore,] and they can receive their test results between 20 and 48 hours.

Hon Deputy Speaker, although scholars do not fall within the vulnerable brackets, that does not mean that this concern is not warranted. We are human after all. †Stop om ons mense te mislei. [Stop misleading our people.]

Hon Deputy Speaker, as we embark on the new normal, the measures instituted provide much needed support for calm and certainty, and a whole of society approach ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired. [Interjection.]

Ms W F PHILANDER: ... to this pandemic, and the risk factors. I conclude, hon Deputy Speaker. In the meantime, let us not forget to do our part ... [Interjection.] to keep our kids and our communities ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up, hon member.

Ms W F PHILANDER: ... safe and to relieve the pressure on the system.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Ms W F PHILANDER: I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. I know that hon Minister Mbombo is in the House, and she is still awarded two minutes from her previous time, plus her four minutes, so I am handing over to you, hon Minister Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Okay, thank you. I am not sure where I left off, because I was just speaking, speaking, speaking until the point I lost the connection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: But the point what we are trying to make is that international research does show that learners or children are mostly not affected by the Corona virus, compared to adults, as is often the case in some diseases, like TB and HIV.

So in this case the issue is going to be how we can prevent the circumstance of when they congregate, specifically the adults, and they end up infecting the others. That is why we work with the Department of Education as to what means should be in place.

Again, look at the incoming research that keeps on coming up. I gave an example of the sanitising tunnels that some were proposing should be part of it. The evidence shows that they actually will not have much impact.

Anything that fumigates, and all of those, it is only on surfaces where the cleaning will have an impact.

Also you may recall that the schools were closed at a time that Covid was not as widespread, and even if there was an infection there a month ago, there is no way that the virus will still be there. Therefore the issue is not about disinfecting the whole school but it is where learners now return and they have to change their classrooms. How do we disinfect all of those?

So what we are trying to highlight is that there is no way anyway that Education would have actually reopened schools without bouncing with Health. There is no sector that could open without looking at the occupational and health and safety responsibilities, and also in terms of meeting the regulations.

So for me, where I am sitting, in terms of the guidelines that we have provided, and if Education sticks to these guidelines, there is no way anywhere in the world where you will not be able to open the schools, which we have seen actually worldwide; but again, we keep on learning every day. We do not want to be over-confident, but at least we need to be able to open and see how it goes, because the issue is as National Health has indicated, as the models have indicated, that the worst scenario will be in September in South Africa. Does it mean that now our children will still be waiting until September?

However, lastly, hon Deputy Speaker, we need to understand that people keep on reflecting that some teachers have got infected. What is going to happen where that teacher has been infected? I always say that I am from a Department that works 24 hours, 365 days. If now I was expected to say to a teacher in Delft he/she must not come to work in case they are infected, it means that I have to send the same message to a nurse, to a policeman: “Do not come to work.”

So it cannot be that we are saying that some other sectors, the essential service sectors, should be open and the others cannot. However, we must not do it recklessly and a phased approach for the grades needs to be endorsed by Health. Not only in the Western Cape, even the National Department of Health, even before it was suggested that the schools reopen, it was bounced by us together with the experts. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister Mbombo. That concludes the Interpellations. We will now move in terms of Rule 202 to Questions. Just to stress that you have four opportunities for follow-up questions as printed on the Question Paper, but the hon member who initiated the question gets the first opportunity to respond. So over to Questions. I recognise the hon Minister Fernandez.

#### **QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY**

*Food parcels, distribution of*

**1. Ms P Z Lekker asked the Minister of Social Development:**

(a) What is the total number of food parcels distributed since the start of the lockdown period to date and (b) what challenges have been experienced?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Good afternoon, hon Deputy Speaker. Am I audible? Can you hear me loud and clear?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Deputy Speaker, I would like to thank the hon member Lekker for the question, which has two parts.

The first part of the question talks to the number of food parcels distributed by the Department of Social Development. I can give the breakdown. We distributed 4,920 parcels to existing beneficiaries at targeted feeding sites. A further 5,000 beneficiaries from existing community nutrition and development centres, also known as CNDC's, received parcels, and then a further 37,244 food parcels funded by the Department have been distributed to date by four humanitarian relief organisations.

So in total the DSD parcel allocation distribution is 47,164 food parcels.

The Question 2 regarding challenges. There were numerous challenges. One of the key challenges was the interruption of distribution in areas such as Khayelitsha, Kayamandi, Delft, Dunoon, Oudtshoorn, Villiersdorp and Grabouw, sometimes due to food protests, and also the criminal element.

Some of the other challenges we faced were duplicate applications, incorrect addresses supplied by applicants, the non-availability of applicants on the contact numbers when we returned their calls. When we started off, we operated with a limited staff, because we have not increased our staff complement to make provision for this relief effort.

We also experienced temporary closure of certain DSD offices where COVID-19 became evident, and/or where staff had to go into quarantine. As for the temporary closure of participating humanitarian relief operations due to Covid and social distancing, there were high volumes of requests which impeded the call centres ability to process.

One of the big issues that still continues is fake news that distorted the official messaging regarding the food relief programme, and this resulted in a fair amount of panic and confusion.

There was also unrealistic expectation on the parts of various pressure groups who submitted thousands of names at a time, despite the fact that there were clear criteria specified.

So incorrect client information and a backlog of the Call Centre's "please call me", which resulted in undue delays. One of our responses was to increase the Call Centre complement, and that has assisted greatly. However, the project has now been closed, and we are busy with the final deliveries to the various six regions across the province. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I am just looking at the statistics or numbers that were given by the MEC and I am struggling to make coordination, because in the House we were informed that the Department would distribute 50 000 food parcels. Now from the report of the MEC it is 47 164 and I am really interested to know what happened to the balance that I can see in my calculation?

But also, Deputy Speaker, one of the key challenges mentioned by the MEC is the unrealistic expectations that were submitted by people. I am particularly interested as, if this was unrealistic, what was the plan for how many food parcels would be distributed per community?

I see there are criteria that was put in place, but where does that put the applications of vulnerable people from the informal settlements that may not have been affected by COVID-19, but are literally poor? They do not have the means to buy or even plant their own food garden. So what exactly were the criteria and what was the planning in terms of the applications that would

have been expected by the Department? I thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Lekker. I recognise hon Bosman and then hon Marais.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you very much Deputy Speaker, and to the Minister, through you. Hon Minister, I would like to know since the pool of the vulnerable is growing every day, will the South African Social Security Agency be distributing food parcels to this growing pool of vulnerable people as well?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Deputy Speaker, if I may respond. I think it is important to provide the context to the 50 000 food parcels.

The need for food parcels originated when SASSA's budget was depleted in this province late in the financial year, last year. So SASSA would normally provide what is called Social Relief of Distress and we identified a gap by the number of calls coming through. So what Social Development did, we reprioritised R35 million of DSD funds and it was spread across six social development regions, as far as George and Beaufort West.

At that point we did not have the extended lockdown impacting those

individuals in that vulnerable pool, which is the reason why I say we are now facing a humanitarian crisis.

So the criteria we used; we worked with Social Development and we used their criteria for Social Relief of Distress together with their SOCPEN database to ensure that there was no double dipping, and at that point it would have been people who would have gone to SASSA's offices, but due to SASSA being closed, they could not access the relief that they required and that was the rationale for us, with the Premier making a statement, I think it was on 5 April.

Then I must say that the 47 000 are not our full allocation. We have delivered approximately 40 000 but all the screening and vetting have been done, the recipients know who they are. It is now a matter of the distribution which, as I said, has been impeded by the fact that some members in our distribution team had to go into quarantine, some of our service providers had to go into quarantine, so that has been the backlog.

I am certain that by next Friday we will have a complete close-out report and I can also alert the member that if you go to the Western Cape Government website, there is a little yellow tile and if you click on the yellow tile, it is an interactive map which will show you where food is being distributed across the province.

My response to the question was just based on DSD, but in that mapping

exercise we actually have all our donors. We have Community Chest, we have Ladles of Love, we have the District Municipality figures, we have farmers and Agrimark has stepped up.

In our humanitarian work-stream we are conducting a pilot – Minister Meyer together with the Overstrand District – regarding getting soup ingredients to the communities' soup kitchens in order for people to be fed a hot meal.

I am extremely concerned, Deputy Speaker, that we are talking about pie in the sky projects, like SAA R21 billion bail-outs and Eskom, when in this country more than 50% of our citizens are now experiencing food distress and until we get an announcement from National Treasury, we are just going to be scuppered in trying to stem the tide.

So as a Government, we have allocated R70 million; Education contributed R18 million; DLG gave R16.2 million and DSD gave R35 million. However, these are now unfunded mandates going into the new month and we need clarity urgently from the National Government regarding funding going forward.

When I talk about unrealistic, there was an effort on the part of some people who went knocking, door-to-door, to collect people's names and numbers and the application process was one that you had to call in, as an individual applicant, or you could have directed your request through an NPO or through a municipal manager.

So there were avenues, but sadly there were lobby groups who pushed to get extra food, but I recognise, and I would want the entire House to be mindful, that as this lockdown that I believe has now been extended until 15 July, if that is in fact true, and we cannot see everyone returning to work in Level 3 - I think about the hairdressers and all of them - then that vulnerable pool is going to grow even bigger and sadly, it has come back to Government and Government does not have the silver bullet.

If I speak to hon Bosman's question which talks to SASSA; SASSA works together with us, but the budget they have received for this province for the new year was a mere R36 million, of which only R10 million is allocated for Social Relief of Distress. Now if we have 50 000 parcels valued at R500 through our four service providers, the R10 million is not going to go very far.

But in our humanitarian workstream hon Deputy Speaker, we have SASSA as a key stakeholder in terms of the whole of government and I would like to share from the report that was tabled to Cabinet on 2 June. In terms of the SARD Grant status, SASSA received 13 million applications. Listen carefully. 6.7 million were rejected due to them being incomplete or duplicates. Of the remaining 6.3 million, 3.5 million were processed with 1.5 million then being rejected, so with all the checks and balances, it is a 40% rejection rate, and on the date of this report, there were 666 000 approved applications of which 37 000 were processed and, listen to this, only 2 117 were paid in the Western Cape.

We are in trouble. SASSA is our social security agency and unfortunately they are not responsive, they are not getting the food or the grants to the people quickly enough. Then I also need to add that, in the conditions, foreigners without papers will also not be considered and that provides the Department with an ethical dilemma, because poverty, hon Deputy Speaker, does not wear a political T-shirt or have a colour. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. I have got hon Marais and hon Botha. Those are the hands that came up. Hon Marais?

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Minister, do you admit the total failure of social services, social development, in feeding the stressed communities hungering for just a piece of bread? I want to ask you now, I have listened to all the figures you have given here, and we had a debate previously, this morning, about livelihoods and preserving the economy. Now when you say 'double-dipping', does it mean that if I want a food parcel every month I am 'double-dipping' or is that one food parcel supposed to be my quota as long as the lockdown lasts, maybe six or 12 months, and if I come again, it is 'double-dipping' or what is 'double-dipping'?

Do you have a fixed amount of money which you are supposed to give to x number of people or do you first determine how many people are in dire need and then you make the funds available from National, what comes first? The people who need, or the money that is ring-fenced, this is all we have and if this money is finished, you can go hungry, we cannot help you, sorry. That to

me is what I would like to understand, what we mean when we say we are giving food parcels? Are we going to feed the people as long as the lockdown lasts and people are prevented from working to earn a living, or are we giving it like a Christmas box? Christmas comes but once a year, when it comes, it brings great cheer. Is that what we are doing? One food parcel but the lockdown lasts until next year January? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Minister Fernandez?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Can you hear me, hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Now I can, yes. Please proceed.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The hon Marais touches on a very important point and it is something that resonates with me, close to my heart, because we need to move beyond food parcels. We need to look at a more sustainable way of addressing the issue of hunger post COVID-19, hence the establishment of the Humanitarian Work Stream.

I must concur with the hon Marais that the SASSA model which has been in existence for some time does not address the needs of the vulnerable in a COVID situation. We have seen large volumes of people calling in and sadly the Department of Social Development, at a provincial level, does not have funding for mass humanitarian feeding.

Funding normally takes place through our NPOs, which are our implementing partners. So what we would do is, once a year, I would sign off a submission as the Executive Authority; the NPOs, they would go out and do the work. What has happened with this extended lockdown is the fact that we had a vulnerable pool that would have been assessed regularly via SASSA's approach, Chapter 3 Social Services Act, and that is where the mandate lies. That mandate has now been devolved to provincial and local governments because of the inability of a national entity to step up to the plate.

I have to be dead honest, when our 50 000 parcels are up, as they are, they have all been allocated, we do not have funding. So we need to sit down as a Cabinet, come up with a plan and try and see where we can find money. But I must say we are running a pilot in a vulnerable ward in the City of Cape Town where we have delivered dry food to NPOs; they in turn cook the food and feed entire streets at a time, and it has been very well received.

However, the cost to the fiscus and as I said, we are hearing about SAA bailouts to the tune of R21 billion, I would like to hear the President say, we have allocated x amount for humanitarian relief, and then my closing remark on this one is that we need to revisit the old saying, 'you give a man a fish or you teach a man to fish', and I support the idea that Minister Meyer has introduced in the rural areas, that of food gardens. It is starting to happen in the city now. We have the City of Cape Town on board in terms of their feedback and I think the City of Cape Town, just this week, released R3.5 million to 10 NGOs in 21 wards. So they have obviously used the GO spatial

mapping, their census data to indicate where the food needs to land.

But with the extension of this lockdown, we are facing a crisis of epic proportions, and we all need to work together to find the necessary solutions to keep people from protesting, because a hungry man, hon Deputy Speaker, is an angry man. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I recognise hon Botha, but before she starts, I just want to say hon Bakubaku-Vos there are only four opportunities and unfortunately you are the fifth, so I call on hon Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. The Minister in her response to the initial question said in terms of challenges there were unsuccessful applicants. I just want to check, in terms of these unsuccessful applicants, hon Minister, how were these applicants informed of the outcome of their applications? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you for the question, hon member Botha. As a close-out exercise SMSs were sent to every single applicant who had applied, whether they had applied once or ten times, we had distributed SMSs from the first to the fourth of this month and we have also provided SASSA with a database of the most dire. Remember we are working very closely with SASSA in the province, despite the fact that all

their staff are not back – they are operating with a small team of volunteers - but SASSA is now revisiting that and testing it against the 350 SRD process which will see an individual receive R350 for six months and that would have started from May.

I do have a concern which I must share with the hon Botha, and that is the fact that many disabled grant beneficiaries could not have their grants renewed in March because either there were no doctors or they were unable to get the processing done.

I am now asking SASSA to provide me with an update because I also am concerned about the number of people who would have received a double pension last month and who would not have received a pension this month, bearing in mind that many individuals have their pension cards with the money lenders, and that adds a completely different perspective to this conversation.

However, as DSD, we remain committed to trying to find solutions. We are lobbying donors, we are lobbying NPOs, we have set up a donor desk, we have a warehouse where we are starting to see non-perishables come in and I can announce that right now 5 000 food parcels are being distributed. One of my ex-colleagues that I worked with many years ago has come from Durban and they are distributing and we also received food parcels and cell phones from MTN.

So the figure going forward will not be a DSD figure but a whole of society figure that reports and reflects where food lands in the most vulnerable areas.

I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. We move over to the next question. I recognise hon Minister Maynier.

*Essential products: hiking of prices*

**2. Mr M Xego asked the Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities:**

What role does his Department play in making sure that businesses do not hike the prices of essential products during the lockdown period?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, Deputy Speaker and thank you to the hon member for putting the question.

The Western Cape Government does not control prices but rather relies on the free market to regulate prices. But of course, in anticipation of price gauging or the hiking of prices during the COVID-19 crisis, the National Government promulgated the Consumer and Customer Protection and National Disaster Management Regulations and Directions earlier this year in March 2020.

Now, when the Western Cape office of the Consumer Protector, which of course sits in the Department of Economic Development and Tourism, receives complaints of higher than usual pricing, we direct the person to this regulation which deals, as I have said, with the Consumer and Customer Protection and National Disaster Management Regulations and Directions.

And of course, these regulations are there to promote the concerted conduct to prevent an escalation of the national disaster and to alleviate and contain and minimise the effects of the national disaster.

But most importantly, in addition to that, they serve to protect consumers and customers from unconscionable, unfair, unreasonable, unjust or improper commercial practices during a national disaster. Complaints of price-hiking received by the Western Cape office of the Consumer Protector are also of course directed to the Department of Trade and Industry and Competition. The Western Cape office of Consumer Protection regularly engages with the National Consumer Commission and the Competition Commission to assist businesses and consumers who identify any contravention of the Competition and Consumer Regulations.

I am advised that the Western Cape office of Consumer Protection has only dealt with one case involving allegations of price-gauging so far which was ultimately resolved.

The Western Cape's office of Consumer Protection is part of the Consumer

Protection Forum which includes the National Consumer Commission as well as the Competition Commission and it meets every two weeks during the lockdown to receive updates on regulations that would serve to protect businesses, and of course, consumers in South Africa. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. I recognise hon Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker and thanks to the Minister for the response. I am shocked that the Minister's response is that the Western Cape only recorded one case with the Consumer Protector which was later resolved. The National Minister of Trade and Industry has reported in the public domain that there are a number of cases that involve the Western Cape, such as Spar in Platteklouf that allegedly hiked prices in terms of sanitisers, the Sunnyside Pharmacy in Tableview, that also dealt with the issue of face masks as well as Pick 'n Pay in Milnerton.

So what we want to understand is how serious is the Department, during this time of vulnerability, in detecting all those aiming to hike prices in the province and what are the interventions to ensure that such things do not happen in our province?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Hon

Deputy Speaker, I wish to assure the member that we take any allegations or indeed cases of price-gauging or undue price-hikes very seriously and we will certainly be complementing National Government's effort by investigating any cases that are brought to our attention. However, up until now, only one case has been brought to our attention and that case has been resolved. But should any further cases come to our attention, they will certainly be referred to our office of Consumer Protection and of course to the Department of Trade, Industry and Competition for further investigation. We cannot, in this period, afford any unconscionable, unfair, unreasonable, unjust or improper commercial practices during a national disaster in the Western Cape.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I recognise hon Marais, then hon Baartman, then hon Mackenzie. Hon Marais, over to you.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you so much, Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, I would like to ask you, here now is an opportunity that has been created by COVID-19. Not everything is a dark cloud, there is some rain coming through, especially when it comes to tenders being given for medical equipment etc.

What are you doing to make sure that locally manufactured goods and companies get the contracts to supply schools and hospitals with medical equipment like sanitising whether free-standing, wall-mounted or foot-operated sanitising equipment and PPE; what is your Department doing to make sure that preference is given to SMMEs or local suppliers instead of

importing it because it could create a lot of opportunities, economically for local production and we have such companies who can supply it. Also, tell us, to whom should they apply or have you already decided who gets the contracts? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I can assure the hon member that the relevant localisation provisions are being implemented in our province, but there are some challenges because of course local content needs to be verified by external agencies and of course that takes some time, which presents a challenge during a national state of disaster. But I can assure the member that particularly when it comes to the kind of opportunities which he refers to, particularly in relation to personal protection equipment, that a large amount of PPE is being purchased from local suppliers, which of course support local businesses and jobs in the Western Cape.

I think the hon member would also be aware that we have established what we have called a PPE Marketplace, which seeks to link firms who require PPE with firms or individuals who are manufacturing PPE, which again, support many local companies and jobs in our province and we have at least 170 producers of PPE trading in that marketplace. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Hon Baartman?

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I would like to ask the Minister, what measures has the Minister put in place to protect against price hiking of personal protective equipment gear which could negatively impact on public spending, especially since as the Western Cape Government, we are also spending large amounts on acquiring these PPEs during this COVID-19 crisis? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you. [Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, hon Minister. Is there a point of order, hon Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Yes. Deputy Speaker, I just want to understand from you, the nature of the question, do you allow other speakers to introduce new questions or do they stick to them, because then we can utilise the questions to also try and ask new questions that were not part of the main question?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, that is up to the Minister if he wants

to answer that question, he does not have to because the question is very specific, that is totally up to him.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Right.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Hon Deputy Speaker, I think the hon member's question is pertinent because it relates to what measures we have put in place to ensure that departments in the Provincial Government are not vulnerable to price-gauging or undue price-hikes from businesses in relation to PPE.

Now in response to the hon member, I have made the point, of course, that we cannot and do not control the prices charged by suppliers, but we have put in place measures to support departments to manage prices at an appropriate level.

We have provided departments with a set of uniform specifications, of course which are approved, not only by the Provincial Department of Health but also the National Department of Health. We have provided departments with information about pricing, lead-times for delivery and the quantities available in relation to PPE and we have provided departments with benchmark prices which have been issued by National Treasury.

All these measures, I think go a long way to support departments and to reduce the risk of price-gauging or undue price-hikes which in the end, I think, will ensure that departments and the public get value for money when it comes to PPE. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Deputy Speaker and thank you Minister. Minister, I am just trying to find out what role does the DTI and the National Consumer Protector play when it comes to price-hikes, because that is exactly within their ambit, and secondly on the same question, what is the capacity on the ground to start monitoring and implementing these regulations, as member Xego asked, against price-hikes? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon member. Of course the Department of Trade and Industry and the National Consumer Council all form part of the Consumer Protection Forum which meets every two weeks to receive updates and to monitor and to regulate and to protect businesses and consumers and ultimately, their responsibility under the direction issued by the National Minister, the Consumer, Customer, Protection and National Disaster Management Regulations and Directions, it is their function to investigate those matters that relate to unconscionable, unfair, unreasonable, unjust and improper

commercial practices during this period of national disaster.

Ultimately, hon member, I think that the capacity obviously is always constrained but to the extent that these practices become apparent to our Department, I can assure him, that they will be followed up in the first instance by the Western Cape office of the Consumer Protector and of course each complaint will be referred to the Department of Trade and Industry and Competition so that we can act against price-gauging and undue price-hikes during this state of national disaster in the Western Cape. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Question 3 will stand over. We now move to Question 4. I recognise hon Minister Schäfer.

*[Question 3 standing over.]*

*Vandalism at schools affecting reopening*

**4. Ms L J Botha asked the Minister of Education:**

Whether the 104 cases of vandalism at schools in the province have affected the Department's readiness to reopen schools on 1 June 2020; if so, what support did her Department provide to these schools?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker, and to hon Botha for the question.

The total number of incidents reported to Safe Schools is 109 but this includes reports of suspicious persons near a school with no impact on readiness. So 100 schools were affected by burglary and vandalism between 20 March and 25 May. The majority of incidents happened in the Cape Winelands district, Metro Central and the West Coast. Many of the items stolen are those that are outside the school building, it was in the perimeter of the school such as fencing and garden tools or sporting equipment. Other items included electricity cables, computer equipment, security gates and kitchen equipment.

The WCED added additional day security and doubled night security in schools situated in high risk areas. Dogs were also deployed in some schools to deter people from entering the premises. The additional security costs amount to over R6 million for 470 schools.

Of the 100 schools vandalised, 48 schools required emergency repairs and maintenance. Work has been completed at 45 of those schools and the remainder are scheduled to be completed shortly. However, they are functional and will be able to open on 1 June with close monitoring. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Just before I move on to hon Botha who posed the question, hon Mackenzie is that your hand raised for this question or is that you have not lowered your hand as yet?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: I do apologise, Deputy Speaker, I lower my hand.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Okay, it is hon Botha and then I see hon Sayed and hon Botha, I see you have put your hand up, does that mean that you want to have two bites of the cherry?

Ms L J BOTHA: That is indeed correct, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, so it is hon Botha, you start off and then hon Sayed and then back to you.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, thank you for the answer. In terms of the numbers that you have just quoted with regard to vandalism in schools, how many criminal cases have been opened?

The DEPUTY MINISTER: Over to you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Out of the 100 cases, three of them were not reported. So 97 cases were reported to the police. The reason why two of them were not was because they were attempted burglaries with nothing actually stolen so the schools felt it was not worth it, and the other one we are following up. Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER: Noted. Thank you, Minister. Over to hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Deputy Speaker and thank you to the Minister for the responses. Is the Minister able to tell us how many of these incidents were the result of broken fences, and then if the Minister can just advise members of this House what we can do as members in our constituencies to work with communities to ensure that our schools are protected? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Sayed. I am looking at the list at the moment and there were not a large number of broken fences, but I can get you the exact number, hon Sayed.

What you can do, that is a very welcome question. We always tell communities that we would really appreciate them working with us because no fence to a school is stolen without somebody seeing it and we really, really need to ask our communities to report immediately if they see anybody stealing a fence or hanging around where they should not be, and we certainly have noticed some communities really rising to that challenge and if you could assist with that in communities where you work, that would be most appreciated. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister, I see hon Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. I would just like to

ask the Minister, in regard to the 97 cases that have been opened, do you know what the status of investigations are pertaining to these cases, and were there any arrests already made?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Hon member Botha, the one problem is that we do not get direct feedback from SAPS. They feedback and give progress reports to the schools directly. So we are not aware of that but I am certainly not aware of very many, from what I have heard anecdotally, but I will ask for a report from Safe Schools as well on that issue. I have been keeping lists for quite some time and the time when I last checked, there were really very, very few arrests that had been made and many cases had just simply been closed. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Is there anybody else that wants a final question, hon Sayed I see your hand came up first.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, Deputy Speaker, I am sorry I think I must remove it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, no problem, I see there are no more follow-ups to that question. We move over to Question 5, I see the hon Fernandez. Minister Fernandez, can you hear me? Minister Fernandez? While we sort out Minister Fernandez, if we can move over to Question 6 instead. I am going to

move over to Question 6, I recognise the hon Minister Maynier.

*Small business: Mitchells Plain*

**6. Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities:**

(a) How many small businesses has his Department supported in Mitchells Plain in the last financial year and (b) what are the details of the services provided to these small businesses?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, Deputy Speaker and thank you to the hon member for putting the question.

The Department of Economic Development and Tourism currently supports 300 businesses through the SMME Booster Fund implemented in 2019/20. The SMME Booster Fund aims to enhance existing SMME interventions implemented by intermediary organisations ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Can you hear me clearly?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just wait a minute, hon Maynier. Hon Fernandez ...

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hello, hon Deputy Speaker, can you hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I can hear you, can you hear us?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hello?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, it seems that hon Minister Fernandez does not hear us. I would like to proceed with hon Maynier if that is possible and hon Minister Fernandez, we will take your question afterwards. We will just check your connection in the meantime. Over to you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, Deputy Speaker, can I proceed?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes please, apologies.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER: Can we just ask everyone, one minute just to mute their mics please? Thank you, over to you Minister Maynier.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I think it is appropriate that I begin again.

As I was saying, the Department of Economic Development and Tourism currently supports about 300 businesses through the SMME Booster Fund implemented in 2019/20. The SMME Booster Fund aims to enhance the existing SMME interventions implemented by intermediary organisations that focus on SMME support. The Fund focuses on business development support, enterprise and supply development interventions as well as some infrastructure projects aimed at SMME development.

Of the businesses supported through the SMME Booster Fund, seven are located in Mitchells Plain. Three of these are assisted through the ASISA Flame Programme, two through the Khayelitsha Bandwidth Barn Project and two through the Fix Forward Contractor Development Programme. The ASISA Flame Programme focuses on enterprise development and provides businesses with training, mentorship and coaching.

The Khayelitsha Bandwidth Barn also provides businesses with training and support programmes to entrepreneurs, specifically through the use of digital technology tools, and the Fix Forward Contractor Development Programme develops contractors with training and mentorship support. It also provides market access through a portal where contractors and their work can be showcased and advertised.

Ultimately of course, all the SMMEs in Mitchells Plain are able to access any of the other support and resources that the Department of Economic Development and Tourism have put in place to assist entrepreneurs to start

and to grow their businesses. These include, as I mentioned earlier this afternoon, the Jump for Entrepreneurs Act, which allows SMMEs to better understand their businesses and markets, find other businesses, professional mentors and other beneficial people in their local area using a map and establish relationships for buying and selling of goods and services. Our Red Tape Reduction Unit of course assists entrepreneurs with business information, such as how to start a business, where to register a business as well as dealing with red tape issues related to small businesses, and we have done more.

We have implemented the Go Digital Western Cape Webinar Series and the Tech Volunteer Programme which provide SMMEs with access to digital and technology experts who can advise organisations on how they can adopt new technologies to better promote their products and services and access new markets and identify new opportunities to improve business operations. And of course, small businesses and entrepreneurs in Mitchells Plain are also able to access business development support through the Small Enterprise Development Agency Branch which is part of the Provincial SMME Forum, established by my Department, and assists small businesses with business development services, advice, counselling, access to opportunities and links to training.

And so all the small businesses and SMMEs in Mitchells Plain are of course able to access any of the support provided by the Department of Economic Development and Tourism. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I recognise hon Mackenzie and then hon Marais and I see hon Mackenzie again.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Deputy Speaker and thank you Minister for the response, it is certainly enlightening.

The first point, obviously one would like a list of those businesses, so when I visit my constituency there I can conduct oversight. The second point is how – and they are great services that your Department provides and certainly access to the Internet etc. – does your Department communicate with potential entrepreneurs and potential small businesses to have access to these services, and the second part to that is, how many times do they go out to these communities so that people know where to apply for these services and where do they advertise when they go out to the communities? Thank you, Minister.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you hon member. First of all, we can certainly furnish you with a list of these businesses so that you can indeed do oversight in your constituency, and I would certainly welcome the opportunity to join you in visiting some of these intermediary organisations in your constituency, to showcase and see some of the good work being done by the Department.

I am advised that these various services and the support that we provide to small businesses are of course widely advertised, particularly on the Western Cape Government's website and in other media, so that we can get as wide as possible a group of SMMEs, not just in Mitchell Plain, but all over the Western Cape, taking advantage of the support measures which my Department furnishes to small businesses in the Western Cape. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Hon Marais, then hon Mackenzie, then hon Nkondlo. Hon Marias, over to you.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. Minister, like I said before, we have an opportunity here to really revitalise our dependency on ourselves instead of depending on outside companies to supply us with our needs. I have had complaints from small businesses that said the application for assistance from the fund has been declined because they could not produce a tax clearance certificate.

Is this so in light of the lockdown? Things do not operate as they normally would, even if you want to get tax clearance certificates, etc? But some of them say they have been declined on that basis. I would like to hear your view on that. One company is a recycling business, one of these BBBEEs, a small business here in Parow and which is doing a great service, but it has not been approved. Now the approval, I know that you work with Wesgro and the City of Cape Town too in managing this fund, where does the final decision lie whether it is rejected or not? Do you get a fixed amount for the

Western Cape or is it a conditional grant from which you assist these businesses, and how can you assist them for the Western Cape to get its fair share of this kitty, to help them? They have to pay rent, but they have no income but it does not matter when the person who owns this factory or business says, I want my rent, and they say we cannot open and do not have an income, but he wants his rent. They need assistance and now the Department comes and says we want your tax clearance certificates before we can help you. Can you please comment on that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I am unsure of the fund to which the hon member refers. But there are several funds available from National Government and the case which the hon member refers to, where a business is frustrated because they are not able to apply or as he says, they are not clear on the qualifying criteria or are unsuccessful in their applications, is a fairly widespread problem. We certainly, as the Department, are committed to supporting those businesses resolve the problem. I wonder, hon member, whether in this case it would not be best for you to furnish me with the particulars of this case so that we can follow up and try to resolve and support the business to which you refer.

Mr P J MARAIS: I thank you, Minister. I thank you very much. I will do so.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Hon Mackenzie, was your hand up earlier or did you put that down because you do not need to have the second bite?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: I put it down Deputy Speaker, the Minister already answered the second part of the question, thank you. So he will do the next one.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Nkondlo and then hon Baartman will be the last bite of the cherry. Hon Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. From the response of the Minister can I just understand – because he says there are six tourism enterprises from Mitchells Plain that received support in the categories he mentions - one, assuming that Mitchells Plain in particular has a serious presence of tourism enterprises, and I am saying that because of the pre-engagement we had as the Committee in Mitchells Plain before, as part of the build-up towards the SOPA. An impression was given that Mitchells Plain intends to expand its tourism platform. Now my question is: these six applications that were successful, how many applications were received in Mitchells Plain particularly versus the one that has been approved, and secondly, in total, of the six, what is the cost of this particular support that the Minister is mentioning?

I think hon Mackenzie covered me in terms of how people access this

support, but I would like to ask as my last question, whether the Minister would be able to provide us with similar stats of the tourism and SMMEs that have received support from the programmes that he is mentioning from the Department in the various municipalities of the province? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I think that the hon member may have misunderstood my response to the question. What I said was that seven of the businesses who had benefited from the SMME Booster Fund were located in Mitchells Plain and they are not necessarily from the tourism sector.

On the particulars that the hon member requires on the number of applications submitted and the number of applications approved, I do not have data for the previous financial year on the number of businesses who applied and who were either approved or not approved, but what I do have is data on the number of intermediary organisations that put in proposals to be considered.

There were 104 intermediary organisations who responded to our call for proposals and ultimately, after following a process, where various criteria were considered, 18 of those intermediary organisations then received support. It is the intermediary organisations that then in turn provide support and the kind of support that I have described to the various businesses.

But if the hon member requires further detailed information, I invite her to put a written parliamentary question and we will of course provide her with all the information that she requires, either relating to businesses in the tourism sector or indeed businesses that have benefited from the SMME Booster Fund. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Hon Baartman, over to you.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I would like to find out from the Minister whether there has been any interaction between him or his Department with the Mitchells Plain Chamber of Commerce in the past year regarding small business in the area? And, in particular, I want to find out whether any hairdressers or barbers in the Mitchells Plain area have contacted him or his departments regarding assistance, given that they are not allowed to operate during Lockdown 5, during Lockdown 4 and during Lockdown 3, putting many households' economic viability at risk? Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I am advised that there are several business organisations in Mitchells Plain. There is of course the Mitchells Plain Business Forum, the Mitchells Plain Integrated Development Forum, and the Mitchells Plain United Residence Forum. The Cape Chamber of Commerce

also has a Mitchells Plain Chapter. I can assure the hon member that my departments are in regular contact with all these institutions and she will know that I have set myself a goal of interacting with as many business chambers and associations and of course, by extension, businesses as possible during the COVID-19 crisis. In fact, it was just this morning that I spent a very productive hour with the George Chamber of Commerce and certainly going forward, I look forward to meeting and spending time with the various business organisations in Mitchells Plain so that I can better understand how our Department can support business in Mitchells Plain.

On the question of hairdressers, you are absolutely right. I have not received any submissions from hairdressers. The Department may have received submissions. But certainly as a department, the hon member will know that under Level 4 Regulations and indeed under Level 3 Regulations, our general approach is to open the economy in a way that is responsible and safe and for that reason we have made several submissions under both Level 3 and under Level 4 and certainly we are looking at this sector with a view to making further submissions to National Government, so that we can open the economy, but do so in a way that is safe and that prevents the spread of the Corona virus in the workplace in the Western Cape. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I am going to move back to Question 5. Hon Minister Fernandez, can you hear us?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Deputy Speaker, am I audible?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are audible, you may go ahead.

*Reopening of ECD centres*

**5. Ms L J Botha asked the Minister of Social Development:**

1. (a) What are the details of her Department's plan for the reopening and the state of readiness of Early Childhood Development (ECD) centres, (b) what assistance will her Department provide to advance the readiness of ECD centres and (c) what is the total rand value of the assistance;

(1) whether any ECD centre does not comply with any of the relevant regulations; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you. I would like to thank the hon member Botha for the questions which relate to the detail of the plan for the opening of ECDs.

At this point in time, hon Deputy Speaker, the National Department is in the process of developing a national framework and protocols for the reopening of ECD centres in collaboration with ECD national organisations. This

engagement took place last Tuesday and eight work streams have been established but we have yet some way to go.

The assistance that we are currently providing is trying to keep our ECDs informed and we are communicating with our facilities via the funded service organisations. The challenge we have is that there are many unregistered ECDs which we cannot access because they are not registered on a database and unfortunately, some of them are trading, I am told, at this time but it is a local government intervention.

Question b) was the total Rand value of the assistance: the National Department of Social Development is considering approaching the National Treasury to repurpose the Conditional Grant infrastructure for procuring PPE for our ECDs. I am told the Rand value for the Western Cape will be R2 million and I would like the House to consider this R2 million based on the numbers I quoted in the debate. However, that figure of R2 million still has to be realised. We have not received any feedback.

On whether any ECDs do not comply with the regulations, I can only answer none at this stage as we do not have a list at this stage that I can talk to. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Fernandez. I recognise hon Botha and I see you have your hand up, so you will get two bites of the cherry, over to you.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, through you; Minister, how has the announcement by Minister Motshekga impacted the ECD sector as she indicated that they will be returning on 5 July?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Botha. The impact of the statement created mayhem and chaos in the ECD system. And if I recall correctly, the reference was to Grade R that is linked to DBE already. It does not talk to the registered ECDs within the Provincial Department of Social Development spaces or domains.

So I think it is important for me to alert the members. It says here: Early Childhood Development programmes including child day care mothers, play care groups or similar, shall remain closed until such time that a decision is taken and communicated for the reopening under any of the five alert levels.

The continued closure of these early development programmes is based on the consideration of multiple factors but hon Deputy Speaker, I am deeply concerned because the Minister has the ability to engage specialists in the field and Minister Zulu was on national TV talking to reasons why ECDs are closed and it is unfortunate that the Centre for Early Childhood Development disagrees vehemently and the Chairperson quoted Minister Zulu as being factually incorrect, confused and incoherent in her understanding of the

challenges.

So we have now got eight work streams set up. It happened last week, people are going back to work, I am receiving letters and I think it is very, very important – people might think that we are trying to downplay what is happening – but I received a really sad appeal from a citizen who lives in Khayelitsha, who said to me, what is the decision that I am going to be forced to take? Do I lose my job because I am told that I cannot take my child to an ECD or do I run the risk of going to an illegal operation?

Unfortunately, we have reached a stage where I have become aware that unregistered ECDs are popping up all over the place, but they do not meet the criteria in terms of six children or more. So you can in your home have up to five children, but I would like to appeal – and I have appealed to the National Minister – that we revisit the arrangement to open our ECDs in a manner that is considered, takes the best interest of the child into account, that the directions are clear, they are practical and they can be implemented at a grass roots level without any further confusion. I thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Back to you, hon Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker and thank you to the Minister for that answer. Just in going forward, through you, Deputy Speaker, Minister how will your Department communicate with parents on the opening of ECDs without creating this biblical confusion of many tongues talking at

the same time?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Botha. Within the Department we do have a programme for Early Childhood Development and a very capable chief director and director. We also have forums within the province that we engage with and just recently, I think on Tuesday for the launch, there was an initiative in Stellenbosch, so we will use the platforms that are known to us. We will use media statements, social media and of course, I would imagine that once the directions for Level 3 finally come through that we can then share with all our stakeholders, but you can be assured, we get hundreds of calls every day from desperate parents – in fact, some of the hon members have sent me emails – asking “When are the children going back to school?”

So, as soon as we get word – I am concerned that if lockdown has been extended to 15 July 2020, that the return for ECD’s would only be then, but we are due to have a MinMec and that would be one of my questions, because I think we need to deal with this matter sooner rather than later, as lives are being lost; children are being compromised. They are being left in the care of people that we cannot in some instances rely on to ensure their safety and livelihoods are lost at the same time. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, I do not

see any further hands, if I am correct?

Ms L J BOTHA: Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes?

Ms L J BOTHA: My hand is raised.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: My apologies, hon Botha. You may have the third bite.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. I just want to check, Minister, with all that is said pertaining to the questions, can I therefore take it that all systems are in place to do the monitoring whenever ECD's are reopening?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Botha, our registered ECD's are ready in that we did not stop our payments to ECD's during this period. We continued with transfer payment agreements and that allowed ECD's to continue feeding children. Remember we have a database of registered ECD's and then we know that there is X amount, an approximate amount of unregistered ECD's. What the National Department is now wanting to do, and I see the Deputy Minister launched a programme, is to try and find all the unregistered ECD's in an effort to sort of bring them in the fold to ensure compliance.

However, my office does not have the capacity to monitor ECD's. So what do we rely on? We rely on our local ward councillors and law enforcement to assist us or to alert us if there is anything untoward that they see, but we do have monitoring in place. If you report a specific ECD, we will send out the MME team, but they do not do that as a day to day responsibility, or as part of their day jobs, because they are a small team in number and they really cannot cope with all the different aspects of ECD that have now been imposed on us. Thank you, hon Botha.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. I do not see any further hands. That concludes the end of Questions for Oral Reply. Outstanding replies will be printed in the Hansard. Hon members, we now move over to Statements. I recognise the DA.

## **MEMBERS' STATEMENTS**

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Weighing in at 27 unqualified and 13 clean audits, the Western Cape municipalities are the Mohammed Ali amongst the provinces in South Africa. Albert Einstein defined insanity as doing the same thing over and over again and expecting a different outcome. Whilst this is true for most of the other provinces, it certainly is not the case for the Western Cape as it has consistently got better and better in terms of the governance of its municipalities and councils.

The same cannot be said for the Opposition, as their flagship province –

Gauteng – has continuously deteriorated and regressed in so far as clean and unqualified audits are concerned, with none whatsoever in the Free State.

The DA-led Western Cape Government has placed its citizens' needs above all else and in turn ensured that its municipalities operate to the highest and cleanest level at all times, in order to ensure that they are able to deliver basic services. We determine our success on the ability to deliver basic services to our people and not only chasing clean and unqualified audits. We also measure our success in terms of how we respond to issues and challenges we unexpectedly are confronted with, such as the case in the Witzenberg Municipality, where this municipality was identified as one of the largest COVID-19 hotspots in the province. A swiftly developed response plan was implemented to curb the spread.

Deputy Speaker, there is now an 80% recovery rate which is a clear indication that the DA-led Western Cape Government places the lives and dignity of our people above all else. Lastly, Deputy Speaker, I would like to express my sincere gratitude and appreciation to Minister Anton Bredell for his able and serving leadership. Similarly, to the HOD ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up, hon America.

Mr D AMERICA: ...Mr Paulse, for his team and amazing councillors for their commitment and hard work ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr D AMERICA: ...in delivering outstanding services to our people. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the ANC.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. The DA's dominant shift to the right which I know even certain DA members in this House are not in support of, directs Provincial Government to sacrifice our teachers and children as it sends them to school as cannon fodder in the COVID-19 pandemic with too many schools that are not fully ready to face the biggest world health crisis of the century. Herd immunity directs the Democratic Alliance. Many poor children went to schools on Monday with no masks. Some were even given only two flimsy paper masks. Learner transport is not properly sorted out and not enough sanitiser was delivered. Trusted water supply is also absent or suspect. Some schools still do not even have properly treated and dedicated holding areas for people with fevers.

Hon Deputy Speaker, on 29 May 2020, the Khayelitsha Development Forum wrote to MEC Schäfer's Department to highlight some of these challenges in the Khayelitsha area alone. Therein they also highlighted the fact that five teachers had passed on of COVID-19. They also cited examples of Kuyasa Primary School, of Harry Gwala High School, where teachers have tested

positive. The MEC's Department had admitted to this, however school continued as normal on Monday without any proper measures being put in place, like with John Ramsey Secondary School in Bishop Lavis, where the Department failed to send out a team to disinfect the school and provided no sanitiser whatsoever. There are many such cases that we receive from our poor and working class communities.

Deputy Speaker, we cannot measure readiness with examples of the mainly former Model C schools in leafy suburbs, which this Provincial Government wishes to show the public. We cannot have a situation where the mainly privileged schools reopen, and the mainly poor schools are focused and are forced actually, to remain closed due to lack of readiness. We would be much better as a province to focus our energies on ensuring compliance with all health and safety guidelines at each school as opposed to steamrolling and playing petty politics. The COVID-19 context, Deputy Speaker [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is expired.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...requires us to actually ensure that we amplify the inequalities in education and work towards a greater redress. I thank you. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Member Sayed, thank you very much. I recognise the EFF.

Mr M XEGO (EFF): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. The EFF hereby condemns with disgust the decision of the Western Cape Minister of Education to continue opening schools in the province in defiance of the order of the National Minister of Education, Angie Motshekga, that provinces must wait for a week to assess the situation and implement safety measures for schools.

The reckless behaviour and attitude by the Western Cape MEC continue to place the lives of school children and teachers at risk without any reasonable and just cause whatsoever. Moreover, scholar transport for learners to school is not being operated optimally and efficiently. The fact that not all learners have returned to school now forces the majority of learners to use public transport with the general public, automatically increasing their risk of being exposed to COVID-19.

Furthermore, the Provincial Education Department has also not addressed the issue of teachers who have been infected with COVID-19 in 32 schools in the province. In addition, some feeding schemes in a number of public schools are not operational as yet, leaving a number of poor learners to starve. The EFF calls for sanity to prevail in the province and that those in the leadership of the DA-led Government in the Western Cape, within South Africa, must separate laws that can be chopped and changed at any time in the province and as well as in our country. Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Xego. I recognise the DA.

Ms D M BAARTMAN (DA): Estonia is considered “the most advanced digital society in the world” by Wyatt. 99% of their citizens have electronic ID. 99% of their state services are online. They were ranked the number 1 country in terms of start-up friendliness by Index Venture 2018; number 1 in terms of entrepreneurial activity by World Economic Forum 2018; number 1 in terms of Digital Health Index by Bertelsmann Foundation in 2019.

Deputy Speaker, Estonia’s challenge was, how does one “build a fully functioning country from scratch while knowing that they cannot afford the bureaucracy of a developed democracy”? Estonia gained independence in 1991, Deputy Speaker, the year I was born. So, how did they do this? In 1994 they earmarked 1% of their GDP to the IT sector. By 1996 they had launched their Tiger Leap initiative for country-wide IT infrastructure development and making computer skills a priority in schools. Estonia is essentially the same age as South Africa, but they have been prepared for a no-contact, virtual, borderless, block-chained and secure future for more than two decades. From e-Banking to e-Cabinet Meetings, 98% of Estonians file e-taxes and do so within 3 minutes, e-Voting, a health database with 99% of medical prescriptions being handled online, becoming the leading nation in cyber security, to exploring using AI for government solutions. Estonia showed us that you do not need to be rich to be a digital society.

The Western Cape has made available online business toolkits and a mobile app for entrepreneurs; has turned the CTICC into a paperless, digital hospital for the COVID-19 crisis, from a COVID-19 online health dashboard which

promotes transparency to our Education Department making online learning material available. The WCPP has also followed the Estonia Parliament's example, becoming the second parliament in the world to go virtual and the first province to do so in South Africa. The time is now to leap past the Fourth Industrial Revolution and straight into the Fifth. We need to commit to fully embracing e-government and digital education. Ke nako [it is time.] Deputy Speaker, I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise GOOD.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Over the past few weeks, I have been raising my concerns about the Western Cape's rampant infection and death rate while two steps in the health protocols appear to be poorly implemented. While our testing ratio has been the highest in the country, our community screening performance and our contact tracing results have been extremely weak.

The national health protocol for containing the rapid spread of the Corona virus and to save lives, has been community screening, testing, contact tracing, isolation and quarantine. Data presented by the National Minister of Health has shown that our community screening numbers have been the lowest in the country, under-performing even the Northern Cape in real terms which has a fraction of our population.

That same data showed that at one stage we were tracing less than one

contact per positive case. I am encouraged to see that the most recent data shows that our contact tracing is improving and if we have indeed ramped up to 63 000 contacts; this means we are now tracing about 3.5 contacts per positive case. This is still inadequate, but we are moving in the right direction.

However, this week I visited communities on the Cape Flats where community health care workers expressed frustration with our failure to offer those who test positive the opportunity to quarantine in a public facility. Over-crowded living conditions make it impossible to self-isolate and our Government should know that. Health care workers advise that people who have tested positive in densely populated communities are not isolating because they cannot. Some are wandering around and some are even going to work. This Government must implement the full health protocol from start to finish and the failure to offer those who cannot self-isolate the option to do so in a public facility is not acceptable. We will not contain this Corona virus and save lives if we are careless about the ability of every person to isolate for quarantine. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. The ACDP is very concerned about the trauma cases in some hospitals that doubled overnight since the Level 3 Lockdown was instituted. The lifting of the alcohol ban on Monday was greeted with jubilation but also with great

concern. Arrive Alive noted several incidents involving the arrest of drunk drivers and road accidents. The CEO of the Chris Hani Baragwanath Hospital reported that the number of trauma cases has effectively doubled overnight. The majority of patients were drunk. They also saw patients with stab wounds, gunshot wounds and general assault injuries.

Deputy Speaker, in the Knysna Provincial Hospital most of the incidents that were reported at the hospital and the load case that was doubled were of alcohol-related individuals. The abuse of alcohol is still a killer on our roads and a killer in our communities. Deputy Speaker, this is alarming and very concerning to the ACDP and we cannot condone the irresponsible behaviour of individuals placing others at risk. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I recognise the ANC.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I hear you. You may proceed.

Ms P Z LEKKER (ANC): The Western Cape is a dangerous place for people trapped in informal settlements. More than 200 people annually die in informal settlement fires. The Cape Town Metro is parading as very progressive and the so-called world's best run municipality. This so-called "beacon of light to darkest Africa" is also a risky place to stay, as at least 100 people die a horrible death every year in consuming informal settlement

fires. This does not include the hundreds of children and other people that die off-site of serious wounds or in hospital from secondary infections. There is also no indication how many people and their children are mutilated, how many are scarred for life or their hands burnt, rendering them as people that have to live with disabilities.

The DA in 2006 and 2009 made promises to the high heavens to change this and beef up the fire and rescue services to be more efficient. There is to date still no specific desk tasked with this phenomenon in the province, nor in the fire services, nor in planning to make sure changes are effected to prevent this annual predictable disaster in poor communities.

Reasons why these structures burn so badly, or even that information pamphlets are distributed, are no excuse. Perhaps there is no political will to change this terrible fate of the poorest. The Koeberg nuclear plant, the oil refinery or industrial and business areas all get priority treatment, proving the fact that this DA Government does not care for the poor. Black lives do not matter. They are on their own. I thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I recognise the DA.

Ms L J BOTHA: Deputy Speaker, in this province 98% of schools were ready to reopen their doors in line with Government-gazetted Regulation 43381. At those schools we commend the school management and Provincial Department of Education for the provision of safety protocols, social

distancing measures and good hygiene practices.

On 1 June 2020, many Grade 7 and 12 learners and parents prepared to return and start orientation for the new normal after one term of contact time had already been lost due to the COVID-19 pandemic. With much regret, our national peers were not quite as ready. Minister Angie Motshekga, during her postponed media briefing, or what can be better described as an eleventh-hour national apology, announced that it was already decided to postpone the reopening late on Saturday evening. This meant that the National Government failed to take the nation into confidence on Sunday as scheduled. The ANC-led Government once again confused the entire nation with its unclear and inconsistent policy directives. To reiterate recent court rulings, “irrational and illogical”. As much as the primary objective is to ensure the safety and health of every learner, it is of paramount importance that schools are reopened without further delay by the National Department of Basic Education. The Education Committee will continue to monitor the readiness and the reinforcement of safety protocols at public schools and availability of PPE in the province to promote the continuation of quality education in the Western Cape. Both safety and education remain fundamental to future livelihoods and lives of learners in this province. Our Western Cape learners ought not to suffer because of the incompetent efforts of other ANC-governed provinces and the Cabinet in Pretoria. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I see the Freedom Front Plus. Hon Marais, are you there? Going. Going. Gone. I recognise Al Jama-

ah. Not here. Alright. And then finally I hand over to the DA.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. As Child Protection Week kicked off this week, we are reminded of how the protection and welfare of children are a collective responsibility in any society. The fight against child neglect, abuse and hunger requires a whole-of-society approach in order to put a stop to violence that is being witnessed by children in vulnerable communities.

The DA Government in the Western Cape has gone beyond its core mandate to ensure that children in this province receive the necessary support that will enable them to make the most of the opportunities in life. While we acknowledge that more will always be needed and more needs to be done, the Provincial Department of Social Development continues to provide critical services and programmes for children who are in need in these vulnerable situations.

Children and families ought to be empowered through not only financial means, but through programmes that seek to address their psychological and emotional challenges as well and thus need to have a place of importance in our society. In addition, the Western Cape is the only province in the country, and indeed in Sub-Saharan Africa, to have appointed a dedicated Commissioner for Children.

The National Department of Social Development has exposed their own

ineptitude and incompetence yet again by attempting to enforce regulations that are draconian in communities during this lockdown and this has had a direct negative impact on our children. We are grateful that our justice system is working overtime, where courts have ruled that Lockdown Levels 3 and 4 of the regulations are invalid and unconstitutional. If that is not enough, let us not forget how the Basic Education Minister, Angie Motshekga, demanded that nutritional programmes at schools be halted during the lockdown. Once her party's administration in Gauteng resumed the same feeding scheme, she backtracked.

Why does the ANC place its political interests above those of the people? We must continue to ask this. This is another example of how the Western Cape Government has had to intervene to prevent National Government from placing children further at risk. When we say, "Let us work together", we mean less talk and more action. This is precisely what our Government has demonstrated. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Your time is up. Thank you, hon members. In terms of Rule 145.6 I now give an opportunity to a Minister to present for not more than 5 minutes. Is there a Minister that would like to respond? No? I am assuming not. That brings us to the end of Members' Statements. Hon members, if you can indulge me. I would just like to check if the Speaker is online.

The SPEAKER: I am here, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Hon members, we are now moving to notices of motion. I recognise hon Botha.

### **MOTIONS WITH NOTICE**

Ms L J BOTHA: [Inaudible. – audio lost]

The SPEAKER: Your line is bad, hon Botha. Okay. Hon members, may I request that we take the next motion and then we will come back to hon Botha when she is in a better position. I will go straight to the ACDP. Hon Christians?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the police and army brutality experienced during the lockdown. I thank you.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. Hon Botha, are you ready?

Ms L J BOTHA: Speaker, I am just ascertaining whether you can hear me?

The SPEAKER: Now, yes. It is clear now, yes, Madam.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House, at its next sitting, debates the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic and regulations relevant to the WCED and ECD's on social and economic livelihoods in the province. I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Botha. I now recognise hon Baartman.

Ms D BAARTMAN: Thank you, hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic and regulations on personal care services industry, with an emphasis on hairdressers, barbers and salons; the majority of these individuals are self-employed entrepreneurs, many of whom are sole breadwinners for their families. I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Baartman. I now recognise hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the continued huge inequality between poor schools in former marginalised areas like townships and those wealthy schools in the leafy areas within the shadow of Table Mountain, mostly former Model C schools.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed. Hon members, the hon Dugmore, I am not too sure whether you have a motion – another motion, other than the one that you withdrew earlier. Hon, the Leader of the Opposition? Alright. Thank you, hon members. Let us now move to hon Bans. Alright. Let us move hon members, to hon Nkondlo. We will come back to hon Bans, if and when she joins us again. Okay. Hon Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the socio-economic conditions in the areas declared as COVID-19 hotspots and the impact of such conditions in exacerbating the spread of the Corona virus. I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Nkondlo. Hon members, I recognise hon Bans. Alright. Let us move to hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Speaker. Can you hear me?

The SPEAKER: Yes, we can hear you, hon member.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House, at its next sitting, discusses the DA endangering the lives of children in the Western Cape. I so move, Speaker.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama. Hon members, I now recognise the hon Lekker.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses political abuse by DA office bearers and leaders who use public schools to advance themselves at openings, feeding schemes and now with the Corona virus pandemic, while blocking other parties from performing oversight visits. I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Lekker. Hon members, if the hon Bans is not available, we then move to Motions without Notice. May I please give another opportunity to hon Bans? Alright. Thank you, hon members  
[Interjection.]

Ms A BANS: Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Hon Bans?

Ms A BANS: Mr Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses why the Western Cape Provincial Government sports COVID-19 face masks openly in the main DA colours. I so move.

*[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Bans.

Mr P J MARAIS: Mr Speaker, point of order.

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order, hon Marais?

Mr P J MARAIS: I understood you said we are now on motions without notice, and the member who just spoke said this is a motion with notice. So what is it? Without or with?

The SPEAKER: It is in this manner that I have requested to move, but hon Bans was unable to connect and therefore I gave her leeway, given her intention to move a motion with notice. So on that point, I thought it was important to afford her the opportunity. It was a notice of a motion, hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: I accept your ruling, sir.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marais. Hon members, that concludes the notices of motion and that gives us an opportunity now to consider Motions without Notice. I recognise the hon Allen.

## **MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE**

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the brutal murder of George Floyd in the United States of America that led to the recalibration of the #BlackLivesMatter movement during the current week; I further move that this House recognises with great concern police brutality right here in the Western Cape and in South Africa as well, citing the passing of Collins Khosa

due to alleged heavy-handedness of national safety officials in our country. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Allen. Hon members, is there any objection to the motion being read without notice?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, Speaker. There is an objection to the second part of police brutality in the Western Cape.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Sayed. The objection is noted, and the motion will be recorded in the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House would like to thank everyone for their contribution in helping the most vulnerable during this time. We especially want to thank those who have opened their homes to the poorest and to the vulnerable in their communities. We have seen many soup kitchens, feeding schemes and other types of donations especially in poor communities like Bonteheuwel, Athlone, Mitchells Plain and Manenberg. Hon Speaker, on behalf of the ACDP we want to thank all those who are

making a meaningful contribution in this time. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Agreed to. Hon members, the next motion is by hon Philander.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with great sadness the murder of Dr Roelof Botha in Tulbagh on Monday, 1 June 2020. Hon Speaker, that this House extends our sincere condolences to the family, patients and loved ones of Dr Roelof Botha and that the House notes with concern the senseless attacks on citizens in South Africa. Our thoughts and prayers are with the Botha family during this time. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Philander. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. No objections. Agreed to. Hon

members, the next motion is by hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the principal of Settlers High School in Bellville, Mrs Shireen Gallie, has tested positive for COVID-19 and that we wish her a speedy recovery. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The SPEAKER: No objections. Agreed to. Hon members, I recognise hon Baartman.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that South Africa celebrates Youth Month this month, commemorating the Soweto uprising on 16 June 1976 when unarmed student protestors stood up against the apartheid government in defiance due to the enormosity of the horrific quality and conditions of black education in South Africa; further notes that currently in South

Africa statistics show that the majority of the youth choose not to participate in democratic systems such as elections; acknowledges that while much has been achieved in ensuring that every child has access to education, that many children and youth are still left behind and congratulates the Western Cape Education Department for having provided 1.2 million meals to learners through the emergency feeding scheme during the COVID-19 lockdown and for achieving close to 100% reopening of schools this week in order to continue the fight for the constitutional right to a basic education for all. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Baartman. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections.

*[Interjection.]*

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Is there an objection?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I object to the second part, particularly on the Western Cape. *[Laughs.]*

The SPEAKER: There are objections.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I know, Speaker, we object.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Are you objecting to providing food?

The SPEAKER: Order, hon ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Objecting to placing the safety of learners at risk.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Order. The objection has been noted and the motion will be recorded on the Order Paper. Now, I would like to request that the hon Smith delivers his motion.

Mr D SMITH: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the begrudged resignation of a number of Knysna Municipality officials, including the municipal manager, Ms Michelle Gratz; and further notes that she previously resigned from a similar position, aggrieved by the DA-run Mossel Bay Municipality. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Smith. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Yes, we object.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Objection is noted, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now move to hon Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House observes the month of June as World Pride Month. The DA-led Western Cape continues to be a proud supporter of the LGBTQI+ community and the promotion of equality for all; further that this House notes that the Stonewall riots in New York City in 1969 as part of civil society's protest regarding police brutality, a major concern which we still face today. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The SPEAKER: No objections? Agreed to.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I recognise hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House wishes all victims of gang violence well and sympathises with those that died and also notes that a Manenberg boy, Taufiq Johnson was earlier this week severely wounded when 18 shots were fired on the wooden Wendy House where he stayed, and also a boy of 2-years old, Zhario Johnson and his father of 32 died last night in a Bonteheuwel shooting; calls on all law enforcement agencies to strengthen their resolve to arrest those terrorising our communities. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Agreed to. I now recognise hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the importance of World Foster Day which was observed on 31 May 2020; that this House further notes the importance of safe living conditions and a healthy family environment and that it notes the impact that this has on the development of children. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bosman. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. I now move to hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commends the Strand community activists, led by Xolani Diniso, for placing pressure on the Western Cape Education Department to close Nomzamo Primary School and have it deep-cleaned and decontaminated today after the Department initially refused to close the school for decontamination and deep-cleaning after a staff member tested positive for COVID-19. I so move, Speaker.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The SPEAKER: The objection is noted, and the motion will be printed in the Order Paper. Thank you, hon members. Hon members, I now recognise hon Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Western Cape Education Department for their readiness to reopen schools as required and in line with gazetted regulations on 1 June 2020. Hon Speaker, further that this House thanks all educational staff for their efforts in preparation for the new normal at schools, to promote the safety, health and futures of our learners. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

An HON MEMBER: We object.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Object!

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Botha.

An HON MEMBER: Obvious!

The SPEAKER: The objections have been noted ... [Interjection.]

Ms L J BOTHA: Not surprised. Not surprised.

The SPEAKER: Order, order. Hon members. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognised hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and calls for an investigation into the circumstances behind the cluster transmissions of COVID-19 as observed in retail and agri-sector in the Western Cape; notes further the bad and unhygienic state of the informal markets in the townships and small rural towns that exposes the informal traders and their customers to health and safety risks which could increase chances of COVID-19 spread and calls for an urgent intervention by the relevant authorities to address the matter. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Nkondlo. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice?

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Object. We already have a hotspot approach.

Ms N D NKONDLO: No. So you object in protection of ... *[Interjection.]*

The SPEAKER: Order. Order.

An HON MEMBER: No, for it being moved without notice.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: You cannot have committees of committees of

committees ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members. Order, hon Baartman and order, hon Nkondlo.  
Order.

†Me N D NKONDLO: Ekskuus.

[Ms N D NKONDLO: Sorry.]

The SPEAKER: The objection hon members, has been recorded and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Now we move to hon Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes the recent findings of the High Court in Pretoria; noting specifically that the lockdown regulations gazetted by the National Government for Levels 3 and 4 were found to be invalid and unconstitutional. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

Ms P Z LEKKER: Object!

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mackenzie.

An HON MEMBER: Object to what?

The SPEAKER: I know there was an objection ... [Interjection.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Object!

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: We know those ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Mackenzie, please ...

Ms P Z LEKKER: I do not have to explain myself to you!

The SPEAKER: ...observe the protocols in the House and the decorum that we need to maintain. You delivered a motion. Hon members, the objection has been noted. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognize hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Speaker. Am I audible?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you are.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you. I move without notice:

That the House notes the stand-off between the City of Cape Town and the Informal Traders Association operating at the Grand Parade where the Municipality is refusing to provide permits and enable trade to resume in the area; notes further and condemns the serious double standards of a party in the Government which on the one hand calls for the opening of the economy, while on the other hand denies small enterprises their economic right to trade using rigidity in the applications of the regulations. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Nkondlo. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: The objection is noted, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Thank you, hon members. I now recognise hon Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates those at the forefront of the fight against COVID-19 in the Witzenberg municipal area on their successes in not only flattening the curve, but even lowering the infection rate of

COVID-19 cases; this ongoing success demonstrates that the Western Cape's strategy is effective when different entities, departments, businesses and communities work together and combine their efforts in a whole-of-government approach. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Van der Westhuizen. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice?

HON MEMBERS: Objection.

The SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Marran?

Mr P MARRAN: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes a protest erupted on Monday when the heartless DA-run City of Cape Town destroyed informal structures and evicted people from Joe Slovo in Milnerton. The timing was unfortunate as it was one of the coldest times of the year to be thrown onto the streets. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marran. Hon members, are there any

objections to the motion being read without notice?

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Objections noted. Thank you, hon members, the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Philander.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the 200 nurses currently undergoing training to work at the CTICC Field Hospital; that the House further notes that these nurses are heroes who help capacitate our healthcare system in the province as we fight the COVID-19 pandemic; finally, that the House extends its sincere gratitude to nurses for taking up the critical cause. I so move, Speaker.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Philander. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. Now hon members, I recognise hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes it is reported that at least R28 million was spent by

the Western Cape Provincial Government on the safety of people during the COVID-19 pandemic and that WCED had run short of sub-standard sanitation and protective gear delivered and further calls for a proper investigation and report to this House on the findings. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice?

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: Objection. Someone else wrote that for him.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. The objection is noted ...  
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: He did not understand what he wrote.

The SPEAKER: ... and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now move to hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the remarkable achievement of Dr Mosadi Mahoko,

a registrar in the Division of Plastic and Reconstructive Surgery at Tygerberg Hospital; Hon Speaker, I ask that we as the Western Cape Provincial Parliament congratulate Dr Mosadi Mahoko as she is the first female black South African plastic surgeon to qualify from Stellenbosch University and in the Western Cape. She recently won the Jack Penn Medal for the best result in South Africa for the 2019 Final Plastic Surgery Examination; we thank her for her service, and we wish her well on this magnificent achievement. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bosman. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. Now I recognise hon Dugmore. Alright, hon members, we do not get response from hon Dugmore. We move to hon Baartman.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Thank you, hon Speaker. I hereby move without notice:

That the House notes that the Western Cape Regional Operations received a generous donation on behalf of the Western Cape Government from the MTN Foundation, consisting of 1 833 food parcels for food relief during the COVID-19 crisis; as well as 30 tablet devices with 30 x 1GB data bundles and prepaid SIM cards to the Western Cape Department of Health for use by persons in critical care in hospital in

order to phone their loved ones; thanks MTN for their generous donation, their contribution as an example of all the great work being done by the private sector during the COVID-19 lockdown to assist Government; congratulates the Western Cape Provincial Government for their sterling work of including the private sector in their whole-of-society approach; and calls for continuous, greater involvement of the private sector with Government as we together battle one of the greatest challenges of our lifetime. Thank you. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Baartman. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice?

An HON MEMBER: No.

The SPEAKER: No objections. Motion agreed to. Hon members, I now recognise hon Bans.

Ms A BANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House commends all religious leaders across faith and denomination lines who decided life is of higher value and suspended worship until the COVID-19 pandemic settles down; even though the National Government relaxed restrictions on gatherings to a maximum of

50 people. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bans. Hon members are there any objections to the motion? No objections. Motion agreed to. Hon Philander?

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House welcomes the completed 60-bed temporary hospital in Khayelitsha built by Médecins Sans Frontieres (Doctors Without Borders) at the City of Cape Town's Thusong Centre, which can now provide further care to positive COVID-19 patients. I so move, Speaker.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Philander. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. Hon Smith?

Mr D SMITH: Thank you Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes Langeberg DA ward councillor, Nicklaas Beginsel of Ashton, is still in his position despite being sentenced in court to 4 years in prison on 12 counts of fraud in February and further calls on the

hon Local Government MEC, Anton Bredell, to investigate and report to this House why Beginsel has not been removed from office. Thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Smith. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Objection is noted, hon members. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes with gratitude the donation of 20 000 masks from the Condere Group to traffic and safety officers here in the Western Cape; that this House further notes the support by Minister Albert Fritz and the Department of Community Safety for the protection of frontline workers who continue to serve communities during this time of national crisis. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Allen. Hon members, are there any

objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. I now recognise hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes another old age home suffers due to the COVID-19 devastation and that the Panorama Palms retirement resort in Cape Town has 41 residents of whom two died, and 34 staff members that tested positive; and that this House bids them a speedy recovery and offers our condolences to the family and friends of the deceased. I thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Windvogel. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. I now recognise hon Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, Speaker. I move with pride and without notice:

That the House gives thanks and notes that:

- Portland High School, Principal Mr Williams,
- Oval North, Acting Principal Mr Jacobs,
- Lentegour High School, Principal Mr Cupido,
- AZ Berman Primary School, Principal Stofberg,

- West End Primary School, Principal Mr Clive Arries

all went beyond their call of duty to get their schools ready for school opening and commends all other schools in Mitchells Plain that undertook to ensure they were ready to receive their learners safely. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mackenzie. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice?

HON MEMBERS: No.

The SPEAKER: No objections. Motion agreed to. I now recognise hon Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Thank you, Speaker. I also move with pride and without notice:

That the House notes the DA is running out of money fast and will soon dump many party workers and implores all to keep a watchful eye on where the DA will take money from the public [Interjection.] purse to fund its elaborate spending ahead of the coming elections. [Interjections.] Thank you.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): We are not the ANC.

An HON MEMBER: Object!

The SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are worse! You are worse than the ANC!

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order! This is the House of Parliament. You must please exercise some restraint ... [Interjections.] so that we do not allow our House to degenerate into chaos.

Ms P Z LEKKER: Point of order, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. Order.

Mr D SMITH: Hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: We are dealing with the motion first. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: No objection.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: Object!

An HON MEMBER: Object with pride!

The SPEAKER: The objection is noted, and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] I now recognise the hon Bakubaku-Vos. [Interjections.]

Mr D SMITH: Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Is that hon Kama?

Mr D SMITH: Hon Smith.

Mr M KAMA: Hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Is that a point of order? I have got the hand of hon Kama. Let me just tell you who else wants to talk to us here. Hon Kama and then I will recognise the other hon member after that. Let us hear you, hon Kama. What is your point of order?

Mr M KAMA: Hon Speaker, I wanted to raise a point of order that you please alert members to refrain from interjecting when a member is speaking. It is against the directive you had given as a Speaker and we have adopted that, because we cannot really hear the rest of the point that is made in the motion

when members are interjecting while the motion is being moved. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama. You have just assisted the Speaker and I am very happy that you reminded hon members of this important directive. I would like to reiterate, hon members, let us please exercise some restraint in order to safeguard this space and ensure that we are able to function as this Parliament with the necessary decorum and I hope that hon ... [Interjection.]

Mr D SMITH: It was one member, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: I beg your pardon, hon member.

Mr D SMITH: I was saying it was one member, Speaker. It was the hon Mackenzie.

The SPEAKER: I did not ask that the member addresses me without having raised a hand. So ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Point of order, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: It is fine, hon member, but I am requesting that let us proceed and just continue as you have been doing – you have been doing very well, and let us proceed in that spirit. Now, I recognise hon Bakubaku-Vos.

Mr D SMITH: Hon Speaker, can I raise a point of order?

The SPEAKER: The point of order is sustained. Who is the hon member?

Mr D SMITH: Hon Smith speaking.

The SPEAKER: You may address me, hon Smith.

Mr D SMITH: No-no, Speaker, based on what hon Kama has raised and also the ruling on the point of order, may I now please get the opportunity to clearly read my motion without notice so that the House can clearly hear my motion? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: No, we have gone past that. I have even dealt with the motion until the last moment in terms of the Rules. So the motion was delivered. What he was raising was a point of order to recognise this for future motions and we will make sure that it does not become the routine here on this platform.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon Bakubaku-Vos?

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House commiserates with the family, friends and comrades of the late Kwanele Kwaito Gugushe of Stellenbosch who served the ANC and his community at high level. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Bakubaku-Vos. I now wish to put to the members, are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. Hon member Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the Western Cape Education Department is in denial of its vicarious liability for the safety of learners and teachers using the bus transport contracted by the WCED during the COVID-19 pandemic and that it still squabbles with service providers to bully them to supply, from their pockets, PPE and sanitation while taking learners to school and home; and calls on the WCED to cease hostilities and assist the poor learners to travel safely. I so move Speaker.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed. I now wish to put to the House ...

[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The SPEAKER: ...the motion. Are there any objections?

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Objection.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Absolutely an objection.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. The objection has been noted to the motion and the motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with a deep sense of gratitude the generous donations of food to people affected by the COVID-19 lockdown in Hout Bay, Woodstock and the Bo-Kaap within the Cape Town Central and Atlantic Seaboard constituency by hardworking community-based NGO's: the Sharing Hope Foundation, the Nedebe Foundation, Tshepagalang Holdings and the Southern Suburbs Legal Advice Centre. I so move.

*[Motion as moved by Member.]*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed. Hon members, are there any objections to the motion being read without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. Hon members, I now recognise hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I do not have another motion.

The SPEAKER: Oh, you have no other motion. Thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I have got no other motions.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr G BOSMAN: Nobody has written it for him, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order. Order, hon Bosman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): The hon Bosman must actually share the full motions on Facebook if he ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Sayed [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... wants to attack fellow members.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): This is not Wikipedia where you can change ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: I know you miss each other very much because you cannot see each other's faces in person, but do not worry. We will come to that. We will get there. Now, let us recognise hon Windvogel. Alright. Hon Sayed. So you have no other motions? Now let us look at hon Dugmore – he is not here.

Hon members, thank you very much. You have been very, very honourable and I must congratulate all of you. This is now our sixth House sitting that you have been enjoying. This is the best record that I think we can record and some of the members have recorded this and thank you very much for your cooperation and participation and in advancing democracy. This now concludes the motions and the House is now adjourned. Thank you very much. Have a great evening. Thank you. †Siyabonga. [Thank you.]

The House adjourned at 18:45.