

---

THURSDAY, 1 DECEMBER 2022

---

PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN CAPE PROVINCIAL PARLIAMENT

The sign † indicates the original language and [ ] directly thereafter indicates a translation.

[Hybrid sitting held with some members present in the House and some in virtual attendance through Microsoft Teams]

The House met at 14:15.

Hon member Ms Kaizer-Philander took the Chair.

**BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE**

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Good afternoon, hon members. We will be starting our business in a slightly different manner today. Today, 1 December, is a day of significance. During this period we mark the 16 Days of Activism of No Violence against Women and Children, and let us not forget the LGBTQIA+ community. We stand in solidarity with communities, all civil societies, organisations, Government and stakeholders to end this pandemic, and not just for 16 days, but 365 days of the year.

Today also marks World AIDS Day and all of us should encourage every citizen to get tested and know their status. Let us spend time recognising that despite the impact this disease has on one's life, one can still live a happy and a fruitful life and stop stigmatisation.

Hon members, can I ask that members of this House unite today and direct your thoughts and prayers and observe a moment of silence to those that are affected and those that conquer and for all of us to remain hopeful during this time.

Hon members, let us observe a moment of silence.

[Moment of silence observed.]

Thank you, hon members, you may be seated. Hon Dugmore?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you House Chair. House Chair, just when you opened when you referred to 1 December, did you not forget that this is also the day that slavery was abolished? Maybe it was an oversight, or the DA does not really think that that is something to celebrate, but I would appreciate if you also mentioned that. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Dugmore. Your comment is noted. I see hon Christians and then member Sayed.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS: Thank you, Acting Chairperson. The question is, are we now doing away with opening with prayer, and a minute of silence? It is custom for this House to open in prayer and not a minute of silence. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Christians. Definitely not, today we just made the exception, but we are not doing away with prayer. Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Acting Chairperson, I also just also want to support the point made by member Christians, but also very strangely, I do not know whether it is an oversight on the part of the administration but there are no Order Papers in front of us. They were emailed, but I do not know, not unless other tables or benches have Order Papers but there are only Speakers' Lists. It makes it very difficult to follow the proceedings of the House and to intervene or not intervene if there is no Order Paper. Could we please have that before we go any further? Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. We will have that sorted. In the meantime, let us proceed. Hon member Nkondlo?

†Ms N D NKONDLO: Molo Mhlalingaphambili. Ndinombuzo endingathanda ukuwubhekisa apha kuwe. Ndifuna ukuqonda into yokuba uSomlomo wale

ndlu yowisomthetho uphi? Njengokuba sowitshilo into yokuba siqala le mini kukho izinto esingazaziyo esizibonayo. Uphi ke uSomlomo walapha wendlu yowisomthetho? Sifunda kumaphepha into yokuba ungumntu ubulungu bakhe bale DA akuyo, ithe yabe iyabuthatha ubulungu bayo. Ngoko ke lo nto leyo ithi kuzokuba bekuphakanyiswa nalapha kwindlu yowisomthetho ukuba into yokuba uyasuswa. Zonke ezi zinto zingamahemhem. Sifuna ukuqonda into yokuba ikhona into yokuba ikhona na into ebhaliweyo yena uNobhala wale ndlu yowisomthetho athe wayifumana angayibonisa kuthi apha ukuba ikhona into enjalo. Ndicela ukuzibuzela net lo nto leyo apha kuwe njengomtu ophethe le nqubo yanamhlanje.

[Ms N D NKONDLO: Good day, Chairperson. As you have already said, we are beginning this day not having the complete information about situations. Where is the Speaker of the House? We are reading in these documents that the DA is wanting to revoke their membership. We thought that their removal will be something to be raised in this sitting. We have been hearing rumours. We want to know whether there is anything written down that the Secretary of this House has received that will show there is such a thing. I just want to ask that question from you since you are chairing this sitting today.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much for rising, hon member Nkondlo. That is not a point of order. Hon members, we will proceed with the business of today. As has been our practice to date, hon members will participate... [Interjection.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Can I address you, Chair?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Nkondlo?

Ms N D NKONDLO: Chair, I rose on a matter which I was asking for clarity. I am not sure whether you want me to speak in English for you to understand. I rose on a matter, which I expected you to provide clarity for.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Nkondlo, I note your point made and your question asked. At this stage my only answer will be and for the remainder of this session will be that hon members, we became aware of possible litigation that might impact processes of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament and all members will be kept abreast accordingly. I hope that should answer your question, member. We will proceed.  
[Interjections.]

Hon members, hon Kama, please put your hand down, member Bans, as well as member Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, Chair, you cannot do that.

[Inaudible, microphone muted]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members, order members!

[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): They are not in the House.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): They are not in the House, and you do not even know what we are talking about. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Where is the evidence that ... [inaudible, microphone muted]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We still do not have the Order Paper, but you want to continue with the Sitting. [Interjections.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): A point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members, can I ask for you to please contain yourselves. [Interjections.] Can we please go through the before-proceedings of the House and I will address member Nkondlo accordingly. [Interjections, shouting simultaneously.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): There is no Order Paper. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Sayed, hon members, order! Members, members on my left as well as members on my right, please, can we maintain order in this House. I have asked the Administration to sort out the matter of the Order Papers. Can we proceed in terms of not the business,

starting with the business of the day, but the before-process of, before we get to the business, please. In the meantime, I am sure you will get the Order Papers and then I will address member Nkondlo. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We cannot proceed with the Sitting [Interjections, speaking simultaneously]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Acting Chairperson, can I suggest that we proceed once the Order Papers have arrived. We need Order Papers, it is completely unprofessional that we do not have Order Papers, but that we are expected to continue a sitting.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members, the Order Papers are being distributed.

An HON MEMBER: Full House. [Interjections.] [Members shouting.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members, hon members!

[Interjections.] Order, members, members on both sides of the House.

[Interjections.] Members, can I just get an indication as to who must still receive their Order Papers? We have noted the members that are still to receive Order Papers. I just ask a bit of patience, members.

Members, at this stage can we deal with the opening remarks in the meantime? That does not necessitate for you to have Order Papers. Hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon House Chair, members Kama and Bans had their hands up and they were not recognised. Can you please recognise them? Can they be given an opportunity to raise what they wanted to raise? Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed, I indicated that first the Administration will be dealing with the Order Papers that will be handed out to members. Secondly, we will deal with the opening remarks and then I will take members that do want to or wish to indicate a point of order. That is how we will proceed. Members, in the meantime we are going to deal with the opening remarks. [Interjections.]

Members, in the meantime we are going to deal with the opening remarks. As has been our practice to date, hon members will participate in the Sitting of the House, which is the WCPP, both from here in the Chamber with the Presiding Officer and the Table staff and via Microsoft Teams. Our Standing Rules have accordingly been amended to accommodate such hybrid Sittings of the House. The hon members experiencing challenges in connecting to this Sitting are requested to contact the WCPP ICT colleagues who will assist to resolve their connectivity challenges. Hon members, suppose a member of this House, of this Provincial Parliament, elects to participate virtually and



not from the Chamber, in that case such a member's responsibility is to ensure that he or she has good quality data connectivity, good quality audio and video and that there are no disturbances where they are. Members would note that the hybrid system has been functioning well, poor audio and/or video are not attributed to the system, but rather to the quality of data connectivity.

Hon members, please take note, the media has also been granted access to this MS Teams meeting, as guests of WCPP. However, members of the press may not use the chat room or speak or activate their cameras while the Sitting is in progress. If an individual, who is not a member of this House, activates their mic and video camera such an individual will be exited from the Sitting immediately. I request that those here today who are not members of this House to please observe the decorum of this House. Hon members, you are reminded that no interjections are permitted during these hybrid Sittings. To this end I draw the attention of the hon members to Rule 40 of the Standing Rules. Hon members, there are Rules to this august House.

Let me repeat myself, hon members, there are Rules to this august House. This Parliament is a respected place and in this place where the people of the Western Cape elected their representatives, which are us, hon members, in order for us as hon members of this House to enact laws and conduct our business to the betterment and the welfare of all our people. I wish to call on all members, members to my right as well as members to my left, to adhere today to the order in meetings and to the rules of debate as per Chapter 7 in

our Standing Rules. Now members, before we continue, can I just have an indication if all members have received their Order Papers? Hon Marais is still in need of an Order Paper.

Mr P J MARAIS: Yes. [Laughter.] I just had to say something.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Marais. Are you covered? Thank you very much. Hon members, on... [Interjection.] Hon Sayed, I did not recognise you, please contain yourself. I have indicated that I will address the matter that hon Nkondlo has raised. Can you please provide me with an opportunity to respond?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed, I will not be able...

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I had my hand up, Chair. I am not some child here who is unstable that you can say “please contain yourself.” Give us some respect.

†n AGBARE LID: Ja.

[An HON MEMBER: Yes.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed, are you done?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): We do not want the House to descend into chaos.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Are you done? [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: What is this? [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Hon Bans?

Ms A P BANS: Thank you, thank you, Chairperson. Chairperson, in your opening remarks you said today is an exception, and I think as the House we have accepted not praying, but in your exception as well we are not actually taken into confidence by being told, where is the Speaker? What is the exception? Why is the situation like this today? Can we start there so that we can cooperate in having the House continuing as normal? I do not know why the Deputy Chief Whip is standing up... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Why are you standing up? [Interjections.]

Ms A P BANS: Why is she standing up, because I am still on the floor? [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members! [Interjections.] Hon members!

Ms A P BANS: We are not in a circus here. [Interjections.] We are not in a circus.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Acting Chief Whip...

Ms A P BANS: You are not acknowledged, you must sit down.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Acting Chief Whip, I will recognise you. Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

Ms A P BANS: I am still on the floor. You must sit down! You must sit down!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members!

Ms A P BANS: You must sit down and wait to be recognised. I also... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Bans, hon Bans, please speak to the Chair.

Ms A P BANS: Chair, you must protect me. I was still on the floor. I am still on the floor, while she stood standing. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I have indicated to her to take her seat.

[Interjections.]

Ms A P BANS: She stood while I was on the floor! She stood up while I was on the floor!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, you may continue, hon Bans, thank you.

Ms A P BANS: Chair, I just needed that clarity because we want to cooperate and continue with the meeting, but can you take us into confidence, because we do not know what is happening?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Bans. Hon members, I will repeat myself. We became aware of possible litigation that might impact on WCPP processes and hon members will be kept abreast. Hon members, also note that this matter is not part of the business of today. Therefore I will not entertain any further discussion on this matter.  
[Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: A point of order, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, members. Hon Acting Chief Whip. Please proceed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chairperson, no! Chairperson, no, you

are unfair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You are being unfair. Member Kama had his hand up first, and hon Baartman stands up and you recognise her before that. That is totally unfair! [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Kama, please take your seat. [Interjections] Please take your seat, member Kama!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You must recognise him first. You are completely out of order! [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: The Leader of Government Business as well as, please take your seat. [Interjections, simultaneous shouting.]

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson, why are other people just standing up and you tell them to continue. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, the Leader of Government Business, can I just ask you to take your seat.

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: Hon Chair, hello... [Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: No Chair, no Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Can I please ask you to take your seat.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No Chair, we cannot allow that.  
[interjections]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members! Hon members, member Kama, please put your hand down. I will recognise you, but please put your hand down. It is quite clear, members, it is quite clear for everyone that has got eyes to see what the agenda is today. [interjections, simultaneous shouting.]

And it is quite... [Interjections.] It is quite... [Interjections.] It is quite... [Interjections.] It is quite embarrassing that you use this situation to disrupt the House. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You are not impartial. [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: You are impartial!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members!

Ms R WINDVOGEL: No, you must excuse yourself, Chair!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members! [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: It is your statement... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members. [Interjections.] Hon members. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Kama had his hand up.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member, why are you shouting?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Because you are not listening!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No! You cannot do that! Member Kama... [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: You are also shouting, Chairperson. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Windvogel, member Windvogel!

Mr M KAMA: Thank you very much, Chair. I think, Chair, one thing that has to be accepted is that we are not in a DA caucus. We are in the Legislature, so what you know... [Interjections.]



An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] a caucus DA.

An HON MEMBER: Haibo! [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members! [Interjections, simultaneous shouting.] Members on my right, please. Member Kama, please finish your point of order.

The LEADER OF GOVERNMENT BUSINESS: In the DA we do not shout like that. [Interjections, simultaneous shouting.]

An HON MEMBER: Sit down! [Interjections.]

†n AGBARE LID: Sies man! [Tussenwerpsels.]

[An HON MEMBER: Siss man! [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] ...hon Van der Westhuizen...

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, will you please allow member Kama to finish.

Mr M KAMA: No, thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Chief Whip...

An HON MEMBER: Did you not see member Van der Westhuizen standing up?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I did not see.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Ja, because you do not look at this side.

[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Chief Whip of the Opposition, will you please contain your members in order for us to provide member Kama the opportunity to finish what he started.

Mr M KAMA: No, thank you very much. Thank you very much, Chair. Chair, the point that I am making is that we are definitely not in a DA caucus. We are in the Provincial Parliament. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members on my right. Members, members. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): But why do you not want to listen to the...

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed, you cannot just shout as you please. [Interjections, simultaneous shouting.] Hon members on the right! [Interjections.] Members on the right, will you please afford hon Kama to

finish.

Mr M KAMA: Yes, the point, hon Speaker, is that we are definitely not in a DA caucus. We are in a Provincial Parliament. Now a question is asked as to where is the Speaker, and you have confused me further, because you are now speaking about litigation and all those things that I do not even know what they are about. This House does not know what you are talking about. You might be talking about communications that went somewhere else, hence we are asking where is the Speaker of the House, so that as members of the House, guided by the Rules of the House, we are able to advise in terms of how we should move as per the Rules and the Constitution of the Western Cape. Thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Kama. I recognise the Acting Chief Whip.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Chair. Chair, as you may know, on the Order Paper today under the line, Motion Number 1, deals with matters such as litigation. This motion was brought in terms of Rule 151 by myself yesterday. I consulted the Chief Whips of political parties and where there is no Chief Whip, the leader of the respective Minority Parties, and we are thus waiting so that I am able to move the motion above the line in terms of Rule 20(2) of the Rules of Parliament and the motion is written there for us to see on page 45 of the Order Paper and page 46 of the Order Paper, which is Motion Number 1, dealing with the matter that you have also

indicated. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Acting Chief Whip. I recognise hon Marais.

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Speaker, the Opposition has the right to ask questions. An obligation is on the ruling party to answer to the satisfaction of the person who asked the question. Now I ask you in terms of the question where the Speaker is and media reports, can you confirm or are you prepared to confirm or deny that the Speaker of this House has resigned from the DA and that would explain why he is not here?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

Mr P J MARAIS: Did he resign, can you confirm it or not?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Marais. Hon members, I refer you to the Rule Book. I am not recognising you. I am busy speaking, hon Sayed. [Interjections.] In terms of Rule 26:

“Whenever the Speaker is absent or otherwise unable to perform the functions of the office of the Speaker or whenever the office is vacant:

(a) The Deputy Speaker or...” [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): My hand is up, you do not recognise me?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: (b)

“If there is no Deputy Speaker, a temporary Presiding Officer designated by a resolution of the House, acts as the Presiding Officer.”

Now hon members, I will not dwell into any party matters. I cannot give you an answer as to where the Speaker is, hon Marais made mention of media reports, hon members, this is not the business in front of the House today. I am going to give the last opportunity to hon Mackenzie. [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, House Chairperson. I had my hand up earlier on but you did not recognise me. House Chairperson, may I...

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You are not fair! Chair...

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed, you are out of order. Please take your seat.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: House Chairperson, may I? I call on a point of order... [Interjections.] House Chairperson... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please proceed, hon.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Chairperson, can you protect me from the members because I want to raise a point of order? Chairperson, I had my hand up earlier on, and the House – this is not the first time the House was started by

a House Chair, by the way. So in terms of – let me read the Rule. Anyone can start a House Sitting. On page 26 and this is emailed, if they do not have it I can print it, because it seems there is a problem with you to print the documents. On page 26 of the House Rules, approved by members in this House, not outside of this Chamber, it says here, page 26:

“Absence of the Speaker: whenever the Speaker is absent or otherwise unable to perform the functions...” [Interjections.]

Can you... [Interjections.] Speaker, House Chairperson, can you allow me...  
... [interjections, speaking simultaneously]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members!

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Members do not want to listen to the truth.

“Whenever the Speaker is unable to perform the functions of the office of the Speaker, or whether the office is vacant:

(a) The Deputy Speaker or

(b) if there is no Deputy Speaker

a temporary Presiding Officer – which is yourself – may preside over the House.”

So, if people want to know where the Speaker is, the DA, they must go to the DA’s Head Office. By the Rules of this Parliament, you are allowed to preside the House and anyone who does not like the Rules of the House, you must act accordingly. [Interjections, simultaneous shouting.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Mackenzie. Hon members, order! [Interjections.] Order, members! [Interjections, simultaneous shouting.] Members, we will proceed with the business of today.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No Chair, Chairperson... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: The Motion without Notice in terms of Rule 150. [interjections]

An HON MEMBER: House Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I now recognise the Acting Chief Whip.

An HON MEMBER: House Chair, House Chairperson?

An HON MEMBER: It is the ruling faction...

An HON MEMBER: House Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Acting Chief Whip, please proceed.

An HON MEMBER: House Chair.

(Motion)

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, House Chairperson, I move:

That, notwithstanding the provisions of Rule 20(12) [Inaudible – 00:30:23] the motion below the line as printed on the Order Paper. I so move. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: On a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Dugmore, you are not recognised. Please take your seat.

An HON MEMBER: House Chairperson. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: What is your point of order, member?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Member Mackenzie, we are waiting!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: House Chair, the point of order and I would like to refer you to Rule 20(1) of the Provincial Constitution. ... [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: The powers.



The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It says:

“...that the Provincial Parliament must elect a Speaker from amongst its members at the first Sitting after election, or, where necessary, to fill a vacancy.”

Now it is clear, House Chair, that from this motion below the line here, there is at one level information given to us that there has been some or other process and there is reference to a former Speaker so that is the clearest indication that we do not have a Speaker and the clearest indication that in fact his membership of his party has been removed and he is no longer a member of that House. So, when a vacancy arises, we, and then you go on:

“...that a Judge designated by the President of the ConCourt must preside over the election of the Speaker.”

That is the crisis that we have. We have a vacancy so to go and quote, as one of the hon members do, Rule 26, which says “that whenever the Speaker is absent...” The Speaker is not absent.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: He is not absent.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: He does not – there is no Speaker, “...and/or otherwise unable to perform his function.” [Interjections, simultaneous shouting.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: He is not there. We do not have a Speaker! [Interjections, simultaneous shouting.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order members!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Chair, we want you to provide this House with evidence, because there is confusion now. Where are the correspondences from the political party that indicates that he is no longer a member? We want to see that. So once we establish that there is a vacancy we want to adjourn this House to contact the Constitutional Court and elect a Speaker. There are many things that we are going to decide here. We do not have a Speaker of this House. We need to elect a Speaker. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, order, members! Acting Chief Whip.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Sorry, maybe because I am short you cannot necessarily see my hand. I am so used in the House we have to rise when you raise a point of order, but House Chairperson, in terms of Section ... [Interjection.]

Mr M XEGO: But when are we being recognised, Chair?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...of the Constitution, when someone has lost their membership, there cannot then be the Speaker, first of all. Second of all... [Interjections.]

HON MEMBERS: Yes, yes.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Second of all, House Chairperson. [Interjections, simultaneous shouting.] Chair, please protect me. [Interjections.] Please protect me.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members, hon members, member Marran.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Chairperson, I would like to continue.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Marran. [Interjections.] You do not know your name now, member Marran?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): May I continue?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Can you please provide the Acting Chief Whip an opportunity.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Chair. I would like to

continue. As the Opposition will see, for example, in subsection C after the “resolves” of the motion, it reads, a motion that we still need to move:

“...that for as long as the position of Speaker remains vacant the Secretary of the Legislature may perform the functions pertaining to the receipt and communication of statutory and relevant information and documentation.”

In terms of the Financial Management of Parliament and Provincial Legislatures Act (FMPPLA), with all due respect, Temporary House Chair, you cannot communicate that to us. The Secretary is unable to communicate information to us until we move this resolution, which is on the Paper today in order for us to deal with it so that the Secretary is able to send out the respective information. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No ways! Where are you getting that?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, members!

An HON MEMBER: Calm down!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Acting Chief Whip. Thank you, members. We need to get to the motion and more clarity with indeed be provided. In terms of Motion without Notice, I recognise the Acting Chief Whip. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson, Chair... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Acting Chief Whip.

Mr M KAMA: Chair, on a point of order. [Interjections, simultaneous shouting.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, no ways!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, members!

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson, on a point of order, on a point of order. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order members! Members, I am not recognising you.

Mr M KAMA: House Chair, you do not have a choice.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Kama.

Mr M XEGO: House Chairperson.

Mr M KAMA: You do not have a choice.

Mr M XEGO: House Chairperson.

Mr M KAMA: You do not have a choice.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Kama.

An HON MEMBER: House Chairperson.

Mr M KAMA: You do not have a choice.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Kama, member Sayed.

Mr M KAMA: No, it is not a choice!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I am not recognising you.

Mr M KAMA: It is not a choice!

Mr M XEGO: But House Chairperson...

Mr M KAMA: It is not a choice!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members, the Acting Chief Whip must just provide an explanation ... [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: There are also hands online, House Chairperson, that are online.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...and in term of the motion that is currently on the Order Paper. [Interjections.]

Mr M XEGO: No man, no, you cannot ... [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please continue, Acting Chief Whip.

Mr M XEGO: We are here online. We wanted to speak, man, and we have been having our hands up and you are not recognising us.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Chair, can you give me some protection.

An HON MEMBER: Can we be recognised?

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson, on a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members... [Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA: We are rising on a point of order, Chair.

(Motion)

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): I give notice that I shall move the motion

as printed in my name on the Order Paper for today. I thank you.

Mr M XEGO: We are also members of this House. We want to be recognised.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Acting Chief Whip.

Mr M XEGO: Chairperson, on a point of order, Chair?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Are there any objections to the motion?

Mr M XEGO: A point of order!

HON MEMBERS: No, no, no. [Simultaneous shouting.]

Mr M XEGO: A point of order, Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Motion agreed to.

An HON MEMBER: A point of order, Chair.

Mr M KAMA: Chair, there is no motion agreed.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I now recognise the Acting Chief Whip.



An HON MEMBER: The arrogance of members!

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson, on a point of order. [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: No way, what is happening?

Ms A P BANS: On a point of order, Chair. [Interjections, simultaneous shouting.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: Where, where was the motion read?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, members. Member Kama, unless you are... [Interjections.]

Ms A P BANS: On a point of order, Chair!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Nkondlo! Member Nkondlo!

Ms A P BANS: No, Chair. Chair, on a point of order.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: On a point of order.

Ms A P BANS: On a point of order, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Bans, please take your seat.

You have not been recognised.

Ms A P BANS: No Chair, but this side... [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please take your seat.

Ms A P BANS: No, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member, please take your seat.

Ms A P BANS: No Chair. You cannot, we are raising hands online.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Bans.

Ms A P BANS: And then you are saying we must take a seat... [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Bans!

Ms A P BANS: No, Chair, no, it does not work that way.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Bans, please take your seat.

Ms A P BANS: No Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Sayed, I have not recognised

you.

Mr M KAMA: Have you recognised the Leader of the Opposition?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: LOGB, can I please ask you...

Mr M KAMA: Have you recognised the leader [Interjection.]

Mr M XEGO: Can you recognise us online?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Kama?

Mr M KAMA: Can you recognise me?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No-no-no, do not speak.

Mr M XEGO: Can you recognise us, we are online.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please take your seat.

Ms A P BANS: On a point...

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Kama, turn off your mic and put your hand down. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: No, I want to speak, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I am addressing you member Kama.

Mr M XEGO: So he must stand up. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Kama, there are Rules to this House and all hon members, because you do not like what you hear, does not give you a reason to disrupt the proceedings of this House. So unless you are not rising on a point of order, as per the Rules of this House, I will not recognise you. I recognise the Acting Chief Whip. [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson, you also cannot choose to listen to what you like. It is not possible.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Chair.

Mr M KAMA: You cannot choose to listen to what you want to, you like, a point of order, Chair.

(Motion)

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Chair, I must now move:

That the House, in circumstances where:

(i) the former Speaker of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament (“the

Legislature”) lost his membership of the Legislature on 28 November 2022...” [Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: A point of order, Chairperson, we are not listening to that. That is just... [Interjections.]

Mr M XEGO: Can we be recognised online, House Chair, we are also here as part of this House. Can we be recognised?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): [Reading from Motion]

“...in accordance with Section 106(3)(c) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996...”

Mr M XEGO: Mama Philander, can we be recognised?

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): [Reading from Motion]

(ii) Section 29 of the Powers, Privileges and Immunities of Parliament and Provincial Legislatures Act, 2004, of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa...”

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson, a point of order.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): [Reading from Motion]

“...together with the State Liability Act, 1957, provides that the Speaker of the Legislature is the nominal defendant or respondent

in litigation against the; and...” [Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson, on a point of order. Order, Chairperson.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): [Reading from Motion]

(iii) at this moment, the Legislature does not have a Speaker...

[Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: Order!

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA):

“Therefore resolves:

(a) That the Secretary of the Legislature is hereby authorised...”

An HON MEMBER: Order! [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Is that what we are doing now?

Mr M KAMA: Order, Chairperson.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): [Reading from Motion]

“...hereby authorised to act on behalf of the Legislature in respect of any litigation...”

Ms R WINDVOGEL: What is she reading, what is she reading?

Mr M KAMA: Order Chair, on a point of order, on a point of order, Chairperson.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): [Reading from Motion]

“...in which the Legislature is cited or may become cited until such a time as the Legislature again has a Speaker .” [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: What is she reading?

Mr M KAMA: We are rising on a point of order.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: What is that there, what is that?

Mr M KAMA: A point of order, Chair.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): [Reading from Motion]

“(b) and for the Secretary to report regularly to the House...”

An HON MEMBER: What is happening?

Mr M KAMA: Order, Chair. [Laughter]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): [Reading from Motion]

“...in respect of the Secretary’s performance of the obligations in

paragraph (a) above; and...”

Ms R WINDVOGEL: What is she reading? What is happening?

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson, a point of order.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: What is she reading, a point of order?

Mr M KAMA: We are not even hearing what she is saying.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: (?) Chair, a point of order!

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): [Reading from Motion]

(c) that, for as long as the position of Speaker remains vacant...”

Ms R WINDVOGEL: A point of order, Chair.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): [Reading from Motion]

“...the Secretary of the Legislature may perform the functions pertaining to the receipt and communication...” [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: A point of order, Chair.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): [Reading from Motion]

“...of statutory and relevant information and documentation.”



I so move.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: A point of order, Chair, a point of order, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Acting Chief Whip.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: A point of order!

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: This is what happens when [Inaudible.] [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Are there any objections to the motion? [Interjections, simultaneous shouting]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: A point of order, Chair, a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No objections? The motion is agreed to.

An HON MEMBER: No! [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I recognise the hon Kama. [Interjections.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: What is that? Why are they clapping hands?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No members.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please members, on the left and the right. I recognise the hon Kama online or rather member Xego.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chairperson, may I address you?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Xego, member Xego, online.

An HON MEMBER: You must sit down.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Xego?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): May I raise a point of order, Chair. [Interjections.]

Mr M XEGO: House Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Xego.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chairperson... [Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: She is having a meeting with them. You are having a meeting with the DA members. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Sit down!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Xego. [Interjections.]

Mr M XEGO: Yes, yes, yes.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: It is a DA caucus, it is a DA caucus now.  
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Mesuli!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Kama.

Mr M XEGO: I would love to proceed.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Kama, put your mic off. Unless you are rising on a point of order, I will not recognise you.

Mr M KAMA: When you say a point of order, what do you mean, Chair?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: What is your point of order, member

Kama?

Mr M KAMA: So it means nothing has happened so far, Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members, members, on this side, please.

What is your point of order, member Kama?

Mr M KAMA: No thank you very much. Thank you very much, Chairperson.  
Chair. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: On a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, hon members, hon members on the left and the right.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Hey, the Leader of Government Business.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Nkondlo, member Windvogel, are you even now disrupting your own member for the sake of disrupting.  
[Interjections.]

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson.

Ms N D NKONDLO: We have Parliament here, we do not have to think about our own members. [Interjection.]

Mr M KAMA: Chairperson!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members on the left as well as hon members on the right.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chairperson, may I address you?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Sayed, I am not recognising you.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I raised a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Kama is on the floor.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Okay, but I raised a point of order before member Kama. In fact after the first motion you made a ruling, I raised a point. You did not recognise me.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please proceed, hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, Chairperson. Chairperson, I would want to bring your attention to the fact that when the first motion was moved by the Acting Deputy Chief Whip, you then put it to a vote and everybody that side said yes, and I said here: "No!" You did not even bother to look on

this side. You only concentrated on that side and as a matter of procedure, Chairperson, you were supposed to have seen that there was or heard that there was an objection, and you were supposed to follow the proper processes that are to be followed. Now you have gone further to a second motion. Now that again, Chair, I stood here and decided to sit back again. You allowed member Mesuli to speak on whatever point of order that he was going to raise and I am pleading with you, Chairperson, to be procedural when dealing with these issues in order to avoid havoc, because clearly you did not even look at this side. You did not even bother to listen. I did raise an objection and in accordance to that Rule specifically, Rule 50, Rule 150, you were supposed to have used what is necessary or at your disposal to make sure that you proceed with the process of the motion properly. Now you have gone further to the second motion, and you approved the second motion without due consideration of other people. Now I am pleading with you, Chairperson, to be procedural. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Lekker, and please let me enlighten you on the fact that I am aware in terms of the procedure. Now how am I supposed to even hear your objection if your members cannot contain themselves? It is unacceptable member...

An HON MEMBER: They are not listening.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...to even hear anything during this noise. Hon Sayed, are you raising on a point of order and on which Rule are

you rising?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon House Chair, thank you very much. I am rising on Rule 132. I am calling for a division of the motion that was just passed because you did not even give us a chance. This is why, hon House Chair, you need to recognise everyone when we put our hands up. It is not that we are trying to be funny... [Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you so much.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, we need a division, I am calling in terms of Rule 132 for a division on the motion that was just passed, because, I mean, the House is descending into a circus because of the manner in which you are chairing the Sitting, the manner in which you are chairing this particular Sitting.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Sayed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Do not allow DA internal politics to descend this House into chaos.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Sayed. Thank you very much, hon members. I recognise the hon Acting Chief Whip.  
[Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: You are embarrassing...

An HON MEMBER: You are!

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible.] ...making a mockery.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Chair, would you like me to repeat the motion? [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, please. [Interjections.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Chair, I move Motion 1 on the Order Paper. ... [Interjections.]

Mr M XEGO: But before the Motion... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Mackenzie, please take your seat, hon Acting Chief Whip.

Mr M XEGO: Before the motion, no, Chair, you recognised me.



The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Mackenzie, can I please ask for you to cooperate in this regard.

Mr M XEGO: But before hon Mackenzie you did recognise me, House Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: The Acting Chief Whip will be repeating the second motion, but before we proceed, hon Xego's hand has been up for a while. Hon Xego, please proceed.

Mr M XEGO: Hon Xego, please proceed.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: But what about the division? What about that?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: That is on the second motion, member, which the Acting Chief Whip... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No, the very first one, you did not allow.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, Chair.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: That is the point.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No, no, I could not hear anything from

this side, member Dugmore. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: That is what we pointed out to you that we did not agree on... [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Xego.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chairperson, on a point of order, Chair.

Mr M XEGO: Thank you, House Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Xego, are you there?

Mr M XEGO: Yes, I am here, House Chair. Can you hear me? Am I audible?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: You are being told that you did not follow 132.

Mr M XEGO: Am I audible, House Chair?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Yes, House Chair, am I audible?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Ja.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Is he responding?

An HON MEMBER: You made an excuse, but in a way... [Inaudible.]

Mr M XEGO: Am I audible?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Xego.

Mr M XEGO: Yes, House Chair, am I audible?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members, order, please. Members.

Mr M XEGO: Am I audible, House Chair?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Ministers Mitchell and Simmers!

Mr M XEGO: Am I audible, House Chair?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Xego, please proceed.

†n AGBARE LID: Jy het gelieg!

[An HON MEMBER: You lied!]

Mr M XEGO: Yes, thanks, House Chair. To be honest, it is a worrying

matter how motions were seriously moved without us here. We are part and parcel of this House. We are online, we have not heard a single word that was said there. There is a thing that you have raised earlier on, on the issue of litigations that this House might be facing, and here we are having moved things that we did not hear a single thing of. Is it possible that we can go back to the first because we did not hear anything; you might have heard each other there in the House from the first motion, the second motion, and whatever, but here where we are seated, we did not hear anything. So we do not know what you are moving and who has managed to move in what direction, but can we be able to be taken into the entire process that is supposed to be, because in most instances when we are calling point of orders, you would say as people that are presiding over these meetings, you could not be able to hear because of the heckling that is happening in the House. But we see today the bulldozing and the steamrolling of the process with all the heckling that is happening in the House with us not having heard a single word what is going on there. It is a circus that is going on there. Can we be taken through the proper process, please?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Xego.

I recognise the Acting Chief Whip. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: No-no-no. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed, are you rising on a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, Chair, yes, again I am continuing to raise on the point of order that the first Motion, Chair, and it is also unfair, my sound has been put off.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Secretary, are we allowed to go back?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order members!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Sayed.  
Please proceed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, unfortunately not being able to listen to this side of the House is not an excuse for not adhering to the Rules. I raised the point of order in terms of Rule 132 that the first motion should have gone through a division. That division was not called for. I am asking that a division takes place. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed, there was not an issue in doing so. The issue is not allowing the Acting Chief Whip to continue.

An HON MEMBER: No.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, we are suspending the proceedings for five minutes. [Interjections.] Five minutes, thank you.

Business of the House was suspended for 12 minutes and resumed at ...

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon members, please do take your seats. Hon members, in order for us to proceed with our business for today, may I please ask members on both sides to please keep your interjections, please keep the noise levels down. It is extremely difficult when a motion is moved to hear members and that is not intentionally. This is the situation that you cannot hear if someone objects.

Members in terms of the first motion, which was agreed to, the second motion will deal with that of precedence, and I will now recognise the Acting Chief Whip.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Can we just get clarity, Speaker, I mean, Chairperson, on what you have conveyed to the House. Are you saying that Motion Number 1 about the Acting Chief Whip of the Majority Party, that that motion has been adopted by the House, even though it has been brought to your attention by our Deputy Chief Whip that there should be a division and you said you could not hear it. So, I do not see how it is possible to pass something when your attention has been drawn to the fact according to a Rule that we want a division on that matter, so we are requesting you, can you please call a division on that one?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Dugmore. I have made a ruling that in terms of the situation at current there were no objections recorded that could not have been heard... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Uh-uh, no ways, no ways, no.

An HON MEMBER: Haibo!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, No-no-no, no.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Not a division?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members, I have made a ruling in that regard. I recognise the Premier. [Interjections.]

The PREMIER: Thank you, thank you very much, House Chair. I think in the interests of proceeding in this House, and I know you have made a ruling, but could I request that perhaps we actually go back to item 1, and we actually go through it again and if there is an objection, we can note the objection.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Will that satisfy you, members?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: As long as we know that, so

you take instructions from the Executive?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Members, we... [Interjection.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No, yes, that is what we ask for. That is what we are asking for.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: That is what we are asking for, but if it takes an instruction from the Executive, it is fine. We just want a division, thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Hon members, order! I recognise now the Motion without Notice in terms of Rule 150, the Acting Chief Whip on the first Motion. Order, members.

(Motion)

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Chair, I move Motion Number 1 under the line, in my name.

That the House, in circumstances where:

- (i) the former Speaker of the Western Cape Provincial Parliament (“the Legislature”) lost his membership of the Legislature on 28 November 2022 in accordance with Section 106(3)(c) of the



Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996; and

(ii) Section 29 of the Powers, Privileges and Immunities of Parliament and Provincial Legislatures Act, 2004, together with the State Liability Act, 1957, provides that the Speaker of the Legislature is the nominal defendant or respondent in litigation against the Legislature; and

(iii) at this moment, the Legislature does not have a Speaker,

Therefore resolves:

(a) That the Secretary of the Legislature is hereby authorised to act on behalf of the Legislature in respect of any litigation in which the Legislature is cited or may become cited until such a time as the Legislature again has a Speaker; and

(b) for the Secretary to report regularly to the House in respect of the Secretary's performance of the obligations in paragraph (a) above; and

(c) that, for as long as the position of Speaker remains vacant, the Secretary of the Legislature may perform the functions pertaining to the receipt and communication of statutory and relevant information and documentation.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Acting Chief Whip. Are there any objections, members?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, yes.

Ms R WINDVOGEL: There is a hand.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): There is a hand up.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Objections will be so recorded.

Mr M KAMA: Chair, on a point of order. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Kama, why are you on your feet?

Mr M KAMA: I am rising on a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: What is your point of order and on what Rule, member?

Mr M KAMA: I do not know if I heard correctly, Chairperson, I heard the Acting Chief Whip talking about a motion that is below the line and my understanding – can you protect me from the Acting Chief Whip, please Chair, and my understanding is that a notice has not been given for this Motion. I heard her saying “the motion under the line.” That is why I am raising, I heard her saying “the motion under the line.”

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you very much, member Kama. Please take your seat. I am just taking advice from the Secretary. [Pause.] Thank you very much, Secretary. Order, members.

Members, the first motion that was passed dealt with precedence, and that is exactly what the Acting Chief Whip will now be addressing, as member Kama indicated, of the motion below the line, once we afford her the opportunity to rise for the next motion. Acting Chief Whip.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, Chair. I moved this motion as a Notice of Motion yesterday in terms of Rule 151 in terms of how you move a Notice of Motion. Earlier in this sitting I asked for precedence which was approved and now I am moving because of the precedence, the Notice of Motion Number 1, which we have given precedence to in this House. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Acting Chief Whip. Members, are there any objections to the motion?

HON MEMBERS: No, no.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chairperson, yes. Chairperson?

An HON MEMBER: What is the question?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Are you rising on a point of order, hon Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, hon Chairperson. In terms of firstly a couple of issues here. Rule 132, again, Chair, I called for a division. I called for a division before we broke so that we can have a division on the first motion. You then adjourned. You then left. I want to also understand what that adjournment was for, because in terms of Rule 134, which states:

“If the required number of members support the demand for a division, the division bells must be rung...”

There were no division bells rung:

“...and the doors locked as soon as, after the lapse of three minutes as the Presiding Officer may direct.”

None of that happened. It is almost as if it was just a leg-stretch that took place. Can we please adhere to the Rules and procedures and be procedural and not descend us into chaos? [Interjections.] Because it clearly seems as if the hon House Chairperson is being managed by the Executive. Maybe the Executive, the Head of the Executive must tell us whether the hon Speaker resigned, or he was pushed to resign, like the DA did with the hon Marais when he was the Mayor. Thank you. [Interjections.]

[Pause.] [Interjections, speaking simultaneously.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, members! Members, hon Dugmore, thank you very much. Hon members, the first motion in terms of precedence were dealt with. That Motion was dealt with. We now need to afford the Acting Chief Whip... [Interjections.]

Mr P MARRAN: Says who?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Member Marran...

Mr P MARRAN: Yes?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You need to raise a point of order if you want to speak. Do you have a point of order, hon Marran?

Mr P MARRAN: No, I do not have, none. Myself and member Dugmore... do object... – Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, I recognise the Acting Chief Whip.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, Chair, again, on another point of order... [Interjections, simultaneous shouting]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please proceed, Acting Chief Whip.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Chair, I move the Motion number 1 that we moved in terms of precedence above the line that is in my name. [Interjections.] [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Chair, you are... [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, are there any objections to the motion? [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: On a point of order.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Dugmore, hon Dugmore. Hon members, we cannot continue like this. You do not – no!

An HON MEMBER: [Inaudible – microphone muted.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No, you do not listen! Now you keep on asking the same questions.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): No, I am not.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Sayed, hon Sayed, hon Sayed, as Acting Chairperson, I will not be bullied by you. [Interjections.] I will not be bullied by you.

An HON MEMBER: Chairperson, member Khalid... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): You are bullying everybody here.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, I am asking for a

suspension... [Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: There was no process.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, I am asking for a five-minute suspension... [Interjection.]

Ms R WINDVOGEL: Chairperson, there was no process...

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ...to deliberate with the Chief Whips of the parties. Thank you.

[Business of the House was suspended for 45 minutes and resumed at ...]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members, we have had quite an afternoon, but we did have a very fruitful discussion with the various Whips of the parties and members, it is quite unfortunate that during our first session of our proceedings that we unfortunately were unable to conduct our business in an orderly way. Members, I do want to apologise from my side in terms of, as the members indicated, not hearing the various objectives (verbatim) coming from this side. It was extraordinary circumstances which made it very difficult to do so. Hon members, on the way forward, the first motion has been passed, and therefore we have agreed to continue with the business of today and I will be recognising the Acting Chief Whip.

Thank you.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, House Chair. I hereby give notice that I shall move:

That, in terms of Section 62(5) of the National Constitution, read with Section 2(3) of the National Council of Provinces (Permanent Delegates Vacancies) Act, 1997 (Act 17 of 1997), Mr Frederik Jacobus Badenhorst be appointed as a permanent delegate to the National Council of Provinces. I so move.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Acting Chief Whip. Hon members, are there any objection to the motion? No objection? Motion agreed to. Thank you very much, members.

### **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: The Secretary will now read the First Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of principle of the Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill [B 3–2022]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Secretary. I now recognise the hon Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank



you, hon Chairperson, hon members of the House. Two days ago, we welcomed the good news that 85 000 jobs were created in the Western Cape in Quarter 3 according to the latest quarterly Labour Force Survey. This means that more than 203 000 jobs were created in the Western Cape year-on-year. We also welcomed the news that not only had more jobs been created in this province, but that the Western Cape's expanded unemployment rate decreased by 1,8 percentage points quarter-on-quarter and by 0.8 percentage points year-on-year, and while the unemployment rate is still far too high, the Western Cape's unemployment rate is 13,6% lower than the national unemployment rate.

While we are making progress, the headwinds remain powerful. Our country grapples with sluggish economic growth, high levels of unemployment and poverty, significant debt service costs, a rising cost of living, and especially a debilitating energy crisis. We also face a budget squeeze provincially as a direct consequence of years of corruption and state capture.

In the face of this and to set out our plan towards a better future, on Thursday last week, I had the honour of tabling before this House, the Medium Term Budget Policy Statement, and the Adjustment Budget for the 2022/23 financial year, which sets out a framework for hope and this Government's path from recovery to growth, which we are debating in this House today, eventually.

While I share the framework and the scaffolding, the departmental details per

vote have been deliberated upon in the Standing Committees and will be further debated in coming days. To keep us on course, and to respond to immediate pressure in the 2022/23 financial year, we will use the Budget Adjustment to adjust our sails so that citizens are cared for. We will do this by making provision for a net addition of R490,6 million in expenditure for the 2022/23 financial year. Although we have welcomed 85 000 more jobs in quarter three, there are still too many people across this province who remain unemployed and who are unable to put food on the table for their families and so through this Adjustment Budget, we will allocate R25 million in the short term to fund food relief initiatives. On the frontlines and our communities responding to the very real distress that families face, which includes the scourge of gender-based violence, our social workers are struggling with overwhelming case loads. To help alleviate their burden so that they can continue to make inroads in helping and providing care for citizens, R43,9 million will be allocated to fund additional social workers and alleviate pressure on case loads.

Overall, in 2022/23, to keep us on our course from recovery to growth and to give full effect to our framework for hope, we will have allocated R54,7 billion to our Wellbeing Priority, R15,8 billion to our Growth for Jobs Priority, and R2,65 billion to our Safety Priority. We do, however, face significant uncertainty in our ability to plan spending over the MTEF due to the ongoing public sector wage negotiations. Over the past few years, we focused on maintaining fiscal sustainability through prudent cost of employment expenditure and headcount management.

During the Adjustment Budget process, a differentiated funding approach was applied after considering the current financial position and headcount levels of each department. Going forward, the uncertainty caused by the ongoing wage negotiations continue. While we have welcomed assurance by National Government to not pass the cost on of agreements reached to provinces, this commitment only extends to the 2022/23 financial year, meaning we are not adequately able to plan over the medium term. We will however, continue to engage with the National Government in a bid to gain more certainty and we will of course, monitor the situation closely.

While we do face uncertainty, this framework for hope guides us towards a future with economic growth that leads to opportunity and job creation, a future which is safe and nurturing, no matter where you live; a future where your life journey is full of care. In this relentless pursuit, as ever, we are guided by our North Star Priorities of Jobs, Safety and Wellbeing, which are the key components for real change and our reason for hope.

Chairperson, over the 2023 Medium Term Expenditure Framework, as a result of changes and how the Provincial Equitable Share is calculated, as I set out previously, we will be receiving R1,92 billion rand less for the horizontal division. Fortunately, over this period, additional allocations for service delivery pressures as well as conditional grants allocated to provinces from the National Government will offset this decline marginally allowing for a narrow 2,2% increase in funding for the Province over the MTEF. The fact

remains we are going to have to do more with much less, and we will do so. We will face these challenges head on, guided by sound budget principles, which have stood us in good stead and which were pointed out by the Auditor-General in the Consolidated General Report on National and Provincial Audit Outcomes for 2021/22. When she said that, and I quote:

“In 2021/22 the consistent positive pattern of prior years continued, reflecting an overall robust control environment with a solid and consistent pattern of good financial governance. This positive reflection highlighted the tone set by the accounting officers and authorities, instilling a culture of doing the right thing, being accountable and improving controls as key elements in achieving and sustaining clean audit outcomes...”

And our framework for hope will be guided by these principles as we:

- (1) act to protect our core mandates to deliver life-saving and life-changing services, such as healthcare, basic education and social services;
- (2) as we embrace innovative solutions and focus on programmes that maximise impact in our priorities of growth for jobs, safety and wellbeing;
- (3) as we act to enhance our Government's productivity by ruthlessly focusing on doing more with less to deliver value for money projects.

Overall to give effect to this framework for hope, the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement has a total of R1,28 billion to spending over the next three

years, bringing the total estimated expenditure for the Western Cape over the 23 MTEF to R230,82 billion. To give effect to this framework for hope and deliver on our priority of growth for jobs, we will add R466,5 million to the new Infrastructure and Mobility Departments over the MTEF, while R257,3 million will be added to our Education and Health Departments to expand critical infrastructure.

Over the MTEF we are planning to spend R31,17 billion on infrastructure in the Western Cape. The importance of infrastructure in facilitating economic growth cannot be understated. In fact, adequate and cost-effective infrastructure is a prerequisite for growth, with the National Development Plan targeting a 30% gross fixed capital formation contribution to GDP to ensure accelerated economic growth, and we, as Government, are responsible for a significant portion of this gross fixed capital formation with a third needing to come from the public sector. In the Western Cape, we are working hard to reach that third and pushing to reach 30% because according to estimates, this investment in infrastructure could contribute an additional R88,8 billion to GDP, which is why after this adjustment the Western Cape Government's infrastructure budget for 2022/23 allocates R3,5 billion to economic infrastructure; R3,9 billion to social infrastructure, and R2,4 billion for various cross district infrastructure allocations. This means that in 2022/23 financial year, we have allocated R1 billion for education infrastructure, R823 million for health infrastructure, and R2,144 million for human settlements and this infrastructure investment is spread across the Western Cape with R3,6 billion allocated in the City of Cape Town; R637

million allocated in the West Coast district; R958 million allocated in the Overberg district; R935 million allocated in the Cape Winelands District, R1 billion allocated in the Garden Route district, and R325 million allocated in the Central Karoo district.

With low levels of economic growth in South Africa worsened now by loadshedding, it is critical that we help unlock much higher levels of economic growth in the Western Cape, so that we can create opportunity. To give effect to this framework of hope and to deliver on our safety priority we will allocate an additional R200 million over the MTEF to continue the Law Enforcement Advancement Program, ensuring that Boots on the Ground in crime hotspots continue to save lives. This means that over the MTEF, we will allocate just under a billion rand to LEAP. We do this firstly, because we know that our citizens are not safe and do not feel safe and they will not be able to live a life they value unless they feel safe and are safe.

Secondly, we are investing in significant funds because the National Government is not investing enough in safety. In fact, we now have fewer SAPS members per 100 000 residents than we did a decade ago and as we continue to leverage our constitutionally mandated police oversight role to ensure that SAPS has the resources that it needs to do its job properly, the safety of our residents will continue to be an apex priority for this Government.

Prevention is another key focus in increasing safety. Using our rich health data we will continue to implement targeted responses that work in our

communities, such as strengthening relationships between caregivers, better support for youth at risk, reducing alcohol-related harms and preventing gender-based violence.

To give effect to this framework of hope we will add R246.5 million to the well-being priority over the MTF to support a comprehensive response to the very real social distress being experienced in our communities. This includes funding for an additional 170 social workers in the Western Cape.

Overall Health and Education will receive the lion's share of the Western Cape's budget with a combined allocation of R168.69 billion, or 73,1% of the total budget over this period and to make sure that we are prepared to respond to unforeseen events, we will also recharge our provincial reserves with R1.46 billion so that if the unexpected occurs we will be able to respond rapidly and decisively.

I look forward to debating this budget and hope to hear constructive feedback and viable proposals on how we can collectively work even harder to ensure residents have access to opportunities to live a life they value.

In conclusion, hon Chairperson, we have a clear view of where we are going, our destination of a better future for our citizens. We have a framework of hope guided by our North Star priorities of delivering opportunity, safety and wellbeing for our citizens. We have adjusted our sails in the face of significant challenges so that we remain on course and so that we are able to

respond to the needs of our communities and we will remain relentless in our pursuit of a future characterized by economic growth, opportunity, safety and care, thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Minister. I now recognise hon member Dugmore.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Thank you very much, hon House Chair.

Hon House Chair, we note from the Order Paper that the MEC for Finance will also be speaking at the end and therefore I would like to ask you at the beginning of my speech to please respond to two issues in particular.

Number one, there has been a lot of fanfare about allocations to Education in regard to extra infrastructure. What would I like to ask is will that infrastructure be ready by the beginning of the new school year? We cannot leave a single child behind. We need to make sure that every child has a place in school.

So it is one thing to make announcements, but can you give this House that guarantee that the infrastructure will be ready for the 2023 school year?

Secondly, I would request the MEC to respond as to why, given that in so many of the adjustment votes there have been costs of employment returned



back to the Treasury, given commitments around job creation and also looking at the initiatives that our President has taken in regard to public employment, what were the reasons why the Provincial Treasury and the Cabinet did not decide to use those savings from not having made appointments, to actually embark on short-term public employment schemes which clearly would bring relief to those in our province who are unemployed? What were the reasons that you did not do that? Because it is clear that the only public employment that this province talks about are the national ones, expanded public works, etcetera, which are nationally funded.

This Province does not allocate its own resources from provincial reserves to public employment, but, hon House Chair, when our hon Minister of Finance, Enoch Gondwana, tabled the 2022 medium-term budget policy statement, he quoted our former President Nelson Mandela and I would like to quote again what our former President said, and I quote:

"Democracy will have low content and indeed will be short-lived if we cannot address our socio-economic problems within an expanding and growing economy."

The quality of democracy in the Western Cape depends on the quality of the life lived by the people of this province. While we may seriously question the understanding of democracy and democratic practices by the governing party in this province, despite having the word "democratic" in their name, that is a debate for another day.

So clearly the focus of today's debate should be on the socio-economic problems within an expanding and growing economy as pointed out by former President Mandela.

At a principled level our country needs a serious debate about what our economy needs right now to ensure growth, employment and reducing inequality. In this respect I agree with the hon MEC when she said we need to have a frank conversation about it in this House. "It" being the cuts, but I would think that she would encourage a broader discussion as well.

In fact, the MEC goes so far as to say that the consequences of not doing so, i.e., not having this frank discussion, will be severe, especially for the poor hopefully and she will agree that the African, Coloured and Indian population [Inaudible.] of our province and country, need the urgent attention.

We have always maintained that the blaming and pointing of fingers in any direction will not help and blame is not going to help our people. The MEC in her input just made the point, for instance, about the low unemployment levels in the Western Cape, but I think we should be honest with each other that whichever party has governed the Western Cape post 1994, the lowest unemployment rates have always been in the Western Cape.

In fact when the ANC was governing the unemployment rate was in fact lower than it currently is, but then I must not take cheap shots and be

populace either because we have at this period just emerged out of a COVID period, we are trying to grow the economy, but when one does not acknowledge those realities one falls into a trap of populism and not actually focusing on what this Province in particular needs to do, because blaming will not expand our economy.

What we need to do is to reflect on the discussion, on our Government, I would argue, needing to spend more now to stimulate growth and employment and to put measures in place to reduce the cost of living and the massive impact that the interest rate hikes are having on everyone, especially the middle class. That is a serious issue.

So, this whole debate about whether we spend more now to grow the economy or whether we simply fall into a fiscal austerity mindset without even debating what the impact would be of spending more to stimulate growth, we simply close that debate down. I do not think we are going to be finding solutions because often that debate gets dominated by so-called orthodoxies and they do not actually provide solutions. One can only cite the classical austerity and the disastrous effect that it has in fact had on the UK economy recently.

On a very practical level though our President has been leading from the front in ensuring [Interjections.] – we have a President in this country. He respects the Constitution, he is driving a renewal process, [Interjections.] he respects the laws of our country ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, hon members!

The LEADER OF OPPOSITION: ... the Rules of Parliament and that is what guides us and that is the difference that President Ramaphosa has bring. A commitment that all of us, whoever we are, are bound by the Constitution, the rules of this country.

So let us have confidence in our democracy and how that particular matter will play itself out.

On a very practical level, our President, in the wake of COVID-19 and the sluggish recovery of the global economy, he was emphatic that the growth and recovery plan must have certain critical elements. As reminder these are firstly to achieve sufficient, secure and reliable energy supply.

Now before laughter starts again on the other side, the issue is what do we do as a country when there is serious sabotage of the national grid? You know, do we celebrate that because this is a sign of a so-called ANC failure, or do we actually realise that as a country if we have sabotage, if we have treason and we do not deal with it, and I think all of us must acknowledge that the President has assisted greatly in ensuring that we have a more active and focused NPA, that the SIU is beginning to do its work; that SARS is in a much better situation than it was and in a context such as Eskom we need to understand how important it is to support the attainment of this reliable

energy supply and that is going to mean a just transition.

There is no way that we can have the kind of coal resources that we have in the ground, which are now being exported to European countries, without a transition to renewables that is sustainable and based on a proper baseload and that is why our energy plan includes mixed forms of energy supply.

We have to secondly create, I am talking now about the critical elements, and this is what the President has already delivered on, create and support over 800 000 work opportunities in the immediate term to respond to job losses. It has been our President that has ensured over 900 000 people in fact have been attached to public employment schemes linked to schools.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may wrap up, hon member.

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Our argument is that this province has not done that. Has not utilised those savings in a time of a lack of growth, to boost public employment to help our people. That is what we need. †Ixesha lam liphelile. [My time is up.] Ma'am? [Interjections.]

†The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Ixesha liphelile.

[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Your time is up.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Can we not ask you to clarify the position of the Speaker? [Interjections.] Whether the Speaker is still the

Speaker of the House? [Interjections.] I am sure you can make a very good ruling on that right away.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Dugmore.

I now recognise hon Marais. [Interjections.]

Ms C A T MURRAY: Murray.

†The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Usisi Iowa.

[The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: The lady over there.]

Ms C A T MURRAY: The Scottish one. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon Madam Chair.

Our country is a sleeping giant, and she is unable to wake up. She cannot open her eyes because her very cells, the citizens and residents of this country, cannot provide her with the will that she needs to stand up and stand tall among her fellow continental giants – the USA, Britain, China, Brazil and Australia.

Her cells, which are the very building blocks of her body, are not able to perform their functions to the best of their ability because her organs are constantly being attacked by the cancers of violence, corruption, gangsterism,

poor service delivery, criminality and even indifference.

Day by day she edges closer to her dying day. As she sleeps, she takes solace from the cloak of deep blue that she wears. The colour of the shoreline surrounding our coast, the colour of hope and the colour of the Democratic Alliance, but hon Madam Chair, there is something that is keeping this beautiful creature that we call South Africa alive and that is her most vibrant and vital organ, her heart.

Her heart, or the DA-led Western Cape, is punching well above its weight and helping to prevent these cancers from killing her entirely. Her heart, this heart of the giant, has most recently been provided with invaluable life support when the Provincial Minister of Finance, Mirelle Wenger, tabled the very welcome medium-term budget policy statement.

Minister Wenger explained that the cells of this organ or the people of this province will be enabled to find meaningful work opportunities as almost R16 billion has been allocated towards the growth of the jobs priority for the 2022/23 financial year.

What is more, over R324 million has been additionally allocated to the Provincial Department of Transport and Public Works, of which R196 million will be allocated towards improving transport safety and the Go George public transport system overall. This will ensure that each person can be transported to work and back safely.

As I have previously said, the giant's heart punches well above its weight. This was evidenced by the release of the quarterly Labour Force Survey's report this week. The report highlighted that according to the expanded definition of unemployment, which includes both job seekers and those who are discouraged, that the province has the lowest unemployment rate in the country.

Nationally the average expanded unemployment rate sits at an alarming 43,1%, whereas it stands at 29,5% in the Western Cape. This is 13 percentage points lower than the national average.

The Western Cape has further seen a welcomed quarter on quarter decline in unemployment under the DA. In a statement earlier this week I highlighted that there is certainly more that needs to be done to combat unemployment in this province. [Interjections.] Without jobs our residents are increasingly at risk of social, economic and psychological harm. [Interjections.]

My question, hon Madam Chair ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, hon member.

Ms C A T MURRAY: My question, hon Madam Chair, is if these cells are not able to work how can we hope that our giant will ever wake up and stand tall?



Having said that, if we look at the official unemployment rate, which considers those actively looking for work, the Western Cape once again has the lowest unemployment rate in the country at 24,5%, which is 8,4 percentage points less than the national average. [Interjections.]

Again, there is hope and the heart of the giant is a testament to that ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may sit, hon member. There is a point of order. What is your point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: No-no-no, hon – welcome, hon [Interjections.] House Chairperson, Mama Bakubaku-Vos.

I just want to know whether the hon member is willing to answer a question. It is quite an interesting speech. Is she willing to answer a question there?

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITIONS: [Inaudible.] let her [Inaudible.]

An HON MEMBER: She knows you cannot ask [Inaudible.]. [Interjections]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may continue, hon member.

Ms C A T MURRAY: I am not willing to take a question, hon Madam Chair.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Are you willing to take a question as  
[Interjections.]

Ms C A T MURRAY: No.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay, you may continue. [Interjections.]

Ms C A T MURRAY: Thank you. Again, hon Madam Chair, there is hope and  
the heart of the giant is testament to it.

The DA-led Western Cape Government has further allocated an additional  
R128 million towards infrastructure projects, including roads. Infrastructure  
enables growth as it supports entrepreneurs to grow their businesses. It helps  
workers to get to their jobs and back, and it ensures that our learners arrive  
at school safely. That is why this organ is prioritising, building its very own  
chambers, its valves and its vessels, ensuring that the cells of this heart are  
not left without purpose.

The heart also understands that a job for a sake of a job is not enough. Each  
cell must be engaged in meaningful work opportunities, motivating them to  
continue their important functions. The heart knows that each cell, no matter  
where they are located, must be supported to achieve their utmost potential.

We see this in the SMME booster fund which prioritises, among others,

women. Last year alone 54% of the programme's beneficiaries were women-owned businesses. I also had the privilege of engaging with one of these beneficiaries first-hand when visiting a hair salon and Lesedi Square, Bredasdorp, during a cluster visit this year.

What is more, almost R96 million was allocated this year to the Provincial Department of Economic Opportunities, Skills Development and Innovation Programme. Among other achievements the programme supported 2 429 beneficiaries with skills development, each of whom receives paid experiential learning opportunities, increasing their employability.

These are very important drivers of growth and job creation, ensuring that the heart of the giant maintains its strong pulse. That is why R74,8 million has further been allocated to trade and sector development. This will be supported by the R2,5 million increase from the Main Budget and it includes efforts to increase exports through developing relationships with businesses and international markets and increasing foreign investment into the province.

Wesgro has further secured R5,9 billion which was committed last year, creating 4 445 jobs in the Western Cape.

Hon Speaker, jobs are critically important in creating a strong economy and ensuring that our comatose giant can finally wake up and be taken off of life support. We need jobs so that she can take her place as the economic

hegemony of Africa. However, this is being impeded by the energy crisis.

The giant's nervous system, Eskom, which is responsible for managing each electrical impulse in her body, is failing her. As Minister Wenger explained this year, we have lost a total of 2 932 hours of electricity, which could have been used productively, but we have lost it due to loadshedding, which is not likely to end anytime soon.

That is why this Province or heart is pioneering the Municipal Energy Resilience Initiative, ensuring that our economy and its ability to create jobs are not hampered any further by Eskom.

The Independent Power Producer Programme in the Western Cape, which includes Excelsior Wind Energy Facility and Perdekraal East Wind Farm, was further operationalised in 2022 and it has since seen a total of 139,7 megawatts brought online, considerably reducing dependence on Eskom.

The Western Cape is further finalising its Independent Power Producers Programme's preferred bidder project which will bring 785 megawatts online. We are ...[Intervenens.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Murray, you may sit, there is a point of order. What is your point of order, hon member?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP [ANC]: Hon House Chair, I rise on the point of

order that the hon member is reading the speech. [Interjections.]

She is not supposed to be reading the speech. The Rules do not allow to read the speech. You must – it is a speech. [Interjections.] It is not a reading. [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Workshop! Workshop! [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: That is really not a point of order. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members! Hon members! [Interjections.] There is only one Chair, there is only Chair in this House, hon member Bakubaku-Vos. [Interjections.] There is only Chair ...[Intervenues.]

An HON MEMBER: Hon Chairperson. [Laughs.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: There is only one Chair, hon members. [Interjections.] Thank you very much.

Hon member, you may continue.

Ms C A T MURRAY: Thank you, hon Madam Chair.

The Western Cape is advancing into the implementation phase with Stellenbosch Municipality being the first municipality to be provided with the transaction advisory support for municipal procurement of up to 50 megawatts by 2025.

The City of Cape Town is also well underway with their procurement programme, bringing online 200 megawatts by the end of 2025.

We have also seen small scale embedded generation programmes produce 120 megawatts across the Western Cape municipalities since December 2020. Municipalities' own renewable energy generation has since availed an additional one megawatt to Stellenbosch, Hessequa and George.

All of this means that our giant's heart will continue to be strong, even if the ANC-led National Government is trying their very best to clog our heart's arteries with corruption, maladministration, poor service delivery and much more.

We see this particularly in that President Ramaphosa himself faces possible impeachment due to the scandal he tried to conceal on his Phala Phala farm.

In conclusion, hon Madam Chair, while this beautiful giant remains unconscious, she dreams of the day when she will wake up. She knows that on that day she will be draped in a cloak of DA blue. She will be able to

muster the energy to finally stand up and be seen as the strong and formidable creature that she is, by her fellow continental giants. She will draw from the strength of the wealth of her resources, which include her natural beauty, her plethora of fauna, flora and minerals, her vast array of expertise and infrastructure and the sheer diversity that defines her.

The day will come when she will stand tall among fellow giants, knowing that her cells will be able to help her to recover from her diseases and her body will help and have enough energy to finally awaken her. This day is inevitable and it will happen when the DA takes over the Union Buildings in 2024. I thank you, hon Madam Chair. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. [Interjections.]

There is a hand. Hon member Marais?

Mr P J MARAIS: Thank you, hon Speaker.

Interesting thing happened now. We are all very precise when it comes to observing Rules and I have noticed here that the Whips on both sides frequently refer the speakers to Rules.

Now hon member Sayed referred to reading your whole speech, not occasionally looking at the paper, but just reading the whole speech, which is

not in terms of the Rules and we laughed. Are we saying some Rules are no more valid? Are you prepared to say we scrap some Rules when it suits us? Or can we get the Speaker, the acting Speaker, to please tell us, by not addressing the issue with the member, I did not interfere, but by not addressing it and telling the member, "You are not supposed to read your speech," are you saying this House is scrapping that clause in the Rules?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you [Interjections.], thank you hon member Marais for addressing the acting Chairperson.

I may recognise hon member Makamba-Botya.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Thank you very much ... House Chair.

Hon House Chair?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You are audible, you may continue.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: Okay. Thank you very much, hon House Chair.

I just want to make a quick comment at the last member, hon member Marais [Inaudible.] ... the financial year to change the inequalities of Western Cape.

Hon House Chairperson, on behalf of the EFF, the reason why the EFF will



never welcome any budget tabled by the DA-led Provincial Government is because of this entrenched trend of passing a budget only for the same budget to end up being underspent and we normally see it on annual reports every year.

Their aim is to appear as if they are doing something whereas in actual fact there is nothing that is even being achieved as the target, they set for themselves.

Hon Madam Chair, following the devastating effect of COVID-19, where thousands of people lost their jobs and various sources of income, this province is still [Inaudible.] environment for entrepreneurs to thrive and create job opportunities in this province.

However, hon Madam Chair, the reality is that most of these entrepreneurs offer our people salaries [Inaudible.] where waiters and waitresses are paid from their daily gratuity or tips from customers, meaning that if that waiter or waitress did not make enough tips on that day, then he or she is as good as being a slave, since they would not even have transport money to go home or to come back to work the following day. This is just one example of how desperate job seekers are subjected in this province.

A report produced by the Department of Labour found that majority, which is 55% of employers in Western Cape, do not declare their employees to the Department of Labour. These employers deduct UIF money from the meagre

salaries of employees, only to keep the money for themselves. This illegal practice leaves employees in a destitute situation later when their employment is terminated, as they cannot claim UIF.

Hon Madam Chair, we are told that Health and Education received the lion's share of the budget, totalling over R168 billion. However, we know by now that the situation in Khayelitsha Hospital and Mitchells Plain Hospital will never change as they will continue to remain underfunded.

Hon Madam Chair, a government that cannot guarantee a patient a bed, a doctor, a nurse and medication in what should be a hospital facility, is a failed government.

To show that DA is running a failed government, come 2023 we still continue to have unplaced learners in schools despite the Provincial Education Department being granted additional billions, but we will see the giant, as hon member Murray has alluded.

Hon Chairperson, by now everyone knows that the Safety Plan is nothing but a pipe dream as we have said before. One does not have to look further than the recent crime stats released for the second [Inaudible.] where the Western Cape, especially in Nyanga, Mitchells Plain [Inaudible.]

**The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you very much, hon member. [Interjections.]

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: ... if original allocated budget of R400 million could not assist in eradicating crime in the province, hon Chairperson, I need not [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Your time is up, hon member, thank you very much.

Ms N MAKAMBA-BOTYA: [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I now recognise hon Minister Mbombo.

†The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Enkosi kakhulu, Sihlalo. Molweni bethunana.

[The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Thank you, Chairperson. Good day, everyone.]

The theme identified by hon Minister Wenger in her Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement Adjustment, it talks about a framework of hope, which follows the challenges South Africa is facing.

†Sihlalo, [Chairperson,] as we deliberate on this debate, it is part of 16 Days of Activism that talks about the elimination of all forms of violence against women and children and others who are vulnerable. Under the theme socio-

economic rights and empowerment to build women's resilience against gender-based violence and femicide, connect, collaborate and contract.

Just to remind the House that unlike all other pandemics, South Africa had an AIDS pandemic, South Africa had a COVID pandemic. Out of those two you will find that there has been progress, but if you look in terms of the GBVF it is the only pandemic that has worsened and also the tools [Interjections.] to eradicate it are so weak that we are even being dubbed that South Africa is one of the most violent countries in the world, where women and children are raped and murdered because they are women. Shame on us.

So, hon Chair, whilst we are here, business as usual, we need to be reminded that one in three women every day they lose their lives at the hands of men, which are the sons we used to love. Now they are men we hate because they are perpetrators.

Second thing, †Sihlalo. [Chairperson] today is also world AIDS DAY. Under the theme:

"Equalize and integrate to end AIDS."

Again, South Africa has the highest number of people living with HIV. All these above epidemics that I have just mentioned, †Sihlalo, [Chairperon,] there is a common thread. Economic factors as the major underlying contributor to these social ills that get actually absorbed by us, Health, and

they end up becoming as a health problem.

Thanks, hon Minister Wenger, for bringing hope through this budget to tackle some of these underlying factors, but I will leave the details to my colleague, Minister of Social Development, where it will demonstrate that we have prioritised the socio-economic factors through this budget. We cannot keep mopping the floor only, we have to make sure that we close the tap as well.

The high levels of unemployment, the poverty, the rising cost of living, the energy crisis, all of these cripples our economy and all of these impact on overall well-being and also the health status of all citizens, rich or poor.

Hon Chair, economy and health are twins. There are no binaries between saving lives and/or improving our livelihoods. When our livelihoods are better through the healthy economy, as manifested in employment, food availability, diminished poverty, our lives are saved. When economy goes down, as it is currently, so is the health of the population, the health of the individuals and those that are being hit hardest are the most vulnerable, †oo*Tannie Sara* and nabantwana babo. [You are typical Tannie Sara's and their children.]

Hon Chair, healthy economy, healthy population and healthy profit. All those three go together and also it is also vice versa. Job losses mean people are unable to feed their families. It means that even for those who could be able to feed their families, they do not have sound choices and options in order for

them to bring healthy, nutritious meals when the food prices are skyrocketing. As I always say health is wealth.

Being healthy unfortunately is not only an individual's choice, but it also means that something needs to happen. It means that it also has got a political underpinning, a political choice because it is at a political level that the socio-economic factors are influenced. That is what we call social determinants of health. It is about when you choose what type of economic model, when you choose at a political level, at a national level, the investments and all of those, whether the economy should grow or not, you must know that it does actually have an impact on health.

As I indicated, hon Chair, Health absorbs all of these, and we are expected to address these inequalities that are perpetrated outside the Health system but originated by political choice. Health is political. People go to bed hungry with no meals because of our national political choices.

People for the first time, hon Chair, in more than a decade see malnutrition in children. It is not because these are the children of the families that do not feed their kids, it is because of political choices that impact on the economy that we have.

So, the issue of the mental health state and total well-being of people, that has deteriorated, it has even surpassed all of the pre-pandemic levels. Crime, hon Chair, which has increased. As I have mentioned, with more women and

children being killed every day.

The other part, Chair, I mentioned that is HIV/AIDS, we have seen that the gains and the progress that we saw pre-pandemic when it comes to HIV, TB, STIs, now you will find that during the pandemic more than 50% of the HIV testing has gone down. Almost 50% of the people initiating [Inaudible.] have gone down under the circumstances where people are also hungry.

Also, hon Chair, we have seen, we have heard what the United Nations has indicated that in sub-Saharan Africa every two minutes, actually in 2021, every two minutes there was an adolescent and a young girl who was getting infected, which makes it about 4 900 per week of the adolescents and the young girls that get infected.

Without going into details on that, the Health system is experiencing a marked increase in non-COVID service demands as I alluded to. So it cannot be business as usual. It means that we have to [Inaudible.] whatever it must in order to be able to render these services. Unfortunately, hon Chair, as I alluded to, Health absorbs all these inequalities. They are perpetrated outside the Health system or they might not be prioritised by other sectors, but we still have to absorb them.

So that is why we have adopted a research strategy that talks Health is everybody's business, which sets out the Department's policy agenda and highlights our aspirations as we build back stronger. The rationale

underpinning the strategy becomes, actually provides the key motivation. So that is why the Department was renamed as a Department of Health and Wellness in order to accommodate these social ills that I have already mentioned, but, hon Chair, these require collaboration with other sectors. We cannot do it alone. We need all other departments. We need all of the private sector and even individuals themselves.

The post-COVID, I mean COVID made us to be bounded. We are wounded. We are a fragile health system. Actually, even exposed more of these inequalities because sitting of now, †sithi ngoku kufuneka bacholachole zonke ngoku ezi zinto zenzekayo. [so, we are the ones that need to fix these broken situations.]

So, with our strategic approach in this health is everybody's business, when we rebuild our system it talks about service platform reform, where we have to redesign our service model based on evidence and data, learning from COVID.

So, in order to focus on this quadruple burden of disease, for example, the issue of fast-tracking the surgical backlogs, it was never part of the whole system, but we have to do it because they have been left behind.

The governance reform that talks about local geographic and overall policy alignment, gone are the days where things are only happening probably at the district or a sub-district level. It has to go ward by ward so that we leave no



one behind and also to apply the principles of the [Inaudible.] and the worker because with COVID it taught us the hotspot strategy.

The public policy reform, as I indicated, hon Chair, that we have to mitigate these socio-social determinants of health. That is why we said Department of Social Development, give them the money because there is no way that we will be able to resolve all other issues.

So, something needs to be happening. That is why we engage, we embark on a campaign. Nothing about us, without us, which is a *driebeenpotjie* that has to talk in terms of the strength in the pillar, the Government, the political societies, which is through the Mayors, MPs and all of those, so that you participate, so that you know in this House some of you are what the constituency has in these areas, you have been part where we brought our Government and then engage and talk about what are the programmes and whatever that is happening, and also what are the challenges in some of these areas so that we do not leave anyone behind?

**The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON:** Your time is up, Minister.

**The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS:** Ja. So having said that, hon Chair, I am really disappointed with the Provincial Equitable Share formula, that we will find that for Western Cape Department of Health it is one that will be hugely impacted in the next MTEF because of what we have been doing.

Where we are trying to deescalate the services to be in the communities  
...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may sit now.

The MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS: Yes, in the communities,  
but now we are being penalised for that. Thank you, hon Chair. See you on  
Monday [Inaudible.]. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Thank you very much,  
Minister Mbombo.

I now recognise hon member August.

Mr S N AUGUST: Hon House Chair, the Western Cape Adjustments  
Appropriation Bills greatly disappoints on the basic principles of delivering  
services to the Western Cape and communities in which so much more can be  
done.

The Government continues singing its own praises that it is better than its  
national counterparts. The sad reality is that whilst it is blowing its own  
horn, it is failing people of this province daily by supporting dysfunctional  
policies and fuelling priorities that do not speak or seems to address the  
needs of the people.

Our people are poor, jobless, hopeless, futureless and have surrendered to the challenges. This Government manages billions of public funds, but the very people who sacrifice so much to keep its coffers oiled are the ones who lose hope.

Homelessness is on the rise. Where is the Department of Social Development? Crime is on the rise. Where is the Department of Safety and Security? Unemployment on the rise. Where is the Department of Economic Opportunities? Communities are broken and falling apart. Where is the Department of Arts, Culture and Sport. Sickness and health are on the rise. Where is the Department of Health?

Where are all these departments that should invest in making a real-life impact on the people of this province? What are they doing as the statistics are speaking for themselves? This Bill should champion the people's causes and should make funds available in accordance with their needs. The need is clearly an alleviation of socio-economic challenges, address crime, health, wellbeing, safety and security as well as the future of our people.

There are young men and women who will never own their own home, own a car or have a family. Why? Because their lives revolve around drugs. They survive on the economy of crime, they will never know or have access to a different life because the decision taken in this House is failing them. Let us not play house with the lives of millions of destitute, desperate and hopeless

people.

The Bill disappoints severely and could have been more impactful with tangible data focused solutions. Instead, it creates an airy framework of guessing and we will do more harm than good in the lives of our people. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member August.

I now recognise hon member Christians.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Thank you, hon House Chair.

It is very concerning for the ACDP that the Western Cape is allocated less money with more people coming to the Western Cape. This is not sustainable, but this is a stark reality. Shockingly the National Government in the Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement indicated that R30 billion will be provided to stabilise SOEs.

Hon Chair, the question must be asked is this money going to bail out a failing SOE, or is it going to disappear? For the past 20 years these bailouts have proven to go down a big black hole, which amounted to R187,4 billion. According to the Zondo Commission most of this money was looted and stolen, for example, R41 billion to bail out Transnet, 70% was on irregular

contracts.

In other words, hon Chair, money was stolen from the most vulnerable, from the poor and the most destitute. Hon Chair, the ACDP welcomes the establishment of the Cabinet Level Energy Council to coordinate the immediate action over the next year. This province cannot rely on the National Government or Eskom to resolve the energy crisis. The question is when will this province be off the Eskom energy grid away from loadshedding.

It is sad to see the number of small businesses that have closed down. Just take a walk in the Golden Acre and see businesses, small business closing down.

Let us come to safety. Initially the ACDP was opposed to the LEAP officers programme, but it is working at the moment, but at the moment we believe it is only a stopgap. It is not sustainable to roll out money. We always believe that the communities should empower Neighbourhood Watches and they will help assist because they stay in the community, they are there. When LEAP officers leave crime then escalates. So, we believe that Neighbourhood Watches are the way to go.

It was a pleasure being at the Chrysalis Academy on Saturday to see what a pleasant experience it is, to see that young men and women turn their lives around. What a three-month programme will do transforming lives of our

youth and that is youth at risk, and we believe there were 208 graduates. Speaking to them, the way they speak, the way they present themselves were mindboggling and this should be duplicated to other areas so that not 208 graduates' benefit, but more and more benefit. We saw and I believe a duplication of this will assist us ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You may wrap up, hon member.

Mr C F CHRISTIANS: Okay. [Interjections.] Okay, thank you, hon Chair, I will stop there. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. [Interjections.]

Thank you very much, hon members. I now recognise hon member Nkondlo.

†Ms N D NKONDLO: **Enkosi, Sihlalo.**

[Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you, Chairperson.]

The ANC rejects this Adjusted Estimate Appropriation Bill [B3 2022]. We believe that it is laden with contradictions and in some instances downright hypocrisy.

The MEC of this DA-led Provincial Government must be reminded that the challenges of this country and its economy started long before state capture post 1994, as the colonial and apartheid legacies responsible for the path

dependence that set the SA economic fate, and actually the colonial inheritance of the Cape Colony that set the Western Cape ahead of others. Nothing about the scary DA that actually has demonstrated in this House how it is willing to moot injustice to a Speaker of this House and render this House toothless.

How is it that only in the Adjustment Budget of 2022/23 the MEC announces the Jobs For Growth Strategy at the tail end of this administration, whilst the Premier in his first State of the Province Address promised a job for each household. Is this another DA drumming up its election campaign for 2024?

Same with the Municipal Resilience Project, we are still waiting to see an ounce of the megawatts as we were told.

If this Provincial Government is data driven it will realise or emphasise that 75% of public transport trips done per day in this province are done by our taxis. Our provincial economy needs a strong public transport system and the DA in this province has been in denial about the taxi industry. In fact, when they do engage the industry, they approach it in a patronising manner. [Interjections.]

The MSC announces R196 million for GoGeorge, but nothing in place of the Blue Dot Project. Their own DA blue pet project. Instead, they point to the National Government to intervene [Interjections.] as after the show has ended, the curtains have been drawn, reality kicks in. Put your money where

your mouth is.

An HON MEMBER: It is true!

Ms N D NKONDLO: The DA demands powers to be devolved on functions like public transport, yet they fail to be responsive to the growing demand of Metros like City of Cape Town, George, to ensure their municipalities are agile in their integrated transport plans, MEC, issue permits timeously and declare new routes expeditiously so as not to clog our roads and rather slow productivity of many who must sit hours in reaching their destinations during peak times.

Please protect me. I am not sure whether I have touched the MEC in his [Inaudible.]. [Interjections.]

What they do instead is to unleash a trigger [Interjections.] happy ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member ...[Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: ... J P Smith ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: ... Nkondlo, you may sit down.

Ms N D NKONDLO: Thank you.



The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members on my right-hand side, you can heckle, but do not drown the speaker and I think we have been doing well so far. Let us continue with the business of the day. [Interjections.] Hon member, continue.

Ms N D NKONDLO: What they do instead is to unleash a trigger-happy J P Smith who is loaded with taxpayers' money from the Safety Plan, to harass, intimidate and impound taxis off the road as his way to show force. Talk about a spoiled brat with a new toy in his hands.

Writing about this, Vanessa Farr, member of Women's International League for Peace and Freedom Network, and Leslie Green, a professor of Anthropology in UCT, ask how has it come about that the City's traffic services now operate as a heavily armed municipal militia whose purpose appears to be to target those who have remained poor because the City has yet to address apartheid spatial planning and its entrenchment of poverty.

In characterising the J P Smith phenomenon, the article they wrote points to the plenty of parallels of decision-making in other parts of the world where the militarisation of city policing is closely linked to the defence of white privilege and where political parties, like the Republicans in the US or DA in Cape Town, allow powerful individuals to continue tenure, even when they risk the failure of democracy.

In his 2017 book "Straight Talk on Trade", Harvard economist, Dani Rodrik, though not a defender of market-based economies, suggests and I quote:

"Markets depend on non-market institutions because they are not self-creating, self-regulating or self-legitimizing."

Some of these non-market institutions for Rodrik includes investment in transportation, communications and logistics, enforcement of contracts and arrangements to bring distributional outcomes into conformity with social norms.

Hon Speaker, the ANC does not object to investment in GoGeorge or even MyCiti, although these two are limping under the DA in the City of Cape Town. What we do object to is the systematic targeting of the taxi industry and what amounts to be choking the industry.

We further ask that this budget is redirected to fund the continuation of the Blue Dot from the provincial reserves. We wish to highlight this glaring budget anomalies from this adjustment, a total of R639 451 000, that is over half a billion rand in under expenditure. R40,65 million returned by the Department of Transport and Public Works [Interjections.] initially identified for infrastructure, and 122 and R155 million transversely returned, and which was initially budgeted for compensation of employees.

Furthermore, in the Main Appropriation above R856 million, that is nearly

R1 billion, was transversely budgeted for consultants, whilst R45,6 million was budgeted for training in Programme 1, that is in the leadership and administration programme, a non-core function of each department.

However, this Adjustment Budget does nothing to take focus of these non-essential services. While the ANC does realise that if we are to reduce consultants drastically the services provided by consultants must be insourced as part of building capacity of the state and responding to the growing service delivery needs due to population growth in this province.

We are concerned by the sluggish pace in which vacancies in the Provincial Government are filled, funds returned initially identified for SOC as burden is left to the current staff to carry the workload.

In my count the MEC used the word "opportunities" at least twice in her speech last week. She spoke of promising opportunities and new opportunities, yet we believe that she and this DA-led Provincial Administration are in denial about major opportunities related to the expansion and growth of our provincial economy in an inclusive way.

There are opportunities in agriculture, township and rural small *dorpië* economies. We say denial because insofar as agriculture is concerned the skewed broad DA data produced by their own Provincial Government highlights the vast potential for new and promising opportunities these sectors of our economy possess.

In her MERO speech earlier in the morning before presenting this Adjustment Budget the MEC said, and I quote:

"As I am sure Minister Ivan Mayer will celebrate, the ~~merrow~~ MERO also sets out how the agriculture, forestry and fishing sector in the Western Cape expanded. With this sector in the Cape Metro increasing by 8,9%, followed by West Coast at 8,6%, overall, the expected growth in this sector was 8,3% in 2021."

Less than an hour later, in presenting this Adjustment Budget, the MEC said absolutely nothing about the same agricultural sector she has just praised and recognised for its growth.

However, the ANC believes that recognition must be given by this Provincial Government that the sustainability of the agricultural sector in the Western Cape rests on the shoulders of farm workers as the significant input to the productivity of the sector. Yet these are the people living in deplorable conditions, are landless, whilst they work and cultivate land for a meagre salary. This DA Government is deaf on the plight of these farm workers regarding minimum wage and their basic living conditions, but will run and allocate funds for rural safety to protect commercial farmers and landowners that are predominantly white.

We have been here, even in the last administration, making a call for

township and rural economies to be given recognition in the growth plans of this province. All this fell on arrogance of whiteness, hellbent to offer our black communities and their consumption currency for donation to the big retail friends; the Pick n Pays under some charade of market store owners, where to date such has been stopped abruptly with no close-off report brought to the Standing Committee of yet another failed DA gimmick to the plight of the poor.

As policymakers we must recognise that when we speak of expanding the economy, we mean expanding the formal economy because the informal economy exists and we continue to deny it and ignore it at our own peril as policymakers, especially here in the province. The expansion of the formal economy to include the township economy to rural economy, even the taxi industry, allows for the growth in the tax base.

We know why before PERO and MERO were scientific driven exercises, today the research is according to the DA's political agenda. However, when we read between the lines, even these politically driven research exercises, we note that, for example, the informal employment accounts for nearly 19% of employment in the province. Private households account for the highest contributor of informal employment, accounting for nearly 56% of total employment, while not surprisingly transport services and trade as informal employment account for nearly 25%, a quarter each to total employment.

These statistics alone make a case for the township and rural economies, but

without a focus by this Administration on these, we will never know the true extent of the potential held by these to expand and grow our formal economy. The ANC cannot ...[Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member ...[Interjections.]

Ms N D NKONDLO: ... support [Interjections.] this Budget Vote. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear-hear! [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much [Interjections.] – hon members! Thank you very much, hon member.

I now recognise Minister Fernandez.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon House Chairperson, to all the hon members in the House and on the virtual platform, good afternoon.

As we recognise 16 Days of Activism, I am appealing to this August House to reflect on the significance not only of 16 days, but our nation's response to gender-based violence and femicide 365 days a year.

On 11 December 2019 the Ministry within the Department of Social Development launched a gender-based violence and femicide multi-sectoral

working session to declare 365 days of action and not only 16 days of activism, for no violence against women and children.

We have steadfastly stuck to this commitment for the last three years and will continue to do so given the high levels of violence still prevalent in South Africa, but it is during this period of 16 days of activism for no violence against women and children, that the spotlight on the scourge of GBVF is even brighter.

During this period, I urge us all to look at interventions with the public and private sector, along with communities and civil society which we can and must implement to protect and support the most vulnerable members in our society.

The latest crime stats presented by the National Police Minister reveals that GBVF is spiralling out of control. Between July and September this year sexual offense incidents increased by 11% nationwide.

Hon House Chairperson, on 20 October 2022 the Western Cape Government held its first provincial summit on gender-based violence and femicide. The summit was convened with the aim of taking stock of progress made in implemented commitments made through the National Strategic Plan on GBV to address the scourge in the country and to provide input to the presidential GBV summit that was held early in November 2022.

The hybrid summit was attended by 1 485 delegates online, along with participants at in person satellite venues in George and Robertson. Attendees discussed the different pillars of the NSP as reflected on and the extent to which the Western Cape had progressed in implementing the related commitments on the various pillars.

So much progress has the Province made, the Western Cape Government has proactively put in place measures to localise the NSP by developing a Western Cape Government GBV implementation plan for all our departments. The core objective of the plan is to assist Province with its planning, implementing, coordinating and monitoring of essential actions and services for the prevention and mitigation of GBV across the Western Cape.

The Province established a GBV transversal group consisting of GBV champions from each department. This transversal group includes all departments and reports monthly on high level matters relating to GBV.

At a Local Government level, Swartland Municipality is an example of best practice as it has mobilised one ward committee member of each of the 12 ward committees to become GBV ambassadors to conduct education, awareness and community support on gender-based violence and femicide. Ambassadors work with ward councillors and relevant stakeholders. They also coordinate activities with the gender focal person within the municipality.



The Swartland area-based team forms part of the Western Cape Government's Safety Plan which allows communities to be actively involved in addressing violence against women and children, working hand-in-hand with Government and key stakeholders. At the same time, we are hoping that other municipalities will take their cue from Swartland and replicate this best practice.

Various other multisectoral bodies and structures have been put in place to ensure coordination and to strengthen accountability. These include, but are not limited to, a Western Cape Government GBV technical workgroup, the Provincial Gender Justice Forum, the Provincial Victim Empowerment Programme Forum, which meets quarterly, is another useful platform, and then we also just opened an additional six GBV shelters. Sadly, our colleagues in Gauteng had to return the six shelters because the Department of Social Development could not come to an agreement with Provincial Public Works in that province.

So, this is just a snapshot of some of the bodies and structures that we have put in place to ensure that we do not just talk the talk, but actually walk it. Unlike National Government that promised to set up a National Council to tackle GBV, yet four years later it is still not up and running and is mired in contention.

It would be remiss of me to say that at the Free State GBV summit a male beat up a female official at an actual summit and a similar incident happened

at the national GBV summit.

I will ask us to beg the hon [Interjections.] House Chairperson – I am speaking the truth because gender-based violence cuts across all provinces and the country. [Interjections.] We have come a far way and it has helped identify gaps in systems on a provincial and national level, which requires urgent addressing.

The Western Cape Women's Shelter Movement highlighted a security risk relating to their work, stating that loadshedding, another failure of the ANC-led National Government, is increasing the risk faced by its shelters and many facilities housing vulnerable individuals.

A shelter in Fish Hoek had to fork out an extra R25 000 this year to keep its security system up [Interjections.] and running to ensure – would you stop interjecting, please?

Hon Chairperson, protect me.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Minister, can you sit down.  
Can you sit down.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: And this is ...

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Kama, please make

sure that you do not have a conversation with the member that is on the podium so that we can continue.

Mr M KAMA: I was not having [Inaudible.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay. Hon Minister, you can continue.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: This is just one of many as most of the shelters are plagued by the same or similar problems.

Other challenges that are hampering intervention efforts include services provided by SAPS that are not the standard. Victims often complained of insensitive and uninformed officials. Collaboration and building of relationships too require resourcing, hon House Chair, and there are too few resources.

Civil society organisations do not have additional resources to allocate to interventions to aid their participation in national platforms and processes to address GBVF. The private sector thus has an important role to play and support and resource collaboration between CSOs and Government.

The Department of Social Development has support and prevention programmes in place for boys and men, but it has been woefully inadequate. Often the voices of men are silent when it comes to gender issues.

[Interjections.] Prevention needs to focus on boys, especially boys who are victims of violence. Research suggests that the analysis that 65% of adult cases of GBV are physical violence, but this increases to 85% amongst teenagers. Yet, despite these challenges, we remain resolute in continuing the fight.

The framework of hope requires us to have more courageous conversations, like the ones I got to be a witness to at FAMSA's office in Khayelitsha last month. Men who participated in FAMSA's Fatherhood Programme shared how they were able to deal with multifaceted challenges such as depression, patriarchy, violence meted out on them by the partners in their homes and all of this in a safe space by speaking to other men and receiving counselling from social workers.

I was moved when one man spoke about how these sessions motivated him to start his own NPO in Mfuleni, where he helps other men and young boys in schools to steer clear of violence. We need more of these interventions, we need more men like him.

Programmes like these including our parenting programmes in which DSD and NPO staff train and equip parents with the necessary skills needed to navigate the important parenting roles, are imperative to promoting healthy homes and healthy communities.

Hon House Chair, post COVID the key drivers of interpersonal violence can

be attributed to poverty, unemployment and mental health challenges, amongst others. However, the Government's Recovery Plan focuses on jobs, safety and well-being. As part of the framework of hope, DSD has been allocated R25 million, which the Sustainable Livelihoods Programme will be utilising for food relief for social relief of distress. The Department has also subsidised an additional 90 shelter beds just this quarter, bringing the total number of subsidised shelter beds to 2 298.

Hon House Chair, I am pleased to announce that we are now in the process of filling vacant posts, many of which are for social work professionals, which will be placed in safety hotspot areas where crimes against women, children and interpersonal violence is rife.

In closing, House Chairperson, I wish to extend my thanks to the Minister of Finance and Provincial Treasury for providing a framework of hope to DSD which will in turn benefit the most vulnerable in communities across this province. I thank you. [Applause.] [Interjections.]

**The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you very much, hon Minister.

I now recognise hon member Marais. I do not know if he is online. Okay, hon member Marais, have left the House. I am going to continue with the list.

Hon member Mackenzie, I recognise you, sir.

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, House Chairperson.

Today, hon members, we debate the Western Cape Adjustment Budget against the backdrop of massive political uncertainty in this country and hon member Dugmore asked a very important question [Inaudible.] start the debate, and I am going to quote him, hon House Chair. He said:

"On a principles level we need an honest debate about what is needed to identify ..."

I missed that word, hon member Dugmore, but what he basically meant what is needed to fix the country right now on a principles level, to paraphrase hon member Dugmore and I can honestly say, hon Deputy House Chairperson, during the Adjustment Budget Vote what is needed to fix the challenges as hon member Dugmore asked this House earlier on, is an early election.

An HON MEMBER: Is a what?

Mr R D MACKENZIE: An early election. Hon House Chairperson, [Interjections.] despite the uncertainty facing this country, the DA-led Western Cape Government has consistently remained the best performing and the most stable government in this country for years [Interjections.] and this budget adjustment framework for work is no different.

As the hon Minister said, infrastructure is a key driver for growth and I am extremely proud that the Western Cape Government has taken this framework for hope, for infrastructure seriously, unlike other governments in this country.

As we have seen recently the Government infrastructure investment can be visibly seen in the quality of our roads and the quality of our infrastructure that are being built. We saw the new housing development in Mitchells Plain that Minister Tertius Simmers opened the other day and just yesterday I took a walk around the streets of Mitchells Plain where our Government is busy building new roads. The quality of the roads that are being built in Mitchells Plain is far more than the quality that is being built in other provinces. That is the partnership [Interjections.] between the City and the Western Cape Government.

The problem is ...[Interjections.]

**The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON:** Hon member, just sit down.

Hon members, starting with the Leader of the Opposition, can we not drown the speaker so that we can hear, all of us. Thank you very much.

Hon member, you can continue.

**Mr R D MACKENZIE:** Thank you, hon Chairperson.

A road that starts with a "R" is a regional road, in case the hon members did not know, but the quality of the roads that are being upgraded and built in the Western Cape is far better than the quality of the roads that are being built in other provinces. That is the difference between us and the ANC.

Hon members, there are some in this House who would like to take us backward rather than forward. It would be remiss of me not to talk on the matters of what happened in the taxi industry strike two weeks ago. It was one of the worst strikes we have seen in a long time. In fact, this House must condemn it, and I am proud of the members of the Standing Committee [Interjections.] of Transport and Public Works that actually condemned this blatant attack on our economy. It is completely unacceptable and should never happen again in this province.

It is a sad day that the ANC in the Western Cape did not condemn this blatant attack on our economy. [Interjections.] It is sad that we now know what we always knew that the ANC do not care for the people of the province. [Interjections.]

Hon House Chairperson, these actions over the last week were the most [Interjections.] undefendable things that we have not seen in a long time. In fact, the Blue Dot Taxi Programme is the best programme ever created by any government [Interjections.] since 1994.



The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, hon member, just sit down. I think – hon member Dugmore, we listened to you. Hon member Nkondlo, we listened. Hon members, let us give each other a chance to debate so that we can continue with the business of the day. [Interjections.]

Do not drown, heckle, do not drown the speaker so that we can all listen and those communities that are online also can hear what the member is saying. Like they listened to you when you were on the podium.

Over to you, hon member. [Interjections.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: Thank you, House Chairperson.

The Blue Dot Programme is the best Government programme ever created since 1994 to professionalise the taxi industry, by the DA-led Government. [Interjections.] It is the first attempt created by the Government to bring the taxi industry into a fold. [Interjections.]

I want to thank our colleagues in the Western Cape Government, Minister Mitchell, for this ground-breaking initiative. Unfortunately ... [Interjections.]

The LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION: Madikizela [Inaudible.]

Mr R D MACKENZIE: ... unfortunately – and the predecessor, Madikizela, yes, it is true, hon member Dugmore.

Unfortunately, the National Government and the ANC Government, despite numerous attempts by our colleague, hon Minister Mitchell, to get funding for this programme, they blatantly refused to assist us in funding this programme. [Interjections.] This blueprint called the Blue Dot should be a programme and a blueprint for National Government to finally fix the taxi industry that has been in chaos for the last 100 years [Interjections.], but instead of our hon members in this House supporting us, writing to the National Minister to ask them to fund it, they have been quiet about it. Like we said, the ANC does not care about the people of this province.

If the National Government has the political will, they would have funded the Blue Dot Programme, but they do not have the political will, hon members. [Interjections.]

Hon members, you know our economy cannot function without a functioning rail system. Just this morning I took a walk to Cape Town Station. It is truly sad to see our trains not running effectively. The great Shosholoza Meyl has not been running for months. Our long-distance transport workers who work in long distance trains, a total of 450 overall staff with 100 dedicated specifically for Shosholoza Meyl, idling and not doing any work.

Today is 1 December, hon members, the start of a festive season, the busiest period of the month, but people cannot get to the Eastern Cape because the trains are not running. That is the reality. Despite that the Western Cape

Government continues to invest in infrastructure and what did we hear about the silence of the union-driven ANC colleagues? Nothing. That is why we say the ANC does not care about the people of this province. Not one of them have condemned the fact that a hundred people are sitting at Cape Town Station, employed to work on the trains, but they are not working. The ANC does not care about the people of this province.

As the DA, we take this very seriously. [Interjections.] We take this very seriously – now we have taken matters into our own hands. Our Western Cape Government conjunctly with the City of Cape Town are making progress with a feasibility study to devolve rail.

The study that began in July this year has now reached critical inception in one of the milestones that they reported. The devolution of rail to the City and functioning governments will happen whether the National Government likes it or not.

In completely expected news I have just heard from my colleague, hon member Gillion Bosman, the Transnet freight rail, they entice the private sector to come and help them to fix the rail. Out of 19 bidders [Interjections.] – this is under Ramaphosa – I am not sure if he is President or not yet – under 19 companies only one has been shortlisted on – it is crazy how every project the Government has in relation to the economy, investment or jobs, ended up like this.

Hon members, coming to the third biggest mode of transport, the buses. A terrible and horrible attack on Intercape the last few months, 150 attacks, and to this day we have not seen the action plan of National Minister Mbalula on how to fix this. He defied court orders in a row. The ANC Western Cape has been silent on this matter. That is why we say they do not care for the people of this province.

Hon members, infrastructure is key for this province and attacks on infrastructure are unacceptable, but I want to thank hon Minister David Maynier on his new Rapid Build Programme that he launched, in fact in Afrikaans it is called †"die vinnige bouprogram" [the fast-building programme]. So, I will describe hon Minister David Maynier as †"Vinnige Fanie" [Fast Fanie.] [Applause.]

In this †"Vinnige Fanie" ["Fast Fanie"] programme, over 842 new schools were built, providing 26 000 classrooms, and I always have to say and I must say I appreciate the intent endorsement by hon member Dugmore, because they are happy about this, but they want it to happen fastly, including our deputy, †"Vinnige Fanie", ["Fast Fanie"], hon member Sayed, and they are saying, and I quote from Minister [Inaudible.] Twitter page, he said that:

"Hon Minister David Maynier aka †"Vinnige Fanie", ["Fast Fanie"], must speed it up" and I would like hon Minister, ag, Salie to, who is now, I refer to as Adjunk †"Vinnige Fanie", ["Fast Fanie"], to run faster because hon Minister Maynier already used his spade, and he has toiled the soil in two schools already. So, †Adjunk [Deputy] Minister Fanie must run faster to

keep up with hon Minister Fanie. So, the Western Cape Government has shown that here, that we can contribute greatly ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, may you take your seat? I recognise you, hon member. [Interjections.]

An HON MEMBER: Does he say he is the hon Minister?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, I do not know whether the new Minister Fanie or Salie ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, you are better...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Who is hon member Mackenzie referring to?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Is that a point of order or not, hon member?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): *Ja*, it is a point of order because such a member does not exist. Maybe, he can ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: That is no a point of order like that ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...say who is referring to, but just be clear ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: You know better, hon member.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...so we know, then we can see there ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, take your seat! Take your seat! Hon member, continue.

Mr R D MACKENZIE (DA): Sorry, I was just making the point, hon Deputy Speaker that he is saying that the programme must be sped up, but hon Minister David Maynier has already sped up the programme. He already used a spade the other day and dug the ground. So, the †Adjunk [Deputy] Minister Fanie must speed up and meet hon Minister Fanie where he is busy with.

The DA applauds the Western Cape Government for their continued investment in infrastructure. Infrastructure creates jobs and this is what the DA National Government continues to do, as opposed to hiding the money in the couches in National Government. The DA fully supports the Budget Adjustment and anyone voting against this Budget, is voting against the people living in the province. I thank you. [Applause]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Mackenzie. I now recognise hon Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. The Western Cape Government's Adjustment Appropriation Bill is a clear indication that the Province is ... [Audio distorted.] the budget ... [Audio distorted.] effectively, especially in areas where most needed. It has become the usual practice of the DA Government when it fails to deliver, to put the blame on National Government. This Province is only delivering superfluous statements on its performance. The talks about reviving the economy and to create viable opportunities for economic growth in areas where needed, such as the development of tourism in townships and in the rural areas, are not happening.

The plight of overcrowded schools is not being dealt with effectively. Money is spent on unnecessary court cases against progressive teachers like Mr Wesley Neumann and educators who are supporting him. Instead, we see no drop in the high crime rates and do not blame National Government. There is a clear lack of an effective plan on how to deal with crime effectively. There is only a plan in the budget to how effectively welcome and protect tourists to the province, the formation of the Western Cape Government's tourism unit. Yes, we do need to provide safety to tourists, but there are some discrepancies when it comes to the safety of our people in townships like Nyanga, Hanover Park and Delft.

The Western Cape's Appropriation Bill is not prioritising the needs in crucial areas such as health, education, crime, housing, and economic growth on the Cape Flats. Al Jama-ah does not support this anti-poor Bill. Instead, the Western Cape must look at giving each and every ward in the Western Cape Province a proper budget of R500 million. I thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Thank you very much. Hon members, you do not have to be excited. I now recognise hon Lekker.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Let me start off my address by noting the absence of the hon Premier of the Province in the House. As the ANC, we raise serious concern about the absence of the hon Premier in last week's Sitting, when this Province's Adjustment Appropriation Bill, Estimated Appropriation Bill was tabled. This continues the trend that the hon Premier consistently undermines this House and refuses to take accountability and oversight in this House seriously. The hon Premier chooses a breakfast with EU diplomats over fulfilling his constitutional duties in this House. As the hon Meyer continuously reminds this House – I see he is also absent – and maybe, he should remind his hon Premier that you can have a plan and a policy, but if you have no budget to back up that plan or policy ...[Interjection.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: On a point of order.



The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): ...then it becomes meaningless. The hon Premier exposed his lack of understanding. The political importance of the ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, hon member Lekker. May you take a seat? Thank you. Hon Minister Meyer, is there a point of order?

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. I hear that the hon Chief Whip of the ANC says I am absent. I am in this meeting. I am on a virtual platform. I am listening, I am taking part in this debate. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Is that a point order?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Okay. [Interjections.] Thank you, hon Deputy, I recognise you.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): *Ja*, hon Temporary Chairperson. No, thank you very much for the intervention by the possible incoming Premier on that one. [Laughter.] [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE: hon Temporary Chairperson, I have got higher ambitions than that. Since there is no President in South Africa ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: That is just a frivolous interjection. Hon members, come on! [Interjections.] Hon members. Hon member Bosman! Hon member Sayed! Member Lekker, may you see them?

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Bosman, hon member Sayed. Like I said, and really a continuous interjection is allowed, but do not drown the speaker. And your Chief Whip is addressing us. At least give her that due respect.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Must it be that?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Lekker, ...[Laughter] over to you. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): I see hon Meyer has logged in from wherever he is logging in from. I do not know where he is.

The hon Premier exposes lack of understanding, the political importance of tabling of the MERO and the Adjustment Appropriation Bill when he chose a breakfast over coming to this House for the First Reading. The reality which hon MEC Wenger must face is that Captain Winde has abandoned his ship as he makes his way for his successor. It is hard to point out any instance where

the Head of an ANC Executive chose to stay away from the tabling of a budget in Parliament or a Provincial Legislature.

The hon MEC and her fans complain about astute data when determining the Provincial Equitable Share, yet she and the rest of her caucus cannot link other instances of this astute data to their federal agenda and devolution drive. Only recently, did the hon Premier realise that the Western Cape will suffer if the people of the province did not participate in the census. This is what happens when you encourage federalism and Western Cape independence. So, while the hon MEC may well complain about astute data in clinics, the ANC thinks she should have bigger worries when the results of Census 2022 are released. [Interjection.]

The hon MEC then goes on to mention a new growth for job strategy. Well, this is because the old one which was two years old, did not work. In October 2020, the hon Premier stood up in this House and announced his Economic Recovery Plan. At SOPA again this year, the hon Premier mentioned his October 2020 Address to this House, setting out his Government's priorities for recovery. Let us remind ourselves of what the hon Premier promised. On that day, he promised to create, and I quote:

“20 000 jobs through rapid interventions, including 26 private sector investments ...[Then.] currently in the pipeline.”

I end quote. A mere four months later in February 2021, reading his SOPA

again, we heard nothing about 26 rapid interventions and by then, only 7 500 jobs were created, far from the 20 000. At SOPA this year, even though he was proud to announce his administrations failed recovery, we heard neither of the 26 000 rapid interventions nor about how many of the actual 20 000 jobs were actually created. But one supposes that in October 2020, the hon Premier believed that the State does play a role in creating jobs. That is why he made the promise, but today, the DA uses the excuse: the private sector creates jobs to recover their broken promises.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the ANC wishes to remind the DA, its hon Premier and the hon MEC that more boots on the ground will not address the challenge of crime. That is apartheid thinking. Even worse still, throwing R200 million to LEAP, which existed long before this hon Premier and his Safety Plan existed, will not help. If they had allocated R200 million to strengthening and supporting Community Policing Forums, then maybe the ANC would have said Provincial Government is making progress.

The same can be said about Health and Education. While the hon MEC recognises that Health and Education receive the lion's share of the budget, it comes as a surprise to her that it is the trend in all provinces. That is because Education and Health are core competencies of a provincial government: politics 101. Yet, take Education at the beginning of this year, 17 000 Grade 1 and Grade 8 learners were not placed in schools. 8 500 Grade 2s and 7s and 9s to 12s that requested transfers, were not placed. This disaster eventually led to the resignation of the hon MEC. Although you did

not tell us, we know. The same train smash is waiting to happen at the beginning of next year, but the DA is incompetent of listening to proposals and solving this challenge. Why? We must not fool ourselves ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member, conclude. Your time is up.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): It is politics. The ANC rejects this Adjustment Budget. I thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I now recognise hon member Baartman. [Interjections.] [Laughter.]

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hallo, Western Cape residents. Today, hon Temporary Chairperson, I would like to actually speak about the art of doing mundane tasks. There are chores in our lives that we simply need to do, it needs to get done whether you like it or not. We make our beds, we do the dishes, we take out the rubbish. Because you see, hon Temporary Chairperson, if you are not able to do the small things in life, how will you be able to do the big things? It is because over the years, the Western Cape has systematically been making its bed, doing its dishes and taking out the rubbish, that it has been able to focus on the big issues: infrastructure, growth and fighting for our fair share of the National Budget.

Today, I would like to actually reflect on the terminology of the word ‘mundane’, which stems from the Latin word *mundas*, meaning ordinary and worldly, essentially an everyday matter. What is interesting is this word comes from the translation of the Greek word *cosmos* which while in mathematics it refers to the physical universe, but originally actually meant ‘orderly arrangement’.

So, when the Western Cape tells you that all departments in the Western Cape Government received unqualified audits for the 2021/2022 financial year, it is not an achievement to ignore [Interjections.] because if you make your bed, if you do the dishes and take out the rubbish, you can focus on attending the netball games and piano recitals. You can focus on reading to your children before bed and you can focus on the things that matter. Because if you do not deal with the mundane tasks in your life, your space will become cluttered. You will not have an orderly arrangement.

It was Victoria Moran that said, quote:

“A simple life is not seeing how little we can get by with – that is poverty – but how efficiently we can put first things first. When you are clear about your purpose and your priorities, you can painlessly discard whatever does not support these, whether it is clutter in your cabinets or commitments on your calendar.”

Quote closed. Hon Temporary Chairperson, the Western Cape did not just

wake up and suddenly have 100% of unqualified audits in its departments. The Province was clear about its purpose and its priorities, and we then painlessly discarded whatever does not support these. An unqualified audit outcome does not happen overnight. You need strong and ethical leadership and the culture of accountability that the DA has instilled in the Western Cape Government.

The reasons for this are because we are dealing with the people's money. It is not President Ramaphosa's money, it is not hon Minister Godongwana's money [Interjections.], it is not even hon Premier Winde's or hon Minister Wenger's money, it is the people's money. The State is funded by the taxpayer through income tax, [Interjections.] through VAT, through fuel levies and the like, and the beneficiaries of this money are the people of South Africa because it is the people's money. So, when National Government allocates us Provincial Equitable Share, they are not doing us a favour. It is the people's money. We need to make sure that we have a level of financial responsibility so that we can deliver services efficiently in the Western Cape.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, we saw in the Zondo Commission report, ANC politicians love seeing money go down the drain, but money needs to come from somewhere and it does not grow under mattresses. And if you want more money to do the big things, you first need to get the small things right. You need to do the mundane tasks. Because we have become so good at making our beds, cleaning our dishes and taking out the rubbish that we have

indeed been able to focus on the big things like adding an additional R1,28 billion to the Provincial Government spending over the next three years, bringing total expenditure of the 2023 MTF to R230,82 billion. This includes R31 billion on infrastructure projects, an additional R200 million to continue the Law Enforcement Advance Plan, also known as the LEAP project, an additional R168 billion over the MTF for Health and Education, with these two departments controlling 73% of the budget for this period.

The Western Cape Education Department will be constructing an additional 842 classrooms in the current financial year, far exceeding the construction of 212 classrooms last year, also known as the Rapid Build Project. And hon Temporary Chairperson, for those who do not know, this is like building the equivalent of almost 70% more than what Gauteng announced. And by the way, on 27 November, hon Temporary Chairperson, the ENCA News Channel published that 35 000 Grade 1s and Grade 8s in Gauteng, still need to be placed.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, when you are clear about your purpose and your priorities, you can painlessly discard whatever does not support your priorities. Hon Minister Wenger has tabled a framework for hope because she has clear purpose and clear priorities.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, sometimes, when you do as well as the Western Cape Government, you become a victim of your success. The population growth in the Western Cape is progressing at a rapid rate with Stats SA



projecting an increase of more than 460 000 people for the period 2021/2026, which will increase service delivery pressures in the province, and it is important for us to remain resolute in our clarity of purpose and priorities. It is difficult, however, when despite being financially responsible, you are facing budgetary cuts and cost of living increases. While we received an additional increase for public wages as part of national contingencies, in the actual Division of Revenue Adjustment Bill on page 4, when you go and look at the actual Bill, the Western Cape did not receive a cent ...[Interjection.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Calm down!

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...in terms of the Provincial Equitable Share for service delivery. The revision to the Provincial Equitable Share Formula will also see the Western Cape over the MTF period lose over R500 million in their Health Vote and we are in this dire situation because the ANC-run National Government is not clear about its purpose or its priorities. Those who make their beds, clean their dishes, and take out their rubbish are now being punished for cleaning their house too well. Those who are good at cleaning must not be punished, hon Temporary Chairperson, because what the ANC also fails to learn and continually fails to understand is that we are not good at the mundane. [Interjections.] If you are not good at the ordinary, you will fail at being extraordinary. Hon Temporary Chairperson, I thank you. [Applause.]

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Before you get a heart attack, thank you, *ja*.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Hon member Lekker? [Interjections.] Hon member Lekker? Hon member Marran.

The ACTING CHIEF WHIP (DA): Would you like me to speak to you more?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Lekker, can you please switch off your mic there?

†The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Oh, uxolo.

[The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Oh, sorry.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. I now recognise hon Minister Wenger.

The MINISTER FOR FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson and thanks very much to the hon members for their contributions to this debate. I have taken note of the comments and in response to some of them, to hon Dugmore: we have a careful compensation of employee strategy which allows departments in a differentiated way to mobilise their human resources as they need for service delivery, that also provides a fiscal buffer from uncertainties year-on-year which I had already spoken about.

On the school infrastructure, I know my colleague, hon Mackenzie, has

already mentioned it, but it is very important to reiterate that hon Minister Maynier has announced last week, a very ambitious school building programme ...[Interjection.] which aims to deliver 842 additional classrooms, which is space for 26 000 learners at least. And this, again, emphasises the importance of infrastructure, especially social infrastructure. For this, we have provisioned R1 billion for Education infrastructure and R2,14 billion for Human Settlements. [Interjections.]

I would like to thank hon Murray for sharing information on the Public Employment Programme through our Skills Development Programme, which has been hugely successful. Hon Minister Mbombo, thanks very much for sharing your concerns which I share with you, about the Health component of the Provincial Equitable Share and that is something that we do need to tackle head on.

I think hon August missed the jobs numbers that came out yesterday, so let me repeat: 85 000 jobs created in Quarter 3 [Interjections.] and 203 000 jobs created year-on-year. Hon Christians, I agree with his inputs as well. Instead of spending money on SOEs to bail them out, give that money to provinces for service delivery. And I note his comments on Neighbourhood Watches. I would like to thank hon Minister Fernandez, hon Mackenzie and hon Baartman for their contributions to the debate.

To hon Brinkhuis: I am not quite sure how he could say that we are not prioritising safety. We are spending R1 billion over the MTF to put more

boots on the ground in crime hotspots. [Applause.]

An HON MEMBER: Yes! [Applause.]

The MINISTER FOR FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: If that is not prioritising safety, I do not know what is and it is precisely to subsidise National Government failures. And yes, we are continuing funding a very small unit for the tourism, the Tourism Unit, but that is R2 million, which is in addition to the R1 billion for crime hotspots and we do that in those areas where tourists, both local, domestic and international, go to visit because tourism is a job creator. It supported 175 000 jobs in 2019 and so we need to make sure that we can grow our tourism sector so that we can create jobs.

In response to hon Lekker, I think she also missed the jobs numbers. So, let me repeat: 85 000 created in Quarter 3 and 203 000 created year-on-year. And I would like to also then reemphasise the point that tax collected does not belong to the National Government. It belongs to the citizens of this country. It is their hard-earned blood, sweat and tears and that includes citizens of this province. And us as public representatives of the people of the Western Cape, ought to fight, we have to fight for our fair share of that funding in order to make sure that the citizens of the Western Cape can equally be cared for.

Then, in response to hon Nkondlo. She is quite right. Hon Premier Winde, in

his Maiden State of the Province Address, did promise job creation and the Western Cape Government has continued to have this as a priority. That has not changed. But we did have a once in a lifetime pandemic and so the Government embarked on a Recovery Plan to make sure that our job creation priority could stay on track. We are now transitioning from recovery to growth, through the Growth for Jobs Strategy, so we can move from immediate recovery of jobs lost to jobs through growth. That shows the agility of this Government, and it reminds me of a quote from J F Kennedy who said that:

“Change is the law of life. And those who look only to the past or the present are certain to miss the future.”

And that is why we have set out a clear framework for hope, detailing how we will continue on our path from recovery to growth ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members.

The MINISTER FOR FINANCE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES: ...by allocating funds across the departments of this Government, guided by our priorities of jobs, safety, and wellbeing towards a better future for the people of the Western Cape. Thank you. [Applause.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Order, hon members. Hon members, that concludes the Debate on the Consideration

[Interjections.] Order, hon members. That concludes the Debate on the Consideration of the Principle of the Bill. Are there any objections to the Approval of the Principle of the Bill?

HON MEMBERS: No!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Yes, yes!

An HON MEMBER: The principle?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: *Ja*.

An HON MEMBER: Is that the name of the Bill? [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members [Interjections.] Hon member, order! Hon members, order please. We do not want the same situation as earlier today, so please pay attention. Are there any objections to the Approval of the Principle of the Bill?

HON MEMBERS: No!

HON MEMBERS: Yes!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Objections noted. [Interjections.] Order hon members. [Interjections.] Hon members standing, are you coming or are

you going? [Laughter.] Thank you very much, hon members. [Interjections.] Thank you very much. Order, hon members, can we move along. The Secretary will now read the Bill.

The SECRETARY: *Western Cape Adjustments Appropriation Bill* [B3–2022]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Secretary. The House will then now further deal with the separate Votes onwards. The Secretary will now read the Second Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of report of the *Standing Committee on Social Development on the Children's Amendment Bill* [B 18D–2020] (NCOP).

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Secretary. Order, hon members. The House received the Report of the Standing Committee on Social Development on the Children's Amendment Bill conferring authority on the Western Cape Delegation in the NCOP to support this Bill. This mandate has been sent to the NCOP. I will now afford parties an opportunity to make a declaration if they so wish and it will be a three-minute declaration per party. I now recognise the ANC.

An HON MEMBER: Incoming Speaker.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Incoming Speaker. [Interjections.] Thank

you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, the ANC supports the Children's Amendment Bill. The Bill seeks to strengthen protection of vulnerable children through coordinated provision of Care and Protection Services [Interjections.], address gaps and challenges in the Child Care and Protection system ...[Interjection.]

Ms C MURRAY (DA): A point of order, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Bakubaku-Vos, apologies.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Yes?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: There is a point of order. Please take your seat.

Ms C MURRAY (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. I would just like to raise that the hon member is reading, once again. Thank you very much. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon members! [Interjections.] [Laughter.] Hon members. Order hon members. Can we please let hon Bakubaku-Vos continue ...[Interjection.] Hon Sayed, a point of order?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, this is declaration, not a speech, hon Temporary Chairperson. The Rules speak



about not reading the speech, not about not reading the declaration. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Sayed. [Interjections.] Hon Bakubaku-Vos, you may continue. [Interjections.] Do you have a point of order, hon Minister? Hon Minister Fernandez and hon Bakubaku-Vos, why are you conversing across the floor? [Interjections.] Did you want a point of order, hon Minister? Order, hon members. Order, hon members! Hon member Bakubaku-Vos. Thank you very much, for the clarity, hon Minister. Hon Bakubaku-Vos, please continue.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. The Bill seeks strengthening and protection of vulnerable children through coordinated provision of Care and Protection Services, address gaps and challenges in the Child Care and Protection system and identify strategies to address these challenges, and to respond to a High Court order relating to the foster care challenges and provide for a comprehensive legislative system.

We recognise that Bill was in response to the 2017 North Gauteng High Court order, which instructed the hon Social Development Minister to come up with a comprehensive legal solution to the challenges facing the foster care system. In accordance with the ruling, the Minister introduced a Bill in Parliament on 31 August 2020. The process has not been an easy one. It had its ups and downs and, in many areas, disagreements among political parties and stakeholders, but we appreciate the progress made to get to this point.

We must also note and commend the sterling job done by the hon member, and especially, the hon Chairperson of the Select Committee on Health and Social Services, comrade Maurencia Gillion. Together with her team, they led a well-coordinated public participation process and gave a number of key-stakeholders opportunities to give their input and consulted Provincial Legislatures. However, we remain alarmed by the current foster care backlog and hope that the finalisation of the Bill brings lasting solutions to the current challenges.

The Bill, through its objective, also provides for: children's right to privacy and protection of information, funding of any Childhood Development programmes, the designation and function for a Registrar of the National Child Protection Register, extension of the children's code jurisdiction, the hearing of child abduction matters, the care of abandoned or orphaned children and additional matters that may be regulated. Additional matters related to children is ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Bakubaku-Vos, your time.

Ms N G BAKUBAKU-VOS (ANC): ...alternative care and other related matters. I thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. [Applause.] The EFF? [Laughter.] Order, hon members. EFF? I do not get any indication

from the EFF. The GOOD party? GOOD?

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): I am here, I am here. Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. All legislation that looks to strengthen society's defence against the misuse, abuse and violence against children is greatly welcomed. GOOD launched a campaign to address Gender-Based Violence and we know domestic violence often gives way to endangering the lives of our children, and it is on this that we should develop stronger measures to protect them.

This Bill in question looks to address spiralling challenges which will serve the children of this province and the country at large. In equal measure, the act of deregistering children after continued absence from school, as well as the absence of social programmes and extra curriculum activities in communities, do more damage to our collective efforts than what it does any good. GOOD calls on the continued development of legislation to protect children's basic rights from being eroded on and that there is greater investment in our youth: their education, their participation in society and their future.

Social Development and Education should form the cornerstone for these programmes to be implemented and should become foundation institutions to protect children and build them to become valued citizens of this Republic. This Bill advances a great deal of the rights of children to be active members of society, to have access to a safe, loving, and caring home and to address challenges such as children's abductions.

Good welcomes this Bill, its development and what it seeks to achieve in the lives and development of the future of our province. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member August. ACDP?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. The ACDP is not making a declaration now. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Christians. The Freedom Front Plus? [Interjections.] Freedom Front Plus? [Interjections.] Not responding. Order, hon members. [Interjections.] Al Jama-ah?

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, Al Jama-ah supports this ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Bosman. Order, hon members. Hon member Brinkhuis, is that you?

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Yes, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, yes, thank you very much. Al Jama-ah supports this Bill.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Proceed, hon member Brinkhuis.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Am I audible, hon Temporary Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Indeed, you are, hon member. You may proceed.

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much. Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, Al Jama-ah supports this Bill. Thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Brinkhuis. That was short and sweet. The Democratic Alliance?

Mr D PLATO (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson, thank you very much for the opportunity. During 2017, the North Gauteng High Court ruled that the foster care system in its current form is unconstitutional, unlawful, and invalid. [Interjection.] The Court also found that the delay in putting in place the necessary mechanism, structures, and resources to ensure that the foster care system operates in a sustainable and effective manner is also unconstitutional, unlawful, and invalid.

“The first respondent is directed within 15 months of this order to prepare and introduce before Parliament the necessary amendments to the Children’s Act 38 of 2000 and”  
...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member Plato, please take your seat. Can I ask the two hon members on my righthand side – they know who they are, hon members Maseko and hon Bosman – can I please ask you not to converse aloud as you are interfering with the speaker on the floor. Thank you very much. [Interjections.] You may continue [Interjections.] You may continue, hon member Plato.

Mr D PLATO (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

“The first respondent is directed within 15 months of this order to prepare and introduce before Parliament the necessary amendments to the Children’s Act 38 of 2005 or the Social Assistance Act 13 of 2014, to produce a comprehensive legal solution regarding the foster care system.”

Therefore, the main thrust of the Bill is to bring the Bill in line with the decision of the North Gauteng High Court. Our Standing Committee focused on clauses that relate to care, as well as to deal with the challenges and solutions relating to foster care. This Government’s Standing Committee on Social Development has played its meaningful role by embarking on an extensive public participation process to debate and getting input from stakeholders as far as possible.

On that note, hon Temporary Chairperson, I am very pleased to recommend,

like others in this House today, acceptance of the final mandate as it stands. I thank all our hon members of the Standing Committee on Social Development for their support during this process. Thank you so much.

An HON MEMBER: Yes, hear, hear!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Thank you very much, hon member Plato. [Applause.] Thank you. Thank you, hon members. [Interjections.] Hon members, hon members, I am putting the question to you. Are there any objections to the motion?

HON MEMBERS: No! No!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No objections, agreed to. Thank you very much, hon members. I have to announce that there are currently – the number of hon members in the House? [Laughter.] Order! Order, hon members. Thank you very much, hon members. Therefore, the Report on the Standing Committee on Social Development on the Children's Amendment Bill has therefore been adopted.

Hon members, the Secretary will read the Third Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of report of the *Ad Hoc Committee on Western Cape Provincial Parliament Seats*.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I have been informed by the hon Chief Whip that the Programming Authority resolved that there would be no list of speakers and that parties who wish to do so, will now be afforded an opportunity to make a declaration of the Vote for a maximum of three minutes. I will now afford parties an opportunity to make a declaration if they so wish. I now recognise the ANC.

The CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. The ANC realising that as members of this House, we are all held liable, and our actions must speak what we preach. In the ANC, we therefore have read the Report of the Ad Hoc Committee Rule in terms of Rule 119 of the Standing Committee, the Rules for the increase of the seats in the Western Cape Provincial Legislature.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, I rise on behalf of the ANC to support the adoption of this report today. When the Ad Hoc Committee was established earlier this year, the ANC mentioned that 28 years into our democracy, it would be fair to evaluate the number of representatives of our people in this House. Again, the ANC wishes to reiterate that amidst the economic challenges of our time, the ANC does not make this decision to adopt this report today recommending the increase in the number of seats in the House, lightly.

The Ad Hoc Committee established to investigate the feasibility of the increase in seats heard from the WCPP Research Unit presenting both



qualitative and quantitative arguments for the increase in numbers. The Committee has also engaged the IEC and these discussions too, were helpful in the Committee making the recommendations that it does.

The demographics of our province, having changed over the last 20 years, and specifically, the increase in population. We cannot help though, but to mention those who criticise the migration of people in the Western Cape are also the ones supporting the increase of seats and therefore benefit from this increase in population. There should be little doubt that the ANC would want to go as far as scrapping the Provincial Constitution of the Western Cape altogether, yet as long as this Provincial Constitution remains in place, we will insist that at times, it be amended appropriately and that provisions as they stand in the implementation, are implemented.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the ANC wishes to repeat that efforts must be made to ensure that our democracy is strengthened, and we therefore support any means which seek to strengthen the state and efficiency of our people's representation and therefore, democracy. The ANC supports the adoption of the report. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Lekker.  
[Applause.] I now recognise the EFF.

Mr M XEGO (EFF): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please continue, hon member Xego.

Mr M XEGO (EFF): Yes, thanks. As the EFF, we take note of the recommendations that were made in the report in terms of the number of seats in the Western Cape Provincial Legislature. The understanding is that this will assist members in terms of effectiveness, as far as executing their duties in the House such as holding the Provincial Executive to account, as well as attending the party deployments, amongst other things; especially taking note that the last termination of seats was done in 1999 and since then, nothing has been made in that particular regard, which directly impacted on the constituency serving in the Western Cape.

It is indeed true that hon members of House have a duty to hold the Provincial Executive to account. However, currently, as things stand, hon members of the DA in this House always defend their fellow DA members who serve in the Provincial Executive, rather than holding their members accountable. We have seen this happening in this House, in committees, as well as in SCOPA. So, having additional members will not change this attitude. Hon members of the DA will not suddenly say they have no additional members and therefore, take this House seriously. No, it is not going to happen. This is just an exercise that will seriously impact on the increase of membership and constituency serving, but it will not impact directly on the hon members of the House holding the Executive to account. Perhaps the model can be developed more effectively and successfully in developed countries with vast resources, and not just here in South Africa

and other areas. But we do accept and support this Bill that let there be changes in terms of the seat numbers. Thank you very much.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Xego. The GOOD party?

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Hon Temporary Chairperson, the cost of living is at an all time high. The cost of rates, taxes, food, water, and electricity is crippling citizens and they simply do not have more financial rope left to honour living expenses. While the people are suffering, this Government adopts a position to increase the seat capacity of the Legislature to pay more politicians, dish out millions more to secretarial and constituency allowances and all this, to whose cost? The already overburdened taxpayer who simply cannot carry it.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, we are living in a time of digital wonder, technological advancements, and greater strides with innovation. This House prides itself that it could continue its work at the onslaught of the COVID-19 pandemic as it incorporated virtual sittings. Considering this and ensuring that politicians should ...[Interjection.] technology ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon member August? Hon member August, my apologies for interrupting you. Please take your seat. There is a point of order in the House. Hon member Sayed?

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, is hon member August willing to take a question about what he did in the Committee when it sat? Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon member Sayed. That is not a point of order. Please continue, hon member August.

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Hon Temporary Chairperson, I have not made any comments in the House or in the Committee at all. While I have attended, I was there only to listen, but let me proceed, hon Temporary Chairperson. Considering this [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order hon members! [Interjections.]  
Order, hon members. Hon member August, please proceed.

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Considering this and ensuring that politicians should incorporate technology in the advancement of political work, the same DA is now asking the people of the Western Cape to look the other way as they want to give more of their friends millions, whilst some people in the province go hungry daily.

GOOD opposes the call for the Government to increase the seat capacity of this Legislature. It is a waste of limited public resources that could have been better utilised elsewhere. Whilst the DA is looking to enlarge the gravy train, there are children going to bed hungry who have not had a meal in

days; a young man slaughtering cats for consumption just to be able to survive; women, children and youth being raped, murdered, abducted and trafficked; large scale joblessness, zero opportunities, unemployed graduates, broken families and communities, and many more social challenges.

In the face of all of this, the DA-led Provincial Government is of the opinion that more politicians are the answer and taxpayers should just be okay with carrying these costs at a time where our people have so little trust in politicians and little apathy for politics itself. Not only is this wrong, but it is also insensitive and out of touch with the plight of the people who could benefit more from that money should it be reprioritised into a working and functional social package. This is plainly opportunistic and should be condemned in the strongest sense. Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member August. ACDP?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, the ACDP supports the adoption of this report of the Ad Hoc Committee concerning the Western Cape Provincial Parliament seats. It is a fact that the current number of seats is not sufficient to represent the people of the Western Cape optimally. Only 31 members serving on committees have oversight, engage in public and constituency-based work, while 11 of the members serve on the Executive. So, an increase is critical to serve the people of the Western Cape. We know that the numbers, the

population growth, have increased to almost 7 million people and it does not do justice to 31 members doing oversight.

I must also say that well done to the Chair, hon Van der Westhuizen, and the hon members of the Committee who held and contributed to the compilation of the report. It was well done. Hon members worked well together, and we can achieve much more working together in order to ensure that our residents in the Western Cape are heard and their needs are addressed. I thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Christians. Freedom Front Plus? Freedom Front Plus? No indication. Al Jama-ah?

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. Yes, hon Temporary Chairperson, on behalf of the Al Jama-ah we support the adoption of the Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on seats, to increase the seats of the Western Cape Legislature. I thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member Brinkhuis. [Interjections.] The Democratic Alliance? [Interjections.] Order, hon members!

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson, until

the hon August spoke, all parties in this House supported this report. Between the passing of the Western Cape Constitution in 1996 and 2021, the population of the Western Cape grew by more than 44%. This means that instead of the target of 1 for every 100 000 citizens, we are currently each serving almost 170 000 citizens.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the Zondo Commission confirmed the importance of good governance. It goes without saying that if the people of this province feel divorced from the democratic processes that take place in this House, the very purpose of the democracy that we have worked so hard to establish and to build in this province and the country, is defeated. [Interjections.] For this reason, ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, hon members!

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): ...this House unanimously decided earlier this year to form an Ad Hoc Committee, representing all parties in the House to investigate whether the current size of the Legislature is still appropriate. [Interjections.]

The Committee benefitted tremendously from studies done by the research section, the support of the Committee section, as well as information provided by our legal advisors. Our attention was drawn, inter alia, to the finding of the Constitutional Court in 1999 that provinces with their own constitutions have the right to determine the number of seats in the

Legislature and (b) that the Electoral Act was amended last year requiring of the IEC to now determine, redetermine the number of seats before every national election. This formula of 1:100 000 residents has remained in that amended Electoral Act.

So, I am pleased to report that this multi-party body has unanimously decided to recommend that the Western Cape Constitution be amended to allow for the growth in population figures and at the time, it did include the vote from hon August as well. Given that we all agree that such a change is necessary, on paper at least, I would urge all hon members of this House to work together to ensure that the process of revising Section 13 of the Western Cape Constitution is completed in time for the 2024 elections – that is, if we do not go for an early election – which again, will give our people the representation in the Legislature which they so deserve. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, hon members!

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): I thank all hon members in this House, especially those on the Ad Hoc Committee for their willingness ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Van der Westhuizen, please wrap up.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): ...to work together on this matter



and look forward to seeing a more representative Western Cape Provincial Parliament in future. Therefore, I urge all hon members to support the report on the Ad Hoc Committee ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Thank you, hon Van der Westhuizen.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): ...on the number of Western Cape Provincial Parliament seats ...[Interjection.]

An HON MEMBER: Hear, hear!

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): I thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. What is your point of order?

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, the point of order relates to creating precedent in this House. As we all know, we were just hearing declarations regarding a multi-party Committee and I think we must just, and I would like you as an hon Temporary Chairperson possibly to rule on this at a later point when you discuss, but when a Chair of a multi-party committee then addresses the House, that Chair should avoid making party political statements because he is actually reflecting a report on a committee.

So, it is not something that, you know, we are going to crucify hon Van der Westhuizen for, but it is not good practice when he brings in this ridiculous notion of an early election when he is not. He is representing his party there, whereas actually, he was representing the multi-party Committee. I think it is just a lesson for the hon member to learn. [Interjections.] He is still young in this House.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Dugmore.  
...[Interjection.]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Van der Westhuizen, are you  
...[Interjection.]

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): On a point of order? On a point of order?

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Please proceed.

Mr A P VAN DER WESTHUIZEN (DA): Threatening a member with crucifixion, is that ...[Laughter.] is that parliamentary? Thank you. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very ...[Laughter.] [Interjections.] Order, hon members! Order, hon members. Hon Dugmore, we will ...[Interjection.] Hon Dugmore, do you wish the Chair to make a ruling? Was that your request or did you just give the lesson? [Laughter.]

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: It is, thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. It is an issue of precedent and possibly, you know [Interjections.]. Once we have a new Speaker ...[Interjections.] once we have a new Speaker elected, we can just ask that Speaker to investigate. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, hon members.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Thank you. Ask the Speaker to investigate a convention in regard to multi-party committees and how they report. Thanks.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I do note your comment, hon Dugmore. Unfortunately, the Temporary Chairperson cannot influence members' speeches.

Hon members, I put the question before or rather, I have to announce that there are currently 36 hon members present and entitled to vote, and the House is therefore quorate. The question put before the House is that the Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Western Cape Provincial Parliament Seats be adopted. Are there any objections to the report being adopted, hon members?

HON MEMBERS: No. None.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No objections ...[Interjection.]

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Hon Temporary Chairperson ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Agreed to. [Interjections.]

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Hon Temporary Chairperson, please note GOOD's objection. [Laughter.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Your objection is recorded, hon August. [Interjections.] Order, hon members! We are getting there. [Interjections.]. Order, hon members! The Secretary will now read the Fourth Order of the Day.

†The SECRETARY: Ingqwalaselo kule ngxelo yeKomiti Yendlu Yowiso Mthetho ejongene nozinziso lolunto, elinomgobo othi isidima nokungamela

imisibenzi ethatyathwe yile komiti.

[The SECRETARY: Consideration of report of the Standing Committee on Human Settlements. Theme: Dignity Oversight activities undertaken by the Committee.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. I have been informed by the Chief Whip that the Programming Authority resolved that there would be no list of speakers and that parties who wish to do so, will now be afforded an opportunity to make a declaration of the Vote for a maximum of three minutes per party. I will now afford you to do so. I recognise the ANC.

Mr P MARRAN (ANC): Hon Temporary Chairperson, the ANC notes and welcomes the tabling of this report. The Dignity Oversight report is a culmination of various interactions and engagements with district and category B municipalities between February and September 2022.

The Oversight visit enabled the Committee to witness housing delivery challenges in the Province and across municipalities. There needs to be an urgent intervention to address the challenges related to the Housing Demand Database in all municipalities and the Province. The hon MEC must lead the process of upgrading and aligning this Database, as it is a mess in all municipalities and in the Province. This, together with the rapid spread of informal settlements was raised starkly as a concern in many municipalities. The municipalities also highlighted the poor living conditions of our people

in informal settlements where they are living with minimal basic services at their disposal, due to insufficient resources. There must be concerted efforts to address these challenges. The MEC and Mayors must be seen to be championing these.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the report is welcome as a fair reflection of the housing situation in the province and municipalities. The Western Cape and its municipalities are performing so badly on housing development that if they were to be rated, many will get 1 out of 10. The pace of housing delivery in the province is worryingly low.

Take, for example, the Trans Hex housing projects which were started in 2019/2020 with the aim to deliver 3 226 mixed houses in the first phase. The first 44 houses were supposed to be handed over in December 2020, which was later moved to March 2021 and again, to March 2022. In December 2022, this December – this December 2022 – not a single house had been handed over. The National Home Builders Registration Council (NHBRC) refused to sign off on the 33 houses due to structural problems. This report is therefore welcome as it exposes DA complacency. It shows how the hon MEC remains clueless in this space.

The ANC also continues to make calls on the hon MEC to prioritise providing housing for Ms Bless and her physically challenged son in Witzenberg, who continue to live in squalor. I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Marran. I recognise the EFF. The EFF? I recognise the GOOD party.

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. The Dignity Report 2022 is this Government's presentation to the people of the province to showcase what it has been doing to address decades of human settlements backlogs in various districts and local municipalities in the Western Cape. GOOD stands resolute that we cannot maintain the apartheid spatial architecture where a railway-line, a road or field opening separates different groupings of people and communities.

GOOD calls and will continue to ring the call that this Government and the rest of the country should expediently ensure that the building of affordable housing units in city business and town centres for people to be closer to their place of work, institutions of education, health services and markets, allow for communities of all races, backgrounds, religions, creeds and origins, to bring together those ideals of a true Rainbow Nation; build and develop integrated mixed-use building complexes, such as developments in Bredasdorp and Cape Town, that will ensure all people of this province can access a dignified place of living. How people live matters, where people live matters, how people access public transport matters and how they make an income, matters. At the heart of all this, this is the Human Settlements factor.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, giving people a dignified home should be the

core focus of this Government. The Dignity Report gives some evidence to that, but we must go much further than this. We must do more to address the dire need of housing and the backlog of their delivery. We need to advance Government subsidies, services and support the fast-track mechanisms such as Finance Linked Individual Subsidy Programme (FLISP) so that young people, South Africans, can buy into housing markets of their choice, whether it is in Camps Bay, Platteklouf, Bellville or in our rural communities.

In addition, GOOD calls on greater inclusion of environmentally friendly build techniques and materials, to include greater forestry projects into Human Settlements developments and ensure that we do our utmost best to protect the environment as much as we need to protect the dignity in destitute people in search of a home. Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon August. I recognise the ACDP.

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson, the ACDP supports the Dignity Oversight Report. Just a concern that was highlighted in the report is the increase in the number of Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) houses that are being rented out to migrants by beneficiaries. So, that was one of the major concerns. Another major concern was also the farm evictions in areas that were adding to the housing demand in the Theewaterskloof Municipality. Another major concern, and this is where municipalities had to get security guards, employ security



guards, to protect the illegal occupation of erven.

So, the ACDP notes that there are major concerns and hopes that these concerns and challenges will be addressed. Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Christians. The Freedom Front Plus? Vryheidsfront Plus? No response. Al Jama-ah? [Interjections.]

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, Al Jama-ah welcomes this report. Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Brinkhuis. The Democratic Alliance?

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you very much, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, hon Premier, hon Cabinet members, and hon members. The Standing Committee on Human Settlements has conducted numerous oversight visits under the theme Dignity across the Western Cape this year. The purpose of these visits was to determine whether the commitments made by hon Minister Tertius Simmers earlier in the year, have materialised, giving our communities hope and most importantly, to ensure that residents of the Western Cape know the dignity of home ownership.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, in April of this year, the Standing Committee visited the Garden Route District Municipalities as part of its oversight role to interact with the municipalities, which are B municipalities. The local governments highlighted to the Standing Committee members the challenges they had in providing housing, including the issuing of historical title deeds for the years 1994 to 2014. The Provincial Department of Human Settlements sought to address this issue by making available a grant for title deed restoration to help Garden Route municipalities clear their backlogs. It was clear from the visits that the Western Cape Government remains committed to the eradication of title deeds backlog in the province.

Members of the Committee also ensured that the Provincial Department continues to be aware of challenges through various oral and parliamentary questions to the hon Minister throughout the year. The Standing Committee also embarked on oversight visits to the Cape Winelands where the projects of the Provincial Department of Human Settlements were observed in May this year. The Cape Winelands District Municipalities also revealed details to the Committee about their project on urbanisation challenges, in which the municipality is trying to determine how rapidly the populations from both formal and informal settlements are growing in the area. The Committee commended the Cape Winelands Districts for committing to prepare itself for substantial population growth, in light of the Western Cape's expanding population, and the impact this will have on housing delivery.

Furthermore, the Standing Committee, hon Temporary Chairperson, also visited the Mill Park housing development project in the Cape Agulhas Municipality. In this initiative, the Western Cape Government observed a rise in the Bredasdorp community's interests in buying homes for the first time. It was quite clear that people in the Western Cape have a strong desire to own their own homes and the Provincial Department of Human Settlements continues to support these needs through initiatives like the Help Me Buy a Home programme.

In order to ensure that the Provincial Department fulfils its commitment to offer more people with access to affordable housing opportunities across the province, the Standing Committee will continue to make significant efforts in performing oversight and meeting with the communities and municipalities. With the numbers increasing on the Housing Demand Database, we need to be innovative if we are to tackle ever increasing backlog ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Maseko, you need to wrap up, please.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Thank you. I would like to close by thanking the members of the Human Settlements Standing Committee who crossed the province in a fact-finding mission, for their dedication as seeking transparency from all spheres of Government and making sure that their oversight responsibilities are carried out with diligence.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

Ms L M MASEKO (DA): Hon Temporary Chairperson, I thank you.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon member. I have to announce that there are currently 32 hon members present and entitled to vote, and the House is therefore quorate. The question put before the House is that the Report of the Standing Committee on Human Settlements with the theme Dignity Oversight activities undertaken by the Committee, be adopted. Are there any objections to the report being adopted?

HON MEMBERS: No! No!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: No objections, agreed to. Hon members, the Secretary will now read the Fifth Order of the Day. Or rather, my apologies, which is permitted. The Report of the Standing Committee on Human Settlements with the theme Dignity Oversight activities undertaken by the Committee, has therefore been adopted. The Secretary will now read the Fifth Order of the Day.

The SECRETARY: Consideration of report of the *Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill* [B 22–2022] (NCOP).

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Order, hon

members. The House received the Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP, not to support the Bill. This mandate has been sent to the NCOP. I will now afford parties an opportunity to make a declaration of three minutes each if they so wish. I recognise the ANC.

Ms N D NKONDLO (ANC): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. The African National Congress supports the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill. The ANC acknowledged the R290 million Municipal Disaster Recovery Grant allocated towards the reconstruction and rehabilitation of municipal infrastructure damaged by flash floods in the Western Cape Province between November and December 2021. This grant comes after the Overberg District, Garden Route District, and the Cape Winelands District Municipalities experienced flooding towards the end of last year, destroying over 80 homes along with public infrastructure. We believe that this grant will provide these municipalities with the necessary relief that they require and prevention against future catastrophes.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the ANC also notes from the Adjusted Estimates of Provincial Revenue and Expenditure Budget, the increase of the Provincial Equitable Share in several Votes. Notably, the Department of Social Development and the Department of Transport and Public Works. The Department of Social Development with this budget increase could create more employment of unemployed social worker graduates, as well as increase the budgets for victim empowerment and food relief programmes.

While notorious for underspending, this Provincial Government will never not shut up about restricted funding from National. They piloted the Blue Dot project and even though it yielded good results, they discontinued it complaining about the budget. Surely, there were reserves where they had secured funding from, so what is stopping them from doing it again? But because this project is for the mini-bus taxi industry which caters for the black population, it will never take precedence in the eyes of the DA.

As stated at the beginning of the year, the Equitable Share Formula is a work-in-progress, and we will still maintain hope that the Provincial Government can cooperate with the National Government by supplying a constructive proposal in the development of the Formula. The ANC supports the Bill. I thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: Hear, hear!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Nkondlo. I recognise the EFF. The EFF? No response. The GOOD party?

Mr S N AUGUST (GOOD): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. No declarations in support.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon August. The ACDP?

Mr F C CHRISTIANS (ACDP): Hon Temporary Chairperson, the ACDP does not support the Bill. Thank you.

An HON MEMBER: No!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, hon Christians. The Freedom Front Plus? The Freedom Front Plus? No response. Al Jama-ah?

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, Al Jama-ah supports the Division of Revenue Bill. Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Brinkhuis. I recognise the Democratic Alliance.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. Hon Temporary Chairperson, I will be short because quite frankly, this Bill does not say much. In fact, it says almost next to nothing. In terms of this Bill, if one can go look at page 4, the Western Cape received R0 in terms of the Provincial Equitable Share Formula. There is also R0 adjustment in conditional grants for the Western Cape municipalities, specifically receiving R289 million for the Municipal Disaster Recovery Grant [Interjections.] and we welcome that we are receiving, these municipalities are receiving this Municipal ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Order, hon members!

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): ...Disaster Recovery Grant. But because the ANC house is falling apart so much, the National Treasury tabled the money to the wrong municipalities, hon Temporary Chairperson.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, the Western Cape opposes the recent revisions, revised allocations for the health component in the Provincial Equitable Share Formula as it means the Western Cape will lose over R500 million in the healthcare funding over the medium term. Our calls to include Inclusive Education, formally known as Special Needs Education and Gender-Based Violence as practiced ...[Interjection.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Hon Baartman, my apologies. Please take your seat. Hon Marran and hon Kama, we have now provided the previous speakers the opportunity to deliver their declarations. Can we please afford the same courtesy to the hon member on the floor, please? [Interjections.] Thank you very much. Hon member, please proceed.

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): Thank you, hon Temporary Chairperson. The Western Cape schools plea to include inclusive education, formally known as Special Needs Education and Gender-Based Violence as factors in the Provincial Equitable Share Formula, continues to also fall upon deaf ears. The Budget Committee considered thus the subject of the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill referred to in accordance with Standing Rule 217



and recommended that the House confers on the Western Cape's delegation in the National Council of Provinces, the authority to not support the Bill. We had a minority view in terms of Standing Rule 19 as the National African Congress expressed its minority view that it supports the Bill. Ironically enough, I do not see in this report a view from Al Jama-ah, which is a permanent member on the Committee.

Hon Temporary Chairperson, before I conclude, I just want to say: the Western Cape will unashamedly continue to fight for its fair share in terms of the Provincial Equitable Share. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much ...[Interjection.]

The DEPUTY CHIEF WHIP (DA): We support this report to object to the Bill.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, hon Baartman. [Interjections.] I have to announce that there are currently 31 – order, hon members! Hon member Marran, we are almost there. [Interjections.] Because I only see you speaking. Hon members, order! Hon members, I have to announce that there are currently 31 hon members present and entitled to vote, and the House is therefore quorate. The question before the House that the Report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill conferring authority on the Western Cape delegation in the NCOP not to support the Bill, be ratified and adopted.

The LEADER OF THE OFFICIAL OPPOSITION: No!

An HON MEMBER: Agree!

An HON MEMBER: No.

HON MEMBERS: Agree! Agree!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: I have put the question to the House.  
Are there any objections?

An HON MEMBER: No!

HON MEMBERS: No!

HON MEMBERS: Yes! Yes! Object, object!

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Objection recorded. The report  
...[Interjection.]

Mr G BRINKHUIS (AL JAMA-AH): Al Jama-ah objects. Thank you, hon  
Temporary Chairperson. Al Jama-ah objects.

An HON MEMBER: Al Jama-ah objects.

The TEMPORARY CHAIRPERSON: Noted, hon Brinkhuis. The report of the Budget Committee on the Division of Revenue Amendment Bill has therefore been adopted. Hon members, that concludes the business for the day. The Secretary will now end the meeting and all hon members will be exited from the sitting. The House is adjourned.

The House adjourned at 18:55.