
THURSDAY, 3 OCTOBER 2019

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The SPEAKER: You may be seated. I recognise the Chief Whip.

(Motion)

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you hon Speaker, I move without notice:

That notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 20(1), precedence be given to the Subject for Discussion.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon Chief Whip. Are there any objections to the motion moved by the Chief Whip? No objections? Agreed to.

I would like to request the members and the guests, as I welcome you, hon members, and obviously our important guests in the gallery, that we are all welcome in this Parliament and please enjoy the sitting. Listen to the speeches as we debate, but hon members, when they debate, it does not mean as a guest you must begin to clap hands when there is something that is nice that is being said. So your excitement must be confined to you folding your arms and using your heart to jubilate. So which is, you can only be excited, but not clap your hands. How nice! So those are the Rules of Parliament. So please enjoy the sitting.

I also want to acknowledge in the gallery Fit for Life, which is an organisation based at Vrygrond in Muizenberg that trains, hon Premier and hon members, unskilled and semi-skilled matriculants and non-matriculants who are unemployed and have no criminal record. They are between the ages of 18 and 30 and receive extensive training in hard and soft skills to better equip themselves for the workplace and to help to better understand themselves, so welcome. May we please give them a round of applause?
[Applause.]

I recognise the Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you hon Speaker, I would like to notify the House that Minister Fritz and Minister Mbombo will not be present in the sitting today and the oral questions will stand over.

The SPEAKER: Thank you Chief Whip, noted. Are we all in favour, hon members? Thank you.

I think it is important for the hon members, I think for the guests in the gallery, to take stock of today's debate, that the House will debate the annual national crime statistics released by the National Minister of Police and the impact that it has on the citizens of the Western Cape and the motion was moved by hon member Allen. I now recognise hon member Allen.

SUBJECT FOR DISCUSSION

(The annual national crime statistics released by the National Minister of Police and the impact that it has on the citizens of the Western Cape)

HON MEMBERS: Hear-hear!

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Speaker, I welcome the topic of discussion regarding the annual crime stats as released by the National Minister of Police and its impact on the Western Cape and its citizens. We understand that the crime stats is a tool to guide the operational plans for SAPS. It is also a tool in helping all safety stakeholders anticipate increased risk of crime in order to improve our safety responses.

I hold the view that the stats serve not only to quantify crime or to create a debate in our society, I believe that this is a call to action, a call to action

across all government spheres, business, NGOs and communities. Hon Speaker, the Premier recently pledged an amount of R1 billion towards creating a safer province with the aim to halve the murder rate in the next ten years. This is a bold undertaking but a very necessary one as we know that SAPS are struggling to keep our community safe.

The crime stats released shows that there were less crimes reported by the community to the police and less crimes detected by the police during the 2018/2019 reporting period, but this is in stark contrast of the community's sense of safety and reality. The community reported crime down 1,7% and crime detected as a result of police action down a staggering 27,2%. It is clear that SAPS appears to be unable to stem the tide on crime due to under-resourcing pressures in the Western Cape, and hon Speaker, I fear that communities are increasingly not reporting crime due to a growing unhappiness with the police or distrust in the police's abilities to assist. More worrying is that this is not a new occurrence, as the community reported crimes have been increasing over the last five years.

With this I want to urge communities to continue sending their tip-offs on domestic violence, robberies, burglaries and especially drug- and gangster-related crimes and those activities taking place in and around public facilities. By working together we can rid our schools, our homes and streets of this evil, which often ruins the lives of promising young people. The Police Ombudsman provides an independent impartial system for the handling of complaints about the conduct of police officers. Complaints are

then handled in a manner which is free of any police, governmental or sectional community interest and I want to encourage the community and all members here even, to continue to use this avenue to voice their grievances.

Fellow hon members, for us it is crystal clear that things are not the way it is supposed to be and through this debate and the preparation thereof I really trust that we have been forced to re-apply our minds to the reality behind the stats and how we can come together with ideas and recommendations via a vigorous engagement in order to find solutions.

Hon Speaker, I did a quick Hansard count, and since the beginning of this term up until before you spoke, an amount of 256 014 words have been echoed in this Chamber but I firmly believe that today, as we come together, we will raise our voice and find solutions to know that it is no more time to merely talk but for our plans to come together and for action to take place, so I look forward to this debate and I thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Allen. I now recognise the ANC, hon member Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Hon Speaker, this thing of treating such important debates as a circus or talk-shops has to come to an end. When we talk crime we are talking about people's lives and therefore we must not play games with

people's lives. That is my appeal - stop playing games with people's lives. This platform should be used to engage on best possible strategies we can implement as a province to avert the situation. As a province, with increasing contact crimes as well as the murder rate, we unfortunately do not have the luxury of time, of playing games and playing the blame game for that matter. According to stats, contact crimes have increased in this province, as well as the murder rate which increased by 6,6% in the province. The casual factor for murder includes arguments, misunderstanding, armed robbery, domestic violence, taxi violence and gang-related incidents, which accounted for 938 cases.

The Western Cape had the highest percentage of people aged 16 and above who were victims of street robbery, compared to other provinces. Furthermore, the most likely victims of this crime were males, young adults and people living in the Western Cape. Of interest to me is that of the top 30 murder stations in the country, the province has 11, with 10 of those coming in the top 15 stations. The most used murder weapons were guns and knives as well as sharp objects.

With a closer look at these stations you will see that it is areas like Nyanga, Delft, Khayelitsha, Bishop Lavis, Mitchells Plain, Kraaifontein, to mention but a few. Just by looking at the list you can clearly see that one of the primary drivers of these violent crimes is socio-economic factors.

The research by urban safety reference groups shows that poor planning and

exclusionary spatial form of socio-economic factors contribute to low levels of safety. It is therefore not surprising that all Western Cape stations in the top 30 murder stations are low income areas in the townships and the Cape Flats characterised by drug and substance abuse, high unemployment, especially for youth and surrounded by many informal settlements.

Hon Speaker, from the above we can clearly see that in order for the province to win the mounting battle against crime and murder in the province we need the Provincial Government to come to the party and stop being just distant spectators, spewing vile and hailing insults from the pavilion. The Government must lead and accelerate the process of informal settlement upgrading. The poor lighting and accessibility issues create a conducive environment for crime. The communal toilets in dark spots, which are usually 500 metres away from people's homes, are turned into crime scenes, where women and children are raped and murdered.

Hon Speaker, the biggest problem in the Western Cape is that the Provincial Government does not put resources towards the prevention of crime. To the Provincial Government crime is a national competency. They can only take part if police functions and powers are evolved to province. This is why the Premier has decided to create his own police force. [Interjections.]

While we cautiously welcome additional resources into the fight against crime, the attitude of the Provincial Government needs to change. Instead of causing divisions and tensions among crime-fighting structures, it needs to

support calls for a unified approach towards fighting crime. The starting place should be the support to the integration of Metro Policing to SAPS. [Interjections.]

Secondly, the role of communities should be at the centre of fighting crime. Other provinces have gone to establish ward safety forums and ensuring that they receive necessary support to function. In other provinces there are even school safety forums and committees ensuring school safety... [Interjection.]

Mr D AMERICA: Ja, we have that in the Western Cape.

Mr D SMITH: ...while in the Western Cape resources are spent on taking children on beach trips during holidays. Hon Speaker, without falling into the trap of politicising the matter, but really to stand up here, grandstanding and putting all the blame on SAPS while ignoring the factors, is dangerous, to say the least. [Interjections.] Secondly, when you have 3,3 million people... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members. Order! Please proceed, hon member Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Their two seconds! Secondly, when you have 3,3 million people that are not working in the province you must accept that it is a recipe for disaster. We have to fight for those young men standing on street corners who have little hope for the future besides ending up in jail. [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Have you decided [Inaudible.]

Mr D SMITH: We have to break the cycle of poverty and violence that is gripping too many neighbourhoods. [Interjections.] We need more young men in colleges, than in prison. [Interjections.]

Mr P MARRAN: You can sign on, fortunately... [Inaudible.]

Mr D SMITH: Until such time that we address these root causes, I do not think we will ever win the battle against crime. [Interjections.] Yes, we need more cops but we also need more families. How many times in the last year, hon Speaker, has the province lost a child at the hands of another child? How many times have our hearts stopped in the middle of the night with the sound of a gunshot or a siren? How many teenagers have we seen hanging around on the street corners when they should be sitting in a classroom? How many are sitting in the prison when they should be working or at least looking for a job? How many in the generation are we willing to lose to poverty or violence or addiction? How many more?

Thank you, hon Speaker. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Smith, thank you. [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: How many more?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members. Hon member Smith, thank you. I now recognise the EFF, hon member Xego. [Interjections.]

†Die ADJUNKHOOF SWEEP (DA): Jy kan baie bly wees dit is jou *maiden speech* gewees. Jy kan baie bly wees.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): You should be grateful that it was your maiden speech. You should be very grateful.]

Mr M XEGO: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. On 12 September 2019 the National Minister of Police released the national crime statistics report. The main concern for this House should be that the Western Cape province recorded the highest number of townships which experienced crimes when compared to other provinces. This could be due to the fact that the Provincial Government pays less attention to the safety of the poor in the townships... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Service delivery.

Mr M XEGO: ...as most of the resources of the provincial law enforcement budget is utilised to the benefit of those who are privileged and reside in rich suburbs. [Interjections.] The murder rate in the province increased by 6,6% compared to the 3,4% nationally. Attempted murder increased by 4,4% compared to the 4,1% nationally, whilst car hijacking increased to 5,1%, compared to the 1,8% nationally. More, following the release of these shocking crime statistics, the Western Cape Premier responded by

announcing what he terms “the most comprehensive expansive safety plan.”

An HON MEMBER: Yes, where is it?

Mr M XEGO: The plan is mainly based on increasing the law enforcement personnel in the province and this will be achieved by cutting budgets from other portfolios. The problem with this strategy is that mainly it focuses on one area as crime fighting measure, which is policing. By aiming to take resources from other departments and focusing them only in this one area is a serious challenge. This happens at the backdrop of the crime statistics report making it clear that some of these crimes, for example such as increasing murder, take place as a result of people who are usually closely related to each other in close proximity and who are usually under the influence of alcohol, others being what is termed the crime of passion where people are usually married or dating and then they murder each other. The report makes it clear that most of these murders are caused by misunderstandings and arguments and in almost all these cases it is very difficult to police these crimes, more especially when the victims usually do not come forward to report perpetual abuse which eventually lead to murder. Moreover efforts should be made to empower members of the public to come forward, to report crimes and create an environment where the police take these crimes seriously and effectively act upon them, for example, the national crime statistics report covers 21 crime categories of which 17 were reported by the public and only four were as a result of police activity, mainly taking place in the roadblocks or raids and covering confiscation of illegal firearms,

drinking under the influence of alcohol and drugs; possession of trade and illegal drugs... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: You need to wrap up, hon member. †Gqibezela Ngconde. [Finish up Ngconde.]

Mr M XEGO: Okay, in conclusion. We as the EFF, we see this as a collective responsibility and the civil society and Government institutions must join forces in making sure that we win this war against crime. So we are appealing to Government to include all departments in terms of budget to ensure that we combat crime and everything. [Time expired.] [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you hon member Xego, your time is up. Thank you very much. I now recognise the GOOD party, hon member Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I must say I am disappointed that the DA did not put the Premier's Safety Plan on the Order Paper for debate today. For some reason they seem to avoid allowing this House to debate this Government's term of office priorities. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: It is part of the debate.

Mr B N HERRON: Hon Speaker, we welcome the Premier's decision to introduce a safety plan, but I must say I cannot actually find the plan.

[Interjections.] All I find is a video and a media statement and today I got an email from the DA, I am still obviously on their mailing list, asking me to comment on a plan that I cannot find. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Please opt out!

Mr B N HERRON: It takes me to a video. [Interjections.] Nevertheless, hon Speaker, we do not need debate to confirm that the crime in our province and in our country is out of control. Theft, sex for jobs, denigration of women, assault, murder, hate have become engrained in our society and GOOD has consistently stated that policing alone will never solve our society's problems.

During the elections the DA promised a provincial police force. Their previous Head of Policy said the DA does not take policy very seriously and I am inclined to agree with her, because they have avoided or ignored all of the evidence around the world that shows that policing that is done at a provincial or state level fails to work. In fact, from the USA hundreds of thousands of people have escaped justice simply by crossing provincial or state borders.

When we developed our policies GOOD looked at other countries to see how they have already solved the problems that we are trying to solve. In Columbia for example serious crime has been reduced by more than 80% in some cities and this was achieved by ensuring that policing worked hand in

hand with social services. They focused on fixing the root causes of crime rather than just the symptoms of complex social and economic issues. This is GOOD's proven solution to reducing crime. [Interjections.]

I do appreciate Premier Winde's recent about turn in adopting this plan because he is right, we cannot solve the crime problem without dealing with social services. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Herron.

An HON MEMBER: Disappointed, disappointed, sit down.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Where is the plan? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Herron, I now recognise the DA, Minister Meyer.

†n AGBARE LID: Ja, gooi kole.

[An HON MEMBER: Yes, throw coals!]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, thank you for this opportunity to take part in this debate. I would like to talk about the impact of crime in rural areas on the economy of the Western Cape and particularly

its impact on agriculture. [Interjections.]

Hon Speaker, you will know that the agricultural value production in 2018, which was last year, was R43 billion. [Interjection.] We also know that commercial agriculture in the Western Cape stands at 20,9%. Now all of us in this House knows that the Western Cape is approximately 10% of the geographical landscape, 10% of the population, and yet 20,9% of the commercial agriculture is here in the Western Cape. Despite the worst drought in 2017, hon members of this House will know, many of you in your constituencies had been affected as a result of this drought. Despite the worst drought in a 100 years, the direct investment into agriculture in 2017 was R4 billion.

Hon members of this House will also know that in terms of the GDP contribution, this sector, the agricultural sector, the sector of myself and hon member Pat Marran, is significant... [Interjection.] It made a contribution of 10,3% of the provincial GDP. We also know, hon Speaker, that 45% of all the agricultural exports in South Africa, hon member Marran, comes from the Western Cape. It is in your interest and it is in my interest and it is in the collective interest that we protect the economy... [Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: Even farmworkers?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... precisely about the farmworkers. Farmworkers constitute 16%. [Interjections.] It is very... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members! [Interjections.]

Mr P MARRAN: [Inaudible.] the minimum wage.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon member Pat Marran. [Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: A wage of R1 800. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, will you please take your seat. [Interjections.]

Mr P MARRAN: That is the issue. It is a policy issue. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members! [Interjections.]

Mr P MARRAN: It says R1 800. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you hon member Marran for acknowledging the important role of farmworkers in the landscape of the economy of the Western Cape, because it is 16,7% of the labour force in the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, protect them.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: It is also 26% of the total agricultural labour force in South Africa, so yes, it plays a significant role. It is about 226 000 agricultural workers. [Interjections.] It is about 231 000, so I think hon member Pat Marran and I, we are in agreement that agricultural production needs to be protected. [Interjections.] But more important, hon Speaker, †landbou is die ruggraat van die ekonomie van die Wes-Kaap. [Tussenwerpsels.] [agriculture is the backbone of the economy of the Western Cape.]

An HON MEMBER: We know.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: We agree in this House also, even the Freedom Front, the GOOD party, the EFF, the African National Congress... [Interjections.]

Mr M XEGO: No!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ...as well as my party.

Mr D AMERICA: Yes!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: We agree on one thing. [Interjections.] We need to grow the economy and we believe collectively we will - you are part of this Legislature. You must rise to the occasion. You took an oath of office... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, order, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: That oath must now come into reality.

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon Minister. [Interjections.] [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon Speaker... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon members, I recognise the point of order by the Deputy Chief Whip of the ANC.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, is it correct for the hon MEC, to address the member hon member Pat Marran directly, he should be addressing you, hon Speaker. [Interjection.] Can you please correct him in that regard? Thank you. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Deputy Chief Whip of the ANC.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, I will address you.

An HON MEMBER: You are not recognised, sit down!

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, will you please take your seat.

Mr M XEGO: Please behave and sit down! Behave! [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, the Speaker is speaking. You know, the Speaker is not part of the debate.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: So will you please respect the authority of the Presiding Officer. Mine is to be a fair referee, but do not try to include me in the debate by not listening to me. We want to make sure the spirit and decorum of the House prevail in pursuit of the agenda before us. So I am simply appealing to each and every one of the hon members that let us please allow the debate to continue as intended and observe Rule 40, not to run running commentary, because what happens is that it disrupts the House. I recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Speaker, thank you for this opportunity. †Ons weet dat Landbou is die ruggraat van die Wes-Kaapse ekonomie. Daarom moet ons landbou koester. Ons moet dit beskerm en ons moet dit ondersteun. Ons intensie in die Wes-Kaap is ook om by te dra tot ekonomiese groei in die landbousektor. Ons projeksies, agbare Speaker, dui daarop dat indien ons 5% ekonomiese groei kry in die landbousektor kan ons 23 000 nuwe werkseleenthede hier in die Wes-Kaap skep.

Agb Speaker, 50% van alle Suid-Afrikaanse wynbouproduksie word uit die

Wes-Kaap uitgevoer. U is ook bewus dat die Wes-Kaap beskik oor 98% van alle wynkelders in Suid-Afrika. Landbou is die ruggraat van die Wes-Kaapse ekonomie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[We know that agriculture is the backbone of the Western Cape economy. Therefore we must nurture it. We must protect it and support it. Our intention in the Western Cape is to also contribute to the economic growth in the agricultural sector. Our projections, hon Speaker, indicate that if we can achieve 5% economic growth in the agricultural sector we can create 23 000 new job opportunities here in the Western Cape.]

Hon Speaker, 50% of all South African wine production is exported from the Western Cape. You are also aware that the Western Cape has 98% of all wine cellars in South Africa. Agriculture is the backbone of the Western Cape economy.]

Hon Speaker, an attack on a farm or an attack on a farmer or an attack on a farmworker is an attack on the rural agricultural economy of the Western Cape. Farmers and agri-workers are living in fear in South Africa. Farmers and agri-workers are under attack. Several murders on producers and workers have taken place in recent months in South Africa. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: By who? [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: The current lack of safety not only affects the people, hon Speaker, but it also affects the economy, all of whom compromises the ability of the sector to create jobs, enable food security and to grow our economy. Agri-processing remains a critical Provincial Government priority as the driver to create jobs and stimulate economic growth with many of these jobs within the rural landscape. The safety of all stakeholders within the agricultural value chain is therefore key in addressing poverty.

To address this problem, hon Speaker, the Western Cape Government has developed a response strategy, which is located with the Western Cape Safety Plan recently announced by the Premier of the Western Cape, Alan Winde.
[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Where is the plan?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: The aims of the rural strategy is to align the available law enforcement resources to respond to the safety needs of rural communities. It is also strengthening relationships between rural communities and law enforcement agencies. It also encourages all stakeholders in the rural safety to work together in a coordinated and integrated manner and engage in joint planning, implementation, monitoring, development and evaluation of combating crime in rural areas.

The Western Cape has also started the process of drafting a response to the

national rural safety strategy to ensure that the often unique safety challenges of the very rural communities are considered as the Section 206 of the Constitution. Hon Speaker, the Cabinet has also agreed with the various role players to establish an inter-ministerial committee under my leadership together with the Minister of Community Safety, Minister Albert Fritz.

We have also established a technical committee to make sure that we equip our rural farm watching units, the rural municipalities, the district municipalities with resources and capabilities to use technology to assist us with crime prevention. I have also recently visited some of these farm watches. They are doing outstanding work.

The National Development Plan is clear, we want to succeed in South Africa. We must have active citizenship and I am pleased that many farmers and farm workers have established forums to promote rural safety at their own cost and at their own time and I really, on behalf of this Government, want to thank them for their big contribution in assisting us to promote rural safety. [Interjections.] Hon Speaker, I have also decided that those people who are now committing a crime... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister, you need to wrap up.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Okay, I conclude. Those people in the Western Cape who are harming a farmworker or a farmer, I will be in court to oppose bail as I have done last Monday in the court in Franschhoek.

The PREMIER: Hear-hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: I will be back in court on 16 October.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I now recognise hon Marais, FF Plus.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. †Dankie agbare. [Thank you, honourable.]

†n AGBARE LID: Agbare.

[An HON MEMBER: Honourable.]

Mr P J MARAIS: The question before this House, I want to approach from a different angle - is it endemic in our justice system? [Interjections.] Shut up!

The question before... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: No! Hon member Marais, will you please take your seat. [Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Speaker, they are wasting my time with unwanted

interjections... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Will you please take your seat, hon member.

Mr P J MARAIS: Okay, they will jump up like Jack in the boxes now.
[Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Will you please take your seat, hon member Marais. Please.
Please do that. I recognise the Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker. Not so long ago there was a ruling, if I recall, on the use of the word “shut up” as being unparliamentary, so if you could perhaps guide the hon member on parliamentary procedure and what is parliamentary and not. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip. Hon members...

Mr P J MARAIS: I did not refer to any hon member.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, I think in the spirit, again I would like to request that we conduct ourselves in the manner that respects and promotes the decorum of this House. We have agreed in the previous sittings, hon member Marais, I am responding to your statement. Yes, you may not have done so, but we have requested members to withdraw and I would like you to withdraw that.

Mr P J MARAIS: Who should I withdraw, sir?

The SPEAKER: No, just to withdraw the statement, “shut up”. †Ngoba kuhleli abantu apha amalungu alendlu. [They are members of this House, so please.] Please do so, sir.

Mr P J MARAIS: I withdraw the statement, the word “shut up.”

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you very much. Will you please proceed, Sir.

Mr P J MARAIS: The question before this House, sir, is does our justice system tip heavier in favour of criminals than what it tipped in favour of victims? Has justice itself denied law-abiding citizens sufficient redress for their grievances and inflicted suffering? Are constitutional restraints and uncertainty with regard to the rights of criminals and victims out of balance? In law, the words “will do” or “shall do” or “may” have totally different meanings and if we look at our Constitution in the case of the accused the word “must” is used. In other words the courts must set an affordable sum of money that he can afford. Even if it is R20,00 then he is out on bail. This denies courts any discretion under any circumstances. On the other hand the State is required in Section 64A, B and C to prove that should bail be granted the accused will attempt to evade trial. He will attempt to influence or

intimidate witnesses; that he will destroy evidence. The onus is on the State to prove he will do it; not he might do it, but he will. This is our own remnant from the Roman Dutch law, innocent before proven guilty, whereas in Clause 65 it says “the Court may, where applicable, take into account his degree of violence towards others, he may take into account any threats of violence against people or repeating the same crime.” So in other words, the Court may do it, the Court has discretion. It does not have to take into account the past of this criminal or whether he will intimidate people.

The SPEAKER: Thank you hon member Marais. Your time is up.

Mr P J MARAIS: Can you see why I was annoyed when they wasted my time?

[Time expired.] [Laughter.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon member Marais. I hope they do not do that the next time.

Ms L M MASEKO: Go home!

The SPEAKER: May I request the DA, hon member Philander.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, hon Speaker. As previously mentioned in this House the crimes against women and children are not Women’s Month or 16 Days of Activism shout-out messages. The numbers are horrendous and must be amplified on every possible platform.

Hon Speaker, since 2018 rape cases only decreased by 0,2%. Sexual assault cases increased by 2,7%. Contact sexual offences increased by 18,9%. Altogether five of the top ten stations where contact sexual offences were recorded are located in the Western Cape. This is unacceptable and the community impact are indeed horrendous. From the above it must be stated that even though sexual offences do not only include women and children, women and children are in the majority. For example, just over a quarter of men reported rape where their female counterparts report nearly half of all the cases. The annual national crime statistics concerning women and children shows a slight increase in sexual offences where detected as a result of police action, at 1,8%. However, the actual counts are far too low, 169, compared to the offences reported 7 043.

Hon Speaker, somewhere, somehow, something needs to be done, yet the hope that criminals will be prosecuted is a pipedream for many cases. For the period April 2018 to March 2019 only 21% of the arrests made by SAPS ended in convictions. For the same period 18 cases of rape by police officers was referred to IPID. This, together with Uyinene's case, where a Government employee was found to be a criminal, is evidence of how the system is failing our women and children.

Thankfully the Courts Watching Brief Programme by DoCS revealed to us some failures of the system in order for us to become solution-driven. Yesterday they showed that SAPS only responded to 114 out of 1498 cases, of which systemic failures where documents were simply not present or

investigations were incomplete. Minister Mbombo revealed a plan to remedy the poor performance of EMS services in crime-ridden areas. These are problems that can be addressed by supplementing SAPS resources in our province.

Hon Speaker, this is why I welcome the Premier's R1 billion plan, especially where it aims to supplement SAPS... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Give us opportunity...

Ms W F PHILANDER: ... with 115 investigators as well as the initiative by DoCS to ensure all stations in the Western Cape have rape kits to supplement the evidence process for prosecution, by the end of this month. For these statistics to be reduced it will require small steps like these and for us to continue interrogating failures in order for us to render our communities a little safer every day. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] Checking with Marius.

Ms W F PHILANDER: We can no longer make excuses or shift the blame. We need to react to the cries of our communities in every possible way. [Interjections.]

†Agb Speaker, die ANC is regtigwaar verward. Eers wil hulle nie hê ons moet die blaam skuif nie en as die Premier en hierdie DA-regering 'n plan maak om

wel veiligheidsplanne in te bring, is hulle daarmee ook ontevrede.
 [Tussenwerpsels.] Agbare Speaker, ons verwelkom die ekstra geld vir hierdie provinsie om te verseker dat ons gemeenskappe veilig en in vrede kan lewe. Ek dank u. [Tussenwerpsels.] [Applous.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Hon Speaker, the ANC is really confused. At first they don't want us to shift the blame and when the Premier and this DA Government make a plan to indeed introduce safety plans, they are also unhappy with that. [Interjections.] Hon Speaker, we welcome the extra money for this province to ensure that our communities can live safely and in peace. I thank you. [Interjections.] [Applause.]]

†n AGBARE LID: Mooi!

[An HON MEMBER: Good!]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon member Philander. Hon members, I now recognise Al Jama-ah, hon member De Jager.

Mr I DE JAGER: Good day, hon Speaker, Premier and distinguished guests. Crime in the Western Cape has escalated drastically. The reason for that is high unemployment. In impoverished areas and rural areas there is no community police... [Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Listen to what he is saying.

Mr I DE JAGER: ...policing visibility and no rural safety plans. Attacks on farmers have increased according to the stats 2018 to 2019. On farms alone, 47 murders, 41 incidents of theft of livestock; seven attempted murders reported on the farms alone. Crime has an impact on our farming communities; on our rural communities as a whole. Some police stations are very far apart in assisting the rural areas and not enough police members or vehicles are made available to assist these people in these rural areas, especially in the rural areas. Hon Speaker, I think it is about time that this House and members, that we all get together and start working together to fight these things as members of the Provincial Legislature and stop fighting one another and get together and fight crime, that everybody and not only us but all the people out there that are moaning and groaning about, so let us get together and let us fight the crime from here and not fight the crime from the outside. I thank you, hon Speaker.

Mr P J MARAIS: Fight back. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member De Jager. Did I hear you correctly, hon member Marais, that you want to fight? [Laughter.] May I now... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Workshop, a 15-minute workshop.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon members, I recognise the hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and thank you very much to the hon member Allen for sponsoring this debate. It is really a very important debate for us in this province as well as in our country.

Why do we have crime statistics? Why do we make these statistics available? What do we actually do with these statistics, and you know, I ask myself this question fairly often because generally the statistics that we get are not used for management. Now normally you have statistics so that you can measure and when you measure you manage. In our country we put out crime statistics the next year, way beyond, and it is a history lesson. It is not a mechanism of how we deal with what is happening on the ground every single day in all of our communities, as being mentioned in this House today.

It really amazes me in the evening when I am finished with my last meeting and I get in my car and I pick up my phone to catch up the messages and the first thing I get is Google telling me how long it is going to take me to get home and which road to take to avoid any disruption or whatever the problem is on the way home, it is pre-empting any problem for me getting from A to B. I do not even ask it for that. It just gives it to me. We do not have any clue in this country of how to use crime statistics in management and I said

this to the President the other day: every single time our National Minister releases the crime statistics he apologises because it gets worse. The people in our country feel it. We felt the women of this province and of this country standing up because of the unbelievably high levels of gender-based violence in our system. We know in this province what it is like to be the murder capital of our country. These are all statistics but what are we doing about these statistics? It is all very well giving the country a history lesson but what happens, where is the management once you got the data and the detail and that is non-existent; and guess what is even more important in that management process, whose head is on the block because it does not seem as if our National Minister's head is on the block. There is no consequence at the moment in our system for the criminal. There is no consequence for the criminal. If we have a 3% conviction rate in our country it is much easier to commit crime than go to the casino because 3% conviction rate is nothing. The risk is just about not there, and quite frankly there is no consequence on the other side of the criminal, the politician who leads, what is the consequence for the Minister of Police, the Minister of our criminal justice system, the Ministers of the judiciary, the Ministers of Correctional Services, there is zero, zero consequence. No heads roll, no one is on the red carpet. So quite frankly it is really distressing when we have the release of these crime statistics, which is a history lesson, and quite frankly all it does is just get brushed under the carpet and we move on. But that is why this Province is taking a different stance with regard to crime, but let us also just have a look at some of the issues around the crime statistics at the moment and what is happening.

If we have a look at the murder numbers and I have said in this House a number of times around the murder numbers, I have spoken about our murder numbers in this province, which is actually the most credible statistic that we have, because we can correlate the statistics that the Minister gives us months and months later, we can take those statistics and align them with all of our autopsies in our hospitals and those two statistics line up. The other statistics there is no alignment whatsoever.

Rape, go to the seven Thuthuzela Centres that we have in this province. Have a look at how many women present at those Thuthuzela Centres and then how many are prepared to even lay a charge, less than 50%, and we only have seven of these centres, and quite frankly the numbers of 29 rapes per day in this province are nowhere near the real statistics that should be counted, and the consequence and the management that comes on the back of those statistics. If you have a look at - now let us just sort of blur some of those statistics with regard to murders that we know of, even beyond what the Minister has put out, and linking it to the deployment of the military, and we know the first weekend that the military were brought in we saw a substantial drop in our murder rate in specifically the Metro but also across the province and coming from a weekly between 50 and 70 murders, 70 generally on a payday-weekend, and 50 on average of a normal weekend or an abnormal weekend, should I say, in our Metro areas, and slowly but surely we have been seeing these numbers come down. I used to release these numbers every Monday morning but they had a massive negative impact on our economy but we still use them to manage, and we still use them to hold the police system

to account and I am pleased to announce in this House that in the last two weekends it has been 30 and this last weekend which was a payday-weekend, which is substantial lower than we have seen before and the weekend before was 31, and I really want to commend those dedicated police officers, Metro police officers, law enforcement officers, Neighbourhood Watches, members of the public and the military of being involved in these last operations, we actually started to see some of these numbers coming down and that is really good news and I congratulate them on that.

Statistics and the Safety Plan, but let us just have a look at the recorded number and this is one of the statistics that really is quite scary. 736 of the murders reported nationally and 4 196 common assaults in the stats were committed by children. This is a very, very scary number. I will talk about this graph just now and how many no-parent households we have, how many single-parent households we have, some of the worst statistics in the world, but children becoming more violent and in our plan we have seen, that is why we need to have - and hon member Xego, it is not about the boots on the ground - it is actually about the other integrated plan on every single department and you are right, it is about those long-term plans that will bring change in our province.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Ten years later.

The PREMIER: Those are the ones that are going to bring change in our province and it is interesting because or perhaps let me... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: The DA did nothing about that for about ten years.

The PREMIER: I will get to the ten years in a minute. [Interjections.] But let us also talk about the crime stats and you know there is one thing that these crime stats do not show us, police response times. We do not measure police response times and that is shocking because ask the people up in this gallery how often they call and they wait and they wait and they wait and no-one comes to help. No-one comes to help.

An HON MEMBER: Shocking!

The PREMIER: That is shocking. The number of cases that get struck off the roll, the Court Watching Brief, the system that we are talking about... [Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Oh, they take how long it takes them. That is also the problem. [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: ...that is also absolutely shocking. When we have in the last report 312 cases struck off the roll, 129 because the dockets were not in court - a failure of the system.

What did we do in the last ten years? We now produce these numbers - not the stats that the Police Minister releases. [Interjections.] 126 of these

investigations were incomplete. Who produces those? This Province! That was in the last ten years that we started putting these mechanisms in place. The only province with legislation, the only province in South Africa... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It got worst in the last 10 years.

An HON MEMBER: Ten years.

The PREMIER: And I have just heard - that in the last ten years, and the crime has got worse. The State - after ten years and the shortage of 548 detectives... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members! [Interjections.] Hon Premier, please with your indulgence, I just want to address the hon members here. I am simply asking for cooperation. I know that it may provoke certain reactions but we still have a number of speakers, in fact, two left. May I then request that hon members exercise caution in the amount of noise in terms of Rule 40. I recognise the Premier. [Interjections.] Hon member Lili.

Mr A LILI: Thank you, hon Speaker. Really, this is a serious matter that needs to be addressed, the issue of the Safety Plan around the Western Cape. Is the Premier of the Western Cape... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: What is your point of order?

The SPEAKER: What is your point of order?

Mr A LILI: Is the Premier of the Western Cape ready to take questions around the Safety Plan? [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Okay, alright. Please take your seat, hon member Lili. [Interjections.] Hon members! [Interjections.] Hon members, the hon member is asking whether the Premier is ready to take a question. Hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Will it count in my time?

The SPEAKER: Your time is on hold.

The PREMIER: Is it on hold?

The SPEAKER: Yes.

The PREMIER: If my time is on hold I will take a question.

Mr A LILI: But you are our Premier, you have to answer our questions.

The PREMIER: So ask the question.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Lili, you may ask your question.

Mr A LILI: Okay, thank you, hon Premier, my question is very simple - do you think that the issue around crime is solely around the issue of the law enforcement and excluding the living conditions and the poverty that our communities are forced to live in?

An HON MEMBER: What have you really done on poverty?

The SPEAKER: Alright, thank you, hon member Lili. The Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. Absolutely, and that is why the plan is there, the whole comprehensive plan. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Where? Where is the plan?

The PREMIER: We have seen in the investigations and the shortfall, so let us look at the criminal justice system. In the last while 2 129 001 crimes were reported; 1 000 626 arrests - that is 76%; 276 887 convictions - that is 13% and 152 553 imprisonments - that is 7%. Now what manages this system and this plan is a R1 billion plan and if I have enough time I will talk to that plan. [Interjections.] But listen to this, the criminal justice system as run by ANC management at ANC level, Government National and policy is R204 000 billion ...[Interjections.] and we are putting a R1 billion place in place.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: We want the plan.

The PREMIER: You asked for [Interjections.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: We do not want the figures of the money...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Hon members, the Premier is unable to convey the message within the environment that is conducive to do so. I am asking the Chief Whips here, the Chief Whip and the Chief Whip of the Official Opposition to help me. We need a functional Parliament in order for this debate to take place. Please assist, hon members. I recognise the Premier.

The PREMIER: R204 000 million is the budget of the criminal justice system. The police on which this hon member says, we need to take control of Metro police and law enforcement and SAPS under one body. We have got 19,500 police officers in this province run by the ANC, run by National Government. [Interjections.] We have got 1,500 officers in the Municipality of Cape Town. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order hon members! Is that a point of order, hon member?

An HON MEMBER: No. Create jobs.

An HON MEMBER: I am raising if the Premier is willing to take a question.

The SPEAKER: Hon Premier, are you ready to take a question?

The PREMIER: If you stop, I will take a question.

The SPEAKER: No, the time is not stopped.

The PREMIER: Then I will not take a question.

The SPEAKER: Alright, I recognise the Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you. This obviously seems to hurt with the noise that is coming out. [Interjections.] There are 19,500 police officers in this province and only 1,500... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members! Hon Premier, will you please take your seat. I seriously - Chief Whip, will you please take your seat. Hon members, it is up to us to make sure that the House is what we want. This is our House, so you cannot really rely on the Speaker to keep saying "order, order". We need to conduct ourselves in such a way that the House is not compromised. So I am really calling on all of us to please respect the decorum of the House and allow the Premier to deliver his speech in an environment that is conducive to do so. I recognise the Premier. Chief Whip.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much. So we have 19,500 police officers in this province. This hon member says that the 1,500 Metro police officers and law enforcement officers should fall under the police. The police is a total failure. The management does not exist. The crime statistics are not used.

An HON MEMBER: Exactly!

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): So is the blame [Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: We are not bringing down crime, we are not bringing down crime in South Africa at all. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): And the school resource officers. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: We are on the worst statistics in most of these indicated in the world. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: The Premier is complaining.

The PREMIER: The ANC's model is when something fails; ask another failed organisation to take it over. I mean it is unbelievable how they cannot fix the system in our country and we are now stepping into a space that is not our mandate because we have to make it safer... [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Metro Police is not even deployed in Philippi

[Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: And I agree that it is the whole-of-society approach and that is why our plan is not only 3 000 extra boots on the ground... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order hon members. Premier.

The PREMIER: It is not only putting extra investigators in the system so we do not have the total failure of the existing system. It is making sure that we improve the system so we bring down crime but it is also about every single one of these Ministers and the role that they play across society, whether it be lighting in communities, whether it be poverty reduction, whatever they are, and you have already seen Minister Madikizela has already launched his plan on how in his Department the role that he will be playing around the changing of our traffic police to highway patrol and the different roles that they are going to play. [Interjections.] You have already seen the Minister of Agriculture in the Rural Safety Plan, where that mechanism has already been put in place and you will see each of these Ministers putting their plans in place, and they will be coming back to our Safety Cabinet which will be open for measurement and to the public as we move towards these indicators, whether they are green or red, and how we manage it and what the consequences are. [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Premier.

The PREMIER: We are having to take over the job in this province, because that ANC, their policies and their National Government are a total failure!
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Premier.

The PREMIER: And with that, Mr Speaker, I would like to say thank you very much, but lastly, just to acknowledge the role that our Neighbourhood Watches play. These men and women walk late at night to make sure our communities remain safe and I really want to ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier, your time is up.

The PREMIER: ... thank them. They are the real stars in this fight. Thank you. [Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.] Order, hon members. Thank you, hon Premier. I now recognise the ANC, hon member Kama. [Applause.]

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, Mr Speaker. You know, we need to take note of what is happening in the House today.

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr M KAMA: That the Premier continues to talk about “a plan”, and members of this House are struggling with one thing and they are asking where the plan is so that we can study it, understand it and support Government.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr M KAMA: But we cannot find the plan. [Interjections.] But, Mr Speaker, the statistics, whether viewed on the basis of a national or a provincial overview, gives credence to the fears and concerns of South Africans as it relates to their safety.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M KAMA: Nationally the statistics on the period under review, record the highest murder rate in the past 10 years, at an average of 58 people murdered a day. They record an increase in sexual offences ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Good job!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Under your watch.

Mr M KAMA: ... of 4.6%. and substantial increases in all other contact crimes which create fear in our citizens. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Good job.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Mr M KAMA: Mr Speaker, as the statistical overview in the Western Cape relates, increases of 6.6% in murder; 4.4% in attempted murder and 3.8% in assault with the intent to inflict grievous bodily harm, are recorded.

But, Mr Speaker, unlike the DA Government, which has long decided to politicise the issue of crime, as evident in their manifesto calling for a provincial police force, some of the utterances that we hear today ... [Interjections.] the ANC approach is to look at what the statistics present.

An HON MEMBER: Ja!

Mr M KAMA: We should assist this House in responding to the challenges of crime. [Interjections.] Mr Speaker, on page 25 of the statistics report we see a registered decrease ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M KAMA: ... in the number of ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon member Kama, will you please take your seat. I have made the same call repeatedly, hon members. I

seriously depend on the hon members behaving in a manner that is consistent with the decorum of this House.

So you must help me, both the Chief Whip of the majority party and the Chief Whip of the ANC. I cannot be the Chief Whip from this Chair, but I also request that we just allow the debate and the spirit of the debate to prevail. Hon member Kama?

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker. The ANC's approach is to look at what the statistics present which would assist this House in responding to the challenges of crime.

On page 25 of the statistics report, we see a registered decrease in the murder rate in Nyanga, in Philippi, in Gugulethu, Mfuleni and substantially in Kraaifontein.

We also on page 106 see a registered decrease in sexual offences in the province; in Nyanga, in Gugulethu, Harare and substantially in Mitchells Plain.

We also see decreases in burglary, whether at residential or non-residential premises.

These have been achieved through the stabilisation interventions by the South African Police because the current period, Mr Speaker, under review, does

not record the stabilisation interventions that are in place as we speak. We can confirm in this House that further successes will be recorded.

In that, Mr Speaker, we must commend the work of SAPS and other community crime-fighting structures, as mentioned earlier. Allow me to focus a bit on the SAPS approach.

One is stabilisation intervention at a first stage. Then followed by normalisation interventions which focus on the root cause analysis and bringing together different departments to tackle crime. Social behaviour, as influenced by unemployment, poverty, inequality, dysfunctional families ...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Kama, will you please take your seat. I recognise the Chief Whip.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Mr Speaker. I would like to know if the hon member will take a question?

An HON MEMBER: It is time-wasting.

Mr M KAMA: Out of an understanding, Mr Speaker, as displayed today, that the DA does not understand the challenge of crime ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Answer a question.

Mr M KAMA: ... I would rather use this time to lecture them and educate them on the subject. [Applause.]

Social behaviour is influenced by unemployment, poverty, inequality, dysfunctional families and relationships and all other social ills remain some of the contributing factors of not only murder, but crime in general, hence the importance of the normalisation intervention.

Mr Speaker, instead of the Premier choosing to issue a political statement which he termed as “the best safety plan” we have ever seen, a plan that introduced an additional appointment of 3,000 municipal police service personnel and 150 investigators with no legislative mandate, we want to call on the Premier to give a detailed socio-economic plan with timeframes and budgets, which will focus on changing the lives of the poor in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

The DA Government and its benches have been making false claims that the Western Cape is unfairly treated as it relates to police personnel. A lie which has continuously been refuted. [Interjections.]

What we agree with, as confirmed by police leadership is that the police establishment is not responding to the population growth, because when we had a population of 47 million, the police personnel were about plus-minus 190,000. Even today at 56 million, we still have about plus-minus 190,000 in the country, and this does not only affect the Western Cape; it is a problem in

the country. [Interjections.] Now here we are. [Interjections.] Here we are, Mr Speaker, in responding to this. We welcome the current work in the police service to reveal the establishment and the allocation of enlisting police resources. [Interjections.] We also welcome the announced interventions by the President ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members!

Mr M KAMA: Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon members, order! Please, proceed, hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Mr Speaker, we welcome the interventions that are made by the police. Today we are made to believe that the introduction of 1,500 personnel is the best thing we have ever seen but we have seen the [Inaudible] announced that continuing in the next financial years there is going to be recruitment of 7,000 police personnel that are going to be recruited. [Interjections.]

While sexual offences have decreased in the province and a decrease in rape, being a contributor according to the stats, we have seen an increase in other sexual offences, like sexual assaults and other gender-based violence cases. We call on the police leadership to put in place strict consequence management mechanisms as we can no longer tolerate the dismissive behaviour of police and ill-treatment of victims at other stations.

Police officers must understand that they owe their allegiance to the Constitution of the Republic and citizens of this country, and not criminals.

We also want to welcome the upgrading and revamp of the Family Violence, Child Protection and Sexual Offences Unit, which will also have a cold case capacity ... [Interjections.] to respond to the cries of women and on the cases which were not given the necessary attention. [Interjections.]

Mr Speaker, here is a lecture once again. [Interjections.] In the fight against femicide and gender-based violence, this Government must first understand one thing, which is the historical context of what we are talking about.

This historical context includes the development and evolution of societies under different systems of protection and distribution of resources.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr M KAMA: Those historical relationships of men and means production have always been an influence of how they socially relate to women hence the development of patriarchal relations. [Interjections.]

It is our understanding, Mr Speaker, that the roles of Government therefore should be to ensure that it privatises the economic development of women in the Western Cape. [Interjections.] That in Government departments it must be a thing of the past that only men occupy senior positions against women. In

appointments of board entities, executive councils in Parliaments, in businesses, we should all commit ourselves in fighting for gender parity. This will help on how women and our grandsons grow to view women in society.

[Applause.]

Allow me, Mr Speaker, to focus on community involvement. Statistics in this regard, as confirmed by the Chair, reveal that there is a decrease in crimes that are reported by the community.

An HON MEMBER: What?

Mr M KAMA: Yes, the first argument which is easy, is that ...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order, hon members! Please proceed, hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: The first argument, Mr Speaker, is that communities have lost confidence in the police which we accept because while we have good police, we also have bad police who have compromised the trust between police and communities.

The PREMIER: What are you doing about it?

Mr M KAMA: And this we must deal with.

The PREMIER: What are you doing about that?

Mr M KAMA: Mr Speaker, we also want to put it on record that this is also because of the political meddling of the Provincial Government.

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

Mr M KAMA: The MEC recently issued directives of AGM's which are not in line with the CPF Constitution. Not only that they are not in line, but these directives were also developed in isolation with no community involvement.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr M KAMA: This creates internal factions, fights and defocuses the CPF's from their mandate, and energy and time are focused on AGM's instead of fighting the actual crime. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr M KAMA: We welcome the resolution, Mr Speaker, of the last CPF Board meeting, which called on CPF's to continue and use the CPF Constitution to conduct these AGM's. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Were you there?

Mr M KAMA: Mr Speaker, as I conclude, Mr Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members! Please conclude, hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Yes. As I conclude, Mr Speaker, the Western Cape Provincial Government must stop behaving like a net which finds itself in a Wimbledon final of the great Novak and Roger Federer, whose responsibility is only to divide the two halves of the tennis court.

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M KAMA: The Provincial Government is not dividing the National Government ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr M KAMA: ... and the Local Government.

The SPEAKER: Your time is up.

Mr M KAMA: It has a role to play in changing the lives ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M KAMA: ... of our people. Where is the plan? Thank you very much.

[Applause.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Kama. [Interjections.] Hon members, order! [Interjections.] Order, hon members! [Interjections.] I now recognise the DA, hon member Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Speaker ... [Interjections.] Just because we are shouting ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

Mr R I ALLEN: ... that does not make the argument and the merits of the argument any stronger. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

Let me begin ... [Interjections.] with the opening sentiments as relayed by the hon member Smith and he mentioned playing ... [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It looks like you do not have a speech.

Mr R I ALLEN: ... the blame-game. I fail to understand, because ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It is your game, the blame game.

Mr R I ALLEN: ... whenever I think about the crime stats I am automatically reminded of two family members that were a stat, but to me they are family members.

An HON MEMBER: Mmm.

Mr R I ALLEN: Family members that lost their lives due to crime. So nowhere, anywhere are we to say that we are playing the blame game in understanding that we know that SAPS are under-staffed, they are understaffed by 4,500 people in this province; they are under-equipped; they are under-resourced; and they are under-trained; and we know that is unacceptable. We know that is unacceptable. [Interjections.]

What we are doing is that specifically, as hon member Smith was mentioning, the socio-economic conditions relating to high crime levels and specifically the boy child. The Premier's plan is ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What plan?

Mr R I ALLEN: ... clear in that it will specifically target gang-ridden communities and ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Share that plan.

Mr R I ALLEN: ... as I said it will ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Listen!

Mr R I ALLEN: Listen; it will target specific gang-ridden communities and the successful Chrysalis programme, which aims to address the concerns ...
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Chrysalis?

Mr R I ALLEN: ... raised by the hon member Smith. [Interjections.]

Also, this plan will be made available after the appropriate process, but that does not mean that the work is already starting. The entire Executive has been mandated and we are already looking to see how it can be implemented so that that change can be in effect. [Interjections.] As the DA and in the Western Cape we remain committed ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: To what?

Mr R I ALLEN: ... because crime and safety is a top priority for this Government.

An HON MEMBER: Where is the MEC now?

Mr R I ALLEN: As I was listening to each and every one, I am reminded of a story, Premier ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Do not tell us Zimbabwe.

Mr R I ALLEN: ... in which ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order! Order, hon members! Please proceed, hon member.

Mr R I ALLEN: I am reminded of a story in which a young boy goes with his dad to the beach, and as they come home his shoe is full of sand and he messes the sand in the ... [Interjections.]

Ms P Z LEKKER: Story teller.

Mr R I ALLEN: As the sand is messed in the house, his sister complains that he is making a mess, but his dad is not upset. His dad goes on to say that due to the ocean's moving you basically change the world, and it will take a whole lot of trips to the beach in order to change the world where it makes a difference; and change is difficult ... [Interjections.]

Listen, change ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr R I ALLEN: ... change is difficult.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Allen. Your time is up.

†‘n AGBARE LID: Daar’s hy!

[An HON MEMBER: There you go!]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr R I ALLEN: Change is difficult but change is definitely needed ...

[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Allen. [Interjections.]

Mr R I ALLEN: But let me conclude. [Interjections.] Let me conclude.

The SPEAKER: No, hon member Allen, please take your seat.

Mr R I ALLEN: I was asked to conclude.

An HON MEMBER: No!

Mr P MARRAN: No, no, Chief Whip, you said his time is up. Can the story teller please sit? [Laughter.]

Mr R I ALLEN: Okay.

The SPEAKER: Hon members ... [Interjections.]

†Mnr R I ALLEN: Julle moet eerste wen voordat jy die Speaker kan raak.

[Mr R I ALLEN: You have to win first before you can become the Speaker.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member Allen ... [Interjections.] Hon members, order! Alright, thank you. Hon members, there is only one Speaker, hon member Marran. [Interjections.] Hon member Marran, please do not do that next time. There is only one Speaker, and the Speaker is in full control of the speaking time. [Interjections.]

So please let us not do that next time, but I just want to say to hon members ... [Interjections.] Order, hon members! Thank you very much for your contribution in the debate. It has been a pleasant experience to hear all the contradictions and arguments and inputs.

I am now going to refer members to Interpellations. We are going to entertain the first interpellation. The first interpellation is by hon member Sayed to the Minister of Education. I now recognise Minister Schäfer.

INTERPELLATIONS:

Amalgamation of schools in Herold

1. Mr M K Sayed asked the Minister of Education:

Whether her Department has plans to amalgamate the two public

schools in Herold, namely the Franken Primary School and the Herold Primary School; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and hon member Sayed for the interpellation. I just, as a matter of background, want to first of all sketch what is happening between the two schools.

Franken VGK Primary School is a public ordinary school on leased land. The school has an enrolment of 300 learners from Grade R to 7, plus 55 learners in Grade 8 and 9. 79 learners from surrounding areas made use of the learner transport scheme. The Herold community is also served by a second primary by the name of Herold Laerskool, which is a public ordinary school on state-owned land, with four classrooms and accommodates 50 learners.

The WCED entered into a lease agreement with the Church in 2003 to accommodate Franken VGK Primary. The lease agreement has been renewed every three years. The current lease agreement expired on 31 March 2018, and despite the WCED's intention and efforts to renew the lease, as had been the practice on previous occasions in respect of this property, owing to ongoing negotiations and unresolved points of contention between the landowners and the school, no formal renewal has been concluded as yet.

However, the WCED has continued paying monthly rental to the church as

the lease continues on a month-to-month basis, and the school remains in occupation.

The WCED has been in contact with the Church's attorneys with regards to extending the lease and the negotiations are ongoing. However, the Church, through its attorneys, informed the WCED that it is considering the option of subdividing and selling the premises on which the school is located, which has further complicated the conclusion of the renewal.

As a result of the delay in settling the lease and the possible sale of the land, the Department is now investigating alternatives, which could involve the closure of Franken Primary or the merger of the two schools on Herold Primary property.

The process is in its infancy and therefore there has not yet been consultation between the two schools, nor have I received any formal recommendation to this effect, and so under the circumstances I cannot add anything further at this stage. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I now recognise hon member Sayed.

Mr M K SAYED: Mr Speaker, firstly let me thank the Minister for the response, but as the ANC, we support calls for school mergers in cases where it will promote social cohesion and where it will improve effective

use of scarce education resources for the benefit of all learners, but we vehemently oppose using our schools to preserve white privilege where fully resourced, predominantly white schools, will be allowed to have fewer learners and best teacher-to-learner ratios, whilst those for poor and predominantly black learners will be characterised by overcrowding and lack of resources.

The Department's approach to school mergers in the province is arbitrary and is problematic.

MEC Schäfer's Department is adamant to close down Graafwater High School on the West Coast; one of the best performing schools in that region; despite objections from parents and the community. In fact the entire process around forcing that closure is not transparent, with the MEC even ignoring the governing body's request for her presence in a public meeting.

At the same time we find this particular case where the MEC refuses to amalgamate the Franken Primary. We hear that the process is in its infancy. It is not in its infancy. The calls have been made for a long time. A predominantly black school with 275 learners and Herold Primary, a former Model C school with 50 learners, situated in Herold. The two schools are less than 600 metres apart. I do not know why they are dragging their feet in this regard.

Mr Speaker, the schools are operating from private property, with Franken Primary School operating from the United Reformed Church in Herold. We were approached by Mr Theo Adams from the Herold Meander (Pty) Limited, a 100% black-owned company which develop portions of land in Herold that are suitable for agricultural production. As early as 15 May 2015, Mr Speaker, they have been writing to WCED, raising concerns about some of the activities at Franken Primary that impact negatively on the agricultural activities.

Mr Adams clearly states that the only solution would be to merge the two schools. This was in 2015, Mr Speaker. In his correspondence Mr Adams sharply raised that the refusal to amalgamate the schools is derailing farming activities and negatively impacts on farm security; access to the farm; fencing; occupational health and safety; and blatantly disregarding the property rights of a black farmer. Having not found joy with the MEC's Department, he approached the Human Rights Commission in January this year.

Mr Speaker, we really need to get an answer from the MEC as to why WCED is so reluctant and it has taken so long to merge these two schools, when in other cases it acts swiftly and without even consultation.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Sayed?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Do you even know where

Herold is?

The SPEAKER: Hon members ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Huh?

Mr M K SAYED: Ja, you must pay your electricity.

The SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order, hon members! I now recognise hon member Botha. [Interjections.]

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, hon Mr Speaker. I want to say to the sponsor of the question that he wanted to talk about Graafwater; he should have actually asked the question around Graafwater; and I want to ask the Minister: Minister, what is the general process in amalgamating or closing a school? What is the general process that the Department embarks on? When is the governing body part of it? When are parents part of it, and how are they informed? And in terms of these two schools, are there learners that are hostel dwellers? Are there learners who make use of the school transport? Would this affect them, and how would it affect them if the schools are amalgamated?

And then also generally, how does it happen in other provinces? How do they just close down schools? [Interjections.] Because I know in the Eastern Cape there are many, a few hundred schools that are closing.

[Interjections.]

Mr P MARRAN: Do you have the answer?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: I am not asking you.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, thank you. I now recognise hon member Sayed.

Mr M K SAYED: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Some of the statements made here today by the MEC and by my Chairperson across the floor, are not surprising, Mr Speaker. You will remember that in June this year the MEC's office had denied knowledge of these developments around the schools in the media.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

Mr M K SAYED: This is in spite of the fact that on 28 June 2018, the MEC acknowledged the concerns raised by Mr Theo Adams and his team, and made an undertaking to immediately take the matter up with Mr Archie Lewis. To this day, Mr Speaker, Mr Adams and his team are still waiting for the MEC and a senior delegation from her Department to discuss and resolve these issues.

Premier Winde is also aware of the situation, Mr Speaker, as he was sent emails when he was the then Agriculture MEC.

An HON MEMBER: Ja-ja.

Mr M K SAYED: From the Premier's posture thus far, which is far more constructive and far more forthcoming than his predecessor and some in his Cabinet, Mr Speaker, I trust that Premier Winde will now show bold leadership and resolve this particular matter ... [Interjection.] as a request for former Premier Zille's intervention on the matter, which was sent on 25 February this year, was not acted upon, but we are hoping that the Premier acts upon that, Mr Speaker, because I agree with our Deputy President when he says that Premier Winde is a good man, and thus I trust that he will intervene ... [Interjections.] and also hold his MEC for education accountable ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr M K SAYED: ... and hold those who are not performing accountable in the interest of the citizens of this province, because we have faith in him to an extent, Mr Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: Really?

Mr M K SAYED: Some of the concerns raised are that the Franken Primary

School's sports are conducted on a field with no access to drinking water, toilet facilities and refuse bins. I know that the Premier is taking notes, Mr Speaker. The Franken Primary School buses are parked on Herold Meander land, and hinder access to the farm property. [Interjections.]. The school's ablution facilities are on a private farm. Franken Primary provides electricity ... [Interjections.] to the neighbouring farm houses via a cable that runs on top of the ground, Mr Speaker. The cable does not comply with the ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M K SAYED: ... occupational health and safety requirements.

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Please proceed, hon member Sayed.

Mr M K SAYED: There are additional structures that have been erected onto Franken Primary without the property owner's approval. There is even no confirmation that the erected structures are registered at George Municipality.

Mr Speaker, the lease agreement of Franken expired at the end of March 2018, to be specific and is not yet renewed, as the MEC indicated; and the MEC is yet to honour a meeting invitation with the Church to discuss these concerns. In spite of the absence of a lease agreement the Department continues to make lease payments to the property owner, Mr Speaker.

The MEC should tell us why she has allowed this to happen under her watch. She must tell us how much expenditure has been incurred since April 2018, and ensure that this matter is resolved once and for all, but we are trusting and hoping that the Premier will push her in that correct direction, because we have faith that the Premier will act. Thank you, Mr Speaker.
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Ja.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Sayed. I now recognise the Minister of Education.

The MINISTER FOR EDUCATION: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Yes, I agree with hon member Botha. If the hon member Sayed had wanted to discuss Graafwater he should have raised the issue of Graafwater, but the comment that he made that we arbitrarily close schools is completely and utterly incorrect. We do not ever arbitrarily close any school and even my predecessor was vindicated on his closures, except for one out of 26; whereas other provinces are closing 20 a year, for example, in Mpumalanga, and hundreds in the Eastern Cape. So why the ANC is obsessed about school closures and amalgamations in the Western Cape, I am not quite sure, other than because they want to make political noise.

Graafwater is very transparent. It is also untrue that we refuse to amalgamate. It is so that we have had queries from the landowner of Franken;

that is true, but the fact of the matter is I would imagine the ANC would not want us to have a school on property where they cannot play sport and so on, which is the situation at the moment, because the property on Herold Primary is in fact too small. We do, as a Department, would like to have one educational facility, but at the moment it is not possible because we need to extend the school at Herold if we want to merge the two schools together.

As far as social cohesion is concerned, we completely support that and the comments are without substance. Both schools are very mixed, quite frankly. And then, why we take so long? Well, I mean if you are approaching the Human Rights Commission, good luck with that, because I referred one of our schools ... [Interjections.]

Mr M K SAYED: I am not talking about the Human Rights Commission.

The MINISTER FOR EDUCATION: ... to the Human Rights Commission earlier this year to do an investigation, and they still have not done it. So I do not know, I do not think he will get much joy on that.

An HON MEMBER: He will see.

The MINISTER FOR EDUCATION: Acting swiftly and without any consultation. There is no school ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, will you please take your seat? What is your

point of order, hon member?

Mr M K SAYED: Mr Speaker, on a point of order and on a point of correction, I am not approaching the Human Rights Commission. It is Mr Adams who is approaching the Human Rights Commission, and, Mr Speaker, the hon member ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon member ... [Interjections.]

Mr M K SAYED: ... ought to speak to the Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member ... [Interjections.]

Mr M K SAYED: ... not speak to me and say "you".

The SPEAKER: ... please take your seat, okay. Please take your seat, hon Minister. Hon member Sayed, that is not a point of order.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: It is a point for debate. Now the request that I would make to the hon Minister is not to refer to the hon member by a pronoun. Let us refer to the member as an hon member, but let us proceed, hon Minister.

The MINISTER FOR EDUCATION: Thank you. I did not refer to the member

at all ... [Interjections].

The SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed?

Mr M K SAYED: But, Mr Speaker, I wish to differ, Mr Speaker.

An HON MEMBER: Right.

Mr M K SAYED: It is not a point of debate. It is a factual inaccuracy to say “you”, because in my speech, in my interpellation response I am saying that it is Mr Adams. I am not referring to myself going to the Human Rights Commission, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Sayed, there are Rules that deal with those matters.

An HON MEMBER: Go check ja.

The SPEAKER: And for that purpose you must go through the Rules and approach the Presiding Officer, who can then deal with it in terms of the Rules, but that is not how we conduct ourselves when there is a difference of opinion. I am going to request that we please do so by following the Rules. Hon Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Mr Speaker. I would actually like to

raise a point of order on that.

The SPEAKER: Yes.

Ms M M WENGER: Because the Rules clearly state that a member who is aggrieved may not challenge a ruling in the House.

The SPEAKER: Mmm.

Ms M M WENGER: So therefore that member is in breach of our own Rules.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, thank you, Chief Whip. [Interjections.] You have just – hon Chief Whip, thank you very much. What I was explaining to the hon member, again it is important which you have just alluded to; that Rule 65 has a recourse, but please follow the Rule. I think the Leader of the Opposition and the Chief Whip of the Opposition, we can definitely assist each other. Also the Deputy Chief Whip, the hon member.

So there is a recourse, but let us follow the Rules, then engage the Presiding Officer after the debate. I now recognise the Minister.

The MINISTER FOR EDUCATION: Thank you, Mr Speaker. The fact of the matter is whoever approaches the Human Rights Commission, good luck,

because it will take a while to get any response from them. [Interjections.]

As far as the process concerning school closures is concerned, hon member Botha, what happens is the Department makes a recommendation to myself that they think it is a good idea after having had initial consultations with the schools. I have to then apply my mind as to whether the rationale is a good one, and if I think it is, I then agree that the process will start; a public participation process.

There are then adverts placed for public hearings which are conducted by my Department, not by me, which is why I do not attend those meetings, because we are acting on legal advice on how we process these things every step of the way, given the incessant desire of the ANC to take us to court, or to instigate the schools taking us to court.

So we follow the process very carefully, and it is completely inaccurate to say that we do not consult. We consult, as required by law, always; as Uitsig has recently discovered in the Constitutional Court.

So there are issues, no question about it. There are issues that are being raised by the owner of the property, and there are ongoing discussions, as I have indicated, which will continue, but unless and until they are resolved we cannot continue, we cannot just simply join the two schools together, because there simply is not sufficient space for them, and there are, as I said earlier, about 79 learners who come from surrounding areas to use the transport

scheme.

So I have not refused a meeting. We have in fact been trying to arrange a meeting, but the owner of the land is also not being particularly accommodating in that regard. One of my officials has undertaken to go to the premises there. They want a whole delegation from my office, my Department to go and we are not going to send a whole delegation, because it cost a lot of money.

So she has already agreed. There was in fact, today, I think more correspondence in that regard, and she has given dates to the lawyers for the meeting to happen. So, well, no, maybe not today, but anyway recently.

So we continue to be committed to trying to resolve this issue in the interest of all the learners, and once again resent the fact that the ANC is always trying to make this into a race debate, which is unacceptable.

An HON MEMBER: Ag no.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. That concludes this particular interpellation.

The next interpellation is by hon member Smith to Minister Bredell, the

Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning. I recognise the Minister.

Swellendam Municipality

Implementation of Special Investigation Unit recommendations

2. Mr D Smith asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

Whether he and his Department have put measures in place to ensure that the progress with the implementation of the recommendations of the report of 2014 by the Special Investigating Unit is being monitored at the Swellendam Municipality?

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie, Agb Speaker, en dankie vir die agb lid vir die vraag. Die Spesiale Onderzoek Eenheid verslag is in April 2013 voltooi en dek gebeure wat voor 2011 plaasgevind het.

Die Kantoor van die President het meer onlangs op 21 September 2018 die munisipaliteit skriftelik versoek om terugvoering te gee aangaande enige stappe wat deur die munisipaliteit geneem is om die aanbevelings wat in die spesiale ondersoekverslag vervat is, te implementeer.

My Departement het gedurende Januarie die munisipaliteit skriftelik

versoek om terugvoering te gee in verband met sulke stappe. Die doel van die skrywe was om op te volg in verband met die munisipaliteit se terugvoering aan die Kantoor van die President.

In Maart 2019 het ek die laaste skrywe van die munisipaliteit aangaande hierdie aangeleentheid ontvang. Hierin het die munisipaliteit 'n volledige verslag aangaande die stappe wat geneem is gelewer. Hierdie stappe sluit in:

1. 'n Bateregister wat jaarliks deur die privaatsektor bygewerk word. Die Bateregister word jaarliks deur die Ouditeur-Generaal geoudit en daar was geen sake wat in die verband deur die Ouditeur-Generaal aangeteken is nie. Die munisipaliteit het sy vierde opeenvolgende skoon oudit tydens die 2017/18 boekjaar ontvang; so dit lyk of alles daar in plek is.
2. Alle dokumente word op 'n elektroniese dokument liasseerstelsel gestoor en word ook in 'n harde kopie vorm in 'n sentrale argief gehou soos voorgeskryf deur die Provinsiale Argief Rekord Dienste van die Wes-Kaap, Wet 2005, Wet 3 van 2005. Die Wet op die Nasionale Argiewe en die Rekord Dienste van Suid-Afrika. Daar is drie argiefklerke wat verantwoordelik is vir die korrekte liassering en argivering van hierdie stukke.
3. Die goedkeuring van beleide berus by die Raad en die Raad het

sedert 2013 talle nuwe beleide goedgekeur en gaan voort om alle bestaande beleide jaarliks te hersien. Die Beleid Register word bygewerk elke keer as 'n nuwe beleid geïmplementeer of hersien word. Afskrifte word ook in 'n databasis gehou en op die munisipale webwerf gepubliseer sodat die nuwe beleid deur die Raad goedgekeur en hersien word.

4. Die Bestuurder Inkomste is verantwoordelik vir oorsig en toesien dat die aangewese waardeerders in terme van hul kontrak presteer en binne die tydsraamwerk en sperdatums hulle dienste lewer. Die waardasierol is op datum; die rol is op 1 Julie 2018 geïmplementeer en alle tussentydse waardasies is op datum.
5. Die munisipaliteit het 'n elektroniese voldoeningstelsel geïmplementeer wat alle wetlike voorskrifte aanspreek soos benodig, en alle senior bestuurders het 'n belangrike prestasie aanwyser om te verseker dat die prestasiekontrakte jaarliks hersien en nagekom word.
6. (a) Alle kritieke poste in die administrasie is gevul wat kritieke poste in die Finansiële Afdeling insluit. Die Direkteur Finansiële Dienste sluit ook die funksie van Hoof Finansiële Beampste in.

(b) Die begroting en die verslagdoening en die uitgawes bestuurder is in plek. Die Bestuurder Inkomste is in plek.

Die Bestuurder Inligting en Kommunikasietegnologie is in plek, en sowel as die Voorsieningskanaal Bestuurder is in plek. Die Rekenmeester, die Kantoor vir die Begroting en die Tesourie is ook in plek. Die posisie van Regsadviseur is op die organigram van die Departement Korrektiewe Dienste en is tans 'n vakante, onbefondsde pos. Die Regsadvies is egter op 'n kontrakbasis aangestel in gevolg van die voorsieningkanaal bestuurstelsel vir die periode van drie jaar.

My Departement het ook Swellendam Munisipaliteit op die Back to Basics program geplaas in Februarie 2015. Verdere hulp wat aan die munisipaliteit verleen is sluit in die uitreik van omsendbriewe wat verskeie onderwerpe soos byvoorbeeld die regulasies op aanstelling van diensvoorwaardes van senior bestuurders.

Die eerste Back to Basics bestuurskomiteevergadering is op Mei 2015 plaasgevind, en was bygewoon deur die munisipaliteit asook die relevante sektore.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you to the hon member for the question. The Special Investigation Unit report was completed in April 2013 and I cover events that happened before 2011.]

The office of the President has more recently on 21 September 2018 requested the Municipality in writing to give feedback with regard to any steps taken by the Municipality to implement the recommendations contained in the Special Investigation report.

During January, my Department requested the Municipality in writing to provide feedback with regard to such steps. The aim of the letter was to follow up with regard to the Municipality's feedback to the office of the President.

In March 2019 I received the last letter from the Municipality relating to this matter. Herein the Municipality provided a complete report with regard to the steps taken. These steps include

1. A Register of Assets that is updated yearly by the private sector.

The Register of Assets is audited yearly by the Auditor-General and there were no cases in this regard that were noted by the Auditor-General. The Municipality received its fourth consecutive clean audit during the 2017/18 financial year; so it seems as if everything there is in place.

2. All documents are stored on an electronic document filing system and are also preserved in a hard copy format in a central archives, as prescribed by the Provincial Archives Record

Services of the Western Cape, Act 2005, Act 3 of 2005. The National Archives and the Record Services Act of South Africa. There are three archives clerks responsible for the correct filing and archiving of these pieces.

3. The approval of policies rests with the Council and since 2013 the Council has approved several new policies and continues to review all existing policies yearly. The Policy Register is updated every time that a new policy is implemented or reviewed. Copies are also kept in a data base and published on the municipal website so that the new policy can be approved and reviewed by the Council.
4. The Manager Income is responsible for oversight and sees to it that the appointed valuers perform in terms of their contract and deliver their services within the timeframe and deadlines. The valuation roll is up to date; the roll was implemented on 1 July 2018 and all intermediate valuations are up to date.
5. The Municipality has implemented an electronic adherence system that addresses all legal prescriptions as required, and all senior managers have an important performance indicator to ensure that the performance contracts are reviewed and adhered to annually.
6. (a) All critical posts in the administration are filled, which

include posts in the Financial Division. The Director Financial Services also includes the function of Chief Financial Officer.

- (b) The Budget and Reporting and the Expenses Manager are in place. The Manager Income is in place. The Manager Information and Communication Technology is in place, as well as the Supply Chain Manager. The Accountant, and the Office for the Budget and the Treasury are also in place. The position of Legal Adviser is on the organigram of the Department of Correctional Services and currently is a vacant, unfunded post. The legal advice, however, has been appointed on a contract basis in terms of the supply chain management system for the period of three years.

My Department has also placed the Swellendam Municipality on the Back to Basics programme in February 2015. Further assistance provided to the Municipality includes sending out of circulars covering several subjects, for example the regulations of service conditions at the appointment of senior managers.

The first Back to Basics Management Committee meeting took place in May 2015, and was attended by the Municipality as well as the relevant sectors.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: So alles lyk goed en wel, dankie.

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: So everything looks good and well, thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Your time is up. Thank you. I now recognise hon member Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Thank you, Mr Speaker. †Baie dankie, Minister, vir die reaksie op die vraag.

Minister, in die dieselfde ondersoek word daar verwys na agt poste wat gevul was deur die munisipale bestuurder daardie tyd.

Nou hulle het ook gesê in die ondersoek dat die poste op die begroting is, op die hersiende begroting van daardie spesifieke jaar, en die hersiende begroting van daai spesifieke jaar was nooit goedgekeur deur die Raad nie; maar die poste is wel gevul, en hierdie poste bring vir jou by 'n bedrag van R305,000 in totaal.

My vraag aan u is, Minister, wie het verantwoordelikheid gevat vir die R305,000 wat betaal is aan daardie agt spesifieke persone vir daai tydperk, en kan u as u Departement seker maak dat daai R305,000 deur die verantwoordelike ou, wat die munisipale bestuurder nou op daai stadium

was –

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Thank you, Minister, for the reaction to the question.

Minister, in the same investigation there is reference to eight posts that were filled by the Municipal Manager at the time.

Now they have also said in the investigation that the posts are on the budget, on the revised budget of that specific year, and the revised budget of that specific year was never approved by the Council; but the posts were indeed filled, and these posts bring one to an amount of R305,000 in total.

My question to you is, Minister, who took responsibility for the R305,000 that were paid to those eight specific persons for that period, and can you as Department make sure that that R305,000 by the person responsible, who was the Municipal Manager at that stage] – †can it be recovered from the Municipal Manager?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Smith. I recognise hon member America.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, Mr Speaker. Swellendam Municipality, as indicated by the Minister, has for the past four year received clean audits.

If the Municipality is as corrupt as the member inferred in his question certainly that would not have been the case.

An HON MEMBER: It is in the report.

Mr D AMERICA: Mr Speaker, hon member Smith is completely misguided ... [Interjections.].

An HON MEMBER: It is in the report. [Interjections.]

Mr D AMERICA: I would advise the hon member instead to focus on Matzikama ... [Interjections.] where illegal appointments for family members and friends continue unabated under the ANC and its coalition partners' rule. Appointments are unfunded; they are not on the organogram. The Municipality's liquidity is under serious stress as a result of these kind of illegal appointments, resulting in backlogs in service delivery. This is in contrast to DA run municipalities where clean government and effective service delivery is a priority, as opposed to focusing on political patronage.

So hon member Smith, in the spirit of the World Cup, there is a coffee shop in the Main Road of Swellendam called *Ikigai*. It is a Japanese word for "the reason for being."

Mr P MARRAN: It is a Chinese word.

Mr D AMERICA: What is your motivation for getting up in the morning? I can say without fear of contradiction that this Minister is committed and motivated to deliver the best possible services to people in the Western Cape. Helen Suzman once said, “Go see for yourself.”

An HON MEMBER: It is in the report.

Mr D AMERICA: So, hon member Smith, I would say to you ...
[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon America.

Mr D AMERICA: ... Go to Swellendam and go see for yourself. It is a clean ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member America, your time is up.

Mr D AMERICA: Oh, thank you. Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The SPEAKER: I recognise hon member Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Mr Speaker, no I just want to remind the member that we have – I am talking about a specific report that was done by the Special Investigation Unit, with clear facts.

So this is not speculation; this is not ... it is facts, and the MEC has got the facts. [Interjections.]

We just learned that in Cederberg the DA Mayor now suspended the Municipal Manager, which is supposed to conduct a Council meeting tomorrow morning, where the ANC should take over that Council. The DA Mayor just suspended the Municipal Manager, and I did inform the MEC. I hope he can reappoint him. [Interjections.] Unless that is a strategy by the MEC and the DA [Interjections.] councillors that met yesterday morning, Mr Speaker.

Now, Chair, I just wanted to understand ... [Interjections.] the Swellendam under review, the particular year under review, there was taxpayers' money being used ... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Please proceed, hon member Smith.

Mr D SMITH: There was taxpayers' money being used to pay salaries in Swellendam, the good Swellendam that you are referring to. Under the DA's watch ... [Interjections.] there were certain recommendations in the SIU report. One of them was that the Municipality must do further investigation and report. [Interjection.] Where is the R305,000 that was paid to salaries by taxpayers in that municipality, people that was appointed by Mr Nel, the then Municipal Manager. Where is the money? Has the money been recovered? Yes or no?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Smith. I now recognise the Minister.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: In die ANC se sak.

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: In the ANC's pocket.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie, agb Speaker. Agb Speaker [Tussenwerpsels.], ja, dit is altyd baie moeilik as ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Speaker. Honorable Speaker [Interjections.], yes, it is always difficult when ... [Interjections.]]

†'n AGB LID: In julle sak.

[An HON MEMBER: In your pocket.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... as daar iets agter 'n interpellasie is wat ons nie weet nie, want ons probeer rêrig die feite vir die Huis gee. Ons respekteer die oorsigrol.

Deur die Back to Basics program, geen munisipaliteit is perfek nie. Alle munisipaliteite ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... when there is something behind a new interpellation that we do not know about, because we really try to provide the facts to the House. We respect the oversight role.

Through the Back to Basics programme, no municipality is perfect. All municipalities ... [interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Especially the ANC ones.

[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... het hulle tekortkomings.

So ons erken dit, en ons is besig met die Back to Basics program waar ons die munisipaliteite ondersteun het in die versterking van hulle wykskomitees wat ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... have their shortcomings.

So we acknowledge that, and we are busy with the Back to Basics programme

where we have supported the municipalities in strengthening their ward committees which ... [interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Point of order. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Minister, if you could just take your seat. I think I see a point of order.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

Ms L M MASEKO: Hon Deputy Speaker, is it parliamentary for a member to film a movie in a sitting? I see the member there is busy doing a video. He says he has a tender for doing movies. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can I ask, hon member, that you do not record. This is on television – or at least it is being streamed on YouTube.

So can I ask that you operate with some decorum. [Interjections.] Okay? Thank you. Can I have the Minister? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker,] I get the sense that the colleagues have not prepared for this interpellation very well,

because there is obviously no municipality that is perfect, so we are busy with the Back to Basics programme, and Swellendam actually exited that programme now.

†So hulle het so goed gedoen dat hulle kan uitgaan uit daardie program uit, en ons is besig met verskillende hulp, so ons moet kyk na ons wykskomitees, hoe versterk ons dit, dwarsdeur die Wes-Kaap, ook in Swellendam.

Die webbladsye van ons munisipaliteite probeer ons standaardiseer sodat kiesers makliker en mense makliker daarop kan kommunikeer. Die kommunikasie, die media, die waterbeperkings; al hierdie goed binne 'n beperkte begroting.

Om meer direk na die lid se vraag te kom, of se opvolgstelling te kom. Daar was dissiplinêre verhore wat ook hieruit gekom het, maar ek dink nie dit is die spasio waarin ons die dissiplinêre verhore moet hanteer nie. Daar was 'n proses; die amptenaar - natuurlik met die MM neem die rekenpligtige beampte verantwoordelikheid vir enige uitgawes, en daar is 'n aantal, daar is 'n klagte gelê en 'n persoon het bedank, en is uit die munisipaliteit uit.

Die President se kantoor het geantwoord, so ek is seker daarvan die lid het daardie antwoord gesien, volledig. Die President se kantoor was tevrede daarmee, en ek is heel gemaklik dat die Munisipaliteit alles in sy vermoë gedoen het tot op hede, binne sy beperkte vermoë, want daar is een of twee wat ek - daar is een wat ek uitgelaat het, byvoorbeeld waar hulle die

bateregister maandeliks wou opgradeer het. 'n Klein munisipaliteit het nie daardie kapasiteit nie. Ons doen dit een keer 'n jaar, en daardie tipe goed sal maar altyd op die kaarte bly.

Ek wil net 'n regstelling maak. Die lid het my nie ingelig van Cederberg nie; hy het hier mondelings vir my in lippetaal probeer verduidelik. Ek is nie bewus wat in Cederberg – ons is nie elke sekonde ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[So they have done so well that they can go out of that programme, and we are busy with various means of assistance, so we have to look at our ward committees, how do we strengthen it, throughout the Western Cape, also in Swellendam.

We are trying to standardise the web pages of our municipalities so that voters and people can communicate on there much easier. The communication, the media, the water restrictions, all these things within a limited budget.

To come more directly to the member's question, or the follow-up statement. There were disciplinary hearings resulting from this, but I do not think it is the space in which we should handle disciplinary hearings. There was a process; the official – of course with the MM the accounting official takes responsibility for any expenses, and there are a number, the complaint was

laid, a person had resigned and had left the municipality.

The President's office replied, so I am sure that the member has seen that complete reply. The President's office was satisfied with that, and I am quite comfortable that the Municipality has done everything in its power to date, within its limited ability, because there are one or two - there is one that I have left out, for example where they wanted to upgrade the Register of Assets monthly. A small municipality does not have that capacity. We do it once a year, and those type of things will always be on the cards.

I just want to make a correction. The member did not inform me of Cederberg; he tried here to explain to me verbally. I am not aware what in Cederberg – we are not aware ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Misleading die Huis.

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... wat op Cederberg aangaan nie. As enige, en ek wil tog 'n beroep doen ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... what is happening in Cederberg every second. If any, and I want to appeal to ... [interjections.]]

†Mnr D G MITCHELL: Jy mag nie die Huis mislei nie.

[Mr D G MITCHELL: You may not mislead the House.]

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... agb Adjunkspeaker, want ek kan ook sê Cederberg, die ANC, daar was 'n hofbevel op 26 Junie dat daar 'n kostebevel teen die ANC raadslede was.

So daar het 'n onregmatige vergadering plaasgevind wat die hof 'n kostebevel teen die raadslede laat gee het. Maar my ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... hon Deputy Speaker, because I can also say that Cederberg, the ANC, there was a court order on 26 June that there had been a cost judgement against the ANC members.

So an unlawful meeting had taken place so that the Court handed down a cost judgement against the Council members. But my ... [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... my, die DA lede het nie na die Huis

toe gehardloop ... [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... the DA members did not run to the House ... [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: ... dat [Tussenwerpsels.] Die DA raadslede het nie na die Huis toe gehardloop, [Onhoorbaar.] daar is sekere goed wat polities bestuur moet word.

So as die ANC so voel moet hulle 'n interdik kry teen die burgermeester. Kry 'n interdik en hanteer dit. [Tussenwerpsels.] Op hierdie stadium het die MM my nie laat weet nie; die Munisipaliteit het my nie laat weet nie. Ons kry nie inligting oor wat elke dag, elke sekonde aangaan in elke munisipaliteit nie. Dankie. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ... that [Interjections.] The DA members

did not run to the House, [Inaudible.] There are certain things that must be managed politically.

So if the ANC feels like it, they must get an interdict against the Mayor. Get an interdict and deal with it. [Interjections.] At this stage the MM did not inform me; the Municipality did not inform me. We do not get information every day, every second about what goes on in each municipality. Thank you. [Interjections.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Baie dankie, agb Minister. [Tussenwerpsels.]
 [The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. [Interjections.]] †Thank you very much. [Interjections.] Hon members, order please! [Interjections.]
 Hon Deputy Chief Whip, I see you. We would like to now move on.

We will now deal with Questions as printed on the Question Paper. I recognise the hon the Premier.

†Mnr D G MITCHELL: Sewe dae nou.
 [Mr D G MITCHELL: Seven days now.]

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

New question to the Premier:

Criminal Procedure Act 1977: review or amendments to

1. Mr P J Marais asked the Premier:

In the light of the public outcry to amend the Criminal Procedure Act, 1977 (Act 51 of 1977):

Whether he has taken any action to advocate the review or amending of this Act; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

THE PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, and can I thank the hon member Marais for the question.

With regard to the hon member's question, he does not specify which Section of the Act he is referring to, or even perhaps what the – he uses the word in the question “outcry”. What outcry? So it is very difficult to answer this question with such a broad spectrum.

Due to the failure of the South African Police Services and the National Government to keep our citizens safe, the Western Cape Government has taken a stronger stance in this regard, but rather than focus on driving legislative amendments that may or may not happen, we will rather be driving an integrated provincial plan where we have more control to make lives better and improve safety proactively.

I can also say that this specific piece of legislation has been amended 78 times already as I see, and I am sure the hon member knows as well. I

think he has a member in the National Assembly, and that that member can actually put a private member's Bill if it is a specific change that he wants to be made. [Interjections.] Or perhaps he could raise it through the Standing Committee, of which he is a member, but probably do it through the Safety Standing Committee, on the issues that he would like to have changed, and then start a process. Of course we do not amend national legislation from the Province.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Marais, I see you.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The issue here goes far beyond that. We are acting like a lion comes into this room; he kills a lot of people; and then we want to know what is the colour of the lion? How old is this lion? Appoint a commission of inquiry. How did the lion get here? And should we put the lion in a cage or not? What are we doing? Shoot the lion. [Laughter.] Or take him to a ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, please!

Mr P J MARAIS: ... put him in a cage. This is how we are playing with people's lives. Every time something happens we appoint a commission, and this committee must find out, this man who killed that woman, was he hungry? Perhaps he never had a house; perhaps he has been on a waiting list for 20 years?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, get onto your question, please.

Mr P J MARAIS: Now I want to ask you, in the light of that ...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr P J MARAIS: ... do you still think your plan would take account of all those factors if the Criminal Procedures Act, clause 60, from sub-section 5, that clause protects criminals. It uses words, like I said in my previous speech, that if a man ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Question, please, hon member.

Mr P J MARAIS: ... cannot afford bail, the judge must allow him a smaller bail.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, you must ask the question. This is not a speech.

Mr P J MARAIS: No, I want to ask the Minister: are you prepared ...
[Interjections.] to suggest, by means of a motion in this House, to ask National Government to amend the Criminal Procedures Act, clause 60, from sub-section 4 and 5, so that bail is not granted to people who have committed murder and rape, and that they do not qualify for early parole?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Premier.

The PREMIER: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any further ... [Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: I am sure the voters heard that answer; no.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any further follow-up to the question? No? Thank you very much. We move over to the next question. [Interjections.] I see the hon Minister Madikizela.

Inner-city projects halted by the court

20. Mr B N Herron asked the Minister of Transport and Public Works:

In his speech during the State of the Province debate on 23 July 2019 he said: “I can tell you now, Mr Speaker, that almost all the projects that were initiated by member Herron in the inner-city were halted by the Court, all of them.”

Which inner-city projects were halted by the Court, (b) what is the court case number, (c) who were the applicants and (d) when did the Court halt these projects?

The MINISTER FOR TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you very

much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, due to my limitation in expressing myself in the Queen's language, I think I might have omitted one very important word, that would have changed my response dramatically when I spoke about this. Let me just ... [Interjections.]

In response to the question raised by hon member Herron. Indeed I did say that some of the projects, almost all of his projects were halted by the Court, but in fact what I meant was they were halted by court challenges.

In fact some of the projects, when the City realised that they were going to be subjected to the court challenges, the City, in its wisdom, took a decision then to scrap the process and started from scratch, but I do want to concede that I did omit a very important word. Instead of saying "court challenge" I then said "Court". Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Herron. Can we ...
[Interjections.]

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. So it sounds to me as if the hon Minister is saying that what he said on 23 July was not true? Because in fact none of the projects have been halted by Court, and the court challenge is against the City for cancelling one of the projects; and there are more, there are probably more challenges to come with the other projects that were cancelled by the City themselves. By the DA-led City.

So there is no court that has stopped any of the projects that were

initiated, it was the City.

So can the Minister please advise which court challenge the City was concerned was going to come, which led them to stop these projects?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER FOR TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I think I did concede that ... [Interjections.]

Mr B N HERRON: You just say sorry.

An HON MEMBER: Say sorry.

The MINISTER FOR TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: No, no-no-no, can I ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, please! Please.

The MINISTER FOR TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Can I respond now?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we give him an opportunity, thank you.

The MINISTER FOR TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: In fact one of

the projects was subject to a court challenge by the people, not by the City by the way. By the people who were part of the process. [Interjections.] And the Foreshore Freeway, for example, the City cancelled that project in anticipation of the court challenge, because of a number of complaints in terms of the processes and irregularities that were found in the process and he knows that very well.

So I do want to say, as I said earlier, that when I responded to the question I omitted the word “challenge”. They were not halted by a court; they were halted by a court challenge.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon member Brett Herron and then I see hon Deputy Chief Whip and then I see hon member Maseko; and that will be the end.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I think first of all the Minister is incorrect. He did not respond to a question. This was his first speech in this House after the Premier’s State of the Province Address, and he was addressing – he introduced this himself, not in response to a question; completely unsolicited, and, I mean the Minister is now suggesting that the people, some people, stopped the Foreshore Freeway project.

Does the Minister not know or understand that the City is being sued by the bidders who participated in the Foreshore Freeway project, for its decision to cancel the Foreshore Freeway project; and that there is nobody, no people

that are trying to stop the Foreshore Freeway project. It was the City who tried to stop the Foreshore Freeway project, and the bidders who participate in the project are now suing the City to review and set aside that decision.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister, if you can answer that question.

The MINISTER FOR TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: But I just said that. I said .. [Interjections.] - no-no-no-no ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, please, hon members. Can we ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER FOR TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Can people listen very carefully, okay? I said in the case of the Foreshore it is the City in its wisdom that took a decision to reverse the process that was clearly flawed.

Now the people who are challenging the City – well, they are more than welcome. That must be a subject of the court challenge which will take its own process, but it is the City that took the decision. I just said that in the case of Foreshore Project; but I did also say that one of the projects was actually a subject of a court challenge ... [Interjections.]

Mr B N HERRON: Which one?

Mr P MARRAN: Which one?

The MINISTER FOR TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ... which is Maiden's Cove.

The MINISTER FOR TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: So – but the point that I wanted to make here, because when I responded to this question ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: It was not a question.

The MINISTER FOR TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Sorry, sorry, sorry.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

An HON MEMBER: Which one?

The MINISTER FOR TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Sorry. Now when I responded to this challenge, I – because I need to bring context now to this issue – the member presented himself as the champion of the inner-city development; where in fact, under his watch, he did not do a single inner-city development because, one ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER FOR TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ... some of these projects were the subject of a court challenge but secondly some of these projects the City decided, in its wisdom ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Which one?

Mr M XEGO: Which one?

The MINISTER FOR TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: ... to reverse the process because of the risk of being challenged. So of course the successful bidders have every right to challenge, that will take its own process.

Mr P MARRAN: Which one?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Mitchell?

The DEPUTY CHIF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. In the same SOPA debate speech the Minister spoke about the strategic use of property to address spatial transformation. He also said that he would be challenging and requesting that the National Minister of Public Works would release strategic pieces of land for exactly this goal. So my question to the Minister is, did he address this with the National Minister and if so, what was the outcome?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you very much for that follow-up question. One of the things that I said is that if we are to stimulate the economy, attract investment and really deal with infrastructure investment, it would be very important to work together as all spheres of government.

That is one of the issues I addressed when I met the National Minister of Public Works and Infrastructure and I must say Deputy Speaker, that we did agree that we must look at the possibility of partnering, especially in our properties, both that are owned by National Public Works and Provincial Public Works. It is exactly the process that we are busy with, with the National Minister because it is in the interests of the people of this province that we work together and use those properties for their benefit.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon member Maseko?

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, in the same SOPA you highlighted that dismal delivery record of the USDG and HSDG under the tenure of the previous Mayor where member Herron was also a Mayco member for the DA. [Interjections.] Noting this how did you, in your previous department ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

Ms L M MASEKO: ... intervene in order to bring dignity to the people of the City of Cape Town? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Yes, indeed, it is true ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Yes, hon Deputy Speaker. It is indeed true that there were major concerns around how the Urban Settlement Development Grant was spent, to a point where we were hauled before the National Standing Committee for how poorly the City was performing on this grant.

I think this is also part of what contributed to the challenges in terms of investing in infrastructure in the city and it is a challenge that I took upon myself personally to work with the City, in my previous portfolio, to address it. I must also add, as I am about to sit down Deputy Speaker, that that was one of the issues that I used address and raise constantly with the City, under member Herron at the time, which was never really addressed.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. That is the end of this question. I move over to the next question ... [Interjection.]

Mr B N HERRON: Hon Deputy Speaker, I have been jumping up and down like a jack in the box.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes but when you spoke, I then gave to hon Mitchell ... [Interjection.]

Mr B N HERRON: Yes, but I would like ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Remember there are four follow-ups hon Herron. So, my apologies, the four follow-ups are done.

Mr B N HERRON: I will send another one.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Noted. You have that right, hon Herron. I then see hon Minister Fernandez.

New questions

NGOs in Mitchells Plain

1. Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Minister of Social Development:

Whether her Department is funding NGOs in Mitchells Plain; if so, what are the relevant details;

whether her Department has a monitoring system in place for the NGOs that they are funding in Mitchells Plain; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Deputy Speaker, I wish to thank the hon member, in abstentia, for this question. The answer is, yes, we do fund NGOs in Mitchells Plain and the second part of the question, there is a monitoring system in place. Funded NGOs are assessed yearly in terms of PFMA compliance ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT. That is unparliamentary. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Hon Minister if you can continue.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... their financial statements, quarterly progress reports, non-financial data and validity of the NPO registration. Each programme of the Department has a team consisting of monitoring and evaluation officials who assess financial and

governance compliance. A team of social workers also accompany the monitoring and evaluation officials and the social workers assess norms and standards of an NGO as prescribed by the relevant legislation. For example, the Children's Act or Older Persons Act, the system has been recorded in a standard operating procedure and specific monitoring tools are used. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Any follow-up question to that? No, thank you, we will move on. We move on again to you hon Minister.

Churches and youth organisations in Mitchells Plain: funding

2. Mr R D Mackenzie asked the Minister of Social Development:

Whether her Department has a monitoring system in place for the churches and youth organisations that they are funding in Mitchells Plain; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Deputy Speaker the question is the same for churches and the same process in terms of monitoring and evaluation is maintained for religious bodies. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any follow-ups? I see you hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Minister, I am very interested in what you are doing with NGOs, especially where church and youth bodies are involved. As you are aware, your Minister for Education has made it her duty to close as many schools as possible, so will you use those buildings for NGOs? [Interjections.] Before those buildings are destroyed through vandalism, are you prepared to consider giving those buildings to churches and to NGOs and youth groups which they can use to uplift the coloured and black communities? Are you prepared to do that Minister?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: To direct or respond to the hon member's question, buildings fit in the domain of Public Works, provincially or nationally. However where there is a need for accommodation for safe houses, NGOs and rehabs, and as requests come in and as we do our oversight work, we do try and identify sites that can be used in communities to bring a package of services closer to the community than we currently have. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister. Any follow-ups? I see you hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Hon Minister, I know these buildings go to Public Works once you say you do not need them but there should be co-ordination, on a

Cabinet level, about these issues. Ministers are not islands on their own, so do you consult with the Public Works Department about making those buildings available to churches or NGOs for useful purposes?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon member, it might be a new question but I am willing to take it. Yes, as a Cabinet we work transversally, so no Minister is an island, we talk to each other and we have coalesced ourselves. So it is Health, Education, Social Development, Sports, Art and Culture. We work together and that is part of the Premier's bigger plan, where we actually want to do systemic work on the ground, transversally, to create impact in communities and it means that we need to talk to each other to bring a product to the market. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Minister. Any follow-ups? That is it. Thank you we will move over to the next question. I see the hon Minister Marais.

Indoor netball and soccer matches: Nooitgedacht and Delft

4. Mr P J Marais asked the Minister of Cultural Affairs and Sport:

Whether the Nooitgedacht and Delft community halls are included in her discussions with the City of Cape Town and other municipalities

for utilisation for indoor netball and soccer matches; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. †Baie dankie agbare Marais vir die vraag. Bogenoemde fasiliteite is die Stad Kaapstad se eiendom en is dit dus die verantwoordelikheid van die Munisipaliteit wat betref die instandhouding, gebruik en bestuur, insluitende sekuriteitsdienste. Ons het die inligting van die Stad Kaapstad aangevra om aan te dui of die twee betrokke sale aan die norme en standaarde van die twee genoemde kodes voldoen, en ons gaan ook met die twee betrokke sportorganisasies beraadslaag om vas te stel of die lokale geskik is vir hul sportkodes. Ons sal die nodige inligting deurstuur sodra ons dit ontvang het.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Thank you hon Marais for the question. The above facilities are the property of the City of Cape Town and it is therefore the responsibility of the Municipality with regard to the maintenance, use and management, including security services. We have requested the information from the City of Cape Town to indicate whether the two relevant halls adhere to the norms and standards of the two mentioned codes, and we are also going to consult with the two relevant sporting codes to establish whether the venues are appropriate for their sporting codes. We will send through the necessary information as soon as we have received it.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Marais?

†Mnr P J MARAIS: Ek is baie bly om die Minister se antwoord te hoor, en dat sy dit ook in Afrikaans doen, baie dankie. Die punt wat ek wil maak is, ons gaan 'n Olimpiese netbaltoernooi aanbied, dit staar ons in die gesig. Ons mense, veral in bruin en swart gebiede weet nie eens waar om te oefen nie. Hulle het nie velde soos in baie gebiede waar hulle kan netbal speel nie of sokker speel nie, en ek wil net vra, die tyd dat ons konserte gehou het in munisipale sale, is verby, mense kyk TV. Daai sale staan daar soos

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr P J MARAIS: I am very glad to hear the Minister's reply, and also that she does it in Afrikaans, thank you. The point I want to make is, we are going to host Olympic netball, it is staring us in the face. Our people, especially brown and black areas do not even know where to practice. They do not have fields like in many areas where they can play netball or play soccer, and I just want to ask, the time that we held concerts in municipal halls is past, people are watching TV. Those halls are standing there like] †white elephants. Can we not convert it to make it possible for five-a-side soccer or make it available for indoor netball? That would be very acceptable in my community and I ask you to speak seriously to Mr Dan Plato. †Hy kom uit Ravensmead uit, hy weet daar is niks fasiliteite nie, en hy moet antwoorde vir u gee. Ek hoop u kan terugkom, of ander kom ek met 'n mosie in die Raad. [He hails from Ravensmead, he knows there are

no facilities, and he has to give you answers. I hope you can come back to us, otherwise I will have to come with a motion in the House.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Baie dankie, ek wil net noem dat dr Zahid Badroodien is die *Mayco member* en ons het maandeliks 'n vergadering juis oor die fasiliteite en saam met die L.O.C. vir die netbal vir 2023 is ons besig om alle fasiliteite te ondersoek en op te gradeer vir die groot netbaltoernooi.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you, I just want to mention that Dr Zahid Badroodien is the Mayco member and along with the L.O.C. for the netball for 2023 we are busy investigating all facilities and upgrading it for the big netball tournament.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie, agbare Minister.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.] †Any follow-ups? Yes, I see hon member Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Minister, what has your Department done in terms of promoting sport participation in townships and ensuring it is done at a school level? Has your Department done anything in collaboration – especially in the townships – to ensure

there are activities there?

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORTS: Thank you, hon member. It is a new question but I am prepared to answer. Yes, with our After School programmes and if you attend our Annual Report on 30 October, we will elaborate on it. But, yes, we do a lot with our schools and also with our NGOs in our communities to have participation with all the relevant codes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any follow-ups? Hon member Marais?

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you. Hon Minister, I received this request from the communities of Delft and Nooitgedacht, Bishop Lavis. Can I go back to those two civic organisations and say that you will definitely put them on the agenda to discuss with the City of Cape Town for the possibility of that happening in their areas? May I have your permission to carry over your commitment to fighting for those two townships?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

†Die MINISTER VAN KULTUURSAKE EN SPORT: Enige tyd.
[Tussenwerpsels.]

[The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Any time.
[Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. No follow-ups, I move over to the next question. We are moving onto Question 6, I see the hon Minister Bredell.

[Question 5 stands over.]

Cederberg Municipality Council meeting agenda

6. Mr D Smith to ask Mr A W Bredell, Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

What was on the agenda of the council meeting of the Cederberg Municipality that took place on 15 August 2019?

†Die MINISTER VAN PLAASLIKE REGERING, OMGEWINGSAKE EN ONTWIKKELINGSBEPLANNING: Baie dankie agb Adjunkspeaker, baie dankie vir die vraag, die agenda van die 15de Augustus, opening, aansoek om verlof, verkiesing van die waarnemende Speaker, kommunikasie deur die waarnemende Speaker, kommunikasie deur die uitvoerende burgemeester, sake vir oorweging, items wat die amptenare na die Raad bring, die oorweging van oortrokke fasiliteite, die vervreemding van onroerende eiendom vir ekonomiese ontwikkelingsdoeleindes, en dit is min of meer die agenda. Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, the agenda of the 15th August, opening, application for leave, election of acting Speaker, communication by the acting Speaker, communication by the Executive Mayor, matters for consideration, items the officials bring to Council, the consideration of overdraft facilities, the disposal of fixed property for economic development purposes, and that is more or less the agenda. Thank you.]

†Die ADJUNKSPEAKER: Dankie, agbare Minister.

[The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister.]

Any follow-ups? No. We move over to Question 7. I see the hon Minister Meyer.

Agricultural activities: research

7. Mr A P van der Westhuizen asked the Minister of Agriculture:

Which agricultural activities have been identified for dedicated research by his Department for the remainder of the current financial year?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Deputy Speaker, I would like to thank the hon member van der Westhuizen for this question. Yes, research

is a medium term to a long term activity and research projects undertaken by Programme Research and Technology Development of the Department of Agriculture normally run between three to five years. I think members of this House will know that we have introduced an evidence-based practice and particularly given the fact that agriculture is both animal science and life sciences, so on a regular basis we conduct research.

In the 2019/2020 financial year, 35 projects in animal sciences, 33 in plant sciences and 2 in resource unit will be executed. An average of two to three projects are also submitted to the research committee for approval and approval is granted with due consideration of the available budget in this particular sub-programme.

Animal science projects focus specifically on dairy research and beef research, small stock and ostrich research and the breeding, feeding and management aspects thereof. I think members of this House are also aware that we have seven research farms where this research is being conducted, not only for the Western Cape but for South Africa. I think it is also important for members of this House to note that between 2009 and 2019, over the last 10 years, the research has indicated that we had a significant reduction, for example, in the dairy products, particularly the milk industry. We had about 3 200 milk producers and we have lost many of them. We now have only about 1 260. We had a 65% reduction in this specific field of agriculture, in terms of milk producers. But what we have also seen is that some of these milk producers have increased their

capacity, even up to 78%, in milk production. So we welcome and appreciate that specific aspect in terms of the research.

But, hon Deputy Speaker, in terms of the plant science project, they also focus on small grains with the main focus on conservation agriculture, evaluation of plant pathology, potato production, veld management, vegetation production, alternative crops, wheat management and pastoral research. The projects in the research unit focus also on climate predictions as well as the centennial satellite portal being developed.

I think members of this House are also aware that we have established a drought portal, that drought portal is a result of research. We have also decided, because of the nature of agriculture, because of the nature of climate change that we have also developed alternative crop modelling and it is also very important that you, as a member of the committee, appreciate that we have developed alternative crop funds focusing on alternative crops with higher labour requirements and export potential.

I think the hon member will also appreciate, as a member of the committee, what we do in this Parliament, we also bring up the information so that the members can also represent Parliament outside with the real facts, and I think the hon member Pat Marran is very active in agriculture and to be active you need the right information and so I am very happy to pass the right information on to him ... [Interjection].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order. [Interjections.] Order, hon members.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Yes, I like hon Pat Marran because he is in agriculture and we are ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, no. Hon member Marran. No, hon Minister. Can you speak to me?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Deputy Speaker, I think with the alternative crop model we have seen significant changes in that, particularly in the labour requirements and the export potential. For example, we have done some research that shows that there is a great potential for the market, specifically in the blueberry industry and also in the cherry industry.

The Department has, for example, commissioned specific research on blueberries and the research has now shown that significant export potential happened in that particular market and next week, I think, I am going to see the people from the blueberry industry. The Department, in addition, has also put, I think, R690 000 into the alternative crops, for example specifically in cherries. That is now a big global market and I know Mr Pat would like to export cherries ... [Interjections.] so if he wants to – so the research ...[Interjections.]

Mr Marran can use the research. If he no longer wants to be a member of this House, he can use the research and maybe consider an alternative career because this information is very important from a research perspective.

I think what we have also done, on a more serious note, hon Deputy Speaker, we have recently launched the B-Fab Baseline Research which is the agricultural outlook for 2018 to 2027, which is authoritatively researched. It is a national collaboration. We put in money, we have done some significant research and we welcome the evidence based practice. When I go to the Minister of Finance in the MTEC engagements, I will be taking two documents, the B-FAB research evidence based practice and the Provincial Economic Review and Outlook.

In addition, I think this House has seen before, under your leadership hon Deputy Speaker, when you were the Minister of Agriculture, the great work that you did with the Agricultural Trilingual Dictionary: English, Afrikaans, IsiXhosa. I think this is great work. You cannot publish a dictionary without research.

In addition to that, hon Deputy Speaker, also under your leadership as the previous Minister, *Abundant Harvest*, the Western Cape agriculture success stories. To document success stories, you need research and so we are particularly happy since we also have some extensive involvement of women in agriculture under your leadership. You have also published a

research document *Abundant Harvest: Women at Work* and I think Mr Pat Marran will appreciate that the research of women and the work of women is being acknowledged. Ms Vos, thank you for your acknowledgment in that regard.

In addition to that, we are also publishing on a quarterly basis the *Agri Pro*. This is a magazine distributed to 8000 people in agriculture and we are particularly happy for the work that we are doing in this particular regard. In addition, I think hon Pat Marran will appreciate a copy of this and Madam Deputy Speaker, with your permission, can I hand him a copy?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will give you that permission, hon Minister. [Applause.] Thank you, Minister. I see the hon Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. On a lighter note I can assure you that hon Marran does not need a manual to deal with cherries. [Interjections.] †Kan ek net vir u vra, Minister...[Gelag.] Agbare Speaker, ek wil graag van Minister Meyer net weet ... [May I just ask you, Minister ...[Laughter.] Hon Speaker, I just want to know from Minister Meyer ...]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, please.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ... speel die potensiaal van sekere landbou-studievelde om 'n bydrae te lewer tot ekonomiese groei en

werkskepping, dalk 'n rol in die identifisering van daardie velde as navorsingsvelde vir die Wes-Kaapse Departement van Landbou? Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ... does the potential of certain agricultural fields of study to make a contribution to economic growth and job creation perhaps play a role in the identification of those fields as research fields for the Western Cape Department of Agriculture? Thank you.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister.

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Dankie, agb Adjunkspeaker, in die konteks van watter ander velde vir navorsing is daar; die Wes-Kaapse regering is verbind tot ekonomiese groei, die Wes-Kaapse premier, asook die onlangse

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank, hon Deputy Speaker, in the context of which other fields there are; the Western Cape Government is committed to economic growth, the Western Cape Premier as well as the recent] †tabling of the Municipal Economic Review and Outlook as well as the Provincial Economic Review and Outlook by the hon Minister of

Finance, have indicated two big trends. Firstly, that the biggest export growth in the agricultural sector, from the Minister of Finance's report, has happened in the area of the Overberg, in terms of export growth.

The second part of the research, indicated in the MERO, was that last year the biggest single growth in the five district municipalities happened in the West Coast, so certainly one would like to look at the research capabilities that are needed to grow the economy further in that particular area.

I think hon members will also know that the drought is still severe in Matzikama so we also think that research needs to be done in that particular area, specifically in the area where we have, I think intentional competitive advantage in terms of our export capabilities.

From a research perspective, we have now at the end of September closed the call for proposals for additional research and the committee will evaluate these research proposals to determine to what extent this research will facilitate the number one strategic objective of this Government, namely to grow the economy.

But, it is clear, globally, there is also a big demand for organic wine, organic products, so this is also something that I think needs and requires further research. One of the big research institutions is at the George Agricultural College. Hon member Nkondlo, I would like to invite you to the Outeniqua Dairy Research Institute. I think that is very important. I

think I will also invite the hon member, since he is from Bitou, to the very important research farm that we have in his area and that is ...

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... in terms of ostrich research. So, I think, hon member Van der Westhuizen, since we believe in an asymmetrical approach to economic development we will also commission another study later this year about the growth potential of township regions, and because we believe in an asymmetrical approach to economic development, that will guide our research and development. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. I see the hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I hope the Minister does not mention my name in his sleep because ... [Laughter.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): What is the question?

Mr P MARRAN: There is only one Speaker. I just want to check with the Minister. The Minister has said that ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Speak to that speaker then.

Mr P MARRAN: I just want to check with the Minister. Minister, you have said that there is a big export market for berries ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Cherries.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Speak through the Chair.

Mr P MARRAN: I am speaking through the mic!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members ...

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Speak through the Chair.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am in control, thank you.

Mr P MARRAN: Allow me to speak through the mic! [Laughter.] Please. Allow me to speak through the mic.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marran, get on to your question please.

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, we have heard the Minister say that there is a big export market for berries. I just want to check because I have not heard the Minister speak about these particular products and it seems most applications for the production of cannabis are those who are currently farming berries, meaning it will impact on that particular

industry. Is there or will there be any research, because you have said that you are doing research for the whole country, when it comes to cannabis and what impact will it have on the berry industry?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon member, you have asked me not to mention your name and I will respect your wish. [Interjections.]. Hon Deputy Speaker, I think in addition to what I have mentioned there are export markets specifically focused – and I will come to the question later on – the issue of cherries, the issues of olives, berries, blueberries, honey bush tea, to just mention a few.

I believe that we are now entering a new phase with the cannabis industry. I believe we need further research and evidence but from different sectors. I have noted the issue of the City of Cape Town and the location for cannabis farming in Atlantis and I will certainly engage with my colleagues in this particular regard. I have to make it absolutely clear, I want to be unambiguously on the record, the research must guide us because there are huge implications for education, there are huge implications for mental health and the research must indicate to me where we are going with this and so I would welcome anybody and any research in this particular regard.

And so since this is an industry for economic growth potential specifically.

I was recently in the East. They use this specifically in many of the pharmacies, specifically cannabis oil. So I think the research both from the medical science, hon Minister of Health, I will seek her guidance. I will seek the guidance of the Minister of Social Development in terms of the social impact. I will research the economic potential and certainly this will be a collective research investigation in terms of this. There is absolute clarity in my mind that this must be a product of research and investigations and like any research that this Government does, we always pilot it in a specific area to see the success and the multiplication. I have little doubt that this Government is committed to research and evidence based practice to stimulate economic development.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. Any follow-up questions? Hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: No not a question Chair, I am just glad I could assist the MEC when it comes to this specific product. Hon Minister, never forget my name. Thank you. [Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are no more questions? Then we move over to the final question which is, I see the hon Minister Maynier.

Independent power producers

8. Ms D M Baartman asked the Minister of Finance and Economic

Opportunities:

Whether independent power producers generate sufficient energy to supply in all the energy needs of the province; if so,

whether there are plans for the Province to secure energy from these producers; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. There are currently 12 independent power producers generating electricity through solar and wind power in the Western Cape. These independent power producers have a combined generation capacity of 452 Megawatts. Three new independent power producers are currently under construction and when they come on line which will hopefully be within 14 months, they will bring the total independent power producers' electricity generation capacity in the Western Cape to 732 Megawatts.

The Western Cape's peak load requires approximately 3 900 Megawatts. As such, the cumulative capacity of the IPPs located in the Western Cape can only provide for a small proportion of the province's electricity needs. The electricity produced by IPPs would also not be sufficient without supplementary options such as battery storage, as wind and solar energy are, of course, intermittent sources of power.

There are currently no utility scale battery storage facilities in the province which would of course allow excess renewable energy to be stored and used when required. But of course Eskom has several battery storage development projects underway, five of which are being undertaken in the Western Cape. The Western Cape Government does not have a constitutional mandate as an electricity generator or distributor and is therefore of course not empowered to purchase power from IPPs.

The current model for IPPS only allows for Eskom to purchase from IPPs and the IPPs under contract with Eskom provide of course, all their power to Eskom. The power generated from IPPS goes directly into the national grid and is therefore not for the sole use of the Western Cape.

Municipalities are able to purchase electricity and a number of Metros, including the City of Cape Town, have written to the National Minister of Energy to request a determination to allow them to procure from independent power producers. And of course the City of Cape Town has taken the National Minister of Energy to court to challenge the legal basis for preventing municipalities from procuring power from IPPs and of course we wait the outcome of this court case. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Baartman?

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, through you, if the Minister

could simply indicate to us what the main obstacles currently are for Western Cape municipalities in order to procure this energy directly from independent power producers? Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you. There are several obstacles, hon Deputy Speaker. Despite the fact, of course, that independent power producers have attracted up to R200 billion worth of investment, there are several obstacles. One obstacle is policy uncertainty with the delay in the Integrated Resource Plan, which of course is our electricity road map, stuck in Nedlac, which creates uncertainty about opportunities for further investment by independent power producers.

Then, of course, there is leadership instability with the axing of Karen Breytenbach who headed up the Independent Power Producers office. And then, most importantly, as I alluded to in my reply, there is regulation, where National Government prevents municipalities from purchasing electricity directly from the independent power producers, which is not in the interests of consumers or in the interests of business. It is in the interests of maintaining a monstrous monopoly in the form of Eskom.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon Baartman?

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, through you, if the Minister can just indicate whether the Western Cape ... [Interjection.]

CHIEF WHIP (DA): On a point of order Madam Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute.

CHIEF WHIP (DA): The hon member is on the phone.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lili ...

CHIEF WHIP (DA): My goodness.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can you put that down? Otherwise you will have to leave the House. Thank you very much. [Interjections.]. And can I just ask I am not hearing hon Baartman very well. If you can just speak into your mic. Thank you, hon Baartman.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I would just like to know from the Minister whether the Western Cape is currently investing in any alternative energy sources and if so, what are those details?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank

you, hon member. I would just like to assure hon members that the hon Lili was not phoning me! [Laughter.] Hon Deputy Speaker, I think one of the exciting alternatives ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members. Members we have the Minister on the floor. [Interjections.]. Minister Maynier?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. One of the exciting alternative forms of energy is natural gas, but again, since 2016 there has been such significant uncertainty that this Government has continued to prepare for the possible importation of natural gas at Saldanha Bay.

We have completed several feasibility studies, the most recent funded by the US Trade and Development Agency and of course we have a memorandum of co-operation with Transnet to develop infrastructure to facilitate the natural gas economy in the Western Cape. It presents exciting opportunities because of course we could convert the diesel fire turbines at Ankerlig to use natural gas which would be cheaper and would be in the interests of consumers and businesses in the Western Cape.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Baartman?

Ms D M BAARTMAN: If the Minister could please indicate how many of our municipalities currently have legislation in place should the National

Minister of Energy decide that we can have Section 34 determinations out of the [Inaudible.] provinces? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members. Thank you. Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. We have in fact made considerable progress on the uptake of small scale embedded generation. 23 of our 25 municipalities have in fact adopted by-laws enabling small scale embedded generation and 19 of our 25 municipalities have approved feed-in tariffs and we are on track, we believe, to achieve the 135 Megawatts of installed rooftop solar PV by 2020 in the Western Cape, which we believe is good news.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I just want to check with the Minister, what is the price competitiveness of the IPPs given the current cost per Kilowatt that both households and industries are paying?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Hon Speaker, I am not familiar with the current details but IPPS are becoming competitive all the time and more competitive as time goes by. But I am not familiar with the current pricing details. I will be happy to revert to

my Department and furnish the member with a reply in writing.
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. That is the end of Questions for Oral Reply. We now move over to Statements in terms of Rule 145. I recognise the DA.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Good afternoon, hon Deputy Speaker. Resilience is about being able to overcome difficulties and sustainability is about survival and the goal of resilience is to thrive.

Communities across our province, Madam Deputy Speaker, continue to face challenges related to both social and economic issues and whilst the duty of Government is to provide services that will ensure a conducive environment for success, it is simply not enough. It is important that our communities develop a sense of personal responsibility if we are serious about growth and building resilience.

While the Western Cape is a sterling example of how government can provide a role in providing opportunities for individuals to reach their potential, communities are still being held hostage by acts of criminality, failures in service delivery and limited access to services that this Government can provide. Madam Deputy Speaker, we need to go back to

basics where communities and individuals take personal responsibility for their children and their neighbourhoods because they have a duty of care.

Despite the many challenges the people of the Western Cape face, many individuals have taken the initiative to care for their communities with projects that speak directly to these challenges.

In Lavender Hill, Ralph Bouwers made headlines after he founded a project that seeks to provide children with a safe space, through sport, on a field that is used as a battle ground for gangsters. This is an act of reclamation.

We need locally based community driven solutions. Solutions like the Hope for Food Project that feeds subsistence farmers affected by the drought in Zoar in the Kannaland Municipality.

We have a duty to support such individuals, Madam Deputy Speaker, in their efforts to grow the voices of our next generation. As we are in the process of appointing a Children's Commissioner, we must remember that everyone has a fundamental responsibility to protect the next generation. Everyone has a duty of care to protect our children and everyone has a responsibility to care for our communities. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the ANC.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. As members of this House it is important that we recognise the role played by the ANC in this Legislature in ensuring that this House is in fact moving closer to the day when a Children's Commissioner for the Western Cape will finally be appointed.

Sections 78(1) of the Provincial Constitution states that "There is a provincial Commissioner for Children" and 79(2)(a) obliges such Commissioner to report annually to the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. It is an institution which, like the National Chapter 9 institution such as the Public Protector and the Human Rights Commission, has to be appointed.

In her State of Province Address on being elected as Premier in 2009 Helen Zille and the DA promised the people of the Western Cape that the Commissioner for Children would be established. Ten years ago. History will show that this was not only an empty promise but will also record the active steps taken by the DA to block the appointment of the Commissioner for Children. It became very clear that after making such a public commitment the DA was then advised that this Commissioner may become an embarrassment to the DA given that the plight of children in our province would no doubt be highlighted.

Then there was a sudden about turn and the DA, through the Premier, introduced a Bill into this House to make the appointment of both the Children's and Environmental Commissioners discretionary. This would

have been the death knell of the Children's Commissioner.

It was the ANC in this Legislature that mobilised communities across the province to reject the proposed amendment in public hearings. It was clear that the people of the province supported the provision in the Western Cape Constitution to establish a Commissioner for Children.

It is in terms of this law, which is now being adopted, the Western Cape Commissioner for Children Act, that nominations have now been called for and such nominations close at the end of September.

In terms of the law, the names of all the nominations received will now have to be published in the media calling for objections to any of the names appearing on the list of nominations.

As the ANC in the Legislature, we call on the public to take a keen interest in this process. We need to ensure that the best possible candidate who will champion the interests of children will eventually be appointed by the Premier. We would also like to give notice ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION (ANC): ... that we will intensify our campaign for the appointment of a Commissioner for the Environment. This also has no discretion and needs to be appointed.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I see the EFF.

Mr M XEGO (EFF): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. The EFF notes with concern ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, I cannot hear a thing. Hon member Marran, please. Hon member Lili, please. One minute. Can we just stop the time? In fact can you just put the time back to zero. Hon members, I am now going to start the time again for the hon member because he has not been afforded a rightful start, so can we please have some order so that I can hear him. You may begin.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. The EFF notes with concern the recent report from the Public Service Commission regarding incidents of theft and gross negligence and financial mismanagement of the public officials in the Government departments in the Western Cape Province.

It is important to note at the outset that the Public Service Commission is a Chapter 10 institution, empowered by the Constitution of South Africa, to assist Government departments in promoting and keeping a high standard of professional ethics; making sure that there is efficient, economic and effective use of Government resources by Government institutions; to hold Government accountable in making sure that the public administration is development orientated and the public

administrators must be accountable for their actions, just to name a few.

With this in mind, the Public Service Commission in its recently released report found high proportions of gross negligence in the manner in which public funds were handled by the provincial public officials in Government departments. Gross negligence and misconduct cases stood high at 27%. This was followed by theft at 23,5%, whilst misappropriation and abuse of Government resources at 21.6% related to wrongful use of Government Garage vehicles. The EFF ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M XEGO: ... finds it shocking that so few employees were dismissed following such misconduct. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr M XEGO: The Economic Freedom Fighters condemns these incidences and calls on the Western Cape Government to take appropriate measure to recover the loss of these funds. This is so because such conduct comes at the cost of the taxpayers' money and robs the people of the Western Cape of proper service delivery.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I see the hon DA.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Agb Adjunkspeaker, terwyl inwoners van Kaapstad ... [Tussenwerpsel.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, while citizens of Cape Town ... [Interjections.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Deputy Chief Whip. I see you hon member, you may begin.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Please, hon Deputy Speaker, can I have my two minutes please?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may begin from the beginning. Hon members you are just giving the hon members who are speaking extra time because I am going to restart so that I can actually hear because part of my job is to listen. So I am listening.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Thank you. †Agb Adjunkspeaker, terwyl inwoners van Kaapstad die komende somer met groter gerustheid rondom watervoorsiening kan ingaan, is daar streke van die Wes-Kaap wat steeds swaar ly onder die langdurige droogte.

Ek verwys u in hierdie verband na 'n antwoord van dr. Ivan Meyer, Minister van Landbou, op 'n parlementere vraag oor die toestande in die Hoeko-vallei by Ladismith. Die rivier waaruit geslagte se boere hulle bome besproei het, het vier jaar gelede opgedroog. Kan u u 'n vrugteplaas

voorstel waar tot 80% van die bome gevrek het? Een van die groter plaasgroepe in die vallei moes 182 permanente werkers, waarvan talle geen ander werk as plaaswerk ken nie, afdank. 2000 seisoenwerkers se inkomste is as gevolg van die droogte daarmee heen. Boere in die Hoeko-vallei is tans besig om die jong, klein vruggies op die grond te gooi – in die hoop dat die bome sonder vrugte ‘n beter kans het om nog ‘n droeë somer te oorleef.

Natuurlik kan die reën more kom –oorvloedige reën selfs soos met die Laingsburg-vloed van Januarie 1981. Maar selfs as die damme môre sou oorloop, sal dit nog baie jare duur voordat die verlore werksgeleenthede herwin sal word. Baie van die boorde sal teen ‘n koste van R2,5 miljoen tot R2,8 miljoen per hektaar hervestig moet word en eers na drie jaar ‘n oes begin lewer. En wie gaan nou soveel geld vir ‘n bankrot boer leen? Geen een van die bestaande droogtehulpskemas maak hiervoor voorsiening nie.

Ek glo daar is groot potensiaal vir ‘n skema waar boere deur belastingsverligting aangemoedig word om in die vet jare meer geld opsy te sit vir die maer jare wat kom. Totdat dit gebeur vra ek u om met deernis aan talle families te dink wat weens die droogte reeds hul inkomste verloor het. Baie dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Hon Deputy Speaker, while citizens of Cape Town can face the coming summer with greater peace of mind around water supply, there are still regions of the Western Cape suffering badly under the long drought.

In this regard I refer to a reply from Dr. Ivan Meyer, of Agriculture, to a parliamentary question about the conditions in the Hoeko Valley at Ladismith. The river from which generations of farmers had irrigated their trees, dried up four years ago. Can you imagine a fruit farm where up to 80% of the trees have died? One of the larger farming groups in the valley had to lay off 182 permanent workers, of whom many know no other work than farm work. 2000 seasonal workers' income has gone as a result of the drought. Farmers in the Hoeko Valley are currently dumping the young, small fruit on the ground – in the hope that the trees without fruit will have a better chance to survive another dry summer.

Of course the rains can come tomorrow – abundant rain as with the Laingsburg flood of January 1981. But even if the dams should be overflowing tomorrow, it will take many years before the lost job opportunities will be recovered. Many of the orchards will have to be re-established at a cost of R2,5 million to R2,8 million per hectare and only start to produce a harvest after three years. And who is now going to lend so much money to a bankrupt farmer? None of the existing drought aid makes provision for this.

I believe there is big potential for a scheme where farmers are encouraged

through tax relief to set aside more money during the prosperous years for the lean years that are coming. Until that happens, I ask you to think with compassion about the many families who had already lost their incomes because of the drought. Thank you.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I see the ANC.

Mr M K SAYED (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Concerned parents and community leaders from Mfuleni plead to us for assistance to learners who receive education under very abnormal circumstances. Too many learners, for the past few years have not been placed in schools in Mfuleni.

An agreement was reached to proceed with platooning at two different schools while the Western Cape Education Department would start erecting prefab classes on its land. The WCED said that a primary school would be ready for occupation in the second quarter and a high school in October this year. But the primary school is still without water and electricity.

We find that ANC councillors, amongst them being Charlotte Heyns who is present in the gallery, found out from the City of Cape Town that the building plans were not approved. Emails show that no plan was submitted and the officials from WCED and Public Works explained that the plans were firstly incorrectly compiled. Fairdale Primary school with more than 400 learners is still without a sewer connection and forced to use mobile

toilets. This school does not even have rubbish bins, hon Deputy Speaker. A hole is dug to burn the rubbish. Work at the high school has not even started. Over 600 learners platoon with only four hours of tuition a day which means that they are far behind.

This shows gross negligence and incompetency on the part of the Provincial Government. Premier Winde must hold accountable those MECs involved in this mess as learners are forced to learn under inhumane conditions using bucket toilets, for example. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. I see the DA.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you hon ... [Interjections.] Can I please have my time hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. Your time has not started. Can we have some order please?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Yesterday, the Minister of Transport, Minister Mbalula, released a report in which he admitted that the National Rail Disaster Management Centre, dubbed the 'war room' was not meeting its objectives to address railway challenges in the country, including the issue of rail safety.

Furthermore, the United National Transport Union said last month that the

war room is, and I quote: “ineffective and has had no impact on the train services.” The question must be asked hon Deputy Speaker, what is the point of this war room or if it is just another summit where problems are discussed but not addressed?

Rail safety is at the forefront of the Western Cape Government’s concern when it comes to reforming ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... and revitalising our provincial passenger rail service, especially in the City of Cape Town. We cannot have the National Minister dithering in war rooms which present no tangible solutions to the problems facing our province’s residents every single day. This further proves why the DA in the Western Cape continues to call for the mandate of rail transportation to be devolved to sub-national level.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order member.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Under a litany of ANC Transport Ministers, the Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Please stop my time.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please talk to me, I am listening.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, under a litany of ANC transport Ministers, the Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa has only succumbed to theft and severe corruption leading to a collapse in rail transportation services. [Interjections.]. No amount, hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order, hon Marran. Hon Marran, please. [Interjections.]. Hon members can we have some order please. Hon Lili, hon Marran. Hon Lili and hon Marran can I have your attention please? There is a running commentary going on from both your tables or let us just say it is one table. Can we have a little bit of order and I do know that the three of you keep knocking the football across so this is why these things happen, but can I ask for some order while hon Mitchell finishes off his statement. Hon Mitchell, carry on.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. No amount of summits or war rooms will fix this until the mandate for rail is given to governments that are willing and capable to provide the necessary services, such as the DA-led Western Cape Government. [Interjections.].

The DEPUTYU SPEAKER: Order.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): This, hon Deputy Speaker ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, the status quo will only lead us to further neglect. We cannot allow passengers and commuters to be stranded while National Ministers sit in meaningless summits. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much and I see the – Freedom Front Plus is not here – Al Jama-ah is not here, so the final will be the DA. I see the hon Wendy Philander.

Ms W F PHILANDER (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Members can I have some order please?

Ms W F PHILANDER: Hon Marran, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Members can I have some order so I can actually hear the hon member?

Ms W F PHILANDER (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. In the ANC's haste to pass the NHI Bill, they do not care about the direct influence it

has on every citizen in this country. As we enter Breast Cancer Awareness Month, citizens are once again encouraged and made aware of self-examinations, regular mammograms for early detection as 90% of patients survive for many years after detection at an early stage.

Hon Deputy Speaker, public and private healthcare structures are critical in the screening and patient care concerning this dreadful disease. It is very important that we realise how the intended NHI will affect future care, especially in specialised procedures.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the ANC Government cannot be trusted with public funds. On Tuesday in Tshwane, President Ramaphosa admitted to the fact that corruption in health services ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Ms W F PHILANDER: ... costs lives.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! [Interjections.] Order members! Hon Lili, hon Marran, can you just sit down please. Hon members, the ANC, can I please ask for your attention, in the front row. All three of you are ignoring me when I speak. Now let me not have to rise and get taller so can I just ask that member Philander can continue her statement and complete it. Thank you very much.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. On Tuesday in Tshwane, President Ramaphosa admitted to the fact that corruption in health services costs lives and affects the poorest of the poor. The President announced a loss of R22 billion in the health sector due to corruption.

Hon Deputy Speaker, during this month of breast cancer awareness, it is with great concern that as much as we create awareness and take extra care, next year this time, how many patients will actually have access to the care they deserve? [Interjections.] †Wat die nasionale regering ... [Tussenwerpsel.] [What the National Government is ...[Interjection.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order members!

†Me W F PHILANDER: Wat die Nasionale Regering eintlik vir ons sê met hierdie wetgewing, is dat hulle sal besluit wanneer ons mediese sorg nodig het, by wie ons dit kan kry, wat dit ons gaan kos en of dit enigsins nodig is om verwys te word of spesialisbehandeling te ontvang. [Tussenwerpsels.]

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Ms W F PHILANDER: What the National Government is actually saying to us with this legislation is that they will decide when we require medical treatment, where we should get it, what it is going to cost us and whether it is at all necessary to be referred or receive specialist treatment. [Interjections.]]

How can we entrust billions of Rands ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members.

Ms W F PHILANDER: ... which we do not have, to an ANC Government that would incentivise further corruption through their disastrous Bill.

As the Democratic Alliance, we welcome the extension period for comments which is now due on 29 November 2019. The public and all stakeholders should ensure they vigorously interrogate this Bill, the funding model and how exactly healthcare will be improved for all South Africans.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off member.

Ms W F PHILANDER: The President does not know, how should we know?
I thank you, Deputy Speaker. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon members that is the end – hon members can I have your attention please. That is the end of Statements. Are there any Ministers who wish to rise and respond? Thank you hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I want to rise first of all on the statement by the hon Sayed and say thank you very

much. In echoing his words to me earlier, saying something about a good man in the whole or perhaps part, I say exactly the same thing to him, as a good man in part but can he please when he makes statements around schools in Mfuleni get to understand the full picture, because does he know that there is an existing school right nearby that is standing absolutely empty, number one. Number two he speaks about getting connection at the City water etc., the ANC councillor in that ward, is he doing anything to help with this situation? And so I ask the hon member ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order members!

The PREMIER: ... I ask the hon member to rather be proactive in this process and try to help with finding a solution instead of just coming to this House and complaining. I would also like to address ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members! [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: I would also – I am not blaming the Council, the Council should do their work. ANC councillors are missing. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members! Can you just take your seat, hon Premier. Yes, on a point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): On a point of order, Madam Deputy Speaker. The Rules say that other members may not interrupt another member and this

has happened repeatedly and I ask that those two offenders actually be named now.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think I am going to definitely take the next step. Can I just ask hon member Sayed, I think the question is addressed to you, so if you could just go back to your seat while the Premier is speaking to you so that you cannot speak to him from a different seat. And then can I please ask the front row, can you please contain yourself. Maybe the Leader of the Opposition will have relook at seating because those two are on a roll today, the two hon members, with no due disrespect but please I do not want to have to name you in this sitting. So can I allow the Premier to finish? If you can rise please Premier.

The PREMIER: Can I also say to the hon Xego of the EFF when he wants to make a statement in the House, I presume he made his statement from the front page of a newspaper today, but please would he rather go and get the actual report from the Public Service Commission, because if you read the actual report, what we are talking here about is not gross maladministration and we need to see much harder rulings against these officials.

First of all I would like to point out to him that this is a government with a R67 billion budget and the total financial misconduct of this whole Government is R983 000 of which R183 000 is not a loss to the State. R157 000 has already been recovered. There is R642 000 in question that

is being investigated and this is 51 cases out of 86 000 civil servants, so please will he go and read the report so that he actually gets it into context before he starts using words like gross etc. [Interjections.] And then perhaps a last point ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. [Interjections.] Order.

The PREMIER: Perhaps a last point ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order.

The PREMIER: I am now going to make it a second last point. The second last point on this issue is, obviously we need to deal with any misconduct in a government and if you think about those number of cases I can assure you that we will deal with every single one. We will give the report on every single one, they will be dealt with because there are consequences if you are part of this Government.

And then the last point I want to raise is also to the hon member of the EFF because I do know that the next thing he is going to raise out of the newspapers is probably something to do with performance on payment of invoices within 30 days. First of all, please again, when he looks at that, will he put it into context. The payment of invoices to small business is very, very important. Hon member Nkondlo will know exactly what that means for SMMEs and small businesses. You must put it into context.

Governments must pay within 30 days, we have got that agreement. In Gauteng, the number of people who have not been paid, the number of small businesses who have not received their payment, at the moment stands at 30 713 ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Order. Premier if you can just talk to me.

The PREMIER: This is Provincial Government, so let me say again, in Gauteng the outstanding not paid small businesses ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members. You cannot drown out the Speaker and definitely not the Premier. Let him just finish.

The PREMIER: ... are 30 713. †Skande! [Disgrace!] In the Western Cape also we have got far too many that have not been paid. We have a total number of six. [Applause.] [Interjections.].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright members, that concludes the Member's Statements. We are moving over to Notices of Motion. Are there any motions where notice is given? I see you hon member Botha.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall

move:

That the House debates the impact of the Department of Basic Education's plans to finalise Grade 9 as an exit point of schooling on the quality of education in the Western Cape with reference to the high levels of unemployment. I so move.

[Notice of motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Yes, hon member Sayed.

Mr M K SAYED: Hon Deputy Speaker, I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the continued use of schools as spaces for racial and class exclusion in the Western Cape, and this includes the exorbitant rates charged by schools to community based NGO's for hiring of their halls such as Luckoff High, St Idas Primary and Brackner de Villiers in Stellenbosch. I thank you.

[Notice of Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice taken. Hon member America.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the impact Bargaining Council Agreements have on the development and growth of Small, Medium and Micro Enterprises. I so move.

[Notice of Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice taken. Hon member Windvogel?

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, Hon Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses the plans to change the Murraysburg Hospital and other critical facilities into a mere clinic or Day Hospital in the Western Cape. I thank you.

[Notice of Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice taken. I see the EFF.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): That is not true! It is not going to happen.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the scourge of crime and violence that is taking ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order. Order members. Hon member Smith, if you can just ... [Interjection.]

Mr M XEGO: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the scourge of crime and violence taking place in Western Cape trains, where the majority of commuters using this transport service are poor people. Thank you very much.

[Notice of Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice taken. Any other motions where notice is given? No? Thank you very much. That concludes notices of motion. We move over to Motions without Notice. I see the hon member Botha, then I see hon Smith.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Ms L J BOTHA: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Cederberg Municipality for receiving its third unqualified or clean audit under a DA council. I so

move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? Motion agreed to. Hon member Smith, I saw you first.

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the large number of regular protests against poor service delivery in this province is growing with Paarl residents, the latest group unhappy with the high tariff hikes in Drakenstein Municipality.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see hon member Allen.

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Rlabs, an award winning non-profit organisation based in Athlone, Cape Town, for successfully hosting 350 young people between the ages of 10 and 17 at a bootcamp over the school holidays. The Nxtgen Bootcamp is a holiday program where young people are introduced to artificial intelligence, animation, robotics and coding. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? Motion agreed to. Hon Bans.

Ms A BANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the DA national leader is sinking deeper into a swamp of controversy as he could not properly explain his private Cape Town residence or the Markus Jooste or the Steinhoff sponsored luxury sport utility vehicle he used in this province and also notes experts saying that the DA is again seriously denting its assumed image as a squeaky clean party.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections?

An HON MEMBER: Objection!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] I see the hon Chief Whip.

An HON MEMBER: *Nogals* a white Fortuner!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order please. [Interjections.] Hon Marran. Hon Chief Whip, over to you.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Western Cape Provincial Parliament Secretary, Mr Romeo Adams on his birthday today. [Applause.] On behalf of the Democratic Alliance and I am sure indeed the House, we wish him a very happy birthday today and to trust that he has a lovely day further and many more to come. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

An HON MEMBER: Happy Birthday!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are there any objections to the motion? Are there any objections to the motion itself? Motion agreed to. Thank you very much. Hon Bakubaku-Vos?

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that the umpteenth familicide that took place in this province with a Kuils River man killing his two children and wife before shooting himself and calls on the hon MEC Albert Fritz, in his absence, and hon MEC Sharna Fernandez to up their game in this field. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the oldest resident of Touws River turned 113 years old and Margaret Maritz known as Aunty Griet was given celebrity treatment and that the Legislature sends its congratulations to her and her family.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? Motion agreed to. Hon Baartman.

Ms D M BAARTMAN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the Laingsburg-Karoo Marathon took place in Laingsburg on Saturday, 28 September 2019; congratulates Mr Lucas Nonyana and Ms Cecelia Nel for winning the male and female categories of the full marathon; further congratulates councillor Bertie van As, the Arlington Athletics Club, Laingsburg Municipality and the Western Cape Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport for organising this fun-filled family event; notes that it is a sign of strength, perseverance and discipline to be able to complete a marathon; and conveys thanks to the participants of the various categories for displaying such leadership. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? Motion agreed to. Hon Sayed, then I see you.

Mr M K SAYED: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the Provincial Government is at long last engaging the community of Redelinghuys near Piketberg to amalgamate the two primary schools that are within walking distance of one another, the one mostly coloured and the other the old white school; that the WCED should speed up the process to also amalgamate other duplicate schools in the province that are within walking distance; use the same language of instruction, curriculum and exams and denounces the continuation of apartheid style school divisions along old race lines, like those perpetuating segregation in Villiersdorp.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved? There are objections. [Interjections.] It will be printed on the Order Paper. I am seeing the hon Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the opening of the revamped, tech-savvy Botha's Halte Primary School on Friday 28 September 2019 by Western Cape Minister of Education, Debbie Schäfer. It is a great example of the Western Cape Education Department's collaboration schools

initiative. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? Motion agreed to. Hon Mvimbi?

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes commuter safety on rail transport declined even more since the City of Cape sent in its storm troops to pretend to assist in bringing an end to all kinds of crime, including knife robberies and murder.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion There is an objection, it will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] I see the hon Philander. And then I will come over to this side.

Ms W PHILANDER: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes upon the visit of the Standing Committee on

Health to the Grassy Park Community Health Care facility yesterday, we wish to congratulate Dr Grammaer, Sister Meyer and the staff for a sterling facility and for an exemplary passionate service rendered to the community of Grassy Park and neighbouring communities; further notes that with a population growth of 44 000 over the past five years and with the Pelican Park Health Facility opening that will provide relief, the staff and surrounding communities are partners in ensuring their facility renders the best of services; also notes that this facility speaks of what can be achieved in the health sector and is indeed one of the great examples how functional our healthcare system operates in the Western Cape. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? Motion agreed to. Hon Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the DA kicked out and stripped the membership of its Knysna Mayor Mark Willemse in a bitter dispute for not following its directive to resign and also notes its Metro chairman ...

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members!

Mr D SMITH:

... Grant Twigg could be the next scapegoat in a party riddled with divisions. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without ... [Interjections.] There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Allen. Order members. One minute, can I just, hon Allen if you can just take your seat. I see the ... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Just a point of order. Hon Deputy Speaker, you referred to two of our members recently, but the three of those members in the front are talking so loudly ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... that our members cannot even ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, you are absolutely ... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... be heard above the noise.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are right there. They are extremely loud.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So, if you could please attend to that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will ask that all members of this House ... [Interjections.] No-no, no-no, only – I have listened to the Leader of the Opposition and I would ask for some control amongst all of you, please and in particular when our members are right at the back. It is very difficult for me to hear. Hon Allen – no-no, Hon Smith, is it a point of order? A real one?

An HON MEMBER: Under which Rule?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Under ... [Interjections.] Yes? Wait members, wait members, do not assume. Yes?

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, may I reread this statement please? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No. [Interjections.] No, they objected. It is a motion.

Mr D SMITH: They did not hear. Why are they objecting?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: But I cannot stop whether they object or not hon Smith. It is their choice.

Mr D SMITH: But you can make a ruling on my request.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am not allowed to make a ruling whether ...
[Interjections.] hon members! Please! Can you please just trust that I am actually giving the member a ruling. I do not have the right to question whether they object, or they do not object. So whether you read it or not. They have objected, hon Smith. They are going to object to it again, but it has been read as a record into the Hansard. As long as you have got your microphone on, I promise you the Hansard will record it.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Deputy Speaker ...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Can I rise again on a point of order? I, unfortunately as a member of this House was trying to listen to the motion and I could not hear ... [Interjections.] So can I request that, because hon Deputy Speaker, I would like to hear the motion.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members ... [Interjections.] One minute.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I would like to hear the motion and I request that my right as a member of this House to hear the motion of another member is acknowledged and I appeal to you to allow the member to read the motion. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of order? [Interjections.] Hon members, we have the Chief Whip rising, please can I have order so I can actually listen to a point of order? [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is not going to help with everybody shouting. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): It is completely unacceptable for that request post facto. [Interjections.] The member could have requested that ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... before the decision was put to the House. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can I have some order please! I have got somebody who is standing. Can you please give her the opportunity to rise on a point of order? That is her job. [Interjections.] I cannot tolerate or have anybody else stand or shout at me. Hon members! This is the last time I am speaking and then I am going to name you to leave. If you can just allow the Chief Whip to stand and – no! It is her job to stand on a point of order as I have allowed the member.

An HON MEMBER: What about the Leader of the Opposition?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have heard the Leader of the Opposition – member. [Interjections.] Hon member please, it is not for you to be able to judge anything that I do. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Bring a substantive motion.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Minister is rising. Give me a second. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Madam Deputy Speaker, on a point of order. It is not acceptable for us to rewind the clock post facto, just in order to score political points.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja.

Ms M WENGER: You put the question to the House and the House made a decision. We cannot then go back.

An HON MEMBER: Which Rule?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, members. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Can I respond ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will not, I am not going to take any more points of orders on this matter. We are moving over to hon Allen. This is recorded absolutely fine on the Hansard. Hon member Allen. Let us go on. [Interjections.]

Mr R I ALLEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Enough! Enough hon Lili.

An HON MEMBER: Speak louder.

Mr R I ALLEN: I move without notice:

That the House notes that on 20 and 21 September 2019, 47 learners from the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sports' MOD program

dazzled audiences at the Joseph Stone Auditorium in Athlone; the production called “Sky Walker” spoke about issues such as gender based violence and growing up without a parent as well as the lack of role models while showcasing the learners’ talent in acting, dance, juggling and other skills; that this House congratulates the Minister, the Department and especially the learners involved.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Are there any objections to the motion itself? Motion agreed to. Hon Bakubaku-Vos?

Mr D SMITH: Order Speaker. Order. Can I rise? Order, Speaker, I would like to rise on a previous ruling in this House by the hon Speaker, not the Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: What is your point of order, hon Smith?

Mr D SMITH: The point of order is, I remember in a previous round member Baartman was speaking very softly over the microphone and then the Speaker ruled that the member can re-read the speech. Now ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja, but I heard your motion.

Mr D SMITH: No-no-no. I, no-no.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am listening.

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, can I finish?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. [Interjections.] Wait, hon members ...
[Interjections.]

Mr D SMITH: Why is everyone not treated consequent in this House ...
[Interjections.] by the Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. I think that is an interpretation. You have to allow me to make the ruling and not yourselves to make the ruling on my behalf. I would like to hear hon Bakubaku-Vos. Please carry on.
[Interjections.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the recent British Royal visit to Cape Town by the Duke of Sussex, Prince Harry and his family and thanks Duchess Meghan Markle for casting the world spotlight on gender based violence with her visit to the post office where Uyinene Mrwetyana was recently bashed to death; and tying a yellow ribbon at the

entrance to the memory of the victim as well as discussions with the victim's mother.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? Motion agreed to. I move over to this side and then I will come back to that side. Hon Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates Jerry and Pat Khun of Piketberg, who recently celebrated their 51st Wedding Anniversary, I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? Motion agreed to. Hon Smith, I trust that you are reading a new motion?

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the lame duck governance by the DA structures that leads to more problems like the past weekend's protests and

violent demonstrations at Dunoon and Darling and urges the DA municipalities to engage with communities and deal with their grievances, not to ignore them and that this could curb the situation of protests getting out of hand later.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? [Interjections.] There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see the EFF.

Mr M XEGO: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the brutal evictions of residents who were occupying Arcadia Place in Observatory which took place on 2 October 2019; many of these residents who occupied the three-storey Arcadia building were previously homeless whilst others were backyard dwellers who could not afford monthly rent anymore; further notes that the manner in which these residents were evicted does not align with the values and principles of Ubuntu and human dignity enshrined in the South African Constitution as they were evicted at night by unidentified security personnel carrying what looked like AK47's; we therefore call on the Western Cape Government to assist these residents to realise their constitutional right on adequate housing. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper.

Mr A LILI: [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, hon member Nkondlo. Please, I always miss her, so my apologies. Hon Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Happy Zalwa Day, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that Cosatu and the South African Society of Bank Officials threatened to shut down all banks last week ...
[Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: Hon Deputy Speaker, point of order ... [Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO:

...in protest action against plans for retrenchments in the banking sector; condemns corporate greed ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just, hon member, just take your seat. You will be able to read it again. I have got a point of order up here. Just give me a second.

Ms L M MASEKO: Hon Deputy Speaker, on a point of order. Is it parliamentary for member Lili to say Minister Simmers sent people with guns to go and evict people?

An HON MEMBER: No, he never said that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just give me a second. Hon Lili, did you say that?

Mr A LILI: No-no-no, I never said that. I said, is he objecting as if he is the one that sent those thugs to actually – what do you call it – remove people with – from those flats as the member from the EFF was saying. I said, is he the one responsible for that thuggery ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. [Interjections.] Hon members!

Mr A LILI: He understood me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Fair enough.

Mr A LILI: Hence he did not speak.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I accept what the hon Lili has explained. Can we please move on to hon Nkondlo to finish her motion without notice?

Ms N D NKONDLO: †Khaniyeke ukhleba, [Stop gossiping,]†hon members, please man. I move without notice:

That the House notes that Cosatu and the South African Society of Bank Officials threatened to shut down all banks last week in protest action against plans for retrenchments in the banking sector; condemn corporate greed by the big banks, who in the interest of profits and earning big bonuses will sacrifice employees and calls on the banking industry to halt the planned retrenchments, especially given the high unemployment rate in the country and province, I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the unacceptable attacks on traffic officers by especially taxi operators like recently experienced at Milnerton; and urge the Provincial Government to do more to improve the status and

image of these law enforcers.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Are there any objections to the motion itself? Motion agreed to. I see hon Sayed.

Mr M K SAYED: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that the Democratic Alliance is also rejected at the University of Cape Town campus like in by-elections in the community, their student wing, DASO, not only lost its majority of seats in the SRC, which it had at some point, but was reduced even further by not even getting a single seat at the University of Cape Town in the recent SRC campus elections; furthermore ...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M K SAYED:

... the South African Student Congress is congratulated with its increase in support on that particular campus and a number of other campuses; further notes that the DA could not even win a single seat

at the Nelson Mandela University's George campus, which was won entirely by SASCO. I thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion – there are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] Hon Botha and then I will come back to this side. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Now you are objecting to the truth!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, the longer you – ja [Interjection.]

Ms L J BOTHA: The results are saying the by-elections are fraudulent ... [Interjections.] by the ANC.

An HON MEMBER: No way! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, we are going to be here all night. [Interjections.] Can we have order please? [Interjections.] I must just note though that some of your own members drown out your own members. So can we just have some order. Thank you very much.

Ms L J BOTHA: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House extends its wishes for a speedy recovery to Ms Tania Steyn-Dowie, our secretary who was involved in a car accident on Wednesday 2 October 2019. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? Motion agreed to. Hon Bans?

Ms A BANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes and welcomes the renaming of Darling Street, as the colonial Keizersgracht name is dropped and that the name of District Six is restored, with the apartheid name Zonnebloem dropped, as part of restoring the dignity of this area which was stripped by bulldozers in the erstwhile apartheid regime. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? Motion agreed to. I see you hon Windvogel. [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without

notice ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just one minute, hon Windvogel. [Interjections.]
Sorry, hon America. Hon America! Did you put your hand up for
objection?

Mr D AMERICA: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: My apologies. That motion was rejected.
[Interjections.] It will be printed on the Order Paper, for the record. I
move over to hon Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without
notice:

That the House notes and congratulates South Africa and President
Cyril Ramaphosa on recently receiving a Universal Health Care Award
in New York for the National Health Care Plan of our country.
Amandla! [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

HON MEMBERS: Awethu!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion being moved

without notice? Any objections to the motion itself?

An HON MEMBER: No, no objections.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is an objection. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Yes, hon Minister? [Interjections.] Members. Members!

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: I think the hon member will now be going to Baragwanath after this.

An HON MEMBER: What? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Smith. [Interjections.] Hon Smith, your members are making too much noise.

Mr D SMITH: Yes. Fellow colleagues, hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes Cape Town again seeks a roll-over of unspent informal settlement upgrade funds, during the past financial year and that this time R178 million was not used to improve the lives of the poorest. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? Motion agreed to. Moving over, hon Bakubaku-Vos, I see you. [Interjections.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: When your members keep quiet.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Deputy Speaker, I move without motion that the House notes with concern the ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You cannot move without motion!

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: I mean without notice. [Interjections.] You know, Deputy Speaker, †hulle raas! Dit is hoekom jy wil praat so. Hulle raas! [Gelag.] O Here! Hoekom raas julle so? [Applous.] [they are noisy! That is why you speak like that. [Laughter.] Oh Lord! Why do you make a noise like that? [Applause.]]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister? Hon member, just sit for a second.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: She can only rise to table on a motion without notice, not on a motion without motion.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bakubaku-Vos?

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Laughter.] I move ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, we are going to be here all night!

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the murder of 27-year Clarissa Lindoor on Nietvoorbij farm at Stellenbosch; notes further it is alleged that Clarissa died at the hands of an abusive boyfriend who has since handed himself over to the police; calls on this Provincial Government to invest more resources in fighting this culture of gender-based violence and femicide in the province and conveys its condolences to the family and friends of Clarissa. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? Motion agreed to. Hon Sayed?

Mr M K SAYED: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes the appointment of retired constitutional Judge Edward Cameron as the new Stellenbosch University Chancellor and we wish him all of the best. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? Motion agreed to. Hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that road deaths in the province are too high and that in one recent accident 10 people died and 23 were injured on Ou Kaapse Weg and that especially pedestrians are a vulnerable group; further calls on the Provincial Government to up the message against road fatalities and accidents. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? Motion agreed to. Hon Smith and then hon Bans and then hon Nkondlo.

Mr D SMITH: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes Cape Town has thus far overspent R42 million on the water and sanitation budget for the period April to August and that this is part of the DA-led Metro Council's ploy to milk the taxpayer.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections? [Interjections.] There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I see hon Nkondlo, and then hon Bans, and then hon Cameron Dugmore.

Ms N NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes that 30 September, 342 years ago, one of the founding indigenous mothers of our nation, Krotoa, a niece to Khoi leader Autshumao, called Eva by the Van Riebeeck administration, returned from Robben Island where she, as multi-linguistic and activist, together with her Danish surgeon husband, Pieter van Meerhoff stayed; that she was later imprisoned at the Castle and that she was buried on this day 345 years ago in the fort. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? Motion agreed to. Hon Bans. [Interjections.]

Ms A BANS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the Beaufort-West Municipality on the launch of its digital doorway to connect youth to the world and notes this one of a kind outlet is placed in the state of the art Youth Hub KwaMandlenkosi Project. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved? [Interjections.] There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Cameron Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I move without notice:

That the House notes recent newspaper reports stating that only a

miracle can save the DA National Leader, Mmusi Maimane to survive the damning leaks of him being captured and further notes with disappointment that the hon Western Cape Premier Winde has publicly said that he is not interested in the position.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion [Interjections.] There is objections to the motion. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Sayed?

Mr M K SAYED: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am trying to find out – there we go. Hon Maseko. Hon Sayed you have the mic.

Mr M K SAYED: Thank you. I move without notice:

That the House notes the passing away of Galiema Haron, the wife of struggle hero and religious leader Imam Abdullah Haron who was brutally murdered by the apartheid regime 50 years ago; notes further that even in her death Galiema did not know the truth as to what exactly happened to her husband and who murdered him, who is one of 117 freedom fighters that perished in the detention centres of apartheid, without trial; that we convey sincere condolences to the

family and that the House calls on the National Prosecution Authority to re-open an inquest into the death of Imam Haron. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? Motion agreed to. Hon Mvimbi and then hon Nkondlo.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes the province is fast becoming the violent theft capital of South Africa with statistics showing 14% of the country's hijacking taking place in the Western Cape; and urges the Provincial Government to step up traffic policing of the provincial roads in order to decrease and contain this scourge.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? Motion agreed to. Hon Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes with concern the exploitation of dedicated and hardworking firefighters in the City of Cape Town who work overtime and are not paid for it; notes further that they recently took to the streets to demand being paid for overtime work; supports these calls by firefighters who are faced with death every day in the line of duty, fighting wild range fires across the province; calls on the City to heed to their demands and end the exploitation of the firefighters. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. I then see – who was, put their hand up? Are there any other motions without notice? No, there are not. That concludes motions without notice. [Interjections.] Oh, my apologies, hon member Dugmore. There is another one.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that women in our province often harvest the fruits of wrath, abuse and ill treatment in the rural areas of the Western Cape and calls on the hon Premier Winde to activate a “women’s desk” in his office to focus on the plight of women and take

the lead in advocating women's rights across the province.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any objections [Interjections.] There are objections. They will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjections.] Sorry, Deputy Chief Whip, do you want to rise as you are saying something?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP: Yes. We are objecting to the motion being moved without notice.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. You are objecting to the motion being moved without notice. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Is there another one, hon Dugmore?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes, thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes that the DA has received support from the fired Steinhoff boss Markus Jooste and even used a luxury vehicle donated by Jooste during its campaign in the Western Cape province; and expresses its concern in this regard. [Interjections.]

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections to the motion [Interjections.] there are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper and I think have we another motion without notice? Yes, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, your own members are shouting across here while they do not even know you are speaking.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Okay. Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Guys, your leader is speaking!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, your own members are speaking over you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House notes further DA internal squabbles have again leaked into the public domain; this time in regard to the intended motion of no-confidence against the Metro Chairperson Grant Twigg, that it has led to a further barrage of mudslinging and infighting and raises its concern in this regard.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved [Interjections.] There are objections. It will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Bakubaku-Vos?

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order please, members.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes and congratulates SAPS and its Hawks for arresting a suspect of 65 years in East London for fraud of R4,7 million, meant for Gugulethu upgrades; and that the man will appear in court soon. I so move.

[Motion as moved by Member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice? Any objections to the motion itself? Motion agreed to.

Hon Members, are there any more motions without notice? Then I conclude motions without notice and I conclude the business of the day. Let me just rise and then, the House is adjourned.

An HON MEMBER: Thank you, bye-bye.

An HON MEMBER: Happy Birthday, Deputy Speaker [Singing.]

The House adjourned at 17:49.