
THURSDAY, 2 SEPTEMBER 2021

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

The Speaker took the Chair and read the prayer.

The SPEAKER: You may all be seated. Good afternoon and welcome, hon members, the hon Premier of the Western Cape, and the leaders of political parties, and I must say in the House I am blessed that myself and the hon Deputy Speaker are not alone. We have here in our presence in our midst, the Premier. Thank you, hon Premier, for joining us in the Chamber. Hon Minister Bredell, thank you for joining us in the Chamber. Hon Minister Mitchell, thank you for joining us in the Chamber. Hon Minister Simmers, for joining us in the Chamber, thank you very much.

It can get lonely in the House in the Chamber alone. It is a big Chamber, so it is lovely to have you here. We do have some guests, which is nice. It is your Parliament, you are welcome there in the gallery, to the guests that are here.

Hon members, in terms of the convention and in terms of the Standing Rules, these hybrid sessions and of course this hybrid session is conducted in terms of the Standing Rules, as amended, which then suggests that all the provisions of the Rules apply. That includes what we all know that you do not activate your mic if you are not recognised and you also do not heckle because it disrupts the order as we are in a virtual and in-person forum.

To our guests, members of the fourth estate, to the media, I would like to request that you enjoy the gallery, in that virtual gallery, and please do not activate your microphone and equally do not activate your camera, as it would disrupt the proceedings.

Hon members, I also see the hon, the Leader of the Opposition in the Chamber, †Enkosi [Thank you] Ntlangase. Thank you for joining us here.

Hon members, you might have noticed there was something unique as we began with the proceedings today, that the mace was not carried by the Serjeant-at-Arms, nor the Deputy Serjeant-at-Arms, but rather our very own Mr Charles Breda. Charles Breda has been in the Western Cape Provincial Parliament for 35 years. Thank you very much, Mr Charles Breda. I call him Charlie. He graciously accepts that and he is always pleased with a smile.

Mr Breda has worked in this institution for more than two decades, I mean for more than three decades. He started on 1 September 1986. Again, I would like us to put our hands together for this gentleman. Thank you very much.

This is a stalwart in terms of public service because it is not easy to stay in the one place in the same institution. For some not even for five to ten years, but hon members, hon Premier, he stayed here for 35 years so he was saying to me because we talk from time to time, he says to me, "Mr Speaker, do not forget, we need to have that meeting one-on-one, because I have been here too long now." So we are going to have that meeting, Mr Breda. I have asked my office to activate that so we do not have to make an appointment. Just walk there to see the Speaker. I think you have that authority given your years of service.

Hon members, in terms of our programme and in terms of the Order of the Day we are going to have the Interpellations, Questions, and also we do have Questions without Notice to the Premier and then Members' Statements and then Motions, which we will end with the report from the Conduct Committee, which this House will consider.

In terms of the Interpellations there is only one. It is an interpellation by the hon, the Leader of the Opposition to the Minister of Local Government and Environmental Affairs and Development Planning. I now recognise the hon Minister Bredell.

INTERPELLATION

Corruption Watch Report: South Africa needs clean hands

1. Mr C M Dugmore asked the Minister of Local Government, Environmental Affairs and Development Planning:

- (a) What measures has he and his Department put in place to investigate corruption in the City of Cape Town, and
- (b) What steps have been taken to ensure that the City of Cape Town has clean hands?"

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Thank you hon Speaker and thank you to the hon member for asking me that interpellation. Section 106 of the Municipal Systems Act 2000 requires me as the Provincial Minister responsible for Local Government to initiate a provincial investigation in respect of a municipality in the Western Cape, where:

- 1. I have reason to believe that the municipality cannot or does not fulfil its statutory obligations binding on that municipality, or that maladministration, fraud, corruption or any other serious malpractice has occurred or is occurring in that municipality, and
- 2. I consider such an investigation necessary.

A provincial investigation in terms of Section 106 of the Systems Act must be preceded by a pre-investigation assessment. As required in terms of Section 5 of the Western Cape Government Monitoring and Support Municipal Act, 2014, as part of the pre-investigation assessment I am required amongst other things to provide the municipality in question with an opportunity to provide written representation on any allegations that are being considered for a possible investigation in terms of 106 of the Systems Act and to then objectively assess all available information before taking a decision on the necessity of a provincial investigation.

Any action taken to investigate allegations must furthermore be procedurally sound and defensible and requires substantiated evidence or documentation to support the allegations. I have received allegations relating to the following:

- Corruption between City contractors and City officials;
- Fraud by City contractors who have allegedly inflated invoices;
- Tender manipulation by City officials;
- Money laundering by ward councillors.

I have commenced with the following statutory prescribed processes applicable to the assessment of these allegations. To date the City has been responsive to my request for the relevant information and documentation relating to the various allegations and assessments are currently underway. It should also be noted that the City of Cape Town are equipped with their own internal fraud unit which undertakes their own investigations and report back

to appropriate structures on the status of ongoing investigations. The provisions for a provincial investigation in a municipality are in addition to the monitoring and support function of the Western Cape Government discharged in the ordinary course of an ongoing basis in accordance with the Constitution, read with the applicable legislation. In this regard the Department of Local Government together with the assistance exercise and information provided by a number of other departments in the Western Cape Government, including the Provincial Treasury, objectively assessed the status of the challenges facing municipalities within the Western Cape on an ongoing basis with a view to ensure that the most appropriate and effective solutions are identified, developed and applied to capacitate and support municipalities. My Department provides oversight and support to Municipal Public Accounts Committees to all municipalities within the Western Cape province.

MPACs are monitored on an ongoing basis and serve as an oversight vehicle for municipalities in respect of fruitless, wasteful, irregular and unauthorised expenditure as well as annual reports and issues raised by the Auditor-General.

In addition, my Department supports all municipalities within the Western Cape with the implementation of the Local Government Anti-Corruption Strategy and Integrity Management Framework. All municipalities...
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, will you please wrap up.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: I will stick to that and then we can continue. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, Minister. Hon members, I now recognise the hon, the Leader of the Opposition.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, Speaker. Speaker, in 2016 the African National Congress won one municipality which was Laingsburg. As we speak there are nine municipalities which are either run by the ANC through a majority or through coalition. So that means that over the past period, through by-elections through dissolution with the DA, 30% of those municipalities are now run by the ANC. I think this, Speaker, is creating panic, so the question that we are facing today after whatever MEC Bredell, the hon Bredell said in his four minutes, what it actually came down to is that there has never been a Section 106 investigation into the City of Cape Town.

He fails and I hope that he would in his response indicate to us what the timeframes are, we have no issue – through the Speaker – to MEC Bredell with the criteria that you outlined, that is correct, that is how it should be. But you failed to mention in regard to the City of Cape Town, the fraud, contractual corruption, corruption by officials and many findings. You do

not inform this House as to when those interim investigations will be concluded and on what basis a Section 106 investigation will be conducted or not. So in your response, please indicate, but I think it is fear of strengthening ANC that is winning by-elections from the DA that has now resulted in essentially a bias. You look at the municipalities in the non-Metro, hon Speaker, and you see where we have Section 106 investigations, and how quickly those investigations are actually set up. There is bias. We have the situation where the very Chairperson of this Standing Committee who is going to speak after me, refused to discuss detailed evidence, raising concerns about the bias of this Department and other matters. That is shocking that someone who is supposed to have oversight ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon the Leader of the Opposition, will you please take your seat. There is a point of order online.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: A point of order.

The SPEAKER: Yes.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Okay.

The SPEAKER: Hon members, there is a point of order by the hon, the Chief Whip of the Majority Party.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you hon Speaker. I was listening quite carefully and to me it sounded to me a lot like the hon Dugmore was casting aspersions on both the Minister as well as one of the backbenchers in the House and according to my reading of the Rules that is not the way to do so. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip. That is indeed within the Rules, there is no aspersion on the person by the – it is a political discussion, so the Minister will respond in his debate. I will now request the hon, the Leader of the Opposition, to proceed.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, Speaker, could I just ask before I start again, how many more seconds do I have?

The SPEAKER: Your time – you have 30 seconds.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: 30 seconds. †U sien, Speaker, die Hoofsweep van die DA, sy is net so desperaat soos die LUK en sy kom hier met foefies want op die einde van die dag, dit is 'n skande dat mnr America weier om getuienis voor die Komitee te laat bespreek. Dit is 'n skande. Hy moet sy kop hang in skaamte,

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[You see, Speaker, the Chief Whip of the DA is just as desperate as the MEC

and she comes here with gimmicks because at the end of the day, it is a disgrace that Mr America refuses for evidence to be discussed before the Committee. It is a disgrace. He should hang his head in shame,] because he should be playing oversight, so it is very clear here, there is no political will to deal with because they are scared of the City of Cape Town ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Your time is up, thank you, hon Dugmore, your time is up, thank you. Hon members, I see the hand up of the hon, the Deputy Chief Whip of the Majority Party. Hon Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Speaker, previously when member Dugmore was speaking he did not mention a name of one of the Chairs in the backbenches to which he was referring but the second time around after the Chief Whip raised a point of order regarding casting aspersions he mentioned the name directly and I wanted to find out whether you can please rule whether he is casting aspersions upon a backbencher in this House.

The SPEAKER: Backbencher, hon Baartman, I find it difficult to deal with the matter on the basis of what the hon, the Leader of the Opposition has said, but do you want to be specific on what rule he violated?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Apologies, Speaker, I am just trying to unmute. May I go ahead?

The SPEAKER: Please go ahead, hon Baartman. There is currently a point of order, and there is no point of order on a point of order.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Apologies, Speaker, I am trying to unmute and every time I am trying to unmute it just keeps on showing that I am muted again.

The SPEAKER: Now we can hear you. Will you please proceed, hon Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you so much, Chair. Speaker, I wanted to find out whether in terms of the Rules of Debate in terms of Rule 59, Reflection upon Members of the House, whether that was in order what the member Dugmore said?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Baartman. What I have indicated in terms of my previous ruling on the same matter, on the point of order raised by the Chief Whip, the hon Chief Whip of the majority party, is that there was no basis for me to rule any wrongdoing on the part of the hon Dugmore in this regard and therefore your point of order does not stand. In this case we proceed. I will not be entertaining any points of order in this specific matter, but we proceed with the hon America. Thank you. Hon America.

Mr D AMERICA: Thank you Speaker. Speaker, hon Dugmore should receive another crash course on oversight, despite him being one of the longest

serving members of this House. Speaker, I am perplexed by the audacity and the hypocrisy of the hon Dugmore's comments. In the past he has bragged about MECs in ANC-run provinces having always cooperated with respect to questions concerning municipalities. If member Dugmore cared about facts you would see that ANC MECs share the same sentiments as Minister Bredell. Some have gone a step further and have written to their respective Speakers to ask that an array of municipal questions be removed from the Question Paper. In fact, some ANC MECs simply ignored questions.

Secondly, if member Dugmore wants to talk about dirty hands at municipalities then he must remember that the President Ramaphosa sent the SIU to investigate ANC municipalities in the Western Cape. They had the dirtiest of hands. A further sign of hypocrisy is the ANC talking about corruption and yet no ANC member attended the Standing Committee briefing on interventions into their municipalities in the Western Cape. Currently the Department is involved in litigation against Kannaland for the illegal decisions made in Council and there are Back to Basics support programmes being put in place for Laingsburg. On Monday, Minister Maynier stated that his Department has decided to place Beaufort West under partial administration, owing to the crippling financial situation. Could the Minister, Speaker, just please indicate what his inputs are regarding this problematic municipality? I thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you, hon members. The hon members

in the Chamber will you please exercise some restraint. Thank you. Hon member America, thank you for your contribution. Hon members, I now recognise the hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Speaker, thank you to the Minister. Every time when the Provincial Minister of Local Government in the Western Cape is approached with matters concerning municipalities in the province, he is always quick to reply, emphasising the aspects that municipalities have their own autonomy to determine their own processes, as provided by the Constitution.

What he always omits is that Chapter 3 of the Constitution of South Africa demands all three spheres of the Government to cooperate with one another in mutual trust and good faith by assisting and supporting one another. So how is it possible that a Provincial Government department, which exercises oversight over municipalities, cannot intervene and assist municipalities battling with corruption that has even become public knowledge. Every cent that is stolen and mismanaged in our municipalities results in poor communities being denied access to basic services and the ability for them to exercise their rights properly.

The reports at issue – the issue of the list of the City of Cape Town has been amongst a number of municipalities in the country who saw an increase of 50% corruption complaints by the whistleblowers. The City is also listed as third when it comes to the number of corruption reporting

relating to the office of the municipal manager.

Now †Somlomo [Speaker], in the light of this report at issues and the allegations contained therein, what has the Department done to assist the City of Cape Town to investigate or to get to the root of this corrupt allegations and report those in the wrong to the relevant authorities.

Thank you †Somlomo. [Speaker.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Makamba-Botya. Hon members, I now recognise the hon, the Leader of the Opposition.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much once again, Speaker. Speaker, it is very clear that the Democratic Alliance is losing ground in this province. The ANC is now leading close to ten municipalities, in fact nine. The tenth one can be taken tomorrow. Why is this? This is because the DA is an elitist party that does not care about service delivery... [Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Order, hon members.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Chair, on a point of order, you ruled that there are no interjections and there is squabbling from the other side.

The SPEAKER: Please contain yourselves.

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: Hulle is so bang dat hulle moet nou huil hierso. Hulle huil hierso.

[LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: They are so scared that they now have to cry here. They are crying here.]

The SPEAKER: Please proceed, hon Dugmore. Hon members please, I am calling on the House, especially the members in the Chamber on my right-hand side. Please do not make the work, the job of the Presiding Officer difficult. I have muted. I have put a pause on your time, hon Dugmore, so you may proceed, you just used 28 seconds of your time. That is giving you more time. I see there is a point of order from the hon, the Premier. What is your point of order, hon Premier?

The PREMIER: Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, I would like to ask on a point, I want to say clarity. Am I allowed to ask a question of the Leader of the Opposition during an interpellation?

The SPEAKER: You are allowed, hon Premier, it is a debate, if the hon member so wishes to grant you permission to do so. Hon, the Leader of the Opposition, are you willing to take a question?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No, Speaker, on my timer when I was rudely interrupted it was 44 seconds, so I presume I am going to start at 30 seconds †want hulle het so baie en hard gehuil. [because they cried so much and hard.] †Bayalila bona kwi DA ngoba baloozile

apha eNtshona Koloni. [The DA is in tears in the Western Cape because they have lost.]

The SPEAKER: In terms of... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: There is no way that I can accept a question from the Premier, but we can go outside... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Are you taking a question or not?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: ...after this and sort it out.

The SPEAKER: Okay, okay.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: If he wants to come outside with me, we will go outside and or in our meeting tomorrow ... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon, the Leader of the Opposition, hon Premier, it is clear he is not taking a question. [Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: Do you need the backbenchers to go with you?

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: So die antwoord is nee.

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So the answer is no.]

†Ndithi hayi, andifuni kuphendula imibuzo ngoku. [I said I do not want to answer any questions now.]

The SPEAKER: You may proceed, hon, the Leader of the Opposition.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: So I do not think, hon Speaker, that the hon America should be surprised to find himself the subject of a court case of a High Court application, which is going to test fundamentally whether a Chairperson of a committee is allowed to suppress discussion which is in fact about accountability, because that is what he is has done. †Dit is 'n skande! [It is a disgrace!] So do not be surprised if the hon America loses that case. I hope, you, Speaker, do not join that application and I hope he bears the costs of such an application, because through you, the Premier, he has refused for over a year, he has refused for over a year to discuss a dossier which was presented to him.

Let us talk about Kannaland. I want to put it on record. We as the ANC do not support the illegal appointment of the current acting MM. We do not support that and we will oppose it, that we have a situation there which all parties need to deal with in the interest of the people of Kannaland and I put on record we do not support that appointment. Secondly, in Beaufort West, I am not sure that the hon members of the DA should talk about

Beaufort West, because, †daar gaan 'n bom bars. Daar gaan 'n bom bars môre oor 'n raadslid van die DA wat heeltemal korrup is, [a bomb is going to burst. A bomb is going to burst tomorrow about a council member of the DA who is totally corrupt,] totally corrupt, and that bomb is going to burst tomorrow.

There is a process of actually working with Provincial / National Treasury and other officials to put an Economic Recovery and a Financial Recovery Plan in Beaufort West and we are supporting that. It is very strange that the MEC mentions that the City of Cape Town has got an SIU. What nonsense is this? There is only SIU. They call themselves the SIU, but this is the very City of Cape Town SIU that has refused to report into serious allegations of corruption into the City of Cape Town Housing Maintenance Department.

Why has that SIU and possibly the MEC the so-called City SIU. †Hulle praat groot name maar hulle doen niks. [They talk big names but they do nothing.]

They have kept that report under wraps. That is about officials accepting bribes, giving, getting, receiving cars from contractors. We do not want the MEC to come with platitudes here. We want a timeframe from the MEC about this particular matter. That is what we want because in essence what we see here is a DA losing support. We are not condoning any acts of corruption in whatever way, but the basic problem is the DA

does not serve the poor. That is why Civic Associations, other organisations are joining with the ANC because they want to focus on service delivery. That is what is happening... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you.

†Die LEIER VAN DIE AMPTELIKE OPPOSISIE: En dit is hoekom hulle bang is.

[The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: And that is why they are scared.]

†Bayoyika kwi DA. [The DA is terrified.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, your time is up. Thank you, hon Dugmore. Hon members, thank you. That is the end of your address, hon Dugmore. I now recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Hon Speaker, to the hon member of the EFF, hon Makamba-Botya, my Department concluded the following initiative in the City of Cape Town as part of our oversight and support role: the rollout of the MPAC Guide and Toolkit to the City of Cape Town to improve oversight and good governance done in conjunction with SALGA, the Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs and Provincial Treasury as well as the rollout of Local Government

Anti-Corruption Strategy Integrity Management Framework done in conjunction with the National Treasury Department of CoGTA, as well as SALGA and the Provincial Treasury. We do that, and you started off by acknowledging we are three spheres of Government. We do not interfere and just intervene. We assist and first try to help and support the municipalities.

†Die Agbare Dugmore, dit is baie ironies dat die ANC 'n les wil probeer gee van korrupsie. Dit is reëligwaar alombekend dat die party hierdie land op sy knieë het weens korrupsie en hulle is in beheer daarvan, want die agbare Dugmore moet onthou, dit is nie hoeveel rade jy regeer nie, dit is hoé jy hulle regeer. Ons kan hulle lees en ons kan gaan kyk wat sê die bewyse. Wat, wie skuld vir Eskom in hierdie provinsie geld? Wat skuld hulle? As ons nie nou ingryp – en dit is nie 'n *interference* in Beaufort-Wes nie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[The hon Dugmore, it is very ironic that the ANC tries to lecture on corruption. It is really known all round that the party has this country on its knees through corruption and they are in control of that, because the hon Dugmore should remember, it is not about how many councils you govern, it is how you govern them. We can read it and we can go and look at what the evidence says. What, who owes Eskom money in this province? What do they owe? If we do not now intervene – and it is not

an interference in Beaufort West.]

It is a support package that we want to support Beaufort West with. We even pull in National to come and support them with a turnaround strategy.

†Maar soos wat die agbare Dugmore nou gesê het, met Kannaland gaan sy ANC-lede hom ignoreer in Beaufort-Wes en dit gaan weer 'n chaos wees, agbare Speaker, want hy gee voor van leierskap. Hy was laas by 'n kongres in 2015. Hulle kan nie eers hulle eie party bestuur nie, dan wil hy vir ons kom lesse gee.

Agbare Speaker, ons het hoeveel keer gevra, as ons korrupsie wil aanspreek kom ons kapasiteer die Hawks.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[But as the hon Dugmore now said, with Kannaland his ANC members are going to ignore him in Beaufort West and it is going to be chaos again, hon Speaker, because he is pretending about leadership. The last time he attended a congress was in 2015. They cannot even manage their own party, and then he wants to come and teach us.

Hon Speaker, we have asked how many times, if we want to address corruption, let us capacitate the Hawks.]

Let us build capacity within the Hawks. Let us build capacity within the Public Protector's Office.

†Dit is baie ironies dat die ANC hier staan en preek maar hulle gaan op 'n nasionale begroting en sny die Hawks se begroting met R400 miljoen. Nou wil hulle kamtig heilig spreek. Dit is 'n skande in die oë van die publiek. Dit is welombekend dat die ANC se beleid is hoe armer die mense hoe meer mense sal vir hulle steun. Hulle dink hulle kan mense *bribe* met 'n R350 'n maand. Dit is 'n skande! Dit is 'n skande waarvoor hulle 'n baie duur prys sal betaal.

So die agbare Dugmore moenie hier kom *brag* oor hoeveel raadjies hulle bestuur nie, agbare Speaker. Daardie rade is vrot van korrupsie. Hy kan hulle nie beheer nie. Sy party kan hulle nie beheer nie, want dit is totale chaos op grondvlak. So die laaste wie vir ons 'n les moet probeer gee is die ANC. Ons het so pas 27 oudits wat skoon en ongekwalfiseerd is, die drie rade wat daar buite val is al drie onder ANC se beheer. Dit sê ook 'n storie.

Baie dankie, Agbare Speaker.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[It is very ironic that the ANC stands here and preaches but they go to a national budget and cuts the Hawks' budget by R400 million. Now they

pretend to speak holy. It is a disgrace in the eyes of the public. It is known all round that the ANC's policy is that the poorer the people are, the more people will support them. They think they can bribe people with R350 per month. It is a disgrace! It is a disgrace for which they will pay a very expensive price.

So the hon Dugmore should not come and brag here about how many little councils they manage, hon Speaker. Those councils are rotten with corruption. They cannot control them. His party cannot control them, because it is total chaos at ground level. So the last who should try and give us a lesson is the ANC. We have just had 27 audits that were clean and unqualified, the three councils falling outside that are all three under ANC control. It also tells a story.

Thank you, hon Speaker.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, that concludes the debate on the Interpellation and now we move to Questions.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Speaker, on a point of order.

The SPEAKER: What is the point of order hon Dugmore?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No thank you, Speaker. I

notice that when the MEC had his first opportunity to speak that he did not manage to finish. Is it possible to ask through you, Chair, that the MEC can give us his full initial response in writing, what he was going to say.

The SPEAKER: Yes, that is standard, if the hon Minister did not finish he can provide it to the member who asked the question. Minister, will you provide the response?

The MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING: Yes.

The SPEAKER: It will be provided, thank you. Thank you, hon Minister. Order, hon members, the question number... [Interjection.] [inaudible discussion in background.]

I see the hon members missed the Chamber. I am glad, it is clear that next time we are going to have a full House. [Laughter]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: [Inaudible – no mic.]

The SPEAKER: I called them to order. The hon members who are connected virtually, they will not bear testimony to this, but I can tell the hon Dugmore that the chairs next week, they had eyes, they would confirm that. [Laughter.] But it is true that I have done my very best here.

Hon members, let us move swiftly to the Questions for Oral Reply. We all know the standard practice. For those hon members who wish to ask follow-ups, they will do so after the intention to do so by the first, by the member who asked the question first. I now recognise the hon Minister of Education, the question was asked by the hon member Sayed.

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

Specialist Mathematics and Science teachers

1. Mr M K Sayed asked the Minister of Education:

Whether she and her Department have conducted a needs analysis to determine the need for specialist Mathematics and Science teachers; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much, Speaker, and to the member for the question. The answer is yes, the WCED is applying a strategy that gathers information on the need for teachers in all subjects which provides the necessary data that we need including for Maths and Science. In addition, for the Further Education and Training Phase, the Department conducted a survey in April this year, during which districts indicated shortages in qualified Mathematics and Physical Science teachers. At the time for Grades 10 to 12 there were 15 teachers needed in Mathematics and 11 in Physical Science and these shortages are addressed

on a case-by-case basis. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister, I have the Chair of the Standing Committee and then followed by – okay, hon Sayed, is he represented by yourself, hon Dugmore? Alright, I will recognise hon Sayed, hon members, followed by hon Botha, in that order. Thank you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, Speaker. I would like to ask the MEC that whether she would agree that in the way that she has answered the question, in a typically evasive way, without giving any detail, whether she is aware that that type of conduct from her has resulted in a huge mass disillusionment with her performance in regard to Education in general and in regard to Maths and Science in particular, so much so that members of her own party are agitating that she be removed. Is she aware that she has become known as the “give us money” MEC, but an MEC who does not look for solutions when even she had money which could have been used for Maths and Science, which was given back to the Treasury she has still failed to place learners. As we speak, they are overcrowded, so in regard to Maths and Science
[Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: You must ask the question. You must ask the question, hon Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I would like to ask, does

her response indicate why she has got this reputation in this province because she is actually destroying education in this province.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): A point of Order.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore. I would like to request hon Dugmore and all the other hon members, when you ask a question, you do not enter into a debate. You have done more of a debate than asking the question and I do not want to create a culture where we get accustomed to that conduct. May I request, there is an hon member in the House, the Minister Mitchell who has a point of order.

The MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND PUBLIC WORKS: Thank you, Speaker. Speaker, I am rising on Rule 59(1) where again hon Dugmore is reflecting on the integrity and dignity of an hon member of this House. That the direct aspersions cast on the hon Minister is a direct, according to my view, he is going against the Standing Rules of Parliament and I want you to rule on it, please. [Interjection.]

Mr P MARRAN: According to your view.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mitchell. Hon members, I am going to request, there is another point of order by the hon, the Chief Whip, she online, the Chief Whip of the majority party.

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Mr Speaker. The hon Dugmore is asking for an opinion which is not permitted by the Rules of this House. I therefore ask that you would rule his question out of order.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Chief Whip. Hon members, I am just going to do the following. I am going to rule on Section 59(1) and (2) but more particularly the subsection 59 (1) (a), (b) and (c), which say:

"No member may impute improper motives or reflect on the integrity or the dignity of or verbally abuse another member.

Then (2):

"A member who wishes to bring an improper or unethical conduct on the part of another member to the attention of the House may do so only by way of a substantive motion comprising of clearly formulated and properly substantiated allegations."

What the hon Dugmore has done is to make a political statement. He did not call for this House to remove the Minister or for the Premier to remove the Minister, nor did he call the Minister anything other than referring to what is now before us a political debate. So it is making it difficult if you were to sit where I am sitting.

It makes it extremely difficult to make a determination and satisfy everyone, so what I am going to do is to rule on the basis of the Standing Rules that we have before us, hon Mitchell and the hon the Chief Whip of

the majority party, I am going to refer on Hansard and to see exactly how the Presiding Officer should be dealing with this matter and I will do so in the next closer opportunity.

I do hope that we make progress in this area because it is raised now for the second time in the same sitting and for that matter I do intend to keep the decorum of this House consistent with the Standing Rules.

Now let us move, now may I request the hon Minister to respond. There is another hand in the online platform, hon Mackenzie. If it is on this matter, which I do not want to pre-empt, but if it does, I have already made a determination unless you want to speak so the hand is for contribution in the question itself.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Speaker, I just had a point of order on another matter that you previously ruled on please.

The SPEAKER: Does your point of order still stand, hon Mackenzie?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Yes please, yes, please, I would like to raise it now.

The SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Speaker, you previously ruled on people

interjecting from the platform and hon Marran has now twice done it. He has done it actually while you are busy making a ruling on quoting hon Minister Mitchell, and I would just like you to be aware of it in case that you did not here. It is now the second time he has done it during this sitting. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Mackenzie, I will monitor that. I have certainly made a strong statement in this area specifically to the hon member in question and I wish that this comes to an end, but I am having to look into it. Thank you, hon Mackenzie. I now recognise the hon Minister of Education.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much, Speaker, and thank you to the Leader of the Opposition. I must say if that is the best you have to offer, then I think we are in a really good place in the upcoming elections. Do I agree? As a fellow lawyer I would have thought that the hon Dugmore could have noticed that the question said, "Did my Department conduct a needs analysis", and I answered, "Yes, we did", and I told him exactly how, so if that is answering in an evasive manner, I do not quite understand that. He clearly was not listening to the answer.

Do I know all the other issues? No, I do not. We have all kinds of methods in our party that if people really want to remove me they can do so at any point in time and the reason we are always asking for money is because the ANC has stolen all of it at the national level which is filtering

down to the other provinces all the time and it is making it extremely difficult for us in Education to continue delivering the excellent work we deliver in the Western Cape with ever-increasing demands with people running away from the ANC Government Eastern Cape because they know they cannot get a proper education there but they can here. So if people know me as asking for money I am very happy about that because we cannot – as you would know – as a former MEC for a brief while, that you cannot deliver education outcomes without money and when you have more and more people coming to the province and less and less money in real terms every year because of the ANC's complete and utter mismanagement of this country's economy and our finances, then it is going to be a refrain that you are continue hearing as long as I am in this office. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I now recognise hon Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you very much, Speaker, and I am following up on the money and Minister, did the Department receive an increase in maths and science conditional grant funding since 2017 up until now in its Annual Budget with the particular reference to the current financial year? Thanks Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Botha. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Speaker, and thank you to

member Botha for the question. Our allocation for the MSG Conditional Grant increased year-on-year from 2019 except for the revised allocation in 2021 because of the school closures as a result of COVID.

In 2019/20 the allocation was R34,4 million which has risen to R36,3 million for the current financial year. In terms of supporting teaching the grant is directed towards teacher training rather than the employment of subject specific educators. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, Hon Minister. Hon, the Leader of the Opposition.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: I thank you, Speaker. As a follow-up question I would like to ask whether the MEC, given the importance of specialist Mathematics and Science teachers particularly at Primary School level, could give us an indication of to what extent the needs analysis is indicating that we in fact may need to acquire the services of teachers from other countries, given for instance the valuable contribution that Zimbabwean teachers are making; does the analysis point to the need to possibly import additional teachers, particularly for primary school learners, who need the subjects and whether she can indicate to us when the needs analysis that she has indicated has been concluded not only to Mathematics and Science teachers but in fact all subjects, when would that be made available to this House through the Standing Committee or otherwise? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Dugmore. The Minister?

The PREMIER: Thank you, Speaker, and thank you for the question. As I mentioned in my response the first time, we do an ongoing analysis but we did a survey particularly in April this year which indicated shortages which have since been addressed. As far as importing skills we are always in need of Maths and Science skills as well as many other subjects but we do not really mind where they come from. We agreed that there are many people from other countries like Zimbabwe who can make a very good contribution.

Unfortunately, the ANC has put measures in place to make it extremely difficult for them to be able to get work permits in South Africa and in fact it is national policy to only allow them in exceptional circumstances which we find most unfortunate. Of course, that does not apply to Cubans who seem to get special access to our country whenever the ANC wishes. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I recognise hon Botha.

Ms L J BOTHA: Thank you very much, Speaker. Speaker, through you to the Minister. Minister, do you believe that temporarily employing Cuban specialists would be a sustainable means of improving Maths and Science teaching? Thanks, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Botha. I recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Speaker, and again, thank you member Botha. No, of course I do not. We have our own excellent specialists in South Africa employed in our province as well in the Western Cape to train our teachers. We also have our own Teacher Training and Leadership Institute whereby we can do so. So important temporary specialists at our costs through a National Government agreement, who then leaves the country taking their skills and support with them, do not make sense at all, and as I said earlier, we also have concerns about why Cubans seem to enjoy preferential treatment when in fact there are people in our neighbouring countries who find it extremely difficult to get work permits. Thank you, Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, that concludes Question Number 1. I now move to Question Number 2 by hon Nkondlo to the hon the Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities, the hon Minister Maynier. I recognise you, sir.

Township economy: struggling stores

2. Ms N D Nkondlo asked the Minister of Finance and Economic Opportunities:

Whether any measures have been put in place to assist those stores

that are struggling to operate and generate profit; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you, Speaker, and thank you to the hon member for the question. We are very proud of the success of our partnership with the private sector... [Interjection.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister, may I draw your attention to your volume on your microphone. It is soft.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you Speaker, I want to just confirm, am I audible?

The SPEAKER: Yes, you are much better now. You may proceed, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you Speaker. Thank you for drawing my attention to that. We are very proud of the success of our partnership with the private sector through the Pick n Pay Market Store Programme. Since starting the programme in 2017 we have helped to open eight market stores across the Western Cape.

Prior to the Market Store conversion 24 people were employed in the respective shops and currently those shops employ 177 people.

Importantly alongside the increase in employment the programme has also increased the cumulative turnover of these stores by more than R6 million from about R1,15 million to R7,87 million.

The success is of course first and foremost due to the model, the sites and the entrepreneurs are identified by Pick n Pay while we assist in unblocking any obstacles and where applicable, for example, access to land and townships. In addition, we provide a grant funding towards the renovation and conversion costs of these stores while Pick n Pay contributes a grant funding which also includes point of sale equipment, trolleys, uniforms, opening stock, et cetera, and the balance of the funding of course is sourced from development loan funders facilitated by Pick n Pay.

The partnership importantly provides independent traders access to Pick n Pay's distribution channel, business systems and management mentorship but the programme is unique in that all the market stores remain 100% independent. The stores of course are fitted with new refrigeration and IT systems and stock and edible and non-edible groceries and of course services like money transfers, ticketing, airtime, data, bill payments are all assisted.

It is important that each staff complement also receives expert training in IT systems, customer service and retailing skills and of course once the stores are up and running there is also ongoing training and mentorship

provided to owners by Pick n Pay, who work closely with store owners on any challenges that they may face.

However, despite our best efforts, and the best efforts of Pick n Pay since the start of the programme one store was unfortunately closed. The decision was not reached lightly and followed numerous attempts and intervention by Pick n Pay, but ultimately the store was closed, and I think it is important to note that prior to reaching this point Pick n Pay assigned two managers to the store to assist the owner in turning around the store to ensure its sustainability.

The management managers had several recommendations to assist the owner in the operations and management of the store. The Department of Economic Development also reached out to the store owner on several occasions to discuss possible ways that we could assist.

Of course this is an unfortunate outcome but the track record of the programme shows that this is the exception rather than the rule and it is clear evidence that this initiative is creating jobs, is supporting skills and development and providing opportunities to entrepreneurs in our townships and this project is a great example of how the public and private sector are working together to grow small businesses and of course create jobs, especially in the township economy in the Western Cape.

Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. I recognise hon member Nkondlo. Immediately after hon member Nkondlo, hon Marais will follow, in that order, and then hon Baartman. I recognise the hon member Nkondlo.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Hon Speaker, firstly before I ask the question, how many opportunities do I have as the initiator of the question to ask?

The SPEAKER: In terms of the Rules you have the first opportunity and if you so wish you indicate by raising your hand or indicate to the Presiding Officer now.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you †Somlomo [Speaker]. Thanks to the Minister for the response and hoping that the Minister would have spent more time on the essence of the question than presenting what I think he decided to speak about what is good about the programme because the question is very pointed. He is asking about those struggling stores, what support has been given to those struggling stores, and I just want to check with the Minister whether he himself or his Department, when last were they there in that store to hear the side of the store owner's view about what has happened beyond what he is saying, which is what Pick n Pay provides him with.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Nkondlo. The hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, hon Speaker. I want to

emphasise that both the Pick n Pay and the Department, as I said in the reply, provide ongoing mentorship and training, but of course that when the stores get into the trouble the assistance is of course then escalated and in the store which I mentioned, I want to emphasise that Pick n Pay did interview the two managers who were allocated to the store over a considerable period of about six months to assist the owner.

In addition, DEDAT has reached out to the store owner to assist, but I do want to assure the member that it goes beyond this. I have made further enquiries and I am advised that in the case of the store to which I believe she is referring, there are now ongoing discussions between Pick n Pay and the store owner to settle the outstanding matters and hopefully those outstanding matters can be settled by the end of the week and certainly to the extent that the Department may be able to play a role, we will certainly stand ready to assist to resolve this outstanding matter. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, I now recognise hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Hon Minister, I want to speak to you about what you are doing to preserve Cape culture in terms of business. You know, we have for decades, centuries occupied the Grand Parade, the Salt River Fish Market, [inaudible.] Elsie's River along the street, there were hawkers selling fruit, vegetables. I can still hear their cries for, †“Lekker vis, lekker lemoene, soveel vir 'n rand.” [Nice fish,

sweet oranges, so much for a Rand.] It was a happy place until first we started killing them by huge shopping centres, where people flock to and they were driven out of business.

Then the supermarket chains, hypermarket chains, took over and killed our butchers, our off-sales, our fruit stalls, our fish markets. They could sell everything. So the small man was destroyed and now with COVID the few that were left get no assistance. The hawkers who shout there with bananas or with apples or with fish and oranges, nobody cares about the ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: What is your ...[Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: ... unemployed. What are you doing for them? What are you doing for the small, Coloured hawker, Minister?

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marais. May I now request the hon Minister to respond.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: We would obviously want to do everything that we can to preserve and support the hawkers and traders to which you refer, and to maintain what you refer to, I think very eloquently, as those happy places.

I am aware, for example, that the City of Cape Town regards and is

reviewing their bylaws in order to look at and examine these measures because they recognise just how important informal traders are to our economy, supporting opportunities and providing income to households.

I would encourage the member to perhaps put a detailed written question to me so that I can provide him with a much more comprehensive reply, but certainly we would want, as a Department, to do everything that we can to support the small businesses, informal traders who occupy the happy places to which he refers in the Western Cape.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. The hon Minister has correctly dealt with the question. I thought the hon member Marais was now introducing other matters which make it difficult for the member in the Executive to respond and I would like to request the hon members when seeking to do a follow-up, please do so in terms of the original question or by means of following up on the responses by the member of the Executive. It makes it easier and it is in line with the Standing Rules. That we are able to hold the Executive to account. Otherwise you must ...[Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: I thank – I thank you, hon Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Otherwise you must put in writing your question to the hon member. Thank you, hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: I thank you, hon Speaker, for indulging me. I realise that I perhaps was offline with the question, but I still thank the Minister for considering it important enough to respond, thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marais, that is assisting a lot, thank you.

Now, hon members, I recognise the hon the Chair of the Committee, hon member Baartman.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Minister given the success of the programme so far throughout the Western Cape, although with the concerns of the one store obviously, whether there are programmes of such a nature that are implemented in other provinces and if so if there are any learnings from those provinces that the Minister could share with us. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Baartman. Perhaps the Minister will be able to respond. I recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: [No audible response.]

The SPEAKER: Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: I am sorry, hon Speaker, I was on mute.

I did want to make the point that the Pick n Pay Market Store Programme we think has been a resounding success in our province, but I do think it is important to note that it is not only implemented in our province.

In fact, the programme commenced, if I am correct, in another province, in Gauteng and while the intervention is often dismissed by members of the Opposition in this province, those reservations do not seem to be shared by the Opposition's counterparts who are in government in Gauteng and in fact I would like to quote Premier David Makhura who in fact referred to the programme and I quote when he said that:

“One of the great stories in the township economy is how this ...”

And he refers to it as a:

“Transformative partnership between Pick n Pay and the Gauteng Enterprise Propeller has supported small business by creating market stores in Gauteng.”

Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, I see there is a whole host of hands that have been lifted online. I can, however, indicate that there is only one opportunity left and I have got, in terms of the line-up, hon member Mackenzie, hon member Nkondlo and hon member

Makamba-Botya and that then suggests that hon member Mackenzie will go first and then the rest of the hands now fall away.

So I am so sorry for that but that is the Rules.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you for the earlier response, hon Minister.

Hon Minister, given that we are dealing obviously with the store and the township and the township economy, what else is the Minister and his Department doing in the township economy? Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Mackenzie. I recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, hon Speaker. As it happened, I was invited to speak in the NCOP on exactly this subject yesterday, on building a self-reliant and vibrant township economy and it was in that debate that I made the point that the township economies are a unique focus of our approach to small business support.

Of course, I traversed the Pick n Pay Market Store Project which I have spoken about at length in my reply to the hon member Nkondlo, but that is not our only intervention in the township economy. Yesterday I referred members of the NCOP to, for example, our Western Cape Entrepreneurship Recognition Awards, which recognised the achievements and potential of

the most inspiring entrepreneurs in the Western Cape and of course those awards have specific categories for township businesses as well as women-owned and youth-owned business, and most importantly they provide recipients not just with prize money, but much more importantly critical access to business support services such as financial, training and mentorship.

I also referred members of the NCOP to our SMME booster fund where we are supporting small business including small businesses in townships across the Western Cape.

We have, for example, the CISA Training Programme which is providing financial literacy and training and business incubation, business skills training, seed funding and business coaching and mentorship to small businesses in Khayelitsha, in Gugulethu, in Mfuleni, in Kayamandi. Beneficiaries like the Fix Forward are providing business training workshops for example and mentoring are to trade contractors in Gugulethu and Langa and Philippi, and of course the South African Education Project is providing training and mentorship and financial management and regulatory compliance advice to 15 Early Childhood businesses in Mitchells Plain, in Philippi and of course in Philippi East.

I went on to talk about what we had done in the township economy during COVID-19. Assisting informal traders and spaza shop owners to access funding assisting businesses to pivot and adapt to manufacturer PPE and

provide COVID-19-related services through our COVID-19 supplier development programme and of course providing 11,000 COVID-19 safety kits to small businesses and informal traders across the 30 municipalities in the Western Cape.

I also talked about our very innovative intervention in the township economy where the Community Economic Recovery Project was supporting local spaza shops through the provision of digital vouchers for food relief and community kitchens and of course those digital vouchers were provided to 225 community kitchen which were then spent at 122 participating spaza shops and injected over R3 million into the local township economy in the Western Cape.

Of course I also talked about the work that we are doing to support municipalities, supporting the development, for example, of the Cape Agulhas Municipality Trading Hub; the Laingsburg Municipality Trading Hub and of course the Skoonvlei Business Hub; all supporting small businesses, and of course I also drew members' attention to the Khayelitsha Bandwidth Barn, which is, as members know, a very successful partnership between the City of Cape Town and the Province and others right in the heart of Khayelitsha, and these are just a few of the measures that we are taking to support the township economy in the Western Cape. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, that concludes this

particular question.

We now move to Question Number 4. Question Number 3 was withdrawn and therefore the question at hand now is by hon member Van der Westhuizen to the hon Minister of Agriculture. I now recognise the hon Minister Meyer.

[Question 3 withdrawn]

Distribution of drought relief

4. Mr A P van der Westhuizen asked the Minister of Agriculture:

What are the processes or procedures followed by his Department to ensure that drought relief is distributed fairly and to those who need it most?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you to the hon member Van der Westhuizen for this question.

†Die Wes-Kaap se Departement van Landbou ondersteun veeboere met voer en weens die beperkte beskikbare befondsing ondersteun die Departement slegs veeboere wat in kritieke en uiters kritieke gebiede is volgens die Departement se jaarlikse veld-assesseringskriteria.

Tweejaarlikse ramp-assesserings word onderneem om onder meer die huidige status van die heersende droogte te bepaal deur die assessering van die natuurlike veldtoestande. Natuurlike veldtoestande is 'n goeie aanduiding van gebiede wat nog steeds deur droogte geteister is, so ons gebruik daardie veldsassessment as die maatstaf om te bepaal watter gebiede droogtehulp moet kry.

Die mees onlangse tweejaarlikse assessering is vanaf 2 tot 5 Maart 2021 uitgevoer en hierdie evaluerings het bevestig dat die hele Sentraal-Karoo, dele van die Tuinroete, Overberg en noordelike gebiede van die Weskus Distrik steeds in die greep van 'n erge droogte is.

Die hoeveelheid steun wat aan boere verleen word is gebaseer op die aantal grootvee-eenhede op elke plaas. Elke aansoek word op distriks- en op hoofkantoorvlak beoordeel en geëvalueer. Elke kwalifiserende boer ontvang dan ook 'n voerbewys vir vee wat afgelos kan word by die naaste koöperasie wat dan op die databasis van die projekbestuursidentiteit geregistreer is en die Departement volg elke bewys op vanaf die tyd dat dit aan die boere uitbetaal is totdat die koöperasie betaal is. So ons werk via die plaaslike koöperasie wat dan op ons databasis geregistreer is.

Die Departement volg dan ook dan die standaard bedryfsprosedure vir droogtevoer wat dan 'n regverdigte aankoopproses verseker vir alle boere wat in uifers kritieke of selfs kritiek droë gebiede geleë is.

Agbare Speaker, tot op hede het hierdie kritieke en uiters kritieke gebiede korttermyn voerverligting ontvang, maar moet verdere voerverligting ook voorsien word. 'n Ander beoordeling sal in September 2021 gedoen word om die toestand van die veld vas te stel en op grond van die veldherstel sal die ondersteuning dan aan die boere dienooreenkomstig aangepas word.

Die implikasie daarvan is dat sekere gebiede het intussen ook goeie reën ontvang en daarom word daar ook weer 'n herevaluering gedoen ten einde die nodige ondersteuning vir die boere dienooreenkomstig aan te pas.

So baie dankie, agbare Speaker.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The Western Cape Department of Agriculture supports stock-farmers with fodder and because of the limited available funding the Department supports only stock-farmers in critical and ultra-critical areas according to the Department's annual veld assessment criteria.

Two-yearly disaster assessments are undertaken to, amongst other things, determine the current status of the existing drought by assessing the natural veld conditions. Natural veld conditions are a good indicator of areas that are still being plagued by drought, so we use that veld assessment as the guide to determine which areas should receive drought relief.

The most recent two-yearly assessment was conducted from 2 to 5 March 2021 and these evaluations confirmed that the whole of the Central Karoo, parts of the Garden Route, Overberg and northern parts of the West Coast District are still in the grip of a severe drought.

The amount of support provided to the farmers is based upon the number of stock units on each farm. Each application is judged and evaluated at a district and head office level. Every qualifying farmer then receives a fodder voucher for stock that can be traded at the nearest co-op which is then registered on the data base of the project management identity, and the Department follows up each voucher from the time that it has been paid out to the farmers until the co-op has been paid. So we work via the local co-op which is then registered on our data base.

The Department then also follows the standard industry procedure for drought fodder which then ensures a fair purchase process for all farmers who are based in ultra-critical or even critical dry areas.

Hon Speaker, to date these critical and ultra-critical areas have received short term fodder relief, but further fodder relief must also be provided. Another assessment will be done in September 2021 to determine the condition of the veld and on the basis of the veld recovery the support to the farmers will be adjusted accordingly.

The implication thereof is that certain areas have in the meantime also

received good rains and therefore a re-evaluation is again done in order to adjust the necessary support to the farmers accordingly.

So thank you, hon Speaker.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, I recognise hon member Van der Westhuizen. Ahead of doing that we have the hon member Marais and hon member Marran as the next speakers.

I recognise you, hon member Van der Westhuizen.

†Mnr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Agbare Speaker, deur u aan Minister Meyer.

Alle voorspellings is dat die huidige goeie reënvaljaar vorentoe weer deur erge droogtes gevolg sal word en ons weet ook dat die beste droogteverligtingsmaatreël is om genoeg water te stoor in jare soos hierdie vir daardie jare waar die reënval weer onder die gemiddeld sal wees.

Nou die Minister van Openbare Werke, mev Patricia de Lille, het vroeër hierdie week die Clanwilliamdam Projek besoek en weereens beloof dat ons binnekort vordering sal sien in hierdie projek wat [Onhoorbaar.] weer tot stilstand gekom het.

Dit volg op Minister Nkwinti se loodsing van die projek in 2008 nadat dit 'n

vorige keer ook alreeds tot stilstand gekom het. So ons sien hierdie soort van beloftes voor elke verkiesing.

Ons het ook gesien dat daar beloftes was vroeër vanjaar van ANC-vertegenwoordigers dat daar honderde plaaslike werksgeleenthede deur hierdie projek geskep sou word. Veral was hierdie beloftes gemaak toe die Cederberg Munisipaliteit verwag het dat daar 'n tussenverkiesing sal wees.

Nou my vraag deur u, agb Speaker, aan Minister Meyer is in die lig van die gedrag wat ons tot dusver gesien het, kan u vir ons verseker dat u en u Departement nie die posisie van desperate arm en werklose mense sal gebruik, veral in hierdie droogtetyd en droogte-areas, deur leë beloftes te maak nie en veral om stemme te wen voor die komende munisipale verkiesings nie en dat droogtehulp deur u Departement aan almal beskikbaar gestel sal word wat daarvoor kwalifiseer, ongeag hulle politieke ondersteuning van u party?

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Hon Speaker, through you to Minister Meyer.

All forecasts are that the current good rain-season will in future again be followed by severe droughts and we also know that the best drought relief measure is to store enough water in years like this for those years where the

rainfall is going to be below average.

Now the Minister of Public Works, Ms Patricia de Lille, earlier this week visited the Clanwilliam Dam Project and again promised that we will soon see progress in this project that [Inaudible.] came to a standstill again.

It follows on Minister Nkwinti's launch of the project in 2008 after it previously also had come to a standstill. So we see these types of promises prior to every election.

We also saw earlier this year that there were promises from ANC representatives that hundreds of local jobs will be created by this project. These promises were especially made when the Cederberg Municipality expected that there was going to be a by-election.

Now my question through you, hon Speaker, to Minister Meyer is, in the light of the conduct we have seen so far, can you assure us that you and your Department will not exploit the position of desperate poor and jobless drought areas, by making empty promises and especially to win votes before the coming municipal elections and that drought relief will be made available by your Department to all qualifying for it, irrespective of their political support of your party?]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Van der Westhuizen. I now recognise the hon Minister.

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Baie dankie, agb Speaker, en dankie aan agb lid Van der Westhuizen.

Ons weet dat water is 'n basiese reg, dit is 'n konstitusionele reg en word beskerm in die Grondwet en ek dink dit sal 'n gruwelike nalatigheid wees om water en watergebruik te misbruik vir politieke goedkoop doeleindes, en ek kan u die versekering gee dat my Departement sal geensins deelneem aan goedkoop politieke aktiwiteite nie en ek sal my werk doen binne die raamwerk van die Grondwet soos voorgeskryf.

Ek het ook soos my kollegas en uself in hierdie Wetgewer, 'n ampseed geneem om seker te maak dat ons doelwitte, ons aktiwiteite en ons projekte en ons programme sal voldoen aan die beginsels van billikheid en redelikheid.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you to the hon member Van der Westhuizen.

We know that water is a basic right, it is a constitutional right and is protected in the Constitution and I think it will be a gross neglect to abuse water and water use for cheap political purposes, and I can assure you that my Department will in no way participate in cheap political activities and I will do my work within the framework of the Constitution as prescribed.

I have also, like my colleagues and yourself in this Legislature, took an oath to ensure that our goals, our activities and our projects will adhere to the principles of fairness and reasonableness.]

But since the hon member referred specifically now to the raising of the Clanwilliam Dam, I think this is very important, hon Speaker. Just yesterday I had a meeting with the stakeholders in agriculture and one of the stakeholder organisations did present to us what they call the drivers for agriculture, and they mentioned four things:

1. Energy provision;
2. Infrastructure;
3. Safety; and
4. Water.

Now all of these, hon Speaker and hon members, all of these functions are competents of the National Government Department, but we are now beyond blaming the National Government because energy is Eskom, infrastructure is the National Department of Public Works and Water Affairs. Safety is the responsibility of the National Government; water is from Water and Safety Affairs.

The Premier has asked us to apply the principle of resilience and so working together with the various departments and the municipalities we will continue to make sure that we deliver what is within our mandate, but

it is disappointing that the proposed raising of the Clanwilliam Dam by the Department at the time of Human Settlements and Water and Sanitation, that they will significantly yield, if it properly managed, 70 million cubic water per annum and 70% of the additional water is earmarked, hon Speaker, for resource, poor farmer development and the balance to improve the water supply to existing water allocations.

Now raising the Clanwilliam Dam wall will have significant benefits. The capacity of the dam is being roughly doubled, there will be additional 5,500 hectare of irrigated land and there will be an additional 3,800 jobs.

So if this project is properly managed, everybody can collectively benefit in that particular area.

Now my Department is also involved in the studies because we provided valuable input into the bridging study to determine whether the water should be used and the infrastructure required to determine the water to the farm boundaries, for example, we have made [Inaudible.] available, hon Speaker, for LORWUA which is the Lower Olifants River Water Use Association.

We supported them with R5,8 million to conduct preventative maintenance and if anybody now travelling in that particular area, you would have seen there are some preventative maintenance work taking place in the canal. For us that is very, very important.

I think it is sad, it should have been completed already, but the incompetence, the bankrupt, mismanaged National Department of Water and Sanitation has caused numerous delays and, hon Speaker, former Minister Nkwinti, since hon member Van der Westhuizen has now referred to former Minister Nkwinti, he and former Minister Mokonyane and their successors were complete disasters in the Department of Water and Sanitation and Minister Lindiwe Sisulu was equally not fit for purpose to manage a critical resource like water and we know that one of the key drivers of economic growth specifically in the West Coast region, specifically in the agricultural region there in the area of Matzikama and Citrusdal, is the issue of the water security and it seems to me that the current Minister of Water and Sanitation is missing in action and that is why the National Minister of Public Works had to go to Clanwilliam during the course of the week. She went there because the current Minister was missing in action, and we know that the current Minister of Water and Sanitation, Minister Senzo Mchunu, he has failed to manage the wage bill of the Government and now he has been given another important assignment and that is to manage water and sanitation, and he was again missing in action and the National Minister of Public Works had to go and do oversight over his projects.

So I am certainly disappointed, but the Premier has taken this matter up with the National Government because certainly this is an important matter.

My colleague, the Minister of Local Government and Environmental Affairs, is in continuous contact with the National Department in this particular regard because there are massive spinoffs if this Clanwilliam Dam's wall is raised.

So I am disappointed but determined and confident that we will be able through our various structures to get this project back on track, even if the Premier has to raise it at the PCC, the President Coordinating Council. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, I now recognise the hon member Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Speaker. Minister, something in what you said drew my attention. You mentioned that, †“Ons werk deur die plaaslike koöperasies,” en dan het u ook gesê, [“We work through the local co-ops,” and then you also said,] “We give help to those who need it most.”

Now that is something that needs re-examination. Do all emerging farmers belong to the cooperatives? Certainly not. So how are they consulted?

The cooperative mostly belongs to white commercial farmers, that is a fact, I have got nothing against it, but if you only work through those who are registered and you work through the local cooperatives it means a

small farmer who is not part of the cooperative because he is not into commercial farming yet - what happens to him?

And what happens also to the issue of who needs it most? Obviously a farmer with 1,000 cattle compared to a small farmer with only 100 cattle, who are you going to say who needs it most? Who is going to get the most water and the most feed?

It is like saying this woman has five big children and the other one only has one child. So the one with the five children needs it most so the other one get nothing almost because she has got one child. How are you going to get ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: The question, hon member?

Mr P J MARAIS: ... equitable distribution ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: [Inaudible.]

Mr P J MARAIS: ... of assistance?

The SPEAKER: [Inaudible.] may I request that you stick to the question.

Mr P J MARAIS: That is the question.

The SPEAKER: Alright. Thank you, hon member ...[Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: To ensure the drought relief is distributed fairly. That is the question, hon Speaker. I ask if it is fairly distributed, if you must decide between giving the small farmer with [Interjections.] 50 cattle and assistance to ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: Hon ...[Interjections.]

Mr P J MARAIS: ... one with 1,000 cattle.

The SPEAKER: Hon member Marais, what I am saying is that I wanted you to ask the question but not to enter into a debate at this point. So you have asked the question. I did not want you to motivate the question.

So – because that are the Rules and I thank you that you have done that. Now the hon Minister is ready to respond.

†Die MINISTER VAN LANDBOU: Baie dankie aan agb lid Marais, ek waardeer die vraag. Dit is 'n baie relevante vraag.

Agb lid Marais, ons gebruik een belangrikste kriteria, dit is die veld-assessering. Dit is vir ons belangrik ongeag of jy 10 skape het en of jy 'n 100 skape het dit is vir ons belangrik dat ons kyk na die veldkondisies en ook baie belangrik ons kyk ook na die veld, die grootte van die veld en die

drakrag van die veld. Met ander woorde as ons die veld-assessering gedoen het sal ons dan vir die boer sê, “Gegewe jou veld-omstandighede, dit is die maksimum skape wat jy mag aanhou op hierdie terrein,” en ons veld-assessering sal dan ook bepaal hoeveel hulp u sal kry ten opsigte van veevoer.

Dit baat nie ons sê vir die boer, “Jou veld-assessering is van so ’n aard dat jy net 50 skape mag aanhou,” en dan kom ons daar dan het jy ’n 1,000 skape. In daardie gevalle penaliseer ons daardie boere want hulle mag nie ’n 1,000 skape aanhou as die veldkrag of soos ons praat die drakrag van die veld net sê 50 skape kan aanhou nie, dan sal ons vir die 50 skape veevoer gee, maar jy moet baie versigtig wees ons gaan nie vir mense ’n 1,000 skape se veevoer gee nie want volgens jou drakrag sê die veld-assessering jy kan net 50 skape aanhou. So dit is belangrik die drakrag van die veld gebaseer op die veld-assessering.

Agb lid Marais, ek dink u vra ’n geldige vraag want ons moet altyd billik en redelik optree en ook teenoor kleinboere.

Wanneer ’n mens by ’n koöperasie [Onhoorbaar.] baie boere gebruik maar die koöperasie. Kleinboere, kommersiële boere, enige persoon. U kan ook by ’n koöperasie soos uself weet instap. Wat ons doen by die koöperasie is daar word nie gediskrimineer nie. Boere het gewoonlik twee rekeninge.

’n Bedryfsrekening met enige ou wat enige iets wat hy aankoop vir sy plaas

gaan na die koöperasie en hy koop dit op sy eie, maar wanneer hy droogtehulp kry, agb lid Marais, dan open ons vir hom 'n tweede rekening by die koöperasie en daai rekening se naam is “Droogtehulp”. Kleinboere ontvang dan 'n koopbrief van my Departement en op die koopbrief sal daar staan 300 of 400 sakke veevoer.

So hy kan nie by die koöperasie kom en besluit, “Jong, wag ek is lus nou vir 'n dop brandewyn nie.” Dit gaan nie werk nie. As hy by die koöperasie kom, ons gee hom dan 'n brief en hy neem dit vir die koöperasie. Dit word dan, kom ons sê die boer kry R10,000 of R20,000 se veevoerhulp, dan kry hy 'n brief en hy neem dit, ons open 'n spesiale rekening by die koöperasie en hy neem dan die brief na die koöperasie toe en hy sê vir die koöperasie, “Man, ek soek so R2,000 se veevoer,” dan word dit van daai R20,000 afgetrek, dan het hy nog R18,000 by die koöperasie, en so kan hy aangaan.

So 'n kleinboer, kommersiële boer, ongeag waar, hulle word almal op daardie basis gehelp. So daar is geen diskriminasie nie, almal word baie mooi gehelp. Ek was self by kleinboere daar in Namakwaland, ek het self gaan kyk, self die veevoer van 'n bakkie afgelaai op hulle bakkies. So dit gaan vir ons oor die veevoer.

So daar word twee rekeninge geopen om seker te maak dat daar – en daar word ook maandeliks rekonsiliasie gedoen sodat ons kan weet hoeveel van die kleinboere het vee gekoop en my Departement se amptenare gaan ook uit om te kyk of die boere dan ook gevestig is, hoe doen hulle vee, hulle

veepunte, dat die diere darem gesond is, ensovoorts.

So daardie program is in werking en dit werk baie oulik en ek dink al die boere verstaan hoe die koopbriefstelsel werk en ek nog geen klagtes ontvang nie, en hier en daar is sommige boere maar stout, maar oor die algemeen werk dit baie positief en is daar geen diskriminasie nie.

U vraag van billikheid en redelikheid,

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you to the hon member Marais, I appreciate the question. It is a very relevant question.

Hon member Marais, we use one important criterion, that is the veld assessment. It is important to us whether you have 10 sheep or you have 100 sheep, it is important to us that we look at veld conditions and also very importantly, we look at the veld, the size of the veld and the growth capacity of the veld. In other words, when we have done the veld assessment we will then say to the farmer, "Given your veld conditions, this is the maximum number of sheep you may keep on this terrain," and our veld assessment will then also determine how much aid you will receive with regard to fodder.

It does not work if we say to the farmer, "Your veld assessment is of such

nature that you can only keep 50 sheep,” and then we get there and he has 1,000 sheep. In those cases we penalise those farmers because they may not keep 1,000 sheep if the veld capacity, or as we say growth capacity, of the veld can only say allow 50 sheep, then we will provide fodder for 50 sheep, but you have to be very cautious, we will not provide fodder to 1,000 sheep to people, because your growth capacity, the veld assessment indicates that you can only keep 50 sheep. So it is important, this growth capacity of the veld based on the veld assessment.

Hon member Marais, I think you are asking a legitimate question because we should always act fairly and reasonably also towards the small farmers.

When you at a co-op [Inaudible.] many farmers use the co-op. Small farmers, commercial farmers, any person. You can also walk into a co-op, as you know. What we do at the co-op, we do not discriminate. Farmers usually have two accounts.

A trade account, with any one who buys anything for his farm, he goes to the co-op and he buys it on his own, but when he receives drought relief, hon member Marais, then we open a second account for him at the co-op and that account's name is “Drought Relief”. Small farmers then receive a voucher from my Department and on the voucher it will say 300 or 400 bags of fodder.

So he cannot go to the co-op and then decide, “Man, wait, I would love a

tot of brandy.” That will not work. When he gets to the co-op, we give him the voucher and he takes it to the co-op. That then becomes, let’s say the farmer receives R10,000 or R20,000 worth of fodder, then he gets the voucher and takes it to the co-op, we open a special account at the co-op and he takes the voucher to the co-op, and he says to the co-op, “Man, I want R2,000 worth of fodder,” then it is deducted from that R20,000, then he still has R18,000 left, and so he can carry on.

So a small farmer, commercial farmer, irrespective where, they are all supported on that basis. So there is no discrimination, everyone is assisted very well. I have personally been to small farmers there in Namaqualand, I went to look for myself, offloaded the fodder from a bakkie and onto their bakkies. So to us it is about the fodder.

So two accounts are opened to ensure that there – and monthly reconciliation is done so that we can know how many of the small farmers have bought stock and my Department’s officials go out to see if the farmers are settled, how their stock are doing, their stock posts, that the animals at least are healthy, and so on.

So that programme is in operation and it works very well and I think all the farmers understand how the voucher system works and I have received no complaints, and here and there some farmers are naughty, but in general it is very positive and there is no discrimination.

Your question of fairness and reasonableness,] fairness and reasonableness is applied in the allocation of drought support.

I love your grandchild there in the background ...[intervenes]

Mr P J MARAIS: Oh, she just ...[intervenes]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: ... former Premier.

Mr P J MARAIS: [Laughing.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Waiting for your wife?

Mr P J MARAIS: She just landed here now. [Laughs] Thank you, Minister, thank you for answering my question in a manner that I expect of you.

The SPEAKER: [Laughs] Hon member Marais. No, we will miss you when you are no longer in this Chamber. That is the privilege of being a veteran. You see, I have to comply otherwise I am in trouble, but thank you, hon member Marais.

Hon Minister, thank you. We have the last opportunity by hon member Marran. Given the time limit I will not take anyone beyond that, it is going to be hon member Marran and then the hon Minister will respond.

Mr P MARRAN: Thanks, hon Speaker. Hon Speaker, I just heard that the hon member Van der Westhuizen is planning the success of the ANC within the West Coast Region on the Clanwilliam Dam because since 2016 the West Coast Region and specifically ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: What is your question ...[Interjections.]

Mr P MARRAN: ... the Cederberg [Inaudible.] municipalities. Hon Speaker ...[Interjections.]

The SPEAKER: What is your question, hon member Marran?

Mr P MARRAN: My question is, hon Speaker, †gepraat van die Clanwilliamdam en die droogte, die Premier het in 2019 belowe dat sy regering nie vir een oomblik sal twyfel om die Provinsie se geld te spandeer as dit kom by water nie, die Brandvleidam spesifiek, maar daai R20 miljoen wat daar was het toe intussentyd verdwyn, hy het toe weer verskyn, hy het toe weer verdwyn. So dit is leë beloftes, agb Speaker.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[Speaking of the Clanwilliam Dam and the drought, the Premier in 2019 promised that his Government will not hesitate for a moment to spend the Province's money when it comes to water, the Brandvlei Dam specifically, but that R20 million that there was then disappeared in the meantime, and

then appeared again, and disappeared again. So these are empty promises, hon Speaker.]

Hon Speaker, can this MEC tell us whether it is true that his Department, except the cooperations that he has mentioned, that his Department is using third parties to manage and to pay emergency relief especially when it comes to drought, to farmers and if true, what cut do these consultants take as a commission before even one beneficiary is paid? Thanks.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marran. I now recognise the hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Speaker, and thank you, good afternoon to my good friend, hon member Marran, and thank you for your concern about the dam and the water security.

Yes, I think you would have heard in my answer because your question was also related, your questions have multiple angles, one of the angles is what have we done in terms of our funding in terms of water security.

As I indicated very important work that took place recently is in the area of the maintenance on the canal through the Lower Olifants River Water User Association (LORWUA). R5,8 million was made available. You would also recall that I did announce this in my main budget in the beginning of the year.

Yes, I agree hon member and thank you for raising it again, I think it is important the issue of the R20 million. I was at the time the Minister of Finance where we approved the R20 million and due to some issues that were involved the Department of Water and Sanitation have made some promises to me that they will start with the construction work, they have promised me that they have completed the architectural designs. I have personally met a young architect from Bellville Water Affairs at Brandvlei Dam in the area of Breede Valley Municipality together with the Mayor of Breede Valley Municipality to personally observe what is the holdup.

I was then also informed that this must happen before the rain season, in other words round about October, that was two years ago, but it seems that there was just one or other continuous stumbling block in this particular regard. Ja, and I think we are still dealing with that particular matter.

I think hon member Marran will also have noticed because he is from that particular area there in the Breede Valley area, he would have appreciated that we have completed and I have recently launched a R78 million ecological infrastructure project that was destroyed as a result of major floods near Holvlei in Rawsonville and so that project is now handed over to the Water Use Association so many more water can go into the Brandvlei Dam.

Yes, so there are some further work that needs to happen in terms of the context of water security, but I can assure that my colleague, the Minister of Local Government and Environmental Affairs is also in continuous

contact with the Department of Water Affairs, I am in continuous contact with them through our disaster management and so through our land care programme continuously working no matter how complex the situation is, no matter how difficult it is, we are trying to make sure that we ensure greater water security.

We are very thankful that in the recent past we had quite a lot of rain and we are expecting record harvest seasons. The Minister of Local Government has released a statement recently that our dams are now 101,6% full of water so we are very thankful for the good rains, but there are certain parts there where we still need some rain.

Lastly, hon Speaker, hon member Marran asked about third parties and consultants. Well, I will have to come back in terms of that particular answer, but what is happening there are multiple roleplayers involved in drought assessment. Firstly, there is the Provincial Department of Agriculture, there is the National Department of Agriculture, there is the Provincial Disaster Management Centre, there is the National Disaster Management Centre, there are the co-ops, there are the current role-players and we do use the co-ops, a medium through which we channel the funding for drought support. That is certainly the case and everything there is above board.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Minister. Hon members, that concludes the debate on the questions. That conclude the replies on the questions and the

question itself and we have also exhausted the time for Questions for Oral Reply.

We now move to Questions to the Premier without Notice and that is in terms of Rule 204. The hon members that have expressed interest to ask questions to the Premier, it is hon member Marran, it is hon member Botha, hon member Wenger, hon member Herron, hon member Makamba-Botya, hon member Windvogel and hon member Christians.

I now recognise the hon member Marran.

QUESTIONS TO THE PREMIER WITHOUT NOTICE

†Mnr P MARRAN: Agb Speaker, dankie. My vraag gaan in Afrikaans wees.

Agb Speaker, kan die Wes-Kaap se Premier vir ons vertel hoekom hy so vasberade is om die verkope van drank aan te help en te herstel te midde van 'n wêreldsiekte en talle probleme soos fetale alkoholsindroom en laer intelligensie, drankmisbruik wat talle ander euwels aanjaag soos gesinsgeweld, messtekery, ongelukke wat allerlei beserings aanhelp, waar onafhanklikheid hoog is en duur om te behandel.

Die gevolge van die apartheidsdopstelsel is nog sigbaar en nog met ons en onder meer hewige suikersiektes weens goedkoop soet rantsoenwyn wat veral aan plaasmense verkoop word en selfs laerskoolkinders drank skool

toe vat en drank nou op die skole se geleentheid verkoop kan word.
Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr P MARRAN: Hon Speaker, thank you. My question is going to be in Afrikaans.

Hon Speaker, can the Western Cape Premier tell us why he is so determined to assist and recover the sales of liquor in the midst of a world illness and numerous problems such as foetal alcohol syndrome and lower intelligence, liquor abuse that aggravates many other evils such as family violence, stabbing, accidents that lead to all kinds of injuries, where independence is high and is expensive to treat.

The consequences of the apartheid dop system is still visible and with us and amongst other things, serious diabetes as a result of cheap sweet ration wine that is sold especially to farm workers, and even primary school children take liquor to school and liquor can now be sold at the schools' events. Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Marran. I now recognise the hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker, and thank you very much to the hon member Marran for that question.

†Ek is baie dankbaar dat u nou hierop fokus met jou vraag. Ek dink dit was 'n gedeelte van die gesprek verlede week ook saam met die Leier van die Opposisie en ek is baie bly dat veral die ANC in die Huis hierdie punt veral opneem. Ek dink dit is baie, baie belangrik.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraph follows.]

[I am very grateful that you now focus on this with your question. I think it was part of the discussion last week also with the Leader of the Opposition and I am especially pleased that the ANC in the House takes up this issue. I think it is very, very important.]

I want to say initially that of course we have for years now had a number of interventions and we have gone through a number of processes specifically trying to find that balance in the space of alcohol abuse and of course the space where the alcohol industry specifically, and where the hon member Marran also is in support of the rural economy, rural jobs, on farms, specifically the wine industry, etcetera, and you have got to always be looking at a balance, but of course part of this question, †dit is oor wat is die gevolge van miskien ons witskrifte, die werk wat ons doen as regering om van ons mense te beskerm asook deur wetgewing en die wetgewing-verandering, [it is about what are the consequences of perhaps our White Papers, the work we do as Government to protect our people as well as through legislation and the change of legislation,] and I think as I said last week in June already we signed off as a Cabinet for the next

phase of an amendment to our Liquor Bill, and so of course we must have a look at how we can use regulation and how we find that balance through regulation on the one side, but also engagement, I think with the industry itself.

I also think that the industry also needs to take a lot more responsibility. I quite often liken - and especially when we look at the systems that we have got in place here like our trauma system in our hospitals, which we are now rolling out more and more. We are almost at 20 of our hospitals that will have that trauma measurement system where we can actually see the consequences of the abuse of alcohol.

Now I always liken this to the motor vehicle industry to say how many people, or the motor vehicle industry takes responsibility for the safety of their drivers, their customers, people who utilise their product and then they even come out like manufacturers saying, "This is the safest vehicle on the market and these are what we do about making a vehicle safer, etcetera, and we need to also say to the industry understand where damage is done, what are we doing about it there because it cannot only be around regulation, but it also cannot only be Government and the industry it has also got to be our citizens. Our citizens, our public reps in this House, everyone has got to be playing a role here because it is also about behaviour change and about the person. Remember we changed car accidents to car crashes because somebody behind that wheel caused the crash, or somebody caused that vehicle to crash and did something, that

driver had to do something, and there was a crash.

So there was a cause and here with alcohol there is also a cause and that is citizens that are not able to utilise this product responsibly and of course that results in a whole lot of issues.

So behaviour change is also critical and that is also a key partner in trying to get this system right.

So, hon Speaker, it is about the regulation, it is about the industry and it is also about citizens, but what does concern me about the question from the hon member, and I mean I have been in this House for many years and I have had this debate for many years at one stage. I am the Premier now, I have the responsibility [Inaudible.] also had the key responsibility when the Liquor Authority vested with me as the MEC responsible then, and time after time after time I get this response that I heard today and the question about the *dopstelsel*. I really want to say and I am sure I have said to the hon member Marran before please, number one, can you give me the detail? But I presume the detail that you are going to give me is going to be a docket number or a charge number because it is illegal and if you have got – and especially as a member of this House if you have got information that there is a *dopstelsel* system running here and you have not laid that charge, you are just as culpable.

So do not make the statement here without backing it up. You need to

please lay that charge with the police. Give me the information, we will follow it up, we will make sure that we find convictions because it is absolutely illegal and please I want to make sure, †ek wil seker maak, agb lid, dat u hierdie boodskap moet duidelik kry. As u hierdie informasie het, asseblief, ek soek daai klagstaat. [I want to make sure, hon member, that you must get this message clearly. If you have this information, please, I'm looking for that charge sheet.] We must lay this charge, it is illegal.

I want to say the same thing around †laerskoolkinders wat drank misbruik [primary school children abusing alcohol.] That is also absolutely illegal. If you are aware of it, please we need to know the school, the children, where they go to school, where they live, etcetera. Let us have a look at that. Of course, this is even more complex than the first case you mentioned, but we need to go in and have a look. We need to get Social Development involved, we can lay charges against parents. We need to make sure we deal with this.

So if you have got information on both of these issues that you have raised, please, I would expect to get that information, names, places, times and also at the same time the charges that you have laid specifically because you are aware of this illegal activity. †Baie dankie, agb Speaker. [Thank you, hon Speaker.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. I now give an opportunity for a first follow-up to hon member Marran if you so wish.

†Mnr P MARRAN: Ag Speaker, ja, baie dankie. Om te luister is 'n *skill*. Wat ek gesê het is die gevolge van die apartheiddopstelsel wat nog steeds sigbaar is in ons gemeenskappe. Ek hoop ek antwoord die Premier in terme van daai ene.

Agb Speaker, die tweede vraag – agb Speaker, kan die agb *speaker* vir ons byvoorbeeld – en hy het gepraat van *finding the balance between saving livelihoods and saving lives*. Kan die Premier vir ons sê of hy al by 'n hospitaal se noodafdeling was en gesien het hoe lewens van slagoffers van drankgeweld met moeite gered word terwyl dit 'n groot las op die staatskas van die provinsie is? Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Mr P MARRAN: Hon Speaker, yes, thank you. To listen is a skill. What I said are the consequences of the apartheid dop system that is still visible in our communities. I hope I'm answering the Premier in terms of that one.

Hon Speaker, the second question – hon Speaker, can the hon speaker tell us for example – and he spoke about finding the balance between saving livelihoods and saving lives. Can the Premier tell us if he had been to the emergency section of a hospital and saw how lives of victims of liquor-related violence are saved with great effort while it places a great burden on the state coffers of the Province? Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marran. I recognise the hon Premier.

The PREMIER: Thank you very much, hon Speaker. Thank you very much for the follow-up hon member.

I think first of all yes, maybe just your point on that first follow-up and of course I think one of the biggest consequences is foetal alcohol syndrome. It is a massive problem in our province also in our country and again that is an area that we need to be continually focusing on. Foetal alcohol syndrome sets up a young person to fail in the future. When that child is born, we know that that child is disadvantaged from the get-go because foetal alcohol syndrome has severe consequences from a brain damage point of view and of course it is very difficult because how do you know when someone is pregnant? And you actually want that responsibility to be held by the citizen, that individual pregnant mother to be able to know that they are pregnant, and they are not going to drink excessively. They are not going to drink actually, we should make sure that that happens. That moms to be do not take alcohol during the pregnancy because they do disadvantage their child. That is just one. I mean there are a whole lot of them, absolutely, and I agree with the hon member.

Then with regard to his question on whether I have been to these units. Absolutely, and exactly in the last month I have visited Mitchells Plain, Khayelitsha, Drakenstein Hospital and – where else was I? Somewhere up

the West Coast I visited a hospital, but I have been visiting hospitals wherever I go. I visit a hospital when I go and specifically the questions are asked not necessarily about COVID-19, although that is the main issue that most of our hospitals are dealing with and to engage with the frontline workers and thank them, but I always focus on two other things.

The one is trauma which is what the hon member speaks about, I will come back to that, and then of course it is also about mental well-being. I also make sure that we ask questions about mental well-being and maybe I can say here to the hon members of this House when it comes to a question that we are busy dealing with at the moment around who gets dropped off at our hospitals when it comes to our psych wards. They are totally overburdened, we know that mental wellness is a big issue in our province at the moment, but our psych wards are also being abused by the policing system where it is much easier to drop off someone who is perhaps on drugs or perhaps inebriated. They are criminals, they are known, they are probably a multiple offender and instead of doing the paperwork you drop them off at the hospital for observation, and we have got to look at these kind of issues and that is what helps when you go and visit yourself because of course the Health Department themselves are also busy dealing with all of these issues, but on that question of our trauma.

I mean we are the only province in South Africa that measures that trauma that he speaks about in our hospitals. We measure it and we measure it according to all cases of trauma, but obviously if there is alcohol-related

trauma that is also a part of that measurement tool, so we can tell you how many cases, where it happens, what time it happens, and in actual fact even in our violence prevention programmes now we are actually looking at how we deepen that data so that it is not only about this person who appeared in our hospital, they were inebriated, they have got a gunshot wound or a knife wound or they have been beaten up because of alcohol abuse.

We do not want to know which hospital they arrived at and which hospital number it is, we actually want to know where that happened so that we can start to get that data and that is the violence prevention data that is now getting expanded through this exact system in our hospitals so that we know that it happens at a certain nightclub, pub, shebeen, wherever it happens or it is at home. Which streets, which districts, which towns so we get a hotspot focus on where these things are happening, how it is influencing our health system and of course as the hon member said, it costs us a huge amount of money, that kind of trauma. I think these are some of the benefits that has come out of our learning specifically now managing COVID-19 and seeing the pressure on our frontline and obviously seeing that reduction in sales was helping to reduce our numbers of our trauma cases and in doing that we are actually learning lessons on dealing with regulation, on understanding different aspects of our ability to regulate.

So definitely very, very key and I can tell you that as a Province we

understand it better and better each and every day, linking through the MRC, linking through with our universities and the work that our Health Department is doing to really get to better understand those trauma cases. Thank you.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon members, I now recognise hon member Marran, if you do wish to enjoy the benefit of the second opportunity.

Mr P MARRAN: Hon Speaker, definitely.

The SPEAKER: You may proceed.

Mr P MARRAN: Thanks, hon Speaker. Yes, yes, yes, I am just getting to my last question, hon Speaker. The balance between saving lives and saving livelihoods.

†Agb Speaker, dit is dat die Premier weet dat jou ekonomie kan weer herstel word, maar as iemand sou sterf dan is dit vir ewig. As ons byvoorbeeld kyk in Breedevallei het die Democratic Alliance byvoorbeeld twee *councillors* verloor. Die een is 'n Speaker as gevolg van COVID. So dit is die verskil *between saving lives and saving livelihoods*.

Agb Speaker, kan die Premier miskien vir ons sê watter rolspelers in die drankbedryf sy party of enige ander enkeling in die DA regstreeks of

onregstreeks, die Premier ingesluit, op enige manier geldelik ondersteun word of borg deur die drankbedryf. Dankie.

[Translation of Afrikaans paragraphs follow.]

[Hon Speaker, it is that the Premier knows that your economy can be recovered again, but if someone should die, that is forever. If we look at the Breede Valley for instance, the Democratic Alliance lost two councillors. The one was a Speaker, as a result of COVID. So that is the difference between saving lives and saving livelihoods.]

Hon Speaker, can the Premier perhaps tell us which roleplayers in the liquor industry in any way financially support or sponsor his party or any other individual in the DA directly or indirectly, the Premier included, through the liquor industry. Thank you.]

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member Marran. I recognise the hon Premier.

The PREMIER: I think the hon member spoke about the party and of course this is not a place to answer questions on the party, this is a place to answer questions from Government.

So the answer is no, and then the second part of that answer is, you know it was a similar question to the one hon member Dugmore asked me last week

– I mean he even used the name of someone last week to say had I met with this person and I said, “Not to my recollection.” I actually straightaway sent a message through to my office and said, “Please go and have a look,” and we trawled back to three years ago when that person was last a Member of Parliament and we could not find one meeting at all.

But I also want to say to the hon member Marran that there is also linking business and Government. Now I want to say that it is interesting how the ANC is – I mean this is the second week talking about this Government and business and linking to business. I want to say absolutely.

Minister Maynier and Minister Meyer who are responsible for agriculture or the economy, they need to meet with our businesses over and over and over again, because one of the biggest complaints that we are getting from business and whether it is us getting it or our universities or business or the business chambers talking about it in South Africa, it is a structural problem where the ANC does not meet with business.

You know at this time of COVID-19 it is quite interesting, the President will make an announcement that affects thousands of jobs and there will be no consultation before making that announcement. I cannot believe that a government operates like that.

Every single time we have a PCC, what happens is we ask our Health Department and we ask our Economics Departments to get together to have

a look at the balance of lives and livelihoods. We ask for comment from both sides. We have engagements, whether it be through the liquor industry, through any kind of industry, specifically at the moment it is engagement with those industries hardest hit: the hospitality industry and all those SMMEs and small businesses that are linked to that industry.

The smallest of the business in our province, the questions dealt with from hon member Nkondlo today with the hon Minister of Economic Opportunities were specifically about support for SMMEs because those are the businesses that are so hard hit now during this crisis time and quite frankly it is unacceptable that at a national level we do not engage. I can assure you that at this level we engage and we had a robust debate in our strategy meetings so that we make the correct decisions and our epidemiologists are in those meetings, our Health Department is in those meetings, that is why we have got measurements of trauma, but also the economy has to have a voice in those meetings if we are to be a responsible Government trying to find that balance between lives and livelihoods.

I will give the example of the previous Minister of Health, before he was known for his Digital Vibes, that Minister actually met with the liquor industry in this province and it was interesting, after that Minister's meeting with the liquor industry, understanding the impact of a lockdown on our wine industry, on jobs and on actually getting that balance right.

Because can you imagine, I just visited one cellar that had more than 10

million litres of wine in store and that could not be sold, obviously because there were slow-downs and times that they could not sell it. But imagine that gets dumped into the market afterwards because now you have to pay your bonds, you have to pay your salary, you have to pay back or the banks are going to foreclose on you. So, what do you do? You cheapen the price of your product and you dump it in the market. Imagine if that had to happen, what the consequences then are on lives versus livelihoods in our region.

This takes careful management, balancing and engagement across the board from all sides. And in actual fact, if the ANC could learn one thing during this pandemic and now, in the third wave going towards the fourth wave, rather start consulting, rather start getting that balance right because quite frankly, it is destroying jobs and lives, livelihoods and lives the way it is being managed at the moment. We need to make sure we get that balance right. Thank you, hon Speaker.

The SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Premier. Hon members, the time allocated to Questions to the Premier: it is 20 minutes in terms of Rule 204(2) and we have followed the Rules often in terms of subsection 9 of the same Rule, and there was no Rule that was broken, but the time is broken. So, we need to end here. It is now 19 minutes 43 seconds, so the former Deputy Chief Whip of the majority party, the Minister is nodding. So, I am glad that there is agreement. I would like to say to the hon members, thank you very much to the hon Premier and hon Marran. I apologise to the rest of the members who were lining up. I do know that you have forgiven me. We now move to

Members' Statements. In terms of Rule 145, I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS:

Ms L J BOTHA (DA): Hon Speaker, in a motion delivered in this House last week, the hon Sayed launched an unwarranted attack on the Creative Arts Conference hosted by Rustenburg Girls Junior School, in partnership with the WCED. He claimed that it excluded teachers who could not afford a ticket and demanded that it be cancelled or made free.

Speaker, it appears that the member had not done his homework, unfortunately. The fact is that the school approached sponsors so that tickets to the conference would be available for free, to those who could not afford the R150 cost. Had member Sayed bothered to simply have a look at the conference website, he would have seen this: plain as day. It is deeply concerning that a member of this House would so readily make such inaccurate comments in Parliament.

Through you, hon Speaker, I encourage member Sayed to publicly retract his remarks. His comments were yet another, in a long line of easily disapproved claims he has made about the education sector. Unwarranted attacks do not constitute oversight.

The conference itself was extremely successful with nearly 2 000 attendees

engaging on a variety of topics in creative arts education. The Democratic Alliance congratulates the organisers and affirms the importance of creative arts in equipping learners with the skills our economy needs now and will need in the future. I thank you.

[The Deputy Speaker takes the Chair.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Apologies, hon members. We are just changing shifts and I have to just find myself. Thank you very much, hon member, I now recognise the ANC.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. The ANC wishes to condemn the serious lack of attention and support given to people living with disabilities in this province, by the MEC and the Department of Social Development. On 27 July 2020, the MEC for Social Development announced the appointment of Ms Nomvuyo Mabulesa to head the Provincial Disability Desk. A year later, we are informed by members of the disability community that the desk is vacant again. Surely, this points to a systemic challenge within the Department and an inability by the MEC to lead.

When the global community is facing a pandemic such as COVID-19, all systems and structures are to be activated, especially in respect of the vulnerable groups of our society. The lack of attention and urgency displayed by the MEC in this regard, reiterates the elitist attitude that this

Provincial Government has towards fighting COVID-19.

When looking at the Department's so-called easy read booklet containing information on COVID-19, one would think that this was for anyone and not designed specifically for members of our communities living with disabilities. Hardly anything in the booklet speaks to people with disabilities and support needs to be given to them.

Hon Deputy Speaker, international trends suggest that between 15% of a population in any part of the world is affected by a disability. This means approximately 765 000 people in our province have a disability of one sort or another. Local organisations suggest that in the Western Cape, the more realistic figure may be higher.

One wonders whether the Department itself, and the MEC, are aware of how many people in our province are affected by disabilities, yet this kind of information and the role of the community with disabilities in fighting COVID-19, should be championed by the Disability Desk in this Department. However, like many other vulnerable groups, this MEC, in her lack of leadership, is leaving many behind. So, for over one year we have no Disability Desk in the very Department that is mandated to have one. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise the EFF.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The EFF in the Western Cape would like to take this opportunity to condemn in the strongest possible terms the disgusting, inhuman and negligent conduct of the City of Cape Town for not attending to its constitutional duties of service delivery in poor, black communities. This follows an incident in which 2-year-old Imthande Swartbooi was found dead after falling into and drowning in a sewerage manhole which had been left unattended by the City of Cape Town, despite numerous calls to the City by the Khayelitsha residents requesting the drain to be covered.

Hon Deputy Speaker, incidents of this nature are very common in townships and informal settlements as the City does not care about the safety and the wellbeing of the poor people living in these areas. If the very same drainage system would have been reported openly in the leafy suburbs, it would have taken only a few minutes for the City to rush to the area and close it down, in order to protect children of the rich and the white people.

It is so sad to live in a city which deliberately flaunts its constitutional duties of providing basic services to certain communities, only because of skin colour and economic status. Poor people in our townships remain neglected by those in government and are only remembered when it is time to cast their votes. This situation is so bad and it gambles with human lives at the expense of certain individuals scoring seats in the councils and then going back to ignore the very same people who put them in power.

As the EFF, hon Deputy Speaker, we would like to send our heartfelt and deepest condolences to the family of Imthande Swartbooi. May his soul rest in peace. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, I now recognise the DA.

Mr D AMERICA (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The recent audit outcomes revealed that 18 out of 30 municipalities in the Western Cape achieved clean audits; 9 municipalities achieved an unqualified audit report. Beaufort West is the only municipality that achieved the worst possible audit outcome, which is a disclaimer. Hon Deputy Speaker, this means that 90% of our municipalities achieved a clean or unqualified audit. This is not surprising. These municipalities are all led or were led by the DA, whilst those with adverse audit outcomes are all governed by the ANC.

Western Cape residents can be assured that their monies are, well, not stolen. Jobs are not given to friends and family, and public services are efficiently rendered. When the people of the Western Cape go to the polls in the upcoming elections, an important question to ask is this: do you trust the ANC which does not pay even its own workers? Do you trust a party whose municipalities require intervention and support from the Provincial Government to help them deliver services or do you trust those small inyana parties who make outlandish promises because they do not have any track record in government? Of course, you do not. Would you trust a party in government, both provincially and locally?

Deputy Speaker, the people of the Western Cape are much the wiser because they deserve better than the ANC's lies and not so good political mania. The Western Cape residents know they have a home when they vote for clean governance, ethical leadership and a party that gets the job done. This, hon Deputy Speaker ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr D AMERICA: Is the DA. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise GOOD. I take it that hon Herron is not there? He is on. The last call for hon Herron? Okay, I am going to move onto the ACDP. If he has got a problem with technicalities, please, I will come back to him. To the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Statistics released by the World Health Organisation 2020, show a suicide occurs every forty seconds and a suicide attempt every three seconds. It shows 800 000 die by suicide each year. Suicide is the second leading cause of death in the world's population of 15 to 29-year-olds. In this country, South Africa, an average suicide of 17,2 per 100 000 or 8% of all deaths. This only reflects deaths reported by academic hospitals.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the South African Depression and Anxiety Group reports that 20% of high school learners in South Africa, have tried at a point

to take their own lives; 9% of young people's deaths are labelled as suicide. Jason Bantjes, a senior professor lecturer at the University of Stellenbosch says, and I quote:

“For every suicide death, there are estimated to be at least another 20 suicide attempts. Some studies show that as many as 35 people are seriously affected by each suicide.”

Literature on youth suicide referred to school aged children between the ages of 7 and 12, and adolescents between the ages of 13 and 20-years old. Young people of these ages are vulnerable to mental health problems, especially during their adolescent years. They are often confronted by high expectations from relatives to perform at their best. This results in conditions of helplessness, stress and the loss of self-confidence.

The ACDP calls on the Western Cape Government to more vigorously support initiatives, such as ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Okay, thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Apologies for the interruption there. Thank you very much. I now recognise the ANC.

Ms A P BANS (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. We have always maintained that the DA does not take seriously the arts, sports and culture in the province. There are many examples just to prove this, but the decision to cut the funding for the Western Cape School of Sport will go down in history as the worst decision ever, by this Department.

Due to the Provincial Government's nonchalant attitude towards arts, sports and culture, many artists and organisations have since relied on the support from National Government for survival. For the current financial year, hon Deputy Speaker, the Department of Arts and Culture has contributed over R29,5 million for African art, culture, education and the Sports Trust. This was paid directly to individuals and organisations in the Western Cape. A total of 666 beneficiaries received funding from the National Department up until mid-August. In addition to this, over R1,5 million has been paid to support organisations in the film industry in the Western Cape.

The ANC in the Western Cape commends the National Department under the stewardship of Minister Nathi Mthethwa. The assistance to this Department in the Western Cape is appreciated and it goes a long way to give hope and a chance of survival to many organisations that were beginning to lose hope, following the devastating impact of COVID-19. Hon Deputy Speaker, we call on more National Government departments to follow suit and bring more national investment to this province, where the majority of artists and organisations are not funded by the Provincial Government. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the DA.

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. A few weeks ago the province experienced some of the most devastating disruptions to the taxi industry we have seen in recent times. The Western Cape Government and Minister Daylin Mitchell made a correct decision to close route B97, bringing calm and stability to the situation and protecting Western Cape commuters.

Throughout the period, Minister Mitchell, Premier Winde and National Minister Mbalula worked tirelessly to bring an end to the disruption. Minister Mitchell took the following key steps. He invoked his powers in terms of Section 91 of the NLTA to close the ranks. He had numerous engagements with the parties involved, including through an arbitration process. The National Minister actually supported him during this process, including lending his signature the ceasefire agreement. The SAPS and Law Enforcement, as well as the SANDF also assisted during the enforcement process and the City of Cape Town and the Department of Community Safety, led by Minister Albert Fritz, played a crucial role in dealing with law enforcement and supported the Government in this crucial work.

This co-ordinated approach sends a benchmark of what can be achieved in co-operative governance when politics are set aside. However, we are concerned with the extremely low conviction rate of individuals involved in the taxi

violence. We urge the National Prosecuting Authority to prioritise those individuals who were involved in sanctioning those crimes in the taxi industry, so that justice is seen to be done and felt for the victims of these crimes. The over 700 000 passengers who use the minibus taxi industry every day, must be able to travel safely in the Western Cape. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise the Freedom Front Plus.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker. The Freedom Front Plus is greatly concerned about the poor performance of Kannaland Local Municipality comprising the towns of Ladismith, Calitzdorp and Zoar. Currently, this municipality is under ANC control. It has led me to the conclusion that the Minister of Local Government in the Western Cape may have failed in his duties and that he should appoint a committee to advise him on what the most appropriate remedial action would be to resolve this matter.

I will be tabling a motion at our next plenary session in this regard, hoping that the Demarcation Board could be asked to investigate possible adjustments to the municipal boundaries of Kannaland, to increase its administrative and financial capacity to benefit the communities living there. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, I now recognise Al Jama-

Ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The martyr Steve Bantu Biko said, and I quote:

“A people without a positive history, is like a vehicle without an engine.”

As South Africans and citizens of the Western Cape, we have a proud history of resistance against colonialism and unjust laws. The Khoi and San tribes have fought the Dutch settlers since 1659 against occupation of their land. Other resistances were that of Muslim political prisoners brought by the colonialists as slaves to South Africa and of course, we also remember the several resistance campaigns against an apartheid regime. So yes, indeed, we do have a positive history as our people stood up against oppression and colonialism.

Biko also said:

“I am against the fact that the settler minority should impose an entire system of values on an indigenous people.”

Today, we find that tourism’s pitch to boost local economy still produces colonial dynamics of the inequality existing between the white and black tourism industry. This, the legacy of colonialism, remains a stark reminder

in the tourism industry.

Our positive and proud history has been reduced to memory walls in the townships of the Cape Flats. The statues of the Gugulethu Seven are admirable, but unfortunately, neglected. In Drakenstein and other rural areas, the pictures and landscapes depict the history of colonialism. The political hangings were that of Poqo members from Paarl, but there is nothing to depict that history.

It is unacceptable that previously disadvantaged communities are forced to continue with resistance campaigns against historical sites being turned into new liberal imperatives for economic growth and development. I am referring to the River Club development which is on a site sacred to the Khoi and San tribes who fought the Dutch settlers against the dispossession of their land. The Cape Malay ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Choir Board is also deprived from using the Good Hope Centre for its competitions. We call on the province to ensure ... [Interjection.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, your time is up.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you very much, I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker, fellow South Africans. September marks a start of Tourism Month in South Africa, but due to the COVID-19 pandemic and related regulations, many tourism businesses have already shut their doors and may never open again. Others are hanging on for dear life.

With decreasing numbers of COVID-19 infections, the Western Cape exiting its peak of its third wave and with a continued rollout of COVID-19 vaccinations, it is time for National Government to ease up lockdown regulations. We cannot live under continued lockdown regulations day in and day out, with no end in sight. Regulations, such as the curfew, restrictions on alcohol sales, attendance at sports events and gathering sizes, need to be revisited, especially if the gathering is work related, such as conferences and meetings.

Every regulation imposed on a business in the particular sector also has a knock-on effect for businesses in the value chain. If a large hotel is unable to fill its rooms and conference venues, then the local laundromat might suffer. If businesses are unable to sell alcohol during certain times or on certain premises, it effects bottling and labelling companies, and logistic businesses alike. Restrictions on attendance at sports events and gatherings, effect local and informal entrepreneurs who regularly sell their goods at these

events.

The tourism industry is estimated to have lost more than 75 000 jobs in 2020 and in order for this sector to survive, it needs to be able to capitalise on the upcoming spring and summer months, as well as the opening of travel from Germany, France and the Netherlands to South Africa. Tourism is a top employment sector in the Western Cape and the DA thus calls upon the National Government to where it can safely be done, to ease up restrictions so that tourism businesses and its value chain can keep their doors open and our tourist sectors can once again thrive as always. To give hope to your residents, we need to balance lives and livelihoods. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member, that brings us to the end of Statements. In terms of Rule 145(6), I give one or more members of the Executive an opportunity to respond for not more than five minutes collectively. Are there any Ministers who would like to respond?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Deputy Speaker, if I may? My hand is up, if you would recognise me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I recognise you, hon Fernandez. Minister Fernandez, you may proceed.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Good afternoon, hon Deputy Speaker, the Premier, members of the House. I would like to use the

opportunity I think, to set the record straight, regarding the hon Dugmore's inputs on the Disability Desk. I think there are two key factors that must be taken into account. I think if I can state for the record, we were the only province that had established a Disability Desk. It was done at the time to compliment the additional disability programme that we have.

However, when the DPSA regulations changed, we had to then extend that contract on an annual basis, year to year, and that proved to be cumbersome. So, in fact what we did, we took the Disability Desk and we mainstreamed it by actually appointing a second Deputy Director to the post of Disability and that was done recently. So, we improved the arrangement by replacing the temporary Disability Desk post with a permanent one and in that way, we have mainstreamed.

I also think it is disingenuous of the hon Dugmore to suggest that there is privilege. Just on Saturday, I had the opportunity to address the RETT 21 Conference and as you may know, RETTs is a disability that affects more girl-children than boy-children, and this was conducted at Iris House where I had the opportunity to do oversight and actually observe the equine and the dog therapy that they use for severely disabled persons. So, we do have a close relationship with the disability network and I on two occasions, attended their AGM.

So, the hon Dugmore must first get his facts right regarding the establishment of the Department and not come and speak untruths to Parliament, and make

it out as if it is gospel. So, our disability programme is up and running, and we are seized. It is one of my four priorities: disability, substance use disorder, gender-based violence and strengthening families. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Minister Fernandez. Any further input from the Ministers? I do not see any hands. I then take it that we have come to the end of Members' Statements. We now move over to Notices of Motion. In terms of the new Rule 151, all Notices of Motions by members are required to be delivered to the Secretary for placing it onto the Order Paper. These motions have been duly submitted and published in the Order Paper below the line.

MOTIONS WITH NOTICE

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates primary-school learner drop-outs for 2020 and 2021; and notes that by July of this year an estimated 750 000 learners had dropped out of school as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic.

[Notice of motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Mr P MARRAN: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the abuse of taxpayer money by the DA to fight poor and vulnerable people, while regularly losing – such as the Cape Town Tent City case (in Green Point) where it evicted people, but had to return belongings to victims.

[Notice of motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House discusses support to the Uyinene Mrwetyana Foundation to turn the Claremont Post Office – where this UCT student was killed in 2019 by a male worker – into a memorial wellness centre for survivors of gender-based violence.

[Notice of motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the DA's general confused leadership led by the so-called white cabal that just handed the wooden spoon to Cape Town Mayor Dan Plato in the race where he is again merely a place holder for the next white boss.

[Notice of motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

MR A LILI: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House debates the failing and poorly maintained municipal infrastructure under DA-led provincial governance and oversight that leads to the deaths of many of our children.

[Notice of motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: I give notice that I shall move:

That the House notes that almost half a million people contracted the COVID-19 in the province and about 28 000 have died of complications because of the coronavirus pandemic; and proposes that an advertisement be placed in all the major newspapers to commiserate with the families and friends of the deceased and also to encourage all people to be vaccinated and to stay positive.

[Notice of motion as printed on the Order Paper.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We now move to Motions without Notice. I would like to inform you once again that in terms of the new Standing Rules of 150 pertaining to Motions without Notice, condolence and congratulatory were submitted to the Programming Authority prior to this plenary on 31 August 2021. Members are also reminded that the Motions without Notice pertaining to these congratulatory or condolences, will not be allowed in this sitting that

have not been processed by the Programming Authority.

I have been informed that in the Programming Authority meeting of 31 August 2021, political parties did submit the names of the hon members in their desired order of speaking and who had wished to move a Motion without Notice in this sitting of the House. I will, therefore, just for noting and for the purposes of the Minutes, call out the hon members whose names have accordingly been submitted and approved. The following member motions have been approved by the Programming Authority as follows: hon Allen, hon Christians, hon Bosman, hon Botha, hon Sayed, hon Botha, hon Mvimbi, hon Mackenzie, and hon Bans.

MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

Mr R I ALLEN: I move without notice:

That the House expresses its congratulations to Marlene le Roux for being honoured with the Charlotte Maxeke Award on Friday, 27 August at the Bring Her Up Awards ceremony; notes that in her position as the first woman of colour to preside as CEO of the Artscape, she has tirelessly advocated the rights of youths and persons with disabilities; and further commends Ms Le Roux on her leadership, creativity and contributions to society.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: I move without notice:

That the House commends the members of the 4 x 100 meter men's U 20 relay team for their victory; notes that we celebrate the victory that earned them a world record of 38,51 seconds; notes that we revel in the euphoria that lifted the collective spirit of our country on the day; notes that it is wonderful to celebrate the achievements of young people, to see them reach their full potential in their chosen field is indeed a joy and the sheer spectacle of their physical prowess on the athletic track was a sight to behold; notes that the national junior men's relay team finished off a momentous five-day campaign by the South African squad at the World Athletics U 20 Championship held in Nairobi, Kenya; notes that Mhlahli Xhotyeni, Sinesipho Dambile, Letlhogonolo Moleyane and Benjamin Richards broke the world record of 38,62 set by the USA in Costa Rica in July 2019; notes that the quartet also shattered the African record of 39,33 seconds; may their achievement encourage the young people of our country and the world to raise their standards; may they be an example of what can be achieved through hard work and the discipline of practice; and may their world record remain for a long time.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr G BOSMAN: I move without notice:

That the House expresses its congratulations to the City's Social Development and Early Childhood Development Department on the launch of its Youth-focused Rapid Employment and Development Initiative (READI); notes that the READI programme will be invaluable in aiding the professional and interpersonal development of youths to equip them with the tools needed to enter the workforce; and further commends this initiative on its recognition of the importance of creating opportunities for young people to thrive.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms L J BOTHA: I move without notice:

That the House expresses condolences to the relatives of a beloved resident of the town Eendekuil, Maria Wewers, who died on Thursday, 26 August 2021 at the ripe old age of 73; notes that she leaves a large gap in her family and in the community of Eendekuil; and notes that she will be missed by the children of the community because she provided them every day at her own cost with a plate of food. Rest in peace, dear Maria Wewers.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I move without notice:

That the House congratulates the 16 out of 50 participants who successfully completed the National Government's Smallholder Farmer Development Programme to become fully fledged commercial farmers; and notes that the Department of Agriculture continues to give support to the remaining 34 candidates.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms L J BOTHA: I move without notice:

That the House expresses condolences to the relatives of Winston Abrahams, beloved husband of Lyna Abrahams, and beloved resident of Lamberts Bay who died on Wednesday, 25 August 2021; and notes that Winston was a mainstay in his community and that he will be greatly missed. May his soul rest in peace.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr L L MVIMBI: I move without notice:

That the House commends the National Transport Minister, Fikile Mbalula, for extending the grace period for the renewal of driver's and car licences from 31 August 2021 to 31 March 2022, due to the disruptions of the COVID-19 pandemic.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: I move without notice:

That this House congratulates the Provincial Department of Transport and Public Works for its recent completion of the Ashton Arch Bridge; notes that the R130 million project resulted in it being a milestone for our country: the first ever concrete-tied bridge to be built using the transverse launching method; notes that, during construction, the project provided more than 500 employment opportunities for local residents; notes that not only will this improve road transport as a whole, but it will allow for the town to use this bridge as a source of tourism; and continues to support the Department in rolling out important infrastructure throughout the province, which stands to support jobs, safety and dignity for all.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

Ms A P BANS: I move without notice:

That the House commends national rugby captain Siya Kolisi and his Springboks for a great recovery in the latest series against New Zealand? and for regaining one of the leading positions in international competition; and notes that, even when the COVID-19 pandemic may force them to abandon the present tests, we will support Kolisi's men in

their future endeavours.

[Motion as printed in the Minutes.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now put the motions duly submitted and approved by the Programming Authority to the House. Are there any objections? No objections ... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: None.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, no objections, agreed to. The motions will appear in the Minutes of the proceedings and in Hansard, in each individual member's name as if that member has read them out aloud. I will now afford the opportunity to members to move Motions without Notice as per the Standing Rule of 153(d). This includes Motions without Notice that were not approved in the Programming Authority meeting. Members are reminded that the 30 minutes as per Standing Rule will start now. In the order of the list that I have, I now recognise hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Thank you very much, Hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House commends the efforts by the honourable Khalid Sayed in resolving the transport crisis for kids from the previous Iris Qwela Primary School to travel to the new De Doorns Primary School in

Stofland, and that these kids until last Friday had been without transport since the opening of the new school at the beginning of the current school quarter where they were eventually placed. I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Thank you. I recognise hon Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you, Hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House:

- (1) Condemns the City of Cape Town over its celebration for spending 95% of its Urban Settlement Development ...[Inaudible – audio distorted]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Makamba-Botya, your sounds has – we cannot hear you. Hon Makamba-Botya, what I am going to do is hon Wenger, I see

your hand is ...[Inaudible – audio distorted]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA:

(3) One of the many examples that comes to mind is the story of a 27-year-old ...[Inaudible – audio distorted]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Makamba-Botya, if you can just take your seat for a second? Hon Wenger, Chief Whip?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Madam Deputy Speaker. No, it was just to note that we could not hear the hon member and so, we do not know if we can agree or not.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, correct. So, what I am going to ask hon Makamba-Botya, you can try one more time. If not, I am going to move on until you have actually fixed up your sound. If you can try that once again?

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Should I start from the beginning, hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I can hear you clearly now. You may proceed from the beginning, please.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Okay, I move without notice:

That the House:

- (1) Condemns the City of Cape Town over its celebration for spending 95% of its Urban Settlement Development Grant budget for the 2020/2021 financial year.
- (2) It cannot be right that the City celebrates exhausting almost all of the funds whereas in reality, we do not see changes in informal settlements, as the majority of people still live in congested areas made up of shack structures.
- (3) One of the many examples that comes to mind is the story of the 27-year-old disabled Busiswa Pikinini, who has no feet and hands and resides in the Khayelitsha informal settlement in section RR.
- (4) Busiswa who lives with a family of 4 in a congested shack and has previously applied for state housing in the past 10 years without any luck. Instead of the City assisting her to get a state house, they have instead run to the media to say they cannot find her on the list of applicants.
- (5) This just shows that the City has no regard for the principles and values of Ubuntu and Batho Pele which would ordinarily prioritise the elderly and people with disabilities and not only in policy documents, but in actual reality by making an impact in people's

lives. I so move. Thank you.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes, objection.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Objection.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. [Interjection.]

Mr P J MARAIS: Speaker, point of, point of – point of information, thank you.

An HON MEMBER: Guys!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I recognise. Just give me a second. Hon Marais, what is your point of order?

Mr P J MARAIS: The motion is contradictory. It says: I commend the

Council for doing something wrong, and then, she lambasts the Council. It cannot be that she commends them. The word 'commend' ...[Inaudible – audio distorted]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Marais, thank you so much for the explanation, but it is not for us to analyse the actual motion that the hon member has put forward. We may proceed. I now move over to hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Hon Deputy Speaker, I move without notice:

That the House condemns the irresponsible and insensitive manner in which the Western Cape Education Department has dealt with the positive testing case of the Deputy Principal at Kensington High School, fuelling the anxieties of the school community and calls on the WCED to ensure that decontamination of schools basically takes place timeously when positive cases occur, especially among staff, so as to stop the rapid spread and mutation of the COVID-19 virus. I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Objection.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes, I object.

An HON MEMBER: Objection.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise hon Makamba-Botya again.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House notes:

- (1) The lack of basic infrastructure for water drainage systems in the Cape Town Informal Settlements.
- (2) The EFF has constantly been vocal about this issue, but our calls have always fallen onto deaf ears. The situation becomes worse during the rainy season and as in recent times when there is flooding.
- (3) The Western Cape needs a proactive Metropolitan which is able to assist the poor and the needy who reside in deplorable conditions in areas such as Mau Mau, Kwa Langa, Nyanga East, and Kraaifontein, just to mention a few. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are there any objections to the motion being moved without notice?

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Yes.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, objection.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): It is expected.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I recognise hon Marran.

Mr P MARRAN: Thank you, Hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That this House, after numerous complaints by communities, considers getting a full senior bar council opinion whether it is legal for municipalities to summarily deduct municipal accounts in arrears or on agency basis for any creditor first when residents buy electricity. I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion

being moved without notice?

An HON MEMBER: Object.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Hon Deputy Speaker, we do not know, sorry, we do not know what he is asking.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, hon member, I have seen an objection. That is all I need to know. Thank you. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. I now recognise hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Hon Deputy Speaker. I move without notice:

That the House condemns the irresponsible manner in which the Education MEC, Debbie Schäfer, has victimised a member of the public, a parent and a whistle-blower, Mr Gasant Abader, during last week's sitting – a platform where Mr Abader cannot defend himself – after he publicly exposed her Department's failure to properly address allegations of corruption against the former principal at Golden Grove Primary School. I so move.

[Motion as moved by member.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Are there any objections to the motion

being ...[Inaudible – audio distorted]

An HON MEMBER: Object!

The CHIEF WHIP (DA): Object.

HON MEMBERS: Object.

The MINISTER OF EDUCATION: For defamation, I think.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are objections. The motion will be printed on the Order Paper. Hon Marais, I see your hand was up again. I hope it is not an explanation on the content of the motions?

Mr P J MARAIS: I do apologise. I failed to lower it, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your apology is accepted, but I – that is absolutely fine. Thank you very much, hon member. We now move over to the Order of the Day. The Secretary will read the Order of the Day.

ORDER OF THE DAY

The SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Conduct Committee on a complaint against an honourable member of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament in accordance with the Code of Conduct for Members of the

Western Cape Provincial Parliament, dated 7 May 2021.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr Secretary. I have been informed by the Chief Whip that the Programming Authority resolved that there would be no list of speakers and that parties who wish to do so, will now be afforded an opportunity to make a declaration of the vote for a maximum of three minutes. I recognise the ANC. Any declaration?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): The ANC – am I audible, hon Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, you may proceed. One minute, hon Lekker? Okay, hon Philander, I will call you when the time is right. I am assuming you are waiting in to do a declaration. I recognise the ANC first. Over to you, hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The ANC wishes to note this complaint and the report tabled here today. We will not go so far as to welcome the report because this complaint should never have been made in the first place. The complaint speaks to an old apartheid-like style of thinking, where one cannot speak out and in particular, the complaint speaks to a serious lack of appreciation for democracy and parliamentary privilege.

This complaint questioned the very foundation of our democracy. It comes from a place where black people may not question wealthy, white businessmen in our country. In other words, the thinking behind this complaint: was how dare this black man speak out and question me? This mentality has no place in our democracy. We will defeat this sense of white privilege. Every single member of this House, no matter what race, gender or class, may pose questions, may criticise and may debate any issues that the Constitution allows us to do so.

It is astounding that 27 years into our democracy, that this mentality is exposed in this manner. At least, we would have thought this particular complainant would have the shame to rather hide such a complaint, not so when it comes to white men privilege. This bombastic 'baas' mentality, when it comes to some white men, knows no bounds. At least, we thank the Conduct Committee for rising to the occasion.

The ANC requests members of this House who are friends with this DA funder, to speak to him and teach him about the new South Africa. Whilst some in the Western Cape may think they can dismiss the constitutional imperatives of our country, we would hope all members of this House recommit themselves to these constitutional imperatives and dismiss this racist, classist mentality that moved this complaint in the first place. I thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise the EFF.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA (EFF): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The EFF is not making any declaration. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Can I check that hon Herron is making a declaration?

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): Hon Deputy Speaker, can you hear me?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I can hear you, hon Herron.

Mr B N HERRON (GOOD): I do not have a declaration, thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay, thank you very much. I assume that was 'no'. Yes. Can I call on the ADCP?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ADCP): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. The complaint against fellow member, hon Smith, is worrying. The fact that this matter was referred to the Conduct Committee for investigation, is even more disturbing.

As members of this House, we are protected by the Powers, Privileges and Immunities of Parliaments and Provincial Legislatures Act. The Constitution

of South Africa assures members of this House, freedom of speech and immunity from civil and criminal prosecution. Is this a ploy from the DA trying to curb freedom of speech? Is the DA trying to intimidate members, so that we will not participate in robust debates? This matter should have been dealt with, sent to the complainant and say 'members are protected'. It is quite amazing to see that this matter was brought for investigation to the Conduct Committee. It is disgusting and we will not be intimidated by unnecessary and frivolous investigations. I thank you, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, hon member. I now recognise the Freedom Front Plus.

Mr P J MARAIS (FFP): Hon Deputy Speaker, the Freedom Front Plus has no declaration to make.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise Al Jama-Ah.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Al Jama-Ah is covered. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise the Democratic Alliance.

Ms W F PHILANDER (DA): Thank you, hon Deputy Speaker. Hon Deputy

Speaker, the Registrar, having presented his report, the Committee deliberated on the matter and resolved that no further action needs to be taken against the hon member.

The complainant, which was a member of the public, complained that certain remarks made by hon Smith during the debate on the State of the Province Address at the hybrid parliamentary sitting held on 18 February 2021 at Genadendal, were defamatory of the complainant. The hybrid sitting at Genadendal satisfies the definition of parliamentary precincts contained in Sections 2(1) and 2(2) of the Powers, Privileges and Immunities of Parliaments and Provincial Legislatures Act 4 of 2004.

Section 117(1) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa provides that members of the Provincial Legislatures enjoy freedom of speech and immunity from civil or criminal prosecution, or damages for anything said in the Legislature. That is during a formal sitting of the House. The remarks made by hon Smith took place during an official sitting of the House and are therefore covered by parliamentary privilege as set out in Section 117 of the Constitution.

Nonetheless, hon Deputy Speaker, the complainant enjoys a right of reply in terms of Section 25 of the Powers, Privileges and Immunities of Parliaments and Provincial Legislatures Act 4 of 2004. The Committee deliberated and found that no further action be taken against hon member Smith and no breach of the Code has occurred. The Committee further deliberated and

resolved that the Secretary to Parliament be instructed to write to the complainant, drawing his attention to his right of reply and enquiring if the complainant wished to make a written reply.

Hon Deputy Speaker, the decision concurred with the recommendation of the Registrar and recommended by the Conduct Committee on 25 August 2021.

Hon Deputy Speaker, I therefore encourage this House to accept the recommendation of the Conduct Committee. I so move, hon Deputy Speaker. I thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, hon member. I now have to announce that there are currently 35 hon members present and entitled to vote, and the House is therefore quorate. The question put before the House is that the Report of the Conduct Committee on a complaint against an Honourable Member of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament in accordance with the Code of Conduct for Members of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament, dated 7 May 2021, be adopted. Are there any objections to the report being adopted?

HON MEMBERS: No!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: There are no objections, agreed to. Hon members, that concludes the business for the day. The Secretary will now end the meeting and all members will be exited from this meeting. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 16:55