
FRIDAY, 2 DECEMBER 2022

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 10:00.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may be seated. Good morning to all our hon members and to guests and those that are currently online. As we proceed today with our Order Paper, before we proceed, I would like to just remind the members about some of the logistical arrangements with regard to participating virtually and ensuring that you please have good audio and that there are no disturbances when you are online. I have also granted media access or access to the media, but just to remind all our guests that they may not interrupt or switch on their microphones or their video cameras during

the Sitting and hon members are reminded that no interjections are permitted during the hybrid Sittings, and to this end I draw the hon members' attention to Rule 40 of our Standing Rules. Hon members, we will then now proceed to the first Order of the Day. Hon Sayed, I recognise you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. The first issue before I go into the issues relating to the debate and time allocations – we received an ATC yesterday indicating that the Speaker or former Speaker is no longer a member of the House. Could we please get clarity from the Secretary possibly or by yourself as to whether a vacancy has been declared, because, if that is indeed the case, then the necessary processes ought to take place for the election of a Speaker in this particular House. We cannot continue with so much of business, important business, without having an elected Speaker as a matter of urgency.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Deputy Whip Sayed. I would like to just remind the House that yesterday's Sitting we had a Temporary Chair that dealt with the matter according to the Rules, so that is firstly the most important. I would also like to just take the opportunity, if I may – give me a second please, sorry, I am not using a mouse, – alright, that in terms of the ATC on 1 December in terms of Section 62(5) of the National Constitution read with Section 2.3 of the National Council of Provinces, alright, that was dealt with as a motion. Then with regard to the Secretary's matter on Monday, 28 November 2022, the Secretary to the Western Cape Provincial Parliament informed the former Speaker of the Western Cape

Provincial Parliament, Mr Masizole Mngqasela, that the Office of the Secretary received correspondence from the Democratic Alliance regarding the cessation of his membership of that political party.

“Mr Mngqasela was further informed that in terms of Section 106 (3)(c) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996, his membership of the WCPP has ceased...” I quote, according to the ATC.

I also note that yesterday's motion, which was supported in this House, the Secretary had used his formal mandate, as per the Parliamentary motion, to communicate that ATC as well as communicate directly to the former Speaker. I trust that that will answer your question, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, partially, but at the stage when we raised the issue and when clarity was given there was no ATC. Now the matter has been ATC'd, so post the matter being ATC'd, it is only correct then that we are given clarity as to whether a vacancy has been declared and actually a vacancy ought to be declared and we ought to then be having a Speaker, because at that stage the matter was not ATC'd.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, so in terms of my position as Deputy Speaker, hon Sayed, I do not have the mandate to declare anything of such a nature. It would have to come through the Secretary in his new powers. Alright, thank you very much. Over to you, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Yes, no indeed, we are not expecting you as the Deputy Speaker, to, in any way, declare a vacancy. The mere fact that the Secretary has that powers the Secretary ought to be and the Secretary is in the House. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja, ja, but the Secretary does not have that opportunity to make that decision now in the House, according to the Order Paper, so what I am asking... [Interjections.] May I finish? What I would like to suggest is we have given the power to the Secretary, allow the Secretary to take up that mandate in his right. I cannot ask him to make that decision here in the House as the Presiding Officer. Hon members, can I also just state that I am here as the Deputy Speaker in terms of Rule 26 and that the House can continue, as I am able to carry out, according to the Rules, my job to finish the Order Paper for today. I do not have any other mandate other than that in this Sitting. Yes, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Mr Dugmore had his hand up for quite a while. He was not recognised.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, sorry, I was focussing on you. Hon Dugmore?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker, and good morning hon members.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Good morning.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I think in terms of the motion my understanding is that, which was carried, that the Secretary was given the powers to take necessary actions in regard to any legal challenge or where the Legislature is summonsed to appear or to defend any action and that he is asked to then, and secondly the power then to give reports, and thirdly, that for as long as the Speaker's position remains vacant, that he would take over the functions of receiving statutory and other information. But, I think we have a challenge, which, I think, we must address in the best possible way, and that is that, as you have indicated, Deputy Speaker, you do not have the power to now act. Alright, the Secretary's functions here do not include the issue that member Sayed has raised. So it is very clear and member Nkondlo dealt with that yesterday about Section 20 of our Constitution, which says that the Provincial Parliament must elect a Speaker from amongst its members at its first Sitting or when necessary to fill a vacancy. So, I think the clarity that we require, what is the process that we need to follow. Obviously, we have to contact the President of the Constitutional Court to designate a Judge, but it seems that there is no direction coming now, so surely this House – because it says here that the House must elect. We are sitting here as this House and we should deal with this matter and then possibly specifically pass a resolution to instruct the Secretary to contact the President of the Constitutional Court to designate a Judge. So surely, you know, we can ask the Whips that are here today, they have an opportunity to go and sit, and then to come to this House while we

are sitting to pass such a resolution, because where else, given that we do not have a Speaker and you do not have those powers. So I would suggest that we need to ask the Whips to confer and to come back to this session so we can pass such a resolution, giving the mandate to the Secretary to actually do that. Thanks.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore. Hon Deputy Chief Whip?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Firstly, Deputy Speaker, because any such matter is not on the Order Paper for today, this House in terms of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, is only able to deal with matters that are on the Order Paper. Given that the resolution has passed, and we have given the Secretary the powers... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order members!

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): We need to allow the Secretary to do his respective job and the reason that we cannot suspend for the Whippery to meet in order for something like that to be considered today in terms of Rule 151 subsection (3), is that there needs to be unanimous – I repeat:

“...unanimous concurrence of all the members present, no motion may be moved on the day on which the notice is given thereof...”

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, hon Nkondlo!

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): And I do acknowledge no motion has been given to date. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo, one minute. Thank you very much. [Interjections.] So, hon members, hon members, before I – can I respond? Hon members... [Interjections.] Hon Nkondlo, I would like to respond, hon Nkondlo. So, hon members, I think, firstly... [Interjections.] Hon Dugmore, give me a second.

Hon Dugmore is correct that I have no powers to do so, but just remember that that motion was only passed yesterday, and if I remember you finished at 7:30 p. m. [Interjections.] Hon members, you finished at 7:30 p.m. last night. I trust that the Secretary will communicate all relevant information as he is mandated to do in front of this House and that he will communicate or take up the processes, which is only less than 24 hours after the motion was passed. So we do need to give him the space to be able to act in his mandate. He only got that yesterday, firstly.

Secondly, I would like to just remind the House and many of you have been here for many years, that the Acting Chief Whip is quite correct that the Order Paper is the Order Paper, and that 151.3, hon Sayed or hon Lekker, as the Whips, are very clear about motions. So I am not able to make such a ruling, and nor can anybody else, because we have an Order Paper that has been approved and has to carry through the business of today. I have also, just to say, availed myself and I would perhaps advise all of you, I have

availed myself till 10 p.m. tonight. We will get through this Order Paper. It is a Friday evening. I am free to be here in the House till 10 p.m. – maybe later if we need to, but we need... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon Speaker... [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, I am fully mandated, as the Deputy Speaker, to run the House today in a Sitting and I will certainly do so. So I would ask that you all make arrangements, because we have to get through the Order of the Day. Hon Dugmore, but I did see hon Kama, your hand was up, and then hon Dugmore. First to hon Dugmore – give me a second. Hon Kama, sit for one second. Hon Dugmore can take...

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I think there was an initial confusion which we have later established that in fact whether that below-the-line motion of yesterday was adopted but we are told that it was adopted, so.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So I am moving from that base. Now, the issue is, the Chief Whip of the Majority Party just read out a particular Rule there, which says that on the day of the Sitting, if there is a unanimous support for that resolution, it can be tabled. So I am not suggesting that we interrupt this program. What I am suggesting is that we

bring such a motion during the course of the day and that we ask that that motion be discussed, because surely there is no-one in this House... [Interjection.] There is no-one in this House that would object to this House resolving to give the mandate to the Secretary to actually enact 20.1 and 2, which is to contact the court-designated Judge and he elects a Speaker. My worry is that in terms of the limited powers that were given... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: In terms of the limited powers that were given to the Secretary, the Speaker is kind of the Executive Authority of the House. There are going to be many issues that need to be dealt with and the House cannot proceed without a Speaker for a very long time.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: And I think it is in our interest to pass such a resolution, give that power, and then elect a Speaker next week.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So hon Dugmore, before I take anybody else's hands, you have in your right in terms of Rules 150.1.1, 150.1.2 and 150.1.3 to bring a motion on the day. You may certainly act within your rights of the Rules and I cannot object to you doing so. [Interjections.] But just, hon

Kama, and then hon Sayed and then I have seen Minister Meyer. So hon Kama, first to you. Have you been covered?

Mr M KAMA: Yes, I think I am covered, Deputy Speaker, the point really that one wanted to make is that we cannot run the House like this, that we cannot be surprised, because we were surprised here yesterday in the House, as members of this House, that we do not have a Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is correct.

Mr M KAMA: As it was then later ATC'd.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

Mr M KAMA: And now we are led to just sit in this House and not know what is happening with the position of the Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, okay.

Mr M KAMA: And I think overall the point we are making is that all of us need to understand that we are not in a DA caucus here. We are in a Provincial Parliament and we need to give it that respect so that we are able to run this House and give it the decorum it deserves. Thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you very much. Hon Sayed, have

you – are you covered or can I move over?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I am covered.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are covered, thank you. Hon Baartman, and then hon Minister Meyer. Okay.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I think and extraordinary circumstances require bold leadership. We are sitting with a crisis. We do not have a Speaker. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: A crisis, it is a crisis!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We do not have a Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We also know the process around removal, that is fine, but we do not have a Speaker. As hon Kama says, this is not a DA caucus. To argue, because there is an argument now that was presented that the motion must come through the Programming Authority. There was a motion passed yesterday that did not come through the Programming Authority so that point becomes moot, but I think what is important for us to do, is given the crisis, given the fact that we are not finding each other, I do not see the harm in the House taking a decision and

agreeing that as a matter of urgency, before we go any further, the Whips must meet, and then let the House then agree to mandate the Secretary to immediately declare a vacancy, and make sure ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): And make sure that we elect...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): The process must start for the election of the Speaker... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): And the DA must tell us, they are standing up here on a whole lot of frivolous technicalities... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kama. [Interjections.] Hon Marran.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): They must tell us that they are not ready because the internal factionalism is saying that they are not ready, they do not know whom they want as the Speaker. We have a Deputy Speaker. You have the choices to make. Make up your mind and do not hold the people of the Western Cape to ransom.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Baartman.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Firstly, Deputy Speaker... [Interjections.] Firstly, Deputy Speaker, yesterday's motion was submitted in terms of Notice of Motion proceedings in terms of Rule 151 subsection (2). The request in terms of precedence was given yesterday in the House in terms of Rule 20 subsection (2) in order to bring it above the line, which does not require Programming Authority if in terms of precedence the House then agrees to give the respective motion which was moved duly above the line. In terms of Notice of Motion proceedings you have to bring a Notice of Motion in terms of the Rules. That is 151 subsection (2). Should the ANC wish to bring a Notice of Motion for matters to be dealt with today... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... in terms of Rule 151 subsection (3) we are more than happy for them to exercise their respective rights... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): ... in terms of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament Rules. However, Deputy Speaker, in terms of the Order Paper

today this is the Order Paper at 10 o'clock today and we have not seen a Notice of Motion and we have not been asked to move that respective Notice of Motion above the line, and therefore we need to continue with the Order Paper of the Day. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Minister Meyer. [Interjections.] Attention, order members! Just give everybody the opportunity, please. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bans!

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: Hon Deputy Speaker, it is quite clear what is happening here now. This is a pretext of what has happened yesterday. So let us be clear about what the Rules say and what governs these Rules in terms of this matter before the House. I think the hon Deputy Chief Whip is correct, that except with a unanimous concurrence, and this is Rule 151 subsection (3), that except with a unanimous concurrence and she has read it and I am re-reading it to all the members present:

“No motion may be moved on the day on which the notice thereof is given...”

The Rules are clear, it cannot be, but as the Deputy Chief Whip has indicated, it can happen at a later stage, but not now, and so therefore we cannot and should not – and should not – continue to disrupt the House... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marran!

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: Because then we disrupt the Rules of the House. We have to act in terms of the Rules, but above the Rules is the Constitution... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: And the Constitution is very clear, subsection / Section 20 of the Constitution:

“The Provincial Parliament must elect a Speaker from amongst its members... ”

As the hon Leader of the Official Opposition indicated:

“... members at the first Sitting, after its election, or when necessary, to fill a vacancy... ”

Filling a vacancy is a process, it cannot be this engagement. So I ask you, the Deputy Chair, to proceed because of the Rules that is clear and of the process that is described on which the Secretary will have to apply his mind and come back to the House, but it cannot be today. It is not on the Order Paper.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is correct.

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: So may I, with due respect,

hon Deputy Speaker, as the Leader of Government Business, propose that we continue with the order of business.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon members, I am not going to entertain further. You know your Rules. You may act well within the Rules of the House. If you want to bring a motion, there is a Sitting on Monday, and you may certainly do that within whatever Rules it is allowed... [Interjections.] But, it is very clear.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Order, Deputy Speaker, order, order!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, you do not have to shout, you know I always recognise you. Hon Sayed, you may stand up.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, on a point of order, we cannot conclude the matter just after the Leader of Government Business, we are not being run here by the Executive. There are members here, hon Lekker, and hon Dugmore have got their hands up. I think it is only fair that their hands be entertained.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: But we can also continue to raise the same frivolous points of order. We have to work within the Rules, so hon Dugmore, I will recognise you, but I have to start the Order of the Day.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, Speaker.

Speaker, we have no intention not to proceed with this.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: We have no intention, Deputy Speaker, not to proceed with this, but... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: But please may I ask your members to keep quiet.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Okay, sorry. But, it is a problem when the Leader of Government Business and the Chief Whip of the Majority Party selectively read from Rules, because they did not read out 151(1)(a), which says:

“... that when giving notice of a motion, a member must read it aloud and deliver at the table a signed copy of the notice, deliver to the Secretary... ”

Who is sitting with us here:

“... on any working day for placing on the Order Paper.”

Now that means that technically there is nothing stopping us, except obviously if, and then I go onto 3:

“... except with the unanimous concurrence of all the members no motion may be moved on the day...”

So in practical terms, what we would like to suggest is that if we submit such a motion to the Secretary now... [Interjections.]

Mr P MARRAN: It can happen.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It can happen, and then if, if it is unanimous. Obviously if you vote – no-no, through the Deputy Speaker, if you vote against it, then it is not unanimous... [Interjections.] But we are trying to make an argument that the motion... [Interjection.] The motion that we are trying to submit would then give a specific... [Interjections.] Sorry, Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, I cannot, it is your own side that is creating too much noise.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: That that would then give a specific mandate to the Secretary because the mandate that the Secretary was given yesterday was a limited mandate, and surely if we formulate a motion in a way, and we want to bring that motion here in the course of this morning, which indicates that that specific power, because we have a gap in our Rules... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja, sure.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ... so this is like a precedented situation. So what I would like to request is that we proceed with the proceedings and in the course of the morning we will submit a motion to

the Secretary in front of everyone. We can then, as a House, entertain that. If it is not unanimous, then clearly it is not unanimous.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja, ja. So hon Dugmore, and I would just like to respond. I just, firstly, hon Dugmore, can you check that you... [Interjections.] Hon members! Can you just check that you have March of 2021 Rules, just, you have the right ones? Okay. So I just want to – you are welcome to do hon Dugmore, Rule 1 says:

“When giving notice of a motion the member must deliver to the Secretary a signed copy of the notice on any working day for placing on the Order Paper.”

The Order Paper is already pre-populated. However, however, hon Dugmore, are you with me?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: He is reading. Hon Dugmore, however, you can, you may exercise your right as an Opposition and do and go and put something on paper. Whether it is within the Rules is another story, but it will have to be decided upon. In fact, you also may seek legal advice on the matter in terms of the interpretation of the Rule. [Interjections.] Alright, so can we now proceed? I am now going to move, hon Baartman. Hon Baartman, okay.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Chair. I just want to make it

clear and on the record from the Democratic Alliance's side. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon Marran.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): If the ANC wishes to bring a Notice of Motion in terms of Rule 151 subsection (1) and subsection (2), it is their right. If they wish to ask a question in this House in terms of Rule 151 subsection (3) it is their right and we will deal with the matter at that time. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Correct, thank you very much.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chairperson.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, can I ask...

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No-no, I think we...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: These are the last two questions and then we can proceed.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Chair, sorry, Chairperson.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I cannot hear. [Interjections.] Hon Nkondlo! [Interjections.] Hon Nkondlo, your own Leader of the Opposition cannot be

heard. Alright.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Sorry, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I just must indicate that although it does not make material difference, I do not want to give this House the wrong impression that what the first thing – it was actually March... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I was wondering.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It is very clear from the... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Is that the March Rules?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...the March '21 Rules.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Exactly the same, that except with the unanimous concurrence, when giving a notice, a signed copy must be delivered to the Secretary, etcetera. [Interjections.] So the contents

are exactly the same, but I just wanted to correct that. Thanks.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay. Hon Lekker, the last point that I am going to do, yes, over to you, your hand is up.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you. Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, I would want to rise on a point of order in reference to how the Deputy or the Acting Chief Whip has actually identified herself in this House, which is unprecedented and tomorrow we will be then having a House that has a Chief Whip, a Deputy Chief Whip of the House, a Speaker and a Deputy Speaker of the House, who are no longer referred to as members of the House but rather as members belonging to a particular political party in this House. Now I... [Interjection.] Shut up!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Uh-uh, no-no-no, hon Lekker, no! [Interjections.] Hon Lekker, no! [Interjections.] No-no, hon Lekker, one minute. Hon Nkondlo, no! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: But why are you [Inaudible.]. Why are you stopping ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is it a point of order? Premier?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You must sit down until you are recognised! [Microphone muted.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, hon Lekker, just one minute. [Interjections.]

Hon minute, hon Sayed. I am talking to her. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Why is there... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Lekker, just one minute.

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: A point of order.
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute. I would like you to withdraw that.
[Interjections.]

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: Hon Deputy Speaker, I rise on
a point of order on the statement made now by the Chief Whip of the ANC.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: To shut-up. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: She said, to use the word, that
is not parliamentary.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja.

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: Can you also rule that what

she said now is unparliamentary. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Deputy Speaker, on a point of order, how do you...
[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, Chair, a point of order!
[Interjections.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Yes, Speaker, you are biased. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, I am speaking to hon Lekker...
[Interjections.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Why are you allowing him, but they were shouting at our Chief Whip... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, hon Meyer and the DA do not have free privilege in the House. He cannot just stand up when he is not being recognised and speak.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, but I recognised him.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): He should have first sat down, put up his hand. He has been in this House for long. I mean, I remember him 2009 already he has been here. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): He is supposed to sit down...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bakubaku-Vos! [Interjections.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: You allow the DA members to speak as they wish to our Chief Whip and our members. You allow them!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members, order members! Hon Bakubaku-Vos, you have not been recognised. Please put your microphone off. [Interjections.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Deputy Speaker, our Chief Whip, when she responds, she is wrong. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bakubaku-Vos, please!

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: You are biased!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, hon Lekker, would you mind rising, please? Hon Lekker. Hon Lekker, would you mind rising, please? So can I just have order in the House, please? Before anybody stood up, hon Lekker knows, I am just asking to withdraw. That is all. We know that the word

“shut-up” is unparliamentary. It does not matter who says it, and it does not matter who rises on it. [Interjections.]

†An HON MEMBER: Uyagula.

[An HON MEMBER: You are mad.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please, hon Lekker. Hon Lekker, you would not appreciate that either. If I can ask...

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I withdraw, Chair, but those two must keep quiet.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, will you withdraw, thank you very much.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): When someone is speaking they must keep quiet.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, thank you very much. Can we proceed to the first Order of the Day?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now call on... [Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Still my point of order... [Interjection.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: My hand is up, my hand is up, Deputy Speaker,

my hand is up.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bakubaku-Vos! Can you please mute hon Bakubaku-Vos, she is not recognised.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, you asked me to withdraw the word “shut-up”.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, yes, yes.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): And not my point of order, that I was raising in this House.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, what is your point of order? So I just asked you to withdraw the word.

†The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Kutheni wena?

[The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): What’s wrong with you?]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No-no, hon Lekker, focus on me, please.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, that one must just be ordered.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No-no, hon Lekker, I cannot entertain that if there is a point of order.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Deputy Speaker, I think it is going to be important that members of the Executive behave as members of the Executive and in an honourable way.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Or otherwise I will match that particular [Inaudible.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Lekker, we do not need any more rulings on this matter. I trust that we can now begin. Hon Dugmore, you are well within your rights as the Leader of the Opposition, or as Whips to exercise your request as per what you stated in the House. Can I proceed, hon Lekker, or do you want to... [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, yourself or me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, I said if yourself as Whips, as Whip of the Opposition or hon Dugmore with regard to his request around a motion. Okay.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No thank you, Chair. I was actually not going to speak on what Cameron has spoken to.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I am speaking with regard to an unprecedented way that members of the Democratic Alliance have started. It is a trend since 2019 up until today still. Members are elected to be a Chief Whip of the House and not a Chief Whip of a particular political party in the House. It is very unprecedented, and it leaves a bitter taste. Thank you, Chair.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now would like to proceed to the debate on Vote 1 with the Premier. The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day. Hon Sayed, can we end?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Ja, no-no, this is not on this particular topic.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, perfect.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker, and it is relating to what the Secretary is about to read out. Now I am not sure whether, as the ANC, we got the wrong end of the stick, but my query is regarding what I see here on the Orders of the Day, with regards to the speaking times and in the particular Programming Committee or Programming Authority meeting, I asked and double-checked, like I asked with the Second Reading Debate:

“Does the ANC get 24 minutes?”

“Yes.”

Does the ANC get 8 minutes?”

“Yes.”

But now I see the ANC is given 16 minutes. I would like to query that, I think that, because that now gives that we would have been able to prepare much more, had we known that we are given the 16 minutes. In the Programming Authority we were given eight minutes and we communicated that to our team, so that, I think, needs to change. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Hon Acting Chief Whip.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you Chair. Chair, after the Programming Authority meeting, I received the procedural advice that it actually does need to be 16 minutes. Yesterday when the communication went out regarding the Speakers’ List I did check and the minutes for every party were correct yesterday when the Speakers’ List went out before today’s Sitting, to make sure that that is specifically on there.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, and remember that I cannot preside, I cannot... That was decided in the Programming Authority. That is totally a programmable process. Members, can I begin Programme 1. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I just want to, firstly I want to pre-empt and indicate that we are not being difficult...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): And it is not – we saw last week we cooperated with yourself.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It is not that one is questioning the manner in which you are Chairing and that we want things to be done properly. Obviously what we see here, this has never... This did not happen earlier in the year, this type of mess-up or other years, so it is not that we are being partisan, and it is not a particular blame being placed on the Acting Chief Whip. It is a reflection of the instability of the Democratic Alliance, and it is now impacting on a simple thing like speaking times.

Now, hon Deputy Speaker, according to the admission here of the hon Deputy Chief Whip or Acting Chief, the Programming Authority, the idea from the Programming Authority is that the speaking times were different to what we have here now. There was a consultation made, of course, but we were not consulted. We were not informed, as political parties who are part of the Programming Authority, that the speaking times have been changed, so I am proposing that we go back to the original speaking times that were agreed upon in the Programming Authority. It is not going to make a big difference. In fact, there were already members, member Van der Westhuizen, I think

member Mackenzie, it is a pity member Mackenzie is not here, who were actually arguing for even less time than the original that was put there. So I do not see how, on the Democratic Alliance's side, it is going to be a problem. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Chief Whip, Acting Chief Whip.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Deputy Chairperson. Ag, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, because I in general do not want to go against procedural advice, which is why we corrected it. However, if the members wish to speak less, the Democratic Alliance is amenable to making the speaking time less.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, so can I – can we agree on that, hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, two things. Firstly, before I respond to that, the hon Bakubaku-Vos has had her hand up and she is not being recognised. I just want to put that it is important that she be recognised and be given an opportunity. She is online. Number 2, yes, it must not be viewed as a favour, but, if, and I think this is how we do in a sense also resolve matters, after we have debated that then we will then reduce it, if the Democratic Alliance is amenable, as the Deputy Chief Whip has indicated, we reduce the speaking times going back to the original format. Thank you very much, but please do recognise the hon Bakubaku-Vos. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I do not see any further hands up.
Hon Bakubaku-Vos, is your hand up?

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Yes, my hand was up, Deputy Speaker, then, while the members of the other side were shouting at our Chief Whip, and you pointed at our Chief Whip not to speak like that in Parliament, but you let the Democratic Alliance members of Parliament to speak as they wish to us and our Chief Whip. You must stop being biased. You will not control Parliament, if you are doing that. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bakubaku-Vos, what is your point of order?

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: That is what I wanted to say.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bakubaku-Vos, what is your point of order?

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: [No audible reply.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, thank you, we will now proceed. I will ask the Secretary to read the First Order of the Day.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 1 – Premier – Western Cape Adjustments

Appropriation Bill [B3–2022]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Secretary. I recognise the hon Premier Winde.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. Can I say to the hon members of this House, Cabinet, the Leader of the Opposition and members, it is a great opportunity to be able to address you on the Adjustment Appropriation Vote 1 for the 2022/23 year.

Can I say that I think that this has been a challenging year; it has been a challenging year, obviously for the citizens of our province, as well as the citizens of our country, but globally, I think it has been a challenging year. If I think back to the Adjustments Appropriation just one year ago, we would have all been online, or very few of us in the House. We were just about to be red-listed and, once again, our economy taking further pounding, and of course, since then, we have had various knocks to our economy, to jobs, to citizens ability to put food on their table, reaching far and wide. We have seen the Russian invasion of the Ukraine, and the impact that that has had on citizens here in our province. The price of food has gone up in this province, because of a war happening on the other side of the world.

We have also seen the impact of excessive and more and more loadshedding across our country. What that does to our economy has been devastating, and of course, at the end of the day, when it affects our economy, it affects every

single citizen's ability to live a life that they value, just looking at food inflation, and what that has done to families here in our province, let alone our country. Just having a look at how many businesses are unable to operate when you go above loadshedding level four, and the outlook – I am sorry to say – for the next year, is even more bleak.

If you look at the report from Eskom, which saw double the loadshedding in South Africa this year, as to last year, and they are all saying that next year is going to be worse and that does not bode well for the citizens of this province. It really, really is putting so much pressure on every single person.

I think that our job here is to understand those pressures, and to make sure that while understanding those pressures on our citizens, that we make decisions both in the province, as well as in South Africa, to find hope, to find hope within this environment, and this Department and this Department's budget needs to make sure that we deliver tangible results, to demonstrate and show residents that we are capable of governing and of making that difference. We continue to put our citizens at the centre of all of the work that we do, whether it be here in Parliament, or whether it be in our respective day-to-day jobs as Government and as Opposition.

In our Government, we will continue to focus on our three main areas of recovery going into this new difficult economic environment. We will continue to focus on safety, and I must say that there I, and I know that this will be discussed in the Safety Vote, but I want to say to Minister Reagan

Allen and to his team, thank you, and well done. You know that the Safety Plan is a 10-year plan. It is interesting to see quarter after quarter after quarter when the crime results come out that we can see a reduction in murder numbers in those targeted areas.

When I look at the latest numbers, and I see that in our targeted areas like Atlantis, a 25% reduction, compared to the 2021 results. If I look at Bishop Lavis 6,7%; Gugulethu, 16,3%; Harare, 3,6%; Khayelitsha, 9,4%, on top of the 14% that we saw in the last quarter. Kraaifontein 15,6%, on top of the 16%, we saw in the last quarter, and Mfuleni, a 32,4% reduction. Obviously, this is the start of the Safety Plan, and the real focus has got to come now on prevention. We have got to the prevention space, but of course, those will be discussed in those budgets of the various Ministers and departments that are focusing on prevention as part of the Safety Plan.

Jobs as well, I think inflation and the effect that that is having on our citizens, as I have already outlined, is massive, but in this place of hope, if I look at the double-digit growth figures that we have seen in agriculture, and I noticed Minister Meyer has just slipped out, but also thank you to that team on what they have achieved. How they have aided and helped this double-digit growth numbers in this environment is unbelievable.

If I think about other sectors in our economy, the tech sector, and I think about the growth and opportunity that comes out, that is in our jobs environment, and I think as the Minister said yesterday, you can see those

signs of growth and the promise of a really good festive season, holiday season, tourism industry coming back. The 192 direct flights this season per week to our airport. If I think about the tech sector and the fin-tech sector and the growth, I think about FinTech, I think about the Stellenbosch fibres companies, I think about – I think about Marlon Parker and building a head office of a global company now in the midst of Mitchells Plain, which really is amazing to see. So those signs of growth and jobs, that is about hope, and that really does give me hope, and of course then as a government, dignity and wellbeing and what does this Department mean to enabling our various departments so that we can deliver dignity and wellbeing to our citizens.

This is where the most money is spent in our Government and within this Department, making sure that we are supporting through DOTP from data, from ICT, Tech, across the board making sure that we are supporting all of our priorities. We will remain under significant pressure going forward and we must take a sober look at our budgetary priorities to ensure that they speak to addressing the harsh realities that many of our people face every single day.

Exacerbating our economic position are the ongoing and worsening energy crisis that I have spoken about, and that is why I have put together what we call an Energy Council, how we bring each and every one of those departments or role players together so we can put more urgency into the system.

I must also say that for me it was really an interesting week this week, where Premier Zamani Saul and I managed to sign our MOU and agreement between the Northern Cape and the Western Cape as part of the Green Hydrogen Conference that took place, but I must give recognition to the Administration, to the Director General in DOTP, the team from the Western Cape Government as administrators, the time that they have spent in Kimberley in the Northern Cape working on this, on this agreement. I must say to the Premier in the Northern Cape, thank you very much to your officials who have spent time with our officials making sure that we are creating an enabling environment so that the two provinces and Namibia can start to work together on this massive challenge that the world has, which are targets for 2030 and 2050; green decarbonising targets that we are setting, making sure that we are focusing now on the grid system, or perhaps taking the agreement that we have just managed to put together between ArcelorMittal, Sasol and the Free Port of Saldanha, enabling an economic future. So, gratitude to the role that DOTP have played and all of our officials, but also to every single one of those officials across our Department, and specifically in Economic Development so they have really spent a lot of time trying to enable this energy security for our future, and the role that that is going to play, which is a long term play, but on enabling the grid system now so that we can actually bring in the new energy players that are being procured or are tendering at the moment.

I want to say that at the same time, this Department DOTP, I had a meeting with the top management yesterday, and it was really great to have that

meeting at the Desmond and Leah Tutu Foundation's building down at the Old Granary here in town, and in the discussion that we had there talking about the decisions that we make, I was thinking about the Arch, and what the Arch would be saying, had he been sitting in our meeting, in our deliberations. At the end of the day, I am confident that the track that we are on in this Department and in this Government, when we are looking inwardly at our own value system and how we behave as a Government, because if you do not get your culture right within your Government, how do you expect to be improving the delivery of your service to your clients; that we base all of our decisions on our values of innovation, caring and competence, accountability, integrity, and responsiveness; that we do this every single day and so that was really, I think, something that had good meaning for our top management team. I also want to say thank you to them for continually receiving a clean audit and that brings me, Madam Deputy Speaker, to the Adjustment Budget.

This is an Adjustment Budget which is a downward budget of R19,998 million. It is around 1% of our total budget R1,8 billion, and it is a downward adjustment, because, as I said in the beginning, we have to make responsible judgment calls on how we spend our money in this Department and as a Government that is in the best interests of our citizens.

I heard yesterday in the political debate on the adjustments, where people are saying we need to actually take every cent that we have and spend it right now. Well, quite frankly, that would be the wrong thing. We have learnt over

the years in this Government, we must always put some money away, we call it for a rainy day in our families or in our households. In this Government, we do exactly the same thing. I have just said or spoken about the loadshedding impact on the citizens of this province in the year to come, what it is going to do to our economy. What we are seeing with the pressure on just the cost of employment and increasing salaries and wages and our inflation rate is going to be continually climbing over the next while. We must prepare for those extra expenses that are coming so that we can be a responsible government delivering services to our citizens going into the future.

You will see in these adjustments that we are putting money into the Safety Plan. We will be transferring money across to departments where we are making sure that this apex priority is delivered and putting money towards the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport and this goes to what I spoke about, the violence-prevention side of the Safety Plan. We have to make sure that we are getting to those young boys and girls in our family, in our communities that are being attracted by gangs that are being pulled out of school time that are truant, and we have to get them back into those systems. We have to bolster our after-schools programmes. We have to make sure that we do that. [Interjection.]

Madam Speaker, does one of the members want to ask me a question?
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kama, hon Kama, stand up if you wanted to raise a point of order, did you?

Mr M KAMA: No, I do not, Madam Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, are you just heckling?

The PREMIER: Oh, he is just heckling.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: He is just heckling, Premier.

The PREMIER: People need to heckle with a bit more clarity, otherwise I cannot answer them. Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. Funds are also being rolled over from the 2021/22 year to enable the citizen-centric culture journey that I have just spoken about, making sure that we are enabling our own staff, you know, they always say you have to start with yourselves, if you really want to go to the next level of service and that is the process that we are busy with.

We are building a modern province, so must keep pace with the demands and expectations that come with it. Funds are being rolled over for ICT related services in the Department of Health to further modernise and improve the healthcare system and there I must say to the Health Department, congratulations on winning the South African Innovation Award for the HECTIS Programme that is now rolled out to 27 of our hospitals that

monitors violence; the only province in South Africa that can do it, and well done to every single one of those officials, those doctors, those scientists and those data people who have given us that ability. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

Yes, absolutely, I think it is valuable to give them that applause and a programme that we developed and used so extensively during the pandemic, and when I say “we”, not only in this province, South Africa. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: South Africa used that system to determine waves and impact of the COVID 19 pandemic. I also want to say that there will be funds to continue with the refresh process, making sure that by the first of April, the new Departments of Public Works and Transport are modernised into the Department of Infrastructure and the Department of Mobility and that we continue to support this space, because obviously, in South Africa, we know that infrastructure is what is letting us down as a country, whether it be energy infrastructure, whether it be rail infrastructure, whether it be ports infrastructure, it is infrastructure and I hasten to say or hesitate to say, water infrastructure. People are going to ask us when the next day zero comes, what have you done between then and now? Where is the Clanwilliam Dam? We really have to start focusing on infrastructure over and above what we do at the moment and pushing boundaries far more than we have ever pushed before.

The same thing with mobility, how do people get to work? We know the poorest of the poor spend 40% of their salary, if they have a job, on transport. That has to change. We have to get mobility right. So, Madam Deputy Speaker, I want to say that, for me this adjustment is a small adjustment. We really work hard at making sure that we manage the funds in this Government responsibly in the best interests of the citizens of this province.

I want to say to the Director General and to the full team in DOTP, thank you for the role that you play and the hours that you put in. I can assure you that officials in this Government go far away and beyond their normal expected time that they put in, in the interests of this Government and of the citizens of this province. It does not go unnoticed, and I want to thank them for that energy for what they do every single day when they come to work, and so this, I want to submit, is an adjustment, that is an adjustment that is responsible and an adjustment that is in the best interests of the citizens of this province. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much hon Premier. I now recognise hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you. Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, Vote 1 and the Adjustment Budget is not just about a set of numbers. The Premier has started off his speech reflecting on the kind of year that we have had and the challenges and we need to note that the Vote is there and the adjustment is there, but actually this adjustment is also a reflection on the leadership or the lack of leadership that has been provided by the Premier to this province. It is interesting that the Premier mentions the issue of loadshedding and the initiatives such as the Energy Council to develop an integrated approach, but I think if we are honest, Deputy Speaker, up to now all that we have seen is the investment of millions of public funds into consultants who have been doing work at a local government level, but if we are honest, those initiatives of this Province have not produced one megawatt of power. So we would like you when you respond, Premier, can you tell us from the money that the Provincial Government has allocated to all these municipalities, and that is what I am talking about specifically, as the Stellenbosch Municipality, how much have they received and how many megawatts have they produced? I think that is what we need, you know, I am not saying that in a sense that we want to dismiss the notion of we need to develop energy resilience, but let us not spin things, let us not create a perception, which is not based on reality.

Then Premier, you also spoke about the issue of the reduction of crime, but what is always strange to me is that when the Premier and also MEC Allen mentioned this issue, they do not tell the House and tell the public about the

deployment of extra SAPS resources to those very areas that they mentioned, because the reality is we can argue about the impact of the LEAP officers and what has been attached and the integrated, holistic approach, but it is just not honest when you do not mention that the South African Police have specifically also allocated additional resources to those. So I think we need to start moving beyond this petty notion of sort of claiming victories but not being honest about the fact that despite the problems in the SAPS there has been a genuine effort, which has resulted in the real deployment of extra resources, and to be honest, the Safety Plan, still this House has not been provided with actually what constitutes a plan. In other words, who is doing what by when. We have who is doing what. We have a list of what the different MECs are supposed to do but there is no information about how much resource is attached to that, where the infrastructure improvement is going, what a tangible Safety Plan and an Operational Plan would involve. I hope that our members, and I am not sure if this House has noticed, that because of our specific interest also in rural safety, Deputy Speaker, we have actually decided to ask member Bans to specifically deal with the Safety portfolio and we have many reasons why we are asking our young lion, hon member Kama, to deal specifically with sport and recreation and the whole area of youth. So that Committee actually needs to engage in an operational plan. I welcome through you, Deputy Speaker, hon, the Premier's reference to Marlon Parker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I welcome that reference because I do think what someone like Marlon Parker has done initiating the R Labs in Athlone and where he has taken that to, is a very important example to raise and I think that the province really needs to celebrate that but at the same time, we would love it if the Premier, in his role as leading this Province, would also be vocal and active about issues that member Nkondlo has been raising around the township economy, in particular the problems which emerged regarding the Pick n Pay investment into the townships. These are the issues that we must look at, what are the successes, what are the failures. But, I think I was disappointed, Deputy Speaker, that in his introductory words here today, the Premier did not go into more detail around the COE issues, not only as they affect the Department of the Premier, but many other departments who have failed to fill posts.

Now, clearly we are not going to utilise those funds for the rest of the financial year, and given the critical importance of public employment to bring relief, I would like the Premier to respond and I asked the same issue through to the MEC for Finance yesterday. Why did the Premier, as the Leader of this Province, not utilise the savings on costs of employment to actually push into public employment schemes, because the reality is that the only public employment schemes that are working in this province are those which are funded and provided by the National Government. EPWP, the CWP, the initiative that the President took to support schools, so we do not see, we see an investment in LEAP officers, but we do not actually see provincial money from the Equitable Share being used to advance public

employment.

We are also happy that there has been an agreement between the Northern Cape and the Western Cape, and when the ANC was governing this particular province, which was up until 2009. [Interjections.] It was a while ago. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No, it was the ANC, Deputy Speaker, actually got 46% of the vote, you would recall, and we worked with the new National Party in a coalition which actually delivered in this Western Cape, we had lower unemployment than we currently have now, which is the truth. So what I am trying to say, in those days we had what we refer to as the Cape Corridor, actually working with the Provincial Governments of both the Eastern Cape as well as the Northern Cape, because we would all recall that this very building where we are standing in used to be the Centre of the old CPA, and there are many, many connections between the people of the Northern Cape, the Western Cape, the Eastern Cape, and, for instance, we are not hearing enough, Premier, when you talk about mobility, what are the strategies to ensure that people of our province would be able to be mobile and to move via train to the Eastern Cape on a Friday and be able to then come back, for instance. We know that there are people coming to our province from Gauteng. They are coming from the Northern Cape and so on, and we should actually welcome that, so we want to ask the Premier to take

seriously what the ANC had started, which was actually to build the Cape Corridor. [Interjections.] Yes, it was a very important initiative.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: 10 seconds, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: What is that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: 10 seconds.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I beg your pardon?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: 10 seconds left.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: But I thought, aren't...
[Laughter]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: [Laughter] No, he did not, he was pointing out. He was pointing out the realities of a decision that was made and not communicated properly. So I will then, so are you actually ruling that my time has expired?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am, because...

†Die ADJUNK HOOFSWEEP (ANC): Ja.

[The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There we go, hon Sayed is correct.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No problem, so my time has expired.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So these are the things that we need to look at, and that is why, in conclusion... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just finish off.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, we cannot support this Vote, because it is not actually utilising those savings made to actually ensure that the Khayelitsha Hospital, for instance, gets money over and above investment into a technology which is not meeting the needs of the people.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: The full speech will be provided. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: [Laughter.] Thank you. I now recognise hon Xego. Are you online?

Mr M XEGO: Yes, Deputy Speaker, I am here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed, sir.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, the EFF welcomes the Adjusted Appropriation to the Department of the Premier and the reduction of more than R19 million. This is the second Premier, who, during the State of the Province Address, promised people in this province that poverty and unemployment will be a thing of the past. Since then, the opposite has become an entrenched status quo. Deputy Speaker, under the Premier's leadership, we are still witnessing a provincial economy that is battling to recover from the effects of COVID-19. The so-called Recovery Plan that was preached about is still a plan, which cannot be fulfilled because the Premier is running a failed Provincial Government, which cannot provide people with meaningful decent jobs that will change their lives and lift them out of the poverty line. Just last week, during the two-day taxi protest, a foreign telecommunications company operating in this town, which is called Capita, made its employees to sleep on the floors of the company just to make sure that it does not lose profits. This is the kind of treatment that is akin to slavery, and of which we expect that the Premier would speak a volume for such kind of treatment of workers in the province that he is

presiding over. This is the kind of entrepreneurs that the DA-led Government attracts when it says its job is to create an enabling environment for job opportunities, as it is not the duty of Government to create jobs. Once you outsource the responsibility of job creation to white monopoly capital, we see such kind of treatment of our people. This Government attracts this kind of entrepreneurs, Premiers who have no regard for employees' wellbeing, and they have no respect for employment rules of this country and, yet, the Premier would stand up and say nothing about such kind of treatment.

Deputy Speaker, contact crime and sexual-related crimes are forever increasing in this province under the Premier's leadership. Our health facilities cannot provide patience... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Xego, your time is up.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Thank you. I now recognise hon member Fry.

Mr T FRY: Hon Deputy Speaker, the budget for the Department of the Premier has been adjusted to R1,085 billion. The mission of the Department is to enable and lead a capable Western Cape Government by institutionalising a culture of innovation and collaboration for improved services for the people of the Western Cape. This budget, although adjusted

downwards from R1,825 billion, seeks to support that mission, especially in advancing the cause of providing access to broadband facilities to the people of the Western Cape, thereby creating opportunities for employment and small business development. Deputy Speaker, the following should be noted: R2,5 million was rolled over from the 2021/22 financial year for enabling a citizen-centric culture. This empowers the Western Cape Government to ensure that all available resources are placed to foster an environment where citizens are at the centre of governance.

Examples of this culture is the first Thursdays' Initiative, where the entire Government is placed at the disposal of the citizens here in Wale Street in order to attend to any issues that they may have. Further developments on this model include taking First Thursdays to the people, which will be shared in due course. It is also important to note that, through the Western Cape Government the Department has done the following:

1. It has provided a highly capable workforce, creating an enabling workplace and developed leadership that has enabled employee engagement and optimal service delivery, primarily through embarking on a culture journey with all employees, including introducing all new staff to the senior management team.
2. It has optimised service delivery in the Western Cape Government through the coordinated implementation of innovative information and communication technologies.

3. It has transformed governance resulting in improved service delivery.
4. It has improved public service perception by promoting and protecting the Western Cape Government brand and coordinating communication messaging to ensure that the vision inspired priorities of the Western Cape Government are communicated effectively to the people of the Western Cape.

Deputy Speaker, the WiFi sites and the Centres for e-Innovation across the province have facilitated internet access to countless citizens of the Western Cape. Expenditure for the first six months of this financial year amounted to R617 million. The adjusted budget for this initiative is R1,2 billion which is a decrease from the main budget of R1,245 billion or 1,1%. R548 million has been allocated towards Connected Government and Infrastructure Services. There were oversight visits to the WiFi Centres, WiFi sites, and the Centre of e-Innovation in Groote Schuur and Observatory. In order to ascertain the functionality of these sites, this Committee gained firsthand experience on how systems operate from a health, education and environmental viewpoint, as well as the capabilities made possible for citizens through public WiFi access. It was also communicated that the State Information Technology Agency (SITA) is implementing a 10-year Broadband Programme on behalf of the Western Cape Government along with its partner, Liquid Intelligent Technologies. Further to this, during a parliamentary oversight visit to the Bitou Municipality, the Committee visited the KwaNokutula and New

Horizons e-Centres, which are part of the Cape Access Programme. These centres offers services such as typing and printing, job and business research information, school and job applications and basic e-skills training. The facilities currently have an average of 60-user sessions per day, and really boasts many success stories of people who have used the centre to study and find work opportunities. The offerings to the community include soft skills, computer training, assistance with research for school projects, setting up email accounts, cyber renewals for security officers and SARS registrations for job seekers.

In a previous media release, I have stated that the partnership between various actors, including the Bitou Municipality, the Expanded Public Works Programme and Youth for Change has made these facilities a ray of hope for the people of KwaNokutula and New Horizons, who have taken advantage of their valuable resources and upskilled themselves. These e-centres continue to demonstrate the Western Cape Government's and the Local Municipality's commitment to educating residents in essential ICT skills so that they may become self-reliant and compete in the employment market. I wish to reiterate that these centres are shining lights in the Bitou area and catalysts for growth and opportunity in their respective communities as they provide access to information and services that stimulate growth and opportunity.

Deputy Speaker, we live in an uncertain time where the prospect of growth sits at an all-time low and nationally leadership in the Executive is at an unprecedented state of flux. The focus of the Western Cape Recovery Plan,

however, is putting the province on track for growth and opportunity. The three pillars of the plan, namely safety, jobs, and dignity and wellbeing, are constantly being worked on to realise the mission of institutionalising a culture of innovation and collaboration for improved services to the people of the Western Cape. As per the latest statistics in the Quarterly Labour Force Survey, published a few days ago, the Western Cape's expanded unemployment figures are 13,6 percentage points lower than the national average, with nearly 85,000 jobs created.

To further gear the Government for growth and job creation, the Departments of Infrastructure and Mobility will be established on 1 April 2023. That being said, we still have a long way to go to ensure that everyone has opportunity to better themselves.

With regard to safety, the introduction of the LEAP Programme in the City of Cape Town has helped realise the goal of halving the murder rate in the next 10 years. The question that must be asked though is why do we need the LEAP programme? The answer is very simple: the constant failings of SAPS in this province. I am sure member Bosman will further elaborate on this in his speech.

At this time, I wish to thank the members of the Committee for the cordial manner in which we conducted our business. I would also like to thank the Procedural Officer, Ms Waseemah Kamish-Achmat for her expert guidance, as well as Dr Malila and his team in the Department.

In closing, hon Deputy Speaker, the Department's efforts in fostering growth by creating access to information and communication must be applauded and I look forward to seeing the Department continue on its current course. The DA supports this Vote. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Fry. I now recognise hon Premier Winde.

The PREMIER: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker, and thank you very much to all of the members of this House that took part in this debate. I will start off with the hon Chairperson, first of all, thank you, Chair, thank you for those words. Thank you for the way in which you Chair the Committee and for the support through this process. It is appreciated and valued. Thank you.

Just to highlight one or two areas that you spoke about, and maybe add to it. I think the Cape Access Centres agreed they offer massive opportunity to people who ordinarily would not be able to have access to look for a job to increase their ability to do research for homework, to run their small businesses and every one of those Cape Access Centres that you visit, you come across unbelievable South Africans who are making use of this rollout. Of course, for me, you want to roll it out faster, quicker, and we also have to be nimble in understanding what the next phase of broadband is going to be like. Is it going to be broadband cables that are laid under the ground or is it going to come from satellites or, and we have to be nimble and there again, I

really want to recognise the USA and the USAID and how they helped this Province in so many various ways, but specifically in the R20 million that they have given us to do that study on enabling and checking what we are doing, and are we getting ready for the next change or leap into the future.

You also mentioned First Thursdays and perhaps there I must also thank, first of all, all of the officials and the Ministers who give up their time on a Thursday, a first Thursday of every month. This is not overtime or anything like this. This is extra that they give to citizens, and still, as far as I know, there is no other Government in the world that does that, and it is unique and it is amazing to be able to engage with citizens, enable them to bring their ideas, enable them to bring their problems, because that shows us that we, in that engagement, are checking on what we are doing. Is it giving the relevant results that our citizens need?

The hon Xego, I am sorry that you did not have that much time, but again, speaking about crime, speaking about strike, strike action, the impact thereof, and of course, I am always the proponent to say why do we not rather sit around the table, have discussions before we end up by blocking the economy, causing further job delays, and then of course, on crime, I think it is evident that safety is something that I am really passionate about, because I know it is so damaging to so many of our citizens.

Then to the hon Dugmore, thank you very much. You raised many, many issues and I am going to see I can give you as much as possible but let us

start with what we want to call is EPWP. Well, you are incorrect, so this Province added another R316 million for 2022 to the money that we do get from National, so you are incorrect. We add extra funding to it.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Which Vote?

The PREMIER: We can give it all to you if you want it, it is across the board. Then, when it comes to Energy. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Premier, if you could just take your seat please, there is a point of order. Hon Sayed, what is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, with respect, the hon Premier cannot say to the hon Dugmore, "I will give it to you." I will give it to him. Thank you. [Interjection.] [Laughter.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Well, it is essential English language now.

An HON MEMBER: Shame!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed, okay. Premier, you may proceed. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: I do not know how that English works but to the hon Leader of the Opposition, I assure you, I will give it to him. I mean, I really do not

get that, but anyway. [Laughter] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members! [Laughter]

The PREMIER: So the hon Leader of the Opposition is incorrect, and we will send him – him – the detail of the programmes across all of our departments. He also spoke about mobility, and it is critical that we get mobility right. I agree with him, because of the absolute failure, specifically, of the backbone of any mobility system anywhere in the world which should be the train system, and where the bulk of citizens live in the City of Cape Town, who should be relying on a cost effective, safe, reliable transport system, the ANC have destroyed that. It is damaged beyond repair, not only in the Western Cape, but across our whole country – across our whole country, and not only people moving, because that is mobility of people, but mobility of goods, mobility of goods and services. Do you know that how they have wrecked the system in trade? The Durban Port should be shipping to the hub of the economy of our country, which is Gauteng, should be shipping in excess of 20 trains a day. We are lucky if three or four work, at the moment, per day.

In actual fact, this Government run by the ANC in South Africa, are putting more energy into creating a border post between South Africa and Mozambique so goods and services can travel by road and truck through to the port in Namibia, I mean, in Mozambique, more than getting our own ports fixed. It is unbelievable. So of course, we need to be focusing on mobility. That is why we are creating a Mobility Department. That is why the Minister

of Mobility needs to have a look at what can we do within the constrained environment of the ANC, what can we do to help the citizens find better mobility, find more efficient or cost effective and safe mobility.

Then when it comes to policing, and the policing numbers, in actual fact, in the policing numbers in the Western Cape, we have less SAPS at 70% of the stations then we had 10 years ago, those glorious days of the ANC National Party Coalition in this province.

Today SAPS and the ANC are delivering to the citizens of this province 70% less manpower, 70%, can you believe it? So in accordance to SAPS themselves the ideal number of SAPS members at station level should be 195 000 members. However, the actual amount is 105 000. Do you know that every time the Minister of Police stands up and he says: “Look, we are giving you another 1000 members.” But he forgets that 1200 retired, resigned, were murdered – all sorts of other, because we are going backwards at a rate of knots under the ANC management, when it comes to policing.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Premier, just take your seat, please. Hon Dugmore, I recognise you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Deputy Speaker, I just would like to ask whether the Premier would accept a question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Premier will accept a question, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Premier, my question is the following, that in the targeted areas where there are so-called crime hotspots, do you concede that additional police resources in the last 12 months have been allocated to some of those targeted areas where crime levels have reduced?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, Premier.

The PREMIER: I will concede that to some areas, some policing officers have been added, because absolutely, that is exactly what we are doing. We are taking provincial resources and adding it to the SAPS numbers in these target areas to make that difference, but I promise you, those numbers, those population ratio numbers are not being corrected. They are not being corrected the way that they should be corrected. The police stations are not being built in those hot spot areas where they should be built.

Do you even know that – I do not know how many times they have made a promise of a police station in Philippi – you know, it was supposed to have started I think three times in the last three years, they should have started construction. I had a one-on-one meeting with the Police Commissioner yesterday, and, I mean, you cannot believe how frustrated he is, but of course, we want to really work with the police. We have to work with the police to find these solutions. Unfortunately, what is happening is the political management of the police is non-existent, and the resourcing from

Pretoria does not resource adequately to deal with the crime levels. So I can say to the hon Dugmore, yes, I concede in some areas a few more police officers may have been deployed, but overall, when you look at the crime hotspot areas, which I am holding up here, and the 30 top police murder hotspots, it is not just in the Western Cape, across South Africa it is the same picture, which shows that at a national level policing and the police management are what is unacceptable. That is why we need devolution of power of policing, decision making, because I promise you, already what we have seen makes a difference.

It is not making any difference anywhere else in any other province in South Africa. Every time they put the crime statistics out, it gets worse. Every single province, murder rate, gender-based violence, violence, just general crime just gets worse, province by province, and statistics do not lie. At the end of the day, there is only one province where we are seeing some change, a start to get to a change. It never gets recognised by this side of the House. [Interjections.] They turn a blind eye to it because they are too afraid to own up to their own massive failure as a National Government, and following on from the policing numbers and what the hon Dugmore was saying, the police report and the report that comes to the Standing Committee deals with all of these queries. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, members!

The PREMIER: With murder in LEAP areas, LEAP operation and deployment

by quarter, it talks about the searches on every single area... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The PREMIER: ... of those hotspot areas where this extra policing is being made. The number of liquor-related actions, the number of hotspot patrols and operations, the firearms and domestic violence visits, the homicides per week, and what the types of homicides are.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It is not about...
[Inaudible.]

The PREMIER: The top homicide precincts year-to-date, the priority areas week 47 and 48, this is just the high-level report, and it goes page after page. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: You do not get anything near this.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Nkondlo. [Interjections.] Hon Nkondlo.
[Interjections.] Hon members, please, thank you. You may proceed, Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, and then so that is policing. So then the honourable member spoke about energy, and of course, just as important

as safety is...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Take your seat, hon Premier, please. Thank you. What is your point of order, hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Is the hon Premier, as he did with the Leader of the Opposition, is he willing to take a question?

The PREMIER: Yes, of course.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, and thank you very much to the hon Premier for accepting to take it. Is the hon Premier in support, given what he has said about the liquor sales and the dangers, does the hon Premier not view it as problematic that the Western Cape Government, and particularly the Department of Education, is permitting the sale of alcohol at our schools, particularly schools in the most vulnerable of communities?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much for that question. I would ask the hon Sayed to bring me every single school that he is talking about that does sell alcohol and the reason why it happened because I guarantee you that those governing bodies in those schools have not given the permission.
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The PREMIER: You cannot ask a question and then not accept the answer, hon member. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: We can disagree with the answer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members!

The PREMIER: Well, both of you ask silly questions and then you...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! Focus on me, Premier, you may proceed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We are leaving the question for written reply. [Interjection.]

The PREMIER: I wait for that question, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, so then when it comes to energy, and of course, aside from crime and what crime does to us citizens, energy is the next biggest crippling activity that takes place in our country, which is again, just as policing, an absolute show of ANC failure. I mean, under the ANC's rule in the last 28 years, you can just about take almost everything that they have to do as a government and

you can tick every single box as a failure. It is just unbelievable, and the impact of energy is now really taking us right down to the bottom of the doldrums when it comes to any chance of jobs and economic growth into the future. So then he asks questions about what the plan has delivered and what we have done so far. So first of all, it is very interesting to note from a report from UCT showing, and you will know that this Government has worked on what we initially called the Energy Game-Changer, because we were only able to operate in the SSEG space, which we did, and in South Africa it is unbelievable to see the effect on SSEG across the board and specifically noting that we are now the sixth biggest economy in the world when it comes to solar inverter and battery markets, as this little country called South Africa, the sixth biggest in the world.

Now, we are busy with the programme, the same programme that he speaks about, so in the City of Cape Town we have over 3000 independent power producers already. What is the result? I do not know if he is listening at the moment, but we have over 3000 independent power producers already, and, of course, those independent power producers are still within the one-megawatt boundaries. That has changed in the last year and the programme that he speaks about is now engaging in how do we make sure that we connect all 3000 of those producers to our grid system, because that has been the problem. How do we connect them to the grid system, and, I must say that in South Africa we have given the wrong message to independent power producers, because they always see the threat of power tax, a threat of extra

charges if they register and let it be known that they are producing their own power or going off the grid. We have always said please remain on the grid and remain a power producer for our system.

The next stage that we have to enter into is where we actually look at how do we get time-of-tariff charges in for energy in our region. Now, these are difficult choices that you need to make with time-of-tariff, but it allows you to pay more during peak times of usage to those providing power.

Then let us get to our municipalities that we are enabling. I do not need to say too much more about Cape Town other than already people who are in the city feel the difference. They have already closed their first round of tenders and they are evaluating them. The second round is almost ready to go out. It is going to go out, it was supposed to go out now in December. They will probably put it out in January. This round is even going beyond the 100 megawatts. They are actually saying agnostic and no limit and they will investigate each and every one of those that come in. So it is not going to say you have to only supply solar or wind, you can supply battery power, you can supply any form of power and it will be evaluated, considering the crisis that we find ourselves in.

Then, of course, George, that municipality is ahead of all of our other municipalities when it comes to wheeling of power, which is quite nice, because it is good to see when municipalities are actually getting ahead of other ones because it starts to put pressure on them, and they start to increase

their speed to market because of the challenges. Stellenbosch, which the honourable member mentioned, is also in the process of almost ready for tender and by the sounds of things, the race is on to see which municipality will be loadshedding free, and they are trying very hard to be that municipality. Then Saldanha Bay, because of what is happening there at the moment with the free port with Sasol and with ArcelorMittal, are also in a position where they are getting lots of interest into bigger power supplies.

Mossel Bay is in the same way, they are in extensive discussions specifically with the current Saldanha gas system, and whether they can be using flaring for energy provision, but there has also been the recognition now that three gigawatts of gas can be made available in that region for the Garden Route. So the energy team already...and that is only the energy team that sits within the economic development portfolio. There is also energy workstreams within our infrastructure team. There is an energy workstream within our environmental team, because, of course, we need to make sure we have EIAs, enabling the environment. So across the board there is a lot of work being done, and I want you to then commend lastly on energy, Green Cape. So Green Cape is an organisation that when I was in the position that Minister Wenger is at the moment, we put some funding aside, and we set up an organisation called Green Cape knowing that in those days already in loadshedding environments, and knowing that the green economy was what is going to be the saviour of our energy system going forward, and I want to commend every single person that operates in the Green Cape environment and how they have grown from those days. They are key in advising now at a

national level in South Africa, and in actual fact, they are also involved in a number of countries, internationally known as Green Cape, and even have offices now set up, funded by the EU and based in Europe. So it is actually really commendable that that team has enabled not only us here in the Western Cape, but is actually playing a role in South Africa, and also playing a role internationally, because that is what we have to be doing to be nimble, and to be ahead of the curve so that we can mitigate this massive risk, beyond just crime, but also energy provision, so that we can have an economy going forward. At loadshedding level six or seven or eight, which is predicted for next year, that really puts our economy under huge stress. But thank you very much to the hon members that have taken part and I know that we have gone into a lot of discussion around the outside areas that DOTP supports, but at the end of the day, this is a Budget Vote for a R19 million reduction of a R1,8 billion budget, which is about good governance and making sure that we are preparing for next year. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Premier. Hon Dugmore, what is your point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. I rise in regard, into a point of order, and I refer you and the House to Rule and I just want to give everyone the insurance that I am dealing with the March 2021 Rules.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Which Rule, hon Dugmore?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: That is 151(1) and also referred, 151(3).

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: So am I understanding you... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So I would like to read...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You can only deliver.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Yes, so I am going to deliver.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Perfect.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: But I am supposed to – you do not want me to read it out?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No-no-no-no, there is no Rule.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So I am just going to deliver and then I am also going to refer you to 151(3) which says that if there is unanimous concurrence then this motion can be dealt with.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So could I deliver to the Secretary?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. You may deliver it to the Secretary and the Secretary may proceed or he may decide what he wants to do with that. Thank you very much, hon Dugmore. That concludes Vote 1.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Secretary, if he is ready, will read the Second Order of the Day.

†Die SEKRETARIS: Debat oor Begrotingspos 8 – Menslike Nedersettings – Wes-Kaapse Aansuiweringsbegrotingswetsontwerp. [W3–2022]

[Debate on Vote 8 – Human Settlements – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3–2022]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Secretary. I now recognise the hon Minister Simmers.

†'n AGBARE LID: Hoor, hoor!

[An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!]

†Die MINISTER VAN MENSLIKE NEDERSETTINGS: Baie dankie.

[The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you.] Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Premier, hon colleagues of the Cabinet, present and online, hon members of the House, both sides of the House, present and online, our honoured guests who are following today's Sitting as well.

Deputy Speaker, we began this year with a budget themed "A Budget with an Opportunity for You." Indeed, in the first half of this year, we made concerted efforts to ensure that we create housing opportunities and to ensure that tangible economic and job opportunities are created at the same time. In the 2020 to 2025 Strategic Planning Forecast, we set key targets and deliverables aligned with creating citizen-centric opportunities.

To date we have delivered 24 477 housing opportunities. It is often said that the proof is in the pudding, and the Department's commitment is demonstrated in the achievement of its targets as I have just highlighted, so, Deputy Speaker, as you can see, we do not only talk about a budget with an opportunity for you, but we live by it, and it is there for all to see through our work for our citizens. That is why we say it is for you.

Today, we are here to discuss the adjustments of our budget as we reach the halfway mark of our financial year for 2022/23, and the halfway mark is usually signalled with a recess and efforts that affords one with an opportunity to review tactics, actions and plans. †En ons was darem 'n bietjie doenig, moet ek sê, vir die helfte van hierdie jaar in daai verband. [And we have been fairly busy, I must say, for half of the year in that regard.]

It is also accompanied with realignment, where deemed necessary to ensure that the overall objective is achieved. It is therefore, at this time that we acknowledge the misinterpretation of the Help Me Buy a Home, or, as it was formerly called, Finance Linked Individual Subsidy Programme (FLISP) Policy and Regulations during the period from 2012 till 2019, which led to erroneous payments in the processing of transactions, but not to beneficiaries, but to financial institutions and I will love the Opposition to get their facts straight in that regard, hon Deputy Speaker, because some would have you believe that it was a misappropriation of funds, which it clearly was not in this case, and upon recognition of this misinterpretation in 2019, I can confirm that the Department has implemented the following corrective measures...

†Want ons vat aksie. Ons weet nie net van 'n probleem en doen niks soos die Oposisie in hierdie Huis nie. [Because we take action. We do not know about a problem and do nothing about it like the Opposition in this House.]

We firstly engage the financial institutions rigorously on the matter. Secondly, we formulated built-in mechanisms to ensure that the beneficiaries are subsidised in accordance with a sliding scale, which is ultimately the crux of this matter. [Interjection.]

Deputy Speaker, at our midway mark we have reviewed our budget and targets while taking into consideration the landscape of our sector. I am therefore pleased to announce that our budget has received an upward adjustment of R63,169 million. This resulted in the budget shifting from

R2,415 billion to R2,478 billion.

As part of the Adjustment Budget R667 000 for planning, fees were allocated to the Vredenburg Urban Revitalisation Project. This project will see the completion of 162 housing opportunities. In further assisting our municipalities with opportunities, my Department has shifted R7,7 million. Swellendam Municipality will receive R5,5 million and Hessequa Municipality will receive R2,2 million for electrical connections to unlock affordable housing opportunities at the Railton and Melkhoutfontein Projects. Through this social infrastructure investment we will yield 350 housing opportunities by the end of our 2022/23 financial year. Both projects will be completed and delivered, hon Deputy Speaker, within a record time of 18 months.

†Ek dink nie die Opposisie in hierdie Huis gaan enige iets daarvan sê nie want hulle kan dit nie eers in 30 maande doen nie. [Tussenwerpsels.] [I don't think the Opposition in this House is going to say anything about it, because they cannot even do it in 30 months.]

An HON MEMBER: We have done this.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In our Adjustment Budget we allocated an additional R15 million for the Deferred Ownership Pilot Project called Mill Park or Cape Agulhas, as I formally informed this august House. This project was launched in June 2022 with seed funding of R10 million in

the 2021/22 financial year. The R15 million in the 2022/23 financial year will provide capital to build deferred ownership houses that will be sold in two years' time, in terms of our Rent-to-Own Agreement with our beneficiaries. To date and since we turned the sod in June 2022, I am pleased to report to this House that, despite the increased interest rate and market price increases, this project has seen the completion of 12 successful transactions and individuals are paying their rent, which is required. Ten of the Help me Buy a Home houses have also been sold, and they have not even been built yet, to be quite honest. It shows the success of this drive.

This, once again, is proof of the effectiveness of our Government's innovative efforts to restore the dignity and pride of our citizens by creating programmes that unlock economic opportunities through our social infrastructure projects, and, as I could see for myself, yesterday, when I handed over the homes in the Blue Rise Village, we do not simply build houses away from work and economic opportunities, which is sadly a narrative so many a times repeated by that side of the House. The Blue Rise Village housing project is in Blue Downs. It is a stone's throw away from the Blackheath Industrial Area and main transport routes along that route as well. So through social infrastructure, we leverage our existing fixed asset base as an offset incentive mechanism for partnering with the private sector to see a hybrid financial partnership that allows each party to co-fund and procure elements of the project directly. We also ensure that our projects are completed within optimal timeframes, incorporates good governance principles, and that all partners achieve their objectives. Once again, the Blue

Rise Village Project is such an example.

Deputy Speaker, in the Blue Rise Village Project, together with the private sector, we were able to unlock 423 Help Me Buy a Home housing opportunities. Yesterday, we handed over the first 10 beneficiaries and what I found quite heart-warming, and the bulk of us here fall under this age category. All the beneficiaries were younger than 39 years old. [Interjections.]

Thanks to this initiative, and I am going to use some examples now, the young couple, Mr and Ms Bonn, would still be out there struggling to get a foot into the home-ownership market, but upon receiving the keys yesterday, and the husband said, I quote him:

“We had many sleepless nights worried about being approved for a bond. However, that was until we learnt about the Affordable Housing programme at the Department and the Help Me Buy a Home option. We would like to encourage our peers out there earning an income to make use of this great opportunity that Government has created for us.”

This is what we mean by looking after the wellbeing of our citizens, as the Bonns went to bed last night, knowing that they are well on their way to providing a secure financial legacy for their children, which they are also planning in their new home.

The same can be said for the upstanding 30-year-old South African Police

Service Constable, Constable Sandile Ngomane, who now also owns a proud home in the same development. We are also integrating people from different backgrounds. Guided by a Medium-Term Strategic Framework (MTSF) and the Western Cape Government's Growth for Job Strategy, the Department, as of September 2022, facilitated 730 job opportunities against an annual target of 1 000 for the year under review. †Ons is goed op pad om ons teiken te bereik. [Tussenwerpsels.] [We are well on our way to achieve our target. [Interjections.]

Statistics South Africa's recent Residential Building Statistics for Quarter 3 indicated that, and I quote them:

“The Western Cape's relatively strong performance in new home building planning and activity is reflective of its economy outperforming in terms of growth, creating new jobs at a faster pace and fuelling stronger demand for housing.”

It is also worth noting that in the last job statistics, the construction sector created 46 000 jobs and is one of the highest job contributors for the quarter in South Africa. It is as a result of such economic activity that 68,7% of the Department's Human Settlements Development Grant (HSDG) was paid to contractors in the designated groups. 14,5% and 6,8% of the HSDG Grant was paid to contractors, which are women or youth presentation respectively, outperforming our said targets again, but during this first half of the financial year under review, we also facilitated training to 180 youth.

Deputy Speaker, so you see, we cannot mention safety and wellbeing as priorities without the inclusion of women and youth in our programmes. I therefore call on all women and youth entrepreneurs following us now virtually, and also job seekers in the built environment to come forward and seize the opportunities afforded to them by this caring Department, by this caring DA-led Provincial Government. [Interjections.]

For the remainder of the MTSF, the Department will continue to contribute towards empowerment opportunities, by awarding contracts to contactors within the targeted groups and by facilitating job opportunities and training for young people in the built environment, but Deputy Speaker it is one thing to build homes. It is one thing to create job opportunities. The people of the Western Cape need to be assured of the security of tenure, something the ANC failed up until 2009 before this DA Government took over.

†Die WAARNEMENDE HOOFSWEEP (DA): Sê vir hulle.

[The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Tell them.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: The Department continues to make strides in eradicating the backlog of historical title deeds, with concerted collaborative efforts between the Department and the State Attorney to resolve that which was deemed difficult cases by an incompetent ANC, I should add. A total delivery of 17 485 title deeds have been transferred to qualifying beneficiaries during this MTSF period, which allowed for the security of tenure through home ownership.

Earlier this year when I delivered the 2022/23 budget speech, we were joined in the gallery by a beneficiary who had received his title deeds in December 2021, and it is a pity the ANC member has left the Chamber, who said “Mr Title Deeds”, and she will see now why I am so passionate about title deeds. [Interjections.]

Mr Kooste from Vredenburg in Saldanha Bay waited 50 years to get this title deed so I was quite sad when I heard, hon Deputy Speaker, that a few months...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.] Order members! Hon Marran, I cannot hear. Over to you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS:...that a few months after he got this life-changing document in his hand, after waiting 50 years, he sadly passed away, but I believe that he passed away a very happy man because he finally owned something in the country of his birth, something which was denied to him by the ANC prior to 2009, because they failed at everything that they did up until 2009. [Interjections.]

But this further confirms the importance of and the reason why I use Mr Kooste as an example, of why this Provincial Department and this Provincial Government need to ensure that we deliver title deeds to beneficiaries such as Mr Kooste, and the only way that we can do that is to empower our

municipalities as our partners in ensuring they get their title deeds and it is on this basis that we have reallocated R11,378 million as a rollover to seven municipalities in respect of the Title Deed Restoration Programme, †want ons wil ons mense se lewens daadwerklik verander deur eienaarskap [because we want to change our people's lives for real through ownership.]

In November my heart once again was touched, when, together with the Langeberg Municipality, and I must say in record time again, we delivered 172 Breaking New Ground (BNG) Unites to the Nkqubela Housing Project, but the good work did not stop there of this Provincial Department and its staff and this Provincial Government. [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: It continued.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Deputy Speaker, we handed over title deeds within 60 days to the same beneficiaries, something the ANC could never do before 2009 and they are still struggling in the other eight provinces, by the way, and I think this House will agree with me and I think this House will agree with me...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: That was R27 million well spent by this Provincial Government to ensure we change all our people's lives. It is a pity we cannot just get Eskom on board for the rest. One of the

beneficiaries, once again it is a pity the member of the Opposition is not in the House, and I hope her colleagues conveys this to her, is Ms Dikasi Luwalala, and this is the oldest beneficiary I have given a house and a title deed to in the last three years. She is 92 years old. She never owned a house. She worked on a farm in the Langeberg area. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: I was still that side.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: And she said and I quote her – it is not my words. [Interjections.]

“It is with the highest gratitude that I stand here today and receive this title deed.” [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: “At some point in my life, I thought this dream will never be realised, and today, here we are. I would like to thank our caring Provincial Government for making this possible.”

And the irony is, Deputy Speaker, her grandchild is an ANC Councillor in the same municipality. [Interjections.] Deputy Speaker, in conclusion... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I would like to end with this quote... [Interjection.]

“We cannot always choose the music life plays for us, but we can choose how we dance to it.”

HON MEMBERS: Hear, hear!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: This Provincial Department and this Provincial Government are choosing the restoration of hope and the dignity of all of our citizens. I think that is the beat we all want to dance to. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister.

†n AGBARE LID: Hoor, hoor! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear! [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, hon Kama. The floor is yours. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Remember the focus is on [Inaudible.]

Mr M KAMA: No, we did say, we did say that...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, members! [Interjections.] Order on my left side. Hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. We did say that...
...[Interjection.]

The PREMIER: Remember to read speech. [Unclear.]

Mr M KAMA: There are people who are thinking that we are running a pub here, hence why we are told about beats, that we must dance to...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No-no, hon Kama, you have the floor now, so you must focus, yes.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, Deputy.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, hon members, incoming Premier Ivan Meyer, outgoing Premier Winde. [Laughter] Leader of the Official Opposition. [Interjections.] [Laughter] The ANC declines to support this Budget Vote.

An HON MEMBER: Declines, ah no! Why? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are supposed to listen!

Mr M KAMA: I think what is important...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order! Order, hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: I think what is important, Deputy Speaker, is that the DA must stop the act.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kama, take your seat for a moment. Hon Bosman, what is your point of order?

Mr G BOSMAN: Speaker, I rise to ask if the hon member is prepared to take a question.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kama?

Mr M KAMA: No, I am not, Chair. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sit down, hon Bosman. You may proceed, hon Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Deputy Speaker, the DA must stop the act. No amount of fundraised statistics will change the realities of this Government that it is

comfortable with the privileges of the rich and white and disparities of the poor and black. While noting that the Department's budget has increased by over R62 million, including rollovers of about R6,5 million, and R56,6 million from other adjustments, the ANC does not believe that this increase will bring a positive change for the people.

Yesterday, comrade Pat Marran, in welcoming the Report of Human Settlements on Dignity Oversight, said:

“If the Department’s performance of housing development will be rated, it would get one out of 10 due to its poor performance and slow pace of housing delivery.”

I concur with comrade Pat’s assessment, this is one of the most – it is one of the worst performing departments in the Province, with a weak MEC that is more preoccupied with DA internal factional politics than delivery of houses. We are called upon to pass a budget that will once more lead to material findings by the Auditor-General as the clueless MEC continues to lead the Department astray. We want the MEC to present his plans to address the consistent serious findings against his Department, which always gets the worst audit findings. Recently a media headline read, and I quote:

“The Western Cape Department of Human Settlements has been rapped over the knuckles for weak controls that led to financial losses of R22 million. This was based on the Auditor-General’s finding that the Department provided housing subsidies to people who were not entitled

to one and overpaid valid applicants, which resulted in a loss of R22 million.”

And in this, Deputy Speaker we were reminded of Cynthia Bless, which even member Marran spoke about here yesterday, whose subsidy was approved in April 2020. She is currently staying with her disabled son in a dilapidated house. Up until now she does not have a house built for her. It will be very remiss of me not to congratulate, however, the MEC, on his promotion to the new Department of Infrastructure. I also have to note that with the kind of legacy as gained in the Department of Human Settlements, we have to be very worried and very worried about the future of infrastructure in the province. With this promotion, it is clear that Premier Alan Winde and the DA reward mediocrity. The Housing Demand Database of nearly 600 000 people worsened under his watch and there seems to be no plan from the Provincial Government to help the rapid increase of this database. The insignificant R63 million increase in the Department's budget will not make any positive change. Instead, it will contribute toward the Department's poor performance.

The Dignity Oversight Report that was alluded to above painted a grim picture of dwindling housing targets that are never achieved. It highlighted the challenge of a messed-up Housing Demand Database across municipalities and all of the above point to the need of an urgent intervention from the MEC. The City's annual delivery targets dwindled from over 17 000 homes and service sites between 2013 and 2020 to a mere 8 000. Like COVID-19, which has been the most used excuse by this Government for

underperformance, the MEC is using extortion as a fig leaf to hide from his poor performance. The MEC must stop being a cry-baby. He must use his powers to act. We want to know how he is responding to this challenge of extortion in the Housing Development Project, and how this budget is providing for it.

The ANC has continuously called for accelerated housing provision for low-income earners especially in the areas with high demand. We continue to make calls for Government to address the legacy of apartheid spatial development by building affordable housing near places of opportunities and we continue to make calls for funding upgrades of informal settlements. None of these have been prioritised in this budget. The proposed budget does not come near addressing the housing challenges in the province. Despite all of the abovementioned challenges only R23,4 million additional budget will go towards Programme 3, which is Housing Development.

However, that is not the main challenge. The Department must strengthen its internal measures and come up with strategies to deal with shoddy workmanship, which has led to the collapse of the Trans Hex Housing Project where the first 44 houses which were supposed to be handed over in December 2020 have not yet been handed over to date, due to structural problems, and the MEC deliberately does not talk about this.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Department received R8,5 million in its own revenue collection. Ordinarily, an increase in own revenue collection for a

Department is a welcome development. However, for this Department, it is a matter of grave concern, while black people live in squalor, being crammed in informal settlements with no basic services, white people continue to live lavishly in Government owned properties across a number of leafy suburbs at a rental fee of only R100 rand per month. This is far less than the market-related value. The Committee and the House need to pay a closer look at this anomaly. It is either people pay market-related values for these properties, or access is given to everyone, not only white people.

It is for those reasons that the ANC declines to support this budget. It is disappointing that funds for goods and services and compensation of employees have been reprioritised for provision for higher than budgeted legal costs, travelling costs and security costs.

Deputy Speaker, the reality is that we have a weak MEC in this Department and we want to warn the MEC that in the DA, like we warn all other members of the DA who are non-white, in the DA if you are not white, you are kept in a position for as long as you are weak. A political heist is being committed in this House. We sleep and wake up with no Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr M KAMA: The institution of this Parliament is being led into chaos by Helen Zille and the white bosses of the DA.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon Kama, your time is up.

Mr M KAMA: The MEC is just clueless and allowing all this chaos to unfold.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Finish off.

Mr M KAMA: Zille decided to fire Mngasela and now we must wait for Zille to decide who is going to be the Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Kama, your time is up. Thank you.

Mr M KAMA: And this MEC is a leader of the DA in this province. He is weak. Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Kama. [Interjections.] Order, members. I now recognise hon Makamba-Botya. I think you are online?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. The MEC has actually listed of number of success stories done by his Department that we do not even see on the ground.

Deputy Speaker, there is a list with personal details of residents from Kanana Informal Settlement, who were promised houses by the very same Department and the Department promised to move these residents to the Forest Village by July 2022.

Deputy Speaker, two weeks back someone knocked on my office door and to hand over a list containing private personal details of these applicants. This individual then told us that he found the list in the trash bin and that upon inquiry he also found that the same people in that list are still without houses. Deputy Speaker, this conduct from the Department is inhuman and infringes almost all the values of our Constitution. Not only did the Department deceive them about getting houses but it also disposed of the personnel information in an undignified manner.

Deputy Speaker, today we have what we call a POPI Act which aims to protect the personal information of people of this country, but for the Department to throw people's personal information in a trash bin and on top of that do not provide them with promised houses, is despicable. Deputy Speaker, it is not only these individuals who are battling to get decent houses from the Department, people of Dunoon and Kosovo were promised houses during the height of COVID-19 pandemic by this very same Department, and to date not much has been done by the Department.

Deputy Speaker, a budget increase of more than R63 million will not assist a Department that is unwilling to provide people with houses.

The political head of this Department must just admit that he has failed and must do an honourable thing and resign, because our people cannot continue to suffer as a result of this poor leadership. I thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much hon member. I now recognise hon August. Are you online?

Mr S AUGUST: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Yesterday the Dignity Oversight Report was accepted in this House. As I mentioned in my declaration remarks, the report alludes to some developments. However, we still have a very, very long way to go to achieve our ideals of giving the people of this province a house they can call a home.

The Western Cape's housing backlog is running into hundreds of thousands of applicants in waiting. This Government simply will not be able to meet these targets, not in this term and certainly not in the possible next one as their policies are centralised on upholding the status quo.

We need robust reforms on addressing spatial injustices. We need robust policy redress that tackles how we view the development of human habitats aligned with decent delivery of services. We need to better understand the ever-changing needs of people from human settlements and how this fuses with the ability of any Government to deliver a decent quality need-fulfilling home. I will repeat this again, where people live, matters; how people live, matters; and how they engage with the environment, matters; how they access public transport, matters, and how they make an income, matters. Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. You may finish your sentence.

Mr S AUGUST: You cannot simply just deliver housing units and assume that answers the need. These exercises end up too closely to bear to the Government ends of taking two steps forward and five steps back. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you so much hon member. I now recognise hon Maseko.

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, Premier, Cabinet members, and hon members of the House. I just want to say I thank the Opposition from ANC and the members of the Standing Committee for supporting Vote 8 of this adjustment. I really appreciate that, and I know why they did that because they acknowledge the work that they have seen as they criss-crossed this province, in seeing what this Department is doing, and I know that member Marran, as we criss-crossed, he learned the way to Trans Hex. He will mention it again and again and I appreciate that that project is close to his heart and he will say Trans Hex until I finish doing my debate, which I appreciate, and another one is, Deputy Speaker, I just want to highlight one thing that member Kama said when he stood up in saying that no, they do not support the adjustment. I understand he is not in the Standing Committee, so he did not get their report maybe from their contribution, 20% contribution from member Lili in attending the Standing Committee, and I want to thank member Marran for

his 80% contribution of attending the Standing Committee for Human Settlements. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

I expected member Marran to be the one who was going to contribute as he has been the voice of the Western Cape communities that voted for ANC, even though he is not a permanent member in the Standing Committee. So member Marran, thank you very much, you were just short-changed for not debating this adjustment.

Deputy Speaker, Minister Mireille Wenger presented to us the Provincial Government's framework of hope last week. The Adjustment Budget is set to further restore dignity to Western Cape residents, highlight the Provincial Government's concern for our most vulnerable communities, prioritise infrastructure development, create jobs and inspire hope.

I rise confidently in support of Vote 8, Human Settlements. The Western Cape Department of Human Settlements has been allocated an additional R63 million in the Adjusted Appropriation Budget. This allocation represents an ongoing process of development and delivery of the people of the Western Cape. This budget aims to provide Human Settlements projects with a range of rental and ownership options that cater to the diverse needs and incomes of households, as well as basic and social economic services. It also aims to continuously improve human settlements through citizen and Government efforts supported by contributions from the private sector. The housing crisis in South Africa is a troubling issue that must be addressed in conjunction

with the country's unemployment and economic challenges. When people lack adequate access to stable employment opportunities, they are more likely to turn to the Government for housing as well. The Western Cape Provincial Government's decision to increase the Human Settlements budget by R63 million exemplifies the type of Government that is honest and knowledgeable about the South African housing backlog crisis that dates back decades.

The total additional appropriation for Programme 3, Housing Development, has seen an increase of over R30 million. R15 million of this was spent in respect of the Deferred Ownership Project in Mill Park. R7,7 million was spent on electrical connections for Breaking New Ground units in Railton and Melkhoutfontein Projects. Over the last year, the Provincial Department of Human Settlements has done more than just build houses. It has built homes and given dignity to thousands of households and communities.

In the last financial year, hon Deputy Speaker, the Provincial Department of Human Settlements played a significant role in job creation as well as in providing skills training opportunities to young people, this despite the country being in the middle of an economic and employment crisis. The Department contributed in enabling the recovery of the Western Cape economy. Many locals in various communities of the Western Cape can attest to the job opportunities they were given as a result of Human Settlements projects. Approximately 68% of the Human Settlement Development Grant in the 2021/22 financial period was spent on Small, Medium and Micro

Enterprises with 14,5% and 6,18% of that amount going to contractors who represent women and youth respectively, and I know member Marran is passionate about this because he supports me as the Chairperson. This amplifies how the Department has followed through on its promise to actively support ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms L M MASEKO: ...support the growth of small businesses in the Western Cape. During Women's Month in August, I joined Minister Simmers at a Women-in-Construction event where the Minister announced the development of an app that will make tender processes and information easier to access. The development of such an app, once again, will highlight the innovation and responsiveness of the Western Cape Government to inputs of the public. Hon Deputy Speaker, despite the Department's tireless efforts to ensure that Western Cape housing beneficiaries receive their homes on time and in good condition, the Department has faced significant difficulties due to the gangs that intimidate and extort contractors by demanding what they refer to as protection money that can reach R200 000 per month, and through you, Deputy Speaker, member Kama needs to understand this.

There have been numerous housing projects in the Western Cape that had to be postponed or prolonged as a result of these brazen criminal incidences. It is not a cry-baby; it is a reality. [Interjection.]

Minister Simmers recently disclosed in a parliamentary question that was shared with all of us that R5 billion in housing projects have been put on hold due to criminal activity and other issues. That is around 40 000 beneficiaries. It is about 47 housing projects. I am not counting one house. It is 47 housing projects that are affected. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take your seat, hon member. Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, would the hon Maseko be as gracious enough as the Premier to take a question, please, particularly on who is getting... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Over to you, hon Maseko. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: To be as gracious. [Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms L M MASEKO: Like the hon member mentioned that the Premier is gracious, I am not gracious. [Laughter] So, hon Deputy Speaker, I am pleased to inform this House...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed, honourable.

Ms L M MASEKO: ...to inform this House that the Human Settlements Standing Committee will convene a meeting with the relevant stakeholders in January 2023 to discuss the best approaches to tackle this issue of extortion in Human Settlements projects. We cannot continue to watch while criminals dominate our society and interrupt crucial service delivery projects. I also want to commend the Provincial Department of Human Settlements for its partnership-based and people-centred approach to the delivery of homes and improving the quality of living conditions of people living in informal settlements across the Western Cape.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it is said that, and now I would also like to take this moment to commend the Western Cape Government and City of Cape Town for their continued commitment to building social houses, but we need to acknowledge that that is just not enough because the more this Government delivers, the more we are creating the demand for the housing. There is a ripple effect that the movement will come to this Government because there are opportunities. People, they do not come to the Western Cape just for the housing. [Interjections.] They come for job opportunities. People, they do not eat houses, they need to have the jobs to take care of their families. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! [Interjections.]

Ms L M MASEKO: Now the Western Cape province has the highest number

of social houses in the country where affordable decent rental accommodations in convenient locations throughout the City are provided. The recent announcement of the historic Salt River Project that will see the development of 216 units of social houses is one of the many projects in Cape Town that brings affordable rental units to the heart of the City. Again, the sad part, where National is involved, you know I would also like just to take this moment to express, and I know my colleagues also they will join me in this one...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

Ms L M MASEKO: You know, the District Six community, for decades the National Department of Agriculture Land Reform and Rural Development has denied the displaced beneficiaries the dignity of moving back to their community. Minister Thoko Didiza continues to close the doors of transparency. We even deployed member Marran to try to talk to his colleague in making sure that he comes and talk to us. Member Marran was there... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Ms L M MASEKO: ...when the communities were here in the public hearing, telling us to try and gather information on their behalf to find out after more than 30 years when are they going to move back? They just want answers. [Interjections.] Member Marran promised with this Committee we will try,

but unfortunately, they are hiding behind the POPI Act, so it is still difficult for member Marran, but member Marran said he will check how we can do that when they go for the Congress, if it can happen.

So in closing, Deputy Speaker, we must be honest and in acknowledging that housing delivery in South Africa will continue to be a challenging task. I therefore commend the Western Cape Government's continued hard work in ensuring that in this province, at least this crisis is mitigated as much as possible and in closing I just want to also thank again, my 80% member Marran for the contributions for this financial year, my 20% member in absentia, or maybe online, and his contribution, when he is available. To the Standing Committee, and also for today, member Kama, for representing the 20% which I have to subtract one, now 19%, you have 1% for the contribution. [Laughter.] The Human Settlements family and Minister for really being there as the members always, they ask for reaction within 30 days. This Standing Committee is the one that always has the deadlines, as we go throughout the municipality, so we appreciate all their assistance you are giving, the dignity you are giving to their communities, and with that, Deputy Speaker, this Standing Committee is the only one who supported the Adjustment Budget Vote unanimously. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon Minister Simmers. Hon members, we have to push through. Hon Minister Simmers, over to you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker, and firstly I welcome all the responses ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... of the different parties. †Ek wil amper hê die Voorsitter van die Komitee moet aanpraat. Nou ja, sy het beperkte tyd. [I almost want the Chairman of the Committee to continue speaking. Well, she has limited time.]

And I will respond to some of the inputs by Mr 20/20, seeing that Mr 80 is not here. Now member Kama, it shows why you are part of the 20/20-gang, so let me just put the facts straight to you so you can become part of the 80/80-group, when you are there.

First and foremost, member Kama, you referred to matters which was highlighted by the AG and I do welcome that, but I am not a †tjankbalie [cry baby]. In Afrikaans there is a saying:

† “As die sweep klap en jy moet die houe kry dan moet jy die houe vat.”

[“If the whip snaps and you have to receive the lashes, then you have to take the lashes.”]

And I am man enough to take the shots and the punches when I get it, but you must also be willing to accept it when you will get it. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: So let me start correcting you on some of the misinformation...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, Minister Simmers, just take your seat for a moment. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, I know the colleagues ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Dugmore, one moment.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC):...on the opposite side of the House are now going to say... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, one minute.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ... that I am being like a stuck record, but I will continue. The hon MEC must speak through you... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Speak to me, I understand.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...and the reason why it is happening all the time is because when I do raise it, they treat it like a joke. [Laughter]
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon Minister, you may proceed, please focus on me.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Okay, through you, Deputy Speaker, to member Kama. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, yes, thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Let me now correct some of the incorrect information contained in your input, so I cannot take you for granted, I cannot blame you because you are part of the 20/20 gang, so I fully understand why you relied on somebody else, possibly through you, Deputy Speaker, writing and giving that speech. †Ek verstaan heeltemal, dis eintlik betreurenswaardig, die insette wat gegee was. [Tussenwerpsels.] [I understand perfectly, it is actually lamentable, the inputs that were given. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, Minister. Can you take your seat? Hon Kama, what is your point of order?

Mr M KAMA: Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape is a province of gangs... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, no, what is your point?

Mr M KAMA: And the MEC says I am part of the... He is saying I am part of the 20/20-gang... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Oh No-no-no, no, hon Kama, do not make assumptions. I heard very clearly, just 20/20 is a perfect word.

Mr M KAMA: Okay.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Nothing associated, hon Kama. [Interjection.] No, hon Kama, I cannot. You cannot. We cannot do that, and that is a blanket definition in the dictionary. [Interjection.] Hon Sayed, do you have a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, the point of order, hon Deputy Speaker, is, we are not having a problem with the word, with the term 20/20, it is when it is accompanied with the word gang.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sure.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): That has serious implications. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sure. I will listen very carefully if the Minister accuses any of you of any... hon member. [Interjections.] Over to you

Minister Simmers, focus on me, please.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker, to come back to the 20/20-component, which the hon member is part of.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Ja, that is better, the component.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): That is better, ja.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Component.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: But he must listen to TKZee, which also had a song called... [Indistinct] that is co-independent, so, your R22 million comment. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

†Die MINISTER VAN MENSLIKE NEDERSETTINGS: Ek is jonk. Ek is nie oud nie, [I am young. I'm not old,] by the way, the R22 million, once again, and, Deputy Speaker through you, there is a tendency of the Opposition to use the newspapers as their main source of information. Once again, the misinformation in terms of the R22 million again has now been – I said when I did my speech, I acknowledged what was the real issue and what the corrective steps are, so I would really encourage the member as part of the

20% to actually read my real reason and not depend on a newspaper article as his main source of intelligence, when it comes to this august House.

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Then, Deputy Speaker, Cynthia Bless, once again the fact there, if I am going to give the facts again because I did respond to the hon Lili on this matter, in writing. It is a pity that the other part of the 20/20-group did not give it to this member through you, Deputy Speaker. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: She did.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Ms Bless has a disabled son. On her application at municipal level, when she applied she indicated that there is a disability. That is correct, but when we started the project, and then you go to the next stage of filling in your required information, the municipality failed to process her application properly because units for persons with disability get additional funding and they are retrofitted so we cannot give them duplex units. We need to give them single-storey units, and the problem is, the third problem is that by the time that we became aware of Ms Bless' situation, all the single units were already handed out and I believe this House will agree with me, I cannot give a duplex unit, which is not fitted for persons with disability, to Ms Bless. [Interjections.] But now we go, the

issue is then exaggerated, it is taken further because you cannot continue building houses in the municipality because Eskom cannot actually give additional capacity, so it is a very awkward situation to resolve. Perhaps if Eskom can ensure there is energy ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...and they can actually give additional capacity to the line, then we can actually build Ms Bless the house, which she rightfully deserves. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In terms of the growing backlog, I am happy that the hon Maseko ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marran, one minute. I cannot hear. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I touched on that, hon Deputy Speaker, because you cannot expect this Provincial Government to address a backlog it inherited, nor can you expect this Provincial Government and this Provincial Department to deal effectively and efficiently when we have for more than a decade asked for additional funding to ensure that we effectively deal with the housing need in this province. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: But you can answer about the project also.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In terms of the Trans Hex Project, which is the 80% contributor's main theme since last year, and I really applaud that, Deputy Speaker. That is a site where new technology was being used to build those units. We had certain responsibilities. The Municipality had certain responsibilities, and there is trial and error when you do test new technologies, Deputy Speaker. So I had to acknowledge that technology seemed okay to use, but the contractor was the wrong contractor for the right technology...[Interjections.] But now, where are we currently and...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Through you, Deputy Speaker...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marran.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS:...to mister, to the hon member with the 80% attendance to the Committee, I am proud to say that where we could not in 2020 hand over those units, and I asked my Department, I do not want to hand over the 44 units – through you, Deputy Speaker, the hon

member talks about; I want to hand over all 190 units, because those people have been waiting for a very long time. I acknowledge that, and I am proud to say that we will be making an announcement... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...through the Municipality, when all 190 units will be handed over, not just the 44 that the hon member, through you, Deputy Speaker, is talking about the whole time. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marran.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Deputy Speaker, once again through you, I find it quite ironic, but actually not that the Opposition party keeps on hammering regarding rental stock owned by this Provincial Government...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: The NHBRC [Inaudible.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: And the problem that we have now, hon Deputy Speaker, is that we have commenced and implemented a rental strategy to ensure that tenants firstly are legal, which means they have a rental agreement with my Department. We have applied a scale basis where we also do open market related pricing for our rental stock, so people paying R100 will not be paying R100, but the irony for me, Deputy Speaker, why is

it always about race for the African National Congress. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Yes, because they have nothing else.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: When some of the members or people who have been renting for many years, living in those units, are people of different colours, not just the one colour the African National Congress keeps on hammering about, and it is time for them to look into the mirror, Deputy Speaker, to start reflecting internally, why they are failing in the Western Cape. Why they are failing, they could not even have a Congress. They had to postpone it again, because they are a failing and dying party in the Western Cape. [Interjections.]

†Hou op fokus op ras, fokus op dinge wat saak maak. [Tussenwerpsels.] [Stop focusing on race, focus on things that matter. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members! Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon Deputy Speaker, in terms of the EFF, once again, I so hope that the EFF actually attends the Standing Committee on Human Settlements. [Interjections.] Then, Deputy Speaker, they would be aware ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...the proportion of people who were earmarked to move to Forest Village, were moved to Forest Village in 2021 already, with names which we, as the Department together with the City of Cape Town, in isiXhosa put up, the names of people who were going to move so the community could tell us are these the right people or the wrong people, and when the movement started the correct people were moved, so if there are any other people now alleging they were supposed to move. †Ek is jammer, die bus het beweeg, die mense het getrek. [I'm sorry, the bus had departed, the people had moved.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Deputy Speaker, I still have my hand up.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: In terms of Dunoon...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, can you take your seat. I see there is a hand up. Hon Makamba-Botya, do you have a point of order?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Deputy Speaker, I just want to know if...
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marran.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: ...if the MEC is able to take a question because now he is watering down the information that I have at my disposal.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister Simmers?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Deputy Speaker, through you, I will not take a question, but the member can send me a question in writing for written response so that the EFF can be empowered with the correct information in black and white.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Over to you, Minister.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: We cannot dismiss information on that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Deputy Speaker through you, the matter of Dunoon, once again, as we are speaking, the bulk infrastructure is being installed, but I need to respect the City of Cape Town and their due processes in terms of approval for the rezoning application, which we did. That took up more than a year of our time in that project, but we are a Provincial Government that respects the rule of law and builds good inter-governmental relations with the relevant sphere of Government, so that is why no unit has been build but the bulk infrastructure or installation has commenced earlier this year.

Deputy Speaker, at this juncture I would love to thank our Standing Committee Chairperson and the members of our Committee for the role that

they played in holding us to account. They are doing it effectively and efficiently, irrespective which party members are part of that Standing Committee. †En ek wil baie dankie sê, [And I want to say thank you,] whether you are part of the 80% or the 20%, you are at least holding me 100% accountable, and I really, really thank you for that, but, I would also, Deputy Speaker... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Deputy Speaker, at this stage I would really like to thank our new Head of Department, Labeeqah Schuurman, who is present in the House today, who commenced on 1 November. She has hit the ground running. She has taken charge of the Department, but also together with her team are ensuring that we are focused on the task that lies ahead of us, which is to deliver and continue delivering to qualifying beneficiaries of the Western Cape their much-needed housing opportunities ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members! Hon Kama.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ...and at the same time, being part of the process of Refresh as we wind up this Department to form part of the new Department of Infrastructure. But also the entire Senior Management Team and all 457 employees of Human Settlements, because to us each one plays a part, no matter your small component within our Department.

Additionally, I also want to thank my Ministry staff, it is not easy to deal with two Departments at the same time, but they have done it, they have ensured I reply to oral questions, to written questions, to this House in time with very few requests for extensions during a very, very difficult year, but also the way that they are embracing Refresh, which prepares for the new Department. But, last but not least, also to the Head of my Ministry, Ms Vuyolwethu Njalo, who is always by my side to play a crucial role, and then to all the members of this House from the Department of Human Settlements, I do wish you all a safe, festive season. Travel safely if you are travelling, and indeed have a blessed, blessed New Year, as 2023 is the year where you will see real DA change happening in the Western Cape at a more accelerated pace. I thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. Hon members, hon Sayed and hon Baartman, if you could just concur with me for a minute. I really want to push the next Vote through. We are supposed to break at one, but we might just be 10 minutes late. We have a very long afternoon programme. Is that okay? I am taking [Inaudible.] It is Friday, prayer day. Okay, thank you very much.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will ask that Mr Stemele to read the next Order of the Day. Sorry, just, that concludes this Vote and I ask Mr Stemele to read the next Order of the Day.

†Mr STEMELE: [Inxoxo ngomthetho oyilwayo wehlekahekiso lwezimali lwesebe lezwelimo Entshona Koloni.

[Mr STEMELE: Debate on the Bill for financial abuse of the Department of Agriculture of the Western Cape.]

Debate on Vote 11 – Agriculture – Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B3 – 2022]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Stemele. I now recognise the hon Minister Meyer.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, and thank you for this opportunity to present before lunch. I want to greet all the members of the Legislature. Hon Deputy Speaker, I arise today to table the Western Cape Department of Agriculture Adjustment Budget 2022. Hon Deputy Speaker, on 30 March this year I tabled the Main Budget of R969,218 million, confirming the Western Cape Department of Agriculture through the budget and the theme under the budget, We Are Pushing Forward. Today, I return to this House to place before you an Adjusted Budget of R992,695 million and to confirm that Agriculture is still on the theme.

Now the details of the Adjustment Budgets and the estimates of expenditure before us, and that is the same figures that I have tabled before the Standing Committee, is R2,428 million towards the appointment of a service provider

to conduct a pre-feasibility study, broadcasting services, the design layout of the printing, publications maintenance and repairs, as well as procurement of furniture, equipment and laptops; R109 million towards the economic impact evaluation of FruitLook. As you know, FruitLook is a digital satellite platform to assist people with effective water resource management, management of the water resources through a digital satellite. Also R2,210 million towards the fly-over expenditure maintenance and the repairs of machinery and the procurement of printers and laptops. I think this House will know that every three years we fly over the whole province to get the right data at different levels, and also in the different spatial contexts in the Western Cape. Also R3,7 million towards the procurement of groceries for students, meals at the College, maintenance and the repairs and the machinery and the procurement of laptops and office equipment. R746 000 are also allocated to the capacitation of the Garden Route's Farms Dialogue to engage with farmers, farmworkers in particular in terms of our social capital investment there.

Other adjustments totalling R11 million, include R1,7 million towards the procurement for diesel for generators due to excessive load shedding and price hikes, R553 000 towards installing and configuring of backup storage systems for the Department; R1,3 million is assigned for the implementation of the Disaster Recovery Plan; R400 000 to ensure service delivery continuation by funding official telephones, and R3 million towards the support for logistics for operating the South African National Accreditation System for our facilities of the Veterinary Laboratory Services.

I think, hon Deputy Speaker, you will know that the Western Cape Government is the host of a very effective Provincial Veterinary Laboratory System, and we are doing testing not only for pharmacies in the Western Cape but for the whole country, and that system is now being upgraded to also maintain our accreditation status.

R3 million towards feed and fodder for the herds and flocks on the Agricultural Research Farm. Hon Deputy Speaker, you will also know that the Western Cape has seven well run efficient, effective research farms and those are the allocations in that regard.

Hon Deputy Speaker, R1 million is also allocated to the procurement of groceries for the Elsenburg College hostel procurement, maintenance and upgrades of the Moodle operating system. Hon Deputy Speaker, you know during COVID-19 the learners were unable to come to the College, so we have created an electronic learning, eLearning platform, called Moodle, so that students can have interactive engagements with the lecturers while they were not able to attend the classes, and so we have made that adjustments there.

So hon Deputy Speaker, I now table the Department of Agriculture 2022 Adjusted Budget of R992,695 million for consideration in this House. I thank you. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Thanks, Deputy Speaker. In this budget, Speaker, from the MEC, not a word about farmworkers – not a single word, and in the Committee meeting that we had at the end, the MEC said he is a MEC that cares for both farmers and farmworkers. That was his words. A budget, Deputy Speaker, of R992 million, only R567 000 budgeted for farmworkers, the Prestige Farmworker Event; not even 0,1% of the total budget, not even 0.1% of that budget. [Interjections.]

Now the MEC says that he cares for workers, but in the DA's 2019 Manifesto and as a national leader of the DA, they propose that farmworkers should only receive a wage that is equal to the Old Age Pension Grant, and at that time R1 800 – a slave wage!

This MEC says that he cares for farmworkers, and many times we have seen when a farmer being assaulted or killed, this MEC will go to the Court and oppose bail. Many farmworkers have been killed over the last couple of years. Not once have you seen this MEC in Court in defence of farmworkers, none. Now, and I have spoken, Chair, to the MEC about the issue of farmworkers...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Chair, on a point of order!

Mr P MARRAN: And about the issue of land... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Apologies, hon member Marran. Please take your seat. There is a point of order.

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Chair, I have a point of order.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Apologies, hon member Marran, please take your seat, there is as a point of order. [Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF MOBILITY: Chair, my point of order, my point of order is hon Marran is speaking to Minister Simmers and can he please speak to you as per the Rules, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marran, face me, it is much easier than being distracted. Hon Marran, just take your seat. We have, there is another point of order. Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, on a point of order also, the hon Mitchell, I noticed, he stood up first before he was recognised. I do not have a problem that he did the point of order, it is in order, but he stood up first, the process behind it.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, hon members, we have to push through till lunch, I recognise the hon Acting Chief Whip.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP: Hon Chair, in terms of Rule 66 subsection (3) regarding Procedure Practices and Operations of this House, when we raise our hands for points of order it is for the virtual platform because in COVID we had to get a virtual platform, but when you rise on a point of order, the word rise means that you must stand up, so when we rise on points of order I would like this House to continue with traditional precedents and practices that you must rise on a point of order. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip. Hon Premier, what is your point of order?

The PREMIER: Thank you very much Deputy Speaker, I rise on a point of order because I think I have served in this House longer than any other member in this House, and it has always been the tradition, as you want to rise on a point of order you stand up, and you stay standing until the Speaker recognises you. [Interjections.] Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Honourable...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, one minute, hon Sayed is speaking. [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Speaker, on this issue.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, firstly, number one...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We do recognise, hon Premier, hon Peter Marais as well as having been in the House for a long time. Member Dugmore actually started in 1994, for information purposes, and so we do take their wisdom. So on the basis of that wisdom of the hon Premier, and then the learning from that wisdom from the hon Acting Chief Whip, can we then indicate, because there was a ruling that we cannot stand up if we are not being recognised? Can we then indicate then that there is an amendment; there is a change now so that we can just stand up if we want to be recognised? Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members. Yes, hon members. I am reluctant to do this now because it is going to become a debate and hon Marran is now in, ja, he is on. You are on the hot seat now because your speech is not being heard so I wonder if I could come back and make a ruling on this. So for the interest of time and lunch, and hon Marran, face me, I am looking at you. Thank you very much.

Mr P MARRAN: Thanks, thanks, Deputy Speaker. This MEC is saying that he

cares so much for farmworkers, and when we spoke about farmworkers and this Prestige Farmworker event and spoke about how we can assist them to acquire land and not only to remain farmworkers, the response was bad, but one of the Prestige Agri Workers have won, and through that an opportunity that she took up in Australasia. So this MEC is fine when we lose expertise and not creating those opportunities for those farmworkers to become farmers, the MEC's response is saying: "I am happy that she left to another country." That is actually what the MEC is saying.

Deputy Speaker, the ANC does not support his Budget Vote, let me start with this, after the tabling of the Adjusted Budget, we sat in our respective Committees, which left us with more unanswered questions ...[Interjection.] ...and for this reason we must reject this budget. [Interjections.] The Adjusted Budget has virements that amounts to R5.5 million, but in this Committee we were presented with a figure ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P MARRAN: ...of R300 000 unaccounted for, and we are not sure where that money goes. [Interjection.] Where is the money trail and evidence? Is this not an evidence-led Government continuously set by the Premier? We need that evidence, and we need it soon. You cannot unspent... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P MARRAN: ...and also have money that goes missing. How are the books balancing? [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order!

Mr P MARRAN: With the compensation of employees diminishing year after year, this is also a concern for the ANC. Various departments have witnessed this ongoing trend, and it is worrisome, yet this Provincial Government seeks outside labour while sourcing services instead of employing citizens of this Province.

Deputy Speaker, this Provincial Government is willing to outsource R2,2 million worth of labour instead of working towards elevating the high unemployment rate that we are currently faced with. The decrease in unemployment that was announced a few days ago for the province does not go unnoticed, but we cannot praise a fish for swimming. You have promised one job for every household a few years back. The Department needs to prioritise filling those vacant posts and stop using money appropriated for the compensation of employees, for other programs and projects. Yes, the DA will try and retaliate by saying what about National Government? This has become an old and boring song and they need to account for the province that they are governing. They are continuously keeping to hide behind National Government while they have enough funds, for example, the provision of safe transportation for farmworkers. This is a programme of the Department of Agriculture. Obviously they are suffering the blame and say, no, it is the

responsibility of Public Works and Transport, and yet in 2019, when a certain farmer was killed in Stellenbosch, this Department could manage to get R5 million and distribute it to the different district municipalities to put up cameras across all major roads within the province, and yet they are saying it is the responsibility of Public Works.

Deputy Speaker, it does not stop, but this does not stop them from funding LEAP officers, even though policing is supposedly a national mandate, and earlier this morning we heard the Premier speak about the devolution of powers; they want more powers, admitting actually that policing is not their responsibility, and in the Budget Speech that we heard from the MEC of Finance, billions of rands budgeted for LEAP officers and try to establish this police force that the Premier promised in his Manifesto.

In reality, this Provincial Government refuses to address the challenges faced by agricultural workers. These workers continue to be transported like animals at the back of trucks and this poses a huge risk of safety. It is a food security crisis / threat, when farmworkers are killed at the back of trucks. These are humans, people with homes, people who are held in high regard in the communities, that are being treated and degraded like this. Another issue that we have with this DA-led Government is the Land Reform issue that has been ongoing since we came into this Administration in 2019. To go back to this Government being able to fund programmes, even though they are a national mandate, the Premier said that he was not going to wait for National Government to fund the R20 million Brandvlei Dam Project, they could find

R20 million and put it in the 2019 budget for the rise of the Loopsloot at the Brandvlei Dam. Now Speaker, which brings me to ask this: why are there projects that they can do, even though it is not their mandate, but also projects that they are adamant on not taking on because they are national mandates. This proves that there is nothing stopping them from carrying on these duties. The land ownership of black farmers in this province has decreased...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up.

Mr P MARRAN: ...and black farmers were forced to sell their land to their previous white land owners... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marran, your time is up.

Mr P MARRAN: ...due to insufficient funds to run farms, that is one of the reasons why this MEC is in denial about ownership in the Western Cape, and when the hon Dugmore proposed the written question... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr P MARRAN: ...the MEC referred him to the Deeds Office.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Speaker, I cannot accept this budget and therefore the ANC declines to support this Budget Vote.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

Mr P MARRAN: I thank you. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now call on hon Xego, I think you are online hon Xego?

Mr M XEGO: Yes, that is correct, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Mr M XEGO: Deputy Speaker, increasing the Department of Agriculture budget by more than R23 million is uncalled for. This is the same Department that is unwilling to transform the agricultural sector of the province by making it more inclusive. Every year, millions of rands are pumped into this Department in order to assist the already rich white farmers who can survive without state assistance. The millions of rands were supposed to have been used by the Department to acquire agricultural land to be able to assist emerging black farmers.

When the booming of the agricultural sector is celebrated in this province, it is the white people who continue to get richer. This leads to the increase in

inequalities that are happening in this province. More than 20 years into Democracy we are still battling with the issue of inequality because those who govern do not want to assist the poor to be financially independent and become equal participants in the formal economy. The successful farming in this province relies on farmworkers who continue to be underpaid and abused at the hands of the white farmers. Farmworkers can stay in farm dwellings for almost the rest of their lives, but when they reach the retirement age, they are kicked out of those farms, and they have nowhere else to go.

Most municipalities in this province do not have budget for the provision of emergency houses. So it is the duty of this Department with the Department of Housing to make sure that elderly people, who are no longer farmworkers, get houses when they reach the retirement age or before that. When it comes to social welfare, farmworkers are mostly neglected because most of them are in remote areas and do not have access to the necessities of life.

This Department must make it its duty to assist these farmworkers. The plight of farmworkers and emerging black farmers must be attended to, but until then the EFF will not support this Vote. Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Xego. I now recognise hon August.

Mr S AUGUST: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. When you look at the first

quarter performance of the agricultural sector, I believe it is safe to say that there is a great potential to contribute much more positively to our provincial economy, and to job creation and income security. In comparison to other sectors we have experienced a large percentage of growth ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please proceed, hon member.

Mr S AUGUST: In comparison to other sectors who has experienced large percentage of growth, the agricultural sector growth rate for the first quarter 2022 was 0,5%, but this menial percentage growth created thousands of jobs. We realise that the sector can contribute a great deal to the national and provincial unemployment crisis. Instead of giving people a fish let us teach them how to fish.

This budget should explore a subsistence farming model that would serve poor destitute communities and create an economy around a sustainability mechanism. Empower young people by creating agricultural internship for those in the further education and training phases with the possibility of a support package to smart-start a small holding start-up. Build and establish buffers to withstand the fast-changing effects climate change has on the sector and the dire effects of the economy.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr S AUGUST: We need to rediscover the importance of agriculture and this

budget needs to provide an enabling environment for that discovery. Thank you, Deputy Speaker. [Time expired.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much for your indulgence. I now recognise hon Marais. Hon Baartman?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. I forwarded an email to yourself, the Secretary, and Mr Poggenpoel. Member Marais, just before he was now recognised, has asked that he does not participate in Vote 11. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much for letting me know. I now recognise hon Van der Westhuizen.

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon members. I am grateful for this opportunity to speak on the Adjustments Budget but let me first just respond to some of what was said here earlier today. Recently, I moved in this House that the House congratulates the category winners of the Annual Prestige Agri Worker Awards that were announced at the Gala Ceremony at Grand West on Saturday, 5 November 2022...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order! Order members!

Mr S N AUGUST: And that is where it stops.

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ... and particularly Mr Nigel Klaasen was announced as the overall winner of 2022. Unfortunately, this motion was opposed by the Leader of the Official Opposition, and therefore today I would like to convey to those category winners and to the overall winner, Mr Nigel Klaasen... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take your seat hon member. Hon Sayed, what is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, if I am looking at the Provincial Constitution, there is no reference to a Leader of an Official Opposition in the Western Cape, I just want to know which leader of which official, there is a leader of an opposition. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is not a point of order, but you can answer, hon Van der Westhuizen. [Interjections.] Order.

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: My apologies, my apologies. The unofficial leader of the Opposition. [Laughter] Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: I therefore want to put on record today that the Democratic Alliance congratulates the category winners, that the

Democratic Alliance also want to congratulate, particularly the overall winner, Mr Nigel Klaasen, and, Deputy, I find it very, very sorry, that the hon Marran, who has on numerous occasions been witness to enjoy the hospitality of the Department of Agriculture... [Applause.] ...including at that function, where he particularly enjoyed the lamb shank, that he unfortunately is opposing any adjustments and any budgets for the Department of Agriculture ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ... and I do hope that in future he will act with his conscience when it comes to these things. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Hon members, we are just prolonging our lunch opportunity.

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Under the Western Cape's Department of Agriculture...[interjection]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Van der Westhuizen, take your seat. Hon Marran, you may rise.

Mr P MARRAN: Speaker, ja. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marran, one minute. Hon members, I cannot

hear a thing and we are just prolonging our lunch break. Over to you.

Mr P MARRAN: Thanks, Deputy Speaker. Speaker is it parliamentary to try and bribe a Member of Parliament with a lamb shank, with a lamb shank?
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is a tough one, hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Is it parliamentary?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja, let us proceed, that is not a point of order. Please proceed, hon Van der Westhuizen. [Interjections.]

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please proceed, hon Van der Westhuizen.

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: May I, thank you, and I do trust that the clock was stopped every time, Deputy?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I hope so. Yes, it was.

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Under this Department, the Western Cape has become the biggest exporter of agricultural products...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ... of all South African provinces, and food security, and I think the hon Marran would be grateful for this, which is understood to be the ability to feed one citizen ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: ... has become a very important topic over the last few decades, a consequence of widespread poverty and unemployment. South Africa, thanks to our farmers is a net producer of food. Internationally, and also domestically, there is a fast-rising demand for food due to growing populations and South Africa unfortunately is not getting bigger. The land available for agricultural purposes is not getting bigger and due to climate change it seems as if our water resources are also not great. On an international rank list of driest countries, South Africa was ranked 39 out of 182 countries by the United Nations Food and Organisational Data. While these rankings must be seen in context, it does illustrate the need in South Africa to manage all arable land and our water resources carefully. Predictions are that South Africa together with our neighbours, Botswana and Namibia will be falling in the highest category of water stress by 2040, that is only 18 years from now. That is if we continue with business as usual, which emphasises the need for land reform, not to kill off productive farms, not to decrease production on these farms, but rather to unlock the full potential of all farmlands using water as sparingly as possible. Unfortunately,

the track record of our National Government in this regard is dismal, and we are not getting the prompt return on our investments in land reform. R12-billion was spent by the National Government since 2006, acquiring farms for land reform purposes under their Proactive Land Acquisition Strategy (PLAS), yet the heartless lack of post settlement support by the National Government for these farmers mean that 75% of land reform farms are not commercially viable. I have seen in Europe, particularly in high density cities and towns, how small pieces of land next to railway lines, next to highways, wherever an open piece of land can be found, are used for small scale family gardens.

I am grateful for the work that this Department has done to encourage and support family, but also community food gardens. While some, also in this House, are sceptical about this initiative, we should never forget the benefits of this programme in a country with some of the highest unemployment figures in the world. Despite our climate, that unlike many other countries and even parts of South Africa require water for irrigation of vegetable gardens, this initiative has made a difference to the lives of many of our citizens. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: It is not only [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members! Hon Marran, hon members, I

cannot hear hon Van der Westhuizen. He is quite far back so please, let us get through this. Over to you.

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: This initiative ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No-no-no, no-no, no, no please, can I not have crossing over of conversation. Over to you hon Van der Westhuizen.

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you, Chair, and I trust that this will be added to my time?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja. [Interjections.] Please proceed.

An HON MEMBER: There is that election. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please proceed.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Chair, please protect me.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ja, please hon members, it is just making our lunch opportunity shorter. Over to you.

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: No lunch for those that oppose farming. Chair, it has not only given these people dignity in being able to produce products for their own families, and often surpluses for others, it has given

them focus. Working with the soil and caring for plants also have psychological benefits. It is therefore with sadness and disbelief that members of this House on a recent oversight visit learnt that even these worthwhile initiatives are prone to theft and vandalism.

We have recently learnt that the Western Cape is by far the province that created the biggest number of new jobs in agriculture over the past 10 years. Where the Western Cape has been able to create an additional 67 000 permanent jobs in agriculture, the next best province was Gauteng with only 10 000 jobs. This, while the National Development Plan actually envisaged that agriculture should grow by a million jobs in the period under discussion. [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order.

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: This achievement by the Western Cape... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members! Hon Nkondlo. Hon Premier.

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Deputy Speaker, do you want me to continue despite? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I would like – Hon Marran, I will have to hold off until we have some opportunity to hear hon Van der Westhuizen. You may

proceed. Hon Marran, please!

Mr AP VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Thank you. This achievement by the Western Cape should be celebrated, particularly when seen against the enormous unemployment levels in our country.

Unfortunately, the ANC's labour policy seems set to kill jobs, rather than create jobs. The National Government has often referred to the term infrastructure-led growth, and yes, we are currently benefiting from infrastructure projects by our predecessors. My question to you today is, will our children one day be proud of us? Will our children be able to celebrate and say these capital projects were built in my parent's name, in my parent's time. These projects arise from the increase in the wall height of the Clanwilliam Dam, to the Buffeljags Dam outside of Swellendam, and the work on the canal feeding the Brandvlei Dam. None of these have started or are being completed on time.

I am sorry to report that the National Government is not even keeping up with the maintenance of existing infrastructure, and it is again this Province that is stepping in to fund what is essentially the mandate of central Government. Various water canals are far beyond their design capacity and lifespan, yet there is no funding for new and bigger canals. We may one day end up with water in an enlarged Clanwilliam Dam, should that project eventually come to fruition, but then lack the infrastructure to bring the water in adequate quantities to land reform projects, with enormous job

creation potential and the ability to produce food, such as Ebenhaeser. The Western Cape also has the oldest and best performing Agricultural Training Institute at Elsenburg.

Unfortunately, many of the comparable Agricultural Colleges in other provinces have fallen into disrepair and have become an embarrassment to those provinces, an embarrassment which they would gladly hand over to anyone willing to accept a failed training institution. Can you imagine an Agricultural College where students should be trained to care for livestock but where animals are dying of thirst and hunger? So, despite the National Minister of Agriculture, Rural Development and Land Reform, not even being able to deal with what is primarily the responsibility of the Central Government, she is planning to take over Provincial Agricultural Colleges.

In our view, the training needs in the various provinces, showed different needs. Viticulture, for example, is mostly concentrated in the Western Cape, and Elsenburg has been producing some of the best trained winemakers internationally, winemakers with skills that are now being demanded worldwide. It is therefore clear that these Colleges are best run by the various provinces where the provinces still function.

Now turning to the adjustments in the budget, this Department would be receiving a well deserved additional R23,477 million. This amounts to 2,4% of the original budget. Almost all programmes see a slight increase in the

budget, which allows them to continue with their good work. The sources of additional funding can be traced to rollovers as well as provincial and retained revenue funding.

Extension and advisory services would be able to continue and even expand their world-class scientific support and advice to farmers, helping to ensure the success and the growth of these farmers, particularly emerging farmers. This support is vital to them, and they cannot be expected to be immediate experts in their fields after being handed a title deed or lease agreement, but the National Minister recently admitted that the almost 1 700 beneficiaries of the PLAS programme, in which farmers are forced to only lease this land back from the Government, should be replaced. We have argued that this should be replaced by full ownership of these farms. This will allow them to have access to the credit that is such an important factor due to the seasonal nature of farming.

There has been a R5,5 million additional allocation to the Veterinary Diagnostic Services budget. This shows that the danger of animal diseases that has been seen this year with foot and mouth, and other diseases, is being taken seriously by this Western Cape Department. The foot and mouth disease, with Onderstepoort not being able to produce vaccines anymore, has wreaked havoc under livestock farmers and we can be grateful for the work of this Department that has kept foot-and-mouth disease away from the Western Cape.

The importance of modern technology and advanced information systems in agriculture has grown tremendously over the last few years. The face of agriculture, that for many centuries was seen as a simple slow-moving environment, has changed completely.

I therefore welcome the additional R2 million allocation to the Research Infrastructure Support Services Budget. This programme helps to ensure that the Western Cape is able to keep pace with the evolving nature of agricultural technology with the facilities needed to ensure we can conduct vital research.

Knowledge gained must be shared, and I therefore also welcome the R4,7 million additional allocation to Programme 7, Agricultural Education and Training. As stated earlier, one of the shining lights of Agricultural Higher Education, not only in South Africa, but also the continent. Furthermore, there is an increased allocation of R1,6 million to the Agricultural Skills Development Subprogrammes Budget, ensuring our workforce stay up to date with the latest techniques, and this province is the only one with a Farmworker Development Program. We really care for our farmworkers. [Interjection.]

I therefore I have no hesitation in asking this House to support the adjustments to the budget of the Department of Agriculture. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Van der Westhuizen. I now recognise Minister Meyer. [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: Hear, hear!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, I will be brief. We are the only province in South Africa that has an Agri Worker Competition. We are the only province where 1 000 Agri Workers took part in the competition. We are the only province in South Africa that have allocated R10,9 million for Agri Workers. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order members!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: We are the only province that allocates money and a programme for worker engagement. We are the only Government in South Africa where the funding for Brandvlei was motivated from the perspective of water for rural development, which is the mandate of this Government, and also, hon Deputy Speaker, land reform is a national mandate, but we are not abandoning it, we work with organisations like Partners in Agri Land Solutions (PALS). Hon Deputy Speaker, I want to thank the Chairperson of the Committee for an outstanding debate and outstanding contribution throughout the year, also in his capacity there, and I want to thank all the members of the Committee and my staff, Dr Sebopetsa, Dr Ilse Trautmann, as well as Darryl Jacobs and the Senior Management, the only functional Agricultural Department in South Africa.

An HON MEMBER: Yes.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Hon Deputy Speaker, to conclude...

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order members!

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: To conclude, hon Deputy Speaker, I was now informed that the ANC is planning to bring on Monday a nomination to the House to nominate a Speaker, as the ANC's candidate. I have now been informed that the candidate for Speaker for the ANC on Monday will be President Ramaphosa. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members! Hon members, if I can just have your indulgence, a few seconds please. Hon Sayed? Okay, hon members. [Interjections.] Hon members, can I have your attention please? [Interjections.] Hon Marran. [Interjections.] Hon Marran. [Interjections.]

Hon members, before we suspend the House, hon Marran, have a seat. Before we suspend the House, that concludes the Vote on Agriculture.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We will suspend the House until 2 o'clock where

we will proceed then with Environmental Affairs. That is Vote 9. Members, we have a very full afternoon program, so please enjoy your lunch and the break. The House is suspended till 2 p.m.

[Business of the House was suspended and resumed at 14:00.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon members. You may be seated. If I can ask hon Dugmore to come to the House. If the hon members can just bear with me. Hon members, just before we start the debate on Vote 9, if you can just bear, have an indulgence with me. I am just waiting for the hon Dugmore to get back into the House, thank you. It technically has started. I am just giving hon Dugmore just a quick minute just to get back into the House. He is on his way. If you could just bear with me. Apologies, he should have been given notice and I think there [Interjections.] thank you. Hon Sayed, you will give me a second. Hon Sayed? You will deal with it?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, you may be seated. Thank you. Hon members, thank you for your indulgence. I would like to deal with the Notice of Motion by the hon Dugmore, Leader of the – I will not say Official Opposition – Leader of the Opposition. So, order.

I have received confirmation from the Secretary that the hon Leader of the

Official Opposition has submitted a Notice of Motion in terms of Rule 151(1) of the Standing Rules at 11:35 this morning. [Audio distorted.] Can I ask the hon members online to put off their devices so that we do not have an echo. In terms of the Rules, the Notices of Motion must be placed on the Order Paper for Monday, 5 December 2022. It is a bit unprecedented to have you, hon Sayed, to rise in terms of this motion because it is not in your name. Can I assume that hon Dugmore is online? We cannot move. ...[Interjection.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): We cannot move.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Baartman. Hon Sayed, what I will do is we will proceed with the next Order of the Day, and I will then deliver my ruling or deliver a further notice on this motion afterwards. If you could ensure that hon Dugmore be then ... Hon Baartman? Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you. Thank you so much for your indulgence. The hon Dugmore had an emergency that he was running late from, in terms of his car. If I could then suggest that we move it. He is on his way to the House. If I could suggest that we get to it when he is here, so we start with the Budget Vote now and then, thank you ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is absolutely fine. Hon Baartman?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you so much. I

note the information that hon member Dugmore has moved a Notice of Motion in terms then of Rule 151, but I also do note that the person who moved the motion, if they wished for us to deal with it in this Sitting today, that they must rise on that particular matter ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Correct.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): And since hon member Dugmore is not here, I do not believe the Rules allow for that. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: They do not, but in the interest of collegiality, I will give it – I will deliver the motion at the end of the Environmental Affairs Vote 9. And please ensure that hon Dugmore is then in the House for that reason so that there is no further opportunity for an objection, which is rightly so, by any of the hon members or the Acting Chief Whip.

Hon Maseko, okay. Hon Maseko, would you be so kind as to be part of the Presiding Officer's chair and take my place. Thank you very much. Thank you, hon Sayed. I am going to open then while the hon member makes her way through. We will now begin with the debate on Vote 9. I will ask the Secretary to read the Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning – *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 3-2022]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Secretary, I recognise hon Minister Bredell.

[Ms L M Maseko takes the Chair.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Premier, hon members of the Executive, hon members of the House. Climate change and the world's inability to respond appropriately to it, was identified as the number one risk to humanity for the next decade and beyond, by Global Risk Report 2022.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, we are already experiencing climate change in South Africa and especially, in the Western Cape. Our weather patterns are changing. It is getting hotter. We are experiencing more intense droughts and floods. Compounding these challenges is a migration to the Western Cape by more than 100 000 people per year. This population growth is challenging the ability of our cities and towns to provide basic services, which is adding more pressure on our environment. Hon Temporary Chairperson, water security, sewerage, waste, and air pollution are all aspects of modern civilisation. We need to address these and many other environmental and planning issues if we are to keep the planet in a healthy state for future generations.

The Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning knows

these challenges first hand. Good work has been done during the past year. Our Berg River Improvement Plan project contributes directly to the Berg River estuary receiving Ramsar status this year as a wetland of international importance. Together with CapeNature, the Department has already cleared 55 300 hectares of alien vegetation. In 2021/2022, a total of 4 975 hectares of CapeNature's land was cleared of aliens. This is an important work as it will increase the future resilience for climate change.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the Western Cape Biodiversity Act was signed into law earlier in November 2021 and will come into effect in a phased manner. Certain Sections of the Western Cape Biodiversity Act have come into effect on 15 November 2022. This is an important step towards having a modern environmental management framework that is in step with current realities in the Western Cape, South Africa and globally.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, in the context of the 16 Days of Activism against Gender-Based Violence, I want to congratulate the Waste Directorate for its Gift Dignity Project that is supporting female waste entrepreneurs with hygiene products to recognise the important role they play in the waste economy. Our inclusionary Housing Policy Framework was published in November. This will greatly assist local governments and commercial developments in shaping our towns and cities for the future. We want to enable people to live closer to their places of work, education, and cultural activities.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the Appropriation Bill for the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning, sees the original 2022 Budget of R568 586 000 being adjusted to R575 592 000. The adjustments reflect R2,7 million for salary increases, R2,312 million for rollover projects, R2,214 million for environmental retention projects or revenue retention projects, a saving of R220 000 due to the realignment of projects to the next financial year. Hon Temporary Chairperson, this adds up to adjustments of R7 006 000. This Adjustment Budget reflects a Department that is under severe financial pressure, but still manages to produce and to deliver on its mandate.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, I want to remind this House of my opening statement: climate change is the number one global risk facing humanity. The Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning is working at the coalface of this crisis. Let us support them with this important work. And I want to close by thanking the HOD, Gerhard Gerber and the whole team, for long hours and the commitment to this Province. I thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise hon member Marran.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Thanks. Thanks, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, I rise on behalf of the African National Congress to decline support for this Budget Vote. Before we provide reasons for the

rejection of this Budget Vote, we wish to commend the Department in the decrease in expenditure in Programme 1, especially in cutting foreign travel. We also note the increase in compensation of employment, though we will come to the concern of the slower than planned filling of posts in a moment.

The increase in Programme 3 which is compliance, enforcement and especially, litigation, must also be noted though the ANC believes that these funds of R3 million could have been used to establish the Office of the Environmental Commissioner. And it is on that basis, hon Temporary Chairperson, that the ANC cannot support this budget. We cannot support this budget of the Department that does not support the call to uphold, defend and respect the Provincial Constitution, which calls for the establishment of the Environmental Commissioner's Office.

The ANC has raised this serious concern before, but it would seem that the leadership of the Department of the Premier is not listening. Even the hon Van der Westhuizen pointed out that the filling of posts in the Department remains an issue on the agenda. Every year, the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning complains about the sluggish pace in which critical positions in the Department are filled because of understaffing and staff exits in the Department of the Premier.

Over R2 million will be shifted from funds initially budgeted for compensation of employees because according to the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning, the Corporate Services

Centre in the Department of the Premier is slow to appoint. As we have heard from the hon Dugmore earlier, there are certainly serious staffing issues in the Department of the Premier and we see this impacting on other departments in the Provincial Government. This Department being an example.

The ANC must also raise serious concerns about the decrease in Sustainable Water Programme projects because of nonresponsive and noncompliant bid processes. In Programme 6, there was also a comparative spending which was lower, due to less cost on the Water [Inaudible.] Project as a result of noncomplying bids received. The Sustainable Water Programme and the Waste Entrepreneur's Project, Harare, are important projects, but they seem to be challenged with either nonresponsive or noncompliant bids. Bidding processes are difficult processes for disadvantaged communities and no indication is given as to what the Department is doing to ensure that no one is left behind out of these bidding processes, especially given that both these programmes will be receiving increases in the Adjustment Budget.

The ANC must also raise its concern and objection to the decrease and shifting of funds from Climate Change Management. As we have heard from the hon MEC of Agriculture himself, climate change remains one of the generation's biggest challenges. Even now, when the hon MEC basically has to address us in terms of his budget, he also agrees that climate change is the number one global risk and yet, we have moved R301 000 meant for climate change to other programmes.

While we understand there is no climate change law, funds were budgeted for this sub-programme and should have been spent on this critical area. Again, the absence of a climate change law and the easy shifting of funds from Climate Change Management, lends to the ageless argument for a call to appoint an Environmental Commissioner. Adequate appropriation should have been made for the statutory obligations in the main Appropriation. It is devastating the Climate Change Management has to suffer now because of lack of adequate budgeting.

On this note of climate change which this Provincial Government seems to pay lip service to, because they literally do not put their money where their mouth is, I wish to quote President Cyril Ramaphosa at the recent COP 27 Health in Egypt when he said, and I quote:

“For the sake of our continent and the world, we need a dramatic increase in global mitigation ambition to keep the world on the 1.5-degree pathway. Like other vulnerable regions, Africa needs to build adaptive capacity, foster resilience and address loss and damage, as we all agreed at Paris COP 21. To achieve this, our continent will need a predictable, appropriate and at-scale funding stream and technological support.”

Hon Temporary Chairperson, funding for Climate Change Management cannot be depended on, whether it is a statutory obligation or not. All of us must do

our bit to take climate change seriously and we will expect the Department constitutionally endowed within Environmental Affairs and Development Planning in the Province, to take the lead to taking it seriously. As President Ramaphosa pointed out, we need predictable, appropriate, and at-scale funding streams and technological support to achieve the 1.5-degree pathway.

Again, hon Temporary Chairperson, I rise on behalf of the African National Congress to decline support for this Budget Vote. I thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, a mere increase of just more than R7 million into this Department is not enough. This is the Department that should make sure that we have a sustainable resilient quality and inclusive living environment. Hon Temporary Chairperson, most people in townships experience sewerage spills almost on a daily basis because of poor infrastructure and are made to remain in such conditions for days, if not weeks. Most municipalities in the province are still battling with old infrastructure which is not helpful to the people of this province, especially in the townships and rural areas.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, collection of waste is still a problem in townships and remains a health hazard for people of this province. The DA-

led Government does not take poor people of this province seriously. This situation is quite the opposite when it comes to the CBD and leafy suburbs as that is where one experiences good and sustainable infrastructure, and not the substandard infrastructure found in the townships. The reality, hon Temporary Chairperson, is that the bulk of the budget of this province is mostly spent in rich areas where white people reside. The issue of spatial planning and development is only documented in Government documents, and it is never implemented or even fulfilled. I thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon August.

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Our country and more specifically, our province, our economy and growth potential is challenged due to climate change. Our environment is changing. Landscapes are changing and habitats are changing. All these changes will impact and influence how residents of this province engage with their surroundings, development, and growth.

With all this in mind, a conversation around climate change and our changing environment is not being had at an accelerated rate. Most communities do not understand this all-important topic as some of its words do not even exist in their mother tongue. This Department and the responsibility that they carry, are not doing enough to ensure that our province is prepared for the

dangers that are ahead and how it will impact our daily lives. The adjusted resources and budgets of this Department should be devoted to accelerating our preparedness to withstand the effects of climate change and invest heavily in environmental instruments to assist various communities with their changing environments. Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson, I rise to address the House on the proposed adjustments in the Budget Vote 9, the budget for the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning. The Standing Committee studied the adjustments and by majority vote, decided to recommend to the House that the adjustments be supported.

I want to put on record, and I am glad to hear from the other parties as well, that we are unanimous in our verdict that this Department has been suffering from a lack of budget for a number of years now. What is more, this budget has not kept up with inflation, nor with the growth in our population and particularly, the growth in the recognition of the important role that the environment and the fast-growing pressures being put on the environment. Many of these are caused by our lifestyles: driving and flying with fossil fuel driven engines, heating and cooling of homes and offices, et cetera.

I am also glad to see that all hon members in this Parliament seem to agree

that climate change is real. The causes and the effects have been studied, yet we should be paying even more attention to this challenge. The icecaps are melting, it is getting hotter and drier than ever before, and some studies indicate the tipping point beyond which the earth will continue to heat up regardless of what us humans do. This will be reached in a matter of years, not centuries, and attention is not all that climate change needs. It needs money to implement measures to address this threat, not only for our future, but more so, for the future of our children.

This Department has developed a strong climate change strategy through the Vision 2050 strategy that is supported by the more detail orientated implementation plan and the 2050 carbon emissions mitigation pathway, both in development during 2022/2023. This shows that climate change and the effects on this province are being taken seriously. As a Provincial Government, we can however, only do so much, particularly in the absence of a coordinated and committed effort from National Government.

I expected the ANC's whining regarding the Environmental Commissioner and as with any other ANC-run province or has any other ANC-run province appointed an Environmental Commissioner? [Interjections.] When will the ANC put action to words? When will the ANC start to live according to the principles that they are so quick to proclaim, but then clearly, principled ANC members are hard to find, hon Temporary Chairperson. [Interjections.] Their actions show that they are rotten from the top right down to local level.

I invite the hon Marran to exchange his continuous moaning for a constructive input. What exactly would the hon Marran like such a Commissioner to do? I invite him to start drafting a job description for an Environmental Commissioner so that we can see whether the millions that an office for a Commissioner will cost, will bring a higher yield than the numerous positions of departmental officials that we will have to cut to provide for these millions.

I invite the hon Marran to indicate which departmental programmes should be cut. Must we scale down on our uphill battle against alien vegetation in our water catchment areas? Do we need to cut back on firefighting in our nature reserves? Must we cut back on the limited number of Law Enforcement officers and their desperate fight against poaching, in trying to protect our natural resources? Please, honourable, through you, hon Temporary Chairperson, honourable must step up and indicate from which programme the money for such a Commissioner must be found. [Interjections.] Unfortunately, probably from the bank in Phala Phala. Unfortunately ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member!

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): ...provinces are not receiving the share of national income that we deserve ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member!

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): It is highly frustrating to see the serious shortages and needs in the province ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, can you please sit down. Hon member Marran, you cannot talk directly. If it is a point of order, you have to rise on a point of order, but you cannot request that I respond when you did not put any point of order. [Interjections.] And hon Marran, like I said yesterday, still the same principle: you can heckle, but do not drown the speaker. Just keep it that way. Over to you, hon member.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson, and he must now stop moaning about being fried. [Interjections.]

Unfortunately, provinces are not receiving the share of national income that we deserve. It is highly frustrating to see the serious shortages and needs in this province and then also, to witness how monies from that same precious pool of taxes are being squandered at national level. The net effect of the adjustments is an increase of just over R7 million in the total budget, bringing that to R575 582 000. This represents a small increase of 1,23% on the Main Budget. The adjustments are therefore small and limited to only a few line items. R2,7 million of the increase is due to the 3% salary increases for public service staff as instructed by National Treasury, R2,3 million is for approved rollovers for multi-year programmes and the balance of

R2,2 million is mostly for approved revenue retention.

We also see an increase in funding for compliance and enforcement which deals with monitoring licencing and complaints relating to environmental protection. This strengthens the capacity of the Department to hold transgressors to account and ensure that the environment is not an afterthought for business and developments. If we are to make any progress in protecting the environment, it is of the utmost importance that every factory that leaks runoff into a river or releases harmful gases into the air or even sly contractors dumping their rubble in the veld, must be held to account.

The slight increase in allocation for Programme 2 also points to the prioritisation of spatial planning and a focus on integrated development planning between the different levels of Government. I am worried that more and more self-respecting companies are no longer willing to bid for the procurement needs of the public sector. This is due to the ANC's multiple agendas for a company public sector procurement. This Department has also suffered from non-responsive and non-compliant bid responses.

Salaries and subsidies increased with R357 000 as provision for unpaid leave credits for officials who left the employ of the Department. Other increases were caused by the higher-than-expected increases in fuel costs, which just shows why it is so important to bring an end to the war that Russia has launched against the people of the Ukraine, a war that the ANC implicitly

supports through its cowardly inability to take a strong moral stance.

This Department, similarly to other departments, also experienced delays in the procurement of computer equipment, partly due to the nonavailability of certain parts caused by the COVID-19 pandemic. Money will also be directed to equipment related to water quality. Air quality and water quality are highly important issues when it comes to our health and wellbeing, and we need to genuinely protect these resources in the Western Cape. This Department is doing exceptional work with a limited budget. This is something that my colleagues across the aisle will find strange as national departments often seem to have too much money, money that just as often disappears into the pockets of criminals.

In light of all of the above, I call on hon members to support the Adjustment Budget for Vote 9 so the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning can continue to serve as an example to the rest of South Africa. I thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: *Ja!* [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon Minister Bredell [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, to the hon Marran through you, I am very glad that the ANC does not support this Adjustment Budget because if they will support it, I would have been very worried. So, *ja*, I have expected it.

On his comment on water. The threat to water is ANC Government. We are keeping the water sources running. Just the other day, the Department of Water and Sanitation put out a press release to tell the public that there are no worries about the water, our dams are fine and sending out a very dangerous message. [Interjections.] So, you can expect that from an ANC government.

To the hon Makamba-Botya, infrastructure is a headache and therefore, the hon Premier has recognised that headache and therefore, started a department to focus on infrastructure. It has got nothing to do with race or colour or language or anything [Interjections.]. It has got very much to do with about 100 000-plus people running away from ANC governments in other provinces and coming to us and we welcome them. But obviously, that puts huge strain on our infrastructure [Interjections.], hon Temporary Chairperson, and therefore, we need to get our plans and our house in order. All our municipalities recognise this and put in a huge effort to try and get ahead of this curve.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, to the hon August. I thank you. Growth, all

these challenges, we deal with it, and you are correct that in our communities to land the message, it is very difficult. As they say, hon August, there is a Chinese saying that:

† “In ryk areas, ryk mense het baie om oor bekommerd te wees. Arm mense is bekommerd oor hulle volgende maaltyd.”

[“In rich areas, rich people have a lot to worry about. Poor people worry about their next meal.”]

And it is difficult to sell to poor people the message of climate change because their worry is about getting food on the table for their children. So, it is a challenge, and we work with our communities.

To the hon Chair of the Committee, Andricus, thank you very much hon member for your leadership, for keeping us on our toes, for asking the hard and difficult questions and also for the leadership within the Committee. I want to thank you and with that, we can table the Adjustment Budget. Thank you. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: That concludes – hon members, that concludes the debate on this Vote. [Interjections.]

[Debate concluded.]

[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members. Thank you very much for your indulgence. Welcome back, hon Dugmore. Thank you for making the time to get back. Hon members, I would like to deal with the motion on hand that was submitted today, so I am going to repeat for the record.

I have received confirmation from the Secretary that the hon Leader of the Opposition has submitted a Notice of Motion in terms of Rule 151(1) of the Standing Rules at 11:35 this morning. In terms of the Rules, the Notice of Motion must be placed on the Order Paper for Monday, 5 December 2022. Hon Dugmore, are you going to rise on the point of 151? Not yet?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright. So, you have submitted your motion. Are you rising in terms today? Will you rise or do you want to first respond and then, I can proceed?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Apologies. I was timing to hear for the Local Government Vote ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sure.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...to fetch a vehicle in

Athlone. But as I understand your ruling, you have then agreed that this motion will be placed on the Order Paper for Monday, but my understanding is that there is no reason that the House cannot deal with it now and ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Fair enough.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...and that is what I want to ask. Because if there is unanimous support and I do believe that if the content of the motion was read out to the Legislature, there would be unanimous support because it is simply a constitutional matter and asking for the election of the Speaker to be convened by a designated Judge. So, I would like to ask why we cannot deal with that motion now, thanks.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, I will. I will respond. Hon Baartman?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I rise on Rule 151(3). If the House was asked to deal with the motion, then the House can object or not object, but the House today does not ...[Audio distorted.] to do any Notices of Motions for today. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: *Ja*, just give me a second. So, hon Dugmore, there is a process involved here. You need to cite the Rule in terms of for that request. You may rise.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you very much for that ruling and I believe that if the House does have the opportunity to debate the motion on Monday – it is Friday today. The main purpose behind this is to deal with a situation where the House does not have a Speaker. So, if we can deal with it on Monday then hopefully, all the parties would have the time to consider the matter and then hopefully resolve it. So, I accept your ruling. Thanks.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: If you can give me a second. Thank you very much, hon Dugmore. The matter has now been dispensed of and we move onto the rest of the Order of the Day. Thank you very much, you may proceed. [Interjections.]

[Ms L M Maseko takes the Chair.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members ...[Interjections.] Order, hon members. Hon Deputy Whip of the Opposition. Hon member Mackenzie. Thank you very much ...[Interjections.] we are now on the – Okay. The Secretary will read the Sixth Order of the Day. Oh, the Fifth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Vote 14 – Local Government – *Western Cape Adjustment Appropriation Bill* [B 3-2022].

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, I recognise hon

Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. To the hon Premier, hon members of the Executive, the hon members of the House, thank you for the opportunity. The Department of Local Government is one of the smallest departments in this Government but is making a huge impact in the quality of life of our citizens.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, this is not my opinion. This is according to the Auditor-General, the Department of Water and Sanitation Blue Drop Report, the Department of Water and Sanitation Green Drop Report, Stats South Africa General Household Survey Report. All these reports found that in 2022, local governments in the Western Cape stand head and shoulders above all the other provinces in South Africa. Allow me to thank the HOD, Graham Paulse and his officials for the hard work behind the scenes which played a big part in these successes.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, a lot of hard work has been done in 2022. We grapple with unsustainable and unstable coalitions that are distracting people from focusing on services to their communities. We have four municipalities with outstanding debt to Eskom. This is an embarrassment for me, and we will keep on working to find solutions ...[Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: Who are they?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Temporary Chairperson, the hon Marran does not want to ask that question. [Interjections.] I can promise you. So, hon Temporary Chairperson, there is no reason for a municipality to fall behind on Eskom payments. Loadshedding reached new heights in 2022. We saw that the long loadshedding above Stage 4 is crippling even the best run municipalities. Water, sewerage pumps simply cannot keep up and systems become unstable. I want to thank the Disaster Management Team for their excellent coordination work they have been doing this past year regarding loadshedding. Also, thank you to the technical support our engineers have been providing to our municipalities during this time.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, I also want to give special recognition to our Disaster Management Staff who responded to the dire needs in KwaZulu-Natal after the devastating floods earlier this year. Your selfless and brave actions are recognised by this Parliament and by the KZN Government. Hon Temporary Chairperson, one thing that became very clear during the KZN rescue mission was that successful disaster management requires well-trained and well-equipped staff. There is no sense in having a huge Disaster Fund if you do not have the capacity and skills to act during such events.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, during the Adjustment Estimate of 2022/2023 financial year, the original Budget of R309 301 000 decreased with R9 204 000 to R300 097 000. This was the result of, amongst others, the

following: a saving of R8 440 000 due to the reduction in employee compensation. This is reallocated towards additional contract appointments during the 2023/2024 financial year. Due to the delays with the recruitment process to appoint capacity within the Department, earmarked funds are allocated to support the fire strategy of the Department and strengthen the capacity of Fire and Rescue Services. These funds are to be reallocated in the 2023/2024 financial year to fund the replacement of the Disaster Management Centre audio-visual infrastructure and the maintenance and support requirements relating to the audio-visual infrastructure. Savings under Goods and Services will see R5,4 million shifted to provide support to municipalities through the Joint District and Metro Approach (JDMA) and to fund water resilience projects.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the past year has seen the staff in the Department under severe pressure as challenges in our Local Government seem to grow daily. With finances being under pressure, it is now critical for us to allocate resources where we will see the strategic impact most desired. Again, I want to thank our HOD and the team for doing this important work under difficult circumstances. I thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister Bredell. I now recognise hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, we want to put it on record that

we reject this Budget Vote today. As my colleagues and I go through this Adjustment Budget and in fact, the others as we have done in previous years, but particularly in this Department we are noticing a trend, a trend in the very serious failure of the Department of the Premier to fill and in particular, this Department of Local Government, to fill certain posts.

Now for me, it is not exactly surprising, hon Temporary Chairperson, because hon MEC Bredell has not only been found guilty once, but actually twice by the Public Protector and what has he been found guilty of, hon members? He has been found guilty of attempting to implement cadre deployment within the municipalities. So, now what is happening here, they do headhunting, they do this, but they find that there are no DA-cadres good enough to appoint. So then, they do not fill those posts. This is we have a hon MEC who is the mastermind behind DA cadre deployment. So, it is not surprising that this Department every year says ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, can you take your seat?
There is a point of order.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): hon Temporary Chairperson, I rise in terms of Rule 59 regarding

“No member may –

(a) impute improper motives on;

(b) reflect on the integrity or dignity of; or

(c) verbally abuse, another member.”

Thank you. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, the Deputy of the
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): hon Temporary Chairperson, with respect, I think this is frivolous. The hon Baartman should know better because when she imputed, when she did a similar thing with the matter that was not really in the public domain ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...and was not even a fact about the hon Bakubaku-Vos ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member! ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...when it was SOPA ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Sayed!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...it was dismissed. This is a political matter, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Sayed!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It is a political matter; it is a frivolous point of order ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): The hon member is not imputing anything.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member! You rise on a point of order. You do not make a speech. [Interjections.] So, if you raise a point of order you have to say on which Rule. [Interjections.] You do not do this speech so that we can continue with the Business of the Day.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Responding to that particular point of order.

An HON MEMBER: *Eish, ja!*

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: We are not going to have the conversation, hon member, and you are sitting down, hon member Marran. You are not going to address me. We are going to continue with the Order of the Day.

An HON MEMBER: Malema's point of order speech.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Acting Chief Whip, I will come back to you. We can continue. Hon member, continue. You are disturbing your own hon member from the Opposition ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: It is a matter of ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Let him finish with the ...[Interjection.]
Let him finish with his debate.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No, thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. So, it is clear to me from your ruling that you have actually regarded the Acting Chief Whip's comments as frivolous because you have not ruled, you have not upheld her ruling. So, I can repeat what I said.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I said, hon member, I will come back with the ruling. That means I said something. So, continue with your debate. You do not have to say something after I have ruled. Continue with your debate, hon member.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I thank you very much because when we look at this carefully, we find that it is astonishing that millions, in fact R122 million were surrendered to the Provincial Revenue

Fund over this period due to unspent compensation of employees. No, let us check back over the last couple of years. That is the amount of money that has been surrendered and our argument is that so, we all know that this Department is understaffed. This Adjustment and the Annual Report process shows that, but the continued failure to appoint people to this Department makes it clear that because they cannot find DA-cadres competent enough or loyal enough to them, they then say they cannot fill these posts and give the money back. That is a trend that we have picked up very clearly and it is a huge concern that we need to look at.

Earlier, we heard from the hon Marran that the bottleneck in appointing staff to critical posts in Environmental Affairs and Development Planning lies with the Department of the Premier. So, is it now all the fault of the mastermind of cadre deployment in the DA, hon MEC Bredell, or is it the fault of the mastermind's boss, i.e., the hon Premier? But clearly, there is a process here to make sure that only DA loyalists are appointed to particular positions. I do not even want to go into family members because we all know the story about family members in your Department through the ... but we can get to that.

In this Adjustment Budget, more than R8 million was again shifted because of critical posts in the Local Government Department not being filled. So, the R122 million is a broad figure; the R8 million specifically in this adjustment is the Local Government figures. So, where is actually the problem we ask, hon Temporary Chairperson? According to the figures of the

Local Government, they say it lies with the Department of the Premier. Where does it actually lie?

We know that Local Government is a critical sphere, and it lacks capacity, was the continuous refrain that we heard from the officials themselves. And we all know that after having emerged from the most disastrous drought our province has faced in generations and knowing the potential that the agricultural sector has in our provincial economy, as well as the lack of access to water that our people suffer from, it is inexplicable how there have been delays with the filling of the drought capacity support in the Department to the tune of R3 million. When you do not have capacity, that also means that commercial and small black farmers do not get the drought support that they should.

This must really come to an end, and I appeal to the hon MEC just to be honest with us in the House today about this. We can send you qualified people who are actually able to do this. I take the point around the engineering services where no one is denying it. That is a difficult issue. Often, they get paid more in Local Government, but there are possibilities of contracts, of negotiating with people and getting them on board.

So, it is very clear that the Budget does not provide hardly any support for training capacity at Local Government, which is one of the core functions. Once again, R1,1 million has been surrendered to the Provincial Revenue Fund initially earmarked for Fire Services capacity for the same reason:

delays in the recruitment process. Again, more than half a million rand was surrendered to the PRF due to delays with the recruitment process relating to the appointment of capacity to be utilised for research policy and legislation.

I do not even want to get to the fact that not a cent has been spent on the process towards setting up the House of Traditional Leaders. Not one cent! And that begs the question how important is that House of Traditional Leaders to this Government and this Department in particular because we know during Helen Zille's reign of terror in this Legislature, she made absolutely no effort to get a House of Traditional Leaders. Now that provinces are forced to do it, we still have no political will and I think the Khoi and the San communities of the Western Cape must take notice. Not only did the DA vote against this Bill in the National Assembly, but now in the Province when they actually are required to implement it, they are not spending a cent. In total, nearly R3,5 million was surrendered back to the PRF due to these delays.

And what we also see is that R1 million was taken from Awareness related projects, and machinery and equipment for Community Development Workers to fund IT equipment in Programme 1, which is administration and that for comms and social media campaigns. It is just totally unacceptable, hon Temporary Chairperson. CDWs are critical and the machinery and equipment they employ are indispensable, yet this Department takes funds initially identified for all this machinery of CDWs and equipment for them, and then funds IT in a non-core programme of its administration.

We also note hon Temporary Chairperson, that funds for further awareness raising were shifted to Programme 1 and there should be little doubt that the hon MEC wanted this under his sight so that this communication and social media can be used for party political purposes because you must remember, his poor Department have to communicate unacceptable and biased decisions that he makes on an almost weekly basis. He is going to defend that Councillor; he is not going to defend that Councillor, or he will defend, for party political reasons. So now, his poor Department must communicate that.

Then, †vir die arme MEC wat nou die waarnemende leier van die DA is, mnr Simmers, wat vir die MEC nou wil opdrag gee om vir Keith Jordaan aan te stel. [for the poor MEC who is now the acting leader of the DA, Mr Simmers, who now wants to instruct the MEC to appoint Keith Jordaan.] And I am sure the hon MEC told him straight: you cannot expect me to do that. And now, he because he has got some – hon MEC Simmers – because he has got some debt to pay to Keith Jordaan, he is now telling this hon MEC to allow the appointment of Keith Jordaan. And that is why we have taken that hon MEC to the Public Protector †en hy gaan huil. Hy gaan huil wanneer die uitkoms want die feite daar is. [and he is going to cry. He's going to cry when the outcome of the facts are there.] Voice recordings, WhatsApp recordings are there ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, can you sit down? Hon member, can you sit down? Hon member Bosman?

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson, I do not want to take Vinnige Fanie's job, but the hon member is speaking past you. He is speaking through other hon members, and he is pointing fingers, hon Temporary Chairperson. It is quite disturbing. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member and I know hon member Sayed does not like that behaviour. So, hon member, if you can address the hon member through the Chair, we will appreciate that. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, but hon Temporary Chairperson, only you would know how good the eye contact between the two of us is. It has been very solid. I do sometimes look this way, but you and I have maintained very good eye contact and we will continue to do so. [Interjections.]

There is a total lack of detail when it comes to municipal infrastructure. For example, we see a decrease of R894 000 in the Goods and Services budget of Municipal Infrastructure, but we are not told what these funds were initially identified for in the Main Appropriation. It is therefore difficult, hon Temporary Chairperson, for us to understand what or which Municipal Infrastructure projects or support will not happen.

Now, I want to ask is that because the hon Acting Leader of the DA

...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, you will have to conclude now.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...is giving instructions to this hon MEC about what to do with Infrastructure and I am particularly concerned. I want to warn the hon MEC for Local Government, not to be influenced by his hon Acting Leader because he is going to get him into trouble, big, big trouble. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. [Interjections.] I now recognise hon member Makamba-Botya of EFF.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): It is very concerning and worrying that the Budget of the Department of Local Government is reduced by more than R9 million. This is the Department with a mandate to monitor and support municipalities in order to be able to fulfil their own mandate. Hon Temporary Chairperson, municipalities are a first point of call for residents when it comes to service delivery issues. The majority of municipalities in the province do not have provisions for emergency housing. So, instead of reducing the budget of the Department, why are these funds not transferred to these municipalities which struggle to carry out this mandate of providing for emergency housing for residents?

Hon Temporary Chairperson, municipalities such as Drakenstein have been taken to court in the recent past for this very same issue of not making provision for emergency housing. It is also shocking that most of these municipalities point to a lack of resources, but at the same time, spend millions of rands in litigation defending why they are not executing their mandate.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, beyond the issue of emergency housing, smaller municipalities in the province do not have a budget to provide residents with houses. Lack of services in delivery by municipalities in townships, is a major issue. People from informal settlements still need to relieve themselves in bushes as they are not provided with temporary toilets, at the very least. Hon Temporary Chairperson, the poor people of this province are not taken seriously by this DA-led Government.

On that note, hon Temporary Chairperson, the EFF will not support this Vote. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon member America.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Actually, before I start, and I do not know. I am the Chairperson of the Standing Committee and hon Dugmore and hon Makamba-Botya are all members of the Committee. I do not know whether we are in the same Committee because

the figures mentioned by hon Dugmore are not those figures that are contained in the Adjustment Budget. But more of that, perhaps the hon Minister will respond to that.

But let me continue, hon Temporary Chairperson. Last week, the Provincial Minister of Finance, hon Minister Wenger, tabled the results contained in the 2020 Municipal Economic Review Outlook, commonly referred to as the MERO. This Outlook proved beyond any doubt that the Western Cape is fast becoming the preferred destination for manufacturing, financial and agricultural businesses across South Africa. The 2020 MERO shows that the Western Cape has expanded its Gross Domestic Product or GDP, one of the only three provinces in the country to do so. This growth has been driven by all our municipalities, including the City of Cape Town, which have experienced a year of strong and consistent growth post the devastating years of COVID-19.

Additionally, the recently released unemployment statistics of Stats South Africa, the Western Cape boasts with the lowest unemployment figures in the country. And I would like to remind our matriculants in the gallery that you are more likely to find a job in the Western Cape than in any other province in the country. This is incredibly good news, given that jobs remain at the top of the agenda of the DA. In the words of hon Minister Wenger, I quote:

“A job provides dignity and self-agency, breaking the cycle of poverty. Employment creates opportunity (hon Nkondlo) and

hope for many families across the province.”

These results are not abstract figures which will delight some economist sitting in an airconditioned office somewhere. They represent real, meaningful change in the lives of our citizens. The results include GDP expansion of 6,2% in the West Coast District Municipality, 5,3% in the Cape Winelands Municipality and consistent growth across our province. Judging objectively from all indices, our growth has outstripped the rest of the country, providing for the umpteenth time something which we all already know, that the DA gets things done.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, it is no secret that our municipalities have put the Western Cape municipalities so far ahead from the rest of the country. The Western Cape Government has consistently maintained an unwavering focus on clean and responsible municipal and provincial governance. Over the last year, the DA-run Western Cape achieved great success in the fields of municipal audits, poverty reduction, unemployment, clean and corruption-free governance. By ensuring service delivery and financial health in the province's municipalities, the Department of Local Government has in turn ensured the necessary conditions for growth in the Western Cape.

The Western Cape Government has also doubled down on infrastructure necessary for growth, with significant investments made into ensuring the security of our municipal water supplies. We know that water is a scarce resource in our province and one which is becoming ever scarcer as the result

of climate change. Even now, our dam levels are at their lowest in three years and the lowest since the end of the drought in 2018.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, this is something which keeps me awake at night as it should every citizen of the Western Cape, but I am comforted by the fact that this Government is doing what it does best and taking steps to fix the problem. Since 2018, R67 million has been spent to ensure the future of the Western Cape's water supply and to prevent any crisis in the future. In this Adjustment Budget, the Western Cape Government continues this trend by making an additional R3 million directly available to municipalities and a further R5,4 million transfer through the Joint District and Metro Approach (JDMA) for water resilience projects in the various districts.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, through innovative techniques and intelligent investments, the City of Cape Town is also able to offer businesses a vastly higher degree of energy security than the rest of the country. It is therefore absolutely no surprise that both businesses and ordinary citizens are fleeing the collapsing ANC Government's disastrous administration, to move and come and live in the province, which has the Government it needs to grow, prosper and move forward. In fact, I believe that it will not be long before the economic centre of the country moves from Gauteng to the Western Cape. After all, hon Temporary Chairperson, how can you manufacture without electricity? How can you start a business under a government which only knows bribery and corruption? How can you live without water?

As the Western Cape's governing party, our Opposition often criticises us for drawing too much attention to economic indicators, rather than people. We are told that it is commendable that we have received clean audit outcomes and high GDP growth. We are also told that we failed to clarify the impact these have on the lives of the people whom we represent. So, let me be clear. Good governance results in economic growth, which in turn results in more jobs; enhances safety and a higher standard of wellbeing for the people of the Western Cape. Continuous and sustained economic growth in the Western Cape brings with it jobs, prosperity and wellbeing for the citizens and ensures that the Western Cape remains on a positive trajectory towards a better future and provides yet another example of the DA's proven ability to guarantee growth where it governs.

Above all else, the Western Cape Government does the one thing which seemingly no other government in this country can do. It gives people hope. It gives our citizens, the people of this province that put us in this House, the confidence that we as representatives care for them and that this Government is planning for the future. And this is not even accounting for the work that our Government does on the ground.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, it gives me great pride to state that during our oversight visit in the Overberg region, the Department of Local Government initiated a catalytic project through the JDMA by establishing a network of safe houses for women and children suffering from social ills, including Gender-Based Violence and femicide and poverty across the district.

So, after moving to Bredasdorp in 2012, community worker Ms Lana O'Neill immediately realised the lack of a safe shelter for abused women in the area. Through her non-profit organisation, HeavenlyPromise48, and supported by the Cape Agulhas Municipality, she offered preventative programmes, crisis intervention and shelter to abused women. With the help of the Department of Local Government, a network of these NGO-driven safehouses will be established across our province with strong support from the respective municipalities, private sector, and departments from various spheres of government, to ensure that the safety net where women and children can be moved to according to their needs.

Once again, this Western Cape Government is taking policy that works and rolling it out as quickly as possible. Once again, the Western Cape Government is creating meaningful change in people's lives. Therefore, I would like to express my heartfelt gratitude and appreciation to Ms Lana O'Neill for the selfless work she does with abused women and vulnerable women in Bredasdorp.

So, hon Temporary Chairperson, as we know our country is in a time of political uncertainty, turmoil, and change. I know that hon members opposite, may have a new party leader in the few hours' time. [Interjections.] But what is more important is that South African citizens, the people who still do have the ultimate authority over this country, will soon head to the polls and when they do, I believe they will look to this province, to our

municipalities and to this Government and they will see that there is only once choice to be made at the ballot box: forwards or backwards; DA or ANC.

So, hon Temporary Chairperson, I congratulate the Department, hon Minister Bredell on their work over the last year. I support this Adjustment Budget and I look forward to seeing the success of this province replicated on a national scale following our next election: forwards or backwards; DA or ANC. I thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Is this going forward or what? Who would be a part of ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. [Interjections.] Hon member, I now recognise hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, *ja*, I feel very sorry for my colleagues on the other side, for the ANC. They are in turmoil. They have got a very difficult situation to deal with, so I understand their tension. Hon Temporary Chairperson, I want to say through to the hon Dugmore: at least I have got a leader, an elected leader. The ANC, hon Temporary Chairperson, in this province must be so ashamed. They cannot even hold a congress. I have got more branches in my constituency than they have got in this province.

[Interjections.]

Hon Temporary Chairperson, so *ja*, [Interjections.] to stand up and talk today about [Interjections.] this Vote, it must be very difficult for the ANC. Hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Interjections.], hon Temporary Chairperson, I want to say to the hon Dugmore through you that ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...at least, if you look at where they currently stand with the situation with the President, if you look back on the Zondo Commission [Interjections.] where we spent more than R1 billion of this taxpayer's money for the ANC to determine which cadres stole more than the other one because nobody has ended up in jail currently [Interjections.] more than a billion rand, more than a billion rand.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, they have asked about the four municipalities who do not pay Eskom. Well, surprise, surprise, all four are ANC. [Interjections.] All four are ANC problems. ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Yes, Matzikama. We took over

Matzikama, but it is an ANC governed municipality which ends up in that. We took it over from the ANC. [Interjections.] That is why the voters threw the ANC under the bus there because they cannot even pay Eskom. Matzikama, Cederberg, Kannaland, Beaufort West: there, you have got it, hon Temporary Chairperson. [Interjections.] But hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: ...if you cannot put your party together and have a congress, it is no wonder the country is where it is.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister, can you sit down for a second? Hon member, are you rising on a point of order?

Mr M KAMA: No, I needed to calm him down. I saw that ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, sit down ...[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I am very calm.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: It is not a point of order.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I am calm, hon Temporary Chairperson, I am just so ashamed for the ANC. This mighty organisation who drops to nothing, where we should, in this House, talk about the future of the young people in the audience, we sit here today and do not know if we are going to have a President tonight. [Interjections.]

Hon Temporary Chairperson, they have managed, the ANC has managed to bankrupt Eskom. They have managed to bankrupt our rail system. They have managed to bankrupt our water system. They have managed to bankrupt Telkom. But do you know what is very worrying, hon Temporary Chairperson, poor people, when they need to go and stand in a queue for UIF, they cannot get their money because the ANC do not have the system to pay them.

†Die WAARNEMENDE HOOFSWEEP (DA): Daar is nie geld nie.

[The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): There is no money.]

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: And they dare to stand up in this House and try to grandstand. What a shame! What a shame!

Hon Temporary Chairperson, to the hon Standing Committee, I want to thank the hon Chairperson, to the hon members for the hard work, for asking the difficult questions, for keeping us sharp, keeping us on our toes. I want to

end off, hon Temporary Chairperson.

Through you to the hon Dugmore: you must never misuse freedom of speech. I think it is a disgrace when we start to call people by their name who cannot defend themselves and he must explain how one hon member, because the DA has got one hon member in Kannaland, how does one member employ a person? [Interjections.] You cannot. You cannot. There can be 100 voice clips. That is illegal in any case, but they do not have any regard for the law because according to the law, you are not allowed to tape anybody. Do you know that honourable? But they do not care. [Interjections.] They do not have any regard for the law. That is why the ANC will be voted out in 2024, but now in 2023 because we need an urgent election [Interjections.] because of the failures of the ANC, hon Temporary Chairperson. So, hon Temporary Chairperson, I am looking forward to the next election. So, thank you very much and thank you to the Standing Committee. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Hon members, that concludes the debate on this Vote. [Interjections.] Hon member? Is there a point of order?

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, I am sadly – I was rising on a point of order, but I was ignored. The hon MEC was allowed to say what he wanted to say, many things around casting aspersions,

but it is fine. I did not have an opportunity because you chose to ignore me. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Sayed, that is really not honest of what you are saying, and you know it. [Interjections.] But anyway, we are going to continue with the Order of the Day ...[Interjections.] Hon member Marran! Hon Leader of the Opposition who really has to lead, that ...[Interjections.] The Secretary will read the Sixth Order of the Day. Hon members, we do have guests in the House. [Interjections.] Hon member. [Interjections.] Hon Leader of the Opposition, may I address you? [Interjections.]

Hon member Nkondlo, hon member Sayed, hon member Marran and then all the hon members on my right. We do have guests here that really are looking forward to listening to your debates, not your heckling. I am definitely sure when I interacted with them, they said they are looking forward to listening to your debates. They ...[Interjections.] Let us give them a chance of listening to those debates. [Interjections.] I do thank you for your cooperation. [Interjections.] The Secretary will read the Sixth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works – *Western Cape Adjustment Appropriation Bill* [B3-2022] [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I recognise hon Simmers.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Temporary Chairperson, hon Premier, hon colleagues in the Cabinet physically present and logged in virtually, hon members of the House present, but also logged in virtually, our learners in the gallery and also, our guests logged in via the virtual medium. I was really humbled and honoured when the hon Premier appointed me as the Executive Authority of the new Infrastructure Portfolio, comprising of elements from the Department of Transport and Public Works, which is the Vote I am speaking on now, and the Department of Human Settlements, which I spoke on earlier.

I stand here today to report on the Department of Transport and Public Works' Adjustment Budget which with its budget allocation for the 2023/2024 financial year, will form part of the new Department of Infrastructure on 1 April 2023. But this is a budget that goes beyond excellence and why do I say a budget beyond excellence, hon Temporary Chairperson? ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister, can you take your seat. Hon member?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, *ja*, I mean really. These smart Alec remarks when we want to rise on issues of clarity is really not assisting. I hope the guests in the gallery can see.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, just say your ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): *Ja*, no, no.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...point of order.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Allow us to also pre-empt. Just a matter of clarity. We are busy with Transport and Public Works. I see hon member Simmers speaking. I do not see hon member Mitchell yet. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Acting Chief Whip, I recognise you.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you. Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. As the hon Minister actually indicated in the beginning of his speech, he is the Executive Authority with the respective assigned powers by the hon Premier and therefore, he is part of this debate because of his Executive powers ...[Interjections.] as previously tabled in this House. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. I think that is the clarity to you, hon Deputy. I recognise you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, you see, this shows how the hon Premier has plunged Provincial Government ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...into a state of confusion and disarray.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It is just some idea they thought of: Infrastructure. Now, hon Mitchell ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...does not even have any Executive ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...Authority.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): They have an MEC with no Executive Authority, but I will sit.

An HON MEMBER: Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, you are not going to raise frivolous points of order [Interjections.] so we are going to continue with the Business of the Day. Continue, hon Minister. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: As I was saying, hon Temporary Chairperson, the Department of Transport and Public Works received a clean audit from the A-G not for the first, nor for the second, nor for the third year, but for the tenth consecutive year in a row. [Interjections.] This, indeed, is an achievement beyond the most ambitious of dreams for our counterparts with memberships from Luthuli House who are oddly making a noise. †Maar leë blikke maak die meeste geraas, in elk geval, waarnemende Voorsitter, sê die gesegde. [Tussenwerpsels.] [But empty vessels make the most noise, in any case, Madam Chair, the saying goes. [Interjections.]

Hon Temporary Chairperson, if it were any other government ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister, may you sit down, please? [Interjections.] Chief Whip of the Opposition. [Interjections.] Chief Whip of the Opposition, please try to get your house in order also, on this side. On the Opposition side. [Interjections.] Hon member Nkondlo! Hon member Simmers, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Okay. Thank you, hon Temporary

Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, as I was saying if this were any other government like the other provinces where the Opposition never governed, I am sure we would have seen an R18 million flag that glows in the dark and that would have been erected at 9 Dorp Street. [Interjections.] But this is the Western Cape. †Ons is nie 'n sirkus nie, ons is 'n regering. [We are not a circus; we are a government.] However, because excellence is what we and the public have come to expect from the Western Cape Government, this is just another tick in the box of excellent service delivery. For us, it is not about doing things right at the tenth attempt, but others doing the right thing for the first time. Here is a good example why I say that, hon Temporary Chairperson.

Earlier in the year, the National Minister of Transport decided to launch what he called the Vala Zonke Project or 'Close Them All' campaign, to fix potholes on South Africa's roads. Now, we had to remind the hon National Minister and I actually had to call him to explain to him that in the Western Cape we do not wait for the month of September to repair potholes and reseal potholes or even, maintain our roads in the Western Cape [Interjections.] because we have a scheduled maintenance plan throughout the year that does this. We do not do one-hit wonders, like the hon Minister attempted to do.

One of the projects I can use to substantiate this, which we also showcased to the hon Minister, was a road that is called the Old Fort Road or the DR101 in the City of Cape Town, where we showcased that not only could we create 317 job opportunities as part of our maintenance routine, but that 176 of

those job opportunities were for youth and 87 were for women, hon Temporary Chairperson. But we went beyond that because we could also prove to the hon Minister that we do not have one-hit wonder projects, this is a good example also where 12 of the subcontractors appointed by the Department were 100% women-owned enterprises doing our job for us. So, this project indeed, is aligned to the Growth for Jobs strategy of which this DA-led Government of the Western Cape is the initiator.

However, hon Temporary Chairperson, let me get to the Business of the Day to end the confusion of our hon members on the other side of the aisle. The Main Appropriation of Vote 10 increases by R324,56 million or 3,56% from R9,106 billion to R9 430 958 000. The biggest gain of this upward adjustment is on Programme 4, which is in terms of Transport Operations which from 1 April will be called Mobility, for those of you that have not been following what is happening this year. Which will once again see the promotion of strategic collaborations between the two spheres of government, while empowering the local municipality.

This time, it is to ensure that successful implementation of the George Integrated Public Transport Network (GIPTN) Project in the George Municipality can occur because they are the joint contracting authority. The rollout of GIPTN to Thembalethu commenced in November 2022 and this will see an increase in the service to double the current reach of the system since its initial launch in December 2014 in George.

Additional funding of R25,553 million was allocated to Public Works Infrastructure for the acquisition or properties for Health and Educational purposes. In recent months, we have seen the successful delivery of these educational and health facilities under what we call, the Social Infrastructure Pillar. The completion, among others, of the R17,1 million project at Bothasig High School supplied and installed no less than six mobile classrooms, two general science labs, one double classroom, three administration facilities, two ablutions facilities of 9 square metres each, one feeding kitchen, three storage containers, paved walkways, a parking area, a play area, fencing, benches, and water fountains. Well worth the R17,1 million.

But similarly, we have seen the completion of the construction of the Moorreesburg High School in Swartland in August 2022 this year, for an amount of R65,7 million. This will provide a much-needed educational facility for this part of the West Coast area. The building of this school commenced on 8 January 2021, hon members and it is completed, but during the process we managed to create 211 job opportunities. The Department also completed a R34 million project to build the new Klapmuts Primary School and then, the Klapmuts High School on one erf by using mobile classrooms. Construction of this project began on 3 May 2022 and was completed ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: ...on 8 August 2022.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: May you please take your seat?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. I would like to ask whether the hon MEC for Human Settlements is prepared to answer a question. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Is the hon MEC [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Well, the hon MEC is talking now.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister, will you take the ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Because the hon Premier [Interjections.] the hon Premier answers questions.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member. Hon member!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So, if he wants to be the Premier, he must get used to it.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, you may sit down. I heard you. [Interjections.] We have the hon Minister. I think we do know there is a Minister of Infrastructure. Are you talking about the same hon Minister, the hon Minister of Infrastructure? You talk to me and now, you are ignoring me. [Interjections.] Hon member Sayed, I recognise you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, is the hon Minister willing to tell us whether this means now that hon MEC Mitchell [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Does hon MEC Mitchell hold the budget

An HON MEMBER: No, no, no, no, no, no, no, no, no!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Does hon MEC Mitchell have a department?

An HON MEMBER: No, no, no, no, no, no, no, no, no!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Because this is serious. You have a ceremonial MEC ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member! Hon member!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...MEC Mitchell.

An HON MEMBER: No, no, no, no, no, no, no, no, no! That is not how you ask the [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It is an insult to the people of the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: No, no, no, no, no, no, no, no, no!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): They are paying through the Office of the hon Premier ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No, no, no, no, no, no, no, no, no!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...for the ceremonial MEC. This is an insult to hon MEC Mitchell.

An HON MEMBER: That is not how you ask the question, no.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It is an insult to the people of the Western Cape.

An HON MEMBER: No, no, no, no, no, no, no, no, no!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): They are paying through the Office of the Premier ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No, no, no, no, no, no, no, no, no!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...for a ceremonial MEC.

An HON MEMBER: Hon Temporary Chairperson, it was the method how you asked the question.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members! [Interjections.] Hon members, I think we know the Rule 66. Hon members, I recognised hon Dugmore and hon Dugmore asked the question. So, I have to respond to that. So, I am seeing the Opposition, you are raising a hand. Is there any other point of order on this point of order or why are you raising your hand or is it a question that I am not going to allow you to ask? I am going to ask the Minister if you [Interjections.] as you are the one on the podium, are you prepared to take a question?

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Temporary Chairperson, no because [Interjections.] this is another Vote. [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Are you the next Minister, the next?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I recognise you, you can continue, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister, you may take your seat. Hon member Nkondlo, I recognise you.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Hon Temporary Chairperson, we are debating here and that is what the Secretary read. Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works. The last time our hon MEC for Transport and Public Works is a Mr Mitchell. Where is he? [Interjections.] Hey, no guys, man. [Interjections.] No, guys. [Interjections.] He is not here, here!

An HON MEMBER: But there is no ...[Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Here!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much.

Ms N D NKONDLO: You are not the hon Temporary Chairperson.

[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Premier?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Why do you like to extend? Hon Premier!

[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Premier! [Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Just ...[Interjections.] Just ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Because he [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Premier!

Ms N D NKONDLO: Do you have a hand? ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Nkondlo addressed me.

[Interjections.] Hon member Nkondlo addressed me, and I am going to ask the Acting Chief Whip. I recognise you.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, unlike the ANC, the DA actually reads the *Provincial Gazette* and ...[intervenes]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: What is your ...[Interjection.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...and tablings.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...point of order, hon Acting Chief Whip? [Interjections.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): He is a Minister. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: What is your point of order?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): I rise in terms of the Rules of ATC and *Provincial Gazettes*. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members! Hon members! [Interjections.] Hon members, I will in the meantime ...[Interjections.] Hon members! [Interjections.] Hon member Nkondlo, hon member Nkondlo! I recognise you, hon member Kama.

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much ...[Interjections.] Thank you very much [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, hon members! Order, hon Premier! Order, hon member Nkondlo.

Mr M KAMA: No, thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. I think, hon Temporary Chairperson, this is, this is, this is very ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: What is your point of order?

Mr M KAMA: Why are you not patient? [Interjections.] You did not do that to [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: What is your point of order? I want to find out. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: But why am I abused?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You have to rise on a point of order.

Mr M KAMA: Yes, yes!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: So, we do have Rule 66. Look at it, tell me what is your point of order.

Mr M KAMA: Hon Temporary Chairperson, can you be patient? You are

going to get an opportunity to rule whether it is a point of order or not.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Which Rule are you rising on ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA: I will tell you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...so that I can look at it.

Mr M KAMA: I will tell you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Continue.

Mr M KAMA: Can I make the point? The issue, hon Temporary Chairperson, is that we hear that there is – and this is important for this House, this is very important for this House – we hear that hon Minister Simmers is an Executive Authority on Transport and Public Works. But in the public, like the B97 Route ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, you know that ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA: ...Executive Authority is hon Mitchell.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: That is not a point of order.

Mr M KAMA: And here, we are here to approve a budget. It is not important this process that we are dealing with. We are not just raising it for fun. We are approving a budget here and we are told here is an Executive Authority. But in the public in terms of the work that is going to be done with this budget, it is going to be done and hon Minister Daylin ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Kama!

Mr M KAMA: ...is the one who is going to be an Executive Authority. Hon Temporary Chairperson, we must not accept to be confused by these pronouncements of the hon Premier. You know, what ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Kama!

Mr M KAMA: Let us not allow this confusion to come to the House and stick to what we know here in the House, and the wishful thinking up until the hon President is informed, I think we must wait for that particular point, you know.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Honourable ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA: ...and have someone. Because now it means the House must be concerned that we have ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, sit down.

Mr M KAMA: ...a Minister of Mobility that does not have a budget ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member!

Mr M KAMA: ...and no engagement with us.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Sit down!

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Sit down, hon member! Hon members, I am happy that hon member Kama is refusing to be confused ...[Interjections.] and I am going to really plead with you. We already did the Budgets. We are debating the Budgets. You never questioned in your respective Standing Committees. So, like I said we do have guests and I understand, today is the debating day, we are debating, but if you are going to do frivolous points of orders, you distract the floor of the debate. So, I request this: we have got the clarity from the Acting Chief Whip ...[Interjections.] about the [Interjections.]. It was ATC. [Interjections.] I am going to ask that we continue with the debate. [Interjections.] Hon Minister, you may continue.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Temporary

Chairperson. Now, moving beyond excellence. In line with the growth for the job strategy, the Department created 8 677 Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP) work opportunities. We completed 85 roads and public works construction projects ...[Interjections.] and we maintained 337 road maintenance projects. So, hon Temporary Chairperson, I think the House would agree with me, how can this not be a budget beyond excellence. When the Department received accolade showcasing its innovation and solutions-driven ...[Audio distorted.] efforts.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, I would like to close with the following and this is a quote from Michael Jordan. Really, I think the confusion on that side will be clarified with this ...[Interjections.] and he said:

“Obstacles do not have to stop you. If you run into a wall [which clearly, the Opposition are], do not turn around and give up [which they have]. Figure out how to climb it, go through it and work around it.”

And that is what drives this Department and the Western Cape DA-led Government. Our drive is to find solutions to ensure work opportunities, safety and the wellbeing of our citizens. Thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. [Interjections.] I now recognise the ANC. Hon member Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Can you hear me, hon Temporary Chairperson? Hon Temporary Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Can you hear me?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, hon member, you are audible.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, the ANC does not support this Budget Vote. Below, I will be expanding on the reason given in the Committee for our reason to reject this Budget. From the onset, I must state categorically that we can feel the impact of the juniorisation of this Department by the hon Premier. This is not intended at casting aspersions or disrespect towards the hon MEC.

One example is the fact that former hon MEC Madikizela with his experience and seniority in the DA found it easy to approach the hon Premier and Finance MEC to provide funding for the Blue Dot and ...[Audio distorted.]. A decision by this hon MEC and Provincial Government to terminate the Blue Dot initiative is a clear indication that this Department does not take the taxi industry seriously and that it has owned the Blue Dot initiative as Madikizela's own project.

The juniorisation of the Department is also showing itself in the failure of the hon MEC to deal with the allegations of a serious nature against Mr Farrel Payne, a senior official in the Department. Perhaps the hon Premier has finalised his mistake which resulted in him reducing the mandate of his Department to only focus on mobility. On behalf of the ANC, I want to advise the hon Premier to consider placing this function of Mobility under the Department of Police Oversight and Community Safety and use the saving to fund other government priorities.

Today, my colleagues who preceded me, raised the issue of compensation of employees. This cannot be a lament of every department because just about every department is raising this issue. The Department has cut R70,585 million that was allocated for this specific programme due to slower unexpected filling of vacancies and staff [Inaudible.]

In the 2021 Annual Report, reference is made of the Vision Inspired Priorities, in other words the VIP 4, which is Mobility and Spatial Transformation. I hope this is not going to be just a theoretical policy framework cliché, there must be a practical realisation of this notion through the subsidisation of the mini-bus taxi industry and the identification of suitable land in and around the CBD. This must be done throughout the province district areas, as well as local municipalities in the notion of cooperative government. The Department should not look for land that is in isolation and that is far removed from the Central Business District. The residential areas of non-white people are strategically placed far from the

centre of the CBD, and I think that is actually indicative of the apartheid spatial geography.

Spatial transformation can be pursued through the identification of land and buildings of the Provincial Government throughout the province in district municipalities, as well as in local municipalities for purposes of socioeconomic development and transformation. When we had our Adjustment Budget at the Committee on Monday, the HOD did mention that there is money for spatial transformation, but unfortunately, there seemed to be no adjustment for this programme. If there are funds available, we then need to see a result of economic transformation and integration throughout the programme.

On the Mobility side of the vision-inspired priorities, the subsidisation of the mini-bus taxi industry can be pursued through the continuation of the Blue Dot taxi service. We recently saw how the industry was impacted upon by the discontinuation of this project. To show their frustration, the taxi industry had called for a two-day shutdown that resulted in more damage than good. The Government portrays this industry, especially the Provincial Government, as a violent, barbaric industry, but the main cause of the violence and barbaric behaviour is the action of the Provincial Government that is led by the Democratic Alliance.

The issue of operating licences not being issued in time is the main reason for the fights between these associations. The Government can expedite

permits and issue temporary operating licences to the Golden Arrow Bus Services within a day, but it failed to do so for the mini-bus taxi industry. We saw this with the B97 Route. These taxis are being impounded day in, day out, because the Provincial Government knows that they do not possess operating licences.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, maybe this is a strategy of the Provincial Government to not issue these licences and rather make money through the tickets of these confiscations. Every other day, there are roadblocks targeting taxis which prove that this is a deliberate strategy orchestrated by the Provincial Government to oppress this industry. We need this Department to start taking this industry seriously.

The subsidisation of the mini-bus taxi industry is possible, and the Blue Dot pilot programme has proven that very successfully. The Province has R2,658 billion in its provincial reserve fund and it can take from this reserve to fund the subsidisation of this industry. The Safely Home Fund could also assist towards the taxi subsidisation. We call for the Provincial Government to not dent the already built relationship with the mini-bus taxi industry and extend the pilot programme of the Blue Dot project through subsidisation.

The ANC, therefore, cannot support this Budget. Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. I now recognise

the EFF, hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Hon Temporary Chairperson, thank you very much. As part of its Public Works or the Public Works function, this Department must use this adjusted increase of more than R324 million to build more schools in this province. Hon Temporary Chairperson, as things stand, the province cannot accommodate learners in schools due to the lack of facilities. It is high time we must do away with temporary classrooms as they have proved to be unsafe, as they can be easily swept away by winds during the winter season. This then becomes a danger to learners and staff in schools, as well as members in the surrounding communities.

When it comes to transport, there is an existing crisis regarding the issue of taxi permits. Our people spend a lot of time and money applying for operational taxi permits only to be granted by this Department. This Department continues to frustrate those who want to operate in the taxi industry, by deliberately delaying in issuing them operating taxi permits. Hon Temporary Chairperson, every day taxis are impounded by the Government for operating without taxi permits, but it is the very same Government that is causing them not to have those permits. The impounding of taxis by Government is creating instability and chaos in our townships. When taxi operators retaliate in order to get their taxis back, this puts the lives of ordinary citizens and commuters at a serious risk.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the fines to release taxis when they are

impounded by the DA-led Government, are shockingly high when compared to other provinces and the reason behind this is just to make black people remain poor. Hon Temporary Chairperson, we do not know why services similar to GoGeorge and MyCiTi are not made available in other municipalities.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, for this reason the EFF will not support this Vote. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the GOOD. Hon August?

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Public transport systems in the Western Cape are heavily challenged. From the recent taxi strikes, destruction to public transport vehicles and the City of Cape Town's decision to decrease routes on the MyCiTi Bus Service proves that we are moving backwards with developing a system that could compete with private vehicle use. The constraint of this sector is borrowed over from an era that we are still suffering from: inadequate provisions made for public transport systems in new infrastructure developments.

The Blue Dot taxi programme is but one example of a hasty political decision that was taken to win over the loyalty of taxi drivers by this DA-led Government, and it backfired sourly, with lives and livelihoods suffering the most because of a party that cannot plan to see past the next election. The

taxi industry is responsible for 75% of our provincial haulage with millions of commuters making use of their services. Instead of considering the calls for modernisation in this industry, this Government tried to pass the buck onto the National Department of Transport and hell broke loose.

I welcome the installation of cameras and ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, you have to conclude ...[Interjection.]

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): ...Golden Arrow busses in support in creating a safe transport environment for people in the province. As well as ask this Government to investigate ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member!

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): ...school children and look into the legal way farm workers are transported ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, your time is up.

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. I now recognise hon member Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Thank you, hon members. Hon Temporary Chairperson, the hon Premier, Cabinet members and hon members of the House. Today, we are debating the Western Cape Transport and Public Works Adjustment Budget against a backdrop of massive political uncertainty in this country. Hon members, notwithstanding this uncertainty, particularly in the public transportation sector, there remains hope for the future. The budget of hope. A budget that will revive the transport infrastructure industry in the Western Cape, while creating thousands of jobs.

What is hope, hon members? Today, we have hope in the House. We have students, matriculants from Mitchells Plain ...[Interjections.] and then hon Temporary Chairperson, can you protect me, please? Today, we have students ...[Interjections.] Hon Temporary Chairperson, can you protect me? I am happy the students can see for themselves what is happening. [Interjections.] Hon Temporary Chairperson, these students here today are hope. They are hope today in this House. [Interjections.] Next year, some of these students will be attending university, working or pursuing other opportunities. Some of them will run their own leadership positions in this country and sit in this House and will learn from us how to behave.

What they are seeing today, is the conduct of hon members in our House and I hope they take away from them how they must behave when they go home, how they must behave in Mitchells Plain and Langa because they one day,

will be the future. [Interjections.] I appreciate that you are here today, and I want to thank you that they are here today, hon Temporary Chairperson, because these matriculants are indeed our future. So, welcome hon matriculants.

Hon member, one of the problems is, hon members, people do not read. It is a serious problem in this country. On 17 May, the hon Premier published in the ATC including in emails, in written documents, the assigning of powers to Executive Authorities. We are now on 2 December, seven months later ...[Interjection.]

†Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): [Indistinct]... ngoku, bendithi ndizayi-attenda le ...

[Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): [Indistinct]... I was saying I was going to attend to...]

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): ...members question why hon Minister Simmers is delivering this. ...[Interjection.]

†Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): [Indistinct] Isendleni yakhe

[Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): [Indistinct] It is at his house.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Secondly, hon Temporary Chairperson, in this book – it was delivered to all hon members of the House [Interjections.]

†Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): [Indistinct] Isendleni yakhe...

[Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): [Indistinct] It is his house...]

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): ...published on 31 August. Three months later, we are now in December. If they read this book, it says here:

“Signed here by Minister Simmers as the Executive Authority.”

The second book, hon Temporary Chairperson, also signed by hon Minister Simmers, the Executive Authority. [Interjections.] It is in this book, written, emailed ...[Interjections.] and published in the ATC. It is a problem we have in this country that people do not want to read. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member?

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Hon Simmers ...[Interjection.] was in the House, delivering his ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Mackenzie, take your ...[Interjection.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Is this a part of the debate now?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, I recognise you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much.
[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, are you raising a point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I am raising a point where it is convention ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Are you raising on a point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No, I am raising to ask you, as our hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...whether you can ask the – the hon MEC almost got a promotion – hon Mackenzie, if he is prepared to take a question.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may sit down ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I am asking ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may sit down. I will ask him. Thank you very much. [Interjections.] Hon member, are you prepared to take a question?

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): No, not, thank you. I do not want to take ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay, you may continue.

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Who is ...[Inaudible.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson, the hon members who were in the Budget Committee. That is why hon Mvimbi who is online, he was in the Transport Committee when the Executive Authority delivered the Budget Vote. He delivered this thing. [Interjections.] That is why the hon Mvimbi did not raise what his hon members were raising because he knows what it is happening. [Interjections.] He must brief his hon members in his caucus.

Hon members, as we approach the festive season and while ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): No, no, Hon Chairperson there were two Ministers.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Can we now stick to the debate?

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): ...in the Western Cape to enjoy our lovely vacation attractions. We want them to experience our exquisite wine estates, our gatsbies, our *koeksisters*, our Cape Malay curry. We appreciate their attendance, but we ask them to enjoy and drive responsibly. So, we welcome the R20 million as allocated and rolled over by our colleague hon Minister Tertius Simmers, for the next financial year to assist with the Red Dot transformation initiative which by the way, current President Cyril Ramaphosa promised to fund more than three years ago. Just like the Blue Dot programme, they have not funded it.

Hon members, the Blue Dot programme, and indeed, we agree with hon Mvimbi. The Blue Dot taxi programme is, indeed, one of the best programmes in this country. But as the hon member Mvimbi would know, the National Taxi Lekgotla in 2020, attended by hon President Ramaphosa himself and he addressed that National Lekgotla himself, and I quote the hon President, the current hon President – we do not know where he going to be tomorrow – but he said the following. He said:

“To provide subsidy to the taxi industry is an integral part of the economic model aimed at ensuring long-term stability for the industry.”

This is hon President Ramaphosa. [Interjections.] This is part of the

commitment included from the National Taxi Lekgotla, number 20, which is also hon Dugmore, via you, hon Temporary Chairperson, this is enshrined in Vision 2030, the National Planning Commission document of which hon member Dugmore, via you, was a key provider in. So, he should be disappointed, hon Temporary Chairperson, that hon Minister Mbalula is not doing his job. We are, and I quote again:

“We are committed to putting measures and interventions aimed at influencing the economic variables within the industry value chain, including those aimed at alleviating the impact of high cost of finance.”

Commitment 21:

“To the introduction of an electronic fare collection system to reduce the handling of cash.”

This was a commitment made two years ago, hon Temporary Chairperson, at the National Taxi Lekgotla addressed by hon President Ramaphosa. Where are they today? Nowhere. We had to take more than R200 million of our own money to fund the Blue Dot programme. Where is the money? Where were our hon members on the righthand side? They were nowhere. Where are they asking hon President Ramaphosa, ‘give us the money?’ [Interjections.] They are nowhere. Where are they asking them to fund the Blue Dot programme? They are nowhere. We know the hon President hides

money in the couch. They can give us the money. If the ANC had the political will and the true intention to professionalise the taxi industry, they would have done so, but they do not.

Hon members, if I take you further back to 1995. 1995, the National Task Team on Taxis was established in 1995. That was the last time they considered issues affecting the taxi violence. Where are they today? Nowhere, nothing, *niks!* Not one of the hon members on the right said anything about this. But the only programme that is running very well in this country and we have to give credit to the officials in the Department of Public Works, they deserve a hand of applause, hon members [Applause.] for coming up with the Blue Dot programme [Applause.] because while the rest of the country was stealing, buying donkey carts, we developed a programme called the Blue Dot programme. That is the DA difference, hon members of the House.

Hon members, we have seen recently the attacks on public infrastructure and what I find quite sad is that an hon member of this House accused the Government for ignoring barbarism. What is barbaric is the silence of the ANC. A taxi was caught with thirteen petrol bombs. Thirteen! Not one, not two, not three, thirteen petrol bombs! Not once have the hon members of the righthand side said anything about it. Not once did the ANC release a statement because thirteen petrol bombs are domestic terrorism against people of this province, and we will not tolerate it. So, the City of Cape Town has an absolute right to arrest individuals with petrol bombs in their

car, but the ANC for some bizarre reason, hon members, was extremely quiet on this matter. [Interjections.]

With regards to permits. [Interjections.] It is surprising. The hon members were in the Standing Committee. In the Standing Committee there was not one outstanding permit for the taxi industry. Not one! There was a meeting with the taxi industry held in Nyanga two months ago. Not one outstanding taxi permit by this Government because the Western Cape Government delivers. [Interjections.]

And the second point the hon member raised which is shocking, I must say, the hon member of the EFF. She said the fines are higher in the Western Cape than in any other province. Imagine that you commit a crime and then we said, ‘okay, sorry, brother. Let us give you a lower sentence.’ It is bizarre. ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): [Indistinct]

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): ...coming from a woman knowing the terrible crimes committed in this country. You cannot say to someone we are giving you a lower sentence because you are living in another province. If you commit a crime, you must be punished. That is the law. Finished and *klaar*. ...[Interjection.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): That is not the debate.

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): It is shocking that during the days of 16 Days of Activism, hon members complain about a fine being too high ...[Interjection.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): That was not a debate! The hon member must listen.

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Do not commit a crime. It is that simple. Be honest. Hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, hon Temporary Chairperson?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): [Interjections.]... listening, thank you.

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): [Interjections.]... like yesterday. He alluded to something ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson?

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): He said in the Eastern Cape and the Northern Cape, people could travel. Brilliant point, well done! Thank you for raising that, but what the hon Dugmore failed to inform this House, why can people not travel between the Eastern Cape and the Northern Cape on the trains, in the Eastern Cape? Why can they not, hon House members? They cannot

because the trains are not working. They cannot because of attacks on 150 Intercape busses. So, the reason they cannot is because the ANC collapsed the trains. The ANC collapsed the security cluster, allowing 150 attacks on busses. It is terrible, it is unacceptable, it will never be okay in this province.

The DA in this House fully supports the Budget Vote of R9,4 billion. It is the right thing to do. We will continue to invest in this province. I thank you.
[Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Mackenzie.
[Interjections.] Hon members, can we settle down? [Interjections.] Hon members! [Interjections.] I now recognise hon Minister Simmers.
[Interjections.] Hon member Marran? [Interjections.] Hon member Marran!
...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Mackenzie, Hon member Marran! You can move out and have that conversation as we continue with the business of the House. I recognise hon Minister Simmers.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Hon Temporary Chairperson, there is a hand online.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson? Hon Temporary Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, hon Minister. I recognise hon member Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Yes, hon Temporary Chairperson, my hand has been up actually even by the time hon Mackenzie was making his statement.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, you are not audible, we cannot hear you. [Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): And he mentioned ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: We cannot hear you.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Can you hear me now, hon Temporary Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Try again.

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Can you hear me now?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, I hear you. You can continue, hon member ...[Interjection.]

Mr L L MVIMBI (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, there is a statement that hon Mackenzie has raised that seems to be casting aspersions on the hon Makamba-Botya, saying that she is actually, hon Makamba-Botya being a woman. and I do not know whether he is raising it to her because she is a woman or if it is actually ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, hon member Makamba-Botya, I recognise you.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): No, hon Temporary Chairperson, thank you very much. I think this House has actually been degenerating lately. Why are we always subjected to this kind of treatment by the DA? However, we have been raising our hands on the hybrid and no one is recognising it, and the House is continuing as normal as if we do not exist. So, my point of order does not even – it is actually null and void because the person who was on the podium is no longer speaking.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. Hon members do not make it difficult for the Temporary Chairperson because this is a political debate. So, try to work with the Temporary Chairperson not to give a template of what to be said, what not to be said because it is not up to the Temporary Chairperson to give direction of what is it that needs to be said when there is a political debate. So, help me ...[Interjection.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): All hands, hon Temporary Chairperson,

must be recognised. When we raise our hand on the hybrid, we must be recognised ...[Interjection.] with the people in the Sitting.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, you cannot interject. That is why you have got an option of being in the House so that we can continue having that point of order. But while I am still talking to your point of order, there is no point of order of the point of order. So, you are going to allow the Temporary Chairperson to continue and there are some hands that are raised in the House. I recognise you. You had your chance. Hon Chief Whip of the Opposition, I recognise you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, an order was raised by hon Mvimbi saying hon Mackenzie has cast an aspersion on hon Makamba-Botya. And I am wanting to implore you to rule on that matter because it is a serious one. We are a non-sexist society and as such, we should be accepting the LGBTQ2I if it exists. Now, such a statement is insulting, and it cannot be said in this democratic House, hon Temporary Chairperson. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, I heard hon member Mvimbi, and I did not pick that up. So, I am going to – I will come back. I am going to ask the Table staff to assist me because I did not hear when that was said and then I will come back to the House on that after I got the response if Table staff heard that. So, hon member Mackenzie, I hope after I ruled on that – like I said we are not going to talk now to what I have just

ruled on. Thank you very much. Hon Minister, I recognise you.

The MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, first and foremost, I welcome all the comments by all the political parties. I take note. I also note that the two key issues which the majority of the parties flagged pertain to matters that I believe my colleague, hon Minister Mitchell, has actually answered in this House or in written format ...[Interjection.] So, as such I will not regurgitate what my hon colleague has responded over the last few weeks.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, I think give that the Standing Committee Chairperson has invited matriculants from Mitchells Plain, I think it is quite eloquent that I believe they impart from this House with some words as to put them on their life's journey which they are about to begin. Through you, hon Temporary Chairperson, to the members in the gallery. I would love to just close off with a quote of Michael Jordan which you earlier could not hear due to the noise in the House [Interjections.] but it is quite – I think it is quite fitting for your life journey, which is about to begin post Grade 12, and he said:

“Obstacles do not have to stop you. If you run into a wall, do not turn around and give up. Figure out how to climb it, go through it or work around it.”

Because you come from an area which is faced with so many social

challenges, yet out of despair, through you hon Temporary Chairperson, one can find hope, hope through a Government that creates opportunities for all its people.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, at this junction I would really like to thank in his absence, the Standing Committee Chairperson, and the members of the Standing Committee for a sterling job that they have done in the oversight over myself, but also over my colleague, hon Minister Mitchell. But I would also like to thank each and every official in the Department of Transport and Public Works for the hard work that they have put in this year, to ensure that we continue to deliver quality and reliable infrastructure to our citizens.

But, as I stated in my speech, hon Temporary Chairperson, this Department also received a tenth consecutive clean audit status, which is no easy feat given that they are the only provincial department of its nature to have done this. It speaks to proper and sound collective leadership. But it is very seldom I single out a member of a group that is part of that leadership. However, I really have to convey a special thank you to our CFO who is present here, Adv Smit, who ensured that even while she was going through difficult health challenges, she stayed committed to ensure that this Department received a clean bill of health for the tenth consecutive time, and I want this House to note that she did that. [Applause.]

So, hon Temporary Chairperson, in conclusion to all the hon members in the House, on behalf of Vote 10, on behalf of the Department, I want to wish you

all the time to rest well and spend time with your loved ones. But also, to the HOD and the team because 2023 is going to be a very interesting year, as we now migrate from Transport and Public Works to the Department of Infrastructure, to ensure that the Department which was based on excellence, goes beyond that and even more because they have a sound history of doing that. Thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister. That concludes the debate on this Vote. The Secretary will read the Seventh Order of the Day.

[Debate concluded.]

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 13 – Cultural Affairs and Sport – *Western Cape Adjustment Appropriation Bill* [B3-2022]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I now recognise hon Minister Marais.

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Hon Temporary Chairperson, ...[Inaudible.] I will start again. Hon Temporary Chairperson, as we near the end of 2022, we can see the positive signs of recovery after the devastating effects of the COVID-19 pandemic. Over the past year, we have seen the return of live audiences in our theatres and spectators at our sporting events. This has brought a much-needed boost not only to the economy, but to the mental and physical wellbeing of the people of the

Western Cape.

As I now present the Adjusted Estimates Budget for the 2022/2023 financial year, I wholeheartedly thank each and every one of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport team for the spirit in which we tackled this year. It was a year of rebuilding and recovery, and we did this by rolling out our programmes, many of which were suspended during the pandemic. Led by our Head of Department, Mr Guy Redman, we continued meeting our mandates. With a budget increase of R554 000 from approximately R937,9 million to R938,4 million, we take our leading role in wellbeing seriously and we are committed to working innovatively to ensure that we can continue to deliver our important services to our communities.

We are very excited to see the increase of sporting events happening in our province and we are grateful to have received R3 million from the Department of Economic Development and Tourism and R2 million from provincial funding, to be able to support a Formula E World Championship which will take place in Cape Town for the first time, in February 2023.

We have been focusing on keeping our youth safe and positively engaged in a period after formal school hours. We have received R950 000 from the Department of the Premier for the Shukuma YearBeyond programme, a high school programme to enhance wellbeing and safety at schools, using unemployed youth as facilitators. The programme is offered in the Cape Metro and Cape Winelands in 46 schools. It provides a first work

opportunity to 189 youth.

An amount of R2,7 million was received from the Department of Education for the purpose of furthering the rollout of the Western Cape education at home learning YearBeyond programme. This programme works in 18 community hubs with 51 schools, providing support for 3 000 at risk learners, homework support, parental workshops and fun afterschool activities in parks and community facilities in targeted communities. At the same time, it has provided a first work opportunity to 322 youth.

We have sadly seen that the Philippi Stadium has been vandalised to such an extent that it cannot be used to host any football matches or other events. To this end, R3,9 million has been realigned in the Provincial Revenue Fund to contribute towards the repairs required at the stadium.

The Department received R4,5 million in lieu of a rollover application of committed funds for goods not delivered by end of the 2021/2022 financial year. The rollover mainly related to the impact of COVID-19 on global supply chains in the related industries which affected the delivery of the goods procured.

I now take this opportunity to thank all our stakeholders, partners, and Cabinet colleagues for helping us improve Sport and Cultural Affairs in the Western Cape by sharing experiences and new ways of thinking and ...[Audio distorted.] service of all those who call the province home. We express our

gratitude for the collaborative efforts to enable a safer sporting environment, creating a culture more representative of our population with policies developed to safeguard, protect, and uplift the often marginalised. We appreciate the Standing Committee and our Chairperson, hon member Gillion Bosman, for holding us accountable in the oversight role as together we work towards a socially inclusive, active, and connected Western Cape. I thank you. [Applause.]

[Mr A P Van der Westhuizen takes the Chair.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister. The next speaker is hon Kama. ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It is the best of all the ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No, no. No! No conversing aloud. There is a new Temporary Chairperson. [Laughter.] Thank you. [Interjections.] No. Thank you.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, if the kids or the school kids that were in the gallery were not brought here to just watch hon Mackenzie debating, they would have been very shocked at the claims that the hon MEC is making. In actual fact, they would have felt well represented when I debate.

I think, hon Temporary Chairperson, let me start by noting and congratulating Stephanie Frappart from France, Neuza Back and Karen Diaz, who were the first women to be match officials of a Men's Soccer World Cup yesterday. The ANC rejects this Budget Vote because we are realising that this Government does not realise the importance of this Department in fighting many social ills and advocating for many programmes like that of the emancipation of women through sports and if that was the case, it would have been reflected in this Budget.

The people of the Western Cape are misled to believe that the Department's budget has been adjusted and increased by over R554 000, whereas in reality R3,9 million of the much-needed funds have been shifted out of the Department. Such decisions impede the Department from realising its full potential in fulfilling the vision inspired priorities VIP 1 of inclusive communities and VIP 3 of empowering people. The HOD and senior management are on record saying that they would love this Department's budget to be increased to at least over R1 billion. The hon MEC herself, vowed to go to the Treasury to request additional funding for the case for sport and to our disappointment, not only has the hon MEC failed to act on this commitment, but her Department continues to show disregard, disrespect and disdain for sport as proved by the budget cuts in this Budget.

The Budget for Sport is reduced from R69 million to R67 million. Over and above this, the Budget for school sport and the MOD programme has also been reduced. This disregard for sports does not only end with the reduced

budgets. Sports federations in the province and especially, the South African Football Association (SAFA) continue to be undermined by the hon MEC and this Department.

A case in point in this Department is the Department's meeting with the United Coalition of Sport and Community Based Organisations yesterday, which was meant to discuss the capture of sport by the Department. It is highly disappointing that the Department sent junior officials to the meeting. The highest ranking official in Sport was a Deputy Director. There was no HOD, no Chief Director and no Directors at all. The constituency of SAFA alone, hon Temporary Chairperson, has 86 000 members in the Metro which are young people and have about 150 000 members provincially, and yet, it is treated with such disrespect.

Hon Bans before me, was so passionate about the issue of Sport Infrastructure that is falling apart across municipalities. We will continue to drive this issue until the hon MEC, and the Department start to take it seriously. It is disappointing that the R3,9 million for the repairs of the Philippi Stadium is still not spent and sent to the Provincial Revenue Fund.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, along with sport, youth development is another casualty. Every time we pose questions in this Parliament about the challenge of social ills in the province and how the Safety Plan will address these challenges, whether we ask Social Development about drugs and substance abuse or Community Safety about youth gangs, all fingers always

point to the hon MEC Marais' Department. Having gone through this Department's budget it is highly disappointing that youth development is not prioritised.

The ANC raised its concerns about this in the Committee and we were shocked to learn that the Transversal Youth Development initiatives are handled by a junior Youth Services Director in the Department. Youth unemployment initiatives should go far beyond the YearBeyond programme and Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP) jobs. As the ANC, we are advocating for the Department's Youth Services office to be expanded into a full directorate for youth, with a sufficient budget and for every department in the province to have at least a Director for Youth Development Projects.

The challenge of social ills including high youth participating in gangs, drugs and violent crimes is as a result of this Province's lack of prioritisation of Youth Development, not the Police. Hon MEC, in March, when you acted in the position of former hon MEC Fritz, you promised to create opportunities for the 1 000 Safety Ambassadors that were fired from the Department of Community Safety. To this day, only 50 of those were recruited and over 900 are roaming in the streets and maybe recruited into gangs.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, it is gravely concerning that the Department's Compensation of Employee's Budget has been reduced by over R1 million, while there are over 900 youth that the Department knows about that are jobless because of the DA Government in the province. The fallacy of a

Government for Jobs is getting exposed and crumbling. This Provincial Government, through these unsustainable projects, is killing jobs.

As expected, the budget for Cultural Services is reduced. We suspect that the Department does not take the programme seriously, hence its budget is always cut. However, we welcome the budget increase for the overall budget increases for Library Services. Our demands are clear: no library must be closed down in the province. Should the hon MEC fail to stop municipalities, like the City of Cape Town, from closing down libraries, we will take this as a declaration of war, and we will be more than happy and prepared to meet her in the battlefield. We note the R8,6 million shifted to the Premier's Department. The same Premier's Department has failed to ensure that all rural libraries are connected to the internet through the provincial broadband rollout. This amount must ensure that all rural libraries have internet access and are fully furnished.

In closing, hon Temporary Chairperson, I must thank my organisation for deploying me into this portfolio. We would like to state upfront that I look forward to a cordial relationship with the hon MEC. This is not to be construed, however, as asking for a friendship. I will not be friends with an MEC when her Department has failed to ensure the respect, for example, of *ulwaluko*, the cultural rite of passage practiced by several cultures in the province, including AmaXhosa, AmaHlubi and Sothos. What the Stellenbosch Municipality and that organisation of white people and what they are doing there, is serious provocation. The hon MEC must ensure that

this does not happen again.

I also want to call on you to put pressure on hon MEC Bredell, to accelerate the implementation of the Traditional and Khoi-San Leadership Act in the Province. Hon MEC, many young people do not believe that or do not have confidence that you are going to be able to lead them in this portfolio. They believe that you are too old for the portfolio. To a certain degree I agree with them and hope that you can prove them wrong [Interjections.] through showing more passion for sports, arts and culture.

For the above reasons, hon Temporary Chairperson, the ANC finds it quite impossible to support this Budget. Thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Thank you, hon Kama. Next up, is the hon Makamba-Botya, who is joining us online.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Hon Temporary Chairperson, thank you very much. The EFF is very disappointed to see that the Budget of the Department is only increased by a mere R554 000. This is the Department that should strive for inclusivity in sport, however the reality on the ground is quite the opposite.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, There are no sporting facilities in most townships in the province. This is also the case when it comes to township schools. Without these facilities, it is impossible to participate in different

sporting codes. This kind of social exclusion must be condemned. Hon Temporary Chairperson, every year when these issues are raised in the House, we are often told about the lack of available spaces in townships to build the required infrastructure.

The structural landscape of colonialism still persists to this day. Black and poor people are allocated far away from areas with good sporting facility resources. The very same Provincial Government is not doing much when it comes to responding to issues of spatial planning and making sure that new developments do include sporting facilities adjacent to them.

On that note, hon Temporary Chairperson, the EFF does not support this Vote. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Makamba-Botya. The next on the list is the hon Marais, but I do not see you online, sir. Hon Marais? Pass, which brings us to the hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson and good afternoon to you, good afternoon to our hon colleagues on the righthand side and a very warm welcome to hon Kama, the new shadow MEC for Cultural Affairs and Sports. We sincerely hope you enjoy your time with us. We know you have not been able to make it to that many meetings, but we do understand there is a World Cup on, and you are very passionate about sports.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Bosman? Hon Marran

...[Interjection.]

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Bosman or hon Baartman?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Bosman, just please take your seat. Hon Marran, according to the Rules there is no conversing aloud in this House.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Okay, sir.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No conversation, thank you.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): It was not ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I heard you, hon Marran. Do not disrespect the Temporary Chairperson. I do not want to invoke that Rule. [Interjections.] Thank you, thank you. Last warning and hon Lekker, please respect the Temporary Chairperson in terms of Rule 45. Thank you. [Interjections.] Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Are you naming me? [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Not yet. Last warning.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Last warning?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Correct. [Interjections.] Thank you.
[Interjections.] Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, do not threaten me.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Do not threaten me, hon Temporary Chairperson.
[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Do not threaten me. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Do not threaten me.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Lekker ...[Interjection.]
Please. Hon Lekker? Hon Makamba-Botya, hon Nosipho, please.
[Interjections.] Can I ...[Interjection.] I ...[Interjection.] You are not
supposed to.

“If a member is found in contempt of or is disregarding the

authority of the Chair, or that a member's conduct is grossly disorderly, the Presiding Officer may order the member to withdraw immediately from the precincts of the Provincial Parliament for the remainder of that day.”

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): How could you arrive ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...[Interjection.] that hon Temporary Chairperson!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Hon Lekker?
[Interjections.] Hon Lekker, your point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I would like to raise an order on you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: A point of order, honourable?
...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you. Hon Lekker
...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You are recognised.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, I would like to bring to your attention ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...that intimidating hon members ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...and threatening hon members, reading the Rules incorrectly and applying those Rules incorrectly so, is also a treacherous crime.

An HON MEMBER: Treacherous?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): So, if you do so, hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...we will meet you wherever you want us to meet.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We will go to the Conduct Committee with you as well.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Hon Lekker, I believe that you are at this time grossly disorderly ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Haibo!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...and I therefore order you to withdraw ...[Interjections.] to withdraw from the House. [Interjections.] Thank you. [Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): What is this now?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon members, the House suspended for a minute to allow the hon member just to withdraw. [Interjections.] Table staff, please assist the hon member to withdraw. The House is suspended.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, this is not

your House! We are not in a dictatorship.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Can we please ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...[Inaudible.] our hands!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Can we please just ask that the video feed be cut off. The House is suspended for a minute to allow the hon member.

[Business of the House was suspended at 16:15 and resumed at 16:27.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon members. Business will resume. Hon Lekker, in terms of Rule 45, I have ordered you to withdraw as you were challenging and disregarding the authority of the Temporary Chairperson, before we suspended the proceedings. Will you please withdraw?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Can I ask a question, hon Temporary Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Will you please withdraw?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Inaudible.]... a question, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Will you – only answer ‘yes’ or ‘no’. It is not a debate ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, I have a question. Did you or did you not get advice from the Tabling staff not to take the position that you have taken right now?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I am not going to be drawn, but the answer is no ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I did not get that ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Did you get the advice from the Tabling staff ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Point of order, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...not to rule on [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...what you have ruled on.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I am now invoking ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You are the hon Temporary Chairperson of the House ...[intervenes]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...the Rule 46(1).

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): And there is a Tabling staff that must advise you.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, on a point of order?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I am busy with the first point of order here. [Interjections.]

“If a Presiding Officer is of the opinion that a Member’s conduct is of such a serious nature that an order to withdraw from the Sitting, either from the Chamber or electronic platform, for the remainder of the day’s Sitting is inadequate, the Presiding Officer may name that Member.”

Honourable ...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, on a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...Lekker, I am naming you
...[Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Can we first deal just with this point?
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, no, no, no, on a point of order, hon
Temporary Chairperson. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed? Hon Sayed, I am warning
you as well. [Interjections.] I have made my ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Inaudible.]... warnings.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I have made [Interjections.] I have made
...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Inaudible.]... warnings.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, honourable.

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, on a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed [Interjections.] please withdraw? [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): Point of order, Hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please. Please, withdraw. [Interjections.] Hon Sayed, please withdraw. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA (ANC): On a point of order, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): This is a peaceful meeting ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. [Interjections.] Thank you, please hon members, I have made a ruling. We must first deal with this point of order and then, we will go to the next. Hon Lekker ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, is not ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...Rule 46 has been invoked. Please. Thank you, hon Lekker. I am waiting for you.

An HON MEMBER: Ah, this is not serious. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Sayed. Hon Sayed, please? [Interjections.] Thank you. Hon members, please obey and respect the Temporary Chairperson as per our Rules. [Interjections.] No. [Interjections.] Thank you. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon members. The House will be suspended again just to allow [Interjections.] for these hon members the opportunity to withdraw from the House. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Lekker. [Interjections.]

[Business of the House was suspended at 16:32 and resumed at 16:49.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, you may be seated. Thank you, hon members. Before we proceed with the debate, I want to say that as you may have observed, we have had a discussion amongst the Whips and myself, and we have come to a very collegial agreement.

I am retracting my decisions on Rules 45 and 46, and we have an undertaking that we will all be concentrating on the Business of the House; that we will

be maintaining the decorum for the House for the remainder of the day. We all realise that it has been a very long and tiring day and year and therefore, hon members, we are to proceed with the business of today and therefore, also, the last Order of the Day. Thank you very much for your patience and I am really glad that we were able to come to this agreement. Thank you very much. Hon Bosman, you were on the floor. You are welcome to proceed with your speech.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Inaudible.] [Interjections.] for 24 seconds. [Laughter.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You still have 15 minutes and 15 seconds. You are quite right.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): So, you have taken one minute away. I am being punished. Hon Temporary Chairperson, as I was saying before I was interrupted ...[Audio distorted.] The technology has also decided that we need to end. We have been here too long.

The hon Kama is a new addition to Cultural Affairs and Sport, so we want to also inform him that today is Friday and Fridays in the Cultural Affairs and Sport Committee and across the Western Cape, is netball Friday. And we look forward to the hon Temporary Chairperson allowing us at our next sitting on a Friday, to wear those netball T-shirts. I was scared to wear mine because the hon Leader of the Opposition normally calls us out when we are

not wearing ties or buttoned up shirts. Hon member Dugmore is very particular about that. So, I decided it is best to dress appropriately for the hon Leader of the Opposition. [Laughter.]

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the Western Cape is fortunate to be hosting the Netball World Cup 2023 and that event is testimony to the work done by this Department because the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport plays a critical role in the wellbeing of the people of this province. They encourage excellence and inclusivity. They safeguard the interests of our talented artists and sports people, and their work unites people through sport and culture, to ensure a creative, active, and prosperous Western Cape.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the funds appropriated in this Budget will go a long way in binding our communities together and building a strong and unified nation. And I want to thank hon Minister Marais for launching the first Rule Book of the boxing sport in isiXhosa this last Wednesday because that goes a long way in binding our communities together.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, this week as well provides a perfect example of this Department in action. This week, the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport in partnership with international organisations, such as the British Council, hosted the 8th ArtsAbility Festival at the Artscape Theatre. The African continent's premier festival led by differently abled performers. ArtsAbility seeks to not only provide an inclusive space for artists experiencing disability to express themselves, but also to mobilise their work

towards greater inclusion and transformation in the arts sector. Bringing to life the work of this Department in a ...[Audio distorted.] amazing performances that we saw last Tuesday.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Can we just get all the microphones muted? There seems to be an echo.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): It seems to happen when I speak. I tend to disrupt the House without even saying anything. [Laughter.] As I said, hon Temporary Chairperson, this performance that we saw on Wednesday night at the Artscape theatre, launching the ArtsAbility Festival, brought together the work of this amazing Department through the performance, showcasing the joint collaborative performance of an opera written by internationally renowned composer, Paola Prestini. It incorporated not just dance and opera, but it had a partnership that saw the Artscape associated Unmute Dance Company working in collaboration with international partners, Sensorium Ex from New York and Diversity in Dance from the United Kingdom, to create what was truly a magical experience.

I encourage all hon members, like I invited all hon members in Monday's meeting, to attend the ArtsAbility Festival which closes today. Hopefully, if we get out of here in time, hon member Kama can still catch some of those performances because the member acting for him on Monday probably did not mention that that invitation was extended.

This Adjustment Budget lends further support to projects like this one, by providing an increase of more than R554 000 or a 0,6% increase to the Main Budget. I believe that this Department should receive more funding, but we must acknowledge the stark reality that we face in this country with the Equitable Share continually decreasing and in this budget decreasing by over R574 million in the Main Budget. This is in line with what we already know. The Western Cape always gets far too little of the National Provincial Equitable Share. But, hon Temporary Chairperson, the Western Cape has once again come to the rescue to fill the gaps left by our flailing National Government. This Province has provided additional funding through financing from the Provincial Revenue Fund to supplement some of the gaps left by our failing and flailing National Government.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, with all this doom and gloom, I am still encouraged by this Department because they continually demonstrate the ability to innovate and to do more with less. Despite a decline in funding to Library Services and Archives, this Department continues to deliver these vital resources to our people wherever they find themselves. As the Cluster A Committee member who are present will attest, we saw a beautiful, functionally built library at the New Horizons Library in Plettenberg Bay. That being one of six libraries in the Bitou Municipality. It is a library that is led by not just innovative staff members, but also a library that shows collaboration by working with the Municipality and working with the Department of the Premier. I am sorry, hon Temporary Chairperson, is that question from hon Dugmore?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Dugmore, please? Hon Dugmore.

Mr G BOSMAN (DA): I know that you will deal with the Leader of the Opposition quite firmly, so [Laughter.] I do ask for your protection. [Laughter.] As I was saying, hon Temporary Chairperson, the New Horizons Library showcases a partnership between the Department of the Premier through the Cape Access Centre being integrated into the main function of the library. When we were there, we were shown around the library, the Access Centre, but we were also told about the support that staff at that library gets from the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport. And we know that they will now be launching a robotics lab with further support from this Department.

What they also told us is that they have appointed 13 YeBoneers and I was very delighted to hear that YeBoneers are young people who form part of the YearBeyond programme, that affords youth aged 18 to 25 employment and learning opportunities. Collectively, our libraries have 19 701 active members in the Plettenberg Bay area, a number that is rapidly growing as people return to libraries after COVID-19.

When we vote on this Budget today, I would encourage all hon members present here to think about the nearly 20 000 people who now have access to a world of knowledge through the efforts of this Department. Think of the performance on stage at the Artscape, at the EON, at the Fugard Theatre, at

the Baxter Theatre, at theatres in our communities like the KKNK Festival, like the Riel Dance Festival and think about how these people are working hard towards inclusivity and accessibility and ask yourself what more can we do to support their work, to create an accessible and an inclusive province in the Western Cape.

I encourage all hon members to think about the heritage, which is being preserved by this Department, that is being protected to ensure that our young people are able to access that, like we saw in how this Department is trying to assist Robben Island as well. This is a good example of how this Department has an integrated approach to Youth Development. The Integrated Youth Development Strategy that is housed in this Department gives young people a seat at the table and it does not set a separate table for young people like you want us to do, hon member Kama, through you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, as a fairly new Chairperson to this portfolio, I want to say a very special thank you to the members of this Committee for welcoming me back to the Cluster A because they have shown me that we can work collaboratively, and we can refocus our oversight model to ensure that Cultural Affairs and Sport's successes are highlighted as we do oversight. I want to thank all the members not just for their support in the Committee meetings, but also for engaging and bringing issues and I hope, through you, hon Temporary Chairperson, that the hon Kama will be as excited as hon member Bans when she sent through her list of what the Committee is going

to do. I hope that there will be some space for your ideas as well because we are very busy up until the end of the year. [Laughter.]

I want to thank, hon Temporary Chairperson, the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport because it is one department where every time through the hon Minister, we get immediate feedback on issues that were raised. This Department is ably led by a young, energetic, vibrant Minister who can take anybody on whether it is in a boxing ring or whether it is on a stage. Thank you, hon Minister Marais, for your active leadership in this vital portfolio.

A very special thank you, hon Chairperson, goes to Mr Wasi Matthews and Mr Ben Daza for their commitment to excellence and for ensuring that we are always able to do our work, even when we do not get lamb shanks. [Interjections.] We are grateful, we are very grateful for their work.

Hon House Chairperson, like I said earlier we welcome hon Kama as the new shadow MEC for Cultural Affairs and Sports. [Interjections.] We know that he will use not just his knowledge of soccer, but also he will use some of his community safety experience to ensure that the young people in this province, that the old people in this province and that the in-betweeners receive cultural affairs and sports facilities that are fit for them.

We know that when he joins us for the Provincial Parliamentary Netball Tournament at Leeuwenhof he will go up against our Minister or he will send the Leader of the Official Opposition to participate in that game.

[Interjections.]

Hon House Chairperson, it goes without saying that I support Vote 13 in its entirety, and I hope that all members of this House will join us as members of the Committee in thanking not just to the Department, but in thanking all the civil servants for their hard work throughout this year ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

Mr G BOSMAN: ... because it is the officials in the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sports that revived Cultural Affairs and Sport after we came back from COVID.

With that said, the Democratic Alliance fully supports this Vote, and we fully support the hard working men and women in the arts, culture, sports and heritage sector. I thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Yes!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Bosman, which brings us back to Minister Marais. [Applause.]

Your microphone, hon Minister Marais. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS AND SPORT: Thank you. Hon

member Kama, I just want to say at least you will be able to understand the boxing rules when we get into the ring. [Laughter.]

†Ek wil net sê baie dankie vir elkeen se bydrae, vir julle passie vir die Sport en Kultuur-sektor. [I just want to say thank you for everybody's contribution, for your passion for the Sport and Culture sector.]

I take note of all the comments, even though some are negative, but we take note – the big thing for our departments, we really do not have all the money, but we do what we can with what we have [Interjections.] and I must say thank you to the Standing Committee for your role [Interjections.], for our Chairperson, your passion. †Dis rêrig 'n riem onder die hart. Dankie vir wat jy self doen en die nuwe dimensie wat jy bring aan die Komitee. [It's really very encouraging. Thank you for what you do yourself and the new dimension you bring to the Committee.]

Then I also want to say our Department or in the Western Cape we work very hard and diligently to ensure a safe rite of passage to all our initiates and we did give a report back to hon member Pat Lekker, maybe she can just hand it over to you as well or you can have a discussion and we are very proud that we do not have any deaths in the province and that we speak regularly to our initiation forums. We had a national initiation forum here yesterday afternoon for a fact-finding mission and at this moment they are very happy, and I really wish everyone well for the rest of this initiation season. Thank you so much. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Well done, hon Minister!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon members, thank you, hon Minister. That concludes the debate on this Vote.

The Secretary will now read the Eighth and last Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament – Western Cape Adjustment Appropriation Bill [B 3-2022]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon House Chair, Ministers, members and guests, and to my Opposition on the benches as well as online.

It is my pleasure to participate in the debate on Vote 2: Provincial Parliament. I stand here today as the Deputy Speaker of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament in terms of Rule 26 and not as the Executive Authority of this Vote.

The Western Cape's Main Budget of R176 502 000 was supplemented with rollovers of R10 323 000 and a revenue retention of R350 000 from the

previous financial year, leaving the Western Cape Provincial Parliament with an adjusted appropriation of R187 175 000.

The rollover of the 2021/22 financial year was mainly allocated as follows:

- Programme 1: Governance leadership and administration of R5,129 million rollover from the previous financial year to cover for committed projects, which were not completed in the 2021/22 and priority projects identified.
- Programme 2: R1,847 million to supplement the Standing Committee budget.
- Programme 3: Public engagement of R3,237 million rolled over from the previous financial year to cover for committed projects which were not yet completed in 2021/22 and priority projects identified.
- Programme 4: Members support of R110 000 rolled over from the previous financial year to provide for members' travel to WCPP events.

Major shifts include the provision of R2,559 million for:

- Basement shelving and partitioning fourth and sixth floor;
- Legal fees;
- Life insurance;

- Online subscriptions;
- Computer services;
- PEO workshops; and
- Members' second dwelling.

R268 000, provision for early retirement due to ill health of a staff member and leave gratuity pay-outs, and R2,412 million for closed circuit television, wave readers and laptop refreshing.

I would like to take this opportunity, hon House Chair, to thank the POC for their thorough engagements during the year and the frankness in which we could conduct our business.

A special word of thanks is also extended to hon Minister Wenger and her team of finance specialists for our fruitful engagements and their appreciation for the peculiar needs of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament.

I would also like to place on record my appreciation for the work done by the Secretary to the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, Mr Romeo Adams and his administration, for the exceptional support given to us not only as at a Speaker's level and Speaker's office level, but really to the entire administration. They have really had to pivot, adjust and be resilient with all the constant changes.

On a special note I would like to publicly thank the staff in the Office of the Speaker for the work that they have done diligently over the three years and for their dedication to the Speaker's Office. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The next speaker is the hon member Lekker. Hon member Sayed, point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Yes, yes. Hon Chair, just for noting, I do not want to be, I just want to place on record on behalf of the African National Congress that Rule 26, we do not want disruptions, we can continue. Rule 26 quoted by the hon Deputy Speaker does not apply because there is no Speaker currently. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, noted. Hon member Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Thank you, hon Chairperson.

Hon Chairperson, I would like to point out that the African National Congress has really with pain endured a process where there has been instability in the House and going forward we would like to place on record that as members of this House we all had a responsibility of ensuring that the decorum of the House stays as it is. However, as and when we tend to ignore

the Rules that govern this House, we are bound to have instability.

Now, hon Chairperson, allow me to say that the ANC must rise today and reject this Budget Vote, while also stating what is supposed to be the obvious. We have a Provincial Parliament with no Speaker. It is therefore an anomaly that this budget is introduced by the Deputy Speaker.

The Deputy Speaker in terms of Section 13 of the Financial Management of Parliament Act is not the Executive Authority of Parliament and should not be sponsoring this budget.

Knowing full well that the DA thinks nothing of using taxpayers' money to fund their legal battles and defend corrupt DA councillors, like the one in the City of Cape Town, the ANC wishes to place on record the maladministration that is currently taking place in this Parliament.

We are voting on a Budget Vote of an institution that has no Executive Authority. This is against the law, but so much for the DA respecting the rule of law.

As the hon member Dugmore pointed out yesterday, the Provincial Constitution is clear, the Provincial Parliament must elect a Speaker from amongst its members and at the first sitting after its election or when necessary, to fill a vacancy.

In terms of the Financial Management of Parliament Act, Section 6(2) is clear that the Secretary of Parliament is accountable to the Executive Authority. It would therefore be appropriate to ask who is the Secretary now accountable to if he is running the shop? We find it completely unacceptable that the accounting officer himself would agree to such maladministration.

Be that as it may, hon Chairperson, the ANC wishes to take this opportunity to state emphatically and express our thanks to the loyal and committed non-partisan members of staff of this Legislature. We acknowledge the men and women who work tirelessly to ensure the proper functioning of this Parliament.

However, we are not blind to the DA cadres who are also deployed to the membership of staff of this Legislature. We know people like Unathi [Inaudible.] are appointed here as staff while still be DA operatives in this Legislature. Yet the staff of this Parliament must also know that the DA, whose members are falsely nicely to them, underspend over R4 million in compensation of employment. The staff of this institution must know that the DA-led Parliament refuses to fill vacancies. The ANC has been consistent in complaining about the amount of funds received by the Governance and Administration Programme.

While we note the R10 million in the budget of WCPP, more than half of that increase goes again into the Governance and Administration Programme. Notwithstanding that ICT is covered in this programme, but as with most

budgets the devil is lost in the detail.

If we remember one of the main criticisms of the Main Appropriation in March/April this year, was the fact that this Budget Vote hardly allocates any funding or lack of funding in particular to committee support. It seems our complaints and pleas have fallen on deaf ears. In fact the ANC would want to venture to suggest the reason why the current MEC for Finance appropriated over R10 million in this Adjusted Appropriation to this Legislature was because she was the Chief Whip of the DA then and she knew the plight of this Legislature in fighting for more funds for committees.

Instead over half of that Adjusted Appropriation is now falling into the black pit called Programme 1 and no additional funds have been allocated to committees in this Adjusted Appropriation. The committees are the engine room of this Legislature.

R31 000 is simply carried over to anticipated travel costs. R77 000 is taken from underspending in COE to compensate staff accompanying us, yet nothing towards ensuring more oversight visits for committee activities.

The ANC must also express its dissatisfaction of the use of taxpayers' money. R402 000 in total for the CCMA pay-out due to the lack of planning on the part of the Parliamentary Administration. Again I wish to appeal to members of the DA, do not allow factional fights in your party to compromise the running of this House.

DA factional fights have prevented you from appointing a new Chief Whip. DA factional fights have seen you get rid of the Speaker of this House. DA factional fights have impacted on the business of this Legislature. Protect democracy, it is fragile. The ANC cannot support this budget. I thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Lekker.

The next speaker is the hon member Makamba-Botya who will be joining online.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you very much, hon House Chair †andazi sifeke nini kule-vouto ngoba asinayo i-Speaker]

[I do not know how we arrived to this Vote, because we do not have a speaker.]

Hon House Chair, I find it very strange that we are dealing with this Vote, but then we do not have a Speaker. The Section 111 of South African Constitution makes it clear that at the first sitting of the House, members elected in this House must elect a Speaker. The Speaker must remain until he or she is removed from the House by the resolution of the House. Hon House Chair, the Rules envisage that there should always be a Speaker. When one is removed then another one must be elected.

Hon House Chair, Rule 22.1 states that whenever necessary to elect a Speaker, the Secretary must inform the House accordingly.

So now since the DA did not have what it takes to remove the Speaker through proper constitutional channels, we find ourselves in a situation where necessity has kicked in for the Secretary to inform the House regarding the election of the Speaker. However, what is shocking is that the Secretary is not doing that.

Hon House Chair, it is now clear that no one follows the Rules of this House anymore. People take instructions from the kitchen of Madam Helen Zille. Hon House Chair, the Constitution of this country and the Rules of this House do not permit for us to go this long way without the Speaker. We are currently in a train which we do not know where it is heading as no one can detect where this train must go.

So on that note, hon House Chair, we are actually operating in an illegal Sitting that is leaderless. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Makamba-Botya.

The next speaker is the hon member Maseko.

Ms M L MASEKO: Thank you very much, hon House Chair. [Interjections.]

Hon House Chair, I just want to assist a little bit before I start with my debate for informing the hon members from the Opposition that the Secretary has always been accountable to the House. It is not the DA thing, it is the Rules, and the second one that was mentioned on the Standing Rules 26, it says:

"Whenever the Speaker is absent or otherwise unable to perform the functions of the Office of the Speaker, or whenever that office is vacant:

- (a) The Deputy Speaker or if there is no Deputy Speaker, a temporary presiding officer designated by resolution of the House act as presiding officer."

I just said I will contribute to give for free that info, but, hon House Chair, I would like to start this speech today for this House to remember and celebrate the life and contributions of our DA late Chief Whip, Lorraine Botha.

Lorraine was a phenomenal force within this Chamber. She was quite dignified and strong in her leadership. Her dedication to serving the people of this province and her non-partisan approach, continues to set an example for all of us. Lorraine's unwavering advocacy for the amplification of issues that impact the most vulnerable within this province, will always serve as a

source of inspiration to me and to all of us. This is because she demonstrated through her actions every day that our roles as members of this House went beyond day-to-day and that our responsibilities are to ensure that oversight leads to real tangible change in people's lives.

Hon members, I call on you today to remember that legacy of Lorraine as we debated this Vote and to engage and bring inputs that are ultimately for the betterment of this province and his people.

Hon House Chair, this evening we debate Vote 2 of the Adjustment Appropriation Budget. The Provincial Parliament received an additional allocation of more than R10,5 million over the medium-term budget period. This is a 6,5% increase in the R176,5 million Main Budget for the 2022/2023 financial year.

While this adjusted allocation is welcomed, we must ensure that these funds are utilised in a manner that will maximise this House's ability to perform effective oversight in the interests of the residents and ensures maximum public participation and its processes. The Provincial Parliament's vision is to be regarded as a leading and exemplary Legislature in South Africa and South African region.

In order to achieve this more still needs to be done to ensure that this Parliament works at its most efficient and effective to serve the best interest of the people of Western Cape.

It is also at this point, hon House Chair, that I want to thank the staff of WCPP for their hard work and contributions as we labour to take this Legislature from strength to strength. We acknowledge your support, guidance and dedication.

The Adjusted Allocations per programme will see approximately R5 million towards Governance and Administration. R2,12 million towards Parliamentary Support Services; R3,23 million towards Public Engagement and R285 000 towards Members' Support. [Interjections.]

I want to focus particularly on the Parliamentary Support and Public Engagement Programmes. As members of this House we have an important role as elected public representatives [Interjections.] to ensure that we duly perform oversight of Western Cape Provincial Government and to represent our constituents in the workings of the Provincial Parliament and legislation tabled before it.

So too does the WCPP have an important role in enabling an environment where the nuts and bolts of its operations run effectively to empower this Legislature to become a true Parliament of the people. [Interjections.] Collectively we must ensure that the voice of the people is heard here [Interjections.] in this House.

I am going to repeat that. Collectively we must ensure that the voice of the

people is heard in this House [Interjections.], especially when we deal with critical legislation which has a direct impact on their lives. This Provincial Parliament must simply do better in bringing Western Cape communities along during the deliberation and amendment of legislations. There has to be a concerted effort to ensure that as many residents as possible have an opportunity to give their input into the legislative process, be it in person, in writing or via digital representations.

I therefore note the efforts of the WCPP administration to get the ball rolling on the oversight and public participation front. [Interjections.] Having already spent 46,17% of their R25,958 million adjusted budget for Programme 2, Parliamentary Support Services with the WCPP's projected expenditure in the last two quarters of the 2022/2023 financial year will include, among others, public hearings and oversight visits, provision of Standing Committee meetings, the continuation of the Hansard translation and transcription services, filling of vacant posts and payments for interpreting and sign language services. [Interjections.]

In terms of Programme 3 public engagement, 41,42% of the R17,459 million adjusted budget for this programme has been spent. During the second half of the 2022/2023. financial year the projected expenditure for this programme will, include among others, filling of vacant posts, provision of public education and outreach programmes, and the finalisation of the WCPP's digital online platform. [Interjections.]

The Parliamentary Oversight Committee has throughout this Sixth Parliament deliberated at length the need for greater community outreach and oversight via committees, the need for greater public participation within legislative processes and the necessity of a full staff complement to boost efficiency. This expenditure can therefore go a long way in addressing this contents as the WCPP prepares for the new parliamentary year in 2023.

During the various international study tours undertaken by the members this year, a number of crucial lessons were taken away in regard to strengthening parliamentary oversight and public engagement, for example, in an effort to optimise public participation, the Welsh Parliament established a body called "The Citizens Assembly". This body seeks to encourage engagement with the Legislature through a strategically selected microcosm of their diverse constituencies.

There were also important take-aways from the Scottish Parliament regarding the management of petitions via its digital programme and during the Australian study tour we were once again reminded about the importance of Parliament engaging the public in decision-making [Interjections], as well as practical guidance in understanding one's audience when engaging in their public participation. [Interjections.]

Now it is time to implement some of these lessons in order to create a more efficient Provincial Parliament. This will require buy-in not just from the Provincial Parliament that is Administration, but also from us as members

from across the political divide.

Hon members, I think we can all agree that when we are divided, chaos and disruptions are the order of the day [Interjections.], but when we work together and cooperate the work of this Provincial Parliament continues without interruption.

In that breath I would like to take this moment to commend the members of this Committee for their cooperation and input. While we do not always agree, we should always endeavour to strive above petty political point scoring and for the most part this Committee has always remained consistent in wanting the WCPP to be a world class Legislature with bite and who acts without fear or favour. [Interjections.]

Effective oversight requires political will from both Government and all the political parties represented in this Legislature. I want again to thank the staff of WCPP, those that we see and those who are in the offices that we do not see their faces [Interjections.], the leadership in the WCPP and Secretary that always, always is there to advise when needed and also to thank the Deputy Speaker for being here with us.

It is with this in mind that I urge my colleagues from across the House to support the Vote 2 of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament. [Interjections.] I thank you, hon House Chair. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. [Interjections.] Thank you! [Interjections.] Thank you, hon members. Order! [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.] Order! [Interjections.] Order, hon ... you have had your opportunity.

Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.] No-no ...[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you [Interjections.] ... thank you, hon House Chairperson. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Just a moment. Please, hon members. Is that a point of order? What is your point of order, hon member Marran?

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Chair, is it parliamentary to say that the Speaker, the previous Speaker was a *tati-nati*? [Interjections.] A *tati-nati*. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: What?

Mr P MARRAN: Hon member Bosman ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Is it parliamentary language, is that your question?

Mr P MARRAN: Yes.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: It is, thank you.

Mr P MARRAN: It is parliamentary to ...[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Huh?

Mr P MARRAN: Huh?

An HON MEMBER: Huh? What [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Please take your seat. *Tatinati*, thank you. [Interjections.] Thank you.

Thank you, hon member, please, we have done well. We are at the last speaker. [Interjections.] Hon member Marran? Thank you, hon member Marran. Please. Thank you. Hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon House Chairperson.

I wish to thank all members who have participated in this debate. I note all your contributions made by each and every one of you as members, your criticisms, your praise and the oversight work that you do for this Parliament and for the people of this province. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Hon members, that

concludes the business for the day. [Interjections.] The Secretary will end the meeting and all members will be exited from this Sitting. The House is adjourned. Thank you. See you on Monday.

[The House adjourns at 17:55]