

---

WEDNESDAY, 2 DECEMBER 2020

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams.]

The House met at 10:00.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

**BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

The SPEAKER: You may all be seated.

An HON MEMBER: We have missed you yesterday, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Order! Hon members, welcome, hon the Premier in the Chamber, you are alone here with the Speaker, hon Premier. That is leadership! Thank you very much, and welcome to the hon members who

are all connected virtually.

I wish to indicate to the hon members that as we have been doing since the beginning of lockdown, we are now familiar with the Rules in terms of Rule 1A of the Standing Rules, and of course in terms of the Principles as adopted by this House on how we proceed with the virtual and hybrid sessions. We do not unmute, unless you have something to say and you have been recognised by the Presiding Officer and of course you do not heckle in the virtual platform, and also what is important for the media, please do not activate your camera and do not activate your microphone. We welcome you in this meeting. It is your meeting as much as it is our meeting. As an important stakeholder, as a member of the Fourth Estate, we recognise and appreciate you as a stakeholder.

Now at this stage we are going to proceed with the Business of the Day but before I do that, I see the hand of hon member Dugmore. Hon member Dugmore, I recognise you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, Speaker. Speaker, on a point of order, you were not in the House yesterday when MEC Meyer, responding to an interjection by the Deputy Chief Whip, or not an interjection actually; he was just responding to a request by the Deputy Chief Whip of the ANC to ask a question, whether he was prepared to accept a question. MEC Meyer responded and said: “I do not accept questions from juniors.”

Now firstly in terms of that particular comment MEC Meyer, in terms of our Rules, should have referred to hon Sayed as “an hon member”, and secondly, it is actually, I believe, quite disrespectful. I would like to request, Speaker, that you investigate this matter as to whether the reference to hon Sayed as “junior” was unparliamentary. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore. Hon Wenger, the Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you Mr Speaker, I stand to be corrected, but as I recall the Deputy Speaker had ruled on this matter.

The SPEAKER: Okay, at this stage, thank you hon Chief Whip. I will follow up with the Deputy Speaker, she is coming in later, so this matter must be raised with her again, but I will raise it. I will bring it to her attention. We are not talking about someone that is not going to be here with us and also if there is anything that needs to be resolved, the Deputy Speaker will deal with it as the person who was the Chair at the time.

May I then at this point, if there are no further points, I see the hand of hon Mitchell, but I want to proceed as soon as I hear from hon Mitchell.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you. Thank you, Mr Speaker, as per the Rules, if there is any objection to a ruling made by a Presiding Officer, hon member Dugmore can follow the parliamentary process and

refer the matter to the Rules Committee.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): There was no ruling.

The SPEAKER: Hon Mitchell, there is no ruling that is being questioned, so, but the matter I have already resolved on now, that the Deputy Speaker will deal with it later. I hope we are all on the same page. Thank you very much, hon members. The Secretary will read the Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 1 – Premier – *Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 7–2020].

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Speaker. To hon members online, to the hon Sayed, who is the House with me today, thank you very much for this opportunity to address the House on the Budget Adjustment of the Department of the Premier.

It is strange times in which we live at the moment. In this House we can feel those strange times, three of us as hon members in the House together, one from each side, and the Speaker, but that actually says that perhaps I would like to use this opportunity to say, in these strange times there are good things and bad things, specifically the good things.

We can have meetings like this where half of the House is connected or more than half of the House is connected and we have moved directly into

the Fourth Industrial Revolution as a House and we have done that incredibly well.

I have just completed a President's Coordinating Council meeting this morning. Before COVID-19 that would have been aircraft travel and days worth of notice. Now it can come in late at night, the next morning early in the morning, all the Premiers, Ministers, CoGTA Ministers, MECs all get together and have a quick meeting for an hour and a half. It is a new time in which we live, but I also want to say that there are some tough times as well and perhaps right now I would like to say and use this opportunity to appeal through the constituency leadership that is elected here, the people of this House are elected by the people of this province, we represent the people of this province and we really need, through all of you, to get the behavioural change right with regards to the resurgence of COVID-19 in our province. We see what is happening in the Garden Route, the discussion this morning was about the Garden Route, was about the Eastern Cape, it was about looking at measures in which to curtail the spread of this virus, and of course we all know what to do. The most cost-effective way in curtailing this virus is that we all follow the golden rules. We all make sure that if we feel sick, we stay home. If we have symptoms we only then go for tests. If we are a contact, a direct contact, we quarantine ourselves. We must do this in order to slow the spread.

We all know what to do and I really call on everybody while we are waiting for next year when vaccines look like they are going to be

available, while we are going into the summer season when we need to get the economy going, we also need to do it safely in a new way and my appeal is, through all of you as hon members, please let us make sure that we get the message across, that we get the citizens of this province to join hands with us to slow down the spread. We owe it to the economy. We owe it to those who have lost lives. We owe it to those families who have lost loved ones. We owe it to those who have lost their jobs. Let us get back to a new normal as quickly as possible.

But back to the business of today, hon Speaker, as a province and as a country we face a significant battle. COVID-19 and the hard lockdown have had a severe impact on our economy. At the same time the pressure to deliver has never been higher on this Government. The need for jobs and to deliver education, healthcare and social services has increased while crime and violence continue to be a major concern for most of our residents. This is why as a Province we have identified jobs, safety and dignity and wellbeing as the three areas that we will focus on in our Recovery Plan. For years, Speaker, we have been talking about Government having to do more with less but with provincial budgets and grant allocations being slashed again in favour of an ailing airline or failing policy nationally, this is no longer an option, and we have to make brave decisions.

As a Government we have therefore taken the decision to do less and to do it well to make a real difference in the lives of the residents of this

province.

Hon Speaker, we will continue to manage our finances carefully and transparently. In this regard the Department of the Premier has set the example and is leading from the front.

The Department of the Premier's Budget has been reduced by R73,675 million in this adjustment. The Department has cut its Compensation of Employees' budget by R48,835 million in response for calls to manage the Public Sector Wage Bill. We have done this by taking the decision not to fill certain vacancies and by implementing a wage freeze. We took the difficult decision that all posts that were not filled as at 30 September of this year would no longer be funded.

I must note, however, that Minister Maynier and I on Friday submitted a Section 79 Petition to the President because we believe that the cut to the Provincial Budget totalling nearly R2,4 billion announced by the Finance Minister, Tito Mboweni, is unconstitutional and puts the Province at risk. These pre-emptive cuts assume that the National Government will win their court case against the unions on the wage agreement. Speaker, this will leave the Province in financial trouble if they do not win this case.

To prepare for further cuts and to keep our budgets lean over the medium term, the Department of the Premier will carefully manage all recruitment through a special committee which will determine when immediately

filling a post is critical or whether vacancies can be filled at a later stage.

Hon Speaker, the Western Cape Government has implemented Broadband connectivity in over 1 900 service sites across the province, including corporate sites, schools, health facilities, libraries and the 73 Cape Access Centres, which provide access to Information Technology and IT skills in rural areas.

Free Public WiFi Hotspots have been rolled out at 1 023 sites and more than 1,5 million users have made use of this service, which now gives them three gigabytes of free data service per month. Access to free WiFi during the pandemic has given residents access to information about COVID-19 that they need to keep themselves and their loved ones safe. They have also been able to connect and communicate at a time when they could not see family and friends.

As we focus our attention on recovery and working to claw back jobs that have been lost, free WiFi also gives citizens access to job opportunities, job applications, information and transactional opportunities. Speaker, the COVID-19 lockdown has however had an impact on the timelines and the budgets of our Broadband and public WiFi projects, and we will have to realign budgets for them.

The Broadband Strategy and Implementation Plan, which aims to create access to fast reliability Broadband for all residents, experienced some



challenges due to lockdown restrictions and delays in the approval of municipal applications. This has resulted in the reduction of the 2021 Budget by R30,1 million, which will be added to the MTEF Budget.

The roll-out of WiFi hotspots has also been slower than expected due to the lockdown restrictions. We have met all our targets but the projected underspending of R2,1 million in the current year will be added to the MTEF Budget to ensure that the intended benefits are still delivered to our citizens.

Speaker, the final budget realignment is in the budget for the Children's Commissioner. Of the R8 million allocated to her office, R4,8 million has been surrendered for re-allocation in the 2021/22 Budget. This is due to the set-up of her office, the appointment of staff and the purchase of suitable office space still being in the process.

The Department of the Premier has in the meantime rendered support to help her start work in this important role. We note that some of the positions have already been advertised and the Department of Public Works is in the process of working with Ms Nomdo to find a suitable space for her offices. She is currently based in town but would prefer to be closer to the communities so that the children have easier access to her. Ms Nomdo has travelled around the province conducting community engagements and I am pleased to see that she, and her child monitors, have already made a submission to the Children's Act Amendment Bill and a

submission to the United Nations.

The Western Cape is the first province to appoint a Children's Commissioner and to advocate for the children of this province. Giving a voice to the children of the Western Cape is an important aspect of ensuring their dignity and well-being, and, of course, keeping them safe.

Speaker, of the R14,5 million the Department received through budgetary shifts, R1,6 million will be used to develop software systems for the safety projects, in line with our commitment to rolling out evidence-based and data-driven approach to safety.

A further R1,5 million was shifted to the Department of Economic Development and Tourism for facilitating the establishment of area-based teams for the Safety Plan in support of economic development, through the Economic Development Partnership, the EDP.

We have also repurposed R4,1 million to the Department's 2020/21 Budget for the communications research. This research has informed our COVID-19 communications strategy, and has helped us target and adjust important messaging, based on objective data and behaviour.

Our communications campaign, throughout the COVID-19 pandemic, has been key in bringing about the behaviour change necessary to flatten the curve and equip people with the information they need to keep themselves safe.

In addition, Speaker, to the paid campaign, my office has also launched several in-house communication initiatives throughout the pandemic including a weekly digicon. We will be doing the 30th one this week, Speaker, and daily updates linked to our data dashboard, which was built by the Department of Health and which recently won a silver award for innovation.

Speaker, it did not only win the silver award for innovation competing with the private sector in innovation in our country during this pandemic, they have also just won a second award for that dashboard and that second award is Africa-wide, and so well done to the team for coming up with that kind of innovation during this pandemic and these kind of in-house innovations or our Government innovations have really been something that have stood out for me during this pandemic.

Finally, Speaker, R9,6 million of our Department's budget has been repurposed for ICT software licensing. This is an unavoidable expenditure, which is impacted by the weakening of the rand. The Department did however monitor the fluctuating exchange rate in order to make payment at a time when the greatest savings could be made.

This Department has played a vital role in managing the pandemic, and despite a cut in the budget, continues to play a pivotal role in both our COVID-19 response and our Recovery Plan.

Speaker, in conclusion I would like to use this opportunity first of all to congratulate the Heads of Department who in the Batho Pele Awards received awards. First of all the outgoing Head of Health, Dr Beth Engelbrecht for getting gold, the Head of the Department of Transport and Public Works for a silver award, and the Head of Local Government, HOD Paulse, for the bronze award – all three of these Heads of Department being the top three in our country.

Then of course the best functioning Departments, again this Province walking away with the awards, gold going to the Department of Health as well as to the Department of Transport and Public Works both receiving gold; the Department of Local Government receiving the silver award, and the Department of Environmental Affairs receiving the bronze award. And then last, but definitely by no means least, this Department, the Department of the Premier who walked away with a silver Batho Pele award for service excellence earlier this year and I am immensely proud of the Director-General, Dr Harry Malila and every single Department member for the work that they have done in this really difficult year, in this year where I think everyone has stood up and have been absolutely exemplary in the way that they have helped us as a Government, but also every single citizen in this province managed our way through this pandemic and of course it is by no means over, we still have a way to go. But I really want to thank Dr Malila and the team very much for everything that they have done and are busy doing. Thank you very much, Speaker. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon members, I now recognise the hon, the Leader of the Opposition, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, Speaker. Hon Premier, members, fellow South Africans, I rise today on behalf of the African National Congress to reject this budget vote but just responding to the tired narrative about SAA and it is surprising that the Premier did not listen to the speech of hon Herron yesterday because the reality is that the R10 billion that has been allocated to SAA is actually about business rescue, which the DA themselves supported a short while ago.

Secondly, it is clear that if SAA simply had to be liquidated, besides the impact on jobs and other economic impacts, the liquidation itself would cost R18 billion in terms of liabilities of the South African Government. So that is R18 billion, and finally it has been made clear by both Mr Mboweni and Mr Gordhan that the approach to be followed similar to Telkom is the one that is going to be followed in regard to SAA with bringing the private sector on board, and already there is an expression of interest from Ethiopian Airlines. So, just like the DA tried to hit the Nkandla thing forever and ever thinking that this is going to get votes, this, when one looks at the facts of the situation in the cold light of day, it is clear that the approach taken by the Minister in regard to the SAA, not a

bailout, but in regard to the business rescue process actually making sense if one is willing to listen to facts. But in his last address, Speaker, to the nation on 11 November, our President Ramaphosa said:

“It is our individual actions over the next few weeks and months that will decide the fortunes of our nation. The actions we must take are straightforward, but they are not insignificant. They can and do save lives. Let us continue to work together like the great South African family that we are, to restore, to recover and to rebuild...”

And he concluded, “May God bless our beautiful country South Africa and protect her people.”

Indeed, Speaker, it is our individual actions that will decide the fortunes of our province and our nation. The actions we take here today are straightforward but not insignificant and they can and do save lives.

Coming therefore during the end days of the 16 Days of Activism Against Violence Against Women and Children, the ANC notes with dismay that nearly R5 million will be shifted over to the next financial year from the Children’s Commissioner’s budget and the Premier has referred to this. I want to remind the Premier that it was on 16 April this year that he affirmed and signed off on the appointment of Christina Nomdo as the Children’s Commissioner. That is over six months ago and while we commend the Children's Commissioner for the ground she has been doing

since her appointment, we must continue to raise concerns that the funds allocated to her office seem only to be for salaries and goods and services and have actually not been utilised in the main and that the allocation for staff as we know has not been utilised.

The vulnerability of children during the lockdown is real. A well-capacitated office of the Children's Commissioner cannot be delayed any longer. We welcome the report that the Children's Commissioner is looking for offices which would be more accessible to our communities and we urge that this office is set up without further delay.

While we realise the difficult year that 2020 has been, we note with regret that staff are still seconded to the Commissioner's office via staff from Programme 2 of the Department and that they are assisting the Commissioner, but it is very clear that this in essence is a Chapter 9 Institution and the staff that are required are not only required to be permanent, but they are required to be independent so that they can express the needs of children as they see it. The ANC certainly urges that this important office be given full-time staff with a full-time budget to pursue its constitutional mandate.

At the same time, Speaker, it is opportune to once again raise the issue of the Environmental Commissioner and urge the Premier to take correct and straightforward action as encouraged by Premier Ramaphosa because this is critical to the future of our province. A selling point of the Western

Cape is our bio-diversity. We need to project the Western Cape as a province that is serious about mitigation of the impact of climate change. We need a dedicated focus on our resilience to the impact of drought.

What better way than appointing an Environmental Commissioner whose office is focused on building such resilience to climate change and supporting sustainable development? I call on the Premier to be bold and follow the provisions of the very Western Cape Provincial Constitution. As the ANC we believe that under the DA's leadership that this province is actually in contempt of the Provincial Constitution, and Premier, we believe that the Western Cape has in fact become a constitutional delinquent. We cannot on the one hand promote green technology and a green economy if we do not have the necessary institutional and dedicated focus to ensure that our environment is protected in a sustainable way.

Speaker, while the ANC certainly takes this opportunity to commend the Premier for his leadership during the COVID-19 pandemic, we want to remind him about the problems caused by his own party who from the very outset undermined the national lockdown, railing against the ban on the sale of alcohol; railing against the ban on the sale of cigarettes. We record in fact the confusion caused when the MEC for Health sent out a message questioning the wearing of masks and how long it took this province to deal with that misdirected message.

In the coming days we also see the danger of the rising infections and we



will also be following up on a number of issues that had been flagged in this adjustment. We want to know that in regard to the over R20 million that were paid to non-profit institutions, who these non-profit institutions actually are.

We are interested in the active marketing and promotion of all the public WiFi hotspots because we believe not enough has been done to actually get the message out as to where and how people can access their hotspots. More needs to be done in that regard and we are also interested in the over R4 million spent on research and communications on the campaign during the COVID-19 outbreak.

Following the Resolve Communications debacle in the City and the Hunt Lascaris issue that we experienced in this province, the ANC remains interested in who in fact benefits from these kinds of budgets?

However, we must mention our frustration in the lack of active communication to our communities regarding the public hotspots because in particular how young people can utilise this service.

On the one hand the Premier has argued against a return to a harsh lockdown but called for targeted interventions in hotspot areas. The Premier has called for an end to gatherings of 250 people or more. I want to ask the Premier, does he have a plan to compensate theatres, who have started operating again following social distancing protocols? They were

very hard-hit during the early stages. Premier, will you compensate these theatres given that they were most affected by the early stages of the lockdown and have in fact been complying with the social distancing protocols.

Speaker, the ANC knows that the largest portion of the R73,6 million in this particular vote pertains to the compensation of employees in this Department. While we note the remarks of Minister Mboweni on the Public Sector Wage Bill and also the remarks highlighted by hon Maynier in this House, we must ensure that the cuts to compensation of employees or even the freezing of salaries be done in the most responsible manner. With unemployment as high as it is on the one hand and with the public sector debt also being as high as it is on the other... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon the Leader of the Opposition, unfortunately your time is up.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: We must be able to strike a fair balance. I thank you. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. Hon members, now I recognise hon member Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you very much, Speaker, and greetings to the Premier and other members of the House. The EFF notes the budget from the

Department of the Premier of the Western Cape. However, we are not pleased on how those funds were being utilised as well as being allocated. The money should have been used for the purposes of direct service delivery for the poorest of the people in this province. This would have been in line with the Premier's dream of ensuring that every single person, despite their background, could live a dignified life in this province. However, as we speak, the people of Kraaifontein, the people of Khayelitsha, Mfuleni, Dunoon and other informal settlements in the province do not have basic services such as water to drink, sanitation services and as well as electricity to be able to minimise the contracting of the corona virus in this second wave of the pandemic.

In their attempt to get all this the people of the Western Cape are faced with the situation of either being up in arms against the Government and its violent tendencies against the poor, or they should stay put and live like the slaves that they normally are.

The South African Constitution makes provision for socio-economic rights of the poorest of the people so that they can be provided with basic services, something that the Premier will have to come to terms with and implement if he wants to utter the word "dignity."

As the EFF we reject this budget and we therefore call on the Premier to take note of the kind of service needs that our people are wishing for in areas where there are informal settlements and his Department should

convince the City of Cape Town and other municipalities to withdraw the cases they have against... [inaudible – speaking simultaneously.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you. [Time expired.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Hon members, I now recognise hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, Speaker. We support the vote.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Herron. Hon members, I now recognise hon Mackenzie.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Speaker. The DA also supports this vote, but hon Speaker, it is officially December and South Africans, including myself, love our December holidays. However, we are heading in the wrong direction in our behaviour of COVID-19. Sadly, our numbers are on the increase and we are also heading into Christmas and our favourite time of the year. I personally love Christmas.

I also enjoy long-distance driving and it is normal for many South Africans to start planning our year. However, this is different so, Speaker, we need to do things differently this time around and my message as I start this debate is to urge our fellow Capetonians and everyone travelling that we

do it safely, that we take into account the risks associated with our actions because the more we travel and spend time with our families without masks, without sanitising, without adhering to the Safety Regulations, the more we spread this virus and the riskier it becomes, and the closer it comes to another lockdown. So I think all of us, as members of this House, need to go to our constituents and encourage everybody to adhere to the Safety Regulations to avoid any future lockdown and an unconstitutional National Command Council that treats us like children, to continue with their bad behaviour.

First of all let me just say thank you to the Premier and his team, and obviously the Premier for taking on these unprecedented budget cuts on all of us in this country, because member Dugmore, via you, Speaker, actions have consequences. The actions of bailing out SAA have consequences and part of those consequences are budget cuts on all provinces, including the Western Cape.

Now you can put lipstick on a pig, hon Dugmore, it is still going to be a pig! If you want to give the bailout another name, that is fine, but those billions of rands will still be taken from other provinces or from provinces and it is still going to impact service delivery for other provinces and those municipalities.

So well done, hon Premier and Minister Maynier for not taking this lying down, because that is what you expect from leadership. In times like this

you need good men and women to stand up and Premier Winde, with his Cabinet in the Western Cape, has decided to stand up and take this matter head-on, unlike the other provinces who are sitting down and taking this lying down.

Just on the Ethiopian Airlines, by the way, you know, Ethiopian Airlines, the reason they are so successful is because they appoint competent people. They appoint people that are not corrupt. They do not appoint cadres, so the first point – if this deal with Ethiopian Airlines is going to work, you cannot appoint, what the ANC Cabinet recently done – its appointment of Leonard Ramatlakane to run PRASA; then SAA is still going to fail. So hon Dugmore – the advice would be, via you Speaker – with your colleagues, is that you have to appoint competent people to these SAAs, not cadres who are consistently going to mismanage our State-owned Enterprises. [ 00:46:49] So if this Ethiopian Airlines is going to work, and I doubt it is going to work, and the principle of this R10 billion, hon Dugmore, via you, Speaker, this is not the first time.

Last year we had a special adjustment of R69 billion for Eskom, we still have not seen details of this spend. The year before was another R10 billion; another R2 billion for SABC the other day. There is a consistent behaviour of over R40 billion to SAA and they have not given a return on investment, and that is the principle that we are against, hon Dugmore.

So hon Premier and the team, well done! Take this matter further. You definitely have the support of members of this Parliament because we know the impact in our constituencies, we know the impact in our communities – Policing, Health, Education when it comes to this, and you know, the hon Dugmore, via you Speaker, did mention the Children's Commissioner and I have to applaud the work the Children's Commissioner has done and thank the Department of the Premier and the Children's Commissioner who have come to the Committees in Parliament to present their case and give us status reports on what they were busy with, and it is exciting. I follow her on social media, Facebook, Twitter, I retweet her work. It is exciting to see the quality of the work that is being produced. But we all know, and sadly, hon Dugmore – via you, Speaker – did not use his close relationship with the President wisely.

When the National Department of DPSA did not sign off the structure, as reported in the Standing Committee of which hon Dugmore is a member of, he did not pick up the phone to phone his colleagues in the Presidency to ask the Minister to sign off on the structure. Now we are here today and now he is being sadly hypocritical in what he is saying today, because he could have picked up the phone. It is 40 cents a phone call.

Hon Speaker, on the WiFi Broadband I must say I am very excited. I am actually trying to find a picture here.

When we conducted an oversight visit with colleagues in this House, and

we went to Melkhoutfontein it was so exciting to see the Cape Access Centre, how well they were doing, and how many governments around the world during a pandemic can open up a Cape Access Centre, and my colleague, hon Kama, was with us when we visited Melkhoutfontein, and I will find a picture on my phone once I am almost done with the debate.

Hon members, let me come back to some of the key context of this Second Adjustment debate that has been raised in this House, that has been through our parliamentary committees the last week and we debated on it several times. We are here today – we all know why we are here today. We are not going to keep on hampering upon, but it is a factual point that cannot be understated; we are here because of ANC mismanagement. COVID-19 unfortunately pushed it more forward and made it more serious, but the reason we are here today is because the governing party failed dismally and that is why we are here today, to adjust money to ensure that we are at least trying to let this Government do better.

Hon members, last year I said, I was a member in the debate, I said: “The barbarians were at the gate.” In fact, it was Minister Mboweni who started it first, his first budget debate last year February, and I just continued with that concept, I said “The barbarians broke through the gate.” But this year, hon members, I am forced to say the barbarians have broken through the gate, they smashed the windows, they took our wallets, they ate our food and they left this trail of destruction as they left our homes, and that barbarian is the ANC, of which members of this House are paid-up and



members in good standing, and they fail to address the key issue of the behaviour of their members in National Parliament, and that, members, is the reason we are here today.

Hon Speaker, you know, the last few months the Western Cape Government actually consistently showed through innovation and through this adjustment process why they are the best-run government in the country and I really want to ask the hon members of this House – do a comparative study, visit during the rest of today and tomorrow the websites of the other eight provinces. You will be ashamed; the quality of the information that is not on those websites, and I have done it to get a comparative study as to why our Government is the best in the country. And the awards the Premier spoke of indeed show from different Departments, and each colleague will deal with it on its own later as to why the Western Cape Government is the best in this country. On that note, hon Speaker, I just would like to say to the young retiree Mr Linda Grootboom, who I know is retiring – thank you for your contribution; it has been a pleasure to work with you the last six and a half years, since I became a member, being a member of this Parliament and I hope that you enjoy your retirement and thank you for your contribution and for making Parliament or the Western Cape Government an employer of choice.

Hon Speaker, the budget being allocated to the establishment of the Children's Commissioner - and I have to address that point again, which obviously as we know is the first in the country, and I have been proud to

be part of that process for the last six years, and member Dugmore, I have to admit, has also been part of this process, and I have to say that out of all the interviews that we have done over six years, being a member of this Parliament, this has to be the only candidate that had 110% support of all political parties and I have to thank the members of this Committee that worked hard to get the Children's Commissioner appointed.

So now we have to take it further, so when there is any stumbling block I would ask hon member Dugmore, via you Speaker, to pick up his phone, phone his colleagues in the Presidency and DPSA, sign off on these matters so we can get the Western Cape Children's Commissioner started and progressed and moved forward.

Hon Speaker, on the Second Adjustment Budget, some of the key items again – today is D-day, it is now 10:43. I do not know where the court case is right now, but today a decision is going to be made by the court that is going to have a severe impact on staffing salaries, not only for the Western Cape, for other provinces and for the rest of the country, and you have to say through good governance, through this Western Cape Government's consistent behaviour, in knowing how to manage their money, that we are able to have a kitty to deal with some of the challenges, but this decision caused by the ANC and no-one else, not the pandemic – mismanagement, corruption, maladministration, policy uncertainty, do not know whether they are left or right today, which faction is stronger - that is why we are sitting with this mess. It is going

to have a severe implication on all provinces and this country, whatever the outcome of this case is going to be and I sincerely hope that member Dugmore, via you, Speaker, will use his resources and pick up the phone to his colleagues and say we cannot bankrupt more provinces. Please let us ensure we get this money, him and his friends in the not so good alliance.

Hon Speaker, I really have to say that this economic crisis that we are in could have been averted and whether member Dugmore likes it or not, SAA is a big part of this economic crisis. I do not even want to go to Eskom's R450 billion that we are sitting with, I mean, all 173 SoEs, more of them, I think 99% of them are in a mess because of cadre deployment, the likes of Leonard Ramatlakane who, as far as I know, do not have any credible experience, let alone being a security guard at PRASA. Somehow he has managed to become the Chairperson of PRASA – goodness knows why!

But, hon members of this House, I just want to end off by saying as the Democratic Alliance we support this budget vote and want to thank the Premier, his Director-General, the COO and all the other, the CFO and all staff in the Department of the Premier for consistently being available, providing our Committee with information so that we can provide effective oversight and ensure accountability, transparency, and innovation. Innovation – this Department of the Premier, throughout this period, their communication has been spot on, perfect, and I really do hope that the next few weeks we are going to continue with the communication drive, in fact, allocate more funding for communication because everywhere I go, every

person I speak to on Facebook, people from other provinces, even ANC members from other provinces comment on my Facebook and say: “Hey Mackenzie, you guys in the Western Cape know how to communicate.” And that is the key from that messaging, the fact that I am able to share with people comes from the Department of the Premier, whether it is their Facebook page, the Western Cape Government’s Twitter page, and that is key – communication, communication, communication!

Thank you, Premier, thank you, Director-General, thank you for your team and thank you for allowing me to be part of this process that during the pandemic I can work with individuals that know how to take this Government further.

Thank you very much, honourable.

Ms L J BOTHA: Hear-hear!

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mackenzie. Hon members, I now recognise the hon, the Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, Speaker, and thank you very much to all of the hon members who took part in this debate. Obviously this debate around an adjustment - and adjustments are tools that governments use, specifically governments who are well run so that we make sure that we get the spending right and of course in a year you can never project at

the beginning of the year what the rest of the year is going to be like, and I think this year stands out as a perfect example of when we passed this budget we knew that something was coming. If you all remember, we actually worked very hard in this House and I want to thank all of those members, to get our budget approved and passed, which actually stood us in good stead as a Province of good governance and how things should be run when you understand something is coming your way, and of course this is our Second Adjustment that we are dealing with, and it also shows a sign of good management in a system when you have to, because of a crisis like COVID-19, have two adjustment budgets in a single year.

To the hon member Dugmore, I am sorry that you are rejecting this vote, and I understand that sometimes we bring in outside effects, and I will start with your first point that you spoke about SAA and the bailout or should I say, another bailout, the constant bailouts, and one must understand that in this context the SAA bailout makes it so painful for us as South Africa and as citizens of this province, because once again this is just a single occurrence that is actually showcasing so many things that are happening in our country, so many, many bailouts that are happening in our country, such bad governance at a national level that we end up making budget allocations to entities that should be running themselves and year after year after year there is failure, whether it is SAA as this example and having to have a further bailout or whether it is Eskom and the way that it is run and every single State-owned Enterprise and the way that it is run in our country. I heard the hon member Mackenzie referring to PRASA. He

also referred to the people that you put in charge of these entities, the board members, the CEOs and of course the one thing that the ANC needs to really hang its head in shame about is how they appoint cadres to these positions and all that happens is there is just thieving going on and at the end of the day to top up the thieving we have to then have bailouts. Of course when it came to not just the R10 billion, but the R300 billion that we are going to be having as a shortfall within our financial system as announced by the National Minister of Finance, Tito Mboweni, and of course these all have influences on how the world sees us. We get further downgraded. We look at our debt-to-GDP ratio and sometimes you can argue but that could also not be a bad thing. The problem is our debt-to-GDP ratio with an ANC at the helm means that it is not possible to repay and that is why we continue to get these downgrades because of bailouts, because of failed departments, failed SoEs and failing in the last 25 years, ANC Government policy. This ANC Titanic is still going down.

As I remember in Mitchells Plain, †*hulle moer maar net aan*, [they just stumble on] and that is exactly what we see here. We see no change in the ANC. They keep on going down to the depths of the ocean, taking the whole country with them, and so of course this metaphor of SAA is just one sample of what the ANC is doing to our country and the effect that it is having.

Then the hon Dugmore talks about the Children's Commissioner, and so did the hon member Mackenzie. Of course we are proud of the Children's

Commissioner and what she has managed to achieve despite the difficulties and of course, that is where you see the difference between what the hon Dugmore says and a responsible government between the Department of the Premier and the office of the Children's Commissioner being responsible in this space and saying, well, let us, although COVID-19 put a difficulty, share staff because of course you could not go out and have a look at premises and office spaces. We could not hold interviews. There were all sorts of implications so in good management style we then move that funding. It does not get taken away. We just move it into next year's budget. That is how good responsible government operates.

Of course, we are really glad and I said that in my speech, maybe the hon member Dugmore did not listen, but in actual fact what the office of the Children's Commissioner has attained up until now and of course also we really – and I must commend the DG for this – bent over backwards to say how do we make this happen despite the environment that we found ourselves in, despite people working from home, despite all sorts of pressures put on the system; how do we get this office up and running quickly, and we really do commend Commissioner Nomdo on what she has achieved thus far and we will do whatever necessary to make sure that she is helped in getting to what she wants to achieve as this body that really does look after the interest of children in our province.

I also want to say that listening to his comments specifically around the hotspots, and obviously coming out of the President's Coordinating

Council I cannot speak about what the discussions were, but I have gone out publicly saying that we do believe that there should be focus into specific areas or specific hotspots, be they districts, be they towns, be they sub-councils, whatever those areas are where those hotspots are, how do we zoom in with a different approach to make sure that we flatten the curve, and of course these were the kind of things that were part of our discussion this morning.

He mentions that we say 250 are too many. Well, of course, if you listened to the digicons, if you listen to the Health Department to Dr Cloete and Minister Mbombo, if you listen to what they are saying and how good we are in this province at actually identifying what those super-spreader events are, where they happen, who was involved, the tracking and tracing, that is why we are able to say it was the funeral here or the wedding there, or this event here or that pub or club or tavern or bar or whatever it was, we can pinpoint these areas and that is why we want to be able to say perhaps 250 internally are too much.

How do we reduce that number in that hotspot space so that we can manage this virus? We have shown in this province that we are able to do it and there again I congratulate the citizens for the part that they have played and every single Department across National, Provincial and Local Government, who have all stood together and make sure we flatten the curve. We have got to keep on doing it.



He mentioned the communications budget, the research and its effectiveness. I want to say that we have seen awards for our dashboard. I am not sure if we have entered awards for our communication but I think we should because quite frankly, measure us not only within the country but on our communications that we have put out over the last eight months in this province and the research that goes on the back of it, having a look at the effectiveness. That is how proper responsible governments work. If we are not data-driven we are just flailing in the wind. We have to be data-driven. We have to understand the effectiveness of the communication. Is it understood, how is it changing behaviour? What is the reliability of that data, is it able to give us the information that we need and of course this information was extracted on a regular basis, given to Cabinet, the extended Cabinet, Mayors involved, Municipal Managers involved, the police – South African Police Services involved, the City involved, every single department involved getting this detail back to us and then making decisions based on that detail and that is why you saw this campaign evolve over time. The kind of messaging changed over time because as a government we are responsible in the way that we manage and run things and we base it on data. We are evidence-driven. That is the only way that you can get ahead of the curve here and that is exactly what we do.

I am going to say that I am sorry once again that the hon Dugmore cannot support this vote, I think that specifically those officials in this Department and what they have done from a coordinating point of view, do

need your support, hon Dugmore, and it is not really good that you have not supported it.

Hon member Xego, I think first of all part of your debate was actually in the wrong budget vote. You started talking about basic services, part of other votes, but also part of Local Government, but while on the EFF and basic services I want to just talk to you and what I said to everybody in this House at the start of this sitting, to say we all need to be involved in helping us flatten the curve in saving lives, in making sure that we are responsible in everything that we do. And hon Xego, the EFF has the full right to protest, especially if you are on basic services, but what I think is absolutely irresponsible is when you apply for protest action, you say in the courts you say in the discussions with the police, etcetera, for example 200 people and we will follow protocols, masks, social distancing, and you do exactly the opposite! That is absolutely irresponsible and that kind of leadership is really not the way that we should be going about things. You need to make sure that as a public representative, as a member of this House, that you play a leadership role in helping all of us flatten this curve in this province, and quite frankly what I saw over the last two weeks has been absolutely irresponsible and I think you need to make sure that you take full responsibility for that.

The hon Herron, thank you very much for your support of this budget.

The hon member Mackenzie, can I thank you very much for chairing the

Committee, the oversight committee, as you said in the start of your speech we are going into the Festive Season and of course the real concern that we all have at the moment is how do we manage the Festive Season. It is a time where people want to relax, let their hair down, and of course this is the time where, when we let down our guard, in actual fact this virus is not going on holiday, this virus which is not taking any time off, is going to be at its most active, and we all have to bear that in mind and we all have to make sure that we are playing our part. It is not about those end-of-year Christmas parties; it is not about those irresponsible gatherings, congestion, it is about making sure that we stick to the rules during this Festive Season.

You spoke about us avoiding any further lockdown. Absolutely, every single thing that we do must be to avoid any kind of blunt instrument to manage this virus.

We have to make sure that we use our commonsense and that we do it together in the interest of the economy, in the interests of those who have lost their jobs, those who have lost loved ones, in the interest of dignity of the people of this province. We need to be able to get things going and moving forward.

I want to also say that you also spoke about SAA. You spoke about what that means for us as a province, but of course it is also the point that you raised about the constructive way and you spoke specifically about the

ANC, the constructive way in which the ANC can also play a part in this province and I agree with you. I agree that, it is one thing being in opposition, but I think it is also not being in opposition for opposition sake, it is also how to be a proactive Opposition and specifically when the Opposition is part of the governing party at a national level. I am certain that we can play or that the Opposition can play a stronger role as you suggest.

I also want to say that you mentioned transparency, innovation in the end of your speech, absolutely. I think that has been the cornerstone of what this Government has really worked on achieving from the beginning, transparency, communicate with the public, let them know exactly what is happening as often as possible. Give them the tools, and I spoke about the dashboard and the awards that it has won. The tools that they can on a daily basis at suburb-level understand what is happening around this virus and I think that we ourselves, through the innovation that has happened during this time, which I always celebrate, I think that is going to definitely help us going forward. We need to be that kind of government that embraces ideas, that embraces innovation, specifically innovation that comes from officials in our Government. It is not about the innovation only coming from the top. What really counted for me was that the officials in our Government, no matter where they were across our province, no matter what position they held, they were coming forward with their ideas and those ideas are the ideas that are being celebrated today. Those are the ideas that made a big difference and had a huge

impact on the citizens of this province, never to be reversed, in actual fact only to be celebrated because that is the way that we need to move forward. That is the way we need to learn as a government so that we can continually improve and make it better despite all of the pressures in our province. Make it better for every single citizen in this province.

So for everybody that took part in this debate, I thank you very much. Once again to the officials in DOTP, thank you very much for your dedication and work and ongoing, because as I said earlier specifically around what we are facing now with COVID-19, it is not over yet, we still have a way to go and I really want to thank you and appreciate you for everything that you have done on this journey thus far. Thank you very much, Speaker.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier, and thanks to the hon members who participated in this budget vote, and that concludes this specific budget vote. We will move to the next one shortly. I hope that the hon Minister is ready, and the hon members are ready who are participating in the debate. Hon members, the Secretary will read the second Order the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 10 – Transport and Public Works – *Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 7 – 2020].

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr Secretary. Hon members, I now recognise hon Minister Madikizela, the Minister of Transport and Public works.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Speaker, Premier, Cabinet Colleagues, Leader of the Opposition, hon members, DG and all the officials of the Western Cape Government and more importantly, the citizens of the Western Cape.

It is my privilege to present the Adjusted Estimates for Vote 10, the Department of Transport and Public Works, for 2020/21. This time last year I indicated how in a very short time in this portfolio I had come to appreciate the broad-ranging role which this Department plays in the overall service delivery by the Western Cape Government to the residents of this province. The events of the last eight months have served to confirm my early impressions, as this Department has risen to all the challenges of the pandemic and delivered magnificent facilities and systems in record time.

It is not without justification that the HOD of this Department, Ms Jacqui Gooch, recently received the silver award as one of the top provincial HODs in this country and the Department of Transport and Public Works was honoured with the joint gold award as the best functioning Department, together with the Department of Health. We in the Western Cape are indeed privileged to have people of the quality of HOD Gooch in leadership positions, and hard-working capable officials to keep the wheels

of this Government turning.

It is not my intention today to describe how parlous our country's economic position is. This was eloquently done last week and yesterday by many of my colleagues, especially Minister Maynier in his address. Hardly a day passes without a further economic body-blow to our already staggering economy. As I pointed out yesterday in this House it is simply not true that we can lay all our challenges at the feet of the corona virus. Our problems as a country predate the pandemic by many years and are systemic and entrenched.

Indeed, once I have set out briefly the major adjustments to the Main Appropriation for Vote 10, I want to table a few of the positive steps we have been able to take to restore the economy and to give the people of this province hope for the future.

As is so often the case in life, it is not just the extent of the financial damage which counts, but also the way in which we use what we still have. The Main Appropriation of Vote 10 decreases by R354,5 million or 4% from R8,9 billion to just over R8,5 billion, and it includes the following:

- An additional provision for the Provincial Road Maintenance Grant: R61,3 million;
- Shifting of funds between votes: that is R97 924 000;

- In terms of Programme 2, Public Works Infrastructure: R96 424 000;
- Shifted from Vote 6, Health, to fund the operational lease costs of Cape Town International Convention Centre (CTICC) as Intermediate Care Facility: R44 772 000.

We all remember the Hospital of Hope that we built during the height of this pandemic that we are now grappling with.

- Programme 4, which is Transport Operations, we shifted R1,5 million. This was shifted from Vote 14, Local Government to provide bicycles to the community groups for the distribution of amongst others, medicine and food as part of the Western Cape Hotspot Strategy;
- The realignment of the Provincial Budget, which is R450 913 000;
- Programmes 1 - 5: R50 913 000 was surrendered to the Provincial Revenue Fund due to the reduction on the compensation of employees.

Now member Herron spoke about this yesterday and I will just elaborate why this money was rendered because it sounded as if it is because of the failure to spend, which is not true, and again R200 million, which was unspent, which was meant for quarantine



and isolation facilities. This was also surrendered to the Provincial Revenue Fund, and of course we had to surrender these funds to the province.

Now this is the money that is not lost to the Province but you will remember that we were given the responsibility to make sure that we have enough quarantine and isolation sites, together of course with the feed hospitals, and the money that was budgeted for was unspent because of how well this Government has done in this regard so we had obviously budgeted more than we spent, so we had to send back this money, and of course the R50 million which again we were all forced to surrender because of Compensation of Employees (CoE), and it was compulsory for all of us to do so, so it has nothing to do with the failure to spend.

- Self-financing expenditure: R80 million. This is a decrease of own revenue 2020/21. The R80 million baseline reduction of the Provincial Infrastructure budget, this is as a result of the projected under-recovery of motor vehicle licence fees and lease revenue; the rollovers, R10,4 million.
- In terms of Programme 2, which is Public Works Infrastructure, R8,2 million. R5,7 million was rolled over from the 2019/20 financial year in order to fund the design and construction of the access road linking the Louwville community to the Community Day

Care Centre in Saldanha.

- Transport Infrastructure, which is Programme 3: R2,2 million was also spent for this particular purpose; R1,879 million was rolled over from the same year, which is the last year 2019/20 financial year to fund the rehabilitation and reconstruction of Long and Station Street, Great Brak River in Mossel Bay.

Now despite these significant reductions and the ongoing uncertainty about the future financial flows from the national fiscus relating to the Public Service Wage Agreement, due to be addressed by the Labour Court today, the Department of Transport and Public Works has moved with speed to reactivate projects which were shut down as a result of the various lockdown stages and to make it possible for new projects to commence.

The following details indicate our commitment to boosting the economy in such a way that employment is protected, job opportunities created and essential infrastructure is made available to enable further developments to take place:

- In August 239 contracts were awarded with a total value of just over R62,8 million;
- In September 176 contracts were awarded with a total value of just over R125,9 million;

- In October 383 contracts were awarded with a total value of over R459,8 million.

Now in those three months we injected close to R650 million into the economy, stimulating growth, enabling companies to do business, employing staff and making it possible for families to put food on their table.

Of the 798 contracts awarded in the three months period, I am very happy to announce that 781 of those were awarded to B-BBEE undertakings. Also, my Department during the course of this week will be awarding a further 12 contracts to the value of R68 million and these are due to be adjudicated, and it does not stop here, colleagues. The Department of Transport and Public Works will play a key role in assisting the Western Cape Education Department in planning for and then spending by the end of the first quarter of 2021 the additional R192 million received in terms of the policy based funding facility. In addition, school fencing contracts to the value of R36 million, as announced by Minister Maynier, will also be awarded.

My Department also set aside an amount of R10 million to be available in partnership with PRASA to clear the rail reserve. The meeting to finalise this arrangement is to take place with PRASA this week, and we all know that we have been working very closely with the National Department of

Transport and PRASA to make sure that we fix the rail, particularly the Central Line, and this is part of our contribution to that particular objective. Similarly, we will initiate the clearing of a number of properties as part of the EPWP Programme.

In these challenging times, these are significant injections into the economy by this Department. In fact, as large as they are, considering the fiscal circumstances they represent in terms of hope and belief in the future gigantic contributions to the well-being of the people of the Western Cape.

Now it would be remiss of me not to include in the snapshot of the positive steps taken by Department of Transport and Public Works the initiatives, the innovative initiatives taken in the field of public transport. Not only did my Department achieve a partnership with the taxi industry to respond to urgent needs resulting from the pandemic to ensure the safety of front-line workers in the health sector and to transport people in need of isolation and quarantine, but we were also able to expand this into a concept which can benefit commuter needs in future. So, Red Dot Light and Red Dot tested and shown to work, will produce the incentivised Blue Dot system.

The incentive payment envisaged in the scheme is not limited to operators but will be paid to operators and drivers as well, and this incentive payment is set at a level designed to bring about behavioural change and is

linked to clear performance standards, all measured using appropriate technology. These standards relate to key indicators including speeding, harsh braking and cornering, lane-changing and off-route driving.

In addition to the technology at the disposal of the Department of Transport and Public Works to record and assess these indicators, a passenger feedback mechanism has been developed which allows for easy reporting on service safety and quality and we have used this service before and it has proven to be very effective where passengers from time to time are giving us feedback, which enabled us to rectify and improve the service of this particular industry, and very importantly, based on concerns identified by commuters, provision has been made, among others, for ongoing driver training, vehicle inspection and roadworthiness assessment. For the first time a direct link has been created between incentive payments and the quality, safety and dignity of the service, which of course will assist us towards our quest to professionalise the industry.

Speaker, allow me to conclude with a reminder to all that we will soon once again be in the holiday and Festive Season. The need for responsible driving reinforced by sound traffic law enforcement will, as always, at these times be very, very critical.

This week on Thursday, 3 December, which is tomorrow, we will launch our intensive Festive Season Road Safety Programme, which is already in

operation, and I want to appeal to all the people of our province who will be using our roads during this Festive Season, to drive and behave responsibly.

All our traffic officers will be deployed strategically in all the corners of this province, and I think as the Premier said, having noted the fact that the COVID-19 cases are increasing we will also be targeting specific areas, where we will make sure that we work very closely with other sister departments like the Department of Health, a targeted approach in those areas to make sure that we curb the spread of COVID-19, while we ensure that people are able to travel from one place to another because, I must also reiterate, Speaker and colleagues, that the blanket lockdown is something that is not desirable at this stage. We know where the problems are. We must use a targeted approach so that we can make sure that at the same time, while we deal with the pandemic, we kick-start our economy, because we cannot afford to create a binary between the two. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, the hon Minister. I now recognise hon Mvimbi.

Mr L L MVIMBI: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, hon Premier, hon members, ladies and gentlemen, I rise on behalf of the African National Congress to reject this budget vote. The ANC will continue to reject a budget vote that continues to exclude the biggest transport constituency in our province and we will certainly reject any programme with whatever

calor, if it treats taxi operators as children.

By the MEC's own admission the taxi industry provides more than half of the province's public transport to daily commuters. The so-called "incentives for good behaviour", is what the so-called Blue Dot Programme for the professionalisation of the taxi industry is based on, and it is an incorrect and patronising philosophy. The so-called incentives for good behaviour, are for children, not owners of SMMEs and certainly not stakeholders of the largest public transport industry in our province.

Last week we heard the hon Minister Maynier suggest that this Provincial Government wishes to give our people dignity and bring them hope. Could it therefore appeal to his counterpart, the hon Minister of Transport and Public Work, hon Minister Madikizela, to treat taxi operators with dignity and respect? Maybe then his Department will be able to act as an honest and respectful [Inaudible.] in the challenges that beset the industry, including the challenge of violence.

While we appreciate that this is an Adjustment Budget, we remain disappointed that the Provincial Government has not given the taxi industry in general the necessary support, especially in the knock the industry took during the lockdown.

Other modes of transport do not have incentives for good behaviour. Why must the taxi industry have these? Is it because the industry is

overwhelmingly run by black people for a largely black clientele? Again, by the MEC's own admission 95% of all daily commuters who use public transport come from low to middle income background.

Hon Speaker, the ANC agrees with the MEC that this Adjustment Budget is a difficult one, not only because of COVID-19, the global economic outlook, but certainly because of failed depolicy in the last decade. As much as the Department wishes to explain away in the inefficiencies at motor vehicle licensing centres, the reality remain that for lockdown month these centres had time to prepare for a backlog and for months the Department had time to finalise the agreement with the Post Office. As a result, the Department will lose R80 million because of inefficiency in planning and preparation.

It is incomprehensible that this Provincial Government, which spend so much money on technology, was not able to close this gap and allow for more efficient online application, but even with the online application system one will have needed to work with the South African Post Office.

We commend the Department for the rollout of infrastructure during this pandemic and salute them on the preparation they are currently making in planning for a possible second wave. However, we must recognise the failure of this Government to communicate especially to our communities, where the quarantining and isolations facilities were located. At the same time the ANC will continue to probe where these facilities were located and who benefited from them.



We take this opportunity too to commend the Department on the intervention of R3 million at the Saartjie Baartman Centre after it was damaged by fire, even though this amount was paid for by the Department of Social Development.

The ANC remains concerned of the nearly R6 million roll-over from 2019/2020 financial year, earmarked to fund the design and construction of the access road linking the Louwville community to the Community Day Centre in Saldanha.

It remains a concern to the nearly R2 million roll-over from 2019/2020 financial year to fund the rehabilitation and reconstruction of Long and Station Street in Great Brak River, Mossel Bay. While we acknowledge the difficult year this has been, especially for infrastructure development, we are reminded by President Ramaphosa and Minister Mboweni of the important role that infrastructure development plays in our country's economic revival, but infrastructure also remains key for addressing apartheid spatial planning and COVID-19 was an opportune time for this Department to address those issues.

The emergency brought about by COVID-19 could have allowed for buildings in the possession of the province and even municipalities, to be made available to our people to ensure isolation in quarantining, but also at the same time address the spatial injustices of the past.

It is a pity that the Department put no effort in making a list of buildings it has in its possession available so that these may be used for social intervention, especially such as shelters for survivors of gender-based violence.

Hon Speaker, when we look at the detail of the Adjustment Budget and the expenditure, we note the large amount of money spent on computer services. For example, in the Department's Programme 3 alone over R35,6 million is spent on computer services. We certainly hope that these services will be used even after COVID-19 has subsided and that even here the necessary caution was taken to procure these services.

In conclusion, I wish to quote from the declaration of the National Taxi Lekgotla when it says, and I quote:

“We call upon all stakeholders and all sub-sectors within the industry to forge a compact and transform the industry into formalised and professionalised economic sector, that delivers world-class services to the majority of commuters within the Republic.”

Hon Speaker, the first stakeholders who must lead in forging compact and transforming the taxi industry, especially in the Western Cape, must be this Provincial Government. Unfortunately, it has failed to lead in this respect. It is for this reason, and others, that the ANC rejects this Adjustment on Vote

10. Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mvimbi. Hon members, I now recognise hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Speaker.

The EFF notes that the Transport and Public Works Budget have now been cut by R354,5 million, something that we do not entirely support.

Then there is a provincial funding of R6,6 million reserved for the acquisition of properties for education purposes. This money is too little for such purposes, considering that every year the province struggle with classroom spaces for the allocation of learners. The Department cannot spend roll-overs on the refurbishment of office accommodation for the Education Department, whereas learners are accommodated in makeshift temporary class structures.

Furthermore the Department should also create employment opportunities for our young people, rather than to surrender funds intended for compensation of employees to the Provincial Revenue Fund. Some of the funds which have been surrendered by the Department due to the reduction of the Compensation of Employees, should have been used to add to the budget for the acquisition of the properties which should be intended for the classroom spaces.

Those people in the Education Department cannot be accommodated in comfortable offices at the expense of learners. These are the very same people who are quick to take teachers of colour to disciplinary hearings for classifying themselves as African.

As EFF we do not support the Vote, thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Makamba-Botya. I now recognise hon member Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, while we support this Vote, we do have to raise concerns around the failure of the Department to spend on infrastructure. On the one hand we have the Minister for Finance including infrastructure spend as part of the job creation projects or job creation spend of this province, but the Department that needs to run the infrastructure projects is surrendering money that was meant and earmarked for infrastructure.

It is not correct, as the MEC for Transport and Public Works indicates, that the money is not being spent. In fact the Medium-term Budget Policy Statement indicates that R45 million is being surrendered due to slow spend; R155 million for Road Infrastructure is being surrendered for slow spend, and more than R100 million is being verimented to other projects that are not infrastructure-related due to slow spend.

So the Department is not spending money on infrastructure and we are relying on the Department to spend money on infrastructure in order to create jobs.

We have got this extra R61 million being allocated for Road Infrastructure spend from the Additional Conditional Grant, but we have a department which is unable to spend their money on infrastructure projects.

So we do raise concerns around ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you ...[Interjections.]

Mr B N HERRON: ... this Department's failure to spend ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: ... hon member Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: ... and – but we do support the budget. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Herron. I was very much lenient, because of the other minute. You used only one second, but this time I had to accommodate that. Thanks, hon member Herron.

Hon members, I now recognise hon member Mitchell.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Speaker.

Hon Speaker, on 30 July I rose in this House in support of the COVID-19 Special Adjustment Budget. I rose because when a crisis strikes one would hope that those elected to lead us, would lead us with humanity. That is exactly what happened in the Western Cape, but today, five months later, I am here today to make a contribution to the Western Cape Second Adjustment Budget, in particular the contribution to Vote 10: The Department of Transport and Public Works, which aims to tirelessly pursue the delivery of infrastructure and transport services that is inclusive, safe and technologically relevant, seeking to heal, skill, integrate, connect, link and empower every citizen in the Western Cape, driven by passion, ethics and a steadfast commitment to the environment and the people as the cornerstone.

Hon Speaker, while the COVID-19 pandemic is undeniably the pre-eminent crisis of our time, and one which knows no boundaries, the Department, now more than ever, must remain true to its commitment. That is keeping the safety and best interest of the residents of the Western Cape at the forefront.

This particular Budget Vote sees a decrease of R354 million, which includes a reduction in the decrease of Compensation of Employees, a baseline reduction of under Recovery of Motor Vehicle Licences and lease revenue, and a surrendering of underspent quarantine and isolation funds.

Hon Speaker, this in particular is worth noting as it tells us that the Western Cape was indeed beyond ready and capable to manage the first surge of

COVID-19 infections in the province, and critical to note, with capacity to spare.

We also note a reduction in Roads Infrastructure and CYCC allocations. Hon Speaker, these reductions tell us a key fact for the future of the Department over the next financial year. It must do more with less, and by more we mean targeted intervention for the greatest impact where it is most needed. This is what Premier Winde committed to in his Recovery Plan, further outlined by Minister Maynier and it is the benchmark by which we will conduct oversight across this Legislature.

Hon Speaker, with these adjustments in mind I would like to pause and focus on the success and impact of the Red Dot Service during this time. Because this Government protects both lives and livelihoods, over 200 minibus taxis were fitted with protective screens as part of the dedicated service for the transport of healthcare workers and individuals to and from quarantine and isolation sites. This comprehensive and immediate action came in the wake of a potential national taxi strike, because quite frankly the National Government had no plan, or allow me to rephrase, a lack of political will and leadership to save both lives and livelihoods with a sustainable, responsive and adaptable action plan.

This brings me the scourge of violence we have seen on our public transport system. In the second half of 2020 the transport sector has become a playground for a select group of individuals who resort to violence. We have

seen an increase in attacks on the Golden Arrow buses, and we have seen an increase in taxi violence, and at the end of the day who pays the ultimate price? Hon Speaker, the commuters and the residents of this province.

Minister Madikizela has also announced the Blue Dot Taxi Service Pilot Project which aims to strengthen Government and minibus taxi relations. It aims to have an incentivised programme and it finds its roots in safe driving and obeying the rules of the road. Hon Speaker, I appeal to Minister Madikizela to urgently update members of this House on this desperately needed pilot project, and to indicate to us how it loads out to the value of innovation this Government seeks to uphold.

Hon Speaker, to date the recent attacks on Golden Arrow Bus Services have resulted in a loss of 12 Golden Arrow buses due to protest, resulting in a total loss of just under R29 million. This comes at the expense to taxpayers as the Provincial Government contributes to Golden Arrow Bus Services. Furthermore, more than 200 Golden Arrow buses are stoned per month, and six to eight armed robberies take place every week. This is completely unacceptable, hon Speaker. It cannot be tolerated. In this regard I urge Minister Madikizela to address this issue as the loss is far too great for this province and its transport sector, particularly now when we seek to get our residents to work, to school and back home safely.

Secondly, hon Speaker, the increase in taxi violence has become a vital issue which must be dealt with immediately and with the most pronounced impact.



Minister Madikizela and his Department have had discussion with the minibus taxi industry. In fact, recently, as well as holding the National and Provincial Taxi Lekgotla, in which resolutions were implemented to bring stability to the taxi industry. The success of this has, however, been called in question with the recent attacks that took place in the Cape Town CBD and Nyanga taxi decks, resulting in the death of five people and nine others injured.

I therefore further appeal, hon Speaker, to the Minister to provide us with details of his engagements with the taxi industry and its representatives, as well as his national counterpart. Promises have been made with respect to the Provincial Transport Regulator, the Provincial Traffic Act and the formulation of the taxi industry, and as Chairperson of this Committee we will fight to keep and hold the Government to account on these critical matters.

While violence has greatly taken over our transport sector, we must not forget the ANC's failure, as well as that of the President, to restore in the Central Line and Cape Flats Line in the Western Cape. Promises have been made and broken and deadlines have been self-imposed by National Government, but not met. A clear ANC attribute we witness over time. The rail system has become the target for theft and vandalism with political mismanagement of PRASA in Pretoria, doing little to ensure the prevention of further destruction.

The Province has requested that the mandate of rail be handed over so as to ensure that it operates once again. Minister Madikizela, I ask for you to provide us with the details on the progress of restoring the Central Line and the consideration of the Western Cape Government to assume this responsibility of rail in the province, along with the offer of the province to work with other spheres of government in this regard.

Hon Speaker, with our transport sector in disarray, there are steps that can be taken to cure this problem. Firstly, Minister Madikizela, when will the Western Cape Transport Regulator be appointed? It is a much-needed tool in creating a stable transport sector, and secondly the Provincial Traffic Act which is also outstanding and much-needed for the regulation of transport in the province.

Hon Speaker, with that being said, I trust that the Minister would be able to take this House into confidence and provide us with a breakdown on key issues which remain pertinent to the safekeeping and stability of the Western Cape transport sector. We cannot stand by idly and fail our residents. The transport sector in the province provides residents with an opportunity to get to their jobs to earn a living. It gets school and university students to the institution. It helps residents bring food home to feed their families. These are just a few of the reasons a functional, reliable and safe transport sector is so important and as the Government we must do our utmost best to provide that to our residents, as they are the taxpayers and the life of the province.

In conclusion, hon Speaker, allow me this opportunity to appeal to all road users to be safe during this Festive Season, to adhere to the regulations and not to drink and drive.

And finally, to the HOD, Ms Gooch, and the entire team who is at the forefront of delivery every single day to serve the citizens of this province. Thank you, *enkosi, baie dankie*.

The DA supports Vote 10: Transport and Public Works. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mitchell. Hon members, I now recognise the hon Minister, Minister Madikizela.

The MINISTER OF PUBLIC WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and thank you very much to all the members who participated in this Adjustment Vote.

Hon Speaker, I want to add to hon member Mvimbi, and sometimes I wonder if hon member Mvimbi does engage the leadership of the taxi industry. Hon member Mvimbi is saying that this Department or this Government is excluding the taxi industry in the subsidisation and the formulisation process. In fact, this Province is leading the way towards formalisation of the taxi industry. I am not sure where he leads.

We recently had a National Lekgotla which was preceded by our Provincial

Lekgotla and I urge hon member Mvimbi to really engage the leadership of SATACO, because when many other provinces were on the verge of the strike during the lockdown because they are not making any money, Western Cape SATACO issued a statement and made it very clear that they will not be increasing the fares, they will not be striking, because the Western Cape Government under this Department, has gone into a partnership with them, which allowed them to recoup the losses that other provinces made, through the Red Dot.

For hon member Mvimbi's information, the taxi industry is very happy with how we are working with them, and if you look at the incentive that we are talking about, this incentive, in terms of the Blue Dot, it is an incentive that is very welcomed by the industry itself.

So we must be then very careful of coming here into this House and claim to be talking on behalf of the people, when people are saying something completely different.

The Red Dot was such a success, hon Speaker, that the taxi industry is putting pressure on us to really start this initiative, which is Blue Dot, because they stand to benefit.

So to then say the incentive for good behaviour is for children, it is a clear indication of how ill-informed hon member Mvimbi is, because the taxi industry is bleeding as we speak, because they are being heavily punished for

bad behaviour. Their taxis are impounded, they are given multiple fines and any initiative that will make sure that we discourage them from doing that, will result in the opposite. In good behaviour where they will be able to make money, because when you invade routes, this results into violence. When you speed you get traffic fines. When you drive recklessly, when you drive without necessary documentation, your cars get impounded. That is bad behaviour that we are talking about. That is not for children. So we must be very careful of the statement that you were making here.

So the Western Cape is the only province that is leading the way towards formalisation of the taxi industry.

The Provincial Minister of Transport in this province has not met any [Inaudible.] in any industry, transport industry, more than he has met with the taxi industry. So the commitment from our side to professionalise the industry by using the Red Dot and the Blue Dot as a launching pad, is very much welcomed by the industry.

So I think the Chairperson made it very clear here that perhaps we need to come and brief the Standing Committee so that hon member Mvimbi can be more informed about this.

Hon member Makamba-Botya, of course the money for Education, it must be understood that the budget cuts that we have experienced as the Provincial Government of R2,5 billion, which is over R350 million for this Department,

has a huge impact in what we can do as a department, and of course we need to strike the balance between doing all the things that we are responsible for as a department, and that is why unfortunately we cannot do everything that we are expected to do with the budget cuts that we are facing.

So again when it comes to the Department of Education and the point that was made by hon member Makamba-Botya, the issue of building additional schools will be severely hampered with the budget cuts and the fact that the money that should be used for these frontline services, like education and health, is now used to bail dysfunctional state entities like your SAA will have an impact on our province, and that is why the budget cuts that we are now going to have of R2,5 billion, is a budget cut that will impact on the frontline service delivery, including the additional schools that hon member Makamba-Botya is talking about.

Now hon member Herron, thank you very much for supporting the Budget, but I do want to bring to your attention, sir, that you are aware that when you run an infrastructure department like Department of Transport of Public Works, and you then have a situation where we were forced by the DMA regulations ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister Madikizela, there is a point of order in the Chamber. Wil you please take your seat. Hon member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Speaker, I rise on a point of order.

Can you please urge the hon Minister to respect your authority in the House and to speak through you to hon member Herron, and not to speak directly to hon member Herron. I do not want to repeat this plea again with the other Ministers. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Sayed. Hon Minister, will you please speak through the Speaker.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Point taken, thank you very much, hon member Sayed.

Through you, hon Speaker. I do want to say that the construction industry was severely hampered by the DMA Regulations. We had a situation where we were forced to shut down completely for four months during the lockdown, so it is no surprise then, sir, that some of the infrastructure projects were affected by this, but the [Inaudible.] roll-overs that you spoke about, were necessitated partly by the particular challenge, but also I must add that if you look at some of the challenges that were encountered because of that shutdown, we had to cut road expenditure because of that, and also that impacted on our revenue collection.

So these are some of the issues that we had to grapple with because of lockdown, but as I said, thank you very much for supporting the Budget, and it is not failure from our part as Department to spend the money, but some of these issues contributed to some of the massive infrastructure projects which

were delayed by a number of months, which resulted in us then adjusting our budgets in the manner in which we have done. And of course, we have taken note of some of the comments that you have made.

To hon member Mitchell, thank you very much, Chairperson, you have raised a number of very valid points around the taxi violence, and I want to assure you that I have been seized with this matter. As the Provincial Minister I have been engaging the industry leaders about it. We had a number of engagements and we tabled, as the Department of Transport and Public Works, [Inaudible.] resolutions that we are now busy implementing in order to deal with violence in a number of routes in the Western Cape, and we strongly believe, Chairperson and hon member Mitchell, that – through you, hon Speaker – that for us to be able to deal with these challenges is that we must move towards the implementation of the Blue Dot, because as I said earlier, we cannot deal with the problems and the violence in the taxi industry until we come up with incentives that will deal with the bad behaviour that I spoke about, because the manner in which the industry is structured currently does encourage this behaviour, because you have a situation where people invade certain routes, because they see them as more lucrative, because they have a target to make per day so that they can also make a living, and part of our proposal in terms of the Blue Dot, which is what we did under Red Dot, is to create a stable environment where drivers and operators are incentivised so that they cannot embark on those bad behaviours that I am talking about.



So this has worked very well under Red Dot and we feel very strongly that again it is going to work under Blue Dot, and I will be responding to your call for the Department to come and brief the Standing Committee fully on the rolling out of the Blue Dot, starting of course with the phase approach and the areas that we are going to start with, and I fully agree with you that we have a major problem on the [Inaudible.] of GAB buses. As I am talking to you now, this matter is a matter that the DDG responsible for Transport is engaging GABS on. We are already piloting some of the technology in terms of safety to make sure that we deal with this matter, but I must also add, Chairperson, that this is the matter of lawlessness and we are working very closely with SAPS and I suspect that due to the so-called service delivery protest we will see the escalations of the destruction of our infrastructure, and it is very disturbing that some of the members of this House sometimes are seen at these violent so-called service delivery protests, instead of providing leadership so that we discourage people from doing such things.

But as I said, we have a targeted approach working with GABS to make sure that we deal with the torching of their buses, because as you said, the safety of our passengers in our public transport is very, very important and of course in terms of PRASA you might be aware that we have a partnership, we have embarked on a partnership, we have signed an MOU with PRASA working very closely with the Department of Transport nationally to deal with the problems on Central Line. We had an IGC meeting with the City of Cape Town where we were discussing the roles and responsibilities to really unlock some of the challenges that exist there, and the first thing that we

need to do to address the challenges of Central Line, hon member Mitchell, is that we need to relocate the people who were now, have now built their shacks right in the middle of the rail, and of course the issue of the land that must be provided is still a big issue, because the land that was identified which is suitable for this, is owned by National Department of Public Works, because when we relocate these people, the issue of proximity is also a very important one, but of course there seem to be a bone of contention between Public Works and the Department of Police, because that land was earmarked for the Department of Police to build a police station.

So these are ongoing discussions that are happening nationally, where we are playing a supporting role as the Province and the City, because it is in our interest, hon member Mitchell, to deal with this problem, and I am sure you might have noticed that when I talk about this matter I do not talk about the role of PRASA being the national role. I want to be part of the solution rather than keep on blaming PRASA and National Department, because the people who are affected at the end of the day, are people of the Western Cape.

So that is why I have been a very active participant in time to find the solutions, even though of course the powers and the decision lie with PRASA nationally.

So these are a number of engagements that we are having to deal with, violence, particularly in the taxi industry, to also deal with the torching of buses and also to make sure that the Central Line is open, and also to make

sure that our passengers are transported safely, and I will accede to your call, hon member Mitchell, for us to be able to come and brief the Standing Committee fully so that members can be seized with the initiative that we call “Blue Dot”, which is very much welcomed by the industry.

At this point I want to take the opportunity and really thank the HOD and the team for all the hard work that they are doing to make sure that we deal with some of the problems that I spoke about, and also the members of the Standing Committee for keeping us on our toes, and of course, Chairperson, you have raised some very important issues that you have asked us to pay particular focus and attention to, and we will also be coming to you, as the Standing Committee, to brief you as you requested, on some of these issues. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister Madikizela. Hon members who participated in this Budget Vote, thank you. Now this is the end of this particular Budget Vote.

I am going to request that the hon Minister in the next Budget Vote and the hon members, get ready. We will be starting in a bit.

Thank you, hon members. Now the Secretary will ready the third Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 6 – Health – *Western Cape Second*

*Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 7 – 2020].*

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr Secretary. Hon members, I recognise the hon the Minister of Health, Dr Mbombo.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Yes, thank you, hon Speaker. Hon members, thank you, Premier. People of the Western Cape. Good morning.

Today I present to this House the Second Adjustment Budget for the Department of Health, which is a R759 million reduction, which is about 2,75% of the total budget. The initial budget was R28 857 000 000 and now it is going to be R27 097 000 000.

Hon Speaker, before I even dissect in terms of what is the rationale for the reduction of the adjustment, I am presenting this Budget at a time that is so difficult. It is a time of the pandemic. We are talking about the 16 Days of Activism in regard to the gender-based violence and femicide against women and children. It is a pandemic related to COVID, of which the country has got the highest in Africa, and also we find that it competes with others internationally that have got even bigger populations.

We have got a pandemic, the HIV/AIDS. We know that also in Africa and also in the world, the country has got the highest number of people that are living with HIV and AIDS, and also thank you for the ARV programme.

Hon Speaker, also the pandemic related to the economy, we are in a period of the fiscal cliff where the poverty, the inequality, the unemployment, are currently also affecting the country.

Also, hon Speaker, we are in the Festive Season. We already see the high level of the violence, the impact when we see some of these casualties in our hospitals. The forensic pathology, our mortuaries, like over the weekend were about 70-plus of the unnatural deaths due to interpersonal violence and also in regard to some of the accidents that are happening in our province.

Also, hon Speaker, whilst I have mentioned the pandemic. We are at a time where the issue around the Wage Bill increase freeze, there is a whole lot of uncertainty when the hardworking public servants, now where the promise that were provided by the National Government and the unions in terms of the increase, now they do not know whether it is going to go ahead or not.

We are also in a space where we, as confirmed by the National Finance Manager, have the reduction in the Conditional Grant. The Health system is shaken all over in South Africa, also all over the world, where there has never been any other time in our history where you could have so many healthcare workers that could be highly infected. The impact of their absence in terms of the service delivery, especially now when they have to work, is severe. Also at a time where they could die from just one disease, which is the COVID.

We are also in a space where there has never been a time in the health system that we can have so much of the reduction in the non-COVID services. We have seen that some operations, for example for breast cancer like in Groote Schuur, where they normally take about 600 referrals for surgeries and also for chemotherapy per annum, you will find that these are not there anymore. Also freezing of even other elective surgeries, normally, for example, for the knee operations and other orthopaedic surgeries we get about a three to five years wait for some, because of the resources, but now we see a situation where we find that there is not even a guarantee that even those who have been waiting longer, could be able to be there.

So, hon Speaker, when we present this reduction, it is related to the context that I am trying to present to you. Therefore that is why I appeal to the members of the House and also to the constituency heads and the leaders in the various communities in the province, to assist us so that we could be able to create an environment where we could be able to stop the spread, because all what I have mentioned now impact on the health system. We are tired, we are emotionally and also psychologically drained as healthcare workers. We absorbed this unemployment because health and the wealth are on the same WhatsApp group, the more people are unemployed, the more people actually we have to absorb.

The same applies with the issue of the accidents and also issues related to these unnatural deaths, we have to absorb all of them. So therefore that is why we are appealing to please adhere to the three Cs which are:

- Avoiding the crowded places and also pass on the message to your communities.
- Confined spaces, especially where there is a poor ventilation. There should not be any meeting that still happen there, because we do know that the aerosolization of the virus, where people end up breathing that air, does actually cause higher transmission.
- The contact settings, the 1,5 metre to 2 metre distance, that is a science. We cannot be still seeing people where they are on top of each other, be it in a public transport place or even in a meeting, we should be able to avoid those.

The five golden rules that we have always been preaching related to:

- Sanitising your hands.
- Washing your hands.
- Mask up. Please do mask up to avoid spitting towards others. People [Inaudible.] faces and also the surface.
- And also again the physical distance. Stay at home when you are not well.

And I want also to acknowledge that we have a different strategy for the testing, that is that when you do have symptoms, please go and test, and if you are in close contact of a positive case, please quarantine for the next 10 days, or else you can test on the fifth day so that we do not end up having a negative positive, or a positive test.

So that is also crucial. And then, hon Speaker, before I also present, I want to acknowledge and thank the team, starting from Dr Peter as the HOD who took over from Dr Beth Engelbrecht in March. If you recall our first case was on 11 March.

So ever since, nobody has been on leave from the management and also from the staff, the frontline staff.

So what you see now with the resurgence, the same people who have been there actually from 2 March, when we had our [Inaudible.] regarding the COVID, it is the same [Inaudible.] people who still have to now deal with the resurgence, have to deal with the other non-COVID cases and also the accidents and all of those.

So we have never stayed at home, we have always been there throughout. So that is why I am saying that let us first and foremost protect our healthcare workers, because the more you have a high level of community transmission, the more people will end up in our facilities, even if some of them might not be hospitalised, but some of them will end up queuing outside our primary healthcare facilities. Those long queues and people having to stand longer, do have an impact on them mentally and otherwise, but unfortunately we have to limit the influx in the crowded places, in our facilities, but please, please we need these healthcare workers. We need them also for the following years and throughout.



So with the Budget that we have, as I indicated, the major part of it is about the allocation of compensation of the employees that was cut by R599 million, in anticipation of a low increase in the public sector wages for the year, as we are aware that the National Government, together with the unions, are still arguing and they have taken it to court, I think on 2 December. We are actually now supposed to know what is going to happen with regard to the outcome, so we have to take that into consideration, and also the other part of it is about us having lost our revenue collection. We used to collect about half a billion or so per annum, but with the R130 million now where our budget has to be reduced, because more people are unemployed; even for those who were employed, probably when they use our services based on their income, they could be able to pay for some of the other services.

People who are not working, the businesses, they are not getting profits. So that means that we are losing our revenue around that. If you look at the cuts, the Conditional Grants, the National Finance Manager did indicate the HIV and TB Grant has been cut by R19,7 million, and also unfortunately the issue of even cutting the National Tertiary Service Grant - which actually has been quite useful in regard to the training and also the central hospitals - it is quite a great concern, hon Speaker.

But there are also elements of some positive parts that we have had; we received an additional R29 million in terms of the presidential employment initiative, especially in regard to boosting our Hospital Emergency Centre

Trade and Information System, the HECTIS, which assists us into data collection and also to collect evidence.

Also, the roll-over of the R50 million from the previous financial year, because we have to buffer our system, because we do not know what is going to happen next year. And then lastly, hon Speaker, as I indicated in terms of the cuts. For the community health workers budget, actually we have added more because we need them. Inasmuch as that at the national level ever since, the contract workers have always been the stepchild, are still being a stepchild of the health system. Even on the 2010 Human Resource Strategic Plan, the draft that National established then, which actually ended up being a draft, nothing was done about it. You will see that among all the categories of the healthcare professionals of health workers, community health workers were not there. Even at the time with the bargaining chambers, at the national level, with the Resolution 21 of 2018 it was said that they need extra income. The issue whether they should be absorbed or not, was never even taken into consideration in terms of following that with the resources, but I want to acknowledge the fact that at least last week there have been some engagements at national level where they will also look at engaging also with the Minister of Labour and Employment, so that they could be able to accommodate it, but as always they do not have to wait for National to do some of the things, because they are part of the health system.

So especially in the context that they help us in regard to the community screening and testing, and also they are the first contact by the families,

especially when they visit these households, checking on the children's immunisations and all of those.

So, hon Speaker, and my last part is about that, inasmuch as we are talking about COVID, for us we do know that there are other non-COVID services, that there is no way that we can leave them behind. The issue of the children's immunisation, the HIV and the TB, especially the first diagnoses in terms of the initiation of the treatment, those ones you cannot leave behind, despite that with its resurges it means that our health system is inundated, it is overloaded. But you have to make various ways how we can be able to work safely, but at the same time we are making a point that we make use of those lower risk interventions, as I indicated, but it will have a high impact.

The same applies with the distribution of our medicines and the chronic medications throughout, and also some of the minor but urgent operations, for example cataracts, where there was a time where we used to have 400 per month, and then we ended up having zero. We have to look at that space where we could be able to offer these services, when I launch the [Inaudible.] but we have to do it safely, hon Speaker.

So therefore, I just want to thank everyone and all inclusive, because Health is not only – we are responsible for health services, but health is everybody's business. To thank the Mayor, District Mayor, the municipalities, [Inaudible.] municipalities and all of those, in that space of

the joint where they could be able to do as much as they can. The City, where even in their own facilities, in addition to assisting in terms of the surveillance using the water system to check what is the spread, the magnitude of the virus throughout, we want to thank them, and also the NPOs throughout who have assisted us in regard to some other non-COVID services, and also lastly the community through the Clinic Committees, through the Hospital Boards, for everything that they have done, and also of course the National Department of Health where they sometimes often, even now, where they will give just maybe one specialist or so, so that we do not feel like we are left alone.

Thank you very much, hon Speaker, I hereby table the Adjustment Budget of R750 million reduction which now goes R27,97 billion. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, I now recognise hon member Windvogel.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Good afternoon, hon Speaker, Premier, Leader of the Official Opposition, hon members.

Hon Speaker, the Mid-Term Budget Policy Statement by the MEC retracted at length all the measures taken by the Provincial Government to respond to the COVID-19 emergency, as well as preparations for the resurgence.

The correct account of this is that the province recorded its first case on 11 March 2020, and in mid-May it was already the country's epicentre, with 70% of South Africa COVID-19 infections. This was due to the Provincial Government's poor response and failure to manage the spread.

Hon Speaker, these include the Government discouraging people from the wearing of masks in public, calls to end the lockdown, limiting COVID-19 testing to only those older than 55 years and the demands for lifting ban on sales of liquor.

We also know that R52,2 million was spent on the 862 beds at CTICC and 338 beds in Brackengate Field Hospital. Yet nothing is to show for it as a rush and thoughtless decision was taken to close down the CTICC hospital despite our warning of a possible resurgence.

Hon Speaker, the poor decision taken during the first wave will come back to haunt us as we spend millions of Rands on quick fixes instead of addressing the real challenges in transforming the public healthcare. Our public hospitals will not withstand the increased COVID-19 case load as a result of the resurgence.

Hon Speaker, the Province is left with one choice, either to act now or suffer the COVID-19 consequences, but I know this DA Government will not act because they do not care. They do not give a damn about the poor people. The only thing they know is to look after the rich and the

privileged. On its war chest the Provincial Government has R227 million for Health, R200 million for Department of Transport and Public Works, and R864 million in the 2019 Provincial Equitable Share Reserves, which, if needed, can provide for a further response to a COVID-19 resurgence.

Hon Speaker, we are confronted with the resurgence right now. When will the Government start using these funds? When are you going to start testing people in communities? The focus is again placed on saving the economy over saving lives. This is similar to when they pursued that [Inaudible.]. The Provincial Government is again making ridiculous calls for the National Government to scrap the COVID-19 travel red list, and for tourists to be allowed to skip quarantine as long as they can show negative COVID-19 results.

These reckless [Inaudible.] should be condemned. If Western Cape moves back to a hard lockdown, the DA Government is to blame for it.

The ANC calls on the Government to release COVID-19 response funds, especially in the farming communities where there is poor infrastructure. Clinics in West Coast and Tulbagh have serious infrastructure challenges, and are experiencing serious ambulance challenges.

The MTBPS makes no provision to respond to these challenges. Perhaps it is time for the National Government to immediately fund the implementation of the ANC resolutions of a method of accelerated

infrastructure planning, delivery, maintenance and revitalisation of health infrastructure that is similar to the ASADI programme used by Basic Education.

We also welcome the commitment by the National Minister to avail funds for the rebuilding of the Tygerberg Regional Hospital and the Klipfontein Regional Hospital after the DA closed the G F Jooste Hospital.

The National Government must also respond to the plight of the community healthcare workers who cry for recognition. As per the Public Health and Social Development Sectoral Bargaining Council Resolution 1 of 2018 continues to fall on deaf ears in the province, the MEC wants to shift the blame to National Government, despite that the Western Cape in 2019 availed R37,5 million to increase the stipends of community health workers.

Hon Speaker, the world observed the World AIDS Day yesterday under the theme “Ending the HIV Epidemic, Resilience and Impact”. We have to continue advocating for more resources to end the HIV and AIDS epidemic in South Africa and the world.

In 2017 HIV was the third leading underlying natural cause of death in the Western Cape. People with HIV are also at higher risk of death from COVID-19, although to a lesser extent than diabetics.

Of the death from COVID-19 in the Western Cape, 12,0% of public sector patients had HIV. Despite these realities, the Provincial Government failed to avail funds from the equitable shares reserves to cushion the Province from the impact of the decreased Conditional Grant allocations for the HIV, TB, Malaria and Community Outreach Grant, and for HIV and AIDS and TB components. Allow me to commend the National Government for the additional allocation for the HIV, TB, Malaria and the Community Outreach Grant for the presidential employment initiative.

Hon Speaker, the decrease of over R759 million in the budget is a cause for serious concern, as it may collapse the public healthcare in the province. The decrease includes R677 million earmarked for Compensation of Employees that has been surrendered to the Provincial Revenue Fund.

This DA must stop grandstanding by threatening court actions against the DoRA Second Bill. We know this Administration has always been [Inaudible.] of reduced Public Wage Bill. This Department has been enriching recruitment agencies by employing seasonal workers instead of filling vacancies through permanent staff.

The R5 million for staff wellness is not enough given the trauma the health workers have suffered during the course of the pandemic. The Department is in contempt of court and may be liable for a fine following its failure to comply with a Labour Court ruling to reinstate Ms Thandeka Mkonile Madikazi, a clinical programme coordinator for community-based service



for the Khayelitsha Eastern Sub-District, who was unlawfully dismissed by the Department. We call on the MEC to immediately reinstate her and to use this Budget to pay what is due to her.

The ANC does not support the Budget with so many reductions. The Provincial Government must release funds from the reserves to cover for the shortfall in the Budget. I thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Windvogel. Hon members, I now recognise hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, hon Speaker.

From a budget increase of R1,6 billion in the First Adjusted Appropriation, the Department of Health saw a budget cut of R759,5 million in the recent Adjusted Appropriation. Such a budget cut would seem to be as a result of COVID-19 cases decreasing in the province as in the rest of the country.

However, this was not a wise move as our public health sector in the province continues to experience serious challenges. The poorest of our people in the province have not entirely been able to exercise their rights to have access to proper healthcare.

In Mfuleni Community Day Centre or even in the Gugulethu Centre, as an example, one still finds patients waiting in long queues, whether in rainy

or hot weather conditions. Hon Speaker, there are shortages of chairs and sick patients are forced to stand for hours as they await their turn to enter the building facility.

Other issues that residents complain about, is that it is almost impossible to set up a consultation with a doctor as the consultation queue is very long. The dispensation of medication is very slow, owing to shortages of pharmacists. Those who receive their medication late are considered lucky as most either do not receive medication at all, or they receive inadequate medication.

I find it very shocking, hon Speaker, that the Department would cut its budget considering all these challenges and more. Then there is an issue of community healthcare workers whom the Department does not take seriously despite their hard work.

On that note, hon Speaker, we do not support the Vote. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Makamba-Botya. Hon members, I now recognise hon member Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Speaker, we support the Vote.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Herron. Hon members, I now recognise the hon member Philander.

Ms W F PHILANDER: Thank you, hon Speaker, members and citizens.

Hon Speaker, if the situation was not so sad it would almost be laughable, because hon member Windvogel should you just ask the comrades in National why they are looting to the expense of communities. †Punt klaar.  
[Point finished.]

Why are we even confronted with reductions, hon member Makamba-Botya? Because of *skelms* running this country.

Hon Speaker, it ultimately depends on us; on me and you. Each and every one of us have the responsibility to turn the resurgence of infections around. As citizens of this country, specifically in the Western Cape, we have to think very carefully about how we conduct ourselves on a daily basis.

Our simple daily task should be executed with caution. We cannot afford to become reluctant to use safety protocols now. Some may feel especially during the Festive Season that they are done with COVID-19, it has been a difficult year, consider that COVID-19 is not done with us. We cannot let our guards down, for our own safety and that of our loved ones.

Hon Speaker, all of us, all private partners and businesses have the responsibility to make sure that hotspot areas are contained and that this dreadful virus does not spread any further. Even more so, that no further

fatalities occur.

One confirmed case in the Western Cape is one case too many. Thus from the start I wish to welcome Minister Maynier's indication of the funds made available to frontline departments in the province to counteract the surge.

Hon Speaker, we have to face the reality that our health systems are under pressure again. There is no room for petty and cheap politics, no room for empty promises made by National Government during the First Budget Adjustment process, and fearmongering tactics on Twitter that pre-empted a second wave. We must act responsibly. The absence of this will buckle our system and fail those on the frontline, who are already facing serious burnout because these past few months have been draining. But like during the first wave of infections we will again fight this pandemic with all we have.

Hon Speaker, in terms of our COVID-19 preparedness, the Western Cape came out best in South Africa. We will continue to save lives, ensure that the health system is prepared, refine our provincial hotspot strategy and COVID-19 response capability.

But, hon Speaker, I am afraid that we cannot count on National Government to act responsibly, as during a world pandemic they chose to save only their own. The spending on SAA during this critical time is immoral and

again, hon Speaker, this could be tolerated if employees of the SOE at least got to keep their jobs, if the SOE made some profit or even delivered a service. It would even have been okay had we not been plagued with corruption, that really plundered the State coffers to date. But we cannot even bargain on the proceeds of SAA in the auctioning of merchandise when failing SOEs are synonymous with corruption anyway.

Hon Speaker, a National Government that should instead by strengthening provinces, strengthen our Local Government sector and ensure that our people have hope; hope in the future of this country.

Amidst the pandemic what we should see is a committed National Government that goes through great lengths to save lives and restoring dignity in any possible way.

As direct consequence, hon Speaker, the Health Budget in the Second Adjustment Appropriation sees a decrease of R759,531,000.

Hon Speaker, we fortunately foresee in the 2020/21 MTEF Budget spending plans and priorities, innovative healthcare when it comes to the well-being of all our communities, as well as socio-economic and physical well-being, of which one of the main objectives is to ensure the continuation of the response to COVID-19.

In terms of readiness, R5 million will be allocated to the Department of

Health to the Data Centre to sustain credible data and enabling health services to respond efficiently and effectively.

Hon Speaker, the Western Cape Health Department also has a standing capacity of R227 million, excluding inventory. These adjustments will ensure that we will constantly improve the quality of health services in the province under bleak fiscal circumstances.

Hon Speaker, as much as the Western Cape endeavours to keep on improving quality service and saving lives, the reality hits home of the insensitive National Government. How is it even possible to comprehend the SAA bailout when in terms of Vote 6, R19,7 million will be cut off with respect to HIV, TB, Malaria and Community Outreach Grants, which are critical in the delivery of immediate and effective response to communicable diseases, but the health and well-being of every citizen in this province and in every community is of the utmost importance to the Western Cape Government and its Health Department.

Hon Speaker, we are facing tough times, but under this DA-led Government tough times do not last. We have a capable, people-centred Western Cape Government that will ensure they do the best and more with the little they have. A government that have proven over the past months that its conduct relates to the best interest of its people, all people in the Western Cape, and I therefore support the Adjustment to Vote 6.

Hon Speaker, in closing, I wish to reiterate my call on all communities, all businesses, public and private partners and political parties alike, to do their part. To do their part in turning this resurgence of COVID-19 around, to ensure that we do our very best on a daily basis to make sure that the virus does not spread and that it does not claim more lives. We are asking of all our citizens to be vigilant, to make sure that you wear your mask, keep your distance, to make the safe and responsible choices by avoiding crowded and confined places and close-contact settings. When you feel sick, stay home.

These are efforts no budget can buy, but have proven effective against this pandemic. It is truly up to our own responsible choices. Let us protect our system, our jobs and freedom, our opportunities and ourselves.

As the Standing Committee Chair, I wish to express my sincere thanks to the Premier of the Western Cape for his sterling and exceptional leadership. To Minister Nomafrench Mbombo for her commitment to the cause. To Dr Keith Cloete and his entire team on every level, in every healthcare facility across this province. Thank you for your dedication and total commitment to our well-being in the Western Cape. I thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member Philander. I now recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH: Thank you, hon Speaker.

Thank you, hon member Philander and also hon member Herron for supporting the Budget. Thank you very much, and also hon member Philander for some of the additional comments, and also for Course 101 in regard to some of the colleagues who do not seem to understand that where does the reduction come from.

It is beyond our control that we have to reduce almost R600 million because of the Wage Bill. Fortunately, the National Health Minister then, who is even now the current one, is are part of the bargaining chambers. We warned them that if now they agree to this, we have got large number of the public servants and it means that because there was no new money, that we have to take from the money that was supposed to be for the service delivery and to add it in regard to the wage increase.

Of course, the public servants work very hard. If the politicians and everyone could have, even the public and the private could have increases in their salaries, they also deserve an increase, but what we said was that they must look at it so that it does not become a blanket increase. The [Inaudible.] coalface does need an increase, but some of the other categories they might not necessarily need the increase.

So we warned them, but they committed to the three year wage increase without any conditions. Now it hits home that they have to pay back the money, the salaries that are being owed, so hence the unions are taking them to court saying, "No, you agreed."



So the reason for us that we have got this reduction for our 33,000 staff members, it is the result of the National who did not listen. So it is not us who are saying that we are reducing you by 599, so something like that for the Wage Bill, so you need to understand that part of it.

Then secondly, the issue related to the Conditional Grant. It is not us who reduced the HIV/AIDS, the Tertiary Grant and the Training Grant, it is them, because they want to bail out the SAA. What type of government would prioritise such? Bailing the failing SOEs to fly higher at the time that there is a pandemic, such a pandemic? So it is not us, it is because there is no money. That is what they are saying. So it is not our fault. So you need to understand.

Then also with regard to taking reserves. Remember when the President was here in the first week of June, when he promised at the time we are dubbed as the so-called Cape Wuhan, when he promised on the national television that, "Western Cape, you are not alone, you are part of South Africa, and therefore you are in need of resources." There was no money, no money that followed. As a result, the Provincial Treasury has to take R1 billion from the provincial reserves and also for us, we have to take about 480-something, half a billion of our own money in terms of the COVID response.

Plus also National, we had 50-something million from the Disaster Management. Do you know what we received from the National Government at the time, which actually we received late, after we have to do as much that

we have got to do in terms of interventions? The 500 and something million that they boosted for the HIV Grant, you cannot build infrastructure with that money, we could employ more of the additional community health workers and do the PPE. By the way, in this province not a single time, whether by SUI, SIU and everyone, and any other they found us that we had stolen any PPE money, nothing. We never stole PPE in this Government, in this Department of Health.

So that R2 billion that we have to commit to for the COVID, there is no money coming from the National, except for the boosting for the HIV Grant. The CTICC that you are talking about, it is our money that was coming from us.

Thank you to the Department of Public Works, the HOD specifically, the two HODs, where in the short space of time they have to come up and build a 860-plus beds facility, but remember at the time that it was built, Khayelitsha Thusong by the MSF, it was still from the beginning, as part of the field hospital that they were busy with. The Brackengate was not complete at the time. Sonstraal was not completed at the time. The [Inaudible.] I am just listing some of the field hospitals that are there, because we are being told that we wasted. No, we did not waste. It is because that at the time it was easier to have one at CTICC, one field hospital, but we have decentralised that, so there is no need to rebuild, because they are saying that now with the resurgence what are we going to do.

As I mentioned, Hermanus 32 beds, where we use the ground floor in order to build an additional field hospital. The Harry Comay that has got about 60 beds, field hospital. The Sonstraal which has got also the field hospital, and some other decentralisation of this field hospitals. Go to Stellies, Stellenbosch Hospital, go to Vredendal Hospital where they converted the whole of the boiler room in order to have all of these.

So it is not about that the resources are not there, they are everywhere. They are there, but you have to make a point that we decentralised all of those. The testing strategy at the time when we had it, the numbers were high because we are using evidence and also scientific backup. We have got four universities here in the Western Cape where we make use of their academics to provide information, whilst for us we are collecting the data, live data from our own health facilities, where it shows that we need a different strategy when it comes to the testing, because we cannot wait for two weeks for the results to come, noting labs are a national competency. Provinces do not own labs inasmuch as that you might have the branches within the province.

It is they who took longer for the results to come when you have tested the people. There was a time we had a backlog of 25,000 in the Western Cape, and then for the whole country about 80-something thousand. Can you imagine someone comes to the hospital, you do not know whether that person has COVID or not. You are waiting for the result that will take two weeks.

So it was a good thing at the time where we had a different strategy approach in terms of the testing. Let us prioritise those persons who are under investigation in the hospital, let us prioritise our healthcare workers so that they can get results early. Let us prioritise those who have comorbidities. Let us prioritise those who are over 55 so that we could be able to get results in immediately, and also because we got evidence that there is already a community transmission, and therefore there was no need just to have a [Inaudible.] in terms of the testing throughout community testing, but to have a target testing where you could be able to go and get all of those who are infected.

So, hon Speaker, lastly about the infrastructure. Tygerberg, let me mention this. Tygerberg Hospital, which is actually mostly the newest, biggest hospital compared to let us say Groote Schuur which is almost 100 years old and all of those. It is the newest hospital. Remember, central hospitals are actually supposed to be a competency of National, because they are the level 3 hospitals that not only render services for the province, but for the whole of the Western Cape, I mean for the whole of South Africa.

So when they conducted using CSIR, which is the research, which is owned by them, they found that how the hospital was built, it means that the plumbing and also some of the infrastructure, were not suitable and it is them who made a suggestion, a recommendation, that there is a need to decant that hospital. Anyway, it is supposed to be a Level 3 hospital, but it has to accommodate even the Level 2 as a regional hospital. It is they who made

that.

Do you know what? They have never followed up with any other monies, except in terms of maintenance, which is when, in the previous budget year, we made a commitment in terms of the maintenance of the hospital, but the whole of the future is about where you divide the Tygerberg Hospital so that it does what it is supposed to do as an academic and a central hospital, to take care of the training and specialisation, and also to have another hospital that you can accommodate, now the Metro East, which is the regional hospital.

So when now you brag and say, “Thank you, National, for giving us money,” this is what they are supposed to have done long ago.

With the Klipfontein Regional Hospital, which is the Jooste, when at the time also that was decommissioned, because it was pieces and pieces of an old age home that ended up being converted to a hospital, we made a submission because it is their responsibility and their obligation to fund these based on the business case that is submitted to them.

So that they took longer to respond to us when we use our own money in regard to the various phases of going towards the hospital, because already the issue of the site and everything we use for our own money, now they are opening their eyes, they are saying, “Oh, *arme foeitog*, we are going to the Klipfontein.” That is because they owe us and they are too late for that, they

should have done it long ago.

So we must stop this thing that National is doing us a favour. No, the taxpayers pay them, they are collecting the money, they tax there and then they have to dish out to our provinces.

So, hon Speaker, having said that, I just want to thank the team again, the Government – I mean the Department, and also all other colleagues, HODs specifically my colleagues from the Executive, other departments, as part of the hotspot strategy they have been responsible for, also taking into account the districts together with the District Mayors and the municipalities to make sure that COVID is no longer a public health issue, but also the face of COVID is social and economic. And thanks for the Premier for chairing the weekly Provincial Command Council as part of the extended Cabinet. And thanks the fifth floor and also the Standing Health Committee for making us accountable.

Thank you very much, hon Speaker.

[Debate concluded.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister, and to the hon members who participated in this Budget Vote. That concludes this Budget Vote.

Hon members, at this point I wish to suspend the House and we will come back at 13:40, and that will be twenty to two, and then we will resume with our proceedings. The House is suspended.

[Business of the House was suspended and resumed after the break.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may be seated. Good afternoon hon members. I trust you are all back online and we will proceed with immediate effect. The Secretary will read the fourth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 5 – Education – *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 7 – 2020].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr Secretary. I recognise the hon Minister Schäfer.

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thanks very much, hon Deputy Speaker and to all colleagues. I would dearly have loved to have been able to share some good news with the House today, following my honest account of the challenges that faced us when we discussed the special Adjustment Budget in July. Unfortunately, as I predicted then, we have not seen any real improvement in our financial situation in this Adjustment Budget.

Firstly, we have had a drastic reduction of R977 million, styled as realignment of the 2020/2021 COE Budget. This is premised on the fact that the public sector wage freeze that is currently being implemented by the National Government, will not be overturned in court. Just yesterday we heard that the National Government was trying to settle the matter, but the unions have refused any postponement of the court hearing. This means, quite simply, that if the National Government loses the court case, we will have a sudden hole of nearly R1 billion in our budget. If it is settled, the chances of the unions settling on what we can afford as a province, are zero. And the chances of us getting the amount from National Treasury that they may negotiate with the unions are less than zero, as this is what we have been dealing with now for many years. And we are then expected to absorb the loss without the money.

So the money has been taken away pre-emptively based on an assumption of a court verdict, a very dangerous stance indeed on several levels. It is thus vitally important that the hon Premier and hon Minister Maynier have submitted a Section 79 petition to the President, questioning the constitutionality of the pre-emptive action.

In this budget we will receive an additional R814 million in funding from the National Treasury for the Presidential Employment Initiative. This will enable the temporary, very temporary in fact, appointment of education assistants and other school assistants as well as direct relief to schools struggling to support SGB-appointed teachers. Whilst we welcome any



funding, and there is no doubt that having classroom assistants will help our teachers in overcrowded classrooms and additional people helping at school will be beneficial, but what happens after March next year? These people will be appointed in December. Schools are on holiday from the 15th December until late January, so they will really be in school for two months.

It will assist in stimulating the economy to some extent, yes, but I am very concerned that this amounts to fiscal dumping and not a genuine attempt to give the real support that is needed and it involves a huge amount of additional work. Our schools will just start getting used to having the extra help when the project comes to an end, as we have no indication that the funding will continue.

So while on paper it almost appears as if we are not losing much money, it is an illusion because the money that is desperately needed on our baseline is being removed and what we are getting back is a short-term fiscal dump for a limited and prescribed purpose. And the ANC has the gall to speak about giving hope.

On the infrastructure front, we have said before that we are struggling to keep up with maintaining our existing schools, building new schools and replacing fencing. The short-term allocation of an additional R192 million will allow us to supplement our fencing and maintenance projects for this financial year. We had previously committed to providing 30 schools with

high security fencing each year as part of the Provincial Safety Plan. This will now be increased for this year with the additional funding. We will also be able to implement some of the necessary maintenance projects we would otherwise have had to postpone. This is also designed to stimulate the economy.

Whilst it is welcome, we need to bear in mind that R159 million was cut from the Education Infrastructure Grant by the National Treasury earlier this year and we have had to divert around R450 million to COVID safety measures and curriculum support. So actually we have a net loss of R417 million, but there is money to bail out failing and mismanaged SOEs.

Essentially the Department has been allocated an additional R1 billion that it must spend before the end of the financial year. This is a very challenging task at the end of an already challenging year. Yet I know that if anyone can get this job done, it will be our incredible team. Our ability to do this will be dependent on all role-players, including the construction industry. We are completely committed to spending every bit and to do so by the book, but we need to understand that there are risks, given the lateness of the allocation.

So in the current circumstances we are very pleased to receive the additional funds, but what we really need is not once-off stopgap measures, conditional grants, presidential projects and earmarked allocations. What we need is a reliable, sustainable baseline so we can implement our plans and provide what is needed for education in our province. We need to be honest about

what this kind of uncertainty means for the education in the Western Cape.

Our province has seen a consistent and substantial increase in learner numbers every year for the better part of a decade. So we have a good idea of how many extra learners we will need to accommodate each year but this is not as simple as just building new schools. Dealing with increasingly crowded schools in areas of high demand requires a package deal, classrooms to accommodate the learners, teachers to teach the learners and resources for teaching and learning, such as textbooks, furniture and ICT infrastructure, devices and software, the supplies for the new learners arriving in the system, as well as the backlog we have from previous years. We do not need a handful of new schools, we need dozens. And we also need thousands of staff to deliver the education that we have to deliver. This involves large-scale, multi-year construction projects, in addition to the deployment of mobile classroom, ongoing teacher professional development and the appointment of sufficient appropriately qualified people. To maintain a ratio of 1 to 35 we currently need an additional 1 453 teachers for the learners that we have in our schools right now.

So when people flippantly ask what is the plan for next year to deal with the incoming cohort of learners, they clearly have no idea of what scale of a problem we are facing. There is no way around it. We have to pay for buildings, we have to pay for teachers and we have to provide resources. If we do not have the funding we cannot do that. It is Finance 101. As I alluded to earlier, clear forward-looking financial planning is essential in managing

this increase and trying to address the backlog. Such planning requires a clear picture of the budget we will receive from year-to-year.

Unfortunately, we have no certainty regarding our funding levels. Instead we have infrastructure grants suddenly disappearing, whilst we have already planned for its expenditure. We have funding to account for the growth in learners allocated at last, only for it to be taken away through a cut in the Provincial Equitable Share. And we have inconsistent and/or unsustainable policy on public sector wages as the National Government aligned partners squabble with one another. In fact, the only consistent thing about education funding in this country is how readily the National Government will divert it to other bailouts, like the SAA vanity project. It is time to bail out our schools.

The Leader of the Opposition in this House loves his tired old slogan that we like to blame and complain. Well, we have good reason to, because the ANC is to blame for the financial mess in which we find ourselves and we have every right to complain because we see the effects of this on the ground. We actually care about our teachers and our learners and all our other Government officials in this province. And when we see how they are working themselves to the bone while the ANC holds out their tired slogans and stale policies that stifle any possibility of economic growth, we will complain. We will complain on behalf of our province and we will complain on behalf of our people. And instead of moaning about us complaining, how about doing something to address the real issues that we are raising?

So let me make it perfectly clear, without an adequate budget we are unable to pay for all the things we need to deliver quality education to learners in this province. Budget cuts mean we cannot build enough schools for the additional 18 000 learners added to our province's schools each year. So there will be a major struggle to find school places every single year until this changes. Budget cuts mean it is harder and harder to undertake speedy repairs and maintenance of schools. Budget cuts mean we cannot put high security fencing around all schools that need it and that they will continue to fall victim to the malicious criminals in our communities.

Having said that, we also cannot accept the ongoing wanton destruction of Government property with the expectation that it will be replaced immediately; it will not. Budget cuts mean we cannot provide learner transport to every learner who needs it, so we still have small children walking up to five kilometres to get to school. Budget cuts mean we cannot hire more teachers. So class sizes and the pressure on our teachers will continue to rise. We cannot continue to provide quality education to every learner in this province without the money to pay for it. It is a financial impossibility.

While the Western Cape prioritises education during our budgeting process, every department will suffer as the National Government demands massive cuts to the provincial share, no matter how important services they deliver are. But there is always money for SAA. We must acknowledge that we are in a very difficult situation and it is going to require working together like

never before, but we can do so if we maintain focus. This Province has shown what we can do during the course of this year under the leadership of our hon Premier. We will continue to do everything we can to protect the education funding we have and fight for prioritisation of education by the National Government on a sustainable basis. Our goal will remain delivering the best possible quality education we can for every learner in this province and we will continue to provide dignity to those in our province and hope for South Africa, because it certainly is not coming from the ANC.

Lastly, I would like to thank the SG and his team for all their work this year and especially Mr Eli in the finance team for what they do to try and manage this huge, but not nearly huge enough, budget.

Thank you to hon Premier Alan Winde and my Cabinet colleagues for trying to assist us during these very difficult times. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise the hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, today marks the halfway in our 16 days of Activism Against The Abuse of Women and Children. Domestic violence and abuse have a detrimental effect on a child's education and even with the difficult year that 2020 has already been for both educators and learners due to Covid-19, we were horrified to hear of the spike in domestic violence

during the hard lockdown. We must defeat this evil together.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the education sector is reeling at the loss of many colleagues and the psycho-social impact of Covid-19 on educators is unimaginable. Hon Deputy Speaker, as we witness a surge in Covid-19 numbers across many education districts, the ANC calls for an increased budget for the health and wellness of employees as well as a budget to address overcrowded classrooms. With all the challenges of education in the province, the ANC is particularly perturbed that the Western Cape Education Department wastes taxpayers' money to employ senior counsel for the Heathfield principal, Mr Wesley Newman's, internal hearing. The Department would rather waste money to be vengeful, instead of addressing the most pressing challenges. Teachers at former model C schools can do as they please, while principals of our historically disadvantaged schools are hauled over the coals when doing things in the best interests of learners.

We have a serious racism challenge in schools and systemic racism in the Western Cape. While resources have been made available and action taken against Mr Newman, no action has been taken as yet against teachers that attended a whites-only private matric farewell in Brackenfell High School.

The ANC stands firmly behind Mr Newman and we call for an amicable solution and engagements on the Newman matter.

Hon Deputy Speaker, education is an important tool to improve the quality of

life for the most vulnerable in our society. Quality teaching and leadership in schools are therefore imperative. In the next budget the ANC will call for a directorate within the WCED that deals specifically with the problem of racism in our schools. Whilst the Head of Department acceded to racism being a problem in our schools, sadly this budget does not make provision to address the problem. We understand that the HOD is sincere in wanting racism to be addressed in the schools.

The African National Congress demands clarity also on the budget for the appointment of the principal at Riviersonderend High School in the Overberg when it was advertised in the Education Bulletin no. 3 of 2019, post 1642. The ANC calls for an urgent investigation into the alleged unfair labour practice, institutional inequality and lack of transformation at Riviersonderend High School. Riviersonderend seems to be another Brackenfell in the making. We have failed to transform the education system considerably in the province and this Adjustment Budget continues to ignore this transformation that is needed. The privileged few receive world-class education, while the majority are subjected to overcrowded classrooms and learning under very poor conditions in schools with poor infrastructure. This budget does not address these disparities. Whilst learner enrolment figures increase, which will have a bearing on class sizes, the budget is silent on building additional classrooms.

In contrast, the ANC Government in Gauteng has made provision in the budget for schools to build additional classrooms as a response to growing



learner numbers and to ensure that every child in the province will be in school come 2021.

Hon Deputy Speaker, another way to address overcrowded classrooms is the employment of additional teachers. In this regard we are concerned with the reduction of the over R977 million for compensation of employees that has been surrendered to the Provincial Revenue Fund. We welcome the additional R814 million, just over that, from the National Government in respect of the Presidential Employment Initiative Programme intended to employ teacher assistants.

Whilst one particular MEC in this House, Dr Ivan Meyer, dismisses me in this Chamber as a junior, his fellow MEC Schäfer asked last week of me to lobby National Government colleagues for increased funding to sustain the employment of teacher assistants in our schools. As a so-called junior, I want to call upon MEC Schäfer to lobby her Cabinet colleague MEC Maynier for additional funding for this purpose. The National Government has played its part, regardless of how critical and valid criticism we can have.

We note the additional R192 million to fund the SOPA commitment by the hon Premier to build security fences at 30 schools each year for the next five years and we welcome that. However, we are shocked and dismayed that the hon Premier made that commitment but now there is no longer a commitment to sustain this programme beyond the next six months.

The budget does not address the challenge of scholar transport in the province. Parents are in the dark regarding the future of Route 315 in Grabouw, where over 100 learners are transported to schools. Instead, the hon MEC can cut expenditure on the School Evaluation Authority and spend the funds to employ more teacher assistants. Moreover, the African National Congress has consistently lobbied the MEC to consider engaging former Model C schools to increase the number of learners per grade. Increasing class sizes in former Model C schools would greatly assist in addressing many challenges in our schooling system, including overcrowded classrooms, unplaced learners, inequality and racism in the province. We cannot support this budget.

Hon Deputy Speaker, we have an oversight responsibility over the Executive. Part of what we are working on today is in line with that. It is rather concerning, hon Deputy Speaker, that the Democratic Alliance uses the Legislature as a tick box exercise, with some members shielding the Executive from accountability. There is a finding made against the contract of the accounting officer of this Department, the person responsible for the budget we are deliberating today, at least at the operational level, yet we have not had time to engage with the PSC to get its side of the story on its report which said the contract extension of Mr Schreuder was irregular and unlawful. And I say that with the deepest respect to Mr Schreuder. Mr Schreuder has served the Western Cape Education very, very well and this further issue is basically dragging his name through the mud.

Our efforts to invite the PSC to the Committee were pushed back by the DA that has been kicking the report for touch and undermining the PSC in the process. The PSC will now only be invited after submitting a so-called final report, whilst both the hon Premier and the Legislature's legal advisor were able to present their opinions in opposition to the report. The contents advisor or the procedural officer even advised us that we must have the PSC.

I wish to commend the student activists, civil society movements, parents, former and current teachers and education activists as a whole across the political spectrums for working closely with us to enhance our level of oversight responsibility over this Government. We commit that moving forward we will continue working as we firmly believe that education stakeholders and civil society must never be undermined but must be strengthened and used to enhance our work to serve learners.

The issue is not necessarily about the province and the Department of Education not having money, but it is about a lack of political leadership that informs skewed priorities of the Provincial Government when it comes to education, how the limited resources are misspent and how education is mismanaged at a political level, regardless of the efforts that our long-serving and multi-talented officials and dedicated officials in the Department want to make.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thanks, hon member.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise hon Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. One of the things that the Western Cape Education Department sets itself up to is to achieve – to make sure that each and every child receives quality learning in a functional and an enabling environment. However, the means undertaken by this Department to achieve such an aim remain shockingly inappropriate, to say the least. A racist school environment which is aimed at excluding and suppressing a black learner can never be classified as enabling nor functional. It is nothing but a rotten environment which is kept intact by a failing Education Department with poor governance structures from the top.

Moreover, as the EFF we will leave no stone unturned until a black child is accommodated in a non-racial education environment that will allow him or her to thrive. Those days of apartheid and segregation policies have come and gone and no racist, either a child or a parent, will be allowed to be comfortable with their racist tendencies.

Furthermore, the Education Department must stop shifting funds to the Office of the Premier and start utilising those funds for infrastructure purposes. Township public schools require proper classrooms for learners and not those makeshift defective classrooms that are forever dismantled by winds during winter and stormy seasons. Those things put the lives of the learners at risk.

Moreover, township schools also require sport facilities for purposes of extramural activities.

Lastly, the Department must stop surrendering funds to the Provincial Revenue Fund at the cost of creating job opportunities. EFF rejects this budget. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, we support the vote, but I do want to raise some concern around the transfer of R40 million from the Education Department's budget for relocation and refurbishment of the head office. In the context of the MEC's constant complaints about budget cuts, not having enough budget to fulfil the function of the Department, the transfer of R40 million for refurbishment of office space for the head office and for the MEC herself is really a case of poor judgment. And I would like the MEC to explain how that judgment came about to be exercised, R40 million for refurbishment and relocation at a time when the MEC and the Department are complaining about insufficient funds to provide education to young learners in our province. Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. Hon Christians.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, the ACDP supports this budget vote but I believe that the Minister was very negative with her remarks. I think as a province we must be very grateful for the funding for additional teacher assistants because we know these teacher assistants will be of great help in our most vulnerable communities where we have overcrowded classrooms and I believe with this intervention our learners will be able to get quality education.

Also with the fencing, year in and year out we go to schools, there is no fencing. Now there is additional money given so that we can have fencing. We have been to areas where we see the gunshots, we hear all about these things. I think as a provincial department we must be grateful that we have additional – yes, there will not be enough money for various things but the important thing is, what we receive we must be grateful for and make the best of it.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I still believe with all of this we can have quality education and that is what the Department stands for.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Quality education in every classroom for every child and that is what believe.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the hon member Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy Speaker, allow me to make this remark. It seems that the EFF is ANC-lite and the ANC is EFF-lite, both honourable members sang from the same hymnal this afternoon. Hon Deputy Speaker, this year Minister Maynier titled the Second Adjustment Budget in the Western Cape, I quote: “A budget to bounce back”, which is once again nothing short of miraculous. And when it comes to Vote 5, it is something Provincial Treasury and the WCED are all too familiar with.

Hon Deputy Speaker, so what led to the Western Cape having to bounce back, I ask? I argue this is due to years of the accumulation of debt by our National Government or, as it may, through the inability to stifle corruption and looting in the public sector on the mere back seat economic policy approach by the African National Congress, or is it EFF-lite.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Democratic Alliance sounds like a broken record when it comes to drawing attention to this ticking time bomb, but it finds it nothing more than devastating that we have a debt level in this country as big as our spending on health and education services. Hon Deputy Speaker, one would have some sort of empathy for the debt crisis in this economic climate

but not when the National Government chooses to bail out SAA instead of boosting our front-line services. It has a direct impact on the income and expenditure estimates to Vote 5, the WCED, its staff and learners.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I wish to welcome the sound and financial management by Provincial Treasury having been able to have a reserve to mitigate the effects of the ANC-led DORA Bill 2020. I thus wish to welcome the following significant adjustments made to the Department of Education in the Province: R412 000 shifted to the Department of the Premier to fund an independent reviewer for the e-portal website.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the pandemic and lockdown cut the academic year drastically and limited the availability of education resources to learners in the province. I thus welcome the shift to improve the accessibility of resources to learners.

I do welcome the additional allocation of R814 million in respect of the Presidential Employment Initiative Programme that aims to employ 20 000 teaching and general assistants in our province. But I call on National Government to extend this programme in the new financial year and bring about meaningful employment for young people in our province and in our country.

Hon Deputy Speaker, in particular I wish to welcome the increase of R192 million for the Accelerated Infrastructure Maintenance for School



Facilities and Fencing Projects. Along with this, I wish to welcome the allocation to deploy additional safety officers at schools by Provincial Treasury and I wish to alert my hon Opposition member of this Committee to the fact that the bailout of the SAA, what more fences at our schools could have been improved if we did not have to do the bailout.

In total, the Provincial Education Department received a total increase of approximately R1 billion and like Minister Schäfer mentioned, along with the track record of academic performance and sound administration by the WC, this is the only education department that can spend funds where it is needed most.

With this, I wish to sincerely thank the SG, who is present here, Mr Brian Schreuder and his team for leading the most successful, well-administered and responsive Education Department in the country for years. Upon his retirement, this will be a true legacy for every learner. Sir, thank you - through you, hon Deputy Speaker - for leading from the front and for your contribution to education in this province. I take the opportunity of wishing you well on your retirement. Thank you for the footprint you shall leave.

Unfortunately, hon Deputy Speaker, these adjustments do not address the concerns raised during the First Adjustment Budget and the adjustments are meant to be understood in entirety. Hon Deputy Speaker, allow me to refresh. The following Provincial Education Grants were cut from the Western Cape

during July 2020: R159 million from the Education Infrastructure Grant and the HIV and AIDS Grant was cut by R4.8 million. The Maths, Science and Technology was cut by R5.1 million. These cuts were separate to the funds the Western Cape Education Department already had to use from the existing Infrastructure Grant for Covid-19 Relief amounting to approximately R615 million. Hon Deputy Speaker, in effect there has been no increase in funds allocated to the Western Cape Education Department in the Second Adjustment Budget when considering the DORA 2020 closely.

The fact thus remains that the money simply does not follow learners and infrastructure required to maintain the vision of quality education for every learner in every classroom as we hoped and we envisioned. The Democratic Alliance has raised concern on concern on the slow and non-existent adoption of the Provincial Equitable Share ratio and the inadequacies of the quintile system towards the increase of learners to the province and the need for more infrastructure. And at the same time, hon Deputy Speaker, it is really discouraging to note the total bailout of SAA this year that amounts to R40 million could have built 25 additional schools in our province, but again the ANC in this House will come at the start of the new academic year and shout from the rooftops when learners cannot be placed.

It is further discouraging that the President's announcement of a tablet for each learner during his 2019 SOPA address remains a pipe dream, which actually would have come in handy during this pandemic. But, hon Deputy Speaker, it is evident that we cannot rely on National Government to uphold

its pledges, nor even to the most deserving citizens.

Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you to the Minister Schäfer who has attended our Committee meetings on a regular basis. I wish to thank every teacher in every classroom in this province who has adapted to the innovation of teaching, those who have taken the leap of treading on a path that has not been tread before. Thank you to all principals who have embraced these challenges brought by Covid-19 to the sector, but nonetheless led from the front. To all our parents who stepped up as teachers, a sincere thank you.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I am concerned about the learners who are not back at school and who will have to repeat grades as a consequence of the lockdown and long periods of absenteeism. Through you, hon Deputy Speaker, hon Minister, I trust that you could speak to how the WCED will address the possible increasing numbers in different grades.

To the members of the Standing Committee, thank you for the support through rigorous engagement, robust debates on the WCED plans and programmes in the interests of our learners, for their availability in embarking on oversight visits, more than what is usually expected. Thank you to the Standing Committee's very capable procedural officer, Ms Hassan Moosa, for her efforts in making our critical work possible.

As I conclude, hon Deputy Speaker, yesterday the hon Leader of the Opposition questioned why the Western Cape Medium-Term Budget

Statement is a budget to bounce back. I hope to have made it clear today, along with my DA colleagues in the contribution of their Adjustment Budgets, that it is a budget to bounce back due to years of maladministration, looting, poor governance and inadequate policies, courtesy of an ANC-led National Government and this year its DORA Bill that borders unconstitutionally in implementation, hon Deputy Speaker.

I support Vote 5 but I make a serious call to the National Government to implement responsible fiscal measures that do not strain front-line servers such as education that affects generations to come and I trust that either the ANC as the EFF-lite or the EFF as the ANC-lite, will bring this under the attention of their national comrades. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I know recognise the hon Minister Schäfer.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. To start with hon Sayed, I think there is one thing I can agree with you on and that is that we must defeat the evil of gender based violence against women and that the 16 days of activism should in fact be 365 days of activism. Actually there are two things I support him on and the second being that we agree, we would love more budget for psycho-social impact as well as for health and wellness programmes for teachers, plus more teachers for overcrowded classrooms and if the hon member was listening carefully, that is exactly what I was complaining about and being negative, according to hon Christians. We agree

completely, we need more money for health and wellness, we need more money for teachers, we need more money for classrooms, absolutely.

The case of Mr Newman, as hon Sayed knows, is currently the subject of a disciplinary process and I am the appeal authority, so I will not get involved despite numerous requests and enticements to do so, into the merits of the matter. But what I will say is that I find it extremely interesting, the incredible interest that the ANC is taking in this particular matter and that the matter is dealing with some issues that actually go against the ANC's own national policy. So perhaps hon Sayed should speak to the national Minister about his approach in this matter.

And I also want to dispel any concerns that people in different schools get treated differently. They do not. There have been some principals at so-called former Model C schools that have definitely been disciplined and that is the point. It will be done without fear or favour based on the facts of every individual case.

Racism challenges in schools. No-one denies that there are challenges in schools across the country. In fact, not only at schools, we see people in this House who have some very concerning attitudes towards different races. And we completely agree it is something that needs to be eradicated. We have been working on it for a number of years already and unfortunately from time to time there are issues that come up that need attention and we will certainly deal with those issues. We do not tolerate racism. We have embarked on the

values campaign and transformative performance strategy and it does not require a lot of budget actually. There is budget for the transformative performance strategy but really it involves teaching values in schools, which is what we are doing. It also involves teaching values at home, which we obviously cannot control but by doing it in schools we are really hoping, based on good evidence, that it will spread out into communities and that we will over time reduce any racism that does still exist in our province.

I also discuss the issue of a specific principal appointment. My HOD does that. If he has not been appointed, there is good reason for it. I have yet to see a case where my HOD has not appointed somebody for anything other than good reason, because what is important and what is crucial is that we get the best principals in every school in this province, because leadership of principals is what determines how good a school is.

I agree that we still do not have sufficient funding to address the disparities, but I do not agree that just because schools are in poor communities they do not get good education. We have seen a very, very good and very promising improvement in schools in poor communities, despite the very difficult circumstances, despite the fact that they have overcrowded classrooms, because of the dedication of our teachers and our officials to help those teachers. And I think shortly we will be getting the results of some more tests that will also prove that point yet again.

Gauteng. Well, that is interesting that hon Sayed refers to Gauteng where

they incurred R1 billion in irregular expenditure to compare us with providing additional classes. We only spend money we have, and unfortunately it is not enough. Even then, perhaps we need to also find out how Gauteng has people that are in place, because there are certainly rumours and they are quite strong rumours that as soon as people are not placed in a school or do not accept the placement in a school, they are removed from the list. So they are not regarded as being looking for a place any longer.

As far as money, we did not surrender R977 million to anywhere. It has been cut from us for the COE that I referred to in my main address, because of the reliance of the National Government on winning this court case on the increase in wages. I never said we are not continuing with the 30 fences a year at all. I said, because of the additional funding, we are able to do more than 30 fences this financial year, but only this financial year. We are certainly continuing with the 30 fences per year as planned as well and if we get extra money next year, we will do more.

Cut on the COE – there is absolutely no chance we will cut on the COE. It is revealing the most amazing things about schools already. The assessments that have been done, the evaluations that have been done have been well received by, I think, every school. Some with more enthusiasm than others but they are really welcoming what is coming out of those reports. They are engaging. They are improving. They are wanting to improve, and the Department is also being held accountable because the HOD and I get reports from the Chief evaluator.

It is revealing some very, very interesting trends in schools. Some extremely good practices and some that need attention, but it is already showing that it can and will improve the quality of education in our schools. And I can understand why the ANC does not want it because accountability is something they do not like and that is something that we are determined to continue with in this province and ensure that we have excellence. Not to try and brush it under the carpet with generalised reports of a non-existent entity like Nido.

Finding millions [Inaudible.] SG is something that the Premier will be making an announcement shortly on. I know he has a meeting next week with the Public Service Commission and there is some very interesting further information that has come up in that matter and I really regret what my SG has been put through in this matter by opportunistic politicians, who also keep on saying how wonderful he is, but then trash him at every opportunity.

I also have to ask, how someone can have deep respect for an individual, or say they have deep respect for an individual when in fact they stand together with fired former principal Brian Isaacs, who holds up a post, calling him a “son of a bitch”, and members of the governing body who post pictures of myself and him as Nazi’s.

Hon Xego, you referred to racist school environments. I do not believe that any school has a completely racist environment and I believe there can be issues of racism at specific schools. The one you are referring to obviously



is Brackenfell, where you terrorised a community for an entire week and I really regret and trust that you will do that [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One minute, Minister, if you can just take your seat, there is [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): On a point of order, Deputy Speaker. It is unparliamentary for the MEC to speak directly to member Xego, no matter how uncomfortable the truth that he is saying, feels to her. The truth about racism. She must not speak directly to him. She must speak through you, thank you [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: [Inaudible.] making a speech. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Just say it again through the Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: To me, through the Chair.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I was speaking through you Deputy Chair. As far as stop shifting manager dot [Inaudible.] I will deal with that under the e-Portal, where hon Botha also mentioned it. Schools that are forever being blown over – one school blew over in an extremely bad storm and the recent storms in fact, schools that were damaged, the most were brick and mortar schools. So it is not the case that mobile schools are worse than other schools at all, although obviously we would like to have brick and mortar

schools wherever we can, but given what you've said about the budget that is not possible.

Just again on the Brackenfell issue. We have seen reports of black learners at the school also saying that they did not experience racism. So, as I said whilst we do not say there are not necessarily incidents of racism, we do not believe that it is a broad culture, and it is clear from people who have come out themselves and said that they did not experience it. That not everyone experiences it the same, but we certainly are working with the school and I will be making a statement on that, I think, tomorrow regarding what has happened about that investigation and what is being done from here onwards.

Hon Herron, yes I agree with you, I am quite happy to explain that relocation and refurbishment of office space. Thank you for supporting the budget. What has happened for the last, before I was even appointed MEC, is that our [Inaudible.] have been in a building in Parliament Street which has been, I do not think sub-optimal is even the word to describe it. It has not been maintained properly. It has lifts that do not work. It has caused incredible loss of productivity. Apart from that, some people regard it as actually a 'sick building syndrome'.

In fact, I think even the Department of Labour has made comments about the state of the building and for many, many years, every single year that building has been the subject of union discussions and threats and we have been keeping them from taking further drastic action by promising them that

we are looking for a new building. After many, many years of trying we finally have found one and I have absolutely no guilt whatsoever about motivating for this to happen. It is important to deliver services that our staff have a building and environment that is conducive and safe for them to work in and that is why we support. It is not for myself. I am staying exactly where I am. I am not included in the move.

Hon Christians, thank you also for supporting the Vote. I am sorry that you think I was negative, but I am afraid that is the reality. I have no doubt – I said we were grateful for the money. I said we were happy to receive it, but the reality is, it will be there for two months and you will be the one coming, through the Deputy Speaker, at the end of March – I am asking where these assistants are. So, what I am saying is, we welcome it, yes absolutely but we want it to be extended and this money is only being approved until the end of March. So, teachers will just get used to having these assistants, schools will get used to having these assistants and then they will disappear. So that is my concern. We certainly do welcome them, and we would love them to continue further into the new financial year.

The same with fences. I have said we welcome the extra money, but it is not sustainable on a long term basis, but also it is coming at a time that is very late in the year which makes it difficult for us to ensure that that is spent in time, especially if there may be builders' holidays coming up. So I am just highlighting concerns, because I will be asked in this House in a few months' time why the money has not been spent, if it is not being spent.

So, hon Botha, thank you very much for your comments as well as for your [Inaudible.] points and yes, the portal has been hugely successful and was really maximally utilised by our officials and curriculum and e-learning during Lockdown particularly. They made huge, huge, huge strides in increasing the size of portals, the capacity and the number of resources that were put on it which enabled many, many people to access quality content that they could otherwise not have done when schools were closed. We have even experienced other provinces using it. Whoever sees it is blown away by what they have seen on there and a lot of that is also free content and zero-rated for those who cannot afford data.

I completely agree with you regarding the Quintile system. As you know, I have been on at that for the last five years and will continue to do so. It is unfair. It does not accurately reflect the poverty levels in many communities where those schools are situated. I am not sure why people are not back at school now because they should be. So, you know, obviously we will look at every school in the new year and see what has to be done where, but parents must also take responsibility for getting their children to school. Government cannot do everything.

I think that is all. So, I can just end by saying thank you to all participants. Thank you once again, to the SG and the team and to those who supported the budget. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. That

concludes the debate on this vote. If we can just give the officials a few minutes just to load up the new video for streaming and for our HOD's to move out. Thank you very much. Thank you, hon members. Premier, we are now going to move on. The Secretary will read the fifth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 9 – Environmental Affairs and Development Planning – *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 7 – 2020].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Mr Secretary. I now recognise the hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, hon Premier, hon Cabinet colleagues, members of the Legislature, ladies and gentlemen.

I rise today to present the Second Adjustment Estimate for the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning for the 2020 Financial Year. This includes CapeNature. Colleagues, it was only four months ago that we met to table an Adjustment Budget. This was done primarily to reallocate provincial funds in the ongoing fight against COVID-19.

That money was used well. The Province successfully built four giant field hospitals within six weeks. These hospitals were equipped and staffed and

were huge successes. I want to congratulate the Premier and the Minister of Health and the Minister of Transport and Public Works in particular on a job well done. I also want to congratulate and thank all the officials of this Western Cape Provincial Government working incredibly hard behind the scenes to combat this pandemic.

Looking at other provinces, it is indeed in times of crisis that one sees if the foundation is made of rock or sand. Hon Deputy Speaker, as we meet here, we have seen off successfully the first wave of infection. That led to the reopening of the economy. It has become a matter of urgency to get the economy growing again. The tourism and hospitality sector remains hard hit by the economic repercussions and job losses remain a serious concern. There is no doubt that the health and economic impacts of COVID-19 had been devastating. This devastation continues.

We meet here at a time when COVID-19 infections are spiking again. We see more than 100% increases in infections in some regions this past week alone. It is “all-hands-on-deck” yet again. The concern is, we are heading into the summer holiday season where we expect a lot of travel and visitors in and out of our province.

We all know that none of this comes easily or cheaply and so we find ourselves having to pass another Adjustment Budget. This response is particularly aimed at the public health priority of saving lives, while maintaining fiscal stability.

The Minister of Finance has highlighted the changes made by the Provincial Treasury, and I am now going to briefly take you through the changes and effects on the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning.

This Department remains one of the smallest in the Provincial Government and – similar to other departments – has been hit with continued budget constraints over the past few years. We have over the years already cut our expenses down to the bone and we continue to save where we can at the present time. This has an impact on our programmes and will certainly continue to have an impact in the future. The more the budget is cut, the more programmes have to be put into cold storage.

With the First Adjustment Budget some of the funding initially allocated to some projects was shifted to the pot to help the Treasury fill other holes. Deputy Speaker, I want to note here for the record, again, that the money we are giving up is money we cannot afford to give up, but we do so, because we understand the reason is great. But we will need the funding back once the system is reset and we get on with business post COVID-19.

Despite the cuts to funding that we have made over the past year, we are doing everything we can to ensure the impact on service delivery - even during the period under review – remains as minimal as possible. With this latest adjustment, the entire cut is coming from the promised salary increases staff of this Department were going to get this year. This is a decision taken

by the National Government, not to honour previous wage agreements with unions. I want to highlight a concern about this scenario, especially at a time where Government employees are working very hard to keep communities safe.

Deputy Speaker, the original appropriation for Vote 9, which includes the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning and the Provincial public entity, CapeNature, was R620 847 000. The COVID-19 First Adjusted Budget which was tabled earlier this year, realised a reduction of R8 921 000 which reduced the allocation to R611 926 000. Today we table further reductions of R21 500 000 across the Department and CapeNature. This significant reduction is achieved through the reduction of the budgeted annual salary increases that will, depending on the outcome of the court case between the National Government and trade unions, no longer happen this year.

Deputy Speaker, the Department, and its entity CapeNature continue to be ably led by officials and leaders who have spent the past few months rolling up their sleeves and getting the work done. I want to wish these leaders and their teams and indeed all members of this House, further good health and strength in the coming months. With those few words, I table the Department's latest Adjustment Budget. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise hon Marran.



Mr P MARRAN: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Deputy Speaker, can you hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I can hear you perfectly.

Mr P MARRAN: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon members, ladies and gentlemen, I rise on behalf of the African National Congress to give input on this Budget Vote, but allow me first to send condolences to the family, friends and comrades of comrade Patko Mapatiza, previously Regional Secretary of the Southern Cape who succumbed to COVID-19 this morning in the George Hospital. May his dear soul rest in peace.

Deputy Speaker, from the very outset of this vote as with a number of votes there is resignation to surrendering funds, especially from the compensation of employees to the Provincial Revenue Fund. We cannot ignore the fact that part of these monies to be surrendered relates to the filling of vacancies or new posts. The instruction by Provincial Treasury for these funds to be surrendered is partly a failure by the Premier's Department to finalise job descriptions as most of the departments do not have their own HR departments. It is not the first time that we see money surrendered from the same votes, Deputy Speaker.

In the previous financial year, large amounts of monies meant for the Compensation of Employees were surrendered by a number of departments and yet we complained about budget cuts while we have failed to spend the

little we had. The officials and staff of this Provincial Government must question whether their political leadership is prepared to fight on their behalf or not. As a result, Deputy Speaker, the cut of over R21 million to this vote is deeply concerning to the ANC. We are told that staff at Cape Nature will see no salary increases in the next year or so, yet we are in the tourism season already.

Concern must be raised at the forecasted drop in the generation of income and especially the lack of innovation in ensuring that this income is somewhere recouped. Whilst we understand the lockdown restrictions in whatever level, we cannot sit back and not be creative in how people can still visit, for example, the nature reserves but still mask up, sanitise while social distancing in the reserve is very possible. At the same time there must be concern in the reduction of targets set by the Department, especially as these have implications on pursuing criminal contraventions and investigation as well as referrals of South African Police Services.

In retrospect, we wish to once again highlight the importance of an Environmental Commissioner as we envision by the Provincial Constitution, to ensure that there is compliance and safe regard for our environment. We must remain concerned at the dropping of targets in pursuing environmental impact assessments and especially how these relate to economic development and the ability to create jobs.

As we saw in the so-called Two Rivers Urban Park it is vital that Government

secures and protects land that has special significance for our communities. In a particular case, and yesterday being Abolition of Slavery in the Cape Day, it is important that this Provincial Government protects land that has historical and cultural significance to our people. The Department remains at the forefront of an enabling climate and environment for economic reconstruction and recovery for its links between spatial development and job creation.

The lowering of the delay or the delay in targets therefore has a great potential to add to the unnecessary red tape that the National Government seeks to reduce. It is also regrettable that performance targets are lowered in anticipation of a harder lockdown when hardly any of us know whether that hard lockdown will happen or not.

Deputy Speaker, whilst we acknowledge the budget cuts may be real, efficiency is, one is able to do more with much less. It cannot be acceptable that a number of integrated waste management programmes are cancelled. The reason why these were identified in the first place have not suddenly just disappeared. Again, while we may welcome the idea that an alternative and virtual workshop was held for women in the green economy, we are told that it did not reach the audience that needed it the most. Yet, this is the story of the Provincial Government. The people who need the Government services the most, the ones who really need their Government to assist them were the ones that this very same Provincial Government ignores.

It is easy to tick the box off, women in the green economy workshop that was held, but how effective was this workshop? Did it reach grassroots? Did it reach the people who need the assistance of their Government the most or will the green economy once again become an opportunity like the Wi-Fi hotspots for the elite, for only those who have access?

Deputy Speaker, as with other votes we know the serious amount of laptops that were acquired by officials and staff to work remotely. We will never want to jeopardize the safety of staff and officials, however we must be able to pay attention to the manner in which large amounts of money was spent on equipment for staff. We certainly hope that when COVID-19 starts to disappear that equipment will not become redundant and that staff will be able to use them to remain more efficient and effective, despite the tightening of our budget belts.

Lastly Deputy Speaker, this Parliament expects from us to support the Second Amendment Budget Vote, yet the Premier submitted the Section 79 petition to the President to bring under his attention material concerns of the 2020 Dora Bill which were passed by National Parliament last week. For the same and other concerns within this vote, the ANC declines to support this Budget Vote. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon Marran. I now recognise hon Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you Deputy Speaker. The Western Cape has a big

problem of waste deposits, especially in our townships. However, the DA-led Government would not know this because they are only concerned with the removal of waste in the leafy suburbs. If the situation in the provincial townships does not change, especially in the informal settlements then this will turn into a serious health hazard for the poor people of this province. The Provincial Department of Health is already failing our people as it does not really have capacity or adequate means to take care of those who are sick, despite the budget cuts.

Furthermore, this Department has surrendered more than R21 million to the Provincial Revenue Fund which was intended for the Compensation of Employees which is a serious challenge that in terms of job opportunities our people will be found wanting. This is the money which the Department should have used to create job opportunities as the Premier promised. This shows that the Democratic Alliance does not take care of our people and it does not take them serious at all. If we can go to Wallacedene now we will find our people swimming in sewerage. If you go to Philippi there is serious health and environmental hazards that are found there. If you go to Dunoon and everywhere else where you find our people, there is a serious challenge of environmental and health challenges. So we can never support a budget that does not talk to the needs of the needy and the poor. Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon member. I recognise hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thank you Deputy Speaker. We support the Vote.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Noted thank you, hon Herron. I recognise hon Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon members, the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning started this financial year with a budget of R621 million. This was reduced to R612 million in the First Revised Budget and now it has seen a further R21,6 million cut to R590 million in this Second Adjusted Appropriation. This represents a reduction of about 5% from the original budget. This is in stark contrast to the annual increases that we have come to expect over the last few years. Even if just to keep up with inflation. We can also add to this the increased need for quality development planning and the growing need to protect the environment from a variety of pressures, aggravated by a growing sense of lawlessness.

We all know that there is never enough money to support all needs. There are always much needed projects that because of financial constraints need to move to other years, or aging equipment in need of replacement but that must be maintained and driven beyond its ideal lifespan. This often comes at the expense of productivity. A loss or cost that no financial statement will reflect. We all know of situations where some staff members are not coping with the workload and of instances where backlogs cannot be eliminated due to capacity restraints. In some cases, staff start making mistakes because of

the pressures that they need to work under. Yet this is in the nature of budgets and having to absorb reductions therefore, it places a lot of pressure on all staff members but particularly on the managers that are required to implement and manage an organisation within these constraints. As this Department quite correctly pointed out in its submission to the Standing Committee, the budget cuts implicate that some of the original targets set for this year just cannot be met anymore. What is making matters worse is that COVID-19 and its disruptions affecting normal work procedures and practices are still with us.

The departments operate with a threat of future lockdowns and/or office closures due to increasing infection rates. One of the focus areas of the Western Cape's Recovery Plan is the preservation, and where possible the creation of jobs. Much of the work done by this Department has an influence on job creation. The developers, farmers and others depend on swift decisions and feedback on applications that affect the environment, when planning new developments or expansions.

Quality development frameworks give certainty to those that wish to invest in new ventures and that want to undertake new developments. It is therefore of the utmost importance that this Department's capacity be protected and even enhanced in order to support the Recovery Plan. Now turning to a breakdown of the budget, where were additional expenses required?

As can be expected, some staff members had to be issued with laptops and

related equipment in order to work from home, and hon Marran referred to this earlier. This R1,17 million expenditure is however a relatively small expense seen against the productivity losses that would have been incurred were these staff members to be sitting idly at home, due to them still being reliant on desktop computers at the office. We also see additional expenditure due to delays in the delivery dates of equipment. These delays were caused by the Lockdown regulations and restrictions on the movement of people and goods. An example of this is the amount of R129 000 for a large format plotter.

The fight against pollution requires accurate measurements and the budget provides for the procurement of equipment to measure water quality to the value of R1,18 million. Similarly R2,3 million will be spent on the purchase of modern air quality monitoring equipment. So, which budget votes suffered in this Second Appropriation Budget?

The Department will be saving on travel expenses, mainly due to COVID-19 resulting in more work being done remotely. I fear however that this saving may also come at the expense of site visits and therefore, of productivity. The ability to work remotely and an over estimation of the budget for data and the amount needed for personal protective equipment in response to the initial challenges of COVID-19, allowed for a decrease in expenditure on these votes.

We were and still are sailing in uncharted waters, including talks of another



hard lockdown. This will influence the final figures for the 2020/2021 Financial Year. As previously indicated the postponement of some projects and workshops also resulted in significant savings despite how undesirable such postponements may be. While Cape Nature came off lightly during the First Adjustment Budget it will now have to forfeit more than R5,1 million of its budget. More than two-thirds of this saving is related to salaries, which brings me to the most significant item in the reduction of expenditure.

As we have seen across the board, provincial departments were instructed by National Treasury not to budget for the annual increases in the salaries of public service employees as per the three-year agreement with public service unions. And I find it strange that hon Marran referred to this as if this is a failure on the side of the Western Cape. From a budget perspective it is extremely important that the outcome of the court case regarding annual increases linked to the salary agreement and which was scheduled to be heard today support the instruction from National Treasury not to provide for these increases.

Deputy Speaker, please allow me to now refer to the speeches of the hon Marran and the hon Leader of the Official Opposition earlier today regarding the Environmental Commissioner. The hon Leader of the Opposition this morning in his usual song and dance about the long standing vacancy for an Environmental Commissioner, yet if the hon members of the Opposition were honest in their views they would convince their colleagues in the eight other ANC-run provinces to lead the way by appointing Environmental

Commissioners in those provinces or they would be pushing for the appointment of a national Environmental Commissioner. I wish the ANC members would stop talking with such a forked tongue. This call for additional expenditure is coming from the very same ANC that is calling on provinces to save on public expenses. This is the very same ANC that is continually bailing out State-owned Enterprises with additional borrowed money. The very same ANC that caused a huge percentage of our taxes not to be spent on the poor or in the interest of the environment but to flow offshore to service Government debt.

This is a leader in the very same ANC Government that is prioritising environmentally damaging coal fire power stations above alternative clean energy options and this because the profit of the ANC's Chancellor House is more important to them than real job creation in the private sector. Please, Deputy Speaker, I call on the hon Dugmore and his colleagues to be coherent and to first sweep before their own party's door or otherwise to stop their howling and to work towards a cost-effective solution that will not create more public service jobs in the hope that more of his cadres will benefit from this as is the case in the public sector in other provinces.

In closing, Deputy Speaker, I believe that the budget currently serving before this House is cutting the expenses of the Department to the bone. It is also a fairly accurate estimate as one can expect in the case of adjustments so late in the financial year. I therefore propose that this House supports Budget Vote 9 in line with the Standing Committee on Agriculture & Environmental

Affairs and Development Planning's report. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Van der Westhuizen. I now recognise hon Minister Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you hon Deputy Speaker, thank you to the members who participated in this debate. Let me start off by thanking the hon Brent Herron for supporting this vote. I think he understands the pressure we are under. Notwithstanding that, I also understand that he will keep a close eye on the Department as he should be.

To the ANC's comments, it is actually, hon Deputy Speaker, the hon Marran, what we cannot ignore – if there is one thing we cannot ignore, that is the corrupt maladministration, failure to hold SOE's accountable through the ANC's National Government. That is why we are here today. There is no other reason. If I was him, I would even have declined a speaking turn today. I would have been so ashamed of my own party.

Hon Deputy Speaker, to then call on and make an example of Cape Nature staff who will not be paid a salary increase – ja. I am just stunned. You know, you must be honest with them because the ANC is not going to give them a salary increase for the next three years because of the failures of the ANC National Government. The corruption within; the mismanagement of SOE's, etcetera. It all accounts to just one thing, the people on the ground

are going to pay the price but you will slowly see how the people are also turning their backs on the ANC because they see the corruption within the organisation.

Hon Deputy Speaker, Integrated Waste Management Plans: We are the only province in the country where you will get integrated waste management plans throughout the municipal system. Waste – you cannot turn it around within one cycle. We are now entering a space where most of our municipalities has their Fourth Generation waste management plans and we will move quickly to the Fifth Generation waste management programmes.

It is just mindboggling that the ANC can comment like this. You know, hon Deputy Speaker, the hon Marran said that the people need the Government most and then he speaks to the Western Cape Government, who on a daily basis only focuses to serve the poorest of the poor. That is why we made money available in the beginning to support our poorest and vulnerable people.

Yesterday they made the comment, the ANC was very vocal on this on R1800 per month. Well, their President offers R350 per month to feed people. The hon Marran talks about Wi-Fi. You know, hon Deputy Speaker, it must be our dream to give Wi-Fi to every citizen. If we want to create opportunities for our children in the poorest of the poor communities, they must have access to Wi-Fi. They must have access to the world because the world is now the market, not their little town or their poor community.

Member Xego of the EFF made a couple of comments on the monitoring and the support, on the R21 million that we surrendered. We did not surrender, we need to give it back. It was taken back because of the failures of National ANC Government. There is no more money. We cannot print money, but hon Xego speaks about waste in poor communities and sewerage and it is wrong, and we do everything in our power to attend to that. It is mostly a municipal issue and we work very closely with the Green Scorpions, with our municipalities, but I also want to tell member Xego that if we go out there where there is illegal land invasion you will always find the EFF.

To the hon Chairperson of the Standing Committee, thank you very much for supporting this budget. Thank you for your oversight role. Member Andricus you take it seriously and you hold us accountable and I want to thank you for that, because in a democracy you need to have somebody that is in power and somebody that keeps a very close eye on those that govern. So thank you very much for taking that role seriously.

Our staff do struggle and I take my hat off to our staff who under very difficult circumstances keep serving this province and keep protecting our environment, keep protecting our biodiversity, protecting our air. The air we breathe in daily is clean. It is because of this Department keeping our water sources as clean as possible, working with our municipalities, doing everything possible to see to it that we protect the environment for future generations. I want to thank you and the Committee for your oversight role

on that.

Lastly, I want to thank my HOD and my Department, all the officials, for working day and night to see to it that future generations will have the luxury of a clean environment and a beautiful biodiversity. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon Min Bredell. That concludes the debate on this Vote. I am just going to give you a second or two Minister Bredell because I know the next one is yours. In the meantime, we will move over to the Sixth Order of the Day. Over to you, Secretary.

†Die SEKRETARIS: Begrotingspos 14 – Plaaslike Regering – *Weskaapse Tweede Aansuiweringsbegroting Wetsontwerp* [B 7 – 2020].

[The SECRETARY: Budget Vote 14 – Local Government – *Western Cape Second Adjustment Appropriation Bill* [B 7 – 2020].]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Mr Secretary. I now recognise the hon Min Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Premier, hon Cabinet colleagues, members of the Legislature, ladies and gentlemen †en aan die Sekretariaat, baie dankie vir daai mooi stukkie Afrikaans [and to the Secretariat, thank you for that nice piece of Afrikaans.]

I want to take a moment to acknowledge our municipalities and the frontline service workers in every district and in every town. The COVID-19 pandemic is an incredible challenge, and it is an exhausting and nerve-wracking event. This pandemic is now heading into a second wave of infections here in this province, with infections spiking across the province. Garden Route municipalities are right in the thick of things at the moment with hospitals filling up and workers struggling to keep up.

I think sometimes people in rural areas feel isolated and forgotten amidst this whole thing and I want to reassure them that this is most certainly not the case in the Western Cape. We have each and every community in our hearts and minds all the time and in fact this Department of Local Government continues to work daily across the province with every council, to see how we can better support our rural areas.

Deputy Speaker, the COVID-19 pandemic remains a tragedy with serious health challenges and serious economic realities. More people are unemployed than ever before, and the outlook forward is not optimistic with economic growth at record lows. Our municipalities continue to see cuts to budgets and low rates of payment from ratepayers and businesses who are all feeling the pinch. Economic drivers in most Western Cape municipalities are generally tourism and hospitality related and that sector has taken hammer blows from the fight against the pandemic.

These economic realities are going to be very hard to overcome in the years

to come. In the meantime, we foresee a very busy summer festive period over the next month as visitors and locals flock to beaches and outdoor places of entertainment after what has been a very tough year. But the reality we are facing, a very real concern - is the concern that these activities most certainly go along with the real risk of spreading COVID-19. This is something we are closely monitoring and something we are working very hard on through the Disaster Management Centre in order to limit the spread of this Corona virus as much as we can.

Deputy Speaker, this is the Second Adjustment Budget for this Department for this year. Every cut the Department makes – much the same in other departments I am sure – comes as a severe blow. These continued cuts have a very real impact on the Department's ability to do its work, work that entails improving the lives of our people in all of our communities, particularly the most vulnerable communities. What makes me furious, however, is that this current cut comes not entirely to fund COVID-19, but it comes as a result of the ANC-led National Government's decision to give another R10,5 billion bailout to the South African Airways.

Deputy Speaker, while we have thousands of people waiting for houses and better services, the ANC has thrown billions more into the black hole that is SAA. There is absolutely no justification for this. With R10,5 billion we could have built nearly 65 600 new houses for people on the housing waiting list. Deputy Speaker, the new Khayelitsha Hospital, a state-of-the-art facility this Provincial Government built in Khayelitsha, cost R632 million to design



and construct. With R10,5 billion this Provincial Government could have built another 17 hospitals in this province. Instead, now we have no money to do so.

A new school built by this Provincial Department of Education in Philippi, a primary school, is being built at the cost of R64 million. It will serve 1 240 learners. With R10,5 billion this Province could have built another 164 primary schools. These examples show the difference in priority between a DA-led Government and an ANC one. But here we are. Deputy Speaker, I now present the latest Adjusted Estimates for the Department of Local Government for the year 2020. The original budget allocated to the Department was R313 901 000. This amount was initially increased by R32 500 000 with the First Adjustment Budget and the total adjusted budget was R346 million.

The increase came at the height of the first wave of the pandemic and went to our municipalities to enable them to help their communities. The Department itself made cuts from other programmes at the time totalling R17,4 million to help with the burden. The bulk of the additional funding was used by our municipalities to ensure the most vulnerable in our province were housed and provided with food during the lockdown that was in place.

Deputy Speaker, with this Second Adjustment Bill we now see a huge budget cut of R49 100 000 to the Department, which sees the final Budget Vote 14 to be R297 200 000. The bulk of this cut comes from the approved salary

increases staff were going to receive this year. The National Government's decision in this regard – a decision to go back on the approved increases – is currently being challenged in court. We shall keep an eye on the outcome.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I want to end off by saying our best wishes and prayers remain with those who have lost loved ones and those who continue to be affected by this Corona virus. And I want to use this moment to implore the public to work with us over the coming festive season to continue to be aware of the COVID-19 Corona virus and to do everything they can to prevent the spread of this Corona virus. Please work with us, help us to help you. Do not risk getting sick. From our side we will be relentless in continuing to fight for our community's health and wellbeing. I thank You.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon Minister. I now recognise hon member Smith.

Mr D SMITH: Deputy Speaker, hon members, ladies and gentlemen, I rise on behalf of the ANC today to decline the support for this Vote. While the ANC wishes to add its voice to that of the MEC in noting the concerns in the rise of the infections along the Garden Route and Khayelitsha, we also wish to thank the staff of the Department for all their hard work that they have done since the national disaster was announced and declared by President Ramaphosa in March of this year.

We agree with the MEC that we must as members of this House, on both sides of the aisle agree to support and encourage our people to wear masks, sanitise their hands and observe social distancing. As with all the Votes presented in this House there will no doubt be an effect on the municipal income streams and other municipalities which in most cases service at the coalface to service delivery will be affected. As a result, our people, often the poorest of the poor who depend on municipal services, will be affected, yet Deputy Speaker, that is what a mature economy is about. Doing more with less.

We recognise the effects that the lockdown and COVID-19 will have on small to medium enterprises, especially in the tourism and hospitality industry. We acknowledge the affect the budget cuts will have on service delivery and in particular to both infrastructure investment that is so sorely needed, yet it is therefore astonishing that the hon Maynier mentioned hardly anything in his Medium Budget Policy Statement last week on infrastructure development and investment. As we saw in the national Economic Reconstruction Recovery Plan, investments in infrastructure remain a cornerstone of our country's economic revival and how opportune it would have been if our municipalities in the Western Cape were at the forefront in the benefitting from the investment identified for this Reconstruction and Recovery Plan.

Yet even in this Adjustment Vote there is nothing that suggests that the Provincial Government will be investing and developing in infrastructure. Deputy Speaker, while we are able to sympathise with the proposed cuts,

especially in relation to compensation of employees, we note the delay in the recruitment of critical staff and the bottle neck.

According to officials in the Department of the Premier and specifically in the Corporate Services Centre, maybe it is time that Human Resources be decentralised from the Department of the Premier to individual departments. We also note the fact that R2 million identified to attract talent and Human Resource for a joint district and metro approach for the district development model as flighted by National Government, has also not been effected, not because of lack of funds, not because of COVID-19 but because of inefficiencies in the Department of the Premier.

The ANC remains cautious over the role and the responsibilities of the Forensic Investigative Unit. The DA has a habit of developing their own security operations, engaging in rogue espionage activities as found in the Desai Commission and as JP Smith is building his own pseudo-police force and army in the City of Cape Town. We therefore hope that this Forensic Investigative Unit will not subvert the criminal justice system in our country, a system that the DA likes to bypass.

We only saw this recently in the provincial conference, as they bypassed legitimate law enforcement agencies to declare the Speaker's claims of an assassination plot by his revival as not having any substance. The FIU must not be another way to subvert a legitimate law enforcement agency within our democracy. The ANC remains concerned about the situation in Kannaland.

We welcome the intervention by the National Treasury in the proposed financial recovery plan but remain cautious about the extension of the Section 139 as well as a further extension to the contract of the administration.

In this critical time of economic downturn as well as COVID-19 it is important that we stabilize our smaller municipalities and especially those ones in places like the Little Karoo. Again, the ANC wishes to thank the officials and staff of the Department for the trying times in which they attempt to do their task and responsibilities. We thank them for the mass distribution of masks which they made readily available, especially to areas where these masks were needed and for doing their jobs during these testing times.

However, the ANC remains unconvinced of the lack of political leadership that the Department suffers from. We are certain that if the Department was to apply for more funding especially during this critical time and that if they made the proper motivations, they would indeed be assisted both by the Provincial Treasury and no doubt by the National Treasury. The ANC therefore cannot support this Vote. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you hon Smith. I now recognise hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. The budget cut of R49,1 million by the Department of Local Government is unacceptable. This is a department which should be supporting municipalities to facilitate service delivery. If the Department was fulfilling its mandate fully then we would not be having residents of Khayelitsha and Kraaifontein marching to municipal offices to demand basic services such as water, proper sanitation and waste removal.

It is the duty of the Department to make sure that the municipalities have capacity to deliver services and operate in a well-coordinated manner. Under this provincial Minister's watch, municipalities in the province have deteriorated to an extent that they only offer proper services to the leafy suburbs at the exclusion of all others. The Department has failed to an extent that township residents remain disfranchised due to lack of services. The situation is unfortunate because people have had enough, to an extent that buses and other services are being torched almost every day as a way of residents expressing their frustrations.

The Minister should be awake to the reality that if the Government does not change its ways, then soon things might get out of hand. As the EFF we do not support this Vote. I thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Thanks, Deputy Speaker. We support the Vote.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Noted thank you. I see hon America.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Good afternoon ladies and gentlemen. Deputy Speaker, it would be apt for me to remind the House the aim of the Department of Local Government is to monitor, coordinate and support municipalities to be effective in fulfilling their developmental mandates and facilitate service delivery and disaster resilience to engagement with Government spheres and social partners. As you will see the latest budget cuts will severely compromise this mandate.

Deputy Speaker, a brief snapshot of these budget cuts are as follows: The Provincial Equitable Share since the First Adjustment declined from R308 293 000 to R259 108 000, resulting in a decrease of R49 185 000. Of this, funds were shifted between Votes, that is R16 750 000 was transferred back to the Provincial Treasury for re-allocation to other departments and they are made up of the following amounts:

- R5 million was shifted to the Department of Health for the Hotspot Strategy, and this is for the initial sourcing of personal protective equipment through bar contracting and community-based manufacturing.
- R10 250 000 was shifted to the Department of Agriculture to provide horticulture training to the youth within communities and to support

and revitalise community food gardens for both subsistence and small-scale trade.

- R1,5 million was shifted to the Department of Transport and Public Works for the Hotspot Strategy, and that is for the provision of bicycles to community groups for the distribution of amongst others, medicine and food.

The nett effect of this resulted in the Department's budget that decreased by R32 435 000. And outline of this R32 435 000 are as follows: Across all the programmes R16 774 000 was surrendered to the Provincial Revenue Fund due to the adoption in the Compensation of Employees.

Now often there is confusion in terms of the surrendering of funds to the Provincial Treasury and with this particular allocation it is money that we are not going to get from National Treasury, that will be separately housed in Provincial Treasury for later use. It is gone.

- R2 million was surrendered to the Provincial Revenue Fund as a roll-over for the organisational design process that was not finalised this particular year and has relation to the appointment of the joint district and metro approach support staff within the Department. It is earmarked funding.
- R1,7 million was surrendered to the Provincial Revenue Fund due to delays in the recruitment process during the lockdown period to appoint capacity within the forensic investigation unit.



- R1,7 million was surrendered for the reallocation over the Medium Term Budget Framework to fund the maintenance and support of audio-visual equipment for the Disaster Management Centre.
- Lastly, R10 250 000 was transferred to the Provincial Revenue Fund for the Hotspot Strategy.

Deputy Speaker, in addition Municipal Infrastructure Grants have also seen a massive decrease with only a handful of municipalities receiving an increase in their water services infrastructure grant. All other grants have been cut. Deputy Speaker, COVID-19 has had a devastating effect on the local sphere of government. The lockdown and the consequent shutdown of business activities reduce overall economic activity. Increased unemployment impacted heavily on household income across the province. The granting of payment holidays by many municipalities and the concomitant reduction of payment and collection rates place severe financial stress on municipalities.

These concessions place enormous strain on already limited operational budget allocations. The response of many municipalities was to reduce spending on non-essential items and implemented stringent cost containment measures.

Deputy Speaker, notwithstanding these pressures, municipalities continue to deliver basic services and have in many respects performed additional responsibilities including additional basic services, especially water and sanitation. In places like Stellenbosch and the City of Cape Town,

extraordinary cleansing of public spaces was conducted. In addition to the provincial allocations, municipalities also from their own funds supplemented these to provide extensive food relief to their communities, thus averting a humanitarian crisis.

So many families are struggling, Deputy Speaker, are unable to pay their bills and put food on the table. This is a South African tragedy. Deputy Speaker, may I also add that building activities came to an abrupt end during the strict lockdown. This coincided with the lead-up to the end of the municipal financial year, a time when capital expenditure conventionally accelerates. Given the lockdown in the last quarter of the financial year we can anticipate significant under-performance against their capital budgets.

Municipalities adopted the 2020/2021 budgets in June. At that time, it was uncertain how long the stringent lockdown measures would remain and when the construction industry would reopen. Moreover, the effect of the COVID-19 pandemic on revenue collection and hence funds with capital expenditure was uncertain.

Deputy Speaker, municipalities were advised by National and Provincial Treasury to factor into their planning and budgets a potential prolonged shutdown. Consequently the 2020 overview of the Adjusted Provincial and Municipal Infrastructure Investment revealed that 24 municipalities adopted special adjustment budgets during the course of August and September. This provided a further opportunity to municipalities to adjust their budgets to

reflect the COVID-19 changes and realities. According to Provincial Treasury, infrastructure investment acts as a catalyst for broad basic economic growth and development, which will require combined and complementary financial contributions from all spheres of government and the private sector.

To this end it is regrettable that the National Government reduced allocations to municipalities in order to fund what Minister Maynier called “zombie SOE’s” such as the South African Airways. Deputy Speaker, political instability and interference in the administration of some of the councils that affect decision making, remain a risk and must be prevented at all costs to ensure the effective implementation of any recovery plan. Any instability at council level will negatively affect a successful post-COVID-19 recovery plan, which could compromise service delivery.

In the end financial sustainability must remain the top priority in our municipalities as it allows them to function and provide basic services to the residents, some who rely heavily on these services. Our Government in the Western Cape and particularly the Department of Local Government, together with Provincial Treasury have taken every measure possible to ensure financial sustainability of their municipalities and that the backlog in service delivery as a result of COVID-19 is cleared.

Deputy Speaker, it should be noted, the recent Auditor General’s Consolidated Audit Outcomes Report revealed that the audit outcomes across

the province have improved, showing real movement towards financial responsibility. The report also highlighted that all 27 DA-led Western Cape municipalities were awarded unqualified financial audits. Of the three remaining municipalities controlled by the ANC, two received qualified findings and one is currently outstanding. Prior to the COVID-19 pandemic provincial and local government programmes were severely stretched due to funding constraints. The allocation equitable share from the National Government has been decreasing year on year. Despite growing demand for more services, the challenge to deliver services and houses to people is becoming increasingly hard.

Deputy Speaker, our municipalities indicated that the levels of rates and tariff collection during the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic have dropped significantly. Many recorded payment rates are at record low levels. Jobs are under pressure and there is very little room left for our municipalities to absorb further decreases in equitable share allocations. We are in serious trouble and will increasingly struggle to improve the lives of our people.

There is simply not enough money to deliver services and rollout infrastructure needed. It will be worse if there is a wage settlement between National Government and the public sector bargaining unit. In this regard, instead of the courts to make a determination the ANC opted to appease the [Inaudible.] partner COSATU to the detriment of millions of South Africans who feel the effect of their mismanagement of the economy.

In conclusion, allow me to congratulate the HOD, Mr Graham Paulse and the entire team for the remarkable achievement for being recognised for their sterling work at the annual budget [Inaudible.] award ceremony. This achievement is a result of hard work, dedication and an unwavering commitment to the task at hand. Thank you so much.

Deputy Speaker, I would also like to express my sincere gratitude and appreciation to Minister Anton Bredell for his capable and servant leadership. Your support and guidance are highly valued. Lastly, while we consider the Department's budget today, we must not forget the 30 municipalities who equally had to deal with reduced budgets. This will come under severe pressure towards the build-up to the 2020/2021 Local Government elections. Therefore, to our Mayors, councillors and staff in our municipalities, thank you for your commitment and hard work in delivering services to our people under trying conditions and ever decreasing resources. I thank you, Deputy Speaker. The DA supports the Budget.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon Min Bredell.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS & DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you, Deputy Speaker and thank you for the members' participation in this debate. Again, thank you to hon member Herron for supporting this Vote. To the ANC, member Smith, you have started off very well and then you started to deviate, started to put your

ANC-hat on and it is not only you but a couple of members quote, “doing more with less”. The thing is there is nothing left because the ANC’s corrupt agenda and cadre deployment agenda just bankrupted this country. So we cannot do more with less, because there is nothing left.

Hon Deputy Speaker, it is actually sad that whenever we want to bring in discipline in a system that the ANC just criticises and attacks those who wants to get to the corruption within the municipal space or within any space. We have never, nor myself or my Department, interfered in any investigations. Our Forensic Unit does their job when they receive information or get information from whistleblowers. They then hand that report to the Hawks to do their investigation and George is a classic example. Oudtshoorn is a classic example. It was DA-controlled municipalities. There were serious allegations. We let the Hawks investigate it. We have never interfered. Two days before a by-election the Hawks walk in. We have never interfered and we I will do everything in my power to get to the bottom and to root out any form of corruption within government because corruption is busy killing our people.

Hon Deputy Speaker, we as Parliament and as a Standing Committee should actually call on National Government to build capacity within the SIU, the Hawks and the NPA so that we can get rid of this corruption within our government space. The hon Smith mentioned that maybe the HR function must be shifted, or we must decentralise it out of the Premier’s office. Well, ja, I only think that the only thing I can say about that is that maybe it is

time for the people to replace the ANC Government. That will solve all our problems.

To the EFF, member Makamba-Botya, I can only say, why do the people move to the Western Cape? It is only because it is the province where there is still hope. Saying that, I realise there is a lot of work to be done, a lot more, and I can just call also on the EFF to stop breaking and start building and help us to build infrastructure. Help us to get the services to the people, because under these severe budget constraints it is not easy.

To the Chairperson of the Standing Committee, thank you very much. Thank you for your role, your oversight role, the working relationship, keeping us accountable. Thank you to you and your Committee and to my staff, my HOD and my staff, again thank you very much for working day and night to support our municipalities during very difficult times. The disaster management was busy 24/7 to see where they can support and link people to support the poorest of the poor. I think we are very privileged to live in the Western Cape.

Hon Deputy Speaker, with that I conclude, and I table the Western Cape Local Government Adjustment Estimate Budget, thank you very much.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. That concludes the debate on this Vote. Thank you. The Secretary will now read the Seventh Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 7 – Social Development – *Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 7 – 2020].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr Secretary. I recognise the Minister, hon Fernandez.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Premier, Cabinet Colleagues, hon members of the Provincial Legislature, officials present, ladies and gentlemen. We meet to deliberate on the Budget Votes in a time of severe economic distress and the resurgence of COVID-19 in most and certain areas of our province. These two factors impact the work of the Department of Social Development negatively. Deputy Speaker, before I present the Budget, I must express my heartfelt thanks to every active citizen, every stakeholder, the faith based organisations, civil society and especially our NPO's who have been the first responders when the pandemic first broke out. Thank you for feeding, caring and displaying compassion in a space where loneliness and hunger crept in and where social and physical distancing, unemployment and fear reigned.

We are in the midst, Deputy Speaker, of 16 days of No Violence Against Women And Children. However, we acknowledge 365 days of activism as women and children are killed every day, 365 days of the year. As I did last year on 11 December, I launched the 365 days. So we shall continue to maintain our focus every single day, not only for 16 days.



Hon Deputy Speaker, we face a bleak future with COVID-19 as the first pandemic and then Gender Based Violence and Femicide as the second silent but more serious shadow pandemic. Hon Deputy Speaker, today is Adjustment Budget Vote 7, it proposes a nett increase of R14 366 000 on the Department of Social Development's budget. This will bring the Department's adjusted annual budget to just over R2 695 000 000. The primary additional amounts include a R53 067 000 conditional grant for post COVID-19 relief in the ECD sector and a R51 281 000 earmarked for additional food relief.

These increases, Deputy Speaker, are offset by three deductions to DSD's baseline. The first is R61,25 million which is DSD's portion of a pre-emptive deduction by National Treasury from the Western Cape and all other provinces on the assumption that the national public sector wage freeze will hold. This is a scary and dangerous assumption which we need to keep a very close eye on.

The second is a shift of R3 million to Vote 10, the Department of Transport and Public Works for the repair of fire damages to a residential wing at Saartjie Baartman Centre for women and children. Many might know that Saartjie Baartman is the biggest centre in the country for women and children and I was out there on Monday morning to inspect the damages and it is indeed severe. The damaged building is owned by Public Works and was used to accommodate victims of Gender Based Violence. It could not be repaired due to budget constraints at Public Works. So DSD has transferred

this funding for the work to be expedited, given the strategic importance of the centre in the fight against GBV.

I might also add, Deputy Speaker, that just yesterday I was invited by the national shelter movement, women's shelter movement and they have in fact set up an additional Gender Based Violence command centre which is based at Saartjie Baartman to assist women across South Africa. Hence the strategic importance to get that building repaired.

The third deduction, hon Deputy Speaker is an amount of R25 732 000 which the Department has requested to be rolled over to the next financial year in order to soften the blow of the expected budget cuts we are facing in 2021/2022. Next year's reduction is yet to be finalised, but we can expect cuts of approximately R248 million next year. Of this amount around R113 million relates to the aforementioned wage freeze. The remaining R135 million is due to the overall reduction in the Province's equitable share by National Treasury in order to accommodate the post COVID-19 contraction in the national fiscus. This amount will have to be absorbed by the Department in which we aim to partially mitigate with today's proposed rollover amount.

Deputy Speaker, although it is welcome, we do have a few concerns with the large amounts of funding we received from the National Government for ECD's and food relief so late in the financial year. We are going to have to deal with a very short turnaround time, whilst ensuring that the funds

received are allocated in accordance with the PFMA guidelines before 1 April, which signals the start of the new financial year. This is a very tight timeframe, and it was not expected at all. I have been beating my drum about a humanitarian crisis six months ago and again sadly “too little, too late”, however it will fill the tummy’s of the most vulnerable and it will assist those ECD’s who need the support. Sadly, it is not enough to go around.

We will do our best hon Deputy Speaker, to manage this risk while ensuring that we can help and support as many vulnerable communities as possible. Apart from the increase and reductions to our baseline, the Department has also had to make a number of smaller internal shifts to reprioritize funds within our existing budget, mainly in order to respond to the COVID-19 disaster. For the sake of time, Deputy Speaker, I will highlight only the most significant adjustments.

A nett increase of R3,79 million has been made to support additional bed spaces in shelters for homeless adults as part of the COVID-19 recovery plan. There has been a major increase in homelessness due to the dire economic impact of COVID-19 and the Western Cape Cabinet has mandated the Department of Social Development to alleviate the situation as far as possible.

For the 2021/2022 financial year we have made a request to treasury to provide us with R20 million in additional funding so that we can reach approximately 1000 additional bed spaces. This will also involve funding,

social workers at the shelters who [Inaudible.] in reintegrating homeless persons with their family members and communities.

Deputy Speaker, a nett increase of R7,212 million has been made to victim empowerment services to assist in the upper rationalisation – that is a big word – of six new shelters for victims of GBV in the properties made available to Social Development by the National Department of Public Works and infrastructure and for that I wish to thank Minister De Lille. An additional R18,4 million has been made available for food relief as part of the COVID-19 Recovery Plan which will be added to the R51 281 000 earmarked allocation, which I mentioned earlier.

Furthermore, smaller additions have also been made to support old age homes, services to persons with disabilities and additional IT equipment to help the Department sustain remote working arrangements. These allocations have been made possible by savings from amongst others decreased GG usage, decreased office supply usage, decreased training or since training was, there was no training during Levels 4 and 5, delays in filling of vacancies during the COVID-19 hard lockdown and a reduction in projected inflationary increases in transfers to NGO's.

Deputy Speaker, the road ahead is indeed a challenging one but a task that we can overcome if we work together. I would like to thank Dr Robert McDonald, the HOD of our Department, the management, and staff of Social Development for their continuing dedication and contribution towards good

governance and maintaining service delivery despite the many challenges. I would also like, in anticipation to thank the Chairperson of the Portfolio Committee and the Committee for their robust, transparent, yet dignified engagements whenever we have had to meet. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise hon Bakubaku-Vos. Hon Bakubaku-Vos, are you online? We can just check.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Can you hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I can hear you.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I can hear you hon Bakubaku-Vos. You may start.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: Deputy Speaker [Inaudible - sound distorted.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I can hear you now.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: [Inaudible - sound distorted] draws to a close [Inaudible.] Christmas and the holidays with out families, I urge everyone to give thoughts to families that are having a lonely and a bleak Christmas, after losing many of their family members to COVID-19 and some having lost their

jobs and livelihoods due to the economic impact of COVID-19. This reality should have been taken into consideration when the Provincial Government was preparing this budget proposal. In this regard I wish to commend the National Government for the additional R6,8 billion to continue mitigation [Inaudible.] securities and poverty as well as to extend a special COVID-19 social relief [Inaudible.] grant.

In addition, the National Government availed R1 billion to the National Department for food relief to vulnerable households [Inaudible - sound distorted.] during the year more than 12 million [Inaudible.] the short term social grant is [Inaudible - sound distorted.] has amount to R48 billion in the 2020/21 financial year. In total, short term social grant base relief amounts to R48 billion in 2020/21. During the year, more than 12 million new recipients received income protection. Over and above this province will receive support from the National Department for the support for Early Childhood Development and appointment of registration support officers through the presidential employment intervention.

Hon Deputy Speaker, through the National Government's investment has been allocated of R51,2 million for food relief and over R55 million for the Early Childhood Development Grant. The Provincial Department worked well in the province to roll out the National Department initiative of using Community Nutrition Development Centres to feed our vulnerable communities.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, are you done? I suspect you are done.

I am sorry we have not heard you very clearly. Are you there?

Ms N BAKUBAKU-VOS: Yes, hon Deputy Speaker, I am here.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is very intermittent hon Bakubaku-Vos, just if you can continue.

Ms N BAKUBAKU-VOS: Can I continue, hon Deputy Speaker? Through this ... [Inaudible – audio distorted.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bakubaku-Vos I cannot hear you unfortunately.

Ms N BAKUBAKU-VOS: [Inaudible – audio distorted.] You cannot hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Bakubaku-Vos, I am unfortunately going to have to end it there. I just cannot hear you. My apologies, you are just not coming through clearly at all. Thank you very much.

Ms N BAKUBAKU-VOS: Can you hear me now, hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I can now. Would you like to finish, you still have four minutes left.

Ms N BAKUBAKU-VOS: Okay, thank you. Despite all the hard work of

National Government, the Department has surrendered over R61,2 million to the Provincial Revenue Fund due to reduction in Compensation of Employees. While a popular narrative in the Province seems to be gaining momentum, we should not forget that every year the Province has surrendered money for the Compensation of Employees back to the Revenue Fund. This will impact negatively on the Department's function. A lot of critical posts will be affected. The MEC should engage the Provincial [Inaudible.] Legislature and Premier to [Inaudible.] to protect critical [Inaudible].

During the first wave we know that a lot of people in residential facilities for old people and in frail care facilities were affected by the virus. Even in the danger of the second wave, the Province should have made provision for the old people. It is a cause of serious concern that funding for the Older Persons' Programme is decreased. We are also concerned with the decrease for the Social Relief Programme. This reduction will only expose elderly people to the risks of COVID-19. As we are witnessing the rise of COVID-19 infections, we have to worry about the second pandemic, gender-based violence and femicide.

In September we heard from police that the Western Cape was home to eight out of 33 GBV hotspots, with Delft being the number one hotspot of GBV in the country. In the MTBPS it was promised that the Province [Inaudible – audio distorted.] Government would provide [Inaudible.] safe spaces in the form of shelters for abused women, victims of human trafficking and childcare and protection services. We have to ask, how is this possible when



the budget for victims' empowerment is only increased by R7,2 million. Since the beginning of [Inaudible.] we have been calling on this Department to increase resources in communities where the victims of GBV stay. The MEC must allocate resources to the GBV Board. In March this year, National Government handed over six buildings to Provincial Government to be converted into shelters for women and children who have survived violence at home.

Public Works and Infrastructure Minister, Patricia de Lille, says Government has signed off 12 properties in Gauteng and the Western Cape to be used as shelters for victims of gender violence. Even under the infrastructure expenditure by municipalities as given in the Overview of Adjusted Provincial and Municipal Infrastructure Investment, 2020 [Inaudible – audio distorted.] there is no expenditure earmarked for these shelters [Inaudible.] and young people in education, employment, training and EETs.

The Department has decreased the budget for the Substance Abuse Prevention and Rehabilitation Programme. For that reason, the ANC does not support this budget. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Bakubaku-Vos. Hon members, can I just say it is your responsibility to ensure you have a good internet connection if you are to read your speech. Unfortunately, there was quite a lot of hon member Bakubaku-Vos' speech which we did not hear, so please could you ensure that you do have good connection when you are

allocated to speak. I now recognise hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. The EFF is disappointed with the allocation decrease of R984 000 in the Second Adjusted Appropriation from the R1 million in the First Adjustment when the Provincial Finance Minister assured this House that the well-being of our people in the province would be one of the key priorities.

The increase in the Early Childhood Development Grant is welcomed. Similarly, the shifting of R3 million to the Department of Transport and Public Works for the purposes of repairing fire damage at the Saartjie Baartman Centre for Women and Children should also be welcomed. However, the R61,2 million surrendered to the Provincial Revenue Fund as a result of the reduction in the Compensation of Employees will not be supported by the EFF. The Department should have used the money to create employment opportunities, more so in times like these where people have lost their jobs as a result of the impact of COVID-19.

On that note, the EFF will not support Vote No. 7. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Makamba-Botya. Hon Bakubaku-Vos can you mute yourself please. I now recognise Hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Hon Deputy Speaker, we support the Vote. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, noted hon Herron. I now recognise hon Bosman.

Mr G BOSMAN: Good afternoon, hon Deputy Speaker. This has perhaps been one of the most difficult years for the people of this province. The pandemic has made more and more people poorer, more and more people unemployed and it has left so many people hungry. Through this we are grateful for the work of the Department of Social Development and the work of the many dedicated DSD people across the length and breadth of the Western Cape.

As the Democratic Alliance we support Vote 7 Social Development in the Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill. We welcome the much-needed increase of just over R14,3 million for Social Development. This speaks to the recognition by this Government of the desperate need for restoring dignity to the residents of our province, particularly those who find themselves in vulnerable, challenging circumstances as a result of this humanitarian crisis that has been exacerbated by the ANC's unduly prolonged irrational hard lockdown.

This Adjustment Budget ensures that we deliver comprehensive services to the people of the Western Cape, services they currently desperately need because our National Government has not been able to provide comprehensive and coordinated services to the people of the Western Cape through the State agencies that have been mandated to deliver these services.

Hon Deputy Speaker, in this province we aim to treat the most vulnerable people with dignity.

We note and welcome the specific increases of R44,7 million to the Children and Families Programme and over R53 million for Early Childhood Development, especially at a time when the National Minister has waged an all out assault on the ECD sector. We once again commend the Western Cape Government for being the only province that continued to pay ECDs and NGOs in this province while the National Government allowed NPOs to struggle.

We welcome the more than R51 million for food relief which will help us feed the many starving residents of this province. This is food relief that will ensure that families are fed and that kids can eat.

A further R68,4 million to the Research and Development Programme, a specific target to live out the Government's value for innovation which is ever more important as we face these dynamic and difficult times. The R116 million for non-profit institutions are important because we realise that government alone cannot tackle the social challenges we face, but must effectively partner with, as far as possible, the many NGOs and community organisations which carry out tremendous work underground and I welcome the fact that a sizable amount of this is designated for additional funding for shelters for people who are homeless.

We note the downward decreases for payments on capital assets, compensation, goods and service, and machinery and equipment. This does, however, highlight the prudent financial management we have come to see from this Government and its ability to make the tough decisions needed during the most extraordinary of times. In the face of a drastic lack of resources and training by the South African Police Services the Province is stepping up to play its part in curbing the pandemic of gender-based violence.

Hon Deputy Speaker, every day we are called to communities to intervene because victims are exposed to secondary victimisation at the many police stations that are ill equipped to provide comprehensive support to victims.

We thank the many community volunteers who provide support to victims during the trauma that crime brings. It is so important that Government helps victims of gender-based violence rebuild their lives and we are grateful for the six safe houses that are being set up to help support those who are victims of gender-based violence.

On the allocation of the six safe houses by our National Department of Public Works, we welcome the signing of the Memorandum of Understanding between the Department and the Province and stakeholders. However, it has come to our attention that a number of these units are not fit for purpose. We will ensure that these sites are properly capacitated to ensure that this Government can deliver safe spaces for people who are victims of gender-

based violence. We will make sure that both the Western Cape Government and the National Department of Public Works play their part in delivery.

We note with concern the proposed migration of the ECD competency from National DSD to Education. In particular, we are perplexed by National Government's irrational hurry to have this change take place within institutional and potential financial implications and we see the hurry for them wanting this change to take place by April next year.

Surely, this speaks to the skewed priorities in the middle of a pandemic, especially since there is no clarity on whether this rushed migration means that both the functional ECD factors as well as the policy responsibilities will be moved. But we understand the urgency with which the President wants to remove this crucial function from his incompetent Minister of Social Development. Surely the President is as appalled as we are by the failure of this delinquent Minister to manage this sector. It seems, hon Deputy Speaker, social development is not taken seriously by the ruling African National Congress. As this is the second Minister of Incompetence that we have had in this sector.

I welcome the Western Cape Department of Social Development's proactive response to the COVID-19 pandemic in the provision of guidelines, PPE and life-giving resources to NPOs, ECDs and homes for the elderly. This Province stands out as being the only one to pay on time, where needed and in the most impactful of ways and we urge other provinces to follow suit and

to follow our best practices.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I can spend years outlining the failures of SASSA, the primary agency for Social Security but they have continually failed to deliver on time. I can spend days talking about the long queues, the unavailability of staff to deal with the queries, the thousands of improper payments, delays in assessing grant appeals and the contempt displayed by National Government in allowing for oversight to take place within the Provincial Legislature but it will just waste our time.

Hon Deputy Speaker, let me take this opportunity to thank Minister Sharna Fernandez, the Head of Department, Dr Robert McDonald and all the people in the Department for the valuable work that they have done to make sure that so many people have something to eat and are looked after. I also want to thank the Committee members and a very special thank you to our procedural officer, Ms Nomonde Jamce for her continued hard work.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Democratic Alliance supports this Vote.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon Minister Fernandez.

The MINISTER FOR SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Deputy Speaker, am I audible, can you hear me loud and clear?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Loud and clear, hon Minister.

The MINISTER FOR SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I wish to thank all the hon members for their participation in the debate today. I wish to thank the hon Bakubaku-Vos for her inputs. However, I must remind the hon member that social relief of distress is vested in Chapter 2 of the Social Services Act and it is a responsibility of SASSA. SASSA is a National entity which is linked to National DSD and sadly, we have, together with her support, tried to bring relief to many citizens who were affected by the SASSA 350 SRD debacle and not only that, the many disability beneficiaries who were not afforded their grants because of SASSA incompetence. So sadly, I would encourage Ms Bakubaku-Vos to take that up with the National Minister.

Then we talk about the R61,25 million and I am sorry, I did a 'Zuma' on my numbers earlier, hon Deputy Speaker, but I have since recognised the error of my ways. Again, it is as a result of National Treasury, so for the hon Bakubaku-Vos to ask me to speak to the Premier and the Provincial Minister of Finance, is not going to help. Maybe if she went on Twitter and spoke with the hon Tito Mboweni who instead of tweeting about what he is eating, he might apply his mind to what citizens need, not only in this province but across the country.

The ANC Government, hon Deputy Speaker, should stop stealing and plundering the public purse because if they stopped stealing and bailing out



SOEs we would have more money for ECDs. We would have more treatment centres, we would have more shelters for victims of gender-based violence, we would have more social workers, we would have more ECDs but the rampant looting and plundering of the public purse that has continued unabated for the last nine, ten years has brought not only this province to its knees, but the entire country to its knees financially. So hon Bakubaku-Vos, please, I would urge you to engage your counterparts at National and deal with them decisively.

To the hon Makamba-Botya, thank you very much for your input, it is valued. Yes, there is the appropriation but sadly it is what it is. Minister Maynier has had a really difficult job trying to balance a budget that has been imposed on him and we are actually operating in the unknown space. We are dependent on litigation and so we are almost flying blind and despite that he has produced a budget, I believe, that will see us through this pandemic.

Then to the hon Herron, thank you very much for supporting Budget Vote 7 and then to our Chairperson, the hon member Bosman, thank you for your chairing of our committees. I wish to thank you and all the Committee members as well as Ms Nomondo Jamce for her support and I also would like to convey my condolences again to her and the family.

I also wish to thank the Premier and my Cabinet colleagues for their support during what was a difficult time trying to mobilise and get food. We had to reprioritise R35 million to get 50,000 food parcels out which was something

that was unknown, never ever happened in a DSD space and so again, we need to come back to SASSA.

Then, hon Deputy Speaker, I wish to thank our HOD, Dr Robert McDonald, for his capable and ethical leadership. I wish to thank a very committed and dedicated management team, but most importantly, I wish to thank every single staff member in the DSD family. Today I want to ask that we observe a moment's silence. Four of our offices are closed. We have one office where virtually every single staff member needs to be tested so we are back in trying times and we are going to need the support of everyone to help us get through this second resurgence.

Finally, hon Deputy Speaker, it would be remiss of me not to thank all stakeholders and active citizens who have assisted the Department by supporting us on the ground. I am going to ask, and because my Department is affected so heavily by the resurgence; our George office, our Worcester office, one or two other offices and it will affect service delivery, I am asking the hon members to bear with us. They do know how to contact me if there is an emergency but let us mask up, let us practice the necessary protocols to ensure that we stop the spread of the resurgence of this COVID-19 pandemic. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Minister Fernandez.

That concludes the debate on this vote. Mr Poggenpoel will read the 8th Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Debate on Vote 2 – Provincial Parliament – *Western Cape Second Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B 7 – 2020].

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Mr Poggenpoel. I recognise the hon Speaker Mnqasela.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Premier, hon members I wish to at this stage present the Western Cape Provincial Parliament Adjustment Budget for the 2020/2021 Financial Year.

2020 has proven to be quite a challenging year for our province, for the country and for the world around as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic which placed enormous strains on the budgets of all of us. The onslaught of the COVID-19 pandemic required a rapid response in terms of planning, decision making and innovation. The implementation of appropriate measures and health protocols as well as the utilisation of innovative tools would ensure that the Western Cape Provincial Parliament could continue with its business in an uninterrupted fashion throughout the COVID-19 lockdown. Even during this difficult time, the Western Cape Provincial Parliament continued to develop strategies to modernise and continually improve institutional procedures and processes to continue the functions of Parliament better.

The biggest shifts in service has been in the establishment of work-from-home protocols, remote access to the WCPP network and the process of enabling virtual Parliament. Hon Deputy Speaker, hon members, the WCPP responded to the pandemic with great efficiency and effectiveness. This is due to the great dedication, support, resilience and commitment by the staff members of this Provincial Parliament and the IT team who managed to chart the uncharted waters in ensuring that we traverse this terrain with distinction. Our hands must be put together to really applaud this kind of excellence by this team in this Provincial Parliament.

Prior to the pandemic, hon members, through you, hon Deputy Speaker, we had the online streaming, but it was very limited and nobody knew what we could do, nobody had the answers to all the challenges that we were confronted with but we said we are not locking down. On the 19 March we met here and we said this Parliament will not lockdown and I must say, hon Deputy Speaker, hon Premier and hon members, it is through collaboration, through finding ways and means of ensuring that we remain relevant, we were able to engage stakeholders but most importantly, this Parliament is able to commit to its obligation of law-making, holding the Executive to account and conducting oversight and that was what seized all of us to ensure that we function optimally in this Parliament.

I thank every single member of this House and every single staff member of this Parliament for really joining hands and making it happen. There were long hours, and nobody complained, but we got all hands-on deck and we

made sure that it happened. That is why we can proudly stand here in this Adjustment Budget and say that whatever it is that we are cutting down, we had to comply because of the pandemic.

Having engaged the Minister of Finance on a number of occasions, hon Deputy Speaker, hon Premier and hon members, it was clear that we are not going to be treated as one of the departments but will be treated as Parliament and I must say that the hon Minister of Finance was able to understand this principle and the Head of Department of Treasury understood this principle, and hence we could still come back and say we will abide and will collaborate and will co-operate with them.

The WCPP has proven that it is more than capable of showing innovation and to display our capabilities as being among the best in the world and we led in this area because we are one Parliament that was able to go completely virtual and we did it within a short space of time, providing effective procedural and related support to members, committees and the House in order to make laws and of course continue with our responsibilities of oversight and accountability.

But there were challenges which I think it is important to just mention one or two. The zero-rated platforms is one of those and we want to assure the hon members and the stakeholders out there in the province, that we want to ensure that each and every responsibility that this Parliament has been entrusted with, in terms of the Constitution, we do not leave people out of

Parliament. We are a Parliament because of the stakeholders, because of the people and we said when we were elected, myself and the hon Deputy Speaker, that we will put people at the centre of this Parliament and that is why it is important to continue to investigate measures that will bring people to the centre when we talk about public engagement, taking our views to the communities for public engagement, more than just engaging but to inform, educate and take their views as we make the new laws in the new era of the world.

So that is very important and I think the Secretary to Parliament, hon Deputy Speaker and hon members, has taken this task to ensure that we are indeed able to achieve just that because of the expensive nature of data in South Africa. So we have to implement this very important aspect of our engagement. Although not everything that we have said here has been easy to achieve, what has been easier is that we have been able to work together with the support of not only the members of Parliament, but staff members did not complain. There was not a single protest in this Parliament. People worked and there were times when we were being tasked with asking them to start coming back to the building. It was not easy and we implemented those protocols in ensuring that staff members are safe but they returned to work safely and we show that we are a caring Parliament and that is something that I think we can all be proud of as this Parliament.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the WCPP responded to the request to look at savings on key areas and those savings will not necessarily affect our functioning as

Parliament. And, of course, whatever we do, it should not negatively affect the ability on key mandates, and that is what we said we will do. Those cuts include R11,53% which is R9,5 million which is the Compensation of Employees; 37,5% which is R11,5 million to Goods and Services; 3,12% which is R72 000 to Machinery and Equipment. This amounts to a total budget cut of R21,086 million.

Now this is not a small amount for Parliament because this is a 12,78% budget cut. R21 million it is not a small thing for us because we actually do not have much budget, hon Deputy Speaker and with everything that we want to do, the apps and other things to drive through your office, really we had to cut the meat and be very, very lean in our approach and I think this can be something that can be attributed to great budgeting by the CFO of this Parliament.

The Compensation of Employees could be cut due to filling some of our vacancies later in the financial year, so we said we are going to hang in a bit and fill in some of the vacancies later. But also we said we are not going to pay performance bonuses this year and also we said we will reduce overtime and only approve overtime when it is really necessary.

On Goods and Services and capital cuts, we have accommodated by reducing mainly on your favourite, hon Deputy Speaker, foreign travel and I know we had to fight to get this right, but also on domestic travel, on catering and smaller items including marketing, stationery and uniforms. It is only going

to be when it is necessary that all of these will be undertaken. Some of these conferences can be done virtually and they have been taking place virtually. The NCSL took place virtually. We have got the CPA wanting to engage us virtually on a number of other conferences. Where we have paid subscriptions and we have got full membership and they want us to attend in person, really as Parliament, we should not be found wanting and that is why it is necessary that we undertake this travel. And of course with domestic travelling, there are some essentials and that includes things like the National Speakers Forum and various other forums where there is necessity either for the Deputy Speaker or for the Speaker or the SMT or any staff member invited to local conferences that it is going to benefit us. But it is not travelling because there is a jamboree somewhere and we just want to travel and that is not going to be the order of the day in this Parliament.

Now oversight visits were also limited during lockdown and that was undertaken only when it was necessary and we continue to do so now, only when it is necessary to do so because we have to be out there in communities, not to be a Parliament that is absent from those who elected us.

In summary, hon Deputy Speaker, hon members, the WCPP's main budget of R166 600 000 was supplemented with roll-overs of R5,8 million from the previous financial year and adjusted by R20,5 million leaving the WCPP with an Adjusted Appropriation of R151 928 million. The roll-overs for the 2019/2020 financial year was mainly allocated as follows:



Programme 1 – Governance, Leadership and Administration; R3,3 million which is broken down as follows: R218 000 to cover projects that were not completed in the 2019/2020 financial year with R138 000 to cover the Association of Public Accounts Committee from the 2019/2020 financial year; R3 million to cover the procurement of IT equipment, Microsoft Teams, internet and disaster recovery costs as well as the Information Security Awareness and Training Programme.

Programme 2 – Parliamentary Support Services with R24 000 to cover procurement of personal protective equipment related to the COVID-19 pandemic.

Hon Deputy Speaker, for Programme 3 on Public Engagement, R1,6 million to cover Legislative Sector Support Projects which were not completed in 2019/2020 was appropriated and lastly;

Programme 4, which is Members Support Services R890 000 of which R490 000 were allocated to cover the once-off Special Programmes Allowance for COVID-19.

So let me just clarify this point, this is the budget that was approved by this House through the intervention by the Speaker to ensure that members get the money and go out to communities and buy protective equipment for communities or provide food relief, because this is a disaster, and it is something that is also a first in this country. It has not been done before but

this Parliament did it.

So it is important that members understand that whatever we spent we had to account for, and this is one of the allocations. Also, R400 000, hon Deputy Speaker, to cover the shortfall on the Constituency Allowances due to the fact that we anticipated that there would be more money coming in from National, but there was less because of the budget cuts that existed at the beginning of the year. So we had to make provision for that so that members and the Constituency Offices are not worse off but were able to capacitate the hon members of this Parliament.

Other than that, I think some of the provisions, hon Deputy Speaker, are for small items where we have R232 000 to accommodate the higher than anticipated costs relating to the regrading of posts. The other one is R522 000 which were also issues of audit fees, because we understated but it was important that we cover those; R568 000 to accommodate head hunting in the recruitment process; R54 000 for CCTV cameras and to deal with the card readers in the entrances because we stopped using the fingerprint system because of COVID-19.

Hon Deputy Speaker, at this point I am going to take a pause. I will cover the rest at the end. But thank you very much and thanks to the hon members.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Speaker. I now recognise hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon members, ladies and gentlemen, I rise on behalf of the African National Congress to decline support for this Budget Vote.

In replying to the Joint Sitting Debate on the South African Reconstruction and Recovery Plan, President Ramaphosa said, and I quote:

“One of the reasons I chose to present this Economic Reconstruction and Recovery Plan to the joint sitting of Parliament, was to give the elected leaders of our country the opportunity to have a thoroughgoing and robust debate on the plan rather than to grandstand.”

Hon Deputy Speaker, there should be little doubt that this Provincial Parliament lies at the very heart of our Province’s own Reconstruction and Recovery Plan, even though we have to wait another three months before it is implemented.

Sadly, what we saw from the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement presented to this House last week, was not a thoroughgoing and robust debate on the economic outlook and recovery of our province, but grandstanding. It is a pity that even in this province where they govern, the DA does nothing else but grandstand.

As we applaud the officials of the Provincial Parliament, for fending off the Provincial Treasury in budgetary cuts and defending their constitutional

mandated functions, we note that the large amount of money being saved because of a delay is in staff appointments. We must ask how it is possible that a senior manager had to be sought, then head-hunted, accept the offer in the region of R1,2 to R1,4 million only then to rescind his acceptance. What made this senior candidate decline? The offer was after accepting it. We received assurance that the three staff vacancies yet to be filled will have warm bodies in them by the end of the financial year but remain concerned over the general staff morale in the Provincial Parliament.

We commend the Provincial Parliament in continuing their quest to recruit more staff despite envisaged compensation of employees, cut demands by the Provincial Treasury and for not looking into restructuring posts. Sadly, while the issue of regrading or error in grading of certain posts was explained and how this happened, we received no explanation as to why the error was made in the first place and who was held responsible if the errors were deliberate.

Indeed, while it may impress some members that we are beating the international benchmark in protection against phishing, we must note the lack of innovation of ensuring larger public participation in the proceedings of this Provincial Parliament. Yes, there is a lockdown, yes we are limited in space and have to observe social distancing, but we hear of little efforts being made to close the already existent gap that separates this Parliament from the people.

Fortunately, we are able to still participate in some international webinars,

through the associations this Parliament belongs to, but we seem not to be moved by the fact that this Parliament has become a place of grandstanding and not one of thoroughgoing and robust debate.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I wish to reiterate the issue raised in this House by the hon Leader of the Opposition yesterday when he quoted the Premier in his address in the House on 22 October. On that day, the hon Premier said, and I quote:

“The Western Cape Government’s Budget over the medium term is likely to be cut by the same amount or more than is now going to be funnelled into the black hole, which is SAA.”

But, just last week, we got the true picture from National Treasury and the cuts to the Western Cape Budget are nowhere near the same amount or more as the Premier indicated. As the Leader of the Opposition mentioned yesterday, the Premier misled the House. As a result, this Provincial Parliament must ensure tighter measures to guarantee consequence management of the Executive.

We recognise the [Inaudible.] and the Ethics Initiatives run through Programme 1 of the Budget Vote, but this seems to be failing when the head of this Provincial Government literally misleads this House. In the wake of this House being completely undermined by the reappointment of the Head of Department of Education, we must ensure that the office pertaining especially

to members' interests is well equipped and strengthened. We must ensure that the head of this House or the head of this office, like any other senior official, does not succumb to the pressure of political office bearer.

Hon Deputy Speaker, we once again applaud the staff and officials of the Provincial Parliament, recognise their efforts especially in ensuring that all of us, visitors and our communities are given the necessary personal protection equipment, especially masks. The ANC declines to support this vote. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Lekker. And now I recognise hon Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The only concern of the EFF is the understanding by Provincial Parliament related to vacant positions which were not filled and remain vacant. The positions relate to the following sub-programmes: Institutional [Inaudible.] Financial Campaign, Compliance, Internal Control and Members' Support to mention a few. The filling of these posts will assist this institution greatly to run more efficiently. Another purpose that will be served is that of reducing unemployment, which is a problem in this country, especially now during the COVID-19 where the rate of unemployment has seriously increased.

Hon Deputy Speaker, we are happy with some of the safety mechanisms that have been applied by this Parliament in ensuring, especially around staff, that

staff are working in a safe and healthy environment, but we are worried about the safety of the Speaker himself since the allegations that have surfaced in the mainstream media about his safety. We are happy that recently there are some kind of mechanisms that were instituted, bringing in sniffer dogs and everything else because if the Speaker were to die, we would be in a very critical situation especially being under threat from his own comrades.

Other than that, we do not support the vote because of the understanding on employment. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Xego. I recognise hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON: Hon Deputy Speaker, we support this vote. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, noted hon Herron. Hon member Wenger?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Madam Deputy Speaker. The Western Cape Provincial Parliament sees an in-year downward adjustment of R8,2 million for a total Adjusted Appropriation of R212 million for the 2020/2021 financial year. This equates to a 12,8% budget decrease. Cuts have been made to all four programmes totalling R14,7 million, however members' salaries increased by R6,4 million as a direct charge on the Provincial Revenue Fund in the period.

The decreased budget comes in the main, from Programme 1 – Governance and Administration in the amount of R7 million making up approximately 50% of the overall budget decrease. The Compensation of Employees budget has been cut by 11,5% or R9,5 million and of this R8,3 million comes from the late filling of posts as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic. A further R809 000 comes from not awarding bonuses this year and slashing R380 000 from the overtime budget. Good and Services are reduced by 38% or R11,5 million. The foreign travel budget has reduced in its entirety and local travel reduced by two thirds. Catering and advertising are also cut by 60%. The Western Cape Provincial Parliament COVID-19 expenditure on PPE, while significant is not major. Political parties were allocated a once-off R540 000 to provide disaster declaration pandemic relief in their constituencies.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the Western Cape Provincial Parliament was the first, and to my knowledge, the only legislature in the country that has published its COVID-19 PPE expenditure for public scrutiny, a first for legislative transparency during the pandemic.

Hon Deputy Speaker, this institution has received another clean audit opinion and the Parliamentary Oversight Committee will continue to do its work in terms of the Financial Management of the Parliament and Provincial Legislatures Act to monitor the financial performance of this institution. This Parliament has a small budget of a R152 million, yet it is one of the most efficient and well-run legislatures in the country with the least number of



staff per member. That being so we will have to be creative to do more with less. This is because of the dire economic situation in our country exacerbated by the COVID-19 pandemic and because of political decisions to again fund State-owned Entities resulting in provincial budget cuts.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the innovation of this institution, even with its small budget, was none the more evident than during the hard lockdown. The WCPP was the very first provincial legislature to carry out its business in a virtual environment in South Africa. Our Standing Committee sittings and all other parliamentary work moved online within days, even though this was an entirely new way of doing business.

It is our democratic obligation to find ways to conduct proper oversight so that we can be sure every possible step is taken to ensure the safety and wellbeing of the residents in our province during this pandemic. Creative solutions through technology have allowed us to continue to serve the people of this province. As hon Lekker mentioned, public participation has always been a concern. We recall going to meetings and communities across the province only to have handful of participants.

By moving public participation to WhatsApp, which is readily available to most, we saw for example that the Ad-hoc Committee had over 17 000 responses to the public participation process. So we are proud to have set the standard of provincial legislatures in South Africa by conducting our work in a virtual environment.

The WCPP is certainly doing its best to realise its vision of being a dynamic, effective and efficient Parliament supporting constitutional democracy. The Democratic Alliance therefore supports this Budget Adjustment so that much needed funds can go to other service delivery needs in face of overall budget cuts.

I take the opportunity to thank members of the POC for their contributions over this year. Integral to this Committee is the Presiding Officer, Mr Dustin Davids and senior Ms Lizette Cloete under the management of Mr Mario Sassman. I would also like to thank the Speaker and you, Madam Deputy Speaker as well as the Secretary, Mr Romeo Adams and his management team, for being available to the Committee, for tabling financial and quarterly reports on time and for being available to answer all our questions.

In conclusion, Deputy Speaker the DA supports Vote 2. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Wenger. I now recognise the hon Speaker Mnqasela.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker and thank you to the hon members. The beauty, hon Deputy Speaker, is that the Speaker and the parliamentary team, appears before the POC all the time so there is nothing new to really share. I think it is a customary thing and also a legislative provision, as a mandate, that we come and present this attachment here. But it was shared with the POC, and of course the POC has been able to

interrogate us and interrogate the report and I presume that all of the concerns were attended to when we met last week and the spirit was good in such a way that members were satisfied with the responses thereto. But I do welcome that it is not going to be enough, you know we must continue to engage on some of the more specific responses. For instance when hon Lekker was referring to the capacitation of the Registrar's office: there is nothing that is lacking so you do not capacitate when there is nothing that is lacking, but when there is a need we responded at the POC and I want to emphasise here in this Chamber, that we have every mechanism to augment capacity whenever it is needed because this is Parliament and the Registrar is the Registrar of this Parliament and we capacitate that office. I congratulate the Registrar, Advocate Burgess, for accepting his appointment in this regard.

But what is important here, to the hon Lekker, through you, hon Deputy Speaker, is that this is the first time I am hearing about the issue of low staff morale. We have a very great team here and I think I have made it clear in applauding the work that they have done. If the staff morale was low, I can tell you that we would not have been successful in doing what we have been doing because people would have found an opportunity to stay out of work.

In terms of the happiness index, if we were to go around and poll the happiness of staff members, you will find that everywhere around the world, when COVID-19 hit, everybody could not believe that they could not see their families. They could no longer get onto a taxi or drive to work. It has

been a stressful environment but any happiness index in terms of our environment will not be related to being treated badly by the employer, it will be on the basis of any other thing including Covid, but in terms of staff morale and where we are it is news to me and I know when we engaged with staff members, they told me that they are happy to work for this Parliament.

I actually had a very good meeting, hon Deputy Speaker, hon Premier and the hon members, with all the staff members. It was virtual hybrid meeting right at the tail-end of Level 2, Level 3 and that meeting was a very good session, and everyone said, Speaker we are with you. Now I want to know, through you, hon Deputy Speaker to hon Lekker, where would that low morale come from? But we will engage at the POC because this is not just one platform.

At some stage the hon Lekker was saying that we have got a Parliament that needs to improve on innovation. I thought everybody here has been saying we are the most innovative Parliament in the region and part of the best Parliaments in the world. So I think that maybe your recollection is not serving you well as I heard members saying it all the time throughout the lockdown, thanking our teams, but today to hear that we need more innovation? I think it would be contrary to the popular belief and what has been shared with us. But again, we will see what are the pertinent areas that need attention. Nobody is perfect but we continue to do the best we can as this Parliament.

I think the issue of the director was mentioned here. People accept positions

and sometimes they decide later that they do not want to work there. And sometimes they get better offers and we cannot really find any other excuse for the director that we appointed for Parliamentary Services who later said, “No, I do not want to come and work there.” He was happy and excited but when he said he cannot work here it can only be that there were greener pastures elsewhere and we do not stop people from accepting other offers as well. It is actually a good thing when they are able to do that.

Hon Xego, we have a number of vacancies including the one that I have just mentioned. Various reasons exist for why one or two vacancies have not been filled but the reality is some of them we have decided to park because not everyone has been fully occupied during COVID-19. I mean if you have to sit here, the service officers, how many of us are in the House now, in the Chamber? It is me; it is the Deputy Speaker; it is the hon Premier and hon Sayed. Where are the rest of the members? In the comfort of their homes or somewhere in their constituencies so we cannot expect everybody to be here every day but if we have to employ more, what are they going to be doing? And we must allow the public fiscus to pay? We cannot be doing that to taxpayers when we know very well that there will not be a need at the time. But we are going to fill some of these vacancies in the new year and we will ensure we follow the proper processes.

On the issue that was raised about the Premier by hon Lekker, there is a Standing Committee for the Premier and constitutional matters and that the Standing Committee must do its work and its job is to ensure that it holds the

Premier to account there. If there is something that was raised by the Premier and it is found to be raising questions, they must be raised there and also there are other mechanisms to deal with those because I do not want this particular budget vote to be about anything else than what we have to deal with here.

Lastly, I want to thank hon Herron for supporting this budget vote. I know that you have been very critical at times and you have not been folding your arms, but you have been very critical in ensuring that we do ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: One-minute hon Speaker, there is hand raised. Hon Marran what is your point of order?

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Speaker, just a point of correction. The Speaker is wrong by saying that we are all in our comfort zones. Some of us are stressed ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no hon Marran there is no such thing as point of correction, please lower your hand. You may proceed, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. At this stage I want to thank the Chair of the COVID-19 Committee, who, everybody will agree, led this Committee with dedication, excellence and professionalism and of course the Committee and all the political parties that participated to help us remain relevant, engaging and informing the public during COVID-19 and holding

the Executive to account. Hon Wenger led this dedicated team of members in this period and for that, thank you very much hon Wenger, through you, Chairperson.

At the very outset I said, this Parliament could not fold its arms when it came to COVID-19 and this Committee made sure that we did not close business but remained relevant in engaging with the stakeholders and of course with all Government departments and the Executive members.

Hon Deputy Speaker, as I conclude, I wish to thank the hon Deputy Speaker, yourself, for the work that you have done in the office and for this Parliament and the hon members of Parliament on everything that we have achieved. It is not without you, and of course all the members of this team in this very beautiful Parliament, led by the Secretary Mr Romeo Adams, for having worked tirelessly to realise all the objectives set by the law, to remain a Parliament that can effectively deal with our law-making processes, holding the Executive to account but also ensuring that there is quality oversight. And thank you to the office of the Speaker for the work that it has done over this period to support the Speaker and the Deputy Speaker, in this period.

Hon members as you know whenever we end the year, we end with our customary lunch, which is hosted by the Speaker but there will not be a lunch now because we are in this period where we find ourselves with COVID-19, but it has now been exacerbated by the recent resurgence in the infections which has resulted in the event not appearing on the calendar.

I think you will agree with me, hon members that it will be suitable to find an opportunity to have a welcome lunch when we come back and doing so in the new year and all of us by then will be looking forward to the beautiful year and we pray that it will be less hectic than it is now in terms of COVID-19, and also we can do it in style, as we welcome the new year.

Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker and thank you to the people of the Western Cape for supporting this Parliament. Just on the 20th last week, we had a hybrid session here, where the youth of this province came together in all the corners of this province and some of them were here in this venue having a youth dialogue on matters that affect young people. Thank you very much to all the young people and all the stakeholders for supporting this Parliament. I thank you.

[Debate concluded.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. That concludes the debate on this vote. Hon members, before I move on I have to announce the report of Standing Committee and Community Safety, Cultural Affairs and Sport on the recommendation for the appointment of candidates to the governing board of the Western Cape Liquor Authority have been duly ATC'd on 12 November 2020 and in terms of the relevant legislation need not be considered by this House. The 9th Order, therefore, falls away.

That concludes the business for House. The House is adjourned. The



Secretary will now end the meeting and all members will be exited. Thank you very much.

The House adjourned at 17:00.