

---

TUESDAY, 3 DECEMBER 2019

---

The House met at 10:00.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

### **BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

The SPEAKER: May we all be seated. Alright, good morning, hon members. Hon, the Leader of the Opposition?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Speaker. It is a point of order which I would just like to get clarity on whether you would be able to assist, but we notice on the Order Paper and the list of speakers for the day that in comparison to yesterday when the tradition of previous years was once again established yesterday by having the Chairperson of the Standing Committee speaking immediately after the MEC, that that appears to have been changed.

I would just like to ask if you could clarify to us why that change has actually been made because in our caucus we have been briefed very specifically on the order being, was it possibly because the DA is concerned [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): No, that is not a point of order! That is a

debate.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...that they would want - that they would actually want the opportunity to respond to our shadow MEC because they were concerned at the issues raised. What is this, because this actually goes against the tradition that has been developed in the House as to how we manage the issue of the Adjustments Appropriation? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon member. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Speak to what you [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order, Order hon members! [Interjections.]

Mr P MARRAN: Why, are you scared?

The SPEAKER: Order! Thank you hon the Leader of the Opposition. Hon members, I want to recognise the Chief Whip at this point. The Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Hon Speaker. There is no rule governing exactly in which order the speakers should speak. It is, however, the Minister responsible for the vote at the beginning and at the end with unlimited speaking time. It is then the parties. Yesterday's speaking list was then a DA speaker, a DA speaker, then an ANC, then an EFF, etcetera, and I determined that it would be better to have a split between, so instead of two consecutive

DA speakers to then have a member of the Official Opposition in between the two. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: They are confused.

†Die ADJUNKHOOF SWEEP (DA): Die Speaker is nog nie klaar nie.

[The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): The Speaker is not finished yet.]

†n AGBARE LID: Ja!

[An HON MEMBER: Yes!]

The SPEAKER: Okay, thank you, hon Chief Whip. Thank you, hon Chief Whip. Who else is it, hon Minister Meyer are you indicating? Is there a point of order?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, I just wanted to welcome hon member Lili back to the House.

The SPEAKER: [Laughter.] That is not a point of order. Hon, the Leader of the Opposition.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Ja, thank you, thank you, Mr Speaker. The reality is that such a fundamental change from a

convention, which has been established, would surely need to be discussed by the Programming Committee.

What we have, could the Chief Whip, through you, hon Speaker, could we receive an indication... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Will you please take your seat.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...as to whether this matter has been... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, Chief Whip, please take your seat!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...whether this matter has been discussed at the Programming Authority. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It is not a roadmap to [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you, hon, the Leader of the Opposition. Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you. It is the Chief Whip's prerogative and I have determined it so. Also, the Order Paper - the Speakers List was sent out yesterday on time and there was no objection received at that stage and so now at the beginning of the sitting is certainly not the time to raise it.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, can the Programming Authority please deal with this matter in their earliest meeting at the earliest opportunity. Let us not hold the House at ransom on these matters. It is not good. So, the clarity must be sought at that stage and I take the point raised by the honourable, the Leader of the Opposition. So the fact that the issue is raised here, now I am directing it to be brought to the Programming Authority and that it is dealt with at that level. Are we all in order? So this is the finality on this matter, and that we need to proceed.

Welcome, hon Premier, and hon members that have just joined us. Welcome! May we now proceed?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Chair, could I just obtain clarity then. In your ruling that we should stick with the convention of yesterday... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No man!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Because if that is not your ruling then I would request that the House adjourns now and the Programme Committee discusses this matter. This is a fundamental [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] Do you want to exchange seats?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...it is a fundamental breach when an issue like this is not discussed at the Programme Committee and a unilateral change is made by the Chief Whip... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is early in the morning [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: Why? No, no!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: If we allow this, so I would request that the House adjourns and that the Programme Authority meets. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No, no!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): On a point of order, hon Speaker, this is not a point of order. Every Speakers List is determined on its individual basis.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hear-hear!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): There has never ever been an issue of this convention and that convention. Every debate is determined individually and there has never been a question of speakers' lists and order of speakers for particular basis to have gone to the Programming Authority ever. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes, yes.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): So this in fact what the Leader of the Opposition is requesting is a break in convention.

The SPEAKER: Alright, hon members, I am going to request that my Table staff brief me in this regard. Then I need a five-minutes break. Thank you.

[Business of the House suspended at 10:07 and resumed at 10:12]

The Speaker took the Chair.

The SPEAKER: You may all be seated. Welcome back again, hon members. I have consulted with my Table staff. I have the following to say. In terms of Rule 53, which I will go through now, Subsection 1 and 2:

53. (1) In a debate the Presiding Officer must call on members to speak in accordance with a list of members who are to speak and in accordance with the times allocated in that list for speeches by those members.
- (2) When a member rises to speak, he or she must be acknowledged by the Presiding Officer, and if two or more members rise at the same time, the member who is so acknowledged is entitled to speak.

Basically this is the only Rule closer to what we are dealing with, the only Rule, and also Rule number 4, if there is a convention and there is an absence in the Rules on what the convention is, the convention takes precedence, but if there is a convention and there is a Rule on the same convention the Rule takes precedence, and that is the Rules that we have. So, if there is a matter that the hon members feel uncomfortable about in terms of the Rules, it must be brought to the Rules Committee.

Currently we have a matter that is relating to the Programming Authority. I asked the question to the team whether this matter was brought to all parties and I got the feedback that it was circulated by email yesterday and that there was no objection to what was shared with political parties as is the norm when the Chief Whip or the Programming Authority deals with matters of programming.

Now what we are presented with is the Speakers list before me, which I need to follow in terms of the normal Rule, as Rule 53 says, the Speaker does not interfere with the Speakers list. I am going to request again to the Leader of the Opposition that this matter must please be debated there. If you want to change the Rules it must be brought to the Rules Committee so that in future we agree on what the Rule should say in terms of the Speakers List. That then closes the matter and I do not wish to debate it further, because I want us to proceed, please.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Just to get clarity.



The SPEAKER: Clarity?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Clarity.

The SPEAKER: Hon, the Leader of the Opposition?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, it is actually an order point seeking clarity. I would just like to clarify that in your discussions, hon Speaker, did you confirm that the suggested change in the convention was never discussed at the Programming Authority, because it is one matter to release an email, to release an email... [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): On a point of order... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You must sit down. You must sit down.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: The issue is, I want to ask whether it is correct... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...whether it is correct that the change compared to yesterday was actually discussed in a Programming Authority meeting or not, because this is the first opportunity to formally object when we are sitting today in the House with an order like this

[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Oh, come on!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So this is the objection that we have made today. I would like to clarify in your discussions did you confirm that this matter and the order was discussed and agreed to in the Programming Committee?

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon the Leader of the Opposition. I recognise hon member Marais, and then I will come to the Chief Whip.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Speaker. I plead for sanity in this issue. Precedence becomes law, becomes a rule. In the highest courts there are always similar cases which are referred to and what the decision was. In this case, sir, you will be that Presiding Judge, and I think we are setting a dangerous precedent when we can hop and skip for strategic purposes to get a strategic advance on a debate, because there is obviously a strategic advantage to the DA now to have the list the way it is like this...

[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr P J MARAIS: ...because you put somebody to speak after the Leader of the Opposition, which can then unleash venom on him, which would not have

been the case if it was the way it was before. [Interjections.] So it is a political decision and that political... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: It is motivational!

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you hon member Marais.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: They never discussed the issue. [Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS: I just ask you, sir, to take... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: The point has been raised and we have recorded that.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, the Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Hon Speaker. The convention in fact is that the Minister speaks and then the Official Opposition speaks, so in fact what we have here is more in line with convention than what it was yesterday. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): And we have countless examples where a Minister...  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): For example, after the State of the Province  
Address... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...in the debate the Leader of the Opposition is first.  
So therefore he speaks after the Premier. [Interjections.] Therefore, what we  
are doing here... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): What we are doing here is absolutely not against  
convention. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): So the rhetoric in the House is incorrect and I would  
like to correct that. Also, what is the big deal? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order hon members!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): We have a DA Minister followed by the Official Opposition, followed by a DA speaker, followed by a member of the EFF, then GOOD, then ACDP, then Freedom Front Plus, then Al Jama-ah and the Minister to close.

Every party has been afforded the number of minutes as agreed to in the Programming Authority and in the Rules Committee. [Interjections.] No-one is being denied their opportunity to speak and no-one's time has been reduced. [Interjections.]

Mr P MARRAN: Listen to the points!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): This is making politics for the sake of politics. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip. [Interjections.] Order! Order hon members! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: They play politics and they come here and say [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members, order! We must try and work together here. I have made my ruling. I gave an account of what the Rules are that is before me, say, and I tried to afford the House to proceed with its business as the Presiding Officer. I am going to give the last two speakers to raise the

issue they want to raise on whatever points of order you want to rise on. There is no debate now. This is not a debate. The next debate is the Order of the Day. The Chief Whip of the Opposition?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. You know, hon Speaker, when there are changes in any nature an email is circulated to all and there must be a sentence that says: "Amendments to the previous Order Paper."

An HON MEMBER: There is no amendment.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): There was no amendment to the Order Paper.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Now yesterday at 12:28 we received an email from Ms Belinda Sickle which reads: "Dear members, kindly find the Speakers List for tomorrow's sitting", and in it there are changes. Now the Order Paper that was printed before is what we have. The Order Paper that we have today has changes.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): On a point of order, that is incorrect. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Relax!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): That is incorrect. The Order Paper has not changed.

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip, will you please take your seat.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): The Order Paper has not changed.

The SPEAKER: Chief Whip, please take your seat. [Interjections.] Order hon members!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): There was no change to the Order Paper.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! [Interjections.] Let us allow the Chief Whip of the Opposition to conclude and then there would be responses, if there are, from the Chief Whip, please.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. Now it is disingenuous that one will circulate an email like this, whereas there has been email that was circulated with no changes. Now in any event where there are changes that must be cited. Now today we find ourselves debating something that should have been clearly illustrated on the email that we received yesterday at 28 minutes past 12, sent by Belinda Sickle.

Now for now, Chair, I have heard you have made the ruling but the fact remains - the changes were never discussed and it was never even indicated on the email that there are changes to the previous Order Paper that was sent. That is disingenuous. [Interjections.]

So really, Chair, in as much as there was no email sent, because there was no need to send an email when something wrong has been done, because it was

disingenuous to begin with, so Chair, in as much as you have made your ruling, it still remains that those changes were effected without any proper consultation. There was nothing wrong for the Chief Whip to say to me: “We are intending to change this, as it was yesterday, one of the members who were scheduled to speak here, there were changes...” and she informed me and I was okay with it.

Now for this one, for some reason or the other, there was no indication whatsoever to say, “We are changing to Order Paper as per the previous that was circulated.”

An HON MEMBER: Sit down!

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip. The Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Mr Speaker, the Chief Whip of the Opposition is the one that is being disingenuous. There has been no change to the Order Paper. The Order Paper that was circulated has not changed.

This Speakers List was not circulated previously and then changed and no-one was informed - no! The Speakers List was circulated [Interjection.]



Mr A LILI: [Inaudible.] about the meeting informing... [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...and each Speakers List is determined on its own merits... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon member Lili.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): You cannot say because yesterday we debated Social Development, today we are now changing Social Development's debate. No! Each debate is on its own merits. We have not changed any of the speakers as the parties have given through to us. We have taken those parties' speakers [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You changed the order. The order has changed.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): And their speaking time and we have allocated it to the Speakers List. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members, order!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): We have followed this particular format countless times...

Mr A LILI: What format? What format are you talking about?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): And so I really do not understand what this storm in a teacup is all about. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: No, you are not telling me something [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Whip. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Just on a matter of [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: I recognise hon Minister Fernandez.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Speaker, and hon members, I think in terms of the Rules once the Speaker as the Presiding Officer has made a ruling and you had indicated that this matter will go to programming, I do not know the merits to the changes, but I do not think it is appropriate in terms of the Rules after a ruling has been made, to engage in further debate on that matter, so I would like to propose that we continue with the Business of the Day and that this matter be dealt with in Programming, and it is contained in the Rules. [Interjections - talking simultaneously.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! Order, hon members, what we are doing now, hon members!

[Interjections.] Hon members, order! I have made the ruling. What I am simply doing is to ensure that the Chief Whips, the Whippery does what the Whippery should do.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: So let us now leave this out of the hands of the Speaker because I have made the ruling as to what we are going to be doing. Hon Minister Fernandez is correct, but I simply wanted to make sure that the Whippery is assisting in terms of how we should move forward.

### **BUSINESS OF THE DAY**

The SPEAKER: Now hon members, I would like to ask the Secretary to read the first Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Vote 4, Community Safety - *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 6 - 2019].

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I recognise the Minister of Community Safety, Minister Fritz.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: †Somlomo [Speaker] †Molo, molweni [greetings]. Good morning hon Speaker, Deputy Speaker, hon Premier, Cabinet colleagues, hon Leader of the Opposition, hon members of

the Western Cape Provincial Parliament...

An HON MEMBER: “The”, what do you mean, “the”?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Ja, the. It is exactly what it means; citizens of the Western Cape.

The Adjustment Budget comes at a time when the DA-led Western Cape Government is putting in place the final pieces of a Safety Plan that will change the fabric of our society, and it will indeed change the fabric, hon Speaker, to hon Lili opposite me. While the ANC pays lip service to the intrinsic needs of all humans to feel safe and encourages its allies to make this province ungovernable, this DA-led Government will ensure that over the next 10 years we deal decisively with the challenges of making this province safer for all who live in it.

We stand by a very noble dictum that you do not play political games with people’s lives. You do not use the lives of people to score cheap political points. Rather, you mobilise the human need of all people to feel safe by pooling the resources of the state to fight against criminality.

Under the leadership of Premier Winde, this Government is hard at work putting in place the measure to reduce the murder rate by half over the next 10 years.

Honourable Speaker, on 26 November, Minister Maynier tabled the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement (MTBPS) and the 2019 Adjusted Estimates of the Provincial Revenue and Expenditure in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament.

As with all other departments across Government, my Department has had to execute its mandate within an increasingly constrained economic environment and let me remind the House that the austerity measures in place are there because of the criminal mismanagement and destruction of the economy by the ANC through the endemic corruption and state capture. †Hulle het alles gesteel! [They stole everything!]

†n AGBARE LID: Ja!

[An HON MEMBER: Yes!]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: But, despite these budgetary constraints, I welcome the MTBPS and the Adjustments Budget as it breathes life into the Premier's Safety Plan. [Interjections.] In support of building safer and cohesive communities in the province... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: What about the [Inaudible.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order hon members! Please proceed, Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...an additional R130 million...

[Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: You must talk to us about the crime that is affecting [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Can I speak, hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Please proceed. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. Please proceed, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: So in support of building safer and cohesive communities in this province an additional R130 million has been allocated in the 2019/2020 financial year for the Law Enforcement Advancement Plan also called LEAP, and also referred to as the ‘Boots on the Ground’.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, that is the only thing [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The project forms part of the larger transversal Safety Plan led by the Department of the Premier. LEAP is an initiative that we are implementing in partnership with the City of Cape Town and I want to add, hon Speaker, also with the National Government soon, so we are very far in advance with that plan with National Government, and we have made tremendous progress in setting up the basic systems to implement this.

This increase was made possible by minimising the Department's budget by R17,9 million. The amount of R3 million was transferred to the Department of the Premier for the development of software systems for the prioritised safety projects within the Department. The Department further surrendered funds to the Provincial Treasury through the reprioritisation of internal projects to contribute R14,9 million towards the Safety Plan and in turn the Department has been allocated, and it is so good to hear, the Department has been allocated:

- Firstly, R130 million in the Adjustments Budget for 2019/20; and
- R417 million in 2020/21;
- R350 million in 2021/22 and;
- R400 million in 2022/23;
- R1.3 billion towards the implementation of LEAP over the next four years.

Hon Speaker, this budget will make it possible to implement the Premier's Safety Plan announced on 19 September 2019. As part of this Safety Plan each Minister has been allocated apex priorities, which they will be personally accountable for and to report on during the Safety Cabinet. My particular apex - my priorities include:

- Overseeing the training and deployment of additional law enforcement officers and 150 investigators to place to places and times where and when violent crime happens, in other words an evidence-based approach;

- Working to expand the Chrysalis Youth Academy Programme;
- Enhancing police oversight;
- Looking at working to reduce alcohol-related harms (Alcohol-related Harms Programme);
- And then lastly, implementing the Premier’s Boys-to-Men Programme.

Hon Speaker, I want to say that soon we will take up the suggestion made by - I cannot remember, I think it is member Marais, where we will get every Opposition party in the room and specifically what the hon Brett Herron has been saying, we want to get all of them, not only the ANC – every one of the Opposition in a room, and explain and go through the Safety Plan in its final form - in its final form. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yesterday you said “shut up” and the Premier said “shut up”... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: In its final form.

The SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Speaker, because we do not play political games with the lives and safety of our citizens, this DA-led Government has reprioritised itself ... [Interjections - shouting / speaking simultaneously.]



The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: ...to ensure that this province becomes a safer place for all who live in it and, therefore, we do not have one Opposition party, we have five. All of them will be invited and not the ANC having monopoly on what they know and what they do not know.

Mr A LILI: No man, stop talking about the ANC man, talk about “us”.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. Hon members, I would like to draw your attention to Rule 39 and Rule 40 as well as Rule 38 of the Standing Rules. Let us conduct ourselves in such a way that we do not compromise the decorum of the House. We must allow the speakers to be heard but also we must ensure that other members allow us to be heard. If we want to do justice in the debate we have to maintain our noise levels, please hon members.

Now I recognise hon member Kama.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hear-hear, hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon members of the House, guests in the gallery, staff members from the HOD up to even a cleaner, shadow MEC Fritz, and the real MEC in absentia MEC J P Smith. [Laughter.] I greet you all this morning. [Interjections.]

We gather here to look at the Adjusted Estimates of the Provincial Revenue and Expenditure that were tabled in this House last week. You must appreciate that I entered this Legislature, hon Speaker, very young, but I can see I will be having grey hair when the term ends. I can tell you, my mental health is also threatened. The DA has continued to sow confusion in the past few months without fail. This should be attributed to the party's inability to appreciate the complexities of the crime-and-gangsterism phenomena in the province. The adjustments made in this budget are proving exactly that point, for you do not need to take money from other Departments to ensure that you implement an integrated strategy to fight crime.

Nadine Bowers du Toit from Stellenbosch University stated that one of the most pressing issues in urban ghettos of the Cape Flats is that gangsterism and the scourge of power and powerlessness - that is its life blood. Furthermore, she said, it is a pandemic that is closely tied to a deprivation trap of poverty, marginalisation, isolation, unemployment and ultimately powerlessness.

In my seven months, Speaker, as a member of the Committee on Safety, I have always been advocating for any plan or strategy to have the factors

listed by Ms Bowers du Toit as its central pillars.

As the ANC we always maintain that we need an integrated approach that recognises the importance of community involvement in the fight against crime. Today to my surprise, hon Speaker, this Government is cutting budgets on subprogrammes like Safety, Promotion and Community Police Relations. In other shifts funds intended for payment of Community Police Forums, (CPFs) have been diverted for additional funds required for marketing material in relation to CPFs Annual General Meetings (AGMs).

This is because instead of supporting CPFs which have always complained about lack of submission funding for their projects, the MEC is interested in who gets elected into these CPFs. [Interjections.]

This was evident in his unconstitutional directives which he issued to the CPFs AGM which were rejected by CPFs and SAPS. Due to fewer accredited Neighbourhood Watches as well as unaccountability of some and infighting, the Department has underspent on transfers to Neighbourhood Watches, and has since shifted money for additional funds required for advertising, travel and subsistence as well as computer hardware. This yet again shows community involvement is not an apex priority for this Government.

Hon Speaker, through these Adjustments Estimates the Department has received an overall additional appropriation of R112 million. Funds have been taken away from other critical programmes of the Department to fund

Programme 3, Provincial Policing Functions, and an additional budget of R130 million is made available to fund Premier Winde and MEC JP Smith's Safety Plan.

This is not to mock my good friend, MEC Fritz, but his role in what the Premier now calls, working document Safety Plan, has merely been reduced to only employing a project manager. All other operations will be conducted and handled by MEC JP. I must say that it is my first time witnessing a Government that sets aside millions to fund a working document. There is no Safety Plan in the Western Cape but only a working document. I always maintained that the DA uses safety to score cheap political points.

On 17 September 2019 in front of the Premier, President Cyril Ramaphosa called a joint parliamentary sitting on gender-based violence and femicide to outline Government's plans to tackle this scourge. In turn, Premier Winde, who did not want to be outshined, went there to announce a R1 billion plan to fight crime.

Allow me to take the last few minutes to talk about the so-called Safety Plan. It has two legs: one being the deployment of law enforcement called Boots on the Ground, and the second being reducing and preventing violence.

The second one is mainly about addressing the underlying causes of crime and violence. Nothing is being done about it. All focus and attention are on the Boots on the Ground. The first 1 000 recruits will be deployed in the

Metro and other municipalities will not benefit. The working document is silent on details of recruitment, training and conversation of these law enforcements officers. As things stand, we do not have a breakdown of the R130 million. We just know it is a transfer to JP Smith, who should decide what he does with it. [Interjections.]

We cannot support transfer of funds to JP Smith who runs his very weak army base in the City of Cape Town. Metro Police, when the City of Cape Town is consistently attacked, under-resourced, made to work in buildings that even have snakes because [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Huh, snakes?

Mr M KAMA: Always, because it has always spoken against the political meddling and control of JP Smith.

An HON MEMBER: Where?

Mr G BOSMAN: What type snakes are these?

Mr M KAMA: It is this J P Smith who said to only standardise the remuneration of the Metro Police Chief to that of other Chiefs in other provinces, because it is his puppet, but chose not to do so in all other Metro Police units in order to frustrate and suppress that unit. [Interjections.]

On the contrary the law enforcement officers who are only trained for three months and given guns, and now expected to go and perform a miracle in the ten highest murder precincts in Cape Town, are receiving more support, because they allow JP Smith to control them through a WhatsApp Group.

To validate the above, ask him about the Law Enforcement Security Plan for those councillors who are in those chambers. They do not have.  
[Interjections.]

The ANC will reject these Adjustments Estimates for the reasons above.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Noted. [Inaudible.]

Mr M KAMA: We however, hon Speaker, want to recognise, the work that is done by the departmental officials of Community Safety because they try against all odds to come up with the plan, but the problem is that they are led by a wrong person, and we want to also thank the Chair of the Committee, all the time we tried to hold all of the Executive accountable but, hon Speaker, we must say that lastly the honourable member is exposed. He must take off the mask.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M KAMA: This is not our MEC Fritz. This is JP Smith.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: J P Smith? [Laughter.]

Mr M KAMA:: Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Hon members, I now recognise...  
[Interjections.] Order, order!

The PREMIER: You should make that speech in Hanover Park.

The SPEAKER: I now recognise hon Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you, hon Speaker. Through you I would like to dispel the fear that hon member Marais raised regarding spewing venom as the hon member Kama is already facing threatening health issues, so I would rather want to dispel the myth and the misconceptions that he has raised.

Hon Speaker, long before we have reached the worst Women's Month in the history of South Africa the Democratic Alliance in the Western Cape called for increased boots on the ground, not only for our communities to experience a sense of safety but for every citizen to go about their daily routine to be economically fit and socially active without worrying about being robbed on a train; to be hit by a stray bullet on the way to school or for the justice to be served that our innocent so desperately deserve. Yet our pleas have fallen on deaf ears and this came at an unacceptable price. Hence I would agree that R130 million is simply not enough, but we live in a time

where we cannot but always find a way to see that the glass is half full. Hence, from the start and without hesitation I wish to express my support for Vote 4, because again safety is everybody's business.

The upward adjustment of the budget for the Department of Community Safety, however, unfortunately, came at the cost of every other Department in the Western Cape and Provincial Treasury on its own faced unprecedented challenges. Therefore, I wish to commend the Premier for his direction along with the Minister Albert Fritz and Minister David Maynier for their hard work during the last few months.

An HON MEMBER: And JP.

Mr R I ALLEN: If anything, the increased investment into provincial safety capacity building shows dedicated responsibility, responsiveness, and accountability, but more importantly it is elements that we no longer see in Government, which is integrity and a commitment to a promise of creating a better future and a safer province for everyone.

Under Programme 3 for the period of April 2019 to September 2019 the programme spending has been decreased by R3,7 million, due to the reduction of advertising and security in the office of the Police Ombudsman. However, in a meeting with his office the Standing Committee was reassured of its optimal functioning with regard to various ways in communicating its work to ensure that we provide an accessible complaints operation to



contribute to the improved and credible police performance in the Western Cape.

An amount of R205 million has been shifted to Vote 1 for the development of software systems relating to safety projects, to ensure that we have data to roll out our Safety Plan effectively. Through you, hon Speaker, to the honourable Premier, please kindly be advised that we will be doing a follow up to ensure that we make progress and inform our people in this regard.

Furthermore, as Chairperson for Community Safety I would ensure that we conduct oversight and especially joint oversight visits as safety manifests itself in various portfolios as seen in the shifting of funds in this particular MTEF period.

We will be embarking on these visits, not only as we reach the end of the financial year, but until the comprehensive Safety Plan is felt by everybody on the ground. We will ensure that where there is a need that we interrogate and respond with the respected level of seriousness that does not disregard the pleas of the community. We have been criticised, hon Speaker, over and over for the tune that the South African Police Service does not fall within the mandate of the Provincial Government, but the fact is... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Does it?

Mr R I ALLEN: But the fact is that it does not and that is the simple truth,

that it does not, yet we are committed to supplement the services and support where we can. Last week during a committee meeting on the Annual Report of SAPS in the Western Cape it was revealed that service is anticipating a human resource boost in the form of graduate deployments and we will be watching this development closely. Every effort towards making the Western Cape a safer place must be welcomed and supported without hesitation across each sphere of Government and particularly across party lines.

I recall not too long ago consensus in this House to prioritise crime in this province, yet during our debate yesterday, although one is always open to constructive debate, it was as if for a moment we forget the pleas of our people as they filled the streets and marched against violence on 5 September 2019.

Hon Speaker, I would also like to bring clarity around the definition of a working document in order to help my colleague over there. It is a type of technical report, draft of a work in progress. It is a common occurrence to underestimate the importance of a draft, hon member Kama.

It provides the planner a chance to meld his thoughts and to further develop plans instead of ending up with a signed-off plan that misses critical points, and before hon member Kama and I was born, I am not sure if any of the hon members in this House would be a fan of the Television hit series the A-Team... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr R I ALLEN: ...where they coined the popular phrase there, “I love it when a plan comes together.” I know that was before our time but we would definitely have to catch up, sir.

An HON MEMBER: Before your time.

Mr R I ALLEN: Furthermore, it is our job to criticise if our people suffer an injustice by the inability of National Government to curb debt, corruption and maladministration in order for us to stop accommodating year-on-year budget cuts.

Yesterday I also heard that the surrendering of funds is a sin, yet to me it would be a sin to let innocent people die at the hands of criminals, while we can accommodate needs without compromising on frontline service delivery, but I think we should all agree that we have reached the period of severe financial constraint throughout our entire country where we all have to learn to budget and to plan a little more critically than before and to save and to reprioritise where we can.

In Afrikaans there is a saying that goes: †“Liewer bang Jan as dooie Jan.” [Better a living dog than a dead lion.] Thus in closing I would like to say that even though financial insecurity of the public purse is a scary reality as many budgets were cut and that we face challenges in making ends meet, I would

rather have each and every citizen move freely without fear for their lives by building safety capacity in the province in order for communities to build their own financial security and to thrive socially above being killed by a stray bullet due to a lack of police visibility.

Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Allen.

†Die MINISTER VAN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID: Mooi!

[The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Good!]

The SPEAKER: In the absence of the EFF I recognise hon member Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, the problem is not the idea of a Safety Plan. I think everybody supports a plan that addresses or seeks to address the root causes of crime and increases visible policing. The problem is allocating R130 million to the City of Cape Town without a plan. So we do not know if R130 million is informed by operational requirements, or if this is some amount that the Province was able to cobble together by cutting other budgets and so it is an arbitrary number and this is the problem that we have.

We have an arbitrary number that is not justified by any plan that shows us that there are operational requirements that meet R130 million worth of

funding and so too with the outer year provisions, there is no plan that indicates how those numbers are arrived at and how they will be deployed or allocated or spent. So we have an arbitrary number that we are expected to support based on a working document that is very, very superficial and very, very generic. So we do not have a plan, but we are certainly not opposed to a plan. The hon member Allen is saying the drafts always precede a plan and of course they do... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member.

Mr B N HERRON: ...but you should not allocate funding based on a draft. Get the plan in place! [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Your time is up, thank you. Hon members, now I recognise hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Speaker, to prioritise crime is not the problem. It is how the DA wants to implement this stillborn baby. That is the problem. Now let me tell you, hon Speaker, let me tell you law enforcement offices are there to enforce municipal bylaws. Metro Police is appointed under the South African Police Act and they come to our Standing Committee to come and give a plan, an Annual Performance Plan each and every year.

Why can we not strengthen and beef up that? Because now you have a Metro Police that have police real powers to combat crime so it is not - the problem

is not looking at prioritising crime. It is how the DA wants to have law enforcement officers, R130 million down the drain. It will go down the drain. R1,3 billion will go down the drain because this Law Enforcement Officers' Course will not work. They are there to enforce municipal by-laws and not do police work.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member, your time has expired.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Why do we not - then they come back and account and we can then tell them to go and appear with the Annual Report to account to the Standing Committee. [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Please switch off the mic.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: This is a failed plan. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

An HON MEMBER: A failed plan! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: When the Speaker or any Presiding Officer says the time is up, it means your time has ended.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Hon Speaker, I apologise. I apologise.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians. Your apology is accepted, hon member. May I now recognise hon member Marais.

†Mnr P J MARAIS: Baie dankie, agb Speaker. Minister Fritz, u is 'n briesie vars lug. [Gelag.] U praat die taal van die gewone man, probeer niemand beïnvloed met jou hoë Engels nie en jy praat, as die mense sê “straf misdadigers”, ek sien in die koerant, hulle sê hiero: “Fritz sê: ‘Verkragters en dié wat aan moord skuldig bevind is moet nie op parool vrygelaat word nie’...”

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Minister Fritz, you are a breath of fresh air. [Laughter.] You speak the language of the ordinary man, do not try and influence anybody with your high English and you talk, when the people say “Punish criminals”, I see in the newspaper, they say here: Fritz says: “Rapists and those found guilty of murder should not be released on parole...” ]

You have got guts that nobody else so far has shown me they have got in this House, on that side of the House, I mean, so I say thank you.

You talk Boots on the Ground! Fine, but I want to know whose feet will be in the boots! [Laughter.] I do not care if it is a black foot or a white foot or a coloured foot, he must be properly trained and he must be a person of

incredible integrity. Nelson Mandela said: “I do not care if the cat is white or if the cat is black, as long as it catches the mouse.” [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Your time is up, thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: I wanted to hear about the cat so I am glad you finished that part. Thank you very much, hon member Marais. Hon members, I am hearing that there is a complaint about the aircon so that is being sorted out now. The members are saying it is cold, yes, we are sorting that out.

Hon members, order! Now I recognise in the absence of hon member Brinkhuis, I recognise the Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Thank you, hon Speaker. I want to say to the hon Marais, to start with the end, thank you for those nice words, and I think our philosophy and our policy is very, very much that the best person whose feet must go into those boots and properly trained, and I think that is the point. Now what hon member Kama cannot get into his head is that when we work inter-governmentally you work with National Government and Local Government and I know you spoke about ghosts yesterday. I think hon member Kama is seeing ghosts during the day, you know, he sees JP Smith as the MEC, he is one of those ghost MECs so that is the one problem with this, with that dictum. [Interjections.] So what we will continue to do, what the ANC cannot get into their heads and what they



cannot do is to implement.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Ja.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: And we will show them in this case that we will go and implement the plan and I want to immediately address - and I really take seriously what hon member Brett Herron is saying, that we can assure you, hon member - we will not dump money anywhere. That is precisely the point why we are insisting and our teams are technical people and are working with the City's side and our side on finalising the implementation plan, the project plan, and I think that is the point. So we have the framework and let me just suggest that our plan is so incredibly evidence-based and let me give you the one example because we have two areas where we implemented the neighbourhood safety people who are not just - they do not enforce municipal bylaws at all. They focus on safety in Bonteheuwel, and I want to say how we have seen the reduction in the murder rate in Bonteheuwel specifically. Now the same plan, because of the wideness of the area of Delft, did not work, and therefore that is some of the lessons we have learnt and therefore our research shows the methodology we should use. I really want to say to all members and specifically, I am talking about the other members, not only the ANC and I emphasise it - not that I am not having an issue with them - but to have that workshop where we can work and really give back to every member of the Opposition to say this is the plan. But we just want to finish it quickly ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Order, hon members. Hon Minister please address the Speaker.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Sorry, hon Speaker. But, hon Speaker, the problem with the ANC and my dear friend hon Nkondlo, is that the ANC always have this static plan and then they force a square peg into a round hole and it never fits in and therefore all their problems are failing and then they start calling names – the MEC this and the MEC that.

Hon Speaker, you know I actually have much respect for hon Kama and I am actually disappointed in what I heard today because we normally – in the Committee and everywhere we talk and we work in a collaborative way but I understand when you have to talk in front of a TV. You know when he is on TV, unfortunately he must politicise issues. That is the fundamental problem. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hon Christians, I think I really want to say to you let us give this a chance. It is not law enforcement. Remember that the policeman has to sign off ... [Interjections.] giving us the right to have a whole lot of trained peace officers is a very – and I do not think he realised what he is signing. So I can assure you it is far beyond just law enforcement. It is really trying to make an impact even if the ANC always accuses us because they are too pathetic to implement policing in this

province. We have to see how we can push the boundaries to make our people safer in this province.

I want to say to hon Reagen Allen, thank you. I think one day we must actually get all that information out, how members are, on a daily basis, communicating with us on the trains, on cable thefts along the railway lines in Netreg, how they come under attack, young people from our communities who are giving up almost their lives to safeguard us.

I think we must actually do site visits to those sites to see young people at four o' clock in the morning, stopping criminals stealing who make the economy dysfunctional by stealing cables along the railway lines.

PRASA, the national institution, is just sitting watching it and you know that agreement with the ... [Interjection.] – ja, because you are part of them, you are part of the failure – that is the problem. Our whole central line has been made dysfunctional and the National Government is just looking on. PRASA is looking on and when we do something they complain, they criticize.

I also want to say that the R130 million is a start. Remember we have over four years, it will be augmented all the time. [Interjections.] We also want to really, Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members. [Interjections.] Hon Minister, please proceed.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Mr Speaker, we really want to welcome the issue around oversight, proper oversight so that we can get the stuff implemented and all of us work in a collaborative way. You know we had an attack on the N1 two days ago, this past weekend. Again, our National Government is nowhere to be found. Again, we must jump in; they are nowhere to be found. [Interjections.]. They are a waste of time. That is what they are.

I want to agree with the hon member Allen. What the ANC is allowing our people is to be †dooie Janne, en nie Bang Janne nie. [better a living dog than a dead lion.] [Dead Janne, and not scared Janne.] So all our people are dead, dying at this rate and therefore our people are dead, they are dead Janne, you know Jan, Johns instead of †Bang [scared] Janne.

And then lastly, Mr Kama, I am really disappointed in your ... [Interjections.] – he is a man, he is young, he is a very, very capable intellectual. Unfortunately the opposite was seen this morning in the House because of political populism but I want to say to him, the gangsters – and we concur with all the academics. Academics are just academics. They stay at university and they have seminars but we concur, the whole issue around gangsterism and the power of gangs and poverty and when people are disempowered, that they then take the gap. Therefore we are changing it.

That is the reason why we are changing it and a man with intellectual capability like him should have noticed that, should have seen it.

[Interjections.] But unfortunately hon Speaker, I feel sorry for him. He is captured; he is intellectually captured by the ANC. He is completely captured. [Interjections.]

I also just want to say that as a project we will also work, hon Speaker, we will work with the National Government. We are meeting at a very high level on the 10th with National Government. And I want to say we will continue to work with National. We will also work with the Provincial Local Government. We will work with all of them to get a plan that is better together for this province and it will be a plan that comes together and will be better together for every citizen of this province.

Lastly, I want to thank my HOD, I want to thank our senior officials for the work and I want to thank JP. [Interjections.]. No why must I apologise? Thank you JP for doing your work ... [Interjections.]. Thank you, Minister Bheki Cele, because we will all work together even though this ANC Government or Opposition does not want to work together. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon members. Thank you hon Minister. Hon members, thank you. Is that a point of order, hon, the Leader of the Opposition?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes, hon Speaker, thank you. It is a point of order. I refer you to the Rules on page 11, under

definitions, where a point of order is described as a matter related to the procedure, practice or operation of the House or a complaint of unparliamentary conduct or behaviour on the part of another member ... [Interjections.] which a member is entitled to raise during the sitting of the House or committee for seeking guidance or a ruling on a matter from the Presiding Officer. Now Speaker, with respect to the ruling that you have made, we want to bring to your attention ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... we want to bring to your attention that in regard to the conduct of the Chief Whip of the majority party, we believe that having looked at Hansard for the last five years, from 2014 to 2019, which indicates that the order that has been established in discussion of all budget votes and all adjustment appropriation votes, the order of Minister, Chairperson of the Committee, of Opposition has been followed. Essentially what we have witnessed here today, and we would like a ruling on this matter, whether you are prepared to consider an investigation into this matter, that that order and convention which was established for both Budgets and Adjustments has been summarily, without consultation with the programming authority, changed by email.

Now we regard this as a serious breach and unparliamentary behaviour by the Chief Whip and we are bringing this matter to your attention. We have the evidence here of all the order points. [Interjections.] We would like you to

actually acknowledge and come back to this House, having studied Hansard for both the Budget Votes of the last five years and the Adjustments and come to this House with a ruling. I so move.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Mr Speaker, on a point of order.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Thank you hon, the Leader of the Opposition. I have made a ruling on this specific matter and I do however want to note that if there is a matter that the hon, the Leader of the Opposition wants to bring to the attention of the Speaker, that the Speaker must be approached in that regard and that the Speaker will investigate using the available mechanism in this Parliament. Can we then on that note – the Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Mr Speaker. Also having studied the Hansard of the Sixth Parliament, I will just remind members of this House that the ANC responded after the Premier in the SOPA. In the two DA debates, the ANC followed the DA's speaker in the introduction of the debate. In the ANC debate, the DA followed the ANC speaker who introduced the debate. In the NCOP debate, the DA opened, the ANC followed. [Interjections.] So that has been the convention in this Sixth Parliament. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Order. Order hon members.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): That is my first point and then my point of order is under Rule 66(5), which states ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... which states that a member who is aggrieved may not challenge a ruling in the House and there are particular ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order. Let us allow the Chief Whip to continue.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... avenues which the Leader of the Opposition may follow. Thank you. [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Please take your seat hon Deputy Chief Whip. Hon members I have made the ruling on this matter and this is the same sitting where I made the ruling. So we cannot revisit the same ruling in the same sitting. Let us respect the Rules of this House. Let us do so, so that the House is orderly. I am not taking any other speaker on this matter. We are now going to proceed with the business of the day. May we please proceed. Can the ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Another point of order ... [Interjections.].



The SPEAKER: What are you rising on hon Mitchell?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. I am rising on ...  
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: That is an unrelated matter.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... Rule 59 (2) where the hon Leader of the Opposition cast aspersions on the integrity of the Chief Whip of the Opposition of the majority party. I want you to rule on it. [Interjections.]. There are mechanisms he can use ... [Interjections.] I want you to rule. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon Deputy Chief Whip. What is the point that you are raising? What is it that hon member said?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): If the Leader of the Opposition has an issue with the integrity or casting aspersions on the integrity of the Chief Whip, he must do so through a substantive motion as covered in Rule 59 (2). [Interjections.].

The SPEAKER: Alright. Hon members order. Order hon members. Now that is the point of order hon, the Leader of the Opposition. I would like to hear from yourself, hon member, on the exact point that is raised by the hon Deputy Chief Whip of the majority party.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Speaker. I quoted for you the definition of a point of order and I was rising on a point of order which says clearly that if one believes that there was behaviour on the part of another member of unparliamentary conduct or behaviour. I was rising on that point of order, given that in my view, the Chief Whip has summarily changed the convention of this House which I regard as unparliamentary conduct.

So that is in terms of the Rules, a point of order that I raised, it is a criticism in regard to my interpretation of her conduct of breaking a convention in this House without discussing it with the Programming Committee. But you have made a ruling and I accept your ruling.

The SPEAKER: Alright, please take your seat hon member. May we please proceed? Hon Deputy Chief Whip of the majority party?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Order please, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Is that a point of order?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: A point of order.

The SPEAKER: I recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Speaker. The

hon Dugmore is correct in terms of point 66, however what he failed to recognise is point 66(5) which says, “a member who is aggrieved may not challenge a ruling in the House. That member should follow the process of writing to the Speaker, who must then convene a Rules Committee within a reasonable time ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Please take your seat hon Minister. Please take your seat.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: So there is an option for the hon Dugmore.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, please take your seat. I have already made this point and the House – hon members may we please allow the proceedings to go unhindered as intended. Thank you hon members and let us please assist the presiding officers here. It is going to be a long day but we can make it a very productive one, if we work together. Now that concludes the debate on Vote 4. I would like the Secretary to read the next vote, which is Vote 12.

[Debate concluded.]

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 12 – Economic Development and Tourism – *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 6 – 2019].

The SPEAKER: I recognise the Minister.

The MINISTER OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, hon Speaker. I am pleased today to speak to the Adjusted Estimates of Vote 12, the Department of Economic Development and Tourism.

Now the Department of Economic Development and Tourism plays a critical role in creating an enabling environment for the private sector and for the markets to drive economic growth and to create jobs in the Western Cape. The Main Appropriation of R523,3 million has been adjusted down by R12,1 million to R511,2 million for the 2019/20 financial year.

I will of course not deal with all of the adjustments which are of course set out in the Adjusted Estimates of Provincial Revenue and Expenditure 2019 but I will, and I believe it is important, highlight some of these and how they link to the continued programme to back business in the Western Cape.

We will for example be shifting R1 million to Programme 2 for the Oudtshoorn Aerodrome Project, which of course is an important upgrade, which is required to ensure that the aerodrome maintains its CAA licence and status as a back-up airport to the George Airport.

We will be shifting R1,4 million to Programme 2 in support of the Violence Prevention through Urban Upgrading organisation and of course, this funding will be utilised specifically for the creation of additional multi-functional community buildings which will be utilised for a business incubator programme which will provide 10 innovative businesses with work spaces.

We will be shifting R100 000 in Programme 2 for the provision of formal trading spaces for informal trade in the Green Point Market, and this funding was provided at the request of the City of Cape Town and of course, the South African Informal Trading Association. We will be shifting R100 000 to Programme 3 to assist the Halaal certification bodies to become globally accredited as certification bodies which will allow them to certify Halaal products and companies for the important Halaal export markets.

We will be shifting R496 000 to Programme 7 in support of the Competency Based Modular Training Project which aims to ensure that young people, in technical vocations, are equipped with relevant training so that they can get jobs. This has already resulted in an increased uptake of students completing training with companies like Imperial Motors, Golden Arrow and MyCiTi.

Finally, we have received an additional R471 000 for Programme 7 from the manufacturing, engineering and related sectoral education and training authorities and these funds will of course, support the work and skills projects undertaken by the Department.

Hon Speaker, I thought that it would be appropriate to mention that last week I had the pleasure of meeting a number of innovative and impactful Western Cape entrepreneurs and business owners at the Western Cape Entrepreneurship Recognition Awards. These awards, as you know, are an annual event organised by my Department, to celebrate the hard work of entrepreneurs and their contribution to job creation and economic growth in

the Western Cape.

The title of Business of the Year was awarded to Ziyahlanjwa Laundry Services which was started in 2010 by Sivo Mongo as a home-based laundry service in Khayelitsha but today employs 18 people and services clients such as Shosholoza Meyl and De Beers Marine.

Sivo like many of the other business owners who received awards last week, plays an important role in creating jobs and supporting skills development in our communities and in so doing, helps us to grow the economy and create jobs in the Western Cape. We obviously will support and encourage these entrepreneurs because the brave leap into the unknown, that is required to start a new business, often results in innovation, in competition and in the disruption of industries and in new ideas that we need to grow the economy and create jobs in the Western Cape. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. I now recognise the hon Nkondlo.

†UNksz N D NKONDLO: Enkosi Somlomo, mandibulele eli thuba undinikileyo ukuthi siphendule eyethu imbono ngalo oluhlahlelo lwabiwo lwe mali.

[Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Speaker. I would like to thank you for the opportunity to respond to budget allocation discussion.]

Hon Speaker, I think the first important thing to actually note is that this

particular Department is meant to play a catalytic role to drive economic opportunities for its citizens and lead in unlocking growth opportunities for the province.

It is important, also to mention as part of the context to this Adjustments Budget, that this Department states its vision as a vision for a Western Cape that has a vibrant, innovative and sustainable economy characterised by growth, employment and equitable opportunities and built on the full potential of all.

Hon Speaker, this becomes very important when we then look and consider what we, as the legislative arm of government, are supposed to do in attending to this particular budget.

Ten years down the line, it is important for us to ask the question: how has the DA economic policy fared in realising this objective, noting that scholars of public policy indicate that it takes a minimum of a ten year period for a particular policy to realise its intended objectives?

What have we seen in the economy? Already we are sitting here speaking about information that is well known to everybody, of high levels of income inequality in this particular province. Again, spiralling levels of crime that have actually led to a discretionary approach by the Premier, where he declares a Safety Plan, comes to the House, to this particular Parliament and requests this Parliament to then approve a budget wherein he will still go and

clean up the plan and then, as Minister Fritz has said, come back here to workshop us on the plan. This is exactly the type of governance and the role of Parliament that the DA wants to subject us to.

Surely, this is against good governance where indeed the separation of powers needs to be respected and the role of Parliament cannot be reduced to just a toothless voice that actually comes here and just approves things before we actually know what is entailed in it. Actually, we must be cautioned, as this House, on this discretionary approach to public policy in this particular province.

I want to remind members that it was here which actually got our Premier into this City, as the first man of the province, where he did the same, declared a Day Zero and funds were then directed to Day Zero. Today we are still asking, where is Day Zero? The reality of the matter is we are told, once again, that we are still looking for money to manage drought in this particular province and indeed no one has come back to us and maybe given us a workshop on the impacts of the funds that were spent as far as Day Zero is concerned.

And my question Premier: is this the type of public policy approach that you are bringing into our space where all you do is to decree the resources of this Provincial Government and only come here, expecting us to just agree?

Let me then come back to what we have seen in the Adjustments Budget. We



welcome the funds that have been allocated to the Atlantis SEZ to fast track the process of establishing the much needed SEDIC Company to ensure the roll-out of the Atlantis SEZ, including the additional funds that have been allocated to the Saldanha IDZ.

One of the questions that we ask MEC is one of the challenges that was mentioned here in our discussions in the Committee with the Saldanha IDZ, where indeed the programme that is supposed to drive skills development, enterprise development, all the developmental needs that are supposed to be responded to in Saldanha Bay, is actually an unfunded mandate.

It is very interesting, that even in this budget you chose not to respond to that particular reality, that seeks to ensure that the capital investment that is done in Saldanha actually responds to the realities of the socio-economic challenges of the people of Saldanha.

We welcome the R164 000 which is shifted for regional skills co-ordination which will then be going to the West Coast Business Development Forum but the question, once again, is when are we finding money from the Provincial Reserve Fund to actually give money to Saldanha IDZ for the developmental programme and the projects that they need to drive?

Going further, with regard to skills development and innovation we are seeing again in the report that this programme has deviated slightly from its planned expenditure forecast. This is so unfortunate, because once again

questions have been sent to yourself and the Department asking about the continuous investment as far as skills are concerned. All we get is a runaround. There is no clearcut answer of how much, or many artisans have been produced through the programmes, how many rare skilled artisans.

We are told now that money is shifted to CMBT, a programme that is supposed to ensure the work readiness of learners and the question is: what is an artisan programme that is designed by the Department outside of exponential learning which is an integral part of any production by an artisan? So these are glaring gaps in as far as the interventions that have been done by this Department.

Amongst others, we have raised our issues around how do we ensure that we create an inclusive economy that ensures redress in this particular province and many times we have actually raised our voices, again in the Committee, on these matters around the issue of tourism and ensuring how do you integrate township tourism and small town tourism. But once again, this seems like a mirage in the type of approach that is undertaken by this particular Department.

Almost R12,5 million from the Compensation of Employees is surrendered to the Provincial Reserve Fund and this is something that we have seen across departments, that this seems to be the case. We are sitting with a challenge of redress in as far as employment equity is concerned and ensuring that we bring on board employees with disabilities. Black women in senior

management positions seems to be a very difficult exercise in this Provincial Government including in this particular Department.

†USOMLOMO: Siyabulele.

[The SPEAKER: We thank you.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Can I conclude Chair?

The SPEAKER: Yes please.

Ms N D NKONDLO: I conclude by saying it is important for us to see that the economy of this province, led by this particular Department, ensures that it does not reproduce inequality and elitism. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you hon member. Thank you hon Nkondlo, hon members, and I recognise the hon Baartman.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Speaker, fellow South Africans. Some of the adjustments in Vote 12, Department of Economic Development and Tourism of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill B6 2019, relate to the realignment of fund for the implementation of departmental leadership training and minor IT related assets. Further, there has been a reclassification regarding various goods and services to transfers and subsidies due to accounting related reasons, such as:

The establishment of the strategic economic development infrastructure company, SEDIC.

There is also additional funding for the existing SMME development interventions of the Violence Prevention through Urban Upgrading organisation; and for the funding of the provision of formal trading spaces for informal businesses operating in the Western Cape in partnership with the South African Informal Traders Association as well as global, digital repositioning as implemented through Wesgro.

Other shifts in the economic classification included the sight operations and management component of the deed of skills, I-Can Learn Project.

We welcome the provision of the funds of the R1 million to support Oudtshoorn Municipality with the upgrading of Oudtshoorn Airport which has been identified as a key economic asset: their R1,4 million that has been allocated for the strategic plan and informality project; R60 000 which has been utilised for the Women's Empowerment Project and R17,7 million for the provision of funding in support of SMME development interventions for the SMME booster fund, forming part of the economic emerging themes and job creation stimulus.

These funds will be supporting the Laingsburg, Cape Agulhas, Witzenberg and Oudtshoorn Municipalities. I am excited about the almost R1,5 million that will be allocated to the Laingsburg Municipality and I look forward to

communicating this to my constituency.

Connected to this, recently while doing oversight in Laingsburg, I found that the Department of the Premier has already assigned two new staff to the Cape Access Centre, a centre that currently assists 800 to 1000 community members, approximately 10% of the community.

Further, part of that particular oversight, I found that it is not only that we get a social worker and an auxiliary social worker in the Department of Social Development but also Child Welfare will now be getting another social worker and I thank the Ministers and the Premier for this. They are not only getting an internet connection but fibre is currently being installed and it just shows, in terms of oversight and the connection with working with departments closely, what we can achieve in this particular province.

In this particular vote I further welcome the R5 million for the support of the operations of the National Empowerment Fund for funding for SMMEs; R340 000 for encouraging entrepreneurial projects with the Western Cape Entrepreneur Summit, Awards Expo and the #YouthStartCT Entrepreneurial projects.

Further, I welcome the R7,75 million for the establishment of the Atlantis Special Economic Zone. We welcome the provision of funds for the filling of vacant posts as part of the Skills Incentives sub-programme and again, we take cognisance of the fact that Government has had to balance decisions of

whether or not one should fill a vacant post or whether we could use these extra funds for the drought, security and safety of this province.

Due to the uncertainty of the Main Budget allocations coming up, it was heard that there was going to be a freeze on the filling of the majority of these posts, while R50 million for drought and R1 billion for Community Safety is not enough, we hope that the R12 million surrendered to the Provincial Revenue Fund will be reallocated in order to assist in providing relief for drought and making the Western Cape safer.

In connection to this particular drought, I would also just like to thank Minister Bredell for requesting that Cape Nature do an assessment of the Laingsburg Buffels River, of which I received communication from the ground this particular week, and would like to thank the Central Karoo District Municipality who have already started scraping the Moordenaars Karoo Road which trucks need in order to utilise to deliver supplies to farms and which tourists use in order to spend their vacation times at guests homes in the serene Karoo area. This will also assist the wind farms currently setting up in the Laingsburg area to transport parts to their farms safely, speedily and at reduced costs. These are economic opportunities that are transversal, hon Speaker.

I would like to thank Mr Meyer and Minister Maynier for the drought relief that has been coming from this particular budget. Minister Meyer specifically came to Laingsburg to witness the drought and the plight of the farmers,

farmworkers and their spouses. They introduced fodder relief and pastoral and psychological assistance.

During some farm to farm visits I witnessed the impact of drought on the local economy and was also informed of a young farmer, who I will not name, who committed suicide because he had given up hope. Thank you for supporting the Laingsburg community because this will go a long way in assisting with keeping hope.

Further, we welcome the additional funding in the vote of R200 000 for the Ocean Economy Commodity Market Research project as well as the R164 000 for the West Coast District Municipality for the support of the Regional Skills Coordination. Economic developments do cut across provinces and I would thus like to thank Minister Marais for the support of the rugby jerseys, water bottles and rugby balls to the Laingsburg rugby team who have been exponentially climbing the rugby ranks this particular year.

I would like to thank my colleagues in the Economic Opportunities and Tourism Committee for their engagement and contribution, the Minister, the HOD, Mr Solly Fourie, the Department and its various entities for their hard work and dedication towards the Western Cape Province and for always finding innovative ways to assist entrepreneurs in the Western Cape.

Finally, I would like to thank our Procedural Officer, Ms Zaida Adams, who advises us on the Economic Opportunities and Tourism Committee for her

sound advice and commitment to this province. I would also like to wish her a happy birthday for this particular coming Friday. To Mr Fourie, a special thank you for the Department's hard work in the green economy.

I have recently found out on the ground, with regards to the wind farms, that almost everyone in Matjiesfontein has been employed due to the new renewable wind farm operations and I will definitely be visiting the operations soon to engage with the businesses and those employed regarding the related benefits and any concerns they may have. Thank you hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Baartman. Hon members, in the absence of the EFF, I now recognise hon Herron. Hon Herron? Thank you hon Herron. Now hon Christians. Thank you hon Christians. Hon Marais? Thank you hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I want to ask the Minister, that we need to focus on foundation concepts, like leadership, change management, teamwork, visual management of projects and we need to transform people's mindsets regarding business processes and systems at functional levels. You know you can have an A plan and overseas it works beautifully but that same A plan if you bring it here will have a 20% success rate because we lack these things I just mentioned.

We must set the road map for the people's business journeys, newcomers into business. We are not doing that. Ask yourself, does the present Budget have



the elements to bring this to fruition? Do we need to train people? Do they only know how to sew a button on a shirt or do they know where it starts and where the shirt becomes a finished product or do they only see, like a fly, one section of the total ... [Interjections.]

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie. Baie dankie, agb lid. Baie dankie meneer.

[The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon member. Thank you, sir.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Mr Chairman, I think this clock needs batteries because ...

[Interjections.][Laughter.]

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie.

[The SPEAKER: Thank you.] We will try and get new batteries. Thank you, hon Marais. I now recognise the Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, hon Speaker. I would like to begin by thanking the hon Baartman for her kind words about the Head of Department, Mr Solly Fourie and the Department itself for their contribution to creating an enabling environment for the private sector in the markets to drive economic growth and create jobs in the Western Cape.

In response to the hon Marais, yes, our programmes do cover the issues to which you refer. I must say I was surprised earlier when the hon Marais took to quoting [Inaudible.]. It took me by surprise, which brings me to the hon

Nkondlo.

The hon Nkondlo asks what has this Department and indeed, this province achieved over the past ten years in relation to economic growth and job creation in the Western Cape? Well, the answer to that question is clear. We have achieved more economic growth, more investment and more jobs, certainly more than any other province in this country.

The hon member would be aware that when I tabled the Provincial Review and Economic Outlook, that if we take the outlook over the next three years, it is a story of a recovery in economic growth, a recovery in employment and indeed improving human development in the Western Cape.

Now the hon member is concerned that she and her party are being reduced to toothless voices in this Parliament which of course takes me by surprise that the hon member and her party appear to be trying to marginalise themselves by taking issue with the fact that they speak immediately after the Minister, which in my view should be their rightful place as the biggest minority party in this House. [Interjections.]

On the question of the Saldanha IDZ, the member will be aware that the Saldanha IDZ has a significant commitment to skills development and indeed, one of the obstacles often to that programme is leveraging funds from National Government. The hon member also raises the question of compensation of employees and funds surrendered to the Provincial Revenue

Fund, quite rightly. We are, of course committed, as we explained in Committee, to filling vacancies but particularly at a senior level but only once we have finalised our Provincial Strategic Plan in the Department.

In closing, hon Speaker, I would like to associate myself with the comments of the hon Baartman and thank our Head of Department, Mr Solly Fourie and his team for all their efforts in getting things done in the Western Cape and we, of course going forward, will continue to back business by being responsive to business, by being open to business so that we can continue to grow the economy and create jobs and give hope to people who do not have jobs or who have given up looking for jobs in the Western Cape. I thank you.

[Applause.]

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister, hon members. That concludes this particular vote. Now we will just allow three minutes to switch between this and the next vote. We are live streaming this debate so that the public is able to have access. You may remain seated or you may go and have coffee. Thank you.

[Business of the House was suspended at 11:43 and resumed at 11:45].

The SPEAKER: You may all be seated. Hon members before we proceed with the next vote, the Chief Whip has brought to my attention that there was

a bit of an issue yesterday with the votes being brought earlier than the times set, so I want to make sure that no hon member is aggrieved because of that. We are running at a bit of high pace. I think we are doing well in terms of the time. So there are two votes that we might still do before lunch.

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The SPEAKER: So I just want to bring that to the attention of the House so that we prepare ourselves accordingly. Are we all in order?

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

The SPEAKER: All in order? Thank you very much, hon members. I will then at this point request the Secretary to read the next order.

The SECRETARY: Vote 3 – Provincial Treasury – *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriations Bill* [B 6 – 2019].

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr Secretary. I recognise the Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I am again pleased today to speak to the Adjusted Estimates of Vote 3: The Provincial Treasury.

The Provincial Treasury of course is in the main responsible for

implementing the provincial fiscal strategy by, as I mentioned in the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement, continuing to focus on proper expenditure management, proper revenue management and maintaining a balanced budget in the Western Cape, and of course by continuing to apply the principles of allocative efficiency, fiscal sustainability, fiscal consolidation and fiscal discipline in the Western Cape.

The Main Appropriation of R357,3 million has of course been adjusted down by R19,3 million to R338 million for the 2019/20 financial year. I will of course not deal with all the adjustments which are set out in the Adjusted Estimates of Provincial Revenue and Expenditure, but I will highlight some of the adjustments which of course are linked to the implementation of our fiscal strategy in the Western Cape.

We will, amongst others, be shifting an amount of R395 000 to Vote 1 for the Department of the Premier for broadband connectivity for the Client Walk-In Centre in respect of the Supplier Evidence Base. This will of course allow those suppliers who want to do business with the Western Cape Government to more readily access us and get information they may need to respond to Government tenders in the Western Cape.

We will also be shifting R17,6 million from Programme 2 with the largest portion of that shift amounting to R14,3 million going to Programme 4 for the Western Cape Financial Management Support Grant, and of course as hon members know that support grant provides financial assistance to

municipalities to improve the overall financial governance within municipalities inclusive of optimising revenue; of improving the credibility and the responsiveness of the municipal audit outcome and addressing institutional challenges.

We of course remain committed to filling all the critical vacancies, but compensation of employees has been adjusted down by R6,9 million due to the late filling of posts; attrition and internal appointments and the lower uptake of trainees.

Earmarked allocations amounting to about R4,6 million were surrendered to the Provincial Revenue Fund. Of this total R4,6 million has been surrendered to the Provincial Revenue Fund in relation to the infrastructure development support funding, which is awaiting approval, or the structure which is awaiting approval by the Department of Public Service and Administration.

R10 million of the ear-marked allocation has been surrendered to the Provincial Revenue Fund in respect of the Financial Good Governance Grant pending the finalisation of the framework in respect of the grant. An additional R571 000 was financed through the Provincial Revenue Fund to the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board to refund overpaid taxes in the case of Hollywood Sportsbook.

Of course, Mr Speaker, the Provincial Treasury implements our provincial

fiscal strategy precisely so that we can maintain stability, credibility and transparency when it comes to the budget in the Western Cape. I thank you.

[Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I now recognise hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Let me welcome in our midst the brand new from the box Head of the Department of Treasury. I just want to greet him.

Mr Speaker, from the onset allow me to express concerns around the amounts of rollovers by various provincial departments which have totalled over R156,1 million. This includes also some of the COE funds that also had to be surrendered from some of the departments and the entities, which actually suggests that there is a lot to be done in as far as tight mechanisms to ensure fiscal discipline and a full optimal expenditure of budgets by Provincial Treasury and also the departments.

I think this is a matter that we have discussed in the Committee and also in Scopa to ensure that as we engage with the budget it becomes important, when Parliament is required to actually approve the budget, that a practice and culture of optimum use of that budget is actually instilled.

Having said that, R19,5 million has been surrendered to the Provincial

Revenue Fund in this Adjusted Budget we are told, which I think also brings another area of concern, especially I think the one on what is termed “savings” on the compensation of employees, which is done through delays as the Minister has just alluded to, delays in filling of posts and staff attrition, which I think is a cause for concern.

It is a cause for concern because again we heard, I think especially during the discussion of the Annual Reports of the last financial year, of how employees of the departments, including this Provincial Treasury, are experiencing very strange working environments as pressure mounts on them and that is demonstrated in the high take-up of their sick leave.

So this becomes important in appreciating the human capital that we have and also looking at opportunities for upward mobility, especially at senior management levels, as one of the things that we have raised to say when there are vacancies it becomes important that priority is given to some of the equity limitations that are already glaring in the Department, especially in ensuring that we bring in women and black women in particular.

The innovation of the eSystem including the Walk-In Centre that will actually allow all those suppliers who need to be part of the database of the Province is something that is welcomed. Having said that, Mr Speaker, amongst other issues that are very critical to note in the entire management of the supply chain of Provincial Government is I think an alignment that



needs to be done with the other department that the Minister is sitting over, with the ease of doing business, the red tape, but most importantly contract management especially as it related to Local Government, because these are some of the areas where we have seen an increase in litigation and sometimes delays of payments to SMMEs.

So if we are talking about a fiscal strategy that promotes growth, those are some of the issues that are supposed to be a priority in the discussions of Provincial Treasury and I think supporting in particular the unit or the sub-programme that is focusing on the financial oversight of the municipalities; and this actually speaks to the fiscal strategy that must indeed look at how to support municipalities as part of the mandate of the Department in any way, because this is not something new.

As the Minister related earlier on, if one looks at the PERO and the MERO, the continuous assessment of the growth of this province that he was boasting about, I think he is not mentioning the other reality of the challenge of the GTBR contributions of the municipalities, especially those municipalities that historically are servicing the very poorest communities; if you talk about municipalities like the Matsikama's of this province, where you see that their Gini coefficients remain very high at around 6,61, closer to one, which indicates high levels of inequality in poverty in those areas, and that information is actually produced by the Provincial Treasury.

The question that one always needs to ask is the extent to which this information is therefore utilised in the actual planning and the allocation of resources, including at this point where you need to utilise the budget as we have seen with the Safety Plan, to actually consider one of the biggest challenges in the province and that challenge of inequality.

So in conclusion, hon Deputy Speaker, it becomes important I think also to make mention of the fact that one of the observations is that the Department has got an oversight responsibility over the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board and under these Adjusted Estimates the Board will receive over R571 000 additional budget.

The Auditor-General awarded an unqualified audit opinion with findings to this Board. It should be of concern that this Department has failed to ensure that an entity that reports directly to it does not obtain a clean audit with no findings.

So these are some of the things that when you talk about a clean audit, obviously when you oversee some of the entities under you, an expectation is that at least the practice must also rub off on the entity itself.

So, lastly perhaps when Parliament reopens ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order, hon member, will you please take your seat.  
Hon member Marais, will you please help me.

Mr P J MARAIS: I am sorry, sir. I apologise, I could not find the button to switch it off.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Your apology is accepted. Sorry, my apologies, hon member Nkondlo. Please proceed with your speech.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Okay. How many minutes do I still have, Mr Speaker?

An HON MEMBER: Six minutes.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: 20 seconds.

The SPEAKER: You are still fine.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Mr Speaker - yôh.

The SPEAKER: [Laughter.] You are still fine, hon member Nkondlo. You have got one minute and a half. [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I think one of the issues we would like to highlight in this particular budget and I think also an issue we have raised with the Minister through the Committee, is the austerity measures. It becomes important to not only look at the traditional ways of looking at austerity. One of the things I think we continue as governments to miss when we talk about austerity is to actually look at the cost of running a

business of government and its affairs.

I think in this regard we need to make mention of some of the capital projects and the cost of delays of projects and sometimes the cost of the type of suppliers that we utilise that end up, some of them I think mentioned in Public Works, would actually run a risk of liquidity to a point where that impacts on the projects themselves.

We would like to submit that when Parliament reopens we need to get more details on how much the Province has taken back to the Provincial Revenue Fund. It is a public purse and the public should know how much the Province has in its reserves and what will they be used for. I thank you.  
[Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Nkondlo. Hon members, I now recognise hon member Baartman.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Mr Speaker, fellow South Africans. Finance is not always the sexiest topic and back in the day, if I remember correctly – not in my time – but butchers used to wear heels to avoid stepping on blood, and men in the upper echelons of society also used to wear heels in order to signify that they do not engage in hard labour, which necessitates you being flat on the ground. Women then over time took over the convention of heels and turned it into a fashion accessory which again started to evolve into the representation of empowerment. So please bear with me with the Finance

Vote when I try to turn the butcher's heels into heels of empowerment.

The purpose of the Adjustments Budget process is to provide an opportunity to revise the Main Budget in response to the changes that may have been affected in terms of a particular department during that year before the financial year comes to a particular conclusion. In this particular year the severe drought and safety and security concerns have affected each department and similarly we have then had to make provision for the budget cuts as part of the main budget process in the next financial year.

In this particular Budget Adjustment Vote 3: Provincial Treasury, I welcome the provision for funds for the earlier than anticipated filling of vacant posts as part of programme support, accounting support as well as the supply and chain management sub-programmes, and also welcome the commitment for the current vacant posts that will be filled before the end of the financial year.

Further, I welcome the additional provision of R1,2 million for the Supplier Evidence Bank Client Walk-In Centre which will assist entrepreneurs with a supplier management service in respect of the Western Cape supplier database.

Further, we welcome the areas identified related to travel, consumable items, venue hire and consultancy fees where the Department has indicated that it has saved costs and reallocated them to programmes that will have significant

impact on residents of this province, such as the shifting of R395 000 to Vote 1 of the Department of the Premier in order to provide broadband connectivity for the Client Walk-In Centre in respect of the Supplier Evidence Bank.

These suppliers can now receive direct assistance from the Provincial Government as well as support for tender documentation, and I will definitely be communicating this to both the Chairpersons of Laingsburg *Sakekamer* and the Laingsburg Black Business Forum should this vote be accepted.

Further, the R14,3 million in additional funds to develop financial human capacity within municipal areas to enable a sustainable local financial skills pipeline is welcomed given the current Local Government capacity constraints.

After having read the overview of the Adjusted Provincial and Municipal Infrastructure Investment, I would like to indicate to Minister Mbombo that after seeing the progress, personally, at the hospitals and the clinics, that those upgrades are coming along nicely within the Laingsburg community.

I would like to thank my colleagues on the Finance and Budget Committees for the engagement and contribution; for the Minister; for HOD, Ms Gantana; the Provincial Treasury and its entity, for their hard work and dedication towards the Western Cape Province and their resilience to what has been a very difficult economy in South Africa.

I would also like to thank our procedural officers, Ms Zaheeda Adams, who advises us on finance, and Ms Waseemah Kamish-Achmat who advises us on the Budget Committee. Your sound advice and commitment to the province is truly appreciated.

Minister Maynier, previously you reminded us about the *spekboom*'s resilience, but today I would like to remind you about the *spekboom*'s versatility and adaptability. Did you know that the *spekboom* leaves are edible? You can use the leaves to quench your thirst; treat exhaustion; dehydration, heatstroke; you can use the crushed leaves to provide relief for blisters; chewing it can treat a sore throat and mouth infections. The juice of the leaves are used as an antiseptic and for skin ailments, and its stems can be used to build huts, homes and thatched roofing. In Mozambique, for example, breastfeeding mothers consume *spekboom* leaves in order to increase their milk supply, and during previous famines the Zulu culture used to use it in order to prevent dehydration.

Further the *spekboom* assists in removing carbon dioxide from the air because it acts like a carbon sponge, improving the very air that we breath, absorbing between four and 10 tons of carbon per hectare, and the *spekboom* Foundation actually indicated that:

“The *spekboom*'s capacity to offset harmful carbon omissions is compared to that of moist subtropical forests. This remarkable plant is unique in that it stores solar energy to perform

photosynthesis at night. This makes *spekboom* ten times more effectively per hectare at carbon fixing than any tropical rainforest."

So as we embark on 2020 let us ask ourselves how can we be as resilient as the *spekboom*, as thoughtful as the *spekboom*, as versatile as the *spekboom*, as adaptable as the *spekboom* and as innovative as the *spekboom*.

Hon members and officials, I wish you all a festive season and to those who are travelling please be safe. Let us wear our seatbelts; whether we are sitting in the driver's seat, navigator seat, DJ seat or naptime seats; let us not spiral ourselves into debt in order to impress people who you only see once or twice a year, and let us buy our stationary supplies first and to the youth, let us live our lives responsibly. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Baartman. I now recognise hon member Makamba-Botya. Oh, she is not present, alright. Hon member Herron? Thank you, hon member Herron. Hon member Christians? Thank you, hon member Christians. Hon member Marais? I recognise hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Let me just see if I have got anything to say here. [Laughter.] Do not laugh. [Interjections.] Mr Speaker, I think that I will pass on this one. I just want to know that this is Treasury and I want to ... [Interjections.]



The SPEAKER: Your time is up, you have concluded your minutes.

[Laughter.]

Mr P J MARAIS: I do not know whether you are joking or are serious.

[Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: You may proceed. You have got one minute. [Laughter.]

Hon member Marais, please proceed.

Mr P J MARAIS: Mr Speaker, I wanted to ask whether we are considering asking National Government to recalculate our equitable shares, conditional grants, etcetera?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr P J MARAIS: This needs a relook at.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr P J MARAIS: The money that they give us, we have very little, I think it is 3,6% old funds. The rest we rely on National Government and the equitable share, the formula used and the conditional grants, we will seriously have to engage with National Treasury on this. The Western Cape

has become a suction point for people desperate to seek work, to seek a better life. I do not blame them if they come here, but the money must follow. I believe finance must follow function.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr P J MARAIS: Give us the function we perform, but send the money with it and I want to ask our Treasury to please engage with National Government on these two issues. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marais. With the absence of Al Jama-ah, I recognise the Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Mr Speaker, I thought for a moment that this would be the rare occasion on which the hon member Marais had nothing to say, but he recovered and to answer his question: yes, we are interacting with Provincial Treasury on the matters to which you refer and in fact we are going to conduct research on alternative division of revenue models in ... [Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: I hope I did not disappoint you.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... the Western Cape. No, the hon member certainly did not disappoint.

I wish also to associate myself with the hon member Baartman's comments about the festive season and also to congratulate her on her deep dive research into the merits of the *spekboom*, which brings me to the hon member Nkondlo, who raises a concern about compensation of employees.

Mr Speaker, in this constrained fiscal environment of course we have to be prudent and we have to maintain our COE expenditure ceilings, but of course by not at the same time compromising service deliver in the Western Cape.

On the specific issue about filling vacancies in the Provincial Treasury, which we discussed at length with the hon member in Committee, we are absolutely committed to filling critical vacancies in the ... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: What about equity?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: ... Provincial Treasury.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: What about equity?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND

TOURISM: I would also like to thank the Minister for her compliments in respect of the Walk-In Centre and also associate myself with her comments on assisting municipalities, hence of course the Western Cape Financial Management Support Grant to which I referred.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: [Inaudible.] Minister. It is a Freudian slip.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM: On the question of the R571 000 in the gambling environment, I wish to assure the hon member that this was a result of a software error and we have obviously reached an amicable settlement in this matter.

The hon member also raises the question about whether there are not efficiencies which can be gained in the procurement environment and I completely associate myself as we discussed in Committee, with that view, which is why in the Medium-term Budget Policy Statement I announced that over the medium-term we will be looking at procurement strategies and strategies to achieve efficiencies and savings in the Western Cape.

Mr Speaker, in conclusion I would obviously like to thank Provincial Treasury's former Acting Head of Office, Julinda Gantana, and of course Team Finance for their dedication and professionalism and tireless commitment to the Provincial Treasury, to the budget process and to the people of the Western Cape; but I would also like to extend a special

welcome to the new head official of Provincial Treasury, Mr David Savage, who brings extensive experience at National Treasury and at international finance institutions, to Government in the Western Cape and I am sure the House would like to join me in wishing him luck in his new position. Thank you. [Applause.]

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, that concludes the debate on Vote 3 and now we are moving to the next vote, but a three minutes break before then, just to switch between the votes, so that your Department can watch you on TV, hon Minister.

[Business of the House was suspended at 12:09 and resumed at 12:14].

The SPEAKER: Hon members, welcome and thank you for your indulgence. I now at this stage want to request the Secretary to read the next Order.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sports – *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 6 – 2019].

The SPEAKER: I recognise the hon Minister.

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Agb Speaker, dankie vir die geleentheid om vandag aan hierdie baie belangrike begrotingsposdebat

deel te neem. Ek gaan die Wes-Kaapse Regering se verbintenis tot dienslewering en burgerimpak binne 'n haglike fiskale omgewing op 'n konstruktiewe manier bespreek.

My dank aan Minister David Maynier, die Provinsiale Tesourie-span, my Kabinetskollegas en Departement Kultuursake en Sport se Uitvoerende Bestuurspan en amptenare vir die begrip wat hulle getoon het vir die waarde van kulturele aangeleenthede en sport, om nie net 'n eens verdeelde nasie te herbou nie, maar om aan almal wat die Wes-Kaap as hul tuiste beskou, 'n gevoel van samehorigheid te bied en om hoop te inspireer in 'n nasionale klimaat waar die meerderheid mense voel dat hulle deur die nasionale ANC-regering in die steek gelaat is.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Hon Speaker, thank you for the opportunity to participate here today in this very important Budget debate. I am going to discuss the Western Cape Government's commitment to service delivery and citizen impact within a desperate fiscal environment in a constructive manner.

My thanks to Minister David Maynier, the Provincial Treasury team, my Cabinet colleagues and the Executive Management team and officials of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport for the understanding they have shown for the value of cultural aspects and sport, not to just rebuild a once

divided nation, but to offer a feeling of solidarity and inspire hope to all who regard the Western Cape as their home, in a national climate where the majority of people feel that they have been left in the lurch by the national ANC Government.]

Hon Speaker, the National Minister of Sport, Recreation, Arts and Culture once noted, to which I agree, and I quote:

“It is important to note and acknowledge the glaring reality that South Africa’s freedom would remain hollow for the majority of the population, predominantly black, if they remain on the fringes of the economy.”

Yet, Mr Speaker, the majority of the population who are our vulnerable and previously disadvantaged, are further pushed into despair and blocked from opportunities by allowing taxpayers’ money to instead fund maladministration, mismanagement, state capture, SAA and Eskom bailouts and the sort.

Mr Speaker, I have witnessed first-hand how Western Cape athletes and creatives, mostly youth, have been locked out of national opportunities as a consequence or sacrifice of political grandstanding. This is absolutely unacceptable as our youth are still dying in townships, on the flats and in our remote rural areas as a result of hopelessness caused by national nonchalance.

†Kaapstad is die trotse gasheerstad vir die 2023 Wêreldbeker-netbaltoernooi. Ons vertrou die stad gaan hoop en eenheid inspireer en 'n instaatstellende omgewing vir konstruktiewe geleenthede skep. Daar is R779,000 aan die Stad Kaapstad herbewillig om netbalinfrastruktuur in die streek uit te bou en deelname, talentidentifisering en vaardigheidsontwikkeling in die kode volhoubaar te maak. Dit gaan ook veiliger ruimtes skep en meer lewensveranderende geleenthede bied.

Agb Speaker, die gebruik van sport- en kultuursake as hulpmiddels om ons burgers van veiliger ruimtes te voorsien en geleenthede vir selfbemagtiging en sosiale inklusiwiteit te skep, staan sentraal tot ons werksaamhede by die Wes-Kaapse Departement van Kultuursake en Sport.

Ons het groot vordering gemaak met die skep van 'n bemagtigende omgewing waarin ons kiesers holisties kan floreer. Met ons beperkte jaarlikse begroting het ons ons belegging in die jeug geprioritiseer deur toegang tot en deelname aan kultuursake en sport te verhoog deur organisasies te befonds, meer platforms vir talent-tentoonstellings te skep en deur nuwe innoverende vennootskappe met ander te smee ten einde te verseker dat groter geleenthede materialiseer. Daarom het ons ongeveer R10,2 miljoen na die Departement van die Premier verskuif vir Ondernemingsinhoudbestuur of die ECM.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Cape Town is the proud host city for the 2023 World Cup Netball



Tournament. We trust that the city will inspire hope and unity and create an enabling environment for constructive opportunities. R779,000 was reallocated to the City of Cape Town to expand netball infrastructure in the region and to render participation, talent identification and skills development in the code sustainable. It will also create safer spaces and offer more life-changing opportunities.

Hon Speaker, the use of sport and cultural affairs as aid to provide our citizens with safer spaces and create opportunities for self-empowerment and social inclusivity is central in the activities at the Western Cape Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport.

We have made great progress with the creation of an empowering environment in which our voters can flourish holistically. With our limited annual budget we have prioritised our investment in youth by increasing access to, and participation in, in cultural affairs and sport by funding organisations, create more platforms for talent exhibitions and through forging new innovative partnerships with others to ensure that bigger opportunities materialise. Therefore we have shifted about R10,2 million to the Department of the Premier for Enterprise Content Management or the ECM.]

Critical thinking, consciousness and a sense of belonging contribute to rebuilding a fractured nation and identity. At the Department we are committed to changing mindsets to offer positive alternatives to already

negative circumstances and unsafe spaces. Each day a greater amount of national funds is announced as stolen, misused, mismanaged and privately pocketed by ANC heavyweights. This angers and frustrates us, the Western Cape Government and our enabling partners, as we too often receive [Interjections.] what has now become the default response from the National Government that there are no funds available to optimise on our already functional and successful programmes in which lives are changed and communities uplifted through the work we do at DCAS in the Western Cape.

The arts, sport and cultural affairs allow people how to think , not what to think. Thus the work of the Department is serious business, often misinterpreted as simple fun and a time passer-by, when in fact it is a fundamental branch of Government. It is concerned with the wellbeing of the mind and, Mr Speaker, if the minds of our people are not equipped in our diversity and constructively empowered, it is less likely that they will take up the opportunities rightfully to be availed to them.

Cultural Affairs and Sport challenges, dismantles and disrupts the idea that “Because we are different, we cannot be together”. We have made incredible progress in promoting the beauty and power in our diversity and will continue to show in all real terms that the ANC’s propaganda has polluted the minds of our people for far too long with no sustainable ... [Interjections.] solutions to living lives free from fear in which hard work and dedication bring success and children grow up healthy and prepared for tomorrow’s economy. [Interjections.]

In contrast, Mr Speaker, key to our efforts at the Department is the creation of an enabling environment in which all who call the Western Cape home feel a sense of identity, belonging, united and most importantly, safe. There have been significant developments in the Province's commitment to identify, conserve, protect, manage and promote the heritage resources in the Western Cape so that we are aware of our cultural, historical landscape.

We therefore allocated an additional R506 000 for maintenance at our provincial museums to assist with the transformation of our heritage landscape in documenting where we come from and advocating for the significance of our regional beginnings as a diverse people.

With the ANC consciously allowing taxpayers' money to enrich the already rich ... [Interjections.], if it is not failing State-owned Enterprises, our officials are placed under severe pressure and are less capacitated as salaries ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members!

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: ... do not remunerate the sacrifice, hard work and selfless contribution to nation building. Mr Speaker, R6,1 million was re-appropriated and translated to surrender compensation of employees to the Provincial Revenue Fund for fiscal consolidation. Our staff have become despondent as very little financial growth is available in this very difficult economic environment.

[Interjections.]

Mr Speaker, it is clear that our Western Cape residents are speaking and are more vocal about our grievances, because they have been accustomed to a transparent, responsible and capable Provincial Government.

The Western Cape Government promotes diversity and will ensure vigorous public participation processes in which all interested voices will be heard, considered and democratically implemented. Hon member Bans, Marais, Kama, Windvogel and Xego, our people deserve freedom, fairness and opportunity. How better to honour Tata Madiba by proactively building the all-inclusive nation he once was prepared to die for.

The Western Cape Government, under the visionary leadership of Premier Alan Winde, firmly believes that innovation is always on the agenda and I look forward to collaboratively embracing new ideas and always doing the right thing with competent integrity, always mindful of the people we serve.

I thank you. [Applause.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Of the ANC.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

Ms N D NKONDLO: You will like that guidance from the ANC.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): No-no-no.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, after this vote we will take a break for lunch, so there will not be another vote immediately, there will be lunch break and then we will come back. I thought I just need to mention that to the hon members. I now recognise hon member Bans.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

†Die MINISTER VAN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID: Praat mooi.

[The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Speak well.]

†‘n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

Ms A BANS: Enkosi Somlomo. [Thank you Speaker]

An HON MEMBER: The ANC, the ANC.

UNksz A BANS: Enkosi Somlomo, kuyacaca ukuba ubukho bam noko kuyavakala, xa neqembu eliphikisayo lishukuma xa ndiphakamayo, Somlomo mandithathe elithuba ngokuqala kakuhle ndizokuqala kakuhle namhlanje ngomama ondiphetheyo umamaMarais, mandithi enkosi kuye kwiSitting yokugqibela apha, ndifike ndiphethe uhlelo alunehlazo lecandelo yethu mandibulele mamaUmarais ngomsebenzi owenzileyo ndivile intoyokuba

ushukumile kwenzekile noko, asisahlelanga kulandawo besikuyo ngokuba singakwazi ukukhupha intlokozethu phandle ngenxa yentloni ezenzeka kwiCandelo lwethu.

*[Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.]*

[Thank you, hon Speaker. It is clear that my presence has great impact. Even the opposition party is applauding as I rise to address the house. Hon Speaker, allow me to take this opportunity to start on a good note. My leader, mama Marais, allow me to say thank you to you. During the last sitting I came here with a motion that was a disgrace to our Department. Mama Marais thank you for your great work. I have heard you moved and all matters shaped up so at least we were not embarrassed. We can now walk tall that the disgrace did not take place in our Department.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear.

Ms A BANS: Mr Speaker, on 5 July 2019 the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport launched the case for a Sport Research Report. At the launch the MEC said the following, I quote:

“There is no doubt in my mind that those seasoned in the Western Cape Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport (DCAS) portfolio can agree that there exists a disconnect between the positive impact of sport and the budget often allocated to its programmes. This

comprehensive research now physically motivates for increased support not only for sport and recreation, but also affairs, cultural affairs as well.

I hope to enter into the budget adjustment period saying less this year and simply presenting Provincial Treasury with our case for sport in the bid for greater financial backing based on empirical information, academic substantiation and expert advice from custodians in the field.”

As we have entered the Budget Adjustment period the Provincial Treasury’s response was a R25,8 million decrease of the Department’s budget, whereas it was not what the Minister had committed to in her speech.

Mr Speaker, all programmes’ budgets were cut except for Programme 4: Sport and Recreation. The budget for Programme 1: Administration was decreased by R1.9 million. For Programme 2: Cultural Affairs the decrease was R677 000 and for Programme 3: Library Services, the decrease was R23,5 million - too much to decrease in one department.

Under Programme 4: Sport and Recreation budgets, for Sub-programme 4.4: Sport and Sub-programme 4.5: MOD programme, have both been decreased. The budget cuts for school sport and MOD programmes are totally unacceptable. At the height of gangsterism in the province and especially in rural areas at schools, disorder is the order of the day. These sub-programmes help to keep children busy and off the streets always. Given the importance

of these two sub-programmes there can never be any sound reason to justify these budget cuts.

What we need is additional budget so that we would be able to expand the MOD Programme to rural and farming communities where it is needed the most.

Time does not permit me to talk to the challenges that should be fixed in these sub-programmes, like the lack of synergy on cooperation between schools and federations to improve school sports.

SAFA in the Western Cape is not given any role to play in school sport. This does not make any sense because talented boys in school sports should be scouted and recruited in teams for playing for SAFA leagues. Talent is dying undiscovered.

Mr Speaker, the MEC needs to tell us what is the Provincial Treasury's response to the Department when it has presented the case for sport.

The Department has invested millions into two phases of research and our members of this Legislature are to ensure full implementation of the study's recommendations, and for this to happen the Provincial Treasury needs to come to the party and make funds available for the case of sport.

I do not want to say the MEC misled the public when she said during the



Budget Adjustments period she would ask for additional funds. I think the MEC has good intention for this Department, however as a female MEC ...  
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Not however.

Ms A BANS: ... in the Cabinet *bosberaad* her soprano becomes a minority in the base of the man-dominated *bosberaad*. [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: The decision?

Ms A BANS: Through these Adjustments Estimates the Department and the Provincial Treasury have missed the window of opportunity to accelerate increased support for strategic objectives achieved through sport.

When we raised these issues in the Committee we were promised that our concerns would be addressed in the Main Budget. Mr Speaker, the R17,7 million surrendered to the Provincial Revenue Fund could have assisted a great deal in the case for sport study.

In 2023 we will be hosting the Netball World Cup. We need to accelerate the programme of building netball courts in all communities so that we can get more netball players for the future, as well as to get more courts where different countries can train.

In this regard I want to cautiously welcome the additional R779 000 to build more tennis courts in the city of Cape Town.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Ms A BANS: However, the city should not only be the first to receive and the only, with many municipalities said to benefit in the future.

The city of Cape Town can never be interpreted to be the city of the province receiving all of the funds. We should ensure that all regions are being included.

Mr Speaker, I have noted that year in and year out, the Budget Sub-programme 3.3 is always decreased during this period of Budget Adjustments. I want to propose that in the future we allocate this programme only R20 million for this is the figure it has been spending over the past couple of years.

The decrease in the budget allocation for Library Services should be rejected and condemned. It is really unacceptable to shift funds away while not all townships have libraries; not all rural communities have access to libraries.

In conclusion, investing in the Department can keep clinics, hospitals and prisons empty. †Hoekom moet ons dan nou net beplan om elke keer van 'n *Safety Plan* te praat terwyl ons dit kan voorkom? Baie dankie, agb Speaker.

[Applous.] [Why should we now just plan to every time speak of a Safety Plan while we can prevent it? Thank you, hon Speaker. [Applause.]]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: With health and safety.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Bans. [Interjections.] Hon members, I now recognise hon member Allen. [Interjections.]

Mr R I ALLEN: Mr Speaker, the aim of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport under the capable leadership of Minister Anroux Marais, is to encourage excellence and inclusiveness in sport and culture through the smart use of our resources and through creative partnerships and funding.

The Department continues to set the standard in terms of moving towards excellence in making this province the sports and cultural centre of South Africa by creating the conditions for excess and mass participation; talent identification and skills development.

With this, Mr Speaker, allow me to briefly highlight the more significant adjustments. The shifting of R779 000 to the City of Cape Town to build netball courts. I may have heard tennis courts earlier on, but it is netball courts within the region as we believe this sport has done exceptionally well and will play a role in further amplifying the inclusion of women and

communities.

Also the allocation of R506 000 for maintenance at provincial museums as the DA-led Provincial Government values the importance of the preservation of our history and cultures.

Also, Mr Speaker, the rollover of R769 000 towards computer equipment as part of the rural library connectivity project as we recognise the importance that technology and literacy play in developing and giving access to valuable information.

It is thus a pleasure for me to stand here today in support of Vote 13. The Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport has gone beyond their call of duty in ensuring that opportunities are being made available to the people of this province.

Mr Speaker, Cultural Affairs and Sport play a crucial role in building the social fabric of our communities and our country at large. While the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport continues to play their role in shaping our next generation, it is simply not enough to fight the scourge of violence and the state of dysfunctionality in some of our communities.

It would be remiss not to consider the effect of our failed State-owned Enterprises and ANC corruption ... [Interjections.] as it continues in this province. Instead of investing more in this country's talent, the ANC would

rather rush to preserve failed entities and in turn their own lavish lifestyles.

Despite this, Mr Speaker, the DA-led Western Cape Government excels even in the face of unprovoked ANC politicking at a national level. We know that the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport has a pivotal role to play in facilitating community conversations; promoting culture, heritage, libraries, archives and language and using sport and recreation to advance social cohesion. Under the DA Government we have utilised our resources to the best of our ability to work towards that vision.

Mr Speaker, I would like to take this opportunity to thank each and every member of the Standing Committee as well as the Department for their rigorous engagements that have taken place since the beginning of the Sixth Parliament. Also a special welcome to our procedural officer, Mr Waseem Matthew for his help and dedication, as well as Mary-Anne Burgess, our assistant.

I would also like to express a vote of thanks to the members of the public for their meaningful contributions towards the work of this Parliament. We value the role that the members of the public play in our oversight process.

Mr Speaker, the Democratic Alliance supports this Vote. Thank you.  
[Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Allen. Hon members, in the

absence of the EFF I now recognise hon member Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, Mr Speaker. The problem with this Adjustments Vote or proposed vote is the precedent and the starting gates that gives this Department in terms of this draft Safety Plan working document, where the Minister must be responsible for the coordination of youth and service programmes, which will be scaled up to increase opportunities for unemployed youth age 18 to 24, and there will be additional after-school programmes targeted to reach at-risk youth who currently do not attend these programmes, to reduce anti-social behaviour and school dropouts.

Yet the Department is starting out the 2019 to 2024 Provincial Programme with a decrease of R26 million ...

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr B N HERRON: ... experiencing similar cuts that Education and Social Development are experiencing.

So we are starting out cutting those departments that are meant to address the root causes of crime whilst at the same time promising that they will be doing exactly that. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Herron. I now recognise hon

member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I want to agree with the Minister, we cannot undermine the power of sport and culture. We cannot undermine the power. We saw what it did in the Rugby World Cup, so it is very important that we must never look at it as a minor department.

So, hon Minister, just to explain the money that is going to the City of Cape Town for netball courts, R779 000. Why only to Cape Town? Because Stellenbosch is quite close by; Stellenbosch and Paarl are quite close by and Stellenbosch is one of the hubs of netball. So I just want to know why is it only limited to the City of Cape Town; and also, I mean our national team is doing exceptionally well. Last when I checked they were fourth in the world, so rugby can do a lot.

So when we speak about safe spaces we can also move out the safe places to Drakenstein and to Stellenbosch, the near areas. I am not talking about far-reaching areas, near areas to also give those people a boost.

Another important thing, Minister, I would have also wanted to see money be allocated more to the MOD Centres, because we can also then hype ...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: ... netball and other opportunities for our youth.  
Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Christians. I now recognise hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, Mr Speaker, I will not waste time. I just want to say that now that the Traditional Leaders and Khoisan Bill has been passed and signed by the President, how are they going to accommodate those extra costs? Have you engaged with the National Department? Who is going to pay for all these scores of chiefs who have now come to the fore? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: No, sjjjjt.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr P J MARAIS: I think ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Marais, please proceed.

Mr P J MARAIS: I think it is time that we get serious in this House. It is okay to laugh, but the people out there they do not laugh. They are angry; and we must see whether we budget here for what Government at national



level has already approved.

The second thing is, Minister, please, the Delft community and Bishop Lavis begged me for soccer posts. I have got quotes for a set of soccer posts. It is R20 000. You can find that money. They will erect it themselves. Let them have a nice Christmas practicing and playing soccer. Let us not dabble in things ... [Interjections.]

†Die SPEAKER: Baie dankie.

[The SPEAKER: Thank you.]

Mr P J MARAIS: ... that are unimportant.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr P J MARAIS: Please when you reply to me tell me you have got the money ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: ... to pay for R20 000 ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Your time is up, thank you.

Mr P J MARAIS: ... for the posts. Thank you. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Yes! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. I now recognise the Minister.  
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You must support him, he supported the DA.  
[Interjections.]

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Baie dankie vir elkeen se inset. Ek gaan eerstens net oor die algemeen antwoord.

Die Stad Kaapstad is die stad wat die netbaltoernooi aanbied en daarom moet die Internasionale Federasie vir Netbal fondse allokeer en ons het dit nie geprioritiseer nie, ons het dit goedgevind om nou vir hulle daardie fondse te gee om infrastruktuur reg te kry, maar ons het fondse geprioritiseer oor die hele provinsie, en ons het reeds netbalbane gebou in Mosselbaai, in Hermanus, Bredasdorp en dan ook in die Weskus. [Tussenwerpsels.]

So ons het reeds begin en dit is nie net vir die stad alleenlik nie.

Dan wil ek sê dankie vir agbare lid Bantsoen. SAFA het 'n voorlegging by die MINMEC kom doen so ek kan vir u later terugvoer gee daarvoor, want dit is vir ons 'n uitdaging oor wat presies in SAFA se geledere aangaan en, Reagen, baie dankie vir jou konstruktiewe leiding - ag, *hon member Reagen, sorry.*

Tussenwerpsels.] - vir jou konstruktiewe leiding.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you for everyone's input. Firstly I am only going to reply in general.

The City of Cape Town is the city that is hosting the netball tournament and therefore the International Netball Federation has to allocate funds and we have not prioritised that. We thought we would give them those funds now to get their infrastructure ready, but we have prioritised funds across the whole province, and we have already built netball courts in Mossel Bay, in Hermanus, Bredasdorp and then also in the West Coast. [Interjections.]

So we have already started and it is not solely for the city.

Then I want to thank hon member Bans. SAFA did a presentation at the MINMEC so I can provide feedback to you on that later, because it is a challenge to us exactly what is happening in SAFA circles and, Reagen, thank you for your constructive guidance - oh, hon member Reagen, sorry. [Interjections.] – for your constructive guidance.]

Hon member Herron, all our stakeholders, NGOs and private partnerships, is helping us with this, with the safety plan and all that we want to impact on our communities, so it is not only provincial funding, it is our good

relationships with these stakeholders that help us; and then – in Drakenstein, agb lid Christians, het ons die WoSA program, so ons is ook daar besig om die gemeenskap veilig te kry, of te maak, en dit is reeds aan die gang.

†Dan wil ek net sê dankie aan die Staande Komitee vir 'n goeie jaar, vir 'n konstruktiewe jaar, vir die positiewe insette en die manier waarop julle [Tussenwerpsels.] en ons saam kon werk.

Dan wil ek ook net sê vir elkeen 'n geseënde seisoen en koester mekaar in hierdie tyd, baie dankie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Then I just want to say thank you to the Standing Committee for a good year, for a constructive year, for the positive input and the way you [Interjections.] and us could work together.

Then I also just want to wish everyone a blessed season, and cherish each other in these times, thank you.]

†Mnr P J MARAIS: En wat van my? [Tussenwerpsels.][Gelag.]

[Mr P J MARAIS: And what about me? [Interjections.] [Laughter.]]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. [Interjections.] †Siyabulele [We thank you.] †Baie dankie. [Thank you.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Mr Speaker, on a point of order. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, you still have time. You wanted to say something?

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: I can answer, I did have a discussion with hon member Marais about Delft, and I promised not for now, we do not have the money for now, but we will have the discussion in the new year. [Interjections.] And I already promised him that. [Interjections.]

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon Minister. [Interjections.] Hon members [Interjections.] ... Order, hon members! We are now going to go for lunch. As you are all aware I have invited each of you individually, hon members, for lunch, which is the end of the year lunch for this Chamber, and on that note ... [Interjections.]

Now the House is adjourned until after lunchtime.

An HON MEMBER: What time?

The SPEAKER: We will reconvene at quarter past two. [Interjections.] Do you want 2 o'clock? We have enough time so we will convene at 2 o'clock.

[Interjections.] Thank you. Please remain standing.

[Business of the House was suspended at 12:41 and resumed at 14:00].

[Hon member Philander took the Chair as Temporary Chairperson.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please do take your seats, hon members.

[Applause.] Thank you for the warm welcome. As we reconvene, members, we will now afford the Secretary to read the next Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Vote 8, Human Settlements - Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 6 - 2019].

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Can we settle down, hon members. Thank you very much. I now recognise the honourable member, Minister Tertuis Simmers.

†Die MINISTER VAN MENSLIKE NEDERSETTINGS: Dankie Voorsitter, en geluk dat u nou die vergadering moet lei tot uitvaltyd toe, kan ek aflei.

[The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you, Chairperson, and congratulations that you have to lead the sitting until adjournment, I can gather.]

Hon Chairperson, hon Premier, hon fellow Cabinet members, hon Leader of the Opposition, hon members of the House, colleagues and guests. As I am

pleased to table the Adjustments Estimates for Vote 8, which is Human Settlements, I do so reflecting on a well-known and historical speech which was delivered by Theodore Roosevelt on 23 April 1910.

I am going to quote a portion of this well-known quote for you, because it is so relevant in the time which we as a country find ourselves in, and he said:

“It is not the critic who counts; not the man who points out how the strong man stumbles, or where the doer of deeds could have done them better. The credit belongs to the man who is actually in the arena, whose face is marred by dust and sweat and blood; who strives valiantly; who errs, who comes short again and again, because there is no effort without error and shortcoming; but who does actually strive to do the deeds; who knows great enthusiasms, the great devotions; who spends himself in a worthy cause; who at the best knows in the end the triumph of high achievement, and who at the worst, if he fails, at least fails while daring greatly...”

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: This Western Cape Government has been and still remains at the forefront of daring greatly to ensure a better quality of life for all its residents.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

†Die MINISTER VAN MENSLIKE NEDERSETTINGS: Ons kan nie dieselfde sê vir die Nasionale Regering nie, natuurlik. [Tussenwerpsel.]

[The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: We cannot say the same to the National Government, of course. [Interjection.]]

An HON MEMBER: Mumbo jumbo!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: This is demonstrated in our commitment to accelerating Human Settlements delivery while promoting social inclusion through the development of integrated resilient and sustainable human settlements in an open society. Madam Chair, our settlements are and will continue to reflect citizens living together in one community, regardless of their colour, creed, language, culture or sexual orientation. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: We are building true and cohesive communities in the Western Cape for the country in this country but also one community at a time. Since the commencement of my tenure as Minister exactly six months ago, I stated that I will be focusing on three radical drivers throughout my term of office and just as a recap these three are; one, radical acceleration of housing opportunities; secondly, radical implementation of innovative solutions and lastly an integrated approach to human settlements. Our use of the term “radical” refers to a significant



innovative push towards getting our people into housing opportunities along with ownership through title deeds as in both instances we are creating a better life for all of our people while restoring the dignity of our residents, given our past injustices. [Interjections.]

†Die ADJUNKHOOFSWEEP (DA): Luister! Luister! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Listen! Listen! [Interjections.]]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Chair - †Ag, hulle wil in elk geval nie luister nie, hulle kan maar hulle mond hou. [Oh, they don't want to listen anyway, they can remain silent.]

Madam House Chair, it does, however, not stop there. As we are ensuring that our people are living in better locations, in better areas and under remarkably improved conditions, this is all occurring at an accelerated pace so that our residents and the immediate families are able to benefit. We are experiencing this integration on a daily basis as people from different areas are all moving together to establish and form new communities. We have many examples, where integration is currently happening. If it is going to be an effort to travel then just drop in at Forest Village where earlier this morning 85 beneficiaries moved in and noting that it is also World Disability Day, 34 of the 85 that moved in this morning are persons with disability.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: By the end of tomorrow another 96 people would have moved in, bringing the total people with disability over the two days moving into this area to 108 over the two days.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Well done!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: That is integration [Applause] [Interjections.] And if you are able to travel, like your hon Leader of the Opposition... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order members!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: And it is not even that far. Drive into Bredasdorp where you will see further examples of our projects ... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member, Minister Simmers, will you please take your seat? Can I please ask the members on my left to contain yourselves; you will have the opportunity to the mic. Please give the Minister an opportunity to finish his speech. Please go ahead, Minister. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Chair, I understand that they cannot contain their excitement so it is fine. [Laughter.] Our flagship first development in the Belhar CBD is another such example,

Madam Chair, where you can once again go and experience for yourself members, instead of just each time pointing out failures, go and see true integration happening in a sustainable manner.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

†Die MINISTER VAN MENSLIKE NEDERSETTINGS: In al hierdie gevalle, net soos met al ons projekte, sal u ons almal hier in hierdie Huis 'n mengelmoes van mense vind wat saam in een gemeenskap woon; ware integrasie waar die gemeenskappe ook toegang het tot ekonomiese geleenthede of opkomende ekonomiese geleenthede, die publieke vervoerstelsel, die gedeelte wat nog werk, asook alle staatsgeriewe soos skole, klinieke en biblioteke wat normaalweg in 'n baie nabye radius is.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In all of these cases, as with all our projects, one will find all of us in this House a mixture of people living together in one community; true integration where the communities also have access to economic opportunities or emerging economic opportunities, the public transport system, the part that still functions, as well as state facilities such as schools, clinics and libraries that are normally within a close radius.]

Integration is happening throughout this province, Madam Chair, all in an

effort to address the apartheid spatial legacy... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It is not spatial integration [Inaudible.] Reversal of apartheid spatial... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: But I am happy, I am hearing what the Leader of the Opposition is saying, he should be wise, together with the Opposition to remember the City of Cape Town is not the Western Cape. There are 30 municipal areas which form the Western Cape.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Yes.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: So go and take a 360 degree view before you want to argue what you are arguing at the moment.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Integrated [Inaudible.] what about [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Chair... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order members! Minister, can I ask you to please address the Chair. Hon members, please contain yourselves! Please go ahead, Minister. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: There is an objection. [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Chair, I am going to focus on the Adjustments Budget, which is why we are here today.

[Interjections.]

The adjustment we have received is just over R122 million, which is an increase of 5,7% when measured against our Main Budget. This includes R3,415 million for emergency housing. The National Department of Human Settlements allocated a portion of an unallocated Schedule 7 Grant to our province during July 2019 following the devastating fire damage to houses in Wupperthal, which is in the Cederberg/Clanwilliam area.

Revenue of R34,5 million from the 2018/19 cycle was retained and approved for bulk and related infrastructure not funded from the Urban Settlement Development Grant (USDG). This includes Penhill and Ithemba farms as well as the Belhar CBD and provision of R10 million for innovative housing solutions in George is also part of this amount.

An HON MEMBER: George?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Chairperson... †Ja, George. Het jy 'n probleem daarmee? [Yes, George. Do you have a problem with that?]

An HON MEMBER: No.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Chairperson, during his delivery in the House last week, Minister Maynier highlighted the dire state of our economy. I do not have to repeat it as we are all fully aware of the current situation given the stats that was released half an hour ago. I would, however, like to quote one aspect of his address where he stated and I am quoting him:

“What should be going up is going down and what should be going down is going up in South Africa.”

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Yes.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: This is quite significant, particularly for us as a delivery component of the Western Cape Government. This is part of the reason why I have visited and engaged a wide variety of stakeholders across all districts and local municipalities; 30 to be in total. The message that I have given to them is clear and concise, †en julle kan maar gaan opvolg. [and you are welcome to go and follow up.]

It is not business as usual anymore, Madam Chair, but yet we need to deliver at an accelerated pace under difficult circumstances.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: So perhaps I should repeat

myself for our colleagues on this side of the House. It is not business as usual... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Yes.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...yet delivery should be accelerated under these difficult circumstances. †*Madam Chair*, soos ek verskeie distrikte besoek het en met belanghebbendes en belanghebbende groepe gepraat het, was van my kritiese vrae aan hulle:

- Eerstens, aan die munisipaliteite: watter projek of projekte is nou gereed om versnel te word binne u plaaslike munisipaliteit, want ons as die Provinsiale Regering en ek as die Minister wou verseker dat ons mense so gou as moontlik en binne die raamwerk van die wet gehelp word. Moet nie na projekte kyk wat nog lank in die pyplyn af is nie en ons wil veral deur hierdie projekte wat julle moet identifiseer, bejaardes, gestremdes, huise waar kinders die ouer-rol of hoofrol moet speel en dié wat nou al langer as 15 jaar of meer op die waglys is en wag, sowel as ons agterplaasbewoners graag help, so verseker dat julle projekte kan materialiseer binne 'n vyfjaar-termyn vir lewering. [Tussenwerpsels.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Madam Chair, as I visited various districts and spoke to stakeholders and interested parties, some of my critical questions to them were:

- Firstly, to the municipalities: which project or projects are now ready

to be accelerated within your local municipality, because we as the Provincial Government and I as the Minister wanted to ensure that our people are assisted as soon as possible and within the framework of the law. Do not look at projects that are still far down the pipeline, and we want to especially through these projects that you have to identify, help the aged, handicapped, houses where children play the parent role or main role and those who have already been on the waiting list for more than 15 years, as well as backyard dwellers, so ensure that your projects can materialise within a five year term for delivery. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: But there is nothing new about that.

†Die MINISTER VAN MENSLIKE NEDERSETTINGS: Terwyl ons die toekennings eweredig oor alle distrikte versprei was die klem geplaas daarop dat hul projekte absorpsiekapasiteit moet hê. Amper sê ek *member* Moron, *member* Marran.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: While we spread the allocations evenly across all districts the emphasis was placed on their projects' absorption capacity. I almost said member Moron, member Marran.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Marran.



The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: For those who took the time and made the effort to read through the 2019 Overview of the Adjusted Provincial and Municipal Infrastructure Investment document, †dan sal u daarvan bewus wees dat aan die Weskus, en ek het nou gehoor wat u sê *member* Moron, op die Weskus ontvang hulle 'n addisionele R64,1 miljoen. [Gelag.] Sorry. [then you will be aware that at the West Coast, and I have now heard what you had said *member* Moron, on the West Coast they receive an additional R64,1 million. [Laughter.]]

An HON MEMBER: Chair... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: This brings the Provincial Government's total commitment towards Human Settlement's infrastructure ... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member, Minister Simmers! Yes, hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, on a point of order, I do not... I have been looking through the list of names and surnames of members in the House. I do not recall there being a member Moron in the House. [Laughter.] Can the honourable MEC please withdraw the remarks, and the way in which he has referred to, I do not know to whom he is referring to but there is no member Moron in the House.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you member Sayed. Minister?

†Die MINISTER VAN MENSLIKE NEDERSETTINGS: In oorsig is dit tekortkominge, me die Voorsitter. Ek dink nie ek sien 'n moroon nie; ek sien morone, maar verskoning member Marran. Dankie. Waar was ek nou weer?

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In oversight it is shortcomings, Ms the Chairperson. I do not think I'm seeing a moron; I see morons, but my apology, member Marran. Thank you. Where was I again?]

This brings the Provincial Government's total commitment towards Human Settlements infrastructure to a R149,9 million for 2019/2020. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members! Minister! Yes, hon member Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Madam Chair, is it parliamentary for the MEC to refer to members of Parliament as morons because now he spoke about morons in the plural. [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: He must withdraw.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): He must withdraw that.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Minister Simmers, was that deliberately or intentionally?

An HON MEMBER: No!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Will you then kindly withdraw?

†Die MINISTER VAN MENSLIKE NEDERSETTINGS: Voorsitter, ek sal die lid aanraai om 'n woordeboek te gaan raadpleeg, dan gaan hy sien wat die woord “moroon” beteken. Dankie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

Die drie groot projekte wat hieruit gaan baat is Riebeek-Kasteel wat R24,1 miljoen ontvang; Lutzville R24,1 miljoen, en Lambertsbaai R19 miljoen. Kleiner toelae wat ook onder andere aangewend is, is in Velddrif teen R7,7 miljoen en Malmesbury R6,9 miljoen. [Tussenwerpsels.]

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Chair, I would like to advise the member to consult a dictionary, then he will see what the word “moron” means. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The three large projects that are going to benefit from this are Riebeek Kasteel that will receive R24,1 million; Lutzville R24,1 million, and Lamberts Bay R19 million. Lesser allocations amongst others that were

applied were in Velddrif at R7,7 million and Malmesbury R6,9 million.

[Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: Hon Speaker...

†Die MINISTER VAN MENSLIKE NEDERSETTINGS: Voorsitter, op hulle beurt word R88,4 miljoen vir behuising aangewend in die Overberg distrik.

[The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Chair, in turn R88,4 million is used for housing in the Overberg district.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Minister! Hon member Lili, are you rising on a point of order?

Mr A LILI: On you, hon Speaker, I do not understand you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Come again?

Mr A LILI: I do not understand you, hon Speaker.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: What is the problem, member Lili?

Mr A LILI: I mean there was a question we raised in relation to the member that insulted the members. Instead of you ordering that member to actually withdraw what he said, you are asking on what basis? On what basis hon Speaker, are you asking? [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Lili.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: It is not unparliamentary. It is not unparliamentary.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Lili, I hear you; can you please take your seat? On the first question I heard the member withdrawing in Afrikaans if I am not mistaken.

An HON MEMBER: No, he was not.

An HON MEMBER: Correct.

Mr A LILI: No!

An HON MEMBER: He did not.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, he did.

Mr A LILI: No!

The PREMIER: Check Hansard. We will check Hansard. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Let us refer to Hansard and get back to you. Please proceed, Minister.

†Die MINISTER VAN MENSLIKE NEDERSETTINGS: Dankie Voorsitter. Om myself weer te herhaal, op hulle beurt word R88,4 miljoen vir behuising aangewend in die Overberg-distrik. Hiervan is R16,1 miljoen en R13,5 miljoen onderskeidelik vir Bredasdorp en Hawston waar topstrukture aangebring sal word. Die Tuinroete-distrik ontvang 'n inspuiting van 27,2%. Dit is 'n styging vanaf R367,3 miljoen tot R467,1 miljoen. 'n Paar voorbeelde wat hier genoem kan word is die Thembaletu-uitbreiding wat R15,3 miljoen sal ontvang vir topstrukture; R15 miljoen vir dienste op die Metro-gronde in George, terwyl meer as R14 miljoen vir die Xolweni-, Bossiesgif-, sowel as die Ebenhaezer-ontwikkeling in die Bitou munisipale area gaan.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you, Chair. To repeat myself, in turn R88,4 million for housing used for housing in the Overberg district. Of this, R16,1 million and R13,5 million respectively for Bredasdorp and Hawston where top structures will be built. The Garden Route district receives an injection of 27,2%. This is an increase from R367,3 million to R467,1 million. A few examples that can be mentioned here are the Thembaletu extension that will receive R15,3 million for top structures; R15 million for services on Metro grounds in George, while more than R14 million will go to the Xolweni, Bossiesgif, as well as the Ebenhaezer development in the Bitou municipal area.]

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor-hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In the Central Karoo district - †dankie [thank you] Lulama, that is for you. [Laughter.] In the Central Karoo district and from a social infrastructure perspective the provincial allocation for 2019/20 almost doubled from R45,2 million to R80,8 million. That is a 70,8% increase in this Adjustments Budget. The significant increase can be attributed to an additional R37 million from the Human Settlements Development Grant (HSDG) allocation that has been appropriated towards the construction of top structures in Beaufort West.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: This allocation bodes well to address the need for adequate housing in the Central Karoo district.

An HON MEMBER: That is good.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Chair, if we are to deliver sustainable developments then the use of Alternative Building Technology (ABT) can no longer be ignored. Earlier I said that it is not business as usual, yet delivery should be accelerated, and ABT addresses the cost factor, the time-saving factor, while also protecting our environment.

At the same time our most deserving residents are benefiting but at an

accelerated pace. We are coming to the end of a decade and cannot allow ourselves to be stuck in the past. Instead, we ought to embrace the future if we are to continue being successful and creating opportunities at an accelerated pace.

Just before I conclude, let me mention the following, Madam House Chair. For the current financial year, we are the only province that has spent more than 50% and to be exact nearly 60% of its allocations on the creation of housing opportunities. The next best performing provinces are Mpumalanga and the Eastern Cape, both on 48%. It is for this reason that just last week the National Minister of Human Settlements and Water and Sanitation, Lindiwe Sisulu, is quoted in *The Citizen* article saying the following:

“Redirected money, which was taken from five provinces, has been allocated to provinces where they have been doing a good job of meeting their housing construction commitments. Those provinces are the Western Cape, Eastern Cape, KwaZulu Natal and Mpumalanga.”

We will continue to be daring, Madam House Chair, by being innovative as we remain committed to assisting our residents throughout the province. We intend not to return to societies of old. Instead, the establishment of integrated, safe, resilient and sustainable communities will not only be continued, but accelerated across our province.

My challenge today to all members in this House, is to become an enabler by



encouraging your constituencies and constituents to be law-abiding citizens, to register to become beneficiaries of our projects and refrain from illegal land occupation and protests that hinders and hampers the actual delivery of services as these illegal activities only cause delays to and for those that should be benefiting from this Government.

†Baie dankie. [Thank you.] [Applause]

†Die TYDELIKE VOORSITTER: Baie dankie, agb Minister Simmers. Ek erken nou die agbare lid Andile Lili. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Minister Simmers. I now recognise the hon member Andile Lili. [Interjections.]]

†Die MINISTER VAN GEMEENSKAPSVEILIGHEID: Mooi praat, mooi praat!

[Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Speak well, speak well!

[Interjections.]]

An HON MEMBER: Oh, the President, the President. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: Thanks very much. Indeed, it is a shame on the Government of the Devil's Alliance to claim easy victories about the Western Cape that all of us sitting here, even on the gallery, knows, it is in a bad state in terms of service delivery. [Interjections.] Madam Chair, South Africa prides itself

with having one of the most progressive constitutions. [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili, will you please take your seat?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Chairperson, I just want to understand if the member is referring to a political party in this House when he refers to the Devil Alliance?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili?

Mr A LILI: Yes, I am referring to a political party.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Well, in that case, on a point of order, can I please ask that you ask the member to withdraw because there is no such party. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: To whom? There is no Devil's Alliance here. I will never apologise. I am sorry. You are wasting my time. Since the inception of an inclusive democracy the ANC-led Government has prided itself on ensuring that... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili, please take your seat.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Chair... [Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Chair, he is wasting my time.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili, can you please take your seat and afford the Deputy Chief Whip...

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Chair, I just want to understand, is it parliamentary for a member to speak outside of his bench? [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: You are wasting our time!

Mr A LILI: Since the inception of an inclusive democracy the ANC-led Government has prided itself on ensuring that it constantly works towards protecting the rights of its citizens. Madam Chair, Section 21 of the Constitution states that everyone has the right to housing, yet the DA-led Government, as it can be seen with these Adjusted Estimates, is failing to provide citizens of Saldanha Bay with housing.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Only Saldanha?

Mr A LILI: I wish to provide context for the House, the Pongweni PHP Project in Middelpoort, Saldanha, was approved in 2009 for 1401 plots. It is important to highlight that it was under the rule of the ANC... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] Tell them.

Mr A LILI: ...that 551 units were built during that time, phase 1. When the DA Government came into power the project was brought to a halt for various reasons such as apparent lack of funds and the other deliberate mistruths like illegal occupants.

The Department continues to fail to take accountability and insists on playing the blame game and insists that funds are allocated at a national level. I wish to highlight that these are all serviced sites, thus meaning that the only thing that is needed is top structure and infrastructure. There are over 800 houses that still need to be built. The beneficiaries are asking for answers and this Department keeps on feeding them lies. At least when I visited them again, I will be able to show them what it contains in these Budget Adjustments.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: You are very ill-informed about housing [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: No. [Inaudible.]

Mr A LILI: Unfortunately I was there with my feet. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: You do not want to take responsibility.

Mr A LILI: There are over 800 houses that still... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili, my apologies, can

you please take your seat? Hon members on the left and on the right, will you please refrain from talking back and forth, you are disrupting the member. The Deputy Chief Whip, on the question of the member stepping out of his bench, I believe it is a space-issue. It is not that the member wants to exit his bench completely so we will now, please members, afford the hon member Lili the opportunity.

Mr A LILI: I so wish you are counting my time, Madam Chair. Money that could have been used to finish the Pongweni PHP project is being used for other non-important things. The Department continues to reclassify, redirect funds for various sub-programmes. However, none of these reclassifications, redirections speak to addressing real issues on the ground. Can we also look at the contribution of poor housing and the influx of informal settlements to the crime situation in the province? The Premier's R1 billion Safety Plan should also look into housing provision.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: R1,3 million. [Laughter.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order members!

Mr A LILI: Accessible roads and adequate lighting, especially in those top ten murder precincts in the province. The people of Marikana are protesting on a daily basis because they do not have services. They are forced to live under inhuman conditions with no water and sanitation.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Ja, you put them there.

Mr A LILI: They are still forced to use the bucket-system, the porta potty. That is your toilet, the porta potty. Jissis! [Laughter.] The Premier has met with them and made many empty promises. I wish; I had hoped that it could be addressed through these Adjusted Estimates. Madam Chair, the Department is getting an additional R122,3 million; R84 million of this is rollovers that were not used for the Provincial Emergency Housing Grant to be utilised to provide temporary shelter, assistance to households affected by fire and storm damages in the Cape Metro. Thousands of our people fall victim to fire hazards and flooding every year. So far a lot of money not being used is a cause of serious concern.

Madam Chair, the continued outcry of housing opportunities near places of opportunity, should receive all the necessary attention it deserves. The unwillingness of the Democratic Alliance to make provisions for low cost and affordable housing, as well as social housing near places of opportunities, should be condemned. The battle for the Tafelberg site to be used for housing for the poor went to the High Court last week, in which Judge Gamble reminded the DA - which is the Devil's Alliance - that it has not built social housing near places of opportunity. In the past ten years... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili, hon member Lili, can I please caution you from name calling. I believe there is no political party in

this House as the Devil's Alliance.

Mr A LILI: But... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Not "but", hon member.

Mr A LILI: It seems as if you are biased now.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No, I am not, hon member.

Mr A LILI: When I am talking about Devil's Alliance I am... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili... [Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: What Rule?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: There is no such party.

Mr A LILI: What Rule did I break?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: There is no such party as the Devil's Alliance.

Mr A LILI: What Rule did I break, Chair?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Will you please proceed with your address?

Mr A LILI: Okay. Through these adjustments we had hoped to see provisions made to address the above concerns. However, the DA has not cared about the poor. This MEC is out to tarnish the legacy of the little good things that MEC Madikizela did in that Department. I disagree with you on many things... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order members!

Mr A LILI: ...especially on the porta potties. In the midst of all those differences, he still acknowledged that the majority of the population and those on the waiting list reside in the Metro. This is not to say there is no need for housing in other regions, but the focus needs to be in the Metro. This MEC who is followed by a cloud of allegations of stealing electricity in George, is using this Department's budget to clean his image of R10 million for housing development, has since been set aside to finance George Municipality. [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili, please take your seat, member. Deputy Chief Whip?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Chair. Chair, I am rising on Rule 59.2 and I quote:



“Any member who wishes to bring any improper or unethical conduct on the part of any member to the attention of this House may only do so by way of a substantive motion.”

I ask that you please ask the member to withdraw his statement unless he can substitute that with a substantive motion.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Deputy Chief Whip. Hon member Lili, will you please withdraw your statement?

Mr A LILI: I still maintain it is alleged and everybody in this House knows it is alleged, that we... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: We know. We know... [Inaudible.]

Mr A LILI: No-no-no, I will not. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members!

Mr A LILI: I will not, I will not. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili!

Mr A LILI: ...for as long as the people of this House... [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili, hon member Lili, I am speaking now.

Mr A LILI: You must speak, not him!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You are saying you mentioned alleged.

Mr A LILI: Yes.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: We will refer to Hansard and revert back.

Mr A LILI: Yes.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Can I please ask you to conclude?

Mr A LILI: Okay.

An HON MEMBER: But listen. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member!

Mr A LILI: This MEC who is followed by a cloud of allegations...

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili, hon member Lili, I

ask you to please conclude.

Mr A LILI: Yes.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You cannot repeat yourself.

Mr A LILI: I am not repeating myself, but you are interrupting me - of stealing electricity in George, he is using the Department's budget to clean his [Inaudible 00:34:45.] Yes. [Interjection - speaking simultaneously.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili, your time is up. Please take your seat.

Mr A LILI: ...the initiative for innovative emergency housing solution... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili, your time is up. Please take your seat.

Mr A LILI: None of the other municipalities... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili, please take your seat!

Mr A LILI: ...got the same special attention of the MEC.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): On a point of order... [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: It is wrong for the public purpose to use ... [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): On a point of order, on a point of order...

Mr A LILI: But you see, you know, on a point of order... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili, I did not recognise you. Please take your seat.

Mr A LILI: On a point of order to you... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I did not recognise you, hon member.

Mr A LILI: No-no-no!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili, take your seat.

Mr A LILI: No-no-no-no, on a point of order here.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please take your seat!

Mr A LILI: No, I am raising now my... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: The Chief Whip was on her feet. Please take your seat.

Mr A LILI: I am raising a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please take your seat, hon member Lili.

Mr A LILI: No, you are rude. No-no-no-no. [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please take your seat!

Mr A LILI: Allow me to make a point of order. [Interjections.] Allow me to make a point of order.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: What is your point of order, hon member Lili?

An HON MEMBER: You are out of order. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, I ask that you name this member for improper conduct in this House.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please take your seat, hon member Lili.

Mr A LILI: You are biased, you are biased!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili, please take your seat.

[Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: [Inaudible - mic off - speaking simultaneously.] ...in this House, can you not be biased on the other side of the House. You seem to be biased. You must read your Rules. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I recognise the Chief Whip.

Mr A LILI: No!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Chairperson. That member's conduct is completely out of order. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: The same as yours. The same as yours!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): And I ask that you to call him to order and if not... [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: The same as yours!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...that you request that the member be named. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Can I address you, hon Speaker?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Go ahead Chief Whip. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: And the Chief Whip was also not [Inaudible.]

Mr A LILI: You are always... [Inaudible.]

†Die HOOFSWEEP (ANC): Kalm asseblief, *comrades!*

[The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Calm please, comrades!]

An HON MEMBER: You are always angry!

Mr A LILI: Angry?

An HON MEMBER: Always!

Mr A LILI: Chief Whip, I do not know what is wrong.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili, please contain yourself.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chief Whip, I realise that there seems to be tensions that are up but in that, Chairperson, I would like you to make a ruling based on what you have made your observations on. I am raising this,

because the Chief Whip has just arisen and as the Chief Whip summarises the input she then says: “I will suggest that you name the member.” And as I am standing here I believe that you are the only Chairperson appointed or designated to preside over the proceedings of the House and therefore, for somebody else to actually tell you what to do, is really not necessary and uncalled for. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, member. We will indeed refer to Hansard and revert back to the House. Thank you very much.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, yes.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Hon Chair, I rise on a point of order. I mean, this is very, very serious and you referring to Hansard when the message that is coming from a member is not very clear. The member clearly is casting aspersions on the integrity of the Chairperson and everybody heard that. That is completely unacceptable.

Mr A LILI: On a point of order... [Inaudible - mic not switched on.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Do you see what I mean? I would like the Chairperson to consult the Table so that... [Interjections.]



An HON MEMBER: There is a point of order.

Mr A LILI: A point of order, Chair.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: So that you can make a ruling in this regard.

Mr A LILI: A point of order, Chair, I am telling you now the Rule [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: The behaviour of this member is completely unacceptable. [Interjection.]

Mr A LILI: Chair, a point of order!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: He is casting aspersions... [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: A point of order, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order member!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: He is casting aspersions.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order hon member Lili. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: I rise on a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please take your seat, hon member Lili.

An HON MEMBER: No, man, there are too many Chairs.

An HON MEMBER: The Chair can make a ruling.

Mr A LILI: But he stood without being recognised and you recognised me once.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili, you are out of order.

Mr A LILI: No, you are biased. You are biased.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please proceed, Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Then he must be thrown out!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Surely, Chairperson, this behaviour cannot be tolerated.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I recognise hon Minister Fernandez.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Chairperson, in the interest of getting on with the business of the day, there are two issues. Rule 43 says, the precedence of the Presiding Officer or Chairperson, whilst you are speaking an honourable member cannot be sitting down and shouting at you; and then you move to Rule 45, where a member can be ordered to withdraw if his behaviour or her behaviour is in direct contrast to what is required. What we are seeing playing out here is a complete contempt for the Chair and the Rules of this House. So please be guided accordingly, but I do think our members should go and read their Rules and manage themselves. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Minister. Hon member Kama?

Mr M KAMA: In actual fact, Chair, I want to agree with the last speaker to say that you have made a ruling.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

Mr M KAMA: The actual contempt of the Chair is them trying to change the ruling you have made. You have made a ruling that you are going to check Hansard and revert to the matter. Thanks.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you hon Chairperson, I would like to raise a further point of order which says that no member may reflect on the honour or competence of the holder of an office whose removal from such office is dependent on a decision from the House. The hon member has accused you of bias, which I believe is in contravention of this Rule.

An HON MEMBER: No, the Speaker has made a ruling!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you Chief Whip. Hon members, for the sake of proceeding I will stand by the ruling that I will refer to Hansard and this matter will come back to the House. We will now recognise the hon Derrick America.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, House Chair. There is lots of tension in the House. House Chair, yesterday I headed my speech with a reference to a song by Bob Dylan. [Laughter.]

Today I will begin my speech with a reference to a singer called Pete Seeger, a song that was made famous in 1963 with a song of *Little Boxes*, and many of us might know the song and I will entertain you with my singing abilities, it says:

“Little boxes on the hillside

Little boxes made of ticky tacky

Little boxes on the hillside

Little boxes all the same

There's a green one and a pink one

And a blue one and a yellow one

And they are all made..."

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili, are you rising on a point of order? Hon member America, will you please take your seat?

Mr A LILI: Hon Speaker, is it parliamentary for a member to sing in the House?

An HON MEMBER: Well, they will do that, do not worry.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: That is not a point of order, hon member.

Mr A LILI: I am asking, Chair. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please take your seat. [Interjections.]

Mr A LILI: Is it parliamentary for him to sing in the House? [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please take your seat, hon member Lili.

Mr A LILI: Alright.

Mr D AMERICA: So, the point is, House Chair, the context of the song is that since the dawn of democracy in 1994 we had an ANC Government that developed norms and standards for building houses for our people that resembles little boxes and they all look the same and they all have different colours and if you go into the rural areas you will see every rural area in South Africa or in the Western Cape in particular has a Smartie-town because they are all different colours and they look the same.

So, if one looks at the Annual Performance Plan of this Department for 2019/20 and if you have gone through this you will notice that there is a concerted and a deliberate attempt by the Department to move away from the construction of houses that resemble little boxes and that the ANC affectionately refer to as RDP houses. So, House Chair, this Department, I can say, is committed to accelerated delivery of housing, while promoting social cohesion through the development of an integrated and sustainable human settlements in an open society. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Where is this going to?

Mr D AMERICA: Read your Annual Report. You never come to Committee meetings; and it seems to promote settlements that offer good basic and socio-economic services to our people. [Interjection.]

The Department of Human Settlements led by Minister Tertuis Simmers has committed itself to delivering housing opportunities and restoring the dignity

of our people, including those living in informal settlements and backyard dwellers across the province. With the constant moving of people into the province resulting in the ever-increasing informal settlements, it remains a challenge for this Department. To that end, we must commend the Department for being responsive to the needs of the most vulnerable and impoverished people of our province. The Department has diligently championed a number of successes and the three priority areas that were identified by the Minister, being directed to, are the upgrading of informal settlements, increasing affordable housing and prioritising housing to the most deserving poor people including military veterans in relation to the allocation of those houses.

We need to acknowledge the ongoing challenge and the updating of the beneficiary databases of our municipalities, the Department employed innovative ways through technology in dealing with the challenge and I have no doubt that the preliminary results show great promise and will greatly benefit the communities of the Western Cape.

House Chair, I support the Department of Human Settlements Adjusted Appropriation Budget for this particular financial year. Furthermore we are pleased with the Department's commitment to go above and beyond its call of duty and to show that the Western Cape does not only deliver top structures but it has prioritised bulk services. Service delivery to this Department is a priority and service delivery particularly in housing has to be fast-tracked. People on the ground are demanding services, they are demanding houses and

they do not care who delivers those houses and where the blockages are, whether it is National Government or municipalities, they want houses.

We cannot sleep well at night knowing that so many of our people are in need of a roof over their heads. We dare not sit back and be complacent. “No action” can be seen by the people as reflection on our Government. We do not falter and disappoint them. We need to condemn the disruption of service delivery to the most deserving beneficiaries as those criminal elements delay the completion of housing projects.

By doing so, we will turn the tide against social ills and the unemployment rate that leads to crime in the country and in our province in particular. The Government society... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: A lot of experience in that Department.

Mr D AMERICA: The Government’s whole society approach, we need to have a paradigm shift in terms of how we think about housing and how we move away from this dependency mode of our people that Government must provide and Government must build houses. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Portable toilets are... [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, hon member America, will you please take your seat.



Mr L L MVIMBI: Who must provide?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, we cannot make a mockery of these proceedings, and I do not know if you are taking chances because I am in the Chair. Hon member Lili, you are in contravention of Rule 40. By your behaviour you are interrupting the speaker. Can I please ask you to refrain from doing so.

Mr A LILI: Can I say... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili, I did not recognise you. Please do take your seat. Hon member America, please proceed.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, House Chair. What I was saying, House Chair, is that we need to have a paradigm shift.

Mr A LILI: Order Chair, on a point of order.

Mr D AMERICA: We need to move away from this notion that Government ...  
[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili, what is your point of order?

Mr A LILI: No, Chair, there are things that I do not understand about you, in

your chairing... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: What is your point of order, hon member Lili?

Mr A LILI: I need a clarity on you, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: What is your point of order?

Mr A LILI: No, Chair, how you treated me, whilst I was talking, they were howling.

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

†n AGBARE LID: Ja!

[An HON MEMBER: Yes!]

Mr A LILI: And it seems as if you are biased, Chair, and that is really out of order for you, Chair. That is out of order for you, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili, please take your seat.

Mr A LILI: No! They were howling at me. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Chairperson, again the hon member Lili has reflected on your competence as a holder of office, which is in my view, and I am certain others would share my view, that would be in contravention of the Rules... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Which Rule?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): And I would ask that you please consider this. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Rule 62.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): 62.

Mr A LILI: What about clarity?

An HON MEMBER: We want clarity.

Mr A LILI: Chair... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Chief Whip, we will revert back. Hon member Lili, please take your seat. I will now ask hon member America to proceed.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, House Chair. What I was saying, House Chair, is that we as members of this august House and engaging with our communities, we need to reorientate our people and move away from the notion that Government must provide everything and we are one of the few countries in the world that provides free houses to people and so we need to ensure that our people pay for services. If they get a free house, they must pay for electricity. They must pay for their services, but nonetheless, House Speaker, the Standing Committee on Human Settlements has consistently engaged with the Department to do things differently and the Minister and his Department has committed themselves that they will usher in a new approach towards the delivery of houses, and we are pleased that we as a Standing Committee always receive their full cooperation. The Minister's leadership is vital for creating housing opportunities for all approved beneficiaries in this province.

On behalf of our Chairperson, hon member Matlhodi Maseko, who due to unforeseen circumstances cannot be here today, I wish to thank the Standing Committee members for really engaging with the Department. Furthermore, may I also express our sincerest gratitude to Minister Madikizela for the solid foundations laid over the past ten years from which we reap the benefits today. [Interjection.]

Lastly, to the outgoing HOD Mr Thando Mguli, you have led this Department with humility and together with your team of competent professionals contributed immensely to changing people's lives in the Western Cape.

[Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: You are referring to [Inaudible.]

Mr D AMERICA: To the incoming HOD Ms Jacqueline Samson, your competency and commitment to service delivery is unquestioned and unrivalled. We have no doubt that together with the Minister you will take this Department to new heights. Congratulations on your appointment.

House Chair, the DA supports this Adjustments Budget and I thank you.

[Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member America. I now recognise the hon member Makamba-Botya. [Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. I could not be here this morning because of time constraints. We only have two minutes in this House to speak so we cannot have any contributions. However, I am here now. Thank you.

At the core of apartheid spatial planning was the exclusion of black people from economic hubs and [Inaudible.] areas, that they would be cramped in the townships and commute to town every day to serve their employers and go home.

Services and infrastructure development prioritised white suburbs, cities and towns. The majority of our people in our country were excluded from the basic services like water and sanitation, electricity, housing and refuse collection services. Not much has changed in the 25 years, 25 years later, whilst the poor mostly black are still stuck in conditions they were in even in the past democracy, post democracy. Sorry. [Interjection.]

The Western Cape Human Settlements Department, through the case on the sale of Tafelberg site in Sea Point and other similar cases has displayed that it has no plans for proper social integration. Their idea of social integration is throwing black people of different cultural backgrounds in dry housing settlements in the periphery with not much access to transport, schools, and health facilities. The silence on the appalling conditions of the concentration camp called Blikkiesdorp, which was meant to be a temporary relocation centre, and various so-called temporary relocation centres that have become home of our people, is appalling.

The situation is even worse for rural communities who have been treated as stepchildren of all Government structures. There are high numbers of farm evictions and this report does not specify how this will be kept and what provisions are there for families who get kicked off farms. They are never included in the budget whatsoever. Farmworkers' children end up dropping out of school... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, can I please ask you to

conclude.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Women find themselves highly dependent on abusive men because of the only source of security they have. We must be a government that is always on the side of the poor.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, Chairperson. Chairperson, I have no objection to the proposed Adjustments Budget, but I do want to point out to our Government that if they regard Forest Village and the two Bredasdorp housing projects as evidence of spatial integration then we have a deep, deep, deep problem with this Government. Forest Village and Bredasdorp are the epitome of developing the apartheid spatial form. They are built on the urban peripheries in both the City of Cape Town and Bredasdorp and if this Safety Plan is to succeed, Chairperson, then you are going to have to address the Group Areas Act and the apartheid spatial form. You cannot only do it with social services and Boots on the Ground. And finally, just to complete hon member America's song: "There is a pink one and a blue one and a green one and a yellow one." It may not be the colour of the houses built in Bredasdorp, but they are little boxes. [Laughter.] [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Herron. I recognise the hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I am not going to talk.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You decline your opportunity. Thank you. Hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Speaker. I want to say that I want the Minister please to have a look at Morning Star Durbanville houses. There is more than 150 houses built, beautiful houses standing vacant for more than two years now and the battle there is the NGO wants to allocate houses. Where they think they get the power from I do not know. That is a City function. Why can't this matter be settled in court as speedily as possible? Why must houses stay empty, stand empty, while people are living on the streets and in squatter camps?

The second point, I want the Department please to tell this House, if need be we must take back the houses under Communicare, expropriate those houses. Ask the Government, they took social housing and charged the people now market-related rents for former social housing.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please wrap up, hon member.

Mr P J MARAIS: And I am wrapping up, member. I want to say if you could



please do something about it, there are other legal possibilities to take those houses back and charge the people social rent... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Your time has run out, hon member Marais. Thank you very much. Please take your seat.

Mr P J MARAIS: Hell, I wish we had another Speaker. Okay, thank you. [Time expired.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member. [Interjections.] I now afford the opportunity for the hon Minister Simmers.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you, House Chair.

†Dis baie interessant om na die insette te luister maar ek wil net vir *member* Mathodi Maseko in haar afwesigheid baie dankie sê vir haar leiding met die Staande Komitee. Dankie aan u ook, *member* America wat 'n boodskap namens haar oorgedra het, maar ek wil ook aan die volle Staande Komitee dankie sê dat alle partye ingestem het tot die verskuiwings wat ons binne hierdie begroting wil maak.

*Hon member* Lili, in Afrikaans is daar 'n gesegde, “Leë blikke maak die meeste geraas”.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[It is very interesting to listen to the input but I just want to thank member Mathodi Maseko in her absence for her leadership in the Standing Committee. Thank you too, member America, who conveyed a message on her behalf, but I also want to thank the full Standing Committee that all parties agreed to the adjustments that we want to make in this budget.]

Hon member Lili, in Afrikaans there is a saying, “Empty vessels make the most noise”.]

An HON MEMBER: I did not agree [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: That is an insult.

†Die MINISTER VAN MENSLIKE NEDERSETTINGS: Dit is nie ’n *insult* nie, dit is ’n Afrikaanse gesegde. Lees hom op. Nou om die relevante punte te beantwoord.

[The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It is not an insult, it is an Afrikaans saying. Read it up. Now to reply to the relevant points.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker...

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Minister Simmers, please take your seat. Are you rising on a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, on a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members Marran and Lili, I am unable to hear your own member this side. Will you please contain yourselves.

An HON MEMBER: ...a member of the House.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, on a point of order and it is a point that I raised yesterday as well. It is not correct for the MEC to be speaking directly to the member. He is addressing the hon member Lili directly. He should speak through yourself, thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member. Hon member Lili, are you the Chair now? Minister, please refrain from referring to the members. Please address the Chair.

†Die MINISTER VAN MENSLIKE NEDERSETTINGS: Huisvoorsitter, deur u, daar is 'n Afrikaanse gesegde wat sê: "Leë blikke maak die meeste geraas."

[The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: House Chair, through you, There is an Afrikaans saying that goes, "Empty vessels make the most noise".]

†'n AGBARE LID: Ja, die meeste, meeste.

[An HON MEMBER: Yes, the most, most.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon member Lili, on the

matter of the Bongweni Project, and it was explained to you. You and I had a meeting in my office, Madam Chair, through you, Madam Chair... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: He is doing the same thing.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, he is doing it again, Chairperson.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): He said already “through the Chair.”

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): He is doing it again, he did not say “through the Chair.” That can then be referred to Hansard to see whether he said it through the Chair. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No, he did not.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, on the left and the right, please settle down. I did explicitly hear the Minister say: “through the Chair.” Thank you. Please proceed, Minister.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Can I address you, Chair?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Chair, through the Chair... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Are you rising on a point of order?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Let me answer you through the Chair.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The Project in Saldanha, Bongweni, you are correct, hon member Lili.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Minister, please take your seat.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Chair. Maybe, Chair, I really need to address you, when MEC Simmers stood up again after the ruling he again said, “member Lili, through the Chair”, and not “through you Chair.” So he made it the other way around.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): And I do not want this House to be confused by the fact that he said “through you”, but he said that after he mentioned hon member Lili’s name. So whilst we are here, we really need to be genuine in dealing with issues so that we do not really cast aspersions on one another, but we really assist this House on doing and executing its responsibilities and I would like to make another request that I address something after this

specific vote, Chair, if I am allowed.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Will that be on a point of order, hon member?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please take your seat.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Proceed, Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Madam Chair, on the Bongweni matter, hon member Lili and I did have a meeting, Madam Chair, in my office where it was explained to him that yes, it was approved that there were multi-budget years, but you are not guaranteed funding in the outer-budget cycle. But he also concurred with me during that meeting that other communities within the Saldanha area also need to be afforded a housing opportunity.

I do concur with hon member Lili, Madam Chair, that everyone has the right to adequate housing but there are due processes to ensure, in a fair manner, that everybody actually gets access to an adequate housing opportunity.

On the matter of Marikana, Madam Chair, it was reported earlier in the year through an interaction in this House, that the City of Cape Town has ensured that there is temporary toilet structures for the Marikana community but also water provision, well above the normal national ratio.

Madam Chair, now I could go to hon member Herron. Hon member Herron, if you visit the Forest Village site and the Bredasdorp site, and I have had the privilege to hand over numerous units at both sites to see the beneficiaries receive these houses, who have never actually lived in a formal structure in any form in their lives. Even this morning when I got clips from what is happening on the Forest Village site, Madam Chair, the people that were there, some of them have been waiting for more than 40 years, I think they will beg to differ what has been said here regarding the Forest Village and Bredasdorp sites, but yes, we do need to do more and that is what we will do over the next few years, Madam Chair, through you, to hon member Herron.

Hon member Chair, to the EFF regarding the matter of farmworkers, we are busy looking into this matter and in due course in the New Year we will report to this House how we will deal with that problem.

Through you, Madam Chair, to hon member Marais, [Inaudible - 01:02:67] unfortunately the Morning Star issue is in litigation and as the governing party we do respect the process of law. Unfortunately, due to the community's own interactions and seeking that route we must all await the outcome of litigation. It is unfortunately something that is out of our control.

Regarding the Communicare issues, through you, Madam Chair, I can say that the tribunal is looking into numerous cases and we are busy preparing and finalising reports which in due course will serve before Cabinet during the New Year, because as the Minister I am also concerned what is busy happening and there is only so much that I can do in that regard.

Madam House Chair, the last six months has truly been a journey of change, both for me as an individual but also for my Department, but also the 30 municipalities where I visited and people that I have interacted with, so it really has changed me over the last six months, but Madam Chair, change is also the only constant in life. That is what we all need to remember here. †Dit is al ding wat verseker is. Daar kom verandering. [That is the only thing that is assured. Change is coming.]

It is therefore on this platform in this House that I want to wish the outgoing HOD, Mr Thando Mguli, who has been the HOD for seven years of this Department, well on his journey that lies ahead. †Want dit is selde dat mense hierdie tipe toegewyde, gedissiplineerde, gefokusde staatsamptenare in die moderne era kry en om mnr Mguli aan te haal - “dis die Goddelike eerlike waarheid.”

Ek wil ook dankie sê aan ons senior bestuurspan hier teenwoordig, vir hul toegewydheid om ons mense se lewens radikaal te verander. Hulle het dit alreeds begin doen oor die afgelope tien jaar. Dit sal dit net versnel, me die Huisvoorsitter. [Tussenwerpsels.]



*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[Because it is seldom that people get these type of committed, disciplined focused civil servants in the modern era and to quote Mr Mguli - “It is God’s honest truth.”

I also want to thank our senior management team present here, for their commitment to changing our people’s lives radically. They have already started doing that over the past ten years. It will only accelerate it, Madam House Chair. [Interjections.]]

But, Madam House Chair, many of us here have families. We spend so much time serving our communities that many times our family see so little of us and I want to take this opportunity, firstly my own office staff who I see as my close family. They are sitting here in the gallery, some of them, it is their first time that they are actually attending a sitting like this, Madam Chair, and I want to thank them and they are under the leadership of my head of Ministry who is Ms Vuyolwethu Njalo. I call her Bubu for short, and I want to thank them for being just as committed as I am to radically change the people’s lives.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Minister Simmers, please take your seat.  
Hon member Lili.

Mr A LILI: Chair, I wanted clarity. I wanted clarity, Chair, from the MEC,

through you.

†n AGBARE LID: Skande!

[An HON MEMBER: Disgrace!]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: What is your point of order member Lili?

Mr A LILI: I am rising on a point of clarity. Is it parliamentary for him to only fire the only black, the only black HOD in that Government of the Devil Alliance?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili, that is not a point of order, neither a point of clarity.

Mr A LILI: The only black. If you can [Inaudible.] [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lili, you are out of order. Please take your seat.

Mr A LILI: Alright. Thanks.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Minister, please proceed.

†Die MINISTER VAN MENS LIKE NEDERSETTINGS: Agb Huisvoorsitter,

dan ook elkeen van ons in hierdie Huis het eggenotes, ons het kinders, ek self en ek wil my eggenoot en my kinders, maar ook my ouers wat nou al redelik gevorderd is in hulle jare, baie dankie sê dat hulle bereid is om my op te offer om alles te kan doen wat ek wil doen ten bate van die breër gemeenskap van die Wes-Kaap.

En laaste, maar nie die minste nie, wil ek vir elke liewe lid in hierdie Huis 'n geseënde en voorspoedige feesseisoen en Kersfees toewens. Mag ons deur hierdie tyd reflekteer waarom is ons lede van hierdie Huis want dan bepaal dit waarnatoe ons gaan na 2024.

Baie dankie.

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]*

[The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon Madam House Chair, then also, each one of us in this House has a spouse, we have children, me too, and I want to thank my wife and children, but also my parents, who are already fairly advanced in their years, that they are prepared to sacrifice me to do everything that I want to do in aid of the broader community of the Western Cape.

And lastly, but not least, I want to wish every single member in this House a blessed and prosperous festive season and Christmas. May we reflect through this period why we are members of this House because then it will determine

where we are heading to 2024. Thank you.]

†Die TYDELIKE VOORSITTER: Baie dankie, agb Minister Simmers.

[Applous.]

[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Minister Simmers.

[Applause.]] Hon member, you wanted to address the Chair?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you Chair. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order members!

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Whilst respecting the fact that you have already made a ruling on the first issue, there was a second one that came up where comrade Lili used a word - my apologies - where member Lili used a word or alleged to have been casting aspersions on your part as the Chair. If I listened carefully to what he said, hon member Lili said, “It seems like you are being biased.”

With that Chair, I want to bring your attention to the wording of the Rule, which is Rule 62, which reads as follows:

“No member may reflect on the honour or competence of the holder of an office...”

Now there was - this is a collection of words, first, and in it there is a word “may”. Now “may” has different meanings, which means he “expressed a possibility.” If one can make an example, one can say “My grandma may travel alone in that journey.” [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member...

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Chairperson, on a point of order... [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...meaning the grandma may or may not travel... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, can you... [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): And therefore, I want to bring your attention to the technicality of that clause itself as and when you are making a decision because the use of that Rule on its own is problematic. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Sit down.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): On a point of order.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It is not phrased properly and it needs to be worked on. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Sit down!

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): And therefore there is a technicality and I do not think the use of the word “may seem” from comrade Lili is actually casting an aspersion on you, like he did allegedly, and he said “it may seem”.  
[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, thank you hon member.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, I have already ruled on this. I will also apply Rule 52(e) which refers to the Chair’s discretion, which means that I keep to the ruling that was made and will not further entertain this issue. I will now allow for a two-minute break whereafter we will reconvene.

Thank you.

[Business of the House suspended at 15:04 and resumed at 15:07]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please be seated, hon members. The Secretary will read the Order.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 2, Provincial Parliament – *Western Cape*

*Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B6 – 2019].*

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: May I now call on the hon Speaker, hon Mngasela.

The SPEAKER: Hon Chairperson, thank you for the opportunity. Hon Premier, hon members. It is an abnormal situation that I must now stand this side. So, I am trying to find my feet. I wish to present the Western Cape Provincial Parliament's Adjustment Budget for the 2019/2020 Financial Year.

The Western Cape Provincial Parliament Adjustments Budget has increased by R1.5 million and that is from R202 million, including the direct charge to R203.6 million, which is an amount of R2.151 million, which was allocated to direct charges for members' gratuity payment, and an amount of R631 000 was transferred to the Department of Public Works for *ad hoc* infrastructure requirements.

The rollover from the 2018/2019 Budget will be revoted over the MTF. However, there are shifts between various Programmes and an amount of R2.19 million has been shifted from Programme 1 to cover constituency allowances for members within the Programme 4.

Hon Chairperson, there were also shifts from Programmes to cover inter alia spending such as foreign travel costs, the International Centre for Parliamentary Studies and the Sixth Parliament asset purchases, our tools of

trade and various other components.

The Sixth Parliament's legacy publication, and of course hon Chairperson, as I conclude I wish to thank the hon members, the Deputy Speaker, the Secretary to Parliament and the SMT for all the support during this year. It has been a wonderful year for me, as a new incumbent in office. They gave me their support, the Deputy Secretary and the team that you see in this Parliament.

But of course, because it is a new Parliament, members have been very cooperating in ensuring that the Parliament operates and functions as an institution. I also want to take the opportunity to thank the Minister of Finance. You know, with FAMPLA we have had so many opportunities, I think about three if not four, where we sit down and talk about what affects this institution as Parliament and of course what we sought to canvas and lobby from the Minister to support the Programmes of Parliament.

I also want to say that, the fact that the Minister appreciates that the Parliament is not just another vote, Parliament is one of the arms of state and Parliament as a legislative arm of the state, must be treated as a legislative arm of the state, equal to the Executive and the judiciary. Not to be treated like a department when it comes to how we deal with the Budget, when it comes to this particular vote. So the Minister understands that, and it has been one of those appreciations that I can say, the Minister equally afforded to this Parliament.



I must also say that I look forward to continuously working to improving these relations with both his office and the Executive in order to ensure that the existing protocols, hon Chairperson, to ensure that the Western Cape Provincial Parliament is adequately funded, in order to ensure that our business of holding the Executive to account and our business of ensuring that the money that is spent by Government, we are able to follow it, do oversight, but also make sure that this Parliament functions, because if Parliament fails the whole Government fails. Because Government succeeds when Parliament is doing its job.

If Parliament is not doing its job, Government will fail, and the people will suffer. So that is why we need to encompass as part of our mandate, the element of capacitating members, capacitating the workers of Parliament in order to capacitate also committees; in order to ensure the work of committees is done as it should, because Parliament without committees is not Parliament.

There is no Parliament without the work that is done in the engine, called the committee. So, hon Chairperson, that is it from my side. Thank you very much. Thank you, hon members. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I must say, you are the only Speaker that has so far, you are the only Speaker that have actually received applause from both sides of the House. So that means there is something very good that you are doing. I have observed that.

Now we are going to allow hon Petronella Lekker [Interjections.].

†UNksz P Z LEKKER: Enkosi Sihlalo,

[Ms P Z LEKKER: Thank you, Speaker.]

†As I rise to engage on the proposed Budget Adjustments, allow me to say that economic and social wellbeing of staff members is very important. In the previous Financial Year, the Western Cape Provincial Parliament embarked on a functional enhancement study and thousands of rands were spent on this study.

With this in mind, I am worried as to how will the decrease in the Adjusted Appropriation have in the implementation of the findings in the study. Moreover, with the Provincial Parliament experiencing challenges due to the new systems which were put in place, how will this decrease affect the Provincial Parliament's ability in addressing challenges?

Through this Adjusted Estimates, the Provincial Parliament Budget for the 2019/2020 cycle has been decreased by R631 000. The filling of vacant posts has been one of the key challenges of this Legislature. Because of lack of skills and experience among the current employees of this Legislature, the former Deputy Speaker was appointed as a consultant and to me this is a clear sign of cadre deployment by the DA at its best. All the former employees who did not come back, have now been given other cushy jobs as consultants or as special advisors. The 2018/2019 Annual Report of the

Provincial Parliament highlighted that the vacancy [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, order, order hon members.

Ms P Z LEKKER: It has highlighted that the vacancy rate from 2017/2018 Financial Year to the 2018/2019 Financial Year has increased. Given this realities under these Adjusted Estimates, we see money earmarked to fill critical vacancies, being shifted to other Programmes.

For instance, table 2.2 on the Adjusted Estimates in the Cape that in Sub-programme 1.2, Office of the Secretary, the Provincial Parliament aims to shift R1.7 million funding for vacant posts to things that cover for instance, higher than anticipated foreign travel costs.

Furthermore, the Provincial Parliament is planning to do the same with other Programmes, thus leading to R5 million being shifted from being used for funding vacant posts to other activities in the Programmes. With the R631 000 decrease and the R5 million shift, how will this affect effective and efficient functioning of the employees in the Provincial Parliament?

Here we are talking about employees that are already over stretched in their duties; overworked and sometimes forced to work overtime due to staff shortages. For this reason, the R5.6 million decrease for compensation of employees is ill-conceived and should be rejected. Surely such move was not motivated by the functional enhancement.

PriceWaterhouseCoopers conducted a comparison study, analysing the organisational structure and innovative business practices of the Legislatures in Parliament in South Africa and around the world, comparing them to the WCPP.

A revised organisational structure was approved in November 2018 and planning for the implementation of the structure commenced. The Provincial Parliament on its 2018/2019 Annual Report indicated that there were delays in the implementation of the functional enhancement project. This further shows how the Provincial Parliament picks and chooses what it wants [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You must round out, hon member.

Ms P Z LEKKER: ...what it wants the study to report and fails to implement. Over R2.2 million for funded posts that has been shifted for expenditures, such as IT equipment, should have been used to cover study funding for employees as well as to increase the remuneration of staff members who put in a lot of effort to support the functioning of the Legislature. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. [Applause.] I will now call on hon M Wenger.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you Chairperson. The Western Cape Provincial Parliament sees an in-year downward Adjustment of R631 000 for

an Adjusted Appropriation of R158.5 million for the 2019/2020 Financial Year.

The decreased Budget comes from Programme 2, Parliamentary Support Services and comes mainly from unfilled posts, due to unforeseen vacancies and a fully funded post being abolished. In addition, funds are shifted from Programme 1 to Programme 4 to members' support.

Adjusted funds are allocated to cover the increase in secretarial and constituency allowances to be in line with the recommendations of the National Parliament. Funding is also however allocated for higher than expected costs associated with the National Council of Provinces (NCOP) visit week. In the last NCOP so-called visit week, it was more like a WCPP visit week that the NCOP attended. We were expected to foot the bill for catering and for land transport costs for the NCOP delegates. [Interjections.] Why should this Legislature fund the NCOP, I ask?

The NCOP clearly has sufficient Budget, if they are spending money on gimmicks like this pen [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, hon members.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): This pen! [Interjections.] With a little flag in it. A rollout pen. Yet it is not able to fund its own members' catering and transport costs to conduct oversight. We should not be subsidizing the NCOP that has

scant regard for the 6-week cycle and has all but ignored the Western Cape's request for public consultation on money bills that directly affect our province.

Chairperson, this institution, the Western Cape Provincial Parliament has just received a clean audit opinion [Interjections.] and the Parliamentary oversight committee will continue to do its work in terms of the financial management of Parliament and Provincial Legislatures Act, so that we can monitor the financial performance of this institution.

This Parliament does have a small budget. A small budget of R158 million. [Interjections.] Yet, this Legislature is one of the most efficient and most well run legislatures in the country with the least number of staff per member. That being said, we can do with less if it means that the children and the sick of this province get more.

The Democratic Alliance therefore supports this Budget Adjustments so that much needed funds go to service delivery in the face of overall Budget cuts. [Interjections.] I take this opportunity to thank the members of the Parliamentary Oversight Committee for their contributions over this year. Integral to this committee is the presiding officer, Mr Dustin Davids, as well as the committee management [Interjections.] Ms Lizette Cloete and the management of Mr Marius Sassman.

I would like to thank the Speaker and the Deputy Speaker, as well as the

Secretary and his management team for always tabling the financial and quarterly report on time and for being available to answer all of our questions in the committee.

In conclusion, Chairperson, the Democratic Alliance supports Vote 2.  
[Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I now call on hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Chairperson. The Provincial Parliament seems to be following in the footsteps of the DA-led Government and its Department when it comes to failure to fill vacancies. When looking at these Adjusted Estimates, there is a high shifting of funds intended for job opportunities into other areas.

It cannot be that funds intended to fill up posts within the Legislature are now used to fund foreign travels whilst our province and country is experiencing high unemployment rates and huge gap between the “have’s” and “have not’s”. Another concerning feature is the issue of vacant positions not being filled and the money which was supposed to remunerate those positions is now transferred and used to write off funds that disappeared as a result of theft within the Legislature.

This Legislature often prides itself for adhering to good governance systems and monitoring mechanisms and managing resources effectively, efficiently

and economically. If that is to be told, then the Legislature must explain what steps did it take to recoup these funds and try to investigate the rot that is developing from within itself as outlined in paragraph 1.3 on Financial Management.

This is a concern because the question can be asked, what will the society say when they are told that the Provincial Parliament cannot fill our posts because the money intended for that purpose is now used to cover theft? For years society has placed their hope and trust in this institution with the belief that it is where their concerns and grievances will be deliberated and solved.

Now when they learn that the very same House conceals theft and provides funds to cover it up, then hope and trust in this institution will be lost. We plead for good and clean governance within the Legislature, which takes society's interests at heart while managing its resources effectively and efficiently as per its core aim. I thank you, Speaker.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. Hon B Herron. Okay, thank you very much. Hon F Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Chairperson, just the one point that I want to make, as in this Legislature we must fill posts and we must look after our staff. We had in the previous Parliament the posts not being filled, staff members being burnt out. So, if our posts are filled and these staff members, some of them are there to assist us to do our jobs, I do not think Chairperson, that we can



cut when it comes, and save on staff vacancies. This is a crucial – we know, we interact with the staff and we know that without their assistance we will not be able to perform our task optimally. Thank you, Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Christians. Hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: I will pass this one.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much.

An HON MEMBER: Support. Support the vote!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: In the absence of [Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS: I will support the vote. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chairperson. [Interjections.] In the previous terms one of my tasks was to be a sweeper. So I am tempted to sweep, but I will not do that today [Interjections.] I will not do that today. I simply want to say thank you to the hon members and also to say to hon Lekker, we do things differently. In terms of capacity on the question of the deployment of cadres you know, we do not really do that. We do not. [Interjections.] You know in this Parliament, in this Parliament, nobody [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Donald Grant is not a cadre.

The SPEAKER: ...is asked which membership card you have. Nobody. In fact, it is not, it is the least of my interests. So that is why, when you look at the professionalism you have heard hon members, I was impressed by the way, because hon members left, right and centre – from the extreme right to the centre to the left, to the extreme left, members were saying, we thank the staff members of this institution for the work they are doing. And you have said that. We applauded. Because I heard members doing so.

So, I want to say, thank you members for appreciating the professionalism and also the skills set that exists in this institution. And that is why, whenever a vacancy arises, hon Chairperson, it is on the basis of fitness for purpose, and that simply put, the best person for the job. So men and women in this institution [Interjections.] are employed on the basis of what they contribute in the vision of this Parliament.

So it is very clear, and I am not going to meddle with the administrative matters in so far as who must be hired. I refuse to accept that such a practice should be adopted by Parliament. We should never even risk the temptation to do that. However, I must say in the Parliament here, hon Chairperson, that at the POC we dealt with the matter that the hon Chief Whip of the Opposition raised. And that matter, we put it to bed at that level. And the reason why I am saying that, it is because of the thorough explanation that I gave to hon the Chief Whip of the Opposition.

But again, the hon, the Leader of the Opposition is aware of the difficulty that the Speaker found himself in, in order to beef up some capacity in the system. And the Leader of the Opposition and myself worked together to understand what the complexities were, because I do not take these decisions alone. I consult.

The only Parliament where you have got the Speaker's consultative political party forum, which is a platform where all political parties get together and I get to be appraised of the concerns, the issues raised by members. And some will say I over-consult, but I must tell you, it is the right way to go. It is the right way to go.

Even the hon Premier sits at the Speaker's political party, consultative political party forum, and the LOGB sits there and the Chief Whips and all leaders of political parties. You want to check where that exists? Nowhere else does it exist. But because we want to be a parliament of all people. So I just want to deal with that now and put it to bed and bury it, that this matter not be raised again, because we have addressed that.

I just want to thank the Chief Whip, hon Wenger. Well said and thank you for your remarks, especially on the areas of some of the frustration with the NCOP. I think we are raising these issues with the NCOP at the National Speaker's Forum, because some of the challenges, hon members, through you Chairperson, that Chairperson, if you look at the frustration – a bill lands today and then all of a sudden you hear that there is a public hearing. That

the committee must decide on the areas and the dates, but there are also other programmes of the institution.

So in order to cut out the last minute presentation of the bills for them to be processed by the institution, we are saying we need to do it differently. The 6-week cycle itself needs to be reviewed, but I am raising these issues at the National Speaker's Forum, in order to make sure that we can consult with the public and do qualitative public hearing. Not just this box-ticking. Qualitative public hearings.

The last one, hon Makamba-Botya, you have mentioned something crucial which I – I am not going to mention some of the names, but there are some members from the Fifth Parliament who have created a bit of a challenge for Parliament as an institution in terms of money that we need to recoup and we are doing what must be done to get what is due to Parliament. But we are not going to go by the way of trying to embarrass individuals, you know. I think there are some reasons why some are taking longer, and some have made some commitments to pay.

And it is a matter of getting former members to pay, so that we do not have to go to court and try to recoup the money in that process. I have already been briefed by the team and I thought it is something that I would like to get the members to pay easier instead of going through the vigorous litigation process. That route is not the route I would like to seek.

So that means every member here must learn, because some of the challenges, when a member says, I am going to a public hearing, Chairperson and then they do not arrive. They do not arrive. They just do not pitch! But you have booked food. You have paid the room. Maybe three rooms. I mean three days, consecutively, but the member just does not pitch.

So we are using public funds and we have got to respect it. At times a flight has also been booked, a return flight. A member just does not pitch. So these are some of the things that we are trying to really encourage members, the hon members, Chairperson, that this Sixth Parliament, may we please avoid being drawn into those kind of frustrations, because it frustrates a member, because if you find yourself in this space, we will recoup the money.

So thanks hon Makamba-Botya, Chairperson through yourself, and to also say that some of the issues that members raised, they are political in nature but the rest of the issues have been very positive and I appreciate. I just want to say, this Parliament will never be the Parliament that we see without all the members of the staff of the WCPP, from the moment you get into the reception, how you get to be received in this Parliament, from the time you get to this Chamber here, how you get to be treated in this Parliament, fairly and on the basis of professionalism by the Table staff.

I also want to thank the Secretary to Parliament, the Deputy Secretary, our CFO who is very careful about numbers and often tells us that this is money that we must spend and spend it all. So we try and spend all our money by the

end of the financial year and thank everybody here in the institution again, and say that this has been a tough but a fruitful year. Thanks to all of you, hon members, hon Premier, thank you very much. Thank you, Chairperson. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I must say it has been the most calm debate that has taken place for today. Maybe it is because all parties got something to lose if they start being difficult towards the Speaker. [Interjections.] So, everybody was behaving. Thank you very much, hon members. We are now going to take a five minutes break. Thank you very much.

[Business of the House suspended at 15:35 and resumed at 15:40]

The SPEAKER: You may please be seated. Hon members, welcome back. [Interjections.] Order, hon members. The Secretary will now read the 7<sup>th</sup> Order.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Votes and Schedules, *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill*. [B 6 – 2019].

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr Secretary. Hon members, you have an option of making declaration as parties to cover all votes or to make a declaration on each vote individually. So I give you an opportunity, political parties. I put Vote 1, the Premier. I recognise the ANC.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Speaker, I just want to get clarity on whether it is possible for parties to express their view but then make one statement in regard to all the particular votes?

'n AGB LID: Ja, ons doen dit so.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, we do it like that.

The SPEAKER: Yes, thank you hon the Leader of the Opposition. That is an opportunity to make a declaration for all of them. One statement for all of them, yes. I now recognise you, Sir.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: At what stage? Now?

The SPEAKER: Now. Now is the opportunity.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, Speaker. Speaker, it is in fact quite an irony that we witnessed yesterday that the Democratic Alliance opposed the Division of Revenue Bill, yet then brings an Adjustments Appropriation Bill, which is in fact informed by the very content of the Division of Revenue Bill and asks this House to support it.

In fact this is nothing less than opportunism and also an unfortunate overhang of the DA's want to blame and complain about National Government.

Received money for the National Health Service. Use that money, but then in public oppose the National Health Insurance system.

As the ANC we were looking for clear signs in all of these Adjustments votes, that the new direction promised by the Premier in his State of Province Address, would find its way even in small ways, into these Adjustments. But the danger of populism and playing to the gallery and seeking media attention is that you end up then with half-baked plans, in fact, not even a plan. A working document dressed up as a plan.

The least we would have expected when the Premier talks about his Safety Cabinet for instance, and the working document refers, and I want to quote, there is a reference in this working document to what every single provincial Minister is expected to do in regard to this working document. But in fact, we did not see in these Adjustments any of the particular MEC's, except of course for Community Safety beginning to say how these adjustments even begin to strengthen the working plan for Community Safety.

So that was a disappointment. We all agree that the Adjustments are happening in an environment, clearly with fiscal constraints. And all of us share the concerns around the lack of growth in our economy. We cannot be blind to that, but I think we also need to acknowledge that we must commend the progress which is being made in the Zondo Commission, in that it is beginning to expose the death of state capture.



And we are committed that all those responsible in the public and the private sector are brought to book and that there is no turning back in this regard. But very often we hear nothing from the DA about Steinhoff and others implicated in various of these commissions. But also, we must acknowledge when we discuss the state of this economy and the state of our State-owned Enterprises, that our President has appointed an SIU special tribunal to fast-track the recovery of our state assets.

This work has already started and it is beginning to bear fruit, but in this province the DA takes no action to recover losses, for instance caused by Filcon and Saul Loggenberg where there could be civil actions instituted against them, but we hear nothing from the DA and that is why we wonder, is it because these individuals were responsible for funding the Democratic Alliance that you have taken no civil action against them?

The process of dealing with the challenges facing our State-owned Enterprises has begun. It is going to be difficult. It is going to be torturous, but that process has begun [Interjections.] So fundamentally this adjustment, we believe, does not show a clear agenda to deal with poverty, inequality and unemployment. And in fact, doing that, we have seen reductions to Education, reductions to Social Development, reductions to Cultural Affairs and Sport. And unless you actually deal with those issues you are not going to deal with crime. So unfortunately [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...this Adjustment has become simply about boots [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon members.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...on the ground and nothing else and therefore in conclusion we as the ANC, Speaker, cannot support these adjustments and while we want to acknowledge fully the role of all Treasury officials and Department officials...[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you hon Dugmore [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...for the hard work they have done in preparing these Adjustments.

The SPEAKER: That concludes your time. [Applause.] I now recognise the EFF.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you Speaker. As EFF we will abstain and with no comments, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. GOOD.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you Speaker. Speaker for as long as people

continue to be disempowered and trapped, living without hope and apartheid's racialised townships, the perverse levels of crime and violence will continue. We will not change anything by denying education, denying early childhood development, exacerbating poverty and inequality, cutting alcohol and drug abuse programmes.

To undo the perverted work of the racists who created this mess we need bold and ambitious plans. We welcome the announcement of the Provincial Safety Plan because it promised to increase visible policing as well as addressing the root causes of crime. Unfortunately, we now see that there is no plan. All we have is a superficial working document that avoids any mention of spatial redress.

The Premier said he would spend R1 billion per year, but the Finance Minister has allocated less than 40% of that. And this year we get no money at all. We are asked to simply support the transfer of R130 million for the law enforcement advancement project called "Boots on the Ground". There is no plan to justify this number.

We do not know if it is informed by operational requirements, or if it is simply the amount that the province could cobble together. Without a plan the allocation is arbitrary. All of the social services are cut. The Education Department cuts R34 million from the Public Ordinary School Education vote and R7 million from Early Childhood Development. Social Development reduces their Social Welfare Services by R24 million and surrenders

R5.1 million.

Cultural Affairs and Sport cuts R26 million. The very departments needed to reduce crime are cutting their budgets. Speaker, it is irresponsible for legislatures to blindly support a blank cheque transfer of R130 million from one DA administration to another in the absence of a clear plan. We cannot support a budget that cuts the services needed to address the root causes of crime. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Herron. I recognise the FF Plus. Hon Marais.

An HON MEMBER: Support.

Mr P J MARAIS: Speaker, my friend here says he is ahead of me and I do not want him an enemy, so.

The SPEAKER: No, I recognise FF Plus.

Mr P J MARAIS: Okay. Speaker, I plead for, while accepting the Budget Adjustments, I plead for greater collaboration across party lines here. I ask that we must grow up politically and not sometimes act as though one is the bully and the other is the one who is being bullied. But that to recognise that there are intelligence and bright ideas amongst all the political parties here.

Nobody has a monopoly on wisdom. And we must share whatever we know,

and I feel we can start creating this great collaboration across party lines to combat crime, eradicate poverty and to scrap regulations that stands in the way of SMME's flourishing. We have got to do something about it. We must stop talking now. We have got to come together, come up with a Marshall plan, even if we call it the Winde Plan or the Dugmore Plan. As long as it is a plan. It cannot just be wishful thinking, pie in the sky when you die.

So I want to plead with this Parliament that if we are going to come in the new year, that will be our vision and our goal that we are going to put aside party political affiliations and put on the Western Province jersey and fight these issues and the one thing we should start with, I am sick and tired of getting one minute! If I cough, the minute is finished!

I do not see if they give each one of these parties an extra two minutes whether some of these people will die of sleeplessness, because it will mean eight minutes added to the total debate. 8 minutes! And you earn so much money, you should sleep here actually. So I want to say that, why do they give smaller parties one minute when they cannot even cough in one minute, they will lose 10 seconds. Give a minimum of three minutes, and then we can have a decent debate and it will encourage greater cooperation.

For the rest I want to say, I have made some friends. I am not friendless. So I wish everybody a festive season and that we will come back with renewed strength. I did not think I will get a warm reception, but I did get a warm reception after a 15-year absence. And I look forward to the next 15 years.

Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Marais. I now recognise the ACDP. Hon Christians.

An HON MEMBER: Support!

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Speaker. You know, sometimes you sit here, and you work and you speak – I did not speak on all the items. The portfolios that I sit on, I got one minute and I try to get in a minute and a half and so on, but Speaker the problem that I have is, when the Chief Whip of the majority party wants to score cheap political points by taking a photo here and put it on Facebook to say, where is the Freedom Front Plus, GOOD, EFF and the ACDP when it is the Budget of Health?

Now yesterday ... [Interjection.] at 14:09 she sent it out. Now the true reflection is Speaker, if we are going to make a mockery of this, that is what we must do. There are 14 votes, I have been present at 10 of them. I think hon Herron has been present at all of them, and to do that is scoring cheap political points. If we are serious about this [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, it is a point of order. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Christians, will you please take your seat. What is your point of order, hon Mitchell?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, I am rising on relevance because this is a declaration on the votes. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Mitchell. [Interjections.] Order hon members. Order. When we deal with votes they are political in nature as much as they are budgets. So I cannot prescribe to the member what to say and what not to say. I think the member may, I am hoping that you are going to come back to the subject.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: No, Speaker, this is relevant. Because she is talking about our absence in the House. She takes one photo and tells the public that we are not here. [Interjections.] And I hope when we leave here she will take a photo and say, they were here on the majority of the votes. I hope she takes a photo to tell that because Speaker, we are serious about business here and when we come here we do not score cheap political points.

We have debated, we have sat in the committees. Now people do not know that we debate these in the committees and we only come here to speak on the Budget. We have done our work, but I am asking you Speaker that the Chief Whip refrain from cheap political points. I thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. I wanted to hear your declaration but thank you hon Christians. [Interjections.] Order hon members. I recognise the Democratic Alliance.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you Speaker. We will do a declaration on all the votes. The Democratic Alliance supports all of the votes, while we do not support the Division of Revenue, because we are not getting a fair allocation and because we only see a fraction of what we contribute to the fiscus [Interjections.]

We do support the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill and what this Western Cape Government plans to do with the funds, is supported. We are quite surprised however at the ANC's U-turn in supporting or not supporting the votes because in committee they did support the votes on Health, on Human Settlements, Transport and Public Works and Local Government. [Interjections.] And so we would like to understand why there has been a change of heart between the Committee's support and then this House.

The Western Cape Government has just returned 79% clean audits, leaving other provinces in the dust. This means that hard earned tax rands are being spent prudently and on frontline service delivery, especially to the vulnerable and the poor. We support these Budget Votes because we support safety, because we support rural communities suffering under the weight of a crippling drought, because we support giving the lion's share of our budget to educating our province's young and because we support universal public health care for all residents in our province. Thank you.



The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon Chief Whip. Hon members that concludes [Interjections.] hon members, order. That concludes the declarations on this report. Are there any objections to the report being adopted? No objections. There is an ANC objection. Any other objection? No other objection. The objection of the ANC will be noted.

Now, thank you hon members. The Secretary will now read the 10<sup>th</sup> Order. Sorry members. Hon members, thank you. The Speaker needs a second pair of glasses. Hon members, I wish to put Clauses 1 to 3 of the Bill, which is what I omitted, and the members raised their objections and the report was adopted. The ANC noted their objection which has been noted, so that that has been dealt with. Now I put the title – where am I now? Thank you. Now the Secretary will read the 8<sup>th</sup> Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: *Finalisation of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill*. [B 6 – 2019].

The SPEAKER: Thank you Mr Secretary. I recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you Speaker. The Medium-term Budget Policy Statement and the 2019 Adjusted Estimates of Provincial Revenue and Expenditure tabled last week, outlined exactly how we plan to actually get things done in the Western Cape. It outlined how we will ensure the efficient, effective and sustainable management of our public finances, so the people are safe. So the people

have jobs and so that people have access to opportunities in the Western Cape.

I am sure that members will agree that the quote of the debate goes to the hon Reagen Allen, who quoting the A-Team, said, “I love it when a plan comes together!” Now which plan was he referring to? He was referring to the Western Cape Safety Plan, which is clear [Interjections.] which is bold and which is ambitious and which is aimed at combatting crime, especially violent crime in the Western Cape. We made a promise and we kept that promise. We listened to the victims of crime and [Interjections.] we heard the victims of crime and we have found R1.3 billion over the next four years to deploy an extra 1 000 law enforcement officers to fight crime, especially violent crime in the Western Cape.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Please proceed hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you Speaker. Now Speaker, I must thank all the hon members who participated in the various debates on the Budget votes. I also wish to thank Premier Alan Winde and my Cabinet colleagues for their support during this very tough budget process and of course I would like to once again give special thanks to Provincial Treasury’s former acting head official, Julinda Gantana and team finance who worked so hard preparing the Budget here in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament.

Hon Speaker, in conclusion, I now move that the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill 2019 be finalised.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. As there is no list of speakers, are there any objections to the Bill being finalised?

An HON MEMBER: No! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon, the Leader of the Opposition.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I would like to make a statement on this.

The SPEAKER: Statement, yes. Alright. I am going to request the following, because there is no provision for statements in this specific one, but if you, I cannot change the Rules from here. I cannot. [Interjections.] No, there is absolutely no opportunity for that. You have made your declaration.

Now that the objection of the ANC has been raised, the objection of the ANC will be noted. Are there any further objections? No? Thank you. [Interjections.] Because there are no further objections, then it is agreed to. I will now request the Secretary to read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill*. [B 6 – 2019].

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. The Bill will be sent to the Premier for assent. The Secretary will now read the 9<sup>th</sup> Order.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Conduct Committee on the Failure of Hon Members N Makamba-Botya and M Xego to submit disclosure forms timeously.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. [Interjections.] I wish to do the following because there is no speakers list. If there are members who wish to make a declaration, to make a statement in this regard, you are free to do so, as parties. And I recognise the ANC, if you so wish, and I will also do the same for all parties. No more than three minutes. No statements? Alright. Thank you. Chief Whip. Deputy Chief Whip. Yes.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you Speaker. Speaker, first and foremost I want to move, I move without notice that the fourth paragraph for the report, that 39 be omitted and substituted by 40.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Deputy Chief Whip. In fact, in this case as the Chairperson of the Conduct Committee. Thank you. Alright. Hon members, that concludes this matter. [Interjection.] Oh, you want to say something? Yes, sir. Please proceed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Speaker. I take that the

amendment has been agreed to. Alright. Hon Speaker [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: The amendment has been agreed to. No objection.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, hon members Makamba-Botya and Xego, having been sworn in as members of the House on 22 May 2019, failed to return their initial disclosure of registerable interest forms within 60 days of their appointment as a member, as is required by the 60 day limit which is required by the Provincial Code of Conduct.

The Committee then deliberated and found that by failing to return their disclosure forms timeously the hon members was in breach of Section 11(2) of the Provincial Code of Conduct. This decision concurred with the recommendation of the Registrar that the hon members had indeed breached the code by failing to submit their declaration timeously. The hon members were then afforded the opportunity to make written submission in mitigation of their penalty to be recommended by the Conduct Committee.

In respect of member Makamba-Botya, she explained that she struggled to obtain information on companies registered under her name from the Department of Trade and Industry, hence her late submission and she apologized for that.

In respect of member Xego, the Committee noted that hon member admitted that he has breached the code and has established an administrative system in his office to avoid any repetition in future. The submission and matter was

then deliberated on by the Conduct Committee on 15 November in which we considered that hon members Makamba-Botya and Xego were new members and took into consideration the fact that this is the first time that both hon members contravened the conduct and have shown remorse.

During these deliberations the Committee resolved to recommend that both hon members Makamba-Botya and Xego receive a reprimand in terms of Section 32(1) of the Provincial Code of Conduct. I therefore encourage this House to accept the recommendation of the Conduct Committee. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chairperson of the Conduct Committee. Are there any further declarations on this matter? Nothing? No-one. Now at this point – that concludes the declaration on this report. Are there any objections to the report being adopted? No objections? Agreed to. Hon members, please allow me to deal with the reprimand. Hon Makamba-Botya, will you please rise.

Pursuant to the adoption by the House of the Report of the Conduct Committee, hon Makamba-Botya, on your failure to submit your member's disclosure forms on time, I hereby reprimand you for breaching paragraph 11.2 of the Code of Conduct for members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament.

Members have to abide by the principles, rules and obligations set out in the Code of Conduct and your failure to do so is a serious transgression. I trust

that as members you will learn, in fact, in this case hon Makamba-Botya, I trust that as a member of this House you will learn from this experience and that you will not be found to be on the contrary to what the Rule is and to what the Code of Conduct prescribes to us as members. I hope that this is the last time, and it is not going to be a norm in future. Will you please take your seat.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, the Secretary will read the 10<sup>th</sup> Order.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of the Report of the Rules Committee on the Parental Leave for Parliamentarians, dated 2 December 2019.

The SPEAKER: Hon Members, I have been informed by the Chief Whip that there will be no speakers list in this regard, but parties will do so if they so wish to speak and they will have an opportunity to make a declaration on the report for no more than three minutes. I recognise the ANC.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: We have been briefed by our participants in this Committee. We welcome the work that is being done and we also note the Report.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon the Leader of the Opposition. EFF.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you Speaker. We welcome the recommendation. I am part of the Committee, so I have no objections, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. GOOD. Thank you, hon member. ACDP. Thank you, hon Christians. FF Plus. Thank you, hon Marais. And the Democratic Alliance?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Mr Speaker. Up until the end of the Fifth Parliament, the Western Cape Provincial Parliament Standing Rules and Practice did not provide for Parental Leave for members. On 19 April 2018 the House adopted a resolution in my name that the Rules Committee be tasked with drafting a policy for members of the House relating to maternity, paternity, adoption and surrogacy leave and that the Committee reports such a draft policy to the House for consideration.

In the Sixth Parliament the Rules Committee established a sub-committee to draft this policy. The sub-committee consisted of hon Mitchell, Baartman, Lekker, Makamba-Botya and myself. The Committee looked at the Basic Conditions of Employment Act as a guide. We also looked at practice and procedure in the National Assembly, other South African Legislatures, Parliaments of Kenya, New Zealand, the United Kingdom and Canada.

The result of this research and our deliberations is the document contained in the ATC. What makes this policy unique is that it is not gendered. The



policy differentiates between parental leave for primary caregivers and parental leave for non-primary caregivers. So gender does not matter.

By adopting this policy the Western Cape Provincial Parliament is taking a bold step to ensure rights for parliamentary parents for maternity, paternity, adoption and surrogacy leave. The policy makes provision for parliamentary parents, whatever their gender or family arrangements, in the spirit of our Constitution. I therefore ask this House to consider and adopt the report and the Parental Leave for Parliamentarians Policy. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Chief Whip. Hon members. That concludes the debate on this report. Are there any objections to the report being adopted. No objections. Okay. Hon members, I tell you it felt like a marathon, but we have arrived now.

I am going to request that as it is the order in our tradition that as Parliament we allow party representatives to address the House when the year comes to an end. We are going to afford parties to do the same and I wish to request that we do so at least in three minutes maximum. And I am going to recognise the ANC to do that first.

Mr M K SAYED: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Let me yet again greet you as a Speaker, let me greet the rest of the members and let me also greet those in the gallery and also the staff of Provincial Parliament, as led by the Secretary, Mr Adams.

Firstly, on behalf of the African National Congress the Opposition, we would like to thank the Speaker of Provincial Parliament and his team for really ensuring that since our swearing in as members and particularly those who have been sworn in for the first time, for really ensuring that the environment is conducive for us to do proper oversight.

It is not being partisan; it has really been conducive and we want to thank you for that. We also would like to thank all members, regardless of their political parties for the manner in which we have worked together. Despite the fact that in the House the last few sittings have been very robust, and that is part of oversight. Being robust, when we differ sharply, coming from our various political party perspectives, the focus and objective is still to contribute to a bigger whole, and I would like to thank members for that. We have done that, and we have maintained our respect, our personal respect and our camaraderie in that regard.

We would also like to thank the staff. Staff of political parties as well, our own staff and the staff of the Legislature, the staff of committees for ensuring that we are able to serve our people on the ground to the best of our ability as members. Finally and within that spirit we would like to wish each and every member, all staff of Provincial Parliament, well over the festive season and to be safe on the roads and to ensure that we get a good rest so that we are revived for next year to continue with our working relations next year. I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed. I now recognise the EFF.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you Speaker. I am going to sound as if I am going to be echoing the same words as the last speaker, but as EFF we wish everyone a happy holiday and a revolutionary love, success and happiness into the new year.

We also want to thank the House, especially the office of the Speaker for the guidance that you have provided us throughout since we have started this journey and wish that we can work together and when you are out there to our communities, we remove our political party hats and be the citizens of South Africa and support our communities, especially the poor communities. So in that regard, thank you very much and happy New Year! [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Makamba-Botya. I now recognise the GOOD Party.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you Speaker and thank you for this opportunity. We wish to extend our wishes for a peaceful, safe and enjoyable festive season to every member of this Parliament, to the staff of Parliament who support us every single day. We thank them as well. But most importantly, to the people of this province and to all of those who will be visiting our beautiful province over the season. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. I now recognise the Freedom Front

Plus.

†Mnr P J MARAIS: Speaker, ek wil namens die Vryheidsfront Plus almal bedank in hierdie Huis, vanaf die Premier [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Mr P J MARAIS: Speaker, on behalf of the Freedom front Plus I want to thank all in this House, from the Premier [Interjections.]]

†‘n AGB LID: Ons kan nie hoor nie.

[An HON MEMBER: We cannot hear.]

An HON MEMBER: One minute.

An HON MEMBER: Ja, one minute.

†Mnr P J MARAIS: Premier, die Kabinetslede, Speaker, die Leier van die Opposisie, leier van kleiner partye. Dit was ‘n ondervinding vir my gewees en ek sien baie dinge het verander. Dit is nie meer dieselfde nie. Hulle het verander maar ek kan nie sê dit is agteruitgang verandering nie. Ek kan u sê dit was ‘n groot verbetering.

Die Sekretaris wil ek ook bedank. Hy is altyd oop-deur. Hy is altyd bereid om te luister en sy personeel is uitstekend. Hulle het ons regtig bygestaan en gehelp. Ons kan trots wees as Opposisie vir die tipe kantore en die kwaliteit van die kantore, toerusting en alles, tot parkeerplekke. Ons sal nog daaroor praat later, maar *okay*.

Ek wil vra dat die Speaker,

*[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]*

[Mr P J MARAIS: Premier, the Cabinet members, Speaker, the Leader of the Opposition, leaders of smaller parties. It has been an experience for me and I see many things have changed. It is not the same. They have changed but I cannot say it is regressive change. I can tell you it has been a big improvement.]

I also want to thank the Secretary. He is always open-door. He is always prepared to listen and his staff is outstanding. They have really assisted and helped us. We can be proud as Opposition for the type of offices and the quality of the offices, equipment and everything, to parking spaces. We will speak about that later, but okay.

I want to ask that the Speaker,] you especially, I think I know a lot of Speakers since I have entered politics, have come through a lot of them, but you are one of the best I will count amongst them. [Applause.] Your attitude is not overbearing. You know there is a difference between those who demand to be respected and those who command respect. You command respect. You have earned respect.

And the way you always try and include everybody and have an open-door

policy, where we can come to your office and sit and chat. I have never had a meal with previous Speakers. It is my first meal with the Speaker, and I was so overtaken that I even had everybody sign my menu to remember this day. I want to say I give my cooperation fully and when I differ with you, I differ with you for the better of the province. I do not differ because it is personalised. It will never be personalised.

I hope that we have a joyous Christmas, a wonderful festive season and remember the reason why there is a festive season, because there is a man who died for us, who spread love in this world; and who preached love. I will continue to stand up for values, Christian values that I consider dear to me, but at the same time, I respect the values other people hold that might be different to mine.

I thank the Ministers. They do not walk around here with an overbearing attitude. The friendliness of all your Ministers, Mr Premier, and the way they have received and communicated with me since I have arrived here is something that I really appreciate, and I want to say thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Marais. I now recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you Speaker, I think in this House we debate and we argue but I want to say in the committees it is totally different, where we are embracing one another, irrespective of political parties and we always look at what is the best for the people on the ground. So I think this is very

good. I mean I have served in the previous Parliament. This Parliament again reminded me of why we are here.

So, Speaker again, thank you to you and the Premier and the Ministers for their open doors and for always being there to assist and to help. So, thank you very much, and for the Secretary and the staff. But I want to read something out of the Bible for us as we go our ways and this is from 1 Chronicles 4:10 where Jabez cried out to the Lord God of Israel and said,

“Oh God, that you would bless me indeed, enlarge my territory. Let your hand be on me and keep me from harm so that I will not endure any pain.”

So that is my prayer for this House when we travel. Spend some good quality time with your families. Come back refreshed and wherever you go, I pray the blessing of God upon us all, I thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Christians. I now recognise the DA.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS : Thank you very much Mr Speaker. Let me start by thanking you and your officials for really keeping a very tight ship. I think as you said earlier, it has been a very long and difficult year for all of us. But I must say that being here now for the third term, this Parliament is more lively than the previous two parliaments. It is just my personal opinion.

I think really, I want to appreciate the colleagues in the House. I think many speakers have said this, we are members of different political parties here. This is a battle ground, where we debate issues but I really appreciate the collegiality and the patriotism that are always displayed by all of us when we meet outside this House and I really want to take this opportunity and say to the Premier, to my colleagues, to all the staff members that have contributed immensely to make our work easier as the members who are sitting in this House, to wish them all the best.

I think people must really take a well-deserved rest because I think we all need it. We are coming from an election year. And lastly, I really do want to emphasize the importance of driving safely on the road. Some of us will be out there to make sure and I do want to appeal to each and every member of this Parliament, because it is not only the responsibility of the Minister or the governing party to make sure that we really reduce the carnage on our roads, because we want to see each and every member of this House coming back safely after a festive season. So with those words, Mr Speaker I want to say, travel safely and may you have a wonderful time with your families and come back in one piece, not in pieces. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Min Madikizela. At this point I wish to say to all of you, hon members, as I did during lunchtime, it has been a fruitful and successful year in terms of our parliamentary democracy and in light of our mandate here as Parliament, I can tick all the boxes and that is because of



the work that we have done together here as a collective.

So I want to really, from the bottom of my heart, thank you and say let us proceed with this spirit. Let us not shy away from doing oversight. Never shy away from doing it robustly and of course doing it in order to protect the people that put us into office.

That is why we are here. And I wish to really express my love to all of you and that you much enjoy the Festive Season, but to those members of our staff in the institution, we may not say this all the time but we love and appreciate you. We are here, we succeed because you get up every day, even when it hurts you do not show it. You come to work. Thank you for that and to the people of the province, thank you very much. We are here to serve. Have a blessed festive season, a merry Christmas and a happy New Year. The House is adjourned. [Applause.]

The House adjourned at 16:24.