
THURSDAY, 3 SEPTEMBER 2020

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may be seated. Order! Good afternoon, hon members, guests, members of the press. Today we will continue to use a hybrid model for the sitting of the House. We have both our hon members here in the Chamber with the Presiding Officer, the Table staff as well as the hon members on Microsoft Teams. I trust that everyone of you are connected today and that you are fully operational. Should you find any problems, please contact the ICT staff who will be able to assist you.

Hon members, please may I remind you that you remain on mute when members are speaking and that you remember to switch your microphones off in the House should you not be speaking.

For the purpose of this sitting via this hybrid model, we have for the first time put in language translation services which are available both in the Chamber as per normal and on Microsoft Teams via the respective channels. Hon members participating in this sitting of the House must please access the language translation services via a second device such as your cell phones and if you have earphones available please use it for the language translation services. By now the WCPP ICT colleagues should have made contact with all of our members participating in the sitting of the House via Microsoft Teams to assist you with accessing and utilisation of the language translation services.

As ruled by the Presiding Officer in the sitting of the House on 23 April 2020, no interjections shall be permitted during the debate. In this regard I wish to draw your attention to Rule 40 of our Standing Rules.

I will now call on the Chairperson to come and take over from me. Thank you, Chair.

[Hon member Maseko takes the Chair.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Hon

Speaker, there is an echo connecting the phones that are close to the mics, so if you members can check that you place your cell phones far away from your mics, I will appreciate that. Thank you very much. I now recognise the Deputy Speaker.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Madam Chair... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No-no, my apologies about that. I recognise the Chief Whip.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Madam Chair. I move without notice:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 20(1), precedence be given to the Speakers Debate.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: No objections, but there is a sound.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay, let us try to find out, where does the sound come from? Is it still there?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: It is better now, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Much better.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. We will now deal with the Speakers Debate as printed on the Order Paper. I recognise the hon Deputy Speaker.

HON MEMBERS: Hear-hear!

SPEAKERS DEBATE

(Challenges confronting women during the COVID-19 pandemic)

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Good afternoon, hon members. Appearing in a well-worn T-shirt at her home, having just put a small child to bed, Jacinda Ardern sits casually in front of her Facebook live while her country citizens tuned in. Her words, she says, are there only to offer guidance, but also to prepare to hunker down.

Jacinda is an ordinary woman, but not an ordinary leader. As New Zealand's current Prime Minister she is hailed as one of the world's best in handling the COVID-19 pandemic. Her regular Facebook live sessions were helpful, and she always spoke in a warm and simple way.

“Think of those people who will be in your life consistently over this time and call them your family bubble and act as though you already have COVID-19 towards those outside of your bubble,” she said. Her messaging left no room for confusion. She justified implementing severe policies with practical examples. “Avoid playgrounds”, she said to the parents, “as the virus lives on surfaces for 72 hours”, and she always ended her messages with “be kind to one another”. The result, the people responded. People did not always understand something she said, “but we know that she has our backs.” they said. This is a high level of trust and confidence in her, because of the people and because of the empathy, people said. It was not what she said, Chairperson, it was the way she said it that made such a difference to her people.

Germany was one of those first European countries that led the way that handled COVID-19 from their world-class healthcare system to their testing. Angela Merkel, the Chancellor of Germany, stood up very early in the outbreak and calmly told her country that this was a serious bug that would infect up to 70% of the population. “It is serious, so take it seriously,” she said. She did, so they did too. Trust was their foundation.

Across the way another female leader, Tsai Ing-wen, President of Taiwan, took rapid action. In January of this year when she saw the first sign of the new illness, President Ing-wen introduced 124 new measures to block the spread. She acted when the rest of the world was still waking up.

Early intervention paid off and these measures meant that Taiwan did not even need to order a full nationwide lockdown as a result. She attributes her action from past experiences when the SARS outbreak in 2002 resulted in Taiwan being one of the most affected nations. The aftermath of SARS helped her to prepare for what COVID-19 had coming so when President Ing-wen spoke the people listened. They trusted her.

Denmark's youngest ever Prime Minister, Mette Frederiksen joins the ranks of female leaders that made headlines during this pandemic. At first, she was accused of over-reacting when the news of the virus emerged, when only eight days after Denmark reported its first case, she restricted gatherings to a 1000 people only. A few days later she reduced it to 100 and then to 10. Looking back her overreaction was totally justified. She took to social media and connected to teenagers, warning them about the virus. She too was trusted by her own citizens. And in the same region, Sanna Marin, Prime Minister of Finland, only 34 years old - Finland's youngest ever leader and the second-youngest leader in the world. She only came to power in December 2019 and had to clearly think on her feet with the onset of COVID-19. She did what no other Fin had ever done during peace time. She invoked the Emergency Powers' Act to allow for the flow of public funds for healthcare and social welfare. Being a millennial herself, she adopted a unique strategy to reach out to her people by using social influences that were better access to information. She too became trusted by her people.

Chairperson, the sentiment for women leaders across the world have been

unprecedentedly positive during this pandemic. While women hold only 7% of the world's government leadership roles, their swift action, their empathy and compassion and their communication style have been exactly what was needed to minimise the impact of this pandemic on the people of their nations, but it was not just the soft emotions that put them well ahead of other nations.

What was strongly reported on across the globe was their ability to make the hard decisions on one hand but at the same time inspire the support of communities on the other. These women leaders have been hailed as voices of reason amid the chaos of this terrible pandemic.

It has been now more than ever that we see the impact of great women leaders and how in times of crises they have come to the forefront in creating a much more effective platform for participation and democracy and get it when you are talking about good healthcare. They understand the hard decisions that must be taken in order to protect the most vulnerable.

As Ellen Sirleaf, former President of Liberia, said:

“I do not see any contradiction in being empathetic and compassionate and being a strong leader.”

That is not weakness. That is strength!

Chairperson, today I pay tribute to the women leadership across the world and to the many women in this country we will talk about in this debate here today, who have equally led the way at whatever level, both empathetically and compassionately, but most of all, with strength. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. I now recognise hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Hon Chairperson, hon Premier, hon members of the Cabinet, hon members of this House, women. As the sun sets and the curtain is drawn on celebrating yet another Women's Month, the resilience of our women grew even stronger amidst a pandemic and in new uncharted territory.

Chairperson, the women of 1956 handed us the baton and we have surely done them proud. Women have drawn from all the principles and the resolution of those who have gone before us, and we soldiered on that, drawing upon their strength and example.

Chairperson, studies show that during the lockdown women spent more time on paid and unpaid work than men. Chairperson, these are the moms who had no choice to balance working from home, home-schooling and running errands under the strangest of times. During these last five months, our women have given all they had to fight back during the disaster period and endured at all costs as they formed the backbone of the frontline in the fight against COVID-19.

We have seen during this time the highlights of women-led successes and resilience. We saw women being carried by other women, and women leading their male counterparts.

Chairperson, last night on eNCA it was reported that more women are joining the police service. This goes to show our ongoing willingness to put our lives before others and grow into the heroes of the day.

As Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Education, I want to salute women in the management teams of schools. It is a known fact that the majority of educators are women and they serve with compassion and go beyond what they are compensated for.

Chairperson, I extend my accolades to all our municipalities where our women are wearing the mayoral hats and taking up leadership positions in the council and its structures. They have been tasked with the essence of Disaster Risk Management in our communities. I honour the ordinary community serving leader woman who took from her own household to kick-start feeding schemes. Chairperson, these are acts of modern-day bravery, but unfortunately there are some who are still unable to find a seat at this table.

According to the *Harvard Business Review 2018*, gender equality at work has slowed down since the 1990s. There has been a stop in integrating gender occupations and attitudes have changed whilst the gender wage gap is

decreasing at a slower rate. Our own Global Wage Report for the 2018/19 year shows that women are paid nearly 30% less than men, and South Africa has the highest wage inequality overall, Chairperson. [Self-correcting earlier phrase.]

Cultural expectations of women differ vastly. In South Africa many women are still subject to the motherhood penalty. Single-headed households are a common occurrence and with gender-based violence skewed against women, women truly have to find new ways to ground their position in management which is something we really still take for granted. Today still companies try to get away with avoiding maternity leave payouts.

Chairperson, I commend the successes of women against all odds, but I would not do this debate justice without acknowledging the obstacles women still have to overcome.

Firstly, I wish to pay tribute to those women who have succumbed to the coronavirus and had left their dear families behind. Chairperson, many of our women's lives changed forever. They have lost their only source of income, their livelihoods. Rural communities had to learn quickly about COVID-19 as the infection rate rapidly grew. These individuals are already at a disadvantage when it comes to opportunities. Therefore I also pay homage to our rural women who also had to endure a lot in a unique way.

Chairperson, I turn my attention to survivors of abuse who had no escape as

we were required to stay home, a place where one out of three women are killed by their intimate partners. The hotline established during the pandemic has unfortunately showed that even more women have been abused at the hands of male partners.

Chairperson, my heart goes out to the girl-child in South Africa who grows up fearing this reality. It is unacceptable. We are in desperate need of an integrated approach to really stem the tide of violence against women and children.

Chairperson, I began by saying how women are claiming their position in management roles and today I really wish to highlight this resilience despite these extreme adversities. Resilience is perfectly encapsulated in Afrikaans. The Afrikaans term is †Veerkragtig, en my los vertaling hiervan, Voorsitter, is “bons terug met grasie.” [and my loose translation for this, Chairman, is “bounce back with grace.”]

Chairperson, like events in 1956, the coronavirus pandemic will be recorded in history. Those women who come after us will read of how the women of 2020 have taken on COVID-19, what we have done not only in our households but how they have managed it in their streets and across communities. Women will read this and be encouraged to apply principles, encourage empowerment and carry the baton of resilience forward.

Chairperson, like Bette Midler ends off her song:

“Just remember in the winter, far beneath the bitter snows, lies the seed that with the Son’s love in the spring becomes the rose.”

Chairperson, that rose lies within every female resident. We can overcome; we will break boundaries and position ourselves to greater change free of abuse and with opportunities. Chairperson, I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Botha. I now recognise hon member Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Good afternoon Chairperson, Premier, Leader of the Opposition, Deputy Speaker and hon members.

Chairperson, COVID-19 has dealt a fatal blow to many families where women have been left to raise children alone after the passing-on of their husbands who were breadwinners. These are women such as Aunt Susanna Plaatjies of Buffeljags, a small town in Swellendam, who lost her husband due to COVID-19. Her husband was the breadwinner but now she has to provide for the family, and so many other women are facing the same challenge.

In marginalised communities the burden of caring for children, the sick and elderly, is latched on by women. During the nationwide lockdown Government’s containment measures such as school closure and curtailment of various health services placed an extra burden on women and young girls who now had extra duties such as caring for children who are out of school as

well as taking care of their ill family members. Women have an inherent instinct that allows them to care for the needy and those less fortunate than themselves without thinking twice.

Chairperson, during lockdown it became apparent that we were dealing with more than just the COVID-19 pandemic but GBV and femicide as well, which the President called the “second pandemic.” For far too long we as women stood on the side while women, girl children and even babies are being slaughtered by men.

Therefore our focus in this debate needs to go beyond the COVID-19 infections and mortality rate. It must extend to how COVID-19 has affected families thus far, particularly women and girls. Global statistics show that women are less likely to die from COVID-19 than men. However, this does not ease the extra burden that women had to carry during lockdown. The OECD painted a clear picture of the effects of the pandemic when they said that while the global fatality rates are higher for men, the socio-economic impact of the crisis is particularly severe for women.

In April the UN in its policy brief had noted that the pandemic is deepening pre-existing inequalities, exposing vulnerabilities in the socio-political and economic system which are in turn amplifying the impacts of the pandemic. This was the case for women on farms where the majority of them face the crisis of hunger during nationwide lockdown since they could not access the two main Government sources of livelihood support, namely the UIF

COVID-19 Temporary Employer and Employee Relief Scheme and the Social Relief Support through food parcels.

Chairperson, women were also amongst the first to bear the brunt of the pandemic as many women were in the frontline services in the sector; sectors mainly affected by cluster outbreaks. These include the retail sectors, agriculture, where women were exposed to the danger of the virus as they did not have adequate PPEs and sometimes forced to work in the environment where there was a complete disregard for occupation, health and safety. In the healthcare many women, particularly nurses, were exposed to the virus and some even died in the service of the people.

As we reflect on the challenges confronting women during this pandemic, let us salute these fallen heroes and sympathise with the families that lost their breadwinners.

Deputy Speaker, or Chairperson, the COVID-19 crisis is a watershed moment for South Africa to rethink the role of women in society and their participation in the economy and the country as a whole. It is time to prioritise gender equality. Let us stop paying lip service to the need to address gender inequalities. Actions speak louder than words. Now is the time to take practical steps to address the disparities exposed by the pandemic. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member

Windvogel. I now recognise hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Chairperson, and greetings to the House. The COVID-19 pandemic continues to have devastating socio-economic effects on the lives of many people, and more particularly women who still remain vulnerable in our society. There are three main issues that have impacted negatively on women, namely the economic impact, health and wellbeing, healthcare system. The economic impact on women includes the high rate of job losses and unemployment. Many women are working in informal jobs, generally earning less, saving less, usually holding unsecure jobs like domestic work or working in the hospitality industry. The majority of females are single parents, who usually have less access to social protection. The female-headed households were badly affected by the job cuts and lockdown.

According to the United Nations 2020, 740 million women globally work in informal sectors and that women are paid less than men in many industries. With the pandemic more than 1.5 million school children were not going to schools due to the school's closure and many would lead to early marriage and higher rate of pregnancy that would also increase the burden of social grants. This pandemic has affected the gains that have been made over the years of women progressing in the male-dominating workforce. Health and wellbeing include expected teen pregnancies due to school closures.

This trend was seen during the Ebola outbreak when more than 18 000 girls

became pregnant. Some health facilities are closed and with limited access to those that are operating.

There is also a spike in sexual, physical and domestic abuse. Many females have revealed that they were asked for sex by landlords where they could not afford to pay their rent and in South Africa there is a huge spike in reported cases of gender-based violence. Before the pandemic it was also reported that one in three women will experience violence in their lifetime.

I had a conversation with five heads of three female-headed households in Mfuleni. All five of them ran away from abusive relationships to build their own shacks. In many instances it is the male police officers who turn away these vulnerable in reporting their cases. Reduced access to health facilities and exclusion to treatment for females have impacted on their health. Several reproductive health facilities in different countries were deemed not essential, thus putting many lives at risk. Pregnant women are at risk of pregnancy-related complications.

In conclusion, Chairperson, the COVID-19 pandemic disaster is a disaster for everyone, particularly the females. Although the lockdown was necessary to save people's lives it had a negative impact on women reversing the gains that have been made over the years. Female-headed households suffered, especially those that lost their jobs.

There was also an increase in land occupation during the lockdown with more

than 70% of the occupation being females. Most of them reported that they were running away from the abuse. I thank you, Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise Minister Marais.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you Chairperson. Today we are addressing the challenges confronting women during the COVID-19 pandemic. However, if we are to adopt an honest and frank approach, the challenges we will hear about are not specific COVID-19, but always existed and were daily experiences long before, and if we are not proactive in our resolve, will be after COVID-19. Cultural life has taken a hit one way or another in terms of both social and economic impact. This pandemic has exposed some structural vulnerabilities and inequalities within our provinces and communities. The pandemic has further revealed inequalities facing vulnerable groups, in particular women.

Over these past five months, Minister Fernandez and our humanitarian response lead, HOD Brent Walters regularly reported on SASSA's failure to provide social relief funding and feed those in dire need as they are constitutionally mandated to do. We were pained to see the long queues at SASSA offices in adverse weather conditions and despite persistent engagement within regional and national offices; they failed to deliver when it was most needed.

In a bid to sustain their families mostly †gogos [grandmothers] were forced to line up outside these closed doors. Mostly girl-children braved the cold and stigma to stand in line to receive a warm meal from compassionate community leaders. Gender-based violence escalated and while no justice has been served for the many slain victims of this scourge, it remains a burning question and concern. The pandemic and subsequent lockdown regulations zoomed in and made even more obvious the unequal lived realities experienced as a woman in South Africa. 64 years after the iconic women's march to the Union Buildings and long after society allowed us pants and self-determination. While despondence in national policies and political will spike, we are in an opportune position to advance the agenda for women and strike while the proverbial iron is hot to disrupt the institutional, structural and societal patriarchy still oppressing us as women today.

During Women's Month I had a few virtual engagements with women in sport stakeholders, as we do, to discuss our very debate topic today. In one such Netball South Africa dialogue with all nine provinces and the National Deputy Minister, all of whom are women Ministers, in attendance, my provincial colleagues and friends, many in Opposition benches today, shared personal accounts of how structural patriarchy has prohibited many a woman from executive level or deserved jobs and significant roles in sport, based solely on the fact that they are women. High-ranking positions of key importance are secured for men, hence the masculine collective, "the fraternity."

Chairperson, yet and still despite it all we are resilient, persistent and ambitious. In the doom and gloom of it all, like a phoenix, women of this province rose to the challenges and true to form initiated Mental Wellness Outreach Programmes, amongst others, one of which was by our Provincial Women in Sport Commission which all federations in the province represented.

Chairperson, one of our own, a passionate official, started her own Zoom Yoga classes to encourage wellness and open channels of interaction, mainly to inspire motivation, reminding us all of the power, the compassion and the resolve of a woman on a mission.

To all the women in power, in a position of authority with even an inkling of influence in the House today, I urge you to join me in advancing the agenda of women, to open the doors we have become accustomed to being shut.

There is no time like the present and like Lenny Kravitz said, and the Deputy Speaker noted, and I quote:

“It is time to turn it over to the women. Men have had their chance to run the world, and look where we are.”

I thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

[Hon member Windvogel takes the Chair.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Minister Marais. Good afternoon, hon members. We will now continue with the Speakers Debate. I now recognise the hon member Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, Chairperson. According to the United Nations Women Report of April 2020 many women are trapped at home with their abusers and are at increased risk of other forms of violence as overloaded healthcare systems and disrupted justice services struggle to respond. If we are going to fight gender-based violence and domestic abuse, we need leaders who are angry about this scourge. We need leaders who will take action and we need leaders who are determined to move beyond constraints to make sure that not one woman more remains in danger.

We do not have those leaders in the Western Cape Provincial Government. We have wingers, blamers and women – yes, women – occupying leadership positions but unwilling to move mountains to protect another woman from a violent life. When we raised questions in this House about the transfer of six buildings for GBV shelters from the National Department of Public Works, to the Province, both the MEC for Social Development and the MEC for Education told us that they are unable to make progress because the mountain to move is a massive bill for renovations to the six buildings that the Department of Public Works wants to charge the Province. They suggested that the National Minister of Public Works had held a media event and they

have not followed through on the promise.

The facts are that the Minister of Public Works has been imploring this Government to make more rapid progress in finalising the transfer of the buildings. It is this Government that is stalling, incompetent or uncaring. The massive bill for the renovations is actually only about R100 000 per building and the Department of Public Works has even offered this Government a payment plan of R800 to R1 200 per month. It is disappointing, Chairperson, that this Parliament was led to believe that women in danger cannot be offered protection because the Provincial Government cannot afford the renovations bill. It is sad and painful that two women leaders in this Government chose to try score political points on the backs and on the lives of women across this province living in danger and looking for help. It is simply not credible that a small monthly cost of R800 to R1200 per month is a barrier to safety for women. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Herron, thank you very much. I now recognise the hon member Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you Chairperson. A lot of womens' challenges in South Africa did not arrive with COVID-19. The NDP correctly notes that despite over a decade into democracy too many people remain trapped in poverty and we remain a highly unequal society. Despite significant progress our country remains divided, which opportunity is still shaped by the legacy of apartheid. In particular, young people and women

are denied the opportunities to lead the lives that they desire.

In a society such as this it was always certain that women would most likely bear the brunt end of the virus. One example is the increased cases of gender-based violence. Example, in the increased cases of gender-based violence the nationwide lockdown provided a perfect storm for South Africa's GBV crisis. As communities we are advised to stay at home. Women and young girls were at a heightened risk for child abuse, domestic violence, sexual and other forms of intimate partner violence. Throughout the lockdown period I have been raising in the House through motions, statements and in debates the challenge of shortage of shelters for victim empowerment.

May I also add the homeless people – particularly women and children were not spared from the COVID-19 impact. The worst impact on this group included infringement on their dignity as shown by the ridiculous funds issued by municipalities, and the inhuman conditions they were exposed to in the Strandfontein concentration camp, which exposed some to danger of sexual violence. It is a well-known fact that while a disease outbreak such as COVID-19 and Ebola negatively impacts on health of all people, women are disproportionately affected as some measures taken by Government leave them vulnerable to [Inaudible.] One example is that the curtailment of health services put more women at risk of unplanned and unwanted pregnancies. Important services, such as abortion care and contraceptives, were affected as the closure of schools during lockdown left many young girls with no access

to the much-needed sanitary towels which they normally accessed at school through the Sanitary Dignity Project. In the Western Cape the budget for this all-important project was cut and the sanitary towels are kept in storerooms. Moreover, schools provide a safe environment for many children particularly young girls; they are protected from various abuses and certain behaviours. Losing the protection has had long-lasting implications including teenage pregnancies. In many families in the past there were rigid disciplinary practices such as if one falls pregnant, then she had to drop out of school to take care of the child which resulted in high school dropout rate. This contributed to the gender inequalities we experience today.

Another challenge that will hit us in the long run is children who will suffer from malnutrition and other challenges as a result of control measures that resulted in fewer visits to healthcare facilities for maternal health services. The outbreak of COVID-19 compels the Government to commit itself to put measures in place to end gender-based violence inequalities and to end gender-based violence at all. We reiterate the cause for Government to put measures in place to end GBV, including that perpetrators are remanded in prison without the possibility of parole.

Hon Speaker, the National and Provincial Government must strengthen its system to track the processing of GBV cases. While the Western Cape has Court Watching Briefs intended for this purpose, it is disappointing to note that they are not monitoring cases that involve Provincial Government employees. The case of the Provincial Treasurer office, which has been

postponed more than 13 times, is the case in point. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Bakubaku-Vos. I now recognise the hon member Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Chairperson. Hon Speaker, Deputy Speaker, hon Premier, Ministers and hon members, the COVID-19 pandemic represents a dreadful threat to all in our society but we must acknowledge the dire threat to women from the second pandemic of job losses, negative economic growth and spiralling public debt which will impact on the delivery of social services. In this second pandemic it is women who will be and are hardest hit by the economic crisis. This in turn will have a significant impact on our society given the number of female-headed households and the effect this will have on families and children.

Out of the estimated three million who have lost their jobs, just from the first phase of lockdown, two million of those are women. Women, who face a double disadvantage, as they were already amongst the most disadvantaged in the labour market, are now severely and disproportionately targeted by the economic ripple effects of COVID-19. The majority of such women are persons of colour, further demonstrating that we, as a nation, have a long way to go in eradicating the legacy of apartheid. Ours is an ongoing fight to achieve a full set of economic opportunities and emancipation of black women in particular. Nevertheless, Chairperson, COVID-19 has forced societies and governments the world over to embrace a new kind of normal.

As a result we are in a position to re-imagine our economic systems, adopt social support mechanisms and rethink afresh how we approach the role of Government in partnership with civil society and the private sector. In short, we have a chance to make amends and turn a new chapter. What this will require, however, is the voice of women to be heard, seen, appreciated, and for their voices to carry substantive weight. We need to be intentional about elevating our women to positions of power, not merely as tokens for the appeasement of patriarchal box-ticking exercises. The absence of women from the boardroom table means that for centuries our ideas have been sold short or suppressed altogether. This is not only of disadvantage to women but to men as well who stand to benefit from the leadership ingenuity and innovation of women.

Moving forward, Chairperson, we must realise that the job losses faced thus far may well be amongst only the first wave of direct job losses from sectors such as hospitality and tourism. These sectors in particular employ far more women than men and will require objective consistent regulations if we are to prevent further haemorrhaging of jobs. Through targeted interventions, much like our hotspot approach for the health pandemic and support to industries in safely reopening the economy, we can get the wheels of economic growth in motion. The recent launch of our *We Are Open Domestic Tourism Campaign* last week, combined with the awarding of the World Travel and Tourism Council Safety Stamp, is an indication that the Western Cape is dedicated to supporting these sectors and the thousands of women who work in them.

Last week black women in the South African wine industry marched to the Parliament to protest against the economic exclusion of their businesses during the development of the National Wine Industry Strategy. Indeed, their very presence and entrepreneurial spirit are a reminder of the resilience and ingenuity of the women of this country. Even in the face of economic hardships we improvise, develop and match the challenges of our times head-on. Through Government cooperation across all spheres and strategic allocations of resources and partnerships we can grow new markets, develop existing ones and craft niches to meet the demands of the day. In the ECD sector, which is almost entirely run and owned by women, many ECDs are unable to reopen without financial support. Mothers, especially single mothers, depend on their local ECDs to care for their children while they are away at work. Without this essential service, women will be left with the impossible choice of caring for their children or working to feed them.

With the impact on Government's ability to provide social services from the second pandemic we need to ensure greater support for female entrepreneurs in this sector or face even greater social and economic consequences.

The Western Cape has, however, already reallocated over R10 million worth of funding to this sector and provided protocols and training for safe reopening. Not only will we seek to grow the ECDs as job generators but also ensure that our children are provided with safety and educational nurturing whilst parents return to work.

This is an investment for our current economic standing but also that of the next generation – one already said to be strapped by debt.

The terrible economic uncertainty of this second pandemic will continue to impact women far more than men. It will continue to impact women far more than men and therefore, now more than ever, we must step up as a collective and say no to discrimination, no to sexual harassment in the workplace and no to unequal pay for women. Women are the backbone of our society and our economy and must be treated as such.

Finally, Chair, a message to the strong women of this House and all in the province in the words of Maya Angelou:

“Each time a woman stands up for herself, without knowing it possibly, without claiming it, she stands up for all women.”

This is a reminder that we are in this together, irrespective of our differences, ours is a collective struggle and each time we achieve a victory may we celebrate it together, uplift one another, and extend the ladder of success and opportunity to those still at the coalface of our battle for equality and prosperity on all fronts. I thank you, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Maseko. Hon member Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Chairperson. Lucinda Evans and Caroline Peters said, and I quote:

“In South Africa we are more at risk being raped and killed than contracting COVID-19. We have a government who does not care about our lives. We have a government who is not able to protect our bodies.”

Another mother said, and I quote:

“We had suffered severely under COVID-19 with no income. My husband is too proud to ask for help. I will steal in order to see that my two children do not go to bed hungry.”

Chairperson, this is the harsh reality that some of the people are facing in the Western Cape. The Western Cape Government will have to roll out more innovative plans to assist the people of the Western Cape especially our women who have lost their jobs, who ran their households in order to endure this hardship.

Then I spoke to a lady and she said, it was difficult under lockdown to escape her abusers but afterwards, now that she can go out, she sits today with physical and emotional scars.

I call on the Premier and the Minister of Community Safety to engage the National Minister of Justice to address the inadequacies – they need to speak

to the Minister of Justice to look at our criminal justice system. Our criminal justice system is failing our ladies and we need to attend to that. Hon Speaker, more must be done to assist our women and I want to close with the following and somebody once said:

“She overcame everything that was meant to destroy her.”

So I salute our women! I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Christians. I now recognise hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Speaker, cultures in South Africa that discriminate against women, impairing their dignity or denying them equality should be investigated. There are cultures within South Africa that treat women and children like consumable goods or disposable assets, offering free sex. I have frequently warned in this House the domestic abuse against women will increase during the lockdown and I have been proven to be correct. Under the lockdown period domestic violence has worsened. No woman deserves to be removed from the safety of their homes as a result of reporting abuse by a partner or a spouse, possibly hoping to bring his †loslappie [**mistress**] home.

Remove the abuser and place them in a facility for abusers. They should be named. They should be shamed. The Western Cape Government should propose recommending the removal of abusers instead of building more

shelters for their victims. Women's financial dependency on abusive husbands should be investigated and addressed too.

We need projects that will empower women to become financially independent. Men who abuse, rape and murder our women should never be allowed bail or parole. These men, especially repeat offenders, should be kept locked up and where possible be subjected to continuous legal monitoring. We need to protect the foundation of our nation, our women, for without them there can be no hope for a better South Africa.

We are killing future Helen Suzmans. We are killing Thuli Madonselas, Margaret Thatchers, Sofia Fosters and Cici Gools. We have become a nation of soft-hearted liberal *sissies*, showing compassion towards offenders instead of its victims. In such instances like the Chief Whip of the DA said...
[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Will you wrap up, hon member.

Mr P J MARAIS: ...compassion must be seen in such instances as a chronic weakness instead of an admirable strength. I thank you.

[Hon member Bakubaku-Vos takes the Chair.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise hon member G Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS: [No audible reply.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Brinkhuis, are you in the House?

Mr G BRINKHUIS: [No audible reply.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. We are moving forward. I now recognise hon member Bans.

Ms A P BANS: †Enkosi mhlali ngaphambili ndiyazibulisela kuwe Premier nakwiqembu elilapha phakathi endlini namhlanje, mhlali ngapambili [Thank you Chairperson, Premier and the parties. I greet you all inside the House, Chairperson.]

At its 54th National Conference the ANC noted that colonial oppression, discrimination and violence, including violence associated with systematic social and economic exclusion is what we have inherited, and we need to build a new society that is peaceful, equal and just, as envisaged in the NDP and the UN's Agenda of 2030 and Africa's Agenda of 2063.

The ANC further stated that inequalities at the social and economic levels over the centuries need to be addressed if we are to reduce social ills in our society. Central to the ANC's agenda to address these inequalities is the desire and commitment to increase the level of women empowerment.

Significant progress has been made in the public sector, even though more work still needs to be done, especially in the provinces like the Western Cape where senior managed posts are dominated by white males. The private... sector remains the biggest challenge. In the post-COVID-19 society the Government must take radical decisions to accelerate women empowerment to bring about transformation. Over and above, Government must continue the struggle against misogyny and patriarchal beliefs and tendencies that continue to oppress women.

The World Economic Forum agrees with this call as it is stated in May that given that the COVID-19 crisis affects men and women in different ways, measures to resolve it must take gender into account. It continued to say that the women and girls' vulnerabilities in the home on the frontlines of healthcare and in the labour market must be addressed.

†Sihlalo [Chair], I want to give an account of women vulnerabilities in the labour market. We are already experiencing the detrimental effects of COVID-19 in the economy which have disrupted many markets and supply-chains, causing businesses to close or downsize its labour force. Millions of workers have lost their jobs and livelihoods. There is resounding evidence to show that we will be disproportionately affected by the economic effects of COVID-19. The capacity of women to absorb economic shocks is less than of the men. This is because women earn less than men and many employed in the informal sector.

When the Provincial Government failed to set aside funding to preserve the livelihoods of informal traders, it contributed to women suffering. Many artists, which include women, lost their livelihoods during the nationwide lockdown.

When the entertainment industry came to complete shutdown this included the nightclubs, concerts and festivals where artists usually performed for an income. To this day I know of many women especially in the rural areas, who are still crying that they never received any form of support from the Government.

The COVID-19 crisis has exposed and exacerbated the inequalities gap between the men and women and it threatens to roll back the gains already made in the participation of women in the labour force. Industries like tourism, hospitality, retail and agriculture, which have threatened retrenchments, have an over-representation of women in the labour force.

†Mhlali ngaphambili [Chairperson], the COVID-19 crisis is sending a clear message to Government that there is an urgent need for the development and implementation of effective policy measures to accelerate gender equality. Now is the time to address the disparities exposed by this pandemic. The ANC in its *Reconstruction, Growth and Transformation: Building a New Inclusive Economy* discussion document has proposed a drastic measure to promote the participation of black women and youth in all economic levels. This resulting in transformed patterns of asset ownership and income

distribution in our society. Such is a Government.

In the DA, however, such is not the case as stated by the DA's caucus leader in Gauteng, John Moodey, in his resignation, that he was leaving because of the party's lack of principle in failing to appropriately deal with the redress in this most unequal society. One example is the removal of a PR councillor, Liezel Pienaar, replaced by a male candidate. The same is happening in the constituency offices. They combined the offices of Laingsburg and Prince Albert and retrenched [Inaudible.] and kept a young man.

To seal all of this [Inaudible.] an old white man moved from the Eastern Cape for employment in the Western Cape. Have we forgotten it is a crime to move from the Eastern Cape to seek opportunities in the Western Province? Or does this only apply to a certain race?

For once, let us agree that women are disadvantaged and we will do something about it as a collective. I thank you† mhlali ngaphambili
[Chairperson]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Bans. Let us move to hon member Philander. I now you recognise you, hon member.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, hon Chairperson. I wish to begin in tribute to the healthcare frontline workers who lost the fight against COVID-19. We are immensely grateful to these heroes for their courage, their

passion, and the ultimate sacrifices made so that we can be here today in health.

We salute their resilience, admire their grace, and aspire to their compassion as they serve the people of this province. No task is too great for these heroes, most of whom are women.

Hon Chairperson, according to the World Health Organisation the majority of health workers are women, including those at care facilities, an astounding 70%, almost 100 million globally. Female health workers are the unofficial drivers of the global health system, and the majority of health frontline workers amidst the COVID-19 pandemic are indeed female.

The pandemic also shed light on paid and unpaid care workers, as well as those less remunerated and not employed by the State. For instance, where men work just under one half hour of unpaid care, women take on well over four hours. This was amplified by school and ECD closures, and other care facilities for children.

The challenge women health professionals face is not just in the immense strain of saving lives, but in playing the caring role, both at home and at work. After spending long hours working at hospitals or clinics, many women return home to then care for their children and families. This double burden on women is further strained through other factors. For one, single parent households often mean the mothers bear the brunt of childcare responsibility.

They are responsible not just for the life of a patient at the hospital, but also the future of the next generation.

Where the husband and father is part of the family unit, he too often does not share in the duties of care at home, and the longstanding tradition of the mother taking full responsibility for domestic responsibilities and childrearing leaves the female health worker exhausted.

Added to this is the gender pay gap in the healthcare industry. On average, women earn 28% less than their male counterparts in the health profession. As if this was not enough, the gender bias in the industry and society at large adds to the already heavy psychological toll women face. Although we are seeing the growing participation of women in senior healthcare positions, there is a very long way to go.

Our patients and our healthcare system stand to benefit from the skills, the talent and the perspectives that we can bring, but we will need a global commitment to industry transformation in order to see this through. This begins at home and how we teach our children. If we perpetuate the assumption that a nurse is a woman and a doctor is a man, we only serve to fuel gender occupational segregation, already so rampant across all industries for that matter. How we talk impacts how we think and how we think shapes the structure of our society.

Hon Chairperson, the reality is that COVID-19 exposed the patriarchal

underbelly of not just the whole of society, but the systems and structures that underpin healthcare industries. In some of the worst instances we have seen women suffer a lack of access to medical healthcare or diversion of resources away from reproductive health to bolster the COVID-19 response. In various parts of the developing world we saw a decline in the availability of and access to sexual, neo-natal, and family planning medical resources.

Hon Chairperson, whilst many were isolating at home, it is these very women that were returning for work, under severe stress and fear for contracting the virus, and possibly transmitting it to their families. The stigma attached is also documented, as researchers note that despite the isolation at home still the fear remains for contracting the virus. This feeds into the pre-existing disproportionate levels of psychosocial trauma that women endure.

Yet, hon Chairperson, in the face of this all women have stepped up and stepped in. In the face of gender bias the woman physician serves. In the face of discrimination the woman doctor saves lives. In the face of blatant sexual harassment the woman nurse cares. In the face of domestic violence the woman specialist operates. In the face of unending hours and exhaustion the woman virologist breaks new ground.

A woman's place, hon Chair, is not in the kitchen; it is in the laboratory, it is in the operating theatre, it is in the hospital wards and corridors, it is at the healthcare boardroom table, it is at the Cabinet meeting.

Hon Chairperson, while COVID-19 has exposed the wounds of sexism and discrimination anew, it has also proven once more that in the face of adversity we as women gain new strength with each challenge and will instinctively and tirelessly save lives. Humanity owes a priceless debt to the women healthcare worker. I thank you, hon Chairperson.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Philander. I now recognise hon Deputy Speaker, B Schäfer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Chairperson, thank you hon members and ladies of this Parliament for contributing towards such an important debate. While we talk about feeding schemes and gender wage gaps, maternity issues, the success of women is still there against all odds, and you are right, hon member Windvogel, that this is a much deeper issue that must be looked at post-COVID-19, that unfortunately within this space inequality is still a massive issue, particularly after COVID-19. And that, hon member Makamba-Botya, that healthcare, the economy, and wellbeing, are key areas where women and young girls are being affected.

I just recently saw the 2020 Sustainable Development Goals Report which has indicated that there is an unprecedented crisis looming, and that the world's poorest and most vulnerable affected particularly, are those women after COVID-19, and that in particular, disruption to health and vaccination

services, and limited access to diet and nutrition, have the potential to cause hundreds of thousands of additional under 5 age deaths, and tens of thousands of additional maternal deaths in 2020. This is not just a phenomenon that happens here, but it really is a challenge that the whole world finds itself facing.

Hon member Herron, it is a pity that you are now creating a blame game of failure in this province. I think gender-based violence is endemic at all levels of our society. It does not sit in one hotspot or one area at all. If it was, it would be much easier to handle.

So the questions we must be asking ourselves is how do we pick up the pieces, especially in our country, in our communities, post COVID-19? How do we as women help raise healthy balanced boys who grow into healthy, stable, well-balanced men? And how do we instil good character skills that pay off for future generations of women in this country?

I know that hon member Bans also touched on that, and hon member Philander, you are so correct, how we talk and think shapes our patriarchal society.

But, hon members, I think that South Africa still has a long way to go. Our socio-economic and gender-based violence challenges, particularly felt on women, cannot improve until we take a hard line in the courts, as has been mentioned by hon member Marais, and where we have a whole of society

approach where everybody is involved.

While it takes a village to feed your child, the question really to us as women is how do we get that village to protect our †gogos [grandmothers], our mothers, our sisters, and our daughters, and to be able to empower them with skills and opportunities so that they no longer have to remain victims of abuse. I thank you. Thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. That concludes the Speaker's debate.

[The Speaker takes the Chair.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members, hon Premier, hon Deputy Speaker, the debate went very well.

Now we are moving to Interpellations and the first interpellation is by hon member Allen to the Minister, hon Minister Fritz. Where is the correct one? Give me the correct one. You see the Table staff want to give me the correct one. Thank you very much. Thank you.

Thank you, hon members. The interpellation is by hon member Xego to hon Minister Simmers. I now recognise hon member Simmers, the Minister.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Yes, hon member Makamba-Botya, you may come through, but I just received your email.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Okay. No, I was ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Is it in that regard?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Yes, hon Speaker, it is.

The SPEAKER: All right.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTHA: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Let me just address the House. Hon members, hon Xego is not here, and in terms of the Rules with the adequate notice to the Executive, to the Presiding Officer, the opportunity will be granted to hon member Makamba-Botya to take over from hon member Xego in this regard.

So may we then give an opportunity to hon member Makamba-Botya who is going to speak in response to every slot by the hon Minister.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Point of order, hon Speaker.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Speaker, I had a conversation with the Chief Whip and according to the Rules the interpellation had to be taken to the next

sitting in his absence.

The SPEAKER: Okay.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Makamba-Botya. Well, that is with reference to the motions, right?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): No. Hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: All right.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you, hon member Makamba-Botya Hon Chief Whip, before I recognise you, there are at least two emails from hon member Makamba-Botya. I thought she was talking to another one. So let me apologise for that. I recognise you, hon Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. The Rules require, under Rule 198, that the interpellant must respond to the reply in the speech.

So I do not know if the Rules would permit for a speaker to be interchanged with another person that is not the interpellant, and therefore on that

interpretation of the Rules, the EFF has requested that this interpellation in fact be withdrawn and it will then be resubmitted in a subsequent sitting.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip, you are correct.

Now we have no interpellations. Thank you very, hon members, we have no interpellations, and therefore we move to Questions. There are a number of questions, in fact Question 4 and Question 7 will stand over, but Question 6 has been withdrawn.

Now the first question – and I see the hon Premier is looking at me. Yes, it is to you, hon Premier by hon member Makenzie. Now I recognise the hon Premier.

[Interpellations withdrawn.]

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Work-from-home People Management Strategy

1. Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Premier:

(a) What has been the work-from-home People Management Strategy for the employees of the Western Cape Government during COVID-19 and beyond, (b) how has this been implemented, (c) where necessary, how

has this been communicated to residents, for example at provincial service centres, and (d) how has this been communicated to staff?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much hon Speaker and thank you very much to the hon member for the question.

Part (a): With due consideration to department operational requirements, employees that were able to render a service remotely were encouraged to do so.

As at 28 August 2020, which is the latest available data for which this information is available, 10,2% of the total Western Cape Government employee population was working remotely. The percentage of total employees coming to the office on a full-time basis at present is 83%. The trend through the various lockdown levels for employees coming to the office on a full-time basis, is as follows:

- Lockdown Level 5 – only essential service employees were required to come into the office on a full-time basis.
- Lockdown Level 4 – 38% of employees came into the office on a full-time basis.
- Lockdown Level 3 – 86% of employees came to the office on a full-time basis.
- Lockdown Level 2 – 83% of employees came to the office on a full-time basis.

Now probably someone will raise a question immediately, why on Level 3, 86% and then Level 2, 83%? I must say I asked exactly the same question, but if you will remember that at one stage we actually had a further closure in our schools, where one week specifically was taken in the Western Cape, but it also then created an anomaly between those two numbers, so that explains those two differences, but of course our schools are now back in full swing.

Then (b): Guided by the Western Cape Government's alternative work arrangements and consequent representative departmental work arrangements policies, employees were entered into remote work arrangements. Individual outputs and the overall outcome are measured according to the individual performance agreements, business plans, and ultimately the departmental Annual Performance Plan.

(c): The Department of the Premier's Cape Access Centres were closed from mid-March and are still in the process of reopening. As respective host facilities and venues reopen, we manage to make sure that vulnerable staff are still protected.

The hon member is advised to also refer this question to the service delivery departments as they may have communicated directly with their clients or residents in respect of the work from home policy.

And then (d) – or the last part: The transversal communiques to all Western

Cape Department staff were published in the Western Cape Government's internal intranet, myGov, for all staff to access. In addition, various other platforms are utilised for communication to staff, such as departmental newsletters, the MS Teams groups, WhatsApp groups, emails, and correspondence, and for example the DG sends a regular staff newsletter and has been increasing those frequencies during this period of lockdown. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Speaker. Thank you for the answer, Premier.

Hon Premier, can you share with us, how has this been received by the employees in the Department, and similarly has there been data or funding made available to these individuals that worked from home? Thank you.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much for the follow-up. If you remember in the Adjustments Budget in certain departments, and of course departments are different, we had to make data available.

So data was purchased and put onto dongles. I do not have the exact number, but it was in the Adjustments Budget that we dealt with here. That is one example.

But of course, of the departments are different, so the Department of Education would have been very different to the Department of Health. The Department of Health were on duty from day one, and of course in the administrative departments, what we really tried to do is also move officials that were able to perhaps go and help in other spheres.

So, for example, I know at the Hospital of Hope, within the Health Department, we had volunteers moving in from the Prosthetics Department, because they did not really have much work, and so they moved in to help in the Hospital of Hope. Or, for example, people in the Premier's Department who deal with events; events were stopped so they helped in the call centres, for example.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. I recognise hon member Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Speaker. It sounds as if the whole process has been successful in terms of how it has been implemented, and we know that certainly in the City of Cape Town we have a severe traffic congestion problem, and a public transport system that is under strain, and I am wondering if the lessons learned from this period cannot be extended as was discussed between the Western Cape Provincial Government and the City of Cape Town about three years ago, as a travel demand management strategy, where staff can work remotely in order to assist in alleviating traffic congestion, and also for Government to lead the way and to lead by example?

So if the Provincial Government and the City of Cape Town will allow its staff to work remotely, we can then move on to large employers and encourage them to do the same thing.

So I am wondering if the Premier sees this as an opportunity and whether there are any plans, or whether there could be any plans to extend this? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Herron. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you to the hon member for the question.

I definitely do. I know that, I have even asked the DG within the Premier's Department to say how can we play a leading role? Let us find what kind of percentage of people in the Department could continue to work from home. In other words if you are a front desk service provider in one of our entrance areas, then it is probably not so easy to work from home, but if you are in a management role that you could work from home.

So we are busy working out how can we still get together, perhaps at a later time on a Monday morning, where you bring the team together, but then the rest of the time they would work from home? So you would have sort of face-to-face management, but you would also have a percentage working from home, which is the kind of idea that you were talking about, because if we

can get 10 or 20%, it will definitely have a reduction in congestion, or even if we started to shift hours when you do come into the City. That is the first point.

I think there are obviously also numbers, when I was looking at these numbers and in the reporting, that you almost feel that there is a lot of people coming to work, but you do not feel it when you are in the city centre, because if you speak to businesses in the city centre there might be congestion in the mornings, but the city centre is still dead, because there is lots of office space that is dead, and it is about trying to find that balance between the two. But I definitely think there are opportunities for Government to play a leading role, and then I think the next stage are the banks and the big employers that are in the city, who I think are also already leading in some of these areas where they – I know when they built the First National Bank tower, they only built 75% of the desks for 100% of the staff.

So they already started with those processes, but I have no doubt that COVID-19 has helped us take a massive leap forward, and we have just got to make sure that we do not slip back. So I think it is a huge opportunity to make sure that we build this into how we operate going into the future.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon members, I recognise hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Speaker and hon member Herron, who

took one of my questions. [Laughter.]. Hon Premier, just a follow-up on that question, which I think is a very important question for all of us, and my opinion has been that I have seen almost an increase of productivity in some people working from home, and that is my experience. From administrators replying to emails, some late at night, on weekends, that they previously have not done so, and I have seen in my experience there has been an increase in productivity.

And given hon member Herron's question and what you have said earlier, looking at, from the Department of the Premier – and I do not want to make it sound compulsory - the sort of a percentage, or the numbers you used were 86% and 83%, that we should look at 15 or 20% of staff administrators to start working from home; are those the kind of things that we are looking at going into the future? Thank you.

The PREMIER: Thank you, hon Speaker, thank you to the hon member.

As I said, so far it is 10,2% that are working from home at the moment and I agree with you, how do we get it to a greater percentage, number 1, but number 2, what we also have to get is a change in mindset of how we do things, because we have got to move from hours in the day to tasks.

So to get this right you cannot say well, you have got to work from eight until four, or whatever those hours are, because there is no one to manage that, so then it is about tasks. It is about as long as you do the following

things and they are completed – well, when you do them and how you do them, as long as the taxpayer and the citizen is getting value for that specific job and that specific salary.

So that is what we have got to grapple with now. But I agree with you that we need to set some benchmarks, and again, every department is going to be different. For more administrative departments, it might be easier, but of course for the bigger frontline service departments it is much more difficult, but I agree.

Then perhaps my last point on this is that I was immensely proud of the response of the administration during the peak in COVID-19. We were having strategy sessions on Sundays; we were having three Cabinet meetings a week. Between that the other meetings were happening. You would be sending emails at 11 o'clock at night and Government officials were replying to the emails, and you would almost say to a message, "Get some rest now, I mean, come on." And at 11 o'clock on a Sunday night the strategy sessions have gone on and on and you sit there, and you look at who is on the team meeting and you think, "Wow, this is just amazing."

And I really felt proud and I really thank the people in this province; the staff, the people that work for this Provincial Government and the services that they were giving through this period to the citizens, but we also have to bring in a sort of - and I heard it is kind of the debate on the radio at the moment - people are asking these questions, when do you turn off? And when

do you expect – now people send you an email and then you get a WhatsApp to say, “I have sent you an email and you have not answered me yet.” And this is seven or 8 o’clock at night and you think to yourself, well, I wonder at what stage a government official – a politician may be a bit different - also has to get to a space where we do not want burnout, but we also want to learn the lessons of COVID-19 to say how do we take the energy to a new level, utilising all of these learnings so we deliver better for the citizens of the province?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. I do not see more hands. I guess – Hon member Baartman. Thank you.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Thank you, hon Speaker. I just wanted to know, given that Stage 4 load shedding commenced yesterday and continued today, some of the hon members here today actually physically, digitally cannot log into the Provincial Parliament sitting at home because there is load shedding in our area at the moment; how has that impacted on the work from home policy of Government, especially today when we are going into a setting where some municipalities are on Stage 4, while the City of Cape Town is on Stage 3 due to our extra capacity? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Baartman. Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Thank you, hon Speaker, and the hon member Baartman for the question.

It is a big problem. I know that today I had a weekly digicon or press conference, and we had to delay it by half an hour because a lot of the journalists were not able to log on. I know that when the load shedding goes on where I stay, the cell phone towers just are not able to maintain the connectivity, and then of course any of that connectivity just drops off.

So obviously that has a huge negative affect on this new normal that we are speaking about, and it is all very well saying 10% of the workforce are working from home, but if they are not going to be effective because of the load shedding, then it is absolutely counterproductive.

So yes, it is a big issue. I know that a lot of the discussion with the cell phone people was how to find new ways. They were also having their battery systems stolen, trying to find new ways which enables them to keep signal going, but of course Stage 4 load shedding is also massively detrimental not only to the ability of Parliament to work, or Government to work remotely. The impact on our economy is just devastating.

We had a session yesterday where we are in the recovery discussions as a Bosberaad, as Cabinet, and so what we did is we asked a few business leaders or business people to come and tell us about their situation, and it is interesting.

So especially people setting up their businesses from home and the impact that load shedding is having on them, it is devastating; it really is devastating

to businesses. I am sorry that the work that has been done over the last few years to mitigate load shedding risks in the City, where we can probably drop on whole load shedding level as you have said, from 4 to 3 in the City, we are not able to do it across the province, or even have now sufficient power to do it across the country.

Now it is really more urgent than ever before to allow our municipalities to put in those 10 megawatt plants to actually enable in a greater way private businesses and households to also put on solar systems so that we can build or mitigate this risk, which is probably one of the biggest negatives on getting any business confidence post-COVID-19, and this really is exacerbating it as we get load Schedules 4 and the potential is even going worse than that over the next couple of days and of course, we also hear from Eskom, in the next couple of years. How do you build business confidence when those kinds of messages are coming out?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon members, that concludes Question 1 to the hon Premier. The next question is hon member Brinkhuis asking the question to the Minister of Education. I recognise the Minister, Minister Schäfer.

Schools: liquor sales at events

2. Mr G Brinkhuis asked the Minister of Education:

- (1) (a) How many schools have applied to sell liquor at school events since January 2019 and (b) what criteria are used when evaluating applications from schools to sell liquor?

- (2) whether her Department reports illegal shebeens operating near schools; if not, why not; if so, what action has been taken against these shebeens?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker, and to hon member Brinkhuis.

The answer to part 1(a) is we have received 14 applications for liquor consumption or sales that were approved by the Head of Department.

Part (b): The Head of Department in terms of Section 45(b)(11) of the Western Cape Provincial School Education Act has issued the Western Cape Education Department guidelines for the consumption or sale of alcoholic liquor on school premises, or at a school activity.

These guidelines are designed to provide procedures to be followed by the governing body or principal of a public school when applying to the Head of Department for authorisation to permit the consumption or sale of alcoholic liquor on school premises. They also make provision for ensuring that no learners are present when alcoholic liquor is consumed or sold and ensure that there are safety measures in place during the consumption or sale of

alcoholic liquor.

The application requires the governing body or principal to provide sufficient particulars to enable the Head of Department to make an informed decision to specify the estimated dates and types of staff and school functions or other activities, to indicate arrangements that are in place or will be made to ensure safety at the school function or other activity, and to indicate if learners will be present at the activity and measures planned to be taken to avoid exposing the learners to the consumption or sale of alcohol.

In considering whether to grant the authorisation, the Head of Department must have due regard to the following:

- The policies of the Western Cape Government regarding alcohol harms reduction.
- The religious ethos of the school and the community.
- The motivation for the application.
- Whether the authorisation will be beneficial to the school.
- Safety measures adopted by the school.
- Any other factors which the Head of Department may deem relevant in reaching an appropriate decision.

The HOD may refuse or may grant the authorisation applied for by the governing body or principal. Unless the authorisation granted by the HOD is limited to a particular event or events or to a stipulated timeframe through

the conditions imposed with the authorisation, the authorisation will remain valid for one specific academic year.

The school must apply annually, indicating the relevant events or school activities. These planned events and activities must be communicated when the governing body prepares the budget for consideration and approval. If a governing body or a principal is granted the authorisation, the governing body or principal may not compel any school staff member to participate in the function if the latter is unwilling due to religious, cultural, or other reasons. The governing body or principal must ensure that the consumption or sale of the alcoholic liquor on school premises or at a school activity is managed and monitored, and that they familiarise themselves with the contents of the Western Cape Liquor Act and any other applicable legislation, regulations, or bylaws relating to the consumption or sale of alcoholic liquor.

A governing body or principal must ensure that the proceeds derived from the school activity are reflected in the financial statements of the school. The proceeds generated from the consumption or sale of alcoholic liquor must be used only for educational purposes.

Question 2: The WCED has had complaints regarding illegal shebeens near schools. School principals are advised to contact the relevant law enforcement authorities as this does not fall under our control. We do not keep records of the action taken against these shebeens as we are not privy to this information. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Schäfer. Hon member Brinkhuis, do you have a follow-up?

Mr G BRINKHUIS: [No audible response]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Brinkhuis. I now recognise hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and thank you to the Minister for the response.

Mine is a follow-up to the second part firstly. With regards to those schools that were built near shebeens, that were already existing, such as what we have seen, for example, in the Mitchells Plain area, Tafelsig to be specific, how will this matter be dealt with?

Then with regard to part (1). Given the low numbers of schools that have applied to sell alcohol, what does the Minister think could be the possible reasons for that? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Sayed. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker. I think that was two questions, but, hon member Sayed, as far as schools that are [Inaudible – audio distorted.] existing, I cannot answer completely – I think that is quite a

technical legal issue, but if schools are already present, then usually that would be a ground for objecting to the granting of a liquor licence, but it is also quite difficult to take away people's existing rights, which is problematic.

I do, however, have a concern in that we have recently had a new licence near one of our schools that has been applied for, to which we did object and our objection was not upheld by the Liquor Authority and that was a concern. I think, if I recall correctly, we even appealed against it and did not win that appeal.

So it is not an easy issue at all, but we do object where we can. Obviously I cannot speculate on the issue about what schools do and do not at all. I think this is also still quite a new procedure, so perhaps they still have not quite got into it yet, but that is also fine. People were saying they were going to do it on a wholesale basis, which just shows that is not the case. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, I recognise hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. I just want to ask the Minister in regard to learners, what is the WCED doing to help address the problem of alcohol use amongst our learners?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Botha. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker and hon member Botha.

We have an ongoing programme to try and curb all kinds of substance abuse amongst learners. We have referral mechanisms at our schools, we have our Safe Schools call centre, we do also have psychosocial support available. We have Safe Schools holiday programmes very often also to ensure that learners are not left unsupervised. We have our Transform to Perform strategy where we are focusing on different values. We also do work with SAPS and law enforcement to address all illegal activities at schools. Our life orientation curriculum includes material on substance use and abuse. Our schools staff are also trained to detect alcohol experimentation and abuse by learners and refer them to the appropriate support sooner.

We also do have strong partnerships with other departments and agencies as part of our Safe Schools strategy; over five programme areas enhancing safety and safe and secure mechanisms at schools; enhancing school safety management systems; facilitating the appropriate law enforcement; building cohesive school community culture, which is located in a community orientated problem-solving approach, and also a Limiting Substance Abuse programme which is led by the Department of Social Development. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Schäfer. Hon members, I recognise hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Minister, you know the thing that we lack, and I am only speaking for my own community, the Coloured community, are role models. That is something we need very much, role models.

Now what is your view on the consumption at school functions by teachers? Is there a limit to which they can drink, or can they drink until they fall to the ground? And what example do they then set for these children that we are trying to uplift, to make morally upstanding community members? What is your personal view on students being witness to the amount of liquor their own teachers can consume at such functions? Is there a limit or is there freedom of choice for these teachers in terms of how much liquor they can consume? And what example do you think they set for future leaders or children at these schools?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marais. I recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker and hon member Marais.

Yes, I completely agree with you that we do need role models and you may recall from my initial response that the guidelines that have been issued by the Department that the HOD takes into account when making such a decision, is to ensure that no learners are present when alcoholic liquor is

consumed or sold at school premises.

It is for adult functions only and so therefore the situation should not arise that the hon member has mentioned, and that is exactly the reason for that provision being in the guidelines. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, I now recognise hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you to the Minister.

I just want to find out, since the inception of the Bill to sell alcohol at school premises, have there been cases where the schools were not compliant with the whole process in terms of making sure that they are compliant? And if that is the case, is there a process in place by the Department of Education to revoke those liquor licences from those schools that are not compliant? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Makamba-Botya. I now recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Speaker and to the hon member.

I have not personally had any complaints of people not complying, and if there are any such cases, please will you refer them to me, because there is a provision in place that if they do not comply with the conditions that are specified then the permission can be revoked.

Likewise, with any school that may still be engaging in these activities and not having applied, they would equally be falling foul of this. Thank you very much.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Schäfer. Hon members, in the absence of hon Xego, the Minister can submit the response in writing, otherwise we are going to entertain Question 4, and that is by hon member Mackenzie to the hon Minister of Agriculture.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: That question has been withdrawn.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Mackenzie, Question number 3 will stand over, but we are moving to Question 4 and recognise the hon Minister.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Hon Speaker, due to the ... [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker ... [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ...bereavement in Dr Meyer's family, that question will stand over until next week.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mackenzie. I already indicated; now it is my own omission. We have Question 5. Hon Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. I just wanted to reiterate that the hon Minister Meyer had tendered an apology for today's sitting.

The SPEAKER: Yes, thank you, hon Chief Whip. For the record, hon members, Question 4 and Question 6 will both stand over, as well as Question 3. Are we all on the same page? All right, thank you. I now recognise the hon Minister of Health, hon Minister Mbombo.

[Questions 3 and 4 standing over.]

COVID-19: prolonged symptoms

5. Ms M M Wenger asked the Minister of Health:

Whether her Department is tracking cases of prolonged COVID-19 symptoms, often referred to as "long COVID-19"?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: [No audible response.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Mbombo?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: [No audible response.]

The SPEAKER: I do not know whether there is still load shedding where you are, hon Minister Mbombo?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Speaker, I see the Minister has just joined us again online. I am not sure if she heard that she was called?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Yes, I only heard the last part. I keep on moving. I keep on shifting spaces in the house because of load-shedding.

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Mbombo, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Can you hear me, hon Speaker?

The SPEAKER: Yes, we can all hear you, hon Minister Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Okay. Thank you for the question, hon member Wenger, about the prolonged COVID symptoms referred to as “long COVID-19”.

Patients with prolonged symptoms of COVID do get treated in our clinical services. For example, at Groote Schuur, the pulmonologist and

endocrinologist specialists follow up on their patients whom they have diagnosed as such, but there is no formal registry.

In the Tygerberg Hospital, which is the second central hospital for COVID, because we have got two central hospitals, specialised hospitals – they do have a multi-disciplinary post-COVID clinic which focuses on patients with ongoing respiratory symptoms.

At this stage we are busy with a project that focuses on the long-term effects of having contracted COVID, specifically on those patients with diabetes and also those who are elderly, but there is no routine registry to track COVID patients once they have been discharged.

Of course, where patients do have serious residual problems as consequences of having contracted the virus, there is a follow-up by a multi-disciplinary team once they get discharged.

So that is where we are in regard to long-term, long COVID-19. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Mbombo. Hon members, I recognise hon member Wenger, the Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Through you to the Minister, there is a growing body of information about a group of individuals

that had contracted COVID, many of whom were not sick enough to end up in hospital care and were at home, but who did not recover after three weeks and several months later continue to experience symptoms.

We see support groups in other countries starting to develop and I would like to understand whether this is something that the Health Department has on its radar and whether there might be some research or resources into these patients with long COVID, that were not necessarily hospitalised, but who some time later still suffer severe fatigue and in some cases still continue to have symptoms that prevent them from continuing their lives as they did before contracting the illness?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: In terms of the follow-up by the Department, if we have been in the system, diagnosed with COVID, in the 10 days that you are in isolation you are still part of the system. Therefore we have an obligation to check up on you if you end up having other complications or there is a need to come to a health facility, that is when we will be able to follow up.

But in a case where you might have been diagnosed with COVID and you have completed your 10 days, we do not follow up in that regard. However, in a case where you might need to come back to the hospital for various reasons, that is when we at least could be able to do so. Taking note of how

many positive cases we have we will not be able to know exactly what is happening with those patients, but the patients who have comorbidities, who perhaps have been hypertensive prior to getting COVID, they are still going to come to the facility for their hypertension anyway and it therefore becomes easier to follow up on those cases. But generally, for other patients that are out of the health system, we would not know, unless they have a condition or problem that will end up resulting in them coming to the facility.

Secondly, we are now conducting surveillance regarding the serology, to test antibodies, just to see to the magnitude of the epidemic at the time, specifically now that the epidemic has declined, the peak has declined.

So it will also provide an opportunity for us to pick up some patients who might actually, as you indicated, hon member Wenger, not have been in our system, for example, those ante-natal care patients who during pregnancy might not have known that they are positive. When we take these bloods randomly, we will be able to see many of these COVID cases. With some patients, especially among men presenting for HIV, we might have also that opportunity.

And now lastly, the National Department and the Human Sciences Research Council and NICD are together with us in the Western Cape. We are already exploring the serology where they will conduct household surveys, meaning going door-to-door, getting blood specimens from certain areas, which at this

stage we do not have the specifics for, so that we will be able to see those who might have fallen through the cracks. We must take into consideration the excess deaths that have been picked up by the MRC, those patients who might not been in our system and not knowing whether they are positive or not, but they have died and are being picked up through registrations with Home Affairs. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Mbombo. Hon member Bans?

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, hon Speaker. My question to the Minister is if you are diagnosed with this prolonged COVID-19 you will go to Groote Schuur or Tygerberg; in a case where you are outside of the Metro, where will you be treated for it? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Barnes. Hon Minister Mbombo?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: In each and every district, because Health is planned according to districts. Within the districts there are sub-districts; outside the Metro we have sub-districts in a district using municipality boundaries. The Metro is also a district on its own, it is a health district according to our definition.

So for each and every one of those there is a package of comprehensive care starting at the lower level, which is home-based care up to the level of the specialisation. For example, in the Garden Route the Level 2 hospital is the

George Hospital, which has specialisation there. Each and every Level 1, which is a district hospital, whether it is in Mossel Bay, whether it is Riversdale, whether it is Oudtshoorn and all of those, they would be able to refer their patients that need Level 2 of specialisation to George.

I was in George a few weeks ago where we saw how they have expanded the beds to accommodate the Garden Route and also service the Central Karoo, and about 24 staff members were appointed. They were coming from the CTICC and already they were appointing them in George. The same applies with some of the staff who volunteered in Tygerberg and have been exposed to working with COVID, they are already there.

So Level 2 is there in the Garden Route and Central Karoo. If there is a need to refer to Level 3, there is Groote Schuur as well as Tygerberg for that. It is a similar thing in the Metro. Khayelitsha is a Level 1, Karl Bremer is a Level 1, Mitchells Plain is a Level 1. They also will refer Metro East to Tygerberg; Metro West will refer to Groote Schuur.

In the Cape Winelands we have got two Level 2 hospitals, which are the Worcester Hospital and also the Paarl Hospital where they would be able to absorb other referrals, let us say from Stellenbosch. In Stellenbosch we have seen how they have increased their beds; they have even got palliative care beds, and they also have beds for high flow oxygen, although it is specialisation for Level 2.

So in all of these areas we do have such kind of referrals beyond the Metro. The same in the West Coast where we have got the Vredendal Hospital, Clanwilliam, Citrusdal, Berg River. Each and every one has a referral pathway, for example, they can go to the Paarl Hospital or they can go to another Level 2 in the Metro, like New Somerset in the case of, for example, Vredenburg.

So each and every area has got its own package. You will see a similar thing in the eight substructures in the Metro and a similar thing the rural areas. So there is no area that is left behind. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Mbombo. I do not see – all right, hon member Philander.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Can the Minister perhaps indicate how many of these prolonged cases have been admitted, if any, and did it have any impact on the health system at that point? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Philander. Hon Minister Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you for the question.

As I indicated earlier, there is no requirement for such a registry. However, if for example the patient has a residual issue related to the lungs, pulmonary,

then a lung specialist might want to see that specific patient just to see that the patient has probably been cured or might need to be referred for physio or whatever, then that patient will continue, as part of the multi-disciplinary team in that aspect.

Where we have been focusing now is on the diabetes project, because diabetes, whether it is in mild form or severe, does have quite an impact in terms of the complications when combined with COVID. So this is where we do have that data as part of the pilot and already we have seen many patients now that have been discharged within that pilot.

Then there are other areas of specialisation depending on the condition.
Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Mbombo. You are not off the hook yet. The next question is by hon member Philander to the Minister of Health. I recognise you, hon Minister Mbombo. That is Question 8.

[Question 6 withdrawn and question 7 standing over.]

COVID-19: impact on healthcare workers

8. Ms W F Philander asked the Minister of Health:

Whether she can provide an overview of the impact of COVID-19 on healthcare workers, with specific reference to (a) the way this has been monitored by the Department and (b) what is being done to mitigate the effects; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Yes, thank you, thank you, hon Speaker. Thank you, hon member Philander for the question.

An integrated monitoring and reporting system has been developed in the province to track both public and private health workers which we started very early and we are very fortunate that private health were also on board. As at 26 August there were about 4,549 health workers that have been infected and out of those almost 95%, which is 4,333, have already recovered. In the public sector alone we can equate that to about 13,9% of the infection rate.

In terms of the direct protection, there was an internal occupational health and safety, OHS, work group that was established with the input from top infectious disease specialists and senior management that were tasked to develop a range of policies and guidelines to guide safety practices at all facilities. You will hear of health workers where they named them in terms of the circulars or the policies that were developed by names like EN745, HC434, something like that. If you are not part of the healthcare workers, you would not even know what it actually means, yet, they know what it is with regard to, whether it is part of the PPE or other preventative measures.

So, it is part of the OH practices that were implemented.

They ranged from issuing protective equipment and also in terms of how to practice in order to avoid exposure, especially in high risk areas and also to implement measures to protect the families of staff members and to isolate vulnerable staff, especially those with comorbidities. Also, some interventions are actually related to psycho-social support via the Employee Wellness Programme and the Leadership Development Programme, where we prioritise our staff. At the time we had a different strategy for testing. The healthcare workers were prioritised

In terms of transportation, together with the Public Works Department, we implemented the Red Dot taxi service, especially for those staff members who left work after seven, during the time that public transport was not available for those who were using it.

The same applies with the flu vaccine which we had prioritised for staff and the elderly as well, because of their high exposure rate, and we keep on urging and encouraging the staff to remain vigilant in observing the golden rules of the hygiene practices, the wearing of masks, taking into consideration that some staff might not necessarily have been infected in the workplace. It might be outside. Or if it is a workplace, some of them were not necessarily infected in the clinical area where they work. It might have been in the tearooms or in the corridors. So, there they also have to be vigilant. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Philander?

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, hon Speaker. Thank you very much, Minister. In terms of the Employee Health and Wellness Programme, Minister, through you Speaker, specifically for psychological aid to healthcare workers, what was the response of the workers and what was the Department's approach accordingly? Was it a more preventative approach or what kind of approach did the Department enhance in psychological support? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thanks you, hon Philander. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, hon Speaker. Thank you, hon member. It is a whole package. It is psychological related where we have psychologists as part of the package and in some of the facilities, for example on the West Coast, they even approached the Metropolitan to assist them at a facility level. Taking note that some of these interventions were already available even before COVID-19, but now they needed to be customised in order to fit and also expanded to the families of staff members. For example, the EMS attacks are not necessarily related to COVID-19, but they still have to be part of the package.

In the 337 plus of the facilities that we have I think already more than 80% have established OH as committees, because it is part of the requirement that at each and every facility, depending on the size of the facility, there should

be these committees and organised labour is part of that space too.

In addition, all of these interventions should not only be happening at that level, but also at top management level. We have two organised labour members that were elected by Labour, who form part of the provincial OHS Committee, where they deal with these kind of issues in terms of input, especially with the concerns that would have been raised by some of the staff members which we have seen now were part of NEHAWU and the protests that took place throughout the country.

Then lastly, we have got a buddy-system, where they are paired to support each other so that one would be able to look out for or check on other peers, in the case of not only not coming to work but also if there is any kind of need that the person might have, but it is difficult to highlight or engage with the employer or immediate supervisor. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Kama. I recognise you.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, hon Speaker and let me thank the MEC for the responses that have been given so far. I think, hon Speaker, we have to agree that 4 000 plus health workers have been infected or 13% of the Government employees, if I heard the MEC correctly on that one.

I want to ask, because there were incidents, I do not remember where I read this, where some health workers claimed that in some instances where a

positive case has been found amongst them, they were told not to talk about this and in turn, were expected to work in those conditions with no other protective measures being followed.

Now, I want to ask if any of these or similar instances have been reported to the MEC and what was the response and what have we done to prevent such from happening as that might contribute to an increase in the infection rate of these hard-working health workers? Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, hon Speaker. Thank you, hon member. I must put it on record here that in the Western Cape so far there has been no shortage of PPE. However, I must indicate as well that at the beginning, because it was a new virus and people were not exactly sure how people got infected, everyone was understandably afraid.

Even if PPE was recommended in a specific area and although we conducted risk exposure assessments and analysis, we found that some staff members, specifically for example the EMS, who still felt that the PPE that was provided was inadequate. So, the area might require A, B, C of PPE, but you would find that they wanted D, E, F. So, in those cases, irrespective that they wanted D, E, F, we would not be able to provide D, E, F – for example, the white suit where even in the ICU of COVID-19 cases where there is a high level of infection, even the ICU staff do not wear it.

So, at the beginning there were those kind of tensions, but with the weekly engagements, using different methodologies and all of those, it ended up where staff became part of not only the decisions but also understood the bigger picture. And as we grew in understanding the virus, they became comfortable.

In terms of the percentage, one infected healthcare worker is too many. One death of a healthcare worker is too many. So, I do not want to be seen to dismiss the numbers but I am saying that if you compare the 13% infection rate out of the number of the people who were infected, and you compare it to similar cases in other countries, like the US, Canada, British Columbia – China, of course, was the lowest because they had a separate hospital for COVID-19 cases, but you will find that it is still within the international norms.

However, let me just rephrase again that we would not have wanted to have so many workers infected but taking into consideration we are adding all of them, including the private healthcare workers. We are adding every healthcare worker from security, the cleaners, whoever works in the space of the health system. So it is not necessarily only health professionals.

Again for us, we never dissected whether you have been infected from home or you were on leave or you were not working. If you were infected and you were still under PERSAL we added you and we also provided a whole package of care that is necessary for that. At least now, as I have indicated

earlier, one of the markers that shows us that the epidemic is declining is the healthcare worker infection rates.

So whilst we may not as a country be testing much, the mere fact that we are able to determine how many healthcare workers are infected and also even some of them who are not infected but actually being exposed, that number has decreased. So, it is one of those things that we need to celebrate. Although, in an ideal world we would not want any healthcare worker to be infected, at the beginning that was how things were.

The 13% again is taken it from the total number of all the people who had been infected, and if you zoom in in terms of the healthcare workers, out of the Provincial Government people who have been infected, you will find that it is still not as much as compared to other countries in a similar kind of environment. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, we are limited to no more time for questions now, because the rest of the questions that we have will not fit into the next two minutes that are left. So, the remaining questions' replies will be printed in Hansard and therefore we conclude on the minutes for now and I request that we all move to Members' Statements. I recognise the Democratic Alliance.

THE DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. As we continue to see the great strides in overcoming the COVID-19 pandemic, our

Department of Transport and Public Works has provided the necessary quarantine and isolation facilities on time, guided by data and in line with appropriate procurement requirements. And all considered, this has been achieved with capacity to spare and as the saying goes, “Plan for the worst and hope for the best.”

The CTICC field hospital named the “Hospital of Hope” has been considered an integral part of the Western Cape Government’s fight against COVID-19. It housed 864 beds to treat patients and the Hospital of Hope at the CTICC closed on 18 August 2020 and as the infection numbers have since decreased, the Brackengate Intermediate Care Facility has now taken over and become the new Hospital of Hope.

Hon Speaker, in contrast the Auditor-General has now begun commenting on the construction of field hospitals, isolation centres and quarantine sites and their problem areas. The AG identified that there was an oversupply of quarantine and isolation sites, and that the targeted number of sites had not been achieved nationwide. 6 123 quarantine sites had been targeted to be identified and activated by 31 July 2020, whilst only 510 sites had been identified by the National Department of Public Works and only 192 activated by the National Department of Health.

Under the national leadership, the national Department of Public Works needed to source 25 000 additional workers, but by 30 June 2020, hon Speaker, only 8 229 workers were recruited. Further, whilst R26 million was

spent on expenses for PPE, funding was allocated to the amount of R771 million. The Western Cape's plan had 44 activated quarantine and isolation facilities alone, which remains the highest in the country. Additional facilities have always been standing ready for the activation, should they be needed.

In conclusion, hon Speaker, this demonstrates that the Western Cape has led the way in the fight against COVID-19. Our hotspot model was adopted nationally. Our whole ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

THE DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...of government and society approach is the benchmark ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mitchell. Thank you, hon Mitchell. We only have two minutes. Thank you very much, hon Mitchell. Hon members, I recognise the ANC.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Speaker. The ANC welcomes the landmark ruling by the Western Cape High Court, which set aside the unlawful sale of the Tafelberg land for private interest and told the DA-led administration in the Province and the City to draw up policies that address apartheid legacy in the CBD.

This was not the first nor the last suitable pocket of land to be disposed of cheaply to the captors of the DA, the property magnates. From the onset the ANC has been vehemently and principally opposed to the sale of the land. The judgment presents an opportunity for the land to be used for socio-economic development and transformation. It is time for apartheid spatial housing in the Western Cape and Cape Town to end. The land must be used for housing, for those who work in Sea Point. Let us open Cape Town to all and stop being a white enclave.

We humbly appeal to the Premier and his Government to use their judgement to self-correct and start an inclusive process of developing the land for inclusive socio-economic development and address racial spatial segregation. We also call on the City to release a housing masterplan that will demonstrate a genuine program to reverse apartheid spatial planning in the City. Let the DA not waste taxpayers' money to appeal against this ruling.

In closing, Speaker, I want to salute and thank the Civil Society Movement for their contribution in the victory for the people, as well as the Minister of Human Settlements who also joined the court action. Premier, do not allow the arrogance and resistance of your predecessor towards social and spatial integration to define your tenure. Do the right thing. Use the land to build affordable housing near places of opportunities. †Umhlaba ezandleni zabantu. Enkosi Somlomo. [The land is in the hands of the people. Thank you Speaker.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mvimbi. I now recognise the EFF.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Speaker. The Economic Freedom Fighters welcomes the landmark judgment by the Western Cape High Court for setting aside the sale of Tafelberg site. This follows an unjust decision by the Western Cape Provincial Government's attempt to sell the Tafelberg School Site in the Sea Point area to a private developer at a cost of R135 million. In its ruling the Court found that the DA-led City of Cape Town and the Western Cape Provincial Government failed to comply with their respective obligations under enacted legislation to give effect to the provision of housing.

Furthermore, the Court ruled that in so failing to comply with obligatory legislation, the DA Government has also failed to take adequate steps to redress spatial apartheid planning in the city centre. The judgment confirms the EFF's longstanding argument that the DA Government does not consider the interests of people of colour. Their aim is to protect and promote the rich and whites at the expense of black and poor people. This is the latest ruling by the High Court in a series of judgments against this DA Government that continues to oppress black people and deny them socio-economic opportunities. We hope that this will be an eye-opener to this Government to wake up and realise that we are no longer living in colonial and apartheid times where black people were denied rights. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Makamba-Botya. Hon members, I recognise the DA.

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Hon Speaker, on 8 September 2020 the Children's Commissioner in the Western Cape will reach the milestone of 100 days in office. Under Subprogramme 2 in the Department of the Premier, R8 million has already been committed to the current financial year for this ground-breaking initiative.

The prolonged lockdown period exposed vulnerable children in cases where they were subject to domestic abuse, witnessed violence at home and now feel the ripple effects of the second pandemic of poverty. Many children do not comprehend the vastness or the impact of this pandemic.

On this note, hon Speaker, I note with appreciation the outreach already done by the Commissioner and there is also a joint undertaking to protect the child's rights, between the Western Cape Police Commissioner and the Children's Commissioner. In addition, the Children's Commissioner has planned engagements beyond the Metro, including a Children's Rights Workshop and direct connections with local communities for a deeper appreciation of the realities on the ground, starting on the West Coast.

The Commissioner will be building the capacity of stakeholders in the Child Protection System to operate from a child's rights approach. Back in 2015 Ms Christina Nomdo wrote, "We must focus on violence prevention and the role of duty bearers to ensure children are safe, especially in their homes."

Hon Speaker, there is an even greater need today and fortunately we have a

dedicated voice and platform for children in the Western Cape. This is demonstrated by the inclusion of children as an advisory counsel to the Children's Commissioner. The last 94 days were used to set up the office and ensure its accessibility and functions towards the aim of truly enhancing the voice and the needs of children, who are the future in the province, and obviously our country. As we approach day 100, through effective oversight, we will ensure this trail is blazed and the structure of the office and employment of staff is finalised, but let us not forget, this is also the first Children's Commissioner in the Western Cape and in South Africa. This DA-led Government works for the unemployed, the victims of abuse, the vulnerable and the children of this province and we are committed to working for you. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mackenzie. Hon members, I recognise the GOOD party. Hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): I thank you, hon Speaker. The Tafelberg School judgment is a victory for the role of public land in addressing our housing crisis and rolling back the apartheid Group Areas Act. It demolishes the Western Cape Government's argument that well-located land should not be used for housing, because of its high Rand value. Tafelberg School should have been made available, as was always intended, for affordable housing.

The unlawful sale of the Tafelberg School site demonstrates this Government's resistance to social and spatial integration and to using well-

located public land to address the housing deficit. The fact that the Western Cape Government persisted with the sale, despite all the evidence the site was viable for affordable social housing and despite the pleas of countless organisations and housing experts, was an act of arrogance and defiance.

Last year, in the first sitting of the current Western Cape Provincial Parliament, the Premier committed to resolving the dispute and settling the litigation. Instead of honouring this commitment, the Western Cape Government proceeded to defend the review application vigorously. The Premier must rethink his attitude to the release of public land, that he would do so only if National Government does so first.

The judgment confirms what we have been saying that such a condition is unlawful and immature. This judgment is critically important because it confirms the legal obligations of governments to use public property like land and buildings to address critical housing shortages. The Western Cape Government must change its attitude to the use of public land, especially well located land to leverage critical housing opportunities and to achieve integration.

Public land belongs to us all and it should never be regarded as a private commodity to be done with as the government of the day pleases. This Government holds this land in custody on behalf of the people of this country and the obligation is to use it for the public good. This judgment will have far reaching consequences for the role of public land in addressing exclusion

and inequality in a land where the majority are landless. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Herron. Hon members, I recognise the ACDP. Hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Speaker. I want to echo the statement made by ACDP President, Kenneth Meshoe, in National Parliament earlier this week. As the ACDP in the Western Cape, my heart goes out and I want to convey my heartfelt condolences to the loved ones who lost their family in brutal attacks on smallholdings and also farms in the Western Cape.

Reports like on 3 July 2020, “Seven armed attackers overpowered and assaulted a woman in Paarl”, and then you read again, “A farm murder: singer Wynand Breedt was shot and killed on his farm in Robertson”. It is important to note that some of these criminals involved in farm murders also rape women and children and even pour boiling water over them. These crimes are demonic and are driven by hatred which the ACDP strongly condemns.

Hon Speaker, when vulnerable people are killed and tortured and nothing is stolen or robbery did not take place, hatred is what happens and the ACDP believes they should be declared as “hate crimes”. SAPS stats indicate that there were 80 attacks between January and March 2020. Political parties that encourage the invasion of land, including farm land, should be held equally responsible for brutal murders that happen as a result of illegal invasions.

The ACDP Western Cape calls on the Western Cape Government to do everything in its power to stop these brutal attacks in the Western Cape. These perpetrators are criminals and should be harshly punished. The ACDP at national level has called on the Government to bring back the rural commando's to assist the police to stop hate crimes against our farmers and farm workers. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Christians. Hon members, I now recognise the ANC.

The SPEAKER: Hon member, before you proceed, hon Herron, will you please switch off your microphone? Thank you. You may proceed hon member.

Mr D SMITH (ANC): Thank you, hon Speaker. The DA suffocates multi-party democracy, strangles oversight and undermines accountability in the Western Cape Legislature. In fact, it permanently reduces democratic space here where constitutionally issues of provincial importance should be discussed. If any member raises critical issues in this Legislature or committees, that member is shut down, ridiculed, and made out to be stupid. If serious allegations like Executive meddling are brought to this institution as it should be, all kinds of excuses are used to dismiss and reduce it. Political point scoring or protection for the DA and its leaders are more important than issues of state and improving governance. It is pathetic how the DA hides behind some Rules to block public interrogation. The sub

judice rule is abused even when no court or tribunal considers a provincial matter.

It leaves the Opposition no room but to circumvent the Legislature and call upon South Africa's constitutional and democratic watchdogs to probe matters in the Western Cape. This is the case at present where the hon Committee Chair, Derrick America, refuses to deal with evidence brought to him against the hon MEC Bredell. We will have to call on the Public Service Commission to urgently probe this matter. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Smith. Hon members, I recognise the DA.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Agb Speaker, die Suid-Afrikaanse wynbedryf is steeds tot 'n groot mate in die hande van mans. Verlede week het 'n groep swart vroue 'n opmars na die Nasionale Parlement gehou om te protesteer teen hulle uitsluiting in 'n nasionale strategie vir die wynbedryf. Hulle vra dat die Nasionale Minister van Landbou, Grondhervorming en Landelike Ontwikkeling, Minister Tokho Didiza, sal ingryp. Speaker, gelukkig is daar merkwaardige uitsonderings, meestal danksy private inisiatiewe.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Hon Speaker, the South African wine industry is still to a large extent in the hands of men. Last week, a

group of black women marched to the National Parliament to protest against their exclusion in a national strategy for the wine industry. They ask that the National Minister of Agriculture, Land Reform and Rural Development, Minister Tokho Didiza, will intervene. Speaker, fortunately there are remarkable exceptions, mostly due to private initiatives.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Speaker.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Die een so 'n uitsondering is Compagniesdrift [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: The one such exception is Compagniesdrift [Interjection.]]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Speaker.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ...naby Stellenbosch. Compagniesdrift is 'n inisiatief van die Myburgh Familie Trust [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ...near Stellenbosch. Compagniesdrift is an initiative of the Myburgh Family Trust [Interjection.]]

The SPEAKER: Hon Van der Westhuizen.

An HON MEMBER: White males [Inaudible.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Speaker. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Van der Westhuizen, will you please take your seat?
What is the point of order, hon member?

Mr L L MVIMBI: It is not a point of order. I am just, I do not have a problem with the hon reading the speech in Afrikaans, but I am trying now to get this system that we were told we must follow when we want to listen to members. It seems not to be, when you want to listen to other members who are doing their speeches in other languages.

The SPEAKER: Alright. Hon Mvimbi, I tested Afrikaans in particular because my Afrikaans is forever improving, and it does work. You just need to talk to – the IT team will talk to you on the side-line, but we have to proceed.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Okay. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: It does work. It does work. Thank you. Hon Van der Westhuizen, will you please proceed.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Agb Speaker, gelukkig is daar merkwaardige uitsonderings, meesal danksy private inisiatiewe. Een so ‘n uitsondering is Compagniesdrift naby Stellenbosch. Compagniesdrift is ‘n inisiatief van die Myburgh Familie Trust en is in 2010 begin ten einde ‘n volhoubare belang in die wynbedryf vir plaaswerkers te skep. Compagniesdrift was aanvanklik ‘n temperatuurbeheerde bergings- en

etiketeringsfasiliteit vir wyn. Mev Ilse Ruthford, gebore en getoë in Pniël, is in 2014 as besturende direkteur van hierdie firma, wat 100% in swart besit is, aangestel. Mev Ruthford het heel onder in die wynbedryf begin en deur die range gestyg deur vasbyt en harde werk.

Compagniesdrift het tans 50 kliënte. Hulle grootste kliënte sluit bekende name in die bedryf in, name soos Meerlust, King Forrester, Neil Ellis en Friesenhof. Compagniesdrift het in 2015 ook begin om wyn onder hul eie naam te produseer. Speaker, die pad van transformasie is nie maklik nie. Mev Ruthford en Compagniesdrift het gewys dit is moontlik. Ek vertrou dat sulke voorbeelde 'n inspirasie sal wees, nie net vir ander vroue nie, maar veral vir Minister Didiza. Hopelik soveel so dat sy 'n inklusiewe benadering sal volg in 'n tyd waar die Regering hopelik 'n strategiese hulppakket sal saamstel om tegelykertyd sy skade aan die bedryf en die ongelykhede van die verlede ongedaan te maak. Baie dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Speaker, fortunately there are remarkable exceptions, mostly due to private initiatives. One such exception is Compagniesdrift near Stellenbosch. Compagniesdrift is an initiative of the Myburgh Family Trust and was founded in 2010 to create a sustainable interest in the wine industry for farm workers. Initially Compagniesdrift was a temperature-controlled storage and labelling facility for wine. Ms Ilse Ruthford, born and bred in Pniël, was appointed in 2014 as managing director

of this firm, which is 100% in black ownership. Ms Ruthford started right at the bottom of the wine industry and rose through the ranks through determination and hard work.

Compagniesdrift currently has 50 clients. Their largest clients include well-known names in the industry such as Meerlust, King Forrester, Neil Ellis and Friesenhof. Compagniesdrift also started to produce wine under its own name in 2015. Speaker, the road of transformation is not easy. Ms Ruthford and Compagniesdrift showed that it is possible. I trust that such examples will be an inspiration, not just for other women, but especially also for Minister Didiza. Hopefully so much so that she will follow an inclusive approach in a time where the Government will hopefully put together a strategic support package to at the same time undo its damage to the industry and the inequalities of the past. Thank you.]

An HON MEMBER: Lies!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise the Freedom Front Plus.

Mr P MARAIS: Thank you. Thank you so much. Deputy Speaker, the Freedom Front Plus expresses its deep concern for the unabated deforestation of the Milkwood Forest and [Interjections.] Hermanus by illegal land invaders. The invasion of prime beach side properties [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marais.

Mr P MARAIS: ...where no [Interjections.] facilities exist.

An HON MEMBER: There is no forest land. There is no forest land.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marais, if you could just wait one minute.

An HON MEMBER: I was there.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just take your seat. I see there is a point of order.

Hon Kama, what is your point of order?

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. When the member who was speaking earlier on concluded, member Marais on record said "Lies!" I want to check because I think that was being referred to, to the member, and I want to check if that is parliamentary, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. Hon member, as I had just [Interjection.]

Mr P MARAIS: It must have been another member, because I never said "Lies"!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marais, give me one minute, please. As I just walked in I would like to refer to Hansard and then I will revert back in the

next sitting, if that is okay, because I did not hear as we were changing over.

An HON MEMBER: Thank you. Point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright. Thank you very much.

An HON MEMBER: Chair, on a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I referred back to hon Marais. You may continue.

Mr P J MARAIS: Speaker, do I continue or start afresh? It is only two minutes and he is wasting my time.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. You may continue where you left off
[Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Do I start now from minute zero [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Excuse me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may continue. You can begin from the beginning, hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Oh, that is better. Thank you. [Laughter.] Deputy Speaker, the Freedom Front Plus expresses our concern for the unabated deforestation of the Milkwood Forest at Skulphoek in Hermanus by illegal land invaders. The invasion of prime beach side properties where no ablution facilities exist, refuse removal is non-existent and other municipal services cannot be rendered, must be politically motivated and has no place in a constitutional democracy. Let me remind members, the Constitution does not consider prime land with sea views as a constitutional right of anybody. Let me remind them what the Constitution says, 26(1)

“Everyone has the right to have access to adequate housing, but the State must take reasonable legislative measures within its available resources.”

It is not a right for you to grab land and then to say, “We are trying to beat apartheid”. You follow a legal process, providing there is money for the housing and who must give the money for housing? It is the ANC! They control the national purse. So, before you say they must invade land, ask your Government for the funds to build adequate housing!

Speaker, it is a fact that land invasions pose a huge threat to ordinary urbanisation and housing provision on land zoned in terms of the municipal structures plans for such purposes. Every piece of land in this country is not for housing. We need factories. We need schools. We need businesses. We need churches, but if I listen to some of the hon members, they just want

houses everywhere. One of these days we will build houses in the sea as well!

An HON MEMBER: There is no forest. There is no forest left! Both me and you were there [Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Because you took the forest away!

An HON MEMBER: And then what happened when the other guys were building? Where was the forest then?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Point of order, Madam Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you. There are interjections from members of the ANC, and I would like to ask if you would be able to call them to order please.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Correct. Yes, please. If we can please remember what we said at the beginning of the sitting. That we try and limit any interjections for the sake of everyone being able to listen. I now call on the DA.

†Me D M BAARTMAN (DA): Agb Adjunkspeaker, met die hernude Fase 4

beurtekrag is daar klein besighede reg om die provinsie wat hulle deure toemaak. As Transnet en Eskom fasiliteite vir vloeibare aardgas-invoere by Saldanhabaai Hawe ontwikkel, sal ons meer as R160 miljard vir die binnelandse bruto produk bydra en 13 000 werksgeleenthede skep. Hierdie ontwikkeling moet gepaardgaan met die oorskakeling van die Eskom Ankerlig Kragstasie in Atlantis vanaf diesel na vloeibare aardgas, wat water sal bespaar. Daar sal 'n afname in koolstofdioksiedvrystellings wees en Suid-Afrika sal goedkoper elektrisiteit vir huishoudings kan verskaf.

Adjunkspeaker, energie-sekuriteit is brandstof vir welvaart. Fase 4 beurtekrag kos die Wes-Kaap ongeveer R300 miljoen per dag in die midde van een van die ergste droogtes in ons geskiedenis, in die midde van 'n geslagsgeweldheidsramp, in die midde van 'n internasionale gesondheidspandemie en kan ons nie ook nog 'n energie sekuriteitsramp bekostig nie. Min Mantashe kan die een-Megawatt beperking op self-opwekking ophef en om onmiddelik aansienlike hoeveelhede hernubare energie tot die nasionale netwerk by te voeg. Hy kan toestemming gee vir munisipaliteite in goeie finansiële toestand om energie aan te skaf vanaf onafhanklike kragprodusente. Dit is byna 'n jaar vandat die nuwe geïntegreerde hulpbronplan aangekondig was en ons is nog nie 'n tree verder nie.

As jy 'n haarkapper is wat van die huis af werk in Mitchells Plain as gevolg van die COVID-19 pandemie en jy moet nou afsprake neem, dan gaan jy besigheid en 'n inkomste verloor. As jy 'n slaghuis besit dan beteken

beurtekrag dat jou produkte makliker kan verrot, en jou verkoelingsisteme kan breek as gevolg van kragstuwing. Wie betaal vir gereedskap wat breek? Gaan President Ramaphosa daarvoor betaal? Gaan Min Mantashe daarvoor betaal? Hoe lank moet ons wag vir President Ramaphosa se staatsredebeloftes? Die welvaart van ons gemeenskappe is in gevaar en ons benodig energie-sekuriteit nou! Adjunkspeaker, ek dank u.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Ms D M BAARTMAN (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, with the renewed Phase 4 load-shedding there are small businesses all around the province closing their doors. If Transnet and Eskom develop facilities for liquid gas at Saldanha Bay Harbour, we will contribute more than R160 billion to the gross domestic product and create 13 000 job opportunities. This development should be accompanied by the transition of the Eskom Ankerlig Power Station in Atlantis from diesel to liquid gas, which will conserve water. There will be a decrease in carbon dioxide emissions and South Africa will be able to provide cheaper electricity to households.

Deputy Speaker, energy security is fuel for wealth. Phase 4 load-shedding is costing the Western Cape about R300 million per day in the midst of one of the worst droughts in our history, in the midst of a gender violence disaster, in the midst of an international health epidemic and we cannot also afford an energy security disaster. Min Mantashe can lift the one Megawatt limit on self-generation immediately and add substantial quantities of renewable

energy to the national network. He can give approval to municipalities in sound financial state to acquire energy from independent power producers. It has been nearly a year since the new integrated resource plan had been announced and we are still not one yard further.

If you are a hairdresser working from home in Mitchells Plain because of the COVID-19 pandemic and you have to take appointments, then you will lose business and an income. If you own a butchery then load-shedding means that your products can rot easier, and your cooling systems can break down as a result of power surge. Who pays for equipment that breaks? Is President Ramaphosa going to pay for it? Is Min Mantashe going to pay for it? For how long do we still have to wait for President Ramaphosa's State Address promises? The welfare of our communities is in danger and we require energy security now! Deputy Speaker, I thank you.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Baie dankie, agb lid. [The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.] Thank you very much. That brings us to the end of Members' Statements. We now move over in terms of Rule 151 to Notices of Motion. One minute. I forgot something very important. Let me just backtrack. Sorry, hon members. It has brought us to the end of the statements. Before we start the notices of motion in terms of Rule 145(6), I would like to give any Minister, if there is, an opportunity to respond to any of the members statements for not more than five minutes. Any Minister who would like to respond?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I recognise you hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. The DA has noted the court judgment on Tafelberg, but I do want to make a number of points here very clear, hon Deputy Speaker. We cannot be lectured by member Mvimbi and member Herron about addressing the spatial inequalities while they both occupied positions where they were supposed to do exactly the same thing and they did nothing.

This kind of hypocrisy needs to be challenged. In fact, I challenge both of them to go and show me in their previous roles where they did exactly what they are preaching here. So, while we have noted this court judgement, it must be clear, hon Deputy Speaker, that the responsibility of Government is to govern. We respect the Court as a separate arm of Government. We have noted some concerns in this judgment, but of course we will communicate on those issues in due course, but we should not celebrate just yet, because the so-called by the way “activists” are the very same people who have contributed in stifling the inner-city development by orchestrating invasion of strategically located pieces of land in the inner-city.

We are now dealing with a number of people who have occupied these

properties, where there are planned developments, but we cannot do anything because we now have to look for relocation areas, because of these so-called activists that are hailed as heroes here.

One of the GOOD party leaders, who is now the National Minister of Public Works, was the Mayor of Cape Town. She wrote a number of letters to the National Government to release strategically located land in the city and it is not surprising that immediately after occupying the very same position where she is in a position now to release these pieces of land, she has not done that, and yet we have the GOOD member here who is preaching to us about inner-city development when he was in a position to do so together with his current leader and yet they did nothing.

Now the EFF is a party of chaos and destruction and this notion that they care about the poor while they thrive on lawlessness and orchestrating land invasions across the city, is exactly the opposite of what this Government will achieve, because what we are seeing in the city and in the province, where a number of pieces of land that should be used for the development of poor people are suddenly now occupied or invaded by people who are led by the EFF. That is not development. I mean that is anti-development, actually, and we need to challenge that.

So, we will, hon Deputy Speaker, make sure that we comply with some requirements as we have done in the past, because we have made it very clear, as this Government, that we acknowledge that we could have done

more in terms of the inner-city development, but what I cannot accept is that the very same people who were representing the DA, who are in a position to do that, fail dismally and come here and grandstand.

So, hon Deputy Speaker, as I said, we respect the court judgment. We are busy studying it and we will respond appropriately in due course, but I must warn that people must not celebrate just yet because we are in a situation now, as this Government, because of the failures of National Government, we are unable to do a number of developments, because if it cannot grow the economy and be able to make sure that there is enough money to do those developments, we can have all the pieces of land that are strategically located, like Tafelberg, but we will not be able to develop them and that is why it is important for people to understand the importance of striking the balance between raising our own revenue and making sure that we develop in strategically located land.

Lastly, hon Deputy Speaker, we are arguing here about a piece of land that is less than one hectare or just over one hectare and the argument here is not against inner-city development, but the argument is about finding enough pieces of land where you get the economies of scale, especially in a situation where you do not have the luxury of enough money to be able to replicate this across the city and across the province. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. We now move over to Notices of Motion in terms of Rule 151. I recognise the hon

Makamba-Botya from the EFF.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move on behalf of the Economic Freedom Fighters:

That the House debates the brutality of police and law enforcement officials against black people. Thank you.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Thank you. I recognise hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move on behalf of the ACDP:

That the House debates the brutality of the police in the Western Cape. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Thank you. I recognise hon Xego.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: On his behalf, hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move on behalf of the Economic Freedom Fighters:

That the House debates the economic opportunities facilitated by the Western Cape Provincial Government to uplift the disadvantaged youth within the Western Cape. Thank you.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice taken. Hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, good afternoon and thank you very much. I give notice that I shall move on behalf of the African National Congress:

That the House debates the unwillingness of the DA to integrate people as was exposed in the Western Cape High Court's ruling on the DA-run Provincial and Cape Town Government's unwillingness to address the apartheid legacy of spatial development and structural racism perpetuated by the DA with the backroom deal of the Tafelberg School site. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Thank you. I recognise hon

Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: I give notice that I shall move on behalf of the Economic Freedom Fighters:

That the House debates the removal of colonial and apartheid statues and symbols within the Western Cape. Thank you.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Thank you. I recognise hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Hon Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the double standards of the Democratic Alliance to pontificate about supporting constitutionality and the rule of law on the one hand, yet it is regularly found in courts flaunting laws; from its unconstitutional meddling in the Overstrand Municipality's affairs, to not wanting to include this Legislature on key policy issues and disregarding its obligations to integrate and supply social housing in Sea Point. The DA continuously acts and treats laws with disdain. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Thank you. I recognise hon Xego.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move on behalf of the Economic Freedom Fighters:

That the House debates entrenched racism within businesses in the private sector operating in the Western Cape. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Thank you. Hon Smith. Hon Smith? Hon Smith, are you there? I can see your picture. I am going to move over to, I will come back to you. I will call on hon Makamba-Botya again.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move on behalf of the Economic Freedom Fighters:

That the House debates the Western Cape's role in curbing and addressing the issues of gender-based violence and femicide in the Western Cape. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Thank you. Hon Xego. Proceed, hon member.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: On behalf of hon Xego, I give notice that I shall move on behalf of the Economic Freedom Fighters:

That the House debates the challenges faced by black farmers within the Western Cape and the role played by the Western Cape Provincial Government to assist them. Thank you.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Thanks. Hon Smith, your last chance. Calling twice.

Mr D SMITH: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There we go. Over to you.

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, just give me a second.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sure. It is Women's Day. Are you ready, hon Smith?

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I should be ready in a second.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Smith, the last few seconds. We need to move on.

Mr D SMITH: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the fact that many senior DA leaders have jumped ship saying that party has lost direction and they do not feel welcome anymore, like Gauteng leader, John Moodey who left the DA. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: What has that got to do with you?

An HON MEMBER: Shame!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Order. We now move over to Motions without Notice. I recognise the hon Makamba-Botya. Motions without notice.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the Economic Freedom Fighters:

That the House welcomes the sentencing of a 62-year old man,

Peter Tshamese, by the Eastern Cape High Court yesterday. Tshamese was sentenced to 18 years direct imprisonment for raping a 15-month old baby; whilst the sentence is welcomed it must be noted that a sentence of life imprisonment would have been more appropriate in the circumstances. The deviation by the Court not to grant a life sentence due to the age of his rapist is unwarranted; Courts should practice handing down harsh and heavy sentences against rapists and perpetrators of gender-based violence against women and children. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the notice itself? Motion agreed to. I move over to hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice on behalf of the ACDP:

That the House offers its condolences to the bereaved family of 48-year-old Philiswa Ncithi who was killed by a stray bullet when she attended an open air service. Hon Deputy Speaker, the ACDP is referring to a recent article which highlighted the death of a God-fearing Christian who just wanted to worship and go to church. On Sunday evening at Oliver Tambo Avenue, Philiswa heard keyboards

playing from the open-air service and she excitedly went and was shot. The ambulance rushed her to the Heideveld Emergency Centre, but she already passed away. A murder case has been opened but no arrests have been made. Hon Deputy Speaker, the ACDP wants to let the aggrieved family know that we stand behind them in this rough time. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections? Motion agreed to. Hon Xego.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Deputy Chair, according to Rule 195 his motions will – thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the African National Congress:

That the House notes that a senior official of this Provincial Government, that claims it fights violence against women and children, still works here with impunity as that employee allegedly raped a boy of 7-years old and appeared in court at least 14 times in the past 8 months, without any action by his complacent employer.

I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I recognise that there are objections coming out of the House. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Just to check that that is – no, that is absolutely fine. I recognise hon Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the Democratic Alliance:

That the House condemns the brutal murder of a family of three at the beginning of August 2020 in Mfuleni. Further, that this House extends its sincere condolences to the family and friends of Nomaphelo Kebe, 45 years old, her daughter Wendy, 23 years old, and son Sive and that this House notes with deepest regret the ongoing criminal activities which cost residents their lives. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. Hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the Economic Freedom Fighters:

That the House notes the entrenched racism and sexism taking place within the automobile industry in the Western Cape; this follows an advert posted on PNet.com, a job website in which the McCarthy Group, one of the largest chains of luxury car dealerships, advertised a vacancy of marketing manager through an agency; the specifications of a suitable candidate for the vacancy were that the person must be white and preferably male; the advert made it clear that the position does not endorse employment equity and affirmative action; this conduct promotes apartheid era discrimination and injustice against women and people of colour as it does not only violate the Employment Equity Act, but the spirit and values of the South African Constitution. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Lili.

Mr A LILI: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the Western ... [Interjections.] Cape High Court [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members, I cannot hear. Hon Lili, if you can just repeat yourself. Sorry, I was not able to hear.

Mr A LILI: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the Western Cape High Court set aside the DA-led administration's controversial sale of the old Tafelberg School site to a Camp's Bay based school instead of developing it for housing closer to work for the poor working class in Sea Point and surroundings; further notes that this judgment is not only a victory for the poor but again exposes the DA as a party for the privileged and for the preservation of apartheid spatial planning instead; and lastly Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.] notes that the DA-run administration failed to comply with its constitutional and legislative obligation to address apartheid spatial planning as it

initially promised to use this threat of public property to transform and develop affordable housing. I so move. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

HON MEMBERS: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I recognise objections from the House. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

Mr A LILI: Why are you objecting? The High Court ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Baartman.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the Democratic Alliance:

That the House notes that this week Transnet Ports Authority is scheduled to hold a hearing to resolve a dispute over the offloading of liquified petroleum gas at the port of Saldanha Bay between two companies, Avedia Energy and Sunrise Energy; further notes that these two companies have previously been involved in a legal dispute on the matter and calls upon Transnet Ports Authority to ensure a fair and speedy conclusion to the hearing and to assure the

residents of Saldanha Bay that they have taken every precautionary step available to ensure their safety. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Agreed to. Hon Marran. Hon Marran? Last call.

Mr P MARRAN: I thought my mic was on. My apologies. Let me start over.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No problem. I can hear you.

Mr P MARRAN: Okay. Thanks very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice on behalf of the African National Congress:

That the House notes no political party or group who wants this Western Cape Province to break away from South Africa has ever succeeded to get any significant support in any poll or election and that the people of this province are not as gullible to be led down the garden path by the secessionist-minded right wingers, who only bring campaigns like that and murders of farmers shortly before elections to stir up emotions like hate and fear. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Objection! Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the Democratic Alliance:

That the House congratulates Ms Karen Dudley for being selected to form part of the *Mail & Guardian's* Powerful Women list for 2020; that we commend the transformative work done by Ms Dudley in her role at the Western Cape Education Department as the Director of Education for Early Childhood Development until Grade 9, and note that the award list is truly a testimony of the excellent and tireless work by women in our country. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections. Motion agreed to. Hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. It is very interesting how the DA is embracing racism which is not directed at them by objecting on a motion. This is not directed at the DA. It is a matter of principle. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Is that a motion?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, please give me your motion.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice on behalf of the EFF:

That the House notes the killing of a 7-year-old, Cwenga Mafuneka, by a member of a private security company earlier this year on 16 June 2020, on the day residents of the Winnie Madikizela Community in Philippi were involved in a protest when a vehicle owned by a private security company came out of nowhere and started firing live ammunition at protesters. One of the stray bullets hit Cwenga on the forehead and killed her while she was sitting inside a shack. The case was opened in Philippi police station on that day, but to this day no-one has been arrested. The EFF calls for the immediate arrest and prosecution of the perpetrators of these horrible deeds. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections? Agreed to. Hon Lili.

Mr A LILI: [No audible reply.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Just a point of order, Madam Deputy Speaker, a point of order?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: What is your point of order, hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I just want to ask, when people object, no-one knows who objected now to that motion without notice of the McCarthy, so is there a way that we can just perhaps see who is objecting because I do not think people know who objected; it may be someone shouting there and who is not even – and everyone just blames the DA for it. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have my Table staff and it certainly was in the House when there was an objection that I saw here, I am not quite sure to which motion you are referring to, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: The motion on McCarthy and the racist advert, “White”, how can anyone object to that? [Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: It is you! You now realise your mistake.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The DA ... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I am not speaking to you, keep quiet. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order please. [Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: I am speaking to you!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, there were objections in the House on the Democratic Alliance’s side. I now move over to hon Lili.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Anyway, it is unfortunate.

Mr A LILI: Hon Deputy Speaker... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order please! Hon Lili, if you could just speak up, thank you.

Mr A LILI: Okay. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the DA Federal Chairperson Helen Zille personally involved herself, as then Premier, possibly influenced and even vehemently defended the controversial Tafelberg site land bargain sale in Sea Point to a rich group instead of continuing its undertaking to develop it as housing for poor workers close to their jobs. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

HON MEMBERS: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. Hon members, before I continue, let me just remind you about two things: one is that the same Question Rule applies. If the motion is similar to a motion that has been put out before, it will be scrapped. Okay, and just remember to all our members, including our Ministers who are members, that anybody can object to any motion whatsoever, there is no...anybody has the individual right to object to any single motion. I will move on to hon Baartman.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. We must also remember not to generalise the whole industry compared to an individual company. On that note, on behalf of the Democratic Alliance, I move without notice:

That this House notes that the Western Cape... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order please! Order!

An HON MEMBER: Is that part of the motion?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members, I cannot hear hon Baartman. Please may I have some order? Thank you, over to you. May she finish what she is reading please?

Ms D M BAARTMAN: On behalf of the Democratic Alliance I move without notice:

That this House notes that the Western Cape Provincial Treasury has published the second edition of the Procurement Disclosure Report which also reveals that the Western Cape has spent 47% of the COVID-19 expenditure on SMMEs amounting to R669 million; further notes the report details all PPE procurement and expenditure in the Province related to the COVID-19 pandemic, which will be made available on a monthly, quarterly and annual basis to the public; also notes that the report includes information on PPE purchasing and

emergency procurement environment including the National Treasury benchmark prices, the various iterations of pricing and how Provincial Treasury responded; acknowledges the Western Cape is the only province to release this information and congratulates the Western Cape Government for its commitment to transparency and clean governance in the province. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to. Hon member Bans.

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Objection, Deputy Speaker.

Ms A P BANS: On behalf of the African National Congress, I move without notice:

That the House notes that a fire possibly caused by an electrical fault destroyed parts of the iconic Arts and Culture Centre, Guga S'Thebe Theatre this week; notes further that this is a tragic setback for the artist who have been robbed of the only dedicated own venue they have in the community and calls on Government and the City of Cape Town to urgently put resources in place to renovate the damaged section. I so

move, Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to. Hon Baartman.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Deputy Speaker, can I address you?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, hon Baartman, if you can just take your seat. Hon Chief Whip – sorry, not Chief Whip, hon Whip of the Opposition?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Deputy Speaker, and let me just say I am the Chief Whip of the Official Opposition.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Two, I raised an objection when member Baartman was making a motion, and I did not hear you... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: My apologies, what is your objection?

An HON MEMBER: No, it was after.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I am objecting the motion that she moved forward.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Deputy Speaker... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, yes, hon Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): I would ask that you consult Hansard because the objection came after you had asked for objections... [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No-no-no, no-no. [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... and then said that it will be – that it was agreed to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, to both Chief Whips.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Deputy Speaker, can I address you?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much everybody.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Deputy Speaker, can I address you?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon Lekker, you may.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You have moved so quickly that we did not even spend two seconds when you asked whether there was an objection or not, and when I raised an objection you were already calling out member Bans and

I allowed you to proceed so that I can raise this motion without disturbing any speaker forward.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Now we cannot make a change in the conversation when it is not. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, hon Lekker, what I will do and this is my ruling so everyone can put their hands down, I will consult Hansard in the best interest of fairness and we will take that decision in the next sitting. I think that is the only way for us to be able to correctly assess because we are running a hybrid system here and it would be impossible to be able to make a ruling on that at this point. Thank you very much. Hon Smith?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Can I just point out, Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon Lekker, you may.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. In any systems that are being tested there is always shortcomings and for me I find it difficult when I am raising it sharply that I objected to the motion by member Baartman and subsequently at that time you were calling member Bans to come over. Now listening to Hansard that you may not even hear exactly what is said, but you could hear there is a noise at the background, for me is

not justice. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Lekker. We will still run the system as we are according to the Rules and the Table staff will assist me in the decision-making about that ruling after we have convened at the next sitting. Hon Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Deputy Speaker... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, I have made a decision, I have made a ruling here. We are moving over to hon Smith please.

Mr D SMITH: Can I get clarity, Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: My apologies, my apologies. I recognised, I just put a line through hon Baartman. Over to you, hon Baartman and then hon Smith.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. On behalf of the Democratic Alliance, I move without notice:

That this House notes that the Western Cape along with Paarl, Wellington, the City of Cape Town and the V&A Waterfront have all been awarded the Safe Travels Stamp during the COVID-19 pandemic by the World Travel and Tourism Council (WTTC); also notes that the

Stellenbosch Municipality was the first in Africa to receive this award; further notes that the WTCC works with private sector, tourism in across 185 countries and has developed world-class protocols for adoption by municipalities, tourism bodies and establishments at this time; also notes that the accreditation requires adherence to stringent hygiene and safety protocols. An application process to the WTTC is followed in which applicants must demonstrate their health and safety processes and compliance with the new normal guidelines from the global body; and congratulates the Western Cape Government, the Drakenstein Municipality, the City of Cape Town and V&A Waterfront for this achievement. Stellenbosch had already moved a motion previously. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to. Hon member Smith. Just a minute before hon Smith starts, hon Lekker, is your hand still up?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Oh, I am just going to put it down, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, noted, thank you. Hon Smith?

Mr D SMITH: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that since the DA got rid of Mmusi Maimane that the party keeps on bleeding as it self-destructs; and further notes especially Local Government leaders of colour leave the DA as they feel unwelcome in a party whose main aim is to protect the privilege of the erstwhile elite, and that Gauteng leader, John Moodey yesterday left, stating that at least five black Mayors in the Western Cape were replaced by white Mayors. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Object! Not like the President.

An HON MEMBER: I object.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: You want to get rid of the President. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections coming from the House. [Interjection.]

Mr D SMITH: You can pay him... [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: You want to get rid of the President.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon members. I now move over to hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I move without notice, on behalf of the African National Congress:

That the House notes since the damning Public Service Commission investigative report into the irregular reappointment of the Education head, Mr Brian Schreuder, that the ANC called for an urgent discussion with the Premier, with the MEC for Education, with the Public Service Commission and with the Department of Public Service and Administration in the Standing Committee on Education on the problems raised; that the House also notes the exclusion of the Provincial Legislature from the process of approval for the arbitrary further extension of the contract of Mr Schreuder, is a serious breach and must be brought to the attention of the members; that the Premier is requested to approach a court to get clarity on the appointment so that the great legacy of this exceptional civil servant, Mr Brian Schreuder, is not further tarnished. I so move. [Interjection.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Objection, you are tarnishing it all the time.

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Yes, object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections coming from the House. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon member Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Deputy Speaker, the MEC must speak through you when she objects, not directly to the members here. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Objection! [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed. Hon members, let us move on please. I now recognise hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the Western Cape Province seems to be way behind State protocol and etiquette when it comes to National Government; but also notes in some areas the Province stopped keeping up, like in Worcester EMS building where a portrait of a former Premier is still displayed, namely that of Helen Zille, and finally notes either news do not travel fast there or the staff are fixated on having the former Premier around. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I object. The fireman...
[inaudible, speaking simultaneously.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections coming from the House. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Really, really?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now recognise hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. On behalf of the African National Congress I move without notice:

That this House notes the DA still defends its Khayelitsha and other evictions, and the undignified dragging of a naked Bulelani Qolani in the public view and assaulting him, and notes the bad DA so far did the minimum to make good on this ill-conceived action. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: I object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections coming out from the House. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise hon member

Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. On behalf of the Congress movement, I move without notice:

That this House notes the Western Cape administration's unwillingness to cooperate in the Public Protector's probe into COVID-19 acquisitions and that Advocate Busisiwe Mkhwebane started issuing summonses to get to the truth; and further notes many people now ask what is the Western Cape trying to hide? I so move. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Object, that is part of you
[Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, there are objections coming out from the House. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House notes that the hon Minister for Education, Debbie Schäfer, has admitted that the return of the last grades has put screening at the start of a school day under pressure; that we also note that the

heavy rain has caused learners to rush in, to bundle up for shelter and not adhere to the COVID rules of physical distancing and calls on the Department of Education in the Province and our schools to work collectively to make plans to handle a more intense flow of children. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections? There are objections.

The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. On behalf of the African National Congress I move without notice:

That this House notes tensions in Ceres where a resident was shot by police, and in Wolseley where a Neighbourhood Watch member pinned a young man down to severely assault him, have risen too high and that race is entering the fray; calls on this Government to play its role to ensure social cohesion and nation building in that area of Witzenberg. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to. Hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. On behalf of the African National Congress, the people's movement, I move without notice:

That the House notes a number of successes against crime recorded in the last few days; namely a boyfriend was sent to jail for life in the High Court and a mother of six months suspended for three years for the murder of her 18-month-old boy Jeremiah Ruiters in 2017; that a mother was arrested for child neglect because her baby girl was left in Knysna and she appeared in court; that two men caught with R5,6 million perlemoen were sent to jail for effectively five years each in the High Court, and R60 000 must be paid to the Asset Forfeiture Unit; that three men were arrested with almost 300 kilograms of dagga; a Khayelitsha man was arrested for illegally having three guns and ammunition; that a Bonteheuwel man was arrested with drugs like Tik, dagga and Mandrax; that a suspect appeared in the Goodwood Court after last Friday's cash-in-transit robbery; and commends SAPS and our criminal justice system for getting criminals off the street. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any there any objections to the motion

being moved without notice? No objections, agreed to. Hon Bans.

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. On behalf of the African National Congress I move without notice:

That this House notes two right-wing groups, AfriForum and the Institute for Race Relations, publicly stated it will fight Cricket SA transformation to secure the status quo of white supremacy in sport. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: Yes, objections.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Sayed, did I miss you earlier? I will just check afterwards. I am not quite sure. Hon Smith.

Mr D SMITH: [No audible reply.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Smith, and if I have missed out hon Sayed earlier, we will know at the end.

Mr D SMITH: Yes, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you.

Mr D SMITH: Deputy Speaker, just give me a second please.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Smith, have you lost all your paperwork?

Mr D SMITH: Yes, Deputy Speaker, I am here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr D SMITH: I move without notice:

That this House notes the good rainfall during the last few weeks and that most dams are close to or full; and notes some of the gates at the overflowing Clanwilliam Dam were opened for the first time in more than a decade. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: It is a great

rainfall. Good has nothing to do with it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections? Agreed to.

Mr D SMITH: Is that an objection, Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry, I could not hear you?

Mr D SMITH: I just wanted to make sure, is that an objection from the hon Bonginkosi?

An HON MEMBER: No, sir.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I heard you mentioning “good.” It was a great rain. Good had nothing to do with it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is no objection. We move over to hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House notes that the Franklin Uniting Reformed Church Primary School in Herold near George is set to close down because the land on which it stands is up for sale and even though the Church

Council informed the Western Cape Education Department of its intent to sell a few months ago, the Department had shown no interest in the land to assist the school to continue operating, and calls upon the Department to save the school by purchasing the land from the Church so that it may continue to serve the Herold community as it has for generations; noting that the Department of Education has bought land for the Orchard and Rabie Primary Schools in Hex Valley from the very same Uniting Reformed Church a few years ago. I so move and this is my last motion, Deputy Speaker, so you did not miss me, or at least I have only got four motions without notice.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Sayed. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections? Agreed to. Hon Smith?

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, what is your objection? Was there an

objection?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): There was an objection.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Who is that now?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, there is an objection. Thank you. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Smith?

Mr D SMITH: [No audible reply.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you there, hon Smith?

Mr D SMITH: Yes, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): He needs a second. He needs a second again, Deputy Speaker.

Mr D SMITH: I move without notice:

That the House notes Cape Town cautioned people living in informal settlements last week about fire hazards in these areas; also notes it follows a large number of these fires and people killed in these areas; notes in Strand a couple died in such a fire and their ten-year-old boy escaped; and calls on Cape Town to up its game as the wildfire season is

about to start soon. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to. Hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. On behalf of the ANC I move without notice:

That the House notes public allegations of Mafia-like money extortions in the Western Cape are made against so-called security groups said to be headed by gangsters that demand so-called protection money from informal and formal businesses, and calls on the investigation agencies of the State and especially SAPS to clean up the province of their stranglehold. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections? Motion agreed to. Hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. On behalf of the people's

movement, the African National Congress, I move without notice:

That this House notes 18 protesters were arrested and appeared in court for disrupting traffic over the weekend during an anti-farm attack demonstration. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any there any objections being moved? I am missing my words here, my apologies. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections? Motion agreed to. Hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. On behalf of the organisation of President Oliver Reginald Tambo, the ANC, I move without notice:

That this House pays tribute to all police officers who put life and limb on the line in the fight against crime; and notes 39-year-old SAPS member Abongile Mayile was shot in the head in Nyanga; calls on all involved in the criminal justice system to ensure that those involved in the killing of SAPS members are brought to book as an attack on the police is an attack on the State. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to. Hon Bans.

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. On behalf of the African National Congress I move without notice:

That this House notes with excitement that the Western Province Rugby Football Union has appointed former South African Ambassador to the US and our former Premier Ebrahim Rasool as the new Chairperson of the Board of Directors for this rugby union and that it is a positive step to save and transform the ailing enterprise; it further notes that Mr Rasool replaces retiring Dr Johan van der Merwe. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Ooh!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is? Are there objections? No objections? Motion agreed to. Hon member Kama. Hon members, please be very clear if you are going to do an objection. Were there objections?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

An HON MEMBER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There was an objection said in the House, my apologies. That motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Thank you. Hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. On behalf of the ANC I move without notice:

That this House notes the drive-by shooting near Worcester where a man in his car was wounded three times in the side and survived. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to.

Mr P MARRAN: Deputy Speaker, on a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon.

Mr P MARRAN: It is hon Marran.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: What is your point of order, hon Marran?

Mr P MARRAN: Deputy Speaker, I just wanted to check the motion before the hon Kama, there was just an “ooh”. Is an “ooh” now regarded as an objection?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, there was then a clarification that there was an objection.

Mr P MARRAN: Then it must be clear, Deputy Speaker, you cannot “ooh”.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, I understand that, but it was clearly said here. Thank you, hon Marran. I am now with hon Bakubaku-Vos.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. I rise on behalf of the ANC. I move without notice:

That the House notes that the police made a breakthrough and arrested a suspect who was wanted for the murder of Nomvuzo Atoli from Nyanga; notes further the suspect was arrested while in hiding in Idutywa in the Eastern Cape, with the assistance of the National Intervention Unit Team, Umtata, on 29 August and he is in the process of being transferred back to Cape Town; welcomes the arrest and hails the SAPS for swift response and hard work after the body of Atoli was found dumped in Browns Farm on 20 August 2020.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members. Are there any there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The MINISTER OF COMMUNITY SAFETY: No, hon Bakubaku-Vos. No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No objections? Motion agreed to. Hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. On behalf of the ANC I move without notice:

That the House notes the ANC Western Cape as part of its commitment to fighting gender-based violence will this Friday at six p.m. have a broad men's dialogue with President Cyril Ramaphosa in a quest to mobilise this sector of society to take a stand against these atrocious crimes; that this dialogue will be attended by men from not only the Western Cape but also from the Northern Cape; notes that this is informed by the ANC's view that the fight against gender-based violence is not only a policing issue and calls on everyone interested to follow this dialogue as it will be live on all my ANC social media platforms. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion

being moved without notice? No objections? Agreed to. Hon Kama, the last motion of the day.

Mr M KAMA: The last one of the day, yes, thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. On behalf of the ANC I move without notice:

That the House notes the DA race for a provincial leader has started with a contest between the hon leader of Government Business, Bonginkosi Madikizela and the hon Speaker of the Legislature, Masizole Mngasela...

[Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M KAMA: ...and notes the matter is visibly supported by the Southern Cape Cabal as the Speaker introduced his number one supporter on Facebook, which happens to be the son of the hon Human Settlements MEC, Tertuis Simmers. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes, object, object!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections?

An HON MEMBER: Object.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections coming out of the House.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Where is your
[Inaudible.] Where is your congress? [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The motion will be printed on the Order Paper.
[Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: Hey, the Southern Cape Cabal is strong. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS
AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: You cannot even have a congress man.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, that concludes Motions without
Notice. [Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: The Southern Cape Cabal is strong.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member Marran, can I have some order please?
We will now move over to the Order of the Day. The Secretary will read the
Order of the Day.

ORDER OF THE DAY

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Standing Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on the Recommendations for the Appointment of Candidates to the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board, dated 21 August 2020.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr Secretary. I have been informed by the Chief Whip that the Programming Authority resolved that there would be no list of speakers and that parties who wish to do so can be afforded an opportunity to make a declaration of the vote for a maximum of three minutes. I will now afford those parties an opportunity, if they so wish. I recognise the ANC. [No audible reply.] No?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, over to you.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Yes, thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. The ANC does not support ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Mvimbi, over to you.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Can I start, Deputy Speaker? Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may start.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much. The ANC does not support the report as it already put it forward in its minority view in the Committee meeting not to support the recommended names. Our grounds for rejecting the names lie in the critique provided by the 2013 Presidential Review Committee (PRC) on State-owned Enterprises. The PRC stated that the governance, ownership policy and oversight system were found to be inadequate. The quality of the Board and Executive recruitment was found to be inadequate.

There is no clarity on the role of the Executive Authority Boards and the Chief Executive in the governance and operational management of SoEs. The NDP expresses similar critique when it pointed a finger to the credibility deficit in board appointment and instability in SoE Boards. We firmly believe that the process for these appointments was flawed in favour of candidates favoured by the majority party.

Phillip Armstrong, Senior Adviser, Corporate Governance International Finance, has said that in theory a SoE may have been created for the benefit of the citizenry but the reality is that many SoEs are accountable only to whatever political party is in power. The original notion of providing efficient and affordable services to the nation's citizens is long lost. Herein lies the fundamental governance problem.

It is not that all SoEs are inherently corrupt, rather it is the political interplay with structures in effect and activities created with the private sector in mind, all two of them trump the economic or social rationale.

We have seen this in the process of coming up with this recommendation. The political party in power in the Western Cape bulldozes all opposition to the recommended names, including serious concerns raised against certain names who may not be compliant with the South African Revenue Act, which requires members to declare all their interests. One of the recommended names failed in this regard and this was raised in the Committee.

This comes against the background of names not favoured by the DA that were rejected on the basis of integrity. So therefore, on the basis of that, hon Deputy Speaker, we do not support the recommendations.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now call on the EFF.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. The Economic Freedom Fighters rejects with contempt the report of the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Opportunities and Tourism on the Recommendations for the Appointment of Candidates to the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board. The appointment of candidates to the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board is governed by the provisions of the

Western Cape Gambling and Racing Act of 1996. When it comes to the qualifications and experience of those who aspire to serve on the Board, the Act is very vague on whether a person can be disqualified from occupying the vacancy based on those two aspects and whilst we always hear that the composition of those who serve on the Board must be diverse, the reality is that this aspect is open to abuse. Because at times there is a hidden agenda to appoint some individuals and disqualify others and to do that those tasks with making the appointments will automatically disqualify other candidates on the basis that they lack proper experience and/or qualifications. Similarly, the same abuse of power as a result of the deficiencies of the Act can be used by those with a hidden agenda to get people without experience and qualifications into these positions.

The entire selection process and the appointment of the candidates in this instance was flawed. Candidates were disqualified on the basis of integrity which is something not covered by the Sections 4 and 5 of the Act. This is the problem presented by the Act itself as it remains too vague and open to abuse as the appointers can track it from time to time in order to accommodate the candidate they prefer over others. This comes as a result of one of the candidates that was non-compliant with the Tax Administration Act of 2007 of South Africa, by not disclosing certain assets on his tax returns.

Furthermore, the determination of the integrity of candidates was solely left at the hands of an external service provider which conducted the probity investigations and then compiled the probity report on the integrity of the

candidates. The issue of outsourcing such important tasks and solely relying on it also raises eyebrows and it opens for further abuse of the process. On that said, Deputy Speaker, we do not support the report. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise GOOD.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. We support the report.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Deputy Speaker, I am not going to speak on the matter. I abstain from it, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I recognise Freedom Front Plus.

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Speaker, I will support it, because the hon member of the EFF says that they do not support it because they do not like the fact that experience and qualifications are yardsticks, but lack of experience and qualifications are at the heart of government bungling, incompetence, corruption, and municipal irregular expenditure and I am very happy that these factors were considered when appointing people to this Board, that experience and qualification in any high position are vital.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marais, and I recognise the DA.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Apologies. I am just trying to get to a mic. Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Today we consider the Report of the Standing Committee of Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism on the Recommendations on the Appointment of the Candidates of the Western Cape Gambling and Racing Board in terms of the Act.

Three vacancies needed to be filled. One became vacant in June 2020 and two will become vacant in December 2020 and May 2021, respectively. The Provincial Treasury advertised the vacancies in the *Provincial Gazette*, *Vukani*, *Mail and Guardian*, *Die Burger* and the *Weekend Argus*. Nine shortlisted candidates were referred to the Committee for evaluation. The Committee agreed to evaluate the candidates by interviewing them as allowed by Section 3(1) of the Act, 1996.

The Committee disqualified three candidates in the terms of the prescripts of the Act, the law of the Provincial Government of the Western Cape, specifically Section 4(D), 4(E), 5(1) and Section 28(A)(1) dealing with random things such as “fit and proper person, good financial standing, someone having a criminal record and regard for the law.”

A letter was written by myself to the relevant Minister to request that in future such candidates not be referred to the Committee as it frustrates the Committee’s work. Interviews subsequently commenced. Unfortunately, at the time due to illness I was unable to chair the interviews and I thank my colleagues for continuing the important legislative work of Parliament.

I requested the recordings of the interviews afterwards in my capacity as Chairperson, and I am satisfied that the correct procedures were followed.

In terms of the ANC indicating that they had a minority view, to my knowledge as per the recordings and as per the tabled report the ANC did not table a minority view, the EFF was the only party to table a minority view, although I am not too sure why a minority view was tabled by the EFF, but I think this might be for their lack of understanding of the criminal, general and tax laws of our country.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I request that the House supports the Committee report of five persons being recommended for the first vacancy, five persons being recommended for the second vacancy and five persons being recommended for the third vacancy, all vacancies being quite representative in terms of race and gender and the only candidates the EFF ever had a problem with during the procedure were white persons. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Hon members, I have to announce now that there are currently in total 20 Democratic Alliance members, 10 ANC, one EFF, one GOOD, one African Christian Democratic Party, one Freedom Front Plus, zero from Al Jama-ah. In total that is 34 members that are currently in this sitting and that excludes me who is presiding, so therefore this House is quorate.

The question put before the House is that the Report of the Standing

Committee on Finance, Economic Opportunities and Tourism be adopted.

Hon members, are there any objections to the report being adopted?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): No.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Object, object.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Yes, I object.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, there are objections to the report being adopted... [Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: Your lack of understanding sounds just like an insult.
[Speaking simultaneously.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those in favour of the report being adopted, please say “aye”.

HON MEMBERS: Aye.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Those not in favour of the report, say no.

HON MEMBERS: No.

Mr P MARRAN: I can hear they are divided. They are divided.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think in terms of the votes the “ayes” have it.

An HON MEMBER: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The “ayes” have it and the report is approved.

Thank you, hon members. I can now conclude the business for the day, the House is adjourned. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

Mr P MARRAN: Thank you, Deputy Speaker, thanks everyone.

The House adjourned at 17:55.